

National Assembly for Wales Committee Data Report: 2018-19

Introduction

1. The National Assembly for Wales is the democratically elected body that represents the interests of Wales and its people, makes laws for Wales, agrees Welsh taxes and holds the Welsh Government to account.
2. In its report on Making Laws in Wales, the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee recommended that:

“the Assembly Commission invests resources in capturing data relevant to the operation and function of scrutiny in the Assembly as a means of facilitating the decision-making process and ensuring the efficient use of time and resources in the delivery of services to Assembly Members.”¹

3. In particular, the Committee suggested that such data could include:

“the number of draft Bills considered by Assembly committees, the number of Bills subject to post-legislative scrutiny; the amount of available time used by committees and the amount of time used by committees for policy and legislation scrutiny.”²

4. The Assembly Commission (the corporate body responsible for ensuring that property, staff and services are provided for the National Assembly for Wales) accepted this recommendation.
5. It is intended that a data report on the work of Assembly Committees will be published on an annual basis. The reports will cover a one year period of May-April, reflecting that each Assembly will be elected for five years, beginning in the month of May.
6. The Annexes to this report contain data from previous years to give an initial corpus of data for comparison.

The amount of available time used by committees

7. Committees are one of the key mechanisms that enable the Assembly to fulfil its statutory and constitutional functions, including holding the Welsh Government to account and making laws.

¹ Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, Making Laws in Wales, October 2015, Recommendation 32.

² Ibid, para 392.



8. The Assembly has committees set up to look at specific subjects. Each committee carries out tasks, such as examining the general principles of a proposed law (a Bill), or conducting an investigation into policy decisions made by the Welsh Government. In this way, Committees play a key role in holding the Welsh Government to account and making laws.
9. One data set that the Fourth Assembly's Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee expressed a particular interest in was "the amount of available time used by committees."³
10. In a sense, so long as a committee exists, it is using time. For example, when a committee starts investigating an issue, they may ask people to write to them (or send them a video) setting out what they think about a particular issue,⁴ or produce a survey or questionnaire to gather people's views. Individual Members of a committee may receive and read (or view) such responses at any time. Members may also engage in committee work outside of meeting slots.
11. However, for the purpose of addressing the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee's interest in the amount of available time used by committees, we have focussed specifically on the use of 'meeting slots'.
12. Standing Order 11.9 requires the Business Committee to publish from time to time, a timetable for periods of not less than six months, which must include times available for committee meetings. The majority of Assembly committees are allocated 'meeting slots' within a fortnightly timetable of business. Committees are not allocated meeting slots during recess periods.
13. During these meeting slots a committee may hold formal meetings, asking people to come and answer questions about an issue they are investigating. A committee may also use meeting slots to hold informal meetings, visit particular projects related to the issue they are investigating, or otherwise use the allocated time to assist them in their various roles.

What is a meeting slot?

14. Although 'meeting slot' is a commonly used concept within the context of Assembly Business, different committees start and finish at different times. We consider committees that meet for any period of time during their allocated slot to have met. Specifically, whilst the entirety of a Thursday is made available to some committees on a fortnightly basis, any duration of business (formal or informal) during this time is counted as making use of a single available slot.
15. For the purpose of presenting data, we have therefore:
 - a. treated any duration on a Thursday as being one meeting slot;

³ Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, Making Laws in Wales, October 2015, para 392.

⁴ This is called a 'call for evidence'. Anyone can respond to a call for evidence, in writing, through videos or in an audio form ([giving written and digital information to a committee](#)).

- b. treated meetings that did not take place due to a committee having only recently been established, or otherwise did not take place due to external factors (for example: industrial action) as slots unused;
- c. treated a slot as 'used' if a Committee conducted business of any form during a slot (whether that was formal or informal, and regardless of what length of time that business took).⁵

What proportion of meeting slots are used?

- 16.** Taking this definition, we can say that- in total- committees used 94% of their available meeting slots between May 2018 and April 2019.
- 17.** The individual committees' use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in Table 1 below.

Committee	Slots available	Slots used
Children, Young People and Education Committee	36	36
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	36	34
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	4	4
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	36	33
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	35	33
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	36	36
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	37	34
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ⁶	37	31
Finance Committee	35	31
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	36	36
Petitions Committee	18	18
Public Accounts Committee	36	32
Standards of Conduct Committee	18	13

⁵ In taking this decision, we recognised that this meant that a committee which met from 9:00-9:05 on a Thursday would be recorded as using the entire available slot. This may appear to be potentially misleading. However, later in this report (Table 7) we have also provided a breakdown of the time (in days, hours and minutes) that committees have scheduled for formal meetings.

⁶ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

Total	400	376
-------	-----	-----

Table 1

18. It should be noted that the remit of the Standards of Conduct Committee (such as investigation of complaints) necessitates both that it is able to meet on a regular basis, and that in practice it is unlikely to need to use all of its available meeting slots.

Numbers of formal committee meetings held

19. In total, Committees formally met 350 times between May 2018 and April 2019.

20. The number of formal meetings held by each committee, including those held outside their formal slot⁷ is set out in Table 2.

Committee	Formal Meetings
Children, Young People and Education Committee	29
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	27
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	2
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	34
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	38
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	30
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	34
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ⁸	32
Finance Committee	32
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	33
Petitions Committee	18
Public Accounts Committee	30
Standards of Conduct Committee	21

⁷ Individual committees may request to the Business Committee to meet outside their normal slot when required (e.g. where they require additional time or have witnesses who cannot attend during their normal slot). The Standards of Conduct Committee normally has a slot on alternate Tuesdays. This committee has obtained standing permission to meet on the other Tuesdays where it's functions require.

⁸ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

Total	350
-------	-----

Table 2

21. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2018 to April 2019 period is set out in Table 3.

Quarter	Number of committee meetings
1 April - 30 June 2018	95
1 July- 30 September 2018	48
1 October- 31 December 2018	105
1 January- 31 March 2019	102
Total	350

Table 3

22. A similar breakdown of formal committee meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4

Assembly Term	Number of committee meetings
Summer 2018	125
Autumn 2018	123
Spring 2019	102
Total	350

Table 4

Committee activities taking place outside the National Assembly for Wales Estate

What are committee activities outside the Assembly estate?

- 23.** Committees meet- formally or informally- or otherwise gather evidence outside the Assembly estate for a range of reasons. Formal meetings outside the Assembly Estate can enable a wider range of people to observe them, or can facilitate particular witnesses in giving evidence.
- 24.** Informal meetings might be based in settings that witnesses are more familiar with, which can make discussions less intimidating for people taking part. Informal committee meetings are usually based around a more relaxed discussion where witnesses feel comfortable asking questions to the committee members or to each other. Notes of informal discussions can be taken if the witnesses agree to this. These notes can then be used for more formal committee business (such as a committee report). Witnesses can remain anonymous in the notes if they prefer.
- 25.** Other forms of evidence gathering include visits, whereby one or more members of a committee might visit a specific place or project to learn more about it.

How often did committee activities take place outside the Assembly estate?

- 26.** Committees met or otherwise gather evidence outside the Assembly estate for the purpose of informing committee inquiries, on a total of 21 dates between May 2016 and April 2017. A breakdown by each committee is set out in Table 5.
- 27.** Table 5 also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee.

Committee	Date	Event location
Children, Young People and Education Committee	20 June 2018	Cardiff
Children, Young People and Education Committee	4 October 2018	Across Wales
Children, Young People and Education Committee	24 January 2019	Risca and Denbighshire
Children, Young People and Education Committee	7 February 2019	Merthyr and Aberaeron

Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	2 May 2018	London
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	24 May 2018	Tongwynlais
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	6 June 2018	Cardiff Bay
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	12 July 2018	Milford Haven
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	25 July 2018	Royal Welsh Showground, Llanellwedd
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	30 January 2019	Bridgend
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	28 March 2019	North Wales
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	6 July 2018	Aberystwyth
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	2 May 2018	Cardiff
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	4 July 2018	Cardiff
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	22 November 2018	Cardiff
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	6 December 2018	Aberystwyth
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	21 February 2019	Swansea
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	27 June 2018	Taffs Well
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	27 September 2018	Roose
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	25 October 2018	London



Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	15 November 2018	Treforest
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	17 January 2019	Manchester
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	19 July 2018	Across Wales
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	17 January 2019	Bridgend
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	14 February 2019	Gloucester
External Affairs and Additional Legislation	22 October 2018	London
External Affairs and Additional Legislation	18 February 2019	Brussels
Finance Committee	07 June 2018	Swansea
Finance Committee	5 December 2018	Treforest
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	21 June 2018	Carmarthen & Cardiff
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	5 December 2018	Cardiff
Public Accounts Committee	21 May 2018	Cardiff
Public Accounts Committee	21 January 2019	Across Wales
Public Accounts Committee	4 March 2019	Wrexham

Table 5

- 28.** The term “Across Wales” is used above where the committee visited multiple locations in one day, often by splitting the members into smaller reportage groups in order to visit more locations/projects than it would be possible for the entire committee to visit within the time available.

Informal Committee activities taking place on the National Assembly for Wales' Estate

- 29.** As previously noted, Committees sometimes use informal activities to assist their inquiries. Informal meetings can take place inside or away from the Senedd, and are not recorded word for word.
- 30.** Most informal activities and meetings that took place between May 2018 and April 2019 were not on the Assembly estate. These are recorded in Table 5.
- 31.** However, a further 12 informal activities took place on the Assembly estate between May 2018 and April 2019. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6.

Committee	Date	Nature of event
Children, Young People and Education Committee	26 April 2018	Report Launch
Children, Young People and Education Committee	4 July 2018	Stakeholder Roundtable Event
Children, Young People and Education Committee	26 September 2018	Stakeholder Roundtable Event
Children, Young People and Education Committee	13 February 2019	Working group with Stakeholders
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	16 May 2018	Stakeholder workshop
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	28 June 2018	Stakeholder workshop
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	26 July 2018	Informal Meeting
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	6 November 2018	Informal Meeting
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	14 June 2018	Report Launch
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	12 November 2018	Seminar session
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	7 March 2019	Report Launch

Table 6

Use of committees' formal meeting time

How do committees divide up their formal meeting time?

32. Committees can use formal meeting time for a variety of purposes. One issue that the Fourth Assembly's Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee expressed particular interest in was "the amount of time used by committees for policy and legislation scrutiny."
33. In practice, many aspects of scrutiny are intertwined, rather than conducted in isolation. When examining a Welsh Government proposed Bill, for example, a committee would also typically wish to consider the policy context of the Bill, and indeed the financial consequences anticipated to arise from the proposed legislation. Similarly, when examining a Welsh Government policy area, a committee would typically also consider the financial and legislative context of that policy area.
34. Nevertheless, we have sought to differentiate committee activity into a number of broad categories, which we have based on what the 'primary' focus of the activity could reasonably be said to be. These categories are:
35. 'Policy scrutiny,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for committee inquiries;
36. 'Primary Legislation,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of primary legislation (as part of either [Stage 1](#) or [Stage 2](#));
37. 'Subordination Legislation, which' refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of [subordinate legislation](#);
38. 'Financial Scrutiny,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for scrutiny of the Welsh Government's financial decisions and financial decisions of others scrutinised by the Assembly (e.g. Assembly Commission, Auditor General for Wales, Public Service Ombudsman for Wales). This includes - but is not limited to - consideration of the draft budget;
39. 'Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Memoranda,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of [UK legislation that by convention requires the consent of the Assembly](#)
40. 'Post legislative scrutiny,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for reviewing the Welsh Government's implementation of primary legislation previously passed by the Assembly;

41. 'Stand-alone Ministerial scrutiny,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for scrutinising a Welsh Minister on a range of matters within their portfolio, and which does not form part of any particular policy inquiry that a committee might also be doing.
42. 'Other,' which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for activities not covered under the headings above, such as a Committee's consideration of its Forward Work Programme, consideration of correspondence that does not relate to a current inquiry, etc.

What is the proportion of formal meeting time used for policy and legislative scrutiny?

43. Using these broad categories, we can say that between May 2018 and April 2019, the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 502 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 85 hours. From this, it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 6:1.⁹
44. Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 10 minutes of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.
45. It may be noted that the proportion of time dedicated to legislation by Committees is heavily influenced by each Bill's timetable (i.e. how many weeks a Committee has to scrutinise the general principles of a Bill), the number of amendments tabled on a Bill, and the number of Bills that are within the remit of a particular Committee. As such, a Committee will have limited control in practice as to how much of its time it dedicates to legislative scrutiny as opposed to other activities.
46. Table 7 sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2018 and April 2019.

⁹ This has been rounded. The calculation is actually 5.905882353 to 1.

	Policy Scrutiny	Primary Legislation	Subordinate Legislation	Financial Scrutiny	Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Memoranda	Post Legislative Scrutiny	Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny	Other	Total
CYPE	01:19:20	00:17:05	00:00:00	00:06:55	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:10	00:08:25	03:05:55
CCERA	01:17:55	00:00:30	00:01:15	00:05:30	00:08:05	00:00:00	00:01:40	00:06:10	02:17:05
SFM	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:04:00	00:00:00	00:04:00
CLA	00:12:30	00:18:35	00:07:45	00:00:00	00:04:31	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:40	01:22:01
CWLC	02:16:15	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:11:10	03:06:25
EIS	02:13:50	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:40	00:00:15	00:00:15	00:03:50	00:06:00	03:02:50
ELGC	02:10:25	00:18:25	00:00:00	00:08:35	00:00:00	00:01:15	00:00:00	00:05:35	03:20:15
EAAL	01:17:30	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:00	00:00:00	00:16:20	00:06:50	02:18:40
Fin	00:18:55	00:10:00	00:00:40	01:07:15	00:00:10	00:06:30	00:00:00	00:05:05	03:00:35
HSCS	02:09:55	00:20:45	00:00:05	00:03:15	00:01:10	00:11:25	00:00:00	00:03:40	04:02:15
Pet	01:08:20	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	01:08:20
PAC	02:07:30	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:17:05	00:00:00	00:06:05	00:00:00	00:08:00	03:14:40
SoC	00:14:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:10:45	01:00:45
Total	20:22:25	03:13:20	00:09:45	03:05:15	00:16:11	01:01:30	01:05:00	03:02:20	34:03:46
	61.3%	10.4%	1.2%	9.4%	2.0%	3.1%	3.5%	9.1%	100%

Table 7



47. In Table 7, time is expressed as 24 hour days: hours: minutes. To conserve space, we have abbreviated committees' names- a key to these abbreviations is set out in Table 8 below

Short Name	Full name
CYPE	Children, Young People and Education Committee
CCERA	Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee
SFM	Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister
CLA	Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee
CWLC	Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee
EIS	Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee
ELGC	Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee
EAAL	External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee
Fin	Finance Committee
HSCS	Health, Social Care and Sport Committee
Pet	Petitions Committee
PAC	Public Accounts Committee
SoC	Standards of Conduct Committee

Table 8

Length of time Ministers have been scrutinised by committees

- 48.** One of the key functions of committees is to hold the Welsh Government to account. When committees engage with external stakeholders in their inquiries, they are build up evidence and information with which to scrutinise Welsh Government Ministers.
- 49.** Between May 2018 and April 2019, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 4 days and 2 hours – or 98 hours. That is 12% of the time that committees sat.
- 50.** This figure includes both scrutiny as part of a committee inquiry (policy scrutiny) and stand-alone scrutiny.
- 51.** It does not include time related to the legislative process (on the basis that this incorporates consideration of both Government and non-Government legislation and amendments).



Membership of committees

- 52.** One of the unusual features of politics in Wales, compared to the other Parliamentary bodies of the UK, is that it is commonplace for Members to sit on multiple committees.
- 53.** Excluding membership of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister, and Business Committee,¹⁰ at the end of the May 2018-April 2019 period, there were:
- 17 Members not sitting on committees (including Ministers, the Llywydd and the Deputy Presiding Officer)
 - 11 Members sitting on 1 committee
 - 23 Members sitting on 2 committees
 - 9 Members sitting on 3 committees
- 54.** In addition to their roles as committee members, 4 Members had roles as Assembly Commissioners, 3 as Opposition Group Leaders and 3 as Non-Government Business Managers.

¹⁰ For the purpose of presenting these statistics, we have chosen to exclude membership of the Scrutiny of the First Minister committee on the basis that it does not meet as part of the fortnightly meeting pattern. We have also chosen to exclude membership of Business Committee because it functions in a significantly different way to other committees (for example, it has shorter meetings and one of its members will normally be a member of the Welsh Government).



Number of Bills considered by committees

- 55.** When a Bill is first introduced in the Assembly, it will normally be assigned by the Business Committee to a single committee, who will consider and report on the Bill as part of **Stage 1**, and debate and vote on amendments to the Bill at **Stage 2**.
- 56.** Table 9 shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period.

Committee	Number of Assembly Bills considered
Children, Young People and Education Committee	2
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	2
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	2
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	1
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	2
Committee of the Whole Assembly ¹¹	1
Total	10

Table 9

- 57.** It may be noted that in addition to the responsible committee assigned a Bill by the Business Committee, the Finance Committee and Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee will also normally consider and report on each Bill introduced in the Assembly, as part of **Stage 1** scrutiny.

Pre-legislative scrutiny conducted by committees

- 58.** No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period.

Number of Acts subject to post-legislative scrutiny

- 59.** During this reporting period, there was no work specifically attributed to post-legislative scrutiny although some policy inquiries have included the effect of Welsh Government legislation within their scope.

¹¹ The Committee of the Whole Assembly is comprised of all Assembly Members and is chaired by the Presiding Officer.

Annex A

Data from the year 1 May 2017- 31 April 2018

60. Notes on this year

61. In total committees used 89.8% of the available meeting slots between 1 May 2017 and 31 April 2018

62. The individual committees' use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in *Table 1 (2017-18)* below.

Committee	Slots available	Slots used
Children, Young People and Education Committee	34	31
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	34	31
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	4	4
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	33	30
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	34	30
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	34	30
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	34	31
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ^{12 13}	38	35
Finance Committee	34	29
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	34	29
Petitions Committee	17	17
Public Accounts Committee	33	31
Standards of Conduct Committee	17	14
Total	494	387

Table 1 (2017-18)

63. In total, Committees formally met 322 times between May 2017 and April 2018

¹² External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

¹³ Includes meetings of the Sub-Committee on the Regulation of Registered Social Landlords (Wales) Bill which during its existence had access to 5 slots and used 4 of these.

64. The total number of formal meetings held by each committee is set out in Table 2 (2016-17)

Committee	Formal Meetings
Children, Young People and Education Committee	30
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	21
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	4
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	31
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	28
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	27
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	31
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ¹⁴	31
Finance Committee	28
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	29
Petitions Committee	17
Public Accounts Committee	29
Standards of Conduct Committee	16
Total	322

Table 2 (2017-18)

1. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2016 to April 2017 period is set out in Table 3 (2016-17)

Quarter	Number of committee meetings
1 April - 30 June 2017	79
1 July- 30 September 2017	48
1 October- 31 December 2017	96
1 January- 31 March 2018	99
Total	322

¹⁴ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

Table 3 (2017-2018)

65. A similar breakdown of formal meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4 (2016-17)

Assembly Term	Number of committee meetings
Summer 2017	111
Autumn 2017	112
Spring 2018	99
Total	322

Table 4 (2017-18)

66. Table 5 (2017-18) also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee.

Committee	Date	Event location
Children, Young People and Education Committee	28 September 2017	Across Wales
Children, Young People and Education Committee	1 February 2017	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	18 May 2017	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	22 June 2017	Maesteg
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	28 September 2017	Cardiff
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	4 October 2017	Cardiff Bay
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	12 October 2017	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	30 November 2017	Edinburgh
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	18 January 2018	Swansea and Gower

Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	27 October 2017	Cwmbran
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	16 February 2018	Newtown
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	28 February 2018	Cardiff
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	11 May 2018	Cardiff
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	15 June 2017	Glasgow
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	5 October 2017	Brussels
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	8 February 2018	North Wales
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	17 January 2018	Cardiff & Newport
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	31 January 2018	Neath Port Talbot
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	26 June 2017	Brussels
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	16 October 2017	Brussels
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	5 February 2018	London
Finance Committee	15 June 2017	Edinburgh
Finance Committee	13 July 2017	Beaumaris
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	6 April 2017	Across Wales
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	7 December 2017	Newport
Public Accounts Committee	12 June 2017	Across Wales
Public Accounts Committee	3 July 2017	Cardiff

Table 5 (2017-18)



67. A further 10 informal activities took place on the Assembly Estate between May 2017 and April 2018. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6 (2017-18)

Committee	Date	Nature of event
Children, Young People and Education Committee	24 January 2018	Stakeholder event
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	20 September 2017	Informal Meeting
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	14 March 2017	Stakeholder Workshop
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	18 September 2017	Stakeholder event
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	8 March 2018	Stakeholder event
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	18 September 2017	Stakeholder event
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	4 December 2017	Seminar Session (Informal)
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	29 January 2018	Informal meeting
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	25 January 2018	Stakeholder event
Public Accounts Committee	18 September 2018	Networking event

Table 6 (2017-18)

- 68.** Using the broad categories defined in para 48-45 above, we can say that between May 2017 and April 2018 the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 700 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 98 hours. From this it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 7:1.¹⁵
- 69.** Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 8 minutes and 24 seconds of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.

¹⁵ This has been rounded. The calculation is actually 7.142857143 to 1.

70. Table 7 (2017-18) sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2017 and April 2018.



	Policy Scrutiny	Primary Legislation	Subordinate Legislation	Financial Scrutiny	Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Menoranda	Post Legislative Scrutiny	Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny	Other	Total
CYPE	03:10:20	00:11:45	00:00:00	00:04:25	00:00:45	00:00:00	00:04:40	00:01:30	04:09:25
CCERA	03:23:40	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:30	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:30	00:05:10	04:10:50
SFM	00:06:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:07:00
CLA	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:00
CWLC	00:07:05	00:01:35	00:00:50	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:05	00:09:35
EIS	03:04:35	00:00:00	00:03:30	00:03:35	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:30	00:01:00	03:14:10
ELGC	03:12:50	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:04:00	00:00:20	00:06:25	00:02:00	00:02:10	04:03:45
EAAL	03:01:15	00:10:50	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:30	00:00:00	00:02:00	00:09:25	04:00:00
Fin	03:01:15	00:04:25	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:30	00:00:00	00:02:00	00:09:25	03:17:35
HSCS	01:11:35	00:15:40	00:01:30	01:02:05	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:06:25	03:13:15
Pet	02:20:15	00:19:20	00:00:00	00:09:25	00:00:15	00:00:20	00:00:00	00:04:25	04:06:00
PAC	01:00:50	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:15	01:01:05
SoC	02:22:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:15:10	00:00:00	00:01:45	00:00:00	00:03:40	03:18:35
Total	29:04:55	04:02:10	00:05:50	02:23:20	00:02:35	00:08:30	00:12:40	00:21:10	08:06:25
	74.4%	10.4%	0.6%	7.6%	0.3%	0.9%	1.3%	4.6%	100%

Table 7 (2017-18)



- 71.** Between May 2017 and April 2018, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 2 days and 23 hours – or 71 hours. That is 7.5% of the time that committees sat.
- 72.** Table 9 (2017-18) shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period

Committee	Number of Assembly Bills considered
Children, Young People and Education Committee	2
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	3
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	1
Finance Committee	2
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	2
Committee of the Whole Assembly	1
Total	

Table 9 (2017-18)

- 73.** No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period.

Annex B

Data from the year 1 May 2016 – 31 April 2017

- 74.** It should be noted that the majority of committees did not meet in May and June 2016, as committees were being established and the committee timetable developed and agreed during this period.
- 75.** In total committees used 90.3% of the available meeting slots between 1 May 2016 and 31 April 2017
- 76.** The individual committees' use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in Table 1 (2016-17) below.

Committee	Slots available	Slots used
Children, Young People and Education Committee	26	23
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	26	26
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	3	3
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	28	28
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	26	23
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	26	25
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	26	23
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ¹⁶	22	20
Finance Committee	27	27
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	25	25
Petitions Committee	14	14
Public Accounts Committee	25	23
Standards of Conduct Committee	14	6
Total	288	260

Table 1 (2016-17)

- 77.** In total, Committees formally met 250 times between May 2016 and April 2017

¹⁶ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

78. The total number of formal meetings held by each committee is set out in Table 2 (2016-17)

Committee	Formal Meetings
Children, Young People and Education Committee	21
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	20
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	2
Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	28
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	22
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee	24
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	21
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee ¹⁷	20
Finance Committee	26
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	24
Petitions Committee	13
Public Accounts Committee	23
Standards of Conduct Committee	6
Total	250

Table 2 (2016-17)

2. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2016 to April 2017 period is set out in Table 3 (2016-17)

Quarter	Number of committee meetings
1 April - 30 June 2016	5
1 July- 30 September 2016	41
1 October- 31 December 2016	94
1 January- 31 March 2017	110
Total	250

¹⁷ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

Table 3 (2016-2017)

79. A similar breakdown of formal meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4 (2016-17)

Assembly Term	Number of committee meetings
Summer 2016	21
Autumn 2016	119
Spring 2017	110
Total	250

Table 4 (2016-17)

80. Table 5 (2016-17) also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee. For example, on 9 February 2017, Members of the Children, Young People and Education Committee met with parents at two separate locations to support the committee's scrutiny of the general principles of the Additional Learning Needs and Education Tribunal (Wales) Bill.¹⁸

Committee	Date	Event location
Children, Young People and Education Committee	26/01/2017	City Hall, Cardiff
Children, Young People and Education Committee	09/02/2017	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	22/09/2016	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	24/11/2016	North Wales sites (starting and ending in Bangor)
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	26/01/2017	Across Wales
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	02/03/2017	Sites in Pembrokeshire

¹⁸ A summary of key points raised at the events is available at <http://www.senedd.assembly.wales/documents/s60571/Event%20with%20Parents%209%20February%202017%20Summary%20of%20Evidence.pdf>



Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee	20/03/2017	Newport City Campus, University of Wales
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	28/09/2016	Cardiff Bay
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	08/12/2016	Across Wales
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	17/02/2017	Trinity St David's University, Carmarthen
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills	09/03/2017	Shrewsbury
Economy, Infrastructure and Skills	29/09/2016	Nantgarw and Cardiff
Equality, Local Government and Communities	01/12/2016	Glasgow & Edinburgh
Equality, Local Government and Communities	05/10/2016	Across Wales
Equality, Local Government and Communities	17/11/2016	Across Wales
Equality, Local Government and Communities	25/01/2017	Cardiff
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	28/11/2016	Wrexham
Finance Committee	23/06/2017	Newport City Campus, University of South Wales
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	21/09/2016	Cardiff Bay
Public Accounts Committee	05/12/2016	Cardiff Bay
Public Accounts Committee	20/03/2017	Newport

Table 5 (2016-17)

81. A further 8 informal activities took place on the Assembly Estate between May 2016 and April 2017. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6 (2016-17)

Committee	Date	Nature of event
------------------	-------------	------------------------

Children, Young People and Education Committee	28/09/2016	Stakeholder Event
Children, Young People and Education Committee	20/10/2016	Informal meeting
Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee	06/10/2016	Stakeholder Event
Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister	20/09/2016	Informal meeting
Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee	16/11/2016	Stakeholder Event
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	29/09/2016	Informal meeting
External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee	27/03/2017	Stakeholder Conference
Finance Committee	15/09/2016	Informal Meeting
Public Accounts Committee	12/09/2016	Informal Meeting

Table 6 (2016-17)

- 82.** Using the broad categories defined in para 48-45 above, we can say that between May 2016 and April 2017 the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 362 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 115 hours. From this it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 3:1.¹⁹
- 83.** Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 19 minutes of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.
- 84.** Table 7 (2016-17) sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2016 and April 2017.

¹⁹ This has been rounded down. The calculation is actually 3.147826086956522 to 1.

	Policy Scrutiny	Primary Legislation	Subordinate Legislation	Financial Scrutiny	Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Menoranda	Post Legislative Scrutiny	Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny	Other	Total
CYPE	01:08:55	00:22:30	00:00:00	00:02:30	00:01:10	00:00:00	00:03:00	00:09:30	02:23:35
CCERA	01:05:35	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:02:45	00:00:10	00:00:00	00:01:30	01:02:30	02:12:30
SFM	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:10	00:03:45	00:06:55
CLA	00:22:15	00:07:35	00:02:35	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:15	01:12:40
CWLC	01:13:15	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:20	00:00:05	00:00:00	00:02:00	00:17:35	02:12:15
EIS	02:00:06	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:04:45	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:04:00	00:10:40	02:19:31
ELGC	01:09:55	00:15:30	00:00:00	00:04:00	00:00:15	00:09:35	00:05:45	00:07:40	03:04:40
EAAL	01:17:05	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:05	01:20:10
Fin	00:04:05	01:21:10	00:00:00	01:05:20	00:00:30	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:17:50	04:01:55
HSCS	01:11:30	01:00:25	00:00:00	00:04:20	00:01:05	00:00:00	00:03:45	00:09:50	03:06:55
Pet	00:12:37	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:30	00:14:07
PAC	02:01:05	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:01:00	00:14:05	02:16:10
SoC	00:03:15	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:00:00	00:03:55	00:07:10
Total	14:13:38	04:19:10	00:02:35	02:03:00	00:04:15	00:09:35	01:01:10	05:09:10	28:14:33
	50.9%	16.8%	0.4%	7.4%	0.6%	1.4%	3.7%	18.8%	100%

Table 7 (2016-17)



85. Between May 2016 and April 2017, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 3 days and 22 hours – or 94 hours. That is 13.8% of the time that committees sat.
86. Table 9 (2016-17) shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period

Committee	Number of Assembly Bills considered
Children, Young People and Education Committee	1
Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee	2
Finance Committee	2
Health, Social Care and Sport Committee	1
Total	6

Table 9 (2016-17)

87. No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period. However, the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee and External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee both initiated inquiries into the constitutional and legislative implications of the UK Government's White Paper on the 'Great Repeal Bill,' during this reporting period.
88. During this reporting period, the Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee undertook a post-legislative inquiry into the Violence against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence (Wales) Act 2015, reporting in December 2016.
89. In addition, in February 2017 the *Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee's Expert Reference Group on Climate Change* met for the first time. This group was established to provide support to the Committee to scrutinise the progress of the Welsh Government in meeting its targets on climate change mitigation, including post-legislative scrutiny of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 and the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015.