National Assembly for Wales Committee Data Report: 2018-19

Introduction

1. The National Assembly for Wales is the democratically elected body that represents the interests of Wales and its people, makes laws for Wales, agrees Welsh taxes and holds the Welsh Government to account.

2. In its report on Making Laws in Wales, the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee recommended that:

   “the Assembly Commission invests resources in capturing data relevant to the operation and function of scrutiny in the Assembly as a means of facilitating the decision-making process and ensuring the efficient use of time and resources in the delivery of services to Assembly Members.”

3. In particular, the Committee suggested that such data could include:

   “the number of draft Bills considered by Assembly committees, the number of Bills subject to post-legislative scrutiny; the amount of available time used by committees and the amount of time used by committees for policy and legislation scrutiny.”

4. The Assembly Commission (the corporate body responsible for ensuring that property, staff and services are provided for the National Assembly for Wales) accepted this recommendation.

5. It is intended that a data report on the work of Assembly Committees will be published on an annual basis. The reports will cover a one year period of May-April, reflecting that each Assembly will be elected for five years, beginning in the month of May.

6. The Annexes to this report contain data from previous years to give an initial corpus of data for comparison.

The amount of available time used by committees

7. Committees are one of the key mechanisms that enable the Assembly to fulfil its statutory and constitutional functions, including holding the Welsh Government to account and making laws.

---

1 Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, Making Laws in Wales, October 2015, Recommendation 32.
2 Ibid, para 392.
8. The Assembly has committees set up to look at specific subjects. Each committee carries out tasks, such as examining the general principles of a proposed law (a Bill), or conducting an investigation into policy decisions made by the Welsh Government. In this way, Committees play a key role in holding the Welsh Government to account and making laws.

9. One data set that the Fourth Assembly’s Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee expressed a particular interest in was “the amount of available time used by committees.”

10. In a sense, so long as a committee exists, it is using time. For example, when a committee starts investigating an issue, they may ask people to write to them (or send them a video) setting out what they think about a particular issue, or produce a survey or questionnaire to gather people’s views. Individual Members of a committee may receive and read (or view) such responses at any time. Members may also engage in committee work outside of meeting slots.

11. However, for the purpose of addressing the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee’s interest in the amount of available time used by committees, we have focussed specifically on the use of ‘meeting slots’.

12. Standing Order 11.9 requires the Business Committee to publish from time to time, a timetable for periods of not less than six months, which must include times available for committee meetings. The majority of Assembly committees are allocated ‘meeting slots’ within a fortnightly timetable of business. Committees are not allocated meeting slots during recess periods.

13. During these meeting slots a committee may hold formal meetings, asking people to come and answer questions about an issue they are investigating. A committee may also use meeting slots to hold informal meetings, visit particular projects related to the issue they are investigating, or otherwise use the allocated time to assist them in their various roles.

What is a meeting slot?

14. Although ‘meeting slot’ is a commonly used concept within the context of Assembly Business, different committees start and finish at different times. We consider committees that meet for any period of time during their allocated slot to have met. Specifically, whilst the entirety of a Thursday is made available to some committees on a fortnightly basis, any duration of business (formal or informal) during this time is counted as making use of a single available slot.

15. For the purpose of presenting data, we have therefore:

   a. treated any duration on a Thursday as being one meeting slot;

---

3 Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, Making Laws in Wales, October 2015, para 392.
4 This is called a ‘call for evidence’. Anyone can respond to a call for evidence, in writing, through videos or in an audio form (giving written and digital information to a committee).
b. treated meetings that did not take place due to a committee having only recently been established, or otherwise did not take place due to external factors (for example: industrial action) as slots unused;

c. treated a slot as ‘used’ if a Committee conducted business of any form during a slot (whether that was formal or informal, and regardless of what length of time that business took).  

What proportion of meeting slots are used?

16. Taking this definition, we can say that- in total- committees used 94% of their available meeting slots between May 2018 and April 2019.

17. The individual committees’ use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in Table 1 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Slots available</th>
<th>Slots used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In taking this decision, we recognised that this meant that a committee which met from 9:00-9:05 on a Thursday would be recorded as using the entire available slot. This may appear to be potentially misleading. However, later in this report (Table 7) we have also provided a breakdown of the time (in days, hours and minutes) that committees have scheduled for formal meetings.

6 External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.
18. It should be noted that the remit of the Standards of Conduct Committee (such as investigation of complaints) necessitates both that it is able to meet on a regular basis, and that in practice it is unlikely to need to use all of its available meeting slots.

Numbers of formal committee meetings held

19. In total, Committees formally met 350 times between May 2018 and April 2019.

20. The number of formal meetings held by each committee, including those held outside their formal slot\(^7\) is set out in Table 2.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Formal Meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee(^8)</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^7\) Individual committees may request to the Business Committee to meet outside their normal slot when required (e.g. where they require additional time or have witnesses who cannot attend during their normal slot). The Standards of Conduct Committee normally has a slot on alternate Tuesdays. This committee has obtained standing permission to meet on the other Tuesdays where it’s functions require.

\(^8\) External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.
21. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2018 to April 2019 period is set out in Table 3.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quarter</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 April - 30 June 2018</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 July - 30 September 2018</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 October - 31 December 2018</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 January - 31 March 2019</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

22. A similar breakdown of formal committee meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assembly Term</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summer 2018</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autumn 2018</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2019</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Committee activities taking place outside the National Assembly for Wales Estate

What are committee activities outside the Assembly estate?

23. Committees meet- formally or informally- or otherwise gather evidence outside the Assembly estate for a range of reasons. Formal meetings outside the Assembly Estate can enable a wider range of people to observe them, or can facilitate particular witnesses in giving evidence.

24. Informal meetings might be based in settings that witnesses are more familiar with, which can make discussions less intimidating for people taking part. Informal committee meetings are usually based around a more relaxed discussion where witnesses feel comfortable asking questions to the committee members or to each other. Notes of informal discussions can be taken if the witnesses agree to this. These notes can then be used for more formal committee business (such as a committee report). Witnesses can remain anonymous in the notes if they prefer.

25. Other forms of evidence gathering include visits, whereby one or more members of a committee might visit a specific place or project to learn more about it.

How often did committee activities take place outside the Assembly estate?

26. Committees met or otherwise gather evidence outside the Assembly estate for the purpose of informing committee inquiries, on a total of 21 dates between May 2016 and April 2017. A breakdown by each committee is set out in Table 5.

27. Table 5 also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>20 June 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>4 October 2018</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>24 January 2019</td>
<td>Risca and Denbighshire</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>7 February 2019</td>
<td>Merthyr and Aberaeron</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>2 May 2018</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>24 May 2018</td>
<td>Tongwynlais</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>6 June 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>12 July 2018</td>
<td>Milford Haven</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>25 July 2018</td>
<td>Royal Welsh Showground, Llanelwedd</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>30 January 2019</td>
<td>Bridgend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>28 March 2019</td>
<td>North Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>6 July 2018</td>
<td>Aberystwyth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>2 May 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>4 July 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>22 November 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>6 December 2018</td>
<td>Aberystwyth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>21 February 2019</td>
<td>Swansea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>27 June 2018</td>
<td>Taffs Well</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>27 September 2018</td>
<td>Roose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>25 October 2018</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee</td>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Location</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>15 November 2018</td>
<td>Treforest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>17 January 2019</td>
<td>Manchester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>19 July 2018</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>17 January 2019</td>
<td>Bridgend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>14 February 2019</td>
<td>Gloucester</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation</td>
<td>22 October 2018</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation</td>
<td>18 February 2019</td>
<td>Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>07 June 2018</td>
<td>Swansea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>5 December 2018</td>
<td>Treforest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>21 June 2018</td>
<td>Carmarthen &amp; Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>5 December 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>21 May 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>21 January 2019</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>4 March 2019</td>
<td>Wrexham</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5

28. The term “Across Wales” is used above where the committee visited multiple locations in one day, often by splitting the members into smaller reportage groups in order to visit more locations/projects than it would be possible for the entire committee to visit within the time available.
Informal Committee activities taking place on the National Assembly for Wales’ Estate

29. As previously noted, Committees sometimes use informal activities to assist their inquiries. Informal meetings can take place inside or away from the Senedd, and are not recorded word for word.

30. Most informal activities and meetings that took place between May 2018 and April 2019 were not on the Assembly estate. These are recorded in Table 5.

31. However, a further 12 informal activities took place on the Assembly estate between May 2018 and April 2019. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nature of event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>26 April 2018</td>
<td>Report Launch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>4 July 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder Roundtable Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>26 September 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder Roundtable Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>13 February 2019</td>
<td>Working group with Stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>16 May 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder workshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>28 June 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder workshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>26 July 2018</td>
<td>Informal Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>6 November 2018</td>
<td>Informal Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>14 June 2018</td>
<td>Report Launch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>12 November 2018</td>
<td>Seminar session</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>7 March 2019</td>
<td>Report Launch</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Use of committees’ formal meeting time

How do committees divide up their formal meeting time?

32. Committees can use formal meeting time for a variety of purposes. One issue that the Fourth Assembly’s Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee expressed particular interest in was “the amount of time used by committees for policy and legislation scrutiny.”

33. In practice, many aspects of scrutiny are intertwined, rather than conducted in isolation. When examining a Welsh Government proposed Bill, for example, a committee would also typically wish to consider the policy context of the Bill, and indeed the financial consequences anticipated to arise from the proposed legislation. Similarly, when examining a Welsh Government policy area, a committee would typically also consider the financial and legislative context of that policy area.

34. Nevertheless, we have sought to differentiate committee activity into a number of broad categories, which we have based on what the ‘primary’ focus of the activity could reasonably be said to be. These categories are:

35. ‘Policy scrutiny,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for committee inquiries;

36. ‘Primary Legislation,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of primary legislation (as part of either Stage 1 or Stage 2);

37. ‘Subordination Legislation, which’ refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of subordinate legislation;

38. ‘Financial Scrutiny,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for scrutiny of the Welsh Government’s financial decisions and financial decisions of others scrutinised by the Assembly (e.g. Assembly Commission, Auditor General for Wales, Public Service Ombudsman for Wales). This includes - but is not limited to - consideration of the draft budget;

39. ‘Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Memoranda,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for the consideration of UK legislation that by convention requires the consent of the Assembly;

40. ‘Post legislative scrutiny,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for reviewing the Welsh Government’s implementation of primary legislation previously passed by the Assembly;
41. ‘Stand-alone Ministerial scrutiny,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for scrutinising a Welsh Minister on a range of matters within their portfolio, and which does not form part of any particular policy inquiry that a committee might also be doing.

42. ‘Other,’ which refers to time scheduled on committee agendas for activities not covered under the headings above, such as a Committee’s consideration of its Forward Work Programme, consideration of correspondence that does not relate to a current inquiry, etc.

What is the proportion of formal meeting time used for policy and legislative scrutiny?

43. Using these broad categories, we can say that between May 2018 and April 2019, the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 502 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 85 hours. From this, it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 6:1.⁹

44. Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 10 minutes of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.

45. It may be noted that the proportion of time dedicated to legislation by Committees is heavily influenced by each Bill’s timetable (i.e. how many weeks a Committee has to scrutinise the general principles of a Bill), the number of amendments tabled on a Bill, and the number of Bills that are within the remit of a particular Committee. As such, a Committee will have limited control in practice as to how much of its time it dedicates to legislative scrutiny as opposed to other activities.

46. Table 7 sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2018 and April 2019.

---

⁹ This has been rounded. The calculation is actually 5.905882353 to 1.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Policy Scrutiny</th>
<th>Primary Legislation</th>
<th>Subordinate Legislation</th>
<th>Financial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Memoranda</th>
<th>Post Legislative Scrutiny</th>
<th>Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CYPE</td>
<td>01:19:20</td>
<td>00:17:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:06:55</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:10</td>
<td>00:08:25</td>
<td>03:05:55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCERA</td>
<td>01:17:55</td>
<td>00:00:30</td>
<td>00:01:15</td>
<td>00:05:30</td>
<td>00:08:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:40</td>
<td>00:06:10</td>
<td>02:17:05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFM</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA</td>
<td>00:12:30</td>
<td>00:18:35</td>
<td>00:07:45</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:31</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:40</td>
<td>01:22:01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWLC</td>
<td>02:16:15</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>00:11:10</td>
<td>03:06:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIS</td>
<td>02:13:50</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:40</td>
<td>00:00:15</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:50</td>
<td>00:06:00</td>
<td>03:02:50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELGC</td>
<td>02:10:25</td>
<td>00:18:25</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:08:35</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:15</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:05:35</td>
<td>03:20:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAAL</td>
<td>01:17:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:16:20</td>
<td>00:06:50</td>
<td>02:18:40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fin</td>
<td>00:18:55</td>
<td>00:10:00</td>
<td>00:00:40</td>
<td>01:07:15</td>
<td>00:00:10</td>
<td>00:06:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:05:05</td>
<td>03:00:35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCS</td>
<td>02:09:55</td>
<td>00:20:45</td>
<td>00:00:05</td>
<td>00:03:15</td>
<td>00:01:10</td>
<td>00:11:25</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:40</td>
<td>04:02:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pet</td>
<td>01:08:20</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>01:08:20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>02:07:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:17:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:06:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:08:00</td>
<td>03:14:40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SoC</td>
<td>00:14:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:10:45</td>
<td>01:00:45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20:22:25</td>
<td>03:13:20</td>
<td>00:09:45</td>
<td>03:05:15</td>
<td>00:16:11</td>
<td>01:01:30</td>
<td>01:05:00</td>
<td>03:02:20</td>
<td>34:03:46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|          | 61.3%           | 10.4%               | 1.2%                   | 9.4%              | 2.0%                                     | 3.1%                      | 3.5%                          | 9.1%     | 100%   |

Table 7
In Table 7, time is expressed as 24 hour days: hours: minutes. To conserve space, we have abbreviated committees’ names - a key to these abbreviations is set out in Table 8 below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short Name</th>
<th>Full name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CYPE</td>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCERA</td>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFM</td>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA</td>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWLC</td>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIS</td>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELGC</td>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAAL</td>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fin</td>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCS</td>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pet</td>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SoC</td>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8
Length of time Ministers have been scrutinised by committees

48. One of the key functions of committees is to hold the Welsh Government to account. When committees engage with external stakeholders in their inquiries, they are build up evidence and information with which to scrutinise Welsh Government Ministers.

49. Between May 2018 and April 2019, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 4 days and 2 hours – or 98 hours. That is 12% of the time that committees sat.

50. This figure includes both scrutiny as part of a committee inquiry (policy scrutiny) and stand-alone scrutiny.

51. It does not include time related to the legislative process (on the basis that this incorporates consideration of both Government and non-Government legislation and amendments).
Membership of committees

52. One of the unusual features of politics in Wales, compared to the other Parliamentary bodies of the UK, is that it is commonplace for Members to sit on multiple committees.

53. Excluding membership of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister, and Business Committee, at the end of the May 2018-April 2019 period, there were:

- 17 Members not sitting on committees (including Ministers, the Llywydd and the Deputy Presiding Officer)
- 11 Members sitting on 1 committee
- 23 Members sitting on 2 committees
- 9 Members sitting on 3 committees

54. In addition to their roles as committee members, 4 Members had roles as Assembly Commissioners, 3 as Opposition Group Leaders and 3 as Non-Government Business Managers.

10 For the purpose of presenting these statistics, we have chosen to exclude membership of the Scrutiny of the First Minister committee on the basis that it does not meet as part of the fortnightly meeting pattern. We have also chosen to exclude membership of Business Committee because it functions in a significantly different way to other committees (for example, it has shorter meetings and one of its members will normally be a member of the Welsh Government).
Number of Bills considered by committees

55. When a Bill is first introduced in the Assembly, it will normally be assigned by the Business Committee to a single committee, who will consider and report on the Bill as part of Stage 1, and debate and vote on amendments to the Bill at Stage 2.

56. Table 9 shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Number of Assembly Bills considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee of the Whole Assembly¹¹</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>10</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9

57. It may be noted that in addition to the responsible committee assigned a Bill by the Business Committee, the Finance Committee and Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee will also normally consider and report on each Bill introduced in the Assembly, as part of Stage 1 scrutiny.

Pre-legislative scrutiny conducted by committees

58. No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period.

Number of Acts subject to post-legislative scrutiny

59. During this reporting period, there was no work specifically attributed to post-legislative scrutiny although some policy inquiries have included the effect of Welsh Government legislation within their scope.

¹¹ The Committee of the Whole Assembly is comprised of all Assembly Members and is chaired by the Presiding Officer.
Annex A

Data from the year 1 May 2017-31 April 2018

60. Notes on this year

61. In total committees used 89.8% of the available meeting slots between 1 May 2017 and 31 April 2018

62. The individual committees’ use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in Table 1 (2017-18) below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Slots available</th>
<th>Slots used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee¹²¹³</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>494</td>
<td>387</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 (2017-18)

63. In total, Committees formally met 322 times between May 2017 and April 2018

¹² External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.

¹³ Includes meetings of the Sub-Committee on the Regulation of Registered Social Landlords (Wales) Bill which during its existence had access to 5 slots and used 4 of these.
The total number of formal meetings held by each committee is set out in Table 2 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Formal Meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee$^{14}$</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 (2017-18)

1. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2016 to April 2017 period is set out in Table 3 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quarter</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 April - 30 June 2017</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 July- 30 September 2017</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 October- 31 December 2017</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 January- 31 March 2018</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^{14}$ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.
Table 3 (2017-2018)

65. A similar breakdown of formal meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assembly Term</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summer 2017</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autumn 2017</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2018</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>322</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 (2017-18)

66. Table 5 (2017-18) also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>28 September 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>1 February 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>18 May 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>22 June 2017</td>
<td>Maesteg</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>28 September 2017</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>4 October 2017</td>
<td>Cardiff Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>12 October 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>30 November 2017</td>
<td>Edinburgh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>18 January 2018</td>
<td>Swansea and Gower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>27 October 2017</td>
<td>Cwmbran</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>16 February 2018</td>
<td>Newtown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>28 February 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>11 May 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>15 June 2017</td>
<td>Glasgow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>5 October 2017</td>
<td>Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>8 February 2018</td>
<td>North Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>17 January 2018</td>
<td>Cardiff &amp; Newport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>31 January 2018</td>
<td>Neath Port Talbot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>26 June 2017</td>
<td>Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>16 October 2017</td>
<td>Brussels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>5 February 2018</td>
<td>London</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>15 June 2017</td>
<td>Edinburgh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>13 July 2017</td>
<td>Beaumaris</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>6 April 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>7 December 2017</td>
<td>Newport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>12 June 2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>3 July 20178</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 (2017-18)
A further 10 informal activities took place on the Assembly Estate between May 2017 and April 2018. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6 (2017-18)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nature of event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>24 January 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>20 September 2017</td>
<td>Informal Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>14 March 2017</td>
<td>Stakeholder Workshop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>18 September 2017</td>
<td>Stakeholder event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>8 March 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>18 September 2017</td>
<td>Stakeholder event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>4 December 2017</td>
<td>Seminar Session (Informal)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>29 January 2018</td>
<td>Informal meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>25 January 2018</td>
<td>Stakeholder event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>18 September 2018</td>
<td>Networking event</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 (2017-18)

Using the broad categories defined in para 48-45 above, we can say that between May 2017 and April 2018 the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 700 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 98 hours. From this it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 7:1.15

Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 8 minutes and 24 seconds of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.

15 This has been rounded. The calculation is actually 7.142857143 to 1.
70. Table 7 (2017-18) sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2017 and April 2018.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Policy Scrutiny</th>
<th>Primary Legislation</th>
<th>Subordinate Legislation</th>
<th>Financial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Menoranda</th>
<th>Post Legislative Scrutiny</th>
<th>Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CYPE</td>
<td>03:10:20</td>
<td>00:11:45</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:25</td>
<td>00:00:45</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:40</td>
<td>00:01:30</td>
<td>04:09:25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCERA</td>
<td>03:23:40</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:30</td>
<td>00:05:10</td>
<td>04:10:50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFM</td>
<td>00:06:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>00:07:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWLC</td>
<td>00:07:05</td>
<td>00:01:35</td>
<td>00:00:50</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:05</td>
<td>00:09:35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIS</td>
<td>03:04:35</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:30</td>
<td>00:03:35</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:30</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>03:14:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELGC</td>
<td>03:12:50</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:00</td>
<td>00:00:20</td>
<td>00:06:25</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:02:10</td>
<td>04:03:45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAAL</td>
<td>03:01:15</td>
<td>00:10:50</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:09:25</td>
<td>04:00:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fin</td>
<td>03:01:15</td>
<td>00:04:25</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:09:25</td>
<td>03:17:35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCS</td>
<td>01:11:35</td>
<td>00:15:40</td>
<td>00:01:30</td>
<td>01:02:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:06:25</td>
<td>03:13:15</td>
<td>03:13:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pet</td>
<td>02:20:15</td>
<td>00:19:20</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:09:25</td>
<td>00:00:15</td>
<td>00:00:20</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:25</td>
<td>04:06:00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>01:00:50</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:15</td>
<td>01:01:05</td>
<td>01:01:05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SoC</td>
<td>02:22:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:15:10</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:45</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:40</td>
<td>03:18:35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>29:04:55</strong></td>
<td><strong>04:02:10</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:05:50</strong></td>
<td><strong>02:23:20</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:02:35</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:08:30</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:12:40</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:21:10</strong></td>
<td><strong>08:06:25</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>74.4%</td>
<td>10.4%</td>
<td>0.6%</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
<td>0.3%</td>
<td>0.9%</td>
<td>1.3%</td>
<td>4.6%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 (2017-18)
71. Between May 2017 and April 2018, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 2 days and 23 hours – or 71 hours. That is 7.5% of the time that committees sat.

72. Table 9 (2017-18) shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Number of Assembly Bills considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee of the Whole Assembly</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 (2017-18)

73. No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period.
Annex B

Data from the year 1 May 2016 – 31 April 2017

74. It should be noted that the majority of committees did not meet in May and June 2016, as committees were being established and the committee timetable developed and agreed during this period.

75. In total committees used 90.3% of the available meeting slots between 1 May 2016 and 31 April 2017

76. The individual committees’ use of meeting slots (including both those used formal meetings and informal activities) are detailed in Table 1 (2016-17) below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Slots available</th>
<th>Slots used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee¹⁶</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>288</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 (2016-17)

77. In total, Committees formally met 250 times between May 2016 and April 2017

¹⁶ External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.
78. The total number of formal meetings held by each committee is set out in Table 2 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Formal Meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills Committee</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petitions Committee</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standards of Conduct Committee</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>250</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 (2016-17)

2. The total number of formal committee meetings held within particular quarters of the May 2016 to April 2017 period is set out in Table 3 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Quarter</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 April - 30 June 2016</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 July- 30 September 2016</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 October- 31 December 2016</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 January- 31 March 2017</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>250</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

17 External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee was originally titled Reserve Policy and Legislation Committee.
**Table 3 (2016-2017)**

79. A similar breakdown of formal meetings by Assembly Term is laid out in Table 4 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assembly Term</th>
<th>Number of committee meetings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Summer 2016</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Autumn 2016</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spring 2017</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 4 (2016-17)**

80. Table 5 (2016-17) also reflects that on occasion, committees have met or otherwise gathered evidence in multiple locations across Wales on the same date. This could involve a committee as a whole meeting in multiple locations, or could involve a committee splitting up its members to gather evidence in multiple places, and report back to the committee. For example, on 9 February 2017, Members of the Children, Young People and Education Committee met with parents at two separate locations to support the committee’s scrutiny of the general principles of the Additional Learning Needs and Education Tribunal (Wales) Bill.18

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>26/01/2017</td>
<td>City Hall, Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>09/02/2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>22/09/2016</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>24/11/2016</td>
<td>North Wales sites (starting and ending in Bangor)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>26/01/2017</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>02/03/2017</td>
<td>Sites in Pembrokeshire</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

18 A summary of key points raised at the events is available at http://www.senedd.assembly.wales/documents/s60571/Event%20with%20Parents%209%20February%202017%20Summary%20of%20Evidence.pdf
Table 5 (2016-17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Nature of event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee</td>
<td>20/03/2017</td>
<td>Newport City Campus, University of Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>28/09/2016</td>
<td>Cardiff Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>08/12/2016</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>17/02/2017</td>
<td>Trinity St David’s University, Carmarthen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills</td>
<td>09/03/2017</td>
<td>Shrewsbury</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy, Infrastructure and Skills</td>
<td>29/09/2016</td>
<td>Nantgarw and Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities</td>
<td>01/12/216</td>
<td>Glasgow &amp; Edinburgh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities</td>
<td>05/10/2016</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities</td>
<td>17/11/2016</td>
<td>Across Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities</td>
<td>25/01/2017</td>
<td>Cardiff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>28/11/2016</td>
<td>Wrexham</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>23/06/2017</td>
<td>Newport City Campus, University of South Wales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>21/09/2016</td>
<td>Cardiff Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>05/12/2016</td>
<td>Cardiff Bay</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>20/03/2017</td>
<td>Newport</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

81. A further 8 informal activities took place on the Assembly Estate between May 2016 and April 2017. A breakdown of such activities is detailed in Table 6 (2016-17)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Event Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>28/09/2016</td>
<td>Stakeholder Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>20/10/2016</td>
<td>Informal meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee</td>
<td>06/10/2016</td>
<td>Stakeholder Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister</td>
<td>20/09/2016</td>
<td>Informal meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee</td>
<td>16/11/2016</td>
<td>Stakeholder Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>29/09/2016</td>
<td>Informal meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee</td>
<td>27/03/2017</td>
<td>Stakeholder Conference</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>15/09/2016</td>
<td>Informal Meeting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Accounts Committee</td>
<td>12/09/2016</td>
<td>Informal Meeting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 (2016-17)

82. Using the broad categories defined in para 48-45 above, we can say that between May 2016 and April 2017 the total time allocated in committee agendas for policy scrutiny was 362 hours. In the same period, the total time allocated in agendas for legislative scrutiny was 115 hours. From this it can be determined that the ratio of policy scrutiny to legislative scrutiny was 3:1.

83. Or it could be said that for each hour of Policy Scrutiny that was scheduled on committee agendas, on average, 19 minutes of Legislation Scrutiny was scheduled on committee agendas.

84. Table 7 (2016-17) sets out a breakdown of formal committee activity as allocated in committee agendas between May 2016 and April 2017.

---

19 This has been rounded down. The calculation is actually 3.147826086956522 to 1.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Policy Scrutiny</th>
<th>Primary Legislation</th>
<th>Subordinate Legislation</th>
<th>Financial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Scrutiny of Legislative Consent Menoranda</th>
<th>Post Legislative Scrutiny</th>
<th>Standalone Ministerial Scrutiny</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CYPE</td>
<td>01:08:55</td>
<td>00:22:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:30</td>
<td>00:01:10</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:00</td>
<td>00:09:30</td>
<td>02:23:35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCERA</td>
<td>01:05:35</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:45</td>
<td>00:00:10</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:30</td>
<td>01:02:30</td>
<td>02:12:30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFM</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:45</td>
<td>00:06:55</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLA</td>
<td>00:22:15</td>
<td>00:07:35</td>
<td>00:02:35</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:15</td>
<td>01:12:40</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWLC</td>
<td>01:13:15</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:20</td>
<td>00:00:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:02:00</td>
<td>00:17:35</td>
<td>02:12:15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EIS</td>
<td>02:00:06</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:45</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:00</td>
<td>00:10:40</td>
<td>02:19:31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELGC</td>
<td>01:09:55</td>
<td>00:15:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:00</td>
<td>00:00:15</td>
<td>00:09:35</td>
<td>00:05:45</td>
<td>00:07:40</td>
<td>03:04:40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EAAL</td>
<td>01:17:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:05</td>
<td>01:20:10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fin</td>
<td>00:04:05</td>
<td>01:21:10</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>01:05:20</td>
<td>00:00:30</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:00</td>
<td>00:17:50</td>
<td>04:01:55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HSCS</td>
<td>01:11:30</td>
<td>01:00:25</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:04:20</td>
<td>00:01:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:45</td>
<td>00:09:50</td>
<td>03:06:55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pet</td>
<td>00:12:37</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:30</td>
<td>00:14:07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PAC</td>
<td>02:01:05</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:01:05</td>
<td>00:14:05</td>
<td>02:16:10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SoC</td>
<td>00:03:15</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:00:00</td>
<td>00:03:55</td>
<td>00:07:10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>14:13:38</strong></td>
<td><strong>04:19:10</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:02:35</strong></td>
<td><strong>02:03:00</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:04:15</strong></td>
<td><strong>00:09:35</strong></td>
<td><strong>01:01:10</strong></td>
<td><strong>05:09:10</strong></td>
<td><strong>28:14:33</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 (2016-17)
85. Between May 2016 and April 2017, Ministers were scrutinised by committees in formal meetings for a total of 3 days and 22 hours – or 94 hours. That is 13.8% of the time that committees sat.

86. Table 9 (2016-17) shows which committees have been assigned Bills during this reporting period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee</th>
<th>Number of Assembly Bills considered</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Children, Young People and Education Committee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance Committee</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health, Social Care and Sport Committee</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 9 (2016-17)

87. No Welsh Government draft Bills were subject to pre-legislative scrutiny during this reporting period. However, the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee and External Affairs and Additional Legislation Committee both initiated inquiries into the constitutional and legislative implications of the UK Government’s White Paper on the ‘Great Repeal Bill,’ during this reporting period.

88. During this reporting period, the Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee undertook a post-legislative inquiry into the Violence against Women, Domestic Abuse and Sexual Violence (Wales) Act 2015, reporting in December 2016.

89. In addition, in February 2017 the Climate Change, Environment and Rural Affairs Committee’s Expert Reference Group on Climate Change met for the first time. This group was established to provide support to the Committee to scrutinise the progress of the Welsh Government in meeting its targets on climate change mitigation, including post-legislative scrutiny of the Environment (Wales) Act 2016 and the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015.