



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

# Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Cydraddoldeb, Llywodraeth Leol a  
Chymunedau](#)

[The Equality, Local Government and  
Communities Committee](#)

11/10/2017

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)  
[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)  
[Committee Transcripts](#)

## Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau  
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 4 Ymchwiliad i Dlodi yng Nghymru: Gwneud i'r Economi Weithio i'r  
Rheini sydd ag Incwm Isel—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 10  
Inquiry into Poverty in Wales: Making the Economy Work for People on  
Low Incomes—Evidence Session 10
- 45 Papurau i'w Nodi  
Papers to Note
- 45 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o  
Weddill y Cyfarfod ac o'r Cyfarfod ar 19 Hydref 2017  
Motion under Standing Order 17.42(vi) to Resolve to Exclude the  
Public from the Remainder of the Meeting and from the Meeting on 19  
October 2017

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w tystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Gareth Bennett	UKIP Cymru
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	UKIP Wales
John Griffiths	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor)
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour (Committee Chair)
Sian Gwenllian	Plaid Cymru
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	The Party of Wales
Bethan Jenkins	Plaid Cymru
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	The Party of Wales
Rhianon Passmore	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour
Joyce Watson	Llafur
<a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>	Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Meirion Davies	Cyfarwyddwr Datblygu, Menter Iaith Conwy, yn cynrychioli'r Mentrau Iaith Development Director, Menter Iaith Conwy, representing Mentrau Iaith
Angharad Mair	Cyfarwyddwr Gweithredol, Tinopolis Executive Director, Tinopolis Cymru

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Chloe Davies	Dirprwy Clerc Deputy Clerk
Megan Jones	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Naomi Stocks	Clerc Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:30.*  
*The meeting began at 09:30.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau**  
**Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest**

[1] **John Griffiths:** Welcome, everyone, to this meeting of the Equality, Local Government and Communities Committee, and the first item on our agenda today is introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest. We've received one apology from Janet Finch-Saunders. Are there any declarations of interest? No.

**Ymchwiliad i Dlodi yng Nghymru: Gwneud i'r Economi Weithio i'r**  
**Rheini sydd ag Incwm Isel—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 10**  
**Inquiry into Poverty in Wales: Making the Economy Work for People on**  
**Low Incomes—Evidence Session 10**

[2] **John Griffiths:** Then, we will move on to item 2, the committee's inquiry into poverty in Wales, making the economy work for people on low incomes. This is the ninth evidence session of this inquiry. I'm very pleased to welcome Angharad Mair, executive director, Tinopolis Cymru, and Meirion Davies, development director, Menter Iaith Conwy, representing *mentrau iaith*. Croeso to the committee this morning.

[3] **Ms Mair:** Diolch.

[4] **Mr Davies:** Diolch yn fawr.

[5] **John Griffiths:** Perhaps I could begin questions by asking the witnesses for an overview, really, of the specific economic situation in Welsh-speaking communities, with a particular focus on employment opportunities. What would you say is the current picture?

[6] **Ms Mair:** Wel, os gallaf roi **Ms Mair:** Well, if I could give you rhywfaint o gefndir y cwmni, i some of the company's background, ddechrau, rŷm ni'n un o gwmnïau first of all, we are one of the largest mwyaf teledu annibynnol Ewrop a'r independent television companies in Unol Daleithiau. Yn yr Unol Europe and the US. In the United Daleithiau, rydym ni'n cynhyrchu States, we produce programming for rhaglenni ar gyfer y prif rwydweithiau all the main networks. In London, i gyd. Yn Llundain, mae rhai o'n some of our companies are some of cwmnïau ni yn rhai o'r rhai mwyaf the most prominent and well-known blaenllaw ac adnabyddus yn y in the creative industries: for

diwydiant creadigol: er enghraifft, Mentorn sy'n cynhyrchu *Question Time*, *Sunset* and *Vine* sy'n un o'r cynhyrchwyr mwyaf blaenllaw ym myd chwaraeon. Ond mae gwreiddiau'r cwmni yn Tinopolis Cymru, ac yn Llanelli rŷm ni'n cyflogi dros 100 o bobl er mwyn cyflenwi rhaglenni, yn bennaf i S4C. Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol iawn ein bod ni mewn ardal ddifreintiedig iawn, ôl-ddiwydiannol, wrth gwrs. Mae yna dlodi mawr yn ardal Llanelli, ac rŷm ni'n browd iawn o'r ffaith, er ein bod ni wedi tyfu i fod yn gwmni mawr rhyngwladol, gyda chwmni yn Llanelli—y cwmni teledu rhanbarthol mwyaf y tu allan i Lundain—rŷm ni'n browd iawn o'r ffaith ein bod ni yn hyrwyddo'r ffaith bod ein pencadlys ni yng nghanol tref Llanelli. Ac, yn ogystal â'r gwaith rŷm ni'n ei wneud yn cyflenwi rhaglenni teledu, mae ochr ddigidol Tinopolis Rhyngweithiol gyda ni hefyd, ac mae'r sialensiau sy'n wynebu'r cwmni, o safbwynt y ddwy adran ychydig bach yn wahanol, ond mae'n siŵr ddown ni i drafod y rheini yn y man.

[7] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Meirion.

[8] **Mr Davies:** Rydw i'n gweithio i Fenter Iaith Conwy, ond rydw i yma yn cynrychioli'r holl fentrau iaith ar draws y wlad. Fel yr ydych chi yn ei wybod, cyrff cymunedol, yn aml trydydd sector, ydy'r mentrau iaith sy'n creu cyfleoedd, fel arfer, i bobl cael defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Mae

example, Mentorn, who produce *Question Time*, *Sunset* and *Vine*, one of the most prominent producers in sport. But the company is rooted in Tinopolis Cymru, and in Llanelli we employ over 100 people in order to provide programming, mainly for S4C. We are highly aware that we are in a very disadvantaged, post-industrial area. There is huge poverty in the Llanelli area, and we're very proud of the fact that, although we have grown to be a large international company—the largest regional company outside of London, based in Llanelli—we're very proud of the fact that we are promoting the fact that our headquarters is in Llanelli town centre. And, in addition to the work that we do in providing programming for television, there is the digital arm of Tinopolis Interactive, and the challenges facing the company, in terms of both departments, is slightly different, and I'm sure we'll come to that.

**Mr Davies:** I work for Menter Iaith Conwy, but I am here representing all the *mentrau iaith* across the country. As you know, we are community-based organisations, very often third sector organisations, that create opportunities for people to use the Welsh language. The situation of the

sefyllfa'r Gymraeg yn wahanol iawn ar draws y wlad, felly rydym ni'n ymateb yn benodol mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Ond y peth pwysig ydy ein bod ni i gyd yn sylfaenol yma i gryfhau sefyllfa'r Gymraeg yn y gymuned.

Welsh language, of course, is very different in various parts of the country, so we respond in different ways in different areas. But the important thing is that we are all fundamentally there to strengthen the position of the Welsh language in the community.

[9] Wedyn, efallai mae rhai o'r mentrau iaith mwyaf datblygedig, ar ben y gwaith o greu cyfleoedd bob dydd, y clybiau ac yn y blaen—rydym ni hefyd yn edrych ar gryfhau'r Gymraeg trwy ddatblygu cyfleoedd economaidd. Yn gyffredinol, i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, efallai, o ran cyfleoedd gyflogaeth a chymunedau canran uchel, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r cymunedau canran uchel i gyd yn yr ardal Amcan 1, sydd yn dynodi bod y *GDP* yn is yn fanna. Felly mae hynny, yn ei hun, yn broblem. Rydw i o'r farn, beth bynnag, mai hwn ydy un o'r prif broblemau o ran y Gymraeg, o ran gwanhau'r Gymraeg, oherwydd diffyg cyfleoedd swyddi. Rydym ni'n gweld colli siaradwyr Cymraeg ifanc, sydd efo'r Gymraeg yn iaith gyntaf. O'r gwaith yr oedd Delyth Morris wedi'i wneud ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl ym Mhrifysgol Bangor, yr amcangyfrif ydy bod tua thraean o blant a oedd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg yn 1991 wedi gadael Cymru erbyn rŵan, ac nid yw honno'n fath o sefyllfa medrwn ni fod yn mynd ymlaen ac ymlaen efo. Yn genedlaethol, yr amcangyfrif ydy ein bod ni'n colli tua 2,500 o siaradwr Cymraeg bob blwyddyn. Rydym ni'n

So, perhaps some of the most developed *mentrau iaith*, on top of the work of creating everyday opportunities, the clubs and so on—we are also looking at strengthening the Welsh language by developing economic opportunities. Now, generally speaking, to respond to your question, in terms of employment opportunities and communities where there are high percentages of Welsh speakers, well, most of those high-percentage communities are in the Objective 1 area, which denotes that the gross domestic product is low there, or lower, and that is a problem in and of itself. I'm of the opinion that this is one of the main problems in terms of the Welsh language, and the weakening of the Welsh language, because of a lack of job opportunities in those areas. We are seeing young Welsh speakers who have Welsh as a first language leaving those areas. The work that Delyth Morris did a few years ago at Bangor University estimates that around a third of Welsh-speaking children in 1991 have now left Wales, and that's not the kind of situation that is sustainable for the future. Nationally,

colli oherwydd bod pobl yn marw, felly nid oes dim byd llawer a fedrwn ni ei wneud am hynny. Ond, o beth ydw i'n ei weld, nid oes yna strategaeth yna i stopio'r allfudiad o siaradwyr Cymraeg ifanc.

the estimate is that we're losing around 2,500 Welsh speakers per annum. We are losing people because of death—of course, there's not much we can do about that. But, from what I can see, there is no strategy there to stop the out-migration of young Welsh speakers.

[10] Hefyd, beth sydd ar goll ydy'r bwlch mawr yma rhwng y buddsoddiad enfawr sydd wedi bod mewn addysg Gymraeg a'r buddsoddiad mwy sy'n mynd i fod rŵan, gobeithio, a'r byd gwaith. Felly, beth yr ydych chi'n ei gael ydy lot fawr o bobl ifanc sy'n mynd trwy addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg—ac mae hyn efallai'n fwy gwir am yr ardaloedd di-Gymraeg na'r ardaloedd Cymraeg—maen nhw'n gadael yr ysgol ac wedyn nid ydyn nhw byth yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg eto. Ond, ar yr un pryd, rydym ni fel siaradwyr Cymraeg yn cael diffyg gwasanaethau difrifol. Mae'n anodd iawn i ni allu cael gofal plant cyfrwng Cymraeg, gofal henoed cyfrwng Cymraeg, gwasanaethau dros y ffôn, ac yn y blaen ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae yna ddwy broblem yn y fanna, ac rydw i'n meddwl, os ydych chi'n dod â nhw at ei gilydd, o bosib, bydd gennych chi ateb o ran bod y Gymraeg yn gallu cael ei gweld fel rhyw fath o—yn cael ei chydabod yn ddilys fel sgil a rhywbeth mae pobl eisiau yn eu bywydau.

What's also missing is this gap between the huge investment in Welsh-medium education and the even larger investment that we're likely to see now, hopefully, and the world of employment. What you have is very many young people who go through Welsh-medium education—and this is perhaps truer of the non-Welsh-speaking areas than the traditional heartlands—they leave school and then they never use the Welsh language again. But, simultaneously, we as Welsh speakers do suffer a severe lack of services. It's very difficult for Welsh speakers to access Welsh-medium childcare, for example, care for older people, telephone services, and so on and so forth. So, there are two problems there, and I think that, if you brought both of them together, you might find a solution in that the Welsh language could be seen, and could be recognised, as a skill, and something that people need and want in their lives.

[11] O'n profiad ni ar lawr gwlad, fel Menter Iaith Conwy, rydym ni wedi

From our experience on the ground, as Menter Iaith Conwy, we have been

gallu ymateb i'r sefyllfa drwy greu mentrau cymdeithasol newydd i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Bu i ni sefydlu cwmni cyfieithu, Cyfieithu Cymunedol—mae gennym ni rywun oedd yn arfer gweithio i'r cwmni yn y fan acw—sy'n hyfforddi pobl i gyfieithu ond hefyd yn darparu cyfieithu rhatach i'r gymuned, oherwydd roeddem ni'n gweld bod angen hynny, cyfieithu ar bris is i'r trydydd sector a'r sector cymunedol. Mae hefyd yn gwneud gwaith masnachol, wrth gwrs, er mwyn caniatáu i'r cwmni fodoli, felly.

[12] Hefyd, rydym ni wedi sefydlu meithrinfa cyfrwng Cymraeg. Roeddem ni'n gweld yn ardal Conwy, ar yr arfordir, oherwydd demograffeg yr arfordir, lle mae'r Gymraeg, efallai, yn iaith leiafrifol o'i chymharu â'r ardal wledig, nad oedd dim darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg i blant—gofal dydd, felly. Mi ddaru inni fuddsoddi arian ein hunain i gyflogi rhywun i ddatblygu'r project, ac rydw i'n falch iawn o ddweud y gwnaeth hynny esgor ar fenter gymdeithasol newydd gwerth tua £300,000 trwy arian grant, adeilad, ac, erbyn heddiw, mae'r adeilad yn cyflogi 10 o bobl ac mae 30 o blant yn cael gofal bob dydd. Hefyd, rydym ni'n gwybod bod yna ddwy o ferched ifanc yn fanna oedd wedi bod yn Ysgol y Creuddyn. Roedden nhw'n anhyderus iawn eu Cymraeg achos nad oedden nhw wedi defnyddio eu Cymraeg ers nifer o flynyddoedd, ond, ar ôl dod i

able to respond to the situation by creating new social enterprises to provide services. We established a translation company, Cyfieithu Cymunedol—we have someone who used to work for the company sitting over there—which trains people as translators, but also provides cheaper translation for the community, because we saw that that was necessary to provide translation at a reduced price to the community sector and the third sector. It is also involved with commercial work in order to allow the company to succeed and exist.

We've also established a Welsh-medium nursery. We saw in the Conwy area, on the coast, because of the demographics of the area, where the Welsh language is a minority language compared to the more rural inland areas, there was no Welsh-medium provision for day care for children. We invested our own funds in employing someone to develop that project, and I'm very pleased to say that that brought forward a new social enterprise worth around £300,000 through grant funding, a building, and, by now, the building employs 10 people, and there are 30 children being cared for on a daily basis. We also know that there are two young women there who went to Ysgol y Creuddyn who were not confident at all in their Welsh language skills, because they hadn't used the language for many years, but, having come into that



mewn i'r awyrgylch yna, o fewn mis, roedden nhw'n hollol hyderus oherwydd eu bod nhw'n defnyddio'r Gymraeg bob dydd.

[13] Felly, mae'r rheini jest yn ddwy esiamp o sut ydym ni wedi defnyddio'r Gymraeg i greu swyddi, oherwydd bod yna angen am wasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rydym ni hefyd wedi gwneud rhywfaint o waith efo'r sector awyr agored, sydd yn rhywbeth sydd yn tyfu yn y gogledd orllewin. Tua saith, wyth mlynedd yn ôl, gwnaeth Prifysgol Bangor astudiaeth i'r maes, ac ond 5 y cant o'r gweithlu ar y pryd a oedd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg mewn ardal—y siroedd gorllewinol rŵan, Môn, Gwynedd a Chonwy. Mae'r ganran ar gyfartaledd sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn y siroedd yna tua 55 y cant, ac ond 5 y cant o'r gweithlu awyr agored a oedd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg. Mae yna resymau diwylliannol am hynny: pobl yn ei weld o fel maes, efallai, Seisnigaidd; yn hanesyddol, pan oedd yr holl faes yn cychwyn, efallai roedd y brodorion wrthi ar y tir ac yn gweithio mewn chwareli, felly, dyna'r peth olaf ar eu meddyliau nhw. Ond, beth bynnag, mae honno wedi datblygu i mewn i sefyllfa lle mae yna leiafrif o'r gymuned frodorol yn gweithio yn y maes. Ond, trwy arian Ewropeaidd, rydym ni wedi gallu rhoi dros 200, ac yn parhau i wneud, trwy hyfforddiant awyr agored, ac mae'r ganran wedi codi i 25 y cant. Mae hynny bach yn wahanol yn y ffaith ein bod ni wedi

environment, within a month, they were entirely confident because they were using the Welsh language on a daily basis.

So, those are just two examples of how we've used the Welsh language to create jobs, because there is a demand for Welsh-medium services. We've also done some work with the outdoor sector, which is something that's developing in the north-west of Wales. Some seven or eight years ago, Bangor University carried out a study into the area, and it was only 5 per cent of the workforce that were able to speak Welsh in the area—in the western counties of Anglesey, Gwynedd and Conwy. The percentage speaking Welsh in those areas is around 55 per cent, and only 5 per cent of the outdoor pursuits workforce could speak Welsh. There are cultural reasons for that: people seeing it as an area that was anglicised, perhaps; historically, when the whole area developed, maybe the indigenous population were working on the land or in quarries, and it was the last thing on their minds. However, that has developed into a situation where a minority of the indigenous community work in that area. But, through European funding, we have been able to provide training for around 200 in outdoor pursuits, and the percentage is up to 25 per cent now. That's slightly different in the fact that we have seen a sector that is important for the area, an area where

gweld sector sy'n bwysig i'r ardal, there are high-percentage ardal lle mae yna gymunedau canran communities, and we've tried to uchel, ac wedyn wedi trio grasp that sector for the benefit of meddiannu'r sector yna er mwyn lles local communities. y cymunedau lleol.

[14] Felly, i ateb eich cwestiwn chi, So, to answer your question, the mae'r sefyllfa gyflogaeth yn employment situation is weakening gwanhau'r Gymraeg yn ddifrifol o un the Welsh language from one genhedlaeth i'r llall, felly mae angen generation to the next, and we ymyrraeth bellach. Rydym ni'n gweld therefore need further intervention. bod yna gyfleoedd yna, felly. We do see that there are opportunities available there.

[15] **John Griffiths:** Okay, thanks for that. In terms of low-paid work in Welsh-speaking communities, communities with a high level of Welsh speaking, do you consider that the prevalence of low-paid work in those areas is greater than the rest of Wales?

[16] **Mr Davies:** Rydw i'n meddwl, **Mr Davies:** I think, if you take os ydych chi'n cymryd Gwynedd fel Gwynedd as an example, from my esiamp, o beth rydw i'n ei ddeall, understanding, Gwynedd has the Gwynedd sydd efo'r cyflogau isaf a lowest average wage and Gwynedd is the area where there is the highest cymunedau Cymraeg uchel ac, os proportion of Welsh-speaking rydw i'n iawn, Gwynedd ydy'r sir efo'r communities and, if I'm right, Gwynedd has the lowest average cyflogau isaf. Ar yr un pryd, nid yw wage. Whilst unemployment isn't diweithdra ddim mor uchel â hynny, particularly high, salary levels are ond mae lefel y cyflog yn gymharol relatively low. That is a problem, of isel, felly. Mae hynny eto yn broblem course, in that has a knock-on effect o ran bod hynny wedyn yn cael in terms of people's ability to buy sgileffaith o ran gallu pobl i brynu tai homes and in terms of the capital a hefyd o ran y cyfalaf yna mae pobl that people need to establish ei angen i gychwyn busnesau a bod businesses and to be innovative. Very yn fentrus. Yn aml iawn, mae pobl often, people are tied into their jobs jest wedi eu clymu i mewn i swyddi and there is no opportunity to show ac nid oes cyfle i fod yn fentrus, felly. initiative.

[17] **John Griffiths:** And would you cite any particular reasons for the prevalence of low-paid work in Gwynedd? Is it historical, is it the rural

nature, is it tourism?

[18] **Mr Davies:** Ie, y rheini i gyd. Os cymerwch chi Wynedd fel esiamp—wel, y gogledd—orllewin—rydych chi'n sôn am ardal amaethyddol a hefyd rydych chi'n sôn am ardal lle rydym ni'n ddibynnol iawn ar dwristiaeth. Hefyd, mae'n ardal ôl-ddiwydiannol, lle mae'r diwydiannau, maen nhw'n dal yna, rhai ohonyn nhw—rydw i fy hun yn byw ym Methesda, yn nyffryn Ogwen, felly; mae'r chwarel yn dal yna, ond cysgod bach ydy o o beth oedd yna. So, mae gennych chi'r holl ffactorau yma, a dweud y gwir, a chysylltiadau trafndiaeth gwael.

**Mr Davies:** Yes, all of those things. If you took Gwynedd as an example, and the north-west more generally, you're talking about an agricultural area, you're also talking of an area where we are highly reliant on tourism, and also a post-industrial area, where the industries, some of them, are still there—I myself live in Bethesda, in the Ogwen valley, and the quarry is still there, but it's a shadow of its former self. So, you have all of these factors coming into play, and you have poor transport connections.

[19] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Thanks very much for that, then. We'll move on, and we have some questions from Rhianon Passmore.

[20] **Rhianon Passmore:** Thank you. The Welsh Government's new economic strategy takes a regional approach, and you've mentioned some very specific areas of Wales where there are relatively high levels of Welsh-speaking communities. Could you just quantify the scale across Wales in terms of those Welsh-speaking communities? You mentioned Gwynedd and Conwy, but, just for a wider audience, how many people are we talking about in terms of the Welsh-speaking nation?

[21] **Mr Davies:** Gwynedd sydd efo'r rhan fwyaf o gymunedau 70 y cant—Gwynedd a Môn. Wedyn mae yna un ar ôl yn sir Conwy. Ond wedyn mae yna nifer fawr o gymunedau 50 y cant yng Ngheredigion, sir Gaerfyrddin, gogledd sir Benfro, sir Ddinbych—yr ardal orllewinol. Ond, eto, canrannau rydym yn sôn amdanynt yn fan hyn, canran cymuned. Felly beth sy'n digwydd

**Mr Davies:** Gwynedd has most of those communities where 70 per cent are Welsh speaking—Gwynedd and Anglesey. I think there is one remaining in the county of Conwy. But then there are a number of communities where 50 per cent speak Welsh—in Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire, north Pembrokeshire, Denbighshire—so, that's the western area. But, again,

ydy, os ydych chi'n byw mewn cymuned lle mae'r Gymraeg yn cael ei siarad bob dydd—. Yn fy mywyd pob dydd, prin ydw i'n siarad Saesneg, felly, oherwydd lle rydw i'n byw, ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae hynny'n cael effaith o ran pa mor rhugl mae rhywun yn eu Cymraeg, ac yn y blaen—a'r profiadau rydych chi'n eu cael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y cymunedau yma yn bodoli, ond, ar yr un pryd, mae gennych chi ardaloedd, fel yr ardal yma, lle mae yna niferoedd uchel iawn o siaradwyr Cymraeg, ond mae'n bwysig wedyn fod y siaradwyr Cymraeg yna yn cael yr un cyfleoedd, trwy rwydweithio, i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg. Felly, fy nadl i ydy, petai yna farchnad lafur yn cael ei chreu, marchnad lafur cyfrwng Cymraeg, mi fuasai hi'n anorfod yn cryfhau cymunedau lle mae'r canran yn uchel, ond buasai hefyd yn cryfhau rhwydweithiau ar draws Cymru, felly.

we are talking about percentages here, percentages within a community. So, what happens is, if you live in a community where Welsh is spoken on a daily basis—. In my daily life, I hardly speak English because of where I live and the community surrounding me, and so on. So, that has an impact in terms of fluency in the Welsh language, and the experiences that you have through the medium of Welsh. Therefore it is important that these communities do exist, but simultaneously you do have areas such as this area, where there are very high numbers of Welsh speakers, but it's important then that those Welsh speakers are given the same opportunity, through networking, to use the Welsh language. So, my argument is that, if a Welsh-medium labour market was created, then it would inevitably strengthen communities where the percentage is already high, but it would also strengthen the networks across Wales.

09:45

[22] **Rhianon Passmore:** And one would say that if, for instance, Welsh Government relocated offices into different areas across Wales, you already have that Welsh-speaking labour market there now in terms of translation companies. So, in terms of that economic strategy, are you arguing from the evidence that you've both presented that there should be mandatory social procurement based on Welsh-speaking companies and, if so, how would you manage that so that it's equitable to those percentages in even those communities that are non-Welsh speaking, because poverty has no barriers to a certain extent? We have an equal amount of those across Wales who are Welsh speaking and non-Welsh speaking who are poor, and that's obviously

the focus of our inquiry. I don't know what comment you would have in that regard.

[23] **Ms Mair:** Rwy'n meddwl bod hynny'n hollbwysig. Rwy'n meddwl mai un o'r pethau pwysicaf y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud yw sicrhau bod swyddi yn mynd i'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig lle mae yna ganran uchel o bobl yn byw mewn tlodi. I fynd nôl at un o'r cwestiynau cyntaf o ran yr iaith Gymraeg, beth rŷm ni'n wneud yn Tinopolis yw sicrhau mai Cymraeg yw iaith y gweithle. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod pawb yn siarad Cymraeg bob dydd, ac mae hynny felly yn normaleiddio'r iaith. Os ydym ni yn rhoi swydd i rywun sydd ddim yn siarad Cymraeg, rŷm ni felly yn cynnig gwersi Cymraeg yn y gweithle, felly nid ydym yn gorfod mynd allan i chwilio am y gwersi hynny.

**Ms Mair:** I think that's crucially important. It's one of the most important things that the Welsh Government can do to ensure that jobs do go to the most disadvantaged areas where there is a high percentage of people living in poverty. To return to one of the first questions asked in terms of the Welsh language, what we do at Tinopolis is to ensure that Welsh is the language of the workplace. Therefore, it's crucial that everyone speaks Welsh on a daily basis, and that normalises the use of the language. If we do give a job to a non-Welsh speaker, we then offer them Welsh lessons in the workplace, so that they don't have to go out and look for those lessons.

[24] O ran cyflogau isel, wrth gwrs, rŷm ni'n gwmni preifat ac rŷm ni yn gallu talu cyflogau yn ddibynnol ar yr arian sy'n dod mewn i'r cwmni. Yn ein hachos ni gyda rhaglenni teledu—S4C, er enghraifft—rŷm ni i gyd yn gwybod am y toriadau dirfawr fu i S4C yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac rwy'n meddwl ambell waith fod pobl ddim cweit yn deall bod arian sy'n cael ei dorri ar gyfer darlledwr pwysig yn yr iaith Gymraeg yn arian sydd wedyn yn llai i dalu mewn cyflogau i bobl mewn ardal ddifreintiedig fel yr un rydym ni wedi ein sefydlu ynddi yn Llanelli, fel cwmni Tinopolis.

In terms of low wages, of course, we're a private sector company and we can pay salaries dependent on the funds coming in to the company. In our case with television programming—for S4C, for example—we all know of the huge cuts that S4C has faced over the past years, and on occasion I think that people don't quite understand that the funds cut for an important Welsh language broadcaster are money that is then not available to pay in salaries for people in a disadvantaged area such as ours in Llanelli, as Tinopolis.

[25] Ond yn sicr, rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n hanfodol bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod cwmnïau yn symud mewn i'r ardaloedd difreintiedig yma, yn sicrhau felly bod modd i bobl hefyd deithio i'r gwaith. Pan rydych yn siarad am dlodi—. Er enghraifft, gyda ni, os ydym ni yn cyflogi pobl fel rydym ni yn sir Gaerfyrddin, ac mae rhywun yn byw ym Mrynaman ac eisiau teithio i'r gwaith yn Llanelli, mi fyddai hi'n cymryd dwy awr ac 20 munud os buasen nhw'n cymryd bws i wneud hynny, wrth orfod newid o Frynaman i Rydaman, a Rhydaman i Bontarddulais, ac wedyn dod lawr i Lanelli. Dim ond un enghraifft fach yw honno. O ran y trenau, os ydym ni'n cael pobl, er enghraifft, yn dod lawr o Lundain rydym yn dueddol o fynd i'w nôl nhw o Port Talbot achos bod nhw'n gorfod mynd mewn i Abertawe, wedyn newid trê'n fanna. Felly, mae eisiau sicrhau hefyd fod y rhwydweithiau yma yn eu lle.

[26] Ond o safbwynt yr iaith Gymraeg, rwy'n meddwl bod eisiau ni fod yn llawer iawn mwy hyderus. Mae angen inni ddweud, 'Mae yna werth i'r iaith Gymraeg.' Mae'r iaith Gymraeg nid yn unig yn sgil, ond mae yna werth i'r sgil hwnnw, achos os mai nod Llywodraeth Cymru yw cael 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Gymraeg erbyn 2050, mae angen symud y swyddi allan o Gaerdydd. Mae angen sicrhau bod y swyddi rheini hefyd, nifer fawr ohonyn nhw, yn swyddi

But certainly, I do think that it is crucially important that the Government ensures that companies do move in to these disadvantaged areas, to ensure that it's possible for people to travel to work. When you talk of poverty—. For example, in our case, if we employ people as we do in Carmarthenshire, and someone lives in Brynamman and wants to travel to work in Llanelli, then it would take them two hours and 20 minutes if they were to take a bus, having to change in Ammanford and Pontarddulais, and then get down to Llanelli. That's just one example. In terms of trains, if we have people coming from London, we tend to pick them up at Port Talbot because they would have to go into Swansea and change train there. So, we also need to ensure that these networks and that connectivity is in place.

But in terms of the Welsh language, I do think we need to be far more confident. We need to say that there is a value to the Welsh language. The Welsh language is not only a skill, but there is an inherent value to that skill, because if the Welsh Government's aim is to have 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, we need to move those jobs out of Cardiff. We need to ensure that those jobs, many of them, are jobs that are undertaken through the medium of

sydd yn cael eu gweithredu yn yr Welsh.  
iaith Gymraeg.

[27] **Rhianon Passmore:** Okay, thank you. So, in terms of supporting those on low income, I presume you do employ people that are non-Welsh speaking in your company. Is that correct?

[28] **Ms Mair:** Mae pawb sy'n gweithio yn Tinopolis yn gwybod mai yr iaith Gymraeg yw iaith y cwmni, felly mae yna werth arbennig yn cael ei roi i'r sgîl hwnnw o siarad Cymraeg. A'r rheswm pam dros hynny yw os ydym ni'n siarad am raglenni S4C, arian cyhoeddus sy'n talu am S4C. Rhan o'r rheswm, neu un o'r prif resymau, sefydlwyd S4C oedd er mwyn gwarchod yr iaith Gymraeg.

**Ms Mair:** Everyone who works at Tinopolis knows that the Welsh language is the language of the company, so there is a particular value placed on that skill. And the reason for that is that if we are talking about programmes for S4C, then public money pays for S4C. Part of the rationale, or one of the main reasons for the establishment of S4C was to safeguard the Welsh language.

[29] **Rhianon Passmore:** I do understand that.

[30] **Ms Mair:** Felly, rhan o'r cytundeb cymdeithasol rŷm ni'n ei weld gyda'r arian cyhoeddus hwnnw ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg yw ein bod ni'n hybu hwnnw ac yn creu gwaith yn yr iaith Gymraeg mewn ardal ddiffreintiedig. Felly, mae pawb yn y cwmni yn siarad Cymraeg, neu rŷm ni'n rhoi gwersi Cymraeg iddyn nhw.

**Ms Mair:** Therefore, part of the social contract we see with that public funding for the Welsh language is that we promote that and create employment through the medium of Welsh in a disadvantaged area. So, everyone in the company speaks Welsh, or we provide them with lessons.

[31] **Rhianon Passmore:** Okay. So, obviously, you've not answered my question, but I'll move on from that. In terms of how the Welsh language supports your communities in terms of English and Welsh-speaking communities, the majority of the Welsh-speaking communities in the areas that you highlighted, you would argue strongly that there should be mandatory social procurement for the Welsh language. Is that correct?

[32] **Ms Mair:** Yn bendant.

**Ms Mair:** Most certainly.

[33] **Rhianon Passmore:** Yes, okay, thank you.

[34] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Would you point to any practical ways in which that procurement could be taken forward? Would you have any examples of exactly what you would like to see?

[35] **Ms Mair:** Wel, rwyf yn teimlo ar hyn o bryd fod yna ormod o ganoli yn rhywle fel Caerdydd, mewn swyddi efallai nad oes angen eu canoli nhw yng nghanol y ddinas. Er enghraifft, mae'r swyddfa dreth yn symud mewn i ganol y ddinas. Mae'r BBC yn symud mewn i ganol y ddinas. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn mynd i greu problemau anferthol ar gyfer trafndiaeth yn dod mewn i Gaerdydd, ac nid oes rheswm o gwbl mewn gwirionedd pam na ddylai swyddi pwysig fel yna symud allan o Gaerdydd. Ac, a dweud y gwir, rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn hollbwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn edrych o ddifri ar unrhyw swyddi sydd ganddyn nhw ac yn symud adrannau mas o Gaerdydd i'r ardaloedd difreintiedig er mwyn gallu cyflogi pobl mewn ardaloedd gwahanol o Gymru, ac er mwyn creu Cymru gyfan, ffyniannus, lwyddiannus, yn hytrach na'r canoli sy'n digwydd fwyfwy am ryw reswm yng nghanol Caerdydd, gan greu problemau fan hyn yng Nghaerdydd, yn ogystal â gwneud dim byd i helpu rhai sydd â chyflogau isel mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru.

**Ms Mair:** I do feel at the moment that there is too much centralisation in places such as Cardiff, with jobs that don't necessarily need to be located in the city centre. For example, the tax office is moving into the city centre. The BBC is moving into the city centre. This is clearly going to create huge transport problems travelling into Cardiff, and there is no reason whatsoever why those important jobs should not move out of Cardiff. And, if truth be told, I think it's crucially important that the Government looks in earnest at any jobs that they have and moves departments out of Cardiff into disadvantaged areas in order to employ people in different areas of Wales, and in order to create a prosperous, successful Wales, rather than centralising everything, which seems to be happening more and more in the centre of Cardiff, creating problems here in Cardiff, as well as doing nothing to assist those on low wages in different parts of Wales.

[36] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Diolch yn fawr. We will come to Sian Gwenllian in just a moment to—

[37] **Mr Davies:** A gaf ateb yn gyflym?

**Mr Davies:** Can I just respond quickly?



[38] **John Griffiths:** Sorry, Meirion.

[39] **Mr Davies:** Jest ar lefel hollol ymarferol, esiempl o beth rydych chi'n sôn amdano rŵan ydy bod yna ganolfan alw ym Mhenrhyndeudraeth—ac ym Mhorthmadog, rwy'n meddwl, yr oedd o—a nhw sy'n darparu gwasanaeth ar gyfer Traveline Cymru. Rwy'n gwybod, fel siaradwr Cymraeg, bob tro rwy'n ffonio hwnnw, mi gaf wasanaeth Cymraeg. Ac os nad ydych chi'n siarad Cymraeg, rydych chi'n cael gwasanaeth Saesneg. Ond rwy'n hoffi meddwl bod honno'n esiempl hollol ymarferol lle mae yna gwmni wedi ennill cytundeb gan y Llywodraeth i ddarparu gwasanaeth oherwydd eu bod nhw'n gallu ei wneud o yn y ddwy iaith. Ac mae hynny wedyn yn cryfhau—. Mewn trefi bach fel Penrhyndeudraeth a Phorthmadog, efallai ei fod yn creu 20 o swyddi. Rŵan, mae hwnnw'n fodel ymarferol iawn. Gallech chi gael yr un peth ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog, Llanrwst, Bethesda, Caernarfon, a chreu efallai nid cannoedd o swydd, ond gallech greu 20 o swyddi fan hyn, fan draw a fyddai'n gwneud lot fawr i gynaliadwyedd y Gymraeg a chynaliadwyedd y pentrefi yna.

[40] Rwy'n meddwl bod hwnnw'n fodel hollol ymarferol yn rhywle fel Blaenau Ffestiniog, lle mae 70, 80 y cant o'r bobl yn siarad Cymraeg, ond nid ydynt yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg fel sgîl sy'n mynd i ddod â budd iddyn

**Mr Davies:** Just on an entirely practical level, to give you an example of what you're talking about, there is a call centre in Penrhyndeudraeth—and it was in Porthmadog, I think—and they provide services for Traveline Cymru. I know, as a Welsh speaker, that every time I phone that service, I will get a Welsh-language service. And if you don't speak Welsh, you get an English-language service. But I like to think that that's a very practical example, where a company has gained a contract from Government to provide a service because they were able to provide that service in both languages. And that, in turn, strengthens—. In small towns such as Penrhyndeudraeth and Porthmadog, perhaps it will create 20 jobs. Well, that is a very practical model that you could replicate in Blaenau Ffestiniog, Llanrwst, Bethesda, Caernarfon, and create, perhaps not hundreds of jobs, but creating 20 here, there and elsewhere would do a great deal for the sustainability of the Welsh language, and the sustainability of those towns and villages.

So, I do think that that is a very practical model where, in somewhere like Blaenau Ffestiniog, you have 70 or 80 per cent of the population being Welsh speaking, but they don't use the Welsh language as a skill that

nhw felly. Ond mae honno yn esiampl hollol ymarferol, a mynd â pethau fel yna bach yn bellach, a chynllunio pethau fel yna allan bach yn well, rwy'n meddwl, ydy'r ateb—wel, un ateb.

will bring them economic benefits. But that is a very practical example, and it's taking those kinds of things a little further, and planning them a little better, I think, is the solution—or one solution, at least.

[41] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Diolch yn fawr. As I say, we'll come on to Sian Gwenllian in just a moment on these issues. Before we do, though, in terms of the Welsh-medium labour market that you propose, as Rhianon Passmore said, we've got Welsh Government now taking forward a regional approach to economic development. Could you say a little bit about how the Welsh-medium labour market, as part of that economic strategy, might help low-paid employees, low-paid sections of the community, where Welsh speaking is particularly strong?

[42] **Mr Davies:** Rwy'n meddwl bod yr esiampl rwyf newydd ei rhoi yn esiampl hollol ymarferol felly. Beth buasai'r farchnad lafur yn ei wneud ydy cydnabod bod y Gymraeg yn sgîl, ac wedyn rhoi hwnnw ar waith, a fuasai'n galluogi pobl efallai i fynd mewn i waith sydd yn talu bach yn well. Ac, fel rwy'n dweud, rwy'n gweld e'n gweithio ar draws y wlad, er bod angen iddo fo ddigwydd yn rhanbarthol. Yn elfennol, beth sydd ei angen ydy'r cymhwysedd i gynllunio hyn i gyd, oherwydd mae yna gymaint o bethau ar hyn o bryd yn disgyn rhwng stoliau, ac nid yw'r cysylltiadau yna'n cael eu gwneud o ran gwerth y Gymraeg ac yn y blaen.

**Mr Davies:** I think the example I've just given is a very practical example. What a labour market would do would be to recognise that the Welsh language is a skill, and put that to work, and that would then enable people to get in to employment that perhaps pays slightly better. And, as I say, I see it working across the country, although it does need to happen on a regional level. But, ultimately, what's required is the competence to plan all of this, because there is so much falling between the gaps now, and those connections aren't being made in terms of the value of the Welsh language and so on.

[43] Fel roeddwn yn ei ddweud, rydym yn cael gymaint o golled o bobl ifanc o'r ardaloedd gwledig, a'r ardaloedd trefol, sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg, neu bobl ddim yn mynd ymlaen i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg yn y

But, as I said, we are seeing so many young people who can speak Welsh leaving our rural areas and our towns, or people not going on to use the Welsh language in the world of work. That's not sustainable for us in

byd gwaith. Nid yw hynny'n gynaliadwy i ni yn yr hirdymor. Rydym ni'n eithaf ffodus mewn ffordd fod gennym ni—. Os oeddech yn gwmni, ni fydddech yn cario ymlaen fel yna gan wneud colled bob blwyddyn, neu fydddech yn mynd i ddyled mewn dim. Rydym ni'n lwcus mewn ffordd fod gennym ni dipyn o bres yn y banc o ran faint o siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd yna, ond dyna hanfod y farchnad lafur ac rwy'n ei weld yn ffitio i mewn i unrhyw fath o strategaeth a fuasai gan y Llywodraeth—nid jest ar lefel isel, ond ar lefel uwch hefyd. Mae eisiau i bob lefel gael ei ystyried.

[44] Lle rydym yn dioddef fel siaradwyr Cymraeg yw o ran diffyg gwasanaethau iechyd, er enghraifft, trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Dim ond un doctor yn y *surgery* lle rwy'n byw ym Methesda sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg. Ond eto rwy'n clywed, yn anecdotaidd, am lot o siaradwyr Cymraeg sy'n trio cael i mewn i goleg i lawr yng Nghaerdydd—a phobl efo digon o allu—ond maen nhw'n methu cael i mewn, ac wedyn maen nhw'n cael i mewn i brifysgolion yn Lloegr—Bryste neu Lerpwl—ac nid ych chi byth yn eu gweld nhw eto wedyn. So, mae'r gyfundrefn yn fanna—. Mae angen edrych ar bethau bach fel yna, ond ystyried y farchnad lafur, felly.

[45] Yn fy marn i, mae beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r Gymraeg a gwanhau'r Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol yn arwydd o beth sy'n

the long term. We are quite fortunate in a way that we have—. If you were a company, you wouldn't carry on in that way in making a loss every year, or you would be in debt in no time. We're lucky in a way that we do have some funds in reserve in terms of the number of Welsh speakers available, but that is the nature of the labour market and I see it fitting into any strategy that the Government may have—not just at a low level, but also at a higher level. We need all levels to be taken into account.

One area where we as Welsh speakers suffer is in the shortage of health services, for example, through the medium of Welsh. There's only one doctor in the surgery in Bethesda, where I live, who can speak Welsh. But I hear anecdotally of many Welsh speakers who do try to get into the medical college in Cardiff—these are people who have plenty of ability—but they can't get into university in Cardiff, so then they go to England—Bristol or Liverpool—and you never see them again. So, that system—. We need to look at small issues such as that and consider the labour market in that context too.

In my view, what has happened to the Welsh language and the weakening of the Welsh language as a community language is also a symbol of what's

digwydd i Gymru yn ehangach o ran bod pethau'n cael eu canoli i ffwrdd o yma—mae gwasanaethau yn mynd allan o yma. So, mae angen inni edrych ar y pethau yma mewn ffordd sydd bach yn fwy strwythuredig. Rydym ni, fel siaradwyr Cymraeg, efallai am ein bod ni mor ynghlwm efo systemau Prydeinig, yn cael ein chwalu i'r pedwar gwynt. Mae hynny'n amlwg iawn—mae pobl yn cael eu denu i ffwrdd oherwydd bod gan y Gymraeg ddim digon o werth yng Nghymru felly.

[46] **Ms Mair:** O ran strategaeth ranbarthol hefyd, rwy'n meddwl bod honno'n rhywbeth i'w chroesawu os yw'n golygu y bydd rhai prosiectau, a oedd ar un adeg yn fwy o brosiectau cenedlaethol, yn awr yn gallu cael eu torri'n llai fel bod mwy o gyfleoedd gan gwmnïau llai i fynd am y swyddi yma. Er enghraifft, roeddem ni'n sôn ar ddechrau'r sesiwn yma fod problemau sy'n wynebu'r ochr deledu a'r ochr ryngweithiol gyda ni rhywfaint yn wahanol, wel, un o'r pethau sy'n anodd i'r ochr ryngweithiol yn Llanelli yw, achos bod cyn lleied o gwmnïau tebyg yn yr un ardal, nad yw hi'n ardal lle mae pobl yn dewis gweithio. Maen nhw'n dewis mynd i ardaloedd lle mae mwy o'r un cwmnïau yn gwneud yr un peth. Mae'n anodd, felly, neu mae'n anoddach, i ddenu talent mewn a chadw'r talent honno, sy'n golygu ambell waith ein bod ni'n gorfod contractio pobl o'r tu allan, ac ambell waith o'r tu allan i Gymru, ac nid yw

happening to Wales more broadly, that things are being centralised and services are leaving. We need to look at all of these issues in a more structured manner. We, as Welsh speakers, perhaps because we are so tied into British systems, are cast asunder, if you like. That's become very apparent—people are attracted away because there isn't enough value placed on the Welsh language in Wales.

**Ms Mair:** In terms of the regional strategy as well, I think that that is something to be welcomed if it means that some projects, which at one time were more national projects, can now be broken down to a more local level so that there are more opportunities for smaller companies to go for those contracts. For example, at the beginning of the session, I mentioned that the problems facing the television industry and the interactive side of our business are slightly different, but one of the things that is difficult for the interactive side in Llanelli is that, because there are so few similar companies in the same area, it's not an area where people choose to work. They choose to go to areas where there are more similar companies doing similar things. It's difficult, or it is more difficult therefore, to attract and retain talent, which on occasion means that we do have to bring contractors in from

hynny, wrth gwrs, yn sefydlu cwmni lle rych chi'n gallu hyfforddi pobl yn y maes digidol a thyfu'r cwmni yn ddigonol.

outside, and occasionally from outside Wales, and that doesn't establish a company where you can train people in the digital field and develop the company sufficiently.

[47] Mae hynny, rwy'n meddwl, yn rhywbeth sy'n hollbwysig ac i'w groesawu, os yw cytundebau yn mynd yn fwy rhanbarthol a hynny'n golygu bod mwy o gyfleoedd gan gwmnïau llai, fod hynny felly yn annog cwmnïau eraill hefyd i allu sefydlu mewn ardaloedd tebyg i'n un ni, achos mae yna bethau o'n plaid ni—mae'r costau byw yn llai ac mae'n gallu bod yn le braf iawn i fyw ac ati, ond mae angen y cytundebau rhanbarthol llai hynny. Ond, rhaid sicrhau hefyd gyda chytundebau rhanbarthol, os ydych yn sôn am rhywbeth fel cynllun dinesig bae Abertawe, na fydd y swyddi yn cael eu canoli yn Abertawe. Mae mor bwysig eu bod nhw'n mynd mas i sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a Cheredigion ac ati.

That is something that is crucially important and something to be welcomed, if contracts do become more regional and that means that there is greater opportunity for smaller companies, that would encourage other companies to establish in areas such as our own, because there are things in our favour—living costs are lower and it can be a wonderful place to live, but we do need those smaller regional contracts. We also need to ensure with those regional contracts, if you are talking about something like the Swansea bay city deal, that all of the jobs aren't centralised in Swansea. It is so important that they go out to Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion and so on.

[48] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Both of you emphasised the importance of creating quality jobs for young people in Welsh-speaking communities. How would you, again, see that being taken forward as part of the Welsh Government's new economic strategy?

[49] **Ms Mair:** Rwy'n meddwl, o ran gallu cynnig swyddi o safon fel rŷm ni'n gallu ei wneud yn Tinopolis, fod angen sicrhau bod yr adrannau addysg a'r prifysgolion hefyd yn gweithio law yn llaw gyda chwmnïau er mwyn sicrhau bod y sgiliau iawn gan fyfyrwyr wrth iddyn nhw adael y

**Ms Mair:** I think, in terms of being able to provide quality employment, as we do in Tinopolis, that you also need to ensure that education departments and universities also work hand in hand with companies to ensure that students have the necessary skills when they leave

brifysgol. Er enghraifft, gyda ni, mae yna brinder mawr mewn myfyrwyr sy'n gadael prifysgolion sy'n hyddysg yn y gwaith angenrheidiol sydd angen ei wneud wrth ddatblygu a chynllunio meddalwedd newydd. Felly, mae angen sicrhau bod y sgiliau yna yn cael eu gosod yn y prifysgolion a bod yna drafodaeth yn digwydd rhwng cwmnïau a'r prifysgolion er mwyn sicrhau'r sgiliau hynny, yn hytrach na bod myfyrwyr o bosib yn dod allan gyda sgiliau sydd ddim yn caniatáu iddyn nhw fynd yn syth mewn i'r gweithle ond bod angen eu hyfforddi nhw fanna. Mewn cwmnïau bach, mae hynny'n gallu bod yn anoddach hefyd.

university. For example, for us, there is a great shortage of students leaving universities who are skilled in the work that needs to be done in developing new software. We need to ensure that those skills are in place through our universities and that there is discussion between companies and universities in order to ensure that those skills are available, rather than students leaving university with skills that perhaps don't allow them to go straight into the workplace and that they need further training. In small companies, that can be more difficult.

10:00

[50] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Rhianon Passmore.

[51] **Rhianon Passmore:** Just to pick up on the point you mentioned that you think there's a weakening of the Welsh language in communities, obviously, in terms of the investment that's gone into Welsh-medium education and the wider strategy and the 122 Welsh language standards, I would obviously disagree with that. In terms of how you feel—that regional economic development would ensure procurement in Welsh-speaking areas—could you outline what that would mean in practice for communities if they're 50 per cent Welsh-speaking communities? How would that help those in poverty who may be on universal credit, who may be English speaking as well as Welsh speaking? I'm struggling with that parity of esteem when we're talking about poverty. If we're mandating as a Government that we're going to procure in—as you say, already recognised through the Welsh index of multiple deprivation indices—areas that may have low-wage economies, how would you square that in terms of those who are non-Welsh speaking?

[52] **Ms Mair:** Os ydych chi'n sôn am addysg ac os ydych chi'n sôn am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn **Ms Mair:** If you're talking of education and if you're talking about what the Welsh Government is saying

ei ddweud am y dyhead i sicrhau bod of its aspiration to ensure that all pob plentyn yn gallu'r Gymraeg erbyn children can use Welsh by the time eu bod nhw'n gadael yr ysgol they leave primary school, it's just a gynradd, mater o amser yw hi wedyn matter of time then that those erbyn bod y plant hynny yn tyfu ac children grow and that they will have felly mae ganddyn nhw lefel o a level of Welsh-language skill to Gymraeg er mwyn sicrhau bod y ensure that Welsh can be used in the Gymraeg yn gallu cael ei defnyddio workplace— mewn gwaith—

[53] **Rhianon Passmore:** But, for those—to interrupt you. Sorry, Chair. But, for those who are already not in that position, who may be in their twenties and thirties, how would you argue that, with public funding, with £1.2 billion cut off the Welsh Government block—how would you argue that's best usage and best value?

[54] **Ms Mair:** Fe fyddwn i'n sicrhau **Ms Mair:** I would ensure that anyone bod unrhyw un sydd angen ac eisiau who needs and wants opportunities— cyfleoedd—ac, wrth gwrs, mae pawb and of course everyone is seeking eisiau cyfleoedd i gael gwaith da ym opportunities for good employment mhob ardal o Gymru—mae'n rhaid in all parts of Wales—we must ensure sicrhau bod y gwaith yn symud i'r that the jobs move to those areas ardaloedd hynny ac mae'n rhaid and we have to ensure too that sicrhau hefyd bod modd i bobl allu people can get to the workplace. cyrraedd y gwaith. Rwy'n meddwl That's crucially important. bod hynny'n hollbwysig.

[55] **Ambell waith, rwy'n meddwl,** On occasion, I think, even in a hyd yn oed mewn cwmni fel ein un company such as our own—. Let's ni—. Dywedwch fod rhyw ysgol yn say that a school tells us that dweud wrthym ni fod rhywun yn someone is particularly talented in arbennig o dalentog ym maes camera camera or audio work and that we neu sain a'n bod ni'n gallu cynnig can offer them a job, but they can't swydd iddyn nhw, ond nid ydyn get to work. If we're talking about nhw'n gallu cyrraedd y gwaith. Os areas that are so poor that they don't rydym ni'n sôn am ardaloedd sydd have a car in the family, for example, mor dlawd nes bod yna ddim perchen we have to ensure that those jobs get ar gar yn y teulu, er enghraifft, mae'n out there and people can get to those rhaid sicrhau bod y swyddi yn mynd jobs. mas ac mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cyrraedd y swyddi hynny.

[56] **Rhianon Passmore:** Sorry, if I may, Chair, just come in—

[57] **John Griffiths:** We have to move on very quickly, Rhianon, because time is limited.

[58] **Rhianon Passmore:** My question is quite simple—not the transport issue—how would you then benefit those who may not have Welsh-language skills if public money is going to go into a strategy of that type of procurement? That’s my question and I’m not getting the answer, sorry.

[59] **Ms Mair:** Os oes swyddi yn symud allan i'r ardaloedd yma, mae gwaith i bawb. Mwyaf i gyd o waith sydd i bobl, y mwyaf cystadleuol yw'r gwaith, y mwyaf i gyd mae cyflogau'n codi. Felly, y mwyaf o waith y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gallu sicrhau sy'n mynd mas i ardaloedd difreintiedig, p'un ai fod pobl ifanc yn siarad Cymraeg neu ddim yn siarad Cymraeg, y mwyaf o waith sydd yna, y mwyaf o waith a fydd yna, a'r mwyaf i gyd fydd y cyflogau yn codi.

**Ms Mair:** If jobs move out to these areas, then there will be work available for all. The more jobs there are, the more competitive it is, then the more salaries go up. So, the more jobs the Welsh Government can ensure go out to these disadvantaged areas, whether young people speak Welsh or don't speak Welsh, the more jobs there are, the more jobs there will be available to those young people and salaries will go up.

[60] **Mr Davies:** Rwy'n meddwl, hyd yn oed pe na bai'r Gymraeg yn bodoli o gwbl, fod dal angen i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar strategaeth fwy rhanbarthol—o ran, fel rydym wedi sôn, y GDP yn ardaloedd Amcan 1. Felly, mae angen i chi wneud hyn beth bynnag, hyd yn oed pe na bai'r Gymraeg ddim yna.

**Mr Davies:** I think, even if the Welsh language didn't exist at all, the Government would still need to look at a more regional strategy—in terms of, as we've mentioned, GDP in Objective 1 areas. You'd have to do it in any case, even if the Welsh language weren't a factor.

[61] Ond, mae'r ffaith fod y Gymraeg yna yn fwy o reswm i chi ei wneud. Mae gan y Llywodraeth strategaeth 'Mwy na geiriau' efo ieched, ac mae gyda ni strategaeth

But the fact that the Welsh language is there is more of a reason to do it. The Government has a 'More than just words' strategy in health, and we have a new strategy for 2050. You



newydd rŵan ar gyfer 2050. Mae angen i chi allu defnyddio'r cymunedau Cymraeg canran uchel yma i yrru hynny yn ei flaen, o ran o lle mae'r athrawon yn mynd i ddod sy'n mynd i ddysgu Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion. Mae angen cynllunio'r gweithlu i'r dyfodol. Y gobaith ydy fod mwy o bobl yn mynd i gael eu tynnu i mewn i addysg Gymraeg. Rydyn ni'n sôn yn fan hyn am roi gwaith i bobl allu defnyddio'r sgîl sydd ganddyn nhw, sydd ar hyn o bryd ddim yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Mae fel petasech chi'n dysgu cyfiri ac yn gadael ysgol a byth yn ei ddefnyddio fe eto, felly, mewn cymhariaeth. Sgîl ydy'r Gymraeg yn y diwedd. Nid oes dim ots o ble rydych chi'n dod, mae modd ei ddysgu fo.

need to use the high-percentage Welsh-speaking communities to drive that agenda forward, in terms of where the teachers are going to come from who are going to be able to teach Welsh in schools. You need to plan the workforce for the future. The hope is that more people will be attracted into Welsh-medium education. We are here talking about providing employment so that people can use a skill that they already have, which at the moment isn't being used. It's like learning to count, leaving school and never using that skill again. The Welsh language is a skill, ultimately. It doesn't matter where you come from, you can learn Welsh.

[62] Mae yna fodel gan y sosioieithydd Miquel Strubell o Catalunya. Ei farn o ydy y mwyaf o angen sydd yna ar gyfer gwaith cyfrwng Cymraeg ac yn y blaen, y mwyaf o alw wedyn y bydd yna am addysg Gymraeg, cynhyrchu Cymraeg. Mae'n creu cylch sy'n mynd rownd a rownd. Beth sydd wedi bod yn digwydd i'r Gymraeg, oherwydd y sefyllfa hanesyddol, ydy ei bod hi wedi bod yn mynd y ffordd anghywir. Mae yna lai a llai o werth iddi oherwydd y sefyllfa hanesyddol ac rŷm ni eisiau rhoi'r sbin ar y ffordd gywir rŵan. Mae gennych chi'r strategaethau, felly mae'n rhaid i chi feddwl sut ydym ni'n mynd i gael y gweithlu yma sy'n mynd i ddelifro ar gyfer 2050 a 'Mwy na geiriau'. Mae'n

Miquel Strubell, the sociolinguist from Catalunya, has a model. His view is that the more demand there is for Welsh-medium employment, then the more demand there will be for Welsh-medium education to generate Welsh speakers, so it creates a virtuous circle. What's been happening to the Welsh language, because of the historic position, is that it's been going in the wrong direction. Less and less value is placed on the language because of the historic context and we want to spin it around. You do have these strategies and therefore you do have to think about how we're going to get this workforce that can deliver the 2050 target and 'More than just words'. So, you have to make use of

rhaid i chi wneud defnydd o'r siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd allan yna. Mae'n rhaid i bawb hefyd gael y cyfle i ddysgu Cymraeg, beth bynnag ydy'ch cefndir chi, drwy addysg neu fel oedolyn. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig fel bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei gweld fel hunaniaeth sifig Cymru, dim ots pwy ydych chi.

the Welsh speakers that are out there. But everyone, also, must have the opportunity to learn Welsh, whatever their background, through education or as an adult. I think that's crucially important and that the Welsh language should be seen as the civic identity for Wales, never mind who you are or your background.

[63] **John Griffiths:** Diolch yn fawr. Sian Gwenllian.

**John Griffiths:** Thank you. Sian Gwenllian.

[64] **Sian Gwenllian:** Diolch yn fawr. Diolch am ddod atom ni y bore yma. A ydych chi'n meddwl bod yr her sy'n wynebu economi'r gorllewin yn cael ei chydabod yn ddigonol? Rwy'n gwytod ein bod ni'n edrych arno fo drwy lens y Gymraeg rwan, ac mae'r Gymraeg yn rhan annatod o fywyd y gorllewin, ond tynnwch chi'r iaith Gymraeg oddi yna, mewn ffordd, a jest edrych yn foel ar y sefyllfa o ran yr economi yn y gorllewin, mae'r ffaith ei fod o wedi bod yn derbyn cefnogaeth Ewropeaidd yn dweud rhywbeth wrthym ni, ond a oes yna ddigon o ymwybyddiaeth o faint yr her? A fedrwch chi bwyntio ni at beth o'r data sydd yn dangos beth ydy maint yr her a beth ydy natur y problemau a sut ydych chi'n gweld bod ceisio ymateb i'r her yn mynd i wella economi Cymru gyfan? Nid ydym ni'n edrych ar y gorllewin yn ynysig ond yn rhan o Gymru gyfan, o gofio ein bod ni'n edrych ar daclo cyflogau isel, yn enwedig, yn yr ymchwiliad yma.

**Sian Gwenllian:** Thank you very much and thank you for joining us this morning. Do you think that the challenge facing the economy of west Wales is sufficiently recognised? I know that we are looking at it through the lens of the Welsh language now, and the Welsh language is an integral part of life in the west of Wales, but if you take the Welsh language out of the picture and just look at the situation in terms of the economy in west Wales, the fact that it has been receiving European funding tells us something, of course, but is there enough awareness of the scale of the challenge? Can you point us to some of the data that demonstrates the scale of the challenge and what the nature of the problems are? How do you see that trying to respond to that challenge is going to improve the economy of the whole of Wales? We're not just looking at the west of Wales in isolation, but as part of the whole of Wales, bearing in mind that

we are looking at tackling low incomes.

[65] **Ms Mair:** Yn fy nhystiolaeth ysgrifenedig i, roeddwn i wedi nodi bod budd-dal diweithdra yn Llanelli yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol, a bod tri o wardiau cyngor y dref ymysg y tlotaf drwy Gymru gyfan. Felly, rwy'n meddwl mai'r un pwynt eto fan hyn yw: mae angen sicrhau bod gwaith yn symud i'r ardaloedd yma yn y gorllewin a bod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud popeth posib o fewn ei gallu i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd. Rwy'n meddwl beth sy'n dueddol o ddigwydd yw bod cwmnïau neu adrannau'r Llywodraeth eisïau bod yng Nghaerdydd, ond mewn gwlad mor fach â Chymru, nid yw hynny, mewn gwirionedd, yn gwneud synnwyr economaidd os ydym ni eisïau gweld Cymru sy'n ffyniannus ym mhob ardal. Wrth gwrs, mae cael adrannau Llywodraeth, adrannau cyhoeddus, i symud i ardaloedd tlawd wedyn, wrth gwrs, yn sicrhau bod busnesau llai, efallai, yn gallu manteisio ar fwy o bobl yn gweithio yno hefyd. Felly, po fwyaf o bobl sy'n gweithio mewn unrhyw ardal, mae yna dyfiant o fusnesau llai yn tyfu o hynny hefyd.

**Ms Mair:** Well, in my written evidence, I did note that unemployment benefit in Llanelli is higher than the national average and that three of the council wards in the town are among the poorest in the whole of Wales. I do think it's the same point again: that we need to ensure that employment is moved to these disadvantaged areas and that the Government does everything possible within its abilities and powers to make sure that this happens. I think that what tends to happen is that companies or departments of Government want to be in Cardiff, but in a nation as small as Wales, that, in reality, doesn't make economic sense if we want to see a Wales that is prosperous in all areas. Of course, getting departments of Government and other departments to move to disadvantaged areas would ensure that smaller businesses can take advantage of the working population there. So, the more people working in any given area, then there is growth of smaller businesses emanating from that.

[66] I fynd yn ôl at fy mhwynt i, os ydych chi'n symud rhai o'r adrannau mawr i mewn i ganol Caerdydd, er enghraifft, y cwmnïau mawr Prydeinig yng Nghaerdydd sy'n mynd i fod yn gwerthu brechdanau i bawb yn ystod amser cinio yn hytrach na bod

To go back to my point, if you move some of the larger departments into the centre of Cardiff, you have those large multinational companies selling sandwiches to the workforce at lunchtime rather than smaller businesses taking advantage of that.

busnesau llai yn gallu codi oddi ar hynny. Felly, mae un peth yn magu'r llall. Dyna pam ei bod hi'n hollbwysig ein bod ni yn symud sefydliadau. Rwyf mor falch, er enghraifft, ac rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith yn fawr iawn, bod S4C yn symud i Gaerfyrddin, achos rwy'n meddwl bod sefydliad pwysig, cenedlaethol fel yna—fe ddylai fe fod yng nghanol ardal y mae rhywun yn ei gweld fel cadarnle'r Gymraeg, yn yr achos yna. Ond rwy'n meddwl y dylai fe fod yn digwydd hefyd ar draws adrannau'r Llywodraeth.

[67] **Mr Davies:** Rwy'n cytuno efo'r pwynt diwethaf yna ar symud pethau allan i'r rhanbarthau, yn enwedig efo'r gogledd-orllewin. Nid ydw i'n meddwl bod gennym ni'r un sefydliad cenedlaethol sydd wedi ei leoli yn y gogledd-orllewin, yn enwedig rhai sydd ynghlwm â'r Gymraeg. Ond yn ôl i'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol, fel yr oeddwn i'n datgan yn gynharach, petai'r Gymraeg ddim yn bodoli o gwbl, mae dal angen mynd i ymafael â'r broblem, oherwydd mae ardal y gorllewin yn ardal Amcan 1, mwy neu lai, felly mae yna broblem yna. Felly, yn fy marn i, petai eich strategaeth economaidd rhanbarthol chi'n llwyddo, buasai hynny ynddo'i hun yn creu cynaladwyedd i'r Gymraeg hefyd. Mae'r ddau beth yn hollol ynghlwm, felly.

[68] **Sian Gwenllian:** O ran data i gefnogi, rydym ni'n gwybod am Amcan 1 ac yn y blaen, ond mae yna

So, one thing breeds another. That's why it's crucially important that we do move organisations. I am particularly pleased and I welcome the fact that S4C is moving to Carmarthen, because I think that a national organisation such as that one should be based in an area that one would describe as a heartland Welsh-speaking area. But I think it should be happening across departments of Government.

**Mr Davies:** I agree with that last point in terms of moving jobs out to the regions, particularly in the north-west. I don't think we have one national institution that is located in the north-west of Wales, particularly those dealing with the Welsh language. Back to the original question, as I stated earlier, if the Welsh language didn't exist at all, then we would still need to tackle these problems, because west Wales is an Objective 1 area, so there is a problem there. My view is that if there was a regional economy strategy that was successful, that in and of itself would give sustainability to the Welsh language. The two things are integral to each other.

**Sian Gwenllian:** In terms of data, we know about Objective 1 and so on, but there is more recent data and

ddata mwy diweddar ac mae yna astudiaethau wedi cael eu gwneud i gefnogi'r dystiolaeth bod yr economi'n wan ac angen sylw. A oes yna ddiffyg data? A ydym ni angen mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa i ddeall yn well beth sy'n digwydd?

[69] **Mr Davies:** O ran y Gymraeg, mae Mentrau Iaith Cymru wedi cael ychydig o arian gan y gronfa datblygu gwledig i ddechrau edrych ar hyn o ran creu clystyrau o fusnesau a fuasai'n gweithio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'n darparu gwasanaethau cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, rydym ni'n dechrau edrych i mewn i hynny. Hefyd, ein gobaith ni ydy bod yna ychydig o arian yna lle byddwn ni'n gallu cymryd clwstwr rydym ni'n gwybod sydd angen ei ddatblygu, er enghraifft meithrinfeydd cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rydw i'n gwybod am bump neu chwech menter iaith arall sydd yn gweld yr angen yn eu hardaloedd nhw. Felly, bydd yr ychydig o gyllid sydd gennym ni yn ein galluogi ni i ddod â'r clwstwr yma at ei gilydd a phasio'r cynllun busnes ymlaen, pasio beth rydym ni wedi ei ddysgu ym Menter Iaith Conwy, pa gronfeydd i'w targedu, sut rydych chi'n cofrestru—yr holl bethau ymarferol. Felly, mae hynny'n rhywbeth rydym ni'n mynd i fwrw ymlaen efo fo yn y tymor byr, ond ar yr un pryd, bydd yna waith ymchwil pellach yn cael ei wneud i weld beth ydy'r posibiladau, efallai efo canolfannau galw neu efo technoleg, a fuasai'n gallu esgor ar

studies have been done to support this evidence that the economy is weak and that that does need to be addressed. Is there a shortage of data? Do we need to tackle that situation to understand better what's happening?

**Mr Davies:** Specifically in terms of the Welsh language, Mentrau Iaith Cymru has been given some funding from the rural development fund to start to look at this issue in terms of creating clusters of businesses that would be working through the medium of Welsh or providing Welsh-medium services. So, we are starting to look into that issue, but our hope is that there will be some funding where we will be able to take a cluster that we know needs to be developed, for example, Welsh-medium nurseries. I know of five or six other *mentrau iaith* who have identified such a need in their own areas. So, the little funding we have will enable us to bring that cluster together and to pass a business plan and to pass on what we've learnt at Menter Iaith Conwy and what funds we should target and so on, how you register—all of those practicalities. That is something that we will be driving forward in the short term, but simultaneously there will be further research carried out in terms of the possibilities with call centres or technology that could engender new initiatives in order to create employment in the west of Wales, but also across the whole of the nation.

fentrau newydd er mwyn creu'r gyflogaeth yna yn y gorllewin, ond hefyd ar draws y wlad gyfan.

[70] **Sian Gwenllian:** A fedrwch chi ymhelaethu? A oes yna esiamplau penodol o lle mae'r sector cyhoeddus, er enghraifft, wedi cael effaith ar y cymunedau o gwmpas, hynny yw, bod y gwaith wedi effeithio ar fywyd cymunedol?

**Sian Gwenllian:** Can you expand upon any specific examples of where the public sector, for example, has had an impact on surrounding communities, that the work has had an impact on community life?

[71] **Mr Davies:** Nid yw'n gydddigwyddiad bod y Gymraeg wedi dal ei thir yn well yng ngogledd Gwynedd nag unrhyw le arall, oherwydd Cymraeg ydy iaith fewnol Cyngor Gwynedd, ac mae hynny'n cael effaith enfawr ar faint o bobl ifanc sy'n aros yn yr ardal, faint o siaradwyr Cymraeg sy'n cael eu denu i'r ardal, ac yn y blaen. Petai pob awdurdod lleol yn mynd yn agosach at y model yna—. Petai Ceredigion a sir Gâr wedi dilyn model Gwynedd yn y 1970au, rydw i'n eithaf sicr y buasai'r canran o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn y ddwy sir dal uwchben hanner erbyn rŵan.

**Mr Davies:** Well, it's no coincidence that the Welsh language has held its ground better in northern Gwynedd than anywhere else, because Welsh is the language of administration for Gwynedd Council, and that has a huge impact on the number of Welsh speakers who stay in the area, how many Welsh speakers are attracted to the area, and so on and so forth. If all local authorities were to move closer to the Gwynedd model—. If Ceredigion and Carmarthenshire had followed the Gwynedd model in the 1970s, then I am confident that the percentage of Welsh speakers in those two counties would be still above 50 per cent.

[72] Felly, mae beth mae Cyngor Gwynedd wedi ei wneud wedi creu isadeiladwaith economaidd i'r Gymraeg yn y sir, a ble mae'r Gymraeg wedi codi o ran canrannau neu niferoedd, rydych chi wastad yn gweld rhyw fath o farchnad lafur ynghlwm â'r peth. Y rheswm y mae'r Gymraeg yn ffynnu, yn cynyddu, yn yr ardal yma ydy oherwydd bod

So, what Gwynedd Council has done is it has created that economic infrastructure for the Welsh language in the county. Where the Welsh language has increased in terms of percentages or numbers, you always see that there is some sort of labour market attached to that. The reason why the Welsh language is increasing in this area is that you have work

gennyh chi'r gwaith, mae gennyh chi'r sefydliadau yma, mae gennyh chi addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ar dwf ar draws y ddinas, felly mae hynny'n denu pobl i mewn. Gwaith, yn y diwedd, sy'n hoelio pobl lawr i ddarn o dir, felly mae'n hollol hanfodol.

available, you have the institutions and organisations here, you have Welsh-medium education growing across the city, and that attracts people in. So, at the end of the day, it's work and employment that decide where people live, so it's crucially important.

10:15

[73] **Ms Mair:** Ar lefel syml, o'n rhan ni, a heb fod iaith yn dod i mewn i'r peth o gwbl, rydym ni'n cyflogi dros 100 o bobl yng nghanol Llanelli mewn diwydiant lle efallai buasai yna deimlad wedi bod y dylem ni fod yng Nghaerdydd yn rhan o glwstwr y diwydiannau creadigol, ond achos ein bod ni wedi sicrhau o'r dechrau ein bod ni'n gwmni sydd yng nghanol Llanelli, mae hynny'n golygu, wrth gwrs, fod yna 100 o bobl sy'n mynd i siopa amser cinio, sy'n mynd allan i gael coffi, neu fynd i brynu nwyddau neu—. Hyd yn oed pan nad ydych chi'n cymryd yr iaith i ystyriaeth, mae creu'r gwaith hynny wrth gwrs yn hybu bob math o gwmnïau eraill yn yr ardal benodol honno. Dyna pam mae e mor bwysig i gael y gwaith.

**Ms Mair:** From our point of view, without language coming into this at all, we employ over 100 people in the middle of Llanelli in an industry where perhaps there may have been a feeling in the past that we should be located in Cardiff as part of a creative industries cluster, but because we have ensured from the outset that we are a company that is based in Llanelli, that means that there are 100 people who go shopping at lunchtime in the town, who go out for a cup of coffee or go to buy goods in the town. So, even when you don't take the Welsh language into account, then creating that employment of course stimulates all sorts of other companies in that area. That's why it's so important to have that work.

[74] **Mr Davies:** Os caf i ychwanegu, efallai, rhywbeth ar gynffon hyn, felly: pwysigrwydd, hefyd, y trydydd sector. Oherwydd rydym ni—. Mae'r mentrau iaith, y rhan fwyaf ohonyn nhw, yn y trydydd sector, ac mae'r gallu sydd gennym ni, wedyn, i greu mentrau cymdeithasol newydd i

**Mr Davies:** If I could just add one thing on the back of that: the importance of the third sector as well. The *mentrau iaith*, for the most part, are third sector organisations, and we then have the ability to create new social enterprise in order to provide local employment, and I

ddarparu cyflogau lleol, ac rydw i'n meddwl bod yna botensial mawr yn hynny. Buaswn i'n hoffi gweld bod y mentrau iaith, efallai, yn cael y cymhwysedd yna lawr y lein, i allu cynllunio, achos y cryfder mawr sydd gan y mentrau iaith ydy gweld beth sydd ei angen yn lleol, a mynd yna, fel roeddwn i'n sôn efo'r esiampl o'r feithrinfa neu'r cwmni cyfieithu. Mae'r rheini jest yn esiamplau. Rydw i'n meddwl bod yna le, efallai, i sawl cwmni arall yn ein sir ni, er enghraifft, ac wedyn os ydych chi'n dyblygu hynny ar draws pob sir, rydym ni'n sôn—. Yn sydyn iawn, rydych chi yn sôn am gannoedd o swyddi.

[75] Ond hefyd o ran y trydydd sector, mae'r pwysigrwydd maen nhw'n chwarae mewn ardaloedd o Wynedd, er enghraifft. Os ydych chi'n sôn am gwmnïau fel Antur Waunfawr, cwmnïau ailgylchu—faint o bobl maen nhw'n cyflogi—Seren ym Mlaenau Ffestiniog—wel, yr holl fentrau cymdeithasol ym Mlaenau, rwan. Maen nhw i gyd yn gweithredu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, felly pethau sydd wedi cael eu cychwyn yn eu cymunedau ydy'r rheini, felly. Felly, petai yna damaid bach o adnoddau yn cael ei roi i mewn i helpu'n fwy efo'r sector yma, rydw i'n meddwl y buasem ni'n gallu darparu lot, lot mwy. Yn yr ardal lle rydw i'n byw ym Methesda, Partneriaeth Ogwen sydd wedi sefydlu cwmni hydro, ac wedi codi £370,000 o gyfranddaliadau. So, mae yna botensial mawr yn y fanna

think that there's huge potential for that. I would like to see that the *mentrau iaith* are given that competence down the line, because the strength of the *mentrau iaith* is to identify need at a local level, and go there, as I mentioned with the example of the nursery or the translation company. Those are just examples, and I think that there is scope for a number of other companies to develop on our patch, and if you duplicate that across all counties, then all of a sudden you are talking about hundreds of jobs.

But also in terms of the third sector, there's the importance that they have in areas of Gwynedd, for example. If you are talking about a company such as Antur Waunfawr, recycling companies—how many people they employ—Seren in Blaenau Ffestiniog, and all of the social enterprises in Blaenau Ffestiniog now. They all work through the medium of Welsh, so those are things that have been established within the community. So, if some resource was provided to assist more in this sector, then I think we could provide a great deal more. In the area where I live in Bethesda, there is Partneriaeth Ogwen, which has established a hydro energy company and raised £370,000 of share offers. So, there is huge potential there, if the competence were provided to the



hefyd, petai'r cymhwysedd yn cael ei roi i'r sector, felly.

[76] **John Griffiths:** Okay, well, thanks for that. Sian, I think we—

[77] **Sian Gwenllian:** Jest un peth arall— **Sian Gwenllian:** Just one brief point—

[78] **John Griffiths:** Very briefly, because we have to move on.

[79] **Sian Gwenllian:** A fuasech chi yn disgrifio'r swyddi sydd yn dod yn sgil y farchnad lafur Gymraeg yn swyddi o ansawdd da, sydd yn debygol o ddenu pobl yn ôl neu roi llwybr gyrfa o ansawdd uwch, fel bod y busnes yma o godi lefel y cyflogau yn—[*Anhyglyw.*]?

**Sian Gwenllian:** Would you describe the jobs created as a result of the Welsh language labour market as high-quality jobs, which are likely to attract people back or to provide a quality career path to people, so that the business of raising salary levels could be addressed?

[80] **Mr Davies:** I ateb yn gyflym, mae'r syniad o greu marchnad lafur cyfrwng Cymraeg yn un eang, ac nid jest y mentrau iaith fuasai'n rhan ohoni hi. Ein rhan ni ydy, efallai, yr elfen trydydd sector, creu mentrau newydd ar lawr gwlad, ond mae gan y Llywodraeth yn ganolog rôl i chwarae o ran—. Rydym ni'n sôn yn fan hyn, efallai, fel roeddwn i wedi'i grybwyll ynglŷn â'r broblem efo iechyd—nad ydym yn cynhyrchu digon o ddoctoriaid sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg. Mae hynny ynghlwm wrth greu marchnad lafur cyfrwng Cymraeg, lawr at, trwy greu mentrau cymdeithasol newydd, cael pobl i mewn i waith sydd yn talu'n well. Felly, mae'n gysyniad eithaf mawr, ac ond darn bach ohono fo ydym ni fel mentrau iaith. Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus rhan i chwarae, ond mae

**Mr Davies:** To respond briefly, the creation of a Welsh-medium labour market is very broad indeed, and it wouldn't just be the *mentrau iaith* that would be involved. Our part, perhaps, is the third sector element in creating new initiatives on the ground, but the Government, centrally, has a role to play in terms of—. We are talking here, as I mentioned, about the problem in health—that we aren't producing enough doctors who are able to provide services through the medium of Welsh. That is related to the issue of the labour market, down to getting people through the creation of a new social enterprise to get people into work that is better paid. So, it's quite a broad concept, and it's only a small part that we as *mentrau iaith* play. The public sector has its own part to

eisiau ei gydnabod o fel cysyniad, rydw i'n meddwl, ac wedyn mae angen gallu mapio a chynllunio. Efo'r strategaethau—'Mwy na geiriau', 'Cymraeg 2050'—mae'n rhaid i chi gael strategaethau i greu gweithluoedd sy'n mynd i ddelifro'r strategaethau yma, ac nid yw'n gynllun dwy neu dair blynedd; mae'n gynllun 100 mlynedd a mwy.

[81] **John Griffiths:** Okay. We'll have to move on: the private sector. Jenny.

[82] **Jenny Rathbone:** Tinopolis has obviously had a really important leadership role in ensuring that south-west Wales is a centre of excellence for the media. I don't think S4C would have moved to Carmarthen—well, it hasn't happened yet—if Tinopolis wasn't already in Llanelli. I just want to explore with you why it is there aren't other entrepreneurs seizing the opportunities that are presented by public policy—obviously S4C was created with public money—to do similar things along the Tinopolis model. For example, there is going to be a need for a lot more nurseries now that we've got a commitment that all three and four-year-olds of people in work will have free nursery places—huge opportunity here to create new nursery places in the medium of Welsh. Why are private companies not pouring in to Welsh-medium areas?

[83] **Ms Mair:** Wel, mae'n anodd i fi ateb y cwestiwn o safbwynt unrhyw gwmnïau eraill, ond i ddatgan eto yr hyn sydd eisoes wedi cael ei ddweud, rydw i'n meddwl pe bai mwy o swyddi da yn dod gan y Llywodraeth i'r ardaloedd yma, buasai hynny efallai yn magu hyder yn yr ardaloedd hefyd, achos rydw i yn meddwl bod angen hyder, ac rydw i'n meddwl bod angen rhoi cymorth i bobl i sicrhau eu bod nhw'n gallu dechrau cwmnïau a'u bod nhw'n gweld gwerth i ddechrau cwmnïau hefyd yn yr ardaloedd difreintiedig yma. Nid yw

**Ms Mair:** Well, it's difficult for me to answer the question in terms of any other companies, but to state once again what I've already said, I think that if there were more quality jobs coming from Government to these areas, that, perhaps, would engender confidence in those areas too, because I do think that you need that confidence and you need to provide support and assistance to people to ensure that they can establish their own companies and that they see a value in establishing companies in these disadvantaged areas. It's not

hi bob amser yn rhwydd i feddwl am ddechrau busnes newydd, felly rydw i'n meddwl bod unrhyw gymorth sy'n gallu cael ei roi yn rhanbarthol er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn gweld gwerth o fod yn entrepreneuraidd yn yr ardaloedd yma yn sicr yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu'n fawr iawn.

always easy to think of starting your own business, so I think any support that can be provided regionally in order to ensure that people do see the value of entrepreneurialism in this area is certainly something that should be warmly welcomed.

[84] **Jenny Rathbone:** So, you don't think that that is happening at the moment—you don't think there's sufficient support for talking up west Wales as an area of economic development?

[85] **Ms Mair:** Wel, ni allaf ddweud fy mod i wedi edrych ar y manylion hynny'n fanwl, ond gallaf i ychwanegu at fy nhystiolaeth, os hoffech chi i fi wneud hynny, yn sicr.

**Ms Mair:** Well, I can't say that I've looked at that in detail, but I could add to my evidence, if you would like me to do so, certainly.

[86] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. I mean, I suppose one of the key issues—you've already mentioned infrastructure: the difficulty of one of your employees getting to work by public transport. Broadband development is another crucial thing that must be in place before many of the high-tech companies would move there. So, is it now sufficient to enable anybody to set up in Llanelli or anywhere else in the area?

[87] **Ms Mair:** Wel, rydw i'n meddwl bod y problemau gyda *broadband* mewn ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru yn un sy'n cael ei gydnabod yn bendant, ac yn sicr buasai *broadband* ar ben unrhyw restr o'r hyn sy'n rhaid ei roi yn ei le yn iawn er mwyn gallu rhoi pob cyfle posib i unrhyw gwmnïau i sefydlu mewn unrhyw ardal o Gymru. Buaswn i'n dweud bod *broadband* yn sicr gyfuwch, os nad yn uwch nag unrhyw beth arall. Unwaith rydych chi wedi gallu sefydlu cwmni gan ddefnyddio yr holl wasanaethau sy'n dod trwy

**Ms Mair:** Well, I think that the problems with broadband in rural areas of Wales are recognised, and certainly broadband would be on top of any list of things that must be put in place properly in order to provide all possible opportunities for any companies to establish in any area of Wales. I would say that broadband is at the same level, if not higher, than anything else. Once you've established a company using all of the services provided through broadband, which are easily accessible for any urban company,

*broadband*, sy'n hawdd i unrhyw well, then that goes hand in hand  
gwmni sydd efallai'n fwy trefol neu with all of the other things that you  
ddinesig, wel, mae hynny wedyn law need.  
yn llaw gyda'r holl bethau eraill sydd  
angen dod.

[88] **Jenny Rathbone:** It would be nice if that were the case, but we have significant problems around broadband in Cardiff.

[89] **Ms Mair:** Wel, yn sicr, os oes **Ms Mair:** Well, if there are problems  
yna broblemau fan hyn, mae yna here there are certainly graver  
broblemau rhywfaint yn fwy dybryd problems, perhaps, in rural areas.  
yn yr ardaloedd gwledig.

[90] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. All right. But that's—. I mean, is that one of the things that is holding back companies? I mean, things like, obviously, driverless cars, in the not-too-distant future, are obviously going to be a resolution of our interconnectivity problems, but broadband also enables people to do a job without having to go to work, so to speak.

[91] **Ms Mair:** Wel, yn bendant. Mae **Ms Mair:** Well, certainly. That would  
hynny'n golygu bod cwmnïau bach yn mean that small companies could be  
gallu cael eu sefydlu hefyd a bod established and that people can  
pobl yn gallu creu gwaith o'r cartref create employment from their homes  
hefyd. Ond buaswn i'n awgrymu, cyn as well. But I would suggest that  
ein bod ni'n dechrau edrych ar before we start looking at a future of  
ddyfodol sy'n edrych ar geir heb driverless vehicles, I would say that  
yrwyr, buaswn i'n dweud bod angen we need to establish far better public  
sefydlu trafniadaeth gyhoeddus llawer transport in west Wales, because it is  
gwell i ddod i'r gorllewin, achos something that prevents people  
mae'n rhywbeth sydd yn atal pobl. Er there. For example, for us,  
enghraifft, gyda ni, yn enwedig efallai particularly on the interactive side,  
ar yr ochr rhyngweithiol, er ein bod although we are a very successful  
ni'n asiantaeth lwyddiannus iawn yn agency in gaining public contracts  
ennill cytundebau cyhoeddus a and private contracts, on occasion  
phreifat, ambell waith mae'r ffaith ein the fact that we are Llanelli-based, as  
bod ni yn Llanelli, fel soniais i I mentioned earlier, does prevent  
gynnu, yn atal rhai pobl sydd eisiau some people who want to come to  
dod i weithio atom ni, ond hefyd, work with us from doing so, but also,  
ambell waith, mae'n gallu arwain at occasionally, it can lead to people  
bobl yn gweld nad ydym yng nghanol considering us as not being part of

clwstwr arall.

another cluster.

[92] Nawr, unwaith mae pobl yn dod i lawr i Lanelli a gweld yr adnoddau sydd gyda ni a gweld yr adeilad, maen nhw'n cael eu synnu ac wedyn maen nhw'n meddwl bod hynny'n wych o beth. Ond pan rŷchi chi'n gorfod dweud wrth bobl, 'Wel, dewch oddi ar y trŷn ym Mhort Talbot achos mae'n mynd i fod yn haws i chi, ac fe ddown ni i'ch nŷl chi', neu os ydyn nhw'n cymryd y trŷn i Lanelli, eu bod nhw'n gweld hynny fel rhwystr ar gyfer rhoi mwy o gyfleon gwaith i gwmni yn y gorllewin. Rydw i'n meddwl bod hynny'n bendant yn rhywbeth sydd angen edrych arno. Mae hynny'n wir, am wn i, am ardaloedd gwledig eraill yng Nghymru, achos mae'r drafnidiaeth yna—. Os ŷch chi'n sŷn am bobl sydd ar gyflogau isel, mae hyd yn oed yn fwy pwysig wedyn fod trafndiaeth gyhoeddus dda yn cael ei gosod yn ei lle er mwyn gallu rhoi cyfleoedd i bobl i fynd i'r gwaith. Nid ydych chi eisiau bod pobl ifanc difreintiedig iawn yn meddwl, 'Nid ydw i hyd yn oed yn gallu mynd 15 milltir i lawr yr hewl i fynd am y gwaith yna, achos nid wyf yn gwybod sut y buaswn i'n cyrraedd yno.'

Now, when people come to Llanelli and see the resources that we have and our building, they are shocked and surprised and they think that it's wonderful. But when you have to tell people, 'Well, get off the train in Port Talbot because it'll be easier for you and we'll pick you up there', or if they take the train to Llanelli, they see that as a barrier to providing further employment opportunity for a company in west Wales. That is certainly something that needs to be looked at. That, I suppose, is true in other rural areas of Wales, because transport—. If you are talking of people on low wages, then it's even more important that good public transport is put in place in order to provide opportunities for people to access the workplace. You don't want young people in very disadvantaged areas thinking, 'Well, I can't even travel 15 miles down the road to access employment, because I don't know how I'll get there.'

[93] **Jenny Rathbone:** We can agree that public transport is a key issue. What practical steps—? You must, presumably, liaise with other private companies in your area, what practical steps do you think private companies can be taking to increase the number of better-paid jobs, or to translate low-paid jobs into better-paid jobs?

[94] **Ms Mair:** Wel, mae **Ms Mair:** Well, training, of course, is

hyfforddiant, wrth gwrs, yn hollbwysig, achos un o'r pethau rŷm ni'n fwyaf proud ohono yw ein bod ni'n cymryd pobl ifanc o sir Gaerfyrddin i ddod i weithio gyda ni, ac wedyn rŷm ni hyd yn oed yn fwy proud pan ŷm ni'n gweld y rheini'n gadael ein cwmni ni i fynd i weithio, efallai, fel rhyddgyfranwyr neu'n mynd i weithio i gwmnïau eraill. Os ŷch chi'n edrych ar y sector deledu trwy Gymru gyfan, mae canran uchel iawn o bobl camera a sain, er enghraifft, i gyd wedi cael eu hyfforddi gan Tinopolis. Felly, mae hynny'n hollbwysig, i ddechrau, eich bod yn gallu cymryd pobl ifanc a'u hyfforddi nhw, ac efallai eu bod nhw ar gyflogau rhywfaint yn is y pryd hynny, ond wedyn rŷch chi'n rhoi'r sgiliau angenrheidiol iddyn nhw fynd mas i'r farchnad er mwyn gallu ennill cyflogau uwch. Felly, mae hynny'n bendant yn un peth hollbwysig.

[95] O ran codi cyflogau, wel, cystadleuaeth sy'n bwysig. Mae'n rhaid ichi gael mwy o gwmnïau i mewn fel bod mwy o gystadleuaeth, fel bod pobl yn gallu dweud, 'Wel, nid ydw i'n gorfod dewis chi; rydw i'n gallu mynd fan hyn' ac ati. Felly, mae hynny'n hollbwysig mewn ardaloedd, a bod pobl yn cael aros yn eu hardaloedd nhw hefyd, yn hytrach na theimlo'u bod nhw'n gorfod gadael y gorllewin, naill ai i ddod i Gaerdydd, neu fe soniwyd am y nifer o bobl ifanc sy'n gadael Cymru er mwyn mynd i chwilio am waith dros y ffin, ac wedyn rŷm ni'n colli talentau yn

crucially important, because one of the things that we're most proud of is that we take young people from Carmarthenshire to work with us, and we are even prouder when we see those young people leaving our company to go to work in the freelance sector or work for other companies. If you look at the television sector throughout the whole of Wales, a very high percentage of camera people and sound people have all been trained by Tinopolis. So, that's crucially important, that you can take young people and train them and perhaps they may be on lower wages at that time, but you're providing them with the necessary skills to go out into the labour market in order to earn higher salaries. That is certainly one crucial factor.

In terms of raising salary levels, well, competition is the important thing. You need more companies in place so that there is greater competition, so that people can say, 'Well, I don't have to choose you; I can go elsewhere' and so on. So, that's crucially important, and that people can stay in their own areas, rather than feeling that they have to leave west Wales, either to come to Cardiff, or it's been mentioned that so many young people leave Wales totally in order to seek employment over the border, and then we lose those talents to our own areas, whether

ein bröydd ni, p'un ai eu bod nhw'n they are Welsh-speaking or non-  
 siarad Cymraeg neu beidio. Welsh-speaking.

[96] **Jenny Rathbone:** You're obviously doing the right thing in your sector, but are you saying that you're not aware of other private sector companies doing similar things, so building the capacity of—?

[97] **Ms Mair:** Rwy'n siŵr eu bod nhw. Hynny yw, mae yna gwmnïau llwyddiannus iawn yn sir Gaerfyrddin—mae cwmni bwydydd Castell Howell yn un ohonyn nhw. Rydw i'n gwybod, er enghraifft, eu bod nhw'n cefnogi'n fawr iawn y strategaeth ranbarthol newydd, sy'n golygu nad yw cytundebau'n gorfod cael eu hennill ar raddfa genedlaethol, ond bod cytundebau'n gallu mynd yn rhanbarthol. Rydw i'n meddwl eu bod nhw hefyd yn ymwybodol iawn o gwmnïau eraill sy'n gallu cyflenwi yn yr un modd, sy'n gwmnïau llai, ac, wrth gwrs, y mwyaf i gyd o waith sydd yno, y mwyaf i gyd mae siawns i bob cwmni fod yn fwy ffyniannus.

**Ms Mair:** I'm sure they are. That is, there are very successful companies in Carmarthenshire—there's the Castell Howell food company is one of them. I know, for example, that they very much support the new regional strategy, which will mean that contracts don't have to be gained at a national level, but that contracts can be broken down to that regional level. They are also very aware of other companies that can provide in the same way, but are smaller companies, and, of course, the more work there is, then the more chance there is for all companies to be more prosperous.

[98] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Perhaps we can bring Bethan Jenkins in at this stage.

[99] **Bethan Jenkins:** Roeddwn i eisiau gofyn cwestiwn—rwyf wedi gwranddo ar bopeth heddiw. Rydym ni wedi siarad am fusnesau bach ac rydym wedi siarad am sgiliau, ond beth am yr ochr arall, sef gweld y Gymraeg fel y prif beth i ddenu busnesau i Gymru o wledydd eraill? Er enghraifft, o fewn negodi rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraethau gwahanol, neu gyda busnesau mawr,

**Bethan Jenkins:** I wanted to ask a question—I've listened to everything you've said today. We've talked about small businesses and we've talked about skills, but what about the other side of the coin—seeing the Welsh language as a main tool to attract businesses to Wales from other countries? For example, within negotiation between Welsh Government and other nations and

byd-eang, beth yw'ch barn chi o ran dweud, 'Wel, mae'r iaith yma'n unigryw', ac wedyn bod hynny'n treiddio trwy bopeth fyddai'n rhan o'r contract hynny oherwydd y Gymraeg, yn hytrach na gweld y Gymraeg fel sgîl sydd yna fel rhan o *skill set* mwy eang, a gweld y Gymraeg fel y prif beth, efallai, gyda gwledydd eraill, sydd, efallai, ag agwedd mwy positif tuag at y Gymraeg na rhai o'n pobl ein hunain, yn gallu edrych at ddod i Gymru oherwydd y ffaith honno ynddi ei hun?

10:30

[100] **Ms Mair:** Wel, rydw i'n meddwl, mewn ffordd, rŷm ni ym Mhrydain yn reit unigryw achos bod yna ardaloedd eang yn gweld eu hunain fel ardaloedd un iaith. Pan ŷch chi'n trafod â gwledydd eraill, maen nhw'n gyfarwydd iawn â bod yn ddwyieithog, neu fod yn dairieithog, ac ambell waith mae gweld bod y cwmnïau a'r gwlad yn gallu cael yr empathi a'r ddealltwriaeth o beth mae hynny'n ei olygu yn gallu bod yn rhywbeth positif iawn, ac nid ydw i'n meddwl ambell waith ein bod ni'n gwneud digon yn rhyngwladol i bwysleisio bod yr iaith Gymraeg yma gyda ni, achos mae e'n normal i gynifer o wledydd eraill, a Phrydain, neu Loegr, sy'n fwy unigryw oherwydd eu bod nhw'n wlad unieithog. Mae'n normal i nifer fawr o wledydd eraill.

with large multinationals, what is your view in terms of saying, 'Well, we have a language that is unique', and then that that could permeate through everything that would be part of that contract, rather than seeing the Welsh language as a skill that's there as part of a broader skill set, and seeing the Welsh language as the unique selling point, perhaps with other nations, which may have a more positive attitude to the Welsh language than what some of our own population may have, wanting to come to Wales because of the fact that we have the Welsh language?

**Ms Mair:** Well, I think, in a way, we in Britain are quite unique because there are vast areas that see themselves as monolingual. When you look at other nations, they are very familiar with bilingualism or trilingualism, and, on occasion, seeing that companies and the country can have an empathy with what that means and an understanding of what it means can be very positive, and I don't think that we do enough internationally, perhaps, to emphasise the fact that we have the Welsh language, because it's the norm for so many other nations, and it's Britain, or England, that are more unique because they are a monolingual nation. It is the norm for many other nations.



[101] **Mr Davies:** Ie, heb os mae'n arf marchnata enfawr yn rhyngwladol, yn enwedig efo, efallai, twristiaeth. Ond efallai o ran—. Rydw i'n ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth Gwlad y Basg yn gwneud lot o waith da o ran y cytundebau maen nhw'n eu rhoi i gwmnïau rhyngwladol o ran eu cytundebau nhw efo'u *phones* a'u technoleg. Mae'n rhaid, wedyn, i'r cwmnïau mawr yna, o le bynnag maen nhw'n dod, ddarparu'r meddalwedd neu beth bynnag fel ei fod yn gweithio ym Masgeg hefyd. Felly, nid yw'n eu rhwystro nhw rhag ei wneud o. Fel y mae Angharad yn ei ddweud, mae'n rhywbeth eithaf normal, ac mae'r diffyg hyder yma ynghlwm â ni, ac mae angen inni fod bach yn fwy hyderus. Mae Lywodraeth Gwlad y Basg wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad llynedd yn edrych ar werth yr iaith Fasgeg i'r wlad. Roedd hi'n cyfrannu 4.3 y cant, o beth rwy'n ei gofio, at y GDP. Felly, roedd hynny'n ddiddorol iawn, felly.

[102] **Bethan Jenkins:** Y cwestiwn olaf gyda fi oedd jest ynglŷn â beth yr oedd Angharad yn ei ddweud yn gynharach o ran, os oes yna gystadleuaeth, gall rywun ddweud, 'Fyddaf i ddim yn gweithio yn fan hyn, fe fyddaf i'n gweithio i lawr y lôn'. A ydy hynny, ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd y diffyg cystadleuaeth—? A ydych chi wedyn yn gallu eistedd yn ôl a dweud, 'Wel, efallai, wnawn ni ddim penderfynu rhoi cyflog uwch i bobl, efallai wnawn ni gadw'r cyflog

**Mr Davies:** Yes, without doubt it is a huge marketing tool internationally, particularly in tourism, perhaps. But perhaps—. I am aware that the Basque Country's Government is doing a great deal of good work in terms of contracts with international companies in terms of technology and telecommunications. Those multinationals, wherever they are from, must provide the software so it works through the medium of Basque, too. So, it's not a barrier for them. As Angharad said, it's the norm, and that lack of confidence is an integral part of us, and we need to be more confident. The Basque Government published a report last year looking at the value of the Basque language to the nation, and it contributed 4.3 per cent to the GDP. I think I'm right in those figures. So, that was very interesting.

**Bethan Jenkins:** And the final question I had was just on Angharad's comments earlier, in terms of, if there is competition, then one can say, 'I won't be working here, I'll be working somewhere else down the road'. Now, because of that lack of competition—. Can you then sit back and say, 'Well, perhaps we won't decide to provide higher salaries, perhaps we will keep salaries at a lower level because we're able to do that', because the

ar lefel mwy isel oherwydd ein bod ni'n gallu', oherwydd nad yw'r gystadleuaeth yna'n bodoli? Petasai hi'n bodoli, efallai petasai rywun newydd yn dod i mewn gyda chyflog gwaith teg neu gyda system undebau cryf, a fydddech chi wedyn yn dechrau dweud, 'Wel, *actually*, mae'n rhaid inni ddechrau ymwneud yn fwy gyda'r drafodaeth honno', neu, ar hyn o bryd, a ydy'n rhywbeth nad yw'n gorfod digwydd, hyd yn oed yn y sectorau rydych chi wedi eu trafod, Meirion, *call centres*? Nid ydyn nhw'n talu'n dda iawn. A ydyn nhw'n gallu cadw'r lefel yn isel oherwydd, efallai, nad oes cystadleuaeth swyddi yn yr ardaloedd hynny?

competition doesn't exist? If there was that competition, if a new player came into the market with a fair working wage or with a strong unionised system, would you then say, 'Well, perhaps we now have to start getting more engaged with that discussion', or is it at the moment something that doesn't have to happen, even in the sectors that you discussed, Meirion, call centres? They don't pay particularly well. Can they keep those salary levels low because there is no jobs competition in those areas?

[103] **Mr Davies:** Ydyn. Jest ffaith economaidd, rydw i'n meddwl, ydy honno, onid yw hi? Nes eich bod chi'n cryfhau'r isadeiledd yn gyfan gwbl, mae hynny wastad, yn anffodus, yn mynd i fodoli. Felly, y mwyaf o fuddsoddiad rydych chi'n gallu ei roi i mewn i'r ardaloedd, y llai tebygol yw bod hynny yn mynd i ddigwydd.

**Mr Davies:** Well, yes, that's just an economic fact of life, I think, isn't it? Until you strengthen the infrastructure, then that's always going to be the case. So, the more investment you can make in these areas, the less likely that is to happen.

[104] **John Griffiths:** Okay. We're over time, I'm afraid, but we've got a couple of final questions from Joyce Watson.

[105] **Joyce Watson:** Hi, good morning. I do cover Mid and West Wales, so I do know about the poverty, and that includes Llanelli, and I have been to Tinopolis in Llanelli, some time ago. But my question here, really, is mostly to Tinopolis, because you've spoken at length about what it is you would like to see. What I'm going to ask you is what you would like the Welsh Government to do particularly—because that's who we will influence, mostly, in this report—about achieving the aims that we've been talking about all morning. Because we need specifics now so that we can take those forward.

[106] **Ms Mair:** Symud adrannau o Gaerdydd i'r gorllewin—dyna gallai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud. Dweud wrth adrannau addysg, CBAC, iechyd: 'Rydym ni'n symud eich swyddi chi i Gaerfyrddin, i Lanelli, i Geredigion'. Dyna beth gallai'r Llywodraeth ei wneud.

**Ms Mair:** Move departments from Cardiff to west Wales—that's what the Government could do. Tell departments, such as education, WJEC, health: 'We're moving your posts to Carmarthen, to Llanelli, to Ceredigion'. That's what the Government could do.

[107] **Joyce Watson:** Okay. I struggle with that, because I'm not really quite sure what you mean. There is health right across the region, I know, because I spend considerable amounts of time going to see health departments, so I'm not quite sure exactly what you're saying. I know that the hospitals are a major employer in some of those areas; I also know that the public sector in Pembrokeshire, where I live, is the major employer, as I know that every local authority is in Wales. What I was trying to get under here—I know about Gwynedd's policy, because it's also in my area, of operating through the medium of Welsh. But those jobs would be there anyway. Gwynedd Council, for example, would be there anyway. They've chosen to operate through the medium of Welsh, and it undoubtedly has kept the language very much alive. So, I'm struggling with, you know, 'Move things out from Cardiff' and also struggling with the evidence, or, as I'm understanding it, that there's no investment in mid Wales, because I could certainly provide significant figures where that is the case. So, what I'm trying to get is more than that, because we're talking about making the language a living language and taking that part of the economy and expanding it. Meirion, you have given some examples of that, and that's really what we're after.

[108] **Mr Davies:** Wel, rydw i'n cytuno ag Angharad. Os oes modd datganoli gwaith i'r gorllewin, mi ddylid ei wneud. Dyna ffordd medr pethau gael eu gwneud, ond rydw i'n gwybod mae yna swyddfeydd yn y gogledd ac yn Aberystwyth ac yng Nghaerfyrddin. So, rydw i'n gwybod ei fod o'n digwydd i raddau, felly, ond efallai fod angen edrych arno fo mwy.

**Mr Davies:** I agree with Angharad. If it is possible to devolve employment to the west of Wales, then that should happen. That is one way in which things can be done. I know there are offices in north Wales and in Aberystwyth and Carmarthen. So, I do know that it's happening to a certain extent already, but perhaps we need to look at that more.

[109] Ond, o ran cwestiwn penodol y Gymraeg, mae angen gorolwg gwell yn genedlaethol o'r broblem a beth ydy'r atebion. Rydym ni fel mentrau iaith bach ar lawr gwlad yn gallu gwneud hyn a hyn. Rydym ni'n gallu creu sefyllfaoedd sy'n cyflogi efallai 20, 30 o bobl, efallai mwy. Beth rydw i'n meddwl mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ei chael ydy strategaeth economaidd ar y Gymraeg sydd ynghlwm â strategaeth economaidd y Llywodraeth yn ehangach. Mae angen arbenigedd o fewn y Llywodraeth neu o fewn corff hyd braich sydd yn edrych ar y mater yn benodol, ac edrych ar y cyfleoedd y medr y Gymraeg eu creu. Mae hyn wedyn ynghlwm â'r farchnad lafur, sydd ynghlwm â strategaethau iaith, strategaeth iechyd a nifer o strategaethau eraill wedyn. Felly, mae eisiau creu'r cymhwysedd yna i edrych ar y llun mawr, ac nid ydw i'n teimlo bod hwnnw yna ar hyn o bryd. Mae o'n digwydd yn ad hoc ar lawr gwlad, nid yw o'n digwydd mewn unrhyw fath o strategaeth genedlaethol.

Now, in terms of the specific question of the Welsh language, we need a better national overview of the problem and the possible solutions. We as small *mentrau iaith* working on the ground can only do so much. We can create situations that employ 20 or 30 people, occasionally more. What I think the Government needs is an economic strategy related to the Welsh language that would be tied into the Government's broader economic strategy. We need expertise within Government or within an arm's-length body that would look at that specific issue and look at the opportunities that the Welsh language can generate. That then links to the labour market and links to language strategies, health strategies and many other strategies. So, we need to create that competence to look at the bigger picture, and I don't think that that's in place at the moment. It happens on an ad-hoc basis on the ground; it doesn't happen in any national strategic manner.

[110] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Thank you very much. Thank you both for giving evidence to the committee today. You will be sent a transcript to check for factual accuracy. Diolch yn fawr.

[111] **Ms Mair:** Diolch.

[112] **Mr Davies:** Diolch am y cyfle.

**Mr Davies:** Thank you for the opportunity.

10:38

**Papurau i'w Nodi**  
**Papers to Note**

[113] **John Griffiths:** Okay. Item 3 on the agenda today is papers to note. We have two papers. One is my letter to the Cabinet Secretary for Communities and Children in relation to our work on fire safety in high-rise blocks in Wales, and the other one is written evidence from the Welsh Language Commissioner, which is relevant to this inquiry and this evidence session today. Is committee content to note both papers? Yes. Okay. Thank you for that.

10:39

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o Weddill y Cyfarfod ac o'r Cyfarfod ar 19 Hydref 2017**  
**Motion under Standing Order 17.42(vi) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Remainder of the Meeting and from the Meeting on 19 October 2017**

*Cynnig:*

*Motion:*

*bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y exclude the public from the cyfarfod ac o'r cyfarfod ar 19 Hydref remainder of the meeting and from 2017 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog the meeting on 19 October 2017 in 17.42(vi).*

*accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).*

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion moved.*

[114] **John Griffiths:** Item 4 is a motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of this meeting and the meeting on 19 October. Is committee content so to do? Okay, thank you very much. We will move into private session.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10:39*

11/10/2017

*The public part of the meeting ended at 10:39.*