



Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and
Communications Committee](#)

18/01/2017

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)
[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)
[Committee Transcripts](#)

Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Rheoliadau Safonau'r Gymraeg (Rhif 6) 2017: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth
The Welsh Language Standards (No. 6) Regulations 2017: Evidence
Session
- 29 Rheoliadau Safonau'r Gymraeg (Rhif 6) 2017: Craffu ar Waith
Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes
The Welsh Language Standards (No. 6) Regulations 2017: Scrutiny of
the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language
- 42 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Newydd Llywodraeth Cymru:
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 9
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's new Welsh Language Strategy:
Evidence Session 9
- 88 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w dystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Hannah Blythyn Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Dawn Bowden Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Suzy Davies Bywgraffiad Biography	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Neil Hamilton Bywgraffiad Biography	UKIP Cymru UKIP Wales
Bethan Jenkins Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Dai Lloyd Bywgraffiad Biography	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Jeremy Miles Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour
Lee Waters Bywgraffiad Biography	Llafur Labour

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Alun Davies Bywgraffiad Biography	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes) Assembly Member, Labour (The Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language)
Fflur Elin	Llywydd, Undeb Cenedlaethol Myfyrwyr Cymru President, National Union of Students Wales
Iwan Evans	Uwch-swyddog Polisi, Is-adran y Gymraeg Senior Policy Officer Welsh Language Division
Alan Jones	Pennaeth y Gangen Deddfwriaeth Iaith Gymraeg Head of Welsh Language Legislation Branch
Cerith Jones	Aelod o Staff UCMC NUS Wales Staff Member
Dafydd Trystan	Cofrestrydd y Coleg, Coleg Cymraeg Cendelaethol College Registrar, Coleg Cymraeg Cendelaethol
Bethan Webb	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, Is-adran y Gymraeg Deputy Director Welsh Language Division

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Osian Bowyer	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Steve George	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Manon Huws	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Adam Vaughan	Dirprwy Clerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:03.
The meeting began at 09:03.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr a chroeso i gyfarfod Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu y bore yma. Croeso i Aelodau ac i'r tystion. Os bydd larwm tân, dylai pawb adael yr ystafell drwy'r allanfeydd tân penodol a dilyn cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r staff, ond ni ddisgwylir prawf heddiw. Dylai pawb droi eu ffonau symudol i fod yn dawel.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much and welcome to the meeting of the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee this morning. Welcome to Members and to the witnesses. If there's a fire alarm, everybody should leave the room through the specific fire exits and follow the instructions of the ushers and the staff, but we're not expecting a test today. Everyone should turn their phones to silent.

[2] Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog, ac mae clustffonau ar gael i glywed y cyfieithiad ar y pryd ac i addasu'r sain ar gyfer pobl sy'n drwm eu clyw. Mae'r cyfieithu ar y pryd ar gael ar sianel 1 a gellir chwyddo'r sain ar sianel 0.

The Assembly operates bilingually, and headsets are available to hear the simultaneous translation and to amplify the sound for those people who are hard of hearing. There is simultaneous translation on channel 1 and sound amplification is available on channel 0.

[3] Peidiwch â chyffwrdd â'r botymau ar y meicroffonau gan y gall gwneud hynny amharu ar y system, a gofalu fod y golau coch ymlaen cyn dechrau siarad. Please don't touch the buttons on the microphones because this could affect the system, and ensure that the red light is on before starting speak.

[4] A oes unrhyw fuddiannau i'w datgan gan unrhyw un? Na. Ac nid oes ymddiheuriadau na dirprwyon heddiw. Are there any declarations of interest? No. There are no apologies or substitutions today.

Rheoliadau Safonau'r Gymraeg (Rhif 6) 2017: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth The Welsh Language Standards (No. 6) Regulations 2017: Evidence Session

[5] **Bethan Jenkins:** Felly, rydym ni'n symud ymlaen at eitem 2, sef rheoliadau safonau'r Gymraeg. Diolch i chi am ddod. Mae gennym ni Cerith Jones yma, o Undeb Cenedlaethol Myfyrwyr Cymru; Fflur Elin hefyd; ac wedyn Dafydd Trystan o'r Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. So we move on to item 2, which is the Welsh language standards regulations. Thank you for coming. We have Cerith Jones from the National Union of Students Wales; Fflur Elin, also from NUS Wales; and Dafydd Trystan from the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol.

[6] Wrth gwrs, rydym ni yma i drafod yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnwys yn y rheoliadau addysg, sydd wedi cael eu newid yn sgil y ffaith iddynt gael eu gwrthod gan y Cynulliad. A allwch chi jest dweud yn fras os ydych chi'n hapus gyda sut mae'r newidiadau hynny wedi cael eu cyflwyno gerbron gan y Gweinidog, ac a oes yna unrhyw sylwadau pellach gennyh chi fel mudiadau? Of course, we are here to discuss what is included in the education regulations, which have been amended as a result of the fact that they were rejected by the Assembly. Could you please tell us generally whether you are content with how those changes have been introduced by the Minister, and whether you have any further comments as organisations?

[7] **Ms Elin:** Rydym ni'n hapus i weld bod newidiadau wedi'u gwneud ar y safonau, ond nid ydym ni'n meddwl eu bod nhw'n ddigon cryf. **Ms Elin:** We are pleased to see that changes have been made to the standards, but we still don't think that they are robust enough. One of

Un o'r pethau rydym ni wedi'i ddweud yn ein hymateb yw, yn anochel, pan rych chi'n creu rhestr, mae rhai pethau sy'n mynd i fod ar goll. Er enghraifft, nid yw canolfannau hamdden ar y rhestr; prosesu talu ffioedd myfyrwyr; cofnodion myfyrwyr; y broses o geisio am ysgoloriaethau, ac ati. Ac mae'n siŵr y bydd pethau eraill yn codi. Beth fyddai'n well gennym ni ei weld yw'r pethau sy'n cael eu heithrio. Er enghraifft, un o'r pethau mae pobl yn dweud sydd ddim yn gallu bod yn y safonau yw ymchwil, felly efallai byddai hynny'n gallu cael ei eithrio o orfod bod yn gwbl ddwyieithog. Ond rŷm ni'n hapus i weld bod rhai newidiadau wedi'u gwneud.

[8] **Bethan Jenkins:** A fyddech chi'n mynd mor bell ag i ddweud bod angen ailedrych ar y rheoliadau hyn oherwydd, fel rydych chi'n ei ddweud, fod rhai pethau wedi cael eu gadael allan o hyd o'r rheoliadau hyn?

[9] **Ms Elin:** Byddwn. Nid ydym ni eisïau eu gweld nhw'n mynd ac yn cael eu gwrthod eto, achos byddai hynny'n rhoi stop ar y broses eto, ond beth fyddwn ni'n licio ei weld, efallai, yw eu bod nhw jest yn cael eu tynnu'n ôl am ychydig a bod addasiadau'n cael eu gwneud iddyn nhw a'u bod nhw wedyn yn mynd i'r bleidlais.

[10] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. A oes yna

the things that we've said in our response is, inevitably, when you draw up a list, there are some things that will be missing. For example, leisure centres aren't included; the processing of student fees payment; student records; the application process for scholarships, and so on. And I'm sure there will be other issues arising too. What we would prefer to see is that exemptions should've been included. For example, one of the things that can't be included is research, so that could be an exception in terms of having to be entirely bilingual. But we are pleased to see that certain changes have been made.

Bethan Jenkins: Would you go as far as to say that we need to look again at these regulations because, as you say, some things have been exempted in these regulations?

Ms Elin: Yes. We don't want to see them rejected again, because that would delay the process further, but what we would like to see is that they should be held back a little and some adaptations made, and that they are then taken to a vote.

Bethan Jenkins: Okay. Are there any

sylwadau pellach?

[11] **Dr Trystan:** Ie. Ar ran y coleg Cymraeg, y peth cyntaf i'w wneud yw croesawu'r safonau; maen nhw'n gam sylweddol ymlaen ym maes addysg uwch. Mae yna arfer da ym mhob un o brifysgolion Cymru. Mae yna bocedi o arfer da. Ond, yr hyn rŷm ni'n teimlo yw, o weithredu'r safonau yma, fe fydd e'n dod â chysondeb reit ar draws y prifysgolion ac yn sicrhau bod gan fyfyrwyr hawliau ym mhob un o brifysgolion Cymru, lle, efallai, ar hyn o bryd, mae yna brifysgolion sy'n cynnig yr hawliau yna yn llawn, neu bron yn llawn, ond mae yna amrywiaeth; mae yna amrywiaeth yn gallu bod hyd yn oed oddi mewn i brifysgolion unigol, gydag adrannau gwahanol. Mae gosod safonau fel hyn, wedyn, yn gosod ffrâm ac yn gosod sail, ac, o wneud hyn, fe fyddan nhw'n gam sicr ymlaen.

[12] Roeddech chi'n holi, Gadeirydd, tybed beth ddylem ni ei wneud heddiw a nawr gyda'r safonau yma. Gan eu bod nhw'n gam sylweddol ymlaen, byddwn i'n eich cynghori chi i ystyried eu cefnogi nhw, oherwydd eu bod nhw'n gam sylweddol ymlaen. Wrth gwrs, mae yna fwy y gellid ei wneud. Mae yna faterion y gellid eu trafod, ac mae yna faterion, petawn i wedi'u drafftio nhw, a fyddai, efallai, mymryn yn wahanol yn fan hyn. Pwy bynnag fyddai wedi'u drafftio nhw, byddai yna bwyslais mewn rhai manau,

further comments?

Dr Trystan: Yes. On behalf of the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, the first thing to do is welcome the standards; they are a significant step forward in the higher education sector. There is good practice in every university in Wales. There are pockets of good practice. But what we feel is that, in implementing these standards, it will bring consistency right across universities and ensure that students have rights in every Welsh university, where, perhaps, at present, there are universities that offer those rights fully, or nearly fully, but there is variety; there can be variety even within individual universities, within different departments. Setting standards in this way provides a framework and a basis, and, in so doing, they will certainly be a step forward.

You asked, Chair, what we should be doing now with these standards today. As they are a significant step forward, I would advise you to consider supporting them, because they are a significant step forward. Of course, more can be done. There are issues that can be discussed, and there are issues that, if I'd drafted them, perhaps would be slightly different. Depending on who did the drafting, there would be an emphasis in certain areas, but, because they're a significant step forward, the universities expect these standards.

ond, oherwydd eu bod nhw'n gam sylweddol ymlaen, mae'r prifysgolion yn disgwyl y safonau yma. Maen nhw'n dechrau cael effaith yn barod mewn rhai prifysgolion. Rydw i'n credu y byddai'n ddoeth i'w pasio nhw ac wedyn i symud tuag at weithredu, a, maes o law, dysgu unrhyw wersi sydd yna i'w dysgu o'u gosod nhw ar waith.

[13] **Bethan Jenkins:** Yn ôl beth rydw i'n ei ddeall, mae'r comisiynydd iaith yn mynd i allu dewis a dethol pa safonau sy'n cael eu rhoi ar y sefydliadau. A ydych chi'n credu, wedyn, bydd modd i chi ddehongli hynny er mwyn i'r sefydliadau eu deall er mwyn eu gweithredu ar lawr gwlad, achos efallai bydd rhai pobl yn dweud ei bod yn eithaf cymhleth i ddeall pob un ohonyn nhw.

[14] **Dr Trystan:** Ie, mae hynny'n gwestiwn da iawn ac efallai'n dod i'r holl broses safonau. Rydw i'n credu ei bod yn ddoeth bod y Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi bod yna adolygiad am fod o'r mesur a sut i symud ymlaen yn fanna, ac efallai y gallai'r broses fod yn llai biwrocraidd. Yn sicr, yn fy marn i, gallai fod a dylai fod, ond, dyma'r safonau sydd wedi'u gosod, ac, o'u gweithredu, fe fyddan nhw'n glir i brifysgolion ac fe fyddan nhw'n cael effaith ar y gwasanaeth sy'n cael ei gynnis i fyfyrwyr yn y prifysgolion. Rydw i'n credu bod yna ffordd, pan fyddwch chi'n dod i edrych ymlaen yn ystod y tymor yma, i wella'r mesur. Mae yna bethau i'w gwneud, yn sicr,

They're starting to have an impact already in some universities. I think it would be wise to pass them and then move towards implementation, and then learn any lessons that are to be learnt from implementing them.

Bethan Jenkins: From my understanding, the language commissioner will be able to select which standards are to be imposed on institutions. Do you then believe that it would be possible for you to interpret that in order to ensure that institutions understand how they need to be implemented, because some people may say that it's quite difficult to understand all of the?

Dr Trystan: Yes, that is a very good question and perhaps relates to the whole standards process. I think it's wise that the Minister has announced that a review is going to be held of the measure and how to move forward from that, and perhaps the process could be less bureaucratic. Certainly, in my view, it could and should be. However, these are the standards that have been set and, in implementing them, they would be clear for universities and would have an impact on the service that's offered to students in universities. I think there is a way, when you come to look forward during this term, to improve the measure. There are

ond mae'r rhain yn cynnig ffrâm, o'u gweithredu'n llawn yn y gwahanol brifysgolion, i symud y gwasanaeth ymlaen yn sylweddol.

things to do, certainly, but these offer a framework, in implementing them fully in the various universities, to move the service forward significantly.

[15] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes gan Aelodau gwestiynau? Jeremy.

Bethan Jenkins: Do Members have any questions? Jeremy.

[16] **Jeremy Miles:** Oherwydd eich ateb chi, a ydw i'n deall eich bod chi o'r farn, felly, y byddech chi'n barod i'w gweld nhw'n mynd o flaen y Cynulliad yn y ffurf yma, neu a ydych chi hefyd yn gobeithio y bydd newidiadau cyn iddyn nhw fynd i'r Cynulliad?

Jeremy Miles: From your response, do I understand, therefore, that you're of the view that you would be willing to see them put before the Assembly in their current form, or would you hope to see them amended before a vote?

[17] **Dr Trystan:** Yn fy marn i—. Yn amlwg, nid yw'r coleg Cymraeg, fel corff, wedi trafod pob un o'r safonau—y 180, neu faint bynnag ohonyn nhw sydd—mewn manylder. Ond yn fy marn i, gan eu bod nhw yn cynnig cam sylweddol ymlaen, ac, yn wir, nad oes yna gamau yn ôl—. Hynny yw, rydw i'n edrych i'ch trafodaeth chi ddoe, yn sicr. Byddai neb yn dadlau ddoe nad oedd yna gamau ymlaen na chamau yn ôl yn y drafodaeth honno, ond, gyda'r rhain, maen nhw'n gamau ymlaen yn sicr. O bosib, maen nhw'n gamau bach. Nid y rhain yw'r camau mwyaf bras y gellid eu cymryd, ond, ar sail hynny, byddwn i'n awgrymu y dylid eu pasio nhw yn y ffurf yma a'u gweithredu. Gwnaf i roi un enghraifft ichi. Roeddwn i'n trafod gydag un brifysgol sydd wedi datblygu yn

Dr Trystan: In my view—. Clearly, the Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol, as a body, hasn't discussed each one of these standards—the 180, or however many there are—in detail. But, in my view, because they offer a significant step forward, and, really, there are no retrograde steps—. I was looking at your discussion yesterday. Certainly, nobody would argue yesterday that there weren't steps forward or retrograde steps in that discussion, but, with these, they certainly are steps forward. They could be considered to be small steps. They're not the biggest steps that could be taken, but, on that basis, I would suggest that they should be passed in this form and implemented. I will give you one example. I was discussing with one university that have significantly

sylweddol ei darpariaeth yn ddiweddar, ac roedden nhw'n dweud eu bod nhw wedi bod yn gweithio tuag at weithredu'r safonau ac, ar hyn o bryd, mae llai na 10 o swyddi lle mae'r Gymraeg yn ofynnol yn y brifysgol honno. Roedden nhw'n ystyried, o weithredu'r safonau ac er mwyn cynnig gwasanaeth addas i fyfyrwyr, y byddai'r ffigwr yna'n agosach at 100, sydd yn dal i fod yn ganran fach iawn o'r staff sydd yn y brifysgol honno, ond mae hynny'n werthfawr, byddwn i'n awgrymu wrthy ch chi.

developed their provision recently, and they were saying that they've been working towards implementing the standards, and, at the moment, there are fewer than 10 posts where the Welsh language is a requirement. Their thinking was that, in implementing the standards and offering an appropriate service for students, that that figure would be closer to 100, which, okay, is still a small percentage of the staff at that university, but that is valuable, I would suggest to you.

[18] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi eisiau dod nôl ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Do you want to come back on that?

[19] **Jeremy Miles:** Gwnaethoch chi sôn am arfer da mewn prifysgolion. A fyddech chi'n disgrifio'r sefyllfa fel un lle mae arfer da sydd yn well na'r safonau sydd yn cael eu trafod fan hyn, a beth yw'r ffordd orau o rannu'r arfer da yna?

Jeremy Miles: You mentioned good practice in universities. Would you describe the situation as one where there is good practice that is better than the standards being discussed here, and what's the best way of sharing that best practice?

[20] **Dr Trystan:** Wel, mae hynny'n gwestiwn da. Un o'r pethau rydym ni'n ei wneud fel coleg Cymraeg yn rheolaidd yw tynnu arbenigwyr a darlithwyr o ar draws Cymru at ei gilydd i rannu arferion da o ran cefnogaeth myfyrwyr, o ran asesu myfyrwyr. Un o'r pethau lle mae yna drafodaeth i'w chael yw a ddylid cyfieithu gwaith myfyrwyr, er enghraifft. Mae'r Asiantaeth Safonau Ansawdd ei hunan yn dweud nad yw hynny'n arfer gorau, ac felly mae'r Coleg wedi adnabod arferion da lle'r

Dr Trystan: That is a good question. One of the things that we're doing as the *coleg Cymraeg* on a regular basis is to bring experts and lecturers together from all over Wales to share good practice in terms of student support, in terms of student assessment. One of the areas where there is a discussion to be had is whether the work of students should be translated, for example. The Quality Assurance Agency itself says that that is not best practice and, therefore, the *coleg* has identified

ydydym ni'n gallu cydweithio â darlithwyr ac adnabod arbenigwyr. So, os ydych chi'n cyflwyno gwaith yn y Gymraeg, ym mha bynnag bwnc— os yw e yn y gyfraith neu mewn gwleidyddiaeth neu yn nyrsio neu beth bynnag yw e—mae yna arbenigwr sydd, fan lleiaf, yn gallu ail-farcio'r gwaith yn y Gymraeg yn ogystal â'r marcio cyntaf sydd, efallai, o gyfieithiad. So, mae yna ffyrdd o rannu arfer da. Byddwn i'n dweud bod yna sawl enghraifft o arfer sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i'r safonau, ond da hynny. Nid wyf i'n credu y bydd y safonau'n peryglu hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd. Mater i ni, mater i'r prifysgolion ac eraill yw dangos yr arfer da hwnnw a chymell pob un o'r prifysgolion i ymgynraedd at y lefel honno.

good practice where we can collaborate with lecturers and identify experts. So, if you do present work in Welsh, in whatever subject that might be—whether it's in nursing, law, politics or so forth—there will be an expert who, at least, can re-mark that work in Welsh, as well as the first marker, who, perhaps, is using a translation. So, there are ways of sharing good practice. I would say there are many examples of good practice that go beyond the standards, and that's a good thing. I don't think the standards will endanger that in any way. It's a matter for us, for universities and for others, to demonstrate that good practice and to encourage all universities to aim to that level.

[21] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Suzy.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Suzy.

[22] **Suzy Davies:** Rwy'n derbyn bod y cwestiwn o anghysondeb yn creu effaith ar ddealltwriaeth yn gyffredinol, ond a allaf i jest ofyn cwestiynau yn glou am y rhestr o bynciau sydd ddim yn y rhai newydd yma? A ydy e'n bosib dweud os yw rhai o'r rhain, neu un ohonyn nhw, yn flaenoriaeth i'ch myfyrwyr? Rwyf i eisiau trio cael rhyw fath o sens o beth yw'r hawliau mwyaf pwysig i'ch aelodau, achos mae cyfnod i gael tystiolaeth nawr yn dod ymlaen.

Suzy Davies: I understand that the question of inconsistency does have an impact on people's understanding of this generally, but can I just ask you a very quick question on the list of issues not included here? Could you tell us whether any of these is a priority for your students? I'm just trying to get a sense of what the most important issues are for your members, because this is an evidence-gathering period now, isn't it?

[23] **Ms Elin:** Yn y bôn, beth rydym ni'n moyn yw addysg sy'n gynhwysol i bawb, ac addysg y mae pawb yn

Ms Elin: Fundamentally, what we want is inclusive education, education that everyone can access

gallu cael mynediad ati a llwyddo ynddi, dim ots beth yw eu nodweddion a'u cefndir. Yng Nghymru, mae hynny'n golygu cael mynediad at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Pan fyddwn ni'n siarad am addysg yn Gymraeg, nid ydym ni jest yn siarad am ddarpariaeth yn yr ystafell ddosbarth neu'r llyfrau sydd ar gael, er eu bod nhw'n hollbwysig, ond y profiad cyfan yn y brifysgol. Ac rwy'n meddwl mai dyna pam y byddwn i'n hoffi gweld bod eithriadau yn hytrach na rhestr. Er enghraifft, canolfannau hamdden—mae rhai myfyrwyr mewn un brifysgol wedi cael problem gyda dwyieithrwydd yn y ganolfan hamdden sy'n berchen i'r brifysgol, ac mae yna fyfyrwyr sy'n astudio rhannau o'u cwrs nhw yn y llefydd yna. Felly, beth fyddem ni'n licio gweld yw bod y safonau'n rhoi'r pŵer yna i'r myfyrwyr allu herio eu prifysgol pan fo angen, er mwyn gwella'r ddarpariaeth.

and thrive in, whatever their background or characteristics. In Wales, that means having access to Welsh-medium education. When we're talking about Welsh-medium education, we're not just talking about provision in the classroom and the materials available, although they're crucially important, but the rounded experience within the university. And that's why I would want to see exceptions, rather than a list of inclusions. For example, leisure centres—some students at a university have had a problem with bilingualism at the leisure centre owned by the university, and there are students studying parts of their courses at those locations. So, what we would want to see is the standards giving those students the power to challenge their university when required in order to improve provision.

[24] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr.

Suzy Davies: Thank you.

[25] **Bethan Jenkins:** Unrhyw beth arall, Suzy?

Bethan Jenkins: Anything else, Suzy?

[26] **Suzy Davies:** Na, rwy'n iawn.

Suzy Davies: No, that's fine for me.

[27] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dai.

Bethan Jenkins: Dai.

[28] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr am y dystiolaeth. Wrth gwrs, fel pobl sydd yn gorfod pleidleisio ar y pethau yma, yn aml rydym ni mewn cyfyng-gyngor. Fel mae Dafydd wedi cyfeirio

[29] **Dai Lloyd:** Thank you very much for the evidence. Of course, as people who have to vote on these issues, quite often, we're in a quandary. As Dafydd mentioned, with

eisoes, gyda phroses Bil Cymru ddoe, roeddem ni mewn sawl wythnos o gyfyng-gyngor. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, mae'n rhaid i rywun bleidleisio 'ie' neu 'na' o blaid y rheoliadau yma.

the Wales Bill process yesterday, we were in a quandary for many weeks. At the end of the day, one has to vote 'yes' or 'no' in relation to these regulations.

09:15

[30] Rwy'n edrych hefyd at ein cefnogwyr cyfreithiol ni. Rwy'n derbyn beth rydych chi'n ei ddweud, sef bod beth sydd o'n blaen yn well na beth sydd yna ar hyn o bryd, achos, wedi gwrthod y rhain, bron i flwyddyn yn ôl rŵan, nid oes yna ddim byd gerbron yn awr. Felly, os ydym ni fel Cynulliad yn mynd i bleidleisio yn erbyn y rhain achos eu bod nhw'n amherffraith, ni fydd yna'n dal ddim rheoliadau mewn lle. Rydw i jest eisiau nodi hynny. Wedyn, y broses, felly, os ydym ni'n mynd i ddilyn y trywydd o gynnig gwelliant ar hyd y ffordd yr ydych chi'n awgrymu, a ydy hynny'n mynd i oedi'r system? A ydy hynny'n mynd i daflu'r system yn gyfan gwbl i lawr rhyw ffos yn rhywle, neu i'r glaswellt hir, fel na fyddwn yn gweld y rheoliadau yma am fisoedd eto? A ydy hi'n bosibl gwneud rhyw fân newid fel yna drwy atodiad ychwanegol, felly, ar hyd y llinellau sydd wedi cael eu hawgrymu, ynteu a ydy hynny'n mynd i lwyr ddifetha'r system hon, a'r dewis sydd gyda ni ydy cytuno'r rhestr yma neu anghytuno'r rhestr yma, sydd yn golygu blwyddyn arall heb ddim rheoliadau? Nid ydw i'n gwybod pwy sydd eisiau ymateb i hynny.

I'm also looking to our legal advisers. I accept what you say, which is that what is in front of us is better than what is in place currently, because, having rejected these nearly a year ago now, there is nothing before us at the moment. So, if, as an Assembly, we're going to vote against these because they're imperfect, there will still be no regulations in place. I just want to note that. So, the process, therefore, if we're going to follow the route of providing an amendment in the way that you suggest, is that going to delay the system? Is that going to lead to the system being thrown away, into the long grass, so that we might not see these regulations again for many months? Is it possible to introduce minor changes along the lines that have been suggested, or will that completely destroy the system, and the option that we have is to agree or disagree with this list, which would mean another year without regulations? I don't know who'd like to respond to that.

[31] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch, Dai. Fe wnawn ni jest ofyn i Gwyn, fel cynghorydd, i esbonio pe bai ymgynghoriad arall, a yw'n bosibl cael ymgynghoriad arall, neu a oes yn rhaid, wedyn, fel y mae Dai yn dweud, dweud 'ie' neu 'na' i hyn, ac wedyn derbyn yr amherffeithrwydd yn y system.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you, Dai. I will just ask Gwyn, as an adviser, to explain, if there were to be further consultation, whether it's possible to have such a consultation, or, as Dai said, do we just have to agree or disagree with these, and accept the imperfections within the system.

[32] **Mr Griffiths:** Wel, y dewis fydd gerbron y Cynulliad ar sail y ddeddfwriaeth yma ydy 'ie' neu 'nage'. Mae dwy ffordd o'u newid nhw. Yn gyntaf, fe all y Llywodraeth eu tynnu nhw nôl a gwneud mân newidiadau a'u hailgyflwyno nhw. Byddai hynny—wel, yn yr achos yma, mae o wedi arwain at ohiriad o bron i flwyddyn ar gyfer newidiadau cymharol fychan.

Mr Griffiths: Well, the choice before the Assembly on the basis of this legislation will be on a 'yes' or 'no' basis. There are two ways of amending these. First of all, the Government could withdraw them and make minor amendments and reintroduce them. Well, in that case, that has led to a delay of almost a year for relatively minor changes.

[33] Y dewis arall fyddai pasio'r rhain fel y maen nhw, a gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ailystyried rhai materion a chyflwyno rheoliadau pellach sy'n diwygio'r rhain maes o law. Ni fyddai hynny yn oedi'r broses o roi'r rhain ar waith, ond byddai'n rhoi cyfle i chi argymhell newidiadau pellach i'w dwyn ymlaen ymhellach ymlaen.

The other option would be to pass them as they are currently drafted and ask the Government to reconsider certain issues and introduce further regulations that would amend these in due time. That wouldn't delay the process of implementing these, but it would give you an opportunity to propose further changes that could be brought forward at a later date.

[34] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. A oes sylwadau penodol gyda chi ar hynny?

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Any specific comments on that?

[35] **Ms Elin:** Oes. Rydw i'n meddwl, yn amlwg, pan fydd gennych restr fel hon, rydym ni wedi ffeindio pethau

Ms Elin: Yes. I think, clearly, when you have a list such as this, we've found things that are missing, but I

sydd ar goll, ond rwy'n meddwl mai ein blaenoriaeth ni yw bod safonau. Beth nid ydym ni eisiau ei weld yw eu bod nhw'n gorfod cael eu gwrthod eto, achos fel rydych chi'n dweud, mae hynny'n gwneud y broses yn flwyddyn arall. Mae'n bwysig bod gan fyfyrwyr y safonau mewn lle fel eu bod nhw, fel y dywedais i, yn gallu galw am ddarpariaeth well trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, beth fyddem ni'n hoffi ei weld mewn byd delfrydol yw bod modd gwneud y newidiadau a gwneud y gwelliannau, ond os nad yw hynny'n bosibl, ein blaenoriaeth yw bod safonau yna.

think our priority is that there are standards. What we don't want to see is that they have to be rejected again, because as you said, that has extended the process a year. It's important that the students have the standards in place so that, as I said, they can call for improved provision through the medium of Welsh. So, what we would like to see in an ideal world is that there's a way of introducing changes and amendments, but if that isn't possible, the priority would be that the standards exist.

[36] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Dafydd.

Bethan Jenkins: Thanks. Dafydd.

[37] **Dr Trystan:** Rydw i'n meddwl, Gadeirydd, fod rhai o'r pwyntiau y mae ein ffrindiau coll o Gymdeithas yr Iaith yn eu gwneud yn eu tystiolaeth nhw am y broses, a sut efallai y gellid gwella'r broses, yn rhai i'w hystyried yn y dyfodol. Fel ag y mae, rydw i'n teimlo bod y rhain yn gam mawr ymlaen, a byddwn i'n tybio, petawn ni flwyddyn lawr y lein, neu ddwy flynedd lawr y lein, a bod yna *issue* penodol wedi dod i'r amlwg am ganolfannau hamdden neu beth bynnag yw e, fe fyddwn i'n gobeithio y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn agored i ystyried gwneud rheoliadau pellach petai angen.

Dr Trystan: Well, Chair, I do think that some of the points that our missing colleagues from Cymdeithas yr Iaith make in their evidence about the process, and how the process could be improved, are ones that may be considered for the future. But as it currently stands, I do think that this represents a major step forward and I would assume that if we were a year down the line, or two years down the line, and there was a specific issue that had emerged on sports centres or whatever else it may be, then I would hope that the Government would be willing to consider further regulations if that were necessary.

[38] Rydw i yn meddwl bod yna *balance* wrth wneud newidiadau a

I do think that there is a balance to be struck in making changes and in

Deddfau cydraddoldeb o fynd yn ddigon pell i fynd â phobl gyda chi ond heb fynd mor bell ei fod yn anymarferol i'w gweithredu. Mae hynny'n gamp. Rydw i'n eithaf diamynedd fel person. Rydw i bob amser yn hoff o fynd ymhellach, efallai, ond mae'r cydbwysedd yna yn bwysig, ac rydw i'n credu, yn yr achos yma, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ystyried y cydbwysedd yna. Fe fydd ambell her i brifysgolion o weithredu'r safonau yma, ac fe fydd e'n newid diwylliant mewn rhai manau. Felly, wrth eu pasio nhw, gobeithio, peidiwch â meddwl nad oes yna wahaniaeth yn mynd i ddod o ganlyniad i'r safonau sydd ger eich bron heddiw.

[39] **Bethan Jenkins:** A wyt ti eisiau dod nôl ar hynny, Dai?

[40] **Dai Lloyd:** Wel, jest i gadarnhau y bydd pobl yn fodlon, felly, yn y maes, pe bawn ni yn dod i ryw fath o gytundeb yn fan hyn gyda'r rhai sydd yn gorfod pleidleisio ar y pethau hyn, y byddai'n ddigon teg i bleidleisio o blaid y rhestr yma, ond gan ddweud wrth y Llywodraeth fod yna ddisgwyl y bydd angen newid, o bryd i'w gilydd, fel y mae tystiolaeth arall megis y canolfannau hamdden yn dod i law. Felly, rwy'n edrych am ryw fath o arweiniad o ochr Gwyn, ac wrth gwrs ochr y dystiolaeth. Felly, gallai pawb fod yn rhyw fath o hapus efo rhyw fath o osodiad fel yna.

making law on equality, in going far enough and taking people with you, but not going so far that it's impractical in its implementation. That's something of an art. I'm quite impatient as an individual. I always want to go further, but that balance is important. In this case, I do think the Government has taken that balance into account. There will be some challenges for universities in implementing these standards, and it will be a culture change in certain places. So, as they are passed—I hope—please don't think that these standards that are before you today won't make a difference.

Bethan Jenkins: Dai, do you want to come back on that?

Dai Lloyd: I just want to confirm that people will be content in this area if we came to sort of agreement here with those who have to vote on these things that it would be fair to vote for this list, but in doing so saying to the Government that there's an expectation for a change from time to time, as other evidence such as leisure centres comes to light. So, I'm looking for some sort of guidance on this from Gwyn, and from the point of view of the evidence. So, everyone could be sort of content with that sort of statement.

[41] **Dr Trystan:** Nid ydw i ddim yn siŵr os gallaf siarad ar ran y sector gyfan, ond petai'r sector yn rhoi'r hawl i mi ei wneud—. [*Chwerthin.*] Hynny yw, mae darlithwyr, mae'r bobl sydd â'u calonnau nhw yn y gwaith o addysgu cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ein prifysgolion ni, maen nhw'n awyddus i weld safonau a byddan nhw'n falch o weld y rhain yn pasio, ac yn edrych ymlaen at weithio oddi mewn i fframwaith y safonau.

Dr Trystan: I'm not sure if I can speak on behalf of the whole sector, but if the sector were to give me the right to do so—. [*Laughter.*] That is, lecturers and those who are fully involved in teaching through the medium of Welsh in our colleges and universities are eager to see standards, and they will be pleased to see these passed, and will look forward to working within the standards framework.

[42] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ac, wrth gwrs, bydd beirniadaeth wleidyddol eto yn dod i mewn i'r peth hefyd, rwy'n siŵr. [*Chwerthin.*] Lee Waters.

Bethan Jenkins: And, of course, there will be political criticism coming into this again, I'm sure. [*Laughter.*] Lee Waters.

[43] **Lee Waters:** I'd just like to follow up on something Dafydd Trystan said about the practicality. You gave the example of one university where only 10 posts currently require Welsh as an essential, and that will go up to 100. So, how would the university you spoke to in that case be dealing practically with that? Is that achievable, and what would be the opportunity costs of that?

[44] **Dr Trystan:** Well, I wouldn't want to go into the precise specifics of an individual university, but what we've seen is that where universities have, say, put a requirement for Welsh to be essential, or even desirable, on posts, they've managed to recruit suitable staff to fill those gaps. I mean, there are schools in a university not far from here that have an administrative team of, say, half a dozen, and they offer education in both languages, and what they seek to do is to make sure that one of those half a dozen can deal with the students in both languages, and they've managed to achieve that.

[45] I think what's happened, if I was to be a little more open, is that there have been language schemes in place in all of these universities for several years, but the degree to which they have been fully implemented varies greatly. Those that have been implementing their language schemes conscientiously will not have great difficulty with the standards.

[46] **Lee Waters:** Presumably because that's practically very difficult. You give the example of a team of six administrators; so, were this change to be

brought in, I assume that one of those administrators' posts would have to be changed and the existing post holder moved, made redundant, because we're not anticipating extra resource, so we need to be able to do this.

[47] **Dr Trystan:** No. I think there's an element of planning, of creativity, that universities, that all institutions that operate bilingually, have undertaken for many years, and the Welsh Government itself ensures that there are enough staff to be able to deal with the people of Wales in both languages. I don't think it is beyond universities. What we're talking about here is a very small percentage of the university cohort, and there are examples—I come back to the point about different universities—there are examples of universities in the same city that have twice as many Welsh-speaking staff as others, and that's merely because they added 'Welsh desirable' to their adverts. I mean, we're not talking about huge changes here, but there are small changes that can be made that will have, consequentially, a longer term impact. There is no understanding here that there will be, sort of, posts being got rid of or anything; it's slowly, over time, planning properly your workforce needs to deliver to the needs of your students.

[48] **Lee Waters:** Could I also ask the NUS Wales representatives about one of the changes, which was including the student intranet within the standards? I think it's standard 12. So, the student intranet's a dynamic, changing website, with lots of new content being added constantly, so there's going to be a resource implication to that, and, presumably, again, without any extra resources, that's resource coming from elsewhere. Why do you think the student intranet is such an important thing to have translated?

[49] **Ms Elin:** Well, the student intranet is key in terms of accessing your education. So, you use that to submit your assignments, to read resources from class, and, like we said, Welsh students should have the ability to engage with their education through the medium of Welsh. There are students who are more confident when speaking, reading, listening through the language of Welsh, and they shouldn't have an extra barrier placed between them and engaging with education. And with intranet and internet becoming, you know, more and more of a key part of students' everyday academic life—you know, you access your intranet nearly every day when you're a student—they should be able to access that through the medium of Welsh as a right. I think that's why we welcome that the *safonau* put that in place, because there should be central governance from the Assembly putting these duties on universities, in order to ensure that they can access

Welsh language education.

[50] **Lee Waters:** Could I ask a separate point? I was struck by what you said about the case for moving to a basis of exceptions, rather than trying to enumerate everything. Dafydd Trystan said something that was making a similar point. Because this is my first detailed exposure to the standards, and I was struck by how complex they are. So, for example, standard 160 says:

[51] 'You must keep a record of the number of members of staff who wear a badge...at the end of each financial year.'

[52] There's a badge indicating that you're able to speak Welsh. Do you really think that the standards should be capturing that level of detail?

[53] **Ms Elin:** Well, if you take that down to the experience of a student going into university, particularly in south Wales, for example, you might initially start a conversation in English, especially if you're a learner. So, a badge that indicates that you speak Welsh, I suppose, makes the experience—. I mean, that is a big level of detail—

[54] **Lee Waters:** But that's common sense. You don't need to capture that in law, do you?

[55] **Ms Elin:** The *safonau* go into a lot of detail to ensure that this provision is being put in place. I think we welcome that Welsh students can see whether or not staff can communicate with them through the medium of Welsh.

[56] **Lee Waters:** So, you think that level of legal compulsion is necessary.

[57] **Ms Elin:** We think it is good that there are rules on universities to make sure that they are providing an experience for students that is delivered through the medium of Welsh.

[58] **Dr Trystan:** I think what is interesting here—if I may, Fflur—is that were it to be the case that university policies were routinely advising students of the Welsh-speaking skills of their staff, then I'm sure that the Government wouldn't have been minded to make such regulations. But it isn't the case at the moment. In an ideal world, these matters probably shouldn't be matters of law, but we are where we are. I'm sure you're not, but there's almost a temptation to say that—. I mean, all equalities legislation does provide some

burden to the public authorities that have to enforce that legislation. Over time, public authorities, Assembly Members and Members of Parliament have taken the view that, in order to ensure equality, whether it is for Welsh speakers, men and women, LGBT or for whatever other characteristics we would want to ensure equality, there is a need for legislation. Therefore, that's what's behind the standards legislation. It is, in my view, a piece of equalities legislation, and that needs to be appropriate to the context then.

[59] **Lee Waters:** Indeed, and also, the judgment is: where does the boundary of appropriateness start and stop? You made the point about the balance between trying to change culture, and sometimes you go ahead of where public opinion is and risk an adverse reaction. I'm just wondering whether you think that making universities count the number of people issued with badges, and reporting on that on an annual basis, goes too far in that respect.

[60] **Dr Trystan:** I think if you went into the individual details of lots—

[61] **Lee Waters:** Well, that's our job.

[62] **Dr Trystan:** Yes. There could be a discussion. Given the current context, I don't think it goes too far. I think ensuring that people know which staff members they can deal with through the medium of Welsh without having to go through that awkward conversation of starting the conversation in Welsh and then somebody having to apologise, 'Oh, no, I don't really speak Welsh', because that can be embarrassing, not only to the person you're speaking to, but also to the student or to myself. If I start a conversation in Welsh because I believe somebody to be a Welsh speaker, there's always a little bit of awkwardness, isn't there? So, I think it makes sense. It is common sense. If it were being implemented everywhere, I'm sure that the Government would not have made the regulation. The final answer to the question is that you can refer the question to the Minister who will be with you later, who has decided to put it in here. But I think he is right to put it in here on the basis of current practice.

[63] **Lee Waters:** Thank you.

[64] **Bethan Jenkins:** Edrych ymlaen i weld dy fathodyn di y tro nesaf, te, Dafydd. [*Chwerthin.*] Jeremy, a wyt ti eisiau dod nôl ar hynny?
Bethan Jenkins: I'm looking forward to seeing your badge next time, Dafydd. [*Laughter.*] Jeremy, do you want to come back on that?

[65] **Jeremy Miles:** Dafydd, gwnaethoch chi sôn bod y coleg cenedlaethol, wrth gwrs, yn croesawu'r safonau, fel y byddem yn ei ddisgwyl, a bod presenoldeb y safonau, er nad ydyn nhw eto yn gyfraith gwlad, wedi dechrau newid arfer mewn sefydliadau. Beth yw eich argraff chi, yn ehangach, ar ymateb y sefydliadau i ddyfodiad y safonau hyn?

Jeremy Miles: Dafydd, you mentioned that the *coleg cenedlaethol*, of course, welcomed these standards, as we would expect, and that the presence of the standards, even though they're not the law of the land, have started to change practices. What is your experience of the response of institutions to the arrival of these standards?

[66] **Dr Trystan:** Wel, a gawn ni ei roi e fel hyn? Mae yna dair carfan o bobl rwy'n dod ar eu traws yn y prifysgolion. Mae yna bobl sydd yn ymrwymedig i'r Gymraeg. Fe fyddan nhw'n gwneud popeth o fewn eu gallu nhw i ddatblygu gweithgarwch Cymraeg, hyd yn oed os ydyn nhw'n gwneud hynny'n wirfoddol, heb eu bod nhw'n cael unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth gan y brifysgol am wneud hynny. Mae yna garfan yn fanna.

Dr Trystan: Well, if I can put it in these terms: there are three cohorts of people that I come across within universities. There are people who are committed to the Welsh language who will do everything they can to develop Welsh activities, even if they do so on a voluntary basis, without them receiving any recognition from the university for doing that. There is a cohort there.

[67] Mae yna garfan wedyn—a dyma'r garfan fwyaf, o bell ffordd—sy'n barod i wneud pethau os oes yn rhaid iddyn nhw, neu os oes yna achos cryf dros wneud. Dyma grynsyth prifysgolion a staff prifysgolion Cymru.

There is another cohort—and this is the largest, by a long stretch—who are willing to do things if they are required to do so, or if there is a strong case for doing so. This is the largest group within the universities and university staff in Wales.

[68] Wedyn, mae yna rai sydd yn elyniaethus ac yn gwneud popeth y gallan nhw i atal darparu gwasanaethau Cymraeg. Roedd yna un enghraifft o adran a oedd yn dweud, 'Wel, os ych chi am gyflwyno

There are those also who are opposed to these provisions and will do everything they can to prevent Welsh-medium provision. There was one example where a department said, 'Well, if you want to present

gwaith yn Gymraeg, ffein; os ych chi yn bod mor ffôl â hynny, mater i chi yw hynny, ond mae'n rhaid i chi gyflwyno'r gwaith yn Gymraeg o leiaf pythefnos cyn y gwaith yn Saesneg. Fe fyddwn ni'n cael e wedi'i gyfieithu, ac wedyn mae'n rhaid i chi fynd trwy'r cyfieithiad i tsieco ei fod yn ocê, ac wedyn byddwn ni'n ei farco fe yn Saesneg'. Nawr, mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny ddim—. Mae hynny'n bell iawn o fod yn arfer gorau. Felly, fe fydd y safonau yn cael eu croesawu gan y sawl sydd o blaid y Gymraeg ac sydd wedi bod yn gweithio yn ddiwyd dros y Gymraeg. Fe fydd y safonau yn cael eu gweithredu yn ddigon bodlon a hapus gan y crynswth yna o staff sy'n fodlon gwneud pethau ac sy'n gweld yr achos dros ddarparu. Ac, ymysg y sawl, efallai'r lleiafrif bach yna, sydd ddim mor gefnogol i ddatblygiadau Cymraeg a sicrhau hynny, fe fydd y safonau'n ei gwneud yn glir bod yna wasanaeth y gall pob myfyrwr ym mhrifysgolion Cymru ddisgwyl ei dderbyn. Felly, yn gyffredinol, rydw i'n credu y bydd y prifysgolion yn croesawu'r safonau ac y byddan nhw'n edrych i gyrff fel y coleg Cymraeg ac eraill i gydweithio gyda nhw i ddelifro'r safonau mewn ffordd sy'n gall ac sy'n arddel synnwyr cyffredin hefyd.

09:30

[69] **Jeremy Miles:** Ac o ran arweinyddiaeth ac adrannau corfforaethol sefydliadau, a fydddech chi'n dweud bod crynswth y rheini yn

work in Welsh, then fine; if you're that foolish, that's an issue for you, but you'll have to submit that work in Welsh at least a fortnight before the work presented by your colleagues in English. We will get it translated, and then you will have to check that translation to check that it's okay, and we'll mark it in English'. So, it's clear that that isn't—. That's a long way from being best practice. So, the standards will be welcomed by those who are supportive of the Welsh language and have worked diligently to further the language. The standards will be implemented quite happily by that large group of staff who see the case for making the provision and are willing to do so. And, among the perhaps small minority who perhaps aren't as supportive of the development of the Welsh language, then the standards will make it clear to them that there is a service that all students at Welsh universities can expect to receive. So, generally speaking, I think that the universities will welcome the standards and that they will look to bodies such as the *coleg Cymraeg* and others to work with them in delivering the standards in a way that demonstrates common sense and wisdom.

Jeremy Miles: And, in terms of leadership and the corporate departments of the establishments, would you say the majority of those

y categori canol?

[70] **Dr Trystan:** Byddwn. A bod yn onest, rydw i'n credu beth yr ym ni wedi ei weld hefyd mewn blynyddoedd diweddar yw cyfres o benodiadau ar lefel uwch ym mhrifysgolion Cymru o bobl sy'n ymglywed yn fwy gyda Chymru a rôl—rwy'n meddwl am is-ganghellor Prifysgol Caerdydd. O beth y mae e wedi ei ddweud yn gyhoeddus, mae yn amlwg yn gweld Caerdydd fel prifysgol Gymreig ryngwladol. Nid dyna fel y bu erioed ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd—cawn ni ei dweud hi felly.

[71] Mae is-ganghellor newydd Prifysgol Met Caerdydd wedi dod â chyd-destun o weithio ym maes cydraddoldeb ac wedi dod o'r Alban ac mae gydag ef ddiddordeb mawr yng Nghymru ac ati hefyd. Felly, mae yna benodiadau sy'n cynnig y cyfle i arweinyddiaeth prifysgolion a'r safonau blethu a chydweithio.

[72] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Roeddwn i jest eisiau gofyn ynglŷn â'ch sylwadau chi, Fflur, ynglŷn â lles myfyrwyr ac a ydy hynny yn rhy eang. Yn ôl beth rwy'n ei ddeall, mae'r diffiniad yng nghyd-destun iechyd meddwl a chwmsela, ond rŷch chi eisiau i hynny fod yn fwy *specific* ynglŷn â beth sydd yn dod o dan gyngor. Ond, eto, fydddech chi ddim, rydw i'n clywed, am inni bleidleisio yn erbyn hwn. A allwch chi jest ehangu ar hynny yn fras?

are in the middle category?

Dr Trystan: Yes, I would. And, to be honest, what we've also seen in recent years is a series of appointments at senior levels at Welsh universities of people who have a greater awareness of Wales and a role—I'm thinking of the vice-chancellor at Cardiff University. In terms of his public statements, he clearly sees Cardiff as a Welsh and international university. That hasn't always been the case at Cardiff University, if I can put it in those terms.

The new vice-chancellor of Cardiff Met University has brought with him a context of working in the field of equality and has come from Scotland and has huge interest in Wales, and so on. So, there are appointments that provide opportunities for leadership within universities and the standards to come together and work effectively.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. I just wanted to ask about your comments, Fflur, regarding student welfare and whether that is too broad. From what I understand, the definition is in the context of mental health and counselling, but you want that to be more specific in terms of what comes under advice. But, then, I hear that you wouldn't want us to reject this by voting against it. Could you just expand on that broadly?

[73] **Ms Elin:** O ble y byddwn i'n dod yw bod lles myfyrwyr yn gallu bod yn rhywbeth eithaf eang, ac mae'n anodd diffinio yn union beth fyddai hynny. Mewn prifysgolion, mae rhai pobl yn darparu cwnsela, cyngor ariannol, cyngor gyda thai, systemau cyfoed myfyrwyr, lle, pan ych chi'n dechrau yn y brifysgol, mae myfyrwyr sy'n edrych ar eich ôl chi ac yn gwneud yn siŵr eich bod chi'n setlo yn y brifysgol, ac ati, ac rydym ni'n meddwl y dylai myfyrwyr allu gael yr hawl at y systemau a'r cymorth yna drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Nawr, ni fyddwn i eisiau ei weld yn cael ei gyfyngu eto, achos, fel yr ym ni wedi dweud yn barod, pan fo gyda chi restr, rŷch chi'n mynd i golli rhywbeth, ond efallai, os oes newidiadau yn cael eu gwneud i'r safonau, efallai fod modd ymhelaethu ar ba fath o ardaloedd y byddai hynny'n eu cyfro er mwyn i fyfyrwyr allu—. Fel nad ydy ddim jest yn gwneud, er bod hynny'n hollbwysig, achos mae diffyg darpariaeth cwnsela drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn broblem gyffredinol yng Nghymru, ond bod bach o ymhelaethu ar hynny.

[74] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydy'r un peth yn wir ynglŷn â'r trafodaethau dros y llety? A ydych chi'n hapus gyda sut mae'r safonau wedi newid yng nghyd-destun hynny? Achos fydd dal ddim sicrwydd bod y llety cyfrwng Cymraeg yn cael ei ystyried, dim ond y bydd gyda chi'r hawl i roi hynny gerbron fel rhywbeth yr ydych chi ei

Ms Elin: I think what we were referring to was that student welfare can be a broad-ranging issue, and it's difficult to define exactly what that could entail. For example, in universities, some people provide counselling, financial advice, housing advice, and peer-to-peer mentoring programmes in which there are students who help you to settle in at the start of university, and so on, and we think that students should have the right to access that support through the medium of Welsh. So, I wouldn't want to see it limited or restricted, because, as we've said in the past, when you have a list, you're going to miss out certain issues. But, if changes are to be made to standards, then perhaps we could expand upon the kinds of areas that that welfare support would cover, so that it's not just counselling, although that's crucially important, of course, because there is a shortage of counselling provision through the medium of Welsh, and that's a general problem across Wales, but that we could expand that.

Bethan Jenkins: Is the same true for the discussions concerning halls of residence? Are you content with the way the standards have changed in that context? Because there will still be no certainty that Welsh-medium accommodation will be considered, only that you have the right to put it forward as something that you want

eisiau i'r brifysgol ei wneud.

the university to do.

[75] **Ms Elin:** Mae wedi cael ei eirio'n od, roeddwn i'n meddwl, achos rydych chi'n gallu gofyn, ond nid wyf yn meddwl y bydd y brifysgol yn rhoi. Felly, yn amlwg, byddai'n well petai hynny'n cael ei eirio fel darpariaeth i fyfyrwyr allu cael llety cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, byddai hwnnw'n newid y byddem ni'n ei groesawu, petai—

Ms Elin: The wording is quite strange, I thought, because you can request Welsh-medium accommodation, but there's no requirement on the university to provide that. So, I think it would be better if that were worded as a provision for students to be able to access Welsh-medium accommodation. So, that would be a change that we would welcome, if it were—

[76] **Bethan Jenkins:** Efallai ei fod yn cael ei egluro fel hynny oherwydd na fyddan nhw'n gallu rhoi llety Cymraeg i bob un sydd efallai'n gofyn am hynny mewn prifysgol benodedig; efallai ei bod yn haws i, er enghraifft, Aberystwyth ei wneud, ond efallai nid ar gyfer prifysgol arall.

Bethan Jenkins: Perhaps that's been clarified in that way because the universities perhaps can't provide Welsh-medium accommodation for all those who request it; it might be easier for Aberystwyth, for example, but not as easy for other universities.

[77] **Ms Elin:** Rydw i'n meddwl dylai'r dewis fod yno. Un o'r pethau gyda'r safonau yw bod y comisiynydd yn gallu gweithio gyda'r prifysgolion i weld os ydy'r rheoliadau yn mynd i weithio. Er enghraifft, o ran staff cyfrwng Cymraeg, roeddech chi'n ei ddweud gynnu, 'A oes digon o staff yna?' Un peth mae rhai prifysgolion yn ei wneud yw rhoi contract i staff gyda'r ddealltwriaeth bod yr aelod yna o staff yn mynd i ddysgu'r Gymraeg mewn tair, pump, weithiau mwy, o flynyddoedd er mwyn datblygu'r gweithlu sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg mewn prifysgolion. Yn yr un modd, drwy roi'r cynnig yna i fyfyrwyr allu aros mewn llety lle maen

Ms Elin: I think the choice should be there. One of the things about the standards is that the commissioner can work with the universities to see whether the regulations are going to work. For example, in terms of Welsh-speaking staff, you were saying earlier, 'Are there enough staff there?' What some universities are doing is they have a contract for staff on the understanding that that member of staff is going to learn Welsh in three, five, sometimes more, years in order to develop the workforce that can speak Welsh in universities. In the same way, by providing that choice to students to be able to stay in accommodation

nhw'n gallu siarad drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, rŷch chi yn mynd i ddatblygu'r ddarpariaeth yna sydd ar gael. Ond petai prifysgol wir yn cael problem yn llenwi llety i fyfyrwyr Cymraeg yna byddai modd i'r comisiynydd weithio gyda nhw ar hynny. Ond os nad yw yn y safonau i ddechrau ni fydd yr oblygiad yna arnyn nhw i hyd yn oed trio.

[78] **Bethan Jenkins:** A'ch sylwad wedyn ynglŷn â'r ffaith nad yw'r rheoliadau yn cynnwys y gallu wedyn i drafod cynnwys yr addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn ôl beth rydw i'n ei ddeall, a ydy hynny'n rhywbeth—? Rydych chi'n gallu trafod yr hyn sydd o fewn y categori yma ond nid cynnwys yr hyn rydych chi yn ei ddysgu yn y brifysgol.

[79] **Ms Elin:** Rydw i'n meddwl, o ran beth roeddem ni'n ei ddeall, nad yw'r safonau'n gallu cyffwrdd â'r ddarpariaeth ddysgu ei hun. Felly, yn amlwg, beth rydym ni'n moyn gweld ar wahân i'r safonau yma yw bod y Llywodraeth yn ariannu darpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn iawn mewn addysg uwch ond hefyd yn y sector ôl-orfodol i gyd a gwneud datblygiadau eraill. Un o'r pethau rydym ni wedi bod yn edrych arno yw'r strategaeth 1 miliwn o siaradwyr. Eto, mae datblygu gweithlu sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn ein prifysgolion yn hollbwysig ar gyfer honno, ond hefyd drwy rhoi darpariaeth addysg Gymraeg i

where they can speak Welsh, you're going to develop that provision that's available. But if universities really had a problem in filling accommodation for Welsh-speaking students there would be a way for the commissioner to work with them on that. But if it's not in the standards to begin with that obligation will not be on them to even try.

Bethan Jenkins: And then there's your comment on the fact that the regulations don't include the right to discuss the content of education through the medium of Welsh, from what I understand. Is that something—? You can discuss what's included within this category but you don't have the right to discuss the content of what you're taught in the university.

Ms Elin: I think, from our understanding, that the standards can't touch the teaching provision itself. So, clearly, what we want to see separate to this is that the Government funds Welsh-medium education fully in higher education but also in the post-compulsory sector and makes other developments. One of the things we've been looking at is the strategy of 1 million Welsh speakers. Again, developing a workforce that speaks Welsh in our universities is vital for that, but also by providing Welsh-medium education to students so that they can develop those skills to work through the medium of Welsh

fyfyrwyr fel eu bod nhw'n gallu datblygu'r sgiliau i weithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a byw drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y dyfodol. Felly, rwy'n meddwl o ran y ddarpariaeth addysg ei hun mae angen gwneud pethau tu allan i'r safonau i ddatblygu hynny.

[80] **Dr Trystan:** Mae'r gwaith mae'r coleg Cymraeg wedi ei wneud dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf ym maes darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg wedi bod yn sylweddol iawn a beth rydym ni wedi ei weld ar draws ystod o feysydd fel pynciau iechyd neu waith cymdeithasol neu'r gwyddorau caled bod yna ddatblygiad sylweddol wedi bod o ran darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg. Ond, yn ein tyb ni, ac wrth gynllunio beth rydym ni yn ei ddweud yn ein cynllun academaidd ni, a fydd yn cael ei lansio ddiwedd y mis hwn, mae gan fyfyrwyr yr hawl i addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg o'r radd flaenaf. Ond, wrth feddwl am yr hawl honno, a ydy hynny'n golygu bod gan y myfyriwr yr hawl ym mhob un o brifysgolion Cymru i wneud pob un o'r cyrsiau neu efallai a ydy e'n fwy call ac yn rhesymol, os ych chi am sicrhau addysg o safon, ein bod ni'n edrych yn y maes hwn ein bod ni'n mynd i ddatblygu darpariaeth yn fan hyn ac yn fan hyn ac yn fan hyn? Felly, mae yna ystod o opsiynau ac mae dewisiadau gan y myfyrwyr. Os ydyn nhw'n dymuno astudio cyfran neu'r cyfan o'u cwrs hwy yn Gymraeg maen nhw'n gallu gwneud hynny mewn amrywiol gyd-destunau yng

and live through the medium of the Welsh language. So, I think in terms of the education provision itself there's a need to do things outside the standards to develop that.

Dr Trystan: The work that the *coleg Cymraeg* has done over the past five years in the area of Welsh-medium provision has been very substantial and what we have seen across a range of areas such as health or social work or in the hard sciences is that there has been significant development in terms of Welsh-medium provision. But, in our view, and as we plan what we say in our academic plan, which is to be launched at the end of this month, students have the right to Welsh-medium higher education of the highest quality. But, in considering that right, does that mean that the student has a right in all Welsh universities to study all of those courses or perhaps would it be more reasonable that, if you want to ensure quality education, we look in this particular area that we are going to develop provision here, here and here? So, there is range of options and students do have choices. If they want to study a percentage or all of their course through the medium of Welsh then they can do that in various contexts within Wales. Obviously, the Welsh-medium provision available isn't going to be

Nghymru. O reidrwydd, nid yw'r ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael yn y Gymraeg yn mynd i fod mor helaeth â'r ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael yn y Saesneg. Ond wrth weithio gyda'r prifysgolion o dan nawdd ac arweiniad Llywodraeth Cymru mae yna fodd i sicrhau bod y myfyriwr hwnnw sydd eisiau cymhwyso yn y gyfraith neu mewn meddygaeth neu mewn fferylliaeth yn gallu gwneud hynny nawr ac mae hynny'n gam sylweddol iawn ymlaen o hyd yn oed pum mlynedd yn ôl pan nad oedd y cyfleoedd yna ar gael tu hwnt, efallai, i'r dyniaethau a'r celfyddydau ac ambell bwnc arall fel gwleidyddiaeth.

[81] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. A oes unrhyw gwestiynau eraill gan Aelodau? Grêt. Felly, diolch yn fawr iawn am eich tystiolaeth y bore yma. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd hynny'n helpu gyda fframio ein hymateb i'r rheoliadau ac rwy'n siŵr y byddwn ni'n eich gweld eto yn y dyfodol pan fyddwn ni'n edrych ar bynciau eraill. Diolch yn fawr iawn. Byddem ni'n cael egwyl nawr hyd nes fod y Gweinidog yn dod mewn i drafod y strategaeth. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

as broad as the English-medium provision. But in working with the universities under the auspices of the Welsh Government there is a means of ensuring that those students who want to qualify in pharmacy, medicine or the law can do so now and that's a significant step forward from the situation even five years ago when those opportunities didn't exist outwith, perhaps, the humanities and the arts and a few other subjects such as politics.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. Are there any other questions from Members? Great. Thank you very much for your evidence this morning. I'm sure that will assist with the framing of our response to the regulations and I'm sure that we'll see you again in the future when we'll be looking at other issues. Thank you very much. We'll now take a short break until the Minister comes in to discuss the strategy. Thank you very much.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 09:41 a 10:17.
The meeting adjourned between 09:41 and 10:17.*

**Rheoliadau Safonau'r Gymraeg (Rhif 6) 2017: Craffu ar Waith
Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes
The Welsh Language Standards (No. 6) Regulations 2017: Scrutiny of
the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language**

[82] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Rydym ni'n mynd i eitem 3 ar agenda heddiw, sef rheoliadau safonau'r Gymraeg a chraffu ar waith Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Croeso i chi yma heddiw. Mae gennym, wrth gwrs, Alun Davies, Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Bethan Webb, dirprwy gyfarwyddwr is-adran y Gymraeg, ac Alan Jones, pennaeth y gangen ddeddfwriaeth iaith Gymraeg. Diolch i chi am ddod heddiw.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much. We go to item 3 on today's agenda, the Welsh language standards regulations and scrutiny of the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language. Welcome to you here today. We have Alun Davies, the Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language here, Bethan Webb, the deputy director of the Welsh language division, and Alan Jones, head of the Welsh language legislation branch. Thank you for attending today.

[83] Fel gwnes i ofyn i'r tystion yn gynharach, a allech chi jest amlinellu i ni yn fras pam rydych chi'n credu bod y newidiadau yr ydych chi wedi eu gwneud i'r rheoliadau yma yn gryfach na'r hyn a oedd yna o'r blaen? A ydych chi'n hyderus, felly, bydd yna gymeradwyaeth o'r rheoliadau yma, neu a oes angen, efallai, mynd nôl i edrych ar wneud mwy o newidiadau yng nghyd-destun rhai o'r sylwadau yr ydym ni wedi'u clywed gan y myfyrwyr a chan y sefydliadau yn hynny o beth? Diolch yn fawr iawn.

As I asked the witnesses earlier, could you just outline to us broadly why you think the changes that you've made to these regulations are stronger than what was there before? Are you confident, therefore, that these regulations will be approved, or is there a need, perhaps, to return to them and make more changes in the context of some of the comments that we've heard from students and organisations in that respect? Thank you very much.

[84] **Gweinidog y Gymraeg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Alun Davies):** Diolch i chi, Gadeirydd, a diolch i'r pwyllgor am y gwahoddiad i ymuno â chi y bore

The Minister for Lifelong Learning and Welsh Language (Alun Davies): Thank you, Chair, and thank you to the committee for the invitation to

yma. Rydym ni'n cofio ac yn gwybod hanes y *regulations* yma a'r safonau yr ydym wedi bod yn delio â nhw. Rydym ni hefyd yn cofio bod y safonau yma wedi methu yn y Cynulliad. Nid ydw i'n credu ei fod e'n iawn i Lywodraeth fynd â rheoliadau i'r Cynulliad, colli pleidlais, ac wedyn ailgyflwyno'r rheoliadau heb gymryd sylw o'r ffaith ein bod ni wedi colli'r bleidlais. So, mae'n rhaid i ni nid jest ymateb drwy ailgyflwyno, ond cynnal trafodaethau, siarad, a deall pam rydym ni wedi colli'r bleidlais. Mae'n rhaid cydnabod ein bod ni wedi colli'r bleidlais a chydabod nad oedd y rheoliadau yn ddigonol fel yr oedden nhw, ac wedyn ystyried pa fath o newidiadau sydd eu hangen arnom ni er mwyn cymryd sylw o bleidlais yr Aelodau yn y Cynulliad yn ôl ym mis Mawrth. Rydw i'n gobeithio ein bod ni wedi gwneud hynny.

[85] Rydym ni wedi, fel mae'r pwyllgor yn ymwybodol, gwneud sawl newid i'r rheoliadau, ac rydw i wedi darllen trawsgrifiad y drafodaeth y cawsom ni yn y Cynulliad y llynedd, ac rydw i'n meddwl bod y newidiadau ein bod ni wedi'u gwneud yn ymateb i'r pwyntiau yr oedd Aelodau yn eu codi yn ystod y drafodaeth ym mis Mawrth. Rydym ni wedi eu newid i sicrhau bod yna hawl i fynegi dymuniad i gael llety cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rydym ni wedi gwneud newidiadau eraill i sicrhau bod gyda ni'r hawl i fewnrwyd i fyfyrwyr

join you this morning. We recall the story behind these regulations and standards that we've been dealing with. We also bear in mind that these standards were rejected by the Assembly. I don't think it would be right for a Government to take regulations to the Assembly, lose the vote, and reintroduce those regulations without taking note of that lost vote. So, we had not only to respond in terms of reintroducing these regulations, but also in having negotiations, discussions and understanding why that vote was lost. We have to acknowledge that that vote was lost, and we have to acknowledge that the regulations as they were drafted were inadequate, and then consider how changes should be made, and what sort of changes are required in order to take note of that vote by Assembly Members back in March. I hope that we've done that.

As the committee will be aware, we've made a number of changes to the regulations, and I've read the transcript of the discussion that we had in the Assembly last year, and I do think that the changes that we've introduced do respond to the points raised by Members during that debate in March. We have made changes to ensure that there is a right to request Welsh-medium accommodation. We have made other changes in order to ensure that we have a right to a student intranet through the medium of Welsh; a right

Cymraeg; yr hawl i weld arwyddion ym mhob un rhan o'r sefydliad yn y Gymraeg; ychwanegu canolfannau celfyddydol i gwmpas safonau; a hefyd hawl i diwtor personol sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Felly, dyma'r math o drafodaeth cawsom ni y llynedd. Dyma'r pwyntiau roedd Aelodau wedi eu codi yn ystod y drafodaeth, ac rydym ni wedi ymateb i hynny. Ac oherwydd hynny, buaswn i'n gofyn i Aelodau Cynulliad i gefnogi'r safonau, i gefnogi'r rheoliadau fel y maen nhw, fel y maen nhw wedi cael eu diwygio, ac rydym ni'n gallu, wedyn, symud ymlaen—symud ymlaen i osod safonau fydd yn galluogi'r sefydliadau eu hunain i ddechrau'r broses o gyflwyno'r Gymraeg mewn ffordd fwy eang nag y maen nhw'n ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, ond hefyd galluogi'r sefydliadau i symud ymlaen i sicrhau bod gyda nhw bolisiau Cymraeg sy'n galluogi'r rhai ohonom ni sydd am ddefnyddio ein Cymraeg ni i wneud hynny fel rhan o'r broses o fyw a bod yn rhan o'r sefydliadau yma.

[86] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch am hynny. Rwy'n credu bod Aelodau'n clywed yr hyn rydych chi'n ei ddweud ynglŷn ag eisiau pasio nhw er mwyn gweithredu, ond mae dal i fod rhai cwestiynau yng nghyd-destun yr hyn sy'n cael ei gynnwys yn y newidiadau, sef bod UCMC yn dweud bod yna amwysedd ynglŷn ag ansawdd llety a sut, wedyn, maen nhw'n gallu dweud eu bod nhw am gael y llety hynny, ond nid oes gorfodaeth ar y sefydliad

to have signage through the medium of Welsh in institutions; we've added arts centres to the standards; and a right to a Welsh-speaking personal tutor. So these are the kind of discussions that we had last year. These are the points raised by Members during that debate, and we have responded to those. And, as a result of that, I would ask Assembly Members to support these standards, to support the regulations as they are currently drafted and as they have been amended, and then we can move forward in order to put in place standards that will enable the institutions themselves to start the process of introducing the Welsh language more broadly than they currently do, but also enabling the institutions to move forward to ensure that they have Welsh language policies that enable those of us who want to use the Welsh language to do that as part of the process of being part of those HE institutions.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you for that. I think Members are hearing what you're saying and want to pass them in order to implement them, but there are still some questions in the context of what's included in the changes, namely the NUS say that there is ambiguity in terms of quality of accommodation and how, then, they can say that they want that accommodation, but there's no obligation on that organisation to

hwnnw i roi llety trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. A oes yna unrhyw beth rydych chi'n gallu ei ddweud ynglŷn â pham roeddech chi wedi defnyddio'r derminoleg hynny yng nghyd-destun y llety?

provide accommodation through the medium of Welsh. Do you have anything to say about why you use that terminology in the context of accommodation?

[87] **Alun Davies:** Rydym ni wedi gwneud hynny er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ni safonau sy'n galluogi pobl i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg, ond hefyd sy'n rhesymol i'r colegau a sefydliadau weithredu polisi realistig Cymraeg. Rydym ni i gyd yn gwybod—fel rhai ohonom ni sy'n siarad ac yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg bob dydd—rydym ni i gyd yn gwybod ein bod ni eisiau byw mewn llety neu gymuned lle mae'n bosibl i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg fel rhan o'n bywydau pob dydd, ond rydym ni hefyd yn realistig am ein gallu i wneud hynny. Mi fuasai hi'r peth rhwyddaf yn y byd i mi, fel rhywun a oedd wedi mwynhau byw ym Mhantycelyn, mewn neuadd breswyl Cymraeg, pan oeddwn i yn y coleg yn Aberystwyth, i ddweud bod gan bob un ohonom ni'r hawl i wneud yr un peth, a'r peth rhwyddaf yn y byd byddai gwneud hynny, ond nid yw'n realistig ac nid yw'n bosibl i weithredu hynny. Nid wyf eisiau gosod cyfraith gwlad os nad yw cyfraith y wlad yn gallu cael ei weithredu mewn ffordd fydd yn ein galluogi ni i ddefnyddio ein Cymraeg ni. Beth rwyf eisiau ei weld yw hawliau Cymraeg rydym ni'n gallu eu gweithredu ac nid hawliau nad ydym ni'n gallu eu gweithredu, achos nid

Alun Davies: I've done that in order to ensure that we have standards that enable people to use the Welsh language, but that are also reasonable for the institutions and the colleges, so that a realistic policy can be implemented. Those of us who use the Welsh language on a daily basis all know that we want to live in accommodation or in a community where it's possible to use the Welsh language as part of our daily lives, but we are also realistic about the opportunities to do that. It would be the easiest thing of all for me, as someone who enjoyed living in the Pantycelyn hall of residence, a Welsh-medium hall of residence, when I was in university in Aberystwyth, to say that each and every one of us has a right to exactly the same provision. It would be the easiest thing of all to do that, but it's not realistic, and it's not possible to implement that. And what I don't want to do is to put statute in place that cannot be implemented in a way that will enable us to make use of the Welsh language. What I want to do is to have rights that are implementable, rather than rights that we can't implement, because such rights are of no value whatsoever.

yw hawliau felly yn werth eu cael.

[88] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy.

[89] **Jeremy Miles:** Hoffwn i ymestyn y thema yna, os gaf i. Fe wnaeth UCMC sôn hefyd nad oes cyfeiriad yn y rhestr at ohebiaeth gyda myfyrwyr ynglŷn â ffioedd, ysgoloriaethau, ac ati. A wnaethoch chi gymryd penderfyniad penodol i beidio â chynnwys y rheini?

Jeremy Miles: Just to expand on this, if I may, the NUS also mentioned that there was no reference in the list to correspondence for students on fees and scholarships and so on. Did you take a specific decision not to include those?

[90] **Alun Davies:** Rydym ni wedi edrych ar beth sy'n bosibl a beth nad yw'n bosibl, ac os ydych chi'n edrych trwy'r safonau, mi fyddwch chi'n gweld ein bod ni'n delio â rhannau o waith y sefydliadau fydd yn galluogi pobl i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg lle bynnag maen nhw fel rhan o'r sefydliad. Felly, rwy'n gwybod bod rhai wedi dweud bod eisiau ymestyn y safonau i'r gwaith addysgu hefyd, ond rydym ni hefyd yn gwybod nad yw'r safonau i fod i ddelio â hynny. Nid dyna pam rydym ni wedi mabwysiadu'r safonau yma. Felly, rwy'n hyderus fod paragraff 31 yn cynnwys y gweithgareddau pwysicaf o ran y berthynas rhwng y corff, y sefydliad, a'r myfyrwyr. Oes, mae yna rai enghreifftiau lle mae gohebiaeth rhwng y sefydliad a'r unigolyn, y myfyriwr, yn cael ei dal gan safonau eraill pan mae'n dod i drafod gohebiaeth. Felly, rydw i'n eithaf sicr bod y safonau yma'n gryf ac wedi cael eu cryfhau ac yn cynnig hawliau sy'n gallu cael eu gweithredu. Rydw i'n awyddus erbyn hyn i symud

Alun Davies: We have looked at what is possible and what isn't, and if you look through the standards, you will see that we deal with those parts of the work of the institution that will enable people to use the Welsh language wherever they are as part of those institutions. And I know that some have said that we need to extend the standards to teaching, too, but we also know that the standards aren't there to deal with that issue. That's not why we adopted these standards. Therefore, I am confident that paragraph 31 does include the most important activities in terms of the relationship between the institution and the students. Yes, there are some examples where correspondence between the institution and the individual, the student, is captured by other standards when it comes to the issue of correspondence. So, I am quite content that these standards are robust and have been strengthened and do provide rights that are implementable. I am now eager to

ymlaen a gweithredu. Rydw i eisiau hefyd, ac rydw i'n gwybod nad yw'r Cadeirydd eisiau i fi siarad gormod ar hyn, ond—

move forward and to implement these standards. I want to also, and I know that the Chair doesn't want me to speak at too great a length about this issue, but—

[91] **Bethan Jenkis:** Nid wyf wedi dweud unrhyw beth eto. [*Chwerthin.*]

Bethan Jenkins: I haven't said anything yet. [*Laughter.*]

[92] **Alun Davies:** Mae dy wyneb di yn dweud digon. [*Chwerthin.*] Beth rydw i'n awyddus i'w wneud yw gosod y safonau yma fel cyfraith, ac wedyn gweithredu'r gyfraith. Byddaf, ym mis Mai, gobeithio—yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn—yn cyhoeddi Papur Gwyn ar gyfraith y Gymraeg. Rwy'n gobeithio y byddwn ni'n cael mwy o drafodaeth, trafodaeth ehangach a chyfoethog, am y math o gyfraith rydym eisiau ei gweld i ddarparu a sicrhau hawliau, lle a statws y Gymraeg. Felly, rydw i'n awyddus iawn i weithredu'r safonau fel y maen nhw heddiw, fel rydym wedi'u diwygio, ar ôl cydnabod pleidlais y Cynulliad, a symud ymlaen. Wedyn, os oes yna broblem ddifrifol gyda'r rhain, neu unrhyw un o'r safonau sydd gyda ni, mi fydd hi'n bosibl, ar ôl iddyn nhw gael eu gweithredu, i ni ddychwelyd i'r safonau, ac mi fydd gyda chi'r hawl fel pwyllgor, wrth gwrs, i ystyried hynny ac wedyn awgrymu sut rydym yn newid y safonau ar ôl dysgu sut maen nhw'n gweithio yn y byd go iawn.

Alun Davies: Your face says it all. [*Laughter.*] What I am eager to do is to put these standards into law and then implement that law. In May, hopefully—later this year—I will be publishing a White Paper on the legislation surrounding the Welsh language. I hope that we will have broader and richer discussions about the kind of law that we want to see in order to provide and secure the rights and the status of the Welsh language. So, I am very eager to implement these standards as they currently stand, as they have been amended, in recognition of that vote taken in the Assembly, and make progress. Then, if there is a grave problem with these or any of the standards, then it would be possible, after they've been implemented, for us to return to them, and you as a committee, of course, will have a right to scrutinise and consider that and make suggestions as to how we could change the standards, once we've seen how they work in real life.

[93] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee.

[94] **Lee Waters:** I've heard you say a number of times that you find that the whole standards approach overly bureaucratic and you've set out measures to deal with that. I'm just looking at the standards in front of us. Standard 160 says:

[95] 'You must keep a record of the number of members of staff who wear a badge...at the end of each financial year.'

[96] I wonder, given your general criticisms, whether or not you think it's appropriate in law to set out requirements to record the number of badges issued indicating people can speak Welsh.

[97] **Alun Davies:** I try, as a Minister, to engage in conversation and to have a discursive conversation about how we legislate and the nature of our legislation and the nature of our politics. I think that's generally a good thing, rather than simply reading 'lines to take' and taking a very narrow and conservative view of questions and the sorts of conversations we have. I think sometimes my use of language can be somewhat colourful and I wouldn't want to mislead people in saying that I think the whole approach that we're taking is not the correct approach. However, you are right, Lee. You are absolutely right in what I said some weeks ago about the approach that's taken. I think I said it on the record when we are adopting this legislation some time ago and some members may remember that. I think we have a responsibility now to look at how we legislate for the Welsh language, to look afresh when we publish the strategy later in the spring and then to look at the sort of legislation and the structure of legislation we want and the architecture of how we regulate that and how we ensure that we have a balance whereby those of us who wish to speak Welsh and use our Welsh in everyday life have the opportunity to do that and have the opportunity to do that without feeling that we are creating an obligation on the person we're dealing with, without feeling at all embarrassed or shy to do that, and at the same time recognising the capacity of the community in which we live to deliver those services for us as Welsh speakers. So, we need to find that balance and we need to do that in a way that encourages people to use Welsh, breaks down barriers, breaks down walls and creates the language as a bridge and not a barrier for people. We need to find ways of doing that in a way that is both efficient and also in a way that promotes the language, rather than making it into either a weapon of war or a means of creating divisions in our society that are unnecessary. So, we will be looking at all of those issues. I hope the White Paper will spark a debate. I don't intend to narrow that debate down at all. I hope the White Paper will lead to a

conversation that we can have over a period of time. I intend to publish it as early as we can in, perhaps, as I say, spring or early summer, and then run the debate through the summer into autumn of this year and have a very rich debate about how we ensure that we have a statutory underpinning of the use of Welsh that is practical, reasonable and which encourages people and makes them feel comfortable in using the Welsh language in whatever circumstance they find themselves.

10:30

[98] **Lee Waters:** So, you feel that using statute to require the reporting of badges issued meets that test of balance.

[99] **Alun Davies:** There are a number and a range of standards that will deliver different aspects of our ambition. Some of those standards will and may appear to be overly onerous, and others will appear to be less onerous. I think you've had the nature of that conversation with other witnesses you've seen. At the moment, it is my intention and my objective to seek a balance between those two extremes. I think it is possible, certainly, to pick out one standard and say, 'Let's look at this', but I think when you do that, you take it out of context. What I would say to you, Lee, is this: that it is reasonable to understand how many staff in an institution are able to speak Welsh, how they identify themselves so that people are able to use the Welsh language without feeling that they're placing unnecessary burdens on people, and for people to feel comfortable to open a conversation in Welsh if they don't know the person they're speaking to. So, there are reasons behind that, but I recognise fully that, when you read that, it can appear to be an overly onerous and cumbersome requirement. I think what we need to be able to is not simply look at standard 160 alone, but take the whole of those standards and then say, 'Is this a reasonable approach to ensuring that we meet our objectives?' I think that's a much richer debate, and I think it's a more profound debate, and that's certainly the debate that I would like to have over the rest of this year.

[100] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Suzy.

[101] **Suzy Davies:** I think Lee's question was really about what's reasonable and proportionate. I just wanted to ask you a very specific question about why it's reasonable and proportionate to bring these standards into arts centres in colleges and universities, but not into leisure centres in colleges and universities, bearing in mind particularly that sport is one of those areas

of public life where development of the Welsh language is likely to be something we're all expecting to happen.

[102] **Alun Davies:** I think most leisure centres are actually covered by the similar standards on local authorities.

[103] **Suzy Davies:** But that's local authorities. I'm talking about university and college ones.

[104] **Alun Davies:** I understand that. The point that was made to us during the conversations we had following the defeat of the standards last year was that this was a gap, and that was identified as a gap and we've sought to fill that gap. If Suzy is saying there are other gaps, then I think that's a reasonable point to make, but it wasn't made to us during the conversations that we had on these regulations, and as a consequence it isn't included in those regulations. But let me say this: what I'm seeking to do is, as you say, find something that is reasonable, proportionate and which meets our ambitions. Now, I think it's absolutely fair and reasonable for arts centres, frankly whether they're on campuses or not—we're talking about campuses in this case—to provide their services bilingually. I think that's a fair and reasonable requirement for public bodies to have, and I would expect leisure centres, frankly, to do that as well. Leisure centres are covered generally in local government legislation. So, I think that's reasonable, I think it's fair, and I think it's proportionate. If there are additional gaps, then that's a conversation that we can have subsequently, after we've accepted these regulations. I'm always happy to review the legislation. I think reviewing legislation is something that all of us, as legislators, need to do, and need to do more often than we actually do.

[105] **Suzy Davies:** Okay, thank you for that. It was just that the NUS did introduce that in evidence, so I thought I'd raise it with you.

[106] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Lee.

[107] **Lee Waters:** Can I just ask you a question on process? Cymdeithas yr Iaith in their written evidence have made, I think, quite a constructive suggestion about trying to avoid the situation that we've just been in where regulations are turned down and there's been a delay. They argue in their evidence, which is pack page 141 for other members of the committee, that it would be sensible in future that you introduce regulations in draft form and the committee looks at them at the pre-consultation stage and invites

comments from stakeholders to try to investigate and invite any policy clashes or issues at that stage. I wonder what you think about that suggestion.

[108] **Alun Davies:** I think you're absolutely right. It's a fair and reasonable suggestion to make. Any legislator always has the right to turn down the Government's seeking of legislation and the Government doesn't have a right to its legislation: the Government has to persuade and has to argue its case. And if it wins, it wins, and if it loses, it loses. It has to recognise that no Government has a right to legislation; we have to win that and argue our case. So, I've no qualms or issues at all with the National Assembly defeating the Government last year. The National Assembly spoke; the Government needed to listen, and I hope we have listened. So, there's no issue with that at all.

[109] But on the wider point, I spent some time on the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee, as Members here will know, and I think it is right and proper that we seek to extend the way we legislate and that we will publish secondary legislation. Draft primary legislation is quite often published, of course, for exactly the scrutiny that you suggest. Secondary legislation is less commonly published in that way. But Members may know that, as an education Minister, I will be publishing next month the draft code on ALN, additional learning needs, which will be a piece of secondary legislation in order to deliver the primary legislation that's currently in front of the Assembly. So, I think where there are circumstances where that can happen, that's right and proper that it does happen. It's a good, constructive suggestion and I'm very happy to take it forward.

[110] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Eto, o dystiolaeth UCMC—ac fe wnaethom ni godi hyn gyda nhw—fe wnaethon nhw ddweud bod y term 'lles myfyrwyr' yn un eang iawn, ac er nad ydyn nhw eisiau gweld y diffiniad yn cael ei ddileu o'r rhestr, maen nhw eisiau tynnu sylw at y ffaith ei fod e'n golygu mwy iddyn nhw na'r hyn sy'n rhan o'r diffiniad sydd gennyh chi, sef cymorth ariannol, gwasanaethau cwnsela, cymorth tai, ac yn y blaen. A fyddech chi'n ystyried, efallai, y

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Again, from the NUS Wales evidence—and we raised this with them—they said that the term 'student welfare' was a very broad one, and even though they didn't want the definition being taken away from the list, they wanted to draw attention to the fact that it means more to them than that which forms part of your definition, namely financial assistance, counselling, housing support, and so on. Would you consider, perhaps, these

sylwadau yma i helpu myfyrwyr i ddeall yn iawn beth fydd yr hyn y bydden nhw'n gallu ei gael o'r safon benodol hynny, pe na fyddai cwnsela ac yn y blaen yn rhan o hynny, neu a yw e'n gallu bod yn rhan o'r diffiniad fel y mae'n sefyll?

[111] **Alun Davies:** Rydw i'n meddwl bod y term 'lles myfyrwyr' yn un eang iawn, ac rŷm ni'n ei ddefnyddio fe oherwydd ei fod yn derm eang iawn. Rydw i'n ffyddiog bod hynny o fudd i fyfyrwyr. Gall y term hefyd gynnwys y gwasanaethau mae'r corff addysg yn darparu i fyfyrwyr yng nghyd-destun lles iechyd neu wasanaethau cwnsela mewn meysydd ehangach eraill, ac rydw i'n hyderus iawn bod y term yn un sy'n gallu cael ei weithredu, ei ddeall gan sefydliadau a myfyrwyr, ac yn derm y mae pobl yn gyfforddus i'w ddefnyddio.

[112] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond os ydyn nhw'n ffeindio bod yna broblemau yng nghyd-destun yr hyn mae'r safon yn caniatáu, a fyddai modd, wedyn, ailedrych ar sut mae'n cael ei weithredu i lawr y lein, fel rydych chi wedi'i ddweud yn flaenorol, yng nghyd-destun y canolfannau hamdden?

[113] **Alun Davies:** Wrth gwrs, rydw i'n hollol fodlon ar hynny. Mae yna gwestiwn a fuasai'n rôl i'r Llywodraeth neu'n rôl i'r Cynulliad, fel y *legislator*, i wneud hynny, ac rydw i'n gyfforddus iawn gyda'r syniad o ailystyried deddfwriaeth pan

comments to assist students to understand correctly what they will be able to have under that specific standard, if counselling and so forth wasn't part of that, or whether it can be part of the definition as it stands?

Alun Davies: I think the term 'student welfare' is a very broad one, and we use it because of its breadth. I am confident that that will benefit students. The term can also include the services that the education body provides to students in the context of health and well-being or counselling services in other broader areas, and I am confident that that term is one that can be implemented and can be understood by institutions and students, and it's a term that people are comfortable using.

Bethan Jenkins: But if they find that there are problems in the context of what the standard allows, would there be a way, then, to look again at the way it's implemented down the line, as you've said previously, in the context of leisure centres?

Alun Davies: Of course, I would be quite content with that. There is a question as to whether it would be a role for the Government or a role for the Assembly, as the legislator, to do that, and I am comfortable with this idea of looking again at legislation,

mae wedi cael ei gweithredu, a dysgu gwersi. Rydw i'n gyfforddus iawn gyda'r egwyddor o wneud hynny ac rydw i'n gyfforddus iawn os yw'r rôl yna'n cael ei chwarae gan y Cynulliad neu gan y Llywodraeth. Ond rydw i'n credu ei bod yn bwysig nad ydym jest yn cael y ddeddfwriaeth, ond yn deall sut mae'n cael ei gweithredu. Dyna ran o rôl y drafodaeth ar y Papur Gwyn: edrych ar y safonau ac nid jest ar un safon ac un rhan o'r rheoliadau, ond edrych arnyn nhw yn eu cyfanrwydd—a ydy'r system yma a'r ddarpariaeth ddeddfwriaethol yma yn ein galluogi ni i gyrraedd ein hamcanion gwleidyddol a'n gweledigaeth ar gyfer ein hiaith a'n cenedl ni ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac wedyn trafod hynny. Rydw i'n hapus iawn i gynnal y trafodaethau yma, ac rydw i'n gyfforddus iawn os yw'r Cynulliad eisiau gweithredu yn yr un ffordd.

[114] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond a oes gennych chi farn ar hynny nawr, oherwydd, fel y mae rhai Aelodau wedi dweud yn barod a rhai o'r tystion, mae yna flwyddyn wedi bod ers i'r rheoliadau ddod gerbron yn gyntaf, a blwyddyn, wedyn, lle nad yw rhai sefydliadau'n gwneud unrhyw beth o gwbl o ran datblygu'r iaith. A oes yna ffyrdd, wedyn, gennych chi o ran syniadau i hwyluso'r broses honno, achos mae hyn yn mynd i fynd nôl at y comisiynydd nawr, ac wedyn mae'r comisiynydd yn mynd i wneud mwy o waith? Felly, bydd gweithredu'r rheoliadau eto'n cymryd

once it's been implemented, and learning lessons. I'm comfortable with the principle of doing that and I'm happy for that role to be played by either the Assembly or the Government. But I think it's important that we not only have legislation in place, but also understand how it's implemented and how it works. That is part of the role of the White Paper: to look at the standards and not just at one standard or one part of the regulations, but to look at them in their entirety, and to consider whether this system and this legislative provision is enabling us to reach our political objectives and our vision for our language and our nation for the future, and then to discuss that. I'm happy to hold discussions here and I'd be more than happy if the Assembly wanted to do likewise.

Bethan Jenkins: But do you have a view on that now, because, as some Members have already said and some witnesses, a year has passed since the regulations were first introduced, and a year later, some institutions haven't done anything at all in terms of developing the language. Are there ways, then, that you have to facilitate that process, because this is going to go back to the commissioner now, and then the commissioner is going to do more work? So, implementing the regulations will take more time again.

mwyr o amser yn hynny o beth.

[115] **Alun Davies:** A dyna pam rydw i'n awyddus i symud ymlaen a gweithredu'r rheoliadau yma, gweithredu'r safonau yma, ac wedyn ystyried sut y maen nhw'n cael eu gweithredu ac a ydyn nhw'n cyrraedd y nod yr ydym wedi'i gosod ar eu cyfer nhw. Rwy'n gobeithio fy mod i wedi bod yn ddigon clir gyda'r pwyllgor: rwy'n fodlon ystyried y system. Nid wyf yn credu bod y system yn system berffaith. Rwy'n credu bod y system yn system gymhleth. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn or-gymhleth. Rwy'n credu bod angen ystyried y fframwaith deddfwriaethol sydd gyda ni. Rwy'n credu bod angen inni ystyried beth mae'r safonau wedi'i gyflwyno, ac rwy'n credu eu bod nhw wedi cyflwyno rhyw dipyn, *actually*, nid wy'n credu eu bod nhw wedi methu. Ond rydw i yn meddwl—ac rwy'n mynd yn ôl at gwestiwn cynharach gan Lee—fod y system yn or-fiwrocraidd ac yn or-gymhleth a bod yn rhaid inni ystyried sut yr ydym yn newid y system, gan ystyried mai amcan y system yw gweithredu hawliau i ni, sef defnyddwyr y Gymraeg.

[116] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am y sesiwn hynny ar y rheoliadau.

Alun Davies: And that's why I'm eager to implement these regulations and to implement these standards, and then consider how that implementation is working and whether they achieve our objectives for them. I do hope that I have been quite clear with the committee that I am happy to consider the system. I don't believe that the system is perfect. I think it is complex. I think it's overly complex, if truth be told. I think we need to consider the legislative framework that is currently in place. I think we need to consider what the standards have achieved, and I think they have achieved a fair bit, actually; I don't think that they have failed. But I do think—and I return to an earlier question from Lee—that the system is overly bureaucratic and overly complex, and we must consider how we can change the system, bearing in mind that the objective here is to provide rights for people to use the Welsh language.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much for that session on the regulations.

**Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth y Gymraeg Newydd Llywodraeth Cymru:
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 9
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's new Welsh Language Strategy:
Evidence Session 9**

[117] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym yn symud ymlaen yn awr at eitem 4, sef yr ymchwiliad i strategaeth y Gymraeg ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru. Rydym yn croesawu Iwan Evans i'r bwrdd, sef uwch-swyddog polisi isadran y Gymraeg. Diolch i chi am ymuno â ni.

Bethan Jenkins: We are now going to move on to item 4, which is the inquiry into the Welsh Government's Welsh language strategy. I welcome Iwan Evans now to the table, who is the senior policy officer in the Welsh language division. Thank you for joining us.

[118] Fel yr ydych wedi gweld, yn sicr, rydym wedi cael tystiolaeth gan drawstoriad o'r gymdeithas, sydd wedi rhoi barn yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth. Rwyf eisiau gofyn i chi yn fras ar y cychwyn: beth yw'r rhesymeg dros y ffigur o 1 filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn 2050, a pha dystiolaeth a ddefnyddiwyd i sicrhau bod y nod hwnnw'n gyraeddadwy? Beth yr ym ni wedi'i glywed gan lot o bobl yw efallai y dylai'r targedau a'r meincnodi fod wedi dod ar y cychwyn cyntaf er mwyn iddyn nhw allu deall yn iawn sut mae'r nod hynny'n mynd i gael ei gyrraedd gan y Llywodraeth. Felly, a allwch chi roi ymateb i'r cwestiwn mwyaf—beth yw'r gair yn y Gymraeg—eang yma, yn hytrach na'r cwestiynau mwy penodol y bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gofyn yn y man?

As you have seen, certainly, we've received evidence from a cross-section of society, giving their views in the context of the strategy. I would just like to ask you generally at the beginning: what is the rationale for the figure of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, and what evidence base was used to ensure that that aim is achievable? What we've heard from a number of people is that, perhaps, the targets and the benchmarking should have come at the beginning, so that they could understand fully how that target is going to be achieved by the Government. So, could you please respond to the most—what's the word in Welsh—broad question, rather than the more detailed questions that Members will ask shortly?

[119] **Alun Davies:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn *absolutely* dilys, wrth gwrs:

Alun Davies: That's absolutely a valid question, of course, in terms of how

sut ydym ni'n dechrau ar y drafodaeth yma? Mi oedd y ffigur, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o fanifesto'r Blaid Lafur, ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithredu ein hamcanion ni yn y manifesto. So, mae hynny'n bwysig i'w nodi. Ond pam oedd e'n y manifesto—ac nid jest ym manifesto Llafur chwaith? Pam yr ym ni'n gwneud hyn? Rydym ni wedi cael polisi iaith ers rhai blynyddoedd sydd wedi bod yn trio hybu'r Gymraeg a sicrhau dyfodol i'r Gymraeg. Ond a ydym ni wir wedi llwyddo? Dyna'r cwestiwn. Mae'n bosibl edrych ar bob math o amcanion ac ar bob math o dargedau yr ym ni wedi'u gosod dros y blynyddoedd, ac mae'n bosibl dod i sawl casgliad gwahanol.

[120] Beth oeddem ni am ei wneud oedd rhywbeth cwbl wahanol i hynny. Roeddem ni eisiau godi ein huchelgais ni, codi ein gweledigaeth ni, a newid y ffordd yr ym ni'n gweithio fel Llywodraeth ac fel gwlad. Mae hynny'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni newid cyd-destun y drafodaeth. Mae'n rhaid inni newid y cyd-destun yn ei gyfanrwydd a chreu gweledigaeth gydag uchelgais yn hanfodol ynddi. Wedyn, mae'n rhaid inni ystyried sut yr ym ni'n gwneud hynny. Mae'n herio ni fel cenedl, fel cymunedau, fel Llywodraeth ac fel gwleidyddion. Mae'n ein herio ni hefyd fel Gweinidogion. A ydym ni o ddifri am ddyfodol y Gymraeg, ac a ydym ni o ddifri fod Cymru yn mynd i fod yn wlad ddwyieithog—o ddifri? Mae'n rhaid i ddwyieithrwydd olygu

we start this discussion. The figure, of course, was included in the Labour Party manifesto, and the Government is implementing our manifesto objectives. So, that's an important thing to note. But why was this in the manifesto—and not just in the Labour manifesto, either? Why are we doing this? We've had a language policy for some years that has been seeking to promote the Welsh language and secure a future for the Welsh language. But have we truly succeeded? That's the question. One can look at all sorts of objectives and all sorts of targets that have been set over the years, and one can come to a number of different conclusions.

What we wanted to do was something entirely different to that. We wanted to raise our sights and to raise our vision, and to change the way that we work as a Government and as a nation. That means that we have to change the context of the discussion. We have to change the context entirely and put in place a vision that is ambitious and has ambition at its heart. We then need to consider how we can achieve that. It challenges us as a nation, as communities, as a Government and as politicians. It challenges us as Ministers, too. Are we serious about the future of the Welsh language, and are we serious about this concept of Wales being a bilingual nation? Bilingualism, I think, has to be about more than Welsh speakers speaking English as well. It

mwy na Chymry Cymraeg yn siarad Saesneg. Mae'n rhaid iddo fod yn fwy na hynny. Mae hynny'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni newid nid jest statws y Gymraeg pan fyddwn ni'n sôn am y gyfraith, ond statws y Gymraeg mewn pob math o gymuned, mewn mannau cymdeithasol ac fel rhan o'n cymunedau ar draws Cymru. Mae hynny'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni osod uchelgais ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Dyna beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yma yn trio'i wneud.

[121] Rydym yn trafod ar hyn o bryd y math o strategaeth y bydd gyda ni pan fydd yn cael ei chyhoeddi. Rwy'n gobeithio y byddwn—drwy herio ein hunain fel Llywodraeth, fel Cynulliad ac fel cenedl—yn gallu dod i gytundeb ar y Gymraeg: cytundeb ein bod eisiau gweld y Gymraeg fel rhan o'n bywyd bob dydd ni ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae hynny'n meddwl newid y ffordd yr ym ni'n gweithredu, ac mae'n rhaid newid y ffordd yr ym ni'n gweithredu. Ac mae hynny'n her i bob un ohonom. So, dyna pam. Dyna'r *rationale*, yn fras, o ran pam yr ym ni wedi dewis targed o 1 filiwn—

[122] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n deall ei bod yn rhan o'r maniffesto, ond sut wnaethoch chi ddod i'r penderfyniad mai 1 filiwn oedd e, yn rhan o'r maniffesto hynny? A sut ydych chi'n diffinio siaradwr Cymraeg o fewn hynny hefyd? Achos mae yna gwestiwn wedi dod—

has to be about more than that. That means that we have to change not only the status of the Welsh language in law, but also the status of the Welsh language in our communities, in social areas and as part of communities across Wales. That means that we have to have an ambition for the Welsh language. That is what this Government is seeking to put in place.

We are currently discussing the kind of strategy that we will have when it is published. I hope that we will—through challenging ourselves as a Government, as an Assembly and as a nation—come to an agreement on the Welsh language: an agreement that we want to see the Welsh language being part of our daily lives in all parts of Wales. That means a change in approach, and we have to change that approach. And that's a challenge for each and every one of us. So, that's why. That's what the rationale, broadly speaking, is as to why we have selected that target of 1 million—

Bethan Jenkins: I understand that it's part of the manifesto, but how did you come to a decision that it would be a 1 million, as part of that manifesto? And how do you define a Welsh speaker within that figure? Because, a question has—

10:45

[123] **Alun Davies:** Y *rationale* oedd, fel yr ydw i wedi esbonio, herio ein hunain a gosod uchelgais a gweledigaeth glir.

Alun Davies: As I've explained, the rationale was to challenge ourselves and to have a clear ambition and vision.

[124] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond nid yw hynny yn esbonio pam 1 filiwn yn benodol.

Bethan Jenkins: But that doesn't explain why it's 1 million specifically.

[125] **Alun Davies:** Oherwydd roeddem ni eisiau ffigwr a fuasai'n dal dychymyg ac yn ffigwr heriol i ni. Nid oeddwn i eisiau creu gweledigaeth a oedd yn defnyddio geiriau ond ddim yn gosod targed clir a tharged realistig. Nid oes pwynt dweud ein bod ni eisiau creu 1 filiwn—

Alun Davies: Because we wanted a figure that would capture people's imagination and would be challenging to us. I didn't want to put a vision in place that used words but didn't set any clear targets and a realistic target. There's no point in saying that we want to create 1 million—

[126] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ond ar ba sail oeddech chi'n penderfynu ei fod e'n realistig, wedyn—yr 1 filiwn?

Bethan Jenkins: But on what basis did you decide that it was realistic—that figure of 1 million?

[127] **Alun Davies:** Y drafodaeth oedd ein bod ni'n credu ei fod yn realistig o ran sut rŷm ni'n newid y ffordd rŷm ni'n gweithredu.

Alun Davies: We had the discussion that we believed that it was realistic in terms of how we change our approach.

[128] **Bethan Jenkins:** Reit. So, dim o ran tystiolaeth?

Bethan Jenkins: Right. So, it wasn't evidence-based?

[129] **Alun Davies:** Nid wy'n siŵr os oes tystiolaeth galed sy'n dweud, 'Os ydych chi'n gwasgu'r botwm yma, mi fyddwch chi'n creu 1 filiwn o siaradwyr.' Ond beth yr ŷm ni'n gwneud yw gosod gweledigaeth. Ac mae'r weledigaeth yn dod o ymrwymiad y Blaid Lafur a'r

Alun Davies: I'm not sure that you could say that there is hard evidence that states, 'If you press this particular button, you will create 1 million Welsh speakers.' But what we are doing is putting a vision in place, and a vision that is based on the Labour Party's commitment and this

Llywodraeth yma i greu dyfodol i'r Gymraeg fel rhan o'n cymuned genedlaethol ni yng Nghymru. Dyna o le mae'n dod. Mae'n dod o weledigaeth ac uchelgais.

Government's commitment to creating a future for the Welsh language as part of our national community here in Wales. That's where it's emerged from. It emerges from vision and ambition.

[130] Pan rydych chi'n gofyn i fi, 'Sut wyt ti'n mesur siaradwyr?'— A gaf i jest ddweud hyn? Fel Cymry Cymraeg, rŷm ni'n gwastraffu gormod o'n hamser yn beco aboutu lot fawr o bethau. Ac nid ydw i erioed wedi clywed sgwrs aboutu sut i ddiffinio rhywun sy'n siarad Saesneg. Nid ydw i erioed wedi clywed y sgwrs, erioed wedi gweld, 'Sut wyt ti'n diffinio rhywun sy'n siarad Saesneg?' Ond rydw i'n treulio hanner fy mywyd yn trafod sut i ddiffinio rhywun sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Rydym ni'n mynd i ddefnyddio'r sensws. Dyna yw'r ffordd rydym ni'n ei wneud e ar hyn o bryd. Ond beth nad ydw i eisiau gwneud yw hyn: nid ydw i eisiau bod yn y sefyllfa lle rwyf yn pwyntio at un person—'Cymro' neu 'Cymro di-Gymraeg'. Nid ydw i eisiau byw yn y gymuned ac yn y genedl sy'n gwneud hynny.

When you ask me, 'How are you going to define Welsh speaker?'— And may I just say this? As Welsh speakers, we waste too much time worrying about a number of different things, and I've never heard a conversation about how you define an English speaker. I've never heard that conversation, and I've never heard anyone ask, 'How do you define an English speaker?' But I spend half of my life discussing how we define a Welsh speaker. We're going to use the census. That's the approach at the moment. But what I don't want to do is this: I don't want to be in a situation where I point to one individual and say, 'You're a Welsh speaker' or 'You're a non-Welsh-speaking Welshman'. I don't want to live in a nation that does that.

[131] Rydw i eisiau i bobl deimlo'n gyfforddus gyda'r Gymraeg. Rydw i eisiau i'r Gymraeg fod yn bont a ddim yn wal. Ac rydw i eisiau i'r Gymraeg fod yn rhan o bob un ohonom ni. Mae yna lot fawr o bobl sy'n deall rhywfaint o Gymraeg, sy'n gyfforddus gyda rhywfaint o Gymraeg. Mae'n bwysig ein bod ni'n

I want people to feel comfortable with the Welsh language. I want the Welsh language to be a bridge rather than a wall. And I want to Welsh language to be relevant to all of us. There are very many people who understand some Welsh and are comfortable in using some Welsh. It's important that we safeguard that and

diogelu hynny, a diogelu pobl i ensure that people do feel that they don't have to be fluent in order to own the Welsh language and for the Welsh language to be important to them as individuals, as families and as communities. So—

[132] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n credu, jest i ddeall— **Bethan Jenkins:** I think, just to understand—

[133] **Alun Davies:** —i ateb y cwestiwn, yn syml ac yn glir, mi fyddwn ni'n defnyddio'r sensws, ond rydw i eisiau symud yn bell, bell tu hwnt i'r cwestiwn ei hun. **Alun Davies:** —to answer your question in simple, clear terms, we will be using the census, but I do want to move way beyond the question itself.

[134] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt. Dyna beth oeddwn i'n trio gofyn: o le oedd y dystiolaeth yn dod. Jeremy. **Bethan Jenkins:** Great. That's what I was trying to ask: where the evidence was going to come from. Jeremy.

[135] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch. Mae'r uchelgais rydych yn ei hamlinellu i'w chroesawi. Rydych yn gwybod eich bod chi wedi cael ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad; roedd sawl person yn dweud bod absenoldeb yn y strategaeth o dargedau clir a manwl, a'r pryder, wrth gwrs, yw, heb strwythur o dargedau o nawr tan 2050, ni fyddwn ni'n gwybod os ydym ni'n llwyddo i wneud y cynnydd yn y siaradwyr sydd ei angen er mwyn cyrraedd y nod ar ddiwedd y cyfnod. A ydych chi'n derbyn y feirniadaeth honno—bod angen ymhelaethu ar y strategaeth i gynnwys targedau penodol, ac os ydych chi, beth yw'r cynllun i wneud hynny? **Jeremy Miles:** Thank you. The ambition that you outline is to be welcomed. You know that you've had a response to the consultation from a number of people who say that there is an absence in the strategy of clear and detailed targets, and the concern, of course, is that without a structure of targets from now and up until 2050, we won't know whether we're succeeding in making the progress in terms of the number of speakers to reach that target at the end of the period. Do you accept that criticism—that there is a need to expand the strategy to include specific targets, and if you do, what are the plans to do so?

[136] **Alun Davies:** Nid oeddwn i'n ei **Alun Davies:** I didn't see it as a

weld e fel beirniadaeth; roeddwn i'n ei weld e fel cyfraniad positif a phwysig, i fod yn hollol onest gyda chi. Nid oes neb, wrth gwrs, wedi gweld y strategaeth eto, a beth rŷm ni wedi'i wneud yw cyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghori, ac mae trafodaeth wedi dod o hynny. Rydw i'n croesawi, Jeremy, pob un cyfraniad i hynny. Nid ydw i'n gweld y cyfraniad yna fel peth negyddol, ac nid ydw i'n ei weld fel beirniadaeth. Rydw i'n ei weld e fel cyfraniad pwysig. Mi fydd cynlluniau gweithredu, mi fydd yna dargedau, mi fydd yna amcanion, ac mi fydd y strategaeth yn cynnwys yn union yr un math o fframwaith. Nid yw'n ddigonol i Weinidog ddod i bwyllgor yn y Cynulliad, neu i sefyll yn y Siambr, a dweud, 'Mae gennym ni un targed, ac mi fyddwn ni'n cyrraedd y targed yn 2050.' Nid yw hynny'n ddigonol. Nid yw'n ddigonol i unrhyw Weinidog neu i unrhyw Lywodraeth wneud hynny. Felly, mae'n rhaid bod yna dargedau. Mae'n rhaid ein bod ni'n agored aboutu hynny, ac mae'n rhaid inni, wrth gyhoeddi'r strategaeth, gyhoeddi hefyd y ffyrdd o greu *accountability* yn beth rydym ni'n ei wneud, so mae pobl yn gallu sicrhau ein bod ni'n atebol am beth rydym ni'n ei ddweud a'r fath o amcanion rydym ni'n eu gosod. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod yna ddim jest targedau, ond amserlenni hefyd, er mwyn i bobl allu deall beth ydy ein nod ni ac wedyn gall pobl sicrhau atebolrwydd y Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog.

criticism; I saw it as a positive, important contribution to the debate, to be honest with you. Nobody has seen the strategy, as of yet, of course, and what we've done is to publish a consultation document, and the debate has emerged from that. Jeremy, I welcome every contribution to that process. I don't see these contributions as being negative or as being critical. I see this as an important contribution, and, yes, action plans will be in place. There will be targets in place. There will be objectives, and the strategy will include exactly that kind of framework. It isn't sufficient for a Minister to appear before a committee in the Assembly, or to stand up in the Chamber, and say, 'We have one target, and we will reach that target by 2050.' That simply is inadequate. It wouldn't be adequate for any Minister or any Government to take that approach. So, there have to be targets in place. We have to be open about that and, in publishing the strategy, we must also tell people how we are going to have accountability in what we do, so that people can ensure that we are accountable for our statements and for the objectives that we put in place. We must ensure that we have not only targets, but also timetables, so that people can understand what our objectives and ambitions are and then people can secure the accountability of the Government and the Minister.

[137] **Jeremy Miles:** Beth sydd gennych chi mewn golwg ar hyn o bryd, os oes gennych chi rywbeth, yn nhermau pa strwythur fydd i'r cyfnodau hynny gyda thargedau? Mae rhai wedi gofyn am gynlluniau pum mlynedd, rhai eraill wedi awgrymu degawdau ac ati. A oes gennych chi ryw ddamcaniaeth ar hyn o bryd o beth yw'r cyfnodau neu'r cerrig milltir gorau rhwng nawr a diwedd y cyfnod?

[138] **Alun Davies:** Mae'r weledigaeth yn un hirdymor, wrth gwrs, ac, felly, mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym ni strwythur sy'n arwain trwy'r hirdymor i sicrhau bod gennym ni dargedau, ac rwy'n credu bod targedau pum mlynedd yn ddigon rhesymol a thargedau 10 mlynedd yn ddigon rhesymol. Hefyd, pa fath o dargedau ydyn nhw, achos nid ydym ni jest ishe gweld targed ar gyfer nifer y siaradwyr ble mae'r Gymraeg yn ein cymdeithas ni, ond hefyd, beth ydym ni'n ei wneud i sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyrraedd y targed erbyn 2050. Mae hynny'n gallu meddwl, er enghraifft, targed ar faint o athrawon sy'n gallu dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu darged ar faint o bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaethau lleol sy'n gallu darparu gwasanaethau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, rydym ni'n mynd i fesur nid jest canlyniadau'r polisi ond beth rydym ni'n rhoi i mewn i'r system i sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyrraedd amcanion y polisi. Bethan, a ydych chi eisiau ychwanegu

Jeremy Miles: What do you have in mind at the moment, if there is something, in terms of the structure of those periods and the targets? Some have asked for five-year plans, others have suggested decades. Do you have some theory at the moment regarding the best milestones or periods between now and the end of the period?

Alun Davies: This is a long-term vision, of course, and so we have to ensure that we have a structure in place that leads us through the long term to ensure that we have appropriate targets, and I think five-year targets are quite reasonable. Ten-year targets are also reasonable. We also have to consider what kind of targets these are, because we don't just want to see targets in terms of the number of Welsh speakers, but also what we're doing to ensure that we are reaching the ultimate target by 2050. That could mean a target related to the number of teachers able to teach through the medium of Welsh or a target in terms of how many people work in local services who are able to provide Welsh language services. So, we're not going to just measure the outcomes of the policy, but also the inputs, in order to ensure that we reach the policy objectives. Bethan, did you have anything to add?

rhywbeth?

[139] **Ms Webb:** Dyna beth ydy'r bwriad. Fel mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, mae—sori.

Ms Webb: That's the intention. As the Minister's said—sorry.

[140] **Bethan Jenkins:** Na, nid oes angen ichi gyffwrdd ag e.

Bethan Jenkins: No, you don't have to touch it.

[141] **Ms Webb:** Mae'r sensws yn digwydd bob degawd. Mae arolwg defnydd yn digwydd bob degawd ym mlynnyddoedd pedwar a phump sydd yn manylu mwy ar ddefnydd iaith. Bydd y comisiynydd, yn ei gwaith o ddydd i ddydd, yn goruchwyllo defnydd pan fydd y safonau yn cael eu gweithredu. Mae gennym ni ddata PLASC o ran canlyniadau yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 ac yn saith oed. Felly, mae gennym ni lu o ddata yn y system yn barod a bydd y data yna yn adlewyrchu'r daith iaith o rŵan tan 2050. Ond, yn sicr, fel mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, bydd y polisiau gweithredu sy'n aros yn gyfforddus o dan y brif nod strategol yn mynd â ni ar daith bob pum mlynedd.

Ms Webb: The census happens every decade. A survey regarding use happens every decade, in years four and five, which goes into more detail as to the use of language. The commissioner, in her day-to-day work, will supervise the use when the standards are implemented. We have PLASC data in terms of results at key stage 4 and at the age of seven. Therefore, we have a significant amount of data in the system already, and those would reflect the language journey from now to 2050. But, certainly, as the Minister has said, the implementation policies that remain comfortably under the main strategic aim will take us on a journey every five years.

[142] **Jeremy Miles:** Ai'r bwriad yw cyhoeddi'r targedau neu fframwaith o dargedau yn yr un cyfnod ag yr ydych chi'n cyhoeddi'r strategaeth ei hunan? Ai dyna'r bwriad ar hyn o bryd?

Jeremy Miles: Would it be the intention to publish a framework of targets simultaneously with the strategy itself? Is that the intention?

[143] **Alun Davies:** Ie.

Alun Davies: Yes.

[144] **Bethan Jenkins:** Iawn? Grêt, diolch yn fawr, Jeremy. Rydym ni'n

Bethan Jenkins: Okay? Great, thank you very much, Jeremy. We move on

symud ymlaen at Suzy a'i to Suzy.
chwestiynau.

[145] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch, Bethan. **Suzy Davies:** Thank you, Bethan.

[146] I think we all accept that there needs to be a primary focus on education. If that doesn't work, the rest is lost. But there is a very strong, virtually—well, let's call it a strong focus on education, which is dealing with the supply end of things. You're already having to firefight a little bit with the figures that have come out today on the number of secondary teachers qualified through the medium of Welsh. With so much focus on education, how are you planning to manage, alongside the demand side, the use of Welsh outside the school gate or college gate, because you can't leave that until you've sorted the education?

[147] **Alun Davies:** In answering your question, I think it'd be useful, actually, if we had a session—that's a matter for the committee, of course—when the strategy is actually published to go into some of these issues. We're talking about, at the moment, some of the areas that were published in the consultation document. And you're absolutely right, Suzy—you're absolutely right—that there was a great deal of focus on education. Personally, I place a great deal of emphasis on that myself, as a Minister, because I look at the community I represent in Blaenau Gwent—it's a very small number of people actually speaking and using the Welsh language in that community—and how are we going to enable people to feel that Welsh is a part of their lives without creating new Welsh speakers, if you like? That should be a core part of what our education system delivers, both through Welsh-medium education and also through English-medium education. I don't think we should simply see the role of education as being the role of Welsh-medium education; we need to look at the education system in its totality.

[148] But, the question that you ask is the absolutely critical one. If you just take the Welsh-medium sector for a moment, it is possible to create that Welsh-speaking community within a school environment, and if it was in Blaenau Gwent, for example, that Welsh-speaking community would exist within that school environment and wouldn't exist, potentially, on the street outside.

[149] So, how do you enable people to use and feel comfortable using the Welsh language in communities where Welsh is not the language of that community? I think that's one of our key ambitions and one of our key

objectives. We've got a number of ideas how we do that, both in terms of supported institutions and organisations that already do that—*mentrau iaith* is a good example, the Urdd would be another example, and young farmers' clubs, I think, do fantastic work in enabling people to feel part of a Welsh-speaking community, whether they speak the language or not. I think more organisations, and public organisations as well, could do a lot to learn from those sorts of voluntary organisations. So, there is that sort of structure and that social environment already existing outside of schools, but you're absolutely right—we need to look hard at that.

[150] But we also need to look at how that society is changing and how our society is changing. I'm going to be speaking in Bangor on Friday at a conference looking at technology. If, for example, we are using speech-to-text technology, we need to ensure that the Welsh language is a part of that and that the Welsh language is a part of all the different technologies that perhaps our children understand and we don't—certainly in my case. So, the debate and the discussion about the place of Welsh outside of that school environment isn't simply a discussion that happens that is only to do with geography, but it's to do with the whole of our community and how our community communicates with itself in the future. I think it's a very, very exciting challenge, actually. I think sometimes we see it as a very negative thing, as a terrible and difficult challenge to face. I think it's enormously exciting and I think there are fantastic opportunities for us to ensure that the Welsh language is a part of people's lives where they choose it to be so, and that we are able to extend the reach of Welsh, and using technology to do that, as well.

[151] **Suzy Davies:** Thank you for that, because I agree—I think this is probably going to be the most difficult part of it, but I'm glad you're excited about it [*Laughter.*]

[152] For those who are coming into this now, just as the wave crests, if you like, I've got some confidence that the ideas you've expressed today will be very helpful, but there are still the people who exist now who are already over 25. I don't expect you to give us a fully developed policy here, but how are we capturing those who perhaps have had no interest in Welsh, when they see these younger people coming behind them who are culturally different?

[153] **Alun Davies:** 'Culturally different' is an interesting term, isn't it? Is it culturally different? I don't know.

[154] **Suzy Davies:** Well, they will be, if you're right.

[155] **Alun Davies:** Do you know, the key task, if you like, that we have to achieve, is to make the Welsh language easy and comfortable for people? It's a bridge and not a barrier.

[156] **Suzy Davies:** No, no. I heard that.

[157] **Alun Davies:** And that means that we need to ensure that Welsh is around us and that people feel comfortable using the Welsh language around us in different ways. Members will have heard me before talking about the great success of the Football Association of Wales last summer in France—by normalising the use of Welsh, putting the language there, up on the screens, wherever it is, so that people feel comfortable with the use of Welsh, people hear Welsh being used. I was speaking to somebody this week who was overly excited, possibly, by I think a refuse lorry in Cardiff with a warning in Welsh and English when it was reversing [*Laughter.*]

[158] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, they do in Swansea as well.

[159] **Alun Davies:** This is the example I'm using. He said, 'I couldn't believe that, because all of a sudden, the Welsh language is there, and it's fantastic to see'. So, we need to make Welsh—

[160] **Bethan Jenkins:** Just as you get knocked over [*Laughter.*]

[161] **Alun Davies:** There's a happy end to the story [*Laughter.*] So, the serious point here—I'll finish the sentence—is that we need to ensure that Welsh is around us, that people don't feel that they are in any way excluded from that, that we encourage and we are inclusive in the use of that, and that we ensure that the cultural approach that we take, if you like, doesn't create differentiation, but creates a sense of cohesion.

11:00

[162] And we're having lots of debates at the moment about cohesion in society, and some of those debates are positive, some are less positive. And my feeling is that the language is something that can be a unifying force, something that can be used in order to give a sense of place and a sense of purpose, and it is my strong belief, as somebody who grew up as a non-

Welsh speaker, as somebody who has brought up his children to speak Welsh now, and as somebody who moves from English to Welsh in social life on a pretty regular basis, I want people to feel comfortable when they hear Welsh spoken around them, I want people to feel comfortable using Welsh when they choose to do so, and I want people to feel the earlier question about what is a Welsh speaker and what is an English speaker to be completely and utterly irrelevant—that if somebody speaks terrible, broken Welsh, that they're proud of it and it's the only Welsh they know, then they should be encouraged to make those mistakes.

[163] **Suzy Davies:** Lovely, thank you.

[164] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes gen ti gwestiynau ynglŷn ag addysg, ynglŷn â hyfforddiant athrawon hefyd, Suzy? **Bethan Jenkins:** Do you have questions on education and the training of teachers, Suzy?

[165] **Suzy Davies:** I don't think they were my questions, were they?

[166] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. Mae cwestiynau hefyd gennym ni ynglŷn â chynllunio'r gweithlu addysg, a hefyd ynglŷn â sut rydych chi'n credu bod angen ehangu ar hynny yng nghydestun y targed. Gwnaethon ni glywed tystiolaeth gan rai o'r coleg Cymraeg yn dweud bod yna ganran yn barod sy'n medru'r Gymraeg ond sy'n dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, a gallen nhw newid yn syth bin er mwyn gallu dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Pa fath o newidiadau fydd eu hangen yn benodol yn y sector addysg i sicrhau bod athrawon yn gallu dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay. We also have questions on workforce planning—the education workforce—and how you think there is a need to expand on that in the context of the target. We heard evidence from some in the *coleg Cymraeg* who said that there was a percentage already who were Welsh speaking teaching through the medium of English, and they could change immediately to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh. So, what sort of changes are required specifically in the education sector to ensure that teachers can teach through the medium of Welsh?

[167] **Alun Davies:** Un o'r heriau sydd gennym ni pan fydd hi'n dod i'r strategaeth yw sicrhau bod gennym ni'r gweithlu i ddelifro ar ein gweledigaeth ni, ac rwy'n credu bod hynny'n bwysig. Ac rwy'n gweld bod **Alun Davies:** One of the challenges we face when it comes to the strategy is ensuring that we have the workforce in place to deliver our vision, and I do think that that's important. And I do think that the

y coleg Cymraeg wedi bod yn llwyddiant. Mae wedi bod yn hynod o lwyddiannus ac yn fodel arbennig o gryf. Mi fydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol bod Kirsty Williams wedi sefydlu gweithgor a fydd yn edrych ar sut rydym ni'n ehangu rôl y coleg Cymraeg i weithredu yn y sector addysg bellach hefyd, ac rwy'n edrych ymlaen at glywed y gweithgor yn adrodd yn ôl i ni—ac rwy'n credu bydd hynny yn yr haf.

[168] Rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid inni ystyried o ddifrif sut rydym ni'n sicrhau bod gennym ni nid jest y nifer absoliwt o athrawon sy'n gallu dysgu yn Gymraeg, neu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, neu ddysgu'r Gymraeg, ond hefyd bod gennym ni strwythur yn ei le sy'n gynaliadwy ar gyfer y dyfodol hefyd ac sy'n gallu ehangu ar gyfer y dyfodol hefyd, ac sy'n gallu cynnig cyfleoedd i athrawon sy'n siarad Cymraeg ond nad ydynt yn teimlo'n ddigon hyderus i'w ddefnyddio a dysgu a gweithio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, rwy'n edrych ar sawl elfen o gynllunio'r gweithlu ar hyn o bryd, ac mi fydd y strategaeth derfynol yn cynnwys amcanion ar gyfer athrawon sy'n dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, athrawon sy'n dysgu Cymraeg, ac mi fydd gennym ni, yn y strategaeth, ddarlun o sut rydym ni'n gweld y system yn datblygu ar gyfer y dyfodol.

[169] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym ni'n edrych ymlaen at weld hynny. Rydym

coleg Cymraeg has been very successful and has been an exceptionally strong model. Members will be aware that Kirsty Williams has established a working group looking at how we can enhance the role of the *coleg Cymraeg* to be working in the further education sector, too, and I look forward to the outcome of that working group—and I think they'll report in the summer.

I do think we have to consider in earnest how we ensure that we have not only the absolute number of teachers able to teach through the medium of Welsh, or to teach Welsh, but also that we have the structures in place that are sustainable for the future and which can expand for the future, and which can provide opportunities to teachers who are Welsh speaking but don't feel confident enough to teach and work through the medium of Welsh. So, I am looking at a number of different elements in terms of workforce planning at the moment, and the final strategy will include objectives for teachers who teach through the medium of Welsh, teachers who teach Welsh, and we will also, within that strategy, have a portrayal of how we see the system developing for the future.

Bethan Jenkins: We look forward to seeing that. We've heard from one

ni wedi clywed gan un tyst a ddywedodd bod angen, siŵr o fod, 70 y cant o athrawon ychwanegol sy'n medru'r Gymraeg er mwyn cyflawni'r targed a chyrraedd 1 filiwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050. A oes data gennych chi, er mwyn i chi, fel rydych chi wedi dweud, fel rhan o'ch strategaeth chi, i dracio lle fydd angen gwneud y newidiadau i hyfforddiant athrawon ac i greu mwy o athrawon fel rhan o'ch cynlluniau?

witness who says that, probably, there would need to be a further 70 per cent of teachers who can speak Welsh in order to achieve the target of achieving 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. Do you have data so that you, as you said, will be able to track the changes to teacher training and to create more teachers as part of your plans?

[170] **Alun Davies:** Mae'r pwyllgor yn ymwybodol bod yr *Education Workforce Council* wedi bod yn edrych ar sgiliau iaith yn y gweithlu. Nid wyf i'n adnabod y ffigwr rydych chi wedi ei ddefnyddio y bore yma, ond nid wyf i'n dweud nad yw'r ffigwr yn gywir—nid wyf i'n ei adnabod fy hun. Ond, rwy'n hapus iawn i ystyried yr her sydd gennym ni i sicrhau bod gennym ni'r adnoddau ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ac, os nad oes digon o athrawon sy'n gallu dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg gennym ni, wel nid ydym ni'n gallu beirniadu cynghorau am beidio ag agor ysgolion Cymraeg. Mae'n rhaid bod y ddau yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, ac mae'n rhaid bod gennym ni gynllun i sicrhau bod gennym ni'r adnoddau er mwyn cyrraedd y weledigaeth rydym ni wedi ei gosod ar gyfer ein hunain. A dyna'n union y pwynt, i ddod yn ôl at eich cwestiwn cyntaf chi, Gadeirydd, sef: pam ydych chi'n gosod y targed heriol yma. Er mwyn newid—creu newid a chreu'r angen i newid. Achos, y ffordd rwyddaf i

Alun Davies: The committee is aware that the Education Workforce Council has been looking at language skills within the workforce. I don't recognise the figure that you've used this morning, but I'm not saying that it's incorrect—I just don't recognise it myself. But I am more than happy to consider the challenge we face in terms of ensuring that we have the necessary resources for the future and, if we don't have enough teachers who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh, well we can't criticise councils for not opening Welsh-medium schools. Both aspects need to go hand in hand, and we must have a plan in place in order to ensure that we have the resources that enable us to achieve the vision that we have set ourselves. And that brings me back to your first question, Chair as to why you have set this ambitious and challenging target. It's in order to generate change and to generate the need for change. Because the easiest way of publishing a strategy over the

gyhoeddi strategaeth yn ystod y next few months would be a strategy misoedd nesaf fyddai strategaeth nad that didn't challenge us as a yw yn ein herio ni fel Llywodraeth. Government.

[171] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Lee.

[172] **Lee Waters:** The difficulty, Minister, is that we're not starting from a stable position; we're starting from a declining position. *Newyddion* reported last night that the number of students completing secondary training through Welsh has halved in the last three years. So, what implications does that have for our plan?

[173] **Alun Davies:** It doesn't have happy implications, and we're aware of that, clearly. We understand why that is happening, and we're looking at how we can ensure that, in the future, we are able to produce sufficient teachers to deliver on our ambitions. But, you're absolutely right. I won't, in any way, challenge either the numbers, the figures or the analysis. I think you're absolutely right. We do have a number—. I think it's a third of teachers in Wales that are able to speak Welsh at the moment, from our understanding. Is that sufficient? Potentially. Would we like more? Potentially. Are we helping people who have some Welsh to improve their Welsh? Yes, we are. The sabbatical process and project is working well on enabling people to move from speaking a limited level of Welsh to being able to understand Welsh, and to use Welsh as part of their working lives. In the last year for which we have numbers, 245 teachers were able to complete that process. So, yes, there is a significant challenge there; and there are already means and mechanisms in place to recognise and to overcome those challenges.

[174] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee, did you have any more questions?

[175] **Lee Waters:** Shall we address this now or later, as we were planning to—the issue of training?

[176] **Bethan Jenkins:** Just carry on while you're on the theme.

[177] **Lee Waters:** The difficulty, Minister, is that we took evidence from the Education Workforce Council. They were saying that the data they have show that the sabbatical scheme, in which we're investing heavily and have a lot of faith in terms of one of the few options we have of practical projects to address the situation, is having negligible change since it was introduced in 2007. So, on their own evidence, based on data from the register of

practitioners, even though there is anecdotal evidence to suggest there's demand for these courses and the people who go on them find them of benefit, in terms of the amount of teachers who can actually teach through Welsh in classrooms as a result of being on these courses, it's having a negligible impact.

[178] **Alun Davies:** I've not seen that, and that's not my view.

[179] **Lee Waters:** Well, it's the Education Workforce Council's view.

[180] **Alun Davies:** It's not my view. I think the number I've just given to you—245 people having been through that system in a year—demonstrates that it is having an effect. We are looking to—

[181] **Lee Waters:** I'm not sure we can casually set aside the view of the people who monitor this.

[182] **Alun Davies:** I don't accept their analysis, I think, is the best way of putting it.

[183] **Lee Waters:** But there are no data to suggest otherwise, though.

[184] **Alun Davies:** Well, I've just given you a number now. But the point that I'm making to you is this, Lee—

[185] **Lee Waters:** With respect, though, Minister, the number you've given me is not the number of teachers who, actually, as a result of going through these courses, then go back and teach differently. That's what matters.

[186] **Alun Davies:** It is what matters; you're absolutely right. We understand that there are about a third of teachers in Wales who speak Welsh and would be able, potentially, to teach through the medium of Welsh. We are increasing that number, mainly through the sabbatical system on an annual basis. It may well be that not all of those teachers then return to teach through the medium of Welsh in a way that perhaps we would hope, expect and anticipate. I do not believe that it is reasonable, therefore, to describe that as having a negligible effect. I don't accept that analysis and I don't accept that conclusion.

[187] **Lee Waters:** Well, it's difficult when we're abandoning data and relying on faith and judgment, isn't it?

[188] **Alun Davies:** We're not abandoning data, Lee. That is not the case. I have given you the numbers. What we're seeing is an independent evaluation of the scheme, published two years ago, reported that it was having an effect, both in terms of language skills and the use of Welsh after returning to their school or college. So, the only evaluation we have of this—the only evaluation we have of this scheme—says it works, says it succeeds and says it delivers. Now, if other commentators don't accept that, it's their absolute right to have their point of view, but I would like to see the evidence upon which they've based that point of view.

[189] **Neil Hamilton:** Am I right in thinking there are 15,000 qualified teachers in Wales? [*Inaudible.*] I know you're saying it's 27 per cent—
[*Inaudible.*]

[190] **Alun Davies:** Thirty-three per cent.

[191] **Neil Hamilton:** Thirty three per cent class themselves as Welsh speakers, so if by—.

[192] **Bethan Jenkins:** Thirty-five thousand qualified teachers.

[193] **Neil Hamilton:** Thirty-five thousand. Right. I was just trying to put the 245 figure in perspective. I mean, I agree with you, I don't think that is a negligible figure given that this is a relatively new scheme and it is in the process of development.

[194] **Alun Davies:** I would never, as a Minister, sit back and say, 'Everything works perfectly well, I'm content with the world the way it is today.' I think we constantly need to be testing ourselves, challenging ourselves, pushing ourselves. I feel that the evidence that I have seen is that the scheme works, it is effective, it delivers the language skills that we want to see delivered. There's no evidence to suggest it doesn't, and I've certainly never seen any evidence to suggest it doesn't deliver those language schemes. The people who've participated in it have said themselves that their language skills have increased in the way that we would expect and anticipate and we've got no reason to question that, and the use of Welsh has increased as a consequence of being on those schemes. We know that from the independent evaluation. Now, if the Education Workforce Council is saying it has a negligible effect—I haven't seen that myself—then that's a matter for them.

[195] **Bethan Jenkins:** To clarify, they said they're not changing—. When they go back to reregister after they've done those courses, they're not changing how they define themselves after having done those courses. But I think, just to clarify also, it depends on the level of the course. So, in some of them, they wouldn't be expected to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh, so I think we need to take that into consideration when we're making a judgement on the sabbatical courses as well.

[196] **Lee Waters:** There's further evidence as well on the difficulty of the sabbatical courses that we've received. Undeb Cenedlaethol Athrawon Cymru told us that there's a difficulty in releasing teachers and then Estyn further told us that, in backfilling those teachers who have been released, there just aren't the number of supply teachers who are able to speak Welsh to cover them. So, the interlinkages within the system are really quite difficult.

[197] **Alun Davies:** No, they're not difficult; those are the management challenges you find when you enhance or deliver any training activity. Those are the challenges of creating a self-improving system, which is what we want to do in education. Whenever you release a teacher from a classroom, you've got to backfill those vacancies. That happens; that is entirely and absolutely the case.

[198] **Lee Waters:** Indeed, but Estyn's saying that there aren't the number of Welsh-speaking qualified teachers available to backfill.

[199] **Alun Davies:** Lee, the key issue here is not simply to list the problems, but to find solutions, and that's what I seek to do as a Minister.

[200] **Lee Waters:** But we have a scrutiny function Minister, with respect—

[201] **Alun Davies:** Of course you do.

[202] **Lee Waters:** —and we're putting to you the challenges that we've heard in evidence that need to be properly addressed for this strategy to succeed. I'm not trying to trip you up.

[203] **Alun Davies:** I understand the scrutiny system; I think it's hugely important. But let me say this: but I have the right to answer as well. The only evaluation of the scheme was a positive evaluation, and the only evaluation of the scheme has told us that the scheme has been able to both improve

language skills and the use of Welsh. So, we know that and we know that it's working. Does having a comprehensive and popular and extensive sabbatical programme, in the way that we've described, lead to management issues? Yes, of course it does, and those management issues are there to be resolved. What I would like to be able to understand is how we are able to expand this, and still maintain the ability of schools to deliver the teaching that they are required to do. On what I would like to see, some of the funding that we've just announced in the budget will go to expanding this programme, and will go to enabling us, I hope, to have more people on the sabbatical programme in the future. Of course, that does lead to other challenges—there is no argument from me or from anyone else that, actually, this is something that exists without challenges and will be able to be delivered without resolving some of the issues that you've described.

11:15

[204] But the point I'm making to you, rightly—and this is the important point here—is that we create these opportunities, we create the structure in order to deliver on our ambitions, and we have people in place who are able to deliver the management functions to enable that structure to work. And that is what we have to do as a system.

[205] **Lee Waters:** Can I ask a final question on this section?

[206] **Bethan Jenkins:** Yes.

[207] **Lee Waters:** I would suggest it's more than a management problem if the bodies aren't there to be able to manage. But in terms of the—. Can you answer specifically on the Cam wrth Gam scheme—this is the early years practitioners' project—and whether or not you plan to expand or invest in that further?

[208] **Alun Davies:** Yes.

[209] **Lee Waters:** That's very clear; thank you.

[210] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much, and now we have Neil Hamilton ar ddilyniant. **Neil Hamilton** on progression.

[211] **Neil Hamilton:** Like you, I spent several of my formative years as a

resident of Pantycelyn hall; it helped to make us the rounded figures that we've subsequently become.

[212] **Alun Davies:** There we are, we've found something in common after all these years. [*Laughter.*]

[213] **Neil Hamilton:** Although in my day, it was a bilingual hall, not a Welsh language hall.

[214] **Bethan Jenkins:** Were you there at the same time as Prince Charles?

[215] **Neil Hamilton:** Yes, we were boys together.

[216] **Alun Davies:** I wasn't there then. [*Laughter.*]

[217] **Neil Hamilton:** So I'm interested in your policy of creating one continuum of learning the Welsh language, going on by steps through life. We've had evidence in relation to the Welsh in education strategic plans, which have been criticised by the Welsh Language Commissioner, as well as Estyn. The language commissioner said that the experience of the first three years of WESPs was we didn't see any progress, there's been no growth, and she needs more robust guidance from Government to gather data and put reasonable targets in place. We've also had evidence as regards local authorities and the support that they give for this, that that's patchy—I think that was Estyn's evidence. And I was wondering, therefore, if you can explain to us what plans you've got to support local authorities in the planning and development of Welsh-medium provision through the WESP process.

[218] **Alun Davies:** Yes, we've received the vast majority of WESPs, now, from local authorities. There are still a few outstanding; they were due in last month. It is my intention to make a formal statement on this—either an oral or written statement—at an appropriate time, when we've had an opportunity to review the plans that we've had and to make a considered judgment on that. What can I say this morning that will help the process? Some plans are better than others, as we would expect and anticipate. Some plans will help us achieve our ambitions, other plans won't. It is not my intention at any point to become embroiled in a negative conversation with local authorities. Local authorities have different pressures on their budgets and their resources. It is my clear ambition that WESPs are an important tool to enable us to achieve our ambitions in terms of delivering on the target of 1 million Welsh speakers and to ensure that people across Wales have the same

opportunity to access Welsh-medium education.

[219] How do we do that? I believe that we need to have a conversation with different local authorities about how we can work together to do that. I think collaboration and co-operation is better than an approach that is more negative. I want to work with local government, not against local government. I want local government to work together, between local authorities. And I want us to find a process now, having seen the WESPs as they are, of moving forward in an agreed way.

[220] I know this is a very inadequate answer, because I'm not directly answering your question, but what I'm trying to do is to describe my approach and the approach I will take. And I think, when I'm in a position, when I've had an opportunity to consider the WESPs that we've received, to consider the context in which they've been written, to consider whether they achieve the ambitions and the vision, and then be in a position to make an announcement on how I intend to take that forward, I will make that announcement first and foremost to the National Assembly.

[221] **Neil Hamilton:** All right. I suppose the challenge is greater in some parts of the country than others. You referred to Blaenau Gwent earlier on, obviously, being your own constituency, and an area that has very few native Welsh speakers. Insofar as you can tell us, from what you've seen of WESPs already, is the adequacy or inadequacy, in your eyes, of particular plans in any way related to the prevalence or otherwise of Welsh speakers within that community?

[222] **Alun Davies:** I think it would be difficult to characterise it in such a way. I would—I'm trying not to mislead, because we are in the middle of this conversation and this consideration at the moment, and we haven't reached any conclusions. Some authorities have more ambition than other authorities. Some authorities are clearly wanting to develop the delivery of Welsh-medium education in a way that others aren't, and it always has been that situation. I wouldn't like to characterise any of these plans, or any of these deficiencies or whatever, in a way that tries to place that authority geographically. Some are surprising. Some authorities that you wouldn't expect or anticipate to have that vision have been really very, very pleasing to see. Others that you would anticipate to be more ambitious probably aren't as ambitious. So, I think it would be difficult to characterise the overall quality or standard of ambition in those terms, but the key thing for me, as a Minister here in Cardiff, is to work with local government across Wales to

look at how we can deliver Welsh language education in a way that is coherent, which meets the ambitions of the Government as a whole, but also the community that is represented in that place. Clearly, those ambitions will be different in different places. Our expectations will be different in different places. I think what I'm really anxious to do is to ensure that there is agreement and consensus. What I'm not seeking to do is either to impose or enforce.

[223] **Neil Hamilton:** Well, I strongly support that approach. My question was prompted by what you said earlier on about using the language as a bridge rather than a barrier. In the context of current controversies about cohesion in numerous contexts, as your policy succeeds—as we hope it will do—the danger of it becoming a barrier rather than a bridge in respect of areas like Blaenau Gwent, for example, is possibly going to become a more difficult problem as the Welsh language becomes more natural as a means of discourse and living in different parts of Wales. We've got to bring with us the English monoglot areas, which will perhaps require more of the carrot-and-stick approach.

[224] **Alun Davies:** I'm not sure that's true, you know. I visited my old infant school, Glanhwy, in Tredegar with Kirsty Williams before Christmas. We were walking through the school, chatting to teachers, and I heard Welsh being taught there in a way that wasn't taught when I was a four-year-old in Glanhwy. I heard Welsh being spoken there, and children learning basic words in Welsh in a way that you simply wouldn't have heard when I was a child. So, there will be—. As I said earlier, I reject the sort of categorisation of people, because those children will have a grasp of basic Welsh. They will learn Welsh in a way that I never did. There will always be, I think, in Wales—we use that word 'continuum'—people who are absolutely fluent—

[225] **Bethan Jenkins:** We'll come on to that.

[226] **Alun Davies:** Yes. I was afraid we might. [*Laughter.*]

[227] **Bethan Jenkins:** If you let us, that is.

[228] **Alun Davies:** This is one strategy that has been uncovered. [*Laughter.*] There are people who are feeling completely comfortable to speak Welsh as a first language, who prefer to speak in Welsh; then people who will use Welsh in different circumstances—socially rather than professionally, or whatever; and then people who have very little Welsh. We've always had that continuum

in Wales. What we have tried to do is to divide it in half, and we've always been wrong to do that. So, when we talk about that bridge, those children that I spoke to in Tredegar are learning Welsh now in a way that their parents would never have done, and that is the bridge, because they will see things and hear things, and they will understand things that their parents or grandparents would never have done. So, let's look at how we can create that cohesion, and how the language can be something that really does belong to all of us in a very profound way and use that to create cohesion, and not to create division. You know, I visited another school in Bethesda, in Gwynedd, where you have children who come from all sorts of backgrounds, not all from Gwynedd but coming from across the border in England, and also from other parts of the world, and who were learning to speak Welsh. The language brings them together as a community, as a school, and as young children. It's a very positive thing in that way, so that's why I always want to see the language as something where we all feel comfortable. We will feel comfortable in different ways, but let's all feel comfortable about its place in our society.

[229] 11:25

[230] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae yna gwpwl o gwestiynau ar y strategaethau addysg, felly os ydym ni'n gallu cael atebion byrrach, byddai hynny'n grêt. Jeremy Miles.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. There are a couple of questions on education strategies, so if we could have shorter answers, that would be great. Jeremy Miles.

[231] **Jeremy Miles:** Roeddwn i jest moyn adeiladu ar y cwestiwn. Fe wnaethoch chi sôn am y continwmm a rhannu pobl i siarad Cymraeg iaith gyntaf ac ail iaith. Mae'r cymhwyster unedig, wrth gwrs, yn mynd i ddelio gyda hynny o ran cymwysterau. Mae'r cysyniad yma o gontinwmm yn rhywbeth gallai pawb gefnogi ar y lefel o gysyniad; mae'n galonogol ac mae'n bositif. Ond, yn y cynllunio ac ym manylder y broses o ddylunio continwmm y mae'r llwyddo neu'r methu. Ble ydym ni ar hyn o bryd gyda'r cynllunio a'r continwmm

Jeremy Miles: I just wanted to build on the issue of the continuum and separating people into categories of Welsh speakers and second language speakers. This concept of a continuum is something that everyone could support on a conceptual level; it's encouraging and it's positive. But in terms of the detailed planning of designing a continuum, that's where success and failure will lie. So, where are we now in planning that education continuum?

addysgiadol yna?

[232] **Alun Davies:** Pan rydym ni'n sôn aboutu'r *qualifications*?

Alun Davies: When we talk about qualifications?

[233] **Jeremy Miles:** Symud tuag at yr un cymhwyster yna, ie.

Jeremy Miles: Moving towards that one qualification, yes.

[234] **Alun Davies:** Yr un cymhwyster, o ran *GCSE*, ie? Mae'r cwricwlwm newydd yn cael ei gyflwyno yn nes ymlaen y flwyddyn yma. Bydd plant yn dechrau astudio hynny yn nes ymlaen y flwyddyn yma. Bydd yna dal enw 'ail iaith' fel rhan o hynny, ond beth leiciwn i wahodd pobl i'w wneud yw edrych y tu hwnt i'r teitl ac edrych ar beth sy'n cael ei ddysgu. Mi fydd y broses o ddysgu yn newid y flwyddyn yma, a bydd y broses a'r cwricwlwm yn newid y flwyddyn yma. Er bod y teitl yn dal i fod yno fel 'ail iaith', bydd natur y dysgu wedi newid—ac mi fydd hynny'n newid—a wedyn bydd hynny'n bwydo i mewn i'r holl drafodaeth ar Donaldson, a fydd yn newid yn ei gyfanrwydd yn 2021.

Alun Davies: One qualification in terms of *GCSE*, yes? The new curriculum is being introduced later this year, and children will start to study that later this year. There will still be the term 'second language' as part of that, but what I would like to invite people to do is to look beyond the title and to look at what is being taught. The process of teaching will change this year and the process and the curriculum will change this year. So, even though the title is still there as 'second language', the nature of the teaching will change—and that will change—and then that will feed into the whole Donaldson discussion and the complete change in 2021.

[235] **Jeremy Miles:** Ac ar y cynllunio adnoddau ac ati sydd ynghlwm wrth hynny, mae hynny ar y ffordd yn barod, ydyw e?

Jeremy Miles: And in terms of planning resources and so on, that's in the pipeline already, is it?

[236] **Alun Davies:** Ydy, rwy'n hyderus iawn bod y cynllunio—rydym ni wedi trafod rhywfaint cynllunio'r gweithlu—ac rwy'n hyderus bod y broses o gydweithio gyda'r gweithlu yn digwydd. Dyna pam rydym ni'n ei gyflwyno yn y ffordd rydym yn ei wneud. Mae rhai wedi dadlau bod yn rhaid i ni gael gwared ar yr holl fusnes 'ail iaith' yma, a newid yn syth ac yn glou. Ond, nid ydym yn teimlo ein bod ni'n gallu gwneud hynny. Nid ydym ni'n teimlo bod y gweithlu mewn lle i'n galluogi ni i wneud hynny. A dyna pam rydym ni yn ei wneud y ffordd rydym ni'n ei wneud. Felly, rydym ni'n cydweithio gydag ysgolion ac athrawon ac mae gyda ni'r athrawon a'r ysgolion yn teimlo'n hyderus eu bod nhw'n gallu delifro y cwricwlwm newydd o fis Medi ymlaen, ac oherwydd hynny, dyna sut rydym ni wedi dewis ei wneud y ffordd rydym ni wedi. Rwy'n hyderus bod hynny'n mynd i lwyddo.

[237] **Jeremy Miles:** Ar y cwestiwn ehangach o'r continwmm y mae'r TGAU yn un rhan ohono, mae'r continwmm yn mynd o'r blynyddoedd cynnar, drwyddo. A yw'r cynllunio ar gyfer symud tuag at gontinwmm ieithyddol o'r cychwyn cyntaf ar y ffordd yn barod?

[238] **Alun Davies:** Ie, mi fydd hynny'n rhan o'r strategaeth ac mi fydd hynny'n rhan o sut rydym ni'n alinio newidiadau addysg Donaldson a galluogi continwmm i fod yn realiti. Bethan, wyt ti eisiau—?

Alun Davies: Yes, I'm confident that the planning—we've discussed workforce planning—and I'm confident that the process of collaborating with the workforce is happening, and that's why we are introducing it in the way that we are. Some have argued that we have to get rid of this whole business of 'second language' and change immediately and quickly, and we don't feel that we can do that. We don't feel that the workforce is in a place to enable that and that's why we're doing it in the way that we are. So, we're collaborating with schools and the teachers and we have teachers in schools who feel confident that they can deliver the new curriculum from September, and because of that, that's how we have chosen to do it in this way. I'm confident that that is going to succeed.

Jeremy Miles: Just on the broader question of the continuum, because GCSE is one part of that, but the continuum goes from the early years all the way through. Now, is the planning towards moving towards a continuum from the very early stages already in the pipeline?

Alun Davies: Yes, that will be part of the strategy and will be part of how we align the Donaldson education changes and enable to continuum to actually be a reality. Bethan, would you like to add anything?

[239] **Ms Webb:** Jest i ychwanegu, ie, continwwm ieithyddol ydy o, ac i gyd-fynd ag uchelgais Donaldson, y *transactional competence*, yna os bydd rhywun yn gadael yr ysgol yn 16 neu'n 18, ei bod hi wedyn yn bosib cario ymlaen ar y continwwm drwy fynd i'r Ganolfan Dysgu Cymraeg Cenedlaethol a fydd yn cynnig lot o wahanol gyrsiau o ran gloywi iaith, helpu pobl i ddefnyddio'r sgiliau ieithyddol maen nhw wedi'u caffael yn yr ysgol yn y gweithle, ac yn y blaen. Felly, bydd rhaid i'r continwwm sy'n cael ei ddysgu yn yr ysgol o'r blynyddoedd cynnar drwyddo wedyn lincio i fyny i'r arlwy sy'n cael ei gynnig gan y ganolfan ar ddiwedd y daith fel ei bod hi'n fframwaith cynhwysfawr. Dyna'r weledigaeth, a dyna'r gwaith sydd eisoes wedi dechrau.

Ms Webb: Yes, if I could just add to that, it is a linguistic continuum and in terms of the Donaldson vision of the transactional competence, if one leaves school at 16 or 18, that it's then possible for them to continue on that continuum by going to the National Centre for Learning Welsh, which will provide a number of different courses in terms of language improvement, helping people to use the language skills that they've acquired in school in the workplace and so on. So, the continuum from the early years and from the school experience will then have to link up to the provision made by the centre at the end of the journey so it is a comprehensive vision, and that's the work that's already commenced.

[240] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Dai Lloyd.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you. Dai Lloyd.

11:30

[241] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, symud cam yn ôl; cwestiwn byr ynglŷn â'r WESPs. Cyn bod plant hyd yn oed yn cychwyn yn yr ysgol, pa arweiniad ydych chi'n ei roi i gynghorau sir ynglŷn â'r angen i hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, efallai mewn sefyllfa lle na fyddent wedi meddwl amdano? Rwy'n gwybod bod y mwyafrif llethol o'r plant sy'n mynychu ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yma yn y de, beth bynnag, yn dod o gartrefi di-Gymraeg. Ond,

Dai Lloyd: Yes, to go back a step; a short question about the WESPs. Before children even start school, what guidance do you provide to councils about the need to promote Welsh-medium education, perhaps in a situation where they wouldn't have thought about it? I know that a large majority of children who attend Welsh-medium schools here in south Wales come from English-speaking homes, but there is a proportion of

hefyd mae yna garfan o rieni di-Gymraeg nad ydynt erioed wedi meddwl am freintiau addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Sut ydych chi'n hyrwyddo hynny, neu yn dangos arweinid i'w cynghorau sir nhw y dylent fod, o leiaf, yn trio darparu rhyw fath o wybodaeth ynglŷn â breintiau addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg? Yn naturiol, mae nifer fawr ohonom yn swil; mae'r Gweinidog yn swil, rydw i'n swil ac mae nifer iawn o rieni yn swil ac nid ydynt yn hoffi gofyn. Mae angen gwneud yn siŵr bod y wybodaeth yna o'u blaenau nhw. Yn aml nid ydy'r wybodaeth yna, ac mae pobl yn dewis anfon eu plant i'r ysgol agosaf, heb gael y cyfle i feddwl am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

[242] **Alun Davies:** Rydw i'n cytuno gyda'r dadansoddiad. Rydw i'n meddwl mai un o wendidau, efallai, y WESPs yw ein bod ni yn asesu'r galw, ond nid ydym yn hybu'r galw o gwbl, nac yn galluogi pobl i deimlo fel bod ganddynt ddewis go iawn i'w wneud. Yn aml iawn, os nad oes ysgol yn agos iawn, nid yw rhieni yn meddwl bod ganddynt y gallu i wneud penderfyniad i anfon eu plant i ysgol Gymraeg. Felly, un o'r pethau rydw i eisiau ystyried fel rhan o'r strategaeth ydy sut ydym yn gwneud hynny. Nid ydw i eisiau dweud wrth rieni bod addysg Gymraeg yn well nac addysg Saesneg mewn unrhyw ffordd, ond rydw i eisiau i bobl deimlo'n gyfforddus ac yn gartrefol bod y gallu ganddynt i wneud penderfyniad. Felly, mae'n un o'r

non-Welsh-speaking parents who've never thought about the advantages of Welsh-medium education. How do you promote that, or show leadership to our county councils that they should at least be trying to provide some sort of information about the benefits of Welsh-medium education? Naturally, a number of us are shy; the Minister's shy, I'm shy and a lot of the parents are shy and don't like to ask. We need to make sure that the information is there in front of them. Often, that information isn't there, and people just choose to send their children to the closest school, without the opportunity to think about Welsh-medium education.

Alun Davies: I agree with that analysis. I do think that one of the weaknesses of WESPs is that we assess demand, but we don't actually encourage greater demand and tell people that they have an option. Often, unless parents know the school that's very close to them, they don't feel that they have the option to send their children to Welsh-medium education. So, one of the things that I want to consider as part of the strategy is how we actually achieve that. I don't want to tell parents that Welsh-medium education is better than English-medium education in any way, but I do want people to feel comfortable that they are in a position to make that choice. It is one of the challenges facing us, and I agree with

heriau sydd gennym ni, ac rwy'n what you have to say.
cytuno gyda'r hyn rydych yn ei
ddweud.

[243] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi'n credu, felly, bod angen newid beth mae'r WESPs yn ei wneud? Achos rydych newydd ddweud nad ydych yn gofyn am hybu'r galw, ac mae nifer o bobl wedi dweud bod angen newid yn *emphasis* arnyn nhw, felly. Achos, er enghraifft, mae rhai o'r cynghorau dim ond yn mynd i greu lleiafswm o leoedd newydd ar gyfer addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, yn hytrach na'r hyn, efallai, sydd yn—mae'r boblogaeth gyffredinol eisiau mwy na hynny i fodoli yn y dyfodol. Rydw i'n clywed beth rydych yn ei ddweud o ran eich bod chi eisiau cael perthynas bositif gyda nhw, ond os nad yw'r cynghorau yn mynd i fod yn gweithredu hynny, ac wedyn yn mynd i fod yn effeithio ar sut yr ydych yn cyrraedd y targed hynny, pa gamau ydych chi'n mynd i'w rhoi yn eu lle i newid beth mae'r strategaeth yn ei wneud?

Bethan Jenkins: Do you think, then, that there's a need to change what the WESPs are doing? You've just said that you don't ask for promotion of the demand, and a lot of people have said there's a need to change the emphasis. For example, some councils are only going to create the minimum in terms of new places for Welsh-medium education, rather than what, perhaps—the population in general want more than that to exist in the future. I'm hearing what you're saying in terms of wanting to have a positive relationship with them, but if the councils aren't going to be operating on that basis and then affecting how you're going to achieve this target, what steps are you going to put in place to change what the strategies are doing?

[244] **Alun Davies:** Rydw i'n meddwl bod rhaid i ni ystyried y WESPs. Nid ydynt wedi bod yn hynod o lwyddiannus yn y gorffennol i hybu, hyrwyddo a datblygu addysg Gymraeg. Rydym yn gwybod hynny oherwydd mae'r rhifau yn dweud wrthym ni. Felly, rydw i yn meddwl— a dyma pam rydw i'n dweud wrth ateb Neil Hamilton fy mod i ar hyn o bryd yn trio ystyried ble ydym ni gyda'r WESPs—gwneud cyhoeddiad

Alun Davies: I think we need to consider the WESPs. They haven't been particularly successful in the past in promoting and developing Welsh-medium education. We know that because the numbers tell us that. I do think—and that's why I said in response to Neil Hamilton that I am currently considering where we are with the WESPs—that I will make a statement to the Assembly when we have concluded that consideration. In

i'r Cynulliad pan fyddwn wedi dod at ddiwedd yr ystyriaeth honno. Byddaf yn gwneud dau ddatganiad, efallai: datganiad o ble rydym ni gyda'r WESPs presennol, ac wedyn sut yr ydym ni eisiau newid WESPs ar gyfer y dyfodol. Rydw i wedi dweud, wrth ateb cwestiynau blaenorol, bod gennym ni gyfle yn ystod yr haf, efallai, i gael trafodaeth ar y math o strwythur, fframwaith a phensaerniaeth deddfwriaethol ar gyfer y Gymraeg, ac rydw i yn meddwl bod rhaid i'r WESPs fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth. Ai dyma'r ffordd gorau ymlaen? Ai dyma'r ffordd gorau i gynllunio addysg Gymraeg ar gyfer y dyfodol? A ydym ni eisiau sicrhau bod gennym ni addysg Gymraeg ar gael ar draws y wlad, ac wedyn sicrhau bod gan bobl yr hawl a'r gallu i gael *access* i hynny? A ydy'r WESPs yn gwneud hynny? Fe gawn ni weld.

[245] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jest un olaf gen i; a fydd yna sefyllfa lle na fydddech yn cytuno arnyn nhw oherwydd na fyddent yn mynd yn ddigon pell i chi allu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw? Er enghraifft, os nad yw un cyngor penodol yn rhoi ffigwr digon realistig o ran ehangu ar addysg Gymraeg yn yr ardal honno, sut, felly, ydych chi'n mynd i weithredu ar y rhai sydd yn bodoli ar hyn o bryd?

[246] **Alun Davies:** Dyna yn union beth rydw i'n ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Pan fyddaf wedi dod at gasgliad, chi

fact, I perhaps will make two statements: one in terms of the position with the WESPs as they currently stand, and then how we want to see the WESPs change for the future. I've said in response to previous questions that we have an opportunity during the summer, perhaps, to have a debate on the kind of legislative architecture in place for the Welsh language, and I do think that the WESPs will have to be part of that debate. Is this the best way forward? Is this the best way to plan Welsh-medium education for the future? Do we want to ensure that we have Welsh-medium education across the country and then ensure that people have the right and ability to access that? Do the WESPs achieve that? We'll have to wait and see.

Bethan Jenkins: Just finally from me; is there a situation where you wouldn't agree to them because they weren't going far enough to reach that target? For example, if one specific council doesn't provide a realistic figure of expanding Welsh-medium education in that area, how, therefore, are you going to act on those that exist at the moment?

Alun Davies: That's exactly what I'm considering at the moment. When I've come to a conclusion, you will be

fydd y cyntaf i wybod.

the first to hear.

[247] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. I'm pleased to hear that. Dawn.

[248] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you, Chair. Minister, the self-evident fact, I guess, is that the earlier you expose children to the Welsh language the more likely that they will develop as fluent Welsh speakers later in life. That seems to be the research, and that seems to be the evidence that we've taken. So, I wanted to know a little bit more, really, about how you intend to prioritise early years provision in the short term within this strategy. I know that the draft strategy talks about making available 331 additional classes to deliver this, and Mudiad Meithrin are talking about the need for 650 classes to get us to where we need to be. So, just your views around that, really—the prioritisation in the strategy of early learning and whether the strategy is ambitious enough at this stage.

[249] **Alun Davies:** I certainly agree with the analysis. I absolutely agree with the analysis. Certainly, Welsh-medium provision is an absolutely key and fundamental part of the development of the overall childcare offer that Carl Sargeant is leading on. We do need to have in place sufficient provision to reach our targets. We don't have, at the moment—I completely accept that. I hope that the strategy we put in place will contain the targets that you've described.

[250] Now, how will we do that? I think we need to ensure that the provision is available across Wales. It will be more difficult in Merthyr than in Bangor, and how do we do that? That is the question that we're going to have to answer in the coming years. The ambition is there. What I hope we'll be able to do is to ensure, both through the childcare offer and the delivery of Welsh in the foundation phase, that children will have those opportunities to learn and to become familiar with the language. Then, if they wish to develop that familiarity in later years, they'll have the grounding and the opportunity to do so. I think you're absolutely right in what you say about the importance of that early grounding, if you like, in the early years that can then act as a foundation for the future.

[251] **Dawn Bowden:** But can I just ask: is that an early priority within the strategy to start addressing that?

[252] **Alun Davies:** Yes, it is. It is a priority. Myself, Carl, Kirsty and Julie James have met on a pretty regular basis, developing the childcare offer. Carl, as you know, is leading on that. The focus is on how we deliver it. Carl has announced some pilot projects across Wales, which will look at how we do that. We will learn from those pilots, and we will learn how we deliver the childcare offer, both in terms of the overall structure of the early years offer and then how we ensure that the choice of language is a part of that. We and I accept completely the challenge that you outline. The challenge is there. It's an essential part of it, and we need to get it right.

[253] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay, thank you.

[254] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae Jeremy **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy wants to ask a eisiau gofyn cwestiwn. question.

[255] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest ar sail **Jeremy Miles:** Just on the basis of ffigurau'r Mudiad Meithrin—roedden Mudiad Meithrin's figures—they were nhw'n sôn am ryw 650 o gylchoedd newydd y byddai angen eu sefydlu er *cylchoedd* that would need to be mwyn cyrraedd y nod o ddarparu established to achieve the aim of addysg blynyddoedd cynnar ar gyfer providing early years education and dosbarthiadau Cymraeg eu hiaith. Fe Welsh-medium classes. They wnaethon nhw awgrymu costau suggested the cost of establishing sefydlu hynny i ni hefyd. Roedd e'n those too, which was about £40,000 ryw £40,000 y flwyddyn i redeg un a year to run one *cylch*, which works out to be about £26 million a year for cylch, sydd yn gweithio mas yn ryw 650 *cylchoedd*. They are great £26 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer 650 o figures, whatever the funding sources are. Are those figures what you'd ffynonellau ariannu. A ydy'r rhifau expect? hynny yn eich taro chi fel rhifau y byddech chi'n eu disgwyl?

[256] **Alun Davies:** Do you want to answer?

[257] **Ms Webb:** Maen nhw'n **Ms Webb:** The numbers are ambitious niferoedd uchelgeisiol ac rydym yn and we do have ongoing discussions cael trafodaethau parhaus. Ond eto, on this. But again, if we are to os ydym yn mynd i ehangu yr arlwy enhance provision on the Mudiad ar lefel Mudiad Meithrin, bydd yn Meithrin level, we have to develop the rhaid datblygu'r gweithlu hefyd. Beth workforce, too. What's very

sydd yn andros o ddiddorol o ran gweithlu ar y lefel yna ydy ei fod yn denu lot o'r rhai sydd yn ddihyder eu hiaith—y rhai sydd eisiau dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, achos bod yr ieithwedd yn cael ei defnyddio efo plant yn syml. Felly, mae o'n le da iawn i feithrin athrawesau cynorthwyol ar gyfer y gweithlu yn yr ysgol a dod â'r gymuned ynghyd. Felly, mae yna waith mapio pellach i'w wneud efo'r mudiad, ond rydym wedi dechrau'r trafodaethau yna.

interesting about the workforce at that level is that it attracts a number of people who lack confidence in their language skills—people who do want to teach through the medium of Welsh, because the Welsh used with children is at quite a basic level. So, it's a very good starting point for those who want to move on to become teaching assistants in schools. So, there's some further mapping work that needs to be done with Mudiad Meithrin, but we have started those discussions with them.

[258] **Jeremy Miles:** O ran clustnodi adnoddau ac ati, a fyddech chi'n ei weld, beth bynnag yw'r ffigwr ar ben draw'r drafodaeth, fel arian newydd, neu beth bynnag yw'r ffynonellau, neu arian a fyddai'n cymryd lle y ddarpariaeth bresennol?

Jeremy Miles: In terms of earmarking resources and so forth, would you see it, whatever the figure at the end of the discussion, as new funding, or whatever the sources would be, or would it be funding that replaces the current provision?

[259] **Alun Davies:** Rydym ni'n cael y trafodaethau ar hyn o bryd ar y rhain.

Alun Davies: We are having those discussions at that moment.

[260] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt, diolch. Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen nawr at ddarparu adnoddau dysgu ac mae Dai yn mynd i ofyn am hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Great, thank you. We will move on now to the provision of learning resources and Dai is going to ask questions on this topic.

[261] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Yn rhannol, rydych chi wedi ateb hwn yn eich atebion cynhwysfawr sydd wedi dod gerbron, Weinidog, ond yn y bôn, wrth gwrs, os ydym ni'n mynd i ddatblygu'r agenda yma, mae yna oblygiadau ynglŷn ag ariannu deunyddiau—llyfrau, gwahanol ddefnyddiau addysgiadol ac ati. A oes yna ryw fath o gynllun ar y gweill,

Dai Lloyd: Thank you, Chair. You've partly answered this in your comprehensive answers, Minister, but, essentially, if we're going to develop this agenda, there are implications in terms of funding materials—books, different educational materials et cetera. Is there some sort of scheme in place or something to promote that?

neu rywbeth i hyrwyddo hynny? Achos nid yw'n fater jest o gael yr athrawon ac ati, ond mae'n fater o gael deunydd yn yr iaith Gymraeg i fynd efo hynny.

[262] **Alun Davies:** Oes, ac mae Kirsty Williams wedi gwneud datganiad, rwy'n credu. Fe ddywedodd hi yn y Cynulliad ar 30 Tachwedd ei bod hi'n cynnal rhyw fath o *summit* gyda darparwyr yn eu cyfanrwydd i edrych ar sut rydym ni'n gallu gwella'r sefyllfa bresennol i sicrhau bod yna adnoddau addysgol Cymraeg ar gael, ac ar gael ar yr adeg a'r amser y mae eu hangen.

[263] **Dai Lloyd:** Ac yn dilyn o hynny—diolch am yr ateb hwnnw—wrth gwrs, yng nghyd-testun hyn oll, ac fel rydych chi wedi cyfeirio eisoes, mae defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg fel pont, yn lle rhyw fath o wahanfur. Mae yna agenda y mae ei angen i gyflwyno Cymreictod—yn absenoldeb yr iaith, efallai—fel pwnc i bobl sydd yn gwybod y nesaf peth i ddim am Gymru. Ac, wrth gwrs, mae yna adnoddau ynghlwm â hynny hefyd—hynny yw, pan mae pobl yn symud i mewn i fyw i Gymru a ddim yn gwybod dim byd am Gymru, heb sôn am yr iaith Gymraeg. A oes yna ryw feddwl yn rhywle bod angen pontio fel yna hefyd, ac, wrth gwrs, yr adnoddau sy'n mynd yn y cyd-destun yna, fel ei bod, yn nes ymlaen, yn mynd yn haws i bobl ymgyfarwyddo efo'r iaith Gymraeg, achos mae o fewn y cyd-destun Cymreictod yma y

Because it's not just a matter of having the teachers and so forth, but it's a matter of having materials through the medium of Welsh to accompany that.

Alun Davies: Yes, and Kirsty Williams made a statement in the Assembly on 30 November, I believe. She said that she was to hold some kind of a summit with providers in order to see how we can make improvements to the current situation to ensure that Welsh-medium education resources are available and at the appropriate time.

Dai Lloyd: And following on from that—thank you for that response—of course, in the context of all of this, and as you referred to previously, there's using the Welsh language as a bridge, rather than some sort of barrier. There is an agenda that needs to introduce Welshness—in the absence of the language, perhaps—as a subject for people who don't know anything or next to nothing about Wales. And, of course, there are resources involved in that, with people moving into Wales and who don't know anything about Wales, let alone the Welsh language. Is there some sort of thinking somewhere about the need to bridge there, and, of course, there are the resources that are needed in that context, because, later on, it would become easier for people to become familiar with the Welsh language, because it's

maen nhw nawr yn gwybod amdano fe? Maen nhw'n disgwyl cyfarfod efo'r iaith Gymraeg ac yn debyg o fod yn llai gelyniaethus tuag ati.

in this context of Welshness that they are now aware of it? They expect to come in contact with the Welsh language and they are more likely to be less hostile towards it.

[264] **Alun Davies:** Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith y mae Cyngor Gwynedd wedi bod yn ei wneud gyda'r siarter iaith, sydd wedi bod yn gwneud yr union un fath o rôl—sydd wedi bod yn chwarae'r rôl yna—gyda phobl sy'n symud i Wynedd i fyw, ac yn cyflwyno dim jest yr iaith ei hun, yr iaith dechnegol—sut i siarad Cymraeg—ond hefyd y diwylliant y mae'r iaith yn rhan ohono fe. Ac rwyf i wedi gweld ei bod wedi bod yn hynod lwyddiannus ac yn helpu pobl i deimlo'n gartrefol yn eu cartref newydd. Mae'n cael ei gyflwyno fel ffordd o groesawu pobl i fyw yn y gymuned, ac yn helpu pobl i deimlo'n gyfforddus yn y gymuned, ac yn darparu ffordd o ddysgu beth yw'r diwylliant Cymraeg ac yn helpu pobl i deimlo'n rhan ohono fe. Felly, rwyf wedi'i gweld hi fel proses hynod o bositif, ac mae wedi bod yn broject sydd wedi cael ei groesawu gan groestoriad o bobl, a hefyd lle mae pobl wedyn yn teimlo eu bod nhw'n gallu dysgu Cymraeg, os dyna yw eu dewis nhw, ond o leiaf ddeall pam mae'r Gymraeg yn bwysig a hefyd y diwylliant Cymreig ehangach.

Alun Davies: You may be aware of the work that Gwynedd Council has been undertaking with their language charter, which has been carrying out exactly that role with the people moving to Gwynedd to live. It introduces not only the language itself in terms of how to speak Welsh, but also introduces them to the culture within which the language exists. I think that's been a success, and it's helped people to settle in their new homes. It's a way of welcoming people into communities, and helps them to settle and feel comfortable in those communities, and provides a means for people to learn about Welsh culture, and helps people feel part of that culture. And I have seen it as a very positive process, and a project that has been welcomed by a cross-section of the population, and also where people do feel that that they can learn the Welsh language, if that's their choice, but at least understand why the Welsh language is important and why the broader Welsh culture is important, too.

[265] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch, Dai. Rydym ni'n symud ymlaen at gategoreiddio'r ysgolion nawr. Mae gan Lee gwestiynau ar hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you, Dai. We'll move on to school categorisation and Lee has some questions on that.

[266] **Lee Waters:** Thank you, Chair. Could you just give us some sense of, by 2050, what you envisage the mix might be of the different types of schools across Wales, and in what kind of proportions?

[267] **Alun Davies:** In terms of linguistic categorisation—this is something I am considering at the moment and want to give further consideration to. There is a broad debate, sometimes conducted in different ways, about the categorisation of schools. And I understand absolutely, completely, that this is something that is close to the hearts of many people and communities, and it is something that we need to take great care about understanding, and it's something we need to take great care in the way in which we deal with it.

[268] It is my intention to give this more consideration over the coming weeks and months, and it is my intention to look at how categorisation works, and what happens at the end of that school experience for those children who've been through that school. It is my expectation that children, or young people reaching the age of 16 should be either bilingual—being able to speak both English and Welsh—or at least have a good grounding of Welsh, depending on where or, perhaps, what school they've been to. It is also my understanding that that is not always the case. I think we need to have a point of reflection and consideration as to what works and what doesn't work, what is effective and what isn't effective, and how we move forward on that agenda. That is a matter that I will be considering over the coming year.

11:45

[269] **Lee Waters:** I'm pleased to hear that. Thank you, Minister. You mentioned earlier about the need to bring communities with us and the sensitivities around this. As we've been speaking here this morning, Carmarthenshire County Council have been meeting to discuss the case of Llangennech school. I wouldn't expect you to talk about the school, in particular, because there's a process going on, but it's a very good case study of how divisions can develop between communities and people within a school who have a certain set of aspirations, but those aspirations not always being in tune with all of the parents, and certainly with the broader community, and a feeling that the process is being driven by targets from outside the area—and specifically, in this case, in the WESPs. So, I think it does raise a number of issues about how we take schools on this journey. I just wonder if you have any reflections about how we can make sure there

isn't a disconnect between the target in the WESP and the local community feeling.

[270] **Alun Davies:** Yes, I would hope—. I think I said in answer to Neil Hamilton that I wouldn't expect the WESP for one area to be exactly the same as a WESP for another area. I would expect it to represent and reflect the area that it's seeking to describe. You're absolutely right in your assumption—I make no comment. Nothing I should say this morning should be read in any way as a comment about any individual school or decision-making process from any single local authority, and I say that quite clearly.

[271] Let me say this also: my experience of living in this country is that there is a great font of goodwill towards the language, and that there is a great font of goodwill towards ensuring that children growing up in Wales today have the ability to have at least a working knowledge of Welsh. That will mean different things in different places and for different people. I hope that we will be able to reflect, over the coming weeks and months of this year, on how we achieve that. The linguistic character of any school is a matter for considerable discussion and debate in that community, and the linguistic character of a school will sometimes reflect the aspirations of the wider community.

[272] I hope that we will be able to move away from some of the negative debates that we've had in the past, and I hope that we will be able to move towards a debate about how we are able to encourage and enable children from all parts of the community, in all sorts of different parts of Wales, to acquire both a working knowledge of Welsh, to have an education through the medium of Welsh, or to leave school as speaking Welsh. Let us see how we achieve that. That means asking some very challenging questions—some very, very challenging questions—because we have a system at the moment that we believe works in different places. But does it work? Does a bilingual school deliver bilingual people? Ask the question. And if not, why not? What is happening in that school if it is not delivering that agenda for their school career—bilingual citizens? Why isn't it doing it? What is going wrong? So, let's have that discussion. Let's have that debate. Let's have that debate without rancour. Let's have that debate without some of the negativity we've seen in some places, and let's have that debate about the future and what we want for our children. I hope that we'll be able to have that conversation. Lee knows that I want time to reflect on this. I think a period of reflection is more important than a knee-jerk reaction.

[273] **Lee Waters:** Okay, thank you.

[274] **Bethan Jenkins:** Can you just tell us, though—you say that you'd need different approaches in different areas: would you say that you'd need to perhaps take a firmer, or perhaps a tougher stance in some areas where perhaps the levels are lower in those areas that are not seeing the Welsh language as a priority, whereas, as you said earlier, the logic would be, with higher education and the regulations, some institutions are already working hard to deliver that. So, you would see now that there are some local authorities that are already performing well in relation to the numbers of Welsh schools and people going through the system, but then there are others that are lagging far, far behind. What type of approach, then, will be necessary to get that up to scratch for the 1 million to be achieved?

[275] **Alun Davies:** A type of approach that works and not a type of approach that simply means a Minister banging a desk in Cardiff bay. And a type of approach that means that we work with people to reflect the ambitions and visions of the local community and that reflects the difference in experience of the Welsh language in different parts of Wales. The experience of a speaker in using Welsh in some of the places that Neil represents on the Llŷn peninsula will be very, very different to my experience in Blaenau Gwent, which will be different to Hannah's experience in Delyn, and we need to understand and appreciate that. I don't think a one-size-fits-all approach works.

[276] I want to see policies in terms of delivering and supporting both Welsh-language education and the wider use of Welsh in the community that reflect the needs of that community. Jeremy will remember the opening of Tŷ'r Gwrhyd in Pontardawe some months ago—

[277] **Jeremy Miles:** It was great.

[278] **Alun Davies:** Yes. I follow it on Twitter. It's been a great success in ensuring—. You, yourself, Bethan, live not far from there; you will understand and appreciate how a community resource like that can help increase the visibility and use of Welsh in that community. So, let's look at what works in different places and build on that. What I don't want to do is to become involved in a very negative, difficult argument, and I don't think that's what anybody wants any Minister to be doing at the moment.

[279] **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy just had something on this.

[280] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, just on this very specific issue. I agree that, whatever you're doing needs to reflect the needs of that particular population, but one of the criticisms that we've had as an Assembly in the past, and I'm sure Government has had, of Welsh in education strategic plans in particular but not exclusively, is that, if they're not promoting and raising awareness and growing demand, it's actually quite difficult to establish what the needs of that community actually are, as opposed to what they are at a given time. So, what I didn't quite get from you in your answer to Bethan is quite how ambitious you expect all authorities to be.

[281] **Alun Davies:** I expect ambition and we need ambition. But what I'm trying to do is tread this very fine line, if you like, where we say, 'Yes, we want to be ambitious; yes we want to see the Welsh language as a living part of our different communities', but recognise that that's going to be different in different places, it's going to be different in different communities, and reflect upon what the ambitions for all those different communities are. And then, the process—and this is really, really important, Suzy—is not simply to establish targets, arbitrary targets, for this year, for next year—

[282] **Suzy Davies:** I accept that.

[283] **Alun Davies:**—for different parts of Wales, whether it's Swansea, or whether it's Blaenau Gwent, or whether it's Pembrokeshire or wherever. Let's look at what is possible and what is achievable in individual areas and then work with people. And this is a key message I want to get across this morning—I'm not convinced that the WESPs, as they currently exist, are the most effective tool that we have available to us. We certainly need to review them, we need to look at them and we may need a different statutory framework for them. I accept that. Let's have that discussion; let's have that debate.

[284] However, where we are today—and this is why I was so shy in not answering Neil's earlier question—I am considering, at the moment, the WESPs that we have in front of us. I have not completed my consideration of those WESPs yet. When I have completed my consideration, I will make a statement on that—I will make a statement here in the National Assembly first and foremost.

[285] **Bethan Jenkins:** That's separate to the White Paper.

[286] **Alun Davies:** Yes.

[287] **Suzy Davies:** I was being a bit more general about local authorities' general duty towards the Welsh language.

[288] **Alun Davies:** I know, I know. So, we'll take that decision and we'll move forward and we'll do that with consensus and we'll do it in collaboration. Local authorities have an absolutely key role to play. We're aware of the report on the Welsh language in public service delivery that was commissioned by Leighton Andrews last year, but now is being led by Mark Drakeford this year, and Mark has already made one statement to the National Assembly on that and we will look at how we can continue to build on the wider delivery of Welsh-language services with local government, working together to do that.

[289] Again, the same principle applies: what you will deliver in Aberystwyth will be different to what you deliver in Abertillery.

[290] **Suzy Davies:** There may be some other questions on promotion. So, sorry if I've cut across.

[291] **Alun Davies:** But I'm talking about public service delivery as well.

[292] **Suzy Davies:** Ah, right. Lovely, thank you.

[293] **Bethan Jenkins:** Hannah.

[294] **Hannah Blythyn:** We've touched on the need for additional teachers to teach through the Welsh medium if we're going to meet the ambition of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. I think we know that the recruitment and retention of teachers is an issue, specifically more in certain parts of Wales as well. So can you share with the committee how you are liaising with the Cabinet Secretary to address those issues?

[295] **Alun Davies:** Kirsty's made some statements on initial teacher training and teacher education. The challenges you outline are absolutely—I have no question about them; you're absolutely right. What we're seeking to do is to ensure that we are able to have the workforce development mechanisms in place that will achieve our targets. And I think Kirsty Williams has been very clear that we do have some very significant challenges to face at the moment, and she is leading work on that. How do I work alongside her? Let

me say this absolutely clearly: myself and Kirsty work very closely together on all aspects of the education portfolio. She's, I think, leading a process of change in a radical way. I think the tone she's adopted since appointment has been fantastic in the approach that she's taken. And I and she work closely together to ensure that across the whole portfolio we are able to take all of these matters into consideration.

[296] **Hannah Blythyn:** Shifting slightly from that, I think my colleague Dawn alluded to it to her in a question on the importance of that, actually, we know the earlier a child learns Welsh, the better it is. I think, from the evidence we've taken, the retention—more the retention rather than the recruitment in the early years sector—is a specific issue as well, because it's non-statutory and the people that maybe come into early years then go off and train and upskill to become teachers, because there's a difference in pay scales and so on. Have you looked into matters specifically relating to early years in terms of recruitment and retention?

[297] **Alun Davies:** I think Bethan referred earlier to the way in which the early years delivery is being developed. And, certainly, there are some very real challenges there, and one of the things that I'm very anxious to do is look at, for example, how *coleg Cymraeg*, the success of that in higher education, can be extended or replicated in further education. How can we deliver some of the childcare qualifications, for example, through the medium of Welsh in further education? I wanted to see how we do that and the task and finish group at the moment is looking at some of those options and will report in the summer. But when we're taking forward the overall childcare offer we will need a mix of skills, and a mix of skills in both languages, in order to deliver that childcare offer comprehensively and consistently across the whole country. The language is a part of that; it's in the mix to ensure that we are able to deliver bilingually. But the challenges you outline, Hannah, are absolutely clear and understood, and I accept your analysis and the way in which you've outlined that, and those are exactly the sort of issues that we're going to be looking toward dealing with.

[298] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee, did you have something on that?

[299] **Lee Waters:** Yes. Can I just follow on to ask specifically around the learning support staff? They make up 45 per cent of the whole workforce and we've heard in evidence that the whole workforce needs to be considered, not just the teachers. But very little is known, at the minute, about the level of proficiency in Welsh of learning support staff, and anecdotally it's

expected to be fairly low. So, clearly, developing support staff and their ability to improve their language skills is key. What are your thoughts and plans about addressing this?

[300] **Alun Davies:** We're expecting the EWC to deliver their analysis of that in March, and my current view is that we should wait for that and reflect on those reports when we have them. Certainly, the data that you're looking for, the Education Workforce Council should be able to deliver that in March. When we understand those data, when we're able to analyse those data, then we need to work on the basis of establishing our policy response on the basis of that knowledge. So, my current intention is to wait until March, receive the report, reflect upon it and move forward from there.

12:00

[301] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. Suzy has gan Suzy gwestiynau ynglŷn â questions on promotion. hyrwyddo.

[302] **Suzy Davies:** Yes. [*Inaudible.*]—because I wasn't sure if someone else was asking these, but I did want to come back to promotion. You started to mention your view on how public services, more generally, might be able to, shall we say, ramp up their obligations, if you like, to promote the Welsh language, but you indicated you may not be able to tell us very much at this stage. I don't know if there is anything more you can tell us.

[303] If not, that's fine. I've got other questions. [*Laughter.*]

[304] **Alun Davies:** Let me think what I can say. In terms of where we are at the moment, Mark Drakeford's working on the Welsh in public services report and taking that forward. Rhodri Glyn Thomas produced the report, I think it was probably in spring last year, and we need to take that forward and Mark Drakeford is leading on that. In terms of wider issues of promotion, I think it's fair to reflect that, since we had the current statutory framework in place, promotion has not had the place that it should have. As a consequence of that, we have focused on regulation and not promotion. My feeling is that emphasis is in the wrong place, that we should place an emphasis on promotion rather than regulation. One of the reasons why I'm anxious to look at and review the statutory framework we have for Welsh is to ensure that we have a means and mechanism in place to promote Welsh, and not simply to regulate problems with the delivery of the standards and the rest of

it. So, I think we need to take an approach that is more holistic, and we need an approach that places a different emphasis in different places at the moment. You will be aware that the Government has an agreement with Plaid Cymru in terms of the budgets. Part of that agreement was to create an agency to do some of these things. I am continuing my conversations with Plaid Cymru at the moment, and I would hope and expect to be in a position to make an announcement on that in the coming weeks.

[305] **Suzy Davies:** You may want to talk to other parties as well, because that was in other manifestos. Could I ask you a slightly more difficult question, which is how far the reach of Government can go on this? Obviously, I can see the public sector, but a question I've raised with you before, which relates to Welsh and the economy, and the benefits of Welsh to business, that's more difficult for you to get into, through either regulation or legislation, I'd have thought. Have you given any more consideration—again, I appreciate it's early days—about how you can really get buy-in from the Welsh business community to do a lot of this work for you?

[306] **Alun Davies:** Yes. I think you asked this question in the Chamber before Christmas—

[307] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, I did.

[308] **Alun Davies:** —and it's an excellent question. I hope that—. I don't buy the characterisation that compulsion delivers great bilingualism. I think bilingualism at its best is delivered by people who are committed to it, and who want to see bilingualism work and reflect the needs and ambitions of the community. So, I would hope that businesses of any size, description, and all the rest of it, would want to reflect their communities and would want to see the Welsh language as a part of their overall proposition and a part of their overall branding. All of us who will travel regularly will understand that different international businesses will operate in different languages in different territories and different places. I would hope and expect that the bilingualism that we would like to see in Wales would be reflected throughout the whole of the community and including businesses, and it's happening at the moment. I don't buy the characterisation of business as being antagonistic towards any of this. You see businesses operating bilingually, and you see businesses who are doing great things to deliver bilingualism, and I celebrate that, I encourage that. I hope that, as we normalise, if you like, the use of the Welsh language in other parts of the society and the community, business itself will feel able to be a part of that.

It is not my intention to simply use compulsion at every opportunity. It is my preference to use persuasion, and my preference is always—. As a Welsh speaker, I know that the bilingual policies that work easiest for me are bilingual policies that are delivered by people who care and are doing it because they think it's the right to do, because it's part of their business model, it's part of who they are, rather than somebody who's just compelled to put up a bilingual sign.

[309] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, well, I'd agree with you on that one. Can I just test that a little bit further, because I'm still—? I don't disagree with what you're saying there, that this is a big persuasion case rather than, 'Let's go and throw a load of standards at the private sector', but, at some point, the responsibility lies with someone to make things happen, and I'm just trying to get a sense of how far you think that is a role for Government, really.

[310] **Alun Davies:** It's an interesting question, isn't it?

[311] **Suzy Davies:** I don't want to pin you down specifically. I don't want to tie your hands, shall we say, for the future. But, you know, how closed is the door? How open is the door? You cited some businesses that are buying into this now, but they're not in the majority yet. That's certainly my experience in my own region.

[312] **Alun Davies:** Do you know, Government can do great things, and Government can do all sorts of things, but there isn't a Government in the world that can persuade me to speak Welsh to my six-year-old when I'm trying to get him to sleep at night?

[313] **Suzy Davies:** Yes, exactly.

[314] **Alun Davies:** At the end of the day, the change that we are trying to create in Wales is a change that is an organic change and is a change that is part of our communities and is a part of who we are as people. You know, I don't want Government, and I wouldn't want the language, to be seen as a tool of regulation where we always go for the stick and never the carrot. My inclination is always that we should cajole, sometimes persuade, encourage, enable—'enable' is the most powerful, of course; 'enable' is always the most powerful—help people. You know, the role of Government could well be, for example, to help a small business owner to produce bilingual signs, signage and the rest of it; it could be to provide a larger business with support in delivering what would be a bilingual proposition to potential customers. And

so, I think the role of Government will be a different role in different places with different businesses and different sized institutions, but I think the role of Government should first and foremost be a positive role and not simply as a regulator.

[315] **Suzy Davies:** Okay, well, all I seek is reassurance that you're not just waiting for, let's say, 15 years down the line of this strategy, when there's more bilingual capacity, hopefully, in the population at large, to create demand—'organically' was the word you used, I think. I just wondered if there is a bit more to it than that, and I think you said there will be, so, thank you; I don't want to take much more time. No, thank you.

[316] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jest cwestiwn olaf gen i, cyn inni orffen. A ydych chi'n hyderus bod yr arian sydd gyda chi fel Gweinidog o ran delifro strategaeth yn mynd i allu bod yn llwyddiannus i gyrraedd yr amcan o 1 miliwn o siaradwyr yma? Mae'n mynd i gymryd lot mwy na dim ond y sector addysg ac ariannu'r sector addysg yn gynhwysfawr er mwyn gweddnewid yr hyn yr ych chi eisiau ei wneud fel Llywodraeth. So, a ydy hynny'n ddigonol, a pha drafodaethau ydych chi wedi eu cael â Gweinidogion eraill, felly, pan fo yna bethau fel y cyfnod cynnar a mwy o gyfleoedd yn hynny o beth? A ydych chi wedi pennu cyllideb ar gyfer faint o arian yn rhan o'r cynllun hwnnw a fydd angen iddo fynd tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg, er enghraifft?

Bethan Jenkins: Just a final question from me, before we finish. Are you confident that the money you have as a Minister in terms of delivering the strategy is going to be successful in achieving the target of 1 million Welsh speakers? It's going to take a lot more than just the education sector and funding the education sector comprehensively in order to transform what you want to do as a Government. So, is that sufficient, and what discussions have you had with other Ministers, therefore, when there are things such as the early years and more opportunities in that regard? Have you set a budget for the amount of money that, as part of that scheme, will need to go towards the Welsh language for example?

[317] **Alun Davies:** Rwy'n fodlon ar y sefyllfa bresennol, ac rŷm ni'n cynnal trafodaethau yn wythnosol ac yn fisol â'r Gweinidogion eraill i drafod y sefyllfa ariannol a chyllidebau'r dyfodol, ac rŷm ni'n cynnal trafodaethau o wythnos i wythnos ar

Alun Davies: I am content with the current situation, and we have weekly and monthly discussions with other Ministers to discuss the financial situation and future budgets, and we have discussions on a weekly basis on this issue, and I'm confident that

y materion yma, ac rwy'n hyderus bod gennym ni'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen arnom ni. Wedi dweud hynny, wrth gwrs, buasai pob un Gweinidog yn dod gerbron pwyllgor yn gofyn am fwy o adnoddau; mae hynny'n beth cwbl naturiol i'w wneud.

[318] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, a diolch am ddod gerbron y pwyllgor yma heddiw. Rŷm ni'n edrych ymlaen at weld eich strategaeth chi ac, wrth gwrs, mae'n siŵr, pan fyddwn ni'n adrodd ar ein hymchwiliad, y bydd cyfle i chi ymateb yn y drefn arferol. Ond diolch yn fawr iawn i chi heddiw.

[319] **Alun Davies:** A gaf i ddweud fy mod i'n ddiolchgar iawn i'r pwyllgor am y gwaith mae wedi ei wneud? Rwy'n croesawu, ac mi fuaswn i'n croesawu, cyfraniad y pwyllgor i'r gwaith o lunio'r strategaeth. Rwyf i hefyd yn datgan y ffaith liciwn i ddod yn ôl efallai i'r pwyllgor, pan fyddwn ni wedi cyhoeddi'r strategaeth, a thrafod ein gobeithion ar gyfer y strategaeth a pham rŷm ni wedi dewis y ffordd yr ŷm ni wedi'i dewis i symud ymlaen.

[320] **Bethan Jenkins:** Yn sicr, bydd cyfle inni edrych ar hyn yn y dyfodol, ac mae'n sicr y bydd yna sesiynau eraill ar y mater yma yn benodol. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

[321] **Alun Davies:** Diolch i chi.

we have the necessary resources. Having said that, of course, every Minister would always appear before a committee asking for further resources; that's quite natural.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you very much, and thank you for appearing before the committee today. We look forward to seeing the strategy and, I'm sure, when we report on this inquiry, there will be an opportunity for you to respond as per usual. Thank you very much.

Alun Davies: May I say that I am very grateful to the committee for the work that it has undertaken? I welcome, and would welcome, the committee's contribution to the work of drawing up the strategy. I would also say that I'd like to return to the committee once we've published the strategy in order to discuss our hopes and aspirations for that strategy and why we have chosen the approach that we have chosen to take it forward.

Bethan Jenkins: Yes, there'll certainly be an opportunity for us to look at this in future, and there will be further sessions on this specific issue. Thank you very much.

Alun Davies: Thank you.

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public

Cynnig:

Motion:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd ar gyfer eitem 6 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(vi).

that the committee resolves to exclude the public from item 6 in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(vi).

Cynigiwyd y cynnig.

Motion moved.

[322] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 5, nawr. Mae cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod. A yw pawb yn hapus gyda hynny? Diolch yn fawr.

Bethan Jenkins: Item 5 is a motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the rest of the meeting. Is everyone content? Thank you very much.

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion agreed.

Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:10.

The public part of the meeting ended at 12:10.