



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

# Cofnod y Trafodion The Record of Proceedings

[Y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu](#)

[The Culture, Welsh Language and  
Communications Committee](#)

24/11/2016

[Agenda'r Cyfarfod](#)

[Meeting Agenda](#)

[Trawsgrifiadau'r Pwyllgor](#)

[Committee Transcripts](#)

## Cynnwys Contents

- 5 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau  
Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest
- 5 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 1
- 36 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 2  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 2
- 66 Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 3  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 3
- 114 Papurau i'w Nodi  
Papers to Note
- 115 Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd  
o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitem 7  
Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public  
from the Remainder of the Meeting for Item 7

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd. Lle y mae cyfranwyr wedi darparu cywiriadau i'w tystiolaeth, nodir y rheini yn y trawsgrifiad.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included. Where contributors have supplied corrections to their evidence, these are noted in the transcript.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

|   |  |
|---|--|
| Hannah Blythyn<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a> | Llafur<br>Labour   |
| Dawn Bowden<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>    | Llafur<br>Labour   |
| Suzy Davies<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>    | Ceidwadwyr Cymreig<br>Welsh Conservatives                                  |
| Neil Hamilton<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>  | UKIP Cymru<br>UKIP Wales   |
| Bethan Jenkins<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a> | Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor)<br>The Party of Wales (Committee Chair) |
| Dai Lloyd<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>      | Plaid Cymru<br>The Party of Wales  |
| Jeremy Miles<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>   | Llafur<br>Labour   |
| Lee Waters<br><a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a>   <a href="#">Biography</a>     | Llafur<br>Labour   |

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| Dr Gwenllïan<br>Lansdown Davies | Prif Weithredwr y Mudiad Meithrin<br>Chief Executive, Mudiad Meithrin                       |
| Iestyn Davies                   | Prif Weithredwr Colegau Cymru<br>Chief Executive, Colegau Cymru                             |
| Elaine Edwards                  | Ysgrifennydd Cyffredinol, UCAC<br>General Secretary, UCAC                                   |
| Dr Ioan Matthews                | Prif Weithredwr y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol<br>Chief Executive, Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol |

|                           |  |
|---------------------------|--|
| Dr Rhodri Llwyd<br>Morgan | Cadeirydd y Mudiad Meithrin<br>Chairperson, Mudiad Meithrin  |
| Rex Phillips              | Swyddog Cenedlaethol Cymru, NASUWT<br>National Official Wales, NASUWT  |
| Dr Gwennan Schiavone      | Ysgrifennydd y Cwmni ac Uwch Reolwr Academaidd<br>y Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol<br>Company Secretary and Senior Academic Manager,<br>Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol |
| Rob Williams              | Cyfarwyddwr Polisi, NAHT<br>Director of Policy, NAHT   |

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

|              |   |
|--------------|---|
| Osian Bowyer | Gwasanaeth Ymchwil<br>Research Service  |
| Steve George | Clerc<br>Clerk                          |
| Manon Huws   | Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol<br>Legal Adviser |
| Adam Vaughan | Dirprwy Clerc<br>Deputy Clerk           |

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:00.*

*The meeting began at 09:00.*

## **Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau, Dirprwyon a Datgan Buddiannau Introductions, Apologies, Substitutions and Declarations of Interest**

[1] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch a **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you and chroeso i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y welcome to the Culture, Welsh Gymraeg a Chyfathrebu. Os bydd Language and Communications larwm tân, dylai pawb adael yr Committee. If there is a fire alarm, ystafell drwy'r allanfeydd tân penodol please follow the exits and follow the a dilyn cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r directions of the ushers and staff, but staff, ond ni ddisgwylir prawf heddiw. we're not expecting a fire alarm test Dylai pawb droi eu ffonau symudol i today. Please put your mobiles on fod yn dawel. silent.

[2] The National Assembly does operate bilingually, and headphones are available to hear simultaneous translation and to adjust the audio, for people who are hard of hearing. The simultaneous translation is on channel 1 for you and amplification is on 0.

[3] Plîs peidiwch â chyffwrdd â'r Please do not touch the buttons on botymau ar y meicroffonau oherwydd the microphones, as that could affect gall hynny amharu ar y system, a the system and please make sure gofaluwch fod y golau coch ymlaen that the red light is on before you cyn dechrau siarad. A oes unrhyw begin to speak. Are there any ddatganiadau o fuddiannau gan declarations of interest from Aelodau'r Cynulliad yma heddiw? Na. Members today? No, and no Nid oes ymddiheuriadau, ond rydw apologies either, but I do know that i'n gwybod bod Suzy Davies wedi Suzy Davies has said she is going to dweud ei bod hi'n mynd i fod yn hwyr be late today. yma heddiw.

09:01

**Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 1  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 1**

[4] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 2 ar yr agenda yw'r ymchwiliad i strategaeth iaith Gymraeg ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r sesiwn yma heddiw gydag undebau llafur, felly, diolch i Rex Phillips, swyddog cenedlaethol Cymru NASUWT—Cymdeithas Genedlaethol yr Ysgolfeistri ac Undeb yr Athrawesau; Rob Williams, cyfarwyddwr polisi NAHT—Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon; ac Elaine Edwards, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol UCAC—Undeb Cenedlaethol Athrawon Cymru. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi oll am ddod heddiw.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Item 2 on the agenda is the inquiry into the Welsh Government's draft Welsh language strategy. This session today is with trade unions, so, thank you to Rex Phillips, the national official for Wales at the National Association of Schoolmasters Union of Women Teachers; Rob Williams, director of policy, National Association of Headteachers, and Elaine Edwards, general secretary of UCAC—Undeb Cenedlaethol Athrawon Cymru. Thank you all very much for coming today.

[5] Rydw i jest eisiau cychwyn, os yw hi'n iawn, trwy ofyn cwestiynau. Mae yna nifer o gwestiynau gwahanol gennym ni. O'ch asesiad chi fel undebau llafur o nod Llywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau 1 filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn 2050, a allwch chi ddweud wrthym ni a yw hynny'n realistig? A ydych chi'n credu ei bod hi'n gallu digwydd o fewn y cwrpawd mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i roi gerbron pobl Cymru, a sut ydych chi'n credu, fel gweithwyr addysg, y bydd yn bosib i chi geisio gweithio gyda'r Llywodraeth i wneud hyn yn realiti ar lawr gwlad? Felly, jest o ran eich barn benodol yn gyntaf, ac wedyn byddwn ni'n mynd i mewn i fwy o fanylder ymhen ychydig. Pwy sydd eisiau dechrau?

I'd like to begin, if I may, by asking the initial questions. We have many different questions for you. I'd like to know about your assessment as unions of the Welsh Government's aim to reach 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050. Do you think that's realistic? Do you think that it can happen within the timescale that has been set out by the Welsh Government before the people of Wales, and how do you think, as education professionals, it will be possible for you to work with the Government to make this a reality at the grass-roots level? So, I'd be delighted to hear your initial thoughts, and then we'll go into more detail later. Who'd like to start?

[6] Rex, I know I can rely on you. [*Laughter.*]

[7] **Mr Phillips:** I think the members of the committee have got the

response that we put into the draft strategy, so that outlines our position. No problem with the vision, but we think that there are issues related to that vision in terms of how it's going to be funded and how it's going to be achieved. We've also cited what we believe could be unintended consequences of it, because there is a very great reliance, we see, in this vision, on schools and on the education system. So, those would be our initial thoughts on it. The aim is laudable, right. We have said in here that if you're going to embark upon this process, then it needs to be considered to be an adventure, rather than a crusade, because if it's a crusade, you can look at it and say you are forcing people to do this, and I don't think that that would be a reasonable way forward on this.

[8] One of the other concerns I've got is about the reference to deliberate action in this, and, again, that needs to be spelt out—what is meant by that. I know there's reference to legislation in it, but deliberate action can be considered to be enforcement. So, it's that caution. But, overall, yes, it's achievable, if the will is there within people. It's creating, actually, the hunger to learn the language amongst the citizens of Wales. That's how you're going to measure the success of this and no other way, I think.

[9] **Bethan Jenkins:** Thanks, Rex. Rob Williams.

[10] **Mr Williams:** Firstly, I've got the lurgy today, so if I cough and splutter, please—so, stay away, yes. [*Laughter.*] I guess we're in a similar position to the one Rex has described. I guess one of the additions we would add to it is just the scale of educational policy change at the moment for schools to deal with. If you look at curriculum, assessment, ITE, and all those sorts of areas that schools are having to deal with and implement, the capacity of the workforce to do that and to deliver on top of—. So, in our response, we talked about an integrated way of working, looking at opportunities where we're not doing additional things on top of it. I think the message to schools of having something on top of what they're already dealing with may not be popular at the moment, and I think that's worth noting. But the vision, we have no problem with at all. I think there are opportunities for, maybe, some sort of cross-working and sharing of the expertise across education within the Welsh language that maybe haven't been taken up to this point as often as they could be. But that needs to be facilitated, and that does take some level of resource. I think there's a difference between a vision and your ability to deliver that vision, and that's the way maybe some of our members would feel at the moment.

[11] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pam oeddech chi wedi dweud yn benodol efallai nad yw'n boblogaidd ar hyn o bryd? Allech hi jest ehangu'n fras ar hynny?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Why did you say specifically that perhaps it wasn't popular at the moment? Could you just expand on that?

[12] **Mr Williams:** Could you just repeat the—?

[13] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pam oeddech chi wedi dweud yn benodol efallai y byddai'n amhoblogaidd ar hyn o bryd i wneud hyn? Fe wnaethoch chi ddweud hynny'n benodol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Why did you say specifically that perhaps it would be unpopular at the moment to do this? You said that specifically.

[14] **Mr Williams:** Not this in itself would be unpopular, but just an additional thing would be unpopular, because we are talking about the largest educational policy change in a generation plus. There's nervousness, if you like—excitement about things that are changing—about our ability to deliver that because of the sheer scale of it. I think that's why we would be saying it needs to be worked in with what's already being worked on, and not seen as an additional element.

[15] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê, diolch. Elaine.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Okay, thank you. Elaine

[16] **Ms Edwards:** Mae UCAC yn hollol gefnogol i'r weledigaeth, ac yn teimlo ei bod yn gyffrous ac yn uchelgeisiol. Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol iawn hefyd o'r heriau fydd o ran y gweithlu addysg, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth rŷm ni'n teimlo bod yn rhaid cynllunio ar ei gyfer er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n gallu datblygu'r gweithlu dros gyfnod. Bydd hi'n bwysig cael cerrig milltir tymor byr, canolig a hir, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyrraedd y nod yn y diwedd. Ond os nad ydym ni'n dechrau gweithredu mewn rhyw ffordd yn y tymor byr, fe wnawn ni ddim cyrraedd y nod erbyn diwedd cyfnod

**Ms Edwards:** UCAC are totally supportive of this vision and feel that it is exciting and ambitious. We are also very aware of the challenges that will exist in terms of the education workforce, and that is something that we feel needs planning in order to ensure that we can develop the workforce over a period. It will be important to have milestones in the short term, medium term and long term in order to ensure that we reach this target, ultimately. But if we don't start to take action in some way in the short term, we will not achieve the aim by the end of the strategy period.



y strategaeth, fel petai.

[17] Felly, byddwn i'n dweud bod y gefnogaeth yn amlwg a bod angen i ni edrych yn awr ar beth yw'r camau er mwyn sicrhau bod y gweithlu yn ei le. Nid yw'n mynd i ddigwydd dros nos, ond nid oes rheswm pam na allwn ni wneud newidiadau yn raddol ar y cychwyn. Nid ydym ni'n moyn ei adael e tan yn hwyrach ymlaen i weld newidiadau pwysig yn digwydd. Rwy'n cytuno ei bod hi'n amser heriol i'r gweithlu addysg, amser o lwyth gwaith gormodol, ac amser o newid pwysig iawn gydag agenda y cwricwlwm newydd. Ond mae'r cwricwlwm newydd hefyd yn dodi pwyslais—mae 10 argymhelliad yn ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg o fewn ysgolion. Mae hynny hefyd yn sôn am ddatblygu ysgolion o ran cyfrwng eu dysgu. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio bod angen prif-ffrydio'r Gymraeg ym mhob maes polisi addysg er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n gwireddu'r gofynion hyn.

So, I would say that the support is clear and that we need to look now at what steps are needed in order to ensure that the workforce is in place. It's not going to happen overnight, but there's no reason why we can't introduce changes gradually at the beginning. We don't want to leave it until later to see important changes happening. I agree that it's a challenging time for the education workforce, with excessive workloads, and a time of important change with the new curriculum agenda. But the new curriculum also places an emphasis, as there are 10 recommendations there relating to the Welsh language within schools. That also talk about developing schools in terms of the medium of education. It's important for us to remember that there's a need to mainstream the Welsh language in every education policy area in order to ensure that we achieve these aims.

[18] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am fod yn fyr yn eich atebion agoriadol. Rydw i'n credu bod gan Lee gwestiwn clou i gychwyn, ac wedyn byddwn ni'n symud ymlaen at recriwtio athrawon.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much for being succinct in those opening responses. I think Lee has a quick question to start, and then we will move on to recruiting teachers.

[19] **Lee Waters:** Diolch. I'd just like to ask Rex Phillips about the language he uses in his submission and he's just used now, about the emphasis on adventure rather than a crusade. Could you just tell us a little bit more about what's underpinning that?

[20] **Mr Phillips:** Well, I've tried to find a way to perhaps explain the

position of some of our members. I think there will be many of our members who will embrace this eagerly. There will be others who will be very, very apprehensive about this. One of the things that we've argued for in here is that what we don't want to see in terms of schools is this displacing those teachers who are unable to speak the Welsh language—those teachers who work in English medium or even bilingual schools. So, that was one of the unintended consequences that I spoke about beforehand. It's about taking people with you on this. A crusade is something that you will push through, rather than taking people with you along a journey. That's why I've used that phrase. I've tried to nuance it in a way that I thought perhaps captured the differences of opinion that exists amongst our members over the Welsh language. That difference is there, and we can't escape that difference.

[21] **Lee Waters:** 'Crusade' is quite a loaded phrase, isn't it? Do you think there is a danger of perception, a discomfort at the moment amongst your members?

[22] **Mr Phillips:** As I said earlier, yes, there is some discomfort about this. There was some discomfort when the concept of incidental Welsh was brought into the education system. There are some of our members that do not want to use the Welsh language. I can't escape that fact, but I wasn't putting that in there to be inflammatory in any way, shape or form. I thought that was very measured language, and it was soft language that I was putting in place.

[23] **Lee Waters:** But—

[24] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sori, mae Elaine Edwards eisiau jest dod i mewn yn fras, os yw hynny'n iawn. Sori, diolch.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Sorry, Elaine Edwards would like to come in there, if that's okay. Sorry, thank you.

[25] **Ms Edwards:** Rwy'n cytuno. Petaswn i'n dweud wrth rywun, 'Mae'n rhaid ichi wneud hwn nawr', pan nad oes gyda nhw'r sgiliau i wneud rhywbeth, mae e'n mynd i greu gofid a phryder. Ond, o'm darlleniad i o'r strategaeth, roedd y pwyslais ar ewyllys da, datblygu sgiliau'r bobl sy'n dymuno

**Ms Edwards:** I agree. If I were to tell someone, 'You have to do this now', when they don't have the skills to do so, that is going to cause a lot of anxiety and concern. But, from my reading of the strategy, I think the emphasis was on goodwill, developing the skills of the people who would like to use the language

defnyddio'r iaith ac, wrth gwrs, datblygu sgiliau'r gweithlu. Felly, nid oeddwn i'n gweld ei fod e o reidrwydd yn gorfod bod yn unrhyw beth bygythiol i unrhyw un os ydym ni'n gwneud hwn yn iawn. Ac os dodwn ni'r pwyslais ar gynllunio gweithlu'r dyfodol, ddylai hwnna ddim bod yn fygythiad i'r rheini sydd efallai yng nghanol eu gyrfa ac o bosibl ddim yn teimlo bod unrhyw beth gyda nhw i'w gynnig yn y maes yma.

[26] Ar hyn o bryd, o ran ffigurau ar gyfer athrawon cofrestredig Cymru, mae yna 35,516 o athrawon ysgol wedi'u cofrestru gyda Chyngor y Gweithlu Addysg, ac mae 33.3 y cant o'r rheini'n dweud eu bod nhw'n gallu siarad Cymraeg. Mae 27.4 y cant ohonyn nhw wedi nodi eu bod nhw'n gallu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae yna *gap* gyda ni man hyn rhwng bobl sydd yn dweud, 'Rwy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg', a phobl sydd yn dweud, 'Rwy'n gallu dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg'. Efallai, gyda bach o anogaeth, y byddai'r ganran yna o *gap* yn dweud, 'Wel, byddwn i'n awyddus i gyfrannu at newid ethos fy ysgol i, sy'n gyfrwng Saesneg, i'w gwneud ychydig yn fwy Cymreigaidd', neu i ddweud, 'Byddwn i'n hapus i wneud mwy o sgwrsio llafar cyfrwng Cymraeg neu gefnogi dysgwyr trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, er nad ydw i'n moyn addysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg'. Felly, mae yna bwl bach fan'na gyda ni yn barod o athrawon a fyddai, o bosibl, yn

and, of course, developing the skills of the workforce also. So, I didn't see that it necessarily has to be anything threatening for anyone if we do this properly. If we put the emphasis on future workforce planning, that should not be a threat to those who are perhaps in the middle of their careers and who maybe don't feel they have anything to offer in this area.

At the moment, in relation to the figures for registered teachers in Wales, there are 35,516 schoolteachers registered with the Education Workforce Council, and 33.3 per cent of those say that they can speak Welsh. Some 27.4 per cent of those have said that they can teach through the medium of Welsh. So, there's a gap there between people who say they can speak Welsh and people who say they can teach through the medium of Welsh. With a bit of encouragement, maybe that percentage, that gap, would say, 'Well, actually, yes, I would be keen to contribute to changing the ethos of my school, which is an English-medium school, to make it more Welsh in nature', or they might say, 'I would be happy to do more oral discussion in Welsh or support learners through the medium of Welsh, even though I don't want to teach in Welsh myself'. So, we already have a group of teachers there who would possibly be open to further

agored i hyfforddiant pellach, petai'n training, if it is funded and if they  
cael ei ariannu a phetaen nhw'n cael have the support they need, to have  
y gefnogaeth i gael yr amser sydd ei the time they need to improve those  
angen arnyn nhw i wella'r sgiliau skills or to gain the confidence they  
neu'r hyder sydd ei angen arnyn nhw. need.

[27] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very  
Mae Lee jest eisiau dod yn ôl ar much. Lee just wants to come back  
hynny. on that.

[28] **Lee Waters:** Thank you. I just want to continue the discussion with  
Rex, because I'm interested in what you say about the group of teachers who  
would be willing to upskill. I'm interested in understanding the anxieties of  
those who are resistant to upskilling. Rex Phillips mentioned the experience  
of incidental Welsh being introduced. So, I'm just wondering, looking back  
now and reflecting on how that went, you mentioned the anxiety of your  
members towards that. How did they cope with that, and do they still feel  
that anxiety?

[29] **Mr Phillips:** Well, I think some still feel the anxiety, no doubt about  
that, and I know the way that, in some schools, that was approached was not  
the correct way, because I know that some schools required staff to stay  
behind to do in-service training on that, and that was a requirement, and I  
don't think that that was the right approach, either. I also know that, at the  
moment, there are some schools that are moving to change the key stage 3  
curriculum, to introduce Welsh right across that curriculum and put that in  
place now, and there's anxiety amongst our members about how that's going  
to affect their livelihoods and their jobs. And there's anxiety about how  
that's going to affect the broad and balanced based curriculum, because that  
can narrow the curriculum. I mean, the case that I'm referring to is a case I  
was dealing with yesterday, and it appears there that, you know, the modern  
foreign languages, in terms of the option choices for the pupils, are being  
squeezed. So, there are those issues that will affect our members, and those  
issues can impact upon their livelihoods, because, if there's not the same  
requirement for teachers in various subjects, then you can get to a  
redundancy situation. It's why we've written very largely in this response  
about the binding commitment that staff won't be displaced because of this  
strategy in schools.

[30] **Lee Waters:** Thank you.

[31] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn has a question following on from that.

[32] **Dawn Bowden:** It's primarily a follow-up to Rex—hiya, Rex; it's nice to see you. It's primarily a follow-up to that. One of the things that we've seen in evidence is that if we are to achieve this objective, we probably need to get from around the 30 per cent figure that you talked about up to about 70 per cent of teachers that can teach through the medium of Welsh. What do you think we need to do in terms of encouraging that element of your membership that are resistant or have concerns about it to get involved with this, to make this a reality, because we are going to need some of those non-Welsh speakers to be part of that 70 per cent, aren't we? So, getting from the—. How do we get them on to the adventure, then?

09:15

[33] **Mr Phillips:** Well, it follows from what Elaine was saying, I think, that if you're going to do that, and you want them to learn the language, you've got to provide the time for them to do that. That time must be in their working day. They must be released from their other teaching duties. It's not something that can impact adversely on their work-life balance. So, that would be one of the things—it's the respect for the teachers' terms and conditions, respect for their working hours, and if they're going to be encouraged to do this, then free their time up and let them have release from their duties in order to learn. Now, that happens in other areas. What we do as an organisation, if someone comes to us—and someone has come to us quite recently in our office and said that they wanted to learn Welsh. We said immediately to them, 'Well, if you're doing it, then we will fund that for you.' And we are doing that now. Now, that is one way of doing it, and that's one way schools could say 'Yes, we'll fund it for you,' and that's fine for those who want to learn the language and want to give up their time and see that as part of the adventure doing it. For those that are resistant to it, if you want to encourage them, then you provide the time in the working day for them to do it, and that may well encourage them to start upon that adventure.

[34] **Dawn Bowden:** And is that something that the NAHT have also got concerns about?

[35] **Mr Williams:** Yes, I think so. It's interesting; I think the staff development, I agree, does need to take place during their working day, but the issue you've got at the moment is that schools are already using their

entire education improvement grant to sustain their staffing. So, they have no additional money left for training, and that's happening more frequently now. And it's not an unwillingness to be able to support that; their ability to be able to support that is stifled and has been for some years. So, I don't think there's ever been an unwillingness. My wife is from England, but she teaches the foundation phase in a school in Cardiff, and she did an 18-day course in Welsh in order to deliver that. And there was no unwillingness in that sense. But I think there is nervousness about it, because there's an expectation about us being able to raise standards, because that's ultimately what we want to be doing. And I think the ability of staff sometimes to be able to do that, given their own skills to start with, can create some nervousness, I think, around it.

[36] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay. Thanks, Chair.

[37] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy.

[38] **Jeremy Miles:** A gaf i ofyn yn nhermau recriwtio athrawon newydd i'r proffesiwn? Roeddech chi wedi sôn, Elaine, am ryw 35,000 o athrawon cofrestredig. Mae'n amlwg bod rhaid cynyddu'r *cohort* o fewn hynny sy'n gallu dysgu drwy'r Gymraeg. Beth yw'r sialensiau i recriwtio athrawon sy'n medru'r Gymraeg i'r safon i allu dysgu drwyddo fe?

**Jeremy Miles:** Can I just look at recruitment of new teachers, please? You did mention, Elaine, some 35,000 registered teachers. Clearly, that cohort would have to be increased in relation to those who are able to teach through the medium of Welsh. What are the challenges in relation to recruiting teachers who are able to speak Welsh to a professional standard?

[39] **Ms Edwards:** Un o'r problemau sydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd yw bod dim data digonol ar gael ynglŷn â'r gweithlu addysg yn gyffredinol. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dechrau edrych ar hynny, ac mae yna brosiect o ryw dair blynedd nawr i ddechrau casglu mwy o wybodaeth fanwl iawn am y gweithlu addysg. Ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr unig dargedau sy'n cael eu gosod ar gyfer hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yw uchafswm

**Ms Edwards:** One of the problems that we have at the moment is that there are no adequate data available in terms of the education workforce in general. The Welsh Government has started to look at that, and there is now a three-year project to start to collect more detailed data on the education workforce. But, at the moment, the only targets that are being set for initial teacher training are around the maximum numbers,

niferoedd, ac nid yw hynny'n sôn am pa bynciau, nid yw'n sôn am pa gyfrwng iaith, a pha gyfnod. Wedyn mae uchafswm yn cael ei roi i bob sefydliad addysg uwch i recriwtio, ac hefyd, o'n gwybodaeth ni yn bendant eleni, dim ond un sefydliad addysg uwch sydd wedi cyrraedd y nod o'r uchafswm oedd gyda nhw. Felly, nid oes digon wedi cael eu recriwtio eleni beth bynnag.

[40] Mae'r diffyg data yma yn effeithio ar y targedu yma o ran gwybod faint o bobl, mewn gwirionedd, sydd eu hangen arnom ni sy'n gallu dysgu Cymraeg fel pwnc, dysgu pynciau eraill drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a dysgu pynciau eraill sydd yn bynciau lleiafrifol. Ac mae mynd i'r afael â'r data yn rhywbeth allweddol i ni er mwyn gallu cynllunio.

[41] Hefyd, mae denu pobl o safon mewn i'r maes addysgu yn hynod o bwysig. Ac, ar hyn o bryd, yn anffodus, nid yw statws y swydd yng Nghymru o reidrwydd y gorau y gallai fe fod. Mae lot o feirniadaeth wedi bod o safonau ac ati yn y wasg ers nifer o flynyddoedd, ac mae athrawon wedi bod yn gocyn hitio fel petai, ac nid yw o reidrwydd wedi dod â'r ddelwedd orau. Ac hefyd, mae'r cyrsiau hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yn ddwys iawn, iawn, gyda llwyth gwaith sylweddol tu hwnt. Mae yna batrwm nawr yn dechrau datblygu o bobl yn gadael y cyrsiau ar eu hanner yng nghanol eu

and that doesn't mention the subjects, the medium of the teaching, or what stage. And a maximum then is given to every higher education institution to recruit, and from our information this year, definitely, only one institution has reached the maximum aim that they had. So, not enough have been recruited this year, anyway.

This lack of data affects this targeting in terms of knowing how many people really are needed who can teach Welsh as a subject, teach other subjects through the medium of Welsh, and teach other subjects that are minority subjects. And getting to grips with the data is something that is key for us in order to plan.

Also, attracting high-quality people into the teaching profession is extremely important. And, at the moment, the status of the job in Wales isn't necessarily the best it could be. There has been a lot of criticism regarding standards and so forth in the press for a number of years, and teachers have been criticised, and it hasn't necessarily created the best image. And the initial teacher training courses are very intense, with a significant workload. There is a pattern now that's starting to develop of people leaving the courses in the middle of their initial training—in the middle of

hyfforddiant cychwynnol—eu *placement* mewn ysgol—neu, ar ôl iddyn nhw orffen y cwrs yn dewis peidio â mynd mewn i addysgu fel proffesiwn. their school placement—or, after they've finished the course, choosing not to enter the teaching profession.

[42] **Jeremy Miles:** A ydy'r sialensiau yma'n benodol i ddysgu drwy'r Gymraeg, neu a ydych chi'n disgrifio'r darlun yn gyffredinol? **Jeremy Miles:** Are these challenges specific to those teaching through the medium of Welsh or are you describing the picture in general?

[43] **Ms Edwards:** Rwy'n credu ei fod yn ddarlun cyffredinol. **Ms Edwards:** I think it's a general picture.

[44] **Jeremy Miles:** Beth yw'r problemau ynglŷn â'r cwestiwn o recriwtio athrawon i ddysgu drwy'r Gymraeg yn benodol? **Jeremy Miles:** What are the problems with regard to the question of recruiting teachers to teach through the medium of Welsh specifically?

[45] **Ms Edwards:** Rwy'n credu niferoedd, i ddechrau—ein bod ni ddim yn targedu. Os nad ydym ni'n targedu niferoedd—. Nid ydym yn mynd mas ac yn annog pobl mewn ysgolion i feddwl am addysgu fel proffesiwn, i weld y manteision a allai fod iddyn nhw o gael gyrfa o'r math yma, iddyn nhw gael blas ar beth fyddai gyrfa fel athro fel. Dylai fod mwy o waith o'r math recriwtio yna, yn mynd i mewn, o bosibl, i ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, i ysgolion lle mae pobl ifanc yn gweld—eich bod chi'n gweld pobl yn datblygu sgiliau Cymraeg fel pwnc. Rwy'n credu bod y cyswllt yna yn un o'r pethau sydd yn bendant ynghlwm wrth yr angen yma i dargedu niferoedd, i ni wybod faint o bobl sydd eu hangen arnom ni. **Ms Edwards:** I think numbers, to start with, in that we're not targeting. If we don't target numbers—. We are not going out and encouraging people in schools to think about teaching as a profession, to see the advantages of it and what they could have in following such a career, to give them a taste of what it would be like to be a teacher. There should be more work in relation to that type of recruitment and going into Welsh-medium schools, where young people can see people developing skills—. We want to see them developing Welsh-language skills in order to teach Welsh. I think that's very important and that's certainly related to this need to target numbers, to know how many people we're going to need.



[46] **Jeremy Miles:** Mae'r cwestiwn yma o dargedu yn ddiddorol. Mae hynny, wrth gwrs, yn diffinio maint y dasg. Fe fydd eraill yn gofyn cwestiynau ichi maes o law ynglŷn â maint y dasg, ond, a ydych chi'n awgrymu nad oes digon o recriwtio yn digwydd yn gyffredinol? Hynny yw, mae'r cwestiwn o dargedu yn eich tynnu chi tuag at rif penodol ond, yn sicr, mae pobl yn trio cynyddu'r gweithlu sy'n siarad Cymraeg beth bynnag, onid ydyn nhw, mewn ysgolion?

[47] **Ms Edwards:** Ydyn. Rwy'n credu bod prinder. Mae ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ei ffeindio hi'n anodd i recriwtio. Maen nhw'n ei ffeindio hi'n anodd darganfod athrawon cyflenwi cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae diffyg arweinwyr cyfrwng Cymraeg. Ar hyn o bryd, er enghraifft, o ran cefnogaeth, mae prinder ofnadwy o gyrsiau hyfforddiant cyfrwng Cymraeg ar gyfer arweinwyr ysgol. Felly, unwaith mae rhywun yn y proffesiwn, mae'r diffyg cefnogaeth yna yn cyfrannu, efallai, at y broblem o ddatblygiad proffesiynol.

[48] Ond, i fynd yn ôl at hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, mae'n allweddol i ni ddenu pobl â sgiliau da iawn, ond mae'n rhaid i ni gofio hefyd nad athrawon gyda sgiliau da iawn yn y Gymraeg sydd yn bwysig—. Yn fy marn i, mae pob athro yn athro iaith, felly mae angen pobl â sgiliau da iawn yn y Saesneg

**Jeremy Miles:** This question of targeting is interesting. That defines the size of the task. Other people will ask you questions about that later. Are you suggesting that there isn't enough recruitment happening in general? The question of targeting draws you to a particular number, but people are trying to increase the Welsh-speaking workforce in schools in general, are they not?

**Ms Edwards:** Yes. I think there is a shortage. Welsh-medium schools are finding it difficult to recruit. They're finding it difficult to find Welsh-speaking supply teachers. There is a lack of Welsh-medium leaders. At the moment, for example, in terms of support, there is a severe shortage of Welsh-medium training courses for leaders in schools. So, once someone's in the profession, there is a lack of support that contributes, perhaps, to this problem of professional development.

But, to go back to the initial teacher training, it is key for us to attract people with very good skills, but we have to remember also that it's not teachers with very good skills in Welsh that's important—. In my opinion, every teacher is a language teacher and we need people with very good English skills and Welsh skills in

a'r Gymraeg arnoch chi yn eich system addysg, beth bynnag yw eu pynciau nhw. our education system, whatever their subject.

[49] Ond hefyd, mae arnom angen gweithlu staff cymorth sydd â sgiliau iaith da, achos mae llawer o waith un i un yn digwydd yn y dosbarthiadau pan fyddwch yn meddwl am y cyfnod sylfaen ac mae'r plant yn clywed y patrymau iaith hynny yn y Gymraeg neu'r Saesneg. Mae'r safon iaith yna yn hynod o bwysig ar draws y byd addysg, p'un ai yn y sector cynradd, uwchradd neu addysg bellach, a p'un ai rydym ni'n sôn am staff cymorth, athrawon neu ddarlithwyr, achos dyna'r patrymau iaith mae'n pobl ifanc ni a'n plant yn clywed. But also, we need a support-staff workforce that have good language skills, because there is a lot of one-to-one work going on in classrooms when you think of the foundation phase and the children hear the language patterns there in Welsh or English. The standard of language is extremely important across the world of education, whether it's in the primary, secondary or further education sector, and whether we're talking about support staff, teachers or lecturers, because those are the language patterns that our young people and children hear.

[50] **Jeremy Miles:** Beth mwy ydych chi'n credu y gallai HEFCW a'r Llywodraeth ei wneud i'n symud ni ymlaen o lle rydych chi'n disgrifio nawr? **Jeremy Miles:** What more do you think that HEFCW and the Government could do in order to move us on from where we are now?

[51] **Ms Edwards:** Mae yna gwestiwn am y bwrsariau sydd wedi cael eu defnyddio yn y gorffennol i ddenu pobl ar gyfer pynciau ac ar gyfer cyfrwng. Mae hynny'n gallu denu pobl i mewn, ond beth nad yw hynny o reidrwydd yn llwyddo i wneud yw eu cadw nhw yn y proffesiwn os nad ydyn nhw'n hapus. **Ms Edwards:** There is a question about the bursaries that have been used in the past to attract people for subjects and medium. That can attract people in, but what it doesn't necessarily do is retain them in the profession if they're not happy.

[52] Mae gyda ni bryder am y bwrsariau mwyaf uchel o ran eu pris, achos maen nhw'n mynd lan i £20,000 y flwyddyn i astudio. Wel, We have a concern about the higher-cost bursaries, because they go up to £20,000 a year to study. Well, that is nearly as much as a newly qualified

mae hynny bron gyfwerth â chyflog athro sydd newydd gymhwyso. Felly, o'n safbwynt ni, rydym ni'n edrych ar hynny ac yn meddwl y gallai rhywun gael cyfwerth â chyflog athro llawn amser am flwyddyn i astudio ac wedyn penderfynu, 'Nid wyf yn mynd mewn i'r proffesiwn'.

teacher's salary. So, in our view, we look at that and think that someone could have what's equivalent to a full-time teacher's salary for a year and then decide, after studying, that they're not entering the profession.

[53] Felly, mae bwrsariau yn un peth i ystyried, ond rwy'n credu bod yn rhaid i ni bitsio'r rheini'n iawn o ran arian sy'n mynd i, efallai, ddenu pobl i mewn ond sy'n mynd i fod yn fuddsoddiad da ar gyfer y dyfodol.

So, bursaries are one thing to consider, but I think we have to pitch those correctly in terms of the money that's going to attract people in, but that's also going to be a good investment for the future.

[54] **Jeremy Miles:** Beth ydych chi'n meddwl yw'r cam nesaf, ar ôl y bwrsariau, er mwyn cynnal pobl yn y proffesiwn? Beth yw'r cam nesaf i'w cadw nhw?

**Jeremy Miles:** What do you think is the next step, after the bursaries, in order to keep people in the profession? What is the next step to retain them?

[55] **Ms Edwards:** Rwy'n credu yn gyffredinol ar gyfer pawb, mae'n rhaid edrych ar lwyth gwaith. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n ofid cyffredinol i ni fel undebau ar hyn o bryd bod y llwyth gwaith yn ormodol, ac mae'n anodd iawn i bobl cael cydbwysedd bywyd-gwaith a datblygiad gyrfa—cyfleoedd i bobl ddatblygu yn eu gyrfa trwy dderbyn datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus. Mae'r sefyllfa o ran hyfforddiant, unwaith rŷch chi wedi dod yn athro wedi cymhwyso, ers nifer o flynyddoedd, wedi bod yn annigonol. O ran ariannu, fel roedd Rob yn sôn, nid yw'r arian gyda ni, achos mae'n cael ei ddefnyddio i gynnal staffio, ac roedd e'n annigonol beth bynnag. Wedyn, mae

**Ms Edwards:** I think that in general for everyone, we do have to look at workload. I think it's a general concern for us as unions at the moment that the workload is excessive and it's very difficult for people to have a work-life balance and career development—opportunities for people to develop by having continuing professional development. The situation in relation to training, then, of course, once you have become a qualified teacher, for many years now has been insufficient. In relation to funding, as Rob mentioned, the money just isn't there because it's used for staffing, and it was insufficient anyway. Then there is a

angen cefnogaeth unwaith mae pobl yn y swydd— need for support once people are in the job—

[56] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym yn mynd i ddod ymlaen at hynny wedyn, os mae hynny'n iawn. Mae Dawn eisiau dod i mewn yn gyflym os mae'n iawn, Jeremy. **Bethan Jenkins:** We will come on to that in a moment, if that's okay. I think Dawn wants to come in quickly, if that's okay, Jeremy.

[57] Do you want to come in quickly?

[58] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes. It was on the point you were raising about support staff and teaching assistants. Unfortunately, we haven't got the unions here representing that group of staff, so this may be an unfair question, because they are a huge workforce in the education system. I was just interested—. We don't have figures—like we have figures for Welsh-speaking and non-Welsh-speaking teaching staff—we don't have that figure for support staff and teaching assistants. What's your assessment of the extent of the challenge amongst support staff in particular? As you say, many of those staff do very important one-to-one work with some of the most disadvantaged kids, and kids with special needs and so on. What's the extent of the challenge there, do you think? It's an open question.

[59] **Mr Phillips:** I'd say that I don't know. I think you will get those data shortly, or you should be able to get those data now that support staff have to register with the Education Workforce Council. So, presumably that will be available to you. I should imagine the challenges are the same. I think you're absolutely right to highlight the fact that the support staff unions are not here today, because I know that they would welcome meeting with the committee. They would be better placed than us to say what the challenge is. Rob may be able to tell you a little bit more about that from his perspective from the headteachers' union.

[60] **Mr Williams:** What I'd say is, already, given the schools budget issue, shall we say, we know of schools that haven't got numbers issues with their pupils, but have lost support staff numbers purely because their budgets aren't enough. So, that's one generic issue with it. But also, talking to members of ours who are leading Welsh-medium schools, trying to find support staff with the quality of language to be able to work in it is a challenge.

[61] I think there is a generic issue also with the teaching profession and leadership, right the way through any education workforce staffing, if you like, about the image of it at the moment. In general, the headlines tend to be not positive ones, quite often, and then we want to attract the best people working in that environment. It's kind of in conflict, isn't it? Certainly for the leadership side of things, we know people, middle leaders, who are openly saying they wouldn't touch headship with a barge pole for a while. That's a terrible thing to be saying. We're missing the highest quality people because they just don't want to step up to that role. I would suggest that support staff also look at what they have to do and, given their levels of pay, which I think is an issue, you question why they would want to do that—they'd have to do it through a vocation rather than wanting any other thing. I think there is an issue about that, and I think we've got to be honest and say that's the reality.

[62] **Bethan Jenkins:** A allaf i jest ddweud yn glou ein bod ni wedi gofyn i'r NUT ddod mewn, ond doedden nhw ddim yn gallu dod mewn heddiw? Felly, byddwn ni yn cael tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig gan yr undeb sydd yn cynrychioli rhelyw y gweithlu i'n helpu ni yn y drafodaeth hon.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I just want to say quickly that we have asked the NUT to come in, but they couldn't come today. So, we will be receiving written evidence from the union that represents the majority of the workforce to help us with this discussion.

[63] **Dawn Bowden:** I think it's Unison, actually, that represent the support staff.

[64] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. Rydym ni wedi ei roi e mas i dystiolaeth. Rwy'n credu bod—

**Bethan Jenkins:** But we have put it out to consultation—

[65] **Mr Phillips:** Yes, it would be Unison, the GMB and Unite that would represent them, not the NUT, actually.

[66] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rŷm ni wedi gofyn i bawb. Roedd yr NUT i fod i ddod mewn, ond mae pawb wedi cael yr alwad am dystiolaeth. Nid ydw i'n gwybod os oes unrhyw arall—Jeremy, a ydych chi eisiau dod nôl?

**Bethan Jenkins:** We have asked everybody. The NUT was supposed to come in, but everybody has had the request for evidence. I don't know whether Jeremy wanted to come back.

[67] **Jeremy Miles:** Nac ydw. Rwy'n iawn, diolch. **Jeremy Miles:** No. I'm fine, thanks.

[68] **Bethan Jenkins:** Elaine, yn fras, nawr, ar hyn. **Bethan Jenkins:** Elaine, broadly, on this point.

[69] **Ms Edwards:** Mae 29,000 o gynorthwyr dosbarth wedi'u cofrestru gyda Cyngor y Gweithlu Addysg nawr mewn ysgolion, a dros 2,000 yn addysg bellach. Felly, maen nhw'n bwysig dros ben yn y system. Rwy'n cytuno nad yw'r ffigyrau gyda ni am eu gallu Cymraeg nhw, ond mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn trio ymateb nawr i'r angen am wella sgiliau yn y Gymraeg. Er enghraifft, gallaf i feddwl am un sydd â'u tîm nhw sydd yn gyfrifol am wella'r Gymraeg a dwyieithrwydd, sydd yn gweithio gyda phlant ac mewn ysgolion, sydd nawr yn cynnal cyrsiau i gynorthwyr hefyd lle maen nhw'n gweithio gyda'r cynorthwyr a gweld beth byddan nhw'n ei wneud gyda'r plant o fewn yr wythnosau nesaf neu yn ystod y tymor nesaf a gweithio gyda nhw ar eirfa a datblygu sgiliau. Mae yna bethau yn dechrau digwydd mewn mannau nawr sydd yn bwysig dros ben. **Ms Edwards:** There are 29,000 support staff registered with the workforce council now in schools, and over 2,000 in further education. So, they're very important in the system. I do agree that we don't have the figures about their ability in the Welsh language, but some local authorities are trying to respond to the need to improve skills in Welsh. I can think of one, for example, that has a team that is responsible for improving the Welsh language and bilingualism, that works with children and in schools, and they now also hold courses for support staff, where they work with the support staff to see what they are going to be doing in the next few weeks or during the next term, and work with them on vocabulary and skills development. Things are starting to happen in that area that are very important.

09:30

[70] **Bethan Jenkins:** Iawn. **Bethan Jenkins:** Right. We'll move on Symudwn ymlaen at recriwtio. Hannah. Hannah.

[71] **Hannah Blythyn:** Diolch. You touched briefly on the challenges in terms of upskilling—

[72] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sori, **Bethan Jenkins:** Sorry, upskilling. uwchsgilio.

[73] **Hannah Blythyn:** It's okay. I'll just move on. In terms of the impact on work-life balance and being released from duties, what would your assessment be of the opportunities that would currently exist and what primarily would need to change if we're talking about breaking down those barriers that, perhaps, stand in the way of people wanting to do that or, actually, not just being able, but incentivising it as well?

[74] **Mr Williams:** It's the generic challenge we've spoken about already, I guess. The vast majority of the workforce want really-good-quality professional learning. There is no doubt about that. I think it's not been co-ordinated as well as it could be up to now, and also there are some question marks, sometimes, against the quality assurance of what it is they're being delivered. Often, it's down to the schools themselves to source their professional learning. I'm not advocating there's a one size fits all, because there isn't—clearly, different people need different things—but I do think, in terms of a strategy to do with Welsh language, there needs to be a co-ordination about what it is we want from our workforce, and a way in which we can articulate that to our workforce in a way that makes it, one, something that they want to do and, two, that they can then easily access. The question does come down to its availability and also the ability of the schools to support those members of staff to access it, because, at the moment, I think lots of schools would not be unwilling to do it, they just simply cannot.

[75] **Mr Phillips:** Yes, it's about their ability to be able to backfill. If they are releasing teachers to go out, they need to be able to backfill that.

[76] **Bethan Jenkins:** Elaine.

[77] **Ms Edwards:** Mae hefyd elfen o fod ddim yn gwybod yn union beth yw cymwysterau a sgiliau'r bobl sydd yn y gweithlu ar hyn o bryd. Mae cwestiwn am hynny nawr yn yr arolwg i'r gweithlu addysg sydd newydd fynd mas ym mis Hydref, ond nid yw hwnnw o reidrwydd yn mynd i ddod

**Ms Edwards:** There's an element of not knowing exactly what the skills and qualifications of the people in the workforce at the moment are. There's a question about that in the survey of the education workforce that went out in October, but that's not necessarily going to bring us an

ag ateb wrth bawb. Nid oes rhaid ichi ymateb i hwnnw, ond bydd e'n dod â rhyw fath o wybodaeth, fel eich bod chi'n gallu matsio, efallai, y fath o gwrs sydd ei angen ar yr unigolion sydd gennych chi, achos bydd pobl ar lefelau eang, gwahanol o sgiliau. Felly, mae'r matsio yna'n bwysig. Mae fe'n bwysig bod dim gorfodaeth a taw anogaeth yw hi—bod yr ewyllys da yn cael ei ddefnyddio.

answer from everyone. It's not mandatory to respond to that, but it will bring some sort of information, so that you can perhaps match the type of course needed for each individual you have, because people will be on very broad, different levels in relation to skills. So, that matching-up process is important. It is important that nothing is forced on anyone. It needs to be done through encouragement and the use of the goodwill.

[78] Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni beidio ag anghofio'r gweithlu cyn oed ysgol, yn enwedig gyda'r pwyslais nawr ar 30 awr o ofal plant yn rhad ac am ddim. Os nad ydym ni'n sicrhau bod y gofal plant rhad ac am ddim yna ar gael trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae hynny'n mynd i greu problemau inni o ran trosglwyddo i'r ysgolion cynradd. Unwaith y byddan nhw wedi dechrau yn y sector gofal blynyddoedd cynnar, achos bod dim lle cyfrwng Cymraeg ar gael iddyn nhw, efallai yn y sector Saesneg, mae'n mynd i fod yn anoddach i sicrhau dilyniant i'r sector cynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg neu le mae ffrwd cyfrwng Cymraeg.

It's also important that we don't forget the pre-school-age workforce, especially with the emphasis now on 30 hours of free childcare. If we don't ensure that that free childcare is available through the medium of Welsh, that's going to create problems for us in relation to transferring to primary schools. Once they've started in the care sector and early years, because there's no Welsh-medium place for them, they may have started in the English-medium sector, it's going to be more difficult then to ensure progression to the Welsh-medium primary sector or to where there is a Welsh stream.

[79] **Mr Williams:** Just to add to that as well, we know, obviously, that for children, in terms of acquisition of language anyway, the early years are the critical bit. They really are. If you're talking about developing any kind of level of language, and particularly bilingualism, then that's the biggest area to gain, if you like, I guess, because we know children who are disadvantaged coming into schools just on their basic speech and language could be 40 per cent or so behind their peers by the time they're four. If you're not addressing that prior to their arrival, they're already at a disadvantage, and if



you put that in the Welsh language context, it's exactly what Elaine described earlier. That's a real challenge. And I don't think, necessarily, there's been as much joining up between early years and mainstream schools as there maybe could have been. It's just the logistics of how it works, I guess, but I think there does need to be that kind of joined-up thinking if we're talking about this kind of strategy.

[80] **Bethan Jenkins:** A allaf i jest ofyn yn glou am y sefyllfa nawr? Achos roeddwn i mewn ysgol gyda chi'r wythnos diwethaf ac roeddwn i'n siarad efo'r brifathrawes ym Mhen-y-bont ac roedd hi'n dweud bod toriadau ar hyn o bryd i gyrsiau INSET ar gyfer athrawon sydd yn dysgu mewn ysgolion di-Gymraeg. A allwch chi jest ehangu ar hynny? Achos os yw'r sefyllfa yn wael nawr, neu cyrsiau'n cael eu torri nawr, wedyn mae yna fwy o waith i'w wneud na'r hyn, efallai, y byddem ni i gyd yn ei ddisgwyl sydd ei angen.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Can I just ask quickly about the situation now? Because I was at a school with you last week and I was speaking to the headteacher in Bridgend and she was saying that there are current cuts to INSET courses for teachers who teach in non-Welsh-medium schools. Could you expand on that? Because if the situation is bad now, or if courses are being cut now, then there's more work to be done than perhaps we would all expect to be required.

[81] **Mr Williams:** Yes, just in general, I was a headteacher for nearly 10 years, and over that period of time, from the beginning of when I started to the end, the ability to access the generic training we would need for our staff was far more challenging. You had regional consortia that would put on certain areas, but they would have to pitch it, given a broad picture they had of their region, and it wouldn't necessarily be bespoke enough for your specific school. So, that's an issue in terms of just the range of courses that are on offer. But, secondly, it does come back to the ability of the school to enable their staff to access those. As I referred before, we've got schools that have no issues in terms of pupil numbers. They're not losing numbers. So, that's not what's affecting their budgets, but they've used their entire education improvement grant to just sustain their staffing. The Welsh Government recognised that because they allowed that flexibility and that grant because they knew that, actually, if we had to spend it specifically on training, there was risk to staffing. Our most valuable resources are our teachers, our support staff and our school leaders. They are the most important resource we've got. I just think there's been a loss in co-ordinating—and a shape to—professional learning for schools. I think the

new deal was sold as a way in which we could maybe roll forward and shape something, but it's been a while now and it's still difficult to see how that will really be articulated to the wider workforce so that they understand how they can engage with that. From a head's point of view, whenever I look at policy I always think what I would have been doing as a headteacher, and the school you referred to that we met at in Bridgend is exactly the same. The school leader there wants to be able to realise how they can find the kind of training that their staff need to do their jobs to the best of their abilities. At the moment, I don't think there's that kind of structural co-ordination in place.

[82] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rex.

[83] **Mr Phillips:** I think that's one of the problems with the new deal. We're still waiting for the delivery plan. We've focused on everything else but the delivery plan in the new deal, and we are still none the wiser about how access is going to be gleaned for our members to meet their professional development needs. I think one of the biggest barriers to all of this is that funding element to our schools. We've faced year-on-year redundancies in our schools. That's a real problem. Every year now, there are redundancies. Rob talked about redundancies hitting the support staff. They're hitting the teaching staff as well, and that needs to be overcome. It's about that funding gap that exists, and it's about investment in the system. This cannot succeed without that investment. That's where stock needs to be taken. I'm not sure whether the draft plan has been costed, and that really is what needs to happen. How many staff will you need? By how many will you need to increase the staffing complement in our schools across Wales to deliver this plan? That's the crucial question here. Because it can be done, if you invest in it and you put the staff into the schools.

[84] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt. Diolch yn fawr. A ydych wedi gorffen ar hynny? Mae Lee eisiau gofyn cwestiynau ynglŷn â chategoreiddio. Felly, diolch.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Great. Thank you very much. Are you done there? I think Lee wants to ask some questions about categorisation. Thank you, Lee.

[85] **Lee Waters:** Roedd Elaine Edwards yn sôn aboutu pwysigrwydd plant yn clywed y patrymau iaith. Nawr, mewn ysgolion dwyieithog, mae'r plant sydd yn y dosbarth Saesneg yn dal i glywed y

**Lee Waters:** Elaine Edwards mentioned the importance of children hearing the language patterns. Now, in bilingual schools, the children who are in the English stream still hear the language

patrwm iaith o amgylch yr ysgol. Ond, o dan syniad y continwwm, bydd rhai ysgolion dwyieithog yn cau ac yn troi'n ysgolion Cymraeg yn unig. A oes yna berygl bydd plant sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn clywed rhyw fath o Gymraeg o amgylch yr ysgol, yn cael eu symud i ysgolion a fydd â llai o Gymraeg o amgylch yr ysgol?

patterns around the school. But with the idea of the continuum, some bilingual schools will close and turn into Welsh-medium schools only. Is there a danger of children who are currently hearing some sort of Welsh around the school moving into schools where there will be less Welsh around the school?

[86] **Ms Edwards:** Wrth newid categori ysgol rydych chi'n ei feddwl—

**Ms Edwards:** In changing category, you mean, yes?

[87] **Lee Waters:** O dan syniad y continwwm.

**Lee Waters:** Under the idea of the continuum.

[88] **Ms Edwards:** O dan y cynlluniau?

**Ms Edwards:** Under the schemes?

[89] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi'n dweud i newid y categori i ysgol Gymraeg ei hiaith? Bod llai o—

**Bethan Jenkins:** Are you saying that about changing the category to a Welsh-medium school? That there's less—

[90] **Lee Waters:** It might be better if I resort to English.

[91] **Mr Phillips:** Could I just ask a question there? Because were you saying—? I couldn't quite understand the question—

[92] **Lee Waters:** That's the trouble with trying to speak Welsh. [*Laughter.*]

[93] **Mr Phillips:** —and I think I understand the category you're talking about. When we saw 'categorisation', we thought it was about the school categorisation process, but you're talking about changing category from a bilingual to a Welsh-medium school.

[94] **Lee Waters:** Yes. We heard evidence last week about the importance of moving schools along the continuum, from English medium to bilingual, from bilingual to Welsh medium. I'm struck by what Elaine said about the importance of hearing the patterns of speech, and it strikes me that,

currently, in dual-stream schools, even children who are not in the Welsh stream are hearing the patterns of speech and, from your evidence, that is helpful to them to learn the language. I'm just wondering, if—. We've heard about the lack of skills of teachers to speak any Welsh, and Rex Phillips talked to us about the resistance to even doing incidental Welsh among some teachers. In English-language schools at the minute, many of them have virtually no Welsh to speak of, or certainly just some incidental, often taught by teachers who don't speak any Welsh. My question to you was: is there a danger in moving children who are currently in dual streams out of the dual stream? If they choose to remain in English medium, they're going to regress, in a sense, into an English-medium environment, which doesn't have the patterns of Welsh, the patterns of language that you talk about.

[95] **Mr Phillips:** So, exposing them, basically, to that.

[96] **Lee Waters:** It's going to decrease their exposure to Welsh, unwittingly.

[97] **Ms Edwards:** Rwy'n credu mai fy nealltwriaeth i, o ddarllen y ddogfen ymgynghorol ac hefyd cynlluniau strategol y Gymraeg mewn addysg ar hyn o bryd, yw bod yna fwriad i symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwwm i'r pwynt lle byddai pob ysgol yn dysgu fwyfwy trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Rydym ni hefyd ar hyn o bryd yn y sefyllfa o baratoi ar gyfer y cwricwlwm newydd, lle mae'r Athro Donaldson, yn ei adroddiad e, wedi nodi taw'r ffordd gorau o gaffael iaith newydd, o ddysgu iaith newydd, yw eich bod chi'n cael eich addysgu rhywfaint trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu wneud gweithgareddau yn anffurfiol trwy gyfrwng yr iaith honno. Felly, beth allwn ni ddisgwyl o fewn hyd yn oed y cwricwlwm newydd yw, mewn ysgolion sydd ar hyn o bryd yn dal yn gyfrwng Saesneg llwyr, fod rhywfaint o waith

**Ms Edwards:** I think that my understanding, in reading the consultation document and also the Welsh in education strategic plans at the moment, is that there is an intention to move schools along the continuum to the point where every school would be teaching more and more through the medium of Welsh. Also at the moment, we are in a situation where we are preparing for the new curriculum, where Professor Donaldson, in his report, has noted that the best way to acquire a new language, and learn a new language, is that you are taught partly through the medium of Welsh or maybe do informal activities through the medium of that language. So, what we could expect, perhaps, within the new curriculum is that in schools that at the moment are still purely English medium, we will see some more

llai ffurfiol yn digwydd trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, neu efallai bod yna rhai o'r pynciau ymarferol lle mae rhywun yn mynd i ddechrau dysgu rhywfaint trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Ond, yn raddol, fod modd symud ysgolion i'r pwynt lle maen nhw'n dysgu, efallai, 20 y cant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, i 40 y cant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, i 60 y cant trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac yn y diwedd, o bosib, yn gyfan gwbl trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn nifer o achosion, ond bod hynny'n digwydd yn raddol. Wrth hynny, ni ddylai fod unrhyw berygl o gamu nôl, os yw'r broses hon yn digwydd nawr yn raddol dros gyfnod.

informal work happening through the medium of Welsh, or maybe for some of the more practical subjects someone may start to teach a little bit of them through the medium of Welsh. But, gradually, that schools can be moved to the point where they are teaching, maybe, 20 per cent through the medium of Welsh, up to 40 per cent, maybe then 60 per cent, and in the end, possibly, that they are teaching entirely through the medium of Welsh in many cases, but that that happens gradually. In doing that, there shouldn't be any danger of people going backwards, if that process happens gradually over a period.

[98] **Lee Waters:** But that relies on the skilled workforce being there in the first place, and you've just all been telling us that it doesn't exist at the minute. But in the meantime, schools will be moving along that continuum. So, my question remains: those children currently in dual-stream schools who are being exposed to some Welsh, who choose not to go into Welsh medium, will be exposed to less Welsh than they currently are, while they wait for that workforce to be developed.

[99] **Ms Edwards:** Nid o reidrwydd, nid wyf yn meddwl. Rwy'n cytuno â—. Rwy'n gallu cydymdeimlo a chytuno â'r pryderon ynglŷn â'r gweithlu sydd yn y sefyllfa nad ydyn nhw eisiau newid ac nad ydyn nhw eisiau cael eu gorfodi i newid o ran y cyfrwng dysgu neu i ddysgu'r Gymraeg. Ond, mae'n rhaid i ni gofio ein bod ni'n sôn am strategaeth gyda'r nod o ddod i ben, os liciwch chi, yn 2050—dros 30 mlynedd i ffwrdd. Mae dros 30 mlynedd gyda ni yn fanna o athrawon newydd yn dod i gael eu hyfforddi, ac

**Ms Edwards:** Not necessarily, I don't think. I agree with—. I can sympathise and agree with the concerns regarding the workforce that's in the situation where they don't want change, they don't want to be forced to change in terms of the medium of teaching or to learn Welsh. But, we have to remember that we're talking about a strategy with the aim of coming to an end, if you like, in 2050—over 30 years to go. We've got 30 years there of new teachers being trained, and teachers

o athrawon sydd yn y proffesiwn ar hyn o bryd yn ymddeol. Mae hynny'n mynd i symud ymlaen ac yn mynd i newid. Os ydym ni nawr, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ar ôl blwyddyn yn mynd i gael mwy o bobl i mewn i hyfforddiant sydd yn gallu sgwrsio gyda disgyblion yn y Gymraeg yn y sector cyfrwng Saesneg, sy'n gallu dysgu rhywfaint trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn anffurfiol a chefnogi trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, dysgu pwnc trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, neu fod yn athrawon pwnc Cymraeg, achos mae hynny hefyd yn fater pwysig, wedyn nid yw'n rhywbeth rydym ni'n disgwyl i ddigwydd yfory. Nid yw'r holl newid categoreiddio yma a symud ar hyd y continwmm yn rhywbeth sy'n digwydd flwyddyn nesaf. Rydym ni'n sôn nawr am ei gynllunio fe dros gyfnod, ac mae'r cynllunio yna'n bwysig, â phob awdurdod lleol yn edrych ble maen nhw, pa ysgolion sydd gyda nhw gyda'r gallu nawr i symud ar hyd y continwmm, a beth yw anghenion y staff yna i wneud yn siŵr ei fod yn dod yn ei le. Ac mae'r datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus yna yn hynod, hynod o bwysig. Mae'r cynlluniau sabothol sydd wedi bod yn eu lle yn hynod bwysig fel rhan o hynny, a hefyd bod yr adnoddau addysgiadol, hyd yn oed, fel llyfrau a gwrslyfrau ar gyfer cyrsiau TGAU trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn barod yr un pryd â'r rhai cyfrwng Saesneg—mae hynny'n hynod bwysig. Ac mae cyfrifoldeb gyda'r Llywodraeth a mudiadau eraill am hynny. Felly, mae e'n rhywbeth dros gyfnod hir, ond

who are in the profession already retiring. That is going to move forward and change. And if we are now, year on year, going to have more people into training who can have conversations through the medium of Welsh with pupils in the English sector, who can teach a proportion through the medium of Welsh, informally, and offer support through the medium of Welsh, can teach a subject through the medium of Welsh, or who are Welsh subject teachers, as that's also an important issue, then it's not something that we expect to happen tomorrow. All of this change, this categorisation, going along the continuum, is not something that's going to happen next year. We're talking now about planning it over a period of time, and that planning is vital, with each local authority looking where they are, what schools they have with the ability now to move along the continuum, and what are the requirements of those staff to ensure that it is put in place. And that CPD is extremely important. The sabbatical schemes that are in existence are vital as part of that, and also that the teaching resources, even, like books and textbooks for GCSE courses through the medium of Welsh, are ready at the same time as the English ones—that's extremely important. And the Government and other organisations have a responsibility for that. So, it is something that is going to happen over a long period of time, but there is a need for short-

mae angen targedau byrdymor, term, medium-term and long-term  
canolig a hirdymor er mwyn cyrraedd targets in order to reach that aim.  
y nod.

09:45

[100] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae Rex eisiau dod mewn yn glou. Diolch. **Bethan Jenkins:** Rex wants to come in quickly. Thank you.

[101] **Mr Phillips:** I was just going to say, if the adventure is successful, then you would, presumably, get to a position where the schools in Wales would either be Welsh-medium schools or bilingual schools, rather than the category of English-medium school. And, as Elaine said, that's a 30-year process. But that would—. I think the question that you raise wouldn't apply in that sense.

[102] **Lee Waters:** I'm not talking about 30 years, I'm talking about now.

[103] **Mr Phillips:** I was going to say that I think your test would be, in that time: what is the language of the playground? That would be the test in those schools—the language of the playground—to see how successful the adventure and the vision had been.

[104] **Lee Waters:** Okay. It's a slightly different point, and I don't really feel that the point I was asking about, about the now, has really been addressed.

[105] **Ms Edwards:** Roeddwn yn trio ei ateb e trwy ddweud nad yw pob ysgol yn mynd i newid o fewn y flwyddyn nesa i fod yn ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg, neu nid ydyn nhw'n mynd i golli'r ffrwd Saesneg, a bod y rhieni'n symud, efallai, i ysgol cyfrwng Saesneg. Achos ei bod hi'n broses dros gyfnod, nid wyf yn gweld ei fod e'n mynd i fod yn broblem yn y byrdymor, os ydym ni'n ei gynllunio fe. **Ms Edwards:** I was trying to answer you by saying that not every school is going to change within the next year into a Welsh-medium school, or they're not going to just lose their English-medium stream, and have parents moving their children to an English-medium school. Because it's a gradual process, I don't see that it's going to be a problem in the short-term, if we plan it properly.

[106] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ocê. Grêt, diolch. Mae Dai Lloyd eisiau dod i **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay. Thank you. Dai Lloyd would like to come in quickly.

mewn yn glou. Diolch.

Thank you.

[107] **Dai Lloyd:** Ie, dim ond yn fyr, a jest i edrych ar y dyfodol, a'r antur yma rydym ni'n sôn amdani, ac rydym ni i gyd ar yr antur yma, achos y realiti ydy, ers i'r ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg gyntaf gael ei sefydlu—wel, ym Mhatagonia, *actually*, ym 1865, ond roedd yr ysgol gynradd Gymraeg gyntaf yng Nghymru yn Aberystwyth ym 1939—y dyddiau yma, mae yna 386 o ysgolion cynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghymru. A'r realiti ydy, os ydym ni'n mynd i gyrraedd y targed yma o 1 filiwn o siaradwyr, mae angen nifer sylweddol yn fwy o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghymru.

**Dai Lloyd:** Yes, just briefly, to look at the future, and this adventure that we are talking about, and we're all with you on this adventure, because the reality is that, since the first Welsh-medium school was established—well, in Patagonia, actually, in 1865, but the first one in Wales was in Aberystwyth in 1939—these days, there are 386 Welsh-medium schools in Wales. And the reality is that, if we're going to reach this target of 1 million speakers, we need a significantly higher number of Welsh-medium schools in Wales.

[108] Felly, rwy'n derbyn yr holl sylwadau, ac yn enwedig yn derbyn yr angen i gael athrawon gyda'r cymwysterau teilwng i allu mynd i'r afael â'r antur yma, ond hefyd ymhlyg yn hynny, mae angen newid agwedd yn ein cymdeithas, mewn rhai sectorau. A hefyd, buaswn i hefyd yn dweud bod angen newid agwedd tuag at y Gymraeg ymhlith rhai athrawon, mewn rhai ysgolion. Ac felly, mae hynny'n rhan o'r antur hefyd. Llywodraeth y dydd sydd yn dweud hyn rwan, ac mae yna ddisgwyl, felly, ein bod ni'n mynd i gyrraedd 1 filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg. Oes, mae yna waith caled yn y cefndir, ond mae angen newid agwedd i ddweud, 'Dyma ydy ewyllys sefydlog ein gwlad.' Sut ydym ni'n mynd i ymateb i hynny?

So, I do accept all the comments, and I especially accept the need to have teachers with the relevant qualifications in order to tackle this particular adventure, but related to that, of course, there is a need to change attitudes in society, in some sectors. And I would also say that there is a need to change attitudes towards the Welsh language amongst some teachers, in some schools. And so, that is also part of the adventure of course. The Government of the day are the people saying this now, and there is an expectation, therefore, that we are going to reach 1 million Welsh speakers. Yes, there's a lot of hard work going on in the background, but a change of attitude is necessary to say, 'This is what our country wants.' How are we are going



to respond to that?

[109] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr. Oes rhywun eisiau ateb o ran agwedd staff? Rwy'n credu bod Rex wedi cyffwrdd â hyn, ond yr agwedd tuag at fedru'r Gymraeg, a hefyd eich barn chi ar a ddylai fod mwy o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg. Roeddem ni'n clywed yn ein gweithdai yr wythnos diwethaf bod nifer o ysgolion iaith Gymraeg yn cael eu cynllunio, ond wedyn, mae *actually* mynd ati i greu'r ysgolion hynny yn cymryd sbel, ac yn y cyfamser, mae nifer o bobl yn mynd at ysgolion eraill, er enghraifft. Felly, a yw hynny, ynddo'i hun, o ran cynllunio, yn broblem sydd yn mynd i fod ynghlwm â'r targed yma o 1 filiwn o siaradwyr?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. Does anybody want to answer in terms of the attitude of staff? I think Rex touched upon this, but the attitude towards the ability to speak Welsh, and also your views on whether there is a need for more Welsh-medium schools? We heard in our workshops that we held last week that a number of Welsh-medium schools were being planned, but actually creating and establishing those schools takes time, and in the meantime, a number of people are going to other schools, for example. So, is that, in itself, in terms of planning, a problem that is going to be associated with this target of 1 million Welsh speakers?

[110] **Ms Edwards:** Mae'r pwynt a'r cwestiwn am yr agwedd yn bwysig, onid yw e? Mae'n rhaid inni fynd â phobl gyda ni, nid gadael pobl tu ôl, neu eu gelyniaethu nhw. Mae'r pwyslais yn y ddogfen ar ewyllys da yn hynod, hynod bwysig. Mae'n rhaid inni feithrin hwnnw. Bydd rhan ohono drwy beidio â gorfodi ond drwy drafod a chyd-gynllunio gyda'r gweithlu. Hefyd, rwy'n credu, pan fydd y cwricwlwm newydd yn dod, mae yna le yn mynd i fod yn y fan yna i sicrhau bod materion am ddiwylliant Cymru, am iaith Cymru, am hanes Cymru yn rhywbeth a fydd yn dod yn rhan annatod o'r cwricwlwm. Bydd hwnnw yn ei hunan ar gyfer y dyfodol yn fuddsoddiad,

**Ms Edwards:** The question and point about the attitude is very important, isn't it? We need to take people with us and not leave them behind, and we certainly don't want to alienate them. The emphasis in the document is on goodwill, and that's really important. We do have to nurture that. We'll do that partly through not enforcing things but through discussing with people and planning on a joint basis. I also think, when the new curriculum does come on stream, that there will be a place there to ensure that issues regarding the culture, history and language of Wales will become an integral part of the curriculum. That is something that will be an investment in the

ond nid yw'n ateb y gofynion nawr. Mae'n rhaid inni beidio â gelyniaethu pobl. Mae gorfodaeth yn gallu gwneud hynny.

future, but it doesn't answer the requirements now. We must not alienate people. Enforcement can do that.

[111] **Bethan Jenkins:** Unrhyw sylwadau eraill? Mae gan Dawn gwestiwn ar integreiddio rhwng awdurdodau lleol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Any other comments? Dawn has a question on integration in local authorities.

[112] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes, just really about your view on the level of integration and co-ordination of Welsh Government and local authority strategies and funding across the sector. So, do the local authorities seem to have the same view on the way that we need to be pursuing this strategy that the Welsh Government does? What's your thought on that?

[113] **Mr Williams:** It's difficult to know, in all honesty. I wouldn't want to presume to talk on behalf of local authorities. In terms of their strategy for Welsh-medium education and developing schools and places, I think there appears to be a strategy for most of the local authorities I know of around that. I think sometimes there have been issues about take-up on those places, actually, when they've been established; certainly, in some local authorities. I think it is very, very specific to certain areas. So, for some, I think, it's an easier thing, if you like, to be able to roll out. In others, it's been more difficult, more problematic. But I wouldn't want to be speaking on behalf of local authorities, particularly, if I'm honest.

[114] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay. That's fine.

[115] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rex.

[116] **Mr Phillips:** Well, I think local authorities are responding to the demand. The development of the Welsh-medium schools has been based on the demand that is coming in from parents. You've highlighted the number that we have now. It is an area that is increasing. I know that in the Vale of Glamorgan they're looking to build a Welsh-medium school down on the Barry site—or there's one there already, but they're expanding that and then doing a reorganisation down there. But the numbers have increased over the years. So, again, we can't speak for the local authorities, but I'm sure that they would say that they are trying to address the demand as it arises in their areas. So, I'm not sure whether they would be proactive to saying, 'Right,

let's just build a Welsh-medium school', and use the field of dreams syndrome: 'We will build it and they will come.' I think that that's all they can do: really respond to where parents are demanding that's what they want for their children. They look at the places and then they'll build a Welsh-medium school. But that also, of course—

[117] **Bethan Jenkins:** I think you're painting quite a rosy picture.

[118] **Mr Phillips:** Sorry?

[119] **Bethan Jenkins:** I think there are some local authorities where people have been asking for some time—in Gwent, for example, and in other areas of Wales where there has been quite some stalling. But, again, you're not the local authority to be able to speak for them—

[120] **Mr Phillips:** I'll let you put those to the local authorities, yes. *[Laughter.]* Far be it for me to defend what the local authorities are doing. *[Laughter.]*

[121] **Bethan Jenkins:** Elaine, jyst yn fras—rŷm ni'n mynd i orfod gorffen wedyn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Elaine, just briefly, because we're then going to have to finish.

[122] **Ms Edwards:** Byddwn i'n dweud, nid yw mesur y galw a chynllunio yn ôl mesur y galw wedi gweithio. Mae ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg gyda ni oherwydd gwaith caled rhai unigolion a grwpiau fel Rhieni dros Addysg Gymraeg i bwysu am newid. Yn anffodus, yn y cyfamser, mae cenedlaethau o deuluoedd wedi methu â chael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i'w plant. Nid yw'r system yna'n gweithio. Mae'n golygu bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei thrin yn israddol.

**Ms Edwards:** I wanted to say that assessing the demand—. We have Welsh-medium schools because of the hard work of certain individuals and groups such as RhAG, Parents for Welsh-medium Education, to put pressure for change. Unfortunately, we have generations of families that have failed to have Welsh-medium education for their children. The system doesn't work. It means that the Welsh language is treated subordinately.

[123] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch am hynny. Rŷm ni'n mynd i orffen nawr ac rŷm ni'n mynd i fynd yn syth

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you for that. We're now going to move on to the next session. Thank you very much

ymlaen at y sesiwn nesaf. Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich tystiolaeth yma heddiw. Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn anfon record i chi ac i chi ymwneud â'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud fel pwyllgor fel rhan o'r ymchwiliad hwn. Diolch yn fawr.

for your evidence here today. We, of course, will be sending you a transcript and so on on what we'll be doing as a committee on this issue. Thank you very much.

09:55

**Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 2  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 2**

[124] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Sori am roi pwysau arnoch chi er mwyn inni gychwyn, ond diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am ddod yma heddiw—y Mudiad Meithrin. Mae gennym ni dystion heddiw—Gwenllian Lansdown Davies, prif weithredwr Mudiad Meithrin, a Dr Rhodri Llwyd Morgan, cadeirydd y Mudiad Meithrin. Diolch ichi am ddod.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. Sorry to pressurise you to get under way, but thank you very much for coming here today from Mudiad Meithrin. We have Gwenllian Lansdown Davies, the chief executive, and Dr Rhodri Llwyd Morgan, the chair of Mudiad Meithrin. Thank you very much for coming.

[125] Jest i gychwyn yn fras, a allwch chi ddweud wrthym ni beth yw'ch meddylfryd chi ynglŷn ag amcan Llywodraeth Cymru o ran creu 1 filiwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn 2050? A ydych chi'n credu bod momentwm i allu gwneud hynny, a bod yna ddigon o strwythurau ar waith i allu cyflawni'r amcan hynny?

To begin, could I just ask you to give us an idea of your thoughts on the Welsh Government's aim to reach 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050? Do you think that there is the momentum to be able to do that and that there are enough structures in place to be able to achieve that particular goal?

[126] **Dr Morgan:** Diolch am y gwahoddiad, yn y lle cyntaf—mae'n fraint cael bod yma i siarad â chi.

**Dr Morgan:** Thank you for the invitation, in the first place—it's an honour to be here to speak with you.

Rŷch chi siŵr o fod yn gwerthfawrogi bod Mudiad Meithrin yn rhan ganolog, gobeithio, ac yn sylfaen ar gyfer strategaeth iaith Llywodraeth Cymru. Rŷm ni'n fudiad gwirfoddol ac elusennol wedi'i sefydlu ym 1971 fel mudiad cenedlaethol. Cefais fy ngeni ym 1971 hefyd, felly rwy'n teimlo fy mod i'n un o blant y mudiad. Felly, mae Gwenllian a minnau—rŷm ni'n dau wedi cael ein trwytho ac wedi bod yn blant sydd wedi mwynhau'r profiad o fod—

You probably appreciate that Mudiad Meithrin is a central part of, and a foundation for, the Welsh Government's language strategy. We are a voluntary organisation and a charitable organisation established in 1971 as a national organisation. I was born in 1971 as well, so I feel as if I'm one of the organisation's children. So, Gwenllian and I, both of us, have been immersed and have been children who have enjoyed the experience—

[127] **Bethan Jenkins:** A fi hefyd.

**Bethan Jenkins:** And me as well.

[128] **Dr Morgan:** —yn y cylchoedd.

**Dr Morgan:** —of being in the *cylchoedd*.

[129] **Bethan Jenkins:** Ac efallai pobl eraill, nid wy'n siŵr.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I don't know about the other people here.

[130] **Dr Morgan:** Rwy'n siŵr eu bod nhw. Mae hynny'n digwydd efallai am y tro cyntaf, o safbwynt y mudiad—cael dau sydd wrth y llyw wedi bod yn derbyn y gwasanaeth, os liciwch chi.

**Dr Morgan:** I'm sure that they are. That's happening, perhaps, for the first time, in terms of the organisation—having two at the helm who have received the service, so to speak.

[131] Beth rŷm ni'n ei gynnig yw darpariaeth, wrth gwrs, sydd yn addysg drochi cyfrwng Cymraeg, yn ogystal â gofal plant rhan amser a llawn amser mewn 1,000 o leoliadau ledled Cymru. Rŷm ni'n fudiad cymunedol sydd yn darparu ar gyfer tua chwarter o blant Cymru yn y grŵp oedran hwnnw. Rŷm ni wedyn, o ganlyniad, yn sail hollol waelodol i lwyddiant addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion sydd yn dilyn. Rŷm

What we're offering is provision, of course, that is immersive education through the medium of Welsh, as well as childcare—part time and full time—in 1,000 settings across Wales. We are a community organisation that provides for about a quarter of the children in Wales of that age. We, as a result, are a foundation for the success of Welsh-medium education at the schools that follow on from that. We're an organisation for

ni'n fudiad ar gyfer pawb—yn fudiad cynhwysol. Rŷm ni'n darparu ar gyfer 80 y cant o'n plant ni sy'n dod o gartrefi lle nad oes Cymraeg yn y cartref, felly rŷm ni'n darparu ar gyfer y mwyafrif helaeth iawn, iawn sydd yn mynd ymlaen i addysg Gymraeg.

everybody—we're an inclusive organisation. We provide for 80 per cent of our children who come from homes where there is no Welsh in the home. Therefore, we provide for the large majority of the children who go on to Welsh-medium education.

[132] O ran nod y Llywodraeth yn y strategaeth newydd, mae'n nod cymeradwy iawn. Mae'n nod uchelgeisiol iawn, ac mi allwn ni ateb cwestiynau sydd yn dangos, o ddyblu darpariaeth y mudiad, mae sail hollol ymarferol i gwrdd â'r targed.

In terms of the Welsh Government's aim in this new strategy, it is a very commendable aim and an ambitious one. We can answer questions that show that doubling the organisation's provision is a practical foundation for meeting those targets.

[133] **Bethan Jenkins:** Gwenllian.

[134] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** I ategu'r hyn mae Rhodri wedi'i ddweud yn barod, rwy'n meddwl bod gwaith Mudiad Meithrin yn allweddol ac yn gonglfaen i'r agenda creu siaradwyr Cymraeg newydd—nid yn yr ystyr llythrennol, ond, yn sicr, os oes gennych chi ddwy ffynhonnell o siaradwyr Cymraeg newydd, sef y sawl sydd yn dysgu Cymraeg fel oedolion a'r sawl sydd yn dysgu Cymraeg fel plant, yna mae gwaith cynllunio strategol y Mudiad Meithrin—y cydgyllunio ac yn y blaen gydag awdurdodau lleol a chyda Llywodraeth Cymru—yn hollbwysig.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** I'd like to add to what Rhodri's already said by saying that Mudiad Meithrin's work is certainly a cornerstone in relation to the agenda of creating new Welsh speakers—not in the literal sense, of course, but, certainly, if you have two streams of Welsh speakers, namely those who learn as adults and, of course, those who learn as children, then strategic planning work done by Mudiad Meithrin with local authorities, for example, and the Welsh Government is extremely important.

[135] Rŷm ni'n gwybod yn barod bod cyfraddau trosglwyddo'r Gymraeg o rieni i blant yn heriol. Hyd yn oed lle mae dau riant yn siarad Cymraeg yn y cartref, dim ond 80 y

We already know that the transfer rate of Welsh from parents to children is very challenging. Even where two parents speak Welsh at home, only 80 per cent transfer that

cant sydd yn trosglwyddo. Os ydy un rhiant yn siarad Cymraeg—y tad—mae'r gyfradd yn 40 y cant. Os mai'r fam yn unig sydd yn siarad Cymraeg, mae'r gyfradd drosglwyddo yn 49 y cant. Dim ond 5 y cant o blant Cymru sydd â dau riant yn siarad Cymraeg, felly, o ran yr agenda greu, rŷm ni'n ddiabynnol ar berswadio mwy o rieni sydd ddim yn siarad Cymraeg i wneud y dewis o ran gofal plant ac addysg ar gyfer eu plant nhw. Dyna pam bod y cynnig arfaethedig o ran darpariaeth 30 awr o ofal plant rhad ac am ddim mor allweddol bwysig. Mae'n gyfle gwirioneddol o ran yr agenda creu siaradwyr newydd, o'i gynllunio a'i gyllido'n gywir. O'i gam-gynllunio, mae yna risg enfawr hefyd i'r targed o gael 1 filiwn o siaradwyr. Felly, rydym ni'n llwyr gefnogol i'r targed o 1 miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg, ond yn erfyn am gynllunio, am gyllido ac yn rhagweld bod angen mwy na ddyblu'r niferoedd sydd yn bresennol mewn cylch meithrin ac sydd wedyn yn symud ymlaen i addysg Gymraeg fel ein bod ni'n cyrraedd y nod, oherwydd mae'r strategaeth ei hun yn nodi fod 8,000 o blant saith oed yn cael eu hasesu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn bresennol. I gyrraedd 50 y cant, mae'n rhaid ychwanegu 10,000 o blant. Mae hynny yn amlwg yn heriol iawn. Ar y funud, nid ydy'r cyfraddau sydd yn cyrraedd addysg Gymraeg wedi cadw i fyny â'r targed sydd yn ofynnol ohonyn nhw gan ein bod ni'n gobeithio gweld 30 y cant o blant yn derbyn addysg Gymraeg

to their children. If one parent speaks Welsh—the father—it's 40 per cent; if only the mother speaks Welsh, it's 49 per cent. Only 5 per cent of children in Wales have both parents speaking Welsh, so, in relation to creating those new Welsh speakers, we are very dependent on persuading more parents who don't speak Welsh to make that Welsh-medium choice in relation to childcare and education for their children. That's why the offer on the table of 30 hours of free childcare is such a key issue. It's a fantastic opportunity in relation to the agenda for creating new Welsh speakers, as long as it's planned and funded properly. If it's not funded properly and not planned properly, there's a huge risk to that target of 1 million speakers. So, we are fully supportive of that target of 1 million Welsh speakers, but we do ask for planning and funding, and we see that we need to more than double the numbers who are at present attending nurseries through the medium of Welsh and then move on to Welsh-medium education in order to reach that goal. The strategy itself says that 8,000 children at the age of seven are assessed through the medium of Welsh at the moment. To get to 50 per cent, we'd have to add 10,000 children to that mix. Of course, that's very challenging. At the moment, the rates of those who are reaching Welsh-medium education haven't kept pace with the target required because we would want to see 30 per cent in Welsh-

erbyn y flwyddyn 2020, ond nid ydy hynny i weld yn debygol o ddigwydd ar y pwynt yma.

medium education by 2020. But that doesn't look as though it's likely to happen at the moment.

10:00

[136] Yn amlwg, o ran y ddarpariaeth, yr hyn sydd yn hollbwysig ydy gwaith cynllunio ar gyfer y gweithlu, achos heb weithlu sydd yn gymwys, sydd yn meddu ar y cymwysterau angenrheidiol o ran cynnig gofal o ansawdd, ond sydd hefyd yn meddu ar sgiliau ieithyddol Cymraeg, ni fyddwn ni mewn sefyllfa i fod yn cynnig y 30 awr o ddarpariaeth, ac felly yn cynllunio tuag at weld cynnydd yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg. Felly, mae buddsoddiad yng ngwaith Mudiad Meithrin, buaswn i'n cynnig, ac yn ein cynllun hyfforddiant cenedlaethol ni, Cam wrth Gam, yn hollbwysig.

Of course, in relation to the provision, what is very important is workforce planning, because without a workforce that is qualified and has the necessary qualifications in relation to offering qualify childcare, but also has linguistic skills in Welsh, we won't be in a position to offer that 30 hours provision, and therefore planning for an increase in the number of Welsh speakers. So, investment in the work of Mudiad Meithrin, I would say, and also the national training scheme we have, Cam Wrth Gam, is extremely important.

[137] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Mae Jeremy gyda chwestiynau ynglŷn â darpariaeth yn y blynyddoedd cynnar.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much. Jeremy has questions on early years provision.

[138] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch. O ran y strategaeth a'r rôl blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant yn y strategaeth yn gyffredinol, a ych chi'n credu bod digon o flaenoriaeth ar y sector?

**Jeremy Miles:** Thank you. In terms of the strategy, and the role of early years and childcare and the strategy in general, do you think that there's enough of a priority in the sector?

[139] **Dr Morgan:** Rydw i'n credu ei fod yn ddadlennol yn y strategaeth ddrafft. Y cwestiwn cyntaf sy'n cael ei ofyn yw: a oes digon wedi cael ei wneud i gynllunio gweithlu ar gyfer addysg statudol? Wrth gwrs, ein

**Dr Morgan:** I think it's revealing in the draft strategy that the first question that's asked is whether enough has been done to plan the workforce for statutory education. Of course, our answer—and we might be



hateb ni—ac efallai y byddwn ni'n cael ein cyhuddo o ddweud, 'Wel, fe ddylech chi ddweud hynny, wrth gwrs'—yw bod, cyn hynny, mae'n rhaid cynllunio gweithlu ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar fel y cam cyntaf un. Mae hynny, os y'ch chi'n edrych ar ddarpariaeth a lleoliad y dosbarthiad ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ledled Cymru, fe welwch chi glwstwr o gylchoedd meithrin yn yr ardal sydd yn eu bwydo nhw, sydd wedi bod yn sail ac yn sylfaen ar gyfer eu sefydlu nhw yn y lle cyntaf. Felly, heb y sail a'r sylfaen yna, nid oes yna ddim cerbyd ar gyfer twf yn yr iaith fel yr ym ni'n gobeithio gweld i gyd.

[140] Felly, dyna beth rŷm ni'n dweud yn y lle cyntaf. Rydw i'n gwybod bod Gwenllian efallai yn gallu ymhelaethu o safbwynt yr union anghenion o ran cynllunio gweithlu.

[141] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Yr hyn sydd yn ddadlennol hefyd, rwy'n meddwl, ydy fod ymgyrch Llywodraeth Cymru Trafod Gofal Plant, sef, y ddarpariaeth 30 awr o ofal plant yn rhad ac am ddim, wedi'i gyhoeddi ar ôl cyhoeddi'r strategaeth. Felly, o bosibl mae angen meddwl am: a oes modd cyplysu'r ddau beth? Oherwydd mae'r ddarpariaeth 30 awr o ran y blynyddoedd cynnar yn hollbwysig o ran y strategaeth 1 miliwn o siaradwyr hefyd.

[142] Felly, dim ond i ategu'r hyn y mae Rhodri wedi'i ddweud yn barod,

accused of, 'Well, you would say that'—is that, before that, there is a need to plan a workforce for early years as the first step. If you look at the provision and the location of Welsh-medium schools across Wales, you'll see clusters of nursery provision in the area that feed them, and which have been the basis and foundation for establishing them in the first place. So, without that basis and foundation, there is no vehicle for the growth in the language we're all hoping to see.

So, that's what I'd say in the first place. I know Gwenllian could perhaps expand on the exact requirements in terms of workforce planning.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** What is also very revealing is the fact that the Welsh Government's campaign in relation to childcare, which is this 30 hours of free childcare, was published after publishing the strategy. So, perhaps we need to look at whether there is a way of perhaps bringing those two things together, because the 30 hours provision in relation to early years is extremely important in relation to the strategy of achieving 1 million speakers as well.

So, just to add to what Rhodri's already said, I do think at times there

rydw i'n credu ar adegau fod yna berig i ni anghofio fod cynllunio ar gyfer gweithlu blynyddoedd cynnar yn hollbwysig.

is a danger that we might forget that planning the early years workforce is extremely important.

[143] **Jeremy Miles:** A beth yw'ch dealltwriaeth chi o le mae'r cynllunio yna ar hyn o bryd?

**Jeremy Miles:** And what's your understanding of where that planning is at the moment?

[144] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Wel, mae yna lot mawr o ddatblygiadau wedi digwydd yn ddiweddar o safbwynt cynllun newydd, 'Cynnydd ar gyfer Llwyddiant'—'Progress for Success'. Mae gyda ni beth pryderon fel mudiad ynglŷn â'r goblygiadau'r cynllun hwnnw. Y targed ar gyfer Cymru gyfan o safbwynt nifer yr hyfforddeion ydy 2,089, gyda 2,008 ohonyn nhw yn y cyfrwng Gymraeg.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** Well, a lot of developments have taken place recently in relation to a new scheme, 'Progress for Success'. We are a little concerned as an organisation in relation to the implications of that scheme. The target for Wales in relation to trainees is 2,089, with 2,008 of them in the Welsh medium.

[145] **Dr Morgan:** Dau gant ac wyth.

**Dr Morgan:** Two hundred and eight.

[146] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Dau gant ac wyth. Felly, 10 y cant ohonyn nhw yn y cyfrwng Gymraeg. Mae hwn yn darged sydd gan Cam wrth Gam dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** I beg your pardon—208 of them in the Welsh medium. So, that's 10 per cent. That's the target for Cam wrth Gam over the next two years.

[147] Mae yna gyfyngiadau, oherwydd natur y cynllun newydd yma, ar y sawl sy'n cael dilyn y cymhwyster. Felly, mae yna waharddiad ar y sawl sydd dan 25, ac mae yna waharddiad ar ddechreuwr newydd. Mae ein tystiolaeth a'n data ni yn awgrymu bod y sawl sydd wedi dilyn cyrsiau traddodiadol blynyddoedd cynnar ac o dan 25 yn cynrychioli 33 y cant o'r *cohort*, a'r sawl sydd yn ddechreuwr newydd yn

There are limitations, because of the nature of this new scheme, on the people who are able to take the qualification. So, if you're under 25, you're not eligible, and, if you're a new starter, you're not eligible. Our evidence and our data suggests that those who have followed traditional early years courses and are under 25 years old actually represent 33 per cent of the cohort, and those who are new starters are actually 70 per cent

70 y cant o'r *cohort*. Felly, mae gennym ni bryderon ynglŷn â'r ffaith fod yr unigolion hynny wedi cael eu torri allan o'r cynllun yna, achos, o ran cynllunio ar gyfer y gweithlu blynyddoedd cynnar a'r pwyslais sy'n cael ei roi arno gan Lywodraeth Cymru, y cynllun strategol cenedlaethol o bwys ydy Cam wrth Gam.

[148] Wrth gwrs, mae yna waith yn digwydd yn y colegau addysg bellach ac yn y prifysgolion hefyd, ac rydym ni'n rhan ac yn gweithio ar y cyd gyda phartneriaid a rhanddeiliaid yn y sectorau hynny, ond rwy'n meddwl bod y ffaith fod Cam wrth Gam wedi darparu dros 2,000 o hyfforddeion blynyddoedd cynnar ers 2004 yn adrodd cyfrolau am bwysigrwydd y cynllun hwnnw, a hynny mewn hinsawdd lle mae hi'n parhau yn heriol i ffeindio staff i weithio mewn cylch meithrin, achos rydych chi angen, ar y naill law, y cymhwyster lefel 3 o ran gofal plant, ond hefyd y sgiliau iaith angenrheidiol i allu gweithio ar lawr y cylch. Felly, mae yna her yn bodoli hyd yn oed rŵan, efo'r buddsoddiad sydd wedi bod yn y gweithlu blynyddoedd cynnar cyfrwng Cymraeg.

[149] **Jeremy Miles:** Bydd gan Aelodau eraill gwestiynau mwy manwl ar y maes yna, ond un cwestiwn bras, efallai: wrth edrych ar y sector statudol, wrth gwrs, mae gan lywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth Cymru rôl uniongyrchol yn hynny. Rydym

of the cohort. So, we do have concerns in relation to those individuals not being included in that scheme, because, in terms of planning for the early years workforce and the emphasis put on that by Welsh Government, the important national strategic plan is Cam wrth Gam.

Of course, there is work happening in the further education colleges and in universities, and we work with them and work with partners and stakeholders in those sectors, but I do think the fact that Cam wrth Gam has provided for over 2,000 early-years trainees since 2004 speaks volumes in relation to the importance of that scheme, and that in a climate where it continues to be challenging to find staff to work in *cylchoedd meithrin*, because, on the one hand, you need the level 3 qualification in childcare, but you also need the necessary language skills to be able to work in the *cylch*. So there is a challenge there, even today, with the investment that has happened in the early years Welsh-medium workforce.

**Jeremy Miles:** Other Members will have more detailed questions on that, but I have a more general question, perhaps: in looking at the statutory sector, local authorities and the Welsh Government have a direct role in that. We're looking at a sector

ni'n edrych ar sector yn fan hyn sydd yn sector wirfoddol, busnesau preifat, mentrau cymdeithasol, ac ati. Pa sialensiau sydd ynghlwm â hynny i allu newid y rhifau?

[150] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Mae yna her. I unrhyw un yn yr ystafell hon sydd yn gyfarwydd â model cylch meithrin, ei chryfder hi, rwy'n meddwl, ydy'r ffaith ei bod hi wedi gwreiddio yn y gymuned ac yn dibynnu ar gefnogaeth rhieni i fod yn aelodau o'r pwyllgorau rheoli gwirfoddol. Mae hynny'n gryfder, ac rwy'n meddwl fod yr elfen gymunedol yna yn rhywbeth sy'n wirioneddol unigryw, o bosib, i gylchoedd meithrin a Mudiad Meithrin, bellach. Tra bod hynny'n gryfder, mae o hefyd yn her, achos rydych chi'n dibynnu ar egni gwirfoddolwyr i fod yn gyflogwyr, yn y pen draw, ac i fod yn rhedeg cylchoedd meithrin o safbwynt rheoleiddio a llywodraethiant. Cofier bod mwyafrif y sawl sy'n gweithio mewn cylch meithrin erbyn hyn yn staff proffesiynol. Mae yna lai a llai yn dibynnu erbyn hyn ar egni gwirfoddolwyr o safbwynt darparu'r elfen gofal ac addysg yn y cylch meithrin ei hun. Mae'r berthynas gydag ysgolion Cymraeg hefyd yn hollbwysig, ac rwy'n meddwl bod y gwaith pontio a'r dilyniant o'r sector nas gynhelir ymlaen i'r sector statudol yn aml yn cael ei ddylanwadu, yn dda neu'n ddrwg, yn ddibynnol ar y berthynas efo'r ysgolion lleol.

here that is a voluntary sector, private businesses, social enterprises, and so on. What challenges are associated with that to be able to change the numbers?

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** There is a challenge. For anyone in this room who is familiar with the *cylch meithrin* model, its strength, I think, is the fact that it is rooted in the community and relies on the support of parents to be members of the voluntary management committees. That is a strength, I think, and that community element is something that is really unique, possibly, to *cylchoedd meithrin* and Mudiad Meithrin now. While that's a strength, it's also a challenge, because you rely on the energy of volunteers to be employers, ultimately, and to run the *cylchoedd meithrin* in terms of management and governance. We must remember that the majority of those who are working in *cylchoedd meithrin* now are professional staff. There are fewer and fewer relying now on the energy of volunteers in terms of providing that element of childcare and education in the *cylch* itself. The relationship with Welsh-medium schools is extremely important, and the transition work and the progression from the non-maintained sector to the statutory sector is often influenced, for bad or good, depending on the relationship with local schools.

[151] **Jeremy Miles:** A beth yw'r arfer da yn y maes yna, i allu—?

**Jeremy Miles:** And what is the good practice in that field, to be able to—?

[152] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Yr arfer da ydy bod yna gynrychiolaeth o'r llywodraethwyr, neu o bosib y pennaeth yn berson cofrestredig yn y cylch meithrin. Felly, mae yna fuddsoddiad personol, os liciwch chi. Mae gwaith pontio yn ymwneud efo gwneud yn siŵr bod y plant yn cael cyfle i ymweld â'r ysgol Gymraeg, gwneud yn siŵr fod cynrychiolydd o'r ysgol a phlant o'r ysgol yn ymweld â'r cylch meithrin, er mwyn pontio'r berthynas yna. Felly, yn bendant mae yna arfer da, ond hefyd rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n bwysig cydnabod fod yna her oherwydd y natur wirfoddol, ond, ar yr un pryd, dyna ydy cryfder y cylch meithrin hefyd.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** The good practice in that field is that there is a representation of governors, or that the leader is a registered person, so there is personal investment, if you like. There is transition work in ensuring that children can visit a Welsh-medium school, ensuring that there's a representative from the school visiting the *cylchoedd meithrin*, in order to bridge that relationship. So, definitely, there is good practice, but I think it's also important to acknowledge that there is a challenge because of the voluntary nature, but, at the same time, that is the strength of the *cylch meithrin* as well.

[153] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch yn fawr.

**Jeremy Miles:** Thank you very much.

[154] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes yna sialens o ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r cynllun Dechrau'n Deg? Gwnaethom ni glywed yr wythnos diwethaf eto bod yna, efallai, ddiffyg darpariaeth trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn yr ardaloedd lle mae Dechrau'n Deg yn bodoli, a hefyd mae'r Gweinidog, Carl Sargeant, wedi yn ddiweddar datgan y cysyniad yma o *children's zones*. Er nad yw hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n dilyn ag arian, mae'n gysyniad newydd yn y maes yma. Beth yw eich barn chi ynglŷn â'r datganiadau newydd yma, efallai, sydd ddim wedi, ar hyn o bryd, cael

**Bethan Jenkins:** Is there a challenge in relation to what's happening with the Flying Start scheme? We heard last week that, perhaps, there's a lack of provision through the medium of Welsh in the areas where Flying Start exists, and the Minister, Carl Sargeant, has also said that we should be having these children's zones. Although that's not something that comes with funding, it's a new concept in this area. What's your opinion on these new statements, perhaps, that are being made but perhaps haven't been fed into the development of the

eu cwmpasu o ran datblygiad yr iaith yn hynny o beth? language?

[155] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** O safbwynt Dechrau'n Deg, efallai y byddwch chi'n synnu i glywed fod 25 y cant o gylchoedd meithrin yn darparu drwy gynllun Dechrau'n Deg. Rwy'n meddwl, petasech chi'n siarad efo arweinydd cylch meithrin sy'n rhan o gynllun Dechrau'n Deg, mi fyddai hi—achos 'hi' ydyn nhw fel arfer—yn dweud wrthoch chi eu bod nhw'n gefnogol i'r cynllun, fod yr adnoddau a'r hyfforddiant sydd ar gael yn wirioneddol wych, ac yn rhagorol. Rwy'n credu bod yna her o safbwynt sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg, yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, yn cadw i fyny gyda nifer y plant sydd, pan fônt yn saith, mewn addysg Gymraeg.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** In terms of Flying Start, perhaps you'll be surprised to hear that 25 per cent of *cylchoedd meithrin* provide through Flying Start. I think, if you spoke to a leader of a *cylch meithrin* that's part of the Flying Start scheme, she—they're usually 'she'—would tell you that they're supportive of the scheme, that the resources and training available are really good and are excellent. I think there is a challenge in terms of ensuring that the Flying Start provision in the early years keeps up with the number of children who, when they're seven, are in Welsh-medium education.

[156] Felly, os ydych chi'n edrych ar nifer y plant mewn awdurdodau lleol sydd mewn cylch meithrin sydd yn darparu ar gyfer Dechrau'n Deg, yn aml, mae'r cyfraddau a'r canrannau'n is na nifer y plant sydd mewn addysg Gymraeg erbyn eu bod nhw'n cyrraedd blwyddyn 2 yn yr ysgol gynradd, sydd yn awgrymu nad oes digon o fuddsoddiad a chynllunio o safbwynt Dechrau'n Deg yn digwydd yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Ond nid yw hynny i ddweud nad ydym yn gefnogol i amcanion y cynllun. Rwy'n credu bod yna ragoriaethau pendant iawn i'r cynllun yma.

So, if you look at the numbers of children in local authorities who are in a *cylch meithrin* that provides for Flying Start, very often, the percentages and the proportions are lower than the number of children who are in Welsh-medium education by the time they're in year 2 in primary school, which suggests that there isn't enough investment and planning in terms of Flying Start in the early years. But that doesn't mean that we're not supportive of the aims of the scheme. I think there are definite merits to this scheme.

[157] Un her arall efo Dechrau'n Deg One other challenge with Flying Start

ydy bod Dechrau'n Deg yn gofyn i arweinydd cylch meithrin fod yn meddu ar gymhwyster lefel 5 ond, ar y funud, nid oes cymhwyster lefel 5 cyfrwng Cymraeg yn bodoli. Felly, mae yna fwlch o safbwynt y cynllunio a'r hyfforddiant sydd ar gael. Unig ddewis ystyrlon arweinydd sydd yn darparu drwy Dechrau'n Deg ydy dilyn cwrs cyfrwng Saesneg i ennill cymhwyster lefel 5 sydd, wrth gwrs, yn ofynnol fel rhan o Dechrau'n Deg.

is that Flying Start requires the leader of a *cylch meithrin* to have a level 5 qualification but, at the moment, there isn't a level 5 qualification through the medium of Welsh. So, there is a gap there in terms of the planning and the training that's available. The only option for a leader who provides through Flying Start is to follow an English-medium course to gain a level 5 qualification, which is a requirement as part of Flying Start.

[158] Felly, mae yna ychydig o densiwn yn fanna rhwng yr hyn sydd yn ddisgwyliedig o safbwynt uwchsgilio'r unigolyn a'r ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg.

So, there is some tension there between what is expected in terms of upskilling of that individual and the Welsh-medium provision.

[159] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn, a oes cwestiynau gyda chi ynglŷn â recriwtio a chadw ymarferwyr?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn, do you have questions on recruitment and retention of practitioners?

[160] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes. Good morning. It's just building on one of the answers I think you gave to Jeremy about recruitment. We've certainly heard that there are problems in the education sector with recruiting teachers at the moment who are Welsh speakers. Only 30 per cent of all teachers in Wales currently speak Welsh as their first language or teach through the medium of Welsh. Is that a similar problem that you have with early years? You've touched on that, as I say. What are the specific challenges that you've got with the early years and recruiting into early-years teaching?

[161] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Mae yna bwyslais o fewn strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru a chynllunio ar gyfer y gweithlu blynyddoedd cynnar i sicrhau bod y gweithlu yn broffesiynol ac yn meddu ar gymwysterau addas ac yn uwchsgilio. Weithiau, mae'r rhethreg yn

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** There is an emphasis within the Welsh Government's strategy and planning for the early years workforce on ensuring that the workforce is professional and has appropriate qualifications and upskills. Sometimes, the rhetoric is in terms of

ymwneud ag uwchsgilio—meddu ar gymhwyster lefel 5, lefel 6 neu lefel gradd—ond nid yw'r cyflogau sydd ar gael yn cyd-fynd efo hynny. Felly, mae'n anodd iawn achos, ar y naill law, rydych chi'n gofyn i'r unigolyn i wneud buddsoddiad o safbwynt uwchsgilio, ond nid yw'r cyflog ar ddiwedd y daith yn gymharus i'r cyflogau sydd ar gael yn y sector statudol.

[162] Felly, y her i ni weithiau ydy: rydym ni'n cael unigolion gwych, maen nhw'n uwchsgilio, yn meddu ar gymwysterau uwch, ond wedyn maen nhw'n symud ymlaen i'r sector statudol neu'n symud ymlaen i sectorau gwahanol. Mae'n anodd, ar lefel unigolion, i weld bai ar bobl am wneud hynny. O ran ein gwaith ni fel mudiad, oherwydd bod hi'n anodd, tu hwnt i waith lobio a dylanwadu, i geisio sicrhau mwy o gyllid i'r sector, mae'n anodd iawn i ni fod yn cyflyru ar y cyflogau sydd yn cael eu cynnig i unigolion achos rydym ni'n gwybod hefyd fod y cylch ei hun dan bwysau cyllidol oherwydd mae'r cyllid sydd ar gael iddyn nhw hefyd yn crebachu fwy drwy'r cynghorau sir, ac yn y blaen, ac yn y blaen.

[163] Un peth rydym ni wedi'i wneud yn ddiweddar iawn ydy cynnal seremoni wobrwyo Mudiad Meithrin. Mi oedd hynny, gobeithio, yn arwydd o'n parch a'n diolch ni i weithlu sydd yn gwneud y gwaith pwysicaf un, sef edych ar ôl ein plant ni i gyd. Ond mae yna ddeuoliaeth yna hefyd yn yr

upskilling—having a qualification at level 5, level 6 or even a degree—but the salaries available do not match up to that. So, it's very difficult because, on the one hand, you're asking that individual to make an investment in relation to upskilling, but the salary at the end of that journey doesn't really match up to the salaries available in the statutory sector.

So, we have a challenge in that we have excellent individuals, they upskill, they have higher qualifications, but then they move on to the statutory sector or move on to different sectors. It's very difficult, when you look at individuals, to blame them for doing that. In relation to our work as an organisation, because it's very difficult, beyond lobbying and persuasion, to get hold of more money for the sector, it's very difficult for us to have any influence over the salaries offered to individuals, because we know that the cylch itself is under funding pressure because the funding available to them is also being reduced through the local authorities, for example, and so on.

One thing we have done recently is we've had a Mudiad Meithrin awards ceremony. I hope that was a sign of our respect and our thanks to that workforce who do the most important work of all, which is looking after all our children. But there is a duality there as well in that



ystyr ein bod ni am i bobl gynnig we want people to offer a very high  
 gwasanaeth gofal plant o ansawdd a standard of childcare, but the salaries  
 safon ond nid yw'r cyflogau sydd yn on offer just aren't competitive.  
 cael eu cynnig yn gystadleuol.

[164] **Dawn Bowden:** I think that kind of recognition—. It's Maslow's hierarchy of needs, isn't it? It's not all about money, but it does help. In terms of the strategy that you think Welsh Government should deploy, then, do you think there is a direct role for Government in terms of encouraging more people into early-years teaching, which is more than just money? Or do you think that money is the key to it in terms of the salaries on offer?

[165] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Rwy'n **Dr Lansdown Davies:** I think it's more meddwl ei fod yn fwy nag un peth. than one thing. I think this as well is Rwy'n meddwl mai dyma hefyd lle where the 30-hours provision is vital mae'r ddarpariaeth 30 awr yn because, if it is funded properly, hollbwysig achos, o'i gyllido'n gywir, there is an opportunity to be looking mae yna gyfle i fod yn edrych ar lefel at the level of salaries. So, of course, y cyflogau. Felly, wrth gwrs, rydym ni we're about to start a pilot scheme in ar fin cychwyn cyfnod peilot mewn six different areas in Wales, in chwe ardal wahanol yng Nghymru, September 2017, so there is an ym Medi 2017, felly mae yna gyfle i opportunity to look at the lessons, at edrych ar y gwersi, yr arfer dda, a the good practice, that will stem from fydd yn deillio o'r peilot yna. So, that pilot. So, I think that's where the rwy'n meddwl mai dyna lle mae rôl Welsh Government has a direct role. uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

10:15

[166] Rydym ni fel mudiad, a We, as an organisation, and other mudiadau gofal plant a blynyddoedd childcare and early years cynnar eraill yng Nghymru hefyd, yn organisations in Wales also, are gwneud gwaith marchnata, doing marketing work, promotional hyrwyddo. Efallai fod yna dric wedi'i work. Perhaps a trick is being missed gollu hefyd. Os ydych chi'n edrych ar as well. If you look at our workforce, ein gweithlu ni, mae 98 y cant yn 98 per cent are women. The role of fenywod. Mae rôl y tad wedi newid, the father has changed, has wedi'i thrawsnewid yn llwyr, yn y transformed completely, in society, gymdeithas, ac mae'n disgwyliadau and our expectations of the care ni o ofal y mae tadau yn ei ddarparu provided by fathers has also hefyd wedi newid, ond nid ydym wedi changed, but we haven't seen a

gweld yr un newid yna o safbwynt dynion yn dod i mewn i'r sector gofal. Felly, os ydych chi'n cymryd Cam wrth Gam, sydd yn draddodiadol wedi cymhwyso 200 o unigolion bob blwyddyn, fel arfer mae yna bump neu chwech o ddynion, ac efallai, fel sector, ein bod ni yn colli tric o ran peidio â thrio annog mwy o ddynion i fod yn ymgymryd â gyrfa yn y maes.

corresponding change with regard to men entering the care sector. So, if you look at Cam wrth Gam, which traditionally has qualified 200 individuals every year, there are usually about five or six men, and perhaps we as a sector are missing a trick here in terms of not encouraging more men to embark on a career in this field.

[167] **Dawn Bowden:** Thank you for that. Just one final question. I was just taken by one of the statistics that you gave in response to one of Jeremy's questions, which was that only 5 per cent of children have both parents that speak Welsh. Do you think there is a role for the early years system to do more to encourage non-Welsh-speaking parents to actually engage in Welsh language education as well?

[168] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** O, yn bendant, achos y gwir amdani ydy, heb fod rhieni sydd ddim yn siarad Cymraeg yn gwneud y dewis pwysig yna, nid ydym ni byth yn mynd i gyrraedd y targed o filiwn o siaradwyr. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig annog rhieni sydd yn siarad Cymraeg i drosglwyddo'r Gymraeg i'w plant, a dyna pam hefyd y mae gwaith Cymraeg i blant y Mudiad Meithrin yn y cyswllt yna yn hollbwysig. Ond, o ran niferoedd, rydym ni'n gwybod bod mwyafrif y plant sydd yn caffael y Gymraeg yn y blynyddoedd cynnar yn dod o gartrefi lle mae mam a dad yn siarad Saesneg neu, yn wir, iaith arall.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** Yes, most certainly, because the truth of the matter is, without those parents who don't speak Welsh making that important choice, we're never going to reach the target of a million speakers. So, it's extremely important to encourage those parents who speak Welsh to transmit the language to their children, and that's also why Mudiad Meithrin's work in Welsh for children is critical in that regard. But, in terms of numbers, we know that the majority of children who acquire the Welsh language in the early years come from households where both parents speak English or, indeed, another language.

[169] **Dawn Bowden:** Okay, thank you.

[170] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee.

[171] **Lee Waters:** Diolch. I wanted to ask about that statistic as well. I'm interested in the performance data about the academic performance of the children, not just in terms of language, but more generally? Is there a difference in your data between the performance of the children who have both parents Welsh speaking and the performance of the children who do not?

[172] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Ocê. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn difyr, ac, wrth gwrs, mae'n rhaid cofio yn y cyswllt yna fod 60 y cant o gylchoedd meithrin yn cael eu harolygu gan Estyn. Felly, mae gan Estyn ddiddordeb mawr yn ansawdd y ddarpariaeth o safbwynt addysgiadol, ac, felly, pe bai gennych chi ddiddordeb yng ngwaith addysgiadol cylch meithrin, mi fydddech chi'n edrych ar yr arolwg Estyn diweddaraf. Mae AGGCC-CSSIW hefyd yn arolygu'r cylchoedd meithrin. Rhaid cofio, yn y cylch meithrin, rydym ni'n siarad am blant ifanc iawn. Maen nhw o bosibl yn cychwyn yn ddwy, o bosibl yn cychwyn yn ddwy a hanner, o bosibl yn cychwyn yn dair, yn dibynnu ar bolisi'r cylch a pholisi'r awdurdod lleol. Felly, mae nifer o blant yn cyrraedd y cylch meithrin heb unrhyw iaith o gwbl, ac mae'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud yn y cylch meithrin yn dilyn egwyddorion y dull trochi, a beth mae nifer o blant sydd â rhieni yn siarad Saesneg yn y cartref yn ei weld ydy'r wyrth o'r plentyn yn caffael iaith. Mae'r ymchwil ryngwladol i gyd yn dangos i ni po gynharaf y mae'r plentyn yn caffael iaith, po fwyaf tebygol ydy'r plentyn o allu siarad yr iaith honno

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** Okay. That's an interesting question, and, of course, we must remember that, in that context, 60 per cent of *cylchoedd meithrin* are inspected by Estyn. Estyn therefore has a great interest in the quality of the provision in terms of education. So, if you had an interest in a *cylch meithrin's* educational work, you would look at the latest Estyn inspection. The CSSIW also inspects *cylchoedd meithrin*. You must remember that, in the *cylch meithrin*, we're talking about very young children, possibly starting at the age of two, possibly two and a half, possibly starting at the age of three, depending on the *cylch's* policy and the local authority policy. So, a number of children arrive at the *cylch meithrin* without any language at all, and the work that is done in the *cylch meithrin* follows the principles of the immersion approach, and what a number of children whose parents speak English at home see is the miracle of the child acquiring the language. All the international research shows us that the earlier a child acquires a language, the more likely it is that the child will be able to speak the language as an adult.

fel oedolyn.

[173] O safbwynt ein data meintiol ni ynglŷn â ‘pherfformiad ieithyddol’ y plentyn, mae gennym ni gynllun o’r enw Croesi’r Bont yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru sydd yn meintioli ac yn monitro’r union fath yna o wybodaeth, ond nid oes gennym ni ddim cynllun cenedlaethol sy’n cyflawni’r gwaith yna ar y funud, ac felly y data y byddech chi angen edrych arnyn nhw ydy arolygon Estyn, sydd wrth gwrs yn wrthrychol ac yn annibynnol, a bydden nhw’n rhoi syniad a blas i chi o sut mae ‘perfformiad iaith’ y plentyn yn cymharu yn ddibynnol ar iaith y cartref.

In terms of our quantitative data on the ‘linguistic performance’ of a child, we have a scheme called Croesi’r Bont in north-east Wales that quantifies and monitors exactly that sort of information, but we don’t have a national scheme that is doing that work at the moment. So, the data that you would need to look at are the Estyn inspection reports, which are of course objective and independent, and they would give you an idea and a taste of how child’s ‘language performance’ compares, depending on the language of the home.

[174] **Lee Waters:** I wasn’t just interested in their language performance; I was interested in their development more generally, because I know there’s a debate around the data, but there’s an argument that says that some of the data show that children who don’t come from a home where both parents speak Welsh, perform less well than those who do, more generally, and I just wondered if you had any experience of that.

[175] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Nid yw hynny’n brofiad rydym ni wedi dod ar ei draws. Ac, eto, rwy’n meddwl mai’r dystiolaeth mwyaf cadarn yn y maes yma fyddai tystiolaeth arolygon Estyn. Mae hwnnw, a’r ffaith fod cylchoedd meithrin yn cael eu harolygu can AGGCC, yn profi fod yna waelodlin ansawdd a safon sydd ar gael i bob plentyn. Mae gyda ni hefyd ein cynllun ansawdd mewnol, sydd yn ymwneud â phob agwedd ar waith y cylch, o safbwynt ansawdd y gofal, o safbwynt ansawdd yr addysg,

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** That’s not an experience that we have come across. But, again, I think the strongest evidence in this area would be evidence from Estyn inspections. That, and the fact that *cylchoedd meithrin* are inspected by CSSIW, does prove that there’s a quality and standards baseline available for all children. We also have our own internal quality scheme, which relates to all aspects of the *cylch’s* work, in relation to the standard of care, the standard of the education if they’re

os ydyn nhw'n darparu, o safbwynt y dull trochi, ac mae hwnnw'n bwysig iawn o ran arfogi staff yn y cylchoedd meithrin i feddwl am ansawdd y ddarpariaeth o safbwynt pob plentyn. Mae gan bob plentyn mewn cylch meithrin fel arfer hefyd ei dargedau personol yn seiliedig ar anghenion, anghenion datblygiadol y plentyn, ac mae lles y plentyn yn ganolog i holl weithgaredd y cylch yna. Ac mae'r staff yn adnabod eu plant. Dyna pam fod yr elfen gymunedol hefyd mor bwysig. Felly, o safbwynt perfformiad y plentyn yn gyffredinol, mae hwnnw yn un elfen hollbwysig ac yn gonglfaen o waith cynllunio'r cylch meithrin, ac mae'n cael ei arolygu gan Estyn.

[176] **Lee Waters:** Diolch.

[177] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rwy'n credu ein bod ni wedi gofyn cwestiynau ar uwchsgilio, ond os oes cwestiynau ychwanegol gyda chi, Dai—.

[178] **Dai Lloyd:** Roeddwn i jest eisiau cytuno gyda chi yn fanna, Gadeirydd—geiriau doeth fel arfer. Roeddwn am neidio ar y cyfle i longyfarch y Mudiad Meithrin ar eu gwaith arwrol, jest rhag ofn nad oes unlle yn y cofnodion yn y fan hyn lle rŷm ni'n talu teyrnged. Achos, hebdoch chi, byddai'r twf enbyd yna rydym ni wedi'i weld mewn ysgolion Cymraeg, a'r ddarpariaeth, ddim yn digwydd i'r fath raddau. Mae'n ddigon teg i ddweud hynny.

providing that, and also the immersion method, and that's very important in arming staff with the ability to think about the quality of the provision in relation to all children. Every child in a *cylch meithrin* usually has their own personal targets as well, based on their needs, their developmental needs, and the child's well-being is central to all activity within that *cylch*. And the staff know their children very, very well. That's why that community element is also so important. So, in relation to the child's performance in general, that is one element that is extremely important and is a cornerstone of the planning work of the *cylch meithrin*, and which is inspected by Estyn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I think we have asked questions on upskilling, but if there are any further questions, Dai—.

**Dai Lloyd:** Yes, I just wanted to agree with you there, Chair—wise words as usual. I was going to jump on the chance to congratulate the Mudiad Meithrin on their heroic work, just in case there is nowhere in the record where we pay tribute. Because, without you, that great growth that we've seen in Welsh-medium schools and in the provision wouldn't happen to the same extent. I think it's fair to say that.

[179] Yn naturiol, nid oedd rhai ohonom mor ffodus i gael ein geni yn 1971, ond yn sylweddol hŷn na hynny, ac felly, ni wnes i fy hunan elwa o ddarpariaeth Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin ar y pryd. Ond mae fy mhlant i wedi, ac, wrth gwrs, yng nghanol dinas Abertawe, gyda dim ond un rhiant yn siarad Cymraeg, roedd hynny'n brofiad gwerthfawr, gyda'r fam felly yn dysgu Cymraeg efo'r cylch meithrin. Ac, wrth gwrs, nawr, gan ein bod ni gyd wedi tyfu fynd ychydig bach, rwy'n gadeirydd ar ysgol gynradd Gymraeg yn Abertawe, lle mae 92 y cant o'r plant yn dod o gartrefi cyfan gwbl ddi-Gymraeg, ac, o'r 8 y cant arall, mae hanner y rheini â dim ond un rhiant sydd yn meddu'r Gymraeg. A beth sydd yn dod yn amlwg o ganlyniadau Estyn, a phob peth, yw bod eu canlyniadau nhw yn fendigedig, a bod pawb, yn sylfaenol, yn dod yn gyfan gwbl rhugl yn y Gymraeg erbyn iddyn nhw adael yr ysgol yna, pontio, a mynd i Ysgol Gyfun Gŵyr. A'r rôl allweddol ydy po gynnar posib rydych chi'n cael gafael ar y Gymraeg, mae hynny'n rhoi ryw warant felly i chi ddod yn rhugl, ac i gael eich trochi, fel rydych chi wedi dweud eisoes, a chael y dechrau gorau posib.

[180] Wedi dweud hynny i gyd, a bod yn hynod garedig wrthyich chi—ac nid yw hynny'n mynd i newid—yn sylfaenol, mae yna her sylweddol o gael miliwn o siaradwyr erbyn canol y ganrif yma, a buaswn i'n dweud bod

Naturally, some of us weren't so fortunate as to be born in 1971 and are substantially older, and so I myself didn't personally benefit from the then Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin provision. But my children have, and, of course, in the centre of the city of Swansea, with one parent speaking Welsh, that was a valuable experience, with the mother then learning Welsh through the *cylch meithrin*. And, of course, now, as we've all grown up a little bit, I'm chair of a Welsh-medium primary school, where 92 per cent of the children come from completely non-Welsh-speaking homes, and, of the remaining 8 per cent, half of those have only one parent who can speak Welsh. And what becomes apparent from the Estyn inspections, and so forth, is that their results are fantastic and that everybody, basically, becomes fluent in the Welsh language by the time they've left that school and transitioned to Ysgol Gyfun Gŵyr. And the key role is that the younger you are when you acquire the Welsh language, that provides some sort of guarantee that you will become fluent, and to be immersed, as you've mentioned previously, and ensures that you get the best possible start.

Having said all that, and to be extremely kind to you—and that will not change—there is, basically, a substantial challenge now to have a million Welsh speakers by the middle of this century. There's been a lot of

lot o siarad wedi bod ynglŷn â'r her i ysgolion, athrawon, sgiliau, ond mae yna her aruthrol hefyd yn y sector cyn-ysgol, ac yn enwedig, yn y cydestun yma, i chi fel mudiad. Felly, pa gynlluniau yn benodol sydd gyda chi, achos mae'n rhaid i ni gael gafael yn y sefyllfa yma? Mae e fyny i chi nawr i greu y miliwn o siaradwyr yma. Mae'n deg nodi, fel rydym ni wedi dweud eisoes, yr oedd miliwn o siaradwyr yng Nghymru ychydig bach dros ganrif yn ôl, felly adennill y tir yr ydym ni, ond erys her sylweddol. Ac o gael y peth yn iawn, ac i gael siaradwyr Cymraeg sydd yn rhugl ac yn hyderus, gyda rhieni sydd yn hyderus i ddanfôn eu plant i ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, er nad ydyn nhw'n gallu siarad yr iaith eu hunain, ac ennyn yr hyder yna yn y rhieni, mae lot ohono fo lawr i'ch cylchoedd meithrin chi. Felly, sut ydych chi'n mynd i gynllunio at y dyfodol?

talk about the challenge facing schools, teachers, and skills, but there is a huge challenge in the pre-school sector, and particularly in this context for you as an organisation. So, what plans do you have, because we have to address this situation? It's up to you now to create these million speakers. It's fair to say, as we've already mentioned, that there were a million Welsh speakers in Wales just over a century ago, so we're regaining the ground here, but there remains a significant challenge. And in getting this right, and in getting Welsh speakers who are fluent and confident, with parents who are confident to send their children to Welsh-medium schools, even though they can't speak the language themselves, and gaining that confidence in parents, a lot of that is down to your *cylchoedd meithrin*. So, how are you going to plan for the future?

[181] **Bethan Jenkins:** Lawr i chi. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Bethan Jenkins:** It's down to you. [*Laughter.*]

[182] **Dai Lloyd:** Dim pwysau. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Dai Lloyd:** No pressure. [*Laughter.*]

[183] **Dr Morgan:** Yn gyffredinol, i gychwyn, os caf i, mae'r 15 mlynedd diwethaf wedi bod yn gyfnod o fethu a gweld cynnydd amlwg yn nifer a chanran y siaradwyr Cymraeg—dim cynnydd fel y byddai rhywun wedi gobeithio gweld dan y Cynulliad, o safbwynt nifer yr ysgolion, plant mewn addysg Gymraeg ac yn y blaen.

**Dr Morgan:** In general, if I may, to begin, the last 15 years has been a period of not seeing any specific growth in the percentage of Welsh speakers—not an increase as someone would have hoped to have seen under the Assembly, in relation to the number of schools, children in Welsh education and so on. And that

Ac mae hynny'n wir hefyd o safbwynt darpariaeth Mudiad Meithrin. Mae hynny oherwydd bod yna chwyldro arall wedi digwydd yn ystod y cyfnod hynny, drwy gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen a thrwy gyflwyno gofynion uwch am resymau cwbl gymeradwy—gofynion uwch o lawer—o ran arolygu ac o ran rheoliadau lleoliadau gofal plant a'r blynyddoedd cynnar. Wrth gwrs, mae rhywfaint o egni—llawer o egni—Mudiad Meithrin dros y cyfnod yna wedi mynd i mewn i sicrhau bod y safonau gyda'r gorau ac yn safonau y dylai pob rhiant eu disgwyl mewn lleoliad sydd yn cymryd gofal o'u plant gwerthfawr iawn nhw.

[184] Felly, mae'r sylw wedi mynd i'r fan honno. Rŷm ni wedi dal ein tir—rydym ni wedi cynnal niferoedd y lleoliadau drwy'r cyfnod hynny. Beth mae hynny wedi'i ddangos, rwy'n credu, yw y gall y Llywodraeth a rhieni Cymru fod yn gwbl hyderus bod y mudiad yn gorff cenedlaethol sydd wedi'i wreiddio'n lleol ac sydd yn hollol broffesiynol, gyda staff a gweithlu cymwys sydd yn gallu gwneud y job i chi—sydd yn gallu gwneud y job i'r rhieni ac sydd yn gallu gwneud y job i'r Llywodraeth, o safbwynt darparu'r gofal a darparu addysg drochi cyfrwng Cymraeg iddyn nhw.

[185] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rŷm ni'n mynd i symud ymlaen at ddilyniant. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd cyfle ichi ddod yn ôl bryd hynny. Mae gan Neil Hamilton

is also true in relation to the Mudiad Meithrin provision. This is because another revolution has happened in that period, with the introduction of the foundation phase and higher requirements, for very good reasons—far higher requirements—in relation to the inspection and regulation of childcare and early years settings. Of course, a lot of energy from Mudiad Meithrin has gone into ensuring that standards are amongst the best and are what parents should expect in settings that look after their very valuable children.

So, a lot of energy has gone into that. We have managed to hold our ground, and we have sustained the number of settings throughout that time. I think that that has shown that the Government and the parents of Wales can be very confident that the *mudiad* is a national body that has its roots at the local level and is extremely professional, with a qualified workforce that can do the job for you—that can do the job for parents and can do the job for the Government in relation to providing care and providing immersive education in Welsh.

**Bethan Jenkins:** We're going to move on to progression. I'm sure that there'll be an opportunity for you to come back on that. Neil Hamilton has



cwestiynau.

questions.

[186] **Neil Hamilton:** I think we're all impressed by the visionary work that Mudiad Meithrin does. An early years start in speaking Welsh is, obviously, going to be the way by which the language is embedded in the culture of future generations. As I enter my second childhood, unfortunately the immersion theory doesn't work as well as in my first childhood.

[187] **Dai Lloyd:** It depends what you're learning. [*Laughter.*]

[188] **Neil Hamilton:** Exactly—I'll leave that to your vivid imagination. Having been very interested in picking up languages as a child, I know how much more difficult it is in later years. But what we're interested in is going from the early years non-statutory provision, where a child is wholly immersed in a Welsh-speaking environment, and then moving on to the next sector of education, which is provided by the Government. Do you think that the current strategy of getting a million Welsh speakers by 2050 concentrates sufficiently on this transitional process? You can see the problems, in terms of finance and planning also, of everybody who starts off in a Welsh-speaking environment having a right and the opportunity to move on by progression through the medium of Welsh to the next stage in education.

[189] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Rwy'n credu bod y cynllunio strategol sydd yn digwydd ar y cyd rhwng Mudiad Meithrin a'r awdurdodau lleol yn hollbwysig, a'i bod hi'n deg dweud ein bod ni heb weld digon o gynnydd eto. I ni, mae bodolaeth cylch meithrin yn dystiolaeth o'r galw cymunedol am addysg Gymraeg. Mae hynny weithiau'n golygu bod cyfraddau dilyniant yn mynd i fod yn boenus o isel oherwydd nad oes yna ddilyniant ystyrlon oherwydd bod yr ysgol Gymraeg leol yn bell, bod gofyn i'r plentyn deithio ar fws a bod pob rhiant ddim yn gyffyrddus â hynny.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** I do think that the strategic planning being undertaken jointly between Mudiad Meithrin and local authorities is extremely important and that it's fair to say that we haven't seen enough progress up to this point. For us, the existence of a *cylch meithrin* is evidence of demand within the community for Welsh-medium education. This sometimes means that rates in relation to progression are going to be very low because there is no meaningful transition given that the local Welsh school is a long way away, that children have to travel on buses and not all parents are happy for them to do that.

[190] Felly, rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig iawn inni gofio bod yna amrywiaeth o resymau pam mae rhiant yn dewis gyrru ei blentyn i gylch meithrin. Gallai hynny fod yn reddf, gallai fod yn, 'Dyna beth sy'n digwydd. Dyna'r norm', a gallai fod yn, 'Dyna ydy'r ddarpariaeth leol'. Nid pawb sydd yn dewis gyrru ei blentyn i gylch meithrin oherwydd dyna'r ddarpariaeth Gymraeg. Ond, o gyrraedd y cylch meithrin, mae'r tebygolrwydd y byddai'r plentyn wedyn yn symud ymlaen i addysg Gymraeg gymaint yn uwch o'i gymharu â phe na byddai'r plentyn wedi mynd ymlaen i gylch meithrin yn y lle cyntaf. O safbwynt cyrraedd y filiwn, mae ein gwaith dadansoddol ni—. Rŷm ni gyd yn derbyn bod yna'n dal i fod lot o waith ystadegol i'w wneud ar sut yr ydym yn cyrraedd y filiwn. Rŷm ni'n rhagamcanu y bydd angen gweld cynnydd o rywle rhwng 16 a 21 cylch meithrin newydd y flwyddyn bob blwyddyn, ac mae hynny'n her sylweddol iawn, iawn.

[191] Rŷm ni hefyd wedi gwneud gwaith costio—beth ydy cost sefydlu cylch meithrin newydd? Mae cost sefydlu cylch oddeutu £17,000; mae cost rhedeg cylch meithrin sydd ag un arweinydd a chwech cynorthwydd, sydd yn cynnig 12 a hanner awr yr wythnos, o gwmpas y £40,000 y flwyddyn. Felly, meddyliwch am y 30 awr, meddyliwch efallai am y costau, a meddyliwch faint o fuddsoddiad ariannol sydd ei angen er mwyn ein

So, it's very important for us to remember that there's a variety of reasons why parents might choose to send their child to a *cylch meithrin*. It could be instinctive, it could be just to follow the norm or it could be, 'Well, that's the local provision'. Not everyone decides to send their child to a *cylch meithrin* because there's Welsh-medium provision there. However, having arrived at the *cylch meithrin*, the likelihood that that child then moves on to Welsh-medium education is far higher than it would have been if the child had not attended a *cylch meithrin*. In relation to reaching the target of a million speakers, our analytical work—. Of course, we all accept that there's still a lot of statistical work to do in relation to how we get to the million figure, but we project that we will need to see an increase of somewhere between 16 and 21 new cylchoedd meithrin every year between now and then, and that's a massive challenge for us.

We've also done some work in relation to costing—the cost of establishing a new *cylch meithrin*. It's around £17,000; the cost of running a *cylch meithrin* that has one leader and six assistants, which offers 12 and a half hours a week, is around £40,000 a year. So, if you think about the 30 hours, think about the costs, and if you think about the amount of financial investment required so that we are able to more than double the current provision, so

bod ni'n gallu mwy na dyblu y ddarpariaeth bresennol, fel bod nifer y cylchoedd meithrin wedyn yn arwain at fwy o ysgolion Cymraeg. Achos, yn y pen draw, dyna yr ydym yn siarad amdano fo, ac ar y funud rydym ni'n bell, fel cymdeithas, o gyrraedd y targed o gael 30 y cant o blant Cymru mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg erbyn 2020.

10:30

[192] **Dr Morgan:** Ond, os cymerwch chi y ffigurau yma y mae Gwenllian wedi dyfynnu—ein bod ni wedi amcangyfrif bod angen rhwng 16 a 21 o gylchoedd meithrin ychwanegol wedi eu sefydlu y flwyddyn—rhannwch hynny ar draws Cymru, dosbarthwch e, nid yw'n swnio fel nod anymarferol, ydy e? Oes, mae yna gwestiynau ynglŷn â'r cyllid i gefnogi hynny, ond mae'r crebwyll gyda ni, mae'r profiad gyda ni i fedru delifro ar hynny. O allu cael yr *impetus* iawn, efallai, yn yr awdurdodau lleol i fedru gweithio gyda ni o'r safbwynt hwnnw, mi all gael ei ddelifro ac mae hynny yn ddarpariaeth gynhwysol i bawb yn ein cymdeithas.

that the number of *cylchoedd meithrin* then leads to more Welsh-medium schools. Because, basically, that's what we're talking about and at the moment, as a society, we are very, very far from that target of having 30 per cent of Welsh children in Welsh-medium schools by 2020.

**Dr Morgan:** If you, perhaps, look at these figures that Gwenllian has quoted there—that we estimate we're going to need between 16 and 21 additional *cylchoedd meithrin* being established every year—if you share that out across Wales, and divide it up, it doesn't sound like an impractical goal, does it? Yes, there are questions in relation to funding to support it, but the ability is there, the experience is there, we can deliver on that. As long as we can have the correct *impetus* from the local authorities to work with us in relation to that, then it can be delivered and that is an inclusive provision for everyone in society.

[193] **Bethan Jenkins:** Neil, a oes unrhyw beth gennych chi i ddod nôl arno?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Neil, do you have anything more to say to come back?

[194] **Neil Hamilton:** The other question that arises, of course, is that education policy is decided by the Welsh Government, but the delivery mechanism is through local authorities. We all share the aspiration for 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, but do you think there's sufficient

integration and co-ordination between the Welsh Government and local authorities in the progression to the achievement of this aim?

[195] **Dr Morgan:** '*Patchy*', rydw i'n meddwl, yw un gair o ran y modd y mae hynny wedi cael ei ddelifro. Mae'r cysyniad o roi'r pwyslais ar awdurdodau lleol yn mesur y galw ac wedyn yn ymateb i'r galw yn swnio'n rhesymol, ond nid yw wedi gweithio yn ein profiad ni. Mae yna, efallai, enghreifftiau prin o hynny yn llwyddo, ac rŷm ni'n gwerthfawrogi yn fawr iawn y gwaith da iawn sydd yn digwydd mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol yn hynny o beth. Mae cynnydd wedi digwydd mewn rhai, ond nid yw'n wastad, nid yw'n gyson. Rŷch chi'n gweld o'r gwerthusiad diweddar o strategaeth addysg Gymraeg y Llywodraeth cyn lleied o gynnydd, mewn gwirionedd, sydd wedi cael ei wneud yn erbyn y targedau hynny. Mae gweithio gyda'r nifer hynny, wrth gwrs—. Nid wyf eisiau mynd yn wleidyddol, ond mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol a mudiad cenedlaethol sydd ag adnoddau prin pan ddaw at allu cydgysylltu â swyddogion addysg ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'n cynnig her, efallai, sydd yn drech na ni mewn gwirionedd, i fedru bod yn bresennol yn lobio, yn gweithio gyda swyddogion ym mhob ardal. Ond, lle mae hi'n berthynas dda ac adeiladol, mae'r gwaith yn datblygu'n dda.

**Dr Morgan:** '*Patchy*', I think, is one word in terms of the way that has been delivered. The concept of putting the emphasis on local authorities measuring demand and then responding to that demand sounds reasonable, but it hasn't worked in our experience. There may be scarce examples of success, and we do appreciate greatly the very good work that goes on in some local authorities in that context. There's been an increase in some, but it's not consistent. You can see from a recent evaluation of the Government's Welsh in education strategy how little progress has actually been made against those targets. Working with those numbers, of course—. I don't want to be political, but there are a number of local authorities and we're a national organisation that has scarce resources in terms of contacting educational officers throughout Wales. It does offer a challenge that perhaps is too great a challenge for us to be in attendance to lobby and to work with officers in every area. But, where it is a good relationship and a constructive one, the work is developing well.

[196] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae gennym ni gwestiynau ynglŷn ag ymgysylltu â'r gymuned. Mae Hannah

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thanks. We have questions now on community engagement. Hannah will lead on

yn mynd i arwain ar hyn.

this.

[197] **Hannah Blythyn:** Diolch. You said at the outset, I think, that we're very dependent on persuading more parents to make that choice to move their children in the early years to be taught through the medium of Welsh. I was interested to hear what percentage of children in Mudiad Meithrin came from homes where there was no Welsh spoken. I think, if we're going to reach this ambition of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050, then it's going to be very dependent on reaching out to those communities where, not only is the language not widely spoken, but perhaps where it's not really seen as something relevant or related to them. So, I was just wondering, from your perspective, are there any examples of best practice that can be learnt on this and built upon, and where are the major challenges within that?

[198] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Rydw i'n meddwl bod y cynllun newydd Cymraeg i Blant, sydd yn dal wrth gwrs yn ei ddyddiau cynnar, yn rhoi fframwaith cenedlaethol i ni fod yn cynnal y math yna o waith, a deall bod llawer iawn o rieni yn gwneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â gofal ac addysg a'r cyfrwng hyd yn oed cyn geni'r plentyn. Felly mae'r berthynas gyda'r sector iechyd, gyda bydwragedd, ymwelwyr iechyd, ac yn y blaen, yn hollbwysig o ran y gwaith cynllunio.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** I think that the new Cymraeg i Blant scheme, for which it is still early days of course, gives us a national framework so that we can undertake that kind of work, and understand that very many parents make a decision in relation to care and education provision even before a child is born. So, the relationship with midwives, the health sector and health visitors, of course, is extremely important in relation to the planning work.

[199] Os caf i gynnig anecdot personol ichi, rydw i wedi cael babi sydd, erbyn hyn, yn flwydd oed, a phan oedd o yn chwe mis, mi gefais i gyfathrebiad hyfryd gan Lywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn ag ymgyrch plannu coed, ymgyrch o'r enw Plant!, sydd yn enw addas iawn. Pwrpas y cyfathrebiad uniongyrchol yna imi, rydw i'n meddwl, oedd fy hysbysu i fod yna ddwy goeden wedi eu plannu ar ran Arthur mewn coedwig rhywle yng Nghymru a natur amgylcheddol y

Can I, perhaps, give you a personal anecdote? I've had a child, who is now a year old. When he was six months old, I had a very nice communication from the Welsh Government in relation to a tree-planting initiative called Plant!, which is a very apt name. The purpose of that direct communication, I think, was to let me know that two trees had been planted on behalf of Arthur in a forest somewhere in Wales, and the environmental nature of the

neges. Beth oedd yn ddadlennol imi am y cyfathrebiad yna oedd bod yna ddefnydd felly o ddata genedigaethau byw er budd negeseuon sydd yn ddim oll i wneud ag iechyd uniongyrchol y plentyn, ond yn ymwneud â hyrwyddo ffordd o fyw. Felly, gan fod gennym ni fel mudiad ddim mynediad at ddata genedigaethau byw ac nid wyf i'n rhagweld y cawn ni fynediad at y data yna chwaith, tybed a oes yna gynsail wedi ei osod yn y fan honno i ddweud, 'Wel, beth am inni gyrraedd rheini'n uniongyrchol?'—o'n safbwynt ni i fod yn sicrhau bod pob rhiant yn gwybod am fanteision dewis gofal ac addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, ac os nad yn gwthio neges am y manteision, yna'n sicrhau bod y rhieni'n gwybod bod ganddyn nhw ddewis? Achos rydw i'n meddwl mai rhan o'r broblem weithiau ydy bod y rheini ddim o reidrwydd yn deall bod dewis ar gael iddyn nhw yn gymunedol ac yn lleol o ran cyfrwng y ddarpariaeth.

[200] Felly, mae'n gwaith ni i raddau wedi ei—. Nid wyf yn gwybod, achos mae 'llesteirio' yn air rhy gryf, ond mae yna her yn y ffaith bod ein gwaith marchnata ni yn anuniongyrchol. Nid oes gennym ni fynediad uniongyrchol at rieni sydd newydd gael plant neu sydd â phlentyn yn ddwy flwydd oed. Mi fuaswn i'n dadlau bod yna gynsail drwy'r ymgyrch plannu coed, Plant!, i ddweud, 'A oes yna rywbeth creadigol inni wneud?'

message. What was very revealing to me in relation to that communication was that use is made, therefore, of data on live births in the context of messages that are not related to a child's health, but related to promoting a lifestyle. So, given that we don't have access, as Mudiad Meithrin, to data with regard to live births, and I don't foresee us being given access either, has a precedent been set there to say, 'Well, what about contacting parents directly?' — from our perspective, to make sure that they all know about the advantages of choosing Welsh-medium care and education, and if we're not pushing a message about the advantages, then certainly making sure that parents know they have a choice? Because I think part of the problem, sometimes, is that parents don't realise that there is a choice available to them on a community and local level in relation to the medium of the provision.

So, our work, to some extent—. I'm not sure if 'hampered' is putting it too strongly, but there is certainly a challenge in that our marketing work is indirect. We don't have direct access to those parents who have just had children or maybe have a two-year-old. I would argue that there is a precedent through that tree-planting campaign, Plant!, for us to say, 'Is there something creative that we can do here?'

[201] Felly, o safbwynt ein gwaith ni a chyrraedd y rhieni rydych chi'n cyfeirio atyn nhw, gwaith anuniongyrchol ydy o, yn ymwneud â marchnata, gweithio gyda'r ysgolion, gweithio gyda'r sector iechyd, mynd allan, bod yn lladmerydd dros ofal ac addysg Gymraeg a gweithio ar lefel gymunedol hefyd—gweithio gyda staff y cylchoedd meithrin sydd, yn aml iawn, yn llysgenhadon gwych eu hunain o safbwynt y gofal a'r addysg sydd ar gael i blant rhwng dwy a phedair oed yn lleol, â nhw eu hunain, o bosib, wedi cael cyffyrddiad efo'r Gymraeg drwy'r cylch meithrin.

[202] **Dr Morgan:** Mae ymgysylltu cymunedol yn bwynt hynod o bwysig, rydw i'n credu, o safbwynt gwreiddiau'r mudiad, oherwydd mae gan bob cylch meithrin bwyllgor o wirfoddolwyr yn lleol, yn drysorydd, yn gadeirydd, yn nifer o bobl o'r gymuned sydd yn cefnogi, fel rhieni, plant yn y cylch. Maen nhw'n gweithredu fel mentrau cymdeithasol eu hunain ledled y wlad a drwy'r gwaith y maen nhw'n ei wneud a'r gwasanaeth sy'n cael ei gynnig i blant, yn ofal rhan amser a llawn amser, maen nhw'n galluogi miloedd o rieni i gael gwaith. Rydym ni'n cyflogi drwy'r mudiad ymhell dros 2,000 o bobl broffesiynol, ond drwy waith y mudiad rydym yn galluogi degau o filoedd i fedru mynd allan i chwilio am waith a datblygu gyrfa.

[203] **Bethan Jenkins:** Felly gallwn ni

So, in relation to our work and reaching those parents you referred to, it is indirect work, which is linked to marketing, working with the schools, working with the health sector, going out, being a spokesperson for Welsh-medium care and education, and also working on a community level—working with staff in the *cylchoedd meithrin* who are, often, fantastic ambassadors themselves in relation to the care and education available to children between two and four years of age on a local level, and they also, possibly, have had a link with the Welsh language through those *cylchoedd*.

**Dr Morgan:** Community engagement is an extremely important point, I think, in terms of the roots of the organisation, because every *cylch meithrin* has a committee of local volunteers, be they the treasurer, the chair or people in the community who support, as parents, children in the *cylch*. They operate as social enterprises themselves across the country and through the work that they do and the service that's offered to children in terms of part-time and full-time care, they enable thousands of parents to go to work. We employ, through the organisation, over 2,000 professional people, but through the work of the organisation, we enable tens of thousands to go to look for work and develop their career.

**Bethan Jenkins:** So, we can unite this

uno'r cysyniad yma o Plant! o gael enwau ar gyfer y coed drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac felly byddai hynny'n uno dau broject—amgylcheddol a'r Gymraeg. Ond y pwynt difrifol hefyd yw bod angen i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar beth mae'r Gweinidogion eraill yn ei wneud o fewn eu meysydd gwahanol, yn enwedig yn y maes iechyd. A ydych chi'n credu bod digon o waith yn hynny o beth yn digwydd o ran ymwelwyr iechyd, yn gynnar iawn ym mywydau pobl? Achos gwnaethom ni glywed eto gan y rhanddeiliaid a ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth inni yn anffurfiol nad oedd rhai rhieni'n ymwybodol o'r dewisiadau hynny a bod angen i'r maes iechyd fod yn gryfach o lawer yn hynny.

[204] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** A derbyn bod ymwelydd iechyd yn trafod gyda'r rhiant newydd pob math o faterion sy'n ymwneud â lles y plentyn, er enghraifft, pwysigrwydd imiwneiddio neu bwysigrwydd darllen i'r plentyn bach a gwneud dewisiadau doeth ynglŷn â ffordd o fyw o safbwynt deiet ac yn y blaen, rydw i'n credu bod yna gynsail wedi ei osod i ddweud, 'Wel, a oes yna gyfrwng i'r ymwelydd iechyd gynnal sgwrs â rhieni newydd ynglŷn â chyfrwng iaith y gofal a'r addysg y mae'r rhiant hwnnw yn bwriadu ei ddewis?'

[205] **Bethan Jenkins:** Felly, mae hynny'n eu sgilio nhw hefyd; nid yn unig uwchsgilio yn y sector addysg

idea of Plant! by having Welsh-medium names for those trees and that could unite the two projects, the Welsh language and environment. But the key point there is that we do need the Government to look at what other Ministers are doing within their various areas, especially in health. Do you think that enough work is being done in relation to health visitors, very early on in children's lives? Because we heard once again from the stakeholders who gave us informal evidence that some parents were not aware of those choices available to them and that the health sector needs to be far stronger in that regard.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** Accepting that a health visitor discusses with the new parent all sorts of issues that are related to the well-being of the child, for example, the importance of immunisation or the importance of reading to the small child and making wise choices in terms of lifestyle and diet and so on, I think a precedent has been set to say, 'Well, is there a way for the health visitor to have a conversation with the new parent about the medium of language of the care and the education that that parent would choose?'

**Bethan Jenkins:** So, it's upskilling them; not only upskilling in the education sector, but also upskilling



ond uwchsgilio yn sectorau eraill Llywodraeth Cymru.

in the other sectors of the Welsh Government.

[206] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Mae hynny yn digwydd, ond rwy'n credu, fel rydych chi'n ei awgrymu, fod yna dystiolaeth bod yna arfer gwych a bod yna arfer llai gwych. Efallai bod hynny'n ymwneud ag unigolion. Pwy a wŷr? Nid wyf i'n arbenigwr ar y maes iechyd, ond rwy'n credu bod yna gynsail a bod yna arferion da y gallwn ni bwyntio atynt a dweud, 'Mae'n rhaid inni efelychu hyn ymhellach.' Mae'r gwaith hwnnw, y buaswn i'n ei gynnig, yn digwydd gyda'r bydwragedd hefyd, nid yn unig efo'r ymwelwyr iechyd. Mae yna gyfle inni wneud hynny. Ac mae'r berthynas rhwng Mudiad Meithrin, drwy Cymraeg i Blant, a'r colegau bydwragedd, er enghraifft, yn cryfhau. Rydym yn rhoi cyflwyniad i ddarpar-fydwagedd ar waith Mudiad Meithrin, y cynllun Cymraeg i Blant, a'r manteision gwybyddol sydd yn dod o gaffael mwy nag un iaith yn ystod y blynyddoedd cynnar. Felly, mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n digwydd ond, yn sicr, rwy'n credu bod yna le i'w gryfhau.

**Dr Lansdown Davies:** That is happening, but I think, as you suggested, there is evidence that there is excellent practice and there is practice that is not as excellent. Perhaps that relates to individuals. Who knows? I'm not an expert in the health field, but I think there is a precedent and there are good practices that we can look at and say, 'We need to take this further and emulate.' That work, I would suggest, is happening with midwives as well, not only with health visitors. There is an opportunity for us to do that. The relationship between Mudiad Meithrin, through Cymraeg i Blant, and the midwifery colleges, for example, is strengthening. We provide an introduction to midwives who are in training on Mudiad Meithrin, the scheme of Cymraeg i Blant and the cognitive advantages of acquiring more than one language during the early years. Therefore, that work is ongoing but, certainly, I think there is an opportunity to strengthen this.

[207] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes yna gwestiwn ychwanegol gennyt ti?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Do you have another question?

[208] **Hannah Blythyn:** No.

[209] **Bethan Jenkins:** Unrhyw gwestiwn arall? Grêt. Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi am roi dystiolaeth gerbron. Wrth gwrs, mae croeso ichi edrych ar

**Bethan Jenkins:** Any other questions? Thank you very much for giving us your evidence today. You're very welcome to look at what we're doing

yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud fel as a committee, and our final report  
pwyllgor, a'r adroddiad terfynol. will be published. We will send you a  
Byddwn yn danfon record atoch o'r record of everything that's been  
hyn a oedd yn cael ei drafod yma discussed here today. Thank you very  
heddiw. Diolch yn fawr. much.

[210] **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Diolch yn **Dr Lansdown Davies:** Thank you.  
fawr.

[211] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rydym yn **Bethan Jenkins:** We're going to take a  
mynd i gael seibiant byr nawr, felly break now. So, you are welcome to  
mae croeso ichi fynd a dod yn ôl. leave and return later. Thank you  
Diolch yn fawr. very much.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:41 a 10:52.  
The meeting adjourned between 10:41 and 10:52.*

**Ymchwiliad i Strategaeth Iaith Gymraeg Ddrafft Llywodraeth Cymru:  
Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 3  
Inquiry into the Welsh Government's Draft Welsh Language Strategy:  
Evidence Session 3**

[212] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very  
iawn. Rydym ni'n parhau â'r sesiwn much. We continue this session  
dystiolaeth gan y sector addysg o ran taking evidence from the education  
amcan y Llywodraeth i gyrraedd sector in terms of the Welsh  
miliwn o siaradwyr Cymraeg erbyn Government's aim to reach a million  
2050. Gyda ni heddiw mae'r tystion Welsh speakers by 2050. Today we  
lestyn Davies, prif weithredwr have witnesses lestyn Davies, the  
ColegauCymru; Dr Ioan Matthews, chief executive of Colegau Cymru; Dr  
prif weithredwr y Coleg Cymraeg Ioan Matthews, chief executive, Coleg  
Cenedlaethol; a Dr Gwennan Cymraeg Cenedlaethol; and Dr  
Schiavone, ysgrifennydd y cwmni ac Gwennan Schiavone, company  
uwch reolwr academiaidd y Coleg secretary and senior academic  
Cymraeg Cenedlaethol. Teitl neis yna. manager of Coleg Cymraeg  
Cenedlaethol. A nice title there.

[213] Rydym ni'n mynd i fynd i We're going to go to questions  
mewn i gwestiynau yn syth, os mae straight away, if that's okay with you.  
hynny'n iawn gyda chi. Y cwestiynau First question, obviously: do you

cyntaf, yn amlwg: a ydych chi'n credu bod yr her o gyrraedd miliwn o siaradwyr erbyn 2050 yn realistig? A ydych chi'n credu bod angen cynlluniau—pa gynlluniau ymarferol yr ydych chi'n credu y byddai eu hangen er mwyn gwneud hyn yn realiti? Sut wedyn ydych chi'n gweld eich gwaith chi yn rhan o greu'r agenda tuag at symud at yr amcan hwnnw?

[214] **Dr Matthews:** A gaf i gychwyn? Byddwn i'n amlwg yn croesawu'r strategaeth a chroesawu'r dyhead, ond hefyd croesawu'r ffaith bod yna fwrriad i gynllunio yn strategol tuag at wireddu'r dyhead hwnnw. Rydym wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad yn ddiweddar, ac wedi nodi, rydw i'n meddwl, bod angen cynllun gweithredu hirdymor, ond hefyd camau penodol pendant yn y tymor byr i weithio tuag at y targedau hirdymor hynny. Felly, rydym ni'n sicr yn croesawu'r strategaeth ac yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu mewn gwahanol ffyrdd—mae'n bosibl y gallwn ymhelaethu arnyn nhw.

[215] Hefyd, rydym yn teimlo bod yna elfen arall sydd angen sylw, sy'n sicrhau bod y strategaeth hon yn cael ei pherchnogi ar draws holl ystod gwaith y Llywodraeth, ar draws yr holl sectorau a'r holl adrannau. Mae hynny hefyd yn bwysig fel man cychwyn.

[216] **Mr Davies:** Rydw i'n cytuno. Rydw i'n credu mai beth sy'n bwysig

think that the challenge of reaching a million Welsh speakers by 2050 is realistic? Do you think there's a need for any plans—what practical plans do you think are needed to reach this and to make it a reality? How do you see your work being part of creating the agenda for moving towards that aim?

**Dr Matthews:** May I begin? I certainly would welcome the strategy, and welcome the desire, but also the idea that we do need to plan strategically in relation to realising that aim. We have responded to the consultation recently, and we have noted that we need a long-term action plan, but also specific steps in the short term to work towards those long-term targets. So, certainly we welcome the strategy. We welcome the opportunity to contribute to that in many different ways—it's possible that we can expand on those.

And also we feel that there is another aspect that needs attention, which is making sure that this strategy is owned by all sectors and departments within Government. We think that's very important as a starting point.

**Mr Davies:** I agree. I think what's important now is for us to

ar hyn o bryd yw ein bod ni'n cydnabod, gan fod hwn mor heriol, bod yn rhaid i chi ddefnyddio amryw o ffyrdd er mwyn cyflawni'r targed hynny. I ryw raddau, mae'n gêm o niferoedd, onid yw e? Os ydych chi eisiau cael deiliant o filiwn, mae'n rhaid ichi gael y niferoedd yn cael eu rhoi mewn ar un ochr er mwyn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Nid yw hi mor *sterile* â hynny, wrth gwrs—mae hi llawer yn fwy cymhleth—ond, i ryw raddau, rydych chi'n sôn am niferoedd.

[217] O'n rhan ni, efallai rhywbeth sy'n bwysig, nid yn unig ar gyfer y pwyllgor yma ond yn ehangach, yw ein bod ni'n parchu, i ryw raddau, y ddadl ynglŷn â hawliau, y Mesur a'r safonau, sef creu cyd-destun, llwyfan a chydbwysedd ar gyfer hawliau'r iaith, a'n bod ni'n dechrau nawr ystyried beth sydd eisiau ei wneud er mwyn nodi taw'r ffordd orau ymlaen, er mwyn cyflawni'r nod, yw sicrhau ein bod ni'n deall yr her hyfedredd, ein bod ni'n gweld iaith a defnydd o'r Gymraeg fel sgîl a'n bod ni'n trio ymestyn ein hystyriaeth ni o sut mae codi hyfedredd ar gyfer niferoedd helaeth. Rydych chi'n sôn bob blwyddyn am dros chwarter miliwn o ddysgwyr sy'n mynd trwy golegau FE, er enghraifft. Felly, os ydych chi'n targedu hyfedredd a'r *cohort* hynny o ddysgwyr, mae yna fodd ichi gyrraedd y targed o filiwn, efallai, llawer yn gynharach na thrwy ddefnyddio'r ffynonellau a'r ffyrdd presennol o wneud hynny.

acknowledge, because this is so challenging, that you'll have to use a number of ways in order to achieve that target. To some extent, it's a game of numbers, isn't it? If you want to have an outcome of a million, you have to have those figures going in at one end to achieve that target. It's not as sterile as that, of course—it's much more complex—but, to some extent, you're talking about figures.

On our part, I think what's important, not only for this committee but in a broader sense, is that we respect the argument on rights, the Measure and standards—creating a context or platform for language rights—and that we start, now, to consider what needs to be done in order to identify that the best way forward to achieve this aim is to ensure that we understand the aim with regard to ability, that we see this as a skill and that we try to extend our consideration of increasing ability. You're talking about a quarter of a million learners every year going through the colleges, for example. So, if you tackle this and that cohort of learners, there is a way of reaching the target of a million, perhaps, much earlier than using the current sources.

[218] **Bethan Jenkins:** Gwennan.

[219] **Dr Schiavone:** Byddwn i'n croesawu'r ffaith fod y strategaeth yn anelu i fod yn uchelgeisiol iawn. Yn amlwg, mae hynny'n gosod her benodol wedyn, achos pan mae rhywun yn gosod uchelgais, yn amlwg mae'n golygu gwaith caled er mwyn cyrraedd hynny. Yn amlwg, beth sy'n rhaid dilyn y strategaeth ydy'r adnoddau digonol i weithredu'r elfennau gwahanol o fewn y strategaeth.

**Dr Schiavone:** I think I would certainly welcome the fact that the strategy is very ambitious. Of course, that then sets a specific challenge, because you need to do a lot of work to get to that goal. Also, what has to follow the strategy is sufficient resources to put those plans into action.

[220] Rwy'n meddwl mai'r hyn sydd hefyd i'w groesawu yw'r angen yna i edrych ar y darlun cyflawn, ac nid dim ond trin y sector addysg, y gweithle neu beth bynnag arall ar wahân. Mae angen edrych ar y darlun llawn. Mae rhoi bri ar sgiliau iaith yn y gweithle yn rhan o'r ymgyrch ehangach yna o sicrhau bod rhieni'n gweld gwerth i'r iaith wrth fagu eu plant, ac yn y blaen, ac yn gam tuag at sicrhau dilyniant. Felly, mae'r egwyddor yna o edrych ar y darlun llawn, rwy'n meddwl, yn bwysig.

What we'd also like to welcome is the need to look at the full picture and not just the education sector, the workforce or whatever else as separate entities. We do need to look at the full picture. We also need to put a stress on language skills in the workplace as part of the wider strategy of ensuring that parents value the language in bringing up their children, and see it as a step towards ensuring language progression. I think that that idea of looking at the big picture is very important.

[221] Wedyn, mae eisiau sicrhau, yn amlwg, fod pob cynllun sy'n dilyn y strategaeth yn adeiladu ac yn cefnogi ei gilydd, nid yn torri ar draws ei gilydd mewn unrhyw ffordd.

We also need to make sure that all of the plans that follow this strategy work together and don't interrupt each other.

[222] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae gennym ni gwestiynau gan Jeremy nawr, sy'n mynd i ganolbwyntio ar

**Bethan Jenkins:** We have questions from Jeremy now, who's going to concentrate on further education and

addysg bellach ac wedyn cyffwrdd ar addysg uwch. then touch on higher education.

[223] **Jeremy Miles:** O safbwynt y sector addysg bellach, beth, ar hyn o bryd, yw'r ddarpariaeth drwy'r Gymraeg, yn nhermau argaeledd ac o safbwynt ansawdd hefyd? **Jeremy Miles:** From the perspective of further education, what is the current level of Welsh language provision in terms of availability and quality?

[224] **Mr Davies:** Mae'n newid o goleg i goleg ac o gampws i gampws y tu fewn i golegau. Wrth gwrs, 14—neu 12, efallai—o golegau sydd gennym ni bellach, felly mae'r ddarpariaeth yn newid. Byddai yna fodd, efallai, inni holi yn blwmp ac yn blaen, ar gyfer y pwyllgor, yn union beth yw'r niferoedd hynny. Gallaf ymateb ichi drwy lythyr, os byddai hynny o help ichi. Mae'n rhaid inni dderbyn, wrth gwrs, fod y ddarpariaeth hynny yn wahanol ac yn dibynnu ar ba fath o gwrs ac ar ba fath o lefel—a ydych chi'n sôn am ddarpariaeth alwedigaethol neu am ddarpariaeth lefel A, er enghraifft? Felly, mae'n bwysig gweld bod yna ystod eang. Mae ateb y niferoedd yn un peth, a deall y ddarpariaeth honno yn beth gwahanol. **Mr Davies:** It is different between colleges and between campuses within colleges. Of course, we have 14—or perhaps 12—colleges, so the provision changes. If you'd like, I could send you a letter on the specific numbers. We also have to accept that the provision is different, and depends on what type of course you're following and at what level you're studying—are you talking about vocational provision or, maybe, A-level provision, for example? So, it's important to understand that we have a wide range here. Understanding the provision and looking at numbers are two different things.

[225] **Jeremy Miles:** Ydy. O safbwynt y sblit hynny rhwng lefel A a'r cymwysterau galwedigaethol, beth yw'r darlun cyffredinol yn nhermau darpariaeth? **Jeremy Miles:** Yes. Looking at that split between A-levels and vocational qualifications, what's the general picture in relation to provision?

[226] **Mr Davies:** Mae yna fwy o ddarpariaeth, wrth gwrs, yn nhermau'r elfen alwedigaethol. Felly, yn y fan honno rydych yn gweld bod **Mr Davies:** Well, there is more provision in relation to the vocational element, and that's where we see the extensive opportunities to increase

yna gyfleon i godi'r ddarpariaeth. Un o'r pethau rydym ni'n chwilio am gyfle i'w wneud ar hyn o bryd yw sicrhau ein bod ni'n deall yn blwmp ac yn blaen beth yw'r ffigurau hynny. Gallaf ysgrifennu atoch, os ydych chi eisiau, o ran rhoi ffigurau ar hynny ar—nid ydyn nhw gyda fi ar hyn o bryd.

[227] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch. Yn gyffredinol, beth yw'r rhwystredigaethau neu'r heriau i gynyddu'r lefel o ddarpariaeth? A oes gennych chi ddarlun o hynny?

[228] **Mr Davies:** Oes. Yr elfen fwyaf, rwy'n credu, yw'r gweithlu—a yw'r tiwtoriaid, y darlithwyr a'r aseswyr ar gael i fedru cynnal y ddarpariaeth bresennol, yn enwedig os ydym ni am godi'r lefel hynny? Y peth arall yw beth yn union rydym yn trio ei greu. A ydym ni'n trio creu ffrwd arall, sef rhywbeth mewn paralel drwy gyflwyno'r Gymraeg law yn llaw â'r ddarpariaeth uniaith Saesneg, neu a ydym ni'n trio creu darpariaeth ddwyieithog ac wedyn benthg yr arfer da ar draws y byd er mwyn cyrraedd y nod hynny?

[229] Ar hyn o bryd, nid wyf yn credu ei bod hi'n glir beth yw'r amcan. Oes, mae yna amcan o dros filiwn o siaradwyr, ond, y tu fewn i'r colegau, a ydym yn trio creu ffrwd Cymraeg a ffrwd Saesneg i'r un cyfeiriad neu a ydym yn trio plethu'r ddau er mwyn creu deilliannau

provision. One thing we're looking to do at the moment is look at those figure and understand what those figures are. I can write to you with the specific figures on that, if you like—I don't have them at the moment.

**Jeremy Miles:** In general, what do you think the frustrations or the challenges are in relation to increasing the level of provision?

**Mr Davies:** I think the workforce is, certainly, the biggest challenge—do we have the tutors, the lecturers and the assessors available in order to be able to sustain the current provision? If we want to raise it even higher, it's going to be a challenge. The other thing is to look at what exactly we're trying to create. Are we looking at creating another stream—something with Welsh and English running in parallel with each other—or are we trying to create bilingual provision and maybe using, then, good practice from across the world to reach that goal?

At the moment, I don't think it's clear what the goal is in relation to reaching a million speakers. So, within the colleges, are we looking at English and Welsh streams running together in parallel, or are we trying to bring them together and looking at bilingual outcomes? That's not

dwyeithrwydd? Nid yw hynny'n glir ar hyn o bryd.

[230] **Jeremy Miles:** A oes syniad o fewn y sector o beth yw'r ffordd ddefnyddiol o symud ymlaen?

**Jeremy Miles:** Is there some idea within the sector in relation to the ideal way of moving forward?

[231] **Mr Davies:** Mae yna amryw ystyriaethau o beth yw'r ddefnydd—beth rydym eisiau ei gyrraedd—ac mae yna wahanol ffyrdd o gyrraedd hynny. Un o'r pethau rŷm ni wedi'i wneud yn ColegauCymru yw trio asesu beth sy'n digwydd yng Ngwlad y Basg. Rŷm ni wrthi'n trefnu mynd draw i Gatalwnia yn hwyrach y flwyddyn nesaf i ddeall beth yn union yw eu nod a'u targedau nhw. Ond, yn amlwg, mae yna wahanol ffyrdd o gyrraedd y nod hwnnw, boed hynny'n darparu ar y cyd yn Gymraeg a Saesneg neu eich bod chi'n cael dosbarthiadau ar wahân—mae yna wahanol ffyrdd o wneud hynny ac mae gwahanol fodolau rhyngwladol yn bodoli. Y cwestiwn yw yn y lle cyntaf, beth ym ni eisiau ei wneud: ai dwy ddarpariaeth, neu un ar gyfer yr un nod sydd eisiau?

**Mr Davies:** There have been many considerations in relation to what we'd like to achieve, and there are different ways of achieving that. One thing we have done in ColegauCymru is try to assess what's happening in the Basque Country. We're also looking at going to Catalunya next year to understand what their targets are. But, clearly, there are different ways of reaching that goal, whether that's through joint provision of Welsh and English or whether you have separate classes—there are different ways of doing it, and different international models exist. The first question is what are we trying to achieve: two different types of provision or one provision towards the same aim?

11:00

[232] **Jeremy Miles:** A oes syniad gyda chi o ran a yw'r galw yn cael ei ddarparu neu ei ddiwallu ar hyn o bryd? A oes galw sydd ddim yn cael ei ddiwallu gan y colegau ar hyn o bryd?

**Jeremy Miles:** Do you have an idea of whether the demand is being met? Is there a demand that is not being met by the colleges at the moment?

[233] **Mr Davies:** Y cwestiwn yw: beth yw maint y galw, a phwy sy'n

**Mr Davies:** The question is: what is the amount of demand and who is



gosod y galw hynny? Yn ehangach, wrth gwrs, ym maes sgiliau ac addysg alwedigaethol rydym yn dibynnu i ryw raddau ar y galw yn cael ei amlygu gan fusnes, neu gan y sector byd gwaith. Mae yna broblemau yn hynny. Yn enwedig, mae gennych chi sector yr economi, sy'n dibynnu cymaint ar fusnesau bach. Y cwestiwn yw: pa mor *accurate* yw'r galw hynny? Felly, mae yna beth maen nhw'n galw weithiau y *demand-side model*. Beth rŷm ni'n trio ei greu, wrth gwrs, yw *supply-side model* ar hyn o bryd. Mae yna elfen o gydbwysu'r ddau hynny. Nid oes yna ddim pwynt creu lot o ddarpariaeth sgiliau yn ehangach os nad oes angen am hynny gan y cyflogwyr. Ond yn yr un modd, rŷm ni'n trio creu mwy o siaradwyr Cymraeg trwy golegau FE, felly mae eisiau cael y cydbwysedd hwnnw yn hollol iawn. Ond nid ydw i'n credu bod hynny'n wir am ddarpariaeth ehangach sgiliau. Felly, rŷm ni'n dioddef o ddiffyg strategaeth tymor hir ar gyfer rôl a beth rydym ni ei eisiau gan FE—a'r iaith Gymraeg ei hunan hefyd. Felly, mae eisiau datrys hynny tu fewn i strategaeth ehangach FE, ac wedyn clymu hynny i mewn i'r strategaeth hwnnw.

[234] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Suzy gwestiwn penodol ar hynny, ac wedyn gwnaf ddod nôl atat ti, Jeremy, os mae hynny'n iawn.

setting that demand? Of course, in skills and vocational education we are relying on the demand being shown by the business world or the work sector. There are problems in that. In particular, you have the economy sector, which relies so much on small businesses. The question is: how accurate is that demand? Therefore, there is what they call sometimes the demand-side model. What we're trying to create, of course, is a supply-side model at the moment. There is an element of trying to balance both. There is no point creating a lot of wider skills provision if there's no call for it by employers. But in the same way, we're trying to create more Welsh speakers through FE colleges, so we need to get that balance completely right. But I don't think that's true for wider skills provision, so we're suffering from a lack of long-term strategy for the role of FE and what we want from it—and the Welsh language too. So, we need to solve that within the wider FE strategy and then tie that into this strategy.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy has a specific question on this and then I'll come back to you, Jeremy, if that's all right.

[235] **Suzy Davies:** Just to develop a point you'd already started on, actually, Jeremy, about how much Welsh is used in English-medium courses at the

moment. I appreciate that you say that, over time, hopefully, there'll be no distinction to observe, but at the moment there is, and I'm wondering what level of resistance you're getting from course designers to include as a matter of course the use of Welsh in vocational courses, particularly those that are outward-facing—social care, and hair and beauty, even. Is there any formal information or stats on this at the moment, or is it just a sort of anecdotal piece of evidence you're able to give us?

[236] **Mr Davies:** Ie, ychydig yn anecdotaidd yw e. Nid ydw i'n credu ein bod ni'n gweld llawer o *barriers* yn cael eu rhoi mewn lle. O'r sgysiau rydw i'n eu cael pan rydw i'n mynd i golegau, efo pob pennaeth a phob pennaeth adran, mae yna ddealltwriaeth bod yna ddyhead i ddarparu. Rydw i'n credu mai'r her fwyaf yw, pe baem ni'n symud ein model darpariaeth ni, na fydd y gweithlu ar gael. Efallai nad yw'r hyder gan y rhai sydd yn medru'r Gymraeg, hyd yn oed tu fewn i'r gweithlu. I ryw raddau, rwy'n credu bod hynny'n debyg rhwng FE a HE—bod angen rhoi mwy o gyfleon i bobl magu hyder yn eu byd gwaith nhw yn yr un modd yr ym ni'n rhoi hyder i'r dysgwyr, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n creu'r diwylliant yma ei bod yn iawn i chi ddefnyddio'r iaith, ac i fentro'r iaith yn y lle cyntaf.

**Mr Davies:** I think it is a bit anecdotal at the moment. I don't think we're seeing a lot of barriers here. From the discussions I've had in going to colleges with heads, or the heads of department, I think there is an understanding that there's a desire to provide that provision, and I think the biggest challenge is, if we move to that model of provision, the workforce may not be available. Perhaps the confidence isn't there amongst those Welsh speakers within the Welsh-speaking workforce. I think that that's similar between FE and HE in that we need to give more opportunities to people to increase their confidence in their work, in the same way as we give learners confidence, to ensure that we create this culture that it's okay to use the Welsh language.

[237] Nid yw'n amlwg bod unrhyw *kickback* neu unrhyw beth mawr sy'n stopio hynny rhag ddigwydd. Mae jest yn gwestiwn o sut rŷm ni'n ei wneud.

I haven't seen any kickback or anything significant that would stop this from happening. I think it's a case of how we do it.

[238] **Suzy Davies:** A beth am y myfyrwyr?

**Suzy Davies:** And what about the students?

[239] **Mr Davies:** Gyda'r dysgwyr, os

**Mr Davies:** For the learners, if I can

caf i ddiffinio hynny yn wahanol—

define that differently—

[240] **Suzy Davies:** Wel, y rhai heb sgiliau Cymraeg.

**Suzy Davies:** What about the ones who don't have the Welsh-medium skills?

[241] **Mr Davies:** Rwy'n meddwl eich bod yn delio â'r un sefyllfa. Mae'n amlwg bod yna ddysgwyr—cyn-ddisgyblion ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg—wedi gwneud dewis, tra eu bod nhw'n troi yn ddysgwyr trwy adael yr ysgol, i fynd i golegau Saesneg ac i ddilyn cyrsiau Saesneg. Mae hynny yn amlwg yn digwydd. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n werth inni ddeall pam fod hynny'n digwydd. Beth sydd wedi eu hachosi nhw, efallai, i ddewis y cam nesaf trwy'r iaith Saesneg? Ai penderfynu eu bod nhw wedi cael digon, fel petai, o astudio drwy'r Cymraeg yw hwn, neu jest eu bod nhw'n dewis dilyn cwrs—efallai cwrs academaidd neu gwrs galwedigaethol—sydd ddim ar gael yn yr ysgolion? Rwy'n credu ei bod yn bwysig nad ydym ni'n neidio yn gamarweiniol i ddeall pam mae hynny'n digwydd. Efallai ei bod hi'n werth chweil inni wneud mwy o waith arolwg a thrio deall y cwestiwn hwnnw. Ond mae'n amlwg bod rhai dysgwyr yn gwneud penderfyniad personol fel pobl ifanc i beidio â dilyn trywydd iaith Gymraeg, am pa bynnag reswm.

**Mr Davies:** I think you're dealing with the same situation there. I think there are former pupils from Welsh-medium schools who have made a choice as they become learners in leaving school to go to English-medium colleges and follow English-medium courses. That of course does happen. I think perhaps it's best for us to try and understand why that happens and what has caused that—why have they chosen their next step through the medium of English? Is it because they've had enough, as it were, of Welsh-medium study, or because they decide to follow an academic or a vocational course that isn't available in the schools? I think it is important that we don't jump to any conclusions here about why this happens, but it would be worthwhile for us to do more survey work, perhaps, to understand this. But clearly some learners do make a very personal choice as young people not to follow a Welsh-medium pathway, for whichever reason.

[242] **Suzy Davies:** Nid hynny oedd y cwestiwn, ond nid wyf eisiau torri ar draws, felly—

**Suzy Davies:** That wasn't the question, but I don't want to cut across, so—

- [243] **Bethan Jenkins:** Na, mae'n iawn. **Bethan Jenkins:** No, it's okay.
- [244] **Suzy Davies:** Nid oeddwn i'n sôn am fyfyrwyr o gefndir Cymraeg. Roeddwn i'n sôn am fyfyrwyr sy'n dod o gefndir di-Gymraeg, sy'n dod o hyd i'r Cymraeg, efallai—wel, nid am y tro cyntaf, ond sy'n cael syndod bod disgwyl iddyn nhw siarad tipyn o Gymraeg yn eu cyrsiau Saesneg, mewn rhai galwedigaethol. A ydyn nhw'n cwyno, 'O, blwmin Cymraeg', neu ydyn nhw'n falch i weld—? **Suzy Davies:** I wasn't really talking about those with a Welsh background. I'm more interested in those coming from a non-Welsh-speaking background who've come across the Welsh language, maybe not for the first time, but maybe are a bit shocked that they are expected to speak some Welsh in their English courses—in some vocational courses. Do they complain, 'Oh, blooming Welsh', or are they pleased—?
- [245] **Mr Davies:** Anecdote yw hynny. **Mr Davies:** Well, this is an anecdote, isn't it?
- [246] **Suzy Davies:** Rwy'n gwybod hynny. **Suzy Davies:** I know that.
- [247] **Mr Davies:** Ond nid oes arolwg gennym ni sy'n ein helpu ni i ddeall hynny. Ond, yn amlwg, mae'n digwydd. Mae yna rai pobl ifanc sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau drostyn nhw eu hunain efallai am y tro cyntaf pan maen nhw'n 16, ac nid wyf i'n amau am eiliad taw un o'r dewisiadau hynny yw dewis iaith—dewis iaith y pwnc, iaith y dosbarth a phethau eraill. **Mr Davies:** We don't have any survey information that would help us to understand that. But, clearly, it does happen. There are some young people who make independent decisions for the first time when they're 16 years old, and I'm sure that one of those choices is a choice in relation to language—the subject language, the language of the classroom and so on.
- [248] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr. **Suzy Davies:** Thank you very much.
- [249] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae Dawn eisiau dod i mewn yn glou. Nid wyf i'n gwybod a yw Dr Ioan Matthews a Gwennan eisiau dod i mewn hefyd. **Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn wants to come in quickly. I don't know whether Dr Ioan Matthews and Gwennan want to come in.

[250] **Dawn Bowden:** Thanks, Chair. It was just on the point you were making about demand, actually, and whether you see—all of you see—your role as just meeting existing demand or actually creating demand, because if we're going to achieve this, we've got to do more than just hit those people who currently volunteer, if you like, to come and take up courses. So, do you see your role as being creating demand as well?

[251] **Dr Matthews:** Yn fyr iawn ar hynny, rwy'n credu mai un o'r egwyddorion rydym ni wedi mabwysiadu dros y blynyddoedd ydy: tan eich bod chi'n creu'r ddarpariaeth, mae'n anodd iawn profi a oes yna alw amdano fe neu beidio. Felly, rhan o'n strategaeth ni dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf ydy ehangu'r dewis sydd ar gael i fyfyrwyr. Wedyn, pan fyddwch chi'n dod at y cwestiwn o beth sy'n symbylu myfyrwyr i wneud y penderfyniad, mae yna ymchwil wedi ei gwblhau. Gwnaethon ni adroddiad rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ac rwy'n meddwl bod y canfyddiadau yn dal i fod yn gywir. Pan fyddwch chi'n edrych ar y trwch myfyrwyr a fyddai'n medru dilyn darpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae gennych chi garfan sy'n benderfynol, 'Rydw i eisiau astudio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac rwy'n teimlo'n gryf iawn am y peth'. Mae yna garfan arall, fel roedd Iestyn yn awgrymu, sydd, am ba bynnag reswm, wedi penderfynu nad ydyn nhw'n dymuno gwneud, ac mae'n bosib bod angen gweld mwy am pam mae hynny, ond carfan gymharol fechan yw'r rheini. Mae'r mwyafrif yn y canol, mewn gwirionedd, yn mynd i ddilyn y ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael, ac os ydy e yno yn Gymraeg, mi wnawn nhw ei

**Dr Matthews:** Briefly, one of the principles that we've adopted over the years is that, until you create the provision, it's very difficult to prove whether there's demand for it or not. So, part of our strategy over the last five years has been to expand the options available to students. When you then come to the question of what makes students reach that decision, research has been completed. We produced a report a few years ago, and I think the findings are still correct. When you look at the majority of students who could follow Welsh-medium provision, you have a cohort that are determined to study through the medium of Welsh and feel very strongly about that. There is also another cohort, as Iestyn suggested, who, for whatever reason, have decided that they don't wish to do that and perhaps possibly we need to understand why that is, but they are a small proportion. But, the majority, those in the middle, are going to follow the provision that's available to them, and if it's there through the medium of Welsh, they will do it, and there are examples of that. So it's important, I think, to create the provision—there is a need for that balance. Not everything can be

wneud e, ac mae yna enghreifftiau o hynny. Felly, mae'n bwysig, rwy'n meddwl, creu—mae angen y cydbwysedd yna. Nid oes modd darparu popeth, wrth gwrs, ond bod y cyfle mor eang â phosib i astudio ystod mor eang â phosib o gyrsiau. Felly, dyna'r math o ystyriaethau cynllunio sydd gennym ni.

[252] **Mr Davies:** Mae yna ychydig o ymchwil wedi cael ei wneud ar ble mae'r galw, gan y Llywodraeth, ac rydym ni i gyd yn cydnabod y sectorau hynny, sef gofal plant, gofal iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol, gwasanaethau busnes, y diwydiannau creadigol, amaeth ac, wrth gwrs, twristiaeth. Felly, mae dealltwriaeth o ble mae'r galw, ond, unwaith eto, rydych chi'n camu i mewn i'r cwestiynau mwy sylweddol: pa mor ddilys, pa mor ddibynadwy yw'r *labour market intelligence* rydym ni'n ei ddefnyddio yn fanna, yn ehangach? Rhan o'r cwestiwn o ran galw yw'r cwestiwn o sgîl yn yr iaith Gymraeg, oherwydd rydym ni'n sôn am sgîl yn fan hyn, yn hytrach na'r hawl i gael darpariaeth trwy'r Gymraeg. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn dilys, dyrys arall ar wahân.

[253] **Dr Schiavone:** Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sut rydym ni'n hyrwyddo gwerth yr iaith i'n pobl ifanc ni. Yn 16 oed, mae myfyrwyr yn mynd i wneud dewisiadau sy'n llywio dyfodol eu gyrfaedd nhw. A ydym ni'n ddigon clir ynglŷn â gwerth y Gymraeg fel sgîl pan fyddan nhw'n

provided, but the opportunities need to be as broad as possible to study as broad a range of courses as possible. So, those are the sort of planning considerations that we have.

**Mr Davies:** There is some research that has been done in relation to where the demand exists, by the Government, and we do recognise those sectors, namely childcare, business, health, social services, the creative industries, agriculture and, of course, tourism. So, there is understanding of where that demand exists, but, once again, you have to consider the more substantial questions of how valid and how reliable the labour market intelligence that we use is, more widely. Part of the issue in relation to demand is in relation to skills within the Welsh language, because we are talking of a specific skill here, rather than the right to have Welsh-medium provision. That's another very valid, complex and separate question.

**Dr Schiavone:** I think it also relates to the way in which we promote the value of the language among young people. At 16 years old, students do make decisions that are important for their career. Are we being clear enough as to the value of the Welsh language as a skill in the workplace?

mynd i'r gweithle? Mae'n dilyn wedyn ei fod yn ymwneud â dewisiadau astudio drwy gyfrwng yr iaith, ond hefyd yn gwella eu sgiliau yn yr iaith, sy'n ddau beth gwahanol—yn gysylltiedig, ond maen nhw'n ddau beth gwahanol. Oni bai ein bod ni'n glir bod yna werth i'r sgîl at ddibenion cyflogadwyedd, yn ogystal â bywyd yn gyffredinol, yn gymdeithasol, ac yn y blaen, nid ydym ni'n mynd i fynd yn bell iawn gyda denu mwy o fyfyrwyr i astudio a manteisio ar y cyfleoedd sydd yna.

[254] Rydym ni wedi datblygu tystysgrif sgiliau iaith i fyfyrwyr, ac mae myfyrwyr yn gofyn, 'A oes gwerth i fi wneud hyn? A yw'n mynd i fod o help i ni?' Wel, wrth gwrs ei fod o. Mae unrhyw beth ychwanegol sydd gennych chi i fynd i'r gweithle yn help i chi. Os yw'n profi bod gennych chi lefel o sgîl mewn unrhyw faes, wrth gwrs ei fod o o werth, ac mae'n rhoi'r cyfleoedd pellach yna i chi. Nid wyf i'n meddwl ein bod ni'n ddigon cryf yn pwysleisio hynny i'n myfyrwyr ni ar hyn o bryd.

[255] **Mr Davies:** Jest i orffen, y ddarpariaeth bresennol, heb ei dorri fe i lawr, yw 8.4 y cant yn mynd i golegau *FE*, a'r targed a'r nod yw cyrraedd 10 y cant. Ond, er mwyn cyrraedd y targed hynny, mae eisiau sicrhau nid yn unig bod dealltwriaeth o'r galw a'r gwerth ar gyfer y dysgwyr, ond bod y cyrsiau a'r cymwysterau i gyd ar gael ac, fel rydym ni wedi clywed, yn ehangach

So, that does follow through, then, with choices in relation to studying through the medium of Welsh and improving their skills in Welsh. They are linked, but they are two different issues, and unless we are clear about the value of that skill in relation to employment and life in general, and socially also, of course, then we're not going to achieve much as regards attracting more students to study through the medium of Welsh.

We've developed a language skills certificate for students, and people are asking, 'Is it worth me doing this? Is it helpful?' Well, yes, of course it is, because any additional skill that you have and can take to the workplace is helpful. If it proves that you have a level of skill in a particular field, it is of course worth it, and it also provides additional opportunities. I don't think we place a sufficient emphasis on that to our students at the moment.

**Mr Davies:** Just to finish off, the current provision, without breaking it down, is 8.4 per cent going to FE colleges, and the target and the aim is to reach 10 per cent. But, in order to reach that target, we need to ensure that there's not only an understanding of the demand and the value for the learner, but that the courses and the qualifications are all available and, as we've heard, more

ym maes addysg, fod y deunydd addysgu ar gael hefyd er mwyn eu cefnogi a chyrraedd y nod hynny. Felly, nid wyf i'n credu ei fod jest yn gwestiwn o beth yw'r galw gan y myfyriwr neu'r disgybl unigol; mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod rhannau'r jig—so i gyd gyda'i gilydd er mwyn cyrraedd y nod hynny, hyd yn oed o 10 y cant. Ond yr hyn sy'n wir, wrth gwrs, yw nad yw jest darparu TGAU Cymraeg ail iaith yn mynd i gyrraedd y nod. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni gymryd cam mawr ymlaen a defnyddio'r *cohort* yma o ddysgwyr er mwyn trio diwallu'r angen a chyrraedd y nod hynny.

[256] **Bethan Jenkins:** Sori, Iestyn, beth oedd y canran wnaethoch chi ddyfynnu nawr?

[257] **Mr Davies:** Wyth pwynt pedwar y cant yw'r ddarpariaeth ar hyn o bryd. Y nod yw cyrraedd 10 y cant, tu fewn i'r strategaeth, erbyn 2015.

[258] **Bethan Jenkins:** Pa strategaeth?

[259] **Mr Davies:** Strategaeth ColegauCymru.

[260] **Bethan Jenkins:** A ydych chi wedi asesu beth fyddai hynny angen bod, o fewn cwmpas 2050 a'r 1 filiwn o siaradwyr?

[261] **Mr Davies:** Nid ar hyn o bryd, na.

[262] **Bethan Jenkins:** Nid ydych chi

broadly in education, that the educational materials are there as well to support and reach that target. So, I don't think it's just a question of demand by the student or learner; we have to ensure that all parts of the jigsaw fit together to reach that aim of 10 per cent. What is true, of course, is that just providing Welsh second language GCSE isn't going to reach that target. So, we need to take a big step forwards and use this cohort of learners to try to meet the demand and reach the target.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Sorry, Iestyn, what did you say there about that percentage?

**Mr Davies:** Eight point four per cent is the current provision. The goal is to reach 10 per cent, within that strategy, by 2015.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Which strategy?

**Mr Davies:** The ColegauCymru strategy.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Have you assessed what that would need to be, within the scope of 1 million speakers by 2050?

**Mr Davies:** No, we haven't.

**Bethan Jenkins:** You haven't looked at



wedi gwneud asesiad o hynny eto.

it in relation to that.

[263] **Mr Davies:** Na, ond os ydych chi'n sôn am du fewn i addysg bellach, mae dros 167,000 y tu fewn i golegau FE, mae yna ryw 65,000 o ddysgwyr tu fewn i gyfleon dysgu ar sail gwaith, wedyn mae yna ychydig llai na 2,000 yn astudio cyrsiau addysg uwch, HE, tu fewn i golegau FE. Felly, mae'r cyfanswm sydd gyda ni sy'n mynd drwy'r system ychydig dros 0.25 miliwn o ddysgwyr. So, dyna'r niferoedd. Felly, mae'n gwestiwn o wneud y *maths*, efallai, os ydych chi eisiau cyrraedd y targed hynny neu cael y *spreadsheet* allan i weld beth yw'r ffigurau. Rwy'n hapus i wneud hynny i chi y tu fas i'r pwyllgor.

**Mr Davies:** No, but within further education, you have over 167,000 within FE colleges, there are 65,000 learners within work-based learning opportunities, and then there are just under 2,000 studying HE courses within FE colleges. So, the total we have going through the system is a little over a 0.25 million learners. So, those are the numbers, and it's a matter of doing the maths, if you want to reach that target, or maybe get your spreadsheet out and work out those figures. I'm very happy to supply that to you.

[264] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Jeremy.

[265] **Jeremy Miles:** Diolch. Rwy'n troi at addysg uwch nawr a'r coleg Cymraeg. Beth, o'ch safbwynt chi, yw maint yr uchelgais? Beth fydddech chi'n hoffi ei weld fel llwyddiant yn yr hirdymor o ran cyfran yr addysg uwch sy'n dod drwy'r Gymraeg?

**Jeremy Miles:** Thank you. Turning to higher education and the coleg Cymraeg, what, in your view, is the scale of the ambition? What would you like to see as a measure of success in the long term in terms of the proportion of higher education available through the medium of Welsh?

[266] **Dr Matthews:** Rwy'n credu bod dwy wedd i'r cynllun y mae'r coleg wedi'i ddatblygu dros y cyfnod diwethaf. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r niferoedd ac mae'r ail yn ymwneud â'r ehangder. Mae cryn dipyn o waith wedi cael ei wneud, ac mae gan Gwennan rai ystadegau y

**Dr Matthews:** I think there are two aspects to the plan that the coleg has developed. The first relates to the numbers and the second relates to the scope. A lot of work has been done, and Gwennan has some statistics that we could share with you on the change that has been

gallem ni eu rhannu ynglŷn â'r newid sydd wedi cael ei symbylu mewn rhai meysydd penodol, fel, er enghraifft, gwyddorau chwaraeon ym Mhrifysgol Metropolitan Caerdydd. Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, nid oedd dim darpariaeth. Erbyn hyn, mae 60 o fyfyrwyr yn astudio'r maes yna drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

instigated in some specific areas, such as, for example, sports science at Cardiff Metropolitan University. Ten years ago, there was no provision, but, by now, 60 students are studying this through the medium of Welsh.

[267] Ond, er bod y niferoedd yn bwysig, mae hefyd yn—. Rydym newydd ddatblygu—a ddoe, fel mae'n digwydd, fe wnaeth ein bwrdd ni ei gymeradwyo—gynllun academaidd newydd y coleg. Un o'i egwyddorion canolog yw ymateb i'r angen mewn ystod mor eang â phosibl o feysydd. Mae yna rai meysydd lle mae angen a lle mae'r niferoedd yn fach—maen nhw'n fach trwy ba bynnag gyfrwng. Ond, dylid sicrhau bod yna ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg ar gael yn y meysydd hynny hefyd. Maes fel therapi iaith a lleferydd, dyweder, lle mae'r nifer sy'n cael eu hyfforddi yn flynyddol yn fach—dylid sicrhau bod canran o'r myfyrwyr hynny yn medru gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

But, although the numbers are important, it is also—. We have just developed—and it was yesterday, as it happens, our board approved it—the new academic scheme of the coleg. One of its central principles is responding to the demand in as wide as possible a range of areas. There are some areas where there is demand and where the numbers are small—they're small in whatever medium you choose. But, it should be ensured that there is Welsh-medium provision available in those areas as well. For example, speech and language therapy, where the number who are trained annually is small—it should be ensured that a percentage of those students are able to work through the medium of Welsh.

[268] I fynd i faes sy'n hollol i'r gwrthwyneb, wrth gwrs, sydd yn arbennig o bwysig i'r strategaeth hon, sef hyfforddi athrawon, dylid cynllunio'r gweithlu yn y maes yna i sicrhau bod yna weithlu digonol yn cael ei hyfforddi dros gyfnod i ddiwallu amcanion ehangach y strategaeth iaith Gymraeg dros y degawdau nesaf. Mae hynny, rwy'n

Turning to another, totally opposite field, which is extremely important to this strategy, which is teacher training, planning the workforce in that area should ensure that there is a sufficient workforce being trained over a period of time to meet the wider aims of the Welsh language strategy over the next decades. That, I think, is one of the priorities.

credu, yn un o'r blaenoriaethau.

[269] Mae'r hyn sy'n wir am hyfforddi athrawon hefyd yn wir am feysydd eraill fel gwaith cymdeithasol a'r meysydd iechyd a gofal. Mae'r cyhoeddiad, y bore yma rwy'n credu, ynglŷn â'r adroddiad i sefydlu corff newydd i fod yn gyfrifol am gomisiynu hyfforddiant ym maes iechyd yn bwysig iawn. Mae'n gyfle, i ddweud y gwir, i sicrhau bod yna ystyriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i'r holl feysydd sy'n dod o dan awdurdod y corff newydd yna i sicrhau bod yna sylw yn y broses o recriwtio myfyrwyr a hyfforddeion i allu'r bobl yna wedyn i weithio yng Nghymru ac i weithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac yn ddwyieithog.

What's true about teacher training is also true about other areas such as social work and the fields of health and care. The announcement this morning, I think, about the report on establishing a new body to be responsible for commissioning training in the field of health is extremely important. It is an opportunity, I think, to ensure that consideration is given to all those areas that come under that new body to ensure that attention is drawn in the process of recruiting students and trainees to those people's ability then to work in Wales and to work through the medium of Welsh and bilingually.

[270] Mae yna bethau eraill sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn rhai o'r meysydd yma, o ran sut mae hyfforddiant athrawon yn cael ei gynllunio a sut mae maes iechyd a gofal o ran hyfforddiant yn cael ei gynllunio i fewnosod y Gymraeg yn y trefniadau yna. Fe fydd effaith hynny efallai yn cymryd rhai blynyddoedd i'w weld yn dod drwyddo, ond, o'i wneud e nawr, fe fydd hynny'n gydnaws gyda'r syniad o gael cynllun tymor hir, 30 mlynedd, o ran y Gymraeg.

There are other things that are happening at the moment in some of these areas, in how teacher training is planned and how health and social care training is planned to place the Welsh language in those arrangements. It might take a few years for the impact of those arrangements to be felt, but, in doing so now, it will align with that long-term scheme, the 30-year scheme, in relation to the Welsh language.

[271] Rwy'n siŵr, efallai, o ran hyfforddi athrawon, fod gan Gwennan—

I'm sure, perhaps, in terms of teacher training, Gwennan has—

[272] **Dr Schiavone:** Rwy'n meddwl,

**Dr Schiavone:** I think, in general,

yn gyffredinol, fod yna gyfle rŵan i gysylltu, drwy'r strategaeth iaith newydd, ein gwaith ni'n agosach efo anghenion yr economi a blaenoriaethau polisi'r Llywodraeth, ac i edrych ar dargedu meysydd penodol er mwyn sbarduno datblygiadau pellach o ran y ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael a niferoedd y myfyrwyr sy'n dewis astudio'r pynciau hynny.

there is an opportunity now to link, through the new language strategy, our work more closely with the needs of the economy and the Government's policy priorities, and also to target specific areas in order to encourage further developments in relation to the provision available and the number of students who decide to study those subjects.

[273] O ran meddygaeth, er enghraifft, y bore yma, roedd trafodaeth ynglŷn â faint o fyfyrwyr o Gymru sydd yn dilyn cyrsiau meddygaeth yng Nghymru a faint o'r ganran lai fyth, yn amlwg, fydd yn cymhwyso drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac yn gallu darparu gwasanaethau Cymraeg yn ein cymunedau, sy'n hollol greiddiol, wrth gwrs, i weithrediad y strategaeth iaith.

In terms of medicine, there was a discussion this morning, for example, about how many students from Wales study medicine in Wales and how many of the even smaller percentage, obviously, will qualify through the medium of Welsh and will be able to provide Welsh-medium services in our communities, which, of course, is central to the implementation of the Welsh language strategy.

11:15

[274] Yn yr un modd, wedyn, o ran hyfforddiant athrawon, beth sy'n hollol glir o'r strategaeth ydy bod yna naid enfawr ymlaen yn mynd i orfod gael ei chymryd yn y maes yma. Mae'n rhaid cynyddu'r gweithlu, mae'n rhaid cynyddu niferoedd y rhai sy'n cymhwyso i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa bresennol o ran faint o'n hathrawon presennol ni sydd â lefelau gwahanol o sgiliau yn yr iaith. Mae gan y coleg gyfraniad i'w wneud yn y gwaith hynny wedyn o

In the same way, then, in relation to teacher training, what is absolutely clear in the strategy is that a great leap forward is required in this particular field. The workforce must be increased, the number of those who qualify to teach through the medium of Welsh must be increased, and the current situation with regard to how many of our current teachers have sufficient skills in the language needs to be tackled. The coleg has a big contribution to make to that work in assisting with the workforce

gynorthwyo i gynllunio'r gweithlu, gyda golwg penodol ar gyflawni blaenoriaethau polisi'r Llywodraeth a beth fyddai'n deillio o'r strategaeth yn y man.

[275] **Jeremy Miles:** Jest i grynhoi, mae dau brif gyfraniad, fel petai, i'r strategaeth hynny. Yr un cyntaf: hyfforddi athrawon sut i ddysgu trwy'r Gymraeg mewn amryw bynciau. A'r ail un: roeddech chi'n awgrymu, efallai, y broses yna o normaleiddio, fel bod y gweithlu yn gyffredinol a phobl yn gallu darparu gwasanaethau drwy'r Gymraeg a'i bod yn rhan fwy annatod o fywyd bob dydd.

[276] **Dr Schiavone:** Rwy'n meddwl bod cryfhau'r ddarpariaeth a pharhau â'r gwaith hyrwyddo dwys sydd yn digwydd er mwyn trio annog pobl i barhau i astudio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn greiddiol ynddo ei hun ac yn rhan jest o'r gwaith o normaleiddio addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg fel opsiwn, a bod y Gymraeg wedyn fel sgîl a bod y gallu hynny i fod wedi graddio neu gymhwyso drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ddim ond yn mynd i fod o fantais i fyfyrwyr yn y dyfodol. Felly, mae'n edrych ar y darlun llawn, ond gyda golwg yn amlwg ar gyflawni blaenoriaethau polisi er mwyn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

[277] **Dr Matthews:** Rwy'n credu, yn fyr iawn, yr her nesaf fydd adnabod ble yn y sector addysg uwch, ble yn y

planning, with a specific view to fulfilling the Government's policy priorities and what stems from the strategy in due course.

**Jeremy Miles:** Just to summarise, then, I think there are two main contributions to the strategy. The first is training teachers to be able to teach through the medium of Welsh in a variety of subjects. And secondly, you perhaps suggested that process of normalisation, so that the general workforce and people can provide services through the medium of Welsh, so that it's a more integral part of everyday life.

**Dr Schiavone:** I think that strengthening the provision and continuing with the intensive promotional work that is taking place to encourage people to continue to study through the medium of Welsh is also integral and is part of that work to normalise Welsh-medium higher education as an option, so that people see the Welsh language as a skill, and the ability to graduate or qualify through the medium of Welsh will be only advantageous to students in the future. So, it looks at the big picture, but with a clear view to fulfilling policy priorities in order to make a difference.

**Dr Matthews:** I think, briefly, the next challenge will be identifying where in the higher education sector, where in

prifysgolion ac ym mha feysydd y mae'r angen mwyaf i fuddsoddi er mwyn gallu cyfrannu at anghenion cynllunio gweithlu ac anghenion economaidd a chymdeithasol ehangach. Dyna un o themâu ein strategaeth newydd ni sy'n cael ei datblygu ar y funud.

[278] **Mr Davies:** A gaf i ategu hynny? Y trydydd peth yr ydych chi'n ei ffeindio, wrth gwrs, yn nhermau'r sector prifysgolion yn addysgu'r darlithwyr newydd, mae'n rhaid ichi ffeindio pobl sy'n brofiadol yn y Gymraeg, profiadol o ran addysgu a hefyd yn eu maes proffesiynol nhw hefyd. Felly, rŷch chi'n sôn am fireinio i lawr ychydig o'r nifer sydd ar gael. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y ddarpariaeth hynny yn creu, allan o'r gronfa lai hynny, yr unigolion sy'n gallu addysgu yn y maes galwedigaethol hefyd.

[279] **Jeremy Miles:** Un cwestiwn byr. Iawn, roeddech chi'n sôn am y gwaith cynllunio hynny—hynny yw, ble mae'r buddsoddiad yn mynd er mwyn creu ateb y galw neu greu—. Beth yw'r amserlen sydd gyda chi, a pha wybodaeth, cefnogaeth, arweiniad sydd ei angen oddi wrthy ch chi ac oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru i lwyddo i wneud hynny?

[280] **Dr Matthews:** Fel yr ŷch chi'n gwybod, efallai, mae'r prif bwylais yn ystod y pum mlynedd cyntaf o waith y coleg wedi bod ar gryfhau capasiti'r prifysgolion trwy benodi

those universities and in which fields investment is needed most in order to be able to contribute to workforce planning needs and wider economic and social needs. That's one of the themes of our new strategy being developed at the moment.

**Mr Davies:** Could I add to that? The third thing that you find, of course, in terms of the university sector educating new lecturers, is that you need to find people experienced in the Welsh language, experienced in teaching and also in their professional areas. So, you're talking really about refining down a little from the number available. So, it's important that that provision creates, out of that smaller pool, individuals who can teach in the vocational area as well.

**Jeremy Miles:** A quick question. Iawn, you were talking about the planning work—that is, where the investment is going to create the solution to demand or create—. What is the timescale that you have, and what information, support, leadership is needed from you and from Welsh Government in order to succeed in that?

**Dr Matthews:** As you know, perhaps, the main emphasis during the first five years of the coleg's work has been on increasing the capacity of universities by appointing lecturers,

darlithwyr, ac felly mae yna dros 100—rhyw 115—o swyddi darlithio cyfrwng Cymraeg newydd wedi ymddangos ar draws y meysydd. Yr her nawr—mae hwn yn symud ymlaen—yw sicrhau bod y swyddi yna yn cael eu mabwysiadu'n llawn gan y prifysgolion wrth i'r grantiau oddi wrth y coleg ddod i ddiwedd eu pum mlynedd. Dyna oedd y cynllun yn fanna. Ac wedyn rydym ni'n symud tuag at grantiau pynciol, lle bydd y cyllid yn dilyn meysydd yn hytrach na noddi swyddi darlithio yn benodol.

and so, over 100—some 115—new Welsh language lectureships have appeared in these areas. The challenge now—this moves on—is to ensure that those posts are fully adopted by the universities as the grants from the coleg come to the end of their five years. That was the plan there. So, we then move to subject grants, where the funding will follow subject areas rather than sponsoring lecturer posts specifically.

[281] Rŷch chi'n hollol gywir—mae'r drafodaeth hon yn digwydd gydag adrannau'r Llywodraeth er mwyn adnabod ble dylid blaenoriaethu buddsoddiad, a, dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, wrth i'r cydbwysedd o ran y modd y mae'r adnoddau yn cael eu defnyddio symud, mi fydd hi'n gynyddol bwysig sicrhau bod yr elfen strategol yna yn cael ei hystyried. Felly, hyfforddi athrawon, yn amlwg, ac efallai mai cynllunio yn fwy na chyllido ydy'r prif flaenoriaeth yn fanna.

You're quite right—this discussion is ongoing with Welsh Government departments to recognise where there is a need to prioritise investment, and, over the next few years, as the balance in terms of the way in which resources are used shifts, it will be increasingly important to ensure that the strategic element is considered. So, teacher training, clearly, and perhaps planning more than funding is the main priority in that regard.

[282] Ym meysydd iechyd a gofal, fel yr oedd Iestyn yn ei awgrymu, mae yna her nid yn unig i ddatblygu y galw, ond i sicrhau bod yr arbenigedd addysgu yna hefyd. Mae'n mynd i gymryd rhywfaint o amser efallai mewn ambell faes i ddatblygu mwy o gapasiti yn seiliedig ar brofiad ymarferol yn y maes, ond hefyd y gallu i addysgu mewn cydestun addysgol. Felly, mae yna nifer

In the fields of health and care, as Iestyn suggested, there is not only a challenge to develop the demand, but also to ensure that the teaching expertise is there. It's going to take some time perhaps in some areas to develop greater capacity based on practical experience in the field, but also in relation to the ability to teach in an educational context. So, there are a number of—. But that's the

o—. Ond dyna'r cyfeiriad yn general direction. gyffredinol.

[283] **Bethan Jenkins:** A gaf i jest ofyn cwestiwn clou ynglŷn â grantiau? Ar ba sail y mae'r prifysgolion yn penderfynu naill ai i barhau gyda'r darlithydd penodol hynny neu i ddod â hynny i ben? Hynny yw, a ydyn nhw'n hybu myfyrwyr i fynd at y darlithwyr yna fel eu bod nhw'n creu'r galw, yn hytrach na bod y darlithydd yn ffeindio'i hun gyda nifer llai o fyfyrwyr nag oedden nhw'n ddisgwyl, ac wedyn mae'r brifysgol yn cyfiawnhau peidio â chadw y rôl yna oherwydd efallai ei bod yn credu nad yw wedi bod o werth.

[284] **Dr Matthews:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn amserol iawn, achos rydym ni yng nghanol cyfres o gyfarfodydd cynllunio gyda'r prifysgolion ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â'r union fater yma o gynnal y buddsoddiad mewn swyddi. Y newydd calonogol ydy bod yna ewyllys, yn sicr, yn bodoli i ymrwymo yn y tymor hir. Mae yna heriau; mae heriau cyllidol. Mae datblygiadau'r wythnos hon mewn perthynas ag adolygiad Diamond, gobeithio, yn mynd i helpu yn y tymor canolig, yn sicr. A beth sydd angen sicrhau ydy bod prifysgolion yn derbyn, gyda niferoedd cyfrwng Cymraeg, bod y niferoedd yn mynd i fod yn llai nag y bydden nhw drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg, ac felly nad oes modd gosod yr un math o drothwy ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd grŵp. Rwy'n credu

**Bethan Jenkins:** May I just ask a quick question about the grants? On what basis, then, to the universities decide either to continue with a particular lecturer post or to bring that to an end? That is, do they encourage students to go to those lectures so that they create that demand, rather than that the lecturer finding themselves with fewer students than they were expecting, and then maybe the university can justify perhaps not keeping that role open because they feel that it hasn't been worth while.

**Dr Matthews:** That's a very timely question, because we are at the moment in the middle of a series of meetings with the universities about this very issue of maintaining that investment in posts. The good news is that there is certainly a desire to commit to that in the long term. There are funding challenges related to it. Developments this week in relation to the Diamond review, I hope, are going to help in the medium term, certainly. What we need to ensure is that universities accept, in relation to Welsh-medium numbers, that those numbers are going to be lower than they would be through the medium of English, so you can't set the same sort of threshold in relation to the sustainability of a particular group. I



bod hynny yn rhywbeth sydd wedi cael ei dderbyn, a dyna ran o'r drafodaeth. Mae rhai meysydd lle mae'r galw yn parhau i fod yn fach, ond mae'r rheini yn feysydd, efallai, lle mae'r sefyllfa yr un mor argyfyngus yn gyffredinol—ieithoedd modern, er enghraifft. Mae pawb yn gwybod bod yna broblem yn fanna.

think that's something that they do accept, and that's part of the discussion we're having. There are some areas where the demand is still quite small, but maybe those are areas where the situation is just as critical in general—modern languages, for example. Everyone knows that there is a problem in that area.

[285] **Dr Schiavone:** Mae gan y coleg hefyd gynllun ysgoloriaethau israddedig sydd yn rhan o'r gwaith o gynyddu'r cymhelliant i astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac mae'n sicr wedi agor y drws i rai myfyrwyr llai sicr ynglŷn ag astudio drwy gyfrwng yr iaith i wneud hynny, ac mewn nifer o feysydd. Mae'r meysydd lle mae'r ysgoloriaethau i'w cael yn cydfynd â meysydd newydd lle mae'r Coleg wedi buddsoddi ynddyn nhw. Felly, mae yna ymdrechion ar y ddwy ochr, yn hytrach na dim ond creu'r ddarpariaeth a gobeithio bod y myfyrwyr yn dilyn. Mae yna hyrwyddo ac mae yna gynlluniau wedyn er mwyn trio annog myfyrwyr i ddod drwy'r system.

**Dr Schiavone:** The coleg also has an undergraduate scholarship scheme that is part of the work of increasing the encouragement for people to study through the medium of Welsh, and has opened the door for students who aren't as confident in studying in the language to do so, and in many different areas. The areas where the scholarships are available do link into new areas where there has been investment by the coleg. So, there is an attempt on both sides, rather than just creating the provision and hoping that the students will follow. There is promotion and also planning to encourage students to come through the system.

[286] **Bethan Jenkins:** Grêt, diolch. Mae yna gwestiwn nawr gan Dai Lloyd ar uwchsgilio o fewn y sector yn benodol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Great, thank you. A question now from Dai Lloyd on upskilling within the sector specifically.

[287] **Dai Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr, Gadeirydd, a diolch yn fawr am eich cyfraniadau. Roeddwn i dim ond eisiau datblygu ar y syniadau rydych chi eisoes wedi eu cyfrannu, achos fel

**Dai Lloyd:** Thank you, Chair, and thank you for your contributions. I just wanted to develop on the ideas that you have contributed already, because as you've referred to

rydych wedi cyfeirio ato eisoes, mae yna her sylweddol yn y fan hyn i gyrraedd 1 miliwn o siaradwyr erbyn canol y ganrif. Wrth gwrs, mae rhai ohonom yn ddigon hen—mae pawb yn ifanc yn y fan hyn oni bai amdanaf i—ond rydym yn dal i gofio rhai o'r brwydrau yna efo ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg a'u chweched dosbarth, ac, os oedd y plant yn mynd i goleg addysg bellach lleol, y ddarpariaeth, neu'r diffyg darpariaeth, yn y colegau hynny drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Wrth gwrs, mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella rŵan, ond rydym ni yn sôn am *baseline* hynod llwm rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Yn nhermau cynllunio ieithyddol nawr, dim jest annog pobl i ddysgu Cymraeg a gloywi eu hiaith Gymraeg, ond hefyd cael y cyrsiau, fel rydych chi wedi ei ddweud eisoes, drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, achos mae angen athrawon Cymraeg eu hiaith, meddygon, nyrsys, a phobl sydd yn addysgu plant bach yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg—mae'n rhaid i'r cyrsiau yna ddod o rhywle, a'r bobl yna ddod o rhywle. Felly, sut yn union ydych chi'n mynd i gynllunio am hynny? Achos beth roeddwn i yn tueddu i'w glywed oedd os oeddech chi jest yn mynd i ddibynnu ar bwysau—hynny yw, pobl yn dod atoch chi a dweud, 'Mae'n rhaid i mi gael y ddarpariaeth yma', neu a ydych chi yn mynd i fod yn rhagweithiol a chreu'r ddarpariaeth? Achos mae yna nifer o Gymry Cymraeg—fel fi, er enghraifft—rydym ni'n swil ac yn fewnblyg, ac rydym ni yn tueddu i

already, there is a substantial challenge here in reaching 1 million Welsh speakers by the middle of the century. Of course, some of us are old enough—everyone here is young apart from me—to remember some of those battles with Welsh-medium schools and their sixth forms, and, if the children were going to go to a further education college locally, the provision, or the lack of provision, in those colleges through the medium of Welsh. Of course, the situation has improved, but we are talking about a very poor baseline a few years ago. In terms of language planning, not just encouraging people to be learning Welsh or polishing their Welsh, but also to have courses, as you've already said, through the medium of Welsh, because there is a need for Welsh-medium teachers, doctors, nurses, and people who teach young children in their early years through the medium of Welsh—those courses have to come from somewhere, and those people have to come from somewhere. So, how exactly are you going to plan for that? Because what I tended to hear was that if you're just going to rely on pressure—that is, people coming to you and saying, 'I've got to have this provision', or are you going to be proactive and create the provision? Because there are a number of Welsh speakers—like myself, for example—we are shy and introverted, and we tend not to create a fuss. It's much easier that the provision is naturally there, rather than there being a need to

beidio â chreu *fuss*. Mae'n llawer haws bod y ddarpariaeth yna yn naturiol, yn lle bod angen creu darpariaeth neu angen protestio neu ffeindio yr hen blacardiau yna roeddem ni'n arfer eu defnyddio i gael ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y lle cyntaf. So, y cynllunio sydd ei angen—. Rwy'n deall bod angen ariannu hefyd, ond beth buaswn i eisiau ei weld ydy bod yna sicrwydd bod y cynllunio yma yn mynd i ddiwydd yn naturiol, heb ddibynnu yn ormodol ar bwysau oddi wrth bobl sydd eisiau darpariaeth yn Gymraeg, ac efallai sydd ddim eisiau, ar ddiwedd y dydd, gwthio'r cwch allan yn ormodol ac ddim eisiau creu *fuss*—'O, mae yn Saesneg. Fe ai am hwnnw 'te'—achos dyna oeddech chi'n drïo ei awgrymu efo'r ffigurau yna ar y dechrau. Sut ydych chi'n mynd i wneud yn siŵr bod y ddarpariaeth yna yn naturiol?

[288] **Mr Davies:** Cwestiwn anodd sydd yn gwestiwn nid jest i ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg neu at ddiben dwyieithrwydd, ond cwestiwn sydd yn wir am bob math o ddarpariaeth, nid jest yn *FE* ond yn *HE* hefyd, buaswn i'n meddwl. Mae'r cynllunio ar gyfer blwyddyn wrth blwyddyn yn rhywbeth rwy'n credu yn rhywbeth sy'n anodd iawn i gynnal ar unrhyw lefel. Rŷch chi'n sôn am wneud penderfyniadau bron y tu mewn i gyfnod o flwyddyn ynglŷn â pha gyrsiau sy'n medru cael eu cynnal a pha gyrsiau sy'n mynd i gael eu cyfuno a sut rŷch chi'n darparu'r

create provision or protest or find those old placards that we used to use to establish a Welsh-medium school in the first place. So, it's the planning that's needed—. I understand that funding is needed as well, but what I would want to see is that there are assurances that this planning is going to happen naturally, without too much reliance on pressure from people who want the provision through the medium of Welsh, and perhaps who don't want to push the boat out too much or don't want to create a *fuss*—'Oh, it's in English. I'll go for that, then'—because I think that's what you were trying to suggest with those figures at the beginning. How are you going to ensure that that provision is natural?

**Mr Davies:** That's a difficult question not just in relation to Welsh-medium provision or bilingualism, but to all types of provision, not just in FE but in HE also, I would think. The year-by-year planning is something I think that's very difficult to sustain on any level. You're talking about making decisions within a period of a year about what courses can be held and can be amalgamated and whether you provide it in a particular centre and deal with transport issues where perhaps public transport isn't available. So, it's not just a question in relation to Welsh-medium

cwrs mewn un ganolfan ac yn delio â'r cwestiynau o drafnidiaeth pam na fydd trafndiaeth gyhoeddus efallai ar gael. So, nid jest cwestiwn yn nhermau darpariaeth Gymraeg yw hwn ond yn ehangach yn nhermau darpariaeth ar ôl ysgol. Beth rŷm ni'n ei wybod yw bod yn rhaid cael gwell partneriaeth rhwng cynghorau sir, y colegau, ac, wrth gwrs, yr ysgolion, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod ni'n cyflawni diben y targed yma, ond, yn bwysicach fyth, bod y cyfleon efallai nad yw'r dysgwr 16 oed yn deall sy'n gyfleon iddyn nhw yn dal ar gael dwy flynedd neu dair blynedd ar ôl iddyn nhw orffen ysgol, efallai, a'u bod nhw'n ffeindio eu hunain yn y lle gwaith efallai yn difaru na wnaethon nhw ddilyn mwy o gyrsiau yn y Gymraeg. Felly, mae eisiau i ni greu cyfleon i fynd yn ôl mewn i addysg gydol oes, felly, yn sgil hynny. Ond, yr her fwyaf rwy'n credu ar hyn o bryd i unrhyw gynllunio darpariaeth addysg bellach neu addysg uwch, yw'r ffaith bod y telerau'n cael eu cyflwyno flwyddyn wrth flwyddyn. Nid oes modd i chi gyflwyno yn y sector addysg bellach mwy na hynny rwy'n credu ar hyn o bryd.

[289] **Dr Matthews:** Rwy'n credu mai cynllunio ydy'r allwedd i hyn i gyd a chanolbwyntio ar ddilyniant byddwn i'n ei ddweud.

[290] **Dr Schiavone:** Dilyniant a blaenoriaethau'r sectorau, rwy'n meddwl. Mae'r uchelgais sydd gerbron yn uchelgais fawr ac rydym

provision but it's a wider issue in terms of the provision available after school. We do know that we need to have better partnerships between county councils, colleges and, of course, schools, so that we can ensure that we achieve the purpose of this target, but, more importantly, that the opportunities that the learner at 16 may not realise are available to them are still available two to three years after they've left school and they find themselves in the workplace perhaps regretting that they didn't follow more courses through the medium of Welsh. So, we need to create opportunities to go back into lifelong learning as a result. But the biggest challenge, I think, at the moment in relation to planning for further education or higher education provision is the fact that the terms are put forward year by year. You can't plan further ahead than that in FE at the moment.

**Dr Matthews:** I think planning is the key to all of this and concentrating on progression, I would say.

**Dr Schiavone:** Progression and the priorities of the sectors, I think. The ambition that's before us is a great ambition and we accept that there is

ni yn derbyn bod yna waith mawr i'w wneud os ydym ni wir yn mynd i gryfhau safle'r Gymraeg a gwneud yr iaith nid dim ond yn gyfrwng, p'un ai ydy rhywun yn gallu siarad yr iaith neu ddim, ond yn iaith sy'n cael ei defnyddio: ei bod hi'n iaith fyw. Rydym ni yn derbyn, rwy'n meddwl, wrth gynllunio y bydd yn rhaid blaenoriaethu sectorau penodol a chyflwyno cynlluniau sy'n trio gwneud gwahaniaeth yn y sectorau hynny. Mae hyfforddiant athrawon yn enghraifft amlwg iawn, lle, yn amlwg, mae'n rhaid cael y cynnydd mawr yma yn nifer yr athrawon cyfrwng Cymraeg ond eto, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes targedau o ran hyfforddi athrawon i allu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg sy'n sefyllfa ryfeddol o ystyried ei bod hi'n amlwg bod yna alw. Sut, felly, rydym ni yn mynd i'r afael â hynny? Sut rydym ni yn blaenoriaethu meysydd pwnc, er enghraifft, yn ein hysgolion uwchradd, lle mae'n rhaid cael mwy o athrawon? Sut rydym ni'n sicrhau bod y pwll yn ddigon mawr o athrawon sy'n gallu dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac yn gallu gwneud hynny i'r lefel sgiliau hynny sydd ei angen arnom ni? Mae hynny'n rhan o'r cylch o ddatblygu llythrennedd plant y dyfodol. Felly, mae yna feysydd lle gallem ni fod yn blaenoriaethu: iechyd a gofal, er enghraifft, yn faes lle, os ydy'r gwasanaethau yna, bydd pobl yn eu defnyddio nhw—mae'n normaleiddio'r iaith. Ond mae'n rhaid hyfforddi pobl drwy'r system i ddod i weithio'n y sector. Felly, mae yna

a lot of work to be done if we are to strengthen the position of the Welsh language and ensure that the language is not just a medium, whether someone can speak the language or not, but is used, is a living language. I think we accept in planning that we need to prioritise specific sectors and introduce schemes that try and make a difference in those sectors. Teacher training is a clear example, where there is a need for this great increase in the number of Welsh-medium teachers, but, at the moment, there are no targets in terms of teacher training to teach through the medium of Welsh, which is an amazing situation when it's clear that there is a demand. How, therefore, are we going to address that? How are we going to prioritise subject areas, for example, in the secondary sector, where there is a need for more teachers? How do we ensure that the pool is large enough so that we have enough teachers who can teach through the medium of Welsh and with the skills that are needed? That is part of developing the literacy of children in the future. So, there are areas where we could be prioritising: health and social care, for example, is an area where, if the services are there, people will use them, normalising the language. But we need to train people through the system to work in the sector. So, there's a lot of work to be done but I think we would all accept that there is a need to prioritise but there is an

waith cynllunio mawr i wneud ac rydw i'n meddwl y byddem ni gyd yn derbyn mae'n rhaid blaenoriaethu ond mae yna elfen o frys rwy'n meddwl i'r blaenoriaethu hynny fel ein bod yn gallu meintioli'r gwaith ac ymateb.

[291] **Dr Matthews:** Rwy'n credu, ynglŷn â hyfforddi athrawon, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod yna gyfleoedd nawr yn y misoedd nesaf yma. Gan bod yna ail-gyflunio trefniadau hyfforddi athrawon ac adnabod y lleoliadau ar gyfer y trefniadau newydd mae modd sicrhau bod ystyriaethau'r Gymraeg a chapasiti i weithredu ac i ddarparu hyfforddiant dwyieithog yn cael eu hystyried fel maen prawf allweddol wrth wneud penderfyniadau ar leoli'r canolfannau newydd. A dyna'r math o beth. Pan fyddem ni'n sôn am sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd ar draws Llywodraeth, pa bynnag broses neu swyddogion sy'n ymhél â'r broses a'r penderfyniadau hynny, maen nhw hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r cyd-destun yma wrth ddod i'w argymhellion.

[292] **Mr Davies:** Er enghraifft, mae'n bwysig eich bod yn nodi nad oes ystyriaeth o gwbl ynglŷn ag anghenion darlithwyr neu addysgwyr FE y tu mewn i'r strategaeth arfaethedig ar gyfer hyfforddiant dysgu a'r ymgynghoriad ITE sy'n mynd o gwmpas ar hyn o bryd. Roedd honno'n broblem i ni fel sector. Wedyn, gan nad yw e yno ar

element of urgency I think in relation to these priorities so that we can quantify this work and react.

**Dr Matthews:** I think, in relation to teacher training, what's important is that there are opportunities available now in these next few months. As we are re-configuring the arrangements in relation to teacher training and identifying settings for the new arrangements there is a means to ensure that considerations of the Welsh language and capacity to implement and provide bilingual training are considered as an important criterion in making decisions on locating these new centres. And it's that sort of thing. When we are talking about ensuring that this happens across Government, whatever process or officials are involved in those decisions, they also need to be aware of this context in coming to their recommendations.

**Mr Davies:** For example, it's important that you note that there is no consideration at all in relation to the needs of lecturers or teachers in the FE sector within the proposed strategy for training and the ITE consultation doing the rounds at the moment. That was a problem for us as a sector. Then, as it isn't there for the whole sector there is no

gyfer y sector cyfan nid oes ystyriaeth beth yw'r angen ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth yn yr iaith Gymraeg, er enghraifft. Mae'n cwmpo i lawr ar y lefel honno. Ond nid yw'n jest cynllunio darpariaeth y pynciau tu fewn i'r dosbarth neu tu fewn i'r coleg, nag ychwaith y gweithlu uniongyrchol sy'n addysgu, ond yr aseswyr a phobl sy'n mynd i arolygu. A yw'r sgiliau gan Estyn, er enghraifft, i sicrhau bod yr arolygiaeth yn gallu digwydd yn y gweithle neu yn y coleg yng nghydestun yr iaith sy'n cael ei defnyddio? Felly, mae hwnnw'n bwnc llawer mwy na jest y niferoedd o fyfyrwyr sy'n graddio neu yn mynd i PGCE neu rai sy'n mynd i mewn i ddiwydiant ac wedyn ddegawd yn hwyrach yn chwilio am gymhwyster PGCE PCET fel rhan o'u datblygiad proffesiynol nhw. Mae'r cwestiwn cynllunio yn lot fwy na jest cwestiwn i un coleg, neu golegau neu brifysgolion.

consideration of what is required for the Welsh language provision, for example. It falls down on that level. But this isn't just in relation to the subject specific planning in the classroom or in the college, nor in the direct workforce that teaches, but also in relation to the assessors and people who inspect services. Does Estyn, for example, have the skills to ensure that an inspection can happen in the workplace or the college in the context of the language used? So, that is a subject that is much more than just about the numbers of students who graduate or go into PGCE or those who go into industry and then maybe a decade later are looking for a PGCE PCET qualification as part of their professional development. The issue of planning is far more than just about one college, or colleges or universities.

11:30

[293] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae gan Lee **Bethan Jenkins:** Lee has a question. gwestiwn.

[294] **Lee Waters:** I've got a couple of related questions around leadership and the appetite there is for change, because it's quite clear from your evidence this morning that this is going to require a significant step change in both sectors, and a significant allocation of resource, which will present an opportunity cost. So, my question is: how much appetite is there amongst the senior leadership in both sectors that this is the correct use of resource? It does challenge the traditional direction of where the resources have traditionally been put. Are they behind that?

[295] **Mr Davies:** I have no doubt for a minute. I would say that, wouldn't I,

as an organisation that's representative of, and part of our role is to represent the FE sector? I have no doubt for one minute, or less than that; there is nothing less than 100 per cent support from principals.

[296] **Lee Waters:** So, this is where they want to put the resources.

[297] **Mr Davies:** I think they see it as part of a very mature, wider understanding of ensuring that our learners are equipped, not only for the bilingual world of Wales, but are actually fitted and equipped for the multidimensional, multilanguage, global world that we live and work in. I think what you see, particularly in an FE environment, is less consternation over whether or not learning outcomes should be measured in English or Welsh, but because the focus is on the skill, you have a very holistic understanding of what we're trying to achieve with learners.

[298] The difficulty, of course, is when the responsibility for increasing, for instance, Welsh language ability, or indeed effectiveness in terms of numeracy and literacy in other areas, and at the same time widen the horizons and experience of an individual learner, and also address the health and well-being need, when all those things collide in what is already a very challenged curriculum area, it's not a question of, 'Do we want to do it?', it's 'How on earth do we do it?' There's a finite amount of resource, and a finite amount of time in the curriculum, when, actually, the whole point of much of FE provision is that the focus, and actually the majority of focus, should be on developing the core skill in the vocational area that people have gone to study. My concern is not that we have a lack of will, but that there are only so many hours in a day, and so much funding that can be allowed in what is already a curriculum that is under pressure.

[299] **Lee Waters:** Okay.

[300] **Dr Matthews:** I think the key question—. I think on the question about support for the agenda, the landscape has changed there, and there is considerable input from leadership within HE and FE also towards the high-level aims. The question is: what is the balance between the additional support that they can reasonably expect to initiate that step change, and then take control of the agenda going forward?

[301] Rwy'n meddwl mai un o'r I think one of the ways that these ffyrdd y mae'r newidiadau a'r changes and developments in the HE datblygiadau yn y sector addysg sector have seen an increase in



uwch wedi gweld cynnydd mewn niferoedd, ac mewn ystod o ddarpariaeth, yw bod Llywodraeth Cymru ar y pryd, bum mlynedd yn ôl, wedi cymryd y penderfyniad i osod buddsoddiad yn ei le i wneud rywfaint o drawsnewid na fyddai wedi digwydd. Ni fyddai'r prifysgolion, hyd yn oed lle roedd yr ewyllys yn bodoli, wedi penodi 115 o ddarlithwyr ychwanegol. Y cwestiwn wedyn, ar ôl iddyn nhw gael y gefnogaeth yna, ydy: i ba raddau y mae'n rhesymol disgwyl iddyn nhw i fod yn gyfrifol am barhad y ddarpariaeth sydd wedi cael ei hysgogi? Ac mae hynny yn drafodaeth. A'r ateb, fyddwn i'n awgrymu, ydy, mewn nifer o feysydd, ydy, mae e yn resymol, hyd yn oed gyda'r holl heriau eraill sydd wedi—. Mae e'n rhan o'u rôl nhw, ac mae yna ddisgwyliadau arnyn nhw hefyd yn mynd i ddod drwy'r safonau.

[302] Mewn meysydd eraill, mae'r her yn parhau i fod yn un sylweddol. Nid yw'r newid, o'r *baseline* oedd gyda chi, yn rhywbeth sy'n gallu digwydd mewn pum mlynedd. Ac, felly, mae angen edrych ymhellach. A dyna mae argymhellion Diamond yn ei ddweud, ydy bod yna—. Fe gyflwynon ni, fel coleg, dystiolaeth i adolygiad Diamond fod angen, oherwydd nifer o ffactorau, gan gynnwys y ffaith ei bod hi'n anodd i ddarpariaeth, lle mae nifer y myfyrwyr yn llai, i fodoli mewn system sy'n mynd yn gynyddol fasnachol, beth bynnag rydym yn meddwl am hynny. Felly, dyna sut y

numbers, and in the range of provision, is that the Welsh Government at the time, five years ago, took the decision to put investment in place to ensure some transformation that wouldn't have happened. Universities, even where there was a will, wouldn't have appointed 115 additional lecturers. The question then is, after receiving that support: to what extent is it reasonable to expect them to be responsible for the continuation of that provision? And that is a discussion. And the answer, I would suggest, is that, in a number of areas, it is reasonable, even with all the other challenges that have—. It's part of their role, and expectations of them will come through in the standards as well.

In other areas, the challenge continues to be significant. The change, from the baseline that you had, isn't something that can happen within five years. And, therefore, there is a need to look further. And that is what the Diamond recommendations are saying, that there is—. We presented evidence to the Diamond review, as a college, that there is a need, because of a number of factors, including the fact that it is difficult for provision, where the number of students is smaller, to exist in a system that is becoming increasingly commercial, whatever we think about that. So, I think that's

byddwn i'n ei gweld hi.

how I would see things.

[303] **Lee Waters:** Can I just ask—? In terms of higher education specifically, what we've been discussing this morning is primarily around the teaching agenda, whereas universities and vice-chancellors have been preoccupied with the research agenda. So, does this feed into the research agenda at some point, or is this primarily around teaching?

[304] **Dr Matthews:** Mae ymchwil yn rhan bwysig iawn o'n gwaith ni, ac o'n strategaeth ni. Dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, rydym ni wedi noddi bron 100 o ysgoloriaethau PhD mewn pob math o feysydd i ddangos bod modd ymchwilio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae yna gylchgrawn, cyfnodolyn academiaidd, *Gwerddon*, yn ymddangos tair neu bedair gwaith y flwyddyn, yn cynnwys erthyglau academiaidd ar bob math o feysydd trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yn sicr, mae'r gweithgaredd ymchwil sy'n cael ei gyflawni yn yr adrannau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn dod yn fwy amlwg, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod gofynion y REF yn ei gwneud hi'n anodd iawn i gyflwyno'r deunydd hwnnw ar gyfer ei asesu oherwydd bod impact yn rhan mor helaeth o'r mesuryddion. Wedyn, nid yw hi'n bosibl, wrth gwrs, oherwydd y niferoedd o bobl sy'n gallu darllen deunydd yn Gymraeg, iddyn nhw gyrraedd y gynulleidfa dorfol, fyd-eang yna. Ond mae gennym ni ffyrdd hefyd o gyfathrebu bod yna wybodaeth am yr ymchwil cyfrwng Cymraeg yma yn ehangach hefyd. Nid yw'n wir am bob rhan o addysg uwch, ond mae yna adrannau academiaidd sy'n gosod bri a

**Dr Matthews:** Research is a very important part of our work, and of our strategy. Over the last 10 years, we have sponsored almost 100 PhD scholarships in many different fields to show that it is possible to undertake research through the medium of Welsh. We have an academic journal, *Gwerddon*, which appears three or four times a year, which includes academic articles on many different areas through the medium of Welsh. Certainly, the research activity that is undertaken in the departments through the medium of Welsh is becoming far more evident, despite the fact that the REF requirements make it very difficult to present that material to be assessed, because the impact is such a large part of the criteria. So, it's not possible, because of the numbers of people able to read Welsh-medium material, for them to reach that mass, worldwide audience. But we do have ways of communicating that there is information about the Welsh-medium research more broadly also. It's not true of every part of higher education, but there are academic departments that give priority to the research agenda. Where those departments work through the

blaenoriaeth ar yr agenda ymchwil. medium of Welsh, it is natural that  
 Lle mae'r adrannau hyn yn weithredol Welsh-medium research is also a part  
 drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, mae'n of that activity.  
 naturiol bod yr ymchwil cyfrwng  
 Cymraeg hefyd yn rhan o'r  
 gweithgaredd.

[305] **Lee Waters:** Can I just confirm the journal you mentioned and the research activities—those are recognised within the REF, are they?

[306] **Dr Matthews:** They are recognised within the REF. The difficulty with the REF is that—we've had a lengthy discussion with HEFCW, and HEFCE also, about this, and there's no problem with submitting Welsh-medium material for the purposes of REF. The difficulty is that when the impact is measured, it's very difficult to—. When the decision is made, these are the criteria that will be used, so the judgment will be based on these criteria, so that is part of the challenge in terms of Welsh-medium material, Welsh-language material, in terms of the REF itself. But in terms of the quality of that material—so, there is a difficulty there, but the rules of the REF allow this material to be presented, but the actual way that the exercise is taken forward is a challenge.

[307] **Lee Waters:** So, that goes back to my original question in terms of persuading the senior leadership of universities that this is investment that's going to have a payback for them in terms of their priorities. If that has a lesser payback in terms of its REF weighting, it's going to be harder to persuade the leadership of universities that this is where the resource should go.

[308] **Dr Matthews:** Mae hynny'n wir i raddau. Wedi dweud hynny, wrth gwrs, pan ych chi'n edrych ar sefyllfa addysg uwch yn fyd-eang ac ar draws Ewrop, mae'r iaith Saesneg yn amlwg mewn lle—rŷch chi'n gwybod bod yna wledydd a bod yna sefydliadau sydd yn defnyddio'r iaith Saesneg yn helaeth iawn. Ond y pwynt sylfaenol yn fan hyn: hyd yn oed os nad oes modd defnyddio'r ymchwil cyfrwng Cymraeg yna i gael canlyniadau trwy  
**Dr Matthews:** That is true to some extent, but having said that, of course, when you look at the situation of higher education worldwide and across Europe, the English language is apparent—you know that there are countries and institutions that use the English language to a great extent. But the basic point here is: even if there's no way of using that Welsh-medium research to have results through the

REF, oherwydd y rhesymau REF, for the structural reasons I have outlined, you can show you can conduct academic work of quality through the medium of Welsh. That's a very important message for students, and there are specific examples of that happening, and not just in traditional subject areas.

strwythurol rwyf wedi eu hamlinellu, mae modd dangos bod modd cynnal gwaith academaidd o safon trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae hynny'n neges bwysig iawn i fyfyrwyr ac mae yna enghreifftiau penodol o hynny'n digwydd, ac nid yn unig mewn meysydd traddodiadol, fel petai.

[309] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch. Mae'n rhaid inni symud ymlaen. **Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you. We need to move on now.

[310] **Dr Matthews:** Mae'n ddrwg gen i. **Dr Matthews:** I apologise.

[311] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae yna gwestiynau am ddilyniant. **Bethan Jenkins:** We do have some questions about progression.

[312] **Neil Hamilton:** If we are to achieve the objective of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050 in the most comprehensive way, it's very important to see the steps along that road in that time continuum, from early years learning through to statutory education, then on to HE and FE and universities, and then on into the world of work. We've been talking about planning ahead, and the best way to plan ahead is for there to be communication on a regular basis at each stage of the ladder with those who are providing you with your source material in terms of students. So, do you think there is sufficient co-ordination between the different stages of education at the minute to enable you to plan effectively for the future and in the most productive way to achieve these outcomes?

[313] **Dr Schiavone:** 'Na' ydy'r ateb, rydw i'n meddwl. Nid oes yna ddigon o waith yn cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo dilyniant. Dyna ran o'n methiant ni mewn ffordd, o ran sicrhau twf yn niferoedd y siaradwyr, neu osgoi'r trai presennol. Rydym ni'n eithaf clir o ran ymgyrchoedd, yn hyrwyddo gwerth yr iaith i rieni newydd i gyflwyno'r Gymraeg o'r crud, ond nid **Dr Schiavone:** The answer is 'no', I think. There isn't enough work being done to promote progression. That's part of the failure, to be honest, in ensuring that the number of Welsh speakers increases. I think we've been very clear in our campaigns to promote our work to new parents, but we don't maintain that at every point throughout the educational

ydydym yn cynnal hynny ym mhob un pwynt trwy'r sector addysg, a'r hyn rydym yn ei weld ydy ein bod ni'n colli myfyrwyr ar bob un rhan o'r daith hynny. Dyna'r her sydd gennym ni; dyna y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â hynny.

[314] Mae'n rhaid gweithio'n galetach i hyrwyddo gwerth yr iaith, manteision yr iaith, a'r ffaith ei bod hi'n bosib i blentyn—beth bynnag yw ei gefndir teuluol—barhau i astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, reit drwodd tan eu bod nhw'n cyrraedd y gweithle—boed hynny'n gorffen yr ysgol yn 16, neu fynd ymlaen i addysg bellach neu i addysg uwch. Mae yna lwybrau yna ac, wrth gwrs, er mwyn sicrhau bod y ddadl dilyniant hynny'n gref, mae'n rhaid creu'r llwybrau, sef yr hyn rydym i gyd yn trio ei wneud ar hyn o bryd.

[315] Ond rhan o'r darlun arall wedyn, wrth gwrs, ydy'r gweithle. Os gallwn ni fod yn glir bod yna alwad o du cyflogaeth, bod yna fantais ym myd gwaith i fod â sgiliau yn y Gymraeg, yna gallwn fynd ymhell o ran dwyn mwy o berswâd ym meddwl pobl i gynnal eu sgiliau. Nid ydy sgîl yn yr iaith fel unrhyw sgîl arall—ni allwch ei gymryd yn ganiataol; mae'n rhaid cynnal y sgîl ac mae'n rhaid gweithio arno, ac mae honno'n neges glir i'w phwysleisio. Byddwn ni'n sicr yn dweud bod angen llawer mwy o waith ar ddilyniant ac mae angen

sector, and we see that we lose students at all stages of that journey. That's the challenge we're facing, and that's what we have to do to tackle that.

We need to work harder to promote the value of the language, the advantages of the language, and the fact that it's possible for a child—whatever his or her family background—to continue to study through the medium of Welsh, right through until they reach the workplace—whether they leave school at 16 years old, or continue to further education or higher education. There are pathways there for them, and in order to ensure, of course, that that progression debate is strong, we need to create those pathways, and that's what we're trying to do at the moment.

But, of course, the other part of the picture is the workplace. We need to be clear to people that there are advantages to having Welsh medium skills in the workplace, and I think we need to persuade people further to maintain their skills. A skill in the language is not like any other skill—you shouldn't be taking it for granted; you need to work on the skill and maintain it, and that's an important message to emphasise. We certainly would say that we do need a lot more work on progression and more resources to support that work

mwy o adnoddau i gefnogi'r gwaith in every part of the educational  
yna ar bob rhan o'r daith addysgol. journey.

[316] **Neil Hamilton:** Which obviously begs the question of what practical steps the Government can take, perhaps, to help put the different links of the chain together.

[317] **Dr Schiavone:** Wel, **Dr Schiavone:** Well, specific ymgyrchoedd penodol, rwy'n campaigns I think. There's a need to meddwl. Mae angen edrych yn y look at the different sectors and why sectorau gwahanol pam ein bod ni'n we're losing people along that colli pobl ar hyd y daith hynny. Mae journey. There needs to be specific angen ymgyrchoedd penodol sy'n campaigns to tackle that. mynd i'r afael â hynny.

[318] Rydym ni wedi gweld We've seen schemes in the past in cynlluniau yn y gorffennol o ran terms of introducing the Welsh cyflwyno'r Gymraeg o'r crud. Mae language from an early age. More angen mwy o waith o ran yr oed work is needed for that age—working yna—gweithio gyda rhieni ac yn y with parents and so forth—but there blaen—ond mae angen edrych ar y is a need to look at the whole picture. darlun cyflawn. Mae angen edrych ar There is a need to look at what steers beth sydd yn llywio penderfyniadau the decisions of parents, because rhieni, gan mai nhw sy'n gwneud y they make that decision in terms of dewis o ran cyfrwng iaith, yn sicr tan language, certainly up until the age eu bod nhw'n 16 oed. Beth sy'n of 16. What makes them change their gwneud iddyn nhw newid eu attitudes and feelings towards the teimladau nhw, a'u hagweddau nhw language choice of the child? If they tuag at ddewis iaith y plentyn? Os go to Welsh language sessions with ydyn nhw'n mynd i sesiynau Cymraeg their babies when they're 6 weeks i'w babi yn 6 wythnos oed, pam nad old, why don't they then send them ydyn nhw'n eu rhoi nhw mewn to Welsh nurseries and schools? In meithrinfeydd ac wedyn mewn the move from primary to secondary, ysgolion Cymraeg? Pam eu bod nhw, why do they feel there's a need to yn aml iawn, wrth fynd o'r cynradd i'r make that language shift? uwchradd yn teimlo bod angen gwneud y shifft ieithyddol yna?

[319] Felly, mae angen gweithio So, we need to look at different efo'r sectorau gwahanol, a gweld sectors, and see what needs to be beth sydd angen ei wneud. Hefyd, done. There is a need to provide mae angen rhoi mwy o gefnogaeth i more support for parents to learn the

rieni i ddysgu'r iaith gyda'u plant nhw—mae trosglwyddiad iaith yn y cartref mor allweddol. Mae angen edrych yn holistig ar y darlun cyflawn ac edrych ar bob ochr o hyn, ac yn sicr mae'n rhaid rhoi'r adnoddau i gryfhau'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r llwybrau dilyniant.

[320] **Mr Davies:** Rydw i'n credu, Gadeirydd, mae'n bwysig i ni gydnabod pa mor bwysig yn y dilyniant yma mae cymwysterau. Er gwaetha'r ffaith ein bod ni i gyd eisiau dweud mai diwedd y daith yw'r gwelliant ym mherfformiad yr unigolyn, a'r cyfraniad y mae'r unigolyn yna yn ei wneud i fusnes, y gwir yw, rydym ni'n pwysu a mesur llwyddiant addysg ar sail cymwysterau. Nid wyf yn dweud am eiliad bod hynny'n beth annoeth i'w wneud—mae'n bwysig bod yna gloriannu a mesur—ond os ydy hynny yn wir, mae'n rhaid inni ofyn: a ydy'r cymwysterau, ac wedyn y fframweithiau, yn enwedig o fewn dysgu sgiliau yn y gwaith sydd ar gael, yn creu'r cyfleoedd i addysgu drwy'r Gymraeg, ac wedyn yn creu'r allbynnau a'r deilliannau o weithlu sydd yn medru'r Gymraeg?

[321] Beth bynnag rydym ni'n ei ddweud am le mae'r her fwyaf yn nhermau cynllunio, yn y pen draw mae unrhyw system addysgiadol yn ddibynnol, efallai yn or-ddibynnol, ar gymwysterau, boed hynny'n radd, yn gwrs Pearson's neu yn gwrs gan City & Guilds, neu beth bynnag. Y gwir

language with their children, because transferring the language in the home is key. We need to have a holistic view and approach, and certainly there is a need to provide the resources available to promote these progression pathways.

**Mr Davies:** I think it's important also, Chair, that we emphasise the important of qualifications in this progression. We'd all like to say that the end of the journey would be the improvement in the individual's performance, and their contribution to the world of business, but the fact of the matter is that we measure language by looking at qualifications. It's not an unwise thing to do—it is an important thing to do—but if that's true, we do need to ask: are those qualifications and then those frameworks, especially those available in relation to work-based-learning, giving us those opportunities to learn through the medium of Welsh and then providing those outcomes of a workforce that can speak Welsh?

Whatever we say about where the major challenge is in relation to planning, at the end of the day any educational system is dependent, or perhaps overly dependent, on qualifications, whether we're talking about a degree, or a Pearson's course or a City & Guilds course. The fact of

yw, mae addysgwyr yn wastad yn dysgu i gwricwlwm sy'n seiliedig ar drio creu deilliannau yn nhermau llwyddiant, neu fethiant, yn nhermau cymwysterau. Dyna realiti'r sefyllfa. Yn ddelfrydol, efallai, fe gawn ni system arall, ond y gwir yw bod yna lefel bwysig i'r cymhwyster.

[322] **Dr Matthews:** A thra bod hynny'n wir, mae'n bwysig rhoi sylw wedyn i sicrhau bod yr adnoddau sy'n cefnogi'r cymwysterau hynny ar gael yn y Gymraeg i gefnogi'r llwybr—nid yn unig ar gael yn y Gymraeg, ond ar gael yn y Gymraeg yr un pryd â'r un adnoddau drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

[323] Ond jest i fynd yn ôl yn fyr hefyd at fater cynllunio, roedd lestyn yn sôn am gynllunio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, un o'r pethau sydd angen sylw, o bosib, ydy, ochr yn ochr â chreu cynlluniau ar lefel awdurdodau lleol i fesur y galw—mae angen meddwl nid jest beth yw'r galw eleni neu'r flwyddyn nesaf, ond beth, yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth hon, fydd y galw mewn 10 mlynedd. Mae'r math yna o ystyriaethau hefyd, rwy'n i'n meddwl. Pan fyddwn yn dod yn ôl at gynllunio, math o gamau, efallai, sydd angen rhywfaint yn fwy o ystyriaeth wrth feddwl ymlaen. Efallai na fydd y canlyniadau yn glir yn syth, ond os ydy'r math yma o ddyhead yn mynd i gael ei wireddu, dyna'r math o feddwl, nid targedau. Mae'n rhaid cael targedau, ond bydd rhai o'r rheini'n dargedau na fyddwn ni'n

the matter is that teachers are always teaching to a particular curriculum, which is based on trying to create outcomes in relation to success, or failure, in relation to qualifications. That's the reality. Ideally, we'd have a different system, but the fact is that qualifications are important.

**Dr Matthews:** And while that is important, of course, we also need to pay attention to the fact that the resources that support those qualifications are available in Welsh to support that pathway—not just available in Welsh, but also available at the same time in Welsh as they are in English. That's very important.

But just to go back to the issue of planning, lestyn was talking about year-on-year planning, one of the things we need to pay some attention to is, perhaps, side by side with creating the schemes on a local authority level in measuring demands—we need to think about not just what the demand is this year or next year, but in the context of this strategy, what might the demand be in 10 years' time. Those types of considerations are very important, I think. When we come back to planning, those are the types of steps we need to give more consideration to. Maybe those outcomes won't be immediately clear, but if this type of desire is going to be realised, that's the type of thinking we need, not targets. We do need to have targets, of course, but some of them will be



gallu adnabod a ydyn nhw wedi cael eu cyrraedd am beth amser.

targets that we won't be able to identify as to whether they've been reached for some time.

11:45

[324] **Dr Schiavone:** Rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn cydnabod nad ydy'r drafodaeth jest am addysg chwaith, wrth gwrs. Mae'r dilyniant yn gymaint yn fwy nag a yw'r addysg ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu beidio ac a ydy rhywun yn ei ddewis. Mae'n ymwneud ag agwedd pobl at yr iaith—sut mae ein pobl ifanc ni, yn enwedig, yn gweld yr iaith; a ydy hi'n berthnasol iddyn nhw; a ydy hi'n rhan o'u bywyd nhw; a ydyn nhw'n gweld eu bod yn mynd i fod yn parhau â'r iaith drwy weddill eu bywyd. Mae hwnnw'n gosod her fwy ond sydd yn dangos yr ymdrechion y mae'n rhaid inni eu gwneud i normaleiddio'r iaith ymhob cyd-destun ar fywyd, i sicrhau nad yw disgyblion yn gweld hyn fel cyfrwng o ddysgu yn unig—ei bod yn iaith fyw iddyn nhw ym mhob cyd-destun ar fywyd. Mae hynny'n golygu sicrhau cyfleoedd cymdeithasol ac mewn chwaraeon—mynd â'r iaith at bobl yn y cymunedau ac yn y meysydd hynny o ddiddordeb iddyn nhw.

**Dr Schiavone:** I think it's also important to recognise that this discussion isn't just about education progression, of course. It's about more than just whether the education is available through the medium of Welsh and whether people make that decision. It's to do with people's attitudes towards the language—how our young people view the language; is it relevant to them; is it part of their everyday lives; can they see that they're going to continue with the language for the rest of their lives. That places a bigger challenge but shows the efforts that we have to make to normalise the language in every context of life to ensure that pupils don't see this as just an education medium—that it's a living language in every context of life. That means ensuring social and sports opportunities—taking the language to people in the communities and to those areas that are of interest to them.

[325] **Bethan Jenkins:** Mae hynny'n ein cymryd ni at gwestiwn am y gymuned. Mae cwestiwn gan Suzy ynglŷn â hynny yn benodol.

**Bethan Jenkins:** That brings us to a question on community. Suzy has a specific question on that.

[326] **Suzy Davies:** Anticipated there—[*Inaudible*]. I'd like to start with

lestyn, if that's all right. Obviously, there have been great successes and leaps ahead in all parts of Wales for primary education through the medium of Welsh anyway, but if we're looking at 1 million speakers, or 1 million users, at least, by 2050, that still leaves the best part of 2 million who won't be. So, we're still talking, even in the long term, of accepting that certain communities won't be buying into Welsh language education perhaps at any level. Bearing in mind that further education colleges are mainly populated by the people from their locality, what can they do in terms of community engagement to make sure that, for people outside that institution, Welsh is a real thing and is something that actually goes beyond the college gates?

[327] **Mr Davies:** Well, after a break from education—it was only about a year and a half, because I started going into FE colleges, into education environments—I was quite taken aback, not just because they're complying with the statutory requirements or the terms of their schemes. I can't think of any college where I haven't gone to where there isn't an element, and a kind of strong element, of bilingualism, and it's a clear proposition, if you like, from the college that this is the Wales that we currently inhabit.

[328] I think one of the real challenges is to move beyond that college, if you like, as an example of bilingualism and the use of Welsh in its community, to be able to demonstrate through its business engagement functions, through its parents' evenings, through the other things that it does as an ambassador, if you like, in its community, to ensure that particularly employers see the benefit—the economic and business benefits. I'm still not convinced, a year on from coming into this sector, and, indeed, as I would have been previously, that the Welsh Government does engage as effectively as it should do with business in particular to demonstrate the value of offering a bilingual service—and not just the value in terms of customer satisfaction, but the value to its innovation processes and the value it has to its sense of cultural identity. Whilst my visit to the Basque Country back in June wasn't to look at its language provision, what was evident was the notion of the region—the autonomous region—being both a bilingual region as well as a powerhouse in manufacturing. Those two entities were hand in hand.

[329] So, I think if we can promote the idea of Wales being a country that makes, whether it's in the key sectors, or a country that can offer a warm welcome in terms of tourism, or in the other key economic sectors—to be able to do that and then demonstrate that the Welsh adds value, I think, would further strengthen the role of the FE college in its community to be

more than just this island of bilingualism or Welsh provision. But it's a massive, monumental task. We could hit 1 million Welsh speakers and still be short of a third as the demographics of Wales and the population increase. So, as a proportion of the whole, we could be chasing a shrinking target. My personal passion—and I know it's a passion that's shared among the principals, particularly in south-east Wales—is to buck the trend and for people to actually realise that there's some fantastic work going on in south-east Wales in particular in terms of FE, in an area that perhaps you wouldn't associate with it being a bilingual or Welsh-speaking area.

[330] **Suzy Davies:** Well, I'm not going to disagree with anything you said there, but do you think a college has a greater range of influence beyond business? I'm thinking, actually, about the families and the take-up in the first place. People in families work, obviously, so some of them will perhaps come across what you're saying, but some of them perhaps won't. I'm just thinking of those really front-facing jobs—high street, retail—where I still think that the worthwhileness of being bilingual still isn't striking home in communities where, by now, you would have thought it might have.

[331] **Mr Davies:** I think again—a personal observation—is that we've put far too much responsibility on very young pupils to carry the burden, if you like, of bilingualism and the use of the Welsh language going forward.

[332] **Suzy Davies:** Good point.

[333] **Mr Davies:** That explains, perhaps, why some of them, at 16, choose to study outside of a Welsh-medium environment. I think, secondly, whilst the FE institutions are good, grounded, established anchor institutions in their community, they can't do this alone. Clearly, despite saying that my comments today are largely about how you provide an educational service that is either Welsh and English or bilingual, there has to be recognition that, without standards, without the Measure informing and, indeed, enforcing behaviour, any one part of society can't actually equip Wales for this task alone. So, there has to be a concerted effort and it can't be just the job of one Minister, who seems, on the surface, very, very committed and very diligent in the early days of this administration to promoting this target; it has to be something that is accepted across Government.

[334] I genuinely think that the Government has to do a lot more to engage with business to promote the benefits of bilingualism to the bottom line. We're familiar with *laith Gwaith* as a concept, but it's got to also be the

language of profit and the language of actually increasing your bottom line. If you look again across the globe, there are areas of Europe and areas of the world that actually turn their bilingualism into a marketable commodity that improves gross value added. But, ultimately, we have to get to grips with some of the strategic planning problems that I think we've both identified. We didn't collude before coming in. Coffee was nice in the gallery, but we didn't sort of sit down and say, 'What shall we say?'

[335] **Suzy Davies:** It's okay; I've got questions for them in a minute. *[Laughter.]*

[336] **Mr Davies:** We have come to the point that, without strategic systemic planning, you are leaving institutions such as FE colleges and indeed HE institutions, which I would say are much more rigorous, much stronger and much better endowed financially than the FE sector, obviously—

[337] **Suzy Davies:** Hint, hint.

[338] **Mr Davies:** Even allowing them to shoulder this burden will not achieve the aims that we want.

[339] **Bethan Jenkins:** Dawn has got a short question. We can't really afford much more time on—

[340] **Dawn Bowden:** Yes. I'm conscious of time, so I do apologise and I will keep this brief. It's been accepted that, primarily, the new Welsh speakers coming through are going to be through the schooling system, but we're not going to achieve the 1 million without hitting adults as well. Do you believe there is sufficient adult education, or Welsh for adult provision, that's going to feed into that?

[341] **Dr Matthews:** Rwy'n credu bod sefydlu'r Ganolfan Dysgu Cymraeg Genedlaethol wedi mynd i'r afael—. Yr ateb syml, mae'n debyg, er gwaethaf yr holl waith ardderchog a oedd yn digwydd, oedd 'na', ond mae hynny, byddwn i'n ei feddwl, yn mynd i newid, gyhyd ag y bo'r ganolfan newydd, gyda'i strategaeth genedlaethol, yn cael yr adnoddau  
**Dr Matthews:** I think that establishing the National Centre for Learning Welsh has addressed—. The simple answer, it seems, despite all the excellent work that was happening, was 'no', but that, I would think, is going to change, as long as the new centre, with its national strategy, has the resources that are required to operate. The fact that that centre has

angenrheidiol i weithredu. Mae'r ffaith bod y ganolfan honno wedi dod i fodolaeth eleni yn sicr yn mynd i allu arwain at lawer mwy o gynllunio fel bod y gwaith ardderchog sydd yn digwydd yn y maes dysgu Cymraeg nid yn unig yn parhau yn y modd y mae e wedi bod ar hyd y blynyddoedd, ond hefyd bod y ffordd y mae'n datblygu yn cael ei chynllunio—a'r ffordd y mae arbenigedd hefyd mewn dysgu Cymraeg o ran datblygu tiwtoriaid proffesiynol i gefnogi hynny. Felly, yn sicr, nid yw wedi bod yn faes sydd wedi derbyn digon o gefnogaeth, ac nid oes digon o gynllunio cenedlaethol wedi bod, ond mae hynny wedi newid, diolch i'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud yn y maes.

[342] **Mr Davies:** Very briefly, two of the Welsh language centres are located in FE institutions—in Coleg Cambria and Coleg Gwent—under current provision, but I would make the point, wouldn't I, that for as long as the Welsh Government undervalues and then underfunds adult continuing education or adult community learning more widely, then you can't expect it to achieve any support or to give any support in terms of the Welsh language. If you undervalue it, you can't but expect that it underachieves in terms of outcomes more widely, let alone the Welsh language.

[343] **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy, yn glou. **Bethan Jenkins:** Suzy, quickly.

[344] **Suzy Davies:** Ie, jest cwestiwn olaf ynglŷn ag addysg uwch. Jest i fynd yn ôl at y cwestiwn o ddylanwadu ar gymunedau. Wrth gwrs, mae llai o brifysgolion yng Nghymru na cholegau addysg bellach, ac mae'r bobl sy'n mynd yno ddim yn lleol fel arfer. Weithiau y

**Suzy Davies:** Just a final question in relation to HE. Can I come back to the issue of influencing communities? Because there are fewer universities in Wales than there are FE colleges, and the people who attend them are very often not local. Sometimes they are, but they can come from all parts

maen nhw, ond maen nhw'n dod o bob cornel o Gymru. Felly, sut mae'n bosib i sefydliadau addysg uwch ddylanwadu ar gymunedau lleol a chymunedau sydd ddim yn lleol, ond dyna o le y mae rhai myfyrwyr yn dod?

[345] **Dr Matthews:** Mae'n wir bod prifysgolion yn llai lleol yn yr ystyr nad oes yna brifysgol ym mhob cymuned, neu o fewn cyrraedd i bob cymuned, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod nifer ohonynt yn gwneud gwaith pwysig, wrth gwrs, gyda'u cymunedau daearyddol. Ond, rhan o rôl a chyfraniad prifysgolion i'r agenda hon yw dangos i'r gymuned yn ehangach fod modd astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a chyflawni ymchwil drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar lefel prifysgol, sydd yn rhan o ddilyniant, wrth gwrs. Os oes modd ei wneud e yn fanna, mae modd ei wneud e ym mhob man arall. Felly, mae'n fater o gyfathrebu eu llwyddiannau. Wrth gwrs, er nad ydyn nhw, efallai, wedi'u lleoli yn ddaearyddol mewn ambell i fan, mae gweithgaredd prifysgolion yn ymestyn ymhell y tu hwnt i'w canolfannau daearyddol—y tu hwnt i Gymru, yn wir. Felly, mae yna ran ganddyn nhw i'w chwarae yn fanna.

[346] **Dr Schiavone:** Maen nhw hefyd yn gyflogwyr mawr, yn amlwg, yn yr ardaloedd lle mae yna brifysgolion. Mi allent yn sicr ddangos arweiniad drwy sicrhau bod eu staff eu hunain yn cael y cyfleoedd i ddysgu'r iaith ac

of Wales. So, how is it possible for HE institutions to influence local communities and communities that are not local to them, but that is where some students come from?

**Dr Matthews:** It's true that universities are less local in the sense that there isn't a university in every community, or that's easily accessible by every community, but, of course, many of them do some important work with their geographical communities. But, part of the role and contribution of universities to this particular agenda is to show the community on a wider level that you can study through the medium of Welsh and undertake research through the medium of Welsh at university level, which is part of progression, of course. If it's possible to do it there, you can do it everywhere else. So, I think it's a matter of them communicating their successes. Of course, although they may not be located geographically in certain areas, the activities of universities do extend much further than their geographical centres—beyond Wales, indeed. So, they do have a part to play.

**Dr Schiavone:** They're also, of course, large employers in the areas where there are universities. They could certainly give a lot of leadership by making sure that their staff have opportunities to learn the language

i ddefnyddio'r iaith, a'u bod nhw, fel sefydliadau sydd yn ddylanwadol yn y cymunedau lle maen nhw wedi'u lleoli, yn rhoi bri ar yr iaith ac yn defnyddio'r iaith fel cyfrwng, a bod hynny'n weladwy.

and to use the language, and that they, as influential institutions in the communities where they are located, make sure that there is esteem for the Welsh language and that they use it as a medium, and that that is visible.

[347] O safbwynt y myfyrwyr, wedyn, yn aml iawn mae myfyrwyr yn bobl sydd yn dod i mewn ac yn gadael y cymunedau hynny, ond tra eu bod nhw yna, mae ganddyn nhw gyfraniad i'w wneud yn y gymuned. Rŷm ni wedi bod yn gwneud gwaith o ran cynllunio profiad gwaith i fyfyrwyr, ac yn y blaen, sydd yn eu lleoli nhw mewn mannau gwaith lle mae yna gyfle i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg ac ati. Byddai mwy o gynlluniau o'r math yna, sydd yn rhoi cyfle i fyfyrwyr tra eu bod nhw yn y brifysgol i gyfrannu mewn ffyrdd gwahanol at weithleoedd a'r gymuned yn help, yn enwedig os ydyn nhw'n mynd allan â'r iaith gyda nhw fel sgîl ac fel ased ychwanegol i'r dyfodol.

In relation to the students, of course, those students are very often people who come in and then leave those communities, but while they are there, they do have a contribution to make to that community. We've been doing work in relation to planning work experience for students that placed them in workplaces where they can use the Welsh language and so on. More of those sorts of schemes that give students opportunities while they're at university to contribute in different ways to workplaces and the community would help, especially if they're taking the language with them as a skill and an additional asset for the future.

[348] **Suzy Davies:** Grêt. Felly, rydych chi'n gweld rhai o'r myfyrwyr yn mynd yn ôl i'w cymunedau gwreiddiol, sydd ddim yn gymunedau Cymraeg, fel *ambassadors* mewn ffordd. Rydych chi'n gweld eu bod nhw'n gwneud rhai—

**Suzy Davies:** Great. So, you're seeing some students going back to their original communities, which may not be Welsh-speaking communities, as ambassadors, in a way. You see that they're doing some—

[349] **Dr Schiavone:** Wel, mae yna gyfle yna, yn sicr, iddyn nhw fod wedi gwneud hynny. Mae profiadau myfyrwr mewn prifysgol mor

**Dr Schiavone:** Well, yes, there's certainly an opportunity for them to do that. Students' experiences at university are so valuable in terms of

werthfawr o ran y cyfraniad y byddan nhw'n ei wneud unwaith y byddan nhw wedi gadael, ond tra eu bod nhw yna, mae ganddyn nhw gyfraniad i'w wneud yn y gymuned lle maen nhw wedi'i lleoli.

the contribution that they will make once they leave, but while they're there, they have a contribution to make to the community where they're located.

[350] **Suzy Davies:** Y pwynt rwy'n trio jest ei weld yw: a ydych chi'n gweld cymaint o fyfyrwyr sydd yn siarad Cymraeg ac yn hyderus yn y Gymraeg yn mynd i chwilio am ardaloedd Cymraeg neu lefydd fel Caerdydd, lle mae yna siawns i gael swydd ddwyieithog, hyd yn oed, yn lle mynd yn ôl, er enghraifft, i Gyfnewidiadau y de, lle dylai fod cyfle ond nid yw'r cyfle yn cyrraedd?

**Suzy Davies:** What I'm trying to ask is: do you see as many students who are confident in the Welsh language going to look for Welsh areas, or Cardiff, maybe, where there is at least an opportunity to have a bilingual post, instead of going back, for example, to the Valleys of south Wales, where there should be opportunities available for them, but there aren't?

[351] **Dr Matthews:** Mae hynny'n wir.

**Dr Matthews:** That is true.

[352] **Bethan Jenkins:** Jest yn fyr. Sori.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Just briefly. Sorry.

[353] **Dr Matthews:** Rhan o'r her, wrth gwrs, fel y dywedoch chi yn gynharach, ydy sicrhau bod yna, i ryw raddau, gyfleoedd i weithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar draws Cymru, lle bynnag y mae'r ardaloedd yr ydym yn sôn amdanyn nhw.

**Dr Matthews:** Part of the challenge, as you said earlier, is ensuring that there are, to some extent, opportunities to work through the medium of Welsh across Wales, whatever the area we're talking about.

[354] **Dr Schiavone:** Ie, ac os nad oes yna, ein bod ni'n magu'r ymdeimlad ynddyn nhw eu bod nhw eisiau defnyddio'r sgiliau iaith hynny, ac, yn lle bynnag y maen nhw, os nad oes cyfle naturiol mewn swydd i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg, eu bod nhw wedi datblygu i'r graddau hynny eu bod nhw'n ymhyfrydu yn eu sgiliau

**Dr Schiavone:** Yes, and if there isn't, that we nurture that feeling of wanting to use those language skills, and, wherever they are, if the opportunities aren't there naturally to use the Welsh language, that they have developed so much by then that they are proud of their skills and see value in those skills so that they,



ac yn gweld gwerth yn y sgiliau fel eu bod nhw, maes o law, yn gallu cyflwyno'r Gymraeg ym mha bynnag faes. Mae'n rhan o greu'r sifft yma yn y genhedlaeth nesaf o bobl a fydd yn mynd allan i'r man gwaith, a'u hagwedd nhw tuag at yr iaith a'r defnydd ohoni.

eventually, can introduce the Welsh language in whatever area they are. It's part of creating that shift in the next generation of people who are going out to the workplace, and their attitude towards the language and the use of the language.

[355] **Suzy Davies:** Diolch yn fawr, a diolch, Gadeirydd.

**Suzy Davies:** Thank you very much, and thank you, Chair.

[356] **Bethan Jenkins:** A oes modd i chi, lestyn, gael y neges i ni ynglŷn â'r ardaloedd roeddech chi'n dweud a oedd yn ddi-Gymraeg, ond lle roedd addysg bellach yn gweithio yn dda gyda'i gilydd, achos nid oes amser gennym ni i fynd i fanylder yn awr, os yw hynny'n iawn?

**Bethan Jenkins:** Could you, perhaps, lestyn, send us a note in relation to those areas you were mentioning earlier that weren't Welsh speaking, but where FE was working together well, because we can't go into the detail on that now as we don't have time, if that's okay?

[357] **Mr Davies:** Ie. Dim problem.

**Mr Davies:** Yes. No problem.

[358] **Bethan Jenkins:** Diolch yn fawr i chi am roi tystiolaeth yma heddiw. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd croeso ichi ymwneud â'r ymchwiliad fel y mae'n datblygu. Byddwn ni'n anfon y record atoch chi. Diolch yn fawr am eich tystiolaeth yma heddiw.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Thank you very much for giving your evidence here today. We'd be very happy to see you involved further in this inquiry as it develops. We will send you a transcript of the meeting today. Thank you very much for your evidence.

[359] **Dr Matthews:** Diolch i chi, a diolch am y cwestiynau. Diolch yn fawr.

**Dr Matthews:** Thank you, and thanks for the questions. Thank you.

## Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to Note

[360] **Bethan Jenkins:** Rŷm ni'n **Bethan Jenkins:** We're going to move symud ymlaen at eitem 5, sef on to item 5 now—papers to note. papurau i'w nodi. Mae yna lu o We have many papers here—I'm not bapurau yma—nid wyf am ddarllen going to read through them all. trwyddyn nhw i gyd. Mae Aelodau'n Members can see that we've had gallu gweld bod yna lythyrau gan communication from the chair of gadeirydd S4C; mae yna rai ynglŷn â S4C; there are some on Historic Cymru Hanesyddol a chyllideb ddrafft Wales and the Welsh Government's Llywodraeth Cymru, a gan draft budget, and from the director gyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y BBC. A yw general of the BBC. Is everyone happy pawb yn hapus i nodi'r papurau to note those additional papers? ychwanegol hynny?

[361] **Lee Waters:** Could I just ask, on the S4C letter, whether there's been any progress in our communications with the Presiding Officer? Did we not discuss approaching the Presiding Officer about an agreement with S4C to present their accounts?

[362] **Mr George:** There's been no progress on that, but we will take that forward.

[363] **Bethan Jenkins:** What I was going to suggest in private was that we, obviously, bring together the evidence sessions we've had with the BBC, ITV and such, and that we make recommendations in that way through the report that we would carry out, but, if you want it to happen separately, that's fine, we can do that.

12:00

[364] **Lee Waters:** I just think that the S4C letter is not really a policy matter for the inquiry, it's more of a procedural matter for the committee and the Presiding Officer to agree amongst ourselves, and S4C are indicating a willingness to do that more formally, and I would suggest that we institute those discussions with the PO to see if we can make progress.

[365] **Bethan Jenkins:** Okay.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd  
o'r Cyfarfod ar gyfer Eitem 7**  
**Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public  
from the Remainder of the Meeting for Item 7**

*Cynnig:*

*Motion:*

*bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu that the committee resolves to  
gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y exclude the public from the  
cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog remainder of the meeting in  
17.42(vi).*

*accordance with Standing Order  
17.42(vi).*

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion moved.*

[366] **Bethan Jenkins:** Eitem 6: y **Bethan Jenkins:** Item 6: the motion  
cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i under Standing Order 17.42 to  
benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r resolve to exclude the public from  
cyfarfod ar gyfer eitem 7, os yw the remainder of the meeting for  
hynny'n iawn gan bawb. Diolch. item 7, if that's all right with  
everybody. Thank you.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 12:00.*

*The public part of the meeting ended at 12:00.*