



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru The National Assembly for Wales

Y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg The Children, Young People and Education Committee

**Dydd Mercher, 8 Gorffennaf 2015
Wednesday, 8 July 2015**

Cynnwys Contents

[Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon](#)
[Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions](#)

[Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 3](#)
[Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans \(WESPs\)—Evidence Session 3](#)

[Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 4](#)
[Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans \(WESPs\): Evidence Session 4](#)

[Papurau i'w Nodi](#)
[Papers to Note](#)

[Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42\(ix\) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o Weddill y Cyfarfod](#)
[Motion under Standing Order 17.42 \(ix\) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting for the Remainder of the Meeting](#)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Keith Davies	Llafur Labour
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Ann Jones	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Chair of the Committee)
David Rees	Llafur Labour
Aled Roberts	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Simon Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Sioned Birchall	Swyddog Polisi ac Ymchwil, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Policy and Research Officer, the Welsh Language Commissioner
Meri Huws	Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Welsh Language Commissioner
Gari Lewis	Pennaeth y Gymraeg mewn Addysg—y Gangen Gynllunio Head of Welsh in Education—Planning Branch
Huw Lewis AC / AM	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau) Assembly Member, Labour (Minister for Education and Skills)
Dyfan Sion	Cyfarwyddwr Polisi ac Ymchwil, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg Policy and Research Director, the Welsh Language Commissioner
Bethan Webb	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr—y Gymraeg Deputy Director—Welsh Language

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Sarah Bartlett	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Marc Wyn Jones	Clerc Clerk
Siân Thomas	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:32.
The meeting began at 09:32.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Ann Jones:** Good morning, everybody. Welcome to the Children, Young People and Education Committee. There are a number of apologies this morning. We've apologies from Bethan Jenkins and from Suzy Davies, who are both substituting on another committee. We've apologies from John Griffiths, who is on another Assembly committee, as is Lynne Neagle, and we've had apologies from Angela Burns as well. We understand that Mark Isherwood is going to be joining us shortly, and we're delighted to have Mike Hedges with us, who is substituting for Lynne Neagle. So, you're all very welcome. That's changed the committee membership quite a bit, but there you go.

[2] The usual housekeeping rules apply. I don't think I need to go through them in any depth, but I just remind you that, should the fire alarm operate, we'll take our instructions from the ushers. If we're able to get out through the door to my left, then the assembly point is the Pierhead building. Other than that, we'll take our instructions, as I say, from the ushers. We operate bilingually, as you know. You're able to speak in Welsh or English, and there's translation via the headsets. Channel 1 is the translation from Welsh into English, and channel 0 is for floor language amplification, should you need it.

09:33

Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg—Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 3

Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs)—Evidence Session 3

[3] **Ann Jones:** We're going to carry on with our inquiry into Welsh in education strategic plans. In this evidence session, we're delighted to have the Minister with us—and we're always delighted to have you with us. So, Minister, would you like to just introduce yourself and then your officials, and then we'll move into some questions?

[4] **The Minister for Education and Skills (Huw Lewis):** Of course. I'm Huw Lewis, the Minister for Education and Skills. On my left is Bethan Webb, deputy director, and on my right is Gari Lewis, who is head of Welsh in education planning.

[5] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thanks very much. As I said, we're looking at this. We've had quite a lot of written evidence and we're just doing a short inquiry into this. We've got four areas that we want to cover, Minister, if that's okay. The first one is around WESPs and the Welsh-medium education strategy. We want to look at assessing and meeting local demand, and then we want to look at monitoring, reviewing, reporting, approving and compliance with the schemes, and then also how WESPs interact with the broader Welsh Government policies. So, those are the four areas that we're going to be covering. We'll start off, then, and David and Mike, you're going to take the first set on WESPs and the Welsh-medium education strategy. Mike.

[6] **Mike Hedges:** Yes. Can I talk about 16-19 education?

[7] **Huw Lewis:** Sure.

[8] **Mike Hedges:** Most 16-19 education, in fact nearly all in some areas, is run by colleges rather than by schools. How does this plan work with colleges? I know the difficulty colleges have to get pupils, even those who have gone through Welsh-medium education, to actually undertake courses through the medium of Welsh. I'd also like to ask you about City and Guilds and certain craft courses. Are they all eligible to be taken through

the medium of Welsh?

[9] **Huw Lewis:** Okay. I might need to turn to officials on the specifics around City and Guilds, if you'll forgive me. But in terms of FE, it should operate in exactly the same way as it would do for schools, although there might be more of an emphasis perhaps for some FEIs in terms of the need to consult with neighbouring authorities, because they might have a broader geographical intake, of course. So, there shouldn't be any discernible difference there. There has been progress in terms of FE rising to the challenge in terms of delivering courses through the medium of Welsh, but I'll turn to Gary, I think, in terms of the City and Guilds particularly. Do we have that information in our heads?

[10] **Mr Lewis:** Obviously, we work with each awarding body to ensure that they are able to deliver qualifications and support the delivery of qualifications through the medium of Welsh, and there are a number of City and Guilds qualifications that are available through the medium of Welsh. To come back to your original question, the WESPs do take in the post-16 aspect, and, often, FE colleges are represented on local Welsh in education planning forums. That tie-in is quite important. We do ask local authorities to report on transition post-16, whether they're staying—if they're in sixth form provision—in Welsh-medium sixth form provision or whether they're moving on to FE colleges. As you'll know, in the Welsh-medium education strategy, there is a target for those post-16 who undertake qualifications through the medium of Welsh, and we've reported on that as well.

[11] **Mike Hedges:** Can I come back to the questions on City and Guilds, because they do provide a whole range of qualifications, many of which are internationally accepted? If I wanted to be an electrician, could I do my City and Guilds electrical exams all through the medium of Welsh?

[12] **Mr Lewis:** Would you need to, though?

[13] **Mike Hedges:** Well, I would if you're going to teach me through the medium of Welsh. If you're going to teach me electrical theory through the medium of Welsh, I would expect, having been taught it through the medium of Welsh, to take the City and Guilds tests through the medium of Welsh. What's the point teaching me through the medium of Welsh if I have to translate what I've been taught into English to take the exams?

[14] **Huw Lewis:** Of course, Mike. I don't know specifically on the electricians' qualifications. We'd need to get back to that.

[15] **Mike Hedges:** Well, I could have said 'plumbers'. I just picked a trade.

[16] **Huw Lewis:** I know. The range of subject areas that are available—we'll make sure that the committee gets that information.

[17] **Ann Jones:** Do you want to carry on?

[18] **Mike Hedges:** Yes, please. You've got 25 per cent of seven-year-olds being educated through the medium of Welsh as a target. I think it's probably an ambitious target, because it's substantially above the number of people who actually speak Welsh in Wales at the moment. I know that Ti a Fi and Mudiad Meithrin don't come under your area, but, from my experience and, looking around, probably the experience of others, if you get children in Ti a Fi, then you get them in Mudiad Meithrin or they do a Flying Start through the medium of Welsh, and the ability to get them to still be doing Welsh at seven is substantially higher than if they end up going through an English-medium nursery provision. I don't think they come under you, do they? If they do, what are you doing to promote it? If they don't, have you talked to the person who is responsible for it?

[19] **Huw Lewis:** Well, yes, of course. The input of Welsh-medium childcare settings and those organisations—*meithrin* and others—is absolutely integral to the formulation of a WESP, and so each of the 22 local authority WESPs that you might want to take a look at will have, as a very important element, that strategic overview of how the pre-school settings feed into the system. You're absolutely right that that is where most traction can be gained in terms of boosting those numbers by the time they get to the age of seven. So, that is a feature there in each and every one of the WESPs, and needs to be.

[20] **Mike Hedges:** This is my last question, and this again is on the same area of Flying Start. Now, if children go to Welsh-medium Flying Start, the likelihood is that they're going to carry on with Welsh-medium education. If they do English-medium Flying Start, it's only the highly enthusiastic Welsh-medium supporting parent that's going to send them into Welsh-medium education. Again, I know this doesn't come under you, but I also know from problems I've had in my constituency, and from problems that were highlighted by others—Leanne Wood highlighted problems in Newport, and Leanne Wood highlighted problems in the Rhondda regarding it—but what is being done to make sure you have 25 per cent of places in Flying Start in Welsh medium? It's great to have a target of seven, but if children have done it in the English medium from the age of two to six or two to five, the likelihood of them switching is very low. So, I mean, what I'm really asking is: is there integration in the Government to try and say, 'We'll make sure 25 per cent of places in Flying Start are in the Welsh medium to build into the 25 per cent at seven'?

[21] **Huw Lewis:** Well, I've had conversations, obviously, with the colleague who is my ministerial colleague responsible for Flying Start. As I say, the same logic applies as would to the *meithrin*, actually, to make sure that Flying Start is an integrated part of the WESP for that local authority area. I think I'm right in saying that Flying Start is a feature of every single WESP.

[22] In terms of the 25 per cent target, I think it would be very difficult to imply, and impossible to impose and even to assume a 25 per cent target in each and every local area. Every one of the 22 local authorities is different. Within each one of the 22 local authorities there are differences in terms of, for instance, parental demand. But, there has been an uplift. I'd have to write to you with the figures, but there has been a measurable uplift in terms of the numbers of Flying Start places offered through the medium of Welsh. That will, in time, feed its way through the system.

[23] **Mike Hedges:** But, I'm sorry, you're not asking for 25 per cent of seven-year-olds in each local authority to be in the medium of Welsh—it's an overall figure.

[24] **Huw Lewis:** It's an overall figure.

[25] **Mike Hedges:** Gwynedd will probably hit 100 and Monmouth will probably end up under 25. That's just a guess. As long as the balance is 25 per cent, you've hit the target. So, surely we should be looking for that number coming through.

[26] **Huw Lewis:** Yes. Well, we want and we expect, through the WESPs, to see an uplift right across the board. But, as you say, Wales is a very diverse country. In some ways, the WESPs in some parts of Wales—. One of the true worths of the strategic plans now is that we have a publicly acknowledged iterative process for parents, interest groups and the local authority to work through what exactly is deliverable in a particular area and connect that to the parental demand. That now will be a feature annually of the democratic conversation in every part of Wales.

[27] **Mike Hedges:** Sorry, I take it back—I think you're agreeing that that is important.

The real worry that I have with Welsh medium is we get 25 per cent of the population everywhere speaking Welsh—able to speak Welsh—therefore, nobody speaks it and they don't bump into enough Welsh-speakers being able to do so. You hit your target, but the actual use of Welsh in the community drops down considerably because everybody's at that level.

[28] **Huw Lewis:** Well, I think, Chair, Mike Hedges is quite right. I mean, we should be always aware of what, you know, the limitations are of a Welsh in education strategic plan and the setting of targets. To my mind, in terms of the educational opportunities for young people particularly to acquire the Welsh language, the real debate is more about the development of the Donaldson curriculum review than it would be necessarily about a target within a WESP. The WESP has usefulness. It gives us a structure. It gives us an annual conversation in a particular area. It gives parents something that they can clearly latch onto in terms of expressing their wants and their wishes, but it will not, of itself, deliver a bilingual nation. It's not that grand a thing. It has its usefulness in terms of planning of school places, and that's important.

09:45

[29] But I think in terms of language acquisition, it's the new curriculum to which we should look as the major vehicle. This distinction, actually, between Welsh-medium and English-medium is something that should have a question mark over it when it comes to the development of Donaldson.

[30] **Ann Jones:** I've got Simon before I bring David in. Simon, you had a point.

[31] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch. Sawl gwaith nawr, wrth ateb cwestiynau Mike Hedges, rŷch chi wedi cyfeirio at ddewis rhieni. Wrth gwrs, mae hwnnw'n rhan ganolog o'r cynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg, fel y maen nhw. Ond cyn bod rhieni'n gallu gwneud dewis, mae'n rhaid iddyn nhw wybod y ffeithiau: er enghraifft, a ydy addysg yn Gymraeg—addysg ddwyieithog—yn mynd i fod yn fuddiol i'w plant? Yn arbennig, rwy'n ofidus nad oes yna ddigon o rieni mewn ardaloedd, os liciwch chi, llai dosbarth canol, neu fwy difreintiedig, yn gallu gwneud y dewis yna, neu gyda'r wybodaeth i wneud y dewis yna—dyna pam yr oedd cwestiynau Mike Hedges ar Dechrau'n Deg yn bwysig, rwy'n meddwl.

Simon Thomas: Thank you. A number of occasions now, in responding to Mike Hedges's questions, you've referred to parental choice. Of course, that is a central part of the WESPs, as they currently stand. But before parents can make a choice, they need to know the facts: for example, is Welsh-medium education—bilingual education—going to be beneficial to their children? I'm particularly concerned that not enough parents in areas that are less middle class, if you like, or more disadvantaged, can make that choice, or have the information to make that choice. That's why Mike Hedges's questions on Flying Start were important, I think.

[32] Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog lansio ymgyrch i hyrwyddo addysg Gymraeg a buddion addysg ddwyieithog, a rôl hynny hefyd wrth godi safonau'n gyffredinol, achos rydym yn gwybod, yn rhyngwladol, bod addysg mewn mwy nag un iaith yn codi safonau ar draws y cwricwlwm. Mae Donaldson yn adlewyrchu hynny ac y mae'r 'two plus one' rŷch chi wedi sôn amdano ynghylch

In that context, the First Minister launched a campaign to promote Welsh-medium education and the benefits of bilingual education, and the role of that in raising standards generally, because we know, internationally, that multilingual education raises standards across the curriculum. Donaldson reflects that and the 'two plus one' that you've mentioned in terms of other languages also reflects that. How is that

ieithoedd eraill yn adlewyrchu hynny hefyd. campaign going and what's the content of
Sut y mae'r ymgyrch yna'n mynd a beth yw that particular campaign?
cynnwys yr ymgyrch honno?

[33] **Huw Lewis:** Well, of course, this campaign has been of long standing, in terms of the national level, as you say, and there's been a budget allocated to that for many years now. There is information available to parents, whether in written form or online, and we've also had broadcast elements to that information campaign as well. We also developed three local campaigns in 2014-15 in Llanelli, Blaenau Gwent and Flintshire, working with partners and trying to find out what works best, really, at that local level—the partners were Twf, Mentrau Iaith Cymru and Mudiad Meithrin. So, you're absolutely right: that information about the desirability and the educational worth of bilingual or Welsh-medium education is something we should continually push through in terms of public information. Again, though, coming back to Donaldson, I think it is time for us to have a different kind of dialogue with educationalists and, indeed, with the public, about exactly what constitutes an opportunity to grasp in terms of the acquisition of Welsh.

[34] Donaldson, I think, through his idea of progression steps, and through, as I say, my launching of the 'Bilingual plus 1' policy—which was not Donaldson; that was me—I think opens up a world of opportunity now in terms of the challenge we might set ourselves through, particularly, the development of professionals, and rethinking what a bilingual nation might look like. I think there are weaknesses, if we fixate ourselves on the idea that there are things called 'English-medium settings', 'bilingual settings' and 'Welsh-medium settings'. What really matters is: does the individual acquire the language skill? To my mind, we need to reconfigure our thinking, as we work through Donaldson in that regard—that every Welsh child should have the opportunity to acquire the language. How best do we deliver that? Fixating, I think, on ratcheting up the number of Welsh-medium places, although we need to do that, is not going to deliver a nationwide opportunity for every Welsh kid to acquire the Welsh language—it's just not going to do it; the arithmetic won't allow it. So, I think there is a whole new dimension emerging now that goes above and beyond the opportunities that there might be within an annual iterative process around a WESP, for instance.

[35] **Simon Thomas:** A gaf fi jest ddod nôl ar hynny, i fod yn glir, achos rwyf yn croesawu'r hyn rŷch chi'n ei ddweud ynglŷn â'r hawl, yn fy marn i—y dylai pob plentyn yng Nghymru gael yr hawl i ddysgu Saesneg a Chymraeg. Dylai ein system addysg ni allu darparu hynny ac nid ydyw. Mae Donaldson yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen o ran hynny. Ond, wedi dweud hynny, mae'n rhaid inni ddelio gyda'r cynlluniau strategol sydd gennym, ac mae'n rhaid inni weld beth sy'n digwydd nawr ac nid mewn wyth neu 10 mlynedd. Beth oedd y canfyddiad o'r tri phrawf roeddech yn sôn amdanynt yn sir y Fflint, Llanelli a Blaenau Gwent o safbwynt y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol? Os ydym yn gweithredu Donaldson yn y cyd-destun yma, mae'n rhaid inni fynd â rhieni gyda ni; mae'n rhaid i rieni weld nad oes yna unrhyw fygythiad, os liciwch chi, mewn dysgu Saesneg mewn addysg Gymraeg—nid oes bygythiad mewn cael y

Simon Thomas: Can I just return to that, for the sake of clarity, because I do welcome what you had to say about what is a right, in my view—the right that every child in Wales should have to learn English and Welsh. Our education system should provide for that and it doesn't. Donaldson does show the way ahead in that regard. But, having said that, we have to deal with the strategic plans that we have, and we have to see what's happening now and not just what's happening in eight or 10 years. What were the findings of the three tests you mentioned in Flintshire, Llanelli and Blaenau Gwent in terms of the most effective method? If we are to implement Donaldson in this context, we have to take parents with us; parents must see that there is no threat, if you like, to learning English in Welsh education—there is no threat in acquiring two languages, and it's not a weakness to have one language rather than another, and as we know as part of the

ddwy iaith, ac nid oes gwendid mewn cael un iaith yn hytrach na'r llall a bod modd, fel rŷm ni'n gwybod o'r dystiolaeth, i blentyn ifanc ddysgu dwy neu fwy o ieithoedd yn rhwydd, a dysgu drwy gyfrwng y ddwy iaith hynny. Ond mae'n rhaid i bobl ddeall hynny ac mae'n rhaid i bobl gefnogi hynny. Os yw lledaenu'r neges yma unrhyw beth yn debyg i'r busnes rŷm ni'n dau ynddo, sef gwleidyddiaeth, nid yw taflen neu *tweet* ddim yn gwneud y tro; mae'n rhaid i chi siarad â phobl—mae'n rhaid i chi gael lladmeryddion lleol i roi'r neges yna drosodd. A ydych chi yn hyderus bod swyddogion neu bobl sy'n gweithio ar ran polisi Cymru ar bob lefel, gan gynnwys Dechrau'n Deg a Theuluoedd yn Gyntaf a phob math o ymyrraeth sydd gan y Llywodraeth yn y gymuned, yn ddigon cefnogol i'r cysyniad yma—bod addysg Gymraeg ar gael i bawb i ddechrau—ac yn y pen draw y byddech yn ceisio cael pobl i ddeall argymhellion Donaldson hefyd?

evidence that we've gathered, young children can learn two or more languages quite easily, and learn through the medium of those languages. But people need to understand that and support that. If disseminating this message is anything like the business that we're in, namely politics, a leaflet or a tweet isn't going to be fitting; you need to speak to people—you need advocates at a local level to convey that message. Are you confident that officials or people working on behalf of Welsh policy at all levels, including Flying Start and Families First and all sorts of Government intervention in the community, is sufficiently supportive of this concept—that Welsh-medium education is available to all, first of all—and ultimately you would also be encouraging people to understand the Donaldson recommendations?

[36] **Huw Lewis:** You're right to say that there needs to be a big emphasis in terms of hearts and minds, reassurance and, indeed, a continual conversation about the advantages of a bilingual upbringing and so on. I don't believe that, as yet, the local campaigns that I mentioned have had any evaluation.

[37] **Mr Lewis:** Not as such.

[38] Beth rŷm ni wedi ei deimlo ar y pwynt sydd gyda chi yw ein bod ni bellach yn rhoi cyfrifoldeb i ysgolion, a beth mae hynny wedi dangos yw ein bod wedi trefnu'r gweithgareddau yn lleol, ac mae'r rheini wedi tynnu lot o bobl mewn. Efallai nad ydym wedi cael lot o gynnydd yn sir y Fflint, ond roedd rhai rhieni wedi dangos diddordeb mewn rhoi profiad o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i'w plant. Beth rŷm ni wedi penderfynu ei wneud—beth mae'r ymarfer yma wedi ei ddangos—yw bod yn rhaid inni arfogi'r ysgolion eu hunain. Hynny yw, mae'r ddeialog i fod i ddigwydd rhwng yr ysgol a'i chymuned ei hun, mewn gwirionedd, a dyna beth fydd yn digwydd. Rym ni'n mynd i ddatblygu rhyw fath o *toolkit* i ysgolion penodol i weithio gyda'u cymunedau er mwyn esbonio'r math o brofiad mae plant yn ei gael o fewn yr ysgolion yna, ac rwy'n credu taw dyna'r dull gorau, mewn gwirionedd. Ar ôl hynny, wedyn, mae'r gair yn mynd ar led, os oes yna gyfathrebu rhwng yr ysgolion eu hunain

What we have felt on your point there is that we place responsibility on schools, and what that has shown is that we've arranged local activities, and some of those have pulled a lot of people in. Maybe we haven't had many in Flintshire, but there were some parents who showed an interest in providing their children with the Welsh-medium education experience. What we've decided to do—and what this exercise has shown—is that we arm the schools themselves. That is, the dialogue is supposed to happen between the school and its own community, really, and that is what will happen. We are going to develop some sort of toolkit for specific schools to work with their communities to explain the sort of experience that children have within their schools, and I think that's the best method. Subsequently, word spreads, if there is communication from the schools themselves about the provision. So, there's no need for a person in the middle, such as Families First or Communities First or whatever, but people working in the field,

am y ddarpariaeth ei hun. Felly, nid oes eisiau dyn yn y canol, fel Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf neu Gymunedau'n Gyntaf neu beth bynnag, ond y bobl sydd yn gweithio yn y maes, a dyna'r ffordd ymlaen rŷm ni wedi penderfynu ei chael. and that is what we've decided as the way forward.

[39] **Ann Jones:** We've sort of strayed away from WESPs somewhat. Aled.

[40] **Simon Thomas:** I blame the Minister. He mentioned Donaldson. [*Laughter.*]

[41] **Ann Jones:** What I'll do, Aled is: if you want to ask your supplementary on this and then if you do your questions around the Welsh Government policy, we will then get back to WESPs. But, we're halfway through the session and we haven't mentioned WESPs, I don't think so.

[42] **Aled Roberts:** Mae gen i gwestiwn ar y ffaith eich bod wedi cwestiynu dilysrwydd gwahanol dermau yn cael eu defnyddio, fel 'ysgolion dwyieithog', 'ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg' ac 'ysgol cyfrwng Saesneg'. A ydy eich Llywodraeth chi yn cwestiynu o gwbl ddogfennau sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi gan gynghorau sydd yn camarwain? Mae dogfen mynediad ysgolion yn Wrecsam, er enghraifft, yn sôn am ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg—saith ohonynt—a'r 65 ysgol arall yn ysgolion dwyieithog. Ac os ydych chi yn ffonio'r swyddfa yn Wrecsam, maen nhw'n rhoi'r argraff eich bod chi'n gallu cael sgiliau Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion dwyieithog hynny. A ydych yn cytuno bod sgiliau Cymraeg fel dysgu sut i ddweud 'Bore da' ddim yn creu cymdeithas ddwyieithog? **Aled Roberts:** I have a question on the fact that you've questioned the validity of different terms that are being used, such as 'bilingual schools', 'Welsh-medium schools' and 'English-medium school'. Is your Government questioning at all documents that are published by councils that mislead? There is an access to schools document in Wrexham, for example, that talks about Welsh-medium schools—seven of them—and the other 65 schools as bilingual schools. And if you phone the office in Wrexham, they give the impression that you can gain Welsh language skills in those bilingual schools. Do you agree that Welsh language skills such as learning how to say 'Bore da' do not create a bilingual society?

[43] **Huw Lewis:** I'm not in a position to comment; my knowledge is not sufficient in terms of exactly what's going on inside Wrexham County Borough Council, although I would of course condemn—as you'd expect me to condemn—any publication or advice that was given to the public that was misleading. I would do so. I'm very content to ask my officials to take a look at the specifics around what you're saying there, Aled. But in terms of terminology, I think we've got ourselves into a terrible knot over the years in Wales in terms of the categorisation of educational settings and it doesn't help the conversation. And this does, Chair, overlap with WESPs. WESPs are, really, a structured conversation between public, local authority and other interest groups around the provision of Welsh-medium education. As I say, I think it's time to really sit down and question whether we're getting it right in terms of the dialogue between ourselves as Welsh people. It drives me absolutely potty when someone refers to an English school: 'My kids go to the English school.' English schools are in England; there are no English schools in Wales. All schools in Wales are Welsh schools and I think we need to sort our heads out in terms of the way we think about these things. Donaldson, again—it is important, Chair—I think will encapsulate much more widely what is being attempted through WESPs in terms of focusing on planning for places in certain categories of school, which is what WESPs do, and open up the conversation to be something much more wide about young Welsh citizens—how a young Welsh citizen progresses to acquire skills in the Welsh language.

[44] **Ann Jones:** Aled, do you want to—?

[45] **Aled Roberts:** Hoffwn symud ymlaen. Rwyf jest eisiau gweld a ydych chi yn asesu sut mae rhaglenni fel Twf yn cyfrannu at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ar hyn o bryd, gan nodi eich bod chi'n dweud ein bod ni, hwyrach, yn mynd i symud oddi wrth y diffiniadau yna. Ond heb sôn am unrhyw sir yn benodol, a oes yna unrhyw asesiad yn cael ei wneud o'r llif trwy raglenni Twf? Mae gen i esiamplau yn y gogledd lle mae rhieni wedi cyflwyno'u hunain i raglenni Twf, mae buddsoddiad wedi cael ei wneud gan y Llywodraeth, mae'r mamau a'r tadau ar ôl hynny wedi ceisio dysgu Cymraeg trwy addysg Gymraeg i oedolion ac yn parhau i wneud hynny, ac, eto, yn cael llefydd wedi'u gwrthod iddyn nhw mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg o'u dewis.

Aled Roberts: I want to move on. I just want to see whether you assess how programmes such as Twf contribute to Welsh-medium education at the moment, noting that you've said that we are perhaps going to move away from those definitions. But without talking about any county specifically, is any assessment being done of the flow through Twf programmes? I have examples in north Wales where parents have gone through a Twf programme, an investment has been made by the Government, the mothers and fathers after that have tried to learn Welsh through the Welsh for adults and continue to do so, and, yet, are being refused a place in Welsh-medium schools of their choice.

[46] **Huw Lewis:** As I say, I'm responsible here for the overall strategic picture around which we hope local authorities will, both with heart and mind, engage. So, these local issues I will deal with in a normal way, if Members were to contact me about their frustrations, and I will—

[47] **Aled Roberts:** Na; roeddwn yn gofyn i chi a oes unrhyw asesiad wedi cael ei wneud gan y Llywodraeth—

Aled Roberts: No; I was asking you whether any assessment has been done by the Government—

[48] **Huw Lewis:** Yes, I know; I'm getting to that, but you asked me more than one thing. Looking at Twf in particular, I'm not aware of any assessment of Twf. Has there been one?

[49] **Mr Lewis:** Mae yna sawl asesiad wedi cael ei wneud yn y gorffennol o effeithiolrwydd Twf. Roedd Twf wedi cael ei sefydlu yn bennaf i hyrwyddo'r trosglwyddo ymhlith teuluoedd sy'n siarad Cymraeg—bod y Gymraeg yn cael ei throsglwyddo gan y rheini sy'n siarad Cymraeg, boed un rhiant neu'r ddau riant. Bellach, mae Twf wedi symud draw atom ni mewn addysg oherwydd y rheswm yna ein bod ni eisiau gweld y llwybr yma—oherwydd ein bod yn gefnogol i weld llwybr reit o'r cychwyn cyntaf, beth bynnag yw'r diddordeb cyntaf, a beth bynnag yw'r sbardun ar gyfer y diddordeb cyntaf mewn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, neu yn y Gymraeg—a bod dilyniant reit trwyddo. Ar hyn o bryd, rŷm ni yn y broses o edrych yn ofalus iawn ar Twf. Roedd y cytundeb i fod

Mr Lewis: A number of assessments have been made in the past of the effectiveness of Twf. Twf was established effectively to promote the transference of language within families who spoke Welsh—that Welsh was transferred by those who speak Welsh, be that one parent or two parents. Twf has now moved to us in education for this reason that we want to see this pathway—because we support seeing a pathway right from the start, whatever the first interest, and whatever first sparks an interest in Welsh-medium education, or in the Welsh language—and that there is a continuum all the way through. At the moment, we are in the process of looking very carefully at Twf. The contract was to come to an end, but it will not come to an end with Cwmni Iaith, as it happens, but we are looking at what exactly Twf is

i ddod i ben, ond ddaw e ddim i ben gyda Cwmni Iaith, fel mae'n digwydd, ond rŷm ni'n edrych ar beth yn gwmws mae Twf yn ei gyflawni o fewn y pwrpas hwnnw, y swyddogaeth honno o greu'r llwybr cefnogi yma i deuluoedd.

[50] O ran dilyniant, rŷm ni'n gofyn, trwy'r cynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg, i bobl nodi, yn enwedig o ran y dilyniant o gylchoedd meithrin. Nid yw'r patrwm o ran Twf, neu'r ddarpariaeth, yn ddigon sefydlog inni allu mesur hynny ar hyn o bryd. Ond rŷm ni yn gallu mesur y dilyniant o gylchoedd meithrin ac rŷm ni'n gofyn i'r Mudiad Meithrin am y data ac maen nhw'n eu rhannu bellach gydag awdurdodau lleol, trwom ni, er mewn sicrhau nad oes rhwystrau yn y dilyniant yna. Rydym yn edrych yn ofalus iawn ar hynny, ac rydym yn cwrdd â'r Mudiad Meithrin. Rhan o'r cytundeb sydd gyda ni o ran grant Mudiad Meithrin yw ei bod nhw'n adrodd ar y berthynas honno. Felly, rydym yn edrych yn ofalus iawn, ond nid yw'n effeithiol bob tro, fel yr ydym ni'n gwybod.

10:00

[52] **Aled Roberts:** Wrth sôn am blant o gefndiroedd mwy difreintiedig, mae yna dystiolaeth sydd wedi cael ei rhoi gan UCAC, RhAG a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, neu'r cyfarwyddwyr addysg, sy'n awgrymu nad yw'r WESPs eu hunain yn adlewyrchu polisïau grant amddifadedd y Llywodraeth. A ydych chi'n derbyn nad yw'r WESPs eu hunain yn cymryd llawer o sylw o'r nifer o blant o gefndiroedd difreintiedig sydd yn llwyddo i gael cymwysterau trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

achieving within that purpose, that particular function of creating that supporting pathway for families.

[51] In terms of continuity, we do ask, through the WESPs, that people do note, particularly in terms of the continuity in *cylchoedd meithrin*. The Twf pattern, or provision, isn't sufficiently robust for us to measure that at present. But we can measure the continuity from *cylchoedd meithrin* and we ask Mudiad Meithrin for that data and they do share it now with local authorities, through us, to ensure that there are no barriers in that continuum. We are looking very carefully at that, and we meet with Mudiad Meithrin. Part of the agreement that we have in terms of the Mudiad Meithrin grant is that they report on that relationship. So, we are looking very carefully, but it's not always effective, as we know.

Aled Roberts: In talking about children from more disadvantaged backgrounds, there is evidence that has been submitted by UCAC and RhAG and the Welsh Local Government Association, or the directors of education, that suggests that the WESPs themselves don't reflect the deprivation grant policies of the Government. Do you accept that the WESPs themselves aren't taking much notice of the number of children from disadvantaged backgrounds that are succeeding in gaining qualifications through the medium of Welsh?

[53] **Huw Lewis:** Yes, broadly, I do accept that there's an issue around deprivation and the exercise of parental choice, for instance in terms of informed choice around bilingual or Welsh-medium education, because deprivation, as we know, restricts everything about a child's prospects, and quite often that includes the level of awareness, the level of engagement, of a family for various reasons, and many pupils, as we know, may have quite a chaotic home life. So, I think this is something that I need to take on board as those iterations of WESPs unfold, actually. I don't think it's been a robust enough feature of any of the WESPs, really, thus far, but, then again, the Welsh Government didn't ask local authorities really to concentrate on this area first time round. I think we will need to think very carefully about what we require of local authorities in future in this regard, because there are barriers thrown up between some families and any form of official information, any form of officialdom, because of the situation that families find themselves in, and breaking those barriers down needs to be very much part of how we think going forward. Again, I

think much of this will hinge upon the success of organisations like the Mudiad Meithrin in terms of face-to-face experience and real-life conversations between parents of young children and the custodians of settings in the early years. I think, if the trust is established there, and the options are understood there, then all else becomes possible.

[54] **Aled Roberts:** O ran eich sgwrs flynyddol chi ynghylch y cynlluniau yma, a ydy'ch sgysiau yn cael eu cyfyngu at swyddogion cynghorau lleol, neu a ydych chi'n sgwrsio—. Rydych chi wedi sôn am y sgwrs yr ydych chi'n cael efo Mudiad Meithrin, ond a ydych chi'n sgwrsio yn uniongyrchol efo'r rhieni sydd hwyrach yn teimlo braidd yn rhwystredig ynglŷn â pholisiau o fewn awdurdodau unigol?

Aled Roberts: In terms of your annual conversation regarding the WESPs, are they limited to local authority officials or do you have a dialogue—. You've mentioned the dialogue that you have with Mudiad Meithrin, but do you also have direct conversations with parents who perhaps feel a little frustrated about policies within individual authorities?

[55] **Huw Lewis:** Well those conversations with organisations like RhAG, for instance, are pretty much a constant feature of the way we do business here in Wales. Conversations with organisations like this committee also constitute part of that keeping in touch and that dialogue. So, yes, it's not just a question of receiving the WESPs, rubber stamping or sending back the WESPs, although we did do that. I sent 17 of the 22 back, actually, for improvement, to the local authorities, but the conversations around the WESP—as I say, the WESP is a framework. The WESP is at local level a set of strategic aims and statements of direction of travel. The conversation that goes on around the WESP needs to be much wider, and is the daily business of Welsh Government, really.

[56] **Aled Roberts:** O ran y fforymau cyfrwng Cymraeg o fewn awdurdodau lleol, roeddwn i'n gofyn i gynrychiolydd cyngor sir Gâr wythnos diwethaf a oedd y rheini yn agored i'r cyhoedd. Mae yna esiampl arall mewn sir unigol yn y gogledd lle cafodd rhieni eu taflu allan o gyfarfod wythnos diwethaf. Nid oes sôn eu bod nhw yn cam-fihafio, ond dywedir wrthyn nhw ei fod yn gyfarfod caeedig. A oes yna unrhyw ganllawiau o ran a ddylai'r fforymau hyn fod yn agored i'r cyhoedd?

Aled Roberts: In terms of the Welsh in education fora in local authorities, I was asking a representative of Carmarthenshire last week whether those were open to the public. There is another example in another county in north Wales where parents were thrown out of a meeting last week. There is no mention of them misbehaving at all, but they were told that it was a closed meeting. Is there any guidance in terms of whether these meetings should be open to the public?

[57] **Huw Lewis:** The make-up of fora has been pretty much devolved to local authorities on the basis that the Welsh Government would trust them, as public bodies, to run these according to the restraint of public law and requirements around public law, and their requirement to act reasonably in terms of how these things are run. It shouldn't be for the Welsh Government to instruct local authorities how to run a forum properly; they should know.

[58] I have to say I have not received any complaints from any individual or group about them being excluded from a forum—not one. I was acting under the impression, actually, that all of the fora—and they do have all-Wales coverage—were operating with local variations, but were operating with goodwill and an inclusive atmosphere. Again, I'd be very happy to look into the individual circumstances, of course, of which I know only what you've told me at the moment.

[59] **Aled Roberts:** Ocê. Rwyf eisiau cyfeirio, yn olaf, at e-bost a dderbyniais i

Aled Roberts: Okay. I want to refer, finally, to an e-mail that I received on Monday

nos Lun gan riant yn dilyn cyfarfod ges i a Llyr Huws Gruffydd efo swyddogion Wrecsam, lle nad oedd yna ddim symud o ran eu safbwynt nhw. Dyma beth mae riant wedi ei ddweud:

[60] ‘Mae hi mor anodd gwneud penderfyniad ynglŷn a ble fyddai orau i’r genethod. Dwi am iddynt gael yr addysg orau posib ac mae’n gas gen i weld pa mor “complacent” yw agwedd y sir tuag at addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Dwi wir yn gobeithio y bydd Huw Lewis yn ymyrryd. Hyd yn oed os ydym yn penderfynu ar addysg cyfrwng Saesneg i.... Dwi’n bendant ddim eisiau gweld neb arall yn dioddef fel ni.

[61] ‘Wedi gweithio’n wirfoddol yn y cylch meithrin ac wedi cynnal sesiynau stori a chân i Menter Maelor, ond fy mod i, rŵan, yn gorfod ystyried dysgu o adref neu derbyn addysg Saesneg gan y sir.’

[62] Os ydym yn cyrraedd sefyllfa fel yna, lle mae nifer o rieni—nid sefyllfa lle maen nhw’n wedi dwyn i fyny eu plant yn siarad Saesneg ac yn dewis addysg Gymraeg yn dair oed, ond sefyllfa lle mae’r plant yma wedi cael eu dwyn i fyny yn siarad Cymraeg, a dywedir wrthyn nhw fod yn rhaid iddyn nhw deithio dros y sir, rhyw bum milltir. Y broblem sydd gennym ni ydy, pan wnes i ofyn i’r cyngor beth fyddai’n digwydd o ran mynediad i’r dosbarth derbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, wrth ystyried eu bod yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i blant sy’n agosach at yr ysgol, fe ddywedon nhw, ‘Wel, fe fuasai’n rhaid i’r plentyn dderbyn beth sydd ar gael bryd hynny’. Pan wnes i ofyn a fuasai hynny’n creu sefyllfa lle y buasai’r cyngor sir yn disgwyl i’r plentyn symud unwaith eto, dyma nhw’n dweud, ‘Wel, dyna bolisiau mynediad Llywodraeth Cymru; nid ydyn nhw’n caniatáu i ni roi blaenoriaeth i blant sydd o fewn dosbarthiadau meithrin, beth bynnag’.

[63] Os ydym ni yn wynebu sefyllfa fel yna, a oes yn rhaid, hwyrach, i rai o ganllawiau’r Llywodraeth ynglŷn â mynediad at ddosbarthiadau derbyn cael eu hailystyried?

[64] **Huw Lewis:** Well, look, I don’t allocate school places and I don’t run the LEA in

evening from a parent following a meeting that Llyr Huws Gruffydd and I had with officials in Wrexham, where there was no movement in terms of their position. This is what the parent said:

‘It’s so difficult to make a decision about where would be best for the girls. I want them to have the best possible education and I find it upsetting to see how complacent the council seem to be towards Welsh-medium education. I really hope Huw Lewis will intervene. Even if we decide on English-medium education for.... I don’t want to see anyone suffer like we have.

‘Having worked voluntarily in the *cylch meithrin* and having held ‘stori a chân’ sessions for Menter Maelor, I now have to consider teaching from home or accepting English-medium education from the county’.

If we reach such a situation, where many parents—not a situation where they have brought their children up speaking English and then chosen Welsh-medium education at three years old, but a situation where these children have been brought up as Welsh speakers and are then told that they have to travel some five miles across the county to access Welsh-medium education. The problem we have is, when I asked the council what would happen in terms of access to the reception class next year, given that they were giving priority to the children who live closest to the school, they said, ‘Well, the child would have to accept what was available at that point’. When I asked if that would create a situation where the council would expect the child to move again, they said, ‘Well, those are the access policies of the Welsh Government; they don’t allow us to give priority to children who are in nursery classes’.

If we do face such a situation, should some of the Government’s guidance on access to reception classes be reconsidered?

Wrexham, and—

[65] **Aled Roberts:** Perhaps you should.

[66] **Huw Lewis:** There's a democratic mandate from the people of Wrexham to their local authority to do the statutory things that Wrexham, like all our other local authorities, do. I'm more than happy to delve into cases of suspected breaches of natural justice, or ham-fistedness or bad administration; I'm more than happy to broker, hopefully, a better situation on the ground in any local authority. But it's a bit unfair, Aled, for you to put me on the spot here this morning with anecdotal stuff about what people told you in Wrexham. I can't respond.

[67] **Ann Jones:** No, and perhaps you could take that up with the Minister outside and share your correspondence.

[68] **Aled Roberts:** Ocê. Rwyf i jest yn mynd i ofyn, felly, beth ydy'r sefyllfa, heb sôn am unrhyw sir, os ydych chi'n anfodlon efo polisïau neu arfer y sir? A ydych chi'n ystyried—

Aled Roberts: Okay. I just want to ask, therefore, without mentioning any particular county, what is the situation if you are not content with the policies or the practice within any county? Do you consider—

[69] **Huw Lewis:** In terms of allocation of school places?

[70] **Aled Roberts:** Wel, lle yr ydych chi'n ystyried, hwyrach, nad yw'r WESP ei hun yn creu sefyllfa lle mae'r cynllunio wedi bod yn ddigonol, a lle, yn amlwg, nid yw'r sir yn gallu ymateb i'r galw am addysg Gymraeg, a ydych chi wedi ystyried o gwbl defnyddio un ai adran 21 neu adran 57 o'r School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013?

Aled Roberts: Well, where you believe perhaps that the WESP itself doesn't create a situation where the planning has been sufficient, and where, clearly, the county is unable to respond to demand for Welsh-medium education, have you given any consideration to using either section 21 or section 57 of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013?

[71] **Huw Lewis:** Well, look, a WESP—even a good WESP—doesn't guarantee that every parent is going to have their heart's desire fulfilled. What we do expect is that every child in Wales should have access to Welsh or English-medium education as per parental preference. That doesn't entail a guarantee that a particular place in a particular school, as you know, is guaranteed to any particular parent or child. In terms of using those powers, I'm not entirely sure—I didn't know I had those powers—do you know what those powers are? [*Laughter.*]

[72] **Ann Jones:** Well, do you want to leave that, then? [*Inaudible.*] If Aled wants to take that up with you—

[73] **Aled Roberts:** To be fair, Huw has responded.

[74] **Ann Jones:** Well, that's fine then. Okay. I'm going to try to move on. We're still—we haven't even finished the first session and we've got about 20 minutes left. David, shall we come to yours and then we'll move on to Keith for assessing and meeting demands?

[75] **David Rees:** Well, I think most of the questions were raised. Shall we just move on, and I'll come back if that's the case?

[76] **Ann Jones:** Okay, fine. That's great, then. Local demand, then, which is where I think Aled was leaving off. Keith, can you—on WESPs, though, please.

[77] **Keith Davies:** Wel, fel un sydd wedi bod yn ymladd dros addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg am dros 50 mlynedd—roeddwn i'n drysorydd i ysgolion mudiad meithrin Cymraeg Caerdydd yn ôl yn y 1960au, ac yn gorfod ymladd â'r cyfarwyddwr addysg ar y pryd—roeddwn i'n falch iawn o weld eich bod chi'n gwneud pethau'n statudol, a'ch bod chi wedi penderfynu bod yn rhaid i ni gael WESPs. Rwy'n credu bod hwn yn gam ymlaen, ac rwyf wedi gweithio mewn tri awdurdod sydd wedi bod yn gefnogol i addysg Gymraeg, ond rwy'n gwybod am awdurdodau eraill nad ydynt yn gefnogol—a dyna'r cwestiwn.

Keith Davies: Well, as one who has been fighting for Welsh-medium education for over 50 years—I was the treasurer of the Welsh-medium nursery schools movement in Cardiff back in the 1960s, and had to fight the director of education at the time—I was very pleased to see that you're making things statutory, and that you've decided that we have to have WESPs. I think this is a step forward, and I've worked in three authorities that have been supportive of Welsh-medium education, but I know of other authorities that aren't—and that's the question.

[78] Y ddau beth pwysig a wnaethom ni yn yr hen Forgannwg Ganol oedd sicrhau bod swyddogion uchel yn gyfrifol am addysg Gymraeg, ac, yn ail, ein bod ni'n cwrdd â rhieni yn aml. Rwy'n darllen fan hyn i ni gael dros 40 o atebion i'r ymchwiliad hyn, ac rydych chi'n edrych arnyn nhw ac maen nhw yn rhannu. Wrecsam—mae pobl ac unigolion o Wrecsam yn siarad fan hyn. Ac wedyn rwy'n edrych ar rywle fel Castell-nedd a Phort Talbot. Yng Nghastell-nedd yn enwedig—rwy'n synnu nad oes twf yn yr ardal yna, ardal fy ngenedigaeth i. Mae cwm Nedd gyda chi, Glyn-nedd a Resolfen, lle mae pobl yn byw sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Mae llythyr yn y *Western Mail* y bore yma yn Gymraeg wrth rywun o Resolfen—ac rwy'n edrych ar hwn, ac rwy'n meddwl, 'pam?'

The two important things that we did in the former Mid Glamorgan was to ensure that senior officers were responsible for Welsh-medium education, and the second thing was that we met parents on a regular basis. I read here that we've had over 40 responses to this inquiry, and you look at them and they are split. We've got individuals in Wrexham here. And then I look at somewhere such as Neath Port Talbot. In Neath in particular—I'm surprised that there isn't growth in that area, the area where I was born. You've also got the Neath valley, Glyn Neath, Resolfen, where people live who speak Welsh. There's a letter in the *Western Mail* this morning in Welsh from somebody in Resolfen—and, I look at this, and I think, 'why?'

[79] Rwy'n credu ei fod e'n mynd yn ôl—. Rwy'n derbyn y WESPs, rwy'n credu eu bod yn gam ymlaen, ond wedyn efallai ein bod ni'n gofyn gormod ac efallai nad ydym ni'n gofyn digon—achos mae yna amrywiaeth yna.

I think it comes back—. I accept the WESPs, I think they are step forward, but then I think perhaps we're asking too much and perhaps we're not asking enough—because there is a variation there.

[80] Rydych chi'n sôn am Gyngor Sir Gâr, ond beth ddigwyddodd yng Nghyngor Sir Gâr, yw y gwnaethon nhw sefydlu pwyllgor i baratoi cynllun addysg Gymraeg i sir Gâr. Ac wedyn, rydych chi'n gweld beth sy'n digwydd. Roeddwn i mewn ysgol gynradd Gymraeg—rwyf i ar fwrdd y llywodraethwyr—wythnos diwethaf, a'r rhif sy'n cael ei dderbyn mewn ysgol yw 60. Roedd 106 wedi gofyn i fynd mewn i'r ysgol yna, ac roeddem ni fel

You talk about Carmarthenshire County Council, but what happened there was they established a committee to prepare a Welsh-medium education strategy for Carmarthenshire. I was at a Welsh-medium primary school last week—I'm on the board of governors—and the number that's accepted into the school is 60. There were 106 wanting to go into that school, and as governors we were discussing that—but there is a strong plan. Also, what is happening in

llywodraethwyr yn siarad amdano fe—ond mae cynllun cryf. Hefyd, beth sy'n digwydd yn sir Gâr—rŷm ni'n cael ysgolion fel Tre-gib, Dyffryn Aman, Bryngwyn—ysgolion uwchradd sy'n penderfynu bod galw am addysg Gymraeg, ac nid ydyn nhw moyn colli'r plant, ac maen nhw'n rhoi ffrydiau Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion cyfun. Y cwestiwn mawr wedyn yw: a ddylai'r Llywodraeth edrych ar ble mae cynlluniau arbennig a thrafod y rheini a'u rhannu nhw gyda'r awdurdodau ble mae'r gwendidau? Achos, yn y pen draw, rŷm ni eisiau ateb y galw, ond mae'n rhaid i ni ffeindio mas—a ffordd ŷch chi'n ffeindio mas—beth yw'r galw?

10:15

[81] Dyna pam oeddwn i'n cwrdd â rhieni yn aml, a dyna pam oedd Aled yn sôn am y fforwm yn gynharach. Rwy'n credu bod fforwm ym mhob sir yn bwysig iawn, achos maen nhw'n helpu, wedyn, y siroedd i benderfynu beth yw'r galw, ac, wedyn, mae e lan i'r siroedd i benderfynu. Wedyn, mae cwpwl o'r awdurdodau yn fan hyn yn credu ei fod e'n rhy fanwl—fod beth rŷch chi'n gofyn amdano yn rhy fanwl. Wel, iddyn nhw, efallai fod eisiau mwy o help oddi wrth y Llywodraeth.

[82] Rwyf yn credu hefyd fod gormod o awdurdodau yng Nghymru, reit? Yn y siroedd y buais i'n gweithio, yn y ddau gyntaf, roedd 12, wedyn wyth, a nawr mae 22, ac mae'n anodd wedyn. Rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n anodd i'r Llywodraeth i gwrso 22. Gobeithio, amser gawn ni nifer llai o siroedd, bydd pethau yn well.

[83] Ond rwyf yn credu bod eisiau edrych ar y WESPs a phenderfynu a ddylen nhw fod yn wahanol o un sir i'r llall, achos mae'r siroedd yn wahanol—o'r cefndir Cymraeg sydd yna, i'r swyddogion, ac mae swyddogion yn bwysig. Roeddwn i'n sôn am y pethau da oedd gyda ni ym Morgannwg Ganol, ond gallaf i sôn am sir arall weddol agos, lle, oherwydd yr uwchswyddogion, nid oedd dim yn digwydd yna. Roedd Morgannwg Ganol yn agor ysgol gyfun Gymraeg bob saith mlynedd i ateb y galw. Roedd y sir drws nesaf yn gwneud dim.

Carmarthenshire—we have schools such as Tre-gib, Amman Valley, Bryngwyn—secondary schools that are deciding there is a demand for Welsh-medium education, and they don't want to lose the children, and therefore they establish Welsh streams in the comprehensive schools. The big question then is: should the Government be looking at where there are particular plans and discuss those and share those with authorities where there are weaknesses? Because, ultimately, we want to meet demand, but we have to find out—and how do you find out—what the demand is?

That was why I used to meet regularly with the parents, and that's why Aled was talking about the forum earlier. I think having a forum in every county is extremely important, because they help, then, the counties to decide on what the demand is, and, then, it's up to the counties to decide. Then, there are a couple of authorities here who believe that it is too detailed—that what you're asking for is too detailed. Well, for those ones, perhaps they need more help from the Government.

I also happen to believe that there are too many authorities in Wales, right? In the counties I used to work in, in the first two, there were 12, then eight, and now there are 22, and it's difficult then. I think it's difficult for the Government to chase 22. Hopefully, when we get a smaller number of authorities, things will be better.

But I do believe that there is a need to look at the WESPs to decide whether they should be different from one county to another, because the counties are different—from the Welsh background there, to the officials, and officials are important. I was talking about the good things we had in Mid Glamorgan, but I could talk about another county that's quite close by, where, because of the senior officials, nothing happened. Mid Glamorgan opened a new Welsh-medium comprehensive every seven years to meet the demand. The county next door did nothing.

[84] **Ann Jones:** We haven't quite got to Mid Glamorgan yet, so I know—[*Laughter.*] You'll have to come to a question, because we're—

[85] **Keith Davies:** Beth rwy'n ei ddweud yw bod swyddogion yn bwysig, eich bod chi'n cael swyddog â chyfrifoldeb, achos nid wy'n siŵr, yn darllen y rhain nawr, pa un a yw'r swyddogion ym mhob sir yn ddigon uchel yn y sir i ddylanwadu ar y cynghorwyr. Achos, yn y pen draw—mae'r un peth â'r lle hyn—y swyddogion sy'n dylanwadu ar y bobl sydd wedi cael eu hethol. Wedyn, mae cwestiynau gyda fi am rai o'r siroedd hyn, p'un a oes gan y swyddogion ddigon o bŵer yn y siroedd yna i ddylanwadu ar y cynghorwyr.

Keith Davies: What I'm saying is that the officials are important, that you have an officer with responsibility, because I'm not sure, from reading these now, whether the officials in each county are of sufficient seniority in the county to influence the councillors. Because, at the end of the day—it's the same as this place—the officials influence the people who are elected. Then, I have questions about some of these counties, and whether the officials have enough power in those counties to influence the councillors.

[86] **Ann Jones:** I think there is a question there, Minister.

[87] **Huw Lewis:** Possibly. [*Laughter.*]

[88] **Ann Jones:** Look, that's for another committee to look at. We'll try and stick to WESPs, please.

[89] **Huw Lewis:** The Member for Llanelli makes some very important points. Every local area does have a forum—every local area that is required to. Incidentally, those areas with more than 50 per cent Welsh-medium coverage already, so that's Gwynedd, Anglesey and Ceredigion, are exempt from this, but the rest, all of them, have conducted an assessment of parental demand. I have asked to see the paperwork and rubric behind how they conducted that measurement of parental demand, and our initial take on this—and it is an initial take—is that all of them seem reasonably robust. There are, though, always, I would grant—and there always would be—lessons that one local authority can learn from another. As I say, Wales is a very, very diverse country, and what works in Gwynedd might not necessarily work in Newport, but there are ways of conducting a good consultation with people that are transferrable everywhere.

[90] As yet, as I say, it does seem as if the assessments of parental demand have been reasonably robust. My regulatory powers around assessments click in in 2017, and certainly when that happens, I think we will have been through a couple of iterations of the current WESP rounds, and a great deal more will be understood by everybody, I think, in terms of what constitutes a proper, thorough assessment of parental demand. I'll be looking to be extremely rigorous in terms of regulating those assessments, but, as I say, since these are tri-annual requirements at least, then my regulatory powers don't actually come into force until the first three years have gone by, which is 2017.

[91] **Ann Jones:** Okay?

[92] **Keith Davies:** Yes.

[93] **Ann Jones:** Right. Simon: monitoring, review and reporting, approving and compliance of WESPs, please—and nothing else. [*Laughter.*]

[94] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch. Mae sawl un, efallai, wedi cael eu cyffwrdd arno, ond jest ar y pwynt roeddech chi'n sôn amdano

Simon Thomas: Thank you. Many of these have perhaps already been touched upon, but just on the point that you mentioned there,

yn y fan yna, Weinidog, ynglŷn â'r pwerau'n dod i rym mewn tair blynedd, beth ydych chi'n ei wneud yn y cyfamser i fonitro sut mae'r cynlluniau yma yn cael eu gweithredu ar lawr gwlad? A ydych chi'n derbyn adroddiad blynyddol, er enghraifft, gan bob un?

Minister, in terms of these powers coming into force in three years' time, what are you doing in the meantime to monitor how these plans are being implemented on the ground? Do you receive an annual report, for example, from each one?

[95] **Huw Lewis:** Every single one of them has been reviewed. As I say, they need my okay in order to become a fully fledged WESP. In this first iteration, 22 submitted, and 17 were referred back to the local authorities for modification because they weren't really hitting the letter or the spirit of the guidance in some aspect or another. So, that's my gatekeeper role at the moment.

[96] **Simon Thomas:** O'r 17 a gafodd eu hala nôl i ailedrych arnyn nhw, a oedd yna ryw beth cyffredin nad oedden nhw'n ei wneud yn iawn? A oedd yna bryder cyffredinol rhyngddynt nhw?

Simon Thomas: Of the 17 that were returned for reconsideration, was there anything they had in common in terms of what they weren't doing right? Was there a general concern amongst them?

[97] **Huw Lewis:** Well, no, it's impossible to say that all 17 had a particular—. There were issues around targets, and issues around being specific about exactly what the local authority was aiming for. It would be difficult to generalise much further than that. Did you observe anything on that?

[98] **Mr Lewis:** Wnaethom ni ddadansoddiad o ble'r oeddem ni wedi cynnig gwelliannau—fod gan y Gweinidog y pŵer i gymeradwyo cynllun, neu gymeradwyo gwelliannau, neu wrthod cynllun a'n bod ni'n ysgrifennu'r cynllun yn lle'r awdurdod lleol. Mewn gwirionedd, nid ydym ni'n gweld dim gwahaniaeth rhwng cynnig gwelliannau a mynnu cynllun arall. Roeddem ni wedi gweld y ffordd o gynnig gwelliannau yn gyfrwng i wella ansawdd y cynlluniau.

Mr Lewis: We carried out an analysis of where we had suggested improvements—that the Minister had the power to approve a plan, or to recommend improvements, or where we would reject a plan and we would write the plan instead of the local authority. In reality, we don't see any difference between suggesting improvements and insisting on another plan. We saw the way of suggesting improvements as a means of improving the quality of the plans.

[99] Yn gyffredinol, roedd rhyw 35 o welliannau ynglŷn â deilliant 1, sef twf yn y sector. So, dyna le oedd y ffocws yn bendant—ynglŷn â chreu digon o lefydd, targedau uchelgeisiol, ond symud pethau ymlaen.

Generally speaking, around 35 improvements related to outcome 1, growth in the sector. So, that's where the focus, definitely—in terms of creating enough places, having ambitious targets and moving things forward.

[100] Yn ail, roedd rhyw 12 o ran deilliant 5, sef yr un sy'n ymwneud â safonau. Un o'r pethau, efallai, rŷm ni'n ei anghofio ynglŷn â chynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg yw eu bod nhw'n ymwneud â safonau'r Gymraeg a Chymraeg fel ail iaith a dysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Dyna yw eu pwrpas nhw, sef gwella cynllunio a gwella safonau. So, mae tipyn o sylw wedi cael ei roi i'r safonau a'r targedau y mae

Secondly, there were some 12 in terms of outcome 5, which relates to standards. One of the things we forget about the Welsh in education strategic plans is that they relate to the standard of Welsh and Welsh as a second language and teaching through the medium of Welsh. That is their purpose, to improve planning and improve standards. So, quite a bit of attention has been paid to the standards and the targets that local authorities set for

awdurdodau lleol yn eu gosod o ran y Gymraeg a Chymraeg fel ail iaith. Cas hwnnw lot o sylw, ac mae yna batrymau da ynglŷn â phobl sy'n gosod targedau uchelgeisiol ynglŷn â gwella iaith a gwella safonau'r Gymraeg, sydd yn cael lot o sylw, yn enwedig ar yr ochr cynradd.

Welsh and Welsh as a second language. That had a lot of attention, and there were good patterns in terms of people setting ambitious targets for improving language and improving Welsh standards, which have had a lot of attention, particularly on the primary sector side.

[101] Wedyn, yn yr awdurdodau lleol, fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio atyn nhw, ble mae yna ystyriaethau o ran dilyniant, roedd yna dipyn o geisio codi'r bar o ran gwella cyfraddau dilyniant, yn enwedig rhwng cyfnodau allweddol 2 a 3, ac ambell i waith rhwng y cylchoedd meithrin hefyd a mynediad i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Wedyn, lledu ar draws, ond dyna oedd y prif rai, sef twf a safonau.

Then, in the local authorities, which the Minister has referred to, where there are considerations regarding continuity, there was quite a lot of trying to raise the bar in terms of improving progression rates, especially between key stages 2 and 3, and sometimes between the *cylchoedd meithrin* and access to Welsh-medium education. There was also the spreading across, but those were the main ones: growth and standards.

[102] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch am hynny. Mae hwnnw o gymorth, a dweud y gwir, i ddeall y broses yna. Beth rwy'n trio ei geisio nawr yw beth fydd y broses, wrth fynd yn ei blaen, i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau wedi ymateb i'r gwelliannau a oedd gan y Llywodraeth, ac nad ydyn nhw'n syrthio nôl ar beth yr oedden nhw wedi'i ysgrifennu yn wreiddiol, er enghraifft, a'u bod nhw'n mynd i gyrraedd y bar uwch yr ŷch wedi'i osod iddyn nhw. Pa brosesau sydd yn eu lle ichi fonitro hynny—nid o ddydd i ddydd, ond yn sicr o flwyddyn i flwyddyn?

Simon Thomas: Thank you for that. That is helpful, to be honest, in understanding that process. What I'm trying to get at now is what would the process be, going forward, to ensure that the authorities have responded to the improvements made by Government, and that they don't slip back in terms of what they committed to originally, for example, and that they are going to reach that raised bar that you've set for them. What processes are in place for you to monitor that—not necessarily on a day-to-day basis, but certainly year on year?

[103] **Huw Lewis:** Well, it's all there within the structure of what is demanded of local authorities now, statutorily, in terms of what constitutes a WESP. The WESP is an iterative process. It isn't produced in 2015 and then stands for all time. There is a need for an annual review of the WESP, and, triennially then, we have the requirement to make sure that there's proper assessment of parental demand, and another iteration of the WESP should come about, with my role then, in terms of regulating the whole thing and making sure it's done properly and well.

[104] **Simon Thomas:** A gaf i jest ofyn pa mor bwysig ŷch chi'n meddwl yw'r fforymau addysg lleol dros y cynlluniau yma, achos rŷm ni wedi derbyn tystiolaeth amrywiol, a dweud y gwir, fod rhai yn weithredol iawn a bod rhai ond, efallai, yn siop siarad, mewn ffordd? A ydych chi'n eu gweld nhw fel y bobl ar lawr gwlad sydd *actually* yn gwneud yn siŵr bod y cynlluniau hyn yn weithredol ac ar waith?

Simon Thomas: May I just ask how important you think the local educational fora are in terms of these plans, because we've received some inconsistent evidence, to tell the truth, that some are very active and that some are, perhaps, nothing more than a talking shop, in a way? Do you view them as the people on the ground who are actually ensuring that these schemes are operational and are implemented?

[105] **Huw Lewis:** The fora are indispensable, in my view, and it's quite right that all 22

local authorities have a forum, and they should be run probably—they should be run according to the demands of public law and openness, and all that sort of stuff. The fora are not necessarily, though, in my view, the parental voice. The parental voice is something a little different from the forum. We have organisations like the Mudiad Meithrin, and so on, within the fora, and that's quite right, and that's an opportunity for them to have sustained input into the conversation, but we do need also another proper structured—well, it is legally required that the consultation with parents goes beyond the forum into people's homes, basically, and that that consultation is a wider one. But, yes, the fora should be there, the fora should be run well and the fora should be taken seriously by the local authority.

[106] **Simon Thomas:** A fyddai fe o gymorth i'r broses yma pe byddai pob un o'r awdurdodau yn cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynlluniau a beth maen nhw wedi bod yn ei wneud, efallai yn adlewyrchu gwaith y fforwm yn lleol hefyd?

Simon Thomas: Would it be of any assistance in this whole process if each authority published an annual report on the WESPs and on what they've been doing, perhaps also reflecting the work of the forum locally, too?

[107] **Huw Lewis:** I'm not sure that an annual report would give us much more than we already have.

[108] **Simon Thomas:** It might be an aid to them learning from each other and this kind of thing.

[109] **Huw Lewis:** If a local authority wanted to issue an annual report, then of course it would be for them to do so. I don't know that the national view of how we're progressing in terms of the issues at stake that are covered by WESPs would be helped, really, by our having 22 annual reports. It would be an onerous thing, I think, to ask of local authorities as well, at a very difficult time. It should be absolutely transparent at local level exactly where the conversation has got to in terms of the developments around the WESP. This is a piece of local democracy. There's a forum overseeing it, any member of the public or any parent, of course, can involve themselves in terms of finding out exactly where the local authority: everyone can see a copy of the WESP, and so on. As I say, every three years there will be a refresh.

[110] **Simon Thomas:** Rwy'n gweld y pwynt rŷch chi'n ei wneud, ond, er enghraifft, roedd tystiolaeth yr wythnos diwethaf gan Gyngor Sir Gâr yn eithaf clir: mae gyda nhw fforwm yn weithredol, maen nhw'n adrodd i'r cyngor ar weithgaredd o dan y cynllun, felly mae yn gyhoeddus, ac felly, i bob pwrpas, maen nhw yn paratoi adroddiad blynyddol, jest ei fod e'n mynd i'r cyngor, onid e? Nid wy'n gofyn am unrhyw beth ychwanegol, nid wy'n meddwl, na ddylai unrhyw awdurdod ei wneud fel mater o arfer da, sef bod y fforymau yn agored, bod y cofnodion yn cael eu cyhoeddi, a bod yna adroddiad yn cael ei wneud yn eithaf cyson i'r pwyllgor craffu, neu beth bynnag yw'r lefel mwyaf priodol ar gyfer hwn yn y cyngor. Y pryder sydd gen i yw bod nifer o bobl yn poeni mewn rhai awdurdodau sydd ddim cystal â'i gilydd bod y gwaith yma yn mynd o dan y

Simon Thomas: I see the point you're making, but, for example, the evidence we had last week from Carmarthenshire County Council was quite clear: they have a forum that is active, they report to the council on the activity under the plan, and so that is public, and, therefore, to all intents and purposes, they do prepare an annual report, just that it's submitted to the council, isn't it? I'm not asking for anything additional, I don't think, to what all authorities should be doing as a matter of good practice, namely that the fora should be open, that the minutes should be published, and that a report should be prepared quite regularly for the scrutiny committee, or whatever is the most appropriate level for this within the council. The concern I have is that many people are concerned that, in some authorities that are not working as well as others, this work will fall off the radar, and will only appear from

dŵr, a'i fod e ond—bach fel *submarine*—yn ymddangos o bryd i'w gilydd, ac mae'n anodd i rai o'r bobl yma gael gafael ar p'un a yw'r awdurdod wir yn gweithredu'r cynllun mewn ffordd sy'n mynd i gyrraedd y nod yn y cynllun nes ei bod hi'n rhy hwyr. Beth rŷm ni'n trio ei wneud yn fan hyn, wrth gwrs, yw dal rhywbeth cyn ei fod e'n mynd o'i le, a cheisio gwella'r peth tra bo'r broses yn mynd yn ei blaen.

time to time—a bit like a submarine—and it's difficult for some people to get a real handle on whether an authority is actually implementing their WESP in a way that achieves its aims until it's too late. What we're trying to do here, of course, is get a hold of something before anything goes wrong, and try to improve matters while the process is under way.

[111] **Huw Lewis:** Well, it's never too late. As I say, this is an iterative process. There isn't any day of the week or any month of the year when input into the local conversation cannot be had by any parent or citizen. You see, I don't think it is my place as the Minister to individually police these local democratic decisions down to the nth detail. There is a local democratic mandate here, which, in some circumstances, will leave some people disgruntled, but disgruntlement is part of a democratic process.

[112] **Simon Thomas:** It's certainly part of local politics.

[113] **Huw Lewis:** It certainly is, yes. In fact, it's hard to see past the disgruntlement, sometimes. [*Laughter.*]

[114] **Ann Jones:** Aled and David have got a couple of points, and then those will be it. Aled?

10:30

[115] **Aled Roberts:** Rwyf eisiau gofyn ynglŷn â'r rhannu arfer da yma. A oes yna unrhyw ddyletswyddau yn cael eu rhoi ar y consortia rhanbarthol i geisio cydlynu arfer da ar draws rhanbarthau?

Aled Roberts: I just want to ask about sharing good practice. Are there any duties being placed on the regional consortia to try to co-ordinate good practice across regions?

[116] **Huw Lewis:** They are looking at it. I don't think it constitutes a duty, does it? There's no duty as such, but yes, the consortia are, I know, looking at the WESPs in their area. The school improvement work that they're engaged with here naturally overlaps with the planning around the WESPs, twenty-first century schools implications—the whole roll-out from the application of a WESP is naturally partly the business of the consortia as well. So, yes, they're engaged.

[117] **Ann Jones:** Okay. David.

[118] **David Rees:** Just a couple of quick questions, Minister. Whilst I appreciate it's not your job necessarily to look at some of the minute detail of local democracy, it is always helpful to be able to inform local democracy on some of the information and the progress going on through the WESPs. So, I hope you'll do that, anyway. Two quick points, and I'll avoid a long preamble. You've mentioned already today that some of our most deprived communities are hard areas to reach, but as a consequence of that, we also find that, in those communities, the local schools are not delivering education through the Welsh medium. We find that those schools tend to be located in other areas of local authorities; transportation being therefore a big issue. Now, you've already talked about the post-16, what about the nursery education issue? Is it your intention to look very carefully at the provision of nursery transportation so that children can start off in Welsh-medium education? Mike Hedges already highlighted the fact that, if you don't get in at an early age, you may well lose them

and that progress. If you're not providing the transportation to get to those schools, there's a problem. So, are you going to look at how you can actually support parents and families who want to take the opportunity, but simply may not actually be able to afford the current costings of local authorities?

[119] **Huw Lewis:** Yes, I'm well aware—I think all of us are aware as local representatives—of the very real worries and difficulties that many parents face in terms of affordability of things like school transport. School transport's not under my remit. It's a matter for local authorities and another Minister, but it's certainly something that I know has exercised the minds of all 22 local authorities when they've been drawing up their WESPs, and we will need to return to this more than once, I suspect. At the higher end of the age range we've got that support that's come from the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport for older young people, if you like, and we do still have the EMA here in Wales, which I know many young people use, primarily for transport costs post 16. When it comes to the younger age groups, I suppose we'll have the budget today from the UK Government, with all the bad news that will no doubt entail. A conversation will need to be opened up, I think, everywhere in Wales about the affordability for some families of accessing learning, whether it is in the Welsh medium or otherwise. So, I suppose I'm saying I've got no smart answer to this. I don't even have a ministerial remit over it, but I think local authorities will need to ponder now, in much more difficult circumstances over the next few years, how families are assisted as compared to the relatively less constrained situation that we've been facing for the last few years.

[120] **David Rees:** Can I ask my last question?

[121] **Ann Jones:** You can, yes.

[122] **David Rees:** You've already mentioned that 17 of the WESPs were sent back for modification. Does that give you confidence that the local authorities are actually delivering appropriately, with 17 having to be sent back? Based upon that also, the percentage increase we see when you've got the target has gone up by 0.6 per cent in the last three years. Mike has already highlighted the fact that there are some counties where there is a large proportion and there are other counties, which I'm sure you're going to focus upon, where there's a smaller proportion to balance that out. Are we actually doing enough, and is it good enough to have a 0.6 per cent increase in three years, and are the WESPs giving you confidence that in fact we will see that increase? Because if 17 have had to go back for modification, it concerns me that, actually, they're getting it right.

[123] **Huw Lewis:** Yes. I'm never satisfied. I think it's far too early to say to what degree the WESPs will deliver for us. They've only just been agreed, so they've barely had time to gain any traction at all. As you say, it's quite interesting to look across the country. Between 2013 and 2014, there's been a huge variation, for instance, in the number of seven-year-olds being assessed *yn Gymraeg*. Twelve local authorities have seen an uplift; one has seen a kind of static situation; and nine have seen a drop. I'm talking about percentages here, percentages of seven-year-olds in Welsh-medium. None of the changes are that dramatic, although at one end you've got—I think the biggest rise was Neath Port Talbot with a 3.8 per cent increase, Caerphilly's also seen a chunky increase, and then there have been local authorities that have seen a disappointing fall. There doesn't seem to be any discernible pattern, and I wouldn't like to say that there was some kind of nefarious policy going on, for instance in, well, let's take Merthyr Tydfil, for instance, as one. There's been a drop in Merthyr Tydfil, but I don't think that's as a result of any kind of policy change within that local authority area. We should recognise, though, that that there are more seven-year-olds being assessed in Welsh in Welsh schools at the moment than there have ever been. We are at a historical high point here in terms of sheer numbers. So, I've got every hope that the WESPs here are not going to deliver some kind of nirvana, they're not going to solve every

problem, but they do give a real structure to a transparent, localised conversation about a local authority's contribution to the overall Welsh picture. We know all this stuff now, and interested parties locally can use those facts to make sure that the next iteration of the WESP in their area is better than the last.

[124] **Ann Jones:** Okay, I think we'll finish there. We eventually got back round to WESPs. Sorry about that, we did go round the houses somewhat.

[125] **Huw Lewis:** I talked about nothing else actually, Chair.

[126] **Ann Jones:** We'll send you a copy of the transcript to check for accuracy, as you know. Thanks very much for coming. We'll break until 10.45 a.m. now.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:37 ac 10:48.
The meeting adjourned between 10:37 and 10:48.*

Ymchwiliad i Gynlluniau Strategol Cymraeg mewn Addysg: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 4

Inquiry into Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs): Evidence Session 4

[127] **Ann Jones:** We will make a start as time's pressing. Can I just remind you, if you've switched your mobile phones on, can you just make sure they're on silent? I didn't say that at the beginning, but then most of you are used to that by now.

[128] We're going to move on now to the second session in our inquiry into Welsh in education strategic plans. We're delighted to have the Welsh Language Commissioner with us, and her team. I wonder, Meri, would you like to introduce yourself for the record, and your colleagues, and then, if it's okay, we'll go into some questions.

[129] **Ms Huws:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Diolch am y cyfle i ymddangos o flaen y pwyllgor yma. Meri Huws ydw i, Comisiynydd y Gymraeg. Ar yr ochr yma, Dyfan Sion, y cyfarwyddwr sydd â chyfrifoldeb am bolisi ac ymchwil o fewn swyddfa'r comisiynydd; ac, ar yr ochr yma, Sioned Birchall, sydd yn gweithio o fewn y gyfarwyddiaeth polisi ac ymchwil, ac sydd â diddordeb arbennig yn y maes addysg. **Ms Huws:** Thank you very much, and thank you for the opportunity to appear before this committee. I'm Meri Huws, Welsh Language Commissioner. On this side, we have Dyfan Sion, the policy and research director within the commissioner's office; and, on this side, I have Sioned Birchall, who works within the policy and research directorate and has a particular interest in education.

[130] **Ann Jones:** Okay, thanks very much. We've got the same sort of areas of questioning for you as we had for the Minister, and I know that you caught most of the Minister's evidence session. So, it's around WESPs and the Welsh-medium education strategy, then assessing and meeting local demand, monitoring, reviewing, reporting and approving compliance of the schemes, and then WESPs and broader Welsh Government policy. We realise that you're not responsible for Welsh Government policy, but nevertheless we'll be interested in hearing what you've got on that. So, Mike and David, you're going to take the first set of questions.

[131] **Mike Hedges:** Mae'n flin gyda fi; **Mike Hedges:** I do apologise, but I will ask my question in English.

[132] As I asked the Minister earlier, I don't see that you can look at these WESPs in isolation—if you don't have 25 per cent of children going to Ti a Fi and going to Mudiad

Meithrin and, of those in Flying Start areas, if you don't have 25 per cent of them going through the Welsh medium, why does anybody think that you're going to have 25 per cent at the age of seven doing it? Do you agree that, really, it's at the very beginning, before you get into education strategic plans, that you need to get up to 25 per cent if you're going to hold it through to seven-year-olds?

[133] **Ms Huws:** Diolch yn fawr am y cwestiwn. Mewn ymateb i hynny, rwy'n credu bod yn rhaid i ni edrych ar beth yw rôl y WESP o ran creu cysondeb a chreu'r cysylltiadau hynny. Beth rŷm ni'n sôn amdano fan hyn yw cynllun strategol lleol i ddarparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg o ddim i ddiwedd oes. A dyna'r hyn y dylem ni fod yn sôn amdano. Os felly, mae angen i ni sicrhau bod yna gysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng gwaith mewn sefyllfaoedd neu sefydliadau y mae Mudiad Meithrin yn ei wneud, y gwaith sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad, neu ddim yn digwydd yn anffodus, o ran y Gymraeg gyda Dechrau'n Deg, ac wedyn, cyswllt i mewn i ysgolion cynradd, wedyn cyswllt trwy ddilyniant i ysgolion uwchradd a thrwyddo i addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Dyna, i fi, yw hanfod cynllun strategol addysg Gymraeg. A ydy'n gwireddu hynny ar hyn o bryd? Nid wyf yn sicr. Rwy'n credu'n gryf os na wnaiff y Llywodraeth gydio yn yr amcan strategol yna nawr o ran cynlluniau strategol addysg Gymraeg, byddwn wedi colli cyfle anhygoel.

[134] Felly, mae'r dilyniant yna'n bwysig. I sicrhau'r dilyniant yna, mae angen, felly, i glywed lleisiau rhieni yn y broses, sy'n ein dwyn ni yn ôl at y cwestiwn o fesur y galw mewn ffordd ystyrlon. Mae'n tynnu i mewn lleisiau darparwyr, megis Mudiad Meithrin ac mae'n tynnu i mewn y rhai hynny sy'n gweithio ym myd amddifadedd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac wedyn, rŷch chi'n gorfod edrych ar y system ysgolion ffurfiol ac ôl-16. Felly, mae clywed lleisiau'r sefydliadau a'r unigolion hynny o fewn y broses gynllunio wrth greu WESP ac wrth greu cynllun strategol, yn hollbwysig.

[135] **Mike Hedges:** I'm glad you ended on post-16 education, because that's where I was going next. A lot of post-16 education is run by further education colleges, and a lot of the qualifications are run by organisations, and mainly by City and Guilds. The question I asked the Minister and his official who didn't know the answer—perhaps you do—is: are all City and Guilds qualifications, such as those for electricians and plumbers, available to be examined through the medium of Welsh? My second point on this is: I know that there's a huge drop-off at 16 within colleges, certainly in Swansea and in Rhondda Cynon Taf, and I

Ms Huws: Thank you for that question. I think, in response to that, we have to look at the role of the WESP in creating consistency and making those connections. What we're talking about here is a strategic plan at a local level to provide Welsh medium education from birth to the end of one's life. That's what we should be talking about. If so, we need to ensure that there is a direct link between work carried out by organisations such as Mudiad Meithrin, the work that's happening on the ground, or not happening unfortunately, in terms of the Welsh language and Flying Start, and then, that link into primary schools and then the continuum into secondary and through to further and higher education. That, for me, is the foundation of the WESP. Whether it achieves that at present, I am not convinced. I strongly believe that if the Government doesn't get to grips with that strategic objective in terms of WESPs now, then, it will be an incredible opportunity missed.

So, that continuity is important. To ensure that continuity, we need, therefore, to hear the voices of parents in the process, which brings us back to the issue of assessing demand in a meaningful way. It draws in the voices of providers, such as Mudiad Meithrin and it draws in those who work in social services and the area of deprivation, and then you also have to look at the formal schooling system and post-16 education. Therefore, hearing the voices of those organisations and individuals within the planning process and creating the WESP is crucially important.

don't think they'll be abnormal to the rest of Wales, certainly industrial Wales, in terms of people who go through Welsh-medium education up to the age of 16, but then stop being educated through the medium of Welsh. I know that higher education is outside of this remit, but the collapse in the ability to study through the medium of Welsh in higher education is a serious problem.

[136] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i gytuno gyda chi yn y lle cyntaf ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd addysg bellach? Am flynyddoedd—degawdau a dweud y gwir—dyma'r darn o'r jig-so sydd yn hollol ar goll o ran darpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Mae rôl colegau addysg bellach yn hollbwysig o ran sicrhau gweithlu dwyieithog priodol i Gymru yn y dyfodol. Rŷm ni angen y bobl hynny sy'n gallu ymdrin â *drains*, plymio a thrydan trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ond hefyd bobl sy'n mynd i weithio mewn meithrinfeydd, y bobl sy'n mynd i weithio mewn gofal, sy'n mynd i weithio yn y diwydiannau twristiaeth—mae angen iddyn nhw fod yn gallu gweithio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Fe fydd y bobl hynny, ar y cyfan, yn mynd trwy'r system addysg bellach mewn colegau, felly mae'r dilyniant yna yn hollbwysig.

Ms Huws: May I agree with you, initially, on the importance of further education? For many years—decades, if truth be told—this was the part of the jigsaw that was entirely missing in terms of Welsh-medium provision. The role of FE colleges is crucially important in terms of ensuring a bilingual workforce that is appropriate to the needs of Wales in the future. We need those people who can deal with drains, plumbing and electricity through the medium of Welsh, but also people who will work in nurseries, people who will go into the care sector, into tourism—they also need to be able to work through the medium of Welsh. Those people, generally speaking, will go through the FE system in colleges, therefore that continuity is crucially important.

[137] Rwy'n credu y dylem ni gydnabod y gwaith y mae ColegauCymru wedi'i wneud ac yn dechrau ei wneud o ran creu, yn sicr, ymwybyddiaeth o ran colegau addysg bellach, a cheisio cryfhau'r ddarpariaeth. Ond eto, mae'r cwestiwn yma'n codi ynglŷn â sicrhau bod addysg ôl-16 yn cael ei gwneud i mewn i WESPs—i'r cynlluniau yma— o'r dechrau, a bod yna ddilyniant naturiol i rywun sy'n dechrau mewn addysg yn dair blwydd oed a'u bod yn gallu gweld eu bod yn gallu mynd i'r coleg addysg bellach ac astudio trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae hynny'n mynd i gael effaith, ac rwy'n credu bod sicrhau'r dilyniant yna'n hollbwysig. Dyna hanfod y cynlluniau strategol mewn addysg a dyna hanfod strategaeth addysg y Llywodraeth, achos mae hynny'n dweud yn glir mai creu Cymru ddwyieithog a gweithlu dwyieithog yw'r nod.

I think we should recognise the work that ColegauCymru has done and is starting to do in terms of generating an awareness in FE colleges and strengthening the provision. But again, this question arises as to ensuring that post-16 education is actually woven into the WESPs from the very outset, and there is a natural continuum for someone who starts in education at the age of three and that they can see a pathway into FE where they can study through the medium of Welsh. That will have an impact, and ensuring that continuum is crucially important. That is the very essence of the WESP and the essence of the Government's education strategy, because that states clearly that the aim is the creation of a bilingual Wales and a bilingual workforce.

[138] **Ann Jones:** Okay, fine. David.

[139] **David Rees:** Thank you. Just a quick question. Do you think the WESPs are ambitious enough to deliver bilingualism in Wales in the longer term? Obviously, I understand the short-term difficulties we face. Is it your view that the Welsh Government's targets are strong enough as well so the WESPs meet them?

[140] **Ms Huws:** Wrth ateb y cwestiwn yna, a gawn ni ddechrau gyda chynllun strategol y Llywodraeth o ran addysg Gymraeg? Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n gam pwysig cyntaf. Mi allwn ni drafod a yw'r targedau yn ddigon uchelgeisiol, ond mae cael cynllun strategol cynhwysfawr yn eithriadol o bwysig, a dyna'r man cychwyn. A ydy'r targedau neu'r amcanion sydd yn y strategaeth yna yn cael eu trosglwyddo ac yn weladwy o fewn WESPs, o ran y cynlluniau gweithredu? Mae'n anodd dweud ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn gallu gweld eu bod nhw'n gwireddu'r amcanion yna. A ydyn nhw'n ddigon uchelgeisiol? Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar, ac mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod hynny, ond a ydyn nhw'n ddigon uchelgeisiol o ran targedau? Nid ydyn ni'n credu hynny, a'r cwestiwn sy'n deillio o hynny, i fi, yw: beth, wedyn, yw rôl y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod y targedau yn y cynlluniau lleol yn ddigon cryf ac yn mynd i sicrhau gwireddu strategaeth y Gymraeg o ran y Llywodraeth? Nid wyf yn sicr bod y dilyniant yna i'r cynllun o'r strategaeth ganolog. Buaswn i'n dadlau mai rôl y Llywodraeth yw hi i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Wrth i'r cynlluniau gael eu rhoi at ei gilydd, rydym yn gwybod bod pwerau i'r Gweinidog i yrru'r cynlluniau cychwynnol yn ôl—ac mae 17 ohonyn nhw wedi cael eu gyrru yn ôl—ond beth sy'n digwydd wedyn? Os nad yw'r targed yn cael ei weithredu, beth yw rôl y Llywodraeth? Ai i edrych ar fethiant mewn tair blynedd fydd y rôl? Rwy'n credu bod angen swyddogaeth ar y pwynt o fethiant cychwynnol i gamu i mewn a chymryd camau penodol.

Ms Huws: In answering that question, could we start with the Government's strategic plan in terms of Welsh-medium education? I think that that is an important first step. We could discuss whether the targets are ambitious enough, but having a WESP that is comprehensive is extremely important, and that is the starting point. Are those targets or the objectives that are in the WESP being transferred and visible within the WESPs, in terms of the action plans? It's difficult to say at the moment. I can't see that they are realising those objectives. Are they ambitious enough? It is early days, and we have to recognise that, but are they ambitious enough in terms of targets? We don't think so, and the question that stems from that, to me, is: what, then, is the role of the Government in ensuring that the targets in the local plans are robust enough and are going to ensure the realisation of the Welsh-medium education strategy? I'm not sure whether that continuity from the central strategy is there. I would argue that it is the role of the Government to ensure that that happens. As the plans are being put together, we know that the Minister has powers to send these initial plans back—and 17 of them have been returned—but what happens then? If the target isn't being implemented, what is the Government's role? Is it to look at failure in three years' time? I think there should be a function at the point of initial failure that means stepping in and taking specific steps.

[141] **Ann Jones:** Can I just bring Simon in on that point?

[142] **Simon Thomas:** I'll come in at the end.

[143] **Ann Jones:** Right, okay. You're all being very polite today.

[144] **David Rees:** Just one quick question: we talked about this in previous session and, clearly, we understand that a larger proportion in certain counties are able to be educated through the medium of Welsh, but, in other counties, particularly in the south, in one sense, there is perhaps a bigger challenge facing us. Should the Government be more prescriptive with some of the targets to some of the local authorities, because 25 per cent across Wales is one thing, but perhaps some of the south Wales urbanised counties have low figures? Should they be more prescriptive and say to the counties, 'We want to see a more ambitious target for you as well'?

[145] **Ms Huws:** Nid wyf yn sicr y buaswn yn defnyddio'r term '*prescriptive*', ond buaswn, efallai, yn defnyddio'r term 'arweiniad clir gan y Llywodraeth'. Dyna sydd ei angen, a defnyddio'r data sydd ar gael a herio'r cynghorau. Dyna sydd ei angen. Ond, wedi herio a gosod y targed, yn sicr mae'n rhaid gweithredu'r targed yna. Nid y targed sy'n bwysig, ond cyflawni'r targed, ac nid wyf yn gweld beth yw rôl y Llywodraeth ar y pwynt yna.

Ms Huws: I'm not sure whether I would use the term 'prescriptive', but I would, perhaps, use the term 'clear leadership from the Government'. I think that is what is needed, to use the data that are available and challenge the councils. That is what's needed. But, after challenging and setting the target, there is a need to ensure the implementation of that target. It's not the target that's important, but achieving the target, and I don't see what the role of the Government is at that point.

[146] **David Rees:** Okay.

[147] **Ann Jones:** Simon, then Aled.

[148] **Simon Thomas:** Mae gen i gwestiwn sydd, efallai, yn fwy cyffredinol, ar hyn o bryd. A ydy system fel y cynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg, sydd yn gymaint yn seiliedig ar alw rhieni, mesur galw, a dewis rhieni, yn gyson â strategaeth iaith Gymraeg y Llywodraeth?

Simon Thomas: I have what is perhaps a more general question, for the time being. Is a system such as the WESP system, which is so much based on parental demand, parental choice and assessing demand, consistent with the Government's Welsh-medium education strategy?

[149] **Ms Huws:** Cwestiwn da. Mae'n fwy nag ymateb i alw yn unig. Ond, gadewch i ni edrych ar y cwestiwn o alw yn y lle cyntaf. Rwy'n credu, er mwyn mesur galw yn wirioneddol, mae angen rhoi gwybodaeth gyflawn i rieni er mwyn gwneud y penderfyniad yna. Mae yna esiamplau da ar draws Cymru o ymgyrchoedd i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd ynglŷn â gwahanol feysydd, boed yn gynaliadwyedd, neu beth bynnag. Rwy'n credu bod yna gyfrifoldeb yn fan hyn i'r Llywodraeth weithio law yn llaw â llywodraeth leol—yn sicr y Llywodraeth—i gynnig gwybodaeth gynhwysfawr i rieni ynglŷn â buddion addysg ddwyieithog yn y lle cyntaf, felly pan mae'r galw yn cael ei fesur, mae'n alw yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth.

Ms Huws: That's a good question. It's more than responding to demand only. But, let us look at the question of demand in the first place. I think, in order to truly assess the demand, full information needs to be given to parents in order to make that decision. There are good examples across Wales of awareness-raising campaigns to raise public awareness in certain fields—whether it is sustainability, of whatever. I do think that the Government has a responsibility here to work hand in hand with local government—certainly on the part of the Government—to provide comprehensive information to parents on the benefits of bilingual education in the first instance, so that when the demand is assessed, it is demand based on evidence

11:00

[150] Pryd mae rhywun yn mesur y galw? Rŷm ni'n gwybod am esiamplau lle mae mesur y galw yn digwydd dros gyfnod y Nadolig—nid wyf yn siŵr taw hynny yw'r peth callaf i wneud. Felly, wrth fesur y galw, mae angen inni edrych ar bryd a sut mae'r ymarferiad yna yn cael ei gynnal. Ond mae'n fwy na jest mesur y galw, hefyd; mae yna gynllun strategol o ran creu Cymru

When does one assess demand? We know about examples where this happens over the Christmas period—I'm not sure whether that's a wisest thing to do. So, in assessing demand, we need to look at when and how that exercise is undertaken. But there is more than just assessing demand, as well; there is a strategic plan in creating a bilingual Wales.

ddwyieithog.

[151] **Simon Thomas:** Oes; dyna'r cwestiwn. Rwy'n gwybod nad cwestiwn am y cynllun strategol ehangach yw hwn—sesiwn am y WESPs sydd gyda ni fan hyn. Ond, mae yna fwlch, onid oes, rhwng yr hyn y mae cynlluniau strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg yn ceisio'i gyflawni, ac uchelgais ehangach ac uwch y Llywodraeth yn gyffredinol? Rwy'n ei ffeindio hi'n anodd gweld bod llinell glir rhwng y ddau. Rwyf jest yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ofyn ichi a ydych chi'n gweld bod yr un yn gallu arwain yn naturiol at y llall, neu a oes angen mwy—yn benodol ym maes addysg—i gau'r blwch yna. Rydych wedi sôn am wir asesu'r galw, hynny yw, beth yw gwir wybodaeth ac ati, ond, gan adlewyrchu cwestiwn David Rees, a oes diffyg uchelgais yno hefyd?

[152] **Ms Huws:** Beth sydd fanna yw cyfle i greu Cymru ddwyieithog, ond ni fydd hynny'n digwydd trwy ddamwain; mae angen cynllunio cynhwysfawr i wneud hynny, ac edrych ar lle rydym heddiw, gyda chynllun strategol sy'n gosod nod o greu Cymru sy'n ddwyieithog ac yn gallu gweithredu'n ddwyieithog. Mae angen inni beidio â dibynnu ar WESPs yn unig. Mae angen cysylltu'r hyn sy'n digwydd gyda WESPs â meysydd eraill. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n ein poeni ni. Rwy'n credu y gwnaf droi at Sioned mewn munud. Os yw hyn yn mynd i lwyddo, mae angen cysylltiad rhwng yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r strategaeth addysg a phob maes arall, boed yn addysg cyfnod cynnar, boed yn ieched, boed yn gynllunio'r gweithlu. Rydym yn ymateb i ymgynghoriadau yn rheolaidd ac nid oes cysylltiad yna. Rwy'n mynd i ofyn i Sioned i sôn am gwpwl o esiamplau rydym wedi dod ar eu traws yn ddiweddar.

[153] **Ms Birchall:** Diolch, gomisiynydd. Mae yna rai ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus lle'r oeddem ni'n teimlo y dylai fod cyfeiriadau amlwg iawn at y strategaeth addysg Gymraeg, ac nid oedden nhw yna. Rwy'n cyfeirio'n benodol at y drafft 10 mlynedd ar gyfer y gweithlu blynyddoedd cynnar, gofal plant a chwarae yng Nghymru, a gyhoeddwyd yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf.

Simon Thomas: Yes; that's the question. It's not a question about the wider strategic plans—we are concentrating on the WESPs today. But there is a gulf, isn't there, between what the WESPs are trying to achieve and the broader, higher ambition of the Government more generally? I find some difficulty in seeing a clear thread running between the two. I'm just taking this opportunity to ask you whether you think that one can lead to the other, and whether we need more—specifically in education—to close that gap. You've mentioned what you see as being the real assessment of demand based on accurate information and so on, but, referring back to David Rees's question, is there a lack of ambition here too?

Ms Huws: What is there is an opportunity to create a bilingual Wales, but that will not happen by accident; there needs to be comprehensive planning to do so, and looking at where we are today with the strategic plan that sets an objective of creating a bilingual Wales that can operate bilingually. There is a need not to rely on WESPs only. There is a need to link what is happening with WESPs with other areas. That is something that concerns us. I will turn to Sioned in a minute. If this is going to succeed, there needs to be a link between what is happening with the education strategy and every other area, whether it be early years education, health or workforce planning. We are responding to consultations on a regular basis and the link isn't there. I'm going to ask Sioned to talk about a few examples that we've come across recently.

Ms Birchall: Thank you, commissioner. There were some public consultations that we felt should have made clear reference to the Welsh language strategy but they did not. I'm referring specifically to the 10-year draft for the early years workforce for childcare and play in Wales, which was published during the past 12 months. The only intention of the document was to just consider the gaps in

Dim ond ystyried y bylchau sy'n bodoli yn y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg ar draws holl awdurdodau lleol Cymru oedd bwriad y ddogfen yma; nid oedd bwriad i weithredu mewn unrhyw fodd i lenwi'r bylchau. Hefyd, yn fframwaith canlyniadau'r blynyddoedd cynnar—eto, maes hanfodol bwysig—nid oedd cyfeiriad at y strategaeth addysg Gymraeg na strategaeth iaith Gymraeg Llywodraeth Cymru yn yr adran ar gyd-destun y ddogfen ymgynghorol yna. Mae'n anodd deall sut mae sefyllfa fel hynny'n bod.

[154] Rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi hefyd yn berthnasol iawn wrth sôn am rai o brosiectau blaenllaw y Llywodraeth megis Dechrau'n Deg. Rwy'n gwybod bod lot fawr o drafod wedi bod am y prosiect hwnnw yn ystod gwaith y pwyllgor hwn. Os ydym ni'n meddwl am Dechrau'n Deg, dyma fydd pwynt mynediad cyntaf nifer gynyddol o blant i'r ddarpariaeth blynyddoedd cynnar, ac mae cyfrwng iaith y sesiynau yn amlwg yn hanfodol bwysig. Rwy'n gwybod bod Mudiad Meithrin a RhAG yn eu tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor yma wedi nodi pryderon mawr am y prosiect. Mae Mudiad Meithrin yn nodi nad yw canran y lleoedd Dechrau'n Deg sydd ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn agos i gyfateb at y canran sy'n dewis addysg Gymraeg erbyn iddyn nhw fod ym mlwyddyn 2. Mae RhAG wedyn yn tynnu sylw at rai enghreifftiau penodol, er enghraifft nad oes darpariaeth Dechrau'n Deg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn bodoli yng Nghasnewydd, ac yn sir Gâr, lle mae jest o dan 20 y cant o'r disgyblion yn dewis addysg gynradd cyfrwng Cymraeg, fod llai na 5 y cant o leoedd Dechrau'n Deg ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Felly mae'n briodol, rwy'n meddwl, gofyn y cwestiwn pam mae hyn y digwydd, a ble mae'r cydgordio rhwng y polisiau dylanwadol yma a'r strategaeth addysg Gymraeg.

[155] **Ms Huws:** Felly, yr ateb yw, er mwyn llenwi'r bwlch, mae angen i'r Gymraeg fod yn weladwy ym mhob darn arall o bolisi sy'n gallu bwydo i mewn. Nid yw WESPs yn eu hunain yn ateb llawn, ond maen nhw'n ateb pwysig ar hyn o bryd hefyd.

Welsh-medium provision across all Welsh local authorities. There was no intention to take any action to fill those gaps. Also, in the early years outcomes framework—again, a crucially important area—there was no reference to the Welsh-medium education strategy or the Welsh Government's Welsh language strategy in the context section of that document. It's difficult to understand how that could be that case.

I think it's also very relevant to talk about some of the Government's flagship schemes such as Flying Start. I know there's been a great deal of discussion on that project during this committee's considerations. If we think about Flying Start, for an increasing number of children, this will be their first access point to early years provision and the medium of instruction of those sessions is crucially important. I know that Mudiad Meithrin and RhAG in their evidence to this committee have noted grave concerns about the project. Mudiad Meithrin noted that the percentage of Flying Start placements available through the medium of Welsh is nowhere near the percentage that choose Welsh-medium education in year 2. RhAG highlighted some specific examples, for examples there is no Welsh-medium Flying Start provision in Newport, and in Carmarthenshire, where just under 20 per cent of pupils choose primary Welsh-medium education, less than 5 per cent of the Flying Start placements were available through the medium of Welsh in that area. So, I think it's appropriate to ask the question why this is happening and where the linkage is between these influential policies and the Welsh language strategy.

Ms Huws: Therefore, the answer is, in order to fill the gap, there is a need for the Welsh language to be visible in every other piece of policy that can feed in. WESPs in themselves aren't a comprehensive solution, but they are an important solution at the moment.

[156] **Ann Jones:** Aled, and then we'll move to Keith.

[157] **Aled Roberts:** Rwy'n derbyn y ddadl hynny. Rwyf jest eisiau gwybod—. Rydych wedi sôn y dylai'r Gweinidog ymyrryd os oes yna fethiant cychwynnol, fel yr wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi cyfeirio ato. Pa rôl sydd gennych chi, fel Comisiynydd y Gymraeg, i ddweud eich bod chi'n anfodlon efo cynlluniau penodol? A ydych chi'n cael rhyw fath o ymgynghoriad, fel comisiynydd, o ran y ffyrdd y mae'r cynlluniau unigol yma'n cael eu datblygu gan gynghorau?

Aled Roberts: I accept that argument. I just want to know, really—. You've mentioned that the Minister should be intervening if there is an initial failure, which is what I think you referred to. What role do you have, as Welsh Language Commissioner, to say that you're not content with specific plans? Do you have some sort of consultation, as a commissioner, in terms of the way these individual plans are developed by councils?

[158] **Ms Huws:** Os edrychwch chi ar y ddeddfwriaeth sydd yn creu y cynlluniau yma, yr unig rôl sydd gyda ni yw ein bod ni'n ymgynghorai statudol. Felly, wrth fod awdurdod lleol yn rhoi cynllun at ei gilydd, maen nhw'n gorfod ymgynghori â ni unwaith; mae hynny wedi digwydd gyda'r cylch cyntaf. Beth yr ydych yn ei weld, fel sy'n digwydd yn aml gyda sefyllfa ymgynghorai statudol, yw eich bod yn bwydo i mewn i'r broses ac wedyn mae'r broses yn symud ymlaen—nid yw'n dod yn ôl atoch chi ac nid yw'r cylch yn cael ei gau. Felly, gwnaethom ni ymateb i'r 22, ond wedyn ymysg nifer o bobl eraill, ac wedyn mae'n symud ymlaen.

Ms Huws: If you look at the legislation that created these plans, the only role that we have is that we are a statutory consultee. So, as a local authority puts its scheme together, then they do have to consult with us once; that has happened with this first round. What you see happening very often in the statutory consultee system is that you feed into the process and then the process simply moves on—it does not come back to you and that circle isn't squared, if you like. So, we did respond to the 22, but among many other consultees, and then the process moves ahead.

[159] O ran pwerau y Gweinidog, mae hynny'n ddiddorol. Mae yna bŵer gan y Gweinidog, fel y mae ef wedi disgrifio y bore yma, i wrthod neu anfon nhw yn ôl—y cynlluniau yma. Fe wnaeth ef hynny gyda 17 y tro cyntaf. Yr hyn sy'n poeni fi—

In terms of the Minister's powers, that is interesting. The Minister has a power, as he described earlier this morning, to reject or send back the WESPs. He did that with 17 of them in the first round. What concerns me—

[160] **Aled Roberts:** A gaf i ddod i mewn ar y pwynt yna? Fe wnes i ofyn cwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog, rwy'n meddwl. Rydych yn gywir—mae gan y Gweinidog yr hawl i wrthod y cynlluniau gwreiddiol, ond rhan o'r broblem yma ydy, rwy'n meddwl, y ffordd y mae'r rheoliadau wedi cael eu drafftio. Nid oes gan y Gweinidog yr hawl i wrthod yn ôl yr adolygiad blynyddol—felly, o fewn y cylch tair blynedd. Felly, rydym ni'n creu sefyllfa lle, os ydy'r cynllun gwreiddiol yn cael ei dderbyn, i ryw bwrpas rydym ni'n styc efo'r cynllun am y tair blynedd. Gall o gynnig gwelliannau, ond nid gyrru'r cynllun yn ôl o fewn y cylch tair

Aled Roberts: Can I come in on that point? I asked a question to the First Minister, I think. You're correct—the Minister does have the right to reject the original plans, but part of the problem here is, I think, the way that the regulations have been drafted. The Minister does not have the right to reject in terms of the annual review—so, within this three-year round. So, we're creating a situation where, if the initial plan is accepted, to all intents and purposes we're stuck with the plan for the three years. He can suggest amendments, but he can't send it back within the three-year cycle.

blynedd.

[161] **Ms Huws:** Mae yna broblem rheoliadau; mae yna broblem o ran y ddeddfwriaeth hefyd, achos, os edrychwch chi ar y ddeddfwriaeth, wedi i'r cynllun, fel yr ydych yn ei ddweud, gael ei dderbyn a bod yna fethiant amlwg, yn wahanol i weddill y ddeddfwriaeth yr ydym yn edrych arni fan hyn, sef y ddeddfwriaeth yn ymwneud â threfniadaeth ysgolion, lle mae gan y Gweinidog, o dan adran 21, adran 28 ac adran 57, yr hawl i ymyrryd yn uniongyrchol, nid yw'r hawl yna i'w weld yn eistedd gyda'r WESPs. A yw hynny'n gyfreithiol gywir? Nid wyf yn siŵr, achos nid yw wedi cael ei ddefnyddio, ond byddech yn disgwyl bod y pwerau yna, sy'n bodoli yn y ddeddfwriaeth, yn weithredol o ran y WESP hefyd, a bod hawl gan y Gweinidog i ymyrryd â awdurdod lleol pan fo yna fethiant amlwg o ran ateb galw, creu darpariaeth neu weithredu'r cynllun.

Ms Huws: There is a problem in terms of the regulations; there's a problem in terms of the legislation also, because, if you look at the legislation, once the plan, as you say, has been agreed and a clear failing emerges, unlike the rest of the legislation that we're looking at here, namely the legislation related to schools organisation, where the Minister, under sections 21, 28 and 57, does have the right to intervene directly, that right doesn't seem to apply to the WESPs. Whether that's legally accurate, I'm not sure, because that power has not been used, but you would expect that those powers that exist within the legislation should relate to the WESPs also, and that the Minister should have a right to intervene in a local authority where there is clear failing in terms of meeting demand, creating provision or implementing the plan.

[162] **Aled Roberts:** A oes cwestiwn yn codi yma—? Sori.

Aled Roberts: Does a question arise—? Sorry.

[163] **Ann Jones:** Is it a supplementary?

[164] **Aled Roberts:** It is, yes.

[165] **Ann Jones:** You can't have—. Save them for yours. Keith.

[166] **Keith Davies:** Bore da. Yn eich tystiolaeth, rydych yn sôn am ddiffyg uchelgais gan rai awdurdodau, ac rwy'n credu eich bod yn sôn bod hynny oherwydd nad ydynt yn gallu mesur y galw'n iawn. Ai dyna'r gwir amdani, neu beth yw'r rhesymau am y diffyg uchelgais yna?

Keith Davies: Good morning. In your evidence, you talk about a lack of ambition by some authorities, and I think you talk about that being because they can't assess the demand correctly. Is that the truth, or what are the reasons for this lack of ambition?

[167] **Ms Huws:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ein bod wedi sôn am ddiffyg uchelgais mor glir â hynny o ran siroedd penodol, ond mae'n dod yn ôl at y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd ynglŷn â sicrhau bod y targedau sy'n cael eu gosod yn y cynlluniau lleol yn adlewyrchu'r hyn sydd yn strategaeth y Llywodraeth ac yn mynd i wireddu strategaeth y Llywodraeth. Er mwyn creu y cam ymlaen, mae angen sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn dylanwadu ar yr awdurdodau lleol yna sy'n tanberfformio o ran gosod disgwyliadau a'u hannog—na, yn fwy nag annog, disgwyl eu bod nhw'n gosod targedau sy'n mynd i gyrraedd y nod

Ms Huws: I'm not sure we talked of a lack of ambition that clearly in terms of specific counties, but it does come back to that question of ensuring that the targets set in the local plans do reflect what is in the Government's strategy and will achieve the Government's strategy. In order to create that step change, we do need to ensure that the Government influences those local authorities that are underperforming in terms of setting expectations and encouraging—no, more than encouraging, expecting them to set targets that will attain the objective in terms of the Welsh Government's strategy.

o ran strategaeth addysg y Llywodraeth.

[168] **Keith Davies:** Onid y broblem yw'r ffaith nad ydyn nhw'n gallu mesur y galw'n iawn, efallai?

Keith Davies: Isn't the problem the fact that they can't assess the demand correctly, perhaps?

[169] **Ms Huws:** Mae hynny. Gallai hynny fod yn rhan o'r ateb. Mae mesur y galw yn eithriadol o bwysig. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes tystiolaeth gennym ar lawr gwlad.

Ms Huws: There is that. That could be part of the solution. Assessing demand is extremely important. I'm not sure whether we have any evidence on the ground.

[170] **Ms Birchall:** Rwy'n meddwl bod yna enghraifft. Os ydym yn edrych ar gynllun Wrecsam, er enghraifft—mae lot o drafod wedi bod am yr awdurdod hwnnw'r bore yma—mae'r cynllun yn nodi yn fanna bod yr awdurdod wedi bod yn rhagweithiol yn bodloni'r gofyn am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn yr awdurdod. Mae'r Llywodraeth, yn amlwg, wedi derbyn y gosodiad hynny wrth gymeradwyo'r cynllun. Ond rydym yn gwybod erbyn heddiw mai realiti'r sefyllfa erbyn Medi 2015 yw bod prinder mawr o lefydd dosbarth derbyn mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg cynradd y sir a bod llu o ddisgyblion, o ganlyniad, wedi colli allan. Felly, rwy'n credu bod yna enghreifftiau lle mae'n rhaid gofyn y cwestiwn pam fu rhai gosodiadau a pham bod y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn hapus i dderbyn y gosodiadau—ar sail ba dystiolaeth? Ac, yn amlwg, beth sy'n digwydd wedyn, pan nad ydy'r gosodiadau hynny'n troi allan efallai i adlewyrchu'r realiti?

Ms Birchall: I think there is an example. If we look at the Wrexham plan, for example—there's been a lot of discussion about that council this morning—the plan notes that the authority has been proactive in satisfying the demand for Welsh-medium education in the authority. The Government has, obviously, accepted that statement in approving the plan. But we do know by now that the reality of the situation is that by September 2015 there is a shortage of places in reception classes in Welsh-medium primary schools in the county and a lot of pupils have lost out as a result. So, there are examples where you have to ask the question why some statements have been made and why the Government has been happy to accept the statements—on the basis of what evidence? And, obviously, what happens then when those statements perhaps don't turn out to reflect reality?

[171] **Keith Davies:** A ydym yn hysbysebu'r ffaith bod addysg ddwyieithog, neu addysg Gymraeg, yn bwysig iawn? Achos un o'r pethau y gofynnais i i'r Gweinidog yn gynharach—roeddwn i'n edrych ar y dystiolaeth rŷm ni wedi cael, ac roeddwn i'n gweld nad oes unrhyw dwf wedi bod yn ardal Castell Nedd, ac roeddwn i'n synnu ar hynny, ac roeddwn i'n meddwl: beth yw'r rheswm am hynny, te? A ydym yn hysbysebu digon, neu ddim digon, efallai?

Keith Davies: Are we advertising the fact that bilingual education, or Welsh-medium education, is extremely important? Because one of the things I asked the Minister earlier—I was looking at the evidence that we've received, and I saw that there has been no growth in the Neath area, and I was surprised at that, and I was wondering what the reason was for that. Are we advertising enough, or not enough?

[172] **Ms Huws:** Clywsom ni'r sylwadau hynny'n gynt, a dywedwyd mewn ymateb—ac nid wyf yn gwybod a fuaswn i'n cytuno—mai cyfrifoldeb ysgolion oedd gwneud y gwaith gwerthu, marchnata a chodi'r ymwybyddiaeth yna. Rwy'n

Ms Huws: We heard those comments earlier, and there was a statement in response—and I don't know if I'd agree with this—that it was the responsibility of schools to do this marketing and awareness raising work. I feel very strongly that that should happen,

teimlo'n gryf mai ar lefel genedlaethol yn y man cyntaf y dylem fod yn gwneud hynny. O gael strategaeth sy'n gosod amcanion o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a Chymru ddwyieithog, y Llywodraeth, yn gyntaf, y dylai fod yn cynnal ymarferiad ar draws Cymru i godi ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd ynglŷn â buddiannau addysg ddwyieithog. Wedyn, mae'r cyfrifoldeb yn disgyn ar awdurdodau lleol i fod yn rhan o'r patrwm yna o godi ymwybyddiaeth, ond nid wyf yn credu y dylem ni ddisgwyl i ysgolion fod yn cario'r baich yna'n uniongyrchol eu hunain. Maen nhw'n rhan o'r pictiwr, ond nid ar eu hysgwyddau nhw mae'r cyfrifoldeb llawn.

[173] **Keith Davies:** So, a fydddech chi'n cytuno—gwnaeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, rwy'n credu, ddweud, o ran y rhestr o flaenoriaethau, bod datblygu'r Gymraeg yn isel iawn mewn rhai awdurdodau. So, os oes cyfrifoldeb ar y Llywodraeth, yn sicr mae cyfrifoldeb ar yr awdurdodau. A dyna beth y dywedwyd yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

initially, at the national level. In having a strategy that sets targets in terms of Welsh-medium education and a bilingual Wales, it's the Government that should initially be holding an exercise, pan-Wales, to raise public awareness on the benefits of bilingual education. Then, responsibility falls on local authorities to be part of that awareness raising pattern, but I don't think we should expect schools to be taking on that burden directly themselves. They are certainly part of the picture, but the responsibility doesn't fully fall on their shoulders.

Keith Davies: So, you would agree—the WLGA, I think, said that, in terms of the list of priorities in terms of developing the Welsh language, that was quite low in some authorities. So, if there is a responsibility on the Government, certainly there is responsibility on the local authorities. And that is what was said in the evidence that we received from the WLGA.

[174] **Ann Jones:** I think that was a comment, basically. Mike.

[175] **Mike Hedges:** On demand, I think people talk about demand as if it's an absolute number. I can only talk about Swansea East, which I often do, and probably far too much—almost as much as Aled talks about Wrexham. [*Laughter.*] But we've got four Welsh-medium primary schools, and the thing that's driven up demand has been opening those schools. There's an estate that is across the road from Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Lôn Las, which you may well know, and you just see the children flooding across there, when the English-medium school of Birchgrove is a mile away. If I wanted to increase demand, I'd open more schools; if I wanted to reduce demand, I'd put more English-medium schools closer to where people are living. So, it's not an absolute demand, is it? There are people who've got to have Welsh-medium. My granddaughter went half way across Swansea in order to go to a Welsh-medium Mudiad Meithrin school, rather than go to something that was much closer, but not everybody does that. So, really, don't you think the demand is driven by availability as much as by absolute desire?

[176] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n credu bod y galw yn cael ei yrru gan lot fawr o ffactorau. Mae'n anodd iawn penderfynu beth sydd yn arwain at alw'n uniongyrchol, ond mae yna dystiolaeth glir bod pethau'n gallu torri'r galw yna, neu rwystro'r galw yna. Un o'r pethau sy'n gallu ei rhwystro'n syth yw diffyg dilyniant a phroblemau o ran hygyrchedd a chlodiant. Rwyf yn credu bod cwestiwn sylfaenol fan hyn ynglŷn â'r perthynas rhwng darparu a chael strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, a'r hyn sy'n

Ms Huws: I think the demand is driven by very many factors. It's very difficult to identify what directly leads to demand, but there is clear evidence that things can interfere with that demand, or be a barrier to that demand. One of the immediate barriers is a lack of continuity and problems in terms of accessibility and transport. I do think there's a fundamental question here on the relationship between the provision and having a Welsh-medium education strategy, and what's happening in terms of

digwydd o ran cludiant ar hyn o bryd, ac rwy'n mynd i droi at Dyfan fan hyn, achos mae yna gysylltiad uniongyrchol fan hyn.

transportation, and I will turn to Dyfan here, because there is a direct link.

[177] **Mr Sion:** Ie. Rwy'n meddwl, o ran cludiant fel pwnc, mae'n fater sydd wedi codi yn y sesiwn blaenorol hefyd. Y Mesur teithio dysgwyr Cymru sy'n delio â hynny. Mae adran 10 y Mesur teithio'n dweud yn glir bod yn rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol—a Gweinidogion Cymru—hybu mynediad at addysg Gymraeg. Mae hynny, wedyn, yn berthnasol i bob rhan o'r Mesur.

Mr Sion: Yes. I think, in terms of transport as a subject, it's a matter that has been raised in the previous session as well. The learner travel Measure deals with that. Section 10 of the travel Measure states clearly that every local authority—and Welsh Ministers—has to promote access to Welsh-medium education. That, then, is relevant to every part of the Measure.

11:15

[178] Fel comisiynydd, rydym ni wedi derbyn nifer o ymholiadau, cwynion a phryderon gan rieni ynghylch newidiadau arfaethedig i bolisiâu cludiant ac effaith posib hynny ar fynediad at addysg Gymraeg. Yn sgil hynny, wedyn, rydym ni hefyd wedi cynnal rhywfaint o waith ymchwil ein hunain yn edrych ar y cyfnod ôl-16 yn benodol. Beth mae'n canlyniadau ni'n dangos ydy mai anghyson iawn ydy'r drefn ar hyn o bryd ar draws yr awdurdodau. Mae rhai yn codi ffioedd, a rhai yn codi ffioedd uwch na'i gilydd. Beth arall rydym wedi ei weld ydy bod yna nifer fawr o awdurdodau'n ystyried newid eu polisi cludiant ar hyn o bryd, felly mae'n bwnc amserol iawn, rydym yn credu.

As commissioner, we've received a number of inquiries, complaints and concerns from parents regarding proposed changes to transport policies and the possible impact of those on access to Welsh-medium education. As a result of that, then, we have also undertaken some research work ourselves to look at the post-16 sector specifically. What our results show is that the arrangements are very inconsistent at the moment across the authorities. Some charge, and some charge more than others. Something else we've seen is that a large number of the authorities are considering changing their transport policy at the moment, so it is a very timely subject, we think.

[179] Mae hefyd, yn amlwg, yn effeithio fwy ar ddisgyblion ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg na ddisgyblion eraill, o bosib. Er enghraifft, mae 50 y cant neu fwy o ddysgwyr ôl-16 sy'n mynychu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn dibynnu ar gludiant. Felly, mae'n bwnc pwysig o ran mynediad at addysg Cymraeg. Yn sgil hynny, rydym ni wedi gohebu hefyd â'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Rydym ni hefyd wedi codi'r mater efo'r Gweinidog perthnasol, sef Edwina Hart, yn yr achos yma. Wedyn, rydym ni'n parhau i drafod hynny â'r Llywodraeth.

It is also, clearly, having a greater effect on pupils in Welsh-medium schools than other pupils, possibly. For example, 50 per cent or more of post-16 learners who attend Welsh-medium education rely on transport. Therefore, it is an important subject in terms of access to Welsh-medium education. As a result of that, we have corresponded with all local authorities in Wales. We have also raised this issue with the relevant Minister, namely Edwina Hart in this instance. Then, we're continuing to discuss this with the Government.

[180] **Ms Huws:** Rwy'n credu bod hynny'n esiampl dda o le mae galw yn cael ei fwydo gan lot o wahanol ffactorau, ond mae'n hollbwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn tynnu'r gwahanol elfennau sy'n gallu effeithio ar y penderfyniad yna at ei gilydd.

Ms Huws: I think that's a good example of where demand is fed by numerous factors, but it is crucially important that the Government draws all of those elements that can impact upon those decisions together. If there's a problem with transportation, it will

Os oes problemau'n codi gyda chludiant, mae'n mynd i gael effaith ar y galw am addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

have an impact on demand for Welsh-medium education.

[181] **Keith Davies:** Un cwestiwn ychwanegol lle mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn y cwestiwn: dywedodd y gymdeithas eto bod statws iaith yr ysgol a thrïo ei newid yn rhy gymhleth, a'i bod yn doddi hynny fel rheswm am beidio â symud pethau ymlaen. Ond beth am y categorïau yna? Nid wyf yn cofio faint ohonyn nhw sydd, ond rwy'n eu cofio nhw'n dod mas yn 2007, ac roeddwn yn meddwl eu bod nhw'n gymhleth bryd hynny. A ddylem ni gael y categorïau yna? A ydyn nhw'n effeithio ar awdurdodau lleol?

Keith Davies: One additional question with regard to local authorities: the WLGA said again that the language status of a school and trying to change it was too complex, and that they gave that as a reason why they weren't moving things forward. So, what about those categories? I can't remember how many there are, but I remember they came out in 2007, and I thought they were complex then. So, should we have these categories? Do they have an impact on local authorities?

[182] **Ms Huws:** Efallai y buasai'n werth i ni jest sôn hefyd am y dystiolaeth rydym ni wedi ei derbyn ar lawr gwlad ynglŷn â'r broses o symud ysgolion ymlaen o ran cyfrwng Cymraeg. Efallai y gallet ti sôn am hynny hefyd, Dyfan.

Ms Huws: It may be worth mentioning the evidence we've received on the ground in terms of the process of shifting schools in terms of Welsh-medium provision. Perhaps you could also mention that, Dyfan.

[183] **Mr Sion:** Ie. Mae'r mater hynny wedi codi mewn trafodaeth rydym ni wedi eu cael gyda Chyngor Sir Gâr yn benodol. Jest o ran cyd-destun, byddwch chi'n ymwybodol, efallai, bod y cyngor wedi ceisio ymateb yn rhagweithiol i gynyddu'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn sgil canlyniadau'r cyfrifiad. Cam amlwg o hynny ydy'r maes addysg. Wedyn, maen nhw wedi mynegi consŷrn i ni o ran eu cynlluniau nhw bod y broses ar gyfer symud ysgolion ar hyd y continwwm ieithyddol yn cymryd gormod o amser ac yn llesteirio eu cynlluniau nhw. Mae'r côd statudol ar drefniadaeth ysgolion 2013 yn gosod allan wyth cam sy'n rhaid eu dilyn er mwyn symud ysgolion. Rydym ni'n derbyn bod yna elfen ddemocrataidd i'r broses a bod yn rhaid cadw hynny, ond mae o'n broblem sydd wedi amlygu ei hun yn sir Gâr yn benodol. Yn sgil hynny, wedyn, rydym ni wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog addysg yn ddiweddar, yn codi nifer o bwyntiau efo fo, ac mae hwn yn un peth yr ydym yn awyddus i drafod efo fo yn y dyfodol agos.

Mr Sion: Yes. That issue has arisen in discussions we've had with Carmarthenshire County Council specifically. Just in terms of context, you will be aware, perhaps, that the council has tried to respond proactively to increase the use of the Welsh language as a result of the census results. An obvious area is the education field. Then, they have raised concerns with us in terms of their plans that the process for moving schools along the linguistic continuum takes far too long and is affecting their plans. The statutory code on schools organisation 2013 sets out eight steps that have to be followed in order to shift schools. We accept that there is a democratic element to this process and that needs to be retained, but it is a problem that has been highlighted in Carmarthenshire specifically. As a result of that, then, we have written to the Minister for education recently, raising a number of points with him, and this is one thing that we are keen to discuss with him in the near future.

[184] **Keith Davies:** Diolch.

Keith Davies: Thank you.

[185] **Ann Jones:** David.

[186] **David Rees:** Just a very quick, short one, in two parts. With education and transportation issues, please don't look just at post-16, but look at pre-school, because if you don't get them at an early age, you won't have to worry about post-16— it won't be there. So, I think it's important we have those discussions and you look at it. I understand the statutory issues around that, but I think it's an important area to look at.

[187] But are you also concerned—. Mike Hedges identified four schools in my area, and I've got two in my constituency, which are both in Communities First areas, but they serve other areas. Is there concern about the fact that some of these schools are not in areas where there is deprivation, and therefore are not able to support those families, because they need transportation as a consequence of that? Therefore, the location of schools becomes a critical element. Are the WESPs actually addressing the location of schools?

[188] **Ms Huws:** Cwestiwn da. Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol iawn, yn arbennig yn y de-ddwyrain, bod plant o gefndiroedd gwahanol yn gorfod teithio o hyd allan o'r ardal ac yn bell i dderbyn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Ac os yw hynny yn gostus o ran y cludiant, fe fyddan nhw'n newid eu penderfyniadau ac yn camu nôl o hynny. Mae'r dystiolaeth yna'n glir. I ba raddau mae'r math yna o ystyriaethau yn cael ei wau i mewn i'r cynlluniau lleol? I ddweud y gwir, nid oes gennym dystiolaeth ynglŷn â beth yw'r berthynas. Ond dyna'n gywir y math o gwestiynau y buaswn i'n disgwyl i swyddogion y Llywodraeth ofyn i'r awdurdodau lleol: 'Sut ydych chi wedi prif-frydio'r cwestiynau yma ynglŷn â chludiant?', 'Sut ydych chi'n ystyried hynny?', 'Sut ydych chi'n cynllunio i ateb y galw a'r angen wrth ichi symud ymlaen yn wyneb y cwestiwn cludiant?' Dyna'n gywir y math o rôl ragweithiol y buaswn i'n gobeithio bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn chwarae gyda'r awdurdodau lleol wrth roi'r cynlluniau at ei gilydd.

Ms Huws: Good question. We're very aware, particularly in the south-east, that children from different backgrounds still have to travel out of catchment over long distances to access Welsh-medium education. And if that is expensive in terms of transport, they will change their decisions and step back from that. That evidence is clearly there. To what extent those kinds of considerations are dovetailed into the local plans? To be honest, we have no evidence as to what this interrelationship is. But those are exactly the kinds of questions that I would expect Government officials to ask local authorities: 'How have you mainstreamed these questions on transportation?', 'How do you consider that?', 'How are you planning to meet demand as you move forward in the light of the question of transport?' That is exactly the kind of proactive role I would hope to see the Welsh Government playing with local authorities in putting these plans together.

[189] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Shall we come on to you, Simon, on monitoring?

[190] **Simon Thomas:** Os cawn ni ddechrau efo'r cwestiwn a ofynnais i'r Gweinidog: a ydych chi wedi gweld unrhyw arwydd o'r ymgyrch genedlaethol yma i hybu buddiannau addysg Gymraeg?

Simon Thomas: If we can start with the question I asked the Minister: have you seen any signs of this national campaign to promote the benefits of Welsh-medium education?

[191] **Ms Huws:** Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol bod yna un. A ydym ni wedi gweld ôl hwnnw yn gyson o ran canlyniadau ar draws Cymru? Yn sicr, mae'r galw yn cynyddu. Beth sydd yn gyrru'r cynnydd yna, mae'n anodd dweud.

Ms Huws: We are aware that there is one. Have we have seen any consistent outcomes across Wales? Certainly, the demand is increasing. What drives that increase, it's difficult to say.

[192] **Simon Thomas:** Y rheswm rwy'n

Simon Thomas: The reason I ask is that it

gofyn yw iddi gael ei lansio gan y Prif Weinidog gyda ffanffer, os dyna'r gair. [Chwerthin.] Roedd y ffanffer yn eithaf *low key* hefyd.

was launched by the First Minister with fanfare, if that's the word. [Laughter.] The fanfare was quite low key also.

[193] **Ann Jones:** Or off-key.

[194] **Simon Thomas:** Ie. Sut allwn ni ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth fonitro a chadw trwyn yr awdurdodau lleol ar y maen, o safbwynt cynlluniau a mesur y galw a phopeth arall, os nad oes yna lefel genedlaethol sydd o hyd yn cynnal y ddeialog yma gyda'r cyhoedd ynglŷn â buddion addysg ddwyieithog yn y lle cyntaf, ac addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Felly, a ydych chi o gwbl wedi codi'r mater yma gyda'r Llywodraeth o safbwynt y ffordd maen nhw'n hyrwyddo addysg Gymraeg? Achos i fynd nôl at y pwynt roeddech chi'n ei wneud gynnau fach, mae'n amhosibl i rieni wneud unrhyw fath o ddewis—*informed consent*, os liciwch chi, a defnyddio'r term yna—os nad oes ganddynt wybodaeth, os nad oes modd cael hyd i'r wybodaeth yna ac os nad yw swyddogion y Llywodraeth mewn gwahanol ffyrdd, boed yng nghyd-destun Dechrau'n Deg, Cymunedau'n Gyntaf neu beth bynnag, yn hyrwyddo'r polisi yna.

Simon Thomas: Yes. How can we expect the Government to monitor and keep the local authorities' nose to the grindstone, in terms of plans and to assess the demand and so on, if there isn't a national level that is carrying on this dialogue with the public about the benefits of bilingual education in the first place, and Welsh-medium education? Therefore, have you raised this matter at all with the Government in terms of how they're promoting Welsh-medium education? Because to go back to the point that you were making earlier, it is impossible for parents to make any sort of an informed consent decision, to use that term, if they haven't got information, if there isn't a way of finding that information and if Welsh Government officials in different ways, either in the context of Flying Start, Communities First or whatever, are not promoting that policy.

[195] **Ms Huws:** Diolch. Mae sawl elfen i'r cwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, a gawn ni edrych ar y cwestiwn o ymgyrch genedlaethol a chodi ymwybyddiaeth? Rwy'n credu, i wneud hynny, ac i wneud hynny mewn ffordd effeithiol, nid rhywbeth dros nos mewn un ardal yw hynny; rŷch chi'n sôn am ymgyrch sy'n cael ei chynnal dros gyfnod o ddegawdau, a dweud y gwir, os cael newid. Felly, wrth sôn am ymgyrch genedlaethol, nid wyf yn credu bod yna ymgyrch genedlaethol wedi bod eto. Mae yna rannau o ymgyrch sydd â photensial cenedlaethol mewn rhai ardaloedd wedi digwydd. Ymgyrch genedlaethol sydd ei hangen yn seiliedig ar ffeithiau; mae'r ffeithiau yn bodoli ynglŷn â buddion addysg ddwyieithog.

Ms Huws: Thank you. There are a number of elements to that question. First of all, may we look at the question of a national awareness campaign? I do think that to do that effectively, it's not going to happen overnight in one area; you're talking there of a campaign that will be held over a period of decades, to be honest, if we are to achieve change. So, in talking about a national campaign, I don't think there has been a national campaign as of yet. There have been parts of a potential national campaign in certain areas. We need that national campaign based on facts; the facts already exist in terms of the benefits of bilingual education.

[196] Mae honno'n un rôl gan y Llywodraeth, ac rydym wedi codi cwestiynau ynglŷn â hynny mewn llythyr at y Gweinidog ym mis Mehefin, fel rhan o'r drafodaeth rŷm ni eisiau ei chael gydag e.

That is one role for Government, and we have raised that in correspondence with the Minister in June, as part of the debate that we want to have with him. There's a second element to the question that you've just

Mae yna ail elfen i'r cwestiwn rŷch chi newydd ei godi ynglŷn â rôl fonitro'r Llywodraeth o dan y ddeddfwriaeth. Ac rwy'n credu bod yna ddiffygion cyfansoddiadol yn deillio o'r ddeddfwriaeth; collwyd cyfle o ran y ddeddfwriaeth. Rwyf wedi sôn yn barod am yr adrannau o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth y gellid eu defnyddio pe bai nhw'n cael eu cysylltu gyda'r WESP, ac rwyf yn credu bod angen edrych o ddifri beth sydd angen ei wneud yn gyfansoddiadol i sicrhau bod y pwerau yna yn berthnasol i WESP, ac felly, pan mae'r cynlluniau yn methu ar lawr gwlad, bod modd i'r Llywodraeth ymyrryd yn syth er mwyn atal mwy o fethiant. Nid yw ymyrryd bob tair blynedd ddim yn mynd i weithio—rych chi'n adeiladu ar fethiant tair blynedd wedyn, neu rŷch chi'n ceisio ymateb i fethiant tair blynedd. Mae angen cael pwerau lle maen nhw yn gallu ymyrryd, ac, os oes rhaid, defnyddio'r pwerau i gyfarwyddo a gorfodi. Rŷch chi'n sôn am *special measures*, neu amcanion arbennig mewn meysydd eraill o addysg; mae hwn yn bwysig hefyd. Felly, mae angen i'r ymgyrch genedlaethol godi ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd, ac ochr yn ochr â hynny, mae angen cryfhau'r elfen fonitro statudol sydd yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth, er mwyn sicrhau bod y WESPs yn gweithredu. Oherwydd, ar ddiwedd y dydd, maen nhw'n gynlluniau deddfwriaethol statudol—nid trafodaeth ar lawr gwlad. Dyma'r teclyn statudol sydd gyda ni i sicrhau addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg.

[197] **Mr Sion:** Sori, jest un pwynt atodol hefyd os caf i: rŷm ni'n ymwybodol bod y Llywodraeth wedi cynnal gwerthusiad ar y strategaeth addysg Gymraeg. Rŷm ni wedi gweld y canfyddiadau interim, ac rŷm ni rŵan yn edrych ymlaen at weld y canfyddiadau llawn, fel y byddwch chi fel pwyllgor hefyd mae'n siŵr.

[198] **Ms Huws:** Ac os caf i ofyn cwestiwn i'r pwyllgor: a ydych chi wedi gallu cael golwg ar adroddiad Arad ar y strategaeth addysg Gymraeg, sydd, fel rŷm ni'n ei ddeall, wedi cael ei gyflwyno i'r Llywodraeth?

[199] **Simon Thomas:** 'Dim eto' yw'r ateb i hynny, rwy'n credu. Ond diolch am ein cyfeirio ni at y ffynhonnell yna.

raised on the monitoring role of Government under the legislation. And I do think there are constitutional deficiencies emerging from the legislation; an opportunity has been missed in terms of the legislation. I've already mentioned those sections within the legislation that could be used if they were linked with the WESP, and I do think that we need to look seriously at what needs to be done constitutionally to ensure that those powers are relevant to the WESP, and therefore, when the plans do fail on the ground, the Government can intervene immediately to prevent further decline. Intervention every three years isn't going to work—you're building on three years of failure then, or you are trying to respond to three years of failure. They need powers where they can intervene, and, if necessary, to use the powers of direction and enforcement. You're talking of special measures in other areas of education; this is also important. So, the national campaign of awareness raising among the public needs to be in place, and alongside that we need to strengthen that statutory monitoring element, which is in the Government's hands, to ensure that the WESPs are working. Because, at the end of the day, they are statutory plans—not a matter of discussion at a local level. This is the statutory tool that we have to secure Welsh-medium education.

Mr Sion: Sorry, just one supplementary point: we're aware that the Government has undertaken an evaluation on the Welsh education strategy. We've seen the interim findings, and we're now looking forward to seeing the full findings, as you as a committee will be as well.

Ms Huws: If I may ask a question of the committee: have you had sight of the Arad report on the Welsh-medium education strategy, which, we understand, has been submitted to Government?

Simon Thomas: 'Not as of yet' is the response, I think. But thank you for flagging it up.

[200] **Ann Jones:** We've got a single copy. We'll get multiple copies out to Members now, so that's your homework for tonight.

[201] **Ms Huws:** Mae hwnnw'n adroddiad interim, rwy'n credu. Mae yna adroddiad terfynol wedi cael ei gyflwyno. **Ms Huws:** That is an interim report, I think. The final report has been presented.

[202] **Ann Jones:** Oh, right. Okay. We've only got the interim report, so we'll do some chasing around that, thank you.

[203] **Simon Thomas:** Rwyf wedi gweld hwnnw. Af ar ôl y monitro mewn eiliad—rwyf jest eisiau bennu un peth er mwyn imi fod yn glir amdano. Yn y dystiolaeth gyda'r Gweinidog fe soniwyd yn benodol, gyda'r ymgyrch genedlaethol yma, am weithgaredd yn Llanelli, Blaenau Gwent a sir y Fflint. A ydych chi wedi cael cyfle i edrych ar hwnnw o gwbl, ac effaith hwnnw? **Simon Thomas:** I have seen that. I'll go after the monitoring in a second—I just want to ask one further thing for clarification. In the evidence with the Minister it was mentioned specifically, with this national campaign, about the Llanelli, Blaenau Gwent and Flintshire activity. Have you had an opportunity to look at that at all and the impact of that?

[204] **Ms Huws:** Nac ydym. Nid ym ni wedi gwneud unrhyw waith dadansoddi ar hwnnw. **Ms Huws:** No. We haven't done any analytical work on that.

[205] **Simon Thomas:** Ocê. Diolch. Gwaith priodol y Llywodraeth yw e, rwy'n gwybod, ond mae gen i ddiddordeb. O droi at y monitro a strwythur statudol y cynlluniau strategol hyn, rwyf yn cofio yn nhrefodion y pwyllgor—achos roeddwn i ar y pwyllgor ar y pryd—wrth inni drafod y ddeddfwriaeth, bod y Llywodraeth yn awyddus i roi'r cynlluniau ar lefel statudol am y tro cyntaf, ond bod y Gweinidog ar y pryd, Leighton Andrews, wedi datgan y byddai am gymryd pwerau statudol ychwanegol pe bai'r system ddim yn gweithio. A ydych chi'n dweud, felly, ar sail y dystiolaeth sydd gennym eisoes, nad yw'r system yn gweithio, neu ddim yn gweithio i'w llawn botensial? **Simon Thomas:** Okay. Thank you. It's the Government's work, I know, but I'm just interested. Turning to the monitoring and the statutory structures of the strategic plans, I do remember in the committee's discussions—because I was on the committee at the time—when we were discussing the legislation, that the Government was keen to place the plans on a statutory footing for the first time, but that the Minister at the time, Leighton Andrews, had stated that he would want to take additional statutory powers if the system didn't work. Are you saying, therefore, on the basis of the existing evidence, that the system isn't working, or not working to its full potential?

[206] **Ms Huws:** Mae dweud ar sail cyfnod byr iawn, iawn nad yw'r system yn gweithio yn ddatganiad mawr, ond mae'r gwendidau yn dechrau ymddangos yn barod, ac mae'r ffaith bod pobl yn mynegi consŷrn yn y dyddiau cynnar yn golygu bod angen edrych nawr ar ba gamau ychwanegol sydd angen eu cymryd. Nid yw cymryd y cam deddfwriaethol yn golygu bod yn rhaid ichi ei ddefnyddio fe, ond mae e yna wrth gefn. Mi fuaswn i yn annog y Llywodraeth i ystyried cymryd y pwerau yna nawr, er mwyn peidio aros am dair blynedd, ac os **Ms Huws:** To say on the basis of evidence from a very, very short period of time that the system isn't working is a major statement to make, but the weaknesses are starting to emerge already, and the fact that people are expressing concerns at these early stages does mean that we need to look at this now and to consider what additional steps need to be taken. Taking the legislative step doesn't mean that you would have to use that power, but it is there as a back-up. I would encourage the Government to consider taking those powers now, so that we don't wait for

oes yna wendidau mewn ardaloedd, mi ellid camu i mewn yn y dyddiadau cynnar.

[207] **Simon Thomas:** Ond mewn ffordd, mae'r hyn rŷch chi'n ei ddweud yn adlewyrchiad o fethiant y broses bresennol mewn ffordd eithaf sylfaenol. Rwy'n ei ddweud e fel hyn: os yw Llywodraeth yn gallu gwrthod cynllun strategol, fel y maen nhw'n gallu—ac maen nhw wedi gwrthod 17 ohonyn nhw a gorfod cael y drafodaeth yma—ac wedyn yn cymeradwyo cynllun yn ei dro—os nad yw'r cynllun yna'n ffit ar gyfer tair blynedd, mae rhywbeth mawr o'i le yn y system, onid oes?

[208] **Ms Huws:** Mae'n ddyddiau cynnar, cynnar i ddweud ei fod e'n fethiant. Rŷm ni'n amlygu gwendidau—dyna pam mae'r drafodaeth wedi digwydd.

[209] **Simon Thomas:** Ond rŷch chi'n awgrymu bod yna wendidau yn y system. Beth rwyf i'n trio'i ddweud—nid wyf yma i siarad dros y Llywodraeth, yn sicr—yw os yw'r Llywodraeth wedi cymeradwyo cynllun strategol Cymraeg mewn addysg am dair blynedd, mi ddylai fod yn ffit am dair blynedd. Ni ddylem ni fod yn gweld—. Dylai unrhyw wendidau fod wedi eu sgrwio lawr yn y cychwyn cyntaf yna.

[210] **Ms Huws:** Dyna y buasech chi'n ei ddymuno, ond fel yr ŷm ni wedi gweld, ac fel y mae Sioned wedi cyfeirio ato, mae yna achosion yn ymddangos yn barod ar lawr gwlad lle mae yna wendidau a methiannau yn y system. Y cwestiwn sy'n codi yw: beth yw rôl y Llywodraeth ar y pwynt yna?

11:30

[211] **Simon Thomas:** Y cwestiwn yw, wedyn: ble fydddech chi'n gosod y trothwy ar gyfer ymyrraeth gan Lywodraeth? Roedd y Gweinidog yn gwneud y pwynt ei fod ef am i hon fod yn broses leol, ddemocrataidd, a dyna wendid a chryfder, wrth gwrs, unrhyw system sy'n seiliedig ar ddewis rhieni. Mae yna gryfder yna, achos dyna ble mae'r twf wedi bod yn hanesyddol, ond mae yna wendid wrth drïo gwrthio'r peth ymlaen hefyd. A oes gennych chi unrhyw awgrym i'r pwyllgor ar le ddylai'r trothwy yna fod,

three years, and if there are problems in certain areas, steps can be taken at an early stage.

Simon Thomas: But in a way, what you're saying is a reflection of the failure of the current system in quite a substantial way. I'm saying this: if the Government can reject a strategic plan, as they can—and they have rejected 17 of them and have had to have this discussion—and then approve the scheme—if that plan isn't fit for three years, there is something wrong in the system.

Ms Huws: It's very, very early days to say that this is a failure. We are highlighting failings—that's why the discussion has happened.

Simon Thomas: But you're suggesting that there are weaknesses in the system. What I'm trying to say—and I'm not here to talk on behalf of the Government, certainly—is that if the Government has approved a WESP for three years, it should be fit for purpose for three years. We shouldn't be seeing—. Any weaknesses should have been screwed down in the initial phase.

Ms Huws: That's what the aspiration would be, but as we've seen, and as Sioned has mentioned, there are cases emerging already on the ground where there are failings in the system and weaknesses in the system. The question is: what is the Government's role at that point?

Simon Thomas: The question, then, is: where would you place the threshold for intervention by Government? The Minister made the point that he wanted this to be a local democratic process, and that is the weakness and strength, of course, of any system that's based on parental choice. There is a strength there, because that is where the growth has been historically, but there is a weakness in trying to push things forward. Do you have any suggestion for the committee of where that threshold should be,

felly—lle ddylai'r Llywodraeth gamu i mewn a dechrau bod yn fwy ymyrrol yn beth sy'n digwydd?

[212] **Ms Huws:** Yr ateb i'r cwestiwn yna, rwy'n credu, yw i edrych ar weddill y ddeddfwriaeth o ran y Ddeddf Safonau a Threfniadaeth Ysgolion (Cymru) 2013, oherwydd mae'r Ddeddf, yn ei chyfanrwydd, yn edrych ar wahanol—. Mae yna ysgol o gamau, onid oes?

[213] **Simon Thomas:** Oes.

[214] **Ms Huws:** Mae methiannau cynnar a beth yw rôl y Llywodraeth, ac mae methiannau mwy dwys a beth yw rôl y Llywodraeth. A dyna'r math o strwythur sydd ei angen gyda'r cynlluniau hyn: bod ffordd o symud i fyny'r ysgol a rhoi rôl benodol i'r Llywodraeth ar bob cam—rhoi cyngor ar y cychwyn, rhoi cyfarwyddyd, a gorfodi. Felly, nid un pwynt sydd yna, ond rôl i'r Llywodraeth ar bob un o'r pwyntiau hyn lle mae gwendidau a methiannau'n ymddangos.

[215] **Simon Thomas:** Roedd y Gweinidog yn disgrifio'r broses hon fel un *iterative*—dyna'r gair a ddefnyddiodd. A ydych chi'n gweld arwydd ar lawr gwlad o'r broses ryngweithiol yma?

[216] **Ms Huws:** Mae'n gwestiwn o beth yw pwrpas y cynlluniau hyn. Os edrychwch chi ar y Ddeddf a mynd yn ôl at beth yw pwrpas cynllun strategol awdurdod lleol—ei bwrpas yw i weithredu strategaeth addysg y Llywodraeth. Rhan o hynny yw trafodaeth, ac ar ddiwedd y dydd, teclyn i sicrhau gweithredu strategaeth genedlaethol sydd gennych chi fan hyn. Felly, nid jest trafodaeth *iterative* yw hi, mae'n fwy na hynny; mae'n gweithredu ac mae'n cyflawni, ac os oes yna fethiannau, mae'n datrys y methiannau yna. Mae'n fwy o lawer na jest trafodaeth bob blwyddyn ynglŷn â dyheadau; mae'n weithredu. Mae'r elfen o drafodaeth yn bwysig, ond nid jest sgwrs flynyddol yw hon. Mae'n gorfod bod yn gynllun sy'n cael ei weithredu.

[217] **Simon Thomas:** Mae yna un elfen arall o'r broses yma, sef y fforymau lleol yma. Fel y comisiynydd a swyddfa'r

therefore—where the Government should step in and start to have more of an interventional role?

Ms Huws: The answer to that question, I think, is to look at the rest of the legislation in terms of the School Standards and Organisation (Wales) Act 2013, because that Act, in its entirety, looks at different—. There are a whole range of steps, aren't there?

Simon Thomas: Yes.

Ms Huws: There are early failings and what the Government's role is, and there are more ingrained failings and what the Government's role is. And that is the kind of staid structure we need with this system: that there should be a way that the Government can intervene at all stages—they can give guidance, they can give directions and then they can use enforcement powers. So, it isn't a single point, but a role for Government at all of these points where there are failings that emerge.

Simon Thomas: The Minister described this process as an iterative one—that's the word he used. Do you see any sign on a local level of that interactive process?

Ms Huws: It's a question as to what the purpose of these plans is. If you look at the Act and go back to what the purpose of a WESP within a local authority is—it's purpose is to implement the Welsh Government's education strategy. Part of that is a discussion, and at the end of the day, it's a tool to implement the national strategy; that's what the WESPs are. So, it's not just an iterative debate, it's more than that; it's a matter of taking action and achieving, and if there are failings, it resolves those failings. It is far more than simply an annual debate on aspirations; it's a matter of taking action. The discussion around it is important, but it's not just an annual conversation. It has to be a plan that is implemented.

Simon Thomas: There is one other element of this process, namely these local fora. As commissioner and the commissioner's office,

comisiynydd, a ydych chi'n cael trosolwg, o gwbl, o'r fforymau yna ac unrhyw adborth yn ôl o'r fforymau yna ar sut y maen nhw'n gweithio? Mae nifer o'r mudiadau rŷch chi'n eu cefnogi ar y fforymau hyn, er enghraifft.

do you have any oversight at all of those fora and any feedback from the fora on how they're working? A number of the organisations that you support are on these fora, for example.

[218] **Ms Huws:** Ydyn. Rŷm ni'n ymwybodol iawn o'u bodolaeth nhw, ac rŷm ni'n ymwneud â chyrff sy'n rhan o'r fforymau yn y gwahanol ardaloedd. Nid ŷm ni wedi gwneud unrhyw waith dadansoddol arnyn nhw ychwaith. Ond, rwy'n credu, y cwestiynau y buasem ni angen eu gofyn yw: 'Pwy sy'n cael eu cynrychioli ar y fforymau hynny?', 'A yw hynny'n gyson?', 'Ydy lleisiau'r bobl iawn gennym ni? Y teimlad rŷm ni'n ei gael, ar sail anecdotaidd, yw eu bod nhw'n fforymau hanesyddol, ar y cyfan, sydd ddim yn gyson o ran cynrychiolaeth. Cwestiwn arall sylfaenol i fi yw: beth yw'r berthynas rhwng y fforymau hynny a'r consortia rhanbarthol, sydd, fwyfwy, yn bwerus wrth wneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â siâp y ddarpariaeth addysg? A oes yna berthynas ffurfiol? Os nad oes, a ddylem fod yn edrych i ffurfioli hynny? Oherwydd mi allai'r fforymau fod yn effeithiol iawn o ran cynnal trafodaeth, ond a ydy hynny'n cael ei fwydo i mewn i'r cynllunio?

Ms Huws: Yes. We are very aware of their existence and we are involved with some of the organisations that make up the fora in many areas. We haven't carried out any analysis of those either. But, I think the questions that we would need to ask would be: 'Who is represented on those fora?', 'Is that consistent?', 'Are the right voices being heard? The feeling that we get, on an anecdotal basis, is that they are generally historic fora, which aren't consistent in terms of representation. Another fundamental question for me is: what is the relationship between those fora and the regional consortia, which are becoming increasingly powerful in taking decisions on the shape of education provision? Is there a formal relationship between them? If not, should we be looking to formalise that relationship? Because the fora could be very useful in holding a debate, but is that actually fed into the planning?

[219] **Ann Jones:** Okay. Thank you. Aled.

[220] **Aled Roberts:** A oes yna gwestiwn o berchnogaeth o ran y fforymau hyn? Rŷch chi wedi dweud bod rhai ohonyn nhw'n hanesyddol. Hefyd, mae'r rhan fwyaf yr aelodaeth, a dweud y gwir, yn cynnwys swyddogion cyngor a phrifathrawon ysgolion o fewn y sir. O'm mhrofiad i, buaswn i'n dweud ei fod yn anodd iawn i brifathrawon fynd yn erbyn barn unrhyw uwch-swyddog addysg. Felly, rwyf i jest yn gofyn i chi a oes gennych chi unrhyw wybodaeth ynglŷn â'r cyfraniad neu'r dylanwad y mae rhai o'r mudiadau yma'n cael, neu a ydyn nhw'n rhyw fath o bobl sydd jest ar y cyrion, felly?

Aled Roberts: Is there a question of ownership in terms of these fora? You've said that some of them are historic. Also, most of the membership, to be honest, includes council officers and heads of schools within the county. From my experience, I would say that it's very difficult for heads to go against the views of any senior education officer. So, I'm just asking you whether you have any information regarding the contribution or the influence that some of these organisations have, or are they some sort of people who are on the fringes, therefore?

[221] **Ms Huws:** Dim ond tystiolaeth ail-law, eilradd, o fod yn ymwneud â mudiadau fel RhAG ac yn y blaen.

Ms Huws: Only second-hand, anecdotal evidence of being involved with organisations such as RhAG and so on.

[222] **Aled Roberts:** Ocê. A gaf i jest droi at ddylanwad polisïau eraill Llywodraeth

Aled Roberts: Okay. May I just turn to the influence of other Welsh Government

Cymru? Rydych chi wedi sôn am gludiant. A oes gennych chi unrhyw amheuan ynghylch polisiâu mynediad at addysg ffurfiol? Nid oes yna reolau gwahanol o ran addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ac addysg cyfrwng Saesneg. Mae yna broblem mewn rhai ardaloedd lle mae yna bwysau ar niferoedd, lle mae yna blant yn cael eu derbyn ar gyfer dosbarthiadau meithrin, a phan fo'r plant pedair oed yn dod i mewn o feithrinfeydd preifat, er enghraifft, maen nhw'n gwthio'r plant sydd wedi bod i mewn yn yr ysgol ers blwyddyn, ac maen nhw'n cael eu gwrthod ar gyfer dosbarthiadau derbyn. A oes yna unrhyw alw erbyn hyn, o achos y pwysau sydd ar rai siroedd, i Lywodraeth Cymru hwyrach ailystyried y polisiâu neu ganllawiau mynediad i ysgolion?

[223] **Ms Huws:** Trof yn gyntaf at bwynt a wnaethpwyd yn flaenorol gan Sioned a Dyfan ynglŷn â'r dystiolaeth rŷm ni'n ei gweld, bod yna ddiffyg cysylltiad rhwng gwahanol bolisiâu. Nid oes yna elfen o groesgyfeirio gwahanol bolisiâu'r Llywodraeth. Mae yna strategaeth addysg Gymraeg, sy'n eistedd yn ganolog, ond wedyn nid yw hynny'n bwydo allan i'r polisiâu eraill—ac mae yna dystiolaeth nad yw hynny'n digwydd o ran yr ymgynghoriadau sy'n digwydd, o ran polisiâu statudol yn ymwneud â chludiant. Rwy'n credu bod hwn yn broblem cyffredinol—prif-ffrydio'r Gymraeg ac, yn y cyswllt yma, addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, a chroesgyfeirio i bolisiâu eraill. Mae yna wrthdaro, ac rwy'n credu bod angen adolygiad llawn o'r polisiâu eraill hefyd. Gallem edrych ar hynny mewn meysydd eraill: ynglŷn â darpariaeth ôl-16 a chynllunio'r gweithlu. Rŷm ni'n ei weld e o ran datblygiadau, neu ddiffyg datblygiadau, o ran fframwaith cynllunio galwedigaethol yn y maes iechyd: nid oes cyswllt â'r strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Felly, mae yna broblem sylfaenol o ddiffyg cysylltiad a diffyg prif-ffrydio.

[224] **Aled Roberts:** Ocê. Rwyf jest eisiau gofyn cwestiwn hefyd: mi wnaeth Keith gyfeirio at gategoreiddio. Ran amlaf, nid yw hwnnw'n strwythur yr ydym ni'n ei adnabod yn y gogledd. Rwy'n derbyn bod y Gweinidog yn dweud ein bod ni'n symud

policies? You've talked about transport. Do you have any concerns regarding the policies on access to formal education? The rules regarding Welsh-medium education are no different from those for English-medium education. There is a problem in some areas where there is pressure on numbers, where children are accepted for nursery classes, and when children at the age of four come in from private nurseries, for example, they push out the children who have been at the school for a year, and they are refused a place in the reception classes. Are there any calls by now, given the pressures in some counties, for the Welsh Government perhaps to reconsider the policies or the guidance regarding access to schools?

Ms Huws: I will turn first to a point made earlier by both Sioned and Dyfan about the evidence that we see, pointing to a disconnect between the various policies. There is no element of cross-referencing between different Government policies. There is a Welsh-medium education strategy, which sits centrally, but that, then, doesn't feed out to other policies—and there is evidence that that doesn't happen in terms of the consultations that are under way, in terms of statutory policies relating to transport. I think that this is a common problem—mainstreaming the Welsh language and, in this context, Welsh-medium education, and the read-across to other policies. There is a conflict, and I think we need a full review of all the other policies, as well. We could look at that in other areas: in relation to post-16 provision and workforce planning. We see it in terms of the developments, or lack of developments, in terms of a vocational framework for the field of health: there is no read-across to the Welsh-medium education strategy. So, there's a fundamental problem in terms of not making those connections and a lack of mainstreaming.

Aled Roberts: Okay. I just want to ask a question as well: Keith referred to categorisation. More often than not, that is not a structure that we recognise in north Wales. I accept that the Minister is saying that we are moving on from this discussion

ymlaen o'r drafodaeth yma rŵan ynghylch cyfrwng dysgu, a hwyrach y gwnaf i ofyn cwestiwn yn nes ymlaen ynglŷn â Donaldson, a'ch ymateb chi i Donaldson, ond, tra ydym ni efo'r strwythur presennol yma, a oes gennych chi unrhyw bryderon ynghylch diffiniad neu ddiffyg diffiniad addysg uwchradd, o achos mae yna ysgolion yn y gogledd sy'n cael eu cyfeirio atynt fel ysgolion dwyieithog lle mae'r ddarpariaeth iaith Gymraeg o fewn yr ysgolion hynny yn eithaf llipa, a dweud y gwir?

[225] **Ms Birchall:** Mae'r mater yma o addysg uwchradd a'r ddarpariaeth amrywiol sy'n cael ei chynnig gan rai ysgolion yn sicr yn fater o bryder o ran dilyniant ieithyddol a dewis rhieni. A ydyn nhw'n hollol ymwybodol beth yn union ydy'r arlwy o ran pynciau a chyfrwng y dysgu hwnnw? Mae yna, yn amlwg, amrywiaeth helaeth o'r hyn sy'n cael ei olygu gan 'ddysgu dwyieithog'. A ydy hynny'n golygu eich bod chi'n gwneud y cwrs mewn dwy iaith, neu a yw'n golygu bod yna elfennau o ran y gwaith? Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd yn aneglur, ac mae'n rhywbeth, hyd yn oed ar gyfer prospectysau hefyd, lle dylai gwybodaeth fod yn cael ei darparu'n glir i rieni.

[226] Mae o'n gonsŷrn, efallai, o ran dilyniant ieithyddol. Buom ni'n edrych ar y gwaith y bu Estyn yn ei wneud yn edrych ar ddilyniant ieithyddol mewn 10 ysgol uwchradd ddwyieithog, a rhai o'r sylwadau a ddaeth yn ôl o'r gorolwg yna oedd nad oedd dilyniant ieithyddol yn flaenoriaeth i bob un o'r awdurdodau lleol yn y sampl. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn mawr, pan fo dilyniant ieithyddol yn gymaint o ran ganolog o'r strategaeth addysg Gymraeg, nad yw hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu ar lefel awdurdod lleol nac ychwaith wedyn ar lefel ysgolion unigol. Rwy'n meddwl bod yna gwestiwn pwysig iawn o ran y wybodaeth y mae rhieni yn ei chael, y ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael ac sy'n cael ei chynnig gan y gwahanol fathau o ysgolion yna, a'r modd y maen nhw'n cael eu categoreiddio ac efallai'r camddefnydd o gategoreiddio—hynny yw, nid yw'r wybodaeth yn gwbl glir o ran beth sy'n cael ei olygu a'r gwahaniaeth rhwng un ysgol ddwyieithog ac ysgol ddwyieithog arall.

[227] **Aled Roberts:** Yn amlwg, mi oedd

now about the medium of the teaching, and perhaps I will ask you a question later on about Donaldson and your response to Donaldson, but while we have this existing structure, do you have any concerns regarding the definition, or lack of a definition, of secondary education, because there are schools in north Wales that are referred to as bilingual schools, but where the Welsh-language provision within those schools is really quite flimsy, to tell you the truth?

Ms Birchall: This issue of secondary education and the inconsistent provision being offered by some schools is certainly a cause of concern in terms of linguistic progression and parental choice. Are they fully aware of what is being offered in terms of the subjects and the medium of the teaching? There is obviously a huge variability regarding what is meant by 'bilingual teaching'. Does that mean that you are studying a course in two languages, or does it mean that there are elements in terms of the work? That is something that's unclear and it's something, even for prospectuses, too, about which information should be clearly provided to parents.

It is a concern, perhaps, in terms of the linguistic continuity. We looked at the work that Estyn carried out, looking at linguistic continuity in 10 bilingual secondary schools, and some of the comments that came back from that overview were that linguistic continuity was not a priority for every one of the local authorities that were a part of that sample. That is a major question, when linguistic continuity is such a central part of the Welsh-medium education strategy, that that is not reflected at a local authority level or even at the individual school level. I think there's a very important question there in terms of the information that parents receive, the provision that is available and that is offered by those different kinds of schools, and the way in which they are categorised, as well, perhaps, as the misuse of categorisation—that is, the information isn't entirely clear as to what exactly is meant and the difference between one bilingual school and another bilingual school.

Aled Roberts: Clearly, the Minister was

y Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at y ffordd y mae o'n gweld, hwyrach, y patrwm presennol yn newid wrth ystyried goblygiadau Donaldson. Beth ydy'ch teimlad chi ynglŷn â chapasiti'r byd addysg i ymwneud â Donaldson, wrth gofio bod cymaint o feirniadaeth am y ffordd y mae Cymraeg yn cael ei haddysgu fel ail iaith? Wrth gwrs, mae'r WESPs yma yn sôn am addysg ail iaith hefyd o fewn pob sir. Beth yw eich ymateb chi? A ydych chi'n cael eich cynnwys yn y trafodaethau yma ynglŷn â Donaldson?

[228] **Ms Huws:** Gwnaethom ni fwydo tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a thystiolaeth ar lafar i mewn i ymholiad Donaldson. Cawsom ni ymateb positif a chroesawgar i'r hyn a wnaethom ni ei gyflwyno, ac rŷm ni'n reit gyfforddus gyda rhai o'r argymhellion sy'n deillio o Donaldson o ran y Gymraeg.

[229] O ran sut maen nhw'n cael eu gweithredu, wedyn, mae'r datganiadau lefel uchel sy'n dod o Donaldson yn rhai positif, ond gwireddu'r rheini ar lawr gwlad wedyn fydd y sialens. Un peth sy'n fy mhoeni i wrth weld Donaldson—er mor gryf ydyw mewn lot o elfennau, fel yr ateb—yw bod yna gyfnod o amser yn mynd i basio cyn bod Donaldson yn cael ei weithredu. Y cynlluniau strategol addysg sydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd a'r strategaeth addysg sydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd—dyna lle y dylem ni fod yn canolbwyntio am y tair blynedd, pum mlynedd nesaf yma, wrth i Donaldson weld golau dydd. Felly rwy'n poeni o weld Donaldson fel yr ateb i bopeth, ac felly ein bod ni'n gallu arafu popeth ac efallai peidio â rhoi cymaint o bwyslais ar beth sydd gyda ni ar hyn o bryd, sef strategaeth y Llywodraeth a'r cynlluniau lleol. Nawr yw'r amser i weithredu gyda nhw, neu fydd yr hyn y mae Donaldson yn ceisio'i weithredu wedi colli tair blynedd, os nad pum mlynedd.

[230] **Aled Roberts:** O ran y ffordd y mae Donaldson yn plethu i mewn i bolisiâu eraill y Llywodraeth, gan gynnwys y WESPs a'r strategaeth addysg Gymraeg, a oes yna ddigon o gynllunio, dyweder, o ran nifer yr athrawon sy'n cael eu hyfforddi i addysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

referring to the way in which he sees the current pattern changing, possibly, in light of the implications of Donaldson. What are your feelings regarding the capacity of the field of education to get involved with Donaldson, bearing in mind how much criticism there's been regarding the way Welsh is taught as a second language? Of course, these WESPs talk about Welsh as a second language within each county, as well. What is your response? Are you included in these discussions about Donaldson?

Ms Huws: We provided written evidence and we gave oral evidence to the Donaldson inquiry. We had a positive response to what we submitted and our evidence was welcomed, and we are comfortable with many of the recommendations emerging from Donaldson in terms of the Welsh language.

As for how they are implemented, then, the high-level statements emerging from Donaldson are positive, but achieving those on the ground will be the challenge. One thing that worries me in seeing Donaldson—although it is very strong in certain elements, like the response—is that a period of time will elapse before Donaldson is implemented. It's these Welsh in education strategic plans that we have at the moment and the Welsh-medium education strategy that we have—that's where we should be focusing our efforts over the next three years, five years, as Donaldson actually starts to see the light of day. So, I do worry about seeing Donaldson as the solution to everything, and that we can take things more slowly and maybe not place as much emphasis on what we have at the moment, namely the Welsh Government's strategy and the local plans. Now is the time to act on these, or trying to implement what Donaldson suggests will mean that we miss out on three, if not five, years.

Aled Roberts: In terms of the way Donaldson dovetails with the Government's other policies, including the WESPs and the Welsh-medium education strategy, is there enough planning for, say, the number of teachers who are being trained to teach through the medium of Welsh?

[231] **Ms Huws:** Mae yna waith yn cael ei wneud gan y Llywodraeth ar hynny ar hyn o bryd. **Ms Huws:** There is work under way by the Government on that at present.

[232] **Aled Roberts:** A ydych chi'n bwydo i mewn i hynny o gwbl? **Aled Roberts:** Do you have any input into that at all?

[233] **Ms Huws:** Rŷm ni'n bwydo i mewn i'r ymgynghoriadau i gyd, ydyn. Rŷm ni yn sicrhau bod ein llais ni'n cael ei glywed, ac mae'r math yma o fater yn cael ei godi gyda'r Gweinidog. Mae cynllunio'r gweithlu addysg i'r dyfodol yn holl, hollbwysig. Mae'n hollol bwysig. Ochr yn ochr â'r byd iechyd, byddwn i'n dweud mai dyma un o'r pethau pwysicaf sydd angen ei gynllunio ar ei gyfer am y 10 mlynedd nesaf. **Ms Huws:** We have an input into all the consultations, yes. We do make sure that our voice is heard, and this kind of issue gets raised with the Minister. Workforce planning for the future in education is extremely important. It's vitally important. Alongside the field of health, I would say that this is one of the most important things that we need to plan for, for the next 10 years.

[234] **Aled Roberts:** Ocê. Rwy'n mynd i gael fy hun i mewn i helynt rŵan, achos rwy'n mynd i ddyfynnu rhywun arall sydd wedi fy e-bostio i— **Aled Roberts:** Okay. I'm going to get myself into trouble now, because I'm going to quote someone else who's e-mailed me—

[235] **Simon Thomas:** O Wrecsam? **Simon Thomas:** From Wrexham? *[Chwerthin.]* *[Laughter.]*

[236] **Aled Roberts:** Roeddech chi'n dweud, rwy'n meddwl, ei bod hi'n rhy gynnar i ddweud bod yna fethiant. Rwy'n mynd i awgrymu bod yna fethiant yn barod, i ddweud y gwir. Rwyf wedi dyfynnu un fam o gefndir Cymraeg sydd wedi cael ei gwrthod. Rwyf am ddyfynnu dynes arall: **Aled Roberts:** I think you said that it was too early to suggest that there has been a failure. I'm going to suggest that there have already been failings. I've already quoted one mother from a Welsh-speaking background who was refused a place. Now I'm going to quote another woman:

[237] 'My three year old daughter's application for a nursery place at both Bro Alun and Plas Coch has been rejected.... I am disgusted and angry with this situation and feel that we have been let down by a system that up until now has seemed supportive of parents bringing children up bilingually.'

[238] 'Before my daughters even existed my husband and I knew that we wanted Welsh language education for our children. He went to a Welsh language school as a child and I knew what it was like to only speak English despite my maternal family being first language Welsh. I wanted to "pass on the gift of Welsh", almost to right a wrong in my own childhood. I know how hard it is to learn Welsh from just the Welsh lessons in school and that it'll never make a pupil a fluent speaker.'

[239] 'We may be one of the families who have "now accepted a place in an English medium school" but be under no illusion - this was not a CHOICE!'

[240] Rwy'n mynd i awgrymu bod pob un ohonom sy'n eistedd yma heddiw yn delio efo sefyllfa lle'r ydym ni yn methu. **I'm going to suggest that each and every one of us sitting here today is dealing with a situation where we are failing.**

[241] **Ms Huws:** A gaf i ymateb drwy **Ms Huws:** May I respond by saying that, to

ddweud, i fi, fod methiant yn ddiwedd y daith? Beth rŷm ni'n ei weld ar hyn o bryd yw gwendidau difrifol yn ymddangos mewn dyddiau cynnar. Nawr, mae eisiau inni gamu i mewn i sicrhau nad methiant fydd hyn. Os byddwn ni wedi cyrraedd methiant, mae'n ddiwedd y daith. Beth sydd fan hyn yw gwendidau difrifol yn dechrau amlygu a'r angen i gamu i mewn nawr, yn gryf ac yn rymus, i sicrhau nad ydym ni'n adeiladu methiant ar fethiant, gwendidau ar wendidau.

11:45

[242] **Ann Jones:** You can smile at me, but— Simon first, and then Keith.

[243] **Simon Thomas:** Jest ar y pwynt yna *really*, achos dyna pam, wrth gwrs, rŷm ni'n cynnal yr ymchwiliad yma: i geisio dylanwadu ar y broses yna. Rwy'n rhannu'r pryderon ynglŷn ag unrhyw oedi sy'n digwydd gyda'r peth statudol sydd gyda ni nawr er mwyn gwireddu Donaldson—er rwy'n rhagweld, fel yr ydych chithau, fod y pethau uwch yn Donaldson yn bositif iawn ynglŷn â'r continwwm iaith ac ati. Yn benodol, gan fod y cynlluniau strategol yn ymwneud â Chymraeg ail iaith hefyd, ble ŷch chi'n gweld argymhellion Sioned Davies ar hyn o bryd, achos roeddem ni wedi bod yn aros i'r rheini gael eu gweithredu, efallai drwy'r cynlluniau strategol yma? Gohiriwyd ar gyfer Donaldson. Mae Donaldson nawr wedi adrodd ers rhai misoedd, ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedi derbyn. A ydych chi nawr fel comisiynydd yn ymwneud â phwyso am yr argymhellion yma ac, yn bellach, beth ydych chi'n rhagweld yn digwydd y tu fewn i'r cynlluniau strategol i wireddu argymhellion adroddiad Sioned Davies?

[244] **Ms Huws:** Mae'r ddarpariaeth ail iaith wedi bod o gonsŷm i ni, fel y mae wedi bod i nifer o bobl eraill, ers rhai blynnyddoedd nawr. Mi gafodd adroddiad Sioned Davies, neu'r ymateb, ei ohirio tan fod Donaldson yn adrodd, ac fel rŷch chi'n ei ddweud, mae yna elfennau positif iawn fan hyn. Ond eto, mae'r drafodaeth ynglŷn a darpariaeth Cymraeg ail iaith a darpariaeth dwyieithog, fel y mae Sioned wedi cyfeirio ati, yn faterion rŷm ni yn eu codi gyda'r

me, failure is the end of the line? What we're seeing at the moment are serious weaknesses appearing in the early days. Now, we need to step in to ensure that this is not a failure. If we've reached a position of failure, it's the end of the road. What we have here are serious weaknesses starting to emerge, with the need to step in now, strongly and robustly, to ensure that we're not building failure upon failure, or weaknesses upon weaknesses.

Simon Thomas: Just on that point really, because that's why we're carrying out this inquiry: to try to influence that process. I share the concerns regarding any delay that's happening with the statutory things we have now in order to implement Donaldson—although I foresee, as do you, that the higher-level things in Donaldson are very positive regarding the linguistic continuum, and so on. Specifically, given that the strategic plans relate to Welsh as a second language as well, where do you see Sioned Davies's recommendations at the moment, because we had been waiting for those to be implemented, perhaps through the WESPs? There was a delay because of Donaldson. Donaldson has now reported some months hence, and the Government has accepted. Are you now, as commissioner, involved in pressing for the implementation of these recommendations, and further to that, what do you foresee happening within the WESPs to implement the Sioned Davies report's recommendations?

Ms Huws: The second language provision has been of concern to us, as it has for many others, for a number of years now. The Sioned Davies report, or the response to it, was delayed until Donaldson had reported, and as you say, there are very positive elements there. But, again, the debate on the provision of Welsh as a second language and bilingual provision, as Sioned has referred to it, are issues that we are raising with the Minister now.

Gweinidog nawr.

[245] **Simon Thomas:** Diolch.

Simon Thomas: Thank you.

[246] **Keith Davies:** Wel, mae problem gyda ni fanna, rwy'n credu—nifer yr athrawon sydd â'r gallu i ddysgu Cymraeg yn yr ysgolion cyfun yn enwedig. Ond y cwestiwn a oedd gyda fi, yn dilyn beth yr oedd Aled yn sôn amdano'n gynharach, oedd am dalgylchoedd. A ydy pob rhan o Gymru mewn dalgylch ysgol Gymraeg neu beidio? Y rheswm efallai eu bod nhw wedi dweud hynny wrth y fam yna oedd am nad oedd hi mewn dalgylch ysgol Gymraeg, nid wy'n gwybod.

Keith Davies: Well, we have a problem there, I think—the number of teachers who have the ability to teach through the medium of Welsh, particularly in our secondary schools. But, the question I had, following on from what Aled was talking about earlier, was regarding catchment areas. Is every part of Wales in the catchment area of a Welsh-medium school? Perhaps the reason they told that mother what they did is because she's not in the catchment area for a Welsh-medium school, I don't know.

[247] **Aled Roberts:** Na, roedd hi'n byw—

Aled Roberts: No, she lived—

[248] **Ann Jones:** We can't discuss this case across the table. Come on, please.

[249] **Keith Davies:** Na—ond dalgylchoedd, chi'n gwybod? Rwy'n gwybod am frwydrau sydd wedi bod lle mae ysgol ddwyieithog ac ysgol Gymraeg, ac mae'r rhieni sydd mewn dalgylch ysgol ddwyieithog yn moyn mynd i'r ysgol Gymraeg, ac mae'r cyngor sir yn dweud 'na', ac yn y blaen. A ydy hwn yn codi yn aml gyda chi neu beidio?

Keith Davies: No—but catchment areas, you know? I know about battles that have been fought where there's a bilingual school and a Welsh-medium school, and the parents in the catchment for a bilingual school want Welsh-medium education, and the council says 'no', and so forth. So, do you have these sort of complaints?

[250] **Ms Huws:** A ydym ni'n cael cwynion drwyddo am y fath yna o faterion?

Ms Huws: Do we receive complaints about those kinds of issues?

[251] **Mr Sion:** Ydyn. Hynny ydy, rydym ni yn derbyn ymholiadau, cwynion ynglŷn â nifer o faterion gwahanol ar lefel leol, ac rydym ni yn ceisio delio efo'r materion hynny yn unigol. Un peth arall rydym ni'n ceisio ei wneud hefyd ydy, rydym ni wedi llythyr efo'r Gweinidog yn ddiweddar, a beth rydym ni wedi'i wneud ydy defnyddio enghreifftiau lleol lle mae yna broblemau er mwyn codi, efallai, bwynt mwy strategol wedyn efo'r Gweinidog. Mae yna sawl achos lleol wedi bod yn ddiweddar—Wrecsam yn un—lle rydym ni'n defnyddio problem leol er mwyn codi rhywbeth mwy strategol efo'r Gweinidog. Wedyn, dyna sut rydym ni'n ceisio delio efo ymholiadau lleol sy'n ein cyrraedd ni.

Mr Sion: Yes. We do receive enquiries and complaints about a number of different issues at a local level, and we do try and deal with those issues on their merits. Another thing that we are endeavouring to do as well is, we have corresponded with the Minister recently, and what we have done is we've used local examples of where problems arise in order to raise a more strategic point with the Minister, perhaps. There have been a number of cases at a local level recently—Wrexham being just one—where we use a local problem in order to raise a more strategic issue with the Minister. So, that's how we're trying to deal with these enquiries at a local level that reach us.

[252] **Ann Jones:** I think it's around the categorisation of schools and, I think, we should write to the Minister and ask for some clarification, because we didn't get into asking him

that when he appeared. So, if we have some clarification, then perhaps that might assist Aled. I don't know why I want to help Aled's casework, but there we are. I will do that. We've run out of time. Can I thank you very much for coming today? We'll send you copies of the transcript to check for accuracy, so we haven't put any words in your mouth, and then we'll be able to publish it as part of our report. So, thanks very much. It's been great. Thank you.

[253] **Ms Huws:** Ac a gaf i ddiolch i chi am eich cwestiynu? Mae hwn yn fater aruthrol o bwysig. Mae'r cynlluniau yma â photensial, ond rwy'n falch iawn eich bod chi'n edrych ar y mater. Mae eisiau inni gymryd camau nawr i sicrhau eu bod nhw'n gweithio.

Ms Huws: And may I thank you for your questioning? This is a hugely important issue. These plans do have potential, but I'm very pleased that you are looking at this issue. We do need to take some steps now to ensure that they work.

[254] **Ann Jones:** Diolch. Thanks very much.

11:49

Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to Note

[255] **Ann Jones:** We're to note a paper that came, which is part of the inquiry into supply teaching. It's a letter from the Welsh Government to the Chair of public accounts, which has been shared with us. So, can we note that?

11:49

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42(ix) i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o Weddill y Cyfarfod Motion under Standing Order 17.42 (ix) to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting for the Remainder of the Meeting

Cynnig:

bod y pwyllgor yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.42(ix).

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.
Motion moved.*

Motion:

that the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order 17.42(ix).

[256] **Ann Jones:** Then, if everybody's happy, can we move, under Standing Order 17.42, into private for the rest of the meeting? Okay? Thank you very much.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 11:50.
The public part of the meeting ended at 11:50.*