



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru** **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Chynaliadwyedd** **The Environment and Sustainability Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 26 Mawrth 2015**  
**Thursday, 26 March 2015**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

[Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon](#)  
[Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions](#)

[Bil Cynllunio \(Cymru\): Cyfnod 2—Trafod y Gwelliannau](#)  
[Planning \(Wales\) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments](#)

[Grŵp 17: Gorfodi ac Apelio \(Gwelliannau 74, 75, 76, 77, 79 ac 80\)](#)  
[Group 17: Enforcement and Appeal \(Amendments 74, 75, 76, 77, 79 and 80\)](#)

[Grŵp 18: Meysydd Tref a Phentref \(Gwelliannau 57, 116, 19, 20, 21, 22 a 56\)](#)  
[Group 18: Town and Village Greens \(Amendments 57, 116, 19, 20, 21, 22 and 56\)](#)

[Grŵp 19: Paneli Cynllunio Strategol \(Gwelliannau 194, 195, 196, 197, 58, 59, 81, 5, 6, 82, 198, 199, 200, 201, 7, 8, 9, 60, 10, 202, 203, 204, 205, 118 ac 119\)](#)  
[Group 19: Strategic Planning Panels \(Amendments 194, 195, 196, 197, 58, 59, 81, 5, 6, 82, 198, 199, 200, 201, 7, 8, 9, 60, 10, 202, 203, 204, 205, 118 and 119\)](#)

[Y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol: Sesiwn Craffu Ariannol](#)  
[The Minister for Natural Resources: Financial Scrutiny Session](#)

[Papurau i'w Nodi](#)  
[Papers to Note](#)

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir trawsgrifiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.  
In addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

**Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol**  
**Committee members in attendance**

Paul Davies	(yn dirprwyo ar ran Antoinette Sandbach) (substitute for Antoinette Sandbach)
Russell George	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Llyr Gruffydd	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Jeff Cuthbert	Llafur Labour
Alun Ffred Jones	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour
William Powell	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Jenny Rathbone	Llafur Labour
David Rees	Llafur (yn dirprwyo ar ran Mick Antoniw) Labour (substitute for Mick Antoniw)
Joyce Watson	Llafur Labour

**Eraill yn bresennol**  
**Others in attendance**

Tony Clark	Pennaeth Cyllid, Cyfoeth Naturiol a Bwyd, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of Finance, Natural Resources and Food, Welsh Government
Sarah Dawson	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol, Llywodraeth Cymru Legal Adviser, Welsh Government
Neil Hemington	Prif Swyddog Cynllunio, Llywodraeth Cymru Chief Planning Officer, Welsh Government
Matthew Quinn	Cyfarwyddwr, yr Amgylchedd a Datblygu Cynaliadwy, Llywodraeth Cymru Director, Environment and Sustainable Development, Welsh Government
Graham Rees	Dirprwy Gyfarwyddwr, y Môr a Physgodfeydd, Llywodraeth Cymru Deputy Director, Marine and Fisheries, Welsh Government
Carl Sargeant	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol) Assembly Member, Labour (the Minister for Natural Resources)

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Alun Davidson	Clerc Clerc
Peter Hill	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Catherine Hunt	Ail Glerc Second Clerk
Martin Jennings	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service
Lisa Salkeld	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Nia Seaton	Y Gwasanaeth Ymchwil Research Service

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 09:31.*  
*The meeting began at 09:31.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gaf eich croesawu chi i'r pwyllgor yma? Rydych yn gwybod y rheolau: os bydd yna larwm tân, dilynwch yr ystlyswyr allan. Pawb i ddiffodd eu ffonau symudol, eu galwyr a'u BlackBerrys.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I welcome you all to the committee. You all know the rules: if there is a fire alarm, then please follow the instructions of the ushers. Everyone should switch off their mobile phones, BlackBerrys and pagers.

[2] Rydym yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog. Cewch siarad yn Gymraeg neu yn Saesneg wrth gwrs. Peidiwch â chyffwrdd y botymau. A oes unrhyw Aelod eisiau datgan buddiant o dan Reol Sefydlog 2.6? Na. Rydym wedi cael ymddiheuriad gan Mick Antoniwi, ac y mae David Rees yn dirprwyo; croeso i David. A hefyd, mae Paul Davies yma yn lle Antoinette Sandbach oherwydd amgylchiadau arbennig.

We operate bilingually. You're welcome to speak in English or in Welsh. You don't need to touch the buttons on the microphones. Does any Member have a declaration of interest under Standing Order 2.6? No. We've received apologies from Mick Antoniwi, and David Rees is substituting; welcome to David. We also have Paul Davies substituting for Antoinette Sandbach because of special circumstances.

09:32

**Bil Cynllunio (Cymru): Cyfnod 2—Trafod y Gwelliannau**  
**Planning (Wales) Bill: Stage 2—Consideration of Amendments**

**Grŵp 17: Gorfodi ac Apelio (Gwelliannau 74, 75, 76, 77, 79 ac 80)**  
**Group 17: Enforcement and Appeal (Amendments 74, 75, 76, 77, 79 and 80)**

[3] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Croesawaf y Gweinidog y bore yma atom ni i ni gael cwblhau'r gwaith ar Fil Cynllunio (Cymru)—yr ail gyfnod. Rydym yn dechrau gyda gwelliannau yn grŵp 17. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 74 yn enw William

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I welcome the Minister here this morning so that we can complete our work on the Planning (Wales) Bill—that is, Stage 2 proceedings. We will kick off with amendments in group 17. The lead amendment in the group is amendment 74 in

Powell a galwaf ar William i gynnig the name of William Powell and I call on  
gwelliant 74. William Powell to move amendment 74.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 74 (William Powell).  
Amendment 74 (William Powell) moved.*

[4] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd, **William Powell:** Thank you, Chair, and  
a bore da, bawb. good morning, everyone.

[5] I speak to all the amendments in this group and would first like to explain, in brief, amendments 74 to 77. Section 42 of the Bill in its current form prevents amendments to an appeal being submitted, once a notice of an appeal has actually been served, even if those amendments were to make the scheme acceptable. As was reflected in our committee report, it seems that this change in process would inadvertently remove a sensible level of flexibility when it comes to the consideration of a minor variation in an application after an appeal notice. As we heard in our evidence session from the Law Society, in order to avoid the entire application process having to start all over again from square one, with the associated loss of valuable time in these situations, we believe that we should allow the inspectorate, with the agreement of the parties, to return to an application that has been refused and to return for amendment, for re-consultation and, indeed, for redetermination by the local planning authority in each particular case. These amendments seek to address this and also to rebalance the process in favour of avoiding unnecessary bureaucracy and time wasting and also avoiding a system that is potentially too rigid.

[6] I also speak to amendments 79 and 80 in this group. These seek to address the important issue of setting a minimum time limit for responding to a request for information, resulting from appeals and call-ins and, indeed, direct applications. I know that the current system does allow for the whole system to be held up with appellants waiting for, sometimes, unacceptably long periods of time before eliciting a response—there is certainly a great deal of casework that I come across, and I'm sure colleagues around the table will also have the same experience. Concern has previously been expressed to us that there was no reference to time limits within the original Bill, and I feel that it's important therefore to bring forward these significant amendments today. By inserting time limits into the Bill, we can ensure that due process is followed and that the rights of the individual to have timely access to the information that they need are duly protected. I'm grateful.

[7] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, William.  
William. A oes Aelod arall yn dymuno Does any other Member wish to speak? Does  
siarad? A oes rhywun arall eisiau cyfrannu? anyone else want to contribute? No. I'll ask  
Na. A gaf i ofyn i'r Gweinidog os ydy o the Minister therefore if he wants to respond.  
eisiau ymateb?

[8] **The Minister for Natural Resources (Carl Sargeant):** Thank you, Chair. I listened carefully to William's contribution and have had previous discussions with the Member. I am keen to support amendments 45, 44—. Sorry, 74, 75, 76 and 77—I was doing them backwards there, Chair, at that point.

[9] **Alun Ffred Jones:** It's understandable.

[10] **Carl Sargeant:** I am keen to support them, but I will not be seeking to support 79 and 80 in this group under the same name. I think the issue for me on 79 and 80 is that they require the timescale of an eight-week process to be applied as a minimum timescale. I think generalising on the timescale of this may present difficulty in determining applications in the longer term. It doesn't give enough flexibility within the system to be attributed to proper decision making, and therefore we won't be seeking to support the eight-week minimum

timescale. But the rest of the amendments in the group we would be happy to support.

[11] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you. William? William?

[12] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'm grateful to the Minister for coming to meet the bulk of these amendments, and that is positive. There's some disappointment that he can't go far as 79 and 80, but I respect the views that you've expressed and I'd like to see them tested here at committee. Diolch yn fawr.

[13] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William, a ydych chi'n dymuno symud i William, do you wish to move to a vote on bleidlais ar welliant 74? amendment 74?

[14] **William Powell:** Move.

[15] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 74? Unrhyw amendment 74 be agreed. Does any Member wrthwynebiad? Na. Os felly, derbyniwyd object? No. Therefore, amendment 74 is gwelliant 74. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 74 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 74 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[16] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 75? move amendment 75?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 75 (William Powell).  
Amendment 75 (William Powell) moved.*

[17] **William Powell:** Move.

[18] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 75? Unrhyw amendment 75 be agreed. Does any Member wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, mae gwelliant 75 object? No. Amendment 75 is agreed. wedi ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 75 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 75 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[19] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to gwelliant 76? move amendment 76?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 76 (William Powell).  
Amendment 76 (William Powell) moved.*

[20] **William Powell:** Move, Chair.

[21] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 76? Unrhyw amendment 76 be agreed. Does any Member wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, derbyniwyd object? No. Therefore, amendment 76 is gwelliant 76. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 76 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 76 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[22] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 77? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 77?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 77 (William Powell).  
Amendment 77 (William Powell) moved.*

[23] **William Powell:** Move.

[24] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 77? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Na. Felly, derbyniwyd gwelliant 77. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 77 be agreed. Does any Member object? No. Therefore, amendment 77 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 77 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 77 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[25] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 78. **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 78?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 78 (William Powell).  
Amendment 78 (William Powell) moved.*

[26] **William Powell:** Move.

[27] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 78, bydd gwelliannau 115 ac 191 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 78? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Felly, rydym yn symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 78 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae hwnnw'n syrthio. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 78. **Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 78 is agreed, amendments 115 and 191 will fall. The question is that amendment 78 be agreed. Does any Member object? [Objection.] We'll therefore move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 78, please indicate. And all those against. That amendment therefore falls. Therefore, amendment 78 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 78: O blaid 1, Yn erbyn 8, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 78: For 1, Against 8, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 78.  
Amendment 78 not agreed.*

[28] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 115? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 115?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 115 (Russell George).*

*Amendment 115 (Russell George) moved.*

[29] **Russell George:** Move.

[30] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 115, bydd gwelliant 191 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 115? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Felly, awn i bleidlais ar honno. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 115 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r gwelliant yna yn methu. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 115.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 115 is agreed, amendment 191 will fall. The question is that amendment 115 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 115, please indicate. And those against. Therefore, that amendment falls. Therefore, amendment 115 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 115: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 115: For 2, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 115.  
Amendment 115 not agreed.*

[31] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 191?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 191?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 191 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 191 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[32] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Ydw.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[33] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 191? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. A wnewch chi ddangos os ydych o blaid gwelliant 191? Ac yn erbyn, pump. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 191.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 191 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. Please indicate if you are in favour of amendment 191. And those against, five. As there is a tied vote, I'll use my casting vote in the negative and, therefore, amendment 191 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 191: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 191: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David

Powell, William

Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 191.*

*Amendment 191 not agreed.*

[34] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 79? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 79?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 79 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 79 (William Powell) moved.*

[35] **William Powell:** Move.

[36] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 79? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Felly, pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 79 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda—pump. Ac yn erbyn, pump. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal a'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd 79. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 79 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. Therefore, all those in favour of amendment 79 please indicate—five. And those against, five. There is a tied vote and I use the casting vote in the negative, so amendment 79 falls.

*Gwelliant 79: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 79: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 79.*

*Amendment 79 not agreed.*

[37] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, gwelliant 80? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 80?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 80 (William Powell).*

*Amendment 80 (William Powell) moved.*

[38] **William Powell:** Move.

[39] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 80? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 80 i ddangos os gwelwch yn dda—pump. Yn erbyn, pump. Pleidlais gyfartal a'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 80.

amendment 80 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote therefore. All those in favour of amendment 80 please indicate—five. And those against—five. There is a tied vote and the casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, amendment 80 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 80: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 80: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 80.  
Amendment 80 not agreed.*

**Grŵp 18: Meysydd Tref a Phentref (Gwelliannau 57, 116, 19, 20, 21, 22 a 56)  
Group 18: Town and Village Greens (Amendments 57, 116, 19, 20, 21, 22 and 56)**

[40] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn ymlaen felly i grŵp 18, meysydd tref a phentref. Y prif welliant yw gwelliant 57 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 57 a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i siarad i'w welliannau a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We move on therefore to group 18, town and village greens. The lead amendment is amendment 57 in the name of the Minister. I move amendment 57 and call on the Minister to speak to his amendments and the other amendments in this group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 57 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[41] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I'm seeking support for all the Government amendments in my name and not supporting the amendment in the name of Russell George. The Government amendments in this group address the concerns of this committee in providing a means of striking a better balance, we believe, between protecting high-quality green space, valued by local communities, and enabling the right development to occur in the right place at the time. I gave this committee a commitment to bring forward an amendment to prohibit an application to register a town and village green only where planning permission for development is granted or deemed to be granted under the Town and Country Planning Act 1990, and a local development order granting planning permission for operational development of the land under the Act as adopted by the local planning authority, or as an order granting development consent in relation to such land is made under the Planning Act 2008.

[42] This amendment is also supported by the Open Spaces Society. This amendment recognises the importance of the person's right to register land as a town and village green,

and draws a line where sufficient opportunity to exercise the right has been provided, as well as providing certainty for businesses, individuals and communities. Amendment 57 addresses the committee's concerns over time for communities to rally together to make an application to register land as a town and village green, and the overall effect of this amendment is to retain the status quo so that the relevant period remains a two-year timescale. Amendment 56 is consequential on 57 and the amendment ensures the overview section correctly reflects the provisions in the Bill.

[43] I ask Members not to support Russell George's amendment 116, although it does address the recommendation of this committee. In my letter of 26 February, I did outline why I did not propose to amend section 50. Whilst it's not the intention at present to charge fees to register town or village greens, the proposal is in order to futureproof the process should circumstances change and a fee is considered necessary and appropriate at that time. I ask you to move in my name, Chair.

[44] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Russell i siarad. Russell to speak.

[45] **Russell George:** Thanks, Chair. I would like to formally move amendment 116 within the group. It is quite a straightforward amendment that looks to uphold recommendation 42, made at Stage 1. We are legislating to change the planning system now, and there's only so much that can reasonably be futureproofed for a piece of legislation. And if the Minister has no intention of charging fees for applications to amend now, then it shouldn't be on the face of the Bill, and therefore should be removed.

[46] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. A oes unrhyw Aelod arall eisiau siarad? Oes. Are there any other Members who wish to speak? Yes. Julie Morgan, then Llyr. Julie Morgan, wedyn Llyr.

[47] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you, Chair. I'm speaking in support of the Minister's amendments, in particular the amendment that the registering of land will remain at two years. I feel, from personal experience of people seeking to register a town or village green, that they have needed that period in order to trace back to people who have used it over a 20-year period. I'm very glad now that the two years will be retained, and I support the Minister's other amendments.

[48] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Llyr. Llyr.

09:45

[49] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Nid wyf ond yn awyddus i gofnodi'n ffurfiol fy nghefnogaeth i welliant 57 yn benodol. Fe fyddaf yn cefnogi holl welliannau'r grŵp, ond yn enwedig 57. Rwy'n diolch i'r Gweinidog am ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r dystiolaeth rŷm ni wedi'i chael fel pwyllgor, a hefyd i'r ohebiaeth rwy'n siŵr bod nifer fawr ohonom wedi ei chael ar y mater hwn, sy'n adlewyrchu pa mor gryf, rwy'n meddwl, y mae cymunedau'n teimlo ynglŷn â'u meysydd gwyrdd mewn trefi a phentrefi. Mae dim ond yn deg, yn fy marn i, fod y Llywodraeth yn amddiffyn yr amser sydd **Llyr Gruffydd:** I'm just eager to formally note my support for amendment 57 specifically. I will be supporting all amendments in the group, but particularly 57. I thank the Minister for responding positively to the evidence that we as a committee have received, and also to the correspondence I'm sure that many of us have received on this issue, which reflects how strongly communities feel, I think, about their green spaces in towns and villages. It's only fair, in my opinion, that the Government should protect the time that they have to respond to any threat to those greens.

ganddyn nhw i ymateb i unrhyw fygythiad i'r ardaloedd hynny.

[50] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Joyce Watson.

[51] **Joyce Watson:** Thank you, Chair. I want to speak in support of the Government amendments, but particularly amendment 57. It is the case that we're talking about small local groups trying to prove their case in very many instances, where they don't have at their fingertips, necessarily, the expertise required to move very quickly, and a year would be very quick. So, I welcome the status quo, which is two years, and I thank the Minister for listening to us when we made those representations.

[52] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. William.

[53] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'd also like to support amendment 57. I think we found the Minister in listening mode on this issue and this is encouraging, because of the evident pressure that there is out there in communities across Wales. Also, I hope that the indication that we've got from the Minister will also give us some cause for optimism with regard to the issues that we discussed last week with regard to the third party right of appeal, because I think there is some common area of interest in terms of those smaller and less robust groups having an opportunity to have a voice, and maybe that can be revisited at the next stage. Thank you very much.

[54] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, William. Y Gweinidog i ymateb. **William.** The Minister to reply.

[55] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. Again, we're trying to build consensus around this Bill, as you can clearly see. I'm grateful for the comments made by Members regarding, particularly, amendment 57. Unfortunately, the consensus can't exist on amendment 116, as alluded to earlier in my letter, and that is consistent with my view today. It isn't my intention to introduce charges, but it is about futureproofing the Bill and we believe this is the correct vehicle to do this through. I'd ask you to formally move my amendments.

[56] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Mae gwelliant 57 wedi'i gynnig, felly y Amendment 57 has been moved, therefore cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 57? the questions is that amendment 57 be Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim agreed. Does any Member object? No gwrthwynebiad, felly derbyniwyd gwelliant objections, therefore amendment 57 is 57. agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 57 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 57 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[57] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 116?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 116 (Russell George).  
Amendment 116 (Russell George) moved.*

[58] **Russell George:** Move.

[59] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 116? Unrhyw amendment 116 be agreed. Does any

wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Os ydych o blaid gwelliant 116, dangoswch hynny. Ac yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais yn gyfartal. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 116.

Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 116, please indicate. And all those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 116 falls.

*Gwelliant 116: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 116: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 116.  
Amendment 116 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 41 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 41 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[60] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 41 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 41? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 41.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 41 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 41 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 41 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 41 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 41 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[61] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 192?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 192?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 192 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 192 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[62] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[63] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 192? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais, felly. Pawb i ddangos o blaid gwelliant 192—pump. Yn erbyn. Pump yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 192.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 192 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of 192, please indicate—five. All those against. Five against. I use the casting vote in the negative, therefore amendment 192 falls.

*Gwelliant 192: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 192: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 192.  
Amendment 192 not agreed.*

[64] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 193.  
193.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 193 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 193 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[65] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

[66] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[67] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 193 i ddangos trwy godi dwylo. Yn erbyn. Pump o blaid. Pump yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 193.

[68] **Alun Ffred Jones:** We move to a vote. The question is that amendment 193 be agreed. All those in favour. And those against. Five in favour. Five against. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 193 falls.

*Gwelliant 193: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 193: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 193.  
Amendment 193 not agreed.*

[69] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 117? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 117?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 117 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 117 (Russell George) moved.*

[70] **Russell George:** Move.

[71] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 117? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 117 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Pump o blaid. Pump yn erbyn. Mae'r bleidlais fwrw yn negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 117.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 117 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I'll therefore move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 117, please indicate. And those against. Five in favour. Five against. The casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, amendment 117 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 117: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 117: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 117.*  
*Amendment 117 not agreed.*

[72] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, amendment 86. gwelliant 86.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 86 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 86 (Russell George) moved.*

[73] **Russell George:** Move.

[74] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 86? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symudwn i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 86 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Dau. Ac yn erbyn. Mwy na dau. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 86.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 86 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 86, please indicate. Two. All those against. More than two. Therefore, amendment 86 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 86: O blaid 2, Yn erbyn 7, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 86: For 2, Against 7, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Morgan, Julie  
Powell, William  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 86.  
Amendment 86 not agreed.*

**Grŵp 19: Paneli Cynllunio Strategol (Gwelliannau 194, 195, 196, 197, 58, 59, 81, 5, 6, 82, 198, 199, 200, 201, 7, 8, 9, 60, 10, 202, 203, 204, 205, 118 ac 119)**

**Group 19: Strategic Planning Panels (Amendments 194, 195, 196, 197, 58, 59, 81, 5, 6, 82, 198, 199, 200, 201, 7, 8, 9, 60, 10, 202, 203, 204, 205, 118 and 119)**

[75] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symudwn i grŵp 19, paneli cynllunio strategol. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp yw gwelliant 194 yn enw Llyr Gruffydd. Galwaf ar Llyr i gynnig gwelliant 194 ac i siarad am ei welliant a'r gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

[76] **Alun Ffred Jones:** We'll move now to group 19, strategic planning panels. The lead amendment in this group is amendment 194 in the name of Llyr Gruffydd. I call on Llyr to move amendment 194 and to speak to his amendment and other amendments in the group.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 194 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 194 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[77] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I'll be speaking to amendments 194 through to 205, and I'll be voting for all the amendments in this group, with the exception of amendments 5 and 6.

[78] The first amendment in this group, 194, seeks to remove all reference to nominated members of strategic planning panels. Now, the creation of the panels in the first place, in my view, represents a shifting of power away from a more localised community level, but including unelected members on those panels, in my view, not only takes power further away, but it puts it in the hands of people who are unaccountable, of course; whereas currently, all those decisions that are being made within the planning system are made by those who are democratically accountable. So, the amendment is pretty clear in its intention, and amendments 198, 199, 200 and 201 are consequential amendments to 194.

[79] The remaining amendments are tabled in the event of my lead amendment falling, in order to improve the existing section within the Bill on the strategic planning panels. Amendments 194 and 196 will increase the proportion of local planning authority members on the strategic planning panels from two thirds to four fifths; again, to strengthen the democratic representation within those panels.

[80] Amendment 197 will ensure that at least two persons are nominated from each constituent planning authority, increasing it from the one person that's currently proposed in the Bill, as introduced, again, in order to ensure a diversity of views from each authority, or at least a diversity of voices around that table.

[81] Amendment 202 seeks to give the public speaking rights at meetings of the panels, so that the public can have a more direct involvement and a stronger influence over some of the decisions that are being made. If the Government is to create a new tier in the planning process, then I believe it's vital that we increase public participation, and that's obviously the aim of that particular amendment. In the same vein, amendment 203 forces the strategic

planning panel to discuss the annual report at a meeting that is open to the public, and in which the public should be allowed to speak in an effort to ensure transparency and, again, encourage public participation at that particular level of planning.

[82] Amendment 204 removes the rights of strategic planning panels to hold property. For me, as you can gather, I'm sure, there are questions about the accountability of these panels, and I don't believe that they should be allowed to own property that is rightly held by local government—democratically elected local government. Strategic planning panels are a new construct that clearly does not, I believe, reflect that democratic accountability that should be much strengthened in terms of the proposals that are before us.

[83] Amendment 205 will ensure that all members of the panels are required to adhere to the same code of conduct as elected members, as set out in the Local Government Act 2000. For me, that's an absolute minimum in terms of accountability.

[84] I'll be voting against amendments 5 and 6 from the Minister. Amendment 6, to which amendment 5 is consequential, would remove the restriction on the strategic planning panels to choose nominated members to form part of the panel from a list published by Welsh Ministers. Allowing panels to nominate anyone they like is of concern to me, and I'd be slightly more reassured if there was at least a list that could be approved by the Assembly, ideally, or at least published for the public to be able to see.

[85] Now, I will be, as well, supporting Government amendments 58 and 59 for a minimum of 40 per cent local planning authority women members on a panel, although I can't understand why you've gone for 40 per cent. I would have preferred 50 per cent. If that is pursued, I will probably be looking to amend that at Stage 3.

[86] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Llyr. Galwaf ar William Powell i siarad. Llyr. I call on William Powell to speak.

[87] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. I speak to no amendment as such within this group, but Chair, if it's in order I'd like to contribute briefly to the wider discussion, because this is the final opportunity to do so, with regard to the issues pertaining to national parks that we looked at the very end of the last session. Would that be in order?

[88] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I don't think so. I think you should speak to the—

[89] **William Powell:** If this isn't the appropriate opportunity, then I shall refrain from commenting other than to say that I support the broad thrust of the amendments brought forward by Llyr Gruffydd, which I consider to provide some important safeguards.

[90] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right; thank you, William.

[91] Russell i siarad. Russell to speak.

[92] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments—

[93] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sorry, are you—

[94] **Jenny Rathbone:** I wish to speak subsequently, but I'm waiting—

[95] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Oh, yes. Hold on a second. Curb your enthusiasm. Russell George.

[96] **Russell George:** Thank you, Chair. I move amendments 118 and 119 within the

group. Whilst I don't agree with the concept of a strategic development planning tier, as I have spoken to previously, I think it's important that relevant sections of the Bill are strengthened, if the will of the committee at Stage 2 is to proceed with them. These are, in effect, technical tweaks to check ministerial powers in relation to regulations and Orders made around the designation of strategic planning areas and the establishment of strategic planning panels under Schedule 7. This ensures the affirmative procedure is enabled rather than the suggested negative procedure, which, for me, is reasonable and proper. I've heard what Llyr has said on this grouping, and I support all he has said and will be supporting his amendments.

[97] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Russell. A oes Aelodau eraill sydd eisiau Russell. Do other Members wish to speak? siarad? Jenny Rathbone. Jenny Rathbone.

[98] **Jenny Rathbone:** Well, I obviously support the increase in the number of women on planning panels, because I think women often bring an eye to detail on issues, particularly around design and things like disability access. So, I welcome that proposal. I have some concerns that have already been expressed by Llyr Huws Gruffydd, because I think that some planning committees are very inward looking and could benefit from a bit of challenge. I support the fact that the non-elected members do not have a vote, but I think it would be highly beneficial for planning authorities to have to be subject to the rigour of people who bring some expertise, whether it's design expertise or disability access issues, and I have some concerns, as Llyr does, about planning authorities being able to appoint their own non-elected people, who may themselves have conflicts of interest. So, I would welcome hearing from the Minister why he thinks that proposal should be withdrawn.

[99] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Joyce Watson.

[100] **Joyce Watson:** Thank you, Chair. I will be supporting the Government amendments in group 19. I will speak to amendment 58. I am supporting a minimum percentage of women on any strategic planning panel, and I look forward to that, if it's not moved today, being moved in the future. I will also speak to amendment 7, which removes the voting rights of nominated members on a strategic planning panel, which I think is right and is correct, and amendment 8, which introduces the requirement to ensure that at least half of the local planning authority members are present at a meeting of the strategic planning panel so that they can make a decision. I absolutely support that. Again, I think that is right. I also think that it is right that any planning authority is able, because I see this as an enabling part of the Bill, to bring people around the table to assist them in the expertise that they have that might be required to come to a decision. But, at the same time, it adds a check and a balance because they don't have any voting rights.

[101] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Julie Morgan.

[102] **Julie Morgan:** Just to say that I support any moves towards gender equality and the Minister has a good track record in this field. Unfortunately, we don't reach gender equality without targets and quotas, so I certainly support any moves towards gender equality.

10:00

[103] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Unrhyw un arall? Na. Gweinidog. Anyone else? No. Minister.

[104] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair. I've listened carefully to Members' comments regarding strategic planning panels on this issue, and I've also referred back to some of the committee report from the previous stage that you gave us for further consideration in the

laying of amendments. While today I will be seeking to move amendments 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of the Government as listed, it will be something I will give further consideration to at Stage 3 in order to take further advice on some of the issues that Members have raised today.

[105] I wanted to perhaps put on the record around strategic planning panels—and I know it's one of controversy among different parties, and I do understand that, but I'd like to give Members reassurance that this, in effect, is already in place in some areas in a different guise. We have city regions that are operating very effectively across Wales, and this puts, effectively, a board on a statutory process where they will have a planning function on that. I would certainly not agree with Llyr on the process; he suggests there will be no engagement from the public. This is a principled approach to how we want openness and transparency through this at all stages of planning, and this will be consistent with this panel, too. So, I hope that I can give the Member confidence, although I do understand his political position on the principle of panels in this guise.

[106] Could I also raise with Members that Government amendments 58, 59 and 60 today, around gender quotas, I will not be seeking to move these amendments at this stage today. I've just received some further advice on that. It cannot be right that, in 2015, we don't have equality of representation on all public bodies, but I just need to take some further advice, and, once I've received that, it maybe be that at the next stage, Stage 3, I will be seeking to formally move that. I can give the committee assurance that my commitment is still very keen to push this agenda forward, and that should not be doubted in any way. But it is something that I am concerned about, some of the advice I've just received, and therefore I will not be seeking to move that. I would hope that Members would be supportive in that principle, and hopefully we can find a pathway through this proposal.

[107] Just, again, reflecting on some of the issues that Members have raised, we listened carefully at an earlier stage about removing the rights of non-elected members having a voting right. We've laid an amendment in that case, as seen, and we would be hopeful Members could support. On your recommendation, we've delivered on that proposal. I ask the Chair to move amendments 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in my name, but not to move 58, 59 and 60.

[108] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Weinidog. Llyr i ymateb. Minister. Llyr to reply.

[109] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Thank you, Chair. Thank you to all Members for your contributions. I was particularly interested in Jenny Rathbone's assertion that she knows of planning committees that are inward-looking. She may wish to share and name and shame, if there are some, because I'd be very interested to know whether some are in the region that I represent, in north Wales. But of course the problem here is that we're introducing nominated members, no doubt who will have a vested interest in many of the decisions that are being made, and I think that's even worse, actually, so I think there is an inherent danger in moving in that direction. Yes, you can have external experts providing professional advice and information, but having them sat around the panel, I think, gives a degree of influence that I think isn't appropriate, and I would reaffirm that in my comments now.

[110] On the Minister's reference to city regions, I understand the point you're making, but we also have local health boards, of course, which are in a similar situation, education consortia as well, and we're just creating this plethora of new quangos, in effect. That's the danger. That's the effect that we find ourselves drifting towards, I think, in this process, and I fear that the strategic planning panels may be moving, or will be moving, in a similar direction—that's my concern. I would be more content with wholly elected representatives, maybe, but anything other than that, I think, isn't what we should be aspiring towards. I heard

the Minister saying about revisiting the gender balance amendments. I also suggested earlier that I'd be looking for a 50 per cent split of male and female representation, not only from local planning authorities, but actually for the whole membership of the panel. I think that's something we should be aspiring to achieve.

[111] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr, Llyr. A ydych chi am symud gwelliant 194? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much, Llyr. Do you wish to move amendment 194?

[112] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[113] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Os derbynnir gwelliant 194, bydd gwelliannau 195 ac 196 yn methu. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 194? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 194 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 194. **Alun Ffred Jones:** If amendment 194 is agreed, amendments 195 and 196 will fall. The question is that amendment 194 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 194, please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote, and, therefore, amendment 194 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 194: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 194: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 194.  
Amendment 194 not agreed.*

[114] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 197? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 197?

[115] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[116] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Sori, mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Sori, 195 ydy'r—. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 195? **Alun Ffred Jones:** I do apologise. I apologise, it's 195—. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 195?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 195 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 195 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[117] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[118] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 195? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 195 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Diolch yn fawr. Cyfartal. Pleidlais negyddol, felly ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 195.

amendment 195 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 195, please indicate. Those against. Thank you. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative, therefore, amendment 195 falls.

*Gwelliant 195: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 195: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 195.  
Amendment 195 not agreed.*

[119] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 196?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 196?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 196 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 196 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[120] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[121] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 196? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 196 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Pleidlais gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol, felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 196.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 196 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 196. Those against. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative, and, therefore, amendment 196 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 196: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 196: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 196.  
Amendment 196 not agreed.*

[122] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rŵan rydym ni'n dod i welliant 197. Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 197? **Alun Ffred Jones:** We now come to amendment 197. Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 197?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 197 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 197 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[123] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[124] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 197 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 197. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections? [*Objection.*] We move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 197, please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, amendment 197 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 197: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 197: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 197.  
Amendment 197 not agreed.*

[125] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn dymuno cynnig gwelliant 58. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The Minister doesn't wish to move amendment 58.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 58 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[126] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn cynnig gwelliant 59. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The Minister is not moving amendment 59 either.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 59 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[127] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rydym ni'n symud i welliant 81. William, a ydych chi'n **Alun Ffred Jones:** Therefore, we move to amendment 81. William, do you wish to

dymuno cynnig gwelliant 81?

move amendment 81?

[128] **William Powell:** Not move.

[129] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Not move?

[130] **William Powell:** No.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 81 (William Powell).  
Amendment 81 (Carl Sargeant) not moved.*

[131] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Reit. Rydym ni symud felly i welliant 5 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** We move, therefore, to amendment 5 in the name of the Minister.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 5 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[132] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Felly, rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 5. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 5? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 5 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Â'r bleidlais fwrw yn erbyn. Felly, ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 5. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 5. The question is that amendment 5 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of amendment 5, please indicate. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 5 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 5: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 5.  
Amendment 5 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 6 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[133] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigïaf welliant 6 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 6? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly, ar welliant 6. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 6 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Â'r bleidlais **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 6 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 6 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote on amendment 6. All those in favour of amendment 6, please indicate. Five And those against. Five. The casting vote is in the

fwrw yn erbyn. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 6. negative. Therefore, amendment 6 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 6: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).  
As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 6.  
Amendment 6 not agreed.*

[134] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 82? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 82?

[135] **William Powell:** No, Chair.

[136] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid ydych am symud gwelliant 82. **Alun Ffred Jones:** No, it's not moved.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 82 (William Powell).  
Amendment 82 (William Powell) not moved.*

[137] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 198. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 198?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 198 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 198 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[138] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[139] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 198? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i 198? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 198. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 198 be agreed. Does any Member object to 198? No objections. Therefore, amendment 198 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 198 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 198 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[140] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 199? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 199?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 199 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 199 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[141] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[142] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 199? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais, felly. Pawb sydd o blaid 199 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 199.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 199 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of 199, please indicate. And those against. There is a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, amendment 199 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 199: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 199: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 199.  
Amendment 199 not agreed.*

[143] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 200, Llyr.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 200, Llyr.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 200 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 200 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[144] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[145] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 200? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 200 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 200.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 200 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 200, please indicate. Those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 200 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 200: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 200: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 200.*

*Amendment 200 not agreed.*

[146] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 201. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 201. 201.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 201 (Llyr Gruffydd).*

*Amendment 201 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[147] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.

**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[148] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 201? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 201 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 201.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 201 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 201, please indicate. All those against. There is a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 201 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 201: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment 201: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 201.*

*Amendment 201 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 7 (Carl Sargeant).*

*Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[149] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 7 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 7? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 7.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 7 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 7 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 7 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 7 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*

*Amendment 7 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 8 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[150] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n cynnig gwelliant 8 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 8. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 8 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? No. Amendment 8 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 8 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 8 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 9 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[151] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 9 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 9. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 9 in the name of the Minister. The question is: are there any objections to amendment 9? No objections. Therefore, amendment 9 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 9 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 9 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[152] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae gwelliant 60 wedi'i dynnu'n ôl, onid yw? **Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 60 has been withdrawn, I believe.

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 60.*  
*Amendment 60 not moved.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 10 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[153] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 10 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 10? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd y gwelliant. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 10 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 10 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 10 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 10 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 10 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[154] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 202. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to move amendment 202?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 202 (Llyr Gruffydd).*  
*Amendment 202 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[155] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[156] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 202? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 202 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 202. **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 202 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 202, please indicate. And those against. There is a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 202 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 202: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 202: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 202.  
Amendment 202 not agreed.*

[157] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, amendment 203.  
203.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 203 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 203 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[158] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig. **Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[159] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 203? Unrhyw amendment 203 be agreed. Does any wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a pleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 203 i vote. All those in favour of amendment 203, ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. please indicate. And those against. There is a Pleidlais yn gyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 203. negative. Amendment 203 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 203: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 203: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 203.  
Amendment 203 not agreed.*

[160] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, do you wish to

204.

move amendment 204?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 204 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 204 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[161] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[162] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 204? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 204 i ddangos. Pump. Ac yn erbyn. Pump. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 204.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 204 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 204, please indicate. Those against. There is a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 204 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 204: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 204: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 204.  
Amendment 204 not agreed.*

[163] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr, gwelliant 205.**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 205, Llyr.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 205 (Llyr Gruffydd).  
Amendment 205 (Llyr Gruffydd) moved.*

[164] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Cynnig.**Llyr Gruffydd:** I move.

[165] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 205? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 205 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 205.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 205 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] I move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 205, please indicate. Against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 205 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 205: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 205: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 205.  
Amendment 205 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 11 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[166] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 11 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 11? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Mae gwelliant 11 wedi'i dderbyn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 11 in the name of the Minister. The question is that amendment 11 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 11 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 11 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 11 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 12 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[167] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 12 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 12.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 12 in the name of the Minister. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 12 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 12 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 12 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 13 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[168] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 13 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Derbyniwyd gwelliant 13.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 13 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? Amendment 13 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 13 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 13 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 14 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 14 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[169] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 14 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Cynnig. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 14.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 14 in the name of the Minister. I move. Any objections? None. Amendment 14 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 14 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 14 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 15 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 15 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[170] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 15 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 15.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 15 in the name of the Minister. Any there any objections? No. Therefore, amendment 15 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 15 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 15 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 16 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 16 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[171] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 16 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Cynnig. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 16.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 16 in the name of the Minister. Does any Member object? No. Amendment 16 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 16 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 16 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 17 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 17 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[172] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 17 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 17.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 17 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? No objections. Therefore, amendment 17 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 17 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 17 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 18 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 18 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[173] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 18 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Cynnig. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 18.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Amendment 18 in the name of the Minister. I move. Any objections? None. Therefore, amendment 18 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 18 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 18 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 19 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 19 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[174] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynnig gwelliant 19 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 19.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 19 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? None. Amendment 19 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 19 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 19 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 20 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 20 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[175] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwelliant 20 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 20.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 20 in the name of the Minister. Does any Member object? No. Amendment 20 is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 20 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 20 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 21 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 21 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[176] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 21 yn enw'r Gweinidog. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 21.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 21 in the name of the Minister. Does any Member object? No objections. Therefore, amendment 21 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 21 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 21 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 22 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 22 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[177] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 22 yn enw'r Gweinidog. Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 22.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 22 in the name of the Minister. Any objections? None. Therefore, amendment 22 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 22 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 22 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[178] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 118?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 118?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 118 (Russell George).  
Amendment 118 (Russell George) moved.*

[179] **Russell George:** Move.

[180] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 118? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb o blaid gwelliant 118, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 118.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 118 be agreed to. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 118. And those against. There is a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Therefore, amendment 118 falls.

*Gwelliant 118: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 118: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 118.  
Amendment 118 not agreed.*

[181] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to move amendment 119?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 119 (Russell George).  
Amendment 119 (Russell George) moved.*

[182] **Russell George:** Move.

10:15

[183] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 119? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Felly, pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 119 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 119.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that amendment 119 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 119, please indicate. And against. There's a tied vote. The casting vote is in the negative. Therefore, amendment 119 is not agreed.

*Gwelliant 119: O blaid 5, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Amendment 119: For 5, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 119.  
Amendment 119 not agreed.*

[184] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, amendment 120. gwelliant 120.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 120 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 120 (Russell George) moved.*

[185] **Russell George:** Move.

[186] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Symud i bleidlais—. Sorri, y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 120? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 120 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 120.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Move to a vote—. Sorry, the question is that amendment 120 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 120. And those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 120 falls.

*Gwelliant 120: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 120: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 120.*  
*Amendment 120 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 42 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[187] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 42 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 42 in the name of the Minister.

[188] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 42? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 42.

The question is that amendment 42 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 42 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 42 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 42 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[189] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, gwelliant 121. A ydych chi—

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, amendment 121. Do you wish to—

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 121 (Russell George).*  
*Amendment 121 (Russell George) moved.*

[190] **Russell George:** Move.

[191] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Y cwestiwn yw: **Alun Ffred Jones:** The question is that

a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 121? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [*Gwrthwynebiad.*] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 121 i ddangos, os gwelwch yn dda. Ac yn erbyn. Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 121.

amendment 121 be agreed. Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 121, please indicate. All those against. There's a tied vote. I use the casting vote in the negative. Amendment 121 falls.

*Gwelliant 121: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 121: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 121.  
Amendment 121 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 43 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[192] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 43 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 43 in the name of the Minister.

[193] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 43.

The question is that amendment 43 be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Amendment 43 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 43 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 43 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 23 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 23 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[194] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 23 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 23 in the name of the Minister.

[195] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 23.

Does any Member object? No objections. Therefore, amendment 23 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 23 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 23 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 24 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 24 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[196] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 24 in

24 yn enw'r Gweinidog. the name of the Minister.

[197] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim Any objections? No objections. Therefore, gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 24. amendment 24 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 24 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 24 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 25 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 25 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[198] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 25 in 25 yn enw'r Gweinidog. the name of the Minister.

[199] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim Any objections? None. Therefore, gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 25. amendment 25 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 25 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 25 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[200] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, a ydych **Alun Ffred Jones:** Russell, do you wish to chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 83? move amendment 83?

[201] **Russell George:** Is it me?

[202] **Alun Ffred Jones:** It's you, Russell: 83.

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 83 (William Powell).  
Amendment 83 (William Powell) moved.*

[203] **Russell George:** Move.

[204] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You move it.

[205] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn The question is that amendment 83 be agreed. gwelliant 83? Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Does any Member object? [*Objection.*] We'll [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb move to a vote. All those in favour of sydd o blaid gwelliant 83. Diolch yn fawr: amendment 83. Thank you. All those against: pump. Ac yn erbyn: pump. Cyfartal. Felly, five again. There's a tied vote. Therefore, I pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd use the casting vote in the negative. gwelliant 83. Amendment 83 falls.

*Gwelliant 83: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 83: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid: For:	Yn erbyn: Against:	Ymatal: Abstain:
Davies, Paul George, Russell Gruffydd, Llyr Jones, Alun Ffred Powell, William	Cuthbert, Jeff Morgan, Julie Rathbone, Jenny Rees, David Watson, Joyce	

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*

*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 83.  
Amendment 83 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 55 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[206] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 55 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 55 in the name of the Minister.

[207] Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 55. The question is that it be agreed. Does any Member object? No objections. Therefore, amendment 55 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 55 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 55 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 26 (Carl Sargeant).  
Amendment 26 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[208] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 26 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 26 in the name of the Minister.

[209] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 26. Any objections? None. Therefore, amendment 26 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 26 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.  
Amendment 26 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

[210] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, a ydych chi'n dymuno cynnig gwelliant 84? **Alun Ffred Jones:** William, do you wish to move amendment 84?

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 84 (William Powell).  
Amendment 84 (William Powell) moved.*

[211] **William Powell:** Move.

[212] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Unrhyw wrthwynebiad i welliant 84? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais. Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 84 i ddangos. Ac yn erbyn. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Any objections to amendment 84? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote. All those in favour of amendment 84, please indicate. And all those against.

[213] I thought there was an upset there. [*Laughter.*]

[214] Cyfartal. Pleidlais fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 84. There's a tied vote. I use my casting vote in the negative. Amendment 84 falls.

*Gwelliant 84: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.  
Amendment 84: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:  
For:

Yn erbyn:  
Against:

Ymatal:  
Abstain:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 84.*  
*Amendment 84 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 27 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 27 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[215] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 27 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 27 in the name of the Minister.

[216] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim Any objections? None. Therefore, gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 27. amendment 27 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 27 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 27 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 28 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 28 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[217] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 28 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 28 in the name of the Minister.

[218] Unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim Does any Member object? No objections. gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 28. Therefore, amendment 28 is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 28 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 28 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 44 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[219] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 44 yn enw'r Gweinidog. **Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 44 in the name of the Minister.

[220] A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Any objections? [*Objection.*] We'll move to a vote, therefore. All those in favour of [Gwrthwynebiad.] Symud i bleidlais, felly. amendment 44, please indicate: five. And Pawb sydd o blaid gwelliant 44 i ddangos: those against: five. There's a tied vote. I use pump. Ac yn erbyn: pump. Felly, pleidlais the casting vote in the negative. Amendment fwrw negyddol. Ni dderbyniwyd gwelliant 44 falls.

*Gwelliant 44: O blaid 5, Yn erbyn 5, Ymatal 0.*  
*Amendment 44: For 5, Against 5, Abstain 0.*

O blaid:

Yn erbyn:

Ymatal:

For:

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Morgan, Julie  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Rees, David  
Watson, Joyce

Against:

Davies, Paul  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Powell, William

Abstain:

*Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Cadeirydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.20(ii).*  
*As there was an equality of votes, the Chair used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order 6.20(ii).*

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 44.*  
*Amendment 44 not agreed.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 56 (Carl Sargeant).*  
*Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) moved.*

[221] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 56 yn enw'r Gweinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I move amendment 56 in the name of the Minister.

[222] A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Dim gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniwyd gwelliant 56 yn unfrydol.

Does any Member object? There are no objections. Therefore, amendment 56 is agreed unanimously.

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 56 yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 17.34.*  
*Amendment 56 agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34.*

*Barnwyd y cytunwyd ar bob adran o'r Bil.*  
*All sections of the Bill deemed agreed.*

[223] **Alun Ffred Jones:** A gaf i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion am fod yn bresennol? Mi gewch drawsgrifiad o'r cyfarfod i'w wirio am gywirdeb. Felly, mae trafodion Cyfnod 2 wedi dod i ben. Bydd Cyfnod 3 yn dechrau yfory. Bydd y dyddiadau perthnasol ar gyfer trafodion Cyfnod 3 yn cael eu cyhoeddi maes o law. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn darparu i'r Gweinidog baratoi memorandwm esboniadol diwygiedig i gymryd i ystyriaeth y gwelliannau y cytunwyd arnynt heddiw. Bydd y memorandwm yn cael ei osod o leiaf bum niwrnod gwaith cyn trafodion Cyfnod 3.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** May I thank the Minister and his officials for their attendance? You will receive a transcript of this morning's proceedings to check for factual accuracy. That completes Stage 2 proceedings. Stage 3 begins tomorrow. The relevant dates for Stage 3 proceedings will be published in due course. Standing Orders make provision for the Minister to prepare a revised explanatory memorandum taking account of the amendments agreed today. The revised memorandum will be laid at least five working days before Stage 3 proceedings commence.

[224] A dyna ddiwedd y rhan yma o'r cyfarfod. Fe wnawn ni dorri.

And that completes this part of the meeting. We will break.

[225] We'll have a quick break now and we'll return for the ministerial scrutiny session in 10 minutes.

*Gohiriwyd y cyfarfod rhwng 10:20 a 10:30.*  
*The meeting adjourned between 10:20 and 10:30.*

**Y Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol: Sesiwn Craffu Ariannol**  
**The Minister for Natural Resources: Financial Scrutiny Session**

[226] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Rwy'n croesawu'r Gweinidog i'r sesiwn craffu ar faterion ariannol o fewn portffolio'r Gweinidog Cyfoeth Naturiol. A gaf i groesawu'r Gweinidog yma? Efallai y byddai fo'n licio cyflwyno'i hun a'i swyddogion er mwyn y record, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I welcome the Minister to this financial scrutiny session relating to the portfolio of the Minister for Natural Resources. May I welcome the Minister here? Perhaps he'd like to introduce himself and his officials for the record, please.

[227] **The Minister for Natural Resources (Carl Sargeant):** Good morning, Chair. Good morning, committee. I'm Carl Sargeant, Minister for Natural Resources. I'll ask my team to introduce themselves. Tony.

[228] **Mr Clark:** I'm Tony Clark, head of finance, natural resources.

[229] **Mr Quinn:** Matthew Quinn, director of environment and sustainable development.

[230] **Mr Rees:** Graham Rees, head of marine and fisheries division.

[231] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. Croeso ichi i gyd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Many thanks. Welcome to you all.

[232] Right, I'll kick off with some general questions. Could you comment, Minister, on how decisions were made as regards the level of resources that would be returned to central reserves? We all realise that the percentage returned was highest in your department, at 4.3 per cent. So, how were decisions made as to how much would be returned to central reserves?

[233] **Carl Sargeant:** Well, that was an interesting time, Chair. That was the exact point of the reshuffle, so I made some decisions, and other people made other decisions, in reality. However, the process is very similar in terms of how do we balance the books in the department, and can we be assured of managing the risks effectively, with the risks being: do we look at programme and workload and how we can have flexibility sometimes in the system, or the case of starting or stopping some things? That's carefully managed by the Ministers in all departments, including this one, and then we offer funding back to the centre. That's just a typical way of working.

[234] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, you weren't asked for a percentage cut.

[235] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, they give you an indicator. We get an indication from central finance of a percentage return that they would like across the board, and we work towards that. In our department, we managed to achieve that.

[236] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You said that one way was not to start something or to stop doing something, so what was not started, or what was stopped?

[237] **Carl Sargeant:** We saved. Many of the allocation savings were from across several programmes—not stopping things, but making changes to the way that they are delivered. One of the ones was £30 million savings—£5 million on TB eradication, including the EU income estimation. You may want to explore this further with Rebecca Evans, who's responsible for that particular element, but issue is based on risk in TB, and—touch wood—our fight against TB is doing particularly well and therefore our risks are less and therefore we can send money back to the centre. We have sent further funding back from the

environment division, planning and regulation, and we've just looked at where there was some—'slack' is the wrong word to use, but just some space where we could have flexibility within the budget. We've been looking at this, really, to take that out of the system and send it back to the centre.

[238] **Alun Ffred Jones:** You mentioned TB, the TB eradication programme, which was quite a hefty lump. Anything else? Which other programmes were affected by this? Can you indicate any of them?

[239] **Carl Sargeant:** I can list the ones with significant funding: TB eradication; £4 million on the rural development plan domestic budget; £2.7 million on the environment; £0.7 million out of the planning and regulation division; £0.3 million off sheep compensation; and £0.3 million from landscapes and natural parks.

[240] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Did anyone ask whether—. On planning, for example, which is often regarded as the, sort of, Cinderella of public spending, what exactly was not done with that £0.7 million—was it £700,000?

[241] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

[242] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, what was not done by giving that back?

[243] **Carl Sargeant:** Things like training workshops et cetera that would enhance opportunities for local planning authorities, and things like that. Some work around informing us better on programmes, technical advice notes et cetera, when we're trying to update those and bring in expert advice. We just prolonged that process as opposed to having it immediately. We look to programme it in. So, it just takes the flexibility for us to do that out of the system.

[244] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, in general, you would say that the fact that you contributed 4.3 per cent of your budget to central resources was as a result of the demands from the centre for that amount?

[245] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes. What I would—

[246] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So you were targeted, really, for a heftier cut than most other departments.

[247] **Carl Sargeant:** No, absolutely not. That's not the case. It's just that we were able to find that within the division better than others were. The reality is we have to make priorities. The priority of this Government is the health service, and I support that wholeheartedly. The fact is we've got to think, when £1.5 billion less comes into Wales as a result of the UK Government, that that has an effect on public services. It's about prioritisation, and I'm quite confident that we can manage our budgets with the finances we have, with the ability to send some back to the centre to go to the health service. I'm comfortable with that.

[248] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Iawn. Diolch yn fawr. Any other questions on that aspect? David Rees.

[249] **David Rees:** Just a quick one, Minister. The discussions with the finance Minister for that allocation have been both with your predecessor and yourself. I understand that this money has gone back to central reserve. Have you had a discussion to ensure that, obviously, on the contingency fund, you may have full access to it, because we do have risk of flood and other issues? Do you have access with the finance Minister to ensure that, if something pops up, there is contingency there to deal with those issues?

[250] **Carl Sargeant:** Look, it's really tough and the finances across all departments are challenged. However, I'm very pleased with the relationship we have with the finance Minister, in terms particularly of flood risk. We've had another—. You say this very tentatively, don't you, about having good results on dealing with flooding, because you just don't know what's going to happen tomorrow, and I'm very conscious of that? But I think we've got a good record in Wales on how we have dealt with resilience and investment in flood defences, but also investment post flooding, as we saw last year. The finance Minister and, actually, other divisions, came to the aid of people across Wales in order to provide for that. So, there is a collective responsibility around resilience, but I'm not going to sit here and say that it's not tough. It really is difficult to manage budgets now.

[251] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I'm going to try and go through this according to the brief, so we'll stick to the various topics, if we can.

[252] **David Rees:** Flooding was an example.

[253] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, yes, I know. I'm not—. So, Jenny, would you like to continue on this theme?

[254] **Jenny Rathbone:** Yes, just continuing with flood and coastal erosion risk, obviously, Wales has got a good story to tell because we didn't allow farmers to leave land empty and not replant when they were picking up early crops and, obviously, that is what clogged up all the rivers in south-west England with all the problems we saw with flooding. Nevertheless, obviously, climate change is with us, and this is a problem that's not going to go away. Up until now, you've relied on considerable sources of money from the European regional development fund, which may or may not be available in the next seven-year programme, simply because there's more of a sort of strategic focus in the next seven-year European funding programme. So, I just wondered whether you could say whether you will need additional money of that nature or how you're going to manage.

[255] **Carl Sargeant:** I think what I hoped to bring to the department when I came in around six months ago was to start looking holistically at we do, and that's part of the legislative programme as well. So, we've introduced the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill, which puts the whole principle of how we look at long-term investment and the security of Wales for a better Wales. That's one element of that about sustainable development principles, and application on budgets. The second point is that the Planning (Wales) Bill and the environment Bill, which is moving forward, are again looking at how we do things differently.

[256] So, we're looking at land-based management—and that's what we feature in the environment Bill—understanding the use of land, and again the 'something for something' agenda. I've told my team that I won't make investments where there isn't a payback in some form. It's not just a subsidy or a handout; this is about making sure that we get bang for the buck here—what are we going to get back in return for our investment? That's why programmes through the new RDP, programmes that we are looking at through the nature fund—. What is it we can do to protect landscape, which has a better and bigger impact on climate change and the environment? So, I think we've got the message right internally. It's about delivery now, and making sure that we can change the limited amount of funding available into something tangible on the ground. But we are changing policies and the legislation appropriately to deliver on that. So, I think the three pieces of legislation, a new way of funding in terms of the 'something for something' agenda, absolutely delivers on the things that you're talking about.

[257] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. Well, I entirely agree with your strategy. Do you think that,

with your re-focused ‘something for something’, that is going to enable you to lever in ERDF funds?

[258] **Carl Sargeant:** We think so. Again, the task for my team is about leverage so that—. We are just part of the programme, not all of the programme, so, how do we ensure that other parts of investment into Wales, whether that be European or otherwise, or private sector investment—what is the deal here that we can have, as opposed to everybody saying, ‘The Government can fix this’? Because we can’t. Actually, we’ve all got a part to play and I think, from earlier discussions we had in this committee, saying, ‘We all collectively have a stake in this’, well, we’re interested, as Government, in being part of that, but it’s making sure we’ve got the leverage. It’s not about a one-way discussion here. So, absolutely, I think ERDF and RDP all play a significant part in changing the culture and the environment that we live in.

[259] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. Is the funding that NRW has got for its coastal development plan sufficient to deliver on this important coastal flooding protection scheme, or is it going to have an impact on other aspects of their work, given that they’ve had quite a considerable reduction in their budget?

[260] **Carl Sargeant:** The reduction for NRW is not new to them. The whole business case for NRW was constructed on a reduction in budgets long-term. They fully understood that, and their business model was to deliver against that. I’m confident that they can manage that budget. I meet with the chief executive and the chair of NRW on a monthly basis—and in between, actually. We see quite a lot of each other and discuss these many issues. They have not raised with me their ability to deliver on the business model, and I have no reason to believe that they can’t.

[261] **Jenny Rathbone:** Thank you.

[262] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William Powell.

[263] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Good morning again, Minister, and your refreshed team. If I could follow on from Jenny Rathbone, because it is, I think, correct that the availability of ERDF moneys may be less clear in the next round, but have you given any thought to working with your colleague, the Minister for finance, to explore the possibility of additional innovative sources of funding, such as the European Investment Bank? I know that she’s been in dialogue with Jonathan Taylor and his team—the vice president of the bank—since the spring of last year, because, increasingly, the bank has shown its readiness. Because it seems to be more strongly capitalised than it had previously been, they are keen to support strategic projects in the field of utilities working with private-sector partners, but also on flood defence schemes and other infrastructure projects. I know Joyce Watson and I have particularly been impressed with what’s been done, led by Dŵr Cymru, in Llanelli in terms of sustainable drainage. There seems to me to be some scope for some fresh thinking now and maybe to bring some more bucks into the equation—you just spoke about bang for buck. I’d appreciate your thoughts on that.

[264] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, indeed. I think it’s a really helpful question, actually, because that’s exactly where we are. We’ve looked at—. We touched on risk right from the very first question that the Chair asked us about, and we looked at how long-term we can—. We know that we are—. There’s a core element that we’re pretty sure we’re going to get, and there are other bits that we’re not sure about what the future of those programmes are, but we can’t drift into change. We have to have a planned process.

10:45

[265] That’s why investments, working with the finance Minister, around the green growth

agenda—huge potential for Wales. Looking at the ability to make investments, working with the European Investment Bank and the private sector to see what that may bring to us: again, significant opportunities for us. Working on sweating of the assets, so NRW and what they hold in terms of ex-Forestry Commission Wales land, as was then, seeing what leverage they may have in order to be part of a solution to energy or opportunity within these departments, and working with local authorities—again, another key partner. So, in relation to what I said to Jenny earlier on, we can't do this on our own. We have to ensure that we've got maximum leverage with all our partners and that's why investing time and effort into talking to people about what they can bring to the table is something that I'm very keen to deliver on. My team fully understand that.

[266] **William Powell:** Chair, can I come back with a small additional point on that? You speak of the importance of partnership working with local authorities and others. I've been particularly impressed in recent times with the work that Dŵr Cymru has done in partnership with Powys County Council and Welsh Government to bring forward strategic flood defence schemes inland. I just wanted to flag up a concern that's been raised with me, which is the potential for an individual single objection to cause, potentially, the loss of many tens of thousands of pounds and also the missing of funding deadlines. I would urge you to explore with the Minister for finance whether there are ways in which the greater good and the greater need and imperative can be protected against individual actions, which may or may not be questionable.

[267] **Carl Sargeant:** Being nonspecific, if I may, Chair, as regard to planning terms around this, I think—

[268] **William Powell:** As, indeed, was I.

[269] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I've no idea what you're on about. *[Laughter.]*

[270] **Carl Sargeant:** That's very helpful. I think the issue here is potentially there are objections to some schemes and some programmes and there has to be balance in the issue of safety for the broader community. It's something that we are very aware of and sensitive to, but, sometimes, we have to measure that risk and take that into the consideration of the planning determination of that. As you will be aware, and as many people will be aware, if you can please 50 per cent of the people on planning decisions, you're doing pretty well, I think, generally.

[271] **Alun Ffred Jones:** This is a financial scrutiny session, so Llyr Gruffydd.

[272] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I just wanted to pick up on the points that Jenny Rathbone was making earlier. Could you just be clear that you are content that the £150,000 that is being provided to Natural Resources Wales is sufficient additional funding to progress the recommendations from the coastal delivery plan?

[273] **Carl Sargeant:** Absolutely, yes.

[274] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Because the coastal delivery plan makes it clear, of course, from Natural Resources Wales's point of view, that meeting the recommendations will impact on other priorities and, I quote,

[275] 'which will inevitably have to slow or halt.'

[276] So, do you believe that the £150,000 is sufficient to avoid that, or do you still expect them to have to divert resources internally?

[277] **Carl Sargeant:** A very important question. I do not expect them to halt or slow the progress of programmes. This £150,000 is about programmes, not capital to change. It's about enabling them to do this. The conversation I've had with the organisation is that they can do it with this funding. I expect it to be done.

[278] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Joyce, on this point?

[279] **Joyce Watson:** On funding and flood risk. Minister, you talked just now about partnership working in flood alleviation, and particularly financial partnerships. Could I ask you—? You obviously recognise that not all flooding is coastal—in fact, most of it is not coastal. With regard to climate change, and flash flooding particularly, which, because the weather patterns have changed so much, is far more frequent, can I ask how you're looking at your budget to manage those instances in the first place, but, more importantly, in the long term, with people like maybe Dŵr Cymru, and maybe also some forestry, particularly with the effect that it has, not only on the individuals, but alongside some of the main thoroughfares? So, we're talking about railway tracks and highways.

[280] **Carl Sargeant:** There are two parts to the question, I think. There's the immediate stuff, like, you know, when people are affected by climate change and the effects on their locality, and what happens if we have flash flooding, and we see that across Wales and across the UK and other countries. It's really difficult to deal with, because these things happen and it's because of historic infrastructure that's been in place, and that's what happens. How can we deal with that? It's working with people like Dŵr Cymru, et cetera, looking at drainage renewal and opportunities. There is a programme for land drainage in Llanelli that I'm sure the Member is aware of, which is very effective.

[281] The second part to this is about—. We can't fix everything now; we've got to plan strategically, longer term. So, part of the answer is working with organisations like Network Rail, where we know there are areas of land that we would expect to flood. There is a great example, I think, in Swansea, which I visited, where there's a fantastic community facility—walking ground—but they know, with a high-tide level, there are warning facilities around, because they expect that piece of land to flood and it's about displacement of water to there, rather than into the townscape. I think that's what we've got to do, and think clever in terms of our town and country planning.

[282] I go back to what I said earlier on. Part of the solution here is not just about the climate change agenda in terms of the environment, but, actually, the planning Bill holds some keys as well: what are we doing with communities and how do we design them better for the future? So, the holistic view of my department is to say, 'What are our long-term objectives to protect community?': the future generations Bill. 'How can we apply that in real terms?' So, people like Network Rail, like Dŵr Cymru, local authorities and Government work together on flood development plans looking at what impact there is currently, but longer term provision. That's why the LDP process. Where some authorities don't have that in place, they are really at risk, not just of having over-development, but actually of not protecting their communities well.

[283] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. We'll move on to Natural Resources Wales. Julie Morgan, do you want to come in?

[284] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to start by asking about the additional money that the individual projects have received a commitment for to be paid this financial year, which includes Glastir, water quality, a Welsh marine plan, Burry inlet cockle fishery—that list—and I wondered: is that included in the £203.3 million, or is this additional?

[285] **Carl Sargeant:** It's additionality.

[286] **Julie Morgan:** It's additional.

[287] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

[288] **Julie Morgan:** Right. Thank you very much. Do you anticipate having any more money before the end of the financial year; any more additional money, now?

[289] **Carl Sargeant:** Well, I'll be very careful what I say, just in case Jane Hutt is watching, unfortunately, and she requires more to go back to the centre. [*Laughter.*] It's a really—. I'm sure Members are aware the flexibility towards the end of the year, where we have projected spend and actual spend, is in ever-changing mode. We are coming towards the end now and the programmes that you've seen in terms of additional spend are there-or-thereabout numbers; they may change, they may go up, because the ability to have some flexibility at the end is about making sure we can make the right investments at the right time, but I won't be able to give you those exact numbers until later in the year, because we just won't have had year-end clearance at this stage.

[290] **Julie Morgan:** Right, but could it be an additional project, but not in that list?

[291] **Carl Sargeant:** It could be.

[292] **Julie Morgan:** As well as the numbers here changing.

[293] **Carl Sargeant:** It could be. The difficulty is, effectively, about getting money out of the door to create an effective programme that is deliverable. I think that's part of the whole problem around public sector finance; it's about having the ability to have longer term vision and flexibility in budgets. There are some down sides to that, but, if you could have more than 12-month flexibility, sometimes that helps with managing programmes, because, if you just haven't had the time—. The nature fund is a good example, where people are pushing very hard to deliver on the nature fund, but, actually, seasonal objectives creep in where they just can't do hedge cutting, because of the time of the year, because of nesting birds, et cetera. They just are challenging dates, but, if you could push the window a little bit longer, it would be really helpful.

[294] **Julie Morgan:** Thank you for that. The other question was about the further voluntary redundancy scheme at NRW. I think this came as a result of an invest-to-save revenue funding. Is this a new scheme, or is it part of the original restructuring?

[295] **Carl Sargeant:** As I said earlier, the creation of NRW was very clear; their business model was very clear and their cost-savings indicators were clear to them and Government too. The voluntary exit schemes—two of them have been in place, and they were programmed, they weren't additional, and this is just—

[296] **Julie Morgan:** So this is part of the additional £2.5 million invest-to-save funding. It's part of that original plan.

[297] **Carl Sargeant:** That was a delivery mechanism to deliver on this scheme, but the programme was always about understanding how they would manage their budgets longer term. Invest-to-save was just a mechanism to do that.

[298] **Julie Morgan:** So it's not extending the number of people who will take voluntary redundancy.

[299] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

[300] **Alun Ffred Jones:** David Rees.

[301] **David Rees:** Minister, NRW obviously takes various forestry aspects as well, and, clearly, you can have income from forestry, whether it's windfarms or whether it's selling the actual wood itself, but, clearly, the disease we are seeing in the south Wales area in particular also has an impact upon the amount of work you have to do, and the replanting. Can you confirm that you have sufficient funding allocations to NRW to cover the additional work as a consequence of the diseases affecting those areas?

[302] **Carl Sargeant:** Well, there's an unknown quantum there, so I can't guarantee that. What I can do is guarantee that we are working very carefully with them to make investments to do replanting. I think I've said here at committee—and certainly talking to my team and the industry—I think we have to have a discussion about what is achievable in the woodland sector. The difficulty with disease is it crept up on us and delivered a great blow, and therefore we can start on that replanting profile, but, while you're doing that, the investment we should be making on new planting is going elsewhere. So, we have to understand what the consequences of that are. I met with Confor this week, the Confederation of Forest Industries, and the discussions are starting about the long-term agenda and what we can achieve in Wales and what we can't, and I think we've just got to be honest with each other.

[303] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Jeff.

[304] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you. Just a very quick question about the voluntary early severance scheme. I appreciate absolutely, from my own experience, the need to save money and to return it to central reserves where appropriate, but, in terms of Natural Resources Wales, can you assure us that the voluntary early severance scheme will not just look at numbers of staff to go, but the skillsets that are required to remain within Natural Resources Wales, and, if anything, that that that is a more important factor than just numbers?

[305] **Carl Sargeant:** Indeed, and I think the modelling of all organisations that we have a relationship with is something that would be expected. It's not just a case of, 'We just need to get 10; it's the first that come'. It's actually about measuring the capacity and resilience of the organisation in that process as well, and I'm confident that they do that very well. I'm glad that the Member recognises that it was a voluntary exit scheme as opposed to a compulsory redundancy scheme.

[306] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr.

[307] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Yes, I just wanted to ask generally about Natural Resources Wales. Where are we now in terms of reaching the point that the Government always said we'd get to in terms of realising efficiency savings and settling the new organisation in, in a sense? Because there was a profile, wasn't there, over a number of years, that faced a few challenges because of IT, pensions, et cetera, and additional money was found, or at least that projected longer-term budget was reprofiled somewhat to meet more upfront costs. Could you tell us where we're at at the moment, and how confident you are that you'll still be meeting your initial aspirations in terms of that break-even point?

[308] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, in terms of specific numbers, I'd be happy to write to the committee on the detail, just so that I don't mislead you unintentionally. However, I would like to place on record that I think that NRW are very well-placed, they're doing a terrific job in terms of transition, and that's been taken through by a Chair who is due to retire and has done an incredible job, and I just wanted to place that on the record. It has been a very difficult process, but managed well.

[309] As I said, there is a 10-year business case where £158 million-worth of savings was projected for the initial creation of this organisation. I will give you the profile of that, and I'll write to the committee in that guise, but, on the regular discussions I have with the organisation, fortunately, and interestingly, the conversation very rarely leads into a cash issue. It's all about delivery, and how we're going to do this—it's a very positive organisation. I expect there will be people out there who have a different view on how NRW act as a regulator. I expect there are a few that may have the same view of Governments too, but I can tell you very clearly I'm very pleased with the activity that NRW are engaged in, and they're doing a great job.

11:00

[310] **Llyr Gruffydd:** So, you're still confident that you're on schedule and on target, even though you acknowledge that you may need to re-profile somewhat, but you're confident of getting to that point as planned.

[311] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, I am.

[312] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Is there some element of false accounting here? You've returned £13 million to central reserves and you borrowed £2.5 million then out of them in order to give it to NRW. Why didn't you just keep the £2.5 million and not hand it over?

[313] **Carl Sargeant:** That was an interesting comment you made, Chair. I can assure you that isn't the case. Did you say 'false accounting'?

[314] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Well, okay, 'creative' or 'double' accounting.

[315] **Carl Sargeant:** That's slightly different, Chair.

[316] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I've explained my position: you returned £13 million to central reserves then you take £2.5 million out of them in order to pay NRW. Why?

[317] **Carl Sargeant:** Well, it's a procedural issue. They are a different organisation; they are not Government, and we have to make sure that it's clear for you and for us and external auditors that they can see the trail of finances. It may sound a little odd, but it's a process that we just have to follow in accountancy.

[318] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I wasn't accusing you of any misdemeanour in Government, of pinching the money.

[319] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm sure you weren't, Chair. That's a relief. [*Laughter.*]

[320] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Ocê, symudwn ymlaen felly. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay, we'll move on therefore.

[321] Marine matters and fisheries—Joyce Watson and then Russell George will come in.

[322] **Joyce Watson:** Minister, we've taken evidence from varying bodies who have raised varying levels of concern about the budget to deliver for marine and fisheries. And they have told us that they are gravely concerned—not my words, theirs—that, without adequate resources being ring-fenced for next year for other strands of the marine transition programme, and with possible cuts to NRW funding, there is a real risk that the ambitious targets, which I welcome, and they do, and commitments set out within the marine and fisheries strategic action plan, brought together under the marine transition programme, will falter. Do you share their concerns, and do you have a budget that—

[323] **Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Chair: an interesting question, based on opinion, and I welcome all opinions. I do not share theirs. I'm confident that we have sufficient resources within the department to manage our investments for transition. Again, the marine and fisheries team is small but very effective. We are working with a lot of change—European legislation that we are Welshifying, complying with, and it is a huge challenge. But, in terms of financing, well, of course, organisations would like to see more investment—so would I; I'd like to see £1.5 billion returned to Wales, but that's not going to happen either. The reality is about priorities here. Can I deliver on this? Yes, we can, and I'm grateful for the views of external agencies.

[324] **Joyce Watson:** I want to also probe the decision not to allocate funding due to the expected level of budget reductions. Do you, Minister, concur with the suggestions that we've had that marine and fisheries has become the poor relation in your budgeting?

[325] **Carl Sargeant:** In recycling terms, that's rubbish; I absolutely don't agree with that. We have to prioritise across the whole department. Your leading question at the beginning was: do we have enough finance to deliver on our programme? I'm confident we have. And, of course, as I said, people would always want us to make larger investments in different areas. That's a decision of Government. I do not agree with that assumption.

[326] **Joyce Watson:** Thank you.

[327] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I think it's fair to say that the evidence we had from outside bodies suggested that things were moving along at a snail's pace, and that there was a great deal of confusion as to what exactly were the priorities of the department. And, in fact, NRW themselves were far from confident in their ability to deliver on the programme. That is the evidence we received. I think I'm right in saying that. Therefore, you say completely categorically, 'No, we're fine', but where's the evidence? The evidence is that the programmes are not proceeding as was expected.

[328] **Carl Sargeant:** Well, I'd be interested in that evidence from yourselves too, Chair. I can tell you that—

[329] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But these are groups that are involved with the programmes.

[330] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm not going to say that this is easy and I've been open with you about the whole of my budget. This is a challenging budget, but we have to deliver on what we've said we can do. My team assure me that these things will happen, working with NRW too. And I know NRW's view on that. I spoke to them again recently about the challenges we face and I'm looking at how we align budgets with NRW around fisheries and ourselves to work better, rather than having areas, potentially, of duplication, where, for example, if there are things that we need to create evidence bases for for some of these programmes, would it be better that NRW do it or my department? But I'm confident, and I stand ready to be challenged at a later date—if perceived by external bodies that we've failed, then I'm happy to face that challenge. But, at the moment, I'm confident that we can do that. So, while people have an opinion, so do I, Chair, and so does this Government.

[331] We have made significant changes to and achievements in the fisheries division; undertaken comprehensive base line assessments on marine evidence for marine planning—not an easy exercise, but delivered. Made available a marine planning evidence portal for Wales—delivered. All of these things, I believe are—. We have comprehensive examples of what my departments have done this year. I have no reason to doubt their ability to continue delivering on what we've said we will deliver.

[332] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William Powell.

[333] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Minister, do you feel that there is sufficient flexibility available to NRW in terms of a charging regime for permitting and licensing tasks that they may face, particularly looking at some very large infrastructure projects coming up the tracks, such as, for example, the Swansea Bay Lagoon, which could potentially have an enormous effect on a relatively small team of experts? Do you feel that there is sufficient opportunity there to recoup and maybe to reinvest in additional staff resource?

[334] **Carl Sargeant:** I think that's a really important question. We've done some work on fees and charges, and we've done some work immediately for this year on fees and charges. But I think we've got to look at the long-term objective of the organisation and of local planning authorities, to that extent, in terms of recovering the costs of some of this large-scale work that they will be asked to do. Again, on licensing and permitting, many of us may enjoy angling or other activities, but I think there has to be a point where the user has to make a contribution, maybe in full, to the delivery of sustainable fisheries, et cetera. We have to think about that very carefully, and I've asked my team, and NRW, to look at that creatively to see how we can have transition to an effective licensing scheme that will cover the cost, effectively, of the investments that they have to make.

[335] **William Powell:** I'm grateful. Thank you.

[336] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Does anybody want to take up the European fisheries fund or do you want me to ask the question? Are you going to ask the question, Joyce?

[337] **Joyce Watson:** Yes. First of all, Minister, can I ask whether all the European fisheries fund available was spent by the Welsh Government, or whether you'll be required to return any of the funds to the EU?

[338] **Carl Sargeant:** I will ask Graham. Do you have a comment on that, in detail, please?

[339] **Mr Rees:** The European fisheries fund is a UK-based fund, and so all parts of the UK work together on it. There was an arrangement made across the UK to handle additional funding across the UK towards the end of the programme, and that picked up a considerable amount of non-convergence funding. In Wales, we don't have very many non-convergence areas, so it's not something we could utilise. So, at a UK level, there were issues around non-convergence, but not convergence.

[340] **Joyce Watson:** So, they didn't affect Wales. Thank you. The next question is whether there have been any lessons in the department, and any learning from the administration of the European fisheries fund, that could maybe be applied in delivering the new European maritime and fisheries fund that's coming.

[341] **Carl Sargeant:** I think that's again another important question about futureproofing the department and learning lessons from existing schemes. When I took over the department, I asked particularly to spend half a day with the fisheries team looking at their activity and workload et cetera. That's why I'm very confident in my response to committee about what we can deliver and what we can't.

[342] I think there were issues around the UK level of the programme and about—not unique to Wales—our involvement in that, and the relationship between the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and Welsh Government. I think, learning from that is about how we iron out some of the early delays in the programme, so lessons learned from that and how we can develop for the next stage. That's something that I know the team are taking on board.

[343] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Jenny, did you want to come in?

[344] **Jenny Rathbone:** I just wanted to pick up on your point about Wales not being in a non-convergence area. Cardiff is in the competitiveness area and there could easily have been some benefit to encouraging more use of fisheries as an economic activity. I just wondered why that wasn't pursued.

[345] **Mr Rees:** It's just one of the lessons that we've learned from the European fisheries fund, about how we actually move the money around more effectively. Some of the restrictions that were put in place by the Commission are on how EFF was used, and so we couldn't move some of the money around.

[346] **Jenny Rathbone:** Did you consult Cardiff and Newport councils to see whether they had some good projects?

[347] **Mr Rees:** It was an open bidding process.

[348] **Jenny Rathbone:** Were they not aware of it, though, because they might have been—

[349] **Mr Rees:** Yes.

[350] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay, and they didn't bid. Okay, so I'll need to pursue them further on that one.

[351] **Carl Sargeant:** I think, if I may, Chair, Jenny raises a really important point here. I'm uncomfortable with the fact that, when you put open bidding out, actually some authorities don't seek to bid. Is it entirely their fault? Probably not. The fact is what we have to do collectively is enable people to say what's the best value for Wales, and could you be involved in this process? I see that as part of my team's approach to change, but also theirs. So, it's about having that conversation early on to say, 'There is potential here; how are we going to maximise the benefit from that?' That's one of the lessons we've learned.

[352] **Jenny Rathbone:** Thank you.

[353] **Alun Ffred Jones:** There's a comment here from the Welsh Fishermen's Association:

[354] 'Delivery of the European Fisheries Fund was initially under resourced leading eventually to a structural change in March 2012 which has been hamstrung by a back log of enquiries resulting in frustration and missed opportunities.'

[355] Do you recognise that?

[356] **Carl Sargeant:** I think the start of the UK-run programme was challenging, but I perhaps wouldn't have couched it in quite the terms that that organisation did.

[357] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, but this is the experience of people on the ground, presumably, who are the recipients of, or at least potential people who can take part in, these programmes, and their experience is that it's under-resourced and is a missed opportunity. I'm merely asking whether you recognise that comment.

[358] **Carl Sargeant:** Graham.

[359] **Mr Rees:** It did have a difficult start as a UK programme. It did have a very difficult start. It changed managing authority very early on from the Marine and Fisheries Agency to the Marine Management Organisation, and that caused some issues in terms of how the fund was initiated. So, it did have a very poor start, which meant we started very late and we had to catch up, but all those lessons have been learned for the European maritime and fisheries fund, which is the successor scheme, and we're all ready to go, really, in terms of that scheme. We have resources in place to take it forward.

[360] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr. **Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you very much. Ar y gronfa natur, Llyr. On the nature fund, Llyr.

[361] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Diolch. First of all, I just want to ask whether you're confident that the near £3.9 million that's been allocated for this financial year will be spent by the middle of next week.

[362] **Carl Sargeant:** We're close. I think I alluded to it, actually, earlier on, about the nature fund and the pot. Part of the problem with the nature fund is the issues around nature compromising the spend process.

[363] **Llyr Gruffydd:** That's one way of putting it. [*Laughter.*]

[364] **Carl Sargeant:** So, the profile is caught up in things that you can't do because of the stage of where you are in the year. Am I confident that, in the longer term of the programme, the money will be spent? I am. Will it all be spent by next week? I'll have to give you a note on that because I just don't know. The indication is that we're doing quite well, but I just don't have the numbers.

[365] **Llyr Gruffydd:** One of the reasons that nature was compromising some of the spend, of course, was that there were concerns at the delay in organisations finding out whether they'd been successful in applying. You, therefore, acknowledge that that is causing some practical problems now.

11:15

[366] **Carl Sargeant:** Absolutely, and I take full responsibility for that because—and let me be very clear—when the nature fund was created—again, pre my ministerial role—I came into post and I wanted confidence from my team. I don't think it's a bad thing that I wanted to see a long-term opportunity for changing the environment in the way that this works. I wasn't convinced of the argument that the nature fund was probably the right vehicle to do that. That's why it was a precursor to the environment Bill. My view was: how do we give confidence to people who are bidding in the process? For me, there is absolutely no point in giving an organisation a small or large amount of funding for a 12-month period and then stopping it the year after. If you think that's going to have huge ecological changes to a community long-term, it's minimal. I think what we've got to think about in the longer term is how we change and start to shape the way the ecology system works. I don't think the nature fund, unless we were able to commit to the nature fund long-term, as was, and I couldn't—the financial consequences of the nature fund were just too great for me to do that. That's why we need to move it into a different process. But I do accept that the delay in signing off some of the organisations' nature fund bids has had a consequence in spend profile. I accept that. Has it had a major effect other than, 'We're not spending it by next week'? I don't think so. We're in it for the long haul here. I want to make the right decisions for the long term, and I think we've the ability to do that.

[367] **Llyr Gruffydd:** I presume that you'll be undertaking an evaluation of the fund. I thought, actually, it was quite refreshing that the Government just issued an open invitation,

you know, which isn't usually something you get from Governments because there are all sorts of criteria and straitjackets that come with it, albeit you need to be responsible with public money, of course. So, I welcomed that approach, but I presume that lessons have been learned from that. Maybe you've identified strengths in terms of allowing projects to come forward, but also weaknesses in maybe being able to deliberate effectively and in a consistent way across such a broad range of proposals.

[368] **Carl Sargeant:** Indeed. One of the downsides of that is that you get lots of applications. That's not a bad thing, but again, how do you prioritise? You'll be aware that everybody who puts in an application thinks theirs is the best, so you're increasingly challenged on making sure you make the right investment at the right times. As I said earlier on, I think the principle is absolutely right of engaging more than one stakeholder to develop their ownership, and we've got farming communities working with local community groups, Government and non-governmental organisations et cetera. We've got a mixture of things that happen in the nature fund. So, the principle is there or thereabouts right, but as I said, we need to be in it for the long haul here, to change the environment and the ecological structures of communities: land-based change. I just wasn't comfortable with the nature fund as it was. Given my commitment not to be able to fund the nature fund long-term in that guise, I just didn't think we had it right. That's why the discussions on the nature fund is a starter for 10. Moving on, can we include this in processes around the RDP, and other transitional funding methods where we can get better leverage? With the ability around what the environment Bill brings to the table, too, I just think it gives it better shape. I don't think there's anything wrong with the nature fund as we've delivered. Those challenges—I accept all of them, but it's not a bad thing.

[369] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But the nature fund, as it stands, is short term, so it'll come to an end. You said that you'd like to see things that have continuity, so is this wasted?

[370] **Carl Sargeant:** No, not at all. That's why we took a little bit of time on the programmes that we were investing in because we could see that some of them were physical changes to developments and what that would bring back, and whether we could manage them in the long term. That's why some organisations still feel angst towards us because we haven't funded their organisations—not because they were a bad project wholesale, but actually was it sustainable from only Government funding? I can't commit to that. That's why we have to think very carefully about that.

[371] I'll give you one example. Again, it's not a bad example, but it just shows you how quickly things change. We had a bid from north Wales to ensure that the red squirrel on Anglesey was protected. At the time, it was critical to the development of this programme and how, without the nature fund, this may all go horribly wrong. They've done a great job on the island in delivering against this. I read in the *Daily Post*—so it must be true—last week that they've achieved: there are no grey squirrels. So if you're looking for them, don't go to Anglesey. There are no grey squirrels on Anglesey now. So, they've delivered on their objectives and they didn't get any funding from the nature fund.

[372] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Yes, but that's because they were crossing from the mainland and—

[373] **Carl Sargeant:** Indeed. I know the extent of the programme was to control grey squirrels on the other side of the bridge, effectively, but what I'm saying is we have to look at these bids carefully and assess whether it is critical to the success of the organisation or not. I have to understand, long-term, what this means. That's just one example of one project, and we didn't—

[374] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Without going into detail about that example, that example, has,

of course, long been supported by what used to be the *cyngor cefn gwlad* and its predecessor. So, public money has been spent in reinstating the red squirrel. To leave that to fall into disrepair, or whatever, and have the reintroduction of the grey squirrel would have been a total waste of public money if that is what is happening. But I don't want to go into the detail of the bid. Anyway—

[375] **Carl Sargeant:** Can I just clarify, if I may, Chair? I think it's a really important point that you make and that is my point: if we're going to invest in projects, whatever they are, wherever they started, irrespective of squirrels or otherwise, what we have to make sure of is that if we believe that Government intervention here is essential, how do we ensure that, longer term, it isn't wasted programme money? That's why the nature fund was created. I needed to be convinced that, when we start projects, have we got a long-time opportunity for that programme to continue? That's why I wasn't confident with the structure of the nature fund, as was. That's why we need to think about how it moves forward in RDP and so on.

[376] **Llyr Gruffydd:** But the issue in terms of the red squirrel in Anglesey, I'm afraid—

[377] **Carl Sargeant:** I shouldn't have brought this up.

[378] **Llyr Gruffydd:** —was that there's a £30,000 spending shortfall next year, which will jeopardise the years of work that have been done. So, you know, that's maybe something for the coming financial year.

[379] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Right. We'll leave these squirrels where they are. Right, data centre Wales.

[380] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you very much, Chair. Less than one year ago, you launched the data hub, working with external and internal stakeholders. I realise a relatively small sum of additional money was allocated for the end of this financial year for ICT infrastructure—£10,000 to £20,000. Do you feel that that sum is enough to maintain and develop the Wales data hub? What have you learned so far about the value of that data hub? Obviously, it goes without saying that having good data is essential for any planning or any organisation. What benefits have been gleaned so far, and how might you see it develop?

[381] **Carl Sargeant:** I think it's a really exciting tool that we have here. It is early days. The problem is that the collection of data is quite expensive to get to put on there, but once you've got them, keeping on top of that is equally as important. So, the quality of the data is critical. We're working with partners to ensure that there's no duplication. There's some great work going on, again, in many of the universities, but Bangor University particularly, around marine—they hold lots of evidence and data—and what we need to do is collate a lot of that and put this onto the central database. So, I see it as huge. There are many more opportunities, but it's making sure that we have quality data that we can put on there and maintain.

[382] Externally, it's very welcome. External bodies are saying that this is a great opportunity to understand the mapping of how Wales is performing, and, long term, we'll have better data to qualify that. So, it's innovative, it's relatively new, but there are a lot of opportunities for the future for it.

[383] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Presumably, this will be very helpful in ensuring that the goals of the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Bill are actually met.

[384] **Carl Sargeant:** Absolutely. That's a key. That's what I'm saying: quality data are something that—. And that's why we don't want to rush into this. Actually, we need to make sure we've got the right data that can give us the right flow of information for looking about how Wales is performing or otherwise in a global context or a local context.

[385] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you.

[386] **Alun Ffred Jones:** William Powell.

[387] **William Powell:** Diolch, Gadeirydd. Minister, what role so far have stakeholders played in developing the Wales data hub? I'm thinking particularly of the potential role of the Welsh Fishermen's Association. The Crown Estate's also has got a repository of significant amounts of data. To what extent have we been able to draw on that to get best value in delivering an effective data hub?

[388] **Carl Sargeant:** Certainly, we've the formal agreement between Welsh Government and NRW around IT infrastructure, et cetera, in that process. I would have to perhaps give you a note on people we've engaged in that process of data and data capture.

[389] **William Powell:** That would be helpful.

[390] **Carl Sargeant:** This is a positive tool that we see for Welsh Government, but also the sector as well. It's been well-received, but, in terms of the detail of who has been involved, I'd probably need to send you a note.

[391] **William Powell:** Okay, and finally, Chair, if I might ask: how will you be ensuring that there's appropriate levels of use and, critically, accessibility to the information stored within the data hub so that has maximum benefit?

[392] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, the feedback and accessibility of those data are important to us as well, because I wouldn't want to be putting up an online resource that nobody uses. That'd seem to be pretty pointless. Again, I will see if we have any statistics that we can share with you in terms of usage, but it is, as I said, well-received by the sector.

[393] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Can I just—? Oh, sorry. Jenny Rathbone.

[394] **Jenny Rathbone:** I just want to ask: what is the link between the Wales data hub and the energy saving advice service in terms of our ability to target where the most inefficient homes are? None at all?

[395] **Carl Sargeant:** There isn't. There isn't a direct link at all, but I think I can see where you're going with this, and I will give that some further consideration.

[396] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. Could you just tell us how much money you've invested in the energy saving advice service, and is it sufficient to meet demand and publicise the service?

[397] **Carl Sargeant:** Do you have the numbers, Tony?

[398] **Mr Clark:** Not on me.

[399] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm sorry, I'll have to send you a note on that. That is relatively new as well, the—. In fact, I've only recently signed that off, in terms of a programme for investment for advertising for that programme. I will send the committee a note. I don't have those data.

[400] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay, because, obviously, the cowboys that are knocking around Wales are a major issue in terms of promising people things that they don't deliver on, and in terms of our strategy on climate change mitigation.

[401] **Carl Sargeant:** We do intend to have some radio advertising, and some hard copy material that will be distributed through the citizens advice bureaux and doctor surgeries, et cetera, and also web-based contact details, which will be shared as well. I will send the committee a note on the programme that we intend to promote—the Resource Efficient Wales website and programmes.

[402] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay.

[403] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Llyr.

[404] **Llyr Gruffydd:** Just looking at the different budget lines, I notice that there's been a 100 per cent transfer out of the budget entitled 'Meeting the needs of rural communities and rural proofing WAG actions'. There was £2.3 million allocated originally. Now, presumably, such a significant sum warrants, you know, quite an important use, and I was just wondering where that leaves your ability to rural-proof Government actions, if you've just taken that out anyway?

[405] **Carl Sargeant:** I'll ask Tony for detail on that. He's got the numbers that you need.

[406] **Mr Clark:** Sorry, can you—which budget was it again, sorry? It's presumably a transfer.

[407] **Llyr Gruffydd:** It's a transfer to somewhere. It's transferred to somewhere, but I was just wondering where that had gone and what the implications would be for that.

[408] **Carl Sargeant:** While Tony discovers where that funding has transferred to, can I just give you, again, confidence about our ability to deliver? I see that rural communities are increasingly challenged, particularly on energy conservation, and how do we develop programmes for that? I'm looking at the Arbed and Nest schemes to see whether there's something more we can do in that guise. But I don't see a demarcation line where we can't make investment into rural communities. We should be ensuring that we are a collective and we make investments. I think it may be a technical issue with regard to the transfer.

11:30

[409] **Mr Clark:** I think that was the contribution to the in-year savings, but I will double check and look that figure up, because what you've got is a breakdown by action, but within that there's individual budget expenditure lines and I can breakdown that £2,305,000 to show you—

[410] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Could you give us a note, explaining what—. The money was going to be spent doing something, so, what hasn't been—

[411] **Carl Sargeant:** I'm happy to do so. It wasn't a trick question. I just want to ensure, when we give you the information, that it's accurate.

[412] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, a note would be appreciated. Can I just ask, going back to the nature fund, for you to explain something to me? Take the award to Coed Cymru, for example; it's worth £658,000. You're going to give out £373,000 by the end of March, which leaves a balance of £284,000. So, is that £284,000 coming out of this year's budget or is it going to come out of next year's budget?

[413] **Carl Sargeant:** It's next year's.

[414] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, it's split between—. So, there's no transfer of money.

[415] **Carl Sargeant:** No.

[416] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But, presumably, it was in the total that you had originally, was it? Therefore, that money will go back to central reserves then.

[417] **Carl Sargeant:** No. We've made a commitment to these schemes and we have to find that internally over the budget years. So, the total amount of the scheme, as announced, is just split over the two years. I think, as I explained to Llyr, that, unfortunately, the date of next week will compromise some of those processes, but it will still have to be fully funded over the period and we'll just have to find that internally.

[418] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Okay.

[419] Unrhyw gwestiwn arall? Jenny. Any other questions? Jenny.

[420] **Jenny Rathbone:** I just wanted to ask a question on the allocation of capital. There's £6.9 million on infrastructure to deliver CAP reform. The world is littered with ICT projects that turn out to be not quite as useful as was hoped. I just wondered if this investment is going to enable us to move towards an area-based payment scheme, if that's what the outcome of the consultation delivers.

[421] **Carl Sargeant:** Rebecca is dealing with that particular issue. I can't answer that question because it is with the other Minister who is dealing with that process.

[422] **Jenny Rathbone:** Okay. Even though this is a capital—.

[423] **Carl Sargeant:** Indeed.

[424] **Alun Ffred Jones:** I'm sorry, this is very untidy, but to go back to my question about the nature fund, there will be a nature fund next year because you'll have to fund the schemes that you've already approved.

[425] **Carl Sargeant:** I think it will be last year's nature fund—it will be a continuation of the current one.

[426] **Alun Ffred Jones:** But you won't be transferring money. The money will have to come out of next year's budget.

[427] **Carl Sargeant:** Indeed. Yes.

[428] **Alun Ffred Jones:** So, there will be a nature fund next year, except that it won't be open for any further bids.

[429] **Carl Sargeant:** Yes, that is technically correct.

[430] **Alun Ffred Jones:** There we are.

[431] Diolch yn fawr iawn i'r Gweinidog Thank you very much to the Minister and his  
a'i swyddogion am ddod yma a diolch i'r officials for their attendance and I also thank  
Aelodau. Members.

[432] Thank you, Minister; we are very appreciative of your answers here this morning.

11:33

**Papurau i'w Nodi**  
**Papers to Note**

[433] **Alun Ffred Jones:** Eitem 4, papurau i'w nodi: a yw Aelodau'n hapus i nodi'r papurau yma? Hapus. Diolch yn fawr. Dyddiad y cyfarfod nesaf fydd dydd Mercher, 22 Ebrill. Diolch yn fawr iawn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Item 4, papers to note: are Members content to note those papers? Content. Thank you very much. The date of the next meeting will be Wednesday, 22 April. Thank you very much.

[434] Enjoy your break.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 11:33.*  
*The meeting ended at 11:33.*