



Abigail Philips,
Clerc y Pwyllgor Deisebau,
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru,
Bae Caerdydd
Caerdydd
CF99 1NA

Dyddiad
Date 22/12/11

Gofynnwch am
Please ask for Mrs B Hodgett

Linell Uniongyrchol
Direct line

Fy nghyf
My ref

Eich cyf
Your ref

Ymateb Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru i'r ddeiseb ynghylch adolygu Prosiect Gwyrdd

Yr wyf i, ar ran Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru ac wrth gynrychioli Cynghorau Sir Ceredigion a Phowys, yn croesawu'r cyfle i ymateb i'r ddeiseb ynghylch creu ynni o wastraff.

Fel pob Awdurdod Lleol yng Nghymru, mae Cynghorau Sir Ceredigion a Phowys yn ymrwymo i ailgylchu cymaint â phosib o'u gwastraff trefol, ac yn ymdrechu i gyflawni'r targedau ailgylchu a bennir yn "Tuag at Ddyfodol Diwastraff". Bydd y gofynion statudol a bennir yn y ddogfen honno'n cosbi pob awdurdod sy'n methu ag ailgylchu'r ganran ofynnol o wastraff trefol.

Mae Ceredigion a Phowys fel ei gilydd wedi buddsoddi symiau mawr o arian yn y blynyddoedd diweddar wrth wella ailgylchu sych a chasglu gwastraff bwyd ar wahân. Serch hynny, ac er gwaethaf holl ymdrechion yr Awdurdodau Lleol i wella eu gwasanaethau, erys elfen o'r llif gwastraff nad oes modd ei ailgylchu. Hefyd, er bod Awdurdodau Lleol yn annog yr holl drigolion i ddefnyddio gwasanaethau casglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu, mae rhai'n dewis peidio â gwneud hynny, ac felly bydd y llif gwastraff gweddilliol yn cynnwys defnyddiau y gellid eu hailgylchu. Er bod modd echdynnu rhai o'r defnyddiau hynny, mae'n amhosibl echdynnu 100%, gan fod defnydd y gellir ei ailgylchu yn aml yn cael ei lygru wrth i ddeiliad y tŷ ei roi gyda'r gwastraff gweddilliol, ac felly ni fydd yn addas i'w ailgylchu. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r rhan helaeth o wastraff gweddilliol sy'n deillio o Ganol Cymru yn cael ei anfon i safleoedd tirlenwi.

Pan gleddir unrhyw ddefnyddiau bioddiraddadwy mewn safle tirlenwi, maent yn dadansoddi i gynhyrchu nwy tirlenwi, cyfuniad o nwyon gan gynnwys carbon deuocsid a methan yn bennaf. Credir, felly, bod safleoedd tirlenwi yn cyfrannu at allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr y Deyrnas Gyfunol. Mae gwaith ymchwil wedi dangos bod trin gwastraff gweddilliol yn thermol i gynhyrchu ynni yn ddull gwell o'i waredu;

byddai hynny'n disodli'r angen i ddefnyddio tanwydd ffosil ac yn gwella statws y Deyrnas Gyfunol o ran newid hinsawdd.

Mae Troi Gwastraff yn Ynni yn cynnwys amrywiaeth eang o dechnolegau thermol y gellid eu defnyddio, gan gynnwys "llosgi". Mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn rheoleiddio allyriadau o losgyddion yn llym, ac nid yw Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru o'r farn bod unrhyw effeithiau iechyd arwyddocaol yn gysylltiedig â chyfleusterau troi gwastraff yn ynni. Yn 2004, cyhoeddodd DEFRA adroddiad o'r enw "*Review of Environmental and Health Effects of waste management: Municipal Solid Waste and Similar wastes*". Casgliad yr adroddiad oedd "*published epidemiological studies of the health of communities living in the vicinity of incinerators failed to establish any convincing links between incinerator emissions and adverse effects on public health; specifically no impact was demonstrated on the incidence of cancer, respiratory health symptoms or reproductive outcomes*".

Gyda rhai mathau o wastraff a ddiolir (megis papur o ansawdd isel, tecstilau a deunyddiau cymysg, a phren wedi'i drin neu'i liwio), eu troi yn ynni yw'r dewis gorau i'r amgylchedd¹ ac felly byddai gwahardd llosgi defnyddiau y gellir eu hailgylchu yn niweidiol i'r amgylchedd. Mae Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru hefyd o'r farn nad oes angen gwahardd llosgi'r defnyddiau hyn yng Nghymru, gan fod targedau ailgylchu Llywodraeth Cymru o hyd at 70% yn rhoi digon o anogaeth i'r awdurdodau lleol ailgylchu cymaint o wastraff â phosib. Pan aeth WRAP ati'n ddiweddar i ddadansoddi cyfansoddiad gwastraff² canfuwyd y gellid ailgylchu neu gompostio 74% o wastraff trefol Cymru. Felly, wrth gydymffurfio â tharged 70% Llywodraeth Cymru, nid yw'r llif gwastraff gweddilliol yn cynnwys llawer o wastraff nad oes modd ei ailgylchu.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi annog awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio wrth gaffael gwasanaethau trin gwastraff. Gellir sicrhau arbedion mewn costau caffael drwy rannu adnoddau, costau ac arbenigedd. Wrth gyfuno gwastraff awdurdodau lleol, ceir potensial hefyd i leihau costau trin gwastraff drwy gynyddu darvoudion maint. Fel arall, gall dulliau lleol sicrhau buddion o ran lleihau milltiroedd gwastraff a chreu swyddi lleol.

Mae pob awdurdod lleol a phartneriaeth yn gyfrifol am sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng darvoudion maint a milltiroedd gwastraff. Gellir ystyried y materion technegol, amgylcheddol ac ariannol wrth arfarnu cynigion rheoli gwastraff fel rhan o'r drefn gaffael, gyda'r nod o sicrhau'r canlyniadau mwyaf priodol ymhob achos unigol. Fodd bynnag, y farchnad sydd i raddau helaeth yn dylanwadu ar y canlyniadau y gellir eu sicrhau drwy weithdrefnau caffael.

¹ "*Ecological Footprint Impact of the Welsh Waste Strategy*", Arup, 2009

² "*The Composition of Municipal Solid Waste in Wales*", WRAP, 2010

Dylid nodi hefyd nad yw bob amser yn bosibl nac yn briodol i leoli cyfleusterau trin gwastraff o fewn ffiniau sirol pob awdurdod. Mae'r targedau ailgylchu y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u pennu yn golygu bod gan bob sir lai o dunellau o wastraff gweddilliol ar ôl i'w trin. Felly, beth bynnag fo'r dechnoleg, ni fydd yn ymarferol defnyddio'r cyfleusterau sydd ar gael oni bai fod nifer o awdurdodau yn dod ynghyd i'w caffael. Mewn achosion felly, ystyr 'lleol' yw 'yn y rhanbarth' yn hytrach nag o fewn ffiniau unrhyw awdurdod unigol, ac felly mae'n anochel y bydd rhywfaint o filltiroedd gwastraff. Canlyniad hynny yw ailddiffinio'r hyn y credir i fod yn 'lleol'.

Mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth am weld cydweithio'n dod yn bwysicach yn y dyfodol³. Serch hynny, mae Awdurdodau Lleol yn rhydd ar hyn o bryd i ddewis cydweithio neu beidio, a gwneud penderfyniadau gwybodus ym maes caffael ar ôl ystyried yr holl ddewisiadau posibl. Dylid gwneud penderfyniadau o'r fath yn ôl rhinweddau pob achos unigol, ac felly y mae'n digwydd yng Nghanol Cymru. Mae Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru yn credu'n gryf bod cydweithio'n effeithiol pan fo'r holl bartneriaid yn gweld buddion eglur a chyfartal, ac mae'n annog y Cynulliad i barhau i ganiatáu i'r awdurdodau lleol gael y rhyddid a'r hyblygrwydd i benderfynu a ddylent gydweithio yn y dyfodol, a gyda phwy y dylent gydweithio. Drwy hynny gellid rhoi democratiaeth leol ar waith wrth benderfynu, er mwyn cyflawni'r canlyniadau gorau yn lleol neu'n rhanbarthol, fel y bo'n briodol.

Yn gywir



Y Cynghorydd Ken Harris
Cadeirydd Partneriaeth Gwastraff Canol Cymru

³ Adroddiad Simpson: "Local, Regional, National: What Services are Delivered Where?"

Abigail Philips,
Clerk to the Petitions Committee,
National Assembly for Wales,
Cardiff bay
Cardiff
CF99 1NA

Central Wales Waste Partnership response to the petition to review Prosiect Gwyrdd

I, on behalf of the Central Wales Waste Partnership and representing Ceredigion and Powys County Councils, welcome the opportunity to respond to the petition regarding energy from waste.

Ceredigion and Powys County Councils, like all Local Authorities in Wales, are committed to recycling as much municipal waste as possible and are striving to achieve the recycling targets set out in the Welsh Government's waste strategy "Towards Zero Waste". The statutory requirements set out in Towards Zero Waste will penalise all authorities that fail to recycle the minimum percentage of municipal waste.

Both Ceredigion and Powys have invested large sums of money to improve dry recycling and separate food waste collections in recent years. However, despite the best efforts of Local authorities and the improvements to services there still remains an element of the waste stream that cannot be recycled. In addition, although Local Authorities encourage all residents to participate in recycling collection services, some choose not to do so and therefore some otherwise recyclable materials end up in the residual waste stream. Although it is possible to extract some of these recyclable materials it is not possible to extract 100%, as recyclable materials that are put in the residual waste stream by the householder often becomes contaminated and is no longer suitable for recycling. Currently most of the residual waste arising in Central Wales is sent to landfill.

Any biodegradable materials that are landfilled break down to produce landfill gas, a combination of gases including predominantly carbon dioxide and methane. Landfill is therefore seen as a contributor to the UK's greenhouse gas emissions. Research has shown that a better method of disposing of residual waste is to treat it thermally to produce energy, thus displacing the need for fossil fuels and improving the UK's position in relation to climate change.

Energy from Waste includes a wide range of possible thermal technologies which would include "incineration". Emissions from such plants are tightly regulated by the environment agency and the CWWP does not consider there to be any significant health impacts associated with energy from waste facilities. In 2004, DEFRA published a report entitled "Review of Environmental and Health Effects of waste management: Municipal Solid Waste and Similar wastes". This report concluded

that “published epidemiological studies of the health of communities living in the vicinity of incinerators failed to establish any convincing links between incinerator emissions and adverse effects on public health; specifically no impact was demonstrated on the incidence of cancer, respiratory health symptoms or reproductive outcomes”.

For certain separated wastes (such as low grade paper, some plastics, mixed textiles and fabrics, and treated or coated wood) energy recovery can provide the best environmental option⁴ and a ban on burning recyclable materials could therefore have a negative effect on the environment. The CWWP also considers that a ban on burning recyclable materials in Wales is unnecessary as the WG recycling targets of up to 70% sufficiently encourages local authorities to recycle as much waste as possible. A recent compositional analysis carried out by WRAP⁵ found that 74% of Wales’ municipal waste is recyclable or compostable. Compliance with the 70% WG recycling target would therefore effectively mean that there is very little non-recyclable waste available in the residual waste stream.

The WG has encouraged local authorities to collaborate in order to procure waste treatment services. Collaboration can realise savings in procurement costs by sharing resources, costs and expertise. Combining local authority wastes also has the potential to reduce waste treatment costs through increasing economies of scale. Alternatively, local solutions can also deliver benefits in terms of reduced waste miles and local employment.

It’s the responsibility of each local authority or partnership to balance the benefits of scale against waste miles. The technical, environmental and financial aspects, including any benefits of localised solutions can be considered as waste management proposals are evaluated in the procurement process, with the aim of ensuring the most appropriate outcome for individual circumstances. However, the solutions presented during such procurement processes are largely driven by the market.

It should also be noted that it is not always possible or appropriate for waste treatment facilities to be located within each authority’s county boundaries. The recycling targets set by Welsh Government mean that residual tonnages left for treatment processes are diminished in each county. It therefore means that facilities of all technologies are often only viable when procured by a number of authorities coming together in a Hub. In these instances ‘local’ then means ‘within the region’ rather than within the authority boundaries and some waste miles are therefore inevitable, with the outcome of redefining what is considered to be “local”.

⁴ *“Ecological Footprint Impact of the Welsh Waste Strategy”, Arup, 2009*

⁵ *“The Composition of Municipal Solid Waste in Wales”, WRAP, 2010*

There is a clear steer from Government that collaboration will become more important in the future⁶. However, Local Authorities are currently free to choose whether to collaborate and make informed procurement decisions after careful consideration of all the available options. Such decisions should be and are made on a case by case basis. The CWWP strongly believes that collaboration works where all partners see clear and equal benefits and would urge the National Assembly to continue to allow the local authorities the freedom and flexibility to decide whether or with whom to collaborate in the future so that the local democratic decision making process works to deliver the best outcomes locally or regionally as appropriate.

Yours sincerely



Councillor Ken Harris
Chairman of the Central Wales Waste Partnership

⁶ *The Simpson Report: "Local, Regional, National: What Services are Delivered Where?"*