

**Submission by Wales for Europe
to the Senedd Committee on
Culture, Communications, Welsh Language, Sport
and International Relations**

1. CHAPTER 1

2. Rationale:

3. Wales for Europe wishes to submit the following in response to the Committee's request for information on the effects of Brexit and the new EU-UK relationship on individuals and professional life in Wales.
4. We are aware that your enquiry also includes the effects of Covid. We have tried to concentrate on the clear effects of Brexit. That does not mean that there is not some overlap (and indeed some of our respondents do state this) but Covid and its effects must not be used as a smokescreen for effects which are clearly Brexit related.
- 5. Who are we?**
6. Wales for Europe is an independent, cross-party and non-party, collaborative grassroots organisation.
7. We believe that Wales and the UK are inextricably European by virtue of geography, shared history, culture, trade and values.
8. We believe that continued close cooperation with the European Union, its member states and other European organisations is in the best interests of the continued prosperity of the whole continent.
9. Wales for Europe Ltd, company number 12615465, a political organisation.
10. Address: Temple of Peace, King Edward VII Avenue, Cardiff CF10 3AP.
11. General email: hello@walesforeurope.org.
12. Website: www.walesforeurope.org which contains articles and details of our current campaigns.
13. Many of the contributions below are abridged versions of articles written to mark the fifth anniversary of the Brexit referendum. The fuller versions and also an article by our former Chairman Geraint Talfan Davies on where we are today can be seen on our website.
<https://www.walesforeurope.org/articles/22-06-2021/>

15. CHAPTER 2

16. The effect of Brexit on EU and British citizens' lives and rights - including loss of Freedom of Movement.

A) The effect on EU citizens living in Wales.

17. *Ward Sterk is a representative of the 3 million, a trustee of Settled and a Director of Wales for Europe. He is a Dutch citizen. For the series five years on- Voices from Wales he wrote:*

18. "Brexit made EU citizens in the UK 'immigrants' – but Wales is still my home. The outcome of the 2016 referendum was a crude awakening for EU citizens in the UK, in particular those settled here for decades. The sudden realisation of how much we had taken for granted came as a shock. If that wasn't enough, language used subsequently by leading politicians to describe EU citizens in the UK, including by the PM ('queue jumpers', 'citizens of nowhere'), and the abandonment of the promise to automatically ringfence the rights of EU citizens resident here, was a further blow.

19. We had presumed to be fully part of UK society, unalienable, and that the country we had chosen to be our home would not renege on international treaties and alliances. We were reminded again that we were immigrants, whose rights could be revoked if this was politically expedient.

20. The UK had previously been a strong promoter of the free market, which brought along free movement of labour. As labour is enacted by people, this meant free movement of people and we were foremost citizens of one EU nation with a home in another, not immigrants.

21. Our homes were paid for by jobs and housed families. Jobs meant paying taxes, NI contributions and rates. We were net contributors in other words. All we lacked was voting rights for Westminster elections and UK wide referendums, including the EU membership referendum, but in any other aspect we could have been UK citizens as well."

22. *Husband and wife Renate Jahn and Jo Desch, Tregarth, who are German citizens have lived in Wales for many years. Their contribution over decades has been to education in Wales at secondary and university level as both teachers/lecturers and examiners. Renate Jahn writes:*

23. "We obviously had to apply for settled status which made us aware that, to some extent, we are second class citizens now. The application which we carried out via the EU exit app went without problems. I received confirmation of my settled status within two days, Jo had to wait for a fortnight, even though he had spent much longer here than I did. We expected to be asked for our status for NHS treatment, but they obviously have a data base they can refer to. The public body in

Wales for whom I do contracted work has not asked for proof of my settled status either.”

24. Wales for Europe notes: We are concerned that there is no paper document to prove settled status and online confirmation might fail leading to discrimination against citizens with Settled Status, e.g. in obtaining employment or housing..

25. *Padraig J. O'Brien an Irish Labour party member from Merthyr Tydfil writes.*

26. “I contemplated applying for a British passport in 2015. By June 23rd 2016, I was not so sure. Almost every truism about Britain turned on its head. A campaign of outlandish claims about foreigners (some of whom were not even EU nationals to begin), a willingness to blame the EU and Europeans for poor public health conditions, stretched public resources, crime. Being Irish, I was spared any abuse. Not so lucky was a Portuguese PA I occasionally worked with, who was asked on the morning of the 24th June 2016 when she was 'going home'. Why was that? The answer can only be deep-seated racism. Discovering that the opposition could not make up its mind, that the trade union movement was divided on whether to defend this right- wing stunt or wave it through, did not help. The whole experience is deeply unsettling and leaves me wonder what sort of a society I am living in.”

27. *Carmen Dietz is originally from Germany and with her Welsh husband Gareth Wyn Thomas trade under the name CMD Consultants, Language and Intercultural Training, Swansea, Wales. She writes:*

28. “We used to organise and deliver Europe-funded training courses under the Comenius programme (now Erasmus +) for staff in education. Our participants came from Germany, Spain, Finland, France, Latvia, Lithuania, Denmark, Poland. The language of instruction was English - one of their motives for coming was to improve their English skills. We can no longer deliver our training because of Brexit.

29. My Settled Status application took three weeks to decide - although I have been living here for 30 years now and have had a National Insurance number from the start. I have now been granted British Citizenship - but that application took almost 7 months.”

30. Wales for Europe notes: There is a particular problem for British citizens living in the EU and who have an EU wife or partner (and vice versa). They and their partner have to return to the UK (or EU country if currently in the UK) before the end of March 2022 or their partner's settled status application in that country will not be guaranteed.

31. B) The effect on British citizens' rights

i) Barbara Clark writes

32. "I was an active member of Swansea for Europe but last year, in the wake of the last general election and final exit from the EU, I made the difficult decision to move to France in order to retain my EU involvement and rights. I am now registered in France under the Withdrawal Agreement Transition arrangements and will eventually seek French citizenship in order to regain my EU citizenship that was taken away from me. I feel so sad for those who cannot do this.

33. I appreciate all that the Welsh Government is trying to do to retain good links with the EU including Erasmus-style study arrangements. The ability to spend 6 months to a year in various EU countries learning languages etc. was a significant reason for my exit from the UK."

34. ii) Mandi Abrahams from Anglesey writes:

35. "The main feeling that I have is of a total disconnect, a sense of being cut off, and of being sucked into the dominant land mass of England. The Internal Market Act clearly signals this. The explanatory paper on the impacts of Brexit did not even mention Holyhead Port which has been adversely affected by Brexit and the proposed Freeport will not make up for this.

36. One other thing. In support of our small nation, I buy as much local or Welsh produce as possible. I would dearly love to see a "Made in Wales" logo to reinforce our food sector, to English visitors, for exporters and for residents of Wales too."

37. iii) The Rev Jim Clarke, Llanfairpwllgwyngyll writes:

38. "Brexit means I have lost important rights as a citizen of the European Union. As I am retired and have family commitments, I am unlikely to take the opportunity to work and retire and to live permanently in an EU member country. However, I have secured these rights for myself by applying to become an Irish citizen. This is possible because my grandparents came from Co. Wicklow. This step is not possible for many Welsh people. Unfortunately, citizenship is not transferable to my children (now adults) who would be more likely to take up these rights. The loss of the privileges of European citizenship is a great loss to us and to the generations that follow us."

39. C) Loss of Freedom of Movement and its effect on the creative industries.

i) Catherine Linstrum, a well-known writer and film director who lives in Wales notes:

40. "Brexit has negatively impacted on my work in the creative industries, with added costs and bureaucracy to make collaboration with/travel to EU countries no longer cost effective.
41.
I have become increasingly convinced that an independent Wales joining the EU is the only way to put us all back in the same footing as the rest of Europe and in effect to restore what we lost after the 2016 referendum."
42. ii) *On behalf of The Lighthouse Theatre Ltd, Swansea, Sonia Beck writes:*
43. "Lighthouse Theatre are based in Swansea but tour nationally and internationally. Brexit immediately prevents us from collaborating with European arts organisations or taking our work to Europe if any fees or remuneration are involved. It also prevents us from engaging practitioners or associate artists based in Europe and working with them in Wales.
44. The directors of Lighthouse Theatre work on a freelance basis as tour directors in the European travel market. Brexit has terminated our right to work in Europe including with educational travel groups, so cutting off a large section of our yearly income, with which we partially fund our arts business.
45. We are currently considering a partial relocation to Ireland as the only future for our industries, which could be a big loss to ourselves, and we think, to our loyal audiences in Wales."
- 46. D) Restriction on employment opportunities because of loss of freedom of movement**
- i) *Paul Grawe writes:*
47. "I personally feel the effects of Brexit on a daily basis.
48. I am a fairly recently qualified teacher of English as a second language. As a EU citizen I could apply for work in any member country with the minimum of red tape and paperwork and no limitations on further employment beyond the current contract.
49. Now it is necessary to pay for and apply for visas, complete time-consuming paperwork and be subject to limitations as to the work you accept and the time you can remain in the country. This has created insecurity and instability and made it extremely difficult to arrange work compared to EU membership.
50. I ask the Senedd to consider the barriers to exchange and employment between Wales and the EU created by Brexit. I would like the Senedd

to work with the EU to reduce the barriers to a minimum and create an environment in which security of employment, stable residency and opportunity for exchange can flourish. This could be through reciprocal employment/work visa agreements and recognition and promotion of the value of cultural and language exchange.”

51. *Wales for Europe notes: Recent advertisements from agencies who employ teachers of English as a second or foreign language abroad are now beginning to specify that applicants must have EU citizenship.*

52. E) Problems arising from the end of Comenius+ and similar schemes’ arrangements with the EU.

53. Senedd members will be well aware of the restrictions in employment opportunities caused by the loss of European projects and Comenius programmes. Angharad Shaw of Aberystwyth University and Gareth Roberts, a former modern languages adviser, have written about the benefits of European projects and exchanges in articles in the series “Five years on - Voices from Wales”.

i) Gareth Roberts also writes:

54. “Travel and work restrictions caused by Brexit are already limiting the period that Modern Languages students can spend abroad. The traditional “Year abroad” (in reality 8-9 months plus an opportunity to travel) is no longer possible because of the 90-day rule and visa requirements for working permits (particularly slow for Spain at the moment).

55. Reviving, funding and arranging the necessary permissions would be a useful adjunct to any Comenius+ substitute scheme in Wales.”

57. CHAPTER 3

58. “Supply Chain problems” / Restrictions on the movement of Goods

59. We now concentrate on problems that arise from the fact that UK is no longer in “the single market” - problems which are currently called “supply chain problems” in the media.

- i) *Sally Stephenson of ‘The Pencil Case’ shop in Cowbridge is explicit and advises her customers that her supply chain difficulties are due to Brexit. Her website and notices state:*

60. “Like many retailers, we have been hit by Brexit-related supply chain issues. We are currently out of stock ofand are expecting them to arrive by

61. *For the series ‘Five years on - Voices from Wales’ she wrote:*

62. “Thanks to Brexit, it is now much more difficult – and more expensive – for UK businesses, large and small, to trade with the biggest market on the planet. I sell stationery and local school uniforms. A large part of my range is imported from Europe – Romania, France, Germany, Italy and, of course, I buy plenty of products from UK businesses. Customers will inevitably have to pay more in the shops. It is just being disguised at the moment by the Covid pandemic.

63. Now the UK has finally left the EU, businesses are facing another wave of unwelcome cost and complexity. The inevitable – and utterly predictable – consequence of the UK choosing to leave the Single Market and Customs Union is that we now have to deal with customs charges and a mountain of red tape. It is now so expensive and complicated to sell to or buy from Europe that many UK businesses have decided not to bother anymore.”

A) *iii) Mark Rosental, director of an auto repair and MOT garage on Ynys Mon, writes:*

64. “As one of the directors of Star Autocare Ltd, an auto repair and MOT garage here on Ynys Mon, we have had significant problems following leaving the EU. These are especially noticeable in the logistics, supply chain and increased costs for spare parts in the motor industry. As a business dealing with many older vehicles due to the low GDP in our area and the acidic nature of this island surrounded by seas and high winds, we are constantly having long delays in getting parts from Europe and America. With these delays we have vehicles stripped down and immobile waiting for these replacements. Our typical lead time on parts has been between 2 to 10 days and this means a significant reduction in efficiency of the business.”

A) *iv) Stephen Boyd from Llanrhaeadr-ym-Mochnant runs a small online business (model shop). He writes:*

65. "I used to sell worldwide but now restrict most sales to UK only. This is partly Covid related (too many parcels were going missing) but also due to the extra hassle and red tape exporting to the EU and the new EU VAT regulations.
66. A tracked package to Germany took 2 weeks to leave the UK and 3 weeks to get to my customer. Some post office staff don't seem to understand the new requirements.
67. As for imports from the EU a supplier in the Netherlands will no longer ship to the UK.
68. A German supplier advised us in January that they had stopped shipping to the UK due to the extra paperwork. They have just changed that policy, but shipping charges are now much higher. Generally shipping costs for imports from Germany have doubled. Customs charges have complicated the issue.
69. The mass of red tape now required to return damaged goods means this is no longer practical.
70. Some goods are now prohibited (such as spray paints), others require safety certificates / data sheets whereas there was no problem importing these before 1/1/21."

A) *v) Bleddyn Wynn-Jones of Crûg Farm Plants, Caernarfon, and an Honorary Fellow of Bangor University for services to botany, writes:*

71. "We are a horticultural enterprise that diversified out of agriculture over 30 years ago. This has been very successful in fulfilling the then governmental advice, of aiming businesses at e-commerce and export.
72. While the benefits of our business may not have been entirely reflected by our own balance sheets, it has been to the beneficial trade brought into our area. We were able to attract a sizeable quantity of high spending foreign visitors to stay in the area both to purchase our unique collection of plants, as well as visiting our gardens and to observe how to grow the new introductions we were bringing into cultivation. That, as well as utilising local transport to export our produce.
73. We have also lost the ability to promote our produce in the EU, as we were regularly invited to events in many of the EU countries and hosted at their expense. This alone would have dented our profitability had we had to pay for such prestigious promotions.
74. Since the Brexit legislation on export has come into place, we have not been able to trade with the EU at all, not even a blade of grass has

been able to be exported. This despite us working closely with the Animal and Plant Health Agency (APHA). No realistic/practical suggestions on how to proceed with exports have been suggested, that do not add 100-200% additional costs to a typical order to the EU.

75. As regards to what support we require. We require the British Government to get on and sort out the import/export strategy that is workable between ourselves and the EU, without delay.”
76. *vi) David Lea Wilson, a director of Halen Môn, has written extensively about the problems his company has faced (see ‘Five years on - a view from Wales’), and in contributions to the business section of the Daily Post where he is a guest contributor. He writes:*
77. “There are things happening in North Wales that some ascribe to the Covid effect but actually are linked to Brexit. I have experience of three of our own staff returning to the EU and no one replacing them. I see a shortage of delivery drivers, a summer shortage of staff, and huge challenges exporting to the EU. The impact is yet to be felt to the full by agriculture, which still gets subsidy for a year or two.”
78. *He continues by highlighting the probable lack of availability of certain types of food for consumers:*
79. Let’s look ahead to Christmas as a celebration, after Covid begins to loosen its grip on parts of the world. The essence of Christmas food is a turkey and ‘pigs in blankets’. Don’t assume that either will be available at similar prices. I’m told that the pigs in blankets are very labour intensive and are made at this time of year onwards and frozen ready for use. There simply isn’t the spare labour in food factories to do that as before. And as for turkeys, there is expected to be a turkey shortage.”
80. *In his column printed in the Daily Post on Thursday 26 August 2021, he draws attention to problems encountered by Dr Zig, a business based in Bangor: This is Paola Dyboski-Bryant’s story. She has confirmed to Wales for Europe that she wishes to contribute to this submission. She has dual British and Italian nationality- which means she can still work in the EU.*
81. “This month I want to highlight an award-winning business, Dr Zigs, who make giant bubble kits. Paola’s story is heart-breaking.
82. She is in Paris, and has been for a while, as she tries to set up a business that can service her European customers and maintain jobs in North Wales. She has had to set up an import/ export company in France, get VAT numbers for each country they import into, and now look at assembly of kits elsewhere in Europe not Wales. The paperwork trail to do that is horrendous, let alone the cost and time away from focusing on the business.

83. Today's Brexit-inspired challenge is an email from Kuhne and Nagel who are one of the biggest transport companies. This says they are suspending all deliveries from UK to France because of the problems. Those bubbles developed in Wales need to reach Europe. Emails like this question whether any small business has a future exporting. And whether those who voted to "leave" realised what they were causing to happen. We can't blame the EU!"

A) vii) Problems with sending charitable donations abroad. David Lea-Wilson outlines problems with sending charitable donations abroad, highlighted by Paola from Dr Zig. She also is also keen for this problem to be more widely known:

84. "Paola was telling me how she worked with the charity Pobl i Bobl (People to People) to organise aid packs and boxes going to refugee camps in France, Greece and elsewhere. These brought joy to people in crisis as parcels could contain clothes and toys. But all that has had to end because the British Government didn't negotiate an exemption for aid. This means that every item in every box needs a Certificate of origin. This is beyond impossible in practice, so the aid has stopped. The rush to exit Europe meant this was overlooked."

85. **In conclusion**, Brexit has caused significant problems for businesses (often small businesses) who either export to or import from the EU (as well as charities). This has an effect on them and their viability, but also affects consumer choice and availability and discriminates against those receiving charitable aid.

ENDS