

The Assembly Commission

Meeting Venue:
**Presiding Officer's office, 4th floor – Ty
Hywel**

Meeting date:
2 February 2012

Meeting time:
10:30

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



For further information please contact:

Carys Evans, 029 2089 8598
Secretariat

Agenda
AC(4)2012(1)

1. Introduction

Introduction and apologies

Declarations of interest

Minutes of the previous meeting (Pages 1 – 4)

2. Assembly Commission Equality Plan 2012–16 (Pages 5 – 26)

3. Reviewing the effectiveness of the Assembly Commission (Pages 27 – 31)

4. Update on Wales Legislation Online (Pages 32 – 37)

5. Assembly staff reward strategy (Pages 38 – 42)

6. Management Board report to the Commission (Pages 43 – 61)

7. Assembly Commission rolling programme (Pages 62 – 63)

8. Any other business

Agenda Item 1c

The Assembly Commission

Meeting Venue: **Presiding Officer's office, 4th floor – Ty Hywel**

Meeting date: **Thursday, 24 November 2011**

Meeting time: **09: – 11:30**

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Minutes: AC(4)2011(6)

Committee Members:

Rosemary Butler (Chair)
Peter Black
Angela Burns
Sandy Mewies
Rhodri Glyn Thomas

Officials present:

Claire Clancy, Chief Executive & Clerk of the Assembly (Official)
Adrian Crompton, Director of Assembly Business (Official)
Dianne Bevan, Chief Operating Officer (Official)
Keith Bush, Director of Legal Services (Official)
Craig Stephenson, Principal Private Secretary to the Presiding Officer (Official)
Carys Evans, Principal Commission Secretary (Official)
Non Gwilym (Official)
Brian Davidge, Head of ICT and Broadcasting (Official)

Others in attendance:

Tim Knighton, Independent Adviser

1. Introduction

1(i) Introduction and apologies

It was noted that the Commission's budget was agreed by the Assembly on 16 November 2011. Angela Burns AM was thanked for leading the work on the budget and presenting it effectively to the Assembly.

1(ii) Declarations of interest

There were no declarations of interest.

1(iii) Minutes of the previous meeting

The minutes were formally agreed.

2. Bilingual Services

At its meeting on 14 July 2011, the Commission agreed to consult on a draft National Assembly for Wales (Official Languages) Bill and Bilingual Services Scheme and to provide a translated Record of Plenary Proceedings subject to a sustainable arrangement being found at reasonable cost.

Following the pre-legislative public consultation, officials had analysed the responses, which related to both the draft Bill and Scheme. Respondents had suggested a number of revisions to both the Bill and Scheme. The effort made to encourage participation in the consultation was noted and the responses were welcomed by the Commission.

The Commission decided that a duty to provide a fully bilingual Record of Plenary Proceedings would not be included on the face of the Bill. The other proposed revisions to the draft Bill were agreed. The Commission considered the possible revisions to the Scheme and made a number of suggestions which they asked officials to reflect in the revised draft.

Consideration was given to the comments made during the consultation in relation to the Record, and to investigations undertaken into the latest technological developments to assist with translation services.

The Commission decided that from January 2012, the written record of plenary proceedings would be published, within five working days, with English language contributions translated into Welsh and vice versa. This would be achieved using a combination of machine translation and proof reading, with in-house control and editing to ensure that the published Record met the Assembly's existing standards in terms of style, consistency and quality. Precise cost would depend on a range of factors including the speed at which technological advance increases the accuracy of machine translation but would, in any case, not exceed £95,000 per annum.

The revised draft Bill, supporting Explanatory Memorandum, and proposed Scheme would be introduced in January 2012.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM was authorised by the Commission to be the Member in Charge of the Bill. Commissioners thanked Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM and officials for the work undertaken to date. Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM also thanked the Welsh Language Board for the assistance it had provided.

Action: Rhodri Glyn Thomas AM to finalise any pre-introduction amendments to the Bill and Scheme in consultation with Angela Burns AM, who will be responsible for ensuring relevant financial provisions are included in the accompanying Explanatory Memorandum.

3. Carbon Management Strategy Update

In November 2009 the last Commission agreed a Carbon Management strategy. This included an ambition to reduce annual emissions by 8 per cent for energy and 3 per cent annual for business travel, and to achieve carbon neutrality by 2015.

The Commission welcomed the 11.1 per cent reduction in energy emissions that had achieved in Year 2 across the Assembly estate, equating to savings of 182 tonnes of carbon and £50,000 in costs. Overall, emissions have been reduced by 19 per cent against a target of 40 per cent by 2015.

Commissioners noted the good progress to date and reaffirmed its commitment to the Carbon Management strategy in order to maintain the Assembly's status as a leading parliamentary body on sustainability issues, and agreed in principle to proceed with a pilot project to replace the windows in Tŷ Hywel with better designed, part-automated models to support efficient natural ventilation.

Action: Officials to develop a detailed costing of the pilot project for approval by Management Board.

4. ICT Future Service Provision

ICT services at the Assembly are currently provided by Atos under the Merlin contract, which will expire in 2014. The Assembly has no direct contractual relationship with Atos, with services instead provided under a Memorandum of Understanding signed by the Commission and Welsh Ministers at separation in 2007. Following the UNO project, which created an independent ICT platform, the Assembly's ICT systems are no longer integrated with those of the Welsh Government, giving the Assembly greater choice in terms of its future ICT provision.

The Commission endorsed the vision for the future delivery of ICT services, and the range of models by which these services might be delivered. It was agreed that officials would continue to explore the agreed options.

5. Supplementary Budget 2011–12

In its budget for 2011–12, the Commission included separate funds relating to election costs, but made it clear that any excess would be returned to the Welsh block through a supplementary budget.

The Assembly Members' budget included £3.460m, based on an estimated turnover of 30 Members at an average cost of £115k per Member, and the Assembly Services budget included £0.655m. These budget allocations were ringfenced for costs relating to the election. It was noted that actual turnover of 23 Members had resulted in an underspend of £1.8m against the Assembly Members' budget, and of £0.2m against the Assembly Services budget.

The Commission agreed that £2.0m would be returned to the Welsh block through a supplementary budget motion.

6. Portfolio Holder Updates

Commissioners provided an update on activities within their portfolios.

Sandy Mewies AM, Commissioner with responsibility for equalities, said that she would be working with the Equalities Team on the development of the Commission's equalities scheme and the Access Fund for Members.

All Commissioners commented on the feedback they had received from Members and their staff in relation to ICT problems and agreed that it was not acceptable that the problems had persisted over such a lengthy period. Peter Black explained that a meeting had been held at senior level with BT who had given assurances that the broadband problems, which had been UK-wide, would be resolved within about 10 days. Other problems should be resolved once the move to UNO Version 2 (V2) had been completed for everyone, with subsequent fixes for the casework system. If problems remain following these solutions, officials were asked to escalate the complaint, working with the Welsh Government.

7. Assembly Commission Rolling Programme

The rolling programme was noted.

8. Any Other Business

There was no other business.



AC(4)2012(1) Paper 2 part 1

Date: Thursday 2 February

Time: 10:30–12:30

Venue: Presiding Officer's office

Author name and contact number: Ross Davies, ext 8197

Assembly Commission's Equality Plan 2012–16

1.0 Purpose and summary

- 1.1 In line with the Equality Act 2010, the Assembly Commission must publish equality objectives by April 2012. The Equality Team has worked with colleagues across the organisation to develop the attached Equality Plan 2012–16.
- 1.2 The Plan covers our legal duties in relation to equality, our corporate ethos, roles and responsibilities, our priority objectives, consultation methodology and an action plan. The Assembly has worked hard to embed equality in our work. While many of the actions in the plan are new, others build upon current good practice. The plan is attached as Annex A.
- 1.3 The Equality Team will be responsible for supporting and monitoring the progress of the actions outlined in the Plan. Services across the organisation will be asked to provide evidence of how they are taking forward actions. This will inform the Annual Equality Report which will be produced each April for scrutiny by the Assembly Commission.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1 The Assembly Commission is asked to comment on and agree the Equality Plan 2012–16.

3.0 Consultation

- 3.1 Throughout October and November 2011, the Equality Team produced surveys and held focus groups in order to gather feedback from Assembly Members, Assembly Member Support Staff, Assembly Commission staff, contracted staff and the public. A number of focus groups were held across Wales with diverse groups. Further details of the consultation work that was undertaken is available in the Plan.

4.0 Discussion

- 4.1 Under the Equality Act 2010, the Assembly Commission is a non-devolved public body. This means that as an organisation, we have responsibilities under the Public Sector Equality Duties set by the UK Government, as opposed to those set by the Welsh Government. However, where we deem it appropriate, such as the duty to produce an Equality Plan, we will act in accordance with the more prescriptive Public Sector Equality Duties set by the Welsh Government.
- 4.2 It is worth noting that equality issues are also covered within Chapter 9 of the Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances. The Remuneration Board commissioned the Assembly's Equality Team to undertake an equality impact screening when the Determination was developed and we would anticipate we will continue to support the Board in this way.

5.0 Risk assessment

- 5.1 If the Assembly Commission did not publish an Equality Plan with objectives by April 2012 we would be at risk of non-compliance with the Public Sector Equality Duty under the Equality Act 2010.
- 5.2 The Assembly would be likely to face reputational risks if a plan were not published by the April deadline.

This paper has been deemed not suitable for publication in line with the Commission's rules for conduct of business.

Document is Restricted

Agenda Item 3

Comisiwn y Cynulliad

Assembly Commission

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru
National
Assembly for
Wales



AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 3 Part 1) Reviewing the effectiveness of the Commission

Date: Thursday 2 February 2012

Time: 10:30–12:30

Venue: Presiding Officer's office

Author name and contact number: Ian Summers, ext 1824

Reviewing the effectiveness of the Assembly Commission

1.0 Purpose and summary of issues

- 1.1 The new Governance Principles and Supporting Provisions, agreed by the Commission last June, commit the Commission to evaluating its own effectiveness from time to time (that is the effectiveness of the Commission as a body as opposed to the organisation which the Commission oversees). The Commission agreed to undertake the first formal evaluation after about twelve months.
- 1.2 The purpose of this paper is to seek the Commission's agreement for the timescale of the first evaluation and to initiate a discussion on the proposed methodology.
- 1.3 From the current financial year (2011–12), the Commission's annual report and accounts will have to contain a "Governance Statement" which, amongst other things, will describe the work of the Commission and senior management. It will also need to provide information on the effectiveness of the Commission itself.

2.0 Recommendations

- 2.1 The Commission is invited to:
 - i. agree that its first evaluation should take place in November or December 2012;
 - ii. agree the outline methodology for the evaluation stated in this paper (paragraphs 3.4 to 3.8 below) and ask officials to work up more detailed proposals in collaboration with the independent advisers; and

- iii. note that (i) and (ii) above will need to be summarised in the Governance Statement to be published with the 2011–12 accounts.

3.0 Discussion

Timing

3.1 The Commission will almost certainly need to devote time in the late summer and early autumn of 2012 to its 2013–14 budget. It might therefore be most productive for a substantive discussion on the evaluation of effectiveness to take place in November or December 2012. This timetable would mean that the Assembly’s reaction to the Commission’s budget could be taken into account as part of the evaluation.

Methodology

3.2 The evaluation would focus on the role and responsibilities of the Assembly Commission as the governing board for the organisation and on the interface between the Commission and Assembly Members and staff.

3.3 The key responsibilities of the Commission as a board are to:

- i. provide the organisation with leadership and clear strategic direction, acting corporately in the interest of the Assembly as a whole;
- ii. request appropriate financial resources from the Assembly to discharge the Commission’s statutory functions and deliver its strategic objectives¹;
- iii. hold the Chief Executive and senior management to account for delivery of the strategy and the running of the organisation;

¹ Once the resources have been authorised by the Assembly, it is the Chief Executive’s duty, as the Commission’s Principal Accounting Officer, to ensure that they are used in a regular and proper manner and having regard to the need to secure value for money. She is personally accountable to the Assembly and to the PAC in particular in respect of this duty.

Reviewing the effectiveness of the Commission

- iv. ensure that clear lines of communication between the Commission and Assembly Members exist and are operating effectively – Members are the Commission’s key stakeholders and therefore should be made aware of the Commission’s key decisions and the reasons for them, and should also have a clear route for expressing their views and concerns; and
 - v. account to the Assembly for their stewardship of the organisation.
- 3.4 Annex A gives some examples of questions that could be addressed as part of the evaluation of the Commission’s discharge of the above responsibilities. The list is not exhaustive, and will require consideration by the Commission and officials. It is probable that different questions will be appropriate for different stakeholders.
- 3.5 In terms of methodology, it is suggested that the Commission undertake a self-analysis, drawing evidence from the following sources:
- i. a short questionnaire completed by Commissioners, independent advisers, and a sample of Members and other stakeholders, including the Remuneration Board and staff (with questions tailored to each audience);
 - ii. review of correspondence with Members, Commission communications to and from Members, and oral and written Assembly questions to the Commission; and
 - iii. review of relevant media coverage, correspondence from the public and Freedom of Information requests.
- 3.6 To be credible, the evaluation would need to be objective. One way of achieving this would be to engage external consultants to devise the questionnaire, collate the evidence and write a short evaluation report. However, in the present financial climate, this may not be seen as a good use of resources. An alternative would be to ask Ian Summers to agree the specific approach, review the evidence and present the findings and conclusions to the Commission.

Examples of questions that could be addressed as part of the evaluation of the effectiveness of the Commission

- (i) Has the Commission agreed a strategy that includes clear strategic aims and objectives?
- (ii) Is it clear how “success” against those aims and objectives will be measured?
- (iii) Have the Commissioners acted corporately in the interests of the Assembly as a whole, including supporting collective decisions?
- (iv) Has the Commission contributed to the identification and management of key strategic risks for the organisation including giving its views on “risk appetite”?
- (v) Has the Commission provided clear direction and effective challenge to senior management?
- (vi) Has the Commission fully examined and considered spending plans submitted by senior management as a prelude to agreeing the budget to be submitted to the Assembly?
- (vii) Does the Commission receive and question reports on financial outturn compared with budget?
- (viii) Have the independent advisers effectively supported the Commission by providing robust, objective and constructive challenge?
- (ix) Has the Commission been effective in focusing its attention on key strategic issues rather than getting tied up with relatively minor operational matters?
- (x) Have Commissioners responded appropriately and effectively to queries from Assembly Members, including written and oral Assembly questions and other correspondence?
- (xi) To what extent has the work and approach of Assembly staff been successfully aligned with the objectives of the Commission?
- (xii) Do Assembly Members have a clear view of the Commission’s strategic direction and the reasons for key decisions affecting them as stakeholders?

- (xiii) Have the channels of communication between the Commission/senior management and Assembly Members operated effectively?
- (xiv) Is the Commission properly supported in its work by the senior management, the Principal Clerk to the Commission, and the Commission and Member Support Service?

Agenda Item 4

This paper has been deemed not suitable for publication in line with the Commission's rules for conduct of business.

Document is Restricted

Agenda Item 5

This paper has been deemed not suitable for publication in line with the Commission's rules for conduct of business.

Document is Restricted

This paper has been deemed not suitable for publication in line with the Commission's rules for conduct of business.

Document is Restricted

Agenda Item 6

Comisiwn y Cynulliad

Assembly Commission

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru
National
Assembly for
Wales



AC(4)2012(1) Paper 6

Date: 2 February 2012

Time: 10:30–12:30

Venue: Presiding Officer's office

Author name and contact number: Claire Clancy, ext 8233

Management Board report to the Commission

February 2012

Outline

1.0	Strategic goal – provide outstanding parliamentary support	2
2.0	Strategic goal – engage with the people of Wales	5
3.0	Strategic goal – promote Wales.....	5
4.0	Strategic goal – use resources wisely	6
5.0	Financial report.....	10
6.0	Other information	12

List of annexes

- Annex A: Freedom of information
- Annex B: Minutes of Audit Committee meeting (17 November 2011)

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

Assembly Commission's strategic goals

1.0 Strategic goal – provide outstanding parliamentary support

1.1 Assembly business update

1.2 Committees

a. Committees are beginning to come to the end of pieces of work they started in the summer. They have completed their evidence taking and either reported, or are in the process of producing their outputs, on:

- disability-related harassment in Wales;
- regeneration of town centres;
- children's oral health in Wales;
- community safety in Wales;
- stroke risk reduction;
- proposed reforms to Common Fisheries Policy; and
- proposed reforms to the Common Agricultural Policy.

b. In addition they have begun new work on:

- residential care for older people;
- the draft legislative proposals EU Structural Funds for 2014–2020;
- the implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009;
- the provision of affordable housing;
- the effectiveness of European Structural Funding in Wales;
- adoption; and
- public health implications of inadequate public toilet facilities.

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

- c. Committees are also planning and undertaking visits to inform their work, and exploring the use of external expertise where that appears to offer benefits.
- d. Members and staff are continuing to adjust to the flexible styles and working practices needed to support the level of committee activity. Some committees have already begun to evaluate the approach they take to their work as a committee, and to seek adjustments in the support they receive where they feel improvements can be made.

1.3 Assembly Bills

- a. Six Bills are expected to be introduced during the 2011–12 Assembly Year. The first Bill, the Local Government Byelaws (Wales) Bill, was introduced by the Welsh Government on 28 November. The Bill has been remitted to the Communities, Equality and Local Government Committee with a deadline for Stage 1 of 30 March 2012.
- b. The Assembly Commission is also expected to introduce the National Assembly for Wales (Official Languages) Bill in early 2012.

1.4 Draft Bill update

- a. The Food Hygiene Rating (Wales) Bill consultation closes on 7 March 2012. The Health and Social Services Committee have agreed to receive a briefing from Welsh Government officials to help inform their understanding of the Bill.

1.5 Members' Ballots

- a. On 19 October, the Presiding Officer announced that Ken Skates AM had won the Members' ballot to submit proposals for legislation. Ken Skates has since gained the Assembly's agreement to introduce a Member proposed Bill on Continuity from Care into Adult Life, in accordance with Standing Order 26.91.
- b. On 29 November, the Presiding Officer announced that Peter Black and Mohammad Asghar had won the Members' ballot to submit proposals for legislation. In accordance with Standing Order 26.91, Peter Black and Mohammad Asghar may now

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)

Management Board Report to the Commission

each seek the Assembly's agreement to introduce a Member proposed Bill on Park Homes and on Enterprise respectively (scheduled for 1 and 8 February).

1.6 Assembly Measures

- a. The Children and Young People Committee is undertaking a review of the implementation of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009.
- b. This is the first Assembly Measure to be reviewed and the Committee's report is expected to be published in Spring 2012.

1.7 Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee

- a. During the autumn 2011 term, the Constitutional and Legislative Affairs Committee considered 47 Statutory Instruments. It issued specific reports on 20 of them, including 15 on the merits of the instruments concerned. The Committee also considered 2 Legislative Consent Memorandums.
- b. Since September 2011, the Committee has been conducting an Inquiry into the issues surrounding the granting of powers to Welsh Ministers through Westminster Bills. The Committee has now concluded the Inquiry and has agreed an outline of its report and recommendations and will publish its final report in the current term.
- c. The Committee has also started an Inquiry into whether there should be a separate Welsh jurisdiction. Written evidence has been called for and oral evidence taking will start early in the new term. Among other witnesses, the Committee is hoping (with the assistance of the Director of Legal Services) that senior members of the judiciary will be willing to give oral evidence to the Inquiry.

1.8 Remuneration Board

- a. Between January – March the Remuneration Board will be considering the implementation of its Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances, based on feedback received from Assembly Members. Subject to the Board's discussions,

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

a revised Determination incorporating any amendments will be issued for 2012–13.

- b. In a letter to all Members in December 2011, the Chair of the Remuneration Board indicated that the Board would undertake a review of Members' pension arrangements. The review will take place during 2012–13 and any decisions will be published in 2014. This will be a participative review, and the Board will consult with all relevant stakeholders throughout the process.

2.0 Strategic goal – engage with the people of Wales

2.1 Wales Governance Centre

- a. The Wales Governance Centre's (WGC) move to the Pierhead is on schedule for the end of March at the latest. Meetings between WGC staff, Security and the Police will begin in late January/early February to discuss WGC staff responsibilities and duties for ensuring the security of the Assembly estate.
- b. The Deputy Presiding Officer, Adrian Crompton and Non Gwilym met with Professor Richard Wyn Jones to discuss the programme of events that the Centre will deliver in line with the Commission's goals. A draft programme will be available shortly.

3.0 Strategic goal – promote Wales

3.1 International activities update

- a. The Presiding Officer and Deputy Presiding Officer have recently welcomed a number of international dignitaries to the Assembly estate, including HRH Prince Seeiso (High Commissioner to Lesotho), HE Mr Ahmet Ünal Çeviköz (Turkish Ambassador to the United Kingdom), HE Mr Michael Žantovský (Czech Ambassador to the United Kingdom), and Mr Gordon Campbell (High Commissioner for Canada). Ms Anne Hedensted Steffensen, the Danish Ambassador to the UK, visited the Assembly in January to mark the beginning of the Danish Presidency of the Council of the EU.

3.2 British Council

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

- a. On 7 December, the Presiding Officer met with the Chair of the UK British Council, Sir Vernon Ellis. During the meeting, both parties [agreed a set of principles](#) which will underpin the future working relationship between the Assembly and British Council.

4.0 Strategic goal – use resources wisely

4.1 Audit Committee

- a. Minutes from the Audit Committee meeting on 17 November 2011 are attached at Annex B for information.

4.2 External challenge

- a. Commissioners will recall that we undertook a series of external challenge reviews in the autumn, as part of the budget process for 2012–13. These were led by the Commission’s independent advisers and two senior colleagues from other parliamentary bodies (the House of Lords and Houses of Oireachtas). They identified some positive approaches, including a number of areas where Assembly services are seen as exemplar – such as the Member learning and development programme; the standard contract of employment for Members’ support staff; and being the only parliamentary body to publish only electronic versions of the Record.
- b. As well as pointing to areas of real strength, Directors and Heads of Service took away some clear points for enhancing the performance of their areas. These are already influencing their plans and approach. For example:
 - being scrupulous about the accuracy and quality of written communication;
 - evaluating our efforts properly so that we are clear about how effective and successful we are being;
 - working more closely with Assembly Members to ensure that we are meeting their needs and doing things that they support;

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

- thinking beyond the immediate issues – get the right balance between short and long term planning;
- resisting gold-plating everything;
- keeping up the pressure on VFM, efficiency and performance;
- getting the balance right between in-house delivery and external contractors;
- managing peaks and troughs of work, and the flow of business, including using resources across teams effectively;
- considering the commercial potential of some of our work;
- using the skills and experience of our own people to bring on new talent; and
- finding ways to stimulate the desire for change and continuous improvement.

4.3 Facilities management contract – confidential until 25 January 2012

- a. Following a competitive tendering process, the facilities management contract has been awarded to Norland Managed Services Ltd for five years, with an option to extend for an additional one year period with effect from 1 April 2012. The facilities management contract includes maintenance and management of the Assembly estate, estates advice, professional services and window cleaning and involves expenditure of about £925,000 per annum.

4.4 Industrial action – 30 November

- a. On 30 November 2011, employees of the Commission joined other public sector workers across the UK in a national one-day strike over plans to change their pensions. An analysis of the impact across each of the Commission's service areas is shown in the following table:

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

Service	Number of staff	Number of staff on strike	Percentage of staff on strike
Commission & Member Support	21	6	28.57%
Committee Service	22	16	72.73%
Communications	22	4	18.18%
Estates & Facilities Management	26	10	38.46%
Financial Services	16	5	31.25%
Front of House	34	14	41.18%
Governance and Audit	16	6	37.50%
HR	12	2	16.67%
ICT	15	8	53.33%
Legal Services	11	4	36.36%
Legislation and Chamber Services	24	16	66.67%
Research Service	35	23	65.71%
Security	57	27	47.37%
TRS	41	33	80.49%
TOTAL	352	174	49.43%

- b. The public sector unions met in December to discuss the state of the negotiations and to start planning the next stage of the campaign, which we understand that PCS believes needs to include further strike action as early as possible in the New Year if progress cannot be made.

4.5 Staffing update

- a. Following an improved offer to security staff to change to new working hours, there were extra volunteers from those who had chosen to remain on the old patterns, although 12 staff remain on these patterns. In accordance with the Commission's preference to move to the new working patterns on a voluntary basis, a recruitment exercise was undertaken to ensure that we have sufficient staff to cover the Assembly's requirements, including seven day opening, and Plenary sessions or events that continue into the evening. Induction of the new entrants is ongoing and the new work patterns were introduced from 3 January 2012.

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

4.6 Severance scheme

- a. A limited voluntary exit scheme is being offered to all Assembly staff. The Scheme, which was launched during the first week of January, is designed to ensure that the Commission's staffing complement and structure is capable of supporting the delivery of outstanding parliamentary support during the Fourth Assembly by:
 - allowing the organisation to respond to shifts in our skill requirements;
 - improving workforce efficiency;
 - facilitating organisational change; and
 - delivering long-term savings where possible and avoiding additional costs in meeting skill shortages.
- b. Applications will be considered by a panel which will include one of the Commission's Independent Advisors. The Trade Union Side (TUS) has been invited to observe the panel. Decisions to allow staff to leave will be driven by business need and a robust set of criteria have been developed to support the assessment of applications.
- c. Consultation with TUS concerning the scheme has taken place.
- d. In addition to this scheme a separate voluntary exit scheme has been offered to the security team.
- e. Decisions will be made in the current financial year for both schemes and the costs arising from both schemes will fall to the current financial year (2011-2012).

4.7 Recruitment of ICT director

- a. Applications for the position of ICT Director closed on 12 December. A large field of applications was received. A robust assessment process was put in place to support the selection process. A stakeholder group of Assembly Members and Assembly staff will provide an opportunity for shortlisted

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)

Management Board Report to the Commission

candidates to meet with key stakeholders on 26 January before the formal interviews on 27 January.

- b. The interview panel will be Claire Clancy, Angela Burns AM, Peter Black AM and Tim Knighton (Director of Business Solutions Delivery at Companies House with responsibility for IT and change management services).

5.0 Financial report

- 5.1 At the end of December 2011, the Commission's £32.328m budget showed an actual position of £21.916m against a profile of £22.652m. Although this is an under spend of £0.736m (3 per cent), which exceeds the 2 per cent tolerance, there is no risk to the year end position. The most recent Assembly Services' forecast indicates the year end position will deliver an under spend nearer to 1 per cent, although much will depend on the progress of projects and the costs of restructuring in the last quarter. Project progress is a particular risk, with just over 40 per cent of year's work completed to date, leaving the balance to be finished in the last quarter. Regular reviews are held to mitigate this risk.
- 5.2 The Assembly Members' budget is showing a £0.65m under spend to date (6 per cent) which is expected to reduce to £0.5m or 4 per cent by the end of the year. This is an increase of £0.2m from that previously reported at the 24 November meeting. The fluctuation is caused by changing patterns of Members' claims and support staff turnover rates, both of which are showing different expenditure patterns to previous years. This is to be expected in the first year of the new Assembly following a 38 per cent change in membership.
- 5.3 In line with decisions at the November meeting, arrangements to return £1.8m unused election budget from the Assembly Member's budget will be included in the Welsh Government's 2011-12 Supplementary Budget. This provides the maximum opportunity for Welsh Government to utilise these funds. The balance of Assembly Services' £0.2m is to be managed through the year end outturn rather than formally relinquishing resource through the Supplementary Budget. This change provides the maximum benefit to the Commission to deliver its last quarter's work and has minimal impact on the Welsh Government.

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 6)
Management Board Report to the Commission

6.0 Other information

- 6.1 A list of information disclosed since the last report under the Freedom of Information Act is attached at **Annex A**. The full disclosure can be provided to Commissioners on request.

Annex A

Information released following access to information requests (October–December 2011)

- Information which relates to car parking at the Assembly
- Information about how Members make claims regarding office alterations expenses
- Cost of alterations to Presiding Officer and Deputy Presiding Officer offices
- Details about the previous voluntary exit scheme for staff
- Information regarding visitors' items confiscated on the Assembly Estate (Information released by South Wales Police)
- Information relating to the ICT server's and power consumption
- The usage of envelopes in the Assembly
- Information about *The Animal Welfare (Electronic Collars) (Wales) Regulations 2010*, and time spent debating in the Assembly
- Costs and other information relating to the removal of asbestos from the Assembly Estate
- Costs of Senedd maintenance
- Correspondence between the Assembly and an external supplier regarding furnishing the Presiding Officer's office

Information withheld following access to information requests (October–December 2011)

- Correspondence which contains personal data of an Assembly Member
- Some identifiable personal data relating to the previous voluntary exit scheme for staff

Annex B

Bwyllgor Archwilio Comisiwn y Cynulliad Assembly Commission Audit Committee

NAFWC ACAC

Minutes of 17 November 2011

Time: 11:00

Venue: Video Conference Room, Tŷ Hywel

Minutes of 17 November 2011 meeting

Present:

Richard Calvert (Independent Adviser) (Chair – Video Link)

Tim Knighton (Independent Adviser)

Professor Robert Pickard (Independent Adviser)

Angela Burns AM

Officials present:

Claire Clancy, Chief Executive and Clerk

Dianne Bevan, Chief Operating Officer

Nicola Callow, Head of Finance

Lynne Flux, Head of Internal Audit

Ian Pennington, KPMG

Richard Harries, Wales Audit Office

Mark Jones, Wales Audit Office

John Grimes, Head of Governance

Alison Rutherford, Secretariat

Item 1– Introductions

1. The Chair welcomed attendees. No apologies had been received.

Declaration of Interests

2. No interests were declared.

Minutes of meeting held on 07 July 2011

3. The minutes of the previous meeting were agreed.

Matters Arising

4. Claire Clancy informed the Committee that the new Head of Procurement, Jan Koziel, was now in post. He would be reviewing the existing

procurement processes, building on the development of the existing team, and reappraising the overall procurement programme.

Item 2 – Internal Audit – follow up on previous investigations

ACAC(10) Papers a – h. Summary of action on outstanding internal audit recommendations

5. The Committee considered the papers detailing updates on progress on recommendations of Internal Audit reports from the 2010/11 and the 2011/12 programme.
6. Lynne Flux said that she was pleased with progress against the recommendations, that there were mostly valid explanations for slippage, and that testing would be undertaken in due course to check the robustness of the work to implement the recommendations.

Payroll

7. On the Payroll audit recommendations, the Audit Committee noted the importance of using appropriate reports in relation to employee data. Nicola Callow clarified that no reconciliation or review process had been stopped. As the recommended audit approach had not delivered the expected benefits, the emphasis was on ensuring a more efficient review through amending work flows.

UNO report

8. The Committee emphasised the importance of building and maintaining an appropriate working relationship with Atos (formerly Siemens). Dianne Bevan told the Committee that a paper would be presented to the Commission at its next meeting setting out options for the future provision of ICT services.
9. Claire Clancy added that recruitment of the new IT Director was underway, and that this appointment, along with the new Head of Procurement would place the Assembly in a stronger position in holding Atos to account. The Chair was content that these issues were receiving the management attention that was necessary.

Item 3 – Internal Audit – latest investigations

ACAC(10) Paper 3a. Summary tracking report of progress on internal audits

10. Lynne Flux introduced the paper noting that there had been some adjustments to the timing of delivery of assignments to fit in with financial budgeting and other work being undertaken. She reported that she and the Chief Operating Officer were working to circulate the report on Information Security and Data Protection to the Audit Committee by Christmas.
11. The Audit Committee asked whether Lynne Flux was content with the level of resourcing committed to the Audit Programme. Lynne said that she was happy with the relationship now established with KPMG and the programme of work that had been completed. She was confident the audit programme will be delivered. She advised that there is now an opportunity to appoint an apprentice, which would enhance internal capacity.

ACAC(10) Paper 3b. Internal Audit report- Fraud risk management and controls

12. Lynne Flux presented the report to the Committee, which showed that staff have a good understanding of the risks occurring and the controls in place to mitigate those risks.
13. The Chair highlighted the importance of ensuring that the procedures and guidance are written in a way that does not deter internal or external whistle-blowers coming forward and ensuring the privacy and safety of potential whistle-blowers is clear. Mark Jones added that the Auditor General for Wales is a prescribed person under the Whistle Blowing policy.

ACAC(10) Paper 3c. Fraud, corruption, and bribery policy

14. The Audit Committee endorsed the draft policy and emphasised the importance of making the guidance digestible for staff, and the benefit of using practical examples of how fraud and corruption could occur in certain areas, particularly contract management.

ACAC(10) Paper 3d. Internal Audit interim report - Asset management

15. Ian Pennington provided an overview of the first phase report and its recommendations noting that the remaining testing is scheduled for February 2012. The Audit Committee accepted the interim recommendations.

ACAC(10) Paper 3e. Internal Audit update report – Management of website content

16. Lynne Flux outlined the findings. The review highlighted the importance of clear responsibility and ownership of content on the website. Lynne told the committee that work was underway to identify information owners and provide guidance and training to them, to ensure that timely updates are provided in a well controlled way.
17. Tim Knighton suggested that the soon to be implemented Government Digital Service will provide a standard for public service websites and would be a good source of guidance for the Assembly's website. The Chair emphasised the necessity of ensuring that controls are in place for content and that the website manager has the authority to hold the information owners to account.

ACAC(10) Paper 3f. Internal Audit report – Members' Allowances and Expenses

18. Lynne Flux introduced the report which was the first internal audit review of the controls covered by the new Determination. Generally, the controls operating through the Members' Business Support Team (MBS) were robust and effective.
19. There were a few minor recommendations which focused on evidence rather than processes, and Lynne reported that the MBS team had begun to implement these. No inappropriate claims were identified. Mark Jones assured the Committee that the work the WAO would complete next year would cover a different sample of members.
20. Overall, the Chair commented that there was more evidence of testing the risks and controls for 2011-12 than had been reported at the equivalent stage in 2010-11. He was encouraged by the work that had been completed on the audit programme.

Item 4 – External Audit

ACAC(10) Paper 4a. Management Letter

21. Mark Jones introduced the Management Letter which showed that the 2010-11 accounts were certified and laid in July this year, with no material errors. He commented that there was less in the Management Letter compared to earlier years due to continued improvements.

22. Mark Jones commented on the reduction in retrospective purchase orders from 68% to 25%, but he felt that raising awareness and detailed guidance on the use of retrospective purchase orders could help to decrease this figure further. Other areas highlighted were the need for stronger documentation of virements, stronger disaster recovery testing, Logica user access to be tightened and specific access levels set for CODA. Appropriate management responses had been received in all instances.
23. In response Nicola spoke of the positive discussion between finance officials and the WAO. She noted the further reduction in retrospective purchase orders and the work that had already been completed in addressing the management letter points. A brief discussion of the budget virement process followed.

ACAC(10) Paper 4b. Draft 2011–12 Audit Outline

24. Richard Harries introduced the draft 2011/12 audit outline for agreement, a high level plan based on risk assessment. Richard reported that work with Internal Audit had informed the process and that they would ensure as much work as possible would be completed before year end.
25. Richard advised there was no audit fee in the outline which normally would be included. The public sector fees were currently being moderated at the WAO, but he assured the Committee that details of the proposed fee would be forwarded within the next few weeks.
26. The Chair noted that a comprehensive set of risks had been included and the Audit Committee agreed the outline.

Item 5 – Assembly Commission Governance

ACAC(10) Paper 5. Commission budget update

27. Nicola Callow introduced the update on the Commission's 2011–12 and 2012–13 budgets and Claire Clancy added that the Commission's new strategy and goals were set out in the draft budget and would guide service planning.
28. Angela Burns explained that the budget was required to provide the outstanding parliamentary service necessary for the assembly and Assembly Members to meet expectations. The priority for the next four

years would be to improve the understanding of the people of Wales of the Assembly.

Item 6 – Other items

ACAC(10) Paper 6a. Departures summary

29. The Audit Committee agreed that it was useful to review the departure reports regularly, and noted it would be beneficial to include more detail about the extension of existing contracts where these are mentioned.

ACAC(10) Paper 6b. ACAC Forward work programme

30. John Grimes asked the Committee to consider the forward work programme and advised that the draft agenda would be considered in January.

Item 7 – Private discussion with WAO

31. The Committee held a private discussion with the representatives from the WAO and agreed there were no points for action.

Date of next meeting

32. The next meeting will take place on 09 February 2012.



Comisiwn y Cynulliad Assembly Commission

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 7)

Date: Thursday 2 February 2012

Time: 10:30–12:30

Venue: Presiding Officer's office

Author name and contact number: Carys Evans, ext 8598

Assembly Commission rolling programme

Meeting date	Agenda item	Portfolio holder/lead official
8 Mar 12	Assembly staff remuneration (tbc)	Peter Black/Steve O'Donoghue
	Framework for annual report and accounts 2011–12	Angela Burns/Rhodri Glyn Thomas/Non Gwilym/Steve O'Donoghue
	UNO benefits and savings six monthly review	Peter Black/Dianne Bevan
	ICT strategy decision (tbc)	Peter Black/Dianne Bevan
	Draft budget strategy 2013–16	Angela Burns/Steve O'Donoghue
	Members' Pension Scheme Memorandum of Understanding	Angela Burns/Carys Evans
	Portfolio holder updates	Portfolio holders
	Rolling programme	Secretariat
10 May 12	Draft budget strategy 2013–14	Angela Burns/Steve O'Donoghue
	Management Board report to the Commission	Claire Clancy
	Rolling programme	Secretariat
28 Jun 12	Sign off annual report and accounts 2011–12	Presiding Officer/Claire Clancy
	Draft budget 2013–14	Angela Burns/Steve O'Donoghue
	Portfolio holder updates	Portfolio holders
	Rolling programme	Secretariat
12 Jul 12	Draft budget 2013–14	Angela Burns/Steve O'Donoghue

AC(4)2012(1) (Paper 7)

Assembly Commission rolling programme

Meeting date	Agenda item	Portfolio holder/lead official
27 Sep 12	Draft budget 2013-14	Angela Burns/Steve O'Donoghue