

# Concise Minutes – Children, Young People and Education Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 1 – Senedd

Meeting date: Thursday, 2 May 2019

Meeting time: 09.02 – 14.25

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/5517>

## Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Lynne Neagle AM (Chair) Hefin David AM Dawn Bowden AM Suzy Davies AM Siân Gwenllïan AM Jayne Bryant AM (In place of Jack Sargeant AM)
Witnesses:	Julie Morgan AM, Deputy Minister for Health and Social Services Karen Cornish, Welsh Government Emma Gammon, Welsh Government Jamie Gillies, Be Reasonable Sally Gobbett, Be Reasonable Andy James, Equal Protection Network Cymru Catriona Williams, Children in Wales Vivienne Laing, NSPCC Cymru



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

	<p>Menna Thomas, Barnardo's</p> <p>Katherine Shelton, Cardiff University</p> <p>Professor Sally Holland, Children's Commissioner for Wales</p> <p>Rachel Thomas, Children's Commissioner for Wales</p>
Committee Staff:	<p>Llinos Madeley (Clerk)</p> <p>Gareth Rogers (Second Clerk)</p> <p>Sarah Bartlett (Deputy Clerk)</p> <p>Michael Dauncey (Researcher)</p> <p>Sian Thomas (Researcher)</p>

## **1 Introductions, apologies, substitutions and declarations of interest**

1.1 The Chair welcomed Members. Apologies were received from Jack Sargeant AM, Jayne Bryant AM substituted.

## **2 Children (Abolition of Defence of Reasonable Punishment) (Wales) Bill – Evidence session 1**

2.1 The Committee heard evidence from the Deputy Minister.

2.2 The Deputy Minister agreed to provide further clarification on whether the Explanatory Memorandum's estimated 274 cases of reasonable punishment reported to the police in Wales per year included smacking only, or smacking as part of a wider range of behaviours.

## **3 Children (Abolition of Defence of Reasonable Punishment) (Wales) Bill – Evidence session 2**

3.1 The Committee heard evidence from Be Reasonable Wales.

3.2 They agreed to provide a note on the following:

- details of the evidence cited about the impact of physical and non-physical punishment of children;

- further detail on the assertion that the defence of reasonable punishment had been invoked three times in nine years in England, including whether wider charges were being brought at the time in those individual cases and;
- further information on prosecution rates in relation to physical punishment in New Zealand.

#### **4 Children (Abolition of Defence of Reasonable Punishment) (Wales) Bill – Evidence session 3**

4.1 The Committee heard evidence from the Equal Protection Network Cymru.

4.2 They agreed to provide a note on the following:

- details of the evidence cited about the impact of physical and non-physical punishment of children;
- details of relevant cases in the Republic of Ireland and;
- details of the evidence cited as rebutting claims that Swedish data had shown a correlation between changes to the law on reasonable punishment and an increase in child-on-child violence.

#### **5 Children (Abolition of Defence of Reasonable Punishment) (Wales) Bill – Evidence session 4**

5.1 The Committee heard evidence from the Children’s Commissioner.

#### **6 Papers to note**

6.1 The papers were noted.

#### **7 Motion under Standing Order 17.42(ix) to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the remainder of the meeting**

7.1 The Motion was agreed.

## **8 Children (Abolition of Defence of Reasonable Punishment) (Wales) Bill – Consideration of the evidence**

8.1 The Committee considered the evidence heard during the sessions.

## **9 Inquiry into School Funding – Consideration of the key issues**

9.1 Due to time constraints the paper would be put on the agenda for next week's meeting.