

Agenda – Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister

Meeting Venue:	For further information contact:
National Waterfront Museum, Swansea	Steve George Committee Clerk
Meeting date: 16 October 2015	0300 200 6565
Meeting time: 10.30	FM.Scrutiny@Assembly.Wales

Private Pre-meeting (10.20 – 10.30)

1 Introductions, Apologies and Substitutions

2 Ministerial Scrutiny Session (10.30–12.25) (Pages 1 – 14)

2.1 The Promotion and Marketing of Wales

2.2 Constitutional Developments

Carwyn Jones AM, First Minister

Manon Antoniazzi, Director Tourism, Heritage and Sport

Des Clifford, Director of the Office of the First Minister

Hugh Rawlings, Director, Constitutional Affairs

3 Papers to Note (12.25–12.30)(Pages 15 – 50)

CSFM(4)02–15(ptn1) – The Welsh Government Annual Update in Response to Recommendations from the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister: The Welsh Government’s Relationship with the Third Sector and the Private Sector.



CSFM(4)02-15(ptn2) – Letter from the First Minister to the Chair – Follow up from the meeting on 13 March 2015 (the Welsh Government’s role in protecting and enhancing the Welsh language and the process for, and scrutiny of, major public appointments in Wales).

4 Motion under Standing Order 17.42 to resolve to exclude the public from the meeting for the following business:

Item 5

5 Discussion of Evidence from Preceding Session (12.30-12.40)

Document is Restricted

INDEX

ECONOMY, SCIENCE AND TRANSPORT	2
CULTURE, SPORT AND TOURISM.....	10
EDUCATION AND SKILLS	14
NATURAL RESOURCES	15
PLANNING	25
CENTRAL.....	27

ECONOMY, SCIENCE AND TRANSPORT

Pack Page 16

Business Wales Strategic Board	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2013/businesswalesstrategicboard/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Published Documents	http://gov.wales/topics/businessandconomy/business/micro-business-report/?lang=en
Influence of Work	The purpose of the Strategic Board is to strategically monitor, evaluate and suggest improvements to the Business Wales One Stop Shop service. http://business.wales.gov.uk/
Any Proposed Changes	The current appointment will end in December 2015. From January 2016 the Board will be publically appointed to serve for up to three years aligned to renewed service contracts.

Cardiff Capital Region Board (formerly South East Wales City Region Board) and Swansea Bay City Region Board	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/policy/city-regions/city-region-boards/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Published Documents	The Boards are building upon the work undertaken by the City Regions Task and Finish Group which reported in 2012. Earlier this year they published strategic visions for the development and growth of their respective regions. http://gov.wales/docs/det/publications/150306cardiffcapitalregionen.pdf http://gov.wales/docs/det/publications/150216-a-growth-strategy-for-the-swanea-bay-city-region-en.pdf
Influence of Work	Both Boards are bringing together business, local government, education and other stakeholders in advising on the strategic direction and key priorities in each Region.
Any Proposed Changes	The role and function of both Boards was reviewed toward the end of their 18 month period of appointment, and a decision was taken to extend the appointment of both Boards for a further six months to enable them to complete their immediate tasks. This was communicated and explained to Assembly Members via a Written Statement. http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2015/cityregions/?lang=en

Construction Sector Advisory Panel	
Remit	To advise the Welsh Government as it establishes short, medium and long term measures for the sector. http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/construction-sector/?lang=en
Membership	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/construction-sector/construction-sector-panel/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/construction-sector/8215315/?lang=en
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.
Any Proposed Changes	New Panel appointed to serve for three years from October 2014.
Creative Industries Sector Panel	
Remit	To give advice to Welsh Ministers on the creative industries sector in Wales.
Membership	The original Sector Panel's three year term ended in 2013. The Chair Ron Jones will continue to serve until March 2016.
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/creative-industries-sector/?lang=en
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.
Any Proposed Changes	None at present.

Digital Wales Advisory Network	
Remit	To advise Welsh Government on specific strategies to achieve the Digital Wales' vision of a truly digital nation. To consider and provide advice on cross-cutting topic areas which have key strategic importance to the successful delivery of a Digital Wales.
Membership	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/digitalwales/board/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/digitalwales/?lang=en http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/digitalwales/ict-public-sector/digital-first-delivering-welsh-public-svs-online/?lang=en http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/digitalwales/ict-public-sector/digital-first/?lang=en
Influence of Work	DWAN's report and recommendations on the delivery of public services online has influenced the development of a Digital First strategy for Welsh public sector.
Any Proposed Changes	None at present

Energy & Environment Sector Panel	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/energy-and-environment-sector/key-priorities/?lang=en
Membership	New sector panels members recently appointed. http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/energy-and-environment-sector/energy-env-sector-panel/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/energy-and-environment-sector/energysummaryadvice/?lang=en
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.

Any Proposed Changes	None at present.
-----------------------------	------------------

Enterprise Zones	
Remit	http://enterprisezones.wales.gov.uk/ http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/help/enterprisezones/?lang=en
Membership	Anglesey: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/anglesey/about-anglesey-enterprise-zone/how-we-operate Central Cardiff: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/central-cardiff/about-central-cardiff-zone/how-we-operate Deeside: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/deeside/about-deeside-zone/how-we-operate Ebbw Vale: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/ebbw-vale/about-ebbw-vale-zone/how-we-operate Haven Waterway: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/haven-waterway/about-haven-waterway-zone/how-we-operate Snowdonia: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/snowdonia/about-snowdonia-zone/how-we-operate St Athan-Cardiff Airport: http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/enterprise-zone-locations/st-athan-cardiff-airport/about-st-athan-cardiff-airport-zone/how-we-operate
Published Documents	http://business.wales.gov.uk/enterprisezones/
Influence of Work	The knowledge and expertise has played a key role in setting the strategic priorities of each Enterprise Zone. The Boards are currently providing advice on implementation and delivery in each Zone.
Any Proposed Changes	The Enterprise Zone Boards will cease as Task & Finish Groups from 31 July 2015 and are reconstituted as Advisory Bodies from 1 August 2015.

Entrepreneurship Panel	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/newsroom/businessandeconomy/2014/8336166/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Published Documents	None at present.
Influence of Work	Providing the Welsh Government with strategic guidance and expertise on the development and delivery of the entrepreneurship agenda in Wales.
Any Proposed Changes	The Entrepreneurship Panel will end in December 2015. The new REAP panel will lead on the entrepreneurship agenda for Wales.

Pack Page 20

Finance & Professional Services Sector Panel	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/financial-and-professional-services-sector/key-priorities/?lang=en
Membership	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/financial-and-professional-services-sector/fps-sector-panel/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/financial-and-professional-services-sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/financial-and-professional-services-sector/8217030/?lang=en
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.
Any Proposed Changes	Chair remaining with new panel being established.

ICT Sector Panel	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/information-and-communication-technology-ict-sector/?lang=en
Membership	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/information-and-communication-technology-ict-sector/ict-sector-panel/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/information-and-communication-technology-ict-sector/ictsummaryadvice/?lang=en http://justask.wales.com/sectors/ict http://justask.wales.com/downloads (Deloitte Wales Guide)
Influence of Work	Panel provides advice on how best to grow the digital economy in Wales.
Any Proposed Changes	Panel continuing all Members appointments have been renewed to 31 May 2017

Innovation Advisory Council for Wales (IACW)	
Remit	To monitor progress on delivering the objectives of the Welsh Government's Innovation Strategy
Membership	http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/innovation/innovation-advisory-council-for-wales/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/innovation/innovation-strategy-wales/?lang=en http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/innovation/background/?lang=en
Influence of Work	To provide Welsh Government with public and private sector perspectives on innovation and to monitor progress on delivering the objectives of Innovation Wales. See above Links
Any Proposed Changes	No proposed changes.

Llandrindod Wells Business Led Group	
Remit	In response to one of the key recommendations of the Powys Local Growth Zones work, the Minister agreed to pilot a business-led approach in Llandrindod Wells. The Business Group, chaired by Justin Baird-Murray, was tasked with taking forward the development of an action plan to address the economic sustainability of the town, identifying actions that could help deliver jobs and growth to the town of Llandrindod Wells.
Membership	Justin Baird-Murray - Chair of the Llandrindod Wells Business Group and Owner of the Metropole Hotel, Llandrindod Wells, Andrew Davies, Sue Green, Michael Gough, Lloyd Jones, Iain McNair
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/policy/plgzones/plan/?lang=en
Influence of Work	An action plan has been informed by discussions with a wide range of businesses, individuals and stakeholders within the town.
Any Proposed Changes	Action completed by group. A Town Champion was appointed in January 2015 and actions to deliver against the recommendations now underway.

Low Carbon Vehicles Group	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2013/lowcarbonvehicles/?lang=en
Membership	Welsh Government, Welsh Automotive Forum, Cardiff Business School, British Gas, Energy Saving Trust, ITM Power, Western Power Distribution, University of South Wales, Truck Gas Alliance, Scottish & Southern Energy, Toyota
Published Documents	None at present
Influence of Work	See link above for this information.
Any Proposed Changes	None planned at present.

Powys Local Growth Zone Task & Finish Group	
Remit	The Task & Finish Group was set up to explore the suitability of Local Growth Zones for Powys/ http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/policy/plgzones/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/policy/plgzones/reports/?lang=en
Influence of Work	http://wales.gov.uk/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2013/powys/?lang=en
Any Proposed Changes	The group has concluded its work but actions to deliver against the recommendations are on-going.

Teifi Valley Local Growth Zone Implementation Task & Finish Group	
Remit	To oversee the implementation of the recommendations from the Teifi Valley Local Growth Zone Task and Finish Group report and the Welsh Government response to it. The Group will exist for up to eighteen months.
Membership	http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2015/teifivalleygrowthzoneen/?lang=en
Published Documents	
Influence of Work	See link above
Any Proposed Changes	

Welsh Co-operative and Mutuals Commission	
Remit	http://gov.wales/about/cabinet/cabinetstatements/2015/coopmutuals/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Influence of Work	http://gov.wales/topics/businessandconomy/business/welsh-coop-mutuals-commission/?lang=en
Published Documents	See link above for this information.
Any Proposed Changes	The Report is expected end of September 2015.

CULTURE, SPORT AND TOURISM

Broadcasting Advisory Panel	
Remit	http://wales.gov.uk/newsroom/firstminister/2012/6587244/?lang=en
Membership	See link above for this information.
Published Documents	None at present.
Influence of Work	Provides advice on maximising the impact of broadcasting in Wales. Also advises on UK-wide consultations (e.g. from Ofcom, DCMS).
Any Proposed Changes	None at present.

Media Investment Panel	
Remit	To consider Media investment proposals and make recommendations on funding to the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport; to provide specific expertise in making and recouping investments and identifying viable Intellectual Property for commercialisation and distribution; and to advise on establishing processes for the administration of the media investment budget.
Membership	Peter McInerney, Partner at Sheridans – Chair Full panel being established.
Published Documents	None at present
Influence of Work	Consideration of commercial projects.
Any Proposed Changes	None at present

Ministerial Advisory Group on Cadw Commercial Operations	
Remit	To advise Ministers on commercial operations at Cadw
Membership	Kari Coghill – Historic Scotland ; R A Davies; Ellen Donovan; Peter Goodship – Admiralty Consulting Ltd; E M Griffiths – Melin Tregwynt; Nerys Howell – Howel Food Consultancy; Keith James – National Trust Wales; David Michael – National Library Wales, Mark Richards – National Museum Wales; Terry Stevens – Stevens Associates;
Published Documents	None at present
Influence of Work	Review opportunities for commercial operations at the 129 properties in the care of the Welsh Government/Cadw. These include major Welsh visitor attractions such as Caernarfon Castle, Caerphilly Castle and Conwy Castle, as well as the World Heritage listed Blaenavon ironworks. To review current commercial performance, explore opportunities for improvement, identify potential barriers to growing commercial income, and to make recommendations on future commercial strategies. To review wider commercial opportunities relating to the cultural heritage sector in Wales more generally.
Any Proposed Changes	
Wales Tourism Advisory Board	
Remit	To provide the Welsh Government with direct expert advice ensuring that the views and priorities of the industry help inform policy development. To ensure that tourism policy and activities support the growth of the tourism sector as set out in the tourism strategy Partnership for Growth 2013-2020 and its contribution to the Welsh economy and job creation.
Membership	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/tourism-sector/tourism-advisory-board/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandconomy/sector/tourism-sector/tourism-sector-end-of-year-report-2013/?lang=en
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.
Any Proposed Changes	Process to appoint a new Chair currently underway for autumn 2015.

COMPLETED GROUPS

Access to Finance Review	
	Work completed in November 2013. See Development Bank for Wales.
Advanced Materials and Manufacturing Sector Panel	
	Sector panel has now been disbanded and Industry Wales will take forward the work of the sector panel.
Business Rates Task and Finish Group	
	The Group ceased to exist after November 2013.
Business Rates Panel	
	The Group ceased to exist after presenting its report in March 2015. http://gov.wales/topics/businessandconomy/policy/business-rates/?lang=en
Business Support & Finance Review	
	Review concluded. http://business.wales.gov.uk/localcentres
Development Bank for Wales Task and Finish Group	
	Completed - Update on the Review of the Availability of Funding for SMEs
ESTnet for Wales	
	Industry Wales created and ESTnet is within this group. http://www.estnet.uk.net/news/estnet-members-predict-growth-in-jobs,-sales-and-investment-for-2014/

Freight Task and Finish Group	
	Group has concluded its work. http://wales.gov.uk/topics/transport/freight/wales-freight-group/?lang=en
Life Sciences Sector Panel	
	Life Sciences Hub Wales will take forward the work of the sector panel which was disbanded in February 2014. http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/life-sciences-sector/8217058/?lang=en http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/sector/?lang=en
Life Sciences Hub Task & Finish Group	
	This Group has concluded its work.
Murco Task and Finish Group	
	http://wales.gov.uk/newsroom/businessandeconomy/2014/140410mtf/?lang=en
ReNewport Task Force	
Published Documents	Completed - http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/policy/newport-regeneration/?lang=en www.renewport.co.uk
Teifi Valley Local Growth Zone Task & Finish Group	
	Completed and an implementation group established - http://gov.wales/topics/businessandeconomy/policy/teifi-valley-local-growth-zone/teifi-valley-task-and-finish-group-13/?lang=en
Welsh Language and Economic Development Task and Finish Group	
	Group has concluded its work. http://wales.gov.uk/topics/businessandeconomy/policy/wled/?lang=en

EDUCATION AND SKILLS

Wales Employment and Skills Board	
Remit	http://gov.wales/topics/educationandskills/skillsandtraining/employmentskillsboard/?lang=en
Membership	http://gov.wales/topics/educationandskills/skillsandtraining/employmentskillsboard/?lang=en
Published Documents	WESB has not published any documents recently.
Influence of Work	As an advisory board, WESB provides a forum for employers to provide strategic input and robust challenge to shape future employment and skills policy development in Wales. Most recently, it played a central role in influencing the development of the Skills Implementation Plan.
Any Proposed Changes	None at this time.

NATURAL RESOURCES

Building Regulations Advisory Committee for Wales (BRACW)	
Remit	BRACW advises Welsh Government on changes to the Building Regulations in Wales. Meetings of BRACW take place periodically where upcoming topics or specific areas of review are discussed. Welsh Government officials use the views of BRACW in advice to the Minister for Natural Resources.
Membership	<p>Chair – Prof Phil Jones – Cardiff University</p> <p>Architecture – James Chambers – Powell Dobson</p> <p>Sustainability – Andy Sutton - BRE</p> <p>Builder – James Player</p> <p>House Builder- Nigel Smith - Redrow</p> <p>Mechanical and Electrical Services – Chris Lynn – Troup Bywaters & Anders</p> <p>Private Sector Building Control – <i>currently vacant</i></p> <p>Public Sector Building Control – Heather Jones- Powys County Council</p> <p>Needs of the Disabled – Alan Hunt – Pembrokeshire County Council</p> <p>Structural Engineer – Matthew Evans- Arup Associates</p> <p>http://gov.wales/topics/planning/buildingregs/bracw/members/?lang=en (requires update)</p>
Published Documents	N/A
Influence of Work	BRACW contributed their views during the recent updates to Parts L and B of the Building Regulations. They have a presence on the working groups of the current Sustainability Reviews and will contribute towards the 2016 review of Part L.
Any Proposed Changes	Welsh Government is currently in the process of appointing members to fill the current vacancies.

Food and Drink Wales Industry Board	
Remit	The Food and Drink Wales Industry Board has been established to be the representative voice of the industry in Wales. The Board will play a key role in ensuring we embed sustainability, competitiveness, efficiency, productivity, profitability and food safety throughout the industry. The Board will also provide direction, encourage networking and share vital information. Eventually becoming independent of government. It will take shared ownership of ' <i>Towards Sustainable Growth</i> ' and report on its progress to Welsh Government Ministers.
Membership	Chair – Robin Jones MD, The Village Bakery Members: Norma Barry - Director of InsideOut Organisational Solutions Annitta Engel - Director of D.B.G.E Ltd Catherine Fookes - Campaign Manager, Organic Trade Board Justine Sarah Fosh - Chief Executive Officer, Improve Buster Grant, Managing Director - Brecon Brewing Alison Lea-Wilson - Director of Cwmni Halen Môr Môn David Lloyd - Director, Food Industry Centre, Cardiff Metropolitan University Katie Palmer - Sustainable Food Cities Coordinator, Food Cardiff Llior Radford - General Director at Village Dairy/Llaeth y Llan Andy Richardson - Head of Corporate Communications at Volac Justin Scale - Managing Director, Capstone Organic Marcus Sherreard - UK Sales Director at Dawn Meats Huw Thomas - Managing Director, Puffin Produce James Wilson - Director of Bangor Mussel Producers
Published Documents	None at present – but the Group will meet in September 2015 and will agree the Terms of Reference (TOR). Published documents will be posted to the following:- http://business.wales.gov.uk/foodanddrink/food-and-drink-wales-industry-board
Influence of Work	Expert Industry advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and ensure delivery of Towards Sustainable Growth: An Action Plan for the Food and Drink Industry 2014-2020 http://business.wales.gov.uk/foodanddrink/action-plan
Any Proposed Changes	Mr Robin Jones stepped down as chair of the group in June 2015. A successor is yet to be appointed

Inshore Fisheries Groups	
Remit	<p>Inshore Fishery Groups (IFGs) provide stakeholders a forum for communication and engagement with the Welsh Government.</p> <p>There are three IFGs, one for each of North, Mid and South Wales. They comprise representatives from fisheries associations, recreational fishermen, environmental interest groups, marine scientists, Seafish and Natural Resources Wales. The purpose of each is to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • provide proposals to the Welsh Marine Fisheries Advisory Group (WMFAG) relating to fisheries management within the groups region of Wales • assist the WMFAG to engage with those with interests in fisheries and the marine environment within the IFG region • feedback to wider stakeholders within the IFG region on local policy implications
Membership	Membership of each group comprise of representatives from fisheries associations, recreational fishermen, environmental interest groups, marine scientists, Seafish and Natural Resources Wales.
Published Documents	NA
Influence of Work	The Groups input to the Wales Marine Fisheries Advisory Group, and also provide comments to Welsh Government on marine & fisheries topics.
Any Proposed Changes	None

Livestock Identification Advisory Group (LIDAG)	
Remit	To work with and provide advice to the Welsh Government on the implementation of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sheep Electronic Identification; • Simplification of the County Parish Holding reference and system; • Any future changes to Cattle and Pig identification; • Sole Occupancy Authorities; • 6-day standstill rule;
Membership	https://documents.hf.wales.gov.uk/id:A5529467/document/versions/published
Published Documents	None
Influence of Work	<p>The group supports the Welsh Government in communicating, in a consistent manner, important messages to farmers and all those with an interest in livestock identification.</p> <p>The working group:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advise on issues associated with the implementation of electronic sheep movement recording and a database in Wales to include method, form and timing of implementation; • Advise on issues associated with the possible transfer of CPH from the Welsh Government to the Animal and Plant Health Agency; • Advise on any future proposed amendments to the current systems for cattle and pig identification; • Advise on issues around Sole Occupancy Authorities (SOAs); • Advise on issues around the 6 day standstill rules; • Consider and advise on wider livestock policy as and when that impacts on the implementation of livestock identification policy or the implementation of livestock identification policy impacts on wider livestock policy.
Any Proposed Changes	None at present

Review of Designated Landscapes in Wales	
Remit	Stage One Remit: http://gov.wales/docs/desh/publications/141003landscapesreviewtermsofreferenceen.pdf Stage Two Remit: http://gov.wales/docs/desh/publications/150330-designated-landscapes-review-s2-draft-call-for-evidence-letter-en.pdf
Membership	Professor Terry Marsden, John Lloyd Jones, Dr Ruth Williams
Published Documents	http://gov.wales/docs/desh/publications/150305-review-of-designated-landscapes-in-wales-stage-1-report-en.pdf
Influence of Work	The Panel is undertaking an independent review into the purpose and governance of the designated landscapes of Wales – the National Parks and Areas of Outstanding Natural Beauty (AONBs). It will make recommendations on how the designated landscapes fit and deliver with emerging Welsh priorities and ways of working such as the green growth and natural resource management agendas. The final report will be considered by the Minister for Natural Resources.
Any Proposed Changes	This task and finish group will cease on conclusion of its work at the end of July.

Strategic Advisory Board for Farming Connect	
Remit	<p>The aim of the Strategic Advisory Board is to provide specialist advice and expertise to the Farming Connect Knowledge Transfer Programme management team.</p> <p>The Strategic Advisory Board has a remit to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Provide advice on the overall strategy and direction of the Farming Connect Knowledge Transfer Programme in line with the Welsh Government policies and strategies - Make recommendations to the Farming Connect Knowledge Transfer Programme management team on specific themes and topics that should be delivered by the Programme to the agricultural and forestry industry in Wales.
Membership	<p>Professor Wynne Jones (Chair), Dr Cath Milne (SRUC), Neil Blackburn (Kite Consulting), Cate Barrow(ADAS), Professor Nigel Scollan (IBERS), Bob Stevenson (BVA), Tim Williams IBERS), Delyth Davies (Dairy Co), Nia Lloyd (Wales YFC), Julie Finch (HCC), Brian Rees (HSE), David Jenkins (Coed Cymru), David Knowles (IOSH), Paul Allen (CAT), Peter Davies (Commissioner for sustainable futures)</p> <p>Gary Douch (Welsh Government), Eirwen Williams (Menter a Busines), Alun Jones (Menter a Busines)</p>
Published Documents	N/A
Influence of Work	<p>The Group's objectives are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To ensure that the key messages of the Welsh Government's strategies and road maps are fed into the delivery of the Farming Connect Knowledge Transfer programme - To take account of all sectors of Welsh agriculture and to ensure that Climate Change is an overarching theme to all activities - To ensure that the Farming Connect cross cutting themes are incorporated into the themes and topics of delivery - To advise on key themes and topics for inclusion in the Farming Connect selection of Gwlad - To prioritise the research, knowledge and information that needs to be disseminated to the industry - To provide advice and make recommendations to the Farming Connect Knowledge Transfer programme management team.
Any Proposed Changes	<p>The Strategic Advisory Board has been operational under the Rural Development Plan 2007-13 and will end in September 2015. A Framework for Farming Connect is being procured under the 2014-2020 Rural Development Programme. This will commence from October 2015 and include a Strategic Advisory Board.</p>

Wales Animal Health & Welfare Framework Group	
Remit	The Wales Animal Health & Welfare Framework a publically appointed Group of six experts were appointed in June 2014 to support the implementation of the Wales Animal Health and Welfare Framework. The Group has a pivotal role in providing a recognised link between the Welsh Government, livestock keepers, animal owners, industry representatives and the veterinary profession.
Membership	http://gov.wales/topics/environmentcountryside/ahw/wales-animal-health-welfare-framework/animal-health-welfare-framework-group/membership/?lang=en
Published Documents	http://gov.wales/topics/environmentcountryside/ahw/wales-animal-health-welfare-framework/framework-document/?lang=en
Influence of Work	<p>The Wales Animal Health & Welfare Framework describes the long term vision for animal health and welfare in Wales through five strategic outcomes;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wales has healthy productive animals • Animals in Wales have a good quality of life • People trust and have confidence in the way food is produced and the way public health is protected • Wales has a thriving rural economy • Wales has a high quality environment <p>The Wales Animal Health and Welfare Framework Group have agreed their key priorities for 2015/16 below, these are linked to the five strategic outcomes above:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Raising awareness of biosecurity • Raising awareness of antimicrobial resistance • Bovine Viral Diarrhoea • Sheep Scab • Supporting implementation of “Towards Sustainable Growth: An Action Plan for the Food and Drink Industry 2014-20” • Improved engagement with the welfare sector (equine and companion animal)
Any Proposed Changes	There are no proposed changes at this stage.

Wales Marine Fisheries Advisory Group	
Remit	The role of the Welsh Marine Fisheries Advisory Group (WMFAG) is to assist Welsh Government in formulating appropriate policies, plans, strategies and law related to marine fisheries in Wales. The WMFAG meets quarterly to ensure timely local and national input into Welsh marine fisheries management.
Membership	Membership of the group comprise of a Minister appointed Chair, Chairs of each IFG, Fisheries representatives, Seafish, WLGA, NRW, WEL, Science Representative
Published Documents	<i>NA</i>
Influence of Work	The WMFAG will provide feedback to Welsh Government on behalf of marine & fisheries interests.
Any Proposed Changes	Membership and role of the Group will be reviewed in 2016

Woodland Strategy Advisory Panel	
Remit	<p>Advising the WG Forestry Policy Team on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • the development of policy relating to trees and woodlands in Wales including any refresh of the WG Woodland Strategy and/or Action Plan; • the implementation of the Wales Woodland Strategy based on a thorough understanding of the legislation, policies and activity relating to trees and woodlands in Wales; • the commissioning of research and evidence to support the development of forestry policy, including reviewing the progress of the delivery in Wales of the Forestry Commission Science and Innovation Strategy; • the development of networking opportunities, through partnership, to promote sustainable woodlands and forests capable of delivering a range of benefits for the people of Wales; • horizon scanning to ensure that forestry policy, through the Strategy process, responds to new issues and agendas of relevance to Wales.
Membership	<p>The Panel consists of up to 22 members that reflect the social, environmental and business elements of forestry in Wales and includes Natural Resources Wales. They are appointed to serve for two years with the possibility of renewal for a further two years.</p> <p>Current members are: Roger Cooper, Bernard Llewellyn, Tim Kirk, David Jenkins, Martin Bishop, Rory Francis, Jenny Wong, Phillipe Morgan, Judith Webb, Christine Cahalan, Gareth Ellis, Russell Horsey, Kate Hamilton, Jane Forshaw, Ceri Davies, Ruth Jenkins, Gabrielle Torkington, Chris Emery, Jane Barbrook, Rhianne Jones and David Edwards.</p>
Published Documents	The Panel does not publish documents itself but provides advice to the WG Forestry Policy Team.
Influence of Work	The Panel plays a key role in the development of forestry policy in Wales and is an extremely useful forum to test ideas and to receive a response from a wide range of the Welsh woodland sector.
Any Proposed Changes	The remit and membership of the Panel was revised in March 2015 to reflect the change in the governance of forestry in Wales following the formation of NRW and has a 50/50 gender balance.

Young Entrants Support Scheme (YESS) Stakeholder Group	
Remit	To give advice and direction to the Welsh Development on improving mobility for young and new entrants into farming in Wales.
Membership	Welsh Government, NFU Cymru, FUW, CLA, TFA, Wales YFC, NSA, Agri-Academy, FCN, RABI, Addington Fund, YESS Mentors, Barclays Bank, Agri-Advisors Solicitors, DairyCo.
Published Documents	No published documents
Influence of Work	Expert sector advice being provided to inform Welsh Government policy and delivery.
Any Proposed Changes	The terms of reference are due to change in 2015 to reflect the role of the group with regards to the 2014 – 2020 RDP. Members of the group may change, but the external organisations will remain constant.

PLANNING

Design Commission for Wales (DCFW)	
Remit	<p>The role of the Design Commission for Wales is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • to champion high standards of design and architecture to the public and private sector in Wales through promoting wider understanding of design issues and ecological landscapes and the importance of enhancing the built environment across all sectors; • to support the development and implementation of the policies of the Welsh Government (including Planning Policy Wales and Technical Advice Note (TAN) 12: Design) insofar as they relate to design and architecture; • to promote the highest standards of inclusive design in developments that supports and promotes sustainable development in accordance with the goals of the Well-being of Future Generations Act; • to promote excellence in all projects including day-to-day developments, such as small-scale residential and employment schemes; and • to organise relevant exhibitions, meetings, seminars and conferences to further enhance understanding of design issues in the built environment. <p>Formal, quarterly meetings are held between the Welsh Government Sponsor Division (Planning) and DCFW to report on activities and to discuss issues.</p>
Membership	http://dcfw.org/about/
Published Documents	http://dcfw.org/publications/
Influence of Work	<p>DCFW works with colleagues in the fields of urban design, architecture and landscape design, civil engineering, building services and the wider environmental professions who are involved in shaping the countryside, cities, towns and villages of Wales. The Commission engages with members of the public, stakeholders in professional bodies, local authorities, clients and commissioning bodies, in planning, regeneration, energy and infrastructure, making its assistance available throughout Wales.</p> <p>One of the core activities of DCFW is the provision of a Design Review Service for development schemes throughout Wales, available to all local authorities, developers and members of the public.</p>
Any Proposed Changes	New chair person and board members to be appointed by the end of 2015 to start in April 2016. Appointment process to commence in September 2015.

Technical Advice Group (TAG) Planning for Retail and Town Centres	
Remit	<p>The TAG is considering the Welsh Government's planning policies on retail planning as set out in <i>Planning Policy Wales</i> (July 2014) and will advise where it is considered existing policies need to be supplemented by revised technical advice.</p> <p>The TAG will consider what changes need to be made to the existing TAN 4 in light of the published research <i>Town Centres and Retail Dynamics - Towards a Revised Retail Planning Policy for Wales</i>, other relevant evidence including consultation responses, and knowledge and experience of the TAG members themselves.</p>
Membership	WG (Planning, EST & Homes and Places), Wales Retail Consortium (British Retail Consortium), WLGA (Officers from Cardiff and Carmarthenshire LPAs), Centre for Regeneration Excellence in Wales (CREW) and Association of Convenience Stores (ACS).
Published Documents	N/A. Consultation on Draft Planning Policy Chapter 10 and Technical Advice Note (TAN) 4 due Summer 2015
Influence of Work	The TAG will be making recommendations for changes to PPW Chapter 10 and TAN4.
Any Proposed Changes	None

Wales Planning Forum	
Remit	The Wales Planning Forum is a sounding board for the implementation and delivery of land use planning in Wales. Its Terms of Reference are "To provide timely, practical and expert advice to the Minister for Natural Resources on the implementation and delivery of the land use planning service in Wales".
Membership	Its membership includes representatives from business, public sector, voluntary and environmental bodies.
Published Documents	None
Influence of Work	Land use planning stakeholders providing advise to inform Welsh Government planning policy and delivery
Any Proposed Changes	Intention to extend Wales Planning Forum include additional stakeholders

CENTRAL

Land Transaction Tax - Technical Experts Group	
Remit	Provide Stamp Duty Land Tax technical expertise from within WG and from tax practitioners including Solicitors, law firms, accountants, and surveyors.
Membership	Mixture of accountants, solicitors, surveyors and WG representatives from Housing, EST, and FCS.
Published Documents	none
Influence of Work	Tax experts from industry to help develop a replacement to SDLT in Wales.
Any Proposed Changes	None



David Melding AM
Chair of the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister
National Assembly for Wales
Ty Hywel
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff
CF99 1NA

29 April 2015

Dear David

Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister: Meeting on 13 March 2015

I am writing in response to your letter dated 2 April which details points raised by the Committee for the Scrutiny of the First Minister following the meeting I attended on 13 March 2015 to discuss the Welsh Government's role in protecting and enhancing the Welsh language and the process for, and scrutiny of, major public appointments in Wales.

I will address the points made in the order they appear in your letter.

1. The Welsh Government's Role in Protecting and Enhancing the Welsh Language

Financial Support

At the Committee's request, I provide below a breakdown of how the funding under each budget line for the Welsh language is allocated.

Welsh Language (BEL 6020)

The purpose of **BEL 6020** is to support the aims of the Welsh language Strategy *A living language: a language for living* and the policy statement *A living language: a language for living – Bwrw Mlaen* which are:

- To encourage and support the use of the Welsh language within families
- To increase the provision of Welsh-medium activities for children and young people and to increase their awareness of the value of the language
- To strengthen the position of the Welsh language in the community
- To increase opportunities for people to use Welsh in the workplace
- To increase and improve Welsh-language services to citizens
- To strengthen the infrastructure for the language

Area of support	Committed and indicative spend within 2015-16	Allocation Details								
Grants to Welsh Language Organisations	£4,122,151	<p>Total grant funding to Welsh language organisations, such as the National Eisteddfod, Urdd Gobaith Cymru, and the Mentrau Iaith (Welsh language initiatives), to promote the language. In 2015-16 each Menter Iaith will receive baseline funding based on £3.45 per Welsh speaker (except Gwynedd which is capped) with each Menter receiving a minimum of £60,000.</p> <p>This figure is split as follows :-</p> <table border="0"> <tr> <td>Education and Training</td> <td style="text-align: right;">£35,140</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Mentrau Iaith</td> <td style="text-align: right;">£2,289,567</td> </tr> <tr> <td>The Community</td> <td style="text-align: right;">£832,541</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Children and Young People</td> <td style="text-align: right;">£964,903</td> </tr> </table>	Education and Training	£35,140	Mentrau Iaith	£2,289,567	The Community	£832,541	Children and Young People	£964,903
Education and Training	£35,140									
Mentrau Iaith	£2,289,567									
The Community	£832,541									
Children and Young People	£964,903									
Papurau Bro Grants	£87,010	Has been approved for 51 Papurau Bro in 2015-16.								
Bwrw Mlaen Grants	£300,230	Has been awarded to 12 organisations across Wales in 2015-16. This was a one-off funding opportunity made available through the policy statement <i>Bwrw Mlaen</i> .								
Technology and Digital Media Grant Funding	£270,000	This is the final year of a three year commitment to provide funding to encourage and facilitate the use of the Welsh language through technology and digital media. 10 grants have been awarded in 2015-16.								
Research	£55,500*	This includes funding for evaluating the Welsh language strategy <i>Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw</i> , The National Survey and the Welsh Government's membership of the Network to Promote Linguistic Diversity (NPLD).								
Supporting Community Partners	£48,000*	This includes training and support for the grant funded partners.								
Marketing	£80,000*	Including marketing associated with <i>Iaith Fyw: Iaith Byw</i> and the <i>Pethau Bychain</i> campaign								
Welsh Language Tribunal	£50,000*	Running costs for the first full year of the Tribunal's operation 2015-16.								
Children and Young People Projects	£825,400*	This includes projects delivered by contractors; TWF which supports bilingualism from day 1 and PCAI (Prosiect Cefnogi Arferion Iaith) which supports changing language habits within schools and beyond the school gates.								

*These figures are indicative spend and subject to further consideration. All expenditure will be met from within the available budgets.

The purpose of **BEL 6021** is to fund the office of the Welsh Language Commissioner. The Commissioner has wide ranging functions and powers which include:

- working towards ensuring that the Welsh language is treated no less favourably than the English language
- imposing duties on persons who come within the scope of the Measure to comply with standards relating to the Welsh language
- conducting inquiries into matters relating to the Commissioner's functions
- investigating alleged interference with an individual's freedom to communicate in Welsh with another individual.
- promoting and facilitating the use of the Welsh language especially within the third and private sectors

Welsh Language Commissioner Grant in Aid	£3,390,000	The budget allocated for 2015-16
---	-------------------	----------------------------------

Welsh in Education (BEL 5164)

The purpose of the Welsh in Education budget (BEL 5164) is to support the implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy and supports activity in the following areas:

- the planning of Welsh-medium education;
- the delivery of practitioner training through the Sabbaticals Scheme and the Welsh in Education Grant;
- the delivery of Welsh-language training through Welsh for Adults and Welsh second language;
- the commissioning of teaching and learning resources; and
- research, evaluation and marketing in respect of the Strategy.

The budget breakdown is provided below for 2015-16

Budget line	Budget 2015-16	Allocation details
Planning and mainstreaming	£2.684m	This budget allocation includes grant funding to Mudiad Meithrin, Sgiliaith and the Bilingual Champions within the FE and work based learning sectors. This budget also supports research, evaluation and marketing activity in support of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy.
Welsh for Adults	£9.176m	Welsh for Adults recurrent funding, which funds the delivery of courses across Wales.
Linguistic skills	£2.271m	Includes projects to implement the actions within the Welsh second language action plan and grant

		funding to develop the Welsh for Adults programme.
Diagnostic tool	£0.043m	Funding to maintain and promote an on-line Welsh language skills diagnostic tool.
Practitioner training	£1.795m	Includes the Welsh Language Sabbatical Scheme; Welsh-language and methodology training for school and FE college practitioners; and a training programme for early years practitioners.
Resource commissioning	£2.630m	This budget allocation supports the commissioning of Welsh language and bilingual learner resources to support the teaching and learning of Welsh as a subject as well as other subjects through the medium of Welsh.
BEL total	£18.599m	

The committee also asked for information specifically about the Welsh-medium education funding stream and for a breakdown showing how this has increased or decreased. The table below provides the funding to support the delivery of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy over 5 years, 2011-16

	2011-12 (£m)	2012-13 (£m)	2013-14 (£m)	2014-15 (£m)	2015-16 (£m)
Implementation of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy	12.377	16.212	16.212	21.006	18.599

The budget varies across years due to the transfer of budgets and programmes within the Department for Education and Skills as responsibilities and priorities have changed.

For example £9.867m has been transferred in from the Post-16 Education Action for Welsh for Adults funding in order to streamline the process for the sector; and a transfer out of £5.13m of the remaining Welsh in Education Grant to the Education Standards Action, to create the new Education Improvement Grant for schools.

However, on a like for like basis, the budget has decreased by £600k between 2014-15 and 2015-16.

As the Welsh language is a cross cutting theme; in addition to this budget allocation, other divisions and branches within the Department for Education and Skills support the development of Welsh within the education system. Although not easily quantified the total monetary support for the Welsh language in education is significantly higher.

Similarly, other departments include expenditure on the Welsh language within the context of their own policy areas.

Mainstreaming

With regard to mainstreaming the language, the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 sets statutory duties on Welsh Ministers to consider the effects of their decision making on the Welsh language. Policy Making Standards will require the Welsh Government to consider at inception how policy decisions impact on the language, both positively and negatively, so that decisions promote and support its increased use within portfolio areas. Ministers must be fully aware of this duty when they make their decisions: Welsh Government departments are therefore required to undertake impact assessments in order to demonstrate that the Welsh language considerations have been identified and acted upon.

To this end a new Welsh Language Impact Assessment (WLIA) framework was launched in September 2014, in anticipation of the Standards and to ensure high quality policy decisions that consider effects on the language. The framework includes detailed guidance to staff on ensuring that considerations regarding the Welsh language are mainstreamed in Welsh Government policy decisions, which include legislation, the use of statutory powers, policy developments and statements, grant schemes, strategies, contracts and research. As the framework is still relatively new it will be reviewed over the next months to ensure that it is facilitating our work to develop robust policies that have positive outcomes for the language and its users. Subsequently, more workshop training will be offered to Welsh Government staff on completing WLIA's. We have also recently contributed to the Welsh Language Commissioner's review of WLIA processes across public organisations in Wales, and we look forward to the recommendations included in the final report when published later this year.

Turning to the Welsh Government's annual monitoring report on our Welsh language scheme, as I stated at the meeting, officials provided significant information to the Welsh Language Commissioner as part of the Standards Investigation last year, in addition to the information in the Annual Report. Officials are in dialogue to improve future reporting structures under the new Welsh language standards.

Planning and the Planning Bill

We have made amendments to the Planning Bill at Stage 2 which introduce requirements to ensure the Welsh language is considered at the National, Strategic and Local plan level. The Minister for Natural Resources continues to work with all parties to ensure that any further amendments to the Bill in relation to the Welsh language, tabled at Stage 3, reflect the concerns and comments of stakeholders and the Environment and Sustainability Committee and are in the best interests of communities across Wales. The Assembly will have the opportunity to vote on all the amendments at Stage 3 on 5 May.

Welsh Language Standards

The Welsh Language Standards (No.1) Regulations 2015 were approved by the National Assembly on 24 March 2015 and came into force on 31 March 2015. The Welsh Language Commissioner has published a timetable on her website detailing the process for imposing standards on organisations.

We foresee that standards will begin to be operational during March 2016. The first full year of operating under the standards is therefore 2016-17 with organisations likely to publish their first set of reports in spring 2017. Such data will be routinely collected and submitted to the Commissioner as part of the organisation's compliance with Record Keeping Standards. Such data could be compared and cross-referenced against data collected through other means such as language use surveys and internal management data to assess uptake and use.

The organisations subject to the first set of standards have been subject to Welsh Language Schemes for a number of years. Schemes are currently monitored by the Welsh Language Commissioner and previously by the Welsh Language Board. Through collating data on complaints, the findings of investigations into complaints, and through monitoring data compiled through the Annual Reports, the Commissioner has a strong baseline of data on Welsh language services provided by public bodies. We also have baseline data on the use of Welsh language services through the language use surveys conducted in 2004-06 and in 2013-15, and from the Census.

The Welsh Language Standards Programme Board are aware of the need to put in place a robust evaluation framework for the standards, and are working with the Welsh Government's Knowledge and Analytical Services department on how best to achieve this.

Data on the number of Welsh speakers employed by the Welsh Government is available, and would also be available for the other organisations subject to Standards through their compliance with Record Keeping standards. Currently, the percentage of Welsh speakers working for the Welsh Government (22.5%) closely corresponds to the percentage of Welsh speakers in Wales (19%). As part of compliance with standards, vacant posts will be assessed to decide whether Welsh language skills are required.

We note your recommendation regarding the timetable for the second and third set of standards.

Welsh Ministers will begin the process of introducing Regulations to make Standards applicable to organisations subject to the Commissioner's second Standards Investigation before the end of 2015. We cannot provide a more detailed timetable until we receive Standards Reports from the Commissioner. These will help us to understand the scale of the work.

As far as Standards for bodies in the Commissioner's third investigation are concerned, the Commissioner's proposed timetable allows officials to begin the work of preparing Regulations for those bodies at the beginning of 2016. As was the case with previous sets of Standards, we cannot provide a more detailed timetable until we see the Commissioner's standards reports, and we cannot pre-empt the contents of those Reports.

Welsh in Education

Sioned Davies Report

In undertaking his independent review, Professor Donaldson considered the important reports of a number of independent reviews commissioned by the Welsh Government. This included the Review of Welsh second language at Key Stages 3 and 4, chaired by Professor Sioned Davies. Professor Donaldson's conclusions are reflected in his report Successful Futures which was published on 25 February 2015.

On 4 March 2015, the Minister for Education and Skills launched the Great Debate on education in Wales. The outcome of this phase of the Great Debate will inform the Minister's response to Professor Donaldson's recommendations due for publication in the summer. The Welsh Government will consider the possibility of accelerating some of the recommendations with regard to Welsh second language, assuming that they are accepted by the Minister.

Welsh as a Skill

One of the key recommendations of both Professor Davies' and Professor Donaldson's reports is to have a renewed focus in schools on learning Welsh primarily as a means of communication, particularly in preparation for the workplace.

The Welsh Government decided to await the publication of Professor Donaldson's report before revising GCSE Welsh Second Language. Now that his recommendations are known, the Welsh Government will soon begin working with WJEC and other key stakeholders to take forward the reform of qualifications in this key area, giving due consideration to Professor Donaldson's recommendation to realign Welsh language qualifications at 16 with the proposed focus on speaking and listening and application in the workplace.

Teaching Capacity

Ensuring that there are sufficient numbers of practitioners for all phases of education and training, with high-quality Welsh-language skills and competence in teaching methodologies, is one of the aims of the Welsh-medium Education Strategy, and Welsh-language training is available to practitioners through the Welsh-language Sabbatical Scheme.

Further consideration will be given to how to ensure a sufficient pool of practitioners to deliver a renewed Welsh second language curriculum as part of our response to Professor Donaldson's review, Professor Furlong's review of Initial Teacher Training, and as part of the New Deal for the Education Workforce.

Welsh for Adults

Our policy statement *A Living Language: A Language for Living – Moving Forward* clearly indicates our desire to see more people gaining confidence in the Welsh language so that they may use it in their everyday lives. This includes the need to ensure that learners continue to learn at the higher levels and the need to provide opportunities for Welsh speakers to refresh and improve their skills.

The Welsh for Adults Review Group's report, *Raising Our Sights*, was published in 2013 and included a number of recommendations in this direction. The Welsh Government is in the process of implementing the recommendations of the review group, including the first recommendation to establish a national entity to be responsible for leading the sector strategically. One of the first tasks of the entity will be to reduce the number of providers of Welsh for Adults. It is hoped that this will lead to economies of scale in order to ensure a viable and sustainable provision available to learners at all levels and across Wales.

Online services

The Welsh Language Commissioner is responsible for encouraging the private sector to provide services in Welsh, including online services. The Commissioner recently conducted

a review into the Welsh language services of banks, and we welcome the report which the Commissioner published on 29 April 2015.

'Motivating the major technology companies' is one of the themes of the Welsh Government's Welsh language technology and digital media action plan, and in that context we wish to see greater provision of online services. Meetings have been held with major companies such as Apple, Microsoft and Google and we continue to correspond with international companies.

In some situations, deficiencies in Welsh technology infrastructure could be a barrier to the provision of Welsh services. For example, there is no voice-to-text or 'AI' (artificial intelligence/artificial understanding) capability in Welsh, therefore services such as Siri, Cortana and Google Now are not available in Welsh.

Through our Welsh Language Technology and Digital Media Grant projects we have funded Welsh language technology that will facilitate the development of some elements of this critical infrastructure. The same challenge is true when considering the situation of other European minority languages, so we are in discussions regarding cooperation on solutions through European networks such as the Network for Linguistic Diversity (NPLD) and Meta-Net.

Numbers of Welsh Speakers on Major Public Bodies

In light of the Standards which will soon be imposed on the Welsh Ministers under the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011, the guidance for officials managing a public appointment recruitment exercise has changed. Officials are now asked to complete a Welsh language impact assessment and confirm in the submission to their Minister (which requests sign off for the job advert, specification and advertising strategy) that they have considered the requirements of the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011. This should ensure that Welsh language requirements are properly considered and incorporated where necessary into the recruitment process.

2. The Process for, and Scrutiny of, Major Public Appointments in Wales

The independent review of the role and functions of the Children's Commissioner has made a number of recommendations, including one relating to the matter the Committee has asked me to consider. Ministers are currently discussing these issues which are relevant to a number of portfolios and I would not wish to pre-empt the outcome of these discussions.

Yours sincerely



CARWYN JONES