

# Concise Minutes – Finance Committee

---

Meeting Venue:

**Committee Room 2 – Senedd**

Meeting date: Thursday, 28 January  
2016

Meeting time: 09.02 – 11.52

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/3361>

---

## Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Jocelyn Davies AM (Chair) Peter Black AM Christine Chapman AM Mike Hedges AM Alun Ffred Jones AM Ann Jones AM Julie Morgan AM Nick Ramsay AM
Witnesses:	Jane Hutt AM, The Minister for Finance and Government Business Sean Bradley, Welsh Government Richard Clarke, Welsh Government Jeff Andrews, Welsh Government
Committee Staff:	Bethan Davies (Clerk) Leanne Hatcher (Second Clerk)



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

	Georgina Owen (Deputy Clerk)
	Gerallt Roberts (Deputy Clerk)
	Martin Jennings (Researcher)
	Christian Tipples (Researcher)
	Joanest Varney-Jackson (Legal Adviser)

## Transcript

View the [meeting transcript](#).

### 1 Welsh Government Draft Budget 2016–17: Consideration of draft report

1.1 The Committee agreed the draft report with minor changes.

### 2 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

2.1 The Chair welcomed Members to the meeting.

2.2 No apologies were received.

### 3 Papers to note

3.1 The papers were noted.

### 4 Tax Collection and Management (Wales) Bill: Stage 2 scrutiny

4.1 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

#### Amendment 91 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	

	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 91 was not agreed.</b>		

As amendment 91 was not agreed, amendments 92, 93, 94, 95 and 96 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

#### **Amendment 24 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 24 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 75 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

#### **Amendment 25 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	

	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 25 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 26 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 26 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 76 (Jane Hutt)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Christine Chapman	Nick Ramsay	
Julie Morgan		
Mike Hedges		
Ann Jones		
Jocelyn Davies		
Alun Ffred Jones		
Peter Black		
<b>Amendment 76 was agreed.</b>		

As amendment 76 was agreed, amendment 27 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

As amendment 25 was not agreed, amendment 28 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

**Amendment 1 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### Amendment 29 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 29 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 77 (Jane Hutt)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Christine Chapman	Nick Ramsay	
Julie Morgan		
Mike Hedges		
Ann Jones		
Jocelyn Davies		
Alun Ffred Jones		
Peter Black		
<b>Amendment 77 was agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 30 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	

Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 30 was not agreed.		

Amendment 78 (Jane Hutt) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 79 (Jane Hutt) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 31 (Nick Ramsay)**

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	Alun Ffred Jones
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
Amendment 31 was not agreed.		

**Amendment 32 (Nick Ramsay)**

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	Alun Ffred Jones
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	Jocelyn Davies
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
Amendment 32 was not agreed.		

Amendment 80 (Jane Hutt) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### Amendment 33 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	Alun Ffred Jones
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	Jocelyn Davies
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
<b>Amendment 33 was not agreed.</b>		

As amendment 33 was not agreed, amendments 34 and 35 fell.

### Amendment 36 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 36 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 37 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	

	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 37 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 38 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 38 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 81 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendments 82, 83 and 84 (Jane Hutt)** were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 39 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	Alun Ffred Jones
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	Jocelyn Davies
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
<b>Amendment 39 was not agreed.</b>		



### Amendment 40 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 40 was not agreed.</b>		

As amendment 40 was not agreed, amendment 41 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

### Amendment 42 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 42 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 43 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	Alun Ffred Jones
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	

	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 43 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 44 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 44 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 45 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 45 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendments 85 and 86 (Jane Hutt)** were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### Amendment 46 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 46 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 47 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 47 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 48 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	

	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 48 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 49 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 49 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 50 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 50 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 87 (Jane Hutt) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).**

**Amendment 51 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 51 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 52 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 52 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 21 (Peter Black)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 21 was not agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 22 (Peter Black)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 22 was not agreed.		

### Amendment 53 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 53 was not agreed.		

### Amendment 54 (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 54 was not agreed.		

### **Amendment 55 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 55 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 2 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 74 (Peter Black)** was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

### **Amendment 56 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 56 was not agreed.</b>		

### **Amendment 57 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 57 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 58 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 58 was not agreed.</b>		

#### **Amendment 59 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	



	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 59 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 60 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 60 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 3A (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 3A was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 3 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendments 4 and 5 (Jane Hutt)** were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### Amendment 6A (Nick Ramsay)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 6A was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 6 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### Amendment 7 (Jane Hutt)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Christine Chapman	Nick Ramsay	
Julie Morgan		
Mike Hedges		
Ann Jones		
Jocelyn Davies		
Alun Ffred Jones		
Peter Black		
<b>Amendment 7 was agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 61A (Peter Black)

In Favour	Against	Abstain
Christine Chapman	Nick Ramsay	Alun Ffred Jones

Julie Morgan		
Mike Hedges		
Ann Jones		
Jocelyn Davies		
Peter Black		
<b>Amendment 61A was agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 61**, as amended, (**Nick Ramsay**) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 62 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 62 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 63 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	

	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 63 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 64 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 64 was not agreed.</b>		

As amendment 63 was not agreed, amendments 65 and 66 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

**Amendment 67 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 67 was not agreed.</b>		

As amendment 63 was not agreed, amendments 68 and 69 (Nick Ramsay) fell.

**Amendment 70 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 70 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendments 8 and 9 (Jane Hutt)** were disposed of en bloc and were agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 71 (Nick Ramsay)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
	Mike Hedges	
	Ann Jones	
	Alun Ffred Jones	
	Jocelyn Davies	
<b>Amendment 71 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 10 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 88 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 11 (Jane Hutt)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### **Amendment 12 (Jane Hutt)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Christine Chapman	Nick Ramsay	
Julie Morgan		
Mike Hedges		
Ann Jones		
Jocelyn Davies		
Alun Ffred Jones		
Peter Black		
<b>Amendment 12 was agreed.</b>		

**Amendments 13, 14, 15, 16, 17 18 and 19 (Jane Hutt)** were disposed of en bloc and agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### **Amendment 23 (Peter Black)**

<b>In Favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Nick Ramsay	Christine Chapman	
Peter Black	Julie Morgan	
Jocelyn Davies	Mike Hedges	
Alun Ffred Jones	Ann Jones	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used her casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)).Therefore amendment 23 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendments 89, 90 and 20** were disposed of en bloc and agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As amendment 31 was not agreed, amendment 72 (Nick Ramsay) fell.