

Concise Minutes – Environment and Sustainability Committee

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 3 – Senedd

Meeting date: Thursday, 26 November 2015

Meeting time: 09.00 – 13.30

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/3311>

Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	Alun Ffred Jones AM (Chair) Mick Antoniw AM Jeff Cuthbert AM Russell George AM Llyr Gruffydd AM Janet Haworth AM Julie Morgan AM William Powell AM Jenny Rathbone AM Joyce Watson AM
Witnesses:	Carl Sargeant AM, The Minister for Natural Resources Andy Fraser, Welsh Government Lori Frater, Welsh Government



	Nicola Charles, Welsh Government
Committee Staff:	Alun Davidson (Clerk) Adam Vaughan (Deputy Clerk) Lisa Salkeld (Legal Adviser)

Transcript

View the [meeting transcript](#).

1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

There were no apologies.

2 Environment (Wales) Bill – Stage 2 – consideration of amendments

2.1 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

Amendment 14 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	7	0
Amendment 14 was not agreed		

Amendment 91 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 91 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 42 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
7	3	0
<p>Amendment 42 was agreed</p>		

Amendment 21 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	

Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 21 was not agreed.		

Amendment 22 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 22 was not agreed.		

Amendment 1 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 2 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 15 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Llyr Gruffydd	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Joyce Watson	
William Powell	Mick Antoniw	

	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	6	1
Amendment 15 was not agreed		

Amendment 16 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Llyr Gruffydd	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Joyce Watson	
William Powell	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	6	1
Amendment 16 was not agreed		

Amendment 43 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		

7	3	0
Amendment 43 was agreed		

Amendment 118 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	William Powell	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Joyce Watson	Llyr Gruffydd
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	6	2
Amendment 118 was not agreed		

Amendment 119 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	William Powell	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Joyce Watson	Llyr Gruffydd
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	6	2
Amendment 119 was not agreed		

Amendment 44 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 92 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 92 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 79 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 79 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 93 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	

Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 93 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 94 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 94 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 95 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	

5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 95 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 96 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 96 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 80 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 80 was not</p>		

agreed.

Amendment 97 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 97 was not agreed.		

Amendment 81 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 81 was not agreed.		

Amendment 3 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 23 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Llyr Gruffydd	
Russell George	Joyce Watson	
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
4	6	0
Amendment 23 was not agreed		

Amendment 120 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	0
Amendment 120 was not agreed		

Amendment 17 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	Llyr Gruffydd	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Joyce Watson	
William Powell	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	6	1
Amendment 17 was not agreed		

Amendment 24 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	7	0
Amendment 24 was not agreed		

Amendment 25 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	

William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 25 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 98 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 98 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 99 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative</p>		

(in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 99 was not agreed.

As amendment 23 was not agreed, amendment 26 (William Powell) fell.

Amendment 82 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 82 was not agreed.

Amendment 45 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 46 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
7	3	0

Amendment 46 was agreed

Amendment 100 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 100 was not agreed.		

Amendment 83 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 83 was not agreed.		

Amendment 101 (Llyr Gruffydd) was not moved.

Amendment 47 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As amendment 47 was not agreed, **amendment 27 (William Powell)** fell.

Amendment 28 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 28 was not agreed.		

Amendment 48 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 102 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 102 was not agreed.		

Amendment 121 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	William Powell	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	7	1
Amendment 121 was not agreed		

Amendment 122 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 122 was not agreed.		

Amendment 18 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	William Powell	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	7	1
Amendment 18 was not agreed		

Amendment 4 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 103 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 103 was not agreed.		

Amendment 29 (William Powell) was withdrawn in accordance with Standing Order 26.66(i).

Amendment 84 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 84 was not agreed		

Amendment 123 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
	William Powell	
4	6	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 123 was not agreed.		

Amendment 50 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 19 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	

Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	0
Amendment 19 was not agreed		

Amendment 104 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 104 was not agreed.		

Amendment 124 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	

Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 124 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 5 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 49 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 105 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 105 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 85 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	

	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 85 was not agreed		

Amendment 86 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 86 was not agreed		

Amendment 87 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 87 was not agreed		

Amendment 88 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones
Janet Haworth	Mick Antoniw	Llyr Gruffydd
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 88 was not agreed		

Amendment 51 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 52 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 125 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 125 was not agreed.		

Amendment 53 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	

Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
7	3	0
Amendment 53 was agreed		

Amendment 54 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
7	3	0
Amendment 54 was agreed		

Amendment 55 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 56 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 57 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 20 (Russell George)

In favour	Against	Abstain
------------------	----------------	----------------

Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	0
Amendment 20 was not agreed		

Amendment 30 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 30 was not agreed		

Amendment 58 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 106 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	

Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 106 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 126 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 126 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 59 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 60A (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	

	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 60A was not agreed		

Amendment 60B (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 60B was not agreed		

Amendment 60 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 107 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 107 was not agreed.		

Amendment 108 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 108 was not agreed.		

Amendment 109 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 109 was not agreed.		

Amendment 61 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 62 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 63 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 64 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 31 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 31 was not agreed.		

Amendment 127 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 127 was not agreed.		

Amendment 110 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 110 was not agreed		

Amendment 111 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 111 was not agreed		

Amendment 89 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 89 was not agreed.

Amendment 65 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 66 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 6 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 7 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 112 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0

As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 112 was not agreed.

Amendment 32 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	

3	5	2
Amendment 32 was not agreed		

Amendment 113 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 113 was not agreed.		

Amendment 33 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones		Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd		Janet Haworth
William Powell		
Joyce Watson		
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
8	0	2

Amendment 33 was agreed

Amendment 67 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 34 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	Russell George
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	Janet Haworth
William Powell	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	5	2
Amendment 34 was not agreed		

Amendment 8 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 9 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 10 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 114 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 114 was not		

agreed.

Amendment 68 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 115 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 115 was not agreed.		

Amendment 69 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 70 (Carl Sargeant)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
Joyce Watson	William Powell	
Mick Antoniw		
Julie Morgan		
Jeff Cuthbert		
Jenny Rathbone		
7	3	0

Amendment 70 was agreed

Amendment 35 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 35 was not agreed.		

Amendment 116 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 116 was not agreed.		

Amendment 11 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 12 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 71 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 72 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 73 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 36 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
Llyr Gruffydd	Janet Haworth	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	7	0
Amendment 36 was not agreed		

Amendment 90 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 90 was not		

agreed.

Amendment 117 (Llyr Gruffydd)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 117 was not agreed.		

Amendment 74 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 37 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 37 was not agreed.		

Amendment 128 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	0
Amendment 128 was not agreed		

Amendment 38 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Russell George	
Llyr Gruffydd	Janet Haworth	
William Powell	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
3	7	0
Amendment 38 was not agreed		

Amendment 39 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
<p>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 39 was not agreed.</p>		

Amendment 129 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	
<p>Amendment 129 was not agreed</p>		

Amendment 130 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	William Powell	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	8	
Amendment 130 was not agreed		

Amendment 40 (William Powell) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 131 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 131 was not agreed.		

Amendment 132 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
-----------	---------	---------

Russell George	Alun Ffred Jones	William Powell
Janet Haworth	Llyr Gruffydd	
	Joyce Watson	
	Mick Antoniw	
	Julie Morgan	
	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
2	7	1
Amendment 132 was not agreed		

Amendment 75 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 41 (William Powell)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 41 was not agreed.		

Amendment 133 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Llyr Gruffydd	Joyce Watson	Alun Ffred Jones

Russell George	Mick Antoniw	
Janet Haworth	Julie Morgan	
William Powell	Jeff Cuthbert	
	Jenny Rathbone	
4	5	1
Amendment 133 was not agreed		

Amendment 76 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 77 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 78 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 13 (Carl Sargeant) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 134 (Janet Haworth)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Ffred Jones	Joyce Watson	
Llyr Gruffydd	Mick Antoniw	
Russell George	Julie Morgan	
Janet Haworth	Jeff Cuthbert	
William Powell	Jenny Rathbone	
5	5	0
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20 (ii)). Therefore amendment 134 was not agreed.		