



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 9 Gorffennaf 2002**

**Tuesday 9 July 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 20 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 22 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 23 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 24 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
*Composite Motion: Approval of Orders*
- 26 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 28 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002 a Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002  
*Approval of the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002 and the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002*
- 38 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Gorchymyn Cymunedau Ewrop (Dynodiadau) (Rhif 2) 2002  
*Delegation of the Functions of the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2) Order 2002*
- 41 Cymeradwyo Cyllideb Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar gyfer 2003-04  
*Approval of the Budget of the Presiding Office for 2003-04*
- 42 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar y Gymraeg  
*The Culture Committee's Report on the Welsh Language*
- 68 Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Mesur Cyfathrebu  
*The Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Communications Bill*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

### **Tlodi ac Allgáu Cymdeithasol Poverty and Social Exclusion**

**C1 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddylanwad polisïau datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrth fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol? (OAQ18830)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae ein cynllun datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru'n Ennill', wedi ei seilio ar greu cymunedau cryfach a lleihau diweithdra. Mae'r llwyddiannau a gawsom y llynedd, sef torri record cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wrth gynnig £143 miliwn mewn un flwyddyn ariannol, y diddordeb enfawr yng ngrantiau buddsoddi newydd y Cynulliad i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint a'r ffaith bod diweithdra yr isaf a fu ers cenhedlaeth, yn cael yr effaith ddisgwyliedig.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Rhyl yn un o'r lleoedd tlotaf yng Nghymru. Pa fesurau addas ychwanegol sydd ar y gweill i sicrhau y defnyddir arian Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn effeithiol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mynychais seminar yn y Rhyl am ryw awr fore Gwener diwethaf yn ystod fy ymweliad diweddaraf â'r Gogledd. Trafodwyd y cwestiwn o sut y gellid trawsnewid cymuned fel gorllewin Rhyl, sy'n dioddef o dlodi a phroblemau cymdeithasol eraill. Mae arweinwyr cymunedol, ymhlith eraill, yn ceisio canfod ffordd o ddatrys problemau'r ardal honno. Nid oes gan y Prif Weinidog nac unrhyw un arall ffon hud i drawsnewid cymuned fel hon dros nos, ond yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed i ganfod atebion ar sail datblygu economaidd a chymdeithasol fel rhan o raglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf.

**Elin Jones:** Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd eisoes yn cydnabod yr angen i waredu tlodi yng Nghymru drwy Amcan 1. A gytunwch fod

**Q1 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of the Assembly Government's economic development policies in helping to tackle poverty and social exclusion? (OAQ18830)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Our economic development plan, 'A Winning Wales', is based on creating stronger communities and reducing unemployment. Our successes of last year, such as breaking the regional selective assistance record by allocating £143 million in one financial year, the tremendous interest in the new Assembly investment grants for small and medium-sized enterprises, and the lowest unemployment for a generation, are having the anticipated impact.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Rhyl is one of the poorest places in Wales. What additional adequate measures are in hand to ensure that Communities First funding is used effectively?

**The First Minister:** I attended an hour-long seminar at Rhyl last Friday morning during my most recent visit to north Wales. The issue of how to transform a community such as Rhyl west, which suffers from poverty and other social problems, was discussed. Community leaders, among others, are trying to find a way of solving the area's problems. Neither the First Minister nor anyone else has a magic wand with which to transform communities such as these overnight, but we are working hard to find answers based on economic and social development as part of the Communities First programme.

**Elin Jones:** The European Union already acknowledges the need to eradicate poverty in Wales through Objective 1. Do you agree

angen i Lywodraeth San Steffan wneud yr un ymrwymiad drwy gyhoeddi yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant y bydd Cymru'n derbyn cyllid cyfatebol llawn ar gyfer Amcan 1, yn ogystal â'r cyllid Ewropeaidd? A ydych wedi gofyn i'r Canghellor am yr ymrwymiad hwnnw?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna fu ein prif flaenoriaeth mewn trafodaethau gyda'r Canghellor a'r Trysorlys yn uniongyrchol a thrwy Swyddfa Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Buom yn llwyddiannus y tro diwethaf a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn llwyddiannus unwaith eto. Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw'r unig lywodraeth yn y Deyrnas Unedig sydd wedi llwyddo i gyflawni'r gamp honno. Byddwn yn gobeithio gallu cyflawni'r gamp unwaith eto pan gyhoeddir adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant 2002 mewn ychydig o wythnosau.

**Ann Jones:** Is the First Minister aware that although unemployment in the Vale of Clwyd has halved since 1997, some unemployment black spots, such as Rhyl, remain? I am sorry that Eleanor Burnham has left the Chamber, as she will not hear about a success story from Rhyl. I welcome the establishing of the Rhyl women's enterprise project under the auspices of Rhyl College. It is one of the ways that people in Rhyl are being assisted back into employment. Will you join me in congratulating Rhyl College as one of the town's recent success stories?

**The First Minister:** I was glad to be at the seminar in Rhyl on Friday morning, which you and Chris Ruane MP organised. I was impressed by the level of teamwork and the success stories of different initiatives led by the voluntary sector and local government and those which depend upon continued Assembly funding. Much still needs to be done in communities such as Rhyl west, but we reach the goals. I hope that Rhyl west will show the way forward in how to transform an area, in changing from its current state to how its inhabitants want it to be in a few years' time.

**David Davies:** The tourism sector is one of the biggest earners and employers in the Welsh economy. A successful tourism

that the Westminster Government needs to make the same commitment by announcing in the comprehensive spending review that Wales will receive full match funding for Objective 1, as well as the European funding? Have you asked the Chancellor for that commitment?

**The First Minister:** That has been our main priority in discussions with the Chancellor and the Treasury directly and through the Office of the Secretary of State for Wales. We were successful last time and I hope that we will be successful again. The Assembly Government is the only Government in the United Kingdom that has accomplished that feat. We hope to accomplish it again when the 2002 CSR is announced in a few weeks' time.

**Ann Jones:** Er bod diweithdra yn Nyffryn Clwyd wedi haneru ers 1997, a yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ymwybodol bod rhai mannau du o ddiweithdra, fel y Rhyl, yn aros? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fod Eleanor Burnham wedi gadael y Siambr, gan na chaiff glywed am stori lwyddiant o'r Rhyl. Croesawaf sefydlu prosiect menter merched y Rhyl dan nawdd Coleg y Rhyl. Dyma un o'r ffyrdd y mae pobl yn y Rhyl yn cael eu helpu'n ôl i fyd gwaith. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i longyfarch Coleg y Rhyl fel un o lwyddiannau diweddar y dref?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod yn y seminar yn y Rhyl fore dydd Gwener, a drefnwyd gennych chi a Chris Ruane AS. Edmygais lefel y gwaith tîm a hanesion llwyddiant amryfal fentrau dan arweiniad y sector gwirfoddol a llywodraeth leol a'r rhai sy'n dibynnu ar gyllid parhaus gan y Cynulliad. Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd mewn cymunedau fel gorllewin y Rhyl, ond cyrhaeddwn y nod. Gobeithiaf y gall gorllewin y Rhyl ddangos y ffordd ymlaen o ran sut i drawsnewid ardal, wrth newid o'i chyflwr presennol i'r modd y mae ei thrigolion am iddi fod ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd.

**David Davies:** Y sector twristiaeth yw un o'r enillwyr a'r cyflogwyr mwyaf yn economi Cymru. Gall diwydiant twristiaeth

industry does much to alleviate social exclusion in some areas. Why therefore is the Government intent on ruining the tourism industry in parts of Monmouthshire and the Brecon Beacons National Park by forcing the relevant planning authorities to set aside large areas of the countryside for quarrying?

**The First Minister:** I have noticed, David, that you are concerned with stopping almost any project in Monmouthshire, including tourism projects. As I recall, you opposed the project to expand the Rolls of Monmouth club. You now seem to have changed your mind about tourism. Perhaps you could write to me about the quarrying proposals, as you seem to have reversed your stance.

**John Griffiths:** The Assembly's response to the Corus cutbacks has been impressive. Do you agree that the closure of the Ebbw Vale steelworks, marked by the impressive march that my friend Peter Law attended at the weekend, underlines the need to carry through that response and build upon it?

2:10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am glad that you raised that issue. Although 212 years of history has come to an end, we must encourage the start of a new chapter. Transforming an area that has been mainly dependent on one industry for more than two centuries will not be easy. However, the spirit shown on that march, which was also manifested in the attendance of the local Member of the European Parliament, the Vice-President of the European Commission, the Assembly's Minister for Economic Development, the local Assembly Member and Member of Parliament, was impressive. The publicity that the march attracted throughout the United Kingdom will put everyone in the Blaenau Gwent area in good heart that there is much encouragement for a new and diversified future for that community.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn inni symud at yr ail gwestiwn, rhaid imi nodi nad yw'n briodol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ofyn cwestiwn ac yna adael y Siambr cyn diwedd y drafodaeth ar y

llwyddiannus wneud llawer i leddfu allgáu cymdeithasol mewn rhai ardaloedd. Pam felly y mae'r Llywodraeth â'i bryd ar ddfetha'r diwydiant twristiaeth mewn rhannau o Sir Fynwy a Pharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog drwy orfodi'r awdurdodau cynllunio perthnasol i neilltuo darnau mawr o gefn gwlad ar gyfer chwareli?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf wedi sylwi, David, eich bod yn awyddus i atal bron unrhyw brosiect yn Sir Fynwy, gan gynnwys prosiectau twristiaeth. Fel y cofiaf, yr oeddech yn erbyn y prosiect i ehangu clwb Rolls of Monmouth. Yn awr mae'n edrych yn debyg eich bod wedi newid eich meddwl ynglŷn â thwristiaeth. Efallai y gallech ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r cynigion ar gyfer chwareli, gan ei bod yn edrych yn debyg eich bod wedi newid eich meddwl.

**John Griffiths:** Bu ymateb y Cynulliad i doriadau Corus yn un da. A gytunweh fod cau gwaith dur Glynebwy, achlysur a nodwyd gyda'r orymdaith fawreddog y bu fy nghyfaill Peter Law arni dros y Sul, yn tanlinellu'r angen i gario'r ymateb hwnnw ymlaen ac adeiladu arno?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi'r mater hwn. Er bod 212 o flynyddoedd o hanes wedi dod i ben, rhaid inni annog cychwyn pennod newydd. Nid gwaith hawdd fydd trawsnewid ardal a fu'n bennaf ddibynnol ar un diwydiant ers dros ddwy ganrif. Er hynny, yr oedd yr ysbryd a ddangoswyd ar yr orymdaith honno, a amlygwyd hefyd ym mhresenoldeb yr Aelod Seneddol Ewropeaidd lleol, Is-Lywydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, Gweinidog y Cynulliad dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol a'r Aelod Seneddol lleol, yn drawiadol. Bydd y cyhoeddusrwydd a ddenodd yr orymdaith ledled y Deyrnas Unedig yn calonogi pawb yn ardal Blaenau Gwent fod llawer o gefnogaeth i ddyfodol newydd, gwahanol, i'r gymuned honno.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before we move on to the second question, I must note that it is inappropriate for Assembly Members to ask a question and then leave the Chamber before

cwestiwn. Yn wir, oherwydd diddordeb Aelodau yn y mater, yr wyf wedi caniatáu chwe munud ar gyfer y cwestiwn. Credaf ei bod yn briodol imi dynnu sylw at y mater hwn.

discussion of that question comes to an end. Indeed, given Members' interest in the subject, I have allowed six minutes for this question. I feel it appropriate for me to draw attention to this matter.

### **Cyfreithiau Cyflogi Employment Laws**

**C2 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar gyfreithiau cyflogi? (OAQ18834)

**Q2 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the First Minister make a statement on his discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales on employment laws? (OAQ18834)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel arfer, byddaf yn cael cyfarfod wythnosol â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a byddwn yn trafod materion sydd o ddiddordeb cyffredin i'n Llywodraeth ni ac i Lywodraeth San Steffan. Weithiau, mae ein trafodaethau'n cynnwys goblygiadau cyfreithiau cyflogi i Gymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â ni ar unrhyw newidiadau arfaethedig i gyfreithiau cyflogi.

**The First Minister:** I usually meet the Secretary of State for Wales on a weekly basis and we discuss matters that are of interest to our Government and to the Westminster Government. Sometimes, our discussions will include the implications of employment laws for Wales. We are formally consulted by the United Kingdom Government on any proposed changes to employment laws.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A ydych wedi dweud wrth Paul Murphy eich bod o blaid newid Deddf Cysylltiadau Cyflogaeth 1999 sydd wedi bod mor niweidiol yn achos gweithwyr Friction Dynamics Cyf yng Nghaernarfon? A gefnogwch ymdrechion y gweithwyr i newid y Ddeddf honno i sicrhau nad oes modd i gyflogwyr adweithiol fel Craig Smith daflu gweithwyr ar y clwt am iddynt weithredu'n ddiwydiannol? Yr oedd eu hachos yn deg gan fod Craig Smith eisiau torri eu cyflog yn sylweddol. A gytnwch hefyd â Bill Morris, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol Undeb y Gweithwyr Trafnidiaeth a Chyffredinol a ddywed fod rhaid i'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain newid y Ddeddf? Ar ba ochr y safwch chi, Brif Weinidog: ar ochr gweithwyr Friction Dynamics neu ar ochr Tony Blair, sy'n gwrthod newid y Ddeddf?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Have you told Paul Murphy that you are in favour of amending the Employment Relations Act 1999, which has been so damaging in the case of the workers of Friction Dynamics Ltd in Caernarfon? Do you support the workers' efforts to change the Act to ensure that it is not possible for reactionary employers such as Craig Smith to sack workers because they take industrial action? Their case was justified since Craig Smith wanted to substantially cut their wages. Do you also agree with Bill Morris, general secretary of the Transport and General Workers Union, who said that the Labour Government in London must change the Act? With whom do you stand, First Minister: with the workers of Friction Dynamics or with Tony Blair, who refuses to change the Act?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n anodd ateb cwestiwn ar achos sydd ar fin mynd gerbron tribiwnlys diwydiannol. Fe glywir achos gweithwyr Friction Dynamics ym mis Hydref, felly nid yw bosibl imi fynegi barn. Mae egwyddor y mater yn hollol wahanol. Fodd bynnag, gan eich bod wedi cyfeirio at achos penodol, nid yw'n briodol i mi ateb.

**The First Minister:** It is difficult to answer a question on a case that is about to go before an industrial tribunal. The case of the Friction Dynamics workers will be heard in October, so it is not possible for me to express an opinion. The principle of the matter is a different issue. However, as you referred to a specific case, it would not be appropriate for me to respond.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Bydd gweithwyr Friction Dynamics yn siomedig gyda'ch amharodrwydd i ddangos ar ba ochr yr ydych yn y frwydr hon. Yr ydych eisoes wedi beirniadu Craig Smith yn y Siambr. Y cyfan a all y gweithwyr ei obeithio yw y byddwch yn dangos ar ba ochr yr ydych.

A ydych hefyd yn cydnabod yr anniddigrwydd dwfn sy'n bodoli ymhlith gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus a fydd yn gweithredu'n ddiwydiannol wythnos i heddiw oherwydd eu bod yn siomedig gydag agwedd y Llywodraeth Lafur yn Llundain at gyflogaeth a chyflogau teg? A wnewch chi gefnogi'r gweithwyr wrth iddynt weithredu'n ddiwydiannol yr wythnos nesaf i sicrhau cyflogau teg?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni allwch fy ngwneud yn rhan o anghytundeb diwydiannol sydd heb ddigwydd eto. Mae'n rhaid i mi sefyll o'r neilltu tra bod yr anghytundeb hwnnw yn parhau. Gobeithiaf—a chredaf fod pawb yn y Siambr yn cytuno—na fydd y streic undydd yn troi'n streic hir. Gobeithiaf y bydd y cyflogwyr, sef yr awdurdodau lleol, ac arweinwyr undebau gweithwyr llywodraeth leol, yn dod i gytundeb. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw eu bod yn parhau i drafod ac yn dod i gytundeb.

**Mick Bates:** Do you agree that Plaid Cymru's amendments to the Welfare of Farmed Animals (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2002 would not get rid of just a few jobs, but the whole of the egg-laying industry in Wales?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is not about farm animals.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The workers of Friction Dynamics will be disappointed by your unwillingness to take sides in this battle. You have previously criticised Craig Smith in the Chamber. The workers of Friction Dynamics can now only hope that you will show on whose side you are.

Do you also acknowledge the deep dissatisfaction among public sector workers who will take industrial action a week today because of their disappointment with the attitude of the Labour Government in London towards employment and fair wages? Will you support the workers when they take industrial action next week to secure fair wages?

**The First Minister:** You cannot drag me into an industrial dispute that has yet to happen. I must step aside while that dispute takes place. I hope—and I am sure that everyone in the Chamber would agree—that the one-day strike does not turn into a long strike. I hope that the employers, namely the local authorities, and the leaders of local government workers' unions, will reach an agreement. It is important that their negotiations continue so that they reach an agreement.

**Mick Bates:** A gytunwch y byddai gwelliannau Plaid Cymru i Reoliadau Lles Anifeiliaid Fferm (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2002 yn cael gwared nid yn unig ar ychydig swyddi, ond ar y cyfan o'r diwydiant dodwy wyau yng Nghymru?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am anifeiliaid fferm yw hwn.

### **Teithiau Trên y Prif Weinidog i'r Gogledd First Minister's Train Travel to North Wales**

**C3 Dafydd Wigley:** Sawl gwaith y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi teithio ar drên i'r Gogledd eleni, ar waith swyddogol y Cynulliad? (OAQ18840)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf wedi gwneud hynny eleni. Yr egwyddor ar gyfer holl deithiau Gweinidogion yw gwneud y

**Q3 Dafydd Wigley:** How many times has the First Minister travelled to north Wales by train this year on Assembly business? (OAQ18840)

**The First Minister:** I have not done so this year. The principle adhered to with all ministerial journeys is to make the most

dewis mwyaf ymarferol, pa un ai ei bod yn golygu teithio ar y trê neu ddefnyddio'r car. Hyd yma, eleni, ni fu defnyddio'r trê i deithio o Gaerdydd neu o Lundain i'r Gogledd yn fwy ymarferol na defnyddio'r car.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Onid yw'r ateb hwnnw'n dweud y cyfan? Mae'r gwasanaeth trê i'r Gogledd mor echrydus, mae Prif Weinidog Cymru yn dewis peidio â'i ddefnyddio. Pe bai'r Prif Weinidog a'i gyd-Weinidogion yn teithio'n amlach ar y trenau ac yn gweld y problemau ymarferol a wynebir gan bobl sy'n teithio rhwng Caerdydd a'r Gogledd, efallai y byddent yn rhoi mwy o sylw i ateb y problemau hynny a gwella'r gwasanaeth.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes angen ffugio colli tymer, Dafydd; mae hynny'n afresymol. Mae'r egwyddor wedi'i deall a'i derbyn gan bob Llywodraeth: pan mai hynny yw'r dewis ymarferol, yr ydych yn teithio ar y trê. Nid wyf fyth yn teithio i'r Gogledd i un cyfarfod yn unig; fel rheol bydd gennyf dri neu bedwar o gyfarfodydd. Golyga hynny y byddai gofyn i rywun, pe bawn yn defnyddio'r trê, fy ngyrru o orsaf Wrecsam, Rhyl neu Fflint, er enghraifft, i'r cyfarfod cyntaf, ac yna ymlaen i'r ail a'r trydydd cyfarfod, cyn dychwelyd i'r orsaf drenau. Ambell waith, nid yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr.

**Richard Edwards:** Turning to west Wales, are you aware that the Wales and Borders train that I boarded yesterday was late? I know that that revelation will shock you. In fairness, the train was on time, but as it was not Thomas the Tank Engine, it required a driver, who did not arrive until 22 minutes after the scheduled departure time.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that you were travelling on a north Wales train.

**Richard Edwards:** It was west Wales; it is the same country.

**The Presiding Officer:** I appreciate that it is the same country, but this question deals with north Wales.

practical choice, whether it be to travel by train or to use the car. To date this year, using the train to travel from Cardiff or London to north Wales has not proved more practical than using the car.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Does not that answer say it all? The train service to north Wales is so poor, the First Minister chooses not to use it. If the First Minister and his ministerial colleagues travelled by train more often and witnessed the practical problems faced by people travelling between Cardiff and north Wales, they would perhaps pay more attention to solving those problems and improving the service.

**The First Minister:** There is no need to fake losing your temper, Dafydd; that is unreasonable. The principle has been understood and accepted by all Governments: when it is the most practical choice, you travel by train. I never travel to north Wales to one meeting only; I usually have three or four meetings to attend. That means that, were I to take the train, someone would have to drive me from Wrexham, Rhyl or Flint station, for example, to the first meeting, then on to the second and third meeting, before returning to the train station. That sometimes does not make sense.

**Richard Edwards:** A throi at y Gorllewin, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod un o drenau Wales and Borders y teithiais i arno ddoe yn hwyr? Gwn y bydd y newydd hwnnw'n sioc ichi. O ran tegwch, yr oedd y trê yno'n brydlon, ond gan nad Tomos y Tanc ydoedd, yr oedd angen gyrrwr arno, ac ni chyrrhaeddodd hwnnw tan 22 munud wedi'r amser yr oedd y trê i fod i gychwyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf yn meddwl mai teithio ar drên yng ngogledd Cymru yr oeddech chi.

**Richard Edwards:** Gorllewin Cymru ydoedd; yr un wlad yw hi.

**Y Llywydd:** Sylweddolaf mai'r un wlad yw hi, ond mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â'r Gogledd.



**William Graham:** Will the First Minister give details of journeys on Assembly business to or from north Wales by car, train or air? What is the cost-effectiveness of such journeys, and how do they contribute to improving travel and tourism income and activity in Wales?

**The First Minister:** Ministerial travel in itself does not have a direct impact on tourism in Wales. However, we should consider the effectiveness of the way in which we use all different aspects of our transport infrastructure. For example, narrow-gauge railways are among Wales's unique selling points; I believe that we are the only part of Europe that has eight narrow-gauge railways. They are different, and therefore attract people from Germany, Switzerland, the United States of America and so on, where they do not have such railways. It is also true that unreliable trains are a disincentive to tourism.

We are also hopeful that, from November, bmibaby, the no-frills airline, will bring in vast numbers of tourists. Cardiff airport will also gain from the flow of tourists, when the airline begins its services. There is the potential for 500,000 additional tourists to visit Wales—we should not only think of the airline as a cheaper and quicker way of getting people from Wales to other destinations; it is also a way of attracting tourists from the city regions which will be served by the airline.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ18823) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi manylion am deithiau ar fusnes y Cynulliad i'r Gogledd neu oddi yno mewn car, trênn neu awyren? Beth yw cost-effeithiolrwydd y teithiau hyn, a sut y maent yn cyfrannu at wella incwm a gweithgaredd teithio a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid yw teithio gan Weinidogion ynddo'i hun yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar dwristiaeth yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, dylem ystyried effeithiolrwydd y modd y defnyddiwn holl wahanol agweddau ein hisadeiledd trafniadaeth. Er enghraifft, mae rheilffyrdd bach cul ymhlith pwyntiau gwerthu unigryw Cymru; credaf mai ni yw'r unig ran o Ewrop sydd ag wyth rheilffordd fach gul. Maent yn wahanol, ac felly denant bobl o'r Almaen, y Swistir, Unol Daleithiau America ac ati, lle nad oes ganddynt reilffyrdd o'r fath. Mae'n wir hefyd bod trenau annibynadwy'n gweithio yn erbyn twristiaeth.

Yr ydym yn obeithiol hefyd y bydd bmibaby, y cwmni awyrennau cost isel, yn denu niferoedd helaeth o dwristiaid. Bydd maes awyr Caerdydd yntau'n elwa ar y llif twristiaid, pan ddechreu'r cwmni ei wasanaethau. Mae potensial i gael 500,000 o dwristiaid ychwanegol i ymweld â Chymru—dylem nid yn unig feddwl am y cwmni awyrennau fel ffordd ratach a chynt i bobl deithio o Gymru i fannau eraill; mae hefyd yn ffordd o ddenu twristiaid yma o'r dinasoedd a wasanaethir gan y cwmni awyrennau.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4 (OAQ18823) has been transferred for written answer.

### **Proffil y Cynulliad yn y Gogledd The Assembly's Profile in North Wales**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the role of the Minister for Open Government in raising the Assembly's profile in north Wales? (OAQ18841)

**The First Minister:** The Cabinet will be in Llandudno next week for its first public open-mike session. This will give the Minister for Open Government—and all Ministers—the chance to hear at first hand

**C5 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am rôl y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored wrth godi proffil y Cynulliad yng ngogledd Cymru? (OAQ18841)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd y Cabinet yn Llandudno yr wythnos nesaf ar gyfer ei sesiwn hawl i holi cyhoeddus cyntaf. Rhydd hyn gyfle i'r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored—a phob Gweinidog—glywed barn

the views of people in north Wales. In carrying out his role of communicating effectively the achievements of the Assembly Government, the Minister will raise the profile of the Assembly in all parts of Wales. He also proposes to hold press get-togethers in north Wales, and is already familiar with the area as a result of his previous role.

2:20 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** You will be aware that the Sunderland commission made a number of proposals relating to the need for greater education about politics and in particular the need to encourage young people to take an active part in politics. Do you see a role for the Minister for Open Government in north Wales, particularly in relation to encouraging young people to take part in politics? We had an interesting presentation and discussion at lunchtime with young people from south Wales, who were visiting the Assembly and who were able to play an interactive role with their Assembly Members. Will your Minister organise a similar session for north Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do not know of any proposals at this time. The issue of the Assembly being able to promote itself is important. You can have virtual access via the internet to the Assembly at the Pierhead visitor and education centre, regardless of where you are in Wales. That is good. That technology is probably in advance of other parliaments, governments and assemblies in the UK, but I am sure that we can take it further. That will be a matter for the Minister for Open Government and the Assembly's wider authorities.

**David Melding:** Given that membership of the Cabinet has been closed to Members from north Wales for whatever reason, do you not think that it is even more important that the Assembly's Plenary session meets at least once a year in north Wales?

**The First Minister:** That is not a matter for me.

pobl y Gogledd o lygad y ffynnon. Wrth gyflawni ei rôl o gyfathrebu llwyddiannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn effeithiol, bydd y Gweinidog yn codi proffil y Cynulliad ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae ganddo fwriad hefyd i gynnal cyfarfodydd gyda'r wasg yn y Gogledd, ac mae eisoes yn gyfarwydd â'r ardal o ganlyniad i'w rôl flaenorol.

**Janet Ryder:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol y gwnaeth comisiwn Sunderland nifer o argymhellion ynglŷn â'r angen am fwy o addysg am wleidyddiaeth ac yn enwedig yr angen i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan weithredol mewn gwleidyddiaeth. A welwch rôl i'r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored yn y Gogledd, yn enwedig o ran annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn gwleidyddiaeth? Cawsom gyflwyniad a thrafodaeth ddiddorol dros ginio gyda phobl ifanc o'r De, a oedd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad ac a oedd yn gallu chwarae rhan ryngweithiol gyda'u Haelodau Cynulliad. A wnaiff eich Gweinidog drefnu sesiwn debyg ar gyfer y Gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni wn am unrhyw gynigion ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn gallu'i hyrwyddo ei hun. Gallwch gael rhith-fynediad drwy'r rhyngwyd i ganolfan ymwelwyr ac addysg Glanfa'r Cynulliad, lle bynnag yr ydych yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n beth da. Mae'n debyg bod y dechnoleg honno ar y blaen i seneddau, llywodraethau a chynulladau eraill yn y DU, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ei datblygu ymhellach. Mater i'r Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored ac awdurdodau ehangach y Cynulliad fydd hynny.

**David Melding:** Gan fod aelodaeth o'r Cabinet wedi'i chau i Aelodau o'r Gogledd am ba reswm bynnag, oni chredwch ei bod yn bwysicach fyth y dylai Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad gwrdd o leiaf unwaith y flwyddyn yn y Gogledd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid mater i mi yw hynny.

### Camddefnyddio Sylweddau Substance Misuse

**Q6 Geraint Davies:** Will the First Minister

**C6 Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif

make a statement on 'Tackling Substance Misuse in Wales: A Partnership Approach'? (OAQ18839)

**The First Minister:** As a first step to giving greater priority to responsibilities for crime reduction and safer communities, the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities now co-ordinates activities in this field. The Minister combines her existing responsibilities for local government and communities with the additional responsibilities for drug and alcohol misuse.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist. Can the First Minister justify the fact that there are no targets for waiting times for detoxification and rehabilitation services in Wales, yet England has them? Do you think that this factor results in the waiting times in England being a matter of weeks compared with waiting times that are often more than a year here in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I attended a meeting at the Cais drug and alcohol agency in Colwyn Bay last Friday, which has impressive facilities for advice, although the detoxification beds are in a centre in the grounds of Wrexham Maelor Hospital, not in Colwyn Bay. The facilities for detoxification beds are remarkably good in north Wales, in comparison with other areas of Wales. That may be an indication why, although there are 24 beds in north Wales—which I believe are all in the centre in the grounds of the Wrexham Maelor Hospital—there is still a waiting time of five months in north Wales. In some areas of south Wales, there is a shorter waiting time. I have been given a figure of one month for the Merthyr Tydfil area, for example, for alcohol, though not for drugs. It is a mixture, but no-one would argue that north Wales is ahead of the rest of Wales in terms of detoxification beds.

**Christine Gwyther:** I declare an interest because my partner is chair of the Dyfed Drug and Alcohol Advisory Service. Do you agree, Rhodri, that front-line delivery is all-important as we discuss the eradication of drug abuse in Wales? I attended the Dyfed Powys drug and alcohol action team

Weinidog ddatganiad am 'Delio â Chamddefnyddio Sylweddau yng Nghymru: Y Dull Partneriaeth'? (OAQ18839)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel cam cyntaf i roi blaenoriaeth uwch i gyfrifoldebau dros leihau torcyfraith a sicrhau cymunedau diogelach, mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau bellach yn cydlynu gweithgareddau yn y maes hwn. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cyfuno'i chyfrifoldebau presennol dros lywodraeth leol a chymunedau â'r cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol dros gamddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferyllydd. A all y Prif Weinidog gyfiawnhau'r ffaith nad oes dim targedau ar gyfer amserau aros am wasanaethau dadwenwyno ac ymadfer yng Nghymru, er bod rhai yn Lloegr? A ydych yn meddwl bod y ffactor hwn yn golygu mai ychydig wythnosau yw'r amserau aros yn Lloegr o gymharu ag amserau aros sydd yn aml dros flwyddyn yma yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mynychais gyfarfod yn asiantaeth gyffuriau ac alcohol Cais ym Mae Colwyn ddydd Gwener diwethaf, lle ceir cyfleusterau da ar gyfer cynghori, er bod y gwelyau dadwenwyno mewn canolfan ar dir Ysbyty Maelor Wrecsam, nid ym Mae Colwyn. Mae'r cyfleusterau ar gyfer gwelyau dadwenwyno'n hynod o dda yn y Gogledd, o gymharu â rhannau eraill o Gymru. Efallai bod hynny'n dangos pam, er bod 24 o welyau yn y Gogledd—sydd, mi gredaf, i gyd yn y ganolfan ar safle Ysbyty Maelor Wrecsam—y mae amser aros o bum mis yn y Gogledd o hyd. Mewn rhai rhannau o'r De, mae'r amser aros yn fyrrach. Cefais ffigur o un mis ar gyfer ardal Merthyr Tudful, er enghraifft, ar gyfer alcohol, er nad ar gyfer cyffuriau. Mae'n gymysgedd, ond ni fyddai neb yn dadlau fod y Gogledd ar y blaen i weddill Cymru o ran gwelyau dadwenwyno.

**Christine Gwyther:** Datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy nghymar yn gadeirydd Gwasanaeth Cynghori Dyfed ar Gyffuriau ac Alcohol. A gytunwch, Rhodri, fod cyflawni gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn hollbwysig wrth inni drafod dileu camddefnydd cyffuriau yng Nghymru? Mynychais gynhadledd tîm

conference in Carmarthen recently. I was appalled that, for the majority of the conference, there was no Welsh Government official present to answer the questions posed by these front-line workers. It is against this backdrop and the heightening of drug problems in Wales that officials are considering disbanding the action team network. Will you consider a 12-month stay of execution for these teams to enable them to continue delivering the current strategy while the consultation goes ahead? At this precarious time of drug and alcohol abuse in our nation's history we cannot afford to weaken our defences.

**The First Minister:** Before Edwina and I meet with the four chief constables of Wales next week I would be grateful if you could write to me with the details of the problem that you have just raised. I will ensure that we take it up in the appropriate way.

**Glyn Davies:** A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gondemnio agwedd gywilyddus rhai gwleidyddion sy'n credu eu bod yn apelio at bobl ifanc drwy gynnig llacio polisïau sy'n gwahardd cyffuriau?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng safbwyntiau ein pedwar prif gwnstabl yng Nghymru. Gwelwn yr un gwahaniaethau ymhlith gwleidyddion ac ymhlith gwledydd Ewrop o ran sut y maent yn gwahaniaethu rhwng cyffuriau meddal a rhai caled fel heroin a chocên. Y pwynt o wahaniaeth yw beth i'w wneud ynghylch cannabis. Mae pawb yn aros i weld canlyniad yr arbrawf ym mwrdeistref Lambeth, yn ne Llundain. Deuwn i gasgliad yn seiliedig ar yr arbrawf hwnnw. Felly, gallwn wneud sylwadau mwy synhwyrol ac ar well sail pan fydd hwnnw wedi gorffen.

gweithredu cyffuriau ac alcohol Dyfed Powys yng Nghaerfyrddin yn ddiweddar. I mi yr oedd yn warthus nad oedd swyddog o Lywodraeth Cymru yn bresennol am y rhan fwyaf o'r gynhadledd i ateb y cwestiynau a ofynnid gan y gweithwyr rheng flaen hyn. Yn erbyn y cefndir hwn a'r cynnydd mewn problemau cyffuriau yng Nghymru y mae swyddogion yn ystyried diddymu'r rhwydwaith timau gweithredu. A wnewch chi ystyried oedi'r fwyell i'r timau hyn am 12 mis i'w galluogi i barhau i gyflawni'r strategaeth gyfredol tra'r aiff yr ymgynghori yn ei flaen? Ar yr adeg ansicr hon o gamddefnydd cyffuriau ac alcohol yn hanes ein cenedl ni allwn fforddio gwanhau'n hamddiffynfeydd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cyn i Edwina a mi gyfarfod â phedwar prif gwnstabl Cymru yr wythnos nesaf byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ysgrifennu ataf gyda manylion y broblem yr ydych newydd sôn amdani. Fe sicrhaf y rhoddwn y sylw priodol iddi.

**Glyn Davies:** Will you join me in condemning the shameful attitude of some politicians who believe that they are appealing to young people by proposing to relax the laws governing drugs?

**The First Minister:** There are substantial differences between the standpoints of our four chief constables in Wales. We see the same differences between politicians and between European countries in how they distinguish between soft drugs and hard drugs like heroin and cocaine. The only difference is what to do about cannabis. Everybody is waiting to see the outcome of the trials in the borough of Lambeth, in south London. We will draw conclusions on the basis of that experiment. Therefore, we can make better-founded and more rational comments when it is completed.

### **Rhagoriaeth Bensaernïol Architectural Excellence**

**Q7 David Melding:** What measures are being taken to promote architectural excellence in Wales? (OAQ18822)

**The First Minister:** Sue Essex, the Minister for Environment, took the initiative of

**C7 David Melding:** Pa fesurau sydd ar y gweill i hyrwyddo rhagoriaeth bensaernïol yng Nghymru? (OAQ18822)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bu i Sue Essex, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, gymryd y

establishing the Design Commission for Wales. That not-for-profit company is becoming operational and is producing a business plan. It is not only concerned with architectural excellence, but also with matters such as access for disabled people, wheelchair restrictions and so forth.

On architectural excellence generally, we would all like to see it, because we realise what an outstanding architectural heritage we have; for example, Llanerchaeron—which I recently visited—which was designed almost 200 years ago by John Nash, and Plas Mawr in Conwy, which is the most outstanding Elizabethan townhouse in the UK. There is much to inspire today's architects to try to equal the achievements of people like John Nash, not only in buildings, but also in the aqueducts, viaducts and bridges that Thomas Telford built in north Wales, and so forth. We should derive inspiration from those achievements and aim for the same over the next 20 years.

**David Melding:** Thank you for that long answer. I will not bowl a bouncer, I assure you; I commend the establishment of the design council. Do you agree that, in Cardiff for example, when large companies come to the bay with their bland pattern books, they should be told to think of something more innovative? Today's buildings will last for generations, and should please future generations as well as us.

**The First Minister:** It is mostly for local authorities to establish design standards, and to try to persuade architects, builders and developers to follow them—it is developers who set the cost criteria to which architects and engineers must work. We hope that, when the Wales Millennium Centre opens, it will be as outstanding as it looks in the drawings. When it is finished, that may raise standards by providing a benchmark for other architects.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried anghenion pensaernïol bae Caerdydd, a gytunwch fod mawr angen Siambr ar gyfer y Cynulliad i gymryd lle'r twll yn y ddaear sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd? Deallwn fod costau sylweddol ynghlwm wrth gynnal y twll hwn. Pryd y

cam cyntaf wrth sefydlu Comisiwn Dylunio Cymru. Mae'r cwmni di-elw hwnnw'n dechrau gweithio ac yn llunio cynllun busnes. Nid rhagoriaeth bensaernïol yn unig yw ei faes, ond hefyd faterion fel mynediad i bobl anabl, cyfyngiadau i gadeiriau olwyn ac ati.

Ar ragoriaeth bensaernïol yn gyffredinol, byddai'n dda gan bawb ohonom ei gweld, oherwydd sylweddolwn mor eithriadol yw ein treftadaeth bensaernïol; er enghraifft, Llanerchaeron—yr ymwelais â hi'n ddiweddar—a ddyluniwyd bron i 200 mlynedd yn ôl gan John Nash, a'r Plas Mawr yng Nghonwy, sef y tŷ tref Elisabethaidd mwyaf trawiadol yn y DU. Mae llawer i ysbrydoli penseiri heddiw i geisio efelychu campau pobl fel John Nash, nid yn unig mewn adeiladau, ond hefyd yn y pontydd a'r traphontydd a gododd Thomas Telford yn y Gogledd, ac ati. Dylem ddwyn ysbrydoliaeth oddi wrth y gorchestion hyn ac anelu at yr un peth dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf.

**David Melding:** Diolch am yr ateb hir hwnnw. Nid wyf am fowlio pêl galed, fe'ch sicrhaf chi; cymeradwyaf sefydlu'r cyngor dylunio. A gytunwch y dylid, yng Nghaerdydd er enghraifft, ddweud wrth gwmnïau mawr pan ddeuant i'r bae gyda'u llyfrau patrymau di-fflach, y dylent feddwl am rywbeth mwy arloesol? Bydd adeiladau heddiw'n para am genedlaethau, a dylent roi boddhad i genedlaethau'r dyfodol yn ogystal ag i ni.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mater i awdurdodau lleol yn bennaf yw pennu safonau dylunio, a cheisio perswadio penseiri, adeiladwyr a datblygwyr i'w dilyn—datblygwyr sy'n pennu'r canllawiau cost y mae'n rhaid i benseiri a pheirianwyr weithio o'u mewn. Gobeithiwn, pan agorir Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, y bydd mor hynod ag y mae'n ymddangos yn y dyluniadau. Pan fydd wedi'i chwblhau, gall honno godi safonau drwy roi meincnod i benseiri eraill.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given the architectural requirements of Cardiff bay, do you agree that the Assembly needs a Chamber urgently, to fill the hole in the ground that we currently have? We understand that maintaining this hole leads to

bydd y Prif Weinidog yn sicrhau cynnydd ar Siambr newydd y Cynulliad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr eironi o ran y twll yw bod gosod isadeiledd—hynny yw, palu'r ddaear a gosod y sylfeini—wedi costio tua £6 miliwn, heb orwario na gohirio'r amserlen. Dechreuodd y gorwario pan ddaethom at y cam nesaf. Dyna paham y penderfynwyd newid y trefniadau o ran cyflogi'r Arglwydd Rogers fel pensaer y prosiect, ac ati. Gan ein bod wedi penodi Schal International Management Cyf yn gontractwr i fonitro'r broses—fel corgi ar ran y Cynulliad, os mynnwch—gobeithiwn y gall drefnu ailddechrau'r gwaith adeiladu, a hynny yn unol â'r amserlen newydd ac o fewn y costau.

substantial costs. When will the First Minister ensure that progress is made on the new Assembly Chamber?

**The First Minister:** The irony regarding the hole is that putting the infrastructure in place—that is, digging and laying the foundations—has cost around £6 million, without an overspend or delay in the timetable. The overspending began when we reached the next phase. That was why we decided to change the arrangements in terms of employing Lord Rogers as the project's architect, and so forth. Now that we have appointed Schal International Management Ltd as contractor, to monitor the process—like a watchdog on behalf of the Assembly, if you like—we hope that it can arrange the recommencement of the building work, in accordance with the new timetable and within the costs.

#### Ffioedd Dysgu Tuition Fees

**Q8 Peter Black:** What discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government Ministers with regard to the Assembly acquiring the power to abolish up-front tuition fees? (OAQ18823)

**The First Minister:** That has not yet been discussed with UK Government Ministers, but it is an important issue. I think that I have previously stated that Estelle Morris, the Secretary of State for Education and Skills, is currently conducting a wide-ranging review of issues surrounding student finance. We continue to hope that the review will reach the same essential conclusions as the Rees report in Wales regarding up-front tuition fees, and that responsibility for tuition fees will be devolved. We will need to consider legislative powers and discretion for us to deal with this matter in light of Estelle Morris's review.

2:30 p.m.

**Peter Black:** It is important that the Assembly's commitment is maintained. Given the indications that the Westminster Government does not, at this stage, wish to abolish up-front tuition fees, is it worthwhile putting additional pressure on the

**C8 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU mewn perthynas â rhoi'r hawl i'r Cynulliad ddileu'r ffioedd dysgu ymlaen llaw? (OAQ18823)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid yw hynny wedi'i drafod eto gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU, ond mae'n fater pwysig. Credaf imi ddweud o'r blaen fod Estelle Morris, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau, wrthi'n cynnal adolygiad eang ar faterion yn ymwneud â chyllid myfyrwyr. Daliwn i obeithio y daw'r adolygiad i'r un casgliadau sylfaenol ag adroddiad Rees yng Nghymru ynghylch ffioedd dysgu ymlaen llaw, ac y datganolir cyfrifoldeb am ffioedd dysgu. Bydd angen inni ystyried pwerau deddfu a disgresiwn i ni ddelio â'r mater hwn yng ngoleuni adolygiad Estelle Morris.

**Peter Black:** Mae'n bwysig cynnal ymrwymiad y Cynulliad. Yn wyneb yr arwyddion nad yw Llywodraeth San Steffan, ar hyn o bryd, yn dymuno dileu ffioedd dysgu ymlaen llaw, a fyddai'n werth rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar y Llywodraeth i

Government to consider this matter at an early stage? ystyried y mater hwn yn fuan?

**The First Minister:** You must wait until you are discussing a decision rather than a story printed in the newspapers. My guess is that this is tied up with the 2002 comprehensive spending review and that all will become clear over the next fortnight before the Westminster Parliament summer recess.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Rhaid ichi aros hyd y byddwch yn trafod penderfyniad yn hytrach na stori a argraffwyd yn y papurau newydd. Yr wyf yn dyfalu bod hyn ynghlwm yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant ar gyfer 2002 ac y daw popeth yn glir yn y pythefnos nesaf cyn toriad haf Senedd San Steffan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** In your discussions on student poverty and student income, will you press the UK Government to reconsider the counting of student loans and, presumably in future, Assembly learning grants, as income for the purposes of housing benefit? This is especially a problem for mature students, and has forced some of my constituents to leave higher education or leave their family home.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn eich trafodaethau ar dlodi myfyrwyr ac incwm myfyrwyr, a wnewch chi bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i ailystyried cyfrif benthyciadau myfyrwyr ac, mae'n debyg yn y dyfodol, grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, fel incwm i ddibenion budd-dal tai? Mae hyn yn broblem yn arbennig i fyfyrwyr aeddfed, ac mae wedi gorfodi rhai o'm hetholwyr i adael addysg uwch neu adael eu cartref teuluol.

**The First Minister:** I will be happy to do so.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny.

**William Graham:** In your discussions, have you clarified how a Government commitment to improving education has resulted in the Prime Minister having to pay for additional tuition for his own children?

**William Graham:** Yn eich trafodaethau, a ydych wedi dod i ddeall sut y mae ymrwymiad gan y Llywodraeth i wella addysg wedi arwain at reidrwydd i Brif Weinidog y DU dalu am wersi ychwanegol i'w blant ei hun?

**The First Minister:** This matter does not relate to up-front tuition fees. However, the Prime Minister is not the first person to seek additional coaching for his children—that has probably been happening since education began. This matter arises, however, at a time of intense interest in the issue of student financing. By student financing we mean public money rather than private money spent by parents on coaching for their children in preparation for examinations or university entrance.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes a wnelo hyn â ffoedd dysgu ymlaen llaw. Fodd bynnag, nid y Prif Weinidog yw'r person cyntaf i geisio gwersi ychwanegol i'w blant—mae'n debyg bod hynny'n digwydd ers dechrau addysg. Mae'r mater hwn yn codi, fodd bynnag, ar adeg o ddiddordeb brwd ym mater ariannu myfyrwyr. Wrth sôn am ariannu myfyrwyr golygwn arian cyhoeddus yn hytrach nag arian preifat a werir gan rieni ar wersi ychwanegol i'w plant i baratoi ar gyfer arholiadau neu fynediad i brifysgol.

### **Rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy Ebbw Valley Passenger Railway**

**Q9 Peter Law:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Secretary of State for Transport regarding signalling difficulties on the Ebbw Valley passenger railway? (OAQ18827)

**C9 Peter Law:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol y DU dros Drafnidiaeth mewn perthynas â'r problemau gyda'r signalau ar reilffordd Glyn Ebwy? (OAQ18827)

**The First Minister:** The Minister for **Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r Gweinidog

Environment, Sue Essex, has been discussing signalling and infrastructure difficulties. Those discussions have been with senior representatives of Railtrack rather than the UK Secretary of State, Alistair Darling. Sue Essex is currently holding discussions to determine when services between Ebbw Vale and Newport, in particular, can be restored. Complicated technical issues and the feasibility costs remain to be verified.

**Peter Law:** Following your excellent decision to re-open the Cardiff-Ebbw Vale passenger line, will you now include, in the project's first phase, funding for re-signalling of the line into Newport, which the *South Wales Argus* estimates will cost around £700,000? That would provide further valuable economic and social opportunities for my constituents, who have particularly suffered due to the Ebbw Vale steelworks closure.

**The First Minister:** I agree with the principle. It was meant to be an Ebbw Vale-Newport line until the problem with the Newport signal box was uncovered. Although I agree with the principle, I do not agree with the costing. I do not recognise that figure at all. Let us be clear as to what has happened. When, in 1961 I believe, the passenger services were discontinued, the signalling was disconnected at Newport signal box. The company that produced the signalling has, in the meantime, gone out of business. Unless you rebuild the whole signal box, it is difficult to introduce the type of signalling necessary for dual tracks and coverage of the section between Gaer junction and Newport central station.

**Brian Hancock:** You mentioned cost, but can you tell us what it is? More importantly, will you reassure the people of Islwyn, Ebbw Vale and Newport of the importance of opening this passenger railway, rather than avoiding it? Sooner is better than later. Every station should be accessible and have car-parking facilities, closed circuit television, bike racks and buses to the door—not half a mile away—so that it becomes a whole and inclusive service for all of these valleys.

dros yr Amgylchedd, Sue Essex, wedi bod yn trafod yr anawsterau gyda'r signalau a'r isadeiledd. Cynhaliwyd y trafodaethau hynny gydag uwch gynrychiolwyr Railtrack yn hytrach nag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol y DU, Alistair Darling. Mae Sue Essex yn cynnal trafodaethau ar hyn o bryd i benderfynu pa bryd y gellir adfer gwasanaethau rhwng Glynebwy a Chasnewydd yn arbennig. Mae materion technegol cymhleth a chostio dichonoldeb y cynllun yn dal heb eu cadarnhau.

**Peter Law:** Yn dilyn eich penderfyniad ardderchog i ailagor lein deithwyr Caerdydd-Glynebwy, a wnewch chi gynnwys yn awr, yng nghanm cyntaf y prosiect, arian ar gyfer signalau newydd ar y lein i mewn i Gasnewydd, a fydd yn costio rhyw £700,000 yn ôl amcangyfrif y *South Wales Argus*? Byddai hynny'n darparu cyfleoedd economaidd a chymdeithasol gwerthfawr pellach i'm hetholwyr, sydd wedi dioddef yn arbennig yn sgîl cau gwaith dur Glynebwy.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â'r egwyddor. Lein o Lynebwy i Gasnewydd ydoedd i fod cyn y darganfuwyd y broblem gyda blwch signalau Casnewydd. Er y cytunaf â'r egwyddor, ni chytunaf â'r costau. Nid wyf wedi clywed sôn am y ffigur hwnnw o gwbl. Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd. Pan roddwyd y gorau i'r gwasanaethau teithwyr, yn 1961, mi gredaf, datgysylltwyd y signalau ym mlwch signalau Casnewydd. Mae'r cwmni a wnaeth y signalau wedi mynd i'r wal yn y cyfamser. Heb ailadeiladu'r blwch signalau cyfan, mae'n anodd cyflwyno'r math o signalau sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer traciau deuol a rheolaeth dros y darn rhwng cyffordd y Gaer a gorsaf ganolog Casnewydd.

**Brian Hancock:** Soniasoch am y gost, ond a allwch ddweud wrthym beth ydyw? Yn bwysicach, a roddwch chi sicrwydd i bobl Islwyn, Glynebwy a Chasnewydd ynghylch pwysigrwydd agor y rheilffordd deithwyr hon, yn hytrach nag osgoi'r pwnc? Gwell hwyr na hwyrach. Dylai pob gorsaf fod yn hawdd mynd iddi a dylai pob gorsaf gael cyfleusterau parcio ceir, teledu cylech caeedig, raciau beiciau, a bysus at y drws—nid hanner milltir i ffwrdd—fel y bydd yn wasanaeth cyflawn a chynhwysol i'r cymoedd hyn i gyd.



**The First Minister:** There is no avoiding it at all. We are ploughing on in the belief that, as soon as the work can be finished, the Cardiff-Ebbw Vale service, with six intermediate stations on that line, will open in 2005. The Newport connection will be incorporated in 2009 or earlier if we can solve the problems with the signal box under the Gaer. This will be done at a cost of £27 million, including the Newport section, providing that the problem is solved. This considerable undertaking will comprise a 15 km loop from Risca to Aberbeeg junction, signalled using modern colour-light signalling and six new stations. At the moment, it is the simpler scheme to Cardiff, which will open in 2005, that is fully funded. Funding for the rest of the scheme will be determined in future budget planning rounds.

**Rosemary Butler:** Do you agree that, as people are creatures of habit, once they get into the habit of travelling from Ebbw Vale to Cardiff, they will find it difficult to change and come to Newport? This is a major issue for Newport and, as Peter said, for Ebbw Vale. If people travel to Cardiff and spend their money there, Newport will be at a disadvantage. Will you assure us that you will do everything possible to bring this ludicrous situation to a speedy conclusion?

**The First Minister:** It was an unfortunate discovery that the signalling requisite to run passenger services was disconnected in the signal box when the passenger service to Ebbw Vale was originally terminated 40 years ago. The problem is that it is difficult to reconnect the signalling as the type of wiring used is no longer produced. Until the whole signal box is replaced, the link into Newport cannot be provided. It is much simpler to provide the link to Cardiff. The signal box problem is the only reason why a service into Newport cannot be provided; this is not a conspiracy against Newport. As soon as the operational constraints can be removed, we will return to the original idea of linking Ebbw Vale and Newport. By then, we will have three to four years' experience of running the Ebbw Vale to Cardiff link.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes unrhyw gwestiwn o'i osgoi. Yr ydym yn rhygnu ymlaen yn y gred, cyn gynted ag y gellir gorffen y gwaith, y bydd gwasanaeth Caerdydd-Glynebwy, gyda chwe gorsaf ar hyd y lein, yn agor yn 2005. Ymgorfforir y cysylltiad â Chasnewydd yn 2009 neu cyn hynny os gallwn ddatrys y problemau gyda'r blwch signalau dan y Gaer. Gwneir hyn am gost o £27 miliwn, gan gynnwys darn Casnewydd, os caiff y broblem ei datrys. Bydd yr ymgymeriad sylweddol hwn yn cynnwys dolen 15 km o Risca i gyffordd Aber-big, gyda signalau golau-lliw modern a chwe gorsaf newydd. Ar hyn o bryd, y cynllun symlach i Gaerdydd, a agorir yn 2005, sydd wedi'i ariannu'n llawn. Pennir y cyllid ar gyfer gweddill y cynllun mewn cylchoedd cynllunio cyllidebau yn y dyfodol.

**Rosemary Butler:** A gytunwch, gan fod pobl yn greaduriaid sy'n gaeth i'w harferion, y byddant, unwaith y byddant wedi mynd i'r arfer o deithio o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd, yn ei chael hi'n anodd newid a dod i Gasnewydd? Mae hyn yn fater pwysig i Gasnewydd ac, fel y dywedodd Peter, i Lynebwy. Os teithia pobl i Gaerdydd a gwario'u harian yno, bydd Casnewydd dan anfantais. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau y gwnewch bopeth a allwch i ddod â'r sefyllfa hurt hon i ben yn fuan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Darganfyddiad anffodus oedd gweld y cafodd y signalau angenrheidiol i redeg gwasanaethau teithwyr eu datgysylltu yn y blwch signalau pan derfynwyd y gwasanaeth teithwyr i Lynebwy yn wreiddiol 40 mlynedd yn ôl. Y broblem yw ei bod yn anodd ailgysylltu'r signalau gan na chynhyrchir mwyach y math o wifrau a ddefnyddiwyd. Hyd nes ceir blwch signalau cyfan newydd, ni ellir darparu'r cysylltiad i Gasnewydd. Mae'n llawer symlach darparu'r cysylltiad i Gaerdydd. Problem y blwch signalau yw'r unig reswm pam na ellir darparu gwasanaeth i mewn i Gasnewydd; nid cynllwyn yn erbyn Casnewydd yw hyn. Cyn gynted ag y gellir goresgyn y cyfyngiadau gweithredol, awn yn ôl at y syniad gwreiddiol o gysylltu Glynebwy a Chasnewydd. Erbyn hynny, bydd gennym dair i bedair blynedd o brofiad o redeg lein Glynebwy i Gaerdydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 10 (OAQ18831) yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 (OAQ18831) has been withdrawn.

### **Cymorth Gwladwriaethol i'r Diwydiant Glo State Aid to the Coal Industry**

**C11 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch ymestyn cymorth gwladwriaethol i'r diwydiant glo ar ôl mis Gorffennaf eleni? (OAQ18833)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf yn cyfarfod yn gyson ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Trafodwyd y mater hwn ar sawl achlysur yn ddiweddar. Cefais gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr glofeydd y Betws a'r Tŵr ar 21 Mehefin. Yr ydym yn disgwyl cyhoeddiad gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant cyn i'r cynllun presennol ddod i ben ar 23 Gorffennaf.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ar sail eich trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a Gweinidogion eraill yn San Steffan, a ydych yn hyderus y bydd gennych newyddion da i lowyr a rheolwyr glofeydd y Betws a'r Tŵr?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gan mai'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant sy'n gyfrifol am hyn, dylem aros i'r adran honno wneud ei chyhoeddiad. Fe'm sicrhawyd y caiff cyhoeddiad ei wneud cyn i'r cynllun presennol ddod i ben ar 23 Gorffennaf.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the First Minister accept that communities in Wales would much prefer to have dynamic, thriving and prosperous economies and not need state aid? Bearing in mind that unemployment is rising, that manufacturing has fallen deeper into recession and that the latest Dunn and Bradstreet report places Wales at the top of the business bankruptcy league table, does he accept that his transformation of the economy is an abject failure?

**The First Minister:** That was the doom, rapidly pursued by the gloom. I do not know to which figures you refer in saying that unemployment is rising. You should consider the achievements of the past few years. The Dunn and Bradstreet figures are interesting

**Q11 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding extending state aid to the coal industry beyond July this year? (OAQ18833)

**The First Minister:** I have regular meetings with the Secretary of State for Wales. This issue has been discussed on several occasions recently. I met with representatives of Bettws and Tower collieries on 21 June. We expect an announcement from the Department of Trade and Industry before the current scheme ends on 23 July.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** On the basis of your discussions with the Secretary of State and other Ministers in Westminster, are you confident that you will have good news for the miners and management at Bettws and Tower collieries?

**The First Minister:** As the Department of Trade and Industry is responsible for this, we should wait until it makes its announcement. It has given an undertaking to make an announcement before the current scheme ends on 23 July.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn y byddai'n llawer gwell gan gymunedau yng Nghymru gael economïau deinamig, ffyniannus, a pheidio â bod angen cymorth gan y wladwriaeth? O gofio bod diweithdra'n codi, bod gweithgynhyrchu wedi suddo i ddirwasgiad dyfnach a bod adroddiad diweddaraf Dunn a Bradstreet yn gosod Cymru ar ben y gynghair am fethdaliad busnesau, a ydyw'n derbyn mai methiant truenus yw ei ymgais i drawsnewid yr economi?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna'r wylofain, a'r rhincian dannedd yn dynn ar ei sodlau. Ni wn at ba ffigurau yr ydych yn cyfeirio pan ddywedwch fod diweithdra'n codi. Dylech ystyried yr hyn a gyflawnwyd yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae ffigurau Dunn a

and they tell many stories. A doomster and gloomster such as yourself can read much into the figures by comparing one quarter's results with those of a freakishly low quarter four quarters ago, and conclude that there has been a rapid increase in the number of firms going bust. However, a reasonable person would read the report and conclude that the figures go up and down every quarter but that a clear trend cannot be established. You must take a more balanced view, and not leap in on bad news and try to sell it around Wales saying that the manufacturing industry is imploding. Nothing of the kind is happening. The economy is in good shape and in good hands.

Bradstreet yn ddiddorol ac yn dweud sawl stori. Gall wylofwr a rhinciwr dannedd fel chi ddarllen llawer i mewn i'r ffigurau drwy gymharu canlyniadau un chwarter gyda ffigurau chwarter annaturiol o isel bedwar chwarter yn ôl, a dod i'r casgliad y bu cynnydd sydyn yn y nifer o gwmnïau sy'n mynd i'r wal. Fodd bynnag, byddai person rhesymol yn darllen yr adroddiad ac yn dod i'r casgliad fod ffigurau'n mynd i fyny ac i lawr bob chwarter ond na ellir sefydlu tuedd glir. Rhaid ichi gymryd golwg fwy cytbwys, a pheidio â neidio i mewn ar newyddion drwg a cheisio'u gwerthu o gwmpas Cymru gan ddweud fod y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu'n chwalu. Nid oes dim byd o'r fath yn digwydd. Mae'r economi mewn cyflwr da ac mewn dwylo da.

### Sancsiynau Dur Unol Daleithiau'r America United States of America Steel Sanctions

**Q12 Brian Gibbons:** Can the First Minister give an update on any discussions that he has had with the Secretary of State for Wales in relation to US steel sanctions and their impact on Wales? (OAQ18826) [R]

**C12 Brian Gibbons:** A all y Prif Weinidog roi gwybodaeth ddiweddar am unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru mewn perthynas â sancsiynau dur UDA a'u heffaith ar Gymru? (OAQ18826) [R]

**The First Minister:** The Secretary of State and I have routinely discussed this and other steel-related issues over the past two to three years, since assuming our present responsibilities. The steel tariffs have had surprising consequences. They have not led to steel imports being attracted into western Europe because of the speed with which the European Union reacted to divert the exports of those who could not pay the US tariffs. However, considerable damage has been done to Britain's steel industry costings because of the backwash effect of USA mini mills, which are 100 per cent scrap-based, benefiting from a considerable rise in the price of scrap and the doubling of steel prices in the USA. American steel consumers are the losers in this situation, and it is a classic example of why you should not use tariffs unless you know what you are doing.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Trafododd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a minnau hyn a materion eraill cysylltiedig â dur yn rheolaidd dros y ddwy i dair blynedd diwethaf, ers ymgymryd â'n cyfrifoldebau presennol. Cafodd y tollau dur ganlyniadau annisgwyl. Nid ydynt wedi arwain at ddenu mewnforion dur i orllewin Ewrop oherwydd cyflymder ymateb yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i droi ymaith allforion y rhai hynny na allai dalu tollau'r Unol Daleithiau. Er hynny, gwnaethpwyd cryn ddifrod i gostiadau diwydiant dur Prydain oherwydd effaith adlifol melinau bychain yr Unol Daleithiau, sy'n seiliedig gant y cant ar sgrap, yn elwa ar gynnydd sylweddol ym mhris sgrap a dyblu prisiau dur yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Defnyddwyr dur America sy'n colli yn y sefyllfa hon, ac mae'n enghraifft glasurol o pam na ddylech ddefnyddio tollau oni bai eich bod yn gwybod beth yr ydych yn ei wneud.

2:40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** Your answer has reassured me. However, do you share my concern at

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae eich ateb wedi tawelu fy meddwl. Er hynny, a rannwch fy mhryder

America's delay in processing applications made by UK steel companies for tariff exemptions? It has only processed around a third or a half of all such applications to date. Do you agree that it must pull its finger out?

**The First Minister:** The steel consumer in the USA is disadvantaged by the imposition of the tariffs, and wants to exempt steel importers from the tariffs because, for example, the US steel industry cannot supply a certain type of steel, or for other geopolitical reasons. As a result, the USA is processing a huge number of applications, and I believe that British steel companies, such as Corus, are confident that they will get widespread exemptions in time. However, they are in a queue behind many other applications for tariff exemption.

**Alun Cairns:** How do you feel about being the First Minister who presided over the demise of the steel industry in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do not know when that will take place, but if you anticipate that I will still be First Minister in 50 years' time, when it might happen, I am grateful for your belief in the longevity of my political career. Anyone who believes that the steel industry has already had its demise is not reading the newspapers, not living on this planet, not living in the right decade, but is in the right party.

ynghylch yr oedi gan America wrth brosesu ceisiadau a wneir gan gwmnïau dur y DU am gael eu heithrio rhag talu tollau? Dim ond rhyw draean neu hanner o'r holl geisiadau hyn y mae wedi'u prosesu hyd yn hyn. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid i'r Americanwyr dynnu eu bys allan?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae defnyddwyr dur yn yr Unol Daleithiau dan anfantais yn sgîl gosod y tollau, ac mae arnynt eisiau eithrio mewforwyr dur o'r tollau oherwydd, er enghraifft, na all diwydiant dur yr UD gyflenwi math arbennig o ddr, neu am resymau daearyddol-wleidyddol eraill. O ganlyniad, mae'r Unol Daleithiau'n prosesu nifer anferth o geisiadau, a chredaf fod cwmnïau dur Prydain, fel Corus, yn hyderus y cânt eithriadau eang ymhen hir a hwyr. Fodd bynnag, maent mewn rhes y tu ôl i lawer o geisiadau eraill am eithriadau.

**Alun Cairns:** Sut deimlad yw gwybod mai chi yw'r Prif Weinidog a lywyddodd dros dranc y diwydiant dur yng Nghymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni wn pa bryd y digwydd hynny, ond os rhagwelwch y byddaf yn dal i fod yn Brif Weinidog Cymru ymhen 50 mlynedd, pryd y gallai ddigwydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cred yn hirhoedledd fy ngyrfa wleidyddol. Mae unrhyw un sy'n credu fod y diwydiant dur eisoes wedi wynebu ei dranc naill ai heb ddarllen y papurau newydd, neu heb fod yn byw ar y blaned hon, neu heb fod yn byw yn y degawd iawn, ond mae yn y blaid iawn.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** There are several changes to this week's business statement. Following the statement, I will propose a procedural motion under Standing Order No. 6.16 to bring forward a no-named day motion, tabled last week, to allow the Assembly to consider the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002, along with the Countryside (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002, scheduled for approval today. I will also propose two procedural motions relating to Thursday's

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Mae sawl newid i ddatganiad busnes yr wythnos hon. Yn dilyn y datganiad, cynigïaf gynnig trefniadol dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16 am ddod ymlaen â chynnig heb ddyddiad trafod, a gyflwynwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, i ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad ystyried y Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002, ynghyd â'r Rheoliadau Cefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002, y trefnwyd i'w cymeradwyo heddiw. Byddaf hefyd yn cynnig dau gynnig

business, under Standing Order No. 6.16. The first will be to change the order of business to allow questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to be the first item, followed by questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services. This is to allow Jane Davidson to leave Plenary immediately after her questions to attend a family funeral. On behalf of all Members, I express our condolences to her. The second procedural motion is to bring forward the no-named day motion on delegating the functions of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 to the First Minister, to allow the Assembly to consider it alongside the debate on the draft functions of the Act. Also, on Thursday, following last week's discussion in Business Committee on the debate on the world summit on sustainable development, I have replaced that debate with a statement by Jane Hutt on palliative care. I understand that the Business Committee endorsed that this morning. It will also not be possible for Thursday's composite subordinate legislation motion to go ahead as planned, and I have rescheduled it for Thursday, 18 July.

The next three weeks' business is as shown on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. There are no Deputy Presiding Officer determinations to report under Standing Order No. 22.5.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau ar y datganiad?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Bu nifer o Gyfarfodydd Llawn ar ddydd Iau yn denau o ran busnes yn ddiweddar, ac eto, yn ystod y pythefnos olaf, mae tipyn o fusnes i'w drafod. Yn sgil hyn, awr yn unig a briodolir i'r adolygiad o'r Gymraeg, a gyflwynir gan ddau Bwyllgor y prynhawn yma. Yr ydym yn anfonlon â hynny ac â'r ymgais i gwtogi nifer o drafodaethau yr wythnos hon a'r wythnos nesaf. Byddwn yn gwneud cais i sicrhau y caiff dwy awr eu clustnodi yn yr hydref ar gyfer trafod ymateb y Llywodraeth i'r adolygiad o'r iaith Gymraeg. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn llwyddo i drefnu busnes yn well yn y dyfodol, fel na chawn ein

trefniadol yn ymwneud â busnes dydd Iau, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16. Y cyntaf fydd newid trefn busnes i ganiatáu i gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes fod yr eitem gyntaf, wedyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Amcan hynny yw caniatáu i Jane Davidson ymadael â'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn syth ar ôl ei chwestiynau i fynd i angladd aelod o'i theulu. Ar ran yr Aelodau i gyd, mynegaf ein cydymdeimlad â hi. Yr ail gynnig trefniadol yw dod ymlaen â'r cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 i Brif Weinidog Cymru, fel y gall y Cynulliad ei ystyried ochr yn ochr â'r ddadl ar swyddogaethau drafft y Ddeddf. Hefyd, ddydd Iau, yn dilyn trafodaeth yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Pwyllgor Busnes ar y ddadl ar uwch-gynhadledd y byd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yr wyf wedi disodli'r ddadl honno â datganiad gan Jane Hutt ar ofal lliniarol. Deallaf i'r Pwyllgor Busnes gefnogi hynny y bore yma. Ni fydd yn bosibl ychwaith i gynnig dydd Iau ar is-ddeddfwriaeth gyfansawdd fynd yn ei flaen fel a fwriadwyd, ac yr wyf wedi ei symud i ddydd Iau, 18 Gorffennaf.

Mae busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr, dan ddogfennau ategol. Nid oes penderfyniadau gan y Dirprwy Lywydd i'w hadrodd dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.5.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the statement?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Several of our Thursday Plenary sessions have been short on business recently, and yet, during this final fortnight, there is a great deal of business to discuss. This has resulted in just one hour being allocated for discussion on the review of the Welsh language, which is being presented by two Committees this afternoon. We are dissatisfied with that and with the attempt to curtail several of this week's and next week's debates. We will make a request to ensure that two hours are allocated in the autumn to discuss the Government's response to the Welsh language review. I hope that the Government will manage its business more

hunain mewn sefyllfa ar ddiwedd tymor pan fo'n rhaid cwtdgi busnes oherwydd bod cymaint ohono yn cael ei gyflwyno yn sydyn.

effectively in future, so that we do not find ourselves in a position where business must be curtailed at the end of the term because so much has been tabled at the last minute.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dyna sut y mae o ran trefnu busnes. Gwneir pob ymgais i sicrhau y trafodir busnes yn esmwyth drwy'r tymor, ond nid felly y mae yr wythnos hon na'r wythnos nesaf. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod busnes yn dod o flaen y Cynulliad a bod Aelodau yn cael cyfle i'w drafod. Ynglŷn â'r ddadl ar yr iaith Gymraeg, yr ydym eisoes wedi trafod faint o amser fydd ar gael i'r ddadl hon. Y gobaith yw y bydd mwy o amser ar gael pan gaiff y ddadl nesaf ei chynnal yn y Siambr. Mae'n bwnc pwysig dros ben, ac os bydd eisiau mwy o amser i'w drafod, ceisiaf sicrhau bod yr amser ar gael.

**Carwyn Jones:** That is the nature of business management. Every effort is made to ensure that business is transacted smoothly throughout the term, but that has not proved possible this week or next. What is important is that business comes before the Assembly and that Members have the opportunity to discuss it. On the debate on the Welsh language, we had previously discussed the amount of time allocated to this debate. It is hoped that more time will be available when the next debate is held in the Chamber. It is an exceptionally important issue and, if more time is required to discuss it, I shall endeavour to ensure that time is allocated.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored  
(Carwyn Jones):** Cynigaf fod

**The Minister for Open Government  
(Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn newid trefn y cwestiynau ddydd Iau.*

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, changes the order of questions to be taken on Thursday.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn rhybudd blaenorol o un pwynt o drefn. Gobeithio ei fod yn bwynt o drefn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have received prior notice of one point of order. I hope that it is a point of order.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for your indulgence, Presiding Officer.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich goddefgarwch, Lywydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no indulgence from this Chair. If it is not a point of order, I shall say so unreservedly.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes goddefgarwch o'r Gadair hon. Os nad pwynt o drefn mohono, dywedaf hynny heb flewyn ar dafod.

**Alun Cairns:** Point of order. This relates to Standing Order No. 2.7, which relates to the Ministerial Code. The Code of Standards for Members notes that

**Alun Cairns:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae a wnelo hyn â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2.7, sy'n ymwneud â'r Cod Gweinidogion. Dywed y Cod Safonau i Aelodau

'Members shall at all times conduct themselves in a manner which will tend to maintain and strengthen the public's trust and confidence...'

'Rhaid i Aelodau ymddwyn bob amser mewn modd a fydd yn tueddu i gynnal a chryfhau ymddiriedaeth a hyder y cyhoedd...'

The former Minister for Rural Affairs last week accused Welsh farmers and others taking part in the foot and mouth disease inquiry of acting as Tory stooges, which

Yr wythnos diwethaf, bu i'r cyn Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig gyhuddo ffermwyr Cymru ac eraill a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad i glwy'r traed a'r genau o

resulted in this headline in the *Daily Post*,

weithredu fel cynffonwyr i'r Torïaid, a arweiniodd at y pennawd hwn yn y *Daily Post*,

'A Deeply Offensive Insult to those who Suffered'.

Is it in order for a Minister to act in such a manner?

A ydyw mewn trefn i Weinidog weithredu yn y fath fodd?

**The Presiding Officer:** Ministers, and anyone else, may publish whatever they wish in the *Daily Post*. Whether other people want to read it is a matter for them.

**Y Llywydd:** Caiff Gweinidogion, ac unrhyw un arall, gyhoeddi beth a fynnont yn y *Daily Post*. Mater i bobl eraill yw a ydynt am ei ddarllen.

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** Those are not my words.

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for your assistance in all these matters, Minister.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am eich cymorth yn y materion hyn i gyd, Weinidog.

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25, nid yw'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 22.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

**The Minister for Open Government (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25:*

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25:*

*1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad (Safleoedd o Ddiddordeb Gwyddonol Arbennig (Apelau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mehefin 2002; ac*

*1. approves the Wildlife and Countryside (Sites of Special Scientific Interest) (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 11 June 2002; and*

*2. yn ystyried:*

*2. considers:*

*a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Bywyd Gwyllt a Chefn Gwlad (Safleoedd o Ddiddordeb Gwyddonol Arbennig) (Apelau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mehefin 2002;*

*a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Wildlife and Countryside (Sites of Special Scientific Interest) (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 25 June 2002;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd ar 11 Mehefin 2002;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid on 11 June 2002;*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd ar*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid on 26*



26 Mehefin 2002;

3. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Iechyd Planhigion (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Mehefin 2002; ac

4. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iechyd Planhigion (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mehefin 2002;

5. yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Rheoli Sŵn (Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Safleoedd Adeiladu a Safleoedd Agored) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002; ac

6. yn ystyried:

a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft Gorchymyn Rheoli Sŵn (Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Safleoedd Adeiladu a Safleoedd Agored) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd ar 18 Mehefin 2002;

7. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Porthiant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2002; ac

8. yn ystyried:

a) adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw wedi nodi unrhyw faterion sy'n destun pryder yn y gorchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Porthiant (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Mehefin 2002;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd ar 25 Mehefin 2002;

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd ar 1 Gorffennaf 2002. (NDM1112)

June 2002;

3. approves the Plant Health (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 11 June 2002; and

4. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Plant Health (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 25 June 2002;

5. approves the Control of Noise (Codes of Practice for Construction and Open Sites) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 18 June 2002; and

6. considers:

a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Control of Noise (Codes of Practice for Construction and Open Sites) (Wales) Order 2002, laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2002;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid on 18 June 2002;

7. approves the Feeding Stuffs (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2002; and

8. considers:

a) the report of the Legislation Committee which has not identified any matters for concern in the draft Order, the Feeding Stuffs (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 27 June 2002;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid on 25 June 2002;

c) the memorandum of corrections laid on 1 July 2002. (NDM1112)

Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

2:50 p.m.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Y Gweinidog dros Lywodraeth Agored  
 (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

**The Minister for Open Government  
 (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod (NNDM1132) ar gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru)*

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the no-named day motion (NNDM1132) on approval of the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table*

*2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Office on 5 July 2002.  
Gorffennaf.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002 a Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002**  
**Approval of the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps)(Wales) Regulations 2002 and the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have agreed to the request that these motions be debated together. I see that there are no objections to that.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi cytuno i'r cais i drafod y cynigion hyn gyda'i gilydd. Gwelaf nad oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i hynny.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 18 June 2002. (NDM1113)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002 (NDM1113).*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 2 July 2002;*

*1. yn ystyried Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002;*

*2. approves:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo:*

*a) that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 18 June 2002;*

*a) gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 June 2002;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002;*

*c) the memorandum of corrections, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 2 July 2002. (NDM1114)*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002. (NDM1114)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 18 June 2002. (NDM1115)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002. (NDM1115)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly:*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table and e-mailed to Members on 2 July 2002;*

2. *approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 18 June 200, the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 2 July 2002, and the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2002. (NNDM1132)*

The Countryside Council for Wales is required, under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000, to publish maps of the land to which the new access rights will apply. The council has already initiated a phased programme of consultation across Wales on the draft maps of open country and registered common land, in line with the new regulations approved by the Assembly in December 2001. The regulations for consideration today cover the next main stage in the mapping and consultation process. They are concerned, in particular, with the preparation and publication by CCW of provisional maps of open country and registered common land, and the associated appeals process. The provisional maps will be produced once representations on the draft maps have been considered by CCW. When the provisional map for an area is issued, those with a legal interest in any land shown on the map, such as landowners, tenants and those with rights over the land, may appeal, in certain circumstances, to the National Assembly. The second set of regulations for consideration today covers the arrangements for the appeals process. Once appeals have been determined, the maps will be issued by CCW in final form.

The implications of this legislation are

Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw arbennig y Cynulliad at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002;*

2. *yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mehefin 2002, memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002, a'r arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd ar 3 Gorffennaf 2002. (NNDM1132)*

Mae'n ofynnol i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru, dan Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000, gyhoeddi mapiau o'r tir y bydd yr hawliau mynediad newydd yn weithredol arno. Mae'r cyngor eisoes wedi cychwyn rhaglen fesul cam o ymgynghori ledled Cymru ar y mapiau drafft o wlad agored a thir comin cofrestredig, yn unol â'r rheoliadau newydd a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad yn Rhagfyr 2001. Mae'r rheoliadau sydd i'w hystyried heddiw'n ymdrin â'r prif gam nesaf yn y broses fapio ac ymgynghori. Mae a wnelont, yn arbennig, â pharatoi a chyhoeddi mapiau dros dro gan y cyngor cefn gwlad o wlad agored a thir comin cofrestredig, a'r broses apêl gysylltiedig. Caiff y mapiau dros dro eu llunio unwaith y bydd sylwadau ar y mapiau drafft wedi'u hystyried gan y cyngor cefn gwlad. Pan gyhoeddir y map dros dro ar gyfer ardal, caiff y rheini sydd â budd cyfreithiol mewn unrhyw dir a ddangosir ar y map, fel tiffeddianwyr, tenantiaid a phobl â hawliau dros y tir, apelio, mewn amgylchiadau arbennig, i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'r ail set o reoliadau a ystyrir heddiw yn ymdrin â'r trefniadau ar gyfer y broses apêl. Unwaith y bydd apeliadau wedi'u penderfynu, cyhoeddir y mapiau yn eu ffurf derfynol gan y cyngor cefn gwlad.

Mae goblygiadau'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn

important to Wales. The new access provisions that these regulations help to implement in Wales are expected to create public access to an area of over 300,000 hectares. This is a significant area that is roughly equivalent in size to Wales's three national parks. For consultation purposes, CCW has divided Wales into 15 areas and aims to produce provisional and conclusive maps for each area on a phased basis, as it is doing for the draft maps. The regulations before the Assembly today aim to ensure that the different maps are all produced in a consistent manner across Wales, and are made readily available to all those with an interest. The regulations therefore specify how the maps should be prepared, published and made available for inspection. The regulations are consistent with, not identical to, those being prepared by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs for England. For example, our regulations make provision for farmers and land managers to receive, on request, a free copy of the provisional and conclusive maps for the area. This is not being done in England, but it has been welcomed by Welsh farming interests.

On the appeal regulations, once the provisional map for an area has been published, those with a legal interest in the land may, in certain circumstances, appeal to the Assembly. The most common appeal is expected to be on the ground that the land should not have been mapped as open country or registered common land. Other potential appeal situations include land manager applications for restricted access being rejected by the relevant authority, which would normally be CCW or the national park. The regulations cover the main procedures to be followed in the handling and determination of appeals, and I have decided that the Planning Inspectorate should normally handle appeals brought under Part 1 provision of the Act, utilising procedures similar to those under the planning system, which are well known and understood. These regulations aim to ensure that all appeals permitted are dealt with on a fair, consistent and effective basis. I commend the motion to Members.

**Janet Davies:** Publication of these maps in a

bwysig i Gymru. Disgwylir i'r darpariaethau mynediad newydd y mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn helpu i'w sefydlu yng Nghymru greu mynediad cyhoeddus i ardal o dros 300,000 hectar. Mae hynny'n arwynebedd sylweddol sy'n gyfwerth yn fras â thri pharc cenedlaethol Cymru. I ddibenion ymgynghori, mae'r cyngor cefn gwlad wedi rhannu Cymru'n 15 ardal a'i nod yw llunio mapiau dros dro a therfynol ar gyfer pob ardal fesul cam, fel y mae'n gwneud ar gyfer y mapiau drafft. Nod y rheoliadau sydd gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw yw sicrhau y caiff yr holl fapiau gwahanol eu cynhyrchu mewn modd cyson ledled Cymru, ac y byddant ar gael i bawb sydd â diddordeb. Felly mae'r rheoliadau'n pennu sut y dylid paratoi a chyhoeddi'r mapiau a sicrhau eu bod ar gael i'w harchwilio. Mae'r rheoliadau'n gyson, ond nid yn union yr un fath, â'r rheini sy'n cael eu paratoi gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i Loegr. Er enghraifft, mae ein rheoliadau ni'n darparu i ffermwyr a rheolwyr tir dderbyn, ar gais, gopi am ddim o'r mapiau dros dro a therfynol ar gyfer yr ardal. Ni wneir hyn yn Lloegr, ond fe'i croesawyd gan y byd ffermio yng Nghymru.

Ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau apêl, unwaith y bydd y map dros-dro ar gyfer ardal wedi'i gyhoeddi, caiff y rheini sydd â budd cyfreithiol yn y tir, mewn amgylchiadau penodol, apelio i'r Cynulliad. Disgwylir i'r apêl fwyaf cyffredin fod ar y sail na ddylid bod wedi mapio'r tir fel gwlad agored neu dir comin cofrestredig. Mae sefyllfaoedd eraill lle gellid apelio yn cynnwys ceisiadau gan reolwyr tir am gyfyngiad yn cael eu gwrthod gan yr awdurdod perthnasol, sef y cyngor cefn gwlad neu'r parc cenedlaethol fel arfer. Mae'r rheoliadau'n nodi'r prif weithdrefnau i'w dilyn wrth drafod a phenderfynu ar apeliadau, ac yr wyf fi wedi penderfynu y dylai'r Arolygaeth Gynllunio fel arfer ymdrin ag apeliadau a wneir dan ddarpariaeth Rhan 1 y Ddeddf, gan ddefnyddio gweithdrefnau tebyg i'r rheini dan y system gynllunio, sydd yn hysbys ac yn ddealedig yn gyffredinol. Nod y rheoliadau hyn yw sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â phob apêl a ganiateir ar sail deg, cyson ac effeithiol. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Aelodau.

**Janet Davies:** Mae cyhoeddi'r mapiau hyn ar

consistent form is necessary to ensure that the legislation is fairly and properly implemented. I am pleased to see the proposed appeals system, as it will ensure that anyone who feels aggrieved by this legislation will receive a fair hearing. This is important legislation for developing the tourism potential of rural areas, which should help to bring more money into such areas, and also improve general health, as people have more opportunities to walk in open countryside, on land and heath. I welcome these measures.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats also welcome these measures, particularly the Minister's comments about landowners' specification and notification.

One of the most divisive concepts to develop recently is that town and country life must be in conflict. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that only through mutual understanding will barriers be broken down. The countryside has an economic function and is also a treasure for us all. People should have the right to enjoy the countryside, provided they do so considerately and respectfully.

Cartography is not usually a political subject, but it obviously has become one. Full consultation with all parties, including landowners, should be considered. With a definite and conclusive map, no disagreement should get out of hand.

On a strategic level, the Liberal Democrats believe in full provision for diverting footpaths, particularly where a path is too close to a business property or dwelling. There should be sufficient funding to provide signs and wardens. Many farmers might consider being involved in that custodial role. While we encourage more countryside visits, we need to safeguard biodiversity as well as property.

On an operational level, we commend and welcome the Minister's comments about notification, but we urge her to write to all farmers so that they do not miss out on important information. We also want forestry

ffurf gyson yn angenrheidiol er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y ddeddfwriaeth ei gweithredu'n deg ac yn briodol. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y system apelio arfaethedig, gan y bydd yn sicrhau y bydd unrhyw un sy'n teimlo iddynt gael cam gan y ddeddfwriaeth yn cael gwrandawriad teg. Dyma ddeddfwriaeth bwysig ar gyfer datblygu potensial twristiaeth ardaloedd gwledig, a ddylai helpu i ddod â mwy o arian i mewn i ardaloedd o'r fath, a hefyd wella iechyd yn gyffredinol, wrth i bobl gael mwy o gyfleoedd i gerdded yng nghefn gwlad, ar dir a gwaun. Croesawaf y mesurau hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r mesurau hyn hefyd, yn enwedig sylwadau'r Gweinidog am y drefn ar gyfer pennu a hysbysu tîrfeiddianwyr.

Un o'r cysyniadau mwyaf ymrannol i ddatblygu'n ddiweddar yw fod yn rhaid i fywyd y wlad a'r dref wrthdaro. Cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru mai dim ond trwy gyd-ddealltwriaeth y chwelir y muriau. Mae gan gefn gwlad swyddogaeth economaidd ac mae hefyd yn drysor inni i gyd. Dylai pobl gael yr hawl i fwynhau cefn gwlad, dim ond iddynt wneud hynny yn ystyriol a chyda pharch.

Nid yw cartograffeg fel arfer yn bwnc gwleidyddol, ond yn amlwg y mae bellach. Dylid ystyried ymgynghori'n llawn â phob parti, gan gynnwys tîrfeiddianwyr. Gyda map pendant a therfynol, ni ddylai unrhyw anghydfod fynd dros ben llestri.

Ar lefel strategol, cred y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mewn darpariaeth lawn ar gyfer gwyro llwybrau, yn enwedig lle bo llwybr yn rhy agos at adeilad busnes neu dŷ annedd. Dylai fod digon o gyllid i ddarparu arwyddion a wardeiniaid. Gallai llawer o ffermwyr ystyried cael rhan yn y rôl warchodol honno. Tra bod angen annog mwy o ymweliadau â chefn gwlad, mae angen diogelu bioamrywiaeth yn ogystal ag eiddo.

Ar lefel weithrediadol, cymeradwywn a chroesawn sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â hysbysu, ond fe'i hanogwn i ysgrifennu at bob ffermwr fel na chollant unrhyw wybodaeth bwysig. Mae arnom eisiau

and farming sites to be properly signed, so that there is no concern about insufficient wildlife protection, such as for ground-nesting birds.

**David Davies:** The Welsh Conservatives will not support these proposals because they do nothing to alleviate this highly unfair legislation and we do not wish to be associated with it in any way. The legislation will greatly increase the burden—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Every minority is entitled to its point of view.

**David Davies:** I wish that the tolerance that Members want for other minorities could be extended to the Conservative Party, which is not such a minority in Wales: it achieved more votes than Plaid Cymru and the Liberal Democrats.

**David Melding:** Point of order. I hope that I am not being obtuse, but we do not know yet whether our view is in the minority.

**The Presiding Officer:** I stand corrected. The view may have been in the minority in the past.

**David Davies:** Our concern is that the legislation greatly increases the burden on farmers and landowners, who will not only be forced to allow access to land which they have bought and paid for, but will also be in the unfair position of being legally responsible for anybody who has an accident on their land. There have been no proposals to deal with that. How long will it be before a court case is brought against a hill farmer because somebody sprained an ankle while climbing over a stone wall? Unfortunately, the new breed of rather sleazy, no-win-no-fee lawyers would be all too willing to take the side of someone who wanted to make a claim. The proposals do not adequately protect farmers. Apart from the fact that legal responsibility for accidents it is inherently unfair, it sets a dangerous precedent in turning the delicate balance between individual and state in favour of the state.

arwyddion iawn hefyd i safleoedd coedwigaeth a ffermydd, fel na fydd dim pryder ynghylch diffyg gwarchodaeth i fywyd gwyllt, er enghraifft i adar sy'n nythu ar y ddaear.

**David Davies:** Ni wnaiff Ceidwadwyr Cymru gefnogi'r cynigion hyn gan na wnânt ddim i liniaru'r ddeddfwriaeth hynod annheg hon ac ni ddymunwn gael ein cysylltu â hi mewn unrhyw fodd. Bydd y ddeddfwriaeth yn cynyddu'r baich—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan bob lleiafrif hawl i'w safbwynt.

**David Davies:** Hoffwn pe gallai'r goddefgarwch y mae Aelodau'n ei ddymuno i leiafrifoedd eraill gael ei ymestyn i'r Plaid Geidwadol, nad yw'n gymaint o leiafrif yng Nghymru: fe enillodd fwy o bleidleisiau na Phlaid Cymru a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**David Melding:** Pwynt o drefn. Gobeithio nad wyf yn bod yn dwp, ond ni wyddom eto a yw ein barn yn y lleiafrif.

**Y Llywydd:** Derbyniat fy nghywiro. Efallai y bu'r farn honno yn y lleiafrif yn y gorffennol.

**David Davies:** Ein pryder yw fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn cynyddu'r baich ar ffermwyr a thirfeddianwyr yn aruthrol; nid yn unig y'u gorfodir i ganiatáu mynediad i dir y maent wedi'i brynu ac wedi talu amdano, ond fe'u gosodir yn y sefyllfa annheg o fod yn gyfreithiol gyfrifol am unrhyw un a gaiff ddamwain ar eu tir. Ni chafwyd unrhyw gynigion i ddelio â hynny. Pa mor hir fydd hi cyn y deuir ag achos llys yn erbyn ffermwr mynydd am fod rhywun wedi troi ei ffêr wrth ddringo dros wal gerrig? Yn anffodus, byddai'r brid newydd o dwrneiod amheus, dim-tâl-os-nad-enillir-yr-achos, yn fwy na bodlon ochri gyda rhywun a fyddai am wneud hawliad. Nid yw'r cynigion yn diogelu ffermwyr yn ddigonol. Ar wahân i'r ffaith fod cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol am ddamweiniau ynddo'i hun yn annheg, mae'n gosod cynsail beryglus o ran troi'r cydbwysedd bregus rhwng yr unigolyn a'r wladwriaeth o blaid y wladwriaeth.



**Alun Pugh:** I will vote for these regulations. The statutory right of access to our mountains and high moorland will, at last, right an injustice that has run for centuries. The descendants of those arrested and jailed in the mass trespass of factory workers at Kinder Scout will be happy if these regulations are passed today, even if the Tories will not. Rights of way are needed to access high ground, but many rights of way in Wales are blocked. Minister, will you address the need to open those rights of way so that people can access that ground?

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I look forward to the day when regulations under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 will be approved without controversy. I am not sure that that day will ever come.

3:00 p.m.

I will run through the comments made. Thank you, Janet, for working on this. I agree that it is a huge opportunity for tourism; it will increase income for many farmers currently going through difficult times.

Eleanor, on the links between town and country, we are beginning to understand that they need to be made in many ways, whether through food production or sharing land. These regulations will help. Until now, our approach seems to have worked pretty well. I would never say that it will work well forever: that would tempt fate. However, our kind of approach—and the Countryside Council for Wales's work—is inclusive, and really means consultation. That process has given confidence to some of the people who were, initially, against the Act in principle, but nevertheless feel that, as an organisation, CCW has done its best to include people.

**Glyn Davies:** You make frequent reference to the Countryside Council for Wales with regard to this legislation. Do you accept that you have presented that in such a way as to suggest that the CCW agrees with this obnoxious legislation when, in fact, it is only

**Alun Pugh:** Pleidleisiaf fi dros y rheoliadau hyn. Bydd hawl mynediad statudol i'n mynyddoedd a'n gweundiroedd uchel, o'r diwedd, yn unioni cam sydd wedi parhau ers canrifoedd. Bydd disgynyddion y rhain a arestiwyd ac a garcharwyd yn y tresmasu torfol gan weithwyr ffatri yn Kinder Scout yn hapus os derbynnir y rheoliadau hyn heddiw, hyd yn oed os na fydd y Torïaid. Mae angen hawliau tramwy er mwyn mynd i dir uchel, ond mae llawer o hawliau tramwy yng Nghymru wedi'u cau. Weinidog, a wnewch chi roi sylw i'r angen i agor yr hawliau tramwy hynny fel y gall pobl gyrraedd y tir hwnnw?

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Edrychaf ymlaen at y dydd pan gaiff rheoliadau dan Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 eu cymeradwyo heb ddadl. Nid wyf yn siŵr y daw'r dydd hwnnw byth.

Af yn frysio g drwy'r sylwadau a wnaethpwyd. Diolch ichi, Janet, am weithio ar hyn. Cytunaf ei bod yn gyfle enfawr i dwristiaeth; bydd yn cynyddu incwm i lawer o ffermwyr sydd yn mynd drwy amserau caled ar hyn o bryd.

Eleanor, ar y cysylltiadau rhwng gwlad a thref, yr ydym yn dechrau deall bod angen eu gwneud mewn sawl ffordd, boed drwy gynhyrchu bwyd neu rannu tir. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn help. Hyd yma, mae'n ymddangos bod ein dull o fynd ati wedi gweithio'n eithaf da. Ni ddywedwn fyth y gwnaiff weithio'n dda am byth: temtio ffawd fyddai hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dull ni—a gwaith Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru—yn gynhwysol, ac yn golygu ymgynghori go iawn. Mae'r broses honno wedi rhoi hyder i rai o'r bobl a oedd, ar y dechrau, yn erbyn y Ddeddf mewn egwyddor, ond sydd serch hynny'n teimlo bod y cyngor cefn gwlad, fel corff, wedi gwneud ei orau i gynnwys pobl.

**Glyn Davies:** Cyfeiriwch yn aml at Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ynglŷn â'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. A dderbyniwch eich bod wedi cyflwyno hynny yn y fath fodd fel ag i awgrymu bod y cyngor yn cytuno â'r ddeddfwriaeth wrthun hon pan nad yw, mewn gwirionedd, ond yn

carrying out your wishes? Many of its employees and supporters believe—as I do—that you have created an appalling situation.

**Sue Essex:** I do not know why you keep fighting this, when the Act is there.

**Glyn Davies:** Democracy, that is why.

**Sue Essex:** Democracy has taken its course, Glyn. The last Conservative Government introduced much unpopular legislation and, at the time, you always argued was that it was democracy. Whether you like it or not, you lost the 1997 election. We have legislation, and if you are saying that we should not implement it here, that is of great surprise to me. It is the Assembly's duty to enact that legislation and to vote on the regulations. My commitment has always been to do so fairly and efficiently.

You quote countryside council employees, but I have not spoken to them, though I speak to many of its staff. Many people are encouraged by the way that we are going about this. Following the dire period of foot and mouth disease and its associated problems, an appreciation has arisen of just how important access to the countryside is to the Welsh economy.

Not everybody in the countryside feels the same: some people are still implacably opposed to the Act, and I accept that I cannot do anything about that. However, many others have gone along with the spirit of it, and are saying that we are implementing it in the proper way. That is what the Countryside Council for Wales is doing. I was there when its consultation exercise was launched in south-east Wales, in Caerphilly. It has involved around 12 centres around south-east Wales in the exercise, for people to see the maps and to make comments.

On David's view, I suppose that that gentleman is not for turning, and never will be—but remember what happened to the lady who was not for turning. You put yourself in a position where you cannot hear the voice of reason. That is your decision, but—

cyflawni'ch dymuniadau chi? Mae llawer o'i weithwyr a'i gefnogwyr yn credu—fel myfi—eich bod wedi creu sefyllfa erchyll.

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn pam eich bod yn dal i ymladd yn erbyn hyn o hyd, a'r Ddeddf wedi'i sefydlu.

**Glyn Davies:** Democratiaeth, dyna pam.

**Sue Essex:** Mae democratiaeth wedi rhedeg ei chwrs, Glyn. Cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf lawer o ddeddfwriaeth amhoblogaidd ac, ar y pryd, eich dadl chi bob amser oedd mai democratiaeth ydoedd. Hoffi neu beidio, colli a wnaethoch yn etholiad 1997. Mae gennym ddeddfwriaeth, ac os ydych chi'n dweud na ddylem ei gweithredu yma, mae hynny'n fy synnu i'n fawr. Dyletswydd y Cynulliad yw gweithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth honno a phleidleisio ar y rheoliadau. Fyymrwymiad i bob amser fu gwneud hynny yn deg ac effeithlon.

Yr ydych yn dyfynnu gweithwyr y cyngor cefn gwlad, ond nid wyf fi wedi siarad â hwy, er imi siarad â llawer o'i staff. Mae llawer o bobl wedi'u calonogi gan y ffordd yr ydym yn mynd o gwmpas hyn. Ar ôl dyddiau enbyd clwy'r traed a'r genau a'i broblemau cysylltiedig, gwerthfawrogir mor bwysig yw mynediad i gefn gwlad i economi Cymru.

Nid pawb yng nghefn gwlad sy'n teimlo'r un fath: mae rhai pobl yn gwbl wrthwynebus i'r Ddeddf o hyd, a derbyniaf na allaf wneud dim am hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o rai eraill wedi cyd-fynd ag ysbryd y Ddeddf, ac yn dweud ein bod yn ei gweithredu yn y ffordd briodol. Dyna beth mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru'n ei wneud. Yr oeddwn yno pan lansiwyd ei ymarfer ymgynghori yn y De-ddwyrain, yng Nghaerffili. Mae wedi cynnwys oddeutu 12 o ganolfannau o gwmpas y De-ddwyrain yn yr ymarfer, i bobl gael gweld y mapiau a gwneud sylwadau.

Ar farn David, mae'n debyg nad oes troi ar y gŵr, ac na fydd byth—ond cofiwch beth a ddigwyddodd i'r fenyw nad oedd am droi. Yr ydych yn eich rhoi eich hun mewn sefyllfa lle na allwch glywed llais rheswm. Eich penderfyniad chi yw hynny, ond—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**Sue Essex:** No, I will not take any more interventions. This debate is taking a long time. You have had your say.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Whether or not the Minister wishes to accept interventions is entirely a matter for her, as David Davies knows.

**Sue Essex:** We are trying to do this in a fair way. If you disagree with it, I accept that that is your right. However, in turn, you must accept that a majority in the Chamber is in favour of passing the regulations. The majority has taken the right commonsense decision and if the Act proves beneficial to the economy of Wales—which I am sure it will—the majority can take some credit for that.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002.

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Sue Essex:** Na, ni chymeraf ragor o ymyriadau. Mae'r ddadl hon yn cymryd amser maith. Yr ydych wedi cael dweud eich dweud.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mater i'r Gweinidog yn llwyr yw a yw'n dymuno derbyn ymyriadau ai peidio, fel y gŵyr David Davies.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud hyn mewn ffordd deg. Os anghytunwch â hynny, derbyniaf mai dyna'ch hawl. Fodd bynnag, yn eich tro, rhaid i chithau dderbyn bod mwyafrif yn y Siambr o blaid derbyn y rheoliadau. Mae'r mwyafrif wedi gwneud y penderfyniad cywir o ran synnwyr cyffredin ac os profa'r Ddeddf yn fuddiol i economi Cymru—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwna—gall y mwyafrif gymryd rhywfaint o glod am hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David

Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Mapiau Dros Dro a Therfynol) (Cymru) 2002.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the Countryside Access (Provisional and Conclusive Maps) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

*Cynnig: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Motion: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on

egwyddor Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn the principle of the Countryside Access  
Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations  
2002.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau Mynediad i Gefn Gwlad (Gweithdrefnau Apelau) (Cymru) 2002.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the Countryside Access (Appeals Procedures) (Wales) Regulations 2002.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David

Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Gorchymyn Cymunedau Ewrop  
 (Dynodiadau) (Rhif 2) 2002**

**Delegation of the Functions of the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2)  
 Order 2002**

**The First Minister:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,*

*resolves to delegate all the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2) Order 2002 (SI 2002/1080) to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or reducing the role of Assembly Committees in the exercise of the*

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cynigaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*yn penderfynu dirprwyo i Brif Weinidog y Cynulliad holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Orchymyn Cymunedau Ewrop (Dynodiadau) (Rhif 2) 2002 (OS 2002/1080) ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir yn ôl y gyfraith eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn nac yn lleihau rôl Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod.*

*above functions.* (NDM1117)

A copy of the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2) Order 2002 can be found on the internet, as set out in the explanatory note previously circulated to Members.

The motion seeks the Assembly's agreement to delegate the functions contained in the regulation to be made under the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2) Order 2002 to the First Minister. The Government of Wales recognises that the Assembly may delegate its functions in the interest of administrative efficiency. A range of programmes have been in place since 2000 to deliver improved conditions to many people in parts of Wales that have long endured lower incomes and fewer jobs than their counterparts in urban south-east and north-east Wales. These programmes include Objectives 1, 2 and 5b, the rural development plan and LEADER+. They are five key European agricultural guidance and guarantee fund programmes that are making a difference to the lives of people in rural Wales.

Since their inception, the detailed administrative arrangements for these programmes have operated smoothly in terms of the agricultural programmes for which powers to legislate are available to the Assembly under its common agricultural policy designation. However, legal advice to us has now made it clear that measures that extend beyond the CAP and concern the wider rural economy lack an appropriate regulation-making power for implementation purposes under section 2 (2) of the European Communities Act 1972. An example of such a programme is LEADER+. The order in council empowering the Assembly to make such regulations, implementing such wider rural development programmes outside orthodox CAP was made on 17 April 2002 and came into force on 20 May 2002. The regulations affect EAGGF programmes and related match funding as regards rural development only.

The regulations will in due course be brought forward under section 2 (2) of the European

(NDM1117)

Gellir gweld copi o Orchymyn Cymunedau Ewrop (Dynodiadau) (Rhif 2) 2002 ar y rhyngwyd, fel a amlinellwyd yn y nodyn eglurhaol a ddsbarthwyd eisoes i'r Aelodau.

Mae'r cynnig yn ceisio cytundeb y Cynulliad i ddirprwyo'r swyddogaethau a geir yn y rheoliad sydd i'w wneud dan Orchymyn Cymunedau Ewrop (Dynodiadau) (Rhif 2) 2002 i Brif Weinidog Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n cydnabod y gall y Cynulliad ddirprwyo'i swyddogaethau er mwyn effeithlonrwydd gweinyddol. Mae amrediad o raglenni wedi'u sefydlu ers 2000 i wella amodau llawer o bobl mewn rhannau o Gymru a fu'n dioddef cyflogau is a llai o swyddi ers tro na'u cymheiriaid yn ardaloedd trefol y De-ddwyrain a'r Gogledd-ddwyrain. Mae'r rhaglenni hyn yn cynnwys Amcanion 1, 2 a 5b, y cynllun datblygu gwledig a LEADER+. Dyma bum rhaglen allweddol dan gronfa cyfarwyddo a gwarantu amaethyddiaeth Ewrop sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau pobl yng nghefn gwlad Cymru.

Ers eu cyflwyno, mae'r trefniadau gweinyddol manwl ar gyfer y rhaglenni hyn wedi rhedeg yn esmwyth o ran y rhaglenni amaethyddol y mae pwerau i ddeddfu ar eu cyfer ar gael i'r Cynulliad dan ei ddynodiad dan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyngor cyfreithiol a gawsom wedi dangos yn glir inni bellach fod mesurau sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i'r PAC ac yn ymwneud â'r economi wledig ehangach yn dioddef o ddiffyg hawl briodol i wneud rheoliadau i ddibenion gweithredu'r mesur dan adran 2 (2) Deddf Cymunedau Ewrop 1972. Enghraifft o raglen o'r fath yw LEADER+. Gwnaethpwyd y gorchymyn yn y cyfrin gyngor, yn rhoi grym i'r Cynulliad wneud rheoliadau o'r fath i weithredu rhaglenni datblygu gwledig o'r fath y tu allan i'r PAC arferol, ar 17 Ebrill 2002 a daeth i rym ar 20 Mai 2002. Mae'r rheoliadau'n effeithio ar raglenni EAGGF ac arian cyfatebol cysylltiedig ar gyfer datblygu gwledig yn unig.

Maes o law deuir â'r rheoliadau ymlaen dan adran 2 (2) Deddf Cymunedau Ewrop 1972 a

Communities Act 1972 and they will provide for administratively efficient grant-making schemes to encourage rural development. They will provide the conditions under which grants are paid, outline supporting information required to ensure that claims are proper and regular and help key partners—the Welsh European Funding Office and the Welsh Development Agency—to ensure that claimants receive their money quickly and properly in accordance with commonly agreed administrative systems. They will provide for appropriate match funding programmes to be implemented within EAGGF rural development schemes. They will enable EAGGF or match funded moneys to be recovered where appropriate and old EAGGF programmes such as Objective 5b to be closed. These are necessary administrative powers which essentially tidy up the Assembly's powers relating to wider rural development ensuring that administration of the rural development elements of these programmes is beyond doubt and that the schemes can be properly run. They ensure consistency with analogous CAP arrangements.

darparant ar gyfer cynlluniau llunio grant a fydd yn weinyddol effeithlon er mwyn annog datblygu gwledig. Byddant yn darparu'r amodau ar gyfer talu grantiau, yn amlinellu gwybodaeth ategol a fydd yn ofynnol i sicrhau bod hawliadau'n briodol ac yn rheolaidd ac yn helpu partneriaid allweddol—Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru—i sicrhau bod ymgeiswyr yn cael eu harian yn gyflym ac yn briodol yn unol â systemau gweinyddol y cytunir arnynt gan bawb. Darparant ar gyfer gweithredu rhaglenni arian cyfatebol priodol o fewn cynlluniau datblygu gwledig cronfa cyfarwyddo a gwarantu amaethyddiaeth Ewrop. Byddant yn caniatáu adennill arian y gronfa neu arian cyfatebol lle bo'n briodol, a chau hen raglenni'r gronfa, fel Amcan 5b. Mae'r rhain yn bwerau gweinyddol angenrheidiol sydd, yn y bôn, yn tacluso pwerau'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â datblygu gwledig ehangach gan sicrhau bod gweinyddiad elfennau datblygu gwledig y rhaglenni hyn y tu hwnt i amheuaeth ac y gellir rhedeg y cynlluniau'n iawn. Maent yn sicrhau cysondeb â chynlluniau PAC cyfatebol.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'n ymddangos bod unrhyw un am gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon.

**The Presiding Officer:** It seems that no-one wishes to contribute to this debate.

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian



Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Cyllideb Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar gyfer 2003-04 Approval of the Budget of the Presiding Office for 2003-04**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I propose that  
**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 19.00,* *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog 19.00,*

*adopts the budget for the Presiding Office for 2003-04 and indicative allocations for the subsequent two years as set out in the table entitled 'Presiding Office Budget for 2003-04 and Indicative Budget for 2004-05 and 2005-06' laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2002. (NDM1120)*  
*yn mabwysiadu'r gyllideb ar gyfer Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar gyfer 2003-04 a'r dyraniadau dangosol ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd ddilynol fel y'u nodir yn y tabl a elwir 'Presiding Office Budget for 2003-04 and Indicative Budget for 2004-05 and 2005-06' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2002. (NDM1120)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid yw'n ymddangos bod unrhyw un am gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon ychwaith.  
**The Presiding Officer:** It seems that no-one wishes to contribute to this debate either.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David

Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.09 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.09 p.m.*

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ar y Gymraeg The Culture Committee's Report on the Welsh Language**

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Diwylliant,  
 'Ein Hiaith: Ei Dyfodol', a osodwyd yn y  
 Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Gorffennaf 2002.  
 (NDM1118)*

Mae'n fraint ac yn anrhydedd i gael cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn, nid yn unig ar ran y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ond hefyd ar y cyd â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Bu'r ddau Bwyllgor yn cydweithio ar yr adroddiad sylweddol a hanesyddol hwn. Canmolaf aelodau'r Pwyllgorau. Bu'n flwyddyn ers i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant etifeddu cais gan y

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*notes the report of the Culture Committee entitled, 'Our Language: Its Future', which was laid in the Table Office on 1 July 2002.  
 (NDM1118)*

It is a privilege and an honour to present this report, on behalf not only of the Culture Committee, but also the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. Both Committees have collaborated on this significant and historic report. I praise the Committees' members. A year has passed since the Culture Committee inherited a

Cynulliad—ar ôl diddymu'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant ôl-16—i ystyried y posibiladau o wireddu'r nod o Gymru ddwyieithog. Pwysleisiaf y geiriau hynny oherwydd y cais a gawsom oedd cyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad y strwythurau angenrheidiol i wireddu'r nod hwnnw. Yr oeddem yn ei chymryd yn ganiataol bod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyfan yn ymrwymo i'r nod hwnnw. Disgwylid i'r Pwyllgor roi ar waith strategaethau y byddai eu hangen i wireddu hynny.

3:10 p.m.

Penderfynwyd gofyn i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ystyried addysg statudol oherwydd bod arbenigedd yn y Pwyllgor hwnnw i allu gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'w Gadeirydd blaenorol, Cynog Dafis, ac i'r Cadeirydd presennol, Gareth Jones, am eu cydweithrediad.

Mae'r Pwyllgorau wedi llwyddo i gydweithio i ddod ag adroddiad unedig ger eich bron. Mae holl aelodau'r Pwyllgorau wedi gorfod gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Cafwyd sylwadau yn y wasg a'r cyfryngau am gyfaddawdu gwleidyddol er mwyn sicrhau bod yr adroddiad yn dod ger eich bron y prynhawn yma. Dywedaf yn glir nad yw'r cyfaddawdu hwnnw'n arwydd o wendid o gwbl; mae'n arwydd o gydweithio gwleidyddol aeddfed gan bob aelod o'r Pwyllgorau hynny.

Pan oedd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn ceisio llunio'i argymhellion terfynol rai wythnosau yn ôl, dywedodd Glyn Davies wrth y Pwyllgor ei fod yn gweithredu'n gyson. Mae hynny'n wir: bu'n gyson trwy gydol ein trafodaethau yn gwrthwynebu argymhelliad penodol ynglŷn â newid statws tŷ annedd yn dŷ haf. Nid yw'n credu bod hynny'n ymarferol ac nid yw'n ei gefnogi, ond dywedodd na fyddai hynny'n ei atal rhag cefnogi'r adroddiad cyfan oherwydd bod yr adroddiad ei hun yn bwysig ac arwyddocaol. Mae hynny'n arwydd o aeddfedrwydd gwleidyddol ac mae wedi'i fabwysiadu gan holl aelodau'r ddau Bwyllgor. [*Chwerthin.*] Credaf imi roi diwedd ar yrfa wleidyddol Glyn Davies wrth ei ganmol, ond fe'i gwneuthum yn ddiffuant oherwydd bod ei sylw yn gymorth mawr inni.

request from the Assembly—following the dissolution of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee—to consider the possibilities of realising the aim of a bilingual Wales. I emphasise those words because we were charged with presenting to the Assembly the structures necessary to realise that aim. We took it for granted that the entire National Assembly was committed to that aim. The Committee was expected to put in place the strategies required to make that a reality.

We decided to ask the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee to consider statutory education because it had the expertise to do so. I am grateful to its former Chair, Cynog Dafis, and to the present Chair, Gareth Jones, for their co-operation.

The Committees succeeded in working together to present a cohesive report before you. All members of the Committees had to work together. There were reports in the press and the media of a political compromise in order to ensure that the report came before you this afternoon. I say unequivocally that that compromise is not in any way a sign of weakness; it is indicative of mature political co-operation from every member of those Committees.

When the Culture Committee was finalising its recommendations some weeks ago, Glyn Davies told the Committee that he was acting consistently. That is true: he was consistent throughout our discussions in opposing a specific recommendation regarding changing the status of a permanent dwelling into a holiday home. He does not believe that to be practical and does not support it, but he said that that would not prevent him from supporting the report as a whole because the report itself is important and significant. That is indicative of the political maturity shown by all members of both Committees. [*Laughter.*] I am afraid that I have just destroyed Glyn Davies' political career by praising him, but I did so sincerely because his comment was of great assistance.

Mae hwn yn ddigwyddiad hanesyddol: ers degawdau buom yn trafod yr iaith Gymraeg a, chan fwyaf, yn trafod ei thranc. O ganlyniad i'r adroddiad hwn, gallwn ddechrau gweithredu i sicrhau dyfodol y Gymraeg a Chymru ddwyieithog. Mae'n rhaid i bob un ohonom weithio i sicrhau Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Mae hynny'n gyfrifoldeb ar bawb, yn Gymry Cymraeg ac yn Gymry di-Gymraeg oherwydd bod yr iaith yn eiddo i bawb yng Nghymru.

Yn syml, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn creu strwythur i ganiatáu i Lywodraeth Cymru gymryd cyfrifoldeb am dwf ieithyddol. Mae'n sôn am system lywodraethol lle y bydd uned strategol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn sicrhau bod pob polisi yn cael ei gydlyn yn drawsbynciol a bod gorolwg strategol ar weithgareddau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n sôn hefyd am fforwm iaith a ddaw â'r gwahanol asiantaethau a mudiadau sy'n gweithio i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg at ei gilydd, i'w galluogi i gymryd rhan mewn cynllunio ieithyddol yng Nghymru fel y gall pob un ohonynt weithio tua'r un nod a sicrhau bod eu gweithgareddau yn cael eu cydlyn. Mae hynny'n golygu y gallwn sôn yn realistig am dwf ieithyddol am y tro cyntaf.

Mae fy nyled yn fawr i aelodau'r Pwyllgorau, i'w hysgrifenyddiaethau, i'r ddau ymgynghorydd arbenigol, ac i'r Gwasanaeth Cyfieithu a weithiodd yn eithriadol o galed i sicrhau bod yr adroddiad yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn y ddwy iaith ar yr un pryd. Yn bennaf oll yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i bob mudiad ac unigolyn a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth i'r arolwg.

Cyflwynaf yr adroddiad yn hyderus ger eich bron. Mae'n hen bryd inni beidio â siarad am ddyfodol y Gymraeg a dechrau gweithredu i sicrhau a chynnal Cymru ddwyieithog.

Trosglwyddaf yr awenau'n awr i Gareth Jones, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Lorraine Barrett.

This is an historic event: for decades we have been discussing the Welsh language and for the most part its demise. As a result of this report, we can start to act to secure a future for the Welsh language and a bilingual Wales. We must all work to secure a genuinely bilingual Wales. Welsh-speakers and non-Welsh speakers alike have a role to play because the language belongs to everyone in Wales.

Put simply, this report creates a structure that allows the Government of Wales to take responsibility for language growth. It refers to a system of governance where a strategic unit exists within the National Assembly to ensure that all policies are co-ordinated on a cross-cutting basis and that there is a strategic overview of the Assembly's activities. It also mentions a language forum that will bring together the various agencies and groups that work to promote the Welsh language to enable them to take part in language planning in Wales, so that they can all work towards the same goal and ensure that their activities are co-ordinated. That means that for the first time we can talk realistically about language growth.

I am greatly indebted to the members of the Committees, their secretariats, the two specialist advisers, and to the Translation Service which worked exceptionally hard to ensure that the report was published simultaneously in both languages. Above all we are grateful to all the groups and individuals who gave evidence to the review.

I present the report before you with confidence. It is high time that we stopped talking about the future of the Welsh language and started to take action to create and sustain a bilingual Wales.

I now hand over to Gareth Jones, the Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar Lorraine Barrett.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gareth Jones is to speak next, as we are sharing the 15 minutes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gareth Jones sydd i siarad nesaf, gan ein bod yn rhannu'r 15 munud.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I thought that Gareth was winding up the debate.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr oeddwn i'n meddwl mai dirwyn y ddadl i ben yr oedd Gareth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yes. He will use the rest of the 15 minutes to wind up. You are wasting time now.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ie. Bydd yn defnyddio gweddill y 15 munud i ddirwyn i ben. Yr ydych yn gwastraffu amser yn awr.

3:20 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You should not attack the Chair. I will now call Gareth Jones. However, you cannot speak twice, Gareth. You can speak now but you cannot wind up as well.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni ddylech ymosod ar y Cadeirydd. Galwaf yn awr ar Gareth Jones. Fodd bynnag, ni chewch siarad ddwy waith, Gareth. Cewch siarad yn awr ond ni chewch ddirwyn i ben hefyd.

**Gareth Jones:** Ar ran aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant am roi cyfle inni gymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad polisi pwysig hwn. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i ddau Bwyllgor Pwnc yn y Cynulliad ymgymryd ag adolygiad polisi ar y cyd. Bu'n brofiad diddorol a gwerthfawr.

**Gareth Jones:** On behalf of the members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, I thank the Culture Committee for giving us the opportunity to participate in this important policy review. This is the first time that a joint policy review has been undertaken by two Assembly Subject Committees. It was an interesting and valuable experience.

Fel y gwyddom, mae addysg a hyfforddiant yn hanfodol i ddatblygiad a thwf y Gymraeg. Mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau bod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am weld cynnydd cyson a sylweddol mewn darpariaethau addysg ddwyieithog a chyfrwng Cymraeg yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf a thu hwnt.

As we know, education and training are vital to the development and growth of the Welsh language. I am pleased to confirm that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee wants to see continual and significant progress in the provision of bilingual and Welsh-medium education during the next 10 years and beyond.

Beth bynnag fo barn unigolion am yr adroddiad, erys yn ddogfen gynhwysfawr sy'n cynnwys negeseuon cadarnhaol. Mae'n allweddol i bawb sy'n pryderu o ddifrif ynghylch dyfodol y Gymraeg ac sydd am iddi ffynnu. Yr wyf yn falch cydnabod bod yr adroddiad yn adlewyrchu consensws ar yr iaith, ac ewyllys da tuag ati.

Regardless of individuals' views on the report, it remains a comprehensive document that includes positive messages. It is essential to all those who are seriously concerned about the future of the Welsh language and who wish to see it prosper. I am pleased to acknowledge that the report reflects consensus on, and goodwill towards, the Welsh language.

Mae'r ddogfen yn crynhoi sefyllfa a statws y Gymraeg ar ddechrau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, gan nodi ei chryfderau a'i gwendidau. Fodd bynnag, aiff ymhellach na hynny. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylid sefydlu strategaeth gyfannol i fonitro datblygiadau er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant a

The document summarises the situation and status of the Welsh language at the beginning of the twenty-first century, and notes its strengths and weaknesses. However, it goes further than that. The report recommends that an integrated strategy be established to monitor developments, thus ensuring success

chynnydd ieithyddol. Ym myd addysg a hyfforddiant, rhagwelir strategaeth genedlaethol gydlynol yn seiliedig ar gydddealltwriaeth o gyfrifoldebau ac atebolrwydd mudiadau a sefydliadau perthnasol, nad yw'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd. Ni allaf orbwysleisio pwysigrwydd hynny.

Mae dyhead ac ewylllys gref i sicrhau twf, sy'n argoeli'n dda i ddyfodol yr iaith. Yr her i'r Llywodraeth fydd cynnal y momentwm a'r consensws bod yn rhaid gwella sefyllfa'r Gymraeg. Bydd rhaid ymateb ar fyrder i'r colli tir ieithyddol sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd ar wahanol lefelau ym myd addysg. Cynhwysir hyn oll yn yr adroddiad. Mae pryder bod y gyfundrefn—nid ein hathrawon—yn siomi'n disgyblion ac yn achosi iddynt dangyflawni. Credaf y gellir newid pethau er gwell yn fuan os mabwysiadir a mewnlir yr argymhellion hyn.

Cyflawnwyd llawer o waith ardderchog mewn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog dros y blynyddoedd. Mae hynny er diolch a chlod i unigolion, rhieni, mudiadau ac awdurdodau sydd wedi ymgyrchu'n ddi-baid dros addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Serch hynny, digwyddodd y tyfiant hyd yn hyn mewn modd ad hoc. Mae cyfle'n awr i'r Cynulliad ysgwyddo'r baich drwy arweiniad ysbrydoledig a chyfarwyddyd strategol effeithiol. Dylai'r prif sefydliadau ym maes addysg a hyfforddiant chwarae rhan i gyflawni'r nod o Gymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Rhaid cael diwedd ar siarad gwag; mae'n amser i weithredu, fel y nododd Rhodri Glyn Thomas eisoes.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys dros 30 o argymhellion yn ymwneud ag addysg a hyfforddiant, a nododd y Pwyllgor chwe argymhelliad allweddol: yr angen am gydlunu a chynllunio strategol gwell ar gyfer addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog; yr angen am fframwaith cenedlaethol i hwyluso cynllunio strategol a gwerthuso addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog; yr angen i gydnabod rôl hanfodol addysgu trochi Cymraeg yn ystod y blynyddoedd cynnar, a gwaith pwysig y Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin; pwysigrwydd cysondeb drwy sectorau

and language growth. In terms of education and training, we foresee a co-ordinated national strategy based on a mutual understanding of the responsibilities and accountabilities of relevant organisations and institutions, which does not currently exist. I cannot overemphasise the importance of that.

There is a strong determination to ensure growth, which augurs well for the future of the Welsh language. The challenge facing the Government will be to maintain the momentum and uphold the consensus that the Welsh language must be strengthened. The current contraction of the Welsh language at different levels within the education system must be addressed posthaste. This is all included in the report. There is concern that our pupils are being let down by the system—rather than our teachers—and that that results in underachievement. I am convinced that improvements could rapidly be made if these recommendations were adopted and implemented.

Much excellent work has been done over the years in Welsh-medium and bilingual education. That is thanks to, and to the credit of, individuals, parents, organisations and authorities that have campaigned tirelessly for Welsh-medium education. However, the growth has so far occurred on an ad hoc basis. There is an opportunity now for the Assembly to take responsibility by providing inspired leadership and effective strategic guidance. The main education and training establishments should contribute to the achievement of the aim of a truly bilingual Wales. There must be no more tokenism; it is time to take action, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas has already noted.

The report includes over 30 recommendations involving education and training, and the Committee noted six key recommendations: the need for coherence and better strategic planning for Welsh-medium and bilingual education; the need for a national framework to facilitate strategic planning and the evaluation of Welsh-medium and bilingual education; the need to acknowledge the crucial role of Welsh-language immersion teaching during the early years, and the important work of Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin; the importance of

addysg a hyfforddi amrywiol o'r feithrinfa i brifysgol, a'r angen am set o feini prawf cytûn ar gyfer asesu lefelau cyfredol o gysondeb; yr angen am ymchwil i ddichonolrwydd mesur gallu disgyblion yn y Gymraeg ynghyd â chontinwmm ieithyddol; ac yn allweddol, hawl disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig i gael mynediad i adnoddau er mwyn diwallu eu hanghenion, boed hynny yn y Gymraeg neu yn Saesneg.

Ar ran y Pwyllgor, hoffwn ddiolch i'r tystion, yn enwedig y disgyblion ysgol a roddodd dystiolaeth werthfawr. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r ymgynghorydd arbenigol, Catrin Redknapp, am ei gwaith rhagorol yn cloriannu'r dystiolaeth ac am ei harweiniad a'i chyngor gwerthfawr i'r aelodau. Rhoddaf ddiolch arbennig i swyddogion yr ysgrifenyddiaeth, sef Chris Reading, Holly Pembridge a Gareth Woodhead, am eu gwasanaeth proffesiynol a dibynadwy. Gweithiodd y swyddogion yn galed, yn aml dan bwysau amser anhygoel, tra'n ymateb i amserlen dynn. Diolchaf yn ddiffuant i gyn-Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor, Cynog Dafis, am osod sylfeini cadarn i waith y Pwyllgor ac am iddo sicrhau y cafodd unigolion a sefydliadau allweddol gyfle i gyflwyno tystiolaeth, a sicrhodd y byddai'r adroddiad terfynol yn gytbwys ac yn llawn gwybodaeth werthfawr; fe hwylusodd hynny fy ngwaith i'n ddirfawr. Yn olaf, diolchaf i holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog, am eu cydweithrediad parod a'u cyfraniadau adeiladol a chreadigol. Fodd bynnag, diolchaf iddynt yn bennaf am iddynt bwysleisio'r positif bob amser, am iddynt anelu at gydsynio a chonsensws, ac am iddynt ddangos yr aeddfedrwydd gwleidyddol a grybwyllodd Rhodri Glyn. Mae'r agwedd greadigol honno yn nodweddu'r adroddiad hollbwysig hwn ar yr iaith Gymraeg.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Gareth and Rhodri Glyn have covered most of the important proposals set out in the report in detail. I have learnt a great deal about the Welsh language during the past year, especially how it is taught in schools and spoken in families. It has been quite enlightening. I have benefited in many ways from that learning curve. As a member of both the Culture Committee and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee I have had a double whammy dose of the

consistency through various education and training sectors from nursery to university education, and the need for an agreed set of criteria for assessing current levels of continuity; the need for research into the feasibility of measuring pupils' competence in Welsh along with a language continuum; and, critically, the right of pupils with special needs to have access to resources to meet their needs in Welsh or in English.

On behalf of the Committee, I would like to thank the witnesses, especially the school pupils who gave invaluable guidance. I also thank the special adviser, Catrin Redknapp, for her excellent work in taking stock of the evidence and for her valuable leadership and advice to members. I especially thank the secretariat, namely Chris Reading, Holly Pembridge and Gareth Woodhead, for their professional and reliable service. They worked hard, often under extreme time constraints, while responding to a tight schedule. I sincerely thank the former Chair of the Committee, Cynog Dafis, for establishing firm foundations for the Committee's work and for ensuring that the key individuals and organisations were given the opportunity to give evidence, which ensured that the final report would be balanced and full of valuable information; that made my work much easier. Finally, I thank each Committee member, including the Minister, for their willing co-operation and their constructive and creative contributions. However, I thank them mainly for always emphasising the positive, for aiming for agreement and consensus and for displaying the political maturity that Rhodri Glyn mentioned. That creative attitude characterises this vital report on the Welsh language.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae Gareth a Rhodri Glyn wedi ymdrin yn fanwl â'r rhan fwyaf o'r cynigion pwysig a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad. Dysgais lawer iawn am yr iaith Gymraeg yn ystod y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, yn enwedig am y modd y caiff ei dysgu mewn ysgolion a'i siarad mewn teuluoedd. Bu'n eithaf addysgiadol. Yr wyf wedi elwa mewn sawl ffordd o'r addysg honno. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wyf wedi cael

Welsh language review and it seems to have taken up most of my time during the past year. I have tried to steer a course between the single issue Welsh language pressure groups and the majority of people in Wales who do not speak the language but most of whom have some degree of good will towards it and agree with the steps that need to be taken to ensure its viability. This issue is about priorities. We all resisted one particular group's call for £100 million to be spent on protecting and developing the language. It was important that we agreed on a set of recommendations that would be acceptable to the vast majority of people in Wales, whatever language they spoke, in what is a multicultural society.

Apart from a few notable occasions, the memory of which will fade in years to come like that of the pain of childbirth, we worked hard together as a Committee, particularly on the Culture Committee, which dealt with most of the work. That is where we experienced the most pressure. We worked well and took evidence from a wide variety of representatives from all over Wales. The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and the Culture Committee travelled to most corners of the country to take that evidence. We then came together to discuss all the issues involved. It was one of the most pressured and difficult issues that I have had to deal with because of the emotions attached to the language issue. We came through the experience and I am proud that I was part of the work that led to the production of the report before us today. I hope that everyone takes time over the summer recess to read it. We will discuss the issue again in the future when the Minister returns. Whether we need a two-hour debate is questionable, Rhodri Glyn, but that is a decision for the business managers.

The Welsh language is a vital and unique part of the cultural heritage in Wales and is the main factor that makes us different from other UK countries. Although some members did not agree with every suggestion that was put before the Committee, they should not be seen as being anti-Welsh. It was a shame that some sections introduced that argument in the deliberations. I want to try to be positive and

dos ddwbl o adolygiad yr iaith Gymraeg ac mae'n teimlo iddo gymryd y rhan fwyaf o'm hamser yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr wyf wedi ceisio dilyn llwybr rhwng y grwpiau gwasgu un pwnc a'r mwyafrif yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn siarad yr iaith ond y mae y rhan fwyaf ohonynt â rhyw radd o ewyllys da tuag ati ac yn cytuno â'r camau y mae angen eu cymryd i sicrhau y gall fyw. Mater o flaenoriaethau yw hyn. Gwnaeth pawb ohonom wrthsefyll galwad un grŵp arbennig am i £100 miliwn gael ei wario ar warchod a datblygu'r iaith. Yr oedd yn bwysig ein bod yn gytûn ar set o argymhellion a fyddai'n dderbyniol gan y mwyafrif llethol o bobl yng Nghymru, pa bynnag iaith a siaradent, mewn cymdeithas sydd yn un aml-ddiwylliant.

Ar wahân i ambell achlysur nodedig, y bydd y cof amdanynt yn pylu mewn blynyddoedd a ddaw fel cof poen esgor plentyn, bu inni gydweithio'n galed fel Pwyllgor, yn enwedig ar y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, a ddeliodd â'r rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith. Dyna lle y profasom y pwysau mwyaf. Bu inni weithio'n dda a derbyn tystiolaeth gan amrywiaeth eang o gynrychiolwyr o Gymru benbaladr. Teithiodd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant i bron bob cornel o'r wlad i dderbyn y dystiolaeth honno. Wedyn daethom at ein gilydd i drafod yr holl faterion dan sylw. Yr oedd yn un o'r materion anoddaf a mwyaf pwysfawr y bu raid imi ddelio ag ef erioed oherwydd yr emosiynau sydd ynghlwm wrth gwestiwn yr iaith. Daethom drwy'r profiad ac yr wyf yn falch imi fod yn rhan o'r gwaith a arweiniodd at gynhyrchu'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff pawb gymryd amser dros doriad yr haf i'w ddarllen. Trafodwn y mater eto yn y dyfodol pan ddaw'r Gweinidog yn ôl. Mae'n gwestiwn a oes angen dadl ddwy awr, Rhodri Glyn, ond penderfyniad i'r trefnwyr yw hwnnw.

Mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn rhan hanfodol ac unigryw o dreftadaeth ddiwylliannol Cymru a dyma'r prif ffactor sy'n ein gwneud yn wahanol i wledydd eraill y DU. Er nad oedd rhai aelodau'n cytuno â phob awgrym a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor, ni ddylid meddwl eu bod yn wrth-Gymraeg. Trueni bod rhai carfanau wedi dod â'r ddadl honno i mewn i'r trafodaethau. Mae arnaf eisiau ceisio bod yn



take this issue forward.

gadarnhaol a mynd â'r mater hwn yn ei flaen.

3:30 p.m.

This report is just the beginning. The Assembly is only three years old. I believe that this is the first time that the Welsh language issue has had such an airing and that everyone has been able to express their views and thoughts about how the Welsh language affects them. As I said earlier, the review has opened my eyes with regard to the language. My view on the language has changed since taking part in this review. I want us to move forward with the report, which is a living document that we can use in all aspects of Assembly work. We should consider it calmly and reasonably and not let such an emotional issue divide us. I welcome the report and am proud to have played my part in its development.

**Glyn Davies:** I joined the Culture Committee during its long review of the Welsh language, which has led to today's launch of the report. At my first meeting, I realised that I did not totally agree with the status being given to the Committee's review. There was much talk of it being a unique opportunity and the last chance to save the Welsh language. I consider the review to be an important exercise, but, for me, it is only a part an ongoing process by which the National Assembly carries out its responsibility to protect and promote the Welsh language and to ensure its survival as a living, spoken language. It is a good report, to which all four parties contributed, but I disagree with some of its words. The recommendation about second homes is absurd and unworkable.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad yn un da yn gyffredinol gan ei fod yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cadw ewyllys da pawb yng Nghymru tuag at yr iaith Gymraeg. Nid yw'n ceisio creu drwgdeimlad rhwng Cymry Cymraeg a Chymry di-Gymraeg.

That principle underpins Conservative policy and will continue to do so. I have many specific points to make. First, the most important recommendation in the report is that the Welsh language should become a cross-cutting issue within the National

Dechreuad yn unig yw'r adroddiad hwn. Dim ond tair blwydd oed yw'r Cynulliad. Credaf mai dyma'r tro cyntaf i gwestiwn yr iaith gael ei wyntyllu mor drwyadl ac i bawb gael cyfle i fynegi eu sylwadau a'u syniadau ynghylch sut y mae'r Gymraeg yn effeithio arnynt hwy. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r adolygiad wedi agor fy llygaid i ynglŷn â'r iaith. Newidiodd fy marn am yr iaith ers cymryd rhan yn yr adolygiad hwn. Mae arnaf eisiau inni symud ymlaen gyda'r adroddiad, sydd yn ddogfen fyw y gallwn ei defnyddio ym mhob agwedd ar waith y Cynulliad. Dylem ei hystyried yn bwylllog a rhesymol a pheidio â gadael i fater mor emosiynol ein rhannu. Croesawaf yr adroddiad ac yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi chwarae fy rhan yn ei ddatblygiad.

**Glyn Davies:** Ymunais i â'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant yn ystod ei adolygiad maith o'r Gymraeg, a arweiniodd at lansio'r adroddiad heddiw. Yn fy nghyfarfod cyntaf, sylweddolais nad oeddwn yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r statws a roddid i adolygiad y Pwyllgor. Yr oedd llawer o sôn amdano fel cyfle unigryw a'r cyfle olaf i achub y Gymraeg. Yr wyf o'r farn fod yr adolygiad yn ymarfer pwysig, ond i mi, dim ond rhan ydyw o broses barhaus lle cyflawna'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei gyfrifoldeb i warchod a hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ac i sicrhau ei dyfodol fel iaith fyw, lafar. Mae'n adroddiad da, gyda chyfraniadau gan bob un o'r pedair plaid, ond anghytunaf â rhai o'i eiriau. Mae'r argymhelliad ynghylch ail gartrefi'n hurt ac yn anymarferol.

However, it is a good report in general because it recognises the importance of retaining the goodwill of all people in Wales towards the Welsh language. It does not seek to drive a wedge between Welsh speakers and those who do not speak the language.

Mae'r egwyddor honno'n waelodol i bolisi'r Ceidwadwyr a bydd yn parhau felly. Mae gennyf sawl pwynt penodol i'w gwneud. Yn gyntaf, yr argymhelliad pwysicaf yn yr adroddiad yw y dylid gwneud y Gymraeg yn fater trawsbynciol o fewn y Cynulliad

Assembly and that every Committee and Minister should take into account the effect of the policies that they adopt on the Welsh language. That crucial recommendation is empty words unless an effective procedure is established to ensure its delivery. If the Culture Committee is going to make a real difference, Committee Chairs and Ministers should appear before the Committee once a year to discuss the effect of their policies on the Welsh language.

Secondly, the ability of young people in rural Wales to acquire housing in their own locality must be faced and addressed with sensible and practical measures. I have already expressed my opposition to the recommendation to introduce a separate use class for second homes. That is a political gimmick and is unworkable. If the Government's response is foolish enough to bring forward a proposal endorsing such a scheme, we will oppose it.

Y mae'n gimig gwleidyddol, nid yw'n bosibl ei weithredu ac mae'n niweidiol i'r adroddiad cyfan.

The housing issue must be addressed by the Local Government and Housing Committee—

**Delyth Evans:** The Committee recommended that we ask the Minister to consider this issue along with other measures to help people to find affordable homes in their communities. Do you agree that it is important that the Assembly supports local planning authorities in their attempts to provide local affordable housing to people in their communities?

**Glyn Davies:** I do. However, in order to achieve that, it is absurd to recommend an unworkable idea that is nothing more than a political gimmick. Nothing damages the stability of communities in Wales more than the rules adopted by registered social landlords for letting houses. There should be much more emphasis on a policy of social housing for local people.

The most dangerous threat to the Welsh language is the feeling, in much of Wales,

Cenedlaethol ac y dylai pob Pwyllgor a Gweinidog ystyried effaith y polisïau a fabwysiadant ar yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae'r argymhelliad hollbwysig hwnnw'n eiriau gwag os na sefydlir trefn effeithiol i sicrhau y'i gweithredu. Os yw'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant i wneud gwir wahaniaeth, dylai Cadeiryddion a Gweinidogion Pwyllgorau ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor unwaith y flwyddyn i drafod effaith eu polisïau ar yr iaith Gymraeg.

Yn ail, rhaid i allu pobl ifanc yng nghefn gwlad Cymru i brynu tai yn eu broydd eu hunain gael ei wynebu a rhaid cael camau synhwyrol ac ymarferol i ddelfio â'r mater. Yr wyf eisoes wedi mynegi fy ngwrthwynebiad i'r argymhelliad i gyflwyno dosbarth defnydd ar wahân ar gyfer ail gartrefi. Gimig gwleidyddol yw hwnnw ac ni ellir ei weithredu. Os bydd ymateb y Llywodraeth yn ddigon ffôl i gyflwyno cynnig yn ategu cynllun o'r fath, byddwn yn ei wrthwynebu.

It is a political gimmick, it is unworkable and it damages the report as a whole.

Rhaid i gwestiwn tai gael ei drafod gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai—

**Delyth Evans:** Argymhellodd y Pwyllgor ein bod yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried y mater hwn ynghyd â mesurau eraill i helpu pobl i gael cartrefi y gallant eu fforddio yn eu cymunedau. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad gefnogi ymdrechion awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i ddarparu tai lleol y gellir eu fforddio i bobl yn eu cymunedau?

**Glyn Davies:** Cytunaf. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn sicrhau hynny, gwiriondeb yw argymhell syniad amhosibl ei weithredu nad yw'n ddim mwy na gimig gwleidyddol. Nid oes dim yn niweidio sefydlogrwydd cymunedau yng Nghymru yn fwy na'r rheolau a fabwysiadwyd gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ar gyfer gosod tai. Dylai fod llawer mwy o bwyslais ar bolisi o dai cymdeithasol i bobl leol.

Y bygythiad mwyaf peryglus i'r iaith Gymraeg yw'r teimlad, mewn rhan helaeth o

that Welsh is forced upon people. The sheer crassness of the contributions to the language debate last summer fuelled that feeling, and resentment still festers. At the proclamation of the 2003 national eisteddfod in Welshpool last week, I listened to a speech by Robyn Léwis, the National Eisteddfod of Wales's new archdruid. I did not understand all of his speech, but there was talk of the language being forced upon people. I do not think that it was particularly negative, but there was such talk. I understand why people who truly love the language feel so strongly, but words like 'force' are misguided, and do more damage than good.

I love the language too, and will do all that I can to support it. We want support from everybody in Wales. Words like 'encouragement' and 'persuasion' engender success, as well as Welsh speakers' willingness to share their precious gift. As a child, I remember reading a fable about an argument between the sun and the wind over which was the more powerful, and which could make a man remove his overcoat. Others may remember it. The sun succeeds in persuading the man to shed his overcoat using warmth, while the wind uses force, which leads only to a greater determination to resist. Our job is to ensure that the sun shines on the Welsh language. This is a good report: a small step on a long and difficult journey to a bilingual Wales. I support it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Eleanor Burnham to speak.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Y mae'n ddrwg gennyf; nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli fy mod i fod i siarad. Hoffwn gefnogi'r adroddiad. Mae'n bwysig ein bod oll, drwy'r Cynulliad, yn cael y cyfle i ystyried mater—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You said that you did not realise that you were meant to speak, but your name is on my list. If you do not intend to speak, I will call somebody else. Many Members wish to make contributions.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I apologise, it was a misunderstanding. May I continue speaking?

Gymru, fod y Gymraeg yn cael ei gorfodi ar bobl. Ychwanegwyd at y teimlad hwnnw gan dwpdra rhonc y cyfraniadau at y ddadl iaith yr haf diwethaf, ac mae'r drwgdeimlad yn dal i gorddi. Yng ngŵyl gyhoeddi eisteddfod genedlaethol 2003 yn y Trallwng yr wythnos diwethaf, gwrandewais ar araith gan Robyn Léwis, Archdderwydd newydd Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru. Ni ddeellais y cyfan o'i anerchiad, ond yr oedd sôn am orfodi'r iaith ar bobl. Nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod yn arbennig o negyddol, ond fe fu siarad o'r fath. Deallaf pam y mae pobl sy'n gwirioneddol garu'r iaith yn teimlo mor gryf, ond mae geiriau fel 'gorfodi' yn annoeth, a gwnânt fwy o ddrwg nag o les.

Yr wyf innau'n caru'r iaith, a gwnaf bopeth a allaf i'w chefnogi. Mae arnom eisiau cefnogaeth gan bawb yng Nghymru. Bydd geiriau fel 'anogaeth' a 'pherswâd' yn meithrin llwyddiant, ynghyd â pharodrwydd y Cymry Cymraeg i rannu'r rhodd gwerthfawr hwn. Yn blentyn, cofiaf ddarllen chwedl am ddadl rhwng yr haul a'r gwynt ynghylch pa un oedd y cryfaf, a pha un a allai wneud i ddyn dynnu ei gôt fawr. Efallai fod eraill yn ei chofio. Mae'r haul yn llwyddo i berswadio'r dyn i ddiosg ei gôt drwy ddefnyddio gwres, tra bod y gwynt yn defnyddio nerth, nad yw ond yn creu mwy o benderfyniad i wrthsefyll. Ein gwaith ni yw sicrhau bod yr haul yn gwenu ar y Gymraeg. Adroddiad da yw hwn: cam bach ar daith hir ac anodd tuag at Gymru ddwyieithog. Yr wyf yn ei gefnogi.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar Eleanor Burnham i siarad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I apologise; I did not realise that I was meant to speak. I support the report. It is important that we all have the chance, throughout the Assembly, to consider the matter of—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dywedasochnad oeddech yn sylweddoli eich bod i fod i siarad, ond mae eich enw ar fy rhestr. Os nad ydych yn bwriadu siarad, galwaf ar rywun arall. Mae sawl Aelod yn dymuno cyfrannu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ymddiheuraf, camddealltwriaeth ydoedd. A gaf barhau i

siarad?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You may.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cewch.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfle i siarad. Mae'n hanfodol inni gael adroddiad a gafodd gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n ddiwrnod hanesyddol, a chefnogaf y cynnig hwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am grateful for the opportunity to speak. It is essential that the report receives cross-party support in the Assembly. It is an historic day, and I support this motion.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi rhoi cyfle inni greu strategaeth genedlaethol i'r iaith, un a all helpu unioni'r cam a wnaed gan ddeddfau a pholisïau'r gorffennol. Yr oedd y polisïau a danseiliodd y Gymraeg yn difrio pob amrywiaeth diwylliannol, a chânt eu crisialu yn yr agwedd o 'un deyrnas, un grefydd, un iaith'.

**Owen John Thomas:** The Assembly has given us the chance to create a national strategy for the language, one that can help remedy the inequities of past legislation and policies. The policies that undermined the Welsh language decried all cultural diversity, and are encapsulated in the attitude of 'one kingdom, one religion, one language'.

Y mae'n wyrth ac yn achos dathlu ein bod yn nodi adroddiad heddiw sy'n ystyried sut i gryfhau'r iaith a chreu Cymru wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Tynnaf eich sylw yn benodol at lond dwrn yn unig o'r 70 o argymhellion yn adroddiad yr adolygiad iaith.

It is a miracle and a cause for celebration that we are today noting a report that examines how to strengthen the language and create a truly bilingual Wales. I draw your attention specifically to only a handful of the 70 recommendations in the language review report.

Y mae'n iawn bod yr adroddiad yn nodi'r angen am gynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg fel prif amcan. Yn wir, mae twf ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg dros yr hanner canrif diwethaf, mewn ardaloedd Saesneg eu hiaith yn nwyrain Cymru, wedi dangos ei bod yn bosibl cynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n siarad Cymraeg yn effeithiol, o'r gwaelod i fyny.

It is right that the report notes the need to increase the number of Welsh speakers as a main aim. Indeed, the growth of Welsh-medium schools over the last half-century, in English-language areas in east Wales, has shown that it is possible to increase the number of Welsh speakers effectively, from the bottom up.

Ond—ac mae'n 'ond' pwysig—caiff y datblygiad ei lesteirio gan ddiffyg cynllunio rhagweithiol gan awdurdodau lleol, a diffyg strategaeth genedlaethol i gydlynu'r cyfan. Fodd bynnag, byddai gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad yn cywiro'r sefyllfa, gan agor y ffordd i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg dyfu o fewn cymunedau lleol, mewn ymateb i ofynion rhieni.

But—and it is an important 'but'—that development is hampered by local authorities' inability to plan proactively, and the absence of a co-ordinating national strategy. However, acting on the report's recommendations would remedy the situation, leading the way for Welsh-medium education to grow in local communities, in response to parents' demands.

Yr hyn a rydd hwb a hyder i iaith plentyn yw cyswllt cynnar a chyson. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod y fantais o gyflwyno'r Gymraeg i blant mor gynnar â phosibl, ac yn argymhell hybu datblygiad darpariaeth cyfrwng-Cymraeg o fewn canolfannau gofal plant. Mae hefyd yn argymhell ehangu'r dull dysgu trochi ar y lefel feithrin ac yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gwaith Mudiad Ysgolion

Early and constant contact with a language boosts children's linguistic confidence. The report acknowledges the benefits of introducing Welsh to children as soon as possible, and recommends encouraging the development of Welsh-medium provision within childcare centres. It also recommends extending the immersion learning technique at nursery level and recognises the

Meithrin.

importance of Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin's work.

3:40 p.m.

Nod un awgrym cyffrous yw ysgogi oedolion i ddysgu'r iaith ar y cyd â'u plant. Mae'r adroddiad am weld mentrau iaith yn cydweithio â Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin er mwyn hyrwyddo'r amcan hwn. Gan fod mwyafrif plant y Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin yn dod o gartrefi di-Gymraeg, mae perygl y bydd y Gymraeg yn cael ei chyfyngu i'r ysgol. Felly, mae hybu defnydd o'r iaith yn argymhelliad canolog wrth ymwneud â chynlluniau ieithyddol. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn i'r argymhelliad hwn fod yn effeithiol, mae'n hollbwysig i bob ysgol Gymraeg gael ei lleoli o fewn y gymuned y mae'n ei gwasanaethu. Nid yw hyn yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd mewn sawl ardal o'r brifddinas, er enghraifft, ond byddai'n haws i ysgol leol drefnu gweithgareddau ar ôl oriau ysgol, ac i blant a rhieni gymdeithasu yn Gymraeg yn y gymuned. Mae'n hanfodol bod y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, ynghyd â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, yn sicrhau bod cynlluniau addysg Gymraeg yr awdurdodau lleol yn anelu at greu ysgolion Cymraeg o fewn cymunedau'r disgyblion. Er bod cyfeiriad at hyn yn yr adroddiad, carwn sicrhwydd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r agwedd gymunedol mewn darpariaeth addysg.

One exciting suggestion is to encourage adults to learn the language along with their children. The report wants to see mentrau iaith working with Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin to promote this objective. As the majority of Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin children come from non Welsh-speaking homes, there is a danger that Welsh will be confined to school. Therefore, promoting the use of the language is a key recommendation when dealing with language schemes. However, in order for this recommendation to be effective, every Welsh-medium school must be located within the community it serves. This is not currently the case in many areas of the capital city, for example, but it would be easier for a local school to arrange after-school activities, and for children and parents to socialise in Welsh in the community. The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, along with the Welsh Language Board, must ensure that local authority schemes for Welsh-medium education aim to create Welsh-medium schools in the pupils' communities. Although the report refers to this, I want an assurance that the Government will give priority to the community aspect of education provision.

Mae llwyddiant Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd, a gynhaliwyd yn ddiweddar yng Nghaerdydd, a Pharti Ponty y fenter iaith leol, yn brawf o'r potensial economaidd a diwylliannol o gynnal digwyddiadau cyson sydd yn creu cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r iaith. Oherwydd cylch gorchwyl yr adolygiad, ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant y cyd-destun economaidd, gan gynnwys polisiau tai a chynllunio, a chafwyd trafodaethau eang ar y materion hyn.

The success of the Urdd National Eisteddfod held recently in Cardiff, and the local menter iaith's Parti Ponty, are testament to the economic and cultural potential of holding regular events that create opportunities to use the language. The report's remit led the Culture Committee to consider the economic context, including housing and planning policies, and we discussed these issues widely.

Fodd bynnag, y nod a ddaeth i'r amlwg dro ar ôl tro, ac efallai prif thema'r adroddiad, yw'r angen i ddatblygu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Mae datblygu economaidd yn golygu, er enghraifft, greu canolfannau economaidd rhanbarthol, sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd swyddi o fewn pellter teithio rhesymol—gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd sylw o hyn.

However, the need to develop sustainable communities was a recurring topic, and perhaps the report's main theme. Economic development means, for example, the creation of regional economic centres that offer job opportunities within reasonable travelling distance—I hope that the Government will pay attention to this. It also

Mae hefyd yn golygu hwyluso mynediad i'r farchnad dai i bobl leol, ac mai awdurdodau lleol, yn ogystal â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb am hyn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. It is time to wind up.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae'n bwysig inni anelu at ddatblygu cymunedau cynaliadwy ledled Cymru, nid yn unig yn yr ardaloedd Cymraeg eu hiaith.

Cafwyd llawer o gytundeb rhwng aelodau'r Pwyllgor oherwydd, drwy ganolbwyntio ar faterion fel tai fforddiadwy a chynllunio economaidd rhanbarthol, yr oeddem yn trafod pynciau sydd yn uno'n cymunedau—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must limit the remainder of your speech to two sentences.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr oedd y drafodaeth yn uno cymunedau ar draws y wlad, o Fethesda i Butetown, o Fôn i Fynwy.

Mae'r Gymraeg yn perthyn i bawb yng Nghymru, pa un ai ydynt yn ei siarad neu beidio, beth bynnag fo'u cefndir: mae'n rhan annatod o'n hetifeddiaeth genedlaethol, rhywbeth i'w thrysori a'i meithrin. Barn Plaid Cymru yw bod angen Deddf iaith newydd, ond yn y cyfamser, yr ydym yn fodlon gadael i gomisiwn yr Arglwydd Richard ystyried y mater.

Wrth gloi, gofynnaf am ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg y bydd dadl lawn yn y Siambr ar ei hymateb i'r adroddiad, ar y cyfle cyntaf yn ystod y tymor nesaf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Next time you must wind up when I ask you to.

**Peter Black:** I also welcome this report as an important contribution to the debate on the future of the Welsh language. As recently as a few years ago, the consensus of opinion was that that the Welsh language had been saved and that its future was secure. That

means making it easier for local people to enter the housing market, and this is the responsibility of local authorities as well as the National Assembly.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n bryd dirwyn i ben.

**Owen John Thomas:** It is important that we aim to develop sustainable communities across Wales, not just in Welsh-speaking areas.

There was much agreement among Committee members because, in focusing on matters such as affordable housing and regional economic planning, we were discussing subjects that unite our communities—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi gyfyngu gweddill eich araith i ddwy frawddeg.

**Owen John Thomas:** The discussion united communities across the country, from Bethesda to Butetown, from Anglesey to Monmouth.

The Welsh language belongs to everyone in Wales, whether they speak it or not, whatever their background: it is an integral part of our national heritage, something to treasure and nurture. Plaid Cymru believes that we need a new Welsh language Act, but in the meantime, we are happy to let Lord Richard's commission consider the issue.

To conclude, I ask the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language for a commitment that there will be a full debate in the Chamber on her response to the report, at the first opportunity during the next term.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Y tro nesaf rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben pan ofynnaf ichi wneud hynny.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf finnau'r adroddiad hwn fel cyfraniad pwysig i'r ddadl ar ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg. Mor ddiweddar ag ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, y consensws barn oedd fod y Gymraeg wedi'i hachub a bod ei dyfodol yn ddiogel. Mae'r consensws

consensus has now changed, and we must address specific issues in this report, and, no doubt, in the Government's response to it. However, if we are to make progress, we must address the tacit link between Welsh nationhood and the Welsh language.

The political settlement has changed significantly since devolution. Language and nationhood are two separate concepts; one is linked to a clearly defined geographical area, and the other facilitates communication between individuals. Language is not a national issue. Therefore, while we firmly believe that we should aim to achieve a bilingual Wales, our commitment to regional devolution means that different policies should be adopted in different parts of Wales. Although the review refers to Welsh-speaking heartlands, it falls short of defining them or implementing specific policies for those areas. We should not be afraid to pursue regional policies on the Welsh language and acknowledge and celebrate the breadth and depth of the diversity of Wales.

It is equally important that that is recognised in public policy. A cross-cutting approach is essential to secure effective action to protect and nurture the Welsh language. Establishing a cross-cutting unit would therefore be a welcome step and we must recognise, as the review does, that the survival of the Welsh language is, in many areas, not just about housing, education or the cohesiveness of communities but also about jobs and economic development. The sustainability of communities depends upon complex factors, but the availability of affordable homes and access to high quality employment are key issues.

The Welsh Assembly Government has set the pace in relation to housing with changes to the homebuy scheme. That scheme's success signals that we are serious about protecting Welsh-speaking and rural communities. It is worth noting in this context, and in the context of the report, that the current limit on the price of houses for which the scheme is applicable varies from area to area and is a matter for each local council. The scheme is being reviewed and, hopefully, it will be strengthened by that review and will be better

hwnnw bellach wedi newid, a rhaid inni roi sylw i faterion penodol yn yr adroddiad hwn, ac, mae'n siŵr, yn ymateb y Llywodraeth iddo. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am symud ymlaen, rhaid inni ymdrin â'r cysylltiad dealliedig rhwng cenedligrwydd Cymreig a'r iaith Gymraeg.

Mae'r cytundeb gwleidyddol wedi newid mewn modd arwyddocaol ers datganoli. Mae iaith a chenedl yn ddau gysyniad ar wahân; mae un yn gysylltiedig ag ardal ddaearyddol sydd wedi'i diffinio'n glir, ac mae'r llall yn gyfrwng cyfathrebu rhwng unigolion. Nid mater cenedlaethol yw iaith. Felly, tra credwn yn gadarn y dylem anelu at sicrhau Cymru ddwyieithog, golyga ein hymrwymiad i ddatganoli rhanbarthol y dylid mabwysiadu polisiau gwahanol mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Er y cyfeiria'r adolygiad at y Fro Gymraeg, nid aiff mor bell â'i diffinio na gweithredu polisiau penodol ar gyfer y broydd hynny. Ni ddylem ofni gweithredu polisiau rhanbarthol ar yr iaith Gymraeg a chydnabod a dathlu ehangder a dyfnder amrywiaeth Cymru.

Mae yr un mor bwysig cydnabod hynny mewn polisi cyhoeddus. Mae dull trawsbynciol yn hanfodol i sicrhau gweithredu effeithiol i warchod a meithrin y Gymraeg. Byddai sefydlu uned drawsbynciol yn gam i'w groesawu felly, a rhaid inni gydnabod, fel y gwna'r adolygiad, fod a wnelo goroesiad y Gymraeg, mewn llawer o ardaloedd, nid yn unig â thai, addysg neu gydlynid cymunedau ond hefyd â gwaith a datblygu economaidd. Mae cynaliadwyedd cymunedau'n dibynnu ar ffactorau cymhleth, ond mae sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy a chyfleoedd gwaith o ansawdd da ar gael yn faterion allweddol.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi arwain y ffordd mewn perthynas â thai gyda newidiadau i'r cynllun prynu cartref. Mae llwyddiant y cynllun hwnnw'n dangos ein bod o ddifrif ynghylch gwarchod cymunedau gwledig a Chymraeg. Mae'n werth nodi yn y cyd-destun hwn, ac yng nghyd-destun yr adroddiad, bod y terfyn cyfredol ar bris tai y mae'r cynllun yn berthnasol iddynt yn amrywio o ardal i ardal ac yn fater i bob cyngor lleol. Mae'r cynllun yn cael ei adolygu, a gobeithio y caiff ei gryfhau gan yr

targeted at problem areas.

Welsh Liberal Democrat policy is to pursue language action areas and we are naturally flattered that Plaid Cymru has sought to copy our policy. The seven pilot schemes that the Government will introduce in response to this review are a welcome step forward.

The Liberal Democrat/Labour Government has shown that it is serious about protecting and nurturing the Welsh language. We have done so because of our commitment to the language and the communities it sustains and forms an intricate part of. The Committee's report has an important role in taking forward our actions and I welcome it.

**David Davies:** Mae pawb yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig cefnogi'r iaith ac i'r iaith ddatblygu. Er hynny, mae hefyd yn bwysig meddwl am ffyrdd gwell o sicrhau hynny. Mae'n siom fawr nad yw'r Pwyllgor wedi achub ar y cyfle i wella safle'r Gymraeg yn ein hysgolion drwy ganiatáu plant 14 oed i ddewis a ydynt am barhau â'r Gymraeg. Mae dysgu Cymraeg yn orfodol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy, yn gwneud cam â'r iaith am sawl rheswm.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you agree that we have taken a commonsense approach in waiting for ACCAC's curriculum review on teaching Welsh to 14 to 16-year-olds? We did not want to single that out until we were able to consider the curriculum review.

**David Davies:** I appreciate that some of the suggestions being touted in newspapers prior to the report's publication would have done much more damage to the Welsh language, especially in areas such as Monmouthshire, but they were not implemented. However, I have been campaigning on this issue for several years now and it is right—because learning Welsh is still compulsory in areas such as Monmouthshire between the ages of 14 and 16—that I outline why it is not

adolygiad hwnnw ac y bydd wedi'i dargedu'n well at ardaloedd lle ceir problem.

Polisi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yw ceisio sefydlu ardaloedd gweithredu ieithyddol ac yn naturiol yr ydym wrth ein bodd fod Plaid Cymru wedi ceisio copïo ein polisi. Mae'r saith cynllun peilot y bydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cyflwyno mewn ymateb i'r adolygiad hwn yn gam ymlaen i'w groesawu.

Mae Llywodraeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/Llafur wedi dangos ei bod o ddifrif ynglŷn â diogelu a meithrin y Gymraeg. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny oherwydd ein hymrwymiad i'r iaith ac i'r cymunedau y mae'n eu cynnal ac yn ffurfio rhan annatod ohonynt. Mae gan adroddiad y Pwyllgor rôl bwysig o ran symud ein gweithredu ymlaen ac fe'i croesawaf.

**David Davies:** Everyone agrees that it is important to support the language and for the language to develop. However, it is also important to think of better ways of achieving that. It is a great disappointment that the Committee has not taken this opportunity to improve the standing of Welsh in our schools by allowing 14-year-old children to choose whether they want to continue studying Welsh. The compulsory teaching of Welsh, especially in areas like Monmouthshire, does an injustice to the language for several reasons.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A gytunwch ein bod wedi defnyddio synnwyr cyffredin wrth aros am adolygiad cwricwlwm ACCAC ar ddysgu'r Gymraeg i blant 14 i 16 mlwydd oed? Nid oedd arnom eisiau rhoi sylw penodol i hynny nes y byddem wedi gallu ystyried adolygiad y cwricwlwm.

**David Davies:** Sylweddolaf y byddai rhai o'r awgrymiadau a gafodd eu gwyntyllu yn y papurau newydd cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad wedi gwneud llawer mwy o ddrwg i'r Gymraeg, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy, ond ni chawsant eu gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi ymgyrchu ar y mater hwn ers sawl blwyddyn bellach ac mae'n iawn—oherwydd mae dysgu Cymraeg yn dal yn orfodol mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy rhwng 14 ac 16 mlwydd oed—fy mod



working.

Ar hyn o bryd nid oes digon o athrawon ond, lle mae ysgolion yn gallu cael hyd i athrawon, mae'n rhaid iddynt wastraffu eu hamser ar blant sydd heb unrhyw ddiddordeb yn yr iaith. Mae problemau yn y dosbarthiadau; nid yw'r mwyafrif am ddysgu'r iaith ac felly maent yn rhwystro'r lleill sydd yn awyddus i ddysgu'r iaith. Mae hi'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd Lorraine Barrett, annog agwedd gadarnhaol at yr iaith ond mae Cymraeg gorfodol yn troi disgyblion a'u rhieni yn ei herbyn. Os canolbwyntiwn ar bobl sydd eisiau dysgu'r Gymraeg, byddai hynny'n gwella safle'r iaith ledled Cymru. Cynnig dewis yw'r ateb. Gadewch i ni gynnig dewis yn ein hysgolion a gwella safle'r iaith.

3:50 p.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Bu ichi ganolbwyntio ar Sir Fynwy, David. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y byddai statws, bri a phwysigrwydd y Gymraeg yn dirywio pe na bai'n bwnc gorfodol ar draws Cymru yn y cyfnod hwn? Byddai'n ergyd ddifrifol i'r iaith.

**David Davies:** Cytunaf fod statws yr iaith yn wahanol ledled Cymru. Mewn ardaloedd fel Gwynedd, lle mae'r mwyafrif yn siarad yr iaith, byddai'n bosibl cael polisi ychydig yn wahanol i'r polisi mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Fynwy. Derbyniaf fod y sefyllfa yn wahanol ledled Cymru ac, o'r herwydd, gallwn gael polisiau ychydig yn wahanol ledled Cymru.

**John Griffiths:** I will continue the theme of what is applicable in different parts of Wales, depending on prevailing circumstances. In Newport, only 2 per cent of the population speaks Welsh. I suspect that much the same is true of Monmouthshire. One of the most important recommendations in the Committee's report is on the use of Welsh in communities and increasing the opportunities to use Welsh outside school. If bilingualism is to be taken forward effectively in areas such as Newport, those areas need greater support. Different circumstances prevail in such areas. However, rather than decreasing the amount of tuition, as David Davies

yn amlinellu pam nad yw'n gweithio.

At the moment there are not enough teachers but, where schools can find teachers, they have to waste their time on children who have no interest at all in the language. There are problems in the classrooms; the majority do not want to learn the language and therefore disrupt others who are keen to learn. It is important, as Lorraine Barrett said, to foster a positive attitude to the language but compulsory Welsh turns pupils and their teachers against it. Concentrating on those who want to learn Welsh would improve the standing of the language throughout Wales. Offering a choice is the answer. Let us offer a choice in our schools, and improve the standing of the language.

**Cynog Dafis:** You have concentrated on Monmouthshire, David. However, do you agree that, if the language ceased to be a compulsory subject across Wales at this time, its status, esteem and importance would diminish? It would be a serious blow to the language.

**David Davies:** I agree that the status of the language varies throughout Wales. In areas like Gwynedd, where the majority of people speak Welsh, it would be possible to have a slightly different policy from that in areas such as Monmouthshire. I accept that the situation is different throughout Wales and that, therefore, we could have slightly different policies throughout Wales.

**John Griffiths:** Parhaf â'r thema o beth sydd yn addas ar gyfer gwahanol rannau o Gymru, yn dibynnu ar yr amgylchiadau. Yng Nghasnewydd, dim ond 2 y cant o'r boblogaeth sy'n siarad Cymraeg. Yr wyf yn amau fod yr un peth yn wir am Sir Fynwy. Mae un o'r argymhellion pwysicaf yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn ymwneud â defnydd y Gymraeg mewn cymunedau a chynyddu'r cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg y tu allan i'r ysgol. Os am symud dwyieithrwydd ymlaen yn effeithiol mewn ardaloedd fel Casnewydd, mae angen mwy o gefnogaeth ar yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae'r amgylchiadau'n wahanol mewn ardaloedd o'r fath. Fodd

suggested, support and assistance should be increased to take account of the greater difficulties. Teachers who provide Welsh language tuition in English-medium schools in Newport are often only one step ahead of the children. The teachers go on short courses to enable them to teach Welsh, which is not ideal. However, because not many Welsh speakers live in the area, it is difficult to recruit such teachers. It is also more difficult to use Welsh in Newport, as less Welsh is spoken in the community.

Schoolchildren and adult learners in areas such as Newport need greater support and we should further consider developing an effective strategy to address those special difficulties. There is also a cultural element to this. Peter Black mentioned the difference between Wales as a nation and the Welsh language. However, language is central to culture. As Lorraine Barrett said, the Welsh language is vital and unique to Wales. It is pleasing to know that a consensus was achieved in the Committee. We need to build on that consensus in Wales. It has broken down in recent times and we need to return to political and civic consensus if possible.

The whole of Wales would benefit if the Welsh language were to become stronger in all of Wales. That would be better for cohesion, cultural identity and for people's sense of a place in the world, and it would also lead to a more united Wales. I received hardly any Welsh language tuition at school. We were taught the Welsh national anthem, and that was about it. Many people in Newport have told me that they feel robbed of their inheritance because they never had the opportunity to learn Welsh in school. They rightly believe that, as a result, they have missed out on a great deal in terms of language and culture.

An equality of opportunity agenda should be pursued in this regard. Areas such as Newport, which have smaller numbers of Welsh speakers, should be given special attention to enable bilingualism to be taken

bynnag, yn hytrach na chwrtogi ar yr hyfforddiant, fel yr awgrymodd David Davies, dylid cynnig mwy o gefnogaeth a chymorth i adlewyrchu'r anawsterau mwy. Yn aml, dim ond un cam ar y blaen i'r plant y mae'r athrawon sy'n dysgu Cymraeg mewn ysgolion Saesneg yng Nghasnewydd. Aiff yr athrawon ar gyrsiau byr i'w galluogi i ddysgu Cymraeg, sefyllfa nad yw'n ddelfrydol. Fodd bynnag, am nad oes llawer o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn byw yn yr ardal, mae'n anodd recriwtio athrawon o'r fath. Mae'n anoddach defnyddio'r Gymraeg yng Nghasnewydd hefyd, gan y siaredir llai o Gymraeg yn y gymuned.

Mae angen mwy o gefnogaeth ar blant ysgol ac oedolion sy'n dysgu Cymraeg mewn ardaloedd fel Casnewydd a dylem ystyried ymhellach ddatblygu strategaeth effeithiol i ddelio â'r anawsterau arbennig hynny. Mae elfen ddiwylliannol i hyn hefyd. Soniodd Peter Black am y gwahaniaeth rhwng Cymru fel cenedl a'r iaith Gymraeg. Er hynny, mae iaith yn ganolog i ddiwylliant. Fel y dywedodd Lorraine Barrett, mae'r Gymraeg yn hanfodol ac yn unigryw i Gymru. Mae'n dda gwybod y cafwyd consensws yn y Pwyllgor. Mae angen inni adeiladu ar y consensws hwnnw yng Nghymru. Mae wedi torri i lawr yn ddiweddar ac mae angen inni ailgyraedd consensws gwleidyddol a chymdeithasol os oes modd.

Byddai Cymru gyfan ar ei hennill pe deuai'r Gymraeg yn gryfach yng Nghymru gyfan. Byddai hynny'n well o ran cydlynid, hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol ac i synnwyr pobl o'u lle yn y byd, a byddai'n arwain at Gymru fwy unedig hefyd. Ni chefais i nemor ddim addysg Gymraeg yn yr ysgol. Dysgwyd yr anthem genedlaethol inni, a dyna'r cwbl. Mae llawer o bobl yng Nghasnewydd wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo i'w hetifeddiaeth gael ei dwyn oddi arnynt am na chawsant fyth y cyfle i ddysgu Cymraeg yn yr ysgol. Maent yn gywir i gredu eu bod, o ganlyniad, wedi colli allan ar lawer iawn yng nghydestun iaith a diwylliant.

Dylid dilyn agenda cyfle cyfartal yn hyn o beth. Dylid rhoi sylw arbennig i ardaloedd fel Casnewydd, lle mae niferoedd llai o siaradwyr Cymraeg, er mwyn galluogi datblygu dwyieithrwydd yn fwy effeithiol ar

forward more effectively across Wales, for the good of all of Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** First, I regret the fact that only one hour has been allocated for this historic debate. I am reluctant to break down the consensus and disagree with Lorraine Barrett, but one hour can hardly do justice to the work of two Committees over a year, let alone to one of the most positive and important issues that has come before the Assembly to date. When the Government's response is debated in the autumn, I hope that we will have two full hours to discuss it, to enable Members who were not part of the Committee process to contribute. 'Our Language: its future' deserves at least three hours of debate in the Assembly.

As others have said, this is a historic day. After a year of taking evidence and of engaging in at times fierce debate, two Assembly Committees have presented a plan for the future of our unique and precious language. The plan is visionary as well practical, challenging as well as deliverable, and optimistic as well as realistic. I thank all those who have been involved: the Chairs, fellow Committee members, staff, and above all, those who have given evidence. The process of producing this report has been an example of the Assembly working at its best, as Delyth Evans said in a reception earlier today. I am pleased to have had the opportunity to contribute in a small way to this process.

This report is the fruit of consensus and, inevitably, of compromise. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales group wanted some of the recommendations to go further. For example, we firmly believe that a new Welsh language Act is needed to give statutory protection to the rights of individuals to use Welsh and receive services through the medium of Welsh. The report stops short of calling for that. In the section on education, we would have liked stronger recommendations on, for example, the provision of Welsh-medium higher education, and sabbatical leave for teachers to enable them to train to teach through the medium of Welsh. That last point might have addressed some of John Griffiths's concerns. However, we, like

draws Cymru, er lles Cymru gyfan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn gyntaf, gresynaf mai dim ond awr sydd wedi'i chlustnodi ar gyfer y ddadl hanesyddol hon. Yr wyf yn gyndyn o dorri'r consensws ac anghytuno â Lorraine Barrett, ond prin y gall un awr wneud cyfiawnder â gwaith dau Bwyllgor dros flwyddyn, heb sôn am un o'r materion pwysicaf a mwyaf cadarnhaol i ddod gerbron y Cynulliad hyd yma. Pan drafodir ymateb y Llywodraeth yn yr hydref, gobeithiaf y cawn ddwy awr lawn i'w drafod, er mwyn galluogi Aelodau na fu'n rhan o broses y Pwyllgor i gyfrannu. Mae 'Ein Hiaith: ei dyfodol' yn haeddu o leiaf tair awr o ddadl yn y Cynulliad.

Fel y dywedodd eraill, mae hwn yn ddiwrnod hanesyddol. Wedi blwyddyn o gymryd tystiolaeth a dadlau ffyrnig ar adegau, mae dau o Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wedi cyflwyno cynllun ar gyfer dyfodol ein hiaith unigryw a gwerthfawr. Mae'r cynllun yn dangos gweledigaeth yn ogystal â bod yn ymarferol, yn gosod her yn ogystal â bod yn un y gellir ei gyflawni, ac yn optimistaidd yn ogystal â bod yn realistig. Diolchaf i bawb a fu wrthi: y Cadeiryddion, cyd-aelodau Pwyllgor, staff, ac yn anad dim, y rheini a roddodd dystiolaeth. Bu'r broses o lunio'r adroddiad hwn yn esiampl o waith y Cynulliad ar ei orau, fel y dywedodd Delyth Evans mewn derbyniad yn gynharach heddiw. Yr wyf yn falch o fod wedi cael y cyfle i gyfrannu mewn ffordd fach at y broses hon.

Ffrwyth consensws ac, yn anochel, cyfaddawd yw'r adroddiad hwn. Yr oedd ar grŵp Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales eisiau i rai o'r argymhellion fynd ymhellach. Er enghraifft, credwn yn gryf fod angen Deddf iaith newydd i roi warchod yn statudol hawliau unigolion i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg a derbyn gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Nid aiff yr adroddiad mor bell â galw am hynny. Yn yr adran ar addysg, buasem wedi hoffi argymhellion cryfach ar, er enghraifft, ddarpariaeth addysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a gwyliau sabothol i athrawon i'w hyfforddi i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Efallai y buasai'r pwynt olaf hwnnw wedi lleddfu rhai o bryderon John Griffiths. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym ni, fel

others, have been more than prepared to compromise on particulars to ensure the overall positive progress that has been achieved.

We welcome the recognition of the need for national, strategic planning to ensure the consistent, but regionally appropriate, development of Welsh-medium education, and the teaching of Welsh as a second language, at all levels and ages. We look forward to the Government of Wales welcoming the responsibility for taking a national lead and promoting language growth. We also look forward to a positive response to the recommendations on further education as, currently, only 2 per cent of provision is through the medium of Welsh. Everyone on the Committee agreed that that was a disgrace. That has to be rectified, especially since vocational training through the medium of Welsh could contribute to increasing the use of Welsh in the workplace and service delivery through the medium of Welsh.

If accepted, the report's recommendation that pupils and students with special educational needs should have the right for their needs to be met through the medium of Welsh—if that is their and their families' choice—is a historic breakthrough. It will be music to the ears of many parents who are struggling with these issues. I know that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning supports that. We now need delivery.

I hope that the Government of Wales accepts this report's recommendations, and I urge the Cabinet to accept them and to act on them. There will be resource implications, and these must be addressed. This report will, rightly, raise the expectations of Welsh speakers, Welsh-speaking communities and the friends and supporters of the language—that is, the majority of the people of Wales. They will expect action and radical change. To deliver that change, we must ensure, as others have already said, that the consensus that we have worked hard to build in the Assembly is strengthened and developed into a national consensus. To this end, it is vital that the Government of Wales takes steps to distance itself from the blatantly anti-Welsh

eraill, wedi bod yn fwy na pharod i gyfaddawdu ar fanylion er mwyn sicrhau'r symudiad ymlaen cyffredinol gadarnhaol a gafwyd.

Croesawn y ffaith y cydnabyddir yr angen am gynllunio strategol, cenedlaethol i sicrhau datblygiad cyson, ond rhanbarthol briodol, addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith, ar bob lefel ac oed. Edrychwn ymlaen am i Lywodraeth Cymru groesawu'r cyfrifoldeb dros roi arweiniad cenedlaethol a hyrwyddo twf yr iaith. Edrychwn ymlaen hefyd at ymateb cadarnhaol i'r argymhellion ar addysg bellach, gan mai dim ond 2 y cant o'r ddarpariaeth sydd drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Cytunodd pawb ar y Pwyllgor fod hynny'n warthus. Rhaid cywiro hynny, yn enwedig gan y gallai hyfforddiant galwedigaethol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg gyfrannu at gynyddu'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle a darparu gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Os y'i derbynnir, bydd argymhelliad yr adroddiad y dylai disgyblion a myfyrwyr ag anghenion addysgol arbennig gael yr hawl i gael eu hanghenion wedi'u bodloni drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg—os mai dyna'u dewis hwy a'u teuluoedd—yn gam hanesyddol. Bydd yn newyddion bendithiol i lawer o rieni sy'n ymdrechu gyda'r materion hyn. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn cefnogi hynny. Yn awr mae angen cyflawni.

Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru dderbyn argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn, ac anogaf y Cabinet i'w derbyn a gweithredu arnynt. Bydd goblygiadau o ran adnoddau, a rhaid rhoi sylw i'r rhain. Bydd yr adroddiad hwn, gyda rheswm da, yn codi disgwyliadau siaradwyr Cymraeg, cymunedau Cymraeg a chyfeillion a chefnogwyr yr iaith—hynny yw, y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru. Byddant yn disgwyl gweld gweithredu a newid radicalaidd. I weithredu'r newid hwnnw, rhaid inni sicrhau, fel y dywedodd eraill yn barod, y caiff y consensws yr ydym wedi gweithio'n galed i'w adeiladu yn y Cynulliad ei gryfhau a'i ddatblygu i fod yn gonsensws cenedlaethol. I'r perwyl hwn, mae'n hollbwysig fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn

language element within its parties. For example, Llew Smith MP's hysteria in response to the mild suggestion—

cymryd camau i ymbellhau oddi wrth yr elfen wrth-Gymraeg ddigywilydd o fewn ei phleidiau. Er enghraifft, yr oedd hysteria Llew Smith AS mewn ymateb i'r awgrym cymedrol—

**Pauline Jarman:** I refer you to recent comments by Chris Bryant, MP for Rhondda. He suggested that Welsh-medium education hinders the acquisition of modern foreign language skills and that, in promoting the development of Welsh-medium education, we may become a nation that is good at speaking to itself but not to the rest of the world.

**Pauline Jarman:** Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at sylwadau diweddar Chris Bryant, AS dros y Rhondda. Awgrymodd ef fod addysg Gymraeg yn llesteirio disgyblion rhag ennill sgiliau mewn ieithoedd tramor modern ac y gallem, wrth hyrwyddo datblygiad addysg Gymraeg, ddatblygu yn genedl sy'n dda am siarad â hi ei hun ond nid â gweddill y byd.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is supposed to be an intervention, Pauline.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hyn i fod, Pauline.

4:00 p.m.

**Pauline Jarman:** Do you agree that that not only sends out a damaging and misleading message, but also shows a remoteness of dinosaur proportions, not only in distance from Westminster, but from empathy with and understanding of a developing bilingual nation?

**Pauline Jarman:** Oni chytunwch fod hynny nid yn unig yn anfon neges niweidiol a charmarweiniol allan, ond ei fod hefyd yn dangos pellenigrwydd anferth, nid yn unig o ran pellter o San Steffan, ond o ran cydymdeimlad at a dealltwriaeth o genedl ddwyieithog sy'n datblygu?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I shall take that as my example, rather than the one that I proposed to use.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cymeraf hynny fel fy enghraifft, yn hytrach na'r un y bwriedais ei defnyddio.

**Rosemary Butler:** It is disappointing that people are quoting Members of Parliament of whatever party, who are not part of this body. I am concerned that what I thought was good consensus across all four parties here is beginning to drift into party politics. I resent that, because every party here, and particularly Members from south-east Wales, have worked hard on this document. I hope that we do not get any more petty party political points.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae'n siomedig fod pobl yn dyfynnu Aelodau Seneddol o ba plaid bynnag, nad ydynt yn rhan o'r corff hwn. Yr wyf yn bryderus fod yr hyn yr oeddwn wedi credu oedd yn gonsensws da ar draws y pedair plaid yma yn dechrau symud tuag at wleidyddiaeth plaid. Mae hynny'n fy nigio, oherwydd mae pob plaid yma, ac yn enwedig Aelodau o'r de-ddwyrain, wedi gweithio'n galed ar y ddogfen hon. Gobeithiaf na chawn fwy o sgorio pwyntiau pitw rhwng pleidiau gwleidyddol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The point that I sought to make, which you would have heard had I been able to finish it, was that it is important that the lack of understanding that such comments sometimes reflect is not allowed to break down the consensus and understanding that we have developed here—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud, y buasech wedi ei glywed pe bawn i wedi cael ei orffen, oedd ei bod yn bwysig nad ydym yn caniatáu i'r diffyg crebwyll y mae sylwadau o'r fath weithiau'n ei adlewyrchu chwalu'r consensws a'r gyd-ddealltwriaeth yr ydym wedi eu datblygu yma—

**Lorraine Barrett** *rose*—

**Helen Mary Jones:** I must finish, Lorraine; I understand what you were saying. We have developed a consensus here, and have gone a long way to addressing some of the fears and concerns of Welsh-speaking communities and Welsh speaking people. It is important that we turn that into a national consensus. We cannot do that while powerful figures outside the Assembly undermine that. We have taken incredibly important steps. I am not seeking to break down that consensus, but it must be based on honesty. I look forward to a positive response from the Government of Wales to this report, which I am sure we will have, and to continuing the positive work to develop a nation where both our traditional languages are respected, and where other languages are welcomed and are allowed to grow.

**Alun Pugh:** Globalisation offers many benefits. Open societies engaging in international trade in goods and services have the potential to offer benefits to us all. Today we engage in travel and trade patterns that were unimaginable to me growing up in the Rhondda in the 1960s. A weekend break spent in another member state of the European Union is not a mundane event, not least because of the jolt that you receive on hearing the multi-linguistic competence of our EU partners, but neither is it an unusual event. However, globalisation has its downsides. It can become a juggernaut, squashing out all cultural diversity. Linguistic diversity is being relentlessly ironed out all over the world by the global dominance of English and, to a lesser extent, Spanish, as international languages of trade and electronic communication.

I am sorry that Plaid Cymru has introduced a sour note and broken the consensus this afternoon. Simon Brooks and Seimon Glyn, and other senior Plaid figures, are right that there is a threat to the Welsh language. That threat fully justifies the Assembly's full consideration and a comprehensive policy response covering education, economic development and housing. However, their solution—an inwards-looking, spiteful, petty

**Lorraine Barrett** *a gododd*—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Rhaid imi orffen, Lorraine; yr wyf yn deall beth yr oeddech yn ei ddweud. Yr ydym wedi datblygu consensws yma, ac wedi gwneud llawer i leddfu rhai o ofnau a phryderon cymunedau Cymraeg a phobl Gymraeg eu hiaith. Mae'n bwysig inni droi hynny'n gonsensws cenedlaethol. Ni allwn wneud hynny tra bo ffigyrau grymus y tu allan i'r Cynulliad yn tanseilio hynny. Yr ydym wedi cymryd camau anhygoel o bwysig. Nid wyf yn ceisio chwalu'r consensws hwnnw, ond rhaid iddo fod wedi'i seilio ar onestrwydd. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb cadarnhaol gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'r adroddiad hwn, yr wyf yn siŵr y daw, ac at barhau'r gwaith cadarnhaol i ddatblygu cenedl lle perchir ein dwy iaith draddodiadol, a lle croesewir ieithoedd eraill a chaniateir iddynt dyfu.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae globaleiddio'n cynnig nifer o fanteision. Gallai cymdeithasau agored sy'n masnachu nwyddau a gwasanaethau yn rhyngwladol gynnig manteision i bawb ohonom. Heddiw yr ydym yn teithio a masnachu mewn modd na fuaswn i wedi gallu ei ddychmygu pan oeddwn yn tyfu i fyny yn y Rhondda yn y 1960au. Nid yw bwrw'r Sul mewn un o aelod wladwriaethau eraill yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn brofiad cyffredin, nid yn lleiaf oherwydd yr ysgytwad a gewch o glywed hyfedredd amlieithog ein partneriaid yn Ewrop, ond nid yw'n brofiad anarferol ychwaith. Fodd bynnag, mae i globaleiddio ei anfanteision. Gall fynd yn anghenfil mawr sy'n dileu pob amrywiaeth diwylliannol. Mae amrywiaeth ieithyddol yn cael ei dileu'n ddidostur dros y byd i gyd gan dra-arglwyddiaeth fyd-eang y Saesneg ac, i raddau llai, Sbaeneg, fel ieithoedd rhyngwladol masnach a chyfathrebu electronig.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fod Plaid Cymru wedi cyflwyno nodyn sur ac wedi torri'r consensws y prynhawn yma. Mae Simon Brooks a Seimon Glyn, a ffigyrau uchel eraill yn y Blaid, yn iawn pan ddywedant fod y Gymraeg dan fygythiad. Mae'r bygythiad hwnnw'n llwyr gyfiawnhau ystyriaeth lawn y Cynulliad ac ymateb polisi cynhwysfawr ar addysg, datblygu economaidd a thai. Fodd bynnag, byddai eu hateb hwy—cymdeithas

society with a collective chip on its shoulder—would be as economically inefficient as it would be socially unjust. You do not have to hate the English to take pride in our nation, where the presence of two languages is a national source of strength.

**Cynog Dafis:** Dim ond eisiau gwirio oeddwn i a oedd hynny oll yn eich sript.

**Alun Pugh:** Not at all, Cynog. I am changing it as I go along. It is not racist to stand up to those who break into Assembly offices, or those who seek to damage tourism—people whose fluency in the Welsh language sometimes does not extend to the word ‘croeso’. While the occasional moment of sporting schadenfreude is entirely understandable, a systematic rejoicing at every misfortune that takes place in England—on or off the sporting field—is a sign of stunted emotional development.

That is the fault line in this debate—between Welsh Labour, which is totally committed to not only defending the language, but celebrating the growth of Welsh-medium education and building a Wales where two languages are treated as equal, and those who consider English pensioners living in Wales to be a burden on Welsh society, rather than British citizens who have exercised their right to spend their retirement in one of the more beautiful corners of the UK.

Mae gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb difrifol am yr iaith Gymraeg. Heb ein cefnogaeth mae perygl i'r Gymraeg fynd yr un ffordd â'r Fanaweg. Rhaid inni atal hynny rhag digwydd. Rhaid inni weithredu mewn sawl ffordd, ond mae tri mater yn hanfodol. Yn gyntaf, rhaid annog rhieni sy'n siarad Cymraeg i drosglwyddo'r iaith i'w plant. Yn ail, yn ein polisi addysg, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ddysgu'r iaith i blant ifanc. Mae'n hawdd i blant ifanc ddysgu'r Gymraeg, ond mae'n anodd i hen ddyn fel fi. Yn drydydd, rhaid inni ymateb i dwf addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn ardaloedd Seisnigaidd. Mae llawer o rieni yn deall manteision addysg ddwyieithog, ond nid yw'r un cyfleoedd ar gael i bawb ar hyn o bryd.

fewnblyg, sbeityld, bitw gyda sglodyn enfawr ar ei hysgwydd—mor economaidd aneffeithiol ag y byddai'n gymdeithasol anghyfiawn. Nid oes raid casáu'r Saeson i ymfalchïo yn ein cenedl, lle mae presenoldeb dwy iaith yn ffynhonnell cryfder cenedlaethol.

**Cynog Dafis:** I just wanted to check whether all that was in your script.

**Alun Pugh:** Ddim o gwbl, Cynog. Yr wyf yn ei newid wrth imi fynd yn fy mlaen. Nid yw'n hiliol sefyll yn erbyn y rheini sy'n torri i mewn i swyddfeydd y Cynulliad, neu'r rheini sy'n ceisio niweidio twristiaeth—pobl nad ydynt weithiau'n ddigon rhugl yn y Gymraeg i wybod y gair ‘croeso’. Tra bod ambell ennyd o schadenfreude ym myd y bêl yn gwbl ddealladwy, mae dathlu'n systemataidd bob anffawd sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr—ar y maes chwarae neu oddi arno—yn arwydd o ddiffyg datblygiad emosiynol.

Dyna'r llinell ffawt yn y ddatl hon—rhwng Plaid Lafur Cymru, sy'n gwbl ymroddedig nid yn unig i amddiffyn yr iaith, ond i dathlu twf addysg Gymraeg ac adeiladu Cymru lle caiff dwy iaith eu trin yn gyfartal, a'r rheini sy'n ystyried bod pensynwyr o Saeson sy'n byw yng Nghymru'n faich ar y gymdeithas Gymraeg, yn hytrach nag yn ddinasyddion Prydeinig sydd wedi defnyddio'u hawl i dreulio'u hymddeoliad yn un o gorneli harddaf y DU.

The Assembly has a serious responsibility for the Welsh language. Without our support there is a danger that Welsh will go the same way as the Manx language. We must prevent that from happening. We must take many steps, but three matters are crucial. First, we must encourage parents who speak Welsh to pass the language on to their children. Secondly, in our education policy, we must concentrate on teaching the language to young children. It is easy for young children to learn Welsh, but it is difficult for an old man like me. Thirdly, we must respond to the growth of Welsh-medium education in Anglicised areas. Many parents understand the advantages of a bilingual education, but not everyone has the same opportunities at present.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant a'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Both Committees and their staff have worked extremely hard to produce this thorough joint report. I am pleased to respond to it today. It is a product of our modern democracy in Wales, and of democratic processes. I will make an initial statement on Assembly Government policies on the Welsh language over the course of the summer. This is very much a preliminary response. That will then be followed by a detailed action plan towards the end of the year, following the Assembly's budget process. The Welsh Assembly Government will take a cross-cutting approach to this response, which will reflect policies beyond my portfolio and that of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, and will involve all Ministers. This review has taken over a year to complete. The talking is over; now is the time for action.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn glir yn ei chefnogaeth i'r iaith Gymraeg a'i dyfodol.

The Assembly Government is clear about the main principles that will underpin its action plan on the Welsh language. Foremost among these is the Assembly Government's wholehearted commitment to supporting and promoting the Welsh language. It is an important part of our national identity, and there is growing awareness of the educational, cultural, social, and potential economic benefits of bilingualism. The Assembly Government will provide clear, strategic direction and political leadership on Welsh language policy. We will work hard to sustain and encourage the growth of the language in a tolerant and welcoming Wales. Our policies will apply to the whole of Wales, but local flexibility will be a key element of our approach. I hope that John Griffiths will welcome that, given the tenor of his contribution today.

There have been calls for new primary

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** First, I thank the Culture Committee and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

Mae'r ddau Bwyllgor a'u staff wedi gweithio'n eithriadol o galed ar y cyd i gynhyrchu'r adroddiad trwyadl hwn. Pleser yw ymateb iddo heddiw. Mae'n gynnyrch ein democratiaeth fodern yng Nghymru, ac yn gynnyrch prosesau democrataidd. Gwnaf ddatganiad cychwynnol ar bolisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y Gymraeg dros yr haf. Ymateb rhagarweiniol yw hwn i raddau helaeth. Dilynir hwnnw wedyn gan gynllun gweithredu manwl tua diwedd y flwyddyn, yn dilyn proses cyllideb y Cynulliad. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd ati mewn modd trawsbynciol i lunio'r ymateb hwn, a fydd yn adlewyrchu polisiau y tu hwnt i'm portffolio i a phortffolio'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a bydd yn cynnwys y Gweinidogion i gyd. Mae'r adolygiad hwn wedi cymryd dros flwyddyn i'w gwblhau. Mae'r siarad ar ben; amser gweithredu yw hi yn awr.

The Welsh Assembly Government is clear in its support for the Welsh language and its future.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn glir ynglŷn â'r prif egwyddorion a fydd yn sail i'w chynllun gweithredu ar y Gymraeg. Yn bennaf ymhlith y rheini mae ymrwymiad llwyr Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi a hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg. Mae'n rhan bwysig o'n hunaniaeth genedlaethol, ac mae ymwybyddiaeth gynyddol o fanteision addysgol, diwylliannol, cymdeithasol, ac economaidd posibl dwyieithrwydd. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu cyfeiriad strategol ac arweiniad gwleidyddol clir ar bolisi iaith Gymraeg. Gweithiwn yn galed i gynnal ac annog twf yr iaith mewn Cymru oddefgar a chroesawgar. Bydd ein polisiau'n berthnasol i Gymru gyfan, ond bydd hyblygrwydd lleol yn elfen allweddol i'n dull o weithredu. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff John Griffiths groesawu hynny, o gofio geiriad ei gyfraniad heddiw.

Cafwyd galwadau am ddeddfwriaeth



legislation, which have at times threatened to distract the Committee from adopting practical measures to nurture the language. I concede that there might be scope for better focused institutional action in support of the Welsh language, but I believe that this can be accomplished within existing legislation, and I am pleased that the Committee accepted my commitment to take every opportunity to use that legislation fully.

Our focus in the coming years must be on measures that will enable and encourage people who wish to speak Welsh in all walks of life. The Committee heard evidence that Welsh was increasingly becoming confined to school and to home. If Welsh is to survive as a truly living language, we need to take it out into the community and promote its use in work, in business, and in leisure. It is essential that Welsh society, and young people especially, feel ownership of the language, and find it natural and appropriate to use it in all social settings.

We will continue to encourage people to learn the language and encourage parents to pass on the language to their children. We are committed to ensuring that the appropriate structures are in place to enable people to learn the language at whatever age. We are alive to the crucial importance of maintaining Welsh as a natural language of many of our communities in Wales. The decline in the number of communities where Welsh is the primary language gives cause for concern. However, policies that exclude individuals from communities will not help the language. Our guiding principle will be the pursuit of policies that support and strengthen communities' social and economic framework. We will work hard to create sustainable and open communities, and will maximise the tools currently available by developing language action pilot schemes in communities experiencing substantial language shift, or where the language is being used less and less by young people. These pilot schemes will help to ensure greater collaboration and co-operation between all key stakeholders, and make the language central to the future development of these communities.

sylfaenol newydd, a fygythiodd ar adegau dynnu sylw'r Pwyllgor oddi ar fabwysiadu mesurau ymarferol i feithrin yr iaith. Yr wyf yn addef efallai fod lle i sicrhau gwell ffocws i weithredu sefydliadol o blaid y Gymraeg, ond credaf y gellir cyflawni hyn o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth sy'n bodoli, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Pwyllgor wedi derbyn fy ymrwymiad i achub ar bob cyfle i ddefnyddio'r ddeddfwriaeth honno'n llawn.

Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio yn y blynyddoedd i ddod ar fesurau a fydd yn galluogi ac yn annog pobl sydd eisiau siarad Cymraeg ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd. Clywodd y Pwyllgor dystiolaeth fod y Gymraeg yn cael ei chyfyngu fwyfwy i'r ysgol a'r cartref. Os yw'r Gymraeg i oroesi fel iaith wirioneddol fyw, mae angen mynd â hi allan i'r gymuned a hyrwyddo ei defnydd mewn gwaith, mewn busnes ac mewn hamdden. Mae'n hanfodol fod cymdeithas yng Nghymru, a phobl ifanc yn arbennig, yn teimlo perchenogaeth dros yr iaith, ac yn teimlo ei bod yn naturiol a phriodol ei defnyddio ym mhob sefyllfa gymdeithasol.

Byddwn yn parhau i annog pobl i ddysgu'r iaith ac annog rhieni i drosglwyddo'r iaith i'w plant. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y strwythurau priodol yn eu lle i alluogi pobl o bob oed i ddysgu'r iaith. Yr ydym yn effro i bwysigrwydd allweddol cynnal y Gymraeg fel iaith naturiol llawer o'n cymunedau yng Nghymru. Mae'r dirywiad yn y nifer o gymunedau lle mai Cymraeg yw'r brif iaith yn peri pryder. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaiff polisïau sy'n cau unigolion allan o gymunedau helpu'r iaith. Yr egwyddor a fydd yn ein harwain fydd ceisio dilyn polisïau sy'n cynnal ac yn atgyfnerthu fframwaith cymdeithasol ac economaidd cymunedau. Gweithiwn yn galed i greu cymunedau cynaliadwy ac agored, a gwnawn y mwyaf o'r arfau sydd ar gael ar hyn o bryd drwy ddatblygu cynlluniau iaith peilot mewn cymunedau lle mae symudiad iaith sylweddol, neu lle y caiff yr iaith ei defnyddio lai a llai gan bobl ifanc. Bydd y cynlluniau peilot hyn yn helpu i sicrhau mwy o gydweithio a chydweithredu rhwng yr holl randdeiliaid allweddol, ac yn gwneud yr iaith yn ganolog i ddatblygiad y cymunedau hyn yn y dyfodol.

4:10 p.m.

With these principles in mind, I am pleased to announce the allocation of £450,000 to the Welsh Language Board to initiate a range of measures that will support and promote the Welsh language. This is new money for this financial year. I am grateful to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities for making this money available. I believe that Members have had details of the seven projects that the money is intended to assist distributed to them. Briefly, these include measures to allow mentrau iaith to employ project officers, some of whom will work to encourage the use of Welsh by local private companies; assistance to private businesses throughout Wales to help them make more use of Welsh; the development of new facilities at Nant Gwrtheyrn; four new sports officers for Urdd Gobaith Cymru to organise sports activities through the medium of Welsh, focusing on areas of social disadvantage and the expansion of language action pilot schemes to co-ordinate the activities of a range of organisations, such as mentrau iaith and others, working in communities that are experiencing substantial language shift, or where fewer young people are using the language—this builds on the work of the current pilot project in Fishguard. The measures also include the extension of the Twf initiative, which promotes the transferring of the Welsh language within the family; and further support for Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin to expand its work in disadvantaged areas and where there is shortage of provision.

I hope that Members will welcome this announcement of immediate additional resources as an indication of the Assembly Government's commitment to the language. This is an important initial step in making a significant change to the fortunes of the Welsh language. It is important to remember that language choice is a matter for the individual and for society. However, the Assembly Government is committed to creating the right conditions in which the language can flourish, and I have clearly indicated this positive commitment today.

Gyda'r egwyddorion hyn mewn golwg, yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi dyraniad o £450,000 i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i gychwyn amrediad o fesurau a fydd yn cynnal ac yn hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg. Arian newydd am y flwyddyn ariannol hon yw hyn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am ddarparu'r arian hwn. Credaf y cafodd manylion am y saith prosiect y bwriedir i'r arian eu cynorthwyo eu dosbarthu i'r Aelodau. Yn fyr, mae'r rhain yn cynnwys mesurau i ganiatáu i fentrau iaith gyflogi swyddogion prosiect, rhai ohonynt i weithio i annog cwmnïau preifat lleol i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg; cymorth i fusnesau preifat ledled Cymru i'w helpu i wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r Gymraeg; datblygu cyfleusterau newydd yn Nant Gwrtheyrn; pedwar swyddog chwaraeon newydd i Urdd Gobaith Cymru i drefnu gweithgareddau chwaraeon drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan ganolbwyntio ar ardaloedd o anfantais gymdeithasol ac ehangu cynlluniau peilot gweithredu iaith i gydlynu gweithgareddau amrediad o gyrff, fel y mentrau iaith ac eraill, gan weithio mewn cymunedau lle ceir symudiad ieithyddol sylweddol, neu lle mae llai o bobl ifanc yn defnyddio'r iaith—mae hyn yn adeiladu ar waith y prosiect peilot cyfredol yn Abergwaun. Mae'r mesurau hefyd yn cynnwys ehangu'r cynllun Twf, sy'n hyrwyddo trosglwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg o fewn y teulu; a chymorth pellach i Fudiad Ysgolion Meithrin i ehangu ei waith mewn ardaloedd diffreintiedig a lle mae prinder darpariaeth.

Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff yr Aelodau groesawu'r cyhoeddiad hwn o adnoddau ychwanegol di-oed fel arwydd o ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r iaith. Dyma gam cyntaf pwysig i greu newid sylweddol yn hynt yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai mater i'r unigolyn ac i gymdeithas yw dewis iaith. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i greu'r amodau iawn fel y gall yr iaith ffynnu, ac yr wyf wedi dangos yr ymrwymiad cadarnhaol hwn yn glir heddiw.

Diolch yn fawr am wrando.

Thank you for listening.

**Gareth Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr oedd camddealltwriaeth yn gynharach. Yr oeddwn o dan yr argraff bod Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant a minnau, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn cael 15 munud rhyngom i gyflwyno'r hyn yr oeddem am ei ddweud. Yr oedd Rhodri Glyn wedi trefnu i mi gael cloi'r ddadl. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod hynny'n groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog mewn rhyw ffordd. Felly, ar ran y ddau Bwyllgor, diolchaf o galon i bawb a gyfrannodd. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau ganolbwyntio ar gynnwys yr adroddiad. Canolbwyntio ar hynny yw'r gorau, ac nid ar safbwyntiau eraill o'r tu allan.

**Gareth Jones:** Point of order. There was a misunderstanding earlier. I was under the impression that the Chair of the Culture Committee and myself, as Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, would be given 15 minutes between us to make our comments. Rhodri Glyn had arranged for me to close the debate. However, I understand that that contradicts Standing Orders in some way. Therefore, on behalf of the two Committees, I give my heartfelt thanks to everyone who contributed. I ask Members to concentrate on the content of the report. It is best to concentrate on that, and not on other external points of view.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I refer you to Standing Order No. 7.4. If you read it, all will be clear.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Fe'ch cyfeirir at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.4. Os darllenwch hi, daw popeth yn glir.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri

Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Mesur Cyfathrebu The Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Communications Bill**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 3 and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 2 and 5 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2 a 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

1. *approves the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the consultation on the Communications Bill;*

1. *yn cymeradwyo ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r ymgynghoriad ar y Mesur Cyfathrebu;*

2. *notes that the Welsh Assembly Government's draft response asks for changes to the draft Bill to ensure a strong voice for Wales throughout the new regulatory structure;*

2. *yn nodi bod ymateb drafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gofyn am newidiadau i'r Mesur drafft er mwyn sicrhau bod gan Gymru lais cryf yn y strwythur rheoliadol newydd;*

3. *notes that the Welsh Assembly Government has consulted extensively in preparing this draft response and that the Culture Committee discussed and approved the paper at its meeting on 27 June. (NDM1119)*

3. *yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymgynghori'n eang wrth baratoi'r ymateb drafft hwn a bod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant wedi trafod a chymeradwyo'r papur yn ei gyfarfod ar 27 Mehefin. (NDM1119)*

I am pleased to have the opportunity to open this debate on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the UK Government's draft Communications Bill. As you know, the Bill proposes a new light-touch regulatory regime for the communications sector. The five existing regulatory communications bodies will be replaced by Ofcom—the new single regulatory body. We must ensure that we consider the Bill in terms of citizenship as well as the interest of service providers and consumers.

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i agor y ddadl hon ar ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Fesur Cyfathrebu drafft Llywodraeth y DU. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r Mesur yn cynnig trefn reoleiddio newydd ysgafn ei chyffyrddiad ar gyfer y sector cyfathrebu. Disodlir y pum corff cyfathrebu rheoleiddiol presennol gan Ofcom—yr un corff rheoleiddiol newydd. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried y Mesur yn nhermau dinasyddiaeth yn ogystal â buddiannau'r darparwyr gwasanaeth a'r defnyddwyr.

I presented our draft response to the Culture Committee for its comments and I am grateful for its useful and thoughtful insights. I have reflected on these while finalising the draft response before you this afternoon to what is essentially the broadcasting part of this Bill. The Committee agreed the paper on 27 June. The point of this debate is to seek your approval of our response that will be submitted to the UK Government's consultation process on the draft Bill at the end of this month. I have consulted widely in drawing up the Welsh Assembly Government's response. Colleagues on the Culture Committee have received written and oral evidence from a wide range of broadcasting bodies in Wales. I have had the opportunity to discuss the Bill with the broadcasting bodies in Wales. Although each body has its own concerns, there was unanimity on the need for a strong Welsh voice in the new structure and the importance of universal and equal access to communications services. Their input has been invaluable.

In our response, I have tried to achieve a balance between the Bill's intention of creating a light-touch regulatory regime and ensuring that Wales has a strong voice within the regulatory structure and that particular Welsh interests are taken into account. I do not have time to go through the draft Bill clause by clause—there were 259 of them when I last looked and there are more to come. However, I will flag up three key issues. First, on national representation, communications services in all their guises are of crucial importance to the people of Wales. Given the unique environment in Wales in terms of language, culture and geography, we have our own concerns, which are not addressed in the draft Bill as it stands.

In our original response to the White Paper, we recommended that the Bill provide for a member for Wales on Ofcom's central board. Many of the existing regulatory bodies already make provision for Welsh representation and the new structure should not mean giving Wales less of a voice than it currently has. However, the draft Bill does not provide for such a member for Wales or

Cyflwynais ein hymateb drafft i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant i gael ei sylwadau ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ei sylwadau buddiol a meddylgar. Yr wyf wedi myfyrio ar y rhain wrth lunio'r ymateb drafft terfynol sydd ger eich bron y prynhawn yma i'r rhan o'r Mesur sydd yn ei hanfod yn ymdrin â darlledu. Cytunodd y Pwyllgor ar y papur ar 27 Mehefin. Pwynt y ddadl hon yw ceisio'ch cymeradwyaeth i'r ymateb a gyflwynwn i broses ymgynghori Llywodraeth y DU ar y Mesur drafft ddiwedd y mis hwn. Yr wyf wedi ymgynghori'n eang wrth lunio ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Derbyniodd cyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor Diwylliant dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar gan amrediad eang o gyrff darlledu yng Nghymru. Cefais y cyfle i drafod y Mesur gyda'r cyrff darlledu yng Nghymru. Er bod gan bob corff ei bryderon ei hun, yr oedd unfrydedd ar yr angen am lais cryf i Gymru yn y strwythur newydd a phwysigrwydd mynediad cyffredinol a chyfartal i wasanaethau cyfathrebu. Bu eu mewnbwn yn werthfawr dros ben.

Yn ein hymateb, yr wyf wedi ceisio taro cydbwysedd rhwng bwriad y Mesur i greu trefn reoleiddio ysgafn ei chyffyrddiad a sicrhau y caiff Cymru lais cryf o fewn y strwythur rheoleiddio ac y cymerir buddiannau penodol Cymru i ystyriaeth. Nid oes gennyf amser i fynd drwy'r Mesur drafft fesul cymal—yr oedd 259 ohonynt pan edrychais ddiwethaf ac mae mwy i ddod. Fodd bynnag, mi dynnaf sylw at dri mater allweddol. Yn gyntaf, o ran cynrychiolaeth genedlaethol, mae gwasanaethau cyfathrebu yn eu holl agweddau o bwysigrwydd allweddol i bobl Cymru. O gofio'r amgylchedd unigryw yng Nghymru yn nhermau iaith, diwylliant a daearyddiaeth, mae gennym ein pryderon ein hunain, na chawsant sylw yn y Mesur drafft fel y saif.

Yn ein hymateb gwreiddiol i'r Papur Gwyn, argymellasom y dylai'r Mesur ddarparu ar gyfer cael aelod o Gymru ar fwrdd canolog Ofcom. Mae llawer o'r cyrff rheoleiddio presennol eisoes yn darparu ar gyfer cynrychiolaeth o Gymru ac ni ddylai'r strwythur newydd olygu rhoi llai o lais i Gymru nag sydd ganddi ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Mesur drafft yn darparu ar

for any of the other UK nations. The Bill makes no explicit provision for any statutory role for the Assembly in the new structure, no provision for a Ofcom office in Wales and no explicit consultative structure to support the members for Wales on Ofcom's content board and consumer panel.

While I agree with the sentiments behind Jonathan Morgan's amendments 2 and 5, I cannot support them as their substance is the same as that in the draft response. I am pleased to receive Jocelyn Davies's support for the idea of a Wales communications council, which is put forward in our document. I have no problem with that body being required to submit an annual report to the Assembly. However, I see the council's role as advising Ofcom rather than issuing guidance to it; on that basis I will not support amendment 3.

UK Ministers say that they expect content board and consumer panel membership to be in line with discussions with the Assembly and so on. However, we need a firm guarantee in the legislation, if at all possible. I accept the good faith of the current Government; it is giving us assurances on this issue. However, the political persuasion of the Westminster Government could change—that may seem difficult to contemplate at the moment, but it is possible. I ask you to support our demand in point 2 of the motion for changes to the draft Bill to ensure a strong voice for Wales throughout the new regulatory structure.

4:20 p.m.

Secondly, regional production of programming is a major concern for us in Wales. Although lifting restrictions on media ownership may well enliven the communications market by introducing skills and investment from all over the world, it may also result in many of our communications services being run by London-centric or multinational corporations with little understanding of our unique communications ecology. We urge Ofcom to take every step to ensure that substantial,

gyfer aelod o'r fath i Gymru nac i'r un o genhedloedd eraill y DU. Ni wna'r Mesur unrhyw ddarpariaeth benodol ar gyfer unrhyw rôl statudol i'r Cynulliad yn y strwythur newydd, dim darpariaeth ar gyfer swyddfa Ofcom yng Nghymru a dim strwythur ymgynghori penodol i gefnogi'r aelodau dros Gymru ar fwrdd cynnwys a phanel defnyddwyr Ofcom.

Tra cytunaf â'r teimladau y tu ôl i welliannau 2 a 5 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, ni allaf eu cefnogi gan fod eu sylwedd yr un fath â'r hyn a geir yn yr ymateb drafft. Yr wyf yn falch o gael cefnogaeth Jocelyn Davies i'r syniad o gyngor cyfathrebu i Gymru, syniad a gyflwynir yn ein dogfen. Nid oes gennyf broblem gyda gofyn bod y corff hwnnw'n cyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, rôl y cyngor yn fy marn i fyddai cynghori Ofcom yn hytrach na rhoi canllawiau iddo; ar y sail honno ni wnaaf gefnogi gwelliant 3.

Dywed Gweinidogion y DU eu bod yn disgwyl i aelodaeth y bwrdd cynnwys a'r panel defnyddwyr fod yn unol â thrafodaethau gyda'r Cynulliad ac ati. Fodd bynnag, mae arnom angen gwarant gadarn yn y ddeddfwriaeth, os oes modd o gwbl. Derbyniaf fwriadau da'r Llywodraeth gyfredol; mae'n rhoi geiriau o sicrwydd inni ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, gallai lliw gwleidyddol Llywodraeth San Steffan newid—efallai fod hynny'n anodd i'w ddychmygu ar hyn o bryd, ond y mae'n bosibl. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'n cais ym mhwynt 2 y cynnig am newidiadau i'r Mesur drafft er mwyn sicrhau llais cryf i Gymru yn y strwythur rheoliadol newydd.

Yn ail, mae cynhyrchu rhaglenni'n rhanbarthol yn bryder mawr i ni yng Nghymru. Er y gall codi cyfyngiadau ar berchenogaeth cyfryngau yn wir fywiogi'r farchnad gyfathrebu drwy gyflwyno sgiliau a buddsoddiad o bedwar ban byd, gall hefyd olygu y caiff llawer o'n gwasanaethau cyfathrebu eu rhedeg gan gorfforaethau Llundain-ganolog neu ryngwladol heb fawr o ddealltwriaeth o'n hecoleg gyfathrebu unigryw. Pwyswn ar Ofcom i gymryd pob cam i sicrhau y gwneir cytundebau

detailed and explicit agreements are made with broadcasters regarding the number of hours, proportion and investment of Welsh programming and production.

Thirdly, on access, if the digital revolution is to bring benefits to the people of Wales, digital services need to be accessible to all. I want people in Wales to be able to receive Welsh television channels. Some cannot do so because of technical difficulties, but some do not know that it is even possible to do so. Digital services may help, but it may not be an affordable option for many, which is why we urge the UK Government to consider assisting people who wish to redirect or upgrade their existing aerials. Those considering switching to digital services need an assurance that they will have the widest possible choice of platforms. Our famed mountainous terrain may mean that satellite may be the only option for most people in Wales. Therefore, it is vital that digital satellite is under an obligation, before switchover, to carry the same Welsh public service broadcasters as terrestrial and cable providers.

**Kirsty Williams:** You may be aware of problems that have arisen in the Brecon Beacons National Park, where it is against planning guidelines to erect a satellite dish on a house. This is causing great concern to people in my constituency who could potentially suffer from a lack of adequate television coverage, if they are not allowed to place satellite dishes on their houses.

**Jenny Randerson:** That is a significant issue for people in your constituency. I will write to the Department for Culture, Media and Sport with any issues raised here today, such as yours, which are not included in our response, so that it has a flavour of the debate.

Once in possession of digital television, Welsh viewers need to be able to find Welsh channels easily on the electronic programme guides and not have to find them tucked away in the far reaches between the shopping and holiday channels. I will not support Jocelyn Davies's amendment 4, which deals with matters outside the scope of the

sylweddol, manwl a chlr gyda darlledwyr ynghylch nifer oriau, cyfran a buddsoddiad rhaglenni a chynhyrchu o Gymru.

Yn drydydd, ar fynediad, os yw'r chwyldro digidol i ddod â budd i bobl Cymru, mae angen i wasanaethau digidol fod ar gael i bawb. Mae arnaf eisiau i bobl Cymru allu derbyn sianeli teledu Cymreig. Ni all rhai wneud hynny oherwydd anawsterau technegol, ond mae rhai nad ydynt yn gwybod fod modd gwneud, hyd yn oed. Gall gwasanaethau digidol helpu, ond efallai na fydd llawer yn gallu fforddio'r dewis hwnnw, a dyna pam yr anogwn Lywodraeth y DU i ystyried cynorthwyo pobl sy'n dymuno ailgyfeirio neu uwchraddio eu herialau presennol. Mae'r rheini sy'n ystyried newid i wasanaethau digidol angen sicrwydd y cânt y dewis ehangaf bosibl o systemau. Efallai y golyga ein mynyddoedd enwog mai lloeren yw'r unig ddewis i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig fod y gwasanaeth lloeren digidol dan rwymedigaeth, cyn trosglwyddo, i gario'r un darlledwyr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymreig â darparwyr tir a chebl.

**Kirsty Williams:** Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol o broblemau a gododd ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog, lle mae canllawiau cynllunio'n gwahardd codi dysgl lloeren ar dŷ. Mae hyn yn peri pryder mawr i bobl yn fy etholaeth a allai o bosibl ddiodeff o ddiffyg gwasanaeth teledu digonol, os na chaniateir iddynt osod dysglau lloeren ar eu tai.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae hynny'n fater pwysig i bobl yn eich etholaeth. Fe ysgrifennaf at yr Adran Diwylliant, Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon gydag unrhyw faterion a godir yma heddiw, fel eich un chi, sydd heb eu cynnwys yn ein hymateb, er mwyn rhoi blas o'r ddadl.

Unwaith y bydd ganddynt deledu digidol, bydd angen i wylwyr yng Nghymru allu dod o hyd i sianeli Cymreig yn hawdd ar y canllawiau rhaglenni electronig ac nid yn gorfod dod o hyd iddynt wedi'u cuddio yn y pellafoedd rhwng y sianeli siopa a gwyliau. Ni chefnogaf welliant 4 Jocelyn Davies, sy'n delio â materion y tu allan i faes y Mesur

## Communications Bill.

## Cyfathrebu.

I hope that you agree that our response has identified some key issues for Wales and that Westminster should take heed and act accordingly. I ask the Assembly to endorse our proposed response to the UK Government and look forward to Members' comments. Delyth Evans as my deputy will sum up.

Gobeithiaf y cytunwch fod ein hymateb wedi nodi rhai materion allweddol i Gymru ac y dylai San Steffan roi sylw iddynt a gweithredu'n bwrpasol. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ategu ein hymateb arfaethedig i Lywodraeth y DU ac edrychaf ymlaen at sylwadau'r Aelodau. Bydd Delyth Evans, fy nirprwy, yn crynhoi.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1, dileu 'yn cymeradwyo' ac yn ei le rhoi 'yn nodi'.

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: in point 1, delete 'approves' and replace with 'notes'.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ôl pwynt 2 ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill yn unol â hynny:

I propose amendment 3. Insert a new point after point 2, and renumber accordingly:

*yn galw ar y cyngor cyfathrebu arfaethedig i Gymru;*

*calls for the proposed Wales communications council;*

*a. i gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol; ac*

*a. to present an annual report to the National Assembly; and*

*b. i gyhoeddi canllawiau ar gyfer Ofcom a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol mewn perthynas â swyddogaethau Ofcom yng Nghymru.*

*b. to issue guidance to Ofcom and the Secretary of State in relation to the functions of Ofcom in Wales.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ôl pwynt 2 ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n weddill yn unol â hynny:

I propose amendment 4. Insert a new point after point 2, and renumber accordingly:

*yn nodi y byddai ymateb drafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei atgyfnerthu drwy alw am:*

*notes that the Welsh Assembly Government's draft response would be strengthened by calling for:*

*a. adolygu cyllid S4C yng ngoleuni'r heriau sy'n ei wynebu yn yr oes ddigidol; a*

*a. S4C's funding to be reviewed in light of the challenges it faces in the digital age; and*

*b. eithrio is-deitlau Cymraeg i Saesneg ar S4C rhag deddfau hawlfraint.*

*b. the exemption of Welsh-to-English subtitles on S4C from copyright laws.*

Croesawaf yn gynnes ymateb ystyrlawn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Mesur hwn. Mae'n dangos bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrando ar lawer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan unigolion a chyrrff sydd yn ymwneud â'r byd darlledu a chyfathrebu yng Nghymru. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog ar hynny.

I warmly welcome the Assembly Government's considered response to this Bill. It shows that the Government has listened to many points raised by individuals and bodies in the broadcasting and communications world in Wales. I congratulate the Minister on that.

Yr ydym wedi arfer â gweld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn neidio i dderbyn polisiau o Lundain, gan wneud mân newidiadau yma ac

We are used to seeing the Assembly Government enthusiastically accepting policies from London, making minor changes



acw a'u cyflwyno fel ateb i'n holl anghenion. Felly, yr oedd yn bleser darllen ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i Fesur Cyfathrebu drafft Llywodraeth San Steffan. Yn wir, mae'n anodd gweld bai ar ymateb sydd yn talu'r fath sylw priodol i anghenion a dyheadau Cymru.

Mae'n dda bod paragraff 1.1 yn lleisio'r ofnau cwbl resymol na fydd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cyflawni pob un o'n disgwyliadau. Mae paragraff 1.2 yn pwysleisio'r angen i benodi aelod ar gyfer Cymru ar fwrdd Ofcom. Mae'n afresymol nad yw Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cydnabod egwyddor datganoli na bodolaeth y Cynulliad wrth ganoli grym Ofcom yn Llundain.

Galwodd Plaid Cymru o'r dechrau am lais cryf i Gymru ar fwrdd Ofcom, a dylai'r cyfryw gynrychiolydd gael ei enwebu gan y Cynulliad a'i gadarnhau gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Yr ydym yn falch o weld bod y Gweinidog yn cefnogi'r alwad hon.

Mae'n rhaid imi ganmol sylwadau'r Llywodraeth ar aelodaeth bwrdd cynnwys a phanel defnyddwyr Ofcom. Dyna paham na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Pe baech yn darllen ymateb y Llywodraeth yn ofalus, fe welech fod paragraffau 1.6 ac 1.8 yn gwneud y gwelliant yn ddiangen.

Mewn gwirionedd, byddwn yn dadlau bod angen mynd ymhellach na'r Llywodraeth. Mae perygl y gallai un aelod o Gymru ar unrhyw bwyllgor gael amser caled wrth geisio cael y maen i'r wal. Onid yr ateb i'r broblem yw sefydlu pwyllgor i Gymru, wedi'i benodi gan y Cynulliad, er mwyn arolygu holl waith Ofcom yng Nghymru? Byddai'r pwyllgor yn atebol i'r Cynulliad ac yn cyflwyno adroddiadau cyson i ni ac i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Os mai hynny sydd mewn golwg ym mharagraff 1.10, sy'n sôn am gyngor cyfathrebu i Gymru, byddem yn ddigon hapus. Wrth gynnig gwelliant 3 felly, yr ydym yn rhoi sail bendant i gyngor cyfathrebu.

Rhaid imi hefyd ganmol Llywodraeth y

here and there and presenting them as the solution to all our problems. Therefore, it was a pleasure to read the Government of Wales's response to the Westminster Government's draft Communications Bill. Indeed, it is difficult to find fault with a response that pays such appropriate attention to the needs and aspirations of Wales.

I am pleased that paragraph 1.1 voices the reasonable concerns that the Westminster Government will not fulfil all our expectations. Paragraph 1.2 emphasises the need to appoint a member for Wales on the Ofcom board. It is unreasonable of the Westminster Government not to acknowledge the principle of devolution and the existence of the Assembly by centralising Ofcom in London.

Plaid Cymru has called from the outset for Wales to have a strong voice on the Ofcom board, with any such representative nominated by the Assembly and confirmed by the Secretary of State. We are pleased that the Minister supports this call.

I must commend the Government's response to the membership of Ofcom's content board and consumer panel. This is why we will not support amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Were you to read the Government's response carefully, you would see that paragraphs 1.6 and 1.8 make the amendment unnecessary.

We would, in fact, argue that we need to go further than the Government's response. There is a danger that a sole Welsh member on any panel could face a hard time in trying to move issues forward. Would not the solution be to establish a committee for Wales, appointed by the Assembly, to review Ofcom's work in Wales? Such a committee would be accountable to the Assembly and would provide us and the Secretary of State with regular reports. If this is what is intended in paragraph 1.10, in its reference to a communications council for Wales, we would be satisfied. In proposing amendment 3, therefore, we offer a firm foundation for the establishment of a communications council.

I must also commend the Assembly

Cynulliad am geisio sicrhau, ym mharagraff 1.13, fod dyletswydd ar Ofcom i gydnabod awdurdod y Cynulliad.

Government for trying to ensure, in paragraph 1.13, that Ofcom is obliged to recognise the Assembly's authority.

Trof at deledu annibynnol. Er bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, Tessa Jowell, yn sôn am bwysigrwydd cwmnïau teledu rhanbarthol, mae holl dueddiadau'r Mesur yn pwyntio i gyfeiriad arall, drwy roi rhwydd hynt i ychydig o gwmnïau mawr feddiannu'r cyfan. Mae teledu yng Nghymru, boed yn nwylo'r BBC, HTV neu S4C, yn rhy bwysig i'w roi yn nwylo pwyllgor canolog a benodir gan Lywodraeth San Steffan. Yn yr un modd, mae angen rheoleiddio'r gorsafodded radio sy'n darlledu yng Nghymru, er mwyn sicrhau bod cyfran deg o'u harlwy yn dod o Gymru.

I now turn to independent television. Although the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, Tessa Jowell, makes reference to the importance of regional television companies, the Bill's tendencies point in the other direction by giving a few big companies a free reign to seize control of everything. Television in Wales, be it in the hands of the BBC, HTV or S4C, is too important to be placed under the control of a central committee appointed by the Westminster Government. Similarly, radio stations that broadcast in Wales need to be regulated in order to ensure that a fair share of their programmes comes from Wales.

Wedi i S4C gyhoeddi ei hadroddiad blynyddol yn ddiweddar, daeth yn amlwg bod y sianel, sydd mor bwysig i ddyfodol y Gymraeg, yn wynebu anawsterau mawr. Carem gael sicrwydd bod cyllid y sianel yn gwbl ddiogel. Efallai mai'r Cynulliad yw'r unig gorff all roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw.

It became clear, from S4C's recently published annual report, that the channel, which is crucial to the future of the Welsh language, is facing significant problems. I seek an assurance that the channel's funding will be secured. The National Assembly is perhaps the only body that can provide such an assurance.

Mae ail ran gwelliant 4 yn cyfeirio at bwynt arall sy'n destun gofid. Deallwn fod hawlfraint ar is-deitlau Saesneg S4C yn creu rhwystrau o ran ambell raglen, yn enwedig wrth drosi caneuon Cymraeg. Er bod hawlfraint yn fodd i sicrhau bywoliaeth awduron, yr wyf yn amau a oes neb yn elwa drwy godi hawlfraint ar is-deitlau Cymraeg-i-Saesneg. Felly, hoffem weld is-deitlau yn cael eu heithrio o'r gyfundrefn hawlfraint.

The second part of amendment 4 refers to another cause for concern. We understand that the copyright on S4C's English subtitles can cause difficulty in the case of certain programmes, particularly with the translation of Welsh songs. Even though copyright protects authors' livelihoods, I doubt whether anyone benefits from the copyright on Welsh-to-English subtitles. Therefore, we would like subtitles to be exempt from the copyright system.

Yn fras, mae ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Mesur Cyfathrebu hollbwysig yn gam mawr i'r cyfeiriad iawn, a dylem ei gefnogi'n frwd.

In general, the Assembly Government's response to this important Communications Bill is a big step in the right direction, which we should support wholeheartedly.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 2: add at the end of point 2:

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

*including the legal right for the National Assembly for Wales to appoint representatives to the content board and the consumer panel of Ofcom.*

*gan gynnwys yr hawl gyfreithiol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru benodi cynrychiolwyr ar fwrdd cynnwys ac ar banel defnyddwyr Ofcom.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*supports the establishment of a significant Ofcom presence in Wales.*

Unfortunately, the contributions so far have not offered a real opportunity to attack or disagree with the Government on this issue. I found myself in the same boat during the debate on the review of the Welsh language, as I could not find any reason then either to attack the Government. Had it not been for the debate on countryside access, we would probably have seen today the elusive cross-party consensus that we were striving to achieve—or at least someone was striving to achieve—when the Assembly was established.

In principle, I prefer to note, rather than approve, Government statements, even when we do approve of them. There is nothing quite as nauseating as governments issuing self-congratulatory motions. Therefore, we will support Plaid Cymru's amendment 1 that seeks to replace the word 'approves' with 'notes', even though I approve of almost everything the Minister said. I daresay that political differences will emerge during the passage of this complicated Bill, which will probably be best addressed after the summer recess.

It is of major concern to all Members that Wales should not be sidelined by this complex Bill. This is why we tabled our amendments. We are not disagreeing with the Government, and I am aware that reference is made to these points in the Government's response. However, it seemed sensible to emphasise them in our amendments. The Government is being miserable in not supporting those amendments; it is even more miserable of Plaid Cymru not to offer its support. I do not understand why it is doing this, but I suppose that, with the Assembly elections fast approaching, it is trying to establish its distinctiveness and make itself seem a little individualistic even when it is not.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cefnogi sefydlu presenoldeb sylweddol gan Ofcom yng Nghymru.*

Yn anffodus, nid yw'r cyfraniadau hyd yn hyn wedi cynnig cyfle gwirioneddol i ymosod nac anghytuno â'r Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn. Cefais fy hun yn yr un cwch yn ystod y ddadl ar yr arolwg o'r iaith Gymraeg, gan na allwn ganfod unrhyw reswm bryd hynny chwaith i ymosod ar y Llywodraeth. Oni bai am y ddadl ar fynediad i gefn gwlad, mae'n debyg y buasem wedi gweld heddiw y consensws trawsbleidiol di-ddal hwnnw yr oeddem yn ymdrechu i'w gael—neu yr oedd rhywun, o leiaf, yn ymdrechu i'w gael—pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad.

Mewn egwyddor, mae'n well gennyf nodi, yn hytrach na chymeradwyo, datganiadau gan y Llywodraeth, hyd yn oed pan fyddwn yn eu cymeradwyo. Nid oes dim sydd lawn mor gyfogyd â llywodraethau'n cyhoeddi cynigion hunanlongyfarchol. Felly, cefnogwn welliant 1 gan Plaid Cymru sy'n ceisio gosod y gair 'nodi' yn lle 'cymeradwyo', er fy mod yn cymeradwyo bron bopeth a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Mae'n siŵr y daw gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol i'r amlwg yn ystod hynt y Mesur cymhleth hwn, y bydd yn well eu trafod, mae'n debyg, ar ôl toriad yr haf.

Testun pryder mawr i'r holl Aelodau yw na ddylai Cymru gael ei gwthio o'r neilltu gan y Mesur cymhleth hwn. Dyna pam y bu inni gyflwyno ein gwelliannau. Nid ydym yn anghytuno â'r Llywodraeth, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol y cyfeirir at y pwyntiau hyn yn ymateb y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, ymddangosai'n synhwyrol inni eu pwysleisio yn ein gwelliannau. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn bod yn grintachlyd wrth beidio â chefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn; mwy crintachlyd byth yw Plaid Cymru yn peidio â chynnig ei chefnogaeth. Nid wyf yn deall pam y mae'n gwneud hyn, ond mae'n debyg, gydag etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn prysur nesáu, ei bod yn ceisio sefydlu ei harwahanrwydd a gwneud iddi'i hun ymddangos ychydig yn wahanol hyd yn oed pan nad ydyw.

4:30 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you take an intervention?

**Owen John Thomas:** A gymerwch chi ymyriad?

**Glyn Davies:** In the spirit of consensus, I will.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn ysbryd consensws, gwnaf.

**Owen John Thomas:** A ydych yn derbyn, Glyn, fod yr hyn a gynigiwch yng ngwelliant 2 eisoes wedi'i gynnwys yn ymateb y Llywodraeth, ac felly nid ydych yn ychwanegu dim?

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you accept, Glyn, that your proposal in amendment 2 is already included in the Government's response and it therefore adds nothing to the motion?

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'n amlwg na fu ichi glywed yr hyn a ddywedais funud yn ôl. Dylech wrando.

**Glyn Davies:** It is obvious that you did not hear what I said only a minute ago. You should listen.

It was reasonable for us to table amendments highlighting the most important points, and I regret that they will not be supported by the other parties.

Yr oedd yn rhesymol inni gyflwyno gwelliannau'n amlygu'r pwyntiau pwysicaf, a gresynaf na wnaiff y pleidiau eraill eu cefnogi.

Even though it is desirable, I suspect that it is unlikely that Wales will have a full member of the Ofcom board. Therefore, we must secure membership of the content board and the consumer panel and ensure that that is enshrined in legislation. The wording at present does not mean that it is enshrined, and I agree with the Minister that we must continue to press for it to become enshrined. I hope that Wales will have a structure that feeds into the Welsh presence on these boards. We are too fond of committees in Wales; it is a Welsh characteristic. However, in this case, we need some form of board or panel in Wales to feed into the presence on the two main boards. I hope that we can find a way of accommodating that.

Er ei bod yn ddymunol, mae'n annhebygol y caiff Cymru aelod llawn ar fwrdd Ofcom. Felly, rhaid inni sicrhau aelodaeth o'r bwrdd cynnwys a'r panel defnyddwyr a sicrhau y caiff hynny ei gynnwys yn y ddeddfwriaeth. Nid yw'r geiriad ar hyn o bryd yn golygu ei fod wedi'i gynnwys, a chytunaf â'r Gweinidog fod yn rhaid inni ddal i bwysu am ei gynnwys. Gobeithiaf y bydd gan Gymru strwythur a fydd yn bwydo i mewn i'r gynrychiolaeth Gymreig ar y byrddau hyn. Yr ydym yn rhy hoff o bwyllgorau yng Nghymru; nodwedd Gymreig yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn yr achos hwn, mae angen rhyw fath o fwrdd neu banel yng Nghymru i fwydo i mewn i'r gynrychiolaeth ar y ddau brif fwrdd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn ddod o hyd i ffordd o sicrhau hynny.

My final point relates to the importance of an Ofcom presence in Wales. There is no disagreement among us on this issue; we do not simply want a junior clerk and a tea person representing Ofcom in Cardiff. As Ofcom develops into an important institution, we need a significant, genuine presence in Wales. As I said, I agreed with almost all of the Minister's contribution, and I can only hope that the Government of Wales can move forward and exercise influence at the appropriate level.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf yn ymwneud â phwysigrwydd presenoldeb gan Ofcom yng Nghymru. Nid oes anghytundeb rhyngom ar y mater hwn; nid oes arnom eisiau mân glerc a pherson gwneud te yn cynrychioli Ofcom yng Nghaerdydd. Wrth i Ofcom ddatblygu'n sefydliad pwysig, mae arnom angen presenoldeb arwyddocaol, go iawn yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais, cytunais â bron popeth a ddywedodd y Gweinidog, ac ni allaf ond gobeithio y gall Llywodraeth Cymru symud ymlaen a dylanwadu ar y lefel briodol.

**Karen Sinclair:** I am sure that you will not be surprised to hear that I will raise the issue of inclusion and access for people with a sensory impairment. I know that the Royal National Institute for Deaf People and the Royal National Institute of the Blind have been vocal on these issues at a UK level and that other Members will no doubt raise the issue of inclusion today. Therefore I will not belabour the point. Suffice it to say that the Bill needs to build in rights and protection for people with sensory impairment to ensure that they get the level of access that they deserve.

It is also imperative that there is sufficient representation of the varied needs of people with different disabilities on Ofcom's consumer panel and that these are fed into the content board. The situation is further complicated in Wales by the need for access for Welsh speakers to Welsh-language programming. Joint research by the RNID and S4C has proved that there would be a significant interest in Welsh-language subtitles, which are currently unavailable.

I welcome the commitment to equality of access shown so far and hope that the consultation process will enable interest groups such as the RNID and RNIB to further feed into the process at the UK level.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gael cyfrannu at y ddadl a chroesawaf y ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwrandao ar nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf ar y Mesur hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth San Steffan yn gwrandao ar lais Llywodraeth Cymru yn hyn o beth.

Codwyd pryderon ynglŷn ag effeithiau'r newidiadau o ran darlledu rhanbarthol. Mae patrwm teledu ym Mhrydain wedi'i or-ganoli yn Llundain ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Daw dros 80 y cant o raglenni o Lundain ac, mewn rhai adrannau, mae'r ffigur yn gymaint â 97 y cant. Mae hyn yn wir am y BBC a chwmnïau teledu annibynnol. Mae presenoldeb HTV yng Nghymru wedi crebachu yn sgîl pwysau masnachol ac mae perygl y gallai'r duedd hon ledaenu. Mae perygl hefyd i'r pŵer fynd i ddwylo ychydig o *tycoons* neu *media moguls* yn y sector annibynnol. Mae angen

**Karen Sinclair:** Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddwch yn synnu o wybod fy mod am godi cwestiwn cynhwysiant a mynediad i bobl â nam ar eu synhwyrau. Gwn fod Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol Pobl Fyddar a Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion wedi bod yn llafar ar y materion hyn ar lefel y DU ac y bydd Aelodau eraill yn ddi-os yn codi cwestiwn cynhwysiant heddiw. Felly ni wnaif orbwysleisio'r pwynt. Digon yw dweud bod angen i'r Mesur warchod a chynnwys hawliau pobl â nam ar eu synhwyrau er mwyn sicrhau y cânt y mynediad y maent yn ei haeddu.

Mae'n hanfodol hefyd y caiff anghenion amrywiol pobl â gwahanol anabledau eu cynrychioli'n ddigonol ar banel defnyddwyr Ofcom ac y caiff y rhain eu trosglwyddo i'r bwrdd cynnwys. Cymhlethir y sefyllfa ymhellach yng Nghymru gan yr angen i sicrhau mynediad i siaradwyr Cymraeg at raglenni Cymraeg. Mae ymchwil ar y cyd gan yr RNID ac S4C wedi profi y byddai diddordeb sylweddol mewn cael is-deitlau Cymraeg, nad ydynt ar gael ar hyn o bryd.

Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad i fynediad cyfartal a ddangoswyd hyd yma a gobeithiaf y bydd y broses ymgynghori'n galluogi grwpiau â buddiant fel yr RNID a'r RNIB i fwydo mwy i mewn i'r broses ar lefel y DU.

**Dafydd Wigley:** I am pleased to be able to contribute to this debate and I welcome the fact that the Government of Wales has listened to many of the points made about this Bill over the past few weeks. I hope that the Westminster Government listens to the voice of the Government of Wales in this regard.

Concerns have been voiced about the effects of changes to regional broadcasting. The pattern of British television has been over-centralised for many years. Eighty per cent of programmes come from London and, in some classes, the figure is as high as 97 per cent. These figures relate to the BBC and independent television companies. HTV's presence in Wales has diminished as a result of commercial pressure and there is a danger that this tendency could become commonplace. There is a danger also that the power will go into the hands of a few tycoons

symud o'r meddylfryd sydd yn seiliedig ar yr honiad fod popeth da yn dod o Lundain; dylid datganoli, nid yn unig i Gymru ond i ranbarthau Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Ni fu digon o drafodaeth yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ar y mater hwn ac y mae angen i ni godi llais.

Mae hefyd yn ymddangos na wnaed digon o ymchwil ar effeithiau'r newidiadau yn y Mesur drafft o safbwynt diwylliant Cymru yn y ddwy iaith, ac yn wir o safbwynt lefel cynhyrchu rhaglenni yng Nghymru. Cyfeirir yn arbennig at sefyllfa unigryw cwmnïau bach annibynnol yng Nghymru sydd yn gwasanaethu S4C. Cyfeiriodd Owen John Thomas a nifer o siaradwyr eraill at gynrychiolaeth Cymru ar fwrdd Ofcom a phanel y defnyddwyr, yr angen i'r Cynulliad dderbyn adroddiadau'r cyngor cyfathrebu arfaethedig i Gymru, cyllido S4C a hawlfreintiau yn ymwneud ag is-deitlo. Nid wyf am ymhelaethu ar y materion hynny, ond yr oeddwn am gyfeirio at eu pwysigrwydd.

Ni ddylid diffodd y gwasanaeth analog yng Nghymru nes bod y targed o 95 y cant o bobl yng Nghymru yn gallu derbyn gwasanaeth digidol wedi'i gyflawni. Os yw hyn yn golygu bod yn rhaid defnyddio gwasanaeth lloeren mewn rhai ardaloedd, efallai y dylai pobl sy'n dibynnu ar offer lloeren i dderbyn y gwasanaeth digidol, ond heb allu fforddio hynny, dderbyn cymorth ariannol.

Ynglŷn â sefyllfa pobl anabl, dylid ymdrechu i sicrhau y cânt eu cynrychioli ar banel y defnyddwyr. Wrth i'r ddeddfwriaeth ddatblygu, mae angen ystyried sefyllfa unigryw Cymru. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn cael gwrandawriad yn San Steffan.

**Brian Gibbons:** I contribute to the consensus on this draft Communications Bill. The Welsh Assembly Government's response is a useful supplement to what is written in the Bill. As Jenny said, there are so many clauses and sections, it is almost like a digital television channel's schedule, or as that icon of US global cultural imperialism, Bruce Springsteen, said:

or media moguls in the independent sector. We need to move from the mindset based on the assumption that everything good comes from London; we should have devolution, not only to Wales, but also to English regions, Scotland and Northern Ireland. There has not been sufficient discussion in the House of Commons on this matter and we need to make our voice heard.

It also seems that not enough research was undertaken on the effects of the changes in the draft Bill in terms of Wales's culture in both languages and, indeed, in terms of the level of programme production in Wales. I refer specifically to the unique situation of small independent companies in Wales that serve S4C. Owen John Thomas and many others referred to Welsh representation on the Ofcom board and the consumer panel, to the need for the Assembly to receive reports from the proposed Wales communications council, the funding of S4C and copyright relating to subtitles. I will not expand on those issues, but I wanted to refer to their importance.

The analogue service should not be switched off in Wales until the target of 95 per cent of people in Wales being able to receive a digital service has been achieved. If this means having to use a satellite service in some areas, perhaps those who are dependent on satellite equipment to receive a digital service, but who cannot afford it themselves, should be given financial assistance.

On the situation of disabled people, an effort should be made to ensure that they are represented on the consumer panel. As the legislation develops, it needs to consider Wales's unique situation. I hope that the points made by the Government of Wales will be heard in Westminster.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cyfrannaf at y consensws ar y Mesur Cyfathrebu drafft hwn. Mae ymateb drafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn atodiad buddiol i'r hyn sy'n ysgrifenedig yn y Mesur. Fel y dywedodd Jenny, mae cymaint o gymalau ac adrannau, mae bron fel rhestr raglenni sianel deledu digidol, neu fel y dywedodd yr eicon hwnnw o imperialaeth ddiwylliannol fyd-eang yr Unol Daleithiau, Bruce Springsteen:

‘Fifty-seven channels and nothing on.’

As part of the consensus on this, I gather that Glyn Davies is also a Bruce Springsteen fan, which is a little surprising given that most of Springsteen’s songs are about blue-collar workers in the United States.

The Welsh Assembly Government’s response concentrates on filling in the Welsh dimension of the draft Communications Bill, which is appropriate if you have a quick run through it. However, we already know that in Wales, as Dafydd said, twice as many people do not receive an analogue signal as in the rest of the United Kingdom. Approximately 98.5 per cent receive an analogue signal in Wales compared with over 99.5 per cent in the UK as a whole. This unfortunate situation will not improve because the analogue signal coverage will not be increased in the roll-out of digital television. Indeed, that roll-out is likely to make the situation worse rather than improve it.

The analogue signal is likely to go off air when there is 95 per cent digital free-to-air coverage. However, if there is no change in the current Government’s attitude, up to 85 per cent of people in Wales will not be able to receive free-to-air digital coverage. Dafydd raised the point, which is also included in the Welsh Assembly Government’s response, that it is entirely correct to insist on regional coverage targets before the analogue signal is cut off and that, for example, we must be able to achieve a 95 per cent free-to-air digital coverage in Wales before the analogue signal is cut off. Even if we accept that regional target, there will still be over 100,000 people, possibly even 150,000, without digital coverage. These people are most likely to live in the dispersed rural communities of Wales or in the upper Valleys communities. Many such communities already experience high levels of social exclusion and their lack of access to digital television will exacerbate their sense of social exclusion. The Welsh Assembly Government commentary is correct to note that the proposed legislation makes no commitment to universal coverage before the analogue signal is turned off. We must fully

‘Fifty-seven channels and nothing on.’

Fel rhan o’r consensws ar hyn, deallaf fod Glyn Davies hefyd yn ffan Bruce Springsteen, sydd yn dipyn o syndod o gofio bod y rhan fwyaf o ganeuon Springsteen am weithwyr coler glas yn yr Unol Daleithiau.

Mae ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn canolbwyntio ar lunio y dimensiwn Cymreig i’r Mesur Cyfathrebu drafft, sy’n briodol os ewch drwyddo’n gyflym. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom eisoes, fel y dywedodd Dafydd, fod nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy’n methu derbyn signal analog ddwywaith yn uwch na’r nifer yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Oddeutu 98.5 y cant sy’n derbyn signal analog yng Nghymru o’i gymharu â thros 99.5 y cant yn y DU yn ei chyfanrwydd. Ni wnaiff y sefyllfa anffodus hon wella oherwydd ni chaiff y signal analog ei ledaenu ymhellach wrth i deledu digidol gael ei gyflwyno. Yn wir, mae’r cyflwyno hwnnw’n debygol o waethygu’r sefyllfa yn hytrach na’i gwella.

Mae’r signal analog yn debyg o gael ei ddiffodd pan fydd 95 y cant o bobl yn derbyn y gwasanaeth digidol sydd ar gael am ddim. Fodd bynnag, os na fydd y Llywodraeth bresennol yn newid ei hagwedd, bydd hyd at 85 y cant o bobl Cymru’n methu â derbyn y gwasanaeth hwnnw. Cododd Dafydd y pwynt—sydd hefyd wedi’i gynnwys yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—ei bod yn hollol gywir mynnu ar dargedau derbyniad rhanbarthol cyn diffodd y signal analog ac, er enghraifft, bod yn rhaid inni allu sicrhau bod 95 y cant o bobl yng Nghymru yn derbyn y gwasanaeth digidol sydd ar gael am ddim cyn y caiff y signal analog ei ddiffodd. Hyd yn oed os derbyniwn y targed rhanbarthol hwnnw, bydd hynny’n gadael dros 100,000 o bobl o hyd, efallai hyd yn oed 150,000, heb wasanaeth digidol. Mae’r bobl hyn yn fwyaf tebygol o fyw yng nghymunedau gwledig gwasgaredig Cymru neu yng nghymunedau uchaf y Cymoedd. Mae llawer o gymunedau o’r fath eisoes yn profi lefelau uchel o allgáu cymdeithasol a bydd eu diffyg mynediad at deledu digidol yn dwysáu eu teimlad eu bod wedi’u hallgáu’n gymdeithasol. Mae sylwebaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gywir i

support the Welsh Assembly Government's call that universal access to the digital signal be available to all, free of charge, before the analogue signal is turned off. There is no reason at this stage why we should not demand measures to provide reception to those communities that cannot receive the analogue signal. In virtually all cases in Wales, the current lack of satellite coverage could be remedied. However, this will cost hundreds of pounds for many in socially excluded areas, even though we have the prospect in the near future of the £100 digibox.

4:40 p.m.

Two options are open to us. First, either areas currently without analogue reception, which are unlikely to receive free-to-air digital reception in future, should be supplied with free digiboxes, as Dafydd mentioned, or, using clause 240 in part 4 of the draft Bill, the cost of the television licence should be varied to help meet the costs of securing satellite coverage. The other option is not included in the Welsh Assembly Government response, but there is merit in the Welsh Assembly Government including such an option in its submission to the UK Government.

**Peter Black:** As many have mentioned, the key issue is that the interests of Wales are properly served in the Communications Bill. That is why I am pleased by the Minister's early robust stance and the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Bill. For the UK Government, this is an important test of how well it understands devolution. It must recognise that Wales has specific media needs and problems, in particular our bilingual agenda, the future of S4C, and several other issues alluded to by other speakers. It is important that Wales has a voice in these structures and that our interests are represented by people appointed by the democratically elected voice of Wales, namely the National Assembly for Wales. In that context, I welcome the assertion in the

nodi nad yw'r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig yn gwneud dim ymrwymiad i dderbyniad i bawb cyn diffodd y signal analog. Rhaid inni gefnogi'n llwyr alwad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod rhaid i fynediad cyffredinol at y signal digidol fod ar gael i bawb, yn rhad ac am ddim, cyn y diffoddir y signal analog. Nid oes dim rheswm ar hyn o bryd pam na ddylem fynnu mesurau i ddarparu derbyniad i'r cymunedau hynny na all dderbyn y signal analog. Ym mhob achos bron yng Nghymru, gellid cywiro'r diffyg yng ngwasanaeth teledu lloeren cyffredol. Fodd bynnag, bydd hyn yn costio cannoedd o bunnoedd i lawer mewn ardaloedd sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n gymdeithasol, er ein bod yn edrych ar y tebygolrwydd y ceir blwch digidol am £100 yn y dyfodol agos.

Mae dau ddewis yn agored inni. Yn gyntaf, naill ai dylai ardaloedd sydd ar hyn o bryd heb wasanaeth analog, ac sy'n annhebygol o gael y gwasanaeth digidol sydd ar gael am ddim yn y dyfodol, gael blychau digidol am ddim, fel y soniodd Dafydd, neu, gan ddefnyddio cymal 240 yn rhan 4 y Mesur drafft, dylid amrywio cost y drwydded deledu i helpu talu costau sicrhau gwasanaeth lloeren. Nid yw'r dewis arall wedi'i gynnwys yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond mae rhywbeth i'w ddweud dros Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynnwys dewis o'r fath yn ei chyflwyniad i Lywodraeth y DU.

**Peter Black:** Fel y soniodd llawer, y mater allweddol yw y gwasanaethir buddiannau Cymru'n iawn yn y Mesur Cyfathrebu. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi fy mhlesio gan safiad cadarn cynnar y Gweinidog ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Mesur hwn. Prawf yw hwn ar ddealltwriaeth Llywodraeth y DU o ddatganoli. Rhaid iddi gydnabod bod gan Gymru anghenion a phroblemau penodol gyda'r cyfryngau, yn enwedig ein hagenda ddwyieithog, dyfodol S4C, a sawl mater arall y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan siaradwyr eraill. Mae'n bwysig fod gan Gymru lais yn y strwythurau hyn ac y cynrychiolir ein buddiannau gan bobl a benodir gan lais etholedig democrataidd Cymru, sef Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, croesawaf yr



Government response that Welsh representation on the content board and consumer board must be assured. We must have a statutory role in making appointments to Ofcom committees. Ofcom should have an office in Wales. The new body should ensure that the listing of restrictions on media ownership and other consolidation measures does not lead to broadcasting centres outside London becoming branch offices of London-centric or international operators, as the response states.

Reception issues, which have been touched upon, are also important and must be addressed by Ofcom. That is another reason why we need a representative body with a distinctive Welsh voice. Digital television is an important way forward in this regard, but it is not a panacea. As Brian and others have said, it may require Government intervention to ensure a full rollout across Wales before the switchover from analogue television.

Like Dafydd Wigley, I make a plea on behalf of disabled persons. It is important to clarify the copyright law with regard to subtitling. Until we do, a number of deaf people will be denied access to television. It is equally important that the consumer panels, as Dafydd mentioned, have representatives of deaf and partially sighted people on them so that they have an input into policy. Clearly, that is not just a Welsh issue, but a UK issue. However, it should form part of the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the UK Government on this matter.

The amendments address many of the issues that I have raised. However, I do not understand why some of them have been tabled, as the points raised are covered in the Welsh Assembly Government's response.

Television, in particular, has undergone a revolution in recent years, largely due to the onset of satellite and digital services. I believe that it is right that a new regulatory framework be established. However, that framework must take account of the Welsh context, and it is the UK Government's responsibility to ensure that that happens.

haerid yn ymateb y Llywodraeth fod yn rhaid sicrhau cynrychiolaeth i Gymru ar y bwrdd cynnwys a'r bwrdd defnyddwyr. Rhaid inni gael rôl statudol mewn gwneud penodiadau i bwyllgorau Ofcom. Dylai Ofcom gael swyddfa yng Nghymru. Dylai'r corff newydd sicrhau nad yw rhestru cyfyngiadau ar berchenogaeth cyfryngau a mesurau cydgyfnerthu eraill ddim yn arwain at droi canolfannau darlledu y tu allan i Lundain yn swyddfeydd cangen i weithredwyr Llundainig neu ryngwladol, fel y dywed yr ymateb.

Mae materion derbyniad, a grybwyllwyd, yn bwysig hefyd a rhaid i Ofcom roi sylw iddynt. Dyna reswm arall pam y mae arnom angen corff i'n cynrychioli gyda llais Gymreig amlwg. Mae teledu digidol yn ffordd bwysig ymlaen yn hyn o beth, ond nid yw'n foddion at bob clwyf. Fel y dywedodd Brian ac eraill, efallai y bydd angen i'r Llywodraeth ymyrryd i sicrhau gwasanaeth llawn ar draws Cymru cyn y diffoddir y signal analog.

Fel Dafydd Wigley, gwnaf apêl ar ran pobl anabl. Mae'n bwysig bod y ddeddf hawlfraint yng nghyd-destun is-deitlo yn cael ei hegluro. Hyd nes gwnawn hynny, bydd nifer o bobl fyddar yn methu mwynhau teledu. Mae yr un mor bwysig i'r panelau defnyddwyr, fel y soniodd Dafydd, gael cynrychiolwyr pobl fyddar a rhannol ddall arnynt fel y gallant gael mewnbwn i bolisi. Yn amlwg, nid mater Cymreig yn unig yw hwnnw, ond mater i'r DU. Serch hynny, dylai ffurfio rhan o ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Lywodraeth y DU ar y mater hwn.

Mae'r gwelliannau'n delio â llawer o'r materion a godais. Er hynny, nid wyf yn deall pam y cyflwynwyd rhai ohonynt, gan fod y pwyntiau wedi'u cynnwys yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Bu chwyldro ym maes teledu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn bennaf oherwydd dyfodiad gwasanaethau lloeren a digidol. Credaf ei bod yn iawn i sefydlu fframwaith rheoleiddio newydd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r fframwaith hwnnw ystyried y cyd-destun Cymreig, a chyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y DU yw sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Diwylliant a'r Amgylchedd (Delyth Evans):** Yr wyf yn falch i gael ymateb i drafodaeth mor gadarnhaol, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Aelodau mor gefnogol i ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Mesur Cyfathrebu. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed Owen John yn dweud ei bod yn anodd dod o hyd i fai yn ymateb y Llywodraeth; ni chlywn hynny'n aml ganddo, felly croesawaf hynny.

Soniodd Owen John am sefydlu corff i gynrychioli anghenion darlledu a rhaglennu Cymru. Dyna bwrpas cyngor cyfathrebu Cymru, yr ydym yn ei awgrymu yn ein hymateb. Nododd Glyn ei bod yn bwysig bod llais gwylwyr a darlledwyr yng Nghymru yn cael ei gynrychioli gan gorff o'r math hwn. Dyna ein bwriad wrth awgrymu sefydlu'r cyngor hwn yn ein hymateb.

I agree with Glyn that Wales should not be sidelined in terms of the Communications Bill. That is why the Welsh Assembly Government has responded as it has. I am pleased that Glyn welcomes it. The Wales communications council would be a way of addressing the concerns that you raised. We hope that that suggestion will be taken on board.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree that we should raise awareness among people in Wales, particularly on the borders, who can receive Welsh stations but choose not to do so? Do you agree that we should also raise awareness among bodies and institutions, such as hotels? It is wrong that guests in some hotels in Cardiff cannot access Welsh television, and therefore cannot see what is going on in the Assembly and appreciate the Welsh quality of life.

**Delyth Evans:** I agree that we must raise awareness. I represent a border region, and I often come across that problem.

Several Members mentioned the need for disabled viewers to be able to access programming, particularly people who are hard of hearing, as Karen mentioned. We have taken that important point on board.

**The Deputy Minister for Rural Affairs, Culture and the Environment: (Delyth Evans):** I am pleased to respond to such a positive debate, and I am pleased that Members are so supportive of the Assembly Government's response to the Communications Bill. I was pleased to hear Owen John say that it is difficult to fault the Government's response; we do not often hear him say that, so it is welcome.

Owen John mentioned establishing an organisation to represent Wales's broadcasting and programming needs. That is the purpose of the Wales communications council, which we suggest in our response. Glyn noted that it is important that the voice of viewers and broadcasters in Wales are represented by this kind of body. That was our intention in suggesting the establishment of this council in our response.

Cytunaf â Glyn na ddylai Cymru gael ei gwthio i un ochr yn nhermau'r Mesur Cyfathrebu. Dyna pam y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymateb fel y gwnaeth. Yr wyf yn falch fod Glyn yn ei groesawu. Byddai cyngor cyfathrebu Cymru'n ffordd o ateb y pryderon a godasoch. Gobeithiwn y derbynnir yr awgrym hwnnw.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A gytunwch y dylem godi ymwybyddiaeth ymysg pobl yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ar y gororau, a all dderbyn gorsafoedd Cymreig ond sy'n dewis peidio â gwneud? A gytunwch y dylem godi ymwybyddiaeth hefyd ymhlith cyrff a sefydliadau fel gwestai? Nid yw'n iawn na all gwsteion mewn rhai gwestai yng Nghaerdydd wyllo teledu Cymreig, ac felly na allant weld beth sy'n mynd ymlaen yn y Cynulliad a gwerthfawrogi'r bywyd Cymreig.

**Delyth Evans:** Cytunaf fod yn rhaid codi ymwybyddiaeth. Yr wyf fi'n cynrychioli ardal ar y ffin, a deuaif ar draws y broblem honno'n aml.

Soniodd sawl Aelod am yr angen i wylwyr anabl allu mwynhau rhaglenni, yn enwedig bobl drwm eu clyw, fel y soniodd Karen. Yr ydym wedi derbyn y pwynt pwysig hwnnw. Soniodd Peter Black, Dafydd Wigley ac eraill

Peter Black, Dafydd Wigley and others mentioned the importance of having an input into Ofcom's decision-making process.

Soniodd Dafydd am ddarparu rhaglenni rhanbarthol. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ceisio cyfleu'r pwynt hwn yn gryf i'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain. Mae darlledwyr yng Nghymru wedi sôn am hyn hefyd. Cytunaf â Dafydd ar hyn. Nid perchenogaeth cwmnïau sy'n bwysig, ond natur a safon y rhaglenni a ddarparant. Dyna'r hyn y dylid ei ddiogelu drwy gyfrwng y Mesur hwn, a dyna fwriad ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Mesur.

Dywedodd Dafydd Wigley, Brian Gibbons ac eraill fod yn rhaid mesur targedau cyrhaeddiad digidol ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Mae hyn yn bwysig, oherwydd mae cyrraedd lefel Brydeinig yn debygol o olygu y bydd Cymru ar ei cholled. Mae'n bwysig y mesurir y ganran ar lefel Gymreig. Yn ein hymateb gobeithiwn berswadio'r Llywodraeth i wneud hynny.

The Bill is still out to consultation, and there is a long way to go before it becomes law. I know that Brian has discussed the points he raised about free digiboxes or a reduction in television licence fees with the Minister for Culture. The Minister has taken those points on board. The Communications Bill is aimed at introducing a much lighter regulatory regime. It has been warmly welcomed by virtually everyone in the communications industry. It is in tune with the rapidly changing technology and market environment, and it is appropriate for the United Kingdom in the twenty-first century. The Assembly Government is making a positive input to this process.

am bwysigrwydd cael mewnbwn i broses benderfynu Ofcom.

Dafydd mentioned regional programming. The Assembly has tried to convey this point strongly to the Government in London. Broadcasters in Wales have also raised this issue. I agree with Dafydd on this. It is not the ownership of companies that is important, but the nature and quality of the programmes that they produce. That is what should be safeguarded through this Bill, and that is the intention of the Assembly Government's response to the Bill.

Dafydd Wigley, Brian Gibbons and others stated that digital coverage targets must be measured on an all-Wales level. That is important, as reaching the British level will probably mean that Wales will lose out. It is important that the percentage is measured on a Welsh level. In our response we hope to persuade the Government to do that.

Mae'r mesur yn parhau'n destun ymgynghoriad ac mae ffordd bell i fynd cyn y daw'n ddeddf. Gwn fod Brian wedi trafod y pwyntiau a gododd ynglŷn â blychau digidol am ddim neu ostyngiad yn y tâl am drwydded deledu gyda'r Gweinidog Diwylliant. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymgymryd â'r pwyntiau hynny. Nod y Mesur Cyfathrebu yw cyflwyno trefn reoleiddio lawer ysgafnach. Mae wedi cael croeso cynnes gan bawb, fwy neu lai, yn y diwydiant cyfathrebu. Mae'n gydnaws ag amgylchedd y farchnad a thechnoleg sy'n newid mor gyflym, ac mae'n briodol i'r Deyrnas Unedig yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i'r broses hon.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.  
Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue

Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd

Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 3, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 2: For 3, Abstain 1, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Ryder, Janet

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 3: For 17 Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
David, Davies  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 4: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter

Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 4, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 25.  
Amendment 5: For 4, Abstain 13, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Davies, Andrew  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.49 p.m.*

*The session ended at 4.49 p.m.*