

CONSULTATION PAPER
PERFORMANCE INDICATORS FOR BEST VALUE PROPOSALS FOR 2001 / 2002
List of responses received to letter on 1 December 2000. Deadline for responses 31 January 2001

Document Number	Date Received	Date / Form of Reply	Response Received From	Brief Description of Comments Received
1	25.01.2001	23.01.2001 (Letter)	G Iwan Huws Secretary - Welsh National Park Authorities	Supports Assembly' s aim to remove burden and confusion surrounding PI's. Generally content with indicators proposed. Note that two Audit Commission indicators relating to access for disabled are not in National Park list or identified as deleted.
2	17.01.01	16.01.2001 (Letter & e-mail)	D Keith Morgan Chairman - Consortium Local Authorities Wales (CLAW)	Detailed information regarding the work of CLAW and their benchmarking activities in property services.
3	23.01.01	23.01.2001 (Letter)	Geraint F Edwards Managing Director - Ynys Mon County Council	Support the removal of the requirement to produce a draft BVPP. Comment on specific indicators covering the Corporate Governance, Environment, Transport and Planning sets.
4	21.12.00	21.12.2001 (Letter)	T B Davies Assistant Chief Constable – Heddlu Gwent Police	Restricted comments to crosscutting community safety indicators and will be in a position to report position to central government on PI's 126-128 and 173.
5	18.12.2000	14.12.2000 (Letter)	David Bowen Secretary - Commission for Local Administration in Wales	Noted the intention to remove from PI's the number of complaints classified as local settlements. Suggests consideration be given to whether settlements could form a useful addition to other indicators to be retained.
6		19.12.2000 (Minute)	Huw Lloyd Jones, Estyn	Detailed comments on Education set of PI's. Supports the removal of some PI's.
7	29.01.2001	29.01.2001 (E-mail)	Mr T Sorsby - Blaenau Gwent CBC	Welcomes the streamlining / reduction of PI's. Raises the point that indicators, which are reported to other Government Departments, should be specified fully. Support the 30 June publication of the plan and removal of the draft requirement

8	26.01.2001	26.01.2001 (E-mail)	Norman Humphreys Principal Best Value and performance Management Unit - Neath Port Talbot CBC	Agreed the need for a reduced, streamlined and more focused set of statutory indicators, but comments that this may result in a loss of comparability created by a larger number of locally defined indicators. Reservations raised over the deletion of certain financial indicators and would welcome information on the situation with the Local Voices survey. Support the 30 th June BV performance Plan publication date and the removal of the need for a draft plan. Comments on other specific indicators.
9	26.01.2001	25.01.2001 (Letter)	Beverley Noon Operational Manager - Vale of Glamorgan Council	Welcome the reduction in the number of indicators, but do not support the re-numbering or amendment to the definitions of the indicators. The authority would welcome a confirmation of the situation of user satisfaction indicators.
10	29.01.2001	23.01.2001 (Letter)	Dr Jane Gilbert Chief Executive - The Composting Association	Responded to the Environment PI's. Detailed description regarding the actual definition of composting used in the PI's. Materials used as daily cover in landfills should not be included in the estimate of percentage materials composted. They give an alternative that could be used as a definition of composting.
11	26.01.2001	26.01.2001 (E-mail)	Pete Bland -Ramblers Association Wales	Concern over the proposal to abandon PI's regarding public rights of way namely sign-posting of paths leaving public roads and ease of use of Rights of Way. Concern that the Ramblers Association was not consulted directly.
12	15.01.2001	15.01.2001 (E-mail)	Mark Elliott Assistant Director Corporate Performance -Ceredigion County Council	E-mail requesting clarification on whether a draft BVPP was required to be published by 31.03.2001. Technical difficulties expressed regarding downloading of information from the NAW website.
13	30.01.2001	28.01.2001 (Letter)	Mr J W Stokes	Expresses opinion that all 172 indicators be published and remain in the public domain.

14	29.01.2001	29.01.2001 (Letter)	Peter Jones Biffa Waste Services	Agree that indicators should reduce burden whilst still providing meaningful data. Concern that balancing these requirements with the need to supply a sufficient range of performance data will be lost by the removal of some indicators. Specific comments on environment indicators.
15	30.03.2001	28.01.2001 (Letter)	Geoffrey Williams Dyfed Area Secretary – The Ramblers Association	Concern that the consultation document was not sent to the Ramblers Association Wales and disagrees with the proposal to reduce the number of indicators from 172 to 83. Concern at the removal of the indicators relating to public rights of way.
16	29.01.2001	29.01.2001 (E-mail)	Steven White - City and County of Swansea	Specific comments relating to indicators and definition wording with areas requiring clarification – comments against all sections.
17	30.01.2001	29.01.2001 (Letter)	Kate Ashbrook General Secretary - Open Spaces Society	Concerned that they did not receive a copy of the consultation document. Concerned about the removal of the indicators about sign posting and ease of use of footpaths. Notes that the DETR has also removed these indicators and subject to lobby had now re-instated them.
18	30.01.2001	29.01.2001 (Letter)	Mr David Foot	Opposed to the removal of indicators “percentage of footpaths...sign-posted where they leave the road and ease of use of footpaths by members of the public.” Dropping PI’s will deteriorate local authority performance in these areas.
19	30.01.2001	30.01.2001 (E-mail)	Russell Elliot Sustainable Development Policy Officer – Countryside Council for Wales	Welcomes the inclusion of a section on sustainable development for the first time. Disappointed that indicators on ‘rights of way’ are excluded. If removed local authorities will have no compulsion to publish their rights of way performance data. These indicators should be kept because of the NAW’s emphasis on cycling and walking.

20	30.01.2001	29.01.2001 (Letter)	Malgwyn Davies Chief Executive - Caerphilly County Borough Council	Support the 30 th June BVPP publication date. Welcomes the general approach and reduction in number of indicators. Some surprise at removal of a number of specific Indicators. Support the development of the library of local indicators but raise the point that the work undertaken by welsh local authorities for the library may offset any advantages gained by the reduced statutory set. Comments on housing indicators and planning indicators.
21	31.01.2001	29.01.2001 (Letter)	Brian Goffee Director of Policy Planning - The Sports Council for Wales	Smaller number of well defined indicators welcomed. Expect local authorities to use a larger set of measures to monitor daily activities. They seek some strategic outcome based indicators that will measure achievement rather than output. Specific suggestion of indicators and definitions.
22	1.2.01	31.1.01 (E-mail)	Gwynedd County Council	Disappointed at the delay in receiving the Welsh version of the consultation documents. Support the removal of the draft BVPP requirement and the intention for stability in the set of indicators. Concern at the removal of some financial input indicators with implications on the ability to make comparisons. Specific definitional questions.
23	31.1.01	31.1.01 (E-mail)	David & Anita Thomas Arfon & Dwyfor Footpath Secretaries – The Ramblers Association	Concern of the removal of right of ways indicators AC-P6a and AC-P6b
24	31.1.01	31.1.01 (E-mail)	Sue Gittins Deputy Director Wales – The Ramblers Association	Concern with removal of right of ways indicators AC-P6a and AC-P6b. Concern at organisation not being consulted
25	30.1.01	30.1.01 (Letter)	Peter Davies Footpath Officer – Llanelli Group of the Ramblers Association	Concern with removal of right of ways indicators AC-P6a and AC-P6b. Concern at organisation not being consulted. The marked difference in number of sign post since the introduction of statutory indicators
26	31.1.01	30.1.01 (letter)	H.E. Griffiths	Concern with removal of right of ways indicators AC-P6a and AC-P6b.
27	1.2.01	31.1.01 (Letter)	Steve Blake Regulatory Impact Unit - Cabinet Office Regulatory Impact Unit	Request that the Assembly adopt the trading standards indicator used by DETR in order to support the Home Office Enforcement concordant.

28	31.1.01	29.1.01 (Letter)	Allen Charlesworth Chief Executive - Trading Standards Institute	Concern that Wales is not adopting a BVPI for Trading standards – believe that FSA Plan adequately covers the inspection of food premises PI. Strongly recommend the inclusion of at least one indicator in this area.
29	30.1.01	(Letter)	Geoff Price Chairman North Western & Dave Sanders Chairman South Wales Branch – Trading Standards Institute	Concern at the lack of Trading Standards indicator and the need for a headline indicator in this area. Recommend that the checklist approach will be to provide a more meaningful comparison.
30	31.1.01	31.1.01 (E-mail)	Louis Mahendra – NM4 National Assembly for Wales	Views from discussions with representatives of the Welsh Association of Technical officers on the Transport indicators.
31	30.1.01	26.1.01 (Letter)	Stewart M Burgess Chair, Best Value Processes Sub Group - Welsh Association of Technical officers	Details annexes of the views of benchmarking clubs set up by the group on transport indicators, goes wider than the proposed set and proposes that the NAW take up their set of indicators.
32		30.1.01 (Email)	Andy Rees Wales Waste Policy Support Unit - Environment Agency	Email in response to meeting with Assembly environment officers. Specific comment on the use of household /municipal waste and also on kerbside collection In the environment section
33	30.01.01	30.1.01 (E-mail)	Composting Association	Duplication of response at 10.
34	31.1.01	31.01.01 (E-mail)	Sian Phipps Assembly Liaison officer - Environment Agency Wales	Highlights the overlap in the many forms of indicators currently in use and asks the Assembly for clarification. Concern that sustainable development issues have to be viewed across the whole set. Comments also made on Local agenda 21 plans and specific indicators.
35	26.1.01	26.1.01 (E-mail)	Andy Rees Environment Agency	Email to environment Assembly officials. Confirming Environment Agency agreement with Composting Associations comments.
36	30.01.01	30.01.01 (E-mail)	Bob Gilchrist – Director Environment Campaigns (Cymru) /Keep Wales Tidy	Concern that there are areas such as dog fouling, flytipping etc that are not been included in the environment set of Indicators. Suggested indicators for inclusion
37	30.1.01	30.01.01	Huw Evans Executive	Comments on the introduction of the NAW library standards.

		(E-mail)	Officer - Welsh Library Association	Concern with the remaining library PI and views on the changing use of libraries which needs to be reflected. Suggestion on improving the indicator.
38	31.1.01	30.1.01 (Letter)	Stan Rupa Head of local Government - Unison	Unconvinced that Best Value regime can deliver the support for performance measure. Concern over the growing level of audit and inspection and the burden of best value. Indicators are not focused on the public and definitions are obtuse. Failure to produce indicators that provide for the needs of customers and providers. Welcome the reduction in the number of indicators. Concern about the set of sustainable development/community safety indicators.
39	30.1.01	30.1.01 (E-mail)	Lowri Edwards Performance Co-ordinator - Ceredigion County Council	The authority will consider using removed indicators as local information. Indicator specific comments.
40	31.1.01	31.1.101 (Fax)	Phil Bevan Head of Policy – Pembrokeshire County Council	Support 30 th June plan publication date. Feel new numbering system and number of small amendments will not aid comparison. The council proposes that only deletion takes place and definition changes are left until next year as commented on in the Best Value Advisory group. Specific comments on individual indicators.
41	31.1.01	31.1.01 (Letter)	Dianne Bevan Corporate Manager - Cardiff County Council	Support removal of draft BV Performance Plan and welcomes the reduction of indicators with further scope for rationalisation. Concern over the shift away from the DETR PI's and ability to compare with English authorities.
42	1.2.01	30.1.01 (Letter)	John Wreford Corporate Chief Officer - Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council	Document focuses on Social Service indicators only. Concern over the integrating of BV and Policy Agreement Social Service Indicators and hope that the performance management framework will not require a duplication of effort.

43	01.02.01	01.02.01 (Letter) also e-mail version received 31.01.01	Joy Robson – Monmouthshire County Council	Welcomes the 30 th June for new publication date of BV Performance Plan, and also the reduction in number and focus of indicators as a more meaningful measure of performance. Also welcomed the library of Local PI's and quality of life PI's. Concerned over the consistency in definitions so that year on year comparison can take place. Disappointed at removal of user satisfaction information. View that indicators in Policy Agreements should match BV set. Views on specific indicators.
44	31.1.01	29.1.01 (Letter)	Ken Smith Head of Performance Management - Powys County Council	Support proposal to remove requirement to produce a draft BVPP and remain with 30 th June final publication. Applaud progress so far on development of PI's and rationalisation of Audit Commission BV PI's. Request stability in the indicators and unable to understand reasons behind some PI's being removed. Comments on specific indicators throughout set.
45	31.01.01	31.01.01 (Letter)	Ruth Rees Corporate Consultancy - Carmarthenshire County Council	Comment that the re-numbering of indicators and amendments to definitions will cause confusion and difficulty in comparison. Welcome the reduction in number of indicators. Stated view that cost based indicators provided useful measurement information to balance outcomes against the cost of providing a service. Unclear about collection of user satisfaction indicators in future years.
46	31.01.01	31.01.01 (E-mail)	Margaret Griffiths Customer Care Officer – Social Services and Housing Division Neath Port Talbot C.B.C.	Specific comments on Housing indicators.
47	01.02.01	01.02.01 (E-mail)	Charlie Nelson Principal Passenger Transport Officer - Welsh Region of the Association of Transport Co-ordinators	Welcome reduction in public transport indicators and commented that some authorities will continue to collect user satisfaction information.

48	01.02.01	01.02.01 (E-mail)	Urvashi Bramwell - Wrexham County Council	Support the composite set of indicators, but highlight the importance of retaining the ability to compare with authorities across the border. Support the 30 th June publication date and removal of draft requirement.
49	01.02.01	01.02.01 (Fax)	Chris Howell District Audit	View that the guidance should specify the information and targets that must be included in the BVPP. Concern at the move away from cost based indicators. Concern about the ability to perform comparison and the guidance should include instruction on comparison with Welsh/English authorities in their BVPP.
50	30.01.01	30.01.01 (e-mail)	Katie Doucet Best Value Policy Advisor - DETR	Concern at the 55% reduction in the number of education indicators and if the remainder will provide a meaningful set of information. Views on the removal of cost/efficiency indicators. Concern about the comparability of the remaining set.
51	01.02.01 02.0.201	01.02.01 (E-mail) 01.02.01 (Letter)	Steve Evans Head of Performance information - Audit Commission	Welcomes the inclusion of some of its original indicators and the proposed cross cutting themes. Concern in the divergence of sets in England and Wales and the impact on comparability. Concern of the removal of almost all cost indicators and make specific comments on a few indicators they would welcome being retained. Understand the wish to reduce burden, but in some areas a few more indicators are required to provide a more rounded picture.
52	31.01.01	31.01.01 (e-mail)	Stuart Neil Statistics Directorate NAW	Paper providing a view on the differing levels of performance indicators and the concept of what makes a good indicator. The existing indicators have been assessed to see how they conform to the criteria
53	01.02.01	01.02.01 (E-mail)	Rhys Dafis Welsh Language Board	Welcomes the reduction of indicators and the development of the local library. Specific comments on individual indicators from a linguistic equality viewpoint.
54	01.02.01	01.02.01 (E-mail)	Paul Charkiw - Syniad	Syniad welcomes the reduction in number of indicators and the streamlining of the sets. Some further work necessary on clarity of definitions and is a good basis for a fundamental review in future years.

55	01.02.01	01.02.01 (e-mail)	Amelia John Policy Officer - Disability Rights Commission	Welcome their inclusion in the consultation process. Specific views on existing indicators and suggestions of future indicators. Also the DRC are undertaking a project reviewing the most effective way of including disability equality within Best Value and the Performance Indicators.
56	02.02.01	30.01.01 (Letter)	Susan Samuel Assistant Education Officer - Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council	Note emphasis on quality and standards in education and will continue to collect cost based indicators for management purposes. The removal of cost indicators may cause difficulty in future comparison.
57	02.02.01	02.02.01 (e-mail)	Rona Aldrich Vice President – Society of Chief Librarians (Wales)	Welcome the streamlining of reporting and the proposed cross cutting indicators and the support it will provide to community planning. They are pleased that the consultation on Library standards is looking to link with Best Value. They doubt the retention of only one indicator in this area is sufficient to provide a meaningful measure of performance.
58	02.02.01	02.02.01 (e-mail)	Cheryl Barclay - Bridgend County Borough Council	Welcome streamlining of the sets of indicators and the reduction in overall number. An appendix was attached giving Manchester LEA view on the difficulties and approaches to take with reporting financial and academic years information.
59	05.02.01	01.02.01 (Letter)	Nia Morgan Senior Development Manager - Equal Opportunities Commission	View that an indicator should be included that relates to the implementation of Equal Opportunity policy with the authority. They have attached draft version of the EOC document to assist LA's to produce a generic equality standard.
60	05.02.01	03.02.01 (Letter)	MR W Parker	Concern that the Ramblers Associations were not consulted Strongly protest at removal of the 2 Audit Commission indicators regarding footpaths and rights of way.
61	05.02.01	05.02.01 (e-mail)	Aneurin Phillips - Planning Officers Society for Wales	Specific comment on the planning suite of indicators
62	06.02.01	05.02.01 (e-mail)	Frances Medley Acting Chief Executive - The Arts Council for Wales	Focuses on Cultural Services, and makes reference to the Assembly's " Culture in Common" report.

63	06.02.01	06.02.01 (e-mail)	Jesse James	Concern over the proposal to abandon PI's regarding public rights of way namely 'sign-posting of paths leaving public roads' and 'ease of use of Rights of Way'.
64	06.02.01	05.02.01 (letter)	Ron Williams Secretary The Ramblers Association – North Wales area	Concern over the proposal to abandon PI's regarding public rights of way namely 'sign-posting of paths leaving public roads' and 'ease of use of Rights of Way'.
65	07.02.01	07.02.01 (e-mail)	Dave Beynon – Association of Transport Co-ordinators	Reduction of PI's welcome. Specific comment of the transport set of indicators
66	07.02.01	07.02.01 (e-mail)	Rachel Brookes Housing Access Manager - Conwy County Council	Specific question on the definition of a Housing indicator.
67	30.01.01	29.01.01 (letter)	Elwyn Moseley Commissioner of The Commission for Local Administration in Wales	Refers to BVPI 5b, Noted the intention to remove the number of complaints classified as local settlements. Suggests consideration be given to whether settlements could form a useful addition to other indicators to be retained.
68	08.02.01	01.02.01 (letter)	Roman Leszczyszyn – National Executive Institute of consumer Affair	Specific comment of the environmental health indicator and concern at the lack of Pi's covering trading standards
69	08.02.01	07.02.01 (letter)	Joan Mills – Secretary of Rhodwyr Llyn Ramblers Association	Concerns about removal of the rights of way Audit Commission indicators from the consultation document.
70	08.02.01	07.02.01 (e-mail)	John Marsh – Association for Public Services Excellence (APSE)	Welcomes the reduction in indicators, but points out the issue of comparability of local performance measures. Request the Assembly stabilise the set in order to facility comparability. APSE has developed a Performance Network of practitioners covering most service areas.
71	09.02.01	09.02.01 (letter)	Ian Chapman	Concerns about removal of the rights of way Audit Commission indicators from the consultation document.
72	09.02.01	09.02.01 (letter)	Geoff Elliot (secretary)– The Ramblers Association – Meirionnydd Committee	The indicators on footpaths are a very useful tool to show what resources are needed to keep the footpath network in a satisfactory state. Especially useful in Gwynedd due to the location of Snowdonia National Park.
73	12.02.01	12.02.01 (letter)	Harold & Rene Hayes - Ramblers Association	Concerned about the removal of indicators concerning 'rights of way survey' and the 'sign posting of footpaths where

				leaving a metalled road'.
74	09.02.01	12.09.01 (letter)	Karen Jones South Wales Police	Confirm that the final DETR set of indicators varies from the indicators set out in our consultation document.
75	09.02.01	12.02.01 (e-mail)	Emma Parry Denbighshire County Council	Specific comments on the planning set of indicators.
76	12.02.01	12.02.01 (Letter)	Nancy Saville	Concerned about the 'Rights of Way' PI's removal.
77	12.02.01	12.02.01 (e-mail)	Rosemary Yale – Chair of Campaign for the Protection of Rural Wales	Concerned about the 'Rights of Way' PI's removal.