



Policy Review:  
Welsh Language  
in Education

Contents	Page
----------	------

## Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education

### Education and Lifelong Learning

Introduction	1
Early years	1
Primary schools	2
Secondary schools	5
Further education colleges	8
Welsh for adults	9
Work-based training	10
Careers	11
Local education authorities	12
Initial teacher training	14
Dual literacy in schools	16
Recommendations	17

**POLICY REVIEW: WELSH LANGUAGE IN EDUCATION**

**EDUCATION AND LIFELONG LEARNING COMMITTEE: 24 April 2002**

**Introduction**

Estyn is Her Majesty's Inspectorate for Education and Training in Wales. Estyn inspects provision in all sectors of education and training in Wales with the exception of higher education but including initial teacher training in institutions of higher education.

The purpose of this paper is to provide a summary of Estyn's perspective on the policy review of the Welsh language in education. It addresses all sectors of education and training inspected by Estyn. It sets out relevant evidence, outlines what works and identifies areas of concern, leading to a final set of recommendations. It is intended to support the presentation to be made to the Committee by the Chief Inspector of Estyn on 24 April 2002.

**1. Early years**

**Evidence**

Nearly all young children aged three to five receive some form of early years education in either the maintained or non-maintained sector and for either all or part of each day.

Our evidence from inspection of the maintained sector shows that young children make good progress in the development of their language, literacy and communication skills. In designated Welsh-medium and bilingual schools pupils aged three to five often receive a good foundation for the development of their fluency in Welsh. This is the case even when they come from homes where English is the sole language. In English-medium schools, many young children also receive some early experience of Welsh that introduces them to the use of Welsh in everyday settings.

Young children also receive some support in learning Welsh in voluntary, private and independent settings in the non-maintained sector. About 20% of young children attend Welsh-medium playgroups within the non-maintained sector. However, there are no precise figures available

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

on the total number of young children receiving some early experience in learning Welsh in the English-medium non-maintained sector.

In the Welsh-medium non-maintained sector, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin (MYM) is effective in helping young children to establish good foundations in the Welsh language. It provides immersion teaching and support in the Welsh language for children from Welsh-speaking homes and some English-speaking homes. MYM also works effectively with young children who speak English as an additional language who are mainly from ethnic minority families in urban centres such as Cardiff, Swansea and Newport.

**What works well?**

Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin has proved its ability to provide a firm grounding in Welsh for young children who do not speak Welsh at home. This has thereafter given parents the choice of sending their children to either English-medium or Welsh-medium schools.

When children of pre-school age learn Welsh it often provides a valuable opportunity for them to begin to be aware of the distinctiveness of Wales, its languages and its culture. It also provides a valuable preparation for a child's learning of Welsh at key stage 1. Young children often benefit greatly from the use of Welsh in play, role-play and structured activities across the sector.

ACCAC's 'Desirable Outcomes' and the production of guidelines by some LEAs on the six areas of learning have helped teachers to foster pupils' language skills and this can include their bilingual skills. Some Early Years Partnerships in LEAs have improved planning for Welsh-medium education for young children.

**Main areas of concern**

- There is not enough reliable information on the extent of learning of Welsh by young children in the non-maintained sector.
- Not enough detailed guidance is generally available for playgroup and nursery leaders about constructing a curriculum in a bilingual setting or in developing children's competence in a second or third language.

## **2. Primary schools**

### **Welsh first language**

#### **Evidence**

Inspection evidence (2000-2001) shows that standards in Welsh first language are good or very good in 53% of classes in key stage 1 and in 43% of classes in key stage 2. There are no classes in key stage 1 where standards are unsatisfactory. In key stage 2, 7% of classes are unsatisfactory.

National Curriculum assessments reflect these good standards. In key stage 1, the proportion of pupils gaining level 2 or above in Welsh first language is around 86%. In the lowest performing LEA (Flintshire), the percentage is 79% while in the highest performing LEA (Wrexham) the percentage is 93%.

The proportion of pupils gaining level 3 has increased significantly over the last five years (from 18% in 1996 to 25% in 2001). The largest increase has been in reading (from 17% to 28%) with smaller increases in oracy (from 19% to 24%) and writing (from 6% to 10%).

In key stage 2, the proportion of pupils gaining level 4 or above in Welsh first language is around 70%. In the lowest performing LEA (Anglesey), the proportion is 60% while in the highest performing LEA (Cardiff) it is 82%. This variation can be explained partly by the fact that a far higher proportion of pupils sit the test in Welsh as a first language in Anglesey, whereas the pupils in Cardiff are all in a small number of designated Welsh-medium schools.

There has been a similar increase in the proportion of boys and girls achieving level 4 over the last five years (about 17 percentage points in both cases). However, the proportion of boys achieving level 5 (15%) is a great deal lower than the proportion of girls (26%).

#### **What works well to improve writing?**

Schools where standards in writing are good often make strong links between the various language modes (oracy, reading and writing). For example, when pupils have opportunities to form sentences, to describe and express viewpoints orally before writing them down, there is often a beneficial effect on the quality and accuracy of their written work.

Focused visits by athrawon bro can also help to enrich pupils' writing. In the best practice, these are usually weekly visits to work with a class for a part or the whole of a session during which pupils 'brainstorm' ideas orally with the teacher and gather relevant descriptions, idiomatic phrases and vocabulary.

These strategies, linked with writing frames and a reference list of useful patterns, vocabulary and idiomatic phrases, have led to improved standards in writing in many Welsh-medium and bilingual schools.

### **What works well to improve reading?**

Schools where standards in reading are good often have an up-to-date supply of Welsh books (fiction and non-fiction) that cater for the needs of a wide variety of interests. Attention is given to the interests of boys in the school, recognising the particular need to engage boys in reading. Some schools also adopt strategies to explore and exploit books more widely, for example as a basis for oral development and drama work, for work in personal and social education and as a source of personal enrichment. They often use the school's wider community to make reading fun and to give it high status. Parents and other adults read extracts from their favourite children's books and they prepare 'book sacks'<sup>1</sup> for infant children to promote curiosity about reading. Local celebrities talk about the books they used to enjoy reading when they were young and authors visit schools to work with pupils on composing new books or alternative endings to books that the children have already read.

Paired and group reading programmes work well in many schools. This strategy makes more books accessible to readers of limited fluency and promotes the pleasure of reading for all.

### **Main areas of concern**

- The standard of pupils' writing in Welsh is often not good enough.
- Pupils' personal reading in Welsh is often limited.

---

<sup>1</sup> 'Book sacks contain a variety of artefacts and objects associated with the books, for example puppets, games, tapes of fathers/men reading extracts.

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

- Too few boys achieve excellence in Welsh at the end of key stage 2.

### **Welsh second language**

#### **Evidence**

Inspection evidence indicates that Welsh second language is one of the subjects where standards highest in key stage 1 and lowest key stage 2. In key stage 1, standards are good or very good in 57% of classes and unsatisfactory in about 2% of classes. In key stage 2, standards are good or very good in 44% of classes and unsatisfactory in 11% of classes.

#### **What works well?**

The schools and settings (including language centres) where standards are good often set themselves a clear objective, namely that pupils will become fluent in Welsh in everyday situations by the end of key stage 2. In order to achieve this, they set out from year to year the language patterns, functions and vocabulary that pupils will need to learn. They teach these thoroughly and consistently and build on pupils' knowledge and skills from class to class as they progress through the school.

Language centres for non-speakers of Welsh who are new to Welsh-speaking areas and to Welsh-medium education often work effectively. These centres provide learners with an intensive language course over one to two terms (full-time or part-time). As much of the work is cross-curricular, the pupils learn to use their newly-acquired language in a range of contexts and situations from the start. This prepares them well to join bilingual/Welsh-medium classes when they return to their primary schools.

#### **Main areas of concern**

- Pupils are not making enough progress in Welsh as a second language and are too often unable to converse in Welsh in key stage 2.
- It is not clear enough to schools what language patterns, functions, terms and vocabulary need to be taught to each year group in key stage 2 to build progressively on their skills.
- In many schools, in spite of the good work done in providing training for teachers and their commitment

to delivering the mandatory programme of Welsh, pupils are not able to use Welsh second language in the other subjects of the curriculum. Consequently they are not able to transfer successfully to Welsh-medium or bilingual education if they so wish.

- Teaching Welsh second language, especially at key stage 2, remains a great challenge for primary school teachers who are not themselves fluent Welsh speakers.

### **3. Secondary schools**

#### **Welsh first language**

##### **Evidence**

Inspection evidence shows that standards are generally good. The percentage of classes with good or very good standards is higher in Welsh (65%) than in any other National Curriculum subject. No classes have unsatisfactory standards. The percentage of classes with good or very good teaching is also the highest of all National Curriculum subjects (69%). Teaching is unsatisfactory in 3% of classes.

In key stage 3, 71% of pupils achieve level 5 or better (compared with 62% in English). The LEAs with large numbers of Welsh speakers (Gwynedd, Anglesey and Carmarthenshire) have better scores for Welsh than for English.

In key stage 4, 72% of pupils who entered GCSE Welsh first language achieved A\*-C grades while the comparable figure for English was about 56%.

The proportion of pupils who are taught and assessed in Welsh first language in key stages 3 and 4 varies enormously between LEAs in traditionally Welsh speaking areas. In Gwynedd, for example, 78.5% of the Year 9 cohort is assessed in Welsh first language as a subject, whereas in Carmarthenshire it is only 29%. In Year 11 in Gwynedd, 82% are taught Welsh as a first language whereas in Carmarthenshire it is only 28.5%. (These figures are based on key stage 3 and key stage 4 results for 2001).

Too many pupils in bilingual secondary schools follow Welsh second language courses and sit GCSE Welsh second language even though they may have undertaken National Curriculum assessment in key stage 2 and key stage 3 in Welsh first language. This strategy serves to boost

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

schools' overall results, with more pupils gaining A\*-C in Welsh second language. However, in terms of pupils' progression in the Welsh language, this is an artificial boost and they receive less of a challenge as a result. Designated Welsh schools do not offer this choice. One way to address this anomaly would be to review the structure of external assessment and offer dual accreditation of attainment to pupils at examinations such as GCSE so that pupils might be awarded grades for their attainment in Welsh both as a first and a second language.

**What works well?**

Schools where standards are good build effectively on pupils' prior attainment in the language. Staff in these schools have often benefited from clear guidance and training in how to offer bilingual provision and how to develop pupils' language skills in all subjects of the curriculum.

These schools also work hard to improve parents' understanding of the educational benefits of bilingualism for their children. The most successful bilingual schools produce whole-school language policies and explanatory booklets for parents.

**Main areas of concern**

- In some areas of Wales, a large proportion of pupils from Welsh-speaking areas of Wales are not taught Welsh as a first language.
- Too many pupils sit GCSE Welsh second language when they have undertaken National Curriculum assessment in Welsh first language in key stage 2 and key stage 3.
- The proportion of pupils entered for GCSE Welsh first language and achieving A\*-C grades at GCSE is too low.

**Welsh second language**

**Evidence**

Inspection evidence shows that the proportion of key stage 3 classes with good or very good standards in Welsh second language (37%) is amongst the lowest in the National Curriculum subject. Standards are unsatisfactory or poor in 12% of classes. The proportion of classes with good or very good teaching (45%) is also

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

lower than in any other National Curriculum subject and teaching is unsatisfactory in 12% of classes.

Nearly all pupils (99%) are now taught Welsh either as a first or second language up to and including key stage 4. This reflects the mandatory position of Welsh in the key stage 4 curriculum. In 1992, only 35% of pupils were taught Welsh.

More than half the pupils learning Welsh second language in key stage 4 follow the 'short course' route. In most cases, this means a lesson of about an hour's duration in Welsh second language per week. It is sometimes less than this. The quality of this 'short course' experience is often unsatisfactory. In 2001, the proportion of pupils entered for the full GCSE course in Welsh second language was 31%. The 19% entered for the short course represents an increase of 9 percentage points since 1999.

Sixty-three per cent of pupils entered for full GCSE in Welsh second language achieved A\*-C grades. However, only 35% of those entered for the short course gained A\*-C and most of these gained a C grade. Nevertheless, the short course A\*-C result in Welsh was better than that in either French or German.

About one in three pupils (37%) who follow courses in Welsh as a second language in Year 11 do not enter any examination leading to a mainstream qualification in Welsh. Welsh second language full and short course entries account for nearly 50% of the Year 11 cohort, Welsh first language entries account for 13% and CoEA entries account for about 3% of the cohort.

Many Welsh second language teachers are not language specialists, but they can speak Welsh and they often teach it as a second language because of the lack of Welsh specialists available. These teachers are often effective and enthusiastic, but they do not all have clear training and guidance about how best to maximise pupils' learning in the language.

**What works well?**

Pupils often make more effective progress in schools where there is a flexible model of bilingual delivery. This includes both teaching Welsh as a subject and using Welsh as a medium for teaching other subjects, especially practical subjects.

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

Some secondary schools in south-east Wales have developed innovative curricular patterns for the effective delivery of Welsh. For example, they provide a small amount of bilingual teaching in subjects other than Welsh in key stage 3 and intensive courses in Welsh in either key stage 3 or key stage 4. This strategy helps to raise standards quickly and successfully. Athrawon bro are often effective in supporting intensive and innovative projects (although athrawon bro work mostly in primary schools).

**Main areas of concern**

- Standards in Welsh second language are too low in key stage 3 and key stage 4. In particular, not enough pupils are able to achieve fluency in the second language by the end of key stage 3.
- Too many pupils fail to enter an examination in Welsh second language at the end of Year 11.
- There is not enough continuity and progression between the key stages, especially key stage 2 and key stage 3, with too many pupils transferring from Welsh medium to English medium provision.
- It is important to learn more from effective models of delivery, for example short intensive courses, which have generally proved more effective and efficient than 'drip-feed' approaches.
- There has not been enough research into the possibility of offering dual accreditation for pupils' attainment in Welsh first language and Welsh second language, at GCSE level particularly.

**4. Further education colleges**

**Evidence**

Fewer than 2% of all students in FE colleges have their work assessed through the medium of Welsh. This is despite the substantial increase in recent years in the numbers of pupils who receive their secondary education through the medium of Welsh and who progress to colleges of further education.

There has been an increase in the number of colleges with Welsh language schemes. These colleges are mainly in

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

north and west Wales (they include Coleg Menai, Coleg Meirion Dwyfor, Coleg Llysfasi, Coleg Llandrillo and Coleg Sir Gâr). Their language schemes include specific timetables for extending the range of courses, or parts of courses, offered through the medium of Welsh.

Although there has also been some progress in a few colleges in the south east, such as Coleg Pontypridd, where more Welsh medium or bilingual routes are being developed, our evidence shows limited progress overall.

**What works well?**

There are examples of good practice in a few colleges in the provision of courses through the medium of Welsh or bilingually, most notably in Coleg Meirion Dwyfor, Coleg Llysfasi and Coleg Menai. Coleg Llandrillo, Coleg Sir Gâr and Pontypridd College are expanding their provision. Many other colleges could benefit from developing similar patterns of provision.

There has been an increase in the quantity and range of resources available for teaching in the Welsh language or bilingually over recent years. There has been a particularly positive growth in useful multi-media materials available via the internet from the Coleg Digidol. Their production has been funded by ELWa.

The Further Education National Training Organisation has recently published its 'Standards for Bilingual Teaching and Supporting Bilingual Learning'. These have yet to impact fully on the sector.

**Main areas of concern**

- Too few pupils continue learning through the medium of Welsh when they move from secondary school to further education, partly because too few bilingual or Welsh medium courses are offered.
- Too few students are assessed through the medium of Welsh in further education.

**5. Welsh for adults**

**Evidence**

The National Council is responsible for funding the Welsh for adults provision. The provision involves a wide range of providers who work together in eight consortia.

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

The consortia comprise every provider of Welsh for adults within a specific catchment area. The consortia were established in 1994 to co-ordinate and develop the provision strategically.

The demand for Welsh for adults provision has increased significantly, from 13,300 students registered for courses in 1994 to 21,011 in 2001. Most students are working towards levels 1 and 2.

Our evidence (2000-2001) indicates that all providers of Welsh for adults deliver courses of at least satisfactory quality. Standards of work are mostly good at all levels.

**What works well?**

Intensive courses, such as 'wlpan' and short-term residential courses, have been particularly effective in helping adults to learn Welsh.

**Main areas of concern**

- Not enough learners progress to higher level courses. Many are content to consolidate their learning at the same level for too long. Many are people who undertake Welsh learning in their leisure time and do not feel the need to progress to higher levels.
- Too many learners drop out of beginners' classes, often because they do not appreciate how demanding it is to learn until they start.
- In some areas there are too many providers competing for the same clients.
- In many areas it is difficult for providers to recruit suitable tutors to meet local needs. Tutors often need more training and guidance and would benefit from a structured national route for teaching/tutoring at every level.
- The provision for Welsh in the workplace is uneven across consortia. Some providers offer little or nothing, while others respond better to needs.

**6. Work-based training**

## **Evidence**

Inspection evidence shows that few trainees complete any part of their training or assessment bilingually or through the medium of Welsh, even in the traditional Welsh-speaking areas. Many trainees from Welsh-medium or bilingual schools decide to switch completely to English for their training. Often, providers do not do enough to determine the demand for bilingual training, nor do they do enough to promote it actively. Where demand for bilingual training is identified during induction or at the interview stage, providers try to meet that demand but often have difficulty in getting hold of Welsh medium materials and assessors.

Few National Training Organisations and awarding bodies produce materials bilingually. Where training does take place in Welsh or bilingually, providers often produce their own bilingual training, assessment and reference materials, including those for key skills development.

Providers often miss opportunities to promote bilingualism, even when they occur naturally in the workplace.

## **What works well?**

Learners make good progress where occupational standards have been translated into Welsh and there are Welsh-speaking trainers who can support the work. Some work placements operate effectively through the medium of Welsh and help trainees to keep and improve their language skills.

## **Main areas of concern**

- Not enough trainees develop their skills during training through the medium of Welsh or bilingually. There is not enough provision in training to offer progression from Welsh-medium or bilingual schools at the end of key stage 4.
- Many trainees work in places where Welsh is the day-to-day language. Most trainers and assessors are happy to talk informally or to hold interviews or reviews in Welsh, but few are confident to train or assess through the medium of Welsh.
- There is a lack of relevant Welsh-medium materials to support training and assessment through the medium of

Welsh and to support the everyday language of many workplaces.

## **7. Careers**

### **Evidence**

Our evidence shows that young people and parents have more and more access to Welsh-medium materials to help them think about careers. In general, careers companies are responding positively to the Welsh-language needs of their clients, but they often struggle to provide Welsh-medium secondary schools with Welsh-speaking advisers in all cases. Most companies are working hard to resolve this issue, some with more success than others. In careers work, there is not enough labour market information available on the value of Welsh in the workplace or the demand for bilingual staff.

Careers companies are working with other agencies to take the Welsh language agenda forward.

### **What works well?**

In the best instances, young people and their parents have ready access to a good range of bilingual information booklets and publications to help them plan for future careers.

If they choose, young people and parents can receive interviews through the medium of Welsh and receive telephone advice in Welsh from careers companies.

Sometimes, companies highlight occupations where there is a shortage of Welsh speakers when advising Welsh speakers.

Young people and parents can receive career action plans in Welsh if they want them.

### **Main areas of concern**

- Not all companies are proactive enough in linking bilingualism to employment opportunities.
- The demand for bilingual careers services in secondary schools is not met in all cases.

## 8. Local education authorities

### Evidence

Local education authorities (LEAs) have a responsibility for supplying sufficient school places. This includes Welsh-medium and bilingual provision 'in balance with demand' (betterwales.com). LEAs publish school organisation plans to cover a 5-year period with updates every year.

LEAs are required to publish Welsh language schemes and submit them to the Welsh Language Board.

As a result of the 1980 Education Act, funding was allocated to LEAs to support Welsh-medium education. A team of area teachers (athrawon bro) was established to support the teaching of Welsh. Funding for this service has been supplemented by grants for education, support and training (GEST). Most LEAs have an athrawon bro team that operates in the primary and/or the secondary sector. The athrawon bro are currently funded via grants, with the Welsh Language Board contributing 75% of the allocation and the LEAs 25%. Grants are awarded according to four priority areas:

- athrawon bro;
- centres for latecomers;
- residential language courses; and
- pilot projects.

LEAs have a responsibility to provide support services and in-service education and training (INSET) for schools, including Welsh-medium and bilingual schools.

Evidence shows that there are not enough materials to support Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching and learning. A similar situation exists in relation to the teaching and learning of Welsh as a second language. LEAs have for many years developed and published their own materials according to locally perceived needs. In the past, these materials have been shared with other LEAs mainly through Welsh advisers. However, budgets are now more strained and LEAs tend to produce only enough resources to meet their own needs. Across Wales, this results in much duplication of effort and resources.

School organisation plans do not always include enough planning information about provision for Welsh-medium and

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

bilingual pupils. Even in LEAs where there is a growing demand for Welsh-medium and bilingual provision, there is too little analysis of trends and not enough forward planning. For example, where numbers in bilingual primary schools are increasing, there is often not enough planning for bilingual secondary provision.

In traditionally Welsh-speaking areas, there is often a lack of continuity between bilingual provision in the primary and secondary sectors. Pupils who have been learning subjects through the medium of Welsh or bilingually in primary schools are often provided with limited choices to continue with their Welsh-medium and bilingual learning in secondary schools. Some subjects are taught exclusively through the medium of English even in Welsh -medium schools, thus eroding much of the good work achieved in the primary sector.

The demands on athrawon bro are often great. In some English-speaking areas, they are the main teachers of Welsh in the National Curriculum. They also provide INSET for English-speaking primary teachers to enable them to teach the language themselves in their classrooms. In Welsh-speaking areas, they support Welsh-medium education and are often the main proponents of innovation and good practice. They also often bear the main responsibility for successful integration of English-speaking latecomers through their work in the language centres.

Few LEAs have the personnel to undertake INSET work exclusively, and fewer still have the number of Welsh-speaking staff necessary to support Welsh-medium and bilingual schools effectively. Cross-county agencies have been established following reorganisation in 1996 to carry out most of this work on behalf of the LEAs. However, only one or two agencies across Wales are able to support Welsh-medium, bilingual and English-medium schools equally effectively, and offer INSET in both English and Welsh across all NC subjects.

**What works well?**

Partnerships between LEAs help to deliver Welsh-medium and bilingual INSET effectively. Cross-county agencies, for example Cynnal and Cymdeithas Ysgolion Dros Addysg Gymraeg, are also effective in this respect. Collaborative working and partnerships are also useful in disseminating and sharing materials and resources. However, this kind of inter-authority work is limited to a few LEAs; many bilingual schools in other areas find it

difficult to gain access to relevant and specific INSET that takes account of their bilingual needs.

Many Welsh language schemes show how authorities intend to make increasing use of Welsh in administration and management, for example in procuring translation services so that more bilingual documents can be distributed to schools.

#### **Main areas of concern**

- There is still a relative lack of Welsh-medium and bilingual materials to support effective teaching and learning, although much good work has been done.
- LEAs do not always plan provision for Welsh-medium and bilingual pupils with enough rigour and detail.
- There are not enough advisers and/or athrawon bro across Wales to support fully the growth of Welsh-medium and bilingual provision.
- Continuity between primary and secondary schools in Welsh language provision is often weak. This undermines pupils' progress and erodes the progress many have made.

### **9. Initial teacher training**

#### **Evidence**

There are eight higher education institutions in Wales that provide initial teacher training (ITT) courses in partnership with schools. Most Welsh-medium training takes place at Aberystwyth, Bangor or Trinity College, Carmarthen. Some trainees in other institutions also receive additional funding to help them teach in Welsh in secondary schools. All providers offer some training or support for trainees who wish to teach in Welsh, although the extent of this support varies a great deal.

Seven providers (all except the North East Wales Institute) offer secondary courses, of which four (Aberystwyth, Bangor, Swansea and the University of Wales Institute Cardiff) provide courses for teaching Welsh as a subject. In two providers (Aberystwyth, Bangor), trainees can train in most secondary subjects through the medium of Welsh. For primary courses, all providers offer the opportunity to learn Welsh as a second language

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

and take up is generally extensive. Many English-speaking trainees opt to learn Welsh as part of their training. Many of these make good progress in their ability to use Welsh in their teaching. Training often combines the teaching of Welsh with the provision of a valuable insight into the methods of teaching it as a second language. A small number of Welsh-speaking trainees choose not to train to teach in Welsh. There is scope for encouraging these trainees to use more Welsh in their training.

The most recent inspection evidence (Aberystwyth and Trinity) shows that the standard of trainees' Welsh-medium teaching is similar to that of their English-medium teaching. Trainees teaching in Welsh understand the needs of bilingual pupils. Their planning and teaching are usually effective in helping pupils develop in both languages. Competence in written and oral Welsh is good for primary trainees and satisfactory for secondary trainees. Trainees who receive training to teach in Welsh participate well in Welsh-medium discussions. These trainees generally complete their written assignments to a good standard and acquire a firm grasp of subject and education terms in Welsh.

Recent evidence shows that the quality of college-based training for teaching in Welsh is often good in most subject areas. On primary courses, trainees can study most subjects in Welsh. Tutors usually provide a very good language model. In the best primary practice, the common ground between teaching in both languages is often emphasised. On secondary courses, in a few subjects where the bulk of the direct training is only available in English, there is not always enough support for trainees who teach in Welsh. Colleges offer language enrichment courses for trainees who teach in Welsh. These courses are of good quality and support trainees' language development well. This additional support is now usefully extended to school-based training.

Our evidence shows that secondary schools in some areas, for example in north-east Wales, have to use non-specialist staff whose only qualification in the subject is that they speak the language. These teachers often do their best and are usually enthusiastic, but they have not been trained in the methodology of how to teach languages effectively.

A lower than average number of applicants apply for posts to teach Welsh as a second language. This is confirmed in the recent teacher recruitment survey report published

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

by the General Teaching Council (GTC) for Wales. Additionally, a lower than average number apply for posts where teaching is through the medium of Welsh. This is also confirmed by the GTC report. This year, the Chief Inspector's Annual Report identifies a shortage of teachers of Welsh as a subject in secondary schools, as well as of teachers who can teach other subjects through the medium of Welsh.

**What works well?**

Trainee teachers make good progress when the weakness in their own command of written Welsh are identified and addressed systematically and thoroughly during their training.

Many trainees attend supplementary courses to improve their command of written and spoken Welsh. This element has been helpful in raising trainees' level of confidence and their linguistic proficiency, thus preparing them better for their teaching roles in Welsh-medium and bilingual schools. This approach works best for the trainees whose command of Welsh is relatively strong. Other trainees often find that as the demands of their course increase they are not able to continue their Welsh course.

Some staff in initial teacher training institutions make some good contributions to support Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching more generally. Examples include producing guidance for teachers on teaching Welsh and for teachers teaching mathematics through the medium of Welsh.

Students make good progress when they have school-based tutors who speak Welsh and can support the development of their Welsh language skills in the workplace.

**Main areas of concern**

- There is a relative lack of teachers joining the profession who can teach Welsh as a subject and in Welsh-medium and bilingual settings and there are no targets for training them.
- There is not enough tutorial support for Welsh-speaking students in the institutions that do not offer courses through the medium of Welsh.

- The Assembly's data on recruitment concentrates on vacant posts in schools. This does not throw enough light on the qualifications of the teachers who are currently teaching.

## **10. Dual literacy in schools**

Dual literacy is an aspect of bilingualism. It allows the learner to benefit from a proficiency in two languages. It includes the ability to speak, read and write easily in both languages and to move confidently and smoothly between languages for different purposes.

### **Evidence**

Well-developed dual literacy skills are highly valued social skills. They are also very marketable skills in the workplace. They enable learners to access information, knowledge and opinion, as well as literature in all its forms, in two languages equally proficiently.

Our evidence shows that there is some good practice in developing pupils' dual literacy skills in schools. This is described and evaluated in our discussion paper on dual literacy.

However, most schools do not build enough on pupils' bilingual skills or help them systematically to switch languages easily and confidently in all three language modes of speaking, reading and writing and in most contexts and situations according to need.

### **What works well?**

Some LEA advisers (for example in Pembrokeshire and Gwynedd) are doing innovative work in this area in collaboration with teachers in the bilingual sector to produce resources to guide classroom practice. Some of the materials are due to be published shortly.

There has been some effective INSET in this area, including some useful video materials produced by the BBC Education Department.

### **Main areas of concern**

- Dual literacy is not developed systematically enough.

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

- There is very little INSET to guide teachers to develop pupils' dual literacy skills.

## Recommendations

**In order to raise standards in Welsh-medium and bilingual education and training, there is a need to:**

1. establish a firm statistical basis for reviewing the provision for Welsh teaching and learning in the non-maintained sector within Early Years provision.
2. continue to develop and refine the linguistic skills of primary school teachers who are Welsh learners to help them to teach Welsh as a second language;
3. encourage more use of bilingual delivery for subjects other than Welsh in English-medium primary schools ;
4. develop in the short term a national framework for the content and delivery of Welsh second language lessons across all key stages with the main objective of achieving fluency by the end of key stage 3;
5. pilot projects which aim to develop more effective arrangements for delivering Welsh, for example by using more intensive courses, especially in key stage 2, so that more pupils can opt for a Welsh-medium education in secondary schools ;
6. reduce the number of pupils who move to assessment in Welsh second language having followed programmes of study at an earlier stage in Welsh first language;
7. develop dual literacy more systematically in both primary and secondary schools and support this development with relevant guidance and in-service training;
8. develop a national training programme to guide Welsh second language teachers, particularly those secondary school teachers who are not language specialists but who teach Welsh as a second language because of the general lack of Welsh specialists;
9. reduce the number of pupils who enter no examination in Welsh second language at the end of key stage 4;
10. increase the proportion of pupils entered for GCSE Welsh first language, particularly in those LEAs with a large proportion of Welsh speakers and a relatively low entry level;

Policy Review: Welsh Language in Education  
Estyn

11. initiate further research into the viability of dual accreditation in the assessment of Welsh as a first and second language in order to benefit from the continuum model of language development;
12. make more use of Welsh to teach other subjects in secondary schools where English is the chief medium of teaching (particularly practical subjects such as physical education, art, drama, technology and music)  
;
13. improve the continuity in Welsh-medium and bilingual provision between primary and secondary schools and between secondary schools and further education colleges;
14. organise support and in-service training for Welsh-medium and bilingual schools on a national level and reduce the burdens on individual LEAs;
15. establish a national network of athrawon bro to make use of information and learning technology to support improvements in teaching and learning;
16. set targets for increasing the assessment of students through the medium of Welsh in further education and training;
17. set targets to increase the number of teachers who are trained to teach Welsh and through the medium of Welsh;
18. seek ways to attract more trainee teachers to follow initial teacher training courses which prepare them effectively to teach through the medium of Welsh or bilingually;
19. make sure there are enough relevant materials available for training companies to train and assess their clients through the medium of Welsh, thus building on the everyday language of many workplaces;
20. make sure that all training companies and careers companies promote the value of bilingualism in the workplace; and
21. provide education and training qualifications that offer scope for bilingual assessment.