

Education and Lifelong Learning Committee

Extending Bilingualism in the Education System

1 Introduction

1.1 The evidence presented in this paper training is central to the theme:

“Developing Welsh medium education and training across a wide range of subjects and at all levels”,

and to the key considerations (Annex B)

“...that every child and student in Wales be given the opportunity to become bilingual in Welsh and English....”

“A clear understanding of what is meant by the vision of a ‘bilingual Wales’, and an assessment of the implications of this interpretation in relation to individual and collective linguistic rights

Possible alternatives to the dichotomy ‘Welsh as a medium / Welsh as a subject’ (or Welsh as a medium / English as a medium’) and the potential afforded by the use of the two languages as dual media.”

1.2 The evidence also is closely linked to several points in your Terms of Reference and in Schedule B – Key considerations:

“To seek to define more closely the promotion of the Welsh language and the benefits of bilingualism and education and lifelong learning in achieving the National Assembly’s vision, of fostering Wales’ unique and diverse identity

..... suggest a strategy (or part-strategy) for actions in the area of education and training to help achieve that vision

“Develop Welsh medium education and training across a wide range of subjects and at all levels.”

It will deal with “fostering an awareness of the potential contribution of bilingualism to raising standards of achievement at a wider level,” by raising the issue that using two languages rather than one enhances understanding and paves the way for widening participation in bilingual education, which is the right of every individual in contemporary Wales.

It will deal in more detail with initial training and the

“... emphasis on bilingual methodology and the challenges / implications that will accompany bilingual teaching.” (Annex B)

in order to “develop Welsh and bilingual skills” throughout the education system.

1.3 The observations are based on various research studies during the last 10 years and on over 30 years teaching experiences across all the education sectors in Wales

2 The studies and research projects that are most relevant to the evidence being presented here are:

2.1 A study of **a late immersion situation** at Ysgol Maes Garmon, Mold, where the progress of a cohort of Welsh learners who came to this school from the non-Welsh primary sector was observed. The progress of the class was monitored for 5 years between July 1994 and March 1999.

“The main purpose of the study was to look at teaching methods that were proving successful with a class of learners in an English area, and to attempt to analyse the secret behind the success that, by year 11, is making fluent bilingual pupils of children that were almost totally monoglot English. Another aim was to analyse and discuss in a qualitative way the teaching methods used by the teachers, in order to disseminate those methods to other schools that could benefit. If the statutory expectations were raised, to include Welsh medium teaching in all secondary schools, some of the methods and practices seen in this study would lead the way for other schools in Wales.”

(See **Appendix A** for a short version of the last chapter of this study)

2.2 A summary of various bilingual teaching models

This paper is based on examples seen over the years in Welsh medium secondary schools, the research mentioned in 2.1 above, developmental research projects in Further Education, a developmental project in the School of Nursing and Midwifery, University of Wales, Bangor and on a project where several of our Universities’ Education departments collaborated (ESCALATE project)

It may be argued that the most natural situation for concurrent use of two languages in the classroom is the one seen in many primary schools throughout Wales where recent learners and fluent Welsh speakers are taught together in the same class. The first weeks spent at special Language Centres for Latecomers, in the old counties of Dyfed and Gwynedd, are excellent examples of very efficient bilingual teaching.

(Appendix B includes a Paper that deals with some of these models, a Paper that was recently updated)

2.3 Translanguaging – a skill for developing bilingualism

Translanguaging simply means (i) receiving information in one language and (ii) using or applying it in the other language. It is a skill that happens naturally in everyday life, e.g. when a child receives a telephone message for his/her mother in English and conveys the message to her in Welsh. This skill needs to be developed systematically throughout the Education system so that pupils are able to switch efficiently from one language to the other, thus fully utilising their bilingual capability.

(Appendix C discusses this aspect in more detail)

3 Relevant Conclusions

Some highly relevant conclusions arise from the studies and projects outlined in Section 2.

3.1 Late immersion situations need to be extended to other areas in Wales so that more pupils are given the opportunity to develop their bilingualism. There are several possibilities for this in the primary sector, as suggested by the group of ‘immersion education advisers’ commissioned by the Welsh Language Board. This Paper, however, concentrates only on the Secondary sector. Two possible routes are proposed.

(i) To offer learners the opportunity to transfer from the English primary sector to the Welsh / Bilingual secondary sector in more of the specified Welsh medium / Bilingual schools by establishing a class of late immersion pupils similar to the Ysgol Maes Garmon situation. The advantage of using the schools in the existing Welsh medium / Bilingual sector is that they would already have the resources and bilingual teachers. Progression for this type of group, therefore, would be maintained.

(ii) To extend Welsh medium into English medium secondary schools. As Welsh is a core or basic subject in all of Wales’ primary schools, there is now a firm basis in most areas for this development. A natural progression would be to study parts of the total curriculum (i.e. individual subjects), or parts of several curricular areas through the medium of Welsh. That would give the teaching of Welsh in the primary sector a defined purpose and using the language as a medium for part of the secondary stage would make the language far more relevant. Such innovation would need to be planned carefully in a progressive fashion by arranging the subjects that would be suitable for this developmental stage according to the amount of language use within each subject area. Consequently, this could be matched to the stage each group of pupils has reached on a Welsh medium capacity continuum e.g.

Stage 1: For those with a limited knowledge of Welsh. They would start with practical subjects, e.g. Physical Education, Technology, Art, as pupils often become so engrossed in the activities that they forget they are developing and using a second language in such situations;

Stage 2: For those with a firmer grasp of Welsh. Subjects listed in Stage 1 could be introduced plus aspects of subjects such as Mathematics and Science where a more intense use of language occurs for brief periods but where they are alternated with ‘doing,’ ‘applying’ or ‘responding’.

Stage 3: For those who have made the transition and have a firm knowledge of both languages. Subjects listed in Stage 1 could be introduced, plus elements of those subjects listed in Stage 2 as well as elements of subjects which require an even more intense use of language, e.g. History, Geography and Religious Education.

3.2 Defining what is meant by bilingual teaching

Agreed definitions of terms such as “bilingual teaching”, “teaching in the bilingual situation”, “teaching which develops both languages”, “teaching through the medium of both languages”, etc. are needed. Due to a lack of definitions, some of these terms are misinterpreted. Even though Appendix B begins to describe and analyse different models of bilingual teaching much more research on various models and a definition of their function is needed.

There is a vast difference between (i) bilingual teaching which aims to develop the bilingualism of each individual within the class and (ii) bilingual teaching where those being taught through

the medium of Welsh are in the same class as those being taught through the medium of English, solely for administrative and financial purposes. Steps should be taken in favour of the first situation.

3.3 Introducing translanguaging as a skill to be developed throughout the education system

One golden unwritten rule applied in the past was not to use both languages within the same teaching situation. By now, we should have enough confidence in our bilingualism to allow for systematic movement from one language to the other for educational purposes. A pupil studying Welsh History through the medium of English could benefit from using the Welsh language series “Cymru 2000” and similarly a pupil studying Geography through the medium of Welsh should be able to benefit from English television programmes. The ultimate aim is to develop and use our bilingualism to its fullest potential.

Teachers need to be able to manage teaching situations so that they enrich and develop both languages rather than using one to replace the other. This would strengthen pupils’ understanding and enrich their learning experiences.

4 Further implications and Considerations

There are several other practical implications that ought to be considered in creating a strategy to “Develop Welsh medium education and training across a wide range of subjects and at all levels”. Some of them are listed here.

- Making Welsh as a second language a core subject so that it is assessed at the end of the key stages. The advantage of this would be to ensure that the subject is taken seriously by each school in Wales, and that this, in turn, would lead to improved standards generally.
- Considering each pupil’s linguistic development on a bilingual continuum as a means of normalising bilingualism. This could lead to everyone studying part of the curriculum through the medium of Welsh and to considering bilingualism as an integral part of any future curricular schemes, e.g. Baccalaureate
- ACCAC should give serious consideration to developing both languages as mediums of study as an unique part of the development of all pupils within the education system in Wales.
- Constructive use should be made of the 11 years of learning Welsh that the pupils of Wales receive by designing initial teacher training courses that have to extend and strengthen their bilingualism. Simultaneously their training should equip them to introduce (i) the curriculum (in the primary sector) or (ii) their main subjects (in the secondary sector) bilingually. Over a period of time, this would lead to strengthening the system and provide sustainability.
- Increase quotas for bilingual teachers for the primary sector and in specific curricular areas that are part of a strategy to extend bilingualism and Welsh medium teaching at secondary level. [See 3.1, (ii)]
- Introduce a module(s)/ elements (i) on using two languages for teaching and (ii) on the advantages and methods of developing translanguaging to every initial teacher training course that prepares students for working in any part of Wales
- Conduct more research into (i) the use of two languages for teaching (ii) translanguaging as an educational skill (iii) late immersion situations (iv) successful teaching methodologies e.g. those that are used at centres for latecomers (v) any other relevant aspects so that our bilingual teaching system is founded on a solid research basis.

- Create a progression for education at 16+, training and higher education so that Welsh medium and/or bilingual education are training available throughout the education system and lifelong learning.

Cen Williams
(12:03:02)

Appendix A – Chapter 6 of the Report “Gaining a Language”

Chapter 6 A Guidebook for Future Travellers

6.1	Introduction
6.2	Organisation
6.3	“Every teacher is a teacher of language...”
6.4	Using the Active Language Skills
6.5	The Responsibility of the Various Departments
6.6	A Theory of Bilingual Teaching
6.7	Transferring the Ideas to Other Schools
6.8	The End of the Journey - Recommendations for the various Groups
6.9	Ending with Gratitude

6.1 Introduction

This final chapter has a dual purpose:

- (i) concluding the report by offering definite recommendations based on the findings of chapters 1-5, and
- (ii) linking some of the findings and recommendations with theory and research; in these cases, extensive reference is made to Williams (1994).

It will therefore offer theories and possible actions based on what was observed. That will be the purpose of:

- (i) section 6:5, which concentrates on the role of the various subject areas within a holistic language development framework, and
- (ii) section 6:6 which will offer a theory of bilingual teaching that schools could pilot, adapt and develop.

The following key lists the recommendations or discussion points, together with a suggestion of the main audience for each.

A	Administrators within the Education System in Wales
B(i)	Administrators and Headteachers of schools in the Welsh-medium sector
B(ii)	Administrators and Headteachers of schools in the English-medium sector in Wales
C	Secondary teachers in their daily work setting

A B(i) B(ii)	<p>The school in this study is the only designated bilingual school in Wales which takes an entire class of learners who have not attended Welsh-medium primary schools, and which converts them into bilingual (Welsh/English) pupils during their secondary education.</p> <p>Should every bilingual school in Wales offer the same provision for a group of pupils that wishes to transfer to the Welsh-medium sector and an immersion setting at age 11?</p> <p>In what ways can some of the 177 schools that are outside the Welsh-medium sector increase their provision?</p>
---	---

6.2 Organisation

B(i) B(ii)	In cases where schools adapt the curriculum in order to promote acquisition of the Welsh language by using that language as a teaching medium, it would appear that this does not impair the pupils' performance in other subjects, even where offering a particular subject is delayed for a year
-----------------------------	--

6.3 "Every teacher is a teacher of language..."

In the study school, it was observed that every teacher understood (i) "the linguistic processes involved in a child's method of securing knowledge and understanding," (Bullock Report, DES, 1975) and (ii) the implications of this on his / her own use of language in the classroom. They were fully aware:

- ◆ that the pupils were learners and they accepted that using the mother tongue (English) as well as the second language was necessary in order to secure full understanding;
- ◆ of ways of using the mother tongue to extend the second language and to reinforce understanding when discussing and considering concepts;

- ◆ of when (i) the class, and (ii) individuals within the class were sufficiently confident and proficient in the Welsh language for them, as teachers, to be able to use less English.

Similarly, from year 9 onwards, they were aware:

- ◆ that, as teachers, their own use of language was a powerful key element in their ability to teach their subject effectively;

and likewise,

- ◆ that the pupils' use of language in the classroom, and therefore their use of their second language, was a major factor in their capacity to succeed in the subject.

This is in full agreement with research undertaken in the United States of America which concluded that one major factor in the process of learning and becoming proficient in a second language is that it is necessary to integrate the language and the subject content. (Milk, 1990, p.34). He further suggests that developing concepts through the medium of both languages is necessary, and the need to consider how they interrelate. Christian states that it is necessary to consider the input the pupil receives, ensuring that it is sensible and comprehensible, (Christian et al, 1990, p.145).

Cummins (1991) stresses that policy-makers should consider the pedagogic aspects as well as the interaction that is taking place in the classroom, because, in cases of failures, it is often these factors that are deficient. If this is true on a national level, it is also true on an authority level and on a school level. This is why it is vital to consider the various interactions between:

- ◆ teacher - pupil;
- ◆ pupil - pupil;
- ◆ resources - pupil

in order to achieve success. The theories of Christian, Cummins and Milk were being implemented in practical situations in the study school.

6.4 Using the Active Language Skills

During the pupils' first few months at the school, teachers concentrated mainly on the passive skills (primarily listening), but during the time spent at Glan-llyn, structured activities gave the pupils the opportunity to develop their active skills, with the primary emphasis on talking. (see 3.1.3)

<p>B(i) B(ii) C</p>	<p>It is essential that the way in which pupils use their various passive and active language skills is structured in order to hasten the acquisition of language to the level of using it as a medium.</p> <p>It is essential that pupils are given the opportunity to use their active skills in a genuine context, once they have an acceptable level of passive understanding.</p> <p>Secondary school teachers who are teaching their subjects through the medium of Welsh to pupils for whom Welsh is a second language, should be aware that (i) their own use of language, and (ii) the ways in which pupils use their active skills, might influence their level of understanding in the subject area. (It can be taken for granted that, in a Wales context, there is a learner in every Welsh-medium subject class.)</p> <p>It is also important that teachers in a bilingual setting are aware of the individual pupil's level of achievement in both languages. It would, therefore, be a creative step forward to think of the child's position on a bilingual continuum.</p>
--	---

An example in this study of the way in which bilingualism is used actively is **translanguaging** (see 5.3), which reinforces the interrelationship between the two languages while also reinforcing the languages. The following discussion of bilingualism as a valuable tool is an extract from an article by the author of this report (Williams, 2001).

... It should be emphasised that the aim in Wales is **to strengthen and to use both languages to a high level in order to develop balanced and confident bilingual pupils**. Because of this, different developmental and reinforcement methodologies have to be adopted. (The aim in the USA is different because there, the priority in education is to acquire the second language, English, in order to displace the vernacular language.) Translanguaging is one of the techniques or strategies used for that purpose. Baker (2000) sees its possibilities:

“Translanguaging has two potential advantages. It may promote a deeper and fuller understanding of the subject matter. It is possible in a monolingual context, for students to answer questions or write an essay without fully understanding the subject. Whole sentences or paragraphs can be copied or adapted from a textbook without rarely understanding them. This is less easy in a bilingual situation. To read and discuss a topic in one language, and then to write about it in another, means that the subject matter has to be properly ‘digested’ and reconstructed. Translanguaging may also help students develop skills in the weaker language ...” (The Care and Education of Young Bilinguals. Multilingual Matters, 2000. p104-105)

What is translanguaging and how can it be used?

The simplest definition is:

- ◆ **receiving information in one language and then,**
- ◆ **using it in the other language.**

Every language develops through being used in purposeful and real situations. And that is especially true of learning a second language and continuing to use both by developing and improving them constantly. In translanguageing, we:

- ◆ **receive** information using our **passive** language skills (listening and reading), and then we
- ◆ **use** the information using our **active** language skills (talking and writing).

Translanguageing is a method for children who have a reasonably good grasp of both languages; it is a strategy for retaining and developing bilingualism rather than for initial teaching of the second language. And that is what is needed in twenty first century Wales: a method of retaining and using both languages. Throughout Wales, the success that nursery, infant and primary teachers have had is remarkable; the challenge is to preserve pupils' bilinguality.

Recommendations

B(i) B(ii) C	<p>Receiving information in one language and then using it in another gives pupils an opportunity to digest information more fully. Translanguageing should therefore be developed as an essential skill in bilingual Wales as being able to assimilate and discuss subject matter in both languages appears to promote understanding.</p> <p>By using and perfecting translanguageing skills pupils in the bilingual sector will be able to make greater use of English-medium textbooks and television programmes. (However, the need to develop Welsh-medium reference material and textbooks is not diminished.)</p> <p>By developing two-way translanguageing, i.e. from Welsh to English as well as from English to Welsh, teachers and pupils would be better able to take advantage of the best resources in both languages.</p>
---	--

6.5 The Responsibility of the Various Departments

One of the main features of this study was that each department within the school recognised and accepted its responsibility for developing the Welsh language skills of the target group of learners, especially in years 7 and 8.

Each department, and each individual within the departments, adopted their own methods of responding to the bilingual development of pupils. It was not apparent that the various departments undertook

responsibility for specific aspects of that development. With careful planning however, it would be possible to identify elements of grammatical/linguistic development that occurred naturally in specific subject areas. Some of these aspects are listed in the full report in order to offer some guidance to each department when identifying its own responsibility, and also to help the language co-ordinators and the management team when they are considering holistic development.

<p>B(i) B(ii) C</p>	<p>In order to hasten learners' bilingual development and to help them become confident bilingually:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (i) every school should adopt a policy which makes the subject departments responsible for developing various linguistic aspects that occur naturally within those subject areas; (ii) the role of the language departments within such an integrated policy should also be defined clearly, so that they are not expected to shoulder all the responsibilities and the expectations; (iii) each department within a school should be fully conscious of its own linguistic responsibilities. <p>In a bilingual school, a similar policy should also be adopted in relation to the English language, especially in the more Welsh areas of Wales and in the traditional bilingual schools.</p>
--	---

What has been stated in this section (6.5), is equally relevant when developing a cross-curricular language policy, or alternatively, when apportioning the linguistic responsibilities in the case of mother tongue (Welsh or English) pupils. However, in cases where the language is the pupils' second language, it is essential that their bilingual development is structured.

B(i) B(ii) C	<p>Often in schools where there are good learners (i.e. those who have been learning the language for a number of years), the tendency is to offer them Religious Education, Geography and History through the medium of Welsh. Because of the high level of linguistic content (see the introduction to the sections on the Humanities, Mathematics and Physical Education), this could be a shortcoming.</p> <p>It may be better to categorise subjects according to the way language is used within that subject area, and according to the relationship between that usage and non-linguistic support. Humanities would be retained for the upper level of second language subject area contact according to the following categories:</p>	
	<p>Step 1: Practical subjects e.g. Physical Education, Technology, Art</p>	<p>These are the subjects that could be introduced initially to the learners who had a relatively poor grasp of the second language</p>
	<p>Step 2: Subjects such as Mathematics and Science</p>	<p>Subjects where the linguistic element is presented in short bursts leading to practice, application etc.</p>
	<p>Step 3: Subjects such as Religious Education, Humanities and History</p>	<p>Subjects that require a high level of ability in the language of presentation, so that performance in that subject will not suffer.</p>
<p>Schools that offer Humanities, and Humanities alone, to second language pupils should therefore reconsider the position.</p>		

6.6 A Theory of Bilingual Teaching

In some of the earlier lessons that were observed during the pupils' preparatory week (chapter 2), a section of a Biology lesson was seen, in which the teacher used both languages as teaching media. From this lesson, several important and constructive principles are identified which could be used as a basis for developing a bilingual teaching methodology. These ideas are placed in a theoretical context in another report, Williams, Lewis and Baker (1996) and the comments are quoted in their entirety below. There is a detailed consideration in the full report.

A theory of bilingual teaching, developed in the United States by Jacobson and Faltis, is based on cues for switching languages when teaching. But there are sixteen different cues. It is unreasonable to expect any teacher to be aware of such a high number of cues when he/she is teaching.

By switching the emphasis to a consideration of the linguistic and conceptual demands made on the child in every classroom situation, these cues can be reduced to 5 ways in which language is used in teaching and in developing concepts, namely using language:

- in a **practical** situation
- to explain linguistic and grammatical points, that is, knowledge about language – **linguistic** use
- **communicative** use – i.e. to communicate in the classroom (BICS)
- **instructional** use i.e. to instruct, to present and to question the class on a literal and basic level (BICS leading to CALP)
- **cognitive** use – where a child is expected to think and reflect in order to gain understanding, or before replying (CALP)

By adopting the above labels (in bold print), it is possible to construct a **theory of bilingual teaching by determining which language medium is most appropriate in each situation**. It will be necessary to decide which of the following linguistic categories are appropriate to the group at a particular stage in its bilingual development:

- almost exclusively through the medium of the mother tongue
- bilingually with emphasis on the mother tongue
- bilingual - balanced
- bilingually with emphasis on the second language
- through the medium of the second language only.

e.g. the following language medium policy could be adopted with a class of learners whose language is very limited:

practical	through the medium of the second language only
linguistic	bilingual - balanced
communicative	bilingual with emphasis on the second language
instructional	bilingual balanced
cognitive	bilingual with emphasis on the mother tongue

A transcript of the first science lesson given to a Year 7 group of learners, whose grasp of the language is limited, is discussed in the full report. In it, a developing pattern is emerging; a pattern that could be further developed early in the first term in order to follow a more challenging language medium policy for bilingual development.

6.7 Transferring the Ideas to Other Schools

In concluding this report, there are questions to be asked, e.g. to what extent could the procedure, some of the teaching methodologies and the successes that were seen in one school, be transferred to others?

The procedure adopted in this school would not necessarily have to be duplicated in other schools, equivalent success may be achieved with a slightly different procedure. Other schools adopt different ways of organising the curriculum; the only reason for outlining in chapter 2 the procedure that was used in this school was to exemplify one model. The key aspects of that procedure were:

- ◆ the preparatory visit in June before being admitted to the secondary school and the extra attention the pupils received from the *athrawon bro*;
- ◆ the change in curriculum organisation in order to give the Welsh language more contact time;
- ◆ the fact that History and Geography were taught in year 7 by teachers who were also trained to teach Welsh as well as their subject;
- ◆ the visit to Glan-llyn in the January of year 7 – a key milestone that raised expectations and increased oral confidence.

Recommendations may be made to other schools, but in doing so, the nature of those schools should be borne in mind and the recommendations should be adapted accordingly:

1 According to a statistics leaflet produced by the Welsh Language Board, there were 52 Welsh-medium/bilingual secondary schools, and 177 other secondary schools in Wales, in the school year 2000/2001.

The target school in this study is the only one of the 52 schools that offers Welsh-medium provision for an entire class of learners who have not attended Welsh-medium primary schools.

Welsh/bilingual (52)	Other schools (177)
All the other Welsh/bilingual schools have the resources to receive a group of learners such as the target group, and offer them the same experiences. Perhaps not all schools will have the staffing resources to offer full, cross-curricular provision. But they could accept a class of pupils who have not attended Welsh-medium primary schools. By adopting some of the methodologies and the techniques outlined in this report, they could develop an increasingly	It would be difficult to transfer all the elements across the school, because these schools do not have bilingual staff in all departments. But in those departments where schools have bilingual staff, many of the positive methodologies and techniques outlined here could be adopted. In order to build on the pupils' bilingualism, and in order to extend their ability to use the Welsh language, each school in this category should

bilingual policy and curriculum as pupils progress through the school, and succeed in their mastery of the Welsh language.

consider:

- i) how much of what is outlined in this report they could adopt;
- ii) in which specific departments?

In considering these points, they should bear in mind sections 6.4, 6.5 (especially the final box) and 6.6 above.

2 By June 2001, every pupil aged 16 in Wales (apart from in-migrants) will have been learning the Welsh language for 11 years. Assuming that on average they receive 2 hours of Welsh per week, they will have received a total of 880 hours of Welsh by the time they leave school.

Past experiences show us that success is more concentrated and permanent when the language is used as a medium.

Welsh/bilingual (52)

It is in these schools that we have seen the greatest success and that is because the language was used as a medium.

There is room for them to extend that success by accepting pupils who have not attended Welsh-medium primary schools, wherever that is possible, if a truly bilingual Wales is to become a reality.

Other schools (177)

Every school in Wales should be bilingual to as great an extent as possible.

Real growth is now possible in this sector, and schools should build on the opportunity to become bilingual that was given to pupils in Wales by the Conservative Government of the day, by extending bilingualism to subject areas. This is what would make them actively bilingual giving them the tools to take better advantage of the employment market and job opportunities that exists in Wales.

6.8 The End of the Journey - Recommendations for the various Groups

Reference was made in the first chapter to a number of different groups that may be interested in this report. In concluding the report, the chapters that would be of greatest interest to the various groups are listed below:

Audience	Chapters
----------	----------

Management teams and governors of schools outside the Welsh-medium sector who are responsible for staffing and language policies	1, 2, 3.5, 3.6, 6
Teachers in schools that are outside the designated bilingual sector	3, 5, 6
Teachers in the official bilingual schools	3, 4, 5, 6
Teachers in the traditional bilingual schools	3, 4, 5, 6
Teacher trainers in university education departments and in teacher training institutions	3, 5, 6
Students on the Post Graduate Certificate in Education courses	3, 5, 6
Teachers in the Primary sector and lecturers in the Further and Higher Education sectors	3, 5, 6
Researchers and teachers in other bilingual and multilingual settings	1 – 6
ACCAC	1, 2, 3, 5, 6

It is recommended that each group should read the report in its entirety in order to be aware of the fuller picture, but the sections listed above might be a starting point, especially if time is short.

6.9 Ending with Gratitude

I would like to thank the class, Ysgol Maes Garmon, the two headteachers: Dr Philip Davies and Mr Huw Alun Roberts, all the teachers at the school, especially Mr Edwin Jones, the jovial head of school who made all the arrangements, - the travel agent so to speak.

I hope this work will provide you with a valuable map and guidebook.

Appendix B

BILINGUAL TEACHING MODELS

In this section, different bilingual teaching models are described. The possible advantages and disadvantages of each are noted in turn. As classroom visits were not part of this particular study the models are based on:

- previous research by the Welsh Medium Teaching Development Officer in a variety of educational sectors;
- a FEFCW funded project into bilingual teaching methodologies in the FE sector 1997-98ⁱ;
- comments offered by staff during a study undertaken on behalf of FEFCW into the uses made of Welsh-medium funding within the Further Education sector (1999 - 2000) ;
- observations made during a current Welsh Office funded project involving the education of midwives at University of Wales, Bangor and the Wrexham sites (1998 - 2000);
- the Welsh Medium Teaching Development Officer's research into Welsh-medium and bilingual teaching in the secondary schools of Gwynedd (1992 - 94)

Traditionally, where Welsh-medium education was offered, parallel teaching groups were utilised. The current tendency in FE and in some schools, however, is to teach Welsh-medium courses as part of a bilingual group and this was strongly defended by a majority of the staff members interviewed. Strong opposition to this organisational grouping was voiced by a small minority of lecturers. Subsequently, the models have been classified according to whether each individual student uses one or both languages to follow the course.

SITUATIONS WHERE EACH STUDENT USES ONLY ONE LANGUAGE

MODEL A - SEPARATE WELSH AND ENGLISH CLASSES

This model is used in one FE institution, and widely in HE and in the secondary schools sector where Welsh-medium numbers are sufficiently high to offer viable teaching groups. It is predominately an entitlement model for situations where students have opted to study through the medium of one language only.

Positive features

- Lecturers are engaged in monolingual teaching only without

Negative features

- Students communicate subject material in one language only. This

having to concentrate on language switching cues.

- As both groups are taught separately it does not entail having to prepare twice (i.e. in both English and Welsh for the one teaching session).
- The lecturer has more time to attend to students faced with subject-matter, terminology and general language problems.
- The student is not given an opportunity to 'switch-off' when the lecturer is using the language-medium which is not his/her choice.
- The Wm/Eng.m student is not made to feel inadequate or inferior because of language problems.
- The peer-pressure to use the majority language (that is often present when a minority group are allocated half the teaching time) is absent; this leads to fewer Em students switching to Eng.m after a short period.

does not enhance their bilingual capabilities.

- Running parallel teaching groups is twice as costly for the institution.

MODEL B - SEPARATE LANGUAGE GROUPS WITHIN THE SAME CLASS

B (i) A MINIMALIST APPROACH

Within this model:

- notes are available in both languages;
- transparencies used for presentations are bilingual;
- groups are arranged according to language;
- the minority language group is given an opportunity to discuss in the minority

language but is expected to switch to the majority language when the tutor visits the group or when providing feedback in a whole-class situation;

- the lecturer/tutor is monolingual in the majority language;
- most, if not all of the assessment is in the majority language.

Institutions using this model could be accused of tokenism towards the Welsh language even though there may be a genuine attempt to offer the Welsh students an opportunity to discuss the curricular content in Welsh. This may provide them with the necessary experience and confidence to use it more extensively in future years.

Positive features

- It provides an opportunity for students to discuss orally through the medium of Welsh.
- Students are introduced to all the relevant terms in both languages.
- All the student's written work has been translated into Welsh

Negative features

- The lecturer/tutor is unable to take part in the discussions therefore the language reverts to English (this may be a positive feature where the bilingual development of each individual is an issue).
- Non-Welsh members of the group would see this opportunity as tokenism which encroaches on their monolingual entitlement.
- They are not encouraged to use Welsh terminology as that is not required for assessment purposes. Therefore they do not become fully acquainted with the use of terms in context and Welsh terminology does not become a natural part of their linguistic endowment.
- The work has been translated by a translator. The lecturer/tutor would not be aware of any errors or discrepancies, or inappropriate language register.

MODEL B - SEPARATE LANGUAGE GROUPS WITHIN THE SAME CLASS

B (ii) A 50-50 APPROACH

Model B(ii) is a well planned approach where the content is well presented and where both languages are treated equitably.

Within this model:

- lecturers limit whole-class teaching to an acceptable minimum thus minimising the need for tedious 'other language' repetition;
- the teaching is more student-centred and based on the active learning;
- notes are available in both languages;
- the transparencies used for presentations are bilingual;
- groups are arranged according to language;
- both the majority and the minority language groups are given an opportunity to follow the whole course in their chosen medium;
- the lecturer provides oral translation from the minority language to the majority language; it is not deemed necessary to translate from the majority language into the minority language although the lecturers often repeat important points and concepts in both languages;
- assessment is in the students' chosen medium.

The positive and negative features presented for this model are based on the most efficient examples observed. It is recognised that not all the teaching and learning within the 50:50 model would contain features as effective as those cited.

Positive features

- All students are able to follow the course in their chosen language; all the written resources developed by the lecturer are bilingual.
- Assessment is available in the chosen language.
- The bilingual element is part of a

Negative features

- Welsh-medium text books, reference books, software, etc. provided by external suppliers are rarely available bilingually.
- Problems arise with externally assessed courses as agencies are unable to provide bilingual assessors/validators.
- Lecturers may be led by students

firm and accepted institutional policy which is implemented from the first taught period and is evident in all the relevant literature. It is therefore accepted by all parties.

- The lecturer is acquainted with the correct terminology in both languages.
- It is cost efficient and can accommodate an imbalance in student numbers within the two linguistic groups.
- It is based on a well thought out teaching methodology.
- Preparation time is doubled.
- Where the numbers of Welsh students are very low compared to the English group, there may be feelings that the time allocated to Welsh-medium presentation should be in direct ratio to the number of students within both groups.
- In most cases, lecturers would need to follow a comprehensive staff development programme before being able to present bilingual courses effectively.

SITUATIONS WHERE EACH STUDENT IS ENCOURAGED TO DEVELOP BILINGUALLY

MODEL C - DEVELOPING BILINGUALISM USING MONOLINGUAL SESSIONS

This model is based on the notion that students need to be fully bilingual in order to meet employment requirements. This involves the ability to deal with all aspects of a subject or vocation in both languages. Therefore, students are equipped with a range of bilingual skills and an ability to use all terminology appropriately in both languages.

The model involves teaching alternate modules, or component parts of the course, in different languages. This would involve students using the relevant terms in both oral and written contexts and discussing all aspects of the course bilingually over a stated period.

Positive features

- Students would become acquainted with all aspects of the course in both languages over a specified period.
- It is a means of providing additive

Negative features

- All members of the group would have to reach an agreed threshold of competence in both languages.

bilingualism.

- Bilingual skills would continue to be developed.
- Lecturers prepare for monolingual sessions throughout the course therefore it would not present them with an additional burden.
- The work would be assessed in the language of presentation.
- The model would lead to a natural form of bilingualism.
- It would not necessitate staff development in bilingual teaching methodologies.
- Lecturers would have to be acquainted with the terminology in both languages (although they would not necessarily be used concurrently).
- It could (through misuse) lead to a teacher centred situation with over dependence on oral delivery.

MODEL D - ENGLISH ORAL DELIVERY: BILINGUAL ASSESSMENT FOR INDIVIDUALS

This model is economical and is or has been used:

- where individuals ask for Welsh medium assessment; or
- where the institutions themselves encourage Welsh medium assessment in order that they may benefit from the secondary factor funding.

General features are that:

- all the classroom teaching is through the medium of English;
- more often than not, the lecturers are non-Welsh speakers;
- in some cases, Welsh medium notes etc. are translated by a translator, in others, the students are only given English notes which they are expected to translate themselves;
- Welsh speaking students are given the opportunity or are encouraged to provide Welsh written assignments/assessments and to take oral assessment through the medium of Welsh;
- a translator, normally another Welsh-medium lecturer from the department or

from another department is used to mediate or translate during oral assessment and written work is usually translated;

- some institutions provide more encouragement and/or backup services than others e.g. linguistic help for students.

The funding formula pre 1997 in the FE sector could be seen as a means of encouraging this model.

Positive features

- An opportunity is extended to Welsh-medium students to be assessed in their preferred language.
- Some backup is provided in some cases e.g. translating teaching material, mediators for oral assessment etc.
- This model provides the individual student with an ability to discuss the subject area bilingually; it may be argued that it is a means of developing a better understanding of subject concepts as well as fostering students' bilingual capabilities.
- Institutions without Welsh-

Negative features

- The students do not experience Wm presentations where (i) terms are used in context and (ii) where there is an opportunity to experience subject matter being discussed in a relevant linguistic register.
- The linguistic teaching experience for this minority does not match the experience for students studying through the medium of English, thus leading to an inequality of opportunity.
- In cases where students had to translate their own notes an unnecessary burden was placed upon individuals.
- Assessment procedures could also place an extra burden on students as they may be unsure of the appropriate Welsh terminology or feel that their language register was inappropriate in the circumstances.
- Where other lecturers from the college are used as mediators /translators their unfamiliarity with the subject area, terminology etc. could further exacerbate an already strained situation.
- Some translators, who are

medium staff are able to offer a modicum of Welsh-medium teaching and learning experiences.

unacquainted with the subject area, provide texts which are difficult for students and/or assessors to follow.

MODEL E - ORAL PRESENTATION IN WELSH OR BILINGUALLY: WRITTEN WORK AND ASSESSMENTS IN ENGLISH

In many Welsh-speaking areas, and in the traditionally bilingual schools, this was the traditional VIth form model; all the pupils and the teacher would be bilingual but traditionally, the written assessment would be in English. English terminology would be used orally within Welsh sentences and all resources would be through the medium of English.

Within this model in the FE sector, individuals would chose to have their written work assessed partly through the medium of Welsh but oral assessment would be mainly through the medium of Welsh for all students.

Positive features

- There is a natural feel to the oral presentation.
- This model provides the individual student with an ability to discuss the subject area bilingually in oral contexts; it may be argued therefore that it is a means of developing bilingualism.

Negative features

- Academically and professionally, Welsh language demands are less rigorous as many English words and phrases are used.
- Because students are usually unable to use the whole range of Welsh terminology, this provision could be accused of not providing a balanced bilingual experience.

It is ourⁱⁱ provisional belief that:

Model A is an acceptable model but it can be uneconomical where numbers in one linguistic group are low. It does not lead to a balanced bilingual development, where individual students are concerned, but it may be easier for lecturers to implement.

Model B(ii) is an acceptable model where the lecturer ensures that both languages are treated equitably and where pre-planning has been stringent in ensuring that all college-developed materials are bilingual. Another prerequisite is that lecturers adhere to their own language medium policy and code-switching cues. This model is ripe for research and subsequent development and adoption as a

recognised model of bilingual delivery.

Model C is acceptable where all students within the group have reached an accepted threshold level of competence in both languages and could be developed in Welsh-medium strongholds. However, the sudden arrival of a student who had not been given a grounding in Welsh as a second language would necessitate a change of model.

These models should all be considered for maximum funding on condition that Models B(ii) and C are adopted on a 50:50 basis or that the total Welsh medium element is not less than 40% of the whole.

Model B(i) is a minimalist model where institutions cater for individual entitlement needs. Some institutions may feel the need to continue using this model for a period as it is their only means of immediately responding to individual requests for Welsh-medium study. However, the aim of the department should be to discontinue this model and adopt one of the 3 acceptable models within a reasonable period e.g. 3 years.

Model D could be seen as a means of attracting secondary factor funding without providing the necessary infrastructure and should be discouraged.

Model E is not an attempt to validly deal with content material through the medium of Welsh and should be discouraged.

Models B(i), D and E should only attract 60% of the total funding. Models D and E should cease to attract funding altogether after 3 years.

Model B(i) should be accepted only:

- **in those Anglicised areas where it appears to be the only practical option;**
- **where it is seen as a means of offering an entitlement provision to an individual student or small group and before being developed into either Model A, B(ii) or C.**

It is also recommended that Models A, B(ii) and C receive the full Welsh-medium funding complement and that B(i) receives the full amount for 3 years only.

AN ADDITIONAL MODEL

This additional model will be implemented during the 2000-2001 session. It is similar in many respects to Model B and would be recommended for full funding.

MODEL B - SEPARATE LANGUAGE GROUPS WITHIN THE SAME CLASS

B (iii) Whole year group lectures: smaller groups with tutors

This is a model which will be used during the 2000-2001 session by one large department in one university college. The model is suitable where whole-year groups are taught in large 100+ teaching situations, e.g. as part of a core course or where visiting lecturers are invited. Usually, these lectures are presented in English and one model is for the class to be split into smaller tutor-led groups for further discussions, to expand on and apply the content. It is therefore quite practical, where bilingual tutors are available, for one or more of these smaller tutorial groups to be conducted through the medium of Welsh. Within this situation the following should apply:

- bilingual notes/handouts to be made available;
- bilingual transparencies;
- groups to be arranged according to language ;
- the minority language group(s) to conduct discussions in the minority language led by a bilingual tutor;
- during feedback (if relevant) (i) a student from the group, or (ii) the tutor, to provide feedback in the majority language;
- the main speaker is usually monolingual in the majority language, therefore it is imperative that the tutor is acquainted with the correct terminology and general subject register in both languages;
- the majority, if not all the assessment to be in the majority language.

This model is a positive and practical solution in that it offers both categories of students the same educational experience and does not give the Welsh-medium group a feeling of inferiority. It offers them an opportunity to hear the main lecturer's contribution in English and to be able to discuss it through the medium of Welsh. If they are efficient in their use of translanguaging as a learning skill, it could provide them with an opportunity to understand the work more fully than in a monolingual situation.

Positive features

Negative features

- It offers Welsh-medium students an opportunity to discuss subject material through the medium of Welsh.
- The subject area is experienced bilingually: this could lead to a deeper and fuller comprehension.
- Terminology is presented bilingually.
- All course material will be available in Welsh.
- Where the work has been translated by a translator the lecturer/tutor would not be aware of any errors / discrepancies, or inappropriate use of language register.. (This could be rectified if the lecturer and tutor had consulted and co-operated before the session.)

MODEL F

Practical Issues

Often, what happens in the classroom differs slightly from what is included in the language- medium policy. This was evident in all the above models. The most common aspects of deviation from the stated policy evident in those models relating to Welsh-medium teaching were as follows:

- **Welsh-medium sessions becoming bilingual sessions.** This usually happened when there were proficient learners (individuals or groups) present in the classroom. Lecturers / teachers used English to corroborate the learning and to ensure that each individual's interpretation of the presented material was correct.
- **Much of the classroom discussions would be bilingual or would include bilingual essentials even where all present were fairly balanced bilinguals.** The reasons for this would be very similar to those listed under bullet point 1 above. Occasionally terms / definitions / explanations would be presented bilingually in order that students / pupils fully understand the English medium reference materials.
- **References would be largely in English.** This is inevitable as so much supplementary and reference material is either printed in English or available on the Web. Consideration should be given to how students studying through the medium of Welsh can best benefit from their bilingualism and the accrued advantages that access to the wealth of English medium material offers. This should be viewed as a positive feature in the teaching-learning process and should lead to developing translanguaging as a skill that would enable students to confidently switch from one language to the other.
- **Translanguagingⁱⁱ, orally and in the written mode is used naturally in the classroom.** Occasionally, this occurs without the lecturers / teachers or students / pupils being aware that they are utilizing a relevant and purposeful skill where developing and maintaining a bilingual proficiency is

concerned. Further consideration should be given to how translanguaging may be used to promote a bilingual confidence. This should be done in such a way that students / pupils do not feel that reading English supplementary and reference material is not an added burden in a situation where they have chosen to study through the medium of Welsh. Translanguaging may also be used to develop the Welsh learners' confidence and to offer them the opportunity of further developing their bilingualism.

- **The right to complete assignments and assessments in English.** Some students / pupils are not confident that their grasp of the language is of a sufficiently high standard to enable them to sit examinations or offer assignments through the medium of Welsh. Often, these are Welsh learners or students in FE / HE who have not previously used Welsh as a medium of study. Consideration should be given to whether they should submit a percentage of their assignments / assessments in Welsh.

Positive

- A very suitable model for proficient learners (+ some Welsh speakers)
- Translanguaging could strengthen both languages if correctly employed
- Does not mean change in organization / extra preparatory burden

Negative

- This could lead to an unselective use of both languages by the lecturers / teachers or students / pupils

ⁱ 'The Study of Welsh-medium Provision in the FE Sector in Wales' - a study undertaken by Professor Colin Baker, Mr Gareth Davies-Jones, Dr Geraint Wyn Jones and Dr Cen Williams into Welsh-medium provision in the FE sector, 1999 - 2000. Available in full on the ELWa web site.

ⁱⁱ The simplest definition is – to receive information in one language and then to use that information in the other language. Usually it means receiving information using the passive language skills (listening and reading) in the one language; and using the active language skills (speaking and writing) to reorganize or transfer that information.

Appendix C - Translanguaging

Translanguaging entails using one language to reinforce the other:

- (i) in order to increase understanding, and
- (ii) in order to augment the pupil's ability in both languages.

It should be emphasised that the aim in Wales is **to strengthen and to use both languages to a high level in order to develop balanced and confident bilingual pupils**. Because of this, different developmental and reinforcement methodologies have to be adopted. (The aim in the USA is different; the priority in education is to acquire the second language, English, in order to displace the vernacular.) Translanguaging is one of the techniques or strategies used for that purpose. Baker (2000) sees its possibilities:

“Translanguaging has two potential advantages. It may promote a deeper and fuller understanding of the subject matter. It is possible in a monolingual context, for students to answer questions or write an essay without fully understanding the subject. Whole sentences or paragraphs can be copied or adapted from a textbook without rarely understanding them. This is less easy in a bilingual situation. To read and discuss a topic in one language, and then to write about it in another, means that the subject matter has to be properly ‘digested’ and reconstructed. Translanguaging may also help students develop skills in the weaker language ...” (The Care and Education of Young Bilinguals. Multilingual Matters, 2000. p104-105)

It is, therefore, a natural skill for any bilingual individual.

When translanguaging, the pupil:

- internalises the words he hears;
- assigns his own labels to the message / concept, and then
- switches the message / concept to the other language;
- augments the message / concept and supplements it.

This process is translanguaging, not translating. It requires:

- a full understanding of the language in which the message is received, and
- sufficient vocabulary and a firm enough grasp of the other language in order to express the message, i.e.
- a passive understanding of both languages, and
- an active knowledge and mastery of at least one of the languages.

The skill of translanguaging offers exciting and broad possibilities in the development of two languages, but as yet, few teachers are willing to attempt to use two languages in one class. To an individual who is an active bilingual, translanguaging is a natural way of developing and strengthening both languages whilst simultaneously gaining a deeper understanding.