



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 25 Tachwedd 2008
Tuesday, 25 November 2008**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 25 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement
- 27 Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order
- 28 Datganiad am Archwiliad Iechyd y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin
Statement on the Common Agricultural Policy Health Check
- 40 Datganiad am Addysg Uwch
Statement on Higher Education
- 71 Caffael Cynaliadwy
Sustainable Procurement
- 91 Amser Pleidleisio
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Galwaf y Cynulliad i drefn.

The Presiding Officer: I call the Assembly to order.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, OAQ(3)1472(FM), a chwestiwn 2, OAQ(3)1481(FM) yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 1, OAQ(3)1472(FM), and question 2, OAQ(3)1481(FM) have been withdrawn.

Post Office Card Account

Q3 Leanne Wood: What representations has the First Minister made regarding the post office card account? OAQ(3)1496(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Following the representations that have been made, I very much welcome the announcement made on 13 November by the Department for Work and Pensions to award a new card account contract to Post Office Ltd. It is a done deal and a good deal.

Leanne Wood: I also welcome the Government's u-turn on the post office card account. Do you think that this decision has opened up the possibility of creating a people's bank in post offices throughout the nation, an idea that has been backed by the Communication Workers Union and the National Federation of SubPostmasters? Has any assessment been made of the opportunities to use post offices as a bank for individuals and local businesses? The majority of people in Wales live within 3 miles of a post office, but may have to travel many miles to access a bank, and, given the problems that banks are facing, we could see many more of their high street branches closing. My view is that we should consider this opportunity to create a people's bank based on the principle of responsible lending. Do you agree?

The First Minister: I remember Allan Leighton, chairman of the Royal Mail, telling me that he wished that it had never been obliged to sell Girobank, which was, in

Cyfrif Cerdyn Swyddfa'r Post

C3 Leanne Wood: Pa sylwadau mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cyflwyno ynglŷn â chyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post? OAQ(3)1496(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Yn dilyn y sylwadau sydd wedi'u gwneud, yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd ar 13 Tachwedd gan yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i ddyfarnu contract cyfrif cerdyn newydd i Swyddfa'r Post Cyf. Mae'r fargen wedi'i chadarnhau, ac mae'n fargen dda.

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn croesawu tro pedol y Llywodraeth ynghylch y cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa bost. A ydych yn credu bod y penderfyniad hwn wedi agor y posibilrwydd o greu banc y werin mewn swyddfeydd post ledled y wlad, syniad sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth gan Undeb y Gweithwyr Cyfathrebu a Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol yr Is bostfeistri? A oes unrhyw asesiad wedi'i wneud o'r cyfleoedd i unigolion a busnesau lleol ddefnyddio swyddfeydd post fel banc? Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru'n byw o fewn 3 milltir i swyddfa bost, ond efallai fod yn rhaid iddynt deithio milltiroedd lawer i gyrraedd banc, ac, ac ystyried y problemau y mae banciau'n eu hwynebu, gallem weld llawer mwy o'u canghennau stryd fawr yn cau. Yn fy marn i, dylem ystyried y cyfle hwn i greu banc y werin wedi'i seilio ar egwyddor benthyca cyfrifol. A ydych yn cytuno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cofiaf i Allan Leighton, cadeirydd y Post Brenhinol, yn dweud wrthyf ei fod yn gresynu iddynt orfod gwerthu Girobank, sef banc y werin, i bob pwrpas. Pe

effect, the people's bank. If it could buy it back for the same price as it was sold, that would be wonderful, but that would not be allowed. The question is how its range of financial services can be developed. Given that some areas have no banks, it is important that post offices offer a range of financial services to draw people in. For example, Ely, in my constituency, which has 28,000 residents, has no bank, although there are three or four post offices. On top of the POCA, which is now saved, and the foreign exchange service, Post Office Ltd should continue to develop more services to give people more reason to go into the post office.

Peter Black: As Leanne has just said, the Government is now looking for other uses for post offices to make their financial future more secure. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing in that regard? Are you discussing with Assembly Government sponsored bodies how they could make better use of post offices so as to secure the future of branches around Wales?

The First Minister: Primarily, our job is to get on with reopening the post office development fund, now that we know that there will be a viable network. We expect to reopen it to bids from 1 January 2009, and the Deputy Minister for Regeneration, who has responsibility for post office matters, will be saying considerably more about the criteria for applying to the reopened PODF shortly.

Huw Lewis: Rhodri, as you know, people from all political parties, but most crucially people in communities throughout Wales, breathed a collective sigh of relief when the card account contract was awarded to Post Office Ltd, and many of us here had been campaigning for that outcome for many months. Following that good news, could you outline what discussions are planned between the Assembly Government and local government on the other ways in which we can help to support our post offices, perhaps through processing council tax payments, as well as through the new post office

gallent ei brynu'n ôl am yr un pris ag y gwerthwyd ef amdano, byddai hynny'n wych, ond ni châi hynny ei ganiatáu. Y cwestiwn yw sut y gellir datblygu eu hystod o wasanaethau ariannol. Ac ystyried nad oes banciau mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae'n bwysig bod swyddfeydd post yn cynnig ystod o wasanaethau ariannol i ddenu pobl i mewn. Er enghraifft, nid oes banc yn Nhrelái, a'i 28,000 o drigolion, yn fy etholaeth, ond mae yno dair neu bedair o swyddfeydd post. Yn ogystal â'r cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa bost, sydd wedi'i achub, a'r gwasanaeth cyfnewid arian tramor, dylai Swyddfa'r Post Cyf barhau i ddatblygu mwy o wasanaethau i roi mwy o reswm i bobl fynd i swyddfa'r post.

Peter Black: Fel y mae Leanne newydd ei ddweud, mae'r Llywodraeth yn awr yn chwilio am ddefnyddiau eraill i swyddfeydd post i sicrhau bod eu dyfodol ariannol yn fwy cadarn. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud yn hynny o beth? A ydych yn trafod gyda chyrff a noddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sut y gallent ddefnyddio swyddfeydd post yn well er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol canghennau ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein prif waith yw bwrw ymlaen gydag ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, gan ein bod bellach yn gwybod y bydd yna rwydwaith dichonadwy. Yr ydym yn disgwyl ei ailagor i gynigion o 1 Ionawr 2009 ymlaen, a bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Adfywio, sy'n gyfrifol am faterion swyddfeydd post, yn dweud llawer mwy am y meini prawf ar gyfer gwneud cais i'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post wedi'i hailagor cyn bo hir.

Huw Lewis: Rhodri, fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd yn rhyddhad i bobl o bob plaid wleidyddol, ond yn bwysicaf, i bobl mewn cymunedau ledled Cymru, pan ddyfarnwyd y contract cyfrif cerdyn i Swyddfa'r Post Cyf, ac yr oedd nifer ohonom yma wedi bod yn ymgyrchu dros y canlyniad hwnnw ers misoedd lawer. Yn dilyn y newyddion da hwnnw, a allech amlinellu pa drafodaethau sydd wedi'u cynllunio rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol am y ffyrdd eraill y gallwn helpu i gefnogi ein swyddfeydd post, efallai drwy brosesu taliadau'r dreth gyngor, yn ogystal â drwy'r

development fund?

The First Minister: Now that we have a rough idea of the core network that Post Office Ltd will continue to run, the additional kinds of payments that can be made directly at a post office will be of huge interest to everyone, as well as our reopening of the post office development fund to new applications on 1 January. The proportion of people who have no bank accounts runs at about 15 per cent overall, but in many communities it will be as high as a third. I am sure that that would be true of Ely, which, as I mentioned earlier, has no local bank. Therefore, accessibility to a post office is crucial, especially for pensioners, who have opened post office card accounts at double the level that was estimated; pensioners like using post offices. I am sure that they would welcome the opportunity to pay their council tax and perhaps their utilities bills and so on, at the post office, which you cannot do that at the moment, through the post office card account.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 4, OAQ(3)1495(FM) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

Residents in South Wales Central

Q5 Andrew R.T. Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of the Welsh Assembly Government's key policies on the lives of residents in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)1488(FM)

The First Minister: I am glad that you have asked me that question, because it enables me to say that education is one of our key priorities and responsibilities, from the foundation phase to access to university education, about which Jane Hutt will say more in an hour or so. Education is a priority and a crucial area for us, and that has led to additional benefits being brought to the residents of South Wales Central.

Andrew R.T. Davies: In the current challenging climate, the residents of South Wales Central, and Wales in general, must have confidence in their political leaders.

gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post newydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gan fod gennym bellach syniad bras o'r rhwydwaith craidd y bydd Swyddfa'r Post Cyf yn parhau i'w redeg, bydd y mathau ychwanegol o daliadau y gellir eu gwneud yn uniongyrchol mewn swyddfa bost o ddiddordeb enfawr i bawb, yn ogystal â'r ffaith y byddwn yn ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post i geisiadau newydd ar 1 Ionawr. Ar y cyfan, mae tua 15 y cant o bobl heb gyfrif banc, ond mewn nifer o gymunedau, bydd yn gymaint â thraean. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai hynny'n wir am Drelái, lle nad oes banc lleol, fel y dywedais eisoes. Felly, mae swyddfa bost hygyrch yn hollbwysig, yn enwedig i bensiynwyr, gan eu bod yn agor dwywaith cymaint o gyfrifon cerdyn swyddfa bost ag a amcangyfrifwyd; mae pensiynwyr yn hoff o ddefnyddio swyddfeydd post. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent yn croesawu'r cyfle i dalu eu treth gyngor ac efallai eu biliau gwasanaethau ac ati, yn y swyddfa bost, ond ni allwch wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd, drwy'r cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa bost.

The Presiding Officer: Question 4, OAQ(3)1495(FM), has been transferred for written answer.

Trigolion Canol De Cymru

C5 Andrew R.T. Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am effaith polisiau allweddol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar fywydau pobl sy'n byw yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)1488(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw imi, gan ei fod yn fy ngalluogi i ddweud bod addysg yn un o'n blaenoriaethau a'n cyfrifoldebau allweddol, o'r cyfnod sylfaen hyd fynediad at addysg mewn prifysgol, a bydd Jane Hutt yn dweud mwy am hynny mewn oddeutu awr. Mae addysg yn flaenoriaeth ac yn faes allweddol inni, ac mae hynny wedi arwain at fuddiannau ychwanegol i drigolion Canol De Cymru.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Yn yr hinsawdd heriol sydd ohoni, rhaid i drigolion Canol De Cymru, a thrigolion Cymru'n gyffredinol, fod â hyder yn eu harweinwyr gwleidyddol. Bydd

One looks to the leaders to give some form of directional policy. Senior members of Plaid Cymru are saying that the Labour Party is a party in decline with no ideas and no vision for the future. How can people have confidence when your vision and ideas are being questioned by senior members of your coalition partner?

The First Minister: I am not sure that that quite hangs together as a question. There will always be political, inter-party knockabout. We saw it in spades from the shadow Chancellor yesterday—it was almost as though he was wishing the recession to be deeper than it need be, because that would be of party political benefit to the Conservative Party. I think that that is disgraceful conduct, but that is my view and, no doubt, you will disagree with it. You will always get political knockabout between the leaders of different political parties; we have to accept that. The important questions are: do we have a vision, and, what is the evidence for the vision? As I mentioned, the money invested into the foundation phase was the biggest single investment of new money into education in Wales ever. Jane Hutt will be talking about the vision for universities later today. The two biggest universities in Wales are in South Wales Central. As you say, that is a vision for the future. You will see that this is the case when Jane Hutt gets up to speak in an hour or so.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): I want to ask some questions about the pre-budget report announced yesterday and its consequences for Wales, and about the general economic situation. The PBR affects the whole economic position of Wales in this recession, which, I think you now accept as such. The Confederation of British Industry has calculated that, by the end of next year, 3 million people are likely to be unemployed throughout the United Kingdom. What assessment has been made of the position in Wales, as that figure heads towards 100,000 this Christmas?

The First Minister: We do not have an estimate of unemployment in Wales, because

rhywun yn disgwyl i'r arweinwyr roi rhyw fath o bolisi cyfeiriadol. Mae uwch aelodau Plaid Cymru'n dweud bod y Blaid Lafur yn blaid sy'n dirywio, heb ddim syniadau na gweledigaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Sut y gall pobl fod yn hyderus pan mae uwch aelodau eich partner mewn clymblaid yn cwestiynu eich gweledigaeth a'ch syniadau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y mae'r hyn a ddywedasoch yn dod at ei gilydd fel cwestiwn. Bydd dadlau gwleidyddol rhwng pleidiau bob amser. Gwelsom ddigonedd ohono gan Ganghellor yr wrthblaid ddoe—yr oedd bron fel petai'n dymuno i'r dirwasgiad fod yn waeth nag y mae angen iddo fod, gan y byddai hynny o fudd gwleidyddol i'r Blaid Geidwadol. Credaf fod hynny'n ymddygiad gwarthus, ond dyna yw fy marn i, ac mae'n siŵr y byddwch yn anghytuno â hi. Bydd dadlau gwleidyddol rhwng arweinyddion gwahanol bleidiau gwleidyddol bob amser; rhaid inni dderbyn hynny. Y cwestiynau pwysig yw: a oes gennym weledigaeth, a beth yw'r dystiolaeth dros y weledigaeth? Fel y dywedais, yr arian a fuddsoddiwyd i'r cyfnod sylfaen oedd yr un buddsoddiad mwyaf o arian newydd i addysg yng Nghymru erioed. Bydd Jane Hutt yn sôn am y weledigaeth i brifysgolion yn ddiweddarach heddiw. Mae dwy brifysgol fwyaf Cymru yng Nghanol De Cymru. Fel y dywedwch, mae hynny'n weledigaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gwelwch fod hynny'n wir pan fydd Jane Hutt yn codi i siarad mewn oddeutu awr.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Hoffwn ofyn rhai cwestiynau am yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe a'i oblygiadau i Gymru, ac am y sefyllfa economaidd gyffredinol. Mae'r adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol yn effeithio sefyllfa economaidd gyfan Cymru yn y dirwasgiad hwn, a chredaf eich bod bellach yn derbyn ei fod yn un. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi cyfrifo ei bod yn debygol y bydd 3 miliwn o bobl yn ddi-waith ledled y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn nesaf. Pa asesiad sydd wedi'i wneud o'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru, wrth i'r ffigur hwnnw nesáu at 100,000 y Nadolig hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennym amcangyfrif o ddiweithdra yng Nghymru,

one of the unknown factors is how deep or long the recession will be. The boldness of Alistair Darling's pre-budget report statement yesterday was an attempt to limit the impact of the recession, to make it shorter and shallower than it otherwise would be. It now requires other countries, such as France, Germany, Italy and Spain—we know that the USA will do this as soon as the President-elect becomes the President; he has said so—and other big countries to create a similar stimulus. The stimulus announced amounts to the equivalent of 1 per cent of gross domestic product but, if there is leakage, because other countries do not carry out a similar stimulus, its impact will be reduced to 0.5 per cent of GDP. If other countries play the game, everybody will get a shorter and shallower recession. Britain is certainly playing its part. Until we know whether other countries are going to create similar fiscal stimuli, it is hard to give an estimate of what the level of unemployment might be next year.

Nick Bourne: That seems curious, in view of the fact that the CBI is able to come up with an estimate for the UK position. I would have thought that it would be possible to estimate the position in Wales. However, I will move on if you feel unable to respond to the PBR announced yesterday with a ballpark figure. I think that everybody would accept that some fiscal stimulus was needed, but I do not believe that the tax cuts for Christmas that we heard about yesterday, which we will pay for for the rest of our lives through tax rises, is the way to do it. I think that the appropriate way is to do it through public spending; there was some mention of that, to be fair. Perhaps we could look at the consequential sums for Wales. Capital amounting to, I think, £140 million in Wales and some income consequentials were announced. What assessment is the Government making in relation to that?_What announcements are you intending to make? If you cannot tell us now how that money will be spent, when do you think that you will be able to make an announcement in the Chamber on what will happen in Wales?

oherwydd un o'r ffactorau anhysbys yw pa mor ddwfn neu ba mor hir y bydd y dirwasgiad. Yr oedd hyfdra datganiad adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol Alistair Darling ddoe yn ymgais i gyfyngu ar effaith y dirwasgiad, i'w wneud yn fyrrach ac yn fasach nag y byddai fel arall. Nawr, mae angen i wledydd eraill, megis Ffrainc, yr Almaen, yr Eidal a Sbaen—gwyddom y bydd UDA yn gwneud hyn cyn gynted ag y bydd y darpar Arlywydd yn Arlywydd; mae wedi dweud hynny—a gwledydd mawr eraill greu ysgogiad tebyg. Cyhoeddodd yr ysgogiad symiau sy'n gyfwerth ag 1 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth ond, os ceir gollyngiad, am nad yw gwledydd eraill yn cyflawni ysgogiad tebyg, caiff ei effaith ei leihau i 0.5 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Os bydd gwledydd eraill yn chwarae'r gêm, bydd pawb yn cael dirwasgiad byrrach a basach. Mae Prydain, yn sicr, yn chwarae ei rhan. Nes cawn wybod a fydd gwledydd eraill yn creu ysgogiadau cyllidol tebyg, mae'n anodd amcangyfrif beth y gallai lefel diweithdra fod y flwyddyn nesaf.

Nick Bourne: Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn ddi-ddorol, ac ystyried y ffaith bod Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn gallu rhoi amcangyfrif ar gyfer sefyllfa'r DU. Byddwn wedi meddwl y byddai'n bosibl amcangyfrif y sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, symudaf ymlaen os teimlwch na allwch ymateb i'r adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe gyda ffigur bras. Credaf y byddai pawb yn derbyn bod angen rhyw fath o ysgogiad cyllidol, ond nid wyf yn credu mai'r toriadau treth ar gyfer y Nadolig y clywsom amdanynt ddoe, ac y bydd rhaid inni dalu amdanynt am weddill ein hoes drwy godiadau treth, yw'r ffordd o wneud hynny. Credaf mai'r ffordd briodol o wneud hynny yw drwy wario cyhoeddus; cafwyd rhywfaint o sôn am hynny, a bod yn deg. Efallai y gallwn edrych ar y symiau canlyniadol ar gyfer Cymru. Cyhoeddwyd swm cyfalaf o £140 miliwn, credaf, a rhai symiau incwm canlyniadol. Pa asesiad y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud mewn cysylltiad â hynny? Pa gyhoeddiadau yr ydych yn bwriadu eu gwneud? Os na allwch ddweud wrthym yn awr sut y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario, pryd yr ydych yn meddwl y gallwch wneud cyhoeddiad yn y Siambr am yr hyn a fydd yn

digwydd yng Nghymru?

1.40 p.m.

The First Minister: I am grateful for that question. You are much more objective than your shadow Chancellor was yesterday. In terms of income, the Government has given an assessment that it believes that the changes in tax credits and benefits announced yesterday would have a positive benefit of some £90 million per year in Wales for pensioners and people in receipt of child benefit or child tax credit and so on. It thinks that that means additional spending power. It has not broken the VAT figure down into additional spending power in Wales, and we may be able to make a calculation as to what we think that the impact of the VAT changes will be. You also made a very important point about the capital bring forward. It is important to state that this is not new money. The only new money for us to spend, as a result of Barnett formula consequentials, is the £6 million on the warm homes scheme. In terms of capital, the £140 million potential bring forward from 2010-11, the third year of the current spending review, into either the tail end of this financial year or into 2009-10, we may well be able to do that, but it is not additional money—we will get less money in 2010-11, and get more money, pound for pound, in 2009-10. We have expressed concerns already about the impact that that might have on baselines from 2011-12 onwards.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that clarification, as there seems to have been some doubt about the precise profiling of the money, in terms of what is income and what is capital. You have now clarified that there is £140 million bring forward in capital, and only £6 million in revenue. Perhaps you would indicate when you will be able to return to the Chamber with an announcement on how that money is to be re-profiled or, in the case of the £6 million, how it is to be spent in this budget round. I will return to the first question that I asked the First Minister, because it is of crucial significance in the consequences for the Assembly in relation to fuel poverty, for example, and repossession, because of the impact of unemployment. Will the First Minister, as we go into this

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Yr ydych yn llawer mwy gwrthrychol nag yr oedd Canghellor eich gwrthblaid ddoe. O ran incwm, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi rhoi asesiad ei bod yn credu y byddai'r newidiadau mewn credydau treth a budd-daliadau a gyhoeddwyd ddoe o fudd positif o tua £90 miliwn y flwyddyn yng Nghymru i bensynwyr a phobl sy'n derbyn budd-dal plant neu gredyd treth plant ac ati. Mae'n credu bod hynny'n golygu mwy o bŵer gwario. Nid yw wedi dadansoddi'r ffigur TAW i ganfod mwy o bŵer gwario yng Nghymru, ac efallai y gallwn amcangyfrifo effaith y newidiadau TAW. Gwnaethoch hefyd bwynt pwysig iawn am ddwyn cyfalaf ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig datgan nad arian newydd yw hwn. Yr unig arian newydd inni ei wario, o ganlyniad i symiau canlyniadol fformiwla Barnett, yw'r £6 miliwn ar y cynllun cartrefi cynnes. O ran cyfalaf, a'r posibilrwydd o ddwyn £140 miliwn ymlaen o 2010-11, sef trydedd flwyddyn yr adolygiad gwario presennol, naill ai i ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon neu i 2009-10, mae'n bosibl y gallwn wneud hynny, ond nid arian ychwanegol ydyw—byddwn yn cael llai o arian yn 2010-11, ac yn cael mwy o arian, yn gyfatebol, yn 2009-10. Yr ydym eisoes wedi mynegi pryderon am yr effaith y gallai hynny ei chael ar linellau sylfaen o 2011-12 ymlaen.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr eglurhad hwnnw, oherwydd ymddengys bod rhywfaint o amheuaeth wedi bod am union broffil yr arian, o ran beth sy'n incwm a beth sy'n gyfalaf. Yr ydych yn awr wedi egluro y caiff £140 miliwn ei ddwyn ymlaen mewn cyfalaf, a dim ond £6 miliwn o gyllid. Efallai yr hoffech ddweud pryd y gallwch ddychwelyd i'r Siambr i gyhoeddi sut y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei ailbroffilio neu, yn achos y £6 miliwn, sut y caiff ei wario yn y cylch cyllideb hwn. Dychwelaf at y cwestiwn cyntaf a ofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog, gan ei fod yn hanfodol arwyddocaol o ran y goblygiadau i'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt tlodi tanwydd, er enghraifft, ac adfeddiannu, oherwydd effaith diweithdra. A all y Prif Weinidog, wrth inni symud i mewn i'r

recession, be able to come forward with an estimate of the likely worst scenario of unemployment so that, as an Assembly, we can plan for the dreadful consequences of that in fuel poverty, repossessions and so on?

The First Minister: One of the purposes of the £60 cheque that will go to all pensioners on 1 January is to tackle fuel poverty, and a range of people who are eligible for the Christmas bonus will also be eligible for the £60 cheque, even though they may not be pensioners. That was the basis for the quick calculation of £90 million, which we did overnight on the basis of the Treasury's figures. As regards the consequences of unemployment, we have seen the references in what is a brutally honest pre-budget report—it is the most honest that I have observed over three previous recessions and this one; I do not think that anyone else referred to permanently lost output in the way that Alistair Darling did yesterday. He referred to £60 billion in permanently lost output. That implies that the financial services industry will be permanently incapable of returning to its previous position. I have made the point before that the shape of the Welsh economy to some extent cushions us from this, in that the financial services industry has never been that important in Wales. You will also have seen the *Financial Times* survey on Monday of where private sector growth has been healthiest in the United Kingdom, and Wales was at the top, with 9 per cent private sector growth between 1998 and 2006, higher than in any of the nine English regions or Scotland or Northern Ireland.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6, OAQ(3)1492(FM), yn ôl.

Home Maintenance

Q7 Lorraine Barrett: Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government measures available to enable households to undertake basic home maintenance? OAQ(3)1470(FM)

The First Minister: There are 22 care and repair agencies in Wales, one for each local authority, and we provide core funding at a level of £4.5 million a year to enable them to

dirwasgiad hwn, gyflwyno amcangyfrif o'r senario gwaethaf tebygol o ran diweithdra, fel y gallwn, fel Cynulliad, gynllunio ar gyfer goblygiadau ofnadwy hynny o ran tlodi tanwydd, adfeddiannu ac ati?

Y Prif Weinidog: Un o ddibenion y siec £60 a roddir i bob pensïynwr ar 1 Ionawr yw mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd, a bydd ystod o bobl sy'n gymwys i gael y bonws Nadolig hefyd yn gymwys i gael y siec £60, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt yn bensiynwyr. Dyna oedd sail y cyfrifiad cyflym o £90 miliwn, a wnaethpwyd dros nos gennym ar sail ffigurau'r Trysorlys. O ran goblygiadau diweithdra, yr ydym wedi gweld y cyfeiriadau mewn adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol poenus o onest—y mwyaf gonest yr wyf wedi'i weld dros dri dirwasgiad arall cyn yr un hwn; ni chredaf fod unrhyw un arall wedi cyfeirio at allbwn a gollwyd yn barhaol fel y gwnaeth Alistair Darling ddoe. Cyfeiriodd at £60 biliwn mewn allbwn a gollwyd yn barhaol. Mae hynny'n awgrymu na fydd y diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol byth yn gallu dychwelyd i'w sefyllfa flaenorol. Yr wyf wedi nodi eisoes bod siâp economi Cymru'n ein amddiffyn rhag hyn i raddau, gan nad yw'r diwydiant gwasanaethau ariannol erioed wedi bod yn bwysig iawn yng Nghymru. Byddwch hefyd wedi gweld arolwg y *Financial Times* ddydd Llun, o ble ym Mhrydain y mae twf sector preifat wedi bod iachaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a Chymru oedd ar y brig, gyda 9 y cant o dwf sector preifat rhwng 1998 a 2006, yn uwch nag unrhyw un o naw rhanbarth Lloegr na'r Alban na Gogledd Iwerddon.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6, OAQ(3)1492(FM), is withdrawn.

Gwaith Cynnal a Chadw yn y Cartref

C7 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am fesurau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i alluogi pobl i wneud gwaith cynnal a chadw syml yn eu cartrefi? OAQ(3)1470(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ceir 22 o asiantaethau gofal a thrwsio yng Nghymru, un i bob awdurdod lleol, ac yr ydym yn darparu cyllid craidd ar lefel o £4.5 miliwn y flwyddyn i'w

carry out basic home maintenance for those who cannot do it themselves. We also provide an additional £2.1 million for the service that the agencies provide for those returning from hospital or the newly disabled, with rapid-response adaptations, such as the installation of grab rails, in homes.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for that response, First Minister, and for the support that is provided. I have been contacted by constituents in Penarth with regard to the care and repair service. My constituents feel that, although the service is excellent, it could be expanded to include housing association and council tenants who have small jobs to be done, such as fixing a curtain rail or putting up a shelf. While landlords are responsible for carrying out repairs to the homes of housing association and council tenants, it is sometimes the little jobs that can cause accidents—when you step onto a chair to try to fix something yourself. What opportunities might there be to look at expanding the care and repair service to the tenants of social landlords? The tenants would pay for those minor works, but it would be so much easier to have a friendly, helpful face turn up to do the jobs that no-one else can do.

The First Minister: We all face this problem. It is not worth paying a plumber a £100 call-out fee to carry out one small job, such as changing a washer, but it might be worth while if you have three small jobs that need to be done. The call-out fee might be unreasonable, but you have to get that job done or your tap will keep dripping, so there are problems in that area.

The difficulty if a service charge is paid to the housing association is that you are, in theory, paying public money twice—first to the housing association for coverage via the service charge, and then in additional sums via care and repair for a friendly handyman, handyperson, plumber or whoever to do the required odd job. It is a difficult issue. If you write to the Deputy Minister for Housing, Jocelyn Davies, I am sure that you will receive a considered reply.

galluogi i gyflawni gwaith cynnal a chadw sylfaenol yn y cartref i'r rheiny na allant ei wneud eu hunain. Yr ydym hefyd yn darparu £2.1 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth y mae'r asiantaethau'n ei ddarparu ar gyfer y rheiny sy'n dychwelyd o'r ysbyty neu bobl sydd newydd fynd yn anabl, gydag addasiadau brys, megis gosod rheiliau gafael, mewn cartrefi.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog, ac am y gefnogaeth a ddarperir. Mae etholwyr ym Mhenarth wedi cysylltu â mi ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth gofal a thrwsio. Teimla fy etholwyr, er bod y gwasanaeth yn wych, y gellid ei ymestyn i gynnwys tenantiaid y cyngor a chymdeithasau tai y mae angen gwneud mân dasgau yn eu cartrefi, megis trwsio rheilen llenni neu osod silff. Er mai'r landlordiaid sy'n gyfrifol am wneud gwaith trwsio yng nghartrefi tenantiaid y cyngor a chymdeithasau tai, y mân dasgau hynny a all achosi damweiniau weithiau—pan fyddwch yn camu ar gadair i geisio trwsio rhywbeth eich hun. Pa gyfleoedd a geir, o bosibl, i edrych ar ymestyn y gwasanaeth gofal a thrwsio i denantiaid landlordiaid cymdeithasol? Byddai'r tenantiaid yn talu am y mân dasgau hynny, ond byddai'n haws o lawer petai wyneb cyfeillgar, cymwynasgar yn galw i wneud y tasgau na all neb arall ei wneud.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym i gyd yn wynebu'r broblem hon. Nid yw'n werth talu ffi galw allan o £100 i blymwr wneud un dasg fach, megis newid wasier, ond gallai fod yn werth y ffi petai gennyhch dair tasg fach y mae angen eu gwneud. Efallai fod y ffi galw allan yn afresymol, ond rhaid ichi drwsio'r tap hwnnw neu bydd yn dal i ddiferu, felly ceir problemau yn y maes hwnnw.

Yr hyn sy'n anodd os telir tâl gwasanaeth i'r gymdeithas dai yw eich bod, mewn theori, yn talu arian cyhoeddus ddwywaith—yn gyntaf i'r gymdeithas dai i gael y gwasanaeth drwy'r tâl gwasanaeth, ac yna mewn symiau gofal a thrwsio ychwanegol am gael tasgmon, tasgmones neu blymwr cyfeillgar, neu bwy bynnag, i ddod i wneud ambell dasg y mae angen ei gwneud. Mae'n fater anodd. Os ysgrifennwch at y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai, Jocelyn Davies, yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch

ateb ag ôl meddwl mawr arno.

Mark Isherwood: A figure often used is that 70 per cent of the homes in which people will be living by 2050 have already been built, but the Welsh housing quality standard excludes the owner-occupied sector, and many local authorities are pulling in their belts on home improvement grants in the current economic climate. How do you propose to assist those lower-income households that happen to be owner-occupiers to fund essential home maintenance, not only to achieve a quality standard of living but to introduce energy efficiency, which will be so important in the difficult times ahead?

Mark Isherwood: Un ffigur a ddefnyddir yn aml yw bod 70 y cant o'r cartrefi y bydd pobl yn byw ynddynt erbyn 2050 eisoes wedi'u hadeiladu, ond mae safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn eithrio sector y tai sy'n berchen i'r rheiny sy'n byw ynddynt, ac mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn tynhau eu gwregysau yng nghyswllt grantiau gwella cartrefi yn yr hinsawdd economaidd bresennol. Sut yr ydych yn cynnig cynorthwyo'r teuluoedd hynny ar incwm isel sy'n digwydd bod yn berchen ar eu tai i dalu am waith cynnal a chadw hanfodol ar eu cartrefi, nid yn unig i sicrhau safon byw o ansawdd ond hefyd i gyflwyno effeithlonrwydd ynni, a fydd yn hynod bwysig yn y cyfnod anodd sydd o'n blaenau?

The First Minister: I mentioned earlier, in answer to Nick Bourne and others, that there is new money coming to us. Our budget processes mean that it is not obligatory for us to spend it in the same way as is proposed in England, but it is available to spend on home energy efficiency, because that is the channel through which it is coming to us. It is the only new money for us for next year announced in yesterday's pre-budget report, on top of what we already spend on home energy efficiency.

Y Prif Weinidog: Soniais yn gynharach, mewn ymateb i Nick Bourne ac Aelodau eraill, fod arian newydd yn dod atom. Mae ein prosesau cyllideb yn golygu nad oes yn rhaid inni ei wario yn yr un modd â'r hyn a gynigir yn Lloegr, ond mae ar gael inni ei wario ar effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref, oherwydd drwy'r sianel honno y daw atom ni. Dyna'r unig arian newydd inni ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adroddiad cyn cyllideb ddoe, ar ben yr hyn yr ydym eisoes yn ei wario ar effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref.

I should say that Care and Repair does more than the odd-jobbing that I referred to earlier, such as replacing washers or putting up curtain rails. It also gives advice to people on making the best possible case when filling in forms for home renovation grants, and on the management of building work where you are your own clerk of works for things done under the home renovation grant. There is a responsibility on the house owner, rather than just the council, for managing the HRG process. It also gives advice on benefit availability, which can be crucial, enabling you to be passported to some other benefits, including home energy and healthy home assessments. For many people, as they get frailer, a grab rail in the bath to prevent them from falling and breaking a leg can be important.

Dylwn ddweud bod Gofal a Thrwsio yn gwneud mwy na'r ambell fân dasgau y cyfeiriais atynt yn gynharach, megis gosod wasieri newydd neu osod rheiliau llenni. Mae hefyd yn rhoi cyngor i bobl am gyflwyno'u hachos yn y ffordd orau bosibl wrth lenwi ffurflenni am grantiau adnewyddu cartrefi, ac am reoli gwaith adeiladu pan fyddwch yn goruchwyllo gwaith a wneir dan y grant adnewyddu cartrefi. Mae cyfrifoldeb ar berchennog y tŷ, yn hytrach na'r cyngor yn unig, dros reoli proses y grant adnewyddu cartrefi. Mae hefyd yn rhoi cyngor am y budd-daliadau sydd ar gael, a all fod yn hanfodol, gan eich galluogi i gael eich cyfeirio at rai budd-daliadau eraill, gan gynnwys asesiadau ynni cartref ac asesiadau cartref iach. I lawer o bobl, wrth iddynt fynd yn fwy bregus, gall canllaw yn y bath i'w rhwystro rhag cwmpo a thorri eu coes fod yn bwysig.

David Lloyd: Rai misoedd yn ôl, daeth Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol i gytundeb â chwmnïau ynni i leihau'r defnydd a wneir o ynni drwy wella lefelau inswleiddio cartrefi. Mae rhai sylwadau cychwynnol yn awgrymu nad yw addewid y Llywodraeth Brydeinig wedi trosglwyddo i weithredu ar lawr gwlad, gan arwain at wella lefelau inswleiddio. A oes gennych adborth am hynny, ac a allwch roi adroddiad i'r Cynulliad ar nifer y cartrefi sydd wedi elwa ar y cynnig inswleiddio am ddim ers i Gordon Brown wneud y cyhoeddiad?

David Lloyd: Some months ago, the United Kingdom Government reached an agreement with energy companies to reduce energy consumption by improving home insulation. Some preliminary comments suggest that the British Government's promise has not yet been translated into action on the ground, leading to an improvement in insulation levels. Do you have any feedback on that, and can you give the Assembly a report on how many homes have benefited from the offer of free insulation since Gordon Brown's announcement?

1.50 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf ffigurau y prynhawn yma, ond byddaf yn gofyn i Jane Davidson ysgrifennu atoch, gan ei fod yn bwnc sydd ar flaen y gad o ran ei blaenoriaethau adrannol a'i blaenoriaethau personol hefyd. Bydd hi'n cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y chwe chwmni cyflenwi ynni mawr a'r Cymdeithas Manwerthu Ynni ar 2 Rhagfyr i drafod sut y gallant wneud eu gweithgareddau ar gyfer y targed lleihau allyriadau carbon, sef y rhaglen berthnasol y cyfeiriasoch ati, a rhai o'r rhaglenni cymdeithasol eraill yn fwy perthnasol ac effeithiol yng Nghymru.

The First Minister: I do not have figures to hand this afternoon, but I will ask Jane Davidson to write to you, given that it is at the forefront of her departmental as well as her personal priorities. She will be meeting representatives of the six large energy supply companies and the Energy Retail Association on 2 December, to discuss how they can make their activities on the carbon emissions reduction target, namely the relevant programme to which you referred, and some of the other social programmes more relevant and effective in Wales.

Mick Bates: You and others have already mentioned yesterday's £140 billion-worth pre-budget announcement, which included a reduction of 2.5 per cent in value-added tax as part of that package, which will cost the Exchequer £12.4 billion. VAT is not payable on essential items like food, so the reduction is unlikely to help a lot of middle and lower-income families. Do you agree that a better way to stimulate the economy and to put money back into people's pockets would be to reduce VAT to 5 per cent on building repair and improvements, which my colleague, Kirsty Williams, tabled a statement of opinion on? That would have the benefit of enabling families to retrofit microgeneration equipment or to undertake home improvements, and that would, in turn, provide valuable jobs in Wales. Given that Kirsty's statement of opinion has support from your backbenchers, what action are you taking to urge Westminster to adopt the proposal, which will be needed in the future, as we see that the economy is not fully stimulated by yesterday's package?

The First Minister: I reject what you said that the reduction of 2.5 per cent in VAT is irrelevant to less well off people because it does not cover food. We are not encouraging people to buy more food simply to put it in the cupboard. Why would people want to do that? They have to cover their food needs. What we are trying to do is stimulate people to resume their normal purchasing of the semi-essential, inessential and maybe essential items, but not the absolutely essential items such as food. Therefore, that comment is well off the mark. The important thing about the other changes in VAT, which we all welcome, is that a stimulus will be applied for 13 months to bring forward expenditure that people might otherwise defer until 2011 or 2012. They will have a particular opportunity to buy products and pay less VAT as of 1 December. You will have heard the criticism that we made that it is already tricky for retailers and others to incorporate the change over the next few days before 1 December. If you had more differentiated rates—and there is already a 5 per cent rate on certain items—we would

Mick Bates: Yr ydych chi ac Aelodau eraill eisoes wedi sôn am y cyhoeddiad cyn cyllideb gwerth £140 biliwn a wnaethpwyd ddoe, a oedd yn cynnwys gostyngiad o 2.5 y cant mewn treth ar werth fel rhan o'r pecyn hwnnw, a fydd yn costio £12.4 biliwn i'r Trysorlys. Nid yw TAW yn daladwy ar eitemau hanfodol megis bwyd, felly nid yw'r gostyngiad yn debygol o helpu llawer o deuluoedd ar incwm isel a chanolig. A gytnwch y byddai gostwng TAW i 5 y cant ar waith trwsio a gwella tai, sef mater y cyflwynodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Kirsty Williams, ddatganiad barn yn ei gylch, yn ffordd well o ysgogi'r economi a rhoi arian yn ôl ym mhocedi pobl? Mantais hynny fyddai galluogi teuluoedd i osod cyfarpar microgynhyrchu yn ôl-weithredol neu i wneud gwaith gwella cartrefi, a byddai hynny, yn ei dro, yn darparu swyddi gwerthfawr yng Nghymru. Ac ystyried bod datganiad barn Kirsty wedi cael cefnogaeth gan eich Aelodau o'r meinciau cefn, pa gamau gweithredu yr ydych yn eu cymryd i annog San Steffan i fabwysiadu'r cynnig, y bydd ei angen yn y dyfodol pan welwn nad yw'r pecyn a gyflwynwyd ddoe yn ysgogi'r economi yn llwyr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwrthodaf yr hyn a ddywedasoch fod y gostyngiad 2.5 y cant mewn TAW yn amherthnasol i bobl lai cyfoethog am nad yw'n cynnwys bwyd. Nid ydym yn annog pobl i brynu mwy o fwyd er mwyn ei gadw yn y cwpwrdd yn unig. Pam fyddai ar bobl eisiau gwneud hynny? Mae'n rhaid iddynt ddiwallu eu hanghenion bwyd. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei wneud yw ysgogi pobl i barhau â'u harferion arferol o brynu eitemau lled-hanfodol, anhanfodol ac efallai eitemau hanfodol, ond nid yr eitemau cwbl hanfodol megis bwyd. Felly, mae'r sylw hwnnw'n gwbl anghywir. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig am y newidiadau eraill mewn TAW, a groesewir gennym i gyd, yw y bydd ysgogiad yn cael ei osod am 13 mis i ddwyn gwariant ymlaen y byddai pobl efallai wedi'i ohirio tan 2011 neu 2012. Yn benodol, bydd ganddynt gyfle i brynu cynhyrchion a thalu llai o TAW o 1 Rhagfyr ymlaen. Byddwch wedi clywed y feirniadaeth yr ydym wedi'i rhoi ei bod eisoes yn anodd i gwmnïau manwerthu ac i werthwyr eraill ymgorffori'r newid dros yr ychydig ddyddiau nesaf cyn 1 Rhagfyr. Petai gennych fwy o gyfraddau

have to make sure that those rates, which were not the normal VAT rates that should apply to certain categories, were negotiated with Europe, and that certainly could not be done quickly to make it part of a fiscal stimulus. It may, however, still be a very good idea in principle for all sorts of green and green-jobs reasons.

gwahaniaethol—a cheir cyfradd 5 y cant ar eitemau penodol yn barod—byddai'n rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr bod y cyfraddau hynny, nad oeddent yn rhan o'r cyfraddau TAW cyffredin y dylid eu defnyddio mewn categorïau penodol, yn cael eu trafod gydag Ewrop, ac yn sicr, ni ellid gwneud hynny'n gyflym i'w gynnwys mewn ysgogiad ariannol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl ei fod yn dal yn syniad da iawn, mewn egwyddor, am bob math o resymau gwyrdd a rhesymau yn ymwneud â swyddi gwyrdd.

The Legislative Programme

Q8 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister provide an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's legislative programme for the next year? OAQ(3)1484(FM)

The First Minister: In a previous answer to you, I referred to my statement of 15 July, in which I set out the items of legislation that we aim to bring forward for the next year. On recent progress in this area, I am pleased to announce that, since your last question on this subject, the vulnerable children LCO has obtained parliamentary approval.

Jenny Randerson: I am pleased to see that progress, but if I were a teacher marking your work, I would give you only 50 per cent, given that only three of your six pieces of legislation from last year are making satisfactory progress. One is stuck in the Westminster mire and is the subject of an unseemly tussle between the Assembly and Parliament over powers, and two of them appear to be lost without trace. Do you plan to modify your programme for the future in the light of the unwillingness of Parliament to make swift and efficient progress with our legislation and to give us the powers that we request?

The First Minister: I am very grateful for your 50 per cent pass mark on our legislative programme's progress. That is very generous of you. You have used the words 'unseemly tussle' before, and no doubt that is part of the inter-party knockabout that you want to engage in. That is fair enough and we all

Y Rhaglen Ddeddfwriaethol

C8 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r manylion diweddaraf am raglen ddeddfwriaethol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf? OAQ(3)1484(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mewn ateb blaenorol ichi, cyfeiriais at fy natganiad ar 15 Gorffennaf, pan osodais allan yr eitemau o ddeddfwriaeth yr ydym yn bwriadu eu symud ymlaen ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Ynghylch cynnydd diweddar yn y maes hwn, yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi bod y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynghylch plant agored i niwed wedi cael cymeradwyaeth seneddol ers eich cwestiwn diwethaf ar y pwnc hwn.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn falch o weld y cynnydd hwnnw, ond petaem yn athrawes yn marcio eich gwaith, rhown 50 y cant yn unig ichi, ac ystyried mai dim ond tri o'ch chwe darn o ddeddfwriaeth ers y llynedd sy'n gwneud cynnydd boddhaol. Mae un yn sownd yng nghors San Steffan ac yn destun ysgarmes aflednais rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Senedd dros bwerau, ac ymddengys fod dau ohonynt wedi diflannu'n llwyr. A ydych yn bwriadu addasu eich rhaglen ar gyfer y dyfodol yng ngolwg amharodrwydd y Senedd i wneud cynnydd cyflym ac effeithlon â'n deddfwriaeth ac i roi'r pwerau inni yr ydym yn gofyn amdanynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am y marc pasio 50 y cant a roesoch imi am gynnydd ein rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol. Mae hynny'n hael iawn. Yr ydych wedi defnyddio'r geiriau 'ysgarmes aflednais' o'r blaen, ac mae hynny'n sicr yn rhan o'r frwydr rhyngbleidiol yr ydych yn awyddus i'w chael.

accept that. However, if the legislative competence Order that you are referring to on that front is the one that I think that you are referring to, it has simply been part of a bedding-in process. We are making good progress on that legislative competence Order, and we will report further progress when we get it. However, I cannot give a running commentary every week on any particular one.

You underplay the significance of the LCO on vulnerable children. As I have said in past months, we had envisaged that there would be some big legislative competence Orders, some broad ones, and some narrow ones. This is a broad one, which has now been approved by Parliament. It is a significant measure of consolidation, which enables us to take an holistic Welsh approach, and that will be of enormous benefit to vulnerable children in the way in which they are dealt with in Wales.

Lesley Griffiths: 'One Wales' pledged to ensure that we have an effective youth and criminal justice system in Wales, and that the Government would consider the potential for devolving some or all of the powers over the criminal justice system in Wales. Given the recently published report of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child, which is critical of how youth justice operates in the UK, do you think that the time has come to consider making progress on devolving more powers to us in that area?

The First Minister: The House of Commons Select Committee on Welsh Affairs recommended devolving youth justice to the Assembly some years ago. It is not an easy thing to do separately from the rest of the criminal justice agenda, as it would involve sentencing and such like. However, we have expressed an interest in this, and we expressed a positive response to the Welsh Affairs Committee's recommendations. The youth justice system is the closest to the rest of the agenda for which we are already responsible, but the issue is how you partition

Mae hynny'n ddigon teg ac yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, os y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y cyfeiriwch ato yn y cyswllt hwnnw yw'r un y credaf yr ydych yn cyfeirio ato, yn syml, mae wedi bod yn rhan o broses ymwreiddio. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd da yng nghyswllt y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol hwnnw, a byddwn yn adrodd ar ragor o gynnydd pan ddigwydda hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf roi sylwebaeth barhaus bob wythnos ar unrhyw un yn benodol.

Ni rowch ddigon o bwyslais ar bwysigrwydd y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynghylch plant agored i niwed. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud dros y misoedd diwethaf, yr oeddem wedi rhagweld y ceir rhai Gorchymynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol mawr, rhai eang, a rhai cul. Mae hwn yn un eang, ac mae'r Senedd wedi'i gymeradwyo erbyn hyn. Mae'n fesur cyfuno sylweddol, sy'n ein galluogi i gymryd ymagwedd Cymru gyfan, a bydd hynny o fudd mawr i blant agored i niwed yn y ffordd yr ymdrinnir â hwy yng Nghymru.

Lesley Griffiths: Addawodd 'Cymru'n Un' i sicrhau bod gennym system cyfiawnder ieuencid a throeddol effeithiol yng Nghymru, ac y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried y potensial ar gyfer datganoli rhai o'r pwerau dros y system cyfiawnder troseddol yng Nghymru, neu bob un ohonynt. Ac ystyried yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, sy'n feirniadol o'r ffordd y mae cyfiawnder ieuencid yn gweithio yn y DU, a gredwch ei bod yn bryd ystyried gwneud cynnydd ynghylch datganoli rhagor o bwerau inni yn y maes hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Argymhellodd Pwyllgor Dethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar Faterion Cymreig y dylid datganoli cyfiawnder ieuencid i'r Cynulliad rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Nid yw'n hawdd gwneud hynny ar wahân i weddill yr agenda cyfiawnder troseddol, oherwydd byddai'n cynnwys dedfrydu ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi mynegi diddordeb yn hyn, a mynegwyd ymateb cadarnhaol gennym i argymhellion y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig. Y system cyfiawnder ieuencid sydd agosaf at weddill yr eitemau ar yr agenda yr ydym yn gyfrifol

different bits of the criminal justice system, and find a way around the ragged edges that you would create. You would not get rid of the ragged edges; you would simply move them from A to B. That is the problem.

Darren Millar: The Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Legislative Competence) (No. 2) Order 2007, relating to environmental protection and waste management, was heralded as a cornerstone of your legislative programme when it was announced in the Chamber some 16 months ago. However, it now remains in a logjam at Westminster because of disagreements between the Labour Party here and the Labour Party there. It has not even commenced its parliamentary scrutiny process, despite its being a manifesto commitment that, presumably, both sides of the Labour Party—the side that you present here and the side that presents at Westminster—agreed to. Do you expect to be able to deliver the powers under that LCO to the Wales, or is that to be yet another broken promise to the people of Wales, and the people who supported you at the last election?

The First Minister: That is a slight exaggeration, Darren, but you are right to point to the environment LCO as the one on which we have had the greatest difficulty with Whitehall. Negotiations continue; we are gradually pushing all the dominoes down, but there is always one that remains that you cannot get out of the way, and that is the one that we continue to work on with our Westminster colleagues.

Alun Davies: Some Labour backbenchers have been concerned about the progress of some of the LCOs that are going through Whitehall. Once we have been through this process of learning and 'bedding in', as you say, when we would expect these teething issues, would you be prepared to accept that it may be useful to review how the process is working, particularly the relationships between the Welsh Assembly Government and individual Whitehall departments? That

amdanynt, ond y mater dan sylw yw sut mae rhannu gwahanol ddarnau o'r system cyfiawnder ieuencid, a dod o hyd i ffordd o osgoi'r ymylon afreolus y byddech yn eu creu. Ni fydddech yn cael gwared ar yr ymylon afreolus hyn, ond yn hytrach yn eu symud o A i B. Dyna'r broblem.

Darren Millar: Cafodd Gorchymyn Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol) (Rhif 2) 2007, sy'n ymwneud ag amddiffyn yr amgylchedd a rheoli gwastraff, ei ystyried yn gonglfaen eich rhaglen deddfwriaethol pan y'i cyhoeddwyd yn y Siambr oddeutu 16 mis yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, mae'n dal mewn tagfa yn San Steffan ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd anghytuno rhwng y Blaid Lafur yn y fan hon a'r Blaid Lafur yn y fan honno. Nid yw proses graffu'r Senedd wedi dechrau ar ei gyfer, hyd yn oed, er ei fod yn ymrwymiad manifffesto y cytunodd dwy ochr y Blaid Lafur—yr ochr a gyflwynir gennych yn y fan hon a'r ochr a gyflwynir yn San Steffan—arni, yn ôl pob tebyg. A ydych yn disgwyl gallu sicrhau'r pwerau dan y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol hwnnw i Gymru, ynteu a fydd hwnnw'n addewid arall a gaiff ei dorri i bobl Cymru, sef y bobl a'ch cefnogodd yn yr etholiad diwethaf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi gorliwio hynny fymryn, Darren, ond yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch mai'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynghylch yr amgylchedd yw'r un yr ydym wedi cael yr anhawster mwyaf yn ei gylch yn Whitehall. Mae'r trafodaethau'n dal i fynd rhagddynt; yr ydym yn gwthio'r holl rwystrau i lawr yn raddol, ond bydd un yn dal i sefyll na allwch ei symud o'r ffordd, a hwnnw yw'r un yr ydym yn dal i weithio yn ei gylch gyda'n cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan.

Alun Davies: Mae rhai o Aelodau meinciau cefn y Blaid Lafur wedi pryderu ynghylch cynnydd rhai o'r Gorchymynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol sydd wrthi'n mynd drwy Whitehall. Ar ôl inni fod drwy'r broses hon o ddysgu ac 'ymwreiddio', fel y dywedwch, pan fyddwn yn disgwyl y problemau cychwynnol hyn, a fydddech yn fodlon derbyn y gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol adolygu sut mae'r broses yn gweithio, yn enwedig y berthynas rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac

would ensure that we have a far smoother relationship with central UK departments, so that we can avoid these sorts of difficulties in the future.

The First Minister: What we always envisaged, as I have said dozens of time in the Chamber, was that there would be some big LCOs, some small ones, some consolidation Measures, and some brand-new Measures, and that we would find out as we went along which could get through the Whitehall machine easily, subject always to proper scrutiny here and in Whitehall and Westminster. Therefore, there was always going to be a learning process. As I mentioned to Darren, the most difficult logjam has been with the environment LCO; others have been more temporary than that, and are less fundamental. However, there is a learning process, as you recommend: at all times, we are learning as we go, as are Whitehall and Westminster.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ(3)1497(FM), yn ôl.

A494 Queensferry Bypass

Q10 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister provide an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans for the A494 Queensferry bypass? OAQ(3)1480(FM)

2.00 p.m.

The First Minister: You will be aware that the original proposals to improve the A494 were rejected by the inspector following the inquiry in February of this year. Ieuan Wyn Jones, the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport, accepted that conclusion in March. On 7 October, he announced plans to update traffic data and to look at alternative answers to the problem.

Brynle Williams: Time has passed, Minister, and there is much speculation in the Queensferry area about what is going on. It seems a rather ridiculous situation. We now

adrannau unigol yn Whitehall? Byddai hynny'n sicrhau bod gennym berthynas fwy hwylus o lawer gydag adrannau canolog y DU, er mwyn inni allu osgoi'r math hwn o broblemau yn y dyfodol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr hyn yr oeddem wedi'i ragweld o'r cychwyn, fel y dywedais ddwsinau o weithiau yn y Siambr, oedd y ceid rhai Gorchmynion cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol mawr, rhai bach, rhai Mesurau cyfuno, a rhai Mesurau newydd sbon, ac y byddem yn cael gwybod wrth fynd ymlaen pa rai a allai symud drwy beiriant Whitehall yn hawdd, yn amodol bob amser ar graffu priodol yma ac yn Whitehall a San Steffan. Felly, yr oeddem yn rhagweld proses ddysgu o'r cychwyn. Fel y soniais wrth Darren, cafwyd y dagfa anoddaf gyda'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynghylch yr amgylchedd; tagfeydd dros dro a fu'r gweddill, ac maent yn llai sylfaenol. Fodd bynnag, ceir proses ddysgu, fel yr argymhellir gennych: bob amser, yr ydym yn dysgu wrth fynd ymlaen, fel y mae Whitehall a San Steffan hefyd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9, OAQ(3)1497(FM), is withdrawn.

Ffordd Osgoi'r A494 Queensferry

C10 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r manylion diweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer ffordd osgoi'r A494 Queensferry? OAQ(3)1480(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwch yn ymwybodol y cafodd y cynigion gwreiddiol i wella'r A494 eu gwrthod gan yr arolygydd ar ôl yr ymchwiliad ym mis Chwefror eleni. Derbyniodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, y casgliad hwnnw ym mis Mawrth. Ar 7 Hydref, cyhoeddodd gynlluniau i ddiweddarau data traffig ac ystyried atebion eraill i'r broblem.

Brynle Williams: Mae amser wedi mynd heibio, Weinidog, ac mae llawer o ddyfalu yn ardal Queensferry am yr hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen. Mae'r sefyllfa'n ymddangos yn

have six lanes going to the River Dee and ending there. I would appreciate an update on what is happening.

The First Minister: You are right in drawing our attention to the fact that the inspector's report did not state that nothing needed to be done to the A494; he was of the opinion that it would need some improvement in the future. The options are being considered now, and they include alternative routes, public transport, including the A548 Flintshire bridge, and utilising the latest technology and softer, complementary traffic management measures. It is now about putting that package together, following the inspector's rejection of plan A, to form plan B. I am sure that Ieuan Wyn Jones, as the Minister responsible for these matters, will update the Assembly as soon as they are crystallised.

Janet Ryder: A number of properties along both sides of the roadway were purchased under compulsory purchase orders. Those properties are now empty and are becoming damaged and creating an eyesore. The local community has always wanted an input into how that extra land will be used. This would be the ideal opportunity to involve those local communities, given that some land may be needed for future road programmes to go through. There must be some way of allowing local voices to be heard in a local planning mission. That would allow those people to feel some ownership again of that area and of this part of the scheme. Would you look at that and consider what can be done to help those residents?

The First Minister: You are right to refer to the bruised feelings of people in the area. This was never a popular scheme, and that was one of the factors that the inspector took into account in rejecting plan A. Now that we have property that we, presumably, no longer require, it is not clear to me how we return it to the community or to the original owners if they want it. When a scheme is brought forward, a public inquiry is held, and an inspector states, 'I have concluded that you should not proceed with it', a possible

chwerthinllyd braidd. Bellach mae gennym chwe lôn yn mynd at afon Dyfrdwy ac yn gorffen yno. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr hyn sy'n digwydd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu ein sylw at y ffaith na ddywedodd adroddiad yr arolygydd nad oedd angen gwneud dim i'r A494; yr oedd o'r farn y byddai angen ei gwella ychydig yn y dyfodol. Mae'r dewisiadau'n cael eu hystyried yn awr, ac maent yn cynnwys llwybrau eraill, trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, gan gynnwys pont sir y Fflint ar yr A548, a defnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf a mesurau rheoli traffig cydategol, meddalach. Y gwaith yn awr yw rhoi'r pecyn hwnnw at ei gilydd, wedi i'r arolygydd wrthod cynllun A, i ffurfio cynllun B. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Ieuan Wyn Jones, fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y materion hyn, yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad cyn gynted ag y byddant yn glir.

Janet Ryder: Prynwyd nifer o dai ar hyd dwy ochr y ffordd dan orchmynion prynu gorfodol. Mae'r tai hynny'n wag yn awr ac yn cael eu difrodi ac yn troi'n ddolur llygad. Mae wedi bod yn ddymuniad erioed gan y gymuned leol gael mewnbwn o ran y modd y defnyddir y tir ychwanegol hwnnw. Byddai hyn yn gyfle delfrydol i gynnwys y cymunedau lleol hynny, a chofio y gallai fod angen rhywfaint o dir i hwyluso rhaglenni ffyrdd yn y dyfodol. Rhaid cael rhyw fodd i ganiatáu clywed y farn leol mewn cenhadaeth gynllunio leol. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu i'r bobl hynny deimlo bod ganddynt rywfaint o berchnogaeth eto ar yr ardal honno ac ar y rhan hon o'r cynllun. A fydddech yn edrych ar hynny ac yn ystyried beth y gellir ei wneud i helpu'r preswylwyr hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n briodol ichi gyfeirio at deimladau briw pobl yn yr ardal. Ni fu hwn erioed yn gynllun poblogaidd, ac yr oedd hynny'n un o'r ffactorau a ystyriodd yr arolygydd wrth wrthod cynllun A. A ninnau'n berchen ar eiddo nad oes arnom ei angen bellach, gellir cymryd, nid yw'n glir i mi sut y'i dychwelwn i'r gymuned neu i ddwylo'r perchnogion gwreiddiol os ydynt am ei gael. Pan fydd cynllun yn cael ei ddwyn ymlaen, ac ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn cael ei gynnal, ac arolygydd yn dweud, 'Yr

consequence is that the land becomes surplus to requirement.

The ideas that you have referred to regarding holding more community consultation on what to do now would probably be appropriate. I am sure that you can draw that to Ieuan's attention.

Eleanor Burnham: Like others, I am delighted for the residents who have been hard-pressed and worried about having huge amounts of extra traffic running alongside their homes. What possibilities, including those around the greening of freight, have you discussed with Network Rail with regard to substantially reducing the volume of freight traffic that travels along that extremely busy hill?

The First Minister: I am uncertain regarding the freight aspect, but certainly the greening of non-freight passenger road transport by a modal switch from private transport to public transport is very much at the heart of plan B, which is being considered at the moment. Public transport, using the latest technology, traffic management, pedestrians and cycling—all of the green alternatives—are being considered. I am uncertain as to whether you can also apply that to freight use. I will ask Ieuan Wyn Jones to consider that and to write to you on that particular point.

Prison Sites in North Wales

Q11 Mark Isherwood: What discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government had regarding potential prison sites in north Wales? OAQ(3)1479(FM)

The First Minister: There is nothing further to report since we last discussed this. There are two sites on the shortlist in north Wales: the former Ferodo factory in Caernarfon and the former Firestone factory in Wrexham.

Mark Isherwood: You will probably be aware that Denbighshire County Council has written to the Ministry of Justice supporting the proposal for a site in north Wales and

wyf wedi dod i'r casgliad na ddylech fynd ymlaen ag ef,' un canlyniad posibl yw y bydd y tir yn mynd yn ddiangen.

Mae'n debyg y byddai'r syniadau yr ydych wedi cyfeirio atynt o ran ymgynghori'n fwy helaeth â'r gymuned ar yr hyn i'w wneud yn awr yn rhai priodol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwch dynnu hynny i sylw Ieuan.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel rhai eraill, yr wyf yn falch dros y preswylwyr sydd wedi bod dan bwysau ac wedi poeni ynghylch cael llawer iawn o draffig ychwanegol yn mynd heibio i'w cartrefi. Pa bosibiliadau yr ydych wedi'u trafod â Network Rail, gan gynnwys y rheiny sy'n ymwneud â dulliau gwyrdd o gludo nwyddau, gyda golwg ar leihau'n sylweddol faint y traffig nwyddau sy'n mynd ar hyd y ffordd brysur iawn honno ar y bryn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch yr agwedd sy'n ymwneud â chludo nwyddau ond, yn sicr, mae sicrhau dulliau gwyrdd o gludo teithwyr, nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â chludo nwyddau, ar ffyrdd drwy newid moddol o drafnidiaeth breifat i drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus yn elfen ganolog yng nghynllun B, sy'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Mae trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, defnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf, rheoli traffig, cerddwyr a beicwyr—yr holl ddewisiadau gwyrdd—yn cael eu hystyried. Nid wyf yn sicr a ellir cymhwyso hynny at gludo nwyddau hefyd. Gofynnaf i Ieuan Wyn Jones ystyried hynny ac ysgrifennu atoch am y pwynt penodol hwnnw.

Safleoedd Carchar yn y Gogledd

C11 Mark Isherwood: Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cael ynghylch safleoedd posibl i garchardai yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ(3)1479(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim pellach i'w adrodd ers inni drafod hyn ddiwethaf. Mae dau safle ar y rhestr fer yn y gogledd: cynffatri Ferodo yng Nghaernarfon a chyn-ffatri Firestone yn Wrexham.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'n debyg y byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Cyngor Sir Ddinbych wedi ysgrifennu i'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder gan gefnogi'r cynnig i gael safle

proposing two additional sites in Denbighshire. I believe that Ministry of Justice officials have visited at least one of those sites. The North Wales Economic Forum has issued a document supporting a prison in north Wales, stating that north Wales is more in need of its first prison than south Wales is in need of a fifth. Do you agree with that? Does the Assembly Government support the North Wales Economic Forum in its statement that the prison should be in north Wales? If so, what representations are you making to ensure that that would include youth custody and female provision as well as that for adult male custody?

The First Minister: The point that you make about the extension of the consultation period is important. The consultation period does not finish until 28 November 2008, and the Ministry of Justice may wish to add sites to the shortlist following the representations made by local authorities in Wales.

We have to be neutral as to whether we support a prison in north Wales, as distinct from a prison in south Wales. You asked a question about north Wales, and I answered it accurately. There are two sites on the Ministry of Justice's shortlist in north Wales, which are the former Ferodo and Firestone factories. Likewise, there are two sites in south Wales on the shortlist. We do not know whether the Ministry of Justice wants to build two jails in Wales, whether it wants jail capacity for women prisoners only, or whether it wants capacity for male and female prisoners. We do not know whether it wants to continue with the successful Peterborough experiment, in which males and females, uniquely, in the Ministry of Justice's estate, are housed in separate blocks within the same prison. That is a matter for the Ministry of Justice; we are neutral. If there were only to be one new prison in Wales, it would be up to the Ministry of Justice to decide whether it should be in north or south Wales.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 12, OAQ(3)1477(FM), a chwestiwn 13, OAQ(3)1467(FM), yn ôl.

yn y gogledd a chynnig dau safle ychwanegol yn sir Ddinbych. Credaf fod swyddogion y Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder wedi ymweld ag o leiaf un o'r safleoedd hynny. Mae Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru wedi cyhoeddi dogfen o blaid cael carchar yn y gogledd, gan ddatgan bod ar ogledd Cymru fwy o angen cael ei garchar cyntaf nag y mae ar dde Cymru angen cael ei bumed. A ydych yn derbyn hynny? A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi datganiad Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru y dylai'r carchar fod yn y gogledd? Os ydyw, pa sylwadau yr ydych yn eu cyflwyno i sicrhau y byddai hynny'n cynnwys dalfa ar gyfer pobl ifanc a darpariaeth i fenywod yn ogystal â honno ar gyfer dalfa i oedolion gwrywaidd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud am ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori'n bwysig. Ni ddaw'r cyfnod ymgynghori i ben tan 28 Tachwedd 2008, a gallai'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder ddymuno ychwanegu safleoedd at y rhestr fer yn dilyn y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

Rhaid inni fod yn ddiuedd o ran a ydym o blaid cael carchar yng ngogledd Cymru, yn hytrach na charchar yn ne Cymru. Gofynasoch gwestiwn am y gogledd, ac fe'i hatebais yn gywir. Mae dau safle ar restr fer y Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder yn y gogledd, sef cyn-ffatri Ferodo a chyn-ffatri Firestone. Yn yr un modd, mae dau safle yn y de ar y rhestr fer. Ni wyddom a yw'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder am godi dau garchar yng Nghymru, a yw am gael lle mewn carchardai i fenywod sy'n garcharorion yn unig, neu a yw am gael lle i garcharorion gwrywaidd a benywaidd. Ni wyddom a yw am barhau â'r arbrawf llwyddiannus yn Peterborough, lle mae gwrywod a benywod yn cael eu cadw mewn blociau ar wahân yn yr un carchar, sy'n unigryw ar ystad y Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder. Mae hynny'n fater i'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder; yr ydym yn ddiuedd. Pe na fyddai ond un carchar newydd yng Nghymru, mater i'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder fyddai penderfynu a ddylai fod yn y gogledd neu yn y de.

The Presiding Officer: Question 12, OAQ(3)1477(FM), and question 13, OAQ(3)1467(FM), have been withdrawn.

The Current Financial Crisis

Q14 Kirsty Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of the current financial crisis on Wales? OAQ(3)1475(FM)

The First Minister: Labour market data shows clearly that the Welsh economy is slowing in a similar fashion to the economy in the rest of the UK, although it is possibly slightly worse in Wales. However, the *Financial Times* survey that I referred to earlier shows that private sector growth over the past eight years has been stronger in Wales than in any other part of the UK. Therefore, you have to balance those two factors in working out what the impact will be in 2009-10 and beyond.

Kirsty Williams: The effect of the current crisis on the private sector is manifold. There have been particular problems with the credit insurance market retrenching, which is causing some businesses, and especially small businesses in Wales, difficulty in trading with long-established customers. In France, the Government has sought to support the credit insurance industry. What discussions have you had with your colleagues in London about doing the same? I know that your colleagues in London are working with the Institute of Credit Management to provide assistance and information to businesses on the issues of credit management. Does your Government intend to do the same?

The First Minister: In early October, before the first economic summit, I paid a visit to the premises next door, which is the home of Atradius, one of the leading companies in the area of credit management. Its representatives expressed to me that, since the company's claims were rising rapidly because of non-payment, it was going to have to put its insurance rates up, as all insurance companies do when they have more claims—they have to compensate by charging higher premiums for the following year. The company also expressed concern about the impact of the Icelandic crisis, which was then at its full height, and the problems on the retail high street and with some of the more

Yr Argyfwng Ariannol Presennol

C14 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am effaith yr argyfwng ariannol presennol ar Gymru? OAQ(3)1475(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae data ar y farchnad lafur yn dangos yn glir fod economi Cymru'n arafu mewn modd tebyg i economi gweddill y DU, er ei bod ychydig yn waeth o bosibl yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arolwg gan y *Financial Times* y cyfeiriais ato'n gynharach yn dangos bod twf y sector preifat dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf wedi bod yn gryfach yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU. Felly, rhaid ichi gydbwyso'r ddau ffactor hynny wrth geisio canfod beth fydd yr effaith yn 2009-10 ac ar ôl hynny.

Kirsty Williams: Mae effaith yr argyfwng presennol ar y sector preifat yn amlochrog. Mae problemau neilltuol wedi bod wrth i'r farchnad yswiriant credyd leihau, sy'n achosi anhawster i rai busnesau yng Nghymru, a busnesau bach yn enwedig, o ran masnachu â chwsmeriaid hir sefydlog. Yn Ffrainc, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ceisio cefnogi'r diwydiant yswiriant credyd. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael â'ch cymheiriaid yn Llundain ynghylch gwneud yr un peth? Gwn fod eich cymheiriaid yn Llundain yn cydweithio â'r Sefydliad Rheoli Credyd i roi cymorth a gwybodaeth i fusnesau ar y materion sy'n ymwneud â rheoli credyd. A yw'ch Llywodraeth yn bwriadu gwneud yr un peth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ddechrau Hydref, cyn yr uwchgynhadledd economaidd gyntaf, ymwelais â'r adeilad drws nesaf, sy'n gartref i Atradius, un o'r cwmnïau mwyaf blaenllaw ym maes rheoli credyd. Dywedodd ei gynrychiolwyr wrthyf fod y cwmni'n mynd i orfod codi ei gyfraddau yswiriant, gan fod yr hawliadau iddo'n cynyddu'n gyflym am fod taliadau heb eu gwneud, fel y bydd yr holl gwmnïau yswiriant yn gwneud pan gânt fwy o hawliadau—rhaid iddynt ddal y ddysgl yn wastad drwy godi premiymau uwch ar gyfer y flwyddyn ddilynol. Mynegodd y cwmni bryder hefyd ynghylch effaith yr argyfwng yng Ngwlad yr Iâ, a oedd yn ei anterth bryd hynny, a'r problemau yn siopau'r stryd fawr

marginal chains of retailers and what they were purchasing from their suppliers. We invited Atradius to the first economic summit, which was held almost two months ago, and its presentation was one of the most interesting that we had.

Alun Davies: In terms of how Wales responds to the current financial crisis, I am sure that you would agree with me that continuing to invest in manufacturing and skills will lead to the creation of a world-class economy in Wales. However, if we are to achieve our potential and enable people in Wales to achieve their potential, we will need to focus on ensuring that we have the skill levels plus the research and development funding and spending in Wales to underpin strong economic growth. Would you agree that we need to continue to invest in research and development to ensure that Wales can compete effectively with the rest of the United Kingdom as well as the rest of the world?

The First Minister: I accept that. Firms must have a survival toolkit to get through the present recession, and then they must have a long-term competitiveness toolkit to come out the other side fighting fit. Both of those issues are addressed by the ReACT and ProACT programmes. We all know about the ReACT programme; the ProACT programme is being worked on at present in Jane Hutt's and John Griffiths's department. We hope to give details about that before long. That will deal with the pre-redundancy situation by enabling people to be re-skilled and to complete apprenticeships, or, if they did an apprenticeship 25 years ago, to bring their skills up to date. You must have a vision of what you are going to do if you can survive the recession, as well as the survival toolkit to get through it.

Historically, Wales has not been strong in research and development. However, the research and development tax breaks that are now available are important, and that is one of the reasons why we have some of the world's big names in technology research and development developing in Wales now; they never did before.

a rhai o'r cadwynau manwerthu mwy ymylol a'r hyn yr oeddent yn ei brynu gan eu cyflenwyr. Gwahoddasom Atradius i'r uwchgynhadledd economaidd gyntaf, a gynhaliwyd bron ddeufis yn ôl, a'i gyflwyniad ef oedd un o'r rhai mwyaf diddorol a gawsom.

Alun Davies: O ran y modd y mae Cymru'n ymateb i'r argyfwng ariannol presennol, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech â mi y bydd parhau i fuddsoddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu a sgiliau'n arwain at greu economi o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, os ydym i wireddu ein potensial a galluogi pobl yng Nghymru i wireddu eu potensial, bydd angen inni ganolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod gennym y lefelau sgiliau angenrheidiol ynghyd â'r ariannu ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu a'r gwariant sy'n angenrheidiol yng Nghymru i gynnal twf economaidd cryf. A gytunech fod angen inni ddal i fuddsoddi mewn ymchwil a datblygu i sicrhau bod Cymru'n gallu cystadlu'n effeithiol â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn ogystal â gweddill y byd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Rhaid i fusnesau fod â modd i barhau drwy'r dirwasgiad presennol, ac wedyn rhaid iddynt fod â modd i gystadlu yn y tymor hir er mwyn dod allan yn y pen arall yn atebol i unrhyw beth. Mae'r ddau fater hynny'n cael sylw drwy'r rhaglenni ReACT a ProACT. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod am raglen ReACT; mae gwaith yn digwydd ar raglen ProACT ar hyn o bryd yn adran Jane Hutt a John Griffiths. Yr ydym yn gobeithio rhoi manylion am hynny cyn hir. Bydd honno'n delio â'r sefyllfa cyn colli swyddi drwy alluogi pobl i ddysgu sgiliau newydd a chwblhau prentisiaethau, neu, os gwnaethant brentisiaeth 25 mlynedd yn ôl, i ddiweddarau eu sgiliau. Rhaid ichi fod â gweledigaeth o'r hyn yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud os gallwch barhau drwy'r dirwasgiad, yn ogystal â'r modd i ddod drwyddo.

Yn hanesyddol, nid yw Cymru wedi bod yn gryf o ran ymchwil a datblygu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyfleoedd treth ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu sydd ar gael yn awr yn bwysig, a dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y mae rhai o'r enwau mwyaf blaenllaw o ran ymchwil a datblygu ym maes technoleg yn datblygu yng Nghymru'n awr; ni wnaethant erioed o'r

blaen.

2.10 p.m.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yn amlwg, yn yr argyfwng ariannol sy'n wynebu Cymru, fel mae'n wynebu rhannau helaeth o'r byd, bydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru benderfyniadau anodd i'w cymryd. A gytunwch fod unigolion a chwmnïau yn y byd celfyddydol yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn cyrraedd lefelau o ardderchogrwydd ar lwyfannau rhyngwladol? A allwch ein sicrhau na fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwneud yr hyn y mae Llywodraethau eraill wedi ei wneud yn y math hwn o sefyllfa, sef targedu cyllideb sydd yn weddol hawdd ei tharo mewn sefyllfa o'r fath, fel y gyllideb dreftadaeth, ond sicrhau bod y berthynas dda a adeiladwyd â'r gymuned gelfyddydol yng Nghymru yn parhau er ein bod yn derbyn bod y sefyllfa ariannol hon yn anodd i bawb?

Y Prif Weinidog: Derbyniaf yr egwyddor honno. Darllenais—er nad wyf yn cofio hyn y bersonol—am raglen yr Arlywydd Franklin Delano Roosevelt yn y 1930au yn yr Unol Daleithiau, sef rhaglen y Fargen Newydd. O dan y rhaglen honno, cyflogwyd pobl o'r byd celfyddydol a defnyddiwyd hwy i godi ysbryd a rhoi gwaith a chyfle iddynt ddatblygu yr ochr greadigol ac ardderchogrwydd. Y rhaglen honno oedd un o'r pethau mwyaf llwyddiannus a wnaeth yr Unol Daleithiau o dan Roosevelt yn y 1930au.

Jeff Cuthbert: Clearly the economic situation has hit the manufacturing sector as hard as any other sector, but do you agree that reports such as that in yesterday's *Financial Times*, which stated that Wales has been the only part of the UK where private sector growth has outpaced that of the public sector in recent years, are encouraging?

The First Minister: It was an interesting report, because it confirmed something that we have always said but on which we have not always found acceptance across the party-political divide in Wales. Even with the assumptions chosen, which were pretty restrictive, it was still found that Wales was in positive territory, having, at 9 per cent

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Obviously, during the current financial crisis that Wales is facing, along with the vast majority of the world, the Government of Wales will have some difficult decisions to take. Would you agree that individuals and companies in the world of art in Wales are attaining levels of excellence on international platforms? Can you assure us that the Government of Wales will not do what other Governments have done under these kinds of circumstances, namely targeting a budget that is a relatively easy target in such circumstances, such as the heritage budget, but instead that it will ensure that the good relationship that has been built up with the arts community in Wales will continue, although we accept that the current financial situation is difficult for everyone?

The First Minister: I accept that principle. I read—although I do not remember this personally—about President Franklin Delano Roosevelt's New Deal programme during the 1930s. Under that programme, people from the arts world were employed to raise people's spirits and to give them work and an opportunity to develop creativity and excellence. It was one of the most successful steps taken by the United States of America under Roosevelt in the 1930s.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n amlwg bod y sefyllfa economaidd wedi taro'r sector gweithgynhyrchu cyn galeted ag y mae wedi taro unrhyw sector arall, ond a ydych yn cytuno bod adroddiadau fel hwnnw yn y *Financial Times* ddoe, a nododd mai Cymru fu'r unig ran o'r DU lle mae'r sector preifat wedi tyfu'n gynt na'r sector cyhoeddus yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn galonogol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd yn adroddiad diddorol, gan ei fod yn cadarnhau rhywbeth yr ydym wedi'i ddweud erioed ond heb bob amser gael gan y rhai ar draws y rhaniad gwleidyddol yng Nghymru ei dderbyn. Hyd yn oed ar sail y rhagdybiaethau a ddewiswyd, a oedd yn eithaf cyfyngol, cafwyd bod Cymru ar yr ochr gadarnhaol o hyd, gan fod

over the eight years between 1998 and 2006, a higher rate of private sector growth than that in any of the nine English regions, Scotland or Northern Ireland. Since north-east England was next to us, it also showed that the myth that is sometimes purveyed that we are 'public sector dependent' or that public sector dependency crowds out healthy private sector activity is complete rubbish. That is simply not supported by the evidence on employment trends.

Lesley Griffiths: I am currently undertaking a survey of small and medium-sized enterprises in my constituency of Wrexham to ascertain what problems they face when dealing with banks during the current economic downturn. I will gladly share the results of the survey with you, but in the meantime, do you agree that there is an onus on banks to help businesses as much as possible, just as Welsh taxpayers have helped banks in recent weeks?

The First Minister: Yes. When they accepted £37 billion of taxpayers' money to recapitalise them, the banks gave an undertaking to restore lending rates to 2007 levels. It is not easy to monitor that, because you cannot have a civil servant standing in the interview room when the bank manager discusses a potential loan with a client. That is not feasible. However, the banks should be made to abide by that condition otherwise it was accepted somewhat dishonestly on their part.

I am pleased that you are monitoring the situation in Wrexham, and I would like to see the results of your survey, because that will be valuable evidence with which we can have a go at the banks at the Welsh level. We can then also ask Gordon Brown, Alistair Darling, Peter Mandelson and other Ministers who are involved in monitoring the banks more directly at Westminster level to say, 'Come on—we have put in the money, why are you not lending it?'

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 15, OAQ(3)1476(FM), yn ôl. Diolch i'r Prif

ei chyfradd dwf o 9 y cant ar gyfer y sector preifat dros yr wyth mlynedd rhwng 1998 a 2006, yn uwch na honno ar gyfer unrhyw un o naw rhanbarth Lloegr, yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon. Gan fod gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr yn nesaf atom, yr oedd hefyd yn dangos bod y goel a daenir weithiau i'r perwyl ein bod yn dibynnu ar y sector cyhoeddus neu fod dibyniaeth ar y sector cyhoeddus yn cyfyngu gweithgarwch iach yn y sector preifat yn nonsens pur. Nid yw'r dystiolaeth ar dueddiadau cyflogaeth yn ategu hynny o gwbl.

Lesley Griffiths: Yr wyf yn gwneud arolwg ar hyn o bryd o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn fy etholaeth, sef Wrecsam, i gael gwybod pa broblemau a wynebant wrth ddelio â banciau yn ystod y dirywiad economaidd presennol. Byddaf yn falch o rannu canlyniadau'r arolwg â chi, ond yn y cyfamser, a ydych yn cytuno ei fod yn gyfrifoldeb i fanciau helpu busnesau gymaint ag y gellir, yn union fel y mae trethdalwyr Cymru wedi helpu banciau yn yr wythnosau diwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Pan dderbyniasant £37 biliwn o arian y trethdalwyr i'w hailgyfalafu, addawodd y banciau adfer cyfraddau benthyca i lefelau 2007. Nid yw'n hawdd monitro hynny, gan na ellir cael gwas sifil yn sefyll yn yr ystafell gyfweld pan fydd y rheolwr banc yn trafod benthyciad posibl â chleient. Nid yw hynny'n ymarferol. Er hynny, dylid gwneud i'r banciau ufuddhau i'r amod hwnnw neu, fel arall, fe'i derbyniwyd braidd yn anonest ar eu rhan.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cadw golwg ar y sefyllfa yn Wrecsam, a hoffwn weld canlyniadau'ch arolwg, gan y bydd hynny'n dystiolaeth werthfawr inni ei defnyddio yn erbyn y banciau ar lefel Cymru. Gallwn ofyn wedyn hefyd i Gordon Brown, Alistair Darling, Peter Mandelson a Gweinidogion eraill sy'n ymwneud â monitro'r banciau'n fwy uniongyrchol ar lefel San Steffan ddweud, 'Dewch ymlaen—yr ydym wedi cyfrannu'r arian, pam nad ydych yn ei fenthyca?'

The Presiding Officer: Question 15, OAQ(3)1476(FM), has been withdrawn. I

Weinidog am ateb y cwestiynau.

thank the First Minister for answering the questions.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Counsel General and Leader of the House (Carwyn Jones): I have one change to report to today's planned Government business, namely that the statement by the Deputy First Minister on the rail programme and the reprioritisation of the trunk road forward programme has been postponed until next Tuesday, 2 December. In its place, the Minister for Rural Affairs will make a statement on the common agricultural policy health check.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement and announcement that can be found in the agenda papers available to Members electronically.

Alun Cairns: What plans do you have to bring forward a debate following the Chancellor's statement yesterday? There are significant implications for Wales as there will be additional capital funding and possibly revenue funding, and every Member will no doubt want to express a view on that. There are also downsides for Wales, in that the health service is Wales's largest employer, and local government is the second largest, and the increase in national insurance contributions for employers will have a significant effect in taking money out of Wales, despite the claims made by some in the Assembly Government and by other Labour politicians. We need to get to the bottom of this, and we need to explore all of the implications. What plans do you have to bring forward this important debate early on so that we can bring transparency to yesterday's murky statement?

Carwyn Jones: A statement will be made next week, as has been mentioned. All of us on this side of the Chamber welcome what was said in yesterday's pre-budget report. We saw Alistair Darling swimming confidently in the financial sea while George Osborne looked like a little boy who had just taken off his water wings.

Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac Arweinydd y Tŷ (Carwyn Jones): Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd ym musnes arfaethedig y Llywodraeth heddiw, sef bod y datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am y rhaglen reilffyrdd ac ailflaenoriaethu'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd wedi'i ohirio tan ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 2 Rhagfyr. Yn ei le, bydd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn gwneud datganiad am archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes y gellir ei weld ymysg y papurau agenda sydd ar gael i Aelodau'n electronig.

Alun Cairns: Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i ddod â dadl gerbron yn dilyn datganiad y Canghellor ddoe? Mae goblygiadau arwyddocaol i Gymru gan y ceir cyllid cyfalaf ac efallai gyllid refeniw ychwanegol, ac mae'n siŵr y bydd pob Aelod yn awyddus i fynegi barn ar hynny. Mae anfanteision i Gymru hefyd, sef mai'r gwasanaeth iechyd yw cyflogwr mwyaf Cymru, a llywodraeth leol yw'r ail fwyaf, a chaiff y cynnydd yng nghyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol cyflogwyr effaith sylweddol o ran cymryd arian allan o Gymru, er gwaethaf yr haeriadau a wneir gan rai yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chan wleidyddion Llafur eraill. Mae angen inni fynd at wraidd hyn ac mae angen inni ymchwilio i'r goblygiadau i gyd. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i gyflwyno'r dadl bwysig hon yn fuan fel y gallwn ddod â thryloywder i ddatganiad niwlog ddoe?

Carwyn Jones: Gwneir datganiad yr wythnos nesaf, fel y soniwyd. Mae pawb ohonom ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr yn croesawu'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ddoe. Gwelsom Alistair Darling yn nofio'n hyderus yn y môr ariannol tra mae George Osborne yn edrych fel crwtyn bach a oedd newydd dynnu'i adenydd dŵr.

Nerys Evans: Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod mai heddiw yw Diwrnod Rhyngwladol Gwaredu Trais yn erbyn Menywod, gyda'r rhuban gwyn yn symbol o'r ffaith na oddefwn na chadw'n dawel am drais yn erbyn menywod. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod llawer o Aelodau Cynulliad yn gwisgo'r rhuban gwyn. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cymunedau a Diwylliant yn lansio adroddiad am strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar drais yn erbyn menywod yr wythnos nesaf. A allwch sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn ymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor mor gyflym â phosibl yn y flwyddyn newydd?

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth, Alun Ffred Jones, oedd y cyntaf i siarad Cymraeg yng nghyfarfod Cyngor y Gweinidogion yr wythnos diwethaf, a byddaf innau'n siarad Cymraeg am y tro cyntaf ym Mhwyllgor Rhanbarthau Ewrop yfory. Felly, a allwch gyflwyno datganiad yn y Siambr am ymdrechion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Gymraeg gael ei siarad yn Senedd Ewrop?

Carwyn Jones: Ynghylch defnyddio'r Gymraeg yn Ewrop, 'cam ceiliog' yw'r dywediad a ddaw i'r cof. Yr ydym wedi gweld y Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio am y tro cyntaf yn y cyngor, gydag Alun Ffred Jones yn ei siarad, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Yn y dyfodol, pwy a ŵyr ynghylch y defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn y senedd ei hun.

O ran ymgyrch y rhuban gwyn, mae sawl Aelod yn ei chefnogi ar draws y pleidiau. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth i sicrhau bod yr ymgyrch yn cael ei chynrychioli, nid yn unig yn yr wythnos hon tra bod pobl yn gwisgo'r rhuban, ond yn y dyfodol hefyd.

Kirsty Williams: Will the Leader of the House consider bringing forward two statements to the Chamber? The first is on the future of the Brecon Jazz Festival. You will be aware of concerns about the sustainability of the jazz festival following a difficult summer.

Secondly, I asked you last week for a statement from the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing on the future of the planning function of the Brecon Beacons

Nerys Evans: I am sure that you are aware that today is the International Day for the Elimination of Violence against Women, with the white ribbon symbolising the fact that we will not tolerate violence against women or remain silent about it. I am pleased to see so many Assembly Members wearing white ribbons. The Communities and Culture Committee is launching a report on the Assembly Government's strategy on violence against women next week. Can you ensure that the Government will respond to the committee's report as soon as possible in the new year?

Last week, the Minister for Heritage, Alun Ffred Jones, became the first person to speak Welsh at a meeting of the Council of Ministers, and tomorrow I will be the first to speak Welsh at the European Union's Committee of the Regions. Will you, therefore, make a statement on the Assembly Government's attempts to have Welsh spoken at the European Parliament?

Carwyn Jones: Regarding the use of Welsh in Europe, 'baby steps' is the saying that comes to mind. We have seen Welsh being used for the first time in the council, when Alun Ffred Jones addressed it, and that is to be welcomed. In future, who knows about the use of Welsh in the parliament itself.

Many Members from all parties support the white ribbon campaign. The Assembly Government will do everything possible to ensure that the campaign itself is represented, not only this week while people are wearing their ribbons, but in future as well.

Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff Arweinydd y Tŷ ystyried dod â dau ddatganiad gerbron y Siambr? Mae'r cyntaf ynglŷn â dyfodol Gŵyl Jazz Aberhonddu. Byddwch yn ymwybodol o bryderon ynghylch cynaliadwyedd yr ŵyl jazz yn sgil haf anodd.

Yn ail, fe'ch holais yr wythnos diwethaf am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai ar ddyfodol swyddogaeth gynllunio Awdurdod

National Park Authority. Yet again, I spent most of this Monday dealing with constituents who are extremely concerned about the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority's ability to carry out its development control functions and the impact that the national park authority's current leadership is having with regard to listening to communities and what they want. Will you ask the Minister to give the Chamber an update on her scrutiny of the work of the Brecon Beacons National Park Authority?

Carwyn Jones: I cannot go beyond the answer that I gave last week about how the national park authority is being monitored. The Minister remains available for meetings with you. I understand that you last met on 14 May, and I am sure that there will be a further opportunity to meet the Minister should fresh concerns arise.

With regard to the Brecon Jazz Festival, if there are concerns about its financial future, then the matter needs to be brought to the attention of the Minister for Heritage to see whether there is a difficulty and, if so, whether help can be provided.

2.20 p.m.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

David Melding: I raise a point of order relating to Standing Order No. 19, on the Committee for Scrutiny of the First Minister. I start by commending you, Presiding Officer, and your staff—indeed, all of the staff of the Assembly Parliamentary Service, who do so much magnificent work to support us. I realise that the demands involved in forming scrutiny committees, legislative committees and the various standing committees in an Assembly of 60 Members, of whom just 45 can, in practicality, sit on those committees, have been formidable. However, are we now in a position to receive some indication from you about when the requirements of Standing Order No. 19 might be met?

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, David, not only for giving me notice of your

Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog. Eto fyth, treuliais y rhan fwyaf o'r dydd Llun yma'n delio ag etholwyr sydd yn bryderus eithriadol ynghylch gallu Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog i gyflawni ei swyddogaethau rheoli datblygu a'r effaith y mae arweinyddiaeth gyfredol awdurdod y parc cenedlaethol yn ei chael o ran gwranddo ar gymunedau a'u deisyfiadau. A wnewch chi ofyn i'r Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Siambr am ei gwaith yn craffu ar waith Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog?

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf fynd ymhellach na'r ateb a roddais yr wythnos diwethaf am y modd y caiff awdurdod y parc cenedlaethol ei fonitro. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dal ar gael i gyfarfod â chi. Deallaf ichi gwrdd ddiwethaf ar 14 Mai, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd cyfle eto i gyfarfod â'r Gweinidog os cyfyd pryderon o'r newydd.

Ynglŷn â Gŵyl Jazz Aberhonddu, os oes pryderon am ei dyfodol ariannol, yna mae angen dwyn y mater i sylw'r Gweinidog Treftadaeth i weld a oes anhawster ac, os oes, a ellir darparu cymorth.

David Melding: Codaf bwynt o drefn ynglŷn â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19, sy'n sôn am y Pwyllgor Craffu ar Waith y Prif Weinidog. Dechreuaf drwy eich canmol chi, Lywydd, a'ch staff—yn wir, holl staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, sy'n gwneud cymaint o waith gwych i'n cefnogi ni. Sylweddolaf fod y gofynion sydd ynghlwm wrth ffurfio pwyllgorau craffu, pwyllgorau deddfu a'r amryfal bwyllgorau sefydlog mewn Cynulliad o 60 o Aelodau, a dim ond 45 o'r rheiny, yn ymarferol, yn gallu eistedd ar y pwyllgorau hynny, wedi bod yn aruthrol. Fodd bynnag, a ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa i gael rhyw arwydd gennych ynghylch pa bryd y gellid ateb gofynion Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19?

Y Llywydd: Diolch, David, nid yn unig am roi rhybudd imi am eich bwriad i godi'r

intention to raise this matter, but for the generous comments that you have just made. I get unswerving support from the chief executive and her intelligent and effective staff, particularly in this area of organising committee work. It has been a learning curve for us all, but now that we have firmly established the scrutiny committees and the legislative committees we are in a position to move forward. I give you that assurance.

I share your desire for us to be able to hold the First Minister to account at all times and, indeed, I am the first to declare my concern and my slight feeling of unease, if not guilt, that we have not yet complied with the Standing Order in this case. However, with the willing support of the First Minister, I have allowed questions to the First Minister to extend beyond the 45 minutes that are required by Standing Orders. That is no substitute for the scrutiny committee, of course. The debates and discussions of our Business Committee are a well-kept secret, but if you were to have a word with your party's business manager, I am sure that he could confirm what I am about to say. He has raised this matter in the Business Committee, and we will consider, at its next meeting, how we can move forward to establish a committee for the scrutiny of the First Minister. The issue is whether it should be a large or small committee; it may well be that making use of the skills of our current scrutiny Chairs, along with those of the Chair of the Audit Committee, might be a useful way forward. Indeed, that would follow the precedent of Janet Davies, the former Chair of the Audit Committee, chairing the first of the committees scrutinising the First Minister.

Datganiad am Archwiliad Iechyd y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin Statement on the Common Agricultural Policy Health Check

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Ar 20 Tachwedd, daeth y Gweinidogion yng Nghyngor Amaethyddiaeth a Physgodfeydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i gytundeb gwleidyddol i ddod â'r broses o archwilio iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin i ben. Yr oeddwn yn bresennol fel aelod o dîm negodi Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig. Fy

mater hwn, ond am y sylwadau caredig yr ydych newydd eu gwneud. Caf gefnogaeth ddi-sigl gan y prif weithredwr a'i staff deallus ac effeithiol, yn enwedig yn y maes hwn o drefnu gwaith pwyllgorau. Bu'n gromlin ddysgu inni i gyd, ond, a ninnau bellach wedi sefydlu'r pwyllgorau craffu a'r pwyllgorau deddfu'n gadarn, yr ydym mewn sefyllfa i symud ymlaen. Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw i chi.

Rhannaf eich awydd inni allu dal y Prif Weinidog i gyfrif bob amser ac, yn wir, myfi yw'r cyntaf i ddatgan fy mhryder a'm teimlad bach o anesmwythder, os nad euogrwydd, nad ydym eto wedi cydymffurfio â'r Rheol Sefydlog yn yr achos hwn. Fodd bynnag, gyda chefnogaeth barod y Prif Weinidog, yr wyf wedi caniatáu i gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ymestyn y tu hwnt i'r 45 munud sydd yn ofynnol dan y Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni all hynny gymryd lle'r pwyllgor craffu, wrth gwrs. Mae dadleuon a thrafodaethau ein Pwyllgor Busnes yn gyfrinach ddiogel, ond pe caech air â rheolwr busnes eich plaid, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai ef gadarnhau'r hyn yr wyf ar fin ei ddweud. Mae wedi codi'r mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, a byddwn yn ystyried, yn ei gyfarfod nesaf, sut y gallwn symud ymlaen i sefydlu pwyllgor i graffu ar y Prif Weinidog. Y cwestiwn yw ai pwyllgor mawr ynteu fach y dylai fod; efallai y byddai defnyddio sgiliau ein Cadeiryddion craffu cyfredol, ynghyd â sgiliau Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, yn ffordd fuddiol i fynd ati. Yn wir, byddai hynny'n dilyn cysail Janet Davies, cyn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, yn cadeirio'r cyntaf o'r pwyllgorau i graffu ar y Prif Weinidog.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): On 20 November, Ministers of the Agriculture and Fisheries Council of the European Union came to a political agreement to bring the common agricultural policy audit health check process to an end. I was present as a member of the negotiating team of Ministers from the United Kingdom. My purpose this afternoon is to outline the

mhwyrpas y prynhawn yma yw amlinellu'r prif agweddau ar y cytundeb fydd yn cael eu defnyddio i weithredu a gweinyddu'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin hyd at 2013.

O'r dechrau'n deg, mae angen i mi egluro nad bwriad yr archwiliad iechyd oedd diwygio'r polisi yn sylweddol. Yn hytrach, gorchwyl y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, yn dilyn adolygiad o'r pecynnau diwygio'r PAC o 2003 ymlaen, oedd cyflwyno adroddiad yn 2008 ar gynigion i symleiddio'r PAC.

Dechreuodd y broses archwilio ryw 12 mis yn ôl. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, yr wyf i, ar y cyd â fy swyddogion, wedi bod yn cymryd rhan lawn yn y broses o ddatblygu safbwyntiau negodi'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ogystal â mynychu cyfarfodydd y cyngor. Yr ydym wedi cymryd rhan ym mhrosesau craffu mewnol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd fu'n ystyried y cynigion ar gyfer yr archwiliad iechyd.

Yr wyf i wedi ymgynghori â'r rhanddeiliaid allweddol yng Nghymru er mwyn helpu i lywio ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad tuag at yr archwiliad iechyd. Yr wyf hefyd wedi trafod rhai o'r prif faterion yn uniongyrchol â Mariann Fischer Boel, Comisiynydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd dros Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig.

Yr wyf hefyd angen dweud wrth yr Aelodau—er bod cytundeb gwleidyddol ar archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, nid yw hyn eto wedi'i gyflwyno ar ffurf testun deddfwriaethol, ffurfiol a therfynol. Bydd y cytundeb ffurfiol ar y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf.

Yr wyf yn awr am amlinellu rhai o'r prif benderfyniadau a wnaed.

Yn gyntaf, gall Cymru barhau i ddefnyddio'r sail hanesyddol ar gyfer cynllun y taliad sengl hyd at 2013 o leiaf. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng 2014 a 2020, mae'n amlwg na fydd modd parhau i wneud taliad o dan y polisi sy'n seiliedig ar gynhyrchiant yn 2000 to 2002. Felly, yr wyf wedi dweud wrth fy swyddogion am gysylltu â'r rheiny sy'n gweithio yn y diwydiant ffermio a chefn gwlad i edrych ar yr opsiynau sydd ar gael

main approach of the agreement that will apply to the operation and administration of the common agricultural policy until 2013.

At the outset, I need to make it clear that the health check was never intended to deliver significant reform. Rather, the European Commission, following a review of the CAP reform packages for 2003, was asked to report in 2008 on proposals to simplify the operation of the CAP.

The health check started some 12 months ago. In that time, my officials and I have been fully engaged in developing the UK negotiation positions as well as attending meetings of the council. We have been taking part in the EU internal scrutiny processes that examined the health check proposals.

I have consulted stakeholders in Wales to help inform the Assembly Government's overall approach to the health check. I have also discussed certain key issues with Mariann Fischer Boel, the EU Commissioner for Agriculture and Rural Development.

I also need to let Members know that, although there is political agreement on the CAP health check, it has not yet a formal and final legislative text. This legislation will be formally agreed within the next few weeks.

I now want to outline some of the key decisions taken.

First, Wales can retain the historic basis for the single payment scheme until 2013 at least. However, for the period between 2014 and 2020, it is apparent that payments will not be made under the system based on production that was used between 2000 and 2002. Therefore, I have instructed my officials to engage with farming and countryside interests to examine the options available in moving towards an area-based

wrth symud tuag at gynllun taliad sengl ar sail arwynebedd. Pan wnes i gyfarfod â'r comisiynydd ym mis Ebrill eleni, cadarnhaodd y byddai angen rhoi trefniadau yn eu lle i bontio'r cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddem yn disgwyl i hynny fod yn fwy na dwy neu dair blynedd.

O ran modiweiddio, bydd trefn orfodol bresennol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o 5 y cant yn codi i 10 y cant erbyn 2012 drwy gynydd fesul cam o 2 y cant yn 2009 ac 1 y cant ar gyfer pob blwyddyn ar ôl hynny. Mae'r arian sy'n deillio o'r cynnydd yn y modiweiddio gorfodol yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'w ddefnyddio o dan gynlluniau datblygu gwledig i ariannu gweithgareddau sy'n mynd i'r afael â materion yn ymwneud â newid yn yr hinsawdd, rheoli dŵr, bioamrywiaeth, ynni adnewyddadwy, arloesi a'r diwydiant llaeth.

Cafodd cynigion y comisiwn ar gyfer cyfraddau gorfodol uwch ar daliadau o €100,000 neu fwy eu gwrthod, a'r cynnig bellach yw codi modiweiddio gorfodol 4 y cant ar daliadau sengl sy'n fwy na €300,000. Bydd y gyfradd uwch hon yn effeithio ar chwe ffermwr yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Yng Nghymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Gyfunol, bydd y cynnydd yn y gyfradd orfodol yn golygu y bydd gostyngiad tebyg yn y gyfradd modiweiddio gwirfoddol. Yn ymarferol, mae hyn yn golygu na fydd y gymuned ffermio yng Nghymru yn gweld unrhyw gynydd yng nghyfradd gyffredinol modiweiddio o ran eu taliad sengl, heblaw am y rhai sydd uwchlaw'r trothwy o €300,000.

Mae'r ffrydiau ariannu modiweiddio presennol a chymorth ariannol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig yn cael eu diogelu. Mae'r comisiwn wedi cadarnhau y gallwn barhau i ddefnyddio'r system fodiweiddio orfodol 'newydd' i ariannu gweithgareddau sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd, yn benodol y cynlluniau rheoli o dan echel 2 y cynllun datblygu gwledig.

Cytunodd y cyngor hefyd ar amserlen glir ar gyfer taliadau datgysylltu. Erbyn 2013, yr unig sectorau fydd yn cael taliadau sy'n cadw'r cysylltiad â chynhyrchiant fydd buchod sugno, defaid a geifr. Bydd cynllun

payment single payment scheme. When I met the commissioner in April this year, she confirmed that there would need to be transitional arrangements but we should not expect that period to be longer than two or three years.

On modulation, the current EU compulsory regime at 5 per cent will increase to 10 per cent by 2012 through stepped increases at 2 per cent in 2009 and 1 per cent for each of the years 2010, 2011 and 2012. The receipts from the increase in compulsory modulation transfer for use under rural development plans to support activities that address issues relating to climate change, water management, biodiversity and renewable energy, innovation and the dairy industry.

The commission's proposals for higher compulsory rates where the single payment receipt was at €100,000 or more were rejected, and the proposal now is for an additional 4 per cent rate will apply to payments above €300,000. Some six farmers in Wales will be affected by this higher rate. For Wales, and the rest of the UK, the increase in the compulsory rate will require a comparable reduction in the rate of voluntary modulation. What this means in practice is that the Welsh farming community will see no increase in the overall rate of modulation applied to their single payment, except for those above the €300,000 threshold.

The existing modulation funding streams and EU support for the rural development plan are safeguarded. The commission has confirmed that we can continue to use the 'new' compulsory modulation to support existing activities, particularly the land management schemes under axis 2 of the rural development plan.

The council also agreed a clear timetable on decoupling payments. By 2013, the only sectors where coupled aid will remain payable are suckler cows and for sheep and goats. The EU energy crop scheme will be

cnydau ynni yr UE yn cael ei ddiddymu yn 2010. abolished in 2010.

O ran y diwydiant godro, mae'r cytundeb yn arwain y ffordd at ddiddymu'r drefn gwotâu yn 2015. Cafwyd cytundeb ar gynigion y comisiwn ar gyfer cynnydd blynyddol o 1 y cant yn lefelau'r cwotâu dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd o 2009 ymlaen. On the dairy sector, the agreement paves the way for the quota regime to be abolished in 2015. The commission's proposals for a 1 per cent annual increase in quota levels from 2009 over five years has been agreed.

Mae un o elfennau mwy dadleuol y cytundeb yn ymwneud ag ehangu darpariaethau yr amlen genedlaethol, a gafodd eu cyflwyno o dan becyn diwygio 2003. O fewn y Deyrnas Gyfunol, dim ond yr Alban sydd wedi defnyddio'r amlen i ddarparu cynllun ariannu lloi eidion. A more contentious element of the agreement relates to the expansion of the national envelope provisions, introduced under the 2003 reform package. Within the UK, only Scotland has used the envelope to deliver a beef calf support scheme.

O dan ddarpariaeth fwy hyblyg yr amlen genedlaethol, bydd gostyngiad o hyd at 10 y cant yn yr uchafswm ariannol cenedlaethol, neu yn achos Cymru, yn yr uchafswm rhanbarthol. Byddai hynny ar gyfer ariannu gweithgareddau i fynd i'r afael ag anfanteision amgylcheddol neu yn y sector da byw, yn ogystal ag ar gyfer sefydlu cynlluniau yswirio cnydau a chronfeydd cydfuddiannol i fynd i'r afael â chlefydau anifeiliaid a phlanhigion. Cytunwyd ar derfyn o 3.5 y cant pan fo defnyddio'r amlen yn golygu taliad sy'n gysylltiedig â chynhyrchiad. Yn ogystal, ac o fewn terfynau penodedig, mae modd ailgyfeirio arian sydd heb ei ddefnyddio o fewn yr uchafswm cenedlaethol y taliad sengl, i'w ddefnyddio o dan yr amlen genedlaethol neu ar gyfer y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Ar gyfer cynllun y taliad sengl, cytunwyd ar drothwy newydd o €100 neu 1 hectar. Ar hyn o bryd, 0.3 hectar yw'r trothwy yng Nghymru. The more flexible national envelope provisions allow for a deduction of up to 10 per cent in the national financial ceiling or, in the case of Wales, the regional financial ceiling. This would be to fund actions addressing environmental disadvantage or in the livestock sector, as well as for setting up crop insurance schemes and mutual funds to address animal and plant disease. A limit of 3.5 per cent has been agreed where use of the envelope involves payment related to production. In addition, and within specified limits, unused funds within the single payment national ceiling can be redirected for use under the national envelope or directed to the rural development plan, and, for the single payment scheme, a new minimum threshold of €100 or 1 ha has been agreed. At the current time, 0.3 ha is the level that applies in Wales.

Mae llawer o fanylion i'w hystyried ar archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaeth cyffredin y byddaf am eu rhannu gydag Aelodau a'r gymuned ffermio. Er hynny, yr wyf o'r farn fod modd i ganlyniad y cytundeb gwleidyddol gael ei lywio'n bositif er budd a sefydlogrwydd y diwydiant ffermio yng Nghymru. There is much detail to be digested on the common agricultural policy health check that I will want to share with Members and the farming community. I believe, however, that the outcome within the political agreement can be shaped positively to the benefit of Wales and Welsh farming.

Brynle Williams: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog.

Brynle Williams: Thank you for your statement, Minister.

I am sure that the Minister will be aware of the mixed response from the industry on the Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r ymateb cymysg gan y

outcome of the CAP health check. The retention of payments made on a historic basis until 2013 is most welcome. However, given the adverse effect on the social structure of rural Wales, a future move to a simple flat rate payment would push small family-run farms out of business and lead to larger ranched farms, and will not deliver the Government's habitat improvement environmental benefits. Will the Minister provide details on how she and her officials are planning to make payments after 2013 and during the transition period?

2.30 p.m.

On the issue of milk quotas, Welsh producers have been put at a significant disadvantage compared with producers in Italy, who are being given a full increase of 5 per cent, compared with Wales's 1 per cent, until 2015. It is all very well to threaten the super levy if they overproduce, but given the historic situation with Italy over the super levy and late payment for many years, Welsh producers will be rightly suspicious of whether there will be any enforcement of this. Do you share that view, Minister?

Finally, can the Minister explain why buffer strips are to be included in cross-compliance? They are totally unsuited to Wales's topography, given our high rainfall and large number of small streams. Given Wales's typically small fields, introducing buffer strips will take vast areas out of production. We will not be able to spread fertiliser there, or spray or crop to the edge of streams and so on. This is yet another example of EC regulations trying to fix a problem that does not exist in Wales. What steps is the Minister taking to protect Welsh farming from these regulations and to stop them from, once again, being gold-plated by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs?

Elin Jones: Diolch am eich sylwadau, Brynle. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'n bosibl, ar hyn o bryd, inni roi manylion am gynllun y taliad sengl ar sail arwynebedd yn dilyn 2013. Ni fydd hynny yn ein hwynebu tan 2013, oherwydd y penderfyniad yr wythnos

diwydiant i archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Mae croeso mawr i'r bwriad i gadw taliadau ar sail hanesyddol tan 2013. Fodd bynnag, yn wyneb yr effaith andwyol ar adeiledd cymdeithasol y Gymru wledig, byddai symudiad yn y dyfodol at daliad safonol syml yn gwthio ffermydd teulu bach allan o fusnes ac yn arwain at ffermydd ransh mwy, ac ni chyflawnir buddion amgylcheddol y Llywodraeth i wella cynefinoedd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion ynghylch sut y mae hi a'i swyddogion yn bwriadu gwneud taliadau ar ôl 2013 ac yn ystod y cyfnod pontio?

Ar fater cwtâu llaeth, mae cynhyrchwyr Cymru wedi'u rhoi dan gryn anfantais o'u cymharu â chynhyrchwyr yn yr Eidal, y rhoddir cynnydd llawn o 5 y cant iddynt, o'i gymharu ag 1 y cant Cymru, hyd at 2015. Hawdd bygwth yr ardoll uwch os ydynt yn gorgynhyrchu, ond yn wyneb y sefyllfa hanesyddol gyda'r Eidal dros yr ardoll uwch a thaliadau hwyr ers llawer blwyddyn bellach, bydd gan gynhyrchwyr Cymru bob hawl i amau a orfodir hyn mewn unrhyw ffordd. A rannwch y farn honno, Weinidog?

Yn olaf, a all y Gweinidog esbonio pam mae lleiniau clustogi i'w cynnwys mewn trawsgydymffurfio? Maent yn gwbl anghydnaws â thopograffeg Cymru, yn wyneb ein glawiad trwm a'n nentydd bychain niferus. Gyda chaeau nodweddiadol fach Cymru, bydd cyflwyno lleiniau clustogi'n golygu na cheir cynhyrchu mewn ardaloedd helaeth. Ni allwn daenu gwrtait hyn, na sgeintio na thocio at lannau nentydd ac yn y blaen. Dyma enghraifft arall fyth o reoliadau'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn ceisio datrys problem nad yw'n bodoli yng Nghymru. Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i amddiffyn ffermio Cymru rhag y rheoliadau hyn a'u rhwystro, unwaith yn rhagor rhag cael eu heuro gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig?

Elin Jones: Thank you for your comments, Brynle. First of all it is not possible, at present, to give details of the single payment scheme on the basis of area following 2013. That will not face us until 2013, because of the decision made last weekend. Therefore,

diwethaf. Felly, dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, byddwn yn datblygu cynllun a fydd yn golygu bod trosglwyddo i'r cynllun ariannu newydd yng Nghymru mor sefydlog â phosibl i'r diwydiant, ac a fydd yn gweithio yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion gychwyn gweithio ar fodelau posibl o'r mathau o gynlluniau a thaliadau y gallem ymgymryd â hwy yng Nghymru. Gwyddom, erbyn hyn, y bydd yn rhaid inni newid o 2013, felly mae gennym gyfnod o amser i baratoi a gweithio gyda'r diwydiant i sicrhau bod y newidiadau hynny mor effeithiol â phosibl, gan osgoi rhai o'r newidiadau sylweddol y bu i chi gyfeirio atynt.

O ran y gallu i gynyddu'r cwota o 5 y cant a roddwyd i'r Eidal yn unig yn y cytundeb yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'r Eidal, ar hyn o bryd, yn gorgynhyrchu llaeth yn sylweddol uwchben y cwota cenedlaethol. Yr oedd gan yr Eidal gytundeb penodol i ganiatáu cynnydd yn y cwota. Ar hyn o bryd, nid ydym yn gorgynhyrchu yng Nghymru nac yng ngwledydd Prydain, felly mae gennym rywffaint o le i gynyddu cynhyrchiant heb orgynhyrchu ac wedyn wynebu ardoll. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf gyda'ch safbwynt; os yw'r Eidal yn torri'r cwota cenedlaethol hwnnw, dylai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd fod yn llawdrwm arni a'i chosbi gyda'r ardoll uwch.

Y rheswm y ceir cyfeiriad at ardaloedd gwag o gwmpas rhediadau dŵr ac afonydd—*buffer strips*; yr wyf yn ymdrechu i gyfieithu'r enw—yn y trawsgydymffurfio yw bod neilltuo tir wedi dod i ben. Felly, yr oedd rhai aelod-wladwriaethau eisiau diogelu rhywfaint o'r budd amgylcheddol o neilltuo tir drwy gyflwyno *buffer strips*. Yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud, a daw hyn yn amlycach pan welwn fanylion y ddeddfwriaeth sy'n deillio o'r cytundeb hwn, yw ein bod am i'r penderfyniad, ynghyd â chyflwyniad y trawsgydymffurfio, fod yn eiddo'r rhanbarthau o fewn yr aelod-wladwriaethau, ac felly'n benderfyniad i ni yng Nghymru.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for your statement, Minister. While the health check is something of an interim report on the CAP, as opposed to a large-scale reform, it should be welcomed as another positive shift in the CAP that serves the Welsh industry well. The

over the ensuing years, we will develop a scheme that will mean that transferring to the new funding scheme in Wales will be as stable as possible for the industry, and will work in the most effective manner. That is why I have asked officials to start working on possible modelling of the kinds of schemes and payments that we could undertake in Wales. We know, by now, that we have to change from 2013 onwards, and now we have a period in order to prepare for that and to work with the industry to ensure that those changes are most effective, in order to avoid some of the substantial changes that you alluded to.

As regards the quota and the 5 per cent increase given to only to Italy in the agreement last week, Italy, at the moment, is producing substantially above the national quota. Italy had a specific agreement to allow an increase in the quota. At present, we are not overproducing in Wales or in the UK, therefore we do have some leeway in order to increase production without going into overproduction and then having to face a levy. However, I do agree with your viewpoint; if Italy is breaking that national quota, the European Union should come down heavily on it and penalise it with a super levy.

The reason that there is a reference to empty areas around running water and rivers—*buffer strips*; I am struggling to translate the name into Welsh—in the cross compliance is that setting land aside has ended. Therefore, some member states wanted to safeguard some of the environmental benefit of set-aside by introducing *buffer strips*. What I have said, and this will become clearer when we see the details of the legislation arising from this agreement, is that we will want the decision, as well as the presentation of the cross compliance, to be owned by the regions within the member states, and therefore a decision for us in Wales.

Joyce Watson: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Er mai rhyw fath o adroddiad interim ar y PAC yn hytrach na diwygiad ar raddfa fawr yw'r archwiliad iechyd, dylid ei groesawu fel datblygiad cadarnhaol arall yn y PAC sy'n was mor

main decision to match the increase in the higher rates of compulsory modulation with an equivalent reduction in voluntary modulation will offer the sector stability. The increased compulsory regime will mean greater parity between the overall rates applying in Wales and the UK to those in the rest of Europe. It is always going to be difficult in an industry that supports so many different interests to balance those interests and short-term needs with long-term concerns. However, the health check feeds into the wider 2020 vision for the Welsh agricultural industry.

ffyddlon i'r diwydiant Cymreig. Bydd y prif benderfyniad i gyfatebu'r cynnydd yn y cyfraddau uwch o fodiwleiddio gorfodol gyda gostyngiad cyfatebol mewn modiwleiddio gwirfoddol yn rhoi sefydlogrwydd i'r sector. Bydd cynnydd yn y drefn orfodol yn golygu gwell cyfatebiaeth rhwng y cyfraddau cyffredinol sy'n berthnasol i Gymru a'r DU a'r rheiny yng ngweddill Ewrop. Mewn diwydiant sy'n cefnogi cynifer o wahanol ddi-ddordebau, bydd hi bob amser yn anodd cydbwysu'r di-ddordebau hynny ac anghenion tymor byr gyda phryderon tymor hir. Fodd bynnag, mae'r archwiliad iechyd yn bwydo i mewn i weledigaeth helaethach 2020 ar gyfer diwydiant amaethyddol Cymru.

I have a few questions, Minister. Concern has been expressed by the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds and other organisations about the environmental measures. While the old set-aside model obviously had to go, it was successful in addressing some of the decline in biodiversity, which is very concerning as we approach the 2010 target. In light of the axis 2 review, which will be delivered soon, how well do the different proposals for Wales's agri-environment schemes prepare Wales for future CAP reforms?

Mae gennyf gwestiwn neu ddau, Weinidog. Mynegwyd pryder gan y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar a chyrrff eraill ynghylch y mesurau amgylcheddol. Er ei bod hi'n amlwg ei bod yn rhaid cael gwared â'r hen fodel neilltir, yr oedd yn llwyddiannus o ran mynd i'r afael â rhywfaint o'r dirywiad mewn bioamrywiaeth, sy'n destun pryder mawr wrth inni ddynesu at darged 2010. Yn wyneb adolygiad echel 2, a gyflenwir yn fuan, pa mor dda mae'r amrywiol gynigion ar gyfer cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd Cymru yn paratoi Cymru ar gyfer diwygio PAC i'r dyfodol?

On the same topic, Minister, I take this opportunity to ask for a quick update on the situation with farmers awaiting Tir Gofal payments. The success of Tir Gofal has, thankfully, increased the demand for the scheme in Wales, but the downside has been long waiting lists for farmers wanting to join the scheme. Many farmers have expressed their frustration at having to wait for payments. What can you do, if anything, to speed up the validation forms and reduce waiting lists for Tir Gofal?

Ar yr un pwnc, Weinidog, manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i ofyn am ddiweddariad sydyn ynghylch sefyllfa ffermwyr sy'n disgwyl am daliadau Tir Gofal. Mae lle i ddiolch bod llwyddiant Tir Gofal wedi cynyddu'r galw am y cynllun yng Nghymru, ond ochr arall y geiniog yw'r rhestri aros hir sy'n wynebu ffermwyr sydd am ymuno â'r cynllun. Mynegodd nifer o ffermwr eu rhwystredigaeth ynghylch gorfod disgwyl am daliadau. Beth, os unrhyw beth, y gallwch ei wneud i brysu'r ffurflenni dilysu a chwto'i'r rhestri aros am Dir Gofal?

Finally, with regard to your statement on unused funds within the single payment, I hope—especially in the current economic climate—that you will work with the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport to develop the economic strategies under the rural development plan that will bring the most benefit to rural

Yn olaf, yng nghyswllt eich datganiad ynghylch cronfeydd heb eu defnyddio o fewn y taliad sengl, gobeithiaf—yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd economaidd sydd ohoni—y gweithiwch gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth i ddatblygu'r strategaethau economaidd dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig

communities.

Elin Jones: Thank you, Joyce. You have outlined in your description the way in which the proposed changes in modulation will ensure that there is more of a level playing field across Europe in terms of modulation and top-slicing, if we put it that way, that is expected of Welsh farmers compared with other European farmers. We will now have almost a level playing field between Welsh farmers and those in other member states. It also means that there is no major change for Welsh farmers under the proposed switch from voluntary to compulsory modulation.

The abolition of set aside raises some challenges in meeting the environmental benefits through various other opportunities. I mentioned earlier that the proposal to look at the introduction of buffer zones along watercourses was included in the decision that was agreed last week. In addition, my current consultation on the axis 2 schemes will allow that to be looked at. I expect that to be raised with me by various organisations in response to that consultation.

On Tir Gofal payments—I should have expected this as part of the questions on the CAP—there were changes last year with new European regulations for the common agricultural policy and rural development plan, which meant that we have to cross reference and cross check all single farm payments with axis 2 schemes, such as Tir Gofal. The exact mapping process that is required in that has meant that the validation process has taken longer in some cases. However, on the whole, the process is working well and the validation is progressing. The regulation change last year provided an additional expectation on Tir Gofal payments that my officials have to adhere to. I have not formed a fixed view on the use of those unused funds, but I am sure that there will be plenty of people who will want to point out to me where they would be best used.

2.40 p.m.

a ddaw â'r budd mwyaf i gymunedau gwledig.

Elin Jones: Diolch, Joyce. Yr ydych wedi amlinellu yn eich disgrifiad y modd y bydd y newidiadau arfaethedig mewn modiwlleiddio yn sicrhau y ceir maes chwarae mwy gwastad ar draws Ewrop yn nhermau modiwlleiddio a brigdorri, o'u rhoi felly, a ddisgwylir gan ffermwyr Cymru o'i gymharu â ffermwyr eraill yn Ewrop. Yn awr bydd gennym faes chwarae sydd bron yn wastad rhwng ffermwyr Cymru a rhai mewn aelod-wladwriaethau eraill. Mae'n golygu hefyd nad oes dim newid mawr i ffermwyr Cymru dan y newid arfaethedig o fodiwlleiddio gwirfoddol i orfodol.

Mae diddymu neilltir yn codi ambell i her o ran sicrhau'r buddiannau amgylcheddol drwy amryfal gyfleon eraill. Soniais yn gynharach fod y cynnig i ystyried cyflwyno parthau clustogi ar hyd cyrsiau dŵr wedi'i gynnwys yn y penderfyniad y cytunwyd yn ei gylich yr wythnos ddiwethaf. Yn ogystal, bydd fy ymgynghoriad cyfredol ynghylch y cynlluniau echel 2 yn caniatáu ystyried hynny. Disgwyliaf i amrywiol fudiadau godi hynny â mi wrth ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw.

O ran taliadau Tir Gofal—dylwn fod wedi disgwyl hyn fel rhan o'r cwestiynau ynghylch y PAC—gwelwyd newidiadau y llynedd gyda rheoliadau Ewropeaidd newydd ar gyfer y polisi amaeth cyffredin a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig a olygodd ei bod yn rhaid inni groesgyfeirio a chroesarchwilio pob taliad fferm sengl gyda chynlluniau echel 2, megis Tir Gofal. Mae'r union broses fapio sy'n ofynnol i gyflawni hynny wedi golygu bod y broses ddilysu wedi cymryd mwy o amser mewn rhai achosion. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan, mae'r broses yn gweithio'n dda, ac mae'r dilysu'n dod yn ei flaen. Wrth newid rheolau'r llynedd, gosodwyd disgwyliad ychwanegol ar daliadau Tir Gofal ac mae'n rhaid i'm swyddogion lynu wrth hynny. Nid wyf wedi dod i benderfyniad terfynol ynghylch defnyddio'r cronfeydd hynny nas defnyddiwyd, ond gwn yn ddi-os na fydd prinder o bobl i ddweud wrthyf y ffordd orau o'u defnyddio.

Mick Bates: Thank you for your update on the CAP health check, Minister. Do you agree that all of this work on the health check must be underlined by a principle of stability, and that the best outcome would be for us to maintain stability in the industry and make sure that payments are made on time? I am sure that you would further agree that such stability is even more important given the current economic climate. That is why I will ask you a straightforward question about the future of the single farm payment scheme in 2013, when you seem to accept that it will change. What benefit will this flatter rate, post-2013, bring to Welsh agriculture? Hitherto, the historic scheme that has been acceptable has brought great benefits. I am not clear on what benefits you, as Minister, see in accepting any future flatter rate scheme.

On modulation, you accept an increase in compulsory modulation, so would there be an equivalent reduction in the voluntary modulation rates that we have at present? When we look at the reasons for undertaking this health check, it says that we want to make the whole system more effective and efficient. I heard your answer to Joyce Watson about validation of payments, but that is not satisfactory to those people who enter into schemes such as the organic scheme, Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal in good faith, and now find that their payments are delayed. What plans do you have to meet the requirements of this health check, making it a more effective and efficient scheme, therefore ensuring that payments are made on time?

In view of your statement on 22 October, what are your views on the fact that some categories of entrants to Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal were frozen? How will you now meet this health check? Where we talk about effective and efficient schemes, how does that fit in with those terms?

I also note your enthusiasm for energy crop schemes under the rural development plan. What will you do to introduce such a scheme, given that the energy crop scheme will be

Mick Bates: Diolch ichi am eich diweddariad ynghylch archwiliad iechyd PAC, Weinidog. A gytunwch ei bod yn rhaid i'r holl waith hwn ar yr archwiliad iechyd fod wedi'i seilio ar egwyddor o sefydlogrwydd, ac mai'r canlyniad gorau fyddai inni gynnal sefydlogrwydd yn y diwydiant a sicrhau bod y taliadau'n cael eu gwneud yn brydlon? Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunech ymhellach fod sefydlogrwydd o'r fath yn bwysicach fyth yn wyneb yr hinsawdd economaidd cyfredol. Dyna pam y gofynnaf gwestiwn syml ichi ynghylch dyfodol y cynllun taliad sengl yn 2013, pan ymddengys eich bod yn derbyn y bydd yn newid. Pa fudd fydd y taliad mwy safonol hwn yn ei ddwyn i amaethyddiaeth Cymru ar ôl 2013? Hyd yn hyn, mae'r cynllun hanesyddol a fu'n dderbiniol wedi dwyn budd sylweddol. Ni welaf pa fanteision a welwch chi, fel Gweinidog, wrth dderbyn unrhyw gynllun taliad mwy safonol i'r dyfodol.

O ran modiwlleiddio, yr ydych yn derbyn cynnydd mewn modiwlleiddio gorfodol, felly a geid gostyngiad cyfatebol yn y cyfraddau modiwlleiddio gwirfoddol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd? Wrth edrych ar y rhesymau dros gynnal yr archwiliad iechyd hwn, dywedir ein bod am wneud y system gyfan yn fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon. Clywais eich ateb i Joyce ynghylch dilysu taliadau, ond nid yw hynny'n dderbiniol i'r bobl hynny sy'n ymuno â chynlluniau megis y cynllun organig, Tir Gofal a Thir Cynnal yn llawn ffydd, a chanfod yn awr bod eu taliadau wedi'u dal yn ôl. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i fodloni gofynion yr archwiliad iechyd hwn, gan ei wneud yn gynllun mwy effeithiol ac effeithlon, a sicrhau, drwy hynny, bod taliadau'n cael eu gwneud yn brydlon?

O gofio eich datganiad ar 22 Hydref, beth yw eich barn ynghylch y ffaith bod rhai categorïau o ymgeiswyr am Dir Gofal a Thir Cynnal wedi'u rhewi? Sut y bodlonwch yr archwiliad iechyd hwn yn awr? Pan soniwn am gynlluniau effeithiol ac effeithlon, sut mae hynny'n cydweddu â'r telerau hynny?

Sylwaf hefyd ar eich brwdfrydedd dros gynlluniau cnydau ynni dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Beth a wnewch i gyflwyno cynllun o'r fath, a chofio bod y cynllun

stopped in 2010?

Finally, will you give me some more clarity on your intentions with national envelopes? We know that Scotland uses a national envelope to deliver a beef calf support scheme. There has been much discussion about the possible reduction of the suckler herd on Welsh hill farms and the possibility of using a national envelope to retain what are very good environmental creatures. Have you had any discussions with your officials on introducing some further support in the hills for suckler cows under national envelope provisions?

Elin Jones: It looks likely that the change to single farm payment from historic reference to an area scheme will be mandatory as of 2013. I have always been of the view that a historic payment system based on a reference period of 2000-02 would have a shelf life, because, as time goes on, that reference period becomes less meaningful for the recipients of that funding. As I have said—I completely agree with you—stability has been an overriding objective of mine during this health check process, and that will remain as we look forward to the changes to the single farm payment post-2013. That is why I am keen to do early work on the modelling of potential schemes to see how redistributive or not they may be, and to work with the industry on ensuring that we have a transition period, which is as least disruptive as possible to the make-up of our farming sector.

There will be an equivalent reduction in voluntary modulation to meet increases in compulsory modulation. On your reference to my statement in October, Tir Cynnal is currently frozen as a result of my decision to increase the budget to meet the demand for organic conversion. It will remain frozen until we come to a decision on the axis 2 review and changes to all agri-environment schemes.

Energy crops also form part of the axis 2 review, and there is a 'One Wales' commitment to consider whether Wales should develop an energy crops scheme. The

cnydau ynni yn dod i ben yn 2010?

Yn olaf, a wnewch esbonio imi eich bwriadau ynghylch amlenni cenedlaethol? Gwyddom fod yr Alban yn defnyddio amlen genedlaethol i gyflenwi cynllun cefnogi lloeau eidion. Bu trafod helaeth ynghylch y posibilrwydd o leihau'r fuches sugno yn ffermydd mynydd Cymru a'r posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio amlen genedlaethol i gadw creaduriaid sy'n rhai amgylcheddol da iawn. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'ch swyddogion ynghylch cyflwyno rhywfaint o gefnogaeth bellach ar y mynyddoedd i wartheg sugno dan ddarpariaethau amlen genedlaethol?

Elin Jones: Ymddengys y bydd y newid i daliad sengl o gyfeirnod hanesyddol i gynllun ardal yn orfodol o 2013 ymlaen. Yr wyf bob amser wedi credu mai byrhoedlog fyddai system taliad hanesyddol a oedd wedi'i seilio ar gyfnod cyfeirio o 2000-02, oherwydd, dros amser, daw'r cyfnod cyfeirio hwnnw'n llai ystyrlon i'r rheiny sy'n derbyn y nawdd hwnnw. Fel y dywedais—cytunaf yn llwyr â chi—bu sefydlogrwydd yn un o'm hamcanion pennaf yn ystod y broses archwiliad iechyd hon, ac erys hynny wrth inni edrych ymlaen at y newidiadau i'r taliad sengl ar ôl 2013. Dyma pam yr wyf yn awyddus i wneud gwaith cynnar ynghylch modelu cynlluniau posibl i weld i ba raddau y byddent yn aildosbarthu neu beidio, a gweithio gyda'r diwydiant ynghylch sicrhau bod gennym gyfnod trosiannol, sy'n tarfu cyn lleied â phosibl ar gyfansoddiad ein sector ffermio.

Ceir gostyngiad cyfatebol mewn modiwlleiddio gwirfoddol i gwrdd â chynnydd mewn modiwlleiddio gorfodol. O ran eich cyfeiriad at fy natganiad ym mis Hydref, mae Tir Cynnal wedi'i rewi ar hyn o bryd o ganlyniad i'm penderfyniad i gynyddu'r gyllideb i gwrdd â'r galw am droi'n organig. Bydd yn parhau wedi'i rewi nes inni ddod i benderfyniad ar yr adolygiad echel 2 a newidiadau yn yr holl gynlluniau amaeth amgylcheddol.

Mae cnydau ynni hefyd yn rhan o'r adolygiad echel 2, ac mae ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i ystyried a ddylai Cymru ddatblygu cynllun cnydau ynni. Mae'r cynllun cnydau

energy crops scheme referred to in the common agricultural policy health check is a different scheme to the one allowed under rural development plans. Under the rural development plan and axis 2, we continue to be able to have an energy crops scheme should we decide to.

On the use of the national envelope and top-slicing the single farm payment for specific schemes, such as the suckler cow premium scheme in Scotland, in the consultation that I undertook on the CAP health check, farming unions in particular did not show much enthusiasm for top-slicing the single farm payment as it re-circulates money into other rural development schemes and does not represent new money. However, I am willing to consider any options that come forward from Members or farming unions regarding a need in any particular sector in Wales to look at redistributing funds from the single farm payment. If I recollect correctly, we need to inform the European Commission by a date during the next calendar year whether we intend to take up the opportunity. Therefore, there is some time for farming unions or others to raise this with me in the coming weeks and months.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you for your statement, Minister. Many of the points that you made have already been touched on, but I wish to address the matter of the simplification process that many of us hoped would come out of the mid-term review, as it was a review of a wider package of reforms that was brought into play earlier on. Will the group that you have set up to undertake a review of red tape and to address any proposals that affect the agriculture industry adversely deal with any measures that you might bring forward as a result of the mid-term review? As an example, we have heard from my colleague, Brynle Williams, about buffer zones. Will these issues be considered by the review group that you have set up to ensure that Welsh agriculture is not held hostage to the demands of excessive red tape following the mid-term review?

On the historical model, I welcome the

ynni y cyfeirir ato yn archwiliad iechyd y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn gynllun gwahanol i'r un a ganiateir o dan gynlluniau datblygu gwledig. O dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig ac echel 2, mae modd o hyd inni gael cynllun cnydau ynni petaem yn penderfynu gwneud hynny.

O ran defnyddio'r amlen genedlaethol a brigdorri'r taliad sengl ar gyfer cynlluniau penodol, megis y cynllun premiwm buchod sugno yn yr Alban, yn yr ymgynghoriad a gynhaliats ynglŷn ag archwiliad iechyd y PAC, ni ddangosodd undebau'r ffermwyr yn arbennig lawer o frwdfrydedd o blaid brigdorri'r taliad sengl gan ei fod yn ailgylchu arian i gynlluniau datblygu gwledig eraill ac nad yw'n cynrychioli arian newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn barod i ystyried unrhyw opsiwn a ddaw gerbron oddi wrth Aelodau neu undebau'r ffermwyr o ran angen mewn unrhyw sector neilltuol yng Nghymru i edrych ar ailddosbarthu arian o'r taliad sengl. Os cofiaf yn iawn, mae angen inni roi gwybod i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd erbyn dyddiad yn ystod y flwyddyn galendr nesaf a ydym yn bwriadu manteisio ar y cyfle. Felly, mae rhywfaint o amser i undebau'r ffermwyr neu eraill i godi hyn gyda mi dros yr wythnosau neu'r misoedd i ddod.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Mae llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch wedi cael eu crybwyll eisoes, ond hoffwn sôn am fater y broses symleiddio yr oedd llawer ohonom yn gobeithio y byddai'n deillio o'r adolygiad canol tymor, gan ei fod yn adolygiad o becyn ehangach o ddiwygiadau a gyflwynwyd yn gynharach. A fydd y grŵp yr ydych wedi'i sefydlu i gynnal adolygiad o dâp coch ac i ymdrin ag unrhyw gynigion sy'n effeithio'n andwyol ar y diwydiant amaethyddol yn delio ag unrhyw fesurau y gallech eu dwyn gerbron o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad hanner tymor? Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi clywed gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams, am y clustogfeydd. A fydd y materion hyn yn cael eu hystyried gan y grŵp adolygu a sefydlwyd gennych i sicrhau nad yw amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru yn cael ei ddal yn wystl i ofynion gormod o dâp coch yn dilyn yr adolygiad canol tymor?

O ran y model hanesyddol, croesawaf y

Minister's approach in developing a strategy for post 2013. However, as we come to the end of 2008, 2013 is perilously close for a business. Given that Welsh agriculture will face a fundamental change, irrespective of the level of support that you agree it should receive, the strategy must be a priority for any Government of any shade. Can you give an indication of when that work is likely to start? What sort of timeframe is the European Union working to, given that these things become complex and take a considerable time to implement? The European elections next year will afford a new European Parliament, perhaps with new ideas. Therefore, does the Minister have any feel for how we go about bringing proposals forward post 2013?

Finally, on article 68, which relates to the diversion of funds from support payments, I welcome the Minister's view that this is not new money but gives the ability to top-slice existing money. Is the Minister therefore inclined not to use it, given her comment that the industry now needs stability and continuity, following several years of comprehensive change and, above all, given the challenging financial climate? Is the most efficient way to deliver support not to give it straight to the usual beneficiaries rather than top-slice it in the way that article 68 provides for? That said, if the Minister were minded to use article 68, has she any idea how much money would be left over at the end of the year not allocated via the single farm payment? Are we talking about millions, hundreds of thousands, or tens of thousands of pounds when we talk about end-year surpluses?

2.50 p.m.

Elin Jones: Thank you for your comments. As you and others have said, this CAP health check was meant to be a simplifying exercise by the European Commission and the member states, but simplification can mean different things to different people, depending on their perspective.

ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymdrin â datblygu strategaeth ôl-2013. Fodd bynnag, wrth inni ddod i ddiwedd 2008, mae 2013 yn hynod o agos i fusnes. Ac ystyried y bydd amaethyddiaeth Cymru yn wynebu newid sylfaenol, pa lefel bynnag o gymorth y byddwch yn cytuno y dylai ei chael, rhaid i'r strategaeth fod yn flaenoriaeth i unrhyw Lywodraeth o unrhyw liw. A allwch roi rhyw syniad inni pryd mae'r gwaeth hwnnw'n debygol o ddechrau? I ba fath o amserlen y mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gweithio, ac ystyried bod y pethau hyn yn mynd yn gymhleth a'u bod yn cymryd cryn amser i'w gweithredu? Bydd yr etholiadau Ewropeaidd y flwyddyn nesaf yn rhoi inni Senedd Ewropeaidd newydd, gyda syniadau newydd efallai. Felly, a oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw syniad ynglŷn â sut mae mynd ati i ddod â chynigion gerbron ôl-2013?

Yn olaf, o ran erthygl 68, sy'n ymdrin ag arallgyfeirio arian o daliadau cymorth, croesawaf farn y Gweinidog nad yw hwn yn arian newydd ond ei fod yn rhoi'r gallu i frigdorri arian presennol. A yw'r Gweinidog felly yn ystyried peidio â'i ddefnyddio, ac ystyried ei sylw fod angen sefydlogrwydd a pharhad ar y diwydiant yn awr, ar ôl llawer blwyddyn o newid cynhwysfawr ac, uwchlaw popeth, ac ystyried yr hinsawdd ariannol anodd? Onid y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o ddarparu cymorth yw ei roi'n uniongyrchol i'r buddiolwyr arferol yn hytrach na'i frigdorri yn y ffordd y mae erthygl 68 yn darparu ar ei chyfer? Wedi dweud hynny, pe bai'r Gweinidog o blaid defnyddio erthygl 68, a oes ganddi unrhyw syniad faint o arian a fyddai'n weddill ddiwedd y flwyddyn heb gael ei ddyrannu drwy'r cynllun taliad sengl? A ydym yn sôn am filiynau, cannoedd o filoedd, ynteu ddegau o filoedd o bunnoedd wrth siarad am arian ar ben ar ddiwedd blwyddyn?

Elin Jones: Diolch ichi am eich sylwadau. Fel yr ydych chi ac eraill wedi dweud, yr oedd yr archwiliad iechyd hwn o'r PAC wedi'i fwriadu fel ymarferiad symleiddio gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a'r aelod wladwriaethau, ond mae symleiddio'n gallu golygu gwahanol bethau i wahanol bobl, yn dibynnu ar eu persbectif.

The legislative detail on issues such as cross-compliance and the general agricultural and environmental conditions that farmers have to meet will be forthcoming over the next few weeks. I am committed to simplification and to designing systems that are as least bureaucratic as possible, both for the Government and for farmers. Therefore, I give you that commitment. As we look at the legislative detail on cross-compliance, including buffer zones, which you mentioned, and at implementing that, I would consider reducing bureaucracy to its lowest common denominator, while having to meet the regulations as they stand, of course.

I have started, with officials, to look at the early modelling of the redistributive effects post 2013, but that work has been put on hold slightly as the CAP health check has become the priority for those officials. As we move on from the CAP health check, I am keen to do early work with the farming unions and others on the situation post 2013, because it is important for businesses to get an early indication of changes as they make their investment decisions for the future.

On article 68, the national envelope, and the redistribution from the single farm payment, I have no scheme to produce from up my sleeve to take advantage of this opportunity, but if Members here or members of the industry have any ideas or concerns, in the short time frame that we have to consider whether we want to have a scheme of this sort in Wales, I am open to be persuaded. However, I like the simplicity of the current regime, and I would need some persuasion to change it.

Bydd y manylion deddfwriaethol ar faterion fel trawsgydymffurfio a'r amodau amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol cyffredinol y mae'n rhaid i ffermwyr eu bodloni yn dod i'r amlwg dros yr wythnosau nesaf. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i symleiddio ac i gynllunio systemau sydd â chyn lleied â phosibl o fiwrocratiaeth, i'r Llywodraeth ac i ffermwyr. Felly, rhoddaf yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ichi. Wrth inni edrych ar y manylion deddfwriaethol ynglŷn â thrawsgydymffurfio, gan gynnwys clustogfeydd, y cyfeiriasoch chi atynt, ac ar weithredu hynny, byddwn yn ystyried lleihau biwrocratiaeth i'w nodwedd fwyaf cyffredin, er y byddai'n rhaid bodloni'r rheoliadau fel y maent yn sefyll, wrth gwrs.

Gyda'm swyddogion, yr wyf wedi dechrau edrych ar y modelu cynnar o'r effeithiau aiddosbarthol ôl-2013, ond ataliwyd y gwaith hwnnw am ychydig gan mai archwiliad iechyd y PAC yw'r flaenoriaeth i'r swyddogion hynny ar hyn o bryd. Wrth inni symud ymlaen o archwiliad iechyd y PAC, yr wyf yn awyddus i wneud gwaith cynnar gydag undebau'r ffermwyr ac eraill ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa ôl-2013, oherwydd mae'n bwysig i fusnesau gael syniad o'r newidiadau yn gynnar wrth iddynt wneud penderfyniadau buddsoddi ar gyfer y dyfodol.

O ran erthygl 68, yr amlen genedlaethol, a'r aiddosbarthu o'r taliad sengl, nid oes gennyf gynllun i'w dynnu o'm llawes er mwyn manteisio ar y cyfle hwn, ond os oes gan Aelodau yma neu aelodau o'r diwydiant unrhyw syniadau neu bryderon, yn y cyfnod byr o amser sydd gennym i ystyried a ydym am gael cynllun o'r math hwn yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn agored i gael fy mherswadio. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn hoffi symlrwydd y gyfundrefn bresennol, a byddai angen cryn berswadio arnaf i'w newid.

Datganiad am Addysg Uwch Statement on Higher Education

The Minister for Children, Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Hutt): I wish to make a statement setting out the Government's response to the first-stage report from Professor Merfyn Jones, chair of the task and finish group reviewing higher

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Hutt): Hoffwn wneud datganiad yn nodi ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad cam cyntaf yr Athro Merfyn Jones, cadeirydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen sy'n adolygu addysg uwch yng

education in Wales. I am also now announcing a consultation on proposals to refocus the Welsh student finance system

On 25 June, I announced the establishment of that group and its terms of reference. The first stage considered the issue of student finance, and the chair's report on that matter was published yesterday. I am very grateful to Merfyn and to the group members for the speedy completion of their deliberations and the cogency of their arguments. Given the wide-ranging composition of the group, representative of different interests within the HE sector, including the student body, it has been particularly impressive to receive a set of recommendations supported by all those involved.

The report begins by analysing the present system of student finance for full-time undergraduates. Despite its merits, the report concludes that the system is no longer the most effective or the most sustainable option. Moreover, the report also concludes that the present system is unlikely to deliver the key policies of the 'One Wales' agreement, including widening access, tackling student debt, and strengthening the higher education sector. In its place, the report proposes a new approach to student finance, which would better assist us in meeting our policy priorities.

I will now outline briefly the approach that the Assembly Government intends to consult upon in each of the following three policy areas: support for students, tackling student debt, and investing in higher education. I emphasise that the consultation process is real and important. The principles outlined today will underpin that process. The detail of the proposals, however, is vital, and the views expressed in consultation will make a real contribution to shaping the final outcome.

The starting point of any revised system must be, I believe, the help that it will offer to Welsh-domiciled students intending to enter higher education. The task and finish group

Nghymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn awr yn cyhoeddi ymgynghoriad ar gynigion i roi ffocws newydd i'r system cyllid myfyrwyr yng Nghymru.

Ar 25 Mehefin, cyhoeddais fod y grŵp hwnnw'n cael ei sefydlu, ynghyd â'i gylch gorchwyl. Yr oedd y cam cyntaf yn ystyried mater cyllid myfyrwyr, a chafodd adroddiad y cadeirydd ar y mater hwnnw ei gyhoeddi ddoe. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Merfyn ac aelodau'r grŵp am gwblhau eu trafodaethau yn gyflym ac am rym eu dadleuon. Ac ystyried bod cyfansoddiad y grŵp mor eang, yn cynrychioli gwahanol fuddiannau yn y sector AU, gan gynnwys y myfyrwyr, mae cael cyfres o argymhellion a gefnogir gan bawb a fu â rhan ynddo yn hynod o beth.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dechrau drwy ddadansoddi'r system bresennol o gyllid myfyrwyr i israddedigion amser llawn. Er gwaethaf ei rhinweddau, daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad nad y system hon yw'r opsiwn mwyaf effeithiol na mwyaf cynaliadwy mwyach. Ar ben hynny, daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad hefyd fod y system bresennol yn annhebygol o wireddu polisiau allweddol cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', gan gynnwys ehangu mynediad, mynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr, a chryfhau'r sector addysg uwch. Yn ei lle, mae'r adroddiad yn awgrymu ffordd newydd o ymdrin â chyllid myfyrwyr, a fyddai'n ein helpu'n well i wireddu ein blaenoriaethau polisi.

Af ati yn awr i amlinellu'n fyr y drefn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ymgynghori yn eich chylch ym mhob un o'r tri mae polisi canlynol: cymorth i fyfyrwyr, mynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr, a buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch. Pwysleisïaf fod y broses ymgynghori yn real a phwysig. Bydd yr egwyddorion a amlinellwyd heddiw yn sylfaen i'r broses honno. Mae manylion y cynigion, fodd bynnag, yn dyngedfennol, a bydd y farn a fynegir yn ystod yr ymgynghori yn cyfrannu'n wirioneddol tuag at lywio'r canlyniad terfynol

Man cychwyn unrhyw system ddiwygiedig o reidrwydd, yn fy marn yw, yw'r help y bydd yn ei gynnig i fyfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru sy'n mynd i addysg uwch. Daw'r grŵp

concludes that the student finance system could do more to widen access. I therefore propose that a significant proportion of the resources currently devoted to the tuition fee grant be redirected to an enhanced system of Assembly learning grants. The new Assembly learning grants will be much more generous to students from lower-income households, and will continue to be available, on a means-tested basis, to those from middle-income households. How these resources may be allocated between different income groups will form part of the consultation. About a third of students normally living in Wales currently receive a full Assembly learning grant.

The combined effect of more generous Assembly learning grants and increased access to student loans will mean that the maximum help available to low-income students will be enhanced. Modelling carried out by the review group suggests, for example, that assistance for low-income students from grants and loans combined could rise by more than 10 per cent, to just under £11,000. Let me be clear that eligibility will not change for any student entitled to the tuition fee grant for the duration of their current course of study, and the remodelled system will not impact on entitlement for students entering higher education at Welsh higher education institutions in the academic year 2009-10. Change would be phased in and we intend it to begin with new students from the start of the academic year 2010-11. I believe it right that we concentrate our help on those who need it the most and for us to do everything that we can to widen access to and participation in higher education. That is what the enhanced system that is proposed in Professor Jones's report and endorsed by the Assembly Government will do.

I am also determined that we take action to address student debt. Professor Jones's report considers a number of other ways in which the 'One Wales' commitment to provide extra assistance with student debt could be taken forward. As the report recommends, I have begun pressing the UK Government to index-link the subsidised loan repayment

gorchwyll a gorffen i'r casgliad y gallai'r system cyllid myfyrwyr wneud mwy i ehangu mynediad. Yr wyf yn cynnig felly fod cyfran sylweddol o'r adnoddau a neilltuir ar hyn o bryd i'r grant ffioedd dysgu yn cael ei ailgyfeirio drwy well system o grantiau dysgu gan y Cynulliad. Bydd grantiau dysgu newydd y Cynulliad yn llawer mwy hael i fyfyrwyr o aelwydydd sydd ar incwm is, a byddant yn dal ar gael, ar sail prawf modd, i'r rhai o aelwydydd sydd ar incwm canolig. Bydd sut y caiff yr adnoddau hyn eu dyrannu rhwng gwahanol grwpiau incwm yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad. Mae tua thraean y myfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru fel arfer yn cael grant dysgu llawn gan y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd.

Bydd effaith gyfun grantiau dysgu mwy hael gan y Cynulliad a mwy o fynediad at fenthyciadau i fyfyrwyr yn golygu y bydd cyfanswm yr help sydd ar gael i fyfyrwyr incwm isel yn cynyddu. Mae modelu a wnaethpwyd gan y grŵp adolygu yn awgrymu, er enghraifft, y gallai'r cymorth i fyfyrwyr incwm isel ar ffurf grantiau a benthyciadau gyda'i gilydd godi mwy na 10 y cant, i ychydig o dan £11,000. Gadewch imi fod yn glir na fydd y gofynion cymhwysio yn newid i unrhyw fyfyrwr y mae ganddo hawl i'r grant ffioedd dysgu am ei gwrs astudio cyfredol ar ei hyd, ac na fydd y system ar ei newydd wedd yn effeithio ar hawl myfyrwyr sy'n dechrau ar addysg uwch mewn sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ym mlwyddyn academiaidd 2009-10. Câi newid ei gyflwyno'n radd a bwriadwn iddo ddechrau gyda myfyrwyr newydd o ddechrau blwyddyn academiaidd 2010-11. Credaf ei bod yn iawn ein bod yn targedu ein help at y rhai y mae'r mwyaf o'i angen arnynt ac inni wneud popeth a allwn i ehangu mynediad i addysg uwch a chyfranogiad ynddi. Dyna a wnaiff y system ddiwygiedig a gynigir yn adroddiad yr Athro Jones ac a gymeradwyir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn benderfynol hefyd ein bod yn gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr. Mae adroddiad yr Athro Jones yn ystyried nifer o ffyrdd eraill posibl o symud yr ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol gyda dyledion myfyrwyr ymlaen. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei argymhell, yr wyf wedi bod yn pwyso ar

threshold, which is currently fixed at an income level of £15,000 a year. I intend to do more. My preferred approach is to look for ways to provide debt relief to graduates. I will work on the legislative and financial detail in the coming weeks and months. It is one way in which consultation will help us to shape the detail of a new, made-in-Wales approach to tackling student debt. To make debt relief available, new resources will need to be found, including non-cash resources held by the Assembly Government. I am grateful to the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery and his officials for their assistance in exploring a new and imaginative route to increasing the overall investment in higher education and in helping students.

Finally, I turn to the third of the policy priorities that were outlined earlier: greater support for the Welsh higher education sector. As we move to a new system of student finance, the review team proposed that a proportion of the resource released be reinvested in the sector itself. In a period when new resources for any of our public services will be very hard-won, I believe that this will help further to secure Welsh higher education over the years ahead as lead institutions in a UK and international context.

The review team has already turned to phase 2 of its work, to provide advice on the mission, purpose, role and funding of higher education in Wales. It is due to report by March 2009. I will consider the recommendations that I receive in determining the types of investment that will provide best value. Let me make it clear, however, that all this investment would need to take place on a something-for-something basis, which I know the sector recognises. This resource would be used to target priorities in the higher education sector, in line with 'One Wales' Assembly Government priorities, such as the study of priority subjects and Welsh-medium higher education. In line with the group's

Lywodraeth y DU i indecs gysylltu'r trothwy cymhorthdal ad-dalu benthyciadau, sydd wedi'i bennu ar hyn o bryd ar lefel incwm o £15,000 y flwyddyn. Bwriadaf wneud mwy. Y drefn yr wyf fi'n ei ffafrio yw chwilio am ffyrdd o ostwng dyledion graddedigion. Byddaf yn gweithio ar y manylion deddfwriaethol ac ariannol dros yr wythnosau a'r misoedd i ddod. Mae'n un ffordd y bydd ymgynghori yn ein helpu i lunio manylion dull newydd, a saerniwyd yng Nghymru, i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr. Er mwyn gostwng dyledion, bydd angen canfod adnoddau newydd, yn cynnwys adnoddau ar wahân i arian parod sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a'i swyddogion am eu cymorth yn archwilio ffordd newydd a llawn dychymyg o gynyddu'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg uwch drwyddo draw ac o helpu myfyrwyr.

Yn olaf, trof at y drydedd flaenoriaeth polisi a amlinellwyd yn gynharach: mwy o gymorth i sector addysg uwch Cymru. Wrth inni symud i system newydd o gyllid myfyrwyr, awgrymodd y tîm adolygu y dylai cyfran o'r adnoddau a ryddheir gael ei hail-fuddsoddi yn y sector ei hun. Mewn cyfnod pan fydd hi'n anodd iawn denu adnoddau newydd ar gyfer unrhyw rai o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, credaf y bydd hyn yn help pellach i sicrhau bod sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru dros y blynyddoedd i ddod yn arweinwyr yng nghyd-destun y DU ac mewn cyd-destun rhyngwladol.

Mae'r tîm adolygu eisoes wedi troi at gam 2 ei waith, i ddarparu cyngor ynglŷn â chenhadaeth, pwrpas, rôl a chyllid addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Mae i fod i adrodd erbyn mis Mawrth 2009. Byddaf yn ystyried yr argymhellion a gaf wrth benderfynu ar y mathau o fuddsoddi a fydd yn darparu'r gwerth gorau. Gadewch imi ei gwneud yn glir, fodd bynnag, y byddai gofyn i'r buddsoddi hwn ddigwydd ar sail rhywbeth-am-rywbeth, a gwn fod y sector yn cydnabod hynny. Câi'r adnodd hwn ei ddefnyddio i dargedu blaenoriaethau yn y sector addysg uwch, yn unol â blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth 'Cymru'n Un' yn y Cynulliad, megis yr astudiaeth o bynciau y rhoddir blaenoriaeth iddynt ac addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg.

recommendations in phase 1, this will also include making greater provision for additional targeted bursaries and scholarships.

Today's statement represents an important step forward in meeting the commitments set out in 'One Wales'. The new system that I have set out will widen access, help to tackle student debt, and provide a substantial investment boost to our higher education sector. I look forward to the consultation period that will now follow.

3.00 p.m.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I thank the Minister for her statement. I also thank Merfyn Jones and his team for the work that they have undertaken in the challenging timeframe that the Minister set them, and it was a timetable that needed to be exercised as speedily as possible. I look forward to their further recommendations now that they have moved on to the second phase of their work. I note from the Minister's statement that this was a universal recommendation from all committee members. The membership of that committee covered a broad spectrum—it included the National Union of Students, for example. One has to acknowledge that those recommendations come with universal support. I presume that that is the case given your statement this afternoon, Minister.

On Merfyn Jones's letter to you, Minister, we must all acknowledge the importance of higher education in Wales in delivering what we want, namely a world-class higher education sector that is accessible to all. The barriers that might be erected by top-up fees or the lack of financial means should not stop students from moving into higher education, so that they can reach their true potential and deliver for the Welsh economy. That is ultimately what HE delivers, namely graduates who can put prosperity back into the economy and deliver a thriving enterprise culture. I accept that.

At the end of his letter, Merfyn Jones states that he believes that the advice presented is

Yn unol ag argymhellion y grŵp yng nghanam 1, bydd hyn hefyd yn cynnwys gwneud mwy o ddarpariaeth ar gyfer bwrsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau ychwanegol a dargedir.

Mae'r datganiad heddiw yn cynrychioli cam pwysig ymlaen o ran gwireddu'r ymrwymadau a gyflwynwyd yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Bydd y system newydd yr wyf wedi'i chyflwyno yn ehangu mynediad, yn helpu i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr, ac yn darparu hwb buddsoddi sylweddol i'n sector addysg uwch. Edrychaf ymlaen at y cyfnod ymgynghori a fydd yn dilyn yn awr.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Diolchaf hefyd i Merfyn Jones a'i dim am y gwaith y maent wedi'i wneud yn y cyfnod byr a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog. Yr oedd angen rhoi'r amserlen hon ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Edrychaf ymlaen i weld yr argymhellion eraill a hwythau wedi symud ymlaen yn awr i ail ran eu gwaith. Sylwaf o ddatganiad y Gweinidog fod hwn yn argymhelliad a gefnogwyd gan holl aelodau'r pwyllgor. Yr oedd aelodaeth y pwyllgor hwnnw'n cynrychioli sbectwm eang—yr oedd yn cynnwys Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr, er enghraifft. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod cefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r argymhellion hynny. Cymeraf fod hynny'n gywir, Weinidog, o ystyried eich datganiad y prynhawn yma.

O ran y llythyr a gawsoch gan Merfyn Jones, Weinidog, rhaid i bob un ohonom gydnabod pa mor bwysig yw addysg uwch yng Nghymru er mwyn darparu'r hyn y dymunwn ei weld, sef sector addysg uwch o'r radd flaenaf y gall pawb fanteisio arno. Ni ddylai'r rhwystrau a allai gael eu codi gan ffioedd atodol neu ddiffyg modd i dalu atal myfyrwyr rhag mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch, er mwyn cyflawni eu gwir botensial a chynnig budd i economi Cymru. Dyna beth y mae addysg uwch yn ei wneud yn y pen draw. Mae'n cynhyrchu graddedigion a all ddod â ffyniant yn ôl i'r economi a darparu diwylliant menter llwyddiannus. Derbyniaf hynny.

Dywed Merfyn Jones ar ddiwedd ei lythyr ei fod yn credu bod y cyngor a roddwyd yn

frank and bold, addressing the reality of where we are, rather than where we would like to be. That is a fact. We are where we are, and people can moan and groan about the situation, but we, and you as a Government, have to start addressing it.

The funding shortfall exists, sadly, because of the actions taken by previous Labour Governments, as well as by the current Plaid-Labour Government. However, as Merfyn Jones's letter states, we are where we are, and there is no point in looking back. We have to look forward, to ensure that we deliver world-class universities that can compete, not only on a UK basis, but on a European and world basis.

Minister, can you assure us that the proposals in the review will encourage greater participation in higher education in Wales and will not act as a deterrent? Participation rates in Wales sadly lag behind other areas of the United Kingdom, and we must ensure that all students have that ability to access higher education.

One problem that many students face when they go into higher education is the student debt that eclipses many of the arguments for, and benefits of, higher education. I note what you say about addressing that. I also note that it was a proposal in the Conservative manifesto of 2005 in England to increase the threshold from £15,000 to £20,000, so that students could get a foothold on the ladder and start work before they had to start repaying their debt at a higher level. I welcome that, particularly the indexation. However, above all, what must be addressed is the perception that money is a barrier to accessing higher education and being able to go to university.

We must also remember that 40 per cent of Wales's student population is part-time rather than full-time. If we are to bring in all students, we must address the obstacles that many part-time students face when they try to

ddidwyll ac yn feiddgar. Dywed hefyd fod y cyngor yn rhoi sylw i realiti'r sefyllfa bresennol, yn hytrach na lle byddem yn hoffi bod. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon, a gall pobl gwyno a thuchan ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa, ond rhaid i ni, a chi fel Llywodraeth, ddechrau rhoi sylw i'r broblem.

Mae'r diffyg cyllid yn bodoli, yn anffodus, oherwydd y camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraethau Llafur blaenorol, yn ogystal â'r Llywodraeth Plaid Cymru a Llafur sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywed llythyr Merfyn Jones, yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon, ac nid oes diben edrych yn ôl. Rhaid inni edrych tua'r dyfodol, er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn darparu prifysgolion o'r radd flaenaf a all gystadlu, nid yn unig yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond hefyd yn Ewrop a gweddill y byd.

A allwch ein sicrhau, Weinidog, y bydd y cynigion sydd yn yr adolygiad yn annog mwy o bobl i ddilyn cyrsiau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ac na fyddant yn eu cadw draw? Mae cyfraddau cyfranogi yn is yng Nghymru, yn anffodus, nag mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan bob myfyriwr y gallu hwnnw i fanteisio ar addysg uwch.

Un broblem a wynebir gan lawer o fyfyrwyr pan fyddant yn mynd i addysg uwch yw dyled myfyrwyr. Mae'n taflu cysgod dros lawer o'r dadleuon o blaid addysg uwch a manteision addysg uwch. Yr wyf wedi gwneud nodyn o'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud ynglŷn â rhoi sylw i hynny. Sylwaf hefyd mai un o'r cynigion ym maniffesto'r Ceidwadwyr yn Lloegr yn 2005 oedd cynyddu'r trothwy o £15,000 i £20,000, er mwyn i fyfyrwyr allu cael eu troed ar yr ysgol a dechrau gweithio cyn iddynt orfod ad-dalu eu dyled ar lefel uwch. Yr wyf yn croesawu hynny, yn enwedig y mynegeoio. Fodd bynnag, yn bennaf oll, yr hyn y mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw iddo yw'r syniad bod arian yn rhwystro pobl rhag mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch a gallu mynd i brifysgol.

Rhaid inni gofio hefyd bod 40 y cant o boblogaeth myfyrwyr Cymru yn rhan-amser yn hytrach na llawn-amser. Os ydym am gynnwys pob myfyriwr, rhaid inni roi sylw i'r rhwystrau y mae llawer o fyfyrwyr rhan-

access higher education. Some 70 per cent of the workforce of 2020 is already educated and is already in the workplace. If we are to remodel that, we must also address the key issues faced by part-time students as they access higher education.

Therefore, Minister, are you convinced that the report's recommendations will not act as a barrier to participation levels, to ensure that all students achieve results? Are you committed to ensuring that any extra money that will come into higher education is retained there, and that HE benefits from that money? I am led to believe that the proposed measures would raise in the region of £30 million, and we are still faced with a £70 million deficit. I hear that you have talked to the Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery, and that he has offered support. However, are you prepared as a Government to pledge to meet that shortfall, so that HE in Wales can move forward on an equal footing with the rest of the UK?

Politically, can you as a Government deliver this agenda? That is the key question. You are in the driving seat—you must acknowledge that as Ministers. Can you deliver the financial footing that HE needs in Wales to sustain itself and become the world player that we all want it to be for the students and the people of Wales?

Jane Hutt: Thank you, Andrew, for that thoughtful and responsible contribution. On higher education's impact on the economy, by increasing participation in HE, we not only increase opportunity, we boost the Welsh economy. To move forwards in the twenty-first century in Wales, we need a highly skilled workforce and a strong HE sector to generate knowledge and to provide a skilled workforce. Your points are very relevant and appropriate. Our proposals make it clear that the Welsh Assembly Government is determined to ensure that financial barriers should not deter students—particularly those from less privileged backgrounds—from entering higher education. That is why we are targeting our grant support at students from

amser yn eu hwynebu pan fyddant yn ceisio mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Mae tua 70 y cant o weithlu 2020 wedi'u haddysgu'n barod ac yn y gweithle'n barod. Os ydym am ailfodelu hynny, rhaid inni hefyd roi sylw i'r prif broblemau a wynebir gan fyfyrwyr rhan-amser wrth iddynt geisio cael addysg uwch.

Felly, Weinidog, a ydych yn argyhoeddedig na fydd argymhellion yr adroddiad yn rhwystr i'r lefelau cyfranogi, er mwyn sicrhau bod pob myfyriwr yn cael canlyniadau? A ydych wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd unrhyw arian ychwanegol a fydd yn dod i addysg uwch yn cael ei gadw yno, a bod addysg uwch yn elwa o ganlyniad i'r arian hwnnw? Dywedir wrthyf y byddai'r camau arfaethedig yn rhoi tua £30 miliwn, ond yr ydym yn wynebu diffyg o £70 miliwn o hyd. Clywaf eich bod wedi siarad gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, a'i fod wedi cynnig cefnogaeth. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn barod fel Llywodraeth i addo gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â'r diffyg hwnnw, fel y bydd addysg uwch yng Nghymru'n gallu symud ymlaen ar yr un telerau â gweddill y DU?

O safbwynt gwleidyddol, a allwch fel Llywodraeth weithredu'r agenda hon? Dyna'r cwestiwn allweddol. Chi sydd wrth y llyw—rhaid ichi gydnabod hynny fel Gweinidogion. A allwch ddarparu'r sylfaen ariannol y mae ar addysg uwch ei hangen yng Nghymru er mwyn cynnal ei hun a chynnig darpariaeth o'r radd flaenaf i fyfyrwyr a phobl Cymru?

Jane Hutt: Diolch, Andrew, am eich cyfraniad ystyriol a chyfrifol. O ran effaith addysg uwch ar yr economi, drwy gynyddu cyfranogiad mewn addysg uwch, yr ydym yn cynyddu cyfleoedd, ac yn rhoi hwb i economi Cymru hefyd. Er mwyn symud ymlaen yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng Nghymru, mae arnom angen gweithlu hyfedr a sector addysg uwch cryf i gynhyrchu gwybodaeth a darparu gweithlu medrus. Mae eich pwyntiau yn briodol ac yn berthnasol iawn. Mae'n cynigion yn nodi'n glir bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n benderfynol o sicrhau na ddylai rhwystrau ariannol atal myfyrwyr—yn enwedig y rhai hynny o gefndiroedd llai breintiedig—rhag mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Dyna pam yr ydym yn targedu'n

lower-income households. Indeed, in relation to the issues that you raise about universal access to higher education, at the moment there is no evidence to suggest that the tuition fee grant has made a significant difference in encouraging students from households with the lowest incomes into higher education. About 40 per cent of students receiving the tuition fee grant in 2007-08 were not receiving any means-tested financial support from Student Finance Wales.

Your points about part-time study are also important. You will know that we undertook an independent review of part-time higher education, the Graham review, and that review group submitted its report in June 2006. The report recognised that while full-time students and part-time students should be afforded parity of esteem, the financial support systems for the two groups of students would have to be different to reflect the different approaches to studying. However, the review group made a series of recommendations, including a proposal to introduce a range of targeted dependant grants for eligible part-time students. We have implemented that, and Welsh-domiciled part-time students are the only ones in the UK who can access such a comprehensive range of support.

Your point about higher education about our commitment to investing in higher education is important. I pay tribute to the Finance Minister sitting beside me today, and I thank him and his officials for the way in which they have worked with me to ensure that we get more out of this.

You quoted Professor Jones and, as he said, this is a robust and bold set of proposals and a bold report. In reviewing the situation on the radio this morning, he said that he took a dispassionate view, and he hoped that we would do the same in the Chamber this afternoon.

Subject to consultation in terms of proportion, we will be able to lever in at least

cymorth grant at fyfyrwyr o deuluoedd sydd ag incwm is. Yn wir, o ran y pwyntiau yr ydych yn eu codi ynglŷn â chyfle i bawb fynd ymlaen i addysg uwch, nid oes tystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd sy'n awgrymu bod y grant ffioedd dysgu wedi gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth er mwyn annog myfyrwyr o deuluoedd sydd â'r incwm isaf i fynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Yr oedd tua 40 y cant o'r myfyrwyr a oedd yn cael y grant ffioedd dysgu yn 2007-08 heb fod yn cael unrhyw gymorth ariannol yn seiliedig ar brawf modd gan Gyllid Myfyrwyr Cymru.

Mae eich pwyntiau ynglŷn ag astudiaeth ran-amser yn bwysig hefyd. Byddwch yn gwybod ein bod wedi cynnal adolygiad annibynnol o addysg uwch ran-amser, adolygiad Graham, a chyflwynodd y grŵp adolygu hwnnw ei adroddiad ym Mehefin 2006. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn cydnabod y dylai myfyrwyr llawn-amser a rhan-amser gael yr un parch, ond y byddai'n rhaid i'r systemau cymorth ariannol ar gyfer y ddau grŵp o fyfyrwyr fod yn wahanol er mwyn adlewyrchu'r gwahanol ddulliau astudio. Fodd bynnag, gwnaeth y grŵp adolygu gyfres o argymhellion, gan gynnwys cynnig i gyflwyno ystod o grantiau dibynyddion wedi'u targedu ar gyfer myfyrwyr rhan-amser cymwys. Yr ydym wedi gweithredu hynny, a myfyrwyr rhan-amser o Gymru yw'r unig rai yn y DU sy'n gallu cael ystod mor gynhwysfawr o gymorth.

Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn ag addysg uwch a'n hymrwymiad i fuddsoddi mewn addysg uwch yn bwysig. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid sy'n eistedd wrth fy ymyl heddiw, a diolchaf iddo a'i swyddogion am y ffordd y maent wedi gweithio gyda mi er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael mwy allan o hyn.

Dyfynasoch yr Athro Jones ac, fel y dywedodd, mae'r cynigion hyn yn rhai cadarn a beiddgar ac mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn un beiddgar. Wrth adolygu'r sefyllfa ar y radio y bore yma, dywedodd ei fod yn ystyried hyn yn ddiduedd, a'i fod yn gobeithio y byddem ninnau'n gwneud yr un peth yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma.

Yn amodol ar ymgynghoriad yn ymwneud â'r gyfran, byddwn yn gallu ysgogi o leiaf £30

£30 million—over £30 million, in fact. That is for revenue; the figures relating to the funding gap that are quoted and brought before us regularly are for capital and revenue. Of course, we have other sources, as does the HE sector, for capital as well as for revenue. This investment in higher education and the proposals that are before you today are on a year-on-year basis.

We will consult on how we could develop a system of bursary and scholarship routes that could be targeted. They could apply not only to offers that universities in Wales make, but also to the needs of the Welsh economy, the professions and all the skills that work for Wales, and how we can lever in and recruit more students from within and outside Wales. We will be consulting on this in relation to how we will develop such a bursary and scholarship scheme from the money that we will lever into higher education.

As I said in my statement, this has to be a case of something for something. This has to be a renewal of higher education in Wales, and phase 2, which is currently being undertaken, is carrying out a review of the mission, purpose and role of higher education. I want every Assembly Member here to be proud of the Welsh higher education sector, pulling its weight in Wales, in the UK and globally. One example of this is the Institute of Biological, Environmental and Rural Sciences at Aberystwyth University, which is world-renowned for the work that it is doing on an international level, but that work is building on the basic skills and expertise here in Wales.

3.10 p.m.

Janet Ryder: The scheme for tuition fee relief was passed in the Chamber with a great deal of support. The decision was made because the majority of people in the Chamber believe that education is a right and not a privilege, and that financial barriers should not stop people from progressing. As we know, it is the fear of the debts that

miliwn—dros £30 miliwn, mewn gwirionedd. Mae hynny ar gyfer refeniw; mae'r ffigurau sy'n ymwneud â'r bwlch cyllido sy'n cael eu dyfynnu, ac sy'n cael eu rhoi ger ein bron yn rheolaidd, ar gyfer cyfalaf a refeniw. Wrth gwrs, mae gennym ffynonellau eraill, fel sydd gan y sector addysg uwch, ar gyfer cyfalaf yn ogystal â refeniw. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn mewn addysg uwch a'r cynigion sydd ger eich bron heddiw yn mynd o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall.

Byddwn yn ymgynghori er mwyn gweld sut y gallem ddatblygu system o lwybrau bwrsari ac ysgoloriaeth y gellid eu targedu. Gallent fod yn berthnasol nid yn unig i gynigion a wneir gan brifysgolion yng Nghymru, ond hefyd i anghenion economi Cymru, y proffesiynau a'r holl sgiliau sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru, a sut y gallwn ysgogi a recriwtio mwy o fyfyrwyr o Gymru a thu hwnt. Byddwn yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â hyn er mwyn gweld sut y byddwn yn datblygu cynllun bwrsari ac ysgoloriaeth o'r fath â'r arian y byddwn yn ei ysgogi ar gyfer addysg uwch.

Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, rhaid i hyn fod yn achos o rywbeth am rywbeth. Rhaid i hyn olygu adnewyddu addysg uwch yng Nghymru, a cham 2, sy'n cael ei weithredu ar hyn o bryd, yw cynnal adolygiad o genhadaeth, pwrpas a rôl addysg uwch. Mae arnaf eisiau i bob Aelod Cynulliad sydd yma fod yn falch o sector addysg uwch Cymru, sy'n tynnu ei bwysau yng Nghymru, yn y DU ac yn fyd-eang. Un enghraifft o hyn yw Sefydliad y Gwyddorau Biolegol, Amgylcheddol a Gwledig ym Mhrifysgol Aberystwyth, sy'n enwog drwy'r byd i gyd am y gwaith y mae'n ei wneud ar lefel ryngwladol, ond mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n adeiladu ar y sgiliau sylfaenol a'r arbenigedd sydd yma yng Nghymru.

Janet Ryder: Cafodd y cynllun i ostwng ffioedd dysgu ei basio yn y Siambr â chefnogaeth gref iawn. Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad gan fod y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl yn y Siambr yn credu nad braint yw addysg ond rhywbeth y mae gan bobl hawl iddo, ac na ddylai rhwystrau ariannol atal pobl rhag symud yn eu blaenau. Fel y gwyddom, ofn

students are amassing, rather than the fees, that is creating a major problem. Therefore, Plaid Cymru was happy to see the 'One Wales' agreement being signed, which encompassed both student relief and moves to relieve student debt.

We accept the situation, but we also believe that the Government should maintain and uphold that pledge in 'One Wales' for the lifetime of this Government. However, given the present circumstances, the Government has chosen to review that pledge.

We are pleased to see that this consultation includes measures to look at student debt. The measures that you have talked about will take us much further than England has gone. It will not be a holiday; it will be a write-off of debt. That is a unique move for Wales, and it would not be in the agreement had Plaid Cymru not been part of the Government.

We look forward to the outcome of the consultation to see what measures you are going to bring forward, Minister, because they will be crucial. The welfare of students must be at the centre of this. We do not want students coming out of this shackled with a great deal of debt. Whatever the proposals that you eventually come up with at the end of the consultation are, they must have students and their wellbeing at their centre.

We accept that, in the present circumstances, that relief is given to domicile students who are studying in Wales. We would hope that, through the consultation, a debt write-off mechanism could be extended to those students who have to study in England because they cannot study in Wales, and even, perhaps, to those who study in England for whom that is not the case.

How you are going to use that write-off mechanism and your aims in this respect are crucial. If it is a mechanism that encourages the raft of talent that now leeches out of Wales to come back to Wales and to work here, I believe that we would look at that. The mechanism must be tied into that.

dyledion myfyrwyr, yn hytrach na'r ffioedd, sy'n achosi problem fawr. Felly, yr oedd Plaid Cymru'n falch o weld cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cael ei arwyddo, gan ei fod yn ymdrin â chymorth i fyfyrwyr a chamau i leihau dyledion myfyrwyr.

Derbyniwn y sefyllfa, ond credwn hefyd y dylai'r Llywodraeth gynnal a chadw'r addewid hwnnw sydd yn 'Cymru'n Un' tra mae'r Llywodraeth hon mewn grym. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd yr amgylchiadau presennol, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dewis adolygu'r addewid hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn falch o weld bod yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn cynnwys camau i edrych ar ddyled myfyrwyr. Bydd y camau yr ydych wedi siarad amdanynt yn mynd â ni lawer ymhellach nag y mae Lloegr wedi mynd. Nid gwyliau fydd hyn; bydd dyledion yn cael eu dileu. Mae hwnnw'n gam unigryw i Gymru, a phe na bai Plaid Cymru'n rhan o'r Llywodraeth ni fyddai yn y cytundeb.

Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen i weld canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad er mwyn gweld pa gamau yr ydych yn mynd i'w cyflwyno, Weinidog, oherwydd byddant yn hollbwysig. Rhaid i les myfyrwyr fod yn ganolog i hyn. Nid ydym yn dymuno gweld myfyrwyr yn cael eu llyffetheirio â dyledion mawr yn dilyn hyn. Pa gynigion bynnag a gyflwynir gennych yn y diwedd, ar ôl cwblhau'r ymgynghoriad, rhaid i fyfyrwyr a lles myfyrwyr fod yn ganolog iddynt.

Yr ydym yn derbyn, yn yr amgylchiadau presennol, bod y cymorth hwnnw'n cael ei roi i fyfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n astudio yng Nghymru. Byddem yn gobeithio, drwy'r ymgynghoriad, y gellid ymestyn mecanwaith dileu dyledion i'r myfyrwyr hynny sy'n gorfod astudio yn Lloegr gan na allant astudio yng Nghymru, a hyd yn oed, efallai, i'r rhai hynny sy'n astudio yn Lloegr am resymau eraill.

Mae sut y byddwch yn defnyddio'r mecanwaith dileu dyledion hwnnw a'ch nodau yn y cyswllt hwn yn hollbwysig. Os yw'n fecanwaith sy'n annog yr holl bobl dalentog sy'n gadael Cymru ar hyn o bryd i ddod yn ôl i Gymru a gweithio yma, credaf y byddem yn edrych ar hynny. Rhaid i'r

However, we would also look at the pay-off mechanism. At what point would the write-off kick in? These are all crucial questions for your consultation. Would it happen after a number of years? Would it be triggered when a certain earning point is reached? How would you maximise the mechanism to ensure that you equate the situation? It is easy to say that you would give relief from the fees in the first place, which is the present situation. If the mechanism is going to change, the consultation must look at how maximum support can be given to those who have debt that has built up through tuition fees.

The other issue to look at is the Assembly learning grant. As you said, more money will be put into that scheme, which is certainly to be welcomed, and it needs to be targeted. However, given the present tightening financial circumstances, you need to look at the middle-income group whose income might fall and who may be eligible to receive the grant in the future. In your consultation, I would ask you to look at the number of people who currently fall just outside of the eligibility criteria, but who may need that support in a year or two because their financial circumstances will have changed. You are going to have to be flexible, given that financial situations are changing so rapidly. Plaid Cymru will be looking at that with a great deal of interest.

As has been highlighted, the other area of concern is the situation regarding part-time students. Part-time students form a vast majority of students in Wales. As far as we can see, they are not included in these measures, and Plaid Cymru would like them to be included in the consultation. We do not want to see a second consultation for part-time students. We would like you to consider giving direct financial support to those part-time students, the majority of whom are working and have a household to keep. We would also like you to consider whether, for those students who are studying a defined number of courses, some relief can be given

mecanwaith fod yn gysylltiedig â hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddem hefyd yn edrych ar y mecanwaith dileu dyledion. Pa bryd y byddai'r broses o ddileu dyledion yn dechrau? Mae'r rhain i gyd yn gwestiynau pwysig ar gyfer eich ymgynghoriad. A fyddai'n digwydd ar ôl nifer o flynyddoedd? A fyddai'n dechrau ar ôl cyrraedd pwynt penodol ar y raddfa enillion? Sut y byddech yn gwneud y gorau o'r mecanwaith er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gwneud y sefyllfa'n gyfartal? Mae'n hawdd dweud y byddech yn cynnig cymorth gyda'r ffioedd yn y lle cyntaf, sef y sefyllfa bresennol. Os yw'r mecanwaith yn mynd i newid, rhaid i'r ymgynghoriad ystyried sut y gellir rhoi cymaint o gymorth ag sy'n bosibl i'r rhai hynny sydd â dyled sydd wedi crynhoi o ganlyniad i ffioedd dysgu.

Y mater arall y mae angen edrych arno yw grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Fel y dywedasoeh, bydd mwy o arian yn cael ei roi i'r cynllun hwnnw, sy'n sicr i'w groesawu, ac mae angen ei dargedu. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried yr amgylchiadau ariannol anos sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd, mae angen ichi edrych ar y grŵp incwm canolig y gallai eu hincwm ostwng ac a allai fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y grant yn y dyfodol. Byddwn yn gofyn ichi ystyried, yn eich ymgynghoriad, faint o bobl sydd bron â bodloni'r meini prawf cymhwyster ar hyn o bryd, ac a fydd angen y cymorth hwnnw ymhenn blwyddyn neu ddwy o bosibl gan y bydd eu hamgylchiadau ariannol wedi newid. Bydd yn rhaid ichi fod yn hyblyg, gan fod sefyllfaoedd ariannol yn newid mor gyflym. Bydd Plaid Cymru'n edrych ar hynny â chryn ddi-ddordeb.

Fel y nodwyd, y maes arall sy'n peri pryder yw sefyllfa myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Mae llawer iawn o fyfyrwyr Cymru'n fyfyrwyr rhan-amser. Hyd y gwelwn ni, nid ydynt wedi cael eu cynnwys yn y camau hyn, a byddai Plaid Cymru'n hoffi eu gweld yn cael eu cynnwys yn yr ymgynghoriad. Nid ydym yn dymuno gweld ail ymgynghoriad ar gyfer myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Hoffem ichi ystyried rhoi cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol i'r myfyrwyr rhan-amser hynny, y mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn gweithio ac yn cynnal teulu. Hoffem ichi hefyd ystyried, ar gyfer y myfyrwyr hynny sy'n astudio nifer penodol o gysiau, a ellir rhoi rhywfaint o ryddhad ar

in relation to any council tax that they have to pay, if not a write-off. That would release a lot of money in their household budgets and would have a direct input into the finances of part-time students.

I am also concerned that this is being announced towards the end of term, and public holidays mean that institutions will close down for at least a fortnight in the middle of this consultation period. Could you be a little flexible and allow a little more time for institutions and individuals to respond? You have said that you will make this consultation meaningful. We would like to see it made meaningful by all of the views being included, but, in a few weeks' time, institutions will be closing down for perhaps two or three weeks and it will not be easy for them to respond. So, we would like that to be taken into account.

Plaid Cymru will look at this proposal that you have brought forward with great interest. We are certainly concerned to see how the debt write-off will work. That mechanism could be crucial. We look forward to seeing how the questions in the consultation are phrased and to an extension of the consultation period.

Jane Hutt: Thank you for your helpful and constructive contribution. I encourage you to fully take part in the consultation—I know that you will. I am concerned to ensure that everyone with an engagement, a concern and responsibility at the heart of the student body and higher education fully engages in the consultation, to answer your point.

As you know, I will present a consultation paper at the beginning of December. I have already asked the National Union of Students Wales to come to the Senedd to take part in a full consultation in January. We are setting up a date for that. We need to ensure that we work together to make the consultation period effective. That applies to everyone in the Chamber and all of those who have a role and interest in higher education.

We are constrained by time. We will go into

gyfer unrhyw dreth gyngor y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei dalu, os nad dileu'r tâl yn llwyr. Byddai hynny'n rhyddhau llawer o arian yng nghyllidebau eu haelwyd, a byddai'n cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol at sefyllfa ariannol myfyrwyr rhan-amser.

Yr wyf yn poeni hefyd bod hyn yn cael ei gyhoeddi tua diwedd y tymor, ac, oherwydd y gwyliau cyhoeddus, y bydd sefydliadau'n cau am o leiaf bythefnos yng nghanol y cyfnod ymgynghori hwn. A allech fod ychydig yn fwy hyblyg a chaniatáu ychydig mwy o amser i sefydliadau ac unigolion ymateb? Yr ydych wedi dweud y byddwch yn gwneud yr ymgynghori hwn yn ystyrlon. Byddem yn hoffi ei weld yn cael ei wneud yn ystyrlon drwy gynnwys barn pawb, ond, ymhen ychydig wythnosau, bydd sefydliadau'n cau am ddwy neu dair wythnos efallai ac ni fydd yn hawdd iddynt ymateb. Felly, hoffem i hynny gael ei ystyried.

Bydd Plaid Cymru'n edrych ar y cynnig hwn yr ydych wedi'i gyflwyno gyda diddordeb mawr. Yr ydym yn sicr yn awyddus i weld sut y bydd dileu'r ddyled yn gweithio. Gallai'r mecanwaith hwnnw fod yn hollbwysig. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld sut y geirir y cwestiynau yn yr ymgynghori ac at ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori.

Jane Hutt: Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniad buddiol ac adeiladol. Fe'ch anogaf i gyfrannu'n llawn at yr ymgynghori—gwn y gwnewch. I ateb eich pwynt, yr wyf yn awyddus i sicrhau bod pawb sy'n ymwneud â chorff y myfyrwyr wrth ei wraidd ac ag addysg uwch a bod pawb sy'n poeni ac yn gyfrifol amdani, yn cyfrannu'n llawn at yr ymgynghori.

Fel y gwyddoch, cyflwynaf bapur ymgynghori ddechrau mis Rhagfyr. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gofyn i Undeb Cenedlaethol Myfyrwyr Cymru ddod i'r Senedd i gyfrannu at ymgynghoriad llawn ym mis Ionawr. Yr ydym yn pennu dyddiad ar gyfer hynny. Mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn cydweithio er mwyn gwneud y cyfnod ymgynghori'n effeithiol. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i bawb yn y Siambr ac i bawb y mae ganddo rôl a diddordeb mewn addysg uwch.

Mae'n hamser yn brin. Byddwn yn cychwyn

a period of consultation on the proposals and then we will come back for a debate, after which we will have to have technical consultation on changing the regulations. I will share that with you, but I am concerned to make this meaningful from this day onwards.

The points that you make are important in terms of our principles and commitments laid down in the 'One Wales' programme of Government. To reassure you, and to ensure that this comes over clearly, I state that we will maintain the principle that full-time undergraduate students should not be expected to pay upfront fees. I propose that we provide an enhanced level of tuition fee loan to ensure that that principle is maintained and met. We must take action to address student debt, as you say, which is a real issue for those leaving college and university and is a potential deterrent. The graduate debt that concerns me most is the overdrafts relating to expensive commercial loans that some students resort to. There needs to be a campaign on how we handle this. If you look at the subsidised loans that the Government gives to students, they have two major benefits. First, those subsidised loans enable us to move towards a participation in the higher education sector that those of my generation who went to university had no conception of. We wish to enhance that access to participation. Secondly, I have already made the point that full-time undergraduate students do not have to pay upfront fees.

I am committed to making the student loan system sustainable. That is why I am pressing the UK Government, as I said, to index link the subsidised loan repayment threshold currently fixed at an income level of £15,000 a year. If you look at my proposals, most of the cash has been redirected within the student finance system at those students from low-income households.

ar gyfnod ymgynghori ynglŷn â'r cynigion ac yna, deawn yn ôl i gynnal dadl. Wedyn, bydd yn rhaid inni gael yr ymgynghori technegol ynglŷn â newid y rheoliadau. Rhannaf hynny â chi, ond yr wyf yn awyddus i wneud hyn yn ystyrlon o'r diwrnod hwn ymlaen.

Mae'r pwyntiau a wnewch yn bwysig o ran ein hegwyddorion a'r ymrwymadau a wnaethom yn rhaglen Llywodraethu 'Cymru'n Un'. I dawelu'ch meddwl, ac er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn yn glir, dywedaf y byddwn yn cadw at yr egwyddor na ddylid disgwyl i fyfyrwyr sy'n israddedigion amser llawn dalu ffioedd dysgu cyn cychwyn. Cynigiau ein bod yn rhoi benthyciad uwch ar gyfer ffioedd dysgu er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cadw at yr egwyddor honno ac yn ei gwireddu. Rhaid inni gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr, fel y dywedwch, sy'n broblem wirioneddol i'r rheiny sy'n ymadael â'r coleg ac â'r brifysgol ac a all fod yn rhwystr iddynt. Y ddyled sydd gan raddedigion sy'n fy mhoeni fwyaf yw'r gorddrafftiau sy'n berthnasol i fenthyciadau masnachol drud y bydd rhai myfyrwyr yn troi atynt. Mae angen ymgyrch yn awr ynglŷn â sut mae ymdrin â hyn. Os edrychwch ar y benthyciadau rhatach y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu rhoi i fyfyrwyr, mae dwy fantais fawr iddynt. Yn gyntaf, mae'r benthyciadau rhatach hynny'n ein galluogi i symud at lefel gyfranogaeth yn y sector addysg uwch nad oedd y rheiny o'm cenedlaeth i a aeth i'r brifysgol yn ei hamgyffred. Dymunwn gryfhau'r gallu hwnnw i gymryd rhan. Yn ail, yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud na fydd yn rhaid i fyfyrwyr sy'n israddedigion amser llawn dalu ffioedd cyn cychwyn.

Yr wyf yn ymroddedig i sicrhau bod y system benthyciadau i fyfyrwyr yn gynaliadwy. Dyna pam yr wyf yn pwyso ar Lywodraeth y DU, fel y dywedais, i gysylltu'r trothwy ar gyfer ad-dalu benthyciadau rhatach â lefel chwyddiant, ac mae'r trothwy hwnnw wedi'i bennu ar swm incwm sefydlog ar hyn o bryd sef £15,000 y flwyddyn. Os edrychwch ar fy nghynigion, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian wedi'i ailgyfeirio o fewn y system cyllid myfyrwyr i'w roi i'r myfyrwyr hynny sy'n dod o aelwydydd isel eu hincwm.

3.20 p.m.

Those who take out student loans only need to repay them when they can afford to, and the rate of repayment is set by what they earn and can afford. I am also pressing to ensure that the repayment system can be made more generous and more sustainable.

It is important to recognise that there are students domiciled in Wales who have not benefited from the tuition fee grant. I looked at the figures today, and Members will be interested to hear that some 3,205 students in this category are studying outside Wales—they are studying medicine, dentistry, veterinary science, and professions allied to medicine. That is a large percentage of the student body—we have 17,000 students who are eligible for student finance, and 3,205 of our young people are studying outside Wales—220 studying to be veterinarians, 1,730 studying professions allied to medicine, and 1,255 medical students. They are studying outside Wales because they cannot access courses here, and I have not mentioned other courses that are not available in Wales or courses that students have not been able to access here.

With regard to the opportunities that we have to deal with this and to have a made-in-Wales policy to deal with student debt and the possibility of student debt write-off, we are looking at my powers in relation to students who have not been able to benefit from the tuition fee grant and have had to study outside Wales. I cannot go any further today, because this is about a commitment in principle to look at these issues, but it goes beyond that to looking at further options for student debt write-off beyond the introduction of our scheme for 2010 onwards. However, it is important that people know about those figures.

We are now funding over 2,000 non-UK EU students from our tuition fee grant. The funding allocation is projected to go up from £20 million this year to £79 million in the next three years, and that includes a year-on-

Nid oes yn rhaid i'r rheiny sy'n codi benthyciadau i fyfyrwyr eu talu'n ôl nes iddynt allu fforddio gwneud hynny, a phennir cyfradd yr ad-dalu ar sail yr hyn y maent yn ei ennill a'r hyn y gallant ei fforddio. Yr wyf hefyd yn pwysu er mwyn sicrhau bod modd gwneud y system ad-dalu'n fwy hael ac yn fwy cynaliadwy.

Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod myfyrwyr sy'n hanu o Gymru na ydynt wedi elwa o'r grant ffioedd dysgu. Edrychais ar y ffigurau heddiw, a bydd diddordeb gan yr Aelodau glywed bod oddeutu 3,205 o fyfyrwyr yn y categori hwn yn astudio y tu allan i Gymru—maent yn astudio meddygaeth, deintyddiaeth, gwyddor milfeddygaeth, a phroffesiynau cysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Mae hynny'n ganran fawr o gorff y myfyrwyr—mae gennym 17,000 o fyfyrwyr sy'n gymwys i gael cyllid myfyrwyr, ac mae 3,205 o'n pobl ifanc yn astudio y tu allan i Gymru—220 yn astudio i fod yn filfeddygon, 1,730 yn astudio proffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth, ac 1,255 yn fyfyrwyr meddygol. Maent yn astudio y tu allan i Gymru oherwydd na allant gael gafael ar gyrsiau yma, ac nid wyf wedi sôn am gyrsiau eraill nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru neu gyrsiau nad yw myfyrwyr wedi gallu cael gafael arnynt yma.

O ran y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael inni ymdrin â hyn ac er mwyn cael polisi sydd wedi'i lunio yng Nghymru i ymdrin â dyledion myfyrwyr a phosibilrwydd dileu dyledion myfyrwyr, yr ydym yn edrych ar fy mhwerau yng nghyswllt myfyrwyr nad ydynt wedi gallu manteisio ar y grant ffioedd dysgu ac sydd wedi gorfod astudio y tu allan i Gymru. Ni allaf fynd ddim pellach heddiw, oherwydd mae a wnelo hyn ag ymrwymiad mewn egwyddor i edrych ar y materion hyn, ond mae'n mynd y tu hwnt i hynny gan edrych ar ddewisiadau pellach ar gyfer dileu dyled myfyrwyr y tu hwnt i gyflwyno'n cynllun ar gyfer 2010 ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn gwybod am y ffigurau hynny.

Yr ydym yn awr yn cyllido dros 2,000 o fyfyrwyr o'r UE nad ydynt yn hanu o'r DU drwy ein grant ffioedd dysgu. Rhagamcenir y bydd y dyraniad cyllid yn codi o £20 miliwn eleni i £79 miliwn yn y tair blynedd nesaf, ac

year rise in the funding for non-UK EU students in line with their numbers.

Your point about Assembly learning grant eligibility thresholds is important. Students from households with an income between £18,887 and £40,401 are eligible for Assembly learning grants. That is more progressive than the English thresholds. We can look at that issue in the consultation, but we have to recognise that a household with an income of £40,401, which is the current top level, is a middle-income household. I made the point earlier that 40 per cent of the students in receipt of tuition fee grant are not eligible for Assembly learning grant, which means that they come from households with an income of over £40,401.

We have to remember that we subsidise all of our students in student loans, the rates for which are different from those of commercial loans. Student loans are exempt from commercial rates of interest. The rate of interest is in line with inflation, so borrowers will repay only what they borrowed in real terms. Interest rates on repayments for 2008-09 are 3.8 per cent, but there is also a significant Government subsidy on loans. The point that I want to make, Janet, is that we have the opportunity to look at these issues in light of new directions.

With regard to part-time students—an issue that Andrew R.T. Davies also raised—for first part of this review, given the timescale, it was not appropriate to comprehensively review support for part-time students. However, I have asked that the review consider aspects of part-time study during the second phase, and I am sure that we can look back at the Graham review in relation to taking those recommendations forward.

Kirsty Williams: I thank the Minister for her statement and for the courtesy of meeting with me earlier today. I also thank Professor Jones and his colleagues on the review group for the comprehensive and detailed report

mae hynny'n cynnwys cynnydd o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall yn yr arian ar gyfer myfyrwyr yr UE nad ydynt yn hanu o'r DU, yn unol â'u niferoedd.

Mae eich pwynt am drothwyon cymhwysedd grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn bwysig. Mae myfyrwyr o aelwydydd ag incwm rhwng £18,889 a £40,401 yn gymwys ar gyfer grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n fwy blaengar na'r trothwyon yn Lloegr. Gallwn edrych ar y mater hwnnw yn yr ymgynghori, ond rhaid inni sylweddoli bod aelwyd ag incwm o £40,401, sef y lefel uchaf ar hyn o bryd, yn aelwyd incwm canolig. Dywedais gynau nad yw 40 y cant o'r myfyrwyr sy'n cael y grant ffioedd dysgu yn gymwys ar gyfer grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, sy'n golygu eu bod yn dod o aelwyd ag incwm dros £40,401.

Rhaid inni gofio ein bod yn rhoi cymhorthdal i'n holl fyfyrwyr ar ffurf benthyciadau i fyfyrwyr, ac mae cyfraddau'r rheiny'n wahanol i gyfraddau benthyciadau masnachol. Mae benthyciadau i fyfyrwyr wedi'u heithrio rhag cyfraddau llog masnachol. Mae'r gyfradd llog yn unol â chwyddiant, felly ni fydd y rhai sy'n cael benthyc arian ond yn ad-dalu'r hyn yr oeddent wedi'i fenthyc mewn termau real. Y cyfraddau llog ar ad-daliadau ar gyfer 2008-09 yw 3.8 y cant, ond ceir cymhorthdal sylweddol hefyd ar gyfer benthyciadau gan y Llywodraeth. Y pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud, Janet, yw bod cyfle inni edrych ar y materion hyn wrth ystyried cyfarwyddiadau newydd.

O ran myfyrwyr rhan-amser—pwynt a godwyd hefyd gan Andrew R.T. Davies—ar gyfer rhan gyntaf yr adolygiad hwn, ac ystyried yr amserlen, nid oedd yn briodol adolygu mewn ffordd gynhwysfawr y cymorth a roddir i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r adolygiad ystyried agweddau ar astudio rhan-amser yn ystod yr ail gam, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn edrych yn ôl ar adolygiad Graham o ran bwrw ymlaen â'r argymhellion hynny.

Kirsty Williams: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ac am ei chwreisi'n cyfarfod â mi'n gynharach heddiw. Diolchaf hefyd i'r Athro Jones ac i'w gydweithwyr ar y grŵp adolygu am yr adroddiad cynhwysfawr a

that was made available to us yesterday afternoon.

I will begin with some points of principle. First, the Welsh Liberal Democrats very much value the higher education sector here in Wales. It has played an important role in the economic development and cultural life of this country, and will continue to do so.

Secondly, we strongly believe that individual access to higher education should be based on the person's academic ability to complete a course, and not on his or her ability to pay for it, or to be resilient enough to withstand the threat of huge levels of debt. Therefore, we strongly oppose the top-up fee regime, and we are proud that the Assembly took the decision to introduce the tuition fee grant. We protected Welsh students as much as we could, given the powers that we had at the time, from the regime introduced in England, which we saw as extremely regressive. We are proud of the part that we played in that, and proud that the Assembly took that decision. We are therefore disappointed that the Minister is today looking to undo that work.

Undoubtedly, there are problems with that system. The Minister has pointed to the fact that some students are unable to pursue their chosen course because it is not offered in Wales. She also highlighted the fact that the legal restraints within which we work mean that we have to pay for European students at Welsh universities. Their number is set to increase following the deliberate tactic of some institutions to market themselves to that group.

However, the reality is that this report is a fig leaf to hide the fact that the previous Welsh Assembly Government, in a policy continued by the present one, failed to address the growing funding gap between HE institutions in Wales and England. Indeed, if this report is only about student support, then why is the Minister not looking to redirect all the money in the student support system to the groups that she says she wants to help the most? The reality is that that will not happen.

manwl a ddarparwyd ar ein cyfer brynhawn ddoe.

Dechreuaf gydag ambell bwynt o egwyddor. Yn gyntaf, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y sector addysg uwch yma yng Nghymru. Mae wedi chwarae rôl bwysig yn natblygiad economaidd a bywyd diwylliannol y wlad hon, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Yn ail, credwn yn gryf y dylid seilio mynediad at addysg uwch i unigolion ar sail eu gallu academaidd i gwblhau cwrs, ac nid ar eu gallu i dalu amdano, neu i fod yn ddigon gwydn i wrthsefyll bygythiad dyledion enfawr. Felly, gwrthwynebwn y drefn ffioedd atodol yn gryf, ac yr ydym yn falch i'r Cynulliad benderfynu cyflwyno'r grant ffioedd dysgu. Ac ystyried y pwerau a oedd gennym ar y pryd, amddiffynnwyd myfyrwyr Cymru gymaint ag yr oedd modd, rhag y drefn a gyflwynwyd yn Lloegr, trefn a oedd yn ein golwg ni'n gam mawr yn ôl. Yr ydym yn falch o'r rhan a fu gennym yn hynny, ac yn falch i'r Cynulliad wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Yr ydym felly'n siomedig bod y Gweinidog heddiw'n bwriadu dadwneud y gwaith hwnnw.

Yn ddiamau, mae problemau ynghlwm wrth y system honno. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod rhai myfyrwyr yn methu â dilyn eu dewis gwrs am nad yw'n cael ei gynnig yng Nghymru. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at y ffaith bod y cyfyngiadau cyfreithiol yr ydym yn gweithio o'u mewn yn golygu ei bod yn rhaid inni dalu am fyfyrwyr Ewropeaidd ym mhrifysgolion Cymru. Disgwylir i'w nifer gynyddu yn sgil tacteg fwriadol rhai sefydliadau i'w marchnata'u hunain i'r grŵp hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, y gwirionedd yw mai deilen ffigysen yw'r adroddiad hwn i guddio'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth flaenorol y Cynulliad, mewn polisi sydd wedi parhau dan y llywodraeth bresennol, wedi methu â mynd i'r afael â'r bwch cyllido cynyddol rhwng sefydliadau AU yng Nghymru a'r rhai yn Lloegr. Yn wir, os dim ond ymwneud â chymorth i fyfyrwyr y mae'r adroddiad hwn, yna, pam nad yw'r Gweinidog yn ystyried ailgyfeirio'r holl arian yn y system cymorth i fyfyrwyr i'r grwpiau y mae'n dweud ei bod

am eu cynorthwyo fwyaf? Y gwirionedd yw na fydd hynny'n digwydd.

I do not underestimate the challenges that such a funding gap poses to our higher education sector in Wales, which seeks to compete not just in Britain, but in Europe and the world. Indeed, there is a certain irony in funding students to go to universities that have slipped down the league table because of funding problems, and are therefore unable to offer the quality education that we would all want.

Nid wyf yn bychanu'r her y mae bwllch cyllido o'r fath yn ei gosod i'n sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru, sector sy'n ceisio cystadlu nid yn unig ym Mhrydain, ond yn Ewrop ac yn y byd. Yn wir, mae'n eironig braidd ein bod yn cyllido myfyrwyr i fynd i brifysgolion sydd wedi llithro i lawr tabl y gynghrair oherwydd problemau cyllido, ac nad ydynt felly'n gallu cynnig addysg o'r safon y byddem i gyd yn ei dymuno iddynt ei darparu.

However, it is wrong to imply, as this statement does, that it is our investment in student support in recent years that has directly led to that funding gap. That is simply not the case. If one looks at the funding levels and decisions in England and in Wales, we have always failed to prioritise this funding, and it is just putting up a smokescreen to say that it is our student support arrangements that have allowed the funding gap to develop. Now, in order to address that funding gap, it seems that students themselves will have to pick up the tab.

Serch hynny, mae'n anghywir awgrymu, fel y mae'r datganiad hwn, mai ein buddsoddiad mewn cymorth i fyfyrwyr yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf sydd wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at y bwllch cyllido hwnnw. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Os bydd rhywun yn edrych ar y lefelau cyllido a'r penderfyniadau yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru, nid ydym erioed wedi llwyddo i flaenoriaethu'r cyllido hwn, a chodi llen fwg y byddwn wrth ddweud mai ein trefniadau cymorth i fyfyrwyr sydd wedi caniatáu i'r bwllch cyllido ddatblygu. Yn awr, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r bwllch cyllido hwnnw, ymddengys mai'r myfyrwyr eu hunain a fydd yn gorfod talu'r bil.

I turn to some questions. Does your statement signal an end to your Government consistently disputing the fact that there is a significant funding gap between HE institutions in Wales and England? Secondly, are you able to give us an indication of the percentage of the budget that is currently used for the tuition fee grant? How much of that will continue to be used to directly fund students via increases in the Assembly learning grant, as opposed to the revenue funding that you intend to put into the universities?

Trof at ambell gwestiwn. A yw eich datganiad yn arwydd bod eich Llywodraeth yn rhoi'r gorau i ddadlau'n ddi-baid yn erbyn y ffaith bod bwllch cyllido sylweddol rhwng sefydliadau AU yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr? Yn ail, a allwch roi awgrym inni ynglŷn â chanran y gyllideb a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y grant ffioedd dysgu ar hyn o bryd? Faint o hynny a fydd yn dal i gael ei ddefnyddio i gyllido myfyrwyr yn uniongyrchol drwy gynyddu grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, o'i gymharu â'r cyllid refeniw y bwriadwch ei roi i'r prifysgolion?

I understand that you will be putting £30 million revenue into universities. What assessment have you made of how far that will go towards filling the gap? What plans do you have to address the remaining funding gap between English and Welsh institutions?

Deallaf y byddwch yn rhoi refeniw gwerth £30 miliwn i'r prifysgolion. Pa asesiad yr ydych wedi'i wneud ynglŷn ag i ba raddau y bydd hynny'n llenwi'r bwllch? Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i roi sylw i weddill y bwllch cyllido rhwng sefydliadau yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr?

3.30 p.m.

I note that the Minister talks about introducing a system of bursaries and scholarships that will be delivered by individual institutions. What lessons has the Minister learned from the experience of higher education institutions in England that have offered an array of bursary and scholarship schemes? Does she share my concerns that such scholarship and bursary schemes often do not get money to the students for whom it was intended? Does she agree that they are often complex, and that students who could apply do not often get to apply for that money? In many cases they have been used as marketing tools by those institutions, rather than for supporting individual students.

On the issue of graduate debt, to which Janet Ryder paid great attention, I listened carefully to the Minister's words. She gave a commitment to look at the issues of student debt; there is no commitment in the statement to a debt write-off scheme, as you seem to be implying, Janet. Will the Minister explain the weeks and months to which she refers in her statement? When will we have the details of such a debt write-off scheme? What legal advice has the Minister received to date about the ability to introduce a debt write-off scheme? Given that, since the introduction of the current scheme, we have not been able to find a way around the legal system of assisting students who study in England, what confidence can we have that she can negotiate the legal system to come up with a debt write-off scheme? I have my doubts, but if the Minister could tell me when she will have the details of that scheme, I would be grateful. The Minister also says in her statement that, should she be able to arrange such a scheme, she will require additional resources from the Assembly Government. Could she give us an idea of how much money she has been able to secure for the debt write-off scheme to date?

Finally, I turn to the issue of part-time students, which has already been addressed by a number of colleagues. Part-time students are disadvantaged in the current financial system, but are an increasingly important part of the student body in Wales. We often make the mistake of thinking of a student as an 18-

Nodaf fod y Gweinidog yn sôn am gyflwyno system o fwsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau a fydd yn cael ei darparu gan sefydliadau unigol. Pa wersi a ddysgodd y Gweinidog o brofiad sefydliadau addysg uwch yn Lloegr sydd wedi cynnig amryw o gynlluniau bwsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau? A yw'n poeni fel finnow nad yw cynlluniau bwsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau o'r fath, yn aml iawn, yn rhoi arian i'r myfyrwyr y sefydlwyd hwynt ar eu cyfer? A yw'n cytuno eu bod yn aml yn gymhleth, ac nad yw'r myfyrwyr a allai wneud cais am yr arian, yn aml iawn, yn cael cyfle i wneud hynny? Laweroedd o weithiau cawsant eu defnyddio fel arfau marchnata gan y sefydliadau hynny, ac nid i gefnogi myfyrwyr unigol.

Ar fater dyledion graddedigion, y bu Janet Ryder yn rhoi cryn sylw iddo, gwrandewais yn ofalus ar eiriau'r Gweinidog. Ymrwymodd i edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â dyledion graddedigion; nid oes dim ymrwymiad yn y datganiad i gynllun dileu dyledion, fel yr ydych fel petaech yn ei awgrymu, Janet. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro'r wythnosau a'r misoedd y mae'n cyfeirio atynt yn ei datganiad? Pryd fydd manylion cynllun dileu dyledion o'r fath gennym? Pa gyngor cyfreithiol y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i gael hyd yma ar a allwn gyflwyno cynllun dileu dyledion ai peidio? A chofio, ers cyflwyno'r cynllun presennol, nad ydym wedi gallu canfod ffordd o gwmpas y system gyfreithiol o helpu myfyrwyr sy'n astudio yn Lloegr, pa hyder y gallwn ei gael y gall drafod y system gyfreithiol i ddyfeisio cynllun dileu dyledion? Mae'n amheus gennyf fi, ond os gallai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf pryd fydd manylion y cynllun hwnnw ganddi, byddwn yn ddiolchgar. Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd yn dweud yn ei datganiad, pe gallai drefnu cynllun o'r fath, y bydd arni angen mwy o adnoddau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. A allai roi syniad gwell inni o faint o arian y llwyddodd i'w sicrhau ar gyfer y cynllun dileu dyledion hyd yma?

Yn olaf, trof at fater myfyrwyr rhan-amser, sydd eisoes wedi'i drafod gan nifer o'm cyd-Aelodau. Mae myfyrwyr rhan-amser o dan anfantais yn y system gyllido bresennol, ond yn rhan gynyddol bwysig o'r corff myfyrwyr yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn aml yn gwneud y camgymeriad o feddwl am fyfyrwr fel

year-old who has just left school and is going into university for the first time, but that is not the reality for a great many students in Wales. Could the Minister give us more details of how she expects phase 2 of Professor Merfyn Jones's report to address the issue of student support? Minister, do you agree that we should be sticking to a commitment to keep the current regime in place until 2011, and that any changes should be the subject of election manifestos, tested not just as a consultation exercise, but with the people of Wales in an election?

Jane Hutt: Thank you, Kirsty. I am delighted to hear that you support higher education, and that you want to widen access to it. You have the chance, Kirsty, if you engage in the consultation, to be more progressive than we have hitherto been in terms of student finance, supporting students, supporting higher education and dealing with student debt. So, you could turn yourself around to be positive in terms of what you have outlined as your points of principle—that would not take a lot, Kirsty.

To take your points one by one, you recognise that there are some fatal flaws that have been exploited in the present system. We need to address those flaws, but I will not go through them all again. I have given you the information about the thousands of students who are studying medicine, veterinary science and professions allied to medicine and dentistry outside Wales, because that is where they have to study to pursue those subject areas and professions. We need the expertise and skills of those people back in Wales.

You made four or five important points for me to respond to, the first of which was about higher education. What is crucial is that we intend to redirect resources towards the higher education sector. I have tasked phase 2 of the review of higher education in Wales with providing advice on the mission, purpose and role of funding in higher education, so that we can see how it would spend the redirected resources and the investment in higher education that we all subscribe to throughout the Chamber. We all

rhywun deunaw oed sydd newydd adael yr ysgol ac sy'n mynd i'r brifysgol am y tro cyntaf, ond nid dyna'r realiti i lawer iawn o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru. A allai'r Gweinidog roi mwy o fanylion inni ynghylch sut y mae'n disgwyl i gyfnod 2 adroddiad yr Athro Merfyn Jones roi sylw i fater cyllido myfyrwyr? Weiniog, a gytunwch y dylem fod yn glynu at ymrwymiad i gadw'r drefn bresennol fel y mae tan 2011, ac y dylai unrhyw newidiadau fod yn destun manifestos etholiad, wedi'u profi nid fel ymarfer ymgynghori'n unig, ond gyda phobl Cymru mewn etholiad?

Jane Hutt: Diolch, Kirsty. Mae'n bleser gennyf glywed eich bod yn cefnogi addysg uwch, a bod arnoch eisiau ehangu mynediad ati. Mae'r cyfle gennych, Kirsty, os cymerwch ran yn yr ymgynghoriad, i fod yn fwy blaengar nag y buom cyn hyn o ran cyllido myfyrwyr, cefnogi myfyrwyr, cefnogi addysg uwch a delio gyda dyledion myfyrwyr. Felly, gallech newid i fod yn gadarnhaol ynghylch yr hyn y gwnaethoch eu disgrifio fel eich pwyntiau o egwyddor—ni fyddai hynny'n cymryd llawer, Kirsty.

I gymryd eich pwyntiau fesul un, yr ydych yn cydnabod bod rhai beiau difrifol a ecsbloetiwyd yn y system bresennol. Mae angen inni roi sylw i'r beiau hynny, ond nid wyf am fynd drwyddynt i gyd eto. Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r wybodaeth ichi am y miloedd o fyfyrwyr sy'n astudio meddygaeth, milfeddygaeth a'r proffesiynau sydd ynghlwm wrth feddygaeth a deintyddiaeth y tu allan i Gymru, oherwydd dyna lle mae'n rhaid iddynt astudio i ddilyn y meysydd pwnc a'r proffesiynau hynny. Mae angen arbenigedd a sgiliau'r bobl hynny yng Nghymru arnom.

Gwnaethoch bedwar neu bum pwynt pwysig imi ymateb iddynt, y cyntaf ar addysg uwch. Yr hyn sy'n hollbwysig yw y bwriadwn ailgyfeirio adnoddau i'r sector addysg uwch. Yr wyf wedi rhoi'r orchwyl i gyfnod 2 yr adolygiad o addysg uwch yng Nghymru o ddarparu cyngor ar genhadaeth, pwrpas a rôl cyllido mewn addysg uwch, er mwyn inni allu gweld sut y byddai'n gwario'r adnoddau a ailgyfeiriwyd a'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg uwch y mae arnom i gyd eisiau ei weld ar draws y Siambr. Mae arnom i gyd

want to invest in higher education to ensure that it can deliver on an international level in terms of the objectives of the Welsh economy and higher education. As I have said before, this must include a recognition that this will be on a something-for-something basis. I know that the sector recognises this; I am sure that you have met with the vice-chancellors, as I have, and, indeed, we all have, over recent weeks, and they recognise this as something that they can grasp. This is about the reform of higher education and of our student finance arrangements in Wales, in a way that will benefit higher education and students.

Most of the cash that is being redirected within the student financing system, towards students from households with the lowest incomes. I understand that you and your party subscribe to the objectives of widening access, and we have a made-in-Wales means-tested Assembly learning grant. If you look at the figures on its impact on widening access, you will see that the means-tested ALG effectively targets support to reduce the costs and debt associated with HE for students and households that would benefit the most, supporting those in need when they most need it.

To give some figures, at the end of November 2007, among Welsh domiciled students entering higher education who successfully applied for student support for 2007-08, 33 per cent had a residual household income of £17,920 or less and received a full Assembly learning grant. I want to increase that. What do we in the Chamber today know of £17,920 or less? Twenty-nine per cent had a residual income of between £17,921 and £38,925 and received a partial Assembly learning grant, and so it goes on. I am proposing that we redirect resources substantially to ensure that the Assembly learning grant meaningfully widens access and targets young people who are facing barriers to access to higher education, preventing them from going forward.

On the issue of bursaries and scholarships, we have said, and this has come from

eisiau buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch i sicrhau y gall ddarparu ar lefel ryngwladol o ran amcanion economi Cymru ac addysg uwch. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, rhaid i hyn gynnwys cydnabod y bydd hyn ar sail rhywbeth am rywbeth. Gwn fod y sector yn deall hyn; yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod, fel fi, ac yn wir fel pawb ohonom, wedi cwrdd â'r is-gangellorion yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, ac maent yn cydnabod hyn fel rhywbeth y gallant afael yn dynn ynddo. Cwestiwn o ddiwygio addysg uwch a'n trefniadau cyllido myfyrwyr yng Nghymru yw hyn, mewn ffordd a fydd o fudd i addysg uwch a myfyrwyr fel ei gilydd.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian sy'n cael ei ailgyfeirio o fewn y system cyllido myfyrwyr, yn mynd i fyfyrwyr o gartrefi gyda'r incwm isaf. Yr wyf yn deall eich bod chi a'ch plaid yn arddel yr amcanion o ehangu mynediad, ac mae gennym grant dysgu a saerniwyd yng Nghymru sy'n seiliedig ar brawf modd gan y Cynulliad. Os edrychwch ar y ffigyrau ar ei effaith ar ehangu mynediad, gwelwch fod y grant prawf modd hwn mewn gwirionedd yn targedu cymorth i leihau'r costau a'r dyledion sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysg uwch i fyfyrwyr a chartrefi a fyddai'n elwa fwyaf ohono, gan helpu'r rheiny mewn angen pan fo'i angen fwyaf arnynt.

I roi rhai ffigyrau, ddiwedd mis Tachwedd 2007, ymhlith myfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru ac sy'n mynd i addysg uwch a ymgeisiodd yn llwyddiannus am gyllid myfyrwyr ar gyfer 2007-08, yr oedd gan 33 y cant incwm cartref gweddilliol o £17,920 neu lai a chawsant grant dysgu llawn gan y Cynulliad. Mae arnaf eisiau cynyddu hynny. Beth a wyddom ni yn y Siambr heddiw am £17,920 neu lai? Yr oedd gan ddau-ddeg naw y cant incwm gweddilliol o rhwng £17,920 a £38,925, ac yr oeddynt yn cael grant dysgu rhannol gan y Cynulliad, ac yn y blaen. Yr wyf yn cynnig ein bod yn ailgyfeirio adnoddau'n sylweddol i sicrhau bod grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn ehangu mynediad yn ystyrllon ac yn targedu pobl ifanc sy'n wynebu rhwystrau rhag cael mynediad at addysg uwch, gan eu hatal rhag gwella eu hunain.

O ran bwrsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau, yr ydym wedi dweud, a daeth hyn o adolygiad

Professor Jones's review, that part of the money that we reinvest in higher education could be in a bursary and scholarship scheme. This is about proportions and percentages. Through consultation, we will have to see what that balance would be, but we could lever in around £30 million plus in revenue—not capital; I answered Andrew R.T. Davies on that point earlier—year on year into higher education. This could be nationally organised and it could be institutionally organised—we will have to consult on that. We do not have such a scheme in Wales. It is ridiculous that, throughout the UK, universities have schemes for scholarships and bursaries, and unless universities in Wales are able to find the means to develop such schemes, they cannot tailor or target, they cannot recruit and attract, not only from within their institution and communities, but from further afield.

The eminent chair of a university in Wales said to me only last week, 'I do not want my university to just be the local university for this community. I have to go beyond that'. If we leave Welsh universities in a position where they cannot be the university of choice for students from far afield, and from the rest of the United Kingdom, we are doing a disservice to higher education, and it will not be able to deliver in the way that we want. Through the consultation, we can look at how we will deliver those bursary and scholarship schemes.

3.40 p.m.

You also raised important issues about student debt relief and how we would take this forward. Perhaps I went into a bit more detail in response to Janet's question about student debt and how we could move towards another made-in-Wales scheme, which could include a set of debt write-offs. It is possible that such a scheme could be introduced in advance of the move from tuition fee grants to Assembly learning grants. I know that you will recognise that we need detailed legal and financial advice on how we could secure this, but we have the powers to take this forward. I want this to be a full debate; I want to have the options out so that you can contribute to it

yr Athro Jones, y gallai rhan o'r arian y bwriadwn ei ail-fuddsoddi mewn addysg uwch fynd at gynllun bwrsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau. Cwestiwn o gymesuredd a chanrannau yw hyn. Drwy ymgynghori, bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth fydd y cydbwysedd hwnnw, ond gallem fuddsoddi oddeutu £30 miliwn neu fwy mewn refeniw—nid cyfalaf; atebais Andrew R.T. Davies ar y pwynt hwnnw'n gynharach—o flwyddyn i flwyddyn mewn addysg uwch. Gellid trefnu hyn yn genedlaethol a'i drefnu'n sefydliadol—bydd yn rhaid inni ymgynghori ar hynny. Nid oes cynllun o'r fath gennym yng Nghymru. Mae'n hollol hurt bod gan brifysgolion, ledled y DU, gynlluniau ar gyfer ysgoloriaethau a bwrsariaethau, ac oni fydd prifysgolion yng Nghymru yn canfod ffordd o ddatblygu cynlluniau o'r fath, ni fedrant deilwrio na thargedu, recriwtio na denu, nid yn unig o fewn eu sefydliad a'u cymunedau eu hunain, ond o'r tu allan ychwaith.

Fel y dywedodd cadeirydd parchus un o brifysgolion Cymru wrthyf ond wythnos diwethaf, 'Nid oes arnaf eisiau i fy mhreifysgol fod yn brifysgol leol i'r gymuned hon yn unig. Rhaid imi fynd yn bellach na hynny'. Os byddwn yn gadael prifysgolion Cymru mewn sefyllfa lle na allant fod yn brifysgol dewis cyntaf i fyfyrwyr o'r tu allan, ac o weddill y Deyrnas Unedig, byddwn yn gwneud tro gwael ag addysg uwch, ac ni fydd yn gallu darparu fel y dymunwn. Drwy ymgynghori, gallwn edrych ar sut y byddwn yn darparu'r cynlluniau bwrsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau hynny.

Gwnaethoch hefyd godi materion pwysig ynghylch gostwng dyledion myfyrwyr a sut y gallwn wneud hyn. Petawn efallai'n manylu ar hyn wrth ateb cwestiwn Janet ynghylch dyledion myfyrwyr a sut y gallwn symud at gynllun arall a saerniwyd yng Nghymru, a allai gynnwys cyfres o gamau i ddileu dyledion. Mae'n bosibl y gellid cyflwyno cynllun o'r fath cyn symud o'r grant ffioedd dysgu i grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Gwn y byddwch yn cydnabod bod angen cyngor cyfreithiol ac ariannol manwl arnom ar sut i wneud hyn, ond mae'r pwerau gennym i symud ymlaen ar hyn. Mae arnaf eisiau trafodaeth lawn ar hyn; yr wyf am weld

through the consultation, which will start shortly. This is an opportunity for us all to contribute. Every party can contribute to this and work with the Government. I will be seeking external partners in terms of higher education in Wales, such as the National Union of Students. I want to see all of those stakeholders contributing to the way forward.

I have already responded on the issue of part-time students. It is very good that recognition of part-time students has come out of this statement today, because, in fact, we know that there will be more part-time students, that employers need part-time students, and that this is part of 'Skills That Work for Wales'. I believe that the contributions made this afternoon about part-time students will have an influence on phase 2 of the review.

Jeff Cuthbert: Unless I completely misunderstood him, I find myself in the unusual and slightly worrying situation of agreeing with Andrew R.T. Davies. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] I do not know whether that means that there is agreement across the floor, but I suspect not.

With the caveat that existing students in the system are protected, I welcome the report from Professor Merfyn Jones and I extend my congratulations to him and his team for the work that they have done, and I equally welcome your statement today. On behalf of this group, I must say that it is a fundamental issue of social justice for us. I am certainly supportive of the agenda for widening access. It is about raising aspirations among that group of young people who, traditionally, have not thought of higher education as a way forward for them. It is about improving life chances and it is also of enormous value to the Welsh economy as a whole. I cannot think of anything more that is likely to stimulate the need and the achievement of a highly skilled workforce for the future. It is a matter that I trust industry will support actively, thoroughly and publicly.

I do not want you to have to repeat

opsiynau ar gael fel y gallwch gyfrannu ati drwy'r ymgynghoriad, a fydd yn dechrau cyn bo hir. Mae hyn yn gyfle inni i gyd gyfrannu. Gall pob plaid gyfrannu at hyn a gweithio gyda'r Llywodraeth. Byddaf yn chwilio am bartneriaid allanol o ran addysg uwch yng Nghymru, fel Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr. Mae arnaf eisiau gweld pob un o'r rhanddeiliaid hynny yn cyfrannu at y ffordd ymlaen.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi ymateb i fater myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Mae'n beth da iawn bod cydnabod myfyrwyr rhan-amser wedi dod allan o'r datganiad hwn heddiw, oherwydd, mewn gwirionedd, gwyddom y bydd mwy o fyfyrwyr rhan-amser, bod angen myfyrwyr rhan-amser ar gyflogwyr, a bod hyn yn rhan o'r 'Sgiliau Sy'n Gweithio i Gymru'. Credaf y bydd y cyfraniadau a wnaethpwyd brynhawn heddiw ynghylch myfyrwyr rhan-amser yn dylanwadu ar gyfnod 2 yr adolygiad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Oni bai fy mod wedi'i gamddeall yn llwyr, yr wyf yn canfod fy hun yn y sefyllfa anghyffredin a phryderus braidd o gytuno gydag Andrew R.T. Davies. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Nid wyf yn gwybod a yw hynny'n golygu bod cytundeb ar draws y llawr, ond mae'n amheus gennyf bod.

Gyda'r cafeat bod myfyrwyr presennol yn y system wedi eu diogelu, yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad gan yr Athro Merfyn Jones a hoffwn ei longyfarch ef a'i dîm am eu gwaith, ac yr wyf yn yr un modd yn croesawu eich datganiad chi heddiw. Ar ran y grŵp hwn, rhaid imi ddweud mai mater sylfaenol o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ydyw i ni. Yr wyf yn sicr yn cefnogi'r agenda ehangu mynediad. Mater o godi dyheadau ydyw ymhlith y grŵp hwnnw o bobl ifanc sydd, yn draddodiadol, heb feddwl am addysg uwch fel ffordd ymlaen. Mater ydyw o wella cyfleoedd bywyd ac mae hefyd o werth aruthrol i economi Cymru'n gyffredinol. Ni allaf feddwl am ddim mwy sy'n debygol o sbarduno'r angen am a chreu gweithlu medrus yn y dyfodol. Mae'n fater y bydd diwydiant, gobeithio, yn ei gefnogi'n weithredol, yn drylwyr ac yn gyhoeddus.

Nid oes arnaf eisiau ichi orfod ailadrodd y

assurances that you have already given to other speakers, so I can omit a fair amount of what I was going to say. However, the issue of part-timers—I endorse the point that has been made by other Members—is important for us in Wales. We have heard ‘60 per cent’, ‘40 per cent’, and ‘a lot of’ mentioned. In reality, I think that it is approximately 50 per cent of higher education students who are part-timers. For me, that is crucial proof of our commitment to lifelong learning. It is not a question of moving from school into higher education, then into work, and then that is the end of the educational system and learning regime for people; it is a matter of it continuing onwards. People who are either seeking work in later life or who are in work and are looking to develop their skills—perhaps to win promotion—might then turn towards higher education as a means for providing them with that tool.

I trust that work-based learners will be supported and that the role that can be played by industry in supporting part-time learners who come from the world of work will be considered in phase 2 of the work of this committee. Although I do not wish to highlight or praise any particular higher education institution, I do feel the need to mention the work of the Open University, which provides a very flexible form of learning, particularly for part-time students who may be in work or looking to get back into work.

Therefore, Minister, can you assure us that obligations will be placed on higher education institutions with regard to the percentage that will be provided to them, and that it will genuinely be a case of giving something to get something in return? Will institutions genuinely share resources far more to provide wider choices for students who want to study in Wales? Will medical science-related subjects and veterinary science be provided in Wales as ought to be the case? There will always be some highly specialised fields for which learners will have to travel further afield, but the instances of that should be reduced to an absolute minimum. Indeed, institutions should be encouraged to look at issues such as optimum mass, because many of the institutions that we are competing with, particularly in

sicrwydd a roesoch eisoes i siaradwyr eraill, felly gallaf hepgor cryn dipyn o'r hyn yr oeddwn am ei ddweud. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mater o fyfyrwyr rhan-amser—hoffwn ategu'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Aelodau eraill—yn bwysig inni yng Nghymru. Clywsom sôn am ‘60 y cant’, ‘40 y cant’ a ‘llawer’. Mewn realiti, credaf mai tua 50 y cant o fyfyrwyr addysg uwch sy'n rhan-amser. I mi, mae hynny'n brawf pendant o'n hymrwymiad i ddysgu gydol oes. Nid cwestiwn o symud o'r ysgol i addysg uwch ac yna i weithio ydyw, a bod hynny wedyn yn ddiwedd ar y system addysgol a'r gyfundrefn ddysgu i bobl; mater o barhad ydyw. Efallai wedyn y bydd pobl sydd naill ai'n chwilio am waith yn ddiweddarach yn eu bywydau neu sydd mewn gwaith ac am ddatblygu eu sgiliau—ennill dyrchafiad efallai—yn troi at addysg uwch fel ffordd o roi'r arf honno iddynt.

Hyderaf y caiff y rhai sy'n dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith eu cefnogi ac yr ystyrir y rôl y gall diwydiant ei chwarae o ran cefnogi dysgwyr rhan amser sy'n dod o fyd gwaith yng nghanam 2 o waith y pwyllgor hwn. Er nad wyf am amlygu na chanmol unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch penodol, teimlaf yr angen i sôn am waith y Brifysgol Agored, sy'n darparu dull hyblyg iawn o ddysgu, yn arbennig i fyfyrwyr rhan amser a allai fod yn gweithio neu'n awyddus i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith.

Felly, Weinidog, a allwch ein sicrhau y rhoddir rhwymedigaethau ar sefydliadau addysg uwch o ran y ganran a roddir iddynt, ac y bydd o ddifrif yn fater o roi un peth yn gyfnewid am rywbeth arall? A fydd sefydliadau o ddifrif yn rhannu adnoddau yn ehangach er mwyn darparu mwy o ddewisiadau i fyfyrwyr sydd am astudio yng Nghymru? A ddarperir pynciau sy'n gysylltiedig â gwyddoniaeth feddygol a gwyddoniaeth filfeddygol yng Nghymru fel y dylid ei wneud? Bydd meysydd arbenigol iawn y bydd yn rhaid i ddysgwyr deithio ymhellach ar eu cyfer bob amser, ond dylid lleihau'r achosion hynny i'r isafswm lleiaf posibl. Yn wir, dylid annog sefydliadau i edrych ar faterion fel y crynswth mwyaf posibl, oherwydd mae llawer o'r sefydliadau yr ydym yn cystadlu â hwy, yn arbennig yn

England, are far larger than those in Wales, with the possible exceptions of Cardiff and Swansea universities. Therefore, will you assure me, Minister, that those issues will be looked at seriously in phase 2 of the review?

Jane Hutt: Thank you for your positive contribution, Jeff. I believe that this is a fundamental issue of social justice. Indeed, it is an issue of economic realism and opportunity given the position in which we now find ourselves. This review will lever money in to higher education and will get extra public resources into education and public services, although those resources will be hard-won. This is an important opportunity to raise the aspirations of our young people. We have an opportunity to recruit people to higher education and to raise aspirations, which is part of our social justice agenda.

Going back to our 'One Wales' commitment, it is being met by maintaining the current level of resources, including the resources already committed, and by targeting this funding more effectively. That is what responsible governments do. We are targeting our funding more effectively at the lower-income households, striving for equality of opportunity for all and, via those additional targeted bursaries and scholarships, we are ensuring that we meet the needs of HE, the economy and employers, as well as exploring other measures to provide extra assistance with student debt. That is delivering on our 'One Wales' commitment.

I will not repeat what I said about part-timers, as I will come back with a statement on them, aside from phase 2. I spoke to Professor Rob Humphreys from the Open University in Wales only today about the importance of part-time students, and he said that he hoped that the Chamber would acknowledge those students. You have certainly all done that today, which is very important.

On your point about higher education, this is a something-for-something bargain; this is a partnership. I must congratulate Professor Merfyn Jones and his review team, who, in

Lloegr, yn llawer mwy na'r rhai yng Nghymru, ac eithrio prifysgolion Caerdydd ac Abertawe. Felly, a roddwch sicrwydd imi, Weinidog, yr edrychir o ddirif ar y materion hynny yng nghanam 2 yr adolygiad?

Jane Hutt: Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniad cadarnhaol, Jeff. Credaf fod hyn yn fater cyfiawnder cymdeithasol sylfaenol. Yn wir, mae'n fater o realaeth a chyfle economaidd, a chofio'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi ar hyn o bryd. Bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn ysgogi arian i addysg uwch ac yn rhoi adnoddau cyhoeddus ychwanegol i addysg a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, er y bydd yn rhaid gweithio'n galed i ennill yr adnoddau hynny. Mae hwn yn gyfle pwysig i gynyddu dyheadau ein pobl ifanc. Mae gennym gyfle i recriwtio pobl i addysg uwch a chynyddu eu dyheadau, sy'n rhan o'n hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Gan fynd yn ôl at ein hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un', caiff hwnnw ei gyflawni drwy gynnal y lefel adnoddau bresennol, gan gynnwys yr adnoddau sydd eisoes wedi eu hymrwymo, a thrwy dargedu'r arian hwn yn fwy effeithiol. Dyna beth y mae llywodraethau cyfrifol yn ei wneud. Yr ydym yn targedu ein harian yn fwy effeithiol at gartrefi ar incwm isel, gan anelu at gyfle cyfartal i bawb a, thrwy'r bwrsariaethau a'r ysgoloriaethau ychwanegol hynny, yr ydym yn sicrhau ein bod yn diwallu anghenion addysg uwch, yr economi a chyflogwyr, yn ogystal ag ymchwilio i fesurau eraill i ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol gyda dyledion myfyrwyr. Mae hynny'n cyflawni ein hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Nid ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais am ddysgwyr rhan amser, gan y deuf yn ôl i wneud datganiad arnynt, ar wahân i gam 2. Siaradais â'r Athro Rob Humphreys o'r Brifysgol Agored yng Nghymru heddiw ddiwethaf ynghylch pwysigrwydd myfyrwyr rhan amser, a dywedodd ei fod yn gobeithio y byddai'r Siambr yn cydnabod y myfyrwyr hynny. Yr ydych yn sicr wedi gwneud hynny heddiw, sy'n bwysig iawn.

O ran eich pwynt ynglŷn ag addysg uwch, mae hyn yn fargen o roi un peth yn gyfnewid am rywbeth arall; mae'n bartneriaeth. Rhaid imi longyfarch yr Athro Merfyn Jones a thîm

such a short period of time, have done this work, which included the student body, the private sector and vice-chancellors. They have delivered a robust, bold and courageous report, and I hope that I am responding to it as a robust, bold and courageous Minister.

The Presiding Officer: With your agreement, Minister, because of the importance of the subject, I will call the three remaining Members who wish to speak, despite the fact that we are over time.

Mark Isherwood: This brings to mind the well-known saying that, if you think that education is expensive, try ignorance. I note that Professor Jones's letter refers to the recent estimate by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales of a higher education funding gap of at least £61 million in 2005-06 between higher education institutions in England and those in Wales. Is it not, therefore, the case that this gap predated the abolition of top-up fees for Welsh-domiciled students at Welsh universities, and that the solution should not be to increase student debt to contribute to filling that gap? How would you respond to the parent who e-mailed me to say the following?

3.50 p.m.

'I have 1 daughter already in university in Nottingham as there unfortunately was no suitable course available in Wales and consequently am paying the full cost of course fees in England. She sadly is unlikely to return to employment in Wales after graduation. My second daughter is in the process of applying for university...As an A grade student and a Welsh speaker she has a lot to offer Wales but what financial incentive is there to stay if we change the criteria at this crucial stage of her education...Once a student leaves for England they are less likely to return to Wales after graduation'.

That statement is sad but true.

I understand that the numbers of Welsh-domiciled students at Welsh universities have not significantly increased since the removal of top-up fees for them. However, is it not the

yr adolygiad sydd, mewn cyfnod byr iawn o amser, wedi gwneud y gwaith hwn, a oedd yn cynnwys myfyrwyr, y sector gwirfoddol ac is-gangellorion. Maent wedi cyflwyno adroddiad cadarn, beiddgar a dewr, a gobeithiaf fy mod yn ymateb iddo fel Gweinidog cadarn, beiddgar a dewr.

Y Llywydd: Gyda'ch cytundeb, Weinidog, oherwydd pwysigrwydd y pwnc, galwaf ar y tri Aelod sy'n weddill sy'n awyddus i siarad, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ein hamser ar ben.

Mark Isherwood: Daw hyn â dywediad adnabyddus i gof sy'n dweud os credwch fod addysg yn ddrud, rhowch gynnig ar anwybodaeth. Nodaf fod llythyr yr Athro Jones yn cyfeirio at amcangyfrif diweddar gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru am fwch ariannu addysg uwch o £61 miliwn o leiaf yn 2005-06 rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yn Lloegr a'r rhai yng Nghymru. Onid yw, felly, yn wir i'r bwlch hwn ragflaenu diddymu ffioedd atodol ar gyfer myfyrwyr sy'n hanu o Gymru ym mhrifysgolion Cymru, ac nad cynyddu dyledion myfyrwyr er mwyn cyfrannu at lenwi'r bwlch hwnnw yw'r ateb? Sut y byddwch yn ymateb i riant anfonodd e-bost ataf i ddweud y canlynol?

Mae gennyf 1 ferch sydd eisoes yn y brifysgol yn Nottingham oherwydd yn anffodus nid oedd cwrs addas ar gael yng Nghymru ac o ganlyniad yr wyf yn talu ffioedd llawn y cwrs yn Lloegr. Yn anffodus mae'n annhebygol o ddychwelyd i weithio i Gymru ar ôl iddi raddio. Mae fy ail ferch wrthi'n gwneud cais i fynd i'r brifysgol. Fel myfyrwraig gradd A sy'n siarad Cymraeg mae ganddi lawer i'w gynnig i Gymru ond pa gymhellant ariannol sydd iddi aros os newidiwn y meini prawf ar y cam hollbwysig hwn o'i haddysg. Unwaith y bydd myfyrwyr yn gadael i fynd i Loegr maent yn llai tebygol o ddychwelyd i Gymru ar ôl iddynt raddio.

Mae'r datganiad hwnnw'n drist ond yn wir.

Deallaf nad yw nifer y myfyrwyr ym mhrifysgolion Cymru sy'n hanu o Gymru wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ers diddymu eu ffioedd atodol. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n wir,

case that, during the end-to-boom-and-bust era, we encouraged our young people, and indeed the rest of the population, to take a relaxed attitude to debt but that, in common with their parents and communities, that is now over? They will now be very focused on issues of debt and will be more likely to consider Welsh universities. Therefore, is it not precisely the wrong time to be reducing the financial incentives available to them?

How would you address this, from another parent, Minister?

'My two daughters have considered not going to university and in fact discussed which one of them should go then they could share the cost between them! It is a very sad state of affairs when a 10 A* pupil and 3 A grade at A level student is put in this position. The biggest incentive to stay in Wales is the reduced fees payable at the moment and a considerable number of students in our area are seeking to study in Wales and therefore hopefully stay in Wales after graduation.'

That is reflective of the situation in 2008 perhaps, rather than of the more liberal economic environment when this scheme was introduced. I believe, as Professor Jones states, that the commitment remains to the no-up-front-fees principle, which means that graduates would pay after passing a threshold of income after graduation. How can it be equitable for a highly paid graduate from a lower-income background to have to pay more than a lower-paid graduate who perhaps came from a middle-income background, given that the repayment comes from their income stream and not their parents?

To conclude, how would you respond to this parent who said the following, Minister?

'My biggest fear at the moment is that the fees will be reviewed allowing universities to charge even more than they now do and the assistance given by the Senedd will also be reduced particularly to people like myself. I

yn ystod yr oes o roi terfyn ar gynnydd economaidd cyflym wedi'i ddilyn gan ddirwasgiad, inni annog ein pobl ifanc, ac yn wir weddill y boblogaeth, i fabwysiadu ymagwedd hamddenol at ddyled ond bod hynny, fel sy'n wir am eu rhieni a'u cymunedau, bellach ar ben? Byddant erbyn hyn yn canolbwyntio'n fanwl ar broblemau dyled ac yn fwy tebygol wrth ystyried prifysgolion Cymru. Felly, onid yw'n amser cwbl anghywir i leihau'r cymhellion ariannol sydd ar gael iddynt?

Sut y byddech chi'n ymdrin â hyn, gan riant arall, Weinidog?

Mae fy nwy ferch wedi ystyried peidio â mynd i'r brifysgol ac yn wir wedi trafod pa un ohonynt ddylai fynd ac yna rannu'r gost rhyngddynt! Mae'n sefyllfa drist iawn pan fo disgybl sydd wedi cael 10 A* a 3 gradd A yn ei harholiadau safon uwch yn cael ei rhoi yn y sefyllfa hon. Y cymhelliant mwyaf i aros yng Nghymru yw'r ffioedd gostyngol sy'n daladwy ar hyn o bryd ac mae nifer sylweddol o fyfyrwyr yn ein hardal ni yn awyddus i astudio yng Nghymru a byddant, gobeithio, yn aros yng Nghymru ar ôl iddynt raddio.

Dyna adlewyrchiad o'r sefyllfa yn 2008 efallai, yn hytrach na'r amgylchedd economaidd mwy rhyddfrydol a oedd yn bodoli pan gyflwynwyd y cynllun hwn. Credaf, fel y noda'r Athro Jones, fod yr ymrwymiad yn parhau o ran yr egwyddor o ddim ffioedd cyn cychwyn, sy'n golygu y byddai graddedigion yn talu ar ôl mynd y tu hwnt i drothwy incwm ar ôl iddynt raddio. Sut y gall fod yn deg i unigolyn graddedig ar gyflog da sydd o gefndir incwm isel orfod talu mwy nag unigolyn graddedig ar gyflog is sydd o bosibl wedi dod o gefndir incwm canolig, a chofio bod yr ad-daliad yn cael ei wneud o'u ffrwd incwm hwy ac nid o ffrwd incwm eu rhieni?

I gloi, sut y byddech yn ymateb i'r rhiant hwn a ddywedodd y canlynol, Weinidog?

Fy ofn mwyaf ar hyn o bryd yw y caiff y ffioedd eu hadolygu er mwyn caniatáu i brifysgolion godi hyd yn oed fwy nag y gwnânt yn awr ac y bydd y cymorth a roddir gan y Senedd hefyd yn gostwng yn arbennig i

am a teacher and work part time and although am a single parent my daughter probably will not receive any help because we always fall just outside the bracket for financial assistance.'

Jane Hutt: Thank you very much, Mark. I am sure that many constituents will be asking these questions. Through my statement, I want to provide as much information as possible so that they can assess what this means for them. I know that Members will want to engage in that.

I will start with your point about higher education. I am very proud of the achievements of higher education in Wales. Working together, we can maximise its effectiveness and make the best use of the resources available. I remind Members that the Assembly Government funding via HEFCW makes up 42 per cent of the total Welsh higher education income. We are not the only source of revenue for higher education. Working with my colleague, the Deputy First Minister, I am looking at leveraging in technology-transfer funding, for example, and at the commercialisation agenda, which the Enterprise and Learning Committee has also considered. I am discussing these issues with Higher Education Wales and HEFCW. I am also looking at the fundraising initiative. I will take these forward positively, as higher education institutions are doing.

With a current annual contribution of more than £400 million, the Assembly Government will always be the most significant stakeholder in higher education. We cannot be the only source of funding, but this announcement today brings substantial further funding into higher education, and there is an agreed partnership approach to what we can expect from that investment—and, indeed, students.

I have talked at length about the opportunities for bursaries and scholarships, which I hope your constituents will benefit from. Although we do not want to go into individual cases, constituents who are studying outside Wales are disadvantaged, because they do not get

bobl fel fi. Yr wyf yn athro ac yn gweithio'n rhan-amser ac er fy mod yn rhiant sengl ni fydd fy merch yn cael unrhyw help fwy na thebyg oherwydd yr ydym bob amser ychydig y tu allan i'r terfynau ar gyfer cymorth ariannol.

Jane Hutt: Diolch yn fawr iawn, Mark. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o etholwyr yn gofyn y cwestiynau hyn. Drwy fy natganiad, hoffwn ddarparu cymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl er mwyn iddynt allu asesu beth mae hyn yn ei olygu iddynt. Gwn y bydd yr Aelodau am ymwneud â hynny.

Dechreuaf gyda'ch pwynt am addysg uwch. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o gyflawniadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Drwy gydweithio, gallwn sicrhau ei fod mor effeithiol â phosibl a defnyddio'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn y ffordd orau posibl. Atgoffaf yr aelodau fod arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy CCAUC yn cyfrif am 42 y cant o gyfanswm incwm addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Nid ni yw'r unig ffynhonnell refeniw ar gyfer addysg uwch. Drwy weithio gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn edrych ar drosoli arian trosglwyddo technoleg, er enghraifft, ac ar yr agenda fasnacheiddio, y mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu wedi ei ystyried hefyd. Yr wyf yn trafod y materion hyn gydag Addysg Uwch Cymru a CCAUC. Yr wyf hefyd yn edrych ar y fenter codi arian. Byddaf yn gweithredu'n gadarnhaol ar y materion hyn, yn yr un modd â sefydliadau addysg uwch.

Gyda chyfraniad blynyddol presennol o fwy na £400 miliwn, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fydd y rhanddeiliad mwyaf arwyddocaol mewn addysg uwch bob amser. Nid ni fydd yr unig ffynhonnell ariannu, ond mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn heddiw yn rhoi swm sylweddol o gyllid ychwanegol i addysg uwch, ac mae ymagwedd bartneriaeth gytûn i'r hyn y gallwn ei ddisgwyl o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw—ac, yn wir, yr hyn y gall myfyrwyr ei ddisgwyl.

Yr wyf wedi siarad gryn dipyn am y cyfleoedd ar gyfer bwrsariaethau ac ysgoloriaethau, y gobeithiaf y bydd eich etholwyr yn elwa ohonynt. Er nad ydym am fanylu ar achosion unigol, mae etholwyr sy'n astudio y tu allan i Gymru dan anfantais,

access to the tuition fee grant if they are studying outside Wales. However, they may be eligible for the enhanced Assembly learning grant as a result of my announcement today. Do not forget that, in ending the tuition fee grant, I will transfer about 60 per cent of its funding to the Assembly learning grant. We have done illustrations, as you can see in the report, which would mean that, for example, the level of the Assembly learning grant would be increased by 70 per cent to £5,000 per student in the 2010-11 academic year. That would mean that an Assembly grant was available to Welsh-domiciled students from households with an income of up to £19,000. You must recognise, Mark, that there will be more opportunities for your constituents, not just in relation to higher education and its excellence in Wales, but also the funding that is available.

One point that I have not mentioned is the fee cap, because questions are asked about what happens if fees are raised. Today's announcement does not relate to the level of tuition fees, and no decisions have been taken about the level of tuition fees post 2009. In our 'One Wales' agreement, we said that we would honour our current student finance system, and that we would look to try to address the issues, particularly in relation to student debt, if there was a change. My colleague, John Denham, is now looking at these issues, and, when there is a consultation, we will do whatever we can to respond to that. As we say in 'One Wales', we will do,

'whatever is possible to mitigate the effects on Welsh-domiciled students if the Westminster government lifts the cap on fees in 2009'.

We will consider the wider options for future higher education funding in the light of the UK Government's independent review.

Alun Davies: Thank you for your statement this afternoon, Minister. I very much welcome the statement and the work done by Merfyn Jones and the working party. I hope that what you outlined this afternoon will

oherwydd ni chânt fynediad i'r grant ffioedd dysgu os ydynt yn astudio y tu allan i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddant yn gymwys i gael grant dysgu estynedig y Cynulliad o ganlyniad i'm cyhoeddiad heddiw. Cofiwch, drwy ddod â'r grant ffioedd dysgu i ben, y byddaf yn trosglwyddo tua 60 y cant o'i gyllid i grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi llunio enghreifftiau, fel y gallwch weld yn yr adroddiad, a fyddai'n golygu y byddai lefel grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, er enghraifft, yn cynyddu 70 y cant i £5,000 fesul myfyriwr yn y flwyddyn academiaidd 2010-11. Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai grant y Cynulliad ar gael i fyfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru a chanddynt incwm o hyd at £19,000. Rhaid ichi gydnabod, Mark, y bydd mwy o gyfleoedd i'ch etholwyr, nid yng nghyswllt addysg uwch yn unig a'i ragoriaeth yng Nghymru, ond hefyd yr arian sydd ar gael.

Un pwynt na soniais amdano yw capio ffioedd, oherwydd gofynnir cwestiynau ynghylch beth sy'n digwydd os cynyddir y ffioedd. Nid yw'r cyhoeddiad hwn heddiw'n ymwneud â lefel y ffioedd dysgu, ac nid oes penderfyniadau wedi cael eu gwneud am lefel y ffioedd dysgu ar ôl 2009. Yn ein cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', dywedasom y byddem yn anrhydeddu ein system cyllid myfyrwyr bresennol, ac y byddem yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r problemau, yn arbennig yng nghyswllt dyledion myfyrwyr, pe ceid newid. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, John Denham bellach yn edrych ar y materion hyn, a, phan gynhelir ymgynghoriad, gwnawn bopeth o fewn ein gallu i ymateb i hynny. Fel y dywedwn yn 'Cymru'n Un',

'gan wneud beth bynnag sy'n bosibl i leihau'r effeithiau ar fyfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru os bydd llywodraeth San Steffan yn codi'r ffioedd yn 2009'.

Ystyriwn yr opsiynau ehangach ar gyfer cyllid addysg uwch yn y dyfodol yng ngoleuni adolygiad annibynnol Llywodraeth y DU.

Alun Davies: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad y prynhawn yma, Weinidog. Croesawaf y datganiad yn fawr a'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan Merfyn Jones a'r gweithgor. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr hyn a amlinellwyd gennyh y

help to widen access and tackle student debt, as well as provide a substantial investment boost to higher education throughout Wales. I am old-fashioned enough, Minister, to agree with the Robbins principle of free access to education for everyone who will benefit from it. The state must support that access, not simply by ensuring excellence in tuition within institutions, but also in ensuring that students have the means by which to study. That is an important principle of the post-war expansion of higher education, and I am delighted to see today that you are taking that forward, ensuring that the poorest people in Wales will not be disadvantaged, and that there will not be a disincentive for people to go into higher education.

I hope that, in taking forward this statement and this policy area, Minister, you seriously consider the way in which higher education is developing in Wales, and also the relationship with other parts of the UK and the rest of the world. I will certainly be working on this issue in different ways over the coming months. I hope that we can work towards some sort of graduate tax to ensure that we are not basing support for higher education funding entirely on tuition fees. Tuition fees are a failed policy. They have not succeeded in securing sufficient funding for higher education and have, rather, acted as a disincentive for people in the past.

4.00 p.m.

So, I hope that we will be able to move forward on a very different footing in the future, to ensure that higher education has the funding to develop and to deliver the research and development work that we so badly need to support the Welsh economy.

Jane Hutt: Thank you very much, Alun. The only point that I would make in response is to refer to an important paragraph in the letter from the vice-chancellor, Merfyn Jones, where he says that the group was of the firm view that investment in higher education is of benefit to the wider economy, society and culture of Wales, not just to those studying and working in the sector, and that there is not a modern society in existence that does

prynhawn yma yna ehangu mynediad ac yn mynd i'r afael â dyledion myfyrwyr, yn ogystal â rhoi hwb sylweddol i'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg uwch ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn ddigon hen ffasiwn, Weinidog, i gytuno gydag egwyddor Robbins o fynediad am ddim i addysg i bawb a fydd yn elwa ohono. Rhaid i'r wladwriaeth gefnogi'r mynediad hwnnw, nid dim ond drwy sicrhau rhagoriaeth o ran addysgu o fewn sefydliadau, ond hefyd o ran sicrhau bod gan fyfyrwyr ddulliau i ddysgu. Mae honno'n egwyddor bwysig o ehangu addysg uwch ar ôl y rhyfel, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn heddiw o weld eich bod yn gweithredu ar hynny, gan sicrhau na fydd y bobl dlotaf yng Nghymru dan anfantais, ac na fydd pobl yn cael eu hatal rhag mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch.

Gobeithiaf, drwy weithredu ar y datganiad hwn a datblygu'r maes polisi hwn, Weinidog, eich bod yn ystyried o ddifrif y ffordd y mae addysg uwch yn datblygu yng Nghymru, a hefyd y berthynas gyda rhannau eraill o'r DU a gweddill y byd. Byddaf yn sicr yn gweithio ar y mater hwn mewn gwahanol ffyrdd dros y misoedd i ddod. Gobeithiaf y gallwn weithio tuag at ryw fath o dreth i raddedigion i sicrhau nad ydym yn seilio cymorth o ran cyllid addysg uwch yn gyfan gwbl ar ffioedd dysgu. Mae ffioedd dysgu'n bolisi aflwyddiannus. Nid ydynt wedi llwyddo i sicrhau arian digonol ar gyfer addysg uwch ac, yn hytrach, maent wedi atal pobl rhag mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch yn y gorffennol.

Felly, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu symud ymlaen ar sylfaen wahanol iawn yn y dyfodol, er mwyn sicrhau bod gan addysg uwch yr arian i ddatblygu ac i wneud y gwaith ymchwil a datblygu y mae ei cymaint ei angen arnom i gefnogi economi Cymru.

Jane Hutt: Diolch yn fawr iawn ichi, Alun. Yr unig bwynt y byddwn yn ei wneud wrth ymateb yw cyfeirio at baragraff pwysig yn y llythyr gan yr is-ganghellor, Merfyn Jones, lle mae'n dweud bod y grŵp yn credu'n gryf bod buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch o fudd i economi, cymdeithas a diwylliant ehangach Cymru, nid dim ond i'r rheiny sy'n astudio ac yn gweithio yn y sector, ac nad oes cymdeithas fodern yn bod nad yw'n gweld

not see a well-resourced HE sector as pivotal to its prosperity and future.

Bethan Jenkins: I welcome the statement made today and the work done by Merfyn Jones's group. I am sure that most people here received a free education and, therefore, talking about changing the structure today may come somewhat more easily to some of you than to the others of us who have a substantial amount of debt to pay back.

Access to education should be free—that is my view and the view of my party—and I oppose the introduction of top-up fees. I was vocal in my opposition to top-up fees when the vote was taken in the Chamber, when the previous Government was intent on introducing the fee grant for students.

I have heard you say that it will be a real consultation, but I question whether it is a real consultation if you are saying that the current system should be ruled out altogether. I seek assurances, therefore, from the Minister that all options will be considered and that, if the student body or elements of it come back and say that they believe that the current system should be retained, you will take those views on board.

Has the Minister looked at any other models of funding from outside the UK, in terms of addressing this issue? I know that the review group was pressed for time when taking part in this process, and I would like to seek assurances that that did happen, because I do not think that we should be going down the route of confining ourselves to the Westminster agenda of the marketisation of higher education—we should not be following Westminster's lead.

Does the Minister agree that any policy adopted as a result of this review should reflect the One Wales Government's principle regarding universal benefits? I find it quite confusing to accept policies such as free prescriptions and free access to transport when it seems to me that, on this occasion, there is an intention to encourage students to pay more fees, on a means-tested basis. I would like to see clarification on that. Why, for example, are we targeting higher education students? It could be argued that if

sector AU a chanddi ddigon o adnoddau'n ganolog i'w ffyniant a'i dyfodol.

Bethan Jenkins: Croesawaf y datganiad a gafwyd heddiw a'r gwaith a wnaethwyd gan grŵp Merfyn Jones. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sydd yma wedi cael eu haddysg am ddim, ac felly, efallai fod newid y strwythur heddiw'n dod yn haws i rai ohonoch nag i eraill ohonom y mae gennym ddyled sylweddol i'w had-dalu.

Dylai addysg fod ar gael am ddim—dyna fy marn i a barn fy mhlaidd—a gwrthwynebam gyflwyno ffioedd atodol. Yr oeddwn yn wrthwynebydd croch i ffioedd atodol adeg y bleidlais yn y Siambr, pan oedd y Llywodraeth flaenorol a'i bryd ar gyflwyno'r grant ffioedd i fyfyrwyr.

Yr wyf wedi'ch clywed yn dweud y bydd yr ymgynghoriad hwn yn ymgynghoriad go iawn, ond amheuf hynny os ydych yn dweud na ddylid ystyried y system bresennol o gwbl. Ceisiaf sicrwydd, felly, gan y Gweinidog yr ystyrir pob dewis, ac, os bydd corff y myfyrwyr neu elfennau ohono'n dod yn ôl ac yn dweud eu bod yn credu y dylid glynu wrth y system bresennol, y byddwch yn ystyried y farn honno.

A yw'r Gweinidog wedi edrych ar unrhyw fodelau cyllido eraill o'r tu allan i'r DU, o ran mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn? Gwn fod y grŵp adolygu dan bwysau amser wrth iddo gymryd rhan yn y broses hon, a hoffwn geisio sicrwydd i hynny ddigwydd, oherwydd ni chredaf y dylem fod yn dilyn trywydd ein cyfyngu'n hunain i agenda San Steffan, sef marchnadeiddio addysg uwch—ni ddylem fod yn dilyn ôl troed San Steffan.

A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylai unrhyw bolisi a fabwysiedir yn sgil yr adolygiad hwn adlewyrchu egwyddor Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un ynglŷn â rhoi'r un buddiannau i bawb? Fe'i caf yn eithaf dryslyd derbyn polisïau megis presgripsiynau am ddim a thrafnidiaeth am ddim ac eto, i bob golwg, yn y cyswllt hwn, bod bwriad i annog myfyrwyr i dalu mwy o ffioedd, ar sail prawf modd. Hoffwn weld eglurhad ynglŷn â hynny. Pam, er enghraifft, yr ydym yn targedu myfyrwyr addysg uwch. Gellid dadlau, os ydym am

we are going to introduce a means-testing system for higher education, we should introduce it for other levels of education too.

One of the task and finish group's tasks was to look at whether the cap would be lifted in Westminster, and I know that you have touched on that. Do you believe that this system will be sustainable if the cap is not lifted due to economic pressures and the current crisis in the economy? Will you reconsider your position in the light of that?

I welcome the efforts to introduce some form of debt write-off for students, but I would like to take part in the consultation process, via Plaid Cymru, to see details of that debt write-off. Minister, do you think that mitigating—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Bethan Jenkins: Would the debt write-off system mitigate the effect on students if they are going to be paying much greater fees in the future? People may shout from the sidelines, but some people in the Labour Party have already sold out on their principles, and I am intent on not doing that.

Jane Hutt: I have to pay respect to Bethan for her student experience—she is certainly closer to that experience than many of us. She has also played a representative role in the student body. Bethan, you know that I will value your contribution to the consultation. In your role as a regional Member, with your connections with the student body, you will be representing an important body of opinion in terms of the consultation that we are going to carry out. Therefore, your experience is valuable and relevant. The consultation will be on the statement, but so many options will emerge that we will need you to consider. Therefore, I urge you to look at what the statement is offering in terms of new, made-in-Wales policies. We want your input—and that of all Assembly Members—into how we can get the best out of the options that we are presenting for this new way forward, particularly in relation to student debt.

gyflwyno system prawf modd ar gyfer addysg uwch, y dylem ei chyflwyno ar gyfer lefelau addysg eraill hefyd.

Un o dasgau'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen oedd edrych a fyddai'r cap yn cael ei godi yn San Steffan, a gwn eich bod wedi crybwyll hynny. A gredwch y bydd modd cynnal y system hon oni chodir y cap oherwydd pwysau economaidd a'r argyfwng presennol yn yr economi? A wnewch ailystyried eich safbwynt yng ngoleuni hynny?

Croesawaf yr ymdrechion i gyflwyno rhyw ffurf ar ddileu dyledion i fyfyrwyr, ond hoffwn gymryd rhan yn y broses ymgynghori, drwy gyfrwng Plaid Cymru, er mwyn gweld manylion y dileu dyledion hwnnw. Weinidog, a gredwch fod lliniaru—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn

Bethan Jenkins: A fyddai'r system dileu dyledion yn lliniaru'r effaith ar fyfyrwyr os byddant yn talu ffioedd uwch o lawer yn y dyfodol? Gwaedded pobl o'r ystlysau, ond mae rhai pobl yn y Blaid Lafur eisoes wedi cefnu ar eu hegwyddorion, ac yr wyf yn benderfynol o beidio â gwneud hynny.

Jane Hutt: Rhaid imi roi teyrnged i Bethan Jenkins am ei phrofiad fel myfyrwraig—yn sicr, mae'n nes at y profiad nag y mae llawer ohonom. Mae wedi bod cynrychioli corff y myfyrwyr. Bethan, gwyddoch y byddaf yn gwerthfawrogi'ch cyfraniad at yr ymgynghori. Yn eich rôl fel Aelod rhanbarthol, a yn sgil eich cysylltiadau â chorff y myfyrwyr, byddwch yn cynrychioli corff pwysig o farn o ran yr ymgynghori a gynhelir gennym. Felly, mae eich profiad yn werthfawr ac yn berthnasol. Ymgynghorir ynglŷn â'r datganiad, ond bydd cynifer o ddewisiadau'n codi y byddwn am ichi eu hystyried. Felly, pwysaf arnoch i edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r datganiad yn ei gynnig o ran polisïau newydd sydd wedi'u llunio yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am gael eich cyfraniad—a chyfraniad gan bob aelod o'r Cynulliad—ynglŷn â sut y gallwn fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y dewisiadau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno ar gyfer y ffordd newydd hon ymlaen, yn enwedig o ran dyledion myfyrwyr.

This is a social justice agenda, and we are talking about a progressive, redistributive policy. It is not about marketisation. Indeed, it tries to redress the impacts of a marketisation approach to higher education. I will go back the contribution that we will make to HE. Higher education will have to be competitive. There is no question that it is in the marketplace, but not in terms of the student finance system. This student finance system is much more progressive and much more redistributive, and it enhances the social justice agenda.

If you contribute to the consultation, you will see that we can make a difference to the lives of those young people who currently face financial barriers and who suffer from a lack of opportunity because of the tuition fee grant. As I mentioned earlier, 3,000 students who have not had a penny from us in tuition fee grant are studying outside Wales; how can that be fair?

We will contribute to the discussion on whether or not the cap is lifted. My next conversations with John Denham will be about index linking; I know that you have taken that forward as a key issue. Let us as an Assembly make the most of what we can do and the influence that we have.

Agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yw hon, ac yr ydym yn sôn am bolisi blaengar, sy'n ailddosbarthu arian. Nid marchnadeiddio yw hanfod hyn. Yn wir, mae'n ceisio gwneud iawn am effeithiau'r ymagwedd marchnadeiddio at addysg uwch. Dychwelaf at y cyfraniad a wnawn i AU. Bydd yn rhaid i addysg uwch fod yn gystadleuol. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw yn y farchnad, ond nid felly y mae o ran y system cyllido myfyrwyr. Mae'r system cyllido myfyrwyr hon yn fwy blaengar o lawer, mae'n canolbwyntio mwy ar ailddosbarthu arian, ac mae'n cryfhau'r agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Os cyfrannwch at yr ymgynghori, gwelwch y gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau'r bobl ifanc hynny sy'n wynebu rhwystrau ariannol ar hyn o bryd ac sy'n dioddef diffyg cyfle oherwydd y grant ffioedd dysgu. Fel y crybwyllais gynnu, mae 3,000 o fyfyrwyr nad ydynt wedi cael ceiniog gennym ar ffurf grant ffioedd dysgu'n astudio y tu allan i Gymru; sut y gall hynny fod yn deg?

Byddwn yn cyfrannu at y drafodaeth ynglŷn ag a godir y cap ai peidio. Bydd fy sgysiau nesaf â John Denham yn ymwneud â chysylltu'r cyfraddau â chwyddiant; Gwn fod hwnnw'n fater allweddol yr ydych wedi bod ymgyrch yn ei gylch. Gadewch inni yn y Cynulliad fanteisio i'r eithaf ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud a'r dylanwad sydd gennym.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.07 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.07 p.m.*

Caffael Cynaliadwy Sustainable Procurement

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham and amendments 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 yn enw William Graham a gwelliannau 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

welcomes the work of the Assembly Government's Value Wales in supporting the

yn croesawu'r gwaith a wneir gan Werth Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran

delivery of more efficient and effective public services in Wales through smarter public procurement. (NDM4061)

cefnogi'r gwaith o gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwy effeithlon a mwy effeithiol yng Nghymru drwy well caffael cyhoeddus. (NDM4061)

I welcome the progress being made by the Assembly Government's Value Wales in supporting the delivery of improved public services through procurement, and also in using procurement to develop our economic and social policies.

Croesawaf y cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud gan adran Gwerth Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy gaffael, a hefyd drwy ddefnyddio caffael er mwyn datblygu'n polisïau economaidd a chymdeithasol.

Through the recent economic summits, we have already recognised the importance of procurement, especially in maximising opportunities to support the business community throughout Wales. Value Wales, which is a part of my department, is leading a procurement work stream, which includes helping the public sector to reduce payment times to 10 days. I am encouraged that the latest figures for the Assembly Government show an average time of 5.9 days for paying invoices; I urge all public sector bodies in Wales to try to match this performance.

Drwy'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd diweddar, yr ydym eisoes wedi sylweddoli pwysigrwydd caffael, yn enwedig o ran manteisio i'r eithaf ar gyfleoedd i gefnogi'r gymuned fusnes ledled Cymru. Mae Gwerth Cymru, sy'n rhan o'm hadran, yn arwain llif o waith caffael. Mae hyn yn cynnwys cynorthwyo'r sector cyhoeddus i gwtogi cynnodau talu i 10 diwrnod. Mae'n galonogol bod y ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dangos bod anfonebau'n cael eu talu o fewn 5.9 diwrnod ar gyfartaledd. Anogaf bob un o gyrff y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru i geisio gwneud cystal.

In the 'One Wales' agreement, we recognised the importance of procurement in generating efficiency gains. The update that I have circulated to Members shows how the Assembly Government's Value Wales is contributing directly to the achievement of several 'One Wales' commitments. That highlights significant successes so far, which result from real partnership working between the Assembly Government and the public sector. That is especially important as savings realised through procurement can be reinvested into delivering front-line services. Only yesterday, in his pre-budget report, the Chancellor of the Exchequer outlined how an additional £5 billion in efficiency savings will contribute to a £20 billion injection into the UK economy. These efficiencies will be achieved in part through better procurement.

Yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', cydnabuwyd pwysigrwydd caffael er mwyn sicrhau enillion effeithlonrwydd. Mae'r diweddariad yr wyf wedi'i ddsbarthu ymhlith yr Aelodau'n dangos sut y mae Gwerth Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol at lwyddiant sawl un o ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae hynny'n tynnu sylw at lwyddiannau sylweddol hyd yn hyn, sy'n codi yn sgil gwaith partneriaeth go iawn rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig gan fod modd ailfuddsoddi arbedion a wneir drwy gaffael er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen. Dim ond ddoe, yn ei adroddiad cyn-gyllideb, soniodd Canghellor y Trysorlys sut y bydd arbed £5 biliwn yn ychwanegol drwy effeithlonrwydd yn cyfrannu chwistrelliad o £20 biliwn i economi'r DU. Llwyddir i arbed yr arian hwn yn rhannol drwy well caffael.

4.10 p.m.

A good example of how we believe our policies are working is the all-Wales sourcing plan. Wales is the first part of the UK to have

Enghraifft dda o sut y credwn fod ein polisïau'n gweithio yw cynllun cyrchu Cymru-gyfan. Cymru yw'r rhan gyntaf o'r

a cross-sector, collaborative procurement strategy. What we believe stands out is the link to sustainable procurement in the widest sense. It is not about aggregating—or what is often described as bundling—contracts to drive cost down; it is about carefully evaluating what is being bought, and designing the optimum approach to gain the best possible value for money for the Welsh taxpayer. Welsh small and medium-sized businesses have so much to gain. For example, Icon Computer Services from Swansea, Centerprise from Caerphilly and SET Office Supplies from Cardiff are some of those who have secured contracts through the Value Wales programme. Good progress has been made, but Value Wales still only directly influences around 8 per cent of the total public expenditure in this area across Wales. In stepping up to the next level, we must tackle more of the high-spend areas. For example, the construction sector is critical. With spend of over £3 billion a year, it offers a real opportunity to stimulate economic activity.

We should be making our forward plans known as early as possible to help firms make investment decisions. We also need to provide consistent messages on social, economic and environmental requirements. In order to drive that, I am establishing a group reporting to the business procurement taskforce, which I chair, to establish a strategy for public sector construction. In view of the economic climate and the urgency to act, I have asked that group to report to me by the end of January.

We must also look at this more widely and become more ambitious. I have committed £20 million to the xchangewales programme to roll out e-procurement across Wales. The savings could be up to £200 million over the next five years. For example, xchangewales is being made available to all schools in Wales free of charge. That alone has the potential to save up to £20 million, which could be reinvested in school budgets and school facilities. The benefits include dramatically reduced bureaucracy and the faster payment of bills—for example the time

DU i gael strategaeth gaffael gydweithredol ar draws y sectorau. Yr hyn sy'n amlwg, yn ein barn ni, yw'r cysylltiad â chaffael cynaliadwy yn yr ystyr ehangaf. Nid mater o gronni—neu'r hyn a elwir yn aml yn fwndeli-contractau i wasgu ar brisiau yw hi; ond mater o bwysu a mesur yn ofalus yr hyn a brynir, a chynllunio'r ymagwedd orau un er mwyn sicrhau'r gwerth gorau posibl am arian i drethdalwyr Cymru. Mae gan fusnesau bach a chanolig Cymru gymaint i'w ennill. Er enghraifft, Icon Coputer Services o Abertawe, Centerprise o Gaerffili a Set Office Supplies o Gaerdydd yw rhai o'r rheiny sydd wedi sicrhau contractau drwy raglen Gwerth Cymru. Mae cynnydd da wedi'i wneud, ond dim ond 8 y cant o'r holl wariant cyhoeddus yn y maes hwn y mae Gwerth Cymru'n dylanwadu'n uniongyrchol arno o hyd ledled Cymru. Wrth gamu ymlaen i'r lefel nesaf, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â mwy o'r meysydd gwario-mawr. Er enghraifft, mae'r sector adeiladu'n hollbwysig. Mae'n gwario dros £3 biliwn y flwyddyn, ac felly, mae'n cynnig cyfle go iawn i ysgogi gweithgarwch economaidd.

Dylem gyhoeddi'n blaengynlluniau cyn gynted ag y bo modd er mwyn cynorthwyo cwmnïau i benderfynu ynglŷn â buddsoddi. Mae angen inni gyfleu negeseuon cyson hefyd ynglŷn â'r gofynion cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Er mwyn sbarduno hynny, yr wyf yn sefydlu grŵp a fydd yn adrodd i'r tasglu caffael busnes, tasglu yr wyf yn ei gadeirio, er mwyn llunio strategaeth ar gyfer adeiladu yn y sector cyhoeddus. Ac ystyried yr hinsawdd economaidd a bod brys inni weithredu, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r grŵp hwnnw gyflwyno adroddiad imi erbyn diwedd Ionawr.

Rhaid inni edrych yn ehangach ar hyn hefyd a magu mwy o uchelgais. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo £20 miliwn i raglen Cyfnewid Cymru er mwyn lledaenu e-gaffael drwy'r wlad. Gallai hynny arwain at arbed hyd at £200 miliwn dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Er enghraifft, bydd Cyfnewid Cymru yn cael ei ddarparu am ddim i bob ysgol yng Nghymru. Gallai hynny ar ei ben ei hun arbed hyd at £20 miliwn, a gellid ailfuddsoddi'r arian hwnnw yng nghyllidebau ysgolion a chyfleusterau ysgolion. Rhai o'r buddiannau fyddai llai o fiwrocratiaeth o lawer a thalu

taken for bills to be paid can be reduced to just four days through the use of the Welsh purchase card.

More broadly, I am delighted that the Welsh Assembly Government is the first organisation in Wales to advertise a contract reserved for supported businesses and factories. That gives companies like Remploy a real opportunity for the future.

Encouraging and supporting collaboration is vital. I am pleased that projects supported by the Making the Connections improvement fund are stimulating change and introducing better ways of working. For example, the North Wales Procurement Partnership and the recently expanded Welsh Purchasing Consortium are driving improved collaborative working across all local authorities in Wales.

I am particularly mindful of the impact that our procurement policies can have on the business community and SMEs in particular here in Wales. Nearly 50 per cent of the £5 billion that is spent every year on goods and services by the public sector in Wales is now won by companies with a base in Wales. This has increased by just over a third from a few years ago, and we are currently updating the study, so we should have more up-to-date figures shortly. However, businesses are still complaining to me that they are not able to compete for or access public procurement opportunities. This is an important matter. I have recently commissioned research to identify the issues and to make recommendations on how we can overcome them collectively in the public sector. That research will help to dispel the myths and to provide a focus on the substantive issues. The results will be known early next year.

I am delighted that all major public bodies in Wales have signed up to the 'Opening Doors' charter for SME-friendly procurement. That is good news, but the principles now need to be fully adopted in practice. The reality must match the rhetoric. Not enough low-value

biliau'n gyflymach—er enghraifft gellid cwtogi'r amser a gymer i dalu biliau i gyn lleied â phedwar diwrnod drwy ddefnyddio cerdyn prynu Cymru.

Yn fwy cyffredinol, yr wyf wrth fy modd mai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw'r sefydliad cyntaf yng Nghymru i hysbysebu contract sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer busnesau a ffatrioedd a gefnogir. Mae hynny'n rhoi gwir gyfle i gwmnïau fel Remploy yn y dyfodol.

Mae annog a chefnogi cydweithredu'n hollbwysig. Yr wyf yn falch bod prosiectau a gefnogir drwy gronfa gwella Creu'r Cysylltiadau yn sbarduno newid ac yn cyflwyno gwell ffyrdd o weithio. Er enghraifft, mae Partneriaeth Caffael Gogledd Cymru a Chonsortium Prynu Cymru sydd wedi'i ehangu'n ddiweddar yn sbarduno gwell cydweithio ar draws holl awdurdodau lleol Cymru.

Yr wyf yn cadw mewn cof yn arbennig y dylanwad y gall ein polisiau caffael ei gael ar y gymuned fusnes ac ar Fusnesau Bach a Chanolig yn benodol yma yng Nghymru. Mae bron 50 y cant o'r £5 biliwn a werir ar nwyddau a gwasanaethau bob blwyddyn gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn awr yn cael ei ennill gan gwmnïau sydd â chanolfan yng Nghymru. Mae hyn wedi cynyddu fymryn dros draean ers ychydig o flynyddoedd yn ôl, ac yr ydym wrthi'n diweddarau'r astudiaeth. Felly, dylai fod gennym ffigurau mwy diweddar cyn bo hir. Serch hynny, mae busnesau'n dal i gwyno wrthyf nad ydynt yn gallu cystadlu am gyfleoedd caffael cyhoeddus na chael llwybr atynt. Mae hwn yn fater o bwys. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu ymchwil yn ddiweddar i weld beth yw'r problemau ac i gynnig argymhellion ynglŷn â sut y gellir eu goresgyn gyda'n gilydd yn y sector cyhoeddus. Bydd y gwaith ymchwil hwnnw'n gymorth i chwalu'r chwedlau ac i ganolbwyntio ar y materion sydd o bwys. Bydd y canlyniadau ar gael ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod pob corff cyhoeddus mawr yng Nghymru wedi ymrwymo i siarter 'Agor Drysau' ar gyfer trefn gaffael sy'n deg i Fusnesau Bach a Chanolig. Mae hynny'n newyddion da, ond yn awr, rhaid mabwysiaidau'r egwyddorion

contract opportunities are advertised publicly or through the www.sell2wales.com website, and some organisations are not doing all they could to simplify their processes.

In the One Wales agreement, we committed to introducing an all-Wales purchasing code of practice. The Opening Doors Charter is the cornerstone of that code.

It is clear there is huge potential to realise improvement in public service delivery through our procurement policies. It is also clear that challenges remain, and we must focus on making sure that good practice becomes normal practice.

In conclusion, I hope that today's debate will recognise procurement as an important route to saving money, improving public services, and helping businesses to be successful in Wales.

David Melding: I propose amendment 1 in the name of William Graham. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the need to provide better training for procurement officers in the public sector so that more SMEs are encouraged to tender for public sector contracts.

The amendment focuses on the training of procurement officers. It is essential that we improve training so that it is part of the professional discipline to look at many of the issues that were raised by the Minister. We need to set more ambitious targets for what we intend to deliver through effective procurement.

To speak for a minute as the Chair of the Audit Committee, rather than as a frontbench opposition spokesman, the Wales Audit Office has a clear role in spreading good practice and holding events such as today's conference on fleet management, which I think will be a great success.

I want us to be as imaginative as possible. It is important that we increase procurement from companies based in Wales, and, in

yn llawn ar lefel ymarferol. Ni hysbysebir digon o gyfleoedd i gynnig am gontractau isel eu gwerth, nac yn gyhoeddus na thrwy wefan www.gwerthwchigymru.com, ac nid yw pob sefydliad yn gwneud popeth yn ei allu i symleiddio'u prosesau.

Yng Nghytundeb Cymru'n Un, ymrwymwyd i gyflwyno cod ymarfer i Gymru gyfan ar gyfer prynu. Y Siarter Agor Drysau yw conglfaen y cod hwnnw.

Mae'n amlwg bod potensial aruthrol i wella'r dull o gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy ein polisiau caffael. Mae hefyd yn amlwg bod heriau'n aros, a rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod arferion da'n dod yn arferion cyffredin.

I gloi, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y ddadl heddiw'n cydnabod bod caffael yn fodd pwysig i arbed arian, gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a helpu busnesau i lwyddo yng Nghymru.

David Melding: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw William Graham. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r angen i ddarparu hyfforddiant gwell i swyddogion caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus er mwyn annog rhagor o fusnesau bach a chanolig i dendro am gontractau sector cyhoeddus.

Mae'r gwelliant yn canolbwyntio ar hyfforddi swyddogion caffael. Mae'n hanfodol inni wella hyfforddiant fel mai rhan o'r ddisgyblaeth broffesiynol fydd ystyried llawer o'r materion a godwyd gan y Gweinidog. Mae angen inni osod targedau mwy uchelgeisiol ar gyfer yr hyn yr ydym yn bwriadu ei gyflawni drwy gaffael effeithiol.

A siarad am funud fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, yn hytrach na llefarydd ar fainc flaen yr wrthblaid, mae rôl bendant gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru o ran lledaenu arferion da a chynnal digwyddiadau fel y gynhadledd heddiw ar reoli fflydoedd, a fydd yn llwyddiant mawr, yr wyf yn credu.

Yr wyf am inni fod mor ddyfeisgar ag sy'n bosibl. Mae'n bwysig inni gael mwy o gaffael gan gwmnïau sydd wedi'u lleoli yng

particular, from the small and medium-sized enterprise sector. Could we have secondments from local government and other public bodies to the private sector, so that officials get to see the challenges of providing services and tendering for contracts? Interestingly, that is done by the European Commission. Perhaps we have something to learn there.

The Minister referred to the improvement in performance in terms of the number of contracts sourced from companies in Wales. The figure now stands at 50 per cent, up from the low 30s a few years ago. We need better data on this, but there has been improvement and progress and it is to be encouraged. However, looking at public services in England, I note that the UK Government is trying to set a target for public sector procurement of 30 per cent from the SME sector. Could we look at a similar type of policy in Wales? In an economic downturn, there is no doubt that the sector that is squeezed most is the SME sector, and it is often squeezed as larger companies, who are themselves looking to make savings, take longer to pay bills. The Minister is right to emphasise that best practice from the public sector in paying bills is crucial. If we engage more with SMEs, at least they would have that base of prompt payment from public bodies.

The Minister is right to look at the 'Making the Connections' agenda and how we get the maximum value for the Welsh pound. This has been a long-running objective, and our progress has been slow, but I accept the sincerity of the Government's aspirations. Indeed, the Beecham report emphasises the need to get maximum value for the Welsh pound.

However, as a result of the emergency budget that was delivered yesterday, I remind Members that in 2010-11 we will face a reduction in capital spending across the board. There is an attempt to bring capital spending forward, which will have the effect of reducing capital resources in the fiscal

Nghymru, ac, yn benodol, gan sector y busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. A allem gael secondiadau o lywodraeth leol a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill i'r sector preifat, fel y bydd swyddogion yn cael cyfle i weld yr heriau sy'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau a thendro am gontractau? Mae'n ddi-ddorol nodi bod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gwneud hynny. Efallai fod gennym ryw beth i'w ddysgu yn hynny o beth.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y gwelliant mewn perfformiad o ran nifer y contractau a wnaethpwyd â chwmnïau yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigur bellach yn 50 y cant, ar ôl codi o'r 30au isaf ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae arnom angen gwell data ar hyn, ond mae gwelliant a chynnydd wedi bod a dylid hyrwyddo hyn. Fodd bynnag, gan edrych ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn Lloegr, sylwaf fod Llywodraeth y DU yn ceisio gosod targed ar gyfer caffael ar ran y sector cyhoeddus i gael 30 y cant gan y sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. A allem ystyried polisi tebyg yng Nghymru? Yn ystod dirywiad economaidd, mae'n sicr mai'r sector sy'n dod dan y pwysau mwyaf yw'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, a chaiff ei wasgu'n aml wrth i gwmnïau mwy, sydd hwythau'n ceisio arbed, gymryd mwy o amser i dalu biliau. Mae'n briodol i'r Gweinidog bwysleisio bod yr arferion gorau ar ran y sector cyhoeddus wrth dalu biliau'n hollbwysig. Os ymgysylltw'n yn fwy â busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, o leiaf y byddent yn gallu dibynnu ar gael eu talu'n brydlon gan gyrff cyhoeddus.

Mae'n briodol i'r Gweinidog ystyried agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' a'r modd yr ydym yn cael y gwerth mwyaf am y bunt Gymreig. Mae hyn wedi bod yn amcan hir sefydlog, ac mae ein cynnydd wedi bod yn araf, ond yr wyf yn derbyn bod dyheadau'r Llywodraeth yn ddi-dwyll. Yn wir, mae adroddiad Beecham yn pwysleisio'r angen i gael y gwerth mwyaf am y bunt Gymreig.

Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i'r gyllideb frys a draddodwyd ddoe, yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau y byddwn yn wynebu gostyngiad cyffredinol mewn gwariant cyfalaf yn 2010-11. Mae ymgais i ddod â gwariant cyfalaf ymlaen, ac effaith hynny fydd lleihau adnoddau cyfalaf yn y blynyddoedd ariannol ar ôl 2010-11.

years after 2010-11. There will be a tightening of public spending as we try to get the deficit down, which will inevitably lead to some portfolios within the Welsh Assembly Government receiving decreases in their budgets. You may be able to preserve one or two of the budgets, and I am sure that you will attempt to do that in education and in health. However, in a tightening public spending round, we will have to get the maximum out of the spending that is available to us. Whatever happens and whichever Government is in power by 2010-11, public finances will have to be put in much better health. The Chancellor has told us that it could last until 2015. Whatever the economic outlook, and let us all hope that the recession is not quite as severe as some now predict, there will be a call for effective public spending so that we can do the maximum with what is available.

4.20 p.m.

The need for benchmarking is important. That should be between public bodies within Wales of a similar size, but, also, if the new public health bodies are set up, you will probably have to look, on a European-wide basis, for appropriate benchmarking with organisations that face similar challenges. Across the UK, we are not always as skilful as we should be in developing those comparators.

I finish by commending the EU's Small Business Act. It is a bit of a misnomer, as it is not an Act, but it tries to put small businesses first in procurement and also emphasises that we do not face iron regulations from the European Community in encouraging small businesses to tender. We cannot reserve and we cannot nobble the system. If we open procurement up for small businesses, that has to be on a European-wide level, but it will usually be local small businesses that will apply.

Jenny Randerson: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with caution that efficiency-savings and

Bydd gwasgu ar wariant cyhoeddus wrth inni geisio lleihau'r diffyg, a fydd yn sicr o arwain at ostwng cyllidebau rhai o'r portffolios yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Efallai y byddwch yn gallu cadw un neu ddwy o'r cyllidebau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y ceisiwch wneud hynny ym meysydd addysg ac iechyd. Er hynny, yn ystod cylch gwariant cyhoeddus tynnach, bydd yn rhaid inni gael y mwyaf o'r gwariant sydd ar gael i ni. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd a pha bynnag Lywodraeth a fydd mewn grym erbyn 2010-11, bydd yn rhaid gwella'r sefyllfa ariannol gyhoeddus yn sylweddol. Mae'r Canghellor wedi dweud wrthym y gallai bara tan 2015. Beth bynnag yw'r rhagolygon economaidd, a gadewch inni oll obeithio nad yw'r dirwasgiad mor ddifrifol ag y mae rhai'n proffwydo bellach, bydd galw am wariant cyhoeddus effeithiol fel y gallwn wneud y mwyaf â'r hyn sydd ar gael.

Mae'r angen am feincnodi'n bwysig. Dylai hynny fod rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus o fewn Cymru sydd o faint tebyg, ond, hefyd, os sefydlir y cyrff iechyd cyhoeddus newydd, mae'n debyg y byddwch yn gorfod chwilio, ar draws Ewrop, am feincnodi priodol â chyrrff sy'n wynebu heriau tebyg. Ledled y DU, nid ydym bob amser mor fedrus ag y dylem fod wrth ddatblygu'r cymaryddion hynny.

Terfynaf drwy gymeradwyo Deddf Busnesau Bach yr UE. Mae'r enw'n gamarweiniol braidd, gan nad yw'n Ddeddf, ond mae'n ceisio rhoi busnesau bach yn gyntaf o ran caffael ac mae hefyd yn pwysleisio nad ydym yn wynebu rheoliadau haearnaidd o eiddo'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd wrth annog busnesau bach i dendro. Ni allwn neilltuo dim ac ni allwn ymyrryd â'r system. Os byddwn yn cynnig cyfle i gaffael gan fusnesau bach, rhaid gwneud hynny ledled Ewrop, ond busnesau bach lleol a fydd yn ymgeisio fel arfer.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi â rhybudd y gall arbedion

cost-cutting measures can cause the public sector to enter into larger contracts which may not necessarily benefit Welsh SMEs.

effeithlonrwydd a mesurau arbed costau arwain y sector cyhoeddus i fynd am gontractau mwy na fyddant o reidrwydd o fudd i fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.

Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

believes that public procurement can present a shared opportunity to make a difference to people's lives during the coming recession.

yn credu y gall caffael cyhoeddus gyflwyno cyfle a rennir i wneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau pobl yn ystod y dirwasgiad sydd ar ddod.

Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to use public procurement procedures to maximise investment in energy efficiency measures which will help reduce the number of fuel poor households in Wales.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddefnyddio gweithdrefnau caffael cyhoeddus i gynyddu buddsoddiad mewn mesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni a fydd yn helpu i leihau nifer yr aelwydydd sy'n dlawd o ran tanwydd yng Nghymru.

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the public procurement process takes into account the environmental credentials of contractors.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y broses caffael cyhoeddus yn ystyried cymwysterau amgylcheddol contractwyr.

I wish to address amendment 2 specifically. I draw attention to what is a contradiction between the title of the debate, which refers to a sustainable procurement process, and the definition of smarter, more efficient and effective public procurement as generally applied by the Welsh Assembly Government.

Dymunaf roi sylw i welliant 2 yn benodol. Tynnaf sylw at y gwrth-ddweud rhwng teitl y ddadl, sy'n cyfeirio at broses gaffael gynaliadwy, a'r diffiniad o gaffael cyhoeddus sy'n graffach ac yn fwy effeithlon ac effeithiol a ddefnyddir fel arfer gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

I also draw attention to the yawning gap between rhetoric and reality seen by local authorities, in particular, throughout Wales. In order to do that, I will tell you the story of a local stationery supplier in my constituency, which used to supply stationery to a council's department. This is a small local firm. The owner came to me to complain that he had lost the contract to supply stationery because, in line with the Minister's directives and urgings to save money in procurement, the council had decided to have one contract for stationery for the whole council. The firm was unable to supply enough stationery to fulfil the needs of the whole council and therefore lost an

Tynnaf sylw hefyd at y bwlch mawr rhwng rhethreg a realiti a welir gan awdurdodau lleol. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, dywedaf wrthy ch hanes cyflenwr defnyddiau ysgrifennu lleol yn fy etholaeth, a arferai gyflenwi defnyddiau ysgrifennu i un o adrannau'r cyngor. Cwmni lleol bach yw hwn. Daeth y perchennog ataf i gwyno ei fod wedi colli'r contract am fod y cyngor wedi penderfynu cael un contract ar gyfer defnyddiau ysgrifennu i'r cyngor cyfan, yn unol â chyfarwyddiadau ac anogaethau'r Gweinidog i arbed arian wrth gaffael. Nid oedd y cwmni'n gallu cyflenwi digon o ddefnyddiau ysgrifennu i fodloni anghenion y cyngor cyfan ac, felly, collodd gontract

important contract. What chance therefore will small local businesses have when councils in south Wales move to procuring stationery on a consortium basis? I would say that the chances of any Welsh business being able to meet the requirements would be small.

The next point that I wish to make is that progress is slow. Government thinking about what is sustainable is moving slowly. There are real opportunities to develop a sustainable approach to procurement, particularly by taking transport distances as a key factor.

Let us look for a moment at school food. Members will know that I am pursuing a Measure to introduce healthy school food, yet the responses that I get from Government seek to limit the aspect in that Measure looking at the local procurement of food. I regard that as an important aspect of sustainability. Food miles are important in relation to the sustainability of food supply, and yet the Government is exceptionally cautious about this approach and has sought to reduce the impact of that aspect of the proposed Measure.

Also on the gap between the rhetoric and the reality, in his briefing to us, the Minister refers to the shared services project between 10 local authorities in south Wales. That project is very much in its infancy, and it is not without its problems. As the project is currently drafted, those local authorities would see savings in their budget after seven years. What local authority is going to look at an efficiency project that might produce savings after seven years? I know that several of the local authorities involved have serious reservations about the feasibility of this project on that basis. Local authorities can be expected to look ahead up to four years, but having to wait seven years for efficiency savings will not reap any great harvest.

I will finish with a story about Swansea council, which, as part of a general landscaping scheme, wanted to put up

pwysig. Pa gyfle a fydd gan fusnesau lleol bach, felly, pan fydd cynghorau yn ne Cymru'n dechrau caffael defnyddiau ysgrifennu drwy gonsortiwim? Dywedwn mai ychydig o obaith a fyddai gan unrhyw fusnes yng Nghymru o allu cwrdd â'r gofynion.

Y pwynt nesaf y dymunaf ei wneud yw bod y cynnydd yn araf. Mae meddwl y Llywodraeth am yr hyn sy'n gynaliadwy'n symud ymlaen yn araf. Mae cyfleoedd gwirioneddol i ddatblygu dull cynaliadwy o gaffael, yn enwedig drwy gymryd pellteroedd teithio'n ffactor allweddol.

Gadewch inni edrych am eiliad ar fwyd mewn ysgolion. Bydd Aelodau'n gwybod fy mod yn ceisio sicrhau Mesur i gyflwyno bwyd iach mewn ysgolion, ac eto mae'r ymatebion a gaf gan y Llywodraeth yn ceisio cyfyngu'r agwedd yn y Mesur hwnnw sy'n ymwneud â chaffael bwyd yn lleol. Yr wyf yn ystyried hynny'n agwedd bwysig ar gynaliadwyedd. Mae milltiroedd bwyd yn bwysig o ran cynaliadwyedd y cyflenwad bwyd, ac eto mae'r Llywodraeth yn eithriadol o ochelgar ynghylch y dull gweithredu hwn ac mae wedi ceisio lleihau effaith yr agwedd honno ar y Mesur arfaethedig.

Hefyd ynghylch y bwlch rhwng y rhyngwladol a realiti, yn y wybodaeth y mae'n ei rhoi i ni, mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at y prosiect gwasanaethau ar y cyd rhwng 10 awdurdod lleol yn ne Cymru. Mae'r prosiect hwnnw yn dal yn ei ddyddiau cynnar i raddau helaeth, ac nid yw heb ei broblemau. Fel y mae'r prosiect wedi'i ddrafftio ar hyn o bryd, byddai'r awdurdodau lleol hynny'n gweld arbedion yn eu cyllideb ar ôl saith mlynedd. Pa awdurdod lleol a wnaiff edrych ar brosiect effeithlonrwydd a allai ddod ag arbedion ar ôl saith mlynedd? Gwn fod amheuan mawr gan nifer o'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gysylltiedig ynghylch pa mor ymarferol yw'r prosiect hwn ar y sail honno. Gellir disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol edrych ymlaen hyd at bedair blynedd, ond ni fydd gorfod disgwyl saith mlynedd am arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn dod â budd mawr o gwbl.

Gorffennaf â hanes am gyngor Abertawe, a oedd, fel rhan o gynllun tirlunio cyffredinol, yn dymuno codi barrau ar hyd glannau afon

railings along the banks of the River Tawe to stop people from falling in. The council already has a partnership with tendered rates for this type of work. The tendering was done, and the council wanted to go ahead with the work, but Welsh Assembly Government officials said, 'No; put that on stop. You have to retender as part of the procurement exercise and part of Best Value rules'. As a result, the project has been delayed until next year and it could well face serious problems as match funding may not be available next year. Is that an efficient way ahead? Your intentions are good, Minister, but there is a serious gap between the rhetoric and the reality.

Joyce Watson: Small businesses and entrepreneurship are the backbone of the mid and west Wales economy. The majority of these businesses employ 10 people or fewer and do not have the capacity that larger companies have to source contracts. That is why Value Wales is so important, as it is the central point of contact for small businesses and public sector organisations, and it benefits everyone. It promotes value for money in the public sector and it helps Welsh businesses to secure contracts.

In Carmarthenshire, for example, procurement surgeries and events held over the past few years have been hugely successful. I think that the Tories' gloomy amendment is unfounded. In my experience, the procurement officers of Carmarthenshire are very effective, and the Meet the Buyer events that they have organised with Value Wales have helped hundreds of local businesses to secure contracts and to safeguard jobs and create new ones.

We heard from the Liberals about concern about the public sector looking to make efficiency savings and the effect that such savings may have on Welsh SMEs. Those Liberals who represent Powys should make representations to Powys County Council on the payment of its bills, given that it has the second worst record in Wales for paying businesses on time, and that at a time when

Tawe i atal pobl rhag disgyn i mewn. Mae gan y cyngor bartneriaeth eisoes gyda chyfraddau wedi'u tendro ar gyfer gwaith o'r math hwn. Cwblhawyd y tendro, ac yr oedd y cyngor am fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith, ond dywedodd swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, 'Nage; rhowch y gorau i hynny. Rhaid ichi aildendro fel rhan o'r ymarferiad caffael ac fel rhan o reolau Gwerth Gorau'. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae'r prosiect wedi'i ohirio tan y flwyddyn nesaf ac mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd yn wynebu problemau difrifol gan ei bod yn bosibl na fydd arian cyfatebol ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf. A yw hynny'n ffordd effeithlon ymlaen? Mae'ch bwriadau'n dda, Weinidog, ond mae bwloch mawr rhwng y rhethreg a realiti.

Joyce Watson: Busnesau bach ac entrepreneuriaeth yw asgwrn cefn economi canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r busnesau hyn yn cyflogi 10 o bobl neu lai ac nid oes ganddynt yr un gallu â chwmnïau mwy i ennill contractau. Dyna pam y mae Gwerth Cymru mor bwysig, fel y mae'r pwynt cyswllt canolog ar gyfer busnesau bach a chyrrff y sector cyhoeddus, ac mae o fudd i bawb. Mae'n hybu gwerth am arian yn y sector cyhoeddus ac mae'n helpu busnesau yng Nghymru i sicrhau contractau.

Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, er enghraifft, mae cymorthfeydd a digwyddiadau caffael a gynhaliwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben. Credaf fod gwelliant diobaith y Torïaid yn ddi-sail. Yn ôl fy mhrofiad i, mae swyddogion caffael sir Gaerfyrddin yn effeithiol iawn, ac mae'r digwyddiadau Cwrdd â'r Prynwr y maent wedi'u trefnu gyda Gwerth Cymru wedi helpu cannoedd o fusnesau lleol i sicrhau contractau a diogelu swyddi a chreu rhai newydd.

Clywsom gan y Rhyddfrydwyr am bryder ynghylch ymgais y sector cyhoeddus i wneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd a'r effaith bosibl o arbedion o'r fath ar fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru. Dylai'r Rhyddfrydwyr hynny sy'n cynrychioli Powys gyflwyno sylwadau i Gyngor Sir Powys ynghylch talu ei filiau, gan mai ef sydd â'r record ail waethaf yng Nghymru am dalu

they need the money in the bank the most.

busnesau'n brydlon, a hynny ar adeg pan fo arnynt y mwyaf o angen cael arian yn y banc.

We should not discourage the public sector from spending wisely, especially given the current economic conditions. It is important, however, that Welsh businesses are given every opportunity to compete for contracts. The first Wales economic summit decided that small domestic businesses should benefit from the Labour Government's decision to fast-track £3 billion of capital spending by tailoring suitable contracts to fit our small businesses. What progress has been made on that, Minister? How is the Assembly Government working with the UK Government, together with local authorities and organisations like Value Wales, to ensure that Welsh small and medium-sized enterprises benefit from the Labour Government's fiscal stimulus?

Ni ddylem geisio atal y sector cyhoeddus rhag gwario'n ddoeth, yn enwedig a chofio'r amodau economaidd presennol. Mae'n bwysig, er hynny, i fusnesau yng Nghymru gael pob cyfle i gystadlu am contractau. Yn yr uwchgynhadledd economaidd gyntaf i Gymru, penderfynwyd y dylai busnesau domestig bach gael budd o benderfyniad y Llywodraeth Lafur i roi gwerth £3 biliwn o wariant cyfalaf ar y trywydd cyflym drwy baratoi contractau addas ar gyfer ein busnesau bychain. Pa gynnydd a wnaethpwyd yn hynny o beth, Weinidog? Sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU, ynghyd ag awdurdodau lleol a chyirff megis Gwerth Cymru, i sicrhau y bydd busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn elwa o ysgogiad ariannol y Llywodraeth Lafur?

4.30 p.m.

Small businesses in Wales have good reason to feel optimistic; yesterday's pre-budget report delivered relief for businesses and families across the country. The temporary cut in VAT will increase business, and the deferral of the planned increase in small companies' corporation tax comes at the right time. The same is true of the £1 billion export credit guarantee scheme, the decision to provide more generous tax relief for businesses suffering losses and the introduction of the new HM Revenue and Customs business payment support service, which will help businesses that are temporarily having difficulty paying their bill.

Mae gan fusnesau bychain Cymru le i deimlo'n optimistaidd; rhoes yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ddoe ryddhad i fusnesau a theuluoedd ar draws y wlad. Bydd y toriad dros dro mewn TAW yn cynyddu busnes, ac mae'r gohirio ar y cynnydd arfaethedig yn nhreth gorfforaethol y cwmnïau bach wedi ei wneud ar yr adeg iawn. Felly hefyd y cynllun gwarantu credyd allforio gwerth £1 biliwn, y penderfyniad i roi rhyddhad trethi mwy helaeth i fusnesau sy'n gwneud colledion a chyflwyno gwasanaeth cymorth taliadau busnes Cyllid a Thollau ei Mawrhydi, a fydd yn helpu busnesau sy'n cael anhawster talu eu biliau dros dro.

It is right that we are working closely with the Labour Government at Westminster on these nationwide solutions to the local economic storm. What discussions has the Minister had with International Business Wales on the creation of the transition fund to secure private sector funding for viable businesses with short-term funding issues? How long will it be until it is up and running in Wales?

Mae'n deg ein bod yn cydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth Lafur San Steffan ar yr atebion hyn ledled y wlad i'r storm economaidd leol. Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Gweinidog gyda Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru ynglŷn â chreu cronfa drosiannol i sicrhau arian sector preifat ar gyfer busnesau hyfyw sy'n wynebu trafferthion yn y tymor byr? Faint o amser a gymer i'w sefydlu yng Nghymru a'i rhoi ar waith?

Mick Bates: I will use my contribution to flag up three important issues. The first,

Mick Bates: Yr wyf am ddefnyddio'r amser sydd gennyf i godi tri mater pwysig. Mae'r

which is reflected in amendment 3, is a point of principle. The second, reflected in amendment 4, is a practical solution, which has been piloted in Powys. The third ensures that green credentials become part of the procurement process.

I acknowledge the aspirations of the Minister and his Cabinet colleagues to promote local public procurement. It is a stated aim in 'One Wales', and I support that principle, but I believe that we need more integration across ministerial portfolios if we are to succeed. The principle embodied in amendment 3 is that we can use public procurement during this recession to make a difference to people's lives. I would like to target the misery that is caused by fuel poverty in Wales. According to the latest estimates from National Energy Action Cymru's, there are 340,000 households in Wales in fuel poverty. It seems to me that public procurement is a vehicle by which we could assist in the alleviation of fuel poverty. One of NEAC's chief aims is to do just that. It is also campaigning for a new, cross-departmental ministerial fuel poverty task group. I have written to the Cabinet, via the First Minister, to suggest that such a group is set up, and that there should be an enhanced role for local authorities in helping to combat fuel poverty.

The principle of sustainability, which embodies social justice, economic stability and environmental improvement, can be applied to public procurement, as we suggest in amendment 4. It can be used to maximise investment in energy efficiency. Powys County Council had an excellent scheme, recognised throughout Wales as an exemplar of public procurement principles, which reduced fuel poverty while acknowledging that it could make a contribution to reducing carbon emissions. To quote from a Welsh Local Government Association case study:

'the Carbon Dioxide Initiative (CO2i) is a partnership between Powys County Council, an energy supplier and specialist contractors. It is a practical package of energy efficient improvements designed to improve the health and wellbeing of householders by having warmer homes, and homes that are cheaper to

cyntaf, a adlewyrchir yng ngwelliant 3, yn bwynt o egwyddor. Mae'r ail, a adlewyrchir yng ngwelliant 4, yn ateb ymarferol, sydd wedi ei dreialu ym Mhowys. Mae'r trydydd yn sicrhau y bydd ystyriaethau gwyrdd yn dod yn rhan o'r broses gaffael.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod y dyheadau sydd gan y Gweinidog a'i gydweithwyr yn y Cabinet i hybu caffael cyhoeddus lleol. Mae'n un o nodau 'Cymru'n Un', ac yr wyf yn cefnogi'r egwyddor honno, ond os ydym am lwyddo, credaf fod angen mwy o integreiddio ar bethau ar draws portffolios y Gweinidogion. Mae a wnelo'r egwyddor a geir yn egwyddor 3 â defnyddio caffael cyhoeddus yn ystod y dirwasgiad hwn i wneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau pobl. Hoffwn dargedu'r trallod a achosir gan tlodi tanwydd yng Nghymru. Yn ôl amcangyfrifon diweddaraf National Energy Action Cymru, mae 340,000 o aelwydydd yng Nghymru mewn tlodi tanwydd. Ymddengys imi y gallai caffael cyhoeddus fod yn fodd i gynorthwyo i liniaru tlodi tanwydd. Dyna un o brif nodau NEAC. Mae hefyd yn ymgyrchu dros sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl gweinidogol, trawsadrannol newydd. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Cabinet, drwy'r Prif Weinidog, gan awgrymu y dylid sefydlu grŵp o'r fath, ac y dylid cryfhau rôl yr awdurdodau lleol parthed helpu i frwydro'n erbyn tlodi tanwydd.

Mae modd cymhwyso egwyddor cynaliadwyedd, sy'n ymgorffori cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, sefydlogrwydd economaidd a gwella'r amgylchedd, i gaffael cyhoeddus, fel yr awgrymwn yng ngwelliant 4. Mae modd ei defnyddio i wneud yn fawr o'r buddsoddiad mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni. Yr oedd gan Gyngor Sir Powys gynllun rhagorol, a gydnabyddir ledled Cymru fel patrwm o ran egwyddorion caffael cyhoeddus, a fu'n lleihau tlodi tanwydd gan gydnabod y gallai wneud cyfraniad at leihau allyriadau carbon. A dyfynnu o astudiaeth achos gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru:

partneriaeth yw'r Fenter Carbon Deuocsid (CO2i) rhwng Cyngor Sir Powys, cyflenwr ynni a chontractwyr arbenigol. Pecyn ymarferol ydyw o welliannau sy'n effeithlon o ran ynni sydd wedi eu cynllunio i wella iechyd a lles y deiliaid tai drwy sicrhau cartrefi cynhesach, a chartrefi sy'n rhatach

heat. The scheme also reduces carbon emissions’.

The funding for this scheme came mainly from the council, but was also supported by the Government and energy companies. If there is any way that public procurement can be used throughout Wales on this model, then you should look at it, Minister; so many of the ‘One Wales’ targets would come together in such a scheme. The principles of the scheme, and its outcomes, reflect many of those targets, not only in the overall strategy to reduce carbon emissions, but also in reducing fuel poverty. At the same time, it can improve local businesses. Much is made of small and medium-sized enterprises, but when I looked at Construct Wales, construction skills and supply chain management documents, no reference was made to greening those sectors, recognising in protocols that companies with greening credentials, which could create green jobs to meet the green strategy, would also be part of this.

Finally, given that Construct Wales is there to get rid of inefficiencies and waste in business, it would be great if its environmental credentials could also match the effectiveness of its business. That would provide a way of looking for approved suppliers that could guarantee that they would fit microgeneration or insulation in homes according to the principles embodied in our supply chain management and Construct Wales skills.

I urge the Government to support amendments 3, 4 and 5, which offer a magnificent opportunity to undertake truly sustainable procurement in Wales.

Leanne Wood: I will focus my contribution on the opportunities that public bodies have for the sustainable procurement of food in particular, because the politics of food is becoming increasingly important.

There are a huge number of opportunities in this area to contribute to different policy goals, because locally procured food helps to sustain local economies, and money has a

i’w cynhesu. Mae’r cynllun hefyd yn lleihau allyriadau carbon.

Ariannwyd y cynllun hwn gan y cyngor yn bennaf, ond fe’i cefnogwyd gan y Llywodraeth a chan gwmnïau ynni hefyd. Petai modd defnyddio caffael cyhoeddus ledled Cymru ar sail y model hwn, yna dylech ei ystyried, Weinidog; byddai cynifer o dargedau ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn cael eu dwyn ynghyd yn y fath gynllun. Mae egwyddorion y cynllun, a’i ganlyniadau, yn adlewyrchu llawer o’r targedau hynny, nid yn unig yn y strategaeth gyffredinol i leihau allyriadau carbon, ond hefyd o ran lleihau tldi tanwydd. Ar yr un pryd, gall wella busnesau lleol. Mae llawer o sôn am fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, ond pan edrychais ar Adeiladu Cymru, o ran sgiliau adeiladu a dogfennau rheoli’r gadwyn gyflenwi, nid oedd sôn am wneud y sectorau hynny’n fwy gwyrdd, a chydabod mewn protocolau y byddai cwmnïau sydd ag enw da am fod yn wyrdd, a allai greu swyddi gwyrdd i gyflawni’r strategaeth werdd, yn rhan o hyn hefyd.

Yn olaf, a chofio mai pwrpas Adeiladu Cymru yw dileu aneffeithlonrwydd a gwastraff mewn busnes, byddai’n wych o beth pe gallai fod yr un mor effeithiol yn amgylcheddol ag yw’n effeithiol o ran ei fusnes. Byddai hynny’n fodd i chwilio am gyflenwyr cymeradwy a allai warantu y byddent yn gosod dulliau meicrogynhyrchu neu insiwleiddio cartrefi’n unol â’r egwyddorion a ymgorfforir yn ein rheolaeth dros y gadwyn gyflenwi a sgiliau Adeiladu Cymru.

Yr wyf yn annog y Llywodraeth i gefnogi gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5, sy’n rhoi cyfle gwych i sicrhau caffael gwirioneddol gynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar y cyfleoedd sydd gan gyrff cyhoeddus yn neilltuol i gaffael bwyd yn gynaliadwy, oherwydd mae gwleidyddiaeth bwyd yn mynd yn gynyddol bwysig.

Mae llawer iawn o gyfleoedd yn y maes hwn i gyfrannu at wahanol nodau polisi, oherwydd mae caffael bwyd yn lleol yn helpu cynnal economïau lleol, ac mae’n llawer

much greater chance of remaining and multiplying within a local economy if it is spent in a local shop as opposed to a supermarket chain. Locally produced food, if grown organically or, even better, according to the principles of permaculture, is healthier. I know that there is a debate as to whether or not pesticides that are used on food are harmful, but there seems to be evidence of a link between certain health problems and the chemicals that are used in food production. For example, we know from the recent case brought by Georgina Downs that chemicals can cause serious problems. In addition, there are concerns about the growing obesity epidemic, and we know that fresh fruit and vegetables in a diet can contribute to reducing that problem. Locally procured food cuts down on the carbon emissions that come with food travel, usually transported by lorry over long distances. In the current climate crisis, the value of carbon-free or low-carbon food cannot be overestimated.

However, I have a number of questions. How many of our schools, hospitals, prisons, care homes and other public services use locally procured food at the moment? What percentage of food consumed by people using our public services is procured and produced locally? Are public sector contracts small enough to enable and encourage local producers to bid for and win those contracts? How does the power of the supermarkets impact on local procurement, and can anything be done to limit the effect of that power? In other words, can the rules be drawn up in a different way, in order to support and promote local food production and public sector procurement?

Supermarkets and other non-local companies are very powerful, and have a lot of financial clout. It is often very difficult for local producers to compete with them. There has to be a will to take them on and to challenge their power in the market, and to create the conditions for small local producers to flourish.

mwy tebygol y bydd yr arian yn aros ac yn lluosogi yn yr economi lleol os caiff ei wario mewn siop leol yn hytrach nag mewn siopau cadwyn yr archfarchnadoedd. Mae bwyd sydd wedi ei gynhyrchu'n lleol, os yw wedi ei dyfu'n organig, neu'n well byth, yn unol ag egwyddorion permaddiwylliant, yn iachach. Gwn fod dadlau a yw'r plaladdwyr a ddefnyddir ar fwyd yn niweidiol ai peidio, ond ymddengys fod tystiolaeth bod cysylltiad rhwng rhai problemau iechyd a'r cemegau a ddefnyddir i gynhyrchu bwyd. Er enghraifft, gwn o'r achos a ddygwyd yn ddiweddar gan Georgina Downs y gall cemegau beri problemau difrifol. Hefyd, mae pryderon ynghylch yr epidemig gordewdra cynyddol, a gwyddom fod ffrwythau a llysiau ffres yn ein deiet yn gallu helpu i leihau'r broblem honno. Mae caffael bwyd yn lleol yn allyriadau carbon deuocsid a achosir oherwydd bod y bwyd yn teithio, yn cael ei gludo mewn lorïau fel arfer dros bellter hir. Yn yr argyfwng sy'n wynebu ein hinsawdd ar hyn o bryd, nid oes modd gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd bwyd di-garbon a bwyd sy'n isel o ran carbon.

Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf nifer o gwestiynau. Faint o'n hysgolion, ein hysbytai, ein carchardai, ein cartrefi gofal gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill sy'n defnyddio bwyd sydd wedi ei gaffael yn lleol ar hyn o bryd? Pa ganran o'r bwyd a fwyteir gan y bobl sy'n defnyddio ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei gaffael a'i gynhyrchu'n lleol? A yw contractau'r sector cyhoeddus yn ddigon bach i alluogi ac i annog cynhyrchwyr lleol i ymgeisio am y contractau hynny a'u hennill? Sut mae grym yr archfarchnadoedd yn effeithio ar gaffael lleol ac a yw'n bosibl gwneud rhywbeth i gyfyngu effaith y grym hwnnw? Mewn geiriau eraill, a oes modd ail-lunio'r rheolau, er mwyn cefnogi a hybu cynhyrchu bwyd yn lleol a chaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus?

Mae archfarchnadoedd a chwmnïau eraill nad ydynt yn lleol yn rymus iawn, ac mae eu dylanwad ariannol yn fawr. Yn aml mae'n anodd iawn i gynhyrchwyr lleol gystadlu gyda hwy. Mae'n rhaid meithrin ewyllys i fynd i'r afael â hwy a herio'r grym sydd ganddynt yn y farchnad, a chreu amodau a fydd yn galluogi cynhyrchwyr bach lleol i ffynnu.

David Melding mentioned the tightening of the budget for public services in future years—I am referring to the efficiency cuts that were announced in yesterday's pre-budget report. They will put pressure on public services to opt for the cheapest contract, and we all know that the cheapest is not necessarily the best quality, and it often does not mean locally produced. Those efficiency savings—perhaps we should call them by their real name, because they will be public spending cuts—in future years will present a real challenge for local procurement and for small contracts.

4.40 p.m.

Therefore, I would be interested to know whether this issue is being considered by the Government—I know that I may be asking a lot, given that the announcement was only made yesterday—and whether the Government's plans for developing and expanding local procurement will be impacted by these future public expenditure cuts.

Alun Davies: A £5 billion intervention in an economy the size of Wales's is a major intervention in anybody's book. There will be agreement across the Chamber that it is crucial that this intervention is used strategically. For me, that means that it should be used to promote and create a context for the sustainability and working practices of Welsh businesses, promoting business opportunities in Wales. I very much welcome the moves made not only by the Government that was elected last year, but by the previous Government, in creating Value Wales, providing new opportunities to add value to the Welsh economy and for businesses to compete for and, crucially, to win public procurement opportunities. I also welcome the way in which the Government has promoted policies that improve efficiency, deliver best value for the taxpayer and increase collaboration between public bodies. If we are to use the procurement budget that is available to public bodies, those principles are absolutely essential. Even with the Melding squeeze that we will no doubt see over the coming years, public

Cyfeiriodd David Melding at y ffaith y bydd cyllideb y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn dynnach yn y dyfodol—cyfeiriaf at yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd a gyhoeddwyd yn yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol ddoe. Byddant yn dwyn pwysau ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i ddewis y contract rhatach, a gwyddom oll nad y rhatach yw'r ansawdd gorau o angenrheidrwydd, ac yn aml nid yw'n gynnyrch lleol. Bydd yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny—efallai y dylem roi eu henw go iawn arnynt, oherwydd mai toriadau mewn gwarian cyhoeddus a fyddant—at y dyfodol yn her wirioneddol i gaffael lleol ac i gontractau bach.

Felly, hoffwn wybod a yw'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried y mater hwn—gwn o bosibl fy mod yn gofyn llawer, ac ystyried mai ddoe y gwnaethpwyd y cyhoeddiad—ac a yw'r toriadau hyn mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn mynd i effeithio ar y cynlluniau sydd gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer datblygu ac ehangu caffael lleol.

Alun Davies: Byddai pawb yn cytuno bod ymyriad gwerth £5 biliwn mewn economi o faint un Cymru'n ymyriad mawr. Bydd pawb yn cytuno ar draws y Siambr ei bod yn hollbwysig defnyddio'r ymyriad hwn yn strategol. I mi, mae hynny'n golygu y dylid ei ddefnyddio i hybu a chreu cyd-destun ar gyfer cynaliadwyedd ac arferion gwaith busnesau Cymru, gan hybu cyfleoedd busnes yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr y symudiadau a wnaethpwyd nid yn unig gan y Llywodraeth a etholwyd y llynedd, ond gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol hefyd, o ran creu Gwerth Cymru, sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd newydd i ychwanegu gwerth at economi Cymru ac i fusnesau allu cystadlu am gyfleoedd caffael cyhoeddus a'u hennill fel sy'n hollbwysig. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch iawn o'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi hybu polisiau sy'n gwella effeithlonrwydd, yn sicrhau gwerth gorau i'r trethdalwyr ac yn cynyddu cydweithrediad rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus. Os ydym am ddefnyddio'r gyllideb gaffael sydd ar gael i gyrff cyhoeddus, mae'r egwyddorion hynny'n gwbl hanfodol. Hyd yn oed dan y wasgfa y

procurement intervention in the Welsh economy will remain a significant tool for us in moulding the economy.

I welcome the fact that the development of these policies over previous years has meant that nearly half of all public contracts in Wales are awarded to businesses operating in Wales, and that the Welsh public purse is directly responsible for sustaining nearly 100,000 jobs in Wales. That represents a major policy instrument. In moving procurement policy forward, the move to regional contracting has enabled more small and medium-sized businesses to win Government contracts. Twenty-four per cent of the food used in the Welsh public sector now comes from Wales, representing a significant increase—of about a quarter—over the last four years. That is a significant way of delivering direct support to the food production sector. I hope that we will be able to continue to move in that direction and continue to support small and medium-sized enterprises.

I know from my own experience of running a business, and as someone who once sought contracts from the Assembly Government and other public bodies, how difficult the process used to be. I remember thinking, ‘Do I spend a week trying to leap through some of these hoops or do I seek private sector contracts?’; that was an entirely different and easier process. I recognise that the system has now changed and that it is far easier for small and medium-sized enterprises to win Government and public body contracts.

I will conclude my remarks with a plea to the Government to ensure that its policies, as well as its budget, continue to create a context for Welsh businesses, making Wales a secure place for innovation. The power of Government spending must be harnessed to stimulate and create demand for new and innovative products and services. We all agree that public procurement can play a key role in encouraging new and different ways of providing solutions in the delivery of better public services. If we are serious about

cyfeiriodd Melding ati yr ydym yn siŵr o'i phrofi dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, bydd ymyrryd yn economi Cymru ar ffurf caffael cyhoeddus yn dal yn arf o bwys inni o ran siapio'r economi.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod datblygu'r polisiau hyn dros y blynyddoedd a fu'n golygu bod bron hanner holl gontractau cyhoeddus Cymru'n cael eu rhoddi i fusnesau sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru, a bod pwrs cyhoeddus Cymru'n uniongyrchol gyfrifol am gynnal bron 100,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru. Mae hwnnw'n arf sylweddol o ran polisi. O ran symud y polisi caffael yn ei flaen, mae dyfodiad y contractau rhanbarthol wedi bod yn fodd i fwy o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ennill contractau gan y Llywodraeth. Bellach mae pedwar ar hugain y cant o'r bwyd a ddefnyddir yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n dod o Gymru, sy'n gynnydd mawr—tua chwarter—dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Dyna ffordd bwysig o roi cymorth uniongyrchol i'r sector cynhyrchu bwyd. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu parhau i symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw a pharhau i gefnogi busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint.

Gwn o brofiad personol o redeg busnes, ac fel rhywun a arferai geisio contractau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a chan gyrff cyhoeddus eraill, pa mor anodd yr arferai'r broses fod. Cofiaf feddwl, ‘A ddylwn dreulio wythnos yn ceisio neidio dros rai o'r clwydi hyn neu a ddylwn chwilio am gontractau o'r sector preifat?’; yr oedd y broses honno'n gwbl wahanol ac yn haws. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod y system wedi newid bellach a'i bod yn llawer haws i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ennill contractau gan y Llywodraeth a chyrrff cyhoeddus.

Yr wyf am gloi fy sylwadau gyda phle i'r Llywodraeth sicrhau y bydd ei pholisiau, yn ogystal â'i chyllideb, yn parhau i greu cydestun ar gyfer busnesau Cymru, gan wneud Cymru'n lle diogel ar gyfer arloesedd. Rhaid defnyddio grym gwariant y Llywodraeth i ysgogi ac i greu galw am gynhyrchion a gwasanaethau newydd ac arloesol. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno y gall caffael cyhoeddus chwarae rhan allweddol i symbylu ffyrdd newydd a gwahanol o ddarparu atebion parthed cyflawni gwasanaethau cyhoeddus

the green jobs strategy that we saw last week, and if we are serious about delivering clear and innovative policies on climate change, for example, we can help to do that through public procurement policies.

If we can make Wales a place in which to do business and in which to develop and introduce low-carbon and resource-efficient products, processes and services, the public procurement budget will be well spent not only for the taxpayer but also for business, and will create a more prosperous Wales.

The Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery (Andrew Davies): I am grateful for the contributions of colleagues this afternoon. There is widespread recognition that public procurement policies can make a significant difference, not only in helping Welsh businesses to grow and to be ambitious, but also in delivering our wider economic, social, and environmental policies.

I thank David Melding for his thoughtful contribution and also for his recognition that, as a Government and a public sector, we have made significant progress towards achieving our ambitions and aspirations. However, I think that there is a misunderstanding among some colleagues when they talk of setting targets or quotas for the amount of business that is to be won. We cannot do that as it would be in direct contravention of European competition rules. However, it is clear that there is scope within existing EU legislation to interpret procurement rules creatively.

In response to Leanne Wood, it is clear that environmental considerations such as food miles can be incorporated into the procurement contracts for the local sourcing of food, for example, but there have to be clear and transparent criteria. We have clear advice on that from lawyers. Therefore, it is evident that you can embed economic, social, and environmental policies. That is not just true in relation to environmental impact; it is also clear that you can include social clauses or community benefits in such contracts. For

gwell. Os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch strategaeth y swyddi gwyrdd a welsom yr wythnos diwethaf, ac os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch darparu polisiau clir ac arloesol ar gyfer y newid yn yr hinsawdd, er enghraifft, gallwn helpu i wneud hynny drwy bolisiau caffael cyhoeddus.

Os gallwn wneud Cymru yn lle i wneud busnes ynddo ac i ddatblygu a chyflwyno cynnyrch, prosesau a gwasanaethau carbon isel ac effeithlon o ran adnoddau ynddo, caiff y gyllideb caffael ei gwario'n dda nid yn unig er lles y trethdalwr ond hefyd er lles busnesau, a bydd yn creu Cymru fwy ffyniannus.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Andrew Davies): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfraniadau cyd-Aelodau y prynhawn yma. Mae cydnabyddiaeth eang y gall polisiau caffael cyhoeddus wneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol, nid yn unig yn helpu busnesau Cymru i dyfu a bod yn uchelgeisiol, ond hefyd yn gwireddu ein polisiau economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol ehangach.

Diolchaf i David Melding am ei gyfraniad meddylgar a hefyd am ei gydnabyddiaeth ein bod, fel Llywodraeth a sector cyhoeddus, wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol tuag at wireddu ein uchelgais a'n dyheadau. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod camddealltwriaeth ymysg rhai cyd-Aelodau pan fyddant yn sôn am osod targedau neu gwtâu o ran y swmp o fusnes y gellir ei ennill. Ni allwn wneud hynny gan y byddai'n uniongyrchol groes i reolau cystadleuaeth Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, mae'n glir fod lle o fewn deddfwriaeth bresennol yr UE i ddehongli'r rheolau caffael yn greadigol.

Mewn ymateb i Leanne Wood, mae'n amlwg y gall ystyriaethau amgylcheddol megis milltiroedd bwyd gael eu hymgorffori yn y contractau caffael i sicrhau bwyd o ffynonellau lleol, er enghraifft, ond rhaid inni gael meini prawf clir a thryloyw. Mae gennym gyngor clir ar hynny gan gyfreithwyr. Felly, mae'n amlwg y gallwch ymgorffori polisiau economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol. Nid dim ond yng nghyswllt yr effaith ar yr amgylchedd y mae hynny'n wir; mae hefyd yn amlwg y

example, when establishing building or road-building contracts, it would allow you to specify the inclusion of training and employment for long-term unemployed people, as many schemes across Wales have done. That has ensured the efficient delivery of the contract while taking significant numbers of long-term unemployed people off the dole and providing them with training and employment.

David Melding made a valid point about the role of procurement in improving the efficiency of spending, particularly capital investment. As I have made clear previously, and as was stated by the Chancellor yesterday, the significant growth in public expenditure will slow and so that procurement will have a clear role to play in making sure that we get the best value for money from that investment. That is one principle that underlies the establishment of the strategic capital investment fund, as it will allow the more efficient delivery of capital investment through more robust business planning as well as through the procurement process.

Many of the points that colleagues have made, particularly Jenny Randerson, related to the interpretation of procurement law. She said that there is a yawning gap between rhetoric and reality. I have said clearly that, while we have made significant progress, there is still a long way to go. I note, however, that the two examples that Jenny used are both for local authorities. I believe that one was Cardiff council and the other, Swansea council. I will follow up the specific questions that you raised, Jenny, although I cannot comment on them. It is clear through the research on procurement conducted by Professor Dermot Cahill of Bangor University and by Professor Kevin Morgan of Cardiff University that a greater commitment to procurement is needed from the public sector, particularly local authorities. Local authorities could employ more procurement specialists, and that policy should be taken seriously at a senior management level. However, local authorities should also be

gallwch gynnwys cymalau cymdeithasol neu fanteision cymunedol mewn contractau o'r fath. Er enghraifft, wrth sefydlu contractau adeiladu neu adeiladu ffyrdd, byddai'n caniatáu ichi bennu ei bod yn rhaid cynnwys hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth i bobl sydd wedi bod yn ddi-waith dros dymor hir, fel y mae llawer o gynlluniau ar draws Cymru wedi'i wneud. Mae hyn wedi sicrhau bod y contract yn cael ei gyflawni'n effeithlon ac, ar yr un pryd, mae wedi tynnu nifer sylweddol o bobl a fu'n ddi-waith dros dymor hir oddi ar y dôl ac wedi darparu hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth iddynt.

Gwnaeth David Melding bwynt dilys am rôl caffael yn gwella effeithlonrwydd gwariant, yn enwedig fuddsoddi cyfalaf. Fel yr wyf wedi'i wneud yn glir cyn hyn, ac fel y dywedwyd gan y Canghellor ddoe, bydd y twf sylweddol mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn arafu ac, felly, bydd gan y caffael hwnnw rôl glir i'w chwarae yn gwneud yn siŵr ein bod yn cael y gwerth gorau am arian o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Dyna un egwyddor sy'n sail i sefydlu'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, gan y bydd yn caniatáu darparu buddsoddi cyfalaf yn fwy effeithlon drwy gynllunio busnes cadarnach yn ogystal â thrwy'r broses gaffael.

Yr oedd a wnelo llawer o'r pwyntiau y mae cyd-Aelodau, yn enwedig Jenny Randerson, wedi'u gwneud â dehongli cyfraith caffael. Dywedodd fod bwloch enfawr rhwng rhyngwethreg a realiti. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn glir, er ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol, fod ffordd bell i fynd o hyd. Sylwaf, fodd bynnag, fod y ddwy enghraifft a ddefnyddiodd Jenny yn ymwneud ill dwy ag awdurdodau lleol. Credaf mai cyngor Caerdydd oedd un ac mai cyngor Abertawe oedd y llall. Af ar drywydd y cwestiynau penodol a godwyd gennych, Jenny, er na allaf gynnig sylwadau arnynt. Mae'n amlwg o'r ymchwil ar gaffael yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef gan yr Athro Dermot Cahill o Brifysgol Bangor a chan yr Athro Kevin Morgan o Brifysgol Caerdydd fod angen mwy o ymrwymiad i gaffael o du'r sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig awdurdodau lleol. Gallai awdurdodau lleol gyflogi mwy o arbenigwyr caffael, a dylai'r polisi hwnnw gael ei gymryd o ddifrif ar uwch lefel reoli. Fodd bynnag, dylai

interpreting Best Value in its wider sense and not just going for the cheapest bid.

4.50 p.m.

Joyce Watson quite rightly commended Carmarthenshire council, which, together with others, such as Caerphilly council, is at the forefront of procurement, taking it seriously. By doing so, those authorities have shown that not only can they deliver better and more efficient public services, but also that they can have an impact on the local economy.

Jenny Randerson: The point that I was making, Minister, is that local authorities are willing to take that interpretation. However, that way means that they cannot make the 1 per cent savings that you require of them, and the impetus towards achieving the 1 per cent savings—which, in fact, in many cases is a much higher percentage of savings on contracts—works counter to the natural instinct of local authorities to try to do business with local suppliers across Wales.

Andrew Davies: As I said, I cannot comment on the two specific examples that you have raised, Jenny. However, it has been demonstrated by the research of Professor Dermot Cahill of Bangor University particularly that most local authorities in Wales are not prioritising procurement for the better delivery of services as well as for the impact on the local economy. It is clear that they could be much more creative in their interpretation of procurement rules. For example, you raised the issue of a south-east Wales shared service proposal by the 10 local authorities in south-east Wales. That is a collaborative bid led by local authorities. This is not about outsourcing and privatisation; it is a local authority bid with the full engagement of the public sector trade unions. Local authorities believe that it will lead to the better delivery of services in human resources, training and payroll, and also to significant efficiency savings. That is another creative interpretation, helped by funding from the ‘Making the Connections’

awdurdodau lleol hefyd fod yn dehongli'r Gwerth Gorau yn ei ystyr ehangach, nid dim ond manteisio ar y cais rhataf.

Canmolodd Joyce Watson Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn briodol. Mae ef, ynghyd ag eraill, megis cyngor Caerffili, yn arwain y ffordd ym maes caffael, gan ei gymryd o ddifrif. Drwy wneud hynny, mae'r awdurdodau hynny wedi dangos nid yn unig eu bod yn gallu darparu gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a rhai mwy effeithlon, ond hefyd eu bod yn gallu cael effaith ar yr economi leol.

Jenny Randerson: Y pwynt yr oeddwn i'n ei wneud, Weinidog, yw bod awdurdodau lleol yn barod i gymryd y dehongliad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffordd honno'n golygu na allant wneud yr arbedion o 1 y cant yr ydych yn eu mynnu ganddynt, ac mae'r ysgogiad i sicrhau arbedion o 1 y cant—sydd, mewn gwirionedd, mewn llawer o achosion yn ganran lawer uwch o arbedion ar contractau—yn mynd yn groesi i reddd naturiol awdurdodau lleol i geisio gwneud busnes gyda chyflenwyr lleol ar draws Cymru.

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais, ni allaf gynnig sylwadau ar y ddwy enghraifft benodol yr ydych wedi'u codi, Jenny. Fodd bynnag, mae ymchwil yr Athro Dermot Cahill o Brifysgol Bangor yn arbennig wedi dangos nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru yn blaenoriaethu caffael er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau yn well yn ogystal ag er mwyn yr effaith ar yr economi leol. Mae'n amlwg y gallent fod yn llawer mwy creadigol yn eu dehongliad o'r rheolau caffael. Er enghraifft, codasoch fater cynnig gwasanaeth a rennir gan y 10 awdurdod lleol yn y de-ddwyrain. Mae'n gais cydweithredol dan arweiniad awdurdodau lleol. Nid darparu gan gyflenwyr allanol a phreifateiddio sydd dan sylw yma; mae'n gais gan awdurdodau lleol gyda chyfranogiad llawn undebau llafur y sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn credu y bydd yn arwain at ddarparu gwasanaethau gwell ym maes adnoddau dynol, hyfforddiant a'r gyflogres, ac y bydd hefyd yn creu arbedion effeithlonrwydd sylweddol. Mae hwnnw'n ddehongliad

improvement fund. They have also made a proposal and a bid to the strategic capital investment fund, which will be considered in due course.

I will write to Leanne Wood on her specific questions about procurement and food, where we have the figures about how many public bodies, schools, colleges, prisons and so on are procuring food locally, and the proportion of their business that is procured locally. She also made the point about contracts being small enough. The evidence, again from Professor Dermot Cahill, is that most local authorities are not advertising many small contracts, which they are required to do by law. They can advertise on the national procurement website, www.sell2wales.co.uk, or www.xchangewales.co.uk, which would constitute publication. That would open up more of this business to local companies.

I will respond to the specific questions that have been raised, but, in general, I believe that this debate has illustrated that, while public procurement does not necessarily have a high profile, it can have a significant impact on delivering better services in Wales and deriving efficiency savings, but also on making an economic impact for our small and medium-sized enterprises particularly.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there are objections. Therefore I postpone voting until voting time.

The Business Committee has agreed that voting time should not be earlier than 5 p.m. but I understand that the business managers are content for it to be brought forward. Does any Member object to that? I see that there are no objections. Does anyone wish the bell to be rung? I see that there is no such request. We will therefore move straight to voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y bleidlais tan yr amser pleidleisio.
Vote deferred until voting time.*

creadigol arall, wedi'i helpu gan gyllid o gronfa wella 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Maent hefyd wedi gwneud cynnig a chais i'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, a gaiff ei ystyried maes o law.

Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Leanne Wood ynglŷn â'i chwestiynau penodol am gaffael a bwyd, lle mae'r ffigurau gennym am faint o gyrff cyhoeddus, ysgolion, colegau, carchardai ac ati sy'n caffael bwyd yn lleol, a'r gyfran o'u busnes sy'n cael ei gaffael yn lleol. Gwnaeth y pwynt hefyd ynglŷn â chael contractau digon bach. Y dystiolaeth, eto gan yr Athro Dermot Cahill, yw nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn hysbysebu llawer o gontractau bach, y mae'n ofynnol iddynt ei wneud yn ôl y gyfraith. Gallant hysbysebu ar y wefan caffael genedlaethol, www.gwerthwchigymru.co.uk, neu www.cyfnewidcymru.co.uk, a fyddai'n golygu eu bod yn cyhoeddi. Byddai hynny'n agor mwy o'r busnes hwn i gwmnïau lleol.

Ymatebaf i'r cwestiynau penodol sydd wedi cael eu codi, ond, yn gyffredinol, credaf fod y ddadl hon wedi dangos, tra nad oes gan gaffael cyhoeddus broffil uchel o reidrwydd, y gall gael effaith sylweddol ar ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau yng Nghymru a sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd, a hefyd gall gael effaith economaidd o ran ein cwmnïau bach a chanolog eu maint yn arbennig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw cytuno i welliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad, felly gohiriaf y pleidleisio tan yr amser pleidleisio.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes wedi cytuno na ddylai'r amser pleidleisio fod cyn 5 p.m. ond deallaf fod y rheolwyr busnes yn hapus inni ddod ag ef ymlaen. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu hynny? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiadau. A oes unrhyw un am i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes cais o'r fath. Awn yn syth felly at yr amser pleidleisio.

Amser Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant i NDM4061: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment to NDM4061: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Mike
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Christopher
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, Dai
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4061: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 2 to NDM4061: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Mike
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Christopher
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, Dai
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4061: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
 Amendment 3 to NDM4061: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Mike
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Christopher
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Jenkins, Bethan
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Law, Trish
 Lloyd, Dai
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4061: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
 Amendment 4 to NDM4061: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Burns, Angela
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Mike
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Melding, David
 Millar, Darren

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew
 Evans, Nerys
 Franks, Christopher
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane

Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, Dai
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM4061: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 5 to NDM4061: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Burns, Angela
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Mike
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Christopher
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, Dai
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig NDM4061: O blaid 32, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM4061: For 32, Abstain 9, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Christopher
German, Mike
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jenkins, Bethan
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Law, Trish
Lloyd, Dai
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Burns, Angela
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.56 p.m.
The meeting ended at 4.56 p.m.

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)

Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)