



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 29 Tachwedd 2006  
Wednesday, 29 November 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 4 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid  
Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister
- 26 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau  
Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills
- 47 Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr  
Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar yr Agweddau Cynllunio ar Offer Telathrebu  
Symudol  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment,  
Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on the Planning Aspects of Mobile  
Telecommunications Apparatus
- 62 Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr  
Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar y Mesur Morol  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment,  
Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on the Marine Bill
- 71 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 72 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-aes, yr  
Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006 o dan Reol  
Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii)  
Approval of the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road,  
The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006  
under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii)
- 87 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 88 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Cynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol  
Cymru  
Approval of the Changes to the National Assembly for Wales Members' Pension  
Scheme Rules
- 92 Cymeradwyo Penderfyniad ar Dâl a Lwfansau Aelodau  
Approval of a Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances
- 94 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 97 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwyso) 2006 o dan  
adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998  
Approval of the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 under  
section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998
- 103 Cynllun Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol  
The National Assembly's Disability Equality Scheme

- 118 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 119 Cynllun Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: Parhad  
The National Assembly's Disability Equality Scheme: Continued
- 124 Cymeradwyo Datganiad yr Amserlen Gyfnodol  
Approval of the Periodic Timetable Statement

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw'r Gweinidog, croesawaf y ddirprwyaeth o banel craffu yr amgylchedd a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o Ynys Jersey sy'n ymweld â ni. Yr ydym bob amser yn falch o weld pobl o unrhyw ynys yn nysoedd Prydain ac Iwerddon yn ymweld â ni. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call the Minister, I welcome the delegation visiting us from the environment and public services scrutiny panel from the States of Jersey. We are always pleased to see people from any island in the British isles and Ireland visiting us. [*Applause.*]

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Gan gynnwys Ynys Môn.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Including Anglesey.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn wir, gan gynnwys Ynys Môn. Mae yna wastad rywun. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Indeed, including Anglesey. There is always someone. [*Laughter.*]

### **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

#### **Darparu Gwasanaethau Lleol yn Well Improving Local Service Delivery**

**Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Good afternoon, Minister. Will the Minister make a statement on her policies for improving local service delivery? OAQ1014 (LGP)

**C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Prynawn da, Weiniidog. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei pholisïau ar gyfer gwella darpariaeth gwasanaethau lleol? OAQ1014 (LGP)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Good afternoon to you, too—we are all being very civil this afternoon. I refer you to the Welsh Assembly Government's action plan for transforming public services, set out in 'Making the Connections: Delivering Beyond Boundaries', which is our response to Sir Jeremy Beecham's report.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Prynawn da i chi, hefyd—yr ydym i gyd yn gwrtais iawn y prynawn yma. Hoffwn eich cyfeirio at gynllun gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i drawsnewid gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, sydd wedi ei osod allan yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau: Cyflawni Ar Draws Ffiniau', sef ein hymateb i adroddiad Syr Jeremy Beecham.

**Nick Bourne:** When you spoke of delivering 'Beyond Boundaries' last week, you talked about the local service boards, which are intended to bring together key contributors to local service delivery. Could you give us some idea of how large you anticipate each unit will be, and the costs for a full financial year?

**Nick Bourne:** Wrth siarad am gyflawni 'Ar Draws Ffiniau' yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddech yn sôn am y byrddau gwasanaethau lleol, y bwriedir iddynt ddwyn ynghyd y cyfranwyr allweddol i ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol. A allech roi rhyw syniad inni pa mor fawr y disgwylwch i bob uned fod, a'r costau am flwyddyn ariannol lawn?

**Sue Essex:** As I said last week, we are

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais yr wythnos

hoping to get perhaps four or five developmental boards, and some local authorities have already expressed an interest. That has been quite interesting in itself, because we are talking about a relatively small group while some are talking about a larger group, so there will have to be some degree of local flexibility around this, depending on the nature of our partners. I suspect that we will have a core membership of perhaps six or seven organisations, and then others will be working around that and coming in as and when necessary.

The costs should not be more than those associated with the current community strategic partnerships, as they have also needed a secretariat. Therefore, they will really only need people to manage the business, to ensure that agendas and minutes are sent out, and so on. I do not think that there will be much additional cost, if any, as it is only for managing the meetings and the team. Most of the work will still be done by the core organisations.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar arweinydd yr wrthblaid o Ynys Môn. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dymunaf brynhawn da i'r Gweinidog hefyd. Nid oes rhaid imi atgoffa'r Gweinidog o'r ffaith bod Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn yn siomedig iawn ynghylch lefel y setliad a gynigiwyd iddo ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, sef cynnydd o 3 y cant yn unig. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod hynny'n golygu nifer o gwtogiadau i'w gyllideb gan ei fod yn awdurdod cymharol fach, a hynny ar wahân i'r cwtogiadau y gwyddom amdanynt—o'r trafodaethau ynghylch ysgolion, ond hefyd mewn meysydd eraill. Mae'r cyngor yn wynebu gwasgfa ddifrifol. Pa gyngor all y Gweinidog ei roi i Ynys Môn o ran sut i wella a darparu gwasanaethau lleol pan gafodd setliad mor siomedig eleni?

**Sue Essex:** As you know, the settlement is a 4.3 per cent average across local government, and it was allocated using the distribution formula agreed by the consultative forum on finance, so it was not my formula. That is the nature of it: some people go higher than 4.3

diwethaf, yr ydym yn gobeithio cael pedwar neu bum bwrdd datblygu, ac mae rhai awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi mynegi diddordeb. Mae hynny wedi bod yn eithaf diddrol ynddo'i hun, oherwydd yr ydym yn sôn am grŵp cymharol fach tra mae rhai'n sôn am grŵp mwy o faint. Felly, bydd yn rhaid sicrhau rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd lleol mewn perthynas â hyn, yn ôl natur ein partneriaid. Mae'n siŵr y bydd gennym aelodaeth graidd o ryw chwe neu saith sefydliad, ac yna bydd eraill yn gweithio o gwmpas hynny ac yn dod i mewn yn ôl yr angen.

Ni ddylai'r costau fod yn fwy nag sy'n gysylltiedig â'r partneriaethau strategol cymunedol presennol, oherwydd bu angen ysgrifenyddiaeth arnynt hwy hefyd. Felly, dim ond pobl i reoli'r busnes fydd ei angen arnynt mewn gwirionedd, er mwyn sicrhau bod agendâu a chofnodion yn cael eu hanfon allan, ac ati. Ni chredaf y bydd llawer o gost ychwanegol, os o gwbl, oherwydd rheoli'r cyfarfodydd a'r tîm yn unig a wneir. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r gwaith yn dal i gael ei wneud gan y sefydliadau craidd.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call the leader of the opposition, from Anglesey. [*Laughter.*]

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I also wish the Minister a good afternoon. I do not need to remind her that the Isle of Anglesey County Council is most disappointed at the level of settlement which it has been offered for next year. It amounts to an increase of just 3 per cent. The Minister will be aware that that will result in a number of cuts in its budget, given that it is a relatively small authority, besides the cuts of which we are aware—from the discussions about schools, but also in other areas. The council is facing severe pressure. What advice can the Minister give to Anglesey on how to improve and deliver local services when it has been given such a disappointing settlement this year?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwyddoch, 4.3 y cant yw'r setliad ar gyfartaledd ar draws llywodraeth leol, ac fe'i dyrannwyd gan ddefnyddio'r fformiwla ddsbarthu y cytunwyd arni gan y fformwla ymgynghorol ar gyllid, felly, nid fy fformiwla i ydoedd. Dyna ei natur: mae rhai

per cent and others go lower, and Anglesey is in that situation. The variation is largely down to changes in population, as that is the big driver of the formula. I have not looked in detail at Anglesey's settlement, but I will be going there fairly soon to go through it with them. I think that it is probably down to a fall in the school population or that sort of issue.

As regards what the authority can do, I appreciate that it is small, and so finds it hard to adjust to changes within figures such as these. However, the key elements are all there in 'Making the Connections'. In fairness to Anglesey, despite being small, it has a good record so far both in service delivery and in working with others, and it is working very well with Gwynedd. There is a lot of scope for taking that further. Gwynedd is a key part of the north Wales regional grouping that is sharing work in a range of shared-service delivery areas where benefits can be found. The Beecham agenda and the 'Making the Connections' agenda will help Ynys Môn with budget issues.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):**

When you gave your response to the Beecham review you talked about inter-council agreements. I got the impression from what you said then that you were putting much more emphasis on what happens inside local authority boundaries than between such boundaries. Can you assure me that that is as important an aspect of the review as what happens inside local authorities?

**Sue Essex:** We have focused deliberately on local authority areas, as that is what allows the team to work in that area. Teams will, of course, also be responsible for overseeing—as I said to Ieuan—regional delivery schemes. If you have a regional delivery scheme on waste, for example, there is a relationship between reporting back on performance to service boards and reporting back to regional partnerships. Where there is a regional partnership, particularly around service delivery, that affects more than one

pobl yn mynd yn uwch na 4.3 y cant ac mae eraill yn mynd yn is, ac mae Ynys Môn yn y sefyllfa honno. Newidiadau yn y boblogaeth yn bennaf sy'n gyfrifol am yr amrywiad, gan mai dyna sy'n llywio'r fformiwla ar y cyfan. Nid wyf wedi edrych ar setliad Ynys Môn yn fanwl, ond byddaf yn mynd yno cyn hir i'w drafod gyda hwy. Credaf mai lleihad mewn niferoedd disgyblion neu rywbeth tebyg sy'n gyfrifol am hynny.

O ran yr hyn y gall yr awdurdod ei wneud, yr wyf yn sylweddoli mai un bach ydyw, ac felly ei fod yn ei chael hi'n anodd addasu i newidiadau mewn ffigurau fel hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r holl elfennau allweddol wedi'u cynnwys yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. I fod yn deg ag Ynys Môn, er mai awdurdod bach ydyw, mae ganddo enw da hyd yma o ddarparu gwasanaethau a gweithio gydag eraill, ac mae'n gweithio'n dda iawn gyda Gwynedd. Mae llawer o le i ddatblygu hynny ymhellach. Mae Gwynedd yn rhan allweddol o grŵp rhanbarthol y gogledd sy'n rhannu gwaith mewn amrywiaeth o feysydd darparu gwasanaethau a rennir lle y gellir gweld manteision. Bydd agenda Beecham ac agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn helpu Ynys Môn gyda materion cyllideb.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):**

Yn eich ymateb i adolygiad Beecham yr oeddech yn sôn am gytundebau rhwng cynghorau. Yr argraff a gefais o'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennych bryd hynny oedd eich bod yn rhoi llawer mwy o bwyslais ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd o fewn awdurdodau lleol yn hytrach na rhyngddynt. A allwch fy sicrhau bod yr agwedd hon yr un mor bwysig yn yr adolygiad â'r hyn sy'n digwydd o fewn awdurdodau lleol?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio'n fwriadol ar ardaloedd awdurdod lleol, oherwydd mai dyna sy'n galluogi'r tîm i weithio yn yr ardal honno. Wrth gwrs, bydd timau hefyd yn gyfrifol am oruchwylio cynlluniau darparu rhanbarthol—fel y dywedais wrth Ieuan. Os oes gennych gynllun darparu rhanbarthol ar gyfer gwastraff, er enghraifft, bydd perthynas rhwng cyflwyno adroddiadau ar berfformiad i fyrddau gwasanaeth a chyflwyno adroddiadau i bartneriaethau rhanbarthol. Lle

area—there are already a considerable number—we can use the service board mechanism for reporting back. Going back to waste, some will no doubt have to report back because of contracts that are let to individual local authorities.

**Michael German:** One of the questions that local authorities will already have raised with you is on whether service boards are replacing existing partnership arrangements, or whether they will have an overarching oversight role. A huge number of local authority partnerships are already in existence, and there is a worry that the good work done in that respect will be overtaken by service boards that are seen to be taking on the responsibility for this work. What is your view on the role of existing partnerships within the new structures that you are proposing?

**Sue Essex:** As I said to Nick, the idea, essentially, is that these replace the community strategic partnerships, which are the generic partnerships for local authorities. They are not meant to take over the work of the other partnerships that have been developed, such as community safety partnerships. They will stay in place. That is something that we can develop. As I said last week, when I announced this, there is still lots of work to be done over the next few months in consultation with our partners. However, the essential point is that the community strategic partnerships, which have worked well in some authorities but not in others, are replaced by something such as this that is much more encompassing, and which will, with time, hopefully, have pooled budgets in a way that community strategic partnerships were never intended to have.

bydd partneriaeth ranbarthol, yn enwedig ym maes darparu gwasanaethau, sy'n effeithio ar fwy nag un maes—mae yna nifer sylweddol eisoes—gallwn ddefnyddio'r mecanwaith bwrdd gwasanaeth i adrodd yn ôl. I fynd yn ôl at wastraff, yn sicr bydd yn rhaid i rai adrodd yn ôl oherwydd contractau sy'n cael eu gosod i awdurdodau lleol unigol.

**Michael German:** Un o'r cwestiynau y bydd awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi eu codi gyda chi yw a yw byrddau gwasanaeth yn disodli partneriaethau sy'n bodoli eisoes, neu a fydd ganddynt rôl oruchwylio gyffredinol. Mae nifer enfawr o bartneriaethau awdurdod lleol yn bodoli eisoes, ac mae pryder y bydd y gwaith da a wnaed mewn perthynas â hynny yn cael ei lyncu gan fyrddau gwasanaeth sy'n ymddangos yn dod yn gyfrifol am y gwaith hwn. Beth yw eich barn am rôl partneriaethau sy'n bodoli eisoes o fewn y strwythurau newydd yr ydych yn eu cynnig?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais wrth Nick, y syniad, yn ei hanfod, yw bod y rhain yn disodli'r partneriaethau strategol cymunedol, sef y partneriaethau generig ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Ni fwriedir cymryd drosodd waith y partneriaethau eraill sydd wedi datblygu, megis partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Bydd y rheini'n parhau. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y gallwn ei ddatblygu. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, pan gyhoeddais hyn, mae llawer o waith ar ôl i'w wneud dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf drwy ymgynghori â'n partneriaid. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt allweddol yw fod y partneriaethau strategol cymunedol, sydd wedi gweithio'n dda mewn rhai awdurdodau ond nid mewn eraill, yn cael eu disodli gan rywbeth fel hyn sy'n llawer mwy cynhwysfawr, ac a fydd, gydag amser, gobeithio wedi cyfuno cyllidebau mewn modd na fwriadwyd i bartneriaethau strategol cymunedol ei wneud byth.

### **Ffigurau Perfformiad Performance Figures**

**Q2 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Local Government Association data unit's latest performance figures? OAQ0975 (LGP)

**C2 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffigurau perfformiad diweddaraf gan uned data Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru? OAQ0975 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I welcome the publication of the 2005-06 performance data and related statistical bulletin. I hope that this improves the public's understanding of the high quality services provided by local authorities. Equally, I hope that councils themselves use the comparative data to benchmark their performance, and use it to drive improvement.

**Ann Jones:** I also welcome the figures as a way for the public to see how their councils are performing. Like you, I think that we should be looking at comparative data. Will you join me in condemning Denbighshire County Council, which this year has Wales's highest rate of pupils leaving full-time education without a recognised qualification? The Denbighshire figure is some 2 per cent higher than the Welsh average at 4.3 per cent. There is almost a 4 per cent difference between the best performing council—Ceredigion County Council—and Denbighshire. This data is available, and we can all play around with figures, but we must all realise that behind every figure there are real people—in this case, children, who will be affected in terms of quality of life and job opportunities. Will you speak to your colleague, Jane Davidson, and will you both talk to Denbighshire County Council, about an action plan to address the unacceptably poor performance by Denbighshire County Council in this key area?

2.10 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** You are right that Denbighshire did not hit the milestone, and had, I think, the worst performance in Wales on this indicator. To be fair, Denbighshire performed well on other indicators, such as those on adult social care and delayed transfers of care. This is the benefit of the data. Sometimes you can explain the variations, sometimes you cannot. Where you cannot, it is up to local authorities to benchmark and work with those authorities that are doing a good job. That way, you get the best of all worlds. Where there is a bad failing, in an area that matters incredibly to people—and this is one such area—there needs to be an action plan to ensure delivery. I will certainly mention this to Jane Davidson.

**Sue Essex:** Croesawaf gyhoeddi data perfformiad a bwletin ystadegol cysylltiedig 2005-06. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn gwella dealltwriaeth y cyhoedd o'r gwasanaethau o safon uchel a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Yn yr un modd, gobeithio y bydd cynghorau eu hunain yn defnyddio'r data cymharol i feincnodi eu perfformiad, ac yn eu defnyddio i sicrhau gwelliannau.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu'r ffigurau fel modd i'r cyhoedd weld sut mae eu cynghorau'n perfformio. Fel chi, credaf y dylem fod yn edrych ar ddata cymharol. A wnewch ymuno â mi i gondemnio Cyngor Sir Ddinbych, sydd â'r gyfradd uchaf yng Nghymru eleni o ddisgyblion sy'n gadael addysg llawn amser heb gymhwyster cydnabyddedig? Mae'r ffigur ar gyfer sir Ddinbych tua 2 y cant yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru o 4.3 y cant. Mae bron 4 y cant o wahaniaeth rhwng y cyngor sy'n perfformio orau—Cyngor Sir Ceredigion—a sir Ddinbych. Mae'r data hyn ar gael, a gall pob un ohonom chwarae o gwmpas gyda'r ffigurau, ond rhaid inni bob un sylweddoli bod pobl go iawn y tu ôl i bob ffigur—plant yn yr achos hwn, a bydd yn effeithio arnynt o ran ansawdd bywyd a chyfleoedd gwaith. A wnewch siarad â'ch cyd-Aelod, Jane Davidson, ac a wnewch chi eich dwy siarad â Chyngor Sir Ddinbych ynghylch cynllun gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â pherfformiad gwael annerbyniol Cyngor Sir Ddinbych yn y maes allweddol hwn?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn gywir nad oedd sir Ddinbych wedi cyrraedd y garreg filltir, a chredaf mai hwn oedd y perfformiad gwaethaf yng Nghymru ar y dangosydd hwn. A bod yn deg, perfformiodd sir Ddinbych yn dda ar ddangosyddion eraill, megis y rhai ar ofal cymdeithasol oedolion ac oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Dyna yw mantais y data. Weithiau gallwch egluro'r amrywiadau ac weithiau ni allwch. Pan na allwch, mater i awdurdodau lleol yw meincnodi a gweithio gyda'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n gwneud gwaith da. Drwy wneud hynny, yr ydych ar eich ennil. Pan fydd methiant gwael, mewn maes sy'n bwysig iawn i bobl—ac mae hwn yn un maes o'r fath—mae angen llunio cynllun gweithredu i sicrhau darpariaeth. Yn



sicr, fe soniaf am hyn wrth Jane Davidson.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, will you recognise that these performance figures show the Vale of Glamorgan County Borough Council in a very good light? Excellent work is going on there; it is one of the top performers. Will you join me in condemning actions to destable that very good performance and those positive outcomes? Despite the difficult circumstances that the council inherited some years ago, the leadership has managed to turn the local authority around, as is demonstrated by the figures. Party politics is putting the quality of services—

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, a gydnabyddwch fod y ffigurau perfformiad hyn yn rhoi darlun ffafriol iawn o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Bro Morgannwg? Mae gwaith ardderchog yn mynd ymlaen yno; mae ymhlith y perfformwyr gorau. A ymunwch â mi i gondemnio camau i ansefydlogi'r perfformiad da iawn hwnnw a'r canlyniadau cadarnhaol hynny? Er gwaethaf yr amgylchiadau anodd a etifeddwyd gan y cyngor rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, mae'r arweinyddiaeth wedi llwyddo i drawsnewid yr awdurdod lleol, fel y dangosir gan y ffigurau. Mae gwleidyddiaeth plaid yn rhoi ansawdd gwasanaethau—

**The Presiding Officer:** I declare an interest as someone who is about to return to the Vale of Glamorgan to live, but despite where I may live, it is not appropriate for Assembly Members to discuss the internal politics of local authorities. It is quite appropriate for Assembly Members to refer to the relationship between Ministers and local authorities, but the internal freedom of democratically elected bodies to conduct their business is not a matter for us. Members will know that I have spoken about this before, and I may have to speak about it again later, but I defend the right of our fellow democratically elected members to carry out their business.

**Y Llywydd:** Hoffwn ddatgan buddiant fel rhywun sydd ar fin dychwelyd i Fro Morgannwg i fyw, ond ble bynnag y gallaf fod yn byw, nid yw'n briodol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad drafod gwleidyddiaeth fewnol awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n gwbl briodol i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyfeirio at y berthynas rhwng Gweinidogion ac awdurdodau lleol, ond nid mater i ni yw rhyddid mewnol cyrff wedi eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd i gyflawni eu busnes. Bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod fy mod wedi sôn am hyn o'r blaen, ac efallai y bydd yn rhaid imi sôn amdano unwaith eto'n ddiweddarach, ond amddiffynaf yr hawl i'n cyd-aelodau a etholir yn ddemocrataidd i gyflawni eu busnes.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for your guidance, Llywydd. Minister, do you share my concerns about how some issues could be destabilised after some excellent performance results because of individual agendas?

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi am eich arweiniad, Lywydd. Weinidog, a ydych yn pryderu, fel finnau, ynghylch sut y gallai rhai materion gael eu hansefydlogi ar ôl rhai canlyniadau perfformiad ardderchog o ganlyniad i agendâu unigol?

**Sue Essex:** I know that the Vale of Glamorgan is a rural authority, but I did not know everyone was in stables there. I will respond to the first part of the question. In 2005-06, the Vale of Glamorgan performed well. I sent it a letter, and I endorse that. I think that the issues that have concerned people have been around recent events, particularly relating to delayed transfers of care. There has been concern in many parts about what has been happening in that regard. I will not go into that any further.

**Sue Essex:** Fe ymatebaf i ran gyntaf y cwestiwn. Yn 2005-06, perfformiodd Bro Morgannwg yn dda. Anfonais lythyr at yr awdurdod, a chefnogaf hynny. Credaf mai digwyddiadau diweddar yw sail y problemau sydd wedi pryderu pobl, yn enwedig o ran oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Mynegwyd pryder gan lawer carfan am yr hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd yn hynny o beth. Nid wyf am fynd ar ôl y mater ymhellach.

**Mark Isherwood:** In the context of Denbighshire, could you support attempts by the council to get clearance from Jane Davidson's department for its post-16 learning centres, so that we can help address the problem that Ann has highlighted? They are dependent upon Wales European Funding Office funding, but there is a time limit on that, and unless a decision is taken rapidly, those centres could be forfeit.

**Sue Essex:** That is a matter for Jane Davidson, so I cannot comment on that. I work closely with Denbighshire County Council, but that has not been alerted to me. I work closely with all authorities, but I recently met the leader of Denbighshire council, and this issue was not raised. However, I am sure that it is on the record and will be followed through.

**Mark Isherwood:** O ran sir Ddinbych, a allech gefnogi ymdrechion y cyngor i gael cymeradwyaeth adran Jane Davidson ar gyfer ei ganolfannau dysgu ôl-16, fel y gallwn helpu mynd i'r afael â'r broblem y mae Ann wedi tynnu sylw ati? Mae'n dibynnu ar gyllid Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru, ond mae terfyn amser ar hynny, ac os na chaiff penderfyniad ei wneud yn gyflym, gallai'r canolfannau hynny gael eu fforffedu.

**Sue Essex:** Mater i Jane Davidson yw hynny, felly, ni allaf roi sylw arno. Yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda Chyngor Sir Ddinbych, ond ni thynnwyd fy sylw at hynny. Yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda phob awdurdod, ond yn ddiweddar cyfarfûm ag arweinydd Cyngor Sir Ddinbych, ac ni chodwyd y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod wedi'i gofnodi ac y caiff ei drafod ymhellach.

### **Pwysau Cyllidebol Budgetary Pressures**

**Q3 Leanne Wood:** Will the Minister make a statement on budgetary pressures of local government? OAQ0993 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The expenditure sub-group of the consultative forum on finance provides the mechanism for consulting local government on the budgetary pressures that it faces. The provisional local government settlement, published on 25 October, provides a good and detailed response, increasing the revenue support grant budget by 4.3 per cent.

**Leanne Wood:** We are fast approaching the April deadline for the full implementation of job evaluations, but we have yet to hear from the Minister what will be the cost of this, along with the costs for backpay. Do you know what the amount is, Minister? In the Committee on Equality of Opportunity this morning, the Welsh Local Government Association estimated that it would cost between £200 million and £400 million, and would probably be in the region of £300 million. I have no doubt that the Minister will be aware that the cost to Birmingham council has been £300 million. Does the figure of £300 million ring true?

**Sue Essex:** I want to distinguish between implementing equal pay and the backpay

**C3 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysau cyllidebol llywodraeth leol? OAQ0993 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae is-grŵp gwariant y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid yn darparu mecanwaith ar gyfer ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol am y pwysau cyllidebol sy'n ei hwynebu. Mae'r setliad llywodraeth leol dros dro, a gyhoeddwyd ar 25 Hydref, yn darparu ymateb da a manwl, gan gynyddu'r gyllideb grant cymorth refeniw 4.3 y cant.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr ydym yn agosáu'n gyflym at y terfyn amser ym mis Ebrill ar gyfer gweithredu gwerthuso swyddi'n llawn, ond nid ydym wedi clywed gan y Gweinidog hyd yma am gost hyn, ynghyd â chostau ôl-gyflog. A ydych yn gwybod beth yw'r swm, Weinidog? Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal y bore yma, amcangyfrifodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y byddai'n costio rhwng £200 miliwn a £400 miliwn, ac y byddai debygol o fod tua £300 miliwn. Yr wyf yn hollol sier fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai £300 miliwn fu'r gost i gyngor Birmingham. A yw'r ffigur o £300 miliwn yn gywir?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf am wahaniaethu rhwng gweithredu cyflog cyfartal a'r atebolrwydd

liability. On implementing equal pay, we have been putting money in for the past two years. From April 2007, £54 million will be going into the local government baseline. Therefore, I feel that we have more than adequately responded to the legislation in that regard. As I said, money has gone in over past years to enable us to undertake the job evaluation process. Like my colleague, Jane Hutt, I am hopeful that the April deadline will be met by local authorities, because that is the first important step. We want to see equal pay implemented, although there are many authorities that are at different stages of the process. I have spent a considerable amount of my time encouraging local authorities to carry on and do this work.

In terms of backpay liability, you quoted a figure of between £200 million and £400 million. There is a huge difference there. No-one actually knows what the figure will be, because you cannot say until all the detailed work has been done on the job evaluation. In talking to all local authorities about this, I have learned that no two local authorities are the same, so you cannot say that this will read across from one authority to another and make those estimates. However, we all know that the figure will be substantial. We are working with local government for it to get an accurate figure of how this will be dealt with. As I said, the priority is to implement equal pay.

**Leighton Andrews:** Budgetary pressures in Rhondda Cynon Taf will have been relieved by the decision of tenants in the county last week to vote in favour of a community mutual housing scheme. Do you welcome that vote, which will mean better homes for tenants in the county? Do you also welcome the fact that it signifies the latest defeat of Plaid Cymru in the county?

**Sue Essex:** I will not answer the second question—you would not expect me to. On the first question, meeting the Welsh housing quality standard is very important. You cannot overestimate the importance of good-quality housing in children's lives. I am sure that the tenants have made the right decision, and, once this gets implemented, I am sure

dros ôl-gyflog. O ran gweithredu cyflog cyfartal, yr ydym wedi cyfrannu arian am y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. O fis Ebrill 2007, bydd £54 miliwn yn cael ei roi i linell sylfaen llywodraeth leol. Felly, credaf ein bod wedi ymateb yn fwy na digonol i'r ddeddfwriaeth yn hynny. Fel y dywedais, rhoddwyd arian yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf i'n galluogi i ymgymryd â'r broses o werthuso swyddi. Fel fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Hutt, gobeithio y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cadw at y terfyn amser ym mis Ebrill, am mai dyna'r cam pwysig cyntaf. Yr ydym am weld cyflog cyfartal yn cael ei weithredu, er bod nifer o awdurdodau wedi cyrraedd gwahanol gyfnodau yn y broses. Yr wyf wedi treulio llawer o'm hamser yn annog awdurdodau lleol i fwrw ati a gwneud y gwaith hwn.

O ran atebolrwydd dros ôl-gyflog, yr oeddech yn dyfynnu ffigur rhwng £200 miliwn a £400 miliwn. Mae gwahaniaeth sylweddol rhwng y ffigurau hynny. Ni wŷr neb yn iawn beth fydd y ffigur, am na allwch ddweud nes bydd yr holl waith manwl o werthuso swyddi wedi'i wneud. Wrth drafod hyn gyda phob awdurdod lleol, yr wyf wedi dysgu nad oes dau awdurdod lleol yr un fath, felly, ni allwch ddweud y bydd hyn yn gywir ym mhob awdurdod gan wneud yr amcangyfrifon hynny. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom i gyd y bydd yn ffigur sylweddol. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol i gael ffigur cywir am y ffordd yr ymdrinnir â hyn. Fel y dywedais, y flaenoriaeth yw gweithredu cyflog cyfartal.

**Leighton Andrews:** Bydd pwysau cyllidebol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi'u lliniaru gan benderfyniad tenantiaid y sir yr wythnos diwethaf i bleidleisio o blaid cynllun tai cydfuddiannol cymunedol. A ydych yn croesawu'r bleidlais honno, a fydd yn golygu cartrefi gwell i denantiaid yn y sir? A ydych hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith ei fod yn dangos gorchfygiad diweddaraf Plaid Cymru yn y sir?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf am ateb eich ail gwestiwn—ni fydddech yn disgwyl imi wneud hynny. O ran y cwestiwn cyntaf, mae cyrraedd safon ansawdd tai Cymru yn bwysig iawn. Ni allwch orbwysleisio pwysigrwydd tai o safon ym mywydau plant. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y tenantiaid wedi gwneud y penderfyniad cywir, a chyn gynted ag y caiff

that they, and future generations, will reap the benefits of it.

**David Lloyd:** On equal pay, with only four months to go in which to complete the job evaluations, is the expectation of their completion matched by the reality on the ground and the finance being available?

**Sue Essex:** The Money is there to implement equal pay. I would be untruthful if I said that every authority will meet that April deadline, as, unfortunately, that will not be the case. More will meet it than would have been the case 12 months ago, because we have been putting a lot of pressure on authorities. If we could get one or two councils to take it forward—and a few are at an advanced stage—that would encourage others to do so. Therefore, it is about getting the first council to take that step, which is what I am trying to encourage.

**David Lloyd:** The other aspect is the backpay situation, with the backpay costs a looming nightmare for each local authority, which you alluded to. What level of capitalisation or borrowing will be available to local authorities to deal with the costs of backpay?

**Sue Essex:** I should point out that this issue has existed for many years. Had equal pay been implemented earlier, the backpay element would not be such a huge worry. It is going to be managed in a series of ways, and capitalisation, which is the ability to borrow, will play its part. We are in discussions with the Treasury on this. We have some ability in terms of capitalisation this year. I suspect that we are going to be looking at this over three financial years, and that is how we intend to manage it. However, until we have an accurate picture, we cannot make the advances in working that out. Going back to Leanne's question, getting that job evaluation done, agreeing it with the trade unions and getting it through is key to this. In terms of the figure, you will appreciate that there is a great difference between £200 million and £400 million—it could be 100 per cent more, or it could be less. That is the point, and that

hyn ei weithredu, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant hwy, a chenedlaethau'r dyfodol, yn cael budd ohono.

**David Lloyd:** O ran gyflog gyfartal, gan mai pedwar mis sydd gyn cwblhau'r gwerthusiadau swyddi, a yw'r disgwyliad y cânt eu cwblhau yn cyfateb i'r realiti ar lawr gwlad a bod y cyllid ar gael?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r arian yno i weithredu cyflog cyfartal. Byddwn yn anonest pe byddwn yn dweud y bydd pob awdurdod lleol yn cyrraedd y terfyn amser hwnnw ym mis Ebrill, am na fydd hynny'n wir, gwaetha'r modd. Bydd mwy ohonynt yn cyrraedd y terfyn amser nag a fyddai wedi gwneud hynny 12 mis yn ôl, oherwydd yr ydym wedi rhoi llawer o bwysau ar awdurdodau. Pe gallem gael un neu ddau o gynghorau i'w weithredu—ac mae ambell un yn mynd ymlaen yn dda—byddai hynny'n annog eraill i wneud yr un peth. Felly, mae a wnelo ag annog un cyngor i gymryd y cam hwnnw, a dyna yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud.

**David Lloyd:** Yr agwedd arall yw'r sefyllfa o ran ôl-gyflog, ac mae costau ôl-gyflog yn hunllef i bob awdurdod lleol, fel yr oeddech yn sôn. Pa lefel o gyfalafu neu fenthycia a fydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn ymdopi â chostau ôl-gyflog?

**Sue Essex:** Dylwn nodi bod y mater hwn yn bodoli ers blynyddoedd lawer. Pe bai cyflog cyfartal wedi'i weithredu yn gynharach, ni fyddai'r elfen ôl-gyflog yn peri cymaint o bryder. Caiff ei rheoli mewn nifer o ffyrdd, a bydd cyfalafu, sef y gallu i fenthycia, yn un ffordd i wneud hynny. Yr ydym wrthi'n trafod hyn gyda'r Trysorlys. Mae gennym ryw faint o allu i gyfalafu eleni. Credaf y byddwn yn edrych ar hyn dros gyfnod o dair blynedd ariannol, a dyna sut y bwriadwn ei reoli. Fodd bynnag, nes inni gael darlun cywir, ni allwn symud ymlaen i wneud hynny. I ddychwelyd at gwestiwn Leanne, mae cwblhau'r gwerthusiadau swyddi, cytuno arnynt gyda'r undebau llafur a'u gweithredu yn hanfodol i hyn. O ran y ffigur, byddwch yn sylweddoli bod gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng £200 miliwn a £400 miliwn—gallai fod 100 y cant yn fwy, neu gallai fod yn llai. Dyna'r pwynt, a dyna pam yr ydym

is why we are putting pressure on local authorities to get that work done, so that we can go to the Treasury with a real figure.

2.20 p.m.

**David Melding:** Social care continues to place major pressure on local government budgets; indeed, the social care budgets of several authorities are in considerable deficit at the moment. I am not going to throw down the usual challenge to you—that the baseline for social care spending should be increased—but I do want to look at how that large element of local government expenditure is managed. A lot of these problems seem to be created by a small number of vulnerable people in need of care; they are often children, who need to be kept in custody, or who need special provision, and they are sometimes sent out of country, never mind out of county, at vast expense. Are you convinced that, in the wake of the Beecham reforms, you are on the road to effective regional commissioning? These problems can be solved only at a regional level.

**Sue Essex:** There are two major areas of pressure on social care. The first is care for the elderly, particularly where there are pressures on mental health services or elderly mental illness provision. That is associated with an ageing population, and there is nothing that we can do about that except be prepared. The second area is where there is pressure on provision for younger children and perhaps teenagers, who need special care, which, in extreme cases, can be highly personalised and costly. I have discussed this at length with local authorities. We are approaching this problem in the right way, by working with the Welsh Local Government Association. You will be aware of the unit that has been set up. However, as you say, a lot of institutional care is extremely costly and is often not well located in relation to the children. We have discussed with the WLGA how we might take forward regional provision, not just in institutional care, but with cross-boundary support as well. I honestly think that that is the best way to alleviate the problems in the shortest possible timescale.

yn rhoi pwysau ar awdurdodau lleol i wneud y gwaith hwnnw, fel y gallwn gyflwyno ffigur gwirioneddol i'r Trysorlys.

**David Melding:** Mae gofal cymdeithasol yn parhau i roi pwysau mawr ar gyllidebau llywodraeth leol; yn wir, mae cyllidebau gofal cymdeithasol llawer awdurdod mewn diffyg ariannol sylweddol ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf am roi'r her arferol ichi—sef y dylid cynyddu'r llinell sylfaen ar gyfer gwariant gofal cymdeithasol—ond yr wyf am ystyried y ffordd y rheolir yr elfen fawr honno mewn gwariant llywodraeth leol. Ymddengys mai nifer fach o bobl ddiamddiffyn y mae angen gofal arnynt sy'n achosi llawer o'r problemau hyn; plant ydynt yn aml sydd angen eu cadw mewn gofal, neu sydd ag angen darpariaeth arbennig arnynt, ac weithiau cânt eu hanfon allan o'r wlad, heb sôn am allan o'r sir, am gost anferth. Yng ngoleuni diwygiadau Beecham, a ydych yn argyhoeddedig eich bod ar y trywydd cywir i sicrhau comisiynu rhanbarthol effeithiol? Ar lefel ranbarthol yn unig y gellir datrys y problemau hyn.

**Sue Essex:** Mae dau brif faes sy'n rhoi pwysau ar ofal cymdeithasol. Y cyntaf yw gofal i'r henoed, yn enwedig lle mae pwysau ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl neu ddarpariaeth salwch meddwl i'r henoed. Mae hynny'n gysylltiedig â phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, ac ni allwn wneud dim ynglŷn â hynny heblaw bod yn barod. Y maes arall yw lle mae pwysau ar ddarpariaeth i blant iau a phobl yn eu harddegau efallai, sydd ag angen gofal arbennig arnynt. Mewn achosion eithriadol gall y rhain fod yn bersonol iawn ac yn gostus. Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn yn fanwl gydag awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon yn y ffordd gywir, drwy weithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Fe wyddoch am yr uned sydd wedi ei sefydlu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwch, mae llawer o ofal sefydliadol yn gostus iawn ac yn aml nid yw mewn lleoliad da mewn perthynas â'r plant. Yr ydym wedi trafod gyda CLILC sut y gallem hyrwyddo darpariaeth ranbarthol, nid yn unig mewn gofal sefydliadol, ond gyda chymorth ar draws ffiniau hefyd. Credaf mai dyna'r ffordd orau i leddfu'r problemau o fewn y cyfnod byrraf posibl.

**David Melding:** Minister, in your response to the Beecham report, you made it clear that you saw local service boards as the major innovation. I am not expressing any opinion on the boards at this stage, but they are clearly limited to a local authority area. If we are to get the maximum for the Welsh pound from council spending, one of the major challenges will be regional working. I am still not convinced, on areas as critical as social care, that we can see those regional structures now emerging. Are you confident that they are there?

**Sue Essex:** Much of the social care budget will be delivered within the county area. That is the first point. The Beecham response was not just about local service boards; that aspect has probably had the most attention, but there was a raft of other responses. Concentrating on pooled budgets and on joined-up delivery around performance, to stop cost-shunting and blame-shunting, is at the heart of the concept of local service boards. In my answer to Mike earlier, I talked about the importance of regional collaboration, and nothing in the concept of local service boards is contrary to that; we simply need to put in place scrutiny and a performance appraisal of local service boards to show that they are linked to Government and that people can see that they are delivering. We would have done that anyway, pre or post Beecham. Those regional units have to be answerable to someone, and, instead of being answerable to someone anonymous, they could be answerable publicly to a team supporting those local service boards.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, yn eich ymateb i adroddiad Beecham, yr oeddech yn dweud yn glir eich bod yn credu mai byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yw'r prif ddull arloesi. Nid wyf yn mynegi unrhyw farn am y byrddau ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n amlwg eu bod wedi'u cyfyngu i faes awdurdod lleol. Os ydym am sicrhau'r gwerth gorau am arian gan wariant y cyngor, un o'r prif heriau fydd gweithio'n rhanbarthol. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi eto fod y strwythurau rhanbarthol hynny'n dechrau datblygu, yng nghyd-destun meysydd sydd mor bwysig â gofal cymdeithasol. A ydych yn hyderus eu bod yno?

**Sue Essex:** Caiff llawer o'r gyllideb gofal cymdeithasol ei wario yn ardal y sir. Dyna'r pwynt cyntaf. Yr oedd a wnelo ymateb Beecham â mwy na byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn unig; mae'n debyg mai'r agwedd honno a gafodd y sylw mwyaf, ond yr oedd lluo o ymatebion eraill. Mae canolbwyntio ar gyfuno cyllidebau a sicrhau perfformiad mewn modd cydgysylltiedig, rhoi'r gorau i symud costau a bwrw'r bai, wrth wraidd y cysyniad o fyrddau gwasanaethau lleol. Yn fy ymateb i Mike yn gynharach, soniais am bwysigrwydd cydweithredu rhanbarthol, ac nid yw'r cysyniad o fyrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn gwrth-ddweud hynny; yn syml, mae angen inni roi prosesau ar waith i graffu ar fyrddau gwasanaethau lleol ac i arfarnu eu perfformiad er mwyn dangos eu bod wedi'u cysylltu â'r Llywodraeth ac y gall pobl weld yr hyn y maent yn ei ddarparu. Byddem wedi gwneud hynny beth bynnag, cyn Beecham neu ar ôl Beecham. Rhaid i'r unedau rhanbarthol hynny fod yn atebol i rywun, ac yn hytrach na bod yn atebol i rywun dienw, gallent fod yn atebol yn gyhoeddus i dîm sy'n cefnogi'r byrddau gwasanaethau lleol hynny.

#### **Aelwydydd Incwm Isel Low-income Households**

**Q4 Leanne Wood:** What assessment has the Minister made of the impact of council tax on low-income houses? OAQ1004 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I guess that you mean low-income households. Details of what individuals earn are not held by the Assembly

**C4 Leanne Wood:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith treth gyngor ar aelwydydd incwm isel? OAQ1004 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cadw manylion am gyflogau unigolion, ac felly nid yw asesiad o'r fath yn bosibl. Mae'r

Government, and so such an assessment is not possible. The latest available figures show that around 282,000 people claim council tax benefit in Wales.

**Leanne Wood:** Is the Minister content that households in deprived areas such as Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent have the highest council tax bills in Wales? Is she also content that, since 1999, those areas have seen an increase in total Government support, including the deprivation grant, which is below the Welsh average? Does she have any plans to address that?

**Sue Essex:** The deprivation grant was brought in to help those authorities with a low council tax base, so I am not sure about your figures. I thought that, of all authorities, Blaenau Gwent received most per capita from the deprivation grant. However, I will check that.

Going back to your original point regarding the benefits system, we need to ensure that benefits are targeted at those people who need them, and a lot of work has been ongoing to try to improve the take-up of council tax benefit and other benefits to alleviate matters for people on low incomes. Therefore, work that was done and agreed through the budget process last year will help elderly people, in particular, who are currently on low incomes and who face council tax bills that may seem high for them.

fffigurau diweddaraf sydd ar gael yn dangos bod tua 282,000 o bobl yn hawlio budd-dal treth gyngor yng Nghymru.

**Leanne Wood:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon mai aelwydydd mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig fel Rhondda Cynon Taf, Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent sydd â'r biliau treth gyngor uchaf yng Nghymru? A yw hefyd yn fodlon bod yr ardaloedd hynny, er 1999, wedi cael cynnydd yng nghyfanswm cymorth y Llywodraeth, gan gynnwys y grant amddifadedd, sy'n is na chyfartaledd Cymru? A oes ganddi unrhyw gynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â hynny?

**Sue Essex:** Bwriad y grant amddifadedd oedd helpu'r awdurdodau hynny sydd â sylfaen treth gyngor isel, felly nid wyf yn siŵr am eich ffigurau. Yr oeddwn yn credu bod Blaenau Gwent, o bob awdurdod, yn cael yr arian mwyaf fesul pen o'r grant amddifadedd. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn cadarnhau hynny.

I fynd yn ôl at eich pwynt gwreiddiol am y system budd-daliadau, mae angen inni sicrhau bod budd-daliadau'n targedu'r bobl hynny y mae eu hangen arnynt, ac mae llawer o waith wedi mynd ymlaen i geisio cynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n cael budd-dal treth gyngor a budd-daliadau eraill er mwyn lleddfu problemau i bobl sydd ag incwm isel. Felly, bydd y gwaith a wnaed ac y cytunwyd arno drwy broses y gyllideb y llynedd yn helpu pobl hŷn, yn benodol, sy'n cael incwm isel ar hyn o bryd ac sy'n wynebu biliau treth gyngor a all ymddangos yn uchel iddynt.

### **Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Improving Public Services**

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0965(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** I recently set out the Welsh Assembly Government's action plan, as I said in response to Nick, which includes Mid and West Wales as an area of responsibility.

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to improve public services in Mid and West Wales? OAQ0965(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Yn ddiweddar, cyflwynais gynllun gweithredu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Nick, sy'n cynnwys y canolbarth a'r gorllewin fel maes cyfrifoldeb.

**Lisa Francis:** I am sure that you will be aware of a recent announcement by HM Revenue and Customs to cut around 1,000 jobs in Wales by 2011, with a predicted 37 jobs in my home town of Aberystwyth. Have you had any discussions with Westminster colleagues and with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration about this, because it flies in the face of your Government's stated aim of investing in public services? There is a fear that this decision will weaken the service and will involve many people having to travel further to see a public servant for face-to-face assistance. It is also important in that many of these jobs will be cut in Objective 1 areas, and the poorest parts of Wales.

**Sue Essex:** I find that strange coming from the Tories. You make great play about job cuts, which, although important to the people involved, are nevertheless small in number when compared with those that your Government whacked through for all those years. *[Interruption.]* Well, it is worth pointing that out and giving it some historical context.

On your point about non-devolved issues, we have made representations to make sure that people—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. What is wrong with the colleagues on my right-hand side today? The Minister is trying to respond.

**Sue Essex:** They are not happy about getting history lessons, Llywydd. In terms of what might happen to those people who have lost their jobs in Aberystwyth, as you may know, and I am sure you warmly welcome, Lisa—unlike your colleague behind you—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Things are deteriorating unexpectedly. I would also say that this is not a history seminar, Minister. *[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']*

**Sue Essex:** You have started them off as well, Llywydd.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch am gyhoeddiad yn ddiweddar gan Gyllid a Thollau EM i dorri tua 1,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru erbyn 2011, gan ragweld colli 37 o swyddi yn fy nhref enedigol, Aberystwyth. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda chyd-aelodau yn San Steffan a chyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am hyn, oherwydd mae'n mynd yn groes i nod penodol eich Llywodraeth o fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Mae pryder y bydd y penderfyniad hwn yn gwanhau'r gwasanaeth ac yn golygu y bydd yn rhaid i lawer o bobl deithio ymhellach i weld gwas cyhoeddus i gael cymorth wyneb yn wyneb. Mae hefyd yn bwysig oherwydd y bydd nifer o'r swyddi hyn yn cael eu torri mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1, ac yn ardaloedd tlotaf Cymru.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n rhyfedd i'w glywed gan y Torïaid. Yr ydych yn gwneud drama fawr am dorri swyddi, sydd, er eu bod yn bwysig i'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt, yn nifer bach o'i gymharu â'r niferoedd a dorwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi yn yr holl flynyddoedd hynny. *[Torri ar draws.]* Wel, mae'n werth nodi hynny a'i osod mewn cyd-destun hanesyddol.

O ran eich pwynt am faterion sydd heb eu datganoli, yr ydym wedi gwneud sylwadau er mwyn sicrhau y bydd pobl—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Beth sy'n bod ar y cyd-Aelodau ar fy ochr dde heddiw? Mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio ymateb.

**Sue Essex:** Nid ydynt yn fodlon cael gwersi hanes, Lywydd. O ran yr hyn a allai ddigwydd i'r bobl hynny sydd wedi colli eu swyddi yn Aberystwyth, fel y gwyddoch, hwyrach, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ei groesawu, Lisa—yn wahanol i'ch cyd-Aelod y tu ôl ichi—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae pethau'n gwaethygu'n annisgwyl. Byddwn hefyd yn dweud nad seminar hanes yw hwn, Weinidog. *[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']*

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych chithau'n eu hannog hefyd, Lywydd.



A key benefit in the Aberystwyth area is the new Assembly Government building, which is why my reference was made to someone called Glyn Davies, whom I respect considerably. However, I think that he got his comments wrong with regard to that new Assembly building, as it will provide important jobs in that locality. We are working with the people who are losing their jobs at the Department for Work and Pensions office to see whether there are any vacancies in the Assembly Government office for them to take up as a priority.

**Elin Jones:** Nid wyf yn siŵr pam mae Aelodau'r blaidd Doriaidd yn ei chael mor hawdd i chwerthin yn ystod cwestiwn mor bwysig ynglŷn â thorri swyddi yn Aberystwyth. Serch hynny, a ydych mor siomedig â minnau, Weinidog, fod y gwaith da a wnewch fel Llywodraeth i ddatganoli swyddi cyhoeddus i ardaloedd ardal Amcan 1, megis Aberystwyth, yn cael ei wyrddroi'n llwyr gan y polisi o ganoli gwasanaethau sydd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, drwy golli dwy swyddfa bwysig yn Aberystwyth—swyddfa Cyllid y Wlad, o bosibl, a'r Swyddfa Budd-daliadau? A ydych yn barod i godi'r mater hwn yn uniongyrchol gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan, sef bod y gwaith a wnewch chi i ddatganoli swyddi cyhoeddus yn cael ei ddadwneud yn llwyr gan bolisiau hurt San Steffan o ganoli?

**Sue Essex:** It is difficult for me to comment too strongly, because I do not know the rationale behind the model that Westminster uses in terms of service delivery. I am sorry to see anyone losing their job; it is a hard thing to face. We are doing our bit as an Assembly Government, because we are prioritising that area and taking that deliberate decision to locate our office there. There are different models of service delivery.

2.30 p.m.

The critical issue—in fairness, Lisa raised this—is to ensure that people get the best service. Organising how we do things so that people get the best service is at the heart of the Beecham review. That test has to be applied to any model of change. We are talking about efficiencies and saving money,

Mantais allweddol yn ardal Aberystwyth yw adeilad newydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef y rheswm pam y cyfeiriais at rywun o'r enw Glyn Davies yr wyf yn ei barchu'n fawr. Fodd bynnag, credaf iddo wneud camgymeriad yn ei sylwadau am adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, oherwydd bydd yn sicrhau swyddi pwysig yn yr ardal honno. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r bobl sy'n colli eu swyddi yn swyddfa'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i weld a oes swyddi gwag yn swyddfa Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y gallant eu cael fel blaenoriaeth.

**Elin Jones:** I am not sure why Members of the Tory party find it so easy to laugh during such an important question about job cuts in Aberystwyth. However, are you as disappointed as I am, Minister, that the good work that you are doing as a Government to decentralise public jobs to Objective 1 areas such as Aberystwyth is being overturned by the Westminster Government's policy of centralising services, by closing two important offices in Aberystwyth—the Inland Revenue office, possibly, and the Benefits Agency? Would you be prepared to broach this important matter directly with the Westminster Government, namely that the work which you are doing to decentralise public service jobs is being totally undone by the ridiculous Westminster policy of centralisation?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n anodd imi wneud sylwadau rhy gryf, am na wn beth yw'r rhesymeg y tu ôl i'r model a ddefnyddir gan San Steffan o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Yr wyf yn flin gweld neb yn colli swydd; mae'n beth anodd ei wynebu. Yr ydym yn gwneud ein rhan fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, oherwydd yr ydym yn blaenoriaethu'r ardal honno ac yn cymryd y penderfyniad bwriadol hwnnw i leoli ein swyddfa yno. Mae yna wahanol fodelau o ddarparu gwasanaethau.

Y peth pwysig-cododd Lisa hyn, a bod yn deg-yw sicrhau bod pobl yn cael y gwasanaeth gorau. Mae trefnu sut yr ydym yn gwneud pethau er mwyn i bobl gael y gwasanaeth gorau wrth graidd adolygiad Beecham. Rhaid mesur unrhyw fodel o newid yn ôl y prawf hwnnw. Yr ydym yn sôn am

but we also have to assess the value of the service reconfiguration alongside that.

effeithlonrwydd ac arbed arian, ond rhaid inni hefyd asesu gwerth ail-gyflunio gwasanaethau ochr yn ochr â hynny.

### **Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Improving Public Services**

**Q6 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the National Assembly's policies have improved public services in Cardiff? OAQ1000 (LGP)

**C6 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae polisiau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghaerdydd? OAQ1000 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The First Minister reported on improvements in public services in his annual report 2006, to which I would refer you. We will also support the delivery of services to Cardiff County Council with the provision of £353 million in Assembly Government funding for 2007-08, which is an increase of 4.9 per cent on the funding for 2006-07.

**Sue Essex:** Cyflwynodd y Prif Weinidog adroddiad ar welliannau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ei adroddiad blynyddol am 2006, ac fe'ch cyfeiriaf ato. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd drwy ddarparu cyllid o £353 miliwn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2007-08, sef cynnydd o 4.9 y cant o'i gymharu â chyllid 2006-07.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, you will be aware of the funding problems in adult social services in Cardiff, the Vale of Glamorgan, Flintshire, and beyond. The Social Services Inspectorate for Wales has said that all local authorities in Wales appear to be spending more on social services than is indicated in their standard spending assessments. The Welsh Local Government Association believes that this is because local authorities are doing vastly more care assessments each year than in the past, probably because patients are leaving hospitals quicker and at an earlier stage in their recovery. Will you take a long, hard look at funding for local authorities with regard to these services, and, together with your Assembly Cabinet colleagues, will you reconsider the funding of local government for these services?

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, fe wyddoch am y problemau ariannu mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion yng Nghaerdydd, Bro Morgannwg, sir y Fflint, a thu hwnt. Mae Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru wedi dweud bod pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru fel pe bae'n gwario mwy ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol nag a nodir yn eu hasesiadau safonol o wariant. Cred Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru mai'r rheswm am hyn yw bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud llawer mwy o asesiadau gofal bob blwyddyn nag o'r blaen, mae'n debyg am fod pobl yn gadael yr ysbyty ynghynt ac yn gynharach yn eu cyfnod gwella. A wnewch chi fynd ati i ystyried y cyllid ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol o ran y gwasanaethau hyn, ac ynghyd â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yng Nghabinet y Cynulliad, a wnewch chi ailystyried cyllido llywodraeth leol ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hyn?

**Sue Essex:** There are several points there, Jenny, which I will go through. Over the last few years I have spent a lot of time persuading local authorities to put more money into their social care budgets, because I thought that that was where the pressure was. I am not at all surprised that they are spending above the indicator based assessment. The IBA lags behind because of population change, and we have tried to

**Sue Essex:** Mae yn hynny nifer o bwyntiau, Jenny, y byddaf yn eu trafod. Yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf yr wyf wedi treulio cryn amser yn darbwyllo awdurdodau lleol i neilltuo mwy o arian yn eu cyllidebau gofal cymdeithasol, oherwydd dyna ble yr oedd y pwysau, yn fy marn i. Nid wyf yn synnu o gwbl eu bod yn gwario mwy na'r asesiad ar sail dangosyddion. Mae'r asesiad ar ei hôl hi oherwydd newidiadau yn y boblogaeth, ac yr

explain that. As a society, we have to make a fundamental shift in resources to support what I have described before as an ageing population, and one that is expecting, quite rightly, higher levels of service. The issue is also very much around how we deliver those services and pull things together. Going back to David Melding's earlier point, I was taken by an article in one of the financial magazines, which talked about how joint working across boundaries has delivered considerable savings in west London. That model of working across some of these boundaries could be very important in providing social care.

Also, regarding the Beecham review, when we get pooled budgets that kind of distribution of money between health and local government will start to matter less, because it will all come under one budget. Therefore, the issue of whether people fall within the health budget or whether they fall within the social care budget, which is a local government budget, will be resolved. That split has caused enormous problems over time, and that pooled budget can be a major answer to that.

**Owen John Thomas:** Minister, one of your colleagues has backed the proposal by Cardiff County Council's Liberal Democrat administration to introduce congestion charging in the capital city. Do you not agree, Minister, that inner city congestion in Cardiff would be best tackled through ensuring an efficient integrated transport system, rather than penalising the public for the deficiencies of local government?

**Sue Essex:** That is largely a matter for Cardiff council. Its members are elected to make those decisions, and, going back to the Llywydd's point, it would not be wise for us to intervene. In London, those two aspects have been coupled together: congestion charging has provided funds that have given a major boost to public transport. As you know, I am a great supporter of public transport, and we are not badly off in Cardiff, because we have the railway system to complement the bus system. However, I

ydyd wedi ceisio esbonio hynny. Fel cymdeithas, rhaid inni newid yn sylfaenol sut y dyrennir adnoddau i gefnogi poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, fel yr wyf wedi'i disgrifio o'r blaen, ac un sy'n disgwyl gwasanaeth gwell, a hynny'n gwbl deg, Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â'r ffordd yr ydyd yn darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny ac yn tynnu pethau ynghyd. I ddychwelyd at bwynt cynharach David Melding, yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb mewn erthygl yn un o'r cylchgronau ariannol a soniai am y ffordd y mae cydweithio ar draws ffiniau wedi arwain at arbedion mawr yng ngorllewin Llundain. Gallai'r model hwnnw o weithio ar draws rhai o'r ffiniau hyn fod yn bwysig iawn wrth ddarparu gofal cymdeithasol.

Hefyd, o ran adolygiad Beecham, pan gawn gyllidebau cyfunol bydd dosbarthu arian rhwng iechyd a llywodraeth leol fel hynny yn dechrau mynd yn llai pwysig, oherwydd bydd yn dod o dan un gyllideb. Felly, bydd modd datrys y broblem a yw pobl yn dod o dan y gyllideb iechyd neu a ydynt yn dod o dan y gyllideb gofal cymdeithasol, sy'n gyllideb llywodraeth leol. Mae'r rhaniad hwnnw wedi achosi problemau mawr dros amser, a gall cyllideb gyfunol fod yn ateb pwysig i hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Weinidog, mae un o'ch cyd-aelodau wedi cefnogi'r cynnig gan weinyddiaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cyngor Sir Caerdydd i gyflwyno taliadau i atal tagfeydd yn y brifddinas. Oni chytunwch, Weinidog, mai'r ffordd orau i fynd i'r afael â thagfeydd yng nghanol y ddinas yng Nghaerdydd fyddai drwy sicrhau system gludiant integredig effeithlon, yn hytrach na chosbi'r cyhoedd am ddiffygion llywodraeth leol?

**Sue Essex:** Mater i gyngor Caerdydd yw hynny yn y bôn. Mae ei aelodau wedi'u hethol i wneud y penderfyniadau hynny, ac i ddychwelyd at bwynt y Llywydd, ni fyddai'n ddoeth inni ymyrryd. Yn Llundain, mae'r ddwy agwedd hynny wedi eu cyplysu: mae taliadau atal tagfeydd wedi rhoi hwb mawr i gludiant cyhoeddus. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn frwd iawn dros gludiant cyhoeddus, ac mae sefyllfa eithaf da yng Nghaerdydd, gan fod y system reilffyrdd yn ategu'r system fysiau. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf â chi yn sicr

would certainly agree with you that it needs an extra boost.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, you might be aware that the ambulance response times were published this morning. In Cardiff, 53 per cent of ambulances are getting to patients who have put in an urgent category-A phone call within the eight-minute target. The overall target is 60 per cent, so it is worrying that, yet again, we see underperformance in the ambulance service. Do you share my concern that the underperformance in Cardiff, and indeed across Wales, is putting lives at risk, and that there are significant numbers of patients whose health could be severely affected by the fact that ambulances are not getting to them quickly enough?

**Sue Essex:** We must be careful how we use the word 'underperformance', because that should not reflect in any way on the ambulance staff, who are performing to a very high standard. I visited Blackweir ambulance station some months ago. I sat down with the team and talked the issues through. It would be fair to say that it is the busiest station in Wales; I will check the figures, but that is what they told me. Going back to Owen's point, they are working in a very congested city, so some of the issues that they face come down to the nature of Cardiff and the high volume of traffic. The team ran through a number of interesting areas where they thought that improvements could be made, none of which were rocket science, I must say. I passed those on to Brian, and I am sure that they will form part of the review. It is really about how the work is organised, including how out-of-hours contracts and so on are organised. I am hoping that the ambulance review will lead to improvements that will enable those hardworking ambulance staff to meet those times.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ1010) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

fod arni angen hwb ychwanegol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol fod amseroedd ymateb cerbydau ambiwlans wedi eu cyhoeddi bore heddiw. Yng Nghaerdydd, mae 53 y cant o gerbydau ambiwlans yn cyrraedd cleifion sydd wedi gwneud galwad ffôn categori A o fewn y targed o wyth munud. Y targed cyffredinol yw 60 y cant, felly, mae'n achos pryder inni weld tanberfformio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, unwaith eto. A ydych yn pryderu, fel finnau, fod y tanberfformio yng Nghaerdydd, ac yn wir ledled Cymru, yn peryglu bywydau, a bod niferodd mawr o gleifion y gellid effeithio'n ddybryd ar eu hiechyd am nad oes ambiwlans yn eu cyrraedd yn ddigon cyflym?

**Sue Essex:** Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus am y ffordd yr ydym yn defnyddio'r gair 'tanberfformio', oherwydd ni ddylai hynny fod yn adlewyrchiad o gwbl o'r staff ambiwlans, sy'n perfformio ar safon uchel iawn. Ymwelais â gorsaf ambiwlans Blackweir rai misoedd yn ôl. Eisteddais i lawr gyda'r tîm a thrafod y materion. Teg dweud mai hon yw'r orsaf brysuraaf yng Nghymru; edrychaf ar y ffigurau eto, ond dyna a ddywedwyd wrthyf. I ddychwelyd at bwynt Owen, maent yn gweithio mewn dinas sy'n orlawn o draffig, felly, natur Caerdydd a'r traffig mawr sy'n gyfrifol am rai o'r problemau a wynebant. Cododd y tîm nifer o feysydd diddorol lle yr oeddent yn meddwl y gellid gwneud gwelliannau, a synnwyr cyffredin oedd pob un o'u cynigion, rhaid imi ddweud. Cyflwynais y syniadau hynny i Brian, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn rhan o'r adolygiad. Mae'n ymwneud yn y bôn â'r ffordd y trefnir gwaith, gan gynnwys sut y trefnir contractau y tu allan i oriau, ac ati. Gobeithio y bydd yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn arwain at welliannau a fydd yn galluogi'r staff ambiwlans diwyd hynny i gyrraedd yr amseroedd hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7 (OAQ1010) has been transferred for written answer.

**‘Ar Draws Ffiniau’  
‘Beyond Boundaries’**

**Q8 David Melding:** When will the Minister be meeting the Secretary of State for Wales to discuss the Welsh Assembly Government’s response to ‘Beyond Boundaries’? OAQ0982 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The protocol is that the First Minister meets the Secretary of State, and I meet Nick Ainger, whom I meet regularly to discuss a wide range of matters. I am sure that the Beecham report and our response to it will be on the next agenda.

**David Melding:** Thank you, Minister. I think that you deserve to meet the big cheese, myself. However, I am sure that your meetings are productive. How do you see local service boards developing? You are on record as saying that this was the heart of the reform to get the maximum out of public services and make them as modern and innovative as possible. However, these bodies will exist in a sort of virtual unincorporated state and possibly resemble JCCs rather than anything substantially equipped with the authority to shape public service delivery. If they are going to shape public services they are going to need power and budgets, are they not? Those, inevitably, would have to be drawn from local government. Is that not the case?

**Sue Essex:** I tried to get across to you, although I clearly failed, the fact that these are going to be a different animal from the JCCs—your history lesson—although there will be some similarities. One of the key differences is that the way in which we are operating means that the local service boards will have the Assembly Government sitting round the table. This will be a team of people that deliver across a range of services. The link will be with us, and there will be an agreement with us on what the key areas for delivery are. I think that people will find that considerably reassuring. People that I have spoken to think that that makes sense. People use the term ‘joined up’ and say things such as ‘Oh, so health and local government will be speaking together—that’s good.’ They

**C8 David Melding:** Pryd fydd y Gweinidog yn cyfarfod ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i drafod ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ‘Ar Draws Ffiniau’? (OAQ0982) LGP

**Sue Essex:** Y protocol yw y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cyfarfod â’r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, a byddaf fi’n cyfarfod â Nick Ainger. Byddaf yn cyfarfod ag ef yn rheolaidd i drafod amrywiaeth helaeth o faterion. Bydd adroddiad Beecham a’n hymateb iddo ar yr agenda nesaf, mae’n siŵr.

**David Melding:** Diolch, Weinidog, Yr ydych yn haeddu cyfarfod â’r dyn mawr ei hun, yn fy marn i. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr fod eich cyfarfodydd yn gynhyrchiol. Sut y bydd byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn datblygu yn eich tyb chi? Mae ar gofnod eich bod wedi dweud bod hyn wrth wraidd y diwygiadau i gael y gorau o’r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a’u gwneud mor fodern ac arloesol â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, bydd y cyrff hyn yn bodoli fel rhyw fath o gorff rhithwir anghorfforedig tebyg i gydbwyllgorau ymgynghorol, yn hytrach na rhywbeth o sylwedd gyda’r awdurdod i lunio darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Os ydynt i lunio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, bydd arnynt angen pwerau a chyllidebau, oni fydd? Byddai’r rheini, yn anochel, yn gorfod dod oddi wrth lywodraeth leol. Onid dyna’r gwir?

**Sue Essex:** Ceisiais esbonio wrthyhch, ond imi fethu’n llwyr, mae’n amlwg, y bydd y rhain yn wahanol i’r cydbwyllgorau ymgynghorol—eich gwers hanes—er y bydd ychydig debygrwydd. Un o’r gwahaniaethau allweddol yw bod y ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu yn golygu y bydd gan fyrddau gwasanaethau lleol Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eistedd o amgylch y bwrdd. Bydd hwn yn dîm o bobl a fydd yn darparu ar draws nifer o wasanaethau. Gyda ni y bydd y cysylltiad, a bydd cytundeb â ni ynglŷn â’r meysydd allweddol ar gyfer cyflawni. Credaf y bydd hynny’n rhoi sicrwydd mawr i bobl. Mae pobl yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy yn credu bod hynny’n gwneud synnwyr. Mae pobl yn defnyddio’r term ‘cydgysylltiedig’ ac yn dweud pethau fel ‘O, felly bydd iechyd a

understand that. Unless it is around pooled budgets, it is about ensuring that budgets and performance are joined up.

So it does not necessarily require extra powers or finance. It is a matter of putting responsibility on all those people. Instead of fighting arguments out in the press, as has happened, they have to sit around a table and work it out together. In my experience, that is a remarkable driver of change. That force of people coming together around a table means that they have to solve problems rather than point the finger at others. So, I think that this will be a considerable change. It will take time to embed, and we shall have to ensure that all the local service boards are up to standard. However, by getting the four or five up and running, piloting those and learning from them, I think that we can achieve a consistent approach across Wales. It is about providing a degree of consistency. We have continually heard Members and others talk about this. We have heard it here today. Ann raised the point about Denbighshire. This is about achieving consistency across the piece, which is what I think that the people of Wales want to see.

2.40 p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mewn ateb blaenorol, yr oeddech yn awgrymu y byddai aelodaeth y byrddau hyn yn amrywio o sir i sir. A ydwyf i ddeall felly na fydd gorfodaeth ar gyrff penodol i fod yn aelodau o'r byrddau hyn? Mae awgrym yn yr adroddiad y gellid hyd yn oed edrych ar gyfuno cyllid gwahanol gyrff. Pwy felly fydd yn rheoli'r cyllid hwnnw—ai'r byrddau lleol hyn? Mae cymaint o gwestiynau ynglŷn â hyn, mae'n anodd deall sut yn union y byddant yn gweithredu. A allech ateb y ddau gwestiwn hynny?

**Sue Essex:** As I said, we are going to take this further. In my statement on the Beecham report, I said that, over the next three months, we will be consulting on some of those details. I think that there will be a core membership for every local authority area. When I said that membership would vary, I meant that there will perhaps be a different

llywodraeth leol yn siarad â'i gilydd—da iawn.' Gallant ddeall hynny. Oni bai ei bod yn ymwneud â chyllidebau cyfunol, mae'n ymwneud â sicrhau bod cyllidebau a pherfformiad wedi'u cydgysylltu.

Felly, nid oes angen pwerau na chyllid ychwanegol o reidrwydd. Mae'n fater o osod cyfrifoldeb ar y bobl hynny. Yn lle dadlau yn y wasg, fel sydd wedi digwydd, rhaid iddynt eistedd o amgylch bwrdd a chydweithio. Yn fy mhrofiad i, mae hynny'n sbardun mawr i newid. Mae cael yr holl bobl hynny ynghyd o amgylch bwrdd yn golygu eu bod yn gorfod datrys problemau yn hytrach na phwyntio bys at eraill. Felly, credaf y bydd hyn yn newid mawr. Bydd yn cymryd amser i ymsefydlu, a bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau bod pob un o'r byrddau gwasanaethau lleol yn cyrraedd y safon angenrheidiol. Fodd bynnag, drwy roi'r pedwar neu'r pump ar waith, eu treialu a dysgu oddi wrthynt, credaf y gallwn gael dull cyson ledled Cymru. Mae a wnelo â chael rhywfaint o gysondeb. Yr ydym wedi clywed Gweinidogion ac eraill yn sôn am hyn o hyd. Yr ydym wedi clywed hyn yma heddiw. Cododd Ann y pwynt ynglŷn â sir Ddinbych. Mae a wnelo hyn â chael cysondeb yn gyffredinol, sy'n rhywbeth y mae pobl Cymru am ei weld, mi gredaf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** In a previous response, you suggested that membership of these boards would vary from county to county. Am I to understand therefore that specific bodies will not be compelled to be members of these boards? There is a suggestion in the report that pooling the budgets of various bodies could be considered. Therefore, who will control that funding—will it be these local boards? There are so many questions around this, it is difficult to see how exactly these boards will operate. Could you answer those two questions?

**Sue Essex:** Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn mynd i ddatblygu hyn ymhellach. Yn fy natganiad am adroddiad Beecham, dywedais y byddwn yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â rhai o'r manylion hynny dros y tri mis nesaf. Credaf y bydd aelodaeth graidd i bob ardal awdurdod lleol. Pan ddywedais y byddai aelodaeth yn amrywio, yr oeddwn yn meddwl

group of people in Gwynedd, for example—community enterprises operate much more strongly in Gwynedd than they do in Cardiff, so you might want a secondary representative from that organisation. However, there will be core members, including, where relevant, non-devolved groups, including the voluntary sector. Therefore, we will be working on that to try to get that level of clarity.

On pooled budgets, there would be a responsibility, but each authority, and each person on the local service boards, will have to go back and respond to the parent organisation. These boards have operated in England—there are examples of this—and, as Sir Jeremy said, by and large there has been a good experience. Where they have not worked properly is where there has been a complete lack of government involvement. This is the difference in Wales—we have the Assembly Government, and there will be the relationship between the local and the strategic, which will help to overcome some of the difficulties found in England.

y byddai grŵp gwahanol o bobl yng Ngwynedd, er enghraifft-mae mentrau cymunedol lawer yn gweithredu lawer yn gryfach yng Ngwynedd nag ydynt yng Nghaerdydd, felly, efallai y byddech am gael ail gynrychiolydd o'r mudiad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bydd aelodau craidd, gan gynnwys, lle y mae'n berthnasol, grwpiau sydd heb eu datganoli, gan gynnwys y sector gwirfoddol. Felly, byddwn yn gweithio ar hynny i geisio cael yr eglurdeb hwnnw.

O ran cyllidebau cyfunol, fe fyddai cyfrifoldeb, ond bydd yn rhaid i bob awdurdod, a phob unigolyn ar y byrddau gwasanaethau lleol, fynd yn ôl ac ymateb i'r rhiant sefydliad. Mae'r byrddau hyn wedi gweithredu yn Lloegr—mae yna enghreifftiau o hyn—ac fel y dywedodd Syr Jeremy, ar y cyfan cafwyd profiad da. Y rhai nad ydynt wedi gweithio'n dda yw'r rheini lle na fu dim ymwneud gan y llywodraeth. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth yng Nghymru—mae gennym ni Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a bydd perthynas rhwng y lleol a'r strategol a fydd yn fodd i oresgyn rhai o'r anawsterau a gafwyd yn Lloegr.

### **Buddsoddi mewn Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Investing in Public Services**

**Q9 Helen Mary Jones:** What are the Minister's priorities for investing in public services? OAQ0995 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Our priorities for public services were set out in the draft budget. The extra £810 million investment next year—2007-08—will deliver on our top 10 'Wales: A Better Country' commitments, as well as a range of other programmes, including £31 million more in funding for social care, £16 million more for local roads, and £7 million for extra investment in schools.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Your Government has been saying for several years now that the protection of looked-after children, and promoting their interests, is a priority. How

**C9 Helen Mary Jones:** Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0995 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Cafodd ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu gosod allan yn y gyllideb ddrafft. Bydd y buddsoddiad ychwanegol o £810 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf—2007-2008—yn helpu cyflawni ein deg ymrwymiad pennaf yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', yn ogystal ag amrywiaeth o raglenni eraill, gan gynnwys £31 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer cyllid gofal cymdeithasol, £16 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer ffyrdd lleol, a £7 miliwn ar gyfer buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn ysgolion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi bod yn dweud ers llawer blwyddyn bellach fod amddiffyn plant sy'n cael gofal, a hyrwyddo eu buddiannau, yn flaenoriaeth.

will your budget proposals invest in the future of looked-after children in Wales?

**Sue Essex:** That is more of a finance question. I can give you the details of how that breaks down. We are doing an innovative piece of work across the piece to look at budgeting for children, and pulling out the budgets. Therefore, it is not just about looked-after children, but pulls out from the budget where there are budget lines affecting children, so that we can see that and can then track trends in expenditure. That will, hopefully, be in place next year.

**William Graham:** You will have noticed speculation in the press following the fact that your opposite number at Westminster has said that he would not hesitate to cap excessive council tax increases in England. Would you follow the same path in Wales?

**Sue Essex:** You know what I have done in previous years. We do not have to cap any authority. One year, we set out the principles, and consulted on them; last year, we got reasonable council tax rises without going that far. I think that a 4.3 per cent settlement is reasonable, and a good settlement for Wales; I believe that it was largely welcomed across the local government community. I know that there are strong pressures every year, but the message that I will give out at present is to keep council tax to a reasonable level. We are still between the draft budget and the final budget for local government, so there might still be some representations to come in, so I will wait until then. However, that would be my approach.

Sut y bydd eich cynigion ar gyfer y gyllideb yn buddsoddi yn nyfodol plant sy'n cael gofal yng Nghymru?

**Sue Essex:** Cwestiwn ynglŷn â chyllid yw hwnnw mewn gwirionedd. Gallaf roi'r manylion ichi. Yr ydym yn gwneud gwaith arloesol yn gyffredinol wrth edrych ar gyllidebu ar gyfer plant, ac wrth nodi'r cyllidebau. Felly, nid yw'n ymwneud â phlant sy'n cael gofal yn unig, ond â'r gyllideb lle mae llinellau cyllideb yn effeithio ar blant, fel y gallwn weld hynny ac fel y gallwn wedyn olrhain tueddiadau mewn gwariant. Bydd hynny, gobeithio, ar waith y flwyddyn nesaf.

**William Graham:** Byddwch wedi sylwi ar y dyfalu yn y wasg ar ôl i'ch cyd-Weinidog yn San Steffan ddweud na fyddai'n petruso cyn capio cynnydd gormodol yn y dreth gyngor yn Lloegr. A fydddech yn dilyn yr un trywydd yng Nghymru?

**Sue Essex:** Fe wyddoch fy mod wedi gwneud hynny mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Nid oes rhaid inni gapio'r un awdurdod. Un flwyddyn, gosodwyd allan yr egwyddorion ac ymgynghorwyd arnynt: y llynedd, cafwyd cynnydd rhesymol yn y dreth gyngor heb fynd mor bell â hynny. Credaf fod setliad o 4.3 y cant yn rhesymol, ac yn setliad da i Gymru. Credaf fod llywodraeth leol wedi croesawu hynny i raddau helaeth. Gwn fod pwysau mawr bob blwyddyn, ond y neges a roddaf ar hyn o bryd yw cadw'r dreth gyngor ar lefel resymol. Yr ydym yn dal rhwng y gyllideb ddrafft a'r gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, felly efallai fod rhai sylwadau i ddod i mewn. Felly, arhosaf tan hynny. Fodd bynnag, dyna sut y byddwn yn gweithredu.

### **Diwygio'r Heddlu Police Reform**

**C10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau na fydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yn cario baich cost y cynlluniau a roddwyd o'r neilltu i ddiwygio'r heddlu? OAQ0986 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** As you know, the proposals for police reform came from the Westminster Government, not from us, so the

**Q10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** How will the Minister ensure that council tax payers will not be burdened by the cost of the abandoned plans for police reform? OAQ0986 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Fel y gwyddoch, cynigiwyd y diwygiadau ar gyfer yr heddlu gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, nid gennym ni,



responsibility lies with it. I believe that the payments announced met half the costs—I know that it covered one authority completely; I believe that that was Gwent. The other three authorities were somewhat adrift from what they expected, but they were relatively—I draw attention to my use of that word—small sums in the total police budget line. I am sure that police authorities can manage those in their reserves.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Byddwch chi a phob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn gwybod bod awdurdodau'r heddlu dan bwysau ariannol mawr yn barod o ran y praesept, yn arbennig oherwydd y problemau gyda chynlluniau pensiwn. Mae eu cyllidebau eisoes dan bwysau enfawr. Er eich bod yn dweud mai canran fach o'r cyfanswm yw hyn, mae'n rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar y praesept ac ar bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor. Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i drafod gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan yr angen iddi ddigolledu awdurdodau heddlu yn llawn am y costau hyn? Llywodraeth San Steffan a orfododd y diwygio hwn ar heddluoedd heb wrando ar eu hymateb, sef ei fod yn ddiangen yng Nghymru.

**Sue Essex:** You know that my colleague, Edwina Hart, takes the lead on this issue and she has written about it. For my part, I have been in discussions with police authorities—in fact, I am meeting them again soon—to look at the pressures. Like everyone else, as I have just explained to William, I think that there are pressures out there, but I expect local authorities and the police to act reasonably when setting council tax or precept levels.

felly, y Llywodraeth honno sy'n gyfrifol am hynny. Credaf fod y taliadau a gyhoeddwyd wedi talu hanner y costau-gwn fod y costau wedi eu talu'n llawn mewn un awdurdod; credaf mai Gwent oedd hwnnw. Yr oedd y tri awdurdod arall wedi cael ychydig yn llai na'r disgwyl, ond symiau cymharol fach oeddent-hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at y gair hwnnw-yng nghyfanswm llinell cyllideb yr heddlu. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gall awdurdodau'r heddlu dalu'r rheini o'u cronfeydd wrth gefn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You, and all other Assembly Members, will know that police authorities already face great financial pressures in terms of the precept, especially as a result of problems with pension schemes. Their budgets are already under great pressure. Although you say that this represents a small percentage of the total budget, it places additional strain on the precept and on council tax payers. What do you intend to do to discuss with the Westminster Government the need to fully compensate police authorities for these costs? This reform was forced on police forces by the Westminster Government without listening to their response, namely that it was unnecessary in Wales.

**Sue Essex:** Gwyddoch mai Edwina Hart, fy nghyd-Weinidog, sy'n arwain ar y mater hwn ac mae wedi ysgrifennu amdano. O'm rhan i, yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gydag awdurdodau heddlu—yn wir, byddaf yn cyfarfod â hwy eto'n fuan—i ystyried y pwysau. Fel pawb arall, fel yr wyf newydd ei esbonio wrth William, credaf fod yna bwysau, ond disgwyliaf i awdurdodau lleol a'r heddlu weithredu'n rhesymol wrth bennu lefelau'r dreth gyngor neu braeseptau.

### **Budd-daliadau Benefit Take-up**

**Q11 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is working with local government partners to maximise benefit take-up? OAQ1017 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** This year, we have allocated £1.5 million to local authorities to increase council tax benefit take-up. We are also working with

**C11 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid llywodraeth leol i sicrhau bod y nifer mwyaf posibl yn manteisio ar fudd-daliadau? OAQ1017 (LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Eleni, yr ydym wedi dyrannu £1.5 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar

the Department for Work and Pensions and local authorities on a one-stop-shop approach with regard to the way that older people access public services. Initially, the LinkAge scheme, with which I am sure that you are familiar, concentrates on maximising income and the take-up of benefits.

fudd-daliadau treth gyngor. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ac awdurdodau lleol hefyd ar ddull siop-un-stop yn y ffordd y mae pobl hŷn yn gallu cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yn y lle cyntaf, mae'r cynllun LinkAge, y gwyddoch amdano, mae'n siŵr, yn canolbwyntio ar gynyddu incwm i'r eithaf a sicrhau bod y nifer uchaf posibl yn manteisio ar fudd-daliadau.

**Huw Lewis:** LinkAge represents good progress, but you will be aware that my review of overindebtedness, which was completed a little while ago, placed some emphasis on community-based delivery for income maximisation initiatives, which included benefit take-up initiatives as part of that. How do you see that progressing?

**Huw Lewis:** Mae LinkAge yn enghraifft o gynnydd da, ond fe wyddoch fod fy adolygiad o orddyledusrwydd, a gwblhawyd ychydig yn ôl, wedi rhoi rhywfaint o bwyslais ar gyflwyno mentrau i gynyddu incwm i'r eithaf yn y gymuned. Yr oedd hynny'n cynnwys mentrau i annog pobl i fanteisio ar fudd-daliadau. Beth yw eich barn am gynnydd y mentrau hynny?

**Sue Essex:** That is a good point: we need to concentrate our resources where there can be the maximum take-up. If I look beyond council tax benefits, to, largely, Edwina's realm, anything that could work in those communities, first to stop people from getting into difficult debt situations, and to maximise their take-up, is important work. I have seen some interesting figures showing that the intensive work that has been carried out has increased benefit take-up by 18 per cent. That is a big increase, and it can make a real difference to the weekly budget of those people who get those increases.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da: mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau lle gellir sicrhau y bydd y nifer mwyaf posibl yn manteisio ar fudd-daliadau. Os edrychaf y tu hwnt i fudd-daliadau treth gyngor, i faes Edwina yn bennaf, mae unrhyw beth a allai weithio yn y cymunedau hynny, yn gyntaf i rwystro pobl rhag wynebu sefyllfaoedd anodd gyda dyledion, ac i sicrhau bod y nifer mwyaf posibl yn manteisio ar fudd-daliadau, yn waith pwysig. Yr wyf wedi gweld ffigurau diddorol sy'n dangos bod y gwaith caled a wnaed wedi arwain at gynnydd o 18 y cant yn y nifer sy'n manteisio ar fudd-daliadau. Mae hwnnw'n gynnydd mawr, a gall wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i gyllideb wythnosol y bobl hynny sy'n cael y cynnydd hwnnw.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills**

### **Gwella Ysgolion Improving Schools**

**Q1 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister update us on her policies for improving schools in Mid and West Wales? OAQ1134(ELL)

**C1 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am ei pholisiau ar gyfer gwella ysgolion yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ1134(ELL)

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** Schools in Powys, Ceredigion and Gwynedd,

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Mae ysgolion ym Mhowys, Ceredigion a

in common with those in all other parts of Wales, are benefiting from the implementation of our key policies, as set out in 'The Learning Country—Vision into Action'. These provide a strong foundation for improving the performance of all our schools.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for that response. She will be aware that many local authorities—half of them last year, but, this year, rather more than that; indeed, nearly all local authorities—are passing on the efficiency cuts that are required by the Government onto schools. Some authorities are doing that directly and some are doing it indirectly by not funding, for example, teachers' superannuation increases. What is she saying to those authorities, bearing in mind that we are facing the prospect, according to authorities throughout Wales—not just in Mid and West Wales, though certainly there—of serious redundancies in many of our schools? These so-called efficiency cuts are now cutting into the bone and are not dealing with any surplus.

**Jane Davidson:** As the Finance Minister has told you on a number of occasions, and I am happy to reaffirm, we have jointly put out a message to all local authorities that just passing on efficiency savings as a third-party cut to schools is not acceptable. We have written to local authorities to say that. We have also said, however, as the chief inspector said in her report on education in Wales, that local authorities have to deal with demographic issues in terms of spare places in our schools. We have already said in the Chamber that there is a prediction of 100,000 empty places in our schools by 2013, if insufficient action is taken. I am sure that you would not want to see funding going to empty places in our schools.

2.50 p.m.

We do not have any evidence to suggest that efficiency savings are leading to teacher redundancies. I would be happy for you to pass on evidence that efficiency savings are leading to teacher redundancies, because our

Gwynedd, fel yr ysgolion hynny ym mhob rhan arall o Gymru, yn cael budd yn sgil gweithredu ein polisiau allweddol, fel y maent wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu - Gweledigaeth ar Waith'. Mae'r rhain yn rhoi sylfaen gref ar gyfer gwella perfformiad pob un o'n hysgolion.

**Nick Bourne:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Fe wyddoch fod nifer o awdurdodau lleol—eu hanner y llynedd, ond llawer mwy ohonynt eleni; yn wir, bron pob awdurdod lleol—yn trosglwyddo'r toriadau effeithlonrwydd sy'n ofynnol gan y Llywodraeth i ysgolion. Mae rhai awdurdodau yn gwneud hynny'n uniongyrchol ac eraill yn ei wneud yn anuniongyrchol, er enghraifft, drwy beidio ag ariannu cynnydd ym mhensiynau athrawon. Beth mae'n ei ddweud wrth yr awdurdodau hynny, o gofio ein bod, yn ôl awdurdodau ledled Cymru—nid yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn unig, ond yn bendant yno—yn wynebu colledion swyddi difrifol mewn llawer ysgol? Mae'r toriadau effeithlonrwydd honedig yn awr yn torri at yr asgwrn heb ddelio ag unrhyw leoedd gwag.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi sôn wrthyh droeon, ac yr wyf yn fodlon cadarnhau hynny, yr ydym wedi cyfleu neges ar y cyd i bob awdurdod lleol nad yw trosglwyddo arbedion effeithlonrwydd fel toriad trydydd parti i ysgolion yn dderbyniol. Yr ydym wedi ysgrifennu at awdurdodau lleol i ddweud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd wedi dweud, fel y dywedodd y prif arolygydd yn ei hadroddiad ar addysg yng Nghymru, fod angen i awdurdodau lleol ddelio â materion demograffeg o ran y lleoedd dros ben yn ein hysgolion. Yr ydym eisoes wedi sôn yn y Siambr am y rhagfynegiad y bydd 100,000 o leoedd gwag yn ein hysgolion erbyn 2013, os na chymerir camau digonol. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydddech am weld arian yn cael ei wario ar leoedd gwag yn ein hysgolion.

Nid oes gennym ddim tystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn arwain at golli swyddi athrawon. Byddwn yn fodlon ichi gyflwyno tystiolaeth imi fod arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn arwain at golli

view, from the Assembly Government, is that the efficiency savings must be ploughed back in to front-line learning. However, there is a major challenge out there for schools in terms of the demographics.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, I am sure that you would agree that an important part of school improvements is making capital investment in improving existing buildings and in building new ones. It has been put to me by the governors and parents of Ysgol Gymraeg Brynsierfel in Llanelli that Carmarthenshire County Council is favouring English-medium schools over Welsh-medium ones in terms of capital investment. That is, of course, a matter for Carmarthenshire, but what you are able to do, working with the local authorities in mid and west Wales, to ensure that their capital development programmes treat both languages equally and that the programmes are consistent with their Welsh-language schemes?

**Jane Davidson:** We ask local authorities to produce asset management plans, to ensure that the investment is prioritised according to the building needs. This has proved to be quite a task for a number of local authorities and despite the fact that we wanted the asset management plans to be in place two years ago, we are still waiting for some local authorities to complete the process. What we require from the Assembly Government is that the additional investment made available by us is spent according to proper priorities in terms of the schools. It is up to the local authority to prioritise, but I am confident that we would not accept a local authority putting forward plans that disadvantaged either the Welsh-medium or the English-medium sectors. We want to see local authorities making it absolutely clear that they are prioritising investment on the basis of the needs of pupils.

swyddi athrawon, oherwydd ein barn ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yw ei bod yn rhaid buddsoddi'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn ôl mewn dysgu rheng flaen. Fodd bynnag, mae her fawr yn wynebu ysgolion o ran demograffeg.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod gwneud buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn gwella adeiladau presennol ac adeiladu rhai newydd yn rhan bwysig o wella ysgolion. Mae llywodraethwyr a rhieni Ysgol Gymraeg Brynsierfel yn Llanelli wedi sôn wrthyf fod Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn ffafrio ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg dros ysgolion Cymraeg o ran buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Wrth gwrs, mater i sir Gaerfyrddin yw hwnnw, ond beth y gallwch ei wneud, drwy weithio gyda'r awdurdodau lleol yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, i sicrhau bod eu rhaglenni datblygu cyfalaf yn trin y ddwy iaith yn gyfartal, a bod y rhaglenni'n gyson â'u cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg?

**Jane Davidson:** Gofynnwn i awdurdodau lleol gynhyrchu cynlluniau rheoli asedau, er mwyn sicrhau bod y buddsoddiad yn cael ei flaenoriaethu yn ôl anghenion adeiladau. Mae hyn wedi bod yn dipyn o her i nifer o awdurdodau lleol, ac er ein bod am weld y cynlluniau rheoli asedau ar waith ddwy flynedd yn ôl, yr ydym yn dal i aros i rai awdurdodau lleol gwblhau'r broses. Yr hyn yr ydym yn gofyn amdano gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yw bod y buddsoddiad ychwanegol a neilltuir gennym yn cael ei wario yn ôl blaenoriaethau cywir o ran yr ysgolion. Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol yw blaenoriaethu, ond yr wyf yn hyderus na fyddem yn derbyn cynlluniau a gyflwynir gan awdurdod lleol a fyddai'n golygu bod naill ai'r sector cyfrwng Cymraeg neu'r sector cyfrwng Saesneg dan anfantais. Yr ydym am weld awdurdodau lleol yn dweud yn gwbl glir eu bod yn blaenoriaethu buddsoddiad ar sail anghenion disgyblion.

### Cynorthwyr Meithrin Nursery Assistants

**C2 Owen John Thomas:** Faint o bobl sydd wedi cael hyfforddiant o dan gynllun y Llywodraeth i greu mwy o gynorthwyr meithrin a all ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y

**Q2 Owen John Thomas:** How many people have had training under the Welsh Assembly Government scheme to lead to more nursery assistants who can teach through the medium

Gymraeg? OAQ1144(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Drwy raglen 'Iaith Pawb' Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac ar y cyd â Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin a Choleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, hyd yn hyn mae tua 450 o ymarferwyr blynyddoedd cynnar, Cymraeg eu hiaith, ychwanegol wedi eu hyfforddi ac mae 300 arall ar fin dechrau hyfforddi, neu eisoes wedi dechrau.

**Owen John Thomas:** Dyma un o lwyddiannau 'Iaith Pawb' ond mae'n bwysig bod y cynllun yn cael ei fonitro. Sut yr ydych yn darganfod faint o'r 450 o bobl sydd wedi bod ar y cyrsiau sydd wedi mynd i ddysgu mewn cylchoedd meithrin, unedau meithrin neu yn y cyfnod sylfaen?

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch yn fawr am y datganiad fod y cynllun yn llwyddiannus; cytunaf â chi ar hynny. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y 300 arall yn dechrau ar y cynllun hwn hefyd. O ran monitro faint o bobl sy'n addysgu neu'n cymryd rhan yn yr agenda blynyddoedd cynnar, nid wyf yn gwybod yr ateb yn awr, ond gofynnaf i'm swyddogion am wybodaeth bellach i chi.

**Lisa Francis:** Minister, I do not know if the scheme that you have just outlined is related to the national guidance. You have stated that the national guidance, 'School Support Staff—The Way Forward', issued by the National Joint Council for Local Government Services, needs to take into account, and have regard to, local authority policies in respect of training nursery assistants. How does that guidance ensure that local authorities are obliged to provide more training for nursery assistants to teach through the medium of Welsh? Also, following on from Owen John's question, how is this monitored, and what key performance indicators are used?

**Jane Davidson:** A simple performance indicator is used in terms of the number of people who obtain qualifications. We have a number of people who have successfully been through the Cam Wrth Gam programme, for which people can qualify at levels 2 and 3, and a number have been through the Geiriau Bach programme, for

of Welsh? OAQ1144(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** To date, through the Welsh Assembly Government's 'Iaith Pawb' programme, and in partnership with Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin and Trinity College, Carmarthen, some 450 additional early years Welsh-medium practitioners have been trained and a further 300 have started, or are about to commence, training.

**Owen John Thomas:** This is one of the successes of 'Iaith Pawb', but it is important that the scheme be monitored. How do you find out how many of the 450 people who have attended the courses have gone on to teach in playgroups, nursery units or in the foundation stage?

**Jane Davidson:** Thank you very much for saying that the scheme is successful; I agree with you on that. I look forward to the other 300 starting this scheme also. In terms of monitoring how many people are teaching or taking part in the early years agenda, I do not know the answer now, but I will ask my officials for further information for you.

**Lisa Francis:** Weinidog, ni wn a yw'r cynllun yr ydych newydd ei amlinellu yn gysylltiedig â'r canllawiau cenedlaethol. Yr ydych wedi dweud bod angen i'r canllawiau cenedlaethol 'School Support Staff—The Way Forward', a gyhoeddwyd gan y Cydgyngor Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Gwasanaethau Llywodraeth Leol, ystyried polisiau awdurdodau lleol mewn perthynas â hyfforddi cynorthwywyr meithrin. Sut y mae'r canllawiau hynny'n sicrhau bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddarparu mwy o hyfforddiant i gynorthwywyr meithrin addysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? Hefyd, yn dilyn cwestiwn Owen John, sut y caiff hyn ei fonitro, a pha ddangosyddion perfformiad allweddol a ddefnyddir?

**Jane Davidson:** Defnyddir dangosydd perfformiad syml o ran nifer y bobl sy'n ennill cymwysterau. Mae nifer o bobl wedi dilyn y rhaglen Cam Wrth Gam yn llwyddiannus, lle gall pobl ennill cymwysterau ar lefelau 2 a 3, ac mae nifer wedi dilyn y rhaglen Geiriau Bach, lle gall pobl ennill cymwysterau ar lefel 4. Yn

which people can qualify at level 4. We clearly need people who are qualified at levels right through the system, to work in, and lead on, early years and childcare initiatives.

There is specific funding of £7 million under 'Iaith Pawb', with a further £4 million for training under Flying Start. There has also been a specific sum of £1 million for training under the foundation phase and, subject to budget discussions being completed, that will be substantially up-lifted for next year as we move towards implementation. There is also the work that the Care Council for Wales has done, looking at workforce issues, which we are taking into account.

amlwg, mae arnom angen pobl sydd â chymhwyster ar lefelau ar draws y system, i weithio ar fentrau blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant a'u harwain.

Mae cyllid penodol o £7 miliwn o dan 'Iaith Pawb' a £4 miliwn arall ar gyfer hyfforddiant o dan Dechrau'n Deg. Neilltuwyd swm penodol o £1 filiwn hefyd ar gyfer hyfforddiant o dan y cyfnod sylfaen, ac yn amodol ar gwblhau trafodaethau ynghylch y gyllideb, caiff y swm hwnnw ei godi'n sylweddol am y flwyddyn nesaf wrth inni symud tuag at y broses weithredu. Mae Cyngor Gofal Cymru hefyd wedi gwneud gwaith sy'n edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â'r gweithlu, ac yr ydym yn ystyried y gwaith hwnnw.

### Gwasanaethau Arlwy Catering Services

**Q3 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on catering services in schools in Wales? OAQ1109(ELL)

**C3 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaethau arlwy mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru? OAQ1109(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** School catering services are crucial to the successful delivery of 'Appetite for Life', our review of school food and drink. I am happy to announce today the first phase of a £4.3 million funding package to support local authorities and schools in driving forward improvements to school food through a whole-school approach.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae gwasanaethau arlwy mewn ysgolion yn hanfodol er mwyn inni lwyddo i gyflawni 'Blas am Oes', ein hadolygiad o fwyd a diod mewn ysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch cyhoeddi heddiw y cam cyntaf mewn pecyn ariannu gwerth £4.3 miliwn i gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion i wella bwyd ysgol drwy fabwysiadu dull ysgol gyfan.

**David Melding:** I am pleased that my question allowed you to make that encouraging announcement. However, there is some concern about the viability of catering services as we shift towards eating more healthily, and the press has carried some daunting stories about crises and so on. Should we not be calmer and insist on promoting healthy eating, while realising that it is part of a wider culture that includes teaching about and understanding food, as well as occasionally allowing options such as chips? We need a balanced approach, but the move to healthy eating is crucial, and we need the patience to get through the initial stage when sales fall off a little.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn falch bod fy nghwestiwn wedi'ch galluogi i wneud y cyhoeddiad calonogol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae yna ychydig bryder am ddichonoldeb gwasanaethau arlwy wrth inni symud tuag at fwyta'n iachach, ac mae yna storïau digalon am argyfyngau ac ati wedi ymddangos yn y wasg. Oni ddylem bwylo a mynnu hyrwyddo bwyta'n iach gan sylweddoli ei fod yn rhan o ddiwylliant ehangach sy'n cynnwys addysgu am fwyd a deall bwyd, yn ogystal â chaniatáu dewisiadau fel sglodion yn achlysurol? Mae angen inni gael dull cytbwys, ond mae'r cam tuag at fwyta'n iach yn hanfodol, ac mae angen inni fod yn amyneddgar drwy'r cam cychwynol pan fydd gwerthiannau yn gostwng ychydig.

**Jane Davidson:** I saw your health spokesperson nodding vigorously at the notion of chips.

You are absolutely right that we need to be calmer. One of the outcomes of having the 'Appetite for Life' and the food in schools working group, which involved people from a large range of setting, was that we know that, essentially, the quality of school meals has improved. We need to do more to ensure that it is better, but we also need to ensure that we do more about public confidence. Authorities that have been calm and disciplined and have made sure that their staff are properly trained and that they have the right facilities in place are seeing that they are maintaining and even increasing the number of children who are taking school meals. Funding is available through the school buildings funding as well as through the additional funding that I am making available today towards kitchens. As a Government, we continue to support the whole-school and whole-day approach, all the way through from early breakfasts to healthy breaks and school lunches. That does not mean that you take chips off the menu completely, but it does mean that you look at a moderate approach. Where we can engage school councils in that dialogue, that is also particularly effective.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn sicr, yr ydym yn croesawu'r datganiad a wnaed heddiw, ac yn cefnogi'n llwyr yr hyn a ddywedodd David Melding ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd ein hagwedd wrth gyflwyno'r mater hwn. Drwy geisio gorfodi plant a phobl ifanc i wneud rhywbeth, yr ydych yn aml yn eu gyrru i'r cyfeiriad arall. Rhaid eu haddysgu, a rhaid bod ganddynt berchenogaeth dros hyn, ond mae angen bod yn gynhwysfawr hefyd. Yr ydych wedi sôn am edrych ar y diwrnod cyfan, ond mae'n bwysig cyplysu hynny â digon o ymarfer corff; os ydych yn bwyta'n iach, ond os nad ydych yn gwneud ymarfer corff, ni fydd hynny o les ichi yn y pen draw. Wrth addysgu pobl ifanc, mae angen sicrhau hefyd eu bod yn ymwybodol o'r cynnyrch sydd ar gael yn lleol. Mae'n rhaid ceisio sicrhau pwrcasu lleol fel bod plant a phobl ifanc yn deall bod y bwyd yn cael ei

**Jane Davidson:** Sylwais fod eich llefarydd iechyd yn ysgwyd ei ben yn egniol pan soniwyd am sglodion.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, mae angen inni bwylllo. Un o ganlyniadau 'Blas am Oes' a'r gweithgor bwyd mewn ysgolion, a oedd yn cynnwys pobl o amrywiaeth eang o leoliadau, oedd ein bod yn gwybod, yn y bôn, fod ansawdd prydau bwyd ysgol wedi gwella. Mae angen inni wneud mwy i sicrhau bod hyn yn gwella, ond mae angen inni sicrhau hefyd ein bod yn gwneud mwy i wella hyder y cyhoedd. Mae awdurdodau sydd wedi ymateb mewn ffordd bwylllog a disgybledig, gan sicrhau bod eu staff yn cael eu hyfforddi'n briodol a bod y cyfleusterau cywir ar gael iddynt, yn llwyddo i gynnal niferoedd a hyd yn oed yn gweld cynnydd yn nifer y plant sy'n cael prydau bwyd yn yr ysgol. Mae arian ar gael drwy'r arian adeiladau ysgolion yn ogystal â thrwy'r arian ychwanegol yr wyf yn ei gyhoeddi heddiw ar gyfer ceginau. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn parhau i gefnogi dull yr ysgol gyfan a'r diwrnod cyfan, o frewast cynnar i amseroedd egwyl a chinio iach. Nid yw hynny'n golygu dileu sglodion oddi ar y fwydlen yn gyfan gwbl, ond yn hytrach mae'n golygu ystyried dull cymedrol. Lle y gallwn gynnwys cynghorau ysgol yn y drafodaeth honno, mae hynny'n arbennig o effeithiol hefyd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We certainly welcome the announcement made today, and fully support what David Melding said about the importance of the way we present this issue. By trying to force children and young people to do something, you often send them in the opposite direction. They must be educated, and they must have ownership of this issue, but we also need to be comprehensive in our approach. You mentioned looking at the whole day, but it is important that that is done hand in hand with adequate physical activity; eating healthily but not taking part in any physical activity will not be beneficial in the long run. In educating young people, we also need to ensure that they are aware of the produce available locally. We must try to ensure local purchasing so that children and young people understand that the food is freshly produced,

gynhyrchu'n ffres ac yn cael ei dyfu yn eu hardal. Bydd yr agwedd gynhwysfawr honno yn arwain at brydau mwy maethlon a phroses fydd yn hybu a chefnogi'r economi leol.

and is grown in their area. Such a comprehensive approach will lead to more nutritious meals, and a process that will promote and support the local economy.

3.00 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn cytuno, a dyna pam bod argymhelliad yn y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy i awdurdodau lleol ystyried defnyddio cynnyrch lleol a thymhorol, ac yn y blaen. Mae bron £20 miliwn wedi ei ddarparu ar gyfer yr agenda bwyta'n iach yn ystod y flwyddyn hon, felly yr wyf yn cytuno.

**Jane Davidson:** I agree, and that is why there is a recommendation in the sustainable development scheme that local authorities should consider using local and seasonal produce, and so on. Almost £20 million has been provided for the healthy eating agenda this year, therefore I agree with you.

### **Dyfodol Dysgu Gydol Oes The Future of Lifelong Learning**

**Q4 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of lifelong learning in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney? OAQ1122(ELL)

**C4 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol dysgu gydol oes ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni? OAQ1122(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Several exciting opportunities are available in these areas. They include expanding and improving the RISE learning network and community learning in Caerphilly, the development of a lifelong learning campus in Merthyr Tydfil and Blaenau Gwent, and new vocational and skill-based 14-19 learning pathways via partnership working.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae sawl cyfle cyffrous ar gael yn y meysydd hyn. Maent yn cynnwys ehangu a gwella'r rhwydwaith dysgu RISE a'r gymuned ddysgu yng Nghaerffili, datblygu campws dysgu gydol oes ym Merthyr Tudful a Blaenau Gwent, a llwybrau dysgu 14-19 galwedigaethol newydd ac ar sail sgiliau drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth.

**Huw Lewis:** You will be aware that the Heads of the Valleys strategy and the Wales spatial plan refer to the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to making Merthyr Tydfil a university town. What is your timetable for delivery on the long-awaited lifelong learning campus for Merthyr Tydfil?

**Huw Lewis:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd a chynllun gofodol Cymru yn cyfeirio at ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud Merthyr Tudful yn dref brifysgol. Beth yw eich amserlen ar gyfer darparu'r campws dysgu gydol oes ym Merthyr Tudful y bu hir aros amdano?

**Jane Davidson:** The first stage of that process has already happened because of the relationship between the University of Glamorgan and the further education college in Merthyr Tydfil. You and I were there to celebrate the setting up of that new partnership. We are now into the second phase in terms of developing the lifelong learning centre in Merthyr Tydfil. There were recommendations in terms of a pathfinder approach that was undertaken by Education and Learning Wales in March 2006, and the

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r cam cyntaf yn y broses honno eisoes wedi digwydd, diolch i'r berthynas rhwng Prifysgol Morgannwg a'r coleg addysg bellach ym Merthyr Tudful. Yr oeddech chi a mi yno i ddathlu sefydlu'r bartneriaeth newydd honno. Yr ydym bellach yn yr ail gam o ddatblygu'r ganolfan dysgu gydol oes ym Merthyr Tudful. Cafwyd argymhellion o ran dull braenaru a wnaed gan Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ym mis Mawrth 2006, a bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn cynnal ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus ffurfiol ar



local authority will take forward a formal hynny.  
public consultation on that.

### **Cyllido Addysg Uwch Higher Education Funding**

**C5 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido addysg uwch yng Nghymru? OAQ1148(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn bod cyllideb ddrafft y Cynulliad yn cynnwys arian ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg uwch eto eleni. Bydd yr arian a dderbynnir o gronfeydd cyhoeddus yn fwy na'r incwm a gynhyrchir drwy'r ffioedd dysgu newydd dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fel y gwyddoch, cyflwynwyd adroddiad Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ar gyllido addysg uwch i'ch pwyllgor yn gymharol ddiweddar. Pan gawsoch eich penodi yn Weinidog yn 2000, yr oedd y bwlch cyllido rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn llai na £2 filiwn. Yn 2004, yr oedd y bwlch wedi cynyddu i dros £40 miliwn. Beth aeth o'i le?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid wyf yn meddwl bod unrhyw beth wedi mynd o'i le. Bydd agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, y cyfeiriais ati sawl gwaith, yn sicrhau bod addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn gallu gweithio yn agosach gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gan dderbyn mwy o arian gan gynghorau ymchwil, er enghraifft, a chreu mwy o gyfleoedd i bobl sydd am ddilyn addysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Bydd hefyd yn gwneud mwy o ran yr economi, ac yn y blaen. Mae'r agenda yn gref iawn.

**Lynne Neagle:** Without addressing the needs of young children in deprived communities, we will not see an increase in children from those communities entering higher education. It is a link that the opposition consistently fails to take into account. Can you provide an assurance that the opposition's obsession with providing more money for the best educated will not stop money going into early-years education and that early-years education remains the priority for the Assembly Government?

**Q5 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on higher education funding in Wales? OAQ1148(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** I was very pleased that the draft Assembly budget contained additional funds for higher education again this year. The support provided from public funds will be over and above the new tuition fee income generated over the next three years.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** As you know, the report by Higher Education Funding Council for Wales on higher education funding was presented to your committee fairly recently. When you were appointed Minister in 2000, the funding gap between Wales and England was less than £2 million. In 2004, the gap had increased to more than £40 million. What has gone wrong?

**Jane Davidson:** I do not believe anything has gone wrong. The Assembly Government's agenda, to which I have referred several times, will ensure that higher education in Wales can work more closely with the Assembly Government, in getting more money from research councils, for example, and creating more opportunities for people who wish to take higher education courses through the medium of Welsh. It will also do more in terms of the economy, and so on. The agenda is very strong.

**Lynne Neagle:** Heb ymdrin ag anghenion plant ifanc mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, ni fyddwn yn gweld cynnydd yn nifer y plant o'r cymunedau hynny sy'n ymuno ag addysg uwch. Mae'n gysylltiad y mae'r gwrthbleidiau yn methu yn gyson â'i ystyried. A allwch roi sicrwydd na fydd obsesiwn y gwrthbleidiau â rhoi mwy o arian i'r rheini sydd â'r addysg orau yn atal arian rhag cael ei fuddsoddi ym maes addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, a bod addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Jane Davidson:** It was interesting that one of the recommendations of the higher education work that Professor Teresa Rees did for the Assembly Government made it clear that the focus of a Government that wanted to expand education opportunity was to make more young people ready for higher education. That is why we have put a tremendous focus on early-years education and, like you, we are confident that that will come through in terms of more young people from more deprived areas going into higher education. Since Teresa Rees told us categorically that all those who achieved the qualifications were going on to higher education, the issue is not with the numbers of those aged 18 who are going on; the issue is with ensuring that more are enabled to go on, and we are absolutely committed to that agenda on this side of the Chamber.

**William Graham:** Minister, I assure you that we are equally committed to that agenda and we congratulate you on the work that you have done in that regard. You will know that the opposition parties have given you support on it in committee and will continue to do so.

On the higher education funding gap, you seemed to evade the issue rather by pointing out that there is a difficulty in gauging its size, which we recognise is not the easiest calculation to make. When will we see precise and meaningful data on the precise size and nature of the gap?

**Jane Davidson:** I welcome your comments on behalf of your party in support of the early-years agenda and I am grateful for the support that you have shown personally for Flying Start and the foundation phase through the committee process.

One of the real difficulties—and I know that my colleague, the Finance Minister, has also said this—is that if you are going to interrogate in detail, you can only interrogate in the past. You always have to look backwards rather than forwards. I thought that it was a useful exercise for me to look at how much additional funding went into higher education as a result of decisions taken in this last year. A total of £33.5

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oedd yn ddiddorol fod un o argymhellion y gwaith ar addysg uwch a wnaed gan yr Athro Teresa Rees ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei gwneud yn glir mai ffocws Llywodraeth a oedd am gynyddu'r cyfleoedd addysg oedd sicrhau bod mwy o bobl ifanc yn barod ar gyfer addysg uwch. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi rhoi ffocws eithriadol ar addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, ac fel chithau yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd hynny'n dwyn ffrwyth i sicrhau bod mwy o bobl ifanc o fwy o ardaloedd difreintiedig yn ymuno ag addysg uwch. Gan fod Teresa Rees wedi dweud wrthym yn bendant fod pob un o'r rheini a oedd yn ennill y cymwysterau yn ymuno ag addysg uwch, nid nifer y bobl ifanc 18 oed sy'n ymuno ag addysg uwch yw'r broblem; y broblem yw sicrhau bod mwy yn cael cyfle i ymuno, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i'r agenda honno ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr.

**William Graham:** Weinidog, gallaf eich sicrhau ein bod ni lawn mor ymroddedig i'r agenda honno, ac fe hoffem eich llongyfarch am y gwaith a wnaed gennych yn hynny o beth. Fe wyddoch fod y gwrthbleidiau wedi eich cefnogi yn y pwyllgor, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

O ran y bwlch cyllido addysg uwch, yr oeddech fel petaech yn osgoi'r mater i raddau drwy egluro ei bod yn anodd mesur ei faint, a chydabyddwn nad dyma'r cyfrifiad hawsaf i'w wneud. Pryd y byddwn yn gweld data manwl ac ystyrlon am union faint a natur y bwlch?

**Jane Davidson:** Croesawaf eich sylwadau ar ran eich plaid yn cefnogi'r agenda blynyddoedd cynnar, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth yr ydych chi wedi'i dangos yn bersonol i Dechrau'n Deg a'r cyfnod sylfaen drwy'r broses bwyllgor.

Un o'r anawsterau gwirioneddol—a gwn fod fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog Cyllid, hefyd o'r un farn—yw os ydych yn awyddus i ymholi'n fanwl, dim ond yn y gorffennol y gallwch wneud hynny. Mae'n rhaid ichi bob amser edrych yn ôl yn hytrach nag ymlaen. Yr oeddwn yn credu ei bod yn ymarfer defnyddiol imi edrych ar faint o gyllid ychwanegol a fuddsoddwyd ym maes addysg uwch o ganlyniad i benderfyniadau a wnaed

million went into the supplementary income stream; £2 million, which was a contribution in last year's budget, went into the funding gap; £3 million went into capital; £1 million went into the additional energy costs; £10.6 million went into part-time education; and £4 million went into Welsh-medium provision. We are pleased that the numbers of students from Wales studying through the medium of Welsh are climbing slowly. That is about £54 million. There has been substantial additional input, in a sense, into higher education in the last year. The Assembly took the decision, which was not a decision that the sector would have taken, that we would put a huge amount of investment into student support. If you look at the HEFCW report, you will see that if we translated our investment into student support and just handed it over to the sector, it would go an awfully long way to meeting the sector's needs. However, we have made the decision about student support.

It is also important to say that the sector's income went up nearly three times overnight with the introduction of the new fee arrangements. This Government, with the support of the Assembly, has invested an amount that is equal to that increase. Therefore, the sector has had substantial extra income in the last year.

**William Graham:** On a different subject, you made an announcement about a Welsh school of mathematical and computational science. Have you been able to give any further consideration to where that might be set up and when?

**Jane Davidson:** I am happy to write to you on that. Now that it has been through the business case stage and has been recommended by HEFCW for the Assembly Government's agreement, I will write to you with the details.

**Peter Black:** Like William Graham, we accept the case for investment in early-years learning to ensure that pupils can take advantage of higher education. However, once they reach the age of 18, there needs to be a higher education sector for them to take

yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Buddsoddwyd cyfanswm o £33.5 miliwn i'r llyf incwm atodol; aeth £2 filiwn, sef cyfraniad yng nghyllideb y llynedd, i'r bwllch cyllido; aeth £3 miliwn i gyfalaf; aeth £1 filiwn i gostau ynni ychwanegol; aeth £10.6 miliwn i addysg ran-amser; ac aeth £4 miliwn i ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg. Yr ydym yn falch fod nifer y myfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cynyddu'n araf. Mae hynny tua £54 miliwn. Gwnaed cyfraniad ychwanegol sylweddol, mewn ffordd, i addysg uwch yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Gwnaeth y Cynulliad y penderfyniad, nad oedd yn benderfyniad y byddai'r sector wedi'i wneud, y byddem yn gwneud buddsoddiad enfawr ym maes cymorth i fyfyrwyr. Os edrychwch ar adroddiad CCAUC, fe welwch, pe byddem yn trosi ein buddsoddiad yn gymorth i fyfyrwyr ac yn ei roi'n uniongyrchol i'r sector, y byddai'n gwneud llawer iawn i ddiwallu anghenion y sector. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi gwneud y penderfyniad am gymorth i fyfyrwyr.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig nodi bod incwm y sector wedi cynyddu bron deirgwaith dros nos drwy gyflwyno'r trefniadau ffioedd newydd. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon, gyda chymorth y Cynulliad, wedi buddsoddi swm sy'n cyfateb i'r cynnydd hwnnw. Felly, mae'r sector wedi cael incwm ychwanegol sylweddol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

**William Graham:** Ar bwnc gwahanol, gwnaethoch gyhoeddiad ynghylch ysgol gwyddorau mathemategol a chyfrifiannu i Gymru. A ydych wedi gallu rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth bellach i'r cwestiwn ble y gellid sefydlu'r ysgol honno a phryd?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu atoch am hynny. Gan fod hyn bellach wedi bod drwy'r cyfnod achos busnes ac wedi ei argymhell gan CCAUC i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gytuno iddo, ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion.

**Peter Black:** Fel William Graham, yr ydym yn derbyn yr achos dros fuddsoddi ym maes dysgu blynyddoedd cynnar er mwyn sicrhau y gall disgyblion fanteisio ar addysg uwch. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl iddynt gyrraedd 18 oed, mae angen sicrhau bod sector addysg uwch ar

advantage of. No-one is saying that the underfunding is that bad, but clearly there is a gap in funding between Wales and England and, more to the point, your Government has already accepted that you will try to close that gap when we reach an agreement on the student support provisions. Can you therefore tell us when you will be coming to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee with a report on what you accept as the definitive gap and how you will try to bridge that gap over a period of time?

3.10 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** I have previously said in the Assembly and to the sector that the Assembly Government wants to ensure that it funds higher education properly and competitively. It is very important to say that there is no risk to the sector in the sense that we have increased funding in higher education by 25 per cent since 2001. We should talk up what our sector can do and not talk it down in any way. However, the third year of a budget spending round, when there is no additional funding in the system, is not the time to make bold statements about increases in funding to any sector. I would not expect to be able to come forward to any Assembly committee until we know the outcomes of the comprehensive spending review, which will come before us in July next year. Whoever has the responsibility in this role, or in any other, will consider that, alongside all the other budget priorities of the education portfolio.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer; it was at least helpful in terms of showing that there can be some progress after the CSR. When you come to look at this funding gap, will you take account of the fact that its main consequence on higher education institutions is that many universities have effectively been neglecting their capital estate so as to generate income to maintain the basic services that they provide in terms of education and investment and research? Across Wales, there are many universities that need quite a lot of investment to be put in place to deal with the condition of their buildings and campuses. Without that

gael iddynt fanteisio arno. Nid oes neb yn dweud bod y sefyllfa danariannu cynddrwg â hynny, ond yn amlwg mae bwlch cyllido rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, ac yn fwy perthnasol, mae eich Llywodraeth eisoes wedi derbyn y byddwch yn ceisio cau'r bwlch hwnnw pan d gawn gytundeb ynghylch y darpariaethau cymorth i fyfyrwyr. A allwch felly ddweud wrthym pryd y byddwch yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau am yr hyn a dderbyniwch fel y bwlch terfynol, a sut y byddwch yn ceisio cau'r bwlch hwnnw dros gyfnod o amser?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen yn y Cynulliad ac wrth y sector fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i sicrhau ei bod yn ariannu maes addysg uwch yn briodol ac yn gystadleuol. Mae'n bwysig iawn dweud nad oes dim risg i'r sector yn yr ystyr ein bod wedi cynyddu'r cyllid i addysg uwch 25 y cant er 2001. Dylem hyrwyddo'r hyn y gall ein sector ei wneud yn hytrach na'i fychanu. Fodd bynnag, nid trydedd flwyddyn cylch gwariant cyllideb, pan nad oes dim arian ychwanegol yn y system, yw'r amser i wneud datganiadau mentrus ynghylch rhoi mwy o arian i unrhyw sector. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl gallu dod gerbron unrhyw un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad nes byddwn yn gwybod canlyniadau'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, a fydd yn dod ger ein bron fis Gorffennaf nesaf. Bydd pw y binnag fydd yn gyfrifol yn y rôl hon, neu mewn unrhyw rôl arall, yn ystyried hynny, ynghyd â holl flaenoriaethau cyllidebol eraill y portffolio addysg.

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw; yr oedd yn ddefnyddiol o leiaf i ddangos bod gobaith o ryw gynnydd ar ôl yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Pan fyddwch yn edrych ar y bwlch cyllido hwn, a ystyriwch y ffaith mai ei brif effaith ar sefydliadau addysg uwch yw bod nifer o brifysgolion mewn gwirionedd wedi bod yn esgeuluso'u hystâd cyfalaf er mwyn cynhyrchu incwm i gynnal y gwasanaethau sylfaenol a ddarperir ganddynt mewn addysg a buddsoddi ac ymchwil? Ledled Cymru, mae yna lawer prifysgol sydd ag angen buddsoddiad sylweddol er mwyn ymdrin â chyflwr ei hadeiladau a'i champws. Heb y buddsoddiad

investment, they will have trouble attracting students in the future.

**Jane Davidson:** One of the items that I outlined in the list that I just gave on additional funding to higher education this year was an amount for capital. It is true to say that, when you consider the comparators, without capital, they are much more equal between Wales and substantial parts of England. However, there is also a challenge to our HE institutions to work more closely together in terms of drawing down additional funding from the research councils and the big medical charities. We need to ensure that they are effectively armed to also be able to deliver that because huge additional income has come to Cardiff following the merger between Cardiff University and the University of Wales College of Medicine. It has climbed into the top 200 universities in the world as a result of that kind of approach. We should all get behind the right kind of collaboration, strategic alliances and, where appropriate, mergers to ensure that Cardiff is not the only area where that goes on in Wales.

hwnnw, byddant yn cael trafferth i ddenu myfyrwyr yn y dyfodol.

**Jane Davidson:** Un o'r eitemau a amlinellais yn y rhestr yr wyf newydd ei rhoi am y cyllid ychwanegol i addysg uwch eleni oedd y swm ar gyfer cyfalaf. Mae'n wir dweud, pan ystyriwch y cymaryddion, heb gyfalaf, eu bod yn llawer mwy cyfartal rhwng Cymru a rhannau helaeth o Loegr. Fodd bynnag, mae yna her hefyd i'n sefydliadau AU gydweithio'n agosach er mwyn manteisio ar gyllid ychwanegol gan y cynghorau ymchwil a'r elusennau meddygol mawr. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod yr adnoddau ganddynt i allu cyflawni hynny, gan fod incwm ychwanegol sylweddol wedi dod i Gaerdydd ers i Brifysgol Caerdydd a Choleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru uno. Mae bellach wedi'i chynnwys yn y rhestr o 200 o brifysgolion gorau'r byd o ganlyniad i'r math hwnnw o ymagwedd. Dylem oll gefnogi'r math priodol o gydweithredu, cynghreiriau strategol, a lle mae hynny'n briodol achosion o uno, er mwyn sicrhau nad Caerdydd yw'r unig ardal lle mae hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru.

### **Addysg Uwch drwy Gyfrwng y Gymraeg Higher Education through the Medium of Welsh**

**C6 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth addysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? OAQ1150(ELL)

**Q6 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of higher education through the medium of Welsh? OAQ1150(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Nid ar chwarae bach y byddwn yn cyrraedd ein targed o 7 y cant o fyfyrwyr yn derbyn rhyw fath o ddarpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr wyf wedi creu pecyn o fesurau i ehangu'r ystod o gyfleoedd ac mae'r sector yn ymateb. Bydd pynciau mor amrywiol â cherddoriaeth, astudiaethau cyfryngau a ffiseg ar gael.

**Jane Davidson:** Our target of 7 per cent of students receiving some provision through the medium of Welsh is not to be taken lightly. I have put in place a package of measures to increase the range of opportunities, and the sector is responding. Subjects as diverse as music, media studies and physics will be available.

**Elin Jones:** Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol bod Llywydd ein Cynulliad wedi gosod yr her i fudiadau ac unigolion yng Nghymru i roi syniadau gerbron ynghylch Mesurau Cynulliad ar ôl 2006, a hyd yn oed i ddrafftio darpar Fesurau. Hyd y gwn i, Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg yw'r cyntaf i gynnig Mesur drafft—ar yr iaith Gymraeg—a bu iddi ei gyflwyno i Aelodau'r Cynulliad y bore yma. Yn ganolog i'r Mesur hwnnw y mae'r hawl i

**Elin Jones:** You may be aware that our Presiding Officer has set a challenge to individuals and organisations in Wales to bring forward ideas for Assembly Measures after 2007, and even to draft prospective Measures. As far as I know, the Welsh Language Society is the first to propose a draft Measure—on the Welsh language—and it presented that to Assembly Members this morning. Central to that Measure is the right

gael addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn sefydliadau uwch. A gredwch ei bod yn rhesymol i unigolion yng Nghymru gael yr hawl i dderbyn rhan o'u haddysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, os ydynt yn dymuno hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn annog mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r cyfle i gael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn y sector uwch. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi rhoi mwy o arian—credaf mai £4 miliwn yw'r swm—tuag at bethau fel y pynciau y soniais amdanynt ynghynt, ynghyd â phynciau fel y gyfraith, yn Abertawe a lleoedd eraill sy'n datblygu mwy o gyfleoedd. Yn ogystal â hyn, sefydlwyd chwe chanolfan newydd gan brifysgolion i annog oedolion i ddysgu Cymraeg. Y gobaith yw y bydd pobl yn symud ymlaen o'r canolfannau i'r brifysgol ac yn gwneud cyrsiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, yr ydym yn parhau i gadw at ein hymrwymiad i ddarparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ar gyfer 7 y cant o fyfyrwyr.

to education through the medium of Welsh in higher education institutions. Do you believe it is reasonable for individuals in Wales to have the right to receive part of their higher education through the medium of Welsh, if they so wish?

**Jane Davidson:** I encourage more people to take up the opportunity to access Welsh-medium education in the higher education sector. That is why we have given more money—I believe the sum is £4 million—towards things such as the subjects which I mentioned earlier, as well as subjects such as law, at Swansea and other places that are developing more opportunities. In addition, six new centres have been set up by universities to encourage adults to learn Welsh. It is hoped that people will move on from those centres to universities and will take courses through the medium of Welsh. Therefore, we are continuing to keep to our commitment to provide Welsh-medium education for 7 per cent of students.

#### **Plant o Deuluoedd Incwm Isel Children of Low-income Families**

**Q7 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on action that she is taking to ensure that children of low-income families get the best educational start in life? OAQ1156(ELL)

**C7 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i sicrhau bod plant o deuluoedd incwm isel yn cael y cychwyniad addysgol gorau mewn bywyd? OAQ1156(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Our Flying Start, raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales, and Cymorth programmes focus especially on positive educational outcomes for children in disadvantaged areas. In addition, the foundation phase and the free school breakfast scheme will particularly benefit those children facing disadvantage and poverty of opportunity.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ein rhaglenni Dechrau'n Deg, sy'n codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigolion mewn addysg yng Nghymru, a Cymorth yn canolbwyntio'n arbennig ar ganlyniadau addysgol i blant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Yn ogystal, bydd y cyfnod sylfaen a'r cynllun brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion o fudd penodol i'r plant hynny sy'n wynebu anfantais a diffyg cyfle.

**John Griffiths:** It is a big challenge for the Welsh Assembly Government to tackle the many barriers that still exist for children from low-income families. RAISE is a valuable initiative and a great deal of other valuable work is going on. I know that RAISE will benefit For a, Milton and Maindee schools, for example, in Newport East, and I look forward to seeing how that money is used and what opportunities it creates. However, in

**John Griffiths:** Mae'n her fawr i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau niferus sy'n parhau i blant o deuluoedd incwm isel. Mae Rhagori yn fenter werthfawr ac mae llawer o waith gwerthfawr arall yn mynd rhagddo. Gwn y bydd Rhagori o fudd i ysgolion Alway, Milton a Maendy, er enghraifft, yn Nwyrain Casnewydd ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld sut y defnyddir yr arian hwnnw a'r cyfleoedd a ddaw yn ei sgîl.

general, do you agree that we need a sustained political commitment if we are properly to challenge and overcome these barriers, as there is still a tremendous waste of human potential in our society, which flows from these poor educational opportunities for children from families with the lowest incomes?

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of schools in your constituency that are participating in the Flying Start programme, I was interested to note that Milton school wants to build a £238,000 centre that will be the centre for Newport to operate Flying Start. That kind of approach is also very important. We have the integrated children's centres across Wales, and we want to extend those, but we can also extend the model by ensuring that Flying Start centres can do some similar initiatives. We are looking to double the number of foundation phase schools in the pilot as a result of bringing on board Flying Start schools, so that we can integrate the children from our most disadvantaged communities during their earliest experiences into our best practice for the future.

**Janet Ryder:** Every child benefits, particularly those from more deprived backgrounds, from having a well educated, well resourced, well staffed school. Yet, your Government's policies are leading to school budgets being cut by 1 per cent. You have justified efficiency savings in schools as cuts in empty places, which are not uniformly spread among schools or authorities, and it is, therefore, difficult to apply a 1 per cent cut to every school. It takes a long time to achieve efficiency savings through new procurement policies and implementing cross-county purchasing; that cannot be achieved within a year. Yet, schools will see a second year of 1 per cent cuts next year. Why are you persisting with those cuts, and do you not now accept that those school budgets need extra support?

**Jane Davidson:** I repeat what I have already said this afternoon. Sue Essex and I have made it absolutely clear that neither of us expects local authorities to pass on the 1 per cent efficiency saving to schools. In fact, they have been given specific guidance from the

Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, oni chytunwch fod angen ymrwymiad gwleidyddol parhaus er mwyn herio a goresgyn y rhwystrau hyn gan fod cymaint o wastraff o ran potensial pobl yn ein cymdeithas o hyd, sy'n deillio o'r cyfleoedd addysgol gwael i blant o deuluoedd ar yr incwm isaf?

**Jane Davidson:** O ran yr ysgolion yn eich etholaeth sy'n cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol sylwi bod ysgol Milton am adeiladu canolfan gwerth £238,000 a fydd yn ganolfan i Gasnewydd weithredu'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg. Mae'r math hwnnw o ddull hefyd yn bwysig iawn. Mae gennym ganolfannau plant integredig ledled Cymru, ac rydym am ymestyn y rheini, ond gallwn hefyd ymestyn y model drwy sicrhau y gall canolfannau Dechrau'n Deg gyflawni mentrau tebyg. Ein nod yw dyblu nifer yr ysgolion cyfnod sylfaen yn y peilot o ganlyniad i gynnwys ysgolion Dechrau'n Deg, fel y gallwn integreiddio'r plant o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn ystod eu profiadau cynharaf yn ein harfer gorau ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae pob plentyn yn elwa, yn enwedig y rheini o'r cefndiroedd mwy difreintiedig, o ysgol sydd ag adnoddau addysgol a staffio da. Ac eto, mae polisïau eich Llywodraeth yn arwain at doriadau o 1 y cant yng nghyllidebau ysgolion. Yr ydych wedi cyfiawnhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd mewn ysgolion fel toriadau yn nifer y llwydd gwag, nad ydynt yn digwydd yn gyson ar draws ysgolion nac awdurdodau, ac felly mae'n anodd gweithredu toriad o 1 y cant ym mhob bob ysgol. Mae'n cymryd amser hir y sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd drwy bolisïau caffael newydd a gweithredu dulliau caffael ar draws siroedd. Ac eto, bydd ysgolion yn gweld ail flwyddyn o doriadau gwerth 1 y cant y flwyddyn nesaf. Pam yr ydych yn parhau'r toriadau hyn, ac oni dderbyniwch yn awr fod angen cymorth ychwanegol ar y cyllidebau ysgol hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Atefaf yr hyn a ddywedais eisoes y prynhawn yma. Mae Sue Essex a minnau wedi'i wneud yn gwbl glir nad yw'r naill na'r llall ohonom yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol drosglwyddo'r arbediad effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant i'r ysgolion. Yn

Assembly Government saying that that would be an inappropriate way to meet the efficiency savings target. The Wales Audit Office will look at how local authorities have made their 1 per cent efficiency savings, and there are several other areas that you have mentioned, such as procurement, in which we would want to see much closer working to gain those efficiency savings—and they would be real efficiencies.

3.20 p.m.

The issue of surplus school places will not go away however much Members might like that to happen. It needs to be tackled, because, otherwise, it will mean 100,000 empty places in our schools by 2013. As you say, that is a differential, and some schools already have more empty places than pupils, which does not make for effective education. We need to look at all these areas together. The vast majority of schools in Wales held reserves at the end of March last year, when the last report was published, and more than 400 of them had reserves in excess of 10 per cent, so we need local authorities to exercise their monitoring function. We can also look at improved reporting mechanisms. Just as I have asked local authorities to treat the indicator-based assessment as an interim target for this coming year and to report to their school budget for a and to the Assembly Government, we can also look at asking them to report on efficiency savings, for example. In this way, local authorities would look at the job that they are meant to do, as democratically elected bodies, with a democratic local mandate to take responsibility for running services.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, you are asking them to run services in their areas with ever-decreasing amounts of money. Denbighshire County Council arranged for an external auditor to investigate its surplus places, and it was found that it does not have a problem: it

wir, rhoddwyd canllawiau pendant iddynt gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud y byddai hynny'n ffordd amhriodol o sicrhau'r targed arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Bydd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn edrych ar y modd y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud eu harbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant, ac mae yna lawer maes arall a grybwyllwyd gennych, megis caffael, lle y byddem am weld cydweithio agosach er mwyn sicrhau'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd hynny—a byddai'r rheini'n arbedion gwirioneddol.

Ni fydd problem llefydd gwag mewn ysgolion yn diflannu, waeth faint y bydd Aelodau yn dymuno i hynny ddigwydd. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn, oherwydd golyga y bydd 100,000 o lefydd gwag yn ein hysgolion erbyn 2013. Fel y dywedwch, mae hynny'n wahanred, ac mae gan rai ysgolion eisoes fwy o lefydd gwag nag o ddisgyblion, ac nid yw hyn yn argoeli'n dda ar gyfer addysg effeithiol. Rhaid inni edrych ar y meysydd hyn i gyd gyda'i gilydd. Yr oedd gan y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion yng Nghymru gronfeydd wrth gefn ddiwedd Mawrth y llynedd, pan gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad diwethaf, ac yr oedd gan fwy na 400 ohonynt gronfeydd wrth gefn o fwy na 10 y cant, felly mae angen i awdurdodau lleol arfer eu swyddogaeth monitro. Gallwn hefyd edrych ar ddulliau gwell o gyflwyno adroddiadau. Yn yr un modd ag yr wyf wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol drin yr asesiad sy'n seiliedig ar ddangosyddion fel targed interim ar gyfer y flwyddyn sydd i ddod, ac i gyflwyno adroddiad i'w ffora cyllidebau ysgolion ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, gallwn hefyd ystyried gofyn iddynt gyflwyno adroddiadau am arbedion effeithlonrwydd, er enghraifft. Fel hynny, byddai awdurdodau lleol yn edrych ar y gwaith y mae disgwyl iddynt ei wneud fel cyrff wedi eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd, gyda mandad democrataidd lleol i fod yn gyfrifol am gynnal gwasanaethau.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, yr ydych yn gofyn iddynt gynnal gwasanaethau yn eu hardaloedd gyda llai a llai o arian. Trefnodd Cyngor Sir Dinbych i archwilydd allanol ymchwilio i'w llefydd gwag, a gwelwyd nad oedd yno problem: nid oes yno ddim llefydd



has no empty places in its primary schools, and very few in its secondary schools. Many other counties would say the same. That shows that there is not a uniform pattern across Wales. You said that purchasing agreements take years to have an effect, but you are asking for school budgets to be cut now. You are pointing to things that cannot be divvied out evenly across Wales, and yet you are saying that there will be a 1 per cent cut in front-line educational services. What will you do, Minister, to authorities that are having to allow their schools to set deficit budgets, because they cannot make their existing budgets go around? What will you do to those authorities that are passing on that 1 per cent cut, or are found not to be funding other areas, like pensions or special initiatives, as they should be? What action will you take? Do you not think that we should just put the money back into those school budgets, and prevent those schools from desperately needing teachers and resources? Let us give those schools the help that they need.

**Jane Davidson:** If I understood your proposition correctly at the end there, you are saying that those authorities that have ensured that they do not pass on efficiency savings to their schools should be penalised so that you can give funding back to those authorities that have passed them onto their schools, against Assembly Government advice. What nonsense. Our position is that local authorities are democratically elected. We do not suggest that there should be a uniform approach, which is why authorities with large numbers of surplus places will need to address issues on a different timescale. I am not aware of any local authority in Wales that has no surplus places in its schools, and I hope that you will provide me with evidence of your claim. The LEA Budget, Schools Budget and Individual Schools Budget (Wales) Regulations 2003 do not permit deductions for efficiency gains in determining individual school budgets; they permit deductions only for certain types of expenditure, in order to arrive at the individual school budget. Therefore, local authorities must take account of efficiency issues in setting the overall school budget figure, and they must discuss that with the school budget forum. They are

gwag yn ei ysgolion cynradd, a nemor ddim yn ei ysgolion uwchradd. Byddai nifer o siroedd eraill yn dweud yr un fath. Dengys hynny nad oes patrwm unffurf ledled Cymru. Yr oeddech yn dweud bod effaith cytundebau prynu yn cymryd blynnyddoedd, ond yr ydych yn gofyn i gyllidebau ysgolion gael eu torri yn awr. Yr ydych yn nodi pethau na ellir eu rhannu yn gyfartal ledled Cymru, ac eto yr ydych yn dweud y bydd toriad o 1 y cant mewn gwasanaethau addysgol rheng flaen. Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud, Weinidog, i awdurdodau sy'n gorfod caniatáu i'w hysgolion bennu cyllidebau mewn diffyg am na allant gadw at eu cyllidebau presennol? Beth fyddwch yn ei wneud i'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n trosglwyddo'r toriad o 1 y cant, neu rai y gwelir nad ydynt yn ariannu meysydd eraill, fel pensiynau neu fentrau arbennig, fel y dylent? Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd? Oni chredwch y dylem roi'r arian yn ôl yn y cyllidebau ysgol hynny a lleddfu'r angen dybryd yn yr ysgolion hynny am athrawon ac adnoddau? Gadewch inni roi i'r ysgolion y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen.

**Jane Davidson:** Os deallais eich cynnig yn iawn ar y diwedd, yr ydych yn dweud y dylid cosbi'r awdurdodau hynny sydd wedi sicrhau nad ydynt yn trosglwyddo arbedion effeithlonrwydd i'w hysgolion, fel y gallwch drosglwyddo'r arian hwnnw yn ôl i'r awdurdodau hynny sydd wedi eu trosglwyddo i'w hysgolion yn groes i gyngor gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nonsens llwyr. Ein safbwynt ni yw bod awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd. Nid ydym yn awgrymu y dylid cael dull, a dyna paham y bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau sydd â niferoedd mawr o lefydd gwag fynd i'r afael â'r broblem yn ôl amserlen wahanol. Ni wn am unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru nad oes ganddo lefydd gwag yn ei ysgolion, a gobeithio y gallwch ddarparu tystiolaeth imi o'ch honiad. Nid yw Rheoliadau Cyllidebau AALI, Cyllidebau Ysgolion a Chyllidebau Ysgolion Unigol (Cymru) 2003 yn caniatáu didynnu am enillion effeithlonrwydd wrth bennu cyllidebau ysgolion unigol; dim ond ar gyfer rhai mathau o wariant y maent yn caniatáu didynnu, er mwyn pennu'r gyllideb ysgol unigol. Felly, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ystyried materion effeithlonrwydd wrth bennu ffigur cyffredinol cyllideb yr ysgol, a rhaid iddynt drafod hynny gyda'r fforwm

democratically elected locally to provide local services.

**Lynne Neagle:** Minister, of course the initiatives that you referred to in your initial answer to John Griffiths are very welcome, but it is just as crucial that we continue to target mainstream resources at our most needy children. As you are aware, the Committee on School Funding report recommended that the Assembly Government take action to ensure compliance with the existing recommendation that local authorities provide targeted support to the most deprived schools in their areas. You indicated in your response to that report that you would be providing an update on this in November. Therefore, are all local authorities now complying, and, if not, what action will you take to ensure compliance?

**Jane Davidson:** The vast majority of local authorities are complying. There is one local authority, Monmouthshire, which has not put the deprivation element into its regulations, as it should have done. Our officials are taking up the matter.

**Jonathan Morgan:** This may sound somewhat obvious, but children benefit from school provided they turn up. We have to overcome the growing challenge to schools around Wales of unauthorised absence. I have been alerted by one local authority organisation that, in many parts of Wales, education welfare officers and truancy officers employed by local authorities are slow to intervene when families take their children out of school to go on holiday. Do you agree that the quicker local authorities act where there is persistent truancy and persistent numbers of unauthorised absences, the better it is for the child—and for the parents, who need to understand their responsibilities?

**Jane Davidson:** I agree. We have recently appointed Professor Ken Reid—who, it is fair to say, has an international reputation on issues of truancy—to chair our steering group for our review of behaviour and attendance. We have put additional funding in place,

cyllidebau ysgolion. Cânt eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd yn lleol i ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol.

**Lynne Neagle:** Weinidog, wrth gwrs, croesawn y mentrau yr oeddech yn cyfeirio atynt yn eich ateb cychwynol i John Griffiths, ond mae'r un mor hanfodol inni barhau i dargedu adnoddau prif ffrwd at ein plant mwyaf anghenus. Fel y gwyddoch, argymhellodd adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau i sicrhau cydymffurfio â'r argymhelliad presennol y dylai awdurdodau lleol ddarparu cymorth wedi'i dargedu i'r ysgolion mwyaf difreintiedig yn eu hardaloedd. Yr oeddech yn awgrymu yn eich ymateb i'r adroddiad y byddech yn darparu diweddariad am hyn ym mis Tachwedd. Felly, a yw pob awdurdod lleol yn cydymffurfio bellach, ac os nad ydynt, pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau cydymffurfio?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae mwyafrif helaeth yr awdurdodau lleol yn cydymffurfio. Mae un awdurdod lleol, Sir Fynwy, nad yw wedi cynnwys yr elfen amddifadedd yn ei reoliadau, fel y dylasai. Mae ein swyddogion yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Efallai fod hyn yn ymddangos hyn braidd yn amlwg, ond mae plant yn elwa o'r ysgol cyhyd ag y byddant yn bresennol. Rhaid inni oresgyn yr her gynyddol i ysgolion ledled Cymru oherwydd absenoldebau heb ganiatâd. Dywedwyd wrthyf gan un sefydliad awdurdod lleol fod swyddogion lles addysgol a swyddogion triwantiaeth mewn llawer ardal yng Nghymru yn araf i ymyrryd pan fydd teuluoedd yn cymryd eu plant o'r ysgol i fynd ar wyliau. Oni chytunwch, po gyflymaf y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gweithredu pan fydd triwantiaeth barhaus a niferoedd cyson o absenoldebau heb ganiatâd, y gorau fydd hynny i'r plentyn—ac i'r rhieni, gan fod angen iddynt ddeall eu cyfrifoldebau?

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf. Yr ydym newydd benodi'r Athro Ken Reid yn ddiweddar—sydd, y mae'n deg dweud, yn enwog ledled y byd am faterion triwantiaeth—i gadeirio ein grŵp llywio ar gyfer ein hadolygiad o ymddygiad a phresenoldeb. Yr ydym wedi

around £6 million, I think, to ensure electronic attendance and registration systems. It is paying dividends as regards the point that you make, as it gives parents notice quickly of their children being out of school.

We are pleased that unauthorised absence levels are not rising, but we are keen to ensure that we do all that we can. As I maintain, and as I hope you would support, children who are not in school cannot receive a full education. Therefore, the Assembly Government actively discourages children from taking holidays during term time.

rhoi tua £6 miliwn yn ychwanegol, mi gredaf, i sicrhau systemau presenoldeb a chofrestru electronig. Mae'n talu ar ei ganfed o ran y pwynt a wnewch, gan ei fod yn rhybuddio'r rhieni'n gyflym pan nad yw eu plant yn yr ysgol.

Yr ydym yn falch nad yw'r lefelau absenoldeb heb ganiatâd yn codi, ond yr ydym yn awyddus i wneud popeth a allwn. Fel y maentumiaf, a gobeithio y byddech yn cefnogi hyn, ni all plant sy'n absennol o'r ysgol gael addysg lawn. Felly, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gryf yn erbyn mynd â phlant ar wyliau yn ystod y tymor ysgol.

### **Colegau Addysg Bellach Further Education Colleges**

**Q8 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on funding allocation for further education colleges? OAQ1113(ELL)

**C8 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyrannu cyllid ar gyfer colegau addysg bellach? OAQ1113(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The further education sector has seen a significant increase in funding over recent years through the further education pay initiative and the strategic capital investment programme. Further education institutions are now funded on an equitable basis to school sixth forms through the national planning and funding system.

**Jane Davidson:** Bu cynnydd sylweddol yng nghyllideb y sector addysg bellach dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf drwy'r cynllun tâl addysg bellach a'r rhaglen buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Mae sefydliadau addysg bellach yn cael eu hariannu ar yr un sail â dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion drwy'r system gynllunio ac ariannu genedlaethol.

**Mark Isherwood:** We understand that core unit funding fell over a three-year period, as did the number of students. We know that, last year, a number of colleges had to make staff redundant, and some colleges even required all of their staff to re-apply for their jobs. We have heard in recent weeks of another possible round of staff redundancies, with a college in my region announcing 15 more redundancies. How many staff redundancies and job losses were there last year and this year, to date, in the further education college sector, and what impact is this having on the delivery of teaching to the students, albeit in their falling numbers?

**Mark Isherwood:** Deallwn fod ariannu uned craidd wedi gostwng dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, fel y gwnaeth nifer y myfyrwyr. Gwyddom fod nifer o golegau y llynedd wedi gorfod diswyddo staff, a bu'n rhaid i rai colegau hyd yn oed ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'w staff ailymgeisio am eu swyddi. Clywsom yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf am gylch posibl arall o ddiswyddiadau, gyda choleg yn fy rhanbarth i yn cyhoeddi 15 o ddiswyddiadau ychwanegol. Faint o ddiswyddiadau staff a swyddi a gollwyd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ac eleni hyd yn hyn, yn y sector colegau addysg bellach, a pha effaith a gaiff hyn ar addysgu myfyrwyr, er bod eu niferoedd yn mynd yn llai?

**Jane Davidson:** We gave a guarantee that no funding would be reduced unless there was a reduction in activity, and that has been fully honoured. In addition to the core funding, there is also funding for further education pay, which, in the 2006-07 financial year, is

**Jane Davidson:** Rhoesom warrant na fyddai ariannu'n lleihau oni fyddai lleihad mewn gweithgaredd, a chydymffurfiwyd yn llwyr â hyn. Yn ogystal â'r ariannu craidd, mae yn arian hefyd ar gyfer cyflogau addysg bellach, sydd, ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2006-07,

around £38 million. Therefore, that is on top of the core funding. Capital funding went up to £17.8 million, which was an increase of 175 per cent. There was an increase of 6 per cent in work-based learning, further education colleges will share in the £32.5 million funding for the 14-19 agenda, and there is an additional £0.5 million for basic skills. Therefore, you have to look at the whole picture on these funding issues. We are looking at far greater collaboration between college and college, school and college, and school and school, in the delivery of the 14-19 agenda. We will be looking hard at this in the review of the mission and purpose of further education, which, as I have just announced, is to be chaired by Sir Adrian Webb.

3.30 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** You alluded to this in your last answer, but do you agree that the further education sector is a crucial part of our lifelong learning provision, which must be properly funded, staffed and resourced? As it becomes a full partner in the 14-19 learning pathways, as the full programme is rolled out, that will demand a sharing of resources and funding across the board.

**Jane Davidson:** I agree with that, but it is also fundamentally important that the FE sector is able to respond to the challenges of employers in ensuring that the courses provided are fit for purpose. It is no good having courses that send out half a plumber, which is why we want to ensure that the review into the mission and purpose of the further education sector looks specifically at ensuring that vocational courses are supported by their industries, in terms of young people getting qualifications that are fit for purpose and which they can use—and not just young people, because Wales is unique in having all-age modern apprenticeships.

oddeutu £38 miliwn. Felly, mae hynny ar ben yr ariannu craidd. Cynyddodd ariannu cyfalaf i £17.8 miliwn, cynnydd o 175 y cant. Gwelwyd cynnydd o 6 y cant mewn dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, caiff colegau addysg bellach gyfran o'r ariannu hwn gwerth £32.5 miliwn ar gyfer agenda 14-19, ac mae £0.5 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer sgiliau sylfaenol. Felly, mae'n rhaid ichi edrych ar y darlun cyflawn yn y materion ariannu hyn. Yr ydym yn edrych ar fwy fyth o gydweithredu rhwng coleg a choleg, ysgol a choleg ac ysgol ac ysgol wrth wireddu'r agenda 14-19. Byddwn yn edrych yn ofalus ar hyn yn yr adolygiad o nod a diben addysg bellach, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Syr Adrian Webb, fel y cyhoeddais.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr oeddech yn crybwyll hyn yn eich ateb diwethaf, ond oni chytunwch fod y sector addysg bellach yn rhan hanfodol o'n darpariaeth dysgu gydol oes, a'i bod yn rhaid ei ariannu a'i staffio'n briodol, a rhoi'r adnoddau priodol iddo? Wrth iddo ddod yn bartner llawn yn y llwybrau dysgu 14-19, wrth i'r rhaglen lawn gael ei chyflwyno, bydd hynny'n galw am rannu adnoddau ac arian yn gyffredinol.

**Jane Davidson:** Cytunaf â hynny, ond mae hefyd yn hanfodol bwysig i'r sector AB allu ymateb i heriau cyflogwyr wrth sicrhau bod y cyrsiau a ddarperir yn addas at y diben. Nid yw'n ddigon da cael cyrsiau sy'n cynhyrchu hanner plymwr, a dyna pam yr ydym am sicrhau bod yr adolygiad o genhadaeth a diben y sector addysg bellach yn edrych yn benodol ar sicrhau bod cyrsiau galwedigaethol yn cael eu cefnogi gan eu diwydiannau, o ran sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael cymwysterau sy'n addas at y diben ac y gallant eu defnyddio—ac nid pobl ifanc yn unig, gan fod Cymru'n unigryw am fod ganddi brentisiaethau modern ar gyfer pob oed.

### Gofalu ar ôl Plant Childcare

**Q9 Eleanor Burnham:** What advice has the Minister given regarding the use of school buildings for after-hours childcare?

**C9 Eleanor Burnham:** Pa gyngor y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i roi ar ddefnyddio adeiladau ysgolion ar gyfer gofal plant ar ôl

OAQ1131(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Childcare is one of the key services set out within our community focused schools guidance. The guidance highlights that many schools are already successfully offering out-of-school-hours childcare on the school site, whether through a voluntary management committee, a private provider, or by the governing body itself.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you, Minister. I am pleased to hear that, but how much funding is available for local authorities to ensure that they are able to provide after-hours childcare? We know that a lot of local authorities are suffering due to all kinds of other priorities, and that often they are not able to provide childcare. In certain schools that I am aware of, there are so many out-of-hours clubs that they are unable to offer childcare. What can you, in the Labour Assembly Government, do to ensure adequate funding?

**Jane Davidson:** Funding for childcare comes through a variety of routes. There is funding via the Genesis project, and 8.5 per cent of the Cymorth funding to local authorities has to be ring-fenced for childcare. The Flying Start initiative has, right at its heart, free part-time childcare for two-year-olds. The community focused schools development grant also provides additional funding to local authorities. By 2008, there will be a new duty on local authorities in relation to securing sufficient childcare in their areas. We will be working with them to look at what additional funding needs to be put in place to achieve that outcome in future budget spending rounds.

**Y Llywydd:** Caiff cwestiwn 10 ei drosglwyddo i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

oriau ysgol? OAQ1131(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Gofal plant yw un o'r gwasanaethau allweddol sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn ein canllawiau ysgolion bro. Mae'r canllawiau'n tynnu sylw bod nifer o ysgolion eisoes yn llwyddiannus yn cynnig gofal plant y tu allan i oriau ysgol ar safle'r ysgol, boed drwy bwyllgor rheoli gwirfoddol, darparwr preifat neu'r corff llywodraethu ei hun.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn falch clywed hynny, ond faint o arian sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y gallant ddarparu gofal plant ar ôl oriau ysgol? Gwyddom fod llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn dioddef oherwydd pob math o flaenoriaethau eraill, ac na allant yn aml ddarparu gofal plant. Mewn rhai ysgolion penodol y gwn amdanynt, mae cynifer o glybiau y tu allan i oriau fel na allant gynnig gofal plant. Beth allwch chi, yn Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, ei wneud i sicrhau arian digonol?

**Jane Davidson:** Daw'r arian ar gyfer gofal plant drwy amrywiol ffyrdd. Mae yna arian drwy brosiect Genesis, a rhaid i 8.5 y cant o arian Cymorth i awdurdodau lleol gael ei neilltuo i ofal plant. Yn hollol ganolog i fenter Dechrau'n Deg, mae gofal plant rhan amser am ddim i blant dwy oed. Mae'r grant datblygu ysgolion bro hefyd yn rhoi arian ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol. Erbyn 2008, bydd dyletswydd newydd ar awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau gofal plant digonol yn eu hardaloedd. Byddwn yn cydweithio â hwy i weld pa arian ychwanegol y mae ei angen i sicrhau'r canlyniad hwnnw mewn cylchoedd gwariant cyllidebau yn y dyfodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 is transferred for written answer.

### Y Ffigurau Perfformiad Diweddaraf Latest Performance Figures

**Q11 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Local Government Association data unit's latest performance figures for pupils leaving school with no qualifications? OAQ1096(ELL)

**C11 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ffigurau perfformiad diweddaraf uned ddata Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar gyfer disgyblion sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb ddim cymwysterau? OAQ1096(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The latest performance indicators show that 2.3 per cent of 16-year-olds in Wales leave school, training or work-based learning without a qualification. Although the figure is still too high, I am confident that the figure will continue to reduce, given the measures that this Government has put in place.

**Ann Jones:** Thank you, Minister. Earlier this afternoon, I asked the Finance Minister whether she would look at the number of pupils in the Denbighshire County Council area who leave school without any qualifications, which is 2 per cent higher than the national average at 4.3 per cent. As I said to the Finance Minister, while we can play around with figures and make them say what we want, we have to remember that behind every statistic is a person—in this case, a young person whom Denbighshire is failing. Will you look at this, along with the Finance Minister, to see whether we can put an action plan in place to address the unacceptably poor performance by Denbighshire in this regard?

**Jane Davidson:** Thank you, Ann. The figure for Wales was 2.83 per cent last year and 2.3 per cent this year, so we are delighted that it has come down by 0.5 per cent. Therefore, 4.3 per cent is an unpalatable statistic. We have to focus on our commitment that, by 2010, no pupil should leave full-time education without an approved qualification. We published that in 'The Learning Country: Vision into Action'. I was pleased when I accompanied Irene James to a school in her constituency, in Risca, recently, where the headteacher, when she had a couple of pupils who were at risk of leaving without a qualification, took lessons to them, in order to ensure that they had a qualification. I also visited a pupil referral unit in Swansea recently where the headteacher ensured that every child left with a qualification. That has to be the attitude that we all expect in future.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r dangosyddion perfformiad diweddaraf yn dangos bod 2.3 y cant o bobl ifanc 16 oed yng Nghymru yn gadael yr ysgol, hyfforddiant neu ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith heb gymwysterau. Er bod y ffigur yn rhy uchel o hyd, yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y ffigur hwnnw'n dal i ostwng, o gofio'r mesurau y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi eu rhoi ar waith.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma gofynnais i'r Gweinidog Cyllid a fyddai'n edrych ar nifer y disgyblion yn ardal Cyngor Sir Ddinbych sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb ddim cymwysterau. Mae hwn 2 y cant yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol o 4.3 y cant. Fel y dywedais wrth y Gweinidog Cyllid, er y gallwn chwarae â ffigurau a gwneud iddynt gyfleu'r hyn yr ydym am iddynt ei gyfleu, rhaid cofio mai person yw pob un o'r ystadegau—yn yr achos hwn, person ifanc sy'n cael ei esgeuluso gan sir Ddinbych. A wnewch chi ystyried hyn, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog Cyllid, i weld a allwn lunio cynllun gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â'r perfformiad annerbyniol o wael yn sir Ddinbych yn y cyswllt hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch ichi, Ann. Y ffigur ar gyfer Cymru oedd 2.83 y cant y llynedd a 2.3 y cant eleni, felly yr ydym yn falch ei fod wedi gostwng 0.5 y cant. Felly, mae 4.3 y cant yn ystadegyn annerbyniol. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ein hymrwymiad na ddylai'r un disgybl, erbyn 2010, adael addysg amser llawn heb gymhwyster sydd wedi'i gymeradwyo. Cyhoeddwyd hynny yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu: Gweledigaeth ar Waith'. Yr oeddwn yn falch cael mynd gydag Irene James i ysgol yn ei hetholaeth, yn Rhisga, yn ddiweddar lle yr oedd y pennaeth, pan oedd ganddi ychydig ddisgyblion a oedd mewn perygl o adael yr ysgol heb gymwysterau, yn mynd â gwersi atynt, er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddynt gymhwyster. Ymwelais hefyd ag uned gyfeirio disgyblion yn Abertawe yn ddiweddar lle yr oedd y pennaeth yn sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn gadael gyda chymhwyster. Dyna'r agwedd y bydd pob un ohonom yn ei disgwyl yn y dyfodol.

**Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar yr Agweddau Cynllunio ar Offer Telathrebu Symudol**

**Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on the Planning Aspects of Mobile Telecommunications Apparatus**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I thank the Committee for considering the important subject of mobile telecommunications apparatus, and I welcome its report. Planning for telecommunications infrastructure is a difficult topic, both technically and legally, and it arouses strong opinions from stakeholders and communities. We are all aware that the planning process followed for the siting of some masts has caused some communities concern. Mobile telecommunications is a quickly evolving industry, with more and more features being added to the latest models of mobile phones. All those new uses require adequate and improved infrastructure. Mobile phones are used by all age groups and sectors of the community for all sorts of activities, both business and social, and are now integral to most people's day-to-day lives. The continuing increased popularity and use of this technology requires that the necessary infrastructure is put in place as smoothly, efficiently and sensitively as possible if the demand society has for this technology is to be met.

In respect of the recommendation on health impact assessments, Brian Gibbons and I have considered carefully the seven recommendations that the committee made, and I am pleased to be able to respond positively to the majority of those. In many cases, the recommendations reflect the work that we already have under way or programmed. Where we have not been able to accept a recommendation at this time, the written statement that I have presented to Plenary makes clear the reasons why more work is needed. We must bear in mind the fact that the committee took evidence from two important stakeholders, the Welsh Local Government Association and the Mobile Operators Association, but that there are

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor am ystyried pwnc pwysig offer telathrebu symudol, a chroesawaf ei adroddiad. Mae cynllunio ar gyfer seilwaith telathrebu yn destun anodd, yn dechnegol ac yn gyfreithiol, ac mae'n ysgogi barn gref ymhlith rhanddeiliaid a chymunedau. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol fod y broses gynllunio a ddilynwyd ar gyfer lleoli rhai mastiau wedi achosi pryder i rai cymunedau. Mae telathrebu symudol yn ddiwydiant sy'n datblygu'n gyflym, gyda mwy a mwy o nodweddion yn cael eu hychwanegu at y modelau diweddaraf o ffonau symudol. Mae angen seilwaith digonol a gwell ar yr holl ddulliau defnyddio newydd hynny. Defnyddir ffonau symudol gan bob grŵp oed a phob sector yn y gymuned ar gyfer pob math o weithgareddau, rhai busnes a rhai cymdeithasol, ac maent bellach yn rhan annatod o fywyd pob dydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl. Mae poblogrwydd a defnydd cynyddol parhaus y dechnoleg hon yn golygu bod yn rhaid rhoi'r seilwaith angenrheidiol ar waith mor ddidrafferth, mor effeithlon ac mor ystyriol â phosibl er mwyn ateb y galw gan gymdeithas am y dechnoleg hon.

O ran yr argymhellion ar asesiadau o'r effaith ar iechyd, mae Brian Gibbons a minnau wedi ystyried yn ofalus y saith argymhelliad a wnaeth y pwyllgor, ac yr wyf yn falch gallu ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r mwyafrif. Mewn llawer achos, mae'r argymhellion yn adlewyrchu'r gwaith a wnawn eisoes neu sydd ar y gweill gennym. Lle nad ydym wedi gallu derbyn argymhelliad ar hyn o bryd, mae'r datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyflwynais i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn gwneud yn glir y rhesymau pam mae angen mwy o waith. Rhaid cofio bod y pwyllgor wedi clywed tystiolaeth gan ddau randdeiliad pwysig, sef Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Gweithredwyr Ffonau Symudol, ond bod yna randdeiliaid eraill,

other stakeholders, such as the emergency services, business, the broadcasting industry, and interest and community groups that are all affected by the way that the telecommunications infrastructure is delivered in rural and urban areas. It would be unwise to change our policy without first considering the views of a wider range of stakeholders.

Improving the code of best practice on mobile phone network development and ensuring that it is followed by local planning authorities and operators, with an improved public communication strategy as the report recommends, is the key to involving communities and dealing properly with their concerns. The research that we commissioned with the Department for Communities and Local Government from Arup and the University of Reading on the working of the code included some stakeholders and local planning authorities from Wales. It is being taken forward by the interdepartmental electronic communications working group. I want to consider the ideas emerging from that group in the coming months with a fuller range of Welsh stakeholders to ensure that our planning policy, technical advice note and code of practice are improved and reflect the best possible practice in rolling out the telecommunications infrastructure, including the issue of site sharing as the committee recommends.

I entirely agree with the committee's recommendation that local planning authorities must take advantage of the offer of meetings with the operators so that the annual roll-out plans are fully discussed and then published. We shall take up this issue with the Welsh Local Government Association.

Brian Gibbons and I fully understand the concerns people have about the possible health consequences in relation to the siting of masts. The current health advice is that the balance of evidence indicates that there is no general risk to the physical health of people living near masts on the basis that exposures are expected to be small fractions of the guideline amounts. In Wales, we have a statutory basis for requiring that a declaration of compliance with the International

megis y gwasanaethau brys, busnesau, y diwydiant darlledu, grwpiau sydd â diddordeb a grwpiau cymunedol, yr effeithir arnynt bob un gan y ffordd y caiff y seilwaith telathrebu ei ddarparu mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol. Annoeth iawn fyddai newid ein polisi heb ystyried barn amrywiaeth ehangach o randdeiliaid yn gyntaf.

Mae gwella'r cod ymarfer gorau ar ddatblygu rhwydwaith ffonau symudol a sicrhau bod awdurdodau cynllunio lleol a gweithredwyr yn ei ddilyn, ynghyd â chael gwell strategaeth gyfathrebu gyhoeddus fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei hargymell, yn allweddol i gynnwys cymunedau ac ymdrin â'u pryderon yn gywir. Yr oedd y gwaith ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gennym ni a'r Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol gan Arup a Phrifysgol Reading ar weithredu'r cod yn cynnwys rhai rhanddeiliaid ac awdurdodau cynllunio lleol o Gymru. Caiff ei weithredu gan y gweithgor cyfathrebu electronig rhyngadrannol. Hoffwn ystyried y syniadau sy'n deillio o'r grŵp hwnnw yn ystod y misoedd nesaf gydag amrywiaeth ehangach o randdeiliaid o Gymru er mwyn sicrhau bod ein polisi cynllunio, ein nodyn cyngor technegol a'n cod ymarfer yn cael eu gwella ac yn adlewyrchu'r arfer gorau posibl wrth ddarparu'r seilwaith telathrebu, gan gynnwys mater rhannu safleoedd, fel y mae'r pwyllgor yn ei argymhell.

Cytunaf yn llwyr ag argymhelliad y pwyllgor ei bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol fanteisio ar y cynnig i gael cyfarfodydd â'r gweithredwyr er mwyn trafod y cynlluniau cyflwyno blynyddol yn llawn ac yna eu cyhoeddi. Byddwn yn trafod y mater hwn gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

Mae Brian Gibbons a minnau yn deall yn llwyr y pryderon sydd gan bobl am y canlyniadau iechyd posibl mewn perthynas â lleoli mastiau. Y cyngor presennol at iechyd yw bod y dystiolaeth sydd ar gael yn dangos nad oes risg gyffredinol i iechyd corfforol pobl sy'n byw ger y mastiau ar y sail mai'r disgwyliad yw mai cyfran fach iawn o'r symiau a argymhellir yw bod yn agored i ymbelydredd. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym sail statudol ar gyfer ei gwneud yn ofynnol



Commission on Non-Ionising Radiation Protection guidelines is provided. Although we cannot accept the committee's recommendation in this regard, we are not complacent about the issue, as my written statement to Plenary makes clear. Should the findings of the Mobile Telecommunications and Health Research Programme indicate that a change of planning policy is necessary, this will be taken up.

There is no evidence at present to indicate that mandatory use of the health impact assessment tool is necessary for planning or prior-approval applications for mobile telecommunications apparatus. However, I will keep the situation under review. I also want to consider the responses to the consultation that has just ended on the ministerial interim planning policy statement on planning, health and wellbeing. Should the consultation indicate that planning policy requires further clarification and/or practical guidance, this will be considered.

3.40 p.m.

Given insufficient evidence on potential impacts, I cannot at this time accept the recommendation to remove permitted development rights for mobile telecommunications apparatus up to 15m. However, I am open-minded as to the legislative possibilities that may be available to us. Further exploratory work needs to be undertaken, and I am aware of the problems that changes could mean for compliance with the EU directive on the common regulatory framework for electronic communication networks and services. I will therefore establish a working group, whose remit will include examining the legal, technical, economic, competitive and safety impacts of changing the permitted development rights for this type of apparatus. Recommendations from the working group will be made to the Assembly Government by next summer.

In conclusion, I welcome the committee's report, and I will continue to keep the

darparu datganiad cydymffurfio â chanllawiau'r Comisiwn Rhyngwladol ar Ddiogelu rhag Ymbelydredd nad yw'n Ïoneiddio. Er na allwn dderbyn argymhelliad y pwyllgor ar hyn, nid ydym yn hunanfodlon am y mater, fel sy'n amlwg yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Pe bai darganfyddiadau'r Rhaglen Ymchwil ar Delathrebu Symudol ac Iechyd yn dangos bod angen newid polisi cynllunio, caiff hyn ei weithredu.

Nid oes tystiolaeth ar hyn o bryd i ddangos bod defnyddio'r offeryn gorfodol i asesu'r effaith ar iechyd yn orfodol yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer ceisiadau cynllunio na cheisiadau cymeradwyaeth ymlaen llaw ar gyfer offer telathrebu symudol. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn parhau i adolygu'r sefyllfa. Yn ogystal, hoffwn ystyried yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad sydd newydd ddod i ben ar y datganiad polisi cynllunio dros dro gan y Gweinidog ar gynllunio, iechyd a lles. Os bydd yr ymgynghoriad yn dangos bod angen eglurhad pellach a/neu ganllawiau ymarferol pellach ar gyfer polisi cynllunio, caiff hyn ei ystyried.

Gan nad oes digon o dystiolaeth am effeithiau posibl, ni allaf, ar hyn o bryd, dderbyn yr argymhelliad i ddileu hawliau datblygu a ganiateir ar gyfer offer telathrebu symudol hyd at 15m. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn cadw fy meddwl yn agored am y posibiladau deddfwriaethol a allai fod ar gael inni. Mae angen gwneud mwy o waith archwilio, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r problemau y gallai unrhyw newidiadau eu hachosi o ran cydymffurfio â chyfarwyddeb yr UE ar y fframwaith rheoleiddio cyffredin ar gyfer rhwydweithiau a gwasanaethau cyfathrebu electronig. Felly, byddaf yn sefydlu gweithgor, gyda chylch gwaith a fydd yn cynnwys archwilio effeithiau'r cyfreithiol, technegol, economaidd a chystadleuol a'r effeithiau o ran diogelwch o newid yr hawliau datblygu a ganiateir ar gyfer y math hwn o offer. Cyflwynir argymhellion y gweithgor i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad erbyn yr haf y flwyddyn nesaf.

I gloi, croesawaf adroddiad y pwyllgor, a byddaf yn parhau i roi gwybod i'r pwyllgor

committee and the Assembly as a whole informed of developments being made in relation to this important matter.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf yn siomedig tu hwnt yn ymateb y Gweinidog i adroddiad y pwyllgor. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwrthod yr argymhelliad a fyddai wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol i gymunedau ac i ddeddfwriaeth ar fastiau telathrebu, sef yr argymhelliad i sicrhau bod yn rhaid i bob mast o dan 15m fynd drwy'r broses gynllunio llawn, fel y rhai dros 15m.

Yr oedd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn arbennig o awyddus i weld hyn yn digwydd yn ei dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, er mwyn cynyddu'r posibilïadau o ymgynghori ar leoliadau mastiau, ac osgoi'r ymateb negyddol a all ddigwydd pan fo mastiau o dan 15m yn ymddangos dros nos mewn cymunedau, heb unrhyw fath o ymgynghoriad lleol. Mae achos yn fy etholaeth i—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod achosion ym mhob etholaeth—o fast o dan 15m a ymddangosodd ar ben to Ysbyty Bron-glais heb fod unrhyw ymgynghoriad â'r trigolion lleol sy'n byw ger yr ysbyty. Yr oeddent yn teimlo'n arbennig o flin na chawsant unrhyw wybodaeth na chyfle i roi eu barn ar y mast hwnnw.

Cytunodd pob aelod o'r pwyllgor i'r argymhelliad hwn, ac ni allaf ddeall pam bod Llywodraeth Lafur yn gwrthod argymhelliad o'r math hwn i ddiwygio deddfwriaeth mewn ffordd ddigon rhesymol, a chymharol syml, a fyddai'n cryfhau democratiaeth a chynyddu hawliau cymunedau, heb beryglu mewn difrif y rhwydwaith telathrebu mewn unrhyw ffordd.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud ei fod eisiau sefydlu grŵp arall i edrych ar hyn, a fydd yn adrodd yn ôl yn yr haf. Erbyn i'r Gweinidog hwn ddod i unrhyw benderfyniad ar y mater hwn, bydd pob mast telathrebu sydd angen cael ei godi yng Nghymru wedi cael ei godi, ac ni fydd eisiau unrhyw fath o newid deddfwriaeth arnom. Efallai mai dyna yw bwriad y Gweinidog wrth ohirio unrhyw benderfyniad ar y mater hwn unwaith eto.

Un cwestiwn sydd gennyf i'r Gweinidog:

ac i'r Cynulliad cyfan am ddatblygiadau mewn cysylltiad â'r mater pwysig hwn.

**Elin Jones:** I am very disappointed at the Minister's response to the committee's report. The Minister has rejected the recommendation that would have made a significant difference to communities and to legislation on telecommunications masts, that is, the recommendation to ensure that every mast under 15m has to go through the full planning process, as do those over 15m.

The Welsh Local Government Association was particularly keen to see this happen in the evidence that it gave to the committee, in order to increase the possibilities of consultation on the location of masts, and to avoid the negative response that can occur when masts under 15m appear overnight in communities, without there having been any local consultation. There is a case in my constituency—and I am sure there are cases in every constituency—of a mast under 15m which appeared on the roof of Bronglais Hospital without any consultation with the local residents living near the hospital. They felt particularly aggrieved that they had not had an opportunity to voice their opinion about the mast.

Every member of the committee agreed to this recommendation, and I cannot understand why the Labour Government is rejecting a recommendation of this kind to amend legislation in a way that would be entirely reasonable, and relatively simple, and which would strengthen democracy and increase the rights of communities without endangering the telecommunications network in any significant way.

The Minister has said that he wants to set up another group to look at this, which will report back in the summer. By the time this Minister comes to a decision on this matter, every telecommunications mast that needs to be erected in Wales will have been erected, and we will not need any legislative change. Perhaps that is the Minister's intention in delaying a decision on this matter once again.

I have one question for the Minister: what is

beth yw'r dylanwad mwyaf sydd arnoch—ai barn Aelodau etholedig y Cynulliad, sy'n cytuno â barn llywodraeth leol, neu fuddiannau a hwylustod cwmnïau masnachol ffonau symudol? Hyd y gwelaf, y cwmnïau masnachol hynny sy'n dylanwadu ar eich penderfyniadau—ond, dyna ni, yr ydych yn aelod o'r un blaid â Tony Blair.

**Carwyn Jones:** Synnwyr cyffredin sy'n fy rheoli i—gwn fod hynny'n hollol estron i Blaid Cymru, ond mae'n rhaid inni dderbyn hynny.

Mae'n rhaid inni gofio bod yn rhaid cael barn y gwasanaethau argyfwng, a'r rheilffyrdd, er enghraifft, cyn gwneud newidiadau. Barn Plaid Cymru yw, os yw rhywbeth yn digwydd, mae'n rhaid ei newid heb unrhyw fath o dystiolaeth. Fodd bynnag, cael tystiolaeth yw'r ffordd ymlaen.

Ni chlywodd y pwyllgor oddi wrth y gwasanaethau argyfwng. Nid wyf yn beirniadu'r pwyllgor am hynny, oherwydd yr oedd amser yn brin. Ni chlywodd y pwyllgor oddi wrth y rheilffyrdd, busnesau na grwpiau cymunedol ychwaith. Nid yw'n beth call i newid y gyfraith heb glywed oddi wrth y grwpiau hynny.

Pwysleisiaf unwaith eto nad wyf yn erbyn newid i'r system mewn egwyddor; yr wyf wedi dweud hynny'n hollol glir. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am sicrhau bod y dystiolaeth gennym cyn gwneud newidiadau. Os yw'r dystiolaeth gennym, yn y pen draw, i newid y system lle mae mastiau o dan 15m yn cael caniatâd ar hyn o bryd, bydd yn rhaid gwneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig fy mod yn clywed barn y gwasanaethau argyfwng, y cwmnïau rheilffordd a grwpiau cymunedol cyn gwneud newidiadau. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, os mai'r hyn sydd ei angen yw i bob mast fynd drwy'r system gynllunio yn llawn, dyna fydd yn digwydd.

**Brynle Williams:** I welcome the Minister's statement this afternoon. No-one would disagree that mobile phones and the networks that supports them are essential to people living in Wales, but the planning system has not previously been the place to raise health problems; that is for the Health Protection

the greatest influence on you—is it the opinion of elected Members of the Assembly, who agree with local government opinion, or the interests of the mobile phone companies and what is convenient for them? As far as I can see, those commercial companies are influencing your decisions—but, there we are, you are a member of the same party as Tony Blair.

**Carwyn Jones:** Common sense is what guides me—I know that is entirely alien to Plaid Cymru, but we have to accept that.

We must bear in mind that we must have the opinions of the emergency services, and the railways, for example, before making changes. Plaid Cymru's opinion, if something is to happen, is that it must be changed without any kind of evidence. However, obtaining evidence is the way forward.

The committee did not hear from the emergency services. I am not criticising the committee for that, because time was short. It did not take evidence from the railways, or business or community groups either. It is not sensible to change the law without hearing from those groups.

I stress once again that I am not against changing the system in principle; I have made that clear. However, I want to ensure that we have the evidence before making changes. If we have the evidence, at the end of the day, to change the system where masts under 15m are allowed at present, that will have to be done. It is important that I listen to the views of the emergency services, the railway companies and community groups before making any changes. However, at the end of the day, if what is required is for each mast to go through the full planning system, that is what will happen.

**Brynle Williams:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma. Ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno nad yw ffonau symudol na'r rhwydweithiau sy'n eu cefnogi yn hanfodol i bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Ond nid y system gynllunio fu'r lle o'r blaen i godi problemau iechyd; gwaith yr Asiantaeth

Agency and other bodies, such as the World Health Organization. They have the resources and the authority to say whether or not masts and antennas are safe. However, the concerns of communities cannot be ignored, especially when equipment is placed in close proximity to schools or hospitals and the public feels that the only opportunity for its voice to be heard is through the planning system. We should not then be surprised that the planning system is used in this way.

However, I support the committee's recommendation that apparatus of up to 15m should be subject to the full planning process. Above all, it is important to strike the right balance. When networks expand and upgrade their services, they must take account of local concerns. Mobile phone technology is still relatively new and parents are especially concerned when it appears that there could be an effect on their children. These concerns are most pertinent in built-up areas, as the issues concerning rural areas are often rather different. Rural parts of north Wales often have a limited consumer choice in terms of available networks and some of the least populated areas, including many of the main road routes, are total black spots. This is particularly concerning, Minister, as many motorists who use these routes rely on their mobile phones as a contact with emergency services in case of accidents.

I thank you for your response, Minister and I hope that you will take on board the recommendations in the committee's report.

**Carwyn Jones:** From my understanding of what you said in the final part of your address to the Assembly, your complaint was that there was not enough mobile phone coverage in Wales, and that there should be more masts, effectively. I am not sure that extending planning controls would necessarily lead to that situation.

In terms of—

**Brynle Williams:** A gaf i ymateb?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n arferol mewn datganiad, os nad yw rhywun yn

Diogelu Iechyd a chyrrff eraill, megis Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd, yw gwneud hynny. Mae'r adnoddau a'r awdurdod ganddynt i ddweud a yw mastiau ac antenau yn ddiogel ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir anwybyddu pryderon cymunedau, yn enwedig pan osodir offer yn agos at ysgolion neu ysbytai a'r cyhoedd yn teimlo mai'r unig gyfle i'w llais gael ei glywed yw drwy'r system gynllunio. Ni ddylem synnu, felly, fod y system gynllunio'n cael ei defnyddio fel hyn.

Fodd bynnag, cefnogaf argymhelliad y pwyllgor y dylai cyfarpar hyd at 15m fod yn agored i'r broses gynllunio lawn. Yn anad dim, mae'n bwysig cael y cydbwysedd cywir. Pan fydd rhwydweithiau'n ehangu ac yn uwchraddio'u gwasanaethau, rhaid iddynt ystyried pryderon lleol. Mae technoleg ffonau symudol yn gymharol newydd o hyd, ac mae rhieni yn arbennig o bryderus pan ymddengys y gallai hyn gael effaith ar eu plant. Mae'r pryderon hyn ar eu mwyaf amlwg mewn ardaloedd adeiledig, gan fod y problemau sy'n ymwneud ag ardaloedd gwledig yn aml ychydig yn wahanol. Yn aml, prin yw'r dewis i ddefnyddwyr mewn rhannau gwledig o'r gogledd, ac nid yw'r dechnoleg ar gael o gwbl yn rhai o'r ardaloedd lle mae'r boblogaeth leiaf, gan gynnwys nifer o'r prif ffyrdd. Mae hyn yn achosi pryder arbennig, Weinidog, gan fod modurwyr sy'n defnyddio'r ffyrdd yn dibynnu ar eu ffonau symudol fel cyswllt â'r gwasanaethau brys pan fydd damweiniau'n digwydd.

Diolch ichi am eich ymateb, Weinidog a gobeithio y byddwch yn ystyried yr argymhellion yn adroddiad y pwyllgor.

**Carwyn Jones:** O'r hyn a ddeallaf am yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn rhan olaf eich anerchiad i'r Cynulliad mai eich cwyn oedd nad oedd digon o fastiau ffonau symudol yng Nghymru, ac y dylid cael mwy ohonynt, mewn gwirionedd. Nid wyf yn siŵr y byddai estyn rheolaethau cynllunio o reidrwydd yn arwain at y sefyllfa honno.

O ran—

**Brynle Williams:** May I respond?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not normal practice during a statement, unless

arweinydd plaid. Datganiad yw'r eitem hon, nid dadl. Pam na chei di air gydag Aelod arall, rhag ofn i mi alw rhywun arall?

**Carwyn Jones:** The 15m limit has been there since 1948, which is not a good reason for keeping it—that much, I accept. However, it needs to be investigated a little further because, first, we need to investigate whether every mast under 15m should be part of the full planning approval process. If so, should there be exemptions, for emergency services, for example? Should there be exemptions for the railways? These are questions that can only be addressed after a further round of consultation, in fairness to the emergency services and those who might be affected. We will then come up with a robust change to the system that is, hopefully, fully supported by all those with an interest.

**Y Llywydd:** O ran y pwynt o drefn a godwyd yn gynharach, tra bod hwnnw'n fyw yn fy meddwl, mae hyn wedi digwydd sawl gwaith ar eitemau fel hyn, lle mae Gweinidogion, yn ddigon priodol yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog presennol, yn gwneud datganiad mewn ymateb i adroddiad pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae yn fy nharo'n gynyddol y byddai dadl briodol, gyda digon o amser, ar adroddiadau pwyllgor yn bodloni dyheadau Aelodau yn well na'r gweithdrefnau presennol. Dyna air bach ar gyfer y dyfodol, fel petai. Diolch am eich amynedd ar hynny.

**Mick Bates:** First, I declare an interest, in that I am a member of a farming business that has a Vodafone telecommunications mast on land that it owns.

3.50 p.m.

Your statement, Minister, is somewhat disappointing, given the thoroughness of the committee's report and the general consensus—I believe that it was unanimous—on the recommendations. I will refer to particular issues. The work undertaken by Arup and the University of Reading gave us a clear guideline that we needed an independent body to look at all this. Do you intend to establish such a body, as suggested in recommendation 1 or 2? It

someone is a party leader. This item is a statement, and not a debate. Why not have a word with another Member, in case I call someone else?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r terfyn o 15m mewn grym er 1948, ac nid yw hynny'n rheswm da dros ei gadw—derbyniad gymaint â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen ymchwilio iddo ychydig ymhellach oherwydd, yn gyntaf, mae angen inni ymchwilio i weld a ddylai pob mast llai na 15m fod yn rhan o'r broses lawn o gymeradwyo cynllunio. Os felly, a ddylid cael eithriadau, ar gyfer gwasanaethau brys, er enghraifft? A ddylid cael eithriadau ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd? Dyna gwestiynau na ellir ymdrin â hwy ond ar ôl cylch ymgynghori arall, a bod yn deg i'r gwasanaethau brys a'r rhai y gallai hyn effeithio arnynt. Yna, byddwn yn darparu newid cadarn yn y system a fydd, gobeithio, yn cael ei gefnogi gan bawb sydd â diddordeb.

**The Presiding Officer:** On the point of order raised earlier, while it is still fresh in my mind, this has happened many times on items such as this, where Ministers, appropriately enough according to our current Standing Orders, make a statement in response to a committee report. However, increasingly, it strikes me that an appropriate debate, with plenty of time, on committee reports would fulfil Members' wishes far better than the present system. That is a thought for the future, as it were. Thank you for your patience in this matter.

**Mick Bates:** Yn gyntaf, datganaf fuddiant am fy mod yn aelod o fusnes ffermio sydd â mast telathrebu Vodafone ar dir y mae'n berchen arno.

Mae eich datganiad, Weinidog, ychydig yn siomedig o gofio trylwyredd adroddiad y pwyllgor a'r consensws cyffredinol—yr oedd yn unfrydol mi gredaf—ar yr argymhellion. Cyfeiriaf at faterion penodol. Yr oedd y gwaith a wnaed gan Arup a Phrifysgol Reading yn rhoi canllaw clir inni fod arnom angen corff annibynnol i edrych ar hyn i gyd. A ydych yn bwriadu sefydlu corff o'r fath, fel yr awgrymir yn argymhelliad 1 neu 2? Nid yw'n ymddangos eich bod am gael unrhyw

does not seem as if you want to have any independence in this. The Welsh Liberal Democrats have always taken the precautionary principle as the way that we should move forward on this. I respect the fact that you have discussed the health issues with Brian Gibbons, but people's suspicions are often aroused by Government looking at its own rules. There is a need, in this case, to accept the Welsh Local Government Association's recommendation that we need some independence in this and full planning permission for masts under 15m. I accept the need to roll out a full range so that, in deep rural areas, everyone can access the benefits of modern telecommunications. The shites—sorry, sites—*[Interruption.]* You do not know how long it took me to practice that.

Spreading out services to people in rural areas is a particular issue. In terms of site sharing, has the Government ever considered a partnership with private companies to ensure that remote areas that do not have the infrastructure to get internet services could use that, because wireless technology is available and I am aware of the fact that the Government has undertaken an experiment on that? That would help to engage with communities. Currently, there is a breakdown of trust with the communities.

I am not certain, from your statement, how the rights of communities have been enhanced. I wish that you could just point to a bit to show me where the communities now have a bigger say in the siting of masts with their local planning authority. You also said, in your statement, that you are not complacent about the health issues, yet I am aware that advice is often given to expectant mothers who are in blue-light services, not to keep their Tetra receivers close to their bodies. Is that true, Minister? Is such advice in existence? If it is, it tends to suggest that there are health impacts that some people are currently unaware of.

Finally, I accept the principle that you need to talk to others on this, such as the blue-light services, but, considering that your response to the committee report is quite late, I tend to agree with Elin that you are kicking this

annibyniaeth yn hyn o beth. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi derbyn yr egwyddor ragofalus bob amser fel y ffordd y dylem weithredu ar hyn. Parchaf y ffaith ichi drafod y materion iechyd gyda Brian Gibbons, ond bydd pobl yn aml yn amheus o Lywodraeth sy'n edrych ar ei rheolau ei hun. Yn yr achos hwn, mae angen derbyn argymhelliad Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, fod angen rhywfaint o annibyniaeth arnom yn hyn a chaniatâd cynllunio llawn ar gyfer mastiau llai na 15m. Derbyniaf fod angen darparu ystod lawn fel y gall pawb, mewn ardaloedd gwledig iawn, fanteisio ar fuddiannau telathrebu modern.

Mae lledaenu gwasanaethau i bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn broblem benodol. O ran rhannu safleoedd, a yw'r Llywodraeth erioed wedi ystyried partneriaeth â chwmnïau preifat i sicrhau y gallai ardaloedd anghysbell, nad oes ganddynt y seilwaith ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r rhyngwrwyd, ddefnyddio hynny oherwydd mae technoleg ddiwifr ar gael a gwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi cynnal arbrawf ar hynny? Byddai hynny'n helpu ymgysylltu â chymunedau. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oedd gan y cymunedau ffydd ynom.

Nid wyf yn sicr, o'ch datganiad, sut y mae hawliau cymunedau wedi eu gwella. Trueni na allech ddangos imi sut y mae gan gymunedau yn awr lais cryfach wrth leoli mastiau gyda'u hawdurdod cynllunio lleol. Yr oeddech yn dweud hefyd, yn eich datganiad, nad ydych yn hollol fodlon eto ynghylch y materion iechyd, ac eto gwn fod cyngor yn aml yn cael ei roi i famau beichiog sy'n gweithio i'r gwasanaethau brys, am beidio â chadw eu derbynyddion Tetra yn agos at eu cyrff. A yw hynny'n wir, Weinidog? A oes cyngor o'r fath ar gael? Os oes, mae'n tueddu i awgrymu bod yna effeithiau iechyd nad yw rhai pobl yn ymwybodol ohonynt ar hyn o bryd.

I gloi, derbyniaf yr egwyddor fod angen ichi siarad ag eraill am y mater hwn, fel y gwasanaethau brys. Ond o gofio bod eich ymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor yn eithaf hwyr, tueddaf i gytuno ag Elin eich bod yn

process into the long grass because you do not want to do anything during your term of office. I hope that, in your reply to my questions, you will allay my doubts and build up a new air of trust between us.

**Carwyn Jones:** That is the first time that I have heard that about the Tetra devices; you will have to ask the Minister for Health and Social Services about that, as it is certainly not something that comes under the planning system. It is worth emphasising what TAN 19 says about site sharing:

‘Local planning authorities may reasonably expect applications for new masts to show evidence that they have explored the possibility of erecting antennas on an existing building, mast or other structure....This evidence should accompany any application made to the local planning authority....If the evidence regarding the consideration of such alternative sites is not considered satisfactory, the planning authority...may be justified in refusing planning permission for the development.’

Those are reasonably strong words in terms of site sharing.

You asked me what the difference is in terms of what is being taken forward. There are some major differences here, although they are not immediate today, but I will explain them. First, the code of practice will be strengthened and if there is a way of strengthening the TAN to ensure that that happens, then that will be done. I have accepted that recommendation. Secondly, in terms of masts under 15m, the door is far from shut on whether they should go through the full planning approval process. All I have said is that there is a need to consult a little further with those who would be excepted—that is not a criticism of the committee, because the committee had a limited amount of time to examine this matter—to examine whether or not there should be exemptions for certain masts, if it is the case that masts under 15m should have planning permission. It is not possible to take a measured judgment on that without listening to further evidence. It is worth emphasising that the planning system relies on local planning authorities

ceisio diystyru'r mater hwn gan nad ydych am ymdrin ag ef yn ystod eich tymor yn y swydd. Gobeithio, yn eich ateb i'm cwestiynau, y byddwch yn lleddfu fy amheuon ac yn creu ymddiriedaeth newydd rhngom.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed am y dyfeisiau Tetra; bydd yn rhaid ichi holi'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am hynny, gan ei fod yn sicr yn rhywbeth nad yw'n rhan o'r system gynllunio. Mae'n werth pwysleisio'r hyn a ddywed TAN 19 am rannu safleoedd:

‘Mae'n rhesymol i'r awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ddisgwyl i ymgeiswyr am ganiatâd cynllunio ar gyfer codi mastiau newydd ddangos tystiolaeth eu bod wedi archwilio'r posibilrwydd o godi antenau ar adeilad, mast neu adeiledd arall sy'n bodoli eisoes..... Os nad ystyrir bod y dystiolaeth o ystyried safleoedd eraill yn foddhaol, gall fod cyfiawnhad i'w awdurdod cynllunio lleol ... wrthod caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer y datblygiad.’

Mae'r rheini'n eiriau digon cryf am rannu safleoedd.

Gofynnech beth yw'r gwahaniaeth o ran yr hyn y gweithredir arno. Mae rhai gwahaniaethau mawr yma, er nad ydynt yn bwysig heddiw, ond fe'u hegluraf. Yn gyntaf, caiff y cod ymarfer ei gryfhau, ac os oes ffordd i gryfhau'r TAN i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd, yna caiff hynny ei wneud. Yr wyf wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw. Yn ail, o ran mastiau llai na 15m, ni wnaed y penderfyniad o bell ffordd a ddylent fynd drwy'r broses lawn o gymeradwyo cynllunio ai peidio. Y cyfan a ddywedais oedd bod angen ymgynghori ychydig yn fwy â'r rhai y byddai disgwyl iddynt—nid yw hynny'n feirniadaeth ar y pwyllgor, oherwydd prin oedd yr amser a oedd ar gael i'r pwyllgor archwilio'r mater hwn—archwilio a ddylid cael eithriadau ar gyfer rhai mastiau ai peidio, os yw'n wir y dylai mastiau llai na 15m gael caniatâd cynllunio. Nid yw'n bosibl llunio barn ystyriol am hynny heb wrando ar dystiolaeth bellach. Mae'n werth pwysleisio bod y system gynllunio yn dibynnu ar awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ac, i raddau llai,

and, to a lesser extent, on the Assembly to take planning decisions. Communities, it is right, have a role in influencing planning decisions, but they cannot take those planning decisions themselves. As soon as that happens, there is a real danger that nothing would ever happen. It is inevitable that an elected body, in some way or other, should take planning decisions.

Your first point was about a recommendation for an independent body, which I must confess I cannot find in the written statement. I think that you mentioned an independent body that would look at masts under 15m. It is not clear what you mean by that. However, if it has been suggested that an independent body should determine applications for masts under 15m, that clearly cannot be right, and I do not think that that is what you meant, in fairness. There is no reference to an independent body, as far as I can see, being set up with regard to masts. We have to remember one thing when it comes to the science: I know from experience that scientists say a great many things that are often contradictory, but we have to look at the weight of evidence in any particular circumstance. That is what the Stewart report is trying to do. We know what the Stewart report says, and our planning guidelines try to follow the advice of that report. It is possible to produce lots of evidence that may or may not be robust, and it is important that we have an independent group, which the Stewart group was, to advise Government properly on the weight of evidence in terms of masts. We know that the report concluded that, yes, there has to be a precautionary principle, but there is nevertheless no general effect on the health of the population. That is the best-known science at the moment—should it change, it is important for planning guidance to change with it.

**Lynne Neagle:** I thank the Minister for his statement and for his meetings with my constituents on this issue. However, I would like clarification on some of the Minister's responses. First, with regard to recommendation 1 on the code of practice, this falls some way short of a commitment to make the current code of practice statutory.

ar y Cynulliad i gymryd penderfyniadau cynllunio. Mae gan gymunedau, mae'n iawn dweud, rôl i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau cynllunio, ond ni allant gymryd y penderfyniadau cynllunio hynny eu hunain. Cyn gynted ag y digwydd hynny, mae gwir berygl na fyddai dim byd byth yn digwydd. Mae'n anochel y dylai corff etholedig, mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd, gymryd penderfyniadau cynllunio.

Yr oedd a wnelo eich pwynt cyntaf ag argymhelliad am gorff annibynnol, a rhaid imi gyfaddef na allaf ddod o hyd iddo yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig. Credaf ichi sôn am gorff annibynnol a fyddai'n ystyried mastiau llai na 15m. Nid yw'n glir beth a olygwch wrth hynny. Fodd bynnag, os awgrymwyd y dylai corff annibynnol benderfynu ceisiadau ar gyfer mastiau llai na 15m, yn amlwg ni all hynny fod yn iawn, ac ni chredaf mai dyna yr oeddech yn ei olygu, a bod yn deg. Nid oes cyfeiriad o gwbl, hyd y gwelaf, at sefydlu corff annibynnol ar gyfer mastiau. Rhaid inni gofio un peth wrth drafod gwyddoniaeth: gwn o brofiad fod gwyddonwyr yn dweud llawer o bethau mawr sy'n aml yn groes i'w gilydd, ond rhaid inni edrych ar yr holl dystiolaeth mewn unrhyw amgylchiadau penodol. Dyna y mae adroddiad Stewart yn ceisio'i wneud. Gwyddom beth a ddywed adroddiad Stewart, ac mae ein canllawiau cynllunio'n ceisio dilyn cyngor yr adroddiad hwnnw. Mae'n bosibl cynhyrchu llawer o dystiolaeth a all neu na all fod yn gadarn, ac mae'n bwysig fod gennym grŵp annibynnol, sef yr hyn ydoedd grŵp Stewart, i gynghori'r Llywodraeth yn briodol am yr holl dystiolaeth am fastiau. Gwyddom i'r adroddiad ddod i'r casgliad fod yn rhaid cael egwyddor ragofalus, ond serch hynny, nid oes unrhyw effaith gyffredinol ar iechyd y boblogaeth. Dyna'r wyddoniaeth orau y gwyddom amdani ar hyn o bryd—os bydd yn newid, mae'n bwysig i'r canllawiau cynllunio newid yr un pryd.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad ac am gyfarfod â'm hetholwyr ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gael eglurhad am rai o ymatebion y Gweinidog. Yn gyntaf, o ran argymhelliad 1 ar y cod ymarfer, mae hyn ymhell o fod yn ymrwymiad i wneud y cod ymarfer cyfredol yn statudol. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod



While I appreciate the need to take things forward in a considered way, I would be interested in having more detail on the timescale in particular. As you know, Minister, when you met my constituents and representatives of the local authority, there are considerable concerns in Torfaen about the conduct of mobile phone operators, and tightening the code would provide an opportunity to address those concerns significantly.

On recommendation 3, I, too, am disappointed that the Assembly Government is not making a more positive recommendation on permitted development rights. We have to recognise the powerlessness that communities feel in the face of mobile phone operators. Certainly, the planning process is one of the few mechanisms that they do have, particularly when the code is not working properly. While I appreciate the need to take account of emergency services and so on, I do not think that it should be beyond the wit of the Assembly Government to deal with the issue and subject all mobile phone masts to full planning control.

On recommendation 4 on health concerns, whatever the current scientific advice, we must accept that the No. 1 concern for people living near a mobile phone mast or whose school is near one is the impact on health and the health of their children. It remains the case that local authorities are in a particularly difficult position: although they do not have the capacity to undertake health impact assessments, they have to take health concerns into account as part of the planning considerations. In Torfaen, this has led to a difficult situation, with the local authority wanting to listen to the concerns of the community, but finding it difficult to do so under the current guidance. I would, therefore, be grateful if you could outline any plans that you have to improve the guidance to local authorities on the issue of health concerns in the community.

**Carwyn Jones:** First, I can make it clear that we do accept recommendation 1 to make the code a statutory document or incorporate parts of it into TAN 19. We will take forward

angen gweithredu ar bethau mewn ffordd ystyriol, byddai mwy o ddi-ddordeb gennyf mewn cael rhagor o fanylion am yr amserlen yn arbennig. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, pan fu ichi gwrdd â'm hetholwyr a chynrychiolwyr yr awdurdod lleol, mae pryderon mawr yn Nhor-faen ynghylch ymddygiad gweithredwyr ffonau symudol, a byddai tynhau'r cod yn gyfle i fynd i'r afael yn sylweddol â rhai o'r pryderon hynny.

O ran argymhelliad 3, yr wyf fi, hefyd, yn siomedig nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud argymhelliad mwy cadarnhaol ar hawliau datblygu a ganiateir. Rhaid inni gydnabod mor analluog y mae cymunedau'n teimlo wrth wynebu gweithredwyr ffonau symudol. Yn sicr, y broses gynllunio yw un o'r ychydig ddulliau sydd ganddynt, yn arbennig pan nad yw'r cod yn gweithio'n iawn. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod angen ystyried y gwasanaethau brys, ac ati, ni chredaf y dylai fod y tu hwnt i grebwyll Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymdrin â'r mater a sicrhau bod pob mast ffonau symudol yn destun rheolaeth gynllunio lawn.

O ran argymhelliad 4 am bryderon iechyd, beth bynnag yw'r cyngor gwyddonol cyfredol, rhaid inni dderbyn mai'r prif bryder i bobl sy'n byw yn agos at fast ffonau symudol, neu sydd â'u hysgol yn agos at un, yw'r effaith ar iechyd ac iechyd eu plant. Mae'n dal yn wir fod awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa arbennig o anodd: er nad oedd ganddynt y gallu i wneud asesiadau o'r effaith ar iechyd, rhaid iddynt ystyried pryderon iechyd fel rhan o'r ystyriaethau cynllunio. Yn Nhor-faen, mae hyn wedi arwain at sefyllfa anodd, lle mae'r awdurdod lleol am wrando ar bryderon y gymuned ond yn ei chael yn anodd gwneud hynny o dan y canllawiau cyfredol. Byddwn, felly, yn ddiolchgar pe gallech amlinellu unrhyw gynlluniau sydd gennych i wella'r canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol o ran pryderon iechyd yn y gymuned.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, pwysleisïaf ein bod yn derbyn argymhelliad 1 i wneud y cod yn ddogfen statudol neu i ymgorffori rhannau ohono yn TAN 19. Byddwn yn gweithredu ar

whichever proves to be the most effective.

ba un bynnag fydd fwyaf effeithiol.

On the issue of full development rights, I have gone through that in some detail before now, and I repeat that I have an open mind on the matter. I certainly do not close the door to it, and if the case is made for changing the planning guidance, that can certainly be done.

O ran hawliau datblygu llawn, yr wyf wedi trafod hynny'n lled fanwl cyn heddiw, a dywedaf eto fod gennyf feddwl agored ar y mater. Yn sicr, nid wyf am ei ddiystyru, ac os bydd dadl dros newid y canllawiau cynllunio, yn sicr gellir gwneud hynny.

The issue of health is difficult. There is a difference between people's perception of something that affects their health and whether it actually does so. It is an old problem that we are familiar with from the case of overhead electricity lines, for example, and it has been the case in the past with other forms of communication as well.

Mae mater iechyd yn un anodd. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng canfyddiad pobl o rywbeth sy'n effeithio ar eu hiechyd ac a yw'n gwneud hynny ai peidio mewn gwirionedd. Mae'n hen broblem yr ydym yn gyfarwydd â hi am linellau trydan uwchben, er enghraifft, ac mae wedi bod yn wir yn y gorffennol gyda mathau eraill o gyfathrebu hefyd.

4.00 p.m.

All that we can reasonably do is to offer an independent group the opportunity to provide an opinion on it. Once that independent group has provided an opinion, we will follow it.

Yr unig beth y gallwn ei wneud yn rhesymol yw cynnig y cyfle i grŵp annibynnol fynegi barn arno. Pan fydd y grŵp annibynnol wedi rhoi ei farn, byddwn yn ei dilyn.

In Wales, we require the presentation of an International Commission on Non-Ionizing Radiation Protection certificate, which ensures that the mast operates within guidelines that are laid down. That is an important safety mechanism as far as the public are concerned, and it also ensures that the masts are safe under those particular guidelines.

Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cyflwyno tystysgrif y Comisiwn Rhyngwladol ar Ddiogelu rhag Pelydredd nad yw'n Ïoneiddio, sy'n sicrhau bod y mast yn gweithredu o fewn y canllawiau a bennwyd. Mae hwnnw'n gam diogelwch pwysig o ran y cyhoedd, ac mae hefyd yn sicrhau bod y mastiau'n ddiogel o dan y canllawiau penodol hynny.

It is difficult for local authorities because they do not have the capacity to assess health impact assessments. Inevitably, local authorities will look at the ICNIRP certificate and they may take advice from the Health Protection Agency, but it all comes back to the report of the Stewart group. Having said that, if the science changes and the planning guidance changes with it, it is difficult for community groups—whom I have met in my constituency—to challenge the science, which is inevitably a difficult thing to do if you are not a scientist. Therefore, we must rely on the science that is there and try to strike a balance between the interests of communities and ensuring that we have a communication system that is safe, according to the report by the Stewart group.

Mae'n anodd i awdurdodau lleol am nad oes ganddynt y gallu i asesu asesiadau effaith iechyd. Yn anochel, bydd awdurdodau lleol yn edrych ar y dystysgrif ICNIRP a gallant gael cyngor gan yr Asiantaeth Diogelu Iechyd hwyrach, ond mae popeth yn dibynnu ar adroddiad grŵp Stewart. Wedi dweud hynny, os bydd y wyddoniaeth yn newid a'r canllawiau cynllunio'n newid hefyd, mae'n anodd i grwpiau cymunedol—yr wyf wedi cwrdd â hwy yn fy etholaeth—herio'r wyddoniaeth, sy'n anochel yn beth anodd ei wneud os nad ydych yn wyddonydd. Felly, rhaid inni ddibynnu ar y wyddoniaeth sy'n bodoli a cheisio sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng buddiannau cymunedau a sicrhau bod gennym system gyfathrebu sy'n ddiogel, yn ôl yr adroddiad gan grŵp Stewart.

**David Lloyd:** I firmly believe that the precautionary principle should apply, as in the Stewart report and other reports, and that mobile phone transmitter masts, of whatever size, should be sited well away from schools, hospitals and residential areas, and be subject to full planning laws each time, much along the lines of what Lynne Neagle enunciated. What will you say to Labour Assembly Members, who, to be fair, always join me in protests against mobile phone transmitter masts being located next to schools, when Labour is given a chance to tighten the planning laws, but fails to deliver?

**Carwyn Jones:** People will do what is right for their constituency, but it is important in Government that we do not make decisions that have a flimsy scientific basis or have not been fully consulted upon.

**Alun Cairns:** I support the statement that you have made, particularly in relation to mobile phone operations. Contrary to some of the statements that have been made, such operations are subject to full planning laws as they stand. The permitted development rights allow speedier action to take place, but do you recognise that planning authorities have the opportunity to object under the current arrangements, and that there needs to be a much closer working relationship between the mobile phone operators and local planning authorities—the blame lies generally with the mobile phone operators—so that they negotiate and work together to come up with a much more suitable arrangement for all concerned?

**Carwyn Jones:** There is an element of truth in what you say, but it is also important to consider further the question of whether masts should come under full planning controls. That is an open question on which I look forward to seeing the evidence provided to me, or to whoever is in this position in the future.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome this report and some of the responses to it, but I share the concerns surrounding prior planning approval for 15m masts. I accept that the Stewart

**David Lloyd:** Credaf yn gryf y dylid dilyn yr egwyddor ragofalus, fel yn adroddiad Stewart ac adroddiadau eraill, ac y dylid lleoli mastiau trosglwyddo ffonau symudol, o ba faint bynnag, yn ddigon pell oddi wrth ysgolion, ysbytai ac ardaloedd preswyl, ac y dylent fod yn amodol ar gyfreithiau cynllunio llawn bob tro, yn debyg iawn i'r hyn a ddywedodd Lynne Neagle. Beth a ddywedwch wrth Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad, sydd, a bod yn deg, bob amser yn ymuno â mi i ymgyrchu yn erbyn lleoli mastiau trosglwyddo ffonau symudol yn agos at ysgolion, pan roddir y cyfle i Lafur dynhau'r cyfreithiau cynllunio, ond sy'n methu â chyflawni?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd pobl yn gwneud yr hyn sy'n gywir i'w hetholaeth hwy, ond mae'n bwysig yn y Llywodraeth inni beidio â gwneud penderfyniadau sydd â sail wyddonol simsan neu sydd heb ymgynghori'n llawn arnynt.

**Alun Cairns:** Cefnogaf y datganiad a wnaed gennyh, yn arbennig o ran gweithrediadau ffonau symudol. Yn groes i rai o'r datganiadau a wnaed, mae gweithrediadau o'r fath yn amodol ar gyfreithiau cynllunio llawn fel y maent. Mae'r hawliau datblygu a ganiateir yn ei gwneud yn bosibl gweithredu ynghynt, ond a ydych yn cydnabod bod gan awdurdodau cynllunio y cyfle i wrthwynebu o dan y trefniadau presennol, a bod angen sicrhau perthynas waith agosach o lawer rhwng y gweithredwyr ffonau symudol ac awdurdodau cynllunio lleol—y gweithredwyr ffonau symudol sydd ar fai yn gyffredinol—er mwyn iddynt drafod a gweithio gyda'i gilydd i lunio trefniant mwy addas o lawer i bawb dan sylw?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae elfen o wirionedd yn yr hyn a ddywedwch, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig ystyried ymhellach a ddylai mastiau gael eu cynnwys o dan reolaethau cynllunio llawn. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn agored ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y dystiolaeth a roddir i mi, neu i bwy bynnag sydd yn y swydd hon yn y dyfodol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a rhai o'r ymatebion iddo, ond yr wyf fi hefyd yn bryderus am y gymeradwyaeth gynllunio ymlaen llaw ar gyfer mastiau 15m.

report is erring on the side of precautionary measures, but the reality is that you can get any evidence that you want from scientists—if you ask them the right questions, you will get the answer that you seek. You mentioned perceptions of health difficulties, but I would probably not offer the roof of my house for a telephone mast or for overhead power lines. Therefore, if it is not right for me or other Assembly Members, it is something that we must question in legislation.

A community in my constituency will have a 15m pole placed in its village, and, to be honest, the developers have ridden roughshod over the planning conditions, and I and other Members have written to you about that. I welcome the opportunity that you have mentioned to create a working group to consider these prior planning approval conditions. Perhaps you can give us more detail on that. I also welcome the fact that you say that the door is still open on this. I accept that there must be time for, and evidence on, exemptions on these reports, but I believe that we should take this seriously.

**Carwyn Jones:** As I have said, the objective is for the working group to report by the summer, with any further changes to planning guidance being done after that as quickly as possible. On scientific evidence, I know from experience that all manner of scientific evidence can be put before you, some of it robust and some of it not particularly robust and not even peer-reviewed. It is also possible for two scientists to say exactly the opposite thing, as we know from years gone by in terms of the debate that took place at one time as to whether there was a link between HIV and AIDS. It is right that science is not as precise as those of us who are not scientists might think. In those circumstances, all that you can do is bring together a group of scientists and measure the weight of evidence. There are some who will disagree, but it is all about what the majority of scientists say about a particular risk. It is the same with smoking: there are still some scientists who say that there is no link between smoking and cancer, but the bulk of scientific evidence suggests that there is. We have to take the same kind of approach to the

Derbyniaf fod adroddiad Stewart yn tueddu i fod yn rhagofalus, ond y gwir yw y gallwch gael unrhyw dystiolaeth a fynnwch gan wyddonwyr—os gofynnwch y cwestiynau cywir iddynt, fe gewch yr ateb a geisiwch. Yr oeddech yn sôn am ganfyddiadau am anawsterau iechyd, ond mae'n siŵr na fyddwn yn cynnig to fy nhŷ ar gyfer mast ffôn nac ar gyfer llinellau pŵer uwchben. Felly, os nad yw'n iawn i mi nac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad, mae'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni ei gwestiynu mewn deddfwriaeth.

Mae polyn 15m i gael ei osod mewn pentref yn fy etholaeth i, ac i fod yn onest mae'r datblygwyr wedi llwyr ddiystyru'r amodau cynllunio, ac yr wyf fi ac Aelodau eraill wedi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hynny. Croesawaf y cyfle yr ydych wedi sôn amdano i lunio gweithgor i ystyried yr amodau hyn o ran cymeradwyaeth gynllunio ymlaen llaw. Efallai y gallwch roi mwy o fanylion inni am hynny. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith eich bod yn dweud bod y drws yn dal ar agor ar y mater hwn. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid sicrhau amser ar gyfer eithriadau ar yr adroddiadau hyn a thystiolaeth, ond credaf y dylem ystyried hyn o ddifrif.

**Carwyn Jones:** Fel y dywedais, y nod yw i'r gweithgor gyflwyno adroddiad erbyn yr haf, ac i unrhyw newidiadau pellach mewn canllawiau cynllunio gael eu gwneud wedi hynny cyn gynted â phosibl. O ran tystiolaeth wyddonol, gwn o brofiad y gellir cyflwyno pob math o dystiolaeth wyddonol ger eich bron, rywfaent ohoni'n gadarn a rhywfaint ohoni heb fod yn arbennig o gadarn, a thystiolaeth na wnaed adolygiad ohoni gan gymheiriaid hyd yn oed. Mae hefyd yn bosibl i ddau wyddonydd wrth-ddweud ei gilydd yn llwyr, oherwydd gwyddom o brofiad yn y gorffennol yn y ddadl a gafwyd ar un adeg am y cwestiwn a oedd cysylltiad rhwng HIV ac AIDS. Mae'n wir nad yw gwyddoniaeth mor fanwl gywir ag y mae'r rheini ohonom nad ydym yn wyddonwyr yn ei feddwl, hwyrach. O dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, y cyfan y gallwch ei wneud yw dwyn ynghyd grŵp o wyddonwyr a phwyso a mesur y dystiolaeth. Fe fydd rhai'n anghytuno, ond mae'n ymwneud â'r hyn y bydd y mwyafrif o'r gwyddonwyr yn ei ddweud am risg benodol. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ysmegu: mae rhai gwyddonwyr yn dweud o hyd nad

recommendations of the Stewart group.

**Glyn Davies:** I thank the Minister for his report and for accepting some of the committee's recommendations. I accept that this is a difficult issue for the Minister to address in terms of some aspects of the report. I will ask you about one of those areas where you have not accepted the committee's recommendation, which relates to permitted development rights. Many Members have asked about that today. There is no doubt that this is problematic. Just to remove permitted development rights is not the only option. In the discussions that I have had with people, there has been a general acceptance that some rights could be removed and that others might not be removed. It is not a black and white position.

You set up a group to consider that—and it is interesting that the broadcast bodies will be contributing to it; they have an important contribution to make to the debate and the committee did not have the benefit of their advice—and the group's workings and conclusions will be of huge interest to Members. When will this group meet? What will the programme be in terms of the evidence that it will be taking? When do you expect that conclusion to be reached? If you are going to address the committee's concerns and those of many other Members, you have to satisfy them that this is a genuine group that is designed to come up with a conclusion and not just, as one or two Members have said, a way of kicking this issue into the long grass.

**Carwyn Jones:** The intention is to set the group up as soon as possible and that it should report by the summer, so it has to be set up pretty quickly. The committee will be notified of the group's composition and remit as soon as possible, once that is done.

oes cysylltiad rhwng ysmegu a chanser, ond awgryma trwch y dystiolaeth wyddonol fod yna gysylltiad. Rhaid inni fabwysiadu'r un math o ymagwedd at argymhellion grŵp Stewart.

**Glyn Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei adroddiad ac am dderbyn rhai o argymhellion y pwyllgor. Derbyniaf fod hwn yn fater anodd i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael ag ef o ran rhai agweddau at yr adroddiad. Hoffwn eich holi am un o'r meysydd hynny lle nad ydych wedi derbyn argymhelliad y pwyllgor. Mae'n ymwneud â hawliau datblygu a ganiateir. Mae nifer o aelodau wedi holi am hynny heddiw. Mae hyn yn sicr yn achosi problemau. Nid dileu hawliau datblygu a ganiateir yw'r unig ddewis. Yn y trafodaethau a gefais gyda phobl, derbyniwyd yn gyffredinol y gellid dileu rhai hawliau ond na ellid dileu eraill. Nid yw'n fater du a gwyn.

Bu ichi sefydlu grŵp i ystyried hynny—ac mae'n ddiddorol y bydd y cyrff darlledu yn cyfrannu ato; mae ganddynt gyfraniad pwysig i'w wneud i'r ddadl, ond ni chafodd y pwyllgor eu cyngor—a bydd gwaith a chasgliadau'r grŵp o ddiddordeb mawr i Aelodau. Pryd y bydd y grŵp hwn yn cwrdd? Beth fydd y rhaglen o ran y dystiolaeth y bydd yn ei chymryd? Pryd yr ydych yn disgwyl dod i'r casgliad hwnnw? Os ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â phryderon y pwyllgor a phryderon nifer o Aelodau eraill, rhaid ichi eu bodloni bod hwn yn grŵp sydd â'r nod gwirioneddol o ddod i gasgliad, ac nid yn ddim mwy na ffordd i daflu'r mater hwn o'r neilltu, fel y dywedodd un neu ddau Aelod.

**Carwyn Jones:** Y bwriad yw sefydlu'r grŵp cyn gynted â phosibl ac y dylai gyflwyno adroddiad erbyn yr haf. Felly, bydd yn rhaid ei sefydlu'n weddol gyflym. Caiff y pwyllgor wybod am gyfansoddiad a chylch gwaith y grŵp cyn gynted â phosibl, ar ôl i hynny gael ei wneud.

**Datganiad am Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr  
Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar y Mesur Morol  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment,  
Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on the Marine Bill**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I welcome the committee's report on the marine Bill and the interest that the committee continues to show in the development of this important piece of legislation. The Assembly Government notes the statements and recommendations that the committee made in its report. We know that the marine Bill represents a change in the way in which UK Bills are drawn up, taking account of the Government of Wales Act 2006 and the way in which devolution is changing.

The development of the marine Bill is taking place at a time that allows us to acknowledge the differences between devolved countries, while also working towards a shared goal of having better-managed, sustainable, UK seas. Given that context, the Assembly Government agrees with the committee's call to secure the broadest possible flexibility in the way in which the Bill is drawn up. The committee's report acknowledges the complicated mix of devolved and non-devolved powers in the marine environment, and work will need to be done with the UK Government, and not just in the cross-border areas, such as the Severn and Dee estuaries.

Marine spatial planning is a new approach to managing our seas and will require a cross-cutting, co-operative approach. We, as a Government, are working with other administrations and departments to develop a system of marine spatial planning that will introduce a better system for managing the use and protection of marine resources, taking account of all activities and uses.

4.10 p.m.

It is important to us that any system of marine spatial planning can operate and work with our terrestrial planning system and the

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Croesawaf adroddiad y pwyllgor ar y Mesur morol a'r diddordeb y mae'r pwyllgor yn parhau i'w ddangos yn y gwaith o ddatblygu'r darn pwysig hwn o ddeddfwriaeth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn nodi'r datganiadau a'r argymhellion a wnaed gan y pwyllgor yn ei adroddiad. Gwyddom fod y Mesur morol yn newid yn y ffordd y paratwir Mesurau yn y DU, gan ystyried Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 a'r modd y mae datganoli yn newid.

Mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r Mesur morol yn digwydd ar adeg sy'n ein galluogi i gydnabod y gwahaniaethau rhwng gwledydd datganoledig, gan weithio hefyd at nod cyffredin o gael moroedd cynaliadwy yn y DU sy'n cael eu rheoli'n well. O gofio'r cyddestun hwnnw, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cytuno â galwad y pwyllgor i sicrhau'r hyblygrwydd mwyaf posibl yn y ffordd y paratwir y Mesur. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn cydnabod y gymysgedd gymhleth o bwerau datganoledig ac annatganoledig yn yr amgylchedd môr, a bydd angen gwneud gwaith gyda Llywodraeth y DU, nid yn yr ardaloedd trawsffiniol yn unig, megis aberoedd afonydd Hafren a Dyfrdwy.

Mae cynllunio gofodol morol yn ffordd newydd o reoli ein moroedd, a bydd yn ofynnol sicrhau dull trawsbynciol, cydweithredol. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn gweithio gyda gweinyddiaethau ac adrannau eraill i ddatblygu system o gynllunio gofodol morol a fydd yn sicrhau system well ar gyfer rheoli defnyddio adnoddau morol a'r modd y cânt eu diogelu, gan ystyried yr holl weithgareddau a'r defnydd a wneir ohonynt.

Mae'n bwysig inni fod unrhyw system o gynllunio gofodol morol yn gallu gweithredu a gweithio gyda'n system o gynllunio daearol

Wales spatial plan. The Assembly Government welcomes the committee's support for a system of marine spatial planning.

The committee's report sets out support for a staged move towards a more integrated licensing regime. The marine Bill presents a key opportunity to remedy the ad-hoc arrangements that are in place and ensure that we approach the management of the seas in a holistic, thoughtful and strategic manner to create a system that will allow the sustainable use, development and protection of our marine resources. The Assembly Government supports the creation of a simplified and streamlined system of licensing for the marine environment.

As many speakers pointed out in the debate on the committee's report, Wales has an enviable marine environment that is increasingly under pressure from many activities, for example, tourism, transport, energy generation and storage. Over 70 per cent of our coastline and 40 per cent of Wales's seas are designated as important because of their habitats and species. There is a range of proposals under the marine Bill to help protect the marine environment. The Assembly Government supports a move towards a more integrated approach to the protection of the marine environment, recognising the importance of protecting not just individual species, but whole ecosystems.

Finally, on fisheries, the Assembly Government supports the committee's recommendation to update inshore fisheries management and legislation. To that end, I announced on 15 September proposals that stated that the Assembly Government should assume full responsibility for the management of fisheries in Welsh waters. Officials are currently holding meetings with key stakeholders and a 12-week public consultation will begin in December.

The marine Bill will enable a significant re-organisation of the management of all our seas, something that is unlikely to be seen again for some considerable time. This is a great opportunity. I welcome the committee's

a chynllun gofodol Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu cefnogaeth y pwyllgor i system o gynllunio gofodol morol.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gosod allan gefnogaeth i symud fesul cam at gyfundrefn drwyddedu fwy integredig. Mae'r Mesur morol yn gyfle allweddol i unioni'r trefniadau ad hoc sydd ar waith ac i sicrhau ein bod yn mynd ati i reoli'r moroedd mewn ffordd gyfannol, ystyriol a strategol i greu system a fydd yn galluogi defnyddio, datblygu a diogelu ein hadnoddau morol yn gynaliadwy. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o blaid creu system drwyddedu symlach ar gyfer yr amgylchedd morol.

Fel y dywedodd nifer o siaradwyr yn y ddadl ar adroddiad y pwyllgor, mae gan Gymru amgylchedd morol y mae nifer yn genfigennus ohono ac sydd o dan bwysau cynyddol oherwydd nifer o weithgareddau, er enghraifft, twristiaeth, trafndiaeth, cynhyrchu ynni a'i storio. Mae 70 y cant o'n harfordir a 40 y cant o foroedd Cymru wedi'u dynodi'n rhai pwysig oherwydd eu cynefinoedd a'u rhywogaethau. Mae amrywiaeth o gynigion o dan y Mesur morol i helpu diogelu'r amgylchedd morol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r symudiad at ddull mwy integredig o ddiogelu'r amgylchedd morol, gan gydnabod pwysigrwydd diogelu ecosystemau cyfan, nid rhywogaethau unigol yn unig.

Yn olaf, o ran pysgodfeydd, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi argymhelliaid y pwyllgor i ddiweddarau rheolaeth a deddfwriaeth pysgodfeydd y glannau. I'r perwyl hwnnw, cyhoeddais ar 15 Medi gynigion a oedd yn dweud y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn hollol gyfrifol am reoli pysgodfeydd yn nyfroedd Cymru. Mae swyddogion yn cynnal cyfarfodydd ar hyn o bryd gyda rhanddeiliaid allweddol, a bydd ymgynghori cyhoeddus am 12 wythnos yn dechrau ym mis Rhagfyr.

Bydd y Mesur morol yn fodd i drawsnewid y ffordd y rheolir ein holl foroedd, rhywbeth sy'n annhebygol o ddigwydd eto am gryn amser. Mae hwn yn gyfle gwych. Croesawaf adroddiad y pwyllgor, a byddaf yn parhau i

report and I will continue to keep both the committee and the Assembly as a whole informed of developments in terms of this important matter.

**Brynle Williams:** First, I am encouraged that the Minister will seek the greatest level of flexibility to develop our own policy in Wales. The sea and coastal areas make an enormous contribution, as you said, Minister, to quality of life and the economy. However, despite the commercial benefits of fisheries and the great asset that the coastline and the sea represent to the tourist industry, it is regrettable that the management of the marine environment has been so ad hoc and often under-resourced.

I note what the Minister has said about the all-Wales fisheries strategy, but there are very serious concerns about how the Minister has chosen to consult on that strategy, particularly in terms of not bringing in the expertise of the existing sea fisheries committees. There was a strong indication at the time that the Minister had already decided on the course of action before issuing the consultation. However, Welsh fisheries are of enormous value to the fishing industry, as well as to recreational anglers.

As the Minister said, both licensing and planning need to be updated. Marine spatial planning will be essential for making best use of the sea. Without it, it will not be possible to ensure that activities can be matched with a truly suitable area. Licensing also needs to be rationalised, as the current arrangements have come together piecemeal over many years and are unsurprisingly complex and confusing for anyone trying to navigate them. Given the prominence of projects such as those for offshore wind, oil and gas exploration, it is essential that any new licensing framework is transparent to the public, that it is applied consistently throughout Wales, and that it is compatible with the systems in bordering areas.

The marine Bill should be an opportunity to end inefficient and uncoordinated use of

roi gwybod i'r pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad cyfan am ddatblygiadau yn y mater pwysig hwn.

**Brynle Williams:** Yn gyntaf, mae'n galonogol fod y Gweinidog i geisio sicrhau'r hyblygrwydd mwyaf i ddatblygu ein polisi ein hun yng Nghymru. Mae'r môr ac ardaloedd yr arfordir yn gwneud cyfraniad enfawr, fel y dywedasoch, Weiniog, i ansawdd bywyd a'r economi. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf buddiannau masnachol pysgodfeydd ac er cymaint o ased yw'r arfordir a'r môr i'r diwydiant twristiaeth, mae'n anffodus fod y gwaith o reoli'r amgylchedd morol wedi bod mor ysbeidiol, a bod prinder adnoddau yn aml.

Sylwaf ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r strategaeth bysgodfeydd i Gymru gyfan, ond mae pryderon mawr iawn ynghylch y modd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dewis ymgynghori am y strategaeth honno, yn arbennig wrth beidio â defnyddio arbenigedd pwyllgorau presennol y pysgodfeydd môr. Yr oedd arwydd clir ar y pryd fod y Gweinidog eisoes wedi penderfynu pa gamau i'w cymryd cyn cyhoeddi'r ymgynghori. Fodd bynnag, mae pysgodfeydd Cymru yn hynod bwysig i'r diwydiant pysgota, yn ogystal ag i enweirwyr hamdden.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae angen diweddarau'r trefniadau trwyddedu a chynllunio. Bydd cynllunio gofodol morol yn hanfodol i wneud y defnydd gorau o'r môr. Hebdo, ni fydd yn bosibl sicrhau y gellir cyfateb gweithgareddau ag ardal gwbl addas. Mae angen rhesymoli trwyddedu hefyd, gan fod y trefniadau presennol wedi eu llunio o dipyn i beth dros flynyddoedd lawer, ac maent yn gymhleth ac yn ddrislyd i unrhyw un sy'n ceisio eu hastudio, ac nid yw hynny'n syndod. O gofio amlygrwydd prosiectau megis prosiectau gwynt a phrosiectau chwilio am olew a nwy yn y môr, mae'n hanfodol i unrhyw fframwaith trwyddedu newydd fod yn eglur i'r cyhoedd, y caiff ei ddefnyddio'n gyson ledled Cymru, a'i fod yn gydnaws â'r systemau mewn ardaloedd ffiniol.

Dylai'r Mesur morol fod yn gyfle i roi terfyn ar ddefnyddio adnoddau'n aneffeithlon ac



resources, such as having one Environment Agency boat patrolling six miles outside the Dee estuary to protect salmon and sea trout, while, at the same time, having a single boat patrolling everything west of the Dee down to Cardigan bay. It must also be a priority to get the necessary powers devolved so that Wales can take charge of its marine conservation.

Our environmentally sensitive sites and special protected areas enjoy the same profile as conservation areas on land; we all agree on that. However, they need effective management and the resources to back them up, in the same way as those on land.

Minister, I ask you to clarify this position on the make-up of a potential marine management operation, which would oversee the implementation of the marine Bill. I am sure that the Minister recognises the importance of compatibility with England as we have two estuaries, north and south, which are likely to have independent bodies set up for them.

Finally, what are the Minister's intentions for retaining the expertise and experience of the personnel in different organisations who are currently undertaking much of the work of managing the seas and fisheries?

**Carwyn Jones:** My position is clear: I want to consult on proposals to bring fisheries management in-house. The public consultation will begin next month, as I have announced, so there will be an opportunity for all those who are interested to express a view on that.

The proposal concerning the marine management organisation is that it should operate in England. It will be a body with executive powers, but we, in Wales, will take a different approach, managing in-house the functions that will be managed by the MMO in England.

Expertise and personnel will still be required even if the structure is different. However, the present legislation is incredibly complex and there is duplication. It is certainly the

anghydlynol, fel cael un cwch gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn patrolio chwe milltir y tu allan i foryd afon Dyfrdwy i ddiogelu eogiaid a brithyll y môr, ac ar yr un pryd, gael un cwch yn patrolio popeth i'r gorllewin o afon Dyfrdwy i lawr i fae Ceredigion. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i sicrhau bod y pwerau angenrheidiol yn cael eu datganoli er mwyn i Gymru allu bod yn gyfrifol am ei gwaith cadwraeth morol.

Mae ein safleoedd amgylcheddol sensitif a'n hardaloedd diogelu arbennig yn mwynhau'r un proffil ag ardaloedd cadwraeth ar y tir; yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae angen eu rheoli'n effeithiol a chael yr adnoddau i'w cefnogi, yn yr un modd â'r rheini ar y tir.

Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi egluro'r safbwynt hwn ar gyfansoddiad gweithrediad posibl i reoli'r moroedd, a fyddai'n goruchwyllo gweithredu'r Mesur morol. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cysondeb â Lloegr gan fod gennym ddau aber, i'r gogledd a'r de, sy'n debygol o gael cyrff annibynnol wedi'u sefydlu drostynt.

Yn olaf, beth yw bwriad y Gweinidog ar gyfer cadw arbenigedd a phrofiad y personél mewn gwahanol sefydliadau sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gwneud llawer o'r gwaith o reoli'r moroedd a'r pysgodfeydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae fy safbwynt yn glir: dymunaf ymgynghori am gynigion i ddod â rheolaeth y pysgodfeydd yn fewnol. Bydd yr ymgynghori cyhoeddus yn dechrau'r mis nesaf, fel y cyhoeddais, felly, bydd cyfle i'r rheini sydd â diddordeb fynegi barn am hynny.

Y cynnig ynglŷn â'r sefydliad rheoli morol yw y dylai weithredu yn Lloegr. Bydd yn gorff sydd â phwerau gweithredol, ond yng Nghymru byddwn yn mynd ati mewn ffordd wahanol, gan reoli'n fewnol y swyddogaethau a gaiff eu rheoli gan y gweithrediad rheoli morol yn Lloegr.

Bydd angen arbenigedd a phersonél o hyd, hyd yn oed os bydd y strwythur yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol yn gymhleth iawn ac mae yna ddyblygu.

case that fisheries patrol vessels often patrol the same area, working for different organisations. That has to come to an end. Sea fisheries committees are also precarious organisations in the sense that they are made up of different local authorities. If they wished to pull out, it is possible that the sea fisheries committees would collapse. That has not happened, and there is no sign of it happening, but, in theory, it is possible. The functions of the committee would then be taken over by us.

I have come across several situations in which there have been difficulties in working out who is responsible for what. One is the Three Rivers estuary, about which Christine Gwyther and others have contacted me. Trying to have a regulating Order on that estuary is incredibly complex. We cannot do it under the law; we need the co-operation of the sea fisheries committee, and, so far, there have been difficulties surrounding that.

Another example that I can give concerns the minimum landing size for sea bass. One area that I want to progress is the introduction of a bag limit for recreational boats taking anglers out. There is such a limit on commercial fishing, as it comes within the controls that are already in place. Rod and line anglers do not take enough fish to make any difference to the stocks, but recreational boats can take any number of fish. I would like to impose a limit on that, but I cannot; the sea fisheries committees have to do it. Those are two examples of the complexities surrounding this difficult area that need to be ironed out.

**Mick Bates:** I welcome your statement. What timetable are you working to now, given the bitter disappointment that the marine Bill was not contained in the Queen's Speech? The comment of an officer of the Marine Conservation Society on this rings true—and it may also be true of your statement—which is, 'Another year, another consultation!'. We are disappointed that the Bill was not listed in the Queen's Speech as,

Mae'n sicr yn wir fod llongau patrolio pysgodfeydd yn am yn patrolio'r un ardal, gan weithio i sefydliadau gwahanol. Rhaid i hynny ddod i ben. Mae pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr hefyd yn sefydliadau ansicr yn yr ystyr eu bod wedi eu ffurfio o wahanol awdurdodau lleol. Pe baent yn dymuno tynnu allan, mae'n bosibl y byddai'r pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd yn methu. Nid yw hyn wedi digwydd, ac nid oes arwydd y bydd yn digwydd, ond mewn egwyddor mae'n bosibl. Ni wedyn fyddai'n ymgymryd â swyddogaethau'r pwyllgor.

Yr wyf wedi dod ar draws nifer o sefyllfaoedd lle bu anawsterau wrth benderfynu pwy sy'n gyfrifol am beth. Un ohonynt yw aber y Tair Afon y mae Christine Gwyther ac eraill wedi cysylltu â mi yn ei gylch. Mae ceisio cael Gorchymyn rheoli ar yr aber hwnnw yn gymhleth iawn. Ni allwn wneud hynny dan y gyfraith; mae angen cydweithrediad y pwyllgor pysgodfeydd môr arnom, a hyd yn hyn cafwyd anawsterau gyda hynny.

Mae enghraifft arall y gallaf ei rhoi yn ymwneud ag isafswm maint y lle glanio ar gyfer draenogiaid môr. Un maes yr hoffwn ei ddatblygu yw cyflwyno cyfyngiad ar nifer y pysgod y gellir eu dal gan gychod hamdden sy'n mynd â genweirwyr allan. Mae yna gyfyngiad o'r fath ar bysgota masnachol, gan ei fod yn dod o fewn rheolaethau sydd eisoes mewn grym. Nid yw genweirwyr gwialen a llinyn yn cymryd digon o bysgod i wneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i'r stociau, ond gall cychod hamdden gymryd niferoedd mawr o bysgod. Hoffwn osod cyfyngiad ar hynny, ond ni allaf; rhaid i'r pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd wneud hynny. Dyna ddwy enghraifft o'r cymhlethdodau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r maes anodd hwn y mae angen eu dileu.

**Mick Bates:** Croesawaf eich datganiad. I ba amserlen yr ydych yn gweithio yn awr, o gofio'r siom enfawr nad oedd y Mesur morol yn rhan o Araith y Frenhines? Yr oedd sylw gan swyddog y Gymdeithas Cadwraeth Môr am hyn yn taro deuddeg-a gallai hefyd fod yn wir am eich datganiad chi-sef, 'Blwyddyn arall, ymgynghoriad arall!'. Yr ydym wedi ein siomi nad oedd y Mesur wedi'i restru yn Araith y Frenhines, fel yr oedd sefydliadau

am sure, were organisations like the WWF, which published a draft Bill in 2005. Much of the work is being done outside Government, so surely there should be better progress. What is your timetable from now on? We welcome the fact that, through the Government of Wales Act 2006, we will have space to put in the parts that we want. I do not wish to sound too negative, and I appreciate your recognition that the current laws are inadequate to protect and enhance our coastal zones and territorial waters, yet, at the same time, it seems that there will be delays.

My second question is about the integrated licensing regime that you referred to. I have previously expressed concerns that many industries are exempt from this licensing, as I understand it, particularly those working in oil and gas exploration. Is that still the case? If so, why, because they actually have a considerable impact?

4.20 p.m.

I fail to understand how they can be exempt from this. We all recognise that there has to be such a marine Bill and we also recognise that the coast surrounding Wales is of immense economic and social importance. We must not forget that 6 per cent of the total Welsh labour force is working in operations connected with our marine environment.

**Carwyn Jones:** It is fair to say that oil and gas, which are not devolved matters, have not been included in the marine Bill reorganisation of licensing. Nevertheless, the Department of Trade and Industry is involved in discussions on the development of the marine Bill, including discussions on a marine spatial planning element, which would give it strategic guidance on individual licence applications. Therefore, this is not being done in a vacuum. There are two options available to any Government if the marine Bill is delayed: to wait for it to be passed at Westminster or to pursue an Order in Council, which is subject to the priorities of the Government. That will need to be considered in due course.

eraill, mae'n siŵr, megis WWF, a gyhoeddodd Fesur drafft yn 2005. Gwneir llawer o'r gwaith y tu allan i'r Llywodraeth, felly, yn sicr dylid cael mwy o gynnydd. Beth yw eich amserlen o hyn ymlaen? Croesawn y ffaith y bydd gennym, drwy Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, gyfle i gynnwys y rhannau y mae arnom eu heisiau. Nid wyf am swnio'n rhy negyddol, ac yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'ch cydnabyddiaeth fod y deddfau presennol yn annigonol i ddiogelu a gwella ein parthau arfordirol a'n dyfroedd tiriogaethol. Eto, ar yr un pryd, mae'n ymddangos y bydd oedi.

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r gyfundrefn drwyddedu integredig y cyfeirir ati. Yr wyf wedi mynegi pryderon o'r blaen fod llawer o ddiwydiannau wedi'u heithrio rhag y trwyddedu hwn, fel y deallaf y sefyllfa, yn arbennig y rheini sy'n gweithio ym maes chwilio am olew a nwy. Ai felly y mae hi o hyd? Os felly, pam, a hwythau'n cael effaith sylweddol mewn gwirionedd.

Methaf â deall sut y gallent fod wedi'u heithrio o hyn. Mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod bod yn rhaid cael Mesur morol o'r fath, a chydabyddwn hefyd fod yr arfordir o amgylch Cymru o bwys economaidd a chymdeithasol aruthrol. Ni ddylem anghofio fod 6 y cant o gyfanswm gweithlu Cymru yn gweithio mewn gweithrediadau sy'n gysylltiedig â'n hamgylchedd môr.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n deg dweud nad yw olew na nwy, nad ydynt yn faterion wedi'u datganoli, wedi'u cynnwys yn y trefniadau trwyddedu newydd yn y Mesur morol. Er hynny, mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn rhan o drafodaethau ar ddatblygu'r Mesur morol, gan gynnwys trafodaethau am yr elfen cynllunio gofodol morol, a fyddai'n rhoi arweiniad strategol iddo ar geisiadau unigol am drwydded. Felly, nid yw hyn yn digwydd mewn gwacter. Mae dau ddewis ar gael i unrhyw Lywodraeth os gohirir y Mesur morol: aros iddo gael ei dderbyn yn San Steffan, neu gyflwyno Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, sy'n amodol ar flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth. Bydd yn rhaid ystyried hynny maes o law.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r Mesur hwn a'r cyfleoedd a ddaw gydag ef i roi trefn ar yn anhrefn presennol, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We welcome this Bill and the opportunities it affords to bring order to the present disorder, as the Minister said.

Gyda'r newid arfaethedig yn y drefn bysgota yr ydych wedi cychwyn ymgynghori yn ei gylch, ategaf un peth a ddywedwyd gan Brynle, sef pwysigrwydd cadw elfennau gorau'r drefn bresennol, sydd yn gweithio. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys eich bod yn bwriadu newid y system fel bod y cyfrifoldeb yn dod yn gyfan i'r Llywodraeth. A ydych yn bwriadu gwneud hynny cyn i'r Mesur morol ddod i fodolaeth, neu, fel yr wyf yn tybio, fel rhan o'r setliad terfynol—oni bai mai dyna fydd y canlyniad yn y pen draw, ac y bydd y cyfrifoldebau sydd gyda'r corff annibynnol yn Lloegr yn dod yn uniongyrchol i'r Llywodraeth yma yng Nghymru? Ydych chi wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw eisoes?

I endorse one comment which Brynle made about the proposed changes to the fisheries system that you have started to consult upon, namely the importance of retaining the best elements in the current system, which do work. However, it appears that you intend to change the system so that the responsibility is brought entirely within Government. Do you intend to do that before the marine Bill comes into force, or as I suspect, as part of the final settlement—unless that is what the end result will be, with the responsibilities that lie with the independent bodies in England transferred directly to Government here in Wales? Have you already made that decision?

Mater arall sy'n codi o'r trefniadau gwahanol yn Lloegr a Chymru yw'r angen i sicrhau cysondeb, a byddai rhywun yn gobeithio bod rhyw fath o gysondeb ar draws Ewrop yn hyn o beth. A oes gennych unrhyw fwriad i gynnal trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth Iwerddon, gan fod Cymru ac Iwerddon yn rhannu yr un môr? Unwaith eto, byddai'n fanteisiol cael cysondeb dros Fôr Iwerddon wrth inni fwrw ati i lunio'r Mesur hwn.

Another issue arising from the different arrangements in England and in Wales is the need to ensure consistency, and one would hope for some kind of consistency across Europe on this. Do you intend to have any discussions with the Government of Ireland, given that Wales and Ireland share the same sea? Once again, it would be beneficial to take a consistent approach across the Irish sea as we begin to shape this Bill.

Sylw sy'n rhyw fath o gwestiwn sydd gennyf yn awr. Mae llawer iawn yn eich ymateb chi ac, mae'n debyg, ym mwriadau'r Mesur ei hun, ynghylch gwarchod. Soniasoch am bwysigrwydd y môr, a'r ffaith bod moroedd yn ardaloedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig ac o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, sy'n hollbwysig am bob math o resymau. Fodd bynnag, a gredwch ei fod yn bwysig cael cydbwysedd fel nad ydym yn gweld y Mesur fel ffordd o atal datblygiadau yn unig, gan ystyried bod cynifer o bobl yn cael eu bywoliaeth o'r môr mewn amryw ffyrdd?

I now have a comment that is also a question of sorts. There was a great deal in your response and, apparently, in the stated intentions of the Bill, about protection. You mentioned the importance of the seas, and the fact that they are areas of special scientific interest as well as of outstanding natural beauty, which is vital for all manner of reasons. However, do you believe it is important to achieve a balance, so that we do not see the Bill as a way of preventing development, given that so many people make a living from the sea in various ways?

Yn olaf, gan gyfeirio'n benodol at eich bwriad i newid y drefn ynglŷn â'r pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr, a ydych yn rhagweld y bydd y Mesur hwn yn arwain at newidiadau sylweddol o fewn y cyrff sydd, ar hyn o bryd, â chyfrifoldebau gwahanol? Un o'r cyrff hynny yw Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. A ydych yn rhagweld newid sylfaenol yn ei

Finally, with particular reference to your intention to change the procedure concerning the sea fisheries committees, do you foresee that this Bill will lead to significant changes within the bodies which currently have various responsibilities? One such body is the Countryside Council for Wales. Do you foresee a fundamental change in its

gyfrifoldebau, ac a fydd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd mwy o'r cyfrifoldeb yn uniongyrchol? Yn ogystal, onid yw'n gyfle i edrych eto ar gyfrifoldebau Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r cyngor cefn gwlad o ran y môr a'r arfordir?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, wrth gwrs ein bod yn dymuno cadw'r elfennau gorau sydd yno ar hyn o bryd. O ran pa bryd y byddwn yn edrych ar newid system y pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr, rhaid inni wneud hynny o'r Mesur ei hun, neu o'r Ddeddf pan fydd yn cael ei phasio, neu ar ffurf arall. Felly, nid yw'n bosibl inni wneud hynny nes i'r pŵer ddod atom.

O ran y sefyllfa yng Nghymru, mae dau opsiwn. Y cyntaf yw sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud gwaith yr MMO yn Lloegr ein hunan, a'r ail yw gofyn i'r MMO wneud peth o'r gwaith ond heb iddo gael pwerau heb ein caniatâd ni. Hoffwn ei gwneud yn hollol glir nad ydym am gael asiantaeth gyda phwerau uniongyrchol sydd ddim yn dod o fewn cylch gwaith y Cynulliad.

Mae'n bwysig i ni siarad ag Iwerddon, gan fydd hwn yn cael effaith ar yr ynys, a hefyd ar Ynys Manaw. Mae'r môr hwnnw y tu allan i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, felly mae'n bwysig siarad gyda'r ddwy Lywodraeth. Mae hefyd yn bwysig pwysleisio mai Mesurau yw'r rhain i gynllunio i'r dyfodol ac nid i atal datblygu drwy ddweud 'na' i bopeth. Derbyniaf hynny. Nid wyf yn erfyn newid sylfaenol i strwythur na chyfrifoldebau'r cyngor cefn gwlad, ond os gwneir achos i sicrhau ei fod yn gallu rhoi mwy o gyngor mewn rhai amgylchiadau, caiff hwnnw ei ystyried.

**Glyn Davies:** I thank the Minister for his statement. I also wish to thank him and the Government at Westminster for the way in which, so far, the marine Bill has been managed. The level of involvement that the Assembly has had in the preparation of the Bill is fairly novel. Clearly, I share Mick Bates's disappointment that a reference to a marine Bill was not included in the Queen's Speech. However, I understand that the Bill is likely to be published in March, or, at least, there will be an indication of what it will contain in March. I hope that the committee's

responsibilities, and will the Government assume more of the responsibility directly? In addition, is it not an opportunity to revisit the responsibilities of the Environment Agency and the countryside council, as regards the marine environment and the coast?

**Carwyn Jones:** Firstly, of course we want to maintain the best elements of what we have at present. In terms of when we will look at changing the system of sea fisheries committees, we must use the Bill itself to do that, or the Act when it is passed, or in an alternative format. Therefore, it is not possible for us to do that before we have that power.

As for the situation in Wales, there are two options. The first is to ensure that we do the work of the MMO in England ourselves, and the second is that we ask the MMO to do some of the work, but without it having powers without our authorisation. I want to make quite clear that we do not want an agency with its own direct powers that do not come within the Assembly's remit.

It is important that we talk to Ireland, as this will have an impact on the island, as well as on the Isle of Man. That sea is outside the European Union, so it is important to speak to both those Governments. It is also important to emphasise that these Bills are to plan for the future, and not to stop development by just saying 'no' to everything. I accept that. I do not expect any fundamental change in either the structure or the responsibilities of the countryside council, but if a case is made to ensure that it can provide more advice in certain circumstances, it will be considered.

**Glyn Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch iddo ef ac i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan am y modd y rheolwyd y Mesur morol hyd yn hyn. Mae ymwneud y Cynulliad â pharatoi'r Mesur yn rhywbeth eithaf newydd. Yn amlwg, yr wyf yn siomedig, fel Mick Bates, nad oedd cyfeiriad at y Mesur morol yn Araith y Frenhines. Fodd bynnag, deallaf f y Mesur yn debygol o gael ei gyhoeddi ym mis Mawrth, neu o leiaf y bydd arwydd o'r hyn y bydd yn ei gynnwys ym mis Mawrth. Gobeithio y bydd ymwneud y pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad yn

and the Assembly's involvement will continue, as the detail of the Bill becomes clear.

I particularly welcome the Minister's comment about the control of recreational fishing at sea. There is no doubt that people who used to be commercial fishermen have become recreational fishermen to avoid the sort of controls that would apply to them if they were commercial fishermen. The size of the bags that they are coming in with is, by any measure, commercial, and that is totally unacceptable.

I have two questions, the first of which relates to the discussions that you might have had with the European Union. Clearly, there is a movement towards marine planning in the European Union that matches what is happening in this country, and with which we have had such a close involvement. What involvement do you have in those discussions in Europe, and what influence do you have on them?

My second question relates to the statement that you made about abolishing the sea fisheries committees. What is the relationship between your statement, with regard to bringing the management of the sea in-house, and the fact that you are consulting on it? Are you consulting on the decisions that have been made, or is there some flexibility on how you might go forward in managing the sea?

**Carwyn Jones:** First, we keep in touch with what is happening in Europe via occasional attendance by officials at the EU Fisheries Council, and, of course, by ensuring that our staff in Brussels are in touch on fisheries matters. Therefore, we are able to keep in touch with what is happening there. In any event, I am aware of what appears on the agenda of the EU Fisheries Council meeting every month.

With regard to what you describe as 'abolishing' the sea fisheries committees, assuming full responsibility for the management of fisheries in Wales is not necessarily the same thing as abolishing the sea fisheries committees, although it means

parhau, wrth i fanylion y Mesur ddod yn glir.

Croesawaf yn arbennig sylw'r Gweinidog am reoli pysgota hamdden ar y môr. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes pobl a fu'n bysgotwyr masnachol wedi dod yn bysgotwyr hamdden er mwyn osgoi'r math o reolau a fyddai'n berthnasol iddynt pe baent yn bysgotwyr masnachol. Mae nifer y pysgod y maent yn eu glanio, ymhob ystyr, yn fasnachol ac mae hynny'n hollol annerbyniol.

Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn, a'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r trafodaethau a gawsoch efallai gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yn amlwg, mae symudiad at gynllunio morol yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n cyd-fynd â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y wlad hon a ninnau wedi bod yn ymwneud ag ef mor agos. Sut yr ydych yn ymwneud â'r trafodaethau hynny yn Ewrop, a pha ddylanwad sydd gennych arnynt?

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r datganiad a wnaethoch ar ddiddymu'r pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr. Beth yw'r berthynas rhwng eich datganiad chi, o ran dod â rheolaeth o'r môr yn fewnol, a'r ffaith eich bod yn ymgynghori arni? A ydych yn ymgynghori ar y penderfyniadau a wnaed, neu a oes rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd o ran sut y gallech fynd ymlaen i reoli'r môr?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn cadw mewn cysylltiad â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Ewrop drwy fod swyddogion yn bresennol yn achlysurol yng Nghyngor Pysgodfeydd yr UE, ac wrth gwrs drwy sicrhau bod ein staff ym Mrwsel yn ymwybodol o faterion yn ymwneud â physgodfeydd. Felly, gallwn gadw mewn cysylltiad â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yno. Beth bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n ymddangos ar agenda cyfarfod Cyngor Pysgodfeydd yr UE bob mis.

O ran yr hyn a ddisgrifiwch fel 'diddymu' pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr, nid yw cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn am reoli pysgodfeydd yng Nghymru yr un peth o reidrwydd â diddymu'r pwyllgorau pysgodfeydd môr, er ei fod yn golygu ymgymryd â'u pwerau

assuming their present powers. It will be important to ensure that we have an advisory structure, made up, at the very least, of experts in fisheries and those who make their living from fisheries. That is one area that we will be looking to develop.

**Elin Jones:** Yn eich datganiad, bu ichi nodi eich bod yn cydnabod yr angen i ddiogelu ecosystemau cyfan yn y môr. Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru wedi codi nifer o bryderon gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn ddiweddar ynghylch peryglon gosod trwyddedau i chwilio am olew a nwy ym mae Ceredigion. A ydych chi hefyd wedi trafod yr un pryderon gyda'r DTI yn uniongyrchol o ran eich cyfrifoldebau i ddiogelu'r môr yn ardaloedd o fae Ceredigion?

4.30 p.m.

Hefyd, a ydych yn flin, fel minnau, bod y Mesur morol heb roi'r cyfrifoldebau i osod trwyddedau i chwilio am olew a nwy i'r Cynulliad fel ein bod fel gwlad yn gallu penderfynu ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y moroedd o'n cwmpas?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yw'r corff sy'n rhoi cyngor i'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar hyn. Mae'r Cyngor Cefn Gwlad yn gorff annibynnol. Os oes unrhyw bryderon gan y cyngor cefn gwlad, maent o bryder i finnau hefyd. Byddaf am wybod pam y maent yn peri pryder i'r cyngor, ac, os oes rhaid gwneud hynny, byddaf yn sicrhau bod y DTI yn cael ei hysbysu o'r pryderon hynny eto.

O safbwynt a ddylid datganoli hyn, ni welaf achos i wneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid inni ystyried a yw'n synhwyrol inni gael grym dros y mater hwn—gwn beth fydd ymateb Plaid Cymru, wrth gwrs. Ar hyn o bryd, ni chredaf fod yr achos wedi'i wneud am hynny.

presennol. Bydd yn bwysig sicrhau bod gennym strwythur cyngori a fydd yn cynnwys, o leiaf, arbenigwyr ym maes pysgodfeydd a phobl sy'n ennill eu bywoliaeth o bysgodfeydd. Dyna un maes y bwriadwn ei ddatblygu.

**Elin Jones:** You said in your statement that you acknowledge the need to safeguard entire eco-systems in the sea. The Countryside Council for Wales recently raised a number of concerns with the DTI regarding the dangers of giving licences for oil and gas exploration in Cardigan bay. Have you also raised those concerns directly with the DTI as to your responsibilities to protect the sea in areas of Cardigan bay?

Are you also sorry, as I am, that the marine Bill has not given the Assembly the responsibility to issue licences to search for oil and gas, so that our country can decide what happens to the seas around us?

**Carwyn Jones:** First of all, it is the Countryside Council for Wales that advises the Department of Trade and Industry on this matter. The council is an independent body. If the countryside council has any concerns, they are of concern to me, too. I will want to know why they cause concern to the council, and, if I must, I will ensure that the DTI is informed of those concerns again.

As regards whether this should be devolved, I see no reason to do so at present. Firstly, we must decide whether it is sensible for us to have power over this matter—and I know what Plaid Cymru's response will be, of course. At the moment, I do not think the case has been made for that.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jenny Randerson:** I raise this point of order under Standing Order No. 6. In the light of your comments earlier today, Presiding Officer, about the appropriateness of us

**Jenny Randerson:** Codaf y pwynt hwn o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6. O gofio'ch sylwadau'n gynharach heddiw, Lywydd, ynghylch y priodoldeb inni wneud sylwadau

commenting on the internal actions of local councils, do you regard the amendment tabled to motion NDM3343 as being in order?

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for giving me advance notice of your point of order and for raising it at this stage. This is an amendment to the principle of the Order. In the past, we have accepted amendments and allowed discussion widely on the principle of any Order. However, I would rule that debate on the principle of this Order should relate to the activity of this Assembly and the appropriateness of this Assembly legislating on behalf of Cardiff County Council and should not relate to any internal matters relating to debates that have already taken place in the council on this matter, or in any sense criticise or question the democratic right of Cardiff council to take the decisions that it has taken democratically, or that officials or inspectors would have taken on its behalf.

Within the Assembly, we have party groups that are all represented on Cardiff council and it is appropriate that the democratic discussion about the principle of whether or not the council should request to make this Order is a matter for the council. I believe that the ruling that I have made now is consistent with the previous rulings that I have made, either in relation to questions or debates, in seeking to ensure that we do not intervene, as a National Assembly, in activities and debates that are appropriate for our local authorities. This must be especially so in the case of the city and county of Cardiff, in which place we are privileged to meet.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii)**

**Approval of the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006 under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii)**

Motion (NDM3343): to propose that

am weithredoedd mewnol cynghorau lleol, a ystyriwch fod y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd i gynnig NDM3343 mewn trefn?

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am fy hysbysu ymlaen llaw o'ch pwynt o drefn ac am ei godi yn awr. Mae hwn yn welliant i egwyddor y Gorchymyn. Yn y gorffennol, yr ydym wedi derbyn gwelliannau ac wedi caniatáu trafodaeth eang ar egwyddor unrhyw Orchymyn. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn penderfynu y dylai trafodaeth am egwyddor y Gorchymyn hwn ymwneud â gweithgaredd y Cynulliad hwn a pha mor briodol ydyw i'r Cynulliad hwn deddfu ar ran Cyngor Sir Caerdydd, ac na ddylai ymwneud ag unrhyw faterion mewnol sy'n gysylltiedig â thrafodaethau sydd eisoes wedi'u cynnal yn y cyngor ar y mater hwn, na beirniadu neu gwestiynu mewn unrhyw ffordd hawl ddemocrataidd cyngor Caerdydd i wneud y penderfyniadau a wnaeth yn ddemocrataidd, neu benderfyniadau y byddai swyddogion neu arolygwyr wedi'u gwneud ar ei ran.

O fewn y Cynulliad, mae gennym grwpiau o bleidiau a gynrychiolir ar gyngor Caerdydd, ac mae'n briodol mai mater i'r cyngor yw'r drafodaeth ddemocrataidd ynghylch yr egwyddor a ddylai'r cyngor wneud cais i wneud y Gorchymyn hwn. Credaf fod y dyfarniad yr wyf wedi'i wneud yn awr yn gyson â'r dyfarniadau blaenorol yr wyf wedi'u gwneud, naill ai mewn perthynas â chwestiynau neu ddadleuon, wrth geisio sicrhau nad ydym yn ymyrryd, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, mewn gweithgareddau a thrafodaethau sy'n briodol i'n hawdurdodau lleol. Rhaid i hyn fod yn wir yn arbennig yn achos dinas a sir Caerdydd, lle yr ydym yn cael y fraint o gyfarfod.

Cynnig (NDM3343): cynnig bod



*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Owen John Thomas. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the local authority, by their stated intention to seek a traffic restriction Order to bring further restrictions on vehicular access by those travelling to and from the Tabernacl church on the Hayes, have failed to pay due attention and importance to protecting the ongoing wellbeing of this religious institution which has been a crucial part of the social, religious and cultural fabric of our capital city for the past 200 years.*

Motion (NDM3344): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*approves the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM3343 in the name of Owen John Thomas.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Extinguishment*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-Aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006, y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Owen John Thomas. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith bod yr awdurdod lleol, drwy ei fwriad datganedig i geisio Gorchymyn cyfyngu ar draffig i ddod â rhagor o gyfyngiadau ar fynediad i gerbydau gan y rheini sy'n teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen i eglwys Tabernacl yr Aes, wedi methu â rhoi digon o sylw na phwysigrwydd ar amddiffyn lles parhaus y sefydliad crefyddol hwn sydd wedi bod yn rhan hollbwysig o wead cymdeithasol, crefyddol a diwylliannol ein prifddinas dros y 200 mlynedd diwethaf.*

Cynnig (NDM3344): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-Aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 I NDM3343 yn enw Owen John Thomas.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Dileu*

*of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006. (NDM3343)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*approves the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006. (NDM3344)*

**Owen John Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM3343 yn fy enw i. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith bod yr awdurdod lleol, drwy ei fwriad datganedig i geisio Gorchymyn cyfyngu ar drafftig i ddod â rhagor o gyfyngiadau ar fynediad i gerbydau gan y rheini sy'n teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen i eglwys Tabernacl yr Aes, wedi methu â rhoi digon o sylw na phwysigrwydd ar amddiffyn lles parhaus y sefydliad crefyddol hwn sydd wedi bod yn rhan hollbwysig o wead cymdeithasol, crefyddol a diwylliannol ein prifddinas dros y 200 mlynedd diwethaf.*

Hoffwn ddatgan buddiant gan fy mod yn aelod o gapel Tabernacl.

At the outset, I want to make it clear that this amendment in no way contradicts the main motion, which I will be supporting.

Furthermore, the amendment does not signify opposition to the development of Cardiff city centre, the St David's 2 project, but seeks the support of the National Assembly in dissuading the local authority from diminishing the valuable activities of the Tabernacl church on the Hayes. This amendment is concerned with the council's intention to make further vehicular

*Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-Aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006, y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3343)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-Aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3344)*

**Owen John Thomas:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM3343 in my name. To add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that the local authority, by their stated intention to seek a traffic restriction Order to bring further restrictions on vehicular access by those travelling to and from the Tabernacl church on the Hayes, have failed to pay due attention and importance to protecting the ongoing wellbeing of this religious institution which has been a crucial part of the social, religious and cultural fabric of our capital city for the past 200 years.*

I wish to make a declaration of interest as I am a member of Tabernacl chapel.

Hoffwn egluro ar y dechrau nad yw'r gwelliant hwn yn gwrth-ddweud y prif gynnig mewn unrhyw ffordd, ac y byddaf yn ei gefnogi.

At hynny, nid yw'r gwelliant yn arwydd o wrthwynebiad i ddatblygu canol dinas Caerdydd, prosiect Canolfan Dewi Sant 2, ond yn hytrach mae'n ceisio cymorth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i berswadio'r awdurdod lleol i beidio â chyfyngu gweithgareddau gwerthfawr eglwys y Tabernacl ar yr Aes. Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn ymwneud â bwriad y cyngor i gyfyngu traffig

restrictions in the Hayes by applying for a traffic restriction Order that would restrict car access to and egress from Tabernacl chapel. The new Order would not allow the council to operate these restrictions for more than eight hours in a 24-hour period, and would also expect the council to exercise them reasonably.

However, a document received last Friday from the council shows that the only unrestricted access that Tabernacl would be allowed to retain on Sundays would be from 1 a.m. until 9 a.m., when most people are in bed. It is not reasonable that on Sundays there should be a restricted time for people to attend a place of worship. The council's defined eight hours of unrestricted use would mean that the hours of restricted access to the church on Sundays amount to 16 hours out of a 24-hour period, which is double the stipulated maximum restricted access of eight hours in any 24-hour period.

The new powers that the council is seeking, by exceeding the statutory eight-hour maximum restriction would, in accordance with Schedule 9, paragraph 13(a) of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984, require the National Assembly's consent. Furthermore, unreasonable use of these powers is subject to judicial review. This will all be avoided if the council keeps to the eight-hour maximum restriction and applies that reasonably.

Tabernacl, which was established in 1813, has a long and proud history, and will soon celebrate its two hundredth anniversary. Over the years, as businesses and commerce have expanded, families have left the city centre and now travel to the church by car from the suburbs, as the limited Sunday bus service does not provide a viable alternative. Furthermore, the majority of those attending the church are at the extreme ends of the age spectrum—they are the elderly, and the very young, who are escorted by their parents. Tabernacl is fortunate in having a car park that can accommodate 30 cars comfortably, or up to 45, allowing for some manoeuvring on leaving.

The church's contribution to society is wide

ymhellach yn yr Aes drwy wneud cais am Orchymyn cyfyngu traffig a fyddai'n cyfyngu mynediad i geir i gapel y Tabernacl ac oddi yno. Ni fyddai'r Gorchymyn newydd yn caniatáu i'r cyngor weithredu'r cyfyngiadau hyn am fwy nag wyth awr mewn cyfnod o 24 awr, a byddai hefyd yn disgwyl i'r cyngor eu harfer yn rhesymol.

Fodd bynnag, dengys dogfen a gafwyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf oddi wrth y cyngor mai'r unig fynediad heb gyfyngiad y byddai'r Tabernacl yn cael ei gadw ar ddydd Sul fyddai rhwng 1 a.m. a 9 a.m., pan fydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn eu gwelyau. Nid yw'n rhesymol cael amser cyfyngedig ar ddydd Sul i bobl fynychu addoldy. Byddai wyth awr diffiniedig y cyngor o ddefnydd heb gyfyngiad yn golygu y byddai'r oriau mynediad cyfyngedig i'r eglwys ar ddydd Sul yn 16 awr mewn cyfnod o 24 awr, sef dwbl yr uchafswm o wyth awr o fynediad cyfyngedig a bennwyd mewn unrhyw gyfnod o 24 awr.

Byddai angen caniatâd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gyfer y pwerau newydd y mae'r cyngor yn eu ceisio, drwy fynd dros yr uchafswm o wyth awr o gyfyngiad statudol, yn unol ag Atodlen 9, paragraff 13(a) o Ddeddf Rheoli Traffig Ffyrdd 1984. At hynny, mae defnyddio'r pwerau hyn yn afresymol yn agored i adolygiad barnwrol. Caiff hyn ei osgoi os bydd y cyngor yn cadw at y cyfyngiad uchaf o wyth awr a defnyddio hwnnw'n rhesymol.

Mae gan y Tabernacl, a sefydlwyd yn 1813, hanes hir, ac yn fuan bydd yn dathlu ei ddau ganmlwyddiant. Dros y blynyddoedd, wrth i fusnesau a masnach ehangu, mae teuluoedd wedi gadael canol y ddinas ac maent bellach yn teithio i'r eglwys mewn car o'r maestrefi, gan nad yw'r gwasanaeth bysiau cyfyngedig ar ddydd Sul yn darparu dewis arall sy'n ymarferol. At hynny, mae mwyafrif y rheiny sy'n mynychu'r capel yn hen, neu maent yn ifanc iawn ac yn cael eu danfon gan eu rhieni. Mae'r Tabernacl yn ffodus fod ganddo faes parcio a all ddal 30 o geir yn gyfforddus, neu hyd at 45 gydag ychydig symud ceir wrth adael.

Mae cyfraniad yr eglwys i gymdeithas yn

and varied. It provides fellowship for its members and their families, holding a service, and adult and children's Sunday schools, in the morning, as well as a service in the evening. Each Sunday afternoon for the past 25 years, the church has provided food and drink in the vestry for the city's homeless. It also hosts a mixed choir and a male voice choir, one rehearsing before the evening service and the other directly afterwards. Every Saturday morning, the vestry is open to members and the public for them to meet for coffee, a cake and a chat, or to attend a Welsh class or various other meetings. Last Saturday morning, a fair was held at the church that raised over £500 for charity.

The church has good relations with other denominations. When Cardiffians of Irish descent held a service in 1997 to commemorate the one hundred and fiftieth anniversary of the arrival here of those who had fled the Irish famine of 1847, it was in Tabernacl that the city's Baptists and Catholics came together. The church, too, was home to Cardiff's first Welsh-language nursery school, and our First Minister, Rhodri Morgan, and his big brother, Prys, were among its first pupils. An annual gymanfa ganu is held there to mark the induction of the city's Lord Mayor, and other concerts are held there frequently.

Last year, Tabernacl raised £15,000 to build a hospital in Pal Wal in India. This year, the church has contributed £20,000 to build the Caselin clinic in Lesotho. In addition, regular sums are donated to the Huggett Centre, Bopath, CASH, and many other charitable organisations. Christmas gifts, and other aid throughout the year, are sent to Romania.

Over the last six years, the average annual cost of the building's upkeep has been almost £21,000. If the council's intention for restricting car access is fulfilled, much of Tabernacl's good work would be impossible to maintain; membership would decline, and the upkeep of this grade II\* listed building would be beyond the capabilities of those remaining. Please support the amendment to maintain the good, voluntary work of Tabernacl, in the community and

eang ac amrywiol. Mae'n darparu cyfeillach i'w haelodau a'u teuluoedd, yn cynnal oedfa, ac ysgol Sul i oedolion a phlant, yn y bore yn ogystal ag oedfa gyda'r nos. Bob prynhawn dydd Sul dros y 25 mlynedd diwethaf, mae'r eglwys wedi darparu bwyd a diod yn y festri i bobl ddigartref y ddinas. Mae ganddi gôr cymysg a chôr meibion, y naill yn ymarfer cyn yr oedfa hwyrol a'r llall yn union wedyn. Bob bore dydd Sadwrn, mae'r festri ar agor i aelodau ac i'r cyhoedd gwrrdd â hwy am goffi, teisen a sgwrs, neu i fynychu dosbarth Cymraeg neu amrywiol gyfarfodydd eraill. Fore dydd Sadwrn diwethaf, cynhaliwyd ffair yn y capel a gododd dros £500 at elusen.

Mae gan yr eglwys gysylltiadau da ag enwadau eraill. Pan gynhaliodd pobl Caerdydd sydd o dras Wyddelig wasanaeth yn 1997 i goffáu canrif a hanner ers i'r rheini a ffodd oherwydd y newyn yn Iwerddon yn 1847 gyrraedd yma, yn y Tabernacl y daeth Bedyddwyr a Chatholigion y ddinas ynghyd. Yr oedd yr eglwys hefyd yn gartref i'r ysgol feithrin Gymraeg gyntaf yng Nghaerdydd, ac yr oedd ein Prif Weinidog, Rhodri Morgan, a'i frawd mawr, Prys, ymhlith ei disgyblion cyntaf. Cynhelir cymanfa ganu flynyddol yno i nodi sefydlu arglwydd Faer y ddinas, a chynhelir cyngherddau yno'n aml.

Y llynedd, cododd y Tabernacl £15,000 i adeiladu ysbyty yn Pal Wal yn India. Eleni, mae'r eglwys wedi cyfrannu £20,000 i adeiladu'r clinig Caselin yn Lesotho. Hefyd, rhoddir symiau rheolaidd i Ganolfan Huggett, Bopath, CASH a nifer o fudiadau elusennol eraill. Anfonir anrhegion Nadolig, a chymorth arall drwy gydol y flwyddyn, i Romania.

Dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf, y gost flynyddol o gynnal a chadw'r adeilad oedd £21,000 ar gyfartaledd. Os cyflawnir bwriad y cyngor i gyfyngu mynediad i geir, byddai'n amhosibl cynnal llawer o'r gwaith da a wneir yn y Tabernacl; byddai'r aelodaeth yn gostwng, ac ni fyddai'r rhai a fyddai ar ôl yn gallu parhau i gynnal yr adeilad rhestredig gradd II\* hwn. Galwaf arnoch i gefnogi'r gwelliant i gynnal gwaith gwirfoddol, da y Tabernacl, yn y gymuned ac yn rhyngwladol.

internationally.

4.40 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Cefnogaf y gwelliant yn enw Owen John Thomas—nid wyf yn dweud hynny yn aml. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu llythyrau at y Gweinidog ers blwyddyn yn cefnogi capel y Bedyddwyr, Tabernacl, yn yr Aes. Priodais yn y capel hwnnw, 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Daeth fy ngwraig yn aelod o'r capel rai blynedd yn ôl, ac yr wyf wedi dysgu un peth—mae capel y Bedyddwyr ychydig fel y maffia: wedi i chi ymuno, ni allwch adael.

**Leighton Andrews:** I support the amendment in the name of Owen John Thomas—I do not say that very often. I have been writing letters to the Minister for a year supporting the Tabernacl Baptist chapel in the Hayes. I was married in that chapel, 10 years ago. My wife became a member of the chapel some years ago, and I have learned one thing—the Baptist chapel is a little like the mafia: once you join, you can never leave.

Tabernacl chapel in the Hayes in Cardiff, or Tab, as it is universally known, is not just a Christian centre in Cardiff, but a centre of support for homeless people and a centre for a range of other important activities in the city. It is also an important national base, which is why this is more than a constituency issue for Cardiff Central. Tab is known throughout Wales, and members of Baptist chapels in my constituency, like Aion in Ynyshir or Soar Ffrwdamos in Penygraig, know its work and its minister and support it. I also recall that Tab played an important role in the campaign to secure the National Assembly. I remember speaking to a Cardiff Says Yes event in 1997 and seeing many members of the congregation in the audience who were active campaigners for the National Assembly.

Nid canolfan Gristnogol yn unig yw capel y Tabernacl yn yr Aes yng Nghaerdydd, neu'r Tab, fel y'i gelwir yn gyffredinol, ond yn hytrach mae'n ganolfan gymorth i bobl ddigartref ac yn ganolfan i amrywiaeth o weithgareddau pwysig eraill yn y ddinas. Mae hefyd yn ganolfan genedlaethol bwysig, a dyna pam mae hwn yn fwy na mater etholaethol yn unig i Ganol Caerdydd. Mae'r Tab yn enwog drwy Gymru benbaladr, ac mae aelodau capeli'r Bedyddwyr yn fy etholaeth i, fel Aion yn Ynys-hir neu Soar Ffrwdamos ym Mhen-y-graig, yn gwybod am ei waith a'i weinidog ac yn ei gefnogi. Cofiaf hefyd i'r Tab chwarae rhan bwysig yn yr ymgyrch i ddiogelu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cofiaf siarad mewn digwyddiad Dweud Ie yng Nghaerdydd yn 1997 a gweld nifer o aelodau'r eglwys yn y gynulleidfa a oedd yn ymgyrchwyr brwd dros y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

I am glad that the Order that we will pass today will give some protection to the chapel. However, it is how that Order is subsequently implemented and the approach that is adopted that will decide whether Tabernacl will be able to carry out the activities for which it is known throughout Wales. I will give you some examples: the chapel holds a Sunday school, which usually lasts until about 1 p.m.. The proposed parking restrictions would require cars to be moved from the chapel by 12 p.m., or they would have to be left there until after 7 p.m.. There has been no attempt to compromise on the part of the council on that 1 hour gap. That is pathetic. It is a simple example, but a telling one. There are other activities that will be undermined by the

Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Gorchymyn y byddwn yn ei dderbyn heddiw yn rhoi rhywfaint o ddiogelwch i'r capel. Fodd bynnag, sut y gweithredir y Gorchymyn wedi hynny a'r ymagwedd a gaiff ei mabwysiadu a fydd yn penderfynu a fydd y Tabernacl yn gallu cynnal y gweithgareddau y mae'n enwog amdanynt ledled Cymru. Dyma rai enghreifftiau ichi: mae'r capel yn cynnal ysgol Sul, sy'n para tan tua 1 p.m. fel arfer. Byddai'r cyfyngiadau parcio arfaethedig yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i geir gael eu symud o'r capel erbyn 12 p.m., neu byddent yn gorfod cael eu gadael yno tan ar ôl 7 p.m.. Ni fu unrhyw ymdrech i gyfaddawdu ar ran y cyngor am y bwlch hwnnw o 1 awr. Mae hynny'n druenus. Un enghraifft yw hon, ond

council's plans, which have been mentioned already by Owen John, including the provision of tea and sandwiches for homeless people on Sunday afternoons.

Other regular activities that will be hit will include prayer meetings, choir practice and so on, as well as meetings of church and other groups. Tab is a national centre for religious services, such as the millennium service in 2000. It is used for rehearsals for the BBC Cardiff Singer of the World contest and is a venue for all kinds of launches and other events. We would not accept this sort of behaviour towards members of other faith communities, whether we were talking about a mosque, a Sikh temple or a synagogue, and we should not allow this kind of behaviour to be adopted towards a Christian chapel either.

There has been a place of worship on this site for over 180 years—it is an important part of the life of the city and it deserves our support. I hope that all the parties in this Chamber that support this amendment today will ensure that their colleagues in those parties on Cardiff council work together to ensure fair play for the chapel. I want to end with some words for the leader of Cardiff council, who has indulged in some pathetic scaremongering on this issue over the last few days and has attacked Assembly Members. It is disgraceful that he has sought to mislead the developers about our intentions in today's debate. None of us oppose the St David's 2 development. Many of my constituents work in Cardiff and may find jobs in this development—if Cardiff council does not tax them with an £8-a-day congestion charge and if Arriva can get the trains to run on time.

Last week, the leader of Cardiff council wrote to Tabernacl again. It was a hopeless letter—churlish, small minded and mean spirited. It was not the letter of a leader; it was the letter of a bureaucrat. Councillor Berman needs to decide whether—

mae'n ddadlennol. Bydd gweithgareddau eraill yn cael eu tanseilio oherwydd cynlluniau'r cyngor, fel y soniodd Owen John amdanynt eisoes, gan gynnwys darparu te a brechdanau i bobl ddigartref ar brynhawn dydd Sul.

Ymysg y gweithgareddau rheolaidd eraill yr effeithir arnynt bydd cyfarfodydd gweddi, ymarferion côr, ac ati, yn ogystal â chyfarfodydd yr eglwys a grwpiau eraill. Mae'r Tab yn ganolfan genedlaethol ar gyfer gwasanaethau crefyddol, fel gwasanaeth y mileniwm yn 2000. Fe'i defnyddir ar gyfer ymarferion cystadleuaeth BBC Canwr y Byd Caerdydd ac mae'n lleoliad i bob math o ddigwyddiadau lansio a digwyddiadau eraill. Ni fyddem yn derbyn y math hwn o ymddygiad tuag at aelodau o gymunedau ffydd eraill, boed yn fosc, yn deml Sikh neu'n synagog, ac ni ddylem oddef y math hwn o ymddygiad tuag at gapel Cristnogol ychwaith.

Bu addoldy ar y safle hwn ers dros 180 o flynyddoedd—mae'n rhan bwysig o fywyd y ddinas ac mae'n haeddu ein cefnogaeth. Gobeithio y bydd pob plaid yn y Siambr sy'n cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn heddiw yn sicrhau bod eu cyd-aelodau yn y pleidiau hynny ar gyngor Caerdydd yn cydweithio i sicrhau chwarae teg i'r capel. Hoffwn gloi gydag ychydig eiriau i arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd, sydd wedi codi bwganod ynglŷn â'r mater hwn dros yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf ac wedi lladd ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n warthus ei fod wedi ceisio camarwain y datblygwyr ynghylch ein bwriad yn y ddadl heddiw. Nid oes yr un ohonom yn gwrthwynebu datblygiad Canolfan Dewi Sant 2. Mae nifer o'm hetholwyr i'n gweithio yng Nghaerdydd a gallent gael swyddi yn y datblygiad hwn—os na fydd cyngor Caerdydd yn codi tâl atal tagfeydd o £8 y dydd ac os gall Arriva gael y trenau i redeg yn brydlon.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, ysgrifennodd arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd at y Tabernacl eto. Yr oedd yn llythyr anobeithiol—yn anfoesgar, yn fychanfrydig ac yn gas. Nid llythyr arweinydd ydoedd; ond llythyr biwrocrat. Mae angen i'r Cynghorydd Berman benderfynu a—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not appropriate, as I pointed out at the start of this debate, in order to avoid this level of discussion, to refer personally to the leader of Cardiff council. This is a decision that we, as the National Assembly, are called upon to undertake as part of our statutory role of making subordinate legislation. I specifically requested that issues relating to the nature of the decision undertaken earlier by Cardiff council should not be the subject of debate. I ask you to conclude without taking those comments further.

**Leighton Andrews:** I accept that ruling, Presiding Officer. However, I must say that the leader of that council has attacked me and other Assembly Members, and we are entitled to some right of reply. I will conclude with this sentence: if Cardiff council does not grant changes in the Order to accommodate Tabernacl, then the council will go down in the history of this city as the council that planned to ban Sunday school.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will not support the amendment, because it is an unworthy and invasive comment on a council's approach to things. I say that in defence of not only the current administration, but also its predecessor. I will give you a little bit of information about the history of these events. We have had the history of Tabernacl and I will give you information on the St David's 2 development. The Labour administration took a much harder line against the rights of Tabernacl and this development, and the pedestrian square, which is a key part of it, has had cross-party support in the council. I am saying this in defence of Cardiff—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. What applies to other Members, must apply to you. Could we not have any more Cardiff history? Let us talk about the importance, or not, of this piece of subordinate legislation and the relevance of the amendment.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I have fought on behalf of the worshippers at Tabernacl for over five years. This started when they were not even consulted by the previous administration on the issue of the St David's 2 development.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol, fel yr esboniais ar ddechrau'r ddadl hon, er mwyn osgoi trafodaeth o'r fath, i gyfeirio'n bersonol at arweinydd cyngor Caerdydd. Penderfyniad yw hwn y gelwir arnom ni, fel y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i'w wneud fel rhan o'n rôl statudol o lunio is-deddfwriaeth. Gwneuthum gais penodol na ddylai materion sy'n ymwneud â natur y penderfyniad a wnaed yn gynharach gan gyngor Caerdydd fod yn bwnc trafod. Gofynnaf ichi gloi heb ymhelaethu ar y sylwadau hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Derbyniaf y dyfarniad hwnnw, Lywydd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud fod arweinydd y cyngor hwnnw wedi lladd arnaf fi ac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad, a bod gennym hawl i roi rhyw fath o ymateb. Byddaf yn cloi gyda'r frawddeg hon: os na fydd cyngor Caerdydd yn caniatáu newidiadau yn y Gorchymyn i gynorthwyo'r Tabernacl, yna bydd y cyngor yn cael ei gofio fel y cyngor a gynlluniodd i wahardd yr ysgol Sul.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, gan ei fod yn sylw annheilwng ac ymosodol ar ddull cyngor o wneud pethau. Dywedaf hynny i amddiffyn nid yn unig y weinyddiaeth bresennol, ond ei rhagflaenydd. Rhoddaf ychydig o wybodaeth ichi am hanes y digwyddiadau hyn. Cawsom hanes y Tabernacl a dyma ichi wybodaeth am ddatblygiad St David's 2. Yr oedd y weinyddiaeth Lafur lawer yn gadarnach ynglŷn â hawliau'r Tabernacl a chafodd y datblygiad hwn, a'r sgwâr i gerddwyr sy'n rhan allweddol ohono, gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y cyngor. Dywedaf hyn i amddiffyn Caerdydd-

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid i'r hyn sy'n berthnasol i Aelodau eraill fod yn berthnasol ichi hefyd. Dyna ddigon am hanes Caerdydd. Gadewch inni sôn am bwysigrwydd, neu ddiffyg pwysigrwydd, y darn hwn o is-deddfwriaeth a pherthnasedd y gwelliant.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch, Lywydd. Bùm yn brwydro ar ran addolwyr y Tabernacl ers dros bum mlynedd. Dechreuodd hyn pan nad ymgynghorwyd â hwy hyd yn oed gan y weinyddiaeth flaenorol am ddatblygiad St David's 2. Dros y cyfnod hwnnw o bum

Over those five years, we have made astounding progress and that is why I cannot support the amendment. What is being offered now bears no relationship to what was being offered two or three years ago. In the last couple of years, there have been major concessions to the legitimate interests of those people who worship at Tabernacl. They will now be able to continue to operate as a church and a social community.

I will give you a few examples of what they are going to be given, as a right. They will be entitled to 10 disabled spaces in their own car park at all times and, at all other times, they will be given the right to 15 spaces in their car park. In restricted hours on a Sunday morning, they will be given, in addition, the right to many more spaces in the multi-storey car parks that will be opposite Tabernacl. On a Sunday morning and at other times in the evening, they will be given the right to a maximum of 60 spaces—either 45 or 60 spaces. Given that the car park officially has only 25 spaces at the moment, the fact that they are being offered 60 spaces on a Sunday morning is actually an advance. I would say to Tabernacl, ‘Given where we came from, you have won the argument’. They have not won 100 per cent of what they asked for, but they have won the argument and have been given tremendous rights. I would not want to be here—

**Owen John Thomas:** Do you regard the only time for unrestricted access to the chapel on a Sunday—between 1 a.m. and 9 a.m.—as anything other than a crude joke?

**Jenny Randerson:** Given that the cross-party agreement on the council is to create a pedestrian—

**Owen John Thomas:** Answer the question.

**Jenny Randerson:** May I just finish my point? Do not interrupt me from a sedentary position.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Owen John Thomas, that displayed a rather un-Baptist and un-Christian attitude, if I may say so.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. The council wishes to create a

mlynedd, yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd eithriadol a dyna pam na allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant. Nid oes cysylltiad o gwbl rhwng yr hyn a gynigir yn awr a'r hyn a gynigiwyd ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, rhoddwyd ystyriaeth ddifrifol i fuddiannau cyfreithlon y bobl hynny sy'n addoli yn y Tabernacl. Byddant yn awr yn gallu parhau i weithredu fel eglwys ac fel cymuned gymdeithasol.

Dyma rai enghreifftiau ichi o'r hyn a roddir iddynt, fel hawl. Bydd hawl ganddynt i 10 lle parcio i'r anabl yn eu maes parcio eu hunain ar bob adeg, ac ar bob adeg arall bydd hawl ganddynt i 15 o leoedd yn eu maes parcio. Ar oriau cyfyngedig ar fore dydd Sul, bydd ganddynt yr hawl yn ychwanegol i lawer mwy o leoedd yn y meysydd parcio aml-lawr a fydd gyferbyn â'r Tabernacl. Ar fore dydd Sul ac ar adegau eraill gyda'r nos bydd yr hawl ganddynt i uchafswm o 60 o leoedd—naill ai 45 neu 60 o leoedd. O ystyried mai dim ond 25 o leoedd parcio swyddogol sydd yn y maes parcio ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ffaith eu bod yn cael cynnig 60 o leoedd ar fore dydd Sul mewn gwirionedd yn welliant. Dywedwn wrth y Tabernacl, 'O ystyried y man cychwyn, yr ydych wedi ennill y ddadl'. Nid ydynt wedi llwyddo i gael 100 y cant o'r hyn y gofynnwyd amdano, ond maent wedi ennill y ddadl ac wedi cael hawliau eithriadol. Ni fyddwn am fod yma—

**Owen John Thomas:** Oni ystyriwch mai jôc yw'r ffaith mai dim ond rhwng 1 a.m. a 9 a.m. y caniateir mynediad heb gyfyngiad i'r capel ar ddydd Sul?

**Jenny Randerson:** O ystyried mai'r cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y cyngor yw creu ardal i gerddwyr—

**Owen John Thomas:** Atebwch y cwestiwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** A gaf fi orffen fy mhwynt? Peidiwch â thorri ar fy nhraws ar eich eistedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Owen John Thomas, nid yw eich agwedd yn gydnaws ag agwedd Bedyddiwr na Christian, os caf ddweud.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch, Lywydd. Mae'r cyngor yn awyddus i greu ardal i gerddwyr ac



pedestrianised area and the Minister's rules and regulations say that if you are going to have such an area, you have to extinguish the highway. At the core of that concept is the fact that you must operate according to health and safety procedures, and at the core of this institution is the principle of sustainability and the idea that we might walk a few feet. If you consider those facts, and take into account the fact that Tabernacl will have 10 disabled spaces and, on a Sunday morning, another 30-odd spaces in the nearby multi-storey car park, which is not subject to any restriction at all, I would say that that package means that they will be able to continue reasonably satisfactorily, by anyone's account.

4.50 p.m.

Finally, I understand why Tabernacl is not entirely happy. From its point of view, it has what you could crudely regard as a valuable piece of real estate in its car park—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Come on.']

Wait a minute; I am giving Tabernacl some advice that I have given it before. That car park has been used regularly for access to the city centre and, as the land owner, the chapel is perfectly entitled to pursue a claim for compensation. I have said this to Tabernacl on several occasions. It is really important that we do not muddle up that right with the rights and requirements of Tabernacl as a place of worship. It is highly valued and important to the history and future of our city.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will be brief. You may be surprised at my speaking on this matter, as a humanist, and as one who is agreeing, for the first time ever, I think, with Owen John Thomas. I also agree with my colleague, Leighton Andrews. I was surprised by the amount of community and voluntary work that Tabernacl does. I would request that the council—I am almost afraid to say the word, in case the Presiding Officer asks me to sit down—extends the hours of access to the car park, particularly with regard to Tabernacl's work with and provision for the homeless. I request that something be done to allow members of Tabernacl to deliver food and

mae rheolau a rheoliadau'r Gweinidog yn dweud, os ydych yn bwriadu creu ardal o'r fath, ei bod yn rhaid ichi ddileu'r briffordd. Yn greiddiol i'r cysyniad hwnnw mae'r ffaith ei bod yn rhaid ichi weithredu yn ôl gweithdrefnau iechyd a diogelwch, ac yn greiddiol i'r sefydliad hwn mae'r egwyddor o gynaliadwyedd a'r syniad y galledd gerdded ychydig droedfeddi. Os ystyriwch y ffeithiau hynny, o gofio y bydd gan y Tabernacl 10 lle i'r anabl, ac ar fore dydd Sul tua 30 o leoedd eraill yn y maes parcio aml-lawr cyfagos, nad oes arno ddim cyfyngiad o gwbl, mi ddywedwn fod y pecyn hwnnw yn golygu y gallant barhau'n rhesymol foddhaol, i bob pwrpas.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn deall pam nad yw'r Tabernacl yn gwbl fodlon. O safbwynt y capel, mae ganddo'r hyn y gellid ei ystyried, mewn termau crai, yn ddarn gwerthfawr o eiddo reol yn ei faes parcio—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Dewch ymlaen.']

Arhoswch funud; yr wyf yn rhoi i'r Tabernacl y cyngor a roddais iddo o'r blaen. Defnyddiwyd y maes parcio hwnnw'n rheolaidd i gael mynediad i ganol y ddinas, ac fel y tirlfeddiannwr mae gan y capel berffaith hawl i wneud cais am iawndal. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn wrth y Tabernacl droeon. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni beidio â drysu rhwng yr hawl honno a hawliau a gofynion y Tabernacl fel addoldy. Caiff ei werthfawrogi'n fawr ac mae'n bwysig i hanes a dyfodol ein dinas.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Byddaf yn gryno. Efallai y byddwch yn synnu fy nghlywed yn llefaru ar y mater hwn, fel dyneiddiwr, ac fel un sy'n cytuno, am y tro cyntaf erioed, mi gredaf, ag Owen John Thomas. Cytunaf hefyd â'm cyd-Aelod, Leighton Andrews. Yr oeddwn yn synnu gweld faint o waith cymunedol a gwirfoddol a wneir gan y Tabernacl. Byddwn yn gofyn i'r cyngor-ac yr wyf bron yn ofni dweud y gair, rhag ofn i'r Llywydd ofyn imi eistedd-ymestyn oriau mynediad i'r maes parcio, yn arbennig o ran gwaith y Tabernacl gyda'r digartref a'r ddarpariaeth a wneir ar eu cyfer. Byddwn yn gofyn am wneud rhywbeth i ganiatáu i aelodau'r Tabernacl ddsbarthu

drink on Sunday to provide refreshments for the homeless in Cardiff. That is my plea, and I hope that something can be done to allow that.

**Alun Cairns:** I approach this debate as someone who is generally in favour of development, and Cardiff city centre certainly needs to develop and prosper, as it has done over the last 15 or 20 years. However, I also approach it as an issue of the rights of individuals to conduct their worship, their duties and their charitable work in a way that is restricted as little as possible. This must be one of the few occasions on which I support absolutely every word that Owen John Thomas and Leighton Andrews have said. [*Interruption.*] A colleague has just told me not to go too far. [*Laughter.*]

This is an extremely important issue. It may involve a relatively small number of people on a Welsh scale, but the principle is exceptionally important. No truer words were spoken than that there would be far more objections, or so it would appear, to this motion were it to affect a chapel of another faith. Can you imagine the protest that each Member would have heard if this affected a mosque and we were restricting access to it on that basis?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This debate is not about inter-faith matters. It is about the principle of a particular restriction on vehicular movement. Although this debate is on the principle, it does not make sense to extend it as far as that.

**Alun Cairns:** I endorse the comments that Members of all parties have made about Tabernacl's charitable work, and how unworkable Cardiff County Council's proposed restrictions are with regard to the continuation of worship and charitable work at Tabernacl. Simply allowing unrestricted access at the times suggested is laughable, as is the proposed access to carry things for the chapel's work with homeless people—that is not how a place of worship such as this works. People need constant and regular access to conduct their ongoing duties, such as the charitable fundraising event of last

bwyd a diod ar ddydd Sul i ddarparu lluniaeth i'r digartref yng Nghaerdydd. Dyna fy nghais, a gobeithio y gellir gwneud rhywbeth i ganiatáu hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymunaf â'r ddadl hon fel rhywun sydd yn gyffredinol o blaid datblygu, ac yn sicr mae angen i ganol dinas Caerdydd ddatblygu a ffynnu, fel y gwnaeth yn ystod y 15 neu 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, ymunaf hefyd gan ystyried hawliau unigolion i addoli, i gyflawni eu dyletswyddau ac i wneud eu gwaith elusennol mewn modd sy'n cael ei gyfyngu cyn lleied â phosibl. Rhaid mai dyma un o'r ychydig achlysuron lle yr wyf yn cefnogi pob un gair a ddywedodd Owen John Thomas a Leighton Andrews. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae cyd-Aelod newydd ddweud wrthyf am beidio â mynd yn rhy bell. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae hwn yn fater pwysig iawn. Efallai mai nifer cymharol fach o bobl sydd dan sylw o ystyried poblogaeth Cymru gyfan, ond mae'r egwyddor yn eithriadol o bwysig. Yr oedd yn arbennig o wir pan ddywedwyd y byddai llawer mwy o wrthwynebiad, neu y byddai'n ymddangos felly, i'r cynnig hwn pe byddai'n effeithio ar gapel ffydd arall. A allwch ddychmygu'r brotest y byddai pob Aelod wedi'i chlywed petai'r cynnig yn effeithio ar fosc a phe byddem yn cyfyngu mynediad iddo ar y sail honno?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes a wnelo'r ddadl hon â materion rhyng-ffydd. Mae a wnelo â'r egwyddor o gyfyngiad penodol ar symud cerbydau. Er mai ar yr egwyddor y cynhelir y ddadl hon, nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr ei hymestyn i'r fath raddau.

**Alun Cairns:** Cymeradwyaf y sylwadau a wnaed gan Aelodau pob plaid am waith elusennol y Tabernacl, ac mor anodd fyddai gweithredu cyfyngiadau arfaethedig Cyngor Sir Caerdydd o ran parhau i addoli a gwneud gwaith elusennol yn y Tabernacl. Mae caniatáu mynediad heb gyfyngiad ar yr adegau a awgrymwyd yn chwerthinllyd, felly hefyd y mynediad arfaethedig er mwyn cario pethau ar gyfer gwaith y capel gyda phobl ddigartref—nid fel hynny y mae addoldy fel hwn yn gweithio. Mae angen mynediad cyson a rheolaidd ar bobl i gyflawni eu dyletswyddau parhaus, megis y digwyddiad

Saturday. The location can be beneficial to the charities for which funds are being raised.

I do not want to prolong the debate more than necessary— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]— other than to underline that support is needed in the hope that Cardiff County Council will listen long and hard to the comments made, seemingly, on an almost all-party basis.

**Brynle Williams:** Fel Aelod o'r gogledd, efallai nad oes gennyf hawl i siarad ar y mater hwn, ond y peth pwysicaf yw mai tŷ'r Arglwydd sydd o dan sylw, ac mae wedi bodoli ers 200 mlynedd. Efallai fod Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr yn meddwl ei fod yn ddigrif, ond yr wyf yn cymryd y mater o ddifrif. Yr ydym yn siarad yn rhy aml am gau capeli ac eglwysi, ond, am unwaith, gadewch inni wneud daioni drwy geisio cadw'r capel yn agored, gan roi'r gallu i bobl fynd yno pan maent eisiau ac nid dim ond pan ddywed y cyngor y gallant fynd. Dyna'r unig beth yr wyf yn fodlon ei ddweud, ond yr wyf yn cefnogi hyn 100 y cant.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** On the basis that everyone seems to have declared their faith in this debate so far, I put on record that I am an existential humanist. As a Minister, my remit is to consider the appropriateness of the Order. I have no connection with Tabernacl chapel, but I have considered the Order and I have accepted the inspector's recommendations. This extinguishment of vehicular rights Order, incorporating the council's modification, does not affect Tabernacl's current access arrangements. However, if passed, the amendment will give a clear message to the local authority that it is expected to pay due attention to protecting the ongoing wellbeing of this religious institution in any future vehicular restrictions that it intends to introduce by way of a road traffic regulation Order, or other means.

In the proposed decision letter concerning this Order, I have also made it clear to the council that I expect it to make every effort to accommodate access to Tabernacl when considering the provisions of any future

codi arian elusennol ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf. Gall y lleoliad fod yn llesol i'r elusennau y codir arian ar eu cyfer.

Nid wyf am ymestyn y ddadl yn hwy nag sydd angen—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']—ac eithrio i ategu'r ffaith bod angen cefnogaeth yn y gobaith y bydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn gwrando'n ofalus ar y sylwadau a wnaed, yn ôl pob tebyg, ar draws y pleidiau i gyd.

**Brynle Williams:** As a Member from north Wales, perhaps I do not have the right to speak on this matter, but the main point is that this is a house of the Lord, and it has existed for 200 years. Perhaps Members on the other side of the Chamber find it funny, but I take the matter seriously. We talk too often about closing chapels and churches, but, for once, let us do some good by trying to keep the chapel open, so that people can go there when they wish, and not only when the council says that they may. That is all I am prepared to say, but I support this 100 per cent.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Ar y sail fod pawb fel petaent wedi datgan eu ffydd yn ystod y ddadl hon hyd yma, hoffwn gofnodi fy mod i'n ddyneiddiwr dirfodol. Fel Gweinidog, fy nghylch gwaith yw ystyried priodoldeb y Gorchymyn. Nid oes cysylltiad o gwbl rhyngof a chapel y Tabernacl, ond yr wyf wedi ystyried y Gorchymyn ac wedi derbyn argymhellion yr arolygydd. Nid yw'r Gorchymyn hwn i ddileu hawliau cerbydau, gan ymgorffori addasiad y cyngor, yn effeithio ar drefniadau mynediad presennol y Tabernacl. Fodd bynnag, os caiff ei dderbyn, bydd y gwelliant yn rhoi neges glir i'r awdurdod lleol bod disgwyl iddo roi sylw dyledus i ddiogelu lles parhaus y sefydliad crefyddol hwn mewn unrhyw gyfyngiadau y bwriada eu gosod ar gerbydau yn y dyfodol drwy gyfrwng Gorchymyn rheoleiddio traffig ffyrdd, neu gyfrwng arall.

Yn y llythyr penderfyniad arfaethedig parthed y Gorchymyn hwn, yr wyf hefyd wedi egluro wrth y cyngor fy mod yn disgwyl iddo ymdrechu'n galed i sicrhau mynediad i'r Tabernacl wrth ystyried darpariaethau

Order, whatever legislative route it chooses to achieve it. It would be inappropriate for me to comment on the specific terms that any road traffic regulation Order may, in due course, embody, since that will be open to separate statutory procedures that may involve consideration by the National Assembly.

unrhyw Orchymyn yn y dyfodol, waeth pa lwybr deddfwriaethol y bydd yn ei ddewis i'w gyflawni. Byddai'n amhriodol imi wneud sylwadau am y telerau penodol y gallai unrhyw Orchymyn rheoleiddio traffig ffyrdd eu cynnwys, maes o law, oherwydd bydd hynny'n destun gweithdrefnau statudol ar wahân a all olygu eu hystyried gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

*Gwelliant: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.*

*Amendment: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion (NDM3344) as amended

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Extinguishment of Vehicular Rights (Mill Lane, Hayes Bridge Road, The Hayes, Hill's Street and St John Street, Cardiff City Centre, Cardiff) Order 2006, a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006.*

*regrets that the local authority, by their stated intention to seek a traffic restriction Order to bring further restrictions on vehicular access by those travelling to and from the Tabernacl Church on the Hayes, have failed to pay due attention and importance to protecting the ongoing wellbeing of this religious institution which has been a crucial part of the social, religious and cultural fabric of our capital city for the past 200 years.*

Cynnig (NDM3344) fel y'i diwygiwyd

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Dileu Hawliau Cerbydau (Lôn y Felin, Heol Pont-yr-Aes, yr Aes, Hill's Street a Heol Sant Ioan, Canol Dinas Caerdydd, Caerdydd) 2006, y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006.*

*yn gresynu at y ffaith bod yr awdurdod lleol, drwy ei fwriad datganedig i geisio Gorchymyn cyfyngu ar draffig i ddod â rhagor o gyfyngiadau ar fynediad i gerbydau gan y rheini sy'n teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen i Eglwys Tabernacl yr Aes, wedi methu â rhoi digon o sylw na phwysigrwydd ar amddiffyn lles parhaus y sefydliad crefyddol hwn sydd wedi bod yn rhan hollbwysig o wead cymdeithasol, crefyddol a diwylliannol ein prifddinas dros y 200 mlynedd diwethaf.*

*Cynnig (NDM3343): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.*

*Motion (NDM3343): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3344): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3344): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau fod

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.19(i) a 6.11, yn gohirio'r ddadl fer tan ddyddiad hwyrach.*

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Orders Numbers 6.19(i) and 6.11, postpone the short debate until a later date.*

**Y Llywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cytuno? Gwelaf bod.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in agreement? I see that there are.

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Procedural motion: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

5.00 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i Reolau Cynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad  
 Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**Approval of the Changes to the National Assembly for Wales Members' Pension  
 Scheme Rules**

**John Marek:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 18 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 3.1, makes a determination to adopt the revised National Assembly for Wales Members' Pension Scheme Rules 2006 e-mailed to Members on 21 November 2006 and revokes the rules set out under the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members) (Pension Scheme) Direction 1999 as amended. (NDM3345)*

I will make a few remarks since these changes are significant. Following the

**John Marek:** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 18 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3.1, yn penderfynu mabwysiadu Rheolau diwygiedig Cynllun Pensiwn Aelodau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru 2006 a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Tachwedd 2006 ac yn dirymu'r rheolau a nodir dan Gyfarwyddyd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau Cynulliad) (Cynllun Pensiwn) 1999, fel y'i diwygiwyd. (NDM3345)*

Gwnaf ychydig sylwadau gan fod y newidiadau hyn yn arwyddocaol. Yn dilyn



implementation of the Pensions Act 2004 and the Finance Act 2004, the old tax regime was swept away and that included replacing the limits on contributions and benefits, which were previously prescribed, with lifetime and annual allowances. The Members' pension scheme is exempt from the scheme-specific funding requirements, but trustees have always adopted best practice after taking advice.

The trustees have recommended the following changes and the House Committee has accepted those changes, and I speak on behalf of the House Committee. The first change is an amendment to the tax-free cash entitlement. That is now broadly in line with the Finance Act 2004 and will allow Members to take about 25 per cent of the capitalised value of their pension, tax free. That will only be subject to the lifetime allowance. A further change is that the earnings cap will be at the discretion of trustees and they will be able to vary it. The trustees have set it for 2007-08, at the rate of increase of the retail prices index for the year to September 2006, and we have rounded it up to the nearest £100. It is divisible by 12 for convenience and we have set it at £112,800 for the next financial year.

The trustees recommend that added years should be able to be purchased and that the limit be increased to 20 per cent of a Member's ordinary salary, including normal contributions. Trustees will have the power to decide on the time limits that apply, and they are likely to be less restrictive than they are at present.

We recommend that the rules covering the withdrawal of the pensions of spouses, partners and dependents be removed. Previously, if a partner or a spouse remarried, the pension would automatically cease and it would be up to the discretion of the trustees to allow that pension to continue. That discretion has been removed under the changes by the trustees. We have also ensured that the minimum pension age will be increased to 55 for all new entrants. That is a statutory requirement, which trustees

gweithredu'r Ddeddf Pensiynau 2004 a'r Ddeddf Cyllid 2004, diddymwyd yr hen gyfundrefn dreth ac yr oedd hynny'n cynnwys rhoi lwfansau gydol oes a lwfansau blynyddol yn lle'r terfynau ar gyfraniadau a buddiannau, a ragnodwyd yn flaenorol. Mae cynllun pensiwn yr Aelodau wedi'i eithrio o'r gofynion ariannol sy'n ymwneud â chynlluniau penodol, ond mae ymddiriedolwyr bob amser wedi mabwysiadu arfer gorau ar ôl cael cyngor.

Mae'r ymddiriedolwyr wedi argymhell y newidiadau canlynol ac mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi derbyn y newidiadau hynny, a siaradaf ar ran Pwyllgor y Tŷ. Mae'r newid cyntaf yn diwygio'r hawliad arian parod di-dreth. Mae hynny bellach yn unol yn fras â'r Ddeddf Cyllid 2004 a bydd yn caniatáu i Aelodau gymryd tua 25 y cant o werth cyfalaf eu pensiwn yn ddi-dreth. Dim ond ar y lwfans gydol oes y bydd hynny'n amodol. Newid pellach yw y bydd y terfyn enillion yn ôl disgrisiwn ymddiriedolwyr a byddant yn gallu ei amrywio. Mae'r ymddiriedolwyr wedi ei osod am 2007-08 ar gyfradd cynnydd y mynegai prisiau manwerthu am y flwyddyn hyd at fis Medi 2006, ac yr ydym wedi ei dalgrynnu i'r £100 agosaf. Gellir ei rannu â 12 er mwyn hwylustod, ac yr ydym wedi ei osod yn £112,800 am y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

Mae'r ymddiriedolwyr yn argymhell y dylai fod yn bosibl prynu blynyddoedd ychwanegol a chynyddu'r terfyn i 20 y cant o gyflog cyffredin Aelod, gan gynnwys cyfraniadau arferol. Bydd gan ymddiriedolwyr y pŵer i benderfynu'r terfynau amser sy'n gymwys, ac maent yn debygol o fod yn llai cyfyngol nag ydynt ar hyn o bryd.

Argymhellwn y dylai'r rheolau sy'n cwmpasu'r broses o dynnu allan bensiwn priod, partner a dibynnydd gael eu dileu. Gynt, pe bai partner neu briod yn ailbriodi, deuai'r pensiwn i ben yn awtomatig a chyfrifoldeb yr ymddiriedolwyr fyddai penderfynu a ddylid gadael i'r pensiwn hwnnw barhau. Mae'r disgrisiwn hwnnw wedi'i ddileu o dan y newidiadau gan yr ymddiriedolwyr. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau y caiff yr oed pensiwn isod ei godi i 55 i bob person newydd sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun. Mae

have had to implement.

I now come to the rule of 80. There are arguments as to whether the rule of 80 is a benefit that should be kept or removed, but the trustees have decided that it is to be removed. It is the benefit that allows retiring Members aged 60 or over, who have over 20 years of service, to retire at 60, or if Members only have 19 years of service, they can retire at 61 instead of the normal 65. The new rule changes will extinguish that benefit for all new entrants. Existing Members will not be affected, and the trustees take their duties seriously and abide by legislation that states that we should interpret the rules for existing Members and not do anything retrospectively to harm Members' interests and the benefits from their pension plans.

There is one clarification of the rules. At present, they allow money transferred into pensions to count towards the rule of 80. Trustees have decided that that was an error in the drafting and, from 1 December, in two days' time, it will not be possible for any Member to do that. However, those Members—and there are some—who have transferred sums in will be able to benefit by the rule of 80, should the conditions apply.

The cost saving from abolishing the rule of 80 will be used to remove the retained benefit test that was part of the old tax regime, which was removed by the Finance Act 2004, and it will mean that, as long as lifetime allowances are not exceeded, Members will get the full benefit of each pension scheme to which they belong. I am aware that Members were on different pension schemes in the past and that, in the past, the revenue had curtailed benefits above a certain sum. That will no longer apply.

On the two amendments—to the rule of 80 and the retained benefit test—one will cost a little and the other will save a little. They are broadly in balance and the scheme actuary has considered them and has agreed with that

hynny'n ofyniad statudol yr oedd yn rhaid i ymddiriedolwyr ei weithredu.

Deuaf yn awr at y rheol 80. Mae yna ddadleuon a yw'r rheol 80 yn fudd y dylid ei gadw neu ei ddileu, ond mae ymddiriedolwyr wedi penderfynu y dylid ei ddileu. Mae'n fudd sy'n caniatáu i Aelodau sy'n ymddeol yn 60 oed ac sydd â dros 20 mlynedd o wasanaeth ymddeol yn 60 oed, neu os 19 mlynedd yn unig o wasanaeth sydd gan Aelodau, gallant ymddeol yn 61 oed yn hytrach na 65 oed, sef yr oed arferol. Bydd y newidiadau yn y rheol yn diddymu'r budd hwnnw ar gyfer pob person newydd sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun. Nid effeithir ar Aelodau presennol, ac mae'r ymddiriedolwyr yn ystyried eu dyletswyddau o ddifrif ac yn cydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth sy'n dweud y dylem ddehongli'r rheolau ar gyfer Aelodau presennol a pheidio â gwneud dim yn ôl-weithredol i niweidio'r buddiannau a gaiff Aelodau o'u cynlluniau pensiwn.

Mae un eglurhad o'r rheolau. Ar hyn o bryd, maent yn caniatáu i arian sy'n cael ei drosglwyddo i bensiynau gyfrif tuag at y rheol 80. Mae ymddiriedolwyr wedi penderfynu bod gwall yn y drafft, ac o 1 Rhagfyr, ymhen dau ddiwrnod, ni fydd yn bosibl i unrhyw Aelod wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr Aelodau hynny—ac mae yna rai—sydd wedi trosglwyddo symiau i mewn yn gallu cael budd o'r rheol 80, os bydd yr amodau'n gymwys.

Defnyddir yr arbediad cost sy'n deillio o ddiddymu'r rheol 80 i ddileu'r prawf buddiannau argadwedig, a oedd yn rhan o'r hen gyfundrefn dreth a ddiddymwyd gan y Ddeddf Cyllid 2004, a bydd yn golygu, ar yr amod nad eir y tu hwnt i lwfansau gydol oes, y caiff Aelodau fudd llawn o bob cynllun pensiwn y maent yn perthyn iddo. Gwn fod yr Aelodau ar gynlluniau pensiwn gwahanol yn y gorffennol a bod y refeniw, yn y gorffennol, wedi cwtogi buddiannau uwchlaw swm penodol. Ni fydd hynny'n gymwys mwyach.

O ran y ddau welliant—yn y rheol 80 a'r prawf buddiannau argadwedig—bydd y naill yn costio ychydig a bydd y llall yn arbed ychydig. Maent yn gytbwys yn fras, ac mae actiwari'r cynllun wedi eu hystyried ac wedi

proposal.

The last significant change is to restrict membership of the scheme to Members who are under 75 years of age. There are penal tax rules for taking tax-free cash sums after the age of 75. That will apply to all Members. Therefore, it will be necessary for all Members to take their benefit in a cash sum by that age.

On other matters, I can report that funds are in good shape. Our investment policies are beating the mid-cap index, which is the benchmark that we have set ourselves. With a changing financial climate, trustees have continued to consider investment policies at every meeting and we will continue to do so. We are a little over overweight on equities. Since the fund is now somewhere around £10 million, it may be right to change the balance of the fund over the next three or four years. Certainly, your trustees will consider that as an important matter at future meetings.

Finally, I thank my fellow trustees of the pension fund for all their hard work and extra time. It is all done voluntarily and gets no publicity. Such work is done in closed rooms. Importantly, I thank the staff, including Roger Beale, Wayne Cowley and others, who work on these pension funds and ensure that the figures are right, that Members get what they pay for and that mistakes—and there has been one mistake, but only involving a couple of hundred pounds—are put right. The figures are generally absolutely right and I commend them on their good work. Therefore, in conclusion, I move this motion to implement these new rules. They will be better for Members, they will represent the up-to-date position and they will take into account the pensions and finance Acts of 2004. I recommend that Members vote for the motion.

cytuno â'r cynnig hwnnw.

Y newid sylweddol olaf yw cyfyngu aelodaeth o'r cynllun i Aelodau dan 75 oed. Mae yna reolau treth sy'n cosbi am gymryd symiau arian parod di-dreth ar ôl 75 oed. Bydd hynny'n gymwys i bob Aelod. Felly, bydd angen i bob Aelod gymryd ei fudd mewn arian parod erbyn yr oedran hwnnw.

O ran materion eraill, gallaf ddweud bod cronfeydd mewn cyflwr da. Mae ein polisiau buddsoddi yn rhagori ar y mynegai cyfalafiad canol, sef y meincnod a bennwyd gennym ar ein cyfer ein hunain. Gyda hinsawdd ariannol sy'n newid, mae ymddiriedolwyr wedi parhau i ystyried polisiau buddsoddi ym mhob cyfarfod, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae lefel ein hecwiti ychydig yn ormodol. Gan fod y gronfa oddeutu £10 miliwn ar hyn o bryd, efallai y byddai'n iawn newid balans y gronfa dros y tair neu'r pedair blynedd nesaf. Yn sicr, bydd eich ymddiriedolwyr yn ystyried hynny fel mater pwysig mewn cyfarfodydd yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i'm cyd ymddiriedolwyr o'r gronfa bensiwn am eu holl waith caled a'u hamser ychwanegol. Gwneir y cyfan yn wirfoddol ac ni chaiff ddim cyhoeddusrwydd. Gwneir gwaith felly mewn ystafelloedd caeedig. Yn bwysicach, diolchaf i'r staff, gan gynnwys Roger Beale, Wayne Cowley ac eraill, sy'n gweithio ar y cronfeydd pensiwn hyn ac yn sicrhau bod y ffigurau'n gywir, bod Aelodau'n cael yr hyn y maent yn talu amdano a bod camgymeriadau-a chafwyd un camgymeriad nad oedd yn cynnwys ond ychydig gannoedd o bunnoedd-yn cael eu cywiro. Ar y cyfan, mae'r ffigurau'n hollol gywir ac fe'u cymeradwyaf am eu gwaith caled. Felly, i gloi, cynigiaf y cynnig hwn i weithredu'r rheolau newydd hyn. Byddant yn well i Aelodau, byddant yn cynrychioli'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf a byddant yn ystyried Deddfau pensiynau a chyllid 2004. Argymhellaf yr Aelodau i bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig.

*Cynnig (NDM3345): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3345): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Penderfyniad ar Dâl a Lwfansau Aelodau  
Approval of a Determination on Members' Pay and Allowances**

**William Graham:** I propose that

**William Graham:** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 16 of the Government of Wales Act 2002* *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 16 o Ddeddf*

*Act 1998 and Standing Order No. 3.1, makes the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 2006, which was e-mailed to Members on 21 November 2006. (NDM3346)*

*Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3.1, yn gwneud Penderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau'r Cynulliad a Swyddogion) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau etc.) 2006, a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3346)*

This motion proposes changes to the National Assembly for Wales (Assembly Members and Officers) (Salaries, Allowances etc.) Determination 2005. The determination has been reviewed to ensure that it continues to be fit for purpose over the election period and during the transition to the third Assembly.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn cynnig newidiadau ym Mhenderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Aelodau'r Cynulliad a Swyddogion) (Cyflogau, Lwfansau ac ati) 2005. Adolygwyd y penderfyniad hwn i sicrhau ei fod yn dal yn addas at y diben dros gyfnod yr etholiad ac yn ystod y cyfnod pontio i'r trydydd Cynulliad.

The committee concluded that a number of amendments will be desirable to avoid potential ambiguities in the current version. Those have been examined by the House Committee and are recommended to Members. The cost of the changes should be broadly neutral and provision for payment of Assembly Members' pay, pensions and allowances has been included in the draft 2007-08 budget. I commend this motion to Members and respectfully request a favourable vote.

Daeth y pwyllgor i'r casgliad y bydd nifer o welliannau'n ddymunol i osgoi amwysterau posibl yn y fersiwn gyfredol. Cafodd y rheini eu harchwilio gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ ac fe'u hargymhellir i Aelodau. Dylai cost y newidiadau fod fwy neu lai yn niwtral, ac mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer talu cyflog, pensiynau a lwfansau Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi ei chynnwys yng nghyllideb ddrafft 2007-08. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn i Aelodau a gofynnaf yn barchus am bleidlais ffafriol.

*Cynnig (NDM3346): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3346): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**Michael German:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.19(ii), refers the draft Order, the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006, to a committee.*

This is a very unusual piece of legislation in terms of the manner in which it arrives with us. Essentially, it allows the National Assembly for Wales to comment on the disqualification from being a Member of this National Assembly for Wales, and it is then made by Order in Council. I am concerned by the list of disqualifying offices—not the legislation itself—and the number of people who would be disqualified from being Members of the National Assembly for Wales, many of whose posts have nothing to do with the National Assembly for Wales or its work. For example, if you happen to be a member of the Channel 4 television corporation and live in Wales, you could not be a Member of the National Assembly for

**Michael German:** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.19(ii), yn cyfeirio'r Gorchymyn drafft, the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006, at bwyllgor.*

Mae hwn yn ddarn anarferol iawn o ddeddfwriaeth oherwydd y modd y mae'n cael ei gyflwyno inni. Yn ei hanfod, mae'n caniatáu i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru roi sylwadau ar ddatgymhwysio rhag bod yn Aelod o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a chaiff ei wneud wedyn gan Orchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. Yr wyf yn bryderus ynghylch y rhestr o swyddi datgymhwysio-nid y ddeddfwriaeth ei hun a nifer y bobl a gâi eu datgymhwysio rhag bod yn Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, nad yw swyddi nifer ohonynt yn gysylltiedig mewn unrhyw ffordd â Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru na'i waith. Er enghraifft, os ydych yn digwydd bod yn aelod o gorfforaeth deledu Channel 4 ac yn byw yng Nghymru, ni allech

Wales.

fod yn Aelod o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

5.10 p.m.

There may be perfectly good reasons why members of that organisation and around 25 other organisations on the list cannot be Members of the National Assembly for Wales, but we have not had an opportunity to consider this appropriately. By referring it to a committee—in this case, the Local Government and Public Services Committee, which has been looking at electoral arrangements in Wales—it seems that we have an opportunity to review the list to ensure that the Assembly is comfortable with it and that it would then be brought back here to be voted upon, should that happen. I am not in a position to comment on why some of these post-holders could not be Members of the National Assembly for Wales without having a discussion with the appropriate officials and officers, who can give us the answers. This piece of legislation has come to us from London and it is meant to be a process of straightforward approval. If we do not pass it, the Secretary of State has to lay it before both Houses of Parliament as an Order in Council and it would go through that route. That is why I suggest that we use this procedural device to ensure that we have an opportunity to consider this matter so that we are comfortable with the categories of people who would be excluded from becoming Members of the National Assembly for Wales, and then come back to ensure that this matter is dealt with next month, perhaps.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am obliged to put this motion to a vote, but I will take one speech against this motion.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I do not agree that this draft Order needs to be referred to a subject committee for consideration. I believe, Mike, that we have followed the appropriate procedure, in terms of the Assembly's role, in relation to the draft National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006. I remind Members that the procedure has been used before. The National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003 was made using the same procedure under section 12 of

Efallai fod rhesymau digon teg pam na all aelodau o'r sefydliad hwnnw a thua 25 o sefydliadau eraill ar y rhestr fod yn Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ond nid ydym wedi cael cyfle i ystyried hyn yn briodol. Drwy gyfeirio hyn at bwyllgor—y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn yr achos hwn, sydd wedi bod yn edrych ar drefniadau etholaethol yng Nghymru—ymddengys fod gennym gyfle i adolygu'r rhestr i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn hapus am y ddeddfwriaeth ac y byddai wedyn yn cael ei dychwelyd atom inni gael pleidleisio arni, pe bai hynny'n digwydd. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i wneud sylwadau am y rheswm pam na allai rhai o'r deiliaid swyddi hyn fod yn Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru heb gael trafodaeth gyda'r swyddogion priodol, a all roi'r atebion inni. Daeth y darn hwn o ddeddfwriaeth atom o Lundain a bwriedir i'r ddeddfwriaeth fod yn broses syml o gymeradwyo. Os na fyddwn yn ei derbyn, bydd yn rhaid i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ei chyflwyno gerbron y ddau Dŷ fel Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a byddai'n dilyn y llwybr hwnnw. Dyna pam yr awgrymaf y dylem ddefnyddio'r ddyfais drefniadol hon i sicrhau bod gennym gyfle i ystyried y mater hwn er mwyn inni fod yn hapus am y categorïau o bobl a fyddai'n cael eu heithrio rhag bod yn Aelodau o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan ddod yn ôl wedyn i sicrhau delio â'r mater hwn fis nesaf, efallai.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae rheidrwydd arnaf i roi'r cynnig hwn i bleidlais, ond derbyniaf un araith yn erbyn y cynnig hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Ni chytunaf fod angen i'r Gorchymyn drafft hwn gael ei gyfeirio at bwyllgor pwnc i'w ystyried. Credaf, Mike, ein bod wedi dilyn y weithdrefn briodol, o ran rôl y Cynulliad, mewn perthynas â Gorchymyn drafft Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwyso) 2006. Atgoffaf Aelodau fod y weithdrefn wedi'i defnyddio o'r blaen. Gwnaed Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwyso) 2003 gan ddefnyddio'r un weithdrefn o dan adran 12 o

the Government of Wales Act 1998. The National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2003 was considered in Plenary, but was not submitted to a subject committee for consideration in advance. When it was considered in Plenary, I do not think that there was any discussion and Members agreed to the motion. We have, therefore, followed the same procedure for the 2006 Order as that used for the 2003 Order.

The Assembly, in line with the provision in section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, is invited to resolve that the Secretary of State be requested to recommend the making of the Order in Council. The Assembly is not being asked to approve the draft Order, because the Government of Wales Act 1998 does not require this. In response to Mike, who was concerned that this was a lengthy list of disqualifications, the 2006 Order replaces the 2003 Order. Therefore, the majority of the posts on the list are already disqualified under the 2003 Order. The additions to the list of disqualifications have been decided using exactly the same criteria that were used for the 2003 Order. If this motion is not passed today and we miss the latest deadline for submitting it to the Privy Council on 7 December, for the Privy Council meeting on 14 December, the Privy Council will not meet again until 6 February. If the Order in Council is not made until then, it will result in a longer period of uncertainty for those intending to stand for election to the Assembly. The Business Committee considered the handling of the Order at its meetings on 14 November and 21 November; no comments were made on either occasion. Therefore, I believe that we have followed the appropriate procedure in relation to the draft National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 and I do not agree with this motion.

Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Ystyriwyd Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2003 yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ond ni chafodd ei gyflwyno i bwyllgor pwnc ei ystyried ymlaen llaw. Pan gafodd ei ystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ni chredaf fod dim trafodaeth wedi bod, a chytunodd Aelodau â'r cynnig. Yr ydym, felly, wedi dilyn yr un weithdrefn ar gyfer Gorchymyn 2006 ag a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer Gorchymyn 2003.

Gwahoddir y Cynulliad, yn unol â'r ddarpariaeth yn adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, i benderfynu y dylid gofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol argymhell gwneud y Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor. Ni ofynnir i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn drafft, oherwydd nid yw Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn gofyn am hyn. Mewn ymateb i Mike, a oedd yn pryderu bod hon yn rhestr hirfaith o ddatgymhwysu, mae Gorchymyn 2006 yn disodli Gorchymyn 2003. Felly, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi ar y rhestr eisoes wedi eu datgymhwysu o dan Orchymyn 2003. Penderfynwyd yr ychwanegiadau at y rhestr ddatgymhwysu gan ddefnyddio'r un meini prawf yn union ag a ddefnyddiwyd ar gyfer Gorchymyn 2003. Os na dderbynnir y cynnig hwn heddiw, ac os na chyflwynwn hyn i'r Cyfrin Gyngor erbyn 7 Rhagfyr, sef y dyddiad olaf ar gyfer cyfarfod y Cyfrin Gyngor ar 14 Rhagfyr, ni fydd y Cyfrin Gyngor yn cyfarfod eto tan 6 Chwefror. Os na wneir y Gorchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor tan hynny, bydd yn arwain at gyfnod hwy o ansicrwydd i'r rheini sy'n bwriadu sefyll fel ymgeiswyr i'r Cynulliad. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Busnes y modd yr ymdrinnir â'r Gorchymyn yn ei gyfarfodydd ar 14 Tachwedd a 21 Tachwedd; ni wnaed sylwadau ar y naill achlysur na'r llall. Felly, credaf ein bod wedi dilyn y weithdrefn briodol mewn perthynas â Gorchymyn drafft Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2006 ac ni chytunaf â'r cynnig hwn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 7, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 41.*

*Motion: For 7, Abstain 4, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:



Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Marek, John  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Ryder, Janet  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion defeated.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwysu) 2006  
o dan adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998  
Approval of the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006  
under section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998**

Motion (NDM3347): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3347): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, requests that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 be made. The draft Order was laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Delete all after '1998,' and replace with:

*declines to request that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 be made because it has not been referred to the Local Government and Public Services Committee for consideration.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, requests that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 be made. The draft Order was laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006. (NDM3347)*

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Delete all after '1998,' and replace with:

*declines to request that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 be made because it has not been referred to the Local Government and Public Services Committee for consideration.*

I do not accept that waiting until February for this list to be agreed is insufficient time in which to wait, given that the list has probably not excluded anyone who has already been selected for candidature for the National

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyngor bod the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud. Gosodwyd y Gorchymyn drafft yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Dileu popeth ar ôl '1998,' a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn gwrthod gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyngor bod the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud gan nad yw wedi cael ei gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i'w ystyried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyngor bod The National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud. Gosodwyd y Gorchymyn drafft yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006 (NDM3347)*

**Michael German:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Dileu popeth ar ôl '1998,' a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn gwrthod gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyngor bod the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud gan nad yw wedi cael ei gyfeirio at y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i'w ystyried.*

Ni dderbyniaf fod aros tan fis Chwefror i gael cytundeb ar y rhestr hon yn amser annigonol i aros, o gofio nad yw'r rhestr, mae'n siŵr, wedi eithrio unrhyw un sydd wedi'i ddewis eisoes i fod yn ymgeisydd i Gynulliad

Assembly for Wales. However, the purpose of raising it now is that we will get the same motion as we got the last time, just before the Assembly elections in 2011, and in 2003, and as was passed by Parliament in 1999, before the Assembly was set up. It is always just as we get right to the wire, and it is a long time after most people have been selected and want to stand. It makes sure that we have an in-built process without any form of review by the National Assembly for Wales to be able to understand whether or not there are people who should be debarred from being a candidate and therefore debarred from being elected to the National Assembly for Wales. Whether or not you believe that people who are members of the Gas and Electricity Markets Authority, the Independent Police Complaints Commission, the Lands Tribunal, the Office of Communications, the Office of Fair Trading, the Pensions Compensation Board, or the Postal Services Commission—

**Leighton Andrews:** I can see that the Office of Communications has been created since the last Assembly elections, but are you suggesting that all of the others have been too, and are therefore new additions?

**Michael German:** Indeed, I am not. I am not suggesting that this was right in 2003 or in 1999, but, at the rate at which we are going, given the way in which this procedure passes through the Assembly, it will always be rushed through right at the last minute. We will never get to change this list, as it is never considered in an appropriate manner. We never have looked at it in an appropriate manner, and that is why I would prefer to have this short delay while we review it. We will not be reviewing it for 2007, but for 2011 and so on.

I could keep going, as there are pages of them. If you believe that the list is right, and that it is perfectly appropriate that people are disqualified from being a Member of the National Assembly for Wales by virtue of their holding an office to which they were appointed by the Westminster Government, that is fine, but we need to have an opportunity to debate it, and we have not had any opportunity to discuss or review it. Given that it is rolled forward from one Assembly to

Cenedlaethol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, y rheswm dros godi hynny yn awr yw ein bod yn cael yr un cynnig â'r tro diwethaf, ychydig cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2011, ac yn 2003, ac fel y derbyniwyd gan y Senedd yn 1999, cyn i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu. Mae hyn yn digwydd bob tro wrth inni gyrraedd y diwedd yn deg, ac mae'n amser hir ar ôl i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl gael eu dewis a bod eisiau sefyll. Mae'n sicrhau bod gennym broses fewnol heb unrhyw fath o adolygiad gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i allu deall a oes pobl na ddylent gael bod yn ymgeiswyr ac felly na ddylent gael eu hethol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. P'un a ydych yn credu bod pobl sy'n aelodau o'r Awdurdod Marchnadoedd Nwy a Thrydan, Comisiwn Cwynion Annibynnol yr Heddlu, y Tribiwnlys Tir, y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu, y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg, y Bwrdd Iawndal Pensiynau, neu'r Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Post—

**Leighton Andrews:** Gallaf weld bod y Swyddfa Gyfathrebu wedi'i chreu ers etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, ond a ydych yn awgrymu bod y rhai eraill wedi'u creu ers hynny hefyd, a'u bod felly yn ychwanegiadau newydd?

**Michael German:** Nac ydw, yn wir. Nid wyf yn awgrymu bod hynny'n iawn yn 2003 nac yn 1999, ond ar y cyflymdra hwn, o gofio'r ffordd y bydd y weithdrefn hon yn mynd drwy'r Cynulliad, bydd bob amser yn cael ei rhuthro drwyddo ar y funud olaf. Ni chawn y cyfle i newid y rhestr hon byth, oherwydd ni chaiff ei hystyried mewn modd priodol byth. Nid ydym erioed wedi edrych arni mewn modd priodol, a dyna pam y byddai'n well gennyf gael yr oedi byr hwn tra byddwn yn ei hadolygu. Ni fyddwn yn ei hadolygu ar gyfer 2007, ond ar gyfer 2011, ac yn y blaen.

Gallwn fynd ymlaen, oherwydd mae yna dudalennau ohonynt. Os credwch fod y rhestr yn iawn, a'i bod yn gwbl briodol datgymhwyso pobl rhag bod yn Aelod o Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru drwy rinwedd swydd y penodwyd hwy iddi gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, mae hynny'n iawn. Ond mae angen inni gael cyfle i'w dadlau, ac nid ydym wedi cael cyfle o gwbl i'w thrafod na'i hadolygu. O gofio'i bod yn cael ei throsglwyddo o un Cynulliad i'r nesaf, nid

the next, this list is virtually without change—with the exception of any bodies that are created or disbanded during that period.

The decision for the National Assembly for Wales is whether it wants to see this list reviewed. If Members believe that we should offer people the opportunity to be candidates from the widest possible range of positions in our society, ask for a review. You would ask for that opportunity. If you vote in support of this motion with the list as it is at present, in effect, all that you are doing is ensuring that this will happen again in 2011.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have only a couple of points to add to what I said earlier in relation to Mike's first points. The issue of timing is clear. We should be clear about who can and cannot be elected to the Assembly well in advance of the election period.

I will just comment briefly on disqualification. Some offices no longer exist, and they have been removed from the list, such as the health service commissioner for Wales and the commissioner for local administration in Wales; in other cases, the setting up of new bodies needs to be taken into account, such as the commissioner for older people in Wales, the deputy commissioner, and staff of the commissioner, all of whom are disqualified in the draft National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006.

It is important to reflect on the criteria. The criteria applied in identifying these posts include: offices wholly or partly funded by the Assembly where the remuneration exceeds £10,000 per year; appointments that are made by the Assembly, or those in which the Assembly has a statutory right to be consulted; and bodies with a significant interrelationship in areas under Assembly control, which could give rise to an unsustainable conflict of interests. It is important that those criteria are put on record in relation to these issues. Offices whose holders are required to be, or seen to be, politically impartial is another. I think that people would generally agree that these

yw'r rhestr hon wedi newid bron o gwbl—ar wahân i unrhyw gyrff sy'n cael eu creu neu eu diddymu yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Y penderfyniad i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yw a yw am weld y rhestr hon yn cael ei hadolygu ai peidio. Os cred Aelodau y dylem gynnig y cyfle i bobl fod yn ymgeiswyr o'r ystod ehangaf posibl o swyddi yn ein cymdeithas, gofynnwch am adolygiad. Byddech yn gofyn am y cyfle hwnnw. Os pleidleisiwch o blaid y cynnig hwn gyda'r rhestr fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, mewn gwirionedd y cyfan a wnewch yw sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd unwaith eto yn 2011.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Dim ond ychydig bwyntiau sydd gennyf i'w hychwanegu at yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach mewn perthynas â phwyntiau cyntaf Mike. Dylem fod yn glir ymhell cyn adeg yr etholiad ynghylch pwy all a phwy na all gael ei ethol i'r Cynulliad.

Hoffwn sôn yn fras am ddatgymhwyso. Mae rhai swyddi nad ydynt yn bodoli mwyach ac maent wedi eu tynnu oddi ar y rhestr, megis comisiynydd gwasanaeth iechyd Cymru a'r comisiynydd dros weinyddu lleol yng Nghymru; mewn achosion eraill, mae angen ystyried sefydlu cyrff newydd, megis comisiynydd pobl hŷn Cymru, y dirprwy gomisiynydd, a staff y comisiynydd, sydd i gyd wedi eu datgymhwyso yng Ngorchymyn drafft Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Datgymhwyso) 2006.

Mae'n bwysig myfyrio ar y meini prawf. Ymhlith y meini prawf a ddefnyddir wrth nodi'r swyddi hyn mae: swyddi a ariennir yn rhannol neu'n gyfan gwbl gan y Cynulliad pan fydd y gydnabyddiaeth yn fwy na £10,000 y flwyddyn, penodiadau a wneir gan y Cynulliad, neu'r rheini lle y mae gan y Cynulliad hawl statudol i fynnu ymgynghori ag ef; a chyrrff sydd â rhyngberthynas sylweddol mewn meysydd a reolir gan y Cynulliad, a allai arwain at achos anghynaliadwy o wrthdaro buddiannau. Mae'n bwysig cofnodi'r meini prawf hynny mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn. Mae'r swyddi lle mae'n ofynnol i'w deiliaid fod yn wleidyddol ddiuedd, neu i ymddangos felly,

criteria are reasonable and are not unduly restrictive.

I have already made my case about the fact that we have used this procedure before, in 2003. This is a matter of timing. This draft Order is being considered under the Government of Wales Act 1998, but the equivalent Order for the next elections—and I am sure that Mike will be interested in this—will be made under section 16 of the Government of Wales Act 2006, and that requires the draft to be approved by resolution of the Assembly. Therefore, that will provide us with the opportunity again. I urge you to support the motion and to reject the amendment.

yn un arall. Credaf y byddai pobl yn cytuno ar y cyfan fod y meini prawf hyn yn rhesymol ac nad ydynt yn amhriodol o gyfyngus.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi pleidio fy achos ynghylch y ffaith ein bod wedi defnyddio'r weithdrefn hon o'r blaen, yn 2003. Mater o amseru yw hyn. Caiff y Gorchymyn drafft hwn ei ystyried o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1988, ond caiff y Gorchymyn cyfatebol ar gyfer yr etholiadau nesaf—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan Mike ddiddordeb yn hyn—ei wneud o dan adran 16 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol cymeradwyo'r drafft drwy benderfyniad gan y Cynulliad. Felly, bydd hynny'n rhoi'r cyfle inni unwaith eto. Fe'ch anogaf i gefnogi'r cynnig a gwrthod y gwelliant.

*Gwelliant: O blaid 6, Ymatal 5, Yn erbyn 41.*

*Amendment: For 6, Abstain 5, Against 41.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

Unamended motion NDM3347: to propose that Cynnig NDM3347 heb ei ddiwygio: cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 12(7) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, requests that the Secretary of State for Wales recommend to Her Majesty in Council that the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 be made. The draft Order was laid in the Table Office on 21 November 2006.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 12(7) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn gofyn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru argymhell i'w Mawrhydi yn y Cyngor bod the National Assembly for Wales (Disqualification) Order 2006 yn cael ei wneud. Gosodwyd y Gorchymyn drafft yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM3347): O blaid 46, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM3347): For 46, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 German, Michael  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

5.20 p.m.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 5.20 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.20 p.m.*

### **Cynllun Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol The National Assembly's Disability Equality Scheme**

Motion (NDM3348): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3348): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. adopts the disability equality schemes of the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Welsh Assembly Government which together constitute the National Assembly for Wales's disability equality scheme; and*

*1. yn mabwysiadu cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn creu cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru; a*

*2. recognises and is grateful for the help and support provided by the Disability Rights Commission, Disability Wales, and the individuals and organisations involved in the production of the scheme.*

*2. yn cydnabod y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth a gafwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, Anabledd Cymru a'r unigolion a'r mudiadau a fu'n rhan o'r gwaith o gynhyrchu'r cynllun hwn, ac yn ddiolchgar am hynny.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make provision for the training of public sector managers in how to mainstream the disability equality duty.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure the disability equality duty is at the core of its funding strategies.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Before I call the Minister, I remind Members that there is no longer a cut-off time, as there is no short debate. However, we are running late, and Members who manage to make short and succinct speeches today will have a much better chance of catching my eye on another occasion. Given that this is an important matter, I will not impose a three-minute time limit on speakers.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose the following motion in my name and the name of William Graham. I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. adopts the disability equality schemes of the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Welsh Assembly Government which together constitute the National Assembly for Wales's disability equality scheme; and*

*2. recognises and is grateful for the help and support provided by the Disability Rights Commission, Disability Wales, and the individuals and organisations involved in the production of the scheme. (NDM3348)*

I am happy to present for adoption the Welsh Assembly Government's first disability equality scheme. The scheme sets out our

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu ar gyfer hyfforddi rheolwyr y sector cyhoeddus ynghylch sut i brif ffrydio'r ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl wrth wraidd ei strategaethau cyllido.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau nad oes terfyn amser mwyach, am nad oes dadl fer. Fodd bynnag, mae hi'n hwyr, a bydd yr Aelodau sy'n llwyddo i wneud areithiau byr a chryno heddiw lawer yn fwy tebygol o ddal fy sylw rywbryd arall. Gan fod y mater hwn yn un pwysig, ni orfodaf derfyn amser o dair munud ar siaradwyr.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau y cynnig canlynol yn fy enw i ac enw William Graham. Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn mabwysiadu cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl Anabl Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn creu cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl Anabl Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru; a*

*2. yn cydnabod y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth a gafwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, Anabledd Cymru a'r unigolion a'r mudiadau a fu'n rhan o'r gwaith o gynhyrchu'r cynllun hwn, ac yn ddiolchgar am hynny. (NDM3348)*

Yr wyf yn falch cyflwyno, i'w fabwysiadu, gynllun cydraddoldeb cyntaf Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i bobl anabl. Mae'r cynllun



commitment to mainstreaming disability equality in everything that we do by developing systems and structures that will enable us to deliver policies that promote equality for disabled people, both in our role as an employer and as the Government of Wales. The scheme is a living document and we will update it as we review our progress towards achieving our commitments to ensure the best outcomes for disabled people in Wales.

One of the statutory requirements of developing a disability equality scheme is to involve disabled people. In April this year, we took our first steps towards involvement by running a series of engagement events in partnership with the Assembly Parliamentary Service. We involved Disability Wales and the Disability Rights Commission in helping us to reach out to disabled people, bringing them to the meetings to ensure that as many people as possible—individuals, and representatives of disability organisations—were involved in those events held in Mold, Aberystwyth and Cardiff. That was particularly important given that, on 4 December 2005, the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 extended the definition of disability to include, among others, people with HIV/AIDS, cancer or multiple sclerosis, effectively from the point of diagnosis, and removed the requirement for mental illness to be clinically well recognised.

At all those events, we asked disabled people what the important issues were for them and how we could address them, as an Assembly Government. We produced a summary report as a result, which was sent to all the people who attended the events, to public bodies in Wales, and to all of our Assembly Government equality champions across departments, who took the issues into account when they developed their departmental action plans, which form part of our disability equality scheme. I have no doubt that involving disabled people in the development of our scheme has enabled us to better identify and prioritise areas for action. This is not a one-off event; it is part of an ongoing process of engagement. We have established a critical friends group, made up

yn amlinellu ein hymrwymiad i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl ym mhopeth a wnawn drwy ddatblygu systemau a strwythurau a fydd yn ein galluogi i gyflwyno polisiau sy'n hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, yn ein rôl fel cyflogwr ac fel Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'r cynllun yn ddogfen fyw, a byddwn yn ei diweddarau wrth inni adolygu ein cynnydd tuag at gyflawni ein hymrwymadau i sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau i bobl anabl yng Nghymru.

Un o ofynion statudol datblygu cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yw cynnwys pobl anabl. Ym mis Ebrill eleni, cymerwyd ein camau cyntaf tuag at eu cynnwys drwy gynnal cyfres o ddigwyddiadau ymgysylltu mewn partneriaeth â Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Cynhwyswyd Anabledd Cymru a'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd i'n helpu i ymgysylltu â phobl anabl, gan ddod â hwy i'r cyfarfodydd er mwyn sicrhau bod cynifer o bobl â phosibl—unigolion, a chynrychiolwyr sefydliadau anabledd—yn cymryd rhan yn y digwyddiadau hynny a gynhaliwyd yn yr Wyddgrug, Aberystwyth a Chaerdydd. Yr oedd hynny'n bwysig iawn o gofio bod y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 2005, ar 4 Rhagfyr 2005, wedi ehangu'r diffiniad o anabledd i gynnwys, ymhlith eraill, pobl â HIV/AIDS, canser neu sglerosis ymledol, o adeg y diagnosis i bob diben, a dileu'r gofyniad i salwch meddwl gael ei gydnabod yn glinigol.

Yn yr holl ddigwyddiadau hynny, holwyd pobl anabl am y materion sy'n bwysig iddynt a sut y gallem fynd i'r afael â hwy, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Lluniwyd adroddiad cryno gennym o ganlyniad i hynny, a anfonwyd at bawb a fu yn y digwyddiadau, at gyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac at holl hyrwyddwyr cydraddoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar draws adrannau. Ystyriodd y rheini y materion wrth ddatblygu eu cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol, sy'n rhan o'n cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Yr wyf yn sicr fod cynnwys pobl anabl yn y gwaith o ddatblygu ein cynllun wedi ein galluogi i nodi a blaenoriaethu meysydd gweithredu yn well. Nid digwyddiad unigryw mohono; mae'n rhan o broses ymgysylltu barhaus. Yr ydym

of representatives of national disability organisations, and we plan to set up an expert advisory panel that will support us in the impact assessment of our policies and in policy development. We will hold events every year for disabled people around Wales, and we will make contact with hard-to-reach groups, who, up to now, may not have had the opportunity to make their voices heard.

The key test of the disability duty and, by extension, our scheme, will be in delivering real outcomes and practical improvements in the day-to-day lives and experiences of disabled people. That requires leadership, with a clear and genuine commitment from the top of the organisation to fulfil the actions that are set down in the scheme and the departmental action plans. Those action plans demonstrate the commitment of my colleagues to the scheme. I wish to mention one important development, which is the secondary legislation that Carwyn Jones is bringing forward that will require access statements to accompany applications for planning permission and listed building consent in Wales. Those statements have to be submitted when applications for planning permission are put forward.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sorry to interrupt you, Business Minister, but only one Member should be standing at any one time.

**Jane Hutt:** To give Members a flavour of the other key strategic actions, we are producing training and awareness-raising materials on disability equality for teachers, schools and local education authorities; we are providing £3 million in funding over the next three years to support 15 projects for disabled people to provide community transport; we are conducting a patient equalities monitoring project, which will also help to assess the impact of health service delivery on disabled people; and we are developing a combined equality impact assessment, which will be used to help us to ensure that equality issues become a fundamental part of the policy-making process.

I am happy to support both the Liberal

wedi sefydlu grŵp o gyfeillion beirniadol, sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr sefydliadau anabled cenedlaethol, a bwriadwn sefydlu panel cyngori arbenigol a fydd yn ein helpu i asesu effaith ein polisiau a'u datblygu. Byddwn yn cynnal digwyddiadau bob blwyddyn i bobl anabl ledled Cymru, a byddwn yn cysylltu â grwpiau anodd eu cyrraedd, sydd efallai, hyd yma, heb gael y cyfle i leisio'u barn.

Prawf allweddol y ddyletswydd i bobl anabl, a'n cynllun, drwy ymestyn hynny, fydd sicrhau canlyniadau gwirioneddol a gwelliannau ymarferol ym mywydau a phrofiadau bob dydd pobl anabl. Mae hynny'n gofyn am arweinyddiaeth, gydag ymrwymiad clir a dilys ar frig y sefydliad i sicrhau'r camau gweithredu a nodir yn y cynllun a'r cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol. Dengys y cynlluniau gweithredu hynny ymrwymiad fy nghyd-Aelodau i'r cynllun. Hoffwn sôn am un datblygiad pwysig, sef y ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd y mae Carwyn Jones yn ei chyflwyno ac a fydd yn gofyn am ddatganiadau hygyrchedd gyda cheisiadau am ganiatâd cynllunio a chaniatâd adeilad rhestredig yng Nghymru. Rhaid cyflwyno'r datganiadau hynny pan gyflwynir ceisiadau am ganiatâd cynllunio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar eich traws, Drefnydd, ond dim ond un aelod a ddylai fod ar ei draed ar yr un pryd.

**Jane Hutt:** I roi rhagflas i'r Aelodau o'r camau strategol allweddol eraill, yr ydym yn llunio deunyddiau hyfforddiant ac yn cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth ym maes cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl ar gyfer athrawon, ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol; byddwn yn darparu £3 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gefnogi 15 o brosiectau i bobl anabl i ddarparu cludiant yn y gymuned; byddwn yn cynnal prosiect monitro cydraddoldeb cleifion, a fydd hefyd yn helpu asesu effaith darparu gwasanaeth iechyd ar bobl anabl; a byddwn yn datblygu asesiad cyfunol o effaith ar gydraddoldeb, a ddefnyddir i'n helpu i sicrhau bod materion cydraddoldeb yn dod yn rhan sylfaenol o'r broses o lunio polisiau.

Yr wyf yn falch cefnogi gwelliannau'r

Democrat amendments. The first is very much in the spirit of what we are trying to achieve. As well as the general duty under the Disability Discrimination Act 2005, the majority of public authorities will also be subject to the specific duties that require them to produce a disability equality scheme. That includes a demonstration of a commitment to train staff on the requirements of the duty. Each public authority in Wales will make its own commitment to this.

Amendment 2 is also in the spirit of what we are doing; indeed, we are required to do it by section 120 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, and the Assembly Government will continue to do so under the new Government of Wales Act 2006. We will report regularly on the actions that we have taken in our annual report on equalities.

The scheme, together with the Assembly Parliamentary Service's disability equality scheme, covers all of the functions currently exercised by the National Assembly for Wales, on which the duty to promote disability equality is currently placed. It must be a catalyst to effect change throughout our organisation and enable us to be an exemplar throughout the public sector in Wales. I thank everyone for their contributions. That is my commitment.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make provision for the training of public sector managers in how to mainstream the disability equality duty.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'r cyntaf yn adlewyrchu'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni. Yn ogystal â'r ddyletswydd gyffredinol o dan y Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 2005, bydd y mwyafrif o awdurdodau cyhoeddus hefyd yn ddarostyngedig i'r dyletswyddau penodol sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt lunio cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Mae hynny'n cynnwys dangos eu hymrwymiad i hyfforddi staff am ofynion y ddyletswydd. Bydd pob awdurdod cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn gwneud ei ymrwymiad ei hun i hyn.

Mae gwelliant 2 hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud; yn wir, mae'n ofynnol inni ei wneud o dan adran 120 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, a bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i wneud hynny o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru newydd 2006. Yn ein hadroddiad blynyddol ar gydraddoldebau byddwn yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd am y camau yr ydym wedi eu cymryd.

Mae'r cynllun, ynghyd â chynllun cydraddoldeb Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad i bobl anabl, yn cynnwys yr holl swyddogaethau a gyflawnir gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar hyn o bryd, sef y rhai y mae'r ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yn seiliedig arnynt ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid i'r cynllun ysgogi newid drwy ein sefydliad benbaladr, a'n galluogi i fod yn esiampl drwy'r sector cyhoeddus i gyd yng Nghymru. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau. Dyna yw fy ymrwymiad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu ar gyfer hyfforddi rheolwyr y sector cyhoeddus ynghylch sut i brif ffrydio'r ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure the disability equality duty is at the core of its funding strategies.*

The Government and the National Assembly together have a pivotal role as a policy instigator, a driver and a funder in relation to disability equality issues. As a party, we welcome the scheme and the compliance with that duty. We also welcome the commitment to move disability equality further into Government policies, actions and funding. However, I am sure that the Minister would be the first to say that we all have a very long road to travel. Our amendment 1 is designed to ensure that the training of public sector managers is undertaken so that the disability equality issue is thoroughly mainstreamed throughout organisations. Of course, mainstreaming, in itself, implies a duty to train.

The disability equality scheme will remain merely a written document rather than a living, effective document if training and education on its requirements are not provided, and provided in a thorough manner. The training provided to public sector officers must show the relevance of this duty to their work. One of the key issues is the number of people who say that this duty is not relevant to their work, but, in reality, there are very few people who could truly say that it is not relevant to their work. There is a danger that people in some positions will simply keep their heads down and say that this does not apply to them; our purpose is to ensure that everyone thinks that it applies to them.

On amendment 2, placing this duty at the core of funding strategies is the quickest and most effective way of demonstrating that the Government is serious about mainstreaming equality of opportunity for disabled people. In the scheme, for example, the Government simply says that it will consider this duty in its funding strategies. I remind everyone that, a few weeks ago, on a cross-party basis, we threatened to reject England and Wales regulations as part of the equal pay legislation, because they had been watered down so that they required public sector

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl wrth wraidd ei strategaethau cyllido.*

Mae gan y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gyda'i gilydd, rôl hanfodol fel anogwr, llywiwr ac ariannwr polisi mewn materion cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Fel plaid, croesawn y cynllun a'r cydymffurfio â'r ddyletswydd honno. Croesawn hefyd yr ymrwymiad i gynnwys cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yn fwy ym mholisiau, gweithredoedd a systemau ariannu'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr mai'r Gweinidog fyddai'r cyntaf i ddweud bod gennym i gyd lawer iawn i'w wneud eto. Bwriedir i welliant 1 sicrhau bod rheolwyr y sector cyhoeddus yn cael eu hyfforddi er mwyn i gydraddoldeb i bobl anabl gael ei brif ffrydio drwy'r sefydliadau i gyd. Wrth gwrs, mae prif ffrydio, ynddo'i hun, yn awgrymu dyletswydd i hyfforddi.

Bydd y cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yn dal yn ddogfen ysgrifenedig yn unig yn hytrach na dogfen fyw, effeithiol os na caiff hyfforddiant ac addysg am ei ofynion eu darparu, a hynny'n drylwyr. Rhaid i'r hyfforddiant a roddir i swyddogion y sector cyhoeddus ddangos perthnasedd y ddyletswydd hon i'w gwaith. Un o'r materion allweddol yw nifer y bobl sy'n dweud nad yw'r ddyletswydd hon yn berthnasol i'w gwaith. Ond mewn gwirionedd, ychydig iawn o bobl a allai ddweud yn wirioneddol nad yw'n berthnasol i'w gwaith. Mae yna berygl y bydd pobl mewn rhai swyddi yn ceisio osgoi hyn ac yn dweud nad yw'n gymwys iddynt; ein gwaith ni sicrhau bod pawb yn credu bod hyn yn gymwys iddynt.

O ran gwelliant 2, gosod y ddyletswydd hon wrth wraidd strategaethau ariannu yw'r ffordd gyflymaf a mwyaf effeithiol i ddangos bod y Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch prif ffrydio cyfle cyfartal i bobl anabl. Yn y cynllun, er enghraifft, dywed y Llywodraeth yn syml y bydd yn ystyried y ddyletswydd hon yn ei strategaethau ariannu. Hoffwn atgoffa pawb, ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, ar sail drawsbleidiol, ein bod wedi bygwth gwrthod rheoliadau Cymru a Lloegr fel rhan o'r ddeddfwriaeth cyflog cyfartal, am eu bod wedi eu glastwreiddio fel eu bod yn ei

organisations simply 'to consider' some aspects of equal pay. Yet, here we are, taking a relatively weak approach to this issue—in this case, in relation to disabled people. It is important that funding strategies fit in with Government and Assembly strategy and commitments. For example, where did the disability equality strategy and the commitment to it fit in to the Government's decision not to introduce free homecare for disabled people? Putting equality at the heart of your funding strategies will create some serious issues, which must be answered.

gwneud yn ofynnol i sefydliadau'r sector cyhoeddus 'ystyried' rhai agweddau ar gyflog cyfartal yn unig. Eto, dyma ni, yn mabwysiadu agwedd ddigon gwan at y mater hwn—mewn perthynas â phobl anabl yn yr achos hwn. Mae'n bwysig i strategaethau ariannu weddu i strategaeth ac ymrwymadau'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad. Er enghraifft, sut yr oedd y strategaeth cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl a'r ymrwymiad iddi yn gweddu i benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i beidio â darparu gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl? Bydd gosod cydraddoldeb wrth wraidd eich strategaethau ariannu yn creu rhai problemau difrifol y mae'n rhaid eu datrys.

5.30 p.m.

I will refer briefly to the equality audit that will be produced next year. Can the Minister tell us when next year that will be produced? There are serious issues, and I know that the DRC has serious concerns about the lack of good quality and sufficient statistics. Better statistics—and the Government has a commitment to ensuring better statistics—are essential if we are to be able to measure where we are, and therefore put in place better schemes to ensure that the situation improves.

Cyfeiriai yn gryno at yr archwiliad cydraddoldeb a gynhyrchir y flwyddyn nesaf. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pryd y flwyddyn nesaf y caiff ei gynhyrchu? Mae yna faterion difrifol, a gwn fod y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn pryderu'n fawr iawn am ddiffyg ystadegau digonol o safon. Mae gwell ystadegau—ac mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau gwell ystadegau—yn hanfodol er mwyn inni allu mesur ein sefyllfa, ac felly roi cynlluniau gwell ar waith i sicrhau bod y sefyllfa yn gwella.

Finally, on departmental action plans, the DRC has concerns about these producing a silo approach, which does not sit well with the commitment towards citizen-centred public services. I hope, Minister, that you will take on board that criticism and ensure that there is a cross-departmental approach. These amendments are designed to bridge the gap between rhetoric and reality throughout public life in Wales, and to ensure that we do not just say fine words, but put money where it counts.

Yn olaf, o ran cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol, mae'r Comisiwn yn pryderu y byddant yn arwain at ddull seilo, nad yw'n gydnaws â'r ymrwymiad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd. Gobeithio, Weinidog, yr ystyriwch y feirniadaeth honno ac y sicrhewch ddull trawsadrannol. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn wedi'u cynllunio i gau'r bwlch rhwng rhethreg a realiti ym mhob maes mewn bywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac i sicrhau nad llefaru geiriau coeth yn unig yr ydym, ond yn darparu arian lle mae hynny'n cyfrif.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae'n bleser gennyf gyfrannu at y ddadl hon fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae'n rhaid cofio bod Jenny Randerson yn aelod o'r pwyllgor hwn.

**Gwenda Thomas:** It is a pleasure to contribute to this debate as Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. We must remember that Jenny Randerson is a member of that committee.

Edrychodd y pwyllgor ar y cynllun yn ei gyfarfod ar 25 Hydref. Yr oedd yn dda gennym weld bod gwersi gwerthfawr wedi eu

The committee considered the scheme in its meeting on 25 October. We were pleased to see that valuable lessons had been learned

dysgu o'r ffordd y datblygwyd cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y Cynulliad. Teimlwn fod y gwersi hyn wedi arwain at gynllun a drefnwyd yn dda, ac a ddatblygwyd mewn cydweithrediad â'r rhanddeiliaid perthnasol. Yr ydym yn llongyfarch y rhai a fu'n rhan o ddatblygu'r cynllun hwn, sydd â nodau realistig a chyraeddadwy.

Yr oedd yn dda gennym glywed bod cefnogaeth lawn y Cabinet gan gynllun Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac iddo gael ei ddefnyddio wrth ddatblygu cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol. Canmolwyd ymarferoldeb y cynllun cyfan gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, a dywedodd fod hyn yn wahanol i'w brofiad yn Whitehall, a bod y cynllun wedi'i ddatblygu ymhellach na dim arall a welwyd ganddo. Un mater a nodwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd oedd ei fod yn siomedig ynglŷn â'r diffyg eglurder yn y cynlluniau ynghylch ble yr oedd rhanddeiliaid wedi dylanwadu ar y gweithredu arfaethedig. Yr wyf siŵr y rhoir ystyriaeth i hyn wrth adnewyddu'r cynllun.

We would also like to see an evaluation of the need for formal qualifications for the majority of the posts advertised externally in the Assembly. We feel that the emphasis on formal qualifications could discriminate against some sectors of the disabled community that have not had the opportunity to study in the same way as their able-bodied counterparts.

I take this opportunity to raise an issue that the DRC spoke about at our meeting. The Assembly is justly proud of the number of AMs who are women, but makes no reference to the significant number of AMs who would be defined as having a disability under the Disability Discrimination Acts.

To conclude, we are pleased with the scheme, and we hope that it will produce positive and tangible results for people with a disability throughout Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will not speak at length because, as the committee Chair rightly said, we have had an opportunity to discuss this at length in committee, and there are Members who have not had that opportunity.

from the way in which the Assembly's racial equality scheme was developed. We feel that these lessons had led to a well organised scheme developed in collaboration with the relevant stakeholders. We congratulate those involved in developing this scheme, which has realistic and achievable aims.

We were pleased to hear that the Welsh Assembly Government scheme has the full support of the Cabinet, and that it was used in developing departmental action plans. The practicality of the whole scheme was praised by the Disability Rights Commission, and it said that this was different from its experience in Whitehall, and that the scheme had been developed further than any other that it had seen. One matter which the commission noted was that it was disappointed with the lack of clarity in the schemes regarding where stakeholders had influenced the proposed actions. I am sure that consideration will be given to this when the scheme is renewed.

Hoffem hefyd weld gwerthusiad o'r angen am gymwysterau ffurfiol ar gyfer y rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi a hysbysebir yn allanol yn y Cynulliad. Teimlwn y gallai'r pwyslais ar gymwysterau ffurfiol wahaniaethu yn erbyn rhai sectorau yn y gymuned anabl nad ydynt wedi cael y cyfle i astudio yn yr un ffordd â'u cyfoedion abl.

Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i godi mater y soniodd y Comisiwn amdano yn ein cyfarfod. Mae'r Cynulliad yn haeddiannol falch o nifer yr ACau sy'n fenywod, ond nid yw'n cyfeirio at y nifer sylweddol o ACau a fyddai'n cael eu diffinio fel unigolion ag anabledd o dan y Deddfau Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd.

I gloi, yr ydym yn falch o'r cynllun, a gobeithiwn y bydd yn cynhyrchu canlyniadau cadarnhaol a diriaethol i bobl ag anabledd ledled Cymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni fyddaf yn faith oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn hollol gywir, cawsom gyfle i drafod y mater yn fanwl yn y pwyllgor, ac mae yna Aelodau nad ydynt wedi cael y cyfle

hwnnw.

I will make a few remarks on the Government's scheme. Gwenda Thomas is right to say that this scheme demonstrates progress. Anyone involved in the fiasco that was the drawing up of the Assembly's first race equality scheme, which reached the point when the Assembly was almost in breach of the law—indeed, it would have been in breach, had the Commission for Racial Equality chosen to take action—can see how far we have come, and how far the Government has come. I think that this reflects the Minister's decision to strengthen the equality policy unit, which we very much value. There is evidence in this scheme of improved understanding in some Government divisions. However, there is still a lot to do, Minister.

It is stated that the scheme is a living document, and I will put some points to the Minister that I have raised with her previously about how we might progress the work of the scheme in future and ensure that it remains a living document. I hope that the Minister will accept that the scheme shows that there is a difference in understanding among divisions. As Jenny Randerson said, there are some divisions that clearly understand the relevance of the scheme to their work, and there are others whose understanding of its relevance is less clear. At this stage, it might be invidious to name and shame those divisions that I feel have a long way to go, but I reserve the right to do so, if we do not see progress in future. I hope that the Minister will acknowledge that, and that it will take real leadership to change that—both political leadership from the relevant Ministers and professional leadership from senior civil servants. Can the Minister say something in her response to this debate about how she will work with her Cabinet colleagues to improve understanding in those divisions that still have a long way to go, and to improve their ability to deliver?

Much of the scheme sets out what Government divisions will do. This may be acceptable at this stage, but, in future, I hope

Gwnaf rai sylwadau am gynllun y Llywodraeth. Mae Gwenda Thomas yn llygad ei lle wrth ddweud bod y cynllun hwn yn arwydd o gynnydd. Bydd unrhyw un a fu'n rhan o'r anhrefn o lunio cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol cyntaf y Cynulliad, a gyrhaeddodd sefyllfa lle yr oedd y Cynulliad bron â thorri'r gyfraith—yn wir, byddai wedi gwneud hynny pe bai'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol wedi penderfynu gweithredu—yn gallu gweld y cynnydd hwnnw, a'r cynnydd a wnaed gan y Llywodraeth. Credaf fod hyn yn adlewyrchu penderfyniad y Gweinidog i atgyfnerthu'r uned polisi cydraddoldeb yr ydym yn ei gwerthfawrogi'n fawr. Mae yna dystiolaeth yn y cynllun hwn o well dealltwriaeth yn rhai o isadrannau'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd, Weinidog.

Dywedir bod y cynllun yn ddogfen fyw, a chyflwynaf rai pwyntiau i'r Gweinidog yr wyf wedi'u codi gyda hi o'r blaen am y ffordd y gallem ddatblygu gwaith y cynllun yn y dyfodol a sicrhau ei bod yn parhau'n ddogfen fyw. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn bod y cynllun yn dangos bod gwahaniaeth dealltwriaeth ymhlith isadrannau. Fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson, mae rhai isadrannau'n amlwg yn deall perthnasedd y cynllun i'w gwaith, ac mae eraill nad yw eu dealltwriaeth o'i berthnasedd mor eglur. Ar hyn o bryd, hwyrach na fyddai'n ddymunol enwi a chodi cywilydd ar yr isadrannau hynny sydd â llawer i'w wneud o hyd, yn fy marn i, ond cadwaf yr hawl i wneud hynny oni welwn gynnydd yn y dyfodol. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod hynny, a'r ffaith y bydd angen arweinyddiaeth go iawn i'w newid—arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol gan y Gweinidogion perthnasol ac arweinyddiaeth broffesiynol gan uwch weision sifil. A all y Gweinidog ddweud rhywbeth yn ei hymateb i'r ddadl hon am y ffordd y bydd yn gweithio gyda'i chyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet i wella dealltwriaeth yn yr isadrannau hynny sydd â llawer i'w wneud o hyd, ac i wella eu gallu i gyflawni?

Mae llawer o'r cynllun yn gosod allan yr hyn y bydd isadrannau'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud. Efallai fod hyn yn dderbyniol ar hyn

that the Minister will agree that we need to measure not simply what is done, although that may be welcome in itself, but what difference those actions make. Chapter 5 of the scheme begins:

‘Our Scheme will achieve real outcomes and deliver real improvements for disabled people’.

Well, I should hope so. However, we will not know whether that is being done unless we start measuring outcomes—real changes, not outputs and well-intentioned actions.

Plaid Cymru will support the adoption of the scheme today and the entirely sensible amendments from the Liberal Democrats, but I repeat what I have said to the Minister previously. The scheme needs, in future, to set out clear, measurable and timed targets, setting out what will change for disabled people and when as a result of what each division does, and setting out the consequences for those divisions that do not deliver. Disabled people should not only expect words, which they have had for a long time, and action—they have now reached the point when they should expect change, and they deserve no less.

**Mark Isherwood:** The Conservative group will support both amendments. It is timely that we are debating the National Assembly’s disability equality scheme today, given that Sunday sees the twenty-fifth International Day of Disabled Persons and that 4 December sees the commencing of amended legislation making the disability equality duty compulsory. That is when the Disability Rights Commission will become an enforcement agency.

In mainstreaming equality for disabled people, we must integrate respect for the principles, strategies and practices of equality of opportunity into the everyday work of the National Assembly and other public bodies. We should also address the discrimination faced by carers on the grounds of their caring

o bryd, ond yn y dyfodol gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen inni fesur nid yn unig yr hyn a wneir, er bod hynny ynddo’i hun i’w groesawu, ond y gwahaniaeth y mae’r camau hynny’n ei wneud. Mae Pennod 5 yn y cynllun yn cychwyn fel hyn:

Bydd ein cynllun yn darparu canlyniadau gwirioneddol ac yn sicrhau gwelliannau gwirioneddol i bobl anabl.

Wel, bydd, gobeithio. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn gwybod a yw hynny’n digwydd oni ddechrewn fesur canlyniadau—newidiadau gwirioneddol, nid allbwn a chamau gweithredu a bwriadau da.

Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi’r cynnig i fabwysiadu’r cynllun heddiw a’r gwelliannau cwbl synhwyrol gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais wrth y Gweinidog o’r blaen. Yn y dyfodol, mae angen i’r cynllun osod allan dargedau clir, mesuradwy gyda therfynau amser, gosod allan yr hyn a fydd yn newid i bobl anabl a phryd o ganlyniad i’r hyn y bydd pob isadran yn ei wneud, ac yn gosod allan y canlyniadau i’r isadrannau hynny na fyddant yn llwyddo. Dylai pobl anabl ddisgwyl mwy na geiriau, fel y maent wedi’u clywed ers amser maith, a gweithredu—maent bellach wedi cyrraedd y pwynt lle y dylent ddisgwyl newid, ac maent yn llawn haeddu hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi’r ddau welliant. Mae’n amserol inni fod yn cynnal dadl ar gynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heddiw, o gofio y bydd hi’n bumed Diwrnod Rhyngwladol ar hugain i Bobl Anabl ddydd Sul, ac y bydd deddfwriaeth ddiwygiedig i wneud y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl yn orfodol yn cychwyn ar 4 Rhagfyr. Dyna pryd y daw’r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn asiantaeth orfodi.

Wrth brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, rhaid inni integreiddio parch at egwyddorion, strategaethau ac arferion cyfle cyfartal yng ngwaith beunyddiol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill. Dylem hefyd ymdrin â’r gwahaniaethu a wynebwr gan ofalwyr ar sail eu cyfrifoldeb



responsibility. It is of concern that the summary of engagement meetings involving disabled people indicated that most public servants are still unaware of the social model of disability, or fail to understand it. That must be addressed if we are to ensure that all public bodies are doing all that they can to avoid disabling people.

We must be particularly concerned by the finding that disabled people in north Wales feel detached from the Assembly and would welcome more time and resources devoted to identifying and addressing their needs. This reflects the feeling among the wider population in north Wales. We must be concerned that access to education and training premises for disabled people is still inadequate and, reflecting issues that have been repeatedly raised by me and others in the Chamber, we must be particularly concerned that the Assembly Government's NHS reconfiguration plan, 'Designed for Life', does not appear to take account of the much greater difficulty faced by disabled people in travelling to more remote hospitals.

The Assembly Governments before and after May 2007 must respond to the areas of potential weakness identified by the Disability Rights Commission, which states that concerns over social care provision are the highest profile disability issue in Wales at present. This is particularly so given the proposals by some local authorities to reduce the levels of social care provision or to withdraw it. My discussions with council leaders and chief executives make it clear that this is the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government.

The Disability Rights Commission raises concerns about departmental action plans that do not address cross-departmental issues, highlighting in particular the issue of independent living. The Assembly Government should therefore proof its policies with regard to independent living. There is also a danger that departmental action plans can ignore initiatives in one area that can reap benefits in another, for example, we learned that placing more social workers in hospitals and ensuring better co-ordinated home care provision could lead to savings in

gofalu. Mae'n bryderus fod y crynodeb o'r cyfarfodydd ymgysylltu â phobl anabl yn dweud nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o weision sifil yn ymwybodol o hyd o'r model anabledd cymdeithasol, neu eu bod yn methu â'i ddeall. Rhaid inni ymdrin â hynny os ydym i sicrhau bod pob corff cyhoeddus yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei allu i osgoi anablu pobl.

Rhaid inni bryderu'n arbennig am y darganfyddiad bod pobl anabl yn y gogledd yn teimlo nad oes cyswllt rhyngddynt â'r Cynulliad, a byddem yn croesawu mwy o amser ac adnoddau i nodi eu hanghenion ac ymdrin â hwy. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu'r ymdeimlad ymhlith poblogaeth ehangach y gogledd. Rhaid inni bryderu bod mynediad i ganolfannau addysg a hyfforddiant i bobl anabl yn annigonol o hyd, a chan adlewyrchu materion a godwyd droeon gennyf fi ac eraill yn y Siambr, rhaid inni bryderu'n arbennig nad yw cynllun ailgyflunio'r GIG gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Cynllun Oes', i'w weld yn ystyried yr anhawster llawer mwy sy'n wynebu pobl anabl wrth deithio i ysbytai mwy anghysbell.

Rhaid i Lywodraethau'r Cynulliad cyn mis Mai 2007 ac wedyn ymateb i'r meysydd gwendid posibl a nodwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, sy'n dweud mai pryderon ynghylch y ddarpariaeth gofal cymdeithasol yw'r mater anabledd sydd â'r proffil uchaf yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir o gofio'r cynigion gan rai awdurdodau lleol i leihau lefelau'r ddarpariaeth gofal cymdeithasol neu i'w diddymu. Mae fy nhrafodaethau gydag arweinwyr cynghorau a phrif weithredwyr yn gwneud yn glir mai cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw hynny.

Mae'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn codi pryderon ynghylch cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol nad ydynt yn ymdrin â materion trawsadrannol, gan dynnu sylw'n arbennig at fater byw'n annibynnol. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad felly ystyried ei pholisïau ar fyw'n annibynnol. Mae perygl hefyd y gall cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol anwybyddu mentrau mewn un maes a all ddwyn ffrwyth mewn maes arall. Er enghraifft, gwelsom y gallai gosod mwy o weithwyr cymdeithasol mewn ysbytai a sicrhau darpariaeth gofal cartref wedi'i chydlynu'n well arwain at

health budgets through the freeing-up of beds.

arbedion mewn cyllidebau iechyd drwy ryddhau gwelyau.

5.40 p.m.

As the Disability Rights Commission also states, the Wales Audit Office should also have been mentioned in the scheme. Disabled people must be involved in discussions about the scheme, but the Disability Rights Commission highlights concern that it is not always clear how these discussions have had a bearing on the scheme and its delivery. It also notes that little mention is made of mandatory training provision for staff to undertake impact assessments. In committee, I further noted the absence of reference to the involvement of consultees in training—local disability fora have told me that they would be keen to be involved in staff awareness training locally. In committee, I highlighted the need not only for performance measures, but for performance management measures, as part of an ongoing and systematic process to identify what is working well and what action is needed to address those areas where improvements are still needed. In other words, we need a process, rather than just a plan. This reflects the concerns of the Disability Rights Commission that little mention is made of reflecting deliverable priorities in staff's performance management objectives and targets. I also raised in committee the need for positive action not only to deliver equality in recruitment, but to develop people's skills and qualifications once they were employed. The response that I have received suggests that there is still a failure to understand the meaning of positive action in respect of the most excluded groups. We must also address the unintentional, but systematic barriers to flexibility that, for example, prevent people in Wales with HIV/AIDS from being referred to the Tyddyn Bach respite centre in Penmaenmawr—whereas people with HIV/AIDS in England can be referred to the only respite centre left in England or Wales—and which prevent the new residential facilities at Ysgol Plasbrondyffryn for children with an autistic spectrum disorder from preparing to open, despite the premises being ready for use. We need that sort of flexibility to deliver the outcomes that we all want.

Fel y dywed y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd hefyd, dylid bod wedi cyfeirio at Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn y cynllun. Rhaid i bobl anabl fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau am y cynllun, ond mae'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn tynnu sylw at bryder nad yw bob amser yn eglur sut y cafodd y trafodaethau hynny effaith ar y cynllun a'r ffordd y caiff ei ddarparu. Dywed hefyd nad oes llawer o sôn am ddarparu hyfforddiant gorfodol i staff allu gwneud asesiadau effaith. Yn y pwyllgor, sylwais hefyd nad oedd sôn am gynnwys pobl yr ymgynghorir â hwy mewn hyfforddiant—mae fforymau anabledd lleol wedi dweud wrthyf y byddent yn awyddus i gymryd rhan mewn hyfforddiant ymwybyddiaeth staff yn lleol. Yn y pwyllgor, tynnais sylw at yr angen nid yn unig am fesurau perfformiad, ond am fesurau rheoli perfformiad, fel rhan o broses barhaus a systematig i nodi'r hyn sy'n gweithio'n dda a'r camau y mae eu hangen i ymdrin â'r meysydd hynny lle mae angen gwelliannau o hyd. Hynny yw, mae arnom angen proses, yn hytrach na chynllun syml. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu pryderon y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd nad oes llawer o sôn am adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau y gellir eu cyflawni mewn amcanion a thargedau rheoli perfformiad staff. Codais yn y pwyllgor hefyd yr angen am gymryd camau cadarnhaol nid yn unig i sicrhau cydraddoldeb ym maes recriwtio, ond i ddatblygu sgiliau a chymwysterau pobl ar ôl eu cyflogi. Mae'r ymateb a gefais yn awgrymu bod methiant o hyd i ddeall ystyr gweithredu cadarnhaol o ran y grwpiau sy'n cael eu hallgáu fwyaf. Rhaid inni hefyd ymdrin â'r rhwystrau hyblygrwydd anfwriadol, ond systematig, sy'n atal pobl yng Nghymru sydd â HIV/AIDS, er enghraifft, rhag cael eu cyfeirio i ganolfan seibiant Tyddyn Bach ym Mhenmaen-mawr—ond gellir cyfeirio pobl yn Lloegr sydd â HIV/AIDS i'r unig ganolfan seibiant sydd ar ôl yng Nghymru neu Lloegr—ac sy'n atal y cyfleusterau preswyl newydd yn Ysgol Plasbrondyffryn i blant ag anhwylder sbectrwm awtistig rhag paratoi i agor, er eu bod yn barod i'w defnyddio. Mae angen y math hwnnw o hyblygrwydd arnom i

sicrhau'r canlyniadau yr ydym oll am eu gweld.

Despite estimates that one in five people in Wales have a disability, this section of society is still, too often, excluded. Too many disabled people are economically inactive. With the number of disabled people expected to rise as the population ages, we must push further—

Er gwaethaf amcangyfrifon fod un person o bob pump yng Nghymru yn anabl, caiff y rhan hon o gymdeithas, yn rhy aml, ei hallgáu o hyd. Mae gormod o bobl anabl yn economaidd anweithgar. Gan fod disgwyl y bydd nifer y bobl anabl yn cynyddu wrth i'r boblogaeth heneiddio, rhaid inni wthio ymhellach—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Mark Isherwood:** This will be my last sentence. We must push further by helping disabled people to lead independent lives, supporting carers, and by putting in the effort and investment needed to ensure real equality in the workplace.

**Mark Isherwood:** Hon fydd fy mrawddeg olaf. Rhaid inni wthio ymhellach drwy helpu pobl anabl i fyw bywydau annibynnol, drwy roi cymorth i ofalwyr, a thrwy ddarparu'r ymdrech a'r buddsoddiad angenrheidiol i sicrhau cydraddoldeb gwirioneddol yn y gweithle.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call the Minister to wind up the debate.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ddirwyn y ddadl i ben.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Thank you.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Diolch.

**William Graham** *rose*—

**William Graham** *a gododd*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sorry, were you trying to catch my eye, William? Minister, would you mind?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n flin gennyf, a oeddech yn ceisio dal fy llygad, William? Weinidog, ydych chi'n meindio?

**Jane Hutt:** Not at all.

**Jane Hutt:** Ddim o gwbl.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call William Graham.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar William Graham.

**William Graham:** I want to say something about the Assembly Parliamentary Service disability scheme and how we will be implementing it from December. Is it possible to do that?

**William Graham:** Yr oeddwn am sôn am gynllun anableded Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a sut y byddwn yn ei roi ar waith o fis Rhagfyr ymlaen. A fyddai hynny'n bosibl?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If it is in order, it is possible.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os yw mewn trefn, mae'n bosibl.

**William Graham:** Thank you very much. First, I express my gratitude to the members of the House Committee for electing me their chairman. It is a great privilege. I also acknowledge, John, your commitment to this most important step forward for APS, in

**William Graham:** Diolch yn fawr iawn. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn gyfleu fy niolch i aelodau Pwyllgor y Tŷ am fy ethol yn gadeirydd arnynt. Mae'n anrhydedd mawr. Hoffwn gydnabod hefyd, John, eich ymrwymiad i'r cam pwysig iawn hwn ymlaen i Wasanaeth

delivering a disability equality scheme. The Minister has kindly set out the Welsh Assembly Government's component of the overarching scheme and I will try to give some brief indication of the APS disability equality scheme.

There has been considerable involvement by our staff and disabled people in formulating our scheme. There has been a commendable attempt to involve as many staff as possible in the preparation of the scheme. This has been done in various ways, including an APS-wide competition, a survey of staff views, and awareness-raising sessions for members of the senior management team and groups of staff across the Assembly Parliamentary Service. Groups of staff were involved in the development of targets and tools to help assess the impact of the work that we are doing with disabled people, and equality leads were recruited in branches across APS to assess what we are really doing to promote equality for disabled people, to identify what we can do in the future, and to consider ways of involving more disabled people in the monitoring and shaping of the scheme. We hope that involving as many people as possible in planning action and in implementation will increase the likelihood of the scheme's making a difference in practice. In this way, we increase the awareness of staff about equality issues, while making the most of their expertise about their particular area of work.

With regard to disabled staff working in APS, we are aware that the number of staff who identify themselves as disabled in APS official records is an underrepresentation of those who would be covered by the disability equality scheme and legislation. The scheme will be sent to all staff for comment, along with an invitation to staff to identify themselves as disabled, if they so wish, and for those staff to contribute to a focus group. In involving staff in the development of an impact assessment tool, we also became aware that many non-disabled APS staff have an insight into disability through their relationship with disabled family members and friends. The Assembly Parliamentary Service has involved, and will continue to

Seneddol y Cynulliad, wrth gyflwyno cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Mae'r Gweinidog yn garedig wedi cyfeirio at ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y cynllun cyffredinol, a cheisiaf roi syniad bras o'r cynllun cydraddoldeb gan Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad i bobl anabl.

Yr oedd gan staff a phobl anabl gyfraniad helaeth wrth lunio ein cynllun. Gwnaed ymdrech glodwiw i gynnwys cynifer â phosibl o staff wrth baratoi'r cynllun. Gwnaed hyn mewn llawer ffordd, gan gynnwys cystadleuaeth drwy'r Gwasanaeth cyfan, arolwg o safbwyntiau staff, a sesiynau cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth i aelodau o'r uwch dîm rheoli a grwpiau staff o bob rhan o Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Bu grwpiau o staff yn rhan o'r gwaith o ddatblygu targedau a systemau i helpu asesu effaith y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda phobl anabl, a recriwtiwyd arweinwyr cydraddoldeb i ganghennau ym mhob rhan o'r Gwasanaeth i asesu'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud mewn gwirionedd i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl, i nodi'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn y dyfodol, ac i ystyried ffyrdd i gynnwys mwy o bobl anabl wrth fonitro a llunio'r cynllun. Gobeithiwn y bydd ein penderfyniad i gynnwys cynifer â phosibl o bobl wrth gynllunio camau gweithredu ac wrth weithredu yn cynyddu'r tebygolrwydd y bydd y cynllun yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ymarferol. Drwy hyn, yr ydym yn gwella ymwybyddiaeth staff o faterion cydraddoldeb, ac yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar eu harbenigedd yn eu maes gwaith penodol hwy.

O ran staff anabl sy'n gweithio yn y Gwasanaeth, yr ydym yn ymwybodol nad yw nifer y staff sy'n dweud eu bod yn anabl yng nghofnodion swyddogol y Gwasanaeth yn cynrychioli'r rheini a fyddai'n cael eu cynnwys gan y cynllun a'r ddeddfwriaeth cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl. Caiff y cynllun ei anfon at bob aelod staff er mwyn iddynt roi sylwadau, ynghyd â gwahoddiad i staff nodi eu bod yn anabl, os dymunant, ac i'r staff hynny gyfrannu at grŵp ffocws. Wrth gynnwys staff yn y broses o ddatblygu system asesu effaith, daethom yn ymwybodol hefyd fod gan nifer o staff y Gwasanaeth nad ydynt yn anabl eu hunain ddealltwriaeth o anabledd oherwydd eu perthynas ag aelodau o'r teulu a ffrindiau anabl. Mae Gwasanaeth

involve, disabled people.

The Disability Discrimination Act 2005, which introduced the equalities duty, requires us to involve disabled people in the production and monitoring of the scheme. We have involved disabled people in helping us to identify what we do well and where we can improve. These can be shown in a number of ways.

Disabled people were invited to attend four engagement events delivered in partnership with the Assembly Government in north, south and west Wales and suggest priorities for action for the Welsh Assembly Government and for the Assembly Parliamentary Service. A short survey of visitors to the Senedd is also being used in the exhibition centre and at Colwyn Bay visitor centre.

**Lorraine Barrett:** As a fellow member of the House Committee, I am concerned about disability awareness training for staff. Can you give an assurance that you will ensure that that training will continue for new staff, particularly those who work front of house in the Senedd? We are taking on many new staff, but it is important that we ensure that they all undergo disability awareness training, particularly those who deal with the public.

**William Graham:** That is an important point, and I am delighted to confirm that training will continue for all new staff to make them particularly aware of the issues when they are dealing with the general public and the way in which this splendid building is designed to accommodate disabled people, wherever possible.

We plan to continue involving disabled people by these means, but this is only the beginning. The scheme consists of a vibrant document that can be added to, and it will also exhibit progress. The equality duty is broad in its application, applying, for example, to people with HIV/AIDS and cancer, and we are aware of the importance of involving a broad range of disabled people

Seneddol y Cynulliad wedi cynnwys pobl anabl, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Mae'r Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 2005, a gyflwynodd y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni gynnwys pobl anabl wrth gynhyrchu a monitro'r cynllun. Yr ydym wedi cynnwys pobl anabl i'n helpu i nodi'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yn dda a'r meysydd lle y gallwn wella. Gellir dangos hyn mewn llawer ffordd.

Gwahoddwyd pobl anabl i ddod i bedwar digwyddiad ymgysylltu a ddarparwyd mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y gogledd, y de a'r gorllewin ac i awgrymu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer camau gweithredu i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Yn ogystal, defnyddir arolwg byr o ymwelwyr â'r Senedd yn y ganolfan arddangosfeydd ac yn y ganolfan ymwelwyr ym Mae Colwyn.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Fel cyd-aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch hyfforddiant i staff mewn ymwybyddiaeth o anabledd. A allwch roi sicrwydd y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd yr hyfforddiant hwnnw'n parhau ar gyfer staff newydd, yn enwedig i'r rheini sy'n gweithio mewn swyddi blaen y tŷ yn y Senedd? Yr ydym yn penodi nifer o staff newydd, ond mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau eu bod i gyd yn cael hyfforddiant mewn ymwybyddiaeth o anabledd, yn arbennig y rheini sy'n ymdrin â'r cyhoedd.

**William Graham:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig, ac mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau y bydd hyfforddiant yn parhau i bob aelod staff newydd er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn arbennig o ymwybodol o'r problemau wrth iddynt ymdrin â'r cyhoedd a'r ffordd y mae'r adeilad ysblennydd hwn wedi'i gynllunio i ddiwallu anghenion pobl anabl, ble bynnag y bydd yn bosibl.

Bwriadwn barhau i gynnwys pobl anabl drwy'r dulliau hyn, ond megis dechrau yr ydym. Mae'r cynllun yn cynnwys dogfen fywiog y gellir ychwanegu ati, a bydd hefyd yn dangos y cynnydd a wneir. Mae'r ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb yn eang ei chwmpas, ac mae'n gymwys, er enghraifft, i bobl sydd â HIV/AIDS a chanser, ac yr ydym yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd cynnwys

to reflect this range. We also hope to establish new links between APS branches and disability groups and a disabled staff forum.

As a result of the Government of Wales Act 2006, the Assembly Commission will be established. Therefore, this scheme will only run between December 2006 and May 2007. Given the limited timescale, the APS action plan focuses on three key areas: ensuring that we continue with what we are already doing to promote equality and that we are implementing our systems correctly; gathering information about options for improvements and costings, for example, for automated or magnetised doors in the Assembly office and improved signage inside and outside the Senedd building; and maintaining and building on the links that we have with disabled individuals and groups to ensure their involvement in the development and monitoring of our scheme. APS will review the scheme in April 2007 and make further recommendations that the Assembly Commission will be able to use when it has established its own scheme. The APS scheme will have the capability to form the basis of the Assembly Commission scheme, and I am sure that its fundamental principles can be adopted, although any new functions and practices will need to be assessed after May.

I commend this scheme to the Assembly, and I hope that Members will join me in commending it to the Assembly Commission when it comes into being next year. We must not let this opportunity slip, but continue to maintain momentum.

ystod eang o bobl anabl i adlewyrchu'r ystod hon. Yn ogystal, gobeithiwn feithrin cysylltiadau newydd rhwng canghennau Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a grwpiau anabledd a fforwm staff anabl.

O ganlyniad i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, caiff Comisiwn y Cynulliad ei sefydlu. Felly, dim ond rhwng mis Rhagfyr 2006 a mis Mai 2007 y bydd y cynllun hwn yn weithredol. O gofio'r amserlen gyfyngedig, mae cynllun gweithredu Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn canolbwyntio ar dri maes allweddol: sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i wneud yr hyn a wnawn eisoes i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb a'n bod yn gweithredu ein systemau'n gywir; casglu gwybodaeth am ddewisiadau o ran gwelliannau a chostau, er enghraifft, i roi drysau awtomataidd neu ddrysau wedi'u magneteiddio yn swyddfa'r Cynulliad, a gwella'r arwyddion y tu mewn a'r tu allan i adeilad y Senedd; a chynnal a datblygu'r cysylltiadau sydd gennym ag unigolion a grwpiau anabl er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cymryd rhan yn y broses o ddatblygu a monitro ein cynllun. Bydd Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn adolygu'r cynllun ym mis Ebrill 2007 ac yn cynnig argymhellion pellach y gall Comisiwn y Cynulliad eu defnyddio ar ôl iddo sefydlu ei gynllun ei hun. Bydd cynllun Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad yn gallu bod yn sail i gynllun Comisiwn y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir mabwysiadu ei egwyddorion sylfaenol, er y bydd angen asesu unrhyw swyddogaethau ac arferion newydd ar ôl mis Mai.

Cymeradwyaf y cynllun hwn i'r Cynulliad, a gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n ymuno â mi i'w gymeradwyo i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad pan gaiff ei sefydlu y flwyddyn nesaf. Rhaid inni fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn, ond parhau'r momentwm.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have always interpreted a 5.30 p.m. finish to be a 5.45 p.m. finish at the latest. We are going to finish at about 6 p.m., so I require a motion to be proposed. Business Minister, will you propose an extension to 6.15 p.m. at the

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf bob amser wedi deall bod gorffen am 5.30 p.m. yn golygu gorffen am 5.45 p.m. fan bellaf. Byddwn yn gorffen tua 6 p.m., felly, mae angen i rywun gynnig cynnig. Drefnydd, a wnewch chi gynnig estyniad i 6.15 p.m. fan

latest?

bellaf?

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 6.15 p.m..*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Are there 10 Members in support of this proposal? I see that there are. Therefore, I call a vote.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.15 p.m..*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn? Gwelaf fod. Felly, galwaf bleidlais.

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 3.  
Procedural motion: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 3.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Lewis, Huw

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cynllun Cydraddoldeb i Bobl Anabl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol: Parhad The National Assembly's Disability Equality Scheme: Continued**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** We have done justice to this important new disability equality duty and scheme. Thank you, first, to Gwenda Thomas, as Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, for feeding back the extensive discussion that took place in committee, on which Helen Mary also reflected. You raised several important issues, including a recognition of how we have tried to reach out in our

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr ydym wedi gwneud cyfiawnder â'r ddyletswydd a'r cynllun cydraddoldeb newydd pwysig hwn i bobl anabl. Diolch, yn gyntaf, i Gwenda Thomas, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, am ymateb am y drafodaeth helaeth a gafwyd yn y pwyllgor ac y soniodd Helen Mary hefyd amdani. Codwyd nifer o bwyntiau gennych, gan gynnwys cydnabod y ffordd yr ydym wedi ceisio cynnwys pobl

involvement and engagement with disabled people, and that we have made a step change and learnt a great deal from our experience with our exemplar race equality scheme, as Helen Mary said earlier. Also, that recognition of disability within the Assembly body was an important point made by the Disability Rights Commission in our discussions. We recognise the barriers that can impede opportunities, for example, the issue of formal qualifications and the way in which that can impede on the opportunities for disabled people. Jenny's amendment strengthens the scheme, and that is why we support it, as every party seems to have done across the Chamber.

5.50 p.m.

I will comment again on the importance of training, and the fact that the Public Services Management Wales scheme has a raft of training courses for the public sector. The points about training are important. To reflect on Helen Mary's and Jenny's comments, equality training in the Welsh Assembly Government is being woven into all of our training programmes. That has also been reflected in APS, and I am glad that Lorraine and William raised the point about the importance that we place on the public face of the Assembly, and in the public sector throughout Wales. So, training is fundamental.

In terms of Helen Mary's points, the Disability Rights Commission was right to say that we need to look at a pan-departmental approach. We need to not only sort out our departmental action plans, but also ensure that the plans cross boundaries. The point that Mark made about independent living is important in this respect. We recognise that there is a difference of understanding across departments, which is why the training is fundamental. On the website, from 4 December, there will be a tabular reflection of the scheme across departments, which will include performance indicators and SMART objectives. There will be officials responsible for delivering on action, so it will be outcome-based rather than output-based, Helen Mary, in terms of

anabl ac ymgysylltu â hwy, a'r ffaith ein bod wedi gwneud newid sylweddol ac wedi dysgu llawer o'n profiad o'r cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol rhagorol, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary yn gynharach. Yn ogystal, yr oedd cydnabod anabledd o fewn corff y Cynulliad yn bwynt pwysig a wnaed gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn ein trafodaethau. Cydnabyddwn y rhwystrau a all atal cyfleoedd, er enghraifft, problem cymwysterau ffurfiol a'r ffordd y gall hynny rwystro'r cyfleoedd i bobl anabl. Mae gwelliant Jenny yn atgyfnerthu'r cynllun, a dyna pam yr ydym yn ei gefnogi, fel y mae pob plaid ar draws y Siambr i'w gweld yn ei gefnogi.

Soniaf eto am bwysigrwydd hyfforddiant, a'r ffaith fod gan y cynllun Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Cymru nifer helaeth o gyrsiau hyfforddiant ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r pwyntiau ynghylch hyfforddiant yn bwysig. Er mwyn ymateb i sylwadau Helen Mary a Jenny, caiff hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei gynnwys ym mhob un o'n rhaglenni hyfforddiant. Mae hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu hefyd yng Ngwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn falch fod Lorraine a William wedi codi'r pwynt ynghylch y pwys a roddwn ar wyneb cyhoeddus y Cynulliad, ac yn y sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Felly, mae hyfforddiant yn sylfaenol.

O ran pwyntiau Helen Mary, yr oedd y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod angen inni ystyried dull rhwng pob adran. Nid yn unig y mae angen inni ddatrys ein cynlluniau gweithredu adrannol, ond mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau bod y cynlluniau'n croesi ffiniau. Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Mark ynghylch byw'n annibynnol yn bwysig yn y cyswllt hwn. Cydnabyddwn fod yna wahaniaeth dealltwriaeth ar draws adrannau, a dyna pam mae'r hyfforddiant yn sylfaenol. O ran y wefan, ar ôl 4 Rhagfyr bydd gwybodaeth am y cynllun ar draws adrannau ar ffurf tabl, a fydd yn cynnwys dangosyddion perfformiad ac amcanion CAMPUS. Bydd swyddogion yn gyfrifol am weithredu, ac felly bydd yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau yn hytrach nag ar



an analysis of how we are progressing. It gives the opportunity for monitoring and for reflecting on where we are going.

On amendment 2 in relation to funding, it is important that we put equality at the heart of our funding, across departments. That is why we are pleased to support amendment 2. The extra £3 million in support for carers of people with mental health needs, which Brian Gibbons reported on last week from the £76 million package that he announced in February of this year, is important. He also announced an extra £600,000 for motorised wheelchairs, which was an important announcement in terms of our commitment to funding. Members will want to look closely at the good news in terms of the fairer charging announcements that Brian made last week, because it is about the opportunities for disabled people to be part of the fairer charging regime, which raises the buffer from 25 to 35 per cent above income support. There is also the disability-related expenditure disregard, containing recommendations from the disability organisations themselves, which the Minister has accepted.

Finally, Mark, the international day for disabled people is coming up, and the National AIDS Day is on Friday. We must recognise the social model, which we support, and in terms of the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Welsh Assembly Government working and learning together, we will make progress in terms of ensuring that this is an exemplar disability equality scheme.

allbwn, Helen Mary, o ran dadansoddiad o'r cynnydd a wnawn. Mae'n gyfle i fonitro ac i fyfyrrio ar gyfeiriad ein cynnydd.

O ran gwelliant 2 mewn perthynas â chyllido, mae'n bwysig sicrhau ein bod yn rhoi cydraddoldeb wrth wraidd ein prosesau cyllido, ar draws adrannau. Dyna pam yr ydym yn falch cefnogi gwelliant 2. Mae'r £3 miliwn ychwanegol i gefnogi gofalwyr pobl sydd ag anghenion iechyd meddwl, y soniodd Brian Gibbons amdano yr wythnos diwethaf o'r pecyn o £76 miliwn a gyhoeddodd ym mis Chwefror eleni, yn bwysig. Cyhoeddodd hefyd £600,000 ychwanegol ar gyfer cadeiriau olwyn modur, a oedd yn gyhoeddiad pwysig o ran ein hymrwymiad i gyllid. Bydd Aelodau am ystyried yn fanylach y newyddion da am y cyhoeddiadau taliadau tecach a wnaeth Brian yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r rheini'n ymwneud â'r cyfleoedd i bobl anabl fod yn rhan o'r gyfundrefn taliadau tecach, sy'n codi'r glustogfa o 25 i 35 y cant uwchben cymhorthdal incwm. Yn ogystal, mae yna'r dull diystyru gwariant sy'n gysylltiedig ag anabledd. Mae'n cynnwys argymhellion gan y cyrff anabledd eu hunain ac y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu derbyn.

I gloi, Mark, mae'r diwrnod rhyngwladol i bobl anabl ar y gweill, ac mae'n Ddiwrnod Cenedlaethol AIDS ddydd Gwener. Rhaid inni gydnabod y model cymdeithasol yr ydym yn ei gefnogi, ac o ran y ffordd y mae Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio ac yn dysgu gyda'i gilydd, byddwn yn gwneud cynnydd i sicrhau bod hwn yn gynllun cydraddoldeb rhagorol i bobl anabl.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene

Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion (NDM3348) as amended: to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3348) fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. adopts the disability equality schemes of the Assembly Parliamentary Service and the Welsh Assembly Government which together constitute the National Assembly for Wales's disability equality scheme;*

*1. yn mabwysiadu cynlluniau cydraddoldeb i bobl Anabl Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd, gyda'i gilydd, yn creu cynllun cydraddoldeb i bobl Anabl Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru;*

*2. recognises and is grateful for the help and support provided by the Disability Rights Commission, Disability Wales, and the individuals and organisations involved in the production of the scheme;*

*2. yn cydnabod y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth a gafwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, Anabledd Cymru a'r unigolion a'r mudiadau a fu'n rhan o'r gwaith o gynhyrchu'r cynllun hwn, ac yn ddiolchgar am hynny;*

*3. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make provision for the training of public sector managers in how to mainstream the disability equality duty; and*

*3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu ar gyfer hyfforddi rheolwyr y sector cyhoeddus ynghylch sut i brif ffrydio'r ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl; ac*

*4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure the disability equality duty is at the core of its funding strategies.*

*4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb i bobl anabl wrth wraidd ei strategaethau cyllido.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amended motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Datganiad yr Amserlen Gyfnodol Approval of the Periodic Timetable Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
 propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 5.1 approves the periodic timetable statement, which was e-mailed to Members on Wednesday 22 November 2006. (NDM3349)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 5.1, yn cymeradwyo datganiad yr amserlen gyfnodol, a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ddydd Mercher 22 Tachwedd 2006. (NDM3349)*

**Lisa Francis:** In the periodic timetable statement that appears on the Chamberweb as a supporting document to this motion, it appears that the start of the Conservative group meeting, scheduled on Tuesdays, is at 12 p.m.. I understand that our venerable chief whip informed your good offices that we would like the meeting to start at 11.30 a.m.,

**Lisa Francis:** Yn natganiad yr amserlen gyfnodol fel yr ymddengys ar we'r Siambr fel dogfen ategol i'r cynnig hwn, ymddengys bod cyfarfod grŵp y Ceidwadwyr, ar ddydd Mawrth, yn dechrau am 12 p.m.. Deallaf fod ein prif chwip hybarch wedi dweud wrth eich swyddfeydd yr hoffem i'r cyfarfod ddechrau am 11.30 a.m., sef yr amser arferol. Os gall y

which is the usual time. If the Minister can give us her undertaking that the timetable will be amended to 11.30 a.m., the Welsh Conservative group will be happy to vote for this motion.

Gweinidog addo y caiff yr amserlen ei diwygio i 11.30 a.m., bydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn fodlon pleidleisio dros y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I would not dream of interfering with the timing of Welsh Conservative group meetings, and I give you that undertaking.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Ni fyddwn yn ystyried ymyrryd ag amseriad cyfarfodydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru, ac addawaf wneud hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM3349): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3349): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes business for today.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.56 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.56 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)