



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher, 29 Medi 2004**

**Wednesday, 29 September 2004**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid<br>Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister   |
| 20  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad<br>Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside   |
| 34  | Adroddiad Blynnyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru 2003-04<br>The First Minister's Annual Report 2003-04  |
| 82  | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order   |
| 82  | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynglŷn â Thai ar gyfer<br>Pobl Hŷn<br>The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older People                |
| 91  | Cynnig Trefniadol<br>Procedural Motion  |
| 92  | Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Dai ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn:<br>Parhad<br>The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older People:<br>Continued |
| 102 | Dadl Fer: 'Rhywun i Droi Ato'—Gwrando ar Blant a Phobl Ifanc<br>Short Debate: 'Someone to Turn To'—Listening to Children and Young People   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy yn ddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.*  
*The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister

### Tanwariant yng Nghyllideb y Llywodraeth Underspend in the Government's Budget

**Q1 David Melding:** What was the level of underspend in the Welsh Assembly Government's budget in 2002-03? (OAQ37863)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** In the written Cabinet statement on 2002-03 Assembly expenditure issued on 22 January 2004, I advised that the Assembly's total expenditure was £10,695 million, which was 99.8 per cent of the provision of £10,717 million. Of the budgets allocated to main expenditure groups, for which the Assembly had full discretion, that is, the departmental expenditure limit budgets, the match was 99.1 per cent of the provision of £9,567 million.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that all public authorities have a duty to use public money expeditiously? You may have seen the article in today's *The Western Mail* about local government expenditure on regeneration. Also, many schools have large reserves. If we were to set a good example, it would encourage others to use public money effectively.

**Sue Essex:** We achieve a high level of match of spend to the budget allocation and are one of the best performing parts of government. It is difficult to achieve an exact match, because so many budget lines are demand led. You can never be 100 per cent clear what the demand will be in any year, and when you allocate grants and spend such sums of money—especially on economic development—it is difficult to ensure a match at the end of the year. I take your point that where public money is involved, rather than having it sitting in budget lines not being used—I made this point strongly when we decided on last year's budgets—it is important that we try to ensure that all money

**C1 David Melding:** Beth oedd lefel y tanwariant yng nghyllideb 2002-03 Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? (OAQ37863)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Yn natganiad ysgrifenedig y Cabinet ar wariant y Cynulliad yn 2002-03 a gyhoeddwyd ar 22 Ionawr 2004, nodais mai £10,695 miliwn oedd cyfanswm gwariant y Cynulliad, sef 99.8 y cant o'r ddarpariaeth o £10,717 miliwn. O ran y cyllidebau a ddyrannwyd i'r prif grwpiau gwariant, yr oedd gan y Cynulliad ddisgresiwn llawn drostynt, hynny yw, cyllidebau terfynau gwariant adrannol, y ffigur oedd 99.1 y cant o'r ddarpariaeth o £9,567 miliwn.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch fod dyletswydd ar bob awdurdod cyhoeddus i ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn gyflym? Efallai eich bod wedi gweld yr erthygl yn *The Western Mail* heddiw ynglŷn â gwariant llywodraeth leol ar adfywio. Hefyd, mae gan ysgolion gronfeydd wrth gefn mawr. Pe baem yn gosod esiampl dda, byddai hynny'n annog eraill i ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn effeithiol.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym yn llwyddo i wario canran uchel o'r gyllideb a ddyrannwyd ac mae ein perfformiad yn hynny o beth gyda'r gorau yn y llywodraeth. Mae'n anodd gwario'r gyllideb gyfan, am fod cymaint o linellau'r gyllideb yn cael eu gwario yn ôl y galw. Ni allwch byth fod yn hollol sicr beth fydd y galw mewn unrhyw flwyddyn, a phan fyddwch yn dyrannu grantiau ac yn gwario symiau o arian o'r fath—yn enwedig o ran datblygu economaidd—mae'n anodd sicrhau bod y gwariant yn cyfateb â'r gyllideb ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn. Derbyniaf eich pwynt, o ran arian cyhoeddus, ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau bod yr arian i gyd yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n ddoeth ac yn effeithiol

is used wisely and effectively.

yn hytrach na'i adael yn y gyllideb heb ei ddefnyddio—gwneuthum y pwynt hwn yn gryf pan oeddem yn penderfynu ar gyllidebau'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

**John Griffiths:** In using end-year-flexibility underspend in the future, will you consider some sort of contingency fund to deal with unexpected events, which may be important to our heritage? As you know, a whale washed up near Newport recently, which aroused much interest locally, with thousands—including me—flocking to see it. There was a lot of concern that there was no money available to conserve and display its skeleton, and it had to be removed quickly. Many people suggested that we might have a Wales-wide fund to deal with such events.

**John Griffiths:** Wrth ddefnyddio tanwariant hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn yn y dyfodol, a ystyriwch sefydlu rhyw fath o gronfa wrth gefn i ymdrin â digwyddiadau annisgwyl, a all fod yn bwysig i'n treftadaeth? Fel y gwyddoch, golchodd morfil i'r lan ger Casnewydd yn ddiweddar, a enynnodd gryn ddiddordeb yn lleol, gyda miloedd—a minnau yn eu plith—yn heidio yno i'w weld. Bu cryn bryder nad oedd unrhyw arian ar gael i ddiogelu ac arddangos ei sgerbwad, a bu'n rhaid ei symud yn gyflym. Awgrymodd llawer o bobl y gallem o bosibl sefydlu cronfa Cymru gyfan i ymdrin â digwyddiadau o'r fath.

**Sue Essex:** I suppose that that pun was accidental rather than intended, but it is an interesting point. There was huge interest in that event and it captured the media's imagination because many people do not realise how rich our marine environment is. It was a tremendous example of how fortunate we are to have species like whales in the world. Let us hope that they are not hunted to extinction. On the idea of a contingency fund, there is no such fund, but as you and Rosemary will remember when the remains of a ship were found in Newport, we came up with the goods in terms of money. I would like to think that if there were a special occasion, local authorities would write to us about their need; if it was a Wales-wide phenomenon that we would all need to observe, we would respond.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n bwynt diddorol. Bu diddordeb mawr yn y digwyddiad hwnnw a chydiodd yn nychymyg y cyfryngau am nad yw pobl yn aml yn sylweddoli pa mor gyfoethog yw ein hamgylchoedd morol. Yr oedd yn engraifft wych o ba mor ffodus ydym fod gennym rywogaethau megis morfilod yn y byd. Gobeithio na chânt eu hela nes ein bod yn eu colli yn gyfan gwbl. O ran y syniad o gronfa wrth gefn, nid oes cronfa o'r fath, ond fel y cofiwr chi a Rosemary pan ddarganfuwyd gweddillion llong yng Nghasnewydd, darparwyd cyllid gennym. Hoffwn feddwl y byddai awdurdodau lleol yn ysgrifennu atom am unrhyw anghenion a oedd ganddynt os oedd achlysur arbennig wedi codi; os mai ffenomenon dros Gymru gyfan ydoedd ac y byddai angen inni oll ei hystyried yna byddem yn ymateb.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 (OAQ37854) has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 2 (OAQ37854) yn ôl.

### Symiau Canlyniadol Barnett Barnett Consequentials

**C3 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar symiau canlyniadol Barnett mewn cysylltiad â deddfwriaeth arfaethedig Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig? (OAQ37871)

**Sue Essex:** The principles underpinning the

**Q3 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Barnett consequentials of forthcoming UK Government legislation? (OAQ37871)

**Sue Essex:** Nodir yr egwyddorion sy'n sail i

allocation of public expenditure are set out in the statement of funding policy. Where decisions of UK departments lead to additional costs for devolved administrations, UK departments will meet that cost.

**David Lloyd:** Beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf ynghylch ariannu'r Mesur Paratoadau Sifil?

**Sue Essex:** I believe that it is as reported at committee.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** If more money was available from Barnett consequentials, you might be able to deal with the crisis in the health service. Can you confirm that the way that this Government pays for operations outside Wales is to agree with a hospital or trust that you will only pay for operations within your stated targets for treatment?

**Sue Essex:** I do not accept your premise if this is a question about Barnett. As you will remember, when Gordon Brown announced the extra money earlier this year, including the money for structural funds, we got a good deal out of the settlement. You are wrong to say that Wales is not getting a good deal out of the settlement. There has been a 73 per cent growth in health funding since 1999. So, in terms of those figures, you are wrong. On the specific allocations under the second offer guarantee scheme—I am not sure whether that was what you were referring to—as I understand it, we are paying for it on that basis. I will check on that, but I am sure that that is the way the money is going out.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You are the Finance Minister, and therefore I would have expected that you would have known how your Government is paying for patients to be treated outside of Wales. You will have heard my exchanges with the First Minister yesterday on the case of Mrs Elizabeth Moses from Menai Bridge. She was not aware that it was Government policy not to pay for operations until people have been on the waiting list for a substantial amount of time, which means that patients from Wales have to wait longer for their treatment in English hospitals than patients from England do. I am

ddyrannu gwariant cyhoeddus yn y datganiad o bolisi cylrido. Lle mae penderfyniadau gan adrannau'r DU yn arwain at gostau ychwanegol i weinyddiaethau datganoledig, adrannau'r DU fydd yn talu'r costau hynny.

**David Lloyd:** What is the latest situation with regard to funding the Civil Contingencies Bill?

**Sue Essex:** Credaf fod y sefyllfa fel y'i nodwyd yn y pwyllogr.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pe bai mwy o arian ar gael o symiau canlyniadol Barnett, efallai y gallech ymdrin â'r argyfwng yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. A allwch gadarnhau bod y Llywodraeth hon yn talu am lawdriniaeth y tu allan i Gymru drwy gytuno ag ysbty neu ymddiriedolaeth mai dim ond llawdriniaethau o fewn eich targedau datganedig ar gyfer triniaeth y bydd yn talu amdanynt?

**Sue Essex:** Ni dderbyniaf eich rhagosodiad os mai cwestiwn ynglŷn â Barnett yw hwn. Fel y cofiwch, pan gyhoeddodd Gordon Brown fod arian ychwanegol ar gael yn gynharach eleni, gan gynnwys yr arian ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol, yr oedd y setliad yn un da inni. Nid yw'n gywir dweud nad yw'r setliad yn un da i Gymru. Bu twf o 73 y cant yn y gyllideb iechyd ers 1999. Felly, o ran y ffigurau hynny, yr ydych yn anghywir. O ran y dyraniadau penodol o dan gynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig—nid wyf yn siŵr ai at hynny yr oeddech yn cyfeirio—fel y deallaf, yr ydym yn talu am hynny ar y sail honno. Ymchwiliaf i hynny, ond yr wyf yn siŵr mai dyna sut y caiff yr arian ei wario.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Chi yw'r Gweinidog Cyllid, ac felly byddwn wedi disgwyl ichi wybod sut y mae eich Llywodraeth yn talu am i gleifion gael eu trin y tu allan i Gymru. Byddwch wedi clywed y sylwadau a wnaed ddoe wrth i'r Prif Weinidog a minnau drafod achos Mrs Elizabeth Moses o Borthaethwy. Ni wyddai mai polisi'r Llywodraeth oedd peidio â thalu am lawdriniaeth nes bod pobl wedi bod ar y rhestr aros ers cryn amser, sy'n golygu bod cleifion o Gymru yn gorfod aros am fwy o amser am eu triniaeth mewn ysbtyai yn Lloegr na chleifion o Loegr. Gofynnaf ichi gadarnhau, pan fydd

simply asking you to confirm that when trusts in England perform operations on patients in Wales, your Government will only pay for them provided that they keep within your Government's targets. That means that, for orthopaedic surgery, you will not pay until those patients have been waiting 18 months. It is a simple question. Is the answer 'yes' or 'no'?

**Sue Essex:** You ask about how we are paying: you know how we are paying, and how we are working to targets in Wales. It makes no difference whether the service is provided in England or in Wales. This refers to a waiting time target for Welsh patients. It is the same as for Wales.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** How much will be added to the Assembly budget as a consequence of the Higher Education Bill?

**Sue Essex:** I do not know at the moment. It is still being negotiated. As soon as we know, we will let you know.

**Michael German:** You have given a commitment, which we will debate later this afternoon, that there will not be an increase in tuition fees for 2006. Have you estimated the amount of money that you will have to put into the budget in that financial year to cope with not just the students from Wales studying in Wales, but those who may be studying in England during the previous year?

**Sue Essex:** The estimates are being worked out and they are part of this budget.

#### **Blaenoriaethau Pwyllgor ym Mhroses y Gyllideb Committee Priorities in the Budget Process**

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro sut y mae blaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cael eu hystyried ym mhroses y gyllideb? (OAQ37843)

**Sue Essex:** In line with Standing Order No. 21, I invite all subject committees to submit their views on priorities at the beginning of

ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr yn cynnal llawdriniaethau ar gleifion yng Nghymru, mai dim ond os cadwant o fewn targedau eich Llywodraeth y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn talu amdanyst. Golyga hynny, ar gyfer llawdriniaeth orthopedig, na fyddwch yn talu nes bod y cleifion hynny wedi bod yn aros ers 18 mis. Mae'n gwestiwn syml. Beth yw'r ateb, 'ie' neu 'nag'?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn holi sut yr ydym yn talu: fe wyddoch sut yr ydym yn talu, a sut yr ydym yn gweithio yn ôl targedau yng Nghymru. Nid oes gwahaniaeth pa un ai yn Lloegr neu yng Nghymru y darperir y gwasanaeth. Cyfeiria hyn at darged amser aros i gleifion yng Nghymru. Mae'r un peth â'r targed i Gymru.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratioaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Faint o arian a gaiff ei ychwanegu at gyllideb y Cynulliad o ganlyniad i'r Mesur Addysg Uwch?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn ar hyn o bryd. Yr ydym yn dal i'w negodi. Cyn gynted ag y byddwn yn gwybod, rhoddwn wybod ichi.

**Michael German:** Yr ydych wedi gwneud ymrwymiad, y byddwn yn ei drafod yn nes ymlaen y prynhawn yma, na fydd ffioedd dysgu yn cynyddu yn 2006. A ydych wedi amcangyfrif faint o arian y bydd yn rhaid ichi ei roi yn y gyllideb yn y flwyddyn ariannol honno i ddarparu nid yn unig ar gyfer y myfyrwyr o Gymru sy'n astudio yng Nghymru ond y rhai hynny sy'n astudio yn Lloegr yn ystod y flwyddyn flaenorol?

**Sue Essex:** Mae amcangyfrifon yn cael eu paratoi ac maent yn rhan o'r gyllideb hon.

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister explain how the priorities of the Health and Social Services Committee are considered in the budget process? (OAQ37843)

**Sue Essex:** Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21, gwahoddaf bob pwyllgor pwnc i gyflwyno eu sylwadau ar flaenoriaethau ar

the budget process. Committees are also consulted after the draft budget is published. Their priorities are taken into consideration when budget allocations are decided.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am grateful for your confirming to Ieuan Wyn Jones that patients from Wales treated in English hospitals are treated on the basis of your waiting time targets. I have a copy of a directive from the chief executive of Health Commission Wales that tells the trusts in England that HCW:

‘will require all English trusts to manage activity within the agreed financial envelope.’

Are you not saying that if a patient from Wales is on an 18-month waiting-time target, he or she will not be treated until the target has been reached? Therefore, if a patient from England is on a lower waiting-time target, he or she will be treated earlier, irrespective of clinical need. Patients from Wales being treated in English hospitals will have to wait until the target has been reached, because the Government will not pay and HCW has told the trust not to treat those people until the required time is reached.

**Sue Essex:** You are going around in circles again. You know what the situation is as well as everyone else here. We are buying equivalent provision in England, but on a Welsh basis. That is the nature of it. It is also the nature of devolution. There is much that we do in Wales that is not done in England: concessionary fares, for example. Therefore, you have to accept certain things. You know that we are working to these time requirements, and that is there.

2.10 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Rhodri Glyn Thomas quoted from a Health Commission Wales report that I referred to yesterday in questioning the First Minister, in direct relation to cardiac surgery. We have a waiting time target in Wales of 10 months; I said yesterday that it is rare for a cardiac patient in England to wait longer than four or

ddechrau proses y gyllideb. Ymgynghorir â phwylgorau ar ôl i'r gyllideb ddrafft gael ei chyhoeddi hefyd. Ystyrir eu blaenoriaethau pan benderfynir ar ddyraniadau'r gyllideb.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am gadarnhau i Ieuan Wyn Jones fod cleifion o Gymru sy'n cael eu trin mewn ysybtai yn Lloegr yn cael eu trin ar sail eich targedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros. Mae gennyd gopi o gyfarwyddyd gan brif weithredwr Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru sy'n dweud wrth yr ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr fod y comisiwn:

yn mynnu bod pob ymddiriedolaeth yn Lloegr yn rheoli gweithgaredd o fewn yr amlen ariannol y cytunwyd arni.

Onid ydych yn dweud na chaiff claf o Gymru sydd ar restr aros â tharged o 18 mis, ei drin hyd nes y caiff y targed ei gyrraedd? Felly, os bydd claf o Loegr ar restr aros â tharged is, caiff ei drin yn gynt, waeth beth fo'r angen clinigol. Bydd yn rhaid i gleifion o Gymru sy'n cael eu trin mewn ysybtai yn Lloegr aros nes bod y targed wedi'i gyrraedd, am na fydd y Llywodraeth yn talu ac am fod Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi dweud wrth yr ymddiriedolaeth am beidio â thrin y bobl hynny nes eu bod wedi cyrraedd yr amser gofynnol.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn drysu eto. Fe wyddoch beth yw'r sefyllfa crystal â neb. Yr ydym yn prynu darpariaeth gyfatebol yn Lloegr, ond ar sail Gymreig. Dyna hanfod y mater. Dyna hanfod datganoli hefyd. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer yng Nghymru nas gwneir yn Lloegr: tocybau mantais, er enghraifft. Felly, rhaid ichi dderbyn rhai pethau. Fe wyddoch ein bod yn gweithio yn ôl y gofynion amser hyn, a dyna beth sy'n digwydd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Dyfynnodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas o adroddiad gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru y cyfeiriais ato ddoe wrth holi'r Prif Weinidog mewn perthynas â llawdriniaeth ar y galon. Yng Nghymru mae gennym darged amser aros o 10 mis; dywedais ddoe mai anaml y mae claf yn Lloegr sydd angen llawdriniaeth ar y galon yn aros am fwy na

five months. What Health Commission Wales was saying in that report in July was that there is sufficient capacity in England to treat more Welsh patients, but the Assembly Government will not put any more money or commitment into treating more Welsh patients in England. Bearing in mind that your Government spent £17 million restructuring the NHS in Wales, does this not show a disgraceful lack of priority?

**Sue Essex:** I am certainly prepared to look at that report, Jonathan, to see the figures. You have passed them backwards and forwards with Rhodri Glyn, but I am happy to read the report. I do, however, make the basic point that we need to show fairness to people across Wales. That is why the target levels were set. The cardiac surgery figures—if I remember correctly—are better than 10 months; they are coming down. I will look at that if you send it to me.

phedwar neu bum mis. Yr hyn yr oedd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn ei ddweud yn yr adroddiad hwnnw ym mis Gorffennaf oedd bod digon o adnoddau yn Lloegr i drin mwy o gleifion o Gymru, ond na fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn neilltuo rhagor o arian nac yn ymrwymo i drin mwy o gleifion o Gymru yn Lloegr. O gofio bod eich Llywodraeth wedi gwario £17 miliwn ar ailstrwythuro'r GIG yng Nghymru, onid yw hyn yn fethiant gwarthus o ran blaenoriaethu?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i edrych ar yr adroddiad hwnnw, Jonathan, i weld y ffigurau. Yr ydych chi a Rhodri Glyn wedi bod yn eu dyfynnu o hyd, ond yr wyf yn barod i ddarllen yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, gwnaf y pwynt sylfaenol bod angen inni fod yn deg â phobl ledled Cymru. Dyna pam y gosodwyd lefel y targedau. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ar y galon—os cofiaf yn iawn—yn well na 10 mis; maent yn gostwng. Edrychaf ar yr adroddiad hwnnw os anfonwch ef ataf.

### Cyllideb Addysg The Education Budget

**Q5 Carl Sargeant:** Will the Minister make a statement on the overall funding that she has allocated to the education budget in the past year? (OAQ37836)

**Sue Essex:** The education and lifelong learning main expenditure group in 2004-05 is £1.227 billion. This represents an increase of 3.4 per cent, or £40 million, on 2003-04. The budget covers commitments made in ‘The Learning Country: A Comprehensive Education and Lifelong Learning Programme to 2010 in Wales’ and ‘Wales: A Better Country’. Added to that—and this is important—is the local government revenue settlement, through the local government MEG, which has put resources in for teachers’ pay, workload and pensions arrangements. Therefore, the figure goes up to around 5 per cent on average.

**Carl Sargeant:** I applaud the Government’s extra investment over the last year. Assembly investment is working to reverse the indifferent funding of past Tory administrations, which ran down our schools. I am pleased to see improvements in schools

**C5 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y cyllid cyffredinol y mae hi wedi'i ddyrannu i'r gyllideb addysg yn ystod y flwyddyn a aeth heibio? (OAQ37836)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r prif grŵp gwariant addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn 2004-05 yn £1.227 biliwn, sef cynnydd o 3.4 y cant, neu £40 miliwn, o gymharu â 2003-04. Mae'r gyllideb yn cynnwys ymrwymiadau a wnaed yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu: Rhaglen Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Gynhwysfawr hyd 2010 yng Nghymru' a 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Yn ogystal â hynny—ac mae hyn yn bwysig—ceir setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol, drwy brif grŵp gwariant llywodraeth leol, sydd wedi neilltuo adnoddau ar gyfer trefniadau cyflogau, llwyth gwaith a phensiynau athrawon. Felly, mae'r ffigur yn codi i oddeutu 5 y cant ar gyfartaledd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Cymeradwyaf fuddsoddiad ychwanegol y Llywodraeth dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae buddsoddiad y Cynulliad yn llwyddo i ddadwneud effaith cyllido gwael y gweinyddiaethau Torïaid blaenorol, a amddifadodd ein hysgolion o adnoddau.

in my constituency. However, there are issues, and I look forward to our meeting on the existing education formula. Would you agree that responsible, round-table discussions are far more preferable than the slash and burn of Tory fantasy economics, which seek to make £20 billion cuts in public services?

**Sue Essex:** You are wise to remind us of the performance of former Tory Governments. We know that the Tories are not committed to public expenditure at the levels seen year in, year out since Gordon Brown was made Chancellor of the Exchequer. I compliment education authorities, schools, teachers and pupils across Wales on their improved performances. This is a combination of resources going in and a culture of trying to achieve, leading to great rewards for the pupils who take part. I am aware that we have had the discussion before—I see that Janet is ready to jump up—about the nature of the education formula. I am always willing to look at issues that concern people. However, I stress that local authorities can go above the standard spending assessment if that is what they want to do; we know that some local authorities choose to do so. If we believe in local democracy, we cannot stop authorities going above that. Therefore, you do get differences. I appreciate that that sometimes looks quite harsh, but a lot of it is down to a few local authorities pushing up their expenditure level.

**Janet Ryder:** I will take that further, because—as Carl is aware—Flintshire County Council has always languished at the bottom of the funding table for schools. Unfortunately, it has not put extra resources into education, and it has not sought to address the historical difference that we are always told about. I am glad that Carl has now come around to agreeing—and I hope that you will agree, Minister—that it is time that we had a round-table, all-party discussion on school funding, to see what truths and what myths lie behind this.

**Sue Essex:** Yes, there are a lot of myths. One point that I will make about Flintshire is that

Mae'n dda gennyf weld gwelliannau mewn ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i. Fodd bynnag, mae materion i'w trafod, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ein cyfarfod ar y fformiwlâu addysg bresennol. A gytunech fod trafodaethau cyfrifol o amgylch bwrdd yn llawer gwell na thoriadau hallt polisiau economaidd ffantasi'r Torïaid, sydd am dorri £20 biliwn o wariant mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn ddoeth i'n hatgoffa o berfformiad y Llywodraethau Torïaid blaenorol. Gwyddom nad yw'r Torïaid yn ymrwymedig i wariant cyhoeddus ar y lefelau a welwyd flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ers i Gordon Brown gael ei benodi'n Ganghellor y Trysorlys. Cymeradwyaf awdurdodau addysg, ysgolion, athrawon a disgyblion ledled Cymru ar eu perfformiad gwell. Daw o ganlyniad i gyfuniad o adnoddau yn cael eu rhoi ynghyd â diwylliant o geisio cyflawni, sy'n arwain at fuddiannau mawr i'r disgyblion sy'n cymryd rhan. Gwn inni gael y drafodaeth o'r blaen—gwelaf fod Janet ar fin neidio ar ei thraed—ynglŷn â natur y fformiwlâu addysg. Yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon edrych ar faterion sy'n achos pryder i bobl. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf fod awdurdodau lleol yn gallu mynd y tu hwnt i'r asesiad o wariant safonol os dymunant; gwyddom fod rhai awdurdodau wedi dewis gwneud hynny. Os credwn mewn democratiaeth leol, ni allwn atal awdurdodau rhag mynd y tu hwnt i hynny. Felly, fe fydd gwahaniaethau. Deallaf fod hynny yn edrych yn eithaf hallt weithiau, ond rhyw lond dwrm o awdurdodau lleol yn codi lefel eu gwariant sy'n gyfrifol am hynny i raddau helaeth.

**Janet Ryder:** Parhaf â'r pwynt hwnnw oherwyddd—fel y gŵyr Carl—bu Cyngor Sir y Fflint bob amser ar waelod y tabl cylrido i ysgolion. Yn anffodus, nid yw wedi neilltuo adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg, ac nid yw wedi ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r gwahaniaeth hanesyddol y sonnir amdano wrthynt drwy'r amser. Yr wyf yn falch bod Carl wedi cytuno o'r diwedda—a gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cytuno, Weinidog—ei bod yn bryd i bob plaid ddod ynghyd o amgylch y bwrdd i drafod cyllid ysgolion, i ganfod y gwiredbau a'r anwiredbau ynglŷn â hyn.

**Sue Essex:** Yn sicr, clywir llawer o anwiredbau. Un pwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud

its performance level is high. The trouble with tables is that, if you have 22—it is like the football league—you will have people at the top and people at the bottom. As far as I am concerned—[*Interruption.*] If you have tables of spend, unless everyone is hitting exactly the same level, you will have that gradation. That is the issue in life. What I am concerned about is ensuring that there are enough resources to ensure that the improvements in education that we are seeing can be sustained. Flintshire's record and performance are extremely good—I have looked at the education system outcomes there. I am never complacent—if there is a different or better way to allocate money then I will certainly sit down and discuss that. However, at the partnership council's consultative forum on finance last year, of which you were a member, Janet, we had this discussion, and I offered to do that very thing then, but people said, 'No, we'll leave it as it is'. That is how it goes.

**Peter Black:** Minister, will you consider working with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to allocate funds for equality awareness education for those members of the Cardiff Labour Party who have been found to have issued racist literature during the local council elections on 10 June?

**Sue Essex:** I am not prepared to comment on that matter, as it has been before the Commission for Racial Equality. We are talking about education, and Carl's question was about overall funding for education within the system. As I have said, our record on this is extremely good and we will continue to deliver in this area.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not believe that there is ministerial responsibility for that matter. There is certainly responsibility somewhere, however.

#### **Gweithredu 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' The Delivery of 'Wales: A Better Country'**

**Q6 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on how the Assembly Government's budget contributes to the delivery of 'Wales: A Better Country'? (OAQ37831)

yn glŷn â sir y Fflint yw bod ei berfformiad yn dda. Y drwg gyda thablau yw, os oes 22—mae'n debyg i'r cyngahrain pêl-droed—bydd rhai ar y brig a rhai ar y gwaelod. O'm rhan i—[*Torri ar draws.*] Os oes tablau o wariant, oni bai fod gwariant pawb yn union yr un peth, bydd graddau gwahanol o'r fath. Dyna beth sy'n digwydd mewn bywyd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig imi yw sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau i sicrhau bod modd cynnal y gwelliannau a welwn ym maes addysg. Mae record a pherfformiad sir y Fflint yn hynod o dda—yr wyf wedi edrych ar ganlyniadau'r system addysg yno. Nid wyf byth yn hunanfodlon—os oes ffordd wahanol neu ffordd well o ddyrannu arian yna, yn sicr, byddaf yn fodlon trafod hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn fforwm ymgynghorol y cyngor partneriaeth ar gyllid y llynedd, yr oeddech yn aelod ohono, Janet, cawsom y drafodaeth hon, a chynigiais wneud yr union beth bryd hynny, ond dywedodd pobl, 'Na, nid ydym am ei wneud'. Fel yna y mae pethau.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, a wnewch ystyried cydweithio â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ddyrannu cyllid ar gyfer addysg ar ymwybyddiaeth o gydraddoldeb i'r aelodau hynny o Blaid Lafur Caerdydd a gyhoeddodd ddeunydd hiliol yn ystod yr etholiadau lleol i'r cyngor ar 10 Mehefin?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn barod i wneud sylwadau ar y mater hwnnw, gan ei fod wedi bod gerbron y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol. Trafod addysg yr ydym, a holodd Carl ynglŷn â chyfanswm y cyllid ar gyfer addysg yn y system. Fel y dywedais, mae ein record yn hyn o beth yn dda iawn, a byddwn yn parhau i gyflawni yn y maes hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol dros y mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfrifoldeb yn rhywle, yn sicr.

**C6 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sut y mae cyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyfrannu at y gwaith o weithredu 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'? (OAQ37831)

**Sue Essex:** The draft budget will reflect the work of the internal spending review that I announced last year to ensure that resources are aligned with our strategic priorities as set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

**Lynne Neagle:** Delivering social justice and combating poverty are two key aims in 'Wales: A Better Country'. If these are to be achieved, then Assembly Government policies such as the Wales spatial plan and future public investment must be targeted at assisting deprived communities such as those in the south Wales Valleys so that they, too, can share in Wales's future prosperity. What assurances can you give that the spreading prosperity agenda will lie at the heart of the Assembly Government's forthcoming budget and that future spending priorities will reflect the needs of deprived communities?

**Sue Essex:** You mentioned the Wales spatial plan in particular, and a component of that is to try to ensure that we improve prosperity and the quality of life for everyone in Wales. We must ensure that that is truly for everyone in Wales, and that means looking in particular at how we might achieve those objectives in areas such as the south Wales Valleys. In terms of the budget-setting exercise, 'Wales: A Better Country' has been the basis for informing that and, as you know, it is about mainstreaming social justice. That is being fed through the spending review and the way in which the budget is allocated.

To go back to the local government formula, there has been a complete review of how personal social services are funded, and deprivation is a strong component of that element of the formula.

**William Graham:** In 'Wales: A Better Country' there is a great emphasis on education. Are you sure that there is enough money allocated to education, particularly for the colleges of south-east Wales, to maintain the same vision?

**Sue Essex:** As you have heard me say, we have put in considerable sums of money in

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y gyllideb ddrafft yn adlewyrchu gwaith yr adolygiad mewnol o wariant a gyhoeddais y llynedd i sicrhau y pennir adnoddau yn unol â'n blaenoriaethau strategol fel y'u nodwyd yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

**Lynne Neagle:** Dau o nodau allweddol 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' yw cyflawnder cymdeithasol a brwydro yn erbyn tlodi. Er mwyn cyflawni'r rhain, yna rhaid targedu polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad megis cynllun gofodol Cymru a buddsoddiad cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol at helpu cymunedau difreintiedig fel y rhai yng Nghymoedd y De fel y gallant hwythau hefyd fod yn rhan o ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd i'r agenda lledaenu ffyniant ran ganolog yng nghyllid arfaethedig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac y bydd blaenoriaethau gwario yn y dyfodol yn adlewyrchu anghenion cymunedau difreintiedig?

**Sue Essex:** Bu ichi sôn am gynllun gofodol Cymru yn arbennig, a rhan o hynny yw ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn gwella ffyniant ac ansawdd bywyd i bawb yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod hynny yn cynnwys pawb yng Nghymru, a golyga hynny ystyried yn arbennig sut y gallem gyflawni'r amcanion hynny mewn ardaloedd megis Cymoedd y De. O ran yr ymarfer i osod y gyllideb, bu 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' yn llywio hynny ac, fel y gwyddoch, ei nod yw prif ffrydio cyflawnder cymdeithasol. Adlewyrchir hynny yn yr adolygiad o wariant a'r ffordd y dyrennir y gyllideb.

Gan ddychwelyd i fformiwla llywodraeth leol, bu adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau cymdeithasol personol eu hariannu, ac mae amddifadedd yn rhan amlwg o'r elfen honno o'r fformiwla.

**William Graham:** Yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', mae pwyslais mawr ar addysg. A ydych yn siŵr fod digon o arian wedi cael ei ddyrannu i addysg, yn enwedig ar gyfer colegau yn y De-ddwyrain, er mwyn cynnal yr un weledigaeth?

**Sue Essex:** Fel yr ydych wedi fy nghlywed yn dweud, yr ydym wedi neilltuo symiau

terms of school buildings. I will not answer your particular point on the colleges now, as I will need to follow that up. However, in terms of school buildings, there has been a big effort and a big commitment to upgrade the quality of those buildings, sometimes through renovation, but often through new build. That is the capital side. On revenue, we have put considerable investment into supporting teachers through the teachers' workload agreement and the pay threshold agreement to try to ensure that teachers feel that they have a secure future, that there is a quality environment and that teaching is a job that they want to be involved in. If you look at the figures on education, William, you will see that we are getting there. We are seeing some tremendous figures come through the schools, as well as through the colleges and the investment in further education.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, nobody can deny that 'Wales: A Better Country' puts great emphasis on improving the health of the people of Wales, and neither can anybody deny that your Government has set a fair amount of money to make that happen. With regard to the £17 million spent on reorganisation, what are you doing, as the Finance Minister, to monitor whether that sum has actually delivered an improvement to the health of the people of Wales?

**Sue Essex:** The core of our reorganisation is bringing in local health boards as key commissioners, providers and representatives of the communities. Under the former health authority system, there was a mismatch between the public voice and public expectation and the managerial delivery of services. I do not know what you feel about that, but it was certainly the case in my area. The intention was there, but the public voice was not heard, and that accountability line was not there. That is why I have always supported the reorganisation and the regional commissioning that is part of it. Time will tell whether it is right, but I have been speaking to many local health boards and local authorities, and I feel positive about this agenda, because action at that local level is needed if you are to get the objectives of 'Health Challenge Wales' to bite in. That is where bringing local government in, particularly with its leisure, education and

mawr o arian ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Nid atebaf eich pwynt penodol ar y colegau yn awr, gan y bydd angen imi ymchwilio i hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran adeiladau ysgolion, bu ymdrech fawr ac ymrwymiad mawr i wella ansawdd yr adeiladu hynny, weithiau drwy adnewyddu, ond yn aml drwy godi adeilad newydd. Dyna'r sefyllfa o ran cyfalaf. O ran refeniw, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi symiau mawr mewn cefnogi athrawon drwy gytundeb llwyth gwaith yr athrawon a'r cytundeb trothwy cyflog i geisio sicrhau bod athrawon yn teimlo bod dyfodol sier ganddynt, bod amgylchedd o safon a bod addysgu yn swydd y maent am ymgymryd â hi. Os edrychwr ar y ffigurau addysg, William, fe welwch ein bod ar y trywydd cywir. Gwelwn rai ffigurau gwych yn dod drwy'r ysgolion, yn ogystal â'r colegau a thrwy'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg bellach.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, ni all neb wadu bod 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' yn rhoi pwyslais mawr ar wella iechyd pobl Cymru, ac ni all neb wadu ychwaith fod eich Llywodraeth wedi pennu cyllid eithaf mawr i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. O ran y £17 miliwn a wariwyd ar ad-drefnu, beth ydych yn ei wneud, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, i fonitro a yw'r swm hwnnw wedi arwain at welliant i iechyd pobl Cymru mewn gwirionedd?

**Sue Essex:** Wrth wraidd ein hymarfer ad-drefnu mae cyflwyno byrddau iechyd leol fel comisiynwyr allweddol, darparwyr a chynrychiolwyr y cymunedau. O dan hen system yr awdurdodau iechyd, nid oedd y llais cyhoeddus yn cyfateb â disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd a'r ffordd yr oedd rheolwyr yn darparu gwasanaethau. Ni wn sut yr ydych yn teimlo am hynny, ond yn sicr yr oedd yn wir yn fy ardal i. Yr oedd y bwriad yno, ond ni chlywyd y llais cyhoeddus, ac nid oedd llinell atebolwydd o'r fath. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi cefnogi'r ymarfer ad-drefnu a'r broses o gomisiynu'n rhanbarthol sy'n rhan ohono o'r dechrau. Amser a ddengys a yw'n iawn, ond yr wyf wedi bod yn siarad â llawer o fyrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol, a theimlaf yn gadarnhaol ynglŷn â'r agenda hon, oherwydd mae angen gweithredu ar y lefel leol honno er mwyn i amcanion 'Her Iechyd Cymru' ddechrau cael dylanwad. Dyna ble mae cynnwys llywodraeth leol, yn enwedig

housing arms, is important. That was not possible under the old arrangement.

yr adrannau hamdden, addysg a thai, yn bwysig. Nid oedd hynny'n bosibl o dan yr hen drefniant.

2.20 p.m.

### Anghenion Ardaloedd o Amddifadedd The Needs of Deprived Communities

**Q7 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on how she takes into account the needs of deprived communities in Wales when formulating the overall budget? (OAQ37830)

**Sue Essex:** This is very much connected to my earlier answer. 'Wales: A Better Country' reflects many of our commitments to social justice and to eliminating deprivation and poverty.

**Lynne Neagle:** As you know, I have long-standing concerns about the impact that sparsity weightings in the local government formula have on deprived communities such as those in my local authority and other Valleys authorities. I remain concerned that there appears to be little in the way of robust evidence to justify this approach. My concerns have been reinforced by recent answers to written Assembly questions. Do you agree that if we are genuinely committed to social justice in Wales, we must ensure that spending takes place in the areas of greatest need? Will you consider this issue carefully with a view to ensuring that, where we give extra money to areas, it is always done on the basis of robust evidence?

**C7 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar sut y mae'n ystyried anghenion ardaloedd o amddifadedd yng Nghymru wrth fformiwlleiddio'r gyllideb gyfan? (OAQ37830)

**Sue Essex:** Mae hyn yn gysylltiedig iawn â'm hateb cynharach. Mae 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' yn adlewyrchu llawer o'n hymrwymiadau i gyflawnader cymdeithasol ac i ddileu amddifadedd a thlodi.

**Lynne Neagle:** Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi bod yn pryderu ers amser ynglŷn ag effaith pwysoliadau ar gyfer ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth yn fformiwla llywodraeth leol ar gymunedau difreintiedig fel y rhai yn fy awdurdod lleol i ac mewn awdurdodau eraill yn y Cymoedd. Pryderaf o hyd nad oes fawr ddim tystiolaeth gadarn, mae'n debyg, i gyflawnhau'r ymagwedd hon. Cadarnheir fy mhryderon gan atebion diweddar i gwestiynau ysgrifenedig y Cynulliad. A gytunwch fod rhaid inni, os ydym yn wir ymrwymedig i gyflawnader cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, sicrhau bod gwariant yn yr ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf? A ystyriwch y mater hwn yn ofalus gyda'r bwriad o sicrhau, lle yr ydym yn rhoi arian ychwanegol i ardaloedd, ein bod bob amser yn gwneud hynny ar sail tystiolaeth gadarn?

**Sue Essex:** I know that you and others feel strongly about this. The main issue is the way in which formula allocations take place. The big formula allocation is in the revenue support grant. You will know that when the Assembly was set up—I think that it was Peter Law who led on this—the formula was completely revamped and changed. Deprivation was brought in as a factor for the first time, and this element of sparsity was also introduced, although sparsity was also very much included by the previous regime in terms of how this was delivered. This year, we have commissioned a special study by

Gwn eich bod chi ac eraill yn teimlo'n gryf ynglŷn â hyn. Y prif fater yw'r ffordd y dyrennir arian o dan y fformiwla. Yn y grant cynnal refeniw ceir y dyraniaid mawr o dan y fformiwla. Fe wyddoch ar ôl sefydlu'r Cynulliad—credaf mai Peter Law a arweiniodd ar hyn—i'r fformiwla gael ei hailwampio a'i newid yn llwyr. Cyflwynwyd amddifadedd yn ffactor am y tro cyntaf, a chyflwynwyd yr elfen hon o ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth, er bod yr hen gyfundrefn hefyd yn rhoi lle amlwg iawn i deneurwydd poblogaeth o ran sut y darparwyd hyn. Eleni, yr ydym wedi comisiynu astudiaeth arbennig

Pion Economics to consider whether the sparsity element in the formula is right. It has considered the issue in terms of dispersal, which is not quite the same as sparsity. I think that sparsity is a somewhat misleading concept. This is about dispersal and how that adds to cost. In that sense, it applies equally in many of our Valley communities as it does in rural areas, as it is about the unit cost of delivering services. That report has been done. I will examine it, and I would be happy to share it with you.

gan Pion Economics i ystyried a yw'r elfen yn y fformiwla ar gyfer teneurwydd poblogaeth yn iawn. Mae wedi ystyried y mater o ran gwasgariad, nad yw'n hollol yr un peth â theneurwydd. Credaf fod teneurwydd poblogaeth yn gysyniad camarweiniol braidd. Mae a wnelo hyn â gwasgariad a sut y mae hynny yn ychwanegu at gostau. O ran hynny, mae yr un mor berthnasol mewn llawer o'n cymunedau yn y Cymoedd ag ydyw yn yr ardaloedd gwledig, am ei fod yn ymwneud â chost uned darparu gwasanaethau. Cwblhawyd yr adroddiad hwnnw. Byddaf yn ei ystyried, a byddwn yn fwya na pharod i'w rannu gyda chi.

**Lisa Francis:** With various changes to general practitioner out-of-hours services in rural areas, many of my constituents feel that the telephone triage system of diagnosis will deprive them of a medical doctor's opinion. That will, ultimately, lead to greater use of ambulance services. Do you have any plans for a contingency fund or to give any extra money to the ambulance services for this reason?

**Lisa Francis:** Yn sgîl amryw newidiadau i wasanaethau meddygon teuluol y tu allan i oriau mewn ardaloedd gwledig, teimla llawer o'm hetholwyr y bydd y system o roi diagnosis a blaenoriaethu cleifion dros y ffôn yn golygu na fyddant yn cael barn meddyg. Bydd hynny, yn y pen draw, yn arwain at ddefnydd helaethach o wasanaethau ambiwlans. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau ar gyfer sefydlu cronfa wrth gefn neu roi arian ychwanegol i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans am y rheswm hwn?

**Sue Essex:** There is a change in the GP contract and the out-of-hours services. It is too soon to say whether the consequences to which you allude will happen. If the local health board has done its commissioning correctly, and if that is set within the Wanless context, the idea of providing that advice and support is to cut back on inappropriate admissions to hospital services. Let us wait and see what the implications are. That possible consequence has not been flagged up with me so far, but I am sure that you and others will keep an eye on it and see where we are going.

**Sue Essex:** Mae contract y meddygon teulu a'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau wedi cael eu newid. Mae'n rhy fuan dweud a fydd y canlyniadau y cyfeiriwch atynt yn digwydd. Os yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi comisiynu'n gywir, ac os yw hynny wedi'i osod yng nghyd-destun Wanless, y syniad o roi'r cyngor a'r cymorth hwnnw yw gostwng nifer y cleifion a gaiff eu derbyn i'r ysbyty yn amhriodol. Gadewch inni aros i weld beth fydd y goblygiadau. Nid oes neb wedi codi'r canlyniad posibl hwnnw gyda mi hyd yn hyn, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi ac eraill yn cadw llygad ar hynny i weld beth yw'r sefyllfa.

#### **Arian a Dderbyniwyd oddi wrth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd Money Received from the European Union**

**Q8 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister explain how much of the Assembly's budget is money received from the European Union? (OAQ37867)

**Sue Essex:** European funding increases the total managed expenditure for the Assembly

**C8 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro faint o gyllideb y Cynulliad sy'n arian a dderbyniwyd gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ37867)

**Sue Essex:** Mae arian Ewropeaidd yn cynyddu cyfanswm gwariant y Cynulliad a

by £417.8 million for 2004-05. It is made up of £239.6 million of departmental expenditure limit and £178.2 million of annually managed expenditure of that, if you understand what I mean—I am sure that you do.

**Jenny Randerson:** European funding is important to the Assembly and to the people of Wales. At the Wales in a new Europe conference, held a few weeks ago, the Treasury spokesperson made it clear that the repatriation of European funds is still on the UK Government's agenda. The European Commission's spokesperson also made it clear that, under the Treasury proposals, Wales will miss out badly. What representations have you made to UK Government Ministers to persuade them that repatriation will not be good for Wales, and what meetings have you had with Government Ministers on this issue?

**Sue Essex:** In terms of whether it is good or not, if it happens, it will be a matter of considering the figures and how they affect Wales. You have had the First Minister's commitment that he will continue to argue for what he believes is best for Wales. I am aware that, at that seminar, there was a difference of opinion, but it is literally about knowing the details before we make a judgment on that. I know that the First Minister has made representations, but I made it clear in, I believe, my last meeting with Mr Boateng, and possibly in the one before that, how important this issue is to Wales, how important structural funds have been, and how important having proper regional funds, in whatever form they come, is for us in the future.

### **Tanwariant yng Nghyllideb y Llywodraeth Underspend in the Government's Budget**

**Q9 David Melding:** What was the level of underspend in the Welsh Assembly Government's budget in 2003-04? (OAQ37862)

**Sue Essex:** You have moved forward a year from your earlier question, David. Those figures are not yet available because it takes some time to judge it. I do not know whether you are aware of the nature of the business

reolir gan £417.8 miliwn ar gyfer 2004-05. Mae'n cynnwys £239.6 miliwn o derfynau gwariant adrannol ac o'r swm hwnnw £178.2 miliwn o wariant a reolir yn flynyddol, os ydych yn deall beth wyf yn ei feddwl—yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi'n deall.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae arian Ewropeaidd yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad ac i bobl Cymru. Yng nghynhadledd Cymru mewn Ewrop newydd, a gynhalwyd ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, eglurodd llefarydd y Trysorlys fod ailwladoli cronfeydd Ewropeaidd yn dal i fod ar agenda Llywodraeth y DU. Eglurodd llefarydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd hefyd y bydd Cymru ar ei cholled yn fawr iawn o dan gynigion y Trysorlys. Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u cyflwyno i Weinidogion Llywodraeth y DU i'w darbwyllo na fydd ailwladoli yn beth da i Gymru, a pha gyfarfodydd yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidog y Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn?

**Sue Essex:** O ran pa un ai peth da ydyw ai peidio, os bydd yn digwydd, bydd yn fater o ystyried y ffigurau a sut y maent yn effeithio ar Gymru. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymrwymo y bydd yn parhau i ddadlau dros yr hyn sydd orau i Gymru yn ei farn ef. Gwn, yn y seminar honno, fod gwahaniaeth barn, ond, yn llythrennol, rhaid inni gael y manylion cyn llunio barn ar hynny. Gwn fod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyflwyno sylwadau, ond eglurais, yn fy nghyfarfod diwethaf gyda Mr Boateng fe gredaf, ac yn yr un cyn hynny o bosibl, pa mor bwysig yw'r mater hwn i Gymru, pa mor bwysig fu cronfeydd strwythurol, a pha mor bwysig fydd cronfeydd rhanbarthol gwirioneddol inni yn y dyfodol, waeth beth fo'u ffurf.

**C9 David Melding:** Beth oedd lefel y tanwariant yng Nghyllideb 2003-04 Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? (OAQ37862)

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych wedi symud flwyddyn ymlaen o'ch cwestiwn cynharach, David. Nid yw'r ffigurau hynny ar gael eto am ei bod yn cymryd amser i ddod i gasgliad ar hyn. Ni wn a ydych yn ymwybodol o natur y busnes

now, but we use resource accounting, which any accountant, I am sure, will understand. It means that you spend a lot of time measuring your assets and what is left of them, so you cannot do it on only a cash difference between reserves. Therefore, I cannot answer your question at present, but I do not believe that it will be much different from what I have said previously.

**David Melding:** I seem to have been alpha and omega this afternoon as far as asking this question is concerned. However, I would hope that you will give the Assembly assurance that we will be looking at 99 per cent plus being expended so that we are distributing and using public money effectively.

**Sue Essex:** Absolutely. Just to reassure you, I have monthly meetings with our finance officials to consider how the budget is being spent. It is not a science; it is difficult to get a match, but we all want to see as close a match as possible, and everyone is in the process of doing that. Much of our money is distributed to organisations, so we do not have that kind of synergy from day to day.

**Jenny Randerson:** There are always underspends, and there are always worthy causes on which money can be spent relatively quickly. I urge you to consider the case of the rapid access breast clinic in Cardiff. One of my constituents was asked to wait 10 weeks before attending the clinic in July. I was then assured by the Minister for Health and Social Services that the matter was being urgently addressed. By September, another constituent was being told that she had 17 weeks to wait. That is a rapid deterioration in service. The local health board has indicated that lack of resources and lack of investment in capital equipment is the problem, and that an early injection of funds could make a rapid improvement. Will you give this matter due consideration?

**Sue Essex:** Underspends do not equate to money not being spent, because there are many other schemes out there that take that

bellach, ond yr ydym yn defnyddio dulliau cyfrifo ar sail adnoddau, y bydd unrhyw gyfrifydd, mae'n siŵr, yn eu deall. Golyga eich bod yn treulio llawer o amser yn mesur eich asedau a'r hyn sy'n weddill, felly nid oes modd gwneud hynny ar sail gwahaniaeth arian parod rhwng cronfeydd wrth gefn yn unig. Felly, ni allaf ateb eich cwestiwn ar hyn o bryd, ond ni chredaf y bydd yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn a ddywedais yn flaenorol.

**David Melding:** Ymddengys mai fi sy'n dechrau a diweddu y prynhawn yma o ran y cwestiwn hwn. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn rhoi sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad y bydd gwariant o fwy na 99 y cant er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn dosbarthu ac yn defnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn effeithiol.

**Sue Essex:** Yn sicr. Er mwyn rhoi sicrwydd ichi, yr wyf yn cyfarfod â'n swyddogion cylid bob mis i ystyried sut y gwerir y gyllideb. Nid ymarfer gwyddonol mohono; mae'n anodd sicrhau bod gwariant yn cyfateb â'r gyllideb, ond mae pob un ohonom am eu gweld yn cyfateb mor agos â phosibl i'w gilydd, ac mae pawb yn y broses o wneud hynny. Dosberthir llawer o'n harian i sefydliadau nad oes gennym y math hwnnw o synergedd â hwy o ddydd i ddydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ceir tanwariant bob amser, ac mae bob amser achosion da y gellir gwario arian arnynt yn gymharol gyflym. Apelias arnoch i ystyried achos clinig y fron â mynediad cyflym yng Nghaerdydd. Gofynnwyd i un o'm hetholwyr aros 10 wythnos cyn mynychu'r clinig ym mis Gorffennaf. Yna cefais sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr eid i'r afael â mater ar fyrdwr. Erbyn mis Medi, dywedwyd wrth fenyw arall yn fy etholaeth fod yn rhaid iddi aros 17 wythnos. Mae hynny'n waethygied sydyn yn y gwasanaeth. Mae'r bwrrdd iechyd lleol wedi nodi mai prinder adnoddau a dim buddsoddiad mewn offer cyfalaif yw'r broblem, ac y gellid gwella'r gwasanaeth yn gyflym pe rhoddid arian yn gynnar iddo. A wnewch roi ystyriaeth briodol i'r mater hwn?

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw tanwariant yn gyfystyr â pheidio â gwario arian, am fod llawer o gynlluniau eraill a all dderbyn yr arian

funding. Therefore, I would not want anyone to walk away with the idea that an underspend sits in a reserve and is not used at all; it is used. On the case that you mention, as a local constituency AM, I am also taking that up, and I share your concerns. I know that Jane Hutt is in contact with the trust, and there is a way forward.

hwnnw. Felly, nid wyf am i neb feddwl y rhoddir arian nas gwariwyd mewn cronfa wrth gefn ac na chaiff ei ddefnyddio byth; fe gaiff ei wario. O ran yr achos y cyfeiriwch ato, fel AC etholaethol yn lleol, yr wyf hefyd yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwnnw, a rhannaf eich pryderon. Gwn fod Jane Hutt mewn cysylltiad â'r ymddiriedolaeth, a bod ffordd ymlaen.

### Pŵer Benthyca'r Cynulliad The Borrowing Power of the Assembly

**Q10 Michael German:** What representations has the Minister made towards equalising the borrowing power of the Assembly with that of the putative Northern Ireland Assembly and the Scottish Parliament? (OAQ37851)

**Sue Essex:** Our borrowing powers are set out in the Government of Wales Act 1998. They are consistent with those available to the Scottish Parliament. Different borrowing arrangements apply in Northern Ireland because its public services are structured differently.

**Michael German:** Do you agree that it would be sensible to examine in detail the powers that the Northern Ireland Assembly has, when it is not suspended, to borrow money in order to invest for the future in structural programmes that it believes are essential to the redevelopment and regeneration of its country? Do you believe that such a proposal might be worth considering for Wales?

**Sue Essex:** I am aware of the situation in Northern Ireland because I have frequent discussions with a representative from the Northern Ireland Assembly. However, we receive our funding through the Barnett formula, which should enable us do the many things that we want to do. If you write to me with the details of where you think we can progress, I would be grateful.

**C10 Michael German:** Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cyflwyno o ran sicrhau bod pŵer benthyca'r Cynulliad yn gyfartal ag eiddo Cynulliad tybiedig Gogledd Iwerddon a Senedd yr Alban? (OAQ37851)

**Sue Essex:** Nodir ein pwerau benthyca yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Maent yn gyson â'r hyn sydd ar gael i Senedd yr Alban. Ceir trefniadau benthyca gwahanol yng Ngogledd Iwerddon am fod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wedi'u strwythuro'n wahanol.

**Michael German:** A gytunwch y byddai'n ddoeth astudio'n fanwl bwerau Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, pan nad yw wedi'i atal, i fenthyc arian er mwyn buddsoddi at y dyfodol mewn rhaglenni strwythurol y cred eu bod yn hanfodol i ailddatblygu ac adfywio ei wlad? A gredwch y gellid bod yn fuddiol ystyried cynnig o'r fath i Gymru?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa yng Ngogledd Iwerddon am fy mod yn cael trafodaethau yn fynych gyda chynrychiolydd o Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon. Fodd bynnag, cawn ein harian drwy fformiwla Barnett, a ddylai fod yn fodd inni wneud y lliaws o bethau yr ydym am eu gwneud. Os ysgrifennwch ataf gyda manylion ynglŷn â sut y gallwn weithredu ar hyn yn eich barn chi, byddwn yn ddiolchgar.

2.30 p.m.

## Cyllid Ychwanegol ar gyfer y Portffolio Diwylliant Additional Funding for the Culture Portfolio

**C11 Owen John Thomas:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi derbyn cais am gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y portffolio diwylliant? (OAQ37857)

**Sue Essex:** I will submit the draft budget in October, so you will not have to wait long. I have discussed proposals for additional funding with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport as part of my budget planning.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fel y gwyddoch, bu i Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru dderbyn £100,000 yn llai y flwyddyn rhwng 1996 a 2003, sef cyfanswm o oddeutu £600,000 yn llai, nag a gafodd yn y gorffennol. A wnewch ystyried hynny a'r ffaith bod y Prif Weinidog wedi gwario £1.1 miliwn ar gomisiynu adroddiad comisiwn Richard a'i fod wedi penderfynu ei anwybyddu'n llwyr?

**Sue Essex:** He has not completely ignored the Richard commission report, although you may wish to spread that premise. The Labour Party held a successful full-day discussion on the report. Clearly, many people are engaged. I will discuss the eisteddfod with Alun Pugh as the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

**Q11 Owen John Thomas:** Has the Minister received a case for additional funding for the culture portfolio? (OAQ37857)

**Sue Essex:** Cyflwynaf y gyllideb ddrafft ym mis Hydref, felly ni fydd yn rhaid ichi aros yn hir. Yr wyf wedi trafod cynigion ar gyfer cyllid ychwanegol gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon fel rhan o'm gwaith cynllunio ar y gyllideb.

**Owen John Thomas:** As you know, between 1996 and 2003 the National Eisteddfod of Wales received £100,000 less per year, which amounts to around £600,000 less, than it received previously. Will you consider that and the fact that the First Minister has spent £1.1 million on commissioning the Richard commission report and has decided to ignore it out of hand?

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw wedi anwybyddu adroddiad comisiwn Richard yn llwyr, er eich bod yn awyddus i ddweud hynny. Cynhaliodd y Blaid Lafur drafodaeth undydd lwyddiannus ar yr adroddiad. Yn amlwg, mae wedi ennyn diddordeb llawer o bobl. Trafodaf yr eisteddfod gydag Alun Pugh fel y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

## Siambrau Newydd y Cynulliad The New Assembly Chamber

**Q12 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress made with the building work on the new Assembly Chamber over the summer recess? (OAQ37868)

**Sue Essex:** I am glad that we have reached this question as I am pleased to announce that work on the new Assembly building is progressing well. I refer the Member to the new Assembly building website, where progress updates are posted at the end of each month. Any Member who is interested—and that includes my Conservative colleagues—would be welcome to visit the building.

**C12 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hynt y gwaith o adeiladu Siambrau newydd y Cynulliad yn ystod toriad yr haf? (OAQ37868)

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cyrraedd y cwestiwn hwn oherwydd mae'n bleser gennyf gyhoeddi bod y gwaith ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad yn mynd rhagddo'n dda. Cyfeiriaf yr Aelod at wefan adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, lle y cyhoeddir y diweddaraf ar ddiwedd pob mis. Mae croeso i unrhyw Aelod sydd â diddordeb—ac mae hynny'n cynnwys fy nghyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol—ymweld â'r adeilad.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that encouraging answer. Unlike colleagues in the Conservative Party, I am looking forward to visiting the building. When will we be able to do that? I take particular interest in the renewable energy resources that will heat the building. Has any progress been made on the proposal to build a wind turbine on the Cardiff bay barrage to produce additional renewable energy for the building?

**Sue Essex:** If I give you an inch, you will take a mile, Mick—or half a mile, which is the distance from the building to the barrage. I am sure that any Member would be welcome to visit the building as long as they arrange it through the Assembly new building team.

We should be proud of the renewables and the sustainable resources used in the building. It is leading the way, although we do not know how successful it will be. I will pass on your query about the wind turbine to Andrew Davies, who is better judged to answer it.

**The Presiding Officer:** In order to be fair and balanced, I call on David Davies.

**David Davies:** Is there any truth in the rumour that I have heard that the new Assembly building website will be called wasteofmoney.com and will list all the schools, hospitals and other schemes that the money could have been spent on had it not been spent on that building?

**Sue Essex:** I think that it is extremely insulting of you, Presiding Officer, to refer to David Davies as being fair and balanced. You take that as an affront do you not, David? If you feel so strongly about this issue, you will feel unable to take up your place in the new building. The rest of us will be there, but I am not sure that you will be, for a variety of reasons. However, having stood for election and having been elected as the first-past-the-post Member for the Conservative Party, I would have thought that you would have a duty to your constituents to take up your place in the new building.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch i chi am yr ateb calonogol hwnnw. Yn wahanol i'n cyd-Aelodau yn y Blaid Geidwadol, edrychaf ymlaen at ymweld â'r adeilad. Pryd y gallwn wneud hynny? Mae gennyl ddiddordeb arbennig yn yr adnoddau ynni adnewyddadwy a fydd yn gwresogi'r adeilad. A wnaed unrhyw gynnydd i adeiladu tyrbin gwynt ar forglawdd bae Caerdydd i gynhyrchu rhagor o ynni adnewyddadwy i'r adeilad?

**Sue Essex:** Os rhoddaf i chi fodfedd, fe gymerwch chi filltir, Mick—neu hanner milltir, sef y pellter o'r adeilad i'r morglawdd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai croeso i unrhyw Aelod ymweld â'r adeilad cyhyd ag y bônt yn trefnu hynny drwy dîm adeilad newydd y Cynulliad.

Dylem ymfalchiö yn yr ynni adnewyddadwy a'r adnoddau cynaliadwy a ddefnyddir yn yr adeilad. Mae'n arwain y gad, er na wyddom pa mor llwyddiannus fydd. Trosglwyddaf i'ch ymholiad ynglŷn â'r tyrbin gwynt i Andrew Davies, a fydd yn gallu ei ateb yn well.

**Y Llywydd:** Er mwyn bod yn deg ac yn gytbwys, galwaf ar David Davies.

**David Davies:** A oes unrhyw wirionedd yn y si a glywais mai enw gwefan adeilad newydd y Cynulliad fydd gwastraffarian.com ac y bydd yn rhestru'r holl ysgolion, ysbytai a chynlluniau eraill y gellid bod wedi gwario'r arian arnynt pe na bai wedi cael ei wario ar yr adeilad hwnnw?

**Sue Essex:** Credaf ei bod yn hynod sarhaus ichi, Lywydd, gyfeirio at David Davies fel un teg a chytbwys. Teimlwch fod hynny'n sarhad, onid ydych, David? Os teimlwch mor gryf ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, ni fyddwch yn teimlo y gallwch dderbyn eich lle yn yr adeilad newydd. Bydd y gweddill ohonom yno, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddwch chi yno, am amryw resymau. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl sefyll fel ymgeisydd mewn etholiad ac ar ôl cael eich ethol yn Aelod y cyntaf i'r felin dros y Blaid Geidwadol, byddwn wedi meddwl y byddech yn teimlo o dan ddyletswydd i'ch etholwyr i dderbyn eich lle yn yr adeilad newydd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you, Presiding Officer, for calling me in the spirit of fairness and balance. Minister, do you think that David Davies will have the nerve to take his seat in the new building? Do you also think that he will bring visitors from Monmouth to the new building, because I am sure that many of his constituents will be desperate to see this wonderful venture that will be available to us next year?

**Sue Essex:** The serious point, whether you agree or disagree with the construction of the new building, is that we have made a major commitment. It is a major piece of architecture that will stand the test of time, and people will look back to this period and say 'how wise they were to make this difficult decision'. It will be a flagship building for Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** For the avoidance of doubt, the expression 'fair and balanced' referred to my practice of calling Members evenly, from all sides of the Chamber.

### Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

#### Datblygu Cynaliadwy (Targedau'r Llywodraeth) Sustainable Development (Government Targets)

**Q1 Michael German:** What progress has been made in meeting the Government's targets with regard to sustainable development? (OAQ37796)

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** Our annual report on progress on sustainable development for 2003-04, which will be debated on 13 October alongside our new action plan, records favourable movement in at least five of our 12 adopted indicators.

**Michael German:** Will you comment on the renewable energy target of meeting 10 per cent of our energy needs from renewable sources by 2010? Given the slowness of development and the difficulties faced, how convinced are you that we will reach this target by 2010?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch i chi, Lywydd, am fy ngalw er mwyn tegwch a chydbwysedd. Weinidog, a gredwch y bydd David Davies yn ddigon hyf i dderbyn ei le yn yr adeilad newydd? A gredwch hefyd y bydd yn dod ag ymwelwyr o Drefynwy i'r adeilad newydd, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o'i etholwyr yn hynod awyddus i weld y fenter wych hon a fydd ar gael inni y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Sue Essex:** Y pwynt difrifol yw, pa un a gytunwch â'r penderfyniad i godi adeilad newydd ai peidio, ein bod wedi gwneud ymrwymiad mawr. O ran pensaerniaeth, mae'n adeilad pwysig a ddeil brawf amser, a bydd pobl yn edrych yn ôl ar y cyfnod hwn ac yn dweud 'dyna ddoeth yr oeddent i wneud y penderfyniad anodd hon'. Bydd yn adeilad blaenllaw i Gymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Er mwyn osgoi amheuaeth, cyfeiriodd yr ymadrodd 'yn deg ac yn gytbwys' at fy arfer o alw Aelodau yn deg, o bob ochr o'r Siambra.

**C1 Michael German:** Pa gynnydd a wnaed o ran cyrraedd targedau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ37796)

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae ein hadroddiad blynnyddol ar y cynnydd a wneir o ran datblygu cynaliadwy ar gyfer 2003-04, a drafodir ar 13 Hydref ochr yn ochr â'n cynllun gweithredu newydd, yn cofnodi cynnydd mewn o leiaf bump o'r 12 dangosydd a fabwysiadwyd gennym.

**Michael German:** A wnewch sylwadau ar y targed ynni adnewyddadwy o sicrhau bod 10 y cant o'n hanghenion ynni yn cael eu diwallu drwy ffynonellau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010? O gofio pa mor araf y mae pethau'n datblygu a'r anawsterau a wynebir, pa mor argyhoedddeg ydych y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targed hwn erbyn 2010?

**Carwyn Jones:** I am confident that the target can be reached.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is nice to see such confidence, Minister. I am not sure that it is universally shared, but let us hope that you are right. What are you doing to monitor the work of Assembly sponsored public bodies in terms of their delivery on the Government's sustainability target? What steps will you take to ensure that the bodies to be taken under direct Government control are taking their sustainable development responsibilities seriously and mainstreaming them into their work, not responding on a project-by-project basis?

**Carwyn Jones:** The scheme and the action plan will outline what ASPBs will need to do. As far as the future structure of ASPBs is concerned, our commitment to sustainable development will still be delivered by whatever structure succeeds them.

**Glyn Davies:** I listened carefully to your response to Mike German. Technical advice note 8 has been published and outlines how you intend to reach the 10 per cent target. There is a great deal of concern that there is too great a focus on one energy source, rather than on a wider range of energy sources. This is being driven by the 2010 deadline. Have you considered moving this deadline, so that you can achieve the 10 per cent target by focusing on a range of sources that require further development?

**Carwyn Jones:** The 2010 target stands. A number of energy sources can be used, but wind power stands out as being the most likely source, and wind farms can be placed in appropriate areas, as outlined in TAN 8. However, any support among Members for nuclear energy should be made clear.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn hyderus y gellir cyrraedd y targed.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n braf gweld y fath hyder, Weinidog. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw pawb yr un mor hyderus, ond gobeithio mai chi sy'n iawn. Beth ydych yn ei wneud i fonitro gwaith cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad i gyrraedd targed y Llywodraeth o ran cynaliadwyedd? Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod y cyrff y bwriedir i'r Llywodraeth eu rheoli'n uniongyrchol yn cymryd eu cyfrifoldebau o ran datblygu cynaliadwy o ddifrif ac yn eu prif ffrydio yn eu gwaith, yn hytrach nag ymateb fesul prosiect?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd y cynllun a'r cynllun gweithredu yn amlinellu'r hyn y bydd angen i CCNC ei wneud. O ran strwythur CCNC yn y dyfodol, mae'n dal yn wir y caiff ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ei gyflawni drwy ba strwythur bynnag a fydd yn eu holynu.

**Glyn Davies:** Gwrandewais yn astud at eich ymateb i Mike German. Cyhoeddwyd nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ac mae'n amlinellu sut y bwriadwch gyrraedd y targed o 10 y cant. Mae cryn bryder y canolbwytir yn ormodol ar un ffynhonnell o ynni, yn hytrach nag ar ystod eang o ffynonellau ynni. Y dyddiad terfynol o 2012 sy'n gorfodi hyn. A ydych wedi ystyried newid y dyddiad terfynol hwn, fel y gallwch gyflawni'r targed o 10 y cant drwy ganolbwytio ar amrywiaeth o ffynonellau y mae angen eu datblygu ymhellach?

**Carwyn Jones:** Saif y targed o 2010 fel y mae. Gellir defnyddio nifer o ffynonellau ynni, ond mae ynni gwynt yn amlwg fel y ffynhonnell fwyaf tebygol, a gellir lleoli ffermydd gwynt mewn ardaloedd priodol, fel yr amlinellir yn nodyn cyngor technegol 8. Fodd bynnag, dylai unrhyw gefnogaeth i ynni niwclear ymhlið yr Aelodau gael ei nodi'n glir.

### Lleihau Gwastraff Plastig Reducing Plastic Waste

**C2 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar beth sydd yn cael ei

**Q2 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on what is being done to

wneud i leihau gwastraff plastig? reduce plastic waste? (OAQ37781)  
(OAQ37781)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn cefnogi cynlluniau i gasglu plastig a defnyddiau eraill i'w hailgylchu drwy gynnig grantiau penodol i awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi ymdrechion rhaglen weithredu'r cynllun gwastraff ac adnoddau ac Ymddiriedolaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru i ddatblygu marchnadoedd ar gyfer plastig wedi'i ailgylchu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi cysylltu ag archfarchnadoedd i ofyn sut y maent yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r mater pwysig hwn oherwydd, ar gyfartaledd, mae pob person yng Nghymru yn defnyddio naw bag plastig yr wythnos. Sut y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn argymhell a chefnogi lleihau'r defnydd o fagiau plastig a hybu'r defnydd o fagiau a wneir o ddeunydd gwahanol megis papur?

2.40 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r defnydd o fagiau papur yn gyffredin yn nifer o archfarchnadoedd Iwerddon. Yr wyf yn bwriadu trafod y mater hwn gyda'r archfarchnadoedd dros y misoedd nesaf. Mae rhai archfarchnadoedd eisoes yn casglu bagiau plastig i'w hailgylchu.

**Bryngle Williams:** Do you agree that Wales needs to look at the success of companies such as Nextech Ltd of Stafford, which developed the world's first plastic densifiers that reduce discarded plastic, including expanded polystyrene, by more than 85 per cent? In the light of this, will you instruct officials to bring forward a report to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee to discuss the way forward on this important matter?

**Carwyn Jones:** You have raised an interesting point. We are keen to learn from experiences elsewhere. I am now aware of this as a potential topic for discussion by the committee, and I look forward to hearing the question being raised.

**Janet Davies:** Like some other councils,

**Carwyn Jones:** The Assembly Government already supports the collection of plastic and other materials for recycling through specific grants to local authorities. We also support the work of the waste and resources action programme and the Wales Environment Trust in developing markets for the use of secondary plastic.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats have contacted supermarkets to ask how they intend to deal with this important issue because, on average, every person in Wales uses nine plastic bags each week. What plans does your Government have to recommend and support a reduction in the use of plastic bags and promote the use of bags made of alternative materials such as paper?

**Carwyn Jones:** The use of paper bags is already commonplace in many Irish supermarkets. I intend to discuss this issue with the supermarkets over the next months. Some supermarkets already collect plastic bags for recycling.

**Bryngle Williams:** A gytunwch fod angen i Gymru edrych ar lwyddiant cwmniau megis Nextech Ltd o Stafford, a ddatblygodd y periant cyntaf i ddwysâu plastig. Mae'n lleihau plastig a waredwyd, gan gynnwys polystyren ehangedig dros 85 y cant? Yng ngoleuni hyn, a ofynnwch i swyddogion gyflwyno adroddiad i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i drafod y ffordd ymlaen o ran y mater hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydych wedi codi pwyt diddorol. Yr ydym yn awyddus i ddysgu o brofiadau mewn mannau eraill. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hyn bellach fel pwnc posibl i'r pwylgor ei drafod, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed y cwestiwn yn cael ei godi.

**Janet Davies:** Fel rhai cynghorau eraill,

Plaid Cymru in Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council introduced a kerbside collection scheme for plastic bottles, jars and other material. What discussions do you have with councils that have not yet introduced such a scheme, and with the present administration of Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council to ensure that its scheme continues and grows?

**Carwyn Jones:** We are awaiting data from all local councils to see their progress in reaching the targets outlined in 'Wise about Waste'. When this is done, I will examine how we can encourage local authorities to look at best practice across the rest of Wales and learn from it.

cyflwynodd Plaid Cymru yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Rhondda Cynon Taf gynllun casglu o fin y ffordd ar gyfer poteli plastig, jariau a mathau eraill o ddeunydd. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cael gyda chyngorau nad ydynt wedi cyflwyno cynllun o'r fath eto a chyda gweinyddiaeth bresennol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf i sicrhau bod ei gynllun yn parhau ac yn tyfu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn aros am ddata oddi wrth bob cyngor lleol i weld faint o gynnydd a wneir ganddynt i gyrraedd y targedau a nodir yn 'Yn Gall gyda Gwastraff'. Ar ôl i hyn gael ei wneud, byddaf yn archwilio sut y gallwn annog awdurdodau lleol i edrych ar arfer gorau ar draws gweddill Cymru a dysgu oddi wrtho.

### **Ailgylchu o Fin y Ffordd Kerbside Recycling**

**Q3 Michael German:** Will the Minister make a statement on kerbside recycling? (OAQ37795)

**Carwyn Jones:** The Assembly waste strategy for Wales sets local authorities escalating targets so that by 2009-10 at least 40 per cent of municipal waste is recycled or composted.

**Michael German:** The figures that I have received from the Assembly Parliamentary Service show that there is a great difference in the way councils have implemented kerbside recycling. What measures are in place to ensure that this money, which is hypothecated for waste management, is used for a greater amount of recycling, in order to meet the targets that you have set?

**Carwyn Jones:** There are exemplar authorities which might be expected to be further ahead than other local authorities. We aim to use the examples set by those exemplar authorities to provide examples of good practice to other local authorities. I wish to encourage as much kerbside collection as possible, because the easier it is for people to recycle, the more recycling will take place.

**C3 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gasglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu o fin y ffordd? (OAQ37795)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae strategaeth wastraff Cymru y Cynulliad yn nodi targedau cynyddol awdurdodau lleol nes y bydd o leiaf 40 y cant o wastraff trefol yn cael ei ailgylchu neu ei gompostio erbyn 2009-10.

**Michael German:** Dengys y ffigurau a gefais oddi wrth Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad fod gwahaniaeth mawr yn y ffordd y mae cyngorau wedi mynd ati i gasglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu o fin y ffordd. Pa fesurau sydd ar waith i sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwn, sydd wedi'i neilltuo'n arbennig ar gyfer rheoli gwastraff, ei ddefnyddio i ailgylchu mwy o wastraff, er mwyn cyrraedd y targedau a osodwyd gennych?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae awdurdodau enghreifftiol y byddech yn disgwyli iddynt fod ar y blaen i awdurdodau lleol eraill. Ein nod yw defnyddio esiampl yr awdurdodau enghreifftiol hynny i roi enghreifftiau o arfer da i awdurdodau lleol eraill. Hoffwn annog cyngorau i gasglu cymaint o wastraff o fin y ffordd â phosibl, oherwydd po hawsaf fydd ailgylchu i bobl, y mwyaf o wastaff a gaiff ei ailgylchu.

**John Griffiths:** Newport Wastesavers is an exemplar in recycling. I know that you are aware of its activities. Are you aware of the latest developments whereby there will be a pilot scheme next month involving 9,000 houses across Newport having their recycling boxes collected weekly, whereas rubbish for landfill will be collected fortnightly? In about six weeks' time, a £1.5 million Cleanstream resource centre will be opened with a recycling depot, training workshops for socially excluded people, and an education centre. Do you agree that this shows the way forward?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have visited Newport Wastesavers. It is an excellent organisation. Increasing the frequency of kerbside collection is one way of encouraging recycling. If kerbside collection takes place infrequently, people would be less likely to include materials in the bags earmarked for recycling.

**Alun Cairns:** Minister, do you accept that it is far more expensive to introduce kerbside recycling in rural areas? The formula by which funding for local authorities is calculated for rural areas goes as the crow flies. Do you therefore accept that this type of service would need additional money from the Assembly for those local authorities that are largely rural?

**Carwyn Jones:** No local authorities—urban or rural—have communicated to me any difficulties that they have in terms of funding for kerbside collection.

**Carl Sargeant:** Will you join me in congratulating Flintshire County Council on its excellent recycling scheme? The recycling target is 15 per cent, and Flintshire County Council is currently exceeding that level, at 19 per cent.

**Carwyn Jones:** That is an excellent example of what can be done and I congratulate Flintshire County Council on its work so far.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ37827) yn ôl.

**John Griffiths:** Mae Newport Wastesavers yn esiampl o ran ailgylchu. Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol o'i weithgareddau. A wyddoch am y datblygiadau diweddaraf lle y cynhelir cynllun peilot y mis nesaf a fydd yn golygu casglu blychau ailgylchu bob wythnos o 9,000 o dai ar draws Casnewydd, tra'n casglu sbwriel ar gyfer safleoedd tirlenwi bob pythefnos? Ymhen rhyw chwe wythnos, bydd canolfan adnoddau Cleanstream gwerth £1.5 miliwn yn agor gyda depo ailgylchu, gweithdai hyfforddi i bobl sy'n cael eu hallgáu'n gymdeithasol, ynghyd â chanolfan addysg. A gytunwch fod hyn yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi ymweld â Newport Wastesavers. Mae'n sefydliad ardderchog. Mae casglu gwastraff o fin y ffordd yn amlach yn un ffordd o annog pobl i ailgylchu. Os mai anaml y cesglir gwastraff o fin o ffordd, mae pobl yn llai tebygol o gynnwys deunyddiau yn y cydynnau ar gyfer ailgylchu.

**Alun Cairns:** Weinidog, a dderbynwch ei bod yn llawer drutach cyflwyno cynllun casglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu o fin y ffordd mewn ardaloedd gwledig? Mae'r fformiwla a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo cyllid awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig yn mesur pellter fel yr hed y frân. Felly a dderbynwch y byddai angen i'r Cynulliad roi arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y math hwn o wasanaeth i'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sy'n wledig yn bennaf?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes yr un awdurdod lleol—trefol neu wledig—wedi dweud wrthyf am unrhyw anawsterau sydd ganddynt o ran ariannu casglu gwastraff o fin y ffordd.

**Carl Sargeant:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir y Fflint ar ei gynllun ailgylchu ardderchog? Pymtheg y cant yw'r targed ailgylchu, ac mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn rhagori ar hynny, gan ailgylchu 19 y cant.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dyna enghraifft ardderchog arall o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud a llongyfarchaf Gyngor Sir y Fflint ar ei waith hyd yn hyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4 (OAQ37827) has been withdrawn.

## Rheoli Fermin ar Ffermydd Vermin Control on Farms

**Q5 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on vermin control on farms? (OAQ37826)

**Carwyn Jones:** Vermin control on farms is a matter for farmers.

**Mark Isherwood:** I hope that we can develop that a little. What representations have you made to your Westminster colleagues to champion the agreement of the Burns inquiry with the Farmers Union of Wales, namely that there is no suitable alternative to using dogs when it comes to controlling predatory foxes, particularly in the Welsh uplands?

**Carwyn Jones:** None. It is not a devolved matter.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae amaeth yn rhan o’ch cyfrifoldebau ac yr ydych yn delio’n ddyddiol gyda ffermwyr a’u hundebau, felly pa gyngor y byddwch yn ei roi i ffermwyr mynydd Cymru ar reoli llwynogod oni chânt ddefnyddio cŵn i’w codi o fforestydd a thir gwylt? Mae honno’n broblem ymarferol a bydd yn rhaid i chi, fel penneth y gwasanaeth amaethyddol yng Nghymru, fod yn barod i’w thrafod gyda’r ffermwyr. A ydych o blaid cyfaddawd Prif Weinidog y DU i roi trwyddedau i rai helfeydd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Deallaf fod problemau gyda llwynogod mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru ac y mae’n gyfrifoldeb ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i gynghori ffermwyr beth bynnag am ganlyniad y Mesur gerbron San Steffan ar hyn o bryd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you acknowledge that many people, like me, do not consider foxes to be vermin?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yes.

**Kirsty Williams:** Foxes are not the only vermin that need to be controlled on farms across Wales. Badgers also need to be controlled. How many badger control

**C5 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar reoli fermin ar ffermydd? (OAQ37826)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mater i ffermwyr yw rheoli fermin ar ffermydd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gobeithiaf y gallwn ymhelaethu ar hynny. Pa sylwadau yr ydych wedi’u cyflwyno i’ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan i hybu cytundeb ymchwiliad Burns gydag Undeb Amaethwyr Cymru, sef nad oes unrhyw ddull addas arall ac eithrio defnyddio cŵn i reoli llwynogod ysglyfaethus, yn enwedig ar uwchdiredd Cymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Dim. Nid mater datganoledig ydyw.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Agriculture is one of your responsibilities and you deal with farmers and their unions daily, therefore, what advice will you give Welsh hill farmers on controlling foxes if they are not allowed to use dogs to flush them out of forests and uncultivated land? That is a practical problem and you, as head of the agricultural service in Wales, will have to be prepared to discuss that with the farmers. Are you in favour of the Prime Minister’s compromise to license some hunts?

**Carwyn Jones:** I understand that there are problems with foxes in some parts of Wales and the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs and the Assembly Government have a responsibility to advise farmers regardless of the result of the Bill currently before Parliament.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A gydnabyddwch fod llawer o bobl, fel minnau, o’r farn nad fermin yw llwynogod?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cydnabyddaf hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid llwynogod yw’r unig fermin y mae angen eu rheoli ar ffermydd ledled Cymru. Mae angen rheoli moch daear hefyd. Faint o drwyddedau rheoli moch daear

licences have been issued?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will write to you with an answer. It is important to remember that the definition of vermin varies according to the individual's perception of the animal.

a roddwyd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r ateb. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod y diffiniad o fermin yn amrywio yn ôl canfyddiad yr unigolyn o'r anifail.

### Gwrychoedd Uchel High Hedges

**Q6 Sandy Mewies:** Will the Minister make a statement regarding the implementation of Part 8 of the Anti-social Behaviour Act relating to high hedges? (OAQ37774)

**Carwyn Jones:** We have consulted on draft regulations needed to implement the new powers to handle complaints about nuisance high hedges. I anticipate that the complaints system will be in place before the end of this year.

**Sandy Mewies:** It is unfortunate that the problem of high hedges has come to the point where legislation is required, but it is a fact that many of us will have a great deal of case work involving high hedges. Could you, with local government, ensure, following the enactment of these new powers, that this matter will be widely publicised because many people are waiting to take action on this?

**C6 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynglych gweithredu Rhan 8 y Ddeddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol sy'n ymwneud â gwrychoedd uchel? (OAQ37774)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar y rheoliadau drafft sydd eu hangen i weithredu'r pwerau newydd i ymdrin â chwynion ynglŷn â gwrychoedd uchel sy'n niwsans. Rhagwelaf y bydd y system gwyno ar waith cyn diwedd y flwyddyn.

**Sandy Mewies:** Mae'n anffodus bod y broblem o ran gwrychoedd uchel wedi cyrraedd y fath sefyllfa lle mae angen deddfwriaeth, ond y gwir yw y bydd llawer ohonom yn cael cryn dipyn o waith yn ymwneud â gwrychoedd uchel. A allech chi, gyda llywodraeth leol, sicrhau, ar ôl i'r pwerau newydd hyn ddod i rym, y caiff y mater hwn lawer o gyhoeddusrwydd oherwydd mae llawer o bobl yn aros i gymryd camau ar hyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** I entirely agree. I have a caseload along the same lines. You are right to say that many people are waiting for the outcome of the legislative process before taking action and it will be important to publicise that when the law changes.

**Carwyn Jones:** Cytunaf yn llwyr. Mae gennylf faich achosion tebyg. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud bod llawer o bobl yn aros am ganlynaid y broses ddeddfwriaethol cyn gweithredu ac y bydd yn bwysig rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd i hynny pan fydd y gyfraith yn newid.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I believe that it is recommended that any work on hedges should not take place between March and August owing to the need to protect nesting birds. Could high hedge regulations contravene any wildlife protection legislation?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Credaf yr argymhellir na ddylid gwneud unrhyw waith ar wrychoedd rhwng Mawrth ac Awst oherwydd yr angen i ddiogelu adar sy'n nythu. A allai rheoliadau gwrychoedd uchel fynd yn groes i unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth i ddiogelu bywyd gwylt?

**Carwyn Jones:** No, we do not anticipate that.

**Carwyn Jones:** Na, nid ydym yn rhagweld y bydd hynny yn digwydd.

### Taliadau'r Cynllun Dros-30-mis The Over-30-month Scheme Payments

**C7 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynigion arfaethedig DEFRA ynghylch taliadau o fewn y cynllun dros-30-mis? (OAQ37789)

**Carwyn Jones:** Y mae DEFRA wedi trafod y cynnig i ddiddymu'r iawndal ar fustych a heffrod a fydd yn cael eu cynnwys o fewn y cynllun gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r diwydiant amaeth mewn dau gyfarfod.

**Elin Jones:** A gytunwch ei bod yn annheg fod DEFRA yn ystyried torri'r taliadau i ffermwyr ar y cynllun hwn tra'n parhau i wrthod codi'r gwaharddiad arno, er nad oes bellach sail wyddonol, yn ôl yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd, i gadw'r gwaharddiad hwn ar y cynllun 30-mis?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'r dduau beth yn wahanol. Rhaid i ni ystyried yn fanwl sut i godi'r gwaharddiad yn y lle cyntaf er mwyn sicrhau y caiff hyder prynwyr a'r cyhoedd ei gynnal. Y mae data ar gael sy'n dangos nad yw'r taliadau'n effeithiol o ran bustych a heffrod.

**Bryngle Williams:** Do you agree that many farmers are experiencing a problem with regard to heifers and getting them into calf? Farmers have cattle on their hands with which they can do nothing because they have gone over 30-months. That is why the scheme must be considered carefully.

**Carwyn Jones:** The OTMS data with regard to heifers, particularly with late-finished animals, indicates that the majority of heifers being introduced into the scheme are failed breeders, and that is not necessarily what the scheme is meant to cover.

**Mick Bates:** Will you clarify the position on the funding released by the reduction in the age limit in the 30-month scheme, which will be used for the fallen stock scheme? How long will that money be available from the OTMS for the fallen stock scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** That matter has not been under discussion and no time limit has been imposed.

**Q7 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on DEFRA's proposals regarding payments within the over-30-month scheme? (OAQ37789)

**Carwyn Jones:** DEFRA has discussed the proposal to zero rate compensation for steers and heifers entering the scheme with representatives of the agriculture industry at two meetings.

**Elin Jones:** Do you agree that it is unfair for DEFRA to consider cutting payments to farmers on this scheme while continuing to refuse to lift the ban on the scheme even though there is no longer any scientific basis, according to the Food Standards Agency, to retain the ban on the 30-month scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** The two things are different. We have to look in detail at how to lift the ban in the first instance so that we can ensure that consumer and public confidence is maintained. There is data available showing that the payments are not effective in terms of steers and heifers.

**Bryngle Williams:** A gytunwch fod llawer o ffermwyr yn cael problem o ran heffrod a sicrhau eu bod yn gyflo? Mae ffermwyr yn magu gwartheg na allant wneud dim gyda hwy am eu bod yn hŷn na 30 mis. Dyna pam y mae'n rhaid ystyried y cynllun yn ofalus.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dengys data o'r Cynllun Dros Dri Deg Mis o ran heffrod, yn enwedig anifeiliaid sydd wedi'u pesgu'n hwyr, fod y rhan fwyaf o heffrod a gaiff eu cyflwyno i'r cynllun yn anifeiliaid sydd wedi methu â bridio, ac nid dyna beth y dylai'r cynllun ei gwmpasu o reidrwydd.

**Mick Bates:** A eglurwch y sefyllfa ynglŷn â'r arian a ryddheir drwy leihau'r terfyn oedran yn y cynllun tri deg mis, a gaiff ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer y cynllun stoc marw? Am faint y bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gael o'r cynllun tri deg mis i'r cynllun stoc marw?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid yw'r mater hwnnw wedi cael ei drafod ac ni osodwyd terfyn amser.

2.50 p.m.

### Targedau Ailgylchu Cyngor Sir Penfro Pembrokeshire County Council Recycling Targets

**Q8 Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Will the Minister report on the progress of Pembrokeshire County Council towards meeting its recycling targets? (OAQ37806)

**Carwyn Jones:** The indications are that Pembrokeshire achieved a target of 15.45 per cent on recycling and composting in 2002-03. Indicative performance indicator figures for 2003-04 will be available soon.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** I am sure you agree that Pembrokeshire deserves to be congratulated on achieving and exceeding its targets. It has some good ongoing projects, including roadside kerb collection, which it will extend to 40 per cent of all households by 2005. The purpose of recycling, as I am sure you will agree, is to reduce landfill, and one of the problem areas is the recycling of tyres. Have you investigated the microwave process of recycling tyres currently in use in Australia? We recycle tyres in Pembrokeshire, but we do not remove the metal, as I am sure you aware. The metal then goes to landfill, which is not a particularly helpful exercise. Will you report on that?

**Carwyn Jones:** No company has approached me with proposals for investigating any new process with regard to recycling tyres. I will consider with interest any new proposals brought before me.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is right to say that Pembrokeshire is one of the better-performing councils in terms of its approach towards its recycling targets. However, other councils, as you said earlier, are not doing as well. What are your plans for sanctions against local authorities if they do not take action to meet their recycling, composting and other waste disposal targets?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will consider the position further when I have the 2003-04 indicative

**C8 Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog adroddiad ar y cynnydd y mae Cyngor Sir Penfro wedi'i wneud o ran cyrraedd ei dargedau ailgylchu? (OAQ37806)

**Carwyn Jones:** Ymddengys bod Cyngor Sir Penfro wedi cyrraedd targed o 15.45 y cant ar gyfer ailgylchu a chompostio yn 2002-03. Bydd ffigurau dangosyddion perfformiad dangosol ar gyfer 2003-04 ar gael cyn hir.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Fe gytunwch, mae'n siŵr, fod Cyngor Sir Penfro yn haeddu cael ei longyfarch ar gyflawni a rhagori ar ei dargedau. Mae rhai prosiectau da yn mynd rhagdynt yn y sir, gan gynnwys cynllun casglu gwastraff o fin y ffordd, a gaiff ei estyn i 40 y cant o gartrefi erbyn 2005. Diben ailgylchu, fel y cytunwch mae'n siŵr, yw lleihau faint o wastraff a waredir mewn safleoedd tirlenwi, ac un o'r meysydd lle y ceir problemau yw ailgylchu teiars. A ydych wedi ymchwilio i'r broses ficro-don o ailgylchu teiars a ddefnyddir yn Awstralia ar hyn o bryd? Yr ydym yn ailgylchu teiars yn sir Benfro, ond nid ydym yn tynnu'r metel, fel y gwyddoch mae'n siŵr. Yna caiff y metel ei waredu mewn safleoedd tirlenwi, nad yw'n fuddiol iawn. A wnewch adroddiad ar hynny?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid oes yr un cwmni wedi cysylltu â mi gyda chynigion ar gyfer ymchwilio i unrhyw broses newydd o ran ailgylchu teiars. Ystyriaf unrhyw gynigion newydd a gyflwynwyd imi gyda diddordeb.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n gywir dweud bod perfformiad cyngor sir Benfro gyda'r gorau o ran ei ymagwedd tuag at ei dargedau ailgylchu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cynghorau eraill, fel y dywedasoch yn gynharach, yn gwneud cystal. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i gosbi awdurdodau lleol os nad ydynt yn cymryd camau i gyflawni eu targedau o ran ailgylchu a chompostio a'u targedau eraill o ran gwaredu gwastraff?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ystyriaf y sefyllfa ymhellach pan fydd gennylf y ffigurau dangosol ar gyfer

figures before me, which will inform me how well the whole of Wales has performed.

**Lisa Francis:** Pembrokeshire County Council's scheme is excellent. What plans, if any, does it have to collect and recycle glass? When do you believe that glass will be included in the kerbside recycling scheme?

**Carwyn Jones:** You will have to ask Pembrokeshire County Council.

2003-04, a fydd yn dweud wrthyf pa mor dda y mae Cymru gyfan wedi perfformio.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae cynllun Cyngor Sir Penfro yn ardderchog. Pa gynlluniau, os o gwbl, sydd ganddo i gasglu ac ailgylchu gwydr? Pryd y caiff gwydr ei gynnwys yn y cynllun casglu gwastraff i'w ailgylchu o fin y ffordd, yn eich barn chi?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bydd yn rhaid ichi ofyn i Gyngor Sir Penfro.

### **Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 15 Technical Advice Note 15**

**C9 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar TAN 15? (OAQ37818)

**Carwyn Jones:** Cyhoeddwyd TAN 15 ar wefan y Cynulliad ar 14 Gorffennaf 2004.

**Q9 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on TAN 15? (OAQ37818)

**Carwyn Jones:** TAN 15 was published on the Assembly's website on 14 July 2004.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio cael datganiad ynglŷn â chynnwys TAN 15. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn y bydd y newidiadau hyn yn creu problemau enfawr ym maes cynllunio? Bellach, nid oes modd datblygu mewn ardaloedd a glustnodwyd ar gyfer cynllunio, gan y bydd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gwrthwynebu unrhyw gais ar sail TAN 15. A dderbyniwch hefyd fod rhai pobl yn byw mewn ardaloedd sydd mewn perygl o lifogydd, ac y byddant felly yn profi problemau o ran yswiriant a morgeisi wrth werthu'r tai hynny? A yw'n wir bod y Llywodraeth, wrth lunio TAN 15, wedi mynd llawer ymhellach nag unrhyw gais a wnaed gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Na. Mae'r tywydd yn newid a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn ystyried y rhannau o Gymru sydd yn awr mewn perygl o lifogydd. Nid yw'n wir na chaniateir unrhyw ddatblygiad mewn ardaloedd o risg uchel. Mae'n bosibl datblygu mewn ardaloedd lle mae'r perygl o lifogydd wedi cael ei ystyried a'i fod yn dderbyniol.

**Bryngle Williams:** Over 140,000 properties in Wales, 12 per cent of the housing stock, are thought to be at risk of flooding by rivers or the sea. The incidence of river and coastal flooding is expected to increase over time, as a consequence of climate change. Will you

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I had hoped for a statement on the content of TAN 15. Does the Minister accept that these changes will create massive problems in planning? It is now impossible to develop in areas that were once allocated for planning because the Environment Agency will refuse any applications on the basis of TAN 15. Do you also accept that some people are living in flood risk areas, and that they will therefore experience insurance and mortgage problems when selling their houses? Is it true that the Government, in drawing up TAN 15, went much further than any proposal made by the Environment Agency?

**Carwyn Jones:** No. The weather is changing and we must ensure that we consider the parts of Wales that are now at risk from flooding. It is not true to say that no development can take place in high-risk areas. It is possible to develop in areas where the risk of flooding has been considered and is deemed acceptable.

**Bryngle Williams:** Credir bod dros 140,000 o eiddo yng Nghymru, sef 12 y cant o'r stoc tai, mewn perygl o lifogydd oherwydd afonydd neu'r môr. Disgwylir i lifogydd wrth ymyl afonydd neu ar yr arfordir gynyddu dros amser, o ganlyniad i newid yn yr

give a firm commitment in the Chamber this afternoon that you will put additional moneys in the budget to put further preventative measures in place to protect the people of Wales from horrendous flooding?

**Carwyn Jones:** We will seek to do all that we can to contain flooding and deal with it as it occurs, and to examine new areas that might be at risk of flooding which were previously not at risk. However, it is important that we deal with the underlying problem, which is climate change. That is why it is so important that we seriously consider and support renewable energy, and I look forward to the Conservative Party doing that.

hinsawdd. A wnewch chi ymrwymiad cadarn yn y Siambrau y prynhawn yma y byddwch yn rhoi arian ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i roi mesurau ataliol pellach ar waith i ddiogelu pobl Cymru rhag llifogydd ofnadwy?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ceisiwn wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i reoli llifogydd ac ymdrin â hwy pan fyddant yn codi, ac i ystyried ardaloedd newydd a allai fod mewn perygl o lifogydd nad oeddent mewn perygl gynt. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ymdrin â'r broblem sylfaenol, sef y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Dyna pam y mae mor bwysig inni ystyried ynni adnewyddadwy o ddifrif a'i gefnogi, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Blaid Geidwadol yn gwneud hynny.

### **Pobl Ifanc yn Dod i Mewn i'r Diwydiant Amaethyddol Young People Entering the Agriculture Industry**

**C10 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar unrhyw gynlluniau sydd ganddo yngylch galluogi pobl ifanc i ddod i mewn i'r diwydiant amaethyddol? (OAQ37790)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ystyried nifer o opsiynau ar hyn o bryd i helpu pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys tenantiaethau busnes a ffermio cyfran. Mae cymorth ychwanegol ar gael i ffermwyr ifanc hefyd, er enghraifft, drwy gyfraddau grantiau'r cynllun Cyswllt Ffermio.

**Elin Jones:** Efallai y byddwch yn gwybod bod bwriad yng Ngogledd Iwerddon i gyflwyno cynllun i newydd-ddyfodiaid a fydd yn cynnwys benthyciadau di-log. A ydych yn bwriadu cwrdd â swyddogion Gogledd Iwerddon i drafod y cynllun, ac i gyflwyno cynllun newydd-ddyfodiaid i amaethyddiaeth ar gyfer ffermwyr ifanc Cymru o'r diwedd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi cwrdd â ffermwyr ifanc o Ogledd Iwerddon, yng nghwmni ffermwyr ifanc o Gymru, er mwyn edrych ar y cynllun. Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf am edrych ar y manylion er mwyn gweld sut yn union y gwneir hyn yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, a sut y telir amdano.

**Glyn Davies:** What decisions have you taken, Minister, about the priority access that

**Q10 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on any plans that he has to enable young people to enter the agriculture industry? (OAQ37790)

**Carwyn Jones:** I am currently considering a number of options to help young people, including business tenancies and share farming. Additional support is also available to young farmers, for example, through Farming Connect's grant rates.

**Elin Jones:** You may know that there are plans afoot in Northern Ireland to introduce a scheme for new entrants that will include interest-free loans. Do you intend to meet officials from Northern Ireland to discuss the scheme, and to introduce, at last, a scheme for new entrants to agriculture for young farmers in Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have met young farmers from Northern Ireland, in the company of young farmers from Wales, in order to look at the scheme. At the moment, I want to consider the details to see how exactly it will be done in Northern Ireland, and how it will be paid for.

**Glyn Davies:** Pa benderfyniadau a ydych wedi'u gwneud, Weinidog, ynglŷn â'r

might be given to single farm payments from the national reserve for those young farmers who have started farming or expanded rapidly in the last two or three years?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will make an announcement in due course.

mynediad blaenoriaethol y gellid ei roi i'r taliad sengl o'r gronfa wrth gefn genedlaethol i'r ffermwyr ifanc hynny sydd wedi dechrau ffermio neu sydd wedi ehangu'n gyflym yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf?

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwnaf gyhoeddiad maes o law.

### Ansawdd Dyfroedd Ymdrochi The Quality of Bathing Water

**Q11 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the quality of bathing water on Welsh beaches? (OAQ37811)

**Carwyn Jones:** The quality of our bathing water is excellent. Of the 78 designated bathing waters, 77 achieved the EC mandatory standard in 2003, and a record 65 also met the more stringent guideline standard. Some 34 beaches in Wales now have blue flags, which is, again, a record.

**David Melding:** First Minister—sorry, you are not the First Minister yet.

Minister, do you agree that our coastline and the wonderful quality of the bathing water that we now have are an essential part of marketing Wales? However, there are some cases of beaches failing that have passed previously, and we need to maintain high standards.

**Carwyn Jones:** There are examples of beaches that previously had blue flags losing them, and then regaining them. It is important that we ensure that as many of our beaches as possible have blue flags, and that as many visitors to Wales as possible enjoy the confidence of being able to bathe in excellent bathing waters.

**C11 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ansawdd dyfroedd ymdrochi traethau Cymru? (OAQ37811)

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae ansawdd ein dyfroedd ymdrochi yn rhagorol. O'r 78 o'r dyfroedd ymdrochi dynodedig, cyrhaeddodd 77 safon ofynnol y GE yn 2003, a chyrhaeddodd 65, sef y nifer fwyaf erioed, safon lymach y canllaw hefyd. Mae tua 34 o draethau yng Nghymru wedi ennill baner las erbyn hyn, sydd, unwaith eto, yn record.

**David Melding:** Brif Weinidog—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid chi yw'r Prif Weinidog eto.

Weinidog, a gytunwch fod ein harfordir ac ansawdd gwych y dyfroedd ymdrochi sydd gennym bellach yn rhan hanfodol o farchnata Cymru? Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai achosion methodd traethau sydd wedi cyrraedd y safon yn y gorffennol, ac mae angen inni gynnal safonau uchel.

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae enghreiftiau o draethau a oedd wedi ennill y faner las yn y gorffennol yn ei cholli, ac yna ei hadennill. Mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau bod cymaint o'n traethau â phosibl yn ennill y faner las, a bod cymaint o ymwelwyr â Chymru â phosibl yn teimlo'n hyderus eu bod yn gallu ymdrochi mewn dyfroedd ymdrochi ardderchog.

### Carbon Deuocsid a Ryddheir Carbon Dioxide Emissions

**Q12 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on carbon dioxide emissions in Wales? (OAQ37817)

**Carwyn Jones:** The latest information shows

**C12 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar faint o garbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau yng Nghymru? (OAQ37817)

**Carwyn Jones:** Dengys y wybodaeth

that in 2001, 42.1 million tonnes of carbon dioxide were estimated to be emitted in Wales, which is 7.4 per cent of the UK total. Details for the period to 2002 will be available shortly.

**Mark Isherwood:** Independent research has concluded that there will be no net difference in the carbon dioxide emissions generated by operational or already consented and planned wind turbines in Wales. Has the Welsh Assembly Government undertaken, commissioned or shared any research into this, and what net difference has it identified after factoring in the emissions from conventional power stations as they fire up or down in accordance with wind blow, rather than being decommissioned?

**Carwyn Jones:** It stands to reason that a renewable source of energy is less likely to emit carbon dioxide than fossil fuels. That is why renewable energy is so important for the future of not only Wales, but the whole world. That is not to say that everywhere in Wales is an appropriate place to put a wind farm or install any other form of renewable energy, but it is important that we have a national policy of encouraging renewable energy.

ddiweddaraaf fod 42.1 miliwn o dunelli o gasbon deuoedd wedi'i ryddhau yng Nghymru, yn ôl amcangyfrif, yn 2001, sef 7.4 y cant o gyfanswm y DU. Bydd manylion am y cyfnod hyd at 2002 ar gael cyn hir.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mewn ymchwil annibynnol daethpwyd i'r casgliad na fydd gwahanaeth net yn y carbon deuoedd a ryddheir drwy dyrbinau gwynt gweithredul neu dyrbinau gwynt y rhoddwyd caniatâd cynllunio ar eu cyfer ac a gynlluniwyd yng Nghymru. A yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud, wedi comisiynu neu wedi rhannu unrhyw ymchwil i hyn, a faint o wahaniaeth net a nodwyd ganddo ar ôl rhoi cyfrif am y gollyngiadau o orsafoedd ynni confensiynol wrth iddynt danio yn unol â chwyth gwynt, yn hytrach na chael eu dadgomisiynu?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n gwneud synnwyr bod ffynhonnell adnewyddadwy o ynni yn llai tebygol o ollwng carbon deuoedd na thanwyddau ffosil. Dyna pam y mae ynni adnewyddadwy mor bwysig ar gyfer y dyfodol nid yn unig yng Nghymru, ond yn y byd i gyd. Nid yw hynny yn golygu bod pob rhan o Gymru yn fan priodol i osod fferm wynt neu unrhyw fath arall o ynni adnewyddadwy ond mae'n bwysig bod gennym bolisi cenedlaethol i hyrwyddo ynni adnewyddadwy.

### Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change

**Q13 Lynne Neagle:** What discussions has the Minister had with UK colleagues on the issue of climate change? (OAQ37771)

3.00 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I have had many exchanges and discussions on climate change with Ministers in the UK Government, most recently in relation to the current review of the UK climate change programme.

**Lynne Neagle:** I sponsored an event today at which Sir John Houghton, co-chair of the inter-governmental scientific assessment

**C13 Lynne Neagle:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â'i gyd-Weinidogion yn y DU ynghylch newid yn yr hinsawdd? (OAQ37771)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf wedi cael llawer o drafodaethau â Gweinidogion yn Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn fwyaf diweddar mewn perthynas â'r adolygiad presennol o raglen y DU ar newid yn yr hinsawdd.

**Lynne Neagle:** Noddais ddigwyddiad heddiw pryd y rhoddodd Syr John Houghton, cyd-gadeirydd y gweithgor asesu gwyddonol

working group on climate change, briefed Members on the impact of global warming on the environment. Given the considerable scientific consensus on what the future holds if Governments fail to act, do you agree with the Prime Minister that this is an issue of great urgency, and can you give an assurance that we in Wales will do all that we can to address it? In particular, will you consider having the Assembly Government lead a campaign in Wales to promote awareness of the need for renewable energy and energy-efficiency measures in order to build a consensus for action in Wales on this issue?

rhyng-llywodraethol ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, sesiwn frifio i Aelodau ar effaith gwresogi byd-eang ar yr amgylchedd. O ystyried bod cryn gonsensws ymhliith gwyddonwyr ynghylch y dyfodol os na fydd y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu, a gytunwch â Phrif Weinidog y DU, fod angen ymdrin â'r mater hwn ar fylder mawr, ac a allwch roi sicrwydd y byddwn ni yng Nghymru yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i wneud hynny? Yn arbennig, a ystyriwch drefnu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad arwain ymgyrch yng Nghymru i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'r angen am ynni adnewyddadwy a mesurau i arbed ynni er mwyn cael consensws dros weithredu yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn?

**Carwyn Jones:** I hesitate to tread on the toes of my colleague, Andrew Davies, who has renewable energy proper under his portfolio, but it is absolutely right to say that climate change is increasingly and rapidly becoming a problem. We see what is happening with glacial melting at the north pole, and what has happened this year with the hurricanes that have battered many Caribbean islands, which will suffer tremendously financially and in terms of the human cost from what they have had to endure. We cannot ignore this just because the climate in Britain tends to be more benign than that of other countries. We must do our bit internationally.

**Carwyn Jones:** Oedaf rhag sathru ar draed fy nghyd-Weinidog, Andrew Davies, sy'n wir gyfrifol am ynni adnewyddadwy o dan ei bortffolio ef, ond mae'n holol iawn dweud bod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dod yn broblem gynyddol yn gyflym. Gwelwn yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda rhewlifau yn toddi ym mhegwn y gogledd, a'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd eleni gyda'r corwyntoedd sydd wedi effeithio ar nifer o ynysodd y Caribî, a fydd yn dioddef gryn lawer yn ariannol ac o ran niwed i bobl yn sgîl yr hyn y gorfu iddynt ei ddioddef. Ni allwn anwybyddu hyn am fod yr hinsawdd ym Mhrydain yn tueddu i fod yn fwy tyner nac yng ngwledydd eraill. Rhaid inni chwarae rhan yn rhyngwladol.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Weinidog, gwrandoeais innau ar yr Athro John Houghton, ac i wneud synnwyr o'n cyfrifoldeb penodol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy, oni fyddai'n fwy synhwyrol i'r Cynulliad gael yr hawl i ddelio â phob cais am gynllun creu ynni ar y môr a'r tir ac nid dim ond y rhai sydd dan hyn a hyn o bŵer?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Minister, I also listened to Professor John Houghton, and to make sense of our specific responsibility for sustainable development, would it not be more sensible for the Assembly to have the right to deal with all applications for energy generation schemes on land and sea and not just those under a certain output level?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae hyn eto yn fater i Andrew Davies, ond rhaid inni ystyried a fyddai'n well i gael popeth o dan yr un ymbarél. Dylid gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i Andrew.

**Carwyn Jones:** Again, this is a matter for Andrew Davies, but we must consider whether it would be better to have everything under the same umbrella. You should ask Andrew that question.

**Glyn Davies:** Irrespective of whether you accept the role of human activity in producing climate change, there is no doubt that there is a huge problem that must be addressed. Your renewable energy policy is an important part of Wales's contribution to

**Glyn Davies:** Pa un a ydych yn derbyn bod pobl wedi chwarae rhan wrth newid yr hinsawdd ai peidio, nid oes amheuaeth bod problem enfawr y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael â hi. Mae eich polisi ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn rhan bwysig o gyfraniad Cymru at hynny.

that. Do you accept, however, that it is crucial to retain people's support and awareness of the issue by not focusing wholly on one aspect, but by concentrating on biomass and all the other forms of renewable energy? I do not think that you are doing that satisfactorily at present.

**Carwyn Jones:** We concentrate on as many forms of viable renewable energy as we can. It is important that we get people's support, but it is also important that people think nationally as well in terms of what Wales's contribution can be.

**Mick Bates:** Minister, it was an excellent presentation—congratulations to Lynne Neagle and Friends of the Earth Cymru on staging that event on climate change. During the event, Sir John Houghton made a call to the Government, industry and all non-governmental organisations to lead a public awareness campaign so that people understand why it is necessary to build turbines and to have biomass. Do you agree with that call, and will you work in the Cabinet to ensure that a public awareness campaign will be undertaken in Wales as soon as possible?

**Carwyn Jones:** I think that we all realise that, and it is important that people hear both sides of the argument. I am not sure that that is happening at the moment.

Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch ei bod yn hollbwysig cadw cefnogaeth pobl i'r mater a'u hymwybyddiaeth ohono drwy beidio â chanolbwyntio ar un agwedd yn unig, ond drwy ganolbwyntio ar fomas a phob math arall o ynni adnewyddadwy? Ni chredaf eich bod yn gwneud hynny'n fodhaol ar hyn o bryd.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn canolbwyntio ar gymaint o fathau o ynni adnewyddadwy dichonadwy ag y gallwn. Mae'n bwysig inni ennyn cefnogaeth pobl, ond mae'n bwysig hefyd bod pobl yn meddwl yn genedlaethol yn ogystal â meddwl am yr hyn y gall Cymru ei gyfrannu.

**Mick Bates:** Weinidog, yr oedd yn gyflwyniad ardderchog—llongyfarchiadau i Lynne Neagle a Chyfeillion y Ddaear Cymru ar drefnu'r digwyddiad hwnnw ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yn ystod y digwyddiad, galwodd Syr John Houghton ar y Llywodraeth, diwydiant a phob corff anllywodraethol i arwain ymgyrch i godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlið y cyhoedd er mwyn i bobl ddeall pam y mae angen adeiladu tyrbinau ac i gael bio-mâs. A gytnwch â'r alwad honno, ac a weithiwr yn y Cabinet i sicrhau y caiff ymgyrch i godi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlið y cyhoedd ei gynnwl yng Nghymru mor fuan â phosibl?

**Carwyn Jones:** Credaf fod pob un ohonom yn sylweddoli hynny, ac mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn clywed dwy ochr y ddadl. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

## **Adroddiad Blynnyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru 2003-04 The First Minister's Annual Report 2003-04**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Nid wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan has not been selected.

Cyn imi alw ar y Prif Weinidog i gyflwyno ei adroddiad blynnyddol, yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Cynulliad cyfan yn dymuno imi estyn ein cyfarchion iddo ar ei benblwydd—er y credaf y byddai allan o drefn i ddechrau canu.

Before I call the First Minister to present his annual report, I am sure that the whole Assembly would want me to extend our best wishes to him on his birthday—although I think that it would be out of order to start singing.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):**  
Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu adroddiad Prif Weinidog Cymru 2003-04.*  
(NDM2107)

Diolch am eich dymuniadau da. Gwelais nad oeddech am gael pleidlais ar y canu, ac felly yn ddoeth.

Dylwn ddechrau drwy ddweud mai'r llynedd y cyhoeddwyd 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', ein gweledigaeth yn amlinellu ein blaenoriaethau hyd at yr etholiad ym mis Mai 2007. Dyma fy nhrydydd adroddiad blynnyddol fel Prif Weinidog, ac mae'n cofnodi'r camau sylweddol yr ydym wedi'u cymryd tuag at gyflawni'r agenda honno. Mae ein blaenoriaethau yn eithaf syml, ond yn sylweddol, sef i wella iechyd, i ddod â diweithdra i lawr, helpu i ddatblygu diogelwch yn ein cymunedau a hefyd i greu gwell swyddi a helpu pobl i ddatblygu'r sgiliau i gyd-fynd â'r gwell swyddi hynny. Felly, mae'r adroddiad yn cyhoeddi'r camau yr ydym wedi'u cymryd wrth gyflawni yn erbyn y blaenoriaethau hynny.

Am y tro cyntaf eleni, mae'r adroddiad blynnyddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy wedi'i gyhoeddi mewn copi caled ochr yn ochr ag adroddiad y Prif Weinidog. Mae hynny'n dangos i bawb ein hymroddiad tuag at integreiddio'r gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy i'n holl waith. Daw yr adroddiad hwnnw gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn, ochr yn ochr â fersiwn terfynol y cynllun gweithredu, ar 13 Hydref.

To turn to the individual subjects that are covered in this First Minister's report, I mentioned yesterday the remarkable improvements made in infant mortality rates in Wales. When we took over our responsibilities, the rates were higher than in the rest of Britain, but, for the past two years, 2002-03, they have been considerably lower. That is a remarkable improvement. In previous meetings we mentioned areas where figures indicate that Wales leads over the rest of the United Kingdom. For instance, Wales leads in relation to MRSA rates of infection, at 11 per 10,000 patient bed days in Wales,

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the report of the First Minister 2003-04.*  
(NDM2107)

Thank you for your good wishes. I note that you did not want to put the singing to the vote, and wisely so.

I should start by saying that it was last year that we published 'Wales: A Better Country', our vision outlining our priorities up to the election in May 2007. This is my third annual report as First Minister, and it records the significant steps that we have taken towards delivering that agenda. Our priorities are fairly simple, but are also significant: to improve health, to reduce unemployment, to assist in improving safety in our communities and to create better jobs and help people to develop the skills required to do those better jobs. Therefore, the report sets out the steps that we have taken in delivering against those priorities.

For the first time this year, the annual report on sustainable development has been published in hard copy alongside the First Minister's report. That shows our commitment to integrating sustainable development into all of our work. That report will come before Plenary, alongside the final version of the action plan, on 13 October.

Gan droi at y pynciau unigol a gwmpesir yn yr adroddiad hwn gan y Prif Weinidog, soniais ddoe am y gwelliannau anhygoel a wnaed o ran cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod yng Nghymru. Pan ymgymerasom â'n cyfrifoldebau, yr oedd y cyfraddau yn uwch nag yng ngweddill Prydain, ond, dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, 2002-03, buont yn sylweddol is. Mae hynny'n welliant aruthrol. Mewn cyfarfodydd blaenorol bu inni sôn am ardaloedd lle mae ffigurau yn awgrymu bod Cymru ar y blaen i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Er enghraifft, mae Cymru ar y blaen mewn perthynas â chyfraddau haint MRSA,

compared with 15 in Scotland and 17 in England.

Figures published this morning on waiting lists indicate a considerable fall in those waiting longer than our waiting list targets, which are four months for cataract surgery, six months for angiography, 10 months for cardiac surgery, and 18 months for orthopaedics and other treatments. Since cardiac surgery came up yesterday, I should mention that no-one is now waiting over 10 months for cardiac surgery, and only 32 people have been waiting over eight months, in advance of eight months becoming the target time in March 2005. The total number of people waiting for cardiac surgery is at its lowest since February 1999, which was the quarter before the Assembly took over its responsibilities. That confirms what I said yesterday about the improvements in cardiac surgery waiting lists. We should fit that in with the ambitions that we set out of bringing the 18-month second-offer guarantee scheme down to a 12-month second-offer guarantee scheme. That offer also kicks in at four, six or eight months, according to the target area, for cataract or cardiac surgery or angiography. The 18-month target, which will become 12 months, will only apply where that longer waiting list is the relevant list for the target area. Therefore, we are also solving that major problem.

On jobs, I think that everybody realises that we are continuing to see a fall in unemployment. The number of people on the dole is now down to 39,000, which is quite remarkable. That is less than a quarter of the average unemployment figure during the 18 years when the Conservatives were in power between 1979 and 1997. That is an extraordinary improvement. People may say that that has happened across Britain as a whole, but the fall in unemployment has happened three times faster in Wales than in Britain as a whole in the five and a half years since we took over, and it is continuing.

**David Davies:** Can the First Minister tell us

ar 11 fesul 10,000 o ddyddiau gwely cleifion yng Nghymru, o gymharu â 15 yn yr Alban a 17 yn Lloegr.

Mae ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma ar restrau aros yn dangos gostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y rhai sy'n aros am fwy na'n targedau o ran rhestrau aros, sef pedwar mis ar gyfer llawdriniaeth cataract, chwe mis ar gyfer angiograffeg, 10 mis ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ar y galon, a 18 mis ar gyfer orthopedeg a thriniaethau eraill. Gan inni drafod llawdriniaeth ar y galon ddoe, dylwn sôn nad oes neb yn aros mwy na 10 mis yn awr am lawdriniaeth ar y galon, a dim ond 32 o bobl sydd wedi bod yn aros am fwy nag wyth mis, cyn i wyth mis ddod yn amser targed ym mis Mawrth 2005. Mae cyfanswm nifer y bobl sy'n aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon ar ei isaf ers Chwefror 1999, sef y chwarter cyn i'r Cynulliad ymgymryd â'i gyfrifoldebau. Mae hynny'n cadarnhau yr hyn a ddywedais ddoe am y gwelliannau mewn rhestrau aros ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ar y galon. Dylem gysylltu hynny â'r uchelgeisiau a nodwyd gennym o ostwng cynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig o 18 mis i gynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig o 12 mis. Mae'r cynnig hwnnw hefyd yn dechrau ar bedwar, chwech neu wyth mis, yn ôl y maes targed, ar gyfer llawdriniaeth cataract neu lawdriniaeth ar y galon neu angiograffeg. Dim ond pan fydd y rhestr aros hwy honno yn rhestr berthnasol ar gyfer y maes targed y daw'r targed o 18 mis yn darged o 12 mis. Felly, yr ydym hefyd yn datrys y broblem fawr honno.

O ran swyddi, credaf fod pawb yn sylweddoli ein bod yn parhau i weld gostyngiad mewn diweithdra. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n ddi-waith wedi gostwng yn awr i 39,000, sy'n eithaf rhyfeddol. Mae hynny'n llai na chwarter y ffigur diweithdra ar gyfartaledd yn ystod y 18 mlynedd pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym rhwng 1979 a 1997. Mae hynny'n welliant aruthrol. Efallai y bydd pobl yn dweud i hyn ddigwydd ledled Prydain i gyd, ond mae'r gostyngiad mewn diweithdra wedi digwydd dair gwaith yn gyflymach yng Nghymru nag ym Mhrydain at ei gilydd yn y pum mlynedd a hanner ers inni ddod i rym, ac mae'n parhau.

**David Davies:** A all y Prif Weinidog ddweud

what the increase has been in the number of people claiming sickness benefit over the same period?

**The First Minister:** I am glad that you raised that, because I have noticed this new Tory propaganda line of trying to denigrate the fall in unemployment by implying that, somehow or other, we are doing what the Conservatives did and taking people off the unemployment lists and putting them onto incapacity or sickness benefit. The proportion of people in Wales on sickness or incapacity benefit has fallen in the five and a half years that we have been in power. I am sorry, but the Tory propaganda line is wrong. Go back to Conservative central office and tell it not to give out that propaganda line: it is not true. We are bringing unemployment down and we are bringing the proportion of people on incapacity and sickness benefit down. It was your Government's trick to take people off unemployment benefit and to put them onto long-term sickness benefit. We are not doing that; we are bringing those rates down also.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**The First Minister:** I look forward to your question.

**Alun Cairns:** Is it not the reality that the numbers have gone up? Everyone can play the percentage game, but it is the numbers that are important—there are now more people in the Welsh economy who are inactive than there were under the Conservatives.

3.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The percentage of people of working age on incapacity or sickness benefit has come down. Your party was the one that deliberately pushed people off the unemployment register, because of the shame of having 170,000 people on it, compared with the 39,000 that are on it today. Let us ensure that everyone in Wales remembers those figures. In 1986 it was 170,000; if you average out all 18 years it is

wrthym beth oedd y cynnydd yn nifer y bobl a oedd yn hawlio budd-dal salwch yn ystod yr un cyfnod?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi godi hynny, oherwydd yr wyf wedi sylwi ar y propaganda Torïaid newydd hwn sy'n ceisio bychanu'r gostyngiad mewn diweithdra drwy awgrymu ein bod ni, rywsut neu'i gilydd, yn gwneud yr hyn a wnaeth y Ceidwadwyr a thynnau enwau pobl oddi ar y rhestrau diweithdra a'u rhoi ar fudd-daliadau analluogrwydd neu salwch. Mae cyfran y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau salwch neu analluogrwydd wedi syrthio dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf y buom mewn grym. Mae'n ddrwg gennyd, ond mae propaganda'r Torïaid yn anghywir. Ewch yn ôl i swyddfa ganolog y Ceidwadwyr a dywedwch wrtho am beidio â lledu'r propaganda hwnnw: nid yw'n wir. Yr ydym yn llwyddo i ostwng diweithdra ac yr ydym yn lleihau cyfran y bobl sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau analluogrwydd a salwch. Gêm eich Llywodraeth chi oedd gorffen rhoi budd-dal diweithdra i bobl a rhoi budd-dal salwch hirdymor iddynt yn lle hynny. Nid ydym yn gwneud hynny; yr ydym yn gostwng y cyfraddau hynny hefyd.

**Alun Cairns:** A ildiwrch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Edrychaf ymlaen at eich cwestiwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Onid y gwir yw bod y niferoedd wedi cynyddu? Gall pawb chwarae'r gêm canrannau, ond y niferoedd sy'n bwysig—mae mwy o bobl yn economi Cymru yn awr sy'n anweithgar nag yr oedd pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae canran y bobl o oed gweithio sy'n cael budd-dal analluogrwydd neu fudd-dal salwch wedi gostwng. Eich plaid chi oedd yr un a wthiodd pobl yn fwriadol oddi ar y gofrestr ddiweithdra, am ei fod yn gywilyddus bod 170,000 o bobl arni, o gymharu â'r 39,000 o bobl sydd arni heddiw. Gadewch inni sicrhau bod pawb yng Nghymru yn cofio'r ffigurau hynny. Yn 1986, y ffigur oedd 170,000; os

120,000. It is 39,000 today, remember—even you can work out that that is a quarter of the level that it was when the Conservatives were in power, Alun. You were also the ones that shoved people off the unemployment register and put them on to sickness benefit, were you not? You know that that happened; it is not happening now. The numbers on the sickness and unemployment register are coming down—we are doing the opposite of what you did. Unemployment is at a quarter of the level that it was in 1986, and one third of the level it was over the average of the 18 Conservative years. Is that not a wonderful achievement, Mark Isherwood? Would you not like to be able to stand at this lectern and have such an achievement to boast about?

**Mark Isherwood:** Following your statement on *Good Morning Wales*, two mornings ago, I believe, I contacted the BBC and checked the Assembly Statistical Directorate's economic bulletin for September. That showed that employment in Wales had fallen and that unemployment had not appeared to rise over the last 12 months—it was static, because economic inactivity had risen again. That is the current position on the Assembly's statistical website.

**The First Minister:** The problem is that the only basis of comparison that we have with the Tory years is claimant count unemployment: that is the only way that we can make a comparison. That is why we know that unemployment now is a third of what it was on average in the 18 years that the Tories were in power. I cannot make the comparison on the wider count of unemployment, which is what you are talking about, because the Tories never collected those figures, and they kept doctoring the figures. Our statisticians have had to reconstruct all those figures going back to 1975. That is why we know with complete accuracy that what I am saying is true. The number of people on the dole now is a third of what it was when the Tories were in power; it is the lowest that it has been since 1975, 29 years ago, and is still falling. I cannot make the other comparison because your party never collected those figures; I am sorry about that. This is the only basis of comparison that we have. Who is next—Elin

cyfartaleddwch y 18 mlynedd i gyd mae'n 120,000. Mae'n 39,000 heddiw, cofiwch—gallwch chi hyd yn oed weithio allan bod hynny'n chwarter y lefel yr oedd pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym, Alun. Onid chi hefyd oedd yn gwthio pobl oddi ar y gofrestr ddiweithdra ac yn eu rhoi ar fudd-dal salwch? Gwyddoch i hynny ddigwydd; nid yw'n digwydd yn awr. Mae'r niferoedd ar y gofrestr salwch a diweithdra yn gostwng—yr ydym yn gwneud y gwrthwyneb i'r hyn a wnaethoch chi. Mae diweithdra ar chwarter y lefel yr oedd yn 1986, a thraean y lefel yr oedd ar gyfartaledd dros 18 mlynedd y Ceidwadwyr. Onid yw hynny'n gyflawniad gwych, Mark Isherwood? Oni fydddech yn hoffi gallu seyll yma ac ymfrostio ynghylch cyflawniad o'r fath?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn dilyn eich datganiad ar *Good Morning Wales*, ddua fore yn ôl, fe gredaf, cysylltais â'r BBC a gwirio bwletin economaidd Cyfarwyddiaeth Ystadegol y Cynulliad ar gyfer Medi. Dangosodd hynny fod cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi gostwng ac nad oedd diweithdra wedi codi i bob golwg dros y 12 mis diwethaf—yr oedd yn sefydlog, oherwydd yr oedd anweithgarwch economaidd wedi codi eto. Dyna'r seyllfa bresennol ar wefan ystadegol y Cynulliad.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y broblem yw mai'r unig gymhariaeth y gallwn ei gwneud gyda blynyddoedd y Torïaid yw nifer y bobl a oedd yn hawlio budd-dal diweithdra: dyna'r unig ffordd y gallwn wneud cymhariaeth. Dyna pam y gwyddom fod diweithdra bellach yn draean o'r hyn yr oedd ar gyfartaledd yn y 18 mlynedd pan oedd y Torïaid mewn grym. Ni allaf wneud y gymhariaeth ar gyfer nifer y bobl eraill a oedd yn ddi-waith, sef yr hyn yr ydych chi'n sôn amdano oherwydd ni chasglodd y Torïaid y ffigurau hynny erioed, a buont yn addasu'r ffigurau'n gyson. Mae ein hystadegwyr wedi gorfod ail-lunio'r holl ffigurau hynny gan fynd yn ôl at 1975. Dyna pam y gwyddom yn hollo gwir bod yr hyn a ddywedaf yn wir. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n ddi-waith bellach yn draean o'r hyn yr oedd pan oedd y Torïaid mewn grym; mae ar ei isaf ers 1975, 29 mlynedd yn ôl, ac mae'n parhau i ostwng. Ni allaf wneud y gymhariaeth arall oherwydd ni chasglodd eich plaid y ffigurau hynny erioed; trueni am hynny. Dyma'r unig gymhariaeth sydd

Jones?

**Elin Jones:** I will try to help the Conservatives out here. I think that the point that they are trying to make is that, a year ago, there were 6,000 more people in jobs in Wales than there are now—it has gone down 6,000—and there are 20,000 more people economically inactive now than there were 12 months ago.

**The First Minister:** If you look at the figures over the past 12 months, you will see that there has been a switch around in Wales, by which far more men are in jobs, and there has been a drop in the number of women in jobs. Overall, we can see that, over the past five and a half years, the numbers of people on the dole are falling, and they continue to come down. They are one third of what they were during those 18 wasted Tory years. It is 39,000 compared with 120,000. Those are the figures from our statisticians. The more you want to ask, the more I want to repeat it. It is a wonderful achievement to be able to stand here and say it, but I need to move on. [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister has indicated that he wishes to move on, and I do not disagree with that.

**The First Minister:** I am proud of these figures. I could stay here all day, but I do not believe that I would be allowed to. Let us turn briefly—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have 15 minutes for your opening and closing speeches, despite the fact that it is your birthday.

**The First Minister:** I am conscious of that. Let us talk about GCSE passes. We never used to be as good as the rest of Britain in that regard, but we are now better. We have gone from being 1 percentage point behind to, following the latest results, being 1.5 percentage points up on the rest of Britain. We are up at 60.7 per cent, and I believe that in England the figure is 59 per cent, and we used to be 1 per cent behind. That is a huge achievement for our children, our teachers and our education system in five and a half

gennym. Pwy sydd nesaf—Elin Jones?

**Elin Jones:** Fe geisiaf helpu'r Ceidwadwyr yma. Credaf mai'r pwynt y maent yn ceisio ei wneud yw, flwyddyn yn ôl, yr oedd 6,000 yn fwy o bobl â swyddi yng Nghymru nag yn awr—mae wedi gostwng 6,000—ac mae 20,000 yn fwy o bobl yn economaidd anweithgar yn awr nag oedd 12 mis yn ôl.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os edrychwr ar y ffigurau dros y 12 mis diwethaf, fe welwr fod y darlun wedi newid yn llwyr yng Nghymru; mae mwy o lawer o ddynion â swyddi, a bu gostyngiad yn nifer y menywod sydd â swyddi. Yn gyffredinol, gallwn weld, dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf, bod niferoedd y bobl ddi-waith yn gostwng, ac maent yn parhau i ostwng. Bellach maent yn draean o'r hyn yr oeddent yn ystod y 18 mlynedd hynny a wastraffwyd o dan y Torïaid. Mae'n 39,000 o'i gymharu â 120,000. Dyna'r ffigurau oddi wrth ein hystadegwyr. Po fwyaf yr ydych am ofyn, y mwyaf yr wyf am ei ailadrodd. Mae'n wych gallu sefyll yma a'i ddweud, ond mae angen imi symud ymlaen. [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi nodi ei fod yn dymuno symud ymlaen, ac nid anghytunaf â hynny.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r ffigurau hynny. Gallwn aros yma drwy'r dydd, ond ni chredaf y byddech yn gadael imi wneud hynny. Gadewch inni droi'n fyr at—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae gennych 15 munud ar gyfer eich areithiau agor a chau, er gwaetha'r ffaith mai eich pen-blwydd ydyw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny. Gadewch inni siarad am lwyddiant TGau. Yn y gorffennol, nid ydym byth wedi bod cystal â gweddill Prydain yn hynny o beth, ond erbyn hyn yr ydym yn well. Yr ydym wedi mynd o fod 1 pwynt canran y tu ôl i weddill Prydain i fod 1.5 pwynt canran ar y blaen, yn ôl y canlyniadau diweddar. Yr ydym bellach yn 60.7 y cant, a chredaf mai 59 y cant yw'r ffigur yn Lloegr, ac yr oeddem yn arfer bod 1 y cant y tu ôl iddynt. Mae hynny'n gyflawniad aruthrol i'n plant, i'n

years. On apprenticeships, we set a target to go from 9,000 to 14,000, I believe, by the end of last year. I am glad to say that we are now at 14,900—a 66 per cent increase on the number of people on modern apprenticeships or the modern skills diploma for adults in five and a half years. That is a huge achievement and an extremely rapid rate of growth. In education, the progress on the Daugherty report, standard assessment tests, and introducing the Welsh baccalaureate has also been extremely healthy.

hathrawon a'n system addysg mewn pum mlynedd a hanner. O ran prentisiaethau, gosodon darged i fynd o 9,000 i 14,000, fe gredaf, erbyn diwedd y llynedd. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod bellach wedi cyrraedd 14,900—cynnydd o 66 y cant ar nifer y bobl ar brentisiaethau modern neu'r diploma sgiliau modern i oedolion mewn pum mlynedd a hanner. Mae hynny'n gyflawniad aruthrol ac yn gyfradd twf eithriadol o gyflym. Mewn addysg, bu'r cynnydd ar adroddiad Daugherty, y profion asesu safonol, a chyflwyno bagloriaeth Cymru yn eithriadol o iach hefyd.

On the amendments, I oppose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies because of the progress that I have illustrated. I believe that we are all proud of our record on public service delivery. It is not the case that we have rejected the recommendations of the Richard commission. They will be in simplified form in the White Paper that the Labour Party has promised, if it wins a majority following the next election. I oppose amendment 3, therefore, in the name of Jocelyn Davies, as it misses the mark. Jenny Randerson was making political points and nitpicking, and I therefore oppose amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. I confidently expect the Assembly to support the First Minister's third report.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf gwelliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn mynegi pryder bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi gwrthod argymhelliaid comisiwn Richard bod angen pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, ac yngylch record wael Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.*

O ran y gwelliannau, gwrthwynebaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies oherwydd y cynnydd yr wyf wedi ei ddangos. Credaf fod pob un ohonom yn falch o'n record o ran darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid yw'n wir ein bod wedi gwrthod argymhellion comisiwn Richard. Byddant ar ffurf symlach yn y Papur Gwyn y mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi ei addo, os bydd yn ennill mwyafrif yn dilyn yr etholiad nesaf. Gwrthwynebaf welliant 3, felly, yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gan ei fod yn methu'r nod. Yr oedd Jenny Randerson yn gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol ac yn pigo beiau, ac felly gwrthwynebaf welliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Yr wyf yn hyderus yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad gefnogi trydydd adroddiad y Prif Weinidog.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*expresses concern at the First Minister's rejection of the Richard commission's recommendation for the need for primary law-making powers and the Assembly Government's poor record on the delivery of public services.*

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon ar adroddiad y Prif Weinidog, er y gallech amau mai ei adroddiad ef ydoedd—soniodd am rywbeith a ddigwyddodd rhwng 1979 ac 1987 yn hytrach na'i record ei hun. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'i araith yn cyfeirio at bethau sydd bellach mewn llyfrau hanes. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai'n treulio'r rhan fwyaf o'i amser yn amddiffyn ei hun rhag y cyhuddiadau a wneir yng ngwelliannau Plaid Cymru. Dim ond mewn pwt ar y diwedd y cyfeiriodd at gomisiwn Richard a record drychinezus y Llywodraeth o ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Os na allwch amddiffyn eich record eich hun ar faterion fel hyn—cyfeiriach yn gyflym at eich record drychinezus o ran iechyd—yr hyn sy'n tueddu i ddigwydd yw bod y cyhoedd yn cael llond bol ar y math hwn o wleidyddiaeth. Gallai'r Prif Weinidog fod wedi dweud bod problemau dybryd o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd a'i fod yn ceisio ei orau i'w datrys. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn a gawsom oedd *apologia* hir ar dargedau a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth y mae wedi eu cyrraedd. Nid yw hynny o unrhyw help i bobl fel Mrs Elizabeth Moses, sy'n disgwyl 18 mis am driniaeth yn Ysbyty Gobowen.

Os na dderbyniwch gyfrifoldeb am yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud o ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, bydd pobl yn colli eu hymddiriedaeth ynoch. Os na all y Prif Weinidog ddangos y bu gwelliannau sylweddol ym maes iechyd, bydd pobl yn colli eu hymddiriedaeth ynddo. Fel y gŵyr Tony Blair ar hyn o bryd, unwaith y collwch ymddiriedaeth pobl yn yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud, mae'n anodd iawn ei gael yn ôl. Os ystyriwn yr addewidion a wnaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur yn 1999 o ran rhestrau aros, gwelwn pam mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei chael yn anodd amddiffyn ei record ei hun. Yn 1999, dywedodd na fyddai unrhyw un yn gorfol disgwyl mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty. Bellach mae 1,500 o bobl yn disgwyl am driniaeth. Dywedodd hefyd na fyddai unrhyw un yn gorfol disgwyl mwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad cyntaf i weld meddyg mewn ysbyty. Bellach, mae 72,000 o bobl yn disgwyl am apwyntiad. Mae'r rhestrau aros yn cynyddu ac mae'r gwasanaeth yn dirywio. Mae 500 yn llai o welyau mewn ysbytai; caewyd 12 ysbyty ond agorwyd dim ond pump; a chaewyd 100 o

I am glad to have the opportunity to contribute to this debate on the First Minister's report, although you could doubt whether it was his report—he spoke about events between 1979 and 1987 rather than concentrating on his own record. Most of his speech referred to matters that have now been consigned to the history books. I had hoped that he would spend most of his time defending himself against the accusations in Plaid Cymru's amendments. There was only a brief reference at the end to the Richard commission and the Government's disastrous record in terms of public services. If you cannot defend your own record on such matters—you referred briefly to your disastrous record on health—what tends to happen is that the public becomes tired of this kind of politics. The First Minister could have said that there are serious problems in the health service and that he is trying his best to solve them. However, what we got was a lengthy *apologia* on the targets that the Government has set and attained. That is of no assistance to people such as Mrs Elizabeth Moses, who are waiting 18 months for treatment at Gobowen Hospital.

If you do not accept responsibility for your actions on public services, people will lose trust in you. If the First Minister cannot show that there have been substantial improvements in terms of health, people will lose trust in him. As Tony Blair knows at the moment, once people lose trust in what you are doing, it is extremely difficult to regain that trust. If we consider the pledges that the Labour Government made in 1999 on waiting lists, we see why the First Minister finds it difficult to defend his own record. In 1999, he said that no-one would have to wait more than 18 months for hospital treatment. Now there are 1,500 people waiting for treatment. He also said that no-one would have to wait more than six months for a first hospital appointment with a doctor. Now there are 72,000 people waiting for an appointment. The waiting lists are lengthening and the service is getting worse. There are 500 fewer beds in hospitals; 12 hospitals have been closed but only five opened; and 100 homes for the elderly were closed during the last year. It is little wonder that there are massive problems involving waiting lists in our

gartrefi henoed yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Nid oes rhyfedd bod problemâu difrifol o ran rhestrau aros yn ein hysbytai. Darperir llai o welyau yn y sector cymdeithasol bob blwyddyn. Cadarnhaodd y Prif Weinidog ddoe, a'r Gweinidog Cyllid yn ei hatebion i gwestiynau heddiw, fod y Llywodraeth yn gwrthod talu am driniaethau'r rhai sy'n disgwyl derbyn triniaeth y tu allan i Gymru oni bai eu bod yn cyd-fynd â'i thargedau. Felly, os nad yw person wedi bod ar restr aros sy'n cyd-fynd â thargedau y Llywodraeth, ni chânt arian.

It is little wonder that the First Minister has lost the trust of the people of Wales and that of Labour Party Members in Westminster. If you consider the latest opinion polls published today, at least four of his colleagues are likely to lose their seats. It is also little wonder that Members of Parliament such as Jon Owen Jones and Gareth Thomas are criticising the Welsh Assembly Government. Losing the trust of the people of Wales is a serious matter.

3.20 p.m.

The First Minister has also displayed a lack of judgment in his handling of a number of issues over the past year, for which he has not apologised. What about the D-day commemorations? What about his involvement in the appointment of the Counsel General? What about his Government's interference in the appointment of the chair of the Welsh Language Board? He has simply ignored these issues, regardless of the fact that they are of interest to the people of Wales.

I genuinely feel that the First Minister should have, during the past year, conveyed to Westminster the strong feelings of the people of Wales about the illegal war in Iraq. The United Nations secretary-general declared it an illegal war, and the people of Wales recognise it as such. However, the First Minister stood by Tony Blair's side in his actions in Iraq, when he should have been representing the views of the people of Wales to the Westminster Cabinet.

hospitals. Fewer beds are being provided in the social sector every year. The First Minister yesterday, and the Finance Minister in her answers to questions today, confirmed that the Government refuses to pay for the treatment of those who are waiting to receive treatment outside Wales unless it conforms with its targets. Therefore, if an individual has not been on a waiting list that conforms with the Government's targets, his or her treatment will not be funded.

Nid yw'n syndod felly bod y Prif Weinidog wedi colli ymddiriedaeth pobl Cymru ac ymddiriedaeth Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan. Os ystyriwch y polau piniwn diweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, mae o leiaf bedwar o'i gyd-aelodau yn debygol o golli eu seddau. Nid yw'n syndod ychwaith bod Aelodau Seneddol megis Jon Owen Jones a Gareth Thomas yn beirniadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae colli ymddiriedaeth pobl Cymru yn fater difrifol.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog hefyd wedi dangos diffyg synnwyr cyffredin wrth ymdrin â nifer o faterion dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, nad yw wedi ymddiheuro amdanynt. Beth am achlysur coffáu D-day? Beth am y rhan a chwaraeodd ym mhenodiad y Cwnsler Cyffredinol? Beth am ymyrraeth ei Lywodraeth ym mhenodiad cadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg? Mae wedi anwybyddu'r materion hyn er eu bod o ddiddordeb i bobl Cymru.

Teimlaf, o ddifrif, y dylai'r Prif Weinidog, dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, fod wedi cyfleu teimladau cryf pobl Cymru am y rhyfel anghyfreithlon yn Irac i San Steffan. Datganodd ysgrifennydd cyffredinol y Cenhedloedd Unedig ei fod yn rhyfel anghyfreithlon, ac mae pobl Cymru yn ei gydnabod felly. Fodd bynnag, ochrodd y Prif Weinidog gyda Tony Blair o ran yr hyn a wnaeth yn Irac, pan ddylai fod wedi bod yn cyfleu safbwytiau pobl Cymru i Gabinet San Steffan.

The Government's record shows that it is running out of ideas and running out of steam. It is my hope and sincere wish that Wales will one day have a government of which it can be proud.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 4: add a new point:

*notes that of the 10 'solid' achievements of the Labour Assembly Government claimed by the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, three were due to action taken before 1 May 2003, four had nothing to do with the Assembly and two have not yet happened.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point:

*notes that of the top 10 commitments, listed on page 3 of the First Minister's report, only one has been met—ruling out top-up tuition fees for the full Assembly term—and further notes that this commitment lasts for only one year.*

We will support Plaid Cymru's amendments 1 and 3. This debate was scheduled to take place two months ago, but it was moved aside so that the First Minister could rush through his announcement to abolish the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board and Education and Learning Wales. This caused consternation and instability in every other quango in Wales, where staff are uncertain of the Assembly Government's plans. It also leaves more questions unanswered than answered. However, at least it showed some ambition. There is precious little ambition and next to no action to be found anywhere else in the Government programme before us today.

Our amendments draw attention to the Labour Government's lack of achievement. We do not do that in a general sense, even though that would not be difficult, but we do it in the case of Labour's priorities, or its so-called top 10 commitments. These were supposed to be Labour's flagship policies,

Dengys record y Llywodraeth nad oes ganddi ragor o syniadau a'i bod wedi chwythu ei phlwc. Fy ngobaith a'm dymuniad diffuant yw y bydd gan Gymru un dydd lywodraeth y gall fod yn falch ohoni.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi bod tri o'r 10 o gyflawniadau pendant Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad a hawliwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn ganlyniad camau a gymerwyd cyn 1 Mai 2003, bod gan bedwar ohonynt ddim i'w wneud â'r Cynulliad a bod dau ohonynt heb ddigwydd eto.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi mai dim ond un o'r 10 prif ymrwymiad a restrir ar dudalen 3 o adroddiad y Prif Weinidog sydd wedi'i fodloni—sef diystyr u ffioedd dysgu ychwanegol ar gyfer tymor llawn y Cynulliad—ac yn nodi at hynny fod yr ymrwymiad hwn yn parhau am un flwyddyn yn unig.*

Cefnogwn welliannau 1 a 3 Plaid Cymru. Trefnwyd y ddadl hon ar gyfer dau fis yn ôl, ond fe'i rhoddwyd o'r neilltu er mwyn i'r Prif Weinidog gyhoeddi ar frys ei fod am ddiddymu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru. Achosodd hyn syndod ac ansefydlogrwydd ym mhob cwango arall yng Nghymru, lle mae staff yn ansicr o gynlluniau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae hefyd yn gadael mwy o ateinion heb eu hateb na rhai wedi eu hateb. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf dangosodd rywfaint o uchelgais. Prin iawn yw'r uchelgais a fawr ddim gweithredu sydd i'w gweld yn unman arall yn rhaglen y Llywodraeth sydd ger ein bron heddiw.

Mae ein gwelliannau yn tynnu sylw at ddiffyg cyflawniad y Llywodraeth Lafur. Ni wnaeth hynny yn yr ystyr gyffredinol, er na fyddai hynny'n anodd, ond fe'i gwnawn yn achos blaenoriaethau Llafur, neu ei 10 prif ymrwymiad fel y'u gelwir. Prif bolisiau Llafur oedd y rhain i fod, ond mae

but the Government's approach to these policies has resembled a leaking rubber dinghy. Take the pledge to provide free prescriptions: there was no action for 18 months then the major step taken by the Labour Assembly Government was a reverse turn on free prescriptions for the chronically ill. Having voted for them one year, they voted against them the next, thereby condemning nearly one in five of our adult population suffering from acute arthritis to a continuing drain on their financial resources.

Turning to the £100 million crime fund, not only does it contain nothing new, but all the repackaging of existing funds does not even add up to £100 million. The pledge to invest in school buildings is just as empty. Not only has the £560 million not all been found, but there is no targeting or monitoring of how the money is spent. Therefore, it may not be spent on school buildings at all. On half-price bus travel for 16 to 18-year-olds, the report states that you

'expect to have developed a scheme'

before your term of office ends. That is hardly a ringing sound of confidence.

Labour has done another about turn on reducing class sizes to 25—a commitment agreed to in the previous partnership Government—in favour of a pilot project to introduce free school breakfasts. The choice of priorities is strange, but the lack of drive is stranger. By the time the pilot has been completed and evaluated, it will be difficult to ensure that school pupils have more than one or two free breakfasts before the next Assembly elections. The pilot scheme to introduce free swimming for older people can be taken in the same sense as free breakfasts, with a snail's pace to match.

We have not yet seen the knowledge bank for entrepreneurs. We are told that we will have to wait another year for a commitment costing a mere £3 million. Meanwhile, the

ymagwedd y Llywodraeth tuag at y polisiau hyn wedi ymdebygu i gwch rwber sy'n gollwng. Rhowch addewid i ddarparu presgripsiynau am ddim: ni chymerwyd unrhyw gamau am 18 mis yna yr oedd y cam mawr a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn dro pedol o ran presgripsiynau am ddim i bobl â salwch croning. Ar ôl pleidleisio drostynt un flwyddyn, bu iddynt bleidleisio yn eu herbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, sy'n golygu bod bron un o bob pump o oedolion y wlad sy'n dioddef o arthritis aciwt yn gorfod defnyddio eu harian eu hunain yn barhaus.

Gan droi at y gronfa troseddau £100 miliwn, nid yw'r holl waith o ad-drefnu'r cronfeydd presennol yn sicrhau £100 miliwn hyd yn oed heb sôn am gynnwys unrhyw beth newydd. Mae'r addewid i fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion yr un mor wag. Nid yn unig na sicrhawyd y £560 miliwn i gyd, ond nid yw'r ffordd y caiff yr arian ei wario yn cael ei dargedu na'i fonitro ychwaith. Felly, efallai na chaiff ei wario ar adeiladau ysgolion o gwbl. O ran teithio ar fws am hanner pris i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 mlwydd oed, dywed yr adroddiad eich bod

yn disgwyl bod wedi datblygu cynllun

cyn i'ch tymor mewn swydd ddod i ben. Prin bod hynny'n dangos ryw lawer o hyder.

Mae Llafur wedi gwneud tro pedol arall o ran lleihau maint dosbarthiadau i 25—ymrwymiad y cytunwyd arno yn y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth flaenorol—o blaid prosiect peilot i gyflwyno brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion. Mae'r dewis o flaenoriaethau yn rhyfedd, ond mae'r diffyg ymdrech hyd yn oed yn rhyfeddach. Erbyn i'r prosiect peilot gael ei gwblhau a'i werthuso, bydd yn anodd sicrhau bod disgylion ysgol yn cael mwy nag un neu ddau frecwast am ddim cyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Gellir ystyried y cynllun peilot i gyflwyno sesiynau nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn yn yr un modd ag yr ystyri brecwast am ddim, gyda phawb yn llusgo traed.

Nid ydym wedi gweld y banc gwybodaeth i entreprenoriaid eto. Dywedir wrthym y bydd yn rhaid inni aros blwyddyn arall am ymrwymiad sy'n costio £3 miliwn yn unig.

specific budget line for the business birth rate strategy has been axed. The report's pledge to introduce 20 mph safe zones for schools is impossible to evaluate. The last time that Ministers were questioned about progress on the promise to scrap home care charges for the disabled, they had not even agreed the definition of 'disabled', let alone the delivery of the policy.

This leaves just one top 10 pledge that has been delivered—the promise to rule out university top-up fees during this Assembly term. This will only operate differently in Wales compared to England for a year. The Rees commission, with the Minister breathing down its neck, was reconvened to make us fall in line with top-up fees in England. Therefore, of Labour's top ten pledges, the record of achievement is thin. In its own terms, Labour has little to be proud of. That is without reference to the scandal that is the Welsh NHS, which Ieuan has referred to, the appalling waiting times that Welsh patients face to get treatment. It is also without reference to the First Minister's failure to take forward the Richard commission's unanimous report, and his about turn on his own convictions and his failure to win support from colleagues on the 13.2+ proposals. The First Minister calls this a fascinating debate. The reality is that it is a feast of u-turns. It is a pretty sorry tale. This is a government which missed its first year honeymoon by going to sleep, which, rather than hitting the ground running, after the election, has spent 16 months on a leisurely stroll around the block and is failing to achieve and inspire. The Labour Assembly Government is not active enough to be called New Labour. It is not radical enough to be called Welsh Labour. Its lack of ambition and action are more a case of No Labour.

**Nick Bourne:** The First Minister's annual report as presented today was an exercise in complacency and arrogance. This is the first chance that we have had to debate an annual report for over 18 months. We have not had such a debate in the second Assembly, which

Yn y cyfamser, mae'r llinell gyllideb benodol ar gyfer y strategaeth cyfradd busnesau newydd wedi cael ei dileu. Mae addewid yr adroddiad i gyflwyno parthau diogel 20 mya ar gyfer ysgolion yn amhosibl ei gwerthuso. Pan gafodd Gweinidogion ei holi y tro diwethaf am y cynnydd a wnaed o ran yr addewid i ddileu taliadau gofal cartref i'r anabl, nid oeddent hyd yn oed wedi cytuno ar y diffiniad o 'anabl', heb sôn am gyflawni'r polisi.

Mae hyn yn golygu mai dim ond un o'r 10 prif addewid a wireddwyd—yr addewid i ddileu ffioedd ychwanegol prifysgol yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad hwn. Dim ond am flwyddyn y bydd hyn yn gweithredu'n wahanol yng Nghymru o gymharu â Lloegr. Ailgynnullwyd comisiwn Rees, gyda'r Gweinidog yn pwysu ar ei war, er mwyn inni fod yn unol â ffioedd ychwanegol yn Lloegr. Felly, o blith deg prif addewid Llafur, mae'r cofnod cyrhaeddiad yn wan. Yn ôl ei llinyn mesur ei hun, nid oes gan Lafur lawer i ymfalchïo ynddo. Mae hynny heb sôn am sgandal GIG Cymru, y cyfeiriodd Ieuan ati, yr amseroedd aros gwarthus a wynebir gan gleifion yng Nghymru sy'n aros am driniaeth. Mae hyn hefyd heb sôn am fethiant y Prif Weinidog i weithredu ar adroddiad unfrydol comisiwn Richard, a'i dro pedol ar ei argyhoeddiadau ei hun a'i fethiant i ennill cefnogaeth cyd-Aelodau ar gynigion 13.2+. Geilw'r Prif Weinidog hyn yn ddadl ddiddorol. Y gwir yw ei bod yn wledd o droeon pedol. Mae'n hanes eithaf truenus. Llywodraeth yw hon a gollodd fis mîl ei blwyddyn gyntaf drwy fynd i gysgu, sydd, yn hytrach na mynd ati i weithio'n galed a llwyddiannus, ar ôl yr etholiad, wedi treulio 16 mis yn mynd am dro bach hamddenol ac wedi methu â chyflawni ac ysbrydoli. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ddigon gweithgar i'w galw yn Llafur Newydd. Nid yw'n ddigon radical i'w galw yn Llafur Cymru. Bellach oherwydd ei diffyg uchelgais a gweithredoedd byddai'n fwy addas ei galw yn Ddim Llafur.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr oedd adroddiad blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog fel y'i cyflwynwyd heddiw yn ymarfer mewn hunanfoddhad a haerllugrwydd. Dyma'r cyfle cyntaf a gawsom i drafod adroddiad blynnyddol ers dros 18 mis. Ni chawsom drafodaeth o'r fath

is rather curious. One would think that an annual report would be just that. It may well be that the First Minister thinks that there is little or nothing to crow about and that is why we have had this delay. I can understand that, if that is the reason for the delay.

I have read the annual report and draw attention to a few points. The First Minister talks about striking a chord with the people of Wales after the Assembly elections in true democratic fashion. This is the first example of complacency. All politicians should be wary of complacency, considering the low turn-out during the elections. For example, our most famous first-past-the-post Member in Alyn and Deeside—where the turn-out was less than one quarter—was supported by some 12 per cent of the voters. If that is true democracy, then there we are. I give way to our most famous first-past-the-post Member.

**Carl Sargeant:** As the directly-elected Member for Alyn and Deeside, I thank you for giving way. Do you agree that, because of democracy, 10 out of 11 Members of a party can be elected? If that is true democracy, it is beyond me. It perverses the system allowed for the Welsh people. Even worse, all the leaders in the opposition are list members which is even odder.

**Nick Bourne:** I hope that Alun Michael was listening to that. First, I remind you that Alun Michael was re-elected by that system. Secondly, it was a system that was introduced by the Labour party. Eventually, the people in Alyn and Deeside will wake up to the fact that their Member talks of nothing except the first directly-elected, first-past-the-post member for Alyn and Deeside. They will elect someone else, and hasten the day. Sit down. Let me move on to another point.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It seems that the leader of the Welsh Conservatives is not keen to accept any more interventions at this point.

yn yr ail Gynulliad, sydd ychydig yn rhyfedd. Byddai rhywun yn meddwl y byddai adroddiad blynnyddol yn golygu hynny. Efallai fod y Prif Weinidog yn credu nad oes fawr ddim neu ddim o gwbl i ymffrostio yn ei gylch a dyna pam y cawsom yr oedi hwn. Gallaf ddeall hynny, os mai dyna'r rheswm am yr oedi.

Yr wyf wedi darllen yr adroddiad blynnyddol a thynnaf sylw at rai pwytiau. Sonia'r Prif Weinidog am daro tant gyda phobl Cymru ar ôl etholiadau'r Cynulliad mewn ffodd wirioneddol ddemocratiaidd. Dyma'r enghraift gyntaf o hunanfodhau. Dylai pob gwleidydd wyllo rhag bod yn hunanfodlon, o gofio'r nifer fach o bobl a bleidleisiodd yn ystod yr etholiadau. Er enghraift, cefnogwyd ein Haelod cyntaf i'r felin enwocaf yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy—lle y pleidleisiodd llai na chwarter o'r boblogaeth—gan tua 12 y cant o'r pleidleiswyr. Os mai democratiaeth wirioneddol yw hynny, yna felly y mae. Ildiaf i'n Haelod cyntaf i'r felin enwocaf.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel yr Aelod dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol, diolchaf ichi am ildio. A gytunwch, oherwydd democratiaeth, y gellir ethol 10 o blith 11 Aelod o blaids? Os mai democratiaeth wirioneddol yw hynny, mae y tu hwnt i mi. Mae'n gwyrdroi'r system a ganiateir ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Yn waeth na hynny, mae holl arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau yn aelodau rhestr sydd hyd yn oed yn fwy rhyfedd.

**Nick Bourne:** Gobeithiaf fod Alun Michael yn gwrando ar hynny. Yn gyntaf, fe'ch atgoffaf i Alun Michael gael ei ailethol gan y system honno. Yn ail, yr oedd yn system a gyflwynwyd gan y Blaid Lafur. Yn y pen draw, bydd pobl Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn sylweddoli nad yw eu Haelod yn sôn am ddim heblaw'r aelod cyntaf i'r felin a gafodd ei ethol yn uniongyrchol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Byddant yn ethol rhywun arall, a brysied y dydd. Eisteddwch. Gadewch imi symud ymlaen at bwynt arall.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ymddengys nad yw arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn awyddus i dderbyn rhagor o ymyriadau ar y pwyt hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** One area that the First Minister touched upon was employment. All I can say is that there is a danger of hubris. No reference was made to the civil service jobs or the 500 Panasonic workers at Pentwyn—with whom I sympathise—who were served with redundancy notices today for the end of the year. Therefore, is not this hubris, First Minister? I will ensure that we keep our promises that the First Minister makes in the annual report discussed today. I listened carefully to your statement on the hospital waiting list position. You talked a great deal about some of the successes that you have had. One in 10 people are on a waiting list. The figure is now 85 per cent higher than when you took over in 1999 in this Assembly. If there had been some sidefalls here and there it is like saying, after setting fire to the factory you take credit for coming along with a bucket of water to ensure that it does not spread to the gatehouse.

3.30 p.m.

It is your fault that the waiting list position is so dire. That is the measure of assessing the Government. What has the Government done for public services? No public service is more important than healthcare. Your Government has introduced a two-tier system in which many people cannot afford to wait and have to beg for and borrow the money in order to ensure that they receive private healthcare. For any Government to perceive that as being an acceptable position is deeply shameful.

**The First Minister:** Can I give you some figures published this morning? In July 2001, 2,270 people were waiting over 18 months for orthopaedic treatment, today that figure is 11. In 2001, 1,900 people were waiting over four months for cataract operations and now that is 102. There were 64 people waiting over six months, the target figure, for an angiogram and now that is down to 0. Do you accept that that represents very considerable progress?

**Nick Bourne:** Un maes y soniodd y Prif Weinidog amdano oedd cyflogaeth. Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod perygl iddo ymfalchö ormod yn hyn. Ni chyfeiriwyd at swyddi'r gwasanaeth sifil na'r 500 o weithwyr Panasonic ym Mhentwyn—yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â hwy—a gafodd eu hysbysu heddiw am ddiswyddiadau ar gyfer diwedd y flwyddyn. Felly, onid balchder yw hyn, Brif Weinidog? Byddaf yn sicrhau ein bod yn cadw ein haddewidion a wna'r Prif Weinidog yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol a drafodir heddiw. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar eich datganiad ar y sefyllfa o ran rhestrau aros ysbytai. Bu ichi sôn llawer am rai o'r llwyddiannau a gawsoch. Mae un o bob 10 person ar restr aros. Mae'r ffigur bellach yn 85 y cant yn uwch na phan ddaethoch i rym yn 1999 yn y Cynulliad hwn. Os oedd mân welliannau yma ac acw mae fel dweud, ar ôl rhoi'r ffatri ar dân yr ydych yn cymryd y clod am ddod â bwced o ddŵr i sicrhau nad yw'r tân yn ymledu i'r porthdy.

Eich bai chi ydyw bod y sefyllfa o ran y rhestrau aros mor ofnadwy. Dyna'r ffordd o asesu'r Llywodraeth. Beth mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei wneud ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Nid oes un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn bwysicach na gofal iechyd. Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi cyflwyno system dwy haen lle na all llawer o bobl fforddio aros ac maent yn gorfol benthyca'r arian er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael gofal iechyd preifat. Mae'n warthus bod unrhyw Lywodraeth yn ystyried hynny yn sefyllfa dderbynio.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** A allaf roi rhai ffigurau ichi a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma? Ym mis Gorffennaf 2001, yr oedd 2,270 o bobl yn aros am fwy na 18 mis am driniaeth orthopedig, heddiw 11 yw'r ffigur hwnnw. Yn 2001, yr oedd 1,900 o bobl yn aros am fwy na phedwar mis ar gyfer llawdriniaeth cataract a bellach mae 102 yn aros. Yr oedd 64 o bobl yn aros am fwy na chwe mis, y ffigur targed, am angiogram a bellach mae'r ffigur wedi gostwng i 0. A dderbynioch fod hynny'n gynnydd sylweddol?

**Nick Bourne:** I will repeat the point that I have just made; perhaps you were not listening. I said that you were taking credit for decreasing the figures from the unacceptably high levels that you pushed them up to. That is the point. You have not challenged the fact that there are 311,000 people on waiting lists in Wales today, which is virtually the population of Cardiff. You may be happy with that, but I certainly am not.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you share the concern and disgust of one of my constituents, who was told that he would have to wait 88 weeks to see a consultant for the first time, even before he is put on an in-patient list? His leg is going black and he has told me that he will have to use his retirement savings to pay for the treatment that he so badly needs. That is the reality of the third world service that we are receiving in Wales today.

**Nick Bourne:** That is a specific example of the general problem to which I refer.

The public also wants a responsive Government that is open and honest, said the First Minister. This from a First Minister who interfered in the appointment of the Counsel General and pushed for the second candidate. We know the same happened with the Welsh Language Board. It is not surprising that we have a second-rate Government when it seems to insist on appointing the person who comes second in the interview process rather than the one who comes first.

The First Minister's report is full of priorities, agendas and promises, but very light on delivery. I read the timeline last night. The report includes events such as giving Joe Calzaghe an MBE, which is welcome, and the passing of John Charles, which is sad, but surely they are beyond the remit of the First Minister. However, we begin to understand the psyche that regards golf as being more important than honouring Welsh veterans. That is why such matters appear in the annual report.

**Nick Bourne:** Ailadroddaf y pwynt yr wyf newydd ei wneud; efallai nad oeddech yn gwrando. Dywedais eich bod yn cymryd y clod am ostwng y ffigurau o'r lefelau annerbyniol o uchel y bu ichi eu codi iddynt. Dyna'r pwynt. Nid ydych wedi herio'r ffaith bod 311,000 o bobl ar restrau aros yng Nghymru heddiw, sef poblogaeth Caerdydd bron. Efallai eich bod yn fodlon ar hynny ond yn sicr nid wyf fi.

**Mark Isherwood:** A rannwch bryder a diflastod un o'm hetholwyr, a gafodd wybod y byddai'n rhaid iddo aros am 88 o wythnosau i weld meddyg ymgynghorol am y tro cyntaf, cyn iddo gael ei roi ar restr cleifion mewnol hyd yn oed? Mae ei goes yn troi'n ddu ac mae wedi dweud wrthyf y bydd yn gorfol defnyddio ei gynillion ymddeol i dalu am y driniaeth sydd ei hangen yn ddybryd arno. Dyna realiti'r gwasanaeth trydydd byd a gawn yng Nghymru heddiw.

**Nick Bourne:** Dyna enghraift benodol o'r broblem gyffredinol y cyfeiriaf ati.

Dyweddodd y Prif Weinidog fod y cyhoedd am gael Llywodraeth ymatebol sy'n agored a gonest hefyd. Daeth hyn oddi wrth Brif Weinidog a ymyrrodd ym mhenodiad y Cwnsler Cyffredinol ac a ymgyrchodd dros yr ail ymgeisydd. Gwyddom i'r un peth ddigwydd gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Nid yw'n syndod bod gennym Lywodraeth eilradd pan ymddengys ei bod yn mynnu penodi'r person sy'n dod yn ail yn y broses gyfweld yn hytrach na'r un sy'n dod yn gyntaf.

Mae adroddiad y Prif Weinidog yn llawn blaenoriaethau, agendâu ac addewidion, ond prin yw'r sôn am yr hyn a gyflawnir ganddo. Darllenais yr amserlen neithiwr. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys digwyddiadau megis rhoi MBE i Joe Calzaghe, sydd i'w groesawu, a marwolaeth John Charles, sy'n drist, ond onid yw'r pethau hynny y tu hwnt i gylch gwaith y Prif Weinidog? Fodd bynnag, dechreuwn ddeall meddwl rhywun sy'n credu bod golff yn bwysicach nac anrhyydeddu cyn-filwyr Cymru. Dyna pam mae materion o'r fath yn ymddangos yn yr adroddiad blynnyddol.

People want to see improvements in public services, reduction in student debt, certainties about top-up fees; they do not want these unacceptably high waiting lists. After seven years in power and five years of devolution, it is time to stop talking and to start delivering.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome the First Minister's annual report, which is about delivery for the people of Wales and for my constituents in Cardiff South and Penarth. The issue that continues to plague communities in my constituency is anti-social behaviour, which ranges from verbal and physical abuse on doorsteps to motorbikes driving through gardens, rows of cars being scratched and smashed and graffiti sprayed on every available piece of wall. That is why I want to focus on measures that this Assembly Government is taking to make those communities safer and stronger and specifically with the Assembly's crime-fighting fund.

While the opposition is interested in nit-picking, I am glad that the Welsh Assembly Government is continuing to support and develop this fund because it is working.

**Peter Black:** I appreciate that you, like the Government, may not fully understand what exactly the crime-fighting fund is for, but most of it seems to be old money and not much of it is dedicated to attacking the type of problems that you describe. To what extent is the crime-fighting fund dealing with those problems?

**Lorraine Barrett:** I do not have the figures to hand, Peter, but the fund is being used to deal with these issues and I have examples that I can let you have in writing.

In my constituency, many projects are already progressing under the drug and control action fund, the safer communities fund, domestic violence initiatives—and we all received an awakening yesterday when we attended the launch of the new helpline for domestic abuse—and funding for pilot

Mae pobl am weld gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, lleihad mewn dyledion myfyrwyr, sicrwyd am ffioedd ychwanegol; nid ydynt am gael y rhestrau aros annerbyniol o uchel hyn. Ar ôl saith mlynedd mewn grym a phum mlynedd o ddatganoli, mae'n bryd rhoi'r gorau i siarad a dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Croesawaf adroddiad blynnyddol y Prif Weinidog, sydd a wnelo â chyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru ac ar gyfer fy etholwyr i yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth. Y broblem sy'n parhau i blagio cymunedau yn fy etholaeth i yw ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, sy'n amrywio o ddifrif a chamdriniaeth gorfforol ar garreg y drws i feiciau modur yn cael eu gyrru drwy erddi, rhesi o geir yn cael eu crafu a'u malu a graffiti yn cael eu chwistrellu ar bob darn o wal. Dyna pam yr wyf am ganolbwytio ar gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon yn eu cymryd i wneud y cymunedau hynny yn fwy diogel a chryf ac yn benodol gyda chronfa ymladd troseddau'r Cynulliad.

Er bod y gwrthbleidiau yn ymddiddori mewn pigo beiâu, yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i gefnogi a datblygu'r gronfa hon, oherwydd mae yn gweithio.

**Peter Black:** Gwerthfawrogaf nad ydych chi, fel y Llywodraeth, yn llwyr ddeall efallai diben y gronfa ymladd troseddau, ond ymddengys fod llawer o'r gronfa yn hen arian ac nid yw llawer o'r arian yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â'r math o broblemau a ddisgrifir gennych. I ba raddau y mae'r gronfa ymladd troseddau yn ymdrin â'r problemau hyn?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Nid yw'r ffigurau wrth law gennyf, Peter, ond mae'r gronfa yn cael ei defnyddio i ymdrin â'r materion hyn ac mae gennyf enghreiftiau y gallaf eu rhoi ichi yn ysgrifenedig.

Yn fy etholaeth i, mae llawer o brosiectau eisoes yn mynd rhagdynt o dan y gronfa weithredu ar reoli cyffuriau, y gronfa cymunedau diogelach, mentrau traïs yn y cartref—a daethom oll yn ymwybodol o hyn ddoe yn lansiad y llinell gymorth newydd ar gyfer camdriniaeth yn y cartref—a chyllid ar

projects to tackle disaffection in schools, which addresses some of the woolly excuses made yesterday for not supporting Welsh Labour on anti-social behaviour orders.

However, I hope that by the time the First Minister presents his next report, it will show further progress on the roll-out of crime-fighting measures such as alleygating, which can provide a safer and cleaner space for householders. I would like to see that piloted in some wards in Cardiff South and Penarth. However, I hesitate there, given that the Liberal Democrats are now, unfortunately, the biggest party in Cardiff, because of their lack of support for measures to tackle anti-social behaviour. As we know, the Liberal Democrats are soft on crime and not interested in supporting communities blighted by anti-social behaviour. However, you would not believe it if you listened to their spin machine, particularly here in Cardiff. For example, let us consider the anti-social behaviour orders recently introduced in Bayside in Splott in my constituency, which I, along with Alun Michael, Councillor Clarissa Holland and former Councillor Martin Holland, have been involved with for years in trying to help residents. Those orders are now helping the police to tackle youth annoyance and making people feel safer in their homes, free from the worry of youth crime and annoyance—

gyfer prosiectau peilot i fynd i'r afael â dadrithiad mewn ysgolion, sy'n ymdrin â rhai o'r esgusodion aneglur a wnaed ddoe dros beidio â chefnogi Llafur Cymru ar orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Fodd bynnag, erbyn i'r Prif Weinidog gyflwyno ei adroddiad nesaf, gobeithiaf y bydd yn dangos cynnydd pellach ar y gwaith o gyflwyno mesurau ymladd troseddau megis gosod gatiau, a all ddarparu lle mwy diogel a glanach i bobl yn eu cartrefi. Hoffwn weld hynny'n cael ei gyflwyno ar ffurf peilot mewn rhai wardiau yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth. Fodd bynnag, oedaf, o gofio mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn anffodus, yw'r blaid fwyaf yng Nghaerdydd bellach, oherwydd eu diffyg cefnogaeth i fesurau i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Fel y gwyddom, mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn drugarog tuag at droseddwyr ac nid oes diddordeb ganddynt mewn cefnogi cymunedau sydd wedi eu difetha gan ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddch yn ei gredu pe baech yn gwrando ar eu peiriant sbin, yn arbennig yma yng Nghaerdydd. Er enghraift, gadewch inni ystyried y gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a gyflwynwyd yn ddiweddar yn Bayside yn y Sblot yn fy etholaeth i, yr wyf fi, ynghyd ag Alun Michael, y Cyngorydd Clarissa Holland a'r cyn Gynghorydd Martin Holland, wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â hwy ers blynnyddoedd yn ceisio helpu trigolion. Mae'r gorchmynion hynny yn helpu'r heddlu yn awr i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol pobl ifanc ac yn helpu pobl i deimlo'n fwy diogel yn eu cartrefi, heb bryderu am droseddau ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol pobl ifanc—

**Peter Black:** Will you give way?

**Lorraine Barrett:** No, Peter.

Those measures prompted the Liberal-Democrat-led-council to herald such innovative action, some two months after taking over Cardiff, and even claim credit for it. It is surprising because in Westminster, and at Cardiff County Council level, they had previously opposed all of Labour's efforts to tackle the misery caused by anti-social behaviour. You need not take my word for it,

**Peter Black:** A ildiwrch?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Na wnaf, Peter.

Ysgogodd y mesurau hynny y cyngor o dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ddatgan camau arloesol o'r fath, tua dau fis ar ôl cymryd yr awenau yng Nghaerdydd, a chymryd y clod amdano hyd yn oed. Mae'n syndod, oherwydd yn San Steffan, ac yng Nghyngor Sir Caerdydd, yr oeddent wedi gwrthwynebu holl ymdrechion Llafur o'r blaen i fynd i'r afael â'r dioddefaint a achosir

Peter, just take a look at your record. In Westminster, the Liberal Democrats voted against the Anti-social Behaviour Bill. Simon Hughes MP called measures in the Bill ‘misguided’ and ‘unnecessary’. Tell that to the people of Bayside. In addition, while in opposition in Cardiff—

gan ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Nid oes angen ichi gymryd fy ngair i am hyn, Peter, edrychwrch ar eich record chi eich hun. Yn San Steffan, pleidleisiodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn erbyn y Mesur Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol. Galwodd Simon Hughes AS y mesurau yn y Mesur yn gyfeiliornus a diangen. Dywedwch hynny wrth bobl Bayside. Yn ogystal, pan oeddent yn gweithredu fel yr wrtblaid yng Nghaerdydd—

**Peter Black:** Will you give way?

**Lorraine Barrett:** No, Peter.

While in opposition in Cardiff, they voted against a resolution calling for tough action—Liberals do not like tough action—to tackle anti-social behaviour. The Liberal Democrat leader of Cardiff council opposed dispersal powers, which he is now welcoming in Splott. First Minister, it is essential that your Government—my Government, of which I am proud—continues to take action to tackle my constituents' biggest concern. I only hope that local authorities, on which many of these initiatives are reliant, have the common sense to implement them to help tackle anti-social behaviour and ensure that the people who rightly deserve it are protected from crime.

**Peter Black:** A ildiwch?

**Lorraine Barrett:** Na wnaf, Peter.

Pan oeddent yn gweithredu fel yr wrtblaid yng Nghaerdydd, bu iddynt bleidleisio yn erbyn cynnig yn galw am weithredu llym—nid yw'r Rhyddfrydwyr yn hoffi gweithredu llym—i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Gwrthwynebodd y Democrat Rhyddfrydol sy'n arwain cyngor Caerdydd bwerau gwasgaru, y mae bellach yn eu croesawu yn y Sblot. Brif Weinidog, mae'n hanfodol bod eich Llywodraeth chi—fy Llywodraeth i, yr wyf yn falch ohoni—yn parhau i gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â phryder mwyaf fy etholwyr. Ni allaf ond gobeithio bod gan awdurdodau lleol, y mae llawer o'r mentrau hyn yn dibynnau arnynt, y synnwyr cyffredin i'w rhoi ar waith i helpu i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a sicrhau bod y bobl sy'n ei haeddu, a hynny'n briodol, yn cael eu diogelu rhag troseddau.

**Leanne Wood:** Do you accept that in two or three years' time, when the current anti-social behaviour measures are assessed, they will be proved to be of no effect with regard to reducing peoples' fear of crime? Do you accept that we must take a different approach? Rather than coming down hard on people, moving them on, punishing them and placing curfews on young people who, for whatever reason, engage in anti-social behaviour, we should deal with the causes of crime and not just the symptoms.

**Leanne Wood:** A dderbyniwch, ymhen dwy neu dair blynedd, pan asesir y mesurau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol presennol, y gwelir nad ydynt yn cael unrhyw effaith o ran lleihau ofn pobl o droseddau? A dderbyniwch fod yn rhaid inni fabwysiadu ymagwedd wahanol? Yn hytrach na chosbi pobl yn galed, eu symud ymlaen, a rhoi cyrffiw ar bobl ifanc sydd, am ba reswm bynnag, yn ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol, dylem ymdrin ag achosion troseddu ac nid y symptomau yn unig.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I agree Leanne, and that is at the top of our agenda. I mentioned some of the projects that are dealing with the causes of crime, but that does not help people in Bayside in Splott, whose lives are made a

**Lorraine Barrett:** Cytunaf Leanne, ac mae hynny ar frig ein hagenda. Soniais am rai o'r prosiectau sy'n ymdrin ag achosion troseddu, ond nid yw hynny'n helpu pobl yn Bayside yn y Sblot, y mae ymddygiad o'r fath yn

misery by such behaviour. However, I agree that we must deal with the causes of crime and help these young people, but I must also help my constituents in Cardiff South and Penarth.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n amlwg fod y Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bwriadu llawer o bethau da. Mae adroddiad y Prif Weinidog yn llawn bwriadau da, a phe bai ei Lywodraeth yn cael ei fesur ar fwriadau da, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai gyhoeddi adroddiad ffafriol ynglŷn â hynny. Yn anffodus, mae'r cyflawniadau yn brin eithriadol. Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog hyd yn oed yn llwyddo i gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol yn flynyddol. Sut y mae modd disgrifio adroddiad yn adroddiad blynyddol os na chaiff ei gyflwyno'n flynyddol?

Brif Weinidog, dywedasoch fod y Llywodraeth Lafur yma yn y Cynulliad wedi llwyddo i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau ym maes iechyd. Ni wn am unrhyw un, heblaw amdanoch chithau a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a fyddai'n meiddio gwneud y fath gyhoeddiad. Nid oes unrhyw un arall yn credu hynny. Cyfeiriasoch at rai mathau o driniaeth lle mae gwelliannau wedi datblygu, ond maent yn brin eithriadol. Rhaid ichi gydnabod bod y ffigurau diwethaf, a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma, yn dangos bod nifer y bobl sydd ar restrau aros wedi cynyddu. Mae mwy o bobl ar restrau aros yn awr nag a fu erioed, ac mae hynny o ganlyniad i bum mlynedd o fethiant gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau.

3.40 p.m.

Fe'ch atgoffaf o'r addewid a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur gyntaf y Cynulliad:

'By the end of a Labour Assembly's first term, no one will wait more than six months for out-patient treatment, or more than 18 months for in-patient treatment.'

Erbyn hyn, mae bron i 1,500 o gleifion yn aros am driniaeth yn ein hysbytai, ac mae bron i 74,000 yn aros i weld meddyg am eu triniaeth gyntaf. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 239 y cant ers gwneud yr addewid honno ar

gwneud eu bywydau mor ddiflas. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni ymdrin ag achosion troseddu a helpu'r bobl ifanc hyn, ond rhaid imi helpu fy etholwyr yn Ne Caerdydd a Phenarth hefyd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is obvious that the Labour Government in the National Assembly for Wales has many good intentions. The First Minister's report is full of good intentions, and if his Government was measured on good intentions, I am sure that he could publish a favourable report on that. Unfortunately, achievements are extremely scarce. The First Minister does not even succeed in presenting his annual report annually. How can a report be described as an annual report if it is not presented annually?

First Minister, you said that the Labour Government here in the Assembly has succeeded in getting to grips with the problems in health. I do not know of anyone, apart from you and the Minister for Health and Social Services, who would dare to make such a statement. No-one else believes that. You referred to some kinds of treatment where there have been improvements, but they are extremely scarce. You must acknowledge that the latest figures, which were announced this morning, show that the number of people on waiting lists has increased. There are more people on waiting lists now than there have ever been, and that is as a result of five years of failure by the Labour Assembly Government to tackle those problems.

I remind you of the promise made by the first Labour Assembly Government:

Erbyn diwedd tymor cyntaf Cynulliad Llafur, ni fydd neb yn aros am fwy na chwe mis am driniaeth cleifion allanol, na mwy na 18 mis am driniaeth cleifion mewnol.

Almost 1,500 patients are now waiting for treatment in our hospitals, and almost 74,000 are waiting to see a doctor for initial treatment. That is an increase of 239 per cent since that promise was made at the beginning

ddechrau'r Cynulliad yn 1999. Pa fath o fesur o lwyddiant yw hynny?

How can you claim, First Minister, that you have succeeded in dealing with the problems of the health service in Wales when the figures clearly show that you have failed? You refer to certain areas where there have been improvements as if you are surprised that you managed to improve any of the figures at all. Surely you expect to have made some improvements in five years. The baseline is that more people are on waiting lists in Wales today than there have ever been. That is a direct result of your mismanagement of the health service.

On the children's commissioner, the Government and the First Minister were full of good intentions. You intended—and you have said this on several occasions—that the Children's Commissioner for Wales would be a one-stop shop for children and young people, to deal with any problems that they may have, yet you singularly failed to persuade the Minister for Children in Westminster to allow that to become reality. In the Children Bill, you have allowed them in Westminster to ensure that non-devolved matters will be dealt with by the commissioner in England. This will create utter confusion for young people and children in Wales as to who they should approach if they have a problem, and the children's commissioner himself has said that that will make his work difficult.

You have shown, once again, that you are full of good intentions, but when will we begin to see the outcomes of those intentions? When we see those outcomes, we will be prepared to welcome your report, but until we see them, we can do nothing. Allow us to be proved wrong, First Minister; why not create a few outcomes so that we can be proved wrong? All we have at the moment are empty intentions, good they may be, but there are few outcomes. You have given us a report that shows that over five years, even though it has good intentions, the Government has managed to achieve little in terms of many of the areas for which you have responsibility, and health is an example of that. The situation is worse now than when you came to power in 1999, and that is a sad fact for

of the Assembly in 1999. What kind of measure of success is that?

Sut y gallwch honni, Brif Weinidog, eich bod wedi llwyddo i ymdrin â phroblemau'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru pan ddengys y ffigurau yn amlwg eich bod wedi methu? Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at rai meysydd lle y gwnaed gwelliannau fel pe baech yn synnu eich bod wedi llwyddo i wella unrhyw rai o'r ffigurau o gwbl. Onid oeddech yn disgwyl gwneud rhai gwelliannau mewn pum mlynedd? Y gwir yw bod mwy o bobl ar restrau aros yng Nghymru heddiw nag a fu erioed. Canlyniad uniongyrchol sut y bu ichi gamreoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd yw hynny.

O ran y comisiynydd plant, yr oedd y Llywodraeth a'r Prif Weinidog yn llawn bwriadau da. Eich bwriad chi oedd—ac yr ydych wedi dweud hyn sawl gwaith—y byddai Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn siop un stop i blant a phobl ifanc, i ddelio ag unrhyw broblemau a allai fod ganddynt, ac eto yr ydych wedi methu â darbwyllo'r Gweinidog dros Blant yn San Steffan i ganiatáu i hynny ddigwydd. Yn y Mesur Plant, yr ydych wedi caniatáu iddynt hwy yn San Steffan sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â materion annatganoledig gan y comisiynydd yn Lloegr. Bydd hyn yn creu dryswch llwyr i bobl ifanc a phlant yng Nghymru ac ni fyddant yn gwybod â phwy y dylent gysylltu os bydd ganddynt broblem, ac mae'r comisiynydd plant ei hun wedi dweud y bydd hynny'n gwneud ei waith ef yn anodd.

Yr ydych wedi dangos, unwaith eto, eich bod yn llawn bwriadau da, ond pryd y dechreuwn weld canlyniadau'r bwriadau hynny? Pan welwn y canlyniadau hynny, byddwn yn barod i groesawu eich adroddiad, ond hyd nes y'u gwelwn, ni allwn wneud unrhyw beth. Dangoswch nad yw hynny'n wir, Brif Weinidog; pam na wnewch greu rhai canlyniadau fel y gallwch ddangos nad yw hynny'n wir? Y cyfan sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yw bwriadau gwag, er mor dda ydynt efallai, ond prin yw'r canlyniadau. Yr ydych wedi rhoi adroddiad inni sy'n dangos dros bum mlynedd, er bod ganddi fwriadau da, nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo i gyflawni llawer o ran y meysydd niferus yr ydych yn gyfrifol amdanyst, ac mae iechyd yn enghraift o hynny. Mae'r sefyllfa yn

those of us who fought over the years for devolution for Wales.

waeth yn awr nag yr oedd pan ddaethoch i rym yn 1999, ac mae hynny'n ffaith drist i'r rhai ohonom a frwydrodd dros y blynnyddoedd am ddatganoli i Gymru.

**John Griffiths:** We see great contrast in this debate on progress in Wales over the last year, between the progressive agenda of the Welsh Assembly Government and the carping of the opposition. When we consider reality, we see that what Rhodri Morgan said earlier is absolutely the case: things are moving forward impressively in Wales, on the economy and the provision of public services. We see great improvements with regard to jobs, as outlined, which is such a difference from the Tory years. We heard the recent announcement of 600 extra jobs coming to Newport, to the Office for National Statistics, which is further evidence of great improvements on the job front and in economic development.

**John Griffiths:** Gwelwn gyferbyniad mawr yn y ddadl hon ar gynnydd yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, rhwng agenda flaengar Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a chechu'r gwrthbleidiau. Pan ystyriwn y gwirionedd, gwelwn fod yr hyn a ddywedodd Rhodri Morgan yn gynharach yn hollol wir: mae pethau'n symud ymlaen yn aruthrol yng Nghymru, o ran yr economi a darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Gwelwn welliannau mawr o ran swyddi, fel y soniwyd, sy'n wahanol iawn i'r blynnyddoedd pan oedd y Toraid mewn grym. Clywsom y cyhoeddiad diweddar am 600 o swyddi ychwanegol yn dod i Gasnewydd, i'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, sy'n brawf pellach o welliannau mawr o ran swyddi a datblygu economaidd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I presume that you include the health service with public services. There are three independent reports that have described the health service in Wales under the Labour Government as unsustainable, inefficient and ineffective. Jon Owen Jones MP, a member of your party, referred to the way in which the health Minister is dealing with the portfolio as pathetic. How can you argue that you have a successful record on the health service?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cymeraf eich bod yn cynnwys y gwasanaeth iechyd wrth sôn am wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae tri adroddiad annibynnol wedi disgrifio'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur fel gwasanaeth anghynaliadwy, aneffeithlon ac aneffeithiol. Dywedodd Jon Owen Jones AS, aelod o'ch plaid chi, fod y ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog iechyd yn delio â'r portffolio yn druenus. Sut y gallwch ddadlau bod gennych record lwyddiannus o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd?

**John Griffiths:** I am afraid that, as ever, you give a partial and misleading account of supposed facts. The reality is different, and it has been outlined for you countless times. Unfortunately, the message still has not struck home.

**John Griffiths:** Ofnaf, fel bob tro, eich bod yn cyfleu'r ffeithiau tybiedig yn rhannol ac yn gamarweiniol. Mae'r gwirionedd yn wahanol, ac fe'i hamlinellwyd ichi sawl gwaith. Yn anffodus, nid yw'r neges wedi taro'r nod.

In this report, and contrary to opposition jibes, we see devolution developing. We have seen the largest package of additional devolution—fire and rescue services, student support, the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service—in the last year. We have seen the announcement on the abolition of quangos, and the Richard commission points the way forward for future development. Contrary to opposition jibes, we see the Assembly Government working to

Yn yr adroddiad hwn, ac yn groes i wawdianu'r gwrthbleidiau, gwelwn ddatganoli yn datblygu. Yr ydym wedi gweld y pecyn mwyaf o ddatganoli ychwanegol—gwasanaethau Tân ac achub, cymorth i fyfyrwyr, y Gwasanaeth Cyngori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd—dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Clywsom y cyhoeddiad am ddiddymu'r cwangos, ac mae comisiwn Richard yn dangos y ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer datblygu yn y dyfodol. Yn groes i

make Wales more cohesive and united, promoting a sense of belonging and identity, encouraging people everywhere to engage with the Assembly in taking Wales forward, whereas in huge contrast, opposition Members constantly seek to create division and discord for their own party political purposes.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You referred to the fact that the Richard commission is pointing the way forward. For Labour, which is the way forward?

**John Griffiths:** I am sure that you followed the debate on that with great interest, and it is set out in our document and was discussed at our conference. It is quite clear, and I am sure that you were paying attention and so do not really need an answer to that question.

In illustrating my remarks about the contrast between what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing and what the opposition seeks to do, which is to promote disharmony and bitterness, a classic example is the debate on hunting with dogs, which is not a devolved matter, but is one that many in opposition wish to see devolved to us. We see them trying, repeatedly, to pitch countryside against town. Some in the pro-hunting lobby think that they are above the law and above democracy. We have seen them impose house arrest on Westminster Ministers, cut off water supplies, bang doors and windows, make noise in the early hours, and display violence and aggression. Some of those people were the very people that urged the Tory Government on—in what was virtually a police state—against the miners during the 1984 miners' strike. Now, they seek to put themselves above the law and democracy in a totally absurd manner.

**Leanne Wood:** As someone totally opposed to hunting, I agree with the politics of what you say, but it is important to recognise that, sometimes, direct action is necessary to get a political point across. I am one of the 2

wawdai'r gwrthbleidiau, gwelwn Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio i wneud Cymru yn fwy cydlynus ac unedig, yn hyrwyddo ymdeimlad o berthyn a hunaniaeth, yn annog pobl ym mhobman i weithio gyda'r Cynulliad i ddatblygu Cymru, tra bod Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr, yn gyson yn ceisio creu rhaniadau ac anghytgord at eu dibenion gwleidyddol hwy eu hunain.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Bu ichi gyfeirio at yffaith bod comisiwn Richard yn dangos yffordd ymlaen. Ar gyfer Llafur, beth yw'r ffordd ymlaen?

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn siŵr ichi ddilyn y ddadl ar hynny gyda diddordeb mawr, ac fe'i nodir yn ein dogfen ac fe'i trafodwyd yn ein cynhadledd. Mae'n eithaf eglur, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn talu sylw ac felly nid oes angen ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw arnoch mewn gwirionedd.

Wrth egluro fy sylwadau ar y cyberbyniad rhwng yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud a'r hyn y mae'r gwrthbleidiau yn ceisio ei wneud, sef hyrwyddo anghytgord a chwerwder, enghraifft glasurol yw'r ddadl ar hela â chŵn, nad yw'n fater datganoledig, ond yn un yr hoffai sawl un o blith y gwrthbleidiau ei weld yn cael ei ddatganoli inni. Fe'u gwelwn, yn gyson, yn ceisio gwneud i gefn gwlaid gystadlu â'r dref. Mae rhai yn y garfan sydd o blaid hela yn credu eu bod y tu hwnt i'r gyfraith a democraciaeth. Yr ydym wedi eu gweld yn mynd i dai Gweinidogion San Steffan ac yn eu hatal rhag dod allan, yn torri'r cyflenwad dŵr, yn eurio ar ddrysau a ffenestri, yn gwneud sŵn yn oriau mân y bore, ac yn ymddwyn yn dreisgar ac ymosodol. Rhai o'r bobl hynny oedd yr union bobl a anogodd y Llywodraeth Doriaidd—yn yr hyn a oedd fwy neu lai yn wladwriaeth heddlu—i frwydro yn erbyn y glowyr yn ystod streic y glowyr yn 1984. Bellach, maent yn ceisio mynd y tu hwnt i'r gyfraith a democraciaeth mewn modd holol wirion.

**Leanne Wood:** Fel rhywun sy'n gwrthwynebu hela yn llwyr, cytunaf â gwleidyddiaeth yr hyn a ddywedwch, ond mae'n bwysig cydnabod, weithiau, bod angen gweithredu'n uniongyrchol i bwysleisio

million people who marched on the streets against the war on Iraq, but your Government did not take a blind bit of notice of a single person on that demonstration. That is the time that we have to say that political process is not working, democracy has fallen apart and direct action must be, sometimes, an acceptable way forward.

pwynt gwleidyddol. Yr wyf yn un o'r 2 filiwn o bobl a orymdeithiodd ar y strydoedd yn erbyn y rhyfel ar Irac, ond ni thalodd eich Llywodraeth unrhyw sylw i un person ar y gwrthdystiad hwnnw. Dyna pryd y mae'n rhaid inni ddweud nad yw'r broses wleidyddol yn gweithio, bod democratiaeth wedi chwalu ac mai gweithredu uniongyrchol, weithiau, yw'r ffordd ymlaen sy'n dderbyniol.

**John Griffiths:** I agree entirely that direct action is often necessary and important in our society, Leanne. I, too, was on that march, and I believe that the Government took a great deal of notice of the millions of people who took to the streets of London. They could not ignore it, and it was not ignored.

**John Griffiths:** Cytunaf yn llwyr bod gweithredu uniongyrchol yn aml yn angenrheidiol ac yn bwysig yn ein cymdeithas, Leanne. Yr oeddwn innau hefyd ar yr orymdaith honno, a chredaf i'r Llywodraeth dalu llawer o sylw i'r miliynau o bobl ar strydoedd Llundain. Ni allent eu hanwybyddu, ac ni chawsant eu hanwybyddu.

We will all have our own causes to support, and direct action is entirely defensible, but the sort of violence and aggression that we have seen from the pro-hunting lobby, whose members try to place themselves above and beyond democracy and the law, is entirely indefensible.

Bydd gan bob un ohonom ein hachosion i'w cefnogi, ac mae gweithredu uniongyrchol yn hollol ddiffynadwy, ond mae'r math o drais ac ymddygiad ymosodol a welsom gan y garfan o blaid hela, y mae eu haelodau yn ceisio mynd y tu hwnt i ddemocratiaeth a'r gyfraith, yn hollol anniffynadwy.

**Mark Isherwood rose—**

**Mark Isherwood a gododd—**

**John Griffiths:** Do I have time to give way to Mark Isherwood, Llywydd? If not, I will conclude.

**John Griffiths:** A oes gennyf amser i ildio i Mark Isherwood, Lywydd? Os nad oes, deuaf i ben.

**The Presiding Officer:** I will have to allow you half a minute if you allow the intervention.

**Y Llywydd:** Caniatâf hanner munud ichi os caniatewch yr ymyriad.

**John Griffiths:** Then I shall give way.

**John Griffiths:** Yna fe ildiaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** As someone who has never hunted and never plans to hunt, I went on the countryside march in support of civil rights and against the crisis in the rural economy. I ask you to take note of the miners' hunts—miners who were on the streets in the 1980s and who are now fighting again and who do not wear red coats. I want you to take account of the ordinary, working upland farmers in Wales, who need to use dogs to control predatory foxes when they attack their stock.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel rhywun nad yw erioed wedi hela ac nad yw byth yn bwriadu hela, euthum ar yr orymdaith cefn gwlad o blaid hawliau sifil ac yn erbyn yr argyfwng yn yr economi wledig. Gofynnaf ichi dalu sylw i helfeydd glowyr—glowyr a oedd ar y strydoedd yn y 1980au ac sydd bellach yn brwydro eto ac nad ydynt yn gwisgo cotiau coch. Yr wyf am ichi ystyried y ffermwyr mynydd cyffredin sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru, sy'n gorfod defnyddio cŵn i reoli llwynogod rheibus pan fyddant yn ymosod ar eu hanifeiliaid.

**John Griffiths:** All of that has been, and is being, taken into account, and when people make their points in a proper, democratic and lawful manner, then I am sure that they are listened to.

In conclusion, what a contrast there is between the Welsh Assembly Government and the opposition. The Welsh Assembly Government is taking Wales forward cohesively—north, south, mid, east and west, urban and rural—while the opposition constantly seeks to sow division and discord across Wales.

3.50 p.m.

**David Davies:** Is it not extraordinary that when the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside was asked a perfectly legitimate question about hunting, he sought to avoid answering it on the basis that it is not a devolved issue, and when the relevant Deputy Minister is given an opportunity to defend the Government's record on health, he starts talking about hunting?

You do not have to read far into this document to see how detached from reality this Government has become when it talks about the health service that it has delivered. Rhodri Morgan yesterday asked for proof from the nay-sayers, those who suggest that the health service in Wales is poorer than that in England. Here is the proof: a letter from Herefordshire Primary Care Trust. I will not read the whole letter, but one paragraph sums it all up. It says that English trusts are familiar with the requirements, but that significant difficulties continue to be experienced at some Welsh trusts, where the targets are 'different' and 'less conducive to timeous patient care'. That is the civil service way of saying that patient waiting times in Wales are much longer than they are in Herefordshire. This letter is addressed to general practitioners, and it advises them not to allow their patients to have anything to do with Welsh hospitals because of the waiting list times.

Just in case the message has not got through,

**John Griffiths:** Mae hynny i gyd wedi cael ei ystyried, ac yn cael ei ystyried, a phan fydd pobl yn gwneud eu pwyntiau mewn ffordd briodol, democrataidd a chyfreithlon, yna yr wyf yn siŵr y gwrandewir arnynt.

I gloi, mae cymaint o gyferbyniad rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r gwrthbleidiau. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn datblygu Cymru yn gydlynus—gogledd, de, canolbarth, dwyrain a gorllewin, trefol a gwledig—tra bod y gwrthbleidiau yn gysylltiedig yn ceisio creu rhaniadau ac anghytgord ledled Cymru.

**David Davies:** Onid yw'n rhyfedd pan ofynnwyd cwestiwn holol ddilys ynghylch hela i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad iddo geisio osgoi ei ateb ar y sail nad yw'n fater datganoledig, a phan roddir cyfle i'r Dirprwy Weinidog perthnasol amddiffyn record y Llywodraeth ar iechyd ei fod yn dechrau siarad am hela?

Nid oes yn rhaid ichi ddarllen llawer o'r ddogfen hon i weld pa mor bell o'r gwirionedd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon erbyn hyn pan fydd yn siarad am y gwasanaeth iechyd y mae wedi'i ddarparu. Gofynnodd Rhodri Morgan ddoe am brawf gan y rhai sy'n awgrymu bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn waeth nag yn Lloegr. Dyma'r prawf: llythyr oddi wrth Ymddiriedolaeth Gofal Sylfaenol swydd Henffordd. Ni ddarlenaf y llythyr cyfan, ond mae un paragraff yn ei grynhau. Dywed fod ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr yn gyfarwydd â'r gofynion, ond bod rhai ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru yn parhau i wynebu anawsterau difrifol, lle y mae'r targedau yn 'wahanol' ac yn 'llai tebygol o arwain at ofal amserol i gleifion'. Dyna ffordd y gwasanaeth sifil o ddweud bod amseroedd aros cleifion yng Nghymru yn llawer hwy nag y maent yn swydd Henffordd. Anfonwyd y llythyr hwn at feddygon teulu, ac mae'n eu cynghori i beidio â gadael i'w cleifion gael unrhyw gysylltiad ag ysbystai yng Nghymru oherwydd yr amseroedd y mae cleifion yn aros ar y rhestrau aros.

Rhag ofn nad yw rhai wedi deall hyn, ar y

on the back is a waiver that you have to sign if you want to go skydiving or on zip line, as Helen Mary will do on Friday. It states that the patient accepts that the waiting time for treatment may be longer than at a comparable English trust but that he or she wishes to be referred. GPs and patients have to sign it, and it shows that the people suitable for treatment in the Welsh health service at present are high-risk adrenalin addicts rather than high-risk patients. It is extraordinary that the Deputy Minister did not take the opportunity to try to defend his record.

We heard a slightly more sensible speech from Lorraine Barrett. I closed my eyes for a moment and imagined that she was a Conservative as she talked about the problems caused by out-of-control youths and the lack of any proper will within the justice system to deal with them. She reminded us about the hypocrisy of the Liberal Democrats. We did not need to be reminded of their propensity to condemn things one minute and take credit for them when they work the next. That is run of the mill. However, she forgot to mention that these anti-social problems are common right across Wales. I am currently dealing with a similar issue in Abergavenny. I met the police to discuss why it was so difficult to get evidence against the perpetrators of the misery that is keeping people awake until 2 a.m. or 3 a.m. in Abergavenny town, and they told me that one of the biggest problems is that the Human Rights Act 1998, signed by your Government, makes it virtually impossible for the police to collect covert evidence against the wrongdoers in this case. Therefore, yes, anti-social behaviour orders are a small step in the right direction, but the Human Rights Act 1998 that your Government signed puts more value on the human rights of the perpetrators of crime than on those of the victims.

This report did not mention the disgusting rates of council tax that have been directly imposed by the Welsh Assembly Government. Each year, as we get eye-watering increases in council taxes, the

cefn ceir hepgoriad y mae'n rhaid ichi ei lofnodi os ydych am blymio o'r awyr neu fynd ar linell zip, fel y bydd Helen Mary yn ei wneud ddydd Gwener. Noda fod y claf yn derbyn y gall yr amser aros am driniaeth fod yn hwy nag y mae mewn ymddiriedolaeth debyg yn Lloegr ond ei fod yn dymuno cael ei gyfeirio. Rhaid i feddygon teulu a chleifion ei lofnodi, a dengys mai pobl sy'n hoffi sefyllfaoedd cyffrous ac sy'n hoffi wynebu risg yn hytrach na chleifion risg uchel yw'r bobl sy'n addas i gael triniaeth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n anhygoel nad achubodd y Dirprwy Weinidog ar y cyfle i geisio amddiffyn ei record.

Clywsom arraith ychydig yn fwy synhwyrol gan Lorraine Barrett. Caeais fy llygaid am funud gan ddychmygu mai Aelod o'r Blaid Geidwadol ydoedd pan siaradodd am y problemau a achosir gan bobl ifanc na ellir eu rheoli a diffyg ewyllys briodol yn y system gyflawnder i ymdrin â hwy. Fe'n hatgoffodd o ragrith y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nid oedd angen inni gael ein hatgoffa o'u tuedd i gondemnio pethau un funud a derbyn y clod amdanynt y funud nesaf pan fyddant yn gweithio. Mae hynny'n digwydd drwy'r amser. Fodd bynnag, anghofiodd gyfeirio at yffaith bod y problemau gwrthgymdeithasol hyn yn gyffredin ledled Cymru. Yr wyf wrthi'n ymdrin â mater tebyg yn y Fenni. Cyfarfum â'r heddlu i drafod pam ei bod mor anodd cael tystiolaeth yn erbyn y rhai sy'n creu gofid i bobl drwy eu cadw ar ddihun tan 2 neu 3 o'r gloch y bore yn nhref y Fenni, a dywedasant wrthyf mai un o'r problemau mwyaf yw bod Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, a lofnodwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi, yn golygu ei bod bron yn amhosibl i'r heddlu gasglu tystiolaeth gudd yn erbyn y drwgweithredwyr yn yr achos hwn. Felly, ie, mae gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn gam bach i'r cyfeiriad cywir, ond mae Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 a lofnodwyd gan eich Llywodraeth chi yn rhoi mwy o werth ar hawliau dynol y troseddwyr na hawliau dynol y dioddefwyr.

Ni soniodd yr adroddiad hwn am lefelau gwarthus y dreth gyngor a osodwyd yn uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Bob blwyddyn, wrth inni weld y cynydd dychrynllyd yn y dreth gyngor, mae

Assembly Ministers and Government cast their nets of blame wider and wider like some sort of Spanish trawlerman, looking for someone else to blame. They blame the local authorities, even though they are entirely dependent on the money that comes from the National Assembly in terms of setting their tax. They blamed the Tories, and, even though the Conservative Government left office six years ago, they are starting to blame the Tories again in Monmouthshire on the basis that they introduced the council tax. Using this logic, they will be blaming David Lloyd George next for the pension deficit. We all know that the Welsh Assembly Government has been responsible for imposing council tax rises of 135 per cent in Monmouthshire over the last five or six years, and it is outrageous.

I am grateful for the single piece of good news in this report, namely that this is the last report that we will see before a general election and before the people of Wales have the chance to cast their verdict on this overspending, high-taxing, bureaucratic, wasteful, anti-libertarian Government.

**Leighton Andrews:** If I had any doubt that the opposition parties' approach to this debate was about trying to kick off a general election campaign, David Davies has just dispelled it.

I am delighted to support this report from the Welsh Assembly Government. I am delighted that, this Friday, we will be bringing down prescription charges by £1, as we move towards our policy of free prescriptions. I am delighted with the support that the Welsh Assembly Government has given to United Polymers in my constituency, helping to develop jobs there. That is in marked contrast to the approach taken by the former Plaid-Cymru-controlled Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council, which left millions of pounds unspent on the local regeneration fund budget in Rhondda Cynon Taf, as we have seen reported again in today's *The Western Mail*. Talking about jobs, the Conservatives' Michael Howard has a job creation scheme that has created one job already—he has brought back John Redwood. We look forward to pointing that out around Wales over the next few months.

Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth yn gynyddol yn cynnwys mwy a mwy o bobl pan fyddant yn chwilio am rywun arall i roi'r bai arno. Maent yn rhoi'r bai ar yr awdurdodau lleol, er eu bod yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar yr arian a ddaw o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran pennu eu treth. Bu iddynt feio'r Torïaid, ac, er i'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddod i ben chwe blynedd yn ôl, maent yn dechrau beio'r Torïaid eto yn sir Fynwy am mai hwy a gyflwynodd y dreth gyngor. Gan ddefnyddio'r rhesymeg hon, byddant yn rhoi'r bai ar David Lloyd George nesaf am y diffyg mewn pensiynau. Gŵyr pob un ohonom y bu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyfrifol am gynnydd o 135 y cant yn y dreth gyngor yn sir Fynwy yn ystod y pump neu chwe blynedd diwethaf, ac mae hynny'n warthus.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y ffaith bod un darn o newyddion da yn yr adroddiad hwn, sef mai dyma'r adroddiad olaf a welwn cyn etholiad cyffredinol a chyn i bobl Cymru gael y cyfre i roi eu barn ar y Llywodraeth fiwrocataidd a gwastraffus hon, sy'n gorwario, sy'n gosod trethi uchel, ac sy'n wrthlibertaraidd.

**Leighton Andrews:** Pe bai unrhyw amheuaeth gennyf fod a wnelo ymagwedd y gwrthbleidiau tuag at y ddadl hon â cheisio dechrau ymgyrch etholiad cyffredinol, mae David Davies newydd ei chwalu.

Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r adroddiad hwn gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch y byddwn, y dydd Gwener hwn, yn gostwng taliadau presgripsiwn £1, wrth inni symud tuag at ein polisi o gael presgripsiynau am ddim. Yr wyf yn falch o'r gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei rhoi i United Polymers yn fy etholaeth i, sy'n helpu i ddatblygu swyddi yno. Mae hynny'n hollol groes i'r ymagwedd a fabwysiadwyd gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf a reolwyd gan Blaid Cymru yn flaenorol, a fethodd â gwario miliynau o bunnoedd ar gyllideb y gronfa adfywio lleol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, fel y gwelsom eto heddiw yn *The Western Mail*. Wrth siarad am swyddi, mae gan y Ceidwadwr Michael Howard gynllun creu swyddi sydd eisoes wedi creu un swydd—mae wedi dod â John Redwood yn ôl. Edrychwn ymlaen at roi gwybod i bobl am hynny ledled Cymru yn

ystod yr ychydig fisoeedd nesaf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** As well as your condemnation, will you congratulate Gwynedd Council on spending all of its allocation? It is expecting more money from the Government to fulfil the plans that it has already put in place.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is a shame that you were not so good at spreading best practice among Plaid-Cymru-run councils, or you might have kept one or two others.

I am also delighted to support a Welsh Assembly Government that is putting funding into a new hospital in the Rhondda; the turf for that hospital was cut last week, and that building work is starting. I am also delighted that the Labour-controlled Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council has appointed contractors for the Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road. Those are important developments that are backed by this Welsh Assembly Government.

I am also delighted at the commitments in this report on anti-social behaviour. Much work has gone on in my constituency, and Lorraine Barrett mentioned much in hers. I welcome the report brought out last week by the Member of Parliament for the Rhondda, Chris Bryant, on anti-social behaviour, and the need, first, to get people to understand that the levels of crime are not as they fear, and, secondly, to also understand that we must take action where we find anti-social behaviour.

Plaid Cymru's amendment 3 addresses the Richard commission. We have heard interesting things from Plaid Cymru over recent weeks about the Richard commission report. Plaid Cymru says that it will bring a motion or amendment before this Chamber to call for a referendum. I thought that they might have done that today, but they seem to have shied away from it. That is perhaps because they cannot get unity within their own party on what they believe; we know that some of them support independence and

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yn ogystal â'ch condemniad, a wnewch longyfarch Cyngor Gwynedd am iddo wario ei ddyraniad cyfan? Mae'n disgwyd mwy o arian gan y Llywodraeth i wireddu'r cynlluniau y mae eisoed wedi'u rhoi ar waith.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n drueni na wnaethoch lwyddo i ledaenu arfer gorau ymhliith cynghorau a oedd yn cael eu rhedeg gan Blaid Cymru, neu efallai y byddech wedi cadw un neu ddau o gynghorau eraill.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o gefnogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sy'n rhoi arian i ysbty newydd yn y Rhondda; torrwyd y dywarchen ar gyfer yr ysbty hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae'r gwaith adeiladu hwnnw yn dechrau. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf o dan reolaeth Llafur wedi penodi contractwyr ar gyfer y ffordd liniaru rhwng y Porth a Rhondda Fach. Dyna ddatblygiadau pwysig a gefnogir gan y Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hon.

Yr wyf yn falch hefyd o weld yr ymrwymiadau yn yr adroddiad hwn ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Gwnaed llawer o waith yn fy etholaeth i, a soniodd Lorraine Barrett am y gwaith helaeth a wnaed yn ei hetholaeth hi. Croesawaf yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf gan yr Aelod Seneddol dros y Rhondda, Chris Bryant, ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, a'r angen, yn gyntaf, i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall nad yw'r lefelau troseddu mor uchel ag y maent yn ei ofni, ac, yn ail, i ddeall hefyd bod angen inni gymryd camau lle y ceir ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Mae gwelliant 3 Plaid Cymru yn ymdrin â chomisiwn Richard. Clywsom bethau diddorol gan Blaid Cymru yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf ynghylch adroddiad comisiwn Richard. Dywed Plaid Cymru y bydd yn cyflwyno cynnig neu welliant gerbron y Siambra hon i alw am referendwm. Credais efallai y byddent wedi gwneud hynny heddiw, ond ymddengys eu bod wedi gwingo rhag gwneud hynny. Efallai mai'r rheswm dros hynny yw na allant gael undod yn eu plaid eu hunain o ran yr hyn y maent yn ei

that some of them do not. Still, they are the ones seeking unity. Their amendment 3 is wrong. The Labour Party position, and the document adopted by the Labour Party at our conference will—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Tell us.

**Leighton Andrews:** I will tell you what is in it. It is clear what we are going to do. We will introduce 13.2 under Richard, with a motion on that straight after the election, and we will publish a White Paper that will contain options, including a move towards primary legislation. There is no reason why, under those Labour Party proposals, we cannot have primary legislation within the timescale identified by Lord Richard.

**Michael German:** I wonder whether you could identify the words ‘will introduce a White Paper’ in the paper that the Labour Party has brought forward? I understood that the wording was ‘could introduce a White Paper’.

**Leighton Andrews:** The commitment is clear. The Secretary of State referred to full legislative powers the other day. As you know, I support full primary powers for the Assembly.

Another way in which we have gone further than the Richard commission report is in relation to quangos. One of the weakest sections of the report was the chapter on quangos. It made comments about quangos, but had no proposals. Again, I was delighted when, in July, we made the announcement about the reform of the quangos. That announcement has been widely welcomed throughout Wales. I look forward to our bringing forward further proposals in relation to other quangos in due course. It has been obvious to me and to other Valleys Assembly Members that, in our dealings with organisations such as the Welsh Development Agency, we find too often that it is sometimes hard to get a real endorsement of this Government’s overall priorities in the work of those quangos. I hope that bringing them more closely into Government will

greded; gwyddom fod rhai ohonynt o blaid annibyniaeth ond nid pob un ohonynt. Eto, hwy yw'r rhai sy'n ceisio sicrhau undod. Mae eu gwelliant 3 yn anghywir. Bydd safbwyt y Blaid Lafur, a'r ddogfen a fabwysiadwyd gan y Blaid Lafur yn ein cynhadledd yn—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dywedwch wrthym.

**Leighton Andrews:** Dywedaf wrthych beth sydd ynndi. Mae'n amlwg beth y byddwn yn ei wneud. Byddwn yn cyflwyno 13.2 o dan Richard, gyda chynnig ar hynny yn syth ar ôl yr etholiad, a byddwn yn cyhoeddi Papur Gwyn a fydd yn cynnwys opsiynau, gan gynnwys cam tuag at ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol. Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam na allwn gael deddfwriaeth sylfaenol o fewn yr amserlen a nodwyd gan yr Arglwydd Richard, o dan y cynigion hynny gan y Blaid Lafur.

**Michael German:** Tybed a allech ddod o hyd i'r geiriau yn y papur a gyflwynwyd gan y Blaid Lafur yn nodi y byddwch yn cyflwyno Papur Gwyn? Yr oeddwn ar ddeall mai'r geiriad oedd y gallech gyflwyno Papur Gwyn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r ymrwymiad yn amlwg. Cyfeiriodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol at bwerau deddfwriaethol llawn y diwrnod o'r blaen. Fel y gwyddoch, cefnogaf bwerau sylfaenol llawn i'r Cynulliad.

Un o'r ffyrdd eraill yr ydym wedi mynd ymhellach nag adroddiad comisiwn Richard yw mewn perthynas â chwangos. Un o adrannau gwannaf yr adroddiad oedd y bennod ar gwangos. Gwnaeth sylwadau ynghylch cwangos, ond nid oedd unrhyw gynigion ganddo. Eto, yr oeddwn yn falch pan gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf y byddem yn diwygio'r cwangos. Croesawyd y cyhoeddiad hwnnw yn eang ledled Cymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno rhagor o gynigion mewn perthynas â chwangos eraill maes o law. Bu'n amlwg i mi ac i Aelodau Cynulliad eraill dros y Cymoedd, wrth ddelio â sefydliadau megis Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ei bod weithiau yn anodd sicrhau bod gwaith y cwangos hyn yn cadarnhau blaenoriaethau cyffredinol y Llywodraeth hon mewn gwirionedd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn wneud hyn drwy sicrhau

enable us to do that.

The reality about this debate, from the opposition parties' point of view—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Because of the total inadequacy of this Chamber, even Conservative Members cannot be seen. Mark Isherwood has been trying to make an intervention.

4.00 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** I will take an intervention from him.

**Mark Isherwood:** I wish to say something to my quiz colleague from last night. You mentioned job creation schemes and anti-social behaviour. Has the Prime Minister not brought back Alan Milburn because of the anti-social behaviour shown by his neighbour from hell?

**Leighton Andrews:** I think that you need a new speechwriter, Mark.

During this debate today, we have seen all the way through that opposition Members are no longer thinking about what can be done in the Assembly for the people of Wales; their eyes are on the next general election. If the approach that they will take to the election is represented by the pathetic quality of their speeches today, then what I say about the general election is: bring it on.

**Kirsty Williams:** As Lorraine Barrett did not allow Peter Black to make an intervention, I wish to explain to her, as she obviously pays a great deal of attention to these issues, that anti-social behaviour orders were created by previous legislation, namely the Crime and Disorder Act 1998, which the Liberal Democrats supported and voted for. Lorraine was actually referring to the refusal of Liberal Democrat MPs in Westminster to support the draconian measures of the Anti-social Behaviour Bill, which include allowing the police to move groups of children on for simply chatting, a move that any dictator would be proud of and which the police do

bod cysylltiad agosach rhyngddynt a'r Llywodraeth.

Y gwir am y ddadl hon, o safbwyt y gwrthbleidiau—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Oherwydd annigonolrwydd llwyr y Siambwr hon, ni ellir gweld Aelodau Ceidwadol hyd yn oed. Bu Mark Isherwood yn ceisio gwneud ymyriad.

**Leighton Andrews:** Derbyniad ymyriad ganddo.

**Mark Isherwood:** Hoffwn ddweud rhywbeth wrth rywun a oedd yn yr un tîm â mi yn y cwis neithiwr. Bu ichi sôn am gynlluniau creu swyddi ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Onid yw Prif Weinidog y DU wedi rhoi swydd arall i Alan Milburn oherwydd ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ei gymydog o uffern?

**Leighton Andrews:** Credaf y dylai rhywun newydd ysgrifennu eich areithiau, Mark.

Yn ystod yr holl ddadl heddiw, gwelsom nad yw Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yn meddwl mwyach am yr hyn y gellir ei wneud yn y Cynulliad i bobl Cymru; mae eu bryd ar yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Os cynrychiolir yr ymagwedd y byddant yn ei mabwysiadu tuag at yr etholiad gan ansawdd gwael eu hareithiau heddiw, yna yr hyn a ddywedaf ynghylch yr etholiad cyffredinol yw: gorau po gyntaf.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gan na chaniataodd Lorraine Barrett i Peter Black ymyrryd, hoffwn egluro iddi, gan ei bod yn amlwg yn rhoi llawer o sylw i'r materion hyn, i'r gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol gael eu creu gan ddeddfwriaeth flaenorol, sef Deddf Troedd ac Anhreñf 1998, a gefnogwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac y bu iddynt bleidleisio drosti. Yr oedd Lorraine, mewn gwirionedd, yn cyfeirio at y ffaith bod ASau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan wedi gwrthod cefnogi mesurau llym y Mesur Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol, sy'n cynnwys caniatáu i'r heddlu symud grwpiau o blant am sgwrsio

not want. I am glad that you see money being spent in your community, Lorraine. However, more communities could benefit if you were to live up to the commitment in your manifesto to create a £100 million crime-fighting fund, because it does not exist. It is currently £20 million short. That is £20 million that could be being spent in other communities that is not being spent at the moment. While we are on the subject, I regard the distribution of racist literature by your party to be anti-social behaviour.

â'i gilydd, sef cam y byddai unrhyw unben yn falch ohono ac nad yw'r heddlu am ei weld yn digwydd. Yr wyf yn falch y caiff arian ei wario yn eich cymuned, Lorraine. Fodd bynnag, gallai mwy o gymunedau elwa ar hyn pe baech yn cyflawni'r ymrwymiad yn eich manifesto i greu cronfa ymladd troseddau o £100 miliwn, am nad yw'n bodoli. Mae'n brin o £20 miliwn ar hyn o bryd, sef £20 miliwn y gellid ei wario mewn cymunedau eraill na chaiff ei wario ar hyn o bryd. Tra'n sôn am hyn, yr wyf o'r farn bod yffaith bod eich plaid yn dosbarthu llenyddiaeth hiliol yn ymddygiad gwirthgymdeithasol.

Let us turn to the other top 10 commitments made in the Labour Party's manifesto for last year's elections. I was taught that a manifesto was a pledge, almost a contract, between politicians and the electorate who voted for them. There has been an absolute failure on the Government's part to progress in any meaningful way the policies on which it stood. Only one of the top 10 commitments has been met; the others are in progress and creeping forward at a snail's pace. There were few commitments on the health service specifically in that top 10—I expect that the Government's experience with regard to the pledges that it made in 1999 made it a little wary of including specific commitments. The only specific commitment on health, which promised free prescriptions, is not benefiting patients. I am sure that people in your constituency, Leighton, will be glad that prescriptions will be £1 cheaper next week. However, I am sure that the chronically ill in your constituency—and the Rhondda probably has the worst profile in Wales in terms of chronic sickness—were looking forward to receiving free prescriptions now. That is what your party initially supported, but it has now turned its back on that.

On the health service in general, it cannot be equitable that different treatment rates for patients in England and Wales should continue. Devolution offers us the opportunity to have different structures, systems and methodology in Wales. However, it cannot be equitable that Welsh

Gadewch inni droi at y 10 prif ymrwymiad arall a wnaed ym manifesto'r Blaid Lafur ar gyfer etholiadau'r llynedd. Fe'm dysgwyd bod manifesto yn addewid, bron yn contract, rhwng gwleidyddion a'r etholwyr a bleidleisiodd drostynt. Bu methiant llwyr ar ran y Llywodraeth i ddatblygu'r polisiau ar gyfer yr etholiad mewn unrhyw ffordd ystyrlon. Dim ond un o'r 10 prif ymrwymiad sydd wedi'i gyflawni; mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar y llell ac maent yn cael eu cyflawni'n araf iawn. Prin oedd yr ymrwymiadau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yn benodol yn y 10 prif ymrwymiad hynny—mae'n siŵr bod profiad y Llywodraeth o ran yr addewidion a wnaeth yn 1999 yn golygu ei bod yn gochel ychydig rhag cynnwys ymrwymiadau penodol. Nid yw'r unig ymrwymiad penodol ar iechyd, a addawodd bresgripsiynau am ddim, o fudd i gleifion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl yn eich etholaeth chi, Leighton, yn falch y bydd presgripsiynau £1 yn rhatach yr wythnos nesaf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr bod pobl yn eich etholaeth chi sydd â salwch cronig—ac mae'n debyg bod gan y Rhondda y proffil gwaethaf yng Nghymru o ran salwch cronig—yn edrych ymlaen at gael presgripsiynau am ddim erbyn hyn. Dyna'r hyn a gefnogwyd gan eich plaid ar y dechrau, ond mae wedi cefnu ar hynny erbyn hyn.

O ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gyffredinol, ni all fod yn deg bod cyfraddau trin gwahanol o hyd i gleifion yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae datganoli yn rhoi'r cyfle inni gael strwythurau, systemau a methodoleg wahanol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ni all fod yn deg bod yn rhaid i gleifion yng Nghymru aros

patients must wait much longer than patients in England for the same treatment. The partnership Government commissioned reports to find a way of using devolution to solve those problems. What has happened to the paper on emergency pressures and the Wanless report? They are sitting on the desks of Jane Hutt and Ann Lloyd and are not being driven forward. The health service is crying out for a strategic approach. It needs to know from the Minister what is important and what is not. It needs leadership and direction. That could happen if the Minister got a grip. If we consider the success of Powys Local Health Board in driving its commissioning forward, we can see that Welsh patients can begin to be treated within similar timescales to those in England. However, there are trust chiefs and LHB chiefs across Wales who are not driving hard bargains for the people of Wales and they are not being required to do so by our Minister for Health and Social Services or by the director of NHS Wales.

As we have heard, the record on the health service does not do the devolution settlement any favours, and neither does the riling and squeals from the likes of Jon Owen Jones, Gareth Thomas, Huw Edwards and other MPs. We need a Minister for Health and Social Services who responds to the challenges of the pressures facing NHS Wales and acts on them. We have not seen any action since the beginning of the second Assembly, and this annual report merely reinforces that fact.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome this report, which outlines progress to date during this Assembly. The postponement of this debate from last term gives me the added opportunity to welcome the Government's intention to reform our public services and make them more accountable to the electorate. I look forward to the Government making more necessary reforms and fanning the flames of the bonfire of the quangos.

Despite the protests of the opposition parties, progress is being made to implement Welsh Labour's 2003 manifesto and 'Wales: A

yn llawer hwy na chleifion yn Lloegr i gael yr un driniaeth. Comisiynodd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth adroddiadau i ddod o hyd i ffordd o ddefnyddio datganoli i ddatrys y problemau hynny. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r papur ar bwysau argyfwng ac adroddiad Wanless? Maent ar ddesgau Jane Hutt ac Ann Lloyd ac ni weithredir arnynt. Mae angen dybryd am ymagwedd strategol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog roi gwylod iddo beth sy'n bwysig a beth nad yw'n bwysig. Mae angen arweinyddiaeth a chyfeiriad arno. Gallai hynny ddigwydd pe bai'r Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â phethau. Os ystyriwn lwyddiant Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys i ddatblygu ei waith comisiynu, gallwn weld y gall cleifion yng Nghymru ddechrau cael eu trin o fewn amserlenni tebyg i'r rhai yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, nid yw rhai o brif weithredwyr ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol ledled Cymru yn taro bargin galed i bobl Cymru ac nid yw ein Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol na chyfarwyddwr GIG Cymru yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt wneud hynny.

Fel y clywsom, nid yw'r record ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, na'r sylwadau prifoclyd na'r cwynion gan bobl fel Jon Owen Jones, Gareth Thomas, Huw Edwards ac ASau eraill, yn helpu'r ddadl dros ddatganoli. Mae angen Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol arnom sy'n ymateb i heriau'r pwysau sy'n wynebu GIG Cymru ac yn gwneud rhywbeth amdanynt. Ni welsom unrhyw gamau gweithredu ers dechrau'r ail Gynulliad, ac mae'r adroddiad blynnyddol hwn yn atgyfnerthu hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, sy'n amlinellu'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r ffaith bod y ddadl hon wedi'i gohirio ers y tymor diwethaf yn rhoi'r cyfle ychwanegol imi groesawu bwriad y Llywodraeth i ddiwygio ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a sicrhau eu bod yn fwy atebol i etholwyr. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno rhagor o ddiwygiadau angenrheidiol a megino coelcerth y cwangos.

Er gwaethaf y gwrthwynebiadau gan y gwrthbleidiau, gwneir cynnydd i weithredu maniffesto 2003 Llafur Cymru a 'Cymru:

Better Country'. Our mandate for the people of Wales was to introduce our policies over the lifetime of this Assembly. The Government is seeing to it that this happens, planning the delivery of our manifesto and beginning to deliver for the people of Wales. In stark contrast to this, the opposition coalition has played fast and loose over the past 12 months, grandstanding at every opportunity while failing to tackle people's priorities.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**Carl Sargeant:** In a moment.

In response to the comments by one of the opposition's regional Members for south Wales that I do not speak about Alyn and Deeside very often, given that his party only works 25 hours a week, I would have thought that he would have more time to look at my contributions. I take this opportunity to examine achievement in north-east Wales and in my constituency.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Are you ready yet, Carl?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is up to Members whether they wish to give way.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will in a minute.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is not for Members seeking to intervene to try to cajole others to give way, nor is it for Members refusing to give way to other Members to do so in a way that appears to be putting them down or dissuading them. This is a matter of careful balance.

**Carl Sargeant:** I want to pay particular attention to economic development, transport and the environment in my constituency. As well as examining the past year, it is also worth considering how the Assembly can further develop these areas. The economy of Flintshire remains strong. Employment is high. Given that the Tories do not like hearing that statement, I will say it again—employment is high. Unemployment

Gwlad Well'. Ein mandad ar gyfer pobl Cymru oedd cyflwyno ein polisiau yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd, gan gynllunio'r ffordd o gyflwyno ein manifesto a dechrau gwneud gwahaniaeth i bobl Cymru. Yn hollol groes i hyn, mae'r wrthglynblaid wedi chwarae'r ffon ddwybig yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, gan fanteisio ar bob cyfle i dynnu sylw tra'n methu â mynd i'r afael â blaenoriaethau pobl.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mewn munud.

Mewn ymateb i'r sylwadau gan Aelod rhanbarthol un o'r gwrthbleidai dros y De a ddywedodd nad wyf yn siarad am Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn aml iawn, o gofio nad yw ei blaid ond yn gweithio 25 awr yr wythnos, tybiais y byddai mwy o amser ganddo i ystyried fy nghyfraniadau. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i archwilio'r hyn a gyflawnwyd yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain ac yn fy etholaeth i.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A ydych yn barod eto, Carl?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr Aelodau sy'n penderfynu a ydynt am ildio ai peidio.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddaf yn ildio mewn munud.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ddylai Aelodau sy'n ceisio ymyrryd geisio darbwyllo eraill i ildio, ac ni ddylai'r Aelodau sy'n gwrthod ildio i Aelodau eraill wneud hynny mewn ffordd sy'n ymddangos fel pe baent yn eu bychanu neu'n dwyn perswâd arnynt i beidio ag ymyrryd. Rhaid gofalu bod cydwysedd yma.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf am roi sylw arbennig i ddatblygu economaidd, trafnidiaeth a'r amgylchedd yn fy etholaeth i. Yn ogystal ag archwilio'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'n werthfawr ystyried hefyd sut y gall y Cynulliad ddatblygu'r meysydd hyn ymhellach. Mae economi sir y Fflint yn parhau i fod yn gryf. Mae nifer fawr o bobl mewn gwaith. O gofio nad yw'r Torïaid yn hoffi clywed y datganiad hwnnw, fe'i

continues to fall, and Assembly economic investment enables businesses to continue to expand, diversify and develop. Over £3 million of Assembly investment has helped to secure over £14 million of private investment in Flintshire, and countless jobs have been secured, saved or created as a result.

Over the coming year, the Assembly will have to examine and respond to the north Wales economic strategy. In Flintshire, the Gateway project will continue to develop, and I hope to see the Assembly Government giving its support to this ambitious, promising venture. By combining the economic development and transport portfolios, the First Minister recognised the importance of one to the other.

**Helen Mary Jones** rose—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that Carl Sargeant is giving way.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will give way.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I only rose again because Carl Sargeant indicated that he would give way and perhaps this inadequate Chamber, as you have often described it, Presiding Officer, prevented him from seeing me.

I refer you back to your remarks on the opposition, Carl Sargeant, even though your speech has moved on from there. Do you realise that it is the job of an opposition to oppose when it thinks that the Government is wrong? That is what we are here to do, and I look forward to the day when you find yourself in that position.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you for that contribution.

Ongoing work to bridge the perceived north-south divide is continuing, and I look forward to the continued scrutiny and development of the draft Transport (Wales) Bill. Only with further powers over our transport will we be able to meet the transport demands of

dywedaf eto—mae nifer fawr o bobl mewn gwaith. Mae diweithdra yn parhau i ostwng, ac mae buddsoddiad economaidd y Cynulliad yn galluogi busnesau i barhau i ehangu, arallgyfeirio a datblygu. Mae dros £3 miliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y Cynulliad wedi helpu i sicrhau dros £14 miliwn o fuddsoddiad preifat yn sir y Fflint, ac mae swyddi di-rif wedi'u sicrhau, eu hachub neu eu creu o ganlyniad i hynny.

Dros y flwyddyn i ddod, bydd yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad archwilio strategaeth economaidd y Gogledd ac ymateb iddi. Yn sir y Fflint, bydd prosiect y Porth yn parhau i ddatblygu, a gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi ei chefnogaeth i'r fenter addawol uchelgeisiol hon. Drwy gyfuno'r portffolio datblygu economaidd a'r portffolio trafnidiaeth, cydnabu'r Prif Weinidog bwysigrywyd y naill i'r llall.

**Helen Mary Jones** a gododd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod Carl Sargeant yn ildio.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ildiaf.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Codais eto am i Carl Sargeant nodi y byddai'n ildio ac efallai i'r Siambwr annigonol hon, fel yr ydych wedi'i disgrifio'n aml, Lywydd, ei atal rhag fyngweld.

Fe'ch cyfeiriaf yn ôl at eich sylwadau ar y gwrthbleidiau, Carl Sargeant, er bod testun eich araith wedi newid ers hynny. A sylweddolwch mai tasg gwrthblaid yw gwrthwynebu pan fydd o'r farn bod y Llywodraeth yn anghywir? Dyna'r hyn yr ydym i fod i'w wneud, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y diwrnod pan fyddwch chi yn y sefyllfa honno.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch am y cyfraniad hwnnw.

Mae gwaith i bontio'r bwlch canfyddedig rhwng y Gogledd a'r De yn parhau, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y gwaith parhaus i graffu ar y Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) drafft a'i ddatblygu. Dim ond gyda phwerau pellach dros ein trafnidiaeth y gallwn fodloni

industry and the sustainable development demands of Flintshire. With these sustainable development demands in mind, Welsh Labour continues to deliver for the environment of Wales. Habits are changing in our towns and villages, as more and more people choose to recycle waste. The blue box scheme in Flintshire, with the assistance of Assembly funding, developed from a pilot scheme to a county-wide scheme that has helped Flintshire to meet and exceed the Assembly recycling targets for composting and so on.

4.10 p.m.

To protect our environment from anti-social behaviour, the Government, in partnership with the Westminster Government, has taken action to help local authorities to deal with fly-tipping, noise pollution, litter and abandoned cars, all of which blight people's lives. The Government continues to meet the priorities of the people of Wales, who want jobs, prosperity, prospects, improving and comprehensive health services for the family, good quality schools for their children, and communities that are clean and vibrant—

gofynion diwydiant o ran trafnidiaeth a gofynion sir y Fflint o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. O gofio'r gofynion hyn o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, mae Llafur Cymru yn parhau i gyflawni ar ran amgylchedd Cymru. Mae arferion yn newid yn ein trefi a'n pentrefi, wrth i nifer gynyddol o bobl ddewis ailgylchu gwastraff. Datblygodd cynllun y blwch glas yn sir y Fflint, gyda chymorth arian y Cynulliad, o gynllun peilot i gynllun i'r sir gyfan sydd wedi helpu sir y Fflint i gyrraedd targedau ailgylchu'r Cynulliad ar gyfer compostio ac ati a rhagori arnynt.

Er mwyn diogelu ein hamgylchedd rhag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, mae'r Llywodraeth, mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth San Steffan, wedi cymryd camau i helpu awdurdodau lleol i ymdrin â thipio anghyfreithlon, llygredd sŵn, ysbwriel a cheir gadawedig, y mae pob un ohonynt yn amharu ar fywydau pobl. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn parhau i gyflawni blaenoriaethau pobl Cymru, sydd am gael swyddi, ffyniant, rhagolygon da, gwasanaethau iechyd cynhwysfawr sy'n gwella i'r teulu, ysgolion o safon i'w plant, a chymunedau sy'n lân ac yn fywiog—

**Mark Isherwood rose—**

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Mark Isherwood is indicating that he wishes to intervene. Are you giving way? You are almost out of time.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will give way.

**Mark Isherwood:** I am also a member of the blue box scheme, which I support. I am also a member of the party which supported economic development after the tragedy of the early 1980s on Deeside. As the *Daily Post* reported last week, it was the Welsh Development Agency which, during the Conservative years, brought the new factories and the infrastructure that has made the economy of north-east Wales what it is today.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am glad that I took the intervention. I cannot believe the grandstanding of the Tory party, which still

**Mark Isherwood a gododd—**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Mark Isherwood yn nodi ei fod am ymyrryd. A ildiwrch? Mae eich amser bron wedi dod i ben.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddaf yn ildio.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn aelod o gynllun y blwch glas, a gefnogaf. Yr wyf hefyd yn aelod o'r blaids a gefnogodd ddatblygu economaidd ar ôl trychineb y 1980au cynnar ar Lannau Dyfrdwy. Fel y nododd y *Daily Post* yr wythnos diwethaf, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a gyflwynodd y ffatrioedd a'r seilwaith newydd, yn ystod blynnyddoedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, sydd wedi creu'r economi sydd gennym heddiw yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf yn falch imi dderbyn yr ymyriad. Ni allaf gredu hyfdra'r blaids Dorïaidd, sy'n parhau i wadu iddi wneud

denies that it put 8,000 people on the dole in Deeside when it closed the steelworks.

Welsh Labour continues to provide the public investment to deliver on these priorities and will continue to do so while meeting the demands of social justice and sustainable development.

**Janet Ryder:** It is not the opposition parties that are electioneering here, but the party of government. Let us look at one or two of the promises in the Labour Party manifesto and the First Minister's report. There is the pledge not to introduce tuition fees until 2007. Welcome as it may be, it creates a massive funding gap for higher education. A student who registers in 2006 will be at university for three to five years. The only pledge that we have had is that that first year will be funded to the universities. As the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning could not do so in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee last week, will the First Minister explain where that extra money will come from and how those universities will be funded? The Finance Minister has said today that she does not know how much extra money will come to Wales as a consequence of the Higher Education Bill and any subsequent ramifications. Universities are extremely concerned. First Minister, you owe it to those universities to explain clearly how the full period of those students at university will be funded under your pledge.

Will you also explain how you will support Welsh domiciled students who apply for universities in 2006? When top-up fees are introduced in England in 2006, it is likely that a high proportion of students in England will apply to Welsh universities to escape the top-up fees. What will you do to ensure that Welsh domiciled students will have a fair and good crack of the whip in terms of those places in universities in 2007?

Another of your promises, First Minister, is to provide free school breakfasts for all primary school children. I emphasise that it states in this document that it is for all primary school children. You have told us in

8,000 o bobl yn ddi-waith yng Nglannau Dyfrdwy pan gaeodd y gwaith dur.

Mae Llafur Cymru yn parhau i ddarparu'r buddsoddiad cyhoeddus i gyflawni'r blaenoriaethau hyn a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny tra'n bodloni gofynion cyfiawnder cymdeithasol a datblygu cynaliadwy.

**Janet Ryder:** Nid y gwrthbleidiau sy'n lecsyna yma, ond plaid y llywodraeth. Gadewch inni edrych ar un neu ddwy o'r addewidion ym manifesto'r Blaid Lafur ac adroddiad y Prif Weinidog. Ceir addewid i beidio â chyflwyno ffioedd dysgu tan 2007. Efallai ein bod yn croesawu hynny, ond mae'n creu bwlc cyllido mawr ar gyfer addysg uwch. Bydd myfyriwr sy'n cofrestru yn 2006 yn y brifysgol am dair i bum mlynedd. Yr unig addewid a gawsom yw y caiff prifysgolion eu hariannu ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf honno. Am na allai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes egluro yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wythnos diwethaf o ble y daw'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw a sut y caiff y prifysgolion hynny eu hariannu, a fydd y Prif Weinidog yn egluro hynny heddiw? Dywedodd y Gweinidog Cyllid heddiw nad yw'n gwybod faint o arian ychwanegol a ddaw i Gymru o ganlyniad i'r Mesur Addysg Uwch ac unrhyw ganlyniadau dilynol. Mae prifysgolion yn pryderu'n fawr. Brif Weinidog, dylech egluro i'r prifysgolion hynny sut y caiff cyfnod llawn y myfyrwyr hynny yn y brifysgol ei ariannu o dan eich addewid.

A eglurwch hefyd sut y byddwch yn cefnogi myfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru sy'n gwneud cais am brifysgolion yn 2006? Pan gyflwynir ffioedd ychwanegol yn Lloegr yn 2006, mae'n debygol y bydd cyfran uchel o fyfyrwyr yn Lloegr yn gwneud cais i brifysgolion yng Nghymru i osgoi ffioedd ychwanegol. Beth a wnewch i sierhau y caiff myfyrwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru gyfle teg i gael y lleoedd hynny mewn prifysgolion yn 2007?

Un o'ch addewidion eraill, Brif Weinidog, yw darparu brecwast ysgol am ddim i bob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd. Pwysleisiaf fod y ddogfen hon yn nodi y gwneir hyn i bob plentyn mewn ysgol gynradd. Bu ichi

the Chamber before that every promise in your manifesto was fully costed before it was put into the manifesto. However, in 2002-03 there were 256,690 primary school pupils in Wales. So far, you have delivered a free breakfast to 11,000 pupils, which is just 4 per cent of the total. The figure indicated in your document is £5 million over two years. How much will it cost to deliver your promise of a free breakfast to all primary school children in Wales? You must have those figures: you have told us in the Chamber that you have them, but you have never laid those figures before the Assembly. You must do that now to allow the Assembly to scrutinise them.

Finally, on 5 February 2004, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning said in a statement to all sixth-form headteachers that ELWa would approach change in a measured way, openly and in full consultation with stakeholders. That is the opposite of how you have handled the matter of ELWa's being integrated into the Assembly. It is the process that is important. In the last Plenary meeting before the summer recess, you announced that ELWa would be no more. We were told by Jane Davidson last week in committee that no consultation of any kind had been carried out before that announcement, not even with the chair or the chief executive of ELWa. No consultation was necessary or needed, First Minister, because you knew what you wanted to do and you were going to do it. Yet, you described the appointment of ELWa's first chair as

'probably the most important public appointment ever made in Wales'.

That was in April 2001. You must explain what has changed since April 2001 and how the most important public appointment ever made in Wales became so unimportant, you did not even bother to give them notice that you were going to scrap the job. Very interestingly, we were also told last week that this heralded a new policy initiative, by your Government, to become one level of Government in Wales. Therefore, do you

ddweud wrthym yn y Siambr o'r blaen bod pob addewid yn eich manifesto wedi'i chostio'n llawn cyn ei chynnwys yn y manifesto. Fodd bynnag, yn 2002-03 yr oedd 256,690 o ddisgyblion ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru. Hyd yma, yr ydych wedi rhoi brecwast am ddim i 11,000 o ddisgyblion, sef 4 y cant o'r cyfanswm. Y ffigur a nodir yn eich dogfen yw £5 miliwn dros ddwy flynedd. Faint fydd yn ei gostio i gyflawni eich addewid i roi brecwast am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru? Rhaid bod y ffigurau hynny gennych: yr ydych wedi dweud wrthym yn y Siambr bod y ffigurau hynny gennych, ond nid ydych erioed wedi eu cyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad. Rhaid ichi wneud hynny yn awr er mwyn galluogi'r Cynulliad i graffu arnynt.

Yn olaf, ar 5 Chwefror 2004, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes mewn datganiad i bob pennath chweched dosbarth y byddai ELWa yn cyflwyno newidiadau mewn ffordd bwyllog ac agored a chan ymgynghori'n llawn â rhanddeiliaid. Mae hynny'n groes i'r ffordd yr ydych chi wedi ymdrin â'r mater o integreiddio ELWa yn y Cynulliad. Y broses sy'n bwysig. Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn diwethaf cyn toriad yr haf, bu ichi gyhoeddi na fyddai ELWa yn parhau. Dywedwyd wrthym gan Jane Davidson yr wythnos diwethaf yn y pwylgor na chynhaliwyd unrhyw ymgynghoriad o unrhyw fath cyn y cyhoeddriad hwnnw, nid hyd yn oed gyda chadeirydd neu brif weithredwr ELWa. Nid oedd angen unrhyw ymgynghoriad, Brif Weinidog, am eich bod yn gwybod yr hyn yr oeddech am ei wneud ac yn mynd i'w wneud. Eto, disgrifiwyd penodiad cadeirydd cyntaf ELWa gennych fel

y penodiad cyhoeddus pwysicaf a wnaed erioed yng Nghymru yn ôl pob tebyg.

Yr oedd hynny ym mis Ebrill 2001. Rhaid ichi egluro'r hyn sydd wedi newid ers mis Ebrill 2001 a sut y daeth y penodiad cyhoeddus pwysicaf a wnaed erioed yng Nghymru yn un mor ddibwys fel na wnaethoch drafferthu eu rhybuddio hyd yn oed eich bod yn mynd i gael gwared ar y swydd. Dywedwyd wrthym yr wythnos diwethaf hefyd, a hynny'n ddiddorol iawn, bod hyn yn arwydd o fenter bolisi newydd

intend to scrap local government in Wales in the same way that you scrapped ELWa—without consulting with them?

sydd ar droed, gan eich Llywodraeth chi, i ddod yn un lefel o Lywodraeth yng Nghymru. Felly, a fwriadwch gael gwared ar lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn yr un ffordd ag yr ydych wedi cael gwared ar ELWa—heb ymgynghori â hwy?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The Labour Assembly Government and the people of Wales are working together to make Wales a vibrant country where the core values of fairness, justice, solidarity and opportunity for all are achieved by a strong economy, rising employment and record investments in health and education. Delivering social justice for all is fundamental to achieving a fairer and richer Wales. Our most deprived communities are at the heart of our programme of delivery. Welsh Labour delivers for those most in need—free school breakfasts, free bus travel for the over-60s, free bus travel for disabled people and free summer swimming for young and old were all spearheaded in our most deprived communities.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a phobl Cymru yn cydweithio i sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad fywiog lle y sicrheir gwerthoedd craidd tegwch, cyflawnder, cydymddibyniad a chyfle i bawb drwy economi gref, mwy o bobl mewn gwaith a'r buddsoddiadau mwyaf erioed mewn iechyd ac addysg. Mae sicrhau cyflawnder cymdeithasol i bawb yn hanfodol er mwyn creu Cymru decach a chyfoethocach. Mae ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig wrth wraidd ein rhaglen gyflawni. Mae Llafur Cymru yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r rhai sydd â'r angen mwyaf—cyflwynwyd breswast ysgol am ddim, teithiau bws am ddim i'r rhai dros 60 oed, teithiau bws am ddim i bobl anabl a sesiynau nofio am ddim yn ystod yr haf i'r hen a'r ifanc oll yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

**Owen John Thomas:** You say that you are delivering social justice, but the Minister for Health and Social Services adopted a national strategy for people suffering from arthritis in June 2002 and we are still waiting for details. We still wait for it to be delivered two years and three months later.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr ydych yn dweud eich bod yn cyflawni cyflawnder cymdeithasol, ond mabwysiadodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer pobl sy'n dioddef o arthritis ym mis Mehefin 2002 a pharhawn i aros am y manylion. Parhawn i aros iddi gael ei chyflawni ddwy flynedd a thri mis yn ddiweddarach.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Figures for accident and emergency, certainly in my constituency, are good. The implementation of the Wanless action plans is being warmly received and people are welcoming the steps that are being taken in terms of health in south Wales.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'r ffigurau o ran damweiniau ac achosion brys yn dda, yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i. Caiff y broses o roi cynlluniau gweithredu Wanless ar waith ei chroesawu a chroesewir y camau a gymerir o ran iechyd yn y De.

Delivering a more equal society, creating greater opportunities for growth, better jobs, housing and health are all part of Welsh Labour's commitment to deliver on its promise—and we are delivering. When I talk to my constituents, the key issues for them are health and education. I can tell them that the Assembly Labour Government is reducing prescription charges by £1 and is on

Mae sicrhau cymdeithas fwy cyfartal, creu mwy o gyfleoedd am dwf, swyddi, tai ac iechyd gwell oll yn than o ymrwymiad Llafur Cymru i gyflawni ei haddewid—ac yr ydym yn ei chyflawni. Pan siaradaf â'm hetholwyr, iechyd ac addysg yw'r materion allweddol iddynt. Gallaf ddweud wrthynt fod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn gostwng taliadau presgripsiwn £1 ac mae ar y trywydd

course to abolishing all prescription charges by 2007, as it pledged. I take pride in telling them that a state-of-the-art local general hospital is shortly to be built at the heart of the Caerphilly constituency. It will deliver modern services, more tailored to local needs.

cywir i ddileu pob taliad presgripsiwn erbyn 2007, fel yr addawodd. Ymfalchiaf yn y ffaith y gallaf ddweud wrthynt y caiff ysbty cyffredinol lleol gyda'r offer diweddaraf ei adeiladu cyn bo hir yng nghanol etholaeth Caerfili. Bydd yn darparu gwasanaethau modern, wedi'u teilwra i ddiwallu anghenion lleol.

**David Melding:** Are you comfortable with the fact that the abolition of prescription charges will redistribute around £35 million of Wales's wealth from relatively poorer people to relatively richer people like me, who currently have to pay for their prescriptions for a chronic condition?

**David Melding:** A ydych yn fodlon ar y ffaith y bydd y broses o ddileu taliadau presgripsiwn yn ailddosbarthu tua £35 miliwn o gyfoeth Cymru o bobl sy'n gymharol dlawd i bobl sy'n gymharol gyfoethog fel minnau, sy'n gorfod talu am eu presgripsiynau ar gyfer cyflwr cronig ar hyn o bryd?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** This measure is a true socialist measure that will bring overall benefits. People, like me, who suffer from chronic illnesses—I am a diabetic—already benefit from free prescriptions and I daresay that I might be in the same income category as you, David. In my experience this universal scheme is welcomed by the people of Wales.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'r cam hwn yn gam sosialaidd gwirioneddol a fydd yn sicrhau buddiannau cyffredinol. Mae pobl, fel minnau, sy'n dioddef o afiechydon cronig—mae diabetes arnaf—eisoes yn elwa ar bresgripsiynau am ddim a mentraf ddweud fy mod yn yr un categori incwm â chi, David. Yn fy mhrofiad i, croesewir y cynllun cyffredinol hwn gan bobl Cymru.

I also welcome the money being made available for the Bargoed bypass that will make an important difference to the people of that town. As I said yesterday, the proposed measures to deal with anti-social behaviour will also be welcomed in my constituency.

Croesawaf yr arian a ddarperir ar gyfer ffordd osgoi Bargoed a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth pwysig i bobl y dref honno. Fel y dywedais ddoe, caiff y mesurau arfaethedig i ymdrin ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol eu croesawu yn fy etholaeth i hefyd.

4.20 p.m.

Education is fundamentally important to our young people and their parents. Ensuring vocational education as parity of esteem with traditional education is vital if we are to give back to many young people a true sense of purpose and self-worth. Vocational education, including apprenticeships, is also vital to our economy. It is helping to fill the skills gap and enabling Wales to continue its path of economic growth and widening opportunities for our young and talented citizens. The 14 to 19-year-old learning pathways will transform 14 to 19-year-old education in Wales, with work-focused experience and individually tailored learning pathways providing routes to a range of qualifications. There will be a wide choice of

Mae addysg yn hanfodol bwysig i'n pobl ifanc a'u rhieni. Mae'n hanfodol sicrhau y ceir yr un parch at addysg alwedigaethol ag a geir at addysg draddodiadol er mwyn rhoi ymdeimlad gwirioneddol o ddiben a hunan-barch yn ôl i lawer o bobl ifanc. Mae addysg alwedigaethol, gan gynnwys prentisiaethau, yn hanfodol i'n heonomi hefyd. Mae'n helpu i lenwi'r bwlch o ran sgiliau ac yn galluogi Cymru i barhau ar hyd ei llwybr o dwf economaidd ac ehangu cyfleoedd i'n pobl ifanc a thalentog. Bydd y llwybrau dysgu i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 mlwydd oed yn trawsnewid addysg i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed yng Nghymru, gyda phrofiad sy'n canolbwytio ar waith a llwybrau dysgu wedi'u teilwra at yr unigolyn gan ddarparu

courses and experiences, not necessarily in the same setting. The introduction of the education maintenance allowance for 16 to 18-year-olds will assist in widening access to all. Improving the skills of our young citizens is also essential if we are to maximise the impact of apprenticeship schemes that run in partnership with employers. The skills for business network, recently established by the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, will ensure that we tailor our education system to match the needs of employers and maximise the benefits for our learners.

The piloting of the Welsh baccalaureate shows that we are well ahead of the game. We are setting the agenda and not following it. The baccalaureate shows that we can set the standard for those in education throughout Wales, as it has been awarded the status equivalent of A grade A-level by Universities and Colleges Admissions Service. The baccalaureate is already being piloted at advanced and intermediate level at over 24 centres across Wales.

I am proud to be a Member of an Assembly that has promised to rule out top-up fees in Welsh universities for this Assembly term and which has established the second Rees commission to advise us on the best way forward. In Wales, more first time degree entrants are from lower socio-economic backgrounds than anywhere else in the UK. Welsh Labour is delivering on its promise of reaching higher and wider by allowing more people, regardless of their income or class, into our higher education institutions. Devolving powers to communities and empowering them to take a key role in improving their lives through initiatives such as Communities First, is important. It is about giving them back the tools to improve their lives. It is also about governing by empowerment and through partnership working—something that Wales was not used to until 1997. Welsh Labour is determined to deliver something that goes beyond simply increasing investment in better public services. Welsh Labour is committed to raising the potential of all our

ffyrdd o ennill amrywiaeth o gymwysterau. Bydd dewis eang o gyrsiau a phrofiadau, nid o reidrwydd yn yr un math o leoliad. Bydd y broses o gyflwyno'r lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg i bobl ifanc 16 i 18 mlwydd oed yn helpu i ehangu mynediad ar gyfer pawb. Mae'n hanfodol gwella sgiliau ein dinasyddion ifanc hefyd er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar effaith cynlluniau prentisiaeth a gaiff eu cynnal mewn partneriaeth â chyflogwyr. Bydd y rhwydwaith sgiliau ar gyfer busnes, a sefydlwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ddiweddar, yn sicrhau ein bod yn teilwra ein system addysg i ddiwallu anghenion cyflogwyr a sicrhau'r buddiannau mwyaf posibl i'n dysgwyr.

Dengys prosiect peilot bagloriaeth Cymru ein bod ar flaen y gad. Yr ydym yn pennu'r agenda yn hytrach na'i dilyn. Dengys y fagloriaeth y gallwn bennu'r safon i'r rhai ym maes addysg ledled Cymru, am fod Gwasanaeth Derbyniadau Prifysgolion a Cholegau wedi dyfarnu statws iddi sy'n gyfwerth â gradd A Safon Uwch. Mae'r fagloriaeth eisoes yn cael ei threialu ar lefel uwch a chanolradd mewn dros 24 o ganolfannau ledled Cymru.

Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn Aelod o Gynulliad sydd wedi addo peidio ag ystyried ffioedd ychwanegol ym mhrifysgolion Cymru yn ystod y tymor hwn yn y Cynulliad ac sydd wedi sefydlu ail gomisiwn Rees i'n cyngori ar y ffordd orau ymlaen. Yng Nghymru, daw mwy o fyfyrwyr sy'n astudio am radd am y tro cyntaf o gefndiroedd economaidd-gymdeithasol is nag unrhyw le arall yn y DU. Mae Llafur Cymru yn cyflawni ei addewid i gyrraedd mwy o bobl drwy alluogi mwy o bobl, waeth beth fo'u hincwm neu eu dosbarth, i fynd i'n sefydliadau addysg uwch. Mae'n bwysig datganoli pwerau i gymunedau a'u grymuso i chwarae rhan allweddol i wella eu bywydau drwy fentrau megis Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae a wnelo â rhoi'r dulliau iddynt fel y gallant wella eu bywydau. Mae a wnelo hefyd â llywodraethu drwy rymuso a thrwy weithio mewn partneriaeth—sef rhywbeth nad oedd Cymru yn gyfarwydd ag ef tan 1997. Mae Llafur Cymru yn benderfynol o gyflawni rhywbeth sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i gynyddu buddsoddiad mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell. Mae Llafur

citizens by giving them the practical means to make their lives better, and the report shows that we are delivering.

**Bryngle Williams:** This is an interesting document, although it borders on the arrogant. It is all very well to talk about exciting commitments, but we need straight talking and good, reliable and regular services that perform well for the people of Wales. Last night, I read the news that surgeons have claimed that English hospitals are not allowed to treat Welsh patients until they have been waiting for 18 months. I have mentioned that previously in the Chamber. Tens of thousands of people are living in constant pain and suffering. Minister, sort out the NHS, please. Look after the people that all of us represent. Your priorities must be commended, but they are hollow, with no substance and results. In order to get people on board, you must deliver. To give a few children school breakfasts in 50 schools in Wales is hardly a major achievement, and what is the cost to the taxpayer? You promised to invest in improving school buildings. Many of our buildings are in a disastrous state of repair. I have seen that at first hand in many schools I have visited, including schools in north Wales, and if the health and safety executive was called in, those schools would be closed down. We all debated the Clywch inquiry last week and heard about the terrible allegations. We must protect, nurture and encourage our young people—they are the future. We must not subject them to danger. That is non-negotiable.

You committed yourself, First Minister, to keeping your promises. Many have been made and broken, which include waiting lists and the crisis in farming, to name but two. There is no such thing as a free lunch. The free prescription initiative will cost the taxpayer an astonishing £37 million a year. You spin the line well, First Minister, of giving something for nothing, but you do not provide the costings clearly for everyone to see that in this life, nothing is free. I will offer you some advice, First Minister, on good housekeeping. Why spend £1 million of

Cymru yn ymrwymedig i wella potensial ein holl ddinasyseddion drwy roi ffyrdd ymarferol iddynt wella eu bywydau, a dengys yr adroddiad ein bod yn gwneud hynny.

**Bryngle Williams:** Mae hon yn ddogfen ddiddorol, er ei bod bron yn haerllug. Mae'n iawn siarad am ymrwymiadau cyffrous, ond mae angen siarad yn blwmp ac yn blaen a sicrhau bod gwasanaethau da, dibynadwy a rheolaidd ar gael sy'n gweithio'n dda i bobl Cymru. Neithiwr, darllenais y newyddion bod llawfeddygon wedi honni na chaniateir i ysbytai yn Lloegr drin cleifion o Gymru oni bai eu bod wedi bod yn aros am 18 mis. Crybwylais hynny yn y Siambr o'r blaen. Mae miloedd ar filoedd o bobl mewn poen parhaus ac yn dioddef yn barhaus. Weinidog, rhwch drefn ar y GIG, os gwelwch yn dda. Gofalwch am y bobl y mae pob un ohonom yn eu cynrychioli. Rhaid canmol eich blaenoriaethau, ond maent yn wag, heb sylwedd na chanlyniadau. Er mwyn cael cefnogaeth pobl, mae angen cyflawni. Prin bod rhoi brecwast ysgol i nifer fach o blant mewn 50 o ysgolion yn gamp fawr, a beth yw'r gost i'r trethdalwr? Bu ichi addo buddsoddi mewn gwella adeiladau ysgolion. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'n hadeiladau mewn cyflwr ofnadwy. Yr wyf wedi gweld hynny drosof fy hun mewn llawer o ysgolion yr wyf wedi ymweld â hwy, gan gynnwys ysgolion yn y Gogledd, a phe cai'r awdurdod gweithredol iechyd a diogelwch ei alw, cai'r ysgolion hynny eu cau. Bu i bob un ohonon drafod ymchwiliad Clywch yr wythnos diwethaf a chlywsom yr honiadau ofnadwy. Rhaid inni amddiffyn, meithrin ac annog ein pobl ifanc—hwy yw'r dyfodol. Dylem sicrhau nad ydynt mewn perygl. Nid yw hynny'n agored i drafodaeth.

Bu ichi ymrwymo, Brif Weinidog at gadw eich addewidion. Mae llawer o addewidion wedi'u gwneud a'u torri, sy'n cynnwys rhestrau aros a'r argyfwng ym myd ffermio, i enwi ond dwy ohonynt. Ni roddir unrhyw beth am ddim. Bydd y fenter i roi presgrisiau am ddim yn costio £37 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r trethdalwr sy'n swm anhygoel. Yr ydych yn un da, Brif Weinidog, am gynnig rhywbeth am ddim, ond nid ydych yn rhoi'r costau yn glir er mwyn i bawb weld na cheir dim byd am ddim yn y bywyd hwn. Cynigiaf rywfaint o gyngor ichi, Brif

taxpayers' money on the Richard commission and ignore the findings? Everything in the garden is not rosy: many of our roads and pavements are substandard and billions of pounds are much needed to bring them up to standard. The Wales Millennium Centre is to open across the road from here in November, but there is no car park.

**Ann Jones:** You are supposed to walk there.

**Bryngle Williams:** How can you walk all the way from north Wales?

The list of failings is unending. Perhaps you could follow in the footsteps of Mr Blair, First Minister; on breakfast news this morning he used the word 'sorry'. Perhaps if you admit that all is not wonderful, you may get support from more people.

**Ann Jones:** Do you not think that it is time that the Conservative Government said sorry for its 18 year rule, and for all that the Tories did to the people of Wales? You should stand up and say sorry on behalf of your party.

**Bryngle Williams:** First Minister, you may wish to sign up to alternative pledges that Labour could be pleased to announce: increasing waiting lists to dangerous levels, putting many people's lives at risk; a gross shortage of affordable housing, GPs and dentists, especially in rural areas; council tax rising out of control; £55 million spent on an unnecessary new building for AMs; cuts in the agriculture budget; tuition fees looming in 2007; increasing class sizes; and more mini embassies and overseas junkets at high cost to the taxpayer.

**David Lloyd:** In the small amount of time available for what should be detailed scrutiny of the First Minister's annual report, I shall cut to the chase, as it were. On the finance portfolio, the First Minister should, in all seriousness, consider revisiting the Barnett formula and the need to turn it into a needs-based formula.

Weinidog, ar roi trefn dda ar arian. Pam y bu ichi wario £1 filiwn o arian trethdalwyr ar gomisiwn Richard gan anwybyddu'r canfyddiadau? Nid yw popeth yn fél i gyd: mae llawer o'n ffyrdd a'n palmantau o safon eilradd ac mae angen dybryd am filiynau o bunnoedd i sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd safon dderbynol. Bwriedir agor Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru ar draws y ffordd ym mis Tachwedd, ond nid oes maes parcio.

**Ann Jones:** Yr ydych i fod i gerdded yno.

**Bryngle Williams:** Sut gallwch gerdded yr holl ffordd o'r Gogledd?

Mae'r rhestr o fethiannau yn ddiddiwedd. Efallai y gallich ddilyn Mr Blair, Brif Weinidog, a ymddiheurodd ar newyddion brecwast y bore yma. Efallai os cyfaddefwch nad yw popeth yn fél i gyd y bydd mwy o bobl yn eich cefnogi.

**Ann Jones:** Oni chredwch ei bod yn bryd i'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ymddiheuro am yr hyn a wnaeth yn ystod ei 18 mlynedd mewn grym ac am bopeth a wnaeth y Toriaid i bobl Cymru? Dylech sefyll ar eich traed ac ymddiheuro ar ran eich plaid.

**Bryngle Williams:** Brif Weinidog, efallai y byddwch am gymeradwyo addewidion amgen y gallai Llafur fod yn falch o'u cyhoeddi: cynyddu rhestrau aros i lefelau peryglus, gan roi bywydau llawer o bobl mewn perygl; prinder difrifol o dai fforddiadwy, meddygon teulu a deintyddion, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig; y dreth gyngor yn codi y tu hwnt i reolaeth; gwario £55 miliwn ar adeilad newydd diangen i ACau; toriadau yn y gyllideb amaethyddiaeth; ffioedd dysgu i'w cyflwyno yn 2007; maint dosbarthiadau yn cynyddu; a mwy o lysgenadaethau bach a theithiau tramor ar gost uchel i'r trethdalwr.

**David Lloyd:** Yn yr amser prin sydd ar gael i'r hyn a ddylai fod yn broses graffu fanwl ar adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog, af i wraidd y mater, fel petai. O ran y portffolio cyllid, dylai'r Prif Weinidog, a bod o ddifrif, ystyried ailedrych ar fformiwlau Barnett a'r angen i'w thrawsnewid yn fformiwlau sy'n seiliedig ar anghenion.

The new medical school in Swansea is mentioned in the health section of the First Minister's report, but Swansea is about to lose its excellent paediatric neurosurgical unit. This will be the first time that we have lost a regional service in Swansea—we did not lose a service even in the dark days of Tory rule, pre-devolution. Please look again at paediatric neurosurgery in Swansea.

I studied the timeline, your diary dates, on the last page of the report, and noticed that it starts on 14 June 2003 with Joe Calzaghe getting his MBE, which is excellent, but I wonder what the First Minister's contribution was to that. Unfortunately, the timeline finishes on 27 April 2004 with the pilot of free school breakfasts, but it should have carried on for another few days until 6 June, and then the First Minister might not have missed the D-day commemorations. This report should be about delivery not vacuous intentions. I want some answers, First Minister.

**The First Minister:** I must say to opposition speakers this afternoon that they should respect the facts. I accept that, occasionally, the facts that I put before you this afternoon in my opening speech, yesterday, and in the report itself, can seem boring compared with ranting—Dai and David Davies are the experts in these matters—but sometimes you must respect the facts. When I give factual information, you should have a go at that, rather than make general remarks. Sometimes facts can be excruciating, for example, when the Conservatives have to remember the dark days when the number of people on the dole was, on average, three times higher than it is today—120,000 compared with today's figure of 39,000 and falling. They do not want to bring back the past, but their party leader has brought John Redwood back into the shadow Cabinet and recreated the past for us. The people of Wales will remember that when they have the electoral opportunities that David Davies mentioned earlier.

**David Melding:** Will you take an intervention?

Cyfeirir at yr ysgol feddygol newydd yn Abertawe yn adran adroddiad y Prif Weinidog ar iechyd, ond mae Abertawe ar fin colli ei huned niwrolawfeddygol bediatrig ardderchog. Dyma fydd y tro cyntaf inni golli gwasanaeth rhanbarthol yn Abertawe—ni chollwyd gwasanaeth hyd yn oed yn nyddiau tywyll y Toriaid, cyn datganoli. A fydddech crystal ag ailystyried llawdriniaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn Abertawe?

Astudiai'r amserlen, sef y dyddiadau yn eich dyddiadur, ar dudalen olaf yr adroddiad, a sylwais ei bod yn dechrau ar 14 Mehefin 2003 gyda Joe Calzaghe yn derbyn ei MBE, sy'n ardderchog, ond tybed beth oedd cyfraniad y Prif Weinidog i hynny. Yn anffodus, mae'r amserlen yn gorffen ar 27 Ebrill 2004 gyda chynllun peilot brecwast ysgol am ddim, ond dylai fod wedi parhau am ychydig ddiwrnodau eto tan 6 Mehefin, ac yna efallai na fyddai'r Prif Weinidog wedi colli dathliadau coffâu D-day. Dylai fod a wnelo'r adroddiad hwn â chyflawni yn hytrach na bwriadau gwag. Yr wyf am gael atebion, Brif Weinidog.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid imi ddweud wrth siaradwyr y gwrthbleidiau y prynhawn yma y dylent barchu'r ffeithiau. Derbyniaf y gall y ffeithiau a gyflwynais ichi y prynhawn yma yn fy arraith agoriadol, ddoe, ac yn yr adroddiad ei hun, ymddangos yn ddiflas, o bryd i'w gilydd, o gymharu â dweud y drefn—mae Dai a David Davies yn arbenigo yn y pethau hyn—ond weithiau rhaid ichi barchu'r ffeithiau. Pan roddaf wybodaeth ffeithiol ichi, dylech feirniadu hynny, yn hytrach na gwneud sylwadau cyffredinol. Gall ffeithiau fod yn echrydus weithiau, er enghraifft, pan fo'n rhaid i'r Ceidwadwyr gofio'r dyddiau tywyll pan oedd nifer y bobl ddi-waith dair gwaith yn uwch na heddiw ar gyfartaledd—120,000 o gymharu â ffigur o 39,000 heddiw ac mae'r ffigur hwnnw yn gostwng. Nid ydynt am gofio'r gorffennol, ond mae arweinydd eu plaid wedi ailgyflwyno John Redwood yng Nghabinet yr wrthblaidd ac wedi ail-greu'r gorffennol inni. Bydd pobl Cymru yn cofio hynny pan gânt y cyfleoedd i bleidleisio a grybwyllyd gan David Davies yn gynharach.

**David Melding:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**The First Minister:** I do not have time now.

4.30 p.m.

Mike German's comments were based on an absurd assumption; he tried to pretend that if you put forward a set of pledges for a four-year term, if you did not achieve them during the first 12 or 18 months, you had somehow broken those pledges. That is not the case at all. He mentioned free prescriptions: we froze prescription charges in year one and we will cut those charges on Friday. That is the first cut for 40 years, and it goes right across the board. I think that it was David Melding who said that he does not approve of that, but when talking yesterday about the need for a judicious balance between means-tested benefits and universal benefits, I do not think that anybody on the Conservative side dissented from that position. You can always pick up on the one universal benefit and say that it should be means tested, as it is now, but then you have to say that you are against all universal benefits. We are not against them; we think that it is right to have a judicious mixture. In the context of the Welsh economy and Welsh health, this is a good policy, and the abolition of prescription charges as an in-work benefit will be of great assistance in helping people into work, sometimes into low-paying jobs, after periods of unemployment or economic inactivity. Another example is the free swimming initiative, which is being introduced for old people, following the successful policy for children. You could say that that is a free benefit, but it is of huge importance in terms of its health consequences.

People mentioned the health service, and they keep ranting on that the Welsh health service must, regardless of the facts, be considered to be in a worse state than its counterpart in England. They keep ignoring the fact that 90 per cent of contacts with the health service are at the primary care level. We have given an undertaking of guaranteed access to the primary care services in the NHS in 24 hours,

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes amser gennyf yn awr.

Yr oedd sylwadau Mike German yn seiliedig ar ragdybiaeth hurt; ceisiodd honni eich bod rywsut yn torri addewidion, os oeddech yn cyflwyno cyfres o addewidion ar gyfer tymor o bedair blynedd ond nad oeddech yn eu cyflawni yn ystod y 12 neu'r 18 mis cyntaf. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Soniodd am bresgripsiynau am ddim: bu inni rewi taliadau presgripsiwn yn y flwyddyn gyntaf a byddwn yn gostwng y taliadau hynny ddydd Gwener. Dyna'r gostyngiad cyntaf ers 40 mlynedd, a gostyngiad cyffredinol ydyw. Credaf mai David Melding a ddywedodd nad yw'n cymeradwyo hynny, ond wrth siarad ddoe am yr angen i sierhau cydbwysedd synhwyrol rhwng budd-daliadau yn seiliedig ar brawf modd a budd-daliadau a roddir i bawb, nid oedd neb, fe gredaf, o'r blaid Geidwadol yn anghytuno â'r safbwyni hwnnw. Gallwch bob amser sôn am yr un budd-dal a roddir i bawb a dweud y dylai fod yn seiliedig ar brawf modd, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, ond wedyn rhaid ichi ddweud eich bod yn gwrthwynebu pob budd-dal o'r fath. Nid ydym yn eu gwrthwynebu; credwn ei bod yn iawn cael cymysgedd synhwyrol. Yng nghyd-destun economi Cymru ac iechyd Cymru, mae hwn yn bolisi da, a bydd y broses o ddileu taliadau presgripsiwn fel budd-dal yn y gwaith o gymorth mawr i helpu pobl i gael gwaith, weithiau mewn swyddi â chyflwyno ar gyfer yr henoed, ar ôl y polisi llwyddiannus ar gyfer plant. Gallech ddweud bod hynny'n fudd-dal am ddim, ond mae'n bwysig iawn o ran ei ganlyniadau iechyd.

Soniodd pobl am y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac maent yn dweud y drefn o hyd bod yn rhaid ystyried bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru mewn cyflwr gwaeth na'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr, beth bynnag fo'r ffeithiau. Maent yn anwybyddu'r ffaith mai gofal sylfaenol yw 90 y cant o'r cysylltiadau â'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau mynediad i'r

compared with 48 hours in England. I mentioned the huge improvements in cardiac surgery. Brynle mentioned dangerous levels. Yes, they were dangerous levels when there were long cardiac surgery waiting lists, but they are not now. People no longer die as a matter of routine on cardiac surgery waiting lists as was the case when we took over five and a half years ago. I mentioned the infant mortality rate—no-one in the opposition can cope with good news about the health service in Wales. I mentioned that, when we took over, the infant mortality rate was higher than elsewhere in Britain, and now it is much lower.

We mentioned the GCSE pass rates, which used to be poorer in Wales, but which are now higher. We have improved GCSE pass rates A to C, which is the normal way of measuring relative education success, and you cannot cope. None of you mentions it. You cannot cope with the fact that something is going better in Wales than elsewhere as it is not your job, as Helen Mary openly said, to go forward. That is, you refuse any reference to any good news and just try to concentrate on the bad news. Occasionally, however, you must have some respect for the facts. Lorraine mentioned the safer communities fund, the community safety partnerships, and the success of Operation Tarian. These are all major achievements that are under the umbrella of the crime fighting fund, and they are of huge consequence to people.

Rhodri Glyn, you mentioned waiting lists for surgery. The waiting list issue is not where we want it to be, but you must remember that that is only one third of the hospital side of the national health service. Two thirds are in the accident and emergency side, where we do extremely well on all the comparisons.

**Nick Bourne:** Let me take you back to waiting lists. I know that you think that it is just the opposition going on about the long waiting lists, but take what is being said by

gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn y GIG o fewn 24 awr, o gymharu â 48 awr yn Lloegr. Soniais am y gwelliannau mawr o ran llawdriniaeth ar y galon. Soniodd Brynle am lefelau peryglus. Ie, cafwyd lefelau peryglus pan oedd rhestrau aros hir am lawdriniaeth ar y galon, ond nid ydynt yn beryglus yn awr. Nid yw pobl yn marw mwyach fel mater o drefn ar restrau aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon fel oedd yn wir pan ddaethom i rym bum mlynedd a hanner yn ôl. Soniais am y gyfradd marwolaethau babanod—ni all neb yn y gwrthbleidiau ymdopi â'r newyddion da ynghylch y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Soniais am y ffaith bod y gyfradd marwolaethau babanod yn uwch nag mewn mannau eraill o Brydain, pan ddaethom i rym, ac mae'n llawer is erbyn hyn.

Bu ichi sôn am gyfraddau llwyddo mewn TGAU, a arferai fod yn waeth yng Nghymru, ond sy'n uwch erbyn hyn. Yr ydym wedi gwella cyfraddau graddau A i C TGAU, sef y ffordd arferol o fesur llwyddiant cymharol mewn addysg, ac ni allwch ymdopi â hynny. Nid oes neb ohonoch yn cyfeirio at hynny. Ni allwch ymdopi â'r ffaith bod rhywbeth yn well yng Nghymru nag mewn mannau eraill am nad eich gwaith chi, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary a hynny'n agored, yw symud ymlaen. Hynny yw, yr ydych yn gwrthod cyfeirio at unrhyw newyddion da ac yn canolbwytio ar y newyddion drwg yn unig. O bryd i'w gilydd, fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi barchu'r ffeithiau. Soniodd Lorraine am y gronfa cymunedau diogelach, y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, a llwyddiant Ymgyrch Tarian. Mae pob un o'r cyflawniadau pwysig hyn o dan ymbarél y gronfa ymladd troseddau, ac maent o bwys mawr i bobl.

Rhodri Glyn, bu ichi grybwyl rhestrau aros ar gyfer llawdriniaeth. Nid yw'r rhestrau aros fel yr hoffem iddynt fod, ond rhaid ichi gofio mai dim ond traean o waith ysbytai'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yw hynny. Mae dwy ran o dair mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, lle y gwnawn yn dda iawn o ran yr holl gymariaethau.

**Nick Bourne:** Gadewch imi droi yn ôl at restrau aros. Gwn eich bod o'r farn bod y gwrthbleidiau yn hoff o siarad am y rhestrau aros hir, ond gwrandewch ar yr hyn a

Labour MPs—perhaps understandable because there is a general election just around the corner—about the state of the health service and the way in which it is run. Take what Kim Howells and Jon Owen Jones have been saying. Do you not accept that having one in 10 people in Wales on a waiting list is completely unacceptable and that you really must address that?

**The First Minister:** Indeed, and that is why we have addressed it, and why the 18-month second offer guarantee scheme has been introduced and why the 12-month second offer guarantee scheme will come in. It is not 12 months or 18 months where we have shorter targets, but four months for cataracts, which is better than in England, even though you never admit, concede or refer to it. Six months is the maximum time for angiography, while it is 10 months—shortly to be eight months—for cardiac operations, and 18 months for orthopaedics and other services. However, you will simply never accept that the position of the health service in Wales can be anything other than a case of the grass being greener on the English side of the border.

Our achievements in getting a national children's hospital for Wales started—which will open its doors to patients early next year—is a great achievement, bearing in mind that it was the Tories who closed the only children's hospital that we ever had in Wales.

It is also important that we recognise just how much progress there has been in areas right across the board in public services—again, the Tories do not respond to it—namely the 66 per cent improvement in the number of people who are following modern apprenticeships, which is part of public service delivery. Those are facts that you cannot get away from. That is why I am proud to present this First Minister's report to the Assembly and ask the Assembly to reject all the opposition amendments.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

ddywedir gan ASau Llafur—efallai y gellir deall hyn oherwydd cynhelir etholiad cyffredinol yn fuan—am gyflwr y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r ffordd y caiff ei redeg. Gwrandewch ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd gan Kim Howells a Jon Owen Jones. Oni dderbyniwch fod y ffaith bod un o bob 10 unigolyn yng Nghymru ar restr aros yn holol annerbyniol a bod yn rhaid ichi ymdrin â hynny mewn gwirionedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi ymdrin â hynny, a pham y cyflwynwyd cynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig o 18 mis a pham y caiff cynllun gwarantu'r ail gynnig o 12 mis ei gyflwyno. Nid 12 mis na 18 mis yw'r amserau aros lle mae gennym dargedau byrrach, ond pedwar mis ar gyfer cataractau, sy'n well nag yn Lloegr, er nad ydych byth yn cyfaddef hynny nac yn cyfeirio ato. Chwe mis yw'r cyfnod hwyaf y mae'n rhaid aros am angiogram, tra 10 mis yw'r amser aros—bydd yn wyth mis cyn bo hir—ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ar y galon, a 18 mis ydyw ar gyfer orthopedeg a gwasanaethau eraill. Fodd bynnag, o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, bydd pobl bob amser yn credu bod pethau'n well yn Lloegr, hynny yw, man gwyn man draw.

Mae'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gennym o ran dechrau ar y gwaith o gael ysbty plant cenedlaethol i Gymru—a fydd yn agor ei ddrysau i gleifion ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf—yn gamp fawr, o gofio mai'r Torïaid a gaeodd yr unig ysbty plant a fu gennym erioed yng Nghymru.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn cydnabod faint o gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol—unwaith eto, nid yw'r Torïaid yn ymateb i hynny—sef y gwelliant o 66 y cant yn nifer y bobl sy'n dilyn prentisiaethau modern, sy'n rhan o ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Dyna ffeithiau na allwch eu hanwybyddu. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno adroddiad y Prif Weinidog i'r Cynulliad a gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod pob un o welliannau'r gwrthbleidiau.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Ni ddetholwyd gwelliant 2.  
 Amendment 2 not selected.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 18, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 3: For 18, Abstain 11, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 4: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 5: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2107): O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Motion (NDM2107): For 29, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred

James, Irene	Jones, Elin
Jones, Ann	Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Carwyn	Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Peter	Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw	Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val	Marek, John
Mewies, Sandy	Melding, David
Morgan, Rhodri	Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne	Randerson, Jenny
Pugh, Alun	Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl	Thomas, Owen John
Sinclair, Karen	Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Thomas, Catherine	Williams, Brynle
Thomas, Gwenda	Williams, Kirsty
	Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion defeated.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I am sorry; I voted the wrong way on the motion. I thought that we were still on the previous vote.

**The Presiding Officer:** I apologise if we were moving at a decent pace through the voting. It will be noted for the record. I cannot change the voting, but it was a mistake and it will be noted. The Government's honour is saved even if, technically, the vote was lost.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; pleidleisiais yn anghywir ar y cynnig. Yr oeddwn yn credu ein bod ar y bleidlais flaenorol o hyd.

**Y Llywydd:** Ymddiheuraf os oeddem yn bwrw ati yn gyflym drwy'r pleidleisiau. Caiff ei nodi ar gyfer y cofnod. Ni allaf newid y bleidlais, ond camgymeriad ydoedd a chaiff ei nodi. Caiff anrhwydedd y Llywodraeth ei achub er gwaethaf y ffaith, yn dechnegol, i'r bleidlais gael ei cholli.

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ynglŷn â Thai ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older People**

**Y Llywydd:** Er mwyn diogelu amser y ddadl fer, yr wyf yn bwriadu gosod cyfyngiad amser o dri munud i bob Aelod, ac eithrio Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, a fydd yn cael 15 munud, a'r Gweinidog a fydd yn cael uchafswm o wyth munud os yw'n dymuno. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn synnu pe bai'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn barod i dderbyn cynnig trefniadol i estyn y sesiwn, ar yr amser priodol, pe bai cynnig trefniadol yn cael ei gynnig.

**Janice Gregory:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No 9.9, notes the report of the Social Justice and Regeneration*

**The Presiding Officer:** In order to protect the time for the short debate, I intend to set a time limit of three minutes for each Member, except for the committee Chair, who will have 15 minutes, and the Minister who will have a maximum of eight minutes if she wishes. However, should a procedural motion to extend the session be proposed, at the appropriate time, I am sure that the Deputy Presiding Officer would be willing to accept it.

**Janice Gregory:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.9, yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac*

*Committee entitled 'Policy Review—Housing for Older People' which was laid in the Table Office on 2 July 2004. (NDM2106)*

I am grateful for your comments, Presiding Officer. I had hoped that, because of its importance and the fact that it was postponed from July, this debate would have been afforded sufficient time, but I am grateful for your statement. I had thought that I would perhaps postpone the debate again, but this is a most important debate, and many people have put an awful amount of work into it. It therefore gives me the greatest pleasure to propose this motion.

4.40 p.m.

The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's decision to conduct its policy review into housing for older people spawned from the Welsh Assembly Government's published strategy for older people in Wales. Members will recall that that document outlined a detailed implementation action plan that included the recommendation for a comprehensive, evidence-based need for meeting the future housing needs of older people. The report that we are debating today will provide an invaluable contribution to that exercise.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.41 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.41 p.m.*

The report was launched at the Assembly on 8 July. I was delighted that many of the residents of Wellwood House, Newport joined us for that. The committee visited Wellwood House at the start of the review in 2003, and the facilities offered there became the benchmark for good practice and expectations, which underpinned the whole review. It was fitting that we were able to go full circle and include Wellwood House at the launch.

In reaching its conclusions and recommendations, the committee took into account the substantial body of evidence received as a result of its consultation. Over 400 bodies were consulted at the outset, and several of the larger organisations were asked to supplement their written responses by

*Adfywio, 'Adolygiad Polisi—Tai ar gyfer Pobl Hŷn', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Gorffennaf 2004. (NDM2106)*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau, Lywydd. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio, oherwydd ei phwysigrwydd a'r ffaith iddi gael ei gohirio o fis Gorffennaf, y byddai digon o amser wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y ddadl hon, ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich datganiad. Ystyriais efallai y dylwn ohirio'r ddadl hon eto, ond mae'n ddadl hynod bwysig, ac mae llawer o bobl wedi gweithio'n galed iawn i'w pharatoi. Felly mae'n bleser o'r mwyaf gennyf gynnig y cynnig hwn.

Deilliodd penderfyniad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i gynnal ei adolygiad polisi o dai ar gyfer pobl hŷn o'r strategaeth a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio i'r ddogfen amlinellu cynllun gweithredu manwl a oedd yn cynnwys argymhelliaid o ran angen cynhwysfawr, yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth i ddiwallu anghenion tai pobl hŷn yn y dyfodol. Bydd yr adroddiad yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw yn gyfraniad gwerthfawr i'r ymarfer hwnnw.

Lansiwyd yr adroddiad yn y Cynulliad ar 8 Gorffennaf. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf weld bod llawer o drigolion Tŷ Wellwood, Casnewydd yn bresennol yn yr achlysur. Ymwelodd y pwylgor â Thŷ Wellwood ar ddechrau'r adolygiad yn 2003, a defnyddiwyd y cyfleusterau a gynigir yno fel y meincnod o ran arferion da a disgwyliadau, a fu'n sail i'r adolygiad cyfan. Yr oedd yn briodol inni goroni'r broses drwy wahodd trigolion Tŷ Wellwood i'r achlysur lansio.

Wrth lunio ei gasgliadau a'i argymhellion, ystyriodd y pwylgor y dystiolaeth helaeth a dderbyniwyd o ganlyniad i'w ymgynghoriad. Ymgynghorwyd â thros 400 o gyrff ar y cychwyn, a gofynnwyd i sawl un o'r sefydliadau mwy ategu eu hymatebion ysgrifenedig drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth

providing further information in formal committee hearings. Members also undertook several visits associated with the review and, importantly, these visits were not restricted to our own borders—we went outside Wales to see examples of good practice elsewhere. We saw many examples of innovation on those visits, which took in extra care schemes, specialist provision for people with dementia, housing for black and minority ethnic elders, retirement villages, and home improvement schemes to allow people to remain in their own homes.

It became clear from the beginning that this latter point would underlie the whole report. Older people, generally speaking, want to remain in their homes for as long as possible. There is a need to cater for those who feel the need for additional support, but the committee was convinced that the majority wish to remain in their own homes, even though many live in what is regarded as unfit housing. It is good to see that, with its commitment to funding the Care and Repair Agency and its strategy for combating fuel poverty, which is of greater concern to older people than those below retirement age, the Welsh Assembly Government recognises this. However, this is not the time for complacency. The foundations have been laid, and we must build on them.

A second issue to emerge from our review is that, regarding future provision, older people know what they want, and they want their voices to be heard. This is a lesson to us all. We may think that we know best, but there is no doubt that the people who know best are the end users. Future service design must be driven by the need to serve the requirements of our elders, not the elders having to put up with what we think is best for them. I will give an example. Much of the specialist provision for older people that is still operational today was built in the 1960s and 1970s to design standards that were thought to be acceptable at the time. Such items as wheelchair provision, private bathroom facilities, and even lifts in some instances, were regarded as a luxury rather than a necessity. Today's older generation want far more than this. Even in a cared-for

bellach mewn gwrandawiadau ffurfiol a gynhaliwyd gan y pwylgor. Yn ogystal, cynhaliodd yr aelodau sawl ymweliad mewn perthynas â'r adolygiad ac, yn bwysig, nid dim ond yng Nghymru y trefnwyd yr ymweliadau hyn—aethom y tu allan i Gymru i weld enghreifftiau o arferion da mewn mannau eraill. Gwelsom sawl enghraift o arloesedd ar yr ymweliadau hynny, a oedd yn cynnwys cynlluniau gofal ychwanegol, darpariaeth arbenigol ar gyfer pobl sy'n dioddef o ddemensia, tai ar gyfer pobl hŷn o gymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig, pentrefi ymddeol, a chynlluniau gwella cartrefi sy'n galluogi pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

Daeth yn amlwg o'r dechrau y byddai'r pwyt diwethaf hwn yn sail i'r adroddiad cyfan. Yn gyffredinol, mae pobl hŷn am aros yn eu cartrefi cyhyd â phosibl. Mae angen darparu ar gyfer y rheini sy'n teimlo bod angen cymorth ychwanegol arnynt, ond darbwyllyd y pwylgor bod y mwyafrif am aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, er bod llawer ohonynt yn byw mewn tai yr ystyrir eu bod yn anaddas. Mae'n braf gweld bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gyda'i hymrwymiad i ariannu'r Asiantaeth Gofal a Thrwsio a'i strategaeth ar gyfer trechu tlodi tanwydd, sy'n peri mwy o bryder i bobl hŷn na'r rhai sy'n iau na'r oedran ymddeol, yn cydnabod hyn. Fodd bynnag, nid dyma'r amser i orffwys ar ein rhwyfau. Gosodwyd y sylfeini, a rhaid inni adeiladu arnynt.

Ail fater a ddaeth i'r amlwg o'n hadolygiad, o ran darpariaeth yn y dyfodol, yw bod pobl hŷn yn gwybod beth y maent ei eisiau, a'u bod am i bobl wrando arnynt. Mae hynny'n wers i bob un ohonom. Efallai ein bod yn credu mai ni sy'n gwybod orau, ond yn ddi-  
au, y defnyddwyr terfynol yw'r bobl sy'n gwybod orau. Rhaid i'r angen i fodloni gofynion pobl hŷn, yn hytrach na disgwyl i bobl hŷn dderbyn ein barn ni am yr hyn sydd orau iddynt, fod yn sail i'r broses o gynllunio gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol. Difynnaf enghraift. Adeiladwyd llawer o'r ddarpariaeth arbenigol ar gyfer pobl hŷn sy'n parhau'n weithredol heddiw yn y 1960au a'r 1970au yn unol â safonau cynllunio yr ystyriwyd eu bod yn dderbyniol ar y pryd. Moethusrwydd oedd eitemau fel darpariaeth ar gyfer cadeiriau olwyn, ystafelloedd ymolchi preifat, a hyd yn oed liffiau mewn

environment they want their own front doors, their own living accommodation, and to maintain their independence.

The third lesson learned from our investigation is the need to provide the whole gambit of housing and support services. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is unanimous in its belief that good housing for all is the absolute key to providing a fair, just and healthy society. To achieve this, we must ensure that older people are made aware of their rights and the options that are available to them regarding their housing and care needs. This means an almost seamless service, involving housing, health and social care agencies. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government can create the right environment to allow the appropriate partnerships to develop.

The committee has produced a good report. It identifies the problems that need to be confronted to ensure that our older people can live in comfort and security and as independently as they may wish. It has been greatly assisted in this by the various organisations that have made such high-quality and comprehensive presentations to the committee. I take this opportunity to thank all those organisations that have contributed to our investigations. Without their input we would not be debating this report today. I also pay tribute to my fellow committee members. All too often, politicians are accused of playing party politics instead of tackling real issues. This report gives lie to that accusation. It has the unanimous support of the members of all four political parties and shows the effectiveness of the committee structure and its workings in the Assembly. However, I fully anticipate that the fact that we have reached a consensus will not be worth any column inches in tomorrow's *The Western Mail*, and I have not been inundated with requests from the broadcasting media to discuss harmony within the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. Perhaps that will happen one day.

rhai achosion, yn hytrach nag anghenraid. Mae'r genhedlaeth hŷn sydd ohoni yn disgwyl llawer mwy na hyn. Hyd yn oed mewn amgylchedd lle gofelir amdanynt maent am gael eu drysau ffrynt eu hunain, eu hastafell fyw eu hunain, ac maent am gadw eu hannibyniaeth.

Y drydedd wers a ddysgywyd o'n hymchwiliad yw'r angen i ddarparu'r ystod gyfan o wasanaethau tai a chymorth. Cred y Pwyllgor Cyflawnader Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn unfrydol fod tai da i bawb yn gwbl hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau cymdeithas deg, cyflawn ac iach. Er mwyn cyflawni hyn, rhaid inni sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn ymwybodol o'u hawliau a'r dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt o ran eu hanghenion tai a gofal. Mae hyn yn gofyn am wasanaeth unedig, fwy neu lai, sy'n cynnwys asiantaethau tai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Gobeithiaf y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru greu'r amgylchedd cywir i alluogi'r partneriaethau priodol i ddatblygu.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad da. Mae'n nodi'r problemau y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy er mwyn sicrhau y gall ein pobl hŷn fyw yn gysurus ac yn ddiogel a chadw cymaint o annibyniaeth â phosibl. Cafodd gymorth sylweddol yn hyn o beth gan yr amrywiol sefydliadau a wnaeth gyflwyniadau cynhwysfawr o ansawdd uchel i'r pwyllgor. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r holl sefydliadau hynny a gyfrannodd at ein hymchwiliadau. Heb eu cyfraniad, ni fyddem yn cynnal dadl ynghylch yr adroddiad hwn heddiw. Talaf deyrnged hefyd i'm cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor. Yn rhy aml, caiff gwleidyddion eu cyhuddo o chwarae gêm wleidyddol bleidiol yn hytrach na mynd i'r afael â phroblemau gwirioneddol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi taw ar y cyhuddiad hwnnw. Llwyddodd i ennyn cefnogaeth unfrydol aelodau'r pedair plaid wleidyddol gan ddangos effeithiolrwydd strwythur y pwyllgorau a'u ffyrdd o weithio yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr gennyl na fydd y ffaith inni gael consensws yn cael unrhyw sylw yn *The Western Mail* yfory, ac nid wyf wedi cael fy llethu gan geisiadau di-rif gan y cyfryngau darlledu i drafod cytgord o fewn y Pwyllgor Cyflawnader Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Efallai y gwelwn hynny ryw ddiwrnod.

I also thank the committee clerk, Roger Chaffey, and his team for the immense amount of work undertaken in producing this report. I also thank the Members' research service for its work in analysing responses and providing Members with a comprehensive yet concise summary of the issues that were raised. Its work often goes unnoticed, but I wish to assure Graham Winter and his team that it is no less appreciated.

I give special thanks to Nigel Appleton, the special adviser—and I am delighted to see him in the public gallery—who has assisted the committee on this project. He is one of the acknowledged leaders in the field of housing provision, and has been particularly active in his engagement with services for the elderly. It has been a privilege to work with him. There is not doubt that without his guidance and expertise we would not have been able to arrive at such rounded and thoughtful conclusions. He has been most helpful in guiding the committee in its deliberations.

I am delighted to present this report today. It provides a base on which the Welsh Assembly Government can implement the development of the overall strategies for housing and older people. The report is directed to the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, but I also commend it to the Minister for Health and Social Services. I trust that both Ministers will be able to respond to its conclusions and recommendations at the appropriate time. I commend the report to Members and hope that they will support the recommendations.

**Lisa Francis:** The Welsh Conservative Group is pleased that this policy review into housing for older people in Wales has been conducted. All 26 recommendations in the report are laudable and in keeping with the spirit of the strategy for older people. Recommendation 3 recognises the need to carry out a strategic review to determine the future housing aspirations, requirements and needs of older people. This could be done by carrying out a national study of the views of people in their 50s and 60s on the type of

Diolchaf hefyd i glerc y pwylgor, Roger Chaffey, a'i dîm am eu gwaith eithriadol wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Diolchaf hefyd i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau am ei waith wrth ddadansoddi ymatebion ac wrth roi crynodeb byr ond cynhwysfawr i'r Aelodau o'r materion a godwyd. Anaml y cydnabyddir ei waith, ond yr wyf am sicrhau Graham Winter a'i dîm ein bod, serch hynny, yn ei werthfawrogi.

Diolchaf yn arbennig i Nigel Appleton, y cynghorydd arbennig—ac mae'n bleser gennyf ei weld yn yr oriel gyhoeddus—a fu'n cynorthwyo'r pwylgor gyda'r prosiect hwn. Caiff ei gydnabod fel arweinydd ym maes darpariaeth tai, a bu'n ymwneud yn benodol â gwasanaethau i'r henoed. Bu'n faint cydweithio ag ef. Nid oes amheuaeth na fyddem wedi llwyddo i ddod i gasgliadau mor gytbwys ac ystyrlon heb ei arweiniad a'i arbenigedd. Bu ei gyfraniad yn ddefnyddiol iawn wrth helpu i lywio trafodaethau'r pwylgor.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn heddiw. Darpara sail y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei defnyddio i ddatblygu'r strategaethau cyffredinol ar gyfer tai a phobl hŷn. Mae'r adroddiad wedi'i gyfeirio at y Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ond fe'i cymeradwyaf hefyd i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Hyderaf y bydd y ddu Weinidog yn gallu ymateb i'w gasgliadau a'i argymhellion ar yr adeg briodol. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Aelodau a gobeitiaf y byddant yn cefnogi'r argymhellion.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae Grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn falch bod yr adolygiad polisi hwn o dai ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru wedi'i gynnal. Mae pob un o'r 26 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad yn glodwiw ac yn gydnaws ag ysbryd y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Mae argymhelliaid 3 yn cydnabod yr angen i gynnal adolygiad strategol i ganfod dyheadau, gofynion ac anghenion pobl hŷn o ran tai ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gellid gwneud hyn drwy gynnal astudiaeth genedlaethol o farn pobl yn eu 50au a'u 60au am y math o dai y

housing that they would like to see available to them as they get older.

While this report is welcome, I hope that all the recommendations can be implemented as soon as possible. I am sure that all Members in the Chamber could cite constituency cases where elderly and disabled people are suffering due to poor housing. These are policies for the future, but given the nature of the current system, I am concerned about the practicalities of implementing these policies. On repairs to older people's council housing, for example, I am aware of situations whereby local authorities blame the Welsh Assembly Government for lack of progress because of the withdrawal of funding, while the Government tells us that local authorities are responsible for deciding how they spend their money. The reality is that this bat and ball argument provides no real answers for those elderly, vulnerable, disabled people who have little or no time to wait for improvements.

I welcome the report. Almost 17,000 elderly people have died during the past decade from the effects of cold in their homes. The time for action and clarification of responsibility cannot come soon enough.

**Rosemary Butler:** I welcome this report. Housing has not been at the top of any political agenda for the past 30 years. As a result, it has become somewhat of a cinderella service. This is an excellent report and the committee and the chair should be justly proud of it. It will bring housing to the top of the agenda.

I will make three brief points. Homeowners face the growing problem of seeing their properties rise in value on the one hand, which reduces their points with respect to housing waiting lists, while, on the other, houses have not risen enough in value to allow them to buy into a private sector senior citizen development scheme. Recommendation 2 suggests a number of ideas that may address this problem, including shared ownership. I hope that this idea is progressed.

4.50 p.m.

byddent am iddynt fod ar gael iddynt wrth iddynt heneiddio.

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn, gobeithiaf y gellir gweithredu'r holl argymhellion cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai pob Aelod yn y Siambraeon am achosion yn eu hetholaeth lle y mae'r henoed a phobl anabl yn dioddef o ganlyniad i dai gwael. Mae'r rhain yn bolisiau ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond o ystyried natur y system bresennol, yr wyf yn pryeru ynghylch ymarferoldeb gweithredu'r polisiau hyn. O ran trwsio tai cyngor pobl hŷn, er enghraifft, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o sefyllfaoedd lle y mae awdurdodau lleol yn beio Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ddiffyg cynnydd am iddi dynnu arian yn ôl, ond dywed y Llywodraeth wrthym mai awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am benderfynu sut y caiff eu harian ei wario. Y gwir amdani yw nad yw'r ddadl hon, sy'n mynd yn ôl ac ymlaen, yn rhoi unrhyw atebion go iawn i'r bobl hŷn, diamddiffyn, anabl hynny na allant aros yn hir, os o gwbl, am welliannau.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Bu farw bron 17,000 o bobl hŷn yn ystod y degawd diwethaf o ganlyniad i effeithiau oerfel yn eu cartrefi. Mae'n hen bryd inni weithredu a phennu cyfrifoldebau.

**Rosemary Butler:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Ni fu tai ar frig unrhyw agenda wleidyddol ers 30 mlynedd. O ganlyniad, daeth yn rhyw fath o wasanaeth sinderela. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn un ardderchog a dylai'r pwylgor a'r cadeirydd ymfalchiô ynddo. Daw â thai i frig yr agenda.

Gwnaf dri phwynt cryno. Mae perchnogion tai yn wynebu'r broblem gynyddol o weld eu heiddo yn codi mewn gwerth ar y naill llaw, sy'n lleihau eu pwyntiau o ran rhestrau aros am dai, ac, ar y llaw arall, gwelant nad yw gwerth tai wedi codi ddigon i alluogi iddynt ymuno ag un o gynlluniau datblygu'r sector preifat i'r henoed. Mae argymhelliad 2 yn awgrymu nifer o syniadau a allai fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, gan gynnwys rhan-berchenogaeth. Gobeithiaf y caiff y syniad hwn ei ddatblygu.

My second point relates to the lifestyles of older people. Once their accommodation expectations are realised, we need to consider their leisure and social expectations. We must be wary of parking people in accommodation, regardless of whether it is good accommodation, and not take any further part in helping them to develop their lives. We must encourage them to develop existing and new skills so that they not only live longer, but live longer better.

We need to rethink our views on old age, and I hope that the strategy for older people will help us to think about better lifestyles as well as providing better accommodation. Recommendations 18 and 21 go some way to addressing this issue.

I realise that time is short, therefore I will conclude with a point about partnerships. A number of the report's recommendations deal with partnerships. It is important that good partnerships are established. Partnerships in my constituency could be used as best practice models throughout the UK, not just in Wales. These partnerships with housing associations are delivering extra care schemes and redeveloping worn out prefabricated housing, which is popular with older people. It is important that new partnerships are developed across Wales, not just with health services, but with education and leisure services. If we are to deliver a new lifestyle to accompany accommodation, partnerships must be developed.

The report contains many points that Members would like to address, but time is short and I must conclude. I congratulate the committee, and I hope that the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration will do the report justice.

**David Lloyd:** Nine per cent of homes in Wales are unfit, compared with 7 per cent in England. Over a third of houses in Wales were built before 1919, and 52 per cent of older people live in pre-1919 dwellings. This

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â ffyrdd o fyw pobl hŷn. Unwaith y caiff eu dyheadau o ran tai eu bodloni, bydd angen inni ystyried eu disgwyliadau hamdden a chymdeithasol. Rhaid inni ochel rhag rhoi pobl mewn tai, waeth pa un ydynt yn dai o ansawdd da ai peidio, a pheidio â chymryd unrhyw gamau pellach i'w helpu i ddatblygu eu bywydau. Rhaid inni eu hannog i ddatblygu'r sgiliau a feddant eisoes ynghyd â sgiliau newydd er mwyn iddynt nid yn unig fyw'n hwy, ond byw'n hwy yn well.

Mae angen inni ailystyried ein safbwytiau o ran yr henoed, a gobeithiaf y bydd y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn ein helpu i ystyried gwell ffyrdd o fyw yn ogystal â darparu tai gwell. Mae argymhellion 18 a 21 yn paratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer ymdrin â'r mater hwn.

Sylweddolaf fod amser yn brin, felly dof i ben gyda phwynt am bartneriaethau. Mae nifer o argymhellion yr adroddiad yn ymdrin â phartneriaethau. Mae'n bwysig sefydlu partneriaethau da. Gellid defnyddio partneriaethau yn fy etholaeth fel modelau o arferion gorau ledled y DU, nid yng Nghymru yn unig. Mae'r partneriaethau hyn gyda chymdeithasau tai yn cyflwyno cynlluniau gofal ychwanegol ac yn ailddatblygu hen dai parod, sy'n boblogaidd gyda phobl hŷn. Mae'n bwysig datblygu partneriaethau newydd ledled Cymru, nid gyda'r gwasanaethau iechyd yn unig, ond gyda gwasanaethau addysg a hamdden. Er mwyn inni gyflwyno ffordd newydd o fyw i gyd-fynd â'r tai, rhaid datblygu partneriaethau.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys sawl pwynt y byddai Aelodau yn hoffi ymdrin â hwy, ond mae amser yn brin a rhaid imi ddirwyn i ben. Llongyfarchaf y pwylgor, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywiad yn rhoi sylw haeddiannol i'r adroddiad.

**David Lloyd:** Mae 9 y cant o gartrefi yng Nghymru mewn cyflwr anaddas, o'i gymharu â 7 y cant yn Lloegr. Adeiladwyd dros draean y tai yng Nghymru cyn 1919, ac mae 52 y cant o bobl hŷn yn byw mewn cartrefi a

review, therefore, is welcome, because poor housing equals poor health; it is one of the major determinants of ill health. Nowadays, people live longer and are, by and large, fitter in old age. With an increasing number of fitter older people wanting to maintain their independence, the Government needs to respond with innovative solutions, as demonstrated in this report. This could be done by guaranteed funding for care and repair schemes and by investing in intermediate care and assistive technology, so that older people can stay in their homes with peace of mind and independence. We also need to address the shortage of occupational therapists and physiotherapists in our communities, in order to provide the expert support that older people deserve and need.

We cannot talk about older people remaining in their homes without talking about council tax rebanding. I received a letter from a pensioner that accurately portrays the distress caused by the fact that the council tax demand is now well above the state pension. Much work needs to be done on many fronts to improve housing for older people. Let us turn the report's recommendations into reality.

**Catherine Thomas:** I was pleased to contribute to this review, and I thank Nigel Appleton, the committee's special adviser, for his guidance and expertise. I would also like to thank the committee's staff for their hard work.

This was a much needed review of an area of crucial importance. I take this opportunity to consider the consequences of living in housing that is inadequate and inappropriate, and why a holistic approach must be adopted in relation to older people's housing requirements. A scenario that we too often witness is that of older people living in accommodation that does not meet their needs. Consequently, they are forced to leave their homes when basic adaptation work could have enabled them to stay put. They often suffer the trauma of leaving their home when it could so easily have been avoided. Getting this aspect of housing need right is

adeiladwyd cyn 1919. Felly, croesewir yr adolygiad hwn gan fod tai gwael yn gyfystyr ag iechyd gwael; mae'n un o'r prif ffactorau sy'n achosi salwch. Yn yr oes sydd ohoni, mae pobl yn byw'n hwy ac, ar y cyfan, maent yn fwy iach yn eu henaint. Gyda nifer gynyddol o bobl hŷn, iachach yn awyddus i gadw eu hannibyniaeth, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ymateb mewn ffordd arloesol, fel y nodir yn yr adroddiad hwn. Gellid gwneud hyn drwy warantu cyllid i gynlluniau gofal a thrwsio a thrwy fuddsoddi mewn gofal canolradd a thechnoleg gynorthwyol, er mwyn i bobl hŷn allu aros yn eu cartrefi gyda thawelwch meddwl ac annibyniaeth. Mae angen inni hefyd ymdrin â phrinder therapyddion galwedigaethol a ffisiotherapyddion yn ein cymunedau, er mwyn darparu'r cymorth arbenigol y mae pobl hŷn yn ei haeddu ac y mae ei angen arnynt.

Ni allwn sôn am bobl hŷn yn aros yn eu cartrefi heb sôn am ailfandio'r dreth gyngor. Derbyniais lythyr gan bensiynwr sy'n disgrifio i'r dim y gofid a achosir gan yffaith bod bil y dreth gyngor bellach yn llawer uwch na phensiwn y wladwriaeth. Mae angen gwneud llawer o waith ar sawl tu i wella tai i bobl hŷn. Gadewch inni droi argymhellion yr adroddiad yn realiti.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr oedd yn bleser gennyl gyfrannu at yr adolygiad hwn, a diolchaf i Nigel Appleton, cyngorydd arbennig y pwylgor, am ei arweiniad a'i arbenigedd. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i staff y pwylgor am eu gwaith caled.

Yr oedd yr adolygiad hwn o faes hollbwysig yn un yr oedd dirfawr ei angen. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i ystyried canlyniadau byw mewn tai sy'n annigonol ac yn amhriodol, a pham mae'n rhaid inni feddu ar ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at ofynion tai pobl hŷn. Yn rhy aml, gwelwn bobl hŷn yn byw mewn tai nad ydynt yn diwallu eu hanghenion. O ganlyniad, maent yn gorfol gadael eu cartrefi er y gallai gwaith addasu sylfaenol fod wedi'u galluogi i aros yno. Yn aml, dioddefant y trawma o adael eu cartref lle y gellid bod wedi osgoi hynny yn hawdd. Mae cael yr agwedd hon ar anghenion tai yn iawn yn hollbwysig, oherwydd gallai methu â

vital, as getting it wrong can have major implications for an individual, for society as a whole and for key public services.

There is also the other scenario in which an older person, perhaps with restricted mobility, has to negotiate deep steps leading to his or her property. Installation of a ramp and handrail would make the situation so much easier and mean it was no longer comparable to an obstacle course. A stair lift is another resource that can make a difference.

However, for a wide range of reasons, individuals are too often not recognised as being in need of these adaptations, or have to wait a long time for their installation. It is extremely frustrating and upsetting when an older person falls, hurts himself or herself, and perhaps breaks a hip, leg or arm, when adaptation work could have prevented the accident from occurring.

Far too often when an older person is hospitalised under these circumstances, they do not return home. As I have said, this catastrophic domino effect could be avoided through early intervention, assessment and provision of adaptation works, and this point offers me a good opportunity to acknowledge and praise the work undertaken by Care and Repair Cymru, which plays a major role in taking forward the health, social care and wellbeing agenda. Through its service provision, Care and Repair Cymru helps to give older people peace of mind, addresses issues of home security and gives the individual options. One of the saddest realities facing older people is that their options are significantly reduced or are sometimes nil. That is unacceptable.

I sincerely hope that the recommendations in this review will be taken forward, as they hold the key to fundamental change in the right direction.

gwneud hynny arwain at oblygiadau sylweddol i unigolyn, i gymdeithas gyfan ac i wasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol.

Sefyllfa gyffredin arall yw'r un lle mae'n rhaid i berson hŷn, gyda symudedd cyfyngedig o bosibl, ddringo grisiau serth er mwyn cyrraedd ei dŷ. Byddai gosod ramp a chanllaw yn hwyluso'r sefyllfa ac yn golygu na fyddai bellach yn gwrs rhwystrau i'r unigolyn. Mae lifft grisiau yn adnodd arall a all wneud gwahaniaeth.

Fodd bynnag, am amrywiaeth eang o resymau, yn aml ni chydubyddir bod angen yr addasiadau hyn ar unigolion, neu mae'n rhaid iddynt aros am gyfnod hir cyn iddynt gael eu gwneud. Mae'n rhwystredig iawn ac yn achosi gofid mawr pan fydd person hŷn yn syrthio, yn brifo'i hun, ac efallai'n torri clun, coes neu fraich, lle y gallai gwaith addasu fod wedi atal y ddamwain rhag digwydd.

Yn rhy aml o lawer pan fydd person hŷn yn cael ei dderbyn i'r ysbty o dan amgylchiadau o'r fath, ni fyddant yn dychwelyd adref. Fel y dywedais, gellid osgoi'r effaith ddomino gatastroffig hon drwy ymyrryd yn gynnar, asesu anghenion a gwneud gwaith addasu, a manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i gydnabod a chanmol y gwaith a wneir gan Care and Repair Cymru, sy'n chwarae rhan bwysig wrth hybu'r agenda iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles. Drwy'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddi, mae Care and Repair Cymru yn helpu i roi tawelwch meddwl i bobl hŷn, yn ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch cartrefi ac yn rhoi dewisiadau i unigolion. Un o'r ffeithiau tristaf sy'n wynebu pobl hŷn yw'r ffaith bod y dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt yn lleihau'n sylweddol neu weithiau nad oes unrhyw ddewisiadau ar gael iddynt. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol.

Gobeithiaf yn fawr y caiff argymhellion yr adolygiad hwn eu rhoi ar waith, gan eu bod yn allweddol i sicrhau newid sylfaenol gan ein tywys ar hyd y llwybr cywir.

## Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends Plenary this afternoon until 6 p.m. at the latest.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am clear that this is not an abuse of Assembly procedure. Are there 10 Members in support of this procedural motion? I see that there are. We will therefore proceed to a vote.

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn estyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw hyd 6 p.m. fan bellaf.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn fodlon nad yw hyn yn gamddefnydd o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad. A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig trefniadol? Gwelaf fod 10 yn ei gefnogi. Awn felly at bleidlais.

*Cynnig: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Dai ar gyfer  
Pobl Hŷn: Parhad**  
**The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's Report on Housing for Older  
People: Continued**

**Eleanor Burnham:** I welcome this important report on housing for older people and the opportunity to take part in this debate. I strongly believe in the need to support older people who can, and choose to, live in their own homes in their communities. My early experience as a domiciliary care manager, and now of a mother of 87 who lives on her own in the wonderfully supportive community of Llandrillo in Denbighshire, continues to give me much heart. However, not everyone is as fortunate. The Welsh Assembly Government should continue to do its utmost to support older people in the community as per the various recommendations, which we do not have time to go into.

We, as a society, are indebted to a relatively small band of highly committed and caring employees, who are often under-appreciated, and certainly underpaid, who provide daily care for our older people in their homes. In a mature democracy of the twenty-first century, it is surely not too much to ask the previously hard-working members of our society to be afforded a choice to remain in their own homes and to resist being institutionalised. For that to happen, the Welsh Assembly Government needs to ensure that the local authorities can provide an adequate number of appropriate and affordable homes for older people in order to free up family homes—of which, according to certain housing associations, a shortage exists throughout Wales—to accommodate families.

5.00 p.m.

With the development of local health boards, there should be far better co-operation between housing, health and social care departments, but bedblocking still seems to be another major headache in the health service. It must be constructively tackled by the Welsh Assembly Government with

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad pwysig hwn ar dai i bobl hŷn a'r cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Credaf yn gryf fod angen cynorthwyo pobl hŷn sy'n dewis, ac yn gallu, byw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain yn eu cymunedau. Mae fy mhrofiad cynnar fel rheolwr gofal yn y cartref, a'm profiad o gael mam sy'n 87 oed ac sy'n byw ar ei phen ei hun yng nghymuned Llandrillo yn sir Ddinbych, lle y mae pobl yn helpu ei gilydd, yn parhau i'm calonogi. Fodd bynnag, nid pawb sydd mor ffodus. Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru barhau i wneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i gynorthwyo pobl hŷn yn y gymuned fel y nodir yn yr amrywiol argymhellion, nad oes gennym amser i'w trafod yn fanwl.

Mae ein dyled ni, fel cymdeithas, yn fawr i griw cymharol fach o gyflogeion gofalgars ac ymroddedig, nas gwerthfawrogir yn ddigonol yn aml ac yn sicr na chânt gyflogau digon mawr, sy'n rhoi gofal beunyddiol i'n pobl hŷn yn eu cartrefi. Mewn democratiaeth aeddfed yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, nid yw'n gofyn gormod i roi'r dewis i aelodau ein cymdeithas a fu'n gweithio'n galed drwy gydol eu hoes aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain yn hytrach na chael eu rhoi mewn sefydliad. Er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd, mae angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sierhau y gall awdurdodau lleol ddarparu digon o dai priodol a fforddiadwy i bobl hŷn er mwyn rhyddhau cartrefi teuluol—y mae prinder mawr ohonynt ledled Cymru, yn ôl rhai cymdeithasau tai—i deuluoedd.

Yn sgîl datblygu byrddau iechyd lleol, dylid gweld cydweithredu llawer gwell rhwng adrannau tai, iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ond ymddengys bod blocio gwelyau yn parhau'n broblem fawr arall i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r broblem mewn ffordd adeiladol drwy sierhau bod

adequate funding and a more constructive change of attitudes throughout the NHS to eradicate the often-present silo mentality so that homes can be properly used. Recommendation 6 states that the Welsh Assembly Government should continue to support and promote the excellent work of Care and Repair Cymru, which most of us have seen at first hand, to truly support older people's ability to maintain their homes and keep them safe and secure. On the other hand, I also agree with recommendations 18 and 19, which refer to sheltered housing, which is an important and appropriate alternative for many older people. However, as is often exemplified by case work, it is imperative to ensure that sheltered housing is well-managed by sensitive and caring people who recognise older people's specific needs. The key factor in housing for older people is appropriate and flexible provision, and I urge the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure adequate, affordable housing for our ever-increasing numbers of older people, and to take these recommendations on board. After all, Members, we will all be in that category sooner than some of us care to admit.

**Sandy Mewies:** I was also a member of this committee and I was pleased to take part in this debate. It was a cross-party debate and it was our top priority, which highlights the importance of this subject. The 26 recommendations, when implemented, will provide a strategy that will put older people at the centre of planning for services. It will encourage joint agency working and provide practical solutions, through, for example, Care and Repair Cymru, which works so hard in our communities, including in my own constituency of Delyn and in Flintshire generally. I hope that broader issues, such as help with garden maintenance, will also be supported. It is a tragedy that older people not only see their houses fall into disrepair, but become depressed because of high hedges and gardens with which they cannot cope.

I have referred previously to the shortage of occupational therapists. It is a longstanding problem, which is UK-wide, but which is particularly acute in Wales. That issue must

Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn darparu digon o arian ac yn datblygu agweddu newydd, mwy adeiladol drwy'r GIG cyfan er mwyn cael gwared ar y meddylfryd seilo sy'n gyffredin fel y gall cartrefi gael eu defnyddio mewn ffordd briodol. Noda argymhelliaid 6 y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru barhau i gefnogi a hyrwyddo gwaith ardderchog Care and Repair Cymru, y mae gan y rhan fwyaf ohonom brofiad personol ohono, i gynorthwyo pobl hŷn i gynnal a chadw eu cartrefi ac i'w cadw'n ddiogel. Ar y llaw arall, cytunaf hefyd ag argymhellion 18 ac 19, sy'n cyfeirio at dai gwarchod, sy'n ddewis amgen pwysig a phriodol i lawer o bobl hŷn. Fodd bynnag, mae gwaith achos yn aml yn dangos ei bod yn hanfodol sicrhau y caiff tai gwarchod eu rheoli'n briodol gan bobl sensitif a gofalgar sy'n cydnabod anghenion penodol pobl hŷn. Mae darpariaeth briodol a hyblyg yn ffactor allweddol wrth ystyried tai ar gyfer pobl hŷn, ac erfyniaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod tai digonol, fforddiadwy ar gael i'n niferoedd cynyddol o bobl hŷn, ac i ystyried yr argymhellion hyn. Wedi'r cyfan, Aelodau, bydd pob un ohonom yn rhan o'r categori hwnnw yn gynt nag yr hoffai rhai ohonom ei gyfaddef.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yr oeddwn i hefyd yn aelod o'r pwylgor hwn ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Yr oedd yn ddadl drawsbleidiol ac yr oedd ar frig ein hagenda, sy'n amlygu pwysigrwydd y pwnc hwn. Bydd y 26 o argymhellion, pan gânt eu gweithredu, yn darparu strategaeth a fydd yn rhoi pobl hŷn wrth wraidd y broses o gynllunio gwasanaethau. Bydd yn annog asiantaethau i gydweithio ac yn rhoi atebion ymarferol, drwy, er enghraifft, Care and Repair Cymru, sy'n gweithio mor galed yn ein cymunedau, sy'n cynnwys fy etholaeth i, sef Delyn, a sir y Fflint yn gyffredinol. Gobeithiaf y caiff materion ehangach, megis help i gynnal a chadw gerddi, hefyd eu cefnogi. Mae'n drasiedi bod pobl hŷn nid yn unig yn gweld eu tai yn dadfeilio, ond eu bod hefyd yn digaloni o weld cloddiau uchel a gerddi na allant ymdopi â hwy.

Cyfeiriai yn flaenorol at brinder therapyddion galwedigaethol. Mae'n broblem hirsefydledig sy'n effeithio ar bob cwr o'r DU, ond sy'n arbennig o ddifrifol yng

be addressed because of the vital services that those therapists provide. The report rightly asked the Welsh Assembly Government for solutions to make the best use of practitioners. One idea that we could consider is stopping the practice whereby two occupational therapists from different agencies will carry out assessments of the same person. Another is to provide a career structure, which will provide initial jobs, and a career ladder along which occupational therapists can progress. I endorse Age Concern's call to support the development of extra care housing and intermediate care, which is vital for those who have additional special needs, particularly people with dementia, Alzheimer's disease and so on. They can remain in the community and enjoy their lives, but they must have special support.

Time only allows me to mention a few other points. I was pleased at the recommendation to extend the review of the disabled facilities grant. Everybody who has been involved in local authorities knows that the demand always outstrips the cash available. I hope that we make urgent representations to the UK Government—if we have not done so already—to set VAT at its lowest level, and to ensure that our work to meet the needs of disabled people is not means tested. This report urges everyone involved with older people, from local authorities to health boards, to ensure that older people are enabled to live in their own homes with dignity and security. I urge the Welsh Assembly Government to take on board all these recommendations, but, in addition, to make adequate resource provision so that they can be carried out.

**Mark Isherwood:** We welcome this consensual report, to which we were able to contribute positively. Janice Gregory, as Chair of the committee, is to be complimented, as is my colleague, William Graham, on chairing the meeting that scrutinised and amended the draft report. However, delivery on the report's recommendations now lies with the Welsh Assembly Government, and I therefore urge it to acknowledge that we need joined-up

Nghymru. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno gan fod y therapyddion hynny yn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol. Gofynnodd yr adroddiad, a hynny'n gwbl priodol, i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am atebion a fyddai'n manteisio i'r eithaf ar wasanaethau ymarferwyr. Un syniad y gellid ei ystyried fyddai rhoi'r gorau i'r arfer lle y bydd dau therapydd galwedigaethol o wahanol asiantaethau yn asesu'r un person. Syniad arall yw sefydlu strwythur gyrrfa, a fydd yn cynnig swyddi cychwynnol ac ysgol yrfa y gall therapyddion galwedigaethol symud ar ei hyd. Cymeradwyaf gais Age Concern i gefnogi'r cynnig i ddatblygu tai gofal ychwanegol a gofal canolradd, sy'n hanfodol i'r rheini ag anghenion arbennig ychwanegol, yn enwedig pobl sy'n dioddef o ddemensia, clefyd Alzheimer ac yn y blaen. Gallant aros yn y gymuned a mwynhau eu bywydau, ond rhaid iddynt gael cymorth arbennig.

Oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser, ni allaf ond sôn am ychydig bwyntiau eraill. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf glywed yr argymhelliaid y dylid ehangu'r adolygiad o'r grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl. Gŵyr pawb a fu'n ymwneud ag awdurdodau lleol fod y galw bob amser yn fwy na'r arian sydd ar gael. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn cyflwyno sylwadau brys i Lywodraeth y DU—onid ydym wedi gwneud hynny eisoes—i bennu TAW ar ei lefel isaf, ac i sicrhau na chaiff ein gwaith i ddiwallu anghenion pobl anabl ei seilio ar brawf moddion. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn erfyn ar bawb sy'n ymwneud â phobl hŷn, o awdurdodau lleol i fyrrdau iechyd, i sicrhau y gall pobl hŷn fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain gydag urddas ac yn ddiogel. Erfyniaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ystyried yr holl argymhellion hyn, ond, yn ogystal, i sicrhau bod digon o adnoddau ar gael i'w rhoi ar waith.

**Mark Isherwood:** Croesawn yr adroddiad cydsyniol hwn, y bu inni gyfrannu iddo mewn ffordd gadarnhaol. Dylid canmol Janice Gregory, fel Cadeirydd y pwylgor, felly hefyd fy nghyd-Aelod, William Graham, am gadeirio'r cyfarfod a graffodd ar yr adroddiad drafft a'i ddiwygio. Fodd bynnag, gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awr yw rhoi argymhellion yr adroddiad ar waith, ac felly erfyniaf arni i gydnabod bod angen eu cyflwyno mewn

delivery, with local partnership roles delegated wherever practicable to best practice professionals in the voluntary and enterprise sectors.

Working with registered social landlords, and the public and private sectors, local housing strategies must address the role to be played by sheltered housing. I know that older people in sheltered accommodation seek independent living with security, and the knowledge that support and help will be available when they need it. However, I know from personal experience that they seek a voice in the management of their homes, and priority must be given in older people's forums and beyond to enabling older people to engage directly with their housing services.

We welcome the support of Care and Repair Cymru for the 26 recommendations in this report. However, the Welsh Assembly Government must now deliver on the report's acknowledgement of demographic changes and acceptance that Wales has an ageing population and an ageing housing stock. The Wales care strategy group report predicted a significant increase in the demand for care home and nursing care services over the next 17 years. If the Wanless report's recommendations to provide additional services to support individuals in the community are implemented, the amount by which the capacity of the care home sector will need to increase may be reduced, but they are unlikely to eliminate the need for growth altogether. How do we square that, and recommendations 23 and 25 of the report on care home closures and funding, with the reality that care homes are closing and care beds are being lost in their hundreds across Wales, with north Wales hit particularly hard?

Above all, we must heed the campaign of Ken Mack, who is based in Flintshire, which highlights the high and tragic incidence of early death among residents who are evicted through care home closures. No older person is expendable, and no life is a price worth paying for anybody's dogma about the private sector. Recommendation 13 of the report calls on the Welsh Assembly

ffordd gydgysylltiedig, gyda rolau partneriaeth leol yn cael eu dirprwyo lle bynnag y bo'n ymarferol i'r bobl broffesiynol â'r arferion gorau yn y sectorau gwirfoddol a menter.

Gan weithio gyda landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, a'r sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat, rhaid i strategaethau tai lleol ymdrin â'r rôl y mae angen i dai gwarchod ei chwarae. Gwn fod pobl hŷn mewn tai gwarchod yn awyddus i fyw'n annibynnol ac yn ddiogel, a chan wybod y bydd cefnogaeth a chymorth ar gael pan fydd eu hangen arnynt. Fodd bynnag, gwn o brofiad personol fod pobl hŷn am chwarae rhan wrth reoli eu cartrefi, a rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth mewn fforymau i bobl hŷn a thu hwnt i'w galluogi i gyfathrebu'n uniongyrchol â'u gwasanaethau tai.

Croesawn gefnogaeth Care and Repair Cymru i'r 26 o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn awr weithredu ar y ffaith bod yr adroddiad wedi cydnabod newidiadau demograffig ac wedi derbyn bod gan Gymru boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio a stoc tai sy'n heneiddio. Rhagwelodd adroddiad grŵp strategaeth gofal Cymru gynnydd sylweddol yn y galw am wasanaethau cartrefi gofal a gofal nyrso yn ystod y 17 mlynedd nesaf. Pe rhoddir argymhellion adroddiad Wanless i ddarparu gwasanaethau ychwanegol i gynorthwyo unigolion yn y gymuned ar waith, mae'n bosibl na fydd angen i gapasiti'r sector cartrefi gofal gynyddu cymaint, ond nid ydynt yn debygol o ddileu'r angen am dwf yn llwyr. Sut y gallwn gysoni hynny, ac argymhellion 23 a 25 yr adroddiad ar gau cartrefi gofal a'u hariannu, gyda'r ffaith bod cartrefi gofal yn cau a bod cannoedd o welyau gofal yn cael eu colli ledled Cymru, a hynny'n arbennig o wir yn y Gogledd?

Yn anad dim, rhaid inni wrando ar ymgyrch Ken Mack, sy'n byw yn sir y Fflint, sy'n amlygu niferoedd uchel a thrasig y marwolaethau cynnar ymhlið trigolion sy'n colli eu cartrefi pan gaiff cartrefi gofal eu cau. Mae pob person hŷn yn bwysig, ac nid yw unrhyw fywyd yn bris gwerth ei dalu am athrawiaeth unrhyw un am y sector preifat. Mae argymhelliad 13 yr adroddiad yn galw ar

Government to establish and fund a not-for-profit Welsh home improvement lending agency to provide essential home repair funding for financially excluded home owners. I therefore call on the Minister to give a true working partnership role to the Council of Mortgage Lenders on this matter. The council created and promoted this scheme, it will fund the loans, and its members alone have the innovative skills and expertise that the Welsh Assembly Government will need to draw upon for guidance. This is truly an example of ethical business in the community and real public-private partnership. We must build on this by reversing Welsh Labour housing cuts and empowering the voluntary not-for-profit—

Lwydodaeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu ac ariannu asiantaeth benthyciadau gwella cartrefi di-elw i Gymru i ddarparu cyllid hanfodol i drwsio cartrefi i berchnogion cartrefi sydd wedi'u hallgáu'n ariannol. Galwaf felly ar y Gweinidog i roi rôl bartneriaeth waith wirioneddol i'r Cyngor Benthyewyr Morgais yn hyn o beth. Y cyngor a greodd ac a hyrwyddodd y cynllun hwn ac a fydd yn ariannu'r benthyciadau, a dim ond ei aelodau sy'n meddu ar y sgiliau a'r arbenigedd arloesol y bydd eu hangen ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'w thywys. Mae hon yn enghraifft ardderchog o fusnes egwyddorol yn y gymuned a phartneriaeth cyhoeddus-prefat gwirioneddol. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar hyn drwy wyrdroi toriadau tai Llafur Cymru a grymuso'r sector gwirfoddol di-elw—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sorry, Mark, your time has run out unfortunately.

**Peter Black:** I welcome the report and endorse all the recommendations. An important principle that underpins this report is one that is also supported by Age Concern, that is, that the majority of older people wish to remain living in their own homes for as long as possible. Our job as politicians in the National Assembly for Wales, working with local government and all the other agencies involved, is to try to facilitate that as best as we can. This review recognises that principle by making recommendations relating to care adaptations and repair to enable that to happen.

The decision to properly fund Care and Repair Cymru was a vital step forward in terms of how the Assembly approaches this issue. That agency does important work in communities, and helps hundreds of people around Wales, and its work is to be commended. Recommendation 4 on an integrated community-based support service builds on that work and is an important step forward in trying to help people to remain in their homes. The key to tackling this problem always lies in the resources that are available, whether they are public or private sector resources. For example, the shortage of occupational therapists is contributing to

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Mark, mae eich amser wedi dirwyn i ben yn anffodus.

**Peter Black:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad a chymeradwyaf bob un o'r argymhellion. Mae un o'r egwyddorion pwysig sy'n sail i'r adroddiad hwn yn egwyddor a gefnogir hefyd gan Age Concern, sef bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl hŷn am barhau i fyw yn eu cartrefi eu hunain cyhyd â phosibl. Ein gwaith ni fel gwleidyddion yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithio gyda llywodraeth leol a'r holl asiantaethau eraill perthnasol, yw ceisio hwyluso hynny cymaint â phosibl. Mae'r adolygiad hwn yn cydnabod yr egwyddor honno drwy gyflwyno argymhellion sy'n ymwneud ag addasu a thrwsio cartrefi gofal i'w gwneud yn bosibl i hynny ddigwydd.

Yr oedd y penderfyniad i roi cyllid priodol i Care and Repair Cymru yn gam hanfodol ymlaen o ran ymateb y Cynulliad i'r mater hwn. Gwna'r asiantaeth honno waith pwysig mewn cymunedau, gan helpu cannoedd o bobl ledled Cymru, a rhaid cymeradwyo ei gwaith. Mae argymhelliad 4 ar wasanaeth cymorth integredig yn y gymuned yn adeiladu ar y gwaith hwnnw ac mae'n gam pwysig ymlaen wrth geisio helpu pobl i barhau i fyw yn eu cartrefi. Mae'r adnoddau sydd ar gael bob amser yn allweddol o ran mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, boed yn adnoddau yn y sector cyhoeddus neu breifat. Er enghraifft, mae prinder therapyddion

unacceptable waiting times for the disabled facilities grant. The fact that the budget for those grants was cut by £40 million last year, and again this year, also contributes to those waiting lists and stops people from carrying out necessary adaptations in good time so that they can try to remain in their homes. That must be addressed in some way as part of our review on older people.

Value added tax that penalises repairs is nonsense. If you want to carry out repairs on your property, you are penalised with 17.5 per cent VAT, but you do not have to pay VAT if you build on a greenfield site. This contributes to how we penalise people who want to stay in their homes and carry out essential repairs to make that home windproof and watertight and fit for them to live in.

The situation is most acute in the private sector. There is about a £1 billion backlog in the private sector in repair and maintenance, and most of those properties are occupied by older people. You will never have the grant money to be able to deal with that problem. Therefore, in this report we have looked at equity release. If we are to do that properly, we must have rapid progress on the Welsh home improvement lending agency to increase the tools available to tackle that backlog. Age Concern Cymru has recognised the importance of that agency, but it has also recognised that grants are the only option for many older people. We must ensure that the range of options available—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Again, sadly, time has run out.

5.10 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ategaf ddiolchiadau Janice Gregory i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at yr adroddiad hwn. Cefais i, fel Aelodau eraill, y faint o fod yn aelod o'r pwylgor wrth iddo baratoi yr adroddiad hwn, ac yr oedd yn brofiad buddiol, nid yn unig o ran y trafodaethau a llwyddo i wneud penderfyniadau yr oedd pawb yn gallu eu cefnogi, ond hefyd o ran y broses o fynd allan

galwedigaethol yn cyfrannu at amseroedd aros annerbyniol ar gyfer y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl. Mae'r ffaith i'r gyllideb ar gyfer y grantiau hynny gael ei chwtogi £40 miliwn y llynedd, ac eto eleni, hefyd yn cyfrannu at y rhestrau aros hynny ac yn rhwystro pobl rhag gwneud gwaith addasu angenrheidiol mewn da bryd er mwyn iddynt allu ceisio aros yn eu cartrefi. Rhaid ymdrin â hynny rywsut fel rhan o'n hadolygiad ar bobl hŷn.

Mae treth ar werth sy'n cosbi gwaith trwsio yn wirion. Os ydych am wneud gwaith trwsio ar eich eiddo, cewch eich cosbi gyda TAW o 17.5 y cant, ond nid oes rhaid i chi dalu TAW os byddwch yn adeiladu ar dir glas. Mae hyn yn cyfrannu at y ffordd yr ydym yn cosbi pobl sydd am aros yn eu cartrefi a gwneud gwaith trwsio hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod y cartref hwnnw yn ddiogel rhag y gwynt a'r glaw ac yn addas iddynt fyw ynddo.

Mae'r sefyllfa ar ei gwaethaf yn y sector preifat. Mae ôl-groniad o tua £1 biliwn yn y sector preifat o ran gwaith trwsio a chynnal a chadw, a phobl hŷn sy'n byw yn y rhan fwyaf o'r adeiladau hyn. Ni fydd byth ddigon o arian grant i allu ymdrin â'r broblem honno. Felly, yn yr adroddiad hwn, ystyriwyd rhyddhau ecwiti. Os gwnawn hynny yn iawn, rhaid inni sicrhau datblygiadau cyflym o ran yr asiantaeth benthiadau gwella cartrefi i Gymru er mwyn cynyddu'r gweithdrefnau sydd ar gael i fynd i'r afael â'r ôl-groniad hwnnw. Mae Age Concern Cymru wedi cydnabod pwysigrwydd yr asiantaeth honno, ond mae hefyd wedi cydnabod mai grantiau yw'r unig ddewis i lawer o bobl hŷn. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr amrywiaeth o ddewisiadau sydd ar gael—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Unwaith eto, yn anffodus, mae eich amser wedi dirwyn i ben.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I reiterate Janice Gregory's thanks to all who contributed to this report. I had the privilege, like other Members, of being a member of the committee as it prepared this report, and it was a positive experience, not only in terms of the discussions and our success in reaching conclusions that everyone could support, but also in terms of the process of going out and

a gweld y dystiolaeth drosom ein hunain. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ceisio sicrhau y caiff pob un o'r argymhellion hyn ei weithredu, ond rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith syml fod problemau mawr o'i blaen o ran eu gweithredu, beth bynnag am ei hewyllys da.

Mae angen mawr am yr argymhellion hyn, fel y dywed Age Concern Cymru wrthym. Bydd angen nid yn unig i ymgynghori â phobl hŷn, ond i sicrhau eu bod yn rhan o'r broses o lunio polisiau. Bydd hynny'n broblem fawr. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod ein poblogaeth yn heneiddio. Mae pobl yn byw llawer yn hwy a bydd llawer mwy o bobl yn y categori hwn yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny yn ddo ei hun yn her fawr i'r Gweinidog.

Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at yr angen i sicrhau bod mwy o therapyddion galwedigaethol ar gael, ond mae'r broblem llawer yn fwy na hynny. Un peth yw hyfforddi mwy o therapyddion galwedigaethol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gall y Gweinidog gyflawni hynny—ond peth arall yw creu swyddi ar eu cyfer yn yr awdurdodau lleol a sicrhau y bydd therapyddion a hyfforddir yma yn aros yng Nghymru, oherwydd mae'r pwysau arnynt lawer yn fwy yma nag ydyw mewn mannau eraill o'r DU. Felly, mae problemau ymarferol yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

Cyfeiriodd Peter Black at y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, sef cymhorthdal sy'n caniatâu i bobl ag anabledd addasu eu tai. Mae problem wirioneddol yn hyn o beth gan ei fod yn amrywio o sir i sir. Yn ddiweddar, clywais am rywun a symudodd o Wynedd i Gaerfyrddin, ac a oedd wedi derbyn darpariaeth llawer gwell yng Ngwynedd. O ran y sector gofal, mae gwaith mawr i'w wneud. Yr ydym yn colli 100 o welyau gofal bob mis. Collwyd 784 o welyau gofal rhwng Ebrill 2002 a Mawrth 2003. Yn olaf, dylem gefnogi ymgyrch Ken Mack yn Wrecsam, er ei bod yn ymarferol anodd i gyflawni'r hyn y mae'n gofyn amdano.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I wanted to say a few words in this debate, because I will, of course, formally respond to the committee's report in a written statement and

seeing the evidence first hand. I am confident that the Minister will try to ensure that every one of the recommendations is implemented, but we must face the simple fact that she faces major problems with regard to their implementation, regardless of her good intentions.

These are much-needed recommendations, as Age Concern Cymru told us. We will not only need to consult with older people, but ensure that they are part of the policy-making process. That will be a major problem. We must accept that our population is ageing. People live much longer and there will be many more people in this category in the future. That in itself is a great challenge for the Minister.

Reference has already been made to the need to ensure that more occupational therapists are available, but the problem is far greater than that. It is one thing to train more occupational therapists—and I am certain that the Minister can accomplish that—but it is quite another to create positions for them in the local authorities and to ensure that the therapists who are trained here stay in Wales, because the pressure on them is much greater here than is the case in other parts of the UK. Therefore, there are practical problems in that regard.

Peter Black referred to disabled facilities grants, which are grants that enable disabled people to adapt their homes. There is a real problem with this as the grant varies from authority to authority. I was told of a recent example of someone who had moved from Gwynedd to Carmarthen, and who had received much better provision in Gwynedd. With regard to the care sector, there is a huge amount of work to be done. We lose 100 care beds every month. A total of 784 care beds were lost between April 2002 and March 2003. Finally, we should support Ken Mack's campaign in Wrexham, even though it will be difficult in practical terms to realise his demands.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Yr oeddwn am ddweud ychydig eiriau yn y ddadl hon, gan y byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn ymateb yn ffurfiol i adroddiad y pwylgor

an oral statement. I welcome the work undertaken by the committee in this vast area of housing and older people, and it is important that we understand that this matter must be a key priority for Wales and the Assembly, particularly for us in the Welsh Assembly Government. I took the opportunity early on to discuss the committee report's recommendations with Jane Hutt, as there are close links with health, and I can assure Members that my response will take account of both of our portfolios and the work that will need to be undertaken jointly.

I am sorry that I did not participate in the committee's review—I have chosen, as a Minister, not to participate in committee reviews—because it looked like you had interesting discussions when you went out and about in Wales to meet various organisations. In this sector, I also echo the respect that we have for Care and Repair Cymru as an organisation, which we fund and which does excellent work across Wales. Most important in this debate is the older person. We have spoken about people who have rights and who want to say what they want to do with the rest of their lives. It is not about local government, central Government or anybody else telling them what is best for them. We must put in place the means by which older people can make decisions for themselves. I hope that I will respond in that manner to the report.

**Janice Gregory:** I am conscious of the amount of time left for the short debate, and Members will forgive me if I do not mention them by name in responding.

I start by thanking all Members for their contributions. Perhaps I am looking at it through rose-coloured glasses, but I think that we had unanimous acceptance of the report. That is a delight for members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, as we did a tremendous amount of work on this report. This deserved, and received, our attention.

I reiterate my thanks to the organisations that contributed to the information gathering that we did. We have thanked them. I also

mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig a datganiad llafar. Croesawaf y gwaith a wnaed gan y pwylgor yn y maes helaeth hwn, sef tai a phobl hŷn, ac mae'n bwysig inni ddeall bod yn rhaid i'r mater hwn fod yn flaenoriaeth allweddol i Gymru a'r Cynulliad, yn arbennig i ni yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Manteisias ar gyfle cynnar i drafod argymhellion adroddiad y pwylgor gyda Jane Hutt, gan fod cysylltiadau agos ag iechyd, a gallaf sicrhau'r Aelodau y bydd fy ymateb yn ystyried portffolios y ddwy ohonom a'r gwaith y bydd angen inni ei wneud ar y cyd.

Mae'n edifar gennyf na chymerais ran yn adolygiad y pwylgor—yr wyf wedi dewis, fel Gweinidog, i beidio â chymryd rhan mewn adolygiadau pwylgor—gan ei bod yn ymddangos ichi gael trafodaethau diddorol ar eich teithiau ledled Cymru i gyfarfod ag amrywiol sefydliadau. Yn y sector hwn, yr wyf fi hefyd ynadleisio'r parch sydd gennym tuag at Care and Repair Cymru fel sefydliad, a ariennir gennym ac sy'n gwneud gwaith ardderchog ledled Cymru. Elfen bwysicaf y ddadl hon yw'r person hŷn. Yr ydym wedi sôn am bobl sydd â hawliau ac sydd am ddweud sut y maent am fyw gweddill eu bywyd. Nid oes a wnelo â llywodraeth leol, Llywodraeth ganolog nac unrhyw un arall yn dweud wrthynt beth sydd orau iddynt. Rhaid inni roi systemau ar waith sy'n galluogi i bobl hŷn wneud penderfyniadau drostynt eu hunain. Gobeithiaf y byddaf yn ymateb i'r adroddiad yn yr ysbryd hwnnw.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o faint o amser sy'n weddill ar gyfer y ddadl fer, a gofynnaf i'r Aelodau faddau imi os nad ymatebaf iddynt yn ôl eu henwau.

Dechreuaaf drwy ddiolch i bob Aelod am eu cyfraniadau. Efallai fy mod yn edrych yn rhy obeithiol ar bopeth, ond credaf ein bod yn derbyn yr adroddiad yn unfrydol. Mae hynny'n rhoi pleser mawr i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, gan inni weithio'n galed iawn ar yr adroddiad hwn. Yr oedd yn haeddu ein sylw, ac fe gadodd hynny.

Diolch unwaith eto i'r sefydliadau a gyfrannodd at y wybodaeth a gasglwyd gennym. Yr ydym wedi diolch iddynt. Ategaf

reiterate what Members said about Care and Repair Cymru. The importance of this organisation's work, which allows people to remain in their own homes for as long as possible, came through time and again in all of the work that we did on this report. I cannot emphasise that enough: older people want to remain in their own homes for as long as they possibly can. They may have been married at a young age, especially in constituencies such as mine, and they may have had their children in that home, and they want to remain in it in their older years. Therefore, I applaud the work that Care and Repair Cymru does.

Rosemary is not here now; she has had to leave, but she is right that housing was not on the agenda. However, it is now firmly on the agenda of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, and I know that it is firmly on the Minister's agenda.

I have looked through the report, and I do not know whether I have missed it, but I cannot work out where council tax rebanding comes into it, so I will not go into any detail on that.

Members' comments have shown the size of the task that was before us. The Minister referred to that in her speech. It was a huge task, but, as a committee, we did it justice. The committee did not take the decision to make this our first policy review lightly. We gave it due consideration along with all the other issues in the social justice and regeneration portfolio, but we felt that this was the issue to consider, and I believe that the report reflects that.

I am pleased that Sandy mentioned the issue of dementia, because that was not mentioned in my speech or anyone else's. I believe that the good practice that we saw, and especially that I saw when I went to Northern Ireland, where there was a home devoted to people with dementia, should be a benchmark for us. We should aspire to that, because we can all cite, and we all know, people who suffer this most terrible of diseases.

hefyd yr hyn a ddywedodd Aelodau am Care and Repair Cymru. Tra'n llunio'r adroddiad hwn, clywyd dro ar ôl tro am bwysigrwydd gwaith y sefydliad hwn, sy'n galluogi pobl i aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain cyhyd â phosibl. Ni allaf bwysleisio hynny ddigon: mae pobl hŷn am aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain cyhyd â phosibl. Efallai eu bod wedi priodi yn ifanc, yn arbennig mewn etholaethau fel fy un i, ac efallai eu bod wedi magu plant yn y cartref hwnnw, a'u bod am aros ynddo wrth iddynt heneiddio. Felly, cymeradwyaf waith Care and Repair Cymru.

Nid yw Rosemary yma yn awr; bu'n rhaid iddi adael, ond mae'n llygad ei lle nad oedd tai ar yr agenda. Fodd bynnag, mae bellach wedi'i wreiddio'n gadarn ar agenda'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a gwn ei fod yn gadarn ar agenda'r Gweinidog.

Edrychais drwy'r adroddiad, ac ni wn pa un a wyf wedi'i golli, ond ni allaf weld lle y caiff ailfandio'r dreth gyngor ei gynnwys, felly nid af i unrhyw fanylion yn hynny o beth.

Mae sylwadau Aelodau wedi dangos maint y dasg a oedd yn ein hwynebu. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at hynny yn ei haraith. Yr oedd yn dasg enfawr, ond, fel pwyllgor, gwnaethom gyflawnder â hi. Nid ar chwarae bach y gwnaeth y pwyllgor y penderfyniad i gynnal ein hadolygiad polisi cyntaf yn y maes hwn. Rhoddwyd ystyriaeth ddyledus i'r mater hwn, ynghyd â'r holl faterion eraill sy'n rhan o'r portffolio cyflawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, ond yr oeddem o'r farn mai dyma oedd y mater i'w ystyried, a chredaf fod yr adroddiad yn adlewyrchu hynny.

Yr wyf yn falch i Sandy sôn am ddemensia, am na soniwyd amdano yn fy arraith i nac yn arraith unrhyw un arall. Credaf y dylai'r arfer da a welsom, ac yn arbennig yr hyn a welais i ar fy ymwelliad â Gogledd Iwerddon, lle yr oedd cartref yn arbennig ar gyfer pobl â demensia, weithredu fel meinchnod ar ein cyfer. Dylem anelu at hynny, gan y gall pob un ohonom enwi pobl sy'n dioddef o'r afiechyd mwyaf echrydus hwn, a bod pob un

ohonom yn adnabod rhywun felly.

I thank you all once again, and I thank everyone who contributed to the review. I hope that Members will support the recommendations. Diolchaf i bob un ohonoch unwaith eto, a diolchaf i bawb a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cefnogi'r argymhellion.

*Cynnig (NDM2106): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2106): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### **‘Rhywun i Droi Ato’—Gwrando ar Blant a Phobl Ifanc ‘Someone to Turn To’—Listening to Children and Young People**

**Christine Chapman:** Kirsty Williams, Denise Idris Jones, Laura Anne Jones and Dai Lloyd have requested time to speak in this debate.

When a teacher found that Abby, and that is not her real name, was self-harming, she was referred to a counsellor of the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children. Abby's mother had abandoned her when she was 14, and, in her own words,

‘when it happened, social workers came to see me to check on my situation. But whenever they came, my mum found out and turned up and said she lived with me. I couldn't dare contradict my mother. Even before she left she was hardly ever there. From the time my dad left when I was six, she was always out with a lot of different men. She had her own life and wanted to live it. It was hard to mess with my mum—she would drink a lot and used to hit me until my fifteenth birthday’.

5.20 p.m.

Having abandoned Abby, her mother used to drop money through the letterbox occasionally. Not being able to talk to someone about what was happening to her made it hard to cope. I quote Abby again:

‘When I started seeing the NSPCC counsellor things really started to look up. I am not cutting myself anymore and I'm lots more confident’.

Finally having someone to turn to at a vulnerable time in her life perhaps made Abby more fortunate than many young people in similar situations. However, sadly, far too many children and young people are still unable to achieve their potential in life

**Christine Chapman:** Mae Kirsty Williams, Denise Idris Jones, Laura Anne Jones a Dai Lloyd wedi gofyn am amser i siarad yn y ddadl hon.

Pan ddarganfu athro fod Abby, ac nid dyna ei henw iawn, yn niweidio ei hun, fe'i cyfeiriwyd at un o gwnsleriaid y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant (NSPCC). Yr oedd mam Abby wedi ei gadael pan oedd yn 14 mlwydd oed ac, yn ei geiriau ei hun,

pan ddigwyddodd hyn, daeth gweithwyr cymdeithasol i'm gweld i asesu fy sefyllfa. Ond bob tro yr oeddent yn dod, byddai fy mam yn dod i wybod ac yn dod i'r tŷ ac yn dweud ei bod yn byw gyda mi. Nid oeddwn am fentro gwrth-ddweud fy mam. Hyd yn oed cyn iddiadael prin ei bod yno. O'r adeg pan adawodd fy nhad pan oeddwn yn chwe blwydd oed, yr oedd allan gyda llawer o ddynion gwahanol drwy'r amser. Yr oedd ganddi ei bywyd ei hun ac yr oedd am ei fyw. Yr oedd yn anodd dadlau gyda mam – byddai'n yfed llawer ac yr oedd yn fy mwrw hyd at fy mhen-blwydd yn 15 mlwydd oed.

Ar ôl gadael Abby, byddai ei mam yn rhoi arian iddi drwy'r blwch llythyrau weithiau. Yr oedd methu â siarad â rhywun am yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd iddi yn ei gwneud yn anodd i ymdopi. Dywedodd Abby hefyd:

Pan ddechreuais weld cwnsler yr NSPCC dechreuodd pethau wella. Nid wyf yn niweidio fy hun mwyach ac yr wyf yn llawer mwy hyderus.

Efallai fod cael rhywun i droi ato o'r diwedd ar adeg yn ei bywyd pan oedd yn ddiamdiffyn wedi golygu bod Abby yn fwy ffodus na llawer o bobl ifanc mewn sefyllfaoedd tebyg. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, mae llawer gormod o blant a phobl

because of emotional and psychological problems. Without support they may become demotivated and disaffected, putting their self-esteem and confidence at risk. By failing to listen and take the concerns and worries of children and young people seriously, we are failing them.

A survey recently carried out by the NSPCC Cymru/Wales at the Urdd Eisteddfod in Ynys Môn revealed that young people worry about many things. Anxieties expressed by those who completed the questionnaire included worries over weight, people dying, schoolwork, bullying, war and parents falling out, to name but a few. Other issues also affect them. Children and young people are often the forgotten victims of domestic abuse. Such young people need to be able to talk about their experiences as, too often, they are left feeling isolated by the behaviour that they are experiencing at home.

The tragic story of Laura Rhodes, the young schoolgirl from Neath who committed suicide after apparently suffering from bullying at school, highlighted how much more must be done to provide support for vulnerable children whose daily lives become unbearable. I applaud the Welsh Assembly Government's work on bullying, but I do not think that we are there yet, and much more needs to be done to tackle bullying.

This autumn, the NSPCC will embark on the latest phase of its 'Someone to Turn To' campaign. Research has shown that children and young people who suffer from abuse, bullying and violence may bottle things up and be hesitant to share their problems. The campaign urges children and young people to talk to someone if they are worried, and informs them of sources of advice and support provided by a range of organisations and groups. The campaign is also about mobilising the whole of society, because child protection is everyone's responsibility. Members of the public, for example, can play a part in the initiative by donating money, fundraising and campaigning on the NSPCC's behalf. The NSPCC is calling for independent school-based counselling

ifanc yn methu â chyflawni eu potensial mewn bywyd o hyd oherwydd problemau emosiynol a seicolegol. Heb gymorth efallai y byddant yn colli eu cymhelliant ac yn mynd yn anfoddog, gan beryglu eu hunan-barch a'u hyder. Drwy beidio â gwrando ar bryderon plant a phobl ifanc a'u cymryd o ddifrif, yr ydym yn methu â rhoi cymorth iddynt.

Datgelodd arolwg a gynhaliwyd yn ddiweddar gan NSPCC Cymru yn Eisteddfod yr Urdd ar Ynys Môn fod pobl ifanc yn poeni am lawer o bethau. Ymhllith y pryderon a nodwyd gan y rhai a gwblhaodd yr holiadur yr oedd pryderon am eu pwysau, pobl yn marw, gwaith ysgol, bwlio, rhyfel a rhieni yn ffraeo, i enwi ond ychydig. Mae materion eraill yn effeithio arnynt hefyd. Yn aml plant a phobl ifanc yw'r dioddefwyr sy'n cael eu hanghofio mewn achos o gam-drin yn y cartref. Mae angen i bobl ifanc o'r fath gael cyfle i siarad am eu profiadau oherwydd, yn rhy aml, maent yn teimlo'n unig oherwydd yr ymddygiad y maent yn ei wynebu yn y cartref.

Mae stori drasig Laura Rhodes, y ferch ysgol ifanc o Gastell-nedd a laddodd ei hun ar ôl cael ei bwlio yn yr ysgol yn ôl pob tebyg, wedi amlygu bod angen gwneud llawer mwy i gynorthwyo plant diamdiffyn y mae eu bywydau pob dydd yn annioddefol. Cymeradwyaf waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar fwlio, ond ni chredaf fod ein gwaith ar ben eto, ac mae angen gwneud llawer mwy i fynd i'r afael â bwlio.

Yn ystod yr hydref eleni, bydd yr NSPCC yn dechrau ar gam diweddaraf ei hymgyrch 'Rhywun i Droi Ato'. Mae ymchwil wedi dangos y gall plant a phobl ifanc sy'n cael eu cam-drin, eu bwlio ac sy'n dioddef trais fygu eu teimladau a bod yn amharod i rannu eu problemau. Mae'r ymgyrch yn annog plant a phobl ifanc i siarad â rhywun os ydynt yn poeni am rywbeth, ac yn eu hysbysu am ffynonellau cyngor a chymorth sydd ar gael gan amrywiaeth o sefydliadau a grwpiau. Mae'r ymgyrch hefyd yn ymwneud â sbarduno'r gymdeithas gyfan, oherwydd mae amddiffyn plant yn ddyletswydd ar bawb. Gall aelodau o'r cyhoedd, er enghraifft, chwarae rhan yn y fenter drwy roi arian, codi arian ac ymgyrchu ar ran yr NSPCC. Mae'r NSPCC yn galw am ddarparu gwasanaethau

services to be available for all children to ensure that they get the support that they need to reach their full potential, which is not currently the case.

Counselling should involve not just the child but parents, friends and teachers. Taking such a holistic approach was key to the success of the Wrexham schools counselling team. This project, which has been in existence since 1996, works across the primary and secondary sector. Children and young people are able to self-refer to the independent counsellor in their schools, and referrals are also taken from teachers, parents and other professionals. The project provides counselling group work and workshops and helps schools to establish peer support programmes with pupils.

The Urdd survey demonstrated that many children, nearly three quarters of the respondents, would prefer to turn to a friend—someone they know, who is close to them and, vitally, whom they trust. As such, the NSPCC feels that peer support schemes are of prime importance. Children and young people are trained and recruited so that they can offer support to their peers.

Children and young people are our future. How we nurture them now can have a long-lasting impact on the next generation. If young people such as Abby are to look forward to a more settled future, the Government must look to providing independent listening services for children and young people that will make them feel confident that their worries are being listened to, believed and acted upon where necessary. All children, and not just a few, should have that right.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank Christine for bringing the issue of the rights and welfare of children and young people to the Assembly's attention, as she has done on many occasions. You should be congratulated on your continued work in this area; I know that it is appreciated by all Members. I look forward to joining the NSPCC next month in

cwnsela annibynnol mewn ysgolion i bob plentyn er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt i gyflawni eu potensial llawn, rhywbeth nad yw'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Dylai'r broses gwnsela gynnwys rhieni, ffrindiau ac athrawon yn ogystal â'r plentyn. Yr oedd cymryd ymagwedd gyfannol o'r fath yn allweddol i lwyddiant tîm cwnsela ysgolion Wrecsam. Mae'r prosiect hwn, sydd wedi bodoli ers 1996, yn gweithio ar draws y sector cynradd ac uwchradd. Gall plant a phobl ifanc gyfeirio eu hunain i'w cwnsler annibynnol yn eu hysgolion, a derbynir cyfeiriadau hefyd oddi wrth athrawon, rhieni a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill. Mae'r prosiect yn darparu gwaith grŵp a gweithdai cwnsela ac mae'n helpu ysgolion i sefydlu rhagleni cymorth cyfoedion gyda disgylion.

Dangosodd arolwg yr Urdd fod yn well gan lawer o blant, bron tri chwarter yr ymatebwyr, droi at ffrind – rhywun y maent yn ei adnabod, sy'n agos iddynt ac, yn hollbwysig, y maent yn ymddiried ynddo. Fel y cyfryw, mae'r NSPCC o'r farn bod cynlluniau cymorth cyfoedion yn hollbwysig. Caiff plant a phobl ifanc eu hyfforddi a'u reciwtio er mwyn iddynt allu cynnig cymorth i'w cyfoedion.

Plant a phobl ifanc yw ein dyfodol. Gall y ffordd yr ydym yn eu meithrin yn awr gael effaith hirdymor ar y genhedlaeth nesaf. Os yw pobl ifanc fel Abby i edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol mwy sefydlog, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth geisio darparu gwasanaethau gwrando annibynnol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc a fydd yn gwneud iddynt deimlo'n hyderus bod rhywun yn gwrando arnynt, yn credu ynddynt a bod camau gweithredu yn cael eu cymryd lle y bo angen. Dylai pob plentyn, ac nid dim ond yr ychydig rai, gael yr hawl honno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Christine am dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at fater hawliau a lles plant a phobl ifanc, fel y mae wedi gwneud ar sawl achlysur. Dylid eich llongyfarch am eich gwaith parhaus yn y maes hwn; gwn fod pob Aelod yn ei werthfawrogi. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymuno â'r NSPCC y mis nesaf i hyrwyddo'r ymgyrch

promoting this campaign in my constituency. I sometimes feel that children and young people in rural areas have additional issues and barriers to seeking support because of the nature of the communities in which they live. Everyone knows everyone, and finding someone to speak to in confidence can often be difficult. Accessing services can also be problematic if public transport is not available to take you to a particular venue. I am delighted that the Welsh Liberal Democrats, at our last conference, committed to the call for independent counselling services for all schoolchildren in Wales. I look forward to working with like-minded colleagues, such as Christine, to see what we can do following this debate, which is timely considering the comments made during the Clywch inquiry debate last week.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I also applaud Christine for choosing this subject for her short debate. On 1 December, I will host an NSPCC reception at the Assembly to celebrate the fifth anniversary of the NSPCC's bilingual helpline set up in Bangor. I speak regularly with the volunteers who man the helpline, and know that many of the problems that young people in Wales have relate to bullying. I am a former teacher, and there was a strong bullying policy at the school where I taught, which we attempted to adhere to as much as possible. However, the bullying continued. It caused misery for pupils, and still does. I agree with Christine that the best answer is peer support schemes, whereby pupils help and support other pupils. A desperate person needs someone to listen to them and to help them to raise their self-esteem. It is not easy for children to admit to their parents that the world is against them. To be bullied means that you are different, and that is the last thing that a young person wants. We live in a society where young people want to look and dress the same. Bullying is and will be a huge concern. I am glad that there is an NSPCC helpline in my constituency, and I am grateful to those people on the end of the phone who are willing to listen and to offer advice to others in their preferred language.

hon yn fy etholaeth. Weithiau teimlaf fod gan blant a phobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig broblemau a rhwystrau ychwanegol i ddod o hyd i gymorth oherwydd natur y cymunedau y maent yn byw yn dyddyd. Mae pawb yn adnabod pawb, a gall dod o hyd i rywun i siarad â hwy yn gyfrinachol fod yn anodd yn aml. Hefyd gall cael gafael ar wasanaethau fod yn broblematig os nad oes trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus ar gael i fynd â chi i leoliad arbennig. Yr wyf yn falch bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yn ein cynhadledd ddiwethaf, wedi ymrwymo i alw am wasanaethau cwnsela annibynnol ar gyfer pob plentyn ysgol yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gyda chyd-Aelodau sydd o'r un farn, fel Christine, i weld beth allwn ei wneud yn dilyn y ddadl hon, sy'n amserol o ystyried y sylwadau a wnaed yn ystod dadl ymchwiliad Clywch yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Cymeradwyaf Christine hefyd am ddewis y pwnc hwn ar gyfer ei dadl fer. Ar 1 Rhagfyr, byddaf yn cynnal derbyniad NSPCC yn y Cynulliad i ddathlu pum mlynedd ers lansio llinell gymorth ddwyieithog yr NSPCC ym Mangor. Yr wyf yn siarad â'r gwirfoddolwyr sy'n rhedeg y llinell gymorth yn rheolaidd, a gwn fod llawer o'r problemau sydd gan bobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn gysylltiedig â bwlio. Yr wyf yn gyn-athrawes, ac yr oedd gan yr ysgol lle yr oeddwn yn athrawes bolisi bwlio cryf, ac yr oeddem yn ceisio glynw ato gymaint â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y bwlio yn parhau. Parodd ofid ymhlið disgyblion, ac mae'n parhau i wneud hynny. Cytunaf â Christine mai'r ateb gorau yw cynlluniau cymorth cyfoedion, lle y mae disgyblion yn helpu ac yn cynorthwyo disgyblion eraill. Mae angen i berson mewn sefyllfa anobeithiol gael rhywun i wrando arno a'i helpu i godi ei hunan-barch. Nid yw'n hawdd i blant gyfaddef i'w rhieni bod y byd yn eu herbyn. Mae'r ffaith bod rhywun yn cael ei fwlio yn golygu ei fod yn wahanol, a dyna'r peth diwethaf y mae person ifanc yn ei ddymuno. Yr ydym yn byw mewn cymdeithas lle y mae pobl ifanc am edrych a gwisgo yr un fath. Mae bwlian yn bryder mawr a bydd yn parhau felly. Yr wyf yn falch bod llinell gymorth NSPCC yn fy etholaeth, ac yr wyf yn falch bod y bobl hynny ar ben arall y ffôn yn barod i wrando a chynnig cymorth i eraill yn eu dewis iaith.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I also thank Christine Chapman for bringing forward this important debate, and agree with all the comments made thus far. Listening should be simple, but listening to children means paying attention to what they say and encouraging them to share their thoughts and feelings. That is one of the main pieces of advice provided by the NSPCC, which exists to prevent child abuse. It states that parents who cannot communicate well are more likely to resort to smacking and hitting. Children who are never listened to properly will grow up feeling that the important adults in their lives are not interested in them, which leads to low self-esteem. Communication is vital in preventing child abuse. Being listened to is one of the basic needs of children, as it develops trust. I was fortunate to meet representatives from NSPCC Wales yesterday, and I was extremely impressed by the service that it provides for children in Wales. One project is based on the Gurnos estate at the Busy Bee centre, where residents are given the opportunity to seek advice and to talk to NSPCC staff who provide a valuable support service. Services such as these are essential in today's society, in which the stresses of modern life have led to an increase in the number of children suffering from mental health problems. More than a third of children in Wales experience some form of mental anxiety. The NSPCC shows parents, teachers and all those who interact with children how to spot important signs and how to react. I found yesterday's meeting extremely positive. The NSPCC has an excellent interactive website for children who are being abused, which is invaluable for those who are not brave enough to tell someone about their problems.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Laura, you have had a minute and a half. Sorry about that, but these contributions are supposed to be short.

5.30 p.m.

**David Lloyd:** I congratulate Christine Chapman on choosing a vital subject for debate. Bullying and self-harm are increasingly becoming an issue. I ask the

**Laura Anne Jones:** Hoffwn innau hefyd ddiolch i Christine Chapman am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon, a chytunaf â'r holl sylwadau a wnaethpwyd hyd yn hyn. Dylai gwrando fod yn syml, ond mae gwrando ar blant yn golygu talu sylw i'r hyn y maent yn ei ddweud a'u hannog i rannu eu meddyliau a'u teimladau. Dyna un o'r prif gynghorion a roddir gan yr NSPCC, sy'n bodoli i atal cam-drin plant. Noda fod rhieni na allant gyfathrebu'n dda yn debycach o fwrw eu plant. Bydd plant nad oes neb byth yn gwrando arnynt yn iawn yn tyfu i fyny yn teimlo nad oes gan yr oedolion pwysig yn eu bywydau ddiddordeb ynddynt, sy'n arwain at hunan-barch isel. Mae cyfathrebu yn hanfodol i atal cam-drin plant. Mae cael rhywun i wrando arnynt yn un o anghenion sylfaenol plant, oherwydd mae'n meithrin ymddiriedaeth. Yr oeddwn yn ffodus i gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr o NSPCC Cymru ddoe, a gwnaeth y gwasanaeth y mae'n ei ddarparu i blant yng Nghymru argraff fawr arnaf. Ceir un prosiect ar ystad y Gurnos yng nghanolfan Busy Bee, lle y rhoddir cyfle i'r trigolion gael cyngor a siarad â staff yr NSPCC sy'n darparu gwasanaeth cymorth gwerthfawr. Mae gwasanaethau o'r fath yn hanfodol yn y gymdeithas sydd ohoni, lle y mae straen bywyd modern wedi arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y plant sy'n dioddef problemau iechyd meddwl. Mae mwy na thraean o blant yng Nghymru yn dioddef gyda rhyw fath o ofid meddwl. Mae'r NSPCC yn dangos i rieni, athrawon a phawb sy'n rhngweithio â phlant sut i adnabod yr arwyddion pwysig a sut i ymateb. Yn fy marn i, yr oedd y cyfarfod ddoe yn gadarnhaol iawn. Mae gan yr NSPCC wefan ryngweithiol ardderchog i blant sy'n cael eu cam-drin, sy'n werthfawr iawn i'r rhai nad ydynt yn ddigon dewr i ddweud wrth rywun am eu problemau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Laura, yr ydych wedi cael munud a hanner. Mae'n ddrwg gennylf am hynny, ond mae'r cyfraniadau hyn i fod yn fyr.

**David Lloyd:** Hoffwn longyfarch Christine Chapman am ddewis pwnc hollbwysig ar gyfer y ddadl. Mae bwlian a hunan-niwed yn mynd yn broblem gynyddol. Gofynnaf i'r

Minister to guarantee secure funding for New Pathways, the excellent abuse counselling service in Merthyr Tydfil, which I have visited a few times. It is a vital service for young people from all parts of south Wales.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank Christine for outlining how the NSPCC's proposals on child protection and listening to children form part of its ongoing Full Stop campaign to end cruelty to children. I also thank other Members for their contributions. Protecting children is a matter for everyone, and we all have a duty to report any concerns that we may have about the welfare and safety of a child. This debate, and the NSPCC report, takes us forward with regard to the wider perspective of listening to children, and opening ourselves up as adults so that they can turn to us and trust us. As Denise said, it is key that children and young people can also turn to and trust their peers. The websites, helplines and projects mentioned today, which are innovative and which address these issues, are leading the way. I am delighted, as the Minister with responsibility for the health and wellbeing of children, to be able to respond to and endorse the proposals in the NSPCC report.

The Children Bill brings with it new opportunities, because it will result in changes in policy and legislation in Wales to maximise opportunities and minimise risks for all children and young people. We will be able to ensure that services are focused universally and more effectively on the needs of children, young people and families. The Bill places responsibility on key agencies to have regard to safeguarding children and promoting their welfare in exercising their normal functions. Attending school is part of this, which is why education is key. We will replace the area child protection committees with the new statutory local safeguarding children boards. This will give authorities clout and give backing to the multi-agency groups with responsibilities in this regard.

Gweinidog sicrhau arian diogel ar gyfer Llwybrau Newydd, y gwasanaeth cwnsela ardderchog ym Merthyr Tudful i'r rhai sydd wedi cael eu cam-drin, yr wyf wedi ymweld ag ef sawl gwaith. Mae'n wasanaeth hanfodol i bobl ifanc o bob cwr o dde Cymru.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Hoffwn ddiolch i Christine am amlinellu sut y mae cynigion yr NSPCC ar gyfer amddiffyn plant a gwrando ar blant yn rhan o'i hymgyrch Full Stop sy'n mynd rhagddi i roi diwedd ar greulondeb i blant. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Aelodau eraill am eu cyfraniadau. Mae amddiffyn plant yn fater i bawb, ac mae gan bob un ohonom ddyletswydd i leisio unrhyw bryderon a all fod gennym yngylch lles a diogelwch plentyn. Mae'r ddadl hon, ac adroddiad yr NSPCC, yn ein symud ymlaen o ran y perspectif ehangach o wrando ar blant, a bod yn agored fel oedolion er mwyn iddynt allu troi atom ac ymddiried ynom. Fel dywedodd Denise, mae'n allweddol bod plant a phobl ifanc hefyd yn gallu troi at eu cyfoedion ac ymddiried ynddynt. Mae'r gwefannau, y llinellau cymorth a'r prosiectau a grybwyllyd heddiw, sy'n arloesol ac sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn, yn arwain y ffordd. Yr wyf yn falch, fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am iechyd a lles plant, fy mod yn gallu ymateb i'r cynigion yn adroddiad yr NSPCC a'u cymeradwyo.

Mae'r Mesur Plant yn cyflwyno cyfleoedd newydd, oherwydd bydd yn arwain at newidiadau i bolisiau a deddfwriaeth yng Nghymru er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar gyfleoedd a lleihau'r risgau sy'n wynebu pob plentyn a pherson ifanc. Byddwn yn gallu sicrhau bod gwasanaethau yn canolbwytio'n gyffredinol ac yn fwy effeithiol ar anghenion plant, pobl ifanc a theuluoedd. Mae'r Mesur yn gosod cyfrifoldeb ar asiantaethau allweddol i ystyried diogelu plant a hyrwyddo eu lles wrth arfer eu swyddogaethau arferol. Mae mynchu'r ysgol yn rhan o hyn, sef y rheswm pam mae addysg yn allweddol. Bydd byrddau diogelu plant lleol statudol newydd yn disodli'r pwylgorau amddiffyn plant ardal. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau ddylanwad ac yn rhoi cefnogaeth i'r grwpiau aml-asiantaeth â chyfrifoldebau yn hyn o beth.

It is good and right that the NSPCC report recognises the role of the Children's Commissioner for Wales in providing children and young people with someone to talk to and someone who will take their concerns seriously. When people ask me about the achievements of the children's commissioner and what his role has meant in the past few years, I tell them that one of the most important aspects is the fact that his office exists, because while children may feel that they cannot talk to the commissioner personally, they know that the office exists and that they can take their concerns there. The rest of the UK is following suit in establishing children's commissioners.

The importance of independent advocacy is conveyed in the NSPCC report. We are committed to ensuring that listening and responding to children and young people is part of everyday practice. Independent advocacy is key to this. Since June, children in need have had a statutory right to an independent advocate when raising concerns or making a complaint. Our aim is to extend access to advocacy services to all children and young people in health, social care and education settings. Christine outlined a powerful case study of someone who was clearly excluded and neglected. We find that many children who may think that their circumstances are reasonably protected are suffering from pain, distress and abuse. We need to reach out to all children and young people. A task group has been set up to report on the future development of advocacy in Wales, in order to provide a universal service for all children. The NSPCC is represented on this group.

Many Members have referred to the provision of independent counselling through schools. Children's education is a part of everyday life, and this service could be key. Many young people face social and emotional problems that can affect their educational achievements, experiences and opportunities. Such needs and situations can be overwhelming, as Denise described from her experience as a former teacher. Counselling can play an important role in

Mae'n briodol bod adroddiad yr NSPCC yn cydnabod rôl Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn y gwaith o sicrhau bod gan blant a phobl ifanc rywun i siarad â hwy a rywun a fydd yn cymryd eu pryderon o ddifrif. Pan fydd pobl yn gofyn imi am gyflawniadau'r comisiynydd plant a beth mae ei rôl wedi ei olygu yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, dywedaf wrthynt mai un o'r agweddau pwysicaf yw'r ffaith bod ei swyddfa yn bodoli, oherwydd er y gall plant deimlo na allant siarad â'r comisiynydd yn bersonol, maent yn gwybod bod y swyddfa yn bodoli ac y gallant leisio eu pryderon yno. Mae gweddill y DU yn dilyn yr esiampl hon drwy sefydlu comisiynwyr plant.

Cyflêir pwysigrwydd eiriolaeth annibynnol yn adroddiad yr NSPCC. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod gwrando ar blant a phobl ifanc ac ymateb iddynt yn rhan o arfer pob dydd. Mae eiriolaeth annibynnol yn allweddol i hyn. Ers mis Mehefin, mae gan blant mewn angen hawl statudol i gael eiriolwr annibynnol wrth leisio pryderon neu wneud cwyn. Ein nod yw sicrhau bod gwasanaethau eiriolaeth ym meysydd iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg ar gael i bob plentyn neu berson ifanc. Amlinellodd Christine astudiaeth achos bwerus o rywun a oedd wedi'i allgáu a'i esgeulus. Canfyddwn fod llawer o blant sy'n credu bod eu hamgylchiadau wedi'u diogelu'n rhesymol yn dioddef poen, gofid ac yn cael eu camdrin. Mae angen inni helpu pob plentyn a pherson ifanc. Sefydlwyd grŵp gorchwyl i gyflwyno adroddiadau ar ddatblygiad eiriolaeth yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth cyffredinol ar gyfer plant. Cynrychiolir yr NSPCC ar y grŵp hwn.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at ddarpariaeth gwasanaeth cwnsela annibynnol drwy ysgolion. Mae addysg plant yn rhan o fywyd pob dydd, a gallai'r gwasanaeth hwn fod yn allweddol. Mae llawer o bobl ifanc yn wynebu problemau cymdeithasol ac emosiynol a all effeithio ar eu cyflawniadau addysgol, eu profiadau a'u cyfleoedd. Gall anghenion a sefyllfaoedd o'r fath fynd yn drech na hwy, fel y disgrifiodd Denise o'i profiad fel cyn-athrawes. Gall cwnsela

helping to address a pupil's underlying problems. It is difficult for a child to focus on learning if he or she is upset, frustrated or confused. Therefore, we must consider how we can present an opportunity for independent and supportive counselling. As Christine said, we have a long way to go in terms of policy, but the 14 to 19 learning pathways action plan considers how we can develop basic support mechanisms on counselling issues.

**Kirsty Williams:** You have rightly stressed the need for universal access. Are you aware that 60 per cent of calls to children's helplines are made from telephone boxes? That is for the obvious reason that children cannot access such services from telephones in their homes. A potentially unforeseen problem will be caused by BT's proposals to remove 1,000 phone boxes from across Wales. I am sure that BT is unaware of the impact that that will have on children's ability to find help and advice in a safe environment. Will you undertake to discuss this with Cabinet colleagues? I urge you to contact BT to make it aware of the potential damage that could be done to children who want to access these services by proposals to remove phone boxes from everyone's constituencies.

**Jane Hutt:** That is a confidentiality and privacy issue. Young people often need to make calls for help in a time of crisis. The evidence that you have given certainly suggests that we need to raise this.

We also know that text messaging, websites and e-mail are used by young people who can access a computer, though not necessarily in their homes. NHS Direct now provides a service for young people and it finds, as do the Samaritans, that they are happier to e-mail than phone. We must listen to children and young people and you have given us some evidence of what would be the most appropriate ways of reaching out to them. Helplines are key and I am glad that we have heard more about the NSPCC's

chwarae rhan bwysig i helpu i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau sylfaenol disgwybl. Mae'n anodd i blentyn ganolbwytio ar ddysgu os yw'n teimlo'n ofidus, yn rhwystredig neu'n ddryslyd. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallwn roi cyfle i ddarparu gwasanaeth cwnsela annibynnol a chefnogol. Fel y dywedodd Christine, mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud o ran polisi, ond mae cynllun gweithredu llwybrau dysgu 14 i 19 yn ystyried sut y gallwn ddatblygu cymorth sylfaenol o ran materion sy'n ymwneud â chwnsela.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydych yn gywir i bwysleisio'r angen am wasanaeth sydd ar gael i bawb. A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod 60 y cant o'r galwadau a wneir i linellau cymorth plant yn cael eu gwneud o flychau ffôn? Mae hynny am y rheswm amlwg na all plant gael gafael ar wasanaethau o'r fath o ffonau yn eu cartrefi. Bydd problem bosibl nas rhagwelwyd yn cael ei chreu gan gynnig BT i gael gwared ar 1,000 o flychau ffôn ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw BT yn ymwybodol o'r effaith y bydd hyn yn ei chael ar allu plant i ddod o hyd i help a chyngor mewn amgylchedd diogel. A wnewch drafod hyn gyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet? Fe'ch anogaf i gysylltu â BT er mwyn ei wneud yn ymwybodol o'r niwed posibl y gellid ei wneud i blant sydd am gael gafael ar y gwasanaethau hyn drwy gynigion i gael gwared ar flychau ffôn o etholaethau pawb.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwnnw'n fater sy'n ymwneud â chyfrinachedd a phrifatrwydd. Yn aml mae angen i bobl ifanc alw am help mewn argyfwng. Mae'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd gennych yn sicr yn awgrymu bod angen inni godi hyn.

Gwyddom hefyd fod pobl ifanc sy'n gallu cael gafael ar gyfrifiadur yn defnyddio negeseuon testun, gwefannau a negeseuon e-bost, er nid o reidrwydd yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Mae Galw Iechyd Cymru bellach yn darparu gwasanaeth i bobl ifanc ac mae wedi canfod, fel gwna'r Samariaid, eu bod yn hapusach yn defnyddio'r e-bost na'r ffôn. Rhaid inni wrando ar blant a phobl ifanc ac yr ydych wedi rhoi rhywfaint o dystiolaeth inni o'r ffyrdd mwyaf priodol o'u cyrraedd. Mae llinellau cymorth yn allweddol ac yr wyf

developments. I will address your public telephone concerns.

Again, on education, the personal and social education framework emphasises a child's entire social and emotional, as well as educational, development and is a statutory requirement in the curriculum for children aged five to 16. The PSE framework is about relationships and wider responses within the community, such as peer support, as well as about developing self-awareness and self-respect, which are vital if we are to take this forward because again, it is about access to normal, everyday life experiences. Around £0.5 million will be going to 10 innovative PSE pilot projects across Wales. This also focuses on early intervention and the provision of trained pastoral and counselling support in schools, so if we can disseminate good practice from those pilot schemes, we will ensure that we adopt an all-Wales response, particularly in terms of personal, social and educational development.

You mentioned bullying, which is of great concern. It was tragically highlighted in recent press reports. Last September, guidance was issued to all schools on tackling bullying. There are a number of suggested proposals to prevent and deal with incidents of bullying, such as advice on developing anti-bullying policies in schools. Again, evidence has shown that children and young people need to be engaged in those discussions, and become mentors and buddies. We know that that can work from primary through to secondary school. School councils are taking a lead on that. Jane Davidson will write to all schools to remind them about the guidance, asking them for examples of good practice that we can share across Wales.

5.40 p.m.

In addition, we have begun work on developing information for children and young people on what to do if they are being bullied, whom they can turn to and how they can help others who are being bullied. Young people will be involved in the consultation

yn falch ein bod wedi clywed mwy am ddatblygiadau'r NSPCC. Af i'r afael â'ch pryderon ynghylch ffonau cyhoeddus.

Unwaith eto, mae'r fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol yn rhoi pwyslais ar ddatblygiad cymdeithasol ac emosiynol cyfan plentyn, yn ogystal â'i ddatblygiad addysgol ac mae'n ofyniad statudol yn y cwricwlwm i blant rhwng pump ac 16 oed. Mae'r fframwaith ABCh yn ymwneud â chydberthnasau ac ymatebion ehangach yn y gymuned, fel cymorth cyfoedion, yn ogystal â datblygu hunan-ymwybyddiaeth a hunan-barch, sy'n hanfodol os ydym i ddatblygu hyn oherwydd unwaith eto, mae'n ymwneud â chael profiadau normal, pob dydd. Bydd tua £0.5 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar 10 prosiect peilot ABCh arloesol ledled Cymru. Mae hyn hefyd yn canolbwytio ar ymyrraeth gynnari a darparu cymorth bugeiliol a chwnsela mewn ysgolion gan rai sydd wedi cael hyfforddiant, felly os gallwn rannu arfer da o'r cynlluniau peilot hynny, gwnawn sicrhau ein bod yn mabwysiadu ymateb Cymru gyfan, yn enwedig o ran datblygiad personol, cymdeithasol ac addysgol.

Bu ichi gyfeirio at fwlio, sy'n bryder mawr. Fe'i hamlygwyd yn drasig mewn adroddiadau diweddar yn y wasg. Fis Medi diwethaf, rhoddwyd canllawiau i bob ysgol ar fynd i'r afael â bwlio. Ceir nifer o gynigion i atal ac ymdrin ag achosion o fwlio, fel cyngor ar ddatblygu polisiau gwrth-fwlio mewn ysgolion. Unwaith eto, dengys tystiolaeth fod angen i blant a phobl ifanc gymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau hynny, a bod yn fentoriaid ac yn gyfeillion. Gwyddom ein bod yn gallu gweithio o ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd. Mae cyngorau ysgol yn arwain yn hynny o beth. Bydd Jane Davidson yn ysgrifennu at bob ysgol i'w hatgoffa o'r canllawiau, gan ofyn iddynt roi engrifftiau o arfer da y gallwn ei rannu ledled Cymru.

Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi dechrau gweithio ar ddatblygu gwybodaeth i blant a phobl ifanc am yr hyn i'w wneud os cânt eu bwlio, at bwy y gallant droi a sut y gallant helpu eraill sy'n cael eu bwlio. Bydd pobl ifanc yn cael eu cynnwys yn y broses ymgynghori yn

later this year and an expert group is developing guidance for schools to help promote pupils' mental health and psychological wellbeing. Teachers and all school staff must be able to easily spot early warning signs and deal effectively with minor issues or, if necessary, refer pupils on to more specialist services. That leads us to the child and adolescent mental health strategy, which is appropriately called 'Everybody's Business'. That has been rightly raised by the children's commissioner and the Assembly as a priority. I will be investing additional money this year to ensure that 'Everybody's Business' is fully implemented.

We must also look at the starting point, which is prevention. That is what Cymorth is about. The sum of £42 million has been ring-fenced to local authorities across Wales, and with Sure Start and the children and young people's fund, play, childcare and children's integrated centres are developing across the country. These must all be child-centred and start from the premise that we must listen to and learn from children and young people. We must break down barriers in Wales.

Finally, Members will be aware that Gwenda Thomas's review on safeguarding vulnerable children in Wales will involve listening and talking to children and young people who have been at the sharp end of vulnerability. Gwenda assured me that the NSPCC's proposals are being brought to the attention of her group.

In conclusion, I thank Christine for bringing this important subject to our attention and for highlighting this new dimension of the NSPCC's Full Stop campaign in Wales; the Welsh Assembly Government backs that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.42 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.42 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

ddiweddgarach eleni ac mae grŵp o arbenigwyr wrthi'n datblygu canllawiau i ysgolion er mwyn helpu i hyrwyddo iechyd meddwl a lles seicolegol disgylion. Rhaid bod athrawon a phob aelod o staff yr ysgol yn gallu adnabod y rhybuddion cynnar yn hawdd ac ymdrin yn effeithiol â mân broblemau neu, os oes angen, cyfeirio disgylion at wasanaethau mwy arbenigol. Mae hynny'n ein harwain at y strategaeth iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed, a elwir yn briodol yn 'Fusnes Pawb'. Nodwyd y strategaeth hon fel blaenoriaeth gan y comisiynydd plant a'r Cynulliad a hynny'n gywir. Byddaf yn buddsoddi arian ychwanegol eleni er mwyn sicrhau bod 'Busnes Pawb' yn cael ei gweithredu'n llawn.

Rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar y man cychwyn, saf atal problemau. Dyna nod Cymorth. Neilltuwyd £42 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, a chyda Cychwyn Cadarn a'r gronfa i blant a phobl ifanc, mae gofal plant a chanolfannau plant integredig yn cael eu datblygu ledled y sir. Rhaid i'r rhain ganolbwytio ar y plentyn a bod yn seiliedig ar y ffaith bod yn rhaid inni wrando ar blant a phobl ifanc a dysgu ganddynt. Rhaid inni ddileu'r rhwystrau yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod adolygiad Gwenda Thomas ar ddiogelu plant diamddiffyn yng Nghymru yn cynnwys gwrando ar blant a phobl ifanc ddiamddiffyn iawn a siarad â hwy. Cefais sicrydd gan Gwenda fod cynigion yr NSPCC yn cael eu dwyn at sylw ei grŵp.

I gloi, hoffwn ddiolch i Christine am dynnu ein sylw at y pwnc pwysig hwn ac am amlyu'r dimensiwn newydd hwn i ymgyrch Full Stop yr NSPCC yng Nghymru; mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cefnogi hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

29/09/2004