



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth, 29 Mehefin 2004

Tuesday, 29 June 2004

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|--|
| 4 | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister |
| 31 | Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement |
| 35 | Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order |
| 37 | Rheoliadau Canolfan Iechyd Cymru (Cyfansoddiad, Aelodaeth a Gweithdrefnau) 2004
The Wales Centre for Health (Constitution, Membership and Procedures) Regulations 2004 |
| 37 | Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004 |
| 49 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales) Regulations 2004 |
| 52 | Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio
Annual Report of the Audit Committee |
| 66 | Atal Llifogydd
Flood Defence |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Triniaethau Cancer Cancer Treatments

Q1 Sandy Mewies: Would the First Minister make a statement on patient access to cancer treatments in Wales? (OAQ36409)

C1 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y triniaethau cancer sydd ar gael i gleifion yng Nghymru? (OAQ36409)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Tackling cancer remains one of the Assembly Government's top priorities for the national health service. Our strategy for improving services and access to treatments is through the progressive implementation of our national standards of cancer care and the advice of the National Institute for Clinical Excellence.

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Mynd i'r afael â chanser yw un o brif flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o hyd. Ymgymerir â'n strategaeth ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau a'r gallu i gael triniaethau drwy roi ein safonau gofal cancer cenedlaethol ar waith yn raddol a thrwy ddilyn cyngor y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol.

Sandy Mewies: In England, following criticism from the Government cancer tsar, Professor Mike Richards, the Secretary of State for Health promised that more would be done to ensure more equitable access to cancer drugs. What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to ensure that Welsh patients have access to appropriate cancer treatments?

Sandy Mewies: Yn Lloegr, yn dilyn beirniadaeth gan tsar cancer y Llywodraeth, yr Athro Mike Richards, addawodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd y gwneid rhagor i sicrhau mwy o degwch wrth gael cyffuriau at ganser. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n eu cymryd i sicrhau bod triniaethau priodol ar gyfer cancer ar gael i gleifion yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: All cancer drugs that have been recommended for use by NICE, following its appraisal, are subject to a direction that requires the national health service in Wales to make funding available to implement the NICE guidelines within three months. On 14 June, it was announced that NICE is developing proposals that will assist the NHS in Wales and in England with the implementation of its guidance.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r holl gyffuriau at ganser y mae'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol wedi argymhell eu defnyddio, ar ôl cael eu gwerthuso ganddo, yn ddarostyngedig i gyfarwyddyd sy'n mynnu y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru'n neilltuo arian i roi canllawiau'r sefydliad ar waith o fewn tri mis. Ar 14 Mehefin, cyhoeddwyd bod y sefydliad yn paratoi cynigion a fydd yn helpu'r GIG yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr i roi ei ganllawiau ar waith.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau gwelliant yn nifer y bobl sydd yn derbyn budd-daliadau anabledd, ac yn nifer y cleifion canser sydd yn derbyn y budd-daliadau hyn? Ar 23 Mehefin,

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What plans do you have to ensure an increase in the number of people who receive disability benefit, and in the number of cancer patients who receive this benefit? On 23 June, the Macmillan

amcangyfrifodd elusen Macmillan bod £4 miliwn heb ei dderbyn gan gleifion canser.

charity estimated that £4 million had not been paid to cancer patients.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi gweithredu i geisio helpu pobl sydd yn mynd i weld eu meddyg teulu i dderbyn cyngor oddi wrth gynghorwyr sydd â llawer o wybodaeth ynglŷn â chymhwysedd i gael budd-dal analluogrwydd neu salwch ac ati. Yr ydym wedi ceisio sicrhau bod pobl yn cael cyngor am fudd-daliadau sydd yn gysylltiedig â chyflwr meddygol ym mhraetis y meddyg teulu neu mewn lleoliadau meddygol eraill.

The First Minister: We have taken action to try to help those who visit their general practitioner to speak to advisers who have a great deal of information about eligibility for incapacity benefit, sickness benefit and so on. We have tried to ensure that people get advice about benefits associated with medical conditions in the GP's surgery or in other medical settings.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you agree that the reporting of cancer ought to be made statutory in terms of data registry, as it is in many other countries, in order to complete the picture of those with cancer? We should then allow researchers to use those statistics. Do you accept that we ought to urgently introduce these measures through legislation?

Jonathan Morgan: A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r adrodd am ganser gael ei wneud yn statudol drwy gofrestrfa ddata, fel y gwnaed mewn sawl gwlad arall, er mwyn cael darlun cyflawn o'r rhai sydd â chanser? Dylem ganiatáu i ymchwilyr ddefnyddio'r ystadegau hynny wedyn. A ydych yn derbyn y dylem gyflwyno'r mesurau hyn ar frys drwy ddeddfu?

The First Minister: I am not sure how far that would take us beyond the huge progress that has been made in establishing the Welsh cancer bank. Perhaps you would write to me as to whether what you propose goes beyond that, because we are already ahead of the rest of the United Kingdom in having a cancer bank. It stores tumour and blood samples from cancer patients and, with their permission, allows for further research on those samples. That analysis is integral to informing clinical decisions on the treatment of individual cancer patients. That is a huge advance. Everyone who works on cancer in the United Kingdom is looking at what we have done in Wales. If what you suggest goes beyond that, please write to me and I will ensure that either I or Jane Hutt will respond.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr i ba raddau y byddai hynny'n rhagori ar y cynnydd aruthrol a wnaed wrth sefydlu banc canser Cymru. Efallai yr ysgrifennech ataf ynghylch a yw'r hyn a gynigiwch yn rhagori ar hynny, gan ein bod eisoes ar y blaen i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig drwy gael banc canser. Mae'n storio samplau o dyfiannau a gwaed a gafwyd gan gleifion sydd â chanser ac, o gael caniatâd ganddynt, mae'n hwyluso ymchwil bellach ar y samplau hynny. Mae'r dadansoddi hwnnw'n rhan annatod o'r gwaith o oleuo penderfyniadau clinigol ar y modd i drin cleifion penodol sydd â chanser. Mae hynny'n gam mawr ymlaen. Mae pawb sy'n gweithio ym maes canser yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn edrych ar yr hyn a wnaethom yng Nghymru. Os yw'r hyn a awgrymwch yn rhagori ar hynny, ysgrifennwch ataf, os gwelwch yn dda, a sicrhaf y byddaf fi neu Jane Hutt yn ymateb.

Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol Social Inclusion

Q2 John Griffiths: Would the First Minister make a statement on progress in achieving the Assembly's cross cutting priority of social inclusion? (OAQ36398)

C2 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud wrth gyflawni blaenoriaeth drawsbynciol y Cynulliad ym maes cynhwysiant cymdeithasol? (OAQ36398)

The First Minister: The 'Social Justice Report for 2004' sets out the range of policies and programmes within the social justice and regeneration portfolio that address social exclusion in Wales. Across the Assembly Government, we continue to tackle the wider social, educational and economic barriers that create inequality and poverty, and, therefore, social exclusion.

John Griffiths: Crime, disorder and anti-social behaviour have a considerable detrimental impact on our poorest communities, both for the victims and those committing those acts. In the UK, we imprison more people per head of population than any other country in western Europe. All the evidence shows that young people, for example, who are imprisoned are more likely to commit other crimes than those dealt with by other means. They are also more likely to commit more serious, and violent, crime. Would you agree that the Assembly's youth justice policies have a strong role to play in dealing with young people in ways other than by imprisoning them, and in ensuring that we sufficiently tackle the root causes of crime?

The First Minister: You raise two issues. We would all agree that there is an irreducible minimum of young people for whom there is no alternative to a custodial sentence. The issue is how irreducible, and how small, is that minimum. It is a well-attested fact that locking up young people means spending public money in order to increase the subsequent crime rate—it is the so-called university of crime: too many of the methods used in youth custody do nothing more than provide better-trained, faster, fitter, more streetwise young criminals when they come out. The alternative to locking-up young people is having an active policy of diverting young people away from crime. I am pleased to say that there is excellent work being done across Wales by community safety partnerships. We are providing funding of £8 million to the partnerships to tackle youth offending and to provide diversionary projects, which is what I think that you are referring to.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae 'Adroddiad Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol 2004' yn nodi'r gwahanol bolisiau a rhaglenni yn y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio sy'n ymdrin â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Ym mhob rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, parhawn i fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau cymdeithasol, addysgol ac economaidd ehangach sy'n creu anghydraddoldeb a thlodi, ac, felly, allgáu cymdeithasol.

John Griffiths: Mae troseddau, anhrefn ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn amharu'n fawr ar ein cymunedau tlotaf, yn achos y rhai sy'n dioddef gan y gweithredoedd hynny yn ogystal â'r rhai sy'n eu cyflawni. Yn y DU, carcharwn fwy o bobl am bob pen o'r boblogaeth na'r un wlad arall yng ngorllewin Ewrop. Mae'r holl dystiolaeth yn dangos bod pobl ifanc, er enghraifft, sy'n cael eu carcharu yn fwy tebygol o gyflawni troseddau eraill na'r rhai a drafodir drwy ddulliau eraill. Maent hefyd yn fwy tebygol o gyflawni troseddau mwy difrifol, a rhai treisgar. A gytunch fod lle pwysig i bolisiau'r Cynulliad ar gyfiawnder ieuentid wrth ddelio â phobl ifanc drwy ddulliau heblaw eu carcharu, ac wrth sicrhau ein bod yn ymdrin yn ddigonol ag achosion sylfaenol troseddau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi dau fater. Byddem oll yn cytuno bod nifer bach anlleihadwy o bobl ifanc na ellir rhoi dim ond dedfryd o garchar iddynt. Y mater dan sylw yw pa mor anlleihadwy, a pha mor fach, yw'r nifer hwnnw. Ffaith â chryn dystiolaeth iddi yw bod cadw pobl ifanc dan glo yn golygu gwario arian cyhoeddus i gynyddu'r gyfradd droseddau ddilynol—dyna brifysgol troseddau, fel y'i gelwir: mae gormod o lawer o'r dulliau a ddefnyddir wrth gadw pobl ifanc yn rhai na wnânt ddim mwy na darparu troseddwy'r ifanc mwy effro, abl, strydgall a hyfforddedig pan ddeuant allan. Y dewis yn lle rhoi pobl ifanc dan glo yw cael polisi gweithredol o droi pobl ifanc oddi wrth droseddau. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y gwneir gwaith rhagorol ledled Cymru gan bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Yr ydym yn darparu £8 miliwn o gyllid i'r partneriaethau hyn i ymdrin â throseddau gan bobl ifanc ac i ddarparu prosiectau gwrthdynciadol, sef yr hyn y cyfeiriwch ato,

yr wyf yn credu.

Mark Isherwood: What concrete measures do you propose to generate greater involvement by, and participation with, voluntary councils and registered social landlords, so that the barriers to social inclusion identified by both the social enterprise action plan and housing needs surveys can be overcome?

Mark Isherwood: Pa fesurau pendant yr ydych yn eu cynnig i sicrhau y bydd cynghorau gwirfoddol a landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig yn cymryd mwy o ran, ac y gwneir mwy ar y cyd â hwy, fel y gellir chwalu'r rhwystrau i gynhwysiant cymdeithasol y mae'r cynllun gweithredu ar fenter gymdeithasol a'r arolygon o anghenion tai wedi'u nodi?

The First Minister: You have much greater expertise in this area than I do, Mark. A great deal can be done to ensure that homelessness through lack of access to social housing is not a contributory factor in crime. When people have to be locked-up because there is nowhere else to put them as there is no housing provision available—if they have been broken by a major quarrel with their families, if they cannot afford training, or cannot access benefits for training—they become the lost generation. Once they are out of the system, it is difficult for them to get back in, unless there is some way of getting people into stable homes through voluntary organisations or registered social landlords.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennych lawer mwy o arbenigedd yn y maes hwn na mi, Mark. Gellir gwneud llawer iawn i sicrhau na fydd digartrefedd drwy ddiffyg mynediad i dai cymdeithasol yn ffactor sy'n cyfrannu at droseddu. Pan fo raid rhoi pobl dan glo am nad oes unman arall i'w rhoi gan nad oes tai ar gael—os cawsant eu digalonni gan ffræ fawr â'u teuluoedd, os na allant fforddio hyfforddiant, neu os na allant gael budd-daliadau i ddilyn hyfforddiant—byddant yn troi'n genhedlaeth goll. Unwaith y byddant y tu allan i'r system, mae'n anodd iddynt ddod i mewn iddi eto, oni bai fod rhyw fodd i gael cartrefi sefydlog iddynt drwy gyrff gwirfoddol neu landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Credaf eich bod yn gwybod cystal â mi, Brif Weinidog, er mwyn sicrhau cynhwysiant cymdeithasol go iawn, ac i ddelio â nifer o'r materion yr oedd John Griffiths yn sôn amdanynt, bod angen pwerau deddfu llawn ar y Cynulliad. Ym mis Ebrill, yr oeddech o blaid pwerau deddfu llawn. Pam y bu ichi newid eich meddwl?

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I believe that you know as well as I do, First Minister, that, in order to achieve true social inclusion, and to deal with a number of the issues referred to by John Griffiths, the Assembly needs full legislative powers. In April, you were in favour of full legislative powers. Why have you changed your mind?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi newid fy meddwl. Y mae llawer o bethau yr ydych o'u plaid neu yn eu herbyn. Yr wyf yn erbyn refferenda; yr wyf o blaid pwerau deddfu, fel y dywedasoch. Nid wyf wedi newid fy meddwl. Yr wyf yn erbyn cael llai o Aelodau Seneddol o Gymru neu fwy o Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Yr ydych yn ceisio cysoni'r pethau hyn, ac yn cymryd gormod o sylw o'r hyn a ddywedais yn y gynhadledd ar ddatganoli yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf wedi ceisio dweud bod gwaith ar y gweill er mwyn rhoi dewis ychwanegol ger bron y Blaid Lafur, ac efallai rhai pleidiau eraill.

The First Minister: I have not changed my mind. One is for or against a range of issues. I am against referenda; I am for legislative powers, as you said. I have not changed my mind. I am against a reduction in the number of Welsh Members of Parliament or an increase in the number of Assembly Members. You are trying to reconcile these points, and paying too much attention to what I said at last week's conference on devolution. I have tried to say that work is ongoing in order to put additional options before the Labour Party, as well as some other parties perhaps.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi darllen eich araith, ac mae'n berffaith amlwg eich bod wedi symud i ffwrdd o'r syniad o bwerau deddfu, gan fod Aelodau Seneddol wedi dweud nad ydynt am weld pwerau o'r fath i'r Cynulliad. Realiti'r sefyllfa, Brif Weinidog—ac mae'n rhaid i chi dderbyn hyn—yw bod consensws eang o blaid pwerau deddfu i'r Cynulliad. Yr ydych wedi dweud eich bod yn cefnogi hynny; mae'r undebau llafur yn gryf iawn o blaid; mae Aelodau Llafur yma o blaid; mae dwy o'r tair gwrthblaid yn unol o blaid; mae rhai Aelodau o'r blaid Doriāidd o blaid; mae'r eglwysi o blaid. Pam eich bod yn mynd i lawr y ffordd hurt hon o geisio dweud wrthym fod ffordd arall o ddelio â'r mater hwn? Gwyddoch yn iawn mai pwerau deddfu sydd eu hangen ar y Cynulliad. Pam na wnewch arwain y ddadl?

2.10 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn awr yn rhoi gormod o sylw i'r cwestiwn o bwerau deddfu heb ddweud pa fath o bwerau yr ydych yn siarad amdanynt. Dywedais wrth egluro'r syniad hwn—a dywedaf eto mai gwaith ar y gweill ydyw—efallai nad oes trydydd neu bedwerydd opsiwn nad ydynt ymhlith argymhellion na thystiolaeth comisiwn Richard. Nid oes diben dadlau ynghylch pwerau deddfu eilaidd neu gynradd pan fu symudiadau yn senedd San Steffan yn ystod yr ugain mlynedd diwethaf sydd yn cael gwared ar yr hollt rhyngddynt.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: First Minister, you have changed your position. What is the point of delivering a speech in which you offer an option that no-one has heard about, unless you have changed your position? It is your responsibility to lead the debate on primary law-making powers for the Assembly. I quote from your speech:

'It will not be enough simply to conduct our discussions from behind the barricades of pre-conceived positions.'

The only people who are hiding behind the barricades of pre-conceived positions are Labour MPs in London. It is they who are out of step with the majority feeling in Wales. Why have you sold out to those Labour MPs?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I have read your speech, and it is perfectly clear that you have distanced yourself from the notion of legislative powers, because Members of Parliament have said that they do not want to see such powers given to the Assembly. The reality, First Minister—and you must accept this—is that a broad consensus exists in favour of legislative powers for the Assembly. You have said that you are in favour; Labour Members here are in favour; two of the three opposition parties are united in their support; some Tory Members are in favour; the churches are in favour. Why are you going down the crazy route of trying to tell us that there is another way of dealing with this issue? You know full well that the Assembly needs full legislative powers. Why will you not lead the debate?

The First Minister: You are now concentrating too much on the issue of legislative powers without stating what kind of powers you mean. I said in explaining this idea—and I maintain that it is work in progress—that there may not be a third and fourth option that is neither in the recommendations of, or the evidence to, the Richard commission. There is no point arguing over primary or secondary legislative powers when there has been movement in the Westminster parliament during the last 20 years to eliminate the distinction between the two.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Brif Weinidog, yr ydych wedi newid eich safbwynt. I ba ddiben y traddodech araith lle y cynigiwch ddewis nad oes neb wedi clywed sôn amdano, oni bai eich bod wedi newid eich safbwynt? Eich cyfrifoldeb chi yw arwain y ddadl ar bwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad. Dyfynnaf o'ch araith:

Ni fydd yn ddigon cynnal ein trafodaethau o'r tu ôl i wrthgloddiau o safbwyntiau rhagdybiedig.

Yr unig rai sy'n cuddio y tu ôl i wrthgloddiau o safbwyntiau rhagdybiedig yw ASau Llafur yn Llundain. Hwy yw'r rhai nad ydynt yn cyd-fynd â barn y mwyafrif yng Nghymru. Pam yr ydych wedi ildio i'r ASau Llafur

Your attitude to this is a shameful abdication of leadership. As the people of Wales now understand, we cannot trust Labour and this First Minister to deliver for Wales.

The First Minister: If ever there were a question which condemned its author in his own words, that was it. You quoted my words about getting out from behind the barricades. Was there ever a better example of someone having the opportunity to ask a question and instead hiding behind the barricades? All that you did was throw some verbal hand grenades out from behind the barricades. Come out from behind the barricades, read what I said, and say what you think about it. I have not oversold the proposal—it may prove to be nothing, but we are working on it. If it is workable, then it is a further choice that will be available to people when they consider a menu of choices. You do not like the option, but you do not want to discuss it. You said that nobody has heard of it: that is why it is called an original, made-in-Wales piece of thinking. Give it the respect of trying to understand what it means and get rid of this obsession with the distinction between primary and secondary legislation, which is to a large extent now ignored in the House of Commons. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I, too, read your speech at the Economic and Social Research Council conference last Friday, and it expressed a change of view. I will give you a chance, First Minister, to explain what you meant. As I understand it, your proposals for taking forward the Richard recommendations still rely on us obtaining slots at Westminster for Wales-only legislation and on Wales having sections in Bills that are predominately applicable to England alone. They still rely on the Assembly only being given the authority to take action of which English Ministers approve, and they rely on having a Government at Westminster that is politically sympathetic to the idea of there being a National Assembly for Wales with any power

hynny? Mae'ch agwedd at hyn yn ymwadiad cywilyddus ag arweinyddiaeth. Fel y mae pobl Cymru'n deall yn awr, ni allwn ymddiried yn Llafur ac yn y Prif Weinidog hwn i fynd â'r maen i'r wal dros Gymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os bu erioed gwestiwn a gollfarnodd y sawl a'i gofynnodd yn ei eiriau ei hun, dyna ef. Gwnaethoch ddyfynnu fy ngeiriau ynghylch dod allan o'r tu cefn i'r gwrthgloddiau. A gafwyd erioed well enghraifft o rywun a gafodd gyfle i ofyn cwestiwn ond a guddiodd y tu ôl i'r gwrthgloddiau yn lle hynny? Y cwbl a wnaethoch oedd taflu ychydig o fomiau llaw geiriol o'r tu ôl i'r gwrthgloddiau. Dewch allan o'r tu cefn i'r gwrthgloddiau, darllenwch yr hyn a ddywedais, a rhowch eich barn amdano. Nid wyf wedi gwthio'r cynnig ormod—efallai na ddaw dim ohono, ond yr ydym yn gweithio arno. Os yw'n ymarferol, bydd yn ddewis pellach a fydd ar gael i bobl pan ystyriant y gwahanol ddewisiadau. Nid ydych yn hoffi'r dewis, ond nid ydych am ei drafod. Dywedasoeh nad oedd neb wedi clywed sôn amdano: dyna pam y'i gelwir yn syniad gwreiddiol a wnaed yng Nghymru. Parchwch ef drwy geisio deall yr hyn y mae'n ei olygu a rhowch y gorau i'r obsesiwn hwn â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ac is-ddeddfwriaeth, a anwybyddir i raddau helaeth yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Darllenais innau'r araith a draddodasoch yng nghynhadledd y Cyngor Ymchwil Economaidd a Chymdeithasol ddydd Gwener diwethaf, a dangosodd fod eich barn wedi newid. Rhoddaf gyfle i chi, Brif Weinidog, egluro'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei olygu. Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, mae'ch cynigion ar gyfer hyrwyddo argymhellion Richard yn dal i ddibynnu ar ein gallu i gael amser yn San Steffan ar gyfer deddfwriaeth i Gymru'n unig ac ar sicrhau adrannau ar gyfer Cymru mewn Mesurau sy'n berthnasol i Loegr yn unig gan mwyaf. Maent yn dal i ddibynnu ar ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad gymryd dim ond y camau hynny y mae Gweinidogion Lloegr yn eu cymeradwyo, ac maent yn dibynnu ar y sicrwydd o gael Llywodraeth yn San Steffan

or responsibility at all. How do your proposals take us forward instead of leaving us exactly where we are now? Are they truly your views, or are they the views that have been pushed upon you because of the pressure that you are under from your Labour MPs?

The First Minister: You misdescribe my proposals completely. You and Ieuan are falling for a conspiracy theory about where this idea has come from. It has clearly come from work being done by our officials. You have misunderstood this in saying that it relies on slots at Westminster. I do not know where you get that idea from, as it is a complete misreading. You claim that the proposal relies on our obtaining permission from English Ministers, which is also not the case. You should also do this the respect of trying to understand what is in the proposals before you seek to condemn them. You are completely wrong in all respects.

Michael German: I heard your words, First Minister, and you said 'provided that Minister in England wanted to do what we wanted to do'.

In other words, provided that it has the support of the English Minister. Those are your words. That gives rise to questions, as you gave your support to primary law-making powers when the Richard commission placed its report in the public domain. You know that this has the widespread support of the people of Wales; it is the one aspect of the recommendations on which there was genuine agreement. People may not have agreed on other points, but they agreed on that. The only conclusion that we can draw is that, having seen the strength of opposition from Labour MPs, you now back this framework legislation—which is a second and weaker option—because you do not think that you can get the first option past your own party.

In the last month, we have seen you offend the nation by failing to attend the D-day commemoration—for which you were criticised by members of your own party—

sydd â chydymdeimlad gwleidyddol â'r syniad o gael Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru sydd â rhyw fath o bŵer neu gyfrifoldeb. Sut y mae'ch cynigion yn mynd â ni yn ein blaen yn hytrach na'n gadael yn yr union le yr ydym yn awr? Ai'ch barn chi ydyw mewn gwirionedd, ynteu barn a wthiwyd arnoch oherwydd y pwysau yr ydych oddi tano oddi wrth eich ASau Llafur?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn camddisgrifio fy nghynigion yn llwyr. Yr ydych chi ac Ieuan yn llyncu stori am gynllwyn ynghylch tarddiad y syniad hwn. Mae'n amlwg ei fod wedi codi o waith a wneir gan ein swyddogion. Yr ydych wedi camdeall hynny wrth ddweud ei fod yn dibynnu ar sicrhau amser yn San Steffan. Ni wn o ble y cawsoch y syniad hwnnw, gan ei fod yn gamddehongliad llwyr. Honnwch fod y cynnig yn dibynnu ar ein gallu i gael caniatâd gan Weinidogion Lloegr, ac nid yw hynny'n wir ychwaith. Dylech hefyd barchu hyn drwy geisio deall beth sydd yn y cynigion cyn ceisio eu collfarnu. Yr ydych yn methu'n llwyr ar bob cyfrif.

Michael German: Clywais eich geiriau, Brif Weinidog, a'r hyn a ddywedasoed oedd 'ar yr amod bod Gweinidog yn Lloegr am wneud yr hyn yr oeddem ni am ei wneud'.

Mewn geiriau eraill, ar yr amod bod y Gweinidog dros Loegr yn ei gefnogi. Eich geiriau chi yw'r rhain. Mae hynny'n codi cwestiynau, gan eich bod wedi cefnogi pwerau deddfu sylfaenol pan gyhoeddodd comisiwn Richard ei adroddiad. Gwyddoch fod cefnogaeth gyffredinol i hyn ymysg pobl Cymru; hon yw'r unig agwedd ar yr argymhellion yr oedd gwir gytundeb arni. Efallai na chytunodd pobl ar bwyntiau eraill, ond cytunasant ar hynny. Yr unig gasgliad y gallwn ddod iddo yw, ar ôl gweld maint y gwrthwynebiad gan ASau Llafur, eich bod bellach o blaid y ddeddfwriaeth fframwaith hon—sy'n ail ddewis gwannach—am na chredwch y gallwch beri i'ch plaid eich hun dderbyn y dewis cyntaf.

Yn y mis diwethaf, fe'ch gwelsom yn tramgwyddo'r genedl drwy fethu â mynd i gyfarfod coffâu D-day—y'ch beirniadwyd o'i herwydd gan aelodau'ch plaid eich hun—nid

Labour MPs have not backed you regarding the poor performance of the national health service in Wales, and now you seem to be in a terrible muddle about the primary legislative powers that the Richard commission recommended. First Minister, are you losing your grip?

The First Minister: What a wonderful question from the professor of conspiracy theories. I made it clear that I was not, and never have been, keen on any proposal that would result in a reduction in the number of Welsh MPs. Similarly, I have never been keen on any proposal that would increase the number of Assembly Members. Ivor Richard made clear at the South East Wales Regional Committee meeting a week last Friday, which you chaired, that he did not see the Richard commission proposals as an indissoluble whole that, if you were to start to change or mess around with, would collapse entirely. The issue is whether there is an additional choice that sensible people can consider that solves most of the problems and does so much quicker than the route opted for by the Richard commission.

Michael German: In whisking up this mystery cocktail for us, you seem to forget that this was the one point that united all parties in the Assembly. There was overwhelming support for this in the Chamber. Now, you present this mystery tour around some new solution that Ivor Richard—over two years for goodness' sake—could not find. He spent two years investigating these issues, and he ruled out not having certainty about the future. Are you not, in order to save your bacon with your own party, proposing an unsustainable solution that will eventually lead to this matter being revisited time and again?

The First Minister: I think that you misunderstand how the Richard commission worked. No-one submitted that idea in evidence to the Richard commission, and I do not think that it considered matters not put to it. Had that idea been presented, the commission would have considered it. That is, by and large, how it worked. It did not come up with its own solutions. Either way, it is still important that, should this option

yw ASau Llafur wedi'ch cefnogi o ran perfformiad gwael y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, ac yn awr ymddengys eich bod mewn penbleth ofnadwy ynghylch y pwerau deddfu sylfaenol a argymhellodd comisiwn Richard. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn colli'ch gafael?

Y Prif Weinidog: Am gwestiwn gwych gan yr arbenigwr ar storïau cynllwyn. Eglurais nad oeddwn, ac na fûm erioed, yn bleidiol i unrhyw gynnig a barai ostwng nifer yr ASau o Gymru. Yn yr un modd, ni fûm erioed yn bleidiol i unrhyw gynnig a barai gynnydd yn nifer Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Eglurodd Ivor Richard yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-ddwyrain wythnos i ddydd Gwener diwethaf, a gadeiriwyd gennych chi, nad oedd yn ystyried cynigion comisiwn Richard yn un undod annatod a chwalai'n llwyr pe byddid yn dechrau ei newid neu chwarae ag ef. Y mater dan sylw yw a oes dewis ychwanegol y gall pobl synhwyrol ei ystyried sy'n datrys y rhan fwyaf o'r problemau ac yn gwneud hynny'n gynt o lawer na'r ffordd y mae comisiwn Richard wedi'i dewis.

Michael German: Wrth baratoi'r coctêl cyfrinachol hwn ar ein cyfer, ymddengys eich bod yn anghofio bod yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad yn gytûn ar y pwynt hwn. Yr oedd cefnogaeth ysgubol i hyn yn y Siambr. Yn awr, cyflwynwch y daith ddirgel hon o gwmpas rhyw ateb newydd na allai Ivor Richard ei ganfod—mewn mwy na dwy flynedd, er mwyn popeth. Treuliodd ddwy flynedd yn ymchwilio i'r materion hyn, a dyfarnodd yn erbyn peidio â chael sicrwydd am y dyfodol. Onid ydych chi, er mwyn achub eich croen gyda'ch plaid eich hun, yn cynnig ateb anghynaliadwy a fydd yn arwain yn y pen draw at ailystyried y mater hwn dro ar ôl tro?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf eich bod yn camddeall sut yr oedd comisiwn Richard yn gweithio. Ni chyflwynodd neb y syniad hwnnw mewn tystiolaeth i gomisiwn Richard, ac ni chredaf ei fod wedi ystyried materion nas cyflwynwyd iddo. Pe cyflwynasid y syniad hwnnw, byddai'r comisiwn wedi'i ystyried. Felly y gweithiodd, at ei gilydd. Ni ddyfeisiodd ei atebion ei hun. Y naill ffordd neu'r llall,

turn out to be an additional choice, it is considered sensibly. It should be looked at objectively, and a comparison made with regard to the time needed to execute the two stages proposed by Richard, to see whether it is a better and neater solution. That is provided that it ensures clarity, sustainability, transparency and is easy for the public to understand. You say that it is not, because you have not looked at it yet. That is fair enough; it is all good opposition knockabout. Out in the world, however, it means absolutely nothing.

mae'n bwysig, er hynny, y dylai'r dewis hwn gael ei ystyried yn synhwyrol, os ceir ei fod yn ddewis ychwanegol. Dylid edrych arno'n wrthrychol, a gwneud cymhariaeth o ran yr amser y mae ei angen i gwblhau'r ddau gam a gynigir gan Richard, i weld a yw'n ateb gwell a thaclusach. Mae hynny ar yr amod ei fod yn sicrhau eglurder, cynaliadwyedd, tryloywder a'i fod yn hawdd i'r cyhoedd ei ddeall. Dywedwch nad ydyw, gan nad ydych wedi'i ystyried eto. Mae hynny'n ddigon teg; mae'r cwbl yn hwyl ddiniwed i'r gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, ar lawr gwlad, nid yw'n golygu dim o gwbl.

'Iaith Pawb'

C3 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar 'Iaith Pawb'? (OAQ36422)

Q3 Elin Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on 'Iaith Pawb'? (OAQ36422)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae 'Iaith Pawb' yn dangos ymroddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi a hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg. 'Iaith Pawb' yw'r cynllun gweithredu cenedlaethol cyntaf erioed ar gyfer Cymru ddwyieithog, ac er mwyn ategu'r cynllun, darparwyd £28 miliwn ychwanegol mewn cymorth uniongyrchol i'r Gymraeg rhwng 2003 a 2006. Caiff yr adroddiad blynyddol cyntaf ar roi 'Iaith Pawb' ar waith ei gyhoeddi fis Gorffennaf.

The First Minister: 'Iaith Pawb' demonstrates the Assembly Government's commitment to supporting and promoting the Welsh language. 'Iaith Pawb' is the first ever national action plan for a bilingual Wales, backed up by an additional £28 million in direct support to the Welsh language between 2003 and 2006. The first annual report on the implementation of 'Iaith Pawb' will be published in July.

Elin Jones: A wyddoch fod cydraddoldeb y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn gwbl ddiffygiol mewn rhai o'ch adrannau? Mae arwyddion enfawr wedi'u paentio ar y gefnffordd yn Aberystwyth yn uniaith Saesneg yn ddiweddar. 'North', 'south', 'east' yw'r union eiriau. Mewn llythyr i mi ar y mater hwn, dywedodd Andrew Davies fod rhaid i'r marciau ffordd yn Aberystwyth fod yn uniaith Saesneg oherwydd bod eu maint yn eu gwneud yn haws i'w darllen. Hyd yn oed o dan John Redwood, yr oedd arwyddion ffyrdd yn Aberystwyth yn ddwyieithog. A ydych yn barod i edrych ar y mater hwn? Mae'r sefyllfa'n gwbl gywilyddus.

Elin Jones: Are you aware that the English and Welsh languages are not treated equally by some of your departments? Enormous signs have recently been painted on the trunk road in Aberystwyth in English only. The exact wording reads: 'north', 'south', 'east'. In a letter to me on this matter, Andrew Davies said that the road markings in Aberystwyth had to be in English only because their size makes them easier to read. Even under John Redwood, the road signs in Aberystwyth were bilingual. Are you prepared to look into this matter? It is a shameful situation.

2.20 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n gysylltiedig ag 'Iaith Pawb', ond os ydych am imi edrych ar y drafodaeth rhyngoch chi ac Andrew Davies, gallaf holi Andrew Davies am y mater.

The First Minister: I am not sure whether that is connected to 'Iaith Pawb', but if you want me to look into the discussion between you and Andrew Davies, I can ask Andrew Davies about the matter.

Jenny Randerson: An important enabling power central to the vision of 'Iaith Pawb' is the Welsh Language Act 1993. Can you explain how any new Welsh language Act, were it to be proposed, would sit within your new suggestion of how we would gain more powers? Surely a Welsh language act is the one piece of legislation that could not realistically be given powers within a framework of English law? Do you accept that it would be unacceptable for the future of our Welsh language in legislation to be at the behest of English Members of Parliament?

The First Minister: I am glad that you have raised the question of the Welsh Language Act 1993, because it is interesting to compare what happened before devolution with what has happened since. That was one of a few—I think that there were about three or four—pieces of Wales-only legislation over about a 20-year period. There is now about one Act every year, rather than one every seven or eight years. The purpose of my floating this idea at the devolution conference last week, making it clear that this is not yet a completed piece of work, but that it is being tested to see whether it can reasonably be put before Wales's political parties—and the Labour Party, to speak for my own responsibility—is to see whether certain Acts, or amendments to Acts, for which we have asked, could be made under recommendation 13.2 plus, as you can loosely call it, although that is not a happy marketing name. It is important that you go through these different Acts and say whether they would be capable of major amendment, rewriting or starting again with a second Act, under that power, or not, as the case may be. That is one of the Acts that we are working on at present, and, when the work has been completed, I will be able to reply to you as to whether it would be capable of amendment or rewriting.

Cau Swyddfeydd Post yn Abertawe Post Office Closures in Swansea

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on post office closures in Swansea? (OAQ36417)

Jenny Randerson: Un pŵer galluogi pwysig sydd wrth wraidd y weledigaeth yn 'Iaith Pawb' yw Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993. A allwch egluro sut y byddai unrhyw Ddeddf newydd ar gyfer y Gymraeg, os câi ei chynnig, yn cyd-fynd â'ch awgrym newydd am y modd y gallem gael rhagor o bwerau? Onid deddf newydd ar gyfer y Gymraeg yw'r union ddeddfwriaeth na ellid, yn realistig, roi pwerau iddi o fewn fframwaith o gyfraith Seisnig? A ydych yn derbyn y byddai'n annerbyniol i ddyfodol y Gymraeg mewn deddfwriaeth fod ar orchymyn Aelodau Seneddol o Loegr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi mater Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, gan mai diddorol yw cymharu'r hyn a ddigwyddodd cyn datganoli â'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ers hynny. Honno oedd un o'r ychydig ddeddfau ar gyfer Cymru'n unig—credaf fod rhyw dair neu bedair—dros gyfnod o tua 20 mlynedd. Bellach ceir oddeutu un Ddeddf y flwyddyn yn hytrach nag un bob saith neu wyth mlynedd. Fy amcan wrth gynnig y syniad hwn yn y gynhadledd ar ddatganoli yr wythnos diwethaf, gan egluro mai gwaith sydd ar y gweill ydyw, ond ei fod yn cael ei brofi i weld a yw'n ymarferol ei roi gerbron pleidiau gwleidyddol Cymru—a'r Blaid Lafur, a sôn am fy nghyfrifoldeb fy hun—yw gweld a oes rhai Deddfau, neu ddiwygiadau i Ddeddfau, yr ydym wedi gofyn amdanynt, y gellid eu gwneud o dan argymhelliad 13.2 plws, fel y gellid ei alw'n fras, er nad yw'n enw marchnata atyniadol. Mae'n bwysig ystyried y gwahanol Ddeddfau hyn a dweud a ellid eu diwygio'n helaeth, eu hailysgrifennu neu eu hailgychwyn drwy ail Ddeddf, o dan y pŵer hwnnw, neu beidio, fel sy'n berthnasol. Dyna un o'r Deddfau yr ydym yn gweithio arni ar hyn o bryd, ac, ar ôl cwblhau'r gwaith, byddaf yn gallu'ch ateb ynghylch a fyddai modd ei diwygio neu'i hailysgrifennu.

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar y sefyllfa yn Abertawe o ran cau swyddfeydd post? (OAQ36417)

The First Minister: To date, under the network reinvention of the Post Office Ltd, one post office has already closed in the Swansea local authority area, and a further 16 have been put forward as potential closures. To help counter the effects of network reinvention, our post office development fund has provided funding of £4.1 million to 105 post offices across Wales. Six of those are in the Swansea area, and £300,000—a maximum of about £50,000 per post office—has been allocated so that they can make much-needed structural, aesthetic and security improvements, purchase essential equipment and diversify services for the benefit of local residents.

David Lloyd: What will you do about Labour's decision at Westminster to privatise the post office, which has resulted in the 16 post office closures in Swansea? Will you stand up to Labour MPs on this matter and on many other matters?

The First Minister: We have provided £50,000 worth of funding to six post offices, and, at the same time, we are putting maximum pressure on the Government to give us a list of where it is thinking of closing post offices, because we do not want to grant-aid post offices that have no chance of surviving. We want to put our money into the sub-post-office businesses, which have a chance of surviving, provided that they diversify, modernise security and so on. It is up to the Department of Trade and Industry to decide on financial pressures and on the kind of post office that it expects to see, but we can try to ensure that, by grant-aiding certain post offices with up to £50,000 each—and this is a good opportunity to advertise the fact that that grant is available—we retain a viable post office network, servicing the whole of the population of Wales.

Val Lloyd: The closure of local post offices in Swansea is a blow to my constituency and, in particular, to the regular users of those post offices, and I will continue to make the case for keeping them open. You have mentioned the post office development fund, which was the first of its kind in the UK. Do you agree that that fund assists other post offices in

Y Prif Weinidog: Hyd yma, o dan y gwaith o ad-drefnu rhwydwaith Swyddfa'r Post Cyf, mae un swyddfa bost wedi cau eisoes yn ardal awdurdod lleol Abertawe, ac mae 16 ar ben hynny wedi'u hawgrymu fel rhai y gellid eu cau. Er mwyn helpu i wrthweithio effeithiau'r ad-drefnu ar y rhwydwaith, mae ein cronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post wedi darparu gwerth £4.1 miliwn o gyllid i 105 o swyddfeydd post ledled Cymru. Mae chwech ohonynt yn ardal Abertawe, ac mae £300,000—uchafswm o tua £50,000 i bob swyddfa bost—wedi'i ddyrannu fel y gallant wneud gwelliannau y mae eu mawr angen i'w hadeiladau, eu golwg neu eu diogeledd, prynu offer hanfodol a chynnig gwasanaethau eraill er budd trigolion lleol.

David Lloyd: Beth a wnewch ynghylch penderfyniad Llafur yn San Steffan i breifateiddio Swyddfa'r Post, sydd wedi arwain at gau 16 o swyddfeydd post yn Abertawe? A wnewch herio ASau Llafur ar y mater hwn ac ar sawl mater arall?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi rhoi gwerth £50,000 o gyllid i chwe swyddfa bost, ac, ar yr un pryd, yr ydym yn rhoi'r pwysau mwyaf posibl ar y Llywodraeth i roi inni restr o'r manau y mae'n ystyried cau swyddfeydd post, gan nad ydym am roi cymorth grant i swyddfeydd post nad oes obaith iddynt barhau. Yr ydym am roi ein harian ym musnesau'r is-swyddfeydd post, y mae gobaith iddynt barhau, ar yr amod eu bod yn arallgyfeirio, yn moderneiddio eu diogeledd ac yn y blaen. Lle'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yw penderfynu ar bwysau ariannol ac ar y math o swyddfa bost y mae'n disgwyl ei gweld, ond gallwn geisio sicrhau, drwy roi cymorth grant i rai swyddfeydd post o hyd at £50,000 yr un—ac mae hyn yn gyfle da i hysbysebu'r ffaith bod y grant hwnnw ar gael—ein bod yn cadw rhwydwaith dichonadwy o swyddfeydd post, sy'n gwasanaethu holl bobl Cymru.

Val Lloyd: Mae cau swyddfeydd post lleol yn Abertawe yn ergyd i'm hetholaeth ac, yn benodol, i'r rhai sy'n defnyddio'r swyddfeydd post hynny'n rheolaidd, a pharhaf i ddadlau dros eu cadw'n agored. Cyfeiriasoch at y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a oedd y gyntaf o'i bath yn y DU. A ydych yn cytuno bod y gronfa

Swansea to remain open, as a focal point in their locality, and to widen the services and facilities that they offer their communities?

The First Minister: Yes. As I understand it—and I will correct it in a letter to you if I am wrong—Post Office Ltd has a vision of the network in which there are no post offices within a mile of each other. It wants them to be a little more widely dispersed. Population changes have sometimes removed some of the population from areas where the old network might have made sense but does not now. Therefore, we have tried to ensure this dispersal of an effective network. That is why Graig Lwyd, Broughton Avenue, Conwy Road, Colwyn Avenue, Reynoldston in the Gower, and St Helen's have received Assembly grants.

Peter Black: In yesterday's press, Swansea Labour MPs and constituency AMs branded the Post Office's consultation process a charade. Do you not believe that they should be directing their criticism towards the Government, whose policy on post offices is the real charade?

The First Minister: That is a matter between Swansea MPs and the Department of Trade and Industry, on which they have the ability to ask questions of DTI Ministers. There may be Treasury pressure, or other pressures, on Post Office Ltd, of which we are not fully aware. We try to ensure that, where we can use this grant-making power, there is a viable network. We can only do that if we have information from the Post Office about which post offices it will definitely close, which ones it would not close provided we assist the process of modernisation, and which ones are not in peril.

Alun Cairns: How do you reconcile the views of Labour activists, councillors, AMs, and even MPs, who supported the network reinvention, which is a Government-sponsored initiative, with their opposition to the closures of Swansea post offices, or is it just synthetic opposition?

honno'n helpu swyddfeydd post eraill yn Abertawe i barhau'n agored, fel canolbwynt i'w hardal, ac yn ehangu'r dewis o wasanaethau a chyfleusterau a gynigiant i'w cymunedau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Fel yr wyf yn ei ddeall—ac fe'i cywiraf drwy anfon llythyr atoch os wyf wedi camddeall hyn—mae Swyddfa'r Post Cyf yn rhagweld na fydd unrhyw swyddfeydd post sydd o fewn milltir i'w gilydd. Mae am eu gwasgaru ychydig yn fwy. Mewn rhai achosion, mae newidiadau mewn poblogaeth wedi peri bod llai'n byw mewn ardaloedd fel nad yw'r hen rwydwaith yn addas bellach. Gan hynny, yr ydym wedi ceisio sicrhau bod y rhwydwaith yn cael ei wasgaru'n effeithiol. Dyna pam y mae Graig Lwyd, Broughton Avenue, Conwy Road, Colwyn Avenue, Reynoldston yng Ngŵyr, a St Helen's wedi cael grantiau gan y Cynulliad.

Peter Black: Yn y wasg ddoe, gwnaeth ASau Llafur ac ACau etholaeth Abertawe alw proses ymgynghori Swyddfa'r Post yn siarâd. Oni chredwch y dylent gyfeirio eu beirmiadaeth at y Llywodraeth, gan mai ei pholisi hi ar swyddfeydd post yw'r gwir siarâd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r mater hwnnw'n un sydd cyd-rhwng ASau Abertawe a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, y gallant ofyn cwestiynau yn ei gylch i Weinidogion yr adran. Efallai fod pwysau o du'r Trysorlys, neu bwysau eraill, ar Swyddfa'r Post Cyf, na wyddom amdanynt yn llawn. Ceisiwn sicrhau, lle y gallwn ddefnyddio'r pŵer hwn i roi grant, y bydd rhwydwaith dichonadwy. Ni allwn ond gwneud hynny os cawn wybodaeth gan Swyddfa'r Post ynghylch y swyddfeydd post y mae'n sicr o'u cau, y rhai nas caeai ar yr amod y gwnawn hyrwyddo'r broses moderneiddio, a'r rhai nad ydynt mewn unrhyw fath o berygl.

Alun Cairns: Sut yr ydych yn cysoni barn gweithredwyr, cynghorwyr, ACau, a hyd yn oed ASau Llafur, a oedd o blaid ad-drefnu'r rhwydwaith, sy'n fenter a noddur gan y Llywodraeth, â'u gwrthwynebiad i gau swyddfeydd post yn Abertawe, ynteu ai gwrthwynebiad hollol ffug ydyw?

The First Minister: You are trying to mind read. The Post Office has come up with the network reinvention; that may be under pressure from the DTI and the Treasury to reduce the Post Office's losses, but when has there ever been a nationalised industry that did not come under pressure to do something about any losses that it made? There has been a major turnaround, fortunately, in the Post Office's finances. Network reinvention is reducing the overall numbers of post offices; ensuring that they are modernised is part of that reinvention. Whenever a loss-making public body undertakes a trading activity, that loss will have to be put right in some way or another. There may be arguments about whether it has been done in the right way, but we are making a constructive contribution to ensuring that the people of Wales will always have post offices conveniently available to them.

Y Llywydd: Cyn i mi alw ar Glyn Davies i ofyn cwestiwn 5, croesawaf yn ffurfiol lywydd ac aelodau pwyllgor amaeth Cynulliad Rhanbarthol Twsgani, sydd gyda ni heddiw yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn ceisio darllen meddyliau. Swyddfa'r Post a gynigiodd ad-drefnu'r rhwydwaith; efallai fod hynny wedi digwydd o dan bwysau gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys i leihau colledion Swyddfa'r Post, ond pa ddiwydiant gwladoleddig a gafwyd erioed na ddaeth o dan bwysau i wneud rhywbeth ynghylch unrhyw golledion a wnaeth? Yn ffodus, bu newid mawr er gwell yn sefyllfa ariannol Swyddfa'r Post. Mae'r gwaith o ad-drefnu'r rhwydwaith yn lleihau nifer y swyddfeydd post; mae sicrhau eu moderneiddio'n rhan o'r gwaith hwnnw. Pryd bynnag y mae corff cyhoeddus sy'n gwneud colled yn masnachu, bydd yn rhaid gwneud iawn am y golled honno rywsut neu'i gilydd. Efallai fod dadleuon o ran a wnaed hynny'n iawn, ond yr ydym yn cyfrannu'n gadarnhaol at sicrhau y bydd swyddfeydd post ar gael yn hwylus bob amser i bobl Cymru.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Glyn Davies to ask question 5, I formally welcome the president and members of the agriculture committee of the Regional Assembly of Tuscany, who are with us today in the public gallery. [*Applause.*]

Diogelu Gwlyptiroedd The Protection of Wetlands

Q5 Glyn Davies: What strategy does the First Minister have to protect the wetlands of Wales? (OAQ36406)

The First Minister: We are signatories of the Ramsar convention, an international agreement that gives global protection to wetland areas of international significance in order to conserve the world's water supply and wetland habitat. There are 10 Ramsar sites in Wales. The Countryside Council for Wales is improving other wetlands through sites of special scientific interest management agreements and the European Community's Natura 2000 network of sites. Other protection schemes, such as Wetlands for Wales, are being developed through partnership activity.

Glyn Davies: Do you accept that huge economic benefits arise from an effective wetlands strategy and the varied wildlife that it brings? The revival of the red kite has

C5 Glyn Davies: Pa strategaeth sydd gan y Prif Weinidog er mwyn diogelu gwlyptiroedd Cymru? (OAQ36406)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi llofnodi cytundeb Ramsar, cytundeb rhyngwladol sy'n amddiffyn gwlyptiroedd o bwys rhyngwladol drwy'r byd er mwyn cadw cyflenwad dŵr y byd a chynefinoedd ar wlyptiroedd. Mae 10 safle Ramsar yng Nghymru. Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru'n gwella gwlyptiroedd eraill drwy gytundebau ar reoli safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig a rhwydwaith safleoedd Natura 2000 y Gymuned Ewropeaidd. Mae cynlluniau diogelu eraill, fel Gwlyptiroedd i Gymru, yn cael eu datblygu drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth.

Glyn Davies: A ydych yn derbyn bod buddion economaidd enfawr i'w cael o strategaeth effeithiol ar gyfer gwlyptiroedd a'r bywyd gwyllt amrywiol a geir yn sgîl

brought huge economic benefits to mid Wales. Do you also accept that the fact that ospreys are nesting in Wales for the first time for many decades has huge potential for promoting Wales's rivers and wetlands?

The First Minister: Yes. The word 'ospreys' has two meanings in Wales; sometimes, because of the rugby team based in Swansea and Neath, we forget that the original osprey was an extremely attractive bird, which, unfortunately, left Wales some decades ago, and has now returned. We are trying to ensure that the Wetlands for Wales programme is widely understood and is fully used as a collaborative project between the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, North Wales Wildlife Trust, the Environment Agency and the countryside council, and using funding from the heritage lottery fund to acquire and manage various wetland sites in Wales. I am not sure that that will necessarily mean that ospreys will nest there or find that habitat attractive, but it is important that the wetlands habitat is well-protected because it benefits tourism and conservation and ensures that Wales has a more sustainable society.

2.30 p.m.

Janet Ryder: The mudflats along the Dee estuary, which are a habitat for wading birds, are widely renowned for being a wetland area and they will be affected should any dredging take place there. Will you publish any advice that you have been given by the Welsh Development Agency or the Environment Agency regarding dredging in the Dee estuary?

The First Minister: The Dee estuary, the Burry inlet and the Severn estuary, are Ramsar sites and special protected areas. There are complex procedures for such areas when there are proposals to develop intertidal mudflats, by dredging for example, which are covered by those designations. That involves balancing the environmental benefits of sustaining those wetlands with the occasional

hynny? Mae adferiad y barcod coch wedi dod â buddion economaidd enfawr i'r Canolbarth. A ydych hefyd yn derbyn bod y ffaith bod gweilch y pysgod yn nythu yng Nghymru am y tro cyntaf ers degawdau lawer yn cynnig potensial mawr i hyrwyddo afonydd a gwlyptiroedd Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Mae dwy ystyr i'r gair 'gweilch' yng Nghymru; weithiau, oherwydd y tîm rygbi sydd â'i ganolfan yn Abertawe a Chastell-nedd, anghofiwn fod y gwalch y pysgod gwreiddiol yn aderyn hardd iawn, a adawodd Gymru rai degawdau'n ôl, gwaetha'r modd, ac sydd bellach wedi dychwelyd. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau dealltwriaeth gyffredinol o raglen Gwlyptiroedd i Gymru a defnydd llawn ohoni fel prosiect ar gyfer gwaith ar y cyd rhwng y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar, Ymddiriedolaeth Bywyd Gwyllt Gogledd Cymru, Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r cyngor cefn gwlad, a defnyddio cyllid o gronfa dreftadaeth y loteri i gael a rheoli amryw o safleoedd ar wlyptiroedd yng Nghymru, nid wyf yn sicr y bydd hynny'n golygu o reidrwydd y bydd gweilch y pysgod yn nythu yno neu'n cael eu denu gan y cynefin hwnnw, ond mae'n bwysig amddiffyn cynefinoedd y gwlyptiroedd yn dda gan eu bod yn fanteisiol i dwristiaeth a chadwraeth ac yn sicrhau cymdeithas fwy cynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Janet Ryder: Mae'r traethellau lleidiog ar hyd aber Dyfrdwy, sy'n gynefin i adar hirgoes, yn enwog iawn fel gwlyptir a byddant yn cael eu heffeithio os bydd unrhyw garthu yno. A wnewch gyhoeddi unrhyw gyngor a roddwyd i chi gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru neu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ynghylch carthu yn aber Dyfrdwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae aber Dyfrdwy, mornant Porth Tywyn ac aber Hafren yn safleoedd Ramsar ac yn ardaloedd gwarchod arbennig. Mae gweithdrefnau cymhleth i'w dilyn ar gyfer ardaloedd o'r fath os oes cynigion i ddatblygu traethellau lleidiog rhynglanwol, drwy garthu er enghraifft, o dan y dynodiadau hyn. Mae hynny'n golygu pwysu a mesur y buddion amgylcheddol o

need to develop because of overriding economic or social reasons that are of public importance. The issue regarding dredging the Dee estuary to provide access for freighters to carry Airbus A380 wings, which have been transported by barge from Connah's Quay—from Mostyn to France so that they can be assembled in Toulouse—is vexing. It is currently under consideration and we would have to consider at what stage any advice that we receive would be published under the Code of Practice on Public Access to Information.

John Griffiths: The Gwent levels have great environmental value and many parts of them have been relatively unchanged for many centuries, although there has been considerable development on some parts of the levels. Do you agree that we need to closely consider how we can protect important areas such as this within Wales?

The First Minister: They are classic wetlands, which are inside the sea wall. There are no intertidal mudflats, which Janet referred to in her question regarding the Dee estuary, which are similar but are outside the sea wall. The levels are unique in Wales because they have existed since the middle ages when the sea walls were first erected by monks, I believe, to try to bring agricultural cultivation to that area. I will write to you about the specific conservation issues regarding the Gwent levels, which run from Cardiff to the Severn bridge.

gynnal y gwlyptiroedd hynny ochr yn ochr â'r angen i'w datblygu o bryd i'w gilydd am resymau economaidd neu gymdeithasol sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i'r cyhoedd. Mae'r mater sy'n codi ynghylch carthu aber Dyfrdwy i roi mynediad i longau cludo gael cario adenydd Airbus A380, a gludwyd ar fad camlas o Gei Connah—o Fostyn i Ffrainc fel y gellir eu gosod yn Toulouse—yn un dyrys. Mae'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd a byddai'n rhaid inni ystyried pa bryd y cyhoeddiad unrhyw gyngor a gawn o dan y Cod Ymarfer ar Ganiatáu i'r Cyhoedd Weld Gwybodaeth.

John Griffiths: Mae gwerth amgylcheddol mawr i wastadeddau Gwent ac mae sawl rhan ohonynt yn gymharol ddigyfnewid ers canrifoedd lawer, er bod cryn ddatblygu wedi bod ar rai rhannau ohonynt. A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni ystyried yn ofalus y modd y gallwn amddiffyn ardaloedd pwysig o'r fath sydd yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Maent yn wlyptiroedd nodweddiadol, sydd o fewn y morglawdd. Nid oes unrhyw draethellau lleidiog rhynglanwol, y cyfeiriodd Janet atynt yn ei chwestiwn am aber Dyfrdwy, sy'n debyg ond sydd y tu allan i'r morglawdd. Mae'r gwastadeddau'n unigryw yng Nghymru gan eu bod yn bodoli ers yr oesoedd canol pan godwyd y morgloddiau gyntaf gan fynach, yr wyf yn credu, i geisio dechrau amaethu yn yr ardal honno. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch y materion cadwraeth penodol sy'n ymwneud â gwastadeddau Gwent, sy'n rhedeg o Gaerdydd i bont Hafren.

Amseroedd Aros am Driniaethau Orthopedeg yn Sir Fynwy Orthopaedic Waiting Times in Monmouthshire

Q6 David Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on orthopaedic waiting times in Monmouthshire? (OAQ36412)

The First Minister: At the end of May 2001, there were 623 patients waiting over 18 months for an in-patient or day case operation in trauma and orthopaedics services. This fell to zero by February 2003 and has stayed at this level since then. Therefore, currently, no patients are waiting more than 18 months for an orthopaedic operation in Monmouth. At the end of June 2003, 137 patients in Monmouthshire were

C6 David Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar amseroedd aros am driniaethau orthopedeg yn sir Fynwy? (OAQ36412)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar ddiwedd Mai 2001, yr oedd 623 o gleifion a fu'n disgwyl am fwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth fel cleifion mewnol neu achosion dydd mewn gwasanaethau trawma ac orthopedeg. Yr oedd y ffigur hwnnw wedi disgyn i ddim erbyn Chwefror 2003 ac arhosodd ar y lefel honno ers hynny. Felly, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes unrhyw gleifion a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig yn sir Fynwy. Ar

waiting over 18 months for their first orthopaedic out-patient appointment. By the end of April 2004, that figure had fallen to eight.

David Davies: The truth is that there is a waiting list to get on the waiting list. Targets set by the Welsh Assembly Government for health services aim to ensure that no-one waits longer than 18 months. However, the private sector contracts agreed in England assist English hospitals to meet a waiting target of six months. That is not conjecture on my part; that was included in an official response sent to one of my constituents by the local health board. It is written in black and white. Patients are waiting three times longer in Wales than they are in England, not because of previous Governments, but because of your inability to ditch your political dogma and hatred of the private sector and begin to use private sector beds to treat NHS patients. When will you put those patients before your own political dogma?

The First Minister: I am sorry to disillusion you on this issue, David. You obviously did not listen to the figures that I quoted, which clearly indicate the huge improvement that has been seen over the past two to three years, with figures for those waiting over 18 months falling from 623 to zero and a considerable reduction from 137 to eight in the number of out-patients waiting over 18 months for treatment. The figures are obviously moving in the right direction. However, we realise that there is a capacity issue in Cardiff and the Vale and Gwent, which make up around 27 per cent of the population of Wales.

This was addressed by the Edwards report. It was easier to address the report's recommendations directly in the case of the Cardiff and Vale area, but it was more difficult, because of management problems and the option that Professor Edwards recommended, to do so in the case of Newport, Gwent and the Monmouthshire area. After detailed consideration, the recommendations turned out to be poor value

ddiwedd Mehefin 2003, yr oedd 137 o gleifion yn sir Fynwy a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am eu hapwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol orthopedig. Erbyn diwedd Ebrill 2004, yr oedd y ffigur hwnnw wedi disgyn i wyth.

David Davies: Y gwir yw bod rhestr aros i fynd ar y rhestr aros. Mae targedau a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwasanaethau ieched yn ceisio sicrhau na fydd neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis. Serch hynny, mae'r contractau â'r sector preifat a gytunwyd yn Lloegr yn helpu ysbytai yn Lloegr i gyrraedd targed aros o chwe mis. Nid dyfalu yw hynny ar fy rhan; rhoddwyd hynny mewn ateb swyddogol a anfonwyd at un o'm hetholwyr gan y bwrdd ieched lleol. Mae ar ddu a gwyn. Mae cleifion yn disgwyl dair gwaith yn hwy yng Nghymru nag y maent yn Lloegr, nid oherwydd Llywodraethau blaenorol, ond oherwydd eich anallu i gael gwared ar eich dogma wleidyddol a'ch casineb at y sector preifat ac i ddechrau defnyddio gwelyau'r sector preifat i drin cleifion y GIG. Pa bryd y rhoddwch y cleifion hynny o flaen eich dogma wleidyddol eich hun?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf eich siomi ar y mater hwn, David. Mae'n amlwg na wrandawasoch ar y ffigurau a ddyfynnais, sy'n dangos yn glir y gwelliant mawr a gafwyd dros y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf, gan fod y ffigurau ar gyfer y rhai a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis wedi disgyn o 623 i ddim a nifer y cleifion allanol a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth wedi gostwng yn sylweddol o 137 i wyth. Mae'n amlwg bod y ffigurau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Er hynny, sylweddolwn fod mater yn codi o ran capasiti yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro a Gwent, sy'n ffurfio tua 27 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru.

Ymdriniwyd â hynny yn adroddiad Edwards. Yr oedd yn haws ymateb yn syth i argymhellion yr adroddiad yn achos ardal Caerdydd a'r Fro, ond yr oedd yn fwy anodd gwneud hynny, oherwydd problemau o ran rheoli a'r dewis a argymhellodd yr Athro Edwards, yn achos ardal Casnewydd, Gwent a sir Fynwy. Ar ôl eu hystyried yn fanwl, gwelwyd bod yr argymhellion yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian, ond yr ydym yn

for money, but we hope that, within eight months or so, building will be commenced at St Woolos Hospital. This will be a treatment centre of the kind that you may say ought to be in the private sector. However, money has been allocated to provide a treatment centre in the Newport area, servicing Monmouthshire. Therefore, a mini treatment centre will be set up at St Woolos Hospital, and it will be ready for operation around January 2006.

Peter Law: Will you accept that many patients in Blaenau Gwent go to Nevill Hall hospital in Monmouthshire and were looking forward, after your announcement of £6 million following the Edwards report, to receiving orthopaedic treatment as quickly as possible in order to experience pain relief? We are now told that the five health boards cannot agree with the trust, and that even if they were to start work tomorrow, it would be two years before the St Woolos development would come into operation, while the Nevill Hall orthopaedic ward has disappeared off the radar. There is considerable concern surrounding this issue. People should not be in pain, and I ask you to intervene to resolve the situation.

The First Minister: I answered half of your question in my reply to David Davies. The Edwards report's recommendations were found to be poor value for money. Two of the proposals found to be poor value for money have since been replaced by a strategy that has been agreed by the five health boards at long last. This includes the new treatment centre at St Woolos Hospital. Edwards's recommendation for a medical ward at Nevill Hall was found to be poor value for money, and was therefore rejected. Similarly, the idea of bringing in a kind of instant portakabin solution at St Woolos was found to be poor value for money. There were also management issues within the Gwent Health Authority as regards how it ran orthopaedic services. The Edwards report stated that these issues had to be addressed and that it could not be given more money until this was done. This has now been done and has resulted in improved waiting times. The solution has been agreed, the full business case has been accepted, and it is now a matter of working on the details and going out to tender in order

gobeithio y bydd y gwaith adeiladu'n dechrau yn Ysbyty St Woolos o fewn rhyw wyth mis. Bydd hon yn ganolfan driniaethau o'r math y gallech ddweud y dylai fod yn y sector preifat. Fodd bynnag, dyrannwyd arian i ddarparu canolfan driniaethau yn ardal Casnewydd, a fydd yn gwasanaethu sir Fynwy. Felly, sefydlir ganolfan driniaethau fach yn Ysbyty St Woolos, a bydd yn barod i gychwyn ar ei gwaith tua mis Ionawr 2006.

Peter Law: A wnewch dderbyn bod llawer o gleifion ym Mlaenau Gwent yn mynd i ysbyty Nevill Hall yn sir Fynwy a'u bod yn edrych ymlaen, wedi ichi gyhoeddi £6 miliwn yn sgîl adroddiad Edwards, at gael triniaeth orthopedig cyn gynted ag y byddai modd er mwyn cael lleddfu eu poen? Dywedir wrthym yn awr na all y pum bwrdd iechyd gytuno â'r ymddiriedolaeth, a hyd yn oed pe baent yn dechrau gweithio yfory, yr âi dwy flynedd heibio cyn i'r datblygiad yn ysbyty St Woolos ddechrau ar ei waith, tra bo'r ward orthopedig yn ysbyty Nevill Hall wedi'i hanghofio'n llwyr. Mae cryn bryder ynghylch y mater hwn. Ni ddylai pobl fod mewn poen, a gofynnaf ichi ymyrryd i ddatrys y sefyllfa.

Y Prif Weinidog: Atebais hanner eich cwestiwn yn fy ymateb i David Davies. Cafwyd bod yr argymhellion yn adroddiad Edwards yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian. Mae strategaeth a gytunwyd o'r diwedd gan y pum bwrdd iechyd wedi'i rhoi ar waith bellach yn lle dau o'r argymhellion y cafwyd eu bod yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y ganolfan driniaethau newydd yn Ysbyty St Woolos. Cafwyd bod argymhelliad Edwards am ward feddygol yn ysbyty Nevill Hall yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian, ac felly fe'i gwrthodwyd. Yn yr un modd, cafwyd bod y syniad o gael ateb sydyn drwy osod cabanau symudol yn ysbyty St Woolos yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian. Yr oedd materion yn codi o ran rheoli hefyd o fewn Awdurdod Iechyd Gwent ynghylch y modd yr oedd yn rhedeg gwasanaethau orthopedig. Dywedwyd yn adroddiad Edwards fod rhaid ymdrin â'r materion hyn ac na ellid rhoi mwy o arian iddo hyd nes y gwnaed hynny. Gwnaed hynny bellach ac mae'r amseroedd aros wedi gwella o ganlyniad. Cytunwyd ar yr ateb, a

for building work to be started in January 2005 and to be completed in January 2006. However, there will be many other interventions that we can undertake in the meantime.

derbyniwyd yr achos busnes llawn, ac mae bellach yn fater o weithio ar y manylion a gosod gwaith ar dendr er mwyn cael dechrau'r gwaith adeiladu yn Ionawr 2005 a'i gwblhau yn Ionawr 2006. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn gallu ymyrryd mewn sawl modd arall yn y cyfamser.

Prisiau Llaeth Milk Prices

C7 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig mewn cysylltiad â phrisiau llaeth? (OAQ36419)

Q7 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs Select Committee report regarding milk prices? (OAQ36419)

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd swyddogion Adran yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, ynghyd â'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill ac Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, yn ystyried yr argymhellion a gyflwynwyd i'r Llywodraeth gan y pwyllgor dethol. Rhaid i DEFRA gyflwyno ymateb y Llywodraeth i argymhellion y pwyllgor erbyn 7 Awst.

The First Minister: Officials from the Department for Environment, Planning and Countryside, along with the other devolved administrations and the Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, will consider the select committee's recommendations to the Government. DEFRA has to submit the Government's response to the committee by 7 August.

Alun Ffred Jones: Dywed yr adroddiad:

Alun Ffred Jones: The report states that

'We agree with the Office of Fair Trading and the Competition Commission that there remains a fundamental imbalance of negotiating strength between supermarkets and most of the suppliers'.

Cytunwn â'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg a'r Comisiwn Cystadleuaeth fod anghydbwysedd sylfaenol yn bod o hyd o ran cryfder negodi rhwng archfarchnadoedd a'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyflenwyr.

A yw'r Prif Weinidog o'r farn nad yw'r mesurau presennol yn ddigon cryf i sicrhau pris teg am laeth i gynhyrchwyr, a pha newidiadau yr hoffai eu gweld?

Does the First Minister believe the current measures to be sufficiently robust to secure a fair price for milk producers, and what changes would he like to see made?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae 18c y litr yn bris isel dros ben, ond nid oes gennym ni locus neu darged yng nghyswllt prisiau llaeth. Mae'n siŵr gennyf fod nifer o safbwyntiau gwahanol ar gryfder y prynwr a pha un a yw archfarchnadoedd fel Tesco a Sainsbury's yn camddefnyddio eu pwerau yn erbyn ffermwyr bach. Credaf fod y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig wedi astudio'r pwnc hwn ac na chafodd hyd i dystiolaeth fod archfarchnadoedd yn camddefnyddio eu grym, ac felly nid oedd modd troi at y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg.

The First Minister: Eighteen pence per litre is an extremely low price, but we have no locus or target as regards the price of milk. I am sure that there are differing views on purchasing power and on whether supermarkets such as Tesco and Sainsbury's misuse this power in dealing with small farmers. I believe that the Select Committee on Welsh Affairs has considered this issue and that it did not find any evidence to suggest that supermarkets misuse their power, therefore it was unable to turn to the Office of Fair Trading for assistance.

Brynle Williams: The House of Commons

Brynle Williams: Awgrymodd y pwyllgor

select committee recently suggested that, in the context of milk prices, there is 18p per litre adrift, about which no-one seems to know anything. Processors say that they do not know anything about it, and producers definitely do not know anything about it. Do you agree that it is time that we, as a Government body, looked into this to set a sensible price for milk? There will be a distortion of agriculture in Wales, if the milk industry continues as it is. Eighteen pence is a great deal of money—the wholesaler gets 18p a litre, when it retails at 63p, the processor and retailer, therefore, gets sufficient money from it.

2.40 p.m.

The First Minister: Carwyn Jones and I recognise that there are enormous problems for dairy farmers to make a profit, if they are getting a bulk wholesale price of 18p a litre, as is currently the case. Not only is there a profit-making problem, but there is also one of investing in the business in order to modernise and keep abreast of the latest technology. However, the House of Commons' Select Committee in its report, published on 8 June, does not propose regulatory solutions to the problems, but prefers to recommend addressing them through a mixture of recommendations for actions by the industry and improved information from the Government along the lines of who gets what and where is money being made in the different phases of the food chain.

The Assembly has no locus in this area, but our general policy is to try to ensure that we get the value added in Wales, rather than simply be bulk milk suppliers for others to provide the value added and get the jobs and profits and so on. We want that value added in Wales by converting the milk into milk-based products.

Mick Bates: I like your use of the word 'action'. Would you perhaps consider doing something more positive such as selling more milk, meeting high nutritional standards and reducing tooth decay? You have the powers to do all of those things. Will you introduce

dethol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn ddiweddar fod 18c y litr ar goll yng nghyd-destun prisiau llaeth, yr ymddengys na wŷr neb ddim yn ei gylch. Dywed y proseswyr na wyddant ddim amdano ac, yn sicr, ni wŷr y cynhyrchwyr ddim amdano. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bryd i ni, fel corff Llywodraeth, ymchwilio i hyn er mwyn pennu pris synhwyrol am laeth? Bydd amaethyddiaeth yn cael ei hystumio yng Nghymru, os pery'r diwydiant llaeth fel y mae. Mae 18c yn swm sylweddol—caiff y cyfanwerthwr 18c y litr, a adwerthir wedyn am 63c, felly mae'r proseswr a'r adwerthwr yn cael digon o arian ohono.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Carwyn Jones a mi'n cydnabod ei bod yn anodd iawn i ffermwyr llaeth wneud elw, o gael pris cyfanwerthol crynswth o 18c y litr, fel y maent ar hyn o bryd. Nid yn unig y mae problem o ran gwneud elw, ond mae un hefyd o ran buddsoddi yn y busnes er mwyn moderneiddio a chadw'n wastad â'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf. Fodd bynnag, yn adroddiad pwyllgor dethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin, a gyhoeddwyd ar 8 Mehefin, ni chynigir atebion i'r problemau hyn drwy reoleiddio, ac mae'n well ganddo argymhell ymdrin â hwy drwy gymysgedd o argymhellion ar gyfer camau i'w cymryd gan y diwydiant a gwell gwybodaeth gan y Llywodraeth ynghylch pwy a gaiff beth a pha arian a wneir yn ngwahanol rannau'r gadwyn fwyd.

Nid oes gan y Cynulliad unrhyw le i weithredu yn y maes hwn, ond ein polisi cyffredinol yw ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn ychwanegu gwerth yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na bod yn ddim ond cyflenwyr llaeth crynswth fel y gall eraill ddarparu'r gwerth ychwanegol a chael y swyddi a'r elw ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym am gael y gwerth ychwanegol hwnnw yng Nghymru drwy droi llaeth yn gynhyrchion sy'n seiliedig ar laeth.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn hoffi'ch defnydd o'r geiriau 'cymryd camau'. Efallai yr hoffech ystyried gwneud rhywbeth mwy cadarnhaol fel gwerthu mwy o laeth, cyrraedd safonau maethol a lleihau pydredd dannedd? Mae gennych bwerau i wneud pob un o'r pethau

free school milk at key stage 2?

The First Minister: We have no proposals to do so, but we believe that the children of Wales benefit greatly from milk provision at key stage 1, which is a progressive measure regardless of any dogmatic inferences that might be made by people listening to that comment. It is a progressive initiative, which provides a good diet base for young children aged three to seven in Wales.

hynny. A wnewch gyflwyno llaeth am ddim yn yr ysgol yng nghyfnod allweddol 2?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennym unrhyw fwrriad i wneud hynny, ond credwn fod plant Cymru'n cael budd mawr o'r llaeth a ddarperir yng nghyfnod allweddol 1, gan fod hwnnw'n fesur cynyddgar beth bynnag am unrhyw gasgliadau dogmatig y gallai'r rhai sy'n gwrando ar y sylw hwnnw ddod iddynt. Menter gynyddgar ydyw, sy'n cynnig sylfaen dda i ddeiet plant ifanc tair i saith oed yng Nghymru.

Cyrffyw Plant Children's Curfews

Q8 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the use of children's curfews to combat antisocial behaviour? (OAQ36402)

The First Minister: A range of measures is available to tackle anti-social behaviour, including child curfew schemes. These are not intended to be used in isolation, but as part of an integrated response to tackling anti-social behaviour in local areas. Confusion is often caused by press headlines, which refer to curfews, for example, in Holyhead and Rhymney—the top of the Rhymney Valley, not the bottom. Neither are examples of curfews, but of the power of dispersal, where the police tell gangs of youths, who turn up in the same place every night, such as St Cybi's churchyard in Holyhead and in a square in Rhymney. Curfews are specific whereas dispersal orders are designed to control gangs.

William Graham: In the situations that you described, curfews or dispersal orders seem to work reasonably well in small communities. However, what solutions can you propose for larger towns and cities, where enforcement is a major problem for the police?

The First Minister: I am not aware of any failure to use dispersal orders because the gangs of youths are too numerous or because the potential to enforce them is too limited. If you refer to a specific example, then please write to me, but it is important that the police

C8 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y defnydd a wneir o gyrffyw plant er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol? (OAQ36402)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae amryw o fesurau ar gael i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, gan gynnwys cynlluniau cyrffyw plant. Ni fwriedir iddynt gael eu defnyddio ar wahân, ond fel rhan o ymateb integredig i ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol mewn ardaloedd lleol. Perir dryswch yn aml gan benawdau yn y wasg, sy'n cyfeirio at gyrffyw, er enghraifft, yng Nghaerdybi a Rhymni—pen uchaf cwm Rhymni, nid y gwaelod. Nid enghreifftiau o gyrffyw yw'r naill na'r llall, ond o'r pŵer i wasgaru, lle y mae'r heddlu'n dweud wrth gangiau o bobl ifanc, sy'n dod i'r un fan bob nos, fel mynwent eglwys Cybi yng Nghaerdybi a'r sgwâr yn Rhymni. Mae cyrffyw yn beth penodol tra dyfeisiwyd gorchmynion gwasgaru i reoli gangiau.

William Graham: Yn y sefyllfaoedd a ddisgrifiasoch, ymddengys fod cyrffyw neu orchmynion gwasgaru'n llwyddo'n eithaf da mewn cymunedau bach. Fodd bynnag, pa atebion y gallwch eu cynnig ar gyfer trefi mwy a dinasoedd, lle y mae gorfodi'n peri problem fawr i'r heddlu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn am unrhyw fethiant i ddefnyddio gorchmynion gwasgaru am fod y gangiau o bobl ifanc yn rhy niferus neu am fod y cyfle i'w gorfodi'n rhy gyfyngedig. Os ydych yn cyfeirio at enghraifft benodol, ysgrifennwch ataf, os gwelwch yn dda, ond

now use this power to disperse under Section 30 of the Crime and Disorder Act 1998. It seems to work in Holyhead. Many of these new powers—such as anti-social behaviour orders—in their different forms under the Act, are still being edged forward and the police are learning from each other as to how to enforce them. If you have a problem in your constituency, then I would be interested to hear about it and I will ensure that either I or Edwina Hart reply to you.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you, like me, welcome the decision of the Labour-led Caerphilly County Borough Council to set up a delegated anti-social behaviour unit as a means of helping to tackle such problems and do you further welcome its generous decision to take £100,000 from the councillors' allowance budget to provide for the better management of community and youth centre facilities as a means of helping to keep young people off the streets and provide them with a more positive outlook?

The First Minister: Crime reduction partnerships, which were introduced in the Crime and Disorder Act 1998, give local authorities an opportunity, for the first time, to play their full part, alongside the police, probation services and other services, in tackling crime. That sounds like a constructive use of that power, and I welcome that. I am also glad that you mentioned the fact that there is no point using the power of prohibition or sanction alone. You must also provide a diversion so that young people have something else to do that is at least as exciting and challenging for those of them who may be on the cusp between going down the wrong road and being able to play a full and constructive part in society.

Pydredd Dannedd Plant Childhood Tooth Decay

Q9 Carl Sargeant: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government undertaking to tackle childhood tooth decay? (OAQ36408)

mae'n bwysig bod yr heddlu'n awr yn defnyddio'r pŵer hwn i wasgaru a geir o dan Adran 30 Deddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998. Ymddengys ei fod yn llwyddo yng Nghaerdybi. Mae llawer o'r pwerau newydd hyn—fel gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol—ar eu gwahanol ffurfiau o dan y Ddeddf, yn dal i gael eu datblygu fesul tipyn ac mae'r heddluoedd yn dysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd o ran y modd i'w gorfodi. Os oes gennych broblem yn eich etholaeth, byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed amdani a sicrhaf y byddaf fi neu Edwina Hart yn eich ateb.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych chi, fel minnau, yn croesawu penderfyniad Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, sy'n cael ei arwain gan Lafur, i sefydlu uned ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ddirprwyedig fel modd i helpu i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau o'r fath ac a ydych ymhellach yn croesawu ei benderfyniad hael i gymryd £100,000 o gyllideb lwfansau'r cynghorwyr i ddarparu ar gyfer gwell rheoli ar gyfleusterau mewn canolfannau cymunedol ac ieuencid fel modd i helpu i gadw pobl ifanc oddi ar y strydoedd a rhoi iddynt olwg mwy cadarnhaol ar y byd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae partneriaethau gostwng troseddu, a gyflwynwyd yn Neddf Trosedd ac Anhrefn 1998, yn rhoi cyfle am y tro cyntaf i awdurdodau lleol gael chwarae rhan lawn, ochr yn ochr â'r heddlu, gwasanaethau prawf a gwasanaethau eraill, wrth fynd i'r afael â throseddu. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn ddefnydd adeiladol o'r pŵer hwnnw, a chroesawaf hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch eich bod wedi sôn am y ffaith nad oes diben defnyddio'r pŵer i wahardd neu gosbi ar ei ben ei hun. Rhaid hefyd gynnig gwrthatyniadau fel bod gan bobl ifanc rywbeth arall i'w wneud sydd o leiaf mor gyffrous ac ymestynnol i'r rhai a allai fod ar y groesffordd rhwng mynd ar gyfeiliorn a gallu chwarae rhan lawn ac adeiladol mewn gymdeithas.

C9 Carl Sargeant: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â phydredd dannedd ymysg plant? (OAQ36408)

The First Minister: The latest figures—which are quite old—show that the dental health of five-year-olds in Wales improved between 1997-98 and 2001-02. We hope that the rate of improvement has not reached a plateau. In addition to the promotion of oral health in schools through health visitors, we have initiated a practical programme that tackles these problems. A total of £1.5 million has been made available for a fissure sealant and oral health promotion programme. That is delivered to children at schools in areas identified as deprived by our Communities First programme.

Carl Sargeant: Will you join me in welcoming the news of a trial six-month emergency dental scheme for unregistered patients at Deeside Community Hospital in my constituency of Alyn and Deeside? In addition to improved emergency care, improving NHS dental services in areas such as my constituency would provide parents with the information they need to take appropriate action with regard to their children's teeth. What action are you taking, with the Minister for Health and Social Services, to achieve this improvement?

The First Minister: I would not like to write home about it, but more children are covered by NHS dentistry in Wales than in England, although not by much: 51 per cent compared with 48 per cent. The kind of programme available to children, who are not registered with an NHS dentist, is therefore important. Our publication on children from birth to five years of age, which, I believe, all new mothers receive from their health visitor, contains a section on teeth that covers issues such as fluoride, diet and tooth care and so on, and some Cymorth projects also include oral health programmes. These projects work with people who are up to the age of 25 to ensure that oral health education is successfully provided, and also ensure that toothbrushes and toothpaste are distributed to parents via the health visitor network.

Eleanor Burnham: That is all very well,

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf—sy'n eithaf hen—yn dangos bod iechyd deintyddol rhai pum mlwydd oed yng Nghymru wedi gwella rhwng 1997-98 a 2001-02. Gobeithiwn nad yw'r gyfradd wella wedi aros ar hynny. Yn ogystal â hybu iechyd geneuol mewn ysgolion drwy waith ymwelwyr iechyd, cychwynasom raglen ymarferol sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. Darparwyd cyfanswm o £1.5 miliwn ar gyfer rhaglen selio holltau a hybu iechyd geneuol. Darperir hynny i blant mewn ysgolion mewn ardaloedd a ddynodir yn rhai difreintiedig gan ein rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Carl Sargeant: A wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu'r newydd am gynllun deintyddol brys arbrofol dros chwe mis ar gyfer cleifion sydd heb eu cofrestru yn Ysbyty Cymunedol Glannau Dyfrdwy yn fy etholaeth, sef Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? Yn ogystal â gwell gofal brys, byddai gwell gwasanaethau deintyddol GIG mewn ardaloedd fel fy etholaeth i'n fodd i roi i rieni y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen i gymryd camau priodol mewn cysylltiad â dannedd eu plant. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd, gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i sicrhau'r gwelliant hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni charwn frolio hyn, ond mae mwy o blant yn cael gofal drwy ddeintyddiaeth y GIG yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ond nid o gymaint â hynny: 51 y cant o'i gymharu ag 48 y cant. Gan hynny, mae'r math o raglen sydd ar gael i blant sydd heb eu cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG yn bwysig. Mae ein cyhoeddiad ar blant o'u geni hyd eu pum mlwydd oed, y credaf fod yr holl famau newydd yn ei gael gan eu hymwelydd iechyd, yn cynnwys adran ar ddannedd sy'n ymdrin â materion fel fflworid, deiet a phydredd dannedd ac yn y blaen, ac mae rhai o brosiectau Cymorth yn cynnwys rhaglenni iechyd geneuol hefyd. Mae'r prosiectau hynny'n gweithio gyda rhai hyd at 25 oed i sicrhau y darperir addysg ynghylch iechyd geneuol yn llwyddiannus, a hefyd i sicrhau y caiff brwsys dannedd a phâst dannedd eu dosbarthu i rieni drwy rwydwaith yr ymwelwyr iechyd.

Eleanor Burnham: Hawdd y gallwch

First Minister, but Radio 4's *Today* programme conducted a survey of child tooth decay and found that Wales is one of the worst affected areas in the UK. Dentists blame sugary bottled drinks in particular. In October 2003, the British Dental Association warned of a severe shortage of dentists. More than 100 people queued in Abergele in my constituency recently to register with a dentist. In addition to encouraging the preventative aspects of dental care, what will you do to prevent dental practices from losing dentists?

The First Minister: You referred to sugary drinks, which rot the enamel on children's teeth and so on. This is a major problem, and is one reason why we have introduced the water cooler programme in our schools, and, similarly, the fruit tuck shops, which provide an alternative to sugary drinks and snacks. That is important. The fissure sealant programme is effective, but it is not yet available in all parts of Wales. On registration, although we are ahead of England, we are by no means complacent, precisely because of the problems that you have just mentioned. It is true that the less well off you are, the more likely it is that you and your children will have bad teeth. That is why it is important that we prioritise Communities First areas in the fissure sealant programme.

David Melding: You know that considerable reform in delivering dental services is being considered at present. Do you agree that any new contract will have to move away from focusing on piece work to repair bad teeth and concentrate much more on preventing tooth decay in the first instance?

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: As I understand it, that is precisely the purpose of the changes being proposed in the dental contract. Previously, a dentist did not necessarily get paid unless he 'did something' such as filling a tooth, which was not always necessary. Nevertheless, you would not get paid if all you did was look at the teeth and say, 'Well, you seem okay, but

ddweud hynny, Brif Weinidog, ond gwnaeth rhaglen *Today* ar Radio 4 arolwg o bydredd dannedd ymysg plant a chanfu mai Cymru yw un o'r ardaloedd a effeithiwyd yn waethaf yn y DU. Mae deintyddion yn rhoi'r bai ar ddiodydd potel siwgwraidd yn benodol. Yn Hydref 2003, rhybuddiodd Cymdeithas Ddeintyddol Prydain am brinder difrifol o ddeintyddion. Safodd mwy na 100 o bobl mewn ciw yn Abergele yn fy etholaeth i'n ddiweddar i gofrestru gyda deintydd. Yn ogystal â hybu agweddau ataliol ar ofal deintyddol, beth a wnewch i atal practisiau deintyddol rhag colli deintyddion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriasoch at ddiodydd siwgwraidd, sy'n pydru'r enamel ar ddannedd plant ac yn y blaen. Mae hon yn broblem fawr, a dyma un rheswm yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r rhaglen oeryddion dŵr yn ein hysgolion, ac, yn yr un modd, y siopau ffrwythau mewn ysgolion, sy'n cynnig dewis yn lle diodydd a byrbrydau siwgwraidd. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r rhaglen selio holltau'n effeithiol, ond nid yw ar gael eto ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Ynghylch cofrestru, er ein bod ar y blaen i Loegr, nid ydym yn ddifater o bell ffordd, oherwydd yr union broblemau yr ydych newydd eu crybwyll. Mae'n wir mai po leiaf cefnog yr ydych, mwyaf tebygol ydyw y bydd dannedd drwg gennych chi a'ch plant. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig inni roi blaenoriaeth i ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn y rhaglen selio holltau.

David Melding: Gwyddoch fod diwygio sylweddol ar y dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau deintyddol yn cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd yn rhaid i unrhyw gontract newydd droi oddi wrth waith ar dasg i drwsio dannedd drwg a chanolbwyntio'n fwy o lawer ar atal pydredd dannedd yn y lle cyntaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr wyf yn ei ddeall, dyna union bwrpas y newidiadau a gynigir yn y contract deintyddol. O'r blaen, ni châi deintydd ei dalu o reidrwydd oni bai ei fod yn 'gwneud rhywbeth' fel llenwi dant, nad oedd yn angenrheidiol bob amser. Er hynny, ni chaech eich talu os mai'r cwbl a wnaech oedd edrych ar y dannedd a dweud, 'Wel, yr ydych

you should check your gums'. It is important that the piece-work element is remedied in the new contract, with dentists focused on prevention and providing genuine dental advice and care. I understand that your point is at the heart of what we are looking for in the new dental contract.

yn edrych yn iawn, ond dylech gadw golwg ar gig y dannedd'. Mae'n bwysig cywiro'r elfen honno sy'n ymwneud â gwaith ar dasg yn y contract newydd, fel bod deintyddion yn canolbwyntio ar atal a chynnig cyngor a gofal deintyddol go iawn. Deallaf fod lle canolog i'r pwynt a wnaethoch yn yr hyn a geisiwn yn y contract deintyddol newydd.

Swyddi Meddygon Ymgynghorol Gwag yn y GIG NHS Consultant Vacancies

Q10 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on NHS consultant vacancies in Wales? (OAQ36420)

C10 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y swyddi meddygon ymgynghorol gwag sydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ36420)

The First Minister: The latest published staff data show that, as at September 2002—the figures for September 2003 will be available in a few weeks—the number of whole-time equivalent consultants had increased from 1,312 in September 2001 to 1,377. That is an increase of 4.9 per cent. On vacancies, as at 31 March 2003, there were 153 recorded consultant posts in the NHS that had been vacant for three months or more.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r data diweddaraf a gyhoeddwyd ar staff yn dangos, fel yr oedd ym Medi 2002—bydd y ffigurau ar gyfer Medi 2003 ar gael ymhen rhai wythnosau—fod nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol sy'n cyfateb i rai amser llawn wedi codi o 1,312 ym mis Medi 2001 i 1,377. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 4.9 y cant. Ynghylch swyddi gwag, fel yr oedd ar 31 Mawrth 2003, yr oedd 153 o swyddi meddygon ymgynghorol yn y GIG y cofnodwyd eu bod yn wag ers tri mis neu fwy.

Helen Mary Jones: I am sure that you agree that that is a woeful situation. In Carmarthenshire, a quarter of the consultant posts are unfilled—the situation is much worse than it was when your Government came to power five years ago. When will you take this issue seriously, and give some strategic direction to the NHS in Wales; or is the truth, First Minister, that your Government cannot be trusted to sort out the NHS any more than you, the leader of your party, can be trusted to stand up to Labour MPs to get the Assembly the law-making powers that it needs?

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod honno'n sefyllfa druenus. Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae chwarter swyddi'r meddygon ymgynghorol heb eu llenwi—mae'r sefyllfa'n waeth o lawer nag yr oedd pan ddaeth eich Llywodraeth i rym bum mlynedd yn ôl. Pa bryd y cymerwch y mater hwn o ddifrif, a rhoi rhyw fath o gyfeiriad strategol i'r GIG yng Nghymru; neu ai'r gwir amdani, Brif Weinidog, yw na ellir ymddiried yn eich Llywodraeth i roi trefn ar y GIG yn fwy nag y gellir ymddiried ynoch chi, arweinydd eich plaid, i wrthsefyll ASau Llafur i sicrhau i'r Cynulliad y pwerau deddfu y mae arno'u hangen?

The First Minister: You know how cheap a remark that was, Helen Mary, and I think that you will regret it when you read it tomorrow. The number of whole-time equivalent consultants in Wales has increased by 30 per cent since 1997—on average, an increase of 5 per cent a year. To increase the number of consultants you must advertise the posts, and you do not always fill those posts

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwyddoch mor salw oedd y sylw hwnnw, Helen Mary, a chredaf y bydd yn edifar gennych amdano pan ddarllenwch ef yfory. Mae nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol sy'n cyfateb i rai llawn amser yng Nghymru wedi codi o 30 y cant er 1997—cynnydd o 5 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Er mwyn cynyddu nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol, rhaid hysbysebu'r

immediately. If we were decreasing the number of consultant posts and still had a high vacancy rate, it would be shameful, but we are increasing the number of posts and it is not always easy to fill them. It is a symptom of our increasing the number of posts. I regret that 153 posts are vacant. The vacancy figure can be transitional, however, because people have to give three months' notice, or sometimes a longer period of notice, to their employer. However, we want to put that right as soon as possible. I will write to you to clarify the position further when the September 2003 figures become available in a few weeks' time.

Nick Bourne: About the time that you gave your now-infamous speech about devolution and healthcare, I received a letter from a constituent who faces a wait of four years—so the consultant says in the letter—for a bone density scan. You came to power promising to improve the health service, and it is outrageous that, after more than seven years of a Labour Government, it is now so much worse. What do you say to my constituent, aged 78, who faces a four-year wait?

The First Minister: I wish that she would write, or that you would pass the case on so that it can be dealt with in the normal way. Your allegation that the health service has got worse is manifestly absurd. The number of tests and the range of activities that are carried out in the health service, in both general practitioner and hospital settings, have increased enormously, as has the number of people who are dealt with at accident and emergency units and in elective surgery. That is despite the problems that we have faced in terms of orthopaedic surgery in south-east Wales, which I fully accept. We have a far better health service now, with more consultants, nurses, GPs, and other medical professionals to provide the range of medical and other services across the board.

Nick Bourne: I will contact my 78-year-old

swyddi, ac ni lenwir y swyddi hynny ar unwaith ym mhob achos. Pe baem yn lleihau nifer y swyddi meddygon ymgynghorol a'r gyfradd o swyddi gwag yn parhau'n uchel, byddai hynny'n warthus, ond yr ydym yn cynyddu nifer y swyddi ac nid yw bob amser yn hawdd eu llenwi. Mae'n ganlyniad i'r ffaith ein bod yn cynyddu nifer y swyddi. Mae'n ofid i mi fod 153 o swyddi'n wag. Gall y ffigur am swyddi gwag fod yn un dros dro, fodd bynnag, gan fod rhaid rhoi tri mis o rybudd, neu fwy mewn rhai achosion, i'r cyflogwr. Er hynny, yr ydym am gywiro hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Ysgrifennaf atoch i egluro'r sefyllfa pan fydd y ffigurau am Fedi 2003 ar gael ymhen ychydig wythnosau.

Nick Bourne: Tua'r un adeg ag y traddodasoch eich araith ddrwgenwog bellach am ddatganoli a gofal iechyd, cefais lythyr oddi wrth etholwr sy'n wynebu pedair blynedd o aros—felly y dywed y meddyg ymgynghorol yn y llythyr—am sgan i ganfod dwysedd esgyrn. Daethoch i rym gan addo gwella'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a pheth gwarthus, ar ôl mwy na saith mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, yw ei fod bellach gymaint yn waeth. Beth a ddywedwch wrth fy etholwr, 78 oed, sy'n wynebu pedair blynedd o aros?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai'n ysgrifennu, neu pe baech chi'n rhoi gwybod am yr achos hwn fel y gellir ymdrin ag ef yn y modd arferol. Mae'n amlwg bod eich haerriad bod y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi gwaethygu yn hurt. Bu cynnydd aruthrol yn nifer y profion a'r amrywiaeth o weithgareddau a gyflawnir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, gan ymarferwyr cyffredinol ac mewn ysbytai, fel y bu yn nifer y bobl a gaiff sylw mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys a thrwy lawdriniaethau dewisol. Mae hynny er gwaethaf y problemau a wynebasom o ran llawfeddygaeth orthopedig yn y De-ddwyrain, yr wyf yn eu derbyn yn llwyr. Mae gennym wasanaeth iechyd gwell o lawer yn awr, gyda mwy o feddygon ymgynghorol, nyrsys, meddygon teulu, a gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol eraill i ddarparu amryw o wasanaethau meddygol a rhai eraill yn gyffredinol.

Nick Bourne: Cysylltaf â'm hetholwr 78

constituent and say that we heard your usual party piece that the health service is better than it was. That is absolute nonsense. You must know that it is nonsense: your Labour MPs at Westminster do. If that is the best that you can do in response to hearing that a 78-year-old faces a four-year wait to see a consultant at Singleton, you are not fit to hold the office that you are supposed to exercise. Can you do better than that this time?

The First Minister: That is just pure abuse, Nick. I would have thought that you could have come up with something better than that. You should pass on any such case to the Minister for Health and Social Services so that she can see whether anything can be done, and whether it is within the rules and targets. You trail that case around here as if it demonstrates that the health service has got worse. You have found one case with an unacceptably long wait for a particular kind of test, but that does not change the fact that, undoubtedly, the situation is much improved on that we inherited seven and five years ago. As I mentioned earlier, there are improvements in the number of consultants and in the amount of work going on in the health service. Also, there is the change in the structure that we all agreed, from Wanless's report, had to be made. For example, we all ask ourselves why it is that some 55 per cent of hospital admissions in Wales are via the emergency room—it is 35 per cent in England—and what we should do about that. The answer is that we need medical assessment units to deal with people as they come in, and to administer all the tests that the consultant thinks necessary so that only those that truly need an in-patient bed are given one; the others are sent home or come back the following week or whenever the consultant tells them to do so. That is an urgently needed measure for us, because the pattern in Wales is so different from that in England. We have to put that right through medical assessment units. That started in Royal Glamorgan Hospital, and units are now available in the hospitals in Bridgend, in the Heath, in Morriston and elsewhere.

mlwydd oed a dweud ein bod wedi clywed eich pwt arferol bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn well nag yr oedd. Nonsens llwyr yw hynny. Yr ydych yn sicr o wybod bod hynny'n nonsens: mae'ch ASau Llafur yn San Steffan yn gwybod hynny. Os mai hynny yw'r gorau y gallwch ei wneud mewn ymateb ar ôl clywed bod rhywun 78 mlwydd oed yn wynebu pedair blynedd o aros i weld meddyg ymgynghorol yn Singleton, nid ydych yn addas i ddal y swydd yr ydych i fod i'w chyflawni. A allwch wneud yn well na hynny y tro hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sarhad pur yw hynny, Nick, a dim arall. Tybiwn y gallasech feddwl am rywbeth gwell na hynny. Dylech roi gwybod am unrhyw achos o'r fath i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fel y gall weld a oes rhywbeth y gellir ei wneud, ac a yw'n unol â'r rheolau a'r targedau. Yr ydych yn llusgo'r achos hwnnw o gwmpas yma fel pe bai'n dangos bod y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi gwaethygu. Yr ydych wedi canfod un achos lle y mae arhosiad annerbyniol o hir am brawf o fath penodol, ond nid yw hynny'n newid y ffaith bod y sefyllfa'n sicr yn well o lawer na'r un a adawyd i ni saith a phum mlynedd yn ôl. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae gwelliannau o ran nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol a maint y gwaith a wneir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Hefyd, mae'r ad-drefnu y gwnaethom oll gyntuno ei fod yn angenrheidiol, yn sgîl adroddiad Wanless. Er enghraifft, yr ydym oll yn ymholi pam y mae 55 y cant o'r rhai a dderbynnir i ysbytai yng Nghymru yn dod drwy'r ystafell achosion brys—35 y cant ydyw yn Lloegr—a beth y dylem ei wneud am hynny. Yr ateb yw bod arnom angen unedau asesu meddygol i ddelio â phobl wrth iddynt ddod i mewn, ac i wneud yr holl brofion y mae'r meddyg ymgynghorol yn credu eu bod yn angenrheidiol fel mai dim ond y rhai y mae arnynt wir angen gwely claf mewnol a gaiff un; anfonir y lleill adref neu deuant yn ôl yr wythnos wedyn neu ba bryd bynnag y dywed y meddyg ymgynghorol wrthynt. Mae taer angen inni gymryd y cam hwnnw, gan fod y patrwm yng Nghymru mor wahanol i'r un yn Lloegr. Rhaid inni gywiro hynny drwy unedau asesu meddygol. Dechreuwyd hynny yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, ac mae unedau ar gael yn awr yn yr ysbytai ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yn y

Mynydd Bychan, yn Nhreforys ac mewn mannau eraill.

Nick Bourne: I am astounded by your complacency. You did not give an answer on the dreadful state of the waiting lists, and you must know that that was what the question was about. You have dodged the question twice. The situation is far worse than it was seven years ago. You talked about people not needing choice: that is fine for those who can afford to pay for private treatment. You can exercise that choice, or choose not to do so. People like my constituent, however, are being forced to mortgage their homes, and to beg or borrow the money for private treatment—we all know that is true. That is the result. People have a choice—those who can afford it. You are happy with that. If these people had a real choice, they would not have to wait four years and you would not have to stand before us and say that you do not know whether the wait is within the target time. How outrageous for a First Minister not to state how outrageous it is that a 78-year-old has to wait four years to see a consultant. Is it not time that you answered the question put to you?

The First Minister: You are so concerned with trying to abuse me, that you have not actually asked a question. You have not asked me whether the wait is within or outside the target time. It was I who tried to raise the issue. Instead of using this technique of abuse in raising individual cases in Plenary, thinking it to be terribly clever, you should have passed that letter on so that comment could have been made as to whether it is acceptable or not or whether there is a problem with the particular technology and so on. I cannot respond in detail when I do not even know your constituent's name or the details of the case. You are using the case to avoid discussing the voucher system and the privatisation of the health service that your party wants to introduce. We have expanded the health service. I gave the figures to David Davies. He did not want to listen to them—you clearly do not want to do so either. There is an improvement in long waits for orthopaedic treatment. I am not complacent: I said that

Nick Bourne: Synnaf at eich difaterwch. Ni roesoch ateb ynghylch cyflwr gwarthus y rhestrau aros, ac mae'n rhaid eich bod yn gwybod mai am hynny yr oedd y cwestiwn. Yr ydych wedi osgoi'r cwestiwn ddwywaith. Mae'r sefyllfa'n waeth o lawer nag yr oedd saith mlynedd yn ôl. Dywedasoch nad oedd ar bobl angen dewis: mae hynny'n iawn i'r sawl sy'n gallu fforddio talu am driniaeth breifat. Gallwch arfer y dewis hwnnw, neu ddewis peidio. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl fel fy etholwr yn cael eu gorfodi i forgeisio eu cartrefi, ac i grefu neu fenthycu arian ar gyfer triniaeth breifat—yr ydym oll yn gwybod bod hynny'n wir. Dyna'r canlyniad. Mae dewis gan bobl—y rhai y gallant ei fforddio. Yr ydych yn fodlon ar hynny. Pe bai gwir ddewis gan y bobl hyn, ni fyddent yn gorfod disgwyl am bedair blynedd ac ni fyddai'n rhaid i chi sefyll o'n blaen a dweud na wyddoch a yw'r arhosiad o fewn yr amser targed. Mor warthus ydyw i Brif Weinidog beidio â dweud mor warthus ydyw i rywun 78 mlwydd oed orfod disgwyl am bedair blynedd i weld meddyg ymgynghorol. Onid yw'n bryd ichi ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd i chi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn ymboeni gymaint ynghylch ceisio fy sarhau fel nad ydych wedi gofyn cwestiwn. Ni ofynasoch i mi a yw'r arhosiad y tu mewn neu'r tu allan i'r amser targed. Myfi a geisiodd godi'r mater hwnnw. Yn hytrach nag arfer y dechneg hon o fwrw sen wrth godi achosion unigol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, gan feddwl bod hynny'n hynod glyfar, dylech fod wedi trosglwyddo'r llythyr hwnnw fel y gallesid gwneud sylw ynghylch a yw'n dderbyniol ai peidio neu a oes rhyw drafferth ynghylch y dechnoleg sydd dan sylw ac yn y blaen. Ni allaf ymateb yn fanwl a minnau heb wybod enw'ch etholwr hyd yn oed neu fanylion yr achos. Yr ydych yn defnyddio'r achos i osgoi trafod y system talebau a'r preifateiddio ar y gwasanaeth iechyd y mae'ch plaid am eu cyflwyno. Yr ydym wedi ehangu'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Rhoddais y ffigurau i David Davies. Nid oedd am wrando arnynt—mae'n amlwg nad ydych chi ychwaith. Mae gwelliant o ran yr arosiadau hir am driniaeth orthopedig. Nid wyf yn ddifater: dywedais

that is the most difficult situation in the NHS in Wales, and it needs to be put right by means of an increase in capacity, which we are introducing in Llandough and Newport over the next six to eight months.

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Wrth ddiolch i'r Prif Weinidog, hoffwn ddweud fy mod yn teimlo bod llawer o siarad gwag neu fân siarad yn ystod yr atebion—o ddwy ochr y Siambr. Nid yw hynny'n briodol. Gofynnaf am fwy o barodrwydd i wrando ar y Prif Weinidog yn ateb cwestiynau yn gwrtais y tro nesaf.

mai honno yw'r sefyllfa anhawsaf yn y GIG yng Nghymru, a rhaid ei chywiro drwy gynyddu capasiti, a gyflwynir gennym yn Llandochau ac yng Nghasnewydd dros y chwech i wyth mis nesaf.

The Presiding Officer: That brings questions to the First Minister to an end. In thanking the First Minister, I would like to say that I feel that there is a lot of idle chatter or small talk going on during the answers—from both sides of the Chamber. That is not appropriate. I appeal to Members to listen courteously to the First Minister's answers to questions next time.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): There are two changes to report to this week's business. Today's motion to approve the Wales Centre For Health (Constitution, Membership and Procedures) Regulations 2004 has been moved to 7 July. Also, the motion to delegate the functions of the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales) Regulations 2004 to the First Minister has been moved to 7 July. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. I draw Members' attention to business for Tuesday 21 September, when I have scheduled a two-hour debate on the Clywch inquiry. Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined under Standing Order No. 24.6 that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:

the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Street Works (Inspection Fees) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Food (Emergency Control) (Wales) (Miscellaneous Amendments) (No. 2) Regulations 2004, and the Water Act 2003 (Commencement No. 2)

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Mae dau newid i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig heddiw i gymeradwyo Rheoliadau Canolfan Iechyd Cymru (Cyfansoddiad, Aelodaeth a Gweithdrefnau) 2004 wedi'i symud i 7 Gorffennaf. Hefyd, mae'r cynnig i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni (Cymru) 2004 i'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i symud i 7 Gorffennaf. Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol. Tynnaf sylw Aelodau at fusnes ar gyfer dydd Mawrth 21 Medi, pan wyf wedi amserlennu dadl ddwy awr ar ymchwiliad Clywch. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach:

Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Gweithfeydd Stryd (Ffioedd Archwilio) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Bwyd (Rheolaeth Frys) (Cymru) (Diwygiadau Amrywiol) (Rhif 2) 2004, a Gorchymyn Deddf Dŵr 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004.

(Wales) Order 2004.

3.00 p.m.

Y Llywydd: A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10. I call on the Minister to formally propose the business statement.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly adopts the business statement.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Why has the Cabinet turned down a request for the First Minister to make a full statement on his u-turn on powers for the National Assembly? He was ready to make a statement to the National Assembly on his support for primary law-making powers immediately after the Richard commission's proposals were brought before us, but he made a u-turn on the back of another speech about health last Friday. Is it not important that such significant policy changes are announced to the National Assembly? Do we not need to know whether the First Minister was floating his decision in a personal capacity, as First Minister, or as leader of the Labour Party? Had he discussed that with the Cabinet? Is there Cabinet responsibility for this? Who made this decision? Is it not important to the people of Wales that there is an opportunity to discuss this matter in detail?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pam y mae'r Cabinet wedi gwrthod cais ar i'r Prif Weinidog wneud datganiad llawn ar ei dro pedol ar bwerau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Yr oedd yn barod i roi datganiad i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ei gefnogaeth i bwerau deddfu sylfaenol yn union ar ôl dwyn cynigion comisiwn Richard ger ein bron, ond newidiodd ei safbwynt yn llwyr wrth roi arraith arall ynghylch iechyd ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Onid yw'n bwysig cyhoeddi newid sylweddol o'r fath i bolisi gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Onid oes arnom angen gwybod a oedd y Prif Weinidog yn rhoi gwybod am ei benderfyniad yn bersonol, yn rhinwedd ei swydd fel Prif Weinidog, neu fel arweinydd y Blaid Lafur? A oedd wedi trafod hynny gyda'r Cabinet? A yw'r Cabinet yn gyfrifol am hyn? Pwy a wnaeth y penderfyniad hwn? Onid yw'n bwysig i bobl Cymru y ceir cyfle i drafod y mater hwn yn fanwl?

On the First Minister's proposal that we should have framework legislation and orders in council, is it not incredible that the letter that you sent, Business Minister, to the Chair of the Legislation Committee shows that departments in England have no idea what is happening here? You have written a letter saying that you have made strong representations to the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister about the need to keep it closely informed of legislation that has a bearing on Wales. You also say that the Food Standards Agency has no idea about the Assembly's legislative timetable. Is it not crucial that we have a full debate on this issue and a full statement by the First

Ynghylch awgrym y Prif Weinidog y dylem gael deddfwriaeth fframwaith a gorchmynion yn y cyfrin gyngor, onid yw'n anhygoel bod y llythyr a anfonasoch, Drefnydd, at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Deddfau yn dangos nad oes gan adrannau yn Lloegr unrhyw syniad o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yma? Yr ydych wedi ysgrifennu llythyr yn dweud eich bod wedi cyflwyno sylwadau cryf i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am yr angen i roi gwybodaeth fanwl iddo am ddeddfwriaeth sy'n berthnasol i Gymru. Dywedwch hefyd nad oes gan yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd unrhyw syniad am amserlen ddeddfwriaethol y Cynulliad. Onid yw'n hollbwysig inni gael dadl llawn ar y mater hwn a datganiad llawn

Minister?

Nick Bourne: The Richard commission's report deserves to be taken seriously by all Members and by all parties, and I have made that clear in Plenary previously. We are entitled to a statement from the First Minister as to what his position, and the position of his Government, now is. In answering questions, he talked rather mysteriously of options 3 and 4, conjuring up visions of fresh policy statements made on the hoof without reference to the Assembly. I strongly suspect that he has been ritually humiliated by Labour Members of Parliament at Westminster, and that that is the reason for the volte-face. We need a serious chance to hear what this Labour Government's policy is—if there is one—on the Richard commission, as it cost a great deal of money and took a long time. Therefore, it deserves serious consideration. It is getting that from our party, but where does the First Minister's Government stand?

Peter Black: Like the previous two speakers, I express my party's desire for a statement from the First Minister on these issues. It is right that we should have a clear view from the Government on the issue of primary law-making powers. We also want a debate on other issues. We are concerned that, for example, tomorrow we will be discussing the Wanless review and recommendations, and I understand that the Minister may refer to the local action plans, but the motion makes no reference to those action plans and there is no indication as to whether the Assembly Government will endorse them or not. It is an important subject and we want a much wider debate on it, and specifically on those action plans.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I will take Peter's last—

Carl Sargeant *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members who wish to take part should indicate that they wish to do so more clearly and earlier.

Carl Sargeant: I would like to point out that there are pillars in the way.

gan y Prif Weinidog?

Nick Bourne: Mae adroddiad comisiwn Richard yn haeddu cael ei gymryd o ddirif gan yr holl Aelodau a'r holl bleidiau, ac yr wyf wedi egluro hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn hyn. Mae gennym hawl i gael datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog am yr hyn yw ei safbwynt ef, a safbwynt ei Lywodraeth, yn awr. Wrth ateb cwestiynau, soniodd yn eithaf dirgelaidd am ddewisiadau 3 a 4, gan beri disgwyl datganiadau polisi newydd byrffyr sydd heb eu cyfeirio i'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn amau'n gryf ei fod wedi'i ddarostwng gan Aelodau Seneddol Llafur yn San Steffan, ac mai hynny a achosodd y newid llwyr hwn yn ei safbwynt. Rhaid inni gael cyfle iawn i glywed beth yw polisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon—os oes ganddi un—ar gomisiwn Richard, gan ei fod wedi costio llawer iawn o arian ac wedi cymryd amser hir. Gan hynny, mae'n haeddu cael ei ystyried o ddirif. Caiff hynny gan ein plaid ni, ond beth yw safbwynt Llywodraeth y Prif Weinidog?

Peter Black: Fel y ddau siaradwr blaenorol, mynegaf ddymuniad fy mhlaid i gael datganiad gan y Prif Weinidog ar y materion hyn. Mae'n iawn inni gael barn bendant gan y Llywodraeth am fater pwerau deddfu sylfaenol. Yr ydym hefyd am gael dadl ar faterion eraill. Yr ydym yn bryderus, er enghraifft, y byddwn yfory'n trafod adolygiad ac argymhellion Wanless, a deallaf y gallai'r Gweinidog gyfeirio at gynlluniau gweithredu lleol, ond nid yw'r cynnig yn cyfeirio o gwbl at y cynlluniau gweithredu hynny ac nid oes dim i ddangos a fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymeradwyo ai peidio. Mae'n bwnc pwysig ac yr ydym am gael dadl lawer ehangach arno, ac ar y cynlluniau gweithredu hynny'n benodol.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cymeraf yr olaf o bwyntiau Peter—

Carl Sargeant *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dylai Aelodau sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan roi arwydd eu bod am wneud hynny'n gliriach ac yn gynharach.

Carl Sargeant: Carwn nodi bod pileri yn y ffordd.

I want to mention issues such as manufacturing in Wales and its successes, and matters such as technical advice note 8 on renewable energy, which will come up in the future. These matters are important to us and affect Wales. On the Richard commission, would the opposition parties like to join the Labour group, because we are discussing the Richard Commission's report? Unlike those parties, we are prepared to discuss what we are doing.

If you can find time in the future, Business Minister, may we have a discussion about the use of the word 'wrong' and the selection process for attending game shows? I thank my colleague, Huw Lewis, for bailing out his opposition colleagues on *University Challenge* yesterday.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): On Peter's point, the Wanless action plans were e-mailed to Members on 11 May, so you have all the information that you need for tomorrow's debate. It is for individual Members to ensure that they have all the information that they need to follow, and contribute to, the debate.

I welcome your sensible suggestions, Carl. I informed all party business managers earlier this afternoon that I do not propose to make Government time available to accommodate their requests. I have flagged up for the past few weeks just how tight business is between now and the recess. I cannot make time available. We have already had a debate on the Richard commission in which the First Minister made clear that a widespread debate was now needed throughout Wales on its proposals. His speech last week was a contribution to that debate. Members may have forgotten that we are already scheduled to return to the issue early in the new term.

On the Tories' request for a statement from Jane on the choice agenda, Members may be interested to hear from the Welsh Conservatives about their proposals on choice, including those to reintroduce grammar schools. I suggest that they use their own time to explain their policies to the

Dymunaf sôn am faterion fel gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru a'i lwyddiannau, a materion fel nodyn cyngor technegol 8 ar ynni adnewyddadwy, a fydd yn codi yn y dyfodol. Mae'r materion hyn yn bwysig i ni ac maent yn effeithio ar Gymru. Ynghylch comisiwn Richard, a garai'r gwrthbleidiau ymuno â'r grŵp Llafur, gan ein bod yn trafod adroddiad comisiwn Richard? Yn wahanol i'r pleidiau hynny, yr ydym yn barod i drafod yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud.

Os gallwch gael amser yn y dyfodol, Drefnydd, a gawn drafodaeth am y defnydd o'r gair 'anghywir' a'r broses dethol ar gyfer cymryd rhan mewn rhaglenni teledu cystadleuol? Diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis, am achub croen ei gyd-Aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau ar *University Challenge* ddoe.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Ynghylch pwynt Peter, anfonwyd y cynlluniau gweithredu Wanless drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau ar 11 Mai, felly mae gennych yr holl wybodaeth y mae arnoch ei hangen ar gyfer y ddadl yfory. Mater i Aelodau unigol yw sicrhau bod ganddynt yr holl wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen i ddilyn y ddadl a chymryd rhan ynddi.

Croesawaf eich awgrymiadau synhwyrol, Carl. Rhoddais wybod i reolwyr busnes yr holl bleidiau yn gynharach y prynhawn yma nad wyf yn bwriadu neilltuo amser o eiddo'r Llywodraeth i ymateb i'w ceisiadau. Yr wyf wedi nodi dros yr wythnosau diwethaf mor dynn yw hi o ran busnes o hyn hyd y toriad. Ni allaf neilltuo amser. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cael dadl ar gomisiwn Richard lle yr eglurodd y Prif Weinidog fod angen dadl eang yn awr ledled Cymru ar ei gynigion. Yr oedd ei araith yr wythnos diwethaf yn gyfraniad i'r ddadl honno. Efallai fod Aelodau wedi anghofio ein bod eisoes wedi trefnu i fynd yn ôl at y mater hwn yn gynnar yn y tymor newydd.

Ynghylch cais y Torïaid am ddatganiad gan Jane ar yr agenda ar ddewis, efallai y bydd o ddiddordeb i Aelodau glywed gan Geidwadwyr Cymru am eu cynigion ar ddewis, gan gynnwys y rhai i ailgyflwyno ysgolion gramadeg. Awgrymaf y dylent ddefnyddio eu hamser eu hunain i egluro eu

people of Wales. From our perspective, the more the people of Wales hear about their plans, the better it will be for us. The people of Wales have never voted for the Tories in any numbers: the more that they hear from them, the more they will realise how right they have been in that.

polisiâu i bobl Cymru. O'n rhan ni, po fwyaf y clyw pobl Cymru am eu cynlluniau, gorau oll y bydd i ni. Nid yw pobl Cymru erioed wedi pleidleisio'n llu dros y Toriaid: po fwyaf y clywant ganddynt, mwyaf y sylweddolant mor gywir y buont yn hynny o beth.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 26.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Jenny Randerson: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 24.27. Last Wednesday, 23 June, the Community Care, Services for Carers and Children's Services (Direct Payment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 were discussed in detail at the Health and Social Services Committee, and the Minister made commitments to deal with points raised by Members in the debate on the regulations. At no point did the Minister tell committee

Jenny Randerson: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27. Ddydd Mercher diwethaf, 23 Mehefin, bu trafod manwl ar Reoliadau Gofal Cymunedol, Gwasanaethau ar gyfer Gofalwyr a Gwasanaethau Plant (Taliadau Uniongyrchol) (Cymru) 2004 yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac ymrwymodd y Gweinidog i ddelio â'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Aelodau yn y ddadl ar y rheoliadau

that she had already agreed two days before, on 21 June, with her Cabinet colleagues to use the executive procedure in relation to these regulations. The reason that the Business Minister gives in a letter to party business managers for using the executive procedure is that it is not possible to make these regulations under standard procedure and have them in place by July. We have been aware of these regulations since last autumn, when the Minister used her intention to introduce them as a reason for opposing proposals for legislation under Standing Order No. 31, introduced by my colleague, Michael German. Consultation with local government took place between January and April, and it is proposed to have the regulations in force by November. In view of the fact that these regulations were imposed on English local authorities some years ago, and that only two Welsh local authorities do not yet have such schemes voluntarily in place, do you believe, Presiding Officer, that there is a genuine case of urgency here that justifies using the executive procedure by the Minister and the Cabinet?

3.10 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to Jenny Randerson for raising this issue on the use of executive procedure and I have listened carefully to the comments made. It is not for me to express an opinion on what the Minister may or may not have said in committee, but I am sure that all Ministers always strive to ensure that committees are fully aware of all salient facts. It is for the Cabinet to decide whether the use of the executive procedure was appropriate in terms of this legislation, and it is politically answerable in that regard. It would not be appropriate for me to interpose my judgment. However, on a point of constitutional principle and practice in the Assembly, I am sure that all Members will agree that the disapplication of procedural requirements, which is how our founding constitution, the Government of Wales Act 1998, describes the executive procedure, should always be an exceptional practice.

hynny. Ni ddywedodd y Gweinidog ar unrhyw adeg wrth y pwyllgor ei bod eisoes wedi cytuno ddeuddydd ynghynt, ar 21 Mehefin, gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion i ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol mewn cysylltiad â'r rheoliadau hyn. Y rheswm y mae'r Trefnydd yn ei roi mewn llythyr at reolwyr busnes y pleidiau am ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol yw nad oes modd gwneud y rheoliadau hyn o dan y weithdrefn arferol a'u rhoi ar waith erbyn mis Gorffennaf. Gwyddom am y rheoliadau hyn ers yr hydref diwethaf, pan ddefnyddiodd y Gweinidog ei bwriad i'w cyflwyno'n rheswm dros wrthwynebu cynigion am ddeddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, a gyflwynwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Michael German. Ymgynghorwyd â llywodraeth leol rhwng Ionawr ac Ebrill, a bwriedir rhoi'r rheoliadau mewn grym erbyn mis Tachwedd. Yng ngolwg y ffaith bod y rheoliadau hyn wedi'u gorfodi ar awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ac mai dim ond dau awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru sydd heb sefydlu cynlluniau o'r fath o'u gwirfodd eto, a ydych yn credu, Lywydd, fod gwir achos brys yn hyn o beth sy'n cyfiawnhau defnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol gan y Gweinidog a'r Cabinet?

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jenny Randerson am godi'r mater hwn ar ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol a gwrandewais yn astud ar y sylwadau a wnaed. Nid fy lle i yw mynegi barn am yr hyn y gallai'r Gweinidog fod wedi'i ddweud neu heb ei ddweud yn y pwyllgor, ond yr wyf yn sicr bod yr holl Weinidogion yn ceisio sicrhau bod pwyllgorau'n llwyr ymwybodol o'r holl ffeithiau perthnasol. Mater i'r Cabinet yw penderfynu a oedd defnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol yn briodol yng nghydestun y ddeddfwriaeth hon, ac mae'n wleidyddol atebol yn hynny o beth. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi ymyrryd drwy ddatgan barn. Fodd bynnag, ar bwynt o egwyddor gyfansoddiadol ac ymarfer yn y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr holl Aelodau'n cytuno y dylai'r arfer o ddatgymhwysio gofynion gweithdrefnol, sef y modd y mae ein cyfansoddiad sefydlol, Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn disgrifio'r weithdrefn weithredol, fod yn un eithriadol bob amser.

**Rheoliadau Canolfan Iechyd Cymru (Cyfansoddiad, Aelodaeth a
Gweithdrefnau) 2004**
**The Wales Centre for Health (Constitution, Membership and Procedures)
Regulations 2004**

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25(ii), cyflwynwyd gwrthwynebiad i sicrhau y caiff y rheoliadau drafft hyn ystyriaeth lawn gan y Cynulliad. Felly, ni chynigir cynnig ar y rheoliadau hyn heddiw.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25(ii), a notice of opposition was presented to ensure that these draft regulations are subject to full consideration by the Assembly. Therefore, a motion on these regulations will not be proposed today.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a
Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004**
**Approval of the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and
Amendments (Wales) Order 2004**

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 9 June 2004. (NDM2010)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 22 June 2004 in relation to the draft Order, the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004; and

2. approves that the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 9 June 2004; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 9 June 2004. (NDM2011)

In accordance with Standing Order No. 24, I propose that the Assembly approve the

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Mehefin 2004. (NDM2010)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 22 Mehefin 2004 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r:

a) Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Mehefin 2004; a'r

b) arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Mehefin 2004. (NDM2011)

Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24, cynigiau fod y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn

Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character and Amendments (Wales) Order 2004, which amends the Designation of Schools Having a Religious Character (Wales) Order 1999. It adds three schools to the list of those that have a religious character, namely Sarn Church of England school and Llanelwedd Church in Wales school in Powys and St Brigid's school in Denbighshire, which were omitted from the original Order in error. It adds two schools to the list, namely the Archbishop Rowan Williams school in Monmouthshire and St Oswald's school in Pembrokeshire, which are both Church in Wales schools and have been open since 1999. It also removes five schools from the list in the 1999 Order that have closed or are about to close. Finally, the entry for one school, namely St Paul's Church in Wales school in Wrexham, will be corrected as it is voluntary aided and not voluntary controlled, as was previously stated. The changes fulfil the Assembly's obligation to list all the schools in Wales that have a religious character. Such character is not acquired or lost by virtue of being designated or not designated in an Order made by the National Assembly for Wales; designation is the recognition of a religious character that a school already has. Regulation 9 of the Religious Character of Schools (Designation Procedure) Regulations 1998 states that schools that were in existence prior to 1999 must meet one of three criteria to allow them to be designated as a school with a religious character in an Order. At least one governor must be appointed to uphold the religious ethos of the school, that the land where the school stands must be sold for the benefit of a particular religious denomination if the school is discontinued, and that the trust deeds must state that the school was founded for education within a particular religious denomination. If schools meet the criteria, they must be designated as such in an Order made by the National Assembly.

Janet Ryder: I will raise a few points regarding St Brigid's school in Denbigh. I do not wish to comment on the school but rather on its designation as a Catholic school. I am sure that the Minister is aware of the history of St Brigid's; it was a private school that decided to opt into the system, despite the

Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol a Diwygiadau (Cymru) 2004, sy'n diwygio Gorchymyn Dynodi Ysgolion sydd â Chymeriad Crefyddol (Cymru) 1999. Mae'n ychwanegu tair ysgol at restr y rhai sydd â chymeriad crefyddol, sef ysgol Eglwys Loegr Sarn ac ysgol yr Eglwys yng Nghymru Llanwelwedd ym Mhowys ac ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn sir Ddinbych, a adawyd allan o'r Gorchymyn gwreiddiol drwy gamgymeriad. Mae'n ychwanegu dwy ysgol at y rhestr, sef ysgol yr Archesgob Rowan Williams yn sir Fynwy ac ysgol Sant Oswallt yn sir Benfro, sydd ill dwy'n ysgolion yr Eglwys yng Nghymru ac yn agored er 1999. Mae hefyd yn tynnu pum ysgol o'r rhestr sydd yng Ngorchymyn 1999 sydd wedi cau neu sydd ar fin cau. Yn olaf, bydd cofnod un ysgol, sef ysgol Sant Paul yr Eglwys yng Nghymru yn Wrecsam, yn cael ei gywiro gan ei bod yn un wirfoddol a gynorthwyir ac nid yn un wirfoddol a reolir, fel y nodwyd o'r blaen. Mae'r newidiadau'n cyflawni ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i restru'r holl ysgolion yng Nghymru sydd â chymeriad crefyddol. Ni enillir ac ni chollir cymeriad o'r fath drwy ei ddynodi neu drwy beidio â'i ddynodi mewn Gorchymyn a wneir gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru; mae dynodi'n gydnabyddiaeth o gymeriad crefyddol sydd gan ysgol eisoes. Mae rheoliad 9 yn Rheoliadau Cymeriad Crefyddol Ysgolion (Gweithdrefn Ddynodi) 1998 yn datgan bod rhaid i ysgolion a oedd mewn bod cyn 1999 fodloni un o dri maen prawf i ganiatáu eu dynodi'n ysgol sydd â chymeriad crefyddol mewn Gorchymyn. Rhaid i o leiaf un llywodraethwr gael ei benodi i gynnal ethos crefyddol yr ysgol, rhaid i'r tir y mae'r ysgol yn sefyll arno gael ei werthu er budd enwad crefyddol penodol os terfynir yr ysgol, a rhaid i'r gweithredoedd ymddiriedolaeth ddatgan bod yr ysgol wedi'i sefydlu ar gyfer addysg o fewn enwad crefyddol penodol. Os yw ysgolion yn bodloni'r meini prawf, rhaid eu dynodi fel y cyfryw mewn Gorchymyn a wneir gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Janet Ryder: Codaf rai pwyntiau ynglŷn ag ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn Ninbych. Ni ddymunaf wneud sylw am yr ysgol ond yn hytrach ar ei ddynodi'n ysgol Gatholig. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o hanes ysgol y Santes Ffraid; yr oedd yn ysgol breifat a benderfynodd ymuno â'r system, er

wishes of the local education authority and the Roman Catholic Church. Those wishes were overridden by Rod Richards when he was Secretary of State. Since then, the Roman Catholic Church has had nothing to do with St Brigid's school. The priest who represented the church on the school's governing body resigned and the school is no longer overseen by the bishop, the church or the diocese. The Roman Catholic diocese is particularly worried that it seems that St Brigid's is to be designated—and I quote from a letter sent by one of your officials to Bishop Reagan—

'a school with a religious character that is Roman Catholic'.

The Catholic Church would not object to it being classed as a school with a religious character; it would welcome this. However, it is concerned about the designation as a school 'that is Roman Catholic'. Many parents who choose a Catholic education for their children would expect the school to be overseen by a bishop and that the bishop would be involved in the religious education, the ethos and the pastoral care of the school. In this case, the bishop does not take any responsibility, and neither does he, nor the diocese, have anything to do with the school. In the eyes of the church, therefore, in every important aspect, the school is not Catholic. It may be Christian, but it is not Catholic. According to the regulations, only one governor need be appointed to have overview of the denominational needs of the church.

I am sure that you appreciate the position of the church, Minister. The Order relating to St Brigid's is historical, which is why it has to go through. However, if a new school were to be established, it would have to be recognised by the diocese. St Brigid's is not recognised by the diocese, as the case is historical. However, the regulations raise a quandary if the school is to be recognised as a Catholic school. For example, if a child in Denbigh were to opt for a Catholic education, in the church's eyes, the nearest designated Catholic school would be the Blessed Edward Jones school in Rhyl. According to these regulations, St Brigid's would be the nearest Catholic school. Would the education

gwaethaf dymuniadau'r awdurdod addysg lleol a'r Eglwys Gatholig Rufeinig. Diystyrwyd y dymuniadau hynny gan Rod Richards pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Ers hynny, nid yw'r Eglwys Gatholig Rufeinig wedi ymwneud o gwbl ag ysgol y Santes Ffraid. Ymddiswyddodd yr offeirad a gynrychiolai'r eglwys ar gorff llywodraethu'r ysgol ac ni oruchwylir yr ysgol bellach gan yr esgob, yr eglwys neu'r esgobaeth. Mae'r esgobaeth Gatholig Rufeinig yn arbennig o bryderus oherwydd mae'n ymddangos y bydd ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn cael ei dynodi—a dyfynnaf o lythyr a anfonwyd gan un o'ch swyddogion at yr Esgob Reagan—

ysgol sydd â chymeriad crefyddol sy'n un Gatholig Rufeinig.

Ni fyddai'r Eglwys Gatholig yn gwrthwynebu ei dynodi'n ysgol sydd â chymeriad crefyddol; byddai'n croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bryderus ynghylch ei dynodi'n ysgol 'sy'n un Gatholig Rufeinig'. Byddai llawer o rieni sy'n dewis addysg Gatholig i'w plant yn disgwyl y câi'r ysgol ei goruchwyllo gan esgob ac y byddai'r esgob yn ymwneud ag addysg grefyddol, ethos a gofal bugeiliol yr ysgol. Yn yr achos hwn, nid yw'r esgob yn cymryd unrhyw gyfrifoldeb, ac nid yw ef, na'r esgobaeth, yn ymwneud â'r ysgol o gwbl. Yng ngolwg yr eglwys, felly, ym mhob agwedd bwysig, nid yw'r ysgol yn un Gatholig. Efallai ei bod yn Gristnogol, ond nid yw'n Gatholig. Yn ôl y rheoliadau, dim ond un llywodraethwr y mae'n rhaid ei benodi i oruchwyllo anghenion enwadol yr eglwys.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y deallwch safbwynt yr eglwys, Weinidog. Mae'r Gorchymyn sy'n ymwneud ag ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn un hanesyddol, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid iddo fynd drwodd. Er hynny, os sefydlid ysgol newydd, byddai'n rhaid iddi gael ei chydnabod gan yr esgobaeth. Nid yw ysgol y Santes Ffraid wedi'i chydnabod gan yr esgobaeth, gan fod yr achos yn un hanesyddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rheoliadau'n creu cyfyng-gyngor os yw'r ysgol i gael ei chydnabod yn ysgol Gatholig. Er enghraifft, pe byddai plentyn yn Ninbych yn dewis addysg Gatholig, yng ngolwg yr eglwys, yr ysgol agosaf a ddynodwyd yn Gatholig fyddai ysgol y Bendigaidd Edward

authority then have the right to say that it is prepared to fund travel to St Brigid's but not to the Blessed Edward Jones school in Rhyl? Neither the local authority nor the diocese knows the answer to this question, and they would like clarification on this point.

Having had this designation, the school can now set its own entrance criteria. The local authority objects every year to the entrance criteria set by this school. The criteria are not based on faith, but on educational attainment. The school advertises for pupils who have achieved level 4 and above at key stage 2. In other words, anyone who is below or slightly below average need not bother applying. It seems that this is becoming a selective grammar school. Prospective pupils do not have to follow the Catholic faith, or indeed any faith, but they have to have reached a certain academic level. It is a purely selective school, which goes against the whole ethos of the local education authority and of the Catholic church, which requires no such academic standards for entry into its schools. This situation needs to be clarified.

Do you find it acceptable, Minister, that a school of religious character appoints a governor to be responsible for the religious ethos of that school, only for the school to then become a selective school? Given that this school is funded by the local education authority, we are condoning the establishment of a selective state school. Will you please clarify for the Catholic Church whether the school will be designated a school of religious character, which it would consider acceptable, without having 'Roman Catholic' included in the designation? What state will the school hold if it is to be designated a Roman Catholic school?

David Davies: After hearing Janet Ryder's speech, I, too, would like an answer to the question of whether selective schools are being established in north Wales. If so, unlike Janet Ryder, I congratulate the Minister on bringing in selective education, albeit through

Jones yn y Rhyl. Yn ôl y rheoliadau hyn, ysgol y Santes Ffraid fyddai'r ysgol Gatholig agosaf. A fyddai hawl gan yr awdurdod addysg wedyn i ddweud ei fod yn barod i dalu am gludiant i ysgol y Santes Ffraid ond nid i ysgol y Bendigaid Edward Jones yn y Rhyl? Nid yw'r awdurdod lleol na'r esgobaeth yn gwybod yr ateb i'r cwestiwn hwn, a charent gael eglurhad ar y pwynt hwn.

A hithau wedi'i dynodi fel hyn, gall yr ysgol osod ei meini prawf ei hun ar gyfer mynediad yn awr. Mae'r awdurdod lleol yn gwrthwynebu, bob blwyddyn, y meini prawf ar gyfer mynediad a osodir gan yr ysgol hon. Nid yw'r meini prawf yn seiliedig ar grefydd, ond ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol. Mae'r ysgol yn hysbysebu am ddisgyblion sydd wedi cyrraedd lefel 4 ac yn uwch yng nghyfnod allweddol 2. Mewn geiriau eraill, ni ddylai rhywun ymgeisio os yw'n is neu'n ychydig is na'r cyfartaledd. Ymddengys ei bod yn troi'n ysgol ramadeg sy'n dethol ei disgyblion. Nid oes raid i ddarpar ddisgyblion ddilyn y ffydd Gatholig, nac unrhyw ffydd yn wir, ond rhaid iddynt gyrraedd rhyw lefel academiaidd benodol. Mae'n ysgol gwbl ddetholus, sy'n mynd yn groes i ethos yr awdurdod addysg lleol a'r eglwys Gatholig, nad yw'n gofyn unrhyw safonau academiaidd o'r fath i gael mynediad i'w hysgolion. Rhaid egluro'r sefyllfa hon.

A ydych yn ei chael yn dderbyniol, Weinidog, fod ysgol a chanddi gymeriad crefyddol yn penodi llywodraethwr i fod yn gyfrifol am ethos crefyddol yr ysgol honno, ond i'r ysgol droi'n un ddetholus wedyn? Gan fod yr ysgol hon yn cael ei chyllido gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol, yr ydym yn goddef sefydlu ysgol wladol ddetholus. A wnewch egluro er mwyn yr Eglwys Gatholig a gaiff yr ysgol ei dynodi'n un sydd â chymeriad crefyddol, a ystyriai'n dderbyniol, heb gynnwys 'Catholig Rhufeinig' yn y dynodiad? Pa statws fydd i'r ysgol os ydyw i'w dynodi'n ysgol Gatholig Rufeinig?

David Davies: Ar ôl gwranddo ar araith Janet Ryder, carwn innau gael ateb ynghylch a yw ysgolion detholus yn cael eu sefydlu yn y Gogledd. Os ydynt, yn wahanol i Janet Ryder, llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog ar gyflwyno addysg ddetholus, er ei bod yn

the backdoor. This would be a wonderful development, and I hope that the Minister would consider its introduction in Monmouthshire, about which I would not be critical.

Without knowing the details of the schools involved, I express regret that Rod Richards's name was mentioned in a rather negative fashion. I accept that his name has been mentioned in a negative fashion on previous occasions in many fora. However, in relation to a technical matter such as this, it is unfortunate that, instead of referring to his office, his name was used, as he does not have an opportunity to reply.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I detected no slur upon Rod Richards, indeed, I heard him described as the Secretary of State.

David Davies: I do not know whether he was Secretary of State.

The Presiding Officer: I believe him to have been a parliamentary under-secretary.

3.20 p.m.

David Davies: The point that I wanted to make is that the Conservative group fully supports schools with a religious character. They offer standards of discipline and courtesy that are not always evident in other schools—although they are in some. Those standards of discipline form part of the ethos of schools of religious character. We would like to see more such schools. I regret the fact that some of these schools have been closed, one of which is in my constituency. However, what I particularly regret is that it has become part of a merger and while that school now has a religious character, when the new governors are drawn up, we may find that the church will not be invited to be a part of the merged school. We should remember that the church brings money and expertise to these schools, which often comes from outside the usual channels.

Regardless of whether or not a school is designated as having a religious character, all schools are expected to carry out a daily act of collective worship. I have asked the

gwneud hynny drwy'r drws cefn. Byddai hyn yn ddatblygiad gwych, a gobeithiaf yr ystyriai'r Gweinidog ei chyflwyno yn sir Fynwy, gan na fyddwn yn beirniadu hynny.

Heb wybod y manylion am yr ysgolion dan sylw, mynegaf ofid bod enw Rod Richards wedi'i grybwyll mewn modd eithaf negyddol. Derbynaf fod ei enw wedi'i grybwyll mewn modd negyddol o'r blaen mewn sawl fforwm. Fodd bynnag, mewn cysylltiad â mater technegol fel hwn, mae'n anffodus bod ei enw wedi'i ddefnyddio, yn hytrach na chyfeirio at ei swydd, gan nad oes ganddo gyfle i ymateb.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chanfûm unrhyw sarhad ar Rod Richards, yn wir, clywais ei alw'n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

David Davies: Ni wn a fu'n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

Y Llywydd: Credaf iddo fod yn is-ysgrifennydd seneddol.

David Davies: Y pwynt yr oeddwn am ei wneud yw bod grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn llwyr gefnogi ysgolion sydd â chymeriad crefyddol. Maent yn cynnig safonau disgyblaeth a chwarteisi nas gwelir bob amser mewn ysgolion eraill—er y'u gwelir mewn rhai. Mae'r safonau disgyblaeth hynny'n rhan o ethos ysgolion sydd â chymeriad crefyddol. Carem weld rhagor o ysgolion o'r fath. Mae'n ofid i mi fod rhai o'r ysgolion hyn wedi'u cau, yr oedd un ohonynt yn fy etholaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n peri gofid i mi'n benodol yw ei bod bellach wedi'i chyfuno, ac er bod cymeriad crefyddol gan yr ysgol honno yn awr, pan benodir y llywodraethwyr newydd, gallem weld na wahoddir yr eglwys i gymryd rhan yn yr ysgol gyfunedig. Dylem gofio bod yr eglwys yn dod ag arian ac arbenigedd i'r ysgolion hyn, a ddaw'n aml o'r tu allan i'r sianeli arferol.

Pa un a ddynodir bod cymeriad crefyddol i ysgol ai peidio, disgwylir i'r holl ysgolion gynnal gwasanaeth crefyddol ar y cyd. Yr wyf wedi holi'r Gweinidog ar adegau

Minister on previous occasions about one school, which is not doing so and appears to be flouting the rules. Is that school now fulfilling its obligations to hold the daily act of collective worship?

Mark Isherwood: As a libertarian party, we support the work of faith-based schools and encourage the increase in the number of secondary schools that are faith-based. Notwithstanding the practical limitations on choice presented by issues of rurality and sparsity in large parts of Wales, we must seek to expand parental choice wherever practical, particularly in terms of enabling parents to make the right choice for their child. After all, schools with a religious character, where they exist, are popular with parents and children with and without strong religious beliefs precisely because their relative autonomy from state control drives up standards and pupil achievements. Therefore, we welcome this Order, where designation is a recognition of a religious character, which a school already has as a question of fact and where the five schools named in this Order will benefit from—

Janet Ryder: I am happy to agree with your comments on faith-based schools, which provide an education to a great number of pupils in Wales. Indeed, it would be hard for the education system to exist without them. However, in the case of St Brigid's, which is addressed in this Order and is one of the few schools that are named, the original governors of the school included two Catholic priests—one represented the diocese and the other was from Oxford. As soon as the Catholic Church withdrew its support from the school, the former resigned from the board of governors. The diocese has nothing to do with this school and it is concerned that it will affect educational provision in north Wales, if it is recognised as a Catholic school.

Mark Isherwood: I would be keen to build bridges again between schools and dioceses, but I note that the Order will determine the form of religious education and collective worship that takes place in the schools. Therefore, hopefully that is a step in the right direction, along with the admissions criteria,

blaenorol am un ysgol, nad yw'n gwneud hynny ac yr ymddengys ei bod yn torri'r rheolau. A yw'r ysgol honno bellach yn cyflawni ei hymrwymiad i gynnal gwasanaeth crefyddol ar y cyd?

Mark Isherwood: Fel plaid libertaraidd, cefnogwn waith ysgolion crefyddol ac annogwn gynnydd yn nifer yr ysgolion uwchradd crefyddol. Er gwaethaf y cyfyngiadau ymarferol ar ddewis oherwydd gwledigrwydd a theneurwydd y boblogaeth mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru, rhaid inni geisio ehangu'r dewis sydd ar gael i rieni ym mhle bynnag y gellir, yn enwedig o ran galluogi rhieni i wneud y dewis cywir ar gyfer eu plentyn. Wedi'r cwbl, mae ysgolion sydd â chymeriad crefyddol, lle y'u ceir, yn boblogaidd gyda rhieni a phlant, boed ganddynt gredoau crefyddol cadarn neu beidio, gan fod eu hymreolaeth gymharol rhag rheolaeth y wladwriaeth yn codi safonau a chyflawniadau disgyblion. Gan hynny, croesawn y Gorchymyn hwn, lle y mae'r dynodi'n gydnabyddiaeth o gymeriad crefyddol, sydd eisoes gan yr ysgol fel mater o ffaith a lle y bydd y pum ysgol a enwir yn y Gorchymyn hwn yn cael budd o—

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn falch o gytuno â'ch sylwadau am ysgolion crefyddol, sy'n cynnig addysg i nifer fawr o ddisgyblion yng Nghymru. Yn wir, byddai'n anodd i'r system addysg fodoli hebddynt. Fodd bynnag, yn achos ysgol y Santes Ffraid, y cyfeirir ati yn y Gorchymyn hwn ac sy'n un o'r ychydig ysgolion a enwir, yr oedd dau offeiriad Catholig ymysg llywodraethwyr gwreiddiol yr ysgol—yr oedd un yn cynrychioli'r esgobaeth ac yr oedd y llall o Rydychen. Cyn gynted ag y tynnodd yr Eglwys Gatholig ei chefnogaeth i'r ysgol yn ôl, ymddiswyddodd y cyntaf o fwrdd y llywodraethwyr. Nid yw'r esgobaeth yn ymwneud o gwbl â'r ysgol ac mae'n bryderus y bydd yn effeithio ar ddarpariaeth addysgol yn y Gogledd, os cydnabyddir hi'n ysgol Gatholig.

Mark Isherwood: Byddwn yn awyddus i godi pontydd eto rhwng ysgolion ac esgobaethau, ond nodaf y bydd y Gorchymyn yn pennu'r math o addysg grefyddol a gwasanaethau ar y cyd a geir yn yr ysgolion. Gan hynny, gobeithiaf fod hynny'n gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ynghyd â'r meini prawf ar

staffing arrangements, disposal of assets and inclusion of a statement of ethos in a school's instrument of governance. Hopefully many of the issues will be addressed by this Order. We must celebrate our glorious diversity rather than use it to divide us. We must have freedom of worship and study, providing that it is based on tolerance, democracy, freedom and the rule of law.

For parents, the choice of schools available to their children could scarcely be more important. The statistic of which the Labour Government should be most ashamed is that 7.1 per cent of parents now send their children to private schools. This is the ninth successive year in which the number paying fees has risen. That is despite the 9.6 per cent increase in fees. Governments in London and Cardiff must, therefore, commit to reducing the percentage of parents who send their children to private schools, not by penalising them in any way, but by making the state sector so attractive that parents no longer feel the need to look elsewhere. Funding should be provided so that the education system can be opened up to other organisations, including religious and charitable bodies, to provide schooling to meet the highest standards at the same cost per pupil as in a maintained school, with funding following the child. Popular and successful schools must be allowed to expand. Headteachers and governors must have greater autonomy and control. Bureaucracy and—

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are discussing schools with a religious character. I would be grateful if there was some reference to religion, even on a Tuesday.

Mark Isherwood: With due deference and respect to the Presiding Officer, my next sentence will hopefully address that. Clearly, schools with a religious character are a welcome vehicle for that. Without an understanding of our historic and moral foundations, young people cannot know where they are going because they do not know where they are now or how they got there.

In conclusion, schools must function on a

gyfer derbyn plant, trefniadau staffio, gwaredu asedau a chynnwys datganiad o ethos yn offeryn llywodraethu'r ysgol. Gobeithiaf y trafodir llawer o'r materion dan sylw drwy'r Gorchymyn hwn. Rhaid inni ddatlu ein hamrywiaeth godidog yn hytrach na'i ddefnyddio i'n rhannu. Rhaid inni gael rhyddid o ran addoli ac astudio, ar yr amod bod hynny'n seiliedig ar oddefgarwch, democratiaeth, rhyddid a threfn y gyfraith.

I rieni, prin y gallai'r dewis o ysgolion sydd ar gael i'w plant fod yn fwy pwysig. Yr ystadegyn y dylai'r Llywodraeth Lafur fod â'r cywilydd mwyaf ohono yw bod 7.1 y cant o rieni bellach yn anfon eu plant i ysgolion preifat. Hon yw'r nawfed flwyddyn yn olynol y mae'r nifer sy'n talu ffioedd wedi codi. Mae hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith bod ffioedd wedi codi o 9.6 y cant. Gan hynny, rhaid i Lywodraethau Llundain a Chaerdydd ymrwymo i leihau canran y rhieni sy'n anfon eu plant i ysgolion preifat, nid drwy eu cosbi mewn unrhyw fodd, ond drwy beri i'r sector gwladol fod mor atyniadol fel nad yw rhieni bellach yn teimlo'r angen i chwilio yn rhywle arall. Dylid darparu cyllid hefyd fel y gellir agor y system addysg i gyrrff eraill, gan gynnwys cyrff crefyddol ac elusennol, i gynnig addysg o'r radd flaenaf am yr un gost y disgybl ag mewn ysgol a gynhelir, gyda'r cyllid yn dilyn y plentyn. Rhaid gadael i ysgolion poblogaidd a llwyddiannus ehangu. Rhaid i benaethiaid ysgol a llywodraethwyr gael mwy o ymreolaeth a rheolaeth. Biwrocratiaeth a—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym yn trafod ysgolion sydd â chymeriad crefyddol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai rhyw gyfeiriad at grefydd, hyd yn oed ar ddydd Mawrth.

Mark Isherwood: Gyda dyledus barch i'r Llywydd, bydd y frawddeg nesaf sydd gennyf yn ymdrin â hynny, gobeithio. Mae'n amlwg bod ysgolion sydd â chymeriad crefyddol yn fodd derbynol i gyflawni hynny. Heb ddeall ein sylfeini hanesyddol a moesol, ni all pobl ifanc wybod i ble yr ânt am na wyddant ym mhle maent yn awr na'r modd y daethant yno.

I derfynu, rhaid i ysgolion weithredu ar sail

basis of parity of esteem, rather than a one-size-fits all approach, allowing all children to reach their own mountain tops rather than filling in the valleys. The most disadvantaged and forgotten children, who are also the most disadvantaged by our current education system, must be given true equality of opportunity, based on raising standards through empowerment and diversity, rather than lowering standards to the lowest common denominator of dogmatic control and diktat.

Ann Jones: Janet raised St Brigid's School and I have raised the same issue many times since the decision by the former Welsh Office minister, Rod Richards, to allow it back into state education. That caused great divisions within our community and the Catholic Church and great hardship for many of the schools in my area. The Minister and her officials have worked tirelessly on this. Legal advice has been sought, and I have pressed the Minister continually to address this situation. I am disappointed that we are faced with a situation whereby St Brigid's will now be included by meeting one criterion. We must ensure that St Brigid's comes up to scratch, and that we do all that we can with any future powers to ensure that St Brigid's is on a level playing field—

Janet Ryder: Are you therefore condoning the academic entrance qualifications that that school sets for children, or would you ask it to set those aside and accept children on a faith basis?

Ann Jones: I was going to say, Janet, that I do not condone those qualifications. I feel strongly about the way in which it selects its pupils. I have met with pupils from St Brigid's who had to leave because of the standard of education that they received and the way in which they were treated at that school, which was less than what you would expect from a school that professes to have a faith, whatever that may be. The Minister knows my feelings well, and I have asked time and again that there be no selection procedure for any child in any school, and I hope that we will be able to work towards that in the future. We must have a level

parch cydradd, yn hytrach nag ymagwedd sy'n cynnig yr un peth i bawb, fel y gall pob plentyn gyrraedd y brig yn hytrach nag aros ar y gwaelod. Rhaid rhoi gwir gyfle cyfartal i'r plant mwyaf difreintiedig ac anghofiedig, sydd hefyd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf o dan ein system addysg bresennol, gan godi safonau drwy alluogi ac amrywiaeth, yn hytrach na gostwng safonau i'r lefel gyffredin isaf oherwydd rheolaeth ddogmatig a dictad.

Ann Jones: Crybwyllodd Janet fater ysgol y Santes Ffraid ac yr wyf fi wedi crybwyll yr un mater sawl gwaith ers y penderfyniad gan y cyn-Weinidog yn y Swyddfa Gymreig, Rod Richards, i adael iddi ddod yn rhan eto o addysg wladol. Perodd hynny ymrianiadau mawr yn ein cymuned ac yn yr Eglwys Gatholig ac achosi caledi mawr i lawer o'r ysgolion yn fy ardal. Mae'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion wedi gweithio'n ddiffino ar hyn. Ceisiwyd cyngor cyfreithiol, ac yr wyf wedi pwysu'n barhaus ar y Gweinidog i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa hon. Yr wyf yn siomedig ein bod yn wynebu sefyllfa lle y bydd ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn cael ei chynnwys yn awr am ei bod yn bodloni un maen prawf. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yr ysgol hon yn cyrraedd y safon, ac y gwnawn bopeth a allwn ag unrhyw bwerau a geir yn y dyfodol i sicrhau ei bod yn gydradd—

Janet Ryder: A ydych felly'n esgusodi'r amodau academiaidd ar gyfer mynediad y mae'r ysgol honno'n eu gosod i blant, neu a fydddech yn gofyn iddi eu rhoi o'r neilltu a derbyn plant ar sail grefyddol?

Ann Jones: Yr oeddwn am ddweud, Janet, nad wyf yn esgusodi'r amodau hynny. Teimlaf yn gryf ynghylch y modd y mae'n dethol ei disgyblion. Cyfarfûm â disgyblion o ysgol y Santes Ffraid a oedd wedi gorfod gadael oherwydd safon yr addysg a dderbynient a'r modd yr oeddent yn cael eu trin yn yr ysgol honno, nad oedd cystal â'r hyn a ddisgwyliech gan ysgol sy'n arddel ffydd, beth bynnag fo hynny. Gŵyr y Gweinidog yn iawn am fy nheimpladau, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn dro ar ôl tro am beidio â chael unrhyw weithdrefn ddethol ar gyfer unrhyw blentyn mewn unrhyw ysgol, a gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu ymdrechu i

playing field to get St Brigid's under the control of the local education authority and ensure that we do not have any selection criteria.

In closing, I thank the Minister for all that she has done. It is unfortunate that we are faced with this decision today, but we must learn to work around it, and I am sure that officials in the education department will continue to do that.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): There are issues around St Brigid's school, which do not apply to any other school that is categorised in the Order. Janet, you could have quoted from the letter that I sent to you on 9 June, which clarified both your questions. I will clarify the issue again for the benefit of the Assembly. The letter states that since these schools were omitted, the test which must be applied to their inclusion in an Order is the one which applied at the time. That is set out in regulation 5 of the 1998 designation requirements. The test that must be applied therefore is the test that applied in 1999, not the test that applies to new schools now.

Janet Ryder: According to your letter, the test required that at least one member of the school's governing body must be the person appointed as a foundation governor to represent the interests of one or more religious dominations. As I explained, at that time, two of the governors represented the faith. One resigned when the Church decided not to oversee St Brigid's School. Will you confirm that a governor remains at St Bridgid's who has responsibility for overseeing the development of the faith ethos in the school? Are you confident that the most recent Estyn report, which I believe has just been completed, will show that the school has satisfied all criteria as a faith school?

3.30 p.m.

Jane Davidson: Yes. The Catholic church has no obligation to recognise St Bridgid's school as a school with a Roman Catholic

sicrhau hynny yn y dyfodol. Rhaid inni gael amodau cydradd er mwyn rhoi ysgol y Santes Ffraid o dan reolaeth yr awdurdod addysg lleol a sicrhau nad oes gennym unrhyw feini prawf ar gyfer dethol.

I gloi, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am bopeth a wnaeth. Mae'n anffodus ein bod yn wynebu'r penderfyniad hwn heddiw, ond rhaid inni ddysgu i ddygymod ag ef, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd swyddogion yn yr adran addysg yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Mae materion o ran ysgol y Santes Ffraid, nad ydynt yn berthnasol i unrhyw ysgol arall a ddynodir yn y Gorchymyn. Janet, gallech fod wedi dyfynnu o'r llythyr a anfonais atoch ar 9 Mehefin, sy'n egluro'r ddau gwestiwn a ofynasoch. Egluraf y mater eto er budd y Cynulliad. Mae'r llythyr yn datgan, gan fod yr ysgolion hyn wedi'u hepgor, mai'r prawf y mae'n rhaid ei gymhwyso at eu cynnwys mewn Gorchymyn yw'r un a oedd yn berthnasol ar y pryd. Nodir hynny yn rheoliad 5 yng ngofynion dynodi 1998. Y prawf y mae'n rhaid ei gymhwyso felly yw'r un a oedd yn berthnasol yn 1999, nid yr un sy'n berthnasol i ysgolion newydd yn awr.

Janet Ryder: Yn ôl eich llythyr, yr oedd y prawf yn mynnu bod rhaid i o leiaf un aelod o gorff llywodraethu'r ysgol fod yn rhywun a benodwyd yn llywodraethwr sefydledig i gynrychioli buddiannau un neu ragor o enwadau crefyddol. Fel yr eglurais, bryd hynny, yr oedd dau o'r llywodraethwyr yn cynrychioli'r ffydd. Ymddiswyddodd un pan benderfynodd yr Eglwys beidio â goruchwyllo ysgol y Santes Ffraid. A wnewch gadarnhau bod llywodraethwr yn parhau i fod yn yr ysgol sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros oruchwyllo datblygiad yr ethos crefyddol yn yr ysgol? A ydych yn ffyddiog y bydd yr adroddiad diweddaraf gan Estyn, sydd newydd gael ei gwblhau, yr wyf yn credu, yn dangos bod yr ysgol wedi bodloni'r holl feini prawf fel ysgol grefyddol?

Jane Davidson: Ydwyf. Nid yw'r eglwys Gatholig o dan unrhyw orfodaeth i gydnabod ysgol y Santes Ffraid yn ysgol a chanddi

religious character, and has no responsibility for maintaining the religious character of the school. Designation of the school as one with a Roman Catholic religious character does not carry with it any implication that the school is a Catholic school according to canon law. However, I am sure that we all welcome the fact that the law now states that no school can be designated as a school with a religious character unless it has the support of its diocese. That is a welcome change to the law. Our job as Assembly Members, and my job as Minister, is to ensure that the law is properly upheld, so that, as a matter of law, St Bridgid's cannot set a precedent, because no other schools in Wales can be designated without the support of the relevant diocesan authority. That is why we have brought the Order forward today.

I confirm, as have other Members of my party group, that we maintain our commitment to local schools for local children. We also recognise the work of churches throughout Wales in providing many of our schools. I was pleased to be with Jane Hutt this morning at the opening of the refurbished St Richard Gwyn RC High School in the Vale of Glamorgan, which has received around £2 million of Assembly funding. We are keen that all schools should serve all children. David, we will always ensure that schools uphold the law. I have said this in response to you before, and I will say it again—we have legal arrangements in place and we require schools to uphold the law. However, I ask Members to support the Order, particularly in the knowledge that we will never be in this situation again.

Lorraine Barrett: You talked about equality for children in our schools. Will you join me in condemning Mark Isherwood's comments, which appeared to define children from poorer areas as somehow being the lowest common denominator?

Jane Davidson: I did not hear that in Mark Isherwood's contribution. However, the majority of Mark Isherwood's comments had no relevance to the Order under discussion.

gymeriad crefyddol Catholig Rhufeinig, ac nid oes ganddi unrhyw gyfrifoldeb dros gynnal cymeriad crefyddol yr ysgol. Nid yw dynodi'r ysgol yn un sydd â chymeriad crefyddol Catholig Rhufeinig yn golygu o gwbl fod yr ysgol yn ysgol Gatholig yn ôl cyfraith yr eglwys. Er hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y gyfraith bellach yn datgan na ellir dynodi unrhyw ysgol yn un sydd â chymeriad crefyddol oni bai fod ei hesgobaeth yn ei chefnogi. Mae'r newid hwnnw yn y gyfraith yn un y dylid ei groesawu. Ein gwaith fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a'm gwaith i fel Gweinidog, yw sicrhau bod y gyfraith yn cael ei chynnal yn briodol, felly, fel mater cyfreithiol, ni all ysgol y Santes Ffraid osod cynsail, gan na ellir dynodi unrhyw ysgolion eraill yng Nghymru heb gefnogaeth yr awdurdod esgobaethol berthnasol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi dwyn y Gorchymyn gerbron heddiw.

Yr wyf yn cadarnhau, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill fy ngrŵp plaid, ein bod yn glynu at ein hymrwymiad i ysgolion lleol ar gyfer plant lleol. Yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod gwaith eglwysi ledled Cymru wrth ddarparu llawer o'n hysgolion. Yr oeddwn yn falch o fod gyda Jane Hutt y bore yma wrth agor Ysgol Uwchradd Gatholig Rufeinig Sant Richard Gwyn ym Mro Morgannwg ar ei newydd wedd—derbyniodd yr ysgol tua £2 filiwn o gyllid gan y Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn awyddus y dylai pob ysgol wasanaethu pob plentyn. David, sicrhawn bob amser y bydd ysgolion yn cynnal y gyfraith. Dywedais hyn mewn ymateb i chi o'r blaen, ac fe'i dywedaf eto—mae gennym drefniadau cyfreithiol ar waith a mynnwn y bydd ysgolion yn cynnal y gyfraith. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i Aelodau gefnogi'r Gorchymyn, yn enwedig o wybod na fyddwn byth yn y sefyllfa hon eto.

Lorraine Barrett: Cyfeiriasoch at gydraddoldeb i blant yn ein hysgolion. A wnewch ymuno â mi i gollfarnu sylwadau Mark Isherwood, yr ymddangosai eu bod yn diffinio plant o ardaloedd tlotach yn rhai a oedd rywsut ar y lefel gyffredin isaf?

Jane Davidson: Ni chlywais hynny yng nghyfraniad Mark Isherwood. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o sylwadau Mark Isherwood yn amherthnasol i'r Gorchymyn

dan sylw.

Mark Isherwood: May I just say that when the Record shows my exact words, it will show that I referred to the ‘forgotten children’, not the ‘lowest common denominator’. My comments referred to the quality of education rather than the children who, of course, are equal to the best in Wales.

Jane Davidson: I am grateful for that clarification, Mark. The Assembly Government believes all children to be equal and that all children should all be able to express their talents in full. An education system that is fully comprehensive in its delivery ensures that better than any other.

Mark Isherwood: A gaf ddweud y bydd y Cofnod, pan ddengys fy union eiriau, yn dangos fy mod wedi cyfeirio at y ‘plant anghofiedig’, nid at y ‘lefel gyffredin isaf’. Yr oedd fy sylwadau’n ymwneud ag ansawdd addysg yn hytrach na’r plant sydd, wrth gwrs, cystal â’r goreuon yng Nghymru.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr eglurhad hwnnw, Mark. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn credu bod pob plentyn yn gyfartal ac y dylai pob plentyn allu mynegi ei ddoniau’n llawn. Mae system addysg sy’n gwbl gynhwysfawr yn ei dull o weithredu yn sicrhau hynny’n well na’r un arall.

Cynnig (NDM2010): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2010): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David

Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2011): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2011): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni
(Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales)
Regulations 2004**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 25 May 2004. (NDM2012)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 15 June 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales) Regulations 2004; and

2. approves that the Environmental Assessment of Plans and Programmes (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 25 May 2004;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 25 May 2004; and

c) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 16 June 2004. (NDM2013)

Y Llywydd: Ymddengys nad oes neb am siarad am y cynnig diddorol hwn. Mae'n ddrwg gen i, mae Helen Mary am siarad.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mai 2004. (NDM2012)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mehefin 2004 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni (Cymru) 2004; ac

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Asesiadau Amgylcheddol o Gynlluniau a Rhaglenni (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:

a) Rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mai 2004;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 25 Mai 2004; a'r

c) memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mehefin 2004. (NDM2013)

The Presiding Officer: It appears that no-one wishes to speak on this interesting motion. Sorry, Helen Mary wants to speak.

Helen Mary Jones: I apologise for not having informed you in advance, Presiding Officer, that I wanted to make a brief contribution.

I have two points to raise with you, Minister, with regard to these eminently sensible regulations, which my party group will support. First, there is the issue that UK legislation, under these directives, will cover cross-border plans and programmes. As a group, we have some concerns about this. Can you let me know, either in responding in this debate or in writing, what contact you have had with the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister about the implementation of these regulations, and what steps you will take to ensure that, where there are major cross-border developments that would fall under these regulations if they were Wales-only regulations, your Government is properly consulted? Secondly, as I understand it, private sector plans and programmes are not subject to this directive. Will you agree to keep the impact of this under review? There are major private sector initiatives in, for example, tourism that have major environmental impacts. Will you consider working with the private sector to include that sector in the implementation of this directive in spirit, perhaps by using a voluntary code of conduct?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): The answer to those questions is 'yes'. In terms of the UK regulations, it is right to say that they cover all cross-border matters. I understand that that is also the case for Scotland. Where there is scope to work with the private sector, that will be done.

Helen Mary Jones: Ymddiheuraf am beidio â'ch hysbysu ymlaen llaw, Lywydd, fy mod am wneud cyfraniad byr.

Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w codi gyda chi, Weinidog, mewn cysylltiad â'r rheoliadau tra synhwyrol hyn, y bydd fy ngrŵp plaid yn eu cefnogi. Yn gyntaf, mae mater yn codi i'r graddau mai deddfwriaeth y DU, o dan y cyfarwyddedau hyn, a fydd yn berthnasol i gynlluniau a rhaglenni trawsffiniol. Fel grŵp, mae gennym rai pryderon am hyn. A allwch roi gwybod i mi, un ai wrth ymateb yn y ddadl hon neu mewn llythyr, pa gyswllt a gawsoch â Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynghylch gweithredu'r rheoliadau hyn, a pha gamau a gymerwch, lle y ceir datblygiadau trawsffiniol mawr a fyddai'n ddarostyngedig i'r rheoliadau hyn pe byddent yn rheoliadau i Gymru'n unig, i sicrhau yr ymgynghorir yn briodol â'ch Llywodraeth? Yn ail, fel yr wyf yn deall hyn, nid yw cynlluniau a rhaglenni'r sector preifat yn dod o dan y gyfarwydded hon. A wnewch gytuno i ddal effaith hynny o dan sylw? Ceir mentrau mawr gan y sector preifat mewn twristiaeth, er enghraifft, a gaiff effaith fawr ar yr amgylchedd. A wnewch ystyried gweithio gyda'r sector preifat i gynnwys y sector hwnnw, yn yr ysbryd, wrth roi'r gyfarwydded hon ar waith, efallai drwy ddefnyddio cod ymddygiad gwirfoddol?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): 'Gwnaf' yw'r ateb i'r ddau gwestiwn hynny. Gyda golwg ar reoliadau'r DU, mae'n wir eu bod yn cynnwys yr holl faterion trawsffiniol. Deallaf fod hynny'n wir yn achos yr Alban hefyd. Os ceir cyfle i weithio gyda'r sector preifat, gwneir hynny.

Cynnig (NDM2012): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2012): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2013): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2013): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio Annual Report of the Audit Committee

Janet Davies: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order 6.6 (vi) notes the annual report of the Audit Committee for the period 2003-04, which was laid in the Table Office on 21 June 2004. (NDM2014)

I am pleased to present this first annual report of the Audit Committee of the second Assembly. This reflects our work to hold the Assembly and its related bodies to account for the use of their resources. It sets out four major themes that have emerged from our work, which should interest all those who

Janet Davies: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog 6.6 (vi), yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio am y cyfnod 2003-04, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Mehefin 2004. (NDM2014)

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol cyntaf Pwyllgor Archwilio'r ail Gynulliad. Mae'n adlewyrchu ein gwaith o ddal y Cynulliad a'i gyrff cysylltiedig yn gyfrifol am y defnydd o'u hadnoddau. Mae'n nodi pedair thema bwysig a gododd o'n gwaith, a ddylai fod o ddiddordeb i bawb

value good public services. The first theme is the proper conduct of public business. As we say in the report, the proper conduct of public business is essential for the sustained delivery of good quality services and for the general public's confidence in Government. I think that we all, as politicians, recognise that public confidence is in a precarious state. This is for a variety of reasons, which I shall not attempt to detail, not least because some of them lie outside the Assembly's remit. Instead, I should like to emphasise how the Assembly, and the Audit Committee in particular, is providing an antidote.

3.40 p.m.

The committee provides an unprecedented level of scrutiny of public business in Wales. During the year, we took evidence on 10 reports and published memoranda by the Auditor General covering a wide range of issues. Along the way, we interviewed 26 witnesses and produced 10 reports of our own. Prior to devolution, the Westminster Committee of Public Accounts would, on average, examine one Welsh report a year. It was valuable work, and some of the gross misconduct examined was quite memorable, but it was not enough. While supplies of salacious gross misconduct may not be as abundant as they once were, in several areas—notably some of ELWa's innovation projects—we have found managers and senior office holders failing to do their jobs properly. We have made recommendations to address these problems, and we endeavour to make the tone of our evidence sessions constructive. The example set by some witnesses no doubt provides considerable encouragement to other senior officials to meet the public's expectation of proper conduct.

The second theme is risk management, which is a subject that Members may consider rather dry, but it is an area that is often overlooked and undervalued. Many of ELWa's problems, for example, arose because of a lack of good risk management: the financial implications of the Pop Cafe

sy'n trysori gwasanaethau cyhoeddus da. Y thema gyntaf yw cynnal busnes cyhoeddus yn briodol. Fel y dywedwn yn yr adroddiad, mae'n hollbwysig cynnal busnes cyhoeddus yn briodol os yw gwasanaethau o ansawdd da i gael eu darparu'n gyson ac os yw'r cyhoedd i gael ffydd mewn Llywodraeth. Credaf fod pob un ohonom, fel gwleidyddion, yn cydnabod bod ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd yn fregus. Mae amryw o resymau am hynny, na cheisiaf eu rhestru, a hynny'n anad dim am fod rhai ohonynt y tu allan i gylch gwaith y Cynulliad. Yn hytrach, carwn bwysleisio'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad, a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n benodol, yn cynnig gwrthgyffur i hynny.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn craffu ar fusnes cyhoeddus yng Nghymru i raddau nas gwelwyd o'r blaen. Yn ystod y flwyddyn, cymerasom dystiolaeth ar 10 o adroddiadau a memoranda cyhoeddedig gan yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a oedd yn ymdrin ag amrywiaeth mawr o faterion. Wrth wneud hynny, cyfwelasom 26 o dystion a chynhyrchu 10 adroddiad o'n heiddo ein hunain. Cyn datganoli, byddai'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn San Steffan yn archwilio un adroddiad o Gymru y flwyddyn, ar gyfartaledd. Yr oedd yn waith gwerthfawr, ac yr oedd rhywfaint o'r camymddwyn difrifol a archwiliwyd yn eithaf cofiadwy, ond nid oedd yn ddigon. Er na cheir cymaint o gamymddwyn difrifol anllad ag a geid ar un adeg o bosibl, mewn sawl maes—ac yn rhai o brosiectau arloesedd ELWa yn neilltuoel—cawsom reolwyr ac uwch swyddogion a oedd yn methu â gwneud eu gwaith yn iawn. Gwnaethom argymhellion i ymdrin â'r problemau hyn, a cheisiwn greu naws adeiladol yn ein sesiynau tystiolaeth. Mae'r esiampl a osodir gan rai tystion yn sicr o fod yn gryn anogaeth i uwch swyddogion eraill gyflawni disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd o ran ymddygiad priodol.

Yr ail thema yw rheoli risg, sy'n bwnc y gallai Aelodau ei ystyried yn un braidd yn sych, ond mae'n faes a gaiff ei esgeuluso a'i danbrisiu'n aml. Mae llawer o broblemau ELWa, er enghraifft, wedi codi oherwydd diffyg rheoli da ar risg: ni werthuswyd goblygiadau ariannol prosiect y Caffi Pop yn

project were not properly appraised, and the project was not monitored. The committee has made more recommendations aimed at improving risk management than on any other matter. The value of these recommendations cannot be readily quantified, but an indication is perhaps provided by the fact that the Assembly Government has accepted the vast majority of them. I am grateful to the Government for its constructive attitude, and, through National Audit Office staff, we continue to monitor the implementation of those recommendations.

Our third theme is efficiency. This includes scope for financial savings. Building on savings identified in earlier years, the committee has recommended that the Assembly Government's NHS department pursues possible courses of action that could lead to savings in the procurement of medicine. These include exploring the potential for centralised purchasing. If medicines for community pharmacists and general practitioners could be obtained at the same prices charged to hospitals, that could yield up to £23 million in savings on the top-10 prescribed items alone. Some of this work has challenged powerful vested interests, and there are risks that need to be weighed, but, as a committee, we are not intimidated by vested interests, and we will continue to challenge anomalies such as the large discrepancies between these prices. We expect the Government to implement the recommendations to which it has agreed.

The fourth theme is improving services to the citizen. The committee has consistently asked questions about the impact of services on individual citizens, whether it is a matter of farmers receiving subsidy payments far later than they should, or of hospital patients being treated in dirty and, indeed, unhygienic wards. Again, we have made recommendations aimed at tackling service shortcomings, such as calling for better communication between hospital maintenance and cleaning departments.

There are lessons related to these themes that are relevant to all public services. The

briodol, ac ni chafodd y prosiect ei fonitro. Gwnaeth y pwyllgor fwy o argymhellion sydd â'r amcan o wella'r rheoli ar risg nag ar unrhyw fater arall. Ni ellir mesur gwerth yr argymhellion hyn yn rhwydd, ond ceir un arwydd o hynny efallai yn y ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi derbyn y mwyafrif helaeth ohonynt. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywodraeth am ei hymagwedd adeiladol, a, drwy staff y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, parhawn i fonitro'r modd y rhoddir yr argymhellion hyn ar waith.

Ein trydedd thema yw effeithlonrwydd. Mae hyn yn cynnwys y cyfle i arbed arian. Gan ddilyn arbedion a ganfuwyd mewn blynyddoedd cynharach, mae'r pwyllgor wedi argymhell y dylai adran GIG Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddilyn cyrsiau gweithredu posibl a allai arwain at arbedion wrth gaffael meddyginiaethau. Yn eu plith y mae ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o ganoli'r gwaith o brynu. Os byddai modd cael meddyginiaethau ar gyfer fferyllwyr cymunedol ac ymarferwyr cyffredinol am yr un prisiau a godir ar ysbytai, gallai hynny greu hyd at £23 miliwn o arbedion ar y 10 eitem a ragnodir amlaf yn unig. Mae rhywfaint o'r gwaith hwn wedi herio buddiannau breintiedig pwerus, ac mae risgiau y mae'n rhaid eu pwysu a'u mesur, ond, fel pwyllgor, nid yw buddiannau breintiedig yn codi ofn arnom, a pharhawn i herio anghysonderau fel y gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng y prisiau hynny. Disgwylw i'r Llywodraeth roi ar waith yr argymhellion y mae wedi cytuno arnynt.

Y bedwaredd thema yw gwella gwasanaethau i'r dinesydd. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi gofyn cwestiynau'n gyson am effaith gwasanaethau ar ddinasyddion unigol, boed hynny'n fater o ffermwyr sy'n derbyn cymorthdaliadau'n hwyrach o lawer nag y dylent, neu o gleifion mewn ysbytai sy'n cael eu trin mewn wardiau brwnt, ac anlanwaith, yn wir. Unwaith eto, gwnaethom argymhellion sydd â'r amcan o fynd i'r afael â diffygion mewn gwasanaethau, fel galw am well cyfathrebu rhwng adrannau cynnal a chadw a glanhau mewn ysbytai.

Mae gwersi sy'n gysylltiedig â'r themâu hyn sy'n berthnasol i'r holl wasanaethau

committee, therefore, looks to public officials to consider these to ensure better use of the resources of the people of Wales.

Having given you a flavour of our work over the past year, it is appropriate to look to the future, particularly to developments in public sector audit. The single most significant development is the Public Audit (Wales) Bill. That brings together the existing powers of the Auditor General and the Audit Commission in Wales and transfers their staffs to a new body: the Wales Audit Office. The Bill will also enhance the access and reporting powers of the Auditor General, so that the use of public money can be tracked and checked more effectively.

The Bill will undoubtedly benefit my committee's scrutiny of how public money is spent across Wales, but it is not perfect. Parliament has yet to resolve the concern raised by the Assembly's ad hoc committee on the Bill about clause 54, and the unsatisfactory and unnecessary fettering of the Auditor General's ability to report on certain matters. The Westminster Government has undertaken that these provisions will be reviewed on an England and Wales basis, and the committee looks forward to that.

Not all developments in audit are dependent upon new legislation. I am pleased that the Auditor General is continuing to develop his programme of work in line with the Assembly's needs. In particular, I welcome the way that his programme of value-for-money examinations for the current financial year indicates an increasing emphasis on considering the Assembly's statutory sustainable development obligations, which mark Wales out as a country gearing up for the future. Regard for the long-term stewardship of all of Wales's resources is an essential safeguard against massive risks to those resources, including, of course, public money. It is therefore right that the Auditor General's work should address sustainable development and helps us move from words to action.

cyhoeddus. Gan hynny, mae'r pwyllgor yn disgwyl i swyddogion cyhoeddus eu hystyried er mwyn sicrhau gwell defnydd o adnoddau pobl Cymru.

A minnau wedi cynnig blas i chi o'n gwaith dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, mae'n briodol edrych tua'r dyfodol, yn enwedig tuag at ddatblygiadau ym maes archwilio'r sector cyhoeddus. Y datblygiad pwysicaf yw Mesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru). Mae hwn yn cyfuno pwerau presennol yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'r Comisiwn Archwilio yng Nghymru ac yn trosglwyddo eu staff i gorff newydd: Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Bydd y Mesur hefyd yn hyrwyddo hawliau mynediad ac adrodd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, fel y gellir olrhain y defnydd o arian cyhoeddus a'i wirio'n fwy effeithiol.

Bydd y Mesur yn sicr o fod o gymorth i'm pwyllgor wrth iddo graffu ar y modd y caiff arian cyhoeddus ei wario ledled Cymru, ond nid yw'n berffaith. Nid yw'r Senedd wedi datrys eto y pryder a godwyd gan bwyllgor *ad hoc* y Cynulliad ar y Mesur ynghylch cymal 54, a'r llesteirio anfodddhaol a diangen ar allu'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol i adrodd ar rai materion. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi ymgymryd y bydd y darpariaethau hyn yn cael eu hadolygu ar sail Cymru a Lloegr, ac mae'r pwyllgor yn edrych ymlaen at hynny.

Nid yw'r holl ddatblygiadau ym maes archwilio'n dibynnu ar ddeddfwriaeth newydd. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn parhau i ddatblygu ei raglen waith yn unol ag anghenion y Cynulliad. Yn benodol, croesawaf y modd y mae ei raglen o archwiliadau gwerth am arian ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol yn amlygu pwyslais cynyddol ar ystyried rhwymedigaethau statudol y Cynulliad o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, sy'n nodi Cymru fel gwlad sy'n paratoi ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae ystyriaeth i'r arolygu tymor hir ar holl adnoddau Cymru'n amddiffyniad hanfodol rhag y risgiau aruthrol a geir i'r adnoddau hynny, gan gynnwys, wrth gwrs, arian cyhoeddus. Mae'n briodol, felly, y dylai gwaith yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ymdrin â datblygu cynaliadwy a'n helpu i droi gair yn weithred.

I thank my fellow committee members for their close, cross-party co-operation in the handling of the committee's business, the committee's secretariat for their support, and our numerous witnesses for their co-operation and candour. Finally, I express appreciation to the Auditor General and his staff in the National Audit Office Wales. Sir John Bourn, who has had the distinction of being the first Auditor General for Wales, is stepping down at the end of this year. He has done a superb job in establishing first-rate financial scrutiny for the Assembly. It has been a great privilege to Chair the Audit Committee and to have worked so closely with Sir John Bourn.

Diolchaf i'm cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor am eu cydweithrediad trawsbleidiol clòs wrth drafod busnes y pwyllgor, i ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor am ei chymorth, ac i'n tystion niferus am eu cydweithrediad a'u didwylledd. Yn olaf, mynegaf werthfawrogiad i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'i staff yn Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru. Mae Syr John Bourn, a gafodd yr anrhydedd o fod yn Archwilydd Cyffredinol cyntaf Cymru, yn ymddeol ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon. Gwnaeth waith rhagorol wrth sefydlu craffu ariannol o'r radd flaenaf ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Braint fawr fu cadeirio'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a chael gweithio mor agos gyda Syr John Bourn.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.46 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.46 p.m.*

Leighton Andrews: I am a crime fiction addict—on page and on screen. I realise that there is not necessarily an obvious link between the latest blockbuster thriller and the Audit Committee's report, but there is one. In many crime novels and crime series on television, there is usually a grizzled detective inspector who at some stage says, 'follow the money'. That cliché, which we hear so often in crime fiction, is, in a sense, one of the Audit Committee's driving imperatives. As a new Assembly Member and a new member of the committee, I have found that the Audit Committee has been an excellent way in which to get to understand well how the public sector in Wales operates and how public money is spent. The report demonstrates that this is an essential part of the Assembly's scrutiny function and an essential manifestation of the success of devolution. Paragraph 10 points out that

'Before 1999, Parliament's Public Accounts Committee would, on average, each year examine one report on an aspect of Welsh public business. Now, each year, this Committee considers some eight to ten reports by the Auditor General for Wales, covering the full range of Assembly business.'

I have no doubt that the likelihood of being called to account before the Assembly's Audit Committee is an important check and balance in the system of public sector

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn un garw am straeon ditectif—mewn nofelau ac ar y sgrîn. Sylweddolaf nad oes cysylltiad amlwg o reidrwydd rhwng y nofel gyffrous boblogaidd ddiweddaraf ac adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, ond mae un. Mewn sawl nofel dditectif a chyfres dditectif ar y teledu, ceir fel arfer ryw dditectif arolygydd penwyn sydd ar ryw adeg yn dweud, 'dilynwch yr arian'. Yr ystrydeb honno, a glywn mor aml mewn straeon ditectif, yw un o brif gymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Fel Aelod Cynulliad newydd ac aelod newydd o'r pwyllgor, cefais fod y Pwyllgor Archwilio'n fodd rhagorol i ddod i ddeall yn dda y modd y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n gweithredu a sut y gwarir arian cyhoeddus. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod hyn yn rhan annatod o swyddogaeth craffu'r Cynulliad ac yn amlygiad hollbwysig o lwyddiant datganoli. Mae paragraff 10 yn nodi

'Cyn 1999, byddai Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus y Senedd, ar gyfartaledd, yn edrych ar un adroddiad bob blwyddyn ar agwedd ar fusnes cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Bellach, mae'r Pwyllgor yn ystyried tua wyth i ddeg o adroddiadau Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru bob blwyddyn, yn ymwneud â phob agwedd ar waith y Cynulliad.'

Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth nad yw'r tebygolrwydd i rywun gael ei alw i gyfrif gerbron Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad yn un o'r rhwystrau a gwrthbwysau pwysig yn

management in Wales, and that that is taken seriously by the Welsh Assembly Government and by Assembly sponsored public bodies. The evidence, to which Janet referred, that was taken in relation to ELWa is the most obvious, and perhaps the most extreme, example of that. As Members know, I have had a longstanding concern about this, as the Member for the Pop Factory. I am glad, having gone through that scrutiny process, that the Pop Factory is still there, is still functioning and is engaging with local people in Rhondda and beyond. That inquiry threw up important issues in relation to the governance and management of ASPBs, and I am pleased that those lessons appear to be being noted and have been taken forward by Government.

One difficulty regarding the audit process is that the media will often focus simply on the Auditor General's initial report, which is a focus on the difficulties and problems. They do not tend to look in such detail at how the Audit Committee and the NAO may engage with that process, lay down recommendations for the Government to attend to, and the Government's own response in due course. That does not get as much air time or as many column inches as the initial report, and the media is missing out on that. It is part of the media's role, in scrutinising Government in Wales, to not only report the problems but the constructive agenda and solutions to address them.

3.50 p.m.

It is fair to say that the Auditor General has stressed throughout the report that the conduct of public services in Wales is generally high. That view has also come through most of the reports produced by him and his office. I will also adopt a cross-party spirit, and thank Janet for the way in which she has chaired the committee over the past year. She has played an important role in building consensus in the committee, sometimes on quite sensitive issues. I also thank the committee secretariat for its support. The Auditor General and his team provide the Audit Committee with a powerful

system reoli'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, na'i bod yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Y dystiolaeth, y cyfeiriodd Janet ati, a gymerwyd mewn cysylltiad ag ELWa yw'r enghraifft amlycaf o hynny, a'r un fwyaf eithafol o bosibl. Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, yr wyf yn pryderu am hyn ers tro, fel yr Aelod dros y Ffatri Bop. Yr wyf yn falch, ar ôl mynd drwy'r broses graffu honno, fod y Ffatri Bop yn dal i fod yno, a'i bod yn dal i weithredu a chysylltu â phobl leol yn Rhondda a'r tu hwnt. Gwnaeth yr ymchwiliad hwnnw godi materion pwysig mewn cysylltiad â llywodraethu a rheoli CCNC, ac yr wyf yn falch bod y gwersi hynny'n cael eu nodi, i bob golwg, a bod Llywodraeth wedi gweithredu ar eu sail.

Un o'r anawsterau mewn cysylltiad â'r broses archwilio yw y bydd y cyfryngau'n aml yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar adroddiad cychwynnol yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr anawsterau a'r problemau. Nid ydynt yn tueddu i edrych mor fanwl ar y modd y gallai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol ymwneud â'r broses honno, a chyflwyno argymhellion i sylw'r Llywodraeth, ac ymateb y Llywodraeth ei hun pan ddaw. Ni chaiff hynny gymaint o sylw yn y wasg a'r cyfryngau darlledu â'r adroddiad cychwynnol, ac mae'r cyfryngau'n methu hynny. Rhan o rôl y cyfryngau, wrth graffu ar waith Llywodraeth yng Nghymru, yw adrodd ar yr agenda adeiladol a'r atebion, yn ogystal â'r problemau.

Teg yw dweud bod yr Archwilydd Cenedlaethol wedi pwysleisio drwy'r adroddiad fod y gwaith o gynnal gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru o safon uchel at ei gilydd. Cyflewyd y farn honno yn y rhan fwyaf o'r adroddiadau a gynhyrchwyd ganddo ef a'i swyddfa. Mabwysiadaf innau hefyd ysbryd trawsbleidiol, a diolch i Janet am y modd y cadeiriodd y pwyllgor dros y flwyddyn a aeth heibio. Chwaraeodd ran bwysig wrth greu consensws yn y pwyllgor, a hynny weithiau ar faterion eithaf sensitif. Diolchaf hefyd i ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor am ei chymorth.

capability to examine different elements of the public sector's work. Without their work, there is no question that public life in Wales would not be as well scrutinised as it currently is.

Alun Cairns: I thank the committee Chair, Janet Davies, and current and former clerks for their support during the past 12 months in running the Audit Committee. It is also important to acknowledge the work of the Auditor General, the directors of his office and support staff for their thorough preparation of reports for the committee. I also acknowledge the co-operation of the vast majority of the witnesses. I cannot recall there having been a unco-operative committee witness during the past 12 months, even though some are given a grilling—we do not question aggressively, as the Chair would not allow such behaviour, but we are rigorous—to ensure that we get to the bottom of the issues under consideration.

Leighton Andrews highlighted the importance of the Audit Committee's role. When people ask what are the benefits of devolution, particularly those who voted 'no' in the referendum, the Audit Committee is something tangible that we can refer to in order to highlight the savings and improvements within public services that devolution can bring through appropriate scrutiny. Research indicates that for every pound that the Auditor General spends on running his office and supporting the committee, £7 is saved as a result of efficiency gains or better management in the organisations under scrutiny. I would not question that figure, knowing the rigorous way in which the Auditor General presents data to the committee.

I acknowledge the non-party-political way in which the Audit Committee considers issues and conducts its business. This has been tested on occasions, which is healthy. I asked Janet Davies before the debate whether we have ever held a vote in the committee. I could not recall doing so when trying to agree a report or actions that the committee should

Mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'i dîm yn rhoi gallu mawr i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio i edrych ar wahanol agweddau ar waith y sector cyhoeddus. Heb eu gwaith hwy, nid oes amheuaeth na fyddai crystal craffu ar fywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ag a geir yn awr.

Alun Cairns: Diolchaf i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, Janet Davies, ac i'r clerod presennol a blaenorol am eu cymorth yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf wrth redeg y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod gwaith yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, cyfarwyddwyr ei swyddfa a'u staff cynorthwyol am eu gwaith trwyadl wrth baratoi adroddiadau ar gyfer y pwyllgor. Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod cydweithrediad y mwyafrif helaeth o'r tystion. Ni allaf gofio bod tyst nad oedd wedi cydweithredu â'r pwyllgor yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, er bod rhai'n cael eu croesholi—nid ydym yn holi'n ymosodol, gan na chaniatâi'r Cadeirydd ymddygiad o'r fath, ond yr ydym yn drwyadl—i sicrhau yr awn at wraidd y materion dan sylw.

Gwnaeth Leighton Andrews dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd rôl y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Pan yw pobl yn holi am fanteision datganoli, yn enwedig y rhai a bleidleisiodd yn ei erbyn yn y refferendwm, mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n rhywbeth pendant y gallwn gyfeirio ato er mwyn tynnu sylw at yr arbedion a'r gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y gall datganoli eu dwyn yn ei sgîl drwy graffu priodol. Dengys ymchwil fod £7 yn cael ei arbed am bob punt y mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ei wario ar redeg ei swyddfa a chynorthwyo'r pwyllgor o ganlyniad i arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd neu well rheoli yn y cyrff a craffir ar eu gwaith. Ni fyddwn yn amau'r ffigur hwnnw, o wybod am y modd trwyadl y mae'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn cyflwyno data i'r pwyllgor.

Cydnabyddaf y modd anwleidyddol y mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n ystyried materion ac yn cynnal ei fusnes. Cafwyd bod hynny'n anodd ar adegau, ac mae hynny'n beth iach. Gofynnais i Janet Davies cyn y ddatl a ydym wedi cael pleidlais yn y pwyllgor erioed. Ni allwn gofio gwneud hynny wrth geisio cytuno ar adroddiad neu ar gamau y dylai'r

or should not take. That demonstrates the way in which all parties seek to co-operate on committee business.

I have one concern, namely that the objectivity or non-party-political nature of the committee could be at risk if it is ever used to draw attention away from any controversial issues that might arise—a quango might have to answer serious questions, for example. This has almost happened on many occasions during the past 12 months—I do not believe that such a scenario has actually occurred—when the Assembly Government has said that an issue is in the hands of the Audit Committee and that, therefore, it is not fair to comment on it, even when the public demands some kind of response. We have been told at times that a statement on a certain issue will not be made in Chamber because the committee is investigating that issue. Statements made by the Government before an Audit Committee investigation is completed, or during the process of such an investigation, can be helpful as they can shed light on the issue and help the committee in considering the matter in hand. Therefore, if Ministers are faced with uncomfortable questions, I hope that they would not respond by saying that matters are in the hands of the Audit Committee. It would be wrong to use this reason as an answer. If this happens, we will end up with a situation where it will only be possible to discuss issues in a party-political manner in the Audit Committee. This would defeat the object and the purpose of the Audit Committee as well as the benefits brought about by the way in which it has conducted its work in recent years.

In conclusion, I recognise the efforts of all those who have taken part in the Audit Committee's work, including everyone who has given evidence or undertaken a scrutiny role. I reiterate the obligation on the Assembly Government to respond, if the press and media demand responses to questions, rather than hide behind an Audit Committee investigation. To see the Government shying away from providing responses to questions by hiding behind Audit Committee investigations and using this as an excuse undermines the benefits of Assembly scrutiny.

pwyllgor eu cymryd. Mae hynny'n dangos y modd y mae'r holl bleidiau'n ceisio cydweithredu ar fusnes y pwyllgor.

Mae un mater yn peri pryder i mi, sef y gallai gwrthrychedd neu natur anwleidyddol y pwyllgor gael eu peryglu pe defnyddid ef byth i dynnu sylw oddi wrth unrhyw faterion dadleuol a allai godi—efallai y byddai cwango yn gorfod ateb cwestiynau pwysig, er enghraifft. Bu bron i hynny ddigwydd ar sawl achlysur yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf—ni chredaf fod senario o'r fath wedi digwydd mewn gwirionedd—pan ddywedodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod rhyw fater yn nwylo'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ac, felly, nad oedd yn deg gwneud sylw amdano, hyd yn oed os yw'r cyhoedd yn mynnu rhyw fath o ymateb. Dywedwyd wrthym ar adegau na wneir datganiad ar fater penodol yn y Siambr gan fod y pwyllgor yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwnnw. Mae datganiadau a wneir gan y Llywodraeth cyn cwblhau ymchwiliad gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio, neu yn ystod ymchwiliad o'r fath, yn gallu bod o gymorth gan y gallant daflu goleuni ar y mater dan sylw a helpu'r pwyllgor i'w ystyried. Gan hynny, os yw Gweinidogion yn wynebu cwestiynau annifyr, gobeithiaf na fyddant yn ymateb drwy ddweud bod y mater yn nwylo'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Anghywir fyddai defnyddio'r rheswm hwn fel ateb. Os digwydd hyn, yn y diwedd cawn sefyllfa lle na fydd ond yn bosibl trafod materion mewn modd gwleidyddol yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Byddai hynny'n mynd yn groes i'r bwriad ac i bwrpas y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn ogystal â'r buddion a gafwyd drwy'r modd y cynhaliodd ei waith yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

I derfynu, cydnabyddaf ymdrechion pawb a gymerodd ran yng ngwaith y Pwyllgor Archwilio, gan gynnwys pawb a roddodd dystiolaeth neu a ymgymerodd â rôl craffu. Dywedaf eto fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dan orfodaeth i ymateb, os yw'r wasg a'r cyfryngau'n mynnu atebion i gwestiynau, yn hytrach na chuddio y tu ôl i ymchwiliad gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae gweld y Llywodraeth yn gwingo rhag ateb cwestiynau drwy guddio y tu ôl i ymchwiliadau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a defnyddio hynny'n esgus yn tansilio'r buddion a geir o graffu gan y Cynulliad.

Mick Bates: I record my thanks to the Audit Committee Chair for the way in which she has handled the committee throughout this year, which was my first as a member. It has been an interesting experience. To continue in the vein of consensus, I thank the secretariat for the way in which it has run the committee. I offer particular thanks to Sir John Bourn as Auditor General, who had to establish effective scrutiny in Wales. This has been achieved, and we all look forward, following the passage of the Public Audit (Wales) Bill, to the establishment of the Wales Audit Office and to the continuation of the effective scrutiny undertaken by Sir John and his staff.

Like the Chair, I consider this committee to be fundamental to devolution. Other Members have referred to the lack of scrutiny prior to devolution. An important message for the Government, and particularly for the First Minister, is that the devolution process demands that we look at how we scrutinise our legislative process. The Audit Committee currently investigates the conduct of public bodies, but we need to ensure that we control the legislative process in Wales. Lack of scrutiny by the former Welsh Office supports the case for the Government to press for the recommendations of the Richard commission to be implemented. The audit process, therefore, includes an important message that the Government must take on board.

The committee has met outside Cardiff, which is unique, and I welcomed the committee to Montgomeryshire on one occasion. A committee that deals with scrutiny does not necessarily have to meet in different parts of the country, but it is to be commended on meeting outside Cardiff, as are other Assembly committees.

I assess the effectiveness of the committee by considering the recommendations made on receipt of the Auditor General's report. The recommendations have been 95 per cent effective, as I believe that, out of a total of 80 recommendations, 76 have been accepted by the Government. This is an important aspect of the committee's work, on which the Auditor General and the Chair are to be congratulated.

Mick Bates: Datganaf fy niolch i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio am y modd y trafododd y pwyllgor drwy gydol y flwyddyn hon, sef y gyntaf i mi fod yn aelod ohono. Bu'n brofiad diddorol. Gan barhau yn yr un cywair o gonsensws, diolchaf i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth am y modd y mae wedi rhedeg y pwyllgor. Diolchaf yn benodol i Syr John Bourn yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, sydd wedi sefydlu craffu effeithiol yng Nghymru. Sicrhawyd hynny, ac yr ydym oll yn edrych ymlaen, wedi i Fesur Archwilio Cyhoeddus (Cymru) gael ei basio, at sefydlu Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ac at barhad y craffu effeithiol a wnaed gan Syr John a'i staff.

Yn debyg i'r Cadeirydd, ystyriaf fod y pwyllgor hwn yn rhan hanfodol o ddatganoli. Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at y diffyg craffu cyn datganoli. Neges bwysig i'r Llywodraeth, a'r Prif Weinidog yn benodol, yw bod proses datganoli yn mynnu ein bod yn ystyried y modd y craffwn ar ein proses deddfu. Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n ymchwilio i ymddygiad cyrff cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd, ond rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn rheoli'r broses deddfu yng Nghymru. Mae'r diffyg craffu gan y Swyddfa Gymreig gynt yn ategu'r ddadl y dylai'r Llywodraeth bwysu am roi argymhellion comisiwn Richard ar waith. Felly, mae'r broses archwilio yn cynnwys neges bwysig y mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ei hystyried.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi cwrdd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, a pheth unigryw yw hynny, a chroesewais y pwyllgor i sir Drefaldwyn ar un achlysur. Nid yw pwyllgor sy'n delio â chraffu'n gorfod cwrdd mewn gwahanol rannau o'r wlad, o reidrwydd, ond mae i'w ganmol am gwrdd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, fel y mae pwyllgorau eraill y Cynulliad.

Asesaf effeithiolrwydd y pwyllgor drwy ystyried yr argymhellion a wnaed ar ôl cael adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Bu 95 y cant o'r argymhellion yn effeithiol, gan fy mod yn credu bod 76 o blith cyfanswm o 80 o argymhellion wedi cael eu derbyn gan y Llywodraeth. Mae hon yn agwedd bwysig ar waith y pwyllgor, y dylid llongyfarch yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'r Cadeirydd arno.

The topics discussed by the committee have been of great interest to me. Leighton referred to the fact that it is interesting to be involved in real scrutiny. This was particularly true in the case of ELWa, the report on which brought to the forefront the question of ultimate responsibility for mismanagement. Questions such as this are not always suitably answered by the relevant Minister and, in the case of the ELWa inquiry, questions remain.

The investigations into bovine TB and late payments to farmers were also of particular interest to me. In our scrutiny of contracts during these investigations, as well as those relating to the NHS, we found that they seemed to be written without penalty clauses. This will have to be addressed. Contracts should be transparent and should include penalty clauses relating to non-completion of what we demand from those contracts.

4.00 p.m.

Finally, I consider a subject for future scrutiny to be the Government of Wales Act 1998 and its three main planks of social inclusion, equal opportunity and sustainable development. The Audit Committee should pay particular attention to this to ensure, at some stage, that an audit is held of how successful the Government has been in producing an outcome from these directions in the Government of Wales Act 1998. I endorse the Chair's remarks that with regard to sustainable development, in particular, we must ensure that the Government's rhetoric—which is first-class, I might add—is met by outcomes. Were we to investigate that, we would realise that the Government has not, as yet, been fully effective, or as effective as the Audit Committee has been, in many areas.

Once again, I thank the Chair and all the staff for the way the Audit Committee's business has been conducted.

Mark Isherwood: We commend this report as a full and fair illustration of the fact that the Audit Committee's purpose is to ensure that the Assembly and other public bodies

Ymddiddorais yn fawr yn y pynciau a drafodwyd gan y pwyllgor. Cyfeiriodd Leighton at y ffaith ei bod yn ddiddorol ymwneud â chraffu go iawn. Yr oedd hynny'n arbennig o wir yn achos ELWa, y gwnaeth yr adroddiad arno amlygu'r cwestiwn ynghylch y cyfrifoldeb sylfaenol am gamreoli. Nid yw cwestiynau o'r fath yn cael eu hateb yn briodol bob amser gan y Gweinidog perthnasol ac, yn achos yr ymchwiliad i ELWa, mae cwestiynau'n aros.

Bu'r ymchwiliadau i dwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg a thaliadau hwyr i ffermwyr o ddiddordeb neilltuol i mi hefyd. Wrth graffu ar gontractau yn ystod yr ymchwiliadau hyn, yn ogystal â'r rhai a oedd yn ymwneud â'r GIG, cawsom nad oedd cymalau cosb ynddynt, i bob golwg. Bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â hyn. Dylai contractau fod yn dryloyw a dylent gynnwys cymalau cosb yn ymwneud â methu â chwblhau'r hyn a fynynnw o'r contractau hynny.

Yn olaf, ystyriaf mai un pwnc y gellid craffu arno yn y dyfodol yw Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a'r tri chonglfaen sydd ynddi, sef cynhwysiant cymdeithasol, cyfle cyfartal a datblygu cynaliadwy. Dylai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio roi sylw penodol i hyn er mwyn sicrhau y cynhelir archwiliad, rywbryd, ar y graddau y llwyddodd y Llywodraeth i gyflawni'r cyfarwyddiadau hyn yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Cymeradwyaf sylwadau'r Cadeirydd i'r perwyl bod rhaid inni sicrhau, yn achos datblygu cynaliadwy'n benodol, fod rhethreg y Llywodraeth—sydd o'r radd flaenaf, gallwn ychwanegu—yn arwain i ganlyniadau. Pe byddem yn ymchwilio i hynny, sylweddolem na fu'r Llywodraeth yn gwbl effeithiol, hyd yma, neu mor effeithiol ag y bu'r Pwyllgor Archwilio mewn sawl maes.

Unwaith eto, diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd a'r holl staff am y modd y cynhaliwyd busnes y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

Mark Isherwood: Cymeradwywn yr adroddiad hwn fel amlygiad o'r ffaith mai pwrpas y Pwyllgor Archwilio yw sicrhau bod y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yn

operate to the highest possible standards in the management of financial affairs. We hope that this shows that the Committee provides assurance to the taxpayers of Wales that money is being spent wisely, as a deterrent against waste and as guidance for the Welsh public sector to improve its work. As the report states, the proper conduct of public business is essential for the sustained delivery of good-quality public services for general public confidence. We have heard reference to the volume of work undertaken, and it is interesting that before 1999, Parliament's Public Accounts Committee averaged only one report per annum. The Audit Committee now considers around eight to 10 reports by the Auditor General for Wales annually. This greater coverage undoubtedly helps to achieve a higher and more persistent standard in the conduct of public business in Wales.

Nonetheless, it is a concern that the report states that during this year

'deficiencies have emerged across several areas of business in terms of management and office holders failing to fulfil their proper roles, having relaxed attitudes to controls—even circumventing them—and failures to keep proper business records.'

It clearly highlights the Pop Centre MP3 Café project as an example of that, stating that

'it was clear that the perceived need for speed by ELWa officials and shortcomings in their organisational culture led them to override safeguards intended to ensure that public funds are spent wisely.'

It goes on to say that

'this was a failure of management rather than a failure of the system itself.'

I read the record of the debate on ELWa, and picked up on comments to which I referred from Steve Martin, the former chief executive, who stated that

gweithredu'n unol â'r safonau uchaf posibl wrth reoli materion ariannol. Gobeithiwn fod hyn yn dangos bod y Pwyllgor yn rhoi sicrwydd i drethdalwyr Cymru fod arian yn cael ei wario'n ddoeth, fel rhwystr rhag gwastraff ac fel cyfarwyddyd i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wella ei waith. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, mae'n hollbwysig cynnal busnes cyhoeddus mewn modd priodol os yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da i gael eu darparu'n gyson er mwyn ennyn ymddiriedaeth yn y cyhoedd. Clywsom gyfeirio at faint y gwaith yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef, a diddorol yw nodi mai dim ond un adroddiad y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd a drafododd Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus y Senedd, cyn 1999. Bellach mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n ystyried oddeutu wyth i 10 adroddiad gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru bob blwyddyn. Mae'r ymdriniaeth helaethach hon yn sicr o fod o gymorth i gael safon uwch a mwy cyson yn y gwaith o gynnal busnes cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Er hynny, testun pryder yw bod yr adroddiad yn nodi, wrth gyfeirio at y flwyddyn hon, y

'daeth diffygion i'r amlwg eleni mewn sawl maes o ran rheoli a methiant deiliaid swyddi i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau priodol, eu hagweddau llac at dulliau rheoli—a hyd yn oed hepgor y dulliau rheoli hynny—a pheidio â chadw cofnodion busnes priodol.'

Mae'n tynnu sylw at brosiect Caffi MP3 y Ganolfan Bop fel enghraifft o hynny, gan ddweud iddi ddod yn amlwg

'bod angen canfyddedig swyddogion ELWa i wneud popeth ar garlam a gwendidau yn y diwylliant trefniadaethol wedi peri iddynt hepgor y mesurau diogelu sy'n sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario'n ddoeth.'

Aiff ymlaen i ddweud mai

'Y dulliau rheoli a fethodd yma, yn hytrach na'r system ei hun.'

Darllenais y cofnod o'r ddadl ar ELWa, a nodi sylwadau y cyfeiriais atynt gan Steve Martin, y cyn-brif weithredwr, a ddywedodd fod

‘the Welsh Assembly Government and the council had a huge agenda and were keen to be responsive. In retrospect, it was a mistaken approach. They were too ambitious and tried to do too much.’

‘gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a’r cyngor agenda enfawr ac yr oeddent yn awyddus i fod yn ymatebol. Wrth edrych yn ôl, yr oedd yn ymagwedd annoeth. Yr oeddent yn rhy uchelgeisiol a cheisiwyd gwneud gormod.’

It goes on to say that they should have agreed with the Assembly Government on the nature of the future agenda, but:

Aiff ymlaen i ddweud y dylent fod wedi cytuno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar natur yr agenda ar gyfer y dyfodol, ond:

‘the policy decisions lay with the Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government.’

‘y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru oedd yn gyfrifol am y penderfyniadau polisi.’

This leads us, again, to question the Minister’s role and the denial of the principle of ministerial responsibility in this instance.

Mae hyn yn ein harwain, eto, i amau rôl y Gweinidog a’r ymwadu ag egwyddor cyfrifoldeb gweinidogol yn yr achos hwn.

I wish to make one slight correction, if I may. Throughout this report, reference is made to concerns regarding the Assembly. I would be grateful if this could be corrected to the Welsh Assembly Government, because it is my understanding that in each instance, this was a Government matter rather than the failure of the Assembly itself as a parliamentary and legislative body.

Dymunaf wneud un cywiriad bach, os caf. Drwy’r adroddiad hwn, cyfeirir at bryderon ynghylch y Cynulliad. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gellid cywiro hynny drwy ei newid yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gan fy mod yn deall mai mater i’r Llywodraeth oedd hyn ym mhob achos, yn hytrach na methiant gan y Cynulliad ei hun fel corff seneddol a deddfwrfa.

On risk management, the report states that:

Ynghylch rheoli risg, dywed yr adroddiad:

‘Good risk management is an essential part of the effective management of public business, but is one that is often overlooked or undervalued by officials.’

‘Mae rheoli risg yn dda yn rhan hanfodol o reoli busnes cyhoeddus yn effeithiol, ond yn agwedd sy’n aml yn cael ei diystyru neu ei thanwerthfawrogi.’

I have already referred to the most spectacular example of the failure of risk management in ELWa, and I will briefly use a second example. The Audit Committee’s report highlights the renewal of private sector housing in Wales, which states in its conclusion that

Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at yr enghraifft fwyaf trawiadol o’r methiant i reoli risg yn ELWa, a chyfeiriaf yn fyr at ail enghraifft. Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio’n tynnu sylw at adnewyddu tai sector preifat yng Nghymru, a dywedir yn ei ddiwedd glo

‘it is too early to say much about the success of the new arrangements, but the key will be, as witnesses explained to us, establishing a successful partnership between the players. While this will involve the Assembly trusting local authorities to take advantage of the extra freedom and responsibility they now have for the benefit of the people, given the inevitable risks involved, it is also important that the Assembly fulfils its role—as the Permanent Secretary recognised—of

mae’n rhy fuan i allu dweud llawer am lwyddiant y trefniadau newydd ond, fel yr eglurodd tystion i ni, yr allwedd i hynny fydd sefydlu partneriaeth lwyddiannus rhwng y cyfranwyr. Er y bydd hynny’n golygu y bydd yn rhaid i’r Cynulliad ymddiried mewn awdurdodau lleol i fanteisio ar y rhyddid a’r cyfrifoldeb ychwanegol sydd ganddynt yn awr er budd y bobl, yng ngolwg y risgiau anochel sy’n gysylltiedig â hynny, mae hefyd yn bwysig i’r Cynulliad gyflawni ei rôl—fel

monitoring, at the all-Wales level, how well the authorities perform. There is a world of difference between being an active partner and a sleeping one.'

In its recommendation, the National Audit Office stated that the Assembly, and therefore the Government, must

'remain alert to the key risk concerning the devolution of power to local authorities and continue to play a fully active role in partnership with local authorities.'

On that note, I will jump to the conclusion, namely that we welcome the Committee's 90 recommendations for the improvement of public spending and note that of the 80 recommendations directed at the Assembly, on which it has responded, the Assembly has already accepted 76. However, on a note of caution, real delivery will never happen in full until politicians at a local and national level accept real ownership and embrace strong internal and external scrutiny and control.

Finally, I thank the Chair, Janet Davies, for her fairness and efficiency throughout the year, and I also thank the Auditor General and the National Audit Office for their courtesy, impartiality and wisdom.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I will speak briefly. The Assembly Government supports the Committee's excellent work. In her role as Chair of the Committee, Janet has maintained the high standards of her predecessor, which is a testament to her commitment. The Audit Committee continues to build on its deserved reputation for rigour and independence, and that is imperative. The Assembly Government has consistently agreed with, and taken action on, its recommendations. We all expect high standards of conduct in public business, with regard to the management of risk, efficient and effective use of the Assembly's money and improving services to the citizens of Wales. I fully endorse the Audit Committee's report, and I thank the Committee for its work.

y cydnabu'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol—wrth fonitro perfformiad yr awdurdodau ar lefel Cymru gyfan. Mae byd o wahaniaeth rhwng bod yn bartner gweithredol a bod yn bartner segur.

Yn ei hargymhelliad, dywedodd y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol fod yn rhaid i'r Cynulliad, ac felly'r Llywodraeth

aros yn effro i'r prif risg sy'n gysylltiedig â datganoli pŵer i awdurdodau lleol a pharhau i chwarae rhan weithredol lawn mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau lleol.

Ar y nodyn hwnnw, neidiaf i'r casgliad, sef ein bod yn croesawu'r 90 o argymhellion a wnaeth y Pwyllgor ar gyfer gwella gwariant cyhoeddus ac yn nodi, gyda golwg ar y 80 o argymhellion a gyfeiriwyd i'r Cynulliad, y mae wedi ymateb iddynt, ei fod eisoes wedi derbyn 76 ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, ar nodyn o rybudd, nid eir â'r maen i'r wal o ddifrif hyd nes y bydd gwleidyddion ar lefel leol a chenedlaethol yn derbyn perchnogaeth wirioneddol ac yn croesawu craffu a rheoli mewnol ac allanol cadarn.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd, Janet Davies, am ei thegwch a'i heffeithlonrwydd drwy gydol y flwyddyn, a diolchaf hefyd i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol am eu cwrteisi, eu didueddrwydd a'u doethineb.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Siaradaf yn fyr. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi gwaith rhagorol y Pwyllgor. Yn ei rôl fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, mae Janet wedi parhau â safonau uchel ei rhagflaenydd, ac mae hynny'n dyst i'w hymroddiad. Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n dal i adeiladu ar sail ei enw da haeddiannol am drylwyredd ac annibyniaeth, ac mae hynny'n hanfodol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cytuno'n gyson â'i argymhellion ac wedi gweithredu ar eu sail. Yr ydym oll yn disgwyl safonau ymddygiad uchel mewn busnes cyhoeddus, gyda golwg ar reoli risg, defnydd effeithiol ac effeithlon o arian y Cynulliad a gwella gwasanaethau ar gyfer dinasyddion Cymru. Llwy'r gymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, a diolchaf i'r Pwyllgor am ei waith.

Janet Davies: I will pick up on a few points. First, I thank Members for their contribution to this debate. The Audit Committee depends on the value added from teams of experienced and independent auditors. I agree with Leighton about the problems of the press and I have been talking to a press officer about trying to address some of those issues to ensure that the Audit Committee's reports are better picked up. Alun raised the issue of matters coming before the Audit Committee that should not be discussed beforehand. We agreed upon some key principles with regard to that, namely that Committee members would not comment on any investigations before the Committee had considered them, but there is no such rule that applies to Ministers, although they may have Cabinet rules, of which I am not aware. However, they are free to say what they wish to say at present. I thank Mick for his comments. The idea of looking back at the three main planks is a good one, and we are starting on the sustainable development plank. The forward look in September will allow us to take up the other two planks.

On Mark's point, referring to the Assembly, rather than to the Welsh Assembly Government is a bad mistake, and we must pick up on that. One major issue for the Audit Committee and the National Audit Office is to continue to monitor and ensure that recommendations are implemented and that there is general improvement.

Janet Davies: Ymdriniaf â rhai pwyntiau. Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i Aelodau am eu cyfraniad i'r ddatl hon. Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio'n dibynnu ar y gwerth a ychwanegir gan dimau o archwilwyr profiadol ac annibynnol. Cytunaf â Leighton ynghylch y problemau mewn cysylltiad â'r wasg a bwm yn siarad â swyddog y wasg ynghylch ceisio ymdrin â rhai o'r materion hynny er mwyn sicrhau mwy o sylw i adroddiadau'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Gwnaeth Alun godi'r cwestiwn ynghylch peidio â thrafod materion a ddaw gerbron y Pwyllgor Archwilio ymlaen llaw. Cytunasom ar rai egwyddorion allweddol mewn cysylltiad â hynny, sef na wnâi aelodau'r pwyllgor sylw am unrhyw ymchwiliadau cyn i'r pwyllgor eu hystyried, ond nid oes unrhyw reol o'r fath ar gyfer Gweinidogion, er ei bod yn bosibl bod ganddynt reolau yn y Cabinet na wn amdanynt. Fodd bynnag, maent yn rhydd i ddweud yr hyn a fyddant ar hyn o bryd. Diolchaf i Mick am ei sylwadau. Mae'r syniad o adolygu'r tri phrif gonglfaen yn un da, ac yr ydym yn dechrau ymdrin â chonglfaen datblygu cynaliadwy. Bydd y rhagolwg ym mis Medi yn caniatáu inni ymdrin â'r ddau gonglfaen arall.

Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaeth Mark, mae cyfeirio at y Cynulliad yn hytrach nag at Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gamgymeriad gwael, a rhaid inni ymdrin â hynny. Un mater o bwys i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yw parhau i fonitro a sicrhau y rhoddir argymhellion ar waith ac y ceir gwelliant cyffredinol.

Cynnig (NDM2014): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2014): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Atal Llifogydd Flood Defence

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the consultation on 'Flood Defence Arrangements in Wales—The Future'. (NDM2015)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r ymgynghoriad ar 'Trefniadau Atal Llifogydd yng Nghymru—Y Dyfodol'. (NDM2015)

4.10 p.m.

I am sure that Members will agree that appropriate and adequate flood defence

Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna Aelodau fod trefniadau priodol a digonol i atal llifogydd

arrangements, are an important part of the infrastructure of Wales. The damage and distress experienced by those who are unfortunate enough to have experienced flooding to their property live long in their memories.

The flooding that occurred in 1998 and 2000 was a wake-up call to us all, and the recent flooding in north Wales was a timely reminder. It is estimated that, in Wales, over a 100,000 properties are at risk of flooding, and the estimated capital value of this property is nearly £8 billion. The economic cost of flooding in Wales, as well as the social cost, is therefore significant.

Scientific research into climate change indicates that the severity of storms will increase, and storms that were regarded as infrequent events are likely to become more common place. We also know that global warming and a rise in sea levels will increase the threat to our coastal defences. Therefore, it is important that the flood defence arrangements take account of the need to react to the changes in flood risk that climate change will bring.

The Environment Agency is the principal flood defence authority in England and Wales, and that will remain the case. It operates on river catchments that cross the political border between England and Wales. In Wales, we are currently served by two regional flood defence committees and six local flood defence committees. They obtain money by setting a levy on local authorities who, in turn, are reimbursed by the Government. The Assembly Government also provides direct support for capital works. These arrangements allow for local input, but they limit our ability to deal with flooding problems on a strategic basis by taking account of national priorities and policies. The existing flood defence legislation is equally complex and confusing, having evolved over many years.

In 2002-03 we contributed to a wide-ranging

yn rhan bwysig o seilwaith Cymru. Mae'r difrod a'r gofid a brofir gan y rhai sydd mor anffodus â chael llifogydd yn eu tai yn byw'n hir yn eu cof.

Yr oedd y llifogydd a gafwyd yn 1998 a 2000 yn rhybudd inni i gyd, ac yr oedd y llifogydd yn y Gogledd yn ddiweddar yn ddigwyddiad amserol i'n hatgoffa. Amcangyfrifir bod mwy na 100,000 o dai yng Nghymru mewn perygl oddi wrth lifogydd, a'r amcangyfrif o werth cyfalaf yr eiddo hwn yw bron £8 biliwn. Gan hynny, mae cost economaidd llifogydd yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r gost gymdeithasol, yn sylweddol.

Mae ymchwil gan wyddonwyr i newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dangos y bydd stormydd yn mynd yn fwy garw, a bod stormydd a ystyridd yn ddigwyddiadau prin yn debygol o ddod yn fwy cyffredin. Gwyddom oll y bydd y cynhesu byd-eang a'r codiad yn lefelau'r môr yn peri mwy o fygythiad i'r amddiffynfeydd ar ein harfordir. Gan hynny, mae'n bwysig sicrhau y bydd y trefniadau i atal llifogydd yn darparu ar gyfer yr angen i ymateb i newidiadau yn y risg o lifogydd a ddaw yn sgîl newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yw'r prif awdurdod atal llifogydd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, a bydd yn parhau felly. Mae'n gweithredu ar ddalgylchoedd afonydd sy'n croesi'r ffin wleidyddol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yng Nghymru, fe'n gwasanaethir ar hyn o bryd gan ddau bwyllogor atal llifogydd rhanbarthol a chwe phwyllgor atal llifogydd lleol. Cânt arian drwy osod ardoll ar awdurdodau lleol a gaiff eu had-dalu, yn eu tro, gan y Llywodraeth. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi cymorth uniongyrchol hefyd ar gyfer gweithfeydd cyfalaf. Mae'r trefniadau hyn yn darparu ar gyfer mewnbwn lleol, ond maent yn cyfyngu ar ein gallu i ddelio â phroblemau sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd mewn modd strategol drwy ystyried blaenoriaethau a pholisïau cenedlaethol. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol ar gyfer atal llifogydd yn gymhleth a dyrys i'r un graddau, gan ei bod wedi datblygu dros flynyddoedd lawer.

Yn 2002-03 cyfranasom at adolygiad

review on flood defence funding that concluded that the existing arrangements were not now appropriate to meet the future challenges posed by climate change, and a need was identified to streamline the current funding and administrative arrangements. In light of that review, my predecessor, Sue Essex, concluded that a final decision on the number of committees, their financial arrangements and their composition would be made following a further consultation exercise. To deliver some of these improvements, changes in primary legislation were required and these were introduced as part of the Water Act 2003.

Having welcomed the findings of the funding review, I undertook a consultation last autumn to determine a way forward in Wales. I sought comments on whether there should be a single regional committee, funded primarily by the Assembly, or three committees based on the catchment areas and the agency's three operational areas, funded primarily by levy on local authorities, with direct Assembly grants for capital works. I also consulted on the option of the eastern-most boundary of the committee, or committees, aligning with the political boundary of Wales. The consultation was widely circulated to some 70 organisations and over 40 responses were received. Of the options in the consultation, the results indicated a strong preference for a block grant to be paid by the Assembly directly to the Environment Agency. Two issues of particular note were raised during the consultation responses. These related to the impact of change in funding arrangements and the impact on catchment management should a political boundary be adopted for the single committee in Wales. I have considered these matters in some detail.

In England and Wales we are fortunate to be served by the Environment Agency, and I am confident that the agency can manage flood risk in Wales through a committee based on a political boundary. In streamlining existing arrangements, my aim is to simplify accountabilities, responsibilities and funding arrangements, enable strategic decisions to be taken in the best interests of Wales, and

cynhwysfawr o gyllido gwaith atal llifogydd a ddaeth i'r casgliad nad oedd y trefniadau presennol yn addas bellach i ymateb i'r heriau a geid yn y dyfodol oherwydd newid yn yr hinsawdd, a chanfuwyd angen i symleiddio'r trefniadau presennol ar gyfer cyllido a gweinyddu. Yng ngoleuni'r adolygiad hwnnw, daeth fy rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, i'r casgliad y byddid yn penderfynu'n derfynol ar nifer y pwyllgorau, eu trefniadau ariannol a'u cyfansoddiad ar ôl ymgynghoriad pellach. Er mwyn cyflawni rhai o'r gwelliannau hynny, yr oedd angen newidiadau i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol a chyflwynwyd y rhain fel rhan o Ddeddf Dŵr 2003.

A minnau wedi croesawu canfyddiadau'r adolygiad o gyllido, ymgymerais ag ymgynghoriad yr hydref diwethaf i bennu ffordd ymlaen yng Nghymru. Ceisiais sylwadau ynghylch a ddylid cael un pwyllgor rhanbarthol, wedi'i gyllido'n bennaf gan y Cynulliad, neu dri phwyllgor wedi'u seilio ar y dalgylchoedd a thair ardal weithredol yr asiantaeth, wedi'u cyllido'n bennaf drwy ardoll ar awdurdodau lleol, gyda grantiau uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer gweithfeydd cyfalaf. Ymgynghorais hefyd ar y dewis o gysoni ffin fwyaf dwyreiniol y pwyllgor, neu'r pwyllgorau, â ffin wleidyddol Cymru. Ymgynghorwyd yn eang â rhyw 70 o gyrff a chafwyd mwy na 40 o ymatebion. O blith y dewisiadau yn yr ymgynghoriad, yr oedd y canlyniadau'n dangos bod y rhan fwyaf o blaid y dewis o dalu grant bloc gan y Cynulliad yn uniongyrchol i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Codwyd dau fater o bwys neilltuol yn yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad. Yr oeddent yn ymwneud ag effaith y newid i'r trefniadau cyllido a'r effaith ar reoli dalgylchoedd pe mabwysiedid ffin wleidyddol ar gyfer yr un pwyllgor yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi ystyried y materion hyn mewn cryn fanylder.

Yng Nghymru a Lloegr yr ydym yn ffodus o gael ein gwasanaethu gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y gall yr asiantaeth reoli'r risg oddi wrth lifogydd yng Nghymru drwy bwyllgor sy'n seiliedig ar ffin wleidyddol. Wrth symleiddio'r trefniadau presennol, fy mwriad yw symleiddio atebolrwydd, cyfrifoldeb a threfniadau cyllido, sicrhau y gellir gwneud

enable the Assembly to set the required policy framework and monitor the achievement of its targets. I concluded that the appropriate way forward for Wales is the establishment of a single committee covering the whole of Wales, fully funded by the Assembly. I therefore propose to bring forward Orders to revoke the local flood defence committees and create an interim single flood defence committee, based on the catchment boundary. I also propose to streamline the funding arrangements so that the flood defence service will be fully funded by the Assembly via a block grant. This will be followed by other work so that the regional flood defence committee, based on the political boundary, can be put in place—these Orders being subject to Assembly and parliamentary procedures.

I have asked officials to undertake further work on the composition of the new committee to reflect the new streamlined arrangements, and they will also investigate ways of limiting or removing the levy-raising powers of the agency. The impact of these proposals will be to secure the expenditure on flood defence in Wales that we require and clarify accountabilities. It will also create opportunities for savings by reducing administrative costs and, by having a larger and secure funding stream, the agency will be able to take further advantage of its national procurement arrangements.

Glyn Davies: Is power being transferred from local authorities to the Assembly? That issue is a theme of this Government's activities. To what extent is that theme present in today's proposals?

Carwyn Jones: In the past, flood defence committees have been funded via a levy on local authorities. I propose that that be replaced by a block grant, although local authority representation will continue on the new committee.

I encourage the agency and the other operating authorities to work together. It is, however, important that we remember that the agency will continue to be the operating

penderyniadau strategol er budd Cymru, a galluogi'r Cynulliad i bennu'r fframwaith polisi sy'n ofynnol a monitro'r graddau y cyflawnir y targedau sydd ynddo. Deuthum i'r casgliad mai'r cwrs gweithredu priodol i Gymru yw sefydlu un pwyllgor sy'n cynnwys Cymru gyfan, a gaiff ei gyllido'n llawn gan y Cynulliad. Yr wyf felly'n bwriadu rhoi Gorchmynion gerbron i ddiddymu pwyllgorau atal llifogydd lleol a chreu un pwyllgor atal llifogydd dros dro, yn seiliedig ar ffin y dalgylchoedd. Yr wyf hefyd yn bwriadu symleiddio'r trefniadau cyllido fel y caiff y gwasanaeth atal llifogydd ei gyllido'n llawn gan y Cynulliad drwy grant bloc. Gwneir gwaith arall ar ôl hynny fel y gellir sefydlu'r pwyllgor atal llifogydd rhanbarthol, wedi'i seilio ar y ffin wleidyddol—a'r Gorchmynion hynny'n amodol ar weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad a'r Senedd.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion ymgymryd â gwaith pellach ar gyfansoddiad y pwyllgor newydd i adlewyrchu'r trefniadau symlach newydd, a byddant hefyd yn ymchwilio i ddulliau o gyfyngu ar bwerau'r asiantaeth i godi ardoll neu eu diddymu. Effaith y cynigion hyn fydd sicrhau'r gwariant y mae arnom ei angen ar gyfer atal llifogydd yng Nghymru ac egluro atebolrwydd. Bydd hefyd yn cynnig cyfleoedd i gael arbedion drwy leihau costau gweinyddol ac, o gael llif cyllido mwy a sicr, bydd yr asiantaeth yn gallu manteisio ymhellach ar ei threfniadau caffael cenedlaethol.

Glyn Davies: A yw pŵer yn cael ei drosglwyddo oddi wrth awdurdodau lleol i'r Cynulliad? Mae'r mater hwnnw'n thema yng ngweithgareddau'r Llywodraeth hon. I ba raddau y ceir y thema honno yn y cynigion heddiw?

Carwyn Jones: Yn y gorffennol, câi pwyllgorau atal llifogydd eu cyllido drwy godi ardoll ar awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn cynnig y dylid cael grant bloc yn lle hynny, er y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu cynrychioli o hyd ar y pwyllgor newydd.

Yr wyf yn annog yr asiantaeth a'r awdurdodau gweithredol eraill i weithio gyda'i gilydd. Mae'n bwysig, er hynny, inni gofio mai'r asiantaeth fydd yr awdurdod

authority, although, under the new arrangements, it will be easier for us to clarify the policy for Wales and provide direction on flooding policy and flood defence in the future.

The two amendments are superfluous. We will, of course, take on board the interests of mid Wales, as we take on board the interests of all parts of Wales. On amendment 1 proposed by the Liberal Democrats, we recognise that climate change is an important factor, and so the amendment adds nothing to the proposals.

Mick Bates: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Insert a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for future flood defence arrangements in Wales to take into account the effect of increased carbon emissions on Welsh meteorology.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats welcome the Minister's speech on the consultation on flood defence arrangements in Wales. However, we want to go further and, to paraphrase your Prime Minister on the matter of crime, we want to be tough on floods and on the causes of floods. Even though you reject our amendment, it seeks to broaden the issue from a merely reactive, finger-in-the-dyke approach to causes of flooding.

Your Government's figures show that carbon emissions in Wales have increased. The challenge for Wales section of the consultation contains a clear assumption that a reduction in carbon emissions would help to reduce the risk of flooding through climate change. Minister, I accept that that is a long-term process, but your Government has a responsibility to make that contribution towards a reduction in carbon emissions in line with the Government White Paper and with the European rates. However, you are not achieving that. When we therefore consider how we will reconstitute flood committees and so on, the fundamental cause of the flooding is not being taking into account.

Glyn Davies: Have you read David

gweithredol o hyd, er y bydd yn haws inni egluro'r polisi ar gyfer Cymru o dan y trefniadau newydd a rhoi arweiniad ar bolisi llifogydd ac atal llifogydd yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r ddau welliant yn ddiangen. Byddwn yn sicr o ystyried buddiannau'r Canolbarth, fel yr ystyriwn fuddiannau pob rhan o Gymru. Ynghylch gwelliant 1 a gynigiwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod newid yn yr hinsawdd yn ffactor pwysig, ac felly nid yw'r gwelliant yn ychwanegu dim at y cynigion.

Mick Bates: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gofyn bod y trefniadau atal llifogydd yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol yn dwyn i ystyriaeth effaith y cynnydd yn y gollyngiadau carbon ar feteoroleg Cymru.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn croesawu araith y Gweinidog ar yr ymgynghori ar drefniadau atal llifogydd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am fynd ymhellach, a chan aralleirio sylwadau'ch Prif Weinidog ar fater troseddu, yr ydym am fod yn galed ar lifogydd ac ar achosion llifogydd. Er eich bod yn gwrthod ein gwelliant, mae'n ceisio ymhelaethu ar y mater dan sylw fel ei fod yn ymdrin â mwy nag ymagwedd adweithiol at achosion llifogydd.

Mae ffigurau'ch Llywodraeth yn dangos bod gollyngiadau carbon yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu. Mae'r adran ar yr her i Gymru yn yr ymgynghoriad yn cynnwys rhagdybiaeth bendant y byddai lleihau gollyngiadau carbon yn gymorth i leihau'r perygl oddi wrth lifogydd drwy newid yn yr hinsawdd. Weinidog, yr wyf yn derbyn mai proses dymor hir yw honno, ond mae cyfrifoldeb gan eich Llywodraeth i gyfrannu yn y modd hwnnw tuag at leihau gollyngiadau carbon yn unol â Phapur Gwyn y Llywodraeth a'r cyfraddau Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych yn cyflawni hynny. Felly, wrth ystyried y modd yr ailgyfansoddw bwyllgorau llifogydd ac yn y blaen, nid ystyrir achos sylfaenol y llifogydd.

Glyn Davies: A ddarllenasoch y sylwadau a

Bellamy's comments this week? He indicated that the activities of man, in his view, do not contribute to climate change but that they are part of a long-term cycle. He made a good argument, as he always does.

Mick Bates: Thank you for raising David Bellamy's point, which is similar to that of Paul Loveluck, whose suggestion would lead to the increased use of nuclear power. However, I would not subscribe to that suggestion, and I draw your attention to the Carbon Trust's document, 'The Climate Change Challenge', which I hope you read. The figures in that document demonstrate that man's activities are directly related, through increased carbon emissions, to the greenhouse effect, which is causing the warmth.

David Davies: Will you give way?

Mick Bates: I will in a minute; just let me finish answering your colleague's question first.

If you look at the data being collected, there have been clear fluctuations in global temperature. However, the temperature increase at the moment is massive and unprecedented.

4.20 p.m.

David Davies: David Bellamy is not the first person to make this point; it was made by an eminent professor in Denmark who wrote a book on this subject and who said that the figures from the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change are inaccurate—and I believe that those are the figures quoted by the Carbon Trust. He said that we are not seeing an unprecedented increase in global warming, as similar changes have happened over the past 1,000 years. These can be accurately gauged by tree rings, and the increase in CO₂ is good in some respects, because it increases the fertility of the soil and could, therefore, contribute to feeding the planet.

wnaeth David Bellamy yr wythnos hon? Dywedodd nad yw gweithgareddau dynol ryw yn cyfrannu at newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn ei farn ef, a'u bod yn rhan o gylch tymor hir. Cyflwynodd ddadl dda, fel y gwnaiff bob amser.

Mick Bates: Diolch i chi am godi'r pwynt a wnaeth David Bellamy, sy'n debyg i'r un a wnaeth Paul Loveluck, y byddai ei awgrym yn arwain at fwy o ddefnydd o ynni niwclear. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r awgrym hwnnw, a thynnaf eich sylw at ddogfen yr Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon, 'The Climate Change Challenge', y gobeithiaf yr ydych yn ei darllen. Mae'r ffigurau yn y ddogfen honno'n dangos bod cysylltiad uniongyrchol rhwng gweithgareddau dynol ryw a'r effaith tŷ gwydr, drwy gynnydd mewn gollyngiadau carbon, a honno sy'n peri'r cynhesrwydd.

David Davies: A wnewch ildio?

Mick Bates: Gwnaf mewn munud; gadewch imi orffen ateb cwestiwn eich cyd-Aelod yn gyntaf.

Os edrychwch ar y data a gesglir, gwelwch y bu amrywiadau pendant yn nhymheredd y byd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r codiad yn y tymheredd a geir ar hyn o bryd yn un enfawr a digyffelyb.

David Davies: Nid David Bellamy yw'r cyntaf i wneud y pwynt hwn; fe'i gwnaed gan athro prifysgol blaenllaw yn Nenmarc a ysgrifennodd lyfr ar y pwnc hwn ac a ddywedodd fod ffigurau'r Panel Rhynglywodraethol ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yn anghywir—a chredaf mai'r ffigurau hynny a ddyfynnir gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Carbon. Dywedodd nad ydym yn gweld cynnydd digyffelyb mewn cynhesu byd-eang, gan fod newidiadau tebyg wedi digwydd dros y 1,000 o flynyddoedd diwethaf. Gellir eu mesur yn fanwl yn ôl y cylioedd blynyddol mewn coed, ac mae'r cynnydd o ran CO₂ yn beth da i ryw raddau, gan ei fod yn peri i'r pridd fod yn fwy ffrwythlon a gallai gyfrannu, felly, at fwydo poblogaeth y byd.

Mick Bates: While I would love to argue names and scientific evidence with you, Sir John Houghton, who lives in Wales and who is a regular speaker at most conferences on climate change, points out that the evidence is on the side of climate change at an increased rate. I refer my colleagues in the Welsh Conservatives to the evidence, as they are deflecting from the issue that the Government is failing to meet its own targets, and we can unite in supporting amendment 1, which calls for a greater account to be taken of carbon emissions and for the Government to reduce carbon emissions so that we have less flooding.

It is disturbing to record that 100,000 residential properties, 8,000 commercial properties and over 107,000 hectares of agricultural land are now at an increased risk of flooding because of the Welsh Government's inactivity and failure to reduce carbon emissions. I know that energy comes under a different portfolio, Minister, but we have a target, albeit an aspirational target, of producing 4 TWh of electricity from renewable resources by 2010. The Welsh Government has not set a portfolio to meet that target.

It is all very well saying that you will reject amendment 1, Minister, but your Government is failing. Can you take a considered and rational look at this matter, support our amendment 1 and ensure that your Government addresses the issue of carbon emissions and your failure to reduce them? Will you also take your own target on board to ensure that we have renewable energy that will not add to the atmosphere's carbon content, encourage climate change or increase flooding, which causes misery to so many people in Wales?

Lisa Francis: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Insert a new point at the end of the motion:

that in any changed arrangements the flood defence interests of mid Wales be fully recognised.

According to 'Flood Defence Arrangements in Wales—The Future', it is estimated that,

Mick Bates: Er y byddwn wrth fy modd yn dadlau â chi ynghylch enwau a thystiolaeth wyddonol, mae Syr John Houghton, sy'n byw yng Nghymru ac yn annerch yn rheolaidd yn y rhan fwyaf o'r cynadleddau ar newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn nodi bod y rhan fwyaf o'r dystiolaeth yn dangos bod yr hinsawdd yn newid yn gyflymach. Cyfeirïaf fy nghyd-Aelodau ymhlith Ceidwadwyr Cymru at y dystiolaeth, gan eu bod yn tynnu sylw oddi wrth y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn methu â chyrraedd ei thargedau ei hun, a gallwn ymuno i gefnogi gwelliant 1, sy'n galw am roi mwy o sylw i ollyngiadau carbon ac ar i'r Llywodraeth leihau gollyngiadau carbon fel y cawn lai o lifogydd.

Mae'n destun gofid bod 100,000 o dai preswyl, 8,000 o adeiladau masnachol a mwy na 107,000 hectar o dir amaethyddol mewn mwy o berygl oddi wrth lifogydd yn awr oherwydd diffyg gweithredu gan Lywodraeth Cymru a'i methiant i leihau gollyngiadau carbon. Gwn y daw ynni o dan bortffolio gwahanol, Weinidog, ond mae gennym darged, er ei fod yn un uchelgeisiol, i gynhyrchu 4 TWh o drydan o adnoddau adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi pennu portffolio i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw.

Digon hawdd yw dweud y gwrthodwch welliant 1, Weinidog, ond mae'ch Llywodraeth yn methu. A allwch edrych yn ystyriol a rhesymegol ar y mater hwn, a chefnogi gwelliant 1 o'n heiddo a sicrhau bod eich Llywodraeth yn ymdrin â mater gollyngiadau carbon a'ch methiant i'w lleihau? A wnewch hefyd ystyried eich targed eich hun i sicrhau y cawn ynni adnewyddadwy na fydd yn ychwanegu at y carbon sydd yn yr awyr, yn hybu newid yn yr hinsawdd neu'n creu mwy o lifogydd, sy'n peri gofid i gynifer o bobl yng Nghymru?

Lisa Francis: Cynigïaf welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

caiff anghenion y Canolbarth o ran atal llifogydd eu cydnabod yn llawn mewn unrhyw drefniadau newydd.

Yn ôl 'Trefniadau Atal Llifogydd yng Nghymru—Y Dyfodol', amcangyfrifir y

over the next 50 years, flood damage could increase by 50 per cent for river flooding and in excess of 200 per cent for tidal flooding. It also states that the complex coastal defence networks are at particular risk from the potential impact of climate change.

You will know from our correspondence, Minister, that, in respect of coastal flooding at Towyn in Gwynedd, the independent consultants ABP Marine Environmental Research Ltd, which were appointed by Gwynedd Council, have found a unanimously accepted way forward. A new sea defence system now needs to be constructed, which will allow Towyn beach to be retained as a tourism amenity, which is so vital for the local economy. You will also be aware that this important scheme will require funding other than that provided by the local authority. Realistically, if total funding was immediately forthcoming, this construction could be completed by December 2006. I would stress that the people of Towyn cannot afford to wait long. You mentioned climate change, and ABP has reported that the Victorian seawall, a masterpiece of civil engineering though it is, may not hold up under the constant battering of winter storms and occasional freak waves, which have been experienced by this stretch of coastline over the last 20 or so years. I therefore urge you, Minister, to seek encouragement for funding this construction.

Following the devastating floods in the Conwy Valley last March, we eagerly await the Environment Agency report in July to see what action the agency and the local authority will take to ensure that damage does not occur again. You mentioned that your Government has reached the conclusion that, in Wales, the flood defence service should continue to be provided primarily by the Environment Agency, though in a single flood defence committee structure. Many people have told me that they would prefer three regional committees, which would allow for local input, and we would like to see this discussed further.

In its review, the Environment Agency must

gallai'r difrod oherwydd llifogydd gynyddu, dros yr 50 mlynedd nesaf, 50 y cant yn achos llifogydd o afonydd a mwy na 200 y cant yn achos llifogydd llanwol. Dywed hefyd fod y rhwydweithiau cymhleth o amddiffynfeydd arfordirol mewn perygl neilltuol oherwydd effaith ddichonol y newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Gwyddoch o'r llythyru a fu rhyngom, Weinidog, mewn cysylltiad â llifogydd arfordirol yn Nhywyn yng Ngwynedd, fod yr ymgynghorwyr annibynnol ABP Marine Environmental Research Cyf, a benodwyd gan Gyngor Gwynedd, wedi canfod ffordd ymlaen sy'n dderbyniol gan bawb. Mae angen adeiladu system newydd i amddiffyn rhag y môr yn awr, a fydd yn fodd i gadw traeth Tywyn fel cyfleuster ar gyfer twristiaeth, sydd mor hanfodol i'r economi leol. Gwyddoch hefyd y bydd angen cyllid ar gyfer y cynllun pwysig hwn heblaw'r hyn a roddir gan yr awdurdod lleol. Yn ymarferol, os rhoddid yr holl gyllid ar unwaith, gellid cwblhau'r gwaith adeiladu erbyn Rhagfyr 2006. Pwysleisïaf na all pobl Tywyn fforddio aros yn hir. Cyfeiriasoch at newid yn yr hinsawdd, ac mae ABP wedi adrodd ei bod yn bosibl na fydd y morglawdd Fictoraidd, er cystal ydyw fel campwaith peirianeg sifil, yn gwrthsefyll hyrddiau cyson y stormydd gaeaf a'r tonnau eithriadol a geir o bryd i'w gilydd, a welwyd ar y rhan hon o'r arfordir dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, fwy neu lai. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn eich annog, Weinidog, i geisio cefnogaeth i gyllido'r gwaith adeiladu hwn.

Yn dilyn y llifogydd dinistriol yn Nyffryn Conwy fis Mawrth diwethaf, yr ydym yn disgwyl yn eiddgar am adroddiad Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ym mis Gorffennaf i weld pa gamau a gymer yr asiantaeth a'r awdurdod lleol i sicrhau na cheir difrod o'r fath eto. Dywedasoch fod eich Llywodraeth wedi dod i'r casgliad y dylai'r gwasanaeth atal llifogydd yng Nghymru barhau i gael ei ddarparu'n bennaf gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, er y byddai hynny ar ffurf un pwyllgor atal llifogydd. Mae llawer wedi dweud wrthyf y byddai'n well ganddynt gael tri phwyllgor rhanbarthol, a fyddai'n fodd i gael mewnbyn lleol, a charem weld trafodaeth bellach ar hynny.

Yn ei hadolygiad, rhaid i Asiantaeth yr

ensure that adequate flood warnings are given in good time. In the case of Trefriw last February, Mike Davies of the Environment Agency said:

‘We were unprepared, bearing in mind that there hasn’t been a serious flood in Trefriw...since the 1960s’.

Yet 60 homes and businesses were flooded in the Trefriw and Llanrwst area last February, in the worst flooding witnessed there for 40 years. However, because fewer than 40 homes were affected, the flooding did not fall under the Environment Agency’s definition of ‘severe’. Trefriw was not in the agency’s floodwatch scheme. Members may be aware that insurers assess risk assessment by checking whether a property’s postcode is in a floodplain. The fact that the Environment Agency did not see fit to designate the village of Trefriw as ‘high risk’ is astonishing, when Legal and General designates this postcode area, LL27 0JJ, as a ‘flood risk area’.

It is also important that Floodline, the telephone information service operated by the Environment Agency, takes into proper account the geographical location of the town of Machynlleth in relation to the counties of Gwynedd and Powys, especially as Dyfi bridge represents a key link between north and south Wales. However, it failed to do this during the floods in February. A little local knowledge would have gone a long way to put it right in this instance, which is why these regional committees are important. The Environment Agency states that it learns lessons from flooding incidents, and is not complacent. It is your Government’s duty, Minister, to ensure that that is the case.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: I have listened to the debate with great interest. I thank David Davies for his comments, which explain a lot. There must be a high rate of carbon dioxide in Pembrokeshire because it is incredibly fertile. I will also respond to some of Lisa Francis’s comments later.

Amgylchedd sicrhau y rhoddir rhybuddion digonol rhag llifogydd mewn da bryd. Yn achos Trefriw fis Chwefror diwethaf, dywedodd Mike Davies o Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd:

Nid oeddem yn barod, gan gofio na fu llifogydd difrifol yn Nhrefriw...ers y 1960au.

Ac eto, bu 60 o gartrefi a busnesau dan ddŵr yn ardal Trefriw a Llanrwst fis Chwefror diwethaf, yn y llifogydd gwaethaf a welwyd yno ers 40 mlynedd. Fodd bynnag, gan fod llai na 40 o gartrefi wedi’u heffeithio, nid oeddent yn rhai ‘difrifol’, yn ôl diffiniad Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Nid oedd Trefriw yn rhan o gynllun gwyllo rhag llifogydd yr asiantaeth. Efallai y gŵyr Aelodau fod yswirwyr yn asesu risg drwy edrych a yw cod post yr eiddo ar orlifdir. Mae’r ffaith nad oedd Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gweld yn dda i ddynodi pentref Trefriw fel un ‘risg uchel’ yn syfrdanol, gan fod Legal and General yn dynodi’r ardal cod post hon, LL27 0JJ, yn ‘ardal lle y mae risg o lifogydd’.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod Llinell Llifogydd, y gwasanaeth gwybodaeth ar deffon sy’n cael ei redeg gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, yn rhoi sylw priodol i leoliad daearyddol tref Machynlleth mewn cysylltiad â siroedd Gwynedd a Phowys, yn enwedig gan fod pont Dyfi yn gyswllt allweddol rhwng y De a’r Gogledd. Fodd bynnag, methodd â gwneud hynny yn ystod y llifogydd ym mis Chwefror. Byddai ychydig o wybodaeth leol wedi gwneud llawer i gywiro hynny yn yr achos hwn, a dyna pam y mae’r pwyllgorau rhanbarthol hyn yn bwysig. Dywed Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ei bod yn dysgu gwersi oddi wrth achosion o lifogydd, ac nad yw’n ddifater. Dyletswydd eich Llywodraeth, Weinidog, yw sicrhau bod hynny’n digwydd.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Gwrandewais ar y ddadl gyda diddordeb mawr. Diolchaf i David Davies am ei sylwadau, gan eu bod yn egluro llawer. Rhaid bod cyfradd uchel o garbon deuocsid yn sir Benfro gan ei bod yn ffrwythlon dros ben. Gwnaf ymateb hefyd i rai o sylwadau Lisa Francis yn ddiweddarach.

We should welcome the Minister's statement that we are going for a single committee. That allows us a strategic overview of flooding across Wales, and the block grant also simplifies the Environment Agency's work locally. I have visited my local Environment Agency, based in Haverfordwest, which is responsible for all flood defence schemes across south-west Wales. Where you have an edge or a demarcation, it presents issues.

Lisa Francis: Do you agree that it is equally important for the regional committees to continue to input local knowledge? Local knowledge is everything; it stops confusion when the floods hit.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: There is no doubt that an element of local knowledge is always needed in any form of decision making. Environment Agency Wales has a good structure to feed information through its system. As I said, I have spent a day with my Environment Agency section, which does a considerable amount of work on flood planning and assessing the need for flood defences in terms of capital investment. Interestingly enough, all Members, apart from Mick Bates, concentrated on that, and that is where the majority of the capital block grant will go in terms of building physical defences against potential floods.

Those of you who have spent time with the Environment Agency will be aware that there are different levels of potential flooding—those that will happen frequently, those that may be a 20-year flood, and those that may be a 100-year flood. There was a recent exercise across Wales, involving all emergency services, run by Environment Agency Wales in Cardiff, which I was fortunate enough to see with Glyn Davies. I understand that the First Minister also visited that three-day exercise to plan the contingency action that would occur in those sorts of circumstances.

I recently scrutinised Environment Agency Wales, again with Glyn Davies, as part of our role, as it is an ASPB. The agency has been

Dylem groesawu datganiad y Gweinidog ein bod i gael un pwyllgor. Mae hynny'n fodd inni gael arolwg strategol o lifogydd ledled Cymru, ac mae'r grant bloc hefyd yn symleiddio gwaith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn lleol. Ymwelais â swyddfa leol Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn Hwlfordd, sy'n gyfrifol am yr holl gynlluniau ar gyfer atal llifogydd ledled y De-orllewin. Os ceir ffin neu linell derfyn, mae materion yn codi yn sgîl hynny.

Lisa Francis: A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yr un mor bwysig i'r pwyllgorau rhanbarthol barhau i gyfrannu gwybodaeth leol? Mae gwybodaeth leol yn hollbwysig; mae'n atal dryswch pan fydd llifogydd yn taro.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Mae'n sicr bod angen rhywfaint o wybodaeth leol bob amser wrth wneud unrhyw fath o benderfyniad. Mae gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru drefniadaeth dda i fwydo gwybodaeth drwy ei system. Fel y dywedais, treuliais ddiwrnod gydag is-adran leol Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, sy'n gwneud cryn waith o ran cynllunio rhag llifogydd ac asesu'r angen am amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd yng nghyd-destun buddsoddi cyfalaf. Yn ddigon diddorol, canolbwyntiodd yr holl Aelodau, heblaw Mick Bates, ar hynny, a thuag at hynny yr aiff y rhan fwyaf o'r grant bloc cyfalaf ar gyfer codi amddiffynfeydd ffisegol rhag llifogydd posibl.

Bydd y rhai ohonoch a dreuliodd amser gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ymwybodol bod gwahanol lefelau o lifogydd posibl—y rhai a fydd yn digwydd yn aml, rhai a allai ddigwydd bob 20 mlynedd, a rhai a allai ddigwydd bob 100 mlynedd. Cafwyd ymarferiad yn ddiweddar ledled Cymru, a oedd yn cynnwys yr holl wasanaethau argyfwng, a gafodd ei redeg gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru yng Nghaerdydd, y bûm yn ddigon ffodus i'w weld gyda Glyn Davies. Deallaf fod y Prif Weinidog yntau wedi ymweld â'r ymarferiad tri diwrnod hwnnw i gynllunio'r camau rhag rhaid a geid o dan amgylchiadau o'r fath.

Bûm yn craffu'n ddiweddar ar waith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru, gyda Glyn Davies eto, fel rhan o'n rôl, gan mai

helpful in providing information and working with Glyn and me on that scrutiny. I hope that it will forgive me for some of the harsh questioning that I gave it.

4.30 p.m.

The most important aspect of flood defence, in my view, is linked to the fact that we continually refer in the Chamber to the need to react to flooding. Lisa said that the Environment Agency must ensure that adequate flood warnings are given in time. We talk about stopping floods affecting buildings and building more walls, sea defences and channels to route water. Predicting when floods will occur can often be extremely difficult as they can happen quickly. They can build up and there will be warnings over time or they can happen in a matter of hours. In Wales, we expect the Environment Agency to warn us about flooding. At what point do we tell people that they also have a responsibility? It is a joint responsibility; it is not simply a case of reacting to the warnings that are given via the Environment Agency's information network. We also have a responsibility as individuals to take action. We should be ensuring that planning takes account of building on floodplains and listening to the risk assessments produced by the Environment Agency. It does not want it to be a statutory obligation that all its risk assessment information and decisions should be adhered to. However, we should pay attention to that.

There are geographical difficulties in Wales. However, we must ensure that buildings for at-risk groups—such as hospitals, old people's homes, and homes for those who would have difficulty evacuating in a flood—are not built on floodplains. When will we as individuals take responsibility for our own properties? An organisation called Flodef has produced a number of extremely useful items for protecting individual homes. We must take responsibility for this issue.

Helen Mary Jones: As other Members have said, this is a major issue that affects communities across Wales. I welcome the opportunity to take part in this debate. Plaid

CCNC ydyw. Bu'r asiantaeth o gymorth drwy ddarparu gwybodaeth a gweithio gyda Glyn a mi yn y gwaith craffu hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff faddau i mi am rai o'r cwestiynau anodd a ofynnais iddi.

Mae'r agwedd bwysicaf ar atal llifogydd, yn fy marn i, yn gysylltiedig â'r ffaith ein bod yn cyfeirio'n barhaus yn y Siambr at yr angen i ymateb i lifogydd. Dywedodd Lisa fod rhaid i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd sicrhau y rhoddir rhybuddion digonol rhag llifogydd mewn pryd. Soniwn am atal llifogydd rhag effeithio ar adeiladau ac am godi rhagor o waliau, amddiffynfeydd rhag y môr a sianeli i gyfeirio dŵr. Yn aml, gall fod yn anodd iawn proffwydo pa bryd y digwydd llifogydd gan y gallant ddigwydd yn sydyn. Gallant Gronni a rhoddir rhybuddion dros gyfnod o amser neu gallant ddigwydd o fewn oriau. Yng Nghymru, disgwyliwn i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ein rhybuddio ynghylch llifogydd. Pa bryd y dywedwn wrth bobl fod ganddynt hwythau gyfrifoldeb? Cydgyfrifoldeb ydyw; mae'n fwy na dim ond mater o ymateb i'r rhybuddion a roddir drwy rwydwaith gwybodaeth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i weithredu fel unigolion hefyd. Dylem sicrhau bod cynllunwyr yn rhoi sylw i adeiladu ar orlifdiroedd ac yn ystyried yr asesiadau risg a gynhyrchir gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Nid yw am iddo fod yn rhwymedigaeth statudol i lynu wrth ei holl benderfyniadau a gwybodaeth am asesiadau risg. Fodd bynnag, dylem dalu sylw i hynny.

Mae anawsterau daearyddol yng Nghymru. Er hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd adeiladau ar gyfer rhai sydd mewn perygl—fel ysbytai, cartrefi hen bobl, a chartrefi i rai a'i câi'n anodd eu gadael mewn llifogydd—yn cael eu codi ar orlifdiroedd. Pa bryd y cymerwn ni fel unigolion gyfrifoldeb dros ein tai ein hunain? Mae corff o'r enw Flodef wedi cynhyrchu sawl eitem dra defnyddiol i amddiffyn tai unigol. Rhaid inni gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn.

Helen Mary Jones: Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill, mae hwn yn bwnc pwysig sy'n effeithio ar gymunedau ledled Cymru. Croesawaf y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y dadl

Cymru—The Party of Wales endorses the Minister's decision to take a national approach. There are always cross-border issues to be dealt with, whether they involve river catchments or transportation. There is no reason why, with the best possible communication on cross-border issues, operating on a national level should be a problem. This is particularly relevant in terms of the old Severn basin catchment in mid Wales.

I will raise some concerns that I hope the Minister will be able to address as the plans are implemented. Other Members have mentioned the concern regarding the loss of local expertise, which has been invaluable in the past. It is essential that we find some way of building it into the new system. The Minister could use local authority representatives on the new national committee, for example, to try to ensure that some expertise is developed to a national level.

My party has been concerned for many years—

Glyn Davies: We must ensure that we are not fooled by some of the Minister's comments. He said that there would be local authority representation on the committee. I imagine that that representation will be a token member from the WLGA. Perhaps you should press him on that.

Helen Mary Jones: I agree with you. It is important that the committee has an element of democratic input and local knowledge. We would not be content with there being one representative from the WLGA on the committee, who might come from an area that is not particularly affected by flooding and who would not, therefore, have the required experience. I urge the Minister, when considering the implementation of the arrangements, to take Glyn Davies's point seriously.

We have had concerns over the years about the Environment Agency's capacity to respond to the Welsh agenda, given that it has dual accountability, which can be confusing. We hope that the Minister will ensure that the new national arrangements

hon. Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi penderfyniad y Gweinidog i ddilyn dull gweithredu cenedlaethol. Mae materion trawsffiniol i'w trafod bob amser, boed hwy'n ymwneud â dalgylchoedd afonydd neu gludiant. Nid oes rheswm, o gael y cyfathrebu gorau posibl ar faterion trawsffiniol, na ellid gweithredu ar lefel genedlaethol. Mae hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol yn achos hen ddalgylch basn Hafren yn y Canolbarth.

Codaf rai pryderon yr wyf yn gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi sylw iddynt wrth roi'r cynlluniau ar waith. Mae Aelodau eraill wedi sôn am y pryder ynghylch colli arbenigedd lleol, a fu'n amhrisiadwy yn y gorffennol. Mae'n hollbwysig inni ganfod rhyw fodd i'w gynnwys yn y system newydd. Gallai'r Gweinidog ddefnyddio cynrychiolwyr o awdurdodau lleol ar y pwyllgor cenedlaethol newydd, er enghraifft, i geisio sicrhau y datblygir arbenigedd ar lefel genedlaethol.

Bu fy mhlaid yn bryderus ers blynyddoedd lawer—

Glyn Davies: Rhaid inni ofalu na chawn ein twyllo gan rai o sylwadau'r Gweinidog. Dywedodd y byddai cynrychiolaeth gan awdurdodau lleol ar y pwyllgor. Tybiaf mai'r gynrychiolaeth honno fydd aelod symbolaidd o CLILC. Efallai y dylech bwysu arno ynghylch hynny.

Helen Mary Jones: Cytunaf â chi. Mae'n bwysig i'r pwyllgor gael rhywfaint o fewnbnw democrataidd a gwybodaeth leol. Ni fyddem yn fodlon ar gael un cynrychiolydd o CLILC ar y pwyllgor, a allai ddod o ardal nad effeithir arni'n sylweddol gan lifogydd ac na fyddai, felly, yn meddu ar y profiad angenrheidiol. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i gymryd y pwynt a wnaeth Glyn Davies o ddifrif pan fydd yn ystyried rhoi'r trefniadau ar waith.

Bu gennym bryderon dros y blynyddoedd ynghylch gallu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i ymateb i'r agenda yng Nghymru, gan fod iddi atebolrwydd deul, a all beri dryswch. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y bydd y trefniadau newydd o gymorth i

will help to address issues relating to flooding. I also hope that Welsh circumstances and needs, particularly our national responsibility to promote sustainable development, will be at the core of the Environment Agency's commitment and priorities and how it uses its resources.

I ask the Minister to ensure that the new arrangements put in place protect small communities effectively, and I endorse Lisa Francis's comments in that regard. I will not reiterate Lisa's comments on the flooding last winter in Dolwyddelan, Llanrwst and Trefriw. However, that situation indicated that we were left with flood warning systems that did not work for small communities. I do not think that any Member would consider this to be acceptable.

In response to points raised by Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, I would say that we all have responsibility as individuals, but I am sure that she would agree that many individuals affected do not have the economic wherewithal to be able to, or knowledge of how to, defend their homes. These people may also have difficulty, due to their circumstances, in financing basic measures such as insurance.

Tamsin's body language suggests that she would like to make an intervention.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Yes, I think that my body language was obvious.

I agree that it is often those who are most at risk and who can least afford insurance who find themselves in a position where they cannot use private companies to defend their properties. But—and it is a serious 'but'—no amount of money or capital investment will completely stop flooding. Dealing with flooding has to be a shared responsibility, and, if it falls to the local authority or to the individual, it must be shared with the Environment Agency Wales and with us as a Government. No amount of money will stop the flooding.

Helen Mary Jones: It is right to say that no amount of money will stop flooding, but

ymdrin â materion sy'n gysylltiedig â llifogydd. Yr wyf hefyd yn gobeithio y bydd lle canolog i amgylchiadau ac anghenion Cymru, yn enwedig ein cyfrifoldeb i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, yn ymrwymiad a blaenoriaethau Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r modd y mae'n defnyddio ei hadnoddau.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog sicrhau y bydd y trefniadau newydd a roddir ar waith yn amddiffyn cymunedau bach yn effeithiol, ac ategaf sylwadau Lisa Francis yn hynny o beth. Nid ailadroddaf sylwadau Lisa am y llifogydd y gaeaf diwethaf yn Nolwyddelan, Llanrwst a Threfriw. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y sefyllfa honno'n dangos bod gennym systemau rhybuddio rhag llifogydd nad oeddent yn gweithio yn achos cymunedau bach. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw Aelod a ystyriai fod hynny'n dderbyniol.

Mewn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a gododd Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, dywedwn fod gennym oll gyfrifoldeb fel unigolion, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunai fod llawer o unigolion a effeithir nad oes ganddynt y modd ariannol i allu amddiffyn eu cartrefi, na'r wybodaeth am y modd i wneud hynny. Gallai hefyd fod yn anodd i'r bobl hyn dalu am fesurau sylfaenol fel yswiriant, oherwydd eu hamgylchiadau.

Mae iaith gorfforol Tamsin yn awgrymu ei bod yn dymuno ymyrryd.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Ydwyf, credaf fod fy iaith gorfforol yn amlwg.

Cytunaf mai'r rhai sy'n wynebu'r perygl mwyaf ac sy'n lleiaf galluog i fforddio yswiriant yw'r rhai sy'n aml yn gweld na allant ddefnyddio cwmnïau preifat i amddiffyn eu tai. Ond—ac mae'n 'ond' pwysig—nid oes unrhyw swm o arian neu fuddsoddiad cyfalaf a wnaiff atal llifogydd yn llwyr. Mae delio â llifogydd yn gorfod bod yn gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd, ac, os yw'n dod i ran yr awdurdod lleol neu'r unigolyn, rhaid ei rannu ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru a ni fel Llywodraeth. Nid oes unrhyw swm o arian a wnaiff atal llifogydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n iawn dweud nad oes unrhyw swm o arian a wnaiff atal

further steps could be taken to ameliorate its effects on individuals. I have previously asked the Minister to initiate, along with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, discussions with private insurance companies about areas that they will not currently insure.

The Government is keen on rearrangement, and we endorse this measure. However, the rearrangement will make no difference unless adequate resources are in place, which, sadly, will need to be increased over the years. The Minister can rely on Members, in Plenary and in committee, to monitor his budget to ensure that the resources for the new national flood defence system are in place. We welcome the national approach, and we urge the Minister to ensure that we have an effective flood protection policy that meets the needs not only of communities that are at risk today, but of the increased number of communities that will, for whatever reasons—I do not want to get into the debate about the causes, but I agree more with Mick Bates than with my Conservative colleagues on this—be at risk in future. It is the Government's responsibility to ensure that they are as adequately protected as possible.

Sandy Mewies: I am happy to welcome the Minister's response to this consultation document, particularly as flooding has caused so much hardship in my constituency of Delyn. Strong, preventative measures must be in place to stop these disastrous events occurring, to respond rapidly in order to deal quickly with the chaos caused, and to take swift action to do what can be done to ensure that flooding does not happen again. This is an enormous task and, despite my parochial comments, I am aware that this is a Wales-wide problem.

No-one should underestimate the fear caused by the possibility of flooding. Many constituents have told me that they check the river level during heavy rainstorms because they are so concerned about what could happen. Some flood alleviation schemes have been completed, such as the one at Rhydymwyn. Outstanding, but soon to be

llifogydd, ond gellid cymryd camau pellach i leddfu eu heffeithiau ar unigolion. Yr wyf wedi gofyn o'r blaen i'r Gweinidog gychwyn trafodaethau, ar y cyd â'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, gyda chwmnïau yswiriant preifat ynghylch ardaloedd na wnânt eu hyswirio ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn awyddus i ad-drefnu, a chefnogwn y mesur hwn. Er hynny, ni wnaiff yr ad-drefnu unrhyw wahaniaeth os nad oes adnoddau digonol ar gael, y bydd yn rhaid eu cynyddu dros y blynyddoedd, gwaetha'r modd. Gall y Gweinidog fod yn sicr y bydd Aelodau, yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y pwyllgor, yn cadw golwg ar ei gyllideb i sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol ar gael ar gyfer y system atal llifogydd genedlaethol newydd. Croesawn y dull gweithredu cenedlaethol, ac anogwn y Gweinidog i sicrhau y cawn bolisi effeithiol i atal llifogydd sy'n bodloni anghenion cymunedau sydd mewn perygl heddiw yn ogystal â'r nifer cynyddol o gymunedau a fydd, am ba bynnag resymau—ac nid wyf am ymuno â'r ddadl ynghylch yr achosion, ond cytunaf yn fwy â Mick Bates nag ydwyf â'm cyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol ar hyn—mewn perygl yn y dyfodol. Cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth yw sicrhau y cânt eu hamddiffyn mor ddigonol ag y bo modd.

Sandy Mewies: Yr wyf yn falch o groesawu ymateb y Gweinidog i'r ddogfen ymgynghori hon, yn enwedig gan fod llifogydd wedi peri cymaint o galedi yn fy etholaeth, sef Delyn. Rhaid cymryd camau cadarn, ataliol i rwystro'r trychinebau hyn, i ymateb yn gyflym er mwyn delio â'r anhrefn a achosir, ac i gymryd camau buan i wneud yr hyn a ellir i sicrhau na fydd llifogydd eto. Mae hon yn dasg aruthrol ac, er gwaethaf fy sylwadau plwyfol, yr wyf yn ymwybodol mai problem a geir ledled Cymru yw hon.

Ni ddylai neb synied yn rhy isel am yr ofn a godir gan y posibilrwydd o lifogydd. Mae llawer o etholwyr wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn edrych ar lefel yr afon yn ystod glawogydd mawr gan eu bod mor bryderus am yr hyn a allai ddigwydd. Cwblhawyd rhai cynlluniau lliniaru llifogydd, fel yr un yn Rhyd-y-mwyn. Un sydd heb ei gwblhau, ond

started, is the River Alyn flood alleviation scheme, which I have pressed for since my election and which now looks set to start this year, with completion in 2005. Although the scheme is to be commenced—and I pay tribute to the Environment Agency for raising the extra needed when problems were encountered—it is disappointing that the work will run over two years rather than one. It is because additional money is sometimes needed by the agency, which has to prioritise work throughout Wales, that I hope that the allocation of money through the block grant for flood defence capital works will not preclude the allocation of extra money should vital schemes seem to be in danger when extra costs are identified. We need to bear in mind that people live in fear of their homes being flooded.

As we have heard, revenue costs will go to the flood defence committee. Flexibility is important in this regard. As the single committee structure has been selected, DEFRA must fund its full share of works that have cross-border significance. I agree with previous speakers that the input of local committee members should not be lost and should be automatically fed into the system.

Glyn Davies: As you and other Members have made the point, I must say that I am not sure whether we will be taking the right route by having one committee rather than three. It seems that we will be creating a giant quango with little local authority input. To say that we will have local input as well as this quango suggests that we are not genuinely facing the proposal before us.

4.40 p.m.

Sandy Mewies: I can only say that I genuinely feel that that local knowledge should be built into the process, while I see the arguments for the other side.

To deviate slightly from the main topic, I would like to raise sewage flooding. I agree with WaterVoice Wales, the body that represent water customers, that this is disgusting and unacceptable. In Mynydd Isa

y dechreuir arno cyn hir, yw cynllun lliniaru llifogydd afon Alun, yr wyf wedi pwysu am ei gael ers fy ethol ac yr ymddengys y dechreuir arno eleni a'i gwblhau yn 2005. Er bod y cynllun i'w ddechrau—a thalaf deyrnged i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd am godi'r arian ychwanegol yr oedd ei angen pan gafwyd problemau—mae'n siomedig y bydd y gwaith yn parhau am ddwy flynedd yn hytrach nag un. Oherwydd angen yr asiantaeth am arian ychwanegol o bryd i'w gilydd, gan ei bod yn gorfod blaenoriaethu gwaith ledled Cymru, y gobeithiaf na fydd y dyrannu ar arian drwy'r grant bloc ar gyfer gweithfeydd cyfalaf i atal llifogydd yn nacáu dyrannu arian ychwanegol os ymddengys fod cynlluniau hollbwysig mewn perygl pan ganfyddir costau ychwanegol. Rhaid inni gofio bod pobl yn byw gan ofni y bydd eu cartrefi dan ddŵr.

Fel y clywsom, aiff costau refeniw i'r pwyllgor atal llifogydd. Mae hyblygrwydd yn bwysig yn hyn o beth. Gan mai fframwaith yr un pwyllgor a ddewiswyd, rhaid i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig dalu'n llawn am ei chyfran o'r gweithfeydd sydd o bwys y ddwy ochr i'r ffin. Cytunaf â siaradwyr blaenorol na ddylid colli mewnbyn aelodau'r pwyllgorau lleol ac y dylid ei borthi i'r system yn awtomatig.

Glyn Davies: Gan eich bod chi ac Aelodau eraill wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn, rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf yn sicr y byddwn yn dilyn y llwybr cywir drwy gael un pwyllgor yn hytrach na thri. Ymddengys y byddwn yn creu cwango anferth heb fawr o fewnbwn gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae dweud y cawn fewnbwn lleol yn ogystal â chwango'n awgrymu nad ydym yn wynebu'r cynnig sydd o'n blaen yn iawn.

Sandy Mewies: Ni allaf ond dweud fy mod yn teimlo o ddifrif y dylid cynnwys gwybodaeth leol o'r fath yn y system, er fy mod yn deall y dadleuon dros y dewis arall.

Gan grwydro ychydig oddi wrth y prif bwnc, carwn godi mater llifogydd ar ffurf carthion. Cytunaf â DyfrLais Cymru, y corff sy'n cynrychioli cwsmeriaid dŵr, fod hyn yn ffiائد ac yn annerbyniol. Ym Mynydd Isa yn

in my constituency, many households have suffered this type of flooding on several occasions. I have talked with Welsh Water representatives and the local authority, but Welsh Water states that there is a priority list of schemes and that they cannot decide on those priorities until they know how much money the regulators will make available to them. In the meantime, residents, again, are at the mercy of the vagaries of the weather.

WaterVoice feels that the Welsh Assembly Government's guidance on sewage flooding to OFWAT in the 2005 investment programme is weak, and I would like to hear the Minister's view on that. What can we do to push sewage flooding up the agenda? I realise that funding is finite, but surely action on sewage flooding should be swift and permanent. This is not just a flooding issue—it is also a danger to health.

Another issue that concerns me greatly is the progress of technical advice note 15 relating to developments on floodplains. In England, the equivalent, albeit more robust, guidance, planning policy guidance 25, has been issued. I hope that the Minister will inform me of progress and agree that the tougher guidance to be provided by TAN 15 will be an additional weapon in our armoury to prevent homes from being flooded.

David Davies: I echo Glyn's statement in that I do not seek to undermine what Mick Bates or anyone else says about the environment—I am not a scientist and I do not pretend to be one—but it is important to get to the truth and to remember that there are differences of opinion in the scientific community over the causes and extent of global warming. I urge any Members interested in this topic to read a book called *The Sceptical Environmentalist* by Professor Bjørn Lomborg, which was written some years ago; I have a copy in my office. It systematically takes apart many of the statistics issued by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, the World Wildlife Fund and others and backs that up with evidence that people can find on the internet. Therefore, people should be aware of that book.

fy etholaeth, mae sawl teulu wedi dioddef llifogydd o'r fath ar sawl achlysur. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chynrychiolwyr Dŵr Cymru a'r awdurdod lleol, ond dywed Dŵr Cymru fod rhestr flaenoriaeth ar gyfer cynlluniau ac na allant benderfynu ar y blaenoriaethau hynny hyd nes y gwyddant pa faint o arian y bydd y rheoleiddwyr yn ei roi iddo. Yn y cyfamser, mae preswylwyr yn dal i fod ar drugaredd y tywydd anwadal.

Mae DyfrLais yn teimlo bod y canllawiau a roddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar lifogydd ar ffurf carthion i OFWAT yn rhaglen buddsoddi 2005 yn wan, a charwn glywed barn y Gweinidog am hynny. Beth y gallwn ei wneud i roi mwy o sylw i lifogydd ar ffurf carthion? Sylweddolaf fod y cyllid yn gyfyngedig ond dylid cymryd camau buan a pharhaol ynghylch llifogydd ar ffurf carthion. Nid mater o lifogydd yn unig yw hwn—mae hefyd yn berygl i iechyd.

Mater arall sy'n peri pryder mawr i mi yw'r cynnydd a wneir ar nodyn cyngor technegol 15 sy'n ymwneud â datblygiadau ar orlifdiroedd. Yn Lloegr, mae'r hyn sy'n cyfateb iddo—er ei fod yn gyfarwyddyd mwy cadarn—sef canllaw polisi cynllunio 25, wedi cael ei gyhoeddi. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog fy hysbysu am y cynnydd a chytuno y bydd y cyfarwyddyd cadarnach sydd i'w roi drwy TAN 15 yn arf ychwanegol i atal llifogydd mewn cartrefi.

David Davies: Atefais y datganiad a wnaeth Glyn gan nad wyf yn ceisio tansilio'r hyn a ddywed Mick Bates neu unrhyw un arall am yr amgylchedd—nid gwyddonydd ydwyf ac nid wyf yn honni bod—ond mae'n bwysig cael at y gwir a chofio bod gwahaniaethau barn ymysg gwyddonwyr ynghylch achosion a graddau'r cynhesu byd-eang. Anogaf unrhyw Aelodau sy'n ymddiddori yn y pwnc hwn i ddarllen llyfr o'r enw *The Sceptical Environmentalist* gan yr Athro Bjørn Lomborg, a ysgrifennwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl; mae gennyf gopi yn fy swyddfa. Mae'n chwalu'n systematig lawer o'r ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd gan y Panel Rhynglywodraethol ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, Cronfa Bywyd Gwyllt y Byd ac eraill ac yn ategu hynny â thystiolaeth y gall rhywun ddod o hyd iddi ar y rhyngwyd. Felly, dylid bod yn ymwybodol o'r llyfr hwnnw.

Mick Bates: Healthy debate in the scientific community is a great thing, but when changes in the environment directly impact on your life through the risk of increased flooding, is it not incumbent on people to consider the causes and try to take action? Reducing carbon emissions is one way of trying to alleviate some of those problems for this century. There is a straight choice: are you in favour of more renewable energy or would you like to see future energy needs drawn from nuclear power?

David Davies: That is straying a little further from the debate than I would have liked. I was making the point that we have to get to the truth. However, I accept what you said in that no matter what the causes, some sort of global warming is taking place, which impacts on people's lives.

I am surprised by how the Minister has announced this significant change in the way that flood protection committees are structured. This move towards one giant committee for the whole of Wales could have a huge impact on the amount of local knowledge that we can currently access. I am reminded of a close colleague of mine, Neville Waters, who has been a member of the Usk flood defence committee for many years. His family has farmed on the Gwent levels for 500 years. Records by his ancestors back in the sixteenth century show that they were involved in some of the original flood defence schemes. Surely, we do not want to lose such contributions that could help us try to envisage how the waters will work, what we should expect in terms of sea levels and what can be done about them.

The most important issue is how this scheme will help people on the ground—those businesses and individuals who suffered as a result of flooding. I appreciate that time is short, but I have a special plea for the Minister to consider matters in Monmouth, where people have been told for several years that they can expect a flood defence scheme, or improvements to the existing scheme, to ensure that the area around the not-very-aptly named Drybridge Street ceases to flood. The straightforward technical solution—of which

Mick Bates: Mae dadlau iach ymysg gwyddonwyr yn beth gwych, ond os yw newidiadau yn yr amgylchedd yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar eich bywyd drwy'r perygl o fwy o lifogydd, oni ddylid ystyried yr achosion a cheisio gweithredu? Mae lleihau gollyngiadau carbon yn un modd i geisio lliniaru rhai o'r problemau hynny yn y ganrif hon. Mae dewis syml: a ydych o blaid rhagor o ynni adnewyddadwy neu a garech weld diwallu anghenion ynni yn y dyfodol drwy ynni niwclear?

David Davies: Mae hynny'n crwydro ychydig yn bellach oddi wrth y ddadl nag a ddymunaswn. Y pwynt yr oeddwn yn ei wneud oedd bod rhaid inni gael at y gwir. Er hynny, derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedasochoherwydd, beth bynnag fo'r achosion, mae rhyw fath o gynhesu byd-eang yn digwydd, sy'n effeithio ar fywydau pobl.

Synnaf at y modd y cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog y newid pwysig hwn i drefniant y pwyllgorau atal llifogydd. Gallai'r cam hwn tuag at gael un pwyllgor anferth ar gyfer Cymru gyfan gael effaith enfawr ar faint y wybodaeth leol y gallwn ei chael ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn yn dwyn i gof cydweithiwr agos i mi, Neville Waters, a fu'n aelod o bwyllgor atal llifogydd Wysg ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Mae ei deulu wedi ffermio ar wastadeddau Gwent er 500 mlynedd. Mae cofnodion gan ei hynafiaid yn yr unfed ganrif ar bymtheg yn dangos eu bod yn ymwneud â rhai o'r cynlluniau atal llifogydd cyntaf. Siawns nad ydym am golli cyfraniadau o'r fath a allai ein helpu i geisio rhagweld sut y bydd y dyfroedd yn gweithio, y lefelau môr y dylem eu disgwyl a'r hyn y gellir ei wneud ynghylch hynny.

Y mater pwysicaf yw sut y bydd y cynllun hwn yn helpu pobl yn y fan a'r lle—y busnesau a'r unigolion hynny a ddiodefodd o ganlyniad i lifogydd. Deallaf fod amser yn brin, ond mae gennyf apêl arbennig i'r Gweinidog i ystyried materion yn Nhrefynwy, lle y dywedwyd wrth bobl ers sawl blwyddyn y cânt ddisgwyl cael cynllun atal llifogydd, neu welliannau i'r cynllun presennol, i atal llifogydd yn yr ardal o gwmpas Stryd Drybridge, nad yw ei henw'n un addas iawn. Yr ateb technegol syml—

the Minister will be aware—involves pumping water out of the collecting point and into the river Monnow. Therefore, we have a technical solution and the site has been allocated, but the problem now seems to centre around funding, which is perhaps to be expected, and on the criteria set by the Environment Agency to take on board the ongoing maintenance of that scheme afterwards. Minister, I urge you to sit down with Monmouthshire County Council and the Environment Agency as soon as you possibly can to address this situation. Work must begin in the summer in order to finish six months later. It is too late for that work to begin now, so the earliest that it can begin is next year, which means that by the time it has finished, my constituents could possibly have been subjected to two more years of flooding. Please try to sort this matter—it has been ongoing for years, and it will be difficult for some homes and businesses in the area to continue to get insurance if steps are not taken soon.

Huw Lewis: This consultation is about the bureaucracy of the flood prevention services that are on offer, which is a serious business and must be addressed. However, my concerns regarding flood defence and flood protection are more fundamental.

David Davies is lucky in many ways to be able to talk about the problems of following through on flood defence schemes in his constituency, because some of my constituents do not even figure with regard to qualifying for flood defence. I will explain why. It is not so much about how we arrange these services but about who benefits and why—who deserves flood protection, and who does not. My inquiries into this matter, and my experience, as well as that of my constituents, have shown that there are deserving and undeserving victims of flooding in Wales today. That is because, on domestic properties, whether or not the Environment Agency can act is tied to a piece of rubric in the regulations in something called the multicoloured manual, as I understand, which is related to the current capital value of a property. In other words, if you are a rich person living in a big house, surrounded by a few more rich people living

gŵyr y Gweinidog amdano—yw pwmpio dŵr o'r man y mae'n cronni ac i afon Mynwy. Felly, mae gennym ateb technegol ac mae'r safle wedi'i neilltuo, ond ymddengys fod problem yn awr o ran cyllid, fel y gellid disgwyl efallai, ac o ran y meini prawf a osodwyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i gynnwys y gwaith cynnal a chadw parhaus ar y cynllun hwnnw wedyn. Weinidog, fe'ch anogaf i gwrdd â Chyngor Sir Fynwy ac Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd cyn gynted ag y gallwch er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r sefyllfa hon. Rhaid dechrau ar y gwaith yn yr haf er mwyn ei orffen ymhen chwe mis. Mae'n rhy hwyr i ddechrau ar y gwaith hwnnw'n awr, felly y cynharaf y gall ddechrau yw'r flwyddyn nesaf ac mae hynny'n golygu y gallai fy etholwyr gael eu taro gan lifogydd am ddwy flynedd arall cyn y caiff ei gwblhau. Ceisiwch ddatrys y mater hwn, os gwelwch yn dda—mae'n mynd ymlaen ers blynyddoedd, a bydd yn anodd i rai cartrefi a busnesau yn yr ardal barhau i gael yswiriant os na chymerir camau cyn hir.

Huw Lewis: Mae'r ymgynghoriad hwn yn ymwneud â biwrocratiaeth y gwasanaethau atal llifogydd a gynigir, sy'n fater pwysig a rhaid ymdrin ag ef. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pryderon sydd gennyf fi ynghylch atal llifogydd ac amddiffyn rhag llifogydd yn fwy sylfaenol.

Mae David Davies yn ffodus ar sawl ystyr o allu sôn am y problemau a geir wrth gwblhau cynlluniau atal llifogydd yn ei etholaeth, gan fod rhai o'm hetholwyr nad ydynt yn cyfrif hyd yn oed o ran bod yn gymwys i'w hamddiffyn rhag llifogydd. Egluraf y rheswm. Nid yw'n ymwneud yn ogymaint â'r modd y trefnwn y gwasanaethau hyn ond â phwy a gaiff fudd ohonynt a pham—pwy sy'n haeddu cael ei amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, a phwy nad yw. Mae fy ymchwil i'r mater hwn, a'm profiad i yn ogystal â phrofiad fy etholwyr, wedi dangos bod dioddefwyr haeddiannol ac anhaeddiannol yn sgîl llifogydd yng Nghymru heddiw. Mae hynny oherwydd, yn achos tai preswyl, fod gallu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd i weithredu neu beidio ynghlwm wrth fanylyn yn y rheoliadau mewn rhywbeth a elwir yn llawlyfr amryliw, fel yr wyf yn deall, sy'n gysylltiedig â gwerth cyfalaf cyfredol yr eiddo. Mewn geiriau eraill, os ydych yn rhywun cefnog sy'n byw

in a big, expensive housing estate, then you qualify. If you happen to live in an area where house prices are low because the people are not so well off, then you do not qualify. Clearly that is social injustice.

To my mind, qualification for flood defence should depend on whether your home is at risk. A home is a home. The consequences of flooding are just as dire, serious and distressing, no matter how expensive your home is. In fact, those who are least well off are likely to suffer more from flood damage because, as has already been said, many of them do not qualify for, or cannot afford, insurance in the first place. When Sue Essex was the Minister responsible for the environment, she said in Plenary that the situation was indefensible. Yet, it still exists.

I will give an example that perfectly illustrates social injustice in my constituency. Taff Street and Crescent Street in Merthyr Vale are two long streets lying alongside the river Taff and they have a history of flood problems, which have worsened considerably over the last five to 10 years. The residents of those streets are locked out of flood defence because their houses are not expensive enough to qualify for it. The cost benefit analysis of looking after these people, who are among the least well-off in our society, means that they are locked out. That also means a double burden for the residents of Taff Street and Crescent Street. Not only are they locked out of flood defence, but because their homes are under continual threat, they are also locked out of the Assembly renewal area programme that is progressing through the rest of their electoral ward. The Assembly is providing £27 million towards regenerating that community, but the residents of Taff Street and Crescent Street will miss out because they are just not well off enough to qualify for flood defence. They are locked out of the renewal area because they are locked out of flood defence. They are also locked out of the housing market. Their houses are worth nothing. They cannot sell their homes and they are trapped in these blighted, unsaleable properties because they

mewn tŷ mawr, a rhagor o bobl gefnog o'ch cwmpas yn byw ar ystâd dai fawr ddrud, yr ydych yn gymwys. Os ydych yn digwydd byw mewn ardal lle y mae prisiau tai'n isel gan nad yw'r bobl mor gefnog, nid ydych yn gymwys. Mae'n amlwg mai anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol yw hynny.

I'm meddwl i, dylai cymhwyster i gael amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd ddibynnu ar y perygl i'ch cartref. Cartref yw cartref. Mae canlyniadau llifogydd yr un mor enbyd, difrifol a gofidus, ni waeth pa mor ddrud yw'ch cartref. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r rhai lleiaf cefnog yn debygol o ddiodeff yn fwy gan ddifrod drwy lifogydd oherwydd, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae llawer ohonynt nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael yswiriant yn y lle cyntaf, neu'n methu â'i fforddio. Pan oedd Sue Essex yn Weinidog dros yr amgylchedd, dywedodd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn na ellid amddiffyn sefyllfa o'r fath. Ac eto, mae'n dal i fod.

Rhodaf enghraifft sy'n dangos yn berffaith yr anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn fy etholaeth. Mae Stryd Taf a Stryd y Cilgant yn Ynysowen yn ddwy stryd hir ar lan afon Taf ac mae iddynt hanes hir o broblemau oherwydd llifogydd, sydd wedi gwaethygu'n sylweddol dros y pump i 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Naceir amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd i drigolion y strydoedd hynny am nad yw eu tai'n ddigon drud i fod yn gymwys ar ei gyfer. Mae'r dadansoddiad cost a budd o ofalu am y bobl hyn, sydd ymysg y rhai lleiaf cefnog yn ein cymdeithas, yn golygu y naceir hynny iddynt. Mae hynny'n gosod baich dwbl ar drigolion Stryd Taf a Stryd y Cilgant. Nid yn unig y naceir amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd iddynt, ond am fod eu cartrefi o dan fygythiad parhaus, fe'u caeir allan hefyd o raglen adnewyddu ardal y Cynulliad sy'n mynd rhagddi yng ngweddill eu ward etholiadol. Mae'r Cynulliad yn darparu £27 miliwn tuag at adfywio'r gymuned honno, ond bydd trigolion Stryd Taf a Stryd y Cilgant yn colli hynny am nad ydynt yn ddigon cefnog i fod yn gymwys ar gyfer amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd. Fe'u caeir allan o'r ardal adnewyddu am eu bod wedi'u cau allan o amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd. Fe'u caeir allan o'r farchnad dai hefyd. Nid yw eu tai'n werth dim. Ni allant werthu eu cartrefi ac maent wedi'u dal yn y tai difethedig hyn

do not qualify for flood defence. They have lived with that for years now.

4.50 p.m.

The Minister was kind enough to meet me to discuss this, and I know that he is sympathetic to the plight of that community. However, I am sure that if we had the time and the research capacity to look into this situation, we would find that it is replicated in other communities across Wales. It is still unclear whether we can move to a fairer and socially just system of allocating flood protection money, based on the fact that someone's home is their most important asset. It should not matter if the fixtures and fittings are not worth a great deal. The last time that Taff Street and Crescent Street were flooded, I remember clearly a couple in their 80s whose home meant a great deal to them, but the value of the fixtures and fittings did not add up to many thousands of pounds.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must wind up.

Huw Lewis: Their most valued possessions were their family photographs, and they had been lost. They were worried about their memories of a lifetime that had been snatched away, and their stoical response was, perhaps, the most upsetting thing. Minister, I urge you to consider this matter. I know that you are doing so, but I ask, please, for a sense of urgency.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome the consultation on flood defence arrangements, but I was curious about the fact that the Environment Agency discusses 'flood management', not 'flood defence'. Are we all discussing the same issue?

I seek the Minister's assurance that these proposals will not compromise local knowledge and expertise. Forgive me for being parochial yet again, but I have bobbed about in boats in flooded areas and experienced this issue first hand in the Rossett and Trevalyn area. I know that we can smile, and have a bit of a joke, but this is

na ellir eu gwerthu am nad ydynt yn gymwys i gael amddiffyniad rhag llifogydd. Buont yn byw gyda hynny ers blynnyddoedd bellach.

Bu'r Gweinidog yn ddigon caredig i gwrdd â mi i drafod hyn, a gwn ei fod yn cydymdeimlo â'r gymuned honno yn ei thrafferthion. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr, pe byddai gennym yr amser a'r gallu ymchwil y mae eu hangen i ystyried y sefyllfa hon, y caem ei bod yn codi mewn cymunedau eraill ledled Cymru. Nid yw'n glir eto a fydd modd inni droi at system decach a mwy cymdeithasol gyfiawn o ddyrannu arian ar gyfer amddiffyn rhag llifogydd, yn seiliedig ar y ffaith mai cartref rhywun yw ei ased pwysicaf. Ni ddylai fod o bwys nad yw'r gosodion a'r addurniadau'n werth llawer. Y tro diwethaf y cafwyd llifogydd yn Stryd Taf a Stryd y Cilgant, mae gennyf gof byw o gwpl yn eu 80au yr oedd eu cartref yn golygu llawer iawn iddynt, ond nid oedd gwerth y gosodion a'r addurniadau'n dod i filoedd lawer o bunnoedd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi orffen.

Huw Lewis: Eu trysorau mwyaf oedd y lluniau o'u teulu, ac fe'u collwyd. Yr oeddent yn pryderu am atgofion oes a oedd wedi'u cipio oddi arnynt, a'u hymateb stoicaidd oedd yr hyn a barai'r gofid mwyaf, o bosibl. Weinidog, fe'ch anogaf i ystyried y mater hwn. Gwn eich bod yn gwneud hynny, ond gofynnaf am ei drin fel mater brys, os gwelwch yn dda.

Eleanor Burnham: Croesawaf yr ymgynghoriad ar drefniadau atal llifogydd, ond yr oeddwn yn chwilfrydig ynghylch y ffaith bod Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn trafod 'rheoli llifogydd', nid 'atal llifogydd'. A ydym yn trafod yr un mater?

Gofynnaf am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog na fydd y cynigion hyn yn fygythiad i wybodaeth ac arbenigedd lleol. Maddeuwch imi am fod yn blwyfol, eto byth, ond yr wyf wedi siglo i fyny ac i lawr mewn cychod mewn ardaloedd a oedd dan ddŵr ac wedi profi'r mater hwn yn uniongyrchol yn ardal yr Orsedd a Threfalun. Gwn y gallwn wenu, a

a serious issue. One family is regularly marooned on an island—I am sure that I have written to the Minister on this, but I do not think that he is listening, even now. The family's situation is so serious that I have discussed with them the possibility of their having to move, because the flooding happens so regularly.

We have much local knowledge from former water authority officials and employees, who feel that they have not been listened to over the years. I wrote to your predecessor, Sue Essex, on many occasions about the simple matter of re-opening the sluice gates on the weir in Chester. Surely, and according to former river officials, increasing the scope that the water has to run away to the sea should help floods upstream, in Rossett and Trevalyn. In this area, there is also the issue of 'annual misery', which has been referred to, that means that annual premiums constantly increase, if residents can get insurance at all. It is a big issue for one person who has shown me that it cost £76,000 the previous year to put her house right and there she was, once again, wading around. John Hughes, the chair of the flood defence committee, and I were with her, seeing the serious situation for ourselves. Minister, what can we do to help people who face this annual misery? Frankly, this problem makes you feel impotent when you speak to people and see their complete disaster. While others try to recoup compensation, I wonder what you are doing about the difficult insurance issue. Minister, is there any research that considers the complex reasons for the present-day speed of floods and the speed at which the rivers rise? I understand that forestry management has changed over the years and that that leads to the quicker passage of water from the forestries to the river. Is there anything that we can do about this fundamental issue?

We welcome the rationalisation of committees to a single tier, but we seek your assurance that local representation will not be lost. Local knowledge should be better utilised and incorporated into the work of the Environment Agency. I attended

chael ychydig o hwyl, ond mae hwn yn fater difrif. Mae un teulu'n cael ei adael yn rheolaidd ar ynys—yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog am hyn, ond ni chredaf ei fod yn gwrando, hyd yn oed yn awr. Mae sefyllfa'r teulu mor ddifrifol fel fy mod wedi trafod gyda hwy y posibilrwydd y gallent orfod symud, gan fod y llifogydd yn digwydd mor rheolaidd.

Mae gennym lawer o wybodaeth leol a gafwyd gan gyn-swyddogion a gweithwyr yr awdurdod dŵr, sy'n teimlo na wrandawyd arnynt dros y blynyddoedd. Ysgrifennais at eich rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, ar sawl achlysur ynghylch y mater syml o ailagor y llifddorau ar y gored yng Nghaer. Yn sicr, ac yn ôl cyn-swyddogion yr afon, byddai rhoi mwy o gyfle i'r dŵr redeg i'r môr yn lliniaru llifogydd yn uwch ar yr afon, yn yr Orsedd a Threfalun. Mae mater 'trallod blynyddol', y cyfeiriwyd ato, yn codi yn y maes hwn, sy'n golygu bod premiymau blynyddol yn codi'n gyson, os gall preswylwyr gael yswiriant o gwbl. Mae'n fater o bwys i un person a ddangosodd imi ei bod wedi costio £76,000 y flwyddyn cynt i roi trefn ar ei thŷ a dyna lle'r oedd, unwaith eto, yn cerdded drwy ddŵr. Yr oedd John Hughes, cadeirydd y pwyllgor atal llifogydd, a minnau gyda hi, yn gweld y sefyllfa ddifrifol drosom ein hunain. Weinidog, beth y gallwn ei wneud i helpu rhai sy'n wynebu'r trallod blynyddol hwn? A dweud y gwir, mae'r broblem hon yn peri ichi deimlo na allwch wneud dim pan siaradwch â phobl a gweld y llastr llwyr y maent ynndo. Er bod eraill yn ceisio iawndal, tybed beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch y mater anodd o yswiriant. Weinidog, a oes unrhyw ymchwil sy'n ystyried y rhesymau cymhleth dros gyflymder llifogydd y dyddiau hyn a pha mor sydyn y mae'r afonydd yn codi? Deallaf fod y dull o reoli coedwigoedd wedi newid dros y blynyddoedd a bod hynny'n peri i ddŵr lifo'n gynt o'r coedwigoedd i'r afon. A oes rhywbeth y gallwn ei wneud ynghylch y mater sylfaenol hwn?

Croesawn y rhesymoli ar bwyllgorau i gael un haen, ond ceisiwn sicrwydd gennych na chollir cynrychiolaeth leol. Dylid gwneud gwell defnydd o wybodaeth leol a'i chynnwys yng ngwaith Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Bûm mewn cyflwyniadau a

Environment Agency presentations a few years ago, where I felt that the staff appeared to be rather flippant about what local people said about how to manage floods in the area.

We welcome the changes in funding and we note the Assembly Government's block grant to the Environment Agency. We hope that this will benefit north Wales in particular, to be parochial. I noticed today, in one of the papers, that regional selective assistance funding has been given to a flood protection system that seemed interesting: people in particularly vulnerable places can put up boarding to prevent flooding from becoming even worse in their houses.

The local authority partnerships need to be—
[*Interruption.*] It was in *The Western Mail*, Minister. It was an interesting feature. I cannot remember the page number, but it was interesting as it concerns Assembly-funded RSA grant.

Local authority partnerships need to be effective, and there is scope for the highways department to be involved in cleaning the drains. That is a fundamental issue because, in certain areas, drains get blocked. Surely, it is incumbent on us to ensure that local people do not suffer for such a simple lack of regular maintenance. Also, many tell me that rivers are not cleared and maintained regularly, which, in their view, adds to the problem. I am sure, Minister, that you are on top of all these issues and that you will answer me fully.

I also welcome the cross-border approach, particularly on the Dee because it is important. I look forward to the results of the Welsh Assembly Government's official discussions with the Environment Agency, with regard to the practicality of this option.

Brynle Williams: I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate. We heard about carbon emissions and so on, and maybe they are changing the climate, and maybe not. However, people cannot be allowed to live in fear of their houses being flooded, and that is

roddwyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, a themlais fod y staff yno'n ymddangos braidd yn anystyriol o'r hyn a ddywedai pobl leol am y modd i reoli llifogydd yn yr ardal.

Croesawn y newidiadau i gyllid a nodwn grant bloc Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Gobeithiwn y bydd hyn o fudd i'r Gogledd yn benodol, a bod yn blwyfol. Sylwais heddiw, yn un o'r papurau, fod cyllid cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol wedi'i roi tuag at system atal llifogydd a ymddangosai'n ddiddorol: mae pobl mewn mannau sy'n arbennig o agored i ddifrod yn gallu codi byrddau i atal llifogydd rhag mynd yn waeth byth yn eu tai.

Rhaid i bartneriaethau awdurdodau lleol—
[*Torri ar draws.*] Yr oedd yn *The Western Mail*, Weinidog. Yr oedd yn erthygl ddiddorol. Ni allaf gofio rhif y tudalen, ond yr oedd yn ddiddorol gan ei bod yn ymwneud â grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a gyllidwyd gan y Cynulliad.

Rhaid i bartneriaethau awdurdodau lleol fod yn effeithiol, ac mae lle i'r adran briffyrdd gymryd rhan mewn glanhau draeniau. Mae hwnnw'n fater sylfaenol oherwydd, mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae draeniau'n blocio. Yn sicr, yr ydym o dan ddyletswydd i sicrhau nad yw pobl leol yn dioddef o ganlyniad i ddiffyg gwaith cynnal a chadw rheolaidd. Hefyd, dywed llawer wrthyf nad yw afonydd yn cael eu clirio a'u cynnal a'u cadw'n rheolaidd, ac mae hynny, yn eu barn hwy, yn gwaethygu'r broblem. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, eich bod yn gyfarwydd â'r holl faterion hyn ac y gwnewch fy ateb yn llawn.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r dull gweithredu trawsffiniol, yn enwedig ynghylch afon Dyfrdwy gan ei bod yn bwysig. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniadau trafodaethau swyddogol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, gyda golwg ar ymarferoldeb y dewis hwn.

Brynle Williams: Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Clywsom am ollyngiadau carbon ac yn y blaen, ac efallai eu bod yn newid yr hinsawdd, ac efallai nad ydynt. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir caniatáu i bobl fyw gan ofni y bydd eu tai o dan ddŵr, ac mae

evidenced. Looking at this matter practically, as a farmer, we are still allowing development on floodplains. Where is the common sense in that approach? On the all-Wales committee, I beg you, Minister, to take heed of local people and local knowledge, as my colleagues have said. We have had two major incidents of flooding in north Wales recently, but if local knowledge had been used, we could have possibly alleviated certain problems.

As Sandy Mewies noted, there are problems in Gwernymynydd with sewage. This is a major problem, and I believe that the water authority tried to prioritise spending on this matter. This serious problem does not just affect Gwernymynydd; it is backing up in people's homes. It is everywhere. I can give instances that may or may not make sense, but, Minister, please, let us look at planning. The matter of where we grant planning consent is one of the most serious issues, with building taking place on floodplains in the hope that we will then put our hands in our pockets to divert nature. We think that we are clever, but the Almighty and nature are far cleverer than us.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Let us remind ourselves that, in creating a single committee, we are reducing eight committees to one, which I would have thought opposition Members would have welcomed. It was described as the creation of a quango, but we have one body now where previously there were eight.

There was criticism that this is not the appropriate way to make such an announcement. Sometimes there is criticism that announcements are made outside the Chamber and that there are no debates on announcements, but I believe that this is the proper way to make such an announcement so that it can be debated by Members in the Chamber.

Where there are cross-border issues, of which there will be many, I expect cross-border working to be the norm. That applies particularly in the Severn valley, where it is

hynny'n ddigon amlwg. Gan edrych ar y mater hwn yn ymarferol, fel ffermwr, yr ydym yn dal i ganiatáu datblygu ar orlifdiroedd. Pa synnwyr cyffredin sydd yn hynny? Ar y pwyllgor i Gymru gyfan, erfyniaf arnoch, Weinidog, i gymryd sylw o bobl leol a gwybodaeth leol, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau. Cawsom ddau achos o lifogydd mawr yn y Gogledd yn ddiweddar, ond pe gwnaethid defnydd o wybodaeth leol, mae'n bosibl y gallem fod wedi lliniaru rhai problemau.

Fel y nododd Sandy Mewies, mae trafferthion yng Ngwernymynydd mewn cysylltiad â charthion. Mae hon yn broblem fawr, a chredaf i'r awdurdod dŵr geisio rhoi blaenoriaeth i wario ar y mater hwn. Nid ar Wernymynydd yn unig y mae'r broblem ddifrifol hon yn effeithio; mae'n codi yng nghartrefi pobl. Mae ym mhob man. Gallaf gynnig enghreifftiau a allai, neu na allai, wneud synnwyr, ond, Weinidog, gadewch inni ystyried cynllunio. Mater y lleoedd yr ydym yn rhoi caniatâd cynllunio yw un o'r pynciau mwyaf difrifol, gan fod adeiladu'n digwydd ar orlifdiroedd gyda'r gobaith y byddwn ni wedyn yn talu i newid cwrs natur. Tybiwn ein bod yn glyfar, ond mae'r Hollalluog a natur yn glyfrach o lawer na ni.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Gadewch inni gofio ein bod, wrth greu un pwyllgor, yn lleihau nifer y pwyllgorau o wyth i un, a thybiwn y byddai Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wedi croesawu hynny. Fe'i galwyd yn fwriad i greu cwango, ond mae gennym un corff yn awr lle'r oedd wyth o'r blaen.

Cafwyd beirniadaeth i'r perwyl nad hwn yw'r modd priodol i wneud cyhoeddiad o'r fath. Weithiau ceir beirniadaeth am fod cyhoeddiadau'n cael eu gwneud y tu allan i'r Siambr ac nad oes dadleuon ar gyhoeddiadau, ond credaf mai hwn yw'r modd priodol i wneud cyhoeddiad o'r fath fel y gellir cael dadl arno gan Aelodau yn y Siambr.

Lle y mae materion trawsffiniol yn codi, y ceir llawer ohonynt, yr wyf yn disgwyl i weithio trawsffiniol fod yn beth arferol. Mae hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol i ddyffryn

simply not possible to consider the problem from a purely Welsh point of view because so much work is carried out in the upper Severn valley that is of benefit to those who live downstream—and that must continue. Cross-border working will continue in that way. Also, the situation with regard to finance will be that DEFRA will continue to pay for flood works in Wales that benefit England. It will not, therefore, be the Assembly's responsibility to fund those works. Similarly, for works carried out in England that benefit Wales, the Assembly will pick up the bill.

Two considerations have been put forward. With regard to the three regional committees, we have to consider that, where the boundaries of those committees meet, we will have to fund three different committees rather than one, and the administration costs would be much higher. It therefore makes sense to have one committee. Consideration was also given to whether a committee should follow the former Welsh Water Authority boundary with the Severn Trent Water area, and Montgomeryshire in particular, and become part of a Midlands regional committee. However, there were difficulties. First, it would mean that the people of Montgomeryshire and the upper Severn valley, particularly, would be represented by a committee on which they had no representation, and the Assembly would have to fund that committee without having a say in the way in which the money was spent. Similarly, a committee based in the Welsh Water Authority boundaries, would mean significant parts of Cheshire and Herefordshire being part of the Welsh committee. Given that the Assembly would have funded and created the Welsh committee, it could not be right that people living in Cheshire and Herefordshire should, effectively, be part of an area over which they had no control, democratically. Therefore, I believe that it is right that we should move to a single committee, based on a political boundary.

5.00 p.m.

On what Mick said, carbon emission is a serious problem. With any scientific issue,

Hafren, lle nad oes modd ystyried y broblem o safbwynt Cymreig yn unig gan fod cymaint o'r gwaith a wneir ym mhen uchaf dyffryn Hafren yn dod â budd i'r rhai sy'n byw i lawr yr afon—a rhaid i hynny barhau. Bydd gweithio trawsffiniol yn parhau yn y modd hwnnw. Hefyd, y sefyllfa o ran cyllido fydd bod Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn dal i dalu am weithfeydd sy'n ymwneud â llifogydd yng Nghymru sydd o fudd i Loegr. Felly, nid cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad fydd cyllido'r gweithfeydd hynny. Yn yr un modd, yn achos gweithfeydd a wneir yn Lloegr a ddaw â budd i Gymru, y Cynulliad fydd yn talu'r bil.

Cynigiwyd dau beth i'w hystyried. Gyda golwg ar y tri phwyllgor rhanbarthol, dylem gofio y byddai'n rhaid inni gyllido tri gwahanol bwyllgor, lle y daw ffiniau'r pwyllgorau hynny at ei gilydd, yn hytrach nag un, a byddai'r costau gweinyddu'n uwch o lawer. Peth synhwyrol, felly, yw cael un pwyllgor. Ystyriwyd hefyd a ddylid cael pwyllgor y byddai ei ffin yn dilyn y ffin flaenorol rhwng Awdurdod Dŵr Cymru ac ardal Severn Trent Water, a sir Drefaldwyn yn benodol, gan ddod yn rhan o bwyllgor rhanbarthol ar gyfer canolbarth Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd anawsterau. Yn gyntaf, golygai y byddai pobl sir Drefaldwyn a'r rhai ym mhen uchaf dyffryn Hafren, yn benodol, yn cael eu cynrychioli gan bwyllgor nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw gynrychiolaeth arno, a byddai'r Cynulliad yn gorfod cyllido'r pwyllgor hwnnw heb gael llais o ran y modd y câi'r arian ei wario. Yn yr un modd, byddai pwyllgor a oedd yn seiliedig ar ffiniau Awdurdod Dŵr Cymru yn golygu y byddai rhannau helaeth o swydd Gaer a swydd Henffordd yn rhan o bwyllgor Cymru. Gan mai'r Cynulliad a fyddai wedi cyllido a chreu'r pwyllgor Cymreig, ni allai fod yn briodol i rai sy'n byw yn swydd Gaer a swydd Henffordd fod yn rhan, i bob pwrpas, o ardal nad oedd ganddynt unrhyw reolaeth ddemocrataidd drosti. Gan hynny, credaf ei bod yn iawn inni symud tuag at gael un pwyllgor, yn seiliedig ar ffin wleidyddol.

Ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick, mae gollwng carbon yn broblem ddifrifol. Yn yr

the majority of scientists will say one thing and one or two will always say something different. It is the same with BSE and smoking and tobacco. You will always find one scientist who will say something different to the majority. That scientist can sometimes be convincing, but it does not mean that he or she is right.

In terms of the future, it must be right that the Environment Agency has the capacity to recognise Wales. One of the issues that we must get right is ensuring sufficient local input into the new flood defence committee, but that does not mean that we have to have an enormous committee with many members, because that would be far too unwieldy to function properly. We are looking at creating a mechanism to ensure that local people, and local expertise in particular, are able to feed into the new committee.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you give us an undertaking that, when your thoughts about local representation on the national committee are further developed, you will come back to committee so that we can have an input into addressing these concerns—without being overburdened?

Carwyn Jones: I would fully expect there to be more than one representative from local government on the committee, and it would not be token representation, as may have been suggested.

Sewage flooding, which Eleanor and Sandy Mewies raised, is a matter for the operating authorities, and Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water in particular. At present, we are undergoing a review of water prices, and the regulator will soon announce its findings. Three companies in Wales deal with this, but Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water would need sufficient levels of funding to be put before it—we are talking about a non-profit-making organisation—before it could carry out further works in terms of sewage flooding. Let us not forget that sewage flooding is a significant problem, requiring a significant amount of money to rectify it.

Work is continuing on technical advice note 15, and I hope that that will be in place in the

un modd â phob pwnc gwyddonol, bydd y mwyafrif o wyddonwyr yn dweud un peth a bydd un neu ddau'n dweud rhywbeth gwahanol. Mae yr un fath yn achos BSE ac ysmegu a thybaco. Byddwch bob amser yn cael un gwyddonydd sy'n dweud rhywbeth gwahanol i'r mwyafrif. Weithiau gall y gwyddonydd hwnnw fod yn berswadiol, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu ei fod yn iawn.

Gyda golwg ar y dyfodol, mae'n rhaid ei bod yn briodol i Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd allu cydnabod Cymru. Un o'r materion y mae'n rhaid inni lwyddo ynddynt yw sicrhau digon o fewnbwn lleol i'r pwyllgor atal llifogydd newydd, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu bod rhaid inni gael pwyllgor anferth ac arno nifer fawr o aelodau, gan y byddai hwnnw'n llawer rhy drwsogl i weithredu'n briodol. Yr ydym yn ystyried creu dull gweithredu i sicrhau y bydd pobl lleol, a rhai ag arbenigedd lleol yn benodol, yn gallu porthi'r pwyllgor newydd.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch roi ymgymieriad i ni y deuwch yn ôl i'r pwyllgor, pan yw'ch syniadau am gynrychiolaeth leol ar y pwyllgor cenedlaethol wedi datblygu ymhellach, fel y gallwn gyfrannu at yr ymateb i'r pryderon hynny—heb gael ein gorlethu?

Carwyn Jones: Byddwn yn llawn ddisgwyl y bydd mwy nag un cynrychiolydd o lywodraeth leol ar y pwyllgor, ac nad cynrychiolaeth symbolaidd fyddai, fel yr awgrymwyd.

Mae llifogydd ar ffurf carthion, a gododd Eleanor a Sandy Mewies, yn fater i'r awdurdodau gweithredol, a Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water yn benodol. Ar hyn o bryd, ceir adolygiad o brisiau dŵr, a bydd y rheoleiddiwr yn cyhoeddi ei ganfyddiadau cyn hir. Mae tri chwmmi yng Nghymru'n delio â hyn, ond byddai'n rhaid i Dŵr Cymru Welsh Water gael digon o gyllid—gan gofio mai corff nad yw'n gwneud elw ydyw—cyn y gallai wneud gwaith pellach mewn cysylltiad â llifogydd ar ffurf carthion. Rhaid inni gofio bod llifogydd ar ffurf carthion yn broblem sylweddol, y mae angen swm sylweddol o arian i'w datrys.

Mae gwaith yn parhau ar nodyn cyngor technegol 15, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn

near future.

On the other points that were raised, the Environment Agency and the local authority are currently in discussions as to which scheme would be appropriate for Monmouth, and we are awaiting a grant application from the local authority. I have great sympathy with Huw's viewpoint that damage should not be quantified purely in terms of money. Other factors can be taken into account in a cost-benefit analysis, but further guidance may need to be given—and we will continue to work on this—to ensure that money is not the overriding factor, as that cannot be right. The people of Merthyr Vale deserve our sympathy, but sympathy is not enough, and I intend to take that forward.

We have created an opportunity to have a strategic and well-funded flood defence committee that the Assembly would be able to influence strongly and which would provide a strategic direction for the future. This is a great opportunity for us. There are many challenges ahead with regard to climate change, and I believe that the political structure that I have proposed is the best way forward for Wales.

weithredol yn y dyfodol agos.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau eraill a godwyd, mae Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r awdurdod lleol yn cynnal trafodaethau ar hyn o bryd i ganfod pa gynllun a fyddai'n addas i Drefynwy, ac yr ydym yn disgwyl cais am grant gan yr awdurdod lleol. Cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â safbwynt Huw Lewis na ddylai difrod gael ei fesur yn nhermau arian yn unig. Gellir ystyried ffactorau eraill mewn dadansoddiad cost a budd, ond efallai y bydd yn rhaid rhoi cyfarwyddyd pellach—a pharhawn i weithio ar hyn—i sicrhau nad arian fydd y ffactor pwysicaf, gan na allai hynny fod yn iawn. Mae pobl Ynysowen yn haeddu ein cydymdeimlad, ond nid yw cydymdeimlad yn ddigon, a bwriadaf gymryd camau pellach ynghylch hynny.

Yr ydym wedi creu cyfle i gael pwyllgor atal llifogydd strategol sydd wedi'i gyllido'n dda y gallai'r Cynulliad ddylanwadu'n helaeth arno ac a gynigiai gyfeiriad strategol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae hyn yn gyfle gwych i ni. Mae llawer o heriau o'n blaen o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd, a chredaf mai'r trefniant gwleidyddol a gynigiais yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen i Gymru.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.

Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2015): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2015): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
concludes this afternoon's business. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.05 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.05 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)