



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 28 Mawrth 2006
Tuesday, 28 March 2006**

Cynnwys Contents

Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 17.4 i 17.6 Suspension of Standing Orders Nos. 17.4 to 17.6	4
Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Election to a Planning Decision Committee	5
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	7
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement	30
Datganiad am Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru Statement on the Arts Council of Wales	36
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order	67
Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25	69
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned (Sefydlu Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin, Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau a Diddymu Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned Llanelli/Dinefwr a Chaerfyrddin/Dinefwr) 2006 Approval of the Community Health Council (Establishment of Carmarthenshire Community Health Council, Transfer of Functions and Abolition of Llanelli/Dinefwr and Carmarthen/Dinefwr Community Health Councils) Order 2006	71
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru (Ymchwiliadau Safonau) 2006 Approval of the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards Investigations) Order 2006	75
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestrï Cyflawnwyr) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 Approval of the National Health Service (Performers Lists) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006	78
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 Approval of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006	81
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006	84
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales) Regulations 2006 ..	90

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Chanlyniadol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Sylfaenol) (Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Chytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv)	
Approval of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional and Consequential Provisions (Wales) (No.2) Order 2006, the Functions of Local Health Boards and the NHS Business Services Authority (Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG) (Primary Dental Services) (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts and Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv).....	101
Cynnig Trefniadol	
Procedural Motion.....	115
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): GIG Cymru	
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): NHS Wales.....	117

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 17.4 i 17.6
Suspension of Standing Orders Nos. 17.4 to 17.6**

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with Standing Order Nos. 37.5 and 37.6:

suspends Standing Order Nos. 17.4 to 17.6 to allow for the four Assembly Members nominated to Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-3 to be those mentioned in NDM2968. (NDM2967)

Y Llywydd: Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid y cynnig hwn er mwyn iddo gael ei dderbyn.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 37.5 a 37.6:

yn atal Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 17.4 i 17.6 er mwyn caniatáu mai'r pedwar Aelod Cynulliad a enwebwyd ar gyfer Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cyllunio (2) 2006-3 yw'r rheini a enwir yn NDM2968. (NDM2967)

The Presiding Officer: This motion requires a two-thirds majority vote in favour for it to be carried.

*Cynnig (NDM2967): O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2967): For 31, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio Election to a Planning Decision Committee

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad **The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose**

- | | |
|---|--|
| <p><i>1. fod y Cynulliad yn penderfynu diddymu ei benderfyniad ar 28 Chwefror 2006 gyda golwg ar NDM2854 (ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-2);</i></p> <p><i>2. fod Pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-3, yn cael ei sefydlu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17 y Cynulliad i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y materion y cyfeirir atynt yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn a nodir yng nghyswllt pob mater yn yr atodlen honno a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y rheini'n cael eu dirprwyo i'r pwyllgor hwnnw;</i></p> <p><i>3. mai aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw fydd:</i></p> <p><i>Carwyn Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody, Glyn Davies;</i></p> <p><i>4. fod y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.16 neu ar 28 Ebrill 2006, pa un bynnag a fydd gyntaf;</i></p> <p><i>5. os bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna, yn yr achos hwnnw, dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 2 uchod, yng nghyswllt mater o'r fath, i'r Prif Weinidog.</i></p> | <p><i>1. that the Assembly resolves to rescind its resolution of 28 February 2006 in relation to NDM2854 (election of Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-2);</i></p> <p><i>2. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-3, be established in accordance with Standing Order No. 17 of the Assembly to discharge those functions of the Assembly in respect of the matters identified in the schedule to this motion, which are indicated in respect of each matter in that schedule, and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that committee;</i></p> <p><i>3. that the members of that committee be:</i></p> <p><i>Carwyn Jones, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody, Glyn Davies;</i></p> <p><i>4. that the committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.16 or on 28 April 2006, whichever is the earlier;</i></p> <p><i>5. that if the committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then, in that event, the functions identified in paragraph 2 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.</i></p> |
|---|--|

Atodlen

Schedule

Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 (fel y'i diwygiwyd): adran 78.

Town and Country Planning Act 1990 (as amended): section 78.

Apêl gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

Appeal by the National Assembly for Wales

Datblygiad preswyl arfaethedig yn dilyn

Proposed residential development following

chwalu'r adeiladau cyfredol yn Ysbyty Meadowslea, Pen-y-ffordd, sir y Fflint.

the demolition of existing buildings at Meadowslea Hospital, Penyffordd, Flintshire.

Apêl cynllunio ac apêl caniatâd adeilad rhestredig gan T-Mobile (UK) Cyf. ar gyfer disodli lwfrau cyfredol gyda lwfrau GRP er mwyn hwyluso gosod yn fewnol orsaf ffonau symudol yn Eglwys Sant Thomas, Stryd y Baddon, y Rhyl. (NDM2968)

Planning appeal and listed building consent appeal by T-Mobile (UK) Ltd for the replacement of existing louvres with GRP louvres to facilitate the internal installation of a mobile phone base station at St Thomas's Church, Bath Street, Rhyl. (NDM2968)

Cynnig (NDM2968): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2968): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Gwella Safonau Tai erbyn 2012 Improving Housing Standards by 2012

Q1 William Graham: Will the First Minister outline the factors that will determine the success of the Welsh Assembly Government target to improve housing standards by 2012? OAQ1433(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): To achieve success, there are physical, environmental and housing management factors that have to be met by 2012. We have asked local authorities to submit business plans identifying how the Welsh housing quality standard can be met. In some cases, the option of stock transfer as a means of achieving the standard is under consideration.

William Graham: Thank you for your answer, First Minister, which follows on from previous answers given by Edwina Hart. Would you consider not just stock transfer to registered social landlords, provided of course that there is full agreement by the majority of the tenants concerned, but selling directly to tenants at the price that registered social landlords pay?

The First Minister: It is important that we maintain the principle that tenants have a block on any proposed change via the need for confirmation in a referendum. We are giving a wide choice of types of vehicles by which the stock can be transferred, if transferred, including the community mutual model. So far, the process has been very slow to take off, but there will now be a big stimulus to consider stock transfer among those local authorities that have no other way of meeting the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012.

Leanne Wood: First Minister, in your 2003 election manifesto, you promised that all social housing would be brought up to the required standard by the end of the decade. Do you think that you will keep that promise, or will you need to make another apology?

C1 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu'r ffactorau a fydd yn pennu llwyddiant targed Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella safonau tai erbyn 2012? OAQ1433(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Er mwyn llwyddo, mae ffactorau ffisegol, rhai amgylcheddol a ffactorau sy'n ymwneud â rheoli tai y mae'n rhaid eu cyflawni erbyn 2012. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno cynlluniau busnes sy'n nodi sut y gellir cyflawni'r safon ansawdd. Dan rai amgylchiadau, mae'r opsiwn o drosglwyddo stoc fel modd o gyrraedd y safon wrthi'n cael ei ystyried.

William Graham: Diolch am eich ateb, Brif Weinidog, sy'n dilyn atebion blaenorol a roddwyd gan Edwina Hart. A fydddech yn ystyried trosglwyddo stoc nid yn unig i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, ar yr amod wrth gwrs fod mwyafrif y tenantiaid dan sylw'n cytuno, ond gwerthu'n uniongyrchol i denantiaid am y pris a delir gan landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig inni gynnal yr egwyddor bod tenantiaid yn cael rhwystro unrhyw newid a gynigir drwy fynnu bod angen ei gadarnhau mewn refferendwm. Yr ydym yn rhoi dewis eang o wahanol fathau o gyfryngau ar gyfer trosglwyddo'r stoc, os caiff ei drosglwyddo, gan gynnwys y patrwm cymunedol cydfuddiannol. Hyd yn hyn, araf iawn fu'r broses yn cael ei thraed dani, ond bydd ysgogiad sylweddol yn awr i'r awdurdodau hynny na allant gyflawni safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012 mewn dim un modd arall i ystyried trosglwyddo stoc.

Leanne Wood: Brif Weinidog, yn eich manifesto ar gyfer etholiad 2003, addawsoch y byddai'r holl dai cymdeithasol yn cyrraedd y safon ofynnol erbyn diwedd y degawd. A ydych yn meddwl y byddwch yn cywiro'r addewid hwnnw, ynteu a fydd rhaid i chi ymddiheuro eto?

The First Minister: I think that it is up to local authorities to state whether they can achieve the standard without stock transfer. We will then ask them to go through their asset management plans with us, so that we can see whether we agree with them, as we are deadly serious about achieving the WHQS. Everyone accepts that it is an advanced standard, as it includes certain elements that are not in the English standard. We are confident that that pressure from tenants, us and the political process will mean that local authorities will deliver on that.

Peter Black: One issue as regards improving housing standards lies in the private sector where, often, there are big concerns regarding the availability of grants, particularly the disabled facilities grant, for which there remains an 18-month waiting list on average in Wales. What additional resources are you planning to put into housing over the next few years to try to reduce that waiting time?

The First Minister: You are right to point to the long waiting list for the DFG as being an important issue; it is so crucial in reducing bedblocking in hospitals. Sometimes, work on installing ramps, grab handles, stairlifts and so on has to be done in advance of someone being discharged, so that they are ready for when the patient comes home. I declare an interest in this regard. It is important that we have recently increased the budget, as I recall, but you are right that waiting lists remain quite long. Waiting lists are not always long because of a lack of resources; sometimes, it is simply because we do not have the hit squads of really qualified tradespeople to go in and do the work quickly. That is another cause of waiting lists.

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf mai awdurdodau lleol sydd i ddweud a allant gyflawni'r safon heb drosglwyddo stoc. Yna, byddwn yn gofyn iddynt fynd drwy eu cynlluniau rheoli asedau gyda ni, er mwyn inni weld a ydym yn cytuno â hwy, gan ein bod yn hollol o ddifrif ynghylch cyflawni safon ansawdd tai Cymru. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod y safon yn uwch na'r cyffredin gan ei bod yn cynnwys rhai elfennau nad ydynt yn rhan o'r safon yn Lloegr. Yr ydym yn hyderus bod y pwysau gan denantiaid, gennym ni ac yn sgîl y broses wleidyddol yn golygu y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cyflawni hynny.

Peter Black: Un mater sy'n berthnasol i wella safonau tai yw hwnnw yn y sector preifat lle y ceir pryder mawr yn aml ynghylch y grantiau sydd ar gael, yn enwedig y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl, grant sy'n dal i fod â rhestr aros 18 mis ar ei gyfer ar gyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Pa adnoddau ychwanegol yr ydych yn bwriadu eu darparu ar gyfer tai yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf er mwyn ceisio cwtogi'r amser aros hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn iawn wrth dynnu sylw at y ffaith bod rhestr aros hir ar gyfer y GCA yn fater pwysig; mae'n hollbwysig wrth sicrhau llai o flocio gwelyau mewn ysbytai. Weithiau, rhaid gwneud gwaith gosod rampiau, dolenni gafael, lifftiau grisiau ac yn y blaen cyn i rywun gael ei ryddhau, er mwyn iddynt fod yn barod pan ddaw'r claf adref. Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant yn hyn o beth. Mae'n bwysig ein bod wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb yn ddiweddar, os cofiaf, ond yr ydych yn iawn bod y rhestrau aros yn dal i fod yn weddol hir. Nid yw'r rhestrau aros bob amser yn hir oherwydd diffyg adnoddau; weithiau, y rheswm syml yw nad oes gennym sgwadiau o grefftwy'r â'r cymwysterau uchaf sy'n gallu mynd i mewn a gwneud y gwaith yn gyflym. Dyna reswm arall dros y rhestrau aros.

Seiclo Cycling

Q2 John Griffiths: Will the First Minister make a statement on promoting and encouraging cycling in Wales?
OAQ1402(FM)

C2 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo ac annog seiclo yng Nghymru?
OAQ1402(FM)

The First Minister: The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to promoting and developing cycling. I am sure that we would all want to share our admiration for the remarkable efforts of Nicole Cook in winning a bronze medal at the Commonwealth Games, despite being on her own and facing other cyclists in teams of six. Hers was an extremely brave and inspirational effort.

We have allocated £30 million through the transport supplementary grant and Safe Routes to School, as you are probably aware, John. That money is not restricted to cycling, as it is intended to promote cycling and walking, but we are not sure yet which activity will receive the lion's share.

John Griffiths: Nicole Cook certainly sets a great example.

There is a great deal to be gained from making Wales more of a cycling nation. Cycling is important for health, for the environment, for enjoyment and for improving quality of life. In transport, a quarter of car trips are less than two miles long. It is important that we get people out of their cars and onto their bikes. There is much that can be done in leisure. For example, I would very much like to see a coastal route from the second Severn crossing to Cardiff, as I think that this would have great quality-of-life benefits for local people. Could you give me an assurance, Rhodri, that cycling will be given a high priority in the new Welsh transport strategy and regional transport plans so that this step change in developing cycling in Wales is achieved?

The First Minister: We have allocated £15 million in the transport grant to local authorities for walking and cycling schemes. I guess that the scheme that you mentioned does not go all the way along the coast because there would be a big splash when you got to the mouth of the River Usk. However, there is no doubt that there are ways around that. It is important that we recognise cycling as a leisure pursuit, as part of a healthy living agenda, and as a way of

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i hyrwyddo a datblygu seiclo. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddem oll am rannu ein hedmygedd o ymdrechion rhyfeddol Nicole Cook wrth iddi ennill medal efydd yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad, er ei bod ar ei phen ei hun a'i bod yn cystadlu â seiclwyr eraill mewn timau o chwech. Fe'n hysbrydolwyd gan ei hymdrech hynod o ddewr.

Neilltuwyd £30 miliwn drwy gyfrwng y grant atodol ar gyfer trafndiaeth a Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, John. Nid yw'r arian hwnnw wedi'i gyfyngu i seiclo, gan mai'r nod yw hyrwyddo seiclo a cherdded, ond nid ydym yn sicr eto pa weithgaredd a gaiff y gyfran fwyaf.

John Griffiths: Mae Nicole Cook yn sicr yn gosod esiampl ragorol.

Gallem fod ar ein hennill yn sylweddol o wneud Cymru'n fwy o wlad sy'n seiclo. Mae seiclo'n bwysig er mwyn ein hiechyd, er mwyn yr amgylchedd, er mwynhad ac er mwyn gwella ansawdd bywyd. Ym myd trafndiaeth, mae chwarter y teithiau a wneir mewn car yn deithiau sy'n llai na dwy filltir o hyd. Mae'n bwysig inni berswadio pobl i ddod o'u ceir a mynd ar gefn beic. Mae cymaint y gellir ei wneud ym maes hamdden. Er enghraifft, byddwn wrth fy modd o weld llwybr ar hyd y glannau o'r ail bont dros Hafren i Gaerdydd, gan y credaf y byddai hynny'n dwyn manteision gwych i bobl leol o safbwynt ansawdd eu bywyd. A allech roi sicrwydd i mi, Rhodri, y rhoddir blaenoriaeth uchel i seiclo yn strategaeth drafndiaeth newydd Cymru ac yn y cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol er mwyn inni wireddu'r newid mawr hwn o ran datblygu seiclo yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Neilltuwyd £15 miliwn yn y grant trafndiaeth i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer cynlluniau cerdded a seiclo. Yr wyf yn tybio nad yw'r cynllun y soniasoch amdano'n mynd yr holl ffordd ar hyd yr arfordir oherwydd y byddai sblash fawr pan fyddai rhywun yn cyrraedd aber Afon Wysg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr bod ffyrdd o ddatrys hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod seiclo fel gweithgaredd hamdden, fel rhan o agenda byw'n iach, ac fel ffordd o deithio i'r gwaith

getting to and from work. It is a way of encouraging people out of their cars. Walking or cycling to work is far better than jumping in your car for ludicrously short journeys. Unfortunately, we are miles behind places such as the Netherlands. The Netherlands is naturally laid out like a carpet and, therefore, encourages cycling, while Wales is the very reverse of that.

Owen John Thomas: As you said, First Minister, the benefits of cycling are significant in health terms, and they are also significant in protecting the environment. We have some excellent cycling routes in Cardiff along the Taff trail, for example. However, cycling to work along our busy roads means a perilous journey. What steps is your Government taking to make cycling safer on the roads of our towns and cities?

The First Minister: Part of the £15 million in the transport grant is intended to cover schemes that enable national and local cycle routes to cross or connect to the trunk road network safely. The same applies to the county highway network. This is extremely important because, if cars think that they rule the road, they do not take any notice of the cyclist crossing at a 90 degree angle to them. If enough cyclists were to do this, cars would start to get used to the fact that they need to slow down and respect the bike. In accidents, there is no competition between a car—a box made of metal—and a cyclist, whose body will be exposed to the metal coming towards him or her. That is not a fair competition, so cyclists must be respected by other road users, and perhaps by truck and taxi drivers in particular. However, things are not as bad as they are in London.

Laura Anne Jones: Potholed roads are potentially lethal for cyclists, yet Welsh councils do not receive enough money for road maintenance. Do you agree that it is hard for us to promote cycling when local authorities believe that the road maintenance shortfall of £151 million threatens the safety of road users?

The First Minister: All local authorities

ac adref. Mae'n ffordd o annog pobl i beidio â defnyddio'u ceir. Mae cerdded neu seiclo i'r gwaith gymaint gwell na neidio i'ch car ar gyfer taith hurt o fyr. Yn anffodus, yr ydym filltiroedd ar ei hôl hi o'n cymharu â gwledydd megis yr Iseldiroedd. Mae'r Iseldiroedd yn wlad naturiol wastad fel carped, ac felly, mae hynny'n annog pobl i seiclo, tra bo Cymru'n hollol groes i hynny.

Owen John Thomas: Fel y dywedasoch, Brif Weinidog, mae manteision seiclo'n sylweddol o safbwynt iechyd, ac mae manteision sylweddol hefyd o ran gwarchod yr amgylchedd. Mae gennym nifer o lwybrau seiclo rhagorol yng Nghaerdydd, ar hyd llwybr afon Taf, er enghraifft. Fodd bynnag, mae seiclo i'r gwaith ar hyd ein ffyrdd prysur yn berygl bywyd. Pa gamau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i wneud seiclo'n fwy diogel ar ffyrdd ein trefi a'n dinasoedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bwriedir i ran o'r £15 miliwn yn y grant trafndiaeth dalu am gynlluniau sy'n galluogi llwybrau seiclo cenedlaethol a lleol i groesi'r rhwydwaith o gefnffyrdd neu gysylltu â hwy, a hynny'n ddiogel. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y rhwydwaith o gefnffyrdd sirol. Mae hyn yn hynod o bwysig oherwydd, os bydd ceir yn meddwl mai hwy sy'n rheoli'r ffordd, ni fyddant yn rhoi dim sylw i'r seiclwr sy'n croesi ar eu traws ar ongl o 90 gradd. Petai digon o seiclwr yn gwneud hyn, byddai ceir yn dechrau arfer â'r syniad bod rhaid iddynt arafu a pharchu'r beic. Mewn damweiniau, nid oes cystadleuaeth rhwng car—blwch o fetal—a seiclwr, a'i gorff yn gwbl agored i'r metal sy'n hyrddio tuag ato neu tuag ati. Nid yw honno'n gystadleuaeth deg, felly rhaid i ddefnyddwyr eraill y ffyrdd a gyrwyr lorïau a thacsis yn anad neb o bosibl barchu seiclwr. Wedi dweud hynny, nid yw pethau cynddrwg ag y maent yn Llundain.

Laura Anne Jones: Gall tyllau yn y ffyrdd fod yn anghauol i seiclwr ond eto i gyd nid yw cynghorau Cymru'n derbyn digon o arian i gynnal eu ffyrdd. A gytunwch ei bod yn anodd inni hyrwyddo seiclo pan fydd awdurdodau lleol yn credu bod y diffyg o £151 miliwn ar gyfer cynnal ffyrdd yn bygwth diogelwch y rhai sy'n eu defnyddio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai pob awdurdod

would like more money for every purpose that they have in mind in relation to their duties. That includes road maintenance and the encouragement of cycling and walking as regards routes that are compatible and allow you to cross busy highways safely on your bike. This applies to most of the purposes of local government, and it will always want more money. However, it has to live within its means, use creative methods and do things in an efficient and green way. Most local authority transport departments in Wales will have at least a transport officer with a commitment to cycling or walking routes.

2.10 p.m.

Similarly, with regard to Safe Routes to School, you start schoolkids off and get them into the habit of cycling to school, and they never lose the habit and realise what health benefits it brings.

lleol yn falch o gael mwy o arian at bob diben sy'n rhan o'u dyletswyddau. Mae hynny'n cynnwys cynnal y ffyrdd ac annog pobl i seiclo a cherdded ar lwybrau sy'n addas ar gyfer hynny ac sy'n gadael i chi groesi cefnffyrdd prysur yn ddiogel ar eich beic. Mae hyn yn berthnasol i'r rhan fwyaf o ddibenion llywodraeth leol, a bydd bob amser yn dymuno cael rhagor o arian. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddi fyw o fewn ei modd, defnyddio dulliau creadigol a gwneud pethau mewn ffordd effeithlon a gwyrdd. Mae gan y rhan fwyaf o adrannau trafniadaeth awdurdodau lleol o leiaf un swyddog trafniadaeth sydd ag ymrwymiad i lwybrau seiclo neu gerdded.

Yn yr un modd, gyda golwg ar Lwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, os rhowch blant ysgol ar ben y ffordd a chael ganddynt fagu'r arfer o seiclo i'r ysgol, bydd yr arfer hwnnw'n bwrw gwreiddiau a byddant yn sylweddoli'r manteision i'w hiechyd yn sgîl hynny.

Cefnogaeth y Cyhoedd i Ddatganoli Pellach Public Support for More Devolution

Q3 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): What representations has the First Minister received regarding public support for more devolution? OAQ1423(FM)

The First Minister: It is not a representation to us, but the recent St David's Day poll commissioned by the BBC indicated that there is growing support among the Welsh public for a more powerful Assembly. The Government of Wales Bill provides the vehicle for delivering that four years earlier than was the recommendation of the Richard commission.

Michael German: Your announcement regarding the budget for Wales risks undermining devolution in Wales. Even Gordon Brown, who is known for his tank-like approach to these matters, announces his budget to Parliament. Yet you chose to announce how the budget consequential would be used in Wales to the Labour Party conference. Do you not think it right that the Assembly should hear those results first, from you or your Minister, in the Chamber or in the form of a statement, rather than their

C3 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaidd Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Pa sylwadau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u derbyn ynghylch cefnogaeth y cyhoedd i ddatganoli pellach? OAQ1423(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid sylwadau i ni, ond yn hytrach y pŵl diweddar a gomisiynwyd gan y BBC a awgrymodd fod cefnogaeth gynyddol ymhlith y cyhoedd yng Nghymru i Gynulliad mwy pwerus. Mae Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru'n cynnig cyfrwng ar gyfer gwireddu hynny bedair blynedd ynghynt na'r argymhelliad a gafwyd gan gomisiwn Richard.

Michael German: Mae eich cyhoeddiad ynghylch y gyllideb ar gyfer Cymru mewn perygl o danseilio datganoli yng Nghymru. Mae hyd yn oed Gordon Brown, sy'n adnabyddus am ymddwyn fel tanc mewn materion fel hyn, yn cyhoeddi ei gyllideb gerbron y Senedd. Eto i gyd, yr ydych chi'n dewis cyhoeddi sut y defnyddid symiau canlyniadol y gyllideb yng Nghymru gerbron cynhadledd y Blaid Lafur. Oni chredwch ei bod yn iawn i'r Cynulliad glywed y canlyniadau hynny yn gyntaf, gennyh chi

being broadcast and our hearing them through the media?

The First Minister: You are being a bit picky, Mike. I was careful not to give any details. Those details have been given to the Assembly in a written statement made by my colleague, Sue Essex. What I spoke about were the broad principles.

Michael German: It is quite clear from the radio, the BBC and the written reports over the weekend that we are talking about dentistry and education. The reports that came out over the weekend on education seem to be very accurate: they mirror what is in the statement.

If you add up the figures that are given in the Minister's statement, you will get a total of £16.3 million. We are supposed to have had £17 million from Gordon Brown. Where is the missing £700,000?

The First Minister: I believe that that will be a capital sum, which, I think, is referred to in Sue Essex's written statement of this morning, and on which she will make an announcement later.

I emphasise that, as far as I recall, I did not refer to money in my statement to the Labour Party conference.

Michael German: Perhaps you did not. We have no means of knowing, as most of the Labour Party conference was held in secret, I understand. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] I am only reporting to you what I read in the newspapers, which is all you can see of the Labour Party conference: they report it as they see it.

In the statement today, First Minister, you pledge to give additional money to schools to tackle underachievement. All schools have underachievers, and children who need a boost. Do you intend for this large amount of

neu gan eich Gweinidog, yn y Siambr neu ar ffurf datganiad, yn hytrach na'u bod yn cael eu darlledu a ninnau'n eu clywed drwy'r cyfryngau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn malu glo mân braidd, Mike. Bùm yn ofalus i beidio â rhoi dim manylion. Mae'r manylion hynny wedi'r rhoi i'r Cynulliad mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex. Sôn am yr egwyddorion cyffredinol a wneuthum.

Michael German: Mae'n gwbl glir oddi wrth y radio, y BBC a'r adroddiadau ysgrifenedig dros y penwythnos ein bod yn sôn am ddeintyddiaeth ac addysg. Mae'r adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd dros y penwythnos ynghylch addysg i'w gweld yn gywir iawn; maent yn adlewyrchu'r hyn sydd yn y datganiad.

Wrth adio'r ffigurau a roddwyd yn natganiad y Gweinidog, cewch gyfanswm o £16.3 miliwn. Dylem fod wedi cael £17 miliwn gan Gordon Brown. Ymhle y mae'r £700,000 sydd yn eisiau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf mai swm cyfalaf fydd hwnnw, a chredaf fod cyfeiriad ato yn natganiad ysgrifenedig Sue Essex y bore yma, datganiad y gwnaiff gyhoeddiad amdano'n ddiweddarach.

Pwysleisiaf, hyd y cofiaf, na chyfeiriais at arian yn fy natganiad i gynhadledd y Blaid Lafur.

Michael German: Efallai na wnaethoch. Nid oes dim modd inni wybod, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o gynhadledd y Blaid Lafur wedi'i chynnal y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig, yn ôl fel y caf ar ddeall. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] Dim ond dweud wrthyhych yr hyn a ddarllenaf yn y papurau yr wyf fi, sef y cyfan y caiff rhywun ei weld o gynhadledd y Blaid Lafur: mae'r adroddiadau'n adlewyrchu'r hyn a welwyd.

Yn y datganiad heddiw, Brif Weinidog, yr ydych yn addo rhoi arian ychwanegol i ysgolion er mwyn iddynt fynd i'r afael â thangyflawni. Mae gan bob ysgol blant sy'n tangyflawni, a phlant y mae angen rhoi hwb

money to go directly to all schools in Wales, and for all schools to receive a percentage of this money, or are you going to give it only to some schools?

The First Minister: To correct what you said about closed sessions at the Labour Party conference, it is obvious that you do not watch S4C. I made my speech live on television. [*Interruption.*] Well, you may say, 'Only on S4C', but it was live on television, and so I think that you ought to withdraw that remark about it being a closed session.

On your point about how this money is to be targeted and for what purpose, it will be targeted at the substantial wedge of children who leave school without qualifications, which the Welsh and, to some extent, the British education system have not been very successful at minimising. It is up to those schools with the best and brightest ideas of how to target that particular group and to reduce the number of children who leave school without qualifications. That is the biggest weakness in our education system and that is why we are targeting it.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Un agwedd bwysig ar ddatganoli yw'r ffaith bod y Cynulliad yn fforwm i'r genedl. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch tîm Cymru yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad ar ei lwyddiannau, ac a wnaiff ef longyfarch nid yn unig y sawl a enillodd fedalau—ac yr ydym yn hynod o falch o hynny—ond pob aelod o'r tîm a wnaeth gyfraniad pwysig o ran chwaraeon ac wrth godi proffil Cymru ar lwyfan y byd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs. Er gwaethaf yr anafiadau a'r salwch a effeithiodd ar rai a oedd yn ffefrynnau i ennill medalau, cyrhaeddodd y tîm ei nod o ennill bron 20 o fedalau yn y gemau. Felly, rhaid i mi ei longyfarch, er nad oedd wedi gwneud cystal â'r Alban, a oedd yn arbennig o ddisglair. Yr ydym bob amser yn defnyddio'r Alban fel rhyw fath o wialen fesur. Gwnaethom yn well na'r Alban ym Manceinion bedair blynedd yn ôl, a'r tro hwn, rhaid i ni roi clod i'r Alban, gan ei bod wedi gwneud hyd yn oed yn well

iddynt. A ydych yn bwriadu i'r swm mawr hwn o arian fynd yn uniongyrchol i goffrau pob ysgol yng Nghymru ac i bob ysgol gael canran o'r arian hwn, ynteu ai dim ond ei roi i rai ysgolion yr ydych?

Y Prif Weinidog: A chywiro'r hyn a ddywedasoeh am sesiynau caeedig yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur, mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn gwylio S4C. Rhoddais fy araith yn fyw ar y teledu. [*Torri ar draws.*] Wel, meddech, 'Dim ond ar S4C', ond yr oedd yn fyw ar y teledu, ac felly credaf y dylech dynnu'r sylw hwnnw ynghylch y sesiwn gaeedig yn ôl.

Ynghylch eich pwynt am sut y targedir yr arian hwn ac at ba ddiben, caiff ei dargedu at y nifer sylweddol o blant sy'n ymadael â'r ysgol heb gymwysterau, sefyllfa nad yw system addysg Cymru nac, i ryw raddau, system addysg Prydain, wedi llwyddo'n dda iawn i'w lliniaru. Mater ydyw i'r ysgolion hynny sydd â'r syniadau gorau a disgleiriaf ynghylch sut y mae targedu'r grŵp arbennig hwnnw a lleihau nifer y plant sy'n ymadael â'r ysgol heb gymwysterau. Hynny yw'r gwendid mwyaf yn ein system addysg a dyna pam yr ydym yn ei dargedu.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): One important aspect of devolution is the fact that the Assembly is a forum for the nation. In that context, will the First Minister join me in congratulating the Welsh team at the Commonwealth Games on its successes, and will he congratulate not only those who won medals—and we are very proud of that—but every member of the team who made an important contribution, not just in terms of sport, but in raising the profile of Wales on the world stage?

The First Minister: Of course. Despite the injuries and the illness that afflicted some of those who were favourites to win medals, the team achieved its goal of winning almost 20 medals in the games. Therefore, I must congratulate the team, although it did not do as well as Scotland, who did especially well. We always use Scotland as a kind of yardstick. We did better than Scotland in Manchester four years ago, and, this time, we have to give due credit to Scotland, as it did even better than we did.

na ni.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A ydych yn derbyn bod cyfrifoldeb arnom, fel cenedl, i longyfarch y tîm am ei gyfraniad? Onid yw'n hen bryd i ni ystyried sut y gallwn anrhydeddu cyfraniad pobl fel aelodau tîm Gemau'r Gymanwlad? Mae'r tîm yn cynrychioli Cymru, gan osod Cymru yn llwyddiannus ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol, ond nid oes gennym ffordd o ddathlu hynny, ac eithrio drwy ddweud gair fel hyn yn y Cynulliad. Onid yw'n hen bryd i ni gael system ar gyfer anrhydeddu pobl am eu cyfraniad clodwiw i'r genedl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wedi'r gemau diwethaf, ym Manceinion, pan enillodd Cymru chwe medal aur, anrhydeddwyd y tîm a'r enillwyr, a chafodd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad wahoddiad i gwrrdd â'r tîm a ddaeth o Fanceinion a thîm criced llwyddiannus Morgannwg, a oedd wedi ennill un o'r gwobrwyon criced blynyddol. Felly, yr ydym yn ceisio anrhydeddu ar lefel bersonol, gan ddweud gymaint yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r hyn y mae pobl yn ei wneud i gynrychioli Cymru ar ei gorau. A ydych am fynd ymhellach na hynny? Os felly, yr wyf yn agored i unrhyw syniadau ynglŷn â sut y gellid cael rhestr anrhydeddu, nid ar gyfer chwaraeon yn unig, ond ar gyfer meysydd eraill hefyd.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Do you accept that, as a nation, we have a responsibility to congratulate the team on its contribution? Is it not high time that we considered how to honour the contribution of people such as the members of the Commonwealth Games team? The team represents Wales, successfully putting Wales on the world stage, but we have no means of celebrating that, other than by saying a few words like this in the Assembly. Is it not high time that we had a system for honouring people for their commendable contributions to the nation?

The First Minister: Following the last games, in Manchester, when Wales won six gold medals, the team and the winners were honoured, and all Assembly Members were invited to meet the team that came down from Manchester and the successful Glamorgan cricket team, which had won one of the annual cricket titles. Therefore, we do try to honour people on a personal level, telling them how much we appreciate what they do to showcase Wales at its best. Do you want to go further than that? If so, I am open to any suggestions regarding how we could set up an honours list, not only for sport, but for other areas as well.

Newid yn yr Hinsawdd Climate Change

Q4 Glyn Davies: What steps is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to limit the impact of climate change? OAQ1421(FM)

C4 Glyn Davies: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i leihau effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd? OAQ1421(FM)

Q8 David Melding: What is the Welsh Assembly Government's policy to address the impact of climate change on Wales in the next 20 years? OAQ1430(FM)

C8 David Melding: Beth yw polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd ar Gymru dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf? OAQ1430(FM)

The First Minister: Addressing climate change is one of our key priorities. It is a central theme of the environment strategy for Wales, which will shortly be published in its final form. We are also developing a climate change adaptation plan for Wales and

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae mynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd yn flaenoriaeth allweddol gennym. Mae'n un o themâu canolog strategaeth amgylcheddol Cymru, a gyhoeddir cyn bo hir yn ei ffurf derfynol. Yr ydym hefyd yn datblygu cynllun ymaddasu

policies and programmes that contribute significantly to reducing emissions.

Glyn Davies: We all agree that climate change is one of the most important issues facing the world today, threatening billions of the world's most vulnerable people. Today, we have learned that the UK Government is likely to fail to meet its target of reducing carbon dioxide emissions 20 per cent by 2010 by a considerable margin. As a party, we have said that we are prepared to look for cross-party consensus on the issues that we need to develop to face up to this crucial issue. You will have anticipated today's announcement, as did the rest of us—we knew that it was coming—so what can you tell us about your proposals that will give some impetus to what is one of the most important issues facing us?

The First Minister: I will say two things. It is important that we recognise that carbon dioxide forms part of greenhouse gases. It is the most significant single gas among greenhouse gases, but the UK is not expected to fall short of our greenhouse gas emissions target by 2010. Secondly, that target goes much further than the Kyoto target, which has been agreed with other countries. It is a self-imposed target by the United Kingdom Government. We have already consulted on an environment strategy and, following the receipt of the consultation responses, we will publish the final version of it, and this will form a part of the strategy. Then, the climate change adaptation plan will affect farming, public and private buildings, and a whole range of actions over which we have some control. That plan will go out to consultation shortly.

David Melding: His Grace, the Archbishop of Canterbury has today warned of the magnitude of the threat facing humankind in terms of climate change. Do you agree with him that this starts by being an individual issue? We all need to modify our behaviour. As Wales's political leaders, if we were to

ar gyfer newid hinsawdd i Gymru a pholisïau a rhaglenni sydd yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at leihau gollyngiadau.

Glyn Davies: Yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno mai newid yn yr hinsawdd yw un o'r materion pwysicaf sydd yn wynebu'r byd heddiw, sy'n bygwth biliynau o bobl fwyaf bregus y byd. Heddiw, yr ydym wedi clywed bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn debygol o fethu cyrraedd ei tharged o gwtogi 20 y cant ar ollyngiadau carbon deuocsid erbyn 2010, a hynny o gryn dipyn. Fel plaid, yr ydym wedi dweud ein bod yn barod i edrych am gonsensws ar draws y pleidiau ar y materion y mae angen inni eu datblygu er mwyn wynebu'r mater allweddol hwn. Byddwch wedi rhagweld cyhoeddiad heddiw, fel y gwnaeth y gweddill ohonom—yr oeddem yn gwybod ei fod yn dod—felly beth y gallwch ei ddweud wrthym am eich cynigion a fydd yn rhoi ychydig o hwb i un o'r materion pwysicaf sydd o'n blaenau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedaf ddau beth. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod carbon deuocsid yn rhan o nwyon tŷ gwydr. Dyma'r nwy unigol mwyaf arwyddocaol ymhlith nwyon tŷ gwydr, ond ni ddisgwylir i'r Deyrnas Unedig fethu â chyrraedd ein targed o ran gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr erbyn 2010. Yn ail, mae'r targed hwnnw'n mynd yn llawer pellach na tharged Kyoto, a gytunwyd gyda gwledydd eraill. Mae'n darged y mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi'i osod iddi ei hun. Yr ydym eisoes wedi ymgynghori ynghylch strategaeth amgylcheddol ac, ar ôl cael yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghori, byddwn yn cyhoeddi'r fersiwn derfynol arni, a bydd hyn yn rhan o'r strategaeth. Wedyn, bydd y cynllun ymaddasu ar gyfer newid hinsawdd yn effeithio ar amaethyddiaeth, adeiladau cyhoeddus a phreifat, a lluo o weithgareddau y mae gennym rywfaint o reolaeth drostynt. Bydd ymgynghori ar y cynllun hwnnw cyn bo hir.

David Melding: Mae Ei Ras, Archesgob Caergaint wedi rhybuddio heddiw yngylch anferthedd y bygythiad sydd yn wynebu dynol-ryw o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd. A ydych yn cytuno ag ef fod hyn yn dechrau drwy fod yn fater i'r unigolyn? Mae angen i bob un ohonom addasu ein hymddygiad. Fel

take one or two more trips by public transport, and use our cars less frequently, we would be making those small changes that soon add up to a 10 or 20 per cent target.

The First Minister: Indeed, as is the case, I am told, with taking fewer long-distance foreign holidays and so on. On that theme, I submitted myself to working out my personal ecological footprint in terms of how many resources I use by way of my lifestyle and so on. I was pleasantly surprised to find that I was below average in my use of resources and my long-term impact on the planet, possibly because I holiday in Wales and not in Australia.

2.20 p.m.

As a father and grandfather, I know that people start to think in a different way when they have young grandchildren who will definitely be around in the year 2070, 2080 or whatever, because the world that they inherit will possibly be a world where sea levels are significantly higher than they are today and which has huge numbers of refugees in Wales and from other countries that are currently near sea level.

Mick Bates: How many other areas you will admit to being below average, First Minister? Your Government has a planning policy called technical advice note 8, which is intended to deal with the impact of climate change and develop renewable energy systems. It is currently failing in a big way, because it depends largely on massive windfarm development, particularly in mid Wales. Do you agree that the Government's money would be better invested in encouraging individuals to take action through microgeneration in their own homes?

The First Minister: I am very happy to be below average when it is a good thing and not a bad thing, but perhaps you did not spot that, Mick. As regards microgeneration, I am sure that you will welcome the provisions in

arweinwyr gwleidyddol Cymru, pe cymerem daith neu ddwy yn fwy ar gludiant cyhoeddus, a defnyddio'n ceir yn llai aml, byddem yn gwneud y newidiadau bach hynny sydd yn fuan yn cronni i gyrraedd targed 10 neu 20 y cant.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir, a'r un modd, yn ôl a ddywedir wrthyf, gyda chymryd llai o wyliau tramor mewn gwledydd pell ac yn y blaen. Ar y thema honno, fe'm cyflwynais fy hun i gael mesur fy ôl-troed ecolegol personol o ran faint o adnoddau yr wyf yn eu defnyddio yn sgil fy ffordd o fyw ac yn y blaen. Syndod pleserus imi oedd canfod fy mod yn is na'r cyfartaledd yn fy nefnydd o adnoddau a'm heffaith ar y blaned yn y tymor hir, efallai oherwydd mai yng Nghymru y treuliaf fy ngwyliau ac nid yn Awstralia.

Fel tad a thad-cu, gwn fod pobl yn dechrau meddwl mewn ffordd wahanol pan fydd ganddynt wyrion bach a fydd yma yn bendant yn y flwyddyn 2070, 2080 neu beth bynnag y bo, oherwydd y mae'n bosibl y bydd y byd a etifeddant hwy'n fyd lle y mae lefelau'r môr yn sylweddol uwch nag y maent heddiw a lle y bydd niferoedd aruthrol o ffoaduriaid yng Nghymru ac o wledydd eraill sydd ar hyn o bryd yn agos at lefel y môr.

Mick Bates: Mewn sawl maes arall y gwnewch gyfaddef eich bod yn is na'r cyfartaledd, Brif Weinidog? Mae gan eich Llywodraeth bolisi cynllunio a elwir yn nodyn cyngor technegol 8, y bwriedir iddo ddelio ag effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd a datblygu systemau ynni adnewyddadwy. Ar hyn o bryd mae'n methu'n drybeilig, am ei fod yn dibynnu i raddau helaeth ar ddatblygu ffermydd gwynt anferth, yn enwedig yn y Canolbarth. A ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n well buddsoddi arian y Llywodraeth mewn annog unigolion i weithredu drwy osod systemau microgynhyrchu yn eu cartrefi eu hunain?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn hapus iawn o fod yn is na'r cyfartaledd pan yw'n beth da ac nid yn beth drwg, ond efallai na welsoch hynny, Mick. O ran microgynhyrchu, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch groesawu'r darpariaethau

Gordon Brown's budget, from which there may be some consequentials for the Assembly, to encourage microgeneration on public buildings. If we can get schools, hospitals and other buildings in the public estate to have microgeneration, it will help to bring the costs down. At the moment, microgeneration kits are made on a small-batch or one-off basis, but, once they become mass production items, we can expect to see the cost coming down sharply.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you believe that coal extraction by opencasting could be rendered carbon neutral in Wales by the planting of trees?

The First Minister: I am not in a position to answer that. I will have to give you a considered reply, or I will ensure that Carwyn Jones does so.

yng nghyllideb Gordon Brown, a all gael rhai effeithiau canlyniadol i'r Cynulliad, i annog microgynhyrchu mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus. Os gallwn gael gan ysgolion, ysbytai ac adeiladau eraill yn yr ystâd gyhoeddus dderbyn microgynhyrchu, bydd yn helpu i ddod â'r costau i lawr. Ar hyn o bryd, gwneir pecynnau microgynhyrchu ar sail niferoedd bach, neu un ar y tro, ond wedi iddynt fynd yn eitemau masgynhyrchu, gallwn ddisgwyl gweld gostyngiad mawr yn y gost.

Jocelyn Davies: A ydych yn credu y gellid gwneud cloddio glo brig yn broses niwtral o ran carbon yng Nghymru drwy blannu coed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn gallu ateb hynny. Bydd yn rhaid imi ystyried y mater cyn rhoi ateb ichi, neu sicrhau y gwnaiff Carwyn Jones hynny.

Ymrwymadau Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Health and Social Care Commitments

Q5 Jonathan Morgan: How many of the Welsh Assembly Government's health and social care commitments have not been met? OAQ1413(FM)

The First Minister: I declare an interest as a part-time carer as per my usual practice on that issue. The commitment to provide free homecare for disabled people has been amended to provide a £76 million package of funding for disabled people's services, including categories that were not included in the original manifesto pledge.

Jonathan Morgan: You are wrong, because more than just one commitment has not been met by the Assembly Government since the Assembly was established in 1999. To remind you, the Labour manifesto in 1999 stated very clearly that by the end of the first Assembly, no-one would be waiting longer than six months for out-patient treatment. Currently, 51,320 people are waiting more than six months for out-patient treatment. You also said that a Labour Assembly Government would appoint a health supremo to break down the barriers between the NHS and social services. Those commitments were made almost seven years ago but you have not met them. Do you intend to do that?

C5 Jonathan Morgan: Sawl un o ymrwymadau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd heb eu cyflawni? OAQ1413(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant fel gofalwr rhan-amser ar y mater hwn, fel arfer. Mae'r ymrwymiad i ddarparu gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl wedi'i ddiwygio i ddarparu pecyn £76 miliwn o gyllid i wasanaethau pobl anabl, gan gynnwys categorïau nad oeddent wedi'u cynnwys yn yr addewid maniffesto gwreiddiol.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr ydych yn anghywir, oherwydd y mae mwy nag un ymrwymiad heb ei gadw gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999. I'ch atgoffa, dywedodd maniffesto Llafur yn 1999 yn glir iawn na fyddai neb, erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad cyntaf, yn aros mwy na chwe mis am driniaeth claf allanol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 51,320 o bobl yn aros ers dros chwe mis am driniaeth claf allanol. Dywedasoeh hefyd y byddai Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad yn penodi pennaeth iechyd, i chwalu'r rhagfuriau rhwng y GIG a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Gwnaethpwyd yr ymrwymadau hynny bron saith mlynedd yn ôl ond nid ydych wedi'u cyflawni. A oes

gennyh fwriad gwneud hynny?

The First Minister: I was waiting for the question. The recent delayed transfers of care figures show a very big improvement, with the transfers now running at about half the level of two years ago. In terms of the waiting lists, we are targeting those who have been waiting over 12 months, and the numbers have come down very sharply. There has been about a 90 per cent reduction in the number waiting over 12 months for out-patient treatment. If you compare the end of January last year with the end of January this year, you will see a massive reduction, to go with the 96 per cent drop in the number waiting over 12 months for in-patient treatment. There has been a massive improvement.

Jeff Cuthbert: I am sure that you will agree that the people of Wales do not need reminding of the health and social care commitments of the last Conservative Government. It was one of cuts in the training of doctors and nurses and in hospital expenditure. Do you agree that one of the finest commitments that we are making for the people of Caerphilly is the building of the new hospital at Ystrad Fawr, and that the Labour-controlled Caerphilly County Borough Council is to be congratulated on the steps that it is taking to make this a reality?

The First Minister: I presume that you are talking about planning permission, transport access and so forth. I am not sure about the details on that, but, yes, we must deliver on what I have referred to as the first twenty-first century hospital to be designed and delivered in Wales, and possibly in Britain, with a far smaller dependence on in-patient beds and double dependence on out-patient and diagnostic work. The other question that you raised was about the past, the other administrations that were there up until 1997 and the cuts in the training of medical students, nurses and all the other paramedical professions such as physiotherapists. We have put that right, but it will take time before the advantages of that flow through. The numbers coming into our medical schools are now almost double those recorded in the last year in which the

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn yn disgwyl am y cwestiwn. Mae'r ffigurau diweddar ar oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn dangos gwelliant mawr iawn, a'r trosglwyddo bellach tua hanner y lefel ddwy flynedd yn ôl. O ran y rhestrau aros, yr ydym yn targedu pobl sydd yn aros ers dros 12 mis, ac mae'r niferoedd wedi disgyn yn sylweddol iawn. Bu lleihad o ryw 90 y cant yn y nifer sy'n aros dros 12 mis am driniaeth claf allanol. Os cymharwch ddiwedd Ionawr y llynedd â diwedd Ionawr eleni, gwelwch leihad aruthrol, i gyd-fynd â'r cwmp o 96 y cant yn y nifer sydd yn aros dros 12 mis am driniaeth claf mewnol. Cafwyd gwelliant aruthrol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch nad oes angen atgoffa pobl Cymru am ymrwymadau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf ynghylch iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Ymrwymiad ydoedd i gwtogi hyfforddiant meddygon a nyrsys a gwariant mewn ysbytai. A gytunwch mai un o'r ymrwymadau gorau yr ydym yn ei wneud i bobl Caerffili yw adeiladu'r ysbyty newydd yn Ystrad Fawr, ac y dylid llongyfarch Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, sydd dan reolaeth Llafur, am y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i wireddu hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n debyg gennyf eich bod yn sôn am ganiatâd cynllunio, mynediad at drafnidiaeth ac yn y blaen. Nid wyf yn siŵr ynghylch y manylion am hynny, ond, oes, mae'n rhaid i ni lwyddo gyda'r hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddisgrifio fel yr ysbyty cyntaf i'w gynllunio a'i adeiladu ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng Nghymru, ac o bosibl ym Mhrydain, gyda llawer llai o ddibyniaeth ar welyau cleifion mewnol a dibyniaeth ddeublyg ar gleifion allanol a gwaith diagnostig. Cwestiwn am y gorffennol oedd y llall a godwyd gennyh, am y gweinyddiaethau eraill a oedd yno hyd at 1997 a'r toriadau yn hyfforddiant myfyrwr meddygol, nyrsys a'r holl broffesiynau parafeddygol eraill megis ffisiotherapyddion. Yr ydym wedi unioni hynny, ond fe gymer amser cyn i fanteision hynny ddod i'r amlwg. Mae'r niferoedd sydd yn dod i mewn i'n

Conservatives were in charge.

hysgolion meddygol bellach bron ddwy waith yn fwy na'r rhai a gofnodwyd ym mlwyddyn olaf y Ceidwadwyr wrth y llyw.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): We have already heard three commitments that the Labour Assembly Government has broken in its first, and hopefully last, seven years. Is the First Minister concerned by the rising debts of Welsh NHS trusts and can he give an undertaking that the total debt, already at about £80 million, will not reach £100 million by the end of this Assembly?

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed am dri ymrwymiad y mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi'u torri yn ei saith mlynedd cyntaf, ac olaf, gobeithio. A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn pryderu am ddyledion cynyddol ymddiriedolaethau GIG Cymru ac a all addo na wnaiff cyfanswm y ddyled, sydd tua £80 miliwn yn barod, gyrraedd £100 miliwn erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn?

The First Minister: When you read stories about financial crises in England, it is funny how opposition parties here and, to some extent, the media, try to find out why there is not a similar crisis in the Welsh health service. If we tell them that the potential overspend that we are managing—to use the word used in the NHS—is a figure of around £20 million, they say, 'That is not exciting enough; it is not a big story', so they try to cumulate the figure in such a way that is not comparable with the English figure. In England, they are trying to manage a 1 per cent potential overspend and we are trying to manage a 0.5 per cent overspend on the NHS budget, so it is a very small amount. It is about £20 million. We hope that it will be below that by the end of this week, but I cannot give you any undertakings on that.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pan ddarllenwch hanesion am argyfyngau ariannol yn Lloegr, mae'n ddigrif gweld y modd y mae'r gwrthbleidiau yma ac, i ryw raddau, y cyfryngau, yn ceisio canfod pam nad oes argyfwng tebyg yng ngwasanaeth iechyd Cymru. Os dywedwn wrthynt fod y gorwariant posibl yr ydym yn ei reoli—a defnyddio'r gair a ddefnyddir yn y GIG—yn ffigur o ryw £20 miliwn, dywedant, 'Nid yw hynny'n ddigon cyffrous; nid yw'n stori fawr', felly ceisiant Gronni'r ffigur yn y fath fodd nad yw'n gymharol â ffigur Lloegr. Yn Lloegr, maent yn ceisio rheoli gorwariant posibl o 1 y cant, ac yr ydym ni'n ceisio rheoli gorwariant o 0.5 y cant ar gyllideb y GIG, felly mae'n swm bach iawn. Tua £20 miliwn yw'r swm. Gobeithiwn y bydd yn is na hynny erbyn diwedd yr wythnos hon, ond ni allaf roi dim addewidion i chi ynghlŷn â hynny.

Nick Bourne: I am surprised that the First Minister makes so light of it. On the crisis in the health service, England does not have the dreadful waiting list position that we have. This is £20 million per year on a cumulative basis and, as anybody with a mortgage knows, if you roll forward that deficit, it will become £80 million. On that basis, it will be £100 million at the end of this Assembly. The First Minister seems content with that. Is he content with the fact that there has been no proper planning for the salary deals that have been agreed in terms of the money made available? That is one reason why we have this debt. Never mind the position in England, look at the position in Wales. Is he happy with this debt? Will he give an undertaking that he, together with the Minister for Health and Social Services, is

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn synnu bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymdrin mor ysgafn â'r mater. O ran yr argyfwng yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, nid oes gan Loegr y sefyllfa ofnadwy gyda rhestrau aros sydd gennym ni. Mae hyn yn £20 miliwn y flwyddyn ar sail gronol, ac fel y gŵyr unrhyw un sydd â morgais, os treiglwch y diffyg hwnnw, fe aiff yn £80 miliwn. Ar sail hynny, bydd yn £100 miliwn erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'r Prif Weinidog i'w weld yn fodlon ar hynny. A ydyw'n fodlon â'r ffaith na fu dim cynllunio priodol ar gyfer y cytundebau cyflog a wnaethpwyd o ran sicrhau bod yr arian ar gael? Dyna un rheswm pam mae'r ddyled hon gennym. Na hidier am y sefyllfa yn Lloegr, edrychwn ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru. A ydyw'n hapus gyda'r ddyled hon? A wnaiff roi addewid inni ei fod ef, ynghyd â'r

doing all that he can to bring the debt down?

Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yn gwneud popeth a all i ddod â'r ddyled i lawr?

The First Minister: It is interesting that you say, 'Never mind the position in England' after making a comparison between their waiting lists and ours. You obviously care about the position in England. This entire story comes out of the position in England and the desperate attempt of opposition politicians and the media to find something comparably awful in Wales. They cannot find it, so they find it by trying to produce misleading figures. The important thing is that we are trying to drive out the deficit culture. We started earlier than England in taking an extremely strong line with the systemic overspending by certain health authorities and the expectation of those health authorities that the overspend would be written off. We have taken early action on that. We are running a tough regime and, luckily, it has borne fruit, in that we are now managing a deficit of 0.5 per cent of NHS expenditure this year.

Nick Bourne: I made the comparison with England after you had made one, specifically because I thought that you were unwise to use the words 'crisis' and 'health service' in the same sentence when we have such a dreadful waiting list position.

On the debt, I do not need to make the comparison with England. I know that we have a debt that will reach £100 million if action is not taken by the end of this Assembly. That concerns me, and I am all the more worried because it does not seem to concern you. Given the financial pressures that there are because of salary settlements and what many NHS trusts, and not just those running large deficits, have said, what are you going to do to bring it down to acceptable levels?

The First Minister: Your view of a dreadful performance on waiting lists in Wales seems to be at variance with the facts. There has been a 96 per cent drop in those waiting over 12 months for in-patient treatment in Wales over the past 12 months and an almost

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod yn dweud, 'Na hidier am y sefyllfa yn Lloegr' ar ôl cymharu eu rhestrau aros hwy â'n rhai ni. Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn hidio am y sefyllfa yn Lloegr. Holl sail y stori hon yw'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr ac ymgais wyllt gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau a'r cyfryngau i ddod o hyd i rywbeth yr un mor ofnadwy yng Nghymru. Ni allant ddod o hyd iddo, felly deuant o hyd iddo drwy geisio llunio ffigurau camarweiniol. Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn ceisio diddymu diwylliant y diffyg. Dechreuasom yn gynharach na Lloegr wrth wneud safiad eithriadol o gryf ynghylch y gorwario systemataidd gan rai awdurdodau iechyd a'r disgwyl gan yr awdurdodau iechyd hynny y câi'r gorwariant ei ddileu. Yr ydym wedi gweithredu'n gynnar ar hynny. Yr ydym yn rhedeg trefn galed ac, yn ffodus, mae wedi dwyn ffrwyth, gan ein bod bellach yn rheoli diffyg o 0.5 y cant o wariant y GIG eleni.

Nick Bourne: Gwneuthum y gymhariaeth â Lloegr wedi i chi wneud un, yn benodol oherwydd fy mod yn credu eich bod yn annoeth wrth ddefnyddio'r geiriau 'argyfwng' a 'gwasanaeth iechyd' yn yr un frawddeg a ninnau mewn sefyllfa mor ofnadwy gyda rhestrau aros.

Ynglŷn â'r ddyled, nid oes angen imi wneud y gymhariaeth â Lloegr. Gwn fod gennym ddyled a fydd yn cyrraedd £100 miliwn os na weithredir erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Mae hynny'n peri pryder imi, ac yr wyf yn poeni'n fwy fyth oherwydd nad yw fel pe bai'n peri pryder i chi. O gofio'r pwysau ariannol sydd yn bodoli oherwydd cytundebau cyflogau a'r hyn y mae llawer o ymddiriedolaethau GIG wedi ei ddweud, ac nid dim ond y rhai sydd yn rhedeg diffygion mawr, beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud i ddod â'r ddyled i lawr i lefelau derbyniol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ymddangos bod eich syniad chi o berfformiad ofnadwy o ran rhestrau aros yng Nghymru yn mynd yn groes i'r ffeithiau. Bu cwmp o 96 y cant yn y rhai sydd yn aros dros 12 mis am driniaeth claf mewnol yng Nghymru dros y 12 mis

comparable drop in the numbers waiting over 12 months for out-patient consultations. Brian Gibbons and I take the issue seriously. We are driving out the deficit culture. It is because we started to drive out the deficit culture earlier than England that we are only dealing with a deficit of 0.5 per cent. Is that good enough? No, it ought to be zero.

Jenny Randerson: One broken promise is on the issue of NHS dentistry. In 1997, Tony Blair said that everyone would have access to an NHS dentist. I notice from her statement, that your Finance Minister now specifically refers to a commitment to bringing patient access levels up to at least 40 per cent. Can you explain how your Government's sights have sunk so low?

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: I think that you will find that you are misquoting Tony Blair's 1997 commitment as regards NHS Direct. In terms of trying to ensure that there is no part of Wales where access is below 40 per cent, by and large, something like 46 or 47 per cent of the total population of Wales are with NHS dentists who are willing to take on new patients and have NHS patients on the books. It is far higher than that in areas such as Cardiff and Swansea, but, unfortunately, it is much lower than that in rural parts of Wales. Therefore, this is about ensuring that the money that the Finance Minister committed this morning will enable the spread of personal dental services to areas where they are currently quite weak.

Helen Mary Jones: Jenny Randerson is not misquoting Tony Blair. I have the information here. In 1999, he said that

'everyone within the next two years will be able once again to see an NHS dentist just by phoning NHS Direct'.

You and I know, as does everyone else in the Chamber, that they cannot do that. Is it the fact that the Prime Minister has put you in yet another embarrassing position by breaking

diwethaf a bron cymaint o ostyngiad yn y niferoedd sydd yn aros dros 12 mis am ymgynoriadau cleifion allanol. Mae Brian Gibbons a mi'n cymryd y mater o ddifrif. Yr ydym yn diddymu diwylliant y diffyg. Oherwydd inni ddechrau diddymu diwylliant y diffyg yn gynt na Lloegr yr ydym yn delio â diffyg sydd yn ddim ond 0.5 y cant. A ydyw hynny'n ddigon da? Na, dylai fod yn ddim.

Jenny Randerson: Mae un addewid a dorwyd yn ymwneud â chwestiwn deintyddiaeth y GIG. Yn 1997, dywedodd Tony Blair y byddai pawb yn cael mynediad at ddeintydd dan y GIG. Yn ôl ei datganiad, sylwaf fod eich Gweinidog Cyllid bellach yn cyfeirio'n benodol at godi lefelau mynediad cleifion i 40 y cant o leiaf. A allwch esbonio pam y mae nod eich Llywodraeth wedi mynd mor isel?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf y gwelwch eich bod yn camddyfnnu addewid Tony Blair yn 1997 ynghylch NHS Direct. O ran ceisio sicrhau nad oes dim un rhan o Gymru lle y mae mynediad yn is na 40 y cant, at ei gilydd, mae tua 46 neu 47 y cant o gyfanswm poblogaeth Cymru wedi cofrestru gyda deintyddion y GIG sy'n barod i gymryd cleifion newydd a derbyn cleifion y GIG ar eu llyfrau. Mae'r ffigur yn llawer uwch na hynny mewn ardaloedd megis Caerdydd ac Abertawe, ond yn anffodus, mae'n llawer is yn ardaloedd cefn gwlad Cymru. Felly, yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei sicrhau yw bod yr arian a addawyd y bore yma gan y Gweinidog Cyllid yn lledaenu darpariaeth gwasanaethau deintyddol personol i ardaloedd lle y mae'n brin ar hyn o bryd.

Helen Mary Jones: Nid yw Jenny Randerson yn camddyfnnu Tony Blair. Mae'r wybodaeth gennyf o'm blaen yn y fan hon. Yn 1999, dywedodd

bydd pawb o fewn y ddwy flynedd nesaf unwaith eto'n gallu gweld deintydd y GIG drwy godi'r ffôn a ffonio NHS Direct.

Gwyddoch chi fel finnau, a phawb arall yn y Siambr, nad yw hynny'n wir. Ai oherwydd bod y Prif Weinidog wedi'ch rhoi mewn sefyllfa chwithig arall, drwy dorri

promises that makes you so keen to see Gordon Brown take his place?

The First Minister: None of that is the case. Your words were quite different to those used by Jenny Randerson, as you will see from the Record. What is important is that we are turning the dentistry situation around dramatically through the PDS lead-in contract. The latest figures that I saw, from around a week ago, were that around 900,000 people in Wales are now registered with an NHS dentist on the new PDS contract. Of those, 700,000 are carry-on patients who have transferred over, and around 200,000 are additional patients who have either registered with an NHS dentist for the first time or registered with a new NHS dentist who was not previously providing that service. That is not far off one third of the population of Wales. Given that a new system has come in, that is an impressive turnaround from where we were seven or eight months ago.

addewidion, yr ydych mor awyddus i weld Gordon Brown yn cymryd ei le?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Mae eich geiriau yn wahanol iawn i eiriau Jenny Randerson, fel y gwelwch wrth edrych ar y Cofnod. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn gwella sefyllfa deintyddiaeth yn sylweddol drwy'r contract cyflwyno PDS. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf a welais, gwta wythnos yn ôl, yn dangos bod tua 900,000 o bobl yng Nghymru bellach wedi cofrestru gydag un o ddeintyddion y GIG ar y contract PDS newydd. O'r rheini, mae 700,000 yn gleifion blaenorol sydd wedi trosglwyddo, ac mae tua 200,000 yn gleifion ychwanegol sydd naill ai wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG am y tro cyntaf neu wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd GIG newydd nad oedd yn darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn o'r blaen. Ffigur sydd ychydig dan draean poblogaeth Cymru. Gan gofio bod system newydd wedi'i chyflwyno'n ddiweddar, mae hynny'n drawsnewidiad syfrdanol o'r sefyllfa saith neu wyth mis yn ôl.

Datblygu Gwledig yng Ngheredigion Rural Development in Ceredigion

C6 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu gwledig yng Ngheredigion? OAQ1407(FM)

Q6 Elin Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on rural development in Ceredigion? OAQ1407(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Ceredigion wedi gallu manteisio ar fesurau a ddarparwyd o dan gynllun datblygu gwledig Cymru. Bydd hyn yn wir hefyd yn achos y cynllun nesaf, a fydd yn weithredol rhwng 2007 a 2013. Bydd arian wedi ei glustnodi o'r gyllideb gydgyfeirio, neu fersiwn dau Amcan 1, ar gael o dan y cynllun sy'n olynu cynllun datblygu gwledig gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd.

The First Minister: Ceredigion has been able to access measures provided under the current rural development plan for Wales. This will remain the case for the successor plan, covering 2007-13. Ring-fenced funding from the convergence funding, or version two of Objective 1, will be available under the successor rural development plan for west Wales and the Valleys.

Elin Jones: Mae holl ddatganiadau eich Llywodraeth yn nodi eich bod am weld ardaloedd gwledig hyfyw a llwyddiannus. Un o'r ffactorau ar gyfer sicrhau cymdeithas hyfyw yw gwasanaeth iechyd sy'n ddigonol, yn ddiogel ac o fewn cyrraedd. Pa obaith sydd gan Geredigion os mai unig fwriad y GIG, yn ôl y ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd heddiw ar y gorllewin, yw lleihau'r gwasanaethau yng Ngheredigion a'u pellhau o'r ardal? Mae hyn yn cynnwys y gwasanaethau mwyaf

Elin Jones: All your Government's statements note that you want to see more viable and prosperous rural areas. One of the factors for ensuring a viable society is an NHS that is adequate, safe and accessible. What hope is there for Ceredigion if the NHS's only intention, according to its document on west Wales that was published today, is to reduce the services in Ceredigion and distance them from the area? This includes the most fundamental services, such

elfennol, megis gwasanaethau mamolaeth a phlant Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bronglais. Efallai mai'r hyn yr hoffech ei weld, Brif Weinidog, yw holl boblogaeth ardal fel Ceredigion yn symud i fyw o fewn milltir sgwâr yr M4.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf eich bod chi hyd yn oed yn credu eich gosodiad olaf. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn darllen a cheisio dysgu beth yw'r egwyddorion y tu ôl i'r ddogfen ymgynghorol a gyhoeddwyd gan Alison Williams a'i thîm, a fu'n llunio'r cynllun hwn yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf neu fwy. Rhaid i ni geisio deall beth yw'r dewisiadau. Ceir arbenigwyr sydd am arbenigo'n gulach—ni fydd gennym lawfeddygon orthopaedig yn y dyfodol; yn hytrach, bydd gennym lawfeddygon orthopaedig sy'n arbenigo mewn rhan o'r corff, megis ysgwyddau, traed neu bengliniau. Nid llawfeddygon orthopaedig yn yr hen steil yw'r rhain. Felly, er mwyn cael arbenigwyr o'r fath, rhaid i chi gael y màs critigol o gleifion iddynt eu trin. Fodd bynnag, mae ffactorau eraill yn ymddangos wedyn, sef y pellter rhwng y claf a'r ysbyty. Dyna'r ffactorau sy'n rhaid eu hystyried er mwyn penderfynu pa fath o wasanaeth iechyd yr ydym am ei gael mewn ardaloedd fel Dyfed a Cheredigion yn y dyfodol.

Lisa Francis: Technical advice note 8 has never recognised the importance of tourism, which is worth £2.5 billion per annum to the Welsh economy. It takes control away from local people and centralises power in the Government's hands. The people of Mydroilyn, Llanarth and Talgarreg are concerned that Ceredigion County Council is listening more to lobbying firms than to its local electorate. If a local authority rejects an application for a windfarm, the developers are then likely to appeal to the Assembly, and this can lead to the original decisions of local authorities being overturned and costs being awarded against the planning authority. I know that you think that local democracy is very important—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I would like to hear a question. We are in sensitive territory when discussing a quasi-judicial function of Ministers and the planning decision committee that we have just elected on matters of planning appeals.

as maternity and children services at Bronglais General Hospital. What you want to see, perhaps, First Minister, is the whole population of an area such as Ceredigion moving to live within a mile of the M4.

The First Minister: I do not think that even you believe that last statement. What is important is that we read and try to learn about the principles that lie behind this consultation document published by Alison Williams and her team, who have been drawing up this plan over the last six months or more. We must try to understand what the choices are. We have specialists who wish to specialise more narrowly—we will not have orthopaedic surgeons in future; instead, we will have orthopaedic surgeons who specialise in parts of the body, such as shoulders, feet or knees. These are not old-style orthopaedic surgeons. Therefore, in order to have that type of specialists, you have to have the critical mass of patients for them to treat. However, other factors then come in, namely the distance between the patients and the hospital. Those factors must be considered when trying to decide what type of health service we want in areas such as Dyfed and Ceredigion in the future.

Lisa Francis: Nid yw nodyn cyngor technegol 8 erioed wedi cydnabod pwysigrwydd twristiaeth, sydd yn werth £2.5 biliwn y flwyddyn i economi Cymru. Mae'n dwyn rheolaeth oddi ar bobl leol ac yn canoli'r pŵer yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth. Mae trigolion Mydroilyn, Llanarth a Thalgareg yn gofidio'n arw fod Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn gwrando mwy ar gwmmnïau lobïo na'r etholwyr lleol. Os yw awdurdod lleol yn gwrthod cais am fferm wynt, yna mae'r datblygwyr yn debygol o gyflwyno apêl i'r Cynulliad. Gall hyn arwain at wrthdroi penderfyniadau gwreiddiol awdurdodau lleol ac mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdod cynllunio dalu'r costau. Yr wyf yn gwybod eich bod o'r farn bod democratiaeth leol yn bwysig iawn—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hoffwn glywed cwestiwn. Yr ydym ar dir sensitif iawn wrth drafod swyddogaeth led-farnwrol Gweinidogion a'r pwyllgor penderfyniadau cynllunio yr ydym newydd ei ethol ar faterion yn ymwneud ag apeliadau cynllunio.

Lisa Francis: In the interests of local democracy, how can you guarantee that the Rhos Garn development will remain at 10 turbines instead of 40 plus, and that the will of the local electorate will be observed in this matter?

Lisa Francis: Er mwyn democratiaeth leol, sut y gallwch warantu na fydd datblygiad Rhos Garn yn tyfu o 10 tyrbîn i dros 40, ac y gwrandewir ar farn etholwyr lleol yn hyn o beth?

The Presiding Officer: Order. I cannot accept that this is an appropriate use of Assembly time. You are seeking to question the quasi-judicial role of our planning decision committee, should an appeal take place. I warn you that these are difficult territories. I cannot wait to see this part of the Government of Wales Act 1998 repealed.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni allaf dderbyn bod hyn yn ddefnydd priodol o amser y Cynulliad. Yr ydych yn ceisio cwestiynu swyddogaeth led-farnwrol ein pwyllgor penderfyniadau cynllunio, pe bai apêl yn codi. Yr wyf yn eich rhybuddio eich bod ar dir peryglus iawn. Yr wyf yn dyheu am weld y rhan hon o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn cael ei diddymu.

Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7, OAQ1425(FM), yn ôl.

Question 7, OAQ1425(FM), has been withdrawn.

Pwysigrwydd Syniadau Amgylcheddol Newydd The Importance of Environmental Innovations

Q9 Gwenda Thomas: Will the First Minister comment on the importance of environmental innovations? OAQ1422(FM)

C9 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gyflwyno sylwadau am bwysigrwydd syniadau amgylcheddol newydd? OAQ1422(FM)

The First Minister: Innovation is fundamental to moving towards a low-carbon economy and to stimulate opportunities for economic growth in new areas. It will put Wales at the forefront of clean energy production and is widely reflected in our strategic documents, including the energy route map.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae arloesi'n hanfodol ar gyfer symud tuag at economi carbon isel ac i ysgogi cyfleoedd ar gyfer twf economaidd mewn ardaloedd newydd. Bydd hyn yn rhoi Cymru ar flaen y gad o ran cynhyrchu ynni glân ac fe adlewyrchir hyn yn eang yn ein dogfennau strategol, gan gynnwys y map llwybr ynni.

Gwenda Thomas: Would the First Minister join me in congratulating all those involved in the £1.1 million project to create a new community and education resource room at Aberdulais Falls in my constituency? The architect-designed building will open in August and will be a showpiece of environmental innovation. Funding has been provided by Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, the Wales European Funding Office Objective 1 programme funds, and by the friends of Aberdulais Falls. I am sure, First Minister, that you will be happy to visit it once it has been opened.

Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch pawb a fu ynghlwm â'r prosiect £1.1 miliwn i greu ystafell adnoddau addysg a chymunedol yn Rhaeadrau Aberdulais yn fy etholaeth? Bydd yr adeilad a ddyluniwyd gan bensaer yn agor ym mis Awst ac fe fydd yn enghraifft wych o arloesi amgylcheddol. Darparwyd cyllid gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, cyllid rhaglen Amcan 1 Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru a ffrindiau Rhaeadrau Aberdulais. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Brif Weinidog, y byddwch yn barod iawn i ymweld â'r adeilad pan fydd wedi agor.

The First Minister: I will, because a small-scale hydroelectric project, which has a fish

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, oherwydd bydd prosiect hydro-electrig bach, gyda

pass, and which has explanatory models to enable young people to understand exactly how small-scale hydro works, will undoubtedly add to the many tourist attractions of the beautiful vale of Neath.

David Lloyd: First Minister, what thoughts do you have on automotive energy? That is, harnessing the slipstream energy created by motor vehicles using small wind turbines on the central reservations of motorways.

The First Minister: That is a new one on me, Dai. I will look into it. I have never stood in a motorway reservation for long enough to be able to benefit from the slipstream effect. If there is a potential for capturing the energy and making it useful and economic, I am sure that we will look into it, and I will ensure that you get a reply.

llwybr i bysgod a modelau esboniadol i alluogi pobl ifanc i ddeall sut yn union y mae system hydro fach yn gweithio, yn ddi-os yn gaffaeliad arall at y llu o atyniadau i ymwelwyr yng nghwm Nedd sydd mor brydferth.

David Lloyd: Brif Weinidog, beth yw eich barn am ynni moduro? Hynny yw, harneisio ynni sgilwynt a grëir gan gerbydau modur drwy ddefnyddio tyrbinau gwynt bach yn y llain ganol ar draffyrdd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n rhywbeth newydd i mi, Dai. Ymchwiliad i'r syniad. Nid wyf erioed wedi sefyll yn ddigon hir ar lain ganol traffordd i allu manteisio ar effaith y sgilwynt. Os oes potensial i ffrwyno'r ynni a'i ddefnyddio er budd economaidd, yna fe ymchwiliwn i'r mater. Fe wnaaf yn sicr y cewch ateb i'ch cwestiwn.

Y Mudiad Cydweithredol The Co-operative Movement

Q10 Christine Chapman: How is the Welsh Assembly Government working towards the goals of the co-operative movement? OAQ1434(FM)

The First Minister: It forms part of our wider agenda to develop a sustainable social economy. We are working in partnership with the Wales Co-operative Centre—of which I was a founder director, but I do not have to declare an interest, because it is a long time since I ceased to be a director of it—on a number of issues, including the delivery of our social enterprise strategy.

Christine Chapman: As you reminded us, First Minister, the Co-operative Party and the Labour Party recently celebrated 100 years of partnership and shared goals and objectives, such as social inclusion and a belief that we achieve more when we work in partnership than in isolation. One of the major themes promoted by the co-operative movement is the campaign to establish fairer global-trade practices. This received considerable attention during fair-trade fortnight recently. What progress is the Welsh Assembly Government making on developing Wales as a fair-trade country?

C10 Christine Chapman: Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gweithio tuag at nodau'r mudiad cydweithredol? OAQ1434(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae datblygu economi gymdeithasol gynaliadwy yn rhan o'n agenda ehangach. Yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â Chanolfan Cydweithredol Cymru—yr oeddwn yn un o'r cyfarwyddwyr sefydlu, ond nid oes raid i mi ddatgan buddiant, oherwydd y mae cryn amser wedi mynd heibio ers pan rois y gorau i fod yn gyfarwyddwr—ar sawl mater, gan gynnwys gwireddu ein strategaeth menter gymdeithasol.

Christine Chapman: Fel y gwnaethoch ein hatgoffa, Brif Weinidog, yn ddiweddar bu'r Blaid Gydweithredol a'r Blaid Lafur yn dathlu 100 mlynedd o weithio mewn partneriaeth ar nodau ac amcanion cytûn, megis cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a'r gred ein bod yn cyflawni mwy drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth nag ar wahân. Un o'r prif themâu y mae'r mudiad cydweithredol yn ei hybu yw ymgyrchu i sefydlu arferion tecach o ran masnachu byd-eang. Cafodd hyn gryn sylw yn ystod pythefnos masnach deg yn ddiweddar. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i ddatblygu

Cymru i fod yn wlad masnach deg?

The First Minister: I think that 15 local authority areas or parts of local authorities have fair-trade town, city or borough status, which is a pretty healthy proportion of Wales. There are many local initiatives working towards obtaining fair-trade status for the whole of Wales and all of its local authorities. We would promote that strongly. Other areas in which the co-operative principle is established is the community-mutual model, and the additional Welsh variant, which local authorities can opt for under stock transfer. As you are the representative of the Cynon Valley, I could not let this subject pass without referring to Tower Colliery, which, under the co-operative model, will probably be the first coal mine in Welsh history to work out all of its coal reserves.

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf fod 15 ardal awdurdod lleol neu rannau o awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi derbyn statws tref, dinas neu fwrdeistref masnach deg, sy'n gyfran dda iawn o Gymru. Ceir llawer o gynlluniau lleol sy'n gweithio tuag at ddenu statws masnach deg ar gyfer Cymru gyfan a'r holl awdurdodau lleol. Byddwn yn hybu hynny'n gryf. Mae'r egwyddor gydweithredol wedi'i phlannu mewn meysydd eraill megis y model cymunedol-cydfuddiannol, a'r amrywiol ychwanegol yng Nghymru, y gall awdurdodau lleol ei ddewis dan y drefn trosglwyddo stoc. Gan mai chi yw cynrychiolydd Cwm Cynon, ni allaf symud ymlaen heb gyfeirio at Bwll Glo'r Tŵr, sy'n fodel cydweithredol, sef, yn ôl pob tebyg, y pwll glo cyntaf yn hanes Cymru i weithio'r holl lo sydd yn y pwll.

Datblygu Economaidd Economic Development

Q11 Janet Davies: First Minister, what recent discussions have you had with UK Ministers regarding the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for economic development? OAQ1415(FM)

C11 Janet Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion y DU ynghylch blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd? OAQ1415(FM)

The First Minister: We have regular discussions with UK Ministers on a range of issues, including our priorities on economic development. It was that partnership and co-operative working with UK Government Ministers that was so successful in getting a renewal of Objective 1 for seven years, starting on 1 January 2007.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion y DU ar amrywiol faterion, gan gynnwys ein blaenoriaethau o ran datblygu economaidd. Dyma'r cydweithio a'r gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU a fu mor llwyddiannus wrth adnewyddu Amcan 1 am saith mlynedd arall a fydd yn dechrau ar 1 Ionawr 2007.

2.40 p.m.

Janet Davies: I am glad that you referred to that because I was wondering how you would carry these priorities forward using the new convergence fund from 2007 to meet the Lisbon agenda in the Valleys of South Wales West.

Janet Davies: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at hynny, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn pendroni sut yr ydych yn bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â'r blaenoriaethau hyn gan ddefnyddio'r gronfa gydgyfeirio newydd o 2007 ymlaen er mwyn bodloni agenda Lisbon yng Nghymoedd Gorllewin De Cymru.

The First Minister: Throughout the area of west Wales and the Valleys—you cannot always be specific about which valley or which part—you need to carry forward the

Y Prif Weinidog: Ledled ardal y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd—ni allwch gyfeirio'n benodol at un ardal neu gwm bob tro—rhaid i chi fwrw ymlaen â'r amcanion strategol sydd

strategic objectives that we have because that is the best way to implement Objective 1 in a way that transforms the economy of Wales. I made reference to that in my speech, which perhaps you did not hear, live on television on Saturday morning. I referred particularly to something in Swansea, namely the Institute of Advanced Telecommunications in conjunction with Motorola. That is not in the Valleys of South Wales West, but it will serve those valleys, being so close to them, by stimulating private-sector spin-offs, which may well be in the Valleys provided that you can break the stranglehold of the Oxford/Cambridge M25 belt in terms of world-class research and development in the UK. The £80 million worth Institute of Life Science and Institute of Advanced Telecommunications in Swansea will have private-sector spin-offs, which can go into the Valleys.

Alun Cairns: Do you agree that enterprise agencies are exceptionally important in terms of helping the Welsh Assembly Government achieve its economic targets, particularly in relation to business start-ups and other fast-growth programmes across the range of support that enterprise agencies give? If that is the case, why are budgets for enterprise agencies being slashed? Why are they in a position where they now have to lay off staff, who were told the news just days before the new contracts came into being? These are the organisations that are closest to hand in some of the most deprived communities, but their budgets are being slashed in the same week that the Welsh Development Agency is being centralised. You are also centralising the functions here into the civil service. What sort of confidence does that give—

The Presiding Officer: Order. One question at a time, please. First Minister, you are not required to answer all three questions; just answer two.

The First Minister: I am trying to ignore the jumping-up-and-down part of Alun's question, or should I say presentation? The issue here, Alun, is that you have to accept that the business world thinks that there is too much duplication of agencies involved in

gennym oherwydd mai dyma'r ffordd orau o weithredu Amcan 1 er mwyn trawsnewid economi Cymru. Cyfeiriais at hynny yn fy araith fyw ar y teledu fore Sadwrn, ond efallai nas clywsoch. Cyfeiriais yn benodol at rywbeth yn Abertawe, sef y Sefydliad Telegyfathrebu Uwch ar y cyd â Motorola. Efallai nad yw hynny yng Nghymoedd Gorllewin De Cymru, ond bydd yn gwasanaethu'r cymoedd hynny, gan ei fod mor agos atynt, gan esgor ar sgîl-fanteision yn y sector preifat. Nid oes rheswm pam na all y rhain fod yn y Cymoedd os gallwch lacio gafael coridor yr M25, rhwng Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt, o ran ymchwil a datblygu o safon fyd-eang yn y DU. Bydd y Sefydliad Gwyddor Bywyd a'r Sefydliad Telegyfathrebu Uwch, sy'n werth £80 miliwn, yn esgor ar sgîl-fanteision yn y sector preifat a all ledu i'r Cymoedd.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn cytuno bod asiantaethau menter yn hynod bwysig o ran helpu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflawni ei thargedau economaidd, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â dechrau busnesau a rhaglenni twf cyflym eraill sy'n rhan o'r pecyn eang o gymorth y mae asiantaethau menter yn ei gynnig? Os yw hynny'n wir, pam mae'r cyllidebau ar gyfer asiantaethau menter yn cael eu torri? Pam maent bellach yn gorfod diswyddo staff, a gafodd wybod am hynny ychydig ddyddiau cyn i'r contractau newydd ddod i rym? Y rhain yw'r cyrff sy'n gweithio ar lawr gwlad mewn rhai o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, ond mae eu cyllidebau'n cael eu torri yn ystod yr union wythnos y mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n cael ei ganoli. Yr ydych yn canoli'r swyddogaethau yma yn y gwasanaeth sifil hefyd. Pa fath o hyder y mae hynny'n ei roi—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Un cwestiwn ar y tro, os gwelwch yn dda. Brif Weinidog, nid oes disgwyl i chi ateb y tri chwestiwn; dim ond dau ohonynt.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ceisio anwybyddu'r neidio i fyny ac i lawr a oedd yn rhan o'r cwestiwn, neu efallai y dylem ddweud cyflwyniad, gan Alun. Y mater dan sylw yma, Alun, yw bod yn rhaid i chi dderbyn bod y byd busnes o'r farn bod

encouraging start-ups or in trying to ensure that companies which have not long started up survive and grow. There are too many agencies falling over each other. That is the overwhelming view of business out there. So, rationalisation in that area is perfectly proper both from the point of view of sensible expenditure of public money, and, above all, from the point of view of the customer. They need to know that one agency is providing an assistance scheme to encourage the birth, survival and growth of small and medium-sized enterprises.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Do you agree that, to make a success of economic development, we need a workforce that feels valued? I am amazed that you are not prepared to make a statement today on the pension rights of public-sector workers, who feel betrayed by the Labour Government over the future of their pension position. Do you not recognise that you speak in the Assembly as the First Minister for Wales and that people have a right to expect you to give your view on this matter? Will you make it clear today that you support the public-sector workers in demanding that their pension rights are protected and in ensuring that you will personally intervene to ensure that that will happen?

The First Minister: I have already made a statement on this when I was asked a question on it in this morning's press briefing. Plaid Cymru always produces these penny-in-the-slot polemics; in other words, if there is an industrial relations dispute, particularly in the public sector, there is only one side to be on and automatically, without thinking about it, no matter how much the cost, Plaid Cymru immediately says that it must be met in full now. They do not have to meet the cost of it, so they have the luxury of saying, 'Fine, find £20 billion for this and £10 billion for that. Do not worry about it because we do not have to meet the bill'. That is the irresponsibility of opposition. That is your privilege, but unfortunately it is not ours.

On the local government pension scheme, I never intervene in industrial relations episodes. I said this morning that there is a difference between a funded pension scheme,

gormod o ddyblygu gwaith asiantaethau sy'n ceisio annog busnesau newydd neu'n ceisio sicrhau bod busnesau sydd wedi ennill eu plwyf yn goroesi ac yn tyfu. Mae'r asiantaethau'n mynd dan draed ei gilydd. Dyna farn bendant y byd busnes. Felly, mae rhesymoli yn y maes hwn yn briodol iawn o safbwynt gwario arian cyhoeddus mewn modd call, ac yn anad dim, o safbwynt y cwsmer. Mae angen iddynt fod yn gwybod mai mai un asiantaeth sy'n darparu cynllun cymorth er mwyn annog creu mentrau bach a chanolog a pheri iddynt oroesi a thyfu.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: A ydych yn cytuno bod angen gweithlu sy'n cael ei werthfawrogi er mwyn i ddatblygu economaidd lwyddo? Yr wyf yn synnu nad oeddech yn barod i wneud datganiad heddiw am hawliau pensiwn gweithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus, sy'n teimlo bod y Llywodraeth Lafur wedi'u bradychu o ran eu sefyllfa ynglŷn â phensiwn i'r dyfodol. Onid ydych yn sylweddoli eich bod yn siarad yn y Cynulliad fel Prif Weinidog Cymru a bod gan y bobl hawl i ddisgwyl clywed eich barn ar y mater hwn? A wnewch ddatgan yn glir heddiw eich bod yn cefnogi gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus sy'n mynnu bod eu hawliau pensiwn yn cael eu gwarchod ac y byddwch yn camu i mewn yn bersonol i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud datganiad am y mater hwn pan ofynnwyd cwestiwn i mi yn ystod briffio'r wasg y bore yma. Mae Plaid Cymru bob tro'n cyflwyno dadleuon o'r fath; hynny yw, os oes anghydfod diwydiannol, yn enwedig yn y sector cyhoeddus, dim ond un ochr sydd i'r geiniog. Mae Plaid Cymru'n awtomatig, heb feddwl dim, ni waeth beth fo'r gost, yn datgan bob tro fod rhaid rhoi'r hyn y gofynnir amdano yn gyfan gwbl yn awr. Nid oes rhaid iddynt hwy dalu costau hyn, felly digon hawdd iddynt ddweud, 'Iawn, dewch o hyd i £20 biliwn ar gyfer hyn a £10 biliwn ar gyfer y llall. Peidiwch â phoeni oherwydd nid nyni fydd yn talu'r bil.' Dyna agwedd anghyfrifol y gwrthbleidiau. Dyna'ch braint chi, ond yn anffodus nid yw hynny'n opsiwn i ni.

O ran cynllun pensiwn llywodraeth leol, ni fyddaf byth yn ymyrryd yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd ym maes cysylltiadau diwydiannol. Dywedais y bore yma fod gwahaniaeth

such as local government's scheme, and unfunded pension schemes like those of the civil service, police, firefighters and teachers. We need to be aware of that. I hope that this one-day strike leads to a settlement. It does not involve us or the Government, except as regulators. It is a matter between local government, as employers, and local government unions, as representatives of the workforce. Whenever you get such a dispute, in the end it has to be settled. I hope that it is settled sooner rather than later.

A lot of tactics like that from you might mean that it is settled later rather than sooner, which means that more people will not have their bins emptied. In terms of schools not staying open, I think that that would also be regrettable.

rhwng cynllun pensiwn a ariennir, megis cynllun pensiwn llywodraeth leol, a chynlluniau pensiwn nas ariennir megis y rhai sydd gan y gwasanaeth sifil, yr heddlu, diffoddwyr tân ac athrawon. Rhaid bod yn ymwybodol o hynny. Gobeithio y bydd y streic undydd hon yn arwain at setliad. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim byd â ni nac â'r Llywodraeth, dim ond fel rheolyddion. Mae'n fater rhwng llywodraeth leol, fel cyflogwyr, ac undebau llywodraeth leol, fel cynrychiolwyr y gweithlu. Pan fo anghydfod o'r fath yn codi, rhaid ei ddatrys yn y pen draw. Gobeithio y bydd yn cael ei setlo yn fuan.

Gallai llawer o dactegau o'r fath gennych olygu mai ymhen hir a hwyr y caiff ei setlo, sy'n golygu y bydd mwy o bobl â'u biniau heb eu gwagio. O ran ysgolion nad ydynt yn aros ar agor, credaf y byddai hynny hefyd yn anffodus.

Gwella Bywydau Plant Anabl Improving the Lives of Disabled Children

Q12 Laura Anne Jones: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to improve the lives of disabled children in Wales? OAQ1405(FM)

The First Minister: The key thing is that we have adopted the so-called social model of disability, not the health-related model of disability, in developing our policies and priorities. That is underpinned by the Children First programme, the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services, the special educational needs code of practice, and the learning disability strategy.

Laura Anne Jones: Do you agree that it is a crying shame that in twenty-first century Wales a special school in my constituency has had to rely on a charity's donation to ensure the education of the children? The charity presented the school with a trampoline and a minibus, which, given the location of the school, has helped the children to access special educational lessons, horse-riding and so on. How are you working with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure that children

C12 Laura Anne Jones: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i wella bywydau plant anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ1405(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y prif beth yw ein bod wedi mabwysiadu'r model cymdeithasol o anabledd, fel y'i gelwir, nid y model o anabledd sy'n gysylltiedig ag iechyd, wrth ddatblygu ein polisiau a'n blaenoriaethau. Ategir hynny gan y rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf, y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, y cod ymarfer anghenion addysgol arbennig, a'r strategaeth anabledd dysgu.

Laura Anne Jones: A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn drueni mawr yng Nghymru'r unfed ganrif ar hugain fod ysgol arbennig yn fy etholaeth wedi gorfod dibynnu ar rodd gan elusen i sicrhau addysg y plant? Cyflwynodd yr elusen fws mini a thrampolîn i'r ysgol sydd, o wybod am leoliad yr ysgol, wedi helpu'r plant i gael mynediad at wersi addysgol arbennig, marchogaeth ac yn y blaen. Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau bod plant yn cael y cyfleusterau hyn

have these facilities as a right rather than their having to be applied for?

The First Minister: If you could supply me with the details of the school concerned and what the particular budget issues are on maintenance or acquiring play equipment—I think that is what I heard you say—I am sure that either Jane or I will write you a detailed and considered reply.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog am ei atebion.

Ann Jones: Point of order.

The Presiding Officer: Order. We are in the middle of questions.

Ann Jones: May I not raise a point of order?

The Presiding Officer: Order. In my usual courteous way, I was thanking the First Minister for his answers. We will now move to the business statement.

Ann Jones: May I not raise a point of order?

The Presiding Officer: Order. If there is a point of order, it will be taken in the usual place, which is after statements. However, my understanding is that what you seek to raise is not a point of order for me. Therefore, you will not be called.

fel hawl yn hytrach na gorfod gwneud cais amdanynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe gallech roi manylion am yr ysgol dan sylw imi a beth yw'r materion cyllidebol penodol o ran cynnal a chadw neu brynu offer chwarae—credaf mai dyna a ddywedasoch, yn ôl yr hyn a glywais—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddaf fi neu Jane yn ysgrifennu ateb manwl a phwyllog atoch.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, First Minister, for those responses.

Ann Jones: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydym ar ganol y cwestiynau.

Ann Jones: Oni chaf godi pwynt o drefn?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yn fy null cwrtais arferol, yr oeddwn yn diolch i'r Prif Weinidog am ei atebion. Symudwn yn awr at y datganiad busnes.

Ann Jones: Oni chaf godi pwynt o drefn?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os oes pwynt o drefn, bydd yn cael ei gymryd yn y man arferol, sef ar ôl y datganiadau. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, nid pwynt o drefn i mi yw'r hyn yr ydych am ei godi. Felly, ni chewch eich galw.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have one change to report to this week's business. Following this statement, the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport will be making a statement on the Arts Council of Wales. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda. Following the meeting of the Business Committee this morning, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Animal By-Products (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Education (National Curriculum for Wales)

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Wedi'r datganiad hwn, bydd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn gwneud datganiad am Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, a ddylai fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen i'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth gael eu cyfeirio at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Sgîl-Gynhyrchion Anifeiliaid (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cwricwlwm Cenedlaethol Cymru) (Datgymhwysio

(Disapplication of Science at Key Stage 4) Regulations 2006, and the Fish Labelling (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006.

Gwyddoniaeth yng Nghyfnod Allweddol 4) 2006, a Rheoliadau Labelu Pysgod (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad. Felly, galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally propose the business statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We appreciate the commitment to a debate on climate change. We have had some exchanges on that today and it will be useful to have that debate, in which these issues can be explored in greater detail. It would be helpful if the Business Minister could tell us when she expects the debate to be held.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r ymrwymiad i gynnal dadl ar newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yr ydym wedi cael rhai trafodaethau am hynny heddiw a bydd yn ddefnyddiol cael y ddadl honno, lle y gellir archwilio'r materion hyn yn fanylach. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallai'r Trefnydd ddweud wrthym pryd y mae'n disgwyl i'r dadl gael ei chynnal.

However, we are disappointed that the Government does not feel able to have a statement on the pension crisis and local government workers. It is vital that we have that. The people of Wales have a right to expect the Government of Wales to make its position clear on that, other than the general comments made by the First Minister. We are talking about some of the lowest-paid public sector workers in Wales, and they are entitled to know what the Government of Wales might be able to do to help them in their hour of crisis.

Yr ydym yn siomedig, fodd bynnag, nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gallu rhoi datganiad am yr argyfwng pensiwn a gweithwyr llywodraeth leol. Mae'n hanfodol inni gael hynny. Mae gan bobl Cymru hawl i ddisgwyl i Lywodraeth Cymru wneud ei safbwynt yn glir ar hynny, ar wahân i'r sylwadau cyffredinol a wnaethpwyd gan y Prif Weinidog. Yr ydym yn sôn am rai o'r gweithwyr sy'n cael lleiaf o dâl yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac mae ganddynt hawl i wybod beth y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru ei wneud i'w helpu yn eu hawr o argyfwng.

We are also disappointed that the Government is not prepared to make a statement on the reports that we hear about job losses in the national health service. The Government knows that there are now massive debts in many of our trusts and local health boards. We are entitled to know whether or not that will lead to substantial job losses in the NHS in Wales. We would like a statement on that matter sooner rather than later.

Yr ydym hefyd yn siomedig nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i wneud datganiad am yr adroddiadau yr ydym yn eu clywed am golli swyddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Gŵyr y Llywodraeth fod gan lawer o'n hymddiriedolaethau a'n byrddau iechyd lleol ddyledion enfawr erbyn hyn. Mae gennym hawl i wybod a fydd hynny'n arwain at golli nifer sylweddol o swyddi ai peidio yn y GIG yng Nghymru. Hoffem gael datganiad ar y mater hwnnw yn eithaf buan.

Lisa Francis: We are grateful that we will have a statement from the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport today,

Lisa Francis: Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar y byddwn yn cael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon

albeit that it could have been a request for an urgent question that prompted the statement. I believe that we asked for it last week. Frankly, we are also disappointed, as Ieuan Wyn Jones has just stated, that a statement on public sector workers and their industrial action will not be considered, mainly because we are concerned about the impact that this will have on the elderly and the infirm. We also asked for an oral statement on the budget, on the £45 million consequential. The First Minister announced spending on dentistry and selective schools at the Labour Party conference; we felt that the Assembly Chamber should have been the arena for such an announcement. I understand that there is a written statement out now, but we feel that an oral statement is needed—it is certainly what was given last year.

2.50 p.m.

Finally, we asked you for a statement on the review of health service report, 'Building Local, Safe and Sustainable Services for Mid and West Wales: The Case for Change', and the possible proposed closure of Withybush and Glangwili hospitals, and their replacement with a new hospital. Other aspects of this report affect Prince Phillip Hospital, Llanelli and Bronglais Hospital, Aberystwyth, as well as Swansea. In total, it affects around 1 million people. Therefore, an oral statement on that would have been helpful.

The Presiding Officer: Before I call Peter Black, reference was made by Lisa Francis to an application for an urgent question. This was a confidential application, made to me under Standing Orders. In my normal practice of consulting about an urgent question, as to whether it meets the criterion of being of urgent public importance, this may or may not include consulting officials who work for the Welsh Assembly Government—that is entirely a matter for me. An urgent question, if accepted, would, at maximum, take six to eight minutes to reply to in the Assembly; a full statement, which the Government offers today, may go on for over 30 minutes, as it will, no doubt, today. This is a matter for the Government. The

heddiw, er mai cais am gwestiwn brys a allai fod wedi ysgogi'r datganiad. Credaf ein bod wedi gofyn amdano yr wythnos diwethaf. A bod yn onest, yr ydym ninnau'n siomedig, fel y mae Ieuan Wyn Jones newydd nodi, na fydd datganiad am weithwyr y sector cyhoeddus a'u gweithredu diwydiannol yn cael ei ystyried, yn bennaf oherwydd ein bod yn bryderus am yr effaith y bydd hyn yn ei chael ar yr henoed a'r methodig. Gofynasom hefyd am ddatganiad llafar am y gyllideb, am y swm canlyniadol o £45 miliwn. Cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog wariant ar ddeintyddiaeth ac ysgolion dethol yng nghynhadledd y Blaid Lafur; teimlem mai yn Siambr y Cynulliad y dylid bod wedi rhoi cyhoeddiad o'r fath. Deallaf fod datganiad ysgrifenedig ar gael yn awr, ond teimlwn fod angen datganiad llafar—yn sicr dyna a roddwyd y llynedd.

Yn olaf, gofynasom ichi am ddatganiad am yr adroddiad ar yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth iechyd, 'Building Local, Safe and Sustainable Services for Mid and West Wales: The Case for Change', ac am y posibilrwydd y gallai ysbytai Glangwili a Llwynhelyg gau ac yr adeiledd ysbyty newydd yn eu lle. Mae agweddau eraill ar yr adroddiad hwn yn effeithio ar Ysbyty'r Tywysog Phillip, Llanelli ac Ysbyty Bronglais, Aberystwyth, yn ogystal ag Abertawe. Mae'n effeithio ar gyfanswm o ryw 1 miliwn o bobl. Felly, byddai datganiad llafar ar hynny wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol.

Y Llywydd: Cyn imi alw Peter Black, cyfeiriodd Lisa Francis at gais am gwestiwn brys. Yr oedd hwn yn gais cyfrinachol, a gyflwynwyd imi dan y Rheolau Sefydlog. Yn ôl fy null arferol o ymgynghori ynghylch cwestiwn brys, ynghylch a yw'n bodloni'r maen prawf o fod yn fater brys sydd o bwys cyhoeddus, gall hynny gynnwys ymgynghori â swyddogion sy'n gweithio i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—mater i mi yn unig yw hynny. Byddai cwestiwn brys, petai'n cael ei dderbyn, yn cymryd hyd at chwech i wyth munud i ymateb iddo yn y Cynulliad; gall datganiad llawn, y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gynnig heddiw, fynd ymlaen am ragor na 30 munud, fel y bydd yn gwneud, yn ddi-os, heddiw. Mater i'r Llywodraeth yw hyn. Gall

Government may request statements at any time, and those statements will be allowed in a timely fashion. It has no relation whatsoever to any applications made for urgent questions. Urgent questions are confidential applications made to me, and they become public knowledge only when I have adjudged that they are urgent questions. That is to protect the rights of all of us as Assembly Members, including, strangely as it may seem to some of you, the rights of Ministers. It ill behoves those people who imagine one day that they may be Ministers to behave differently.

Peter Black: I thank the Business Minister for meeting some of the requests that I made earlier. However, I am disappointed that we will not have a statement on the Supporting People programme. This is an issue of some concern in communities, and among many of the bodies that rely on that money. It would be useful at some stage for us to be able to scrutinise the Minister on that in the Chamber.

The main reason why the Liberal Democrats oppose the business statement lies around the statement on the budget. If you are going to spend an additional £17 million, it is only right that the Minister should come to the Chamber and be properly scrutinised on how that money is to be spent; we heard that in the questions that Mike German asked the First Minister earlier on. There are questions that should be asked about the written statement that was put out earlier on. However, because it is a written statement, we do not have the opportunity to raise those questions other than through questions to the First Minister; we do not have the opportunity to question the Minister in any depth about that statement. Therefore, we should have an oral statement on this, as we have done in the past. For that reason we oppose the business statement today.

Carl Sargeant: Business Minister, it would be kind of you if you could consider allocating some time in the future to discuss issues surrounding the Welsh Development Agency and the merger. It is important that we consider the economy's successes, and

y Llywodraeth ofyn am ddatganiadau unrhyw bryd, a chaniateir y datganiadau hynny mewn modd amserol. Nid oes a wnelo ddim o gwbl â cheisiadau a wneir am gwestiynau brys. Ceisiadau cyfrinachol a wneir i mi yw cwestiynau brys, ac ni ddônt yn gyhoeddus nes byddaf wedi dyfarnu eu bod yn gwestiynau brys. Gwneir hynny er mwyn diogelu pob un ohonom fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, gan gynnwys hawliau Gweinidogion, er mor rhyfedd y gall hynny ymddangos i rai ohonoch. Nid yw'n briodol i'r bobl hynny sy'n tybio y gallant fod yn Weinidogion ryw ddiwrnod ymddwyn yn wahanol.

Peter Black: Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am gydsynio â rhai o'r ceisiadau a wnaethpwyd gennyf yn gynharach. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siomedig na fydd datganiad am y rhaglen Cefnogi Pobl. Dyma fater sy'n peri pryder mewn cymunedau, ac ymysg llawer o'r cyrff sy'n dibynnu ar yr arian hwnnw. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol inni allu holi'r Gweinidog yn fanwl ynglŷn â hynny ryw dro yn y Siambr.

Y prif reswm pam mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes yw'r datganiad am y gyllideb. Os ydych am wario £17 miliwn yn ychwanegol, mae'n sicr yn iawn i'r Gweinidog ddod i'r Siambr a chael ei holi'n briodol am sut y bydd yr arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario; clywsom hynny yn y cwestiynau a ofynnodd Mike German i'r Prif Weinidog yn gynharach. Mae cwestiynau y dylid eu gofyn am y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyflwynwyd yn gynharach. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd mai datganiad ysgrifenedig ydyw, nid ydym yn cael y cyfle i godi'r cwestiynau hynny ar wahân i drwy gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog; nid ydym yn cael y cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog yn fanwl am y datganiad hwnnw. Felly, dylem gael datganiad llafar am hyn, fel yr ydym wedi cael yn y gorffennol. Oherwydd hynny, yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes heddiw.

Carl Sargeant: Drefnydd, byddech yn garedig iawn petaech yn gallu ystyried neilltuo rhywfaint o amser yn y dyfodol i drafod materion sy'n ymwneud ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r uno. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried llwyddiannau'r economi, a'n bod yn

that we keep an eye on the ball when the WDA merges into the Assembly. The WDA's success, and organisations such as moneysupermarket.com in my constituency, which has just announced another 200 jobs in Flintshire, should be commended. We are duty bound to discuss the successes of the industry and the agency.

In the past, we have debated dance. It would be useful if we considered engaging the youth of today, particularly in how they play and dress, and their fashion. I welcome the new fashion of Dr Marten boots, which are appropriate wear for the youth of today. I hope that you can consider my contribution today.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I knew that I would not be able to please you all, but I challenge those issues on the basis of which you are not supporting this business statement.

On the important point of pensions in local government, clearly, the First Minister responded to this question just a few minutes ago, and we hope, for all concerned, that this dispute is settled sooner rather than later. I speak as a Minister and also as a member of Unison, and Unison members across the Chamber have, I hope, expressed their wish for this to be settled sooner rather than later. In terms of issues relating to pay, I am glad that we launched the third phase of the equal pay campaign last week—closing the pay gap for the public sector is key for those workers, particularly women, who are disadvantaged by low pay. That is a key point in terms of tackling those issues in the public sector.

Moving on to the review of health services in mid and west Wales, you do not have to put this forward; you know that there is a process. This is a public consultation on 'Designed to Deliver', which contains proposals for mid and west Wales. It is out for consultation with staff and the public in that region, and I am sure that you will get fully engaged in that, along with colleagues

cadw llygad barcud ar y sefyllfa pan fydd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn dod yn rhan o'r Cynulliad. Mae llwyddiant yr awdurdod, a sefydliadau megis moneysupermarket.com yn fy etholaeth i, sydd newydd gyhoeddi 200 o swyddi eraill yn sir y Fflint, i'w gymeradwyo. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnom drafod llwyddiannau'r diwydiant a'r awdurdod.

Yn y gorffennol, yr ydym wedi trafod dawn. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol petaem yn ystyried denu ieuenctid heddiw i gymryd rhan, yn arbennig o ran sut y maent yn chwarae ac yn gwisgo, a'u ffasiwn. Croesawaf ffasiwn newydd esgidiau Dr Marten, sy'n wisg briodol ar gyfer ieuenctid heddiw. Gobeithiaf y gallwch ystyried fy nghyfraniad heddiw.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Gwyddwn na fyddwn yn gallu bodloni pawb heddiw, ond yr wyf yn herio'r materion hynny yr ydych yn seilio'ch penderfyniad i beidio â chefnogi'r datganiad busnes hwn arnynt.

Ar bwynt pwysig pensiynau mewn llywodraeth leol, yn sicr, ymatebodd y Prif Weinidog i'r cwestiwn hwn ychydig funudau'n ôl, a gobeithiwn, er mwyn pawb sy'n gysylltiedig, y bydd yr anghydfod hwn yn cael ei setlo'n fuan. Siaradaf fel Gweinidog a hefyd fel aelod o Unsain, ac mae aelodau Unsain ar draws y Siambr, gobeithio, wedi mynegi eu dymuniad i'r mater hwn gael ei setlo'n fuan. O ran materion sy'n ymwneud â chyflog, yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi lansio trydydd cam yr ymgyrch cyflog cyfartal yr wythnos diwethaf—mae cau'r bwlch cyflogau ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus yn allweddol i'r gweithwyr hynny, merched yn enwedig, sydd dan anfantais oherwydd cyflogau isel. Mae hynny'n bwynt hollbwysig o ran mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny yn y sector cyhoeddus.

A symud ymlaen at yr adolygiad o wasanaethau iechyd yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, nid oes raid ichi gyflwyno'r mater hwn; gwyddoch fod proses ar gael. Ymgyngoriad cyhoeddus yw hyn ar 'Designed to Deliver', sy'n cynnwys cynigion ar gyfer y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae'n destun ymgyngoriad yn yr ardal honno ar hyn o bryd ar gyfer y staff a'r

and other Assembly Members. In relation to the NHS, which, again, came up in First Minister's questions, we are at the forefront of tackling the deficit culture. We had a very strong message from the Derek Wanless review, and we started work on it at that time. We have driven the deficit down, but we obviously want to move from 0.5 per cent to 0 per cent. We are also very proud of our deliveries on our workforce targets in relation to the increased numbers of nurses, doctors and healthcare professionals.

On the additional £45 million announced in the Chancellor's budget, do you want this money to go to the most disadvantaged children? Do you want this money to go to dentists? You are the ones who ask us time and again to ensure that we target the most disadvantaged groups, and that is what we are going to do. Quite rightly and properly, the Finance Minister has issued a written statement on the Government's intentions and we will be laying an in-year motion before the Assembly in due course. Finally, in response to Carl, I congratulate moneysupermarket.com. I also congratulate the Ministers, led by the First Minister, and those who have been engaged with the merger process for Assembly sponsored public bodies. From 1 April, we welcome all those people, and the additional skills and talents that they will bring to the Assembly to deliver for enterprise, innovation and networks, and education and lifelong learning and skills in Wales.

cyhoedd, ac yr wyf yn sicr y byddwch yn ymwneud yn llawn â'r broses honno, ynghyd â chyd-Aelodau ac Aelodau Cynulliad eraill. O ran y GIG, mater a godwyd eto yn y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, yr ydym ar flaen y gad ynglŷn â rhoi sylw i ddiwylliant y diffyg. Derbyniassom neges gadarn gan adolygiad Derek Wanless, a dechreuasom weithio arno bryd hynny. Yr ydym wedi peri i'r diffyg fynd yn llai, ond yr ydym wrth gwrs am symud o 0.5 y cant i 0 y cant. Yr ydym hefyd yn falch iawn o'n llwyddiannau gyda'n targedau ar gyfer y gweithlu gyda golwg ar niferoedd mwy o nyrsys, meddygon a gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol.

O ran y £45 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd yng nghyllideb y Canghellor, a ydych am weld yr arian hwn yn mynd i'r plant mwyaf difreintiedig? A ydych am weld yr arian hwn yn mynd i ddeintyddion? Chi sy'n gofyn inni dro ar ôl tro sicrhau ein bod yn targedu'r grwpiau mwyaf difreintiedig, a dyna beth yr ydym am ei wneud. Yn ddigon cywir a phriodol, mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig am fwriadau'r Llywodraeth a byddwn yn cyflwyno cynnig yn ystod y flwyddyn gerbron y Cynulliad yn y man. Yn olaf, mewn ymateb i Carl, yr wyf yn llongyfarch moneysupermarket.com. Yr wyf hefyd yn llongyfarch y Gweinidogion, dan arweiniad y Prif Weinidog, a'r rhai sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â'r broses o gyfuno'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. O 1 Ebrill, croesawn yr holl bobl hynny, a'r sgiliau a'r talentau ychwanegol y byddant yn eu cyfrannu i'r Cynulliad er mwyn cyflawni ym maes menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau, ac addysg a dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau yng Nghymru.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 25.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 25.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Datganiad am Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru Statement on the Arts Council of Wales

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): With your permission, Presiding Officer, I make a statement to bring the Assembly up to date with events since the arts debate on 1 February. First, on the review of the Arts Council of Wales, Members will recall that the Plenary motion on 1 February committed the Assembly Government to carrying out a Government review of the arts council. We are, of course, complying fully with that Plenary decision. The terms of reference for the review have now been agreed by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee after constructive discussions among party spokespersons and leaders. The review will be wide-ranging. It will look at the future framework for funding arrangements that support the arts, including the role of the Arts Council of Wales. The review will advise me on the existing and future role of ACW in relation to its funding of the arts. It will include the national arts organisations, the development of the arts in Wales, the development of access and inclusion in the arts, and tackling social inequalities. The future roles of the Arts Council of Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government will be examined, taking account of the need for democratic accountability, transparency and openness,

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Gyda'ch caniatâd, Lywydd, yr wyf yn gwneud datganiad er mwyn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad am y digwyddiadau ers y ddadl ar y celfyddydau ar 1 Chwefror. Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio bod y cynnig yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 1 Chwefror wedi peri i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymrwmo i gynnal adolygiad o gyngor y celfyddydau gan y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym, wrth gwrs, yn cydymffurfio'n llawn â'r penderfyniad hwnnw yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Ar ôl trafodaethau adeiladol ymysg arweinwyr a llefarwyr y pleidiau, mae'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon erbyn hyn wedi cytuno ar gylch gorchwyl yr adolygiad. Bydd yr adolygiad yn eang ei gwmpas. Bydd yn edrych ar y fframwaith yn y dyfodol ar gyfer y trefniadau ariannu sy'n cefnogi'r celfyddydau, gan gynnwys swyddogaeth Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Bydd yr adolygiad yn fy nghynghori am swyddogaeth bresennol CCC, a'i swyddogaeth yn y dyfodol, mewn perthynas ag ariannu'r celfyddydau ganddo. Bydd yn cynnwys sefydliadau cenedlaethol y celfyddydau, datblygu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru, datblygu mynediad a chynhwysiant yn y celfyddydau, a rhoi sylw i anghydraddoldebau cymdeithasol. Bydd

artistic freedom, an environment within which the arts can develop in all parts of Wales, improving access to the arts, which is a key interest of mine, excellence, and the active management and development of arts funding recipients. It is particularly important that the review looks beyond Wales. It will consider levels of arts funding and funding mechanisms in an international context.

swyddogaethau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y dyfodol yn cael eu harchwilio, gan roi ystyriaeth i'r angen am atebolrwydd democrataidd, tryloywder a bod yn agored, rhyddid artistig, amgylchedd lle y gall y celfyddydau ddatblygu ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gwella mynediad at y celfyddydau, sydd yn un o'm diddordebau pennaf, rhagoriaeth a chamau i reoli a datblygu rhai sydd yn derbyn cyllid ar gyfer y celfyddydau. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig i'r adolygiad edrych y tu hwnt i Gymru. Bydd yn ystyried lefelau'r cyllido a'r mecanweithiau cyllido ar gyfer y celfyddydau mewn cyd-destun rhyngwladol.

3.00 p.m.

The review will report before December, and we will bring a motion to Plenary. The review will be carried out by a panel of five people, appointed by the Government. The panel's method of working has also been agreed by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee. The panel will need to review and analyse the evidence base to ensure a sound basis for the development of policy recommendations. It will need to engage with a broad range of individuals and groups across Wales and beyond. The terms of reference are clear on this point, saying that the panel should engage directly with a wide range of arts practitioners and others in the sector. It will also conduct public discussion and thus engage with a wider range of views and opinions. I encourage everyone with an interest in the arts to engage with the panel in this most important work.

Bydd yr adolygiad yn adrodd cyn mis Rhagfyr, a byddwn yn dwyn cynnig gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn. Cyflawnir yr adolygiad gan banel o bump, a benodir gan y Llywodraeth. Mae Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon wedi cytuno ar ddull gweithio'r panel. Bydd yn rhaid i'r panel adolygu a dadansoddi'r sylfaen dystiolaeth er mwyn sicrhau bod sail gadarn ar gyfer datblygu'r argymhellion ar bolisi. Bydd yn rhaid iddo ymwneud ag amrywiaeth fawr o unigolion a grwpiau ledled Cymru a'r tu hwnt. Mae'r cylch gorchwyl yn glir ar y pwynt hwn, gan ei fod yn dweud y dylai'r panel ymwneud yn uniongyrchol ag amrywiaeth fawr o ymarferwyr ym maes y celfyddydau ac eraill yn y sector. Bydd hefyd yn cynnal trafodaeth gyhoeddus ac felly'n ystyried amrywiaeth fwy o farnau a safbwyntiau. Yr wyf yn annog pawb sydd yn ymddiddori yn y celfyddydau i ymgysylltu â'r panel yn y gwaith tra phwysig hwn.

I am pleased to be able to announce today that the chair of the review panel will be Elan Closs Stephens. Elan, of course, is well known in public life in Wales. She is Professor of Communications and Creative Industries in the Department of Theatre, Film and Television Studies at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. She is shortly to retire as the chair of S4C, she is also a member of the National Library of Wales court and council, and she is a board member of Chwarae Teg. As for the other members of the panel, discussions are continuing among the party leaders and spokespersons, and I

Yr wyf yn falch o allu cyhoeddi heddiw mai cadeirydd panel yr adolygiad fydd Elan Closs Stephens. Mae Elan, wrth gwrs, yn adnabyddus iawn yn y byd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'n Athro Cyfathrebu a'r Diwydiannau Creadigol yn Adran Astudiaethau Theatr, Ffilm a Theledu ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth. Bydd yn ymddeol cyn hir fel cadeirydd S4C, mae hefyd yn aelod o lys a chyngor Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru, ac mae'n aelod o fwrdd Chwarae Teg. O ran aelodau eraill y panel, mae'r trafodaethau'n parhau ymysg arweinyddion a llefarwyr y pleidiau, ac yr

hope that these will soon be concluded. I will make a further announcement before the Easter recess.

I now turn to the matter of chairing the Arts Council of Wales. I have made it clear that I wanted to run a normal public appointments process, complete with public advertisements and the involvement of committee nominees, but the opposition amendment carried on 1 February makes it difficult to make a full-term appointment. How could a full-term appointment be made when the role of the arts council might be changed after the review? Some Members of the Assembly—and they are doing it this afternoon—are not prepared to wait for the review to do its work. I am not prepared to prejudge that review process. I have, therefore, decided to appoint an interim chair to cover the review period. I intend to complete the full-term appointment as soon as the outcome of the review process is clear. The full-term appointment will, of course, be via the normal process. During the interim period, I want the arts council to get on with business as usual, which involves distributing some £27 million of public money, which is a huge real-terms increase since the Assembly first met.

Council members have important responsibilities. As I explained in committee last week, I have the responsibility to appoint the chair, and the council has the responsibility to appoint a vice-chair. Council members are also trustees of the charity and they have charitable fiduciary responsibilities to take into account. I am pleased, therefore, to announce that Professor Dai Smith will take on the role of interim chair until the process to appoint a full-term chair has been completed. Dai Smith has been a member of the arts council since 2004. As the holder of the Raymond Williams research chair in cultural history at the University of Wales Swansea, Professor Smith has a distinguished academic and public service career, and is well suited to carrying out this role. His leadership of the Library of Wales project has attracted much favourable comment.

wyf yn gobeithio y byddant wedi eu cwblhau cyn hir. Byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad pellach cyn toriad y Pasg.

Trof yn awr at fater cadeiryddiaeth Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir mai fy nymuniad oedd cynnal y broses sydd yn arferol ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus, ac yn rhan o hynny byddai hysbysebion cyhoeddus a byddai'n cynnwys rhai sydd wedi eu henwebu gan y pwyllgor, ond mae gwelliant y gwrthbleidiau a dderbyniwyd ar 1 Chwefror yn peri ei bod yn anodd gwneud penodiad am dymor llawn. Sut y gellid gwneud penodiad am dymor llawn yn wyneb y posibilrwydd y gallai rôl cyngor y celfyddydau gael ei newid ar ôl yr adolygiad? Mae rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad—ac mae hynny'n digwydd y prynhawn yma—yn amharod i aros i'r adolygiad wneud ei waith. Nid wyf yn barod i ragfarnu'r broses adolygu honno. Gan hynny, yr wyf wedi penderfynu penodi cadeirydd dros dro ar gyfer cyfnod yr adolygiad. Yr wyf yn bwriadu cwblhau'r penodiad tymor llawn cyn gynted ag y bydd canlyniad y broses adolygu'n glir. Bydd y penodiad tymor llawn yn digwydd drwy'r broses arferol, wrth gwrs. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn dymuno i gyngor y celfyddydau fwrw ymlaen â'i waith fel arfer, ac mae hynny'n golygu dosbarthu tua £27 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus, sydd yn gynydd aruthrol o ran ei wir werth ers i'r Cynulliad gwrdd am y tro cyntaf.

Mae cyfrifoldebau pwysig gan aelodau'r cyngor. Fel yr esboniais yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, myfi sydd yn gyfrifol am benodi'r cadeirydd, a'r cyngor sydd yn gyfrifol am benodi is-gadeirydd. Mae aelodau'r cyngor yn ymddiriedolwyr i'r elusen hefyd a rhaid iddynt ystyried eu cyfrifoldebau fel ymddiriedolwyr elusen. Yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi, felly, y bydd yr Athro Dai Smith yn ymgymryd â rôl y cadeirydd dros dro hyd nes y bydd y broses i benodi cadeirydd tymor llawn wedi ei chwblhau. Mae Dai Smith yn aelod o gyngor y celfyddydau ers 2004. Ac yntau'n ddeiliad cadair ymchwil Raymond Williams mewn hanes diwylliant ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe, mae'r Athro Smith wedi cael gyrfa nodedig yn y byd academiaidd ac mewn gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, ac mae'n un addas iawn i gyflawni'r rôl hon. Cafwyd llawer o

ganmol ar ei waith yn arwain prosiect Llyfrgell Cymru.

The review of the arts council provides an excellent opportunity for everyone with a genuine interest in the arts and culture to contribute to the debate. I hope that the review will be enlightening and insightful, and will fulfil the expectations that we all have in the Chamber for the best interests of the arts in Wales.

Owen John Thomas: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r newidiadau yr ydych wedi eu gwneud i gylch gorchwyl y panel o leiaf, sef newidiadau a wnaed yn y pwyllgor ac a oedd yn symud eich pwyslais gwreiddiol ar yr adolygiad o berfformiad y cyngor celfyddydau—cyngor a adolygwyd ryw dair blynedd yn ôl—i edrych ar drefniadau strwythurol bwrdd y cyngor a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod am edrych ar drefniadau rhyngwladol i sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gorau yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf na fydd hynny'n golygu y byddwch yn teithio o amgylch y byd, gan wario llawer o arian, oherwydd yr wyf yn siŵr bod digon o enghreifftiau yn Ewrop y gallwch ymweld â nhw.

Gwelaif eich bod eto yn pwysleisio'r diffyg mynediad yn yr ardaloedd difreintiedig. Dywedaf eto, Weinidog, fod yr holl dystiolaeth yn dangos mai diffyg awdurdodau lleol Llafur yn yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n bennaf cyfrifol am y ffaith nad yw'r celfyddydau wedi datblygu fel y dylent. Yr oeddwn o falch o glywed cynnig Huw Lewis—

Huw Lewis *a gododd*—

Owen John Thomas: Nid yn awr, Huw.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This may appear to be a speech, but it is, in fact, a preamble to questions on a statement.

Owen John Thomas: Croesewais gynnig diweddar Huw Lewis i greu amgueddfa y bobl—y gweithwyr, hynny yw—ym Merthyr. Yr wyf yn cefnogi hynny 100 y cant.

Weinidog, rhaid i chi edrych yn agosach ar yr

Mae'r adolygiad o gyngor y celfyddydau'n cynnig cyfle rhagorol i bawb sydd yn gwir ymddiddori yn y celfyddydau ac mewn diwylliant i gyfrannu i'r ddadl. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yr adolygiad yn un craff ac yn goleuo'r sefyllfa, ac y bydd yn cyflawni'r disgwyliadau sydd gan bawb ohonom yn y Siambr er budd y celfyddydau yng Nghymru.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome at least the changes that you have made to the panel's terms of reference, which were made in committee and which shifted the original emphasis that you placed on the review of the arts council's performance—a council that was reviewed some three years ago—to looking at the structural arrangements of the council's board and the Welsh Assembly Government. I also welcome the fact that you want to look at international arrangements to ensure that we have the best in Wales. However, I hope that that does not mean that you will be travelling around the world, spending vast amounts of money, as I am sure that there are plenty of examples in Europe that you could visit.

I see that you are again emphasising the lack of access in deprived areas. I say again, Minister, that all the evidence shows that it is the failure of Labour local authorities in those areas that is mainly responsible for the fact that the arts have not developed as they should have. I was glad to hear Huw Lewis's proposal—

Huw Lewis *rose*—

Owen John Thomas: Not now, Huw.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gallai ymddangos mai araith yw hyn, ond, mewn gwirionedd, rhagymadrodd ydyw i gwestiynau ar ddatganiad.

Owen John Thomas: I welcomed Huw Lewis's recent proposal to create a museum of the people—that is, the workers—in Merthyr. I support that 100 per cent.

Minister, you must look more closely at what

hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr awdurdodau lleol i weld beth yn union sydd o'i le. A ydych yn croesawu'r cynllun i ddatblygu amgueddfa ffotograffiaeth yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot? Efallai y gallwch roi mwy o fanylion i ni am yr amgueddfa honno.

Croesawaf benodiad Elan Closs Stephens. Mae ganddi lawer o brofiad yn y cyfryngau ac yn y celfyddydau. Gan symud at fusnes cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau, yr ydych wedi gwybod ers Gorffennaf 2004 mai bwriad eich Llywodraeth oedd tynnu CCC i mewn i'r Llywodraeth a cheisio tynnu'r mwyafrif o'i gyfrifoldebau oddi wrtho, wrth wneud hynny. Ym mis Rhagfyr 2005, bron 18 mis ar ôl hynny, ddau ddiwrnod cyn y Nadolig—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae arnaf ofn bod yn rhaid i mi ymyrryd. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng rhagymadrodd ac araith. Bydd hon yn mynd yn araith os na chawn gwestiynau ar fyrder. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod yr hanes ac yr ydym wedi dechrau syrffedu arno; gadewch i ni gael ychydig o gwestiynau, os gwelwch yn dda.

Owen John Thomas: Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw pawb yn gwybod yr hanes ac mae'r hanes yn ddiddorol, ond symudaf ymlaen. Yr wyf yn bwriadu ysgrifennu at y Comisiynydd dros Benodiadau Cyhoeddus i dynnu sylw at y ffaith, Weinidog, eich bod wedi anwybyddu'r cod ymarfer wrth wneud penodiadau fel hyn. O ystyried eich bod wedi dweud wrth gadeirydd y cyngor celfyddydau ym mis Rhagfyr 2005 nad oeddech yn mynd i roi tymor ychwanegol iddo, ac y byddai ei dymor presennol o dair blynedd yn dod i ben ym mis Mawrth, sef diwedd yr wythnos hon, yr oedd digon o amser gennych i ddechrau'r broses o hysbysebu a chynnal cyfweiliadau i benodi cadeirydd newydd. Ni wnaethoch hynny ac nid oedd syniad gennych bryd hynny y byddem yn cael cyfarfod ar ddechrau Chwefror i'ch rhwystro rhag mynd ymhellach gyda'r busnes o lyncu'r cyngor celfyddydau. Gwyddoch beth yw hyd y broses benodi, felly pam na wnaethoch roi hysbyseb yn y wasg ar ddiwedd llynedd, ym mis Rhagfyr, i sicrhau bod y broses honno wedi dechrau? Nid oeddech yn gwybod bryd hynny, fel y dywedais, beth fyddai'n digwydd ym mis Chwefror. Hoffwn ateb i'r

is going on in local authorities to see exactly what is going wrong. Do you welcome the proposal to develop a museum of photography in Neath Port Talbot? Perhaps you could give us more information about that museum.

I welcome the appointment of Elan Closs Stephens. She has a great deal of experience in the media and the arts. Turning to matters concerning the chair of the arts council, you have known since July 2004 that it was your Government's intention to merge ACW with the Government and, in doing so, to try to take most of ACW's responsibilities away from it. In December 2005, almost 18 months later, and two days before Christmas—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am afraid that I must intervene. There is a difference between a preamble and a speech, and this will become a speech if we do not have a question from you shortly. We all know the background to this and we have started to get weary of it; let us have some questions, please.

Owen John Thomas: I am not sure whether everyone does know the background to this, and it is interesting, but I will move on. I intend to write to the Commissioner for Public Appointments to draw her attention to the fact that you, Minister, have ignored the code of practice in making appointments such as this. Considering that you told the chair of the arts council in December 2005 that you were not going to extend his term of office, and that his current term of three years would end in March, which is the end of this week, you had plenty of time to start the process of advertising and holding interviews to appoint a new chair. You did not do that and you had no idea at that time that we would have a meeting at the beginning of February to prevent you from moving on with the business of integrating the arts council into the Government. You know how long the recruitment process takes, so why did you not place an advert in the press at the end of last year, in December, to ensure that that process was under way? You did not know at that time, as I said, what was going to happen in February. I would like an answer to that question.

cwestiwn hwnnw.

Alun Pugh: I am happy to have full and detailed discussions about the terms of reference, but I must say to you that the remit must fulfil the terms of the resolution of the debate of 1 February, not what people thought that it meant. It must comply fully with that resolution.

Alun Pugh: Byddaf yn falch o gynnal trafodaethau llawn a manwl am y cylch gorchwyl, ond rhaid imi ddweud wrthyh fod y cylch gorchwyl yn gorfod bodloni telerau'r penderfyniad a gafwyd yn y ddatl ar 1 Chwefror, nid yr hyn y mae rhai'n tybio ei fod yn ei olygu. Rhaid iddo gydymffurfio'n llwyr â'r penderfyniad hwnnw.

3.10 p.m.

As far as travelling is concerned, I intend to do no ministerial travelling whatsoever in this regard, as it is a matter for the committee and the review rather than for me. If the committee wants to look at practice in different parts of the European Union or the different practices emerging in various parts of the devolved United Kingdom, then that is a matter for its members.

O ran teithio, nid wyf yn bwriadu teithio dim o gwbl fel Gweinidog yn hyn o beth, gan mai mater i'r pwyllgor ac i'r adolygiad ydyw, ac nid i mi. Os yw'r pwyllgor yn dymuno ystyried arferion yng ngwahanol rannau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd neu'r gwahanol arferion sydd yn datblygu yng ngwahanol rannau'r Deyrnas Unedig ddatganoledig, yna mae hynny'n fater i'w aelodau.

In mentioning the role of local authorities, you made a partisan point. All I want to say is that local authorities, as major funders of the arts world in Wales, have an important contribution to make to this review. I hope that we could get some local authority involvement on the panel, but that will clearly be a matter for negotiation with the leaders.

Wrth sôn am rôl awdurdodau lleol, gwnaethoch bwynt pleidiol. Y cwbl yr wyf yn dymuno ei ddweud yw bod cyfraniad pwysig i'w wneud i'r adolygiad hwn gan awdurdodau lleol, sydd yn gyllidwyr o bwys ym myd y celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y gallwn sicrhau rhyw ran i awdurdodau lleol ar y panel, ond mae'n amlwg y bydd hynny'n fater i'w negodi gyda'r arweinwyr.

You also said that we will be bringing the arts council into Government, but we have made it clear on many occasions that that is not going to happen. The Arts Council of Wales will continue as a royal charter body and, importantly, as a distributor of lottery funds, which is one of its key functions.

Dywedasoch hefyd y byddwn yn cynnwys cyngor y celfyddydau yn y Llywodraeth, ond yr ydym wedi egluro ar sawl achlysur na fydd hynny'n digwydd. Bydd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru'n parhau fel corff sydd â siarter frenhinol ac, yn bwysig, fel corff sydd yn dosbarthu arian y loteri, sef un o'i brif swyddogaethau.

You said that I ignored the appointments code, and I ask you to think carefully about withdrawing that remark. We certainly have not done that, and I certainly have not done that.

Dywedasoch fy mod wedi anwybyddu'r cod ar benodiadau, ac yr wyf yn gofyn ichi ystyried yn ofalus a ddylech dynnu'r sylw hwnnw'n ôl. Yn sicr, nid ydym ni wedi gwneud hynny ac, yn sicr, nid wyf fi wedi gwneud hynny.

Finally, I am not sure whether you were not listening or perhaps you have not had the opportunity to read my statement, but it was certainly my intention to have a full-term appointment in place. The problem is that we

Yn olaf, nid wyf yn siŵr a oeddech yn gwrando neu efallai na chawsoch gyfle i ddarllen fy natganiad, ond yr oedd yn sicr yn fwiad gennyf gael penodiad tymor llawn. Y drafferth yw na fu gennym swydd sefydlog

have not had a stable job to advertise since the opposition amendment was carried on 1 February.

Lisa Francis: The question on everyone's lips is why you felt that you could not appoint an interim chair. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'He has.']

The Presiding Officer: Order. This will now emerge as a response to the questions.

Lisa Francis: On 23 December, you informed the chair of the arts council that you intended to initiate a full appointments procedure. Subsequently, you have said that you did not intend to proceed with advertising that post because of the motion passed in Plenary on 1 February. I do not see how that could have precluded you from advertising for or seeking an interim chair. The post of arts council chair is a high-ranking position that commands significant responsibility, and appointment to this job follows a lengthy process. You certainly did not act quickly. Your actions in leaving this matter to the eleventh hour have certainly not instilled any confidence in the arts council, as has become apparent from its members' comments and, indeed, those of people in the arts sector. This dispute has united all who work in the arts, but your treatment of them has been cavalier, dilatory and embarrassingly shabby. Surely that is an irony.

You will be quite aware that the arts council called for the current chair's contract to be extended. Most of the arts sector wanted that to happen, and supported that. Will you confirm whether you or the First Minister decided ever to discuss this situation regarding the interim appointment with the current chair? Obviously, he was still the chair from 23 December and, indeed, will be so until 31 March. Did you discuss the prospect of appointing an interim chair with him?

Will you confirm that the appointment has been made within the terms of the royal charter? Are you satisfied that the Charity Commission and the Office of the

i'w hysbysebu ers derbyn gwelliant y gwrthbleidiau ar 1 Chwefror.

Lisa Francis: Y cwestiwn sydd ar wefusau pawb yw pam yr oeddech yn teimlo na allech benodi cadeirydd dros dro. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Mae wedi gwneud hynny.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Bydd hyn yn ymddangos yn awr fel ymateb i'r cwestiynau.

Lisa Francis: Ar 23 Rhagfyr, rhoesoch wybod i gadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau eich bod yn bwriadu dechrau gweithdrefn benodi lawn. Ers hynny, dywedasoch nad oeddech yn bwriadu mynd ati i hysbysebu'r swydd honno oherwydd y cynnig a dderbyniwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 1 Chwefror. Ni allaf weld sut y gallai hynny fod wedi'ch rhwystro rhag hysbysebu am gadeirydd dros dro neu chwilio am un. Mae swydd cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau'n un uchel sydd yn dwyn cryn gyfrifoldeb, ac mae'r penodi i'r swydd hon yn dilyn proses hir. Yn sicr, ni wnaethoch weithredu'n gyflym. Nid yw'r ffaith eich bod wedi gadael y mater hwn tan yr unfed awr ar ddeg wedi ennyn dim hyder yng nghyngor y celfyddydau, yn sicr, fel y daeth yn amlwg o sylwadau ei aelodau ac, yn wir, o sylwadau gan rai yn sector y celfyddydau. Mae'r anghydfod hwn wedi uno pawb sydd yn gweithio ym myd y celfyddydau, ond yr ydych wedi'u trin mewn modd di-hid, oediog a chywilyddus o annifyr. Mae hynny'n sicr yn beth eironig.

Byddwch yn gwbl ymwybodol bod cyngor y celfyddydau wedi galw am ymestyn contract y cadeirydd presennol. Yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r rhai yn sector y celfyddydau'n dymuno hynny, ac yn ei gefnogi. A wnewch gadarnhau a benderfynasoch chi neu'r Prif Weinidog drafod y sefyllfa o ran y penodiad dros dro gyda'r cadeirydd presennol? Wrth gwrs, yr oedd yn dal i fod yn gadeirydd ar ôl 23 Rhagfyr ac, yn wir, bydd yn parhau yn y swydd tan 31 Mawrth. A wnaethoch drafod y posibilrwydd o benodi cadeirydd dros dro ydag ef?

A wnewch gadarnhau bod y penodiad wedi ei wneud yn unol â thelerau'r siarter frenhinol? A ydych yn sicr y bydd y Comisiwn Elusennau a Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd

Commissioner for Public Appointments will be content with your actions, and the timetable for your actions, in this matter?

In the long term, your Government must come up with a proper timetable to appoint a chair proper, so that the process of the review of the arts and that of selecting the chair proper—not an interim chair—do not overlap. The wisest course of action would be to understand that the earliest time to appoint the post of chair proper should be after the completion of the review of the arts and after the Assembly has voted on it. Can you confirm what will happen, because you could not do that at the last meeting of the committee?

In respect of your comments at the committee meeting on 8 March, which part of the review into the culture strategy do you hope to abandon while the review into the arts goes on? You did not make that clear either.

We hope that the review into the arts will be an intelligent and expert investigation into how best to govern the arts in Wales. It will hopefully be different to the lamentable chaos that has been the hallmark of the Assembly Government's watch and treatment of the arts council since 23 December last year.

Alun Pugh: I have appointed an interim chair, and that was the subject of my announcement this afternoon. I had hoped that a long-term appointment would be resolved by now, but that would be to ignore the history of this matter, the statement that I made after Christmas, and the Plenary debate and opposition resolution, that the Government did not support but which the Assembly decided to adopt. That has certainly changed things. The role of the arts council chair may well change depending upon the review. Therefore, it is very difficult to go through a full public appointments process, complete with public advertisements, when the job may move around. I want to make a long-term appointment as soon as possible after the Plenary discussion on it, but there does not seem to be a point in making the appointment until we have an idea of the stability of the

Penodiadau Cyhoeddus yn fodlon ar eich gweithredoedd, a'r amserlen ar gyfer eich gweithredoedd, yn y mater hwn?

Yn y tymor hir, rhaid i'ch Llywodraeth roi amserlen briodol gerbron ar gyfer penodi cadeirydd iawn, fel na fydd proses yr adolygiad o'r celfyddydau a honno ar gyfer dewis y cadeirydd iawn—nid cadeirydd dros dro—yn gorgyffwrdd. Y dull gweithredu doethaf fyddai rhoi ar ddeall y dylai'r adeg gynharaf ar gyfer penodi'r cadeirydd iawn fod ar ôl cwblhau'r adolygiad o'r celfyddydau ac ar ôl i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio arno. A allwch gadarnhau beth fydd yn digwydd, oherwydd ni allech wneud hynny yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y pwyllgor?

O ran eich sylwadau yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor ar 8 Mawrth, pa ran o'r adolygiad o'r strategaeth ddiwylliant yr ydych yn gobeithio rhoi'r gorau iddi tra bo'r adolygiad o'r celfyddydau yn mynd rhagddo? Ni wnaethoch hynny'n glir ychwaith.

Gobeithiwn y bydd yr adolygiad o'r celfyddydau yn ymchwiliad deallus ac arbenigol i'r ffordd orau o lywodraethu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru. Bydd, gobeithio, yn wahanol i'r anhrefn druenus sydd wedi nodweddu'r modd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymdrin â chyngor y celfyddydau ers 23 Rhagfyr y llynedd.

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf wedi penodi cadeirydd dros dro, a dyna oedd testun fy nghyhoeddiad y prynhawn yma. Yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio y byddai penodiad hirdymor wedi bod yn bosibl erbyn hyn, ond byddai hynny'n anwybyddu hanes y mater hwn, y datganiad a wneuthum ar ôl y Nadolig, a'r ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a phenderfyniad yr wrthblaid, nad oedd y Llywodraeth yn ei gefnogi ond y penderfynodd y Cynulliad ei fabwysiadu. Mae hynny yn sicr wedi newid pethau. Mae'n gwbl bosibl y gwnaiff rôl cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau newid, gan ddibynnu ar yr adolygiad. Felly, mae'n anodd iawn mynd drwy broses lawn penodiad cyhoeddus, gyda hysbysebion cyhoeddus, pan allai'r swydd newid. Yr wyf am wneud penodiad hirdymor cyn gynted â phosibl ar ôl y drafodaeth arni mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, ond nid oes fawr o bwrpas mae'n debyg mewn gwneud y penodiad nes bydd gennym syniad

job and until the review is completed and Plenary has given its view on it. I want to make that long-term appointment as soon as possible.

You talk about responsibilities in this area. As I made clear in last week's meeting of the committee, the arts council has a responsibility to appoint a vice-chair. That was an item on its agenda last Friday, and it decided that it could not do so then. As Minister, in terms of governance, I have a responsibility to ensure that the arts council is chaired, and that is what I have done in terms of this afternoon's statement.

You referred to the public appointments code. As a Government, we have complied with the code, and there is no doubt about that. I find it a little disappointing that the opposition parties do not want to talk about the budget for the arts, the record spending or arts policy. They are exclusively focused on process—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is responding to questions on his statement.

Alun Pugh: They are exclusively focused on process and personalities, and while they do that, they will continue to lose elections.

Jenny Randerson: I have read the statement with great care, and it fails to answer a number of key questions. On the timescale of the appointment of a replacement chair, you sacked Geraint Talfan Davies 95 days ago on 23 December. It might surprise some people—not in the Assembly, but outside—that the timescale for public appointments made it impossibly tight to replace him by the end of this month, even if you had acted immediately on 23 December. The guidance says that you must allow at least six months. By any estimation, you had barely three months. At the time of your statements to Plenary and to the committee on 10 January and 19 January respectively, you assured us that advertisements would appear shortly and that the code of practice for ministerial appointments to public bodies would be

ynghylch pa mor sefydlog fydd y swydd ac nes bydd yr adolygiad wedi cael ei gwblhau a bod Cyfarfod Llawn wedi rhoi ei farn arno. Yr wyf am wneud y penodiad hirdymor hwnnw cyn gynted â phosibl.

Yr ydych yn siarad am gyfrifoldebau yn y maes hwn. Fel y gwneuthum yn glir yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, mae gan gyngor y celfyddydau gyfrifoldeb i benodi is-gadeirydd. Yr oedd yr eitem honno ar ei agenda ddydd Gwener diwethaf, a phenderfynodd na allai wneud hynny bryd hynny. Fel Gweinidog, o ran llywodraethu, mae gennyf gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau bod gan gyngor y celfyddydau gadeirydd, a dyna yr ydwyf wedi ei wneud o safbwynt y datganiad y prynhawn yma.

Cyfeiriasoch at y cod penodiadau cyhoeddus. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi cydymffurfio â'r cod, ac nid oes amheuaeth am hynny. Yr wyf braidd yn siomedig nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau am siarad am y gyllideb ar gyfer y celfyddydau, y gwariant uchaf erioed na'r polisi ar y celfyddydau. Maent yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar broses—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb i gwestiynau am ei ddatganiad.

Alun Pugh: Maent yn canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar broses a phersonoliaethau, a thra byddant yn gwneud hynny, byddant yn dal i golli etholiadau.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf wedi darllen y datganiad yn hynod o ofalus, ac nid yw'n ateb nifer o gwestiynau allweddol. O ran yr amserlen i benodi cadeirydd newydd, cafodd Geraint Talfan Davies ei ddiswyddo gennych 95 o ddiwrnodau'n ôl ar 23 Rhagfyr. Efallai y byddai'n peri syndod i rai pobl—nid yn y Cynulliad, ond y tu allan—fod yr amserlen ar gyfer penodiadau cyhoeddus yn ei gwneud yn amhosibl o dynn i sefydlu rhywun yn ei le erbyn diwedd y mis hwn, hyd yn oed pe baech wedi gweithredu ar unwaith ar 23 Rhagfyr. Dywed y canllawiau fod yn rhaid ichi ganiatáu o leiaf chwe mis. Yn ôl unrhyw amcangyfrif, prin bod gennych dri mis. Pan wnaethoch eich datganiadau i'r Cyfarfod Llawn a'r pwyllgor ar 10 Ionawr ac 19 Ionawr, y naill a'r llall, rhoddasoch sicrwydd inni y byddai hysbysebion yn ymddangos yn

followed in its entirety. However, you did not proceed to follow that, but you dilly-dallied—and that is the polite word for it—until events caught up with you when, taken by surprise by the opposition in February, you were forced to reconsider your plan to appoint a replacement chair.

fuan ac y byddech yn cadw at y cod ymarfer ar gyfer penodiadau gan weinidogion i gyrff cyhoeddus yn ei gyfanrwydd. Fodd bynnag, nid aethoch ymlaen i ddilyn y cod, ond buoch yn ymdroi—a'i ddisgrifio'n gwrtais—nes i ddigwyddiadau fynd yn drech na chi ym mis Chwefror pan orfodwyd chi, ar ôl i'r wrthblaid weithredu mewn modd annisgwyl ichi, i ailystyried eich cynllun i benodi cadeirydd newydd.

3.20 p.m.

I agree that, in the circumstances, appointing an interim chair is the only way ahead because, for obvious reasons, the person appointed would want to know what sort of job they were taking on. Can you, however, understand that there is deep suspicion about your whole behaviour, not least because, last week, you refused to confirm to the committee whom you were planning to appoint? Can you tell us exactly when you appointed Dai Smith and when you had your conversation with him? His name as someone who had been offered the job was circulating at least a week, probably a fortnight, ago, and it would have been useful to have known that. Do you recognise that there are codes of practice on this in this place? There are not just the codes of the Office of the Commissioner for Public Appointments but there is the Ministerial Code? That says,

Yr wyf yn cytuno, o dan yr amgylchiadau, mai penodi cadeirydd dros dro yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen oherwydd, am resymau amlwg, byddai'r sawl a gâi ei benodi am wybod pa fath o swydd y byddai'n ymgymryd â hi. A allwch, fodd bynnag, ddeall bod drwgdybiaeth ddofn ynglŷn â'ch ymddygiad drwyddo draw, i raddau oherwydd ichi, yr wythnos diwethaf, wrthod cadarnhau wrth y pwyllgor pwy yr oeddech yn bwriadu ei benodi? A allwch ddweud wrthym pryd yn union y penodasoch Dai Smith a phryd y cawsoch eich sgwrs ag ef? Yr oedd ei enw fel rhywun a oedd wedi cael cynnig y swydd ar led o leiaf wythnos, bythefnos mae'n debyg, yn ôl, a byddai wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol cael gwybod hynny. A ydych yn cydnabod bod codau ymarfer ar hyn yn y lle hwn? Nid yn unig y mae gennym godau Swyddfa'r Comisiynydd dros Benodiadau Cyhoeddus ond mae Cod y Gweinidogion? Dywed hwnnw,

'No appointment shall be made by an Assembly Minister without consultation with the relevant subject committee through its two nominees'.

Ni chaiff dim un penodiad ei wneud gan Weinidog yn y Cynulliad heb ymgynghori â'r pwyllgor pwnc perthnasol drwy ei ddau enwebai.

I am well aware of the usual practice on this and there is no reason why, even in these unusual circumstances, that practice should not have been followed. Have you, at any point up to now, consulted either of the two nominees of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee? I know, for a start, that you have not consulted one of them, and I would like your answer in relation to the other one.

Yr wyf yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r arfer cyffredin ar hyn ac nid oes dim rheswm pam na ellid bod wedi dilyn yr arfer hwnnw, hyd yn oed o dan yr amgylchiadau anarferol hyn. A ydych, ar unrhyw adeg hyd yma, wedi ymgynghori â'r naill neu'r llall o ddau enwebai'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon? Gwn, yn gyntaf oll, nad ydych wedi ymgynghori ag un ohonynt, a hoffwn gael ateb gennych mewn perthynas â'r llall.

Having wasted time, put yourself in a position where you could not possibly have made an appointment from the outset, having

Ar ôl gwastraffu amser, rhoi eich hun mewn sefyllfa lle na fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl ichi wneud penodiad o'r cychwyn, wedi

decided on this strange course of action of not reappointing the chair and having failed to consult with the opposition parties, which, even at this late stage, could have brought co-ordination and co-operation in terms of the new chair, because the new chair deserves the support of everyone at a difficult time, you have managed to create further chaos in an already chaotic situation, which is 100 per cent of your making. At what point, on what date, did you consult the Commissioner for Public Appointments in order to be able to deviate from the normal standards of public appointments because of exceptional circumstances?

Alun Pugh: You have several simple facts wrong there, I am afraid, Jenny. You used the word 'sacked'. No-one has been sacked. The current chair's appointment runs out on Saturday, 1 April. No-one has been sacked.

I said in my statement way back in January that I intended to advertise the post and go through the full, normal process, which involves public advertisements and bringing in the members of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee. The code has been followed and there has been a dialogue between the Assembly Government and the Commissioner for Public Appointments. I was saddened, but not surprised, by the Plenary business that we had on 1 February. It was only natural that, after the opposition parties voted to cut culture funding in the budget, which is what happened— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'No.'] Yes you did. If you look at the Assembly Government's original published intentions for culture spending, you will see that as a result of the budget dialogue, culture funding was cut. That was not the Assembly Government's intention. Therefore, it was only natural that you would seek to engage in party political mischief to cover that up.

I do not accept that I behaved improperly in any way whatsoever. This row has largely been manufactured. Let us face it: we have an interim chair of the arts council, who is a member of the arts council, and he will be

penderfynu ar y dull rhyfedd hwn o weithredu drwy beidio ag ailbenodi'r cadeirydd ac wedi methu ymgynghori â'r gwrthbleidiau, rhywbeth a allai, hyd yn oed mor hwyr â hyn, fod wedi dod â chydrefniant a chydweithrediad o safbwynt y cadeirydd newydd, oherwydd y mae'r cadeirydd newydd yn haeddu cefnogaeth pawb ar adeg anodd, yr ydych wedi llwyddo i greu rhagor o anhrefn mewn sefyllfa a oedd eisoes yn llawn anhrefn, a hynny wedi'i achosi'n gyfan gwbl gennych chi. Ar ba adeg, ar ba ddyddiad, yr ymgynghorasoch â'r Comisiwn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus er mwyn gallu gwyro oddi wrth safonau normal penodiadau cyhoeddus oherwydd amgylchiadau eithriadol?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych wedi cael sawl ffaith syml yn anghywir, mae arnaf ofn, Jenny. Defnyddiasoch y gair 'diswyddo'. Nid oes neb wedi cael ei ddiswyddo. Daw penodiad y cadeirydd cyfredol i ben ddydd Sadwrn, 1 Ebrill. Nid oes neb wedi cael ei ddiswyddo.

Dywedais yn fy natganiad ym mis Ionawr fy mod yn bwriadu hysbysebu'r swydd a mynd drwy'r broses normal, lawn, sy'n golygu hysbysebion cyhoeddus a dod ag aelodau'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon i mewn. Mae'r cod wedi cael ei ddilyn a bu deialog rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Comisiynydd Penodiadau Cyhoeddus. Cefais fy nhristáu, ond nid fy synnu, gan y busnes a gawsom yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 1 Chwefror. Yr oedd yn hollol naturiol, ar ôl i'r gwrthbleidiau bleidleisio i dorri'r cyllid ar gyfer diwylliant yn y gyllideb, a dyna a ddigwyddodd— [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Na.'] Dyna a wnaethoch. Os edrychwch ar y bwriadau gwreiddiol a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran gwariant ar ddiwylliant, fe welwch fod y cyllid ar gyfer diwylliant wedi cael ei gwtogi o ganlyniad i'r deialog am y gyllideb. Nid hynny oedd bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, yr oedd yn hollol naturiol eich bod yn ceisio codi cynnen wleidyddol i gelu hynny.

Nid wyf yn derbyn imi ymddwyn yn amhriodol mewn modd yn y byd. Ffrae wneud yw hon gan mwyaf. Gadewch inni wynebu hyn: mae gennym gadeirydd interim i gyngor y celfyddydau, a bydd yn ymgymryd

taking the chair on a temporary basis while the review completes its business. I do not see anything strange or special about that.

Rosemary Butler: I would like to congratulate you on appointing such a distinguished person as Elan Closs Stephens to chair the review panel. I look forward to the announcement on the other members in the near future. I welcome Professor Smith to his role, and I look forward to his attendance at the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee and to hear how he will deliver on your ambitions and priorities between now and December.

I am sure that you will join me in thanking all the members of the arts council for giving so much of their time freely for the benefit of the arts across Wales. I would particularly like to thank Geraint Talfan Davies for his hard work during the past three years. I would like to thank you, Minister, for taking the committee's recommendations on board. Will you assure us that the review panel will be asked to look at best practice across Europe, and not just in Wales, so that we have a review that will recommend a programme of excellence for the twenty-first century?

Alun Pugh: We have a pair of first-rate appointments. Elan Closs Stephens will do a great job in bringing together the review team, and I look forward to engaging in a dialogue as that review unfolds. I keenly anticipate the outcome of the report. Again, Professor Smith will be the interim chair of the arts council for a few months. I am anxious to get this onto a full-time basis as soon as possible, shortly after the review. In terms of your remarks about Geraint Talfan Davies, who continues to chair the arts council until Saturday, he is an incredibly hard worker. I know that he has been enormously active in the arts, particularly during the past few months.

Denise Idris Jones: I, along with the Chair of the committee, would like to welcome the appointment of Professor Dai Smith to the interim position of chair of the arts council. I am pleased that you confirmed that his

â'r gadair ar sail dros dro tra bo'r adolygiad yn cwblhau ei waith. Ni welaf ddim byd yn rhyfedd nac yn arbennig am hynny.

Rosemary Butler: Hoffwn eich llongyfarch ar benodi rhywun mor nodedig ag Elan Closs Stephens i gadeirio'r panel adolygu. Edrychaf ymlaen at y cyhoeddiad am yr aelodau eraill yn y dyfodol agos. Croesawaf yr Athro Smith i'w rôl, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei bresenoldeb yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ac at glywed sut y bydd yn gwireddu eich uchelgeisiau a'ch blaenoriaethau rhwng hyn a mis Rhagfyr.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch ymuno â mi i ddiolch i holl aelodau cyngor y celfyddydau am roi cymaint o'u hamser o'u gwirfodd er budd y celfyddydau ar draws Cymru. Hoffwn ddiolch yn arbennig i Geraint Talfan Davies am ei waith caled dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Hoffwn ddiolch i chi, Weinidog, am dderbyn argymhellion y pwyllgor. A wnewch roi sicrwydd inni y gofynnir i'r panel adolygu edrych ar yr arferion gorau ar draws Ewrop, nid dim ond yng Nghymru, fel bod gennym adolygiad a fydd yn argymhell rhaglen o ragoriaeth ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain?

Alun Pugh: Mae gennym bâr o benodiadau o'r radd flaenaf. Fe wnaiff Elan Closs Stephens waith rhagorol wrth ddod â'r tîm adolygu ynghyd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyfrannu at ddeialog wrth i'r adolygiad hwnnw fynd rhagddo. Yr wyf yn disgwyl yn eiddgar am ganlyniad yr adroddiad. Eto, bydd yr Athro Smith yn gadeirydd interim ar gyngor y celfyddydau am ychydig fisoedd. Yr wyf yn awyddus i sefydlu hyn ar sail lawnamser cyn gynted â phosibl, yn fuan ar ôl yr adolygiad. O ran eich sylwadau am Geraint Talfan Davies, sy'n dal i gadeirio cyngor y celfyddydau tan ddydd Sadwrn, mae'n weithiwr anhygoel o galed. Gwn ei fod wedi bod yn eithriadol o weithgar yn y celfyddydau, yn enwedig dros y misoedd diwethaf.

Denise Idris Jones: Hoffwn i, ynghyd â Chadeirydd y pwyllgor, groesawu penodi'r Athro Dai Smith i swydd dros dro cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau. Yr wyf yn falch ichi gadarnhau bod ei benodiad yn unol â'r

appointment was in accordance with the national appointments regulations. I am sure that you would agree that Professor Smith has done an excellent job with the Library of Wales.

Alun Pugh: Professor Smith has done a tremendous job on behalf of the Assembly Government in terms of the Library of Wales project. The academic scholarship that he has brought to the series enhances the titles immeasurably. As well as being an excellent academic success, the books seem set to be an enormous commercial success.

Leighton Andrews: I also wish to welcome the appointment of Elan Closs Stephens, who will bring academic rigour to the review of the arts. I also thank Geraint Talfan Davies for his work as chair of the arts council. Do you agree that Professor Dai Smith is one of our leading social and cultural historians? Do you also agree that he had a distinguished career at BBC Wales as head of English-language programmes, where he commissioned dramas of significance, such as Karl Francis's *Street Life* and Trevor Griffiths's *Food for Ravens*? Do you agree that Dai Smith's robust common sense and intellectual integrity are precisely the qualities that the arts council needs at this moment?

Alun Pugh: Indeed. Professor Smith has a long record of scholarship, and you are right to draw the Chamber's attention to that. He has also had a successful management career, and not many people can boast having both.

Michael German: I wish to repeat a question that Jenny Randerson asked, which the Minister failed to answer, which relates to the fact that even had he followed his own timetable, when he effectively sacked Geraint Talfan Davies, there was then insufficient time in which to appoint a new full-time chair. Was the Minister deluding the Assembly in believing that he could have a chair in place? If that was not the case, when did he expect to have a chair in place? By sleepwalking with his eyes wide open in terms of this matter, he has made an adamant

rheoliadau penodi cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod yr Athro Smith wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol gyda Llyfrgell Cymru.

Alun Pugh: Mae'r Athro Smith wedi gwneud gwaith aruthrol ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o safbwynt prosiect Llyfrgell Cymru. Mae'r ysgolheictod academiaidd y mae wedi ei gyfrannu at y gyfres yn gwella'r teitlau'n anfesuradwy. Yn ogystal â bod yn llwyddiant academiaidd rhagorol, mae'n ymddangos y bydd y llyfrau yn llwyddiant masnachol enfawr.

Leighton Andrews: Hoffwn innau hefyd groesawu penodiad Elan Closs Stephens, a fydd yn dod â thrylwyredd academiaidd i'r adolygiad o'r celfyddydau. Diolchaf hefyd i Geraint Talfan Davies am ei waith fel cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau. A ydych yn cytuno bod yr Athro Dai Smith yn un o'n prif haneswyr cymdeithasol a diwylliannol? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd iddo gael gyrfa nodedig yn BBC Wales fel pennaeth rhaglenni Saesneg, lle y comisiynodd ddramâu o bwys, fel *Street Life* gan Karl Francis a *Food for Ravens* gan Trevor Griffiths? A ydych yn cytuno mai synnwyr cyffredin cryf Dai Smith a'i unplygrwydd deallusol yw'r union briodweddau y mae ar gyngor y celfyddydau eu hangen ar hyn o bryd?

Alun Pugh: Yn wir. Mae gan yr Athro Smith record hir o ysgolheictod, ac yr ydych yn hollol iawn wrth dynnu sylw'r Siambr at hynny. Mae hefyd wedi cael gyrfa reoli lwyddiannus, ac nid oes llawer o bobl a all ymffrostio bod ganddynt y naill a'r llall.

Michael German: Hoffwn ailadrodd cwestiwn a ofynnodd Jenny Randerson, nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi ei ateb, sy'n ymwneud â'r ffaith, hyd yn oed pe bai wedi dilyn ei amserlen ei hun, pan ddiswyddodd Geraint Talfan Davies i bob diben, nad oedd digon o amser i benodi cadeirydd llawnamser newydd. A oedd y Gweinidog yn twyllo'r Cynulliad wrth gredu y gallai gael cadeirydd yn y swydd? Os nad felly yr oedd hi, pryd yr oedd ef yn disgwyl cael cadeirydd yn y swydd? Drwy gerdded yn ei gwsg gyda'i lygaid ar agor o safbwynt y mater hwn, mae

case for having an arts council that is at an arm's length from the Welsh Assembly Government.

Alun Pugh: You mentioned the word 'sacked' twice during that contribution. No-one has been sacked, effectively or otherwise. A fixed-term contract has come to its end. It is possible that there will be a short overlap of a couple of weeks. However, as I said in my statement, the Assembly's debate and the resolution that was carried on 1 February has made it impossible to make a full-term appointment at this stage.

3.30 p.m.

Nick Bourne: The Minister's alibi simply does not add up. If he really was going to appoint an interim chairman to take over for the period until 31 March, that process would have to have started long before he told Geraint Talfan Davies that he would have to reapply for his job. That was when he was effectively sacked, and the Minister knows that. His handling of this process has been absolutely disastrous. For him to stand there and lecture us about being partisan as opposition members with regard to someone who has been as non-partisan as Geraint Talfan Davies, who was wanted by the arts community of Wales, who was wanted by the Arts Council of Wales, and who was wanted by the opposition parties, and to pretend that he has acted in anything other than a partisan, political, personal way flies in the face of the evidence.

Why is it that you felt unable to reappoint Geraint Talfan Davies for that short interim period when you knew that that was the universal choice of the arts council and when you knew that it was the view of the arts community? Why, if you are not behaving in a personal way, was that not an appropriate way to move so that we could have had universal approval here? You would not then have had to wheel out the members of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee with their pre-written scripts to say what a great guy Geraint Talfan Davies is, but, nevertheless, he will not be renewed because we think that this guy is even better?

wedi cyflwyno achos diymwad o blaid cael cyngor y celfyddydau sydd hyd braich oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Alun Pugh: Crybwyllasoch y gair 'diswyddo' ddwywaith yn ystod y cyfraniad hwnnw. Nid oes neb wedi cael ei ddiswyddo, i bob diben nac fel arall. Mae contract cyfnod penodol wedi dod i ben. Mae'n bosibl y ceir ychydig o orgyffwrdd am rai wythnosau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, mae'r ddadl yn y Cynulliad a'r penderfyniad a basiwyd ar 1 Chwefror wedi ei gwneud yn amhosibl gwneud penodiad tymor llawn yn awr.

Nick Bourne: Nid yw alibi'r Gweinidog yn gwneud synnwyr. Os oedd mewn gwirionedd yn bwriadu penodi cadeirydd dros dro i gymryd yr awenau tan 31 Mawrth, byddai'r broses honno wedi dechrau ymhell cyn iddo ddweud wrth Geraint Talfan Davies y byddai'n rhaid iddo ailymgeisio am ei swydd. Dyna pryd y cafodd ei ddiswyddo mewn gwirionedd, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod hynny. Mae wedi delio â'r broses yn gwbl drychinebus. Mae'r modd y mae'n pregethu wrthym ynghylch bod yn bleidiol fel aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau ynghylch rhywun sydd wedi bod mor amhleidiol â Geraint Talfan Davies, rhywun yr oedd ar gymuned y celfyddydau yng Nghymru, Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, a'r gwrthbleidiau i gyd eisiau ei gael, a chymryd arno nad yw wedi ymddwyn mewn ffordd sy'n amlwg yn bleidiol, gwleidyddol a phersonol yn mynd yn gwbl groes i'r dystiolaeth.

Pam yr oeddech yn teimlo na allech ailbenodi Geraint Talfan Davies am y cyfnod dros dro byr hwnnw a chithau'n gwybod mai ef oedd dewis unfrydol cyngor y celfyddydau ac yn gwybod hefyd mai dyna oedd barn cymuned y celfyddydau? Pam, os nad ydych yn ymddwyn yn bersonol, nad oedd hynny'n gam priodol i'w gymryd fel y byddai gennym sêl bendith unfrydol ar hyn? Ni fydddech wedyn wedi gorfod galw ar aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon a'u sgriptiau parod i ddweud cystal boi yw Geraint Talfan Davies, ond, er hynny, na fydd yn cael ei ailbenodi oherwydd ein bod o'r farn bod y boi hwn yn well fyth?

He will labour under the difficulties, because of the Minister's disastrous handling of this.

Alun Pugh: We have been through this on many occasions; we have been through it in Plenary, and we have been through it in committee. The opposition is entirely fixated on issues of process and personalities. It does not want to talk about budgets, delivery or arts policy, and does not want to ensure that the record spending on the arts—£27 million of public money—gets to every single community in Wales.

Nick Bourne: Answer the question, Minister.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister has just answered the question. [*Interruption.*] Yes, he has; in terms of order, he has. The content is not a matter for me.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: What we expected from the Minister today was a degree of contrition and humility; what we got was bluff and bluster. This Minister has handled this situation appallingly. He has let down the arts community, and, frankly, he has let down his colleagues in Government in Wales on this issue. The reason that we cannot ask questions about the budget is that his statement is about process. His statement is about the process of the review and it is about the process of the appointment of the interim chair of the arts council.

I will ask him three questions on that appointment. Will he answer the question regarding why he would not, at the request of the members of the arts council, appoint Geraint Talfan Davies as the interim chair? Can he answer that question directly? He has refused so far. Question two is: will he tell us how many members of the arts council he and the First Minister personally rang up pleading with them to take the post of interim chair of the council? The third question is: how many people did he ask to take the chair before Dai Smith was appointed, and how many refused to do so?

Bydd yn wynebu anawsterau wrth ei waith, oherwydd bod y Gweinidog wedi delio â'r mater mor drychinebus.

Alun Pugh: Yr ydym wedi trafod hyn droeon; yr ydym wedi'i drafod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, ac wedi'i drafod mewn pwyllgor. Mae gan y gwrthbleidiau obsesiwn â phroses a phersonoliaethau. Nid yw am siarad am gyllidebau, gweithredu na pholisi'r celfyddydau, ac nid yw am sicrhau bod y gwariant mwyaf erioed ar y celfyddydau—£27 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus—yn mynd i bob cymuned yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Atebwch y cwestiwn, Weinidog.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog newydd ateb y cwestiwn. [*Torri ar draws.*] Ydyw, mae wedi gwneud; o ran y drefn, mae wedi gwneud hynny. Nid mater i mi yw ei gynnwys.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr hyn yr oeddem yn ei ddisgwyl gan y Gweinidog heddiw oedd mymryn o edifeirwch a gwyleidd-dra; yr hyn a gawsom oedd blyffio ac arthio. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymdrin â'r sefyllfa hon yn warthus. Mae wedi siomi cymuned y celfyddydau, ac, a dweud y gwir, mae wedi siomi ei gyd-Weinidogion yn y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru ar y mater hwn. Y rheswm na allwn ofyn cwestiynau am y gyllideb yw oherwydd bod ei ddatganiad yn sôn am broses. Mae ei ddatganiad yn trafod proses yr adolygiad a honno'n broses ar gyfer penodi cadeirydd dros dro i gyngor y celfyddydau.

Gofynnaf dri chwestiwn iddo am y penodiad hwnnw. A wnaiff ateb y cwestiwn ynghylch pam na wnâi benodi Geraint Talfan Davies yn gadeirydd dros dro, a hynny ar gais aelodau o gyngor y celfyddydau? A ydyw'n gallu ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw'n uniongyrchol? Mae wedi gwrthod hyd yma. Yr ail gwestiwn yw hwn: a wnaiff ddweud wrthym faint o aelodau cyngor y celfyddydau a gafodd alwad ffôn ganddo ef a'r Prif Weinidog yn bersonol yn erfyn arnynt dderbyn y swydd fel cadeirydd dros dro'r cyngor? Y trydydd cwestiwn yw: faint o bobl y gofynnodd iddynt dderbyn y gadair cyn penodi Dai Smith, a faint a wrthododd?

Alun Pugh: I certainly have nothing to apologise for in terms of my conduct. Under my watch, we have delivered record spending on the arts, and venues have opened all over Wales. It is my responsibility as Minister, and no-one else's, to ensure that the arts council is adequately chaired; I have discharged that responsibility. It is the responsibility of the arts council to appoint its vice-chair, and I look forward to that appointment taking place very soon.

Alun Pugh: Yn sicr nid oes gennyf ddim byd i ymddiheuro yn ei gylch o ran fy ymddygiad. Ers pan wyf yn y swydd hon, yr ydym wedi gwario mwy nag erioed ar y celfyddydau, ac mae canolfannau wedi agor ar hyd a lled Cymru. Fy nghyfrifoldeb i fel Gweinidog, a neb arall, yw sicrhau bod cyngor y celfyddydau'n cael ei gadeirio'n iawn; yr wyf wedi cyflawni'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Cyfrifoldeb cyngor y celfyddydau yw penodi is-gadeirydd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed am y penodiad hwnnw yn fuan iawn.

I have, not surprisingly, had many conversations with the arts council—collectively, in groups, and individually. The First Minister and I met the vice-chair and two members on 20 March. We said that there were advantages to one of the members becoming the interim chair. The council, at its meeting last Friday, declined to respond positively to this or, as I have said, to appoint a vice-chair. Since that meeting, I have spoken with arts council members, including Dai Smith. It became clear that, on further reflection, Dai Smith was prepared to accept appointment as interim chair and I know that he will do a superb job. *[Interruption.]*

Yr wyf, yn naturiol, wedi cael sawl sgwrs â chyngor y celfyddydau—gyda'r corff cyfan, mewn grwpiau ac yn unigol. Cyfarfu'r Prif Weinidog a minnau â'r is-gadeirydd a dau aelod ar 20 Mawrth. Dywedasom fod manteision gyda phenodi un o'r aelodau'n gadeirydd dros dro. Yn ei gyfarfod ddydd Gwener diwethaf, gwrthododd y cyngor ymateb yn gadarnhaol i hyn na phenodi is-gadeirydd, fel y dywedais. Ers y cyfarfod hwnnw, cefais air ag aelodau o gyngor y celfyddydau, gan gynnwys Dai Smith. Daeth yn glir, ar ôl ystyried ymhellach, fod Dai Smith yn barod i gael ei benodi'n gadeirydd dros dro a gwn y bydd yn un gwych iawn. *[Torri ar draws.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not wish to discuss the reputation of any of my old friends in the Chamber.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf am drafod enw da neb o'm hen gyfeillion yn y Siambr.

**Datganiad am Amserau Ymateb Ambiwylansys a'r Adolygiad a Gynhaliwyd gan
Wasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru
Statement on Ambulance Response Times and the Review Carried Out by the Welsh
Ambulance Service**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The latest quarterly statistics for the performance of the emergency ambulance service, namely the quarter ending on 31 December 2005, show that 82.6 per cent of responses to emergency calls arrived within target times.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Dengys yr ystadegau chwarterol diweddaraf ar gyfer perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans brys, sef y chwarter a ddaeth i ben ar 31 Rhagfyr 2005, fod 82.6 y cant o'r ymatebion i alwadau brys o fewn yr amseroedd targed.

That was achieved despite increasing demand which saw the highest recorded number of 999 ambulance calls—71,500, received in a single quarter. Over 35,000 of these calls were categorised as category A, immediately life-threatening calls, which require a first response within eight minutes.

Llwyddwyd i gyflawni hyn er gwaetha'r cynnydd mewn galw a barodd y nifer fwyaf erioed o alwadau ambiwlans 999—71,500, a dderbyniwyd mewn un chwarter. Yr oedd dros 35,000 o'r galwadau hyn yn rhai categori A, sef galwadau ynghylch achosion sy'n bygwth bywyd yn y fan a'r lle, ac sydd

angen ymateb cyntaf iddynt o fewn wyth munud.

A figure of 55.7 per cent of first responses to category-A calls arrived within eight minutes, 62.1 per cent within nine minutes and 67.3 per cent within 10 minutes, against a target of 75 per cent. I want the best possible ambulance service for the people of Wales and it is clear that the service currently being provided needs to improve, particularly in this important area of life-threatening calls. Measures are being taken to make this happen, including addressing staffing difficulties in the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust.

In March, the trust made two senior appointments to strengthen its management team. Roger Thayne, Chief Executive of Staffordshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust, was appointed to act as interim chief executive, on a part-time basis, to cover the current chief executive who is on long-term sick leave. Mr Thayne's deputy, Dr Anton Van Dellen, is assisting him, taking on the responsibility of director of operations—a post which became vacant following the retirement of the previous postholder.

Roger Thayne was formerly chief executive of Staffordshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust and, under his direction, it was consistently one of the highest performing ambulance trusts in England. I am sure that his interim appointment will be welcomed by both the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and the wider NHS community in Wales.

I am also pleased to advise you that a new chair has been appointed to the trust. Mr Stuart Fletcher will succeed the current chair, Mr Roy Norris, when he stands down from his term of office on 31 March 2006. Mr Fletcher is retired acting chief executive of Health Commission Wales and was previously chief executive of the Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust.

On the review of the Welsh Ambulance

Cyrhaeddodd 55.7 y cant o'r ymatebion cyntaf i alwadau categori A o fewn wyth munud, 62.1 y cant o fewn naw munud a 67.3 y cant o fewn 10 munud, yn erbyn targed o 75 y cant. Yr wyf am i bobl Cymru gael y gwasanaeth ambiwlans gorau posibl ac mae'n glir bod angen i'r gwasanaeth sy'n cael ei ddarparu ar hyn o bryd wella, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt y galwadau pwysig ar gyfer achosion sy'n bygwth bywyd. Mae camau'n cael eu cymryd i wneud hyn, gan gynnwys ymdrechion i ddelio â'r trafferthion staffio yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru.

Ym mis Mawrth, gwnaeth yr ymddiriedolaeth ddau uwch benodiad i gryfhau ei thîm rheoli. Penodwyd Roger Thayne, Prif Weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Swydd Stafford, yn brif weithredwr dros dro, rhan-amser, yn lle'r prif weithredwr presennol sydd ar absenoldeb salwch hirdymor. Mae dirprwy Mr Thayne, Dr Anton Van Dellen, yn ei gynorthwyo, a chanddo ef y bydd y cyfrifoldeb o fod yn gyfarwyddwr gweithrediadau—swydd a ddaeth yn wag ar ôl i ddeiliad blaenorol y swydd ymddeol.

Yn flaenorol, Roger Thayne oedd prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Swydd Stafford ac, o dan ei arweiniad, yr oedd yn un o'r ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans a oedd yn perfformio orau yn gyson yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ei benodiad dros dro yn cael ei groesawu gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru a chymuned ehangach y GIG yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o roi gwybod ichi fod cadeirydd newydd wedi'i benodi ar gyfer yr ymddiriedolaeth. Bydd Mr Stuart Fletcher yn olynu'r cadeirydd presennol, Mr Roy Norris, pan ddaw cyfnod ei swydd ef i ben ar 31 Mawrth 2006. Cyn ymddeol, Mr Fletcher oedd prif weithredwr dros dro Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a chyn hynny ef oedd prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen.

O ran yr adolygiad o wasanaethau gofal

Services NHS Trust's non-emergency patient care service, the service undertakes around 1.4 million non-emergency patient transport journeys each year. In August 2003, a serious incident occurred when a 93-year-old patient was transported home by the patient care service to the wrong address. She subsequently fell and injured herself and sadly died some weeks later in hospital. An independent external review was carried out into the events surrounding the incident to ensure that lessons could be learnt.

The review was undertaken by the chief executive of Blaenau Gwent Local Health Board with a written report presented to the Welsh Assembly Government Health and Social Care Department's clinical risk committee and the boards of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust and the Vale of Glamorgan Local Health Board.

The report identified action already taken in response to the incident by the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust and made nine recommendations. An action plan to address the recommendations was drawn up by both trusts, which was then monitored by the relevant regional offices. In addition, a standard procedure was developed and agreed by the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and NHS trusts for the handover of patients between carers and ambulance and hospital staff to ensure consistency and reduce the risk of future error.

In the interim, all trust chief executives were asked to confirm in writing that they were satisfied that safe procedures were in place. The standard procedure was issued as a Welsh Health Circular in February 2005. Included within that was a requirement to review the effectiveness of these arrangements; that is now being taken forward by Healthcare Inspectorate Wales. The 2003 incident is currently under consideration by the courts.

Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru ar gyfer cleifion nad ydynt yn achosion brys, mae'r gwasanaeth yn gwneud tua 1.4 miliwn o siwrneiau cludo cleifion fel hyn bob flwyddyn. Yn Awst 2003 mewn digwyddiad difrifol, cafodd claf 93 oed ei chludo adref gan y gwasanaeth gofal cleifion i'r cyfeiriad anghywir. Cafodd godwm ac anafu ei hun o ganlyniad a gwaetha'r modd bu farw rai wythnosau'n ddiweddarach yn yr ysbyty. Mae adolygiad annibynnol allanol wedi'i gynnal ynghylch yr hyn a arweiniodd at y digwyddiad er mwyn sicrhau bod gwersi'n cael eu dysgu.

Cafodd yr adolygiad ei gyflawni gan brif weithredwr Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Blaenau Gwent a chyflwynwyd adroddiad ysgrifenedig i bwyllgor risgiau clinigol Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a byrddau Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru, Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Bro Morgannwg.

Yr oedd yr adroddiad, a wnaeth naw o argymhellion, yn argymhell camau sydd eisoes wedi eu cymryd mewn ymateb i'r digwyddiad gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Lluniwyd cynllun i weithredu'r argymhellion gan y ddwy ymddiriedolaeth, a chafodd ei fonitro wedyn gan y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol perthnasol. Hefyd, mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru a'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG wedi datblygu a chytuno ar weithdrefn safonol ar gyfer trosglwyddo cleifion rhwng gofalwyr a staff ambiwlans ac ysbyty i sicrhau cysondeb ac i leihau'r perygl y bydd camgymeriad yn digwydd yn y dyfodol.

Yn y cyfamser, gofynnwyd i holl brif weithredwyr yr ymddiriedolaethau gadarnhau drwy lythyr eu bod yn sicr bod gweithdrefnau diogel ar waith. Cyflwynwyd y weithdrefn safonol ar ffurf Cylchlythyr Iechyd Cymru yn Chwefror 2005. Yr oedd yn cynnwys gofyniad i adolygu effeithiolrwydd y trefniadau hyn; mae hyn bellach yn cael ei drefnu gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru. Mae'r digwyddiad yn 2003 yn cael ei ystyried gan y llysoedd ar hyn o bryd.

I hope you are reassured that a great deal of work is being done to strengthen the management of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and to improve the performance of the ambulance service in Wales. The new management team at the trust, its commissioners, Health Commission Wales, and Welsh Assembly Government officials are working closely together to ensure that performance improvements already achieved are built upon and that we strive to deliver a first-class ambulance service for the people of Wales.

3.40 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I am sure that we are all pleased to hear that the Minister wants the best possible ambulance service for Wales; I am sure that we would all support him in that aspiration. I am also glad to see that he is prepared to acknowledge that that is not what we have yet, and that the current state of affairs is not satisfactory. I will press him a little further on some specific issues to test the extent to which he, as Minister, is on top of the situation.

I refer to the category-A target for which the Minister has given us the figures. Will he acknowledge that that target in itself has been reduced from the 65 per cent target to a 60 per cent target? Is he satisfied with a figure that, in layperson's terms, means that only just over half of those category-A calls get there in eight minutes? The figure of 55 per cent does not sound bad out of a target of 60 per cent, but I am sure that we would all be looking for a target, eventually, of 100 per cent.

What assessment is being made by the Minister and the trusts of geographical variations in that response time? If those figures are available, I apologise that I have not found them. Common sense would dictate that, the closer you are to an ambulance service or to a hospital, the more likely you are to see an emergency ambulance within eight minutes. Does the Minister acknowledge that there is real concern in some rural areas, particularly in parts of Powys, about long response times? Those averages cover a wide variation.

Gobeithio eich bod yn fwy tawel eich meddwl bod cryn dipyn o waith yn cael ei wneud i gryfhau rheolaeth Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru ac i wella perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Mae'r tîm rheoli newydd yn yr ymddiriedolaeth, ei chomisiynwyr, Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, a swyddogion o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos i sicrhau bod gwelliannau perfformiad sydd eisoes wedi eu gwneud yn cael eu cryfhau a'n bod yn ymeginio i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gorau i bobl Cymru.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn falch o glywed bod y Gweinidog am gael y gwasanaeth ambiwlans gorau posibl i Gymru; yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn ei gefnogi yn y dyhead hwnnw. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld ei fod yn barod i gydnabod nad ydym wedi cyflawni hynny eto, ac nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn foddhaol. Byddaf yn pwysu arno ymhellach ar rai materion penodol i weld i ba raddau y mae'r sefyllfa o dan ei reolaeth fel Gweinidog.

Cyfeiriai at y targed categori A y mae'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi ffigurau inni amdano. A wnaiff gydnabod bod y targed ei hun wedi'i ostwng o'r targed o 65 y cant i darged o 60 y cant? A ydyw'n fodlon â ffigur sydd, mewn geiriau syml, yn golygu mai dim ond ychydig dros hanner y galwadau categori A hynny sy'n cyrraedd ymhen wyth munud? Nid yw'r ffigur o 55 y cant yn swnio'n rhy ddrwg yn erbyn targed o 60 y cant, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn awyddus i gael targed o 100 y cant yn y pen draw.

Pa asesiad sy'n cael ei wneud gan y Gweinidog a'r ymddiriedolaethau o'r amrywiadau daearyddol yn yr amser ymateb hwnnw? Os yw'r ffigurau hynny ar gael, ymddiheuraf nad wyf wedi dod o hyd iddynt. Byddai synnwyr cyffredin yn awgrymu mai po agosaf yr ydych at wasanaeth ambiwlans neu at ysbyty, mwyaf tebygol yr ydych o weld ambiwlans brys o fewn wyth munud. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod gwir bryder mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig mewn rhannau o Bowys, ynghylch amseroedd ymateb hir? Mae'r cyfartaleddau

hynny yn cynnwys amrywiadau eang.

The Minister will, no doubt, remember that I have asked him a question about how many local ambulance stations have been closed in each local health board area since 1997. I was concerned that the Minister's reply to my written question was that that information was not collected centrally. How can the Minister and his officials make an assessment of the impact of closing those local ambulance stations and replacing them with stand-by arrangements if they do not even collect the information? That brings me back to my point about the extent to which the Minister is on top of all of this.

Diau y bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio fy mod wedi ei holi ynghylch faint o orsafoedd ambiwlans lleol sydd wedi cau ym mhob ardal bwrdd iechyd lleol ers 1997. Yr oeddwn yn poeni mai ymateb y Gweinidog i'm cwestiwn ysgrifenedig fyddai nad oedd y wybodaeth honno'n cael ei chasglu'n ganolog. Sut y gall y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion asesu effaith cau'r gorsafoedd ambiwlans lleol hynny a chyflwyno trefniadau aros galwad yn eu lle os nad ydynt hyd yn oed yn casglu'r wybodaeth? Daw hynny â mi'n ôl at fy mhwynt ynghylch i ba raddau y mae'r sefyllfa o dan reolaeth y Gweinidog.

The Minister's statement refers to ambulance trust, Health Commission Wales, and Assembly officials meeting regularly to monitor the situation. I am glad to hear that that will take place. However, will the Minister undertake to proactively monitor the outcome of those discussions to ensure that we have proper 24-hour cover as a minimum, and that that eight-minute target is something that is not just an aspiration, but something that can, eventually, be delivered for every community in Wales?

Mae datganiad y Gweinidog yn dweud bod yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd i fonitro'r sefyllfa. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i fonitro canlyniad y trafodaethau hynny mewn modd rhagweithiol er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym o leiaf ddarpariaeth 24 awr iawn, a bod y targed wyth munud nid yn ddyhead yn unig, ond yn rhywbeth y gellir ei gyflawni ym mhob cymuned yng Nghymru yn y diwedd?

Brian Gibbons: The targets have been reduced from 65 to 60 per cent. As you are probably aware, we have put in graded targets over eight, nine and 10 minutes so as to give the ambulance service some incentive in terms of delivery and performance. It also deals with the issue that is frequently and legitimately made that, if an ambulance arrives at eight minutes and one second, that is, somehow, a total disaster. By having these graded responses, it is much fairer to the ambulance service.

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r targedau wedi eu gostwng o 65 i 60 y cant. Fel y gwyddoch efallai, yr ydym wedi cynnwys targedau graddol dros wyth, naw a deg munud er mwyn rhoi rhywfaint o gymhelliad i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans o ran cyflawni a pherfformio. Mae hefyd yn delio â'r pwynt sy'n cael ei wneud yn aml ac yn gwbl gywir, sef os yw ambiwlans yn cyrraedd ymhen wyth munud ac un eiliad, fod hynny rywsut neu'i gilydd yn drychineb. Drwy gael amseroedd ymateb graddol, mae'n llawer tecach i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

The figures are available for geographical variation by local health board. They form part of the routine statistics that should be available on the Health of Wales Information Service website; if they are not there, I would be willing to supply them.

Mae'r ffigurau ynghylch yr amrywiadau daearyddol ym mhob bwrdd iechyd lleol ar gael. Maent yn rhan o'r ystadegau rheolaidd a ddylai fod ar gael ar wefan Gwasanaeth Gwybodaeth Iechyd Cymru; os nad ydynt yno, byddwn yn fodlon eu darparu.

The substantive point that you make is that there is considerable variation across Wales

Y prif bwynt a wneir gennych yw bod cryn amrywiad ar draws Cymru o ran perfformiad.

in terms of performance. Again, it is difficult, in many instances, to bottom out the precise factors because there is no real common factor. Some areas that would be regarded as being reasonably urban or built-up have bad performance as well as some areas that are rural and—one would have thought—would reasonably be expected to find those targets challenging.

I am pleased to see that local health boards in areas such as Bridgend, which does not have a good record, have engaged in a special relationship with the ambulance service to try to create new innovative schemes in those areas precisely to address this underperformance. It is a good development.

Powys Local Health Board is engaged with the ambulance service in coming up with a localised response to dealing with unscheduled care and ambulance responses. Much good, innovative thinking is going on there.

I regularly meet with my officials on this. I realise that the ambulance service is very much one of the front ends of the health service; it is certainly an area where the public judges performance by how quickly an ambulance responds. That is one reason why, originally, Roger Thayne was called in from Staffordshire to undertake a review of ambulance services in which all the factors that contributed to underperformance in Wales were evaluated by him, including where the ambulance stations were located and the jump-off points. Roger Thayne has done a comprehensive report on the workings of the ambulance service. Unfortunately, senior management within the ambulance service, for the reasons that I have outlined—sickness, and so on—were not able to move the Thayne report forward. We were fortunate that we were able to avail ourselves of the services of Roger Thayne and one of his senior officers. He will now be able to come in to help us, and drive forward the very set of recommendations that he made for the ambulance service in Wales.

Therefore, I am confident that we have

Eto, mae'n anodd, mewn nifer o achosion, nodi'r union ffactorau sy'n gyfrifol oherwydd nad oes un ffactor sy'n gyffredin iddynt. Mae perfformiad rhai ardaloedd a fyddai'n cael eu hystyried yn eithaf trefol neu adeiledig yn wael, yn ogystal â rhai ardaloedd sy'n wledig ac y byddai rhywun—fe dybiwn—yn disgwyl iddynt gael trafferth gyda'r targedau hynny.

Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod byrddau iechyd lleol mewn ardaloedd fel Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sydd â pherfformiad cymharol wael, wedi sefydlu perthynas arbennig â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i geisio creu cynlluniau arloesol newydd yn yr ardaloedd hynny yn unswydd er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r tanberfformio hwn. Mae'n ddatblygiad da.

Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys wrthi'n cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans er mwyn canfod ymateb lleol i ddelio â gofal heb ei drefnu ac ymateb ambiwlansys. Mae llawer o syniadau da ac arloesol ar y gweill yno.

Byddaf yn cwrdd â'm swyddogion yn rheolaidd i drafod y mater hwn. Sylweddolaf fod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn rheng flaen y gwasanaeth iechyd; mae'n sicr yn faes lle y mae'r cyhoedd yn barnu perfformiad yn ôl pa mor gyflym y mae ambiwlans yn ymateb i alwadau. Dyna un rheswm pam y cafodd Roger Thayne ei wahodd, yn y lle cyntaf, o Swydd Stafford i gynnal adolygiad o wasanaethau ambiwlans lle y cafodd yr holl ffactorau a oedd yn cyfrannu at danberfformiad yng Nghymru eu gwerthuso ganddo, gan gynnwys lleoliad y gorsafoedd ambiwlans a'r manau lle y maent yn aros i ddisgwyl galwad. Paratôdd Roger Thayne adroddiad cynhwysfawr ar y modd y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn gweithio. Yn anffodus, ni allai uwch reolwyr yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, am y rhesymau a amlinellwyd gennyf—salwch, ac yn y blaen—weithredu ar adroddiad Thayne. Yr oeddem yn ffodus o allu manteisio ar wasanaethau Roger Thayne ac un o'i uwch swyddogion. Bydd yn awr yn gallu dod atom i'n cynorthwyo, a gweithredu ar yr union gyfres o argymhellion a wnaethpwyd ganddo i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru.

Felly, yr wyf yn hyderus ein bod wedi croesi

passed an important watershed in improving performance in the ambulance service, and, hopefully, over the next six to 12 months, we will begin to see some signs of improvement.

Jonathan Morgan: I thank the Minister for Health and Social Services for the update, particularly on the review, but also on the target response times.

The opening paragraph of this statement is quite shabby. It gives the impression that all is well in meeting response times—82.6 per cent arrive within target times. However, when you consider the most important of those target times—category A response times—as Helen Mary Jones pointed out, the figures are stark. When you consider that only 67.3 per cent of category A calls are responded to within 10 minutes, against a target of 75 per cent, it demonstrates that the ambulance service has a long way to go.

Reference has already been made to the fact that the target for responses within eight minutes was reduced from 65 per cent to 60 per cent. Will you resist any further moves to alter the targets, Minister? I know that the targets can seem ambitious to some people—I do not think that they are ambitious enough. However, if targets cannot be met, it is wrong to move the target—you keep the target there in the hope that, with appropriate resources and management, those targets will be reached.

A separate issue, which is not covered in the statement, but which impinges on the ambulance service's ability to meet the response time targets, is the ambulance turnaround target. We know, through recent data that we examined in committee, that the target turnaround time was 15 minutes, but the average turnaround time was 24 minutes. That suggests that a significant number of ambulance crews are unable to leave a particular hospital beyond 24 minutes; I suspect that it could be 45 minutes to an hour, or maybe beyond that. The 24 minutes is an average, and I suspect that the upper end of that is quite severe.

pont bwysig o ran gwella perfformiad yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a, gobeithiaf, dros y chwech i 12 mis nesaf, y byddwn yn dechrau gweld rhai arwyddion o welliant.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf, yn enwedig o ran yr adolygiad, ond hefyd o ran yr amseroedd ymateb targed.

Mae paragraff agoriadol y datganiad hwn braidd yn gamarweiniol. Mae'n rhoi'r argraff bod popeth yn dda o ran bodloni'r amseroedd ymateb—82.6 y cant yn cyrraedd o fewn yr amseroedd targed. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddwch yn edrych ar y pwysicaf o'r amseroedd targed hynny—amseroedd ymateb categori A—fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones, mae'r ffigurau'n drawiadol. O gofio mai dim ond 67.3 y cant o'r galwadau categori A sy'n cael eu hateb o fewn 10 munud, o'i gymharu â tharged o 75 y cant, mae'n dangos bod gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans lawer o waith i'w wneud.

Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at y ffaith bod y targed ar gyfer ymatebion o fewn wyth munud wedi ei leihau o 65 y cant i 60 y cant. A wnech wrthsefyll unrhyw ymgais eto i newid y targedau, Weinidog? Gwn fod y targedau'n gallu ymddangos yn rhai uchelgeisiol i rai pobl—nid wyf yn credu eu bod yn ddigon uchelgeisiol. Fodd bynnag, oni ellir bodloni'r targedau, mae'n anghywir eu symud—rhaid cadw'r targed yn y gobaith, gydag adnoddau a rheolaeth briodol, y bydd y targedau hynny'n cael eu cyrraedd.

Mater gwahanol, nad yw wedi derbyn sylw yn y datganiad, ond sy'n effeithio ar allu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i fodloni'r targedau o ran amser ymateb, yw targed gweithdroi'r ambiwlans. Gwn, yn sgîl data diweddar y buom yn edrych arnynt yn y pwyllgor, mai targed yr amser gweithdroi yw 15 munud, ond yr oedd yr amser gweithdroi cyfartalog yn 24 munud. Mae hyn yn awgrymu nad oedd nifer sylweddol o griwiau ambiwlans yn gallu gadael ysbyty penodol mewn llai na 24 munud; yr wyf yn credu y gallai fod rhwng 45 munud ac awr, neu fwy na hynny hyd yn oed. Y cyfartaledd yw'r 24 munud, a chredaf fod y ffigurau uchaf yn eithaf difrifol.

Do you agree that the one impacts on the other? If you have ambulance staff in an accident and emergency department unable to leave because they have not passed on the patient to an appropriate member of staff, that impinges on their ability, as ambulance crews, to get out and meet those category A targets. Therefore, all this needs to be considered in the round. On the ambulance turnaround time, particularly, how do you intend to tackle that problem in reducing the number of ambulances that are not meeting that 15-minute turnaround time?

Thirdly, I welcome Roger Thayne's appointment. I am familiar with the successes across the board, and it is a sound appointment. I hope that some of those successes will be transferred to Wales, particularly considering some of the underperformance that we have witnessed within the ambulance service itself.

3.50 p.m.

On the review that took place, and the nine recommendations, what assessment has been made by you and your department of any cost implications? I suspect that any cost implications will, in the first place, be borne by the ambulance trust and, potentially, by the NHS trust involved, but there may be longer-term budget implications. Has any assessment been made, and is the Assembly Government able to provide assistance in this regard?

Finally, in terms of the ambulance stock itself, I receive an increasing number of constituency letters in which people are raising concerns about the quality of the ambulances in which they are transported. One could argue that people should not be that picky if an ambulance turns up to take them to hospital, but there have been several instances where ambulance crews have been reluctant to move a patient to an accident and emergency department because they have been concerned about the ambulance in which they are travelling. One particular crew informed me that they had to stabilise a patient before they could transport him in the ambulance, which was in an appalling state.

A ydych yn cytuno bod y naill yn effeithio ar y llall? Os oes gennych staff ambiwlans mewn adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys nad ydynt yn gallu gadael oherwydd nad ydynt wedi trosglwyddo'r claf i aelod priodol o'r staff, mae hynny'n effeithio ar eu gallu, fel criwiau ambiwlans, i adael a bodloni'r targedau categori A hyn. Felly, rhaid edrych ar hyn i gyd yn ei gyfanrwydd. O ran amser gweithdroi ambiwlans, yn fwyaf arbennig, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno i ostwng nifer yr ambiwlansys nad ydynt yn cyrraedd yr amser gweithdroi hwnnw o 15 munud?

Yn drydydd, croesawaf benodiad Roger Thayne. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r llwyddiannau cyffredinol, ac mae'n benodiad doeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd rhai o'r llwyddiannau hynny yn cael eu trosglwyddo i Gymru, yn enwedig o ystyried peth o'r tanberfformiad yr ydym wedi ei weld yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei hun.

O ran yr adolygiad a gynhaliwyd, a'r naw argymhelliad a wnaethpwyd, pa asesiad a wnaethpwyd gennych chi a'ch adran ynghylch unrhyw oblygiadau o ran costau? Credaf y bydd unrhyw oblygiadau o ran costau, yn y lle cyntaf, yn cael eu hysgwyo gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ac, o bosibl, gan yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG dan sylw, ond gall goblygiadau cyllidebol hirdymor ddod i'r amlwg. A wnaethpwyd unrhyw asesiad, ac a yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu cynnig cymorth yn hyn o beth?

Yn olaf, o ran y stoc ambiwlansys ei hun, yr wyf yn derbyn nifer cynyddol o lythyrau gan etholwyr lle y mae pobl yn mynegi pryderon ynglŷn ag ansawdd yr ambiwlansys a ddefnyddir i'w cludo. Gall rhywun ddadlau na ddylent fod yn rhy ffwdanus os oes ambiwlans yn cyrraedd i'w cludo i'r ysbyty, ond cafwyd nifer o achosion pan oedd criwiau ambiwlans yn gyndyn o gludo claf i adran damweiniau ac achosion brys oherwydd eu bod yn bryderus ynghylch yr ambiwlans yr oeddent yn teithio ynddo. Dywedodd un criw wrthyf eu bod wedi gorfod sefydlogi claf cyn y gellid ei gludo yn yr ambiwlans, a oedd mewn cyflwr ofnadwy. A yw'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, neu

Has the ambulance trust, or the Assembly Government in partnership with it, been able to examine and assess the quality of the ambulance stock in Wales and whether any additional investment may be needed?

Brian Gibbons: There is no doubt that the level of performance and the response times of 57 or 58 per cent are not good enough. However, by way of defence, we need to acknowledge that while these percentages do not look very good, the number of emergency calls to which the ambulance service responds has increased quite dramatically over the last four to five years, from 195,000 to 267,000, which is an increase of a third, effectively. Therefore, while it does not look good in percentage terms, in absolute terms, we need to recognise the hard work and dedication of the ambulance staff. Clearly, it is a moving target. If the demand for the ambulance service is increasing so dramatically, then the ambulance staff can be working ever harder but that will not show up in statistics that are based on a percentage. However, Jonathan is right—although the absolute amount of work is going up, we need to get the percentages right.

On the way that the ambulance service responds to some of these emergency calls, I do not have the figures here, but, from memory, I believe that something in the order of 10 to 15 per cent of 999 calls require a blue-light emergency response. That means that, in many instances, ambulances are expected to respond to incidents that do not need that 999-type of response. There is a way of trying to address some of those issues. A range of schemes is being implemented by the ambulance services, including assess-and-refer schemes and extended paramedic services, which are designed precisely to allow staff, rather than having to take all 999 calls to ambulances, to be able to make an initial assessment of the patient and refer them elsewhere, if appropriate. This work is being piloted, so it will not be universally available in the short term. However, this will help to address some of the issues relating to turnaround times, because, certainly in some rural parts of Wales, many of the patients who end up in accident and emergency departments do not need to be there if we accept that only 15 per cent of those calls

Lywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn partneriaeth â'r ymddiriedolaeth, wedi edrych ar gyflwr y stoc ambiwlansys yng Nghymru a'i asesu ac wedi ystyried a oes angen unrhyw fuddsoddiad pellach?

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw lefel y perfformiad a'r amseroedd ymateb o 57 neu 58 y cant ddim yn ddigon da. Fodd bynnag, i amddiffyn y sefyllfa, rhaid inni gydnabod, er nad yw'r canrannau hyn yn edrych yn dda iawn, fod nifer y galwadau brys y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ymateb iddynt wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol iawn dros y pedair neu bum mlynedd diwethaf, o 195,000 i 267,000, sy'n gynydd o draean, i bob pwrpas. Felly, er nad yw'n edrych yn dda fel canran, mewn termau absoliwt, rhaid inni gydnabod gwaith caled ac ymroddiad y staff ambiwlans. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn darged sy'n symud. Os yw'r galw am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cynyddu i'r fath raddau, yna gall y staff ambiwlans fod yn gweithio'n galetach nag erioed ond ni fydd hynny i'w weld mewn ystadegau sy'n seiliedig ar ganrannau. Fodd bynnag, mae Jonathan yn gywir—er bod lefel absoliwt y gwaith yn codi, rhaid inni gael y canrannau'n gywir.

Ynglŷn â sut y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ymateb i rai o'r galwadau brys hyn, nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf yma, ond, yn ôl yr hyn a gofiaf, credaf fod angen ymateb brys golau glas ar tua 10 i 15 y cant o alwadau 999. Mae hynny'n golygu, mewn llawer o achosion, fod disgwyl i ambiwlansys ymateb i ddigwyddiadau nad oedd angen ymateb 999 o'r fath. Mae modd ceisio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau hynny. Mae amrywiaeth o gynlluniau'n cael eu rhoi ar waith gan wasanaethau ambiwlans, gan gynnwys cynlluniau asesu ac atgyfeirio a gwasanaethau parafeddygol estynedig, sydd wedi eu cynllunio'n benodol i ganiatáu i'r staff, yn hytrach na'u bod yn gorfod derbyn pob galwad 999 i ambiwlansys, allu gwneud asesiad dechreuol o'r claf ac yna eu hatgyfeirio at rywun arall, os bydd hynny'n briodol. Mae'r gwaith hwn yn cael ei wneud ar ffurf cynllun peilot ar hyn o bryd, felly ni fydd ar gael ym mhobman yn y tymor byr. Fodd bynnag, bydd hyn yn gymorth i fynd i'r afael â'r materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag amseroedd gweithdroi, oherwydd, mewn rhai rhannau o gefn gwlad Cymru yn sicr, nid oes

require a 999 response. Therefore, a redesign of the way in which the ambulance service responds will be more effective in terms of patients not being brought unnecessarily to accident and emergency departments. It will also address issues such as turnaround time.

On the quality of ambulances, I do not know whether you know this, but the ambulance vehicle fleet has increased by 10 or 11 per cent over the last two to three years. Many of those new vehicles were emergency response vehicles, but a number of them were standard ambulances. Members of the Health and Social Services Committee may remember the unfortunate specifications that were laid for some of those new ambulances, which had to be investigated and redressed. However, the fact that we ordered those new ambulances and that they are coming on-stream is an indication that we accept that some of the ambulance stock is getting past its sell-by date. That is reflected in the fact that the number of ambulance vehicles increased from 532 in 2003 to 578 in March 2004. We recognise some of these criticisms, but, equally, we are putting in the investment. One of the big messages from Roger Thayne's report, however, is that there are inefficiencies in the ambulance service, and I think that the first thing that Roger Thayne does will probably not be to ask for money, but to outline how he will drive forward addressing the inefficiencies that he has diagnosed in the service.

I do not think that the improvements suggested in the nine recommendations will necessarily be expensive, because a lot of them are about the process of hand-over and better work practices. Therefore, I do not think that they will generate a lot of extra costs for the ambulance services; it is just about working better and smarter.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I very much welcome the appointment of a new chief executive and the other appointments associated with the

angen i lawer o'r cleifion sy'n cyrraedd adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys fod yno os derbyniwn mai dim ond 15 y cant o'r galwadau hynny sydd angen ymateb 999. Felly, bydd ailgynllunio'r ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ymateb yn fwy effeithiol o ran peidio â chludo cleifion i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys heb fod angen. Bydd hefyd yn gymorth i fynd i'r afael â materion fel amseroedd gweithdroi.

O ran ansawdd yr ambiwlansys, ni wn a ydych yn ymwybodol o hyn, ond mae'r fflyd ambiwlans wedi cynyddu 10 neu 11 y cant yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf. Yr oedd llawer o'r cerbydau newydd hyn yn gerbydau ymateb brys, ond ambiwlansys safonol oedd nifer ohonynt. Efallai y bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cofio'r manylebau anffodus a roddwyd ar gyfer rhai o'r ambiwlansys newydd hynny, rhywbeth y bu'n rhaid ymchwilio iddo a'i gywiro. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi archebu'r ambiwlansys newydd hynny, a'u bod yn dod ar waith yn arwydd ein bod yn derbyn bod rhai cerbydau yn y stoc ambiwlansys wedi mynd braidd yn hen. Adlewyrchir hynny yn y ffaith bod nifer yr ambiwlansys wedi cynyddu o 532 yn 2003 i 578 ym mis Mawrth 2004. Yr ydym yn derbyn peth o'r feiriadaeth, ond ar yr un pryd, yr ydym yn buddsoddi arian. Un o brif negeseuon adroddiad Roger Thayne, fodd bynnag, yw bod diffygion o ran effeithlonrwydd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a chredaf nad gofyn am arian fydd y peth cyntaf a wna Roger Thayne, ond amlinellu sut y bydd yn mynd ati i roi sylw i'r aneffeithlonrwydd y mae wedi ei ganfod yn y gwasanaeth.

Ni chredaf y bydd y gwelliannau a awgrymwyd yn y naw argymhelliad o reidrwydd yn gostus, oherwydd bod llawer ohonynt yn ymwneud â'r broses o drosglwyddo ac arferion gweithio gwell. Felly, nid wyf yn credu y byddant yn arwain at lawer o gostau ychwanegol i'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans; yr hyn sydd ei angen yw gweithio'n well ac yn fwy clyfar.

Jenny Randerson: Diolch i chi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn croesawu penodi prif weithredwr newydd a'r penodiadau eraill sy'n gysylltiedig ag

Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. There is certainly a strong need for a fundamental review of several aspects of the service. I also welcome the review relating to the non-emergency patient care services.

However, there are some serious questions here about the longevity of the targets, because they were reviewed last year, and I would like to question you further about how you see these targets. In your statement, you say that 55.7 per cent of first responses to category A calls arrived within eight minutes. The target is 60 per cent, but, as has already been mentioned, it used to be 65 per cent. However, I do not believe that anyone has mentioned this afternoon that that 65 per cent was originally intended as a milestone towards meeting a target of 75 per cent. Are you planning to look at the targets fundamentally in the future to see whether we can start revising them up again towards something that is much more satisfactory, or has that 75 per cent target been entirely abandoned?

For all of the new category A targets, all three of the timescales, there was a failure to reach the target, despite the reduced expectations. None of the targets were achieved at an all-Wales level, although some unitary authorities—Conwy, Denbighshire, Wrexham and Swansea—achieved them. Are you looking at why some areas achieve their targets and others do not, or do you expect the new staff in post to look at why there is such variation between one area and another?

I turn now to the other types of call. For category B calls the ambulance should arrive at the scene within 14 minutes in urban areas, 18 minutes in rural areas, and 21 minutes in sparsely populated areas. The target for that is 95 per cent, and performance ranged from 65 per cent in Caerphilly to 96.7 per cent in Conwy. Once again, there is the issue of immense variation between one part of Wales and another, with an unsatisfactory all-Wales average of 80.9 per cent. That is a long way short of the 95 per cent target, Minister. It is not even on the horizon, is it, in terms of achievement?

Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru. Yn sicr mae angen dirfawr am adolygiad sylfaenol o sawl agwedd ar y gwasanaeth. Croesawaf hefyd yr adolygiad o wasanaethau gofal cleifion nad ydynt yn achosion brys.

Fodd bynnag, erys rhai amheuon cryf am hirhoedledd y targedau, oherwydd cawsant eu hadolygu y llynedd, a hoffwn eich holi ymhellach am y modd yr ydych yn gweld y targedau hyn. Yn eich datganiad, dywedasoch fod 55.7 y cant o ymatebion cyntaf i alwadau categori A yn cyrraedd o fewn wyth munud. Mae'r targed yn 60 y cant, ond, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, arferai fod yn 65 y cant. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod neb wedi crybwyll y prynhawn yma mai'r bwriad gwreiddiol oedd y byddai'r 65 y cant hwnnw'n garreg filltir tuag at gyrraedd targed o 75 y cant. A ydych yn bwriadu cynnal adolygiad sylfaenol o'r targedau yn y dyfodol i weld a allwn ddechrau eu codi unwaith eto tuag at rywbeth a fyddai'n fwy boddhaol, ynteu a ydych wedi rhoi'r gorau'n gyfan gwbl i'r targed o 75 y cant?

Ym mhob un o'r targedau categori A newydd, pob un o'r tair amserlen, ni lwyddwyd i gyrraedd y targed, er gwaethaf y disgwyliadau is. Ni chyrhaeddwyd yr un o'r targedau ar lefel Cymru gyfan, er bod rhai awdurdodau unedol—Conwy, sir Ddinbych, Wrecsam ac Abertawe—wedi llwyddo i'w cyrraedd. A ydych yn edrych pam mae rhai yn cyrraedd eu targedau tra bo eraill yn methu, ynteu a ydych yn disgwyl i'r staff newydd yn eu swyddi edrych pam mae'r fath amrywiadau i'w cael rhwng gwahanol ardaloedd?

Trof yn awr at y mathau eraill o alwadau. Yn achos galwadau categori B dylai'r ambiwlans gyrraedd o fewn 14 munud mewn ardaloedd trefol, 18 mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac 21 munud mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth. Y targed ar gyfer hynny yw 95 y cant, ac yr oedd y perfformiad yn amrywio o 65 y cant yng Nghaerffili i 96.7 y cant yng Nghonwy. Unwaith eto, gwelir amrywio enfawr rhwng gwahanol rannau o Gymru, gyda chyfartaledd anfoddfaol o ran Cymru gyfan o 80.9 y cant. Mae hynny'n brin iawn o'r targed o 95 y cant, Weinidog. Nid yw ar y gorwel, hyd yn oed, o ran cyrraedd y nod, nac ydyw?

4.00 p.m.

Looking at urgent journeys, the target was that 95 per cent of all urgent journeys should arrive no more than 15 minutes later than the requested arrival time. The target was 95 per cent, but the achievement was only 67.2 per cent. Are you looking at why only 41 per cent arrived within that 15 minutes in Torfaen, but nearly 87 per cent managed it in Pembrokeshire? I am interested in hearing your comments on that variation between one part of Wales and another.

Finally, in relation to your reference to staffing difficulties, one thing that has concerned me as I have looked at 'Agenda for Change' is the slowness with which it is being rolled out throughout the ambulance trust. I would welcome your comments this afternoon as to whether it is possible to speed that up, as it is certainly the slowest of the trusts in Wales in applying 'Agenda for Change'. I am sure that that must be having a knock-on effect on staffing.

Brian Gibbons: We would have very modest ambitions if we were to say that 65 per cent was the height of our ambition. That would certainly not be my ambition for the service.

On the question that you have asked about variation, as I said to Helen Mary, it is difficult to understand it fully because, if you look at the geographical spread and Roger Thayne's report, you will see that there are not many consistent threads, except that there is not a sufficient level of performance in the system. One interesting thing about the Staffordshire Ambulance Service NHS Trust—and I think that Helen Mary raised the point about ambulance stations—is that Staffordshire has been able to deliver resources to the front line by reducing its number of ambulance stations. That was one of the messages that Roger Thayne gave in his original review. The way in which services were delivered in Wales was old fashioned, bound up in bricks and mortar, with not enough resources given to dynamic deployment, to using information and

Wrth edrych ar siwrneiau brys, y targed oedd y dylai 95 y cant o'r holl siwrneiau brys gyrraedd o fewn dim mwy na 15 munud yn hwyrach na'r amser cyrraedd y gofynnwyd amdano. Yr oedd y targed yn 95 y cant, ond dim ond 67.2 y cant a gyrhaeddodd o fewn yr amser hwn. A ydych yn ceisio canfod pam mai dim ond 41 y cant a gyrhaeddodd o fewn y 15 munud yn Nhor-faen, tra bo bron 87 y cant wedi llwyddo i gyrraedd o fewn yr amser hwn yn sir Benfro? Hoffwn glywed eich sylwadau ar yr amrywiadau hynny rhwng gwahanol rannau o Gymru.

Yn olaf, ynglŷn â'ch cyfeiriad at anawsterau staffio, un peth sydd wedi peri pryder i mi wrth imi edrych ar yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yw pa mor araf y mae'n cael ei rhoi ar waith yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Tybed a allwch ddweud wrthyf y prynhawn yma a yw'n bosibl cyflymu'r broses, gan mai hon yn sicr yw'r arafaf o holl ymddiriedolaethau Cymru o ran gweithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Mae'n siŵr bod hynny'n cael effaith gynyddol ar staffio.

Brian Gibbons: Ni fyddai gennym fawr o uchelgais pe baem yn dweud mai 65 y cant yw'r nod yr ydym yn anelu tuag ato. Yn sicr, nid hynny fyddai fy uchelgais i ar gyfer y gwasanaeth.

O ran y cwestiwn a ofynasoch ynglŷn ag amrywiadau, fel y dywedais wrth Helen Mary, mae'n anodd ei ddeall yn iawn oherwydd, os edrychwch ar yr amrediad daearyddol ac ar adroddiad Roger Thayne, fe welwch nad oes llawer o lynnau cyson, ac eithrio nad yw'r perfformiad yn ddigon da o fewn y system. Un peth diddorol am Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Swydd Stafford—a chredaf fod Helen Mary wedi codi'r pwynt ynglŷn â gorsafodd ambiwlans—yw bod swydd Stafford wedi gallu darparu adnoddau i'r rheng flaen drwy leihau nifer y gorsafodd ambiwlans. Dyma un o'r negeseuon a roddwyd gan Roger Thayne yn ei adolygiad gwreiddiol. Yr oedd y ffordd y darperid gwasanaethau yng Nghymru yn hen ffasiwn, yn seiliedig ar frics a mortar, heb ddigon o adnoddau'n cael eu rhoi i drefniadau

communications technology and other new technology, and to creating better links with the police and fire services and other organisations.

Roger Thayne will be a breath of fresh air, and he will drive the type of efficiency and performance improvements in Wales that he managed to achieve in Staffordshire. Having done his report on Wales a few years ago, when the chance came up for him to come to Wales, he was excited about the opportunity to meet the challenge that he himself had laid down for the ambulance service. That is exciting and I hope to meet Roger Thayne and the new chair of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust in the next week or 10 days to go through what he and the chair see as being the big challenges for the service.

The big issue on 'Agenda for Change' was the matching of the two main staff groups—the ambulance technicians and the paramedics. That certainly delayed things for quite a long time, but I am pleased to be able to say that the paramedics and technicians have now been matched to bands 4 and 5. I think that the process of matching up individual jobs will now start, as will the assimilation of individual workers. For 2005-06, we have allocated £12.5 million to the ambulance service as a means of implementing 'Agenda for Change'. If you bear in mind that the total allocation for 'Agenda for Change' in Wales was in the order of £58 million, you can see the amount of investment that we are making in ambulance service staff as part of the overall commitment to implementing 'Agenda for Change'.

Lorraine Barrett: I would like to preface what I say by paying tribute to all ambulance staff, who work very hard and conscientiously. The 93-year-old patient to whom you referred was a Penarth resident, and what happened to her was sad. We all hope that that sort of thing will not happen again. My message is that pressure on staff must be alleviated. Are you confident that the updating of training for ambulance staff is being undertaken and that as often as it

dynamig, i ddefnyddio technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a thechnolegau newydd eraill, ac i greu gwell cysylltiadau â'r heddlu a'r gwasanaeth tân a sefydliadau eraill.

Bydd Roger Thayne fel chwa o awyr iach, a bydd yn ysgogi'r un math o effeithlonrwydd a gwelliant mewn perfformiad yng Nghymru ag y llwyddodd i'w gyflawni yn swydd Stafford. Ysgrifennodd ei adroddiad ar Gymru rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, a phan ddaeth y cyfle iddo ddod i Gymru, yr oedd yn llawn cyffro wrth feddwl am wynebu'r her a osodwyd ganddo ef ei hun i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae hyn yn gyffrous ac yr wyf yn gobeithio cyfarfod Roger Thayne a chadeirydd newydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn ystod yr wythnos neu'r 10 diwrnod nesaf i fynd drwy'r hyn y mae ef a'r cadeirydd yn eu hystyried fel y sialensiau mawr i'r gwasanaeth.

Y gwaith mwyaf gyda'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' oedd paru'r ddau brif grŵp o staff—y technegwyr ambiwlans a'r parafeddygon. Mae hyn yn sicr wedi dal pethau'n ôl am dipyn o amser, ond yr wyf yn falch o allu dweud bod y parafeddygon a'r technegwyr bellach wedi cael eu paru â bandiau 4 a 5. Yr wyf yn tybio y bydd y broses o baru swyddi unigol yn dechrau yn awr, ynghyd â'r broses o gymhathu gweithwyr unigol. Ar gyfer 2005-06, yr ydym wedi dyrannu £12.5 miliwn i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans er mwyn gweithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. O gofio bod y cyfanswm a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yng Nghymru tua £58 miliwn, gallwch weld cymaint yr ydym yn ei fuddsoddi yn staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fel rhan o'r ymrwymiad cyffredinol i weithredu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'.

Lorraine Barrett: Cyn mynd at yr hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'r holl weithwyr ambiwlans sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn ac yn gydwybodol. Yr oedd y fenyw 93 oed y cyfeiriasoch ati yn byw ym Mhenarth, ac yr oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd iddi yn drist. Mae pob un ohonom yn gobeithio na fydd rhywbeth fel hyn yn digwydd eto. Fy neges yw bod rhaid lleihau'r pwysau sydd ar y staff. A ydych yn ffyddiog bod y gwaith o ddiweddarau hyfforddiant

should be?

My main question is this. Will you monitor the situation in Cardiff and the Vale NHS Trust? There have been two serious situations in Penarth recently in which patients have waited an inordinate length of time for an ambulance. In one of those cases, a 12-year-old boy who had fallen on some park railings had to wait 40 minutes. In the end, the incident was not too serious but, at the time, the headmaster of the local school was very concerned. The second example concerned an ambulance that was deployed from Bridgend, and I understand from reports in the paper that the driver was not quite sure how to get to the University Hospital of Wales as quickly as he needed to, and he had a police escort.

I just wanted to highlight the types of situation in which people can find themselves when there just may not be an ambulance in the right place at the right time. I am reassured by some of your remarks about looking at a better way of deploying those ambulances.

The Presiding Officer: The time allocated for this statement has run out. As we have heard from the four lead spokespeople for each party, I ask the remaining contributors to be as brief as possible and the Minister to be succinct in his usual way.

Brian Gibbons: Dealing with your particular point, Lorraine, as well as the specific investigations and the new guidance issued because of the new cases that you mentioned, Healthcare Inspectorate Wales will also undertake a further review of the passenger transport element of the Wales ambulance service, even though the guidance was put in place after the initial tragic incident to which you referred. Healthcare Inspectorate Wales is going back to see whether lessons have been learned and properly embedded. That was not part of the original plan, but we are asking the inspectorate to do that.

gweithwyr ambiwlans yn cael ei wneud a hynny mor aml ag y dylai gael ei wneud?

Fy mhrif gwestiwn yw hyn. A wneuch fonitro'r sefyllfa yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro? Gwelwyd dwy sefyllfa ddifrifol ym Mhenarth yn ddiweddar lle y bu'n rhaid i gleifion aros am lawer gormod o amser am ambiwlans. Yn un o'r achosion hynny, gorfu i fachgen 12 oed a oedd wedi syrthio ar reiliau mewn parc aros am 40 munud. Canfuwyd yn ddiweddarach nad oedd yr anaf yn un difrifol iawn ond, ar y pryd, yr oedd prifathro'r ysgol leol yn bryderus iawn. Yr oedd yr ail enghraifft yn ymwneud ag ambiwlans a anfonwyd o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, a deallaf yn ôl adroddiadau yn y papur nad oedd y gyrrwr yn hollol siŵr sut i gyrraedd Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru cyn gynted ag yr oedd angen iddo wneud, a chafodd ei hebrwng gan gar yr heddlu.

Yr hyn yr oeddwn am ei wneud oedd tynnu sylw at y math o sefyllfaoedd y gall pobl ganfod eu hunain ynddynt pan nad oes ambiwlans ar gael o bosibl yn y lle iawn ar yr adeg iawn. Yr wyf yn teimlo rywfaint yn hapusach o glywed rhai o'ch sylwadau ynglŷn ag edrych ar ffordd well o drefnu'r ambiwlansys hyn.

Y Llywydd: Mae'r amser a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y datganiad hwn wedi dod i ben. Gan ein bod wedi clywed gan y pedwar prif lefarydd o bob plaid, gofynnaf i'r cyfranwyr sydd ar ôl fod cyn fyrred ag sy'n bosibl ac i'r Gweinidog fod yn gryno fel arfer.

Brian Gibbons: Gan ddelio â'ch pwynt penodol chi, Lorraine, yn ogystal â'r ymchwiliadau penodol a'r canllawiau newydd a gyhoeddwyd o ganlyniad i'r achosion newydd y cyfeiriasoch atynt, bydd Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru hefyd yn gwneud adolygiad arall o'r elfen yng ngwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru sy'n ymwneud â chludo teithwyr, er bod y canllawiau wedi eu sefydlu ar ôl y digwyddiad trist iawn y cyfeiriasoch ato. Mae Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru yn mynd yn ôl i weld a oes gwersi wedi eu dysgu ac wedi eu gweithredu'n briodol. Nid oedd hynny'n rhan o'r cynllun gwreiddiol, ond yr ydym yn gofyn i'r arolygiaeth wneud hyn.

William Graham: You will know that response times in south-east Wales are the poorest in Wales: Monmouthshire has a 41 per cent response time, in Torfaen, it is 49 per cent, and in Blaenau Gwent, it is 45 per cent. A recent Assembly-commissioned study states that there should be at least 10 rapid response vehicles in Monmouthshire, but there is only one. Minister, this is reckless. Please do something about it shortly.

Brian Gibbons: We acknowledge that performance is not good enough, and that is why we have asked for a change at the top in the ambulance service, to address that. We have secured extra rapid response vehicles, which are among the vehicle types that have seen the largest increases, going up from 20 in 2003 to 38 in 2005. If we get the efficiencies in the service that, hopefully, Roger Thayne will be able to deliver, that will transfer more resources to the front line, precisely along the lines that you want.

Carl Sargeant: Minister, thank you for the statement. I echo Lorraine Barrett's comments and congratulate the hard-working front-line staff of the ambulance service.

Flintshire has four ambulance stations: Mold, Flint, Queensferry and Holywell. The problem with that arrangement is that all the hospitals that they attend are either in Chester, Wrexham, Glan Clwyd or further afield. Therefore, all ambulances, regardless of the incident that they are attending, take patients out of the county, and that is one cause of poor time responses. Minister, there is a review of station and estates management; will you give an assurance to me and to the people of Alyn and Deeside that this is about enhanced service delivery and not about going backwards by closing stations? This is about better delivery for the people of Wales.

Brian Gibbons: First, I compliment the ambulance service in Flintshire, because many of its ambulance staff have been on extended practitioner courses to Liverpool

William Graham: Gwyddoch mai amseroedd ymateb de-ddwyrain Cymru yw'r rhai gwaethaf yng Nghymru: mae gan sir Fynwy amser ymateb o 41 y cant, yn Nhorfaen, mae'n 49 y cant, ac ym Mlaenau Gwent, mae'n 45 y cant. Yn ôl astudiaeth a gomisiynwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Cynulliad dylai sir Fynwy fod ag o leiaf 10 cerbyd ymateb buan, ond dim ond un sydd yno. Weinidog, mae hyn yn anystyriol. Gwnewch rywbeth yn ei gylch ar fyrder os gwelwch yn dda.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydym yn cydnabod nad yw'r perfformiad yn ddigon da, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi gofyn am newid ar y brig yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, er mwyn rhoi sylw i hynny. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau rhagor o gerbydau ymateb buan, sydd ymhlith y mathau o gerbydau sydd â'r cynnydd mwyaf, gan gynyddu o 20 yn 2003 i 38 yn 2005. Os llwyddwn i gael yr effeithlonrwydd yn y gwasanaeth, y bydd Roger Thayne, gobeithio, yn gallu ei roi i ni, bydd hynny'n trosglwyddo mwy o adnoddau i'r rheng flaen, sef yr union le yr ydych am iddynt fynd.

Carl Sargeant: Weinidog, diolch ichi am y datganiad. Hoffwn ategu sylwadau Lorraine Barrett a llongyfarch staff rheng flaen y gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn.

Mae pedair gorsaf ambiwlans yn sir y Fflint: yr Wyddgrug, y Fflint, y Fferi Isaf a Threffynnon. Y broblem gyda'r trefniant hwnnw yw bod pob ysbyty y maent yn mynd iddynt naill ai yng Nghaer, Wrecsam, Glan Clwyd neu ymhellach i ffwrdd. Felly, mae pob ambiwlans, beth bynnag yw'r digwyddiad y maent yn mynd iddo, yn mynd â chleifion allan o'r sir, a dyna un rheswm dros yr amser ymateb gwael. Weinidog, mae adolygiad yn cael ei wneud o reolaeth gorsafoedd ac ystadau; a wnewch roi sicrwydd i mi ac i bobl Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy mai gwella'r gwasanaeth yw pwrpas hyn ac nid cymryd cam yn ôl drwy gau gorsafoedd? Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwella'r ddarpariaeth i bobl Cymru.

Brian Gibbons: Yn gyntaf, rhaid imi ganmol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn sir y Fflint, oherwydd y mae llawer o'i weithwyr ambiwlans wedi bod ar gysiau ymarferwyr

John Moores University. In many instances, they are at the front line in terms of service redesign. They are now in a position to treat and assess patients rather than routinely bringing them to accident and emergency departments, which, in many cases, is unnecessary.

4.10 p.m.

It is difficult to address your last specific point, because one of Roger Thayne's key messages is that too many resources are tied up in bricks and mortar, and not enough resources are deployed in people and ambulances. So, we must rely on Roger Thayne's judgment in the way in which he will move forward with his modernisation programme. His record in Staffordshire speaks for itself, and if we can replicate what happened there in Wales, we will have something which we can be really proud of.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn sôn am y cynnydd yn nifer y galwadau yn ystod y chwarter diwethaf, ac yr ydych hefyd wedi sôn am y cynnydd yn nifer y galwadau yn ystod y pedair i bum mlynedd diwethaf. Onid eir i'r afael â'r cynnydd hwn, a ydych yn derbyn y bydd angen rhoi adnoddau sylweddol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans er mwyn gwella'r amseroedd cyrraedd?

Yr ydych hefyd yn sôn am fesurau effeithiolrwydd. A ydych yn derbyn bod rhai mannau yng nghefn gwlad Cymru lle mae'r symudiadau hynny o ran effeithiolrwydd wedi golygu colli gwasanaeth ambiwlans 24 awr, sydd wedi arwain at broblemau dybryd?

Brian Gibbons: The overall strategic response for emergency care will be outlined in the delivering emergency care services project, which we hope will be published in the next four to six weeks. It will look at the holistic response to all unscheduled care, of which the ambulance services is just one part. It is linked to GP and out-of-hours services, how the ambulance service responds as first responders, as well as to the fire services, the police, and so forth. So, we hope to have another chance to revisit these issues when the DECS project is published. There is concern about all these issues but, hopefully, people will feel that the DECS project, when

estynedig ym Mhrifysgol John Moores, Lerpwl. Mewn sawl achos, maent ar y blaen o ran ailgynllunio'r gwasanaeth. Erbyn hyn gallant drin ac asesu cleifion yn hytrach na dim ond eu cludo fel mater o drefn i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, a hynny heb fod angen yn aml iawn.

Mae'n anodd rhoi sylw i'ch pwynt penodol diwethaf, oherwydd un o brif negeseuon Roger Thayne yw bod gormod o adnoddau ynghlwm wrth frics a mortar, a dim digon o adnoddau'n cael eu dyrannu ar gyfer pobl ac ambiwlansys. Felly, rhaid inni ddbynnu ar ddoethineb Roger Thayne o ran yr hyn y bwriada ei wneud gyda'i raglen foderneiddio. Mae'r hyn a wnaeth yn swydd Stafford yn amlwg, ac os gallwn gyflawni'r un peth yma yng Nghymru, bydd gennym rywbeth y gallwn fod yn wirioneddol falch ohono.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You mentioned the increase in the number of calls during the last quarter, and you also mentioned the increase in the number of calls over the past four to five years. If you do not get to grips with that increased demand, do you accept that substantial resources will need to be put into the ambulance service to improve response times?

You also mentioned efficiency measures. Do you accept that there are some parts of rural Wales where those movements in terms of efficiency have led to the loss of a 24-hour ambulance service, which has resulted in dire problems?

Brian Gibbons: Amlinellir yr ymateb strategol cyffredinol i ofal brys yn y prosiect darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys, a fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi, gobeithio, ymhen pedair i chwe wythnos. Bydd yn edrych ar yr ymateb cyfannol i bob gofal sydd heb ei drefnu, a dim ond un rhan o'r gofal hwn yw'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans. Mae'n gysylltiedig â gwasanaethau meddygon teulu a gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau, sut y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ymateb fel ymatebwyr cyntaf, yn ogystal â'r gwasanaethau tân, yr heddlu, ac yn y blaen. Felly, yr ydym yn gobeithio cael cyfle arall i ailedrych ar y materion hyn pan gyhoeddir y

it is published and is open for consultation, will realistically be able to point a way forwards.

prosiect darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys. Mae pryder ynglŷn â'r holl faterion hyn, ond gobeithio y bydd pobl yn teimlo y bydd y prosiect darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys, pan fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi a'i gyflwyno ar gyfer ymgynghoriad, yn gallu dangos ffordd realistig o symud ymlaen.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Ann Jones: Point of order. I apologise for being premature at the beginning of the agenda—a former life flashed back to me on that one, so I apologise for intervening earlier.

Ann Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf fod yn rhy gynnar ar ddechrau'r agenda—cefais fy atgoffa o fywyd blaenorol, felly yr wyf yn ymddiheuro am dorri ar eich traws yn gynharach.

I thank you for the opportunity to raise this point of order on the fact that the voting record from the Plenary debate on the Government of Wales Bill on 22 March shows an inaccuracy against my name. It shows that I did not vote on amendment 10, when, in fact, I voted in the same way on all 16 amendments and used the same procedure. Therefore, I ask that the Record be corrected to show that I attempted to vote but was unable to do so.

Diolch ichi am y cyfle i godi'r pwynt o drefn hwn ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod camgymeriad wrth fy enw i yn y cofnod pleidleisio o ddadl y Cyfarfod Llawn ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru ar 22 Mawrth. Mae'n dangos na phleidleisiais ar welliant 10, er fy mod, mewn gwirionedd, wedi pleidleisio yr un ffordd ar bob un o'r 16 gwelliant ac wedi defnyddio'r un weithdrefn. Felly, gofynnaf am gael cywiro'r Cofnod i ddangos fy mod wedi ceisio pleidleisio ond fy mod wedi methu â gwneud hynny.

Should this happen again, what measures are in place to ensure that we have the confidence to know that the system has recorded our votes correctly? Like you, I take great pride in the Assembly, and I do not want to see any system or measures implemented that will bring us into disrepute. Unfortunately, I do not have an awful lot of confidence in the voting system at the moment, and I look to you for reassurance.

Pe bai hyn yn digwydd eto, pa drefniadau sy'n bodoli er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn fod yn ffyddiog bod y system wedi cofnodi ein pleidleisiau'n gywir? Yr wyf fi, fel chithau, yn ymfalchïo'n fawr yn y Cynulliad, ac nid wyf am weld dim un system neu drefniadau'n cael eu gweithredu a fydd yn rhoi enw drwg inni. Yn anffodus, nid oes gennyf lawer iawn o ffydd yn y system bleidleisio ar hyn o bryd, a byddwn yn falch pe gallech fy sicrhau nad oes problem gyda'r system.

The Presiding Officer: I am pleased to give that reassurance unreservedly. Thank you for giving me notice of this point of order, and I tried to deal with this matter outside the Chamber. I gave a commitment at the end of Plenary last Wednesday to fully investigate the matter. I am very grateful to officials, particularly from the Chamber Secretariat, ICT support and our contractors, who stayed quite late on Wednesday to test the system. I personally supervised that, as did the clerk. Therefore, the voting system has been fully investigated. An e-mail was sent to all

Y Llywydd: Gallaf eich sicrhau heb os nac oni bai nad oes problem gyda'r system. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ddwyn y pwynt o drefn hwn i'm sylw ymlaen llaw, ac yr wyf wedi ceisio delio â'r mater hwn y tu allan i'r Siambr. Addewais ar ddiwedd y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher diwethaf y byddwn yn ymchwilio i'r mater yn llawn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn i'r swyddogion, yn enwedig Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Siambr, staff cymorth TGCh a'n contractwyr, a arhosodd yma'n bur hwyr nos Fercher i brofi'r system. Bûm i fy hun yn goruchwyllo'r gwaith, a'r clerc hefyd.

Members early on Thursday morning, and I am grateful to Chamber Secretariat for doing that so quickly. I also reported to the House Committee in full.

I apologised to the House Committee in case I had moved too quickly in the course of taking votes on amendments on Wednesday. However, I was assured that it was very difficult, technologically, to do so, as a recent test conducted by the manufacturers during the recess involved taking approximately 1.5 million votes by computer over a period of an hour and had found no technological problems. Following the report to the House Committee, there was a discussion, and instructions were circulated to remind all Members—and you should have received them before this afternoon's meeting—that officials of the Assembly Parliamentary Service are available to give further demonstrations of the voting systems, should they so wish. Tests of the voting system are undertaken regularly.

I fail to see what difficulties could be experienced during the vote, because it is perfectly clear: once the LED is on display, the vote is open. Once a Member has cast his or her vote, the LED above the voting buttons clearly indicates that the vote has been cast. As I say, I will ensure in future that I take sufficient time, but I am assured by the people who advise me on this that the voting system here moves very quickly and that we are able to move through our business without being delayed by voting. That is the position. The voting record is, therefore, correct as it stands.

Karen Sinclair: Further to that point of order—

The Presiding Officer: Order. There cannot be much further to that point of order. I have explained the situation as fully as I can.

Karen Sinclair: Further to Ann Jones's point of order, I am also confident that I voted on every amendment to the Government of Wales Bill motion, or at least I pressed the

Felly, yr ydym wedi ymchwilio'n llawn i'r system bleidleisio. Anfonwyd e-bost at bob Aelod yn gynnar fore Iau, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Siambr am wneud hynny mor fuan. Cyflwynais adroddiad llawn hefyd i Bwyllgor y Tŷ.

Ymddiheurais i Bwyllgor y Tŷ rhag ofn fy mod wedi symud yn rhy gyflym wrth gymryd pleidleisiau ar welliannau ddydd Mercher. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy sicrhau ei bod yn anodd iawn gwneud hynny, yn dechnegol, ac mewn prawf diweddar a gynhaliwyd gan y gwneuthurwyr yn ystod y gwyliau cymerwyd tua 1.5 miliwn o bleidleisiau cyfrifiadurol dros gyfnod o awr ac ni chafwyd dim problemau technolegol. Yn dilyn yr adroddiad i Bwyllgor y Tŷ, cafwyd trafodaeth, a dosbarthwyd cyfarwyddiadau i atgoffa pob Aelod—a dylech fod wedi derbyn y cyfarwyddiadau cyn y cyfarfod y prynhawn yma—fod swyddogion Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ar gael i ddangos sut y mae'r systemau pleidleisio'n gweithio eto, pe dymument. Profir y system bleidleisio'n rheolaidd.

Ni allaf feddwl pa anawsterau a allai godi yn ystod y bleidlais, oherwydd y mae'n berffaith glir: pan fo'r LED i'w weld, mae'r bleidlais yn agored. Wedi i Aelod fwrw'i bleidlais neu ei phleidlais, bydd yr LED uwchben y botymau pleidleisio'n dangos yn eglur fod y bleidlais wedi'i bwrw. Fel y dywedais, fe sicrhaf yn y dyfodol fy mod yn cymryd digon o amser, ond mae'r bobl sydd yn fy nghynghori ar hyn yn fy sicrhau bod y drefn bleidleisio yma'n symud yn gyflym iawn a'n bod yn gallu symud drwy ein busnes heb gael ein dal yn ôl wrth bleidleisio. Dyna'r sefyllfa. Mae'r cofnod pleidleisio, felly, yn gywir fel y mae.

Karen Sinclair: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni all fod llawer ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn. Yr wyf wedi esbonio'r sefyllfa cyn llawned ag y gallaf.

Karen Sinclair: Ymhellach i bwynt o drefn Ann Jones, yr wyf finnau hefyd yn hyderus imi bleidleisio ar bob gwelliant i'r cynnig ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru, neu o leiaf imi

button. I wish it to be noted on the Record that I question the record of the voting.

The Presiding Officer: I do not want to have a dispute with people about whether or not they voted. I have described precisely what the situation is: when the LED appears by the word 'vote', you press the relevant button. I have to follow the same procedure in any casting vote, so I observe the system carefully and I have every confidence that it is absolutely robust and has worked properly at all times since we have been in this Chamber. I will not have the integrity of the voting system, the quality of the manufacturers or those who installed it, or the support that we have from our technological staff, questioned in this matter. The voting system is working perfectly. Members and people watching us from outside can draw their own conclusions if it appears that the voting system occasionally does not reflect the vote of individual Members. You know what the position is. I do not want to go any further on this but there are certain desks in this Chamber that know exactly who votes when and where.

William Graham: Further to that point of order, this was well discussed, as you say, in the House Committee. I endorsed your confidence in the robustness of the system and there were distinguished members of the Cabinet who also did not vote in that debate.

The Presiding Officer: We will move on.

Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

bwyso'r botwm. Hoffwn i'r ffaith gael ei nodi yn y Cofnod fy mod yn amau'r cofnod o'r bleidlais.

Y Llywydd: Nid oes arnaf eisiau mynd i ddadlau gyda phobl ynghylch a fu iddynt bleidleisio ai peidio. Yr wyf wedi disgrifio'n union beth yw'r sefyllfa: pan ymddengys yr LED wrth y gair 'pleidleisio', byddwch chi'n pwyso'r botwm perthnasol. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddilyn yr un weithdrefn mewn unrhyw bleidlais fwrw, felly gwyliaf y system yn ofalus iawn ac mae gennyf bob hyder ei bod yn gwbl gadarn a'i bod wedi gweithio'n iawn ar bob achlysur ers inni fod yn y Siambr hon. Ni chaniatâf i neb fwrw amheuaeth ar gywirdeb y system bleidleisio, ansawdd y gwneuthurwyr na'r rhai a'i gosododd, na'r cymorth a gawn gan ein staff technolegol, yn y mater hwn. Mae'r system bleidleisio'n gweithio'n berffaith. Gall Aelodau a phobl sydd yn ein gwyllo o'r tu allan lunio'u casgliadau eu hunain os ymddengys weithiau nad yw'r system bleidleisio'n adlewyrchu pleidlais Aelodau unigol. Gwyddoch beth yw'r sefyllfa. Nid oes arnaf eisiau mynd ddim pellach ynglŷn â hyn ond mae rhai desgiau yn y Siambr hon sydd yn gwybod yn union pwy sydd yn pleidleisio pa bryd ac ym mhle.

William Graham: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cafwyd trafodaeth dda ar hyn, fel y dywedwch, ym Mhwyllgor y Tŷ. Ategais eich hyder yng nghadernid y system ac yr oedd aelodau hybarch o'r Cabinet hwythau heb bleidleisio yn y ddadl honno.

Y Llywydd: Symudwn ymlaen.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p><i>1a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 on the draft the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>b) approves that the Housing (Right to Buy) (Priority of Charges) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with</i></p> <p><i>(i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006;</i></p> <p><i>(ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2947)</i></p> | <p><i>1a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Tai (Hawl i Brynu) (Blaenoriaeth Arwystlon) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag</i></p> <p><i>(i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006;</i></p> <p><i>(ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2947)</i></p> |
|---|---|

*Cynnig (NDM2947): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2947): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned (Sefydlu Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin, Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau a Diddymu Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned Llanelli/Dinefwr a Chaerfyrddin/Dinefwr) 2006
Approval of the Community Health Council (Establishment of Carmarthenshire Community Health Council, Transfer of Functions and Abolition of Llanelli/Dinefwr and Carmarthen/Dinefwr Community Health Councils) Order 2006

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Community Health Council (Establishment of Carmarthenshire Community Health Council, Transfer of Functions and Abolition of Llanelli/Dinefwr and Carmarthen/Dinefwr Community Health Councils) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2948)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned (Sefydlu Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin, Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau a Diddymu Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned Llanelli/Dinefwr a Chaerfyrddin/Dinefwr) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2948)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Community Health Council (Establishment of Carmarthenshire Community Health Council, Transfer of Functions and Abolition of Llanelli/Dinefwr and Carmarthen/Dinefwr Community Health Councils) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned (Sefydlu Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin, Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau a Diddymu Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned Llanelli/Dinefwr a Chaerfyrddin/Dinefwr) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft the Community Health Council (Establishment of

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned (Sefydlu

Carmarthenshire Community Health Council, Transfer of Functions and Abolition of Llanelli/Dinefwr and Carmarthen/Dinefwr Community Health Councils) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2949)

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru will support these regulations, but the Minister will be aware that there is local concern that the best interests of eastern Carmarthenshire and Llanelli do not always coincide with the best interests of the rural west in terms of the provision of health services. Therefore, while supporting the establishment of the joint community health councils so that there will be coterminosity with the local health board, I urge the Minister to ensure that all parts of that county continue to get a fair voice in the representations that the community health council makes to the trust and local health board.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this piece of legislation and, as we notice in the regulatory appraisal, the overwhelming response also supported the proposed amalgamation. However, what are the Minister's intentions in other cases of amalgamations of CHCs throughout Wales? The regulatory appraisal clearly states that the Assembly Government and board of CHCs in Wales wish to achieve coterminosity for the remainder of CHCs where suitable opportunities arise. What does the Minister mean by 'suitable opportunities arise'?

Will the Minister consider, and respond to, the old adage that one size does not fit all? In rural mid Wales, particularly in Powys and my constituency of Montgomeryshire, we have two CHCs that operate very effectively. Given the size and geography of Powys, there is a need that is supported by all to retain both our CHCs. Can the Minister tell us about his intentions for areas in rural

Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Sir Gaerfyrddin, Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau a Diddymu Cyngorau Iechyd Cymuned Llanelli/Dinefwr a Chaerfyrddin/Dinefwr) 2006, yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2949)

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, ond bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod pryder lleol nad yw'r hyn sydd er budd dwyrain sir Gaerfyrddin a Llanelli bob amser yn cydfynd â'r hyn sydd er budd y gorllewin gwledig o ran darparu gwasanaethau iechyd. Felly, wrth gefnogi uno'r cyngorau iechyd cymuned er mwyn rhannu ffiniau â'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, anogaf y Gweinidog i sicrhau y bydd pob rhan o'r sir honno'n parhau i gael llais teg yn y sylwadau y bydd y cyngor iechyd cymuned yn eu cyflwyno i'r ymddiriedolaeth a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol.

Mick Bates: Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ac, fel y sylwn yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol, yr oedd yr ymateb yn llethol o blaid y bwriad i uno hefyd. Fodd bynnag, beth yw bwriadau'r Gweinidog mewn achosion eraill o uno cyngorau iechyd cymuned ledled Cymru? Dywed yr arfarniad rheoliadol yn glir fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a bwrdd cyngorau iechyd cymuned Cymru'n dymuno sicrhau bod gweddill y cyngorau iechyd cymuned yn rhannu ffiniau'r bwrdd iechyd lleol lle y cyfyd cyfleoedd addas. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei olygu pan sonia am 'gyfleoedd addas' yn codi?

A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried yr hen ddywediad nad yw un maint yn iawn i bawb, ac ymateb i hynny? Yn y canolbarth gwledig, yn enwedig ym Mhowys a sir Drefaldwyn, fy etholaeth i, mae gennym ddau gyngor iechyd cymuned sy'n gweithio'n effeithiol iawn. Oherwydd maint a daearyddiaeth Powys, mae pawb yn cytuno bod angen cadw ein dau gyngor iechyd cymuned. A all y Gweinidog

Wales, particularly with regard to the amalgamation of CHCs?

ddweud wrthym am ei fwriadau ar gyfer ardaloedd yn y Gymru wledig, yn enwedig o safbwynt uno cynghorau iechyd cymuned?

4.20 p.m.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The last matter is not quite relevant to today's business, but you will know that the board of CHCs in Wales is meeting today, or met yesterday, and I will be getting a report from it on its work in this area. Therefore, it would be premature and discourteous of me to make any statement in relation to the presentations that we will have from the consultation.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid yw'r mater diwethaf yn hollol berthnasol i'r busnes heddiw, ond byddwch yn gwybod bod bwrdd cynghorau iechyd cymuned Cymru'n cyfarfod heddiw, neu wedi cyfarfod ddoe, a byddaf yn cael adroddiad oddi wrtho am ei waith yn y maes hwn. Felly, byddai'n gynamserol ac yn anghwrtais i mi wneud unrhyw ddatganiad mewn perthynas â'r sylwadau a gawn o'r ymgynghoriad.

On Helen Mary's point about CHCs, it is crucial that they fully and adequately reflect public opinion. Catherine Thomas brought some concerned citizens here from Llanelli last week, and we had a thorough debate about a lot of local issues in Llanelli. One of the concerns that the members of that delegation voiced to me was that they were not always happy that their voices were being heard in the consultation process. I was pleased to assure Catherine and the delegation that a key responsibility of CHCs was to represent their communities. I realise that it is a difficult job in Carmarthenshire for all sorts of reasons, but that must be the challenge that CHCs must rise to.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Helen Mary am gynghorau iechyd cymuned, mae'n hanfodol iddynt adlewyrchu'r farn gyhoeddus yn llawn a digonol. Daeth Catherine Thomas â rhai dinasyddion pryderus yma o Lanelli yr wythnos diwethaf, a chawsom ddatl drwyadl am lawer o faterion lleol yn Llanelli. Un o'r pryderon a leisiwyd wrthyf gan aelodau'r ddirprwyaeth honno oedd nad oeddent bob amser yn hapus bod eu lleisiau i'w clywed yn y broses ymgynghori. Yr oeddwn yn falch o sicrhau Catherine a'r ddirprwyaeth mai un o gyfrifoldebau allweddol cynghorau iechyd cymuned oedd cynrychioli eu cymunedau. Sylweddolaf ei fod yn waith anodd yn sir Gaerfyrddin am bob math o resymau, ond hynny yw'r her y mae'n rhaid i gynghorau iechyd cymuned ymateb iddi.

*Cynnig (NDM2948): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2948): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2949): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2949): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru
 (Ymchwiliadau Safonau) 2006
 Approval of the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards
 Investigations) Order 2006**

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards Investigations) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 28 February 2006. (NDM2950)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards Investigations) Order 2006; and

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru (Ymchwiliadau Safonau) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2950)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006 ynglŷn â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru (Ymchwiliadau Safonau)

2006; a

2. approves that the draft the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales (Standards Investigations) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru (Ymchwiliadau Safonau) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 28 February 2006; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Chwefror 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2951)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2951)

Y Llywydd: Ymddengys nad oes neb am siarad ar y cynnig hwn, felly awn ati i bleidleisio.

The Presiding Officer: It seems that no-one wishes to speak to this motion. We will therefore move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM2950): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2950): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2951): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2951): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestri Cyflawnwyr)
 (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
 Approval of the National Health Service (Performers Lists) (Wales)
 (Amendment) Regulations 2006**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the National Health Service (Performers Lists) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2952)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestri Cyflawnwyr) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2952)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Performers Lists) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestri Cyflawnwyr) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Performers Lists) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestri Cyflawnwyr) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2953)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2953)

Jenny Randerson: I simply wish to seek the Minister's assurance that the co-ordination

Jenny Randerson: Hoffwn yn syml ofyn am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y gwarchodir y

between local health boards in terms of the acceptance of dentists on to the register will be safeguarded. My sole concern about this is that if someone is rejected in one area, they might just apply in another area and be accepted there, having already been rejected. There may not be that flow of information from one area to another. I understand, following your earlier assurances, that if someone was previously registered and deleted from the list for some reason, the information would spread from one area to another. However, I am looking at the positive application process here in voicing my concern. If it is going to be a concern in Wales, it will be of concern across the border, because the structures are different in England. I simply want your assurance that the information flow will be satisfactory in ensuring that dentists cannot go from one area to another until they are accepted onto the list, particularly when they are, for some reason, deemed by some areas to be unsuitable.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I think that we can give that assurance, because, in effect, while the dental performer is formally registered on the list of a particular local health board, the administration is, by and large, done by a centralised business service centre in Powys. Given that much of the work behind this is in a central location, the concerns raised by Jenny will hopefully be addressed.

cydweithio rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol o ran derbyn deintyddion i'r gofrestr. Fy unig bryder ynghylch hyn yw pe câi rhywun ei wrthod mewn un ardal, y gallai wneud cais mewn ardal arall a chael ei dderbyn yno, ac yntau eisoes wedi'i wrthod. Efallai na cheir y llif gwybodaeth angenrheidiol o'r naill ardal i'r llall. Deallaf, yn dilyn eich geiriau o sicrwydd yn gynharach, pe bai rhywun wedi'i gofrestru'n flaenorol ac wedi'i dynnu oddi ar y rhestr am ryw reswm, y câi'r wybodaeth ei throsglwyddo o'r naill ardal i'r llall. Fodd bynnag, edrych ar y broses ceisiadau cadarnhaol yr wyf fi yma wrth leisio fy mhryder. Os yw'n mynd i fod yn bryder yng Nghymru, bydd yn bryder dros y ffin, oherwydd y mae'r strwythurau'n wahanol yn Lloegr. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gennych yn syml y bydd y llif gwybodaeth yn foddhaol o ran sicrhau na all deintyddion fynd o ardal i ardal hyd nes cânt eu derbyn i'r rhestr, yn enwedig pan fo rhai ardaloedd wedi barnu, am ryw reswm, eu bod yn anaddas.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Credaf y gallwn roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw, oherwydd, i bob diben, er mai ar restr bwrdd iechyd lleol penodol y cofrestrir y cyflwynydd deintyddol yn ffurfiol, gwneir y gweinyddu, ar y cyfan, gan ganolfan gwasanaeth busnes canoledig ym Mhowys. O gofio mai mewn lleoliad canolog y gwneir llawer o'r gwaith y tu ôl i hyn, gobeithio yr atebir y pryderon a godir gan Jenny.

*Cynnig (NDM2952): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2952): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2953): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2953): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau
 a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
 Approval of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances)
 (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that	Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod
--	--

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2954)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2954)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau

- | | |
|---|---|
| <p><i>Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Charges for Drugs and Appliances) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:</i></p> <p><i>a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006; and</i></p> <p><i>b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2955)</i></p> | <p><i>a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Ffioedd am Gyffuriau a Chyfarpar) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:</i></p> <p><i>a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006; a</i></p> <p><i>b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2955)</i></p> |
|---|---|

*Cynnig (NDM2954): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2954): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2955): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2955): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2956)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 March 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2956)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y

Office on 14 March 2006. (NDM2957)

These regulations will introduce a 20 per cent fee increase across the board for planning applications for 2006-07 as of 1 April this year, and a further 10 per cent fee increase across the board as of 1 April next year. It means that planning application fees in Wales can be compared to those of England on an even basis. It will also mean that applicants will bear proportionately more of the cost of planning applications and council tax payers will bear proportionately less.

Elin Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau'r hyn am fod yr egwyddor mai'r datblygwr, ac nid y trethdalwr, sy'n gyfrifol am gost unrhyw gais cynllunio yn deg. Fodd bynnag, anfonodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru dystiolaeth atom cyn cyfarfod y prynhawn yma yn nodi nad yw'r cynnydd a nodir yn y rheoliadau yn ddigon i gwrdd â chostau gweinyddu ceisiadau cynllunio. Y broblem yw bod ffi benodol i bawb wedi'i gosod yn y rheoliadau ac, felly, nid oes hyblygrwydd i newid y ffi yn rheolaidd, er enghraifft, yn unol â chwyddiant. Efallai y byddai'n well, Weinidog, pan fydd cyfle i ailedrych ar y rheoliadau hyn, pe bai lleiafswm yn cael ei osod, gan roi'r hawl i awdurdodau lleol unigol osod ychwanegiadau pe dymument wneud hynny a phe bai'r cyngor llawn yn penderfynu, yn ddemocrataidd, o blaid rhannu'r baich rhwng y datblygwr a'r trethdalwr mewn modd tecach na'r hyn a nodir yn y rheoliadau sydd o'n blaenau heddiw.

Brynle Williams: First, I would like to state that I support the principle of the cost recovery behind these regulations, but only if this fee increase results in a better service for the applicants. I have already had several constituency cases where applicants have been waiting in excess of 18 months for a decision from planners. I do not think that this is acceptable. Will the Minister guarantee that this 30 per cent increase over two years will produce a better service for the applicant and will significantly reduce the excessive delays that many people currently face?

Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2957)

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn cyflwyno cynnydd o 20 y cant yn gyffredinol mewn ffioedd am geisiadau cynllunio am 2006-07 a hynny o 1 Ebrill eleni, a chynnydd pellach o 10 y cant mewn ffioedd yn gyffredinol o 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Golyga hyn y gellir cymharu ffioedd ceisiadau cynllunio yng Nghymru ar sail gyfartal â rhai Lloegr. Bydd hefyd yn golygu y bydd ymgeiswyr yn talu cyfran fwy o gost ceisiadau cynllunio a threthdalwyr yn talu cyfran lai.

Elin Jones: Plaid Cymru will support these regulations because the principle that it is the developer, rather than the taxpayer, who is responsible for the cost of any planning application is fair. However, before this afternoon's meeting, we were sent evidence by the Welsh Local Government Association noting that the increase outlined in the regulations is not sufficient to meet the administration costs of planning applications. The problem is that a specific fee for everyone is set out in the regulations, and, therefore, there is no flexibility to change the fee on a regular basis, for example, in line with inflation. Perhaps it would be better, Minister, when there is an opportunity to revisit these regulations, to set a minimum fee and allow authorities to set additional fees should they wish to do so and should their full councils democratically decide to share the burden between the developer and the taxpayer in a way that is fairer than that which is laid out in the regulations before us today.

Brynle Williams: Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddatgan fy mod yn cefnogi'r egwyddor o adennill costau sydd y tu ôl i'r rheoliadau hyn, ond dim ond os bydd y cynnydd hwn yn y ffioedd yn arwain at well gwasanaeth i'r ymgeiswyr. Eisoës cefais sawl achos yn fy etholaeth lle y bu ymgeiswyr yn aros am fwy na 18 mis cyn cael penderfyniad gan y cynllunwyr. Nid yw hyn yn dderbyniol yn fy marn i. A wnaiff y Gweinidog warantu y bydd y cynnydd hwn o 30 y cant dros ddwy flynedd yn rhoi gwasanaeth gwell i'r ymgeisydd ac yn arwain at leihad sylweddol yn y cyfnodau y mae llawer o bobl yn gorfod disgwyl ar hyn o bryd?

4.30 p.m.

Finally, I must stress that the danger of these additional fees pushing up house prices for first-time buyers concerns me slightly. Developers will recover these costs when properties are sold. Having these fees passed on to the buyers will only add to the current difficulties that many young families and first-time buyers have in gaining a foothold on the housing ladder.

Mick Bates: The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the principle of these regulations, as we have discussed before. However, it is important that we are in receipt of regular evaluation of how progress is maintained to recover the costs of planning applications because we are all aware of the difficulties, in many planning departments, with recruitment and retention of staff when the costs of dealing with planning applications fall short of the real costs incurred by the local authorities. That, for most of us, is of great concern because we wish to retain the quality of advice for planning applications within all of our local authorities. I know that my own authority in Powys is concerned that there should be a greater dedication of funds to ensure that a quality planning service is retained.

Further to that, I would like to hear more on how you will measure the improved performance as the 10 per cent increases go through, as this regulation demands. Our scrutiny of how planning occurs is important in helping people understand that cost recovery is an important principle in terms of dealing with any public service—planning being one of those. On monitoring, it is important that we can be assured today that full scrutiny and presentation of an improvement in planning services will be forthcoming in terms of this increase in planning charges.

Alun Cairns: Planning fees clearly form a significant source of income for a range of local authorities and there is a need for consistency from the Assembly and from the

Yn olaf, rhaid imi bwysleisio bod y tebygolrwydd y bydd y ffioedd ychwanegol hyn yn peri i brisiau tai godi i bobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf yn fy mhryderu rywfaint. Bydd datblygwyr yn adennill y costau hyn pan gaiff tai eu gwerthu. Os caiff y ffioedd hyn eu trosglwyddo i'r prynwyr bydd hynny'n ychwanegu at yr anawsterau sy'n wynebu llawer o deuluoedd ifanc a phobl sy'n prynu tai am y tro cyntaf ar hyn o bryd wrth iddynt geisio cael troedle ar yr ysgol dai.

Mick Bates: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi egwyddor y rheoliadau hyn, fel yr ydym wedi trafod o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig inni weld arfarnu rheolaidd ar y cynnydd a wneir i adennill costau ceisiadau cynllunio gan ein bod oll yn gwybod am yr anawsterau sydd ohoni, mewn sawl adran gynllunio, o ran recriwtio a chadw staff, a chostau delio â cheisiadau cynllunio'n llawer llai na'r gwir gostau i'r awdurdodau lleol. I'r rhan fwyaf ohonom, mae hynny'n peri cryn bryder am ein bod am gynnal safon y cyngor a roddir ar gyfer ceisiadau cynllunio ym mhob un o'n hawdurdodau lleol. Gwn fod fy awdurdod i ym Mhowys yn awyddus i gael rhagor o gyllid i sicrhau bod gwasanaeth cynllunio o safon yn cael ei gynnal.

Yn ogystal â hynny, hoffwn glywed rhagor am sut y byddwch yn mesur y gwelliant o ran perfformiad wrth i'r cynnydd o 10 y cant fynd rhagddo, yn unol â'r rheoliad hwn. Mae craffu gennym ar y modd y bydd cynllunio'n gweithio'n bwysig wrth helpu pobl i ddeall bod adennill costau'n egwyddor bwysig o ran delio ag unrhyw wasanaeth cyhoeddus—a chynllunio yn eu plith. O ran monitro, mae'n bwysig inni gael sicrwydd heddiw y bydd craffu llawn a chyflawni gwelliannau yn y gwasanaethau cynllunio'n digwydd yn sgîl y cynnydd hwn mewn taliadau cynllunio.

Alun Cairns: Mae'n amlwg bod ffioedd cynllunio'n ffynhonnell incwm sylweddol i lawer o awdurdodau lleol ac mae angen cysondeb gan y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth

Welsh Assembly Government on the direction of planning fees. It may well be that some authorities have planned increases according to previous statements from Ministers or from committee members on where they expect planning fees to end up and those can have an implication on council tax. So, I highlight that significant issue.

The second issue that I highlight is the cap on the fees. We currently face a situation whereby all of the fees charged by planning authorities do not meet the costs incurred by planning authorities in considering applications. On large developers, with a cap in place, you end up with a situation where an individual requesting permission for an extension on the back of his or her home may well end up subsidising large developers, who, through current gains in planning permission on land, make significant profits. Surely, we need to get to a position whereby planning departments are run efficiently through the fees that they raise, so that, if a cap needs to be in place, it is set at a more reasonable level, particularly when highway assessments for larger developments need to be taken into consideration. However, the impact on income for local authorities is significant and can, in turn, significantly influence council-tax levels.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):

Ar bwynt Elin Jones ar daliadau cynllunio, mae'n bwysig bod y taliadau'r un fath dros Gymru gyfan. Mae'n rhaid sicrhau sefyllfa gyfartal ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, derbynias ei phwynt. Soniodd Alun Cairns bod cost ceisiadau cynllunio yn llawer uwch na'r ffi ei hun. Yn ôl ein ffigurau, mae datblygwyr yn talu tua hanner cost y cais ac y mae'r hanner arall yn cael ei dalu—wedi i'r ffioedd hyn gael eu cymeradwyo heddiw—gan y cyngor. Felly, mae'n rhaid i ni symud tuag at sefyllfa lle mae 100 y cant o'r costau'n cael eu talu gan ddatblygwyr.

On Brynle's point, we all want to see an improved planning system. Leading on to what Mick Bates said, we are introducing a robust evaluation framework, which is currently being developed. That framework will seek to monitor the improvements that

Cynulliad Cymru ynghylch cyfeiriad ffioedd cynllunio. Efallai fod rhai awdurdodau wedi bwriadu codi'r ffioedd yn unol â datganiadau blaenorol gan Weinidogion neu aelodau pwyllgorau ynglŷn â'r hyn y disgwylir iddo ddigwydd i ffioedd cynllunio a gall y rheini effeithio ar y dreth gyngor. Felly, yr wyf yn tynnu sylw at y mater pwysig hwnnw.

Yr ail fater yr wyf am dynnu sylw ato yw'r cap ar ffioedd. Ar hyn o bryd yn y sefyllfa sydd ohoni nid yw'r holl ffioedd y bydd awdurdodau cynllunio'n eu codi yn ddigon i dalu'r costau a ddaw i ran awdurdodau cynllunio wrth ystyried ceisiadau. O ran datblygwyr mawr, pe bai cap, dichon y gallai sefyllfa godi lle y byddai unigolyn sy'n gwneud cais cynllunio ar gyfer estyniad i'w gartref neu'i chartref yn sybsideiddio datblygwyr mawr, sydd, oherwydd yr enillion cyfredol ar ganiatâd cynllunio ar dir, yn gwneud elw sylweddol. Heb os nac oni bai, mae angen inni gyrraedd sefyllfa pan fydd adrannau cynllunio'n cael eu cynnal yn effeithlon trwy'r ffioedd a godant, ac os oes angen cap, dylid ei bennu ar lefel fwy rhesymol, yn enwedig pan fo angen asesiad priffyrdd ar gyfer datblygiadau mwy. Fodd bynnag, mae'r effaith ar incwm awdurdodau lleol yn sylweddol a gall hynny, yn ei dro, ddylanwadu'n helaeth ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):

On Elin Jones's point on planning fees, it is important that the payments are the same throughout Wales. We need a level playing field on this. However, I accept her point. Alun Cairns mentioned that the cost of planning applications is much greater than the fee itself. According to our figures, developers pay half the cost of applications and the other half is paid—after these fees are approved today—by the council. Therefore, we must move towards 100 per cent of costs being paid by developers.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Brynle, yr ydym oll am weld gwell system gynllunio. Gan droi at yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick Bates, yr ydym yn cyflwyno fframwaith arfarnu cadarn, sydd wrthi'n cael ei ddatblygu ar hyn o bryd. Bydd y fframwaith hwnnw'n ceisio monitro'r

are taking place and it will be used as the basis to inform decisions on the level of fees from 2008 onwards. Therefore, we expect to see improvements in the planning service. If there are delays of months for planning applications, it may be open to applicants to appeal planning applications for non-determination; that is a matter for them, of course.

In terms of applications for new dwellings, the effect of the increase will be minimal: a £48 increase in new dwelling applications for next year and a further increase of some £28 the following year. Therefore, we are not talking about an enormous increase which would be passed on to first-time buyers where the costs are low to begin with.

In terms of Alun Cairns's points, these are matters that need to be considered in the future. He seemed to be arguing for a tax, almost, on large profits made by developers; that is something that we will consider with some interest.

gwelliannau sy'n digwydd ac fe'i defnyddir yn sail i benderfyniadau ynghylch lefel y ffioedd o 2008 ymlaen. Felly, disgwyliwn weld gwelliannau yn y gwasanaeth cynllunio. Os bydd misoedd o oedi ar gyfer ceisiadau cynllunio, gallai ymgeiswyr apelio am nad oes penderfyniad wedi'i wneud ynghylch eu ceisiadau cynllunio; mater iddynt hwy yw hynny, wrth gwrs.

O ran ceisiadau am anheddau newydd, bydd effaith y cynnydd yn fach iawn: cynnydd o £48 ar gyfer ceisiadau am anheddau newydd y flwyddyn nesaf a chynnydd arall o ryw £28 y flwyddyn ganlynol. Felly, nid ydym yn sôn am gynnydd anferth a gâi ei drosglwyddo i bobl sy'n prynu am y tro cyntaf lle y mae'r costau'n isel i ddechrau.

O ran pwyntiau Alun Cairns, mae'r rhain yn faterion y bydd angen eu hystyried at y dyfodol. Yr oedd i'w weld yn dadlau dros dreth, bron, ar yr elw mawr y bydd datblygwyr yn ei wneud; mae hynny'n rhywbeth a ystyrir gennym gyda chryn ddiddordeb.

*Cynnig (NDM2956): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2956): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2957): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2957): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru)
 2006**

**Approval of the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales)
 Regulations 2006**

Motion (NDM2958): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis.
 Add a new point at the end of the motion:

requires the Welsh Assembly Government to fully cost the financial implications of these regulations for local authorities and to make provision accordingly.

Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis.
 Add a new point at the end of the motion:

recognises that a registration system would better protect the interests of privately fostered children than a situation in which private foster carers are required only to notify local authorities about arrangements.

Cynnig (NDM2958): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynnu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn costio goblygiadau ariannol y rheoliadau hyn yn llawn ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol ac yn gwneud darpariaeth yn unol â hynny.

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod y byddai system gofrestru'n amddiffyn buddiannau plant sydd wedi'u maethu'n breifat yn well na sefyllfa lle nad oes ond gofyn i ofalwyr maeth preifat hysbysu awdurdodau lleol am y trefniadau.

Motion (NDM2959): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006.*

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 i NDM2958 yn enw Lisa Francis.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2958)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering)(Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

2. *approves that the draft the Children (Private Arrangements for Fostering)(Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 7*

Cynnig (NDM2959): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006.*

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 to NDM2958 in the name of Lisa Francis.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2958)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plant (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno*

March 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2959)

Mark Isherwood: I propose amendment 1. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

requires the Welsh Assembly Government to fully cost the financial implications of these regulations for local authorities and to make provision accordingly.

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

recognises that a registration system would better protect the interests of privately fostered children than a situation in which private foster carers are required only to notify local authorities about arrangements.

The regulatory appraisal on these regulations states that there may be limited additional expenditure implications for local authorities. Local authorities express concerns that the regulations would create a case for specific funding, add to capacity problems of front-line staff, and put pressure on authorities to divert resources away from other children's services. The British Association for Adoption and Fostering has asked whether a new ring-fenced grant will be made available to local authorities to ensure that the private fostering measures are funded, reflecting a degree of concern. However, rather than being provided with costings, we are rather casually told that, to the extent that additional costs arise, these could be met from increases in the services for children's budget which are:

'intended to meet new burdens arising from, among other things, the Children Act 2004'.

Approximately one-third of this has been transferred to local government.

Governments in London and Cardiff have made a clear commitment not to impose additional burdens on local authorities if they were unfunded. However, it has not been made clear to local authorities how the

ar 7 Mawrth 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2959)

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiau welliant 1. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynnu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn costio goblygiadau ariannol y rheoliadau hyn yn llawn ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol ac yn gwneud darpariaeth yn unol â hynny.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cydnabod y byddai system gofrestru'n amddiffyn buddiannau plant sydd wedi'u maethu'n breifat yn well na sefyllfa lle nad oes ond gofyn i ofalwyr maeth preifat hysbysu awdurdodau lleol am y trefniadau.

Mae arfarniad rheoliadol y rheoliadau hyn yn dweud y gallai fod goblygiadau ariannol ychwanegol cyfyngedig i awdurdodau lleol. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn poeni y byddai'r rheoliadau'n creu achos dros gyllid penodol, gan ychwanegu at broblemau capasiti staff y rheng flaen, a dwyn pwysau ar awdurdodau i dynnu adnoddau oddi ar wasanaethau eraill sy'n ymwneud â phlant. Mae Cymdeithas Mabwysiadu a Maethu Prydain wedi gofyn a fydd grant newydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol, a hwnnw wedi'i neilltuo, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y mesurau maethu preifat eu cyllido, sy'n arwydd o beth pryder. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na rhoi'r costau inni, dywedir wrthym yn ddigon didaro, i'r graddau y bydd costau ychwanegol, y gellid talu'r rheini drwy'r cynnydd yng nghyllideb y gwasanaethau plant sydd:

i fod i dalu am feichiau newydd a gyfyd, ymhlith pethau eraill, o Ddeddf Plant 2004.

Mae tua thraean hyn wedi ei drosglwyddo i lywodraeth leol.

Mae Llywodraethau Llundain a Chaerdydd wedi gwneud ymrwymiad clir i beidio â rhoi beichiau ychwanegol ar ysgwyddau awdurdodau lleol heb eu cyllido. Fodd bynnag, nid eglurwyd i'r awdurdodau lleol

scheme will be funded over the long term. Much of the additional funding will be targeted at the training of foster carers and providing information to them, but not at allowances. It does not, therefore, tackle the problem of proper funding for the scheme. It has the potential to cut across the ability of the local authority to develop different arrangements for paying allowances, expenses and other specific grants for costs such as holidays or school trips to foster carers. It is important that local variables, such as the age profile of the looked-after child population, are taken into account when determining allowances locally.

We welcome these regulations but we want to see the beef, which is why the Welsh Assembly Government must fully cost the financial implications for local authorities and make provision accordingly.

Every report that the UK Government commissioned in the five years prior to the Children Act 2004 confirmed that privately fostered children are vulnerable, as we know, but also that a registration system involving the approval of private foster carers would protect their interests better than the current situation in which private foster carers are required only to notify local authorities about arrangements. However, these regulations only provide a strengthened notification scheme.

As my colleague, Tim Lawton, stated in Westminster, the opposition still cannot understand why the Government has proved to be so inflexible on this issue. He added that a registration scheme would help to give much more protection to a host of children whose fostering arrangements were inadequate and ensure that legitimate fosterers are properly remunerated, incentivised and trained. They will then be able to take on much more of the workload, especially with difficult children so that such children can be given a second chance. That is why amendment 2 calls on the Assembly to recognise that a registration system would better protect the interests of many privately fostered children.

sut y caiff y cynllun ei gyllido yn y tymor hir. Caiff llawer o'r cyllid ychwanegol ei dargedu ar hyfforddi gofalwyr maeth a rhoddi gwybodaeth iddynt, ond nid ar lwfansau. Felly, nid yw'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o roddi cyllid priodol i'r cynllun. Gallai dorri ar draws gallu'r awdurdod lleol i ddatblygu gwahanol drefniadau i dalu lwfansau, treuliau a grantiau penodol eraill ar gyfer costau megis gwyliau neu deithiau ysgolion i ofalwyr maeth. Mae'n bwysig ystyried gwahaniaethau lleol, megis proffil oedran poblogaeth y plant sy'n derbyn gofal, wrth bennu lwfansau'n lleol.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn ond hoffem weld cig ar yr asgwrn, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gostio'r goblygiadau ariannol yn llawn ar gyfer yr awdurdodau lleol a darparu'n unol â hynny.

Ym mhob adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan yn ystod y pum mlynedd cyn Deddf Plant 2004 cadarnhawyd bod plant a gaiff eu maethu'n breifat yn agored i niwed, fel y gwyddom, ond hefyd y byddai system gofrestru a fyddai'n mynnu bod gofalwyr maeth preifat yn gorfod cael eu cymeradwyo'n gwarchod eu buddiannau'n well na'r sefyllfa bresennol lle nad oes raid i ofalwyr maeth preifat wneud dim ond hysbysu awdurdodau lleol am y trefniadau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r rheoliadau hyn ond yn darparu cynllun hysbysu gwell.

Ys dywedodd fy nghyd-aelod, Tim Lawton, yn San Steffan, nid yw'r gwrthbleidiau'n deall pam y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod mor anhyblyg ynghylch y mater hwn. Ychwanegodd y byddai cynllun cofrestru'n amddiffyn llawer iawn o blant yr oedd eu trefniadau maethu'n annigonol gan sicrhau y câi rhieni maeth dilys eu talu, eu hysgogi a'u hyfforddi'n briodol. Yna byddant yn gallu ysgwyddo llawer mwy o'r llwyth gwaith, yn enwedig gyda phlant anodd fel y bydd modd rhoi ail gyfle i blant o'r fath. Dyna pam y mae gwelliant 2 yn galw ar y Cynulliad i gydnabod y byddai system gofrestru'n well o ran amddiffyn buddiannau llawer o blant sy'n cael eu maethu'n breifat.

4.40 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru will support these wholly sensible regulations, which we welcome the opportunity to scrutinise in some detail in committee. I support amendment 1, and associate myself with Mark Isherwood's comments that it is important that any additional burdens on local government are fully funded. However, we will not be able to support amendment 2. I can see what the Conservative group is attempting to achieve with this, but I feel that there may be a misunderstanding about the nature of the arrangements that this set of regulations seeks to regulate.

We are talking here, essentially, about private arrangements that are normally made between family members. A registration system—for example, for an aunt taking care of a niece or nephew—might be rather too formal. Many private fostering arrangements are one-offs—they are not someone seeking to become a foster parent in the full sense; they are a family member, responding to a particular emergency situation. Some families may be deterred by this. To give some practical examples, most local authorities will not register smokers as foster parents; normally, when we are talking about a public fostering arrangement, most of us might feel that that was right, but it would not be right for the same criteria to be applied to a member of the child's family. Therefore, we are not content to support amendment 2, although we fully support the intention to provide maximum support and protection for children.

I will put one point to the Minister that I raised with him in committee—he can, hopefully, expand on that today. I draw his attention to the fact, of which he will be well aware, that private fostering arrangements are particularly prevalent in some ethnic minority communities. These regulations rightly place responsibilities on families to make social services departments aware when they have made these arrangements, and we all welcome that. However, what can the Minister tell us about what he is doing to ensure that members of those ethnic minority communities who might be particularly affected are aware of their new

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau cwbl synhwyrol hyn, ac yr ydym yn croesawu'r cyfle i graffu arnynt yn eithaf manwl mewn pwyllgor. Cefnogaf welliant 1, a chysylltaf fy hun â sylwadau Mark Isherwood ynghylch pwysigrwydd cyllido unrhyw faich ychwanegol a roddir ar ysgwyddau llywodraeth leol yn llawn. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 2. Yr wyf yn deall yr hyn y mae grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn ceisio'i gyflawni yn hyn o beth, ond teimlaf efallai fod camddealltwriaeth ynglŷn â natur y trefniadau y mae'r set hon o reoliadau'n ceisio'u rheoleiddio.

Sôn yr ydym, yn y bôn, am drefniadau preifat a wneir fel arfer rhwng aelodau teuluoedd. Gallai system gofrestru—er enghraifft, ar gyfer modryb sy'n gofalu am nith neu nai—fod yn rhy ffurfiol braidd. Trefniadau untro yw llawer o'r trefniadau maethu preifat—yn hytrach na bod rhywun yn ceisio mynd yn rhiant maeth yng ngwir ystyr y gair; aelod o'r teulu ydyw sy'n ymateb i argyfwng. Gallai hyn atal rhai teuluoedd. O roi rhai enghreifftiau ymarferol, ni wnaiff y rhan fwyaf o'r awdurdodau lleol gofrestru ysmygwyr yn rhieni maeth; gan mwyaf, wrth sôn am drefniadau maethu cyhoeddus, efallai y byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn meddwl bod hynny'n iawn, ond ni fyddai'n iawn defnyddio'r un meini prawf yn achos aelod o deulu'r plentyn. Felly, nid ydym yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliant 2, er ein bod yn llwyr gefnogi'r bwriad i roi'r cymorth a'r amddiffyniad llwyr i blant.

Yr wyf am ddwyn un pwynt gerbron y Gweinidog a godais gydag ef yn y pwyllgor—gall yntau, gobeithiaf, ymhelaethu ar hynny heddiw. Tynnaf ei sylw at y ffaith, ffaith y bydd yn gwybod amdani'n iawn, fod trefniadau maethu preifat yn hynod gyffredin ymhlith rhai cymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Gesyd y rheoliadau hyn, a chyfiawn yw hynny, gyfrifoldebau ar deuluoedd i roi gwybod i adrannau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol pan fyddant wedi gwneud y trefniadau hyn, ac yr ydym oll yn croesawu hynny. Er hynny, beth y gall y Gweinidog ei ddweud wrthym ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud i sicrhau bod aelodau'r cymunedau

responsibilities under these regulations? I urge him to work with voluntary organisations that represent those communities, to ensure that we do not reach a situation where loving and supportive families find themselves inadvertently in breach of a law that they did not even realise they were supposed to comply with.

We will support these regulations, and amendment 1, but we will not support amendment 2.

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support these welcome regulations. We will also support both the Conservative amendments. We support amendment 2 because we understand that that is really what these regulations are doing—in effect, they create a register of people who are privately fostering children. Strangely worded as the amendment may be, I assume, having read the regulations with care, that, when a local authority is given information that a family is privately fostering a child, it will place that information on a register. Therefore, those individuals are registering themselves as in a private fostering situation.

There are all sorts of details in these regulations: you must give six weeks' notice that you will be privately fostering; if you cease to privately foster, you need to inform the local authority that you have ceased to do so within a short timescale; you must inform the local authority of the reason why you are ceasing to privately foster, and so on. To me, that means that they are effectively creating a register, and conducting a registration scheme. The Minister might wish to comment on that.

Normally, as Helen Mary pointed out, these arrangements come about simply because of a crisis in an individual family, and, often, it is either close relatives or close friends who pick up this situation. From my own experience, I know that this situation can come upon people almost gradually—they

lleiafrifoedd ethnig hynny, y gallai hyn effeithio arnynt yn neilltuol, yn gwybod am y cyfrifoldebau newydd sydd ganddynt dan y rheoliadau hyn? Yr wyf yn ei annog i weithio gyda mudiadau gwirfoddol sy'n cynrychioli'r cymunedau hynny, er mwyn sicrhau na fydd sefyllfa lle y bydd teuluoedd cariadlon a chefnogol yn eu cael eu hunain yn ddarwybod yn torri cyfraith nad oeddent hyd yn oed yn gwybod bod gofyn iddynt gydymffurfio â hi.

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, a gwelliant 1, ond ni fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 2.

Jenny Randerson: Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r gwelliannau hynod dderbyniol hyn. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi dau welliant y Ceidwadwyr. Cefnogwn welliant 2 oherwydd ein bod yn deall mai dyna'n union y mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn ei wneud—mewn gwirionedd, maent yn creu cofrestr o bobl sy'n maethu plant yn breifat. Er bod geiriad y gwelliant yn rhyfedd efallai, tybiaf, o ddarllen y rheoliadau'n ofalus, os bydd awdurdod lleol yn cael gwybodaeth i ddweud bod teulu'n maethu plentyn yn breifat, y bydd yn rhoi'r wybodaeth honno ar gofrestr. Felly, mae'r unigolion hynny'n eu cofrestru eu hunain mewn modd tebyg i sefyllfa o faethu breifat.

Mae pob math o fanylion yn y rheoliadau hyn: mae'n rhaid rhoi rhybudd o chwe wythnos y byddwch yn maethu'n breifat; os byddwch yn rhoi'r gorau i faethu'n breifat, bydd angen i chi hysbysu'r awdurdod lleol eich bod wedi rhoi'r gorau iddi o fewn cyfnod byr; bydd yn rhaid i chi hysbysu'r awdurdod lleol o'r rheswm pam yr ydych yn rhoi'r gorau i'r maethu preifat, ac yn y blaen. Yn fy marn i, golyga hynny eu bod mewn gwirionedd yn creu cofrestr, ac yn cynnal cynllun cofrestru. Efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog gynnig sylwadau ynghylch hynny.

Fel rheol, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, cyfyd y trefniadau hyn yn sgîl argyfwng mewn teulu unigol, ac, yn aml, perthnasau agos neu gyfeillion agos sy'n camu i'r adwy. Yn ôl fy mhrofiad i, gwn y gall hyn ddigwydd i bobl yn raddol bron—maent yn gofalu am blant sydd, er enghraifft, wedi colli eu rhieni mewn

look after children, who, for example, have lost their parents in something like a car accident, and so on; they take up the immediate crisis situation, and it becomes a fostering situation. Will the Minister comment on how this is going to be carried out in practice? I am aware that people may not set out to foster, but, in practice, a fostering situation can evolve. The timescales here are very strict, and I hope they would be applied with sensitivity and that information would be supplied to families in that situation so that they are made aware of their responsibility to register as private fosterers.

Brian Gibbons: I agree with Helen Mary in relation to Mark Isherwood. These are private fostering arrangements and some of the comments that Mark made were not relevant to such arrangements. On local government, as you said, children's funding has gone up by £10 million to £42 million in 2005-06, and will increase to £45 million in the next financial year. In view of the workload involved in this, it is likely to be more than accommodated within that generic increase of support to local government. Our understanding is that the number of private fostering arrangements at the moment is quite small. Some of the points that were made would be quite relevant if the numbers were much bigger, but because the numbers are relatively small, the points are not particularly relevant.

In terms of publicity, we anticipate that one of the biggest costs of this scheme will be the publicity cost, and I believe that around £45,000 has been allocated by the Assembly Government for leaflets and literature in support of this scheme. Much of the good practice that Helen Mary suggested is the way forward to ensure that people from ethnic minorities, who might be more likely to use private fostering arrangements, have their obligations made known to them. It is possible that one reason for the current numbers is ignorance, and so the numbers may increase. That is the reason why the UK Government, in recognising the requirement to move towards registration, included a sunset clause in the original 2004 legislation. It proposed that if existing arrangements did not prove to be adequate by November 2008, registration could be deemed necessary in the

damwain car neu rywbeth felly, ac yn y blaen; camant i'r adwy mewn argyfwng enbyd, a thry'n sefyllfa o faethu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sylwadau ynghylch sut y gwneir hyn yn ymarferol? Yr wyf yn ymwybodol nad yw'n fwriad gan bobl faethu i ddechrau efallai, ond y gall sefyllfa o faethu, yn ymarferol, ddatblygu. Mae'r terfynau amser hyn yn gaeth iawn, a gobeithio y byddent yn cael eu gweithredu'n sensitif ac y byddai gwybodaeth yn cael ei rhoi i deuluoedd yn y sefyllfa honno fel eu bod yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldeb i gofrestru fel maethwyr preifat.

Brian Gibbons: Cytunaf â Helen Mary ynghylch Mark Isherwood. Trefniadau meithrin preifat yw'r rhain ac nid oedd rhai o sylwadau Mark yn berthnasol i drefniadau o'r fath. O ran llywodraeth leol, fel y dywedaso, cynyddodd y cyllid i blant o £10 miliwn i £42 miliwn yn 2005-06, a bydd yn cynyddu eto i £45 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Yn wyneb y llwyth gwaith y mae hyn yn ei olygu, mae'n debygol y bydd mwy na digon ar gyfer hynny yn y cynnydd cyffredinol mewn cymorth i lywodraeth leol. Yn ôl a ddeallwn, ychydig o drefniadaeth maethu fel hyn sydd ar hyn o bryd. Byddai rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd yn eithaf perthnasol petai'r niferoedd yn fwy o lawer, ond gan mai cymharol fach yw'r niferoedd, nid yw'r pwyntiau yn arbennig o berthnasol.

O ran cyhoeddusrwydd, rhagwelwn mai un o brif gostau'r cynllun hwn fydd cost y cyhoeddusrwydd, a chredaf fod tua £45,000 wedi ei ddyrannu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer taflenni a llenyddiaeth i gefnogi'r cynllun hwn. Mae llawer o'r arferion da a awgrymwyd gan Helen Mary yn ffordd ymlaen er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig, a all fod yn fwy tebygol o ddefnyddio trefniadau maethu preifat, yn cael gwybod am eu cyfrifoldebau. Dichon mai anwybodaeth yw un rheswm am y niferoedd presennol, ac felly fe all y niferoedd gynyddu. Dyma pam y bu i Lywodraeth y DU, wrth gydnabod y gofyniad i symud tuag at gofrestru, gynnwys cymal machlud yn neddfwriaeth wreiddiol 2004. Yr oedd yn cynnig, pe na bai'r trefniadau a oedd yn bodoli eisoes yn ddigonol erbyn mis Tachwedd 2008, y gellid barnu bod angen

light of experience. That is part of the original primary legislation, although Helen Mary's point is quite correct: drawing up a registration for these very specific sets of circumstances seems disproportionately onerous and intrusive.

On Jenny's point with regard to unforeseen circumstances, we were asked in committee what would be regarded as a suitable length of time in which one would deem a private fostering arrangement to have started, and we gave an indication of around 28 days. Therefore, in the event of a tragedy such as a traffic accident, if the child was likely to be placed with new foster parents for in excess of 28 days, then these regulations would kick in and those people would be under a duty to immediately inform social services that they were engaged in a private fostering arrangement. That is if the placement seems likely to last 28 days or more. Hopefully, that clarifies that point. I do not feel that there is any support or merit in the amendments, and I would urge that they be rejected. I urge Members to support the main motion.

cofrestru yng ngoleuni profiad. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol wreiddiol, er bod pwynt Helen Mary yn berffaith gywir: mae gwneud cofrestr ar gyfer amgylchiadau penodol iawn fel y rhain yn ymddangos yn anghymesur o feichus ac ymwithiol.

O ran pwynt Jenny ynghylch amgylchiadau nad ydynt wedi cael eu rhagweld, gofynnwyd i ni yn y pwyllgor beth, yn ein barn ni, fyddai'n gyfnod addas o amser lle y gellid barnu bod trefniant maethu preifat wedi dechrau, a'r awgrym a roesom oedd rhyw 28 diwrnod. Felly, pe digwyddai rhyw drychineb megis damwain ffordd, petai'r plentyn yn debyg o gael ei leoli gyda rhieni maeth newydd am fwy na 28 diwrnod, yna deuai'r rheoliadau hyn i rym a byddai dyletswydd ar y bobl hynny i hysbysu'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn syth eu bod yn rhan o drefniant maethu preifat. Hynny yw, os yw'r lleoliad yn edrych fel petai am bara 28 diwrnod neu fwy. Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn gwneud y pwynt hwnnw'n glir. Ni theimlaf bod dim cefnogaeth i'r gwelliannau na rhinwedd ynddynt, a byddwn yn annog eu gwrthod. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r prif gynnig.

4.50 p.m.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
 Amendment 2: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2958): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

*considers the principle of the Children
 (Private Arrangements for Fostering)
 (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which*

Cynnig (NDM2958): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Plant
 (Trefniadau Preifat ar gyfer Maethu)
 (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y*

was laid in the Table Office on 7 March Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006.

Cynnig (NDM2958): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2958): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2959): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2959): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Chanlyniadol
Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol
(Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac
Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Sylfaenol)
(Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau
Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Chytundebau Gwasanaethau
Deintyddol Personol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif
24.27(iv)**

**Approval of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services
Transitional and Consequential Provisions (Wales) (No.2) Order 2006, the
Functions of Local Health Boards and the NHS Business Services Authority
(Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG) (Primary Dental Services) (Wales)
Regulations 2006, and the National Health Service (General Dental Services
Contracts and Personal Dental Services Agreements) (Amendment) (Wales)
Regulations 2006, under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv)**

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y tair eitem nesaf ynghyd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next three items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional and Consequential Provisions (Wales) (No.2) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2961)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Chanlyniadol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2961)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

approves that the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional and Consequential Provisions (Wales) (No.2) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2962)

yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Chanlyniadol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2962)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Functions of Local Health Boards and the NHS Business Services Authority (Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG) (Primary Dental Services) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2963)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

approves that the Functions of Local Health Boards and the NHS Business Services Authority (Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG) (Primary Dental Services) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2964)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts and Personal Dental Services Agreements) Amendment (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2965)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

approves that the National Health Service (General Dental Services Contracts and Personal Dental Services Agreements) Amendment (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 21 March 2006. (NDM2966)

Helen Mary Jones: Briefly, given the time, I repeat the concerns that have been put to the Minister on a number of occasions, that the new contract, in and of itself, will not necessarily solve the problem that we have had with NHS dentists leaving the service and choosing to work privately. I urge him again to monitor the number of dentists who

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Sylfaenol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2963)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac Awdurdod Gwasanaethau Busnes y GIG (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Sylfaenol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2964)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Chytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2965)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Contractau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Chytundebau Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 21 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2966)

Helen Mary Jones: Yn fyr, o ystyried yr amser, ailadroddaf y pryderon a gyflwynwyd i'r Gweinidog nifer o weithiau, na fydd y contract newydd ynddo'i hun o raid yn datrys y broblem sydd wedi bod gennym o ddeintyddion y GIG yn gadael y gwasanaeth ac yn dewis gweithio'n breifat. Anogaf ef unwaith eto i fonitro nifer y deintyddion sydd

are leaving the NHS. I very much share his hope that this will fall like a stone in the face of the new contract; on the other hand, I do not necessarily share his optimism that it will do so.

Can the Minister confirm that all dentists have now received a copy of the new contract and tell us when they did so? Can he tell us what information has been provided to help them to calculate their new income levels? Hopefully, those income levels will be sufficient for those dentists to want to continue to work in the NHS under the new system. I also press the Minister—if he cannot clarify this this afternoon, perhaps he can come back to me at another time—to clarify how dentists were remunerated under the pilot schemes. My understanding is that some of the support for the pilot schemes was because some of the remuneration was based on list sizes, allowing the dentist to undertake more preventative work, and that there is a feeling that the new contracts do not carry this on, because they are solely based, once more, on a unit of activity, which, arguably, leads us back to a treadmill approach.

We will support these regulations, as we have no desire to delay the introduction of the system, but we do not share the Government's view that the new contract will fix it all. We urge the Minister to monitor nationally whether or not we continue to lose dental practitioners from the public health system, as well as ensuring that the local health boards monitor that at a local level.

Jonathan Morgan: We will support the dental regulations, but I am still concerned at the lack of enthusiasm among many dentists in Wales for this new contract, which is in stark contrast to how the other professional contracts were dealt with. There are still many dentists in Wales who do not feel that this contract has been dealt with in the most appropriate way. I recently received a letter, which I believe has been sent to you as well, from a senior dental practitioner in Cardiff who says that the Government spin would like the public to believe that this is a good contract, but that the reality is very different. He goes on to say that, under GDS, there are

yn gadael y GIG. Yr wyf, fel yntau, yn mawr obeithio y bydd hyn yn gostwng ar ei union yn sgîl y contract newydd; ar y llaw arall, nid wyf o raid yn cyd-fynd â'i optimistiaeth y gwnaiff hynny.

A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod pob deintydd bellach wedi derbyn copi o'r contract newydd, a dweud wrthym pryd? A all ddweud wrthym pa wybodaeth a ddarparwyd i'w helpu i gyfrifo'u lefelau incwm newydd? Y gobaith yw y bydd y lefelau incwm hynny yn ddigon i beri i'r deintyddion hynny fod eisiau parhau i weithio yn y GIG dan y system newydd. Pwysaf hefyd ar y Gweinidog—os na all egluro hyn y prynhawn yma, efallai y gwnaiff roi ateb imi rywbryd eto—i egluro sut y talwyd i ddeintyddion dan y cynlluniau peilot. Yr wyf yn cael ar ddeall i'r cynlluniau peilot hyn gael peth cefnogaeth am fod y tâl yn seiliedig ar faint y rhestrau, a oedd yn caniatáu i'r deintydd wneud mwy o waith ataliol, a bod teimlad nad yw'r contractau newydd yn parhau â hyn, am eu bod yn gyfan gwbl seiliedig, unwaith eto, ar uned gweithgaredd, sydd, gellir dadlau, yn mynd â ni'n ôl at ddull melin droed.

Fe gefnogwn y rheoliadau hyn, gan nad ydym yn awyddus i ohirio cyflwyno'r system, ond nid ydym o'r un farn â'r Llywodraeth y bydd y contract newydd yn gwella pob dim. Anogwn y Gweinidog i fonitro'n genedlaethol i weld a fyddwn yn parhau i gollu deintyddion o'r gyfundrefn iechyd cyhoeddus, yn ogystal â gofalu y bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol yn monitro hynny ar lefel leol.

Jonathan Morgan: Fe gefnogwn y rheoliadau deintyddol, ond yr wyf yn dal yn bryderus am y diffyg brwdfrydedd ymysg llawer o ddeintyddion yng Nghymru tuag at y contract newydd hwn, sydd yn hollol wahanol i sut yr ymdriniwyd â'r contractau proffesiynol eraill. Erys llawer o ddeintyddion yng Nghymru o'r farn nad ymdriniwyd â'r contract hwn yn y modd mwyaf addas. Derbyniais lythyr yn ddiweddar, a anfonwyd atoch chithau hefyd, fe gredaf, gan uwch ymarferydd deintyddol yng Nghaerdydd, sydd yn dweud y carai'r Llywodraeth greu'r argraff i'r cyhoedd drwy gyfrwng ei sbin fod hwn yn contract da, ond

large numbers of practices that will only be signing their contracts under duress and in dispute. That is a damning criticism of how this has been handled.

I know that many dentists in Wales support the contract, and it would be wrong of me to suggest that all dentists are annoyed at how the Government has handled this. However, there is still a significant amount of concern. I hope that you will recognise that it is your job as Minister to ensure, with the local health boards, that the implementation of this contract runs smoothly and that dentists feel the real benefit of enhancing the range of services that are available to the people of Wales.

On a separate issue, a large number of dental places are now provided by companies such as DentaCare. DentaCare is a large organisation: I understand that, this year, it is providing roughly 31,000 places, as a private sector company, in your local health board area. Therefore, I am sure that you would wish to thank DentaCare for the large number of places that it is providing because, if it was not doing so, you would have to find smaller practitioners to provide them. According to the figures, between 2002-03 and 2004-05, DentaCare provided about 10,500 places each year, compared with 39,670 during 2005-06.

I welcome the fact that the Government is willing to look at varied provision of dental services and NHS places, be that through relying on smaller practitioners, as has been the case in the past, or through expanding the number of places provided by larger private organisations. On this side of the Chamber, we do not have a problem with that and you will have my full support on that in future, should you need it. However, I think that you ought to recognise that such services need to be provided on a mixed basis. It will be difficult for you to achieve the large number of places required for people to access dental services purely through using the smaller practitioners, without engaging the larger providers in the private sector. In supporting these regulations, I would like to say that you need to recognise the involvement of others,

nad felly y mae mewn gwirionedd. Â yn ei flaen i ddweud, dan y GDC, y bydd nifer fawr o ddeintyddfeydd yn llofnodi eu contractau dan orfodaeth a than ddadlau. Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth ddeifiol o'r modd yr ymdriniwyd â hyn.

Gwn fod llawer o ddeintyddion yng Nghymru yn cefnogi'r contract, a byddai'n anghywir imi awgrymu bod pob deintydd yn flin gyda'r modd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymdrin â hyn. Fodd bynnag, erys cryn bryder. Gobeithio y byddwch yn cydnabod ei fod yn rhan o'ch gwaith fel Gweinidog sicrhau, gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol, y gweithredir y contract yn hwylus ac y bydd deintyddion yn gweld gwir werth gwella'r ystod o wasanaethau sydd ar gael i bobl Cymru.

Ar bwnc gwahanol, darperir nifer fawr o leoedd deintyddol erbyn hyn gan gwmnïau megis DentaCare. Mae DentaCare yn sefydliad mawr: deallaf ei fod, eleni, yn darparu tua 31,000 o leoedd, fel un o gwmnïau'r sector preifat, yn ardal eich bwrdd iechyd lleol. Felly yr wyf yn sicr y carech ddiolch i DentaCare am y nifer fawr o leoedd y mae'n eu darparu oherwydd pe na bai'n gwneud hynny, byddai'n rhaid i chi ddod o hyd i ymarferwyr llai i'w darparu. Yn ôl y ffigurau, rhwng 2002-03 a 2004-05, darparodd DentaCare ryw 10,500 o leoedd bob blwyddyn, o'i gymharu â 39,670 yn ystod 2005-06.

Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i edrych ar ddarpariaeth amrywiol o wasanaethau deintyddol a lleoedd GIG, boed hynny drwy ddibynnu ar yr ymarferwyr llai, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol, neu drwy ehangu nifer y lleoedd a ddarperir gan y sefydliadau preifat mwy. Nid yw hynny'n broblem i ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, a chewch fy nghefnogaeth lwyr ar hynny yn y dyfodol, petai arnoch ei angen. Fodd bynnag, tybiaf y dylech gydnabod bod angen darparu gwasanaethau o'r fath mewn modd cymysg. Bydd yn anodd ichi gyrraedd y nifer fawr o leoedd y bydd eu hangen i bobl allu cael gwasanaethau deintyddol drwy ddefnyddio'r ymarferwyr llai yn unig, heb ddwyn i mewn y darparwyr mwy yn y sector preifat. Wrth gefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, carwn ddweud y dylech gydnabod cyfraniad eraill, er

for example, those providing services through DentaCare, and assure dental practitioners that you will take personal responsibility for the smooth implementation of the contract.

Jenny Randerson: I will start by repeating my concern, which I have mentioned on every occasion that we have dealt with the dental regulations, about the lack of a bilingual approach to this important set of regulations. It is completely unacceptable that regulations as important as these are only available in English.

Moving on, I want to raise two issues. The first is the basis upon which dentists will be remunerated. The contract poses significant problems for the small numbers of dentists who were not working during the assessment period, which may well have been through no fault of their own, because of illness, or because they came into a practice later in the year. All sorts of reasons could have prevented dentists from working during the assessment period. It appears that those dentists will be prevented from increasing their NHS commitment, even though they may wish to do so in future. The assessment was done as a snapshot over a certain period, and therefore it has to be based on that. I am concerned, as are a number of dentists, that those who were not working at their planned capacity for next year last year will find it difficult to get the remuneration that they would hope to receive and to reach the levels of dental activity that they would hope to achieve.

I also want to refer to the nature of the PDS pilot schemes in Wales. My information is that, in England, PDS pilot schemes have been mainly undertaken with specialists, such as orthodontists, and the GDS pilots have been an alternative, whereas, in Wales, the PDS pilots, which are based on a number-of-patients approach as opposed to a level-of-dental-activity approach, have been applied to general dentists rather than specialists. However, they are being rolled forward into GDS contracts. That changes the nature of the contract considerably from the point of view of those who have been involved in the pilot schemes and are moving into the

enghraifft, y rhai sy'n darparu gwasanaethau drwy DentaCare, a rhoi sicrwydd i ddeintyddion y byddwch yn ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb personol am weithredu'r contract yn hwylus.

Jenny Randerson: Dechreuaf drwy ailadrodd fy mhryder, yr wyf wedi sôn amdano bob un tro y buom yn ymdrin â'r rheoliadau deintyddol, am ddiffyg darpariaeth ddwyieithog yn y gyfres bwysig hon o reoliadau. Mae'n hollol annerbyniol bod rheoliadau mor bwysig â'r rhain ar gael yn Saesneg yn unig.

A symud ymlaen, yr wyf am godi dau bwnc. Y cyntaf yw'r hyn y seilir tâl y deintyddion arno. Mae'r contract yn peri problemau sylweddol i'r nifer fach o ddeintyddion nad oeddent yn gweithio yn ystod y cyfnod asesu, a allai'n hawdd fod wedi digwydd heb ddim bai ar eu rhan hwy, oherwydd salwch neu am mai yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn y daethant i'r ddeintyddfa. Gallai pob math o resymau fod wedi rhwystro deintyddion rhag gweithio yn ystod y cyfnod asesu. Ymddengys na fydd modd i'r deintyddion hynny gynyddu eu hymrwymiad i'r GIG, er y gallant fod eisiau gwneud hynny yn y dyfodol. Gwnaethpwyd yr asesiad fel ciplun dros gyfnod penodol, a rhaid iddo felly fod yn seiliedig ar hynny. Yr wyf yn pryderu, fel y mae nifer o ddeintyddion, y bydd y rhai nad oeddent yn gweithio y llynedd yn unol â'r capasiti a gynlluniwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf yn ei chael yn anodd cael y tâl y byddent wedi gobeithio ei dderbyn a chyrraedd y lefelau o weithgarwch deintyddol y byddent yn gobeithio'u darparu.

Yr wyf hefyd am gyfeirio at natur y cynlluniau peilot GDP yng Nghymru. Y wybodaeth a gefais yw bod cynlluniau peilot GDP yn Lloegr wedi eu gwneud yn bennaf gydag arbenigwyr, megis orthodeintyddion, ac mai dewis arall fu'r cynlluniau peilot GDC; yng Nghymru, ar y llaw arall, gweithredwyd y cynlluniau peilot GDP, sy'n seiliedig ar nifer y cleifion yn hytrach na lefel gweithgaredd deintyddol, gyda deintyddion cyffredinol yn hytrach nag arbenigwyr. Fodd bynnag, maent yn cael eu cyflwyno i'r contractau GDC. Mae hynny'n newid cryn dipyn ar natur y contract o safbwynt y rhai a fu'n rhan o'r cynlluniau peilot ac sy'n symud

mainstream GDS contract.

i contract prif ffrwd y GDC.

5.00 p.m.

There is considerable concern among a large number of dentists that there is a failure to grasp the fact that the new contract is not based on a preventative approach, not on a number-of-patients approach, but on levels of dental activity. For many people, the only way for them to maintain their previous income could well be by attempting to work faster, and that is not in the interests of better patient care.

Brian Gibbons: When would dentists have known what their income was? They should have known before December. All dentists would have been told before Christmas what their income levels would be. Certainly, some dentists felt that the figures that they were given were inaccurate and, where that was the case, individual circumstances were looked at. For some individuals, there was some sort of systematic error in the calculations. By and large, however, the majority of dentists had their figure by December, and, for all those who did not, it is my understanding that they should certainly know by now.

I would not be able to give you an answer as to when everybody had his or her individual contract, because, even as we speak, we do not know whether every individual dentist in Wales will take up the contract. That question is, therefore, unanswerable, certainly now, and probably even for the first couple of weeks. It will be difficult logistically to expect local health boards to ascertain retrospectively, case by case, when contracts were negotiated and handed out.

Janet Ryder: I have looked at the contract that Wrexham Local Health Board is issuing, and in one statement, it says that everybody will be assured and given emergency treatment. However, in another, it states that acute toothache, no matter how bad, will not be classed as an emergency. How are people supposed to know whether their toothache is an emergency if it will not be treated as such?

Brian Gibbons: The answer to that is that

Mae cryn bryder ymysg nifer fawr o ddeintyddion nad ydys yn sylweddoli nad yw'r contract newydd wedi ei seilio ar weithredu ataliol, nac ar weithredu yn ôl nifer y cleifion, ond ar lefelau'r gweithgarwch deintyddol. I lawer o bobl, mae'n bosibl iawn mai'r unig ffordd iddynt gynnal eu hincwm blaenorol fyddai drwy geisio gweithio'n gyflymach, ac nid yw hynny er budd gwell gofal i gleifion.

Brian Gibbons: Pryd y byddai deintyddion yn gwybod beth oedd eu hincwm? Dylent fod yn gwybod cyn mis Rhagfyr. Byddai pob deintydd wedi cael gwybod cyn y Nadolig beth fyddai lefel ei incwm. Yn sicr, teimlai rhai deintyddion nad oedd y ffigurau a roddwyd iddynt yn gywir a, lle y digwyddodd hynny, edrychwyd ar amgylchiadau unigol. O ran rhai unigolion, bu rhyw fath o gamgymeriad systematig yn y cyfrifiadau. Ar y cyfan, fodd bynnag, yr oedd y mwyafrif o ddeintyddion wedi cael eu ffigur erbyn mis Rhagfyr, ac, i'r rhai nad oeddent wedi'i gael, deallaf y dylent yn sicr fod yn ei wybod erbyn hyn.

Ni allwn roi ateb ichi ynghylch pryd y cafodd pawb ei gontract unigol ef neu hi, oherwydd, hyd yn oed wrth inni siarad, ni wyddom a fydd pob deintydd unigol yng Nghymru yn ymgymryd â'r contract. Nid oes modd ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, felly, ar hyn o bryd yn sicr, a mwy na thebyg hyd yn oed yn yr wythnos neu ddwy gyntaf. Bydd yn anodd o safbwynt logistaidd disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol ganfod yn ôl-weithredol, fesul achos, pryd y cafodd y contractau eu negodi a'u cyflwyno.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y contract y mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Wrecsam yn ei roi, ac mewn un datganiad, dywed y bydd meddyliau pawb yn cael eu tawelu ac y rhoddir triniaeth frys iddynt. Fodd bynnag, mewn un arall, dywed na fydd danioedd aciwt, ni waeth pa mor ddrwg yw, yn cael ei hystyried yn achos brys. Sut y mae pobl i fod i wybod a fydd eu danioedd yn achos brys os na fydd yn cael ei thrin felly?

Brian Gibbons: Yr ateb i hynny yw y dylent

they should ring in and discuss it with the on-call service. One element of the new out-of-hours arrangements is that we provide extra resources to strengthen them. I understand your point, because it has always been the case that dental pain per se was not an emergency, even though it was under the old contract, and it was always a bone of contention with dentists. This particular argument is not new; it has been going ever since dentists have been providing emergency services. I understand why you raise this point, but that was the basis on which the emergency treatment element of the contract was eventually agreed. It is not new in the sense that this will suddenly crop up in this contract, but I do accept that there was some element of emergency treatment in the old one. However, dentists were never happy with that, so it is not something new in the sense in which you present it, although I understand why it is somewhat bemusing that that is the case. I have a certain amount of sympathy for the point of view that you express.

For a number of dentists, there will be a lot of uncertainty about the new contract, and that probably applies in Wales as elsewhere. Certainly, the feedback given to me—though it is only anecdotal—is that the relationship that the Welsh Assembly Government enjoys vis-à-vis dentists is better than was the situation across England and Wales. The dental profession is appreciative of the openness and willingness that we have shown in talking to the profession and in exploring members' issues. The variations that we have introduced in Wales compared with England were welcome, and dentists in Wales will be more than delighted to see that the spend that goes into dentistry will have increased by something like 90 per cent since the Assembly came into being. In line with our more flexible approach, the fact that the allocation for dentistry has gone up 90 per cent shows our clear commitment in the Assembly Government, and dentists across Wales will acknowledge that, hopefully.

There is no bias towards the corporate providers. We welcome the areas where the corporate providers are coming in. If you

ffonio i mewn a thrafod hynny gyda'r gwasanaeth aros galwad. Un elfen o'r trefniadau newydd y tu allan i oriau yw ein bod yn darparu adnoddau ychwanegol i'w cryfhau. Yr wyf yn deall eich pwynt, oherwydd dyna fu'r sefyllfa erioed, nad oedd poen dannedd fel y cyfryw yn achos brys, er ei fod o dan yr hen gontract, ac mae wedi bod yn asgwrn cynnen gyda deintyddion erioed. Nid yw'r ddadl neilltuol hon yn newydd; bu'n ddadl ers i ddeintyddion ddechrau darparu gwasanaethau brys. Yr wyf yn deall pam yr ydych yn codi'r pwynt hwn, ond dyna'r sail y cytunwyd ar elfen triniaeth frys y contract arni yn y diwedd. Nid yw'n newydd yn yr ystyr y bydd hyn yn dod i'r amlwg yn sydyn yn y contract hwn, ond yr wyf yn derbyn bod rhyw elfen o driniaeth frys yn yr hen un. Fodd bynnag, ni fu deintyddion erioed yn hapus â hynny, felly nid yw'n rhywbeth newydd yn yr ystyr yr ydych chi'n ei gyflwyno, er fy mod yn deall pam mae'n peri rhywfaint o ddryswch mai felly y mae. Mae gennyf rywfaint o gydymdeimlad â'r safbwynt yr ydych yn ei fynegi.

I nifer o ddeintyddion, bydd llawer o ansicrwydd ynghylch y contract newydd, ac mae'n debyg bod hynny yn wir yng Nghymru fel mewn mannau eraill. Yn sicr, yr adborth a roddwyd i mi—er nad yw ond anecdotaidd—yw bod y berthynas y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei mwynhau gyda deintyddion yn well nag a oedd y sefyllfa ar draws Cymru a Lloegr. Mae'r proffesiwn deintyddol yn gwerthfawrogi'r parodrwydd yr ydym wedi ei ddangos i siarad yn agored â'r proffesiwn ac edrych ar bryderon yr aelodau. Croesawyd yr amrywiadau a gyflwynwyd gennym yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â Lloegr, a bydd deintyddion yng Nghymru yn falch iawn o weld bod y gwariant ar ddeintyddiaeth wedi cynyddu tua 90 y cant ers i'r Cynulliad ddod i fodolaeth. Yn unol â'n dull gweithredu mwy hyblyg, mae'r ffaith bod y dyraniad ar gyfer deintyddiaeth wedi cynyddu 90 y cant yn dangos ein hymrwymiad clir yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a bydd deintyddion ar draws Cymru yn cydnabod hynny, gobeithio.

Nid oes dim gogwydd tuag at y darparwyr corfforaethol. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ardaloedd lle y mae'r darparwyr corfforaethol

look at the areas where corporate providers are most likely to set up in practice, you will see that they are in the areas that have been severely underprovided for in the past, such as north-east Wales and Neath Port Talbot, going down into south-west Wales. I gather that there is also some interest in north-west Wales. In fairness to the corporate players, they are not trying to go head to head with the traditional family dentists or dental practices.

Jonathan Morgan: I was not suggesting that the corporate organisations were going to go head to head or that there was a bias towards them; I was merely suggesting that, in light of your party's view on this issue in recent years, perhaps you should be slightly happier about the fact that you are now engaging in a positive way with these larger organisations.

Brian Gibbons: As an Assembly Government, we are fully committed to promoting good public services wherever possible within a public service ethos. We are not taking a dogmatic view; if there is a role for corporate organisations, which will make a real difference to patients, that must be our first priority. That is how we have acted. As well as that, within this public service ethos, we would also like to see the salaried NHS dentistry services improve equally, and we would not see any problem with the contracted dental services taking up some of the general dental service contracts, which is entirely consistent with promoting better public services.

Jenny has continued to express concern about the nature of the contract, but my understanding is that there were no pilot GDS schemes in England. All the pilot schemes were PDS schemes. There were no specific GDS schemes in England, anymore than there were in Wales. As I tried to explain previously, when the new contract comes into being, there are certain advantages, flexibilities and differences between a PDS contract and a GDS contract. For dentists who provide an unusual mix of services

yn dod i mewn. Os edrychwch ar yr ardaloedd lle y mae darparwyr corfforaethol yn fwyaf tebygol o sefydlu practisiau, fe welwch eu bod yn yr ardaloedd lle y bu diffyg darpariaeth difrifol yn y gorffennol, megis y gogledd-ddwyrain a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot, a hyd at y de-orllewin. Deallaf fod rhywfaint o ddi-ddordeb hefyd yn y gogledd-orllewin. A bod yn deg â'r darparwyr corfforaethol, nid ydynt yn ceisio cystadlu'n uniongyrchol yn erbyn deintyddion teuluol neu bractisiau deintyddol traddodiadol.

Jonathan Morgan: Nid oeddwn yn awgrymu bod y sefydliadau corfforaethol yn mynd i gystadlu'n uniongyrchol na bod gogwydd tuag atynt; dim ond awgrymu yr oeddwn, o ystyried barn eich plaid ar y mater hwn dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, y dylech efallai fod ychydig yn hapusach ynghylch y ffaith eich bod erbyn hyn yn ymwneud mewn ffordd bositif â'r sefydliadau mawr hyn.

Brian Gibbons: Fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i hyrwyddo gwasanaethau cyhoeddus da lle bynnag y mae hynny'n bosibl o fewn ethos o wasanaeth cyhoeddus. Nid ydym yn cymryd agwedd ddogmatig; os oes rôl i sefydliadau corfforaethol, a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i gleifion, hynny o reidrwydd yw ein blaenoriaeth gyntaf. Dyna sut yr ydym wedi gweithredu. Yn ogystal â hynny, o fewn yr ethos hwn o wasanaeth cyhoeddus, hoffem hefyd weld gwasanaethau deintyddiaeth cyflogedig y GIG yn gwella i'r un graddau, ac ni fyddem yn gweld dim problem pe bai'r gwasanaethau deintyddol o dan gontract yn ymgymryd â rhai'r o'r contractau gwasanaeth deintyddol cyffredinol, sy'n gwbl gyson â hyrwyddo gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Mae Jenny wedi parhau i fynegi pryder am natur y contract, ond yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, ni chafwyd dim cynlluniau peilot o ran gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol yn Lloegr. Yr oedd y cynlluniau peilot i gyd yn gynlluniau gwasanaethau deintyddol personol. Nid oedd cynlluniau gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol penodol yn Lloegr, mwy nag yng Nghymru. Fel y ceisiais esbonio o'r blaen, pan ddaw'r contract newydd i rym, mae rhai manteision, elfennau o hyblygrwydd a gwahaniaethau rhwng

outside general dental services, there may be advantages for them to explore the PDS contract as opposed to a GDS contract. They might not be able to take up a GDS contract, because they would not be providing essential services. It is not substantially different in Wales than in England, but there seems to be some confusion. If you want to write to me, you could spell it out in more detail, but I do not think that what are you saying is correct. There is some misunderstanding in how this is rolled out.

contract gwasanaethau deintyddol personol a chontract gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol. I ddeintyddion sy'n darparu cymysgedd anarferol o wasanaethau y tu allan i wasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol, gallai fod manteision iddynt ystyried y contract gwasanaethau deintyddol personol yn hytrach na chontract gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol. Efallai na fyddent yn gallu ymgymryd â chontract gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol, gan na fyddent yn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol. Nid yw'r sefyllfa'n wahanol i raddau sylweddol yng Nghymru i'r hyn sydd yn Lloegr, ond mae'n ymddangos bod peth dryswch. Os ydych am ysgrifennu ataf, gallech fanylu ymhellach, ond ni chredaf fod yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yn gywir. Mae rhyw gamddealltwriaeth o ran sut y mae hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno.

I understood that the benchmarking of activity was undertaken over nine to 12 months, which is a substantial time. Some dentists will not have worked for that full length of time, but some of those issues can be sorted out individually if they were off sick, or in circumstances of that kind. Equally, some people may not have been in place, and they would be in the same position as any other new provider coming into the market. They would have to agree a contract with the local health board, and decide on a reasonable quantum of work that they should be doing in return for a certain level of remuneration. That is one of the key innovations that will take place, because local health boards will be in a position to commission these services.

Yn ôl a ddeallwn, cafodd y gweithgarwch meincnodi ei wneud dros naw i 12 mis, sy'n amser sylweddol. Ni fydd rhai deintyddion wedi gweithio am y cyfnod hwnnw o amser yn llawn, ond gellir datrys rhai o'r problemau hynny yn unigol os oeddent yn absennol oherwydd salwch, neu o dan amgylchiadau felly. Yn yr un modd, efallai nad oedd rhai pobl wrth eu gwaith, a byddent yn yr un sefyllfa ag unrhyw ddarparwr newydd arall sy'n dod i mewn i'r farchnad. Byddai'n rhaid iddynt gytuno ar gontract gyda'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, a phenderfynu ar gwantwm rhesymol o waith y dylent fod yn ei wneud yn gyfnewid am lefel neilltuol o dâl. Dyna un o'r datblygiadau arloesol allweddol a fydd yn digwydd, oherwydd bydd byrddau iechyd lleol yn gallu comisiynu'r gwasanaethau hyn.

The disadvantage that those dentists might be under, compared with those who were subjected to the full 12-month benchmarking test period, is that a guaranteed income would not be available to them if the length of benchmarking was not sufficient to establish their time period. If a dentist was off sick for a month, that could be sorted out on an individual basis. It would be a different situation if someone started in August and the benchmarking period ended in September. That would have to be negotiated on a person-by-person basis.

Yr anfantais a allai fod i'r deintyddion hynny, o'u cymharu â'r rhai a fu'n cymryd rhan yn y cyfnod prawf meincnodi llawn o 12 mis, yw na fyddai incwm wedi ei warantu ar gael iddynt pa na bai hyd y cyfnod meincnodi yn ddigonol i sefydlu eu cyfnod o amser. Pe bai deintydd yn absennol yn sâl am fis, gellid datrys hynny ar sail unigol. Byddai'n sefyllfa wahanol pe bai rhywun yn dechrau ym mis Awst a bod y cyfnod meincnodi yn gorffen ym mis Medi. Byddai'n rhaid trafod hynny fesul unigolyn.

5.10 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2961): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2961): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2962): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2962): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2963): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2963): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2964): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2964): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2965): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2965): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2966): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2966): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 5.12 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.12 p.m.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: To allow enough time for the minority party debate, I invite the Business Minister to propose an extension of half an hour. I think that that will more than cover it.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: I ganiatáu digon o amser i drafod y ddatl plaid leiafrifol, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig estyn y Cyfarfod Llawn am hanner awr. Dylai hynny fod yn ddigon.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, resolves to extend Plenary until 6 p.m.

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn cytuno i ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn hyd 6 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: This is not

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Nid yw hyn yn

an abuse of Assembly procedures as far as I am concerned. Are there 10 Members in support? I see that there are. Therefore, I call for a vote.

gamddefnydd o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, hyd y gwelaf. A oes 10 Aelod o blaid y cynnig? Gwelaf fod, felly galwaf am bleidlais.

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.
Procedural motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Butler, Rosemary
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Lewis, Huw
Neagle, Lynne
Sinclair, Karen

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**GIG Cymru
NHS Wales**

<p>Motion (NDM2960): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales</i></p> <p><i>condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's handling of the finances of NHS Wales and its failure to reduce the debts of NHS bodies.</i></p> <p>Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: <i>regrets that the Assembly Government failed to properly take into account the full costs of 'Agenda for Change'.</i></p> <p>Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: <i>deeply regrets the rapid increase in the accumulated debt to a forecasted £71 million and the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to effectively invest the increases in NHS funding.</i></p> <p>Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: <i>calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to fully fund 'Agenda for Change', and to reimburse all health bodies that experienced any shortfall in funding during the 2005-06 financial year.</i></p> <p>The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis and amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.</p> <p>Jonathan Morgan: I propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales</i></p> <p><i>condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's handling of the finances of NHS Wales and its failure to reduce the debts of NHS bodies.</i> (NDM2960)</p>	<p>Cynnig (NDM2960): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru</i></p> <p><i>yn condemnio'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi trin cyllid GIG Cymru a'i methiant i ostwng dyledion cyrff y GIG.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ystyried yn briodol holl gostau 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn gresynu'n fawr at y cynnydd cyflym yn y ddyled sydd wedi cronni hyd at ragamcan o £71 miliwn ac at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fuddsoddi'r cynnydd yng nghyllid y GIG mewn ffordd effeithiol.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyllido 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn llawn, gan roi ad-daliad i'r holl gyrff iechyd a brofodd unrhyw ddiffyg yn eu cyllid yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06.</i></p> <p>Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis a gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.</p> <p>Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiaf fod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru</i></p> <p><i>yn condemnio'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi trin cyllid GIG Cymru a'i methiant i ostwng dyledion cyrff y GIG.</i> (NDM2960)</p>
---	---

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

deeply regrets the rapid increase in the accumulated debt to a forecasted £71 million and the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to effectively invest the increases in NHS funding.

We are today attempting to highlight the appalling state of financial mismanagement in NHS Wales. As the Government was so reluctant to bring a debate forwards in its own time, we felt that we had little option but to use opposition time to exploit and consider the state of the NHS's finances and how this Government is failing to sort out the spiralling debts.

I am not alone in the opinion that if the Assembly's health department were a private enterprise, its shareholders would have condemned it and liquidated it years ago. From the moment the Assembly Government took charge of NHS Wales in 1999, public money, in the view of the people of Wales, has been squandered with utter contempt by both health Ministers, who believe that spending more equals investment. It simply does not. To get investment out of expenditure, you need reform, and we have seen little of that in the past seven years.

Far from driving out a deficit culture, the Welsh Assembly Government is speeding head on into a looming financial chasm that will take years to correct. This disturbing trend has culminated in an unacceptable financial position for NHS Wales, with its accumulated debts now totalling some £71 million. This fact has been conceded by the chief executive of NHS Wales, the head of Brian Gibbons's department at Cathays Park, although, strangely enough, it has been questioned, and even denied, by members of the Assembly Government frontbench.

I must apologise at this stage; I was wrong about the £71 million, as was the chief executive of NHS Wales. It now looks as though the NHS's accumulated debt could

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu'n fawr at y cynnydd cyflym yn y ddyled sydd wedi cronni hyd at ragamcan o £71 miliwn ac at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fuddsoddi'r cynnydd yng nghyllid y GIG mewn ffordd effeithiol.

Yr ydym heddiw yn ceisio tynnu sylw at y camreoli ariannol arswydus yn GIG Cymru. Gan fod y Llywodraeth mor amharod i ddod â dadl gerbron yn ei hamser ei hun, teimlem nad oedd gennym fawr o ddewis ond defnyddio amser gwrthblaid i edrych ar gyflwr cyllid y GIG a'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn methu â chael trefn ar y dyledion sy'n prysur gynyddu ac i ystyried hynny.

Nid fi yw'r unig un sydd o'r farn, pe bai adran iechyd y Cynulliad yn fenter breifat, y byddai ei chyfranddalwyr wedi ei chondemnio a'i diddymu flynyddoedd yn ôl. O'r funud y daeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol am GIG Cymru yn 1999, mae arian cyhoeddus, ym marn pobl Cymru, wedi cael ei afradu gyda dirmyg llwyr gan y naill Weinidog iechyd a'r llall, sy'n credu bod gwario mwy yn gyfystyr â buddsoddi. Nid yw hynny'n wir. I gael buddsoddiad oddi wrth wariant, mae angen diwygio, ac ychydig o hynny a welsom yn y saith mlynedd diwethaf.

Yn hytrach na dileu arferion sydd yn arwain at ddiffyg, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n mynd ar ei phen i agendor ariannol sy'n dod i'r amlwg, y bydd yn cymryd blynyddoedd i ddod ohono. Pen draw'r duedd annymunol hon yw sefyllfa ariannol annerbyniol i GIG Cymru, sydd wedi cronni dyledion o ryw £71 miliwn bellach. Mae'r ffaith hon wedi ei derbyn gan brif weithredwr GIG Cymru, pennaeth adran Brian Gibbons ym Mharc Cathays, er ei bod wedi ei hamau, yn rhyfedd iawn, a'i gwadu hyd yn oed, gan aelodau o fainc flaen Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Rhaid imi ymddiheuro yn y fan hon; yr oeddwn wedi camgymryd ynghylch y £71 miliwn, fel yr oedd prif weithredwr GIG Cymru. Mae'n ymddangos bellach y gallai

reach at least £80 million. Therefore, I suppose that we were right to hold the debate, although when we tabled the motion and the amendments the figures were somewhat different to those that we have discovered during the past couple of days. All of this has happened despite a record increase in public spending on the health service.

The Labour Party and the Labour Assembly Government may bleat during this debate about the huge dips that we have seen in waiting lists. What they fail to understand is that in 1997, 167,000 people were waiting to see a consultant or for treatment, and that was too many. Today, over 280,000 people are waiting, and that is after the dip that occurred after the previous Minister for health vacated her post and was replaced by Dr Brian Gibbons. It was this Government that created the all-time high in terms of the waiting list position. Five or six years of devolution saw a rapid increase in the number of people waiting for treatment, despite the rapid increase in expenditure on the NHS. Only recently have we seen those waiting lists come down. When you consider the way in which the money has been spent by the Assembly Government, it is clear that Labour has demonstrated an Enron-esque regard for other people's money, by hoping that extra expenditure is somehow an excuse for poor performance. How can anyone move from spending £2.6 billion in 1999 to £5.1 billion in the coming financial year and still manage to run up crippling debts among hospital trusts and local health boards? It is utterly absurd.

Having viewed the past weekend's proceedings in Swansea, they are a real testimony to the aptitude and capability of Welsh Labour, which was told by its Secretary of State that it needed to buck up its ideas to avoid having a Conservative First Minister. Peter Hain hit the nail squarely on the head with that one. The NHS in Wales demands attention, and it is on the NHS that people will judge the Assembly Government next year.

Consider the following statements:

holl ddyledion y GIG fod yn £80 miliwn o leiaf. Felly, mae'n debyg ei bod yn briodol inni gynnal y ddadl hon, er bod y ffigurau braidd yn wahanol pan gyflwynasom y cynnig a'r gwelliannau i'r rhai a ddarganfuom yn y dyddiau diwethaf. Mae hyn oll wedi digwydd er gwaethaf y cynnydd mwyaf erioed yn y gwariant cyhoeddus ar y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Efallai y bydd y Blaid Lafur a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn hel esgusion yn ystod y ddadl hon drwy sôn am y gostyngiadau aruthrol a welsom mewn rhestrau aros. Yr hyn y maent yn methu â'i ddeall yw mai 167,000 o bobl a oedd yn aros yn 1997 i weld ymgynghorydd neu i gael triniaeth, ac yr oedd hynny'n ormod. Heddiw, mae mwy na 280,000 o bobl yn aros, ac mae hynny ar ôl y gostyngiad a gafwyd wedi i'r Gweinidog blaenorol dros iechyd adael ei swydd a chael ei disodli gan Dr Brian Gibbons. Y Llywodraeth hon a greodd y sefyllfa lle'r oedd y nifer fwyaf erioed ar y rhestrau aros. Yn ystod pump neu chwe blynedd o ddatganoli, gwelwyd cynnydd sydyn yn nifer y rhai a oedd yn aros am driniaeth, er gwaethaf y cynnydd sydyn yn y gwariant ar y GIG. Yn ddiweddar iawn y gwelsom y rhestrau aros hynny'n lleihau. O ystyried y modd y mae arian wedi ei wario gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae'n amlwg bod Llafur wedi bod yr un mor ystyriol o arian pobl eraill ag y bu cwmni Enron, drwy obeithio bod gwariant ychwanegol yn rhyw fath o esgus dros berfformiad gwael. Sut y gall neb newid o wario £2.6 biliwn yn 1999 i wario £5.1 biliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol sydd i ddod a chreu dyledion andwyol, er hynny, ymysg ymddiriedolaethau ysbytai a byrddau iechyd lleol? Mae'n gwbl hurt.

Wedi gweld y trafodion y penwythnos diwethaf yn Abertawe, maent yn dyst yn wir i fedr a gallu Llafur Cymru, a hysbyswyd gan ei Hysgrifennydd Gwladol fod angen iddi afael ynddi er mwyn gochel rhag cael Prif Weinidog Ceidwadol. Tarodd Peter Hain yr hoelen ar ei phen wrth ddweud hynny. Mae'r GIG yng Nghymru'n galw am sylw, ac ar fater y GIG y bydd pobl yn barnu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf.

Ystyriwch y datganiadau canlynol:

'The financial position of NHS Wales is unsustainable';

'Delays in SCEPT funding are not satisfactory and should not be repeated'; and,

'There is a risk that the large number of action plans announced by the Welsh Assembly Government have diverted resources away from front line services'.

Those are not my words but those of the Wales Audit Office and the Assembly's all-party Audit Committee. Incidentally, these are statements that Labour colleagues who sit with you, Minister, or do not sit with you as the case may be at the moment, have signed up to. You should accept the criticisms that your party has signed up to in the Audit Committee, namely that, for some reason, the way in which money is allocated within the NHS means that it has not gone through to front-line services in the way that we would have liked to have seen. At the current rate, deficits could reach around £100 million by April 2007. I think that is a legacy that you, as Minister, would wish to avoid. Having worked with you, and sometimes against you, since your appointment, I do not think that you would wish to see the deficits held by those trusts and LHBs being somewhere in the region of £100 million by the end of this Assembly. However, we are rapidly getting there, with no sign of the overall debt being reversed. Would the Minister for health describe this debt as manageable? I do not think that most people in Wales would describe it as such.

The British Medical Association, among others, has sought to provide reasons as to why our trusts and LHBs have faced these substantial debts. One of the reasons that it provided is the fact that the GP contract had been drastically underfunded, but that is something that the Assembly Government has refused to accept.

5.20 p.m.

Mae sefyllfa ariannol GIG Cymru yn anghynaliadwy;

Nid yw'r oedi wrth roi cyllid dan y rhaglen newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd yn foddhaol ac ni ddylai ddigwydd eto; ac

Mae perygl bod y nifer fawr o gynlluniau gweithredu a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi troi adnoddau oddi wrth wasanaethau'r rheng flaen.

Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain ond geiriau Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a Phwyllgor Archwilio trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad. Fel y mae'n digwydd, mae'r datganiadau hyn yn rhai y mae cyd-Aelodau Llafur sydd yn eistedd gyda chi, Weinidog, neu heb fod yn eistedd gyda chi fel y gallai fod ar hyn o bryd, wedi eu derbyn. Dylech dderbyn y beirniadaethau y mae eich plaid wedi eu derbyn yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio, sef, am ryw reswm, fod y dull o ddyrannu arian yn y GIG wedi peri nad yw wedi mynd drwodd at wasanaethau'r rheng flaen fel y carasem weld. Fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, gallai'r diffygion gyrraedd tua £100 miliwn erbyn Ebrill 2007. Yr wyf yn credu y byddech chi, fel Gweinidog, yn dymuno gochel rhag canlyniad o'r fath. A minnau wedi gweithio gyda chi, ac weithiau yn eich erbyn, ers eich penodi, nid wyf yn credu y dymunech weld y diffygion sydd gan yr ymddiriedolaethau a'r BILlau hynny'n cyrraedd tua £100 miliwn erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Er hynny, yr ydym yn prysur gyrraedd sefyllfa o'r fath, heb ddim golwg bod y ddyled gyffredinol yn gostwng. A fyddai'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn galw dyled o'r fath yn un y gellir ei rheoli? Nid wyf yn credu y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru'n ei disgrifio felly.

Mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, ymysg eraill, wedi ceisio cynnig rhesymau dros y ffaith bod ein hymddiriedolaethau a'n BILlau wedi wynebu'r dyledion sylweddol hyn. Un o'r rhesymau a roddodd oedd bod contract y meddygon teulu wedi ei danariannu'n ddybryd, ond mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwrthod derbyn hynny.

It told you, or rather it told your colleague, that elements of the contract had been underestimated, particularly with regard to the quality outcomes framework. Therefore, because of the underestimate regarding how successful GPs would be and what the financial constraints would be for LHBs, and because of your reluctance to listen to the professions, some LHBs in Wales are now facing significant financial pressures. Do you accept that? If so, how do you intend to resolve the pressure on our local health boards?

The Royal College of Nursing has said that not enough money has been devoted to 'Agenda for Change', and it believes that it is underfunded to the tune of £24 million. That is a significant amount of money and a significant amount of underfunding. The Royal College of Nursing is a significant professional body. It represents nurses who work at the coalface and is an organisation that you really ought to listen to. We heard earlier how the Labour Assembly Government is cosy with the unions and has a good working relationship with them. Perhaps you ought to listen to Unison, which warns of significant hospital closure programmes across Wales, with wards closing and services deeply affected. Despite these warnings from the people on the ground and those who work at the front line of service provision, you, as Minister for Health and Social Services, have blundered in a cavalier fashion with a Nelson's eye on the NHS's bank balance, and it is you, as Minister, who ought to accept responsibility for this.

The very real impact of this problem is not just a political one for the Labour Party—although I hope that it will be next May—but this problem affects people. It affects not only doctors, nurses and people trying to run the NHS on a day-to-day basis, but patients. Wards are being closed and operations are being delayed towards the end of the financial year because of a shortage of money. Doctors and nurses are prevented from fulfilling their roles because of the confetti of aims, targets and financial constraints. The bottom line, Minister, is that

Dyweddod wrthy ch, neu wrth eich cyd-Weinidog yn hytrach, fod amcangyfrif rhy fach wedi ei wneud o rai elfennau yn y contract, yn enwedig y rhai sydd yn ymwneud â'r fframwaith canlyniadau ansawdd. Felly, am fod amcangyfrif rhy fach wedi ei wneud o ran llwyddiant meddygon teulu a'r cyfyngiadau ariannol ar BILlau, ac am eich bod yn amharod i wrando ar y gweithwyr proffesiynol, mae rhai BILlau yng Nghymru'n wynebu pwysau ariannol sylweddol. A ydych yn derbyn hynny? Os ydych, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu datrys y sefyllfa o ran y pwysau sydd ar ein byrddau iechyd lleol?

Mae Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys wedi dweud nad oes digon o arian wedi ei neilltuo i'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', ac mae'n credu bod y cyllid ar gyfer hynny'n gymaint â £24 miliwn yn brin. Mae hynny'n swm sylweddol ac yn danariannu sylweddol. Mae Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn gorff proffesiynol o bwys. Mae'n cynrychioli nyrsys sydd yn gweithio yn y rheng flaen ac mae'n gorff y dylem wrando arno. Clywsom yn gynharach mor agos yw Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad at yr undebau a bod ganddi berthynas weithio dda â hwy. Efallai y dylech wrando ar Unison, sydd yn rhybuddio am raglenni mawr i gau ysbytai ledled Cymru, gyda wardiau'n cau ac effeithiau dybryd ar wasanaethau. Er gwaethaf y rhybuddion hynny gan rai sydd yn y fan a'r lle a'r rhai sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau yn y rheng flaen, yr ydych chi, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, wedi bwnghera'n ddi-hid gan gau llygad ar fantolen y GIG, a chi, fel Gweinidog, a ddylai dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb am hyn.

Nid problem wleidyddol yn unig yw hon o ran y Blaid Lafur—er fy mod yn gobeithio mai felly y bydd fis Mai nesaf—ond un sydd yn effeithio ar bobl. Mae'n effeithio ar feddygon, nyrsys a'r rhai sydd yn ceisio rhedeg y GIG o ddydd i ddydd, a hefyd ar gleifion. Mae wardiau'n cael eu cau a llawdriniaethau'n cael eu gohirio tua diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol oherwydd prinder arian. Mae meddygon a nyrsys yn cael eu rhwystro rhag cyflawni eu rolau oherwydd y nodau, y targedau a'r cyfyngiadau ariannol dirifedi. Diwedd y gân, Weinidog, yw bod cleifion yn

patients suffer. In November 2005, you said that you would be surprised if debts in Wales were as high as £40 million. I imagine that the news that NHS debt is somewhere in the region of £70 million to £80 million, and rising, almost puts you on the cardiac waiting list. I am sure that most people in this Chamber would not like to be sat where you are today, facing this enormous task, for which you are partly responsible.

I urge the Assembly Government, and particularly the Minister for Health and Social Services, to sit up and realise that this situation is not just of the making of the LHBs and NHS trusts. I fully accept that they have to do their bit to work within their budgets to ensure efficiency and to bring down administrative pressures. However, you, as a party, have to realise that you have been in Government in the Assembly for almost seven years. Yes, expenditure has gone up, but the debts have also gone up, and very little has been done to bring those debts down. This problem will not go away, Minister. If you do not resolve this issue and show some strength in bringing down the huge debts that the NHS is incurring and the large number of pressures facing the NHS, then I do not think that the service has much of a future. For the sake of patients across Wales and the future of the NHS in Wales, something needs to be done, and done rapidly.

Jenny Randerson: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the Assembly Government failed to properly take into account the full costs of 'Agenda for Change'.

I preface my comments by saying that we will not support Plaid Cymru's amendment 3. Although we are strongly in favour of an urgent review of the Townsend formula and the way in which it is applied, we do not believe that you can effectively write a blank cheque for NHS managers to spend in any way that they want. There has to be financial rigour in the NHS. There are relatively inefficient trusts and relatively efficient

dioddef. Yn Nhachwedd 2005, dywedasoeh y byddech yn synnu pe byddai dyledion yng Nghymru cyn uched â £40 miliwn. Gallwn dybio bod y newyddion bod dyled y GIG tua £70 miliwn neu £80 miliwn, a'i bod ar gynnydd, wedi peri braw o'r mwyaf i chi. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn y Siambr hon yn hoffi bod yn eich lle heddiw, yn wynebu'r dasg aruthrol hon, yr ydych yn rhannol gyfrifol amdani.

Yr wyf yn annog Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn enwedig, i ddefro a sylweddoli nad y BILlau a'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG sydd yn gyfrifol am y sefyllfa hon yn unig. Yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr fod rhaid iddynt wneud eu rhan i gadw o fewn terfynau eu cyllidebau i sicrhau effeithlonrwydd a lleihau pwysau gweinyddol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i chi sylweddoli, fel plaid, eich bod wedi bod mewn grym yn y Cynulliad ers bron saith mlynedd. Ydyw, mae'r gwariant wedi cynyddu, ond mae'r dyledion wedi cynyddu hefyd, ac ychydig iawn a wnaed i leihau'r dyledion hynny. Nid oes dianc rhag y broblem hon, Weinidog. Os na wnewch ddatrys y mater hwn a dangos rhywfaint o benderfyniad drwy ostwng y dyledion enfawr sydd gan y GIG a lleihau'r pwysau mawr sydd ar y GIG, yna nid wyf yn credu bod llawer o obaith i'r gwasanaeth. Er mwyn cleifion ledled Cymru a dyfodol y GIG yng Nghymru, rhaid gwneud rhywbeth, a hynny'n fuan.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ystyried yn briodol holl gostau 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'.

Dywedaf, cyn dechrau rhoi fy sylwadau, na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 o eiddo Plaid Cymru. Er ein bod yn bleidiol iawn i gynnal adolygiad brys o fformiwla Townsend a'r modd y caiff ei gweithredu, nid ydym yn credu y gellir rhoi'r hyn a fyddai, i bob pwrpas, yn sic eic wag i reolwyr y GIG i'w gwario fel y mynnent. Rhaid wrth fanylrydd ariannol yn y GIG. Ceir ymddiriedolaethau cymharol aneffeithlon a

trusts, and there are some very efficient trusts. I am sure that the efficient ones would greatly resent us simply writing off all the debts. However, it is time to review historic debts. If you look at the pattern of spend in some areas—and I will give you an example that is very close to home—the old South Glamorgan Health Authority ran up massive debts. It has been replaced by two local health boards—both with debts—and by Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, which serves those two health boards and which also has debts. All those organisations cannot be inefficient. They cannot all have been badly run. The people at the top have changed, so there must be something fundamentally wrong with the system.

We can only move towards the Townsend formula in good years and, because this year has not been a good financial year for the NHS, there has been no progress on getting on target those areas that are not yet within striking distance. It looks very much as though they will not get anywhere near that target next year. I, therefore, urge the Minister to do something about this issue.

Of the £71 million of debt, £20 million or more will be added this year. Yet, the February report of the Welsh Institute for Health and Social Care at the University of Glamorgan has forecasted that the combined NHS overspend will be nearer £50 million for this year—£47.3 million to be precise. That includes almost £20 million for Health Commission Wales. I would be interested to hear the Minister's comments on whether Health Commission Wales will be living within its means this year and whether that report bears any relation to the true financial situation of the NHS in Wales.

The problem, Minister, is that debt is piling up each year. Things are getting worse. The overspend in NHS was about £9 million last year and, even according to your estimate, it will be over £20 million this year, but it will probably be more than that when the final

rhai cymharol effeithlon, a cheir rhai tra effeithlon. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r rhai effeithlon yn ddig iawn pe baem yn dileu'r holl ddyledion, a'i gadael ar hynny. Er hynny, daeth yn bryd adolygu dyledion blaenorol. Os edrychwch ar batrwm y gwariant mewn rhai ardaloedd—a rhoddaf enghraifft sydd yn agos iawn atom—gwelwch fod hen Awdurdod Iechyd De Morgannwg wedi mynd i ddyled aruthrol. Daeth dau fwrdd iechyd lleol yn ei le—a dyledion ganddynt ill dau—ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, sydd yn gwasanaethau'r ddau fwrdd iechyd hynny ac sydd hefyd â dyledion. Nid yw'n bosibl bod yr holl gyrff hynny'n aneffeithlon. Ni all pob un ohonynt fod wedi ei redeg yn wael. Mae'r rhai yn y swyddi uchaf wedi newid, felly rhaid bod rhywbeth sylfaenol o'i le ar y system.

Dim ond mewn blynyddoedd da y gallwn symud tuag at fformiwla Townsend ac, am na fu eleni'n flwyddyn ariannol dda i'r GIG, ni chafwyd dim cynnydd wrth gyrraedd targedau yn y meysydd hynny nad ydynt eto o fewn cyrraedd. Mae'n ymddangos yn debygol iawn y byddant yn bell o gyrraedd y targed y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, yr wyf yn pwysu ar y Gweinidog i wneud rhywbeth ynghylch y mater hwn.

O'r £71 miliwn o ddyled, bydd £20 miliwn neu ragor yn cael ei ychwanegu eleni. Ac eto, mae'r adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Sefydliad Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Cymru ym Mhrifysgol Morgannwg ym mis Chwefror wedi proffwydo y bydd y GIG wedi gorwario cyfanswm sydd yn agosach at £50 miliwn ar gyfer eleni—£47.3 miliwn a bod yn fanwl. Mae hynny'n cynnwys bron £20 miliwn ar gyfer Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Byddai o ddiddordeb imi glywed barn y Gweinidog ynghylch a fydd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn torri'r siwt yn ôl y brethyn eleni ac a yw'r darlun yn yr adroddiad hwnnw'n debyg i wir sefyllfa ariannol y GIG yng Nghymru.

Weinidog, y broblem yw bod y dyledion yn cronni bob blwyddyn. Mae pethau'n mynd o ddrwg i waeth. Yr oedd y GIG wedi gorwario tua £9 miliwn y llynedd a, hyd yn oed yn ôl eich amcangyfrif chi, bydd yn fwy nag £20 miliwn eleni, ond mae'n debyg y bydd yn

tally comes in. The NHS is sinking ever deeper into debt. However, you say to these health trusts every year, with a very solemn look on your face, that they must live within their means and pay back their debts. However, things are getting worse, and that situation simply cannot continue. We need the reconfiguration that the Wanless review stated should take place. A great shame of the current situation is that it has taken the Labour Party so long to even get to first base. Clearly, reconfiguration will pose difficult issues and be hugely controversial in some areas, and clearly, for that reason, it cannot be done overnight. However, it is a great pity that we are only dealing with consultation possibilities at the moment.

The increasingly pressing issue of the growing cumulative debt of the NHS cannot be ignored, and it is snapping at the heels of the Labour Government in Wales. The causes of the problem are not just the extra expenditure on the GP contract or the extra expenditure on 'Agenda for Change', which Jonathan has already set out. The problems are also caused by the NHS's basic challenges of dealing with an older population, a massive number of new treatments and ever-expanding patient demand. However, the Minister must take control of the increasing costs of the GP contract and 'Agenda for Change' and set out how he will face those challenges.

Jonathan Morgan: For your information, we have just received an answer to a written question that was tabled to the Minister for Health and Social Services, which confirms that he forecasts the cumulative debt, as of 31 March this year, to be in excess of £76.4 million. We have to wait to see the figures, but that forecast is over £5.5 million higher than the figure given to us by officials in the Health and Social Services Committee.

Jenny Randerson: It seems to have gone up by £5.5 million in a fortnight, and I imagine that it will go up further. Everyone will be looking to see how that will be tackled.

fwy na hynny pan wneir y cyfrif terfynol. Mae'r GIG yn mynd fwyfwy i ddyled. Er hynny, byddwch yn dweud wrth yr ymddiriedolaethau iechyd hyn bob blwyddyn, a golwg ddifrif iawn ar eich wyneb, fod rhaid iddynt lunio'r gwadn fel y bo'r troed a thalu eu dyledion. Fodd bynnag, mae pethau'n mynd o ddrwg i waeth, ac ni all sefyllfa o'r fath barhau. Rhaid inni wrth yr ad-drefnu a argymhellwyd gan adolygiad Wanless. Un o'r agweddau tristaf ar y sefyllfa bresennol yw ei bod wedi cymryd cymaint o amser i'r Blaid Lafur ddechrau arni hyd yn oed. Wrth gwrs, bydd ad-drefnu'n codi anawsterau a bydd yn ddadleuol dros ben mewn rhai ardaloedd ac, wrth gwrs, oherwydd hynny, ni ellir ei gyflawni dros nos. Er hynny, mae'n drueni mawr nad ydym ond yn trafod y posibilrwydd o ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd.

Ni ellir anwybyddu mater y ddyled gronol gynyddol yn y GIG, sydd yn pwyso fwyfwy, ac yn ddraenen yn ystlys y Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghymru. Nid y gwariant ychwanegol ar gontract y meddygon teulu neu ar yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yw unig achosion y broblem, fel y mae Jonathan wedi dangos eisoes. Mae'r problemau wedi eu hachosi hefyd gan yr heriau sylfaenol a geir yn y GIG o ddelio â phoblogaeth hŷn, nifer enfawr o driniaethau newydd a galw cynyddol gan y cleifion. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r Gweinidog fynd i'r afael â chostau cynyddol contract y meddygon teulu a'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' ac egluro sut y bydd yn wynebu'r heriau hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Er gwybodaeth i chi, yr ydym newydd gael ateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig a gyflwynwyd i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, sydd yn cadarnhau ei fod yn rhagweld y bydd y ddyled gronol, ar 31 Mawrth eleni, yn fwy na £76.4 miliwn. Rhaid inni aros i gael gweld y ffigurau, ond mae'r rhagolwg hwnnw'n fwy na £5.5 miliwn yn uwch na'r ffigur a roddwyd i ni gan swyddogion yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n ymddangos ei fod wedi codi £5.5 miliwn mewn pythefnos, ac mae'n debyg gennyf y bydd yn codi'n uwch. Bydd pawb am weld sut yr eir i'r afael â hynny.

Finally, Minister, you are faced with a situation where NHS expenditure has increased. We all appreciate that fact, but, as has already been said, the debts and waiting times have also increased. The circle cannot be squared in this way. You must ensure that you bring NHS spending under control and that you meet the expectations of people throughout Wales that they will only have to wait a reasonable period for their operations, that they will get their ambulances on time, and that they will have the opportunity to visit an NHS dentist.

5.30 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to fully fund 'Agenda for Change', and to reimburse all health bodies that experienced any shortfall in funding during the 2005-06 financial year.

I am grateful to Jonathan Morgan and the Conservative group for placing this motion on the Assembly's agenda. I share his regret that it was necessary for a minority party to do so since this is a matter of such high public concern.

I will not repeat some of the figures that we have already heard but it is plain that we have seen a massive increase in spending and, yet, outcomes for so many patients are still poor; we then have deficits piling up, year on year, in the face of those poor outcomes.

There must be a question of management and leadership. While I would acknowledge the variable performance across the trusts, will the Minister tell us today how he accounts for that? However he accounts for that variable performance, he has to take national responsibility for it. After all, he appoints the trust boards who appoint the chief executives. I will have more to say later about the 'pig, pig, jump over the stile or we shall not get home tonight' style of managing the NHS in Wales where it is always, frankly, someone

Yn olaf, Weinidog, yr ydych yn wynebu sefyllfa lle y bu cynnydd yng ngwariant y GIG. Yr ydym oll yn deall hynny, ond, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae'r dyledion a'r amseroedd aros wedi cynyddu hefyd. Ni ellir datrys y sefyllfa fel hyn. Rhaid ichi sicrhau bod gwariant y GIG dan reolaeth a'ch bod yn bodloni'r disgwyliadau sydd gan bobl ledled Cymru na fyddant ond yn gorfod aros am gyfnod rhesymol ar gyfer eu llawdriniaethau, y bydd eu hambiwllans yn cyrraedd ar amser, ac y bydd cyfle iddynt ymweld â deintydd GIG.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyllido'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn llawn, gan roi ad-daliad i'r holl gyrff iechyd a brofodd unrhyw ddiffyg yn eu cyllid yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2005-06.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jonathan Morgan a grŵp y Ceidwadwyr am roi'r cynnig hwn ar agenda'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn rhannu ei dristwch bod rhaid i blaid leiafrifol wneud hynny gan fod hwn yn fater sydd o'r pwys mwyaf i'r cyhoedd.

Nid wyf am ailadrodd rhai o'r ffigurau yr ydym wedi eu clywed eisoes ond mae'n amlwg ein bod wedi gweld cynnydd enfawr mewn gwariant ac eto, mae'r canlyniadau i gynifer o gleifion yn parhau'n wael; yr ydym hefyd yn gweld y diffygion ariannol yn pentyrru, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, yn wyneb y canlyniadau gwael hynny.

Mae'n rhaid ei fod yn fater o reolaeth ac arweiniad. Er y byddwn yn cydnabod y perfformiad amrywiol ar draws yr ymddiriedolaethau, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym heddiw sut y mae'n esbonio hynny? Sut bynnag y mae'n esbonio'r perfformiad amrywiol hwnnw, rhaid iddo dderbyn cyfrifoldeb cenedlaethol amdano. Wedi'r cyfan, mae'n gyfrifol am benodi'r byrddau ymddiriedolwyr sy'n penodi'r prif weithredwyr. Bydd gennyf ragor i'w dweud eto am y dull 'fochyn, fochyn, neidia dros y

else's responsibility.

Turning to the amendment, I am somewhat surprised at what Jenny Randerson had to say. Perhaps we could have worded the amendment more carefully but our intention was to force the Assembly Government to fully reimburse health bodies that experience a shortfall of funding with regard to 'Agenda for Change'. Perhaps that is not entirely clear from the wording of our amendment but I would have expected the Liberal Democrats to support it, although they do have a record of letting the Labour Party off the hook when it suits them to do so; perhaps that is what we are seeing this afternoon.

The trusts have identified a huge challenge in meeting 'Agenda for Change'. Jonathan Morgan has already referred to the Royal College of Nursing's concerns. Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, for example, believes that it has a £4.3 million shortfall in meeting 'Agenda for Change' in the last year and Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust believes that it has a £2.5 million shortfall. Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust says that £1.6 million of its £2.2 million deficit is directly attributable to 'Agenda for Change'.

This Government is getting a reputation for making demands of local service deliverers, whether those be local authorities or NHS trusts, without fully funding those demands. This is something that the Government must address. If it will not fully fund the new demands that it makes, it has to acknowledge that, if those demands are to be met, there must be cuts elsewhere. The Minister needs to take responsibility for that. I stand firmly by amendment 3 and I would ask the Liberal Democrat group—in the light of what I have said—to consider changing its decision about how it will vote.

We have so many other pressures on funding in the NHS. Jonathan Morgan has mentioned

gamfa neu ni chyrhaeddwn adref heno' o reoli'r GIG yng Nghymru, lle y mae rhywun arall ar fai bob tro, a bod yn gwbl onest.

O droi at y gwelliant, yr wyf yn synnu braidd at yr hyn a oedd gan Jenny Randerson i'w ddweud. Efallai y gallem fod wedi geirio'r gwelliant yn fwy gofalus ond ein bwriad oedd gorfodi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adalu'n llawn i'r cyrff iechyd sy'n profi diffyg ariannol o ganlyniad i 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Efallai nad yw hynny'n gwbl eglur yn ôl geiriad ein gwelliant ond byddwn wedi disgwyl i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ei gefnogi, er bod ganddynt hanes o roi dihangfa gyfyng i'r Blaid Lafur pan fo hynny'n gyfleus iddynt; efallai mai dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ei weld y prynhawn yma.

Mae bodloni gofynion 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn her enfawr i'r ymddiriedolaethau. Mae Jonathan Morgan eisoes wedi cyfeirio at bryderon Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, er enghraifft, yn credu bod ganddi ddiffyg o £4.3 miliwn wrth geisio cyflawni 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ac mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent yn credu bod ganddi ddiffyg o £2.5 miliwn. Dywed Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Pontypridd a'r Rhondda bod modd priodoli £1.6 miliwn o'i diffyg o £2.2 miliwn yn uniongyrchol i 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn prysur ddod yn enwog am osod gofynion ar ysgwyddau darparwyr gwasanaethau lleol, boed y rheini'n awdurdodau lleol neu'n ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, heb ariannu'r gofynion hynny'n llawn. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd rhaid i'r Llywodraeth roi sylw iddo. Oni fydd yn ariannu'r gofynion newydd a wneir ganddi'n llawn, rhaid iddi gydnabod, er mwyn cyflawni'r gofynion hynny, y bydd rhaid wynebu toriadau mewn meysydd eraill. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am hynny. Yr wyf yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 yn llwyr a gofynnaf i grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—yng ngoleuni'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud—ystyried newid ei benderfyniad ynghylch sut y bydd yn pleidleisio.

Yr ydym yn gweld cymaint o bwysau eraill ar gyllid yn y GIG. Mae Jonathan Morgan wedi

some of them, and Jenny Randerson has mentioned others. I refer to the complicated and expensive decision-making processes within the NHS. For local health boards, the average increased cost of administration is 11.35 per cent across Wales, but it is as high as 23 per cent in Carmarthenshire. Every penny that is spent on administration is a penny that is not spent on healthcare. I will not be one of these people who say that the service should not be managed. I would argue that we have too much management and not sufficiently good management.

Jonathan Morgan: I have received some figures this week that demonstrate that, in a period of a year, from September 2003 to September 2004, there was a 26.5 per cent increase in the number of non-medical staff employed by local health boards. Do you share my concern that that is an unacceptable increase in what is essentially administrative staff?

Helen Mary Jones: I do share your concern. The service needs to be managed effectively but when the costs are rising at that kind of rate the Government must acknowledge that that is not sustainable in the long term.

I wonder why we have so many decision-makers in the NHS. I have been looking back at responses to questions that I have put to Ministers over recent months, and considering the number of times that I have been told something is the responsibility of the local health board or the local NHS trust, I am beginning to wonder whether the plethora of management is not so much about trying to bring decisions down to the local level, but about trying to get Ministers off the hook when unpopular or unpalatable decisions are made.

We will support this motion—because it is right—but I am not keen that the Assembly should get into the habit of taking lessons on NHS funding from the Conservative Party. I will give some specific reasons as to why.

The Conservative Party was responsible for introducing the expensive, unnecessary and

cribwyll rhai ohonynt, ac mae Jenny Randerson wedi crybwyll eraill. Cyfeiriaf at y prosesau penderfynu cymhleth a chostus o fewn y GIG. Yn achos byrddau iechyd lleol, mae'r cynnydd cyfartalog mewn costau gweinyddu yn 11.35 y cant ledled Cymru, ond mae'n gymaint â 23 y cant yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae pob ceiniog a werir ar weinyddu'n geiniog nas gwerir ar ofal iechyd. Nid wyf am fod yn un o'r bobl hynny sy'n mynnu na ddylai'r gwasanaeth gael ei reoli. Byddwn yn dadlau bod gennym ormod o reolaeth a dim digon o reolaeth dda.

Jonathan Morgan: Derbyniais rai ffigurau yr wythnos hon sy'n dangos, mewn cyfnod o flwyddyn, o Fedi 2003 hyd Fedi 2004, fod cynnydd o 26.6 y cant wedi bod yn nifer y staff nad ydynt yn staff meddygol sy'n cael eu cyflogi gan fyrddau iechyd lleol. A ydych chi'n rhannu fy mhryderon bod hynny'n gynydd annerbyniol yn yr hyn sydd i bob pwrpas yn staff gweinyddol?

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn rhannu eich pryderon. Rhaid i'r gwasanaeth gael ei reoli'n effeithiol, ond pan fo'r costau'n cynyddu i'r fath raddau rhaid i'r Llywodraeth dderbyn nad yw hynny'n gynaliadwy yn y tymor hir.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn meddwl pam mae gennym gynifer o benderfynwyr yn y GIG. Yr wyf wedi bod yn bwrw golwg dros ymatebion i gwestiynau yr wyf wedi eu gofyn i Weinidogion dros y misoedd diwethaf, ac o gofio'r nifer o weithiau y dywedwyd wrthyf mai'r bwrdd iechyd lleol neu'r ymddiriedolaeth GIG leol sy'n gyfrifol am rywbeth, yr wyf yn dechrau meddwl mai pwrpas yr holl reolwyr yw nid yn gymaint er mwyn dod â phenderfyniadau i lawr i lefel leol, ond yn hytrach bod yn fwch dihangol i Weinidogion pan wneir penderfyniadau amhoblogaidd neu annymunol.

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn—oherwydd ei fod yn un cywir—ond nid wyf yn credu y dylai'r Cynulliad fynd i'r arfer o ddysgu gwersi ar ariannu'r GIG gan y Blaid Geidwadol. Rhoddaf rai rhesymau penodol dros hynny.

Y Blaid Geidwadol oedd yn gyfrifol am gyflwyno marchnad fewnol gostus, ddiangen

pointless internal market in health. There has never been any demonstration that that has led to improved patient care. It introduced pointless and costly competition. Jonathan Morgan has just pointed out that we should not be spending a lot of money on administration and passing public money around from one public body to another—no, we should spend it on healthcare. The Conservatives set this up, but we must also bear in mind that the Labour Party has refused to undo this.

There is then the issue of capital charging. Trusts have to pay to use capital, which hardly encourages investment. That was a Conservative idea to restrict spending in the NHS, but it is being maintained by Gordon Brown—I wonder what his great fan, the First Minister, has said to him about this.

When Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales has asked the Government to identify what capital charges are costing trusts in Wales, we are told that we cannot have that information because it would cost too much to give it to us. It is much more likely that the Government is afraid to show how much money is going out of the NHS in Wales in these capital charges. While I appreciate the nods from the Conservatives, I remind them again that it was their party that introduced them, and I wonder whether they are able to—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up.

Helen Mary Jones: I will do so now; I have one more sentence. They are clearly not going to intervene to assure me that they will pressure the lovely Mr Cameron to remove the costs, if he ever comes to power, which we doubt very much.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. That is the sentence, is it not?

Helen Mary Jones: These deficits cannot be allowed to continue; they will, and do, affect patient care. I urge the Government to take urgent action to deal with this, but I am not sanguine that it will.

a dibwrpas mewn iechyd. Ni welwyd dim arwydd erioed fod hynny wedi arwain at wella'r gofal i gleifion. Cyflwynodd gystadleuaeth ddibwrpas a chostus. Dywedodd Jonathan Morgan ychydig yn ôl na ddylem fod yn gwario symiau mawr o arian ar weinyddu a symud arian cyhoeddus o un corff cyhoeddus i un arall—na, dylem fod yn ei wario ar ofal iechyd. Sefydlwyd hyn gan y Ceidwadwyr, ond rhaid inni gofio hefyd fod y Blaid Lafur wedi gwrthod ei ddad-wneud.

Yna mae mater y taliadau cyfalaf. Rhaid i ymddiriedolaethau dalu am ddefnyddio cyfalaf, ac nid yw hynny'n debygol o'u hannog i fuddsoddi. Syniad y Ceidwadwyr oedd hwn i gyfyngu ar wariant yn y GIG, ond mae Gordon Brown am ei gadw—tybed beth y mae ei edmygwr mawr, y Prif Weinidog, wedi ei ddweud wrtho am hyn.

Pan ofynnodd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales i'r Llywodraeth ddatgan faint y mae taliadau cyfalaf yn ei gostio i ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru, dywedwyd wrthym na allwn gael y wybodaeth honno gan y byddai'n costio gormod i'w rhoi inni. Mae'n llawer mwy tebygol bod ar y Llywodraeth ofn dangos faint o arian sy'n gadael y GIG yng Nghymru ar ffurf y taliadau cyfalaf hyn. Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi amneidio'r Ceidwadwyr, hoffwn eu hatgoffa unwaith eto mai eu plaid hwy a'u cyflwynodd, a thybed a ydynt yn gallu—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid i chi ddirwyn i ben.

Helen Mary Jones: Gwnaf hynny yn awr; mae gennyf un frawddeg arall. Mae'n amlwg nad ydynt am ymyrryd i'm sicrhau y byddant yn rhoi pwysau ar Mr Cameron annwyl i ddiddymu'r taliadau, os daw i rym rywdro, er ein bod yn amau'n fawr a welwn hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ai dyna oedd eich brawddeg?

Helen Mary Jones: Ni ellir caniatáu i'r diffygion hyn barhau; byddant, ac maent, yn effeithio ar ofal i gleifion. Pwysaf ar y Llywodraeth i weithredu ar unwaith i ddelio â hyn, ond nid wyf yn obeithiol y gwnaiff

hynny.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have three speakers before I call the Minister; I must call the Minister at 5.46 p.m., which is in about 10 minutes. Therefore, you have about three minutes each, if that is possible.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae gennyf dri siaradwr cyn y byddaf yn galw ar y Gweinidog; rhaid imi alw ar y Gweinidog am 5.46 p.m., sydd ymhen tua 10 munud. Felly, mae gennyf dair munud yr un, os yw hynny'n bosibl.

Mark Isherwood: When you combine dogma-driven Government with doubled NHS spending, you produce the paradox of deficits, cuts, and an NHS review driven by finance rather than efficiency.

Mark Isherwood: Pan fyddwch yn cyfuno Llywodraeth sy'n cael ei hysgogi gan ddogma a dyblu gwariant ar y GIG, cewch y paradox hwnnw o ddiffygion, toriadau, ac adolygiad o'r GIG sy'n cael ei ysgogi gan gyllid yn hytrach nag effeithlonrwydd.

In my north Wales region, Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust and North East Wales NHS Trust forecast combined deficits of almost £7 million. Although North West Wales NHS Trust is not forecasting a deficit, I received a letter only yesterday from newly qualified nurses there, expressing their concern that, after three years' hard work, there are no jobs for them in their local trust.

Yn fy rhanbarth yn y gogledd, mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Conwy a Sir Ddinbych ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru yn rhagweld diffyg rhyngddynt o bron £7 miliwn. Er nad yw Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru yn rhagweld diffyg, derbyniais lythyr ddoe ddiwethaf gan nyrsys newydd gymhwyso yno, yn mynegi eu pryder na fydd gwaith ar eu cyfer, wedi tair blynedd o waith caled, yn eu hymddiriedolaeth leol.

As NHS spending has almost doubled, Labour's initiatives, directives, performance targets and policies have multiplied. Government demands are not joined up, and the costs of implementation are not being met. As the British Medical Association Cymru states:

Wrth i wariant ar y GIG ddyblu, mae mentrau, cyfarwyddbau, targedau perfformiad a pholisïau Llafur wedi lluosu. Nid yw gofynion y Llywodraeth yn rhai cydgyssylltiedig, ac nid oes digon o arian i dalu am gostau eu gweithredu. Fel y dywed Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain Cymru:

'the NHS is there...to treat patients who are ill, not to come up with a bunch of statistics to show Government how good it is.'

mae'r GIG yn bodoli...i drin cleifion sy'n sâl, nid i gynhyrchu pentwr o ystadegau i ddangos pa mor dda y mae'r Llywodraeth yn perfformio.

Welsh NHS trusts have warned that services could be cut, wards closed, bed numbers reduced, and jobs lost, in order to reduce deficits. We are told that healthcare reviews being undertaken in each region are about concentrating acute services at main hospitals and providing care closer to home. Why, then, are we seeing a pattern of cuts, closures and centralisation? NHS trusts and local health boards are not elected by anyone. When the anger turns to the Government, however, it coolly holds up its hands and says, 'nothing to do with us'. This is unacceptable. It is Government policy that

Mae ymddiriedolaethau GIG Cymru wedi rhybuddio bod posibilrwydd y bydd rhaid cwtogi ar wasanaethau, cau wardiau, gostwng nifer y gwelyau, a diswyddo staff, er mwyn lleihau'r diffygion. Yr ydym yn clywed bod adolygiadau o ofal iechyd yn cael eu cynnal ym mhob rhanbarth yn canolbwyntio ar wasanaethau aciwt yn y prif ysbytai ac ar ddarparu gofal i gleifion yn nes at eu cartrefi. Pam, felly, yr ydym yn gweld patrwm o doriadau, cau a chanoli? Nid yw ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a byrddau iechyd lleol yn cael eu hethol gan neb. Pan fydd dicter yn cael ei anelu at y Llywodraeth, fodd

dictates how much money trusts and boards have to spend, and exactly how that money is spent; it must not be allowed to pass the buck any longer.

That is why I am launching CHANT Cymru—community hospitals acting nationally together—at the request of campaigners throughout Wales. It is fighting for local beds at local community hospitals. That is why Care Forum Wales states that NHS underfunding has contributed to the reduction of nursing-care capacity available to Welsh citizens.

That is why organisations providing quality nursing and residential services for people with complex mental health needs have contacted me to complain about a huge wastage of money going through the system, and the reluctance of local health boards to work with the private sector—even where they provide services that the public sector does not or cannot provide. That is why hospices in my region are stating that the Welsh Assembly Government's refusal to extend direct funding beyond this month will have a drastic impact on palliative care services. That letter was received only at the end of last week. This is despite hospices providing more cost-efficient care for palliative and respite care than the NHS, and despite ongoing funding in England.

We need a structural review of NHS funding in Wales for public, voluntary and private sector health service provision. Labour has squandered billions of pounds on unreformed public services, creating cost inflation and reduced cost efficiency, while relying on the goodwill of an increasingly pressurised workforce.

Labour always claims that the NHS is safe in its hands. However, the current state of NHS finance in England and in Wales confirms that this is plainly untrue.

bynag, mae'n codi ei dwylo'n ddiniwed a dweud, 'nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â ni'. Polisi'r Llywodraeth sy'n penderfynu faint o arian sydd gan ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau i'w wario, a sut yn union y mae'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario; ni ddylid caniatáu iddi barhau i wadu ei chyfrifoldebau.

Dyna pam yr wyf yn lansio CHANT Cymru—ysbytai cymuned yn gweithredu gyda'i gilydd yn genedlaethol—ar gais ymgyrchwyr ledled Cymru. Mae'n ymgychu dros welyau lleol mewn ysbytai cymuned lleol. Dyna pam mae Fforwm Gofal Cymru'n dweud bod tangyllido'r GIG wedi cyfrannu at leihau lefel y gwasanaethau gofal nyrsio sydd ar gael i ddinasyddion Cymru.

Dyna pam mae sefydliadau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau nyrsio a phreswyl o safon i bobl gydag anghenion iechyd meddwl cymhleth wedi cysylltu â mi i gwyno am y gwastraff arian enfawr yn y system, ac amharodrwydd byrddau iechyd lleol i weithio gyda'r sector preifat—hyd yn oed pan fydd yn darparu gwasanaethau nad yw'r sector cyhoeddus yn eu darparu neu na all eu darparu. Dyna pam mae hosbisau yn fy rhanbarth yn dweud y bydd penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wrthod ymestyn cyllido uniongyrchol ar ôl y mis hwn yn cael effaith ddifrifol ar wasanaethau gofal lliniarol. Derbyniais y llythyr hwnnw ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae hyn er gwaethaf y ffaith bod hosbisau'n darparu gofal lliniarol a seibiant mwy costeffeithiol na'r GIG, ac er bod y cyllid yn parhau yn Lloegr.

Mae angen adolygiad strwythurol o gyllid i'r GIG yng Nghymru ar gyfer darpariaeth iechyd y sectorau cyhoeddus, gwirfoddol a phreifat. Mae Llafur wedi gwastraffu biliynau o bunnoedd ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd heb eu diwygio, gan greu chwyddiant yn y costau a lleihau costeffeithiolrwydd, a chan ddibynnu ar ewyllys da gweithlu sy'n dod o dan fwy a mwy o bwysau.

Mae Llafur yn haeru bob amser fod y GIG yn ddiogel yn eu dwylo hwy. Fodd bynnag, mae cyflwr presennol cyllid y GIG yn Lloegr ac yng Nghymru'n cadarnhau bod hyn yn gwbl anghywir.

5.40 p.m.

Gwenda Thomas: I welcome the opportunity to respond to some of the references to local health boards. I start by offering my congratulations to Neath Port Talbot Local Health Board, which has been able to manage its funding without a deficit. I understand that Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board is also on a sound financial footing. This is despite the levels of illness and disability within my constituency being among the highest in Wales and the authority containing the highest percentage of ward areas in the most deprived 10 per cent in Wales, alongside Rhondda Cynon Taf and Cardiff. It should be recognised that the LHB has among the shortest waiting times in Wales. It is also able to offer a variety of new services for patients in my constituency, such as an early response service and a community reablement team, out of existing funding. It has been able to provide a large number of NHS dental places under the new personal dental services contract. Surely, opposition parties can welcome initiatives that are made available to improve the health of our nation, and recognise that the net deficit in funding, which is being addressed, represents 0.5 per cent of the overall health budget in Wales. We also heard this from the First Minister during his questions. I challenge you now to say whether you would expect an LHB like Neath Port Talbot, which is on a sound financial footing, to fund the deficits of other LHBs.

Nick Bourne: The state of NHS finances gives us cause for concern. It is perfectly true, as Gwenda Thomas said, that the position is patchy. Some LHBs are performing better than others—that is a perfectly fair point—but, overall, the NHS deficit, as we heard in the response that Jonathan Morgan has just received, stands at some £76 million. It has gone up about £5 million or £6 million since the figures that were given to the Health and Social Services Committee just over a week ago. Therefore, there is real concern that this cumulative debt is mounting. All the speakers in this debate have recognised that, although Helen Mary Jones's speech was good only in parts. However, she did seem to realise that the health service has to be run in a business-like

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i ymateb i rai o'r cyfeiriadau at fyrddau iechyd lleol. Dechreuaf drwy longyfarch Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Castell Nedd Port Talbot, sydd wedi llwyddo i reoli ei arian heb fynd i ddyled. Deallaf fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf hefyd ar sail ariannol gadarn. Mae hyn er gwaethaf y ffaith bod lefelau salwch ac anabledd yn fy etholaeth ymhlith yr uchaf yng Nghymru a bod yr awdurdod yn cynnwys y ganran uchaf o ardaloedd wardiau sydd yn y 10 y cant o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, ochr yn ochr â Rhondda Cynon Taf a Chaerdydd. Dylid cydnabod bod amseroedd aros y bwrdd iechyd lleol ymhlith y byrraf yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd yn gallu cynnig amrywiaeth o wasanaethau newydd i gleifion yn fy etholaeth, megis gwasanaeth ymateb cynnar a thîm ailalluogi, gyda'i arian presennol. Mae wedi llwyddo i ddarparu nifer fawr o leoedd deintyddol o fewn y GIG o dan y contract gwasanaethau deintyddol personol newydd. Mae'n siŵr y gall y gwrthbleidiau groesawu mentrau sydd ar gael i wella iechyd ein cenedl, a chydnabod mai 0.5 y cant o gyfanswm y gyllideb iechyd yng Nghymru yw'r diffyg net mewn cyllid, sy'n cael sylw. Clywsom hyn gan y Prif Weinidog yn ystod ei gwestiynau. Fe'ch heriaf yn awr i ddweud a fydddech yn disgwyl i fwrdd iechyd lleol fel Castell Nedd Port Talbot, sydd ar sail ariannol gadarn, dalu dyledion byrddau iechyd lleol eraill.

Nick Bourne: Mae cyflwr ariannol y GIG yn peri pryder inni. Mae'n ddigon gwir, fel y dywedodd Gwenda Thomas, fod y sefyllfa'n amrywiol. Mae rhai byrddau iechyd lleol yn perfformio'n well nag eraill—mae hynny'n bwynt digon teg—ond, at ei gilydd, mae diffyg y GIG, fel y clywsom yn yr ymateb y mae Jonathan Morgan newydd ei dderbyn, tua £76 miliwn. Mae wedi cynyddu tua £5 miliwn neu £6 miliwn ers y ffigurau a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ychydig dros wythnos yn ôl. Felly, mae'n achosi pryder gwirioneddol fod y ddyled gronnol hon yn cynyddu. Mae pob siaradwr yn y ddadl hon wedi cydnabod hynny, er mai rhai rhannau'n unig o araith Helen Mary Jones oedd yn dda. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys ei bod yn

way. We welcome the fact that she has come on in leaps and bounds on windfarms, but she still has some way to go on the health service; however, we are getting there.

To come back to this debate and the issue of debt and where the buck stops, I have heard Ministers and the Labour Party blaming mismanagement in the service. That will not do. The buck stops with the First Minister and with the two health Ministers that he has had during his two terms, both of whom are sitting here today. It is quite courageous of them to have sat here throughout the debate; the number of Labour Members here, at one stage, dropped to three—two of whom were the current and former health Ministers. That, on an issue of such importance, is pretty deplorable.

The level of waiting lists throughout the Assembly's lifetime has been higher than the position that was inherited, and it is not, to be fair, because of a lack of spending; it is because of a lack of effective management. It is not a lack of management in the sense that we need more of it; there has been micromanagement and far too much of it. There have been far too many initiatives, far too much interference in the system and far too much reform. That is why we are in this parlous position. Of course you need administration and management, but it must be done lightly, with a gentle touch and with the mass of resources going to the sharp end so that you are spending more on doctors, nurses, therapists, dentistry and so on. The waiting-list position and the debt are then taken care of, but we are in the unhappy position of having neither taken care of. It is not about a lack of money, but a lack of effective management. There has been far too much micromanagement of the system.

Nine years ago, it was Labour that cried out that it had 24 hours to save the NHS. In Wales, we have seen how misleading that has been. It is not the fault of the people working in the system. The blame game, of which the Labour Party has been too fond, is disreputable. It is not the fault of the excellent professionals; it is the fault of this

sylweddoli bod rhaid i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gael ei redeg fel busnes. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith ei bod wedi dod yn ei blaen yn dda o ran ffermydd gwynt, ond mae ganddi gryn dipyn o ffordd i fynd o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd o hyd; fodd bynnag, mae pethau'n gwella.

A dychwelyd at y ddadl hon a mater y ddyled a phwy'n union sy'n gyfrifol. Yr wyf wedi clywed Gweinidogion a'r Blaid Lafur yn rhoi'r bai ar gamreoli yn y gwasanaeth. Ni wnaiff hynny y tro. Y Prif Weinidog sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw ynghyd â'r ddau Weinidog iechyd a benodwyd ganddo yn ystod ei ddau dymor, ac mae'r ddau'n eistedd yma heddiw. Maent yn ddewr iawn yn aros yma drwy gydol y ddadl; yr oedd nifer yr Aelodau Llafur a oedd yma, ar un adeg, mor isel â thri—a dau o'r rheini oedd y Gweinidog iechyd presennol a'i ragflaenydd. Mae hynny, ar fater mor bwysig, yn warthus.

Mae lefel y rhestrau aros drwy gydol oes y Cynulliad wedi bod yn uwch na'r sefyllfa a etifeddwyd gennym, ac nid yw, a bod yn deg, yn deillio o ddiffyg gwariant; y rheswm yw diffyg rheoli effeithiol. Nid yw'n fater o ddiffyg rheoli yn yr ystyr bod angen rhagor ohono arnom; cafwyd microeolaeth a llawer gormod ohono. Cafwyd llawer gormod o fentrau, llawer gormod o ymyrraeth yn y system a llawer gormod o ddiwygio. Dyna pam yr ydym yn y sefyllfa argyfyngus hon. Wrth gwrs bod rhaid gweinyddu a rheoli'r gwasanaeth, ond rhaid ei wneud yn ysgafn, gyda chyffyrddiad tyner a chyda chrynswth yr adnoddau'n mynd i'r manau pwysig fel bod mwy'n cael ei wario ar feddygon, nyrsys, therapyddion, deintyddiaeth ac yn y blaen. Yna edrychir ar ôl y sefyllfa o ran rhestrau aros a'r ddyled, ond yr ydym yn y sefyllfa anffodus lle nad edrychir ar ôl yr un ohonynt. Nid diffyg arian sydd wrth wraidd y broblem, ond diffyg rheoli effeithiol. Cafwyd llawer gormod o ficoreoli ar y system.

Naw mlynedd yn ôl, Llafur oedd yn clochdar bod ganddynt 24 awr i achub y GIG. Yng Nghymru, gwelsom pa mor gamarweiniol fu hynny. Nid yw'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y system ar fai. Mae'r arfer o feio, rhywbeth y mae'r Blaid Lafur mor hoff o'i wneud, yn warthus. Nid y gweithwyr proffesiynol rhagorol sydd ar fai; y weinyddiaeth hon

administration that the NHS in this country has come under threat—more of a threat in Wales than in the rest of the United Kingdom.

The Minister for Social Services (Brian Gibbons): On the establishment of the Assembly we inherited services that were overwhelmed with demand and which needed fundamental change to meet the challenges of the twenty-first century. Indeed, those of us who were involved in the very first Health and Social Services Committee will remember that one of the first substantive documents that we received was what was called ‘the Alun Michael stocktake’, which was commissioned by Alun Michael when he was Secretary of State for Wales. The need for that stocktake arose from the dangerously bare health service cupboard that Labour took over from the Tories in 1997; it is amazing how short memories are about that. That is why we embarked on a major programme of reform and improvement in 2001, which was outlined in ‘Improving Health in Wales’. We established local health boards, and their administration cost us 1.5 per cent of their turnover. Local health boards, with the Business Services Centre, are still running cheaper than the envelope cost for the health authorities. It is simply untrue, therefore, to argue that local health boards are an extravagant waste of money. If they are extravagant, then, clearly, the preceding health authorities were even more so.

We also asked Derek Wanless to undertake a review of health and social care in Wales and to see how the record levels of investment that everyone has conceded that we are providing for the health service can be most efficiently used. I would be interested to know whether the various little Tory helpers on the opposition benches would be able to commit to supporting Labour’s record of public investment, in opposition to the policies of their proto-allies, led by the Tory Party, to promote tax cuts rather than public investment.

We are beginning to bring discipline to NHS organisations that were in deficit. Any NHS organisation unable to achieve break-even in any particular year must produce a strategic

sydd ar fai am fod y GIG yn y wlad hon mewn perygl—ac mae mewn mwy o berygl yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad, etifeddwyd gwasanaethau a oedd wedi’u gorlethu gan y galw ac a oedd angen newid sylfaenol i ateb her yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Yn wir, bydd y rhai ohonom a oedd ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol cyntaf un yn cofio mai un o’r dogfennau sylweddol cyntaf a gawsom oedd yr hyn a alwyd yn ‘gyfrif stoc Alun Michael’, a gomisiynwyd gan Alun Michael pan oedd hwnnw’n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Cododd yr angen am y cyfrif stoc hwnnw o gwprdd peryglus o wag y gwasanaeth iechyd a etifeddodd Llafur gan y Torïaid yn 1997; mae’n rhyfeddol mor fyr yw cof pobl am hynny. Dyna pam y bu inni fwrw ati â rhaglen fawr o ddiwygio a gwella yn 2001, a amlinellwyd yn ‘Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru’. Sefydlwyd byrddau iechyd lleol, ar gost weinyddol o 1.5 y cant o’u trosiant. Mae byrddau iechyd lleol, gyda’r Ganolfan Gwasanaethau Busnes, yn dal i redeg yn rhatach na chost amlen yr awdurdodau iechyd. Anwiredd, felly, yw’r ddadl bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn wastraff arian afradlon. Os ydynt yn afradlon, yna, yn amlwg, yr oedd yr awdurdodau iechyd a’u rhagflaenodd yn fwy afradlon fyth.

Hefyd gofynasom i Derek Wanless wneud adolygiad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a gweld sut y gellir gwneud y defnydd mwyaf effeithlon o’r lefelau uchaf erioed o fuddsoddi y mae pawb wedi cydnabod ein bod yn eu darparu i’r gwasanaeth iechyd. Byddai’n ddiddorol gwybod a fyddai amryfal gynorthwywyr bach y Torïaid ar feinciau’r gwrthbleidiau’n gallu ymrwymo i gefnogi record Llafur o fuddsoddi cyhoeddus, yn groes i bolisïau eu proto-gynghreiriaid, dan arweiniad y Blaid Dorïaidd, i hyrwyddo gostyngiadau treth yn hytrach na buddsoddiad cyhoeddus.

Yr ydym yn dechrau dod â disgyblaeth i sefydliadau’r GIG a oedd mewn diffyg. Rhaid i unrhyw sefydliad dan y GIG sydd yn methu adennill costau mewn unrhyw

change and efficiency plan designed to return that organisation to financial stability. One must wonder about the sincerity of this motion and whether it is motivated by pure naked opportunism, when you consider the run-up to the laying of the Assembly budget earlier this year. We did not hear a squeak of awareness about the sudden discovery of the underfunding that the Conservatives say that they have discovered. If they were genuinely concerned about this so-called underfunding that they are waxing about today, why did we not see spending on the health service included on their shopping list for changes to the budget? None of these proposals were included, because this is pure naked opportunism and running with the hares.

Jonathan Morgan: The fact is that the British Medical Association, when negotiating the GP contract, told you that you had completely underestimated part of the GP contract, which, if local health boards followed through, particularly with regard to the quality outcomes framework, would mean that GPs would be likely to reach more targets and therefore be more of a financial constraint on the local health boards, which would have therefore needed more money. You were told that this would happen, but you ignored it.

Brian Gibbons: Precisely, Jonathan, and if this information was available to you in December, which it was, why did you not put more resources for the health service on your shopping list? There was an opportunity for you to do that. You funked the issue, you failed to make that demand, and now you jump on the bandwagon. The inconsistency of your position is totally transparent to everyone.

The First Minister and I have made it clear on a number of occasions that we will not subsidise organisations that continue to run at a deficit. Many of these organisations that are in debt are well-funded by Townsend standards, and it is not acceptable, therefore, to expect the efficient to continue to bail out those who are not exercising proper financial control. Gwenda Thomas's contribution

flwyddyn benodol lunio cynllun newid ac effeithlonrwydd strategol gyda'r nod o ddod â'r sefydliad hwnnw'n ôl i sefydlogrwydd ariannol. Rhaid pendroni ynghylch didwylledd y cynnig hwn ac ai oportiwnistiaeth noeth yw'r symbyliad iddo, pan ystyrir y cyfnod yn arwain at bennu cyllideb y Cynulliad yn gynharach eleni. Ni chlywsom na siw na miw o ymwybyddiaeth am ddarganfod yn sydyn y tanariannu y mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn dweud iddynt ei ddarganfod. Os oeddent yn wirioneddol bryderus am y tanariannu honedig hwn y maent yn paldaruo amdano heddiw, pam na welsom gynnwys gwariant ar y gwasanaeth iechyd ar eu rhestr siopa am newidiadau i'r gyllideb? Ni chynhwyswyd yr un o'r cynigion hyn, am mai oportiwnistiaeth noeth yw hyn a chwarae'r ffon ddwybig.

Jonathan Morgan: Y ffaith yw bod Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, wrth negodi'r contract meddygon teulu, wedi dweud wrthy ch eich bod wedi tanamcangyfrif rhan o'r contract meddygon teulu'n llwyr, a fyddai'n golygu, ped âi byrddau iechyd lleol ati i ddilyn hyn, yn enwedig o ran y fframwaith canlyniadau ansawdd, y byddai meddygon teulu'n debygol o gyrraedd mwy o dargedau ac felly'n rhoi mwy o gyfyngiad ariannol ar y byrddau iechyd lleol, a fyddai o'r herwydd wedi bod angen cael mwy o arian. Dywedwyd wrthy ch y byddai hyn yn digwydd, ond ei anwybyddu a wnaethoch.

Brian Gibbons: Yn hollol, Jonathan, ac os oedd y wybodaeth hon ar gael i chi yn Rhagfyr, ac yr oedd, pam na roesoch ragor o adnoddau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ar eich rhestr siopa? Yr oedd cyfle ichi wneud hynny. Fe wnaethoch osgoi'r mater, ni wnaethoch yr alwad honno, ac yn awr yr ydych yn neidio ar y drol. Mae anghysondeb eich safiad yn gwbl amlwg i bawb.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog a mi wedi datgan yn glir ar sawl achlysur na wnawn noddi cyrff sy'n parhau i redeg ar ddiffyg. Mae llawer o'r cyrff hyn sydd mewn dyled yn derbyn arian da yn ôl safonau Townsend, ac felly nid yw'n dderbyniol disgwyl i'r rhai effeithlon ddal i dalu dyledion y rhai nad ydynt yn arfer rheolaeth ariannol briodol. Dangosodd cyfraniad Gwenda Thomas yn glir y gall rhai

clearly showed that some of the health communities with the biggest burden of ill health can work within their budget to deliver first-class quality services to their populations. That must be extended to the rest of Wales.

A year ago, the former Auditor General for Wales, in his report, said,

‘The health economy in Wales continues to face significant financial pressures’.

The NHS faces many challenges, however, we have seen improvements in financial management. There are organisations that are forecasting a break-even or a surplus in 2005-06. There are, no doubt, other organisations that will need to make further improvements in their financial management and they will be subject to scrutiny and independent review.

5.50 p.m.

The review of health and social care, carried out by Derek Wanless in 2003, recognised that health and social care is a multifaceted and complex issue. That report stated that the current configuration of health services placed an unsupportable burden on the acute sector. That is why we are under these current pressures. It is clear that action needed to be taken in line with the recommendations of the Wanless report. Consequently, one hopes, in the light of the Wanless report, ‘Designed for Life’ describes the services that we want to see in Wales in the future. This will only be achieved by reconfiguring acute services across Wales and releasing that investment to deliver front-line services.

As the various health communities unveil their options to deliver a fit-for-purpose NHS for the twenty-first century, I will be interested to see how the opposition parties respond, in view of their declared opinion that service reconfiguration is often needed. We have heard that again from many of the parties. We look forward to seeing what your responses are and if you do not think that our proposals are up to the challenge, we will be more than interested to hear what you have to

o’r cymunedau iechyd sydd â’r baich mwyaf o ran afiechyd weithio o fewn eu cyllideb i gyflwyno gwasanaethau o’r ansawdd gorau i’w poblogaethau. Rhaid ymestyn hynny i weddill Cymru.

Flwyddyn yn ôl, dywedodd cyn Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, yn ei adroddiad,

Mae economi iechyd yng Nghymru’n parhau i wynebu pwysau ariannol sylweddol.

Mae’r GIG yn wynebu sawl her, ond yr ydym wedi gweld gwelliannau mewn rheolaeth ariannol. Ceir sefydliadau sydd yn proffwydo adennill costau neu warged yn 2005-06. Diamau bod cyrff eraill y bydd angen iddynt wneud gwelliannau pellach yn eu rheolaeth ariannol a byddant hwy’n destun craffu ac adolygiad annibynnol.

Gwelodd yr adolygiad o iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a gyflawnwyd gan Derek Wanless yn 2003 fod iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn fater amlweddol a chymhleth. Datganodd yr adroddiad hwnnw fod cyfluniad presennol y gwasanaethau iechyd yn gosod baich anghynaliadwy ar y sector aciwt. Dyna pam yr ydym dan y pwysau cyfredol hyn. Yr oedd angen gweithredu’n unol ag argymhellion adroddiad Wanless, mae hynny’n glir. O ganlyniad, gobeithio, yng ngolau adroddiad Wanless, mae ‘Cynllun Oes’ yn disgrifio’r gwasanaethau y mae arnom eisiau eu gweld yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Dim ond drwy ailgyflunio gwasanaethau aciwt ledled Cymru a rhyddhau’r buddsoddiad hwnnw i ddarparu gwasanaethau rheng flaen y cyflawnir hynny.

Wrth i’r gwahanol gymunedau iechyd ddadlennu eu hopsiynau ar gyfer cyflwyno GIG addas i’r diben ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y bydd y gwrthbleidiau’n ymateb, yn wyneb y farn y maent wedi’i datgan bod angen ailgyflunio gwasanaethau’n aml. Yr ydym wedi clywed hynny eto gan lawer o’r pleidiau. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld beth yw eich ymatebion, ac os nad ydych yn meddwl y gall ein cynigion ni ateb yr her, bydd gennym

say as an alternative.

I urge the rejection of all the amendments, particularly amendment 3, tabled in the name of Jocelyn Davies. As has already been pointed out, this amendment would present a blank cheque to organisations before the 'Agenda for Change' process has been completed. Bearing in mind that £30 million was allocated in 2004-05, £58 million in 2005-06 and £60 million in 2006-07, we also need to ensure that assimilation is undertaken and only when that process is completed will we be in a position to look at the overall challenge. Furthermore—and Helen Mary agreed that it was a poorly written amendment—it is absurd to call for a reimbursement of all funding shortfalls that have occurred in all NHS bodies. That shows that Plaid Cymru has not gone far down the road of promoting a regime based on financial discipline in the NHS, if that is the approach that the party is going to take.

In conclusion, we waited in vain to hear what the Tories had to offer by way of an alternative. The last sentence of Jonathan Morgan's speech was 'something needs to be done'; I wonder what else Jonathan can add by way of constructive solutions to the problems of the NHS.

Jonathan Morgan: There is a simple change that I would like to see as of next year and that is an exchange of seats. We shall have to wait and see on that, Minister. I thank colleagues who have contributed to this debate, particularly Helen Mary Jones and Jenny Randerson. I am saddened, although not surprised, that no Labour member of the Health and Social Services Committee wished to participate in the debate. It is an important debate, regardless of the party-political knockabout and the political arguments about figures, about the direction and funding of the NHS and how the Government, with the opposition, will seek to reduce the debts that the NHS has incurred. It may be that Labour Party Members who sit on the Health and Social Services Committee will reserve their in-depth scrutiny for our next meeting. However, I would like to thank Gwenda Thomas; I know that she takes a keen interest in these matters. I know that

ddiddordeb mawr mewn clywed beth sydd gennych i'w gynnig yn eu lle.

Anogaf wrthod pob gwelliant, yn enwedig gwelliant 3, a gyflwynir yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Fel y nodwyd eisoes, byddai'r gwelliant hwn yn cyflwyno sicw wag i sefydliadau cyn cwblhau proses yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. O gofio bod £30 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu yn 2004-05, £58 miliwn yn 2005-06 a £60 miliwn yn 2006-07, mae angen inni sicrhau hefyd fod cymhathu'n digwydd a dim ond pan fydd y broses honno wedi'i chwblhau y byddwn yn gallu edrych ar yr her gyffredinol. Ar ben hynny—a chytunodd Helen Mary ei fod yn welliant a oedd wedi'i ysgrifennu'n wael—mae'n hurt galw am ad-dalu pob diffyg o ran ariannu sydd wedi digwydd ym mhob corff dan y GIG. Mae hynny'n dangos nad yw Plaid Cymru wedi mynd ymhell ar hyd llwybr hyrwyddo trefn sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblaeth ariannol yn y GIG, os mai dyna'r dull y mae'r blaid am ei weithredu.

I gloi, buom yn disgwyl yn ofer i glywed beth oedd gan y Torïaid i'w gynnig fel dewis arall. Brawddeg olaf araith Jonathan Morgan oedd 'mae angen gwneud rhywbeth'; tybed beth arall y gall Jonathan ei ychwanegu o ran atebion adeiladol i broblemau'r GIG?

Jonathan Morgan: Mae un newid syml yr hoffwn ei weld o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen, a chyfnwid seddi yw hwnnw. Bydd yn rhaid inni aros i weld ynglŷn â hynny, Weinidog. Diolchaf i gyd-Aelodau a gyfrannodd at y ddadl hon, yn enwedig Helen Mary Jones a Jenny Randerson. Mae'n fy nhristâu, er nad yw'n fy synnu, nad oedd yr un aelod Llafur o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dymuno cymryd rhan yn y ddadl. Mae'n ddadl bwysig, er gwaethaf y colbio pleidiol a'r dadleuon gwleidyddol ynghylch ffigurau, am gyfeiriad a chyllid y GIG a sut y bydd y Llywodraeth, gyda'r gwrthbleidiau, yn ceisio lleihau'r dyledion y mae'r GIG wedi'u casglu. Efallai y bydd Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur sydd yn eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cadw eu craffu manwl ar gyfer ein cyfarfod nesaf. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ddiolch i Gwenda Thomas; gwn ei bod yn cymryd diddordeb brwd yn y

there is a huge difference between local health boards and trusts in Wales in how they manage their budgets. Jenny Randerson hit the nail on the head when she said that some are more efficient than others, and some are not very good at the way that they plan their budgets, however, the one thing that they have in common is that they are all concerned about how the Government places responsibilities onto trusts and LHBs, but does not recognise that those responsibilities should carry Assembly Government funding. It is not good enough for the Assembly Government merely to rely on efficiency changes in LHBs and trusts, and on them getting their houses in order to ensure that they run their administration better, run the hospitals better and commission services more effectively. They must do that, and no-one in the Chamber doubts that they have a responsibility to do so, but the LHBs and trusts believe that you also have a responsibility to ensure that the programmes and initiatives that you started as a Government, and which have received all-party support, are funded.

Brian Gibbons asked why we have not raised these matters about the contractual arrangements before. The British Medical Association told the Assembly Government, when the contract was being negotiated, that LHBs would find it difficult to fund an element of the contract: the quality outcomes framework. As the Minister for Health and Social Services, you accepted that the financial constraint has been quite considerable because doctors have met more of the targets and, as a result, deserve a higher level of funding from the local health boards. We support that, because reaching those targets means that doctors are not just doing an average job, but an above-average job. However, the British Medical Association told the Assembly Government and your department that it was likely that the doctors would not just meet those targets, but exceed them by far and that, as a result, there would be financial pressure on local health boards. Local health boards throughout Wales have told us that they are finding it difficult to meet their legal

materion hyn. Gwn fod gwahaniaeth enfawr rhwng byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau yng Nghymru o ran y modd y rheolant eu cyllidebau. Trawodd Jenny Randerson yr hoelen ar ei phen pan ddywedodd fod rhai'n fwy effeithlon na'i gilydd, ac nid yw rhai'n dda iawn am reoli eu cyllidebau, ond yr un peth sydd ganddynt yn gyffredin yw eu bod i gyd yn bryderus ynghylch y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gosod cyfrifoldebau ar ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol, ond heb gydnabod y dylai'r cyfrifoldebau hynny ddod â chyllid yn eu sgîl gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nid yw'n ddigon da i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddibynnu ar newidiadau effeithlonrwydd mewn byrddau ac ymddiriedolaethau yn unig, a dibynnu arnynt i roi eu tai mewn trefn i sicrhau eu bod yn rhedeg eu gweinyddiaeth yn well, yn rhedeg ysbytai'n well ac yn comisiynu gwasanaethau yn fwy effeithlon. Rhaid iddynt wneud hynny, ac nid oes neb yn y Siambr yn amau nad oes ganddynt gyfrifoldeb i wneud hynny, ond cred y byrddau iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau fod gennych chithau gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau yr ariennir y rhaglenni a'r mentrau a ddechreuwyd gennych fel Llywodraeth, ac a gefnogwyd gan bob plaid.

Gofynnodd Brian Gibbons pam nad ydym wedi codi'r materion hyn am y trefniadau o ran y contract o'r blaen. Dywedodd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, pan oedd y contract yn cael ei negodi, y byddai byrddau iechyd lleol yn ei chael yn anodd ariannu un elfen o'r contract: y fframwaith canlyniadau ansawdd. Fel Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, derbyniasoch fod cryn gyfyngiad ariannol wedi bod oherwydd bod meddygon wedi cyrraedd mwy o'r targedau a'u bod, o ganlyniad, yn haeddu lefel uwch o gyllid gan y byrddau iechyd lleol. Cefnogwn hynny, oherwydd mae cyrraedd y targedau hynny'n golygu bod meddygon nid yn unig yn gwneud gwaith eithaf da, ond gwaith gwell na'r cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'ch adran chi ei bod yn debygol y byddai meddygon nid yn unig yn cyrraedd y targedau hynny, ond yn gwneud yn well o lawer na hynny, ac y ceid pwysau ariannol ar fyrdau iechyd lleol o ganlyniad. Mae

obligations, because the Assembly Government has not put all of the resources in place to help meet those obligations. You should accept responsibility for that.

Sadly, we hear the usual excuse, which is, 'It's not my fault, gov'. However, it is your fault if you are told something by the professional bodies, which have experience of how these contracts work, and are unwilling to accept their advice. Similarly, the Royal College of Nursing told you and us that 'Agenda for Change' is underfunded to the tune of £24 million. That is a lot of money for an NHS trust to find. Where do you think the trusts can find that money to spend on meeting 'Agenda for Change'? We all believe in 'Agenda for Change', because it is beneficial to the nursing profession, which does an excellent job. I do not think that you do it any justice as a Labour Government in showing such a lack of support for this programme by not funding it to the full extent. I know that £24 million is a lot of money, and so do the NHS trusts, but it is your responsibility. I accept that those bodies have a duty to manage their budgets, but how can they manage budgets when they are being told to follow initiatives and programmes that you as a Government are refusing to fund?

That is the thesis that we wanted to put to you this afternoon, because that is what you are refusing to accept as a Labour Welsh Assembly Government. I leave you with this particular point that, during this afternoon's proceedings—including questions to the First Minister—the First Minister and others have referred to the proportion of the budget that is a deficit as 0.5 per cent, and have said that you have been able to bring that down. However, it is not just a matter of percentages; it is the actual figures that count. Debt in the NHS has more than doubled, and that is what you have to deal with. You must find a way of reducing what will shortly be a £100 million deficit, regardless of its size as a percentage of the overall budget. That is

byrddau iechyd lleol ledled Cymru wedi dweud wrthym eu bod yn ei chael yn anodd cyflawni eu dyletswyddau cyfreithiol, am nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi'r holl adnoddau iddynt i helpu i gyflawni'r dyletswyddau hynny. Dylech dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am hynny.

Ysywaeth, clywn yr esgus arferol, sef, 'Nid fi sydd ar fai, bôs'. Fodd bynnag, chi sydd ar fai os dywedir rhywbeth wrthyhych gan y cyrff proffesiynol, sydd â phrofiad o'r ffordd y mae'r contractau hyn yn gweithio, a'ch bod yn anfodlon derbyn eu cyngor. Yn yr un modd, dywedodd Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys wrthyhych chi a ni bod yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' £24 miliwn yn brin o arian. Mae hynny'n arian mawr i ymddiriedolaeth GIG ddod o hyd iddo. Ble'r ydych yn meddwl y gall yr ymddiriedolaethau ddod o hyd i'r arian hwnnw i'w wario ar wireddu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'? Yr ydym i gyd yn credu yn yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', oherwydd y mae o fudd i'r proffesiwn nyrsio, sydd yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol. Nid wyf yn meddwl eich bod yn gwneud cyfiawnder â hi fel Llywodraeth Lafur wrth ddangos cymaint o ddiffyg cefnogaeth i'r rhaglen hon drwy beidio â'i hariannu'n llawn. Gwn fod £24 miliwn yn arian mawr, a gŵyr yr ymddiriedolaethau GIG hynny hefyd, ond eich cyfrifoldeb chi ydyw. Derbyniaf fod gan y cyrff hynny ddyletswydd i reoli eu cyllidebau, ond sut y gallant reoli cyllidebau pan ddywedir wrthynt am ddilyn mentrau a rhaglenni yr ydych chi fel Llywodraeth yn gwrthod eu hariannu?

Hynny yw'r thesis yr oeddem am ei gyflwyno ichi y prynhawn yma, oherwydd dyna'r hyn yr ydych yn gwrthod ei dderbyn fel Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fe'ch gadawaf gyda'r pwynt arbennig hwn, sef, yn ystod trafodaethau y prynhawn yma—gan gynnwys cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog—fod y Prif Weinidog ac eraill wedi cyfeirio at y gyfran o'r gyllideb sydd yn ddiffyg fel 0.5 y cant, ac wedi dweud eich bod wedi llwyddo i'w gostwng. Fodd bynnag, nid mater o ganrannau'n unig ydyw; y ffigurau eu hunain sydd yn bwysig. Mae dyled yn y GIG wedi mwy na dyblu, a dyna'r hyn y mae'n rhaid i chi fynd i'r afael ag ef. Rhaid ichi ddod o hyd i ffordd o leihau diffyg a fydd cyn hir yn £100 miliwn, ni waeth beth

money that could be spent on recruiting doctors and nurses, on modernising the NHS, or on new waiting list initiatives. It is not about percentages; it is about hard cash, and the bottom line is that, by the end of this Assembly, we will face—certainly by the end of the next financial year, unless it happens this year—a cumulative deficit of some £100 million. I cannot accept that that is a manageable deficit, and I doubt that you could accept it as such either. You need to resolve this, and I am more than happy for my party to engage in conversations to reduce this debt. However, ultimately, as the people who run the NHS in Wales, it is your responsibility to get on with the job—that is what you are paid to do.

fo'i faint fel canran o'r gyllideb yn ei chyfanrwydd. Mae hynny'n arian a allai gael ei wario ar recriwtio meddygon a nyrsys, ar foderneiddio'r GIG, neu ar fentrau newydd i ddelio â rhestrau aros. Nid mater o ganrannau ydyw, ond mater o arian caled, a diwedd y gân yw y byddwn, erbyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn, yn wynebu—yn sicr erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, os nad eleni—diffyg cronol o ryw £100 miliwn. Ni allaf dderbyn bod hynny'n ddiffyg y mae modd ei reoli, ac yr wyf yn amheus a allech chi ei dderbyn felly ychwaith. Mae angen ichi ddatrys hyn, ac yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon i'm plaid gyfrannu mewn sgysiau i leihau'r ddyled hon. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, fel y bobl sydd yn rhedeg y GIG yng Nghymru, eich cyfrifoldeb chi yw bwrw ati gyda'r gwaith—am wneud hynny yr ydych yn cael eich talu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

6.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 19, Ymatal 3, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 3: For 19, Abstain 3, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2960): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's handling of the finances of NHS Wales and its failure to reduce the debts of NHS bodies.

Cynnig (NDM2960): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn condemnio'r ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi trin cyllid GIG Cymru a'i methiant i ostwng dyledion cyrff y GIG.

Cynnig (NDM2960): O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Motion (NDM2960): For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion defeated.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd y
completes business for this afternoon. busnes y prynhawn yma.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.01 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6.01 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)

Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)