



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Iau 25 Hydref 2001

Thursday 25 October 2001

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Ddatblygu Economaidd i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Questions on Economic Development to the First Minister
- 13 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau
Questions on Finance to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities
- 24 Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru Dros Dro a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg
Questions to the Acting Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language
- 35 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig
Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs
- 45 Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd
Questions to the Minister for Assembly Business
- 55 Datganiad gan Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Trefnydd ar y Cynllun Strategol
Statement by the First Minister and Minister for Assembly Business on the Strategic Plan
- 73 Pwyntiau o Drefn
Points of Order
- 76 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 77 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth (Swyddogaethau sy'n Weddill) (Diwygio) 2001
Approval of the Milk Marketing Board (Residuary Functions) (Amendment) Regulations 2001
- 79 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Etholiadau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001
Approval of the Local Government Elections (Wales) Order 2001
- 98 Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol ar Addysg i Geiswyr Lloches
Approval of the Local Government Finance Report on the Education of Asylum Seekers
- 105 Dadl Fer: Hosbisau yng Nghymru
Short Debate: Hospices in Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Ddatblygu Economaidd i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions on Economic Development to the First Minister

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): As the First Minister is not here at the moment, may I answer my questions first?

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Gan nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru yma ar hyn o bryd, a gaf i ateb fy nghwestiynau gyntaf?

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Point of order. The questions on economic development to the First Minister are the first item on the agenda.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Pwynt o drefn. Y cwestiynau ar ddatblygu economaidd i Brif Weinidog Cymru yw'r eitem gyntaf ar yr agenda.

The Presiding Officer: I am aware of that. As the First Minister is now here, we will proceed with questions on economic development.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny. Gan fod Prif Weinidog Cymru yma bellach, bwriwn ymlaen â chwestiynau ar ddatblygu economaidd.

Cymorth Ariannol ar gyfer Ardal Gorllewin De Cymru Financial Assistance for the South Wales West Region

Q1 Peter Black: What requests has the First Minister, or the Assembly sponsored public bodies for which he is responsible, had for financial assistance for economic projects in the South Wales West region? (OAQ13073)

C1 Peter Black: Pa geisiadau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru neu'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad y mae'n gyfrifol amdanynt wedi'u cael am gymorth ariannol ar gyfer prosiectau economaidd yn ardal Gorllewin De Cymru? (OAQ13073)

The First Minister: The National Assembly, Education and Learning Wales, the Welsh European Funding Office, Wales Tourist Board and the Welsh Development Agency have received 95 requests for assistance. Most notably, I should mention the successful conclusion of the WDA's negotiations to invest up to £13 million in the mark two Castle Quay retail development on the east side of Swansea city centre.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ELWa, Swyddfa Gyllido Ewropeaidd Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi derbyn 95 o geisiadau am gymorth. Yn fwyaf arbennig, dylwn nodi pa mor llwyddiannus fu negodiadau'r WDA i fuddsoddi hyd at £13 miliwn yn natblygiad manwerthu Ceir Castell cam dau ar ochr ddwyreiniol canol dinas Abertawe.

Peter Black: Will you consider the joint venture agreement between the WDA and Bridgend County Borough Council in Porthcawl? The council's withdrawal from that agreement and its decision to effectively abandon Porthcawl has left the whole scheme in disarray. Porthcawl is left with little prospect of getting a proper regeneration scheme in the near future.

Peter Black: A ystyriwch y cytundeb menter ar y cyd rhwng y WDA a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ym Mhorthcawl? Mae'r ffaith bod y cyngor wedi tynnu'n ôl o'r cytundeb hwnnw a'i benderfyniad i droi ei gefn ar Borthcawl wedi gadael y cynllun mewn anhrefn. Nid oes llawer o obaith y caiff Porthcawl gynllun adfywio priodol yn y dyfodol agos.

The First Minister: I understand that there has been a fundamental disagreement

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Deallaf fod anghytundeb sylfaenol wedi bod rhwng

between Bridgend council and the WDA over the nature of the urban regeneration in Porthcawl. It may be possible to do what happened in Swansea: start with a mark one scheme, which engenders strong and well-argued opposition, and return with a mark two scheme a year or two later when most of that opposition will have been removed. The problem with Porthcawl may be more fundamental, so I do not want to raise hopes unduly. However, I will be grateful to hear from Peter if he wants to suggest a solution to the Porthcawl problem. I will then raise it with the chair of the WDA and with the appropriate members and officials of Bridgend County Borough Council.

Janet Davies: What action do you intend to take to instruct the Assembly sponsored public bodies responsible for economic regeneration to target their activities to ensure the prosperity of areas such as the south west valleys, instead of concentrating their efforts on the M4 and the A55 corridors?

The First Minister: Our general sentiment would be to encourage as many developments as possible to be generated or drawn into the south west valleys. However, you cannot locate a major retail centre such as the Castle Quay development anywhere but in the centre of Swansea. However, it is our policy, where possible, to persuade individual developments from other sectors to go to the south west valleys. You will recall, Janet, the Irish company Elev8 Solutions, which the WDA successfully located in a speculatively built call centre in an office block in Ammanford. I am sure that we both welcome that. There was a chance that the call centre would go to Swansea but the decision was taken to take it to Ammanford if at all possible and, indeed, it went to Ammanford. I am sure you will welcome that, Janet, as a sign that we are already doing exactly what you asked for in your question.

Adroddiad 'Steel Communities Study' The 'Steel Communities Study' Report

Q2 Pauline Jarman: What action has the First Minister taken to respond to the recently

cyngor Pen-y-bont a'r WDA ynglŷn â natur y gwaith o adfywio tref Porthcawl. Efallai ei bod yn bosibl gwneud yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Abertawe: dechrau â chynllun gwreiddiol, sy'n creu gwrthwynebiad cryf a ddadleuir yn dda, a dychwelyd â chynllun diwygiedig flwyddyn neu ddwy yn ddiweddarach pan fydd y rhan fwyaf o'r gwrthwynebiad hwnnw wedi diflannu. Efallai fod y broblem gyda Phorthcawl yn fwy sylfaenol, felly nid wyf am godi gobeithion yn ormodol. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ddiolchgar i glywed gan Peter os yw am awgrymu ateb i broblem Porthcawl. Fe'i codaf wedyn gyda chadeirydd y WDA a chydag aelodau a swyddogion priodol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr.

Janet Davies: Pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i roi cyfarwyddyd i'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad sy'n gyfrifol am adfywio economaidd dargedu eu gweithgareddau i sicrhau ffyniant ardaloedd fel cymoedd y de orllewin, yn lle canolbwyntio eu hymdrechion ar goridorau'r M4 a'r A55?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ein teimlad cyffredinol fyddai annog cymaint o ddatblygiadau â phosibl i gael eu creu neu eu denu i gymoedd y de orllewin. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch leoli canolfan manwerthu fawr fel datblygiad Cei'r Castell yn unman ond ynghanol Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bolisi gennym, lle y bo'n bosibl, i berswadio datblygiadau unigol o sectorau eraill i fynd i gymoedd y de orllewin. Byddwch yn cofio, Janet, y cwmni Gwyddelig Elev8 Solutions, y llwyddodd y WDA i'w leoli mewn canolfan alw y mentrwyd ei hadeiladu mewn bloc swyddfeydd yn Rhydaman. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y ddau ohonom yn croesawu hynny. Yr oedd posibilrwydd yr âi'r ganolfan alw i Abertawe ond penderfynwyd ei hadeiladu yn Rhydaman os oedd hynny'n bosibl ac, yn wir, i Rydaman yr aeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y croesawch hynny, Janet, fel arwydd ein bod eisoes yn gwneud yn union yr hyn a ofynnwyd gennych yn eich cwestiwn.

C2 Pauline Jarman: Pa gamau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cymryd i ymateb i'r

published report, 'Steel Communities Study', commissioned on behalf of the National Assembly, Welsh Development Agency and Education and Learning Wales? (OAQ13061) [R]

The First Minister: The Assembly Cabinet's working group on Corus approved the plan on 10 October 2001, with a few revisions.

Pauline Jarman: Is this not another example of the absence of a dedicated, full-time Minister for Economic Development having a direct effect on your Government's ability to deal in an effective and timely manner with such major issues?

The First Minister: Pauline, perhaps you would like to revise your practice of reading your supplementary question out before listening to the answer to the main question. Had I said that we were still cogitating over what to do about the 'Steel Communities Study', your supplementary question might have been appropriate. However, since I said that the Cabinet's working group on Corus agreed to the plan at its last meeting two weeks ago, with minor revisions, you should rethink your practice on supplementary questions.

William Graham: I have asked you many times to conduct a skills audit, which is part of this study. We asked you to do that before the closures were announced in order to be ahead of the game. You have shown that you are behind the game. How can you assure those who have lost their jobs that you will make a better effort in future?

The First Minister: The skills audit of the Llanwern employees has been carried out. There is no basis for the suggestion in your question.

adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, 'Steel Communities Study', a gomisiynwyd ar ran y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac ELWa? (OAQ13061) [R]

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cymeradwywyd y cynllun gan weithgor Cabinet y Cynulliad ar Corus ar 10 Hydref 2001, gan ddiwygio ambell beth.

Pauline Jarman: Onid yw hon yn enghraifft arall o'r ffordd y mae absenoldeb Gweinidog penodol, llawn amser dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar allu eich Llywodraeth i ymdrin â materion pwysig o'r fath mewn modd effeithiol ac amserol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Pauline, efallai yr hoffech ddiwygio eich arfer o ddarllen eich cwestiwn atodol cyn gwranddo ar yr ateb a roddir i'r prif gwestiwn. Pe byddwn wedi dweud ein bod yn dal i ystyried beth i'w wneud ynglŷn â'r 'Steel Communities Study', efallai y byddai eich cwestiwn atodol wedi bod yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, gan imi ddweud i weithgor y Cabinet ar Corus gytuno i'r cynllun yn ei gyfarfod diwethaf bythefnos yn ôl, gyda mân ddiwygiadau, dylech ailystyried eich arfer ar gwestiynau atodol.

William Graham: Gofynnais lawer gwaith ichi gynnal archwiliad sgiliau, sy'n rhan o'r astudiaeth hon. Gofynasom i chi wneud hynny cyn cyhoeddi bod y gweithfeydd yn mynd i gau er mwyn bod ar y blaen. Yr ydych wedi dangos eich bod ar ei hôl hi. Sut y gallwch sicrhau'r rheini a gollodd eu swyddi y byddwch yn gwneud mwy o ymdrech yn y dyfodol?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r archwiliad o sgiliau cyflogaion Llanwern wedi'i gynnal. Nid oes sail dros yr hyn a awgrymir yn eich cwestiwn.

Datblygiadau Prosiect Technium Developments in the Technium Project

Q3 Alun Cairns: Will the First Minister make a statement on the latest developments in the technium project? (OAQ13090)

C3 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch datblygiadau diweddaraf prosiect technium? (OAQ13090)

The First Minister: This is a successful 'made in Wales' venture. We have been pleasantly surprised by the WDA's ability to develop Technium1 and, more importantly, to get a high standard of tenants into the building. Anyone who has been to the centre will realise that it has made a major breakthrough in the higher value-added research and development related sector. The joint working between the WDA, the University of Wales, Swansea and Swansea Institute of Higher Education has been remarkable. As a result, we will now roll out the Technium concept elsewhere in south-west Wales. The administration has allocated an additional £13 million for that work, which includes an Auto Technium and a Bio Technium. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I would be grateful if the leader of the Welsh Conservatives would switch his mobile phone off.

9:10 a.m.

Alun Cairns: Swansea Technium has been a success and much of the credit for that must go to the First Minister. However, if he accepts the credit, will he also accept responsibility for the fact that Technium 2 is almost six months behind schedule?

The First Minister: I will look into the funding problems with Technium 2. They are related to the funding rules. We are trying to find an answer to those problems, because I am determined that they will not prevent the success of the Technium concept. The fact that it has been rolled out elsewhere in Wales and developed further in the Port Tawe area of Swansea bay proves that it is a made-in-Wales success.

David Lloyd: Croesawaf y datblygiad hwn. Pa fesurau a gymerwyd i dargedu busnesau lleol i adleoli i'r ganolfan hon?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Y bwriad oedd sicrhau cymysgedd o gwmnïau. Yr oeddem am i gwmnïau megis Agilent o Galiffornia, sydd yn fyd-enwog o ran busnes *high-tech*, weithio gyda chwmnïau bach a *spin-outs* o Brifysgol Abertawe neu'r Sefydliad Addysg

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae hon yn fenter lwyddiannus 'a luniwyd yng Nghymru'. Cawsom ein siomi ar yr ochr orau gan allu'r WDA i ddatblygu Technium1 ac, yn bwysicach, i sicrhau tenantiaid o safon uchel yn yr adeilad. Bydd y sawl a fu i'r ganolfan yn sylweddoli ei fod wedi gwneud datblygiad o bwys yn y sector ymchwil a datblygu gwerth ychwanegol uwch. Bu'r cydweithio rhwng y WDA, Prifysgol Cymru, Abertawe ac Athrofa Addysg Uwch Abertawe yn rhyfeddol. O ganlyniad, byddwn yn cyflwyno cysyniad Technium yn awr mewn manau eraill yn y De-ddwyrain. Mae'r weinyddiaeth wedi dyrannu £13 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw, sy'n cynnwys Auto Technium a Bio Technium. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn diffodd ei ffôn symudol.

Alun Cairns: Bu Technium Abertawe yn llwyddiant ac i Brif Weinidog Cymru y mae'r diolch am lawer o hynny. Fodd bynnag, os derbynia'r clod, a dderbynia hefyd y cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith bod Technium 2 bron chwe mis ar ei hôl hi o ran yr amserlen?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Edrychaf yn fanwl ar y problemau ariannol gyda Technium 2. Maent yn gysylltiedig â'r rheolau ariannu. Yr ydym yn ceisio canfod ateb i'r problemau hynny, gan fy mod yn benderfynol na rwystrant lwyddiant cysyniad Technium. Mae'r ffaith ei fod wedi'i gyflwyno mewn manau eraill yng Nghymru a'i ddatblygu ymhellach yn ardal Port Tawe ym mae Abertawe yn profi ei fod yn llwyddiant a luniwyd yng Nghymru.

David Lloyd: I welcome this development. What measures were taken to target local business to relocate to this centre?

The First Minister: The intention was to ensure a mix of companies. We wanted companies such as Agilent of California, which is a world-famous high-tech business, to work with small companies and spin-outs from Swansea University or the Institute of

Uwch er mwyn creu rhyw fath o gemeg rhwng dwy ochr y datblygiad. Mae'r elfen hudol honno wedi digwydd yng nghanolfan Technium yn nocioau Abertawe.

Higher Education in order to create some kind of chemistry between both sides of the development. That magical element has been seen at the Technium centre in Swansea docks.

Denu Mewnffuddsoddwyr i Gymru Attracting Investment to Wales

Q4 Jonathan Morgan: Will the First Minister make a statement on the role of the Welsh Development Agency in continuing to attract investment to Wales given the events of 11 September? (OAQ13053)

C4 Jonathan Morgan: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar rôl Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru o ran parhau i ddenu mewnffuddsoddwyr i Gymru o gofio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ar 11 Medi? (OAQ13053)

The First Minister: We are all perplexed by the question of what the medium-term effects of the events of 11 September will be. The resilience of overseas markets is important. When I met overseas investors in California with the WDA in early September, I found it remarkable the degree to which, despite the downturn in the high-tech sector, they were still willing to consider Europe and Wales as locations for investment and to look ahead three or four years. That was just before 11 September. Since then, there has been an impact on the aerospace industry, which has been manifested in the job losses at GE Aircraft Engines in Caerphilly and, following yesterday's announcement, at Alenia Marconi Systems in Cwmbran. The impact of the downturn in the high-tech sector has given rise to problems at Corning Optical Fibres in north Wales. Therefore, there is a downturn in a few sectors, which the WDA must try to counteract. It is too early to say how big the effect will be on the WDA's efforts to market Wales to overseas investors.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr ydym i gyd mewn penbleth ynglŷn ag effeithiau'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ar 11 Medi yn y tymor canolig. Mae gwytnwch marchnadoedd tramor yn bwysig. Pan gyfarfûm â buddsoddwyr tramor yng Nghaliffornia gyda'r WDA ddechrau Medi, yr oedd eu parodrwydd i ystyried Ewrop a Chymru yn lleoliadau i fuddsoddi ynddynt ac i edrych dair neu bedair blynedd i'r dyfodol, er gwaethaf y dirywiad yn sector y dechnoleg newydd, yn hynod. Yr oedd hynny ychydig cyn 11 Medi. Ers hynny, effeithiwyd ar y diwydiant aerofod, a amlygwyd yn y swyddi a gollwyd yn GE Aircraft Engines yng Nghaerffili ac, yn dilyn cyhoeddiad ddoe, yn Alenia Marconi Systems yng Nghwmbân. Mae effaith y dirywiad yn sector y dechnoleg newydd wedi arwain at broblemau yn Corning Optical Fibres yn y Gogledd. Felly, ceir dirywiad o fewn ambell sector, y mae'n rhaid i'r WDA geisio ei wrthsefyll. Mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud beth fydd yr effaith ar ymdrechion y WDA i farchnata Cymru i fuddsoddwyr tramor.

Jonathan Morgan: The British Tourist Authority announced on 26 September that Britain's inbound tourism industry stands to lose around £2.5 billion this year, due to the combined effects of foot and mouth disease and the events of 11 September. Given that one of Wales's greatest annual investments is in tourism, what measures are being taken to address this knock-on effect?

Jonathan Morgan: Cyhoeddodd Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain ar 26 Medi y gallai'r diwydiant twristiaeth i mewn i Brydain gollu tua £2.5 biliwn eleni, yn sgîl cyfuno effeithiau clwy'r traed a'r genau a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ar 11 Medi. O gofio mai twristiaeth yw un o'r meysydd y buddsoddir fwyaf ynddo yn flynyddol, pa fesurau a gymerir i ymdrin â'r effaith gynyddol hon?

The First Minister: The knock-on effect is nowhere near as big in Wales, proportionately, because, sadly, American

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw'r effaith gynyddol mor fawr o bell ffordd yng Nghymru, yn gyfatebol, oherwydd, yn

tourists tend not to come to Wales in such huge numbers. Wales could face losses of £20 million to £30 million this year and possibly £40 million next year. That is a much smaller proportion of the Welsh tourist market than it is of the total British tourist market, because of the concentration of the typical American package tourist on the London hotel market. It is sad, but it means that, if there is a downturn of between 30 and 50 per cent in the American tourism industry, it will be less of a blow for Wales than for other areas of the UK. The Welsh Development Agency is participating fully in the attempts to relaunch marketing efforts in America when the time is right. It is a matter of trying to predict when Americans will start travelling by air again. That has not happened yet, but we hope that it will in 2002.

Janice Gregory: Jonathan's question involved attracting inward investment. Many companies in Wales trade with the United States and some are subsidiaries of American companies. What monitoring and support mechanisms has the WDA put into place to assist those companies? I am thinking especially of companies involved with the aerospace industry, of which there are several in my constituency, Ogmere.

The First Minister: It is not all bad news in the aerospace industry. Janice will have read that representatives of Boeing's offset group will visit factories in Wales this week. Due to international events, the current downturn in the civil aerospace sector—which was preceded by a downturn in the defence aerospace sector—may be balanced out by an upturn in that latter sector. There has always been a strange balance in the aerospace industry between the civilian and defence sectors. Both sectors are never booming at the same time. The visit by Boeing's offset group, announced yesterday and reported in the media today, may have some beneficial effects in Janice's constituency. It may be of significance in ameliorating the blow caused by the expected downturn in orders for civilian aircraft.

anffodus, mae twristiaid Americanaidd yn tueddu i beidio â dod i Gymru mewn niferoedd mor fawr. Gallai Cymru wynebu colledion o £20 miliwn i £30 miliwn eleni a £40 miliwn o bosibl y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny'n gyfran lawer llai o farchnad dwristiaeth Cymru nag ydyw o gyfanswm marchnad dwristiaeth Prydain, am fod twristiaid y gwyliau parod Americanaidd nodweddiadol yn canolbwyntio ar farchnad westai Llundain. Mae'n drist, ond golyga, os oes dirywiad rhwng 30 a 50 y cant yn niwydiant twristiaeth America, y bydd yn llai o ergyd i Gymru nag i rannau eraill o'r DU. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn cyfranogi'n llawn yn yr ymdrechion i ail-lansio'r ymgyrch farchnata yn America pan fo'r amser yn iawn. Mater ydyw o geisio rhagweld pryd y bydd Americanaid yn dechrau teithio mewn awyrennau unwaith eto. Nid yw hynny wedi digwydd eto, ond gobeithiwn y gwnaiff ddigwydd yn 2002.

Janice Gregory: Yr oedd cwestiwn Jonathan yn ymwneud â denu mewnfuddsoddwyr. Mae llawer o gwmnïau Cymru yn masnachu â'r Unol Daleithiau ac mae rhai yn is-gwmnïau Americanaidd. Pa ddulliau monitro a chymorth a roddwyd ar waith gan y WDA er mwyn cynorthwyo'r cwmnïau hynny? Meddyliaf yn arbennig am gwmnïau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r diwydiant aerofod, y mae sawl un yn fy etholaeth i, sef Ogwr.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid yw'r newyddion yn ddrwg i gyd yn y diwydiant aerofod. Bydd Janice wedi darllen bod cynrychiolwyr grŵp offset Boeing am ymweld â ffatrioedd yng Nghymru yr wythnos hon. O ganlyniad i ddigwyddiadau rhyngwladol, mae'n bosibl y caiff y dirywiad presennol yn y sector aerofod sifil—a ragflaenwyd gan ddirywiad yn y sector aerofod amddiffyn—ei wrthbwyo gan gynnydd yn y sector olaf hwnnw. Bu cydbwysedd rhyfedd erioed yn y diwydiant aerofod rhwng y sector sifil a'r sector amddiffyn. Nid yw'r ddau sector byth yn llewyrchus ar yr un pryd. Gallai'r ymweliad gan grŵp offset Boeing yn etholaeth Janice, a gyhoeddwyd ddoe ac yr adroddwyd amdano yn y cyfryngau heddiw, gael rhyw effeithiau buddiol yn etholaeth Janice. Gallai leddfu'n sylweddol yr ergyd a achoswyd gan y dirywiad disgwylledig yn yr archebion am awyrennau sifil.

Yr Uwch-Gynhadledd Weithgynhyrchu
The Manufacturing Summit

Q5 Brian Gibbons: Has the First Minister had any discussions with the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry regarding Wales's involvement in the forthcoming manufacturing summit? (OAQ13071)

The First Minister: The Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, Patricia Hewitt, announced on 1 October that she plans to hold a manufacturing summit to tackle the challenges facing the manufacturing sector in the United Kingdom. The sector has been experiencing a downturn and is, technically, in recession. It is the major casualty of the strength of the pound against the euro and its weakness against the dollar and the yen. That is causing problems to manufacturers who are trying to export across the sterling/euro barrier.

As yet, no date has been set for the summit. I will attend on behalf of the Assembly Government, and the chairman of the Welsh Development Agency will also be invited to attend. I believe that business and trade union leaders will also attend, although it has not been confirmed whether there will be Welsh representation from those sectors.

Brian Gibbons: Do you agree that, if we are to address the problems of the manufacturing sector, we must have good links with the rest of the UK as a market for Welsh manufacturing output and to secure employment in the manufacturing sector in Wales, which forms a disproportionately large part of the Welsh economy?

The First Minister: I do not approve of the word 'disproportionate'. I believe that 'greater than average' would be a more suitable description. The manufacturing industry is most important to the economy of the West and East Midlands, where there are no ports and not much agriculture. Yorkshire and Humberside are next on the list, followed by Wales, where the manufacturing sector forms 28 per cent of the economy. The

C5 Brian Gibbons: A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cynnal trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant ynghylch rhan Cymru yn yr uwch-gynhadledd weithgynhyrchu sydd ar y gweill? (OAQ13071)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cyhoeddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Fasnach a Diwydiant, Patricia Hewitt, ar 1 Hydref ei bod yn bwriadu cynnal uwch-gynhadledd weithgynhyrchu i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Bu'r sector yn dirywio ac, yn dechnegol, mae'n ddirwasgedig. Dyma'r maes a ddioddefodd yn fawr yn sgîl cryfder y bunt yn erbyn yr ewro a'i gwendid yn erbyn y ddoler a'r ien. Mae hynny'n creu problemau i weithgynhyrchwyr sy'n ceisio allforio ar draws y terfyn sterling/ewro.

Hyd yma, nid oes dyddiad wedi'i bennu ar gyfer yr uwch-gynhadledd. Byddaf yn bresennol ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac estynnir gwahoddiad hefyd i gadeirydd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Credaf y bydd arweinwyr busnes ac arweinwyr undebau llafur hefyd yn bresennol, er na chadarnhawyd pa un a fydd cynrychiolwyr o Gymru o'r sectorau hynny yno ai peidio.

Brian Gibbons: A gytunwch, os ydym i ymdrin â phroblemau'r sector gweithgynhyrchu, fod yn rhaid i'n cysylltiadau â gweddill y DU fod yn rhai da fel marchnad ar gyfer cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu o Gymru ac er mwyn sicrhau cyflogaeth yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, sy'n ffurfio rhan anghymesur fawr o economi Cymru?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chymeradwyaf y gair 'anghymesur'. Credaf y byddai 'mwy na'r cyffredin' yn ddisgrifiad mwy addas. Mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn bwysig iawn i economi Gorllewin a Dwyrain Canolbarth Lloegr, lle nad oes porthladdoedd na llawer o amaethyddiaeth. Swydd Efrog a Glannau Humber sydd nesaf ar y rhestr, a ddilynir gan Gymru, lle y mae'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yn 28 y cant o'r economi.

average is about 22 per cent. In some areas, such as south-east England, the manufacturing industry does not form more than 10 or 15 per cent of the economy. Wales is well above the average. Therefore, manufacturing is more significant to us than to south-east England.

Dafydd Wigley: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod y gymuned fusnes yn amau a all yr uwch-gynhadledd hon gyflawni unrhyw newid o werth? Yn sgîl yr arolwg a gyhoeddwyd gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain y bore yma, sy'n dangos bod hyder ymhlith diwydianwyr yng Nghymru ar ei lefel isaf ers Ionawr 1991, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog gefnogi galwad Rudi Plaut heddiw am ostyngiad pellach o 0.5 y cant yn y cyfraddau llog ar unwaith, heb aros hyd yr uwch-gynhadledd?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid oes gan ddyddiad yr uwch-gynhadledd ddim i'w wneud â gostyngiad mewn cyfraddau llog gan Bwyllgor Polisi Arianyddol Banc Lloegr. Yr wyf wedi darllen arolwg Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, sy'n cynnwys arolwg am Gymru. Mae nifer y cwmnïau sy'n cymryd rhan yn yr arolygon hyn mor fychan fel bo'r canrannau yn dueddol o godi a disgyn heb unrhyw reswm. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod y sector gweithgynhyrchu dan bwysau aruthrol oherwydd cryfder y bunt o'i gymharu â'r ewro.

9:20 a.m.

Y Strategaeth Datblygu Economaidd Genedlaethol The National Economic Development Strategy

Q6 Phil Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on the national economic development strategy? (OAQ13058)

The First Minister: Yesterday, we issued the draft national economic development strategy to members of the Economic Development Committee. We also gave a presentation to the press so that the public can learn more about the draft document. At the same time, Jane Davidson launched the skills and employment strategy, which is on a different consultation timetable. We hope to have a Plenary debate in December on the national economic development strategy,

Y cyfartaledd yw tua 22 y cant. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, fel de-ddwyrain Lloegr, nid yw'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn fwy na 10 neu 15 y cant o'r economi. Mae Cymru yn llawer uwch na'r cyfartaledd. Felly, mae gweithgynhyrchu yn llawer pwysicach i ni nag i dde-ddwyrain Lloegr.

Dafydd Wigley: Is the First Minister aware that the business community doubts whether this summit can achieve any significant change? In view of the survey published this morning by the Confederation of British Industry, which show that confidence among industrialists in Wales is at its lowest level since January 1991, will the First Minister support Rudi Plaut's call today for a further cut of 0.5 per cent in interest rates immediately, without waiting for the summit?

The First Minister: The date of the summit is in no way connected to a cut in interest rates by the Bank of England's Monetary Policy Committee. I have read the CBI's survey, which includes a survey on Wales. The number of companies that participate in these surveys is so small that the percentages tend to rise and fall for no reason. Everyone accepts that the manufacturing sector is under severe pressure due to the strength of the pound against the euro.

C6 Phil Williams: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol? (OAQ13058)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ddoe, cyhoeddasom y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ddrafft i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Rhoesom hefyd gyflwyniad i'r wasg er mwyn i'r cyhoedd allu dysgu mwy am y ddogfen ddrafft. Ar yr un pryd, lansiodd Jane Davidson y strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth, sydd ag amserlen ymgynghori wahanol. Gobeithiwn gynnal dadl yn un o Gyfarfodydd Llawn mis Rhagfyr ar y strategaeth datblygu

subject to business pressures, and we hope to debate the skills and employment strategy in January.

Phil Williams: In the WORD file of the new national economic development strategy document, the section that tracks changes had not been deleted. Therefore, I am sure that you would like an opportunity to explain why, at 9.27 a.m. yesterday, the key recommendation of the WDA report on ICT was deleted from the strategy. Later that morning, the budget for fiscal variations was deleted. Several other major changes were made at the last minute. Do you not agree that publicising widely that major changes were made to this draft at the last minute does not inspire confidence of careful preparation?

The First Minister: I am not sure what you are talking about, Phil. You are operating on a technological level, which is on a different planet to me. Perhaps you could write to me on this question of fact file changes. I am not sure that I understand that term. However, I understand the basis of your question regarding last minute changes to the document. No last minute changes have been made. Since the end of the consultation period in July, it has been a writing process. A working group was set up. It included representatives from the Confederation of British Industry, the Trades Union Congress, the Federation of Small Businesses and the academic sector, including Professor Sir Adrian Webb, the Vice Chancellor of the University of Glamorgan. They have been writing the document in conjunction with Assembly officials since July. In any one week, rewriting the document means that contributions are being made. Changes do not simply appear. The document develops and has been developing consistently and steadily since July.

Rosemary Butler: I am sure that the Economic Development Minister would agree that no economic development strategy would work without the ability to move around the country easily. Do you not agree that the M4 and M4 relief road would form a central strand of any future economic development strategy? Are there any plans to

economiaidd genedlaethol, yn dibynnu ar bwysau busnes, a gobeithiwn gynnal dadl ar y strategaeth sgiliau a chyflogaeth ym mis Ionawr.

Phil Williams: Yn ffeil WORD y ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol newydd, nid oedd yr adran sy'n olrhain newidiadau wedi'i dileu. Felly, yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech gyfle i esbonio pam, am 9.27 fore ddoe, y dilewyd argymhelliad allweddol adroddiad y WDA ar TGCh o'r strategaeth. Yn ddiweddarach y bore hwnnw, dilewyd y gyllideb ar gyfer amrywiadau ariannol. Gwnaethpwyd sawl newid mawr arall ar y funud olaf. Oni chytunwch nad yw rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd eang i'r newidiadau mawr a wnaethpwyd i'r drafft hwn ar y funud olaf yn ennyn hyder pobl bod gwaith paratoi manwl wedi'i wneud?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf yn siŵr am beth yr ydych yn sôn, Phil. Yr ydych yn gweithredu ar lefel dechnolegol, sydd ar blaned wahanol i mi. Efallai y gallech ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r cwestiwn hwn ar newid ffeiliau ffaith. Nid wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn deall y term hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, deallaf sail eich cwestiwn ynghylch newidiadau munud olaf i'r ddogfen. Ni wnaethpwyd newidiadau munud olaf o gwbl. Ers diwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori ym mis Gorffennaf, bu'n broses o ysgrifennu. Sefydlwyd gweithgor. Yr oedd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a'r sector academaidd, gan gynnwys yr Athro Syr Adrian Webb, Is-Ganghellor Prifysgol Morgannwg. Buont wrthi'n ysgrifennu'r ddogfen mewn cydweithrediad â swyddogion y Cynulliad ers mis Gorffennaf. Mewn unrhyw wythnos, mae ailysgrifennu'r ddogfen yn golygu y gwneir cyfraniadau. Nid yw newidiadau yn ymddangos o'u rhan eu hunain. Mae'r ddogfen yn datblygu a bu'n datblygu'n gyson ers mis Gorffennaf.

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn cytuno na fyddai strategaeth datblygu economaidd yn gweithio heb y gallu i symud o gwmpas y wlad yn hawdd. Oni chytunwch y byddai'r M4 a ffordd liniaru yr M4 yn ffurfio llinyn canolog mewn unrhyw strategaeth datblygu economaidd yn y

build the M4 relief road before Newport is declared to be a city?

The First Minister: That last point is outside the province of the national economic development strategy and outside the province of this Assembly, as it is a reserved matter for central Government. However, on the wider issue of the M4, you have raised a genuine difficulty on the definition of economic development. One could say that it includes roads. One could also say that it includes education and local government. However, in general, we take the view that it is in the province of the Economic Development Minister's portfolio. It is closely linked to part of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning's portfolio, regarding those who go through the education system and go on to skills and adult training centres. It relates to pupils in their final years at school and to vocational further and higher education. The line must be drawn somewhere. You could always say that we should have extended it further to include roads or local government, because that is part of economic development. Of course, that is true and you can always argue such a case. However, we have said that this is about economic development. This is about how you create jobs and how you create the skills that enable people to fill those jobs.

dyfodol? A oes cynlluniau i adeiladu ffordd liniaru yr M4 cyn i Gasnewydd gael ei datgan yn ddinas?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r pwynt olaf hwnnw y tu allan i faes y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ac y tu allan i faes y Cynulliad hwn, gan ei fod yn fater a gedwir ar gyfer Llywodraeth ganolog. Fodd bynnag, o ran yr M4 yn fwy cyffredinol, yr ydych wedi codi anhawster dilys wrth ddiffinio datblygu economaidd. Gellid dweud ei fod yn cynnwys ffyrdd. Gellid dweud hefyd ei fod yn cynnwys addysg a llywodraeth leol. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, cymerwn y safbwynt y daw o fewn maes portffolio y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Mae iddo gysylltiad agos â rhan o bortffolio'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, mewn perthynas â'r rheini sy'n mynd drwy'r system addysg ac yn mynd ymlaen i feithrin sgiliau ac i ganolfannau hyfforddi oedolion. Mae'n ymwneud â disgyblion sydd yn eu blynyddoedd olaf yn yr ysgol ac ag addysg bellach ac uwch alwedigaethol. Rhaid tynnu'r llinell yn rhywle. Gallech ddweud bob amser y dylem fod wedi ei hymestyn ymhellach i gynnwys ffyrdd neu lywodraeth leol, gan fod hynny'n rhan o ddatblygu economaidd. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n wir a gallwch ddadlau achos o'r fath bob amser. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi dweud bod hyn yn fater o ddatblygu economaidd. Mae a wnelo hyn â'r ffordd y caiff swyddi eu creu a'r ffordd y caiff y sgiliau eu creu sy'n galluogi pobl i lenwi'r swyddi hynny.

Cyfleusterau Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Afioneg Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan The Defence Avionics Repair Agency's Facilities at St Athans

Q7 David Melding: Will the First Minister make a statement on the WDA's role in developing the Defence Avionics Repair Agency's facilities at St Athans? (OAQ13069)

The First Minister: The WDA's land division is working closely with DARA and Defence Estates to evaluate a proposal to upgrade and modernise the facilities at RAF St Athan to enable DARA to remain in south Wales, following the abandonment of the plan to move DARA a few miles up the road to Cardiff international airport at Rhoose. The land division is currently involved in

C7 David Melding: A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar rôl Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru o ran datblygu cyfleusterau Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Afioneg Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan? (OAQ13069)

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae is-adran tir y WDA yn cydweithio'n agos â DARA a Defence Estates i werthuso cynllun i uwchraddio a moderneiddio'r cyfleusterau yn Awyrlu Brenhinol Sain Tathan er mwyn galluogi DARA i aros yn y De, ar ôl rhoi'r gorau i'r cynllun i symud DARA ychydig o filltiroedd i fyny'r ffordd i faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn y Rhws. Mae'r is-

assembling the land required for the site's development and is undertaking a feasibility study for the possible runway extension that would be required.

adran tir yn ymwneud ar hyn o bryd â'r gwaith o gydosod y tir sy'n ofynnol er mwyn datblygu'r safle ac mae'n cynnal astudiaeth ymarferoldeb ar gyfer yr estyniad posibl i'r rhedfa a fyddai'n ofynnol.

David Melding: One option is for the runway to be extended to the east. I understand that that is the most feasible option. That would divide St Athan. An area of some social exclusion, namely the former east camp, would then be separated from the village schools and shops. Residents would be forced to take a detour of at least a mile and a half to reach those facilities. Will you ensure that the community's concern is noted fully?

David Melding: Un opsiwn yw ymestyn y rhedfa i'r dwyrain. Deallaf mai dyna'r opsiwn mwyaf ymarferol. Byddai hynny'n rhannu Sain Tathan. Câi ardal sy'n dioddef rywfaint o allgáu cymdeithasol, sef yr hen wersyll dwyreiniol, ei gwahanu wedyn oddi wrth ysgolion a siopau'r pentref. Câi trigolion eu gorfodi i deithio milltir a hanner o leiaf allan o'u ffordd er mwyn cyrraedd y cyfleusterau hynny. A sicrhewch fod yr effaith ar y gymuned yn cael ei nodi'n llawn?

The First Minister: I give you that assurance.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Rhoddaf y sicrwydd hwnnw ichi.

Ymddiheuraf am fod yn hwyr. Mae'n rhaid imi gysoni fy wats gyda chloc y Cynulliad.

I apologise for being late. I need to synchronise my watch with the Assembly clock.

Y Llywydd: Mae hynny'n digwydd inni i gyd.

The Presiding Officer: It happens to us all.

Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau

Questions on Finance to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities

Effaith Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau **Impact of Foot and Mouth Disease**

Q1 Glyn Davies: What extra funding will the Minister make available to deal with the impact of foot and mouth disease on the economy of rural Wales? (OAQ13096)

C1 Glyn Davies: Pa arian ychwanegol y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei ryddhau i ymdrin ag effaith clwy'r traed a'r genau ar Gymru wledig? (OAQ13096)

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): Additional resources totalling £60 million have been made available over the current and next two financial years. A breakdown of planned expenditure by activity was included in the rural recovery plan issued on 26 July. I also announced in my budget speech last week that a further £15 million for rate relief for businesses in rural areas will be made available from 1 April next year.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Sicrhawyd bod cyfanswm o £60 miliwn o adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael dros y flwyddyn gyfredol a'r ddwy flynedd ariannol nesaf. Cynhwyswyd dadansoddiad o'r gwariant arfaethedig yn ôl gweithgaredd yn y cynllun adfer gwledig a gyhoeddwyd ar 26 Gorffennaf. Cyhoeddais hefyd yn fy araith gyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf y caiff £15 miliwn pellach ar gyfer cymorth trethi i fusnesau mewn ardaloedd gwledig ei ryddhau o 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

Glyn Davies: From what you have said previously, I know that you agree that immediate financial help is crucial. Much has been made of the £60 million, which makes people think that a huge amount of help has been given. However, do you accept that the financial help for the current year is £37 million, £21 million of which was announced for local authorities, and that therefore the help that you have given rural areas in response to foot and mouth disease is far less than is acceptable?

Edwina Hart: We have made a positive and correct financial response to the foot and mouth disease crisis. We are sympathetic to the crisis in rural areas and have made the necessary funds available, as we should. It has to be recognised that the administration in Wales has done a great deal.

Mick Bates: I am sure that you know that 70 per cent of foot and mouth disease cases in Wales were in Powys. However, in the two tranches of money allocated, Powys received about 7 per cent of the first and about 20 per cent of the second. Will you ensure that Powys receives a fair share of the next tranche, rather than a lot of money being sent to authorities where the disease has had far less impact?

Edwina Hart: As I indicated at the time, I allocated money on the basis of a formula adjustment. When local authorities have not spent the money, it has been re-allocated. I will consider Powys's position sympathetically.

Elin Jones: Yr wythnos diwethaf, bu ichi gyhoeddi £3.5 miliwn ychwanegol i'r gyllideb Gymreig oherwydd clwy'r traed a'r genau. A wnewch roi sicrwydd y bydd y £3.5 miliwn hwnnw i gyd ar gyfer adfywio'r economi wledig ac y bydd yn ychwanegol? A wnewch roi manylion am hynny i'r Cynulliad cyn hir?

Edwina Hart: I will update the Assembly on my financial allocation proposals.

Glyn Davies: O'r hyn a ddywedsoch yn flaenorol, gwn eich bod yn cytuno bod cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol yn hanfodol. Rhoddwyd llawer o sylw i'r £60 miliwn, sy'n gwneud i bobl feddwl bod llawer iawn o gymorth wedi'i roi. Fodd bynnag, a dderbyniwch mai'r cymorth ariannol ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyfredol yw £37 miliwn, y cyhoeddwyd bod £21 miliwn ohono ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, ac felly bod y cymorth a roddwyd gennych i ardaloedd gwledig mewn ymateb i glwy'r traed a'r genau ymhell o fod yn dderbyniol?

Edwina Hart: Bu ein hymateb ariannol i argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yn un cadarnhaol a chywir. Cydymdeimlwn â'r sefyllfa argyfyngus mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac yr ydym wedi rhyddhau'r arian angenrheidiol, fel y dylem. Rhaid cydnabod bod y weinyddiaeth yng Nghymru wedi gwneud llawer.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod mai ym Mhowys yr oedd 70 y cant o'r achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau a gafwyd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yn y ddwy gyfran o arian a ddyrannwyd, derbyniodd Powys tua 7 y cant o'r gyntaf a thua 20 y cant o'r ail. A sicrhewch fod Powys yn derbyn rhan deg o'r gyfran nesaf, yn hytrach nag anfon arian mawr i awdurdodau lle y cafodd y clwyf effaith lai o lawer?

Edwina Hart: Fel y nodais ar y pryd, dyrennais arian ar sail fformiwla a addaswyd. Pan na fydd awdurdodau lleol wedi gwario'r arian, bydd wedi'i ailddyrranu. Ystyriaf sefyllfa Powys â chydymdeimlad.

Elin Jones: Last week, you announced an additional £3.5 million for the Welsh budget as a result of foot and mouth disease. Will you give an assurance that all of that £3.5 million will go towards the regeneration of the rural economy and that it will be additional? Will you provide details to the Assembly about that soon?

Edwina Hart: Rhoddaf y newyddion diweddaraf i'r Cynulliad yn rheolaidd ar fy nghynlluniau i ddyrranu arian.

Busnesau sydd wedi Dioddef o Ganlyniad i Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau
Funds for Businesses Affected by Foot and Mouth Disease

Q2 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make additional funds available for those businesses in Wales affected by foot and mouth disease? (OAQ13109)

C2 Nick Bourne: A fydd y Gweinidog yn rhyddhau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y busnesau hynny sydd wedi dioddef o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau? (OAQ13109)

Edwina Hart: The package of measures in the rural recovery plan includes two special grant reports for the current financial year, totalling £21 million, for local authorities to help business affected by the foot and mouth disease outbreak. A further £14.7 million, over the current and next two financial years, is directed at helping farming businesses. I also announced £15 million for rate relief in my budget speech last week.

Edwina Hart: Mae'r pecyn mesurau yn y cynllun adfer gwledig yn cynnwys dau adroddiad grant arbennig ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, sy'n gyfanswm o £21 miliwn, er mwyn i awdurdodau lleol gynorthwyo busnesau yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan glwy'r traed a'r genau. Cyfeirir £14.7 miliwn pellach, dros y flwyddyn gyfredol a'r ddwy flynedd ariannol nesaf, i helpu busnesau ffermio. Cyhoeddais hefyd £15 miliwn ar gyfer cymorth trethi yn fy araith gyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf.

Nick Bourne: I accept that some assistance has been forthcoming. However, does the Minister agree that Powys's position is particularly dire, especially in Brecon and Radnorshire and the southern part of the county? Businesses there are laying people off. There is a serious threat of more redundancies this winter because of the difficulties caused by foot and mouth disease. Assistance next year will not help the immediate problem. Will the Minister meet a deputation from Powys and does she intend to make fresh assistance available in the current year to alleviate what will otherwise be a bleak winter for Powys?

Nick Bourne: Derbyniaf fod rhywfaint o gymorth wedi'i roi. Fodd bynnag, a gytuna'r Gweinidog fod sefyllfa Powys yn arbennig o enbyd, yn enwedig yn Aberhonddu a Sir Faesyfed ac yn rhan ddeheuol y sir? Mae busnesau yno yn diswyddo pobl. Mae bygythiad difrifol y diswyddir mwy y gaeaf hwn oherwydd yr anawsterau a achoswyd gan glwy'r traed a'r genau. Ni fydd cymorth y flwyddyn nesaf yn helpu'r broblem bresennol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gyfarfod â dirprwyaeth o Bowys ac a fwriada sicrhau bod cymorth newydd ar gael yn ystod y flwyddyn gyfredol i leddfu'r hyn a fydd fel arall yn aeaf llwm i Bowys?

Edwina Hart: Some schemes, such as the small firms loan guarantee scheme, which is operated by the Department of Trade and Industry, have been extended to help more firms in response to the foot and mouth disease outbreak. We all acknowledge the continuing difficulties with foot and mouth disease in Powys and I would be delighted to talk to people about any representations they wish to make.

Edwina Hart: Ymestynnwyd rhai cynlluniau, fel y cynllun gwarantu benthyciad i gwmnïau bach, a weithredir gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant, er mwyn cynorthwyo mwy o gwmnïau mewn ymateb i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Cydnabyddwn oll yr anawsterau sy'n parhau yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau ym Mhowys a byddwn yn falch o siarad â phobl am unrhyw sylwadau y dymunant eu gwneud.

9:30 a.m.

Dafydd Wigley: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y £1.8 miliwn ychwanegol a neilltuwyd i Wynedd i helpu busnesau sydd wedi dioddef yn sgîl argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau.

Dafydd Wigley: I thank the Minister for the additional £1.8 million allocated to Gwynedd to help businesses that have suffered in the wake of the foot and mouth crisis. However, I

Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf iddi edrych eto ar y dyddiadau y mae ei hadran wedi eu gosod ar gyfer gwario'r arian hwn. Rhaid pennu defnydd yr arian erbyn 31 Rhagfyr iddo gael ei archwilio erbyn 31 Ionawr. Golyga hynny fod Gwynedd yn gorfod pennu 12 Tachwedd fel dyddiad cau i'r ceisiadau, sef o fewn y pythefnos nesaf. Mae'r cyfyngiad hwnnw'n ei gwneud yn anodd i geisiadau a fydd yn manteisio ar yr arian gael eu derbyn mewn pryd. A oes modd symud y dyddiadau cau yn ôl i ddyddiad pennu ar y 28 Chwefror a dyddiad gwario ar y 31 Mawrth?

Edwina Hart: In the light of your question, I will ask my officials to review the feasibility of the matter and I will place a note in the Library outlining my decision.

ask her to reconsider the dates that her department has set for this money to be spent. This funding must be committed by 31 December for it to be audited by 31 January. That means that Gwynedd has to set 12 November as the closing date for the applications, that is, within the next fortnight. That time restriction makes it difficult for applications that will benefit from the funding to be received in time. Would it be possible to move the closing dates back to a commitment date of 28 February and a spending date of 31 March?

Edwina Hart: Yng ngoleuni eich cwestiwn, gofynnaf i'm swyddogion adolygu ymarferoldeb y mater a rhoddaf nodyn yn y Llyfrgell yn amlinellu fy mhenderfyniad.

Bonws i Staff yn y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Awarding Bonuses to Public Service Staff

C3 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog adrodd ar unrhyw drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael ynghylch rhoi taliadau bonws i staff yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus am gyrraedd targedau perfformiad? (OAQ13097)

Edwina Hart: I cannot recall any substantive discussions on this issue.

David Lloyd: Symbylwyd y cwestiwn hwn gan adroddiad bod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn bwriadu cynnig taliadau bonws i feddygon a nyrsys am gyrraedd targedau penodol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gynnal trafodaethau gyda Jane Hutt i weld a fydd rhywbeth tebyg yn digwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: If Jane wishes to raise that matter with me, I am sure that she will do so in due course. I have great reservations about the effectiveness of performance bonus systems.

John Griffiths: Is not the real issue that, for too long, the dedication to public service exhibited by public service workers has led to their being taken advantage of with regard to pay and conditions? We must do all that we can to end that situation as soon as possible.

Q3 David Lloyd: Will the Minister report on any discussions she has held regarding the awarding of bonuses to public service staff for meeting performance targets? (OAQ13097)

Edwina Hart: Ni allaf gofio unrhyw drafodaethau sylweddol ar y mater hwn.

David Lloyd: This question was prompted by a report that the Government in London intends to offer bonus payments to doctors and nurses for meeting specific targets. Will the Minister hold discussions with Jane Hutt in order to discover whether anything similar will occur in the health service in Wales?

Edwina Hart: Os hoffai Jane godi'r mater hwnnw gyda mi, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hynny maes o law. Mae gennyf amheuan mawr ynglŷn ag effeithiolrwydd systemau bonws perfformiad.

John Griffiths: Onid y mater gwirioneddol yw bod yr ymrwymiad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus a ddangoswyd gan weithwyr mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, am gyfnod rhy hir, wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle y manteisir arnynt o ran cyflog ac amodau? Rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i ddod â'r sefyllfa honno i ben cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Edwina Hart: I am pleased by the stance that we have taken to achieve equal pay in Wales and in the National Assembly in terms of the salary package that we are presenting to our staff. That approach recognises the quality required of staff in providing public service.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn fodlon â'r safiad a gymerwyd gennym i sicrhau cyflog cyfartal yng Nghymru ac o fewn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nhermau'r pecyn cyflog yr ydym yn ei gyflwyno i'n staff. Mae'r ymagwedd honno yn cydnabod y safon sy'n ofynnol gan staff sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

David Melding: Should we not highly recommend the modest use of market systems? Innovation in the public sector should be rewarded. We need to recruit in areas where there are staff shortages to which we have difficulty in attracting staff. One way to do that is through effective, good pay scales. Another way is to ensure that effort can be rewarded.

David Melding: Oni ddylem argymhell yn gryf y dylid defnyddio systemau marchnad yn gymhedrol? Dylid gwobrwyo dyfeisgarwch yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae angen inni recriwtio mewn ardaloedd lle y mae prinder staff a lle y cawn anhawster i ddenu staff. Un ffordd o wneud hynny yw drwy raddfeydd cyflog da, effeithiol. Ffordd arall yw sicrhau y gellir gwobrwyo ymdrech.

Edwina Hart: Effort needs to be rewarded and general bonus payments were awarded to Assembly staff involved in the foot and mouth disease crisis as recognition of exceptional service during that period. There is a case for bonuses in certain circumstances, but you must consider the issues. The reservations in my first answer refer to the way some performance-related pay systems have been manipulated and where we have not seen the benefits reach all staff.

Edwina Hart: Mae angen gwobrwyo ymdrech a dyfarnwyd taliadau bonws cyffredinol i staff y Cynulliad a oedd yn gysylltiedig ag argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau i gydnabod y gwasanaeth eithriadol yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Mae dadl dros daliadau bonws mewn amgylchiadau arbennig, ond rhaid ichi ystyried y materion dan sylw. Cyfeiria'r amheuan yn fy ateb cyntaf at y ffordd y camddefnyddiwyd rhai systemau tâl ar sail perfformiad a lle na welsom y manteision yn cyrraedd pob aelod o'r staff.

Alun Pugh: Public service staff, such as further education lecturers, have made huge increases in their performance and productivity in recent years. Since the Assembly has put enough money into the education budget to pay FE staff the same rate as their English counterparts, will you support my call for Fforwm to pay the same rates as those paid in England?

Alun Pugh: Mae staff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel darlithwyr addysg bellach, wedi gwneud cynnydd aruthrol yn eu perfformiad a'u cynhyrchiant yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Gan fod y Cynulliad wedi rhoi digon o arian yn y gyllideb addysg i dalu'r un gyfradd i staff addysg bellach ag a delir i weithwyr cyfatebol yn Lloegr, a gefnogwch fy ngalwad ar i Fforwm dalu'r un cyfraddau â'r rhai a delir yn Lloegr?

Edwina Hart: Negotiations between Fforwm and FE lecturers are a matter for them and the National Association of Teachers in Higher and Further Education. However, we should recognise further education's contribution to the Welsh economy.

Edwina Hart: Mae negodiadau rhwng Fforwm a darlithwyr addysg bellach yn fater iddynt hwy a Chymdeithas Genedlaethol Athrawon mewn Addysg Uwch ac Addysg Bellach. Fodd bynnag, dylem gydnabod cyfraniad addysg bellach i economi Cymru.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you agree that the National Assembly's equal pay working group is leading the way in Wales with its

Eleanor Burnham: A gytunwch fod gweithgor cyflog cyfartal y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn arwain y ffordd yng

positive approach to gender equality in the public service employment sector?

Edwina Hart: Of course. I am pleased to say that we have taken the lead in this.

Y Llywydd: Byddaf yn caniatáu amser ychwanegol ar gyfer cwestiwn 4 Cynog Dafis.

Nghymru gyda'i ymagwedd gadarnhaol tuag at gydraddoldeb rhyw yn sector cyflogaeth y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus?

Edwina Hart: Wrth gwrs. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud ein bod wedi arwain y ffordd yn hyn o beth.

The Presiding Officer: I will allow extra time for Cynog Dafis's question 4.

Siambr Newydd y Cynulliad New Assembly Chamber Building

C4 Cynog Dafis: Pa gamau a gymerwyd yn ystod y toriad i sicrhau y caiff Siambr newydd y Cynulliad ei hadeiladu? (OAQ13102)

Edwina Hart: The main progress is in line with the Assembly's decision of 17 July 2001 to proceed with the existing design. A notice was placed in the *Official Journal of the European Communities* on 25 September 2001. That notice seeks formal expressions of interest from developers, contractors and consortia to proceed with the design and construction of the building. I will make a further statement to the Assembly in November once expressions of interest have been received. I welcome the Auditor General's request to provide early advice to the Audit Committee in November. I will ensure that all files are made available to the National Audit Office as quickly as possible.

An audited review of the project documentation has been commissioned and will be available to the Auditor General. I have also commissioned a report by external consultants to advise on the project's future management. Other than confidential evidence in the reports, such as price-sensitive information, I propose to make it publicly available when it is complete. I have commissioned external consultants to report on the historical elements of the project through the Office of the Counsel General. However, in light of the threatened legal proceedings by the Richard Rogers Partnership, I do not propose to release that report or say any more at this stage. To do so

Q4 Cynog Dafis: What progress has been made during the recess towards ensuring that a new Assembly Chamber will be built? (OAQ13102)

Edwina Hart: Mae'r cynnydd mwyaf yn unol â phenderfyniad y Cynulliad ar 17 Gorffennaf 2001 i fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun presennol. Rhoddwyd hysbysiad yn yr *Official Journal of the European Communities* ar 25 Medi 2001. Estynna'r hysbysiad hwnnw wahoddiad i ddatblygwyr, contractwyr a chonsortia fynegi diddordeb ffurfiol mewn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o gynllunio ac adeiladu'r adeilad. Gwnaf ddatganiad pellach i'r Cynulliad ym mis Tachwedd unwaith y bydd diddordeb wedi'i fynegi. Croesawaf gais yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i ddarparu cyngor cynnar i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ym mis Tachwedd. Sicrhaf fod pob ffeil ar gael i'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Comisiynwyd adolygiad wedi'i archwilio o ddogfennaeth y prosiect a bydd ar gael i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Yr wyf hefyd wedi comisiynu adroddiad gan ymgynghorwyr allanol i roi cyngor ar reoli'r prosiect yn y dyfodol. Ac eithrio tystiolaeth gyfrinachol yr yn adroddiadau, fel gwybodaeth sensitif ynghylch prisiau, bwriadaf ei gyhoeddi pan fydd wedi'i gwblhau. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu ymgynghorwyr allanol i gyflwyno adroddiad ar elfennau hanesyddol y prosiect drwy Swyddfa'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, yng ngoleuni'r achos cyfreithiol a fygythir gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, ni fwriadaf ryddhau'r adroddiad hwnnw na dweud mwy ar hyn o bryd. Byddai gwneud

would be to disadvantage the Assembly in any proceedings that might be issued. However, I will make the report available to the Auditor General. In response to Lord Rogers's points in his recent communication to Members, I will make a fuller statement to all Members later this week that will expand on the notes I issued last week.

Cynog Dafis: Croesawaf eiriau'r Gweinidog, yn enwedig ynglŷn â'r broses archwilio. Mae'n bwysig cynnal archwiliad llawn o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd. Mae'n angenrheidiol bod yr adeilad pwysig hwn yn cael ei godi. Hoffwn nodi rhai pryderon. Yn y lle cyntaf, mynegwyd pryder y byddai'r gost yn afresymol ac na ellir ei rheoli. Yr ail bryder yw sicrhau bod yr adeilad o ansawdd uchel, yn unol â gweledigaeth Richard Rogers. Ymddengys i'r Gweinidog weithredu mewn perthynas â rheoli cost. A fydd yn bosibl i Richard Rogers ddod yn ôl i'r ffrâm i redeg y cynllun a sicrhau bod yr adeilad yn unol â'i weledigaeth? Deallaf ei fod ef wedi dweud y byddai'n caru gwneud hynny, a hynny fyddai orau. A all y Gweinidog ddatgan nad yw hi'n rhy hwyr i hynny ddigwydd?

Edwina Hart: I feel strongly about the quality and cost issues. We must examine any bids that we receive closely. We will want the bidders to set out clearly any proposed design changes and we will want to be satisfied that they are acceptable in quality terms. We will similarly examine proposals in respect of finishes. I have no doubt that cost savings can be achieved, but not at the cost of acceptable quality standards. That is clear. We want a world-class building and I remain committed to that concept.

I made it clear in a letter to Lord Rogers that he should respond to the present *Official Journal of the European Communities* advertisement seeking formal expressions of interest to complete the project. I will be happy to consider keeping the original architect on board, but any proposal from him will be on a different basis and must be compared against all other proposals.

Lorraine Barrett: In light of the

hynny'n rhoi'r Cynulliad o dan anfantais pe bai achos yn datblygu. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn sicrhau bod yr adroddiad ar gael i'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol. Mewn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wnaeth yr Arglwydd Rogers i'r Aelodau yn ddiweddar, gwnaf ddatganiad llawnach i'r Aelodau i gyd yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon a fydd yn ehangu ar y nodiadau a gyhoeddais yr wythnos diwethaf.

Cynog Dafis: I welcome the Minister's words, particularly with regard to the audit process. It is important to conduct a full audit of what has happened. It is imperative that this important building is built. I want to note some concerns. First, concern was expressed that the cost would be unreasonable and that it could spiral out of control. The second concern is ensuring that the building is of a high quality, in accordance with Richard Rogers's vision. It appears that the Minister has acted with regard to controlling the cost. Is there any possibility that Richard Rogers can come back into the frame to run the scheme and ensure that the building accords with his vision? I understand that he has said that he would be delighted to do so, and that would be for the best. Can the Minister state that it is not too late for that to happen?

Edwina Hart: Teimlaf yn gryf ynglŷn â'r ansawdd a'r gost. Rhaid inni ystyried unrhyw gynigion a dderbyniwn yn ofalus. Byddwn am i'r cynigwyr nodi bwriadau i newid cynlluniau yn glir a byddwn am fod yn fodlon eu bod yn dderbyniol o ran ansawdd. Yn yr un modd, ystyriwn gynigion o ran gorffeniadau. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth y gellir cyflawni arbedion o ran cost, ond nid ar draul safonau ansawdd derbyniol. Mae hynny'n glir. Yr ydym eisiau adeilad a fydd ymysg y gorau yn y byd ac mae fy ymrwymiad i'r cysyniad hwnnw yn parhau.

Eglurais mewn llythyr i'r Arglwydd Rogers y dylai ymateb i'r hysbyseb bresennol yn yr *Official Journal of the European Communities* sy'n estyn gwahoddiad i bobl fynegi diddordeb ffurfiol yn y gwaith o gwblhau'r prosiect. Byddaf yn hapus i ystyried cadw'r pensaer gwreiddiol, ond bydd unrhyw gynnig ganddo ef ar sail wahanol a rhaid ei gymharu â phob cynnig arall.

Lorraine Barrett: Yng ngoleuni galwadau'r

Conservatives' calls to move the Assembly to City Hall—which would be far more expensive than the present option—will you indicate if there are any contractual obligations to build the new debating Chamber on this site?

Edwina Hart: The Assembly was informed following last year's review that it is obliged under the terms of its agreement with Grosvenor Waterside to construct the Chamber on site 1E. The Assembly could not rule out the possibility of legal action should it fail to meet its obligations. In any case, there would be cost involved in restoring the site, but I must be mindful of the Assembly's legal position and its obligation to Grosvenor Waterside.

Nick Bourne: I ask you to reflect on an earlier statement. You promised that there would be a statement later this week. Does that refer to a statement that will be circulated to Members, and will we have a chance to debate this issue fully in the Chamber? The issues must be debated. It is not true that the Conservatives have called for a return to City Hall. We have asked for that possibility to be investigated. That is consistent with what people in your own party have said.

Edwina Hart: There are some issues that will need to be debated in the Assembly Chamber. There are obviously commercially sensitive and legal matters on which I must protect the Assembly's position. Any reports and paperwork that I have on those issues will go to the Auditor General and will be dealt with in the Audit Committee. The notes that I will hopefully circulate later this week will give a full response to Lord Rogers. As I have indicated, I will then debate some issues in the Chamber in November when I have had the opportunity to assess the expressions of interest. I want to be as open and as transparent as possible, but I must keep the Assembly's interest in terms of legal and commercially sensitive information at the forefront of my mind. It is a difficult position for a Minister.

Ceidwadwyr i symud y Cynulliad i Neuadd y Ddinas—a fyddai'n llawer drutach na'r opsiwn presennol—a nodwch a oes rhwymedigaethau cytundebol i adeiladu'r Siambr ddaclau newydd ar y safle hwn?

Edwina Hart: Hysbyswyd y Cynulliad yn dilyn yr adolygiad y llynedd ei fod yn gorfod adeiladu'r Siambr ar safle 1E o dan dermau ei gytundeb â Grosvenor Waterside. Ni allai'r Cynulliad ddiystyru'r posibilrwydd o gamau cyfreithiol pe methai â chyflawni ei rwymedigaethau. Beth bynnag, byddai cost ynghlwm wrth adfer y safle, ond rhaid imi gofio sefyllfa gyfreithiol y Cynulliad a'i ymrwymiad i Grosvenor Waterside.

Nick Bourne: Gofynnaf ichi ystyried datganiad cynharach. Rhoesoch addewid y ceid datganiad yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. A gyfeiria hynny at ddatganiad a gaiff ei ddosbarthu i'r Aelodau, ac a gawn gyfle i gynnal dadl lawn ar y mater hwn yn y Siambr? Rhaid trafod y materion. Nid yw'n wir bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi galw am ddychwelyd i Neuadd y Ddinas. Yr ydym wedi gofyn am ymchwiliad i'r posibilrwydd hwnnw. Mae hynny'n gyson â'r hyn y mae pobl o fewn eich plaid eich hun wedi ei ddweud.

Edwina Hart: Mae rhai materion y bydd angen eu trafod yn Siambr y Cynulliad. Mae'n amlwg bod materion cyfreithiol a materion masnachol sensitif y mae'n rhaid imi ddiogelu sefyllfa'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â hwy. Bydd yr adroddiadau a'r gwaith papur sydd gennyf ar y materion hynny yn mynd at yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol ac ymdrinnir â hwy yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Bydd y nodiadau y byddaf yn eu dosbarthu yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, gobeithio, yn rhoi ymateb llawn i'r Arglwydd Rogers. Fel y nodais, trafodaf rai materion wedyn yn y Siambr ym mis Tachwedd pan fyddaf wedi cael y cyfle i asesu'r diddordeb a fynegwyd. Yr wyf am fod mor agored ac eglur â phosibl, ond rhaid imi fod yn ymwybodol iawn o fuddiant y Cynulliad yn nhermau gwybodaeth gyfreithiol a gwybodaeth fasnachol sensitif. Mae'n sefyllfa anodd i Weinidog.

9:40 a.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Do you share my concern about the need to ensure that Assembly Members are given as much information as possible regarding this project? It would also be to the Assembly's advantage if the Conservatives reconsidered their position in respect of the steering group, which discusses this matter. It would be to our advantage if they respected the legal position of the Assembly and protected it, as well as protecting the commercial sensitivity of those figures. Do you agree that they should accept those two factors? They would then be in full possession of the facts. Do you also agree that a war of words on this matter is not helpful to the Assembly's expressed aim of building this Assembly Chamber based on the Richard Rogers design, as close as possible to the cost agreed by the Assembly? Would it be to this Assembly's best advantage if the Richard Rogers Partnership submitted an expression of interest before the closing date next Wednesday, so that it can become part of the process by which this project is completed?

Edwina Hart: I have written to Lord Rogers and made it clear that it is open to him to respond to the *Official Journal of the European Communities* advertisement. I know that many Members are attached to the concept of the building design and feel that it is important that the architect who designed it should be involved in the final project. The door is open in that respect. It would be helpful—and I have previously made my views known on this—if the Welsh Conservative Party chose to be members of the steering group, which discusses these issues. However, politics comes above all else in this matter.

Dafydd Wigley: Notwithstanding commercial sensitivity, do you accept that the Assembly has every right to ask as many questions as necessary to establish the full reasons why a project that was heralded as costing £24 million might eventually cost in excess of £40 million? The Audit Committee has a valid role in turning over every stone to establish the veracity or otherwise of the statements made by yourself and the Richard

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder am yr angen i sicrhau y caiff Aelodau'r Cynulliad gymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl am y prosiect hwn? Byddai hefyd o fantais i'r Cynulliad pe bai'r Ceidwadwyr yn ailystyried eu hagwedd tuag at y grŵp llywio, sy'n trafod y mater hwn. Byddai o fantais inni pe baent yn parchu sefyllfa gyfreithiol y Cynulliad ac yn ei diogelu, yn ogystal â diogelu sensitifrwydd masnachol y ffigurau hynny. A gytunwch y dylent dderbyn y ddau ffactor hynny? Yna byddai ganddynt y ffeithiau i gyd. A gytunwch hefyd nad yw rhyfel eiriau ar y mater hwn o fudd i'r nod a fynegwyd gan y Cynulliad o adeiladu'r Siambr hon ar sail cynllun Richard Rogers, mor agos â phosibl at y gost y cytunwyd arni gan y Cynulliad? A fyddai o fantais i'r Cynulliad pe bai Partneriaeth Richard Rogers yn mynegi diddordeb cyn y dyddiad cau ddydd Mercher nesaf, fel y gall ddod yn rhan o'r broses ar gyfer cwblhau'r prosiect hwn?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at yr Arglwydd Rogers i egluro bod croeso iddo ymateb i'r hysbyseb yn yr *Official Journal of the European Communities*. Gwn fod llawer o'r Aelodau yn hoff iawn o gynllun yr adeilad ac o'r farn ei bod yn bwysig y dylai'r pensaer a'i cynlluniodd fod yn gysylltiedig â'r prosiect terfynol. Mae'r drws ar agor yn hynny o beth. Byddai o fudd—ac yr wyf wedi gwneud fy marn yn hysbys ar y mater hwn—pe bai Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn dewis bod yn aelodau o'r grŵp llywio, sy'n trafod y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae gwleidyddiaeth yn bwysicach na phopeth arall yn y mater hwn.

Dafydd Wigley: Er gwaethaf sensitifrwydd masnachol, a dderbyniwch fod gan y Cynulliad berffaith hawl i ofyn cymaint o gwestiynau ag sydd eu hangen er mwyn sefydlu'r rhesymau llawn pam y gallai prosiect y cyhoeddwyd y byddai'n costio £24 miliwn gostio mwy na £40 miliwn yn y pen draw? Mae gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio rôl ddilys wrth droi pob carreg er mwyn canfod gwirionedd neu anwiredd y datganiadau a

Rogers Partnership. Will you tell the Assembly where responsibility lies for overseeing this project? Does it lie purely with your department or does the buck stop with the First Minister and the Cabinet? What, if any, is the responsibility of the policy steering group in this matter?

Edwina Hart: As I said in my original answer, I welcome the involvement of the Audit Committee and the Auditor General for Wales. It is essential that we have definitive answers to the questions which Lord Rogers's statement has raised against the conduct and competence of the Assembly. An investigation by the National Audit Office is the best way of revealing the truth, which, I am confident, will demonstrate that the statements have been ill-founded. This issue, however, is complex. I would not be surprised if Sir John Bourn indicates in November that a fuller study is required. I would welcome that, because it is important that these matters are discussed openly and transparently in the Audit Committee.

The policy steering group has always had an advisory role. I have consulted it on key issues relating to the design and cost of the building. It has provided me with a welcome opportunity to take account of Members' views in making key decisions, enabling me to keep the parties that are involved up to date with progress. I have also been able to share information with it, which could not be placed in the public domain on commercial grounds.

As the Minister responsible, I have made the decisions. I make them on the basis of advice from officials and professional advisers. I make these decisions, not simply as the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities, but as the Minister responsible on behalf of the administration. I refer to the Cabinet's role in this. In July's Cabinet meeting minutes, the Cabinet supported the action that I was taking on conduct regarding the future of the building.

Ron Davies: Next time the Minister takes the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives by the

wnaethoch chi a Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers. A ddywedwch wrth y Cynulliad pwy sy'n gyfrifol am oruchwylio'r prosiect hwn? Ai eich adran chi yn unig sy'n gyfrifol neu ai Prif Weinidog Cymru a'r Cabinet sy'n gyfrifol yn y pen draw? Beth, os o gwbl, yw cyfrifoldeb y grŵp llywio polisi yn y mater hwn?

Edwina Hart: Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb gwreiddiol, croesawaf gyfranogiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio ac Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Mae'n hanfodol bod gennym atebion pendant i'r cwestiynau a godwyd yn natganiad yr Arglwydd Rogers yn erbyn ymddygiad a gallu'r Cynulliad. Ymchwiliad gan y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yw'r ffordd orau o ddatgelu'r gwirionedd, a fydd, yr wyf yn hyderus, yn dangos bod y datganiadau wedi bod yn ddi-sail. Mae'r mater hwn, fodd bynnag, yn gymhleth. Ni synnwn pe bai Syr John Bourn yn dweud ym mis Tachwedd bod angen astudiaeth lawnach. Byddwn yn croesawu hynny, gan ei bod yn bwysig trafod y materion hyn yn agored ac yn eglur yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

Bu gan y grŵp llywio polisi rôl ymgynghorol ers y cychwyn. Yr wyf wedi ymgynghori â'r grŵp ar faterion allweddol mewn perthynas â chynllun a chost yr adeilad. Mae wedi darparu cyfle imi ystyried barn yr Aelodau wrth wneud penderfyniadau allweddol, gan fy ngalluogi i roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am y cynnydd i'r pleidiau dan sylw, a chroesawaf hynny. Bu hefyd yn bosibl imi rannu gwybodaeth â'r grŵp, na ellid bod wedi ei chyhoeddi am resymau masnachol.

Fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol, fi sydd wedi gwneud y penderfyniadau. Fe'u gwnaf ar sail cyngor swyddogion ac ymgynghorwyr proffesiynol. Gwnaf y penderfyniadau hyn, nid fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn unig, ond fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol ar ran y weinyddiaeth. Cyfeiriaf at rôl y Cabinet yn hyn o beth. Yng nghofnodion cyfarfod y Cabinet ym mis Gorffennaf, cefnogodd y Cabinet y cam yr oeddwn yn ei gymryd o ran rheoli dyfodol yr adeilad.

Ron Davies: Y tro nesaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynnu gair cyfeillgar gydag Arweinydd

elbow for a friendly chat, will she remind him that, as most people welcome their change of mind on devolution, many people would also welcome a change of mind on the future of the new building? I was reassured by her answer to Cynog Dafis's question and the spirit in which she has addressed this matter. However, I want to press her on two issues. First, is she still committed to the vision, which was articulated by Jim Callaghan, when he announced the Richard Rogers' Partnership as the winning competitor in the design competition? Secondly, while I understand that she must try to ensure some degree of cost certainty as she takes the project forward, will she resist any compromise on the building's quality, either by ensuring that the design will not be modified unacceptably, or that she will not appoint an architect who is inferior or mediocre to the international, award-winning architect who originally designed the building?

Edwina Hart: I am committed to the building and its design. I wish to publicly state that I want to see the building that was envisaged in that design being built. I want to stop these discussions about whether or not we will build the building. It is essential to recognise that we must have this building, and we must start work as soon as possible, because we need a home for the National Assembly that is fit for this century and for the home of democracy. That is important.

I do not wish to compromise the design or quality. That would be wrong, as it would compromise the vision. I must counterbalance that with what the Assembly asked of me, in terms of the overall costs within which I must keep. My duty on this project has been, as the Minister for Finance, to look after the money. If there are further decisions to be made regarding the building, the National Assembly will decide on them. That is the correct place for such issues to be debated.

Glyn Davies: Minister, can you help me with something that is troubling me over this pretty little project? [*Laughter.*] Is laughter really the First Minister's response to the project? Such a project as this cannot proceed

Ceidwadwyr Cymru, a wnaiff ei atgoffa, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn croesawu'r ffaith iddynt newid eu hagwedd tuag at ddatganoli, y byddai llawer hefyd yn croesawu newid agwedd ar ddyfodol yr adeilad newydd? Tawelwyd fy meddwl gan ei hateb i gwestiwn Cynog Dafis a'r modd cadarnhaol y bu iddi ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am bwysu arni ar ddau fater. Yn gyntaf, a yw'n dal yn ymrwymedig i'r weledigaeth, a fynegwyd gan Jim Callaghan, pan gyhoeddodd mai Partneriaeth Richard Rogers oedd enillydd y gystadleuaeth gynllunio? Yn ail, er y deallaf fod yn rhaid iddi geisio gofalu bod rhywfaint o sicrwydd cost wrth iddi ddatblygu'r prosiect, a wnaiff wrthsefyll cyfaddawdu ar ansawdd yr adeilad, boed hynny drwy sicrhau nad addasir y cynllun mewn ffordd annerbyniol, neu na phenoda bensaer sy'n israddol neu'n gyffredin o'i gymharu â'r pensaer rhyngwladol a enillodd wobrwyon ac a gynlluniodd yr adeilad yn wreiddiol?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i'r adeilad a'i gynllun. Hoffwn ddatgan yn gyhoeddus fy mod am weld yr adeilad a welwyd yn y cynllun yn cael ei adeiladu. Yr wyf am ddod â'r trafodaethau hyn ynghylch pa un a adeiladwn yr adeilad ai peidio i ben. Mae'n hanfodol cydnabod bod yn rhaid inni gael yr adeilad hwn, a rhaid inni ddechrau ar y gwaith cyn gynted ag y bo modd, gan fod angen cartref ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol sy'n addas ar gyfer y ganrif hon ac ar gyfer cartref democratiaeth. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Nid wyf am gyfaddawdu ar y cynllun na'r ansawdd. Byddai hynny'n anghywir, gan y byddai'n cyfaddawdu'r weledigaeth. Rhaid imi wrthbwysu hynny â'r hyn y gofynnodd y Cynulliad imi ei wneud, o ran y costau cyffredinol y mae'n rhaid imi gadw o'u mewn. Fy nyletswydd ar y prosiect hwn, fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, yw gofalu am yr arian. Os oes penderfyniadau pellach i'w gwneud o ran yr adeilad, bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu arnynt. Dyna'r lle cywir i drafod materion o'r fath.

Glyn Davies: Weinidog, a allwch fy nghynorthwyo gyda rhywbeth sy'n fy mhoeni ynglŷn â'r prosiect bach del hwn? [*Chwerthin.*] Ai chwerthin yw ymateb Prif Weinidog Cymru i'r prosiect mewn

without the overwhelming support of the First Minister. There is an impression across Wales that the First Minister is riding for a fall. Can the Minister give us any indication, from her discussions with him, whether he is behind the project or not?

Edwina Hart: I refer you to the Cabinet discussion in the published minutes. They indicate that the Cabinet supported me in my decisions. The First Minister also supported me. We must understand that there have been long and hard battles over this building since the matter was first discussed. We all had views on City Hall and other matters, but there is now cross-party consensus, with certain exceptions, that we want the new building. We are not prepared to pay for it at any cost, but we want the vision of the new building. The First Minister shares that vision.

Y Llywydd: Dychwelwn yn awr at y cwestiynau a ohirwyd o'r sesiwn i goffâu Val Feld ar 19 Gorffennaf 2001.

gwirionedd? Ni all prosiect fel hwn fynd rhagddo heb gefnogaeth lwyr y Prif Weinidog. Ceir argraff ledled Cymru fod y Prif Weinidog yn gwahodd trychineb. A all y Gweinidog roi syniad inni, yn sgîl ei thrafodaethau ag ef, pa un ai a yw yn gefnogol i'r prosiect ai peidio?

Edwina Hart: Cyfeiriaf at drafodaeth y Cabinet yn y cofnodion a gyhoeddwyd. Dangosant fod y Cabinet wedi fy nghefnogi yn fy mhenderfyniadau. Fe'm cefnogwyd gan y Prif Weinidog hefyd. Rhaid inni ddeall i'r brwydro fod yn hir a chaled dros yr adeilad hwn ers i'r mater gael ei drafod gyntaf. Yr oedd gan bob un ohonom farn ar Neuadd y Ddinas a materion eraill, ond erbyn hyn ceir consensws trawsbleidiol, gydag ambell eithriad, ein bod eisiau'r adeilad newydd. Nid ydym yn barod i dalu swm di-ddiwedd o arian amdano, ond yr ydym eisiau gweledigaeth yr adeilad newydd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn rhannu'r weledigaeth honno.

The Presiding Officer: We now return to the questions that were postponed from the session to pay tribute to Val Feld on 19 July 2001.

Cwestiynau i Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru Dros Dro a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg

Questions to the Acting Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language

Creu Canolfannau Rhagoriaeth Mewn Chwaraeon Setting up Centres of Sporting Excellence

Q1 Brian Gibbons: Are there any plans to set up centres of sporting excellence in Wales, across a wide range of disciplines? (OAQ12725)

Acting Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson): Wales already has several centres of sporting excellence, at national and regional level, covering a wide range of sports. There are 42 centres of regional excellence, and over 170 centres of local development in Wales, which provide significantly enhanced coaching opportunities. The Sports Council for Wales has developed a set of criteria for prioritising

C1 Brian Gibbons: A oes unrhyw gynlluniau ar y gweill i greu canolfannau rhagoriaeth mewn chwaraeon yng Nghymru, mewn amrywiaeth eang o wahanol feysydd? (OAQ12725)

Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru Dros Dro a'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson): Mae gan Gymru sawl canolfan ragoriaeth mewn chwaraeon eisoes, ar lefel genedlaethol a rhanbarthol, sy'n cwmpasu amrywiaeth eang o chwaraeon. Ceir 42 o ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol, a thros 170 o ganolfannau a ddatblygwyd yn lleol yng Nghymru, sy'n darparu cyfleoedd hyfforddi gwell o lawer. Mae Cyngor

the specialist sports facilities needed by the governing bodies of sport. This now offers more flexible opportunities for partnership bids, so as to utilise Sportlot funding for new centres of sporting excellence.

Brian Gibbons: In developing centres of excellence, what role do you see for improving opportunities for women and for athletes with disability and linking these centres to educational establishments across Wales?

Jenny Randerson: There is a strong role for sport for women and people with disabilities. The Sports Council for Wales has strategies for developing both of those strands. I am working proactively with them to ensure enhanced opportunities.

In the near future, £48 million of new opportunities fund money will be available, and a great amount of that money will go towards providing sporting facilities in educational establishments. They will all pay attention to the special needs of disabled sportspeople.

Brian Hancock: Can you report on the status of the replacement for the Empire Pool that will be constructed in Swansea? Will it be of Olympic standard, with the correct number of lanes, and of the recommended dimension, with a separate deep diving pool so that athletes and swimmers can practise to Olympic standards? I hope that it will not, as I have been informed, have seven lanes, not eight, and only one pool?

Jenny Randerson: There will only be one pool. It was never suggested that there would be a diving pool. Regretfully, the lottery money available could not accommodate the considerable extra cost of a diving pool. In other respects the facilities will be of Olympic standard, to the best of my knowledge. However, I am not an expert on swimming and I will write to you giving the precise dimensions of the facilities being constructed.

Chwaraeon Cymru wedi datblygu cyfres o feini prawf ar gyfer blaenoriaethu'r cyfleusterau chwaraeon arbenigol sydd eu hangen ar gyrff rheoli chwaraeon. Mae hyn bellach yn cynnig cyfleoedd mwy hyblyg ar gyfer cynigion partneriaeth, fel y defnyddir arian Sportlot ar gyfer canolfannau rhagoriaeth newydd mewn chwaraeon.

Brian Gibbons: Wrth ddatblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth, pa rôl a welwch ar gyfer gwella cyfleoedd i ferched ac i athletwyr sydd ag anabledd a chysylltu'r canolfannau hyn â sefydliadau addysgol ledled Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Mae rôl gref i chwaraeon ar gyfer merched a phobl ag anableddau. Mae gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru strategaethau ar gyfer datblygu'r ddau faes hwn. Yr wyf yn cydweithio'n rhagweithiol â hwy i sicrhau cyfleoedd gwell.

Yn y dyfodol agos, bydd £48 miliwn o arian y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd ar gael, ac aiff llawer o'r arian hwnnw tuag at ddarparu cyfleusterau chwaraeon mewn sefydliadau addysgol. Byddant i gyd yn rhoi sylw i anghenion arbennig pobl anabl mewn chwaraeon.

Brian Hancock: A allwch roi adroddiad ar safon y pwll a gaiff ei adeiladu yn Abertawe yn lle Pwll yr Empire? A fydd o safon Olympaidd, gyda'r nifer cywir o lonydd, o'r dimensiwn a argymhellwyd, a phwll deifio dwfn ar wahân fel y gall athletwyr a nofwyr ymarfer yn ôl safonau Olympaidd? Gobeithiaf nad saith lôn fydd iddo, ond wyth, a dim un pwll yn unig, fel y cefais fy hysbysu?

Jenny Randerson: Dim ond un pwll fydd. Nid awgrymwyd erioed y byddai pwll deifio. Yn anffodus, nid oedd yr arian loteri a oedd ar gael yn ddigon i dalu cost sylweddol ychwanegol pwll deifio. O ran popeth arall bydd y cyfleusterau o safon Olympaidd, hyd y gwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn arbenigwraig ar nofio a byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch gydag union ddimensiynau'r cyfleusterau a adeileidir.

9:50 a.m.

Tom Middlehurst: Will you join me in congratulating Deeside College on its successful bid for funding for a first-class indoor athletics facility at the Connah's Quay campus, which will serve the needs of athletes throughout north and mid Wales?

Tom Middlehurst: A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Coleg Glannau Dyfrdwy ar ei gynnis llwyddiannus am arian ar gyfer cyfleuster athletau dan do o'r safon uchaf ar gampws Cei Conna, a fydd yn diwallu anghenion athletwyr ledled y Gogledd a'r Canolbarth?

Jenny Randerson: I am familiar with that excellent application and I was delighted to hear that it was successful. It is the start of a new flow of developments—I referred earlier to the possibilities offered by the £48 million of new opportunities fund money. That will enable north Wales to have a good range of sports facilities.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r cais ardderchog hwnnw ac yr oeddwn wrth fy modd i glywed ei fod yn llwyddiannus. Mae'n ddechrau llif newydd o ddatblygiadau—cyfeiriais yn gynharach at y posibilïadau a gynigir gan y £48 miliwn o arian y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd. Bydd hynny'n galluogi'r Gogledd i gael amrywiaeth dda o gyfleusterau chwaraeon.

Annog Pobl i Ymddiddori yn y Celfyddydau Encouraging People to take a Keen Interest in the Arts

Q2 John Griffiths: What further steps will be taken to encourage the people of Wales to take a keen interest in the arts in Wales? (OAQ12758)

C2 John Griffiths: Pa gamau pellach a gymerir i annog pobl Cymru i gymryd diddordeb byw yn y celfyddydau yng Nghymru? (OAQ12758)

Jenny Randerson: I want to ensure that the National Assembly's policies offer help and encouragement to enable people in all parts of Wales to enjoy the arts. My draft culture strategy is designed to achieve this objective: for example, abolishing entry fees to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales has made our national treasures freely accessible to all and has led to a record number of visitors to museum sites. Last week, I welcomed the millionth visitor to have visited since April. I was pleased that, on 10 November, it was announced in the draft budget that the Arts Council of Wales will receive a significant increase in funding for next year and in the indicative figures for the following two years.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf am sicrhau bod polisïau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn helpu ac yn annog pobl ym mhob cwr o Gymru i fwynhau'r celfyddydau. Mae fy strategaeth ddiwylliant ddrafft wedi'i chynllunio i gyflawni'r amcan hwn: er enghraifft, ers diddymu ffioedd mynediad i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru mae pawb yn gallu gweld ein trysorau cenedlaethol am ddim ac yn sgîl hynny bu'r nifer fwyaf erioed o bobl yn ymweld â'r amgueddfeydd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, croesewais y miliynfed ymwelydd ers mis Ebrill. Yr oeddwn yn falch y cyhoeddwyd ar 10 Tachwedd yn y gyllideb ddrafft y bydd Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn cael cynnydd sylweddol yn ei gyllid ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf ac yn y ffigurau dynodol ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd ganlynol.

John Griffiths: Free entry has been a fantastic success, and I applaud it. Far too many people are given little or no opportunity to develop their talents in education, music, sport and art. Will you outline your strategy to encourage and facilitate active participation in the arts by Wales's disadvantaged communities?

John Griffiths: Bu mynediad am ddim yn llwyddiant gwych, ac fe'i canmolaf. Mae llawer gormod o bobl na chânt fawr o gyfle neu ddim cyfle i ddatblygu eu doniau ym maes addysg, cerddoriaeth, chwaraeon a chelf. A wnewch amlinellu eich strategaeth i annog y cymunedau yng Nghymru sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf i gymryd rhan frwd yn

y celfyddydau a hwyluso hynny?

Jenny Randerson: That is a strong theme in the strategy. We are examining funding for young people and arts related to cultural diversity in particular. There is a strong emphasis on community involvement. The strategy will be presented to the Culture Committee towards the end of November, and will probably be published early next year.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you agree that we need to do more to market arts practitioners throughout Wales who develop their work through the medium of Welsh? Do you also agree that Harold Carter's comment in the Culture Committee yesterday that 'to be Welsh is to speak Welsh' does nothing to help us in that process?

Jenny Randerson: I strongly disagreed with Harold Carter's comments yesterday, as did every Committee member, I think. I regret that the Committee was used as a platform for such views. However, developing Welsh-medium cultural activity is important. I regret that such comments tend to polarise opinion, when we should be concentrating on developing the Welsh language and Welsh cultural activity.

Owen John Thomas: Mae'n bwysig cynnig esiamplau i bobl ifanc o bobl y gallent eu hedmygu a'u hefelychu ac i noddi mannau lle y gallent weld eu heilunod yn perfformio. Mae Cymru yn gyfoethog mewn doniau cerddoriaeth bop a gallai Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru gynnig llwyfan i rai o'n perfformwyr gorau. A gawn benderfyniad cyn hir o blaid codi'r ganolfan?

Jenny Randerson: I agree with your comments about the need for a stage for young people and the culture in which they are interested and which they support. In relation to the Wales Millennium Centre, I believe that we will be able to make an announcement in November. I will take this opportunity to update Members. During the summer, I and my ministerial colleagues had extensive discussions with Sir David Rowe-

Jenny Randerson: Mae hynny'n thema gref yn y strategaeth. Yr ydym yn archwilio sut yr ariennir pobl ifanc a'r celfyddydau mewn perthynas ag amrywiaeth diwylliannol yn benodol. Ceir pwyslais cryf ar gymunedau yn cymryd rhan. Caiff y strategaeth ei chyflwyno i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant tua diwedd Tachwedd, ac mae'n debygol o gael ei chyhoeddi ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Jonathan Morgan: A gytunwch fod angen inni wneud mwy yng Nghymru i farchnata pobl sy'n ymhél â'r celfyddydau ledled Cymru sy'n datblygu eu gwaith drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? A gytunwch hefyd nad yw sylwadau Harold Carter yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ddoe, 'er mwyn bod yn Gymro, rhaid siarad Cymraeg', yn ein helpu o gwbl yn y broses honno?

Jenny Randerson: Anghytunais yn gryf â sylwadau Harold Carter ddoe a chredaf fod pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor yn anghytuno ag ef hefyd. Gresynaf wrth y ffaith i'r Pwyllgor gael ei ddefnyddio fel llwyfan ar gyfer barn o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, mae datblygu gweithgareddau diwylliannol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn bwysig. Gresynaf wrth y ffaith bod sylwadau o'r fath yn tueddu i garfanu barn, pan ddylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar ddatblygu gweithgareddau diwylliannol Cymraeg a Chymreig.

Owen John Thomas: It is important to offer examples to young people of people whom they can admire and emulate and to sponsor venues where they can see their heroes perform. Wales is rich in pop music talent and the Wales Millennium Centre could offer a platform for some of our best performers. Will we have a decision before long in favour of building the centre?

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau am yr angen am lwyfan i bobl ifanc a'r diwylliant y maent yn ymddiddori ynddo ac y maent yn ei gefnogi. O ran Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, credaf y byddwn mewn sefyllfa i wneud cyhoeddiad ym mis Tachwedd. Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau. Yn ystod yr haf, cafodd fy nghyd-Weinidogion a mi drafodaethau helaeth â Syr David Rowe-

Beddoe. He explained that it was necessary for the project to have a clear view of the funding package so that he could negotiate effectively with the project's construction partner, Sir Robert McAlpine, to establish a fixed price for the construction contract. We agreed with Sir David that the Assembly would set aside up to £37 million for the project, should it be required. That was in line with the statement made by the Minister for Finance in April. The figure of £37 million includes the £8 million already provided. In making that statement, we made it clear that the sum of £37 million represented the absolute limit of Assembly support. The project is now equipped with the right skills and experience for it to deal effectively with the construction and subsequent phases of the project. I look forward to the outcome of the current negotiations, which I expect to be known in November.

Beddoe. Eglurodd ef fod angen i'r pecyn ariannu ar gyfer y prosiect fod yn glir fel y gallai negodi â phartner adeiladu'r prosiect, Syr Robert McAlpine, yn effeithiol, er mwyn penderfynu ar bris penodedig ar gyfer y contract adeiladu. Bu inni gytuno â Syr David y byddai'r Cynulliad yn neilltuo hyd at £37 miliwn ar gyfer y prosiect, yn ôl yr angen. Yr oedd hynny'n gyson â'r datganiad a wnaeth y Gweinidog dros Gyllid yn Ebrill. Mae'r ffigur o £37 miliwn yn cynnwys yr £8 miliwn a ddarparwyd eisoes. Wrth wneud y datganiad hwnnw, eglurwyd mai £37 miliwn fyddai'r cymorth mwyaf posibl gan y Cynulliad. Mae gan y prosiect bellach y sgiliau a'r profiad cywir iddo ddelio'n effeithiol â'r gwaith adeiladu a chamau dilynol y prosiect. Edrychaf ymlaen at ganlyniad y negodiadau presennol, y disgwyliaf iddo fod yn hysbys ym mis Tachwedd.

Annog Pobl Ifanc i Gymryd Rhan Mewn Gweithgareddau Celfyddydol Encouraging the Participation of Young People in the Arts in Wales

C3 Gareth Jones: Beth fydd y strategaeth ddiwylliant yn ei gwneud i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau celfyddydol yng Nghymru? (OAQ12792)

Jenny Randerson: As you know, Gareth, I believe firmly in the benefit of arts for everyone. The draft strategy recognises the importance of engaging young people in the arts and providing them with opportunities to participate in arts and music activities.

Gareth Jones: Un o'r problemau sy'n wynebu grwpiau celfyddydol sy'n derbyn arian gan y loteri yw eu bod yn ei dderbyn am flwyddyn yn unig, sydd yn cyfyngu ar sgôp eu gwaith. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sefydlu cronfa celfyddyd i bobl ifanc, a fyddai'n galluogi grwpiau o'r fath i gynllunio'n well wrth geisio datblygu talentau pobl ifanc yng Nghymru?

Jenny Randerson: There are several strands to that question. We should be able to establish an arts fund for young people and I am discussing that with the Arts Council of Wales. The increase in the arts council's budget next year should enable progress to be

Q3 Gareth Jones: What will the culture strategy do to encourage the participation of young people in the arts in Wales? (OAQ12792)

Jenny Randerson: Fel y gwyddoch, Gareth, credaf yn gryf y gall y celfyddydau fod o fudd i bawb. Mae'r strategaeth ddrafft yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc eu cynnwys yn y celfyddydau gan roi cyfleoedd iddynt gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau celfyddydol a cherddorol.

Gareth Jones: One problem facing arts groups that receive lottery funding, is that they only receive it for a year, which limits the scope of their work. Will the Minister establish an arts fund for young people, which would allow such groups to better plan their work of striving to develop the talents of young people in Wales?

Jenny Randerson: Mae nifer o agweddau ar y cwestiwn hwnnw. Dylem allu sefydlu cronfa celfyddyd i bobl ifanc ac yr wyf yn trafod hynny gyda Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Dylai'r cynnydd yng nghyllideb cyngor y celfyddydau y flwyddyn nesaf

made on that.

Eleanor Burnham: A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym pa gefnogaeth fydd y Cynulliad yn ei rhoi i sicrhau parhad llwyddiant Urdd Gobaith Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: I am aware that Urdd Gobaith Cymru has had a difficult time as a result of foot and mouth disease. We were pleased to provide financial support earlier in the year to enable the organisation to continue. The budget for the coming year includes the welcome addition of approximately £250,000 towards the redevelopment of the Urdd Gobaith Cymru site at Glan-llyn.

Alun Cairns: A ydych yn derbyn bod gennych gyfrifoldeb dros sicrhau llwyddiant yr Urdd eleni, wedi i eisteddfod y mudiad gael ei chanslo y llynedd? O gofio'r gefnogaeth a roddwyd i'r mudiad yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y momentwm yn parhau.

Jenny Randerson: Yes. I am hopeful that this year will be particularly successful, because we have been waiting two years for the Urdd National Eisteddfod, that will be held in Cardiff next summer, to be held here.

sicrhau y gellir symud ymlaen o ran hynny.

Eleanor Burnham: Will you tell us what support the Assembly will provide to ensure the continued success of Urdd Gobaith Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod Urdd Gobaith Cymru wedi cael cyfnod anodd o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr oedd yn bleser gennym roi cymorth ariannol yn gynharach yn y flwyddyn i alluogi'r sefydliad i barhau. Mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf yn cynnwys tua £250,000 o arian ychwanegol tuag at y gwaith o ailddatblygu canolfan Urdd Gobaith Cymru yng Nglanllyn a rhaid croesawu hynny.

Alun Cairns: Do you accept that you have a responsibility to ensure the Urdd's success this year, following the cancellation of the organisation's eisteddfod last year? Given the support that the organisation has received in recent years, we must ensure that the momentum is maintained.

Jenny Randerson: Ydwyf. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Eisteddfod eleni yn arbennig o lwyddiannus, oherwydd yr ydym wedi bod yn aros ers dwy flynedd i Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yr Urdd gael ei chynnal yng Nghaerdydd, a fydd yn digwydd yr haf nesaf.

10:00 a.m.

Derbyn Darllediadau Lloeren Digidol Access to Digital Satellite Broadcasting

Q4 Peter Rogers: What plans does the Minister have to promote access to digital satellite broadcasting in Wales? (OAQ12797)

Jenny Randerson: Broadcasting is not a devolved matter, therefore we do not have initiatives on this matter. To receive Sky Digital, properties must have a line of sight to the Astra 2 satellite. Over 90 per cent of properties in the UK are thought to have such a line of sight. Across the UK, as at 30 June 2001, there were 5.3 million subscribers to Sky Digital. I strongly support the need to secure access to digital services in Wales before analogue services are switched off. I

C4 Peter Rogers: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i hyrwyddo'r gallu i dderbyn darllediadau lloeren digidol yng Nghymru? (OAQ12797)

Jenny Randerson: Nid yw darlledu yn fater datganoledig ac felly nid oes mentrau gennym ar y mater hwn. Er mwyn derbyn Sky Digital, rhaid bod gan adeiladau linell golwg syth tuag at y lloeren Astra 2. Credir bod gan fwy na 90 y cant o adeiladau yng Nghymru linell golwg o'r fath. Ledled y DU, ar 30 Mehefin 2001, yr oedd 5.3 miliwn o bobl yn tanysgrifio i Sky Digital. Cefnogaf yn gryf yr angen i sicrhau bod pobl yng Nghymru yn gallu derbyn gwasanaethau

reiterated that point when I met Kim Howells, the UK Minister for Tourism, Film and Broadcasting, in July.

Peter Rogers: Will you consider a campaign to promote the fact that S4C2 carries live transmissions of Assembly proceedings? Do you agree that wider access to this service will help promote the Assembly's work?

Jenny Randerson: I agree that one problem faced by the Assembly, which we faced during the Assembly referendum in promoting the idea of an Assembly, is that people in Wales do not have sufficient access to Welsh television to be aware of the important topics and issues in Welsh politics. The Assembly, and what it does, is an important part of that. Therefore, I would strongly encourage any such initiative. You have my commitment that I will pursue these matters with the UK Government to ensure that we have good access to digital and analogue services.

Dafydd Wigley: Beth bynnag yw rhinweddau S4C2, ac efallai mai mater i bobl eraill ei feiriadu yw hynny, tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith bod gwasanaeth S4C1 ar deledu digidol yn sylweddol, gydag oriau mwy niferus na'r rhai sydd ar y gwasanaeth daearol. Mae'r gwasanaeth digidol yn bwysig i siaradwyr Cymraeg, a'r rhai sydd yn deall Cymraeg, ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Yn y cyddestun hwnnw, a ydych wedi cael trafodaethau gydag S4C i weld pa gamau y gellid eu cymryd ar fyrder i wneud y gwasanaeth hwn ar gael i bawb yng Nghymru?

Jenny Randerson: When we were considering our response to the British Government's White Paper on communications, I discussed this issue with S4C. I have a meeting scheduled with S4C in the next month or two and I will take that issue up again.

digidol cyn i wasanaethau analog gael eu diffodd. Pwysleisiais y pwynt hwnnw pan gyfarfûm â Kim Howells, Gweinidog y DU dros Dwristiaeth, y Diwydiant Ffilm a Darlledu, ym mis Gorffennaf.

Peter Rogers: A ystyriwch gynnal ymgyrch i hyrwyddo'r ffaith bod S4C2 yn darlledu trafodion y Cynulliad yn fyw? A gytunwch y bydd mynediad ehangach i'r gwasanaeth hwn yn helpu i hyrwyddo gwaith y Cynulliad?

Jenny Randerson: Cytunaf mai un o'r problemau a wyneba'r Cynulliad, ac y bu inni ei wynebu yn ystod y refferendwm ar gyfer y Cynulliad wrth hyrwyddo'r syniad o Gynulliad, yw nad oes modd i bobl Cymru dderbyn digon o deledu Cymreig i fod yn ymwybodol o'r pynciau a'r materion sydd o bwys yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Mae'r Cynulliad, a'r hyn a wna, yn rhan bwysig o hynny. Felly, byddwn yn annog unrhyw fenter o'r fath yn frwd. Yr wyf yn ymrwymo i fynd ar drywydd y materion hyn gyda Llywodraeth y DU er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym fynediad da i wasanaethau digidol ac analog.

Dafydd Wigley: Whatever the virtues of S4C2 may be, and that is perhaps a matter for others to judge, I draw your attention to the fact that the S4C1 service on digital television is comprehensive, with more hours than those on the terrestrial service. The digital service is important for Welsh speakers, and those who understand Welsh, in all parts of Wales. In that context, have you had discussions with S4C to see what steps could be taken in the short term to make this service available to everyone in Wales?

Jenny Randerson: Pan oeddem yn ystyried ein hymateb i Bapur Gwyn Llywodraeth Prydain ar gysylltiadau, trafodais y mater hwn gyda S4C. Yr wyf wedi trefnu cyfarfod gyda S4C yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf a byddaf yn codi'r mater hwnnw eto.

Strategaeth Gynhwysfawr ar Gyfer y Celfyddydau Gweledol A Comprehensive Visual Arts Strategy

C5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A yw'r **Q5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Has the Minister

Gweinidog wedi ystyried creu strategaeth gynhwysfawr ar gyfer y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru? (OAQ12789)

Jenny Randerson: The draft culture strategy will provide a framework for the future, and set priorities for the cultural Assembly sponsored public bodies, including the Arts Council of Wales. The visual arts are an essential component of that strategy in developing excellence and accessibility and promoting Wales and its image abroad. I plan to take the draft strategy to Committee on 21 November for the second time.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A gytunwch fod angen canolfan ar gyfer y celfyddydau gweledol ym mhrifddinas Cymru? A ydych wedi cynnal trafodaethau gydag Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd er mwyn sicrhau canolfan o'r fath i'r brifddinas?

Jenny Randerson: The need for centres for the visual arts throughout Wales is currently being discussed and consulted on publicly by the National Museums and Galleries of Wales. Discussions on the Centre for Visual Arts in Cardiff, which closed a few days after I took office as Minister, took place some months ago. Cardiff is currently considering it in relation to its city of culture bid, as you know, Rhodri.

Mick Bates: We have a world-class collection of paintings in Wales, which is held in Cardiff. What plans do you have to ensure that these paintings can be shown throughout Wales, particularly in mid Wales?

Jenny Randerson: I understand the need to ensure that more paintings, especially those from the National Museum, are put on display. As I have just said, as part of the ongoing consultation, a public consultation will probably start in November or December. In addition, all Assembly Members were invited to discuss this issue in early July. I am conscious of the need for these paintings to be seen by the public. I am developing a pilot project for a series of

considered creating a comprehensive visual arts strategy for Wales? (OAQ12789)

Jenny Randerson: Bydd y strategaeth ddiwylliant ddrafft yn gosod fframwaith ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac yn pennu blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y cyrff cyhoeddus diwylliannol a noddir gan y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Mae'r celfyddydau gweledol yn elfen hanfodol o'r strategaeth honno wrth ddatblygu rhagoriaeth a hygyrchedd ac wrth hyrwyddo Cymru a'i delwedd dramor. Bwriadaf gyflwyno'r strategaeth ddrafft am yr ail dro i'r Pwyllgor ar 21 Tachwedd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do you agree that we need a centre for the visual arts in Wales's capital city? Have you held discussions with the Lord Mayor of Cardiff on securing such a centre for the capital city?

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r angen am ganolfannau ar gyfer y celfyddydau gweledol ledled Cymru yn cael ei drafod ar hyn o bryd ac mae Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd ynglŷn â hyn. Cynhaliwyd trafodaethau ar Ganolfan y Celfyddydau Gweledol yng Nghaerdydd, a gaeodd ychydig o ddiwrnodau ar ôl imi ddechrau yn fy swydd fel Gweinidog, rai misoedd yn ôl. Mae Caerdydd yn ystyried y mater ar hyn o bryd mewn perthynas â'i chais i fod yn ddinas ddiwylliant, fel y gwyddoch, Rhodri.

Mick Bates: Mae gennym gasgliad o luniau o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru, a gedwir yng Nghaerdydd. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau y gellir arddangos y lluniau hyn ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn y Canolbarth?

Jenny Randerson: Deallaf yr angen i sicrhau y caiff mwy o luniau, yn enwedig lluniau o'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol, eu harddangos. Fel y dywedais yn awr, fel rhan o broses ymgynghorol barhaus, mae'n debyg y bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn dechrau ym mis Tachwedd neu Ragfyr. Yn ogystal, gwahoddwyd pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad i drafod y mater hwn ar ddechrau Gorffennaf. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod angen arddangos y lluniau hyn i'r cyhoedd. Yr wyf wrthi'n

partner galleries to the National Museums and Galleries of Wales to ensure that its treasures are not just available to the people of Cardiff.

datblygu prosiect peilot ar gyfer cyfres o orielau partner i Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru i sicrhau nad pobl Caerdydd yn unig sy'n gweld ei drysorau.

Hyrwyddo Ysgrifennu Newydd yng Nghymru Promoting New Writing in Wales

C6 Elin Jones: Pa gamau y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi'u cymryd i hyrwyddo ysgrifennu newydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ12784)

Q6 Elin Jones: What progress has the National Assembly made in promoting new writing in Wales? (OAQ12784)

Jenny Randerson: The National Assembly, via the Welsh Language Board, provides a publishing grant to the Welsh Books Council, which the council then distributes to support the publication of books, magazines and other materials in Welsh. In 2000-01, we provided a grant of £624,000, which was used to support the publication of 220 books, 149 of which were original works. The Arts Council of Wales also supports a wide range of literary activity through grants to organisations such as Academi to provide support and information to its members.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwy Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, yn rhoi grant cyhoeddi i Gyngor Llyfrau Cymru, y mae'r cyngor wedyn yn ei ddsbarthu i gefnogi'r gwaith o gyhoeddi llyfrau, cylchgronau a deunyddiau eraill yn Gymraeg. Yn 2000-01, rhoddwyd grant o £624,000, a ddefnyddiwyd i ariannu'r gwaith o gyhoeddi 220 o lyfrau, yr oedd 149 ohonynt yn weithiau gwreiddiol. Mae Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru hefyd yn cefnogi amrywiaeth eang o weithgareddau llenyddol drwy grantiau i sefydliadau megis yr Academi i roi cymorth a gwybodaeth i'w haelodau.

Elin Jones: Yr oedd nifer o gyfeiriadau positif a phwysig at hybu awduron ac ysgrifennu newydd yn 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Er hynny, nid oedd cyfeiriad at ysgrifennu newydd yn eich strategaeth diwylliant, y dechreuodd yr ymgynghoriad arni yn yr haf. A ydych, fel Gweinidog, yn cefnu ar eich cefnogaeth ar gyfer hybu a chynyddu ysgrifennu newydd?

Elin Jones: There were a number of positive and important references to promoting new authors and new writing in 'A Culture in Common'. However, there was no reference to new writing in your culture strategy, which went out to consultation in the summer. Are you, as Minister, abandoning your support for promoting and increasing new writing?

Jenny Randerson: Certainly not. The current draft of the strategy has developed beyond what was originally stated. The considerable additional funding for the Welsh Books Council in next year's budget is an example of my commitment to new writing.

Jenny Randerson: Nac ydwyf, yn bendant. Mae drafft presennol y strategaeth wedi datblygu y tu hwnt i'r hyn a nodwyd yn wreiddiol. Mae'r arian ychwanegol sylweddol ar gyfer Cyngor Llyfrau Cymru yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf yn enghraifft o'm hymrwymiad i ysgrifennu newydd.

David Davies: What consideration will the Minister give to funding a book on the history of British Legion and working men's clubs in Wales, most of which will close immediately if her opposite number in Westminster implements the Gambling Review Body's recommendations on fruit

David Davies: Pa ystyriaeth y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei rhoi i ariannu llyfr am hanes y Llenng Brydeinig a chlybiau gweithwyr yng Nghymru, y bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn cau yn syth os bydd ffigwr cyfatebol y Gweinidog yn San Steffan yn gweithredu argymhellion y Corff Adolygu Gamblo ar

machines?

beiriannau gamblo?

The Presiding Officer: Order. You get an A minus for effort, but the question was not in order.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Rhoddaf A minws ichi am eich ymdrech, ond nid oedd y cwestiwn mewn trefn.

Codi Proffil Celfyddydol Canol De Cymru Enhancing the Cultural Profile of South Wales Central

Q7 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the Liberal Democrat/Labour administration's plans to enhance the cultural profile of South Wales Central? (OAQ12686)

C7 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynlluniau Gweinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/y Blaid Lafur i godi proffil celfyddydol Canol De Cymru? (OAQ12686)

Jenny Randerson: I apologise, but my notes state that that question was transferred for written answer. Please give me a minute while I find my brief. I believe that you requested a written reply to that question back in July, David.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond yn ôl fy nodiadau trosglwyddwyd y cwestiwn hwn ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig. A fydech crystal â rhoi munud imi ddod o hyd i'm briff? Credaf ichi ofyn am ateb ysgrifenedig i'r cwestiwn hwnnw ym mis Gorffennaf, David.

David Davies: You should have answered my question then.

David Davies: Dylech fod wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn i felly.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The reason why your question was not answered, David, was because the Chair decided that it was not relevant and therefore not in order. That brings question time, therefore, to a close. If question 7 has already been answered in written form, it cannot be answered again, however excellent it may be.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Y rheswm pam nad atebwyd eich cwestiwn, David, oedd bod y Cadeirydd wedi penderfynu nad oedd yn berthnasol ac felly nad oedd mewn trefn. Dyna ddiwedd y cwestiynau, felly. Os atebwyd cwestiwn 7 eisoes ar ffurf ysgrifenedig, ni ellir ei ateb eto, pa mor ardderchog bynnag ydyw'r cwestiwn.

Jenny Randerson: I am happy to answer the question now.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn fodlon ateb y cwestiwn yn awr.

The Presiding Officer: If the Minister is prepared to answer it, then we will proceed.

Y Llywydd: Os yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon ei ateb, yna symudwn ymlaen.

Jenny Randerson: The proposals in my draft culture strategy will boost culture in South Wales Central. In particular, since many National Museums and Galleries of Wales sites are located in that constituency, the vast increase in visitors to those sites has been an important cultural boost.

Janny Randerson: Bydd y cynigion a geir yn fy strategaeth ddiwylliant ddrafft yn hybu diwylliant yng Nghanol De Cymru. Yn benodol, gan fod llawer o Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi'u lleoli yn yr etholaeth honno, bu'r cynnydd enfawr yn nifer yr ymwelwyr â'r safleoedd hynny yn hwb diwylliannol pwysig.

David Melding: You may know that Edinburgh has a national gallery and a national portrait gallery. There is a great appetite for visual art in Wales. Could we not develop on that appetite for visual art, which

David Melding: Efallai eich bod yn gwybod bod gan Gaeredin oriel genedlaethol ac oriel bortreadau genedlaethol. Mae llawer o frwdfrydedd dros y celfyddydau gweledol yng Nghymru. Onid allem ddatblygu'r

includes photographic art, and establish a national gallery and, perhaps, a national portrait gallery in Cardiff, with satellite centres across Wales?

Jenny Randerson: I share that appetite for the visual arts. I have visited the galleries in Edinburgh and enjoyed them very much. I suggest that you visit the National Gallery in Cardiff—certainly now that entry is free—so that you can enjoy the vast number of pictures on display. I share the view that there is room for expansion. That is why I have asked the National Museum and Gallery of Wales to consult on establishing another national gallery, a separate national gallery or a series of galleries throughout Wales. The permutations are endless. I am sorry that you were not present to express your point of view when it came to the Assembly to discuss the issue.

10:10 a.m.

Peter Law: What is the Minister doing to project cultural opportunities into deprived areas, such as my community? Many areas in Wales are regarded as cultural deserts because of the lack of support that they receive from the arts council. How can she justify supporting another £25 million for a Wales Millennium Centre project on which we have not yet voted, when last year the arts council spent only £200,000 in Blaenau Gwent? Will she give us a chance to vote on the millennium centre?

Jenny Randerson: An opportunity for such a vote was offered, but unfortunately had to be withdrawn when we cancelled business following Val Feld's sad death. I will certainly compare arts council funding in Blaenau Gwent with that in other areas and will write to you on the matter. The arts council funds a significant number of projects that should be accessible to the people of Blaenau Gwent. However, I will ask it why it may receive fewer applications from that area and whether it has rejected any such applications.

brwdfrydedd hwnnw, sy'n cynnwys celfyddyd ffotograffig, gan sefydlu oriel genedlaethol ac, efallai, oriel bortreadau genedlaethol yng Nghymru, gydag is-ganolfannau ledled Cymru?

Jenny Randerson: Rhannaf y brwdfrydedd hwnnw dros y celfyddydau gweledol. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â'r orielau yng Nghaeredin ac wedi eu mwynhau'n fawr. Awgrymaf eich bod yn ymweld â'r Oriol Genedlaethol yng Nghaerdydd—yn sicr gan fod mynediad bellach am ddim—fel y gallwch fwynhau'r nifer fawr o luniau a arddangosir. Yr wyf yn cytuno bod lle i ehangu. Dyna pam fy mod wedi gofyn i Amgueddfa ac Oriol Genedlaethol Cymru ymgynghori ar sefydlu oriel genedlaethol arall, oriel genedlaethol ar wahân neu gyfres o orielau ledled Cymru. Mae'r opsiynau yn ddiiddiwedd. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oeddech yn bresennol i leisio eich barn pan ddaeth i'r Cynulliad i drafod y mater.

Peter Law: Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hybu cyfleoedd diwylliannol mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, megis fy nghymuned i? Caiff llawer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru eu hystyried yn anialwch diwylliannol oherwydd y diffyg cymorth a gânt gan gyngor y celfyddydau. Sut y gall gyfiawnhau cefnogi rhoi £25 miliwn arall ar gyfer prosiect Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru nad ydym wedi pleidleisio arno eto, ar ôl i gyngor y celfyddydau wario £200,000 yn unig ym Mlaenau Gwent y llynedd? A rydd gyfle inni bleidleisio ar ganolfan y mileniwm?

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiwyd cyfle am bleidlais o'r fath, ond yn anffodus, bu'n rhaid ei dynnu'n ôl pan ohiriwyd busnes ar ôl marwolaeth drist Val Feld. Byddaf yn sicr yn cymharu'r arian a roddwyd gan gyngor y celfyddydau i Flaenau Gwent â'r arian a roddwyd i ardaloedd eraill ac ysgrifennaf atoch ar y mater. Mae cyngor y celfyddydau yn ariannu nifer sylweddol o brosiectau a ddylai fod yn hygyrch i bobl Blaenau Gwent. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn gofyn i'r cyngor pam ei fod yn cael llai o geisiadau o bosibl o'r ardal honno ac a yw wedi gwrthod unrhyw geisiadau o'r fath.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs

Marchnata Cig Oen Cymru Marketing of Welsh Lamb

Q1 Peter Black: What discussions has the Minister had with the Meat and Livestock Commission to improve the marketing of Welsh lamb? (OAQ12717)

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I have had several meetings with the MLC and the MLC's Welsh Council about the marketing of Welsh lamb. In May, I met Peter Barr, who had just been appointed chairman of the MLC, and other representatives to discuss market recovery following the outbreak of foot and mouth disease—in particular, marketing lightweight lambs. I also met other officials of the MLC when I visited the Anuga food fair in Cologne a week ago last Sunday.

Peter Black: The marketing of Welsh lamb cannot have been helped by the fiasco over the testing of sheep brains for BSE. If the Government in London cannot handle the process, should not we in Wales take full control of animal health?

Carwyn Jones: There are two issues: first, whether we should have testing facilities of our own. That would cost us a great deal; we should remember that the Republic of Ireland also uses the testing facilities available in Britain, especially Pirbright. Secondly, it is my view, the view of the Cabinet and that of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee that we should pursue further devolution of animal health powers to the National Assembly. It is an anomaly of the devolution settlement that the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs has responsibility but not staff in Wales, while we have staff but not responsibility. That must be ironed out.

Jocelyn Davies: In July, you promised to propose what you described as imaginative ideas for the disposal of surplus lamb by the autumn. Will you share those ideas with us today?

C1 Peter Black: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw i wella'r ffordd y mae cig oen Cymru yn cael ei farchnata? (OAQ12717)

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones): Cefais nifer o gyfarfodydd â'r Comisiwn Cig Oen a Da Byw a Chyngor Cymru'r Comisiwn am farchnata cig oen Cymru. Ym Mai, cyfarfûm â Peter Barr, a oedd newydd ei benodi'n gadeirydd y Comisiwn, a chynrychiolwyr eraill i drafod y broses o adfer y farchnad yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau—yn arbennig, marchnata wŷn ysgafn. Cyfarfûm â swyddogion eraill y Comisiwn pan ymwelais â ffair fwyd Anuga yng Nghwlen wythnos i ddydd Sul diwethaf.

Peter Black: Ni all y sefyllfa warthus ynglŷn â'r profion ar ymenyddiau defaid ar gyfer BSE fod wedi helpu'r broses o farchnata cig oen Cymru. Os na all y Llywodraeth yn Llundain reoli'r broses, oni ddylem ni yng Nghymru reoli iechyd anifeiliaid yn llwyr?

Carwyn Jones: Mae dau fater dan sylw: yn gyntaf, a ddylem gyflwyno cyfleusterau profi ein hunain. Byddai hynny'n gostus iawn; dylem gofio bod Gweriniaeth Iwerddon hefyd yn defnyddio'r cyfleusterau profi ym Mhrydain, yn enwedig Pirbright. Yn ail, yn fy marn i, ym marn y Cabinet ac ym marn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, dylem barhau i ystyried datganoli pwerau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ym maes iechyd anifeiliaid. Un o anghysonderau'r setliad datganoli yw mai Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig sy'n gyfrifol am y mater er nad oes ganddi staff yng Nghymru, tra bod gennym ni staff ond dim cyfrifoldeb. Rhaid datrys yr anghysonder hwnnw.

Jocelyn Davies: Ym mis Gorffennaf, gwnaethoch addo cynnig yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gennych yn syniadau creadigol o ran gwaredu wŷn dros ben erbyn yr hydref. A wnewch rannu'r syniadau hynny gyda ni

heddiw?

Carwyn Jones: We only have 5,000 surplus lambs for disposal. Therefore, the issue has not yet arisen.

Carwyn Jones: Dim ond 5,000 o ŵyn dros ben sydd gennym i'w gwaredu. Felly, nid yw'r mater wedi codi eto.

Alun Pugh: I certainly agree that lamb is better eaten than dumped in landfill, but do you recognise the genuine concern of the people of Llanddulas about the current management of the tips there?

Alun Pugh: Yn sicr, cytunaf ei bod yn well bwyta cig oen na'i waredu mewn safleoedd tirlenwi, ond a ydych yn cydnabod gwir bryder trigolion Llanddulas ynglŷn â'r ffordd bresennol o reoli'r tomenni sbwriel yno?

Carwyn Jones: The management of the tips at Llanddulas, and of all landfill sites in Wales, is not a matter for me or, in many respects, for the National Assembly. We believed that we would have to dispose of about 900,000 light lambs during the past month or so. The light lamb welfare disposal scheme closes tomorrow. At present only 5,000 lambs remain to be disposed of in the sites already used—far fewer than we thought.

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw'r ffordd y caiff tomenni sbwriel yn Llanddulas, a phob safle tirlenwi yng Nghymru eu rheoli, yn fater i mi, na'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ar sawl cyfrif. Credwyd y byddai'n rhaid inni waredu tua 900,000 o ŵyn ysgafn yn ystod y mis diwethaf. Mae'r cynllun lles ŵyn ysgafn (gwaredu) yn dod i ben yfory. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 5,000 o ŵyn sydd ar ôl i'w gwaredu yn y safleoedd a ddefnyddiwyd eisoes—sef llawer llai na'r disgwyl.

Peter Rogers: Do you agree that the most urgent priority is to resume exports and get a fair price for farmers' produce? Essential to that task is supporting our livestock auction system, which is burdened by costs and regulations that are imposed on it but not on its competitors. How will you protect livestock auctions?

Peter Rogers: A gyfunwch mai'r flaenoriaeth bwysicaf ar hyn o bryd yw ailddechrau allforio a sicrhau pris teg ar gyfer cynnyrch ffermwyr? Mae rhoi cymorth i'n system arwerthu da byw, a gaiff ei llethu gan y costau a'r rheoliadau a osodir arni, nas gosodir ar y gystadleuaeth, yn hanfodol i'r dasg honno. Sut y byddwch yn diogelu arwerthiannau da byw?

Carwyn Jones: Exports are important, especially for lamb, but also for beef and pig meat. The export market for pig meat is re-opening slowly. There are encouraging signs about the beef market, and I hope that the lamb situation will be resolved early next year. I have put on record that we hope to export by autumn next year. If the current situation continues, and we remain free of foot and mouth disease for a substantial time, then that schedule will move forward.

Carwyn Jones: Mae allforion yn bwysig, yn enwedig o ran cig oen, ond hefyd cig eidion a chig mochyn. Mae'r farchnad allforio ar gyfer cig mochyn yn ailddechrau'n araf. Mae arwyddion calonogol am y farchnad cig eidion, a gobeithiaf y caiff y sefyllfa o ran cig oen ei datrys ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf. Dywedais yn gyhoeddus ein bod yn gobeithio allforio erbyn yr hydref y flwyddyn nesaf. Os bydd y sefyllfa bresennol yn parhau, ac os na fydd rhagor o achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau am gyfnod sylweddol, yna bydd yr amserlen honno yn mynd rhagddi.

Few of the farmers that I meet say that livestock auctions are the fairest system of selling livestock. I have met the livestock auctioneers. My view has always been that, as things stand, it is difficult for farmers to obtain a fair price through auction. If livestock auctioneers wish to come forward

Nid oes llawer o'r ffermwyr yr wyf yn cwrdd â hwy yn dweud mai arwerthiannau da byw yw'r system decaf o werthu da byw. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd ag arwerthwyr da byw. Fy marn erioed fu ei bod yn anodd i ffermwyr gael pris teg am dda byw drwy arwerthiannau, fel y saif pethau ar hyn o bryd. Os bydd

with sensible proposals on how they might help farmers gain a fair price in the market, I am willing to listen to them.

arwerthwyr da byw am gyflwyno cynigion synhwyrol ar y ffordd y gallent sicrhau pris teg yn y farchnad i'r ffermwyr, yr wyf yn fodlon gwrandao arnynt.

The Presiding Officer: Question 2 (OAQ12769) is transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 2 (OAQ12769) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

Cynorthwyo Ffermwyr Cymru i Arallgyfeirio Assisting Welsh Farmers to Diversify

Q3 Alun Cairns: What new measures does the Minister propose to introduce to assist Welsh farmers to diversify? (OAQ12781)

C3 Alun Cairns: Pa fesurau newydd y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu'u cyflwyno i gynorthwyo ffermwyr Cymru i arallgyfeirio? (OAQ12781)

Carwyn Jones: I launched a wide range of practical measures, including capital grants, a free business advisory service and specialist advice and training opportunities on 17 September under the banner of Farming Connect. Farming Connect is designed to help Welsh farmers to access new markets, to undertake new enterprises and modernise their businesses. Farmers can access Farming Connect via a single telephone number; it is a one-stop shop.

Carwyn Jones: Lansiais amrywiaeth eang o fesurau ymarferol, gan gynnwys grantiau cyfalaf, gwasanaeth cynghori busnes am ddim a chyngor a hyfforddiant arbenigol ar 17 Medi o dan faner Cyswllt Ffermio. Nod Cyswllt Ffermio yw helpu ffermwyr Cymru i fanteisio ar farchnadoedd newydd, i ymgymryd â mentrau newydd ac i foderneiddio eu busnesau. Gall ffermwyr fanteisio ar wasanaethau Cyswllt Ffermio drwy ffonio un rhif ffôn; siop un stop ydyw.

Alun Cairns: Does the Minister accept that if diversification is to become a reality, a more responsive and flexible approach to development control is required, as highlighted in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee's report, 'Diversifying the Rural Economy'? Does he also accept that for this to be delivered, the Minister responsible for planning should make a positive statement?

Alun Cairns: A dderbynia'r Gweinidog fod angen ymagwedd fwy ymatebol a hyblyg, fel yr amlinellir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig, 'Arallgyfeirio'r Economi Wledig', er mwyn sicrhau bod arallgyfeirio yn cael ei wireddu? A dderbynia hefyd y dylai'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio wneud datganiad cadarnhaol am hyn, er mwyn i hyn gael ei gyflawni?

Carwyn Jones: I understand that the Minister responsible is considering planning control at the moment. We had a debate on this in 1999, I believe, when Private Member's legislation was brought forward. We need to ensure that we do not have a one-size-fits-all approach in Wales. If we loosened planning controls too much, some urban areas adjacent to farmland would see that farmland disappear overnight. My own constituency is an example. However, we have to implement and approach planning legislation in a manner sympathetic to diversification. That is being actively pursued.

Carwyn Jones: Deallaf fod y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y mater yn ystyried rheolaethau cynllunio ar hyn o bryd. Cynhaliwyd dadl ar hyn yn 1999, fe gredaf, pan gyflwynwyd deddfwriaeth Aelod Preifat. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad ydym yn gweithredu ar y sail bod un peth yn addas i bawb yng Nghymru. Pe baem yn llacio rheolaeth cynllunio yn ormodol, byddai rhai ardaloedd trefol wrth ymyl tir ffermio yn colli'r tir ffermio hwnnw dros nos. Mae fy etholaeth fy hunan yn enghraifft o hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni weithredu ac ymdrin â deddfwriaeth gynllunio mewn modd sy'n gydnaws ag arallgyfeirio. Yr ydym yn mynd

ar drywydd hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A fydddech yn derbyn eich bod chi, a'ch rhagflaenydd, wedi annog ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio i gynhyrchu organig a bod y ffermwyr hynny bellach yn wynebu cystadleuaeth annheg o Ewrop? Gan mai strategaeth y Llywodraeth a'ch cyfrifoldeb chi oedd hyn, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ddiogelu bywoliaeth y ffermwyr hynny?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Would you accept that you and your predecessor have encouraged farmers to diversify into organic production and that those farmers now face unfair competition from Europe? As this was a Government strategy and your responsibility, what are you doing to safeguard those farmers' livelihoods?

Carwyn Jones: Os ystyriwch sut y mae'r farchnad organig wedi datblygu dros y blynyddoedd, fe welwch fod y graff a ddefnyddir i ddangos y sefyllfa yn codi mewn camau. Ar hyn o byd o bryd, mae'r farchnad organig yn wastad. Bydd yn codi yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Mae'r farchnad organig wedi tyfu'n sylweddol, ond nid yw wedi tyfu'n gyson nac yn araf.

Carwyn Jones: If you consider how the organic market has developed over the years, you will see that the graph used to illustrate the situation rises in steps. At the moment, the organic market is flat. It will rise in future. That has happened in the past. The organic market has grown substantially, but it has not grown steadily and slowly.

Un broblem yn y sector llaeth yw nad oes digon o brosesu gennym yng Nghymru. Mae gennym lawer o ffatrïoedd prosesu llaeth llwyddiannus ond mae angen mwy o brosesu arnom yng Nghymru. Unwaith y bydd hynny'n digwydd, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y farchnad yn codi.

One problem in the dairy sector is that we do not have sufficient processing in Wales. We have many successful dairy processing factories, but we need more processing in Wales. Once that happens, I am certain that the market will rise.

Mick Bates: You will be aware that the development of a biomass strategy is in the partnership agreement. It offers farmers great opportunities to develop growing on their farms as well as community heating projects. What progress has been made in developing a biomass strategy?

Mick Bates: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod datblygu strategaeth bio-màs yn rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Rhydd gyfleoedd gwych i ffermwyr ddatblygu bio-màs ar eu ffermydd eu hunain yn ogystal â phrosiectau gwresogi cymunedol. Pa gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu strategaeth bio-màs?

Carwyn Jones: You and I have discussed this, and the exciting projects proposed for Wales, one of which involves the use of recycled material to provide power. We need more proposals to build on the capacity to use biomass for fuel and power. I encourage people to come forward with those proposals.

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda chi, a'r prosiectau cyffrous a gynigiwyd i Gymru. Y mae un ohonynt yn cynnwys defnyddio deunydd wedi'i ailgylchu i gynhyrchu pŵer. Mae angen mwy o gynigion arnom i ddatblygu'r gallu i ddefnyddio bio-màs ar gyfer tanwydd a phŵer. Anogaf bobl i gyflwyno'r cynigion hynny.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiynau 4 (OAQ12755) a 5 (OAQ12716) yn ôl. Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 6 (OAQ12690) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 4 (OAQ12755) and 5 (OAQ12716) have been withdrawn. Question 6 (OAQ12690) is transferred for written answer.

10:20 a.m.

Dyfodol Ffermio yng Nghymru Future of Farming in Wales

Q7 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister make a statement on meetings that he has had with the Minister of State for Rural Affairs in the UK Government about the future of farming in Wales? (OAQ12747)

Carwyn Jones: The Minister for Rural Affairs in the UK Government, Alun Michael, is responsible primarily for rural economic development in England. Nevertheless, I met Alun on 19 September to discuss several matters of mutual interest. The future of farming in Wales is crucial to what we are trying to achieve in the National Assembly. I will publish the long-term vision for agriculture, developed by the Farming Futures group, on 21 November.

Lynne Neagle: Have you had any discussions with the UK Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs about the reform of the common agricultural policy? It currently costs Welsh taxpayers over £180 million a year, in return for which they have more expensive food and inflated land prices, while third world countries face export bans, or have unwanted produce dumped on their home markets.

Carwyn Jones: Most of the money for European schemes comes from Europe, rather than from Westminster. We discuss the subject of the reform and development of the common agricultural policy every month, in my territorial meetings with UK colleagues. CAP will change over the next few years. It is particularly likely to move away from payments to farmers on the basis of the number of animals that they own. We must ensure that any future changes satisfy at least two criteria. First, that the changes are beneficial to the environment, and secondly, more importantly, that our farmers do not lose out as a result.

Elin Jones: Yn y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ddoe, gwnaethoch ddatganiad ynglyn â'ch dymuniad i weld pwerau dros iechyd anifeiliaid yn cael eu

C7 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gyfarfodydd a gafodd gyda'r Gweinidog Gwladol dros Faterion Gwledig yn Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch dyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru? (OAQ12747)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn Llywodraeth y DU, Alun Michael, yn bennaf cyfrifol am ddatblygu economi wledig Lloegr. Er hynny, cyfarfûm ag Alun ar 19 Medi i drafod nifer o faterion sydd o ddiddordeb i'r ddau ohonom. Mae dyfodol ffermio yng Nghymru yn hanfodol i'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyhoeddaf y weledigaeth hirdymor ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth, a ddatblygwyd gan grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio, ar 21 Tachwedd.

Lynne Neagle: A gawsoch unrhyw drafodaethau ag Adran y DU dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig am ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin? Ar hyn o bryd, mae trethdalwyr Cymru yn talu mwy na £180 miliwn y flwyddyn, yn gyfnewid am fwyd drytach a phrisiau tir rhy uchel, tra bod allforion o wledydd y trydydd byd yn cael eu gwahardd, a'u marchnadoedd cartref yn cael eu boddi gan gynnyrch diangen.

Carwyn Jones: Daw'r rhan fwyaf o arian am gynlluniau Ewropeaidd o Ewrop, yn hytrach na San Steffan. Trafodwn y mater o ddiwygio a datblygu'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin bob mis, yn fy nghyfarfodydd tiriogaethol gyda Gweinidogion eraill y DU dros amaethyddiaeth. Bydd y polisi yn newid dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n debygol iawn o symud o'r taliadau i ffermwyr ar sail nifer yr anifeiliaid y maent yn berchen arnynt. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod unrhyw newidiadau yn y dyfodol yn bodloni o leiaf dau faen prawf. Yn gyntaf, bod y newidiadau o fudd i'r amgylchedd, ac yn ail, sy'n bwysicach, nad yw ein ffermwyr ar eu colled o ganlyniad.

Elin Jones: In the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee yesterday, you made a statement on your wish to see powers over animal health transferred to the National

trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A ydych yn hyderus y cewch ymateb positif gan DEFRA a Chabinet y Llywodraeth yn Llundain, i gais gan Weinidog o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am drosglwyddo pwerau i'r Cynulliad sydd y tu hwnt i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998?

Carwyn Jones: Ni ofynnais yn ffurfiol am hynny eto, gan ein bod yn paratoi'r cais ar gyfer DEFRA, i sicrhau y daw'r pwerau i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n hwb bod y Cabinet a'r Pwyllgor yn gefnogol. Gwyddoch fy marn i ar y mater, a byddwn yn awr yn sicrhau y caiff yr achos ei bwysleisio'n gryf i DEFRA ac yn San Steffan.

Assembly. Are you confident that you will receive a positive response from DEFRA and the Cabinet of the Government in London to a request by an Assembly Minister that powers not included in the Government of Wales Act 1998 be transferred to the Assembly?

Carwyn Jones: I have not formally requested that yet, as we are preparing the case that we will give to DEFRA, to ensure that those powers are transferred to the Assembly. It is encouraging that the Cabinet and the Committee are supportive. You know my opinion on the matter, and we will now ensure that the case is made strongly to DEFRA and in Westminster.

Diogelu Diwydiant Cig Oen Cymru Protecting the Welsh Lamb Industry

Q8 William Graham: Will the Minister outline the measures that he has taken to protect the Welsh lamb industry? (OAQ12741) [R]

Carwyn Jones: I have taken several measures to protect the Welsh lamb industry. They include providing an additional £1 million for the 2001-02 agri-food strategy, and inviting the Welsh Development Agency's agri-food directorate, and other sector representatives, including Welsh Lamb and Beef Promotions Limited and the Meat and Livestock Commission, to work on proposals to recapture and develop our markets at home and abroad. Of the Assembly package, £600,000 will be used for the Welsh light, hill lamb marketing project. Of that sum, £300,000 was allocated to Welsh Lamb and Beef Promotions Limited for a consumer marketing campaign, with great success apparently.

William Graham: I refer to the matter raised earlier by Peter Black, on the confusion between ovine and bovine. Can you ensure that that lack of confidence will now be restored?

Carwyn Jones: Food safety is a matter for the Food Standards Agency. Had the DNA tests requested by a National Assembly official not been performed, the matter would

C8 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu'r camau a gymerodd i ddiogelu diwydiant cig oen Cymru? (OAQ12741)

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi cymryd nifer o gamau i ddiogelu diwydiant cig oen Cymru. Maent yn cynnwys darparu £1 filiwn ychwanegol ar gyfer strategaeth bwyd-amaeth 2001-02, a gwahodd cyfarwyddiaeth bwyd-amaeth Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, a chynrychiolwyr eraill o'r sector, gan gynnwys Hybu Cig Oen ac Eidion Cymru Cyfyngedig a'r Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw, i weithio ar gynigion i adennill a datblygu ein marchnadoedd yma a thramor. O ran pecyn y Cynulliad, caiff £600,000 ei ddefnyddio i'r prosiect marchnata ŵyn mynydd ysgafn Cymru. Dyrannwyd £300,000 o'r swm hwnnw i Hybu Cig Oen ac Eidion Cymru Cyfyngedig ar gyfer ymgyrch marchnata i ddefnyddwyr, a fu'n llwyddiannus iawn, yn ôl pob sôn.

William Graham: Cyfeiriai at y mater a godwyd gan Peter Black yn gynharach, o ran y dryswch rhwng defaid a gwartheg. A allwch sicrhau y caiff y diffyg hyder hwnnw bellach ei adfer?

Carwyn Jones: Mae diogelwch bwyd yn fater i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd. Pe na chynhelid y profion DNA y gofynnodd swyddog o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol

have been very serious, with a great loss of consumer confidence this week. I am sure that the FSA would have changed its advice to consumers. We now know that those tests were performed on material that was not sheep brain. That will be a great comfort to Welsh farmers in the short term. However, the theoretical risk of BSE appearing in sheep is still present, and tests are continuing. Every sheep that dies of scrapie in the UK is tested to see whether BSE is present. Tests on around 180 brains have proved negative, which is encouraging news. We should be aware that we must eradicate scrapie. The scientific fear was, and still remains theoretically, that scrapie can mask BSE in sheep. We must eradicate scrapie as quickly as possible. We are moving towards that.

amdanynt, byddai'r mater wedi bod yn ddifrifol iawn, a byddai hyder defnyddwyr wedi gostwng yn sylweddol yr wythnos hon. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd wedi newid ei chyngor i ddefnyddwyr. Gwyddom bellach i'r profion hynny gael eu cynnal ar ddeunydd nad oedd yn dod o ymenyddiau defaid. Bydd hynny yn gysur mawr i ffermwyr Cymru yn y byrdymor. Fodd bynnag, erys y perygl damcaniaethol y bydd BSE yn amlygu ei hunan mewn defaid, a pharheir â'r profion. Profir pob dafad sy'n marw o'r clefyd crafu yn y DU i ganfod a yw BSE yn bresennol. Bu profion ar tua 180 o ymenyddiau yn negyddol, sy'n newyddion calonogol. Dylem fod yn ymwybodol bod yn rhaid inni ddileu'r clefyd crafu. Yr ofn ymhlith gwyddonwyr oedd y gall y clefyd crafu gelu BSE mewn defaid, ac erys yr ofn damcaniaethol hwnnw. Rhaid inni ddileu y clefyd crafu mor gyflym â phosibl. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd tuag at gyflawni hynny.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiynau 9 (OAQ12743) a 10 (OAQ12699) yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 9 (OAQ12743) and 10 (OAQ12699) have been withdrawn.

Cyfraniad y Cynulliad i Benderfyniadau Polisi ar Glwy'r Traed a'r Genau **The Assembly's Input into Policy Decisions on Foot and Mouth**

Q11 Peter Rogers: What recent discussions has the Minister had with the Secretary of State at DEFRA about the Assembly's input into policy decisions on foot and mouth? (OAQ12753) [R]

C11 Peter Rogers: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ynghylch cyfraniad y Cynulliad i benderfyniadau polisi ar glwy'r traed a'r genau? (OAQ12753) [R]

Carwyn Jones: I have had many discussions with Ministers at DEFRA, and Ministers at the former Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, about the situation as regards foot and mouth disease. I met the Secretary of State for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs last week in London and we discussed a range of issues, including those relating to foot and mouth disease.

Carwyn Jones: Cefais lawer o drafodaethau â Gweinidogion yn Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, a Gweinidogion y cyn-Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd, am y sefyllfa o ran clwy'r traed a'r genau. Cyfarfûm â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Llundain yr wythnos diwethaf a thrafodwyd amrywiaeth o faterion, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n ymwneud â chlwy'r traed a'r genau.

Peter Rogers: During those meetings, did you discuss the regulations that govern the age of cattle that can be buried at foot and mouth disease disposal sites in Wales? Will

Peter Rogers: Yn ystod y cyfarfodydd hynny, a drafodwyd y rheoliadau sy'n rheoli oedran y gwartheg y gellir eu claddu mewn safleoedd gwaredu clwy'r traed a'r genau yng

you take this opportunity to correct your statement that no cattle over five years of age were buried at Penhesgyn tip, in light of the fact that I have since seen the relevant birth certificates, which prove that your information was incorrect?

Carwyn Jones: If you have such proof, I would like to see it. It is not our policy to bury cattle in landfill sites in Wales. A small number of cattle were buried in Penhesgyn because they had strayed too close to the site and, as a result, were regarded as a foot and mouth disease risk. If you have evidence that the cattle were older than we were led to believe, we would want to see it so that we could discuss the matter with the appropriate farmers.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A gytnwch mai un o'r problemau mawr y mae'r Cynulliad wedi eu hwynebu o ran ymdrin ag argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau yw rôl y bwrdd ymyrraeth? A gytnwch fod trafod gyda'r bwrdd ymyrraeth yn aml yn debyg i drafod gyda rhywun, nid o wlad arall ond o blaned arall?

Carwyn Jones: Gofynnwyd yr un cwestiwn yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ddoe.

Mae gan y bwrdd ymyrraeth bwerau dros daliadau mewn sefyllfa gyffredin. Ynglyn â chlwy'r traed a'r genau, y bwrdd oedd yn gyfrifol am redeg y cynllun difa ŵyn cyntaf ac am gladdu'r ŵyn hynny. Ar y dechrau, yr oedd problemau ynglyn â sut y rheolwyd y cynllun yng Nghymru, a chafwyd diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng y Cynulliad a'r bwrdd ymyrraeth. Ers hynny, mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwella yn sylweddol.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiynau 12 (OAQ12744), 13 (OAQ12697), 14 (OAQ12768), 15 (OAQ12745), 16 (OAQ12718) a 17 (OAQ12796) yn ôl.

Nghymru? A fanteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i gywiro eich datganiad na chladdwyd gwartheg dros bum mlwydd oed yn safle Penhesgyn, yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fy mod wedi gweld y tystysgrifau geni ers hynny, sy'n profi nad oedd eich gwybodaeth yn gywir?

Carwyn Jones: Os oes prawf o'r fath gennych, hoffwn ei weld. Nid yw'n bolisi gennym gladdu gwartheg mewn safleoedd tirlenwi yng Nghymru. Claddwyd nifer fach o wartheg ym Mhenhesgyn gan eu bod wedi crwydro'n rhy agos at y safle ac, o ganlyniad, ystyriwyd bod perygl eu bod wedi dal clwy'r traed a'r genau. Os oes tystiolaeth gennych fod y gwartheg yn hŷn na'r hyn a ddywedwyd wrthym, hoffem ei gweld fel y gallem drafod y mater gyda'r ffermwyr priodol.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Do you agree that one of the great problems that the Assembly has faced in terms of dealing with the foot and mouth disease crisis is the role of the intervention board? Do you agree that discussing with the intervention board is often similar to discussing with someone, not from another country but from another planet?

Carwyn Jones: The same question was asked in the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee meeting yesterday.

The intervention board has powers over payments in a normal situation. On foot and mouth disease, the board was responsible for running the first lamb slaughter scheme and for burying those lambs. At the beginning, there were problems with the way in which the scheme was being run in Wales, and there was a lack of communication between the Assembly and the intervention board. Since then, the situation has improved considerably.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 12 (OAQ12744), 13 (OAQ12697), 14 (OAQ12768), 15 (OAQ12745) and 16 (OAQ12718) and 17 (OAQ12796) are withdrawn.

Adolygu'r Cynlluniau Grant Coetir Ffermydd

Reviewing the Farm Woodland Grant Schemes

Q18 Glyn Davies: What plans does the Minister have to review farm woodland grant schemes? (OAQ12773)

Carwyn Jones: In implementing Woodlands for Wales, our strategy for trees and woodland, I have asked the Forestry Commission to review all its grant aid for forestry. That review has two parts: first, the commission will review grant aid for existing woodland and, secondly, the commission and the Assembly's Agriculture Department will review grant aid, including the farm woodland premium scheme, for creating new woodland. There will be wide consultation during these reviews, seeking the views of all stakeholders. We will then proceed from there.

Glyn Davies: Your positive response has scuppered my supplementary question. However, while I am in a position to question you, do you agree that a debate on the woodland strategy should be held in the Chamber?

Carwyn Jones: A debate on the strategy will be held in Plenary on 8 November.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 19 (OAQ12767) wedi ei dynnu yn ôl.

C18 Glyn Davies: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i adolygu'r cynlluniau grant coetir ffermydd? (OAQ12773)

Carwyn Jones: Wrth weithredu Coetir Cymru, ein strategaeth ar gyfer coed a choetir, gofynnais i'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth adolygu ei holl grantiau ar gyfer coedwigaeth. Mae dwy ran i'r adolygiad hwnnw: yn gyntaf, bydd y comisiwn yn adolygu cymorth grant ar gyfer coetir presennol ac, yn ail, bydd y comisiwn ac Adran Amaethyddiaeth y Cynulliad yn adolygu cymorth grant, gan gynnwys y cynllun premiwm coetir ffermydd, i greu coetir newydd. Bwriedir ymgynghori'n eang yn ystod yr adolygiadau hyn, gan geisio barn pob rhanddeiliad. Awn ymlaen wedyn o'r man hwnnw.

Glyn Davies: Ar ôl eich ateb cadarnhaol, ofer yw fy nghwestiwn atodol. Fodd bynnag, tra fy mod mewn sefyllfa i ofyn cwestiwn ichi, a gytunwch y dylid cynnal dadl ar y strategaeth goetir yn y Siambr?

Carwyn Jones: Cynhelir dadl ar y strategaeth mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar 8 Tachwedd.

The Presiding Officer: Question 19 (OAQ12767) has been withdrawn.

Diogelu Dyfodol Tymor Hir yr Economi Wledig Securing the Long-term Future of the Rural Economy

Q20 Karen Sinclair: What measures is the Minister taking to secure the long-term future of the rural economy? (OAQ12691)

Carwyn Jones: Apart from the vision that the Farming Futures group will present on 21 November, other matters are ongoing.

The Assembly has published plans in relation to Objective 1 and the rural development plan to secure investment in rural businesses in Wales and, importantly, to help sustain rural communities. On 10 July, I announced the successful groups that have been invited to take forward LEADER+ schemes in Wales.

C20 Karen Sinclair: Pa fesurau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu mabwysiadu i ddiogelu dyfodol tymor hir yr economi wledig? (OAQ12691)

Carwyn Jones: Ar wahân i'r weledigaeth y bydd grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio yn ei chyflwyno ar 21 Tachwedd, mae materion eraill yn mynd rhagddynt.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi cynlluniau ynglŷn ag Amcan 1 a'r cynllun datblygu gwledig i ddiogelu'r buddsoddiad mewn busnesau gwledig yng Nghymru ac i helpu cynnal cymunedau gwledig, sy'n bwysig. Ar 10 Gorffennaf, cyhoeddais y grwpiau llwyddiannus sydd wedi'u gwahodd i

There are other plans in the pipeline.

gyflwyno cynlluniau LEADER+ yng Nghymru. Mae cynlluniau eraill ar y gweill.

On agriculture and food, measures are being implemented to strengthen the food-processing sector under the agri-food strategy, which is led by the Welsh Development Agency. Consultation with the farming industry on the Farming Futures group document, which I mentioned, is ongoing. We will also review how we support rural Wales in the context of the national economic development strategy.

O ran amaethyddiaeth a bwyd, caiff mesurau eu gweithredu i atgyfnerthu'r sector prosesu bwyd o dan y strategaeth bwyd-amaeth, sydd o dan arweiniad Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Mae'r broses o ymgynghori â'r diwydiant ffermio ar ddogfen grŵp Dyfodol Ffermio, a grybwyllwyd gennyf, yn parhau. Byddwn hefyd yn adolygu pa gymorth a roddwn i Gymru wledig yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol.

On 24 July, the rural partnership met and endorsed a short to medium-term plan for the recovery of rural communities following foot and mouth disease, including measures to aid the recovery of farming, tourism and other businesses that have been affected. That culminated on 26 July with the publication of the rural recovery plan. The partnership is also considering the problem of age balance in rural communities and the factors contributing to rural out-migration. That matter will be on the rural partnership's agenda when it meets this afternoon.

Ar 24 Gorffennaf, cyfarfu'r bartneriaeth wledig gan gymeradwyo cynllun byrdymor i dymor canolig ar gyfer adfer cymunedau gwledig yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau, gan gynnwys mesurau i gynorthwyo'r gwaith o adfer ffermio, twristiaeth a busnesau eraill yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Arweiniodd hynny at gyhoeddi'r cynllun adfer gwledig ar 26 Gorffennaf. Mae'r bartneriaeth hefyd yn ystyried y broblem o gydbwysedd oedran mewn cymunedau gwledig a'r ffactorau sy'n cyfrannu at y ffaith bod pobl yn gadael y cymunedau hynny. Bydd y mater hwnnw ar agenda cyfarfod y bartneriaeth wledig y prynhawn yma.

Karen Sinclair: Will you give a brief update on the progress of the veal rearing unit in Carmarthen, which I believe could have enormous potential, not only for farming but for processing?

Karen Sinclair: A wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am gynnydd yr uned magu lloi yng Nghaerfyrddin, a allai, yn fy marn i, fod â photensial enfawr, nid yn unig o ran ffermio ond hefyd o ran prosesu?

10:30 a.m.

Carwyn Jones: The veal unit in Pontyates, situated between Llanelli and Carmarthen, was set up a year and a half ago. There have been difficulties in terms of slaughter costs and marketing. However, as far as I am aware, the project is ongoing. It is an important project in terms of promoting and creating a market for welfare-friendly Welsh veal.

Carwyn Jones: Sefydlwyd yr uned lloi ym Mhont-iets, rhwng Llanelli a Chaerfyrddin, flwyddyn a hanner yn ôl. Bu anawsterau o ran costau lladd a marchnata. Fodd bynnag, hyd y gwn, mae'r prosiect yn parhau. Mae'n brosiect pwysig o ran hyrwyddo a chreu marchnad ar gyfer cig llo Cymru sy'n ystyriol o les y lloi.

Elin Jones: Mae marchnadoedd da byw yn rhan bwysig o batrwm economaidd ardaloedd gwledig a'r diwydiant amaethyddol. Yr oedd eich ateb i Peter Rogers ynglŷn â chefnogi dyfodol y marchnadoedd hyn yn llugoer. Os nad ydych yn gweld rôl ganolog i

Elin Jones: Livestock markets are an important part of the economic pattern of rural areas and the agriculture industry. You gave a lukewarm response to Peter Rogers on supporting the future of these markets. If you do not foresee a central role for livestock

farchnadoedd da byw, sut y bydd marchnad gystadleuol ar gael i fwyafrif ffermwyr Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Fy nod yw sicrhau bod ffermwyr yn cael pris teg am eu cynnyrch. Os gwelaf mai marchnadoedd da byw yw'r ffordd orau o wneud hynny, byddwn yn barod i wrando. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, cydweithredu ag eraill i sicrhau prisiau gwell yw'r ffordd ymlaen, fel sydd yn digwydd mewn gwledydd eraill lle y caiff ffermwyr brisiau gwell na ffermwyr Cymru. Problem y farchnad ar hyn o bryd yw ei bod yn anodd sicrhau pris teg am fod y prynwyr yn gwmnïau mawr ac yn brin, tra bo nifer fawr o werthwyr unigol. Byddwn yn cefnogi unrhyw fodd i ailystyried y system honno er mwyn ei gwella. Er hynny, mae'n anodd gweld ar hyn o bryd sut y gallai'r system helpu i sicrhau pris teg i ffermwyr. Rhaid cofio na ddigwyddodd hyn dros nos nac o ganlyniad i glwy'r traed a'r genau. Yr oedd hon yn gŵyn a glywyd ymhell cyn hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn onest ynghŷn ag ystyried y ffordd orau er mwyn i ffermwyr gael pris teg am eu cynnyrch.

markets, how will the majority of Welsh farmers access a competitive market?

Carwyn Jones: My aim is to ensure that farmers receive a fair price for their produce. If I see that livestock markets are the best way of doing that, I would be willing to listen. However, in my opinion, co-operating with others to ensure better prices is the way forward, as happens in other countries where farmers receive better prices than Welsh farmers. The problem with the market at present is that it is difficult to secure a fair price because the buyers are big companies, of which there are few, while there is a large number of individual sellers. I would support any way of reconsidering that system in order to improve it. However, it is difficult to see at present how the system could help farmers secure a fair price. We must remember that this did not happen overnight or as a result of foot and mouth disease. This complaint has been heard for some time. We must be honest about considering the best way so that farmers receive a fair price for their produce.

Cwestiynau i'r Trefnydd **Questions to the Minister for Assembly Business**

The Presiding Officer: Question 1 (OAQ12712) has been transferred for written answer, and questions 2 (OAQ12723) and 3 (OAQ12795) have been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 1 (OAQ12712) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig, a thynnwyd cwestiynau 2 (OAQ12723) a 3 (OAQ12795) yn ôl.

Datblygu Strategaeth TGCh Cymru Gyfan **Developing the Wales-wide ICT Strategy**

Q4 Peter Black: What budget is available to develop the Wales-wide information and communication technology strategy? (OAQ12707)

C4 Peter Black: Faint o arian sydd ar gael i ddatblygu strategaeth technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu i Gymru gyfan? (OAQ12707)

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): As E-Minister, I instituted a review of all ICT expenditure across all policy areas. This informed our information age strategic framework, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales', which provides a coherent framework for activities under existing portfolios. The total expenditure currently totals £107.8 million for 2001-02, £72.6 million for 2002-03 and £49.1 million for 2003-04.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Fel E-Weinidog, sefydlais adolygiad o'r holl wariant ar TGCh ar draws pob maes polisi. Llywiodd yr adolygiad hwn ein fframwaith strategol ar gyfer yr oes wybodaeth, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales', sy'n rhoi fframwaith cydlynol ar gyfer gweithgareddau o dan y portffolios presennol. Ar hyn o bryd neilltuir £107.8 miliwn ar gyfer 2001-02, £72.6 miliwn ar gyfer 2002-03 a £49.1 miliwn ar gyfer 2003-

04.

Peter Black: The additional money in next year's budget for broadband services is welcome. How will broadband services be rolled out to those areas away from big cities, particularly the Valleys and rural areas, over the next few years?

Andrew Davies: As Peter knows, the rollout of broadband is a top priority of the Cymru Ar-lein strategic framework. The significant announcement, made yesterday by the First Minister and myself, of £18.4 million to be invested in the rollout of high-speed broadband internet services throughout local authorities and schools, will put Wales well ahead of the rest of the UK. It will establish points of presence in each local authority area and provide fast broadband internet access to schools, as well as providing multimedia equipment to every primary, secondary and special school in Wales. We were also able to obtain £2.6 million from the Department of Trade and Industry for the rollout of broadband services. We will use that money to target the Valleys and rural areas, where broadband access is difficult. That will be done, in particular, through the private sector.

Dafydd Wigley: Is the Minister aware that the administration has given so little priority to ICT, that an Objective 1 partnership for ICT infrastructure is only now being set up, almost two years into the programme? So far, nothing has been allocated from a budget of up to £53 million. Are you satisfied with the Government's performance on this?

Andrew Davies: We do not have direct responsibility for Objective 1 programmes. However, there has been significant investment in the Opportunity Wales programme, for example, which is encouraging small and medium-sized enterprises to take up e-commerce and e-business. I have also just referred to the significant announcement that Rhodri

Peter Black: Croesewir yr arian ychwanegol yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer gwasanaethau band llydan. Sut y caiff gwasanaethau band llydan eu cyflwyno mewn ardaloedd y tu allan i'r dinasoedd mawr, yn enwedig yn y Cymoedd ac ardaloedd gwledig, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf?

Andrew Davies: Fel y gŵyr Peter, mae cyflwyno gwasanaethau band llydan yn un o flaenoriaethau pennaf fframwaith strategol Cymru Ar-lein. Bydd y cyhoeddiad pwysig, a wnaethpwyd ddoe gan Brif Weinidog Cymru a minnau, y caiff £18.4 miliwn ei fuddsoddi i gyflwyno gwasanaethau rhyngwyd band llydan cyflym mewn awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion, yn sicrhau bod Cymru ymhell ar y blaen o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU. Bydd yn sefydlu presenoldeb yn ardal pob awdurdod lleol ac yn rhoi mynediad i'r rhyngwyd band llydan cyflym mewn ysgolion, yn ogystal â rhoi offer amlgyfrwng i bob ysgol gynradd, uwchradd ac arbennig yng Nghymru. Llwyddwyd hefyd i gael £2.6 miliwn o'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i gyflwyno'r gwasanaethau band llydan. Byddwn yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw i dargedu'r Cymoedd ac ardaloedd gwledig, lle y mae'n anodd derbyn gwasanaethau band llydan. Gwneir hynny drwy gyfrwng y sector preifat, yn arbennig.

Dafydd Wigley: A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol mai dim ond yn awr y mae partneriaeth Amcan 1 ar gyfer seilwaith TGCh yn cael ei sefydlu, sef tua dwy flynedd ar ôl dechrau'r rhaglen, oherwydd bod y weinyddiaeth wedi rhoi cyn lleied o flaenoriaeth i TGCh? Hyd yma, ni ddyrannwyd dim i TGCh o gyllideb o hyd at £53 miliwn. A ydych yn fodlon â pherfformiad y Llywodraeth o ran hyn?

Andrew Davies: Nid ydym yn gyfrifol yn uniongyrchol am raglenni Amcan 1. Fodd bynnag, buddsoddwyd symiau sylweddol o arian yn y rhaglen Cyfle i Gymru, er enghraifft, sy'n annog mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint i fasnachu a gwneud busnes dros y we. Yr wyf newydd gyfeirio hefyd at y cyhoeddiad pwysig a wnaethpwyd ddoe gan Rhodri Morgan a minnau ynglŷn â

Morgan and I made yesterday on rolling out broadband. That puts us ahead of the rest of the UK in terms of ensuring that Wales is on line and that we can create the small, clever country that we signed up to in the Cymru Ar-lein strategic framework.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

The Presiding Officer: Sorry, we are out of time for this question.

chyflwyno gwasanaethau band llydan. Mae hynny'n sicrhau ein bod ar y blaen i weddill y DU o ran sicrhau bod Cymru ar-lein ac y gallwn greu'r wlad fach ddeallus yr ymrwymwyd iddi yn fframwaith strategol Cymru Ar-lein.

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Y Llywydd: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oes amser ar ôl ar gyfer y cwestiwn hwn.

Rhoi Adroddiad yr WDA ar Ddarparu Technoleg Band Llydan ar Waith Implementing the WDA Report on Provision of Broadband Technology

Q5 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister make a statement on the implementation of the Welsh Development Agency commissioned report into the provision of broadband technology in Wales? (OAQ12710)

Andrew Davies: The WDA published the analysis study into ubiquitous broadband access in Wales on 9 July. In the summer, colleagues and I met the chief executive and senior members of the WDA's board to discuss that report. We agreed that the Assembly and the WDA would jointly manage the implementation plan. Since the report's publication, the WDA has engaged with key stakeholders with a view to presenting recommendations to the Cabinet on implementation soon. In addition, we made that exciting announcement yesterday on rolling out broadband.

Lynne Neagle: I welcome yesterday's announcement on rolling out high-speed broadband internet services in Wales. What action will you take to ensure that that is delivered in a way that stimulates business investment in the communities most affected by recent job losses in the steel and aerospace industries? My constituency is one of those affected: Alenia Marconi Systems announced 120 job losses yesterday.

Andrew Davies: We are working closely with the WDA to draw up a joint implementation plan and will ensure that it is

C5 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y modd y mae'r adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar ddarparu technoleg band llydan yng Nghymru yn cael ei roi ar waith? (OAQ12710)

Andrew Davies: Cyhoeddodd y WDA yr astudiaeth ddadansoddi ar dderbyn technoleg band llydan ym mhob man yng Nghymru ar 9 Gorffennaf. Yn ystod yr haf, cyfarfu cyd-Aelodau a minnau â phrif weithredwr ac uwch aelodau o fwrdd y WDA i drafod yr adroddiad hwnnw. Cytunwyd y byddai'r Cynulliad a'r WDA yn rheoli'r cynllun gweithredu ar y cyd. Ers cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, mae'r WDA wedi cysylltu â rhanddeiliaid allweddol gyda'r bwriad o gyflwyno argymhellion i'r Cabinet ynglŷn â rhoi'r adroddiad ar waith cyn bo hir. Yn ogystal, gwnaethom y cyhoeddiad cyffrous hwnnw ddoe ar gyflwyno gwasanaethau band llydan.

Lynne Neagle: Croesawaf y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd ddoe ar gyflwyno gwasanaethau rhyngwyd band llydan cyflym yng Nghymru. Pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau y caiff hynny ei gyflawni mewn modd sy'n ysgogi buddsoddi mewn busnesau yn y cymunedau sy'n dioddef fwyaf yn sgîl y diswyddiadau diweddar yn y diwydiannau dur ac awyrfod? Mae fy etholaeth i ymysg y cymunedau yr effeithiwyd arnynt: cyhoeddodd Alenia Marconi Systems 120 o ddiswyddiadau ddoe.

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r WDA i lunio cynllun gweithredu ar y cyd a byddwn yn sicrhau y caiff ei

implemented. We will also closely monitor the expenditure announced yesterday, to ensure that local authorities and schools take up that provision. Unless that is done, we will not make the most of the opportunities provided by ICT, particularly in your constituency and some areas of mine.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I presume that you read the WDA's report. It states that Wales is bottom of the UK's regions and nations in terms of access to broadband. A key recommendation of the report was that we should aggregate public sector demand to stimulate provision of broadband communication. If you are implementing this report with the WDA, why were the proposals to aggregate public sector demand cut from the national economic development strategy at 9.27 a.m. yesterday?

Andrew Davies: Sometimes I wonder where Rhodri Glyn Thomas is coming from. I know that he struggles to understand most issues, but obviously he does not have a clue on this one. [PLAID CYMRU MEMBERS: 'Answer the question.']

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is answering the question.

Andrew Davies: Yesterday's announcement is a major step towards fulfilling that commitment to create a public sector network in Wales. Perhaps Rhodri Glyn cannot understand that; it may be intellectually challenging for him. However, the announcement is a significant step towards creating that public sector network. It is only a step and further steps will be taken in due course. I know that Plaid Cymru does not recognise good news, but on this occasion I must report to the other Members that this is hugely significant news for the people of Wales.

The Presiding Officer: Question 6 (OAQ12709) has been withdrawn.

weithredu. Byddwn hefyd yn monitro'r gwariant a gyhoeddwyd ddoe yn fanwl hefyd, er mwyn sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion yn defnyddio'r ddarpariaeth honno. Oni wneir hynny, ni fyddwn yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a gynigir gan TGCh, yn enwedig yn eich etholaeth chi a rhai ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth i.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn cymryd eich bod wedi darllen adroddiad y WDA. Noda fod Cymru ar waelod y pentwr ymhlith rhanbarthau a chenhedloedd y DU o ran mynediad i wasanaethau band llydan. Un o argymhellion allweddol yr adroddiad oedd y dylem gyfuno'r galw yn y sector cyhoeddus i ysgogi'r ddarpariaeth o gysylltiadau band llydan. Os ydych yn rhoi'r adroddiad hwn ar waith ar y cyd â'r WDA, pam y dileuwyd y cynigion i gyfuno'r galw yn y sector cyhoeddus o'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol am 9.27 a.m. ddoe?

Andrew Davies: Ni wn beth sy'n bod ar Rhodri Glyn Thomas weithiau. Gwn ei fod yn ei chael yn anodd deall y rhan fwyaf o faterion, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw'n deall y mater hwn o gwbl. [AELODAU PLAID CYMRU: 'Atebwch y cwestiwn.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb y cwestiwn.

Andrew Davies: Mae'r cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd ddoe yn gam mawr tuag at gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw i greu rhwydwaith yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Efallai na all Rhodri Glyn ddeall hynny; efallai ei fod yn anodd iddo ddeall hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyhoeddiad yn gam mawr tuag at greu'r rhwydwaith hwnnw yn y sector cyhoeddus. Dim ond un cam ydyw a chaiff camau eraill eu cymryd maes o law. Gwn nad yw Plaid Cymru yn cydnabod newyddion da, ond y tro hwn, rhaid imi nodi i'r Aelodau eraill fod hyn yn newyddion pwysig dros ben i bobl Cymru.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6 (OAQ12709) yn ôl.

Masnachu Dros y We Adopting E-Commerce

Q7 Alun Cairns: What is the Minister doing to encourage Welsh businesses to adopt e-commerce? (OAQ12778)

Andrew Davies: It is important that businesses in Wales are made aware of the potential benefits of engaging in e-commerce. They must also have access to the highest quality advice and guidance to assist them to trade electronically. We have therefore supported a large range of projects: the Wales smE-Business, which is run on an all-Wales basis; the Objective 1 project, OpportunitE Wales, which is available in the Objective 1 area; and the network of Business Connect ICT support centres, which are run more locally. These projects are designed to promote and demonstrate to businesses the economic and commercial benefits of engaging in e-commerce.

10:40 a.m.

Alun Cairns: Does the Minister accept that the aggregation of public sector demand for ICT was a key recommendation of the WDA report? If so, why was that recommendation deleted from the national economic development strategy?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will you answer the question now, Minister?

The Presiding Officer: Order. You have had several supplementary questions today, Rhodri Glyn without trying to ask additional ones.

Andrew Davies: All I can say is that our actions speak louder than words. [*Laughter.*]

Brian Hancock: Let us hope that actions will speak louder than words. Is the Minister aware that in future, successful e-commerce will depend on video and broadband communications? According to present plans, the percentage of businesses in the whole of Wales—not just in the Objective 1 areas in the Valleys and west Wales—that have access to broadband is the lowest in the European Union.

C7 Alun Cairns: Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i annog busnesau Cymru i fasnachu dros y we? (OAQ12778)

Andrew Davies: Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod busnesau yng Nghymru yn ymwybodol o fanteision posibl masnachu dros y we. Rhaid bod modd iddynt gael gafael ar gyngor a chanllawiau o'r safon gorau hefyd i'w cynorthwyo i fasnachu'n electronig. Felly, yr ydym wedi cefnogi amrywiaeth mawr o brosiectau: smE-Fusnes Cymru, ar gyfer Cymru gyfan; prosiect Amcan 1, OpportunitE Cymru, sydd ar gael yn ardal Amcan 1; a rhwydwaith canolfannau cymorth TGCh Cyswllt Busnes, a redir yn fwy lleol. Mae'r prosiectau hyn wedi'u cynllunio i hyrwyddo a dangos i fusnesau fanteision economaidd a masnachol masnachu dros y we.

Alun Cairns: A dderbynia'r Gweinidog mai cyfuno'r galw yn y sector cyhoeddus am TGCh oedd un o argymhellion allweddol adroddiad y WDA? Os felly, pam y cafodd yr argymhelliad hwnnw ei ddileu o'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnewch ateb y cwestiwn yn awr, Weinidog?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr ydych wedi gofyn nifer o gwestiynau atodol heddiw, Rhodri Glyn, heb geisio gofyn rhai ychwanegol.

Andrew Davies: Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod mwy o werth i'n gweithredoedd ni na geiriau. [*Chwerthin.*]

Brian Hancock: Gobeithio y bydd gweithredoedd yn well na geiriau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y bydd e-fasnach lwyddiannus yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar gysylltiadau fideo a band llydan? Yn ôl y cynlluniau presennol, Cymru sydd â'r ganran isaf o fusnesau—trwy Gymru gyfan, nid yn ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn y Cymoedd a'r Gorllewin yn unig—sydd â mynediad i dechnoleg band llydan yn yr Undeb

Ewropeaidd.

Andrew Davies: I am not sure that I understand Brian's point, which is not an uncommon position for my colleagues and me to be in. We need to say again that, yesterday, we announced an investment of £18.4 million in broadband infrastructure and its roll out to local authorities in Wales. Other parts of the UK are not doing that. It is a hugely significant announcement. I stress that—Members of Plaid Cymru and the Conservatives are clearly unable to understand it.

Andrew Davies: Nid wyf yn siwr a ddeallaf bwynt Brian, sef sefyllfa eithag cyffredin i'm cyd-Aelodau a minnau. Rhaid inni ddweud eto inni gyhoeddi, ddoe, ein bod yn buddsoddi £18.4 miliwn mewn seilwaith band llydan a'r broses o'i gyflwyno mewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Nid yw rhannau eraill o'r DU yn gwneud hynny. Mae'n gyhoeddiad pwysig dros ben. Pwysleisiaf hynny—mae'n amlwg na all Aelodau Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr ei ddeall.

The Presiding Officer: Question 8 (OAQ12714) has been transferred for written answer.

Y Llywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 8 (OAQ12714) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

Rhwydwaith Cyfathrebu Cymru Gyfan An All-Wales Communications Network

Q9 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement concerning the use of satellite technology to provide access to an all-Wales communications network? (OAQ12736)

C9 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio technoleg lloeren fel cyfrwng i gysylltu â rhwydwaith cyfathrebu Cymru gyfan? (OAQ12736)

Andrew Davies: The Welsh Development Agency's report on ubiquitous access to broadband recognises that satellite technology could be a viable solution in some sectors and in some parts of the country. An action plan is being developed and should be available shortly.

Andrew Davies: Mae adroddiad Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ar fynediad i dechnoleg band llydan ym mhob man yn cydnabod y gallai technoleg lloeren fod yn ateb ymarferol mewn rhai sectorau ac mewn rhai rhannau o'r wlad. Caiff cynllun gweithredu ei ddatblygu a dylai fod ar gael cyn bo hir.

Furthermore, the UK online broadband stakeholders group has identified that satellite technology would be the solution in parts of the UK. An action plan is being prepared by this group and it will be ready by November. My officials are involved in the development of both plans.

At hynny, mae grŵp rhanddeiliaid band llydan ar-lein y DU wedi nodi mai technoleg loeren a fyddai'r ateb mewn rhannau o'r DU. Mae'r grŵp hwn yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu a fydd yn barod erbyn mis Tachwedd. Mae fy swyddogion yn cymryd rhan yn y broses o ddatblygu'r ddau gynllun.

William Graham: I am grateful to you, Minister, for giving the Assembly a reply. [Laughter.] You will know of the exciting technology that broadband and satellite will introduce. These terms are bandied about, but will you ensure that everyone knows what they will mean to them in practical terms?

William Graham: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, Weinidog, am roi ateb i'r Cynulliad. [Chwerthin.] Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r dechnoleg gyffrous y bydd band llydan a lloeren yn ei chyflwyno. Defnyddir y termau hyn yn aml, ond a sicrhewch fod pawb yn gwybod beth y byddant yn ei olygu iddynt hwy yn ymarferol?

Andrew Davies: Perhaps Rhodri Glyn should also listen to this. In order to access

Andrew Davies: Efallai y dylai Rhodri Glyn wrando ar hyn hefyd. Er mwyn gallu

multimedia devices such as video on demand and new digital technology, communications technology must be able to deal with large amounts of information. Broadband is a way of delivering that information quickly. It can be provided in a variety of ways: through fibre optic cables, conventional copper wire, satellite, wireless and microwave technology. We want to ensure that people will have access to broadband. That may be delivered through a variety of ways and satellite may play a part in that. Cost, and the provision by the private sector—in this case—are issues, and, as I indicated in my answer, my officials and I are considering them.

Brian Gibbons: As part of this all-Wales communication network, will we have a baseline access equivalent to asymmetric digital subscriber line standard throughout Wales? That will be a minimum requirement within less than half a decade. We should plan for that now—lesser capacity will be irrelevant and redundant.

Andrew Davies: Due to contractual negotiations, I am not able to say how this will be delivered through the local authorities and schools. However, we hope that the technology will be more advanced than ADSL. There are weaknesses in ADSL. As the name suggests, it is asymmetric, which means that material can be received but not transmitted or sent back. That is a problem for multimedia companies, for example, that need to be able to receive and transmit large amounts of data. However, we are confident that the technology we are about to use will be more advanced than ADSL.

defnyddio dyfeisiau amlgyfrwng megis fideo yn ôl y galw a thechnoleg ddigidol newydd, rhaid bod technoleg cyfathrebu yn gallu ymdrin â llawer o wybodaeth. Mae band llydan yn ffordd o gyflwyno'r wybodaeth honno'n gyflym. Gellir ei ddarparu mewn amrywiaeth o ffyrdd: drwy geblau optig ffibrau, gwifren gopr gonfensiynol, lloeren, technoleg ddi-wifr a thechnoleg micro-donnau. Yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd gan bobl fynediad i dechnoleg band llydan. Gellir cyflawni hynny drwy amrywiaeth o ffyrdd a gall lloeren chwarae rhan yn hynny o beth. Rhaid ystyried y gost, a darpariaeth y sector preifat—yn yr achos hwn—ac, fel y nodais yn fy ateb, mae fy swyddogion a minnau yn eu hystyried.

Brian Gibbons: Fel rhan o'r rhwydwaith cysylltiadau hwn ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, a fydd gennym waelodlin o ran mynediad a fydd yn gyfwerth â safon llinell danysgrifio ddigidol anghymesur ledled Cymru? Yr isafswm gofyniad fydd hynny o fewn llai na phum mlynedd. Dylem gynllunio ar gyfer hynny yn awr—bydd capasiti llai yn amherthnasol ac yn ddiwerth.

Andrew Davies: Oherwydd y negodiadau cytundebol, ni allaf ddweud sut y caiff hyn ei gyflwyno yn yr awdurdodau lleol ac mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiwn y bydd y dechnoleg yn fwy datblygedig na llinell danysgrifio ddigidol anghymesur. Mae gwendidau yn y dechnoleg honno. Fel y mae'r enw yn ei awgrymu, mae'n anghymesur, sy'n golygu y gellir derbyn deunydd ond na ellir ei drosglwyddo neu ei anfon yn ôl. Mae hynny'n broblem i gwmnïau amlgyfrwng, er enghraifft, y mae angen iddynt dderbyn a throsglwyddo llawer o ddata. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd y dechnoleg yr ydym ar fin ei defnyddio yn fwy datblygedig na llinell danysgrifio ddigidol anghymesur.

Polisïau'r Cynulliad ar Gyfle Cyfartal (Cyfleusterau TGCh) The Assembly's Equal Opportunity Policies (ICT Facilities)

Q10 Rosemary Butler: What action has the Minister taken to ensure that the Assembly's equal opportunity policies are central in the provisions of ICT facilities? (OAQ12737)

C10 Rosemary Butler: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau bod polisïau'r Cynulliad ar gyfle cyfartal yn ystyriaeth ganolog wrth ddarparu cyfleusterau TGCh? (OAQ12737)

Andrew Davies: The information age strategic framework 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales', which I mentioned earlier, was approved by the National Assembly on 3 July. The Assembly endorsed the principle that ICT underpins the Assembly's cross-cutting themes, including equality of opportunity. ICT is considered when formulating Assembly policies, particularly where they relate to people who have difficulty in communicating because of the loss of their sight, hearing or speech.

Rosemary Butler: I want to focus on people who have hearing difficulties. We have all visited schools and experienced a wonderful atmosphere in class, but there is invariably one child who struggles to understand what is going on. Is it possible to make the ICT budget as flexible as possible and deliver radio hearing aids for deaf children throughout Wales?

Andrew Davies: We are taking the issues of equality of opportunity on board, not only gender issues but areas of disability in particular. My officials and I have met with the Royal National Institute for the Blind and other organisations that represent people with disabilities. We are considering ways in which we can put flesh on the bones of that commitment to ensure that the equipment is accessible to them. You mentioned those with a hearing impairment. For those with a visual impairment or disability, the challenge is even greater. We are considering ways in which we can support organisations and individuals to make the most of the opportunities offered by the new technology.

Gareth Jones: Mae mynediad i fand llydan yn hollbwysig o ran cyfle cyfartal ac unrhyw agwedd sydd yn ymwneud â'r dechnoleg newydd. Clywsom dipyn o drafod ar hynny yn ystod y cwestiynau. Er mwyn gwella safle truenus Cymru fel ag y mae ar hyn o bryd, pa rôl a fydd gan gwmnïau preifat o hyn allan—ni enwaf unrhyw gwmni—yn y gwaith o sicrhau y bydd band llydan ar gael drwy Gymru gyfan? Ar hyn o bryd, deallaf fod un cwmni yn amharod i gydweithio ar hyn. A allwch chi daflu unrhyw fath o oleuni ar y mater hwn?

Andrew Davies: Cymeradwywyd fframwaith strategol oes gwybodaeth 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales', a grybwyllwyd gennyf yn gynharach, gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar 3 Gorffennaf. Cymeradwyodd y Cynulliad yr egwyddor bod TGCh wrth wraidd themâu trawsbynciol y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys cyfle cyfartal. Caiff TGCh ei hystyried wrth lunio polisiâu'r Cynulliad, yn enwedig pan fyddant yn gysylltiedig â phobl sydd ag anawsterau cyfathrebu oherwydd eu bod wedi colli eu golwg, eu clyw neu eu llefarydd.

Rosemary Butler: Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar bobl sydd ag anawsterau clywed. Y mae pob un ohonom wedi ymweld ag ysgolion gan brofi awyrgylch hyfryd yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, ond mae bob amser un plentyn sy'n ei chael yn anodd deall yr hyn sy'n digwydd. A yw'n bosibl sicrhau bod cyllideb TGCh mor hyblyg â phosibl ac yn cyflwyno cymhorthion clywed radio i blant byddar ledled Cymru?

Andrew Davies: Yr ydym yn ystyried materion cyfle cyfartal, nid yn unig materion rhyw ond meysydd anabledd yn benodol. Mae fy swyddogion a minnau wedi cyfarfod â Sefydliad Cenedlaethol Brenhinol y Deillion a sefydliadau eraill sy'n cynrychioli pobl ag anableddau. Yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn weithredu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw i sicrhau bod yr offer yn hygyrch iddynt. Gwnaethoch grybwyll pobl â nam ar eu clyw. Mae'r her yn fwy byth ar gyfer pobl â nam ar eu golwg neu anabledd. Yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn gefnogi sefydliadau ac unigolion er mwyn iddynt fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a gynigir gan y dechnoleg newydd.

Gareth Jones: Access to broadband is vital in terms of equal opportunities and any aspect that deals with the new technology. We heard a great deal of discussion on that during questions. In order to improve Wales's pitiful present position, what will be the role of private companies from now on—I will not mention any company—in ensuring that broadband is available throughout Wales? At present, I understand that one company is unwilling to co-operate in this matter. Can you shed some light on this issue?

Andrew Davies: It is difficult for me to comment on a private company when I do not know the company or the case. If you write to me, or we can speak about it afterwards, I will take that issue on board. As I said in an earlier answer to William Graham, we are considering delivering broadband through a variety of mechanisms. The MARAN project, which is part of the Llwybr/Pathway project in mid-Wales, which delivers broadband through microwave technology, has been successful. It is a public-private partnership, using European money and delivers through the private company MLL Telecom. It delivers broadband through microwave in a rural area with a largely dispersed population. Access to broadband will probably mean a variety of delivery methods.

Andrew Davies: Mae'n anodd imi wneud sylwadau ar gwmni preifat heb wybod pa gwmni neu achos ydyw. Os ysgrifennwch ataf, neu gallwn siarad amdano wedyn, byddaf yn ystyried y mater hwnnw. Fel y dywedais wrth ateb William Graham yn gynharach, yr ydym yn ystyried cyflwyno band llydan drwy amrywiaeth o ddulliau. Bu prosiect MARAN, sy'n rhan o'r prosiect Llwybr yn y Canolbarth, sy'n cyflwyno band llydan drwy dechnoleg micro-donnau, yn llwyddiannus. Partneriaeth rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat ydyw, gan ddefnyddio arian Ewropeaidd a chan gyflwyno gwasanaethau drwy'r cwmni preifat MLL Telecom. Mae'n cyflwyno band llydan drwy ficro-donnau mewn ardal wledig sydd â phoblogaeth wasgaredig iawn. Mae'n debyg y caiff amrywiaeth o ddulliau cyflwyno eu defnyddio i sicrhau mynediad i dechnoleg band llydan.

The Presiding Officer: Questions 11 (OAQ12756) and 12 (OAQ12757) have been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiynau 11 (OAQ12756) a 12 (OAQ12757) yn ôl.

Rôl Ysgolion yn y Strategaeth TGCh The Role of Schools in the ICT Strategy

Q13 Peter Black: What is the role of schools in the information and communications technology strategy for Wales? (OAQ12706)

C13 Peter Black: Beth yw rôl ysgolion yn strategaeth technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu Cymru? (OAQ12706)

Andrew Davies: Schools have a vital role, both in helping to equip young people with ICT skills and as a community resource for adult learning. Jane Davidson has provided funding through the grants for education, support and training programme to ensure that all schools are connected to the internet by 2002 and there was also yesterday's announcement. In addition, the Assembly is supporting an ambitious 'ICT for Learning' strategy, which includes the provision of ICT learning centres in over 400 schools and community centres across Wales. We aim to build on that work, through the Assembly's wider ICT strategy, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales'.

Andrew Davies: Mae gan ysgolion rôl hanfodol, i helpu i roi sgiliau TGCh i bobl ifanc ac fel adnodd cymunedol ar gyfer addysg i oedolion. Mae Jane Davidson wedi rhoi arian drwy'r rhaglen grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant er mwyn sicrhau bod pob ysgol wedi'i chysylltu â'r rhyngwrdd erbyn 2002 a gwnaethpwyd cyhoeddiad ddoe hefyd. Yn ogystal, mae'r Cynulliad yn cefnogi strategaeth 'TGCh ar gyfer Dysgu' uchelgeisiol, sy'n cynnwys darparu canolfannau dysgu TGCh mewn mwy na 400 o ysgolion a chanolfannau cymunedol ledled Cymru. Ein nod yw datblygu'r gwaith hwnnw, drwy strategaeth TGCh ehangach y Cynulliad, 'Cymru Ar-lein—Online for a Better Wales'.

10:50 a.m.

High-speed connectivity is vital if schools, Mae cysylltedd cyflym yn hanfodol er mwyn

colleges and public libraries are to benefit from the high-quality educational material and multimedia training packages that are available over the internet. Investment in a higher bandwidth network for schools offers the opportunity of improving the quality of education delivered to pupils. It will also act as a means of educating the future workforce on the benefits of ICT. Through our ICT strategy, we will evaluate models for co-ordination and provision of bandwidth requirements for different parts of the public sector, and develop more detailed proposals for practical implementation.

Peter Black: The partnership Government has invested a large amount of money in ICT equipment for schools. Will you work with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure that Welsh ICT companies, such as Mertec Computers in Swansea, can take full advantage of the money by bidding for the equipment, and that they are not excluded from shortlists by local authorities?

Andrew Davies: It is important that, if we are to create a more prosperous economy, we need a strong, indigenous ICT private sector. I fully concur with Peter's comments that we must do everything that we can to create the right conditions for growth for those companies. I have taken up these issues on behalf of my constituency.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, instead of being self-congratulatory about the various strategies and proposals that you intend to implement, why does the Government not attempt to implement even the initial recommendations of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's report on ICT in education? We were told last week that there is a delay of almost a year in implementing the initial recommendations. That is deeply damaging. It was a wide-ranging report with excellent recommendations, and it would contribute greatly towards enhancing the use of ICT in our schools. What message does this send out about the Government's competence?

Andrew Davies: We accept that the implementation of the recommendations has not proceeded as rapidly as we had hoped.

i ysgolion, colegau a llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus elwa ar y deunydd addysgol o safon a'r pecynnau hyfforddiant amlgyfrwng sydd ar gael dros y rhyngwrwd. Mae buddsoddi mewn rhwydwaith ystod uwch i ysgolion yn cynnig y cyfle o wella ansawdd yr addysg a roddir i ddisgyblion. Bydd hefyd yn fodd i addysgu gweithlu'r dyfodol ar fanteision TGCh. Drwy ein strategaeth TGCh, byddwn yn gwerthuso modelau ar gyfer cydlynu a darparu gofynion ystod i rannau gwahanol o'r sector cyhoeddus, a byddwn yn datblygu cynigion manylach o ran eu gweithredu'n ymarferol.

Peter Black: Mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi buddsoddi llawer o arian mewn offer TGCh i ysgolion. A wnewch gydweithio â'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau y gall cwmnïau TGCh Cymru, megis Mertec Computers yn Abertawe, fanteisio i'r eithaf ar yr arian drwy wneud cais am yr offer, ac y cânt eu cynnwys gan awdurdodau lleol ar eu rhestrau byr?

Andrew Davies: Mae'n bwysig nodi, er mwyn inni greu economi fwy ffyniannus, bod angen sector preifat TGCh cynhenid cryf arnom. Cytunaf yn llawn â sylwadau Peter bod yn rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i greu'r amodau cywir fel y bydd y cwmnïau hynny'n tyfu. Yr wyf wedi mynd ar drywydd y materion hyn ar ran fy etholaeth i.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, yn lle llongyfarch eich hun am y strategaethau a'r cynigion gwahanol y bwriadwch eu gweithredu, pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth hyd yn oed yn ceisio gweithredu argymhellion cychwynnol adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar TGCh mewn addysg? Dywedwyd wrthym yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd oedi o flwyddyn bron cyn gweithredu'r argymhellion cychwynnol. Mae hynny'n niweidiol iawn. Yr oedd yn adroddiad eang ei gwmpas gydag argymhellion ardderchog, a byddai'n gwneud cyfraniad mawr tuag at wella'r defnydd o TGCh yn ein hysgolion. Pa neges y mae hyn yn ei chyfleu am gymhwyster y Llywodraeth?

Andrew Davies: Derbyniwn nad yw'r broses o weithredu'r argymhellion wedi digwydd mor gyflym ag yr oeddem wedi'i obeithio. Yr

There were many crucial issues that needed to be resolved in terms of rolling this out, such as working with Assembly sponsored public bodies, procurement and appointment procedures and the implications of the Rothschild report on the national grid for learning.

There have been difficulties, but we will try to resolve them as quickly as possible. I refer again, although Members may be bored of it, to the announcement made yesterday. It is a major step towards ensuring that our schools and colleges can use the new technologies to greatest effect.

oedd llawer o faterion hollbwysig yr oedd angen inni eu datrys o ran cyflwyno'r broses hon, megis cydweithio â chyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, gweithdrefnau caffael a phenodi a goblygiadau adroddiad Rothschild i'r grid dysgu cenedlaethol.

Bu anawsterau, ond byddwn yn ceisio eu datrys mor gyflym â phosibl. Cyfeiriaf eto at y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd ddoe, er bod yr Aelodau efallai wedi hen ddiflasu ar glywed amdano. Mae'n gam mawr tuag at sicrhau y gall ein hysgolion a'n colegau ddefnyddio'r technolegau newydd yn y ffordd orau bosibl.

Datganiad gan Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Trefnydd ar y Cynllun Strategol Statement by the First Minister and Minister for Assembly Business on the Strategic Plan

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn ystod yr haf, dechreuais broses newydd o ymgynghori gyda phobl Cymru, ynglyn â beth oedd o'r pwys mwyaf iddynt hwy, fel rhan o'n paratodau ar gyfer y cynllun strategol.

The First Minister: During the summer, I began a new process of consultation with the people of Wales on what matters most to them, as part of our preparations for the strategic plan.

Mae'n bleser gennyf lansio cynllun strategol y Cabinet heddiw, sy'n ymateb i'r materion sydd bwysicaf i bobl Cymru. Mae hefyd yn gosod gerbron y Cynulliad a phobl Cymru ein syniadau a'n hegwyddorion ar sut i gyflawni ar gyfer Cymru.

It gives me great pleasure to launch the Cabinet's strategic plan today, which is a response to the matters of most importance to the people of Wales. It also sets out before the Assembly and the people of Wales our ideas and principles on how to deliver for Wales.

Cynigia'r cynllun ddau beth i bobl Cymru. Yn gyntaf, ymrwymiad 100 y cant i wella'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a ddefnyddiwn ni, ac y mae ein teuluoedd yn dibynnu arnynt, sef ysgolion, ysbytai ac ati. Yn ail, cyfeiriad clir ar gyfer Cymru fodern, o ran yr economi, yr amgylchedd a'n cymdeithas.

The plan offers two things for the people of Wales. First, a 100 per cent commitment to improving the public services that we use and our families rely upon, namely schools, hospitals and so on. The second is a clear direction for a modern Wales, in terms of the economy, the environment and our society.

The people of Wales rightly expect high-quality public services. We are committed to a programme of reform, which is based on Welsh instinctive preference in favour of universal and comprehensive provision of services, full community involvement, support for those most in need and motivated and supported public sector workers.

Mae pobl Cymru wrth reswm yn disgwyl cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i raglen ddiwygio, wedi'i seilio ar ddewis greddfoll Cymru o blaid darpariaeth gyffredinol a chynhwysfawr, cyfraniad llawn cymunedau, cymorth i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus a gweithwyr yn y sector cyhoeddus sydd wedi'u symbylu a'u cefnogi.

Our aim is for Wales to be a learning country, in which learning is an everyday part of working and non-working life, and where

Ein nod yw sicrhau bod Cymru yn wlad sy'n dysgu, lle y mae dysgu yn rhan feunyddiol o fywyd gwaith a'r tu allan i'r gweithle, a lle

learners' needs come first. We will raise the standards of achievement by focusing on learners' needs, support teachers and reduce bureaucracy and testing. We will also radically improve the provision for young children.

The document 'The Learning Country' has already set out the next phase of our work to deliver better outcomes in schools, colleges and universities and in work-based training.

On health, we want to make Wales a healthier place where no-one is denied the treatment or services that they need, where we support the elderly, and ensure that every child, including those being looked after in the care system, has the same life opportunities. We will ensure that NHS decisions are taken locally. We will recruit and retain more doctors and nurses, and we will improve standards of care. 'Improving Health in Wales: A Plan for the NHS with its Partners' has set the scene for a decade of change and development aimed at improving the health and wellbeing of the people of Wales and tackling health inequalities. Our programme for social care focuses on improving quality and outcomes for service users and carers.

On the economy, we will build on Wales's potential as a small, clever and creative nation to deliver a modern economy that brings prosperity to all in a new, sustainable future for rural and urban Wales. We must create the environment within which modern businesses can flourish. We need to establish a clear and sustainable future for all parts of Wales that supports innovative businesses and increases prosperity and its wider spread. We will work, therefore, to spread prosperity across all parts of Wales. We will use the public sector's buying power to create high-speed telecommunications services, and we will improve business support services and finance. Our new national economic development strategy will build on the foundations laid by Objective 1, and will set out what government can do to make a real difference for business.

mae anghenion dysgwyr yn cael blaenoriaeth. Byddwn yn codi safonau cyflawniad drwy ganolbwyntio ar anghenion dysgwyr, cefnogi athrawon a lleihau biwrocratiaeth a nifer y profion a gynhelir. Byddwn hefyd yn gwella'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer plant ifanc yn sylweddol.

Mae'r ddogfen 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' eisoes wedi nodi'r cam nesaf ar gyfer ein gwaith o gyflawni gwell canlyniadau mewn ysgolion, colegau a phrifysgolion ac mewn hyfforddiant yn y gweithle.

Ym maes iechyd, yr ydym am sicrhau bod Cymru yn lle iachach lle nad yw neb yn cael ei atal rhag cael y driniaeth neu'r gwasanaethau sydd ei angen arno, lle yr ydym yn rhoi cymorth i'r oedrannus a sicrhau bod pob plentyn, yn cynnwys y rhai sy'n derbyn gofal yn y system gofal, yn cael yr un cyfleoedd mewn bywyd. Byddwn yn sicrhau y caiff penderfyniadau'r NHS eu gwneud yn lleol. Byddwn yn recriwtio mwy o feddygon a nyrsys a'u cadw, a byddwn yn gwella safonau gofal. Mae 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru: Cynllun ar gyfer yr NHS gyda'i Bartneriaid' wedi rhoi llwyfan ar gyfer degawd o newid a datblygu a'r nod o wella iechyd a lles pobl Cymru a mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau ym maes iechyd. Mae ein rhaglen gofal cymdeithasol yn canolbwyntio ar wella ansawdd a chanlyniadau i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr.

O ran yr economi, byddwn yn adeiladu ar botensial Cymru fel cenedl fechan, glyfar, greadigol i gyflwyno economi fodern sy'n galluogi pawb i ffynnu mewn dyfodol newydd, cynaliadwy i Gymru wledig a threfol. Rhaid inni greu amgylchedd lle y gall busnesau modern ffynnu. Mae angen inni sefydlu dyfodol eglur a chynaliadwy ar gyfer pob rhan o Gymru sy'n cefnogi busnesau arloesol ac yn sicrhau mwy o ffyniant a'i ledaenu'n ehangach. Felly byddwn yn gweithio i ledaenu ffyniant i bob cwr o Gymru. Byddwn yn defnyddio pw^er prynu'r sector cyhoeddus i greu gwasanaethau telathrebu cyflym iawn, a byddwn yn gwella gwasanaethau cymorth busnes a chyllid. Bydd ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol newydd yn adeiladu ar y sylfeini a osodwyd gan Amcan 1, a bydd yn nodi'r hyn y gall y llywodraeth ei wneud i

On agriculture, we need a sustainable rural economy that provides a broad base of employment—particularly for young people living in rural areas—and in which agriculture adapts to become economically, environmentally and socially sustainable. We will work to give young people more opportunities to stay in rural areas. We will increase access to the countryside, and we will continue to promote Welsh food and farming with a clear, high-quality brand linked with a lean, clean, green image.

On local government, Wales should be a place where young people want to live and work, where the gap between the poorest and wealthiest in society is reduced, and where a revitalised local government speaks for and responds to the needs of the communities it serves. We will tackle poverty, reduce homelessness, and improve the quality of local services.

Wales has a rich natural and built environment and heritage that needs to be conserved and improved through planning policies that are made in Wales and that meet its future needs. At the same time, we need to support a growing economy with an integrated, effective and accessible transport system. We will, therefore, integrate transport in Wales, reduce the present excess of waste that goes to landfill sites, and ensure that we plan strategically for our future needs.

On culture, Wales has a distinctive and creative cultural life, which is vital to our economy, as well as our society. We need to support and promote this and reach out to an international audience. We will set out our vision for cultural policy and cultural development. We will ensure that more public bodies can work bilingually, and we will promote excellence of achievement and community participation in the arts and sports.

To realise our plans we will transform how government at all levels does business. This

wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i fusnesau.

O ran amaethyddiaeth, mae angen economi wledig gynaliadwy arnom sy'n rhoi sail cyflogaeth eang—yn arbennig i bobl ifanc sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig—lle y mae amaethyddiaeth yn ymaddasu i ddod yn gynaliadwy yn economaidd, yn amgylcheddol ac yn gymdeithasol. Byddwn yn gweithio i roi mwy o gyfle i bobl ifanc aros yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Byddwn yn sicrhau mwy o fynediad i gefn gwlad, a byddwn yn parhau i hyrwyddo bwyd ac amaeth Cymru gyda brand clir o safon sy'n gysylltiedig â delwedd lân, werdd.

O ran llywodraeth leol, dylai Cymru fod yn wlad lle y mae pobl ifanc am fyw a gweithio ynddi, lle mae'r bwlbch rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yn lleihau, a lle y mae llywodraeth leol wedi'i hadfywio yn llefaru dros anghenion y cymunedau a wasanaetha ac yn ymateb iddynt. Byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â thlodi, yn lleihau digartrefedd, a gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau lleol.

Mae Cymru yn meddu ar amgylchedd naturiol ac adeiledig gyfoethog a threftadaeth wych y mae angen eu cadw a'u gwella drwy bolisiau cynllunio sy'n benodol i Gymru ac sy'n diwallu ei hanghenion yn y dyfodol. Ar yr un pryd, mae angen inni gefnogi economi sy'n tyfu gyda system drafndiaeth integredig, effeithiol a hygyrch. Felly byddwn yn integreiddio trafndiaeth yng Nghymru, yn lleihau'r gwastraff presennol a waredir mewn safleoedd tirlenwi, ac yn sicrhau ein bod yn cynllunio'n strategol ar gyfer ein hanghenion yn y dyfodol.

O ran diwylliant, mae gan Gymru fywyd diwylliannol unigryw a chreadigol, sy'n hanfodol i'n heconomi, yn ogystal â'n cymdeithas. Mae angen inni gefnogi a hyrwyddo hyn a chyrraedd cynulleidfa ryngwladol. Byddwn yn nodi ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer polisiau diwylliannol a datblygiad diwylliannol. Byddwn yn sicrhau y gall mwy o gyrff cyhoeddus weithio'n ddwyieithog, a byddwn yn hyrwyddo rhagoriaeth cyflawniad a chyfranogiad y gymuned yn y celfyddydau a chwaraeon.

Er mwyn gwireddu ein cynlluniau byddwn yn trawsnewid y ffordd y bydd llywodraeth yn

will mean ensuring that all our public agencies work consistently to deliver their plans and to re-think and improve their services. We will test our policies against our guiding principles of acting now in preparation for the future, counteracting poverty, and promoting equality in all that we do. The ability to do this demands much more open and responsive government—government that involves people and all sectors of society in decisions that affect them, and listens to what they have to say. It also demands taking the full advantage offered by the internet and high-speed communications for our economy and our society.

This programme is, to a large extent, already underway. My report as First Minister set out what has already been achieved over the last year and a half. This plan represents a reaffirmation and a new statement of policy for the partnership Government. It reaffirms our commitment to creating a sustainable, inclusive and more equal Wales. This is the framework of action by which this Government can be judged over the coming years.

Jocelyn Davies: We have had 'Betterwales.com' and 'Putting Wales First'. Now we have the 'Plan for Wales 2001'. This is, therefore, the third strategic plan in two years. I am beginning to wonder whether the real plan is to confuse everyone. Maybe you could explain how they all fit together, and why we need another plan, because people tell me that they want action. The Minister for Assembly Business told us earlier that action speaks louder than words.

11:00 a.m.

This latest plan presents a somewhat distorted picture. For example, why does the section on health and care services not mention the fact that you have presided over a year-on-year increase in NHS waiting lists? Why does the plan also fail to refer to the need for an estimated 2,000 additional nurses in Wales,

gweithredu ar bob lefel. Bydd hyn yn golygu sicrhau bod pob un o'n hasiantaethau cyhoeddus yn gweithio'n gyson i gyflwyno eu cynlluniau gan feddwl o'r newydd am eu gwasanaethau a'u gwella. Byddwn yn profi ein polisiau yn erbyn ein hegwyddorion arweiniol sef gweithredu yn awr er mwyn paratoi at y dyfodol, gwrthsefyll tloedi, a hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb ym mhob peth a wnawn. Bydd y gallu i wneud hyn yn galw am lywodraeth lawer mwy agored ac ymatebol—llywodraeth sy'n cynnwys y bobl a phob rhan o gymdeithas mewn penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arnynt, ac yn gwrando ar yr hyn sydd ganddynt i'w ddweud. Bydd yn galw hefyd am fanteisio i'r eithaf ar yr hyn a gynigia'r rhyngwyd a chysylltiadau cyflym iawn i'n heconomi a'n cymdeithas.

Mae'r rhaglen hon, i raddau helaeth, eisoes ar waith. Nododd fy adroddiad fel Prif Weinidog Cymru yr hyn a gyflawnwyd eisoes yn ystod y flwyddyn a hanner ddiwethaf. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn ategu hynny. Mae'n ddatganiad polisi newydd ar gyfer y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Mae'n ategu ein hymrwymiad i greu Cymru fwy cynaliadwy, cynhwysol a chydradd. Dyma'r fframwaith gweithredu y gellir ei ddefnyddio i farnu'r Llywodraeth yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf.

Jocelyn Davies: Yr ydym wedi gweld 'Gwellcymru.com' a 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'. Bellach mae gennym y 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'. Felly hwn yw'r trydydd cynllun strategol o fewn dwy flynedd. Yr wyf yn dechrau meddwl mai drysu pawb yw'r gwir gynllun. Efallai y gallech egluro sut y maent yn cydweddu â'i gilydd, a pham mae angen cynllun arall arnom, oherwydd mae pobl yn dweud wrthyf eu bod am weld gweithredu. Dywedodd y Trefnydd wrthym yn gynharach fod gweithredoedd yn well na geiriau.

Mae'r cynllun diweddaraf hwn yn rhoi darlun sydd wedi ei gamliwio braidd. Er enghraifft, pam nad yw'r adran ar iechyd a gwasanaethau gofal yn sôn am y ffaith ein bod wedi gweld cynnydd flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yn rhestrau aros yr NHS o dan eich Llywodraeth chi? Pam nad yw'r cynllun

just to meet current demands?

ychwaith yn cyfeirio at yr angen am 2,000 o nyrsys ychwanegol yng Nghymru yn ôl amcangyfrif, a hynny dim ond i ateb y galw presennol?

On transport, the plan does not mention the issues which people tell me that they are concerned about. For example, how will the proposed changes in the management structure of the railway network affect plans to improve rail services? In terms of flood protection, what new steps are proposed to tackle flooding in light of the recent floods in the North?

O ran trafniadaeth, nid yw'r cynllun yn sôn am y materion y mae pobl yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn poeni yn eu cylch. Er enghraifft, sut y bydd y newidiadau arfaethedig yn strwythur rheoli'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd yn effeithio ar gynlluniau i wella gwasanaethau ar y rheilffyrdd? O ran amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd, pa gamau newydd a gynigir i fynd i'r afael â llifogydd yng ngoleuni'r llifogydd diweddar yn y Gogledd?

The attempts to produce a national economic development strategy did not inspire much confidence in your ability to get to grips with the economy. The question that everyone wants answered is: from where are the 40,000 extra jobs coming by 2004? If you only see fit to answer one of my questions, I hope that it will be that one.

Nid yw'r ymgais i lunio strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn ennyn llawer o ffydd yn eich gallu i fynd i'r afael â'r economi. Y cwestiwn y mae pawb am gael ateb iddo yw: o ble y daw'r 40,000 o swyddi ychwanegol erbyn 2004? Os mai dim ond un o'm cwestiynau y byddwch yn barod i'w ateb, gobeithiaf mai'r cwestiwn hwnnw yr atebwch.

The plan ends with a target that, by 2010, satisfaction with the services provided by the Assembly and its partner bodies, which I assume includes local councils, should exceed 90 per cent, and that the Assembly's ability to get things done will be strengthened by then. Does the First Minister agree that the present constitutional set-up is, by far, the greatest barrier to achieving that?

Mae'r cynllun yn gorffen drwy nodi targed y dylai boddhad â'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan y Cynulliad a'i gyrff partner, sy'n cynnwys cynghorau lleol, mi dybiaf, fod dros 90 y cant erbyn 2010, ac y bydd gallu'r Cynulliad i gyflawni pethau wedi'i atgyfnerthu erbyn hynny. A gytuna'r Prif Weinidog mai'r sefyllfa bresennol ynglŷn â'r cyfansoddiad yw'r rhwystr mwyaf, o bell ffordd, rhag cyflawni hynny?

The First Minister: No. Any improvements that we could achieve in the constitutional settlement would be of great benefit, but I do not view the current settlement as a barrier. I know the party shirt on which Jocelyn is speaking; that issue is Plaid Cymru's main purpose of existence. However, her approach this morning is unnecessarily querulous.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Ni chytunaf. Byddai unrhyw welliannau y gallwn eu sicrhau yn y setliad cyfansoddiadol o fudd mawr, ond nid wyf o'r farn bod y setliad presennol yn rhwystr. Gwn ar ba lwyfan gwleidyddol y mae Jocelyn yn siarad: y mater hwnnw yw prif reswm Plaid Cymru dros fodoli. Fodd bynnag, mae ei hymagwedd y bore yma yn gwerylgar heb eisiau.

The purpose of this plan is to update the previous ones. Every plan must be updated from time to time. We do not do that too often, but there will not be a further version of this plan until after the next Assembly elections. Therefore, it covers 18 months. I do not believe that our plans are being spaced out unreasonably, although I understand

Diben y cynllun hwn yw diweddarau'r cynlluniau blaenorol. Rhaid diweddarau pob cynllun o bryd i'w gilydd. Ni wnawn hynny yn rhy aml, ond ni chyhoeddir fersiwn arall o'r cynllun hwn tan ar ôl etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Felly, mae'n cwmpasu 18 mis. Ni chredaf fod y cyfnodau rhwng ein cynlluniau yn afresymol, er y deallaf bryderon Jocelyn.

Jocelyn's concerns. However, we do not update our plans every week or every month.

On Jocelyn's point about actions speaking louder than words, there is not a clearer example of that than the point made up to six times by Andrew Davies in answer to questions: why have people failed to take notice of the announcement made yesterday morning about an £18.4 million commitment that puts Wales ahead of the game in the provision of broadband to schools, libraries and lifelong learning centres? That is an example of action speaking louder than words.

I accept that the problems in the health service are taking a long time to turn around. At the same time, we are trying to change the emphasis from waiting lists to waiting times and from acute secondary care to primary care. Those actions have been fully tested by the Health and Social Services Committee. We need a strategic shift in healthcare provision to create better health in Wales, rather than to simply try to treat Wales's appalling level of illness, which is higher than the UK average. That is the fundamental problem: how do we create better health in Wales? That is why we are removing the health authority tier from the health service and making it more local.

On Jocelyn's point about people wanting action on transport, I believe that people strongly approve of our action to introduce free concessionary bus passes in April 2001. Bus travel will be free for pensioners and people with disabilities from April 2002. The replacement of Railtrack, which has gone into administration, by a not-for-profit model similar to Glas Cymru, is widely commended. I am assured by Sue Essex and Stephen Byers that it should have no adverse effect on the refranchising process and the introduction of the all-Wales franchise. It will be no different to what would have happened had Railtrack been a great success and remained in existence.

In terms of flooding, it is difficult to write a strategic plan for all occasions. There was an incredibly heavy shower of rain in the

Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn diweddarau ein cynlluniau bob wythnos neu bob mis.

Ynglŷn â phwynt Jocelyn bod gweithredoedd yn well na geiriau, nid oes gwell enghraifft na'r pwynt a wnaeth Andrew Davies hyd at chwech o weithiau mewn ateb i gwestiynau: pam nad yw pobl wedi cymryd sylw o'r cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd fore ddoe ynglŷn ag ymrwymiad o £18.4 miliwn sy'n sicrhau bod Cymru ar y blaen o ran darparu band llydan i ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd a chanolfannau dysgu gydol oes? Mae honno'n enghraifft o weithredu yn hytrach na llefaru.

Derbyniaf fod y problemau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn cymryd amser hir i'w datrys. Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym yn ceisio newid y pwyslais o restrau aros i amseroedd aros ac o ofal eilaidd aciwt i ofal sylfaenol. Profwyd y camau hynny yn llawn gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae angen newid strategol yn y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd er mwyn sicrhau gwell iechyd yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na cheisio trin y lefel ofnadwy o salwch yng Nghymru, sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer y DU, yn unig. Dyna yw'r broblem sylfaenol: sut yr ydym yn sicrhau gwell iechyd yng Nghymru? Dyna pam ein bod yn dileu haen yr awdurdodau iechyd o'r gwasanaeth iechyd a'i wneud yn fwy lleol.

O ran pwynt Jocelyn bod pobl am weld gweithredu ym maes trafnidiaeth, credaf fod pobl yn cymeradwyo'n fawr ein cynllun i gyflwyno pasys bws gostyngol am ddim ym mis Ebrill 2001 ymlaen. Caiff pensiynewyr a phobl ag anableddau deithio ar fsys am ddim o Ebrill 2002. Mae cymeradwyaeth gyffredinol i'r cynnig i gyflwyno model nad yw'n gwneud elw yn debyg i Glas Cymru yn lle Railtrack, sydd yn nwylo gweinyddwyr. Mae Sue Essex a Stephen Byers wedi rhoi sicrwydd imi na ddylai gael effaith andwyol ar y broses o fasnachfreinio a chyflwyno masnachfaint i Gymru gyfan. Ni fydd yn wahanol i'r hyn a fyddai wedi digwydd pe bai Railtrack wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr ac wedi goroesi.

O ran llifogydd, mae'n anodd llunio cynllun strategol at bob achlysur. Bu cawod hynod o drom yn nhalgylch Rhuthun. Fodd bynnag, ni

catchment area around Ruthin. However, I do not want to depart from the comments that I made on Tuesday about Mwrog Street in Ruthin. The short-term plan, which attempted to solve the problem, did not work. The long-term plan has not yet been put into action by Denbighshire County Council. It needs the agreement of local landowners, as well as that of the Environment Agency, and that cannot be attained overnight. I would not expect a strategic plan such as this to include one particular flooding scheme in Ruthin that Jocelyn may think should be incorporated. However, that cannot be done at the strategic plan level.

The final issue is the one that Jocelyn says is most important, namely job creation and the achievement of the economic targets. Though she does not refer to it often in her contributions—for whatever reason—unemployment is at a 26-year low in Wales. That is important. Employment is high. Although unemployment did not go up or down according to the claimant count and vacancies figures for September, according to the more widely used labour force survey figures for Wales, which are a month behind and refer to August, unemployment continued to go down. I am sure that she will want to welcome that loudly every time she makes a public speech both inside and outside the Assembly.

The Presiding Officer: I call Alison Halford.

Alison Halford: I wish to raise a point of order.

The Presiding Officer: I have called you to respond to the statement, Alison. I understood that you wanted to speak on it.

Alison Halford: May I speak, or shall I just ask the question?

The Presiding Officer: Since you have been called as the lead speaker from the Labour group, you are allowed a preamble and then you can ask a number of questions, as is our usual practice.

Alison Halford: Thank you, Presiding Officer. That throws me, but I will try not to

fwriadaf fynd yn groes i'r sylwadau a wneuthum ddydd Mawrth ynglŷn â Stryd Mwrog yn Rhuthun. Ni lwyddodd y cynllun byrdymor, a geisiodd ddatrys y broblem. Nid yw'r cynllun hirdymor wedi ei roi ar waith gan Gyngor Sir Ddinbych eto. Mae angen cytundeb tirfeddianwyr lleol, yn ogystal â chytundeb Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd ac ni ellir sicrhau hynny dros nos. Ni ddisgwyliwn i gynllun strategol fel hwn gynnwys un cynllun llifogydd arbennig ar gyfer Rhuthun, y cred Jocelyn o bosibl y dylid ei ymgorffori. Fodd bynnag, ni ellid gwneud hynny ar lefel cynllun strategol.

Y mater olaf yw'r un pwysicaf yn ôl Jocelyn, sef creu swyddi a chyflawni targedau economaidd. Er nad yw'n cyfeirio at ddiweithdra yn aml yn ei chyfraniadau—am ba reswm bynnag—mae ar ei isaf yng Nghymru ers 26 mlynedd. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae cyflogaeth yn uchel. Er na wnaeth diweithdra gynyddu na gostwng yn ôl y cyfrif o'r bobl a hawliodd fudd-dâl a nifer y swyddi gwag ym mis Medi, yn ôl ffigurau arolwg y gweithlu ar gyfer Cymru a ddefnyddir yn fwy cyffredin, sydd fis ar ei hôl hi ac yn cyfeirio at fis Awst, parhaodd diweithdra i ostwng. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd am groesawu hynny'n frwd bob tro y gwna araith gyhoeddus y tu mewn i'r Cynulliad a'r tu allan iddo.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Alison Halford.

Alison Halford: Hoffwn godi pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Gelwais arnoch i ymateb i'r datganiad, Alison. Deallais eich bod am wneud sylwadau arno.

Alison Halford: A gaf fi wneud sylwadau, neu a ddylwn ofyn y cwestiwn yn unig?

Y Llywydd: Gan ichi gael eich galw fel prif siaradwr y grŵp Llafur, cewch ragymadroddi ac yna gallwch ofyn nifer o gwestiynau, yn ôl ein harfer.

Alison Halford: Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Mae hynny wedi fy nrysu, ond fe geisiaf beidio ag

cause further confusion.

I will confine my comments to information and communications technology and the use of broadband by small and medium-sized enterprises and multinationals. Do you agree that to increase broadband coverage in Wales, we must overcome three main obstacles: awareness, rural connectivity and service costs? The priority given to these differs among domestic, business and government users. Increasing awareness is central to increasing demand, and I am pleased that you have provided the £18.4 million in the scheme announced yesterday. However, my concern—and I would like your response to it—is that if every exchange in Wales was given ADSL, the service would still be limited to a three-kilometre radius because of the reduced line length. Are you keeping an eye on events in Scotland where rural areas are given instant access to broadband via satellite dish?

My other concern is that, bearing in mind the relative poverty of Wales and its need to take up broadband rapidly, the costs are prohibitive. Small businesses can be charged approximately £40 a month. It is costing a multinational in my constituency—Unilever in Ewloe—a staggering £300,000 a year to connect to a regional internet node. Can you give an assurance that this excellent document embraces the issues that I have just raised?

The First Minister: That is a thought-provoking contribution. The point made at yesterday's launch of the scheme worth £18.4 million—with a further £6 million provided the following year—was that it initially related directly to public sector provision, namely schools, libraries and life-long learning centres. However, it also related to small and medium-sized enterprises via the WDA's part of the scheme.

Alison mentioned big companies, including Unilever in her constituency. That is a horse and cart issue. Will big firms with huge IT

achosi rhagor o ddryswch.

Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu a'r defnydd o fand llydan gan fentrau a chwmnïau amlwladol bach a chanolig eu maint. A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni, er mwyn sicrhau gwell darpariaeth band llydan yng Nghymru, oresgyn tri rhwystr: ymwybyddiaeth, cysylltedd gwledig a chostau gwasanaeth? Mae'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i'r rhain yn amrywio ymhlith defnyddwyr yn y cartref, defnyddwyr busnes a defnyddwyr y llywodraeth. Mae codi ymwybyddiaeth yn ganolog i sicrhau mwy o alw, ac yr wyf yn falch o nodi eich bod wedi darparu £18.4 miliwn yn y cynllun a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Fodd bynnag, fy mhryder i—a hoffwn glywed eich ymateb iddo—yw pe bai pob cyfnewidfa yng Nghymru yn cael llinell danysgrifio ddigidol anghymesur, na fyddai'r gwasanaeth ond yn cyrraedd cylch o dri chilometr o hyd oherwydd hyd llai y llinellau. A ydych yn cadw golwg ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban lle y mae ardaloedd gwledig yn cael mynediad yn uniongyrchol i fand llydan drwy ddysgl loeren?

Fy mhryder arall yw ei bod yn gostus iawn, o gofio bod Cymru yn gymharol dlawd a bod angen iddi gyflwyno band llydan yn gyflym iawn. Codir tâl o ryw £40 y mis ar rai busnesau bach. Mae'n costio'r swm anhygoel o £300,000 y flwyddyn i gwmni amlwladol yn fy etholaeth i—Unilever yn Ewlo—gysylltu ag un o nodau rhanbarthol y rhyngwyd. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi fod y ddogfen ardderchog hon yn ymdrin â'r materion yr wyf newydd eu codi?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae'r cyfraniad hwnnw yn peri inni feddwl. Y pwynt a wnaethpwyd ddoe wrth lansio'r cynllun gwerth £18.4 miliwn—ynghyd â £6 miliwn arall y flwyddyn ddilynol—oedd ei fod ar y cychwyn yn ymwneud yn benodol â darpariaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus, sef ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd a chanolfannau dysgu gydol oes. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn ymwneud â mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint drwy ran y WDA yn y cynllun.

Cyfeiriodd Alison at gwmnïau mawr, yn cynnwys Unilever yn ei hetholaeth hi. Mae hynny'n fater trol a cheffyl. A fydd cwmnïau

requirements of a kind that we have never seen before in Wales come to Wales in advance of a massive IT and fibre optic capability? When they come and establish the demand, will greater competition then drive the price down? Unilever is the first big Financial Times Stock Exchange 100 company to locate part of its headquarters in Wales. We are thrilled by that in Wales as a whole, because other companies will say that if Wales is good enough for Unilever, then it is good enough for them. That does create a gigantic demand for IT and broadband that did not previously exist.

11:10 a.m.

However, further along the A55 there is another major IT centre in Robertson Research. That should, in principle, drive the price down, because it will lead to other people wanting to come in and put optical fibre in the ground and compete for the last mile service, which is also important. We have done our best in terms of opening up use of the optical fibre network buried under the A55. The Assembly administration took that decision. Likewise, the Llwybr/Pathway scheme, which brings access to rural areas, is also a part of the pre-Objective 1 scheme—Objective 5—which we have funded heavily, jointly with Europe, to open up access. Alison mentioned the use of satellite dishes in Scotland. I am not qualified to answer that, but will attempt to cover that in a written answer.

Nick Bourne: First, and so that I equalise before you score, First Minister, this is not playing the man—it is playing the ball. I would say the same even if Mike German or Jenny Randerson were standing at the lectern. I will concentrate on the document.

It seems that we have a plethora of these documents. I agree with Jocelyn Davies on that. Last week, we listened to your record so far in the First Minister's Annual Report, which could be subtitled 'much ado about nothing'. [Interruption.] I hear Brian Gibbons contributing. He is obviously missing his fan club. If the 'Plan for Wales 2001' deserves a

mawr sydd â gofynion TG enfawr na welwyd eu bath erioed o'r blaen yng Nghymru yn dod i Gymru cyn inni ddatblygu gallu sylweddol ym maes TG ac opteg ffibrau? Pan fyddant yn dod ac yn creu'r galw, a fydd y gystadleuaeth fwy yna yn peri i'r pris ostwng? Unilever yw'r cwmni mawr cyntaf ymhlith y 100 o gwmnïau Cyfnewidfa Stoc y Financial Times i leoli rhan o'i bencadlys yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn hynod o falch o hynny drwy Gymru gyfan, gan y bydd cwmnïau eraill yn dweud, 'os yw Cymru yn ddigon da i Unilever yna, mae'n ddigon da i ni'. Mae hynny'n creu galw enfawr am TG a band llydan nad oedd yn bodoli cyn hyn.

Fodd bynnag, ymhellach ar hyd ffordd yr A55 mae canolfan TG bwysig arall yn Robertson Research. Dylai honno, mewn egwyddor, beri i'r pris ostwng, gan y bydd yn annog pobl eraill i roi ffibr optegol yn y ddaear a chystadlu am y filltir olaf o wasanaeth, sydd hefyd yn bwysig. Yr ydym wedi gwneud ein gorau o safbwynt hwyluso'r defnydd o'r rhwydwaith ffibr optegol o dan ffordd yr A55. Gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad a wnaeth y penderfyniad hwnnw. Yn yr un modd, mae'r cynllun Llwybr, sy'n rhoi mynediad i ardaloedd gwledig, hefyd yn rhan o'r cynllun cyn Amcan 1—Amcan 5—y rhoddwyd symiau sylweddol o arian iddo gennym, ar y cyd ag Ewrop, er mwyn hwyluso mynediad. Cyfeiriodd Alison at y defnydd o ddysglau lloeren yn yr Alban. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i ateb hynny, ond ceisiaf ei drafod mewn ateb ysgrifenedig.

Nick Bourne: Yn gyntaf, er mwyn imi ddod â'r gem yn gyfartal cyn ichi sgorio, Brif Weinidog, nid chwarae'r dyn ydywf—ond chwarae'r bêl. Byddwn yn dweud yr un peth pe bai Mike German neu Jenny Randerson yn sefyll wrth ymyl y darllenfwrdd. Canolbwytiaf ar y ddogfen.

Ymddengys fod gennym lu o'r dogfennau hyn. Cytunaf â Jocelyn Davies yn hynny o beth. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwrandawsom ar eich record hyd yma yn Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru y gellid bod wedi rhoi'r is-deitl '*much ado about nothing*' iddo. [Torri ar draws.] Clywaf Brian Gibbons yn cyfrannu. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn

subtitle, it is 'how Labour has lost'. Many issues are not covered in the document. There is no mention, for example, of the alliance Government. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'The what?'] Well, it is an alliance 'Government'.

There is no mention of the Assembly building, which we heard this morning is vital for the people of Wales. Apparently, in this consultation exercise, the people of Wales did not think so. The more dire the problem becomes, and the higher the costs become, the more the pleas go out again for the Conservatives to join the policy steering group to try to get the Government out of the mire and the hole across the road. I will say two words on that—*dim diolch*, no, thank you.

I turn to the specifics of this document—and I wonder how much it cost. On health, there are extremely unambitious targets. The target of maximum waiting time for heart surgery of 12 months does not satisfy me; it is pretty dire. The target for orthopaedic surgery is 18 months, which is also pretty dire. It is unacceptable. There is nothing about cancer targets, which is a dire omission. On education, there is nothing about the rural schools policy, just as there was nothing about that in the First Minister's Annual Report. Why is it missing? Since the higher education sector is barely mentioned here, will spending on higher education in Wales ever come up to the level in England? The sector is extremely disappointed in your Government's performance.

On the economy, there is a marvellous statement:

'Increase tourism spend in Wales'.

It is diving at the moment. From what, to what is tourism to recover sharply? Noting these vague, general aspirations in these documents is a waste of money. There is a statement on Objective 1:

gweld eisiau ei glwb o edmygwyr. Is-deitl addas i 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', os yw'n haeddu un, fyddai '*how Labour has lost*'. Mae llawer o faterion sydd heb eu trafod yn y ddogfen. Nid oes sôn, er enghraifft, am Lywodraeth y gynghair [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: 'Beth?'] Wel, 'Llywodraeth' cynghair ydyw.

Nid oes sôn am adeilad y Cynulliad, sy'n holl bwysig i bobl Cymru, fel y clywsom y bore yma. Mae'n debyg, yn yr ymarfer ymgynghori hwn, nad oedd pobl Cymru yn cyd-fynd. Po fwyaf y broblem, a pho uchaf y costau, mwyaf y galw yn y byd ar y Ceidwadwyr i ymuno â'r grŵp llywio polisi er mwyn ceisio cael y Llywodraeth o'r twll gyferbyn. Dywedaf ddau air ar hynny—*dim diolch*.

Trof at fanylion y ddogfen hon—tybed faint a gostiodd. O ran iechyd, ceir targedau hynod o anuchelgeisiol. Nid wyf yn fodlon ar y targed ar gyfer yr amser hiraf i aros am lawdriniaeth i'r galon, sef 12 mis; mae'n wael iawn. Mae'r targed ar gyfer llawdriniaeth orthopedig sef 18 mis, hefyd yn wael. Mae'n annerbyniol. Nid oes cyfeiriad at dargedau canser, sy'n hepgoriad gwarthus. O ran addysg, nid oes cyfeiriad at y polisi ar ysgolion gwledig, nac ychwaith yn Adroddiad Blynyddol Prif Weinidog Cymru. Pam na chyfeirir ato? Gan mai prin yw'r cyfeiriad at y sector addysg uwch, a fydd gwariant ar addysg uwch yng Nghymru byth yn cyrraedd y lefel yn Lloegr? Mae'r sector yn siomedig dros ben â pherfformiad eich Llywodraeth.

O ran yr economi, ceir gosodiad gwych:

'Cynyddu'r gwariant yn sgil twristiaeth yng Nghymru'.

Mae'n gostwng yn arw ar hyn o bryd. O beth, i beth y bydd twristiaeth yn adfer yn gyflym? Mae nodi'r dyheadau amwys, cyffredinol yn y dogfennau hyn yn wastraff amser. Ceir gosodiad ar Amcan 1:

‘Meet or exceed our targets for jobs and growth under Objective One.’

Frankly, that is about as likely as Peter Law delivering a lecture on the benefits of government with the Liberal Democrats. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Or Tom Middlehurst.’] Yes, or Tom Middlehurst doing so.

On agriculture, it is disappointing that there is nothing on how we will increase farming incomes. There is nothing about the rundown of rural Wales in terms of the closure of post offices and doctors’ surgeries, health needs, or the rural schools policy. That is another glaring omission. On culture, there is no mention of a national art gallery. We keep hearing that there is consultation on this. Is it not time that it appeared in some vision document, entitled ‘looking forward to 2010’?

The documents pile up, but so too do the depressing statistics. The health waiting lists and waiting times are getting longer, the position on Objective 1 is becoming more dire, and the costs of the Assembly building are increasing. Is it not time, as Jocelyn said, that we have action, and stop these words?

The First Minister: It is always possible to read a document and say that an issue is not included that you believe should be. I reject the idea that the Government should have referred to the Assembly building in this strategic plan consultation. We asked the people of Wales which issues they found important.

It is a new kind of consultation. I understand that your party is also currently engaged in a new kind of consultation, and that is why it has no policies. It has nothing to offer anybody until it finishes its consultation. We are in government and cannot afford to delay. Therefore, we proceeded with our consultation, asking the people of Wales to involve themselves in the Assembly’s Government. That is the reason for the responses and how we have incorporated

‘Bodloni neu wneud yn well na’n targedau ar gyfer swyddi a thwf o dan Amcan Un.’

A dweud y gwir, mae hynny mor debygol o ddigwydd ag y mae Peter Law o draddodi darlith ar fanteision bod mewn llywodraeth gyda’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y CYNULLIAD: ‘Neu Tom Middlehurst.’] Ie, neu Tom Middlehurst.

O ran amaethyddiaeth, mae’n siomedig nodi nad oes dim yn sôn am sut y byddwn yn cynyddu incwm ffermio. Nid oes sôn o gwbl am y dirywiad yng Nghymru wledig o ran cau swyddfeydd post a meddygfeydd, anghenion iechyd, neu’r polisi ar ysgolion gwledig. Mae hynny’n rhywbeth amlwg arall a gafodd ei hepgor. O ran diwylliant, nid oes sôn am oriel gelf genedlaethol. Yr ydym yn clywed sôn o hyd bod ymgynghori ar hyn yn mynd rhagddo. Onid yw’n bryd iddo ymddangos mewn rhyw ddogfen weledigaeth, yn dwyn y teitl ‘edrych ymlaen at 2010’?

Mae’r dogfennau yn pentyrru ond felly hefyd yr ystadegau gwael. Mae rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros iechyd yn mynd yn hwy, mae’r sefyllfa ynglŷn ag Amcan 1 yn mynd yn waeth, ac mae costau adeilad y Cynulliad yn cynyddu. Onid yw’n bryd, fel y dywedodd Jocelyn, inni weld gweithredu, a rhoi taw ar y geiriau hyn?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Mae bob amser yn bosibl darllen dogfen a dweud nad yw mater wedi ei gynnwys y dylid ei gynnwys yn eich barn chi. Gwrthodaf y syniad y dylai’r Llywodraeth fod wedi cyfeirio at adeilad y Cynulliad yn yr ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun strategol hwn. Gofynnwyd i bobl Cymru pa faterion a oedd bwysig iddynt.

Mae’n fath newydd o ymgynghori. Deallaf fod eich plaid chithau wrthi’n ymgynghori mewn modd newydd, a dyna pam nad oes ganddi unrhyw bolisiâu. Nid oes ganddi ddim i’w gynnig i neb nes y bydd wedi cwblhau ei hymgyngoriad. Yr ydym ni mewn llywodraeth ac ni allwn fforddio oedi. Felly, bwriwyd ymlaen â’n hymgyngoriad, gan ofyn i bobl Cymru gymryd rhan yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Dyna’r rheswm dros yr ymatebion a’r ffordd y’u

them into this strategic plan. That plan will last us until after the next elections. That is not a serious criticism.

On Nick's points about the targets being unambitious on heart and orthopaedic services, and no specific reference to rural schools, it is always possible to say that more reference should have been made to some matters. We will try to take his points on board.

It is proving difficult to turn the NHS supermarket around. Nick was almost conflating waiting lists and times. As far as I know, that was as much a part of Conservative party policy as it was for Labour. When switching from waiting lists to waiting times, one effect is that the larger, more serious operations are performed first. The figures cannot be massaged, as happened under the Conservative Government, and also under Labour. For example, if larger operations take six hours, and smaller operations only half an hour, having a drive on small operations, such as on feet, fingers and wrists, removes many people from the waiting lists. It happened under the Tories, it probably also happened under Labour. I am happy to share the blame. However, when we change to waiting times, that cannot happen. We must take the most serious cases first and let the consultants decide on them. As far as I know, that is what you wanted, it is certainly what we wanted and it is what patients want. However, the consequences on statistics can be adverse.

David Melding: You are switching the strategy—that was Conservative policy.

The First Minister: Absolutely. Sorry, no, under William Waldegrave it was the other way round. We recall that clearly.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I cannot allow a sub-debate to take place during a statement.

The First Minister: On the HE sector, you

hymgorfforwyd yn y cynllun strategol hwn gennym. Bydd y cynllun hwnnw yn parhau tan ar ôl yr etholiadau nesaf. Nid yw hynny yn feirniadaeth ddifrifol.

O ran pwyntiau Nick a'i gŵyn nad yw'r targedau yn uchelgeisiol o ran gwasanaethau triniaeth i'r galon a thriniaeth orthopedig, ac nad oes cyfeiriad penodol at ysgolion gwledig, mae bob amser yn bosibl dweud y dylid bod wedi cyfeirio'n fwy at faterion penodol. Ceisiwn ystyried ei bwyntiau.

Mae'r dasg o newid cyfeiriad yr NHS yn un anodd. Bu Nick bron â chyfuno rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros. Hyd y gwn i, bu hynny'n gymaint o bolisi'r Blaid Geidwadol ag y bu'n bolisi gan Lafur. Wrth newid o restrau aros i amseroedd aros, caiff y llawdriniaethau mwyaf difrifol eu gwneud gyntaf. Ni ellir camliwio'r ffigurau, fel a ddigwyddodd o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, ac o dan Lafur hefyd. Er enghraifft, os yw'r llawdriniaethau mwyaf difrifol yn cymryd chwe awr, a llawdriniaethau llai difrifol ond yn cymryd hanner awr, byddai ymgais i gynnal mwy o fân lawdriniaethau, megis i'r traed, i'r bysedd ac i arddyrnau, yn tynnu pobl oddi ar y rhestrau aros. Digwyddodd hynny o dan y Torïaid a digwyddodd o dan Lafur siŵr o fod. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i rannu'r bai. Fodd bynnag, pan newidiwn i amseroedd aros, ni all hynny ddigwydd. Rhaid inni ymdrin â'r achosion mwyaf difrifol yn gyntaf a chaniatáu i'r ymgynghorwyr benderfynu arnynt. Hyd y gwn i, dyna beth yr oeddech ei eisiau, yn ddiau dyna'r hyn yr ydym ni am ei weld a dyna'r hyn y mae'r cleifion yn ei ddymuno. Fodd bynnag, gall y canlyniadau o ran yr ystadegau fod yn anffafriol.

David Melding: Yr ydych yn newid y strategaeth—polisi'r Ceidwadwyr oedd hynny.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yn hollol. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, na, o dan William Waldegrave, fel arall yr oedd. Cofiw hynny yn glir.

Llywydd: Trefn. Ni allaf ganiatáu is-ddadl yn ystod datganiad.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: O ran y sector

will be aware, Nick, that William Hague took money from that sector and created this problem. It has been difficult to hack it back. He took the money to pay for the grant to LG Electronics during 1996-97. It has proved the devil's own difficulty to get the resource expenditure per student back on track.

On tourism, you cannot incorporate the short-term effects of the 11 September disaster into a strategic plan. The figures of £20 million to £30 million have been given for this year and £40 million next year, which is approximately 2 to 3 per cent of total tourist expenditure in Wales. We will recover from that. The Wales Tourist Board has stated that UK tourists are making many late bookings, as they do not want to travel abroad any more than Americans. The net figure will be less than that loss.

Finally, agriculture. Direct intervention to raise prices in agriculture can only happen in a command and control communist system, not in a free market. If there is market failure and the prices of livestock collapse, as has happened since the BSE crisis 10 years ago, you cannot raise farm incomes automatically, except in a communist country. It depends on the market. We can do everything possible to provide strategic direction for agriculture, which is to aim for niche markets, and not to try to compete with prairie agriculture in the price and tonnage markets. The niche markets are the way forward for Welsh agriculture.

Michael German: Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001'.

It builds on the partnership Government, 'Betterwales.com' and 'Putting Wales First'. This document manifests what political partnership can do to improve public services in Wales. It is a programme against which we can be judged, as I will demonstrate by referring to what our opposition does not wish to say about our achievements and what the plan will achieve. The Conservatives want to build a future upon an unsuccessful past.

Addysg Uwch, byddwch yn ymwybodol, Nick, mai William Hague a aeth ag arian o'r sector hwnnw gan greu'r broblem hon. Bu'n anodd ei adfer. Aethpwyd â'r arian i dalu am y grant i LG Electronics yn ystod 1996-97. Bu'n anodd dros ben unioni'r gwariant adnoddau y pen ar fyfyrwyr.

O ran twristiaeth, ni ellid ymgorffori effeithiau byrdymor trychineb 11 Medi mewn cynllun strategol. Rhoddwyd y ffigurau o £20 miliwn i £30 miliwn ar gyfer eleni a £40 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, sef rhwng 2 a 3 y cant o gyfanswm y gwariant ar dwristiaeth yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn adfer o'r sefyllfa honno. Nododd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru fod llawer o dwristiaid o'r DU yn trefnu eu gwyliau yn hwyr, gan nad ydynt hwythau, yn yr un modd a'r Americanwyr, am deithio dramor. Bydd y ffigur net yn llai'r na'r golled honno.

Yn olaf, amaethyddiaeth. Dim ond mewn system gorchymyn a rheoli gomiwnyddol y gall ymrwymiad uniongyrchol i godi prisiau amaethyddol ddigwydd, ac nid mewn marchnad rydd. Os bydd y farchnad yn methu a phris da byw yn cwmpo, fel sydd wedi digwydd ers yr argyfwng BSE 10 mlynedd yn ôl, ni ellir codi incwm ffermydd yn awtomatig, heblaw mewn gwlad gomiwnyddol. Mae'n dibynnu ar y farchnad. Gallwn wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i roi cyfeiriad strategol i amaethyddiaeth, drwy anelu at farchnadoedd arbenigol, a pheidio â cheisio cystadlu ag amaethu ar raddfa fawr yn y marchnadoedd prisiau a thunelli. Y marchnadoedd arbenigol yw'r ffordd ymlaen i amaethyddiaeth Cymru.

Michael German: The Liberal Democrats welcome 'A Plan for Wales 2001'.

Mae'n adeiladu ar y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, 'Gwellcymru.com' a 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'. Mae'r ddogfen hon yn amlygu'r hyn y gall partneriaeth wleidyddol ei wneud i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'n rhaglen y gellir ei defnyddio i'n barnu, fel y dangosaf drwy gyfeirio at yr hyn nad yw ein gwrthwynebwyr am ei ddweud ynglŷn â'n cyflawniadau a'r hyn y bydd y cynllun yn ei gyflawni. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr am adeiladu

dyfodol ar orffennol aflwyddiannus.

We must recognise, First Minister, that we have achieved success. In education, we have been successful by providing free school milk and additional resources to reduce class sizes. This plan commits us to further investment in school buildings. Nick Bourne has failed to understand the budget outline given to us last week, and has not realised that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee will hold a debate soon. There will be a dedicated rural schools policy, and money has been committed to it. There is also a commitment to following through the recommendations of the Rees report and assist in dealing with student hardship.

Rhaid inni gydnabod, Brif Weinidog, inni lwyddo. Ym maes addysg, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i ddarparu llaeth ysgol am ddim ynghyd ag adnoddau ychwanegol i leihau maint dosbarthiadau. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn ein hymrwymo i fuddsoddi rhagor mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Nid yw Nick Bourne wedi deall y gyllideb amlinellol a roddwyd inni yr wythnos diwethaf, ac nid yw wedi sylweddoli y bydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn cynnal dadl cyn bo hir. Bydd polisi penodol ar ysgolion gwledig, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo arian ar ei gyfer. Mae ymrwymiad hefyd i weithredu ar argymhellion adroddiad Rees a helpu i ymdrin â thlodi ymhlith myfyrwyr.

11:20 a.m.

We have had major successes on health during the last year. We froze prescription charges and introduced exemptions for key groups. This plan commits us to investing the necessary resources to reduce waiting times and improve NHS staffing levels and morale.

Cawsom sawl llwyddiant mawr ym maes iechyd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr ydym wedi rhewi taliadau presgripsiynau gan eithrio rhai grwpiau allweddol rhag eu talu yn gyfan gwbl. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn ein hymrwymo i fuddsoddi'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen i leihau amseroedd aros a gwella lefel y staff a'r morâl o fewn yr NHS.

I despair when I hear people repeatedly say—with no evidence—that Objective 1 is not succeeding. I spoke on Monday to the European Commission about its progress, and there is no doubt that we are on target and that Wales is doing well. On top of the success of Objective 1, we have boosted the Welsh Development Agency's and Wales Tourist Board's budgets. The plan before us puts a greater emphasis on innovation, entrepreneurship and exploiting the potential of community enterprise and the social economy. Those are all new areas of progress in Wales.

Anobeithiaf pan glywaf bobl yn dweud dro ar ôl tro—heb dystiolaeth—nad yw Amcan 1 yn llwyddo. Siaradais â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ddydd Llun ynglŷn â'r cynnydd, ac nid oes amheuaeth ein bod yn cyrraedd y nod a bod Cymru yn gwneud yn dda. Yn ogystal â llwyddiant Amcan 1, yr ydym wedi cynyddu cyllideb Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a chyllideb Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Mae'r cynllun sydd ger ein bron yn rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar arloesi, entrepreneuriaeth a manteisio ar fentr gymunedol bosibl i'r eithaf a'r economi gymdeithasol. Maent oll yn feysydd newydd o gynnydd yng Nghymru.

We have had successes on rural policy: Farming Connect; an independent appeals tribunal; greater investment in Tir Gofal; a greater emphasis on organics; biomass and the agri-food strategy. We have an emerging framework that will be critical in ensuring rural Wales's environmental and economic sustainability.

Bu llwyddiannau o ran polisi gwledig: Cyswllt Ffermio; tribiwnlys apelio annibynnol; mwy o fuddsoddiad yn Nhir Gofal; a mwy o bwyslais ar gynhyrchu'n organig; biomas a'r strategaeth bwyd-amaeth. Mae fframwaith yn dod i'r amlwg a fydd yn holl bwysig i sicrhau natur gynaliadwy amgylchedd ac economi Cymru wledig.

I hope that Members will agree that there is

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn cytuno bod

much in this plan which will appeal to the people of Wales. This plan is testimony to what can be achieved through a new form of pluralist politics. It is fine for those who want to be a part of pluralist politics, and fine for those who want to stay on the outside—they can stay there. This is a new commitment: the Liberal Democrats' participation in the Government of Wales has brought stability—

The Presiding Officer: Order.

Michael German: My last question is—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is the first question, I suspect. [*Laughter.*] Order. I always try to be generous to party leaders because I know that they have a difficult job. I once tried to be a party leader myself.

Michael German: Does the First Minister agree that this is political progress through progressive politics?

The First Minister: I could not agree more. Our problem in the Assembly is that the Plaid Cymru and Tory groups have an aversion to any good news. They cannot accept that progress is being made. I try to be as frank as possible when there is bad news—individual events; an external event such as occurred on 11 September; a factory closure, and so on—I wish it was occasionally reciprocated by the other parties accepting progress when it is made.

Mike's other point concerned Objective 1 and the doubts expressed about it. The media plays up those doubts because it thinks that it will sell more newspapers by playing up bad news. Alarm about progress on Objective 1 is not justified by the facts. If they made a comparison with the three Objective 1 regions of England they would see—as the commission confirmed—that we are ahead of the game and that there is good progress on Objective 1. It is already creating jobs. We continue to work closely with our partners to bring to the inhabitants of the two-thirds of Wales covered by Objective 1 the prosperity that they deserve.

cryn dipyn yn y cynllun hwn a fydd yn apelio i bobl Gymru. Mae'n cynllun hwn yn tystio i'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni drwy ffurf newydd o wleidyddiaeth luosryw. Mae'n iawn i'r rhai sydd am fod yn rhan o wleidyddiaeth luosryw, ac yn iawn i'r rhai sydd am aros ar y tu allan—cânt aros yno. Mae hwn yn ymrwymiad newydd: mae cyfranogiad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dod â sefydlogrwydd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn.

Michael German: Fy nghwestiwn olaf yw—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hwn fydd y cwestiwn cyntaf, fe gredaf. [*Chwerthin.*] Trefn. Yr wyf bob amser yn ceisio bod yn hael tuag at arweinyddion y pleidiau oherwydd gwn fod ganddynt swydd anodd. Rhoddais gynnig ar fod yn arweinydd plaid fy hun un tro.

Michael German: A gytuna Prif Weinidog Cymru mai cynnydd gwleidyddol drwy wleidyddiaeth radicalaidd ydyw?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Cytunaf yn llwyr. Y broblem sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad yw bod yn gas gan grŵp Plaid Cymru a grŵp y Torïaid newyddion da. Ni allant dderbyn ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd. Ceisiaf fod mor onest â phosibl pan fo newyddion drwg—digwyddiadau unigol, digwyddiad allanol megis y digwyddiad ar 11 Medi; ffatri'n cau, ac ati—byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai'r pleidiau eraill yn eu tro yn onest wrth dderbyn pan fydd cynnydd o bryd i'w gilydd.

Yr oedd pwynt arall Mike yn ymwneud ag Amcan 1 a'r amheuan a godwyd yn ei gylch. Mae'r wasg yn gorliwio'r amheuan hynny am ei bod yn credu y bydd yn gwerthu mwy o bapurau newydd drwy dynnu sylw at newyddion drwg. Ni ellir cyfiawnhau'r dychryn ynglŷn ag Amcan 1 o ystyried y ffeithiau. Pe bai'r wasg yn cymharu Cymru â'r tair rhanbarth Amcan 1 yn Lloegr byddai'n gweld—fel y cadarnhaodd y comisiwn—ein bod ar y blaen ac yn gwneud cynnydd da o ran Amcan 1. Mae eisoes yn creu swyddi. Parhawn i gydweithio'n agos â'n partneriaid i sicrhau'r ffyniant y maent yn eu haeddu i drigolion y deuparth o Gymru a gwmpesir gan Amcan 1.

Alun Pugh: There is much excellent content about health in this document. Smoking killed 7,000 people in Wales last year, and will kill 7,000 more this year. Smoking is the major contributor to health inequality in Wales, but there are only five words on it in the document. Do you believe that we should do more to support smokers to break their addiction, particularly in Wales's disadvantaged areas? We have no powers to control smoking in public places in Wales. Will you support my attempt to give the Assembly those powers so that we can control smoking in public places in Wales, and help reduce the risk to non-smokers?

The First Minister: I have never worked out whether smoking makes people depressed, or whether they smoke because they are depressed. I am not sure, but I wish we could find the main factors why people continue to smoke, and why young people become smokers. Unfortunately smoking mainly occurs among blue-collar workers. That has happened in the USA, where smoking has almost disappeared among middle-class people. It is not like that in Wales, and it is certainly not like that in the countries of mainland Europe. However, smoking is increasingly becoming a class-based issue. People higher up the income scale, with a few exceptions, are more able to give up smoking. It is important that we see the problem in that context. If we do not manage to reduce smoking among blue-collar workers and their families, we will have a long-term health problem, which will be increasingly concentrated among people who are poor and who use cigarettes as a crutch for their depression and concerns about being poor. In truth, that will only make the situation worse. We must break that vicious circle somehow.

Y Llywydd: Yr ydym wedi cael hanner awr ar gyfer y datganiad a chafodd Aelod o bob plaid ofyn cwestiwn. Caniatâf i'r amser gael ei ymestyn rhyw ychydig ar gyfer y datganiad hwn er mwyn i fwy o Aelodau ofyn cwestiynau.

Alun Pugh: Mae'r ddogfen hon yn cynnwys llawer o bethau da o ran iechyd. Lladdwyd 7,000 o bobl yng Nghymru y llynedd oherwydd ysmegu a bydd yn lladd 7,000 arall eleni. Mae ysmegu yn un o'r ffactorau mwyaf sy'n cyfrannu at anghydraddoldeb iechyd yng Nghymru, ond dim ond pum gair sydd ar hyn yn y ddogfen hon. A gredwch y dylem wneud mwy i gefnogi ysmegwyr i dorri'n rhydd o'u dibyniaeth, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd difreintiedig Cymru? Nid oes gennym y pwerau i reoli ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. A gefnogwch fy ymgais i sicrhau'r pwerau hynny i'r Cynulliad fel y gallwn reoli ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, a helpu i leihau'r risg i bobl nad ydynt yn ysmegu?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Nid wyf erioed wedi deall pa un ai gwneud i bobl deimlo'n isel eu hysbryd y mae ysmegu ynteu eu bod yn ysmegu oherwydd eu bod yn isel eu hysbryd. Nid wyf yn siŵr, ond byddai'n dda gennyf pe gallem ddod o hyd i'r prif ffactorau pam bod pobl yn parhau i ysmegu, a pham bod pobl ifanc yn dechrau ymysgu. Yn anffodus, gweithwyr coler las sy'n ymysgu yn bennaf. Digwyddodd hynny yn UDA, lle mae ysmegu ymhlith pobl dosbarth canol wedi diflannu bron. Nid dyna'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru, ac yn sicr nid dyna'r sefyllfa yng ngwledydd cyfandir Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, mae ysmegu yn dod yn fater sy'n ymwneud yn gynyddol â dosbarth cymdeithasol. Mae pobl sy'n uwch ar y raddfa incwm, heblaw am ambell eithriad, mewn sefyllfa well i roi'r gorau i ysmegu. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ystyried y broblem yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Os na lwyddwn i leihau ysmegu ymhlith gweithwyr coler las a'u teuluoedd, bydd gennym broblem iechyd hirdymor, a fydd yn effeithio gan fwyaf ar bobl sy'n dlawd ac yn defnyddio sigarennau fel modd i'w cynnal drwy eu hiselder a'u pryderon am fod yn dlawd. Y gwir yw mai dim ond gwaethygu'r sefyllfa a wna hynny. Rhaid inni dorri'r cylch dieflig hwnnw rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd.

The Presiding Officer: We have had half an hour for the statement and a Member from each party has asked a question. I will allow for some additional time for this statement so that more Members can ask questions.

Gareth Jones: Un o'r pethau mwyaf uchelgeisiol a chyffrous yn y cynllun yw'r bwriad i greu system addysg gwbl gyfun a fydd yn gwerthfawrogi a chefnogi'r proffesiwn dysgu. Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i bob unigolyn dan y system ariannu bresennol? Yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn o'r blaen. Nid wyf yn gweld unrhyw arwydd yn y cynllun strategol o sut y byddwch yn newid y system honno. Nid wyf ychwaith yn gweld strategaeth i sicrhau y bydd y mwyafrif llethol o'n pobl ifanc yn dewis astudio yng ngholegau Cymru. Cafwyd addewidion, ond a yw wir yn ddymuniad gennych i atal y llif blynyddol o fyfyrwyr Cymreig dros y ffin, na fydd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt byth yn dychwelyd i fyw yng Nghymru? A fydd y cynllun hwn yn newid y sefyllfa druenus honno sydd yn tanseilio hyfywedd ein bröydd Cymraeg a di-Gymraeg?

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Yr oedd y rheini yn ddau gwestiwn diddorol. O ran y fformiwla ariannu, mae gan bob awdurdod lleol ei fformiwla ei hun. Rhaid gofyn, felly, a oes modd cywiro'r anghyfartaledd rhwng y fformiwla'u gwahanol. Os oes problem yn eich etholaeth chi, Gareth, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb i glywed amdani. Gallem wedyn ystyried sut i gywiro unrhyw anghyfartaledd, ac edrych i weld a oes rhai fformiwla'u yn decach na'i gilydd.

Trof at y cwestiwn am golegau Cymru ac ai dyna lle y dylai mwyafrif ein myfyrwyr chweched dosbarth—yn hytrach na lleiafrif, fel sydd yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd—fod yn ymgymryd ag addysg uwch. Fy mreuddwyd a'm gweledigaeth i yw y dylai fod yn bosibl i bobl sydd wedi derbyn addysg uwch ac sydd yn gadael Cymru rhywbryd yn ystod eu gyrfa, i fynd i America, Lloegr, yr Almaen neu unrhyw le arall, ddychwelyd i Gymru am fod swyddi addas ar eu cyfer. Ni ddylai fod ots os ydynt yn croesi'r ffin i fynd i'r coleg neu, yn 25 oed, i weithio er mwyn ennill profiad mewn gwlad arall, cyhyd â bod swyddi ar gael yng Nghymru a'u bod yn gallu dychwelyd. Mae chwyldroad o'r fath wedi digwydd yn Iwerddon yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, a hoffwn weld hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru erbyn diwedd y degawd presennol.

Gareth Jones: One of the most ambitious and exciting aspects of the plan is the intention to create an entirely comprehensive education system that will appreciate and support the teaching profession. How will you ensure equality of opportunity for all individuals under the current funding system? I have asked this question before. I do not see any indication in the strategic plan of how you will change that system. Neither do I see a strategy to ensure that the vast majority of our young people will choose to study at Welsh colleges. Promises have been made, but do you really wish to stem the annual flow of Welsh students across the border, most of whom will never return to live in Wales? Will this plan change that deplorable situation, which is undermining the viability of our Welsh-speaking and non Welsh-speaking communities?

The First Minister: Those were two interesting questions. In terms of the funding formula, every local authority has its own formula. We must ask, therefore, whether it is possible to redress the inequalities between the different formulas. If there is a problem in your constituency, Gareth, I would be interested to hear about it. We could then consider how to redress any inequality, and look to see if some formulas are fairer than others.

I turn to the question of Welsh colleges and whether that is where the majority of our sixth-form students—rather than a minority, as is currently the case—should receive their higher education. My dream and vision is that it should be possible for people who have received higher education and who leave Wales sometime during their career, to go to America, England, Germany or anywhere else, to return to Wales because there are suitable jobs for them. It should not matter if they cross the border to go to college or, at the age of 25, to work in order to gain experience in another country, as long as there are jobs for them in Wales and that they can return. Such a radical change has happened in Ireland during the past 10 years, and I would like to see that happen in Wales by the end of this decade.

Peter Rogers: I have looked at what you have to say about agriculture in the strategic plan. Both you and I know that agriculture is in dire straits. The plan talks of diversification and finding other ways forward. I listened to you talk last week about organic farming, which is not a way forward at present. Do you agree that the main way to support agriculture would be to understand that it must be a food-producing industry and that we can compete if we have a fair marketplace? We must change the attitude that we heard this morning. Livestock markets must be preserved in order to give us any chance of ensuring a fair marketplace.

Peter Rogers: Edrychais ar yr hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud am amaethyddiaeth yn y cynllun strategol. Gŵyr y ddau ohonom fod amaethyddiaeth mewn cyflwr truenus. Mae'r cynllun yn sôn am arallgyfeirio a dod o hyd i ffyrdd eraill ymlaen. Gwrandewais arnoch yn siarad yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â ffermio organig, nad yw'n cynnig y ffordd ymlaen ar hyn o bryd. A gytunwch mai'r brif ffordd o gefnogi amaethyddiaeth fyddai deall bod yn rhaid iddo fod yn ddiwydiant sy'n cynhyrchu bwyd ac y gallwn gystadlu os oes marchnad deg gennym? Rhaid inni newid yr ymagwedd a glywsom y bore yma. Rhaid cadw marchnadoedd da byw os am gadw unrhyw obaith o sicrhau marchnad deg.

11:30 a.m.

The First Minister: This plan talks about the strategic direction of agriculture, which is a move towards a more sustainable, niche-market-oriented form of agriculture. That does not mean that farms in Wales cannot compete in any market sector with imports from Australia, Argentina, USA, Canada or other prairie agriculture countries. However, by and large, the strategic direction is towards either organic farming—though that would never involve more than 10 per cent of farms in Wales—or towards the Tir Gofal, environmental preservation type of farming. Again, only a small percentage of farms in Wales could follow that route. Food produced in Wales should be able to earn a premium because it is associated with an image of a lean, clean, green country background and farming practice. Not all the food would be organic, but it must be associated with that green image. Otherwise, you do not get the premium for the produce and cannot meet the higher costs that accompany our farm structure in Wales. We cannot follow the route of prairie agriculture. Can you imagine the riots in rural Wales if we went in for 5,000 acre farms with milking herds of 4,000 cattle? It is not going to happen and the only other direction is for agriculture to earn a premium by developing a brand image for our milk, cheese, yoghurt, lamb, beef and so on.

Prif Weinidog Cymru: Sonia'r cynllun hwn am gyfeiriad strategol i amaethyddiaeth, sef symud tuag at fath o amaethyddiaeth sy'n fwy cynaliadwy ac wedi'i anelu at farchnadoedd arbenigol. Ni olyga hynny na all ffermydd yng Nghymru gystadlu ag allforion o Awstralia, yr Ariannin, UDA, Canada neu wledydd eraill sy'n amaethu ar raddfa fawr mewn unrhyw sector o'r farchnad. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan, mae'r cyfeiriad strategol yn anelu naill ai tuag at ffermio organig—er na fyddai hynny byth yn cynnwys mwy na 10 y cant o ffermydd yng Nghymru—neu tuag at Tir Gofal, math o ffermio sy'n ymwneud â chadwraeth amgylcheddol. Unwaith eto, dim ond canran fach o ffermydd yng Nghymru a allai fynd ar drywydd hynny. Dylai fod modd i fwyd a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru ennill pris uwch am ei fod yn gysylltiedig â delwedd o wlad ac arferion ffermio sy'n gynnil, yn lân ac yn wyrdd. Ni fyddai'r holl fwyd a gynhyrchir yn organig, ond rhaid iddo fod yn gysylltiedig â'r ddelwedd werdd honno. Fel arall, ni ellir cael pris uwch am y cynnyrch ac ni ellir talu am y costau uwch sy'n gysylltiedig â'n strwythur ffermio yng Nghymru. Ni allwn fynd ar drywydd amaethu ar raddfa fawr. A allwch ddychmygu'r cythrwfl yng Nghymru wledig pe baem yn awgrymu ffermydd 5,000 erw â buchesi o 4,000 o wartheg godro? Ni fydd yn digwydd a'r unig gyfeiriad arall i amaethyddiaeth yw sicrhau pris uwch drwy ddatblygu delwedd brand i'n llaeth, caws, iogwrt, cig oen, cig eidion ac ati.

Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

Dafydd Wigley: Point of order. I gave notice of this point of order before the start of this session, Llywydd. I had intended to raise it under Standing Order No. 6.8, but Standing Order Nos. 6.3 and 6.30 are also applicable. The point relates to the questions and lack of answers on matters relating to 'Winning Wales', the national economic development strategy document published yesterday. The questions were raised by Phil Williams to the First Minister and by Rhodri Glyn Thomas to Andrew Davies.

The matter of concern is that several important and significant changes were made to this document yesterday morning within hours of it being published. That raises questions regarding three issues: first, whether this is the final version or whether more changes are in the pipeline, bearing in mind that these were made at the last minute; secondly, whether the resource implications—which are now different from what they were at 9.00 a.m. yesterday—have been built into the budget for the next three years; and thirdly, whether we can have confidence in a document such as this when changes are made, according to whim or otherwise, at the last minute.

Many changes have been made to the document. Some of them are drafting changes only and that is fair enough. However, some changes are on matters of substance. Phil mentioned one of them. Another, on working with UK Government departments to introduce fiscal incentives in Wales, means that the money has disappeared altogether. That has far reaching implications. If we are to have a rapid and meaningful consultation on this document and move to a conclusion before Christmas, we must be certain that it can stand up to scrutiny and that it reflects the Government's position in an integrated way. If you have not already had a request for a statement to be made on this, Presiding Officer, then a statement should be made.

Dafydd Wigley: Pwynt o drefn, Rhoddais rybudd am y pwynt hwn o drefn cyn dechrau'r sesiwn hon, Lywydd. Yr oeddwn yn bwriadu ei godi o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8, ond mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.30 hefyd yn berthnasol. Mae'r pwynt yn ymwneud â'r cwestiynau a diffyg atebion ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â 'Cymru'n Ennill', y ddogfen strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Cododd Phil Williams gwestiynau â'r Prif Weinidog a chododd Rhodri Glyn Thomas gwestiynau ag Andrew Davies.

Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder yw i nifer o newidiadau pwysig ac arwyddocaol gael eu gwneud i'r ddogfen hon fore ddoe o fewn oriau i'w chyhoeddi. Mae hynny yn codi cwestiynau ynghylch tri mater: yn gyntaf, ai'r fersiwn terfynol yw hon neu a oes mwy o newidiadau ar y gweill, o gofio i'r rhain gael eu gwneud ar y funud olaf; yn ail, a gafodd y goblygiadau i'r adnoddau—sydd bellach yn wahanol i'r hyn a geid am 9 o'r gloch fore ddoe—eu cynnwys yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf; ac yn drydydd, a allwn ymddiried yn y cyfryw ddogfen ar ôl iddi gael ei newid, ar fypwy neu fel arall, ar y funud olaf.

Gwnaethpwyd llawer o newidiadau i'r ddogfen. Dim ond newidiadau drafftio yw rhai ohonynt ac mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai newidiadau yn rhai o sylwedd. Cyfeiriodd Phil at un ohonynt. Mae un arall, ar gydweithio ag adrannau Llywodraeth y DU i gyflwyno cymhellion ariannol yng Nghymru, yn golygu bod yr arian wedi diflannu'n gyfan gwbl. Mae i hynny oblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol. Er mwyn inni gynnal ymgynghoriad cyflym ac ystyrlon ar y ddogfen hon a'i rhoi ar wedd derfynol cyn y Nadolig, rhaid inni fod yn sicr ein meddyliau ei bod yn gallu gwrthsefyll proses graffu a'i bod yn adlewyrchu sefyllfa'r Llywodraeth mewn modd integredig. Os nad ydych eisoes wedi cael cais am ddatganiad ar hyn, Lywydd, yna dylai datganiad gael ei gwneud.

The Presiding Officer: That is not a matter for me directly as it relates to the content of a document that has been laid by the Executive. However, if there are concerns about changes to documents of which the Assembly is not aware, I would take some interest in that matter because it is part of my role to ensure that information is always made available to the Assembly. The First Minister will have heard that exchange. I see that he does not wish to respond, so we will move on.

Janet Davies: Point of order. This relates to Standing Order No. 2, on the responsibilities of the First Secretary. This morning I read the English language version of 'Plan for Wales 2001', which has just been published. I noticed that the First Minister was described as a Member of Parliament. I knew that he had two jobs but I did not know that he still had a third. If that is incorrect, false information discredits the National Assembly and I would be grateful if the matter could be addressed.

The Presiding Officer: The First Minister was a Member of Parliament, but I know that he has a successor because I was with him last night. This is not a matter for me. Correct descriptions of Members of Parliament are a matter for Parliament. My concern is that Assembly Members are described properly. If there is an error in the document I am sure that there will be a second edition.

Alun Pugh: Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 14 on equal opportunities. Yesterday, a senior academic informed the Culture Committee that 'you are only Welsh if you can speak Welsh'. Professor Harold Carter's policy of '*un bobl, un diwylliant, un iaith*'—one people, one culture, one language—is not only offensive to many people in Wales but is in clear breach of our Standing Orders and duty to promote equal opportunities. Will you issue guidance to Committee Chairs in dealing with evidence such as this, which is in clear breach of Standing Orders?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Further to that point

Y Llywydd: Nid mater i mi yn uniongyrchol ydyw am ei fod yn ymwneud â chynnwys dogfen a gyflwynwyd gan y Weithrediaeth. Fodd bynnag, os oes pryderon ynghylch newidiadau mewn dogfennau nad yw'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol ohonynt, byddwn yn rhoi sylw i'r mater hwnnw gan mai rhan o'm rôl yw sicrhau bod gwybodaeth bob amser ar gael i'r Cynulliad. Bydd y Prif Weinidog wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwyd. Gwelaf nad yw am ymateb, felly awn ymlaen.

Janet Davies: Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 2, ar gyfrifoldebau'r Prif Weinidog. Y bore yma, darllenais y fersiwn Saesneg o 'Cynllun i Gymru 2001', sydd newydd ei gyhoeddi. Sylwais fod y Prif Weinidog wedi'i ddisgrifio fel Aelod Seneddol. Gwyddwn fod dwy swydd ganddo ond ni wyddwn fod ganddo drydedd o hyd. Os nad yw hynny yn gywir, mae gwybodaeth anghywir yn dwyn anghlod ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gellid ymdrin â'r mater.

Y Llywydd: Bu'r Prif Weinidog yn Aelod Seneddol, ond gwn fod ganddo olynydd am fy mod yn ei gwmi neithiwr. Nid mater i mi ydyw. Mae disgrifiadau cywir o Aelodau Seneddol yn fater i'r Senedd. Fy rôl i yw sicrhau bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu disgrifio'n briodol. Os oes gwall yn y ddogfen hon, yr wyf yn siwr y bydd ail argraffiad.

Alun Pugh: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 14 ar gyfle cyfartal. Ddoe, dywedodd ysgolhaig o bwys wrth y Pwyllgor Diwylliant nad ydych yn Gymro neu'n Gymraes oni fyddwech yn siarad Cymraeg. Bydd polisi yr Athro Harold Carter sef un bobl, un diwylliant, un iaith, nid yn unig yn sarhau llawer o bobl yn Nghymru ond mae'n amlwg yn mynd yn groes i'n Rheolau Sefydlog a'n dyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal. A wnewch chi gyhoeddi canllawiau i Gadeiryddion Pwyllgorau ar ymdrin â thystiolaeth o'r fath, sy'n amlwg yn mynd yn groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ymhellach i'r pwynt

of order, I will clarify the situation, as Alun was not at the meeting yesterday. Harold Carter was asked whether he as an individual felt that, in order to be Welsh, you needed to speak Welsh. As somebody who has learnt Welsh, he said that his personal feeling was that which has been stated. He has a right to his view. It is important that we do not try to censor what people say in Committee. The Committee Chairs have discussed this at length. There are firm guidelines—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This point of order was addressed to me, not to the Chair of the Committee. Rhodri Glyn is taking my lines. Before I respond, however, a number of other Committee members wish to comment.

Jonathan Morgan: Further to that point of order, it is worth putting on record that this gentleman has 30 years of academic experience. This was supposed to be a serious contribution to a serious review of the Welsh language. It is all very well for some academics to treat these reviews as a joke. In some respects, he attempted to do that and to treat us as if we were undergraduates at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. However, this is a serious review being undertaken by the nation's premier political institution. What he said was offensive. You cannot overlook it by saying that it was in response to a question. It was a clear, unequivocal statement, to which he had given due consideration. It is offensive to the vast majority of people in this Chamber and throughout the country.

Lorraine Barrett: Further to that point of order, I was at the Culture Committee meeting yesterday and the comments were made as part of the Professor's statement. Under the same point of order, I raise concern about his comments about the politically correct silliness of multiculturalism. As the Member for Cardiff South and Penarth, and given the current troubled times, I felt that his were dangerous comments.

Dafydd Wigley: Fel un a oedd yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod yn Abertawe ddoe, anghytunaf

hwnnw o drefn, hoffwn egluro'r sefyllfa, gan nad oedd Alun yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod ddoe. Gofynnwyd i Harold Carter a oedd fel unigolyn o'r farn bod angen ichi fedru'r Gymraeg er mwyn bod yn Gymro neu'n Gymraes. Fel rhywun sydd wedi dysgu Cymraeg, dywedodd mai ei deimlad personol oedd yr hyn a nodwyd. Mae ganddo'r hawl i leisio ei farn. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn ceisio sensro'r hyn a ddywed pobl mewn Pwyllgorau. Mae Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgorau wedi trafod hyn yn fanwl. Mae canllawiau eglur—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnwyd i mi ymdrin â'r pwynt hwn o drefn, nid Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor. Mae Rhodri Glyn yn dwyn fy ngeiriau i. Cyn imi ymateb, fodd bynnag, hoffai nifer o aelodau eraill y Pwyllgor wneud sylwadau.

Jonathan Morgan: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae'n werth cofnodi bod gan y gŵr bonheddig hwn 30 mlynedd o brofiad fel academydd. Yr oedd hwn i fod yn gyfraniad difrifol i adolygiad difrifol o'r Gymraeg. Mae'n hawdd iawn i rai academyddion fychanu'r adolygiadau hyn. Ar sawl cyfrif, ceisiodd wneud hynny a'u trin fel pe baem yn fyfyrwyr yn Mhrifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd hwn yn adolygiad difrifol, yn cael ei gynnal gan brif sefydliad gwleidyddol y genedl. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd yn sarhaus. Ni allwch ei esgusodi drwy ddweud ei fod yn ymateb i gwestiwn. Yr oedd yn ddatganiad clir, digamsyniol, yr oedd wedi ei ystyried yn llawn. Mae'n sarhaus i'r mwyafrif llethol o bobl yn y Siambr hon a ledled Cymru.

Lorraine Barrett: Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr oeddwn yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ddoe a gwnaethpwyd y sylwadau fel rhan o ddatganiad yr Athro. O dan yr un pwynt o drefn, codaf fy mhryder ynglŷn â'r sylwadau am dwpdra cywirdeb gwleidyddol amlddiwylliant. Fel yr Aelod dros Dde Caerdydd a Phenarth, ac o ystyried y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, teimlais fod ei sylwadau yn beryglus.

Dafydd Wigley: As someone who was present at the meeting in Swansea yesterday,

yn sylfaenol gyda dadansoddiad yr Athro Carter. Mae'n ddealladwy i bobl ymateb fel y mae rhai Aelodau wedi gwneud heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bobl yr hawl i'w barn, hyd yn oed pan anghytunwn â hwy. Credaf fod pob aelod o'r Pwyllgor yn anghytuno â'r dadansoddiad. Serch hynny, fel un o'r awdurdodau mwyaf ar ddaearyddiaeth iaith yng Nghymru, mae ganddo'r hawl i ddatgan ei farn a'r hawl i wrandawriad gan y Pwyllgor. Mae gennym ni'r hawl, fel Pwyllgor ac fel Cynulliad, i wrthod ei sylwadau.

Y Llywydd: Diolchaf i'r Aelodau sydd wedi mynegi'u barn. Pan godwyd y mater o roi tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor o'r blaen, fe'i ystyriwyd yn ddwys iawn gennyf fi a'r Dirprwy Lywydd, Clerc y Cynulliad, clerc y Pwyllgor ac—fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Diwylliant—gan Banel y Cadeiryddion. Mae'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn ymddiried y gwaith o gadeirio i Gadeiryddion Pwyllgorau. Mae Panel y Cadeiryddion yn Bwyllgor pwysig yn ein cyfansoddiad. Mae'n rhoi cyfle i Gadeiryddion i drafod arfer gorau. Mae Panel y Cadeiryddion wedi ystyried y mater hwn ac wedi'm cynghori nad ydynt o'r farn, ar hyn o bryd, ei bod yn briodol imi osod canllawiau ynglŷn â chynnwys tystiolaeth a roddir i Bwyllgorau. Fodd bynnag, pe byddai Aelod o'r Cynulliad hwn wedi gwneud y sylwadau ynglŷn â materion aml-ddiwylliannol y cyfeiriodd Lorraine Barrett atynt byddwn wedi datgan eu bod allan o drefn.

11:40 a.m.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the no named day motion tabled on 17 October 2001 on the approval of the Milk Marketing Board (Residuary Functions) (Amendment) Regulations 2001.

I disagree fundamentally with Professor Carter's analysis. It is understandable for people to respond as some Members have done today. However, people have a right to their opinion, even when we disagree with them. I believe that every member of the Committee disagreed with the analysis. However, as one of the greatest authorities on geolinguistics in Wales, he has a right to express his opinion and the right to a hearing from the Committee. We have the right, as a Committee and as an Assembly, to reject his comments.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Members who have expressed their opinions. When the issue of giving evidence to a Committee was raised previously, it was given very serious consideration by myself, the Deputy Presiding Officer, the Clerk to the Assembly, the Committee clerk and—as the Chair of the Culture Committee stated—by the Panel of Chairs. Standing Orders have entrusted the work of chairing Committees to the Chairs. The Panel of Chairs is an important Committee in our constitution. It affords Chairs the opportunity to discuss best practice. The Panel of Chairs has considered this issue and it has advised me that it is not currently of the opinion that it would be appropriate for me to set guidelines on the content of evidence given to Committees. However, had a Member of this Assembly made the comments regarding multicultural issues to which Lorraine Barrett referred I would have stated that they were out of order.

Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd ar 17 Hydref 2001 ar gymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth (Swyddogaethau sy'n Weddill) (Diwygio) 2001.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Jonathan
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 11.42 a.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 11.42 a.m.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth (Swyddogaethau sy'n
Weddill) (Diwygio) 2001
Approval of the Milk Marketing Board (Residuary Functions) (Amendment)
Regulations 2001**

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly, acting under y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn unol â Rheol
Standing Order No. 23.10, approves the draft Sefydlog Rhif 23.10, yn cymeradwyo*

the Milk Marketing Board (Residuary Functions) (Amendment) Regulations 2001, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2001. (NNDM801)

Rheoliadau'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth (Swyddogaethau sy'n Weddill) (Diwygio) 2001 drafft, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2001. (NNDM801)

Glyn Davies: I welcome this proposal. However, will the Minister express his disappointment that the current position is a result of a decision made by Stephen Byers when he was the Minister responsible for this issue? I believe that the Minister has commented on Stephen Byers's hapless performance, which has continued in his present ministry and has become obvious to the whole country over recent days. I am not sure whether the Minister described that performance so graphically—publicly or privately—but that is an indication of his view.

Glyn Davies: Croesawaf y cynnig hwn. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Gweinidog fynegi ei siom bod y sefyllfa bresennol yn deillio o benderfyniad a wnaethpwyd gan Stephen Byers pan oedd yn Weinidog â'r cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn? Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud sylwadau ar berfformiad truenus Stephen Byers, sydd wedi parhau yn ei weinidogaeth bresennol ac sydd wedi dod yn amlwg i'r wlad gyfan yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf. Nid wyf yn siŵr i'r Gweinidog roi disgrifiad mor fyw o'r perfformiad hwnnw—boed yn gyhoeddus neu'n breifat—ond mae hynny'n arwydd o'i farn.

That is significant because farmers and those involved in agriculture have known all along that the current position in terms of milk marketing is disastrous as a result of the performance of a hopeless individual. It is important that, where an Assembly Minister shares that view, it is expressed in the full glare of the public eye and that everybody should appreciate it.

Mae hynny yn arwyddocaol am fod ffermwyr a'r rhai sy'n ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth wedi bod yn ymwybodol trwy'r amser bod y sefyllfa bresennol o ran marchnata llaeth yn drychinebus o ganlyniad i berfformiad unigolyn anobeithiol. Mae'n bwysig bod unrhyw Weinidog o'r Cynulliad pan fo'n cyd-fynd a'r farn honno, yn ei mynegi yng ngŵydd y cyhoedd ac y dylai pawb ei gwerthfawrogi.

Carwyn Jones: These regulations deal with the Milk Marketing Board, which was abolished in 1994 by a Conservative Government, so I fail to see your point.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud â'r Bwrdd Marchnata Llaeth, a ddiddymwyd yn 1994 gan Lywodraeth Geidwadol, felly nid wyf yn deall eich pwynt.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Halford, Alison
 Hancock, Brian
 Hart, Edwina
 Jarman, Pauline
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Richards, Rod
 Rogers, Peter
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wigley, Dafydd
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Etholiadau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001 Approval of the Local Government Elections (Wales) Order 2001

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of William Graham to the first motion.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw William Graham ar gyfer y cynnig cyntaf.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the principle of the Local Government Elections (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001. (NNDM797)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Etholiadau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001. (NNDM797)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Local Government Elections (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001 and approves that the Order is made in

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig at unrhyw fater o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5, mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Etholiadau Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001 ac yn

accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001, the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 9 July 2001 and the supplemental memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 16 October 2001. (NNDM798)

As everybody will be aware, I undertook a consultation on the timing of local government elections as a result of Partnership Council discussions. A view had been expressed that the electoral arrangements of 1999 were not the best. I remind you that those arrangements were to hold county and county borough council elections and the National Assembly elections on one date in May, and town and community council elections on another date in June, which was also the date of elections to the European Parliament. Therefore, it was a full year in terms of elections.

I completed my consideration of the 328 responses to the consultation some time ago. Over two-thirds of respondents did not believe that the arrangements of 1999 should be repeated. A large majority of town and community councils responded with the view that they should revert to the tradition of being elected on the same day as the principal councils. Combining town and community council elections and county and county borough council elections with the National Assembly elections would make the arrangements substantially more complex than those of 1999. I have concluded that all these elections should not take place on the same day.

I have taken particular note of the view if the majority of returning officers, who said that separating the National Assembly and council elections would make the administration process easier. I therefore concluded that local government and National Assembly elections should take place on different dates. That would reduce confusion and, hopefully, encourage participation in democratic elections in Wales. It would help to clarify in the public's mind the accountability of local government and the National Assembly for their various responsibilities.

cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001, y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf a'r memorandwm cywiriadau atodol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Hydref 2001. (NNDM798)

Fel y gŵyr pawb, bûm yn ymgynghori ar amseriad etholiadau llywodraeth leol o ganlyniad i drafodaethau'r Cyngor Partneriaeth. Mynegwyd barn nad trefniadau etholiadol 1999 oedd y rhai gorau. Hoffwn eich atgoffa mai'r trefniadau hynny oedd cynnal etholiadau cynghorau sir a chynghorau bwrdeistref sirol ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar un dyddiad ym mis Mai, ac etholiadau cyngor tref a chymuned ar ddyddiad arall ym mis Mehefin, sef dyddiad yr etholiadau ar gyfer Senedd Ewrop hefyd. Felly, yr oedd yn flwyddyn lawn o ran etholiadau.

Cwblheais fy ystyriaeth o'r 328 o ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad beth amser yn ôl. Yr oedd mwy na dwy ran o dair o'r ymatebwyr yn credu na ddylid ailadrodd trefniadau 1999. Barn y mwyafrif helaeth o'r cynghorau tref a chymuned oedd y dylent ddychwelyd at y traddodiad o gael eu hethol ar yr un diwrnod â'r prif gynghorau. Byddai cyfuno etholiadau cynghorau tref a chymuned ac etholiadau cynghorau sir a chynghorau bwrdeistref sirol ag etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gwneud y trefniadau yn llawer mwy cymhleth na rhai 1999. Deuthum i'r casgliad na ddylid cynnal yr holl etholiadau hyn ar yr un diwrnod.

Nodais yn arbennig farn mwyafrif y swyddogion canlyniadau, a ddywedodd y byddai gwahanu etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac etholiadau'r cynghorau yn gwneud y broses weinyddu yn haws. Felly, deuthum i'r casgliad y dylai etholiadau llywodraeth leol ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael eu cynnal ar ddyddiadau gwahanol. Byddai hynny'n lleihau dryswch a, gobeithio, yn annog cyfranogiad mewn etholiadau democrataidd yng Nghymru. Byddai'n helpu i egluro ym meddwl y cyhoedd atebolrwydd llywodraeth leol a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dros eu cyfrifoldebau amrywiol.

The National Assembly should have its own election date in which each political party is judged on what it can offer to Wales's constituencies and the people. I have also concluded that the elections for county, county borough and town and community councils should take place on the same date. That is the wish of town and community councils, which do not want the expense of organising their own elections.

Having concluded that National Assembly elections should take place on one day and local government elections on another, I considered dates. Only 3 per cent of responses favoured bringing local elections forward to 2002. There were some respondents who favoured two separate dates in 2003. However, in my view, the electorate would not welcome separate elections at such short intervals. That has been proven over the years. I therefore concluded that the next local elections for county and county borough councils and town and community councils should be deferred until a single date in May 2004 and then revert to a four-year cycle.

My proposal will adjust the electoral cycle. The Assembly's Local Government and Housing Committee has considered the results of the consultation on the timing of elections. The Committee held mixed views. William Graham made the opposition of the Conservative Party clear.

William Graham: I propose the following amendments to the first motion. Amendment 1: after '19 June 2001' insert:

and in doing so recognises that voter fatigue accelerates the non-participation of the electorate in democratic elections.

I propose amendment 2. Insert a new sentence after '19 June 2001.':

The electorate in Wales voted their county, county borough and community councillors to an agreed and specified four-year term of office. It is wholly undemocratic to disregard

Dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gael ei ddyddiad ei hun ar gyfer etholiad lle y bernir pob plaid wleidyddol ar yr hyn y gall ei gynnig i etholaethau Cymru a phobl Cymru. Deuthum i'r casgliad hefyd y dylai etholiadau ar gyfer cynghorau sir, cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorau tref a chymuned gael eu cynnal ar yr un diwrnod. Dyna ddymuniad y cynghorau tref a chymuned, nad ydynt am wynebu'r gost o drefnu eu hetholiadau eu hunain.

Ar ôl dod i'r casgliad y dylid cynnal etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar un diwrnod ac etholiadau llywodraeth leol ar ddiwrnod arall, ystyriais ddyddiadau. Dim ond 3 y cant o'r ymatebion a oedd o blaid cynnal yr etholiadau lleol yn 2002. Yr oedd rhai o'r ymatebwyr o blaid dau ddyddiad gwahanol yn 2003. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i, ni fyddai'r etholwyr yn croesawu etholiadau ar wahân gyda chyfnodau mor fyr rhyngddynt. Profwyd hynny dros y blynyddoedd. Felly deuthum i'r casgliad y dylid gohirio'r etholiadau lleol nesaf ar gyfer cynghorau sir a chynghorau bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorau tref a chymuned tan un dyddiad ym mis Mai 2004 gan ddychwelyd wedyn at gylch pedair blynedd.

Bydd fy nghynnig yn addasu'r cylch etholiadol. Mae Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y Cynulliad wedi ystyried canlyniadau'r ymgynghoriad ar amseriad etholiadau. Yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor safbwyntiau cymysg. Mynegodd William Graham wrthwynebiad y Blaid Geidwadol yn glir.

William Graham: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol. Gwelliant 1: ychwaneger ar ôl '19 Mehefin 2001':

ac wrth wneud hynny yn cydnabod bod blinder pleidleiswyr yn cyfrannu at y ffaith nad yw'r etholwyr yn cymryd rhan mewn etholiadau democrataidd.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwaneger brawddeg newydd ar ôl '19 Mehefin 2001.':

pleidleisiodd etholwyr Cymru i ethol eu cynghorwyr sir, bwrdeistref sirol a chymuned am gyfnod cytunedig a phenodedig o bedair blynedd yn y swydd. Mae'n hollol

this decision for the proposed reasons and without a wider consultation with the people.

annemocrataidd fod y penderfyniad hwn yn cael ei anwybyddu am y rhesymau a gynigir a heb ymgynghori'n ehangach â phobl Cymru.

I declare an interest as a member of Newport County Borough Council.

Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd.

This month, the commission on local government electoral arrangements in Wales has received representations via written submissions at public evidence sessions. All these responses sought to address the fundamental issue, of how we increase participation in local government elections. Everyone who has an interest in increasing democracy will act, because one reason clearly identified as a cause of people not exercising their right to vote, is frustration and disillusionment with the political process at all levels. The record-breaking low turnout in the general election and the National Assembly's recent Swansea East by-election fully illustrates that.

Y mis hwn, derbyniodd y comisiwn ar drefniadau etholiadol llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru sylwadau drwy gyflwyniadau ysgrifenedig mewn sesiynau tystiolaeth cyhoeddus. Ceisiodd pob un o'r ymatebion hyn ymdrin â'r mater sylfaenol o sut i gynyddu cyfranogiad mewn etholiadau llywodraeth leol. Bydd pawb sydd â diddordeb mewn cynyddu democratiaeth yn gweithredu, oherwydd un o'r rhesymau amlwg pam nad yw pobl yn ymarfer eu hawl i bleidleisio yw rhwystredigaeth a dadrithiad â'r broses wleidyddol ar bob lefel. Mae'r nifer isaf erioed o bobl a bleidleisiodd yn yr etholiad cyffredinol ac isetholiad diweddar Dwyrain Abertawe yn enghraifft dda o hynny.

Permanently separating the National Assembly and local government elections and placing them a year apart will intensify voter fatigue. Some will argue that these elections are only held every four years. However, when you consider all the other elections that are held, a different picture appears. If this motion is carried today, we commit the electorate of Wales to the possibility of an election every year from 2003 until 2011, with the exception of 2005 and 2010. A referendum on the single European currency could also be held during this period. National Assembly elections will be held in 2003. County, county borough and community council elections and European Parliament elections would be held in 2004. It is possible that a general election will be held in 2006. National Assembly elections will be held again in 2007. County, county borough and community council elections will be held in 2008 and the European Parliament elections will be held in 2009. There could be a general election in 2010 and National Assembly elections in 2011. Enforcing this order of elections on the people of Wales would be a democratic disaster. It would be likely to destroy any recommendations made by the commission on local government electoral arrangements

Bydd gwahanu etholiad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn barhaol a'u gosod flwyddyn ar wahân yn dwysáu blinder pleidleiswyr. Bydd rhai yn dadlau mai dim ond unwaith bob pedair blynedd y cynhelir yr etholiadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, pan ystyriwch yr holl etholiadau eraill a gynhelir, mae'r darlun yn un gwahanol iawn. Os cymeradwyir y cynnig hwn heddiw, byddwn yn ymrwymo etholwyr Cymru i'r posibilrwydd o gynnal etholiad bob blwyddyn o 2003 tan 2011, ac eithrio 2005 a 2010. Gellid cynnal refferendwm ar arian sengl Ewrop hefyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwn. Cynhelir etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2003. Byddai etholiadau cynghorau sir, cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorau cymuned yn cael eu cynnal yn 2004. Mae'n bosibl y caiff etholiad cyffredinol ei gynnal yn 2006. Cynhelir etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol unwaith eto yn 2007. Cynhelir etholiadau cynghorau sir, cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorau cymuned yn 2008 ac etholiadau Senedd Ewrop yn 2009. Gallai etholiad cyffredinol gael ei gynnal yn 2010 ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 2011. Byddai gorfodi'r drefn hon o etholiadau ar bobl Cymru yn drychineb ddemocrataidd. Byddai'n debygol o ddifetha unrhyw

in Wales.

The National Assembly elections were held on the same day as the county council elections in May 1999. We pride ourselves on having the most sophisticated electorate in the world. It understands the significance of voting for its Assembly Members and county and community councillors with a single visit to a polling station. Holding these elections on the same day gives the electorate the best opportunity to ensure that its views are reflected in a ballot. Can we think of another opportunity to encourage the electorate to use its vote other than by holding these elections on the same day?

We have every confidence in our returning officers' and their staff's ability to administer these elections on the same day with their usual efficiency and fairness.

All our county and community councillors stood for election in 1999, accepting an agreed and specified four-year term of office. The electorate of Wales voted for these councillors for that term of office. It is wholly undemocratic to disregard that decision for the proposed reasons and without wider consultation.

The commission on local government electoral arrangements in Wales seeks to encourage the highest participation in our democracy. What message will we send to the electoral commission and the electorate if we agree to this proposal? There will be little justification from the proposer. This is another smash-and-grab raid by the Labour Party, which is supported by the Liberal Democrats, to ensure their political dominance in Wales. We have heard little from Plaid Cymru on this issue. The proposed measures only seek to perpetuate dominance.

11:50 a.m.

Peter Law: I am pleased to support the Minister's common sense proposal to

argymhellion a wnaethpwyd gan y comisiwn ar drefniadau etholiadol llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

Cynhaliwyd etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar yr un diwrnod ag etholiadau'r cynghorau sir ym mis Mai 1999. Ymfalchïwn yn y ffaith bod gennym yr etholwyr mwyaf soffistigedig yn y byd. Deallant arwyddocâd pleidleisio dros eu Haelodau Cynulliad a chynghorwyr sir a chymuned gydag un ymweliad â gorsaf bleidleisio. Drwy gynnal yr etholiadau hyn ar yr un diwrnod caiff yr etholwyr y cyfle gorau i sicrhau yr adlewyrchir eu safbwyntiau mewn pleidlais. A allwn feddwl am gyfle arall i annog yr etholwyr i ddefnyddio eu pleidleisiau heblaw drwy gynnal yr etholiadau hyn ar yr un diwrnod?

Mae gennym bob ffydd yn ein swyddogion canlyniadau a gallu eu staff i weinyddu'r etholiadau hyn ar yr un diwrnod gyda'u heffeithlonrwydd a'u tegwch arferol.

Safodd pob un o'n cynghorwyr sir a chymuned fel ymgeiswyr yn 1999, gan dderbyn cyfnod mewn swydd cytûn a phenodol o bedair blynedd. Pleidleisiodd etholwyr Cymru dros y cynghorwyr hyn am y cyfnod hwnnw mewn swydd. Mae'n hollol annemocrataidd anwybyddu'r penderfyniad hwnnw am y rhesymau a nodir a heb ymgynghori ymhellach.

Mae'r comisiwn ar drefniadau etholiadol llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn ceisio annog y cyfranogiad mwyaf yn ein democratiaeth. Pa neges a anfonwn i'r comisiwn etholiadol a'r etholwyr os cytunwn i'r cynnig hwn? Ni fydd llawer o gyfiawnhad gan y cynigiwr. Lladrad dwyn a dianc arall yw hyn gan y Blaid Lafur gyda chefnogaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn tra-arglwyddiaethu'n wleidyddol yng Nghymru. Ni chlywsom lawer gan Blaid Cymru ar y mater hwn. Dim ond ceisio parhau â goruchafiaeth a wna'r mesurau arfaethedig hyn.

Peter Law: Yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi cynnig synhwyrol y Gweinidog i ohirio etholiadau'r

postpone the county, county borough and community council elections until 2004. That makes sense. It is only because of division and mayhem, which we expect from the Conservatives, that these amendments have been tabled. A majority approved this proposal in the Local Government and Housing Committee meeting in July, because they had common sense.

In the 1999 elections, there was confusion when people were faced with so many different ballot papers and the new lottery of proportional representation, from which the Tories have benefited. The Tories may have a vested interest in seeing that confusion continue, because eight of them were elected as a result of that lottery system. They have done well out of it. That is the party that did not believe in devolution. It did not believe in the Assembly, but eight Conservative Members are sitting here as a result of PR. If you look at them in detail, you will see that a few of them belong to the millionaires' holiday club. The Assembly is a millionaires' holiday club for the Tories to some extent. The fact is that we are talking about the Conservative Party, which is in terminal decline in the UK. It is politically dead in Wales and yet tries to talk to us about democracy. These are the people who parachuted in the NHS trust—

David Davies: The Member does not seem to realise that we did not believe in proportional representation and we did not believe in the Assembly. It was foisted upon us. However, we are here because we believe in playing by the rules and by the constitution that is given to us. The Labour Party set the rules. If he does not like it, then he should not have supported it in the first place.

Peter Law: We all know what you supported. We know how you fought the 'no' campaign and we will never forget that. Talking about democracy, we remember the 20 national health service trusts that you parachuted in overnight, which you stuffed full of Conservative nominees. We all know about the Conservatives' approach to democracy—[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Quango man.']

cynghorau sir, cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorau cymuned tan 2004. Mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Dim ond oherwydd ymranïad ac anhrefn, a ddisgwyliwn gan y Ceidwadwyr, y cyflwynwyd y gwelliannau hyn. Cymeradwywyd y cynnig hwn gan fwyafrif yn y pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ym mis Gorffennaf, gan fod ganddynt synnwyr cyffredin.

Yn etholiadau 1999, bu dryswch pan wynebodd pobl gymaint o bapurau pleidleisio gwahanol a loteri newydd cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, y mae'r Torïaid wedi elwa arni. Efallai y budd y Torïaid yn elwa ar weld y dryswch hwnnw yn parhau, oherwydd etholwyd wyth ohonynt o ganlyniad i'r system loteri honno. Gwnaethant yn dda o ganlyniad iddi. Dyna'r blaid nad oedd yn credu mewn datganoli. Ni chredai yn y Cynulliad, ond mae wyth Aelod Ceidwadol yn eistedd yma o ganlyniad i gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Os edrychwch arnynt yn fanwl, fe welwch fod rhai ohonynt yn perthyn i glwb gwyliau'r miliwnyddion. Mae'r Cynulliad yn glwb gwyliau miliwnyddion i'r Torïaid i ryw raddau. Y ffaith yw ein bod yn sôn am y Blaid Geidwadol sy'n darfod amdani yn y DU. Mae'n wleidyddol farw yng Nghymru ac eto mae'n ceisio sôn wrthym am ddemocratiaeth. Dyma'r bobl a gyflwynodd ymddiriedolaeth yr NHS—

David Davies: Efallai nad yw'r Aelod yn sylweddoli nad oeddem yn credu mewn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol ac nad oeddem yn credu yn y Cynulliad. Cafodd ei orfodi arnom. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yma gan ein bod yn credu mewn chwarae yn ôl y rheolau ac yn ôl y cyfansoddiad a roddir inni. Y Blaid Lafur a osododd y rheolau. Os nad yw'n ei hoffi, yna ni ddylai fod wedi ei gefnogi yn y lle cyntaf.

Peter Law: Gŵyr pob un ohonom beth yr oeddech chi'n ei gefnogi. Gwyddom sut yr ymladdwyd yr ymgyrch 'na' gennych ac ni wnawn byth anghofio hynny. Wrth sôn am ddemocratiaeth, cofiwn am yr 20 o ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a gyflwynwyd gennych dros nos, ac a lenwyd gennych gydag enwebeion Ceidwadol. Gŵyr pob un ohonom am ymagwedd y Ceidwadwyr tuag at ddemocratiaeth—[AELODAU CEIDWADOL Y

CYNULLIAD: 'Dyn cwango.']

I came after. We must remember that it was the Tories who wanted to centralise power. They took away power from local government. It is, therefore, hypocritical for them—in particular for William Graham, who enjoyed an extension of his term as a county councillor in 1995—to criticise this proposal, because it is not the first time that this has been done. It was done in 1973 and in 1995. An extension was granted because of local government reorganisation and I did not see the Tories jumping up and down then. He, hypocritically, was one of those who took advantage of it—

William Graham: Regrettably, like Peter's grasp on most things, that is inaccurate. I was not a councillor in 1995.

Peter Law: I withdraw my comments. I am delighted to remember that we defeated you at the ballot box and you were thrown to one side. That is correct. [*Laughter.*]

However, there were other Conservative councillors in Wales—there were a few—who would have taken advantage of that extension. My colleague, Rosemary Butler, has reminded me that there was a Conservative councillor in Newport. There were some misguided people who voted for the Conservative Party.

This proposal is sensible. It is not the first time that this has happened. We need to have a special general election day for Wales, because of the importance of devolution and the Assembly. That is why the Minister is right. I am pleased to support her and I believe that most Members will support this motion.

Jocelyn Davies: I am sorry to have to disagree with Peter, because I do not normally do so, but Plaid Cymru opposes the Government's proposals to extend the current term of office of county, county borough and community councillors in Wales by a year. It is not a stance that we have taken hastily. We undertook a consultation within the party, which was approved by our councillors' association and national executive. I will not

Deuthum innau wedyn. Rhaid inni gofio mai'r Toriaid oedd y rhai a oedd yn dymuno canoli pŵer. Aethant â'r pŵer oddi ar lywodraeth leol. Felly, mae'n rhagrithiol iddynt hwy—yn enwedig William Graham, a gafodd dymor estynedig fel cynghorydd sir yn 1995—feirniadu'r cynnig hwn, gan nad dyma'r tro cyntaf i hyn gael ei wneud. Fe'i gwnaethpwyd yn 1973 ac yn 1995. Caniatawyd estyniad oherwydd ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol ac ni welais y Toriaid yn neidio i fyny ac i lawr bryd hynny. Yn rhagrithiol, ef oedd un o'r rhai a fanteisiodd ar hynny—

William Graham: Yn anffodus, fel gafael Peter ar y rhan fwyaf o bethau, mae hynny'n anghywir. Nid oeddwn yn gynghorydd yn 1995.

Peter Law: Tynnaf fy sylwadau yn ôl. Yr wyf yn falch o gofio inni eich trechu yn y blwch pleidleisio ac ichi gael eich taflu o'r neilltu. Mae hynny'n gywir. [*Chwerthin.*]

Fodd bynnag, yr oedd cynghorwyr Ceidwadol eraill yng Nghymru—ambell un—a fyddai wedi manteisio ar yr estyniad hwnnw. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Rosemary Butler, wedi'm hatgoffa bod cynghorydd Ceidwadol yng Nghasnewydd. Cafodd rhai pobl eu camarwain i bleidleisio dros y Plaid Geidwadol.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn un synhwyrol. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf i hyn ddigwydd. Mae angen inni gael diwrnod etholiad cyffredinol arbennig i Gymru, oherwydd pwysigrwydd datganoli a'r Cynulliad. Dyna pam y mae'r Gweinidog yn gywir. Mae'n bleser gennyf ei chefnogi a chredaf y bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf orfod anghytuno â chi Peter, oherwydd nid wyf fel arfer yn gwneud hynny, ond mae Plaid Cymru yn gwrthwynebu cynigion y Llywodraeth i ychwanegu blwyddyn at gyfnod presennol mewn swydd y cynghorwyr sir, bwrdeistref sirol a chynghorwyr cymuned yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n safiad a wnaethom yn fyrbwyll. Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad o fewn y blaid, a gymeradwywyd gan

pretend that the party's view is united. However, the most popular option by far was to hold the next council elections, as originally intended, in 2003 to coincide with the National Assembly elections.

This proposal is undemocratic. The Government is misleading the electorate. After all, at the last elections, people understood that they were electing their councillors for a fixed term of four years. They had a mandate to serve for four years, not five. The tenure of councils should not be changed on a whim because Labour did not like the outcome last time. The Minister suggests that this decision was taken after consultation. I accept that, but with whom? It was taken with the people who currently hold office. Was any consultation undertaken with voters, the people whom this decision affects? There was no public consultation, as far as I am aware. The Minister consults those with a direct financial interest. Are we surprised that they want an extra year? The vested interest is blatant and that is unacceptable. The direct financial interest is obvious and those in my group who are councillors will abstain on this motion today.

One of the Minister's reasons for proposing this Order is rather patronising. She claims that the electorate was confused during the 1999 elections—when some constituencies did not vote for a Labour candidate. Peter Law agrees with that. Does the Minister believe that the Welsh electorate cannot cope with more than two ballot papers? Where is the evidence for that? Those of us who scrutinised spoiled ballot papers could see that it was obvious that the majority of them—

Gwenda Thomas *rose*—

Jocelyn Davies: I have nearly finished. Those of us who scrutinised the ballot papers could see that the vast majority of those spoiled were deliberately spoiled. It was not accidental. If the Government believes that Welsh voters are so easily confused, it should

gymdeithas y cynghorwyr a'r pwyllgor gwaith cenedlaethol. Ni honnaf fod barn y blaid yn unedig. Fodd bynnag, yr opsiwn mwyaf poblogaidd o bell ffordd oedd cynnal etholiadau nesaf y cyngor, fel y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol, yn 2003, i gyd-fynd ag etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn annemocrataidd. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn camarwain yr etholwyr. Wedi'r cyfan, yn yr etholiadau diwethaf, deallodd pobl eu bod yn ethol eu cynghorwyr am dymor sefydlog o bedair blynedd. Yr oedd ganddynt fandad i wasanaethu am bedair blynedd, nid pump. Ni ddylid newid daliadaeth cynghorau yn fymrwylol am nad oedd Llafur yn hoffi'r canlyniad y tro diwethaf. Awgryma'r Gweinidog y gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwn ar ôl ymgynghori. Derbyniaf hynny, ond gyda phwy? Fe'i gwnaethpwyd gyda'r bobl sy'n dal swyddi ar hyn o bryd. A ymgynghorwyd o gwbl â'r pleidleiswyr, y bobl y mae'r penderfyniad hwn yn effeithio arnynt? Ni fu unrhyw ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus, hyd y gwn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymgynghori â'r rhai sydd â buddiant ariannol uniongyrchol. A ydym yn synnu eu bod am gael blwyddyn ychwanegol? Mae'r budd iddynt hwy yn amlwg ac mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Mae'r buddiant ariannol uniongyrchol yn amlwg a bydd y rheini yn fy ngrŵp i sy'n gynghorwyr yn ymatal ar y cynnig hwn heddiw.

Mae un o resymau'r Gweinidog dros gynnig y Gorchymyn hwn braidd yn nawddoglyd. Honna fod yr etholwyr wedi drysu yn ystod etholiadau 1999—pan na phleidleisiodd rhai o'r etholaethau dros ymgeisydd Llafur. Cytuna Peter Law â hynny. A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu na all etholwyr Cymru ymdopi â mwy na dau bapur pleidleisio? Ym mha le y mae'r dystiolaeth ar gyfer hynny? Gallai'r rheini ohonom a graffodd ar bapurau pleidleisio a ddifethwyd weld ei bod yn amlwg bod y mwyafrif ohonynt—

Gwenda Thomas *a gododd*—

Jocelyn Davies: Yr wyf bron â gorffen. Gallai'r rheini ohonom a graffodd ar y papurau pleidleisio weld bod y mwyafrif helaeth o'r rheini a oedd wedi eu difetha yn rhai a ddifethwyd yn fwiadol. Nid damwain ydoedd. Os cred y Llywodraeth fod

launch a public education programme to explain the voting system rather than change the election date. I have more confidence in the Welsh electorate than the Minister. You cannot get people to vote Labour, simply by changing the election date. You must work harder than that.

We will abstain on the vote on William Graham's amendments, because we would prefer to vote against the motion than to amend it. I agree with Peter Law on the Conservatives. I remind the Conservative group that its party extended the tenure of county councils in 1995 by a year, because it suited it to do so, when it wanted to accommodate local government reorganisation.

Tom Middlehurst: I take issue with the Conservatives, and, after Jocelyn's contribution, with Plaid Cymru. This proposal is wholly democratic. The use of the word 'undemocratic' cannot be justified in this context. To use it is to fail to recognise devolution, which has brought about this democratically elected institution. Powers are invested in this institution to take decisions on behalf of the people of Wales. We are empowered to make a decision on this proposal under our democratically elected mandate. Will William Graham comment on this democratic system, which has yielded eight Conservative Members through the back door of proportional representation? PR is not the solution to voter apathy. I make my position clear on that. However, there is nothing undemocratic about what we have been asked to do today. On the contrary, supporting the deferment of local government elections can be seen as an act that will enhance the democratic process and separate—

David Davies: Rather than asking us to comment on the system of PR, the Minister should ask her colleague, Ron Davies. He was the one who introduced PR, not the Conservatives. Do not blame us for a system that was foisted upon us.

Tom Middlehurst: I do not blame you for

pleidleiswyr Cymru yn drysu mor hawdd, dylai lansio rhaglen addysg gyhoeddus i egluro'r system bleidleisio yn hytrach na newid dyddiad yr etholiad. Mae gennyf fwy o hyder yn etholwyr Cymru na'r Gweinidog. Ni allwch gael pobl i bleidleisio i Lafur, dim ond drwy newid dyddiad yr etholiad. Rhaid ichi weithio'n galetach na hynny.

Byddwn yn ymatal ar y bleidlais ar welliannau William Graham, oherwydd byddai'n well gennym bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig na'i ddiwygio. Cytunaf â Peter Law ynglŷn â'r Ceidwadwyr. Atgoffaf y grŵp Ceidwadol fod ei blaid wedi ychwanegu blwyddyn at ddaliadaeth y cynghorau sir yn 1995, gan ei fod yn gyfleus iddi wneud hynny, pan oedd am ddarparu ar gyfer ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol.

Tom Middlehurst: Anghytunaf â'r Ceidwadwyr, ac, ar ôl cyfraniad Jocelyn, â Phlaid Cymru. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn gwbl ddemocrataidd. Ni ellir cyfiawnhau'r defnydd o'r gair 'annemocrataidd' yn y cyd-destun hwn. Mae ei ddefnyddio yn golygu methu â chydabod datganoli, sydd wedi arwain at y sefydliad hwn a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Buddsoddir pwerau yn y sefydliad hwn i gymryd penderfyniadau ar ran pobl Cymru. Mae'r awdurdod gennym i wneud penderfyniad ar y cynnig hwn o dan ein mandad a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. A wnaiff William Graham roi ei sylwadau ar y system ddemocrataidd hon, sydd wedi cynhyrchu wyth Aelod Ceidwadol drwy ddrws cefn cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol? Nid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol yw'r ateb i ddifaterwch pleidleiswyr. Mae fy safbwynt ar hynny yn glir. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim yn annemocrataidd ynglŷn â'r hyn y gofynnwyd inni ei wneud heddiw. I'r gwrthwyneb, gellir ystyried cefnogi oedi etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn weithred a fydd yn gwella'r broses ddemocrataidd ac yn gwahanu—

David Davies: Yn hytrach na gofyn inni roi ein sylwadau ar y system o gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, dylai'r Gweinidog ofyn i'w chyd-Aelod, Ron Davies. Ef oedd yr un a gyflwynodd gynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, nid y Ceidwadwyr. Peidiwch â'n beio ni am system a wthiwyd arnom.

Tom Middlehurst: Nid wyf yn eich beio chi

the system, but I do blame the system for producing the Conservative Members in this Chamber.

I contend that this proposal is wholly democratic. It will enhance the democratic process and separate the local government and National Assembly elections, which are important. It will help to clarify the distinct roles and functions of both democratic institutions. I firmly believe that this is in the best long-term interests of democracy in Wales and the people whom we represent.

Rod Richards: If he believes that this is democratic, would he be prepared to consider extending the term of office of independent Members in this Chamber?

12:00 p.m.

Tom Middlehurst: That is a good try, but that decision would not rest with us, Rod.

There has been widespread consideration of this proposal, how to achieve the separation it entails and when the new arrangements should take effect. It is worth reminding ourselves that there is widespread support for this in local government. Jocelyn suggested that it has a vested interest. However, the leader of Gwynedd County Council, Alun Ffred Jones, supports it. Jocelyn was honest enough to admit that there is widespread division in her party on this issue. Alun Ffred Jones supports this proposal along with other leading Plaid Cymru members in local government.

Returning officers have raised important practical considerations. There are difficulties in conducting a whole raft of elections through different systems on one day. The electorate is sophisticated but this is an enormous challenge. Deferring the elections for one year is the best solution in the long term.

Alun Cairns: It will not surprise you that I reject this motion and support William Graham's amendments. The true purpose of this motion is to give an additional year to Liberal Democrat and Labour Councillors, who know that they would not be re-elected

am y system, ond yr wyf yn beio'r system am gynhyrchu'r Aelodau Ceidwadol sydd yn y Siambr hon.

Dadleuaf fod y cynnig hwn yn gwbl ddemocrataidd. Bydd yn gwella'r broses ddemocrataidd ac yn gwahanu etholiadau llywodraeth leol ac etholiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sy'n bwysig. Bydd yn helpu i egluro rolau a swyddogaethau penodol y ddau sefydliad democrataidd. Credaf yn gryf fod hyn er budd hirdymor i ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru a'r bobl a gynrychiolwn.

Rod Richards: Os cred fod hyn yn ddemocrataidd, a fyddai'n barod i ystyried ymestyn cyfnod mewn swydd Aelodau annibynnol yn y Siambr hon?

Tom Middlehurst: Mae hynny'n gynnig da, ond nid ein penderfyniad ni fyddai hynny, Rod.

Rhodddwyd ystyriaeth eang i'r cynnig hwn, sut i gyflawni'r gwahaniad y byddai'n ei olygu a phryd y dylai'r trefniadau newydd ddod i rym. Mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain bod cefnogaeth eang i hyn mewn llywodraeth leol. Awgrymodd Jocelyn fod llywodraeth leol yn elwa ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae arweinydd Cyngor Sir Gwynedd, Alun Ffred Jones, o'i blaid. Yr oedd Jocelyn yn ddigon gonest i gyfaddef bod ymraniad eang yn ei phlaid ar y mater hwn. Cefnoga Alun Ffred Jones y cynnig hwn ynghyd ag aelodau blaenllaw eraill o Blaid Cymru mewn llywodraeth leol.

Mae swyddogion canlyniadau wedi codi ystyriaethau ymarferol pwysig. Mae anawsterau wrth gynnal llond gwlad o etholiadau drwy systemau gwahanol ar un diwrnod. Mae'r etholwyr yn soffistigedig ond mae hon yn her enfawr. Yr ateb gorau yn yr hirdymor yw gohirio'r etholiadau am flwyddyn.

Alun Cairns: Ni fydd yn eich synnu i glywed fy mod yn gwrthod y cynnig hwn ac yn cefnogi gwelliannau William Graham. Gwir bwrpas y cynnig hwn yw rhoi blwyddyn ychwanegol i Gynghorwyr plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r blaid Lafur,

if they placed their record before the electorate. However, the people of Wales have the right to judge their performance.

We heard from Peter Law and, of course, we all know the history of Blaenau Gwent and the difficulties that it has encountered in the past. Is it not right that the people had an opportunity to judge at that time? I am sorry that they did not support the Welsh Conservative Party en masse, however, who knows, bearing in mind how the area has deteriorated still further, the Welsh Conservative Party might yet have a swing to power in Blaenau Gwent.

Swansea City and County Council commissioned an independent report by the Improvement and Development Agency. It will not surprise you that, in last week's *South Wales Evening Post*, the headline 'hall of blame' appeared, which showed clearly the disease that is spreading from the heart of Swansea council. Is it not right that the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities give her electors the right to vote on the performance of the City and County of Swansea, bearing in mind the 'hall of blame' and the disease that is spreading from within that local authority? We have seen and witnessed—

David Davies: Does the Member recall that about a year ago, one of the Liberal Democrat Members for Swansea raised this subject, but seems to be strangely silent on it these days?

Alun Cairns: I recall that incident and I look forward to a further intervention, possibly from the Liberal Democrat whom you mentioned. We will judge him by his actions, as the Minister for Assembly Business said earlier.

The reality is that the electors voted these councillors in for a four-year term of office. Let us judge them on the performance of four years. We have all witnessed and experienced the Labour Party's gerrymandering in Wales in the past. We all know how the borders have changed. We know about how the building of social housing in marginal wards has been completed. One of the most

sy'n gwybod na chaent eu hail-ethol pe baent yn cyflwyno'r hyn y maent wedi ei gyflawni gerbron yr etholwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bobl Cymru yr hawl i farnu eu perfformiad.

Clywsom gan Peter Law ac, wrth gwrs, fe w'yr pob un ohonom am hanes Blaenau Gwent a'r anawsterau a wynebodd yn y gorffennol. Onid yw'n iawn bod y bobl wedi cael cyfle i farnu ar yr adeg honno? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na chefnogwyd Plaid Geidwadol Cymru ganddynt yn llw, fodd bynnag, pwy a w'yr, o gofio sut y mae'r ardal wedi dirywio ymhellach fyth, efallai y daw Plaid Geidwadol Cymru i rym eto ym Mlaenau Gwent.

Comisiynodd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe adroddiad annibynnol gan yr Asiantaeth Gwella a Datblygu. Ni fydd yn eich synnu i glywed bod y pennawd 'hall of blame' wedi ymddangos yn y *South Wales Evening Post* yr wythnos diwethaf, a ddangosodd yn eglur yr haint sy'n lledaenu o ganol Cyngor Abertawe. Nid yw'n iawn bod y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn rhoi'r hawl i'w hetholwyr bleidleisio ar berfformiad Dinas a Sir Abertawe, o gofio'r 'hall of blame' a'r haint sy'n lledaenu o fewn yr awdurdod lleol? Yr ydym wedi gweld a thystio—

David Davies: A yw'r Aelod yn cofio i un o Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol dros Abertawe, tua blwyddyn yn ôl, godi'r mater hwn, ond ei fod yn rhyfedd o dawel yn ei gylch y dyddiau hyn?

Alun Cairns: Cofiaf y digwyddiad hwnnw ac edrychaf ymlaen at ymyriad pellach, o bosibl gan y Democrat Rhyddfrydol a grybwyllwyd gennyh. Byddwn yn ei farnu yn ôl ei weithredoedd, fel y dywedodd y Trefnydd yn gynharach.

Y realiti yw bod yr etholwyr wedi pleidleisio dros y cynghorwyr hyn am gyfnod o bedair blynedd mewn swydd. Gadewch inni eu barnu ar berfformiad pedair blynedd. Mae pob un ohonom wedi profi a thystio i gyffindwylo'r Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol. Gwyddom oll fod y ffiniau wedi newid. Gwyddom am y modd y cwblhawyd y gwaith o adeiladu tai

democratic decisions taken by the last Conservative Government was to stop Labour councils building new council houses. We all know that those houses would have been built within marginal wards where Labour knew it could not win without building social housing.

We do not need to listen to quango man talking about democracy. Peter Law was a member of more quangos than any other Assembly Member. What sort of democracy is that? This comes from an administration that was elected on the platform of a bonfire of the quangos—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This motion has been tightly drafted. It is about extending the period of office for councillors. I would be grateful if you returned to the subject.

Alun Cairns: This breaks the democratic tradition in this country. People have the right to judge councils such like Swansea City and County Council when they read reports like the 'hall of blame'.

I will respond to the points made about proportional representation. We did not support the establishment of the Assembly, but we are prepared to make it work. We do not support proportional representation, but neither do the Liberal Democrats support the first-past-the-post electoral system. Why, therefore, do they stand for election under that system? We do not make the rules, but we are prepared to play by them.

Peter Black: I declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council. I have checked the partnership agreement, but this proposal is not included in it. I will not, therefore, try to claim credit for it.

The Liberal Democrats support this motion. We are in favour of separating the elections, so that people are clear about whether they are voting in a Welsh general election, or on the record of local councils. In line with Alun Cairns's comments, I am sure that when the people of Swansea vote, they will vote on the

cymdeithasol mewn wardiau ymylol. Un o'r penderfyniadau mwyaf democrataidd a gymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf oedd atal cynghorau Llafur rhag adeiladu tai cyngor newydd. Gŵyr pob un ohonom y byddai'r tai hynny wedi cael eu hadeiladu o fewn wardiau ymylol lle y gwyddai Llafur na allai ennill heb adeiladu tai cymdeithasol.

Nid oes angen inni wrando ar ddyn cwango yn sôn am ddemocratiaeth. Yr oedd Peter Law yn aelod o fwy o gwangos nag unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad. Pa fath o ddemocratiaeth yw hynny? Daw hyn gan weinyddiaeth a etholwyd ar lwyfan coelcerth y cwangos—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Cafodd y cynnig hwn ei ddrafftio'n dynn. Mae a wnelo ag ymestyn y cyfnod mewn swydd i gynghorwyr. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn dychwelyd at y pwnc.

Alun Cairns: Mae hyn yn chwalu'r traddodiad democrataidd yn y wlad hon. Mae gan bobl yr hawl i farnu cynghorau fel Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe pan ddarllenent adroddiadau fel '*hall of blame*'.

Ymatebaf i'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd ynglŷn â chynrychiolaeth gyfrannol. Nid oeddem o blaid sefydlu'r Cynulliad, ond yr ydym yn barod i wneud iddo weithio. Nid ydym o blaid cynrychiolaeth gyfrannol, ond nid yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o blaid system etholiadol y cyntaf yn y ras ychwaith. Pam, felly, y maent yn sefyll fel ymgeiswyr o dan y system honno? Er nad ydym yn gwneud y rheolau, yr ydym yn barod i gadw atynt.

Peter Black: Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe. Yr wyf wedi darllen y cytundeb partneriaeth, ond nid yw'r cynnig hwn ynddo. Felly, ni cheisiaf hawlio'r clod amdano.

Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o blaid y cynnig hwn. Yr ydym o blaid gwahanu'r etholiadau, fel y gŵyr pobl pa un ai pleidleisio mewn etholiad cyffredinol ar gyfer Cymru y maent, neu ar record cynghorau lleol. Yn unol â sylwadau Alun Cairns, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl Abertawe,

record of the council, as much as on the record of all other councils, because there will be a clear choice before them. They will not have the confusion of having more than one ballot paper, and different campaigns going on at the same time. It is important to consider that when discussing whether to separate the elections.

This option is not the Liberal Democrats' preferred option. We would have preferred to separate the elections by holding the election in 2003 for a three-year term. However, we had no support for that in the consultation, or from other parties. We therefore support this proposal as the next best option. The key factor in deciding that was the returning officers' support for this change. It is important that we note the wishes of those professional people as regards organising elections, and their concerns about how the 1999 elections were organised and the confusion among the electorate.

This is the most practical option, particularly as the timing of community council elections must be taken into account. They were held on the same day as the European parliamentary elections in 1999. That will not be an option in 2003, and you cannot hold three elections on one day. Therefore, if the local authority elections were held on the same day as the Assembly elections in 2003, the community council elections would have to be held on a different day. That would have been contrary to the community councils' wishes and contrary to common sense. It would have led to a low turnout, which would not have been a desirable outcome.

Times are changing. The Conservative amendment 2 is one of three u-turns by the Conservatives in the last few days. Yesterday, William Graham stated in the Local Government and Housing Committee meeting that the Conservatives would now support Best Value if there were less bureaucracy involved in it. In the afternoon, David Melding talked about the need to raise taxes for health. Now the Conservatives are in favour of more consultation, which they

wrth bleidleisio, yn pleidleisio ar record y cyngor, yn gymaint ag y byddant yn pleidleisio ar hanes pob cyngor arall, oherwydd bydd dewis clir o'u blaenau. Ni fyddant yn wynebu'r dryswch o gael mwy nag un papur pleidleisio, ac ymgyrchoedd gwahanol yn cydreddeg. Mae'n bwysig ystyried hynny wrth drafod a ddylid gwahanu'r etholiadau ai peidio.

Nid yr opsiwn hwn yw'r un y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei ffafrio. Byddai wedi bod yn well gennym wahanu'r etholiadau drwy gynnal yr etholiad yn 2003 am dymor o dair blynedd. Fodd bynnag, ni chawsom gefnogaeth i hynny yn yr ymgynghoriad, na chan y pleidiau eraill. Felly cefnogwn y cynnig hwn fel yr opsiwn ail orau. Y ffactor allweddol wrth benderfynu hynny oedd cefnogaeth y swyddogion canlyniadau i'r newid hwn. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn nodi dymuniadau'r bobl broffesiynol hynny o ran trefnu etholiadau, a'u pryderon ynglŷn â'r modd y trefnwyd etholiadau 1999 a'r dryswch ymhlith yr etholwyr.

Dyma'r opsiwn mwyaf ymarferol, yn arbennig gan fod yn rhaid ystyried amseriad etholiadau'r cynghorau cymuned. Fe'u cynhaliwyd ar yr un diwrnod ag etholiadau senedd Ewrop yn 1999. Ni fydd hynny'n opsiwn yn 2003, ac ni allwch gynnal tri etholiad mewn un diwrnod. Felly, pe cynhelid etholiadau'r awdurdodau lleol ar yr un diwrnod ag etholiadau'r Cynulliad yn 2003, byddai'n rhaid cynnal etholiadau'r cynghorau cymuned ar ddiwrnod gwahanol. Byddai hynny wedi bod yn groes i ddymuniadau'r cynghorau cymuned ac yn groes i synnwyr cyffredin. Byddai wedi arwain at nifer isel o bleidleiswyr ac ni fyddai hyn wedi bod yn ganlyniad dymunol.

Mae pethau'n newid. Mae gwelliant 2 y Ceidwadwyr yn un o dri tro pedol gan y Ceidwadwyr yn yr ychydig ddyddiau diwethaf. Ddoe, nododd William Graham yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi Gwerth Gorau yn awr pe bai llai o fiwrocratiaeth ynghlwm wrtho. Yn y prynhawn, soniodd David Melding am yr angen i godi trethi ar gyfer iechyd. Yn awr, mae'r Ceidwadwyr o blaid mwy o

have not been in favour of in the past. There has been a consultation exercise—

David Melding: I called for a national debate on how to secure the level of resources that we need for our health service to be among the best in Europe. One option would be to raise taxes, but there are others.

Peter Black: I was pleased to hear you express support for the Liberal Democrats' idea of hypothecating taxes, David.

If we are to have wider consultation—and there has been consultation on this proposal—the only way do that would be to hold a referendum similar to that on the Assembly. That is not desirable, if only because it would cost £2.3 million.

In conclusion, this is not ideal, but it must happen, because we must separate the elections. We must, therefore, support this motion.

Gwenda Thomas: This is another issue on which we see the Welsh nationalists looking both ways. The electorate will hold them to account for that. I remind the Assembly, particularly members of the Local Government and Housing Committee, that at the Committee meeting held on 2 May 2001, Janet Davies, the Plaid Cymru spokesperson at the time, warmly welcomed the announcement. I am sure that Janet remembers that. The only opposition at the meeting came from William Graham on behalf of the Conservative Party. At least the Conservatives are consistent, both their behaviour and policies.

12:10 p.m.

In my opinion, and the Welsh Local Government Association is of the same opinion, holding elections in 2003 will not help the development of strategic programmes. The requirement that local authorities produce a community strategy before the next local government elections is important. Holding the elections in 2004 will give more time for meaningful consultation with local communities. There will be better

ymgyngori, rhywbeth nad oeddent o'i blaid yn y gorffennol. Cynhaliwyd ymarfer ymgyngori—

David Melding: Gelwais am ddadl genedlaethol ar sut i sicrhau'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen arnom fel bod ein gwasanaeth iechyd ymhlith y gorau yn Ewrop. Un opsiwn fyddai codi trethi, ond mae eraill.

Peter Black: Yr oeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn mynegi cefnogaeth i syniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o bridianu trethi, David.

Er mwyn ymgyngori'n ehangach—a bu ymgyngori ar y cynnig hwn—yr unig ffordd o wneud hynny fyddai cynnal refferendwm yn debyg i'r un ar y Cynulliad. Nid yw hynny'n ddymunol, yn bennaf oherwydd y gost o £2.3 miliwn.

Wrth gloi, nid yw'n ddelfrydol, ond rhaid iddo ddigwydd, oherwydd rhaid inni wahanu'r etholiadau. Felly, rhaid inni gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae hwn yn fater arall lle y gwelwn y cenedlaetholwyr Cymreig yn edrych ddwy ffordd. Bydd yr etholwyr yn eu dwyn i gyfrif am hynny. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Cynulliad, yn arbennig aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, fod Janet Davies, llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar y pryd, yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar 2 Mai 2001, wedi croesawu'r cyhoeddiad yn frwd. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Janet yn cofio hynny. Daeth yr unig wrthwynebiad yn y cyfarfod oddi wrth William Graham ar ran y Blaid Geidwadol. O leiaf mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn gyson, o ran eu hymddygiad a'u polisiau.

Yn fy marn i, ac mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru o'r un farn, ni fydd cynnal etholiadau yn 2003 yn helpu i ddatblygu rhaglenni strategol. Mae'r gofyniad bod awdurdodau lleol yn cynhyrchu strategaeth gymunedol cyn yr etholiadau llywodraeth leol nesaf yn bwysig. Bydd cynnal yr etholiadau yn 2004 yn rhoi mwy o amser i ymgyngori'n ystyrllon â chymunedau lleol. Bydd cyfle gwell i

opportunity for the development of partnerships with the local electorate, the voluntary and business sectors and with other statutory authorities. There will also be more time to establish effective evaluation and monitoring processes.

Elin Jones *rose*—

Gwenda Thomas: I will not give way, Deputy Presiding Officer. I will have my say this time.

I support this motion. I believe that it is a positive step in aiding the efficient operation of local authorities, particularly as local government is currently involved in fundamental changes geared towards increased public accountability and the development of local and national partnerships.

The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart): I will respond to Alun Cairns's points first, before moving on to serious aspects of the debate. Alun said that local authorities do not have the guts to make their record public. Well, at least Swansea City and County Council had the guts to produce a report, place it in the public domain and discuss its shortfalls, be it in the *South Wales Evening Post* or anywhere else. It is a brave step to look at what you think is wrong, publish it and hold proper consultation and discussion on it.

Alun also mentioned extending terms of office and other issues. We recently had an election in Swansea. It was called the Swansea East by-election. The successful candidate in that election now sits in this Chamber. Alun should recall how Labour's vote increased. I noticed with interest Alun Cairns squabbling with the Liberals. The two parties were also squabbling over last place in the by-election.

I now turn to the serious points raised by William in his amendments. Amendment 1 suggests that there would be greater participation in elections and less voter fatigue if we held all the elections on the

ddatblygu partneriaethau â'r etholwyr lleol, y sectorau gwirfoddol a busnes a chydag awdurdodau statudol eraill. Bydd mwy o amser hefyd i sefydlu prosesau gwerthuso a monitro effeithiol.

Elin Jones *a gododd*—

Gwenda Thomas: Nid ildiaf, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Mynnaf ddweud fy marn y tro hwn.

Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn. Credaf ei fod yn gam cadarnhaol i helpu awdurdodau lleol i weithredu'n effeithlon, yn arbennig gan fod llywodraeth leol yn gysylltiedig ar hyn o bryd â newidiadau sylfaenol sydd wedi'u hanelu tuag at atebolrwydd cyhoeddus cynyddol a datblygu partneriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart): Ymatebaf i bwyntiau Alun Cairns yn gyntaf, cyn symud ymlaen at agweddau difrifol ar y ddadl. Dywedodd Alun nad yw'r awdurdodau lleol yn ddigon dewr i ddatgelu'r hyn a gyflawnwyd ganddynt i'r cyhoedd. Wel, o leiaf yr oedd gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe y dewrder i gynhyrchu adroddiad, ei ryddhau i'r cyhoedd a thrafod ei ddiffygion, boed hynny yn y *South Wales Evening Post* neu yn rhywle arall. Mae edrych ar yr hyn sy'n anghywir yn eich barn chi, ei gyhoeddi a chynnal ymgynghoriad a thrafodaeth briodol arno yn gam dewr.

Soniodd Alun hefyd am ymestyn y cyfnod mewn swydd a materion eraill. Yn ddiweddar cawsom etholiad yn Abertawe. Fe'i galwyd yn isetholiad Dwyrain Abertawe. Mae'r ymgeisydd llwyddiannus yn yr etholiad hwnnw bellach yn eistedd yn y Siambr hon. Dylai Alun gofio sut y cynyddodd pleidlais Llafur. Sylwais gyda diddordeb ar Alun Cairns yn ymgecreu â'r Rhyddfrydwyr. Yr oedd y ddwy blaid yn ymgecreu hefyd ynglŷn â'r lle olaf yn yr isetholiad.

Trof yn awr at y pwyntiau difrifol a godwyd gan William yn ei welliannau. Awgryma gwelliant 1 y byddai mwy o gyfranogiad mewn etholiadau a llai o flinder ymhlith pleidleiswyr pe baem yn cynnal pob etholiad

same day—that is, community council elections, town council elections, county council elections and Assembly elections. If we follow the logic of William’s amendment, we should arrange for elections for the House of Commons and the European Parliament to be held on the same day. We all want to increase the turnout in elections. However, we also want clear accountability for the different tiers of government. Holding too many elections on the same day is complex. We need to know who is responsible for what and vote for those people on a certain day. We also need the order of Assembly elections in 2003, local government elections in 2004 and parliamentary elections in 2005 or 2006.

On amendment 2, I accept that extending the term of office of an elected institution is a serious step. I have not taken that step lightly. It has been done after proper consultation. In the circumstances, I cannot accept that my proposals are contrary to the fundamental principle of democracy. As Jocelyn and Peter pointed out, the Conservative Secretary of State for Wales, John Redwood, extended the term of office of councillors elected in 1991 to five years without any consultation.

I now turn to discuss Jocelyn Davies’s points. This Order was not designed to benefit the Labour Party. I will be as honest as Jocelyn has been. We have had discussions within the Labour Party across Wales, as Plaid Cymru has, about local election dates. As in Plaid Cymru, there were mixed opinions across the board. In making my decision, I am aware that the argument of political advantage will be used. However, I am persuaded by three points of view, which I will reiterate. First, the local authority election administrators have highlighted the confusion for the electorate of having three or four sets of votes. We could lessen this by delaying the community elections, but that would cause major problems. Secondly, the combined votes cause considerable administrative problems. Thirdly, and most importantly, if elections remain combined, it will be difficult to know whether any initiatives to encourage participation in local democracy, particularly

ar yr un diwrnod—hynny yw, etholiadau cyngorau cymuned, etholiadau cyngorau tref, etholiadau cyngorau sir ac etholiadau’r Cynulliad. Pe baem yn dilyn rhesymeg gwelliant William, dylem drefnu i’r etholiadau ar gyfer Tŷ’r Cyffredin a Senedd Ewrop gael eu cynnal ar yr un diwrnod. Mae pob un ohonom am weld cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy’n pleidleisio mewn etholiadau. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am gael atebolrwydd clir hefyd ar gyfer haenau gwahanol llywodraeth. Mae cynnal gormod o etholiadau ar yr un diwrnod yn gymhleth. Mae angen inni wybod pwy sy’n gyfrifol am beth a phleidleisio dros y bobl hynny ar ddiwrnod penodol. Mae arnom angen trefn etholiadau’r Cynulliad yn 2003 hefyd, etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn 2004 ac etholiadau seneddol yn 2005 neu 2006.

O ran gwelliant 2, derbyniam fod ymestyn cyfnod mewn swydd sefydliad etholedig yn gam difrifol. Ni chymerais y cam hwnnw’n ysgafn. Fe’i cymerwyd ar ôl ymgynghori priodol. O dan yr amgylchiadau, ni allaf dderbyn fod fy nghynigion yn groes i egwyddor sylfaenol democratiaeth. Fel y nododd Jocelyn a Peter, ymestynnodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, y Ceidwadwr John Redwood, gyfnod mewn swydd cyngorwyr a etholwyd yn 1991 i bum mlynedd heb ymgynghori o gwbl.

Yn awr trafodaf bwyntiau Jocelyn Davies. Ni fwriadwyd i’r Gorchymyn hwn fod o fudd i’r Blaid Lafur. Byddaf mor onest ag y bu Jocelyn. Cawsom drafodaethau o fewn y Blaid Lafur ledled Cymru, fel y gwnaeth Plaid Cymru, ynglŷn â dyddiadau etholiadau lleol. Fel ym Mhlaid Cymru, yr oedd safbwyntiau cymysg yn gyffredinol. Wrth ddod i’r penderfyniad, yr wyf yn ymwybodol y defnyddir y ddadl ynghylch mantais wleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, caf fy narbwylllo gan dri safbwynt, ac fe’u hailadroddaf. Yn gyntaf, mae gweinyddwyr etholiadau awdurdodau lleol wedi pwysleisio pa mor ddryslyd ydyw i’r etholwyr sydd â thair neu bedair set o bleidleisiau. Gallem leddfu hyn drwy ohirio’r etholiadau cymuned, ond byddai hynny’n achosi problemau mawr. Yn ail, mae’r pleidleisiau cyfunol yn achosi problemau gweinyddol sylweddol. Yn drydydd, ac yn bwysicaf oll, os parheir i gyfuno etholiadau, bydd yn

those flowing from the commission on electoral arrangements, are having any effect. Those three points were the basis of my reasoning.

These decisions are not being taken in isolation. I must consider other issues, such as how to improve turnout in elections and how people look at issues. With local elections, it is important that local issues are judged on the day. It is also important that we have a Welsh general election.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will now vote on amendment 1 to the first motion.

anodd gwybod a fydd unrhyw fentrau i annog cyfranogiad mewn democratiaeth leol, yn arbennig y rhai sy'n llifo o'r comisiwn ar drefniadau etholiadol, yn cael unrhyw effaith. Y tri phwynt hynny oedd sail fy rhesymeg.

Ni wneir y penderfyniadau hyn ar eu pennau eu hunain. Rhaid imi ystyried materion eraill, fel sut i gael mwy o bobl i bleidleisio mewn etholiadau a sut y mae pobl yn ystyried y materion hyn. Gydag etholiadau lleol, mae'n bwysig bod materion lleol yn cael eu barnu ar y diwrnod hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn cael etholiad cyffredinol Cymreig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar welliant 1 i'r cynnig cyntaf.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 9, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 1: For 9, Abstain 8, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will now vote on amendment 2 to the first motion. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar welliant 2 i'r cynnig cyntaf.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 9, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 2: For 9, Abstain 8, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Graham, William
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the principle of the Order. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 17.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lloyd, Val
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Middlehurst, Tom
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: We will now vote on the motion to approve the Order.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 17.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Halford, Alison
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ann

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Graham, William
Hancock, Brian
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Richards, Rod
Rogers, Peter
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd
Williams, Phil

Jones, Carwyn
 Lloyd, Val
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Middlehurst, Tom
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol ar Addysg i Geiswyr Lloches Approval of the Local Government Finance Report on the Education of Asylum Seekers

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

the National Assembly, under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 19.8, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (No. 15) (Wales) 2001 which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2001. (NNDM799)

Wales is playing a full part in providing for asylum seekers who arrive in the United Kingdom. The purpose of this special grant report is to enable the National Assembly to provide financial support to local authorities to help cover the additional costs incurred in providing education and associated support for those asylum seekers who come to Wales. Education is a vital component of any package of measures aimed at ensuring that these people can integrate fully within their new communities.

It is not only schoolchildren who need help. Many adults will also be seeking assistance to learn English or Welsh in order to be able to communicate effectively and become active members of society. They are also catered for in these arrangements. The level of support has been based on the best available information of the cost to the authorities of making this provision and the number of asylum seekers who are likely to arrive here in the current year. The total sum being allocated to local authorities in Wales for 2001-02 is £711,500, of which £269,000

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o dan adran 88B Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 19.8, yn cymeradwyo Adroddiad Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Grant Arbennig Rhif 15 (Cymru) 2001 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2001. (NNDM799)

Mae Cymru yn chwarae rhan lawn wrth ddarparu ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches sy'n cyrraedd y Deyrnas Unedig. Diben yr adroddiad grant arbennig hwn yw galluogi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i roi cymorth ariannol i awdurdodau lleol i dalu costau ychwanegol darparu addysg a chymorth cysylltiedig i'r ceiswyr lloches hynny sy'n dod i Gymru. Mae Addysg yn elfen hanfodol o fewn unrhyw becyn o fesurau sydd â'r nod o sicrhau bod y bobl hyn yn gallu dod yn rhan o'u cymunedau newydd.

Nid dim ond plant ysgol sydd angen help. Bydd llawer o oedolion hefyd yn ceisio cymorth i ddysgu Cymraeg neu Saesneg er mwyn gallu cyfathrebu'n effeithiol a dod yn aelodau gweithredol o'r gymdeithas. Bydd y trefniadau hyn yn darparu ar eu cyfer hwy hefyd. Seiliwyd y cymorth ar yr wybodaeth orau sydd ar gael ynghylch cost y ddarpariaeth hon i'r awdurdodau a nifer y ceiswyr lloches sy'n debygol o gyrraedd yma eleni. Y cyfanswm a ddyrennir i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2001-02 yw £711,500, y dyrennir £269,000 ohono i

is for Cardiff City and County Council. The remaining £442,500 is for the other authorities, which are all part of a consortium. No forecast can be completely accurate. We will review the position as information becomes available. I am pleased to see how authorities have responded to the needs of asylum seekers who have already arrived in Wales. The support that I am proposing today is the right way to ensure that local authorities do not lose out by taking on this responsibility in the interests of enabling asylum seekers to become fully integrated members of our society.

12:20 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae gan addysg rôl allweddol wrth helpu ceiswyr lloches i setlo yn ein cymunedau. Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwireddu ei hymrwymiad i sicrhau nad yw llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn gorfod ysgwyddo gormod o'r baich ariannol o groesawu ceiswyr lloches i'n cymunedau.

Mae gennyf ambell gwestiwn ar yr adroddiad. Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn falch fod grant arbennig i sicrhau y gall ceiswyr lloches brynu gwisg ysgol swyddogol i'w plant. Mae'n holl bwysig nad yw'r plant yn sefyll allan ac yn cael eu gweld fel estroniaid ar eu diwrnod cyntaf yn yr ysgol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu am yr hyn sy'n digwydd pan nad oes gwisg ysgol ffurfiol neu pan fo gwisg ysgol ond mai bach yw nifer y plant sy'n ei gwisgo, fel sy'n digwydd mewn ysgolion yng nghanol dinasoedd. A yw'r adroddiad hwn yn caniatâu i lywodraeth leol roi arian i geiswyr lloches i brynu dillad cyffredin i'w plant, o gofio pa mor brin yw arian parod i geiswyr lloches o dan y trefniadau erchyll presennol?

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r swm a roddir i bob oedolyn ar gyfer addysg, sef £131.25. Ymddengys yn swm isel i mi, yn enwedig o ystyried y mewnbwn dwys sydd ei angen os yw'r ceiswyr lloches eisiau dysgu Saesneg yn gyflym. Sut y penderfynwyd ar y ffigur hwn? A fydd modd ei ailystyried yn y dyfodol os y gwelwn ei fod yn annigonol?

Efallai y bydd yn rhaid i'r Gweinidog

Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd. Rhoddir y £442,500 sy'n weddill i'r awdurdodau eraill, y maent oll yn rhan o gonsortiw. Ni all yr un rhagamcan fod yn hollol gywir. Byddwn yn adolygu'r sefyllfa wrth i fwy o wybodaeth ddod i law. Yr wyf yn falch o weld y ffordd y mae'r awdurdodau wedi ymateb i anghenion ceiswyr lloches sydd eisoes wedi cyrraedd Cymru. Y cymorth yr wyf yn ei gynnig heddiw yw'r ffordd gywir i sicrhau nad yw awdurdodau lleol ar eu colled wrth iddynt ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb hwn er mwyn galluogi ceiswyr lloches i ddod yn aelodau llawn o'n cymdeithas.

Helen Mary Jones: I welcome this report. As the Minister said, education has a key role in helping asylum seekers to settle in our communities. I am pleased that the Government of Wales is fulfilling its commitment to ensure that local government in Wales does not have to shoulder too much of the financial burden of welcoming asylum seekers to our communities.

I have a few questions on the report. First, I am pleased that there is a special grant to ensure that asylum seekers can buy official school uniforms for their children. It is vital that children do not stand out or are perceived as outsiders on their first day at school. However, I am concerned as to what happens where there is no formal school uniform or where there is a school uniform but few children wear it, as happens in city centre schools. Does this report allow local government to give money to asylum seekers to buy ordinary clothes for their children, given how short of cash asylum seekers are under the present appalling arrangements?

My second question involves the sum given to each adult for education, which is £131.25. It seems to me to be a low sum, particularly given the intensive input that is required if asylum seekers want to learn English quickly. How was this figure decided upon? Will it be possible to reconsider it in future if it proves to be insufficient?

Perhaps the Minister will have to refer my

gyfeirio fy nhrydydd cwestiwn at y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn iddi wneud sylw ar y mater heddiw. A ddaw cynlluniau tebyg o flaen y Cynulliad i ddelio â'r costau ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? Derbyniaf ei bod yn llawer anoddach i gyfrifo'r ffigurau yn y maes hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, bydd y costau yn sylweddol ac anogaf Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried y posibilrwydd, os na wnaeth hynny eisoes.

Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn mai cyfrifoldeb y Swyddfa Gartref yw'r costau ychwanegol hyn, mewn egwyddor? A yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn dal i drafod y mater o ad-dalu'r arian hwn â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, yn enwedig gan mai'r Llywodraeth honno sy'n penderfynu ar y nifer o geiswyr lloches i'w derbyn ac ymhle y lleolir hwy?

Edrychaf ymlaen i glywed atebion y Gweinidog i'r cwestiynau hyn, ac anogaf y Cynulliad i gefnogi'r adroddiad pwysig hwn.

Peter Black: I welcome the proposal. Local authorities have been anxious about the additional costs involved in receiving asylum seekers. In the absence of money from the Home Office, it is right for the National Assembly to assist the authorities. The commitment in the partnership agreement states that

'We will work with local authorities to ensure that the educational needs of asylum seekers receive the necessary attention and that sufficient resources are secured to meet these needs.'

That is a vital commitment. This commitment and the way in which the partnership Government is taking it forward should have more prominence.

There are other concerns regarding asylum seekers that are outside the National Assembly's remit and responsibility. Helen Mary outlined many of those concerns. One concern is that asylum seekers still have to use vouchers, thus distinguishing them in

third question to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities. However, I would like her to comment on the issue today. Will similar plans be brought before the Assembly to deal with the additional costs to local authorities as regards social services? I accept that it is far more difficult to calculate the figures in that area. However, the costs will be substantial and I urge the Government of Wales to consider the possibility, if it has not already done so.

I am pleased that the Government of Wales is supporting local government in Wales. However, does the Minister accept that these additional costs are the responsibility of the Home Office, in principle? Is the Government of Wales still discussing the issue of repaying this money with the Westminster Government, particularly as it is that Government which decides on the number of asylum seekers to accept and where they will be placed?

I look forward to hearing the Minister's responses to these questions, and I urge the Assembly to support this important report.

Peter Black: Croesawaf y cynnig. Bu awdurdodau lleol yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r costau ychwanegol sy'n gysylltiedig â derbyn ceiswyr lloches. Am nad oes arian gan y Swyddfa Gartref, mae'n briodol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gynorthwyo'r awdurdodau. Mae'r ymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth yn datgan

'Byddwn yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y rhoddir sylw priodol i anghenion addysgol ceiswyr lloches ac y diogelir adnoddau digonol i fodloni'r anghenion hyn.'

Mae hwnnw'n ymrwymiad hanfodol. Dylid rhoi mwy o amlygrwydd i'r ymrwymiad hwn ac ar y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn ei ddatblygu.

Ceir pryderon eraill ynglŷn â cheiswyr lloches sydd y tu allan i gylch gwaith a chyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Nododd Helen Mary nifer o'r pryderon hyn. Un pryder yw'r ffaith bod yn rhaid i geiswyr lloches ddefnyddio talebau o hyd, gan eu

their communities. Another concern, as Helen Mary said, is the need for a school uniform and for asylum seekers to be able to conduct a lifestyle that does not make them stand out at school. That will be important in order to avoid tensions as more asylum seekers are resettled in Wales. By taking the financial burden away from local authorities, we are doing a great service to them and to asylum seekers. However, we should continue to pressurise the UK Government to take the necessary humanitarian actions to abolish practices such as the use of vouchers, detaining asylum seekers in prisons and so on. All parties in the Assembly have quite rightly condemned those practices.

Jonathan Morgan: The Welsh Conservatives support these measures. It is right and proper that we provide resources to local authorities so that they can give asylum seekers the necessary linguistic and educational support. We are all aware of the appalling circumstances that force people to leave their countries and seek asylum in the UK. We know of the dreadful atrocities that occur overseas, and how terrible it must be for asylum seekers to have to travel to this country. We also know how difficult it must be for them to settle here. We should do everything possible to ensure that they receive as much support and assistance as we can provide.

I have two questions on the budget. First, how will this item be handled in future financial years? Will we continue to fund this through special grant reports, or does the Minister have plans to ensure that the funding will be mainstreamed within our usual budget headings? Secondly, are we able to predict the likely impact in future of additional asylum seekers seeking residence in Wales? Financial planning must include a degree of prediction, as we would anticipate that more people will seek asylum in Wales in coming years.

John Griffiths: To pick up on Jonathan's last point, will Jane clarify whether this grant can be used for asylum seekers who come to Wales, or are here already, under arrangements other than dispersal

gosod ar wahân yn eu cymunedau. Pryder arall, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, yw'r angen am wisg ysgol ac i geiswyr lloches allu byw mewn ffordd nad yw'n gwneud iddynt sefyll allan yn yr ysgol. Bydd hynny'n bwysig er mwyn osgoi tensiynau wrth i fwy o geiswyr lloches ymgartrefu yng Nghymru. Drwy fynd â'r baich ariannol oddi ar awdurdodau lleol, yr ydym yn gwneud cymwynas fawr â hwy ac â cheiswyr lloches. Fodd bynnag, dylem barhau i roi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i gymryd y camau dyngarol sydd eu hangen i ddileu arferion megis y defnydd o dalebau, cadw ceiswyr lloches mewn carchardai ac ati. Mae pob plaid yn y Cynulliad, yn ddigon teg, wedi condemnio'r arferion hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r mesurau hynny. Mae'n gwbl briodol ein bod yn darparu adnoddau i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu roi'r cymorth ieithyddol ac addysgol angenrheidiol i geiswyr lloches. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol o'r amgylchiadau ofnadwy sy'n gorfodi pobl i adael eu gwledydd a cheisio lloches yn y DU. Gwyddom am yr erchyllterau sy'n digwydd dramor, a pha mor ofnadwy ydyw i geiswyr lloches orfod teithio i'r wlad hon. Gwyddom hefyd pa mor anodd ydyw iddynt setlo yma. Dylem wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau eu bod yn cael cymaint o gefnogaeth a chymorth ag sy'n bosibl.

Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn ar y gyllideb. Yn gyntaf, sut yr ymdrinnir â'r eitem hon mewn blynyddoedd ariannol i ddod? A fyddwn yn parhau i ariannu hyn drwy adroddiadau grant arbennig, neu a yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu sicrhau y bydd y cyllid yn cael ei brif ffrydio o fewn ein penawdau cyllidebol arferol? Yn ail, a allwn ragweld effaith debygol ceiswyr lloches ychwanegol a fydd am fyw yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol? Rhaid i gynllunio ariannol gynnwys rhywfaint o ragamcanu, oherwydd rhagwelem y bydd mwy o bobl yn ceisio lloches yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd nesaf.

John Griffiths: I ddilyn pwynt diwethaf Jonathan, a wnaiff Jane egluro a ellir defnyddio'r grant hwn ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches sy'n dod i Gymru, neu sydd yma eisoes, o dan drefniadau ar wahân i

arrangements? Although the Order refers specifically to dispersal arrangements, can the money be used for those seeking asylum in Wales under other circumstances? Secondly, will Jane reconsider the issue of funding for other immigrant children with similar needs?

Lorraine Barrett: I will comment on behalf of the Members who represent Cardiff, three of whom are Ministers and would therefore find it difficult to comment on this report. I welcome the report. Cardiff City and County Council will appreciate the extra financial assistance. I pay tribute to the council, as it has worked hard over the years to welcome asylum seekers and refugees to Cardiff, as the capital city of Wales, and to help them. I am pleased that this money can be used for services such as that of educational psychologists. It is not just a case of helping children and their parents to learn the language or to enter the education system. Asylum seekers who arrive in this country have huge emotional problems, which need to be addressed alongside their educational needs. I welcome the report on behalf of the citizens of Cardiff.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am grateful for all contributions to the debate. Members will observe that the list of services for which we are encouraging local authorities to use the money is deliberately long. I am pleased that Lorraine highlighted educational psychologists, for example. The list includes teachers, bilingual support, educational psychologists, co-ordinators, library resources, transport and school uniform. We have tried to be as helpful as possible to local authorities.

Helen Mary asked a question about school uniforms. We included the provision of school uniforms on the list as it is an important part of enabling children to integrate. There is nothing in the special grant report that would stop a local authority interpreting the provision as ensuring that children have appropriate clothes to attend their school. That is a matter for the local

drefniadau lleoli? Er bod y Rheol yn cyfeirio'n benodol at drefniadau lleoli, a ellir defnyddio'r arian ar gyfer y rhai sy'n ceisio lloches yng Nghymru o dan amgylchiadau eraill? Yn ail, a wnaiff Jane ailystyried mater ariannu ar gyfer plant eraill sy'n mewnfudo sydd ag anghenion tebyg?

Lorraine Barrett: Gwnaf sylwadau ar ran yr Aelodau sy'n cynrychioli Caerdydd, y mae tri ohonynt yn Weinidogion ac y byddai yn anodd iddynt felly wneud sylwadau ar yr adroddiad hwn. Croesawaf yr adroddiad. Bydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd yn gwerthfawrogi'r cymorth ariannol ychwanegol. Talaf deyrnged i'r cyngor, am ei fod wedi gweithio'n galed dros y blynyddoedd i groesawu ceiswyr lloches a ffoaduriaid i Gaerdydd, fel prifddinas Cymru, ac i'w helpu. Yr wyf yn falch y gellir defnyddio'r arian hwn at wasanaethau megis gwasanaethau seicolegwyr addysgol. Nid mater o helpu plant a'u rhieni i ddysgu'r iaith neu i gael mynediad i'r system addysg yn unig ydyw. Mae gan y ceiswyr lloches sy'n cyrraedd y wlad hon broblemau emosiynol enfawr, ac mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy ochr yn ochr â'u hanghenion addysgol. Croesawaf yr adroddiad ar ran dinasyddion Caerdydd.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr holl gyfraniadau at y ddadl. Bydd Aelodau yn sylwi bod y rhestr o wasanaethau yr ydym yn annog awdurdodau lleol i ddefnyddio'r arian ar eu cyfer yn fwriadol hir. Yr wyf yn falch bod Lorraine wedi nodi seicolegwyr addysgol, er enghraifft. Mae'r rhestr yn cynnwys athrawon, cymorth dwyieithog, seicolegwyr addysgol, cydlynwyr, adnoddau llyfrgell, trafndiaeth a gwisg ysgol. Yr ydym wedi ceisio rhoi cymaint o gymorth â phosibl i'r awdurdodau lleol.

Gofynnodd Helen Mary gwestiwn am wisgoeddd ysgol. Cynhwyswyd y ddarpariaeth o wisgoeddd ysgol ar y rhestr am ei fod yn rhan bwysig o'r broses o alluogi plant i ymgynffino. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn yr adroddiad grant arbennig a fyddai'n atal awdurdod lleol rhag dehongli'r ddarpariaeth fel dull o sicrhau bod gan blant ddillad priodol i fynychu'r ysgol. Mater i'r awdurdod

authority. I hope that that interpretation is helpful to Helen Mary.

I now turn to the amounts that have been allocated. In England, the costing was £500 per asylum seeker. One advantage of our relationship with local government in Wales is that we have been able to work out what are felt to be the real costs. That is why we have £1,541 per child and £131 per adult. Those are what the local authorities see as the real costs. That is why we have based our grant on that mechanism. I have also said that this will be under review. These are the costs identified at this time.

12:30 p.m.

The social services issues are Jane Hutt's responsibility. She is examining these issues and they are already being deliberated. In terms of the broader relationship between the Finance Department and the Home Office, Edwina as Minister for Finance will always ensure that the Assembly's interests, in terms of departments that have UK responsibilities, are properly met.

I welcome Peter and Jonathan's support. Jonathan is right: we must do everything possible for this client group. I am grateful for that comment. We have used a special grant report this time and, where it is appropriate to use special grant reports, we will do so. This about a specific group of people and money for specific purposes. As we progress, arrangements may well change, but that will be following discussion with the Minister for Finance.

In terms of predictions, we are working on the numbers that we have been given. They will need to be reviewed. Some of you will have noticed that money is provided for Cardiff City and County Council because Fitzalan High School incurred expenditure last year in making provision for the arrival of 48 asylum seeker children, who did not then arrive. We could not penalise the school for good planning. We therefore need to match the predicted and the actual numbers.

lleol ydyw. Gobeithiaf y bydd y dehongliad hwnnw o gymorth i Helen Mary.

Yn awr, trof at y symiau a ddyrannwyd. Yn Lloegr, darparwyd £500 fesul ceisiwr lloches. Un fantais o'n perthynas gyda llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yw ein bod wedi gallu cyfrifo'r costau gwirioneddol yn ein tyb ni. Am y rheswm hwn mae gennym £1,541 fesul plentyn a £131 fesul oedolyn. Dyna'r costau gwirioneddol ym marn yr awdurdodau lleol. Dyma'r rheswm inni seilio ein grant ar y dull hwnnw. Dywedais hefyd y caiff hyn ei adolygu. Dyma'r costau a nodwyd ar hyn o bryd.

Cyfrifoldeb Jane Hutt yw'r materion sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae hithau'n archwilio'r materion hyn ac maent eisoes yn cael eu hystyried. O ran y berthynas ehangach rhwng yr Adran Gyllid a'r Swyddfa Gartref, bydd Edwina, fel y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, bob amser yn sicrhau bod buddiannau'r Cynulliad, o ran adrannau sydd â chyfrifoldebau yn y DU, yn cael eu bodloni'n briodol.

Croesawaf gefnogaeth Peter a Jonathan. Mae Jonathan yn llygad ei le: rhaid inni wneud pob peth posibl ar gyfer y grŵp cleient hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylw hwnnw. Defnyddiwyd adroddiad grant arbennig gennym y tro hwn a, lle y bo'n briodol i ddefnyddio adroddiadau grant arbennig, byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â grŵp arbennig o bobl ac arian at ddibenion arbennig. Wrth i'r sefyllfa ddatblygu, gallai'r trefniadau newid, ond bydd hynny yn dilyn trafodaeth gyda'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid.

O ran rhagamcanion, yr ydym yn gweithio ar y niferoedd a roddwyd inni. Bydd angen eu hadolygu. Bydd rhai ohonoch wedi sylwi bod arian yn cael ei ddarparu i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd oherwydd bod Ysgol Uwchradd Fitzalan wedi mynd i gostau y llynedd wrth ddarparu ar gyfer 48 o blant a oedd yn geiswyr lloches, ond na wnaethant gyrraedd yn y diwedd. Ni allem gosbi'r ysgol am gynllunio da. Mae angen inni felly sicrhau bod y niferoedd a ragwelir a'r niferoedd gwirioneddol yn cyfateb.

John raised the issue of dispersal arrangements and funding for other immigrant children. I am looking at our commitment to make dispersal arrangements under the current scheme. I will write to you with a specific response as I cannot tell you now if the arrangements currently in place today could be used in the way that you identified. I ask everybody to support the special grant report.

Peter Black: Point of order. I neglected to declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council earlier. I now do so.

Cododd John fater trefniadau lleoli ac ariannu ar gyfer plant eraill sy'n mewnfudo. Yr wyf yn edrych at ein hymrwymiad i wneud trefniadau lleoli o dan y cynllun presennol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch gydag ymateb penodol oherwydd na allaf ddweud wrthyfch yn awr a ellid defnyddio'r trefniadau sydd ar waith heddiw yn y modd a nodwyd gennych. Gofynnaf i bawb gefnogi'r adroddiad grant arbennig.

Peter Black: Pwynt o drefn. Ni ddatgenais fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn gynharach. Gwnaf hynny yn awr.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Geraint
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Ron
Essex, Sue
Evans, Delyth
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hancock, Brian
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jarman, Pauline
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Rogers, Peter
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Hosbisau yng Nghymru Hospices in Wales

Karen Sinclair: I have agreed to allow time at the end of my speech for Helen Mary Jones, Peter Black, David Melding and Lorraine Barrett, who have all signalled that they want to make short contributions. Presumably, it will be up to the Deputy Presiding Officer to decide whether there is time for other Members to speak before Jane Hutt responds. However, I assume that there will be time for those four Members to speak.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The procedure is that you have 15 minutes in which to speak, which includes time for all the people you are going to allow to speak. If you take up all of the 15 minutes, there will be no time for others to speak. The more you shorten your speech, the more time that will be left.

Karen Sinclair: You will watch the clock, presumably.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will.

Karen Sinclair: The World Health Organisation defines palliative care as,

‘the active, total care of patients whose disease is not responsive to curative treatment. Control of pain, of other symptoms, and psychological, social and spiritual problems is paramount. The goal of palliative care is achievement of the best quality of life for patients and their families.’

Palliative and supportive care differ in their philosophy from curative strategies in focusing primarily on controlling the symptoms of a disease rather than its cause or cure.

Of necessity, therefore, the approach is different. It is, of necessity, holistic,

Karen Sinclair: Yr wyf wedi cytuno i ganiatáu amser ar ddiwedd fy araith ar gyfer Helen Mary Jones, Peter Black, David Melding a Lorraine Barrett, y maent oll wedi nodi eu bod am wneud cyfraniadau byr. Yn ôl pob tebyg, lle y Dirprwy Lywydd fydd penderfynu a oes amser i Aelodau eraill siarad cyn i Jane Hutt ymateb. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn tybio y bydd amser i'r pedwar Aelod hynny siarad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Y drefn yw bod gennych 15 munud i siarad, sy'n cynnwys amser i'r holl bobl yr ydych yn mynd i ganiatáu iddynt siarad. Os byddwch yn defnyddio'r 15 munud llawn, ni fydd amser i eraill siarad. Po fyrraf fydd eich araith, y mwyaf o amser fydd ar ôl.

Karen Sinclair: Byddwch yn gwyllo'r cloc, mae'n debyg.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Byddaf.

Karen Sinclair: Mae Mudiad Iechyd y Byd yn diffinio gofal lleddfodol fel,

‘gofal gweithredol a chyflawn i gleifion nad yw eu hafiechyd yn ymateb i driniaeth wellhaol. Rheoli poen a symptomau eraill, a phroblemau seicolegol, cymdeithasol ac ysbrydol yw'r peth pwysicaf. Nod gofal lleddfodol yw sicrhau bywyd o'r ansawdd gorau i gleifion a'u teuluoedd.’

Mae gofal lleddfodol a chefnogol yn wahanol o ran athroniaeth i strategaethau iachaol ac mae'n canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar reoli symptomau afiechyd yn hytrach na'i achos neu iachâd.

Yn ei hanfod, felly, mae'r ymagwedd yn wahanol. Mae, yn ei hanfod, yn gyfannol, yn

pragmatic and multidisciplinary. Traditionally, it has been thought that palliative care and hospice services only apply to those who are dying. However, it has become increasingly obvious that the cost efficacy of palliative care far outweighs attempts at disease cure in terms of quality of life for the individual, and for his or her family.

Pain is common in cancer, as it is in many terminal illnesses. Many patients' primary complaint is pain—about 40 per cent have chronic pain from cancer, and the prevalence rises to 50 per cent during treatment, and to 90 per cent in advanced disease. On admission to a hospice, over 75 per cent of patients reported being unsatisfied with their pain control, and 89 per cent had experienced severe breakthrough pain on top of their baseline pain. Pain is often a complex phenomenon, and it can have complex causes. The distress of pain is worsened by emotional, social and spiritual distress in patients. This is where the holistic approach of palliative care is so important in treating the terminally ill person. Pain, distress, isolation and the fear of leaving dear ones all add to the sufferer's distress. The whole thrust of palliative care is to treat the whole person—to treat the whole family if needs be—and even to continue caring for the family after the death of the terminally ill person.

We are fortunate in Wrexham to have access to a hospice. We have Nightingale House, as well as Hope House for our children. It serves quite a large geographical area and fulfils a role that has been missing in the NHS's traditional role. When I started investigating the funding stream for our hospice, I was, quite frankly, shocked. Just 18 per cent of the total running costs for Nightingale House come from the health authority. It comes from a budget line that is headed 'charitable grants'. In actual terms, 18 per cent of the budget equates to £250,000, which leaves the residual 72 per cent, or £1.1 million, to be raised by way of donations and fund raising. That leads to a huge funding exercise that must be repeated year on year and adds to stress. Donor fatigue is the biggest enemy, which in turn inevitably leads

ymarferol ac yn amlddisgyblaethol. Yn draddodiadol, credwyd mai dim ond ar gyfer pobl sy'n marw y mae gofal lleddfol a gwasanaethau hosbis yn berthnasol. Fodd bynnag, daeth yn fwyfwy amlwg bod effeithlonrwydd gofal lleddfol yn llawer mwyn na'r ymdrechion i iacháu afiechyd o ran ansawdd bywyd i'r unigolyn, ac i'w deulu neu ei theulu.

Mae poen yn beth cyffredin gyda chanser, fel gyda sawl salwch terfynol. Poen yw prif gŵyn llawer o gleifion—mae tua 40 y cant yn dioddef poen cronig oherwydd canser, ac mae'r mynychder yn codi i 50 y cant yn ystod triniaeth, ac i 90 y cant yn ystod afiechyd datblygedig. Wrth gael eu derbyn i hosbis, adroddodd dros 75 y cant o gleifion eu bod yn anfodlon ar y modd y rheolwyd eu poen, ac yr oedd 89 y cant wedi dioddef poen ychwanegol dwys yn ogystal â phoen sylfaenol. Yn aml mae poen yn ffenomen cymhleth, a gall ei achosion fod yn gymhleth. Caiff trallod poen ei waethygu gan drallod emosïynol, cymdeithasol ac ysbrydol mewn cleifion. Dyma ble mae ymagwedd gyfannol gofal lleddfol mor bwysig wrth drin person â salwch terfynol. Mae'r boen, y trallod, yr unigrwydd a'r ofn o adael anwyliaid yn ychwanegu at drallod y dioddefwr. Holl fyrdwn gofal lleddfol yw rhoi triniaeth i'r person cyfan—rhoi triniaeth i'r teulu cyfan os oes angen—a hyd yn oed parhau i ofalu am y teulu wedi marwolaeth y person â salwch terfynol.

Yr ydym yn ffodus yn Wrecsam bod gennym fynediad i hosbis. Mae gennym Nightingale House, yn ogystal â Tŷ Gobaith i'n plant. Mae'n gwasanaethu ardal ddaearyddol fawr ac mae'n cyflawni rôl nad oedd yn bodoli fel rhan o rôl draddodiadol yr NHS. Pan ddechreuais ymchwilio i'r llif arian ar gyfer ein hosbis, cefais fraw. Dim ond 18 y cant o gyfanswm costau rhedeg Nightingale House sy'n dod oddi wrth yr awdurdod iechyd. Daw o linell cyllideb a gaiff ei galw'n 'grantiau elusenol'. Mewn termau gwirioneddol, mae 18 y cant o'r gyllideb yn gyfwerth â £250,000, sy'n gadael y 72 y cant sy'n weddill, neu £1.1 miliwn, i gael ei godi drwy roddion a chodi arian. Mae hynny'n arwain at ymarfer ariannu anferth y mae'n rhaid ei ailadrodd flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ac sy'n ychwanegu at y pwysau. Gorddibyniaeth ar

to fundraisers having to use clinicians as direct fundraisers. That causes a conflict of interest between collaborative care, and between professionals and their employer's demands.

It would be remiss of me not to mention the magnificent work that is done in the community by Macmillan nurses and Marie Curie nurses. However, this work is also funded by charitable money.

Let us look at the hospice's role in delivering care to patients. Nightingale House, with its palliative care ethos, delivers a specialist environment to deal with symptoms such as weakness, nausea, depression, and pain control. In addition, it provides patient carer support, which is essential for families, but which is so lacking, due to time constraints, on busy hospital wards.

Crisis management for families at times of great emotional stress pays huge dividends for the long-term health of the carers. It also provides child and adult bereavement services from the hospital. The range of services is client led, and the charitable side of the funding no doubt allows for this sort of creativity in the service. However, it also provides a great deal of care that would otherwise have to be funded in the NHS. No-one would realistically ask for palliative care to be totally funded by the NHS as this would inevitably lead to a curtailment of services deliverable.

The hospice also funds staff training, which is imperative to delivering such a holistic service. Nurses are employed directly by the hospice, and the hospice is responsible for training them. Training is an ongoing problem. Palliative medicine was recognised as a speciality in 1987, but training and entry requirements were only clearly defined in 1994. There are currently three postgraduate validated courses in Wales for health care professionals. One is in medicine, and two are in nursing. They are based in Cardiff and Swansea.

roddwyr yw'r prif elyn, sydd yn ei dro yn arwain yn anochel at rai sy'n codi arian yn gorfod defnyddio clinigwyr fel pobl uniongyrchol sy'n codi arian. Mae hynny'n achosi gwrthdaro rhwng gofal cydweithredol, a rhwng pobl broffesiynol a gofynion eu cyflogwyr.

Byddai'n anfaddeuol imi beidio â chrybwyll y gwaith ardderchog gaiff ei wneud yn y gymuned gan nyrsys Macmillan a nyrsys Marie Curie. Fodd bynnag, ariennir y gwaith hwn hefyd gan arian elusennol.

Gadewch inni edrych ar rôl yr hosbis wrth ddarparu gofal i gleifion. Mae Nightingale House, gyda'i ethos gofal lleddfól, yn darparu amgylchedd arbenigol i ymdrin â symptomau megis gwendid, cyfog, iselder, a rheoli poen. Yn ogystal, mae'n darparu cymorth i rai sy'n gofalu am gleifion, cymorth sy'n hanfodol i deuluoedd, ond y mae prinder mawr ohono, oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser, ar wardiau prysur mewn ysbytai.

Mae rheoli argyfwng i deuluoedd ar adeg o straen emosiynol mawr o fudd mawr i iechyd hir dymor y gofalwyr. Mae hefyd yn darparu gwasanaethau profedigaeth i blant ac oedolion o'r ysbyty. Caiff ystod y gwasanaethau ei arwain gan gleientiaid, a heb os mae ochr elusennol yr arian yn caniatáu ar gyfer y math hwn o greadigrwydd yn y gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn darparu llawer o ofal a fyddai fel arall yn gorfod cael ei ariannu gan yr NHS. Ni fyddai neb yn gofyn yn realistig i ofal lleddfól gael ei ariannu'n llwyr gan yr NHS oherwydd y byddai hyn yn anochel yn arwain at gwtogi ar y gwasanaethau y gellir eu darparu.

Mae'r hosbis hefyd yn ariannu hyfforddiant i staff, sydd yn hanfodol i ddarparu gwasanaeth mor gyfannol. Caiff nyrsys eu cyflogi'n uniongyrchol gan yr hosbis, a'r hosbis sy'n gyfrifol am eu hyfforddi. Mae hyfforddiant yn broblem barhaus. Cafodd meddyginiaeth leddfól ei chydabod fel arbenigedd yn 1987, ond dim ond yn 1994 y cafodd gofynion hyfforddi a mynediad eu diffinio'n glir. Ar hyn o bryd mae tri chwrs a ddilyswyd ar gyfer ôl-raddedigion yng Nghymru ar gyfer pobl broffesiynol ym maes gofal iechyd. Mae un ohonynt mewn

meddyginiaeth, a dau mewn nyrsio. Maent wedi'u lleoli yng Nghaerdydd ac Abertawe.

12:40 p.m.

Definitions of training to a higher, specialist level in nursing and other disciplines are not yet defined in a regulatory framework. Although the United Kingdom Central Council for Nursing, Midwifery and Health Visiting has defined specialist nursing, the core education and training requirements for palliative care nursing at all levels are not agreed nationally or contained in a definitions framework. It is crucial that a pan-Wales education programme is developed, and that palliative care is included as a statutory part of the revalidation process. Clear training pathways are imperative if we are committed to palliative care, and if we are to create opportunities in order to attract staff into this area of expertise.

Hospice provision in Wales is patchy. It has evolved in an ad-hoc way—each service deliverer being the consequence of a highly motivated fundraising group in a specific area. There is serious inequity, and it is no accident that hospices spring up in leafy suburbs. It is no accident that there is a severe lack of this provision in our more deprived areas where fundraising is difficult. This should patently not be the case. Equitable access to care across Wales is imperative—not necessarily in a dedicated hospice or palliative care unit, but through community care, community hospitals and primary healthcare teams.

To do this, we must identify a standard range of core service components. We must start with a good definition of core services. Match funding of these core services would allow a commitment to delivering these services. Access to palliative care should be a fundamental right based on need rather than postcode. Match funding for hospices is not an unreasonable request for the delivery of a service that would otherwise have to be dealt with in hospitals.

Nid yw diffiniadau hyfforddiant hyd at lefel uwch, arbenigol mewn nyrsio a disgyblaethau eraill wedi'u diffinio mewn fframwaith reoleiddiol hyd yma. Er bod Cyngor Canolog y Deyrnas Unedig ar gyfer Nyrsio, Bydwreigiaeth ac Ymwelwyr Iechyd wedi diffinio nyrsio arbenigol, nid yw'r gofynion addysg a hyfforddiant craidd ar gyfer nyrsio gofal lleddfodol ar bob lefel wedi'u cytuno'n genedlaethol nac wedi'u cynnwys mewn fframwaith diffiniadau. Mae hi'n hanfodol y caiff rhaglen addysg Cymru gyfan ei datblygu, ac y caiff gofal lleddfodol ei gynnwys fel rhan statudol o'r broses ailddilysu. Mae llwybrau hyfforddi clir yn hanfodol os ydym yn ymrwymedig i ofal lleddfodol, ac os ydym am greu cyfleoedd er mwyn denu staff i'r maes arbenigedd hwn.

Mae darpariaeth hosbisau yng Nghymru yn anghyson. Mae wedi esblygu mewn modd ad-hoc—pob darparwr gwasanaeth wedi deillio o grŵp codi arian â chymhelliant cryf mewn maes arbenigol. Mae anghyfartaledd difrifol, ac nid hap a damwain yw'r ffaith bod hosbisau yn ymddangos mewn maestrefi moethus. Nid hap a damwain yw'r ffaith bod prinder difrifol o'r ddarpariaeth hon yn ein hardaloedd mwy difreintiedig lle mae'n anodd codi arian. Mae'n amlwg nad dyma sut y dylai pethau fod. Mae'n hanfodol cael mynediad cyfartal i ofal ar draws Cymru—nid o anghenraid mewn hosbis neu uned gofal lleddfodol ymroddedig, ond drwy ofal cymunedol, ysbytai cymunedol a thimau gofal iechyd sylfaenol.

Er mwyn gwneud hyn, rhaid inni nodi ystod safonol o elfennau gwasanaeth craidd. Rhaid inni ddechrau gyda diffiniad da o wasanaethau craidd. Byddai arian cyfatebol o'r gwasanaethau craidd hyn yn galluogi ymrwymiad i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Dylai mynediad at ofal lleddfodol fod yn hawl sylfaenol wedi'i seilio ar angen yn hytrach na chod post. Nid yw arian cyfatebol ar gyfer hosbisau yn gais afresymol er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth y byddai'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef mewn ysbytai fel arall.

I searched 'Improving Health in Wales' for the words 'hospice' or 'palliative'. There were no occurrences of these words. I ask Jane to address urgently this serious funding issue in palliative care in Wales. Developing a strategy for the care of the terminally ill is essential. Inequity of access for those people with a progressive, life-limiting disease should be addressed urgently. That requires statutory funding of core services to decrease the reliance on charitable funding. It also requires a statutory duty on health authorities and their successors to commission a minimum standard of care with equity of access. Supportive care provision should also be integrated alongside palliative care to ensure cross referral at the appropriate times. I ask Jane to urgently consider these suggestions and to ensure that palliative care takes its rightful place in our health strategy.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to Karen for raising this important issue and for allowing me to contribute. I endorse a great deal of what she has said. I will provide a local example of palliative care. Llanelli, as the Minister knows, has a state-of-the-art hospice that was handed to Carmarthenshire NHS Trust two years ago. However, it is still not staffed for the treatment of in-patients. It seems that our only hope to get it staffed is for the national palliative care review to be completed as soon as possible. We are confident that that review will show the need for more effective palliative care in Carmarthenshire. I would be grateful if the Minister would give us information about the review's progress and about what resources will be made available to address issues that the review may raise.

Developments are going on in the hospice movement across Wales. For example, in north Wales, there is a movement to get an outreach post for the children's hospice. We all welcome those developments, but, as Karen said, they must be funded from the public as well as the private purse.

Chwiliais drwy 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru' am y geiriau 'hosbis' neu 'lleddfol'. Nid ymddangosodd y geiriau hyn unwaith. Gofynnaf i Jane fynd i'r afael â'r mater ariannu difrifol hwn mewn gofal lleddfol yng Nghymru ar fyrder. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn datblygu strategaeth ar gyfer gofalu am y rhai â salwch terfynol. Dylid mynd i'r afael ar fyrder ag anghyfartaledd o ran mynediad i'r bobl hynny ag afiechyd datblygol, sy'n cwtogi eu bywydau. Mae hynny'n golygu cael arian statudol ar gyfer gwasanaethau craidd i leihau'r ddibyniaeth ar arian elusennol. Mae hefyd yn golygu rhoi dyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau iechyd a'u holynwyr i gomisiynu isafswm safon gofal gyda mynediad cyfartal. Hefyd dylid integreiddio darpariaeth gofal gefnogol ochr yn ochr â gofal lleddfol i sicrhau bod trawsgyfeirio yn digwydd ar yr adegau priodol. Gofynnaf i Jane ystyried yr awgrymiadau hyn ar frys ac i sicrhau bod gofal lleddfol yn cael ei le haeddiannol yn ein strategaeth iechyd.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Karen am godi'r mater pwysig hwn ac am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd. Rhoddaf enghraifft leol o ofal lleddfol. Mae gan Lanelli, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, hosbis newydd a gyflwynwyd i Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Sir Gaerfyrddin ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, mae'n parhau i fod heb staff ar gyfer rhoi triniaeth i gleifion mewnol. Ymddengys mai ein hunig obaith o'i staffio yw bod yr adolygiad gofal lleddfol cenedlaethol yn cael ei gwblhau cyn gynted â phosibl. Yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd yr adolygiad hwnnw'n dangos yr angen am ofal lleddfol mwy effeithiol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog roi gwybodaeth inni am gynnydd yr adolygiad ac am ba adnoddau fydd ar gael i fynd i'r afael â materion a allai godi o'r adolygiad.

Mae datblygiadau'n mynd rhagddynt yn y mudiad hosbisau ledled Cymru. Er enghraifft, yng ngogledd Cymru, mae camau ar y gweill i gael swydd *outreach* ar gyfer hosbis y plant. Mae pawb ohonom yn croesawu'r datblygiadau hynny, ond, fel y dywedodd Karen, rhaid iddynt gael eu hariannu o'r pwrs cyhoeddus yn ogystal ag o'r pwrs preifat.

Peter Black: I am also grateful to Karen for allowing me to speak. I had contact with palliative care recently through my family. I understand its importance and the importance of properly funded palliative care. I support what Karen said regarding the core funding of palliative care. It is important that we do not rely on volunteer fundraising to ensure that hospices, in particular, are provided across Wales. We need to consider the provision of palliative care in NHS hospitals. Many consider palliative care to be necessary only for cancer patients. However, there are many other illnesses that require palliative care. That should also be taken on board as part of the review. I thank you for raising this issue.

David Melding: I thank Karen Sinclair for a sensitive and thoughtful speech. I was particularly impressed by how she referred to hospices as centres for excellence, co-ordinating outreach work in the community. We must remember that. Hospices are not simply buildings; they can form the basis of an extensive service to the community. Many people want to remain at home in the final stages of their illness. Hospices are one way to ensure that they remain comfortable for as long as possible. At least we can ensure that they are free of pain, even if they are in terminal decline.

Lorraine Barrett: I also thank Karen for choosing this particular topic. I pay tribute to the work done in Penarth by the Holme Tower Marie Curie hospice, where I worked some 30 years ago. It was a different place then, albeit still undertaking the same sort of caring work. Things have moved on, thankfully, in 30 years. I am grateful that you mentioned Macmillan nurses. Like Peter Black, my family and I have had personal support from them in the last year. We could not have managed without them. I must also mention George Thomas nurses. All these people complement the work of the NHS. Without them, the NHS would have to provide that support and care in our hospitals, using hospital nurses. We have a dilemma, because while those working in hospices want to be seen as independent, providing their own ethos of care, at the same time, we

Peter Black: Yr wyf innau'n ddiolchgar i Karen am ganiatáu imi siarad. Cefais gysylltiad â gofal lleddfol yn ddiweddar drwy fy nheulu. Yr wyf yn deall ei bwysigrwydd a phwysigrwydd gofal lleddfol a ariennir yn briodol. Cefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Karen ynghylch arian craidd ar gyfer gofal lleddfol. Mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn dibynnu ar arian a gaiff ei godi gan wirfoddolwyr i sicrhau y darperir hosbisau, yn arbennig, ledled Cymru. Mae angen inni ystyried y ddarpariaeth o ofal lleddfol mewn ysbytai NHS. Mae llawer yn ystyried mai dim ond ar gyfer cleifion canser y mae angen gofal lleddfol. Fodd bynnag, mae sawl salwch arall y mae angen gofal lleddfol ar eu cyfer. Dylid ystyried hynny hefyd fel rhan o'r adolygiad. Diolch ichi am godi'r mater hwn.

David Melding: Hoffwn ddiolch i Karen Sinclair am araith sensitif a meddylgar. Gwnaeth y ffordd y cyfeiriodd at hosbisau fel canolfannau rhagoriaeth, yn cydlynu gwaith *outreach* yn y gymuned, argraff dda arnaf. Rhaid inni gofio hynny. Nid adeiladau'n unig yw hosbisau; gallant ffurfio sail gwasanaeth helaeth i'r gymuned. Mae llawer o bobl am aros gartref yn ystod camau olaf eu salwch. Mae hosbisau yn un ffordd o sicrhau eu bod yn aros yn gyfforddus cyhyd â phosibl. O leiaf gallwn sicrhau nad ydynt mewn poen, hyd yn oed os ydynt yn darvoud amdani.

Lorraine Barrett: Hoffwn innau ddiolch i Karen am ddewis y pwnc arbennig hwn. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd ym Mhenarth gan hosbis Holme Tower Marie Curie, lle bûm yn gweithio tua 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Yr oedd yn lle gwahanol bryd hynny, er ei fod yn gwneud yr un math o waith gofalu. Mae pethau wedi gwella, diolch byth, mewn 30 mlynedd. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi sôn am nyrsys Macmillan. Fel Peter Black, cafodd fy nheulu a minnau gymorth personol ganddynt y llynedd. Ni fyddem wedi gallu ymdopi hebddynt. Rhaid imi hefyd grybwyll nyrsys George Thomas. Mae'r holl bobl hyn yn ategu gwaith yr NHS. Hebddynt, byddai'n rhaid i'r NHS ddarparu'r cymorth a'r gofal hwnnw yn ein hysbytai, gan ddefnyddio nyrsys yr ysbytai. Mae gennym ddilema, oherwydd er bod y rhai sy'n gweithio mewn hosbisau am gael eu

want them to work for the NHS. It is important that they bring their own special style of care from each particular type of hospice.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): Thank you, Karen, for raising this important subject in the National Assembly. It is an opportunity to highlight the important work of hospices and to thank those involved in the voluntary hospice movement. I value the important contribution that hospices make to the provision of palliative care in Wales. Karen spoke of the valuable contribution of Nightingale House and Hope House in her constituency.

Karen eloquently described the scope and aim of palliative care. The World Health Organisation clearly defines the wide, holistic and multi-disciplinary approach in palliative care. We know that that approach is provided in our hospices and in palliative care in NHS hospitals and the community. David Melding, Lorraine Barrett, Peter Black and Helen Mary Jones acknowledged this approach and recognised this important aspect of the health service in Wales.

There is no question that hospices play an important role in the delivery of palliative care services in Wales. As Karen said, they can be used at various stages in the care of an individual and can provide care and support to families and carers, many of whom play a major role in caring for their relatives and friends and deserve much-needed breaks. A large amount of specialist palliative care is provided by the voluntary sector, not only in hospices but in communities, by charities such as Macmillan Cancer Relief and Marie Curie Cancer Care. You are all involved with and know about hospices in your constituencies. Their contribution is tremendous and their role is vital. As Karen mentioned, the NHS is also a major provider of specialist palliative care.

I turn to funding. At present, NHS funding for palliative care across a range of settings, including hospices, is provided by the health authorities from their general allocations.

hystyried yn annibynnol, yn darparu eu hethos gofal eu hunain, ar yr un pryd, yr ydym am iddynt weithio i'r NHS. Mae'n bwysig eu bod yn cyflwyno eu harddull gofal arbennig eu hunain o bob math arbennig o hosbis.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Diolch, Karen, am godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n gyfle i amlygu gwaith pwysig hosbisau ac i ddiolch i'r rhai sy'n cymryd rhan yn y mudiad hosbisau gwirfoddol. Gwerthfawrogaf y cyfraniad pwysig a wna hosbisau i ddarpariaeth gofal lleddfol yng Nghymru. Siaradodd Karen am gyfraniad gwerthfawr Nightingale House a Tŷ Gobaith yn ei hetholaeth hi.

Disgrifiodd Karen yn huawdl gwmpas a nod gofal lleddfol. Mae Mudiad Iechyd y Byd yn diffinio'n glir yr ymagwedd eang, gyfannol ac aml-ddisgyblaethol a geir mewn gofal lleddfol. Gwyddom y darperir yr ymagwedd honno yn ein hosbisau ac mewn gofal lleddfol yn ysbytai NHS a'r gymuned. Cydnabu David Melding, Lorraine Barrett, Peter Black a Helen Mary Jones yr ymagwedd hon ynghyd â'r agwedd bwysig hon ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

Yn ddiamau mae gan hosbisau rôl bwysig o ran darparu gwasanaethau gofal lleddfol yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd Karen, gellir eu defnyddio ar adegau amrywiol wrth ofalu am unigolyn a gallant ddarparu gofal a chymorth i deuluoedd a gofalwyr, ac mae llawer ohonynt yn chwarae rôl bwysig wrth ofalu am eu perthnasau a'u ffrindiau ac yn llawn haeddu seibiannau. Darperir llawer o ofal lleddfol arbenigol gan y sector gwirfoddol, nid yn unig mewn hosbisau ond mewn cymunedau, drwy elusennau fel Lleddfu Canser Macmillan a Gofal Canser Marie Curie. Mae pawb ohonoch yn ymwneud â hosbisau yn eich etholaethau ac yn gwybod amdanynt. Mae eu cyfraniad yn aruthrol a'u rôl yn hanfodol. Fel y soniodd Karen, mae'r NHS hefyd yn un o brif ddarparwyr gofal lleddfol arbenigol.

Trof at ariannu. Ar hyn o bryd, darperir arian drwy'r NHS ar gyfer gofal lleddfol ar draws ystod o leoliadau, yn cynnwys hosbisau, gan yr awdurdodau lleol o'u dyraniadau

Guidance issued in 1996 provided advice for the health authorities on commissioning arrangements for palliative care. It highlighted significant advances in pain and symptom control for those with cancer and other life limiting disease. It also highlighted the greater emphasis on maximising patients' quality of life. The guidance aims to ensure that all patients can have access to the benefits of the improved treatments. Everyone in Wales should have access to an equally high standard of palliative care. That can be achieved when the NHS and the voluntary hospice movement work together. I have made it clear that I expect health authorities to engage with voluntary hospices in planning and providing for services and vice versa.

Where a patient is assessed as needing palliative care, I expect the relevant agencies, health or social services, to ensure that that care is funded, under the continuing care arrangements. Helen Mary mentioned funding in Llanelli. Delyth Evans has also raised that issue. As Helen Mary knows, I was there in my early days. Dyfed Powys Health Authority has provided £150,000 and the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust has provided £75,000. I recognise that there is a shortfall, but we must acknowledge the commitment of the people of Llanelli to the hospice. We hope that we can move the partnership forward. Where a patient is assessed as needing palliative care, I expect the relevant agencies to ensure that the care is funded under the continuing care arrangements.

12:50 p.m.

In terms of future funding arrangements, as Karen said, the NHS commissioning arrangements are changing. That will affect how all services, including palliative care, are funded. I am committed to ensuring that hospice funding is treated as an integral part of palliative care services in general. I believe that, with proposed new commissioning arrangements, we can ensure that services are delivered and commissioned in a seamless way. We will have new opportunities to develop an all-Wales strategic approach.

cyffredinol. Darparodd canllaw a gyhoeddwyd yn 1996 gyngor i'r awdurdodau lleol ar drefniadau comisiynu ar gyfer gofal lleddfól. Amlygodd ddatblygiadau sylweddol mewn dulliau o reoli poen a symptomau ar gyfer y rhai hynny sydd â chanser ac afiechydon eraill sy'n cwtogi bywyd. Hefyd amlygodd y pwyslais mwy ar gynyddu ansawdd bywyd cleifion i'r eithaf. Nod y canllaw yw sicrhau y gall pob claf gael mynediad at fuddiannau'r triniaethau gwell. Dylai pawb yng Nghymru gael mynediad at safon yr un mor uchel o ofal lleddfól. Gellir cyflawni hynny pan fydd yr NHS a'r symudiad hosbis gwirfoddol yn cydweithio. Yr wyf wedi egluro fy mod yn disgwyl i'r awdurdodau iechyd gydweithio â hosbisau gwirfoddol wrth gynllunio a darparu ar gyfer gwasanaethau ac i'r gwrthwyneb.

Pan asesir bod angen gofal lleddfól ar glaf, disgwyliaf i'r asiantaethau perthnasol, gwasanaethau iechyd neu gymdeithasol, sicrhau yr ariennir y gofal hwnnw, o dan y trefniadau gofal parhaus. Soniodd Helen Mary am ariannu yn Llanelli. Mae Delyth Evans hefyd wedi codi'r mater hwnnw. Fel y gŵyr Helen Mary, yr oeddwn yno yn ystod fy nyddiau cynnar. Mae Awdurdod Iechyd Dyfed Powys wedi darparu £150,000 ac mae Ymddiriedolaeth NHS Sir Gaerfyrddin wedi darparu £75,000. Cydnabyddaf fod diffyg, ond rhaid inni gydnabod ymrwymiad pobl Llanelli i'r hosbis. Gobeithio y gallwn ddatblygu'r bartneriaeth. Pan asesir bod angen gofal lleddfól ar glaf, disgwyliaf i'r asiantaethau perthnasol sicrhau y caiff y gofal ei ariannu o dan y trefniadau gofal parhaus.

O ran trefniadau ariannu ar gyfer y dyfodol, fel y dywedodd Karen, mae trefniadau comisiynu'r NHS yn newid. Bydd hynny'n effeithio ar sut y caiff yr holl wasanaethau, yn cynnwys gofal lleddfól, eu hariannu. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau y caiff ariannu hosbisau ei drin fel rhan annatod o wasanaethau gofal lleddfól yn gyffredinol. Credaf, gyda'r trefniadau comisiynu newydd arfaethedig, y gallwn sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau eu darparu a'u comisiynu mewn modd cydgysylltiedig. Bydd gennym gyfleoedd newydd i ddatblygu ymagwedd strategol Cymru-gyfan.

Karen and Helen Mary asked about the palliative care strategy. We are developing the all-Wales palliative care strategy. It will draw on the report on the services that we already have. The Welsh Medical Committee commissioned the strategy. We have already seen the first draft, and work is ongoing to move it forward. The Wales Association for Hospice and Specialist Palliative Care is involved in the working group, leading towards the development of the palliative care strategy. I have met members of the association, and I have visited many hospices and met staff.

We must ensure that there is consultation on the strategy, and that the comments received from those involved, including voluntary hospices, are considered before we finalise the strategy. Alongside the strategy, we are developing a service framework for pain management services, which is important. Karen mentioned that in her speech. Therefore, the strategy is on its way.

In addition, there is £4.5 million from the New Opportunities Fund towards palliative care in Wales. There was consultation in the summer, of which some Members may be aware of, and the Wales Association for Hospice and Specialist Palliative Care was again involved. The directions are a result of Welsh discussion over that £4.5 million.

We have heard today about the excellent work of hospices in providing care palliative services in Wales. The way in which a society cares for its weakest and most vulnerable people is a measure of how civilised it is. We must work together to provide the best care possible for people with life-threatening and long-term illnesses. Of course, it requires a partnership approach. I believe that we can have a robust partnership in Wales. I will hammer that message home at every opportunity. The way forward for us in Wales is to ensure that our all-Wales palliative care strategy addresses the concerns that Karen raised. This is a timely debate for us to hold today.

Holodd Karen a Helen Mary ynghylch y strategaeth gofal lleddfol. Yr ydym yn datblygu'r strategaeth gofal lleddfol i Gymru gyfan. Bydd yn tynnu ar yr adroddiad ar y gwasanaethau sydd gennym eisoes. Pwyllgor Meddygol Cymru a gomisiynodd y strategaeth. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweld y drafft cyntaf, ac mae gwaith yn cael ei wneud i'w ddatblygu. Mae Cymdeithas Hosbis a Gofal Lleddfol Arbenigol Cymru yn cymryd rhan yn y gweithgor hwn, sy'n arwain at ddatblygu strategaeth gofal lleddfol. Yr wyf wedi cwrdd ag aelodau o'r gymdeithas, ac wedi ymweld â sawl hosbis a chwrdd â staff.

Rhaid inni sicrhau y cynhelir ymgynghoriad ar y strategaeth, ac y caiff y sylwadau a dderbynnir gan y rhai sy'n cymryd rhan, yn cynnwys hosbisau gwirfoddol, eu hystyried cyn i'r strategaeth derfynol gael ei llunio. Ochr yn ochr â'r strategaeth, yr ydym yn datblygu fframwaith gwasanaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau rheoli poen, sy'n bwysig. Soniodd Karen am hynny yn ei haraith. Felly, mae'r strategaeth ar ei ffordd.

Yn ogystal, mae £4.5 miliwn gan y Gronfa Cyfleoedd Newydd tuag at ofal lleddfol yng Nghymru. Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad dros yr haf—efallai bod rhai Aelodau'n ymwybodol ohono—ac yr oedd Cymdeithas Hosbis a Gofal Lleddfol Arbenigol Cymru yn rhan ohono unwaith eto. Mae'r cyfarwyddiadau yn ganlyniad trafodaethau yng Nghymru ynghylch y £4.5 miliwn hwnnw.

Clywsom heddiw am waith rhagorol hosbisau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau gofal lleddfol yng Nghymru. Mae'r modd y mae cymdeithas yn gofalu am ei phobl wannaf a mwyaf diamddiffyn yn arwydd o ba mor waraidd ydyw. Rhaid inni gydweithio i ddarparu'r gofal gorau posibl ar gyfer pobl â salwch hirdymor sy'n peryglu eu bywydau. Wrth gwrs, mae angen ymagwedd bartneriaeth. Credaf y gallwn gael partneriaeth gadarn yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn pwysleisio'r neges honno bob cyfle a gaf. Y ffordd ymlaen i ni yng Nghymru yw sicrhau bod ein strategaeth gofal lleddfol i Gymru gyfan yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a gododd Karen. Mae hon yn ddadl amserol i'w chynnal heddiw.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.54 p.m.
The session ended at 12.54 p.m.