



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 25 Ionawr 2001**

**Thursday 25 January 2001**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg  
*Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language*
- 13 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig  
*Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs*
- 23 Datganiad ar Isafswm Safonau Cenedlaethol Cartrefi'r Henoed  
*Statement on National Minimum Standards for Care Homes for Older People*
- 39 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
*Statement by the Presiding Officer*
- 40 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 53 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Taliadau Uniongyrchol i Ysgolion  
*Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Direct Payment to Schools*
- 93 Dadl Fer: Tai yng Ngefn Gwlad Cymru  
*Short Debate: Housing in Rural Wales*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg Questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language**

### **Annog Menywod i Gymryd Rhan mewn Chwaraeon Encouraging Women to Participate in Sport**

**Q1 Rosemary Butler:** What plans does the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language have to encourage women to participate in sport? (OAQ9059)

**The Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language (Jenny Randerson):** The Sports Council for Wales has already adopted an action plan to increase levels of participation in sport among women and girls. Its objective is to halve the gap between the participation levels of men and women by 2005. The Sports Council takes this matter seriously, as I witnessed when I participated in a women and girls action forum it held recently.

**Rosemary Butler:** I know that the Sports Council takes this seriously. I hope that you also take it seriously, as it is a vital issue. Although there is an action plan, we must move beyond that. We have excellent role models such as Tanni Grey-Thompson, the BBC Wales Sports Personality of the Year 2000, and Anneliese Heard from my constituency, who won the Carwyn James Junior Award at the same ceremony. However, other people need help. Will you consider the actions being taken in New Zealand? The Sports Council for Wales has adopted Dragon Sport, a scheme for children of primary school age that is an offshoot of Kiwi Sport in New Zealand. There is impressive sport provision for women in New Zealand. We must ensure that women enjoy sport and become fit, and are therefore less likely to suffer from osteoporosis and other diseases later in life.

**C1 Rosemary Butler:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg i annog menywod i gymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon? (OAQ9059)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg (Jenny Randerson):** Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru eisoes wedi mabwysiadu cynllun gweithredu i gynyddu lefelau o gyfranogiad mewn chwaraeon ymhlith menywod a merched. Ei nod yw haneru'r bwlch rhwng lefelau cyfranogiad ymhlith dynion a menywod erbyn 2005. Mae'r Cyngor Chwaraeon yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif, fel y gwelais wrth gymryd rhan mewn fforwm gweithredu i fenywod a merched a gynhaliwyd ganddo yn ddiweddar.

**Rosemary Butler:** Gwn fod y Cyngor Chwaraeon yn cymryd y mater o ddifrif. Gobeithiaf eich bod chi hefyd yn ei gymryd o ddifrif, gan ei fod yn fater hanfodol. Er bod cynllun gweithredu, rhaid inni symud y tu hwnt iddo. Mae gennym rôl-fodelau ardderchog megis Tanni Grey-Thompson, Personoliaeth Chwaraeon y Flwyddyn BBC Cymru 2000, ac Anneliese Heard o'm hetholaeth i, a enillodd Wobr Iau Carwyn James yn yr un seremoni. Fodd bynnag, mae angen help ar bobl eraill. A ystyriwch y camau a gymerir yn Seland Newydd? Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru wedi mabwysiadu Chwaraeon y Ddraig, cynllun i blant o oed ysgol cynradd yn seiliedig ar Kiwi Sport yn Seland Newydd. Ceir darpariaeth chwaraeon drawiadol i fenywod yn Seland Newydd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod menywod yn mwynhau chwaraeon ac yn dod yn heini, a'u bod felly yn llai tebygol o ddioddef osteoporosis ac afiechydon eraill yn ddiweddarach yn eu bywyd.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will consider in detail the actions being taken in New Zealand and anywhere else in the world that you can recommend as best practice. The Sports Council for Wales is undertaking many other initiatives. For example, it will introduce a schools sport rewards scheme, which will give a cash incentive to any secondary school that organises two or more after-school activities for girls. That is the kind of measure that will create the climate that Rosemary wants to see. However, I am worried about the gap in activity between men and women, which increases with age.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae pêl fas Gymreig yn un o'r ychydig chwaraeon tîm sydd yr un mor boblogaidd ymhlith menywod ag ydyw ymhlith dynion. A wnaiff y Gweinidog annog Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru i roi mwy o gydnabyddiaeth i'r gêm yn ei raglen gyllido?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree that baseball is a popular sport, which is to be encouraged. I will discuss the funding issue with the Sports Council.

**John Griffiths:** Jogging and running are activities in which many women participate. All Members see women jogging and running along the streets and roads of our constituencies. Would you support a mass participation Welsh marathon, which was once held in Cardiff, if any Welsh local authority supported the idea? It would encourage women, as well as men, to get involved in jogging and running, and thus gain the health and sport benefits of those activities.

**Jenny Randerson:** I support the idea in principle. I have watched many marathons, as my husband used to run in them. I regret that, in recent years, the fashion—if I can call it that—for formally organised marathons, half marathons and even fun-runs seems to have died away. That is a great pity, as many people achieve their fitness from running on our roads. A marathon is a goal to aim towards as part of a training schedule. As the support of local authorities must be secured

**Jenny Randerson:** Ystyriaif yn fanwl y camau a gymerir yn Seland Newydd ac unrhyw le arall yn y byd y gallwch ei argymhell fel arfer gorau. Mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn cynnal llawer o fentrau eraill. Er enghraifft, bydd yn cyflwyno cynllun gwobrau chwaraeon i ysgolion, a fydd yn rhoi cymhelliant ariannol i unrhyw ysgol uwchradd sydd yn trefnu dau neu fwy o weithgareddau ar ôl ysgol i ferched. Dyna'r math o fesur a fydd yn creu'r hinsawdd y mae Rosemary am ei gweld. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu am y bwlch mewn gweithgaredd rhwng dynion a menywod, sydd yn cynyddu gydag oedran.

**Owen John Thomas:** Welsh baseball is one of the few team sports that is as popular among women as it is among men. Will the Minister encourage the Sports Council for Wales to give more recognition to the sport in its funding programme?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf fod pêl fas yn fath poblogaidd o chwaraeon, a dylid ei annog. Trafodaf y mater o gyllido gyda'r Cyngor Chwaraeon.

**John Griffiths:** Mae loncian a rhedeg yn weithgareddau y mae llawer o fenywod yn ymgymryd â hwy. Mae pob Aelod yn gweld menywod yn loncian ac yn rhedeg ar hyd strydoedd a ffyrdd ein hetholaethau. A fydech yn cefnogi marathon cyfranogiad torfol i Gymru, a gynhaliwyd unwaith yng Nghaerdydd, pe bai unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn cefnogi'r syniad? Byddai'n annog menywod, yn ogystal â dynion, i gymryd rhan mewn loncian a rhedeg, a thrwy hynny fwynhau buddiannau iechyd a chwaraeon y gweithgareddau hyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cefnogaf y syniad mewn egwyddor. Gwyliais lawer o farathonau, gan yr arferai fy ngŵr redeg ynddynt. Mae'n anffodus, yn ddiweddar, ei bod yn ymddangos bod y ffasiwn—os caf ei alw'n hynny—o drefnu marathona, hanner marathona a hyd yn oed rasys hwyl yn ffurfiol wedi gostegu. Mae hynny'n drueni mawr, gan fod llawer o bobl yn cadw'n heini drwy redeg ar ein ffyrdd. Mae marathon yn nod i anelu ato fel rhan o raglen hyfforddi.

first, perhaps we can follow that up.

Gan fod yn rhaid sicrhau cefnogaeth awdurdodau lleol yn gyntaf, efallai y gallem fynd ar drywydd hynny.

**William Graham:** The Welsh Conservatives are delighted by your remarks this morning. I hope that you will work with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to ensure that these proposals are enacted in schools. After all, it is in school that most young people develop an interest in sport that they carry into later life. Will you also join me in expressing concern, with regard to sports injuries in particular, that there are now about 5,000 people in Wales waiting more than 18 months for operations?

**William Graham:** Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cael pleser mawr o glywed eich sylwadau y bore yma. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i sicrhau y gweithredir y cynigion hyn mewn ysgolion. Wedi'r cyfan, yn yr ysgol y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc yn datblygu diddordeb mewn chwaraeon a ddatblygir yn eu bywyd fel oedolion. A ymunwch â mi hefyd wrth fynegi pryder, o ran anafiadau chwaraeon yn benodol, bod tua 5,000 o bobl yng Nghymru erbyn hyn yn aros fwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaethau?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That supplementary does not arise from the original question. Not all of those who are awaiting operations have sports injuries. Although the Minister may address the question of such operations relating to sports injuries, this may be a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r cwestiwn ategol hwnnw'n deillio o'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol. Nid anafiadau chwaraeon sydd gan bob un o'r rheini sydd yn aros am lawdriniaethau. Er y gall y Gweinidog ymateb i'r cwestiwn ynghylch llawdriniaethau o'r fath sydd yn ymwneud ag anafiadau chwaraeon, efallai mai mater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ydyw.

**Jenny Randerson:** Jane is not answering questions this morning. On sport in schools, there has recently been consultation on the new round of new opportunities funds, which comprises a total of about £94 million for Wales. A portion of that is likely to be devoted—we are considering responses at present, so there is no certainty—to sport for young people in some way. There is much hope for the future on that aspect.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid yw Jane yn ateb cwestiynau y bore yma. O ran chwaraeon mewn ysgolion, cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad yn ddiweddar ar y cylch newydd o gronfeydd cyfleoedd newydd, sydd yn cynnwys cyfanswm o tua £94 miliwn i Gymru. Mae'n debygol—yr ydym yn ystyried ymatebion ar hyn o bryd, felly nid oes unrhyw sicrwydd—y dyrennir cyfran o hwnnw i chwaraeon ar gyfer pobl ifanc mewn rhyw ffordd. Mae rhagolygon da iawn ar gyfer y dyfodol o ran yr agwedd honno.

### **Sefydlu Oriol Genedlaethol ar gyfer Celf Fodern Establishing a National Gallery of Modern Art**

**Q2 David Melding:** Does Jenny Randerson intend to establish a national gallery of modern art? (OAQ9075)

**C2 David Melding:** A yw Jenny Randerson yn bwriadu sefydlu oriel genedlaethol ar gyfer celf fodern? (OAQ9075)

**Jenny Randerson:** The National Museums and Galleries of Wales is currently examining its policies for displaying its art collection. It will undertake a public

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae Amgueddfeydd ac Oriolau Cenedlaethol Cymru wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn archwilio eu polisiau ar gyfer arddangos eu casgliad celf. Byddant yn

consultation exercise later this year to gauge public opinion on the options that may be open to it. I will talk to it about its future options once we know the outcome of that consultation.

**David Melding:** Will the Minister give us an indication of whether this Liberal Democrat manifesto pledge will be honoured? Why not extend the idea and create a national art gallery that covers all genres of art in Wales?

**Jenny Randerson:** You are correct to refer to the Liberal Democrat manifesto pledge. This was not included in the partnership agreement as we were aware of this forthcoming public consultation, in which this matter is an option that the National Museums and Galleries of Wales will put forward and consider this year. I welcome that consultation. I hope that it will produce good practical proposals. The Conservative Party, for example, has put forward Cardiff City Hall as a possible venue for an art gallery. However, a preliminary look at the practicalities and cost of that—forgetting that one would need the agreement of the people of Cardiff as it is their city hall—would be considerable and would have to be considered against several other proposals.

**David Melding:** We need vision.

**The Presiding Officer:** Was that a second supplementary question?

**David Melding:** No. It was a lament.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that having one centre, whether it be in Cardiff or anywhere else, means that not all people from Wales will have easy access to it? In the consultation, will you be sympathetic to the view that perhaps we should take art out of the galleries and display it in venues throughout Wales? We could have exhibitions in places such as the Wyeside Arts Centre, Brecon Museum and also

cynnal ymarfer ymgynghori cyhoeddus yn ddiweddarach eleni i ganfod barn y cyhoedd ar yr opsiynau a allai fod yn agored iddo. Trafodaf eu hopsiynau ar gyfer y dyfodol gyda hwy unwaith y bydd canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw yn hysbys.

**David Melding:** A rydd y Gweinidog arwydd inni a gaiff yr addewid maniffesto Democratiaidd Rhyddfrydol hwn ei wireddu ai peidio? Beth am ehangu'r syniad a chreu oriel gelf genedlaethol yn cwmpasu pob genre o gelf yng Nghymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydych yn iawn i gyfeirio at addewid maniffesto'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Nis cynhwyswyd hyn yn y cytundeb partneriaeth gan ein bod yn ymwybodol o'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus arfaethedig hwn, lle mae'r mater hwn yn opsiwn y bydd Amgueddfeydd ac Oriellau Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ei gyflwyno a'i ystyried eleni. Croesawaf yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn cynhyrchu cynigion ymarferol da. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol, er enghraifft, wedi cynnig Neuadd y Ddinas, Caerdydd, fel lleoliad posibl ar gyfer oriel gelf. Fodd bynnag, byddai golwg gychwynnol ar ymarferoldeb y lleoliad a'i gost—gan anghofio y byddai angen cytundeb pobl Caerdydd gan mai neuadd eu dinas hwy ydyw—yn sylweddol a byddai'n rhaid ei ystyried yn erbyn sawl cynnig arall.

**David Melding:** Mae angen gweledigaeth arnom.

**Y Llywydd:** Ai ail gwestiwn ategol oedd hwnnw?

**David Melding:** Nage. Galarnad ydoedd.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch bod cael un ganolfan, boed yng Nghaerdydd neu rywle arall, yn golygu na fydd gan holl bobl Cymru fynediad hawdd iddi? Yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, a fyddwch yn ystyried y safbwynt y dylem, o bosibl, dynnu celf o'r oriellau a'i arddangos mewn lleoliadau ledled Cymru? Gallem gynnal arddangosfeydd mewn mannau fel Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy, Amgueddfa Aberhonddu a

venues in north Wales so that all the people of Wales could enjoy the art.

**Jenny Randerson:** The proposal to take more art and artefacts around Wales in rotating exhibitions and on more or less permanent or temporary loan to specific museums and galleries will be part of the public consultation. The National Museum has been asked to look particularly at the feasibility of having regular galleries in which such exhibitions could be held. The ideas of fixed or rotating exhibitions are not mutually exclusive. I am aware that mid Wales has many good art galleries and I am sure that you have one or two in mind.

hefyd lleoliadau yng ngogledd Cymru er mwyn i holl bobl Cymru allu mwynhau'r celf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Bydd y cynnig i gynnal mwy o arddangosfeydd symudol o gelf ac arteffactau ledled Cymru ac i'w benthg ar sail barhaol neu dros dro i amgueddfeydd neu orielau penodol yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus. Gofynnwyd i'r Amgueddfa Genedlaethol ystyried yn benodol ymarferoldeb sefydlu orielau rheolaidd lle y gellid cynnal arddangosfeydd o'r fath. Nid yw'r syniadau o arddangosfeydd sefydlog neu symudol yn ddau beth gwbl ar wahân. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod llawer o orielau celf da yng nghanolbarth Cymru ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi ystyried un neu ddwy ohonynt.

### **Pwysigrwydd yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol The Importance of the National Eisteddfod**

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will Jenny Randerson make a statement on the importance of the National Eisteddfod in the promotion of Welsh culture and the Welsh language? (OAQ9093)

**Jenny Randerson:** The National Eisteddfod is a unique celebration of Welsh language, culture and heritage. It is one of the premier cultural festivals in Europe. It brings together people from all walks of life, of all ages, from all parts of Wales and further afield. At Llanelli last year, 162,000 people attended the Eisteddfod and there were more than 7,000 competitors. I am sure that Denbigh will do us proud when it hosts the festival this year.

**Ann Jones:** I am also sure that Denbigh will do us proud. The statistics, and the importance that we have placed on the festival, show that the Eisteddfod is Wales's shop front. It is our chance to show what we are. Do you agree that Councillor Glyn's comments last week do nothing to help Welsh culture, and only serve to create the opposite of our aim in this Assembly, which is to create an inclusive and tolerant Wales?

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff Jenny Randerson ddatganiad ynghylch pwysigrwydd yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol o ran hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru a'r iaith Gymraeg? (OAQ9093)

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol yn ddathliad unigryw o'r iaith Gymraeg, ein diwylliant a'n hetifeddiaeth. Mae'n un o'r digwyddiadau diwylliannol pwysicaf yn Ewrop. Daw â phobl ynghyd o bob cefndir, o bob oed, o bob cwr o Gymru a'r tu hwnt iddi. Yn Llanelli y llynedd, mynychodd 162,000 o bobl yr Eisteddfod a gwelwyd mwy na 7,000 o gystadleuwyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn gallu ymfalchïo yn ymdrech Dinbych pan gynhelir yr ŵyl yno eleni.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf innau hefyd yn siŵr y byddwn yn gallu ymfalchïo yn ymdrech Dinbych. Dengys yr ystadegau, a'r pwysigrwydd a roddwn ar yr ŵyl, mai'r Eisteddfod yw ffenestr siop Cymru. Dyma'n cyfle i ddangos ein hunaniaeth. A gytunwch na wna sylwadau'r Cynghorydd Glyn yr wythnos ddiwethaf unrhyw beth i helpu diwylliant Cymreig, a'u bod yn mynd yn groes i'n nod yn y Cynulliad hwn, sef creu Cymru gynhwysol a goddefgar?

9:15 a.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am on record as already having condemned Councillor Glyn's remarks. They were amazing, shocking and beyond the pale of civilised political comment. I regret that those comments have probably undermined years of good work to mend the divide between Welsh speakers and non-Welsh speakers that exists, particularly, on the eastern edge of Wales. It is a great pity.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you agree that Councillor Glyn's comments truly reflect the instincts of the nationalist party in the Chamber?

**Jenny Randerson:** I hope that no Member of Plaid Cymru here would sympathise with his comments. However, that is a party political issue and each party has its own way of dealing with people who are out of line. It is an internal issue for Plaid Cymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is about the National Eisteddfod.

**Cynog Dafis:** Diolch am y cyfle i ddweud gair am yr Eisteddfod Genedlaethol. Llongyfarchaf yr Aelodau eraill ar eu gallu i ystumio'r cwestiynau hyn er mwyn sgorio pwyntiau gwleidyddol. Y pwynt ynglŷn â'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol—a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno—yw ei gallu i ddod â phobl o wahanol gefndiroedd a gwahanol ddiwylliannau at ei gilydd i gydweithio a dathlu yr hyn sydd yn Gymreig a'r hyn yr ydym yn falch ohoni. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylai pob un siarad am yr Eisteddfod yn y cyd-destun hwnnw a pheidio â'i defnyddio, nac unrhywbeth arall, fel ffordd o greu ymraniadau yng Nghymru?

**Jenny Randerson:** I am delighted to hear your point of view, Cynog. I believe that 12 per cent of the visitors to the National Eisteddfod last year were either non-Welsh speakers or Welsh learners. That shows the power and influence of the Eisteddfod in bringing non-Welsh speakers together with Welsh speakers. The percentage of non-

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi condemnio sylwadau'r Cynghorydd Glyn ar y record. Yr oeddent yn syfrdanol, yn syndod ac y tu hwnt i sylwadau gwleidyddol gwaraid. Yn anffodus mae'n debygol bod y sylwadau hynny wedi tanseilio blynyddoedd o waith da o geisio cael gwared ar y rhaniad rhwng siaradwyr Cymraeg a'r di-Gymraeg sydd yn bodoli, yn arbennig, ar ymylon dwyreiniol Cymru. Mae'n drueni mawr.

**Alun Cairns:** A gytunwch bod sylwadau'r Cynghorydd Glyn yn adlewyrchiad gwirioneddol o deimladau'r blaid genedlaethol yn y Siambr hon?

**Jenny Randerson:** Gobeithiaf na fyddai unrhyw un o Aelodau Plaid Cymru yma yn cydymdeimlo â'i sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r pleidiau gwleidyddol yw hwnnw ac mae gan bob plaid ei ffordd o ddelio â phobl sydd yn ymddwyn yn amhriodol. Mater mewnol i Blaid Cymru ydyw.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol.

**Cynog Dafis:** Thank you for the opportunity to speak about the National Eisteddfod. I congratulate the other Members on their ability to distort these questions to score political points. The point about the National Eisteddfod—and I hope that the Minister will agree—is its ability to bring people from different backgrounds and cultures together to co-operate and celebrate Welsh life, and that of which we are proud. Does the Minister agree that everyone should talk about the Eisteddfod in that context and not use it, nor anything else, as a means to create divisions in Wales?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n bleser gennyf glywed eich safbwyntiau, Cynog. Credaf fod 12 y cant o'r ymwelwyr i'r Eisteddfod Genedlaethol y llynedd naill ai'n ddi-Gymraeg neu'n ddysgwyr. Dengys hynny bŵer a dylanwad yr Eisteddfod wrth ddod â'r Cymry di-Gymraeg a'r Cymry Cymraeg ynghyd. Mae canran y di-Gymraeg sydd yn



Welsh speakers who attend the Urdd Eisteddfod is much higher. Both organisations should be congratulated for their work in promoting the Welsh language and understanding of the Welsh language.

mynychu Eisteddfod yr Urdd yn llawer uwch. Dylid llongyfarch y ddau sefydliad am eu gwaith wrth hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg a dealltwriaeth am yr iaith Gymraeg.

### **Adolygu Rheolau Cyllido ar gyfer Cronfeydd y Loteri Reviewing Funding Rules for Lottery Funds**

**Q4 Peter Black:** What work has Jenny Randerson carried out to review funding rules for various lottery funds? (OAQ9062)

**C4 Peter Black:** Pa waith a wnaethpwyd gan Jenny Randerson i adolygu rheolau cyllido ar gyfer amryfal gronfeydd y loteri? (OAQ9062)

**Jenny Randerson:** Lottery bodies distribute funds according to their policy and financial direction. In the case of the Heritage Lottery Fund, the new opportunities fund, and the National Lottery Charities Board, these are set by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. However, the Assembly has a significant input into the process. We set directions for the Sports Council for Wales and the Arts Council of Wales directly. I have met lottery distributors to explore how they might take the Assembly's views into account when distributing funds in the future. I will establish a task group shortly to consider how that might be done.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae cyrff y loteri yn dosbarthu arian yn unol â'u polisi a'u cyfarwyddyd ariannol. Yn achos y Gronfa Loteri Treftadaeth, y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd, a Bwrdd Elusennau'r Loteri Genedlaethol, fe'u pennir gan yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y Cynulliad fewnbwn sylweddol i'r broses. Cyflwynwn gyfarwyddiadau i Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn uniongyrchol. Cyfarfûm â dosbarthwyr y loteri i archwilio sut y gallent ystyried safbwyntiau'r Cynulliad wrth ddsbarthu arian yn y dyfodol. Byddaf yn sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl maes o law i ystyried sut y gellid gwneud hynny.

**Peter Black:** Are there any proposals to use lottery funding to improve facilities for children's play and sport facilities for children?

**Peter Black:** A oes unrhyw gynigion i ddefnyddio arian y loteri i wella cyfleusterau chwarae plant a chyfleusterau chwaraeon i blant?

**Jenny Randerson:** There are two main ways in which that could be done. One—and I referred to this earlier in my answer to William Graham—is through the new opportunities fund. Its next tranche of money would give us that opportunity if we wished to pursue this. I am considering responses on that. The Heritage Lottery Fund can also be used for parks and the development of certain parks with a heritage input. I believe that that is being considered in Swansea at the moment.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae dwy brif ffordd y gellid gwneud hynny. Un ohonynt—a chyfeiriais at hyn yn gynharach yn fy ateb i William Graham—yw drwy'r gronfa cyfleoedd newydd. Byddai ei gyfran nesaf o arian yn rhoi'r cyfle hwnnw inni pe byddem am fynd ar drywydd hyn. Yr wyf yn ystyried ymatebion ar hynny. Gellir defnyddio'r Gronfa Loteri Treftadaeth hefyd ar gyfer parciau a datblygu rhai parciau gyda mewnbwn treftadaeth. Credaf fod hynny yn cael ei ystyried yn Abertawe ar hyn o bryd.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The National Lottery is vital to Wales. What is the administration's

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae'r Loteri Genedlaethol yn hanfodol i Gymru. Beth yw agwedd y

attitude to awarding the administration of the National Lottery to Camelot again? What representations did you make prior to that award?

**Jenny Randerson:** The decision to award the lottery franchise to Camelot was a matter for the lottery regulator, the National Lottery Commission. Ministers played no part in the decision, which was made independently of Government, at UK and Welsh level.

**Tom Middlehurst:** When will you be in a position to report on the review of lottery share with respect to arts and sport in particular, in Wales? You are aware that the review is ongoing with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport. That review was initiated about a year ago and the report was due this month. Can you tell me whether there has been any progress?

**Jenny Randerson:** I share your concern about lottery share. I am in regular correspondence with the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport on this issue. The question of the lottery share in relation to sport, and other elements, will be discussed at the Sports Cabinet, which will take place in mid February. There is also the Jack Cunningham review, as it is commonly known. Unfortunately, two proposed meetings with Jack Cunningham's group were cancelled due to unforeseen circumstances, namely bad weather and illness. However, I expect him and his group to visit Wales in the near future. I hope that they will visit in the next few weeks to talk to me and the Sports Council for Wales.

weinyddiaeth tuag at ddyfarnu gwaith gweinyddu'r Loteri Genedlaethol i Camelot eto? Pa sylwadau a wnaethoch cyn y dyfarniad hwnnw?

**Jenny Randerson:** Mater i reoleiddiwr y loteri, Comisiwn y Loteri Genedlaethol, oedd y penderfyniad i ddyfarnu rhyddfaint y loteri i Camelot. Nid oedd unrhyw ran gan Weinidogion yn y penderfyniad, a wnaed yn annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth, ar lefel y DU a Chymru.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Pryd y byddwch mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno adroddiad ar yr arolwg o ddyrannu'r loteri mewn perthynas â'r celfyddydau a chwaraeon yn benodol, yng Nghymru? Yr ydych yn ymwybodol bod yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon wrthi'n cynnal arolwg. Dechreuwyd yr arolwg hwnnw tua blwyddyn yn ôl a disgwyliwyd yr adroddiad y mis hwn. A allwch ddweud wrthyf a fu unrhyw ddatblygiadau?

**Jenny Randerson:** Rhannaf eich pryder am ddyrannu'r loteri. Yr wyf yn gohebu'n rheolaidd â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ar y mater hwn. Trafodir dyrannu'r loteri mewn perthynas â chwaraeon, ac elfennau eraill, yn y Cabinet Chwaraeon, a gynhelir yng nghanol Chwefror. Mae arolwg Jack Cunningham hefyd, fel y'i gelwir yn gyffredinol. Yn anffodus, cafodd dau gyfarfod a drefnwyd gyda grŵp Jack Cunningham eu canslo oherwydd amgylchiadau nas rhagwelwyd, sef tywydd garw a salwech. Fodd bynnag, disgwyliaf iddo ef a'i grŵp ymweld â Chymru yn y dyfodol agos. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn ymweld â ni yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf i drafod gyda mi a Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru.

### **Rhoi 'Diwylliant Cytûn' ar Waith Implementing 'A Culture in Common'**

**Q5 Jonathan Morgan:** Will Jenny Randerson make a statement on the implementation of 'A Culture in Common'? (OAQ9076)

**Jenny Randerson:** I am sure that you share

**C5 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff Jenny Randerson ddatganiad ynghylch rhoi 'Diwylliant Cytûn' ar waith? (OAQ9076)

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod

the view that last week's Plenary debate on this report was constructive and well-informed. I have endorsed the key priorities in the report, and I will pay close attention to the views expressed during that debate as I prepare the partnership Government's response.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Certain sections of the report state that there were powerful arguments for establishing a national gallery. We heard your response to my colleague, David Melding, that reviews are ongoing. However, it is not good enough to say that we have had this report and await the outcome of further reviews. The people of Wales need vision. I ask you to make good the manifesto pledge—as a Liberal Democrat, you said that you would do this—or take a pay cut.

**Jenny Randerson:** I repeat that this was a manifesto pledge by the Liberal Democrats. It was not in the partnership agreement, because the review is ongoing. You talk about a further review, but there has not been a review of how art is displayed in Wales. This is a typical Conservative approach, being profligate with public money. We need a proper review that considers all the options. This review will have three elements. The first element is a review of—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is providing information to the National Assembly, including the Welsh Conservative group.

**Jenny Randerson:** They probably cannot understand it, Presiding Officer.

The first element will involve consultation with interested parties. You will have an opportunity to express your view as a member of the Committee. The third element will be widespread public consultation. I am committed to a much wider distribution of public art in Wales. 'A Culture in Common' pointed to the need for this and, therefore, led to the review.

yn rhannu'r farn y bu'r ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos ddiwethaf ar yr adroddiad hwn yn adeiladol ac yn hyddysg. Cymeradwyais flaenoriaethau allweddol yr adroddiad, a thalaf sylw gofalus i'r safbwyntiau a fynegwyd yn ystod y ddadl honno wrth baratoi ymateb y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Noda rhai adrannau o'r adroddiad bod dadleuon grymus dros sefydlu oriel genedlaethol. Clywsom eich ymateb i'm cyd-Aelod, David Melding, bod arolygon yn mynd rhagddynt. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ddigon da nodi ein bod wedi derbyn yr adroddiad hwn a'n bod yn aros am ganlyniad arolygon pellach. Mae angen gweledigaeth ar bobl Cymru. Gofynnaf ichi wireddu addewid y maniffesto—fel Democrat Rhyddfrydol, dywedasoich y byddech yn gwneud hyn—neu gymryd gostyngiad cyflog.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ailadroddaf mai addewid maniffesto gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oedd hwn. Nid oedd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth, gan fod yr arolwg yn mynd rhagddo. Yr ydych yn sôn am arolwg pellach, ond ni fu arolwg o sut y caiff celf ei arddangos yng Nghymru. Mae hon yn ymagwedd sydd yn nodweddiadol o'r Ceidwadwyr, sef gwastraffu arian cyhoeddus. Mae angen arolwg cywir arnom sydd yn ystyried pob opsiwn. Bydd tair elfen i'r arolwg hwn. Yr elfen gyntaf fydd arolwg o—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn darparu gwybodaeth i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gan gynnwys grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ni allant ei deall, fwy na thebyg, Lywydd.

Bydd yr elfen gyntaf yn cynnwys ymgynghori â phartïon â diddordeb. Cewch gyfle i fynegi eich barn fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor. Y drydedd elfen fydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus eang. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i ddosbarthu celfyddyd gyhoeddus yn llawer ehangach yng Nghymru. Nododd 'Diwylliant Cytûn' yr angen am hyn gan arwain, felly, at yr arolwg

hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi parodrwydd Jenny i ymateb yn wirfoddol i'r adroddiad 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Fodd bynnag, a fyddai hi'n cytuno bod angen proses ffurfiol i sicrhau bod y weinyddiaeth yn ymateb i adroddiadau Pwyllgorau?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I appreciate Jenny's willingness to respond voluntarily to the report 'A Culture in Common'. However, would she agree that a formal process is needed to ensure that the administration responds to Committee reports?

**Jenny Randerson:** I encountered this in my former role as business manager for my party. The Business Committee discussed in depth how these responses are made and it is for the Business Committee to determine on that matter. However, in relation to this particular report, you have my commitment that the Culture Committee will be kept fully informed and involved. However, you are aware, because we discussed this as a Committee, that the report contains 104 recommendations. One cannot respond to all of them at the same time, because the Committee's report formed a 10-year plan.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cododd y pwnc yma yn fy hen rôl fel rheolwr busnes fy mhlaid. Trafododd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn fanwl sut y gwneir yr ymatebion hyn a chyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor Busnes fydd gwneud penderfyniad ar y mater hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mewn perthynas â'r adroddiad penodol hwn, rhoddaf fy ymrwymiad y caiff y Pwyllgor Diwylliant ei gynnwys ac y rhoddir y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf iddo. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn ymwybodol, gan inni ei drafod fel Pwyllgor, bod yr adroddiad yn cynnwys 104 o argymhellion. Ni ellir ymateb i bob un ohonynt ar yr un pryd, gan fod adroddiad y Pwyllgor yn ffurfio cynllun 10 mlynedd.

9:25 a.m.

### **Hyrwyddo'r Iaith Gymraeg Promoting the Welsh Language**

**C6 Geraint Davies:** Pa bolisiau sydd gan Jenny Randerson i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg? (OAQ9051)

**Q6 Geraint Davies:** What policies does Jenny Randerson have for promoting the Welsh language? (OAQ9051)

**Jenny Randerson:** We have agreed with the Welsh Language Board that our policies should be designed to increase the number of people who are able to speak Welsh; to provide opportunities for them to use the language; to change habits of language use; to encourage Welsh speakers to take advantage of the opportunities provided; and to strengthen Welsh as a community language.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydym wedi cytuno gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg y dylid cynllunio ein polisiau i gynyddu nifer y bobl sydd yn gallu siarad Cymraeg; i ddarparu cyfleoedd iddynt ddefnyddio'r iaith; i newid arferion defnyddio'r iaith; i annog siaradwyr Cymraeg i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd a ddarperir; ac i atgyfnerthu'r Gymraeg fel iaith gymunedol.

**Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog annog awdurdodau lleol i gynyddu darpariaeth addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg drwy gynnal arolwg o rieni plant dan dair oed i ddarganfod y bwloch rhwng y galw a'r ddarpariaeth?

**Geraint Davies:** Will the Minister encourage local authorities to increase the provision of Welsh-medium education by conducting a survey of parents of children under three years old to establish what the gap is between demand and provision?

**Jenny Randerson:** I would have to work on that with Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. However, you have my commitment that I will put that proposal to her and we will respond in due course.

**David Davies:** Does the Minister agree that we could further raise the standard of spoken Welsh by targeting time and resources on those who want to learn the language? Does she agree that the insistence on compulsory Welsh, particularly in areas such as Monmouth for pupils over the age of 14, is no more relevant or useful than insisting that all Assembly Members undertake compulsory Welsh studies?

**Jenny Randerson:** The previous Conservative Government introduced, after a period of public consultation, the legislation which led to compulsory Welsh education up to the age of 16. As a former lecturer and teacher, I know that if you ask pupils what they want to learn when they are young, it is not always what they think they should have learned when they are older. The same principle would apply to other subjects such as mathematics, English literature and French. It is a pity that the Conservative group in the Assembly has reneged on the previous Conservative Government's good work on this issue.

**Jenny Randerson:** Byddai'n rhaid imi weithio ar hynny gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Fodd bynnag, ymrwymaf i wneud y cynnig hwnnw iddi ac fe ymatebwn maes o law.

**David Davies:** A gytuna'r Gweinidog y gallem godi safon Cymraeg llafar ymhellach drwy dargedu amser ac adnoddau ar y rheini sydd am ddysgu'r iaith? A gytuna nad yw mynnu Cymraeg gorfodol, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd megis Trefynwy ar gyfer disgyblion dros 14 oed, yn fwy perthnasol na defnyddiol na mynnu bod holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dilyn cwrs astudiaethau Cymraeg gorfodol?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cyflwynodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol, ar ôl cyfnod o ymgynghori cyhoeddus, y ddeddfwriaeth a arweiniodd at addysg Gymraeg orfodol hyd at 16 oed. Fel cyn ddarlithydd ac athrawes, gwn os gofynnwch i ddisgyblion beth y maent am ei ddysgu pan ydynt yn ifanc, nad yw bob amser yr un peth â'r hyn y credant y dylent fod wedi'i ddysgu pan ydynt yn hŷn. Byddai'r un egwyddor yn berthnasol i bynciau eraill megis mathemateg, llenyddiaeth Saesneg a Ffrangeg. Mae'n drueni nad yw'r grŵp Ceidwadol yn y Cynulliad wedi parhau â gwaith da yr hen Lywodraeth Geidwadol ar y mater hwn.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig Questions to the Minister for Rural Affairs**

### **Rôl y Bartneriaeth Wledig i Gymru The Role of the Rural Partnership for Wales**

**Q1 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister for Rural Affairs make a statement on the role of the rural partnership for Wales? (OAQ9104)

**The Minister for Rural Affairs (Carwyn Jones):** The rural partnership for Wales is an advisory body with a broad membership reflecting economic, environmental, educational and voluntary sector interests in Wales. Its aim is to identify policy and practice capable of delivering substantial benefits to rural Wales and to inform

**C1 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig ddatganiad ynghylch rôl y bartneriaeth wledig i Gymru? (OAQ9104)

**Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Carwyn Jones):** Mae'r bartneriaeth wledig i Gymru yn gorff ymgynghorol gydag aelodaeth eang yn adlewyrchu buddiannau economaidd, amgylcheddol, addysgol a sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru. Ei nod yw nodi polisi ac arfer â'r gallu i gyflwyno buddiannau sylweddol i Gymru wledig a

discussion of the rural agenda in Wales. I chair the partnership meetings, and Assembly officials and myself are part of a joint secretariat with the Welsh Local Government Association, the Wales Council for Voluntary Action and the Welsh Development Agency. In July 1999, the partnership published a statement setting out its vision and objectives for rural Wales. These were taken into account in the Assembly's rural development plan, which has been approved by the European Commission. The important issue now is to develop clear priorities for action to turn these objectives into reality. That is why I have called a meeting of the rural partnership in February and I will be putting proposals to the partnership on how to take these matters forward.

**Ann Jones:** It is good to see that we are now getting the partnership back together and that there is a definite interest in how we promote rural issues. However, for it to be constructive and meaningful, and to achieve results, would you agree to look in the future to extend the partnership to include bodies such as Friends of the Earth, the Ramblers Association and the Trade Union Congress? That will show that there can be a strong voice across Wales to consider how we tackle rural issues.

**Carwyn Jones:** The work of the rural partnership is intended to look at all aspects of rural life and not those confined to my portfolio. There is a limit as to the number of people that can be part of the partnership. However, I am happy to look into ways of broadening the membership of the partnership and reaching out to organisations that previously may have felt excluded. The rural partnership is designed to be as broad as possible and to examine all aspects of rural life.

**Elin Jones:** Gan y bydd y bartneriaeth wledig yn trafod yr ystod ehangaf posibl o faterion gwledig, a chan eich bod chi bellach yn galw eich hun yn Weinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, beth yw eich porffolio, ac a gredwch mai chi ddylai fod â chyfrifoldeb

llywio trafodaeth ar yr agenda wledig yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn cadeirio'r cyfarfodyddartneriaeth ac yr wyf innau a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn rhan o gyd-ysgrifenyddiaeth gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Yng Ngorffennaf 1999, cyhoeddodd y bartneriaeth ddatganiad yn nodi ei gweledigaeth a'i hamcanion ar gyfer Cymru wledig. Fe'u hystyriwyd yng nghynllun datblygu gwledig y Cynulliad, a gymeradwywyd gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Y mater pwysig yn awr yw datblygu blaenoriaethau clir ar gyfer gweithredu er mwyn gwireddu'r amcanion hyn. Dyna pam y trefnais gyfarfod o'r bartneriaeth wledig yn Chwefror a byddaf yn cyflwyno cynigion i'r bartneriaeth ar sut i ddatblygu'r materion hyn.

**Ann Jones:** Da yw gweld ein bod yn ailsefydlu'r bartneriaeth a bod diddordeb pendant yn y ffordd yr hyrwyddwn faterion gwledig. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn iddi fod yn adeiladol ac yn ystyrlon, ac i gyflawni canlyniadau, a fydddech yn cytuno ystyried ehangu'r bartneriaeth yn y dyfodol i gynnwys cyrff megis Cyfeillion y Ddaear, Cymdeithas y Cerddwyr a Chynghrair yr Undebau Llafur? Bydd hynny'n dangos y gellir cael llais cryf ledled Cymru i ystyried sut yr awn i'r afael â materion gwledig.

**Carwyn Jones:** Bwriad gwaith y bartneriaeth wledig yw ystyried pob agwedd ar fywyd gwledig ac nid y rheini sydd wedi eu cyfyngu i'm portffolio i. Mae terfyn o ran nifer y bobl a all fod yn rhan o'r bartneriaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i ystyried ffyrdd o ehangu aelodaeth y bartneriaeth ac estyn croeso i sefydliadau a allai fod yn teimlo wedi eu heithrio yn y gorffennol. Cynlluniwyd y bartneriaeth wledig i fod mor eang â phosibl ac i archwilio pob agwedd ar fywyd gwledig.

**Elin Jones:** As the rural partnership will be discussing the broadest possible range of rural issues, and as you now call yourself the Minister for Rural Affairs, what is your portfolio, and do you believe that you should have responsibility for all rural issues in the

dros yr holl faterion gwledig o fewn y Cabinet, sydd yn cynnwys tai, trafndiaeth, iechyd ac addysg o fewn ardaloedd gwledig? Ai atoch chi y dylem gyfeirio cwestiynau ar y pynciau pwysig hyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ymdrin â materion sydd y tu allan i'm portffolio, fel tai, cludiant ac yn y blaen. Rhaid sicrhau nad ydym yn adeiladu waliau rhwng Aelodau'r Cabinet. Mae'r Cabinet yng Nghaerdydd yn wahanol i'r Cabinet yn Llundain gan fod adrannau Whitehall yn gyfarwydd â, ac mewn sefyllfa i, weithio'n annibynnol. Yng Nghaerdydd, ceir perthynas dda rhwng yr adrannau ac nid oes angen pryderu nad yw pobl yn cydweithio. Cydweithiwn yn dda fel Aelodau'r Cabinet ac fel adrannau.

Cabinet, including housing, transport, health and education in rural areas? Should we direct questions on these important issues to you?

**Carwyn Jones:** I deal with matters that are outside my portfolio, such as housing, transport and so forth. We must ensure that we do not erect walls between Members of the Cabinet. The Cabinet in Cardiff is different to the Cabinet in London because Whitehall departments are used to, and in a position to work independently. In Cardiff there is a good relationship between the departments and we do not need to be concerned that people are not co-operating. We co-operate well as members of the Cabinet and as departments.

### **Twbercwlosis Buchol mewn Moch Daear a Gwartheg Bovine Tuberculosis in Badgers and Cattle**

**C2 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff Carwyn Jones ddatganiad ynghylch unrhyw sylwadau a gyflwynwyd iddo o ran y cysylltiad posibl rhwng twbercwlosis buchol mewn moch daear a gwartheg yng Nghymru? (OAQ9120)

**Carwyn Jones:** Derbyniais nifer o sylwadau gan amryw o gyrff ynglŷn â TB mewn gwartheg a moch daear. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd yn ymchwilio i mewn i'r union gysylltiad rhwng moch daear a gwartheg mewn perthynas â TB ac yn archwilio ffyrdd i reoli'r salwch yn well ac yn fyw effeithiol.

**Cynog Dafis:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno nad yw moch daear, fel rhywogaeth, o dan fygythiad, yn hytrach maent yn cynyddu'n gyflym. Mae TB mewn gwartheg yn achosi trallod a chost sylweddol i ffermwyr. Pa ystyriaeth a roddir i estyn y difa y tu hwnt i feysydd treialon Krebs, a chyflwyno iawndal i laesu effaith y cyfyngiadau ar symud y buchesi a effeithir?

**Carwyn Jones:** Cynhaliwyd trafodaeth gyda'r Weinyddiaeth Amaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd a chyrrff sydd yn cynrychioli ffermwyr, er mwyn edrych am ffyrdd ymlaen ynglŷn ag estyn yr iawndal ymhellach na'r sefyllfa

**Q2 Cynog Dafis:** Will Carwyn Jones report on any representations made to him in relation to the possible link between bovine tuberculosis in badgers and cattle in Wales? (OAQ9120)

**Carwyn Jones:** I have received several representations about bovine TB and badgers. The Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food is researching into the precise link between the disease in badgers and cattle and is examining ways to manage the disease better and more effectively.

**Cynog Dafis:** The Minister will agree that badgers, as a species, are not under threat but are multiplying rapidly. Bovine TB causes farmers considerable distress and cost. What consideration is being given to extending the cull beyond the Krebs trial areas and introducing compensation to lessen the impact of restrictions on the movement of affected herds?

**Carwyn Jones:** We have been discussing a way forward with the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food and with organisations representing farmers in terms of extending the compensation further than

bresennol. Ni wŷr neb yn union beth yw'r cysylltiad rhwng moch daear a gwartheg ond mae'n wybyddus bod cysylltiad yn bodoli. Nod treialon Krebs yn Lloegr yw archwilio hyn. Ni chynhelir treialon yng Nghymru am nad yw'r grŵp gwyddonol annibynnol a drefnodd y treialon yn credu bod angen safle yng Nghymru. Cafwyd problemau logistaidd yn ogystal.

Mae'r treialon yn archwilio'r cysylltiad rhwng moch daear a gwartheg gan na wŷr neb union natur y cysylltiad. Am 20 mlynedd, rheolwyd TB mewn gwartheg drwy symud moch daear o gwmpas, ond ymddengys nad yw hynny'n gweithio. Felly, rhaid edrych a oes angen lladd moch daear sydd wedi eu heintio â'r salwch a darganfod a fydd hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth. Dyna nod y treialon a rhaid sicrhau eu bod yn gweithio'n iawn. Mae'n bwysig nad yw pobl yn meddwl eu bod yn gorfod lladd moch daear y tu allan i'r treialon hyn. Byddai hynny'n bwrw amheuaeth dros ganlyniadau'r treialon.

at present. Nobody knows the precise nature of the link between badgers and cattle, but a link has been established. The purpose of the Krebs trials in England is to examine this. No trials are being held in Wales because the independent scientific group that organised these trials did not believe that we needed a site in Wales. There were also logistical problems.

The trials are examining the link between badgers and cattle as we do not know what that precise link is. For 20 years, bovine TB has been controlled by moving badgers around, but it seems that that does not work. We need to consider whether we need to cull badgers infected by this disease, and discover whether that will make a difference. That is the purpose of these trials. We must ensure that these trials work and it is important that people do not think that they must kill badgers outside these trials. That would cast doubt on the results of the trials.

### **Cynllun Amaeth-amgylcheddol Tir Gofal The Tir Gofal Agri-environmental Scheme**

**C3 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff Carwyn Jones roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch cymhwyso cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol Tir Gofal? (OAQ9113)

**Q3 David Lloyd:** Will Carwyn Jones give an update on the application of the Tir Gofal agri-environmental scheme? (OAQ9113)

**Carwyn Jones:** Agorodd trydydd rownd Tir Gofal ar 8 Ionawr 2001, ac yn unol â dyheadau'r Pwyllgor, bydd y rownd ar agor tan ddiwedd mis Mai, er mwyn rhoi cyfle teg i ffermwyr edrych ar ffyrdd o ymuno â'r cynllun. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu adolygiad o Tir Gofal i'w gynnal ym mis Ebrill i edrych ar y ffordd y mae'n gweithio a sicrhau ei fod yn cynnwys y ffermydd priodol, sef rhai canolig. Bydd yn gweld pa mor hawdd yw ymuno â'r cynllun i ffermydd yn y categori hwnnw.

**Carwyn Jones:** The third round of Tir Gofal opened on 8 January, 2001 and, according to the Committee's wishes, will remain open until the end of May, to afford farmers a fair chance to consider joining the scheme. I have commissioned a review of Tir Gofal to be conducted in April, to examine how it works and to ensure that it includes the appropriate farms, namely medium sized farms. It will see how easy it is for farms in that category to join the scheme.

9:35 a.m.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel mab fferm. Mae tystiolaeth gynyddol oddi wrth ffermwyr yn dangos fod y cynllun Tir Gofal yn rhy gaeth ac yn golygu colled ariannol. A yw'r Gweinidog felly o'r farn mai hynny

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a farmer's son. An increasing amount of evidence from farmers demonstrates that the Tir Gofal scheme is too rigid, and leads to financial losses. Does the Minister therefore



sydd yn gyfrifol am y ffaith fod Tir Gofal, ar hyn o bryd, 200 o ffermydd o dan y targed ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd gyntaf?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae Tir Gofal yn gynllun newydd, ac, fel yn achos unrhywbeth newydd yn y Cynulliad, mae'n rhaid edrych ar y ffordd y mae'n gweithio. Fel chi, yr wyf wedi clywed bod tystiolaeth bod llawer o ffermydd bach a mawr yn ymuno â'r cynllun, heb ddigon, efallai, o ffermydd yn y canol, sef ffermydd teuluol. Felly mae'n rhaid ail edrych ar Dir Gofal i weld a oes ffordd o'i wella.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you agree that the key to a successful Tir Gofal scheme is how much money we put into it? How can you justify the massive advert in national newspapers today for a special adviser on Tir Gofal, that is, a special adviser to the Liberal Democrat Cabinet members on rural affairs? It is an advert for two special advisers and almost £100,000 of public money. Is there no limit to the profligacy of this Lib/Lab pact Cabinet? Is there no limit to the puffed-up self-importance of the Liberal Democrats?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a serious question about Tir Gofal, in which many of us have a strong interest, not about the Liberal Democrats.

**Carwyn Jones:** It was a serious question at the beginning but where it went after that, I am not so sure. In the 1980s, a certain political party said that you do not solve problems by throwing money at them. Now I hear the opposite. That, I suspect, is another conversion on the road to Damascus. As regards Tir Gofal and the budget for rural development, this is the best deal that Wales has ever had. The Conservative Party spent next to nothing on rural development in Wales in the 1980s and 1990s. The result of the partnership agreement is that we have a much better settlement for rural Wales than was ever the case under the Conservative Government.

believe that that is responsible for the fact that Tir Gofal is currently 200 farms below the target for the first two years?

**Carwyn Jones:** Tir Gofal is a new scheme, and, as is the case with anything new in the Assembly, we must review its effectiveness. Like you, I have heard that there is evidence that many small and large farms are joining the scheme, but that, possibly, not enough medium-sized farms—family farms—are joining. Therefore, we must look again at Tir Gofal to see whether it can be improved.

**Glyn Davies:** A gytunwch mai'r allwedd i gynllun Tir Gofal llwyddiannus yw faint o arian a roddwn iddo? Sut gallwch gyfiawnhau'r hysbyseb enfawr yn y papurau newydd cenedlaethol heddiw am ymgynghorydd arbennig ar Dir Gofal, hynny yw, ymgynghorydd arbennig i aelodau Cabinet y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar faterion gwledig? Hysbyseb ydyw am ddau ymgynghorydd arbennig a bron i £100,000 o arian cyhoeddus. Onid oes terfyn ar afradlonrwydd y Cabinet Rhyddfrydol/Llafur hwn? Onid oes terfyn ar human-bwysigrwydd rhodresgar y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cwestiwn pwysig am Dir Gofal, y mae gan lawer ohonom ddiddordeb brwd ynddo yw hwn ac nid cwestiwn am y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr oedd yn gwestiwn difrifol ar y dechrau ond nid wyf mor siŵr o'i gyfeiriad wedi hynny. Yn yr 1980au, nododd rhyw blaid wleidyddol nad ydych yn datrys problemau drwy daflu arian atynt. Yn awr clywaf i'r gwrthwyneb. Ymddengys fod hynny'n dröedigaeth arall ar y ffordd i Ddamascus. O ran Tir Gofal a'r gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu gwledig, dyma'r fargen orau a gafodd Cymru erioed. Gwariodd y Blaid Geidwadol y nesaf peth i ddim ar ddatblygu gwledig yng Nghymru yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au. Canlyniad y cytundeb partneriaeth yw bod gennym setliad llawer gwell i Gymru wledig nag a fu'n wir erioed o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol.

**Annog Archfarchnadoedd i Gadw Cynnyrch o Gymru  
Encouraging Supermarkets to Stock Welsh Produce**

**Q4 Rosemary Butler:** Does the Minister have any plans to encourage supermarkets to stock Welsh produce? (OAQ9026)

**Carwyn Jones:** We will always encourage supermarkets to stock as much Welsh produce as possible. The National Assembly, the Welsh Development Agency Food Directorate and the agri-food partnership are working continuously to promote the agri-food strategy, which is our main strategy for ensuring that Welsh food is promoted and marketed across the world. Through the market channels programme—originally called the producer retailer programme—which was established about two years ago, the agri-food partnership is heavily involved in pursuing opportunities with all supermarkets in Wales to promote and encourage the supply of locally produced products. We have had several successes. Not so long ago Tesco, for example, had a policy of not stocking regional produce. That has been overturned, and in the Tesco store in my constituency of Bridgend, the policy of labelling produce as Welsh has proven to be an enormous success. People want to buy Welsh produce. There has been a significant increase also in the number of Welsh lines stocked and in promotional activities for Welsh products in Asda, Sainsbury's, Safeway and Somerfield stores.

**Rosemary Butler:** I agree that people want to buy Welsh produce, because its quality is amazing. I raise the question because I was looking for Christmas presents.

**Nick Bourne:** You are a bit late.

**Rosemary Butler:** It was before Christmas, not today, Nick. I thought it would be good to give Welsh produce to English relations and friends in England. I failed to find such produce. I found French Brie in nice pots but nothing that was truly Welsh and presented

**C4 Rosemary Butler:** A oes gan Carwyn Jones unrhyw gynlluniau i annog archfarchnadoedd i gadw cynnyrch o Gymru? (OAQ9026)

**Carwyn Jones:** Byddwn bob amser yn annog archfarchnadoedd i gadw cymaint o gynnyrch o Gymru â phosibl. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Cyfarwyddiaeth Bwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r bartneriaeth amaeth-fwyd yn gweithio'n barhaus i hyrwyddo'r strategaeth amaeth-fwyd, sef ein prif strategaeth ar gyfer sicrhau y caiff bwyd o Gymru ei hyrwyddo a'i farchnata ledled y byd. Drwy'r rhaglen sianelau marchnad—a elwid y rhaglen manwerthwyr gynhyrchwyr yn wreiddiol—a sefydlwyd tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, mae'r bartneriaeth amaeth-fwyd yn weithgar iawn wrth fynd ar drywydd cyfleoedd gyda phob archfarchnad yng Nghymru i hyrwyddo ac annog cyflenwi cynnyrch a gynhyrchir yn lleol. Bu sawl enghraifft o lwyddiant. Yn gymharol ddiweddar, er enghraifft, yr oedd gan Tesco bolisi o beidio â chadw cynnyrch rhanbarthol. Newidiwyd hynny, ac yn siop Tesco yn fy etholaeth i, sef Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, bu'r polisi o labelu cynnyrch fel cynnyrch o Gymru yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Mae pobl am brynu cynnyrch o Gymru. Bu cynnydd sylweddol hefyd yn nifer y cynnyrch o Gymru a gedwir ac o ran gweithgareddau hyrwyddo ar gyfer cynnyrch o Gymru yn siopau Asda, Sainsbury's, Safeway a Somerfield.

**Rosemary Butler:** Cytunaf fod pobl am brynu cynnyrch o Gymru, gan fod ei ansawdd yn anhygoel. Codaf y cwestiwn oherwydd bwm yn chwilio am anrhegion Nadolig.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydych braidd yn hwyr.

**Rosemary Butler:** Cyn Nadolig, nid heddiw, Nick. Credais y byddai'n syniad da rhoi cynnyrch o Gymru i berthnasau a ffrindiau Saesneg yn Lloegr. Methais â dod o hyd i gynnyrch o'r fath. Gwelais Brie Ffrengig mewn potiau hyfryd ond dim byd a oedd yn

in a suitable way to give as a present. I went to a shop in Monmouth—David Davies will be pleased to know that I went shopping in his constituency—because someone was visiting me with an allergy to cows' milk and I understood that the shop sold Welsh sheep's milk products. I found that they sold sheep's milk, yoghurt and ice cream but that they had been produced in Herefordshire. Why cannot we in Wales produce more Welsh produce for sale in Wales?

**Carwyn Jones:** Good work is being done by the Welsh Development Agency Food Directorate on this. There are three action plans under the agri-food strategy—dairy, organic and red meat—to promote those three important sectors of the Welsh farming economy. We have moved on. A few years ago, little was labelled as Welsh in the supermarkets. If you want to buy presents, hampers are available from organisations such as Cegin Cymru, which is, I think, based in Newcastle Emlyn or in the Welsh food centre in Cardiganshire. It also has a shop in Aberaeron. We need to continue the good work being done in promoting Welsh food in the supermarkets. That is the first step. Once we have done that, we must ensure that our quality levels are maintained and, where we have a flagship product such as lamb or beef, that only Welsh producers are in prime position to produce Welsh lamb or beef. We do not want anybody else to get in on the act.

wirioneddol Gymreig ac wedi'i gyflwyno mewn ffordd addas i'w roi fel anrheg. Bwm mewn siop yn Nhrefynwy—bydd David Davies yn falch o wybod imi siopa yn ei etholaeth—gan fod gennyf ymwelydd ag alergedd i laeth buwch a'm bod ar ddeall fod y siop yn gwerthu cynnyrch laeth dafad Cymreig. Canfwm eu bod yn gwerthu laeth, iogwrt a hufen ia yn defnyddio laeth dafad ond eu bod wedi'u cynhyrchu yn Swydd Henffordd. Pam na allwn ni yng Nghymru gynhyrchu mwy o gynnyrch Cymreig i'w gwerthu yng Nghymru?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae Cyfarwyddiaeth Bwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn gwneud gwaith da ar hyn. Mae tri chynllun gweithredu o dan y strategaeth amaethfwyd—cynnyrch laeth, organig a chig coch—i hyrwyddo'r tri sector pwysig hynny o'r economi ffermio Gymreig. Yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen. Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, nid oedd llawer wedi'i labelu fel cynnyrch Cymreig yn yr archfarchnadoedd. Os ydych am brynu anrhegion, mae hamperi ar gael gan sefydliadau megis Cegin Cymru, sydd, mi gredaf, wedi'i leoli yng Nghastellnewydd Emlyn neu yn y ganolfan bwydydd Cymreig yng Ngheredigion. Mae ganddynt siop hefyd yn Aberaeron. Mae angen inni barhau â'r gwaith da a wneir wrth hyrwyddo bwyd o Gymru yn yr archfarchnadoedd. Dyna'r cam cyntaf. Unwaith y byddwn wedi gwneud hynny, rhaid inni sicrhau y cynhelir ein lefelau ansawdd a, lle bo gennym gynnyrch blaenllaw fel cig oen neu gig eidion, mai dim ond cynhyrchwyr o Gymru sydd mewn sefyllfa dda i gynhyrchu cig oen neu gig eidion Cymreig. Nid ydym am i unrhyw un arall achub ar y cyfle.

### **Prinder o Bobl Ifanc yn Mynd i Mewn i'r Diwydiant Amaethyddiaeth Shortage of Young People Entering the Agriculture Industry**

**C5 Geraint Davies:** Pa gamau penodol y mae Carwyn Jones yn bwriadu eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r prinder mewn pobl ifanc sydd yn mynd i mewn i'r diwydiant amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ9112)

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ystyried sawl syniad i helpu pobl ifanc sydd am ddod i mewn i ffermio yng Nghymru. Cyflwynaf

**Q5 Geraint Davies:** What specific action does Carwyn Jones intend to take to tackle the shortage of young people entering the agriculture industry in Wales? (OAQ9112)

**Carwyn Jones:** I am considering several ideas to help young people who wish to enter agriculture in Wales. I will present a paper

bapur yn ddiweddarach eleni i'r Pwyllgor yn rhoi'r syniadau hynny gerbron.

**Geraint Davies:** A fwriadwch gael trafodaethau â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynglŷn â phleidlais Senedd Ewrop yr wythnos diwethaf i wneud y cynllun mynediad yn orfodol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Mae'n rhyfedd bod Plaid Cymru—gwneuthum y pwynt hwn ddydd Mawrth—am weld y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn gorfodi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i wneud rhywbeth, er bod y Cynulliad wedi cymryd safbwynt arall. Y mae hynny cyn waethed â gofyn i Senedd Prydain Fawr i weithredu'n erbyn dymuniadau'r Cynulliad.

Mae'r Cynulliad wedi mynegi barn. Mae'n rhyfedd bod pobl yn y Cynulliad wedi gofyn i Eurig Wyn sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn gorfod gwneud rhywbeth.

Cyfarfŷm â ffermwyr ifanc ym mis Tachwedd. Yr oedd yn gyfarfod da ac yr wyf yn aros i'r ffermwyr ifanc gyflwyno eu syniadau. Byddaf yn siarad â hwy ac yna'n paratoi papur i'r Pwyllgor yn cyflwyno'r syniadau er mwyn dod o hyd i ffordd ymlaen i helpu ffermwyr ifanc.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that young farmers need to have access to continual training schemes and educational projects to improve their skills? What steps are you taking to ensure that that continues to happen in mid-Wales and that the contribution of young farmers' clubs to that training is not jeopardised by the introduction of police check fees for voluntary organisations?

**Carwyn Jones:** Organisations have been talking about fees to my colleague Jane Hutt. You raised an important point about training and enterprise among young farmers. It is not enough to give young farmers money and say 'go away with that, you are on your own'. That is dangerous. We can consider ways of providing training and we are doing so through Farming Connect, for example, where there is potential for an uplift of grant aid for those under the age of 40. Farming Connect will provide an excellent framework

outlining those ideas to the Committee later this year.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you plan to have discussions with the European Commission regarding the European Parliament's vote last week to make the entrants' scheme compulsory?

**Carwyn Jones:** It is strange that Plaid Cymru—I made this point on Tuesday—want the European Commission to force the National Assembly to do something although the Assembly has taken a different stand. That is as bad as asking the British Parliament to act against the Assembly's wishes.

The Assembly has expressed an opinion. It is strange that people in the Assembly have asked Eurig Wyn to ensure that the Assembly is forced to do something.

I met young farmers in November. It was a good meeting and I am waiting for the young farmers to come back to me with their ideas. I will talk to them and then prepare a paper for the Committee presenting those ideas, to find a way forward to help young farmers.

**Kirsty Williams:** A gytunwch fod angen sicrhau mynediad i ffermwyr ifanc i gynlluniau hyfforddi parhaus a phrosiectau addysgol i wella eu sgiliau? Pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau bod hynny'n parhau i ddigwydd yng nghanolbarth Cymru ac na chaiff cyfraniad clybiau ffermwyr ifanc ei fygwth yn sgîl cyflwyno ffioedd gwiriadau'r heddlu i sefydliadau gwirfoddol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Bu sefydliadau yn trafod ffioedd gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Jane Hutt. Codasoch bwynt pwysig am hyfforddiant a menter ymhlith ffermwyr ifanc. Nid yw'n ddigon rhoi arian i ffermwyr ifanc a dweud 'ewch â'r arian, yr ydych ar eich pen eich hun'. Mae hynny'n beryglus. Gallwn ystyried ffyrdd o ddarparu hyfforddiant ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny drwy Cyswllt Ffermio, er enghraifft, lle ceir potensial i gynyddu cymorth grant i'r rheini o dan 40 oed. Bydd Cyswllt Ffermio yn darparu fframwaith

for training within farming communities and offer business advice in the easiest way possible. When Farming Connect is up and running—and we intend to start the first phase in May, with farm business reviews—one of the major beneficiaries of Farming Connect will be young farmers.

ardderchog ar gyfer hyfforddiant o fewn cymunedau ffermio ac yn cynnig cyngor busnes yn y ffordd fwyaf cyfleus. Pan fydd Cyswllt Ffermio ar ei draed—a bwriadwn ddechrau'r cam cyntaf ym mis Mai, gydag arolygon busnes fferm—ffermwyr ifanc fydd un o brif fuddiolwyr Cyswllt Ffermio.

9:45 a.m.

### **Twbercwlosis mewn Moch Daear a Gwartheg Tuberculosis in Badgers and Cattle**

**Q6 William Graham:** Can Carwyn Jones make a statement on the progress of the scientific trials being undertaken to establish that cattle catch tuberculosis from badgers? (OAQ9103)

**C6 William Graham:** A wnaiff Carwyn Jones ddatganiad ynghylch hynt y treialon gwyddonol sydd yn cael eu cynnal i brofi bod gwartheg yn dal twbercwlosis oddi wrth foch daear? (OAQ9103)

**Carwyn Jones:** I begin with your premise that the trials are being undertaken to establish that cattle catch TB from badgers. That is not their purpose. Their purpose is to determine the precise relationship between cattle and badgers with regard to TB. When the results are known, they will be widely published. The trial programme remains on course and the results should be available by 2004, at the latest.

**Carwyn Jones:** Dechreuaf â'ch tybiaeth fod y treialon yn cael eu cynnal i brofi bod gwartheg yn dal TB oddi wrth foch daear. Nid dyna yw eu diben. Eu diben yw sefydlu'r union berthynas rhwng gwartheg a moch daear o ran TB. Pan fydd y canlyniadau'n hysbys, cânt eu cyhoeddi'n eang. Mae rhaglen y treialon yn mynd rhagddi yn ôl y disgwyl a dylai'r canlyniadau fod ar gael erbyn 2004, fan pellaf.

**William Graham:** You will know that Gwent is now a recognised area for increased incidence of bovine TB and you must be aware of the grief caused to farmers when TB strikes their herds. A lifetime's work may be destroyed. Can you provide hope for farmers in Gwent and throughout Wales by announcing an effective badger population control strategy?

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch fod Gwent bellach yn ardal a gydnabyddir am achosion cynyddol o TB buchol ac mae'n rhaid eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r poen meddwl a ddioddefa ffermwyr pan fydd TB yn effeithio ar eu gyrroedd. Gall gwaith oes gael ei ddinistrio. A allwch gynnig gobaith i ffermwyr yng Ngwent a ledled Cymru drwy gyhoeddi strategaeth effeithiol i reoli poblogaethau moch daear?

**Carwyn Jones:** We must first establish what the link is, as I mentioned in my answer to Cynog Dafis's question. For 20 years, control was gained by moving badgers away from cattle sites. It now appears that that does not work. We need to consider why that is the case. The culling of badgers may or may not make a difference. The trials are supposed to come to a conclusion about that.

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni sefydlu'r cyswllt, fel y crybwyllais yn fy ateb i gwestiwn Cynog Dafis. Am 20 mlynedd, sicrhawyd rheolaeth drwy symud moch daear o safleoedd gwartheg. Ymddengys erbyn hyn nad yw hynny'n gweithio. Mae angen inni ystyried y rhesymau dros hyn. Efallai y byddai lladd moch daear yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bwriedir i'r treialon ddod i gasgliad am hynny.

For many years we have known that there is a link between badgers and cattle with regard to TB but we do not know the precise nature of that link. That is why it is important to get the results of the trials. Once we have the results, we will be able to understand what we need to do to control TB. However, in the long term, we must find a vaccine. It is impossible to tell how long that will take, as is true for any kind of scientific or pharmacological research, but that is taking place. UK scientists are co-operating across international boundaries and building on the work that has already been done on developing TB vaccines. However, it may well take several years.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call Alun Pugh to ask question 7.

**Alun Pugh:** I will take guidance from you on this, Llywydd. I have just received an e-mail, which states that this question has been transferred for written answer by the Minister for Health and Social Services.

**The Presiding Officer:** If you do not wish to ask the question now, that is a matter for you.

Yr ydym wedi gwybod ers blynyddoedd fod cyswllt rhwng moch daear a gwartheg o ran TB ond ni wyddom beth yw union natur y cyswllt hwnnw. Dyna pam fod canlyniadau'r treialon yn bwysig. Unwaith y cawn y canlyniadau, gallwn ddeall yr hyn sydd angen inni ei wneud i reoli TB. Fodd bynnag, yn y tymor hir, rhaid inni ganfod brechiad. Mae'n amhosibl gwybod faint o amser y bydd ei angen i wneud hynny, fel sydd yn wir am unrhyw fath o ymchwil wyddonol neu fferyllol, ond mae'n mynd rhagddo. Mae gwyddonwyr y DU yn cydweithredu ar draws ffiniau rhyngwladol ac yn datblygu'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd eisoes ar ddatblygu brechiadau TB. Fodd bynnag, gallai gymryd sawl blwyddyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar Alun Pugh i ofyn cwestiwn 7.

**Alun Pugh:** Gofynnaf am arweiniad gennych chi ar hyn, Lywydd. Yr wyf newydd dderbyn e-bost, sydd yn nodi bod y cwestiwn hwn wedi'i drosglwyddo i gael ei ateb yn ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

**Y Llywydd:** Os nad ydych am ofyn y cwestiwn yn awr, mater i chi yw hynny.

### **Goblygiadau LEADER+ i Gymunedau Gwledig The Implications of LEADER+ on Rural Communities**

**Q8 Richard Edwards:** Can Carwyn Jones make a statement on the implications of LEADER+ on rural communities? (OAQ9027)

**Carwyn Jones:** I know how important LEADER+ is to Preseli Pembrokeshire and Carmarthen West and South Pembrokeshire, the areas that you and Christine Gwyther represent. That programme will bring 14.7 million euros into rural Wales between 2000 and 2006. To that, the Assembly has allocated match funding of £1 million per year for the next three years. That is a significant pot of money to fund innovative projects that will test new approaches to rural development. As you know, the purpose of LEADER+ is to pilot new ideas and enable them to be developed through mainstream

**C8 Richard Edwards:** A wnaiff Carwyn Jones ddatganiad ynghylch goblygiadau LEADER+ i gymunedau gwledig? (OAQ9027)

**Carwyn Jones:** Gwn pa mor bwysig y mae LEADER+ i Breseli Sir Benfro a Gorllewin Caerfyrddin a De Sir Benfro, yr ardaloedd yr ydych chi a Christine Gwyther yn eu cynrychioli. Daw'r rhaglen hon â 14.7 miliwn o ewros i Gymru wledig rhwng 2000 a 2006. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, mae'r Cynulliad wedi dyrannu arian cyfatebol o £1 miliwn y flwyddyn am y tair blynedd nesaf. Mae hynny'n gronfa sylweddol o arian i ariannu prosiectau arloesol a fydd yn profi ymagweddau newydd tuag at ddatblygu gwledig. Fel y gwyddoch, diben LEADER+ yw profi syniadau newydd drwy gyfrwng

sources of money and then rolled out to other areas if they are successful.

**Richard Edwards:** Do you agree that community involvement is essential in the distribution of European moneys and that communities must be equal partners with local authorities, and not excluded or dictated to? Are you aware that there is a local authority, which shall remain nameless, whose cloak and dagger culture is such that Stalin would have been embarrassed by it?

**Carwyn Jones:** I will not comment on which local authority that might be, but I am aware that you and Christine and have made representations on ensuring that grassroots and community organisations are involved in the LEADER+ programme. I am aware that there are organisations in your constituencies that have much experience in involving the community, drawing investment into the community and developing community projects. As a general principle, it is worthwhile to draw upon as much expertise as possible outside the government sector.

cynlluniau peilot, gan alluogi iddynt gael eu datblygu drwy ffynonellau arian y brif ffrwd ac yna'u cyflwyno i ardaloedd eraill os byddant yn llwyddiannus.

**Richard Edwards:** A gytunwch fod cyfranogiad cymunedol yn hanfodol wrth ddsbarthu arian o Ewrop a bod yn rhaid i gymunedau fod yn bartneriaid cyfwerth gydag awdurdodau lleol, a pheidio â chael eu heithrio neu eu gorchymyn? A ydych yn ymwybodol bod awdurdod lleol, a gaiff aros yn ddienw, sydd â diwylliant mor gynllwyngar y byddai Stalin wedi troi ei gefn arno?

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chyflwynaf sylw ar ba awdurdod lleol y gallai hynny fod, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol eich bod chi a Christine wedi cyflwyno sylwadau ar sicrhau y cynhwysir sefydliadau cymunedol ac ar lawr gwlad o fewn rhaglen LEADER+. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod sefydliadau yn eich etholaethau sydd yn brofiadol iawn wrth gynnwys y gymuned, denu buddsoddiad i'r gymuned a datblygu prosiectau cymunedol. Fel egwyddor gyffredinol, mae'n werth manteisio ar gymaint o arbenigedd â phosibl y tu allan i'r sector llywodraethu.

### **Datganiad ar Isafswm Safonau Cenedlaethol Cartrefi'r Henoed Statement on National Minimum Standards for Care Homes for Older People**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** When we debated the Care Standards Act 2000 in October, there was much discussion of the national minimum standards that will operate in care homes for older people. It was clear that announcements in England have caused confusion and concern in Wales. I promised the Assembly that we would:

‘work with the care industry to determine sensible arrangements through consultation.’

I intend to bring forward a set of standards as soon as possible. However, the key interests in Wales have reached a substantial measure of agreement on the headline standards that will apply to care homes for older people. I believe that it is right to announce these today to end the uncertainty that the care

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Pan gawsom ddadl ar Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 ym mis Hydref, bu cryn drafodaeth ar yr isafswm safonau cenedlaethol a weithredir mewn cartrefi gofal i'r henoed. Yr oedd yn amlwg i'r cyhoeddiadau yn Lloegr beri cryn ddryswch a phryder yng Nghymru. Addewais i'r Cynulliad y byddem yn:

‘[g]weithio gyda'r diwydiant gofal i benderfynu ar drefniadau synhwyrol drwy ymgynghori.’

Bwriadaf gyflwyno cyfres o safonau mor fuan â phosibl. Fodd bynnag, mae'r buddianwyr yng Nghymru wedi llwyddo i gael cryn dipyn o gytundeb ar y prif safonau a fydd yn berthnasol i gartrefi gofal i'r henoed. Credaf ei bod yn briodol imi gyhoeddi'r rhain heddiw er mwyn dod â'r

sector in Wales has experienced recently.

Following widespread consultation last year, a standards group has been working with representatives from all the key organisations, Age Concern Cymru, the Association of Directors of Social Services in Wales, Care Forum Wales, the Wales region of the Registered Nursing Homes Association and regulators from health and social services. The group has recommended seven key standards and these have been accepted. First, from 1 April 2002, the minimum space standard for single rooms in existing care homes will be 100 sq ft or 9.3 square metres. Second, from 1 April 2002, the minimum space standard for single rooms in new care homes, and extensions to existing homes, will be 12 sq m. Third, from 1 April 2002, the minimum space standard for single rooms in new care homes, and extensions to existing homes, for severely disabled residents who permanently use a wheelchair will be 13.5 square metres, and the minimum door width standard will be 800mm. This will not apply to residents who use wheelchairs occasionally or for transfer around the home. Fourth, from 1 April 2002, the minimum space standard for single rooms in existing homes, for severely disabled residents who permanently use a wheelchair will be 12 sq m. That will not apply to residents who use wheelchairs occasionally or for transfer around the home. Fifth, from 1 April 2002, no-one who is assessed as likely to require an assisted transfer around the home in a wheelchair should be admitted to any room unless a safe and effective transfer is possible, which meets their care needs. Sixth, except as noted in the third recommendation, the standard for minimum door width, will be 760mm. Seventh, single rooms in existing care homes should make up at least 70 per cent of resident places by 1 April 2005, at least 80 per cent by 2007, and at least 85 per cent of resident places by 2010.

ansicrwydd diweddar ymhlith y sector gofal yng Nghymru i ben.

Yn dilyn ymgynghori eang y llynedd, bu grŵp safonau yn gweithio gyda chynrychiolwyr o bob un o'r sefydliadau allweddol, Gofal yr Henoed Cymru, Cymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, Fforwm Gofal Cymru, Cymdeithas Cartrefi Nyrsio Cofrestredig yng Nghymru a rheoleiddwyr o faes iechyd a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Argymhellodd y grŵp saith safon allweddol a derbyniwyd y rhain. Yn gyntaf, o 1 Ebrill 2002, yr isafswm gofod ar gyfer ystafelloedd sengl mewn cartrefi gofal sydd yn bodoli eisoes fydd 100 troedfedd sgwâr neu 9.3 metr sgwâr. Yn ail, o 1 Ebrill 2002, yr isafswm gofod mewn ystafelloedd sengl mewn cartrefi gofal newydd, ac mewn estyniadau i gartrefi sydd yn bodoli eisoes, fydd 12 metr sgwâr. Yn drydydd, o 1 Ebrill 2002, yr isafswm gofod ar gyfer ystafelloedd sengl mewn cartrefi gofal newydd, ac mewn estyniadau i gartrefi sydd yn bodoli eisoes, ar gyfer preswylwyr ag anabledd difrifol sydd yn defnyddio cadair olwynion yn barhaus fydd 13.5 metr sgwâr, a'r isafswm lled drws fydd 800mm. Ni fydd hyn yn berthnasol i breswylwyr sydd yn defnyddio cadeiriau olwyn yn achlysurol neu i symud o gwmpas y cartref. Yn bedwerydd, o 1 Ebrill 2002, yr isafswm gofod ar gyfer ystafelloedd sengl mewn cartrefi sydd yn bodoli eisoes, ar gyfer preswylwyr ag anabledd difrifol sydd yn defnyddio cadeiriau olwynion fydd 12 metr sgwâr. Ni fydd hynny'n berthnasol i breswylwyr sydd yn defnyddio cadeiriau olwynion yn achlysurol neu i symud o gwmpas y cartref. Yn bumed, o 1 Ebrill 2002, ni ddylai unrhyw un yr aseswyd ei bod yn debygol y bydd angen cymorth i symud o gwmpas y cartref mewn cadair olwynion arnynt gael eu derbyn i unrhyw ystafell oni fydd modd ei symud yno mewn modd diogel ac effeithiol, sydd yn bodloni eu hanghenion gofal. Yn chweched, ac eithrio fel y nodwyd yn y trydydd argymhelliad, yr isafswm lled drws fydd 760mm. Yn seithfed, dylai ystafelloedd sengl mewn cartrefi gofal sydd yn bodoli eisoes gyfrif am o leiaf 70 y cant o'r lleoedd preswyl erbyn 1 Ebrill 2005, o leiaf 80 y cant erbyn 2007, ac o leiaf 85 y cant o'r lleoedd



preswyl erbyn 2010.

I have accepted two further recommendations from the standards group. First, that these proposed national minimum standards be piloted across Wales in the spring and early summer of 2001. Second, that the national minimum standards that the Assembly adopts should be reviewed within five years of the creation of the care standards inspectorate for Wales, that is, by April 2007.

I said in the debate in October, I will look closely at the possible impact of these new standards especially on smaller homes and on choice for residents in rural areas where there may be fewer alternatives.

I congratulate all of the organisations involved for the qualities they have shown in reaching the substantial measure of agreement on these recommendations. Much more needs to be done. However, we have made a good start in finding a set of standards that strike the right balance between promoting quality of care for service users and giving providers a realistic opportunity to make improvements. I commend these standards to the Assembly.

9:55 a.m.

**David Lloyd:** Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan buddiant fel meddyg teulu a chynghorydd sir, a chan ddiolch i Jane am ei datganiad. Croesawn unrhyw beth a fydd yn gwella safon gofal i'r henoed. Croesawn hefyd y cydweithio a arweiniodd at yr argymhellion hyn.

A gytunwch, Jane—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch, gan y cawsoch yr un math o lythyrau ag a gefais i—fod angen dehongli'r rheolau gyda sensitifrwydd o ran maint ystafelloedd? Mae hynny'n glir yn y datganiad hwn, yn arbennig o ran cartrefi bach sydd yn darparu safonau gofal arbennig o dda, ond sydd wedi teimlo, hyd yma, dan fygythiad gan reolau newydd fel hyn. Yr wyf hefyd yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno y bu pryderon am gostau ychwanegol deddfwriaeth fel hon, er mor glodwiw yw hi.

Derbyniais ddau argymhelliad pellach gan y grŵp safonau. Yn gyntaf, dylid cynnal cynllun peilot ar yr isafswm safonau cenedlaethol ar draws Cymru yn y gwanwyn a dechrau haf 2001. Yn ail, dylid adolygu'r isafswm safonau cenedlaethol a fabwysiedir gan y Cynulliad o fewn pum mlynedd i sefydlu arolygiaeth safonau gofal Cymru, hynny yw, erbyn Ebrill 2007.

Dywedais yn y ddadl ym mis Hydref y byddaf yn ystyried yn fanwl effaith bosibl y safonau newydd hyn yn arbennig ar gartrefi llai ac ar ddewis preswylwyr mewn ardaloedd gwledig lle y gallai fod llai o ddewis.

Llongyfarchaf bob un o'r sefydliadau a gymerodd ran am y rhinweddau a amlygwyd ganddynt wrth gael cryn gytundeb ar yr argymhellion hyn. Mae angen gwneud llawer mwy. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi dechrau'n dda wrth lunio cyfres o safonau a rydd y cydbwysedd priodol rhwng hyrwyddo safon gofal ar gyfer defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth a rhoi cyfle da i'r darparwyr wneud gwelliannau. Argymhellaf y safonau hyn i'r Cynulliad.

**David Lloyd:** I start by declaring an interest as a general practitioner and a county councillor, and by thanking Jane for her statement. We welcome anything that will improve care standards for the elderly. We also welcome the co-operation that led to these recommendations.

Do you agree, Jane—and I am sure that you will, as you have received the same sorts of letters that I have—that the rules as regards the size of rooms need to be interpreted with sensitivity? That is clear in this statement, especially in the case of small homes, which provide extremely good standards of care but have felt, until now, under threat from new rules such as these. I am also sure that you will agree that there have been concerns about the additional costs of legislation such as this, however praiseworthy it may be.

Mae angen adlewyrchu'r costau ychwanegol hyn yn y ffioedd a delir i'r cartrefi.

These additional costs need to be reflected in the fees paid to homes.

Mae safon y gofal yn bwysig, ond hefyd mae eisiau sicrhau bod anghenion yr anabl ar flaen y gad, yn enwedig ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn ymweld â phobl yn y cartrefi hyn. Fel y dywedasoch, dechrau yw hwn, a dylwn allu dod o hyd i ffordd o ddiogelu cartrefi bach, gwledig. Mae rhagor o waith i'w wneud, ond yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch ar y dechrau hwn, a fydd, gobeithio, yn darparu gofal o'r radd flaenaf i'n henoed.

Care standards are important, but there is also a need to ensure that the requirements of the disabled are to the fore, especially for those who visit people in these homes. As you said, this is a first step, and we should be able to find a way of safeguarding small, rural homes. There is more work to be done, but I congratulate you on this first step, which will, hopefully, provide care of the highest quality for our elderly people.

**Jane Hutt:** These measures developed from the debate we had in October when Members from all parties expressed concerns to me, particularly about care providers in rural areas and with smaller homes. Members also recognised that we need to ensure the best standards for our most vulnerable older people. On the same day, I met representatives from Care Forum Wales and other bodies and trade associations representing the providers. This demonstrates that we in Wales can move forward in consensus, as a result of debate and discussion. We also heard from Age Concern Cymru and those who represent the needs of elderly people. I hope that the piloting, and the fact that I undertake to monitor the impact of the standards carefully, will reassure all concerned.

**Jane Hutt:** Datblygodd y mesurau hyn o'r ddadl a gawsom ym mis Hydref pan fynegodd Aelodau o bob plaid bryder, yn enwedig ynghylch darparwyr gofal mewn ardaloedd gwledig a chartrefi llai. Cydnabu'r Aelodau hefyd fod angen inni sicrhau'r safonau gorau i'n henoed mwyaf diamddiffyn. Ar yr un diwrnod, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr o Fforwm Gofal Cymru a chyrrff a chymdeithasau masnach eraill a gynrychiola'r darparwyr. Dengys hyn y gallwn ni yng Nghymru symud ymlaen yn gytûn, o ganlyniad i'r ddadl a'r drafodaeth a gafwyd. Clywsom hefyd gan Gofal i'r Henoed Cymru a'r rhai a gynrychiola anghenion yr henoed. Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynlluniau peilot, a'r ffaith imi addo monitro effaith y safonau yn fanwl, yn rhoi tawelwch meddwl i bawb dan sylw.

This is a modest statement today. These are probably the most contentious issues that concerned people in October's debate; we have much more work to do, clearly, in setting up the care standards inspectorate, and ensuring that we are working in partnership with providers.

Mae hwn yn ddatganiad cymedrol heddiw. Dyma'r materion mwyaf dadleugar o bosibl yr oedd pobl yn pryderu yn eu cylch yn y ddadl ym mis Hydref; mae llawer mwy o waith gennym i'w wneud, wrth reswm, o ran sefydlu'r arolygiaeth safonau gofal, a sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r darparwyr.

**David Melding:** I confirm that the Welsh Conservative Party is part of the consensus to improve standards in care delivery, but we must stress the need for flexibility. I am pleased to see at least a partial response from the Minister on this. It is particularly important that existing, often small, neighbourhood care homes have a chance to implement the new requirements within a reasonable timescale. If we do not ensure

**David Melding:** Cadarnhaf fod Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn rhannu'r consensws ar wella safonau darparu gofal, ond rhaid inni bwysleisio bod angen bod yn hyblyg. Mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod y Gweinidog o leiaf wedi rhoi ateb rhannol ar hyn. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig y caiff y cartrefi bach cymdogol presennol, sydd yn aml yn fach o ran maint, gyfle i weithredu'r gofynion newydd o fewn amserlen resymol. Oni

that, we could lose valuable capacity in that sector, which would have a dramatic effect on the quality of the choice of available care. It is right to make a distinction between existing and 'new-build' homes, which would also include extensions to existing buildings. We can be much more ambitious with new-build and implement targets more speedily. It is quite proper that we do that.

I also welcome your response on room size and the number of rooms, but I wonder whether the Minister agrees that there could be a stronger emphasis on individual choice. In the future it is likely that people will demand higher standards, anyway; however some, for instance, may continue to welcome the companionship that is afforded by double rooms. This is often expressed to me when I visit care homes.

I raise a point about the provision of shaft lifts that is not mentioned in this statement. You have not referred to any of the representations that you received on this issue. Do you acknowledge that the requirement for shaft lifts could have a devastating consequence on smaller care homes that are not amenable to such major structural change? Cannot the principle of individual choice be allowed to determine whether people enter homes that do not have such lifts?

Finally, I am sorry to raise a slightly sour point, but is it not unfortunate that this important matter relating to secondary legislation and regulations will now be determined through your statement? Do you not think that the Assembly should have a more influential role in formulating and agreeing these standards rather than just listening to what you have decided in response to an earlier Plenary debate?

**Jane Hutt:** I have presented a statement on what has happened as a result of discussion involving all the key interests. A standards sub-group was set up to consider these contentious issues that were causing great concern to care providers as well as to those who represent the elderly and anticipate their

sicrhawn hynny, gallem gollu lleoedd gwerthfawr yn y sector hwnnw, a gâi effaith ddybryd ar ansawdd y dewis o ofal sydd ar gael. Mae'n briodol gwahaniaethu rhwng cartrefi sydd yn bodoli eisoes a rhai newydd, a fyddai hefyd yn cynnwys estyniadau i adeiladau sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Gallwn fod yn llawer mwy uchelgeisiol o ran adeiladau newydd a gweithredu targedau'n gyflymach. Mae'n hollol briodol inni wneud hynny.

Croesawaf hefyd eich ymateb ar faint a nifer yr ystafelloedd, ond tybiaf a gytuna'r Gweinidog y gellid rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar ddewis yr unigolyn. Yn y dyfodol, mae'n debygol y bydd pobl yn mynnu cael safonau uwch, beth bynnag; serch hynny bydd rhai, er enghraifft, yn parhau o bosibl i groesawu'r gwmnïaeth a roddir gan ystafelloedd dwbl. Mae llawer yn dweud hyn wrthyf pan ymwelaf â chartrefi gofal.

Codaf bwynt am ddarpariaeth lifftiau siafft na chyfeiriwyd ati yn y datganiad hwn. Ni chyfeiriasoch at unrhyw un o'r sylwadau a gawsoch ar y mater hwn. A gydnabyddwch y gallai'r gofyniad am lifftiau siafft gael effaith ddybryd ar y cartrefi gofal llai na fyddai'n hawdd gwneud y math hwn o newidiadau strwythurol mawr iddynt? Onid oes modd caniatáu i'r egwyddor o ddewis yr unigolyn benderfynu a fydd pobl yn mynd i fyw mewn cartrefi heb lifftiau o'r fath?

I gloi, mae'n ddrwg gennyf godi pwynt sur braidd, ond onid yw'n anffodus y caiff y mater pwysig hwn sydd yn ymwneud â deddfwriaeth eilaidd a rheoliadau ei bennu yn awr drwy eich datganiad chi? Oni chredwch y dylai'r Cynulliad fod wedi cael rhan fwy dylanwadol wrth lunio a chytuno'r safonau hyn yn hytrach na gwrando ar yr hyn a benderfynasoch mewn ymateb i ddadl gynharach mewn Cyfarfod Llawn?

**Jane Hutt:** Cyflwynais ddatganiad ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o ganlyniad i drafodaethau â phob buddiannwr allweddol. Sefydlwyd is-grŵp safonau i ystyried y materion dadleugar a barodd gryn bryder i ddarparwyr gofal yn ogystal â'r rhai sydd yn cynrychioli'r henoed ac yn rhagweld eu hanghenion. Amlinellodd

needs. My statement outlined the group's decisions and consensus on important issues, on which Wales will lead the way. In England, there is a huge dispute on these issues. We have moved forward, and I congratulate the Assembly officials and professionals involved. My statement was intended to inform you, as a Government Minister should, of the outcome of those discussions. This is only the beginning. I did not have to bother to inform you of the good progress that we, and these associations have achieved. However, it is important that I share this good news with you. We will, of course, have to move on all the other issues that come forward relating to lifts and so on.

The standards sub-group will consider many other issues and their discussions will be presented to the Assembly for approval in relation to secondary legislation. It is not a question of me avoiding or bouncing the matter, but of presenting the Assembly with good news about progress in an area that is important to the elderly. People want choice; elderly couples who enter homes will share a room, but others will also want the companionship of sharing rooms. Many in this Chamber will know from personal experience, that the elderly, when they come out of hospital or enter into a stage of fragility and confusion, need the best possible care. Often, they need privacy and other things that we take for granted. Unfortunately, for many years, we have not provided the choice and standards that we will be providing in partnership with the independent sector providers in the future. That sour note was unnecessary because this is important, positive news for the elderly and care sector providers in Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call David Melding to respond.

**David Melding:** I am grateful for your indulgence, Presiding Officer, in allowing me to come back on that point.

**Val Feld** *rose*—

fy natganiad benderfyniadau a chonsensws y grŵp ar faterion pwysig lle y bydd Cymru yn arwain y gad. Yn Lloegr, ceir cryn ddadl ynglŷn â'r materion hyn. Yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen, a llongyfarchaf swyddogion y Cynulliad a'r bobl broffesiynol berthnasol. Bwriad fy natganiad oedd eich hysbysu, fel y dylai Gweinidog y Llywodraeth ei wneud, o ganlyniad y trafodaethau hynny. Dim ond megis dechrau yr ydym. Nid oedd yn rhaid imi eich hysbysu o'r cynnydd da a wnaethpwyd gennym ni a'r cymdeithasau hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig fy mod yn rhannu'r newyddion da hyn gyda chi. Bydd yn rhaid inni, wrth reswm, symud ymlaen ar bob un o'r materion eraill a gyfyd o ran lifftiau ac ati.

Bydd yr is-grŵp safonau yn ystyried llawer o faterion eraill a chaiff eu trafodaethau eu cyflwyno i'r Cynulliad i'w cymeradwyo mewn perthynas â'r ddeddfwriaeth eilaidd. Nid wyf yn osgoi neu'n gorfodi'r mater. Yr wyf yn rhoi newyddion da i'r Cynulliad ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd mewn maes sydd yn bwysig i'r henoed. Mae pobl am gael dewis; bydd cyplau mewn oed sydd yn mynd i fyw mewn cartref yn rhannu ystafell, ond bydd eraill hefyd am rannu ystafell er mwyn cael cwmni. Gwŷr llawer yn y Siambr hon o'u profiad eu hunain fod angen y gofal gorau posibl ar yr henoed, ar ôl eu rhyddhau o ysbyty neu pan fônt yn dechrau drysu neu'n mynd yn eiddil. Yn aml mae angen preifatrwydd arnynt ynghyd â phethau eraill yr ydym yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol. Yn anffodus, ers blynyddoedd maith, nid ydym wedi rhoi'r dewis a'r safonau y byddwn yn eu darparu mewn partneriaeth â darparwyr y sector annibynnol yn y dyfodol. Nid oedd angen y nodyn sur hwnnw am fod hyn yn newyddion pwysig cadarnhaol i'r henoed ac i ddarparwyr y sector gofal yng Nghymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar David Melding i ymateb.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi, Lywydd, am fod mor garedig â rhoi cyfle imi ymateb i'r pwynt hwnnw.

**Val Feld** *a gododd*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I chose to call David Melding at this point because we have time for this statement this morning. It is a matter for me, and I will not take complaints from any quarter of this Assembly about whom I choose to call. If you wish to see me afterwards, my door is always open.

**David Melding:** I am grateful, Presiding Officer. This is an important issue for the development of the Assembly's work and, in future, when we scrutinise secondary legislation and regulations, people will ask for our views on this. What has happened here, Minister, is that we have effectively had—if I can use Parliamentary language—a 'second reading debate'. There is no 'committee stage' or 'report stage', we just heard a statement from you, which is equivalent to a 'third reading', outlining the regulations and asking us to approve or reject them. We want more active participation in this legislative process. I thought that that was the purpose of devolution and this Assembly.

**Jane Hutt:** I have no problem in dealing with David's second point. He seems to be becoming one of those people who spend their time discussing legislation rather than the policy issues that have meaning for people in Wales.

David, you are trying to make an issue out of nothing as far as the people of Wales are concerned. They want to know that, as a result of Assembly Members' input, constructive discussion and consultation has taken place, which has resulted in positive developments for the elderly people of Wales and for independent and public-sector providers of residential nursing home care. That is what people want to know and that is why I brought you this good news today.

This is a statement. You may question me on it and I will take the points that you raise back to the standards group that is considering these issues. It is no more than that. I think that Members welcome the Government coming forward and giving them such information. The people of

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dewisais alw ar David Melding ar hyn o bryd am fod gennym amser i'r datganiad hwn y bore yma. Mae'n fater i mi, ac ni dderbyniaf gwynion gan unrhyw ran o'r Cynulliad hwn ynghylch pwy yr wyf yn dewis galw arno. Os hoffech fy ngweld wedyn, mae fy nrws bob amser ar agor.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, Lywydd. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig o ran datblygiad gwaith y Cynulliad ac, yn y dyfodol, a phan fyddwn yn archwilio deddfwriaeth eilaidd a rheoliadau yn graff, bydd pobl yn gofyn am ein barn ar hyn. Yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yma, Weinidog, yw inni gael, i bob diben—os caf ddefnyddio ieithwedd San Steffan—'dadl ail ddarlleniad'. Nid oes unrhyw 'gam pwyllgor' na 'cham adroddiad', dim ond clywed datganiad gennych, yr ydym, sydd yn cyfateb i 'drydydd darlleniad', gan amlinellu'r rheoliadau ac yn gofyn inni eu cymeradwyo neu eu gwrthod. Yr ydym am chwarae rhan fwy gweithredol yn y broses ddeddfwriaethol hon. Credais mai hynny oedd diben datganoli a'r Cynulliad hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** Ni chaf unrhyw broblem ymdrin ag ail bwynt David. Ymddengys ei fod yn troi'n un o'r bobl hynny sydd yn treulio ei amser yn trafod deddfwriaeth yn hytrach na'r materion polisi sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru.

David, yr ydych yn ceisio codi cynnen o ddim byd o safbwynt pobl Cymru. Maent hwy am wybod, o ganlyniad i fewnbwn Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y bu trafod ac ymgynghori adeiladol, a arweiniodd at ddatblygiadau cadarnhaol i'r henoed yng Nghymru ac i ddarparwyr gofal cartrefi nyrzio preswyl yn y sector annibynnol a'r sector cyhoeddus. Dyna beth y mae pobl am ei wybod a dyna pam fy mod wedi rhoi'r newyddion da hyn ichi heddiw.

Datganiad ydyw. Cewch fy holi arno a chodaf y pwyntiau a godasoch chi â'r grŵp safonau sydd yn ystyried y materion hyn. Nid yw'n fwy na hynny. Credaf fod yr Aelodau'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i roi gwybodaeth o'r fath iddynt. Mae pobl Cymru—nid dim ond yr henoed, ond

Wales—not only the elderly, but carers, families and providers—like to have public updates, and I am providing that today.

10:05 a.m.

**Alison Halford:** I appreciate that David Melding has huge expertise in this field and feels disgruntled that you might be pushing ahead. I know that you would never do that, Minister. We are here to consult, you are listening and it is good that you are sharing information with us.

On a different issue, a constituent came to my surgery last week with a concern that care homes are closing in my part of the world because they are too costly to run. He gave an example of a nursing home, which will remain nameless, from which his 99-year-old mother will have to be moved because it has been taken over by a firm that has sneakily put in a building application to change it into high quality flats. There is an indication, which I am exploring before formally raising this matter with you, that that could be happening throughout Wales. That is of concern to your policy of sorting out bed-blocking. Do you have any knowledge that organisations are submitting planning applications and moving from care provision into other businesses?

**Jane Hutt:** That is an important point as regards regulation of the private sector. A large private and independent sector is involved in providing care for the elderly in nursing homes. The care standards inspectorate in Wales will be important in terms of the changes that are taking place. I have heard of a few other examples of company take-overs. Vulnerable elderly people, who have received and enjoyed care in a particular setting, find that that is changing and they have not been consulted. That is why it is important that we look to the needs of our most vulnerable people and their families in terms of how those changes are taking place.

On the commissioning process, about 70 per cent of the people in care homes in Wales are supported by the public sector, through local

cynhalwyr, teuluoedd a darparwyr—yn hoffi cael yr wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar goedd, ac yr wyf yn rhoi hynny heddiw.

**Alison Halford:** Gwerthfawrogaf y ffaith bod gan David Melding gryn arbenigedd yn y maes hwn ac yn teimlo'n anodlon eich bod yn bwrw ymlaen. Gwn na fydddech byth yn gwneud hynny, Weinidog. Yr ydym yma i ymgynghori, yr ydych chi'n gwranddo ac mae'n dda o beth eich bod yn rhannu gwybodaeth gyda ni.

Ynglŷn â mater gwahanol, daeth un o'm hetholwyr i'm cynghorfa yr wythnos diwethaf gan bryderu bod cartrefi gofal yn cau yn fy ardal i am eu bod yn rhy gostus i'w cynnal. Rhoes enghraifft o gartref nyrsio, nas enwaf, y mae'n rhaid symud ei fam sydd 99 oed oddi yno am fod cwmni wedi ei feddiannu ac wedi gwneud cais adeiladu yn dawel bach, i'w newid yn fflatiau moethus. Ceir arwydd, yr ymchwiliad iddo cyn codi'r mater hwn yn ffurfiol gyda chi, y gallai hynny fod yn digwydd ledled Cymru. Mae hynny wrth gwrs yn effeithio ar eich polisi o ddatrys blocio gwelyau. A wyddoch am unrhyw sefydliadau sydd yn cyflwyno ceisiadau cynllunio ac yn symud o'r sector darparu gofal i fusnesau eraill?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig o ran rheoleiddio'r sector preifat. Mae sector annibynnol a phreifat mawr yn darparu gofal i'r henoed mewn cartrefi nyrsio. Bydd arolygiaeth safonau gofal Cymru yn bwysig o ran y newidiadau sydd yn digwydd. Clywais sôn am nifer o achosion eraill o feddiannu. Mae pobl oedrannus ddiamddiffyn, sydd wedi cael gofal mewn lleoliad arbennig ac wedi mwynhau bod yno, yn canfod bod hynny'n newid ac nid ymgynghorwyd â hwy. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig inni edrych ar anghenion ein pobl fwyaf diamddiffyn a'u teuluoedd o ran sut y digwydd y newidiadau hyn.

O ran y broses gomisiynu, cynhelir tua 70 y cant o'r bobl mewn cartrefi gofal yng Nghymru gan y sector cyhoeddus, drwy

authorities and funding commissioning regimes. We must ensure that the needs of our elderly people come first and ensure quality of care, which is about continuity, safeguards, resident participation and carer involvement in such situations. I would be grateful if you would write to me about that incident.

**Peter Rogers:** I welcome the new standards that are being proposed. However, the big concern in Ynys Môn is the fact that private sector residential homes will invest much money to bring them up to standard, yet that area has the highest use of council-run homes. We are not supporting the private sector and giving them the encouragement to invest large amounts of money. One problem is that many of those homes are running below capacity, particularly some of the homes with elderly mentally infirm standards. We must ensure fairness across Wales.

Residential homes in the private sector, particularly in rural areas, make a valuable contribution to employment. We must ensure that we recognise the importance of private sector residential homes and give them every possible assistance. Councils should know what provisions cost them in-house and that they would save a great deal on their budgets if they took advantage of the private sector. It would not only to save on their budgets, but provide employment in rural areas. We must recognise the importance of independent, private sector homes.

**Jane Hutt:** We must start with the point that local authorities are commissioning care that meets the needs of the person. I am sure that we would all agree with that. We must consider what care, available in a community within a local authority and health authority's boundary, is appropriate for the elderly person who needs it. That must be the starting point in terms of standards, quality, choice and all the issues that David and others raised. People need choice and an appropriate range of settings to suit their dependency levels. That is a big issue in Wales. We have more and more people in the

awdurdodau lleol a chyfundrefnau ariannu comisiynu. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod anghenion yr henoed yn cael blaenoriaeth a sicrhau safon y gofal, sydd yn ymwneud â pharhad, camau diogelu, cyfranogiad y preswylwyr a'r cynhalwyr mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn ysgrifennu ataf am yr achos hwnnw.

**Peter Rogers:** Croesawaf y safonau newydd a gynigir. Fodd bynnag, y pryder mawr yn Ynys Môn yw'r ffaith y bydd cartrefi preswyl y sector preifat yn buddsoddi cryn dipyn o arian i sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd y safon, ac eto yn yr ardal honno cartrefi'r cyngor a ddefnyddir fwyaf. Nid ydym yn cefnogi'r sector preifat a'u hannog i fuddsoddi symiau mawr o arian. Un broblem yw'r ffaith nad yw llawer o'r cartrefi hyn yn llawn, yn enwedig rhai o'r cartrefi â safonau'r henoed â nam meddyliol. Rhaid inni sicrhau tegwch ledled Cymru.

Gwna cartrefi preswyl yn y sector preifat, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gyfraniad gwerthfawr o ran cyflogaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig y mae cartrefi preswyl y sector preifat a rhoi pob cymorth posibl iddynt. Dylai cyngorau wybod faint y mae darpariaethau yn ei gostio iddynt yn fewnol ac y byddent yn gwneud arbedion sylweddol o fewn eu cyllidebau pe baent yn manteisio ar y sector preifat. Byddai nid yn unig yn gwneud arbedion ond byddai'n darparu cyflogaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid inni gydnabod pwysigrwydd cartrefi'r sector annibynnol, preifat.

**Jane Hutt:** Rhaid inni ddechrau â'r pwynt bod awdurdodau lleol yn comisiynu gofal sydd yn diwallu anghenion yr unigolyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem oll yn cytuno ar hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried pa ofal, sydd ar gael mewn cymuned o fewn ffiniau awdurdod lleol ac awdurdod iechyd, fydd yn briodol ar gyfer person oedrannus sydd ei angen. Rhaid inni ddechrau yn y fan yma o ran safonau, ansawdd, dewis a phob un o'r materion a godwyd gan David ac eraill. Mae angen i bobl gael dewis ac ystod addas o leoliadau a fydd yn gweddu i'w lefel o ddibyniaeth. Mae hwnnw'n fater pwysig yng

care and nursing home sector of increasing dependency and fragility. This must start with the social, health and wellbeing needs of the elderly person.

The social care industry in Wales is huge and is growing. Many care homes throughout Wales have obtained investors in people accreditation. They have support for their business needs, and they have received support in the past from an economic development and a business development perspective for their role in the local economy. That is well recognised. The care training needs of the social care industry are enormous. We know that there is a major issue about levels of pay and training opportunities that adds to the issue of quality in our care homes. We must start with the needs of our elderly people in Wales and consider quality and standards in the commissioning. The standards that I announced today, which are agreed by all the interests involved, are a step towards that. However, the important issue for your reassurance, Peter, is that today's announcements are the result of a consensus reached between organisations such as Care Forum Wales and the Welsh branch of the Registered Nursing Homes Association. They are the trade associations that represent the sector in Wales. They feel that they can meet these changing and developing standards and know that, if they can move down that road, that it will also result in choice and in more elderly people seeking their homes and the opportunities that they provide. We want the best for our elderly people and our families and relatives and we hope that local authorities in commissioning will also want that and that care homes will aspire to provide that. They are clearly part of our social and business economy.

**Brian Hancock:** Thank you for this announcement, which is most welcome. It is particularly important to recognise the difficulties with access in homes where wheelchairs, crutches or zimmer frames are used. I wonder whether you and your colleague, the Minister for Finance, Local

Nghymru. Mae gennym fwy a mwy o bobl yn sector y cartrefi gofal a nyrsio sydd yn fwyfwy dibynnol ac eiddil. Rhaid i hyn ddechrau ag anghenion cymdeithasol, iechyd a lles yr henoed.

Mae'r diwydiant gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru yn un enfawr ac yn tyfu. Mae llawer o gartrefi gofal ledled Cymru wedi cael eu hachredu fel buddsoddwyr mewn pobl. Maent yn cael cymorth ar gyfer eu hanghenion busnes, a chawsant gymorth yn y gorffennol o safbwynt datblygu economaidd a busnes oherwydd eu rôl yn yr economi leol. Cydnabyddir hynny yn eang. Mae anghenion hyfforddiant gofal y diwydiant gofal cymdeithasol yn enfawr. Gwyddom fod problem sylweddol o ran lefelau cyflog a chyfleoedd hyfforddiant sydd yn ychwanegu at gwestiwn ansawdd ein cartrefi gofal. Rhaid inni ddechrau ag anghenion ein henoed yng Nghymru ac ystyried ansawdd a safonau yn y broses gomisiynu. Mae'r safonau a gyhoeddais heddiw, ac y cytunwyd arnynt gan bob sefydliad â diddordeb yn y maes hwn, yn gam tuag at hynny. Fodd bynnag, y mater pwysig i dawelu eich pryderon, Peter, yw bod y cyhoeddiadau heddiw wedi deillio o gytundeb rhwng sefydliadau fel Fforwm Gofal Cymru a changen Y Gymdeithas Cartrefi Nyrsio Cofrestredig yng Nghymru. Cymdeithasau masnach ydynt sydd yn cynrychioli'r sector yng Nghymru. Credant y gallant gyrraedd y safonau hyn sydd yn newid a datblygu o hyd a gwyddant y bydd yn arwain at ddewis a mwy o bobl yn ceisio mynediad i'w cartrefi a'r cyfleoedd a roddant pe gallent symud ar y trywydd hwnnw. Yr ydym am gael y gwasanaeth gorau ar gyfer yr henoed, ein teuluoedd a'n perthnasau a gobeithiwn y bydd awdurdodau lleol wrth gomisiynu hefyd am gael hynny ac y bydd y cartrefi gofal yn anelu at ddarparu hynny. Maent yn amlwg yn rhan o'n heconomi gymdeithasol a busnes.

**Brian Hancock:** Diolch ichi am y cyhoeddiad hwn a groesewir yn fawr iawn. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig inni gydnabod yr anawsterau o ran mynediad mewn cartrefi lle y defnyddir cadeiriau olwyn, ffyn baglau a fframiau cerdded. Tybiaf a oes angen ichi a'ch cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Gyllid,



Government and Communities, need to consider what occurs in sheltered homes where the near elderly and the elderly want to maintain some element of independence? It may be a sheltered home or something similar. We might need to consider the standards of those places and adopt the same standards for access in these homes. When I injured my knee through running, I found it difficult to manoeuvre with crutches, and I was healthy at the time. I appreciate what is happening now in nursing homes, but we need to address this issue in a wider context.

10:15 a.m.

**Jane Hutt:** An issue that I discussed with local authorities and private care providers is how we can provide continuity of care as people's needs and dependencies change. Many people in sheltered housing become more dependent, but do not necessarily want to move into residential care. Local authorities and housing associations are particularly concerned about this. I am sure that the Local Government and Housing Committee will look at this issue, as it considers the needs of the elderly in relation to housing. The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities will be interested in this. It is about enabling people to stay at home through adaptation and care support. If they are in sheltered housing, adaptations could be made and care support provided. Perhaps enhanced care support could be provided, traditionally in the form of wardens, so that people do not need to move. We know that elderly people become more confused the more they move. In residential and nursing homes, the largest age group is those who are over 85. That is increasingly the age of people in residential care. Many of the younger residents could remain in sheltered housing much longer with those kinds of adaptations and support systems. We could refer that information to members of the Local Government and Housing Committee, who are interested in these issues.

**Kirsty Williams:** This statement to the Assembly will go some way to clarify the situation and uncertainty that many in the

Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, ystyried yr hyn a ddigwydd mewn cartrefi gwarchod lle y mae'r henoed neu'r rhai cymharol hen am gael rhywfaint o annibyniaeth? Gall fod yn gartref gwarchod neu gartref cyffelyb. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried safonau'r lleoedd hynny a mabwysiadu yr un safonau o ran mynediad yn y cartrefi hyn. Pan glwyfais fy mhen-glin yn rhedeg, cefais anhawster symud â ffyn baglau, ac yr oeddwn innau'n hollriach ar y pryd. Gwerthfawrogaf yr hyn sydd yn digwydd erbyn hyn mewn cartrefi nyrsio, ond mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn mewn cyd-destun ehangach.

**Jane Hutt:** Un o'r materion a drafodais â'r awdurdodau lleol a darparwyr gofal preifat oedd sut y gallwn roi parhad gofal wrth i anghenion a graddau dibyniaeth pobl newid. Mae llawer o bobl mewn cartrefi gwarchod yn dod yn fwy dibynnol, ond nid ydynt am symud i ofal preswyl o reidrwydd. Mae awdurdodau lleol a chymdeithasau tai yn arbennig yn pryderu ynglŷn â hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai yn ystyried y mater hwn, wrth iddo ystyried anghenion yr henoed mewn perthynas â thai. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ymddiddori yn y mater hwn. Ein bwriad yw galluogi pobl i aros gartref drwy addasu eu tai a rhoi cymorth gofal iddynt. Os ydynt mewn tai gwarchod, gellir gwneud addasiadau a rhoi cymorth gofal iddynt. Efallai y gellid rhoi gwell cymorth gofal, yn draddodiadol drwy wardeniaid, fel na fydd angen i bobl symud. Gwyddom po fwyaf y caiff yr henoed eu symud y mwyaf dryslyd y dânt. Mewn cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio, y grŵp oedran mwyaf yw'r rhai dros 85. Yn fwyfwy, pobl dros 85 oed yw'r bobl mewn gofal preswyl. Gallai llawer o'r preswylwyr iau aros mewn tai gwarchod yn llawer hwy gydag addasiadau a systemau cymorth o'r fath. Gallem gyfeirio'r wybodaeth honno at aelodau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, sydd â diddordeb yn y materion hyn.

**Kirsty Williams:** Bydd y datganiad hwn i'r Cynulliad dipyn o gymorth wrth egluro'r sefyllfa a'r ansicrwydd a deimlai llawer yn y

sector felt, following the publication of standards for England, and the subsequent publication of standards for Wales. They wanted to know whether we would follow the same standards or whether we would plough a different furrow in Wales. I also welcome your approach in looking at the concerns of the independent sector. I know that that sector, which provides a large part of the bed capacity, was initially concerned that the National Assembly was not listening to its views. I was glad to hear that Care Forum Wales—which represents the independent sector—was involved in the taskforce that brought these recommendations to you, which you accepted. They will be pleased to have been involved.

The pilot and review procedures that are mentioned in your statement are particularly welcome. Governments are sometimes guilty of passing regulations or laws of this kind, and then thinking that the matter is done and dusted and that they can forget about it. Therefore, I welcome the fact that there will be a period during which these standards will be piloted. I also welcome your commitment to review the procedures to assess their impact.

As others have said, in particular, Peter Rogers, there are concerns in rural areas about the efficacy of rural homes and their cost effectiveness. Many of these rural homes are situated in large, older houses, which do not lend themselves easily to the difficult, physical adaptations that may be required to meet these standards. Of course, there is no excuse for new build and extensions to these homes. They should meet these standards from the outset. However, rural homes have particular problems and, if as a result, a home was closed in the Rhayader area, for example, the nearest home would be at least 16 miles away. That would make it difficult for relatives or members of the community to visit an elderly person. There are similar situations throughout rural Wales. Therefore, I welcome your emphasis on considering the impact on these homes.

However, do you agree that physical

sector, yn sgîl cyhoeddi'r safonau ar gyfer Lloegr, ac wedyn y safonau ar gyfer Cymru. Yr oeddent am wybod a fyddem yn dilyn yr un safonau neu a fyddem yn dilyn trywydd gwahanol yng Nghymru. Croesawaf hefyd eich ymagwedd tuag at ystyried pryderon y sector annibynnol. Gwn fod y sector hwnnw, sydd yn darparu'r rhan helaeth o welyau, yn pryderu ar y cychwyn nad oedd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gwrandao ar ei safbwyntiau. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod Fforwm Gofal Cymru—a gynrychiola'r sector annibynnol—yn rhan o'r tasglu a gyflwynodd yr argymhellion ichi, argymhellion a dderbyniwyd gennych. Byddant yn falch o gael cyfle i gymryd rhan.

Croesewir yn fawr y gweithdrefnau ar gyfer cynnal cynlluniau peilot ac adolygu y cyfeiriwyd atynt yn eich datganiad. Mae Llywodraethau weithiau yn euog o basio rheoliadau neu ddeddfau o'r fath gan feddwl wedyn eu bod wedi cau pen y mwdwl a'u bod yn gallu anghofio amdano. Felly, croesawaf y ffaith y bydd cyfnod o gynnal cynlluniau peilot ar y safonau hyn. Croesawaf hefyd eich ymrwymiad i adolygu'r gweithdrefnau i asesu eu hefffaith.

Fel y dywedodd Aelodau eraill, yn arbennig, Peter Rogers, mae pryderon mewn ardaloedd gwledig ynglŷn ag effeithlonrwydd cartrefi gwledig a pha mor gost-effeithiol ydynt. Lleolir llawer o'r cartrefi gwledig hyn mewn tai hŷn, mawr, nad yw'n hawdd gwneud yr addasiadau anodd, ffisegol iddynt sydd eu hangen o bosibl er mwyn cyrraedd y safonau hyn. Wrth gwrs, nid oes unrhyw esgus o ran adeiladau newydd ac estyniadau i'r cartrefi hyn. Dylent gyrraedd y safonau hyn o'r cychwyn cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, mae gan gartrefi gwledig broblemau arbennig ac os, o ganlyniad, y caeid cartref yn ardal Rhaeadr Gŵy, er enghraifft, byddai'r cartref agosaf o leiaf 16 milltir i fwrdd. Byddai hynny yn ei gwneud yn anodd i berthnasau ac aelodau o'r gymuned ymweld â'r henoed. Ceir sefyllfaoedd tebyg ledled Cymru wledig. Felly, croesawaf eich pwyslais ar ystyried yr effaith ar y cartrefi hyn.

Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch mai dim ond rhan

standards, such as the size of doorways and rooms and the number of single rooms, while being important, are just a part of the care of elderly people in whatever sector? We need to continue to drive up standards, not simply in a physical sense, but in a holistic approach to the quality of lives that older people in Wales enjoy, when they move to such a home.

**Jane Hutt:** I made a statement in order to end the uncertainty. That is why I agreed to the sub-group's views and recommendations. Providers in Wales and organisations like Age Concern Cymru faced uncertainty which, in any kind of service or business, can destabilise not only the current running of the business but also future projections of stability and investments. In agreeing to the recommendations, I am ending the uncertainty. It is important that we are flexible. Piloting is important to help us learn lessons. I have already said that we recognise the issues arising in rural areas and in smaller homes. We have large, old houses and buildings such as those Kirsty described in rural areas throughout Wales. We must work through that in partnership. This is only part of improving standards for older people in Wales as Kirsty said. We hope that that will be reflected in the inclusive strategy group that Brian Gibbons will chair to consider all the needs of older people in Wales, in terms of their long-term care and options.

**Alun Cairns:** A high standard of care for the elderly is an objective of every Assembly Member. I am particularly concerned about standards in the private sector. Hardly a week passes without me receiving some form of representation from private sector residential and nursing care homeowners. I am grateful that you met Care Forum Wales, but it must be said that that was following a considerable amount of lobbying for you to engage with it in your consultation. Any regulations that are imposed on residential and nursing homes are of great concern because of the condition of the private sector.

o ofal i'r henoed yw safonau ffisegol, fel maint drysau ac ystafelloedd a nifer yr ystafelloedd sengl, er mor bwysig ydynt, beth bynnag fo'r sector? Mae angen inni barhau i godi safonau, nid yn unig yn ffisegol, ond drwy ymagwedd gyfannol tuag at ansawdd y bywydau a gaiff yr henoed yng Nghymru pan symudant i gartref o'r fath.

**Jane Hutt:** Gwneuthum ddatganiad er mwyn dod â'r ansicrwydd i ben. Dyna pam y cytunais â barn ac argymhellion yr is-grŵp. Wynebair darparwyr yng Nghymru a sefydliadau fel Gofal yr Henoed Cymru ansicrwydd a all, mewn unrhyw fath o wasanaeth neu fusnes nid yn unig ddadsefydlogi'r busnes presennol ond hefyd y rhagamcanion ar gyfer y dyfodol o ran sefydlogrwydd a buddsoddi. Wrth gytuno â'r argymhellion, dof â'r ansicrwydd i ben. Mae'n bwysig inni fod yn hyblyg. Mae cynlluniau peilot yn bwysig i helpu inni ddysgu gwersi. Dywedais eisoes inni gydnabod y materion sydd yn codi mewn ardaloedd gwledig a chartrefi llai. Ceir tai ac adeiladau mawr, hen, fel y rhai a ddisgrifiodd Kirsty mewn ardaloedd gwledig ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni weithio ar hynny mewn partneriaeth. Dim ond rhan o wella safonau ar gyfer yr henoed yng Nghymru ydyw fel y dywedodd Kirsty. Gobeithiwn yr adlewyrchir hynny yn y grŵp strategaeth cynhwysol i'w gadeirio gan Brian Gibbons a fydd yn ystyried holl anghenion yr henoed yng Nghymru, o ran eu gofal ac opsiynau tymor hir.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae gofal o safon uchel i'r henoed yn amcan i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn pryderu'n arbennig ynghylch safonau yn y sector preifat. Nid oes wythnos yn mynd heibio bron heb imi gael rhyw fath o sylwadau gan berchnogion cartrefi yn y sector gofal preswyl a nyrsio preifat. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi cwrdd â Fforwm Gofal Cymru, ond rhaid dweud i hynny ddigwydd ar ôl cryn dipyn o lobïo ichi gysylltu ag ef yn ystod eich ymgynghoriad. Mae unrhyw reoliadau a orfodir ar gartrefi preswyl a nyrsio yn achosi cryn bryder oherwydd cyflwr y sector preifat.

Much of this reflects the funding formula that the local authorities use in financing the care of the elderly. Why is it the case—and will you give consideration to analysing this much more closely—that local authorities frequently pay the state-owned residential and nursing care homes double what they pay those in the private sector? The private sector will be hit much harder by these regulations than the state sector. Therefore, what consideration have you given to supporting the private sector as it undertakes conversions to deal with the lifts that we have talked about, the width of doorways and the single occupancy issues that Kirsty mentioned? We need to be clear that the sector is in extreme difficulty. You did not answer Peter's question on what encouragement you can give to the sector because of the demographic changes that we will see in Wales over the next 10, 15 and 20 years. We need to do everything possible to facilitate the delivery of high standards of care for the elderly. I am not convinced that your statement has addressed those points.

**Jane Hutt:** The financing, support and assessment issues of the long-term care needs of older people go well beyond this statement. They are matters that we are considering, discussing and debating in the Health and Social Services Committee and will be taking them forward. On your first point, the fact that Care Forum Wales and the Registered Nursing Home Association were involved in this consultation and accepting these standards—we are talking about reaching those standards over a period of time—is the most important step. I recognised before I met Care Forum Wales that it is a partner in Wales in the delivery of service. That is the most important point, that the independent sector is an important partner in the provision of health and social care. That means that we are working together on the difficulties that it may be facing, in terms of how it changes and adapts to reach the standards that it has signed up to. It is not a matter of imposing. If it were, we might have consulted the sector after the event, which is not the way to work. It should be achieved by involving the independent

Mae llawer o hyn yn adlewyrchu'r fformwla ariannu a ddefnyddir gan yr awdurdodau lleol wrth ariannu gofal i'r henoed. Pam felly—ac a wnewch ystyried dadansoddi hyn yn fanylach—bod awdurdodau lleol yn aml yn talu dwywaith cymaint i gartrefi gofal preswyl a nyrsio o eiddo'r wladwriaeth ag y gwnant i gartrefi yn y sector preifat? Bydd y sector preifat yn dioddef llawer mwy na'r sector cyhoeddus oherwydd y rheoliadau hyn. Felly, pa ystyriaeth a roesoch i roi cymorth i'r sector preifat wrth iddo wneud yr addasiadau o ran lifftiau y cyfeiriasom atynt, lled drysau a materion yn ymwneud ag ystafelloedd sengl a grybwyllwyd gan Kirsty? Mae angen inni fod yn glir bod y sector yn cael cryn anawsterau. Nid atebasoch gwestiwn Peter ar sut y gallwch annog y sector oherwydd y newidiadau demograffig a welwn yng Nghymru yn ystod y 10, 15 ac 20 mlynedd nesaf. Mae angen inni wneud y cyfan a allwn er mwyn hwyluso'r broses o ddarparu gofal o safon uchel i'r henoed. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod eich datganiad wedi mynd i'r afael â'r pwyntiau hynny.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r materion sydd yn ymwneud ag ariannu, cefnogi ac asesu anghenion gofal yr henoed yn llawer ehangach na'r hyn a gwmpesir yn y datganiad hwn. Maent yn faterion yr ydym yn eu hystyried a'u trafod yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a byddwn yn eu datblygu. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt cyntaf, y ffaith fod Fforwm Gofal Cymru a'r Gymdeithas Cartrefi Nyrsio Cofrestredig yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori hon ac yn derbyn y safonau hyn—yr ydym yn siarad am gyrraedd y safonau hynny dros gyfnod—yw'r cam pwysicaf. Cyn imi gwrdd â Fforwm Gofal Cymru cydnabûm ei fod yn bartner yng Nghymru o ran cyflwyno gwasanaethau. Dyna'r pwynt pwysicaf, sef bod y sector annibynnol yn bartner pwysig wrth ddarparu ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Golyga hynny ein bod yn gweithio gyda'n gilydd ar yr anawsterau a wyneba o bosibl, o ran sut y mae'n newid ac yn ymaddasu i gyrraedd y safonau y cytunodd arnynt. Nid mater o orfodi mohono. Pe bai hynny'n wir, byddem wedi ymgynghori â'r sector ar ôl gwneud penderfyniad, nad yw'r ffordd addas

sector in the partnership.

o weithio. Dylid ei gyflawni drwy gynnwys y sector annibynnol yn y bartneriaeth.

10:25 a.m.

On the long-term financing of the independent care sector, the number of residential nursing homes for elderly people in Wales has remained fairly constant. During the early 1980s, the figure mushroomed because people thought that they could make money out of elderly people. I was a councillor at the time, and saw Cardiff being transformed as houses were bought and turned into residential nursing homes. Many of those private homes did not reach the standards. All Members will agree that the purpose of improving the provision of residential homes for the elderly in Wales is not to make profit out of the elderly. Unfortunately, that is what happened in the early 1980s. The quality of independent and private sector provision is now much more regulated. If local government provision is to reach these standards, this will also cost the public sector money. In the early 1980s, some of the homes in the local authority for which I, in social services, was responsible, were appalling. There were wards where there were homes in which people had no dignity. Local authority provision has had to change. The new rules will set exacting standards for local authorities. Also, in terms of best value in the provision of services, local authorities are considering what is best for elderly people in their communities.

O ran ariannu'r sector gofal annibynnol yn y tymor hir, mae nifer y cartrefi nyrsio preswyl i'r henoed yng Nghymru wedi aros yn eithaf cyson. Ar ddechrau'r 1980au, bu cynnydd mawr am fod pobl yn credu y gallent wneud elw ar gefn yr henoed. Yr oeddwn yn gynghorydd ar y pryd, a gwelais Gaerdydd yn cael ei thrawsnewid wrth i gartrefi gael eu prynu a'u troi yn gartrefi nyrsio preswyl. Ni chyrhaeddodd llawer o'r cartrefi preifat hynny y safonau. Bydd pob Aelod yn cytuno nad diben gwella darpariaeth cartrefi preswyl i'r henoed yng Nghymru yw gwneud elw ar gefn yr henoed. Yn anffodus, dyna beth a ddigwyddodd ar ddechrau'r 1980au. Mae ansawdd darpariaeth y sector annibynnol a phreifat wedi eu rheoleiddio llawer mwy erbyn hyn. Er mwy i ddarpariaeth llywodraeth leol gyrraedd y safonau hyn, bydd yn costio arian hefyd i'r sector cyhoeddus. Ar ddechrau'r 1980au yr oedd rhai o'r cartrefi yn yr awdurdod lleol yr oeddwn i, yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn gyfrifol amdanynt, yn warthus. Cafwyd cartrefi â wardiau lle nad oedd pobl yn cael unrhyw urddas. Rhaid i ddarpariaeth awdurdodau lleol newid. Bydd y rheolau newydd yn gosod safonau uchel ar gyfer yr awdurdodau lleol. Hefyd, o ran gwerth gorau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau, mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried yr hyn sydd orau i'r henoed yn eu cymunedau.

However, this is a matter of providers ensuring quality and choice by reaching the standards set. That will help those providers in their businesses. People will choose the homes that offer the best provision. It also involves ensuring Best Value in local government and that, through commissioning, the need for quality, choice and standards is recognised. In addition, it involves supporting the private and independent care sector, as I am doing, and involving them in reaching conclusions on standards to which they will then subscribe. They have willingly done that in terms of the standards that I have announced today.

Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn ymwneud â darparwyr yn sicrhau ansawdd a dewis wrth gyrraedd y safonau a bennwyd. Bydd hynny o gymorth i'r darparwyr hynny yn eu busnesau. Bydd pobl yn dewis y cartrefi sydd yn cynnig y ddarpariaeth orau. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau Gwerth Gorau mewn llywodraeth leol a chydabod yr angen, drwy gomisiynu, am ansawdd, dewis a safonau. Yn ogystal, mae'n ymwneud â rhoi cymorth i'r sector gofal preifat ac annibynnol, fel a wna i, a'u cynnwys wrth wneud penderfyniadau ar safonau y byddant wedyn yn cydymffurfio â hwy. Buont yn fodlon gwneud hynny o ran y safonau a gyhoeddais heddiw.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have exceeded the time usually allowed for statements. However, because time is available this morning, I will allow one more question to the Minister. I will then have called all Members who have expressed an interest in this matter.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome this morning's statement. I note that you intend to look closely at the impact of the recommendations. You also said that this is a move towards creating a level playing field between the private and public sectors. That is important. I would have liked a reference to access outside homes, which is just as important as access inside. No doubt, you will consider that. I am amazed by the Welsh Conservatives' criticism of this. It was the Conservative Government that introduced the National Health Service and Community Care Act 1990. Although that Act had many good points, it was inadequately resourced because, at that time, the provision of resources was based on expenditure in the independent sector. The minimum care standards set at that time were unclear and inadequate. This statement is a move in the right direction in seeking to ensure the wellbeing of elderly people. I congratulate the Minister and all those concerned.

**Jane Hutt:** I am grateful for your points. I think that they have been covered in the discussion on my statement.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydym wedi mynd dros yr amser a ganiateir fel arfer ar gyfer datganiadau. Fodd bynnag, gan fod amser ar gael y bore yma, caniatâf un cwestiwn arall i'r Gweinidog. Wedyn byddaf wedi galw ar bob Aelod a fynegodd ddiddordeb yn y mater hwn.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf y datganiad y bore yma. Nodaf eich bod yn bwriadu ystyried yn fanwl effaith yr argymhellion. Dywedasoeh hefyd ei fod yn gam tuag at gael chwarae teg rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Hoffwn fod wedi clywed cyfeiriad at fynediad y tu allan i'r cartrefi, sydd yr un mor bwysig â mynediad o fewn cartrefi. Yn ddiaw, byddwch yn ystyried hynny. Rhyfeddaf at feirniadaeth Ceidwadwyr Cymru o hyn. Y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a gyflwynodd Ddeddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol a Gofal Cymunedol 1990. Er bod gan y Ddeddf honno lawer o rinweddau, nis ariannwyd yn ddigonol, oherwydd, ar y pryd, y seiliwyd darpariaeth yr adnoddau ar wariant yn y sector annibynnol. Yr oedd yr isafswm safonau gofal a bennwyd bryd hynny yn annelwig ac yn annigonol. Mae'r datganiad hwn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir wrth geisio sicrhau lles yr henoed. Llongyfarchaf y Gweinidog a phob un arall a oedd yn ymwneud â hyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am eich pwyntiau. Credaf iddynt gael eu cwmpasu yn y drafodaeth ar fy natganiad.

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**The Presiding Officer:** Before calling Members who have indicated that they want to raise points of order, including the Leader of the Opposition and the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives, I revert to question 7 to the Minister for Rural Affairs, which I called this morning. I have investigated the situation regarding this question. Alun Pugh had not withdrawn the question. It was therefore in order for it to be called. The guidance on oral and written Assembly questions is clear. Paragraph 9.1 of that guidance states that

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn galw ar yr Aelodau sydd wedi datgan eu bod am godi pwyntiau o drefn, gan gynnwys Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid ac Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, ddychwelaf at gwestiwn 7 i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, a alwais y bore yma. Ymchwiliais i'r sefyllfa ynghylch y cwestiwn hwn. Ni thynnodd Alun Pugh y cwestiwn yn ôl. Felly, yr oedd yn briodol iddo gael ei alw. Mae'r arweiniad ar gwestiynau llafar ac ysgrifenedig yn y Cynulliad yn glir. Mae paragraff 9.1 yr arweiniad hwnnw yn datgan

'When an oral question has been wrongly addressed and the Table Office has not been able to advise the Member concerned before it is tabled, Cabinet Secretariat will notify the Member if it is to be transferred.... Questions should be transferred at least 24 hours before they are due to be answered to ensure that suitable notice is given to the Member concerned.'

My understanding, from information I have obtained, is that this transfer did not take place within the required 24 hours and therefore the Member was free to ask his question. If questions are to be withdrawn, it should be done before the start of Plenary sessions. Members will know that I am always keen to ensure that Members have an opportunity to ask questions, particularly when they concern shellfish in the Conwy estuary.

**Alun Pugh:** I tabled this question to the Minister for Rural Affairs because I am concerned that British Nuclear Fuels Limited discharges are damaging the reputation of Welsh food for quality. Therefore, it came as somewhat of a surprise to me this morning when my question was transferred for answer by the Minister for Health and Social Services. However, in view of the toxicity of radionuclear discharges from Sellafield, I can understand why this is being treated as a health issue.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Alun Pugh for his response. I have asked the clerk to ensure that, in future, the guidelines on tabling and transferring questions are adhered to whenever possible, and, if possible, at all times.

'Pan gyfeirir cwestiwn llafar yn anghywir ac na lwyddodd y Swyddfa Gyflwyno i roi gwybod i'r Aelod dan sylw cyn iddo gael ei gyflwyno, bydd Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet yn rhoi gwybod i'r Aelod os bydd yn cael ei drosglwyddo.... Dylid trosglwyddo cwestiynau o leiaf 24 awr cyn y maent i fod i gael eu hateb er mwyn sicrhau bod yr Aelod yn cael digon o rybudd.'

Yr wyf ar ddeall, o'r wybodaeth a gefais, na ddigwyddodd y trosglwyddiad hwn o fewn y 24 awr sydd yn ofynnol a bod rhyddid felly gan yr Aelod i ofyn ei gwestiwn. Os caiff cwestiynau eu tynnu yn ôl, dylid gwneud hynny cyn dechrau'r Cyfarfodydd Llawn. Bydd Aelodau yn ymwybodol fy mod bob amser yn awyddus i sicrhau y rhoddir cyfle i Aelodau ofyn cwestiynau, yn arbennig lle byddant yn ymwneud â physgod cregyn yn aber afon Conwy.

**Alun Pugh:** Cyflwynais y cwestiwn hwn i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig gan fy mod yn pryderu bod arllwysiadau British Nuclear Fuels Limited yn niweidio'r enw da sydd gan fwyd Cymreig am ansawdd. Felly, yr oedd yn rhywfaint o syndod i mi y bore yma pan drosglwyddwyd fy nghwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei ateb. Fodd bynnag, o gofio gwenwyndra arllwysiadau radioniwclear o Sellafield, gallaf ddeall pam ei fod yn cael ei drin fel mater iechyd.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Alun Pugh am ei ymateb. Gofynnais i'r clerc sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, y dilynir y canllawiau ar gyflwyno a throsglwyddo cwestiynau lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, ac, os yn bosibl, ar bob achlysur.

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn cofio y bu inni godi pwyntiau o drefn yn y gorffennol ynglŷn â chyhoeddiadau yn enw'r Cynulliad, ac weithiau yn enw'r Llywodraeth. Cefais innau, ac Aelodau eraill, syndod wrth ddarllen hysbyseb yn enw'r

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Point of order. You will recall that we have raised points of order in the past about publications in the name of the Assembly, and sometimes in the Government's name. I, and other Members, were surprised to see an advert in the

Cynulliad yn *The Western Mail* heddiw i benodi dau gynghorwr arbennig i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sydd yn aelodau o'r Cabinet. Pryd wnaethpwyd y penderfyniad i gyhoeddi'r hysbyseb yn enw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Faint o ymgynghori a fu gyda Swyddfa'r Llywydd ac Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad, a phwy oedd yn gyfrifol am lunio manylion y swydd? Ymddengys mai pwrpas y ddwy swydd yw nid yn unig i gynghori y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cabinet, ond hefyd i gyd-drafod â'r blaid gyfan yn y Cynulliad ac i friffio'r Aelodau ar y meiniâu cefn. Cyfanswm cyflog y ddwy swydd yw £70,000. Nid wyf yn hapus bod swyddi o'r fath yn cael eu hysbysebu yn enw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heb i'r Cynulliad wybod unrhyw beth amdanynt tan iddynt ymddangos yn *The Western Mail*.

**Nick Bourne:** Further to that point of order, we should first congratulate the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development for creating some jobs. Given this week's job losses at Gossard, despite his visit to south-east Wales, and at Dewhurst, despite his visit to mid Wales, and the recent job losses at Alcam, we should note that he has at last created two jobs. However, I am glad that the advert carries the health warning that these posts are only linked to the tenure of the Minister's office. Appointing a second set of special advisers raises constitutional issues. These advisers will not only advise his royal highness the Deputy First Minister on his alleged area of competence, as William Graham so rightly put it, but will also advise his party on all policy areas. We will have two sets of competing special advisers, one for the Liberal Democrats and the other for the Labour Party, presumably on the basis that, during the coming general election, both parts of the pantomime horse will want to pull in opposite directions. Wasting money in this way causes concern. The appointments have not been properly discussed, and we should have been told if they were part of the partnership agreement. Moreover, we should be told from where the money will come. This raises serious questions about cost and the constitutional validity of having two competing sets of special advisers for two

National Assembly's name in *The Western Mail* today for two special advisers for the Liberal Democrat Cabinet Members. When was the decision made to publish this advert in the name of the National Assembly? How much consultation was there with the Office of the Presiding Officer and other Assembly Members, and who was responsible for drawing up the job specifications? It would appear that the purpose of these posts is not only to advise the Liberal Democrat Cabinet Members, but also to confer with all of the party's Assembly Members and to brief its backbenchers. The total salary of both posts amounts to £70,000. I am not happy that posts of this nature were advertised in the National Assembly's name when the Assembly knew nothing about them until they appeared in *The Western Mail*.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, dylem yn gyntaf longyfarch y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd am greu swyddi. O gofio'r swyddi a gollwyd yr wythnos hon yn Gossard, er gwaethaf ei ymweliad â de-ddwyrain Cymru, ac yn Dewhurst, er gwaethaf ei ymweliad â chanolbarth Cymru, a'r swydd a gollwyd yn ddiweddar yn Alcam, dylem nodi ei fod o'r diwedd wedi creu dwy swydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o weld mai dim ond am y cyfnod y bydd y Gweinidog yn ei swydd y mae'r swyddi hyn yn berthnasol. Mae penodi ail set o gynghorwyr arbennig yn codi materion cyfansoddiadol. Nid yn unig y bydd y cynghorwyr hyn yn cynghori ei fawrhydi brenhinol y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar ei faes honedig o fedrusrwydd, fel y nododd William Graham yn gyfiawn, ond byddant hefyd yn cynghori ei blaid ar bob maes polisi. Bydd gennym ddwy set o gynghorwyr arbennig yn cystadlu, un ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r llall ar ran y Blaid Lafur, yn ôl pob tebyg ar y sail y bydd dwy ran y ceffyl pantomeim am dynnu mewn cyfeiriadau croes yn ystod yr etholiad cyffredinol arfaethedig. Mae gwastraffu arian yn y fath fodd yn destun pryder. Ni thrafodwyd y penodiadau yn gywir, a dylid fod wedi'n hysbysu os oeddent yn rhan o'r cytundeb partneriaeth. At hyn, dylid ein hysbysu o ble y daw yr arian. Mae hyn yn



parts of the same Government.

codi cwestiynau difrifol am gost a dilysrwydd cyfansoddiadol cael dwy set o gynghorwyr arbennig yn cystadlu ar ran dwy ran o'r un Llywodraeth.

10:35 a.m.

**The First Minister:** Further to that point of order, the answer is simple, in that the Assembly has taken steps to regularise the appointments of special advisers so that they are made on the basis of merit and not in the way that they were made by Conservative or Labour Governments in the past, when advisers were appointed by the personal choice of Ministers. Once you try to go beyond that, and actually appoint on merit, but in a way that fits in with the role of a special adviser, inevitably it opens up avenues for the opposition to make a lot of fuss because they can read the advertisement. When special advisers were appointed by Margaret Thatcher there were no advertisements. This is an improvement, and is moving away from the way in which an increasing number of special advisers were appointed throughout the 18 years of Conservative Government. Now you are complaining that this Assembly is appointing special advisers based on merit, when Governments that you supported always had special advisers, who were not appointed in this way.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, mae'r ateb yn syml, gan fod y Cynulliad wedi cymryd camau i reoleiddio'r broses o benodi cynghorwyr arbennig fel y'i gwneir ar sail rhinwedd ac nid yn y ffordd y'i gwnaed gan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol neu Lafur yn y gorffennol, pan benodwyd cynghorwyr yn ôl dewis personol Gweinidogion. Unwaith yr eir y tu hwnt i hynny, ac y penodir ar sail rhinwedd, ond mewn ffordd sydd yn cyfateb â rôl cynghorydd arbennig, yn anochel, rhoddir cyfle i'r wrthblaid greu ffwdan gan eu bod yn gallu darllen yr hysbyseb. Pan benodwyd cynghorwyr arbennig gan Margaret Thatcher ni luniwyd hysbysebion. Mae hyn yn welliant, ac yn ddatblygiad o'r ffordd y penodwyd nifer gynyddol o gynghorwyr arbennig drwy gyfnod 18 mlynedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Yn awr yr ydych yn cwyno bod y Cynulliad hwn yn penodi cynghorwyr arbennig ar sail rhinwedd, pan fu gan Lywodraethau a gefnogasoch gynghorwyr arbennig bob amser, nas penodwyd yn yr un modd.

Ieuan's point seems to be quite different, that the appointments should not be advertised under the heading of the National Assembly for Wales. We can consider if there are any other ways of doing it, but these are not Liberal Democrat party employees. They are civil servants under the special terms of special advisers. We are simply regularising the appointment procedure. We did it when we appointed Labour special advisers, and the Liberal Democrats are doing it in the same way. It is the best, cleanest and most open way in which special advisers have ever been appointed by either the Scottish Parliament, the Northern Ireland Assembly or the institutions of the British Government in Westminster. We are well ahead of the game in cleaning up and opening up this process, and yet we still get this nit-picking criticism for criticism's sake, from both

Tybiaf fod pwynt Ieuan yn gwbl wahanol, sef na ddylid hysbysebu'r penodiadau o dan bennawd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Gallwn ystyried a oes unrhyw ffyrdd eraill o wneud hyn, ond nid cyflogeion plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol mohonynt. Gweision sifil ydynt o dan dermau arbennig cynghorwyr arbennig. Rheoleiddio'r weithdrefn benodi yw'r hyn a wnawn. Gwnaethom hynny wrth benodi cynghorwyr arbennig y blaid Lafur, ac mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn gwneud hynny yn yr un ffordd. Dyna'r ffordd orau, fwyaf gonest ac agored a ddefnyddiwyd erioed i benodi cynghorwyr arbennig gan Senedd yr Alban, Cynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon neu sefydliadau Llywodraeth Prydain yn San Steffan. Yr ydym ar flaen y gad wrth lanhau'r broses hon a sicrhau ei bod yn agored, ac eto yr ydym yn dioddef

Ieuan Wyn Jones and Nick Bourne. It is ridiculous.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That was not an acceptable answer from the First Minister. What he has failed to address is the fact that here we have two special advisers being appointed in the name of the National Assembly without the National Assembly even being consulted. The significant point of order is how is it possible for the National Assembly—which contains more than only two parties of government—to have to pay special advisers to advise backbench members of the Liberal Democrats when they are actually also in receipt of opposition money? What will now happen to that money?

**Nick Bourne:** It is not nit-picking, and I notice that the questions raised have not been answered by Rhodri Morgan. I accept that this is open. However, there are two sets of special advisers according to the advertisement, to help brief Liberal Democrat Assembly Members. Will you address that point? Why do we need two sets of special advisers in the Government, some for the Liberal Democrats—not just on their areas in the Cabinet—and some for the Labour party? Why does this go out in the name of the National Assembly when it has not been discussed?

**The First Minister:** Ieuan Wyn Jones and Nick Bourne now seem to think that all the employment advertisements to hire civil servants have to be discussed with all four parties in the Assembly. That does not happen with any other civil service appointments. All civil service appointments are advertised under that heading. It is standard practice, done as the normal personnel procedure for appointments to the civil service. These are civil servants—*[Interruption.]*

I am answering one point and because of that you want me to move to something else. All civil service appointments are made in this way, and these are civil servants, although under special terms. Either you want special

beirniadaeth pigo beiau o hyd gan Ieuan Wyn Jones a Nick Bourne, a hynny er mwyn barnu yn unig. Mae'n chwerthinllyd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid oedd yr ateb hwnnw'n dderbyniol gan y Prif Weinidog. Yr hyn a fethodd gyfeirio ato oedd y ffaith fod gennym yma ddau gynghorydd arbennig yn cael eu penodi yn enw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heb hyd yn oed ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Y pwynt o drefn arwyddocaol yw sut mae'n bosibl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—sydd yn cynnwys mwy na dwy blaid lywodraethol yn unig—orfod talu cynghorwyr arbennig i gynghori aelodau meinciau cefn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol tra'u bod hefyd yn derbyn arian a roddir i wrthbleidiau? Beth fydd yn digwydd i'r arian hwnnw yn awr?

**Nick Bourne:** Nid pigo beiau a wnaif, a sylwaf nad yw Rhodri Morgan wedi ateb y cwestiynau a godwyd. Derbyniaf fod y broses yn agored. Fodd bynnag, mae dwy set o gynghorwyr arbennig yn ôl yr hysbyseb, i helpu i friffio Aelodau Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o'r Cynulliad. A ymatebwch i'r pwynt hwnnw? Pam fod angen dwy set o gynghorwyr arbennig arnom yn y Llywodraeth, rhai i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—nid ar eu meysydd yn y Cabinet yn unig—a rhai i'r blaid Lafur? Pam y'i cyflwynwyd yn enw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol heb iddo gael ei drafod?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymddengys fod Ieuan Wyn Jones a Nick Bourne bellach o'r farn y dylid trafod pob hysbyseb cyflogaeth i gyflogi gweision sifil gyda'r pedair plaid yn y Cynulliad. Ni ddigwydd hynny gydag unrhyw benodiadau gwasanaeth sifil eraill. Hysbysebir pob penodiad gwasanaeth sifil o dan y pennawd hwnnw. Dyna yw'r arfer safonol, a ddilynir fel y weithdrefn personél arferol ar gyfer penodi i'r gwasanaeth sifil. Mae'r rhain yn weision sifil—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Yr wyf yn ateb un pwynt ac oherwydd hynny yr ydych am i mi symud at rywbeth arall. Gwneir holl benodiadau'r gwasanaeth sifil yn y fath fodd, ac mae'r rhain yn weision sifil, er eu bod o dan dermau arbennig. Yr

advisers or you do not. When we advertise them in the cleanest and most above-board way, you decide that you do not like it. That is why I am saying that this is nit-picking, knee-jerk criticism for criticism's sake. The Scottish Parliament Executive, which comprises two parties, has two sets of special advisers as well, but they were not appointed in this way. We are appointing ours on the basis of merit and in an open manner. This has not been done before and I think that you should consider occasionally giving a bit of credit where credit is due.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I do not doubt that the Cabinet needs special advisers. It already has four, so why does it not share the ones it has already appointed rather than taking on more?

**David Davies:** We know that the Government is in trouble when it starts giving us history lessons instead of answering our points. The taxpayers of Wales are being asked to spend over £70,000 a year on a couple of Liberal Democrat spin doctors. If they are not working for the Liberal Democrats, let them brief us and Plaid Cymru on policy issues. We are being asked to fund their spin doctors in the forthcoming Westminster election campaign, which is an absolute disgrace.

**Val Feld:** I question whether this is now a debate on a point of order. It seems to me—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a point of order which has been raised by the Leader of the Opposition—

**Val Feld:** Under what Standing Order? My understanding was that when we raise a point of order we have to say to which Standing Order it is related.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is true. I received earlier notification of these points of order from the Leader of the Opposition and the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives.

ydych naill ai am gael cynghorwyr arbennig neu beidio. Pan fyddwn yn eu hysbysebu yn y ffordd fwyaf onest ac agored, penderfynwch nad ydych yn ei hoffi. Dyna pam fy mod yn dweud mai pigo beiau ydyw, beirmiadaeth ddifeddwl er mwyn barnu. Mae gan Weithrediaeth Senedd yr Alban, sydd yn cynnwys dwy blaid, ddwy set o gynghorwyr arbennig hefyd, ond nis penodwyd hwy yn y fath fodd. Yr ydym yn penodi ein cynghorwyr ar sail rhinwedd ac mewn ffordd agored. Ni wnaethpwyd hyn o'r blaen a chredaf o bryd i'w gilydd y dylech ystyried rhoi clod lle y bo'n ddyledus.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth gennyf fod angen cynghorwyr arbennig ar y Cabinet. Mae ganddo bedwar eisoes, felly pam na wnaiff rannu'r rhai a benodwyd ganddo eisoes yn hytrach na chyflgio mwy?

**David Davies:** Gwyddom fod y Llywodraeth mewn trafferth pan ddechreu roi gwersi hanes inni yn lle ateb ein pwyntiau. Gofynnir i drethdalwyr Cymru wario dros £70,000 y flwyddyn ar ddau feistr sbin i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Os nad ydynt yn gweithio i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gadewch iddynt roi cyngor inni a Phlaid Cymru ar faterion polisi. Gofynnir inni ariannu eu meistri sbin yn ymgyrch etholiadol arfaethedig San Steffan, sydd yn gwbl warthus.

**Val Feld:** Yr wyf yn amau a yw hyn bellach yn ddadl ar bwynt o drefn. Ymddengys i mi—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hwn yn bwynt o drefn a godwyd gan Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid—

**Val Feld:** O dan ba Reol Sefydlog? Yr oeddwn ar ddeall wrth godi pwynt o drefn fod yn rhaid inni nodi â pha Reol Sefydlog y mae'n gysylltiedig.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hynny'n wir. Derbyniais hysbysiad cynharach o'r pwyntiau o drefn hyn gan Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid ac Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

You have another point of order tabled on which I will call you soon.

Yr ydych wedi cyflwyno pwynt arall o drefn y galwaf chi arno yn fuan.

**Val Feld:** This is on a different matter.

**Val Feld:** Mae hyn yn ymwneud â mater gwahanol.

**The Presiding Officer:** I think that we have exercised ourselves sufficiently on this point of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf ein bod wedi trafod digon ar y pwynt o drefn hwn.

**David Melding:** Further to the point of order, there is an important principle here. These special advisers are not special advisers to the Assembly, as civil servants are. If they were, they would be able to advise all Members. Clearly they are special advisers to the Executive, which is perfectly entitled to such advisers. That is a precedent that is accepted by all political parties. However, these posts should be advertised as special advisers to the Executive. Members of the Assembly would not then have been seen to increase the number of special advisers from one to five. There are reasons for doing that, and you can make a case for it, but we have not had such a debate. It was not our decision, it was the Executive's decision; we accept the Executive has the right to make policy decisions.

**David Melding:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn, mae egwyddor bwysig yma. Nid cynghorwyr arbennig i'r Cynulliad yw'r cynghorwyr arbennig hyn, fel sydd yn wir am weision sifil. Pe baent, byddent yn gallu cynghori pob Aelod. Yn amlwg maent yn gynghorwyr arbennig i'r Weithrediaeth, ac y mae ganddi hawl i gynghorwyr o'r fath. Mae hynny'n sefyllfa arbennig a dderbynnir gan bob plaid wleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, dylid hysbysebu'r swyddi hyn fel cynghorwyr arbennig i'r Weithrediaeth. Yna nid ystyrid fod aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi cynyddu nifer y cynghorwyr arbennig o un i bump. Mae rhesymau dros wneud hynny, a gallwch gyflwyno achos dros hynny, ond ni chynhaliwyd dadl o'r fath gennym. Nid ein penderfyniad ni ydoedd, ond penderfyniad y Weithrediaeth; derbyniwn fod gan y Weithrediaeth hawl i wneud penderfyniadau polisi.

**The First Minister:** Further to that point of order; a more reasonable, or reasoned version of the point of order. I accept that there are people who do not like civil service positions being advertised under the heading of the National Assembly for Wales, whether they are special advisers or regular, established, permanent civil service positions. This relates to a problem with devolution: how do you distinguish the governmental or Executive branch of the Assembly from the parliamentary branch that we constitute in the Chamber? I am quite happy to accept a request from any party or group—it could be part of the review of the Assembly's procedures—to discuss how we advertise posts in the civil service. However, from day one of the Assembly we have advertised for civil servants under the heading of the National Assembly for Wales. That confuses people as to the parliamentary and the

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn; fersiwn mwy rhesymol, neu resymoledig o'r pwynt o drefn. Derbyniad fod pobl nad ydynt yn hoffi gweld swyddi o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil yn cael eu hysbysebu o dan bennawd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, boed yn gynghorwyr arbennig neu'n swyddi rheolaidd, sefydledig, parhaol o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil. Mae hynny'n ymwneud â phroblem â datganoli: sut gallwch wahaniaethu rhwng cangen lywodraethol neu Weithrediaeth y Cynulliad a'r gangen seneddol sydd gennym yn y Siambr? Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod derbyn cais gan unrhyw blaid neu grŵp—gallai fod yn rhan o'r arolwg o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad—i drafod sut y dylid hysbysebu swyddi o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil. Fodd bynnag, o sefydlu'r Cynulliad yr ydym wedi hysbysebu am weision sifil o dan bennawd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae hynny'n drysu

governmental sides. Perhaps this raises a particular point when it relates to special advisers, but I do not think that you would expect us to suddenly change the way advertisements for civil servants are placed in the press, on this one occasion, for the special advisers that are being recruited in a clean and above-board way. This breaks new ground within the British political system when it is compared to anything undertaken by the Westminster Government, the Scottish Parliament or the Northern Ireland Assembly.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am not keen to prolong this matter, but I call Rod Richards on this point of order.

**Rod Richards:** Further to that point of order, the First Minister placed a great emphasis on the fact that these people will be employed as civil servants. Does that mean, therefore, that there will be a selection board similar to a civil service selection board, without any politicians on that board deciding on who these legal advisers will be?

**The First Minister:** You will remember—I think that you are the only ex-special adviser here—that when you were appointed by David Hunt, the process that led to your appointment was fairly personal and partly political. I do not think that there was any board or advertisement. You can probably confirm that. That is the way it was done. When, a few weeks later, you were selected as a parliamentary candidate, you had to drop out. That was the rule. Those rules are still in place for special advisers.

We are trying to move to a merit-based procedure, first with the Labour advisers, and then likewise with the Liberal Democrat ones. It still involves a party-political component that is standard for special advisers. However, we are bringing in as much of a standard, merit-based civil service selection procedure as is possible and compatible with a special adviser. I hope that you will accept that it is a big improvement

pobl o ran yr ochr seneddol a'r ochr lywodraethol. Efallai fod hyn yn codi pwynt penodol pan fydd yn ymwneud â chynghorwyr arbennig, ond ni chredaf y byddech yn disgwyl inni newid y ffordd y cyflwynir hysbysebion am weision sifil yn y wasg yn sydyn, ar yr un achlysur hwn, am y cynghorwyr arbennig sydd yn cael eu recriwtio mewn ffordd onest ac agored. Mae hyn yn torri tir newydd o fewn system wleidyddol Prydain o'i gymharu ag unrhyw beth a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, Senedd yr Alban neu Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid wyf yn awyddus i ymestyn y mater hwn ymhellach, ond galwaf ar Rod Richards ar y pwynt hwn o drefn.

**Rod Richards:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, rhoddodd y Prif Weinidog bwyslais mawr ar y ffaith y cyflogir y bobl hyn fel gweision sifil. A olyga hynny, felly, y bydd bwrdd dethol tebyg i fwrdd dethol y gwasanaeth sifil, heb unrhyw wleidyddion ar y bwrdd hwnnw yn penderfynu ar bwy fydd y cynghorwyr cyfreithiol hyn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fe gofiwch—credaf mai chi yw'r unig gyn-gynghorydd arbennig yma—pan gawsoch eich penodi gan David Hunt, mai proses gymharol bersonol a rhannol wleidyddol oedd y broses a arweiniodd at eich penodiad. Ni chredaf y bu unrhyw fwrdd neu hysbyseb. Mae'n siŵr y gallwch gadarnhau hynny. Dyna'r ffordd y'i gwnaethpwyd. Ychydig wythnosau yn ddiweddarach, pan gawsoch eich dethol fel ymgeisydd seneddol, bu'n rhaid ichi dynnu yn ôl. Dyna oedd y rheol. Mae'r rheolau hynny yn dal mewn grym ar gyfer cynghorwyr arbennig.

Yr ydym yn ceisio symud i weithdrefn yn seiliedig ar rinwedd, gyda'r cynghorwyr Llafur yn gyntaf, ac yna yn yr un modd gyda chynghorwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'n cynnwys elfen bleidiol o hyd a hynny'n safonol ar gyfer cynghorwyr arbennig. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cyflwyno gweithdrefn dethol i'r gwasanaeth sifil sydd mor safonol ac wedi'i seilio gymaint ar rinweddau â phosibl ac sydd yn addas ar

on the method of your appointment.

gyfer cynghorwyr arbennig. Gobeithiaf y derbyniwch bod hyn yn welliant mawr ar y dull a ddefnyddiwyd i'ch penodi chi.

10:45 a.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Cynog Dafis fydd yr Aelod olaf i wneud sylwadau ar y pwynt hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Cynog Dafis will be the last Member to comment on this point.

**Cynog Dafis:** Croesawaf y ffaith fod hyn yn agored. Dyna pam y mae'n bosibl inni gael y drafodaeth bwysig hon. Fy nealltwriaeth i am gynghorwyr arbennig yw eu bod yn gynghorwyr i Weinidogion. Nodir yma eu bod yn cael eu penodi i Weinidogion yn rhinwedd y ffaith eu bod yn perthyn i blaid wleidyddol. Hoffwn gael barn ynghylch priodoldeb hynny.

**Cynog Dafis:** I welcome the fact that this is open. That is what has made this important discussion possible. My understanding of special advisers is that they are advisers to Ministers. It is noted here that they are appointed to Ministers due to the fact that they are linked to a political party. I would like a ruling on the appropriateness of that.

Yr agwedd arall sydd yn ymddangos yn gwbl newydd yw swyddogaeth briffio Aelodau Cynulliad a swyddogion y blaid. Golyga hynny fynd y tu allan i Aelodau Cynulliad y blaid hyd yn oed. Mae hynny'n ddefnydd gwahanol i'r hyn a wyddwn i amdani. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chynghorwyr arbennig megis Huw Roberts, a oedd yn gweithio yn y Swyddfa Gymreig i Ron Davies, ac yr oedd ef yn ymgynghori ac yn siarad â phobl o bob plaid. Ond yr hyn sydd gennym yma yw *capacity* ychwanegol ar gyfer Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae angen inni gael archwiliad o hynny.

The other aspect that appears to be completely new is the task of briefing Assembly Members and party officials. That means going beyond the party's Assembly Members even. That is a different usage to that which I know about. I have spoken to special advisers such as Huw Roberts, who worked in the Welsh Office for Ron Davies, and he consulted and spoke to people from all parties. However, what we have here is an additional capacity for the Liberal Democrat Party. We need an examination of this.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd eich sylwadau yn gwbl afresymol. Os ydych yn barod i wirio eich ffeithiau, byddech yn darganfod—yr wyf yn hapus i gael fy nghywiro os ydwyf yn anghywir—fod y swydd-ddisgrifiad yn yr hysbyseb yn safonol. Bu bob amser yn rhan o ddyletswyddau cynghorwyr arbennig—dyna sydd yn eu gwneud yn wahanol i weision sifil arferol—eu bod yn gysylltiedig â phlaid wleidyddol ac yn mynd i'r gynhadledd flynyddol ac i gyfarfodydd eraill y blaid. Dyna sydd yn gwneud y swydd yn wahanol i un gwas sifil arferol. Os yw'r swydd-ddisgrifiad mor anarferol, yr wyf yn barod i ystyried y mater. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu y byddwch yn darganfod hynny os gwiriwch eich ffeithiau.

**The First Minister:** Your comments were totally unreasonable. If you are prepared to check your facts, you will find—I am happy to be corrected if I am wrong—that the job description in the advertisement is standard. It has always been part of the duties of special advisers—that is what makes them different from ordinary civil servants—that they are linked to a political party and attend the annual conference and other party meetings. That is what makes the job different from that of an ordinary civil servant. If the job description is so unusual, I am prepared to consider the matter. However, if you check your facts, I do not think that you will find it to be so.

**Y Llywydd:** Mewn perthynas â materion sydd yn berthnasol i Swyddfa'r Llywydd, byddwn yn edrych eto ar unrhyw oblygiadau ynghylch cyllid i bleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad, gan fod y mater hwn o dan Ddeddf ddiweddar ar wariant pleidiau gwleidyddol, yn berthnasol i'r Cynulliad ac yn cael ei weinyddu, drwy ymgynghoriad, gan Bwyllgor y Tŷ. Mae'n fater hefyd o gyngor gan y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch.

**The Presiding Officer:** In relation to matters relevant to the Office of the Presiding Officer, we will again consider any implications regarding funding for political parties in the Assembly as this matter, under a recent Act on the expenditure of political parties, is relevant to the Assembly and is administered, through consultation, by the House Committee. Advice should also be sought from the Senior Salaries Review Body.

O ran enwau a disgrifiadau swyddi, a'r pennawd 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol' o'i gyferbynu â 'Gweithrediaeth', 'Llywodraeth' a 'Gweinyddiaeth', dyma'r trydydd tro i'r cwestiwn hwn godi mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Trefnydd am yr hyn a ddywedodd ddoe ar ran y Prif Weinidog, ac am yr hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog heddiw ar y mater. Dylai hwn fod yn fater i'r adolygiad a gorau po gyntaf ein bod yn gosod trefn ar yr hyn yr ydym yn galw ein hunain, fel o leiaf bod hynny'n glir.

With regard to job titles and descriptions, and the heading 'National Assembly' as opposed to 'Executive', 'Government' and 'Administration', this is the third time that this question has arisen in Plenary. I am grateful to the Minister for Assembly Business for what he said yesterday on behalf of the First Minister, and for what the First Minister said today on the matter. This should be a mater for the review and the sooner we sort out what we call ourselves the better, so that that, at least, is clear.

**David Davies** *rose—*

**David Davies** *a gododd—*

**The Presiding Officer:** This is not on this point of order, surely, otherwise it will be a constitutional debate. I call you on a fresh and totally unrelated point of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Siawns nad yw hyn yn ymwneud â'r pwynt hwn o drefn, neu fe ddaw'n ddadl gyfansoddiadol. Galwch arnoch ar bwynt o drefn newydd, digyswllt.

**David Davies:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 7.8 (iv). On Tuesday, during questions, an Assembly Member was heard to make a discourteous remark about another Assembly Member while he was speaking. I will be the first to admit that it is easy to get carried away in the heat of debate. I must hold up my hand to this myself on occasions. Nevertheless, a line must be drawn somewhere and I am sure that you will agree that if this matter is not resolved amicably, other Members may follow that example.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.8 (iv). Ddydd Mawrth, yn ystod y cwestiynau, clywyd un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gwneud sylw anghwrtais am Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad tra yr oedd yn siarad. Byddwn gyda'r cyntaf i gyfaddef ei bod yn hawdd colli rheolaeth yng nghanol berw dadl. Rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod yn gwneud hynny fy hun yn achlysurol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid tynnu llinell yn rhywle ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch oni ddatrysir y mater hwn yn gyfeillgar, y gallai Aelodau eraill ddilyn yr enghraifft honno.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have always drawn the attention of Members to the guidance on our activities in the Chamber and on the need for courtesy at all times, both in listening to speeches and also in intervening or seeking to intervene and contributing. I have checked the Record. No disorderly remarks appear in

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf bob amser wedi tynnu sylw Aelodau at yr arweiniad ar ein gweithgareddau yn y Siambr ac ar yr angen i fod yn gwrtais bob amser, wrth wrando ar areithiau a hefyd wrth dorri ar draws neu geisio torri ar draws a chyfrannu. Edrychais ar y Cofnod. Nid ymddengys unrhyw

the Record. Clearly, I would have stopped them. However, I have noticed an increase in sedentary remarks by Members. There may be some going on now for all I know. I ask Members to ensure that we do not resort to that worst of Westminster practices of making remarks that are not in order.

As I have insisted several times in this Chamber, due to the systems that we have here, anything said by speakers must be called by the Presiding Officer or Deputy Presiding Officer so that what is said is on the record, is heard and therefore can be translated, so that no remarks are said in one language, that is in Welsh, that may not be understood by all Members. I would deplore that. Neither is it appropriate to make remarks in the English language that are not suitable for the record or not in order, which may or may not have been made in the past. So I ask that we return to the courtesies of those rules. Thank you, David, for raising that point and for the courteous manner in which you raised it.

**Val Feld:** Point of order. Earlier this morning, you may have detected my concern—expressed from a sedentary position, I admit—when you called David Melding for a second time in the questioning of Jane Hutt’s statement. I have been looking at Standing Orders. Standing Order No. 6 makes reference to Assembly Ministers’ statements but gives no guidance on the conduct of that business. Standing Order No. 7, which refers to order in Plenaries, lays out rules of debate and Standing Orders Nos. 7.4 to 7.7 prohibit Members from speaking more than once, unless they are responding to a motion.

I am concerned that we are making increasing use of statements. We have just seen a whole range of important issues for the Assembly, relating to how we operate, raised under a point of order. I would have liked to contribute to that debate about how we appoint special advisers. I am the person who, in the first instance, pushed Rhodri to advertise those positions. However, this issue was dealt with under a point of order, for

sylwadau anhrefnus yn y Cofnod. Yn amlwg, byddwn wedi rhoi terfyn arnynt. Fodd bynnag, sylwais ar gynnydd o ran sylwadau gan Aelodau sydd yn eistedd. Efallai fod rhywfaint yn digwydd yn awr hyd y gwn i. Gofynnaf i Aelodau sicrhau na ddilynwn arferion gwaethaf San Steffan a gwneud sylwadau allan o drefn.

Fel y mynnais sawl gwaith yn y Siambr hon, oherwydd y systemau sydd gennym, rhaid i unrhyw beth a ddywedir gan siaradwyr gael ei alw gan y Llywydd neu’r Dirprwy Lywydd er mwyn i’r hyn a ddywedir gael ei gofnodi, ei glywed ac felly ei gyfieithu, fel na wneir sylwadau mewn un iaith, hynny yw yn Gymraeg, na ellir eu deall gan bob Aelod. Byddwn yn gresynu at hynny. Nid yw’n briodol ychwaith i wneud sylwadau yn Saesneg nad ydynt yn addas i’r cofnod neu sydd allan o drefn, p’un a’u gwnaethpwyd yn y gorffennol ai peidio. Felly gofynnaf am ddychwelyd at gwrteisi’r rheolau hynny. Diolch, David, am godi’r pwynt hwnnw ac am y ffordd gwrtais y’i codwyd gennych.

**Val Feld:** Pwynt o drefn. Yn gynharach y bore yma, efallai ichi sylwi ar fy mhryder—a fynegwyd o’m heistedd, cyfaddefaf—pan galwoch David Melding am yr ail waith wrth ofyn cwestiynau yn dilyn datganiad Jane Hutt. Bùm yn edrych ar y Rheolau Sefydlog. Cyfeiria Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6 at ddatganiadau gan Weinidogion y Cynulliad ond ni rydd unrhyw arweiniad o ran cynnal y busnes hwnnw. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7, sydd yn cyfeirio at drefn mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, yn nodi rheolau dadlau ac mae Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 7.4 i 7.7 yn gwahardd Aelodau rhag siarad fwy nag unwaith, oni fyddant yn ymateb i gynnig.

Yr wyf yn pryderu ein bod yn gwneud defnydd cynyddol o ddatganiadau. Yr ydym newydd weld amrywiaeth cyfan o faterion pwysig i’r Cynulliad, yn ymwneud â’n ffordd o weithredu, yn cael eu codi o dan bwynt o drefn. Byddwn wedi hoffi cyfrannu at y ddatl honno am sut i benodi cynghorwyr arbennig. Fi oedd y person a anogodd Rhodri, yn gyntaf, i hysbysebu’r swyddi hynny. Fodd bynnag, deliwyd â’r mater hwn



which there are no rules to allow us to engage in debate.

Will you take advice or rule about whether Standing Order No. 7.17 applies in the case of statements and points of order and, if it is your view that it does not, do you agree that it is a matter for urgent attention by the review? We need rules of debate when responding to statements and points of order.

I respect your position, but I am concerned that we have set precedents, whereby a Presiding Officer may call members to speak at his or her discretion. Where statements and points of order become a means of engaging with and opening out issues, the fact that there are no rules for debate, as there are for debates and motions, inhibits those of us who wish to contribute, as we do not know how to do so.

**David Melding:** Further to that point of order, I commend Val Feld for the detail and thoughtfulness of her point of order. I agree that Cabinet statements should be used sparingly, and I believe that they should refer to general principles of policy. The difficulty I had with the Minister's statement this morning, was that she went into considerable detail. It is difficult to scrutinise such detail if you are only allowed to ask one question. I hope that, in the review, we will consider how this Assembly deals with points of detail, such as the crucial details in relation to care standards. At the moment, we are not using existing mechanisms to their full force. The Legislation Committee could have referred this, at the Minister's request, to the Health and Social Services Committee for it to consider these detailed standards, and I would then have been allowed several responses from the Minister in Committee and to ask probing points in questioning at the committee stage. That is how we should work. However, the Executive is bringing many statements to the Assembly at the moment, and many Members have misgivings about that.

o dan bwynt o drefn, lle nad oes unrhyw reolau i ganiatáu inni gynnal dadl.

A gymerwch gyngor neu wneud dyfarniad ynghylch a yw Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.17 yn berthnasol yn achos datganiadau a phwyntiau o drefn ac, os credwch nad yw'n berthnasol, a gytunwch ei fod yn fater y dylai'r arolwg roi sylw brys iddo? Mae angen rheolau dadlau arnom wrth ymateb i ddatganiadau a phwyntiau o drefn.

Parchaf eich safbwynt, ond yr wyf yn pryderu ein bod wedi gosod cyseiliau, lle y gall Llywydd alw ar aelodau i siarad yn ôl ei ddisgresiwn. Lle daw datganiadau a phwyntiau o drefn yn gyfrwng o drafod ac ymhelaethu ar faterion, mae'r ffaith nad oes unrhyw reolau ar gyfer dadlau, fel sydd ar gael ar gyfer dadleuon a chynigion, yn cyfyngu'r rheini yn ein plith sydd am gyfrannu, gan na wyddom sut i wneud hynny.

**David Melding:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cymeradwyaf Val Feld am fanylder a natur feddylgar ei phwynt o drefn. Cytunaf na ddylid gwneud defnydd mawr o ddatganiadau Cabinet, a chredaf y dylent gyfeirio at egwyddorion polisi cyffredinol. Yr anhawster a gefais gyda datganiad y Gweinidog y bore yma oedd iddi fanylu gymaint. Mae'n anodd mynd i'r afael â manylion o'r fath drwy ofyn un cwestiwn yn unig. Gobeithiaf, yn yr arolwg, y byddwn yn ystyried sut dylai'r Cynulliad hwn ddelio â manylion, megis y manylion hanfodol mewn perthynas â safonau gofal. Ar hyn o bryd, nid ydym yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y mecanweithiau sydd yn bodoli eisoes. Gallai'r Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth, ar gais y Gweinidog, fod wedi cyfeirio'r mater i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ystyried y safonau manwl hyn, ac yna byddai sawl ymateb wedi'u caniatáu gan y Gweinidog yn y Pwyllgor a byddai cyfle wedi bod i holi pwyntiau treiddgar yn ystod trafodaethau'r pwyllgor. Dyna sut y dylem weithio. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Weithrediaeth yn dod â llawer o ddatganiadau i'r Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd, ac mae llawer o'r Aelodau yn pryderu am hynny.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Further to that point of order, we may need to look at the use of statements. However, I refute the allegation, which has been made more than once, that the Cabinet is making statements on its own initiative. Most of the statements made since the Assembly came into being have been in response to urgent questions. I have made that point. That is on record several times. Nevertheless, it is worthwhile for us, perhaps as part of the review of Assembly procedures, to consider this.

10:55 a.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Val Feld for raising this point, and I would like an opportunity to discuss it further with her. However, we have had an early discussion on these matters. I am happy for this matter to be discussed by the Business Committee, acting as procedure committee, and for it to give advice to the Minister for Assembly Business and myself on these matters and for this also to be a matter for the review.

On the general point, as regards Standing Order No. 7, speaking more than once refers to speeches. There is a difference between debates, statements, and questions on statements, and question time, that is, supplementaries asked to Assembly questions. The issue always for me is allowing Members to speak and ensuring that Members are called in a balanced way. That has changed in the course of the change in Government, in that my Deputy and I call Members of the Government and the opposition alternately.

On the question of second supplementary questions, I believe that this is the second or third time—I will have to check the record—that I have allowed second supplementary questions on statements to be asked by Members who are neither the Leader of the Opposition nor the Leader of the Conservatives. That is not unusual, even in Westminster, where I was trained. It happens when Members express a clear, strong view to return to a subject, and when they feel that a matter has not been sufficiently dealt with. On statements, it is often the case that

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, efallai y bydd angen inni ystyried y defnydd o ddatganiadau. Fodd bynnag, gwrthodaf yr honiad, a wnaethpwyd fwy nag unwaith, bod y Cabinet yn gwneud datganiadau ar ei liwt ei hun. Bu'r rhan fwyaf o'r datganiadau a wnaethpwyd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad mewn ymateb i gwestiynau brys. Nodais y pwynt hwnnw. Mae hynny ar gofnod sawl gwaith. Serch hynny, mae'n werthfawr inni, efallai fel rhan o'r arolwg o weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, ystyried hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Val Feld am godi'r pwynt hwn, a hoffwn gael cyfle i'w drafod ymhellach gyda hi. Fodd bynnag, cynhaliom drafodaeth gynnar ar y materion hyn. Yr wyf yn fodlon i'r mater hwn gael ei drafod gan y Pwyllgor Busnes, gan weithredu fel pwyllgor gweithdrefn, ac iddo roi cyngor i'r Trefnydd a minnau ar y materion hyn a hefyd i'r mater hwn gael ei gynnwys yn yr arolwg.

O ran y pwynt cyffredinol sydd yn ymwneud â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7, mae siarad mwy nag unwaith yn cyfeirio at areithiau. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng dadleuon, datganiadau, a chwestiynau ar ddatganiadau, ac amser cwestiynau, hynny yw, cwestiynau a ofynnir yn ychwanegol at gwestiynau'r Cynulliad. Fy nyletswydd i bob amser yw caniatáu i Aelodau siarad a sicrhau y'u gelwir mewn ffordd gytbwys. Mae hynny wedi newid yn sgîl newid Llywodraeth, ac erbyn hyn y mae fy Nirprwy a minnau yn galw ar Aelodau o'r Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid am yn ail.

O ran ail gwestiynau ategol, credaf mai dyma'r ail neu'r trydydd tro—bydd yn rhaid imi edrych ar y cofnod—imi ganiatáu i Aelodau heblaw am Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid neu Arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr ofyn ail gwestiynau ategol ar ddatganiadau. Nid yw hynny'n anarferol, hyd yn oed yn San Steffan, lle y'm hyfforddwyd. Digwydd hyn pan fydd Aelodau yn mynegi safbwynt clir, cryf i ddychwelyd at bwnc, a phan deimlant na ddeliwyd yn ddigonol â mater. O ran datganiadau, bydd Aelodau yn aml yn dychwelyd at fater, pan deimlant eu bod am

Members will return to an issue, when they feel that they wish to pursue it. That allows opportunity for scrutiny. I would be loathe to accept any precedent that said that there shall be no further supplementaries asked by Members on statements.

As to the making of statements, I must take some responsibility for the frequency of statements in the Assembly. I take the view that it is important that statements should be made publicly, so that Members can scrutinise them. They should not be matters for governmental press releases, as they often are in other places. Statements should be made to the Chamber whenever possible. That provides the opportunity for Ministers to come under scrutiny. Statements often mean more strenuous scrutiny of Ministers than debates do.

I ask Members, when they make points on these matters, to remember that we are all equal. We all need to have our views expressed. I am in the position of trying to ensure fair and balanced opportunities for Members to contribute. This may be taken further in the review or in private discussion, but I do not think that we should take it further today. I do not believe that we have any more points of order. Sorry, we do, from the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives. He is always a good one for a point of order.

**Nick Bourne:** I will try not to disappoint you. This relates to the transfer of questions between Ministers, which has been dealt with already, up to a point. However, I raise that again as the late notification of transfer that we had this morning did not just result in Alun Pugh not asking his question, but also meant that those who wished to ask supplementaries, did not get a chance to do so. Although my question was lower down the list, I also received notification this morning that my question had been transferred for answer by the Minister for Health and Social Services. I make the plea that we need to be told in good time if a question is being transferred. The whole Assembly should be notified because other Members are preparing for the meeting on

ymhelaethu arno. Mae hynny'n caniatáu cyfle i'w ystyried. Byddwn yn gyndyn i dderbyn unrhyw gysail yn datgan na chaiff unrhyw gwestiynau ategol pellach eu gofyn gan Aelodau ar ddatganiadau.

O ran gwneud datganiadau, rhaid imi dderbyn rhywfaint o gyfrifoldeb am amllder datganiadau yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf o'r farn ei bod yn bwysig i ddatganiadau gael eu gwneud yn gyhoeddus, fel y gall Aelodau eu hystyried. Ni ddylent fod yn faterion ar gyfer datganiadau llywodraethol i'r wasg, fel sydd yn digwydd yn aml mewn lleoedd eraill. Dylid gwneud datganiadau i'r Siambr lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl. Rhydd hynny'r cyfle i Weinidogion gael eu holi. Yn aml caiff Gweinidogion eu holi'n fwy trylwyr yn sgîl datganiadau na dadleuon.

Gofynnaf i Aelodau, wrth iddynt gyflwyno pwyntiau ar y materion hyn, gofio ein bod oll yn gydradd. Mae angen i bob un ohonom fynegi ein safbwyntiau. Yr wyf yn y sefyllfa o geisio sicrhau cyfleoedd teg a chytbwys i bob Aelod gyfrannu. Gellid datblygu hyn ymhellach yn yr arolwg neu mewn trafodaethau preifat, ond ni chredaf y dylid ymhelathu arno heddiw. Ni chredaf fod gennym unrhyw bwyntiau eraill o drefn. Ymddiheuraf, oes, gan Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Gellir bob amser ddibynnu arno am bwynt o drefn.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymdrechaf i beidio â'ch siomi. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo cwestiynau rhwng Gweinidogion, y deliwyd ag ef eisoes, i raddau. Fodd bynnag, codaf hynny eto gan mai nid unig ganlyniad yr hysbysiad trosglwyddo hwyr y bore yma oedd na ofynnodd Alun Pugh ei gwestiwn, ond hefyd ni roddwyd cyfle i'r rheini a oedd am ofyn cwestiynau ategol i wneud hynny. Er bod fy nghwestiwn yn is ar y rhestr, derbyniais innau hefyd hysbysiad y bore yma yn nodi y trosglwyddwyd fy nghwestiwn i gael ateb gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gofynnaf inni gael gwybod mewn da bryd os caiff cwestiwn ei drosglwyddo. Dylid hysbysu'r Cynulliad cyfan gan fod Aelodau eraill yn paratoi ar gyfer y cyfarfod ar y sail y gallent

the basis that they may want to ask fod am ofyn cwestiynau ategol.  
supplementaries.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to the Leader of the Welsh Conservatives for that point. He should have made it earlier, but I accept that we were moving on quickly to other matters at the time.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru am y pwynt hwnnw. Fe ddylai fod wedi'i gyflwyno yn gynt, ond derbyniaf ein bod wedi symud i faterion eraill yn gyflym ar y pryd.

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol) Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

#### **Taliadau Uniongyrchol i Ysgolion Direct Payment to Schools**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 4, 5 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 2, 3, 6 and 7 in the names of Andrew Davies and Kirsty Williams.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 4, 5 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 2, 3, 6 a 7 yn enwau Andrew Davies a Kirsty Williams.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose that

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf fod

*this National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn yn:*

*1. regrets the Labour/Liberal Democrat administration's intention not to continue with direct payments to primary and secondary schools in the financial year 2001-02 and calls on the administration to reverse this decision;*

*1. gresynu at fwriad y weinyddiaeth Lafur/Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i beidio â pharhau â thaliadau uniongyrchol i ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2001-02 ac mae'n galw ar y weinyddiaeth i wrthdroi'r penderfyniad hwn;*

*2. notes that a typical English primary school will receive additional direct payments of at least £20,000 and an English secondary school at least £60,000 in 2001-02;*

*2. nodi y bydd ysgol gynradd nodweddiadol yn Lloegr yn derbyn taliadau uniongyrchol ychwanegol o o leiaf £20,000 ac ysgolion uwchradd yn Lloegr o leiaf £60,000 yn 2001-02;*

*3. agrees that the 'funding fog' that results from the huge variation in per pupil spending between Welsh local authorities is wholly unacceptable to parents and teachers, and thus;*

*3. cytuno bod y 'niwl cyllido' sy'n deillio o'r amrywiaeth enfawr yn yr arian sy'n cael ei wario y pen ar ddisgyblion gan awdurdodau lleol Cymru yn gwbl annerbyniol i rieni ac athrawon, ac felly;*

*4. resolves to support proposals to identify separately within the standard spending assessment formula schools' delegated budgets and other local education authority expenditure.*

*4. yn penderfynu cefnogi cynigion i nodi ar wahân o fewn fformwla'r asesiad gwariant safonol gyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion a gwariant arall yr awdurdodau lleol ar addysg.*

We have tabled this debate this morning as a result of the work that I have been doing, as

Cyflwynasom y ddadl hon y bore yma o ganlyniad i'r gwaith a wneuthum, fel

the education spokesman for the Conservative Party, in meeting teachers, headteachers, governors and parents. Several concerns have been raised, during the two years that I have been in post, about the manner in which education in Wales is funded. Recently, and especially in the last year, there has been confusion in the schools sector and it has reached a new peak. The so-called funding fog seems to have thickened. Members may be aware of that from their postbags. When I reflect on the work that has been conducted in Committee and the working relationship that I have had with teaching unions and headteachers across Wales, there appears to be a problem. It is time for the administration to address the concerns that have been raised.

The amendments before us do little to advance the debate, with the exception of Plaid Cymru's amendments 4 and 8, which we will support. Those amendments appear to want to revisit the Assembly's budget debates. Although I am sure that that is well intentioned, that is not the sole or core purpose of this debate. This debate is about how we spend money on education. The question of how much we spend is valid, but separate.

The Liberal Democrat and Labour amendments are typically cowardly. They attempt to dodge the main issue behind today's debate, which is about cutting through the funding fog. Their amendments indicate that they are in denial about the magnitude of the problem and they propose no solutions to address it. The Conservative group asks the Assembly to reject all amendments in the names of Andrew Davies and Kirsty Williams.

When I meet headteachers and governors across Wales, they complain that they do not get enough of the money allocated to education by the Assembly. In many cases, we see nice increases in the total amount of money given to the education sector, but headteachers and governors complain that they cannot get their hands on sufficient amounts of that money to spend in their

llefarydd y Blaid Geidwadol ar addysg, yn cyfarfod ag athrawon, penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr a rhieni. Codwyd nifer o bryderon, yn ystod y ddwy flynedd y bûm yn y swydd, ynghylch y dull yr ariennir addysg yng Nghymru. Yn ddiweddar, ac yn enwedig yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, cafwyd dryswch yn y sector ysgolion a chyrhaeddodd benllanw newydd. Ymddengys bod y niwl cyllido, fel y'i gelwir, wedi dwysáu. Efallai bod Aelodau yn ymwybodol o hynny o'r llythyrau a dderbyniant. Pan ystyriaf y gwaith a wnaethpwyd yn y pwyllgor a'r berthynas waith a gefais ag undebau athrawon a phenaethiaid ysgolion ledled Cymru, ymddengys bod problem. Mae'n bryd i'r weinyddiaeth roi sylw i'r pryderon a godwyd.

Ychydig a wna'r gwelliannau ger ein bron i wthio'r ddadl yn ei blaen, ac eithrio gwelliannau 4 ac 8 Plaid Cymru, a gefnogwn. Ymddengys bod y gwelliannau hynny am ailedrych ar ddadleuon y Cynulliad ar y gyllideb. Er fy mod yn sicr bod y bwriad yn dda, nid dyma unig bwrpas neu bwrpas craidd y ddadl hon. Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â sut y gwariwn arian ar addysg. Mae'r cwestiwn o faint a wariwn yn ddilys, ond yn gwestiwn ar wahân.

Mae gwelliannau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur yn nodweddiadol o llwfr. Ceisiant osgoi'r prif fater y tu ôl i ddadl heddiw, sydd yn ymwneud â thorri drwy'r niwl cyllido. Dengys eu gwelliannau eu bod yn gwrthod derbyn maint y broblem ac ni chynigiant atebion i ymdrin â hi. Gofynna'r grŵp Ceidwadol i'r Cynulliad wrthod yr holl welliannau yn enwau Andrew Davies a Kirsty Williams.

Pan gyfarfyddaf â phenaethiaid a llywodraethwyr ledled Cymru, cwynant na chânt ddigon o'r arian a ddyrennir i addysg gan y Cynulliad. Mewn llawer o achosion, gwelwn gynnydd braf yng nghyfanswm yr arian a roddir i'r sector addysg, ond cwyna penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr na allant gael eu dwylo ar symiau digonol o'r arian hwnnw i wario yn eu hysgolion. Dywedant y cedwir

schools. They say that too much is being kept back by local councils or spent on things other than education.

You do not have to take my word, and I would not expect you to do so. You should ask the Secondary Heads Association or the National Association of Headteachers. Those unions have led the debate on school funding and the funding fog problems. The National Union of Teachers coined that well-known phrase, and that is what teaching unions and teachers are complaining about. They have no way of telling how much money their school should be receiving. They look at neighbouring schools in other local authorities, which are perhaps only a couple of miles away, and see that they receive considerably more for providing the same service. When they contact their local council, they are given nonsense about historical factors or other reasons.

One of the more extraordinary arguments presented was e-mailed to all Members on Tuesday by the Welsh Local Government Association, as a briefing for this debate. I publicly thank whoever sent that brief because it encapsulates the sort of attitude with which headteachers and teachers have had to put up. The brief stated that,

‘any suggestion that spending levels and [pupil] results are linked is a facile argument’.

I had to re-read that startling statement when I first saw it. Is the WLGA saying that there is no relationship between pupil performance and the level of school funding? Is it saying that, if you halved or doubled a school’s budget, there would be no impact on pupil performance? That was an astounding suggestion and I invite the Minister to say whether she agrees with it.

If it is true, the welcome increase in funds that the Assembly is putting into education will not make the slightest difference to pupil results. I am sure that the Auditor General for Wales would have something to say about that. Ironically, the WLGA is the first organisation to argue that the extra resources

gormod yn ôl gan gynghorau lleol neu y gwerir ar bethau eraill ar wahân i addysg.

Nid oes rhaid i chi gymryd fy ngair, ac ni fyddwn yn disgwyl i chi wneud hynny. Dylech ofyn i Gymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd neu Gymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon. Arweiniodd yr undebau hynny y ddadl ar gyllido ysgolion a phroblemau’r niwl cyllido. Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon fathodd y geiriau cyfarwydd hynny, ac am hynny y mae athrawon a’u hundebau yn cwyno. Nid oes ganddynt unrhyw ffordd o ddweud faint o arian y dylai eu hysgol dderbyn. Edrychant ar ysgolion cyfagos mewn awdurdodau lleol eraill, sydd o bosibl ond ychydig filltiroedd i ffwrdd, a gwelant eu bod yn derbyn cryn dipyn yn fwy am ddarparu’r un gwasanaeth. Pan gysylltant â’u cyngor lleol, yr hyn a gânt yw nonsens am ffactorau hanesyddol neu resymau eraill.

Anfonodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru e-bost at yr holl Aelodau ddydd Mawrth ynglŷn ag un o’r dadleuon mwyaf anhygoel a gyflwynwyd, fel briff ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Hoffwn ddiolch yn gyhoeddus i bwy bynnag a anfonodd y briff hwnnw oherwydd mae’n crynhoi’r math o agwedd y bu’n rhaid i benaethiaid ac athrawon eu dioddef. Yn ôl y briff,

Bu’n rhaid imi ailddarllen y datganiad syfrdanol hwnnw pan welais ef gyntaf. A ddywed CLILC nad oes unrhyw berthynas rhwng perfformiad disgyblion a lefel ariannu ysgolion? A ddywed na fyddai unrhyw effaith ar berfformiad disgyblion pe baech yn hanneru neu’n dyblu cyllideb ysgol? Yr oedd hwnnw’n awgrym syfrdanol a gwahoddaf y Gweinidog i ddweud a yw’n cytuno ag ef ai peidio.

Os yw’n wir, ni wna’r cynnydd derbyniol mewn arian y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei roi i addysg damaid o wahaniaeth i ganlyniadau disgyblion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru rywbeth i’w ddweud am hynny. Yn eironig, CLILC yw’r sefydliad cyntaf i ddadlau y dylid yn lle

that the Assembly wants to give to schools should, instead, be channelled through local authorities.

I firmly believe that parents and taxpayers in Wales want to see their hard-earned money directed to schools and not absorbed in local authorities. We have seen what I would term a local education authority Bermuda triangle. Parents and teachers cannot see why the middleman should take a slice other than to provide essential services, such as special needs and pupil support.

If anyone were to take a cursory glance at the latest education spending figures, they would be astounded by the diversions in spending per pupil and the levels of delegation between local authorities in Wales. One council in Wales keeps a quarter of its education budget for central services, but another gives nearly 85 per cent of its budget to schools. The spending-per-pupil situation is just as varied. For example, a primary school pupil in Denbighshire is worth £1,660, while a pupil in Ceredigion is worth £2,420. Why? Can this honestly be put down to miscellaneous factors?

11:05 a.m.

At present, there is no way for a parent or teacher to know what a council should be spending on its school. In other words, there is no standard spending assessment for what could be devolved to school budgets. This means we have no way of knowing if a council is truly underspending on education. That is an unacceptable state of affairs. I know that the Minister may come up with the figure that local education authorities only spend a fraction of their budget on central bureaucracy. However, my point is not that there are tens of thousands of bureaucrats staffing LEA's across Wales, but that there are wide divergences that cannot be put down to factors such as social disadvantage and rurality. The Minister and the Executive know that that is the case. Will the Minister tell us why the amount spent on central bureaucracy has increased by nearly nine per

hynny sianelu'r adnoddau ychwanegol y dymuna'r Cynulliad eu rhoi i ysgolion drwy awdurdodau lleol.

Credaf yn gryf fod rhieni a threthdalwyr yng Nghymru am weld yr arian y gweithiasant mor galed amdano yn cael ei gyfeirio i ysgolion ac nid yn cael ei lyncu gan awdurdodau lleol. Gwelsom yr hyn y byddwn yn ei alw'n driongl Bermiwda awdurdodau addysg lleol. Ni all rhieni ac athrawon weld pam y dylai'r dyn yn y canol gymryd cyfran ac eithrio i ddarparu gwasanaethau hanfodol, fel anghenion arbennig a chefnogaeth disgyblion.

Pe bai unrhyw un yn cymryd cipolwg bras ar y ffigurau gwariant diweddaraf mewn addysg, fe synnent o weld yr amrywiadau mewn gwariant fesul disgybl a lefelau dirprwyo rhwng awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Mae un cyngor yng Nghymru yn cadw chwarter ei gyllideb addysg ar gyfer gwasanaethau canolog, ond mae un arall yn rhoi bron 85 y cant o'i gyllideb i ysgolion. Mae'r sefyllfa gwariant fesul disgybl hefyd yr un mor amrywiol. Er enghraifft, mae disgybl ysgol gynradd yn Sir Ddinbych werth £1,660, tra bod disgybl yng Ngheredigion werth £2,420. Pam? A ellir mewn difrif priodoli hyn i ffactorau amrywiol?

Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gan riant nac athro unrhyw ffordd o wybod beth ddylai cyngor fod yn ei wario ar ei ysgol. Mewn geiriau eraill, nid oes asesiad gwariant safonol o'r hyn y gellid ei ddatganoli i gyllidebau ysgolion. Golyga hyn nad oes gennym unrhyw ffordd o wybod a yw cyngor mewn gwirionedd yn tanwario ar addysg. Mae hynny yn sefyllfa annerbyniol. Gwn efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi ffigur a ddengys mai dim ond ffraciwn o'u cyllideb y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wario ar fiwrocratiaeth ganolog. Fodd bynnag, nid fy mhwynt yw bod degau o filoedd o fiwrocratiaid yn gweithio mewn AALI ledled Cymru, ond bod gwahaniaethau eang na ellir eu priodoli i ffactorau fel anfantais gymdeithasol a natur wledig. Gŵyr y Gweinidog a'r Weithrediaeth fod hynny'n wir. A ddywed y Gweinidog wrthym pam y

cent this year when the amount delegated to schools on a per pupil basis has only gone up by about 7 per cent? Why does Merthyr Tydfil spend £84 per pupil on central bureaucracy while Conwy gets away with £35? There are good reasons why some councils must spend more. We admit that, but the gap is too big to ignore.

There is a case to answer, but the Minister is unwilling to act. The Assembly deserves to know whether it is a lack of vision or blind loyalty to the former employers at the Welsh Local Government Association. The Minister knows what she can do to improve the situation. However, one of the answers is contained in her own Cabinet's consultation paper issued last September. It states that the Assembly could issue clear benchmarks through a standard spending assessment for the level of delegated schools budgets. If we did that, we would be able to tell the LEA's what they should be spending and the local electorate and the Assembly could decide if these levels are acceptable. I have no problem with local choice and local democracy. However, this must be conducted on an informed basis. I have no problem with taking into account factors such as rurality and social disadvantage. However, I do not like some LEA's using these factors as an excuse to continue underspending.

The other answer the Minister may have given was also clear. She could help clear the funding fog by continuing and extending what the administration has done this year, but something that the Minister proposed to end next year. That is to give money via special grants as we have been doing and welcoming this year. Until November, it seemed that the Executive was going to take this direct payment route one step further. In March 2000, the Finance Minister announced that she was going to allocate between £3,000 and £9,000 to each primary school and between £30,000 and £50,000 to each secondary school in Wales. Headteachers rightly rejoiced. That proposal was one of the

cynyddodd y swm a wariwyd ar fiwrocratiaeth ganolog bron naw y cant eleni pan mai dim ond tua 7 y cant y cododd y swm a ddirprwywyd i ysgolion fesul disgybl? Pam bod Merthyr Tudful yn gwario £84 y disgybl ar fiwrocratiaeth ganolog tra bod Conwy ond yn gwario £35? Mae rhesymau da pam bod yn rhaid i rai cynghorau wario mwy. Cyfaddefwn hynny, ond mae'r bwch yn rhy fawr i'w anwybyddu.

Mae achos i'w ateb, ond mae'r Gweinidog yn amharod i weithredu. Mae'r Cynulliad yn haeddu gwybod ai diffyg gweledigaeth yw hyn neu deyrngarwch dall i gyn gyflogwyr yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Gŵyr y Gweinidog beth y gall ei wneud i wella'r sefyllfa. Fodd bynnag, mae un o'r atebion wedi'i gynnwys ym mhapur ymgynghorol ei Chabinet ei hun a gyhoeddwyd fis Medi diwethaf. Noda y gallai'r Cynulliad gyhoeddi meincnodau clir drwy asesiad gwariant safonol ar gyfer lefel cyllidebau ysgolion dirprwyedig. Pe baem yn gwneud hynny, gallem ddweud wrth yr AALL faint y dylent fod yn ei wario a gallai'r etholaeth leol a'r Cynulliad benderfynu a yw'r lefelau hyn yn dderbyniol. Nid oes gennyf broblem ynglŷn â dewis lleol a democratiaeth leol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cynnal hyn ar sail hyddysg. Nid oes gennyf broblem ynglŷn ag ystyried ffactorau fel natur wledig ac anfantais gymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, ni hoffaf weld rhai AALL yn defnyddio'r ffactorau hyn fel esgus i barhau i danwario.

Yr oedd yr ateb arall a roddodd y Gweinidog o bosibl hefyd yn eglur. Gallai helpu i glirio'r niwl cyllido drwy barhau ac ymestyn yr hyn a wnaeth y weinyddiaeth eleni, ond rhywbeth y cynigiodd y Gweinidog ei derfynu y flwyddyn nesaf. Hynny yw, rhoi arian drwy grantiau arbennig fel y gwnaethom ac fel y bu i ni ei groesawu eleni. Tan fis Tachwedd, ymddangosai fod y Weithrediaeth yn mynd i gymryd y llwybr taliadau uniongyrchol hwn un cam ymhellach. Ym Mawrth 2000, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Gyllid ei bod yn mynd i ddyrannu rhwng £3,000 a £9,000 i bob ysgol gynradd a rhwng £30,000 a £50,000 i bob ysgol uwchradd yng Nghymru. Yr oedd



most popular proposals by an administration of any political colour. We welcomed it and it pointed towards a brave new world for education funding in Wales. I am afraid it all went wrong. Whereas the previous Secretary for education was content to give money to schools, the new Minister prefers to give it to councils. She announced that although secondary schools in England would receive an increase in direct payments in 2000-01, all such payments would cease in Wales. Jeff Jones and Russell Goodway were ecstatic, but the Secondary Heads Association was furious. The Minister must decide her priorities. Is she going to be a champion for Labour's local council barons, or is she going to be a real Minister for Welsh schools? In case we receive the old canard about decisions made in Wales for Wales, let us remember that it was this Assembly, proposed by this Executive, that called for these direct payments. Let us not forget that it was passed unanimously by the Assembly on 16 May without a single dissenter.

In May, the Executive was in favour of direct payment, but we know that it is against them. Edwina Hart said, when proposing these direct payments on 12 April, that she had

'every confidence that governing bodies, teachers and headteachers in schools will ensure that this money is wisely spent'.

I agree, and what is more, that has proved to be the case.

The Liberal Democrats, as usual, are no better. Peter Black, now the Deputy Minister for Local Government said on the same day,

'we welcome paying money directly to schools'.

penaethiaid yn llawenhau, a hynny'n haeddiannol. Y cynnig hwnnw oedd un o'r cynigion mwyaf poblogaidd gan weinyddiaeth o unrhyw liw gwleidyddol. Yr oeddem yn ei groesawu a chyfeiriai at fyd newydd o ran ariannu addysg yng Nghymru. Mae arnaf ofn i'r cyfan fynd o chwith. Er bod yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg blaenorol yn hapus i roi arian i ysgolion, mae'n well gan y Gweinidog newydd ei roi i'r cynghorau. Cyhoeddodd er y byddai ysgolion uwchradd yn Lloegr yn derbyn cynnydd mewn taliadau uniongyrchol yn 2000-01, y byddai pob taliad o'r fath yn dod i ben yng Nghymru. Yr oedd Jeff Jones a Russell Goodway yn eu seithfed nef, ond yr oedd Cymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd yn gandryll. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog benderfynu ar ei blaenoriaethau. A yw'n bwriadu cefnogi barwniaid Llafur y cynghorau lleol, neu a yw'n mynd i fod yn Weiniidog gwirioneddol dros ysgolion Cymru? Rhag ofn inni gael yr un hen chwedl wag am benderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru dros Gymru, gadewch inni gofio mai'r Cynulliad hwn, a gynigiwyd gan y Weithrediaeth hon, a alwodd am y taliadau uniongyrchol hyn. Gadewch inni gofio y'u pasiwyd yn unfrydol gan y Cynulliad ar 16 Mai heb unrhyw anghydsynio.

Ym Mai, yr oedd y Weithrediaeth o blaid taliad uniongyrchol, ond gwyddom ei bod yn eu herbyn. Dywedodd Edwina Hart, wrth gynnig y taliadau uniongyrchol hyn ar 12 Ebrill, fod ganddi

'bob hyder y bydd cyrff llywodraethol, athrawon a phenaethiaid mewn ysgolion yn sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwn ei wario'n ddoeth'.

Cytunaf, ac yn fwy na hynny, profodd yn wir.

Nid yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn ôl eu harfer, damaid gwell. Dywedodd Peter Black, sydd bellach yn Ddirprwy Weiniidog dros Lywodraeth Leol, ar yr un diwrnod, eu bod

'yn croesawu talu arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion'.

A month later, when the special grant report was debated, Jenny Randerson, who now sits comfortably in this Cabinet said,

'I welcome the fact that the money is going straight to schools. I did a survey of every school in my constituency. They replied unanimously that they wanted to get their hands directly on the money....There is a great deal to be said for an additional amount of money that schools can spend as they wish'.

I could not agree more. However, it seems that the Liberals have not only sold out their supporters by joining this coalition, but they have sold out their principles as well. How can you say one thing before entering the administration, and then support a stack of wrecking amendments which support another, completely different, principle? The Liberal Democrats have a few questions to answer.

Where does this leave the National Assembly? It leaves us with an education minister who sees it as her task to represent Labour local government rather than to look after our schools, and Liberal Democrats who would rather sell their granny for a couple of seats in the Cabinet.

In closing, we need a fresh start, so that parents can see transparent funding; so that headteachers can spend education money as they see fit not as you see fit. This is a vision for our education system, and I challenge the Labour administration and their partners, the Liberal Democrats, in this debate. Find a vision for Wales that teachers and parents will share. Find a vision for Welsh education and find a vision for spending money wisely, because at the moment you are not doing the job.

**Cynog Dafis:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Cynigiaf welliant 1. Dileu cymal 1.

Fis yn ddiweddarach, pan gafwyd dadl ar yr adroddiad grant arbennig, dywedodd Jenny Randerson, sydd bellach yn eistedd yn gyfforddus yn y Cabinet hwn,

'Croesawaf y ffaith bod yr arian yn mynd yn syth i'r ysgolion. Gwneuthum arolwg o bob ysgol yn fy etholaeth. Atebasant yn unfryd eu bod yn dymuno cael gafael yn uniongyrchol ar yr arian.... Mae llawer iawn i'w ddweud dros swm ychwanegol o arian y gall ysgolion ei wario'n ôl eu dymuniad'.

Ni allwn gytuno'n fwy. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys bod y Rhyddfrydwyr nid yn unig wedi bradychu eu cefnogwyr drwy ymuno â'r glymblaid hon, ond aethant yn groes i'w hegwyddorion hefyd. Sut y gallwch ddweud un peth cyn ymuno â'r weinyddiaeth, ac yna cefnogi llwyth o welliannau dinistriol a gefnoga egwyddor arall, hollol wahanol? Mae gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ychydig o gwestiynau i'w hateb.

Ble mae hyn yn gadael y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Fe'n gadewir â gweinidog dros addysg sydd yn ystyried ei gorchwyl fel cynrychioli llywodraeth leol Lafur yn hytrach na gofalu am ein hysgolion, a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y byddai'n well ganddynt werthu eu nain am ychydig seddau yn y Cabinet.

I gloi, mae angen dechrau o'r newydd, fel y gall rhieni weld cyllido clir; fel y gall penaethiaid wario arian addysg fel y gwelant yn dda ac nid fel y gwelwch chi yn dda. Dyma weledigaeth ar gyfer ein system addysg, a heriaf y weinyddiaeth Lafur a'u partneriaid, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn y ddadl hon. Ceisiwch ddod o hyd i weledigaeth ar gyfer Cymru y gall athrawon a rhieni ei rhannu. Ceisiwch ddod o hyd i weledigaeth ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru a dod o hyd i weledigaeth ar gyfer gwario arian yn ddoeth, oherwydd ar hyn o bryd nid ydych yn gwneud y gwaith.

**Cynog Dafis:** I propose the amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. I propose amendment 1. Delete clause 1.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd cymal 2:

*nodi â phryder y bydd y cynnydd yn y gwariant ar addysg dros y tair blynedd nesaf yn is o lawer yng Nghymru na Lloegr, a bydd hyn yn gwaethgu'r anfantais bresennol o ran yr arian sy'n cael ei wario y pen ar ddisgyblion yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â Lloegr, Yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon.*

I propose amendment 4. Add at end of clause 2:

*notes with concern that the increase in expenditure on education over the next three years in Wales will be significantly lower than in England, and that this will compound an existing disadvantage in funding levels per pupil in Wales as compared to England, Scotland and Northern Ireland.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Dileu cymalau 3 a 4 ac ychwanegu cymal newydd:

*yn cydnabod bod ffactorau amrywiol yn cyfrannu at y 'niwl cyllido' sydd yn golygu nad oes dealltwriaeth glir o'r sefyllfa ariannol, ac mae hyn yn achosi rhwystredigaeth ac anfodlonrwydd ymysg ysgolion, llywodraethwyr a staff.*

I propose amendment 5. Delete clauses 3 and 4 and add new clause:

*recognises that various factors contribute to a 'funding fog', which makes a proper understanding of the financial situation problematic, thus causing frustration and dissatisfaction among schools, governors and staff.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu cymal newydd ar y diwedd:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddarparu data cynhwysfawr a gwrthrychol, fel bod dealltwriaeth glir o'r lefelau a'r patrymau cyllid yng Nghymru a'r cymariaethau rhwng Cymru a gwledydd eraill y DU.*

I propose amendment 8. Add new final clause:

*calls upon the Government of Wales to provide comprehensive and objective data so that a clear understanding is possible of funding levels and patterns in Wales and of comparisons between Wales and the other countries of the UK.*

Diolchaf i Geidwadwyr Cymru am ddewis y pwnc pwysig hwn ar gyfer eu dadl plaid leiafrifol, ond fel y dangosir gan ein gwelliannau ni, yr ydym o'r farn bod eu hargymhellion polisi ar gyfeiliorn. Mae'r ddadl yn rhoi cyfle i ni drafod tri chwestiwn o bwys mawr, sef yr angen am fwy o lawer o eglurder ynglŷn â faint o arian sydd yn cael ei wario ar addysg ysgol, a beth yn union sy'n digwydd i'r arian; a ddylid cyllido ysgolion yn uniongyrchol o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, naill ai yn gyfan gwbl neu ar rai adegau neilltuol; a'r lefel o wariant ar addysg ysgol, ac a yw'n ddigonol? Yn wahanol i Jonathan Morgan, yr wyf yn teimlo bod y pwynt hwn yn berthnasol oherwydd ei fod wrth wraidd llawer o'r anfodlonrwydd yr ydym yn dod ar ei draws mewn ysgolion y dyddiau hyn.

I thank the Welsh Conservatives for choosing this important topic for their minority party debate, but as is shown by our amendments, we believe that their policy recommendations are misguided. The debate gives us an opportunity to discuss three very important questions, the need for much more clarity regarding the amount of money spent on school education, and what exactly happens to the money; should schools be financed directly by the National Assembly, either entirely or at specific times; and the level of expenditure on school education, and is it adequate? Unlike Jonathan Morgan, I feel that this point is relevant as it is central to much of the dissatisfaction we find in schools these days.

Byddaf yn delio â'r cwestiynau hynny yn eu tro. Mae teimlad cyffredinol a chryf fod yr

I will deal with those questions in turn. There is a strong and general feeling that what is

hyn sy'n cael ei alw'n 'niwl cyllido' yn ei gwneud yn anodd i ysgolion, llywodraethwyr a rhieni wybod a ydynt yn cael rhan deg o'r arian sy'n cael ei glustnodi ar gyfer addysg. Mae hynny'n creu drwgdybiaeth a drwgdeimlad tuag at awdurdodau addysg lleol a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n rhaid gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hynny. Byddai o gymorth pe bai David Blunkett yn rhoi'r gorau i siarad ac ymddwyn fel pe bai penderfynu ar flaenoriaethau gwario yng Nghymru yn fater iddo ef. Mae Ofsted, mae'n debyg, yn feirniadol o'r dryswch sydd yn cael ei achosi yn Lloegr gan yr holl symiau mân a mawr sydd yn cael eu gwasgaru ar wahanol adegau i gyfeiriad ysgolion at wahanol ddibenion ac yn arbennig i greu ffotogyfleoedd a datganiadau i'r wasg i Weinidogion. Pe baem yn datrys y broblem honno, byddem yn cael rhan o'r ateb.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cymeradwyo argymhellad y Comisiwn Archwilio y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyhoeddi blociau gwahanol yr asesiad gwariant safonol. Byddai hynny yn galluogi ysgolion i weld pa gyfran o'r gyllideb genedlaethol ar gyfer addysg sydd yn cyrraedd eu siroedd arbennig hwy, ac yna'n cyrraedd yr ysgolion unigol.

Ynglŷn â'r ail gwestiwn, nid yw hyn yn golygu y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfarwyddo awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â'r ffordd i rannu eu cyllidebau. Nid ydym o blaid pridiannu. Byddai hynny'n tanseilio ymhellach ddilysrwydd democrataidd awdurdodau lleol, a'u gallu i ymateb i ofynion lleol. Nid yw'r Ceidwadwyr o blaid cadw awdurdodau addysg lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae Plaid Cymru am weld eu rôl a'u hymreolaeth yn cael eu cryfhau. Mae cwestiwn pwysig yn codi ynglŷn â'r amrywiaeth mawr mewn lefelau gwariant ar addysg rhwng y gwahanol siroedd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The UK Conservative Party and the Welsh Conservatives are in favour of retaining local education authorities, but our proposal is to severely reduce the role of LEAs. More accountability

called 'funding fog' makes it difficult for schools, governors and parents to know if they receive a fair share of the money earmarked for education. This causes suspicion and bad feeling towards local education authorities and the National Assembly. Something must be done about it. It would help if David Blunkett stopped talking and acting as if decisions on funding priorities for Wales were a matter for him. It seems that Ofsted is critical of the confusion caused in England by all the different amounts of money thrown at schools at different times for different purposes, especially to create photo-opportunities and press statements for Ministers. If we solved that problem, we would find a partial solution.

Plaid Cymru supports the Audit Commission's recommendation that the National Assembly should publish the different blocks of the standard spending assessment. This would enable schools to see what percentage of the national budget for education reaches their counties, and their schools.

On the second question, this does not mean that the National Assembly should direct local authorities regarding the way they divide their budgets. We are not in favour of hypothecation. That would further undermine the democratic validity of local authorities, and their ability to respond to local requirements. The Conservatives are not in favour of retaining local education authorities. However, Plaid Cymru wish to see their role and autonomy strengthened. This begs an important question regarding the great diversity in terms of levels of expenditure on education in different counties.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae Plaid Geidwadol y DU a Cheidwadwyr Cymru o blaid cadw awdurdodau addysg lleol, ond ein cynnig yw lleihau rolau yr AALl yn sylweddol. Byddai penaeithiaid yn cael mwy o atebolrwydd wrth

in decision making would be given to headteachers, but there would be a certain level of agreed services with the LEAs, so they would be retained, but not in their present form.

**Cynog Dafis:** Asiantaethau addysg lleol fyddai'r rheini yn hytrach nag awdurdodau addysg lleol. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth. Mae cwstiwn pwysig ynglŷn â'r amrywiaeth mewn lefelau gwariant ar addysg rhwng y gwahanol siroedd, ond yr hyn sydd ei angen eto yw eglurder ynglŷn â'r rhesymau dros yr amrywiaeth. Hefyd, fel y dywed y Comisiwn Archwilio, yn hytrach na chynyddu targedau i ddirprwyo cyllidebau ymhellach, dylai'r Llywodraeth egluro disgwyliadau awdurdodau addysg lleol. Dyna pam ein bod yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliannau 6 a 7 yn enw Andrew Davies a Kirsty Williams.

11:15 a.m.

Dyma droi at y trydydd pwynt a'r pwysicaf. Dengys y dystiolaeth yn glir fod lefel cyllido i ysgolion yng Nghymru yn ddifrifol o annigonol.

Mae'r ddogfen 'Cyllido'r Gwasanaeth Addysg yng Nghymru', a gafodd ei chyhoeddi tua blwyddyn yn ôl gan yr undebau athrawon, Llywodraethwyr Cymru a fforwm addysg gogledd-orllewin Cymru, yn dangos sut y lleihaodd lefel gwariant ar addysg yng Nghymru mewn cymhariaeth â Lloegr ers 1994-95. Digwyddodd hynny o dan y Torïaid, wrth gwrs.

Erbyn 1996-97, yr oedd gwariant y pen yn y sector cynradd yng Nghymru £71 yn is nag yn Lloegr a £121 yn is yn y sector uwchradd. Mae'r gwahaniaeth â'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn gannoedd o bunnoedd nid yn ddegau.

Pan ymrwymodd y Llywodraeth Lafur newydd i fuddsoddi £19 biliwn yn ychwanegol mewn addysg a hyfforddiant rhwng 1997 a 2000, dim ond £844 miliwn, sef 4.4 y cant a wariwyd yng Nghymru, sydd llawer yn llai na chyfran gyfatebol.

Mewn erthygl ddiweddar yn y cylchgrawn

wneud penderfyniadau, ond byddai lefel benodol o wasanaethau cytûn â'r AALI, felly byddent yn cael eu cadw, ond nid ar eu ffurf bresennol.

**Cynog Dafis:** That would mean local education agencies rather than local education authorities. That is the difference. There is an important question about the diversity in expenditure levels on education from county to county, but once again, what is needed is clarity regarding the reason for that diversity. Also, as the Audit Commission says, rather than increasing targets for the further delegation of budgets, the Government should explain what is expected of local education authorities. That is why we are willing to support amendments 6 and 7 in the names of Andrew Davies and Kirsty Williams.

I turn to the third and most important point. The evidence clearly shows that the level of funding for schools in Wales is seriously inadequate.

The document 'Funding the Education Service in Wales', which was published about a year ago by the teachers' unions, Governors Wales and the north-west Wales education forum, shows how the level of expenditure on education in Wales has decreased compared with England since 1994-95. That happened under the Tories, of course.

By 1996-97, expenditure per head in the primary sector in Wales was £71 less than in England and £121 less in the secondary sector. The difference with Scotland and Northern Ireland is hundreds not tens of pounds.

When the new Labour Government committed itself to investing an extra £19 billion in education and training between 1997 and 2000, only £844 million, 4.4 per cent was spent in Wales, which is much less than a proportionate percentage.

In a recent article in the magazine, *Agenda*,

*Agenda*, mae David Reynolds yn rhestru rhai o'r rhesymau pam y mae darparu addysg yng Nghymru'n ddrutach nag yn Lloegr. Dywed

'Pan ddown ni at faint sydd ar gael i ysgolion i wario ar lyfrau, cyfarpar, deunyddiau dysgu ac ati, mae'n debygol nad yw Cymru ddim ond yn gwario ffraciwn o'r hyn a werir yn Lloegr.'

Pa ryfedd bod athrawon yn ysgolion y Gororau yn cenfigennu at allu gwario eu cymrodr dros y ffin. Mae hynny'n amlwg os ydych yn ymweld ag ysgolion megis y Trallwng yn Sir Drefaldwyn.

Gwaethygu ac nid gwella fydd y gymhariaeth dros y tair blynedd nesaf. O dan yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, bydd y gyllideb addysg a hyfforddiant yn codi 2 y cant yn fwy yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru. Bydd cynnydd Cymru ychydig dros hanner yr hyn a fydd yn Lloegr. Pe bai codiad cyfartal, byddai hynny'n golygu £80 miliwn yn rhagor dros y tair blynedd nesaf, tua £26 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd. Byddai hynny'n gwneud gwahaniaeth, er na fyddai ond yn mynd rhan o'r ffordd i gau'r bwlch. Byddai'n golygu na fyddai o leiaf ddau awdurdod lleol yn fy etholaeth i—Sir Gâr a Phowys—yn rhybuddio ysgolion eu bod yn wynebu toriadau yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Dyna pam yr wyf yn synnu i weld enw Kirsty Williams wrth welliant 3, sydd fel petai yn cymeradwyo'r syniad bod Cymru'n cael bargaen deg ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'n bryd inni gael undod yn y Cynulliad hwn, fel sydd yn bodoli ar draws y wlad, gan fod yn rhaid cywiro'r camwri hwn. Yr ydym yn gwybod beth sydd yn ei achosi, anghyfiawnder fformwla Barnett a'r ffaith ein bod yn gorfod cyllido cymaint o raglenni'r cronfeydd Ewropeaidd ar draul ein cyllidebau craidd, gan gynnwys addysg ysgol. Nid apologia dros Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig sydd eisiau arnom, ond undod i ymgyrchu dros chwarae teg i Gymru. Yn niffyg yr undod hwnnw, bydd Plaid Cymru'n arwain yr ymgyrch honno, yn benodol, dros y tri mis nesaf, wrth inni agosáu at ryw ddigwyddiad gwleidyddol pwysig y ceir sôn amdano ond nad ydym i

David Reynolds lists some of the reasons why educational provision in Wales is more expensive than in England. He says

'When we come to how much is available for schools to spend on books, equipment, teaching materials and so on, it is likely that Wales spends only a fraction of what is spent in England.'

It is no wonder that teachers in schools in the Welsh Marches are envious of the spending power of their colleagues across the border. That is obvious if you visit schools such as Welshpool in Montgomeryshire.

The comparison will worsen, not improve over the next three years. Under the comprehensive spending review, the education and training budget will increase by 2 per cent more in England than in Wales. Wales's increase will be a little over half of what it will be in England. If there was an equal increase, that would mean an extra £80 million over the next three years, about £26 million per annum on average. That would make a difference, although it would only go part of the way to closing the gap. It would mean that at least two local authorities in my constituency—Carmarthenshire and Powys—would not have to warn schools that they are facing cuts during the forthcoming financial year. That is why I am surprised to see that Kirsty Williams tabled amendment 3, which seems to support the idea that Wales currently gets a fair deal.

It is time that we had unity in this Assembly, as is the case throughout the country, because this injustice must be remedied. We know what causes it, the injustice of the Barnett formula and the fact that we have to fund so many European funding programmes at the expense of our core budgets, including school education. We do not need an apologia for the United Kingdom Government, but we need unity to campaign for fair play for Wales. In the absence of that unity, Plaid Cymru will lead that campaign, particularly, over the next three months, as we approach some important political event, which is mentioned, but to which we are not supposed to refer in this Assembly.

fod i gyfeirio ato yn y Cynulliad hwn.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose amendments 2, 3, 6 and 7 in the name of Andrew Davies and Kirsty Williams.

I propose amendment 2. Delete clause 1 and replace with:

*1. welcomes the Labour-Liberal Democrat Partnership Government's proposals to allocate extra money to local authorities over the next three years in order to:*

*reduce class sizes;  
fund training grants for new primary school teachers;  
invest in the upgrade of school buildings;  
re-introduce free school milk for all pupils at key stage 1.*

I propose amendment 3. Delete clause 2 and replace with:

*2. notes that, in 2000-01, provisional figures show that schools in England outside the London area received an average of £2,840 per pupil, compared with £2,870 per pupil in Wales.*

I propose amendment 6. Delete clause 3 and replace with:

*3. welcomes the work being undertaken by the National Assembly and the Welsh Local Government Association to examine and address the issue of the wide variation in per pupil funding between Welsh authorities.*

I propose amendment 7. Delete clause 4 and replace with:

*4. welcomes the focus on improved outcomes based on shared priorities, being introduced by policy agreements between local authorities and the National Assembly.*

Thank you, Jonathan, for bringing this

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau welliannau 2, 3, 6 a 7 yn enwau Andrew Davies a Kirsty Williams.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Dileu cymal 1 a rhoi yn ei le:

*1. yn croesawu cynigion Llywodraeth Partneriaeth Llafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ddyrannu arian ychwanegol i'r awdurdodau lleol dros y tair blynedd nesaf er mwyn:*

*lleihau maint dosbarthiadau;  
ariannu grantiau hyfforddi ar gyfer athrawon cynradd newydd;  
buddsoddi mewn uwchraddio adeiladau ysgol;  
ail-gyflwyno llaeth ysgol yn rhad ac am ddim i'r disgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 1.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Dileu cymal 2 a rhoi yn ei le:

*2. yn nodi bod y ffigurau dros dro ar gyfer 2000-01 yn dangos bod ysgolion yn Lloegr, y tu allan i ardal Llundain, wedi derbyn £2,840 y disgybl ar gyfartaledd, o'i gymharu â £2,870 y disgybl yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Dileu cymal 3 a rhoi yn ei le:

*3. yn croesawu'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, i archwilio a delio â'r amrywiaeth eang yn yr arian sy'n cael ei wario y pen ar ddisgyblion gan yr awdurdodau yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Dileu cymal 4 a rhoi yn ei le:

*4. yn croesawu'r canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau gwell yn seiliedig ar rannu blaenoriaethau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno gan gyntundebau polisi rhwng yr awdurdodau lleol a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.*

Diolch, Jonathan, am ddod â'r ddadl bwysig

important debate to the Assembly today. When one sees the passion that Jonathan and Cynog have brought to this debate, it shows how important it is to discuss education in Wales. I welcome the opportunity to have this debate. I also welcome the opportunity to address what are, from my perspective, misunderstandings and misrepresentations in the motion and in the speakers' contributions.

It is important to clarify at the outset that we reject the first clause of the motion simply because it is incorrect. Core funding for education in Wales has historically been delivered through local authorities and not by direct payment to schools. Jonathan, you referred specifically to £20.5 million going direct to schools last year. However, it did not. It went through local authorities, because we had no mechanism whereby we paid directly to schools. In such an important debate, we must be semantically correct. We did the same thing with the further special grant of £7.9 million before Christmas, that focused on raising standards and making sufficient money available to pay for school management teams. When we did that we set strict conditions for local authorities about how long it should take to get that money out to schools. For example, it was agreed on 19 December to allocate the money to local authorities at the beginning of January with an instruction that schools should receive the funds in the second half of the month.

We must remember that this is not a new policy. The policy of partnership with local government in Wales, where local decisions are made on the basis of local needs and local authorities determine their spend at a local level, was supported by the Conservative Government and has continued to be supported by the Labour Government. There has been no change in policy. We recognise that making additional money available to schools for specific purposes is welcomed by schools, as you have suggested, and it is beneficial to the Assembly in fulfilling its policy ambitions.

Sometimes we might choose to allocate extra

hon i'r Cynulliad heddiw. Pan welir yr angerdd a ddaeth Jonathan a Cynog ag ef i'r ddadl hon, dengys pa mor bwysig yw trafod addysg yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y cyfle i gael y ddadl hon. Croesawaf hefyd y cyfle i fynd i'r afael â'r hyn sydd, o'm safbwynt i, yn gamddealltwriaethau a chamliwiadau yn y cynnig ac yng nghyfraniadau'r siaradwyr.

Mae'n bwysig egluro ar y dechrau ein bod yn gwrthod cymal cyntaf y cynnig dim ond am ei fod yn anghywir. Yn hanesyddol cyflwynwyd cyllid craidd ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru drwy awdurdodau lleol ac nid drwy daliad uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Jonathan, cyfeiriasoch yn arbennig at £20.5 miliwn a aeth yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Aeth drwy'r awdurdodau lleol, oherwydd nid oedd gennym y mecanwaith i dalu'n uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Mewn dadl mor bwysig, rhaid inni fod yn gywir yn semantig. Gwnaethom yr un peth gyda'r grant arbennig ychwanegol o £7.9 miliwn cyn y Nadolig, a ganolbwyntiodd ar godi safonau a sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael i dalu am dimau rheoli ysgolion. Pan wnaethom hynny pennwyd telerau llym i awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â pha mor hir y dylai gymryd i ddosbarthu'r arian i ysgolion. Er enghraifft, cytunwyd ar 19 Rhagfyr i ddyrannu'r arian i awdurdodau lleol ddechrau Ionawr gyda chyfarwyddyd y dylai ysgolion dderbyn yr arian yn ail hanner y mis.

Rhaid inni gofio nad yw hwn yn bolisi newydd. Cefnogwyd y polisi partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, lle caiff penderfyniadau lleol eu gwneud ar sail anghenion lleol a lle penna awdurdodau lleol eu gwariant ar lefel leol, gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a pharhaodd y Llywodraeth Lafur i gefnogi hyn. Ni chafwyd newid yn y polisi. Sylweddolwn y bydd yn croesawu'r ffaith bod ysgolion i wneud arian ychwanegol ar gael i ysgolion at ddibenion penodol, fel yr awgrymasoch, ac mae'n fanteisiol i'r Cynulliad wrth wireddu ei ddyheadau o ran polisi.

Weithiau efallai y dewiswn ddyrannu arian



money to all schools in Wales in addition to the revenue support grant money, as we did last year with those two grants. Contrary to the motion and your assertion, I am on record saying that we have every intention of continuing such arrangements as appropriate and in discussion with our partners in the Welsh Local Government Association. Such approaches are not strategic. They do not take account of local needs, which is why we believe in local democracy and local education authorities rather than agencies for a small amount of spend. Therefore, we must use these approaches sparingly if our overall aim is to drive up standards of education and attainment the length and breadth of Wales. We have a long way to go to address the chronic underfunding that was the legacy of the last Government. I pay tribute to the overall spend on education in Wales by our local education authorities.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I take on board your views—I am sure that they are well-intentioned—about the role of local authorities but in terms of identifying local needs, are not headteachers and local school governors of schools best placed to determine what they are? I do not see why councillors need to determine local needs in the provision of education when headteachers and their staff are better placed to do so.

**Jane Davidson:** That is where we fundamentally disagree. I agree that headteachers are best placed to identify local needs, along with governing bodies and the members of their staff—I do not see headteachers as isolated from the rest of their staff—and that they are responsible for delivering the best possible education in individual schools. As an Assembly, we have a strategic responsibility to address some of the variations that you, and Cynog mentioned. We can only address those variations if we have a strategic approach. I pay tribute to the overall spend on education in Wales by our local education authorities.

The key fact is that school funding has increased ahead of inflation, year on year,

ychwanegol i'r holl ysgolion yng Nghymru yn ychwanegol at yr arian grant cynnal refeniw, fel y gwnaethom y llynedd gyda'r ddau grant hwnnw. Yn groes i'r cynnig a'ch honiad, cofnodwyd fy mod wedi dweud ein bod yn bwriadu parhau â threfniadau o'r fath fel y bo'n briodol ac mewn trafodaeth â'n partneriaid yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Nid yw ymagweddau o'r fath yn strategol. Nid ystyriant anghenion lleol, a dyma pam y credwn mewn democratiaeth leol ac awdurdodau addysg lleol yn hytrach nag asiantaethau ar gyfer swm bach o wariant. Felly, rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r ymagweddau hyn yn gynnil os mai ein nod cyffredinol yw codi safonau addysg a chyrraethiad ar hyd a lled Cymru. Mae ffordd hir i fynd cyn y gallwn ymdrin â'r tanwariant difrifol a etifeddasom gan y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwariant cyffredinol ar addysg yng Nghymru gan ein hawdurdodau addysg lleol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ystyriaf eich safbwyntiau—yr wyf yn siŵr bod iddynt fwriadau da—ynghŷn â rôl awdurdodau lleol ond o ran nodi anghenion lleol, onid penaethiaid ysgolion a llywodraethwyr ysgolion lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i benderfynu arnynt? Ni allaf weld pam bod angen i gynghorwyr benderfynu anghenion lleol wrth ddarparu addysg pan fo penaethiaid ysgolion a'u staff mewn gwell sefyllfa i wneud hynny.

**Jane Davidson:** Dyna lle yr anghytunwn yn sylfaenol. Cytunaf mai penaethiaid sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i nodi anghenion lleol, ynghyd â chyrrff llywodraethu ac aelodau o'u staff—nid ystyriaf fod penaethiaid ar wahân i weddill eu staff—a'u bod yn gyfrifol am ddarparu'r addysg orau bosibl mewn ysgolion unigol. Fel Cynulliad, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb strategol i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r amrywiadau a grybwyllasoch chi a Cynog. Dim ond os oes gennym ymagwedd strategol y gallwn roi sylw i'r amrywiadau hynny. Talaf deyrnged i'r gwariant cyffredinol ar addysg yng Nghymru gan ein hawdurdodau addysg lleol.

Y ffaith allweddol yw y cynyddodd cyllid ysgolion yn fwy na chwyddiant, fesul

since 1997 after years of underinvestment. The mechanism for funding has stayed the same, the amounts have not. In terms of information about resources staying at the centre in local authorities, on average 1.8 per cent is used to deliver central services. That is a good and welcome figure. What is not so welcome is that Merthyr spends £84 and Conwy spends £36. We need to look at those variations in spend so that we can look at how local authorities run those services.

blwyddyn, ers 1997, ar ôl blynyddoedd o danfuddsoddi. Parhaodd y mecanwaith ar gyfer cyllido yr un fath, ond nid y symiau. O safbwynt gwybodaeth am adnoddau yn parhau yn y canol mewn awdurdodau lleol, ar gyfartaledd defnyddir 1.8 y cant i gyflwyno gwasanaethau canolog. Mae hwnnw'n ffigur da a derbyniol. Yr hyn nad yw mor dderbyniol yw bod Merthyr yn gwario £84 a Chonwy yn gwario £36. Mae angen inni edrych ar yr amrywiadau hynny mewn gwariant fel y gallwn edrych ar y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn rhedeg y gwasanaethau hynny.

We will embark on the best value monitoring arrangements this year. I can assure you that I will keep a close eye on these issues. In its recent report, 'Money Matters: school funding and resource management', the Audit Commission confirmed that mainstream funding for schools should be channelled through local authorities. Since 1997, LEAs in Wales have invested money over and above the Government allocation and that is to be welcomed. Provision increased by £50 million in 1998-99, LEAs increased budgets by £60 million and delegated school budgets increased by £48 million. In 1999-2000 the increase was £70.2 million, LEAs increased their budgets by £73 million and delegated budgets increased by £56 million. This year, provision increased by £91 million, LEAs increased their budgets by £92 million and schools delegated budgets, with new areas of delegation, rose by £100 million.

Cychwynnwn ar y trefniadau monitro gwerth gorau eleni. Gallaf eich sicrhau y cadwaf lygad manwl ar y materion hyn. Yn ei adroddiad diweddar, 'Money Matters: school funding and resource management', cadarnhaodd y Comisiwn Archwilio y dylid sianelu cyllid prif ffrwd i ysgolion drwy awdurdodau lleol. Ers 1997, buddsoddodd AALl yng Nghymru arian yn ychwanegol at ddyraniad y Llywodraeth ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Cynyddodd y ddarpariaeth o £50 miliwn yn 1998-99, cynyddodd AALl gyllidebau o £60 miliwn a chynyddodd cyllidebau ysgolion dirprwyedig o £48 miliwn. Yn 1999-2000 £70.2 miliwn oedd y cynnydd, cynyddodd AALl eu cyllidebau £73 miliwn a chynyddodd cyllidebau dirprwyedig £56 miliwn. Eleni, cynyddodd y ddarpariaeth £91 miliwn, cynyddodd AALl eu cyllidebau £92 miliwn a chododd cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion, gyda meysydd newydd o ddirprwyo, £100 miliwn.

11:25 a.m.

The continuation of funding through local authorities is right for Wales. In August last year, our statistics department published statistics comparing spend in England and Wales on a like for like basis. In 2000-01, our LEA funding has delivered an average of £2,870 per pupil, which is higher than in eight of the 10 English regions and higher than the average funding in England, excluding London's £2,840. There is no disadvantage in funding levels in Wales compared with England, as the Plaid Cymru amendment contends. However, we share Members' concerns about the wide variation

Mae parhad ariannu drwy awdurdodau lleol yn briodol i Gymru. Fis Awst y llynedd, cyhoeddwyd ystadegau gan ein hadran ystadegau yn cymharu gwariant yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar seiliau cyffelyb. Yn 2000-01, cyflwynodd ein cyllid AALl gyfartaledd o £2,870 y disgybl, sydd yn uwch nag mewn wyth o'r 10 rhanbarth yn Lloegr ac yn uwch na'r cyllid ar gyfartaledd yn Lloegr, ac eithrio £2,840 yn Llundain. Nid oes unrhyw anfantais o ran lefelau cyllid yng Nghymru o'u cymharu â Lloegr, fel yr honna gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Fodd bynnag, rhannwn bryderon yr Aelodau ynghylch yr

of pupil spend. It is £3,570 per pupil in Ceredigion, which is probably the highest spending authority in Britain, and £2,553 in the Vale of Glamorgan.

Amendment 6 commends the work that we do with the WLGA to better understand why such a wide variation exists. I hope to publish those conclusions shortly. It is an important piece of work and we must start to address the unacceptable variations. This is not only a Welsh phenomenon. Our colleagues across the border have similar problems and we as an Assembly should learn how to address these issues, many of which have a historical base.

On amendment 8, we already publish comparisons with England and I am happy to work on doing the same with Scotland and Northern Ireland. It is important that we look for like for like comparisons. Scotland and Northern Ireland have different systems. We are eager to ensure that we make direct comparisons.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I always enjoy listening to the Minister, as she knows, but she has had eight minutes.

**Jane Davidson:** I was given to understand that I had 10 minutes during this debate, with one contribution. I apologise, but I am, therefore, well within my 10 minutes.

In England, a much higher proportion of funding is centrally directed through the standards fund. That constrains local decision-making, ties up local authorities and schools in the bureaucracy of bidding for and administering grants. We know that such approaches can backfire.

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. With respect, during a minority party debate, should it not be one five-minute contribution from the Minister?

**The Presiding Officer:** Yes. Five minutes.

**Jane Davidson:** I sought clarification on that

amrywiad eang o wariant fesul disgybl. Mae'n £3,570 y disgybl yng Ngheredigion, yr awdurdod â'r gwariant uchaf ym Mhrydain yn ôl pob tebyg, a £2,553 ym Mro Morgannwg.

Cymeradwya gwelliant 6 y gwaith a wnawn gyda CLILC i ddeall yn well pam bod amrywiad mor eang yn bodoli. Gobeithiaf gyhoeddi'r casgliadau hynny'n fuan. Mae'n ddarn pwysig o waith a rhaid inni ddechrau rhoi sylw i'r amrywiadau annerbyniol. Nid ffenomenon Gymreig yn unig yw hon. Mae gan ein cyfeillion dros y ffin broblemau tebyg a dylem ni fel Cynulliad ddysgu sut i ymdrin â'r materion hyn, llawer ohonynt â sail hanesyddol iddynt.

O ran gwelliant 8, cyhoeddwn eisoes gymariaethau â Lloegr ac yr wyf yn hapus i weithio ar wneud yr un peth gyda'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych am gymariaethau ar sail gyffelyb. Mae gan yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon systemau gwahanol. Yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud cymariaethau uniongyrchol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf bob amser wrth fy modd yn gwrando ar y Gweinidog, fel y gŵyr, ond mae wedi cael wyth munud.

**Jane Davidson:** Deallais fod gennyf 10 munud yn ystod y ddadl hon, gydag un cyfraniad. Ymddiheuraf, ond yr wyf, felly, ymhell o fewn fy 10 munud.

Yn Lloegr, caiff canran uwch o lawer o gyllid ei gyfarwyddo'n ganolog drwy'r gronfa safonau. Mae hynny'n cyfyngu ar wneud penderfyniadau'n lleol, ac yn clymu awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion i fiwrocratiaeth ceisio am grantiau a'u gweinyddu. Gwyddom y gall ymagweddau o'r fath fethu.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Gyda phob parch, yn ystod dadl plaid leiafrifol, oni ddylai fod yn gyfraniad unigol pum munud gan y Gweinidog?

**Y Llywydd:** Dylai. Pum munud.

**Jane Davidson:** Ceisiais gael eglurhad ar y

point this morning. I was told that I had 10 minutes.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is five minutes. I am being extremely generous, as are the Welsh Conservatives. Will you please draw your remarks to a close?

**Jane Davidson:** Thank you, Llywydd. I draw attention to the fact that we have debated at length in the Assembly the positive initiatives referred to by other Members. I was pleased that Jonathan said that this was not a debate about what the Assembly is doing and that he recognises the Assembly's substantial work to drive forward the education agenda for Wales.

A consultation document on simplifying the system is out at present—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I hate to intervene again on my former colleague, but you have had nearly 10 minutes.

**Jane Davidson:** I was about to bring my remarks to a close by saying that that document is still out to consultation. It addresses some of the transparency issues. I urge Members to support amendments 2, 3, 6, 7 and 8 to the motion to recognise the significant additional funding that is provided for schools and our commitment to all involved in the education system in Wales in order to get it right.

**David Davies:** I am grateful for the opportunity to highlight how the Government's funding fog has affected specific schools in the Monmouth constituency. Last year, David Blunkett made a grandiose announcement that £35 million was being made available for the new AS level courses. This should have meant £29,000 to Chepstow Comprehensive School. Schools of similar size across the border in the Bristol area received that money. When Mr Hywel Gruffydd, the headteacher of Chepstow Comprehensive School, asked the local education authority for the money that was rightfully his, it claimed to have no knowledge of it. The

pwyt hwnnw y bore yma. Dywedwyd wrthyf fod gennyf 10 munud.

**Y Llywydd:** Pum munud sydd gennych. Yr wyf yn hynod o hael, fel y mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru. A wnewch chi dynnu at y terfyn os gwelwch yn dda?

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch, Lywydd. Tynnaf sylw at y ffaith ein bod wedi trafod y mentrau cadarnhaol y cyfeiriwyd atynt gan aelodau eraill yn faith yn y Cynulliad. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Jonathan wedi dweud nad oedd hon yn ddadl am yr hyn a wna'r Cynulliad a'i fod yn cydnabod gwaith sylweddol y Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r agenda addysg ar gyfer Cymru.

Mae dogfen ymgynghorol yn ymwneud â symleiddio'r system wedi'i chyhoeddi ar hyn o bryd—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n gas gennyf ymyrryd eto â'm cyn gyd-Aelod, ond yr ydych wedi cael bron i 10 munud.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr oeddwn ar fin dirwyn fy sylwadau i ben drwy ddweud bod y ddogfen honno yn parhau i fod yn destun ymgynghoriad. Mae'n ymdrin â rhai o'r materion tryloywder. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi gwelliannau 2, 3, 6, 7 ac 8 i'r cynnig i gydnabod y cyllid ychwanegol sylweddol a gaiff ei ddarparu i ysgolion a'n hymrwymiad i bawb sydd yn ymwneud â'r system addysg yng Nghymru er mwyn ei gael yn iawn.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i amlygu'r modd yr effeithiodd niwl cyllido'r Llywodraeth ar ysgolion penodol yn etholaeth Mynwy. Y llynedd, gwnaeth David Blunkett gyhoeddiad mawreddog bod £35 miliwn ar gael ar gyfer y cyrsiau lefel Uwch Gyfrannol newydd. Dylai hyn fod wedi golygu £29,000 i Ysgol Gyfun Cas-gwent. Derbyniodd ysgolion o faint tebyg ar draws y ffin yn ardal Bryste yr arian hwnnw. Pan ofynnodd Mr Hywel Gruffydd, pennaeth Ysgol Gyfun Cas-gwent, i'r awdurdod addysg lleol am yr arian a oedd yn gyfiawn eiddo iddo, honnodd nad oedd yn gwybod dim amdano. O ganlyniad gorfodwyd penaethiaid yng Nghymru, fel Mr Gruffydd, i

outcome was that headteachers in Wales, such as Mr Gruffydd were forced to fund these new courses from within their existing budgets, at great expense.

This year we have had more grandiose announcements. A school the size of Chepstow Comprehensive School should have received £60,000, inflation-linked for three years, as a result of yet another announcement from David Blunkett. It should also have received an additional £60,000 and £40,000 for building maintenance, making a total of £160,000. This is not largesse money, some sort of generous gift from the Government because it wants to spend some of its huge surplus. This money is there for building maintenance, so that the post-16 exams can be reformed, for ICT and for cutting red-tape and bureaucracy.

The Secondary Heads Association has been assured that the Department for Education and Employment have made this money available to schools in Wales through the block grant for the Welsh Assembly. I challenge the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to tell us today how much of that money Chepstow Comprehensive School will receive. The problem is that this Government is fond of making big announcements about huge amounts of extra funding for various initiatives. However, as my colleague so ably pointed out earlier this morning, that money does not find its way down to headteachers and pupils. The money is not here. I will conclude by quoting the words of Hywel Gruffydd, the headteacher of Chepstow Comprehensive School, in a recent letter:

‘the utter frustration of all of us associated with education is mounting in an unprecedented way with regard to the funding issue and its continuing obfuscation. We ask only for clarity and transparency in funding and for the Welsh National Assembly to aspire, not merely to be different from England, but to be better’.

Members may laugh at my pronunciation of the word ‘obfuscation’, but that is the word of a headteacher of a local comprehensive in Wales. If you care about education, stop trying to split hairs over how I pronounce that word and start thinking about the pupils

ariannu'r cyrsiau newydd hyn o fewn eu cyllidebau presennol, ar gost enfawr.

Eleni cawsom ragor o gyhoeddiadau mawreddog. Dylai ysgol o faint Ysgol Gyfun Cas-gwent fod wedi derbyn £60,000, yn gysylltiedig â chwyddiant dros dair blynedd, o ganlyniad i gyhoeddiad arall eto gan David Blunkett. Dylai hefyd fod wedi derbyn £60,000 ychwanegol a £40,000 ar gyfer cynnal a chadw adeiladau, gan wneud cyfanswm o £160,000. Nid haelioni yw hyn, rhyw fath o rodd hael gan y Llywodraeth am ei fod yn dymuno gwario peth o'r arian aruthrol sydd ganddo dros ben. Mae'r arian hwn yno ar gyfer cynnal a chadw adeiladau, fel y gellir diwygio arholiadau ôl-16, ar gyfer TGCh ac i dorri mân reolau a biwrocratiaeth.

Sicrhawyd Cymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd bod yr Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth wedi sicrhau bod yr arian hwn ar gael i ysgolion yng Nghymru drwy'r grant bloc ar gyfer Cynulliad Cymru. Heriaf y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ddweud wrthym heddiw faint o'r arian hwnnw a gaiff Ysgol Gyfun Cas-gwent. Y broblem yw bod y Llywodraeth hon yn hoff o wneud cyhoeddiadau mawr ynghylch symiau enfawr o gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer mentrau amrywiol. Fodd bynnag, fel y nododd fy nghyd-Aelod mor fedrus yn gynharach y bore yma, nid yw'r arian hwnnw yn cyrraedd y penaethiaid a'r disgyblion. Nid yw'r arian ar gael. Dof i ben drwy ddyfynnu geiriau Hywel Gruffydd, pennaeth Ysgol Gyfun Cas-gwent, mewn llythyr diweddar:

Gall Aelodau chwerthin am ben fy ynganiad o'r gair ‘obfuscation’, ond dyna air pennaeth ysgol gyfun leol yng Nghymru. Os ydych yn poeni am addysg, peidiwch â cheisio hollti blew ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr ynganais y gair hwnnw a dechreuwch feddwl

who are losing out in Wales as a result of your policies.

**Peter Law:** I am pleased of the opportunity to speak in today's debate. I was particularly pleased to hear the Minister refer to the fact that she is aware of the variation in pupil-spend between authorities and that she is actively looking at it, investigating it, working with our partners in the local education authorities and will report back in the future. As I represent Blaenau Gwent, I am concerned about that and also the figures for GEST, the grants for educational and training programme. As the Minister knows, we in Blaenau Gwent, which is a deprived area, received about £100 per year for children under GEST, as it does not recognise social deprivation. Areas such as Powys get £160 a year and Monmouthshire, £103 a year. Therefore, there are many issues that must be considered.

I was interested to hear Jonathan Morgan say that this was not about overall funding figures. The reason he said that was because the Conservatives know that we are putting huge amounts into education and that we are therefore achieving many of our targets. The Minister has strongly outlined that this morning. Cynog Dafis referred to the appalling record of the Conservatives regarding their spending on education. They should hang their heads in shame today. It is amazing that they should come here and have the audacity to even raise a debate on education.

**David Davies:** Does the Member not accept that the amount of money spent on education as a proportion of GDP has fallen since Labour came to Government?

**Peter Law:** I am listening to the Conservative Party who represents, to my mind, a bunch of political joyriders. They are gamblers and malcontents. I have to listen to them every week. These are the people who are responsible for the crumbling schools that we have to deal with. These are the people who introduced the divisive grant-

am y disgyblion sydd ar eu colled yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'ch polisiau.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl heddiw. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch i glywed y Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at y ffaith ei bod yn ymwybodol o'r amrywiad yn y gwariant fesul disgybl rhwng awdurdodau a'i bod yn edrych arno yn weithredol, yn ymchwilio iddo, gan weithio gyda'n partneriaid yn yr awdurdodau addysg lleol ac y bydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad inni yn y dyfodol. Gan fy mod yn cynrychioli Blaenau Gwent, yr wyf yn bryderus am hynny a hefyd y ffigurau ar gyfer GEST, y grantiau ar gyfer rhaglenni addysgol a hyfforddiant. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, derbyniasom ni ym Mlaenau Gwent, sydd yn ardal ddifreintiedig, tua £100 y flwyddyn ar gyfer plant o dan GEST, gan nad yw'n cydnabod amddifadedd cymdeithasol. Caiff ardaloedd fel Powys £160 y flwyddyn a Sir Fynwy £103 y flwyddyn. Felly, rhaid ystyried llawer o faterion.

Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb i glywed Jonathan Morgan yn dweud nad oedd hyn yn ymwneud â ffigurau cyllid cyffredinol. Y rheswm am hynny, meddai, oedd bod y Ceidwadwyr yn gwybod ein bod yn rhoi symiau enfawr i addysg a'n bod felly yn cyrraedd llawer o'n targedau. Amlinellodd y Gweinidog hynny'n gryf y bore yma. Cyfeiriodd Cynog Dafis at record warthus y Ceidwadwyr o safbwynt eu gwariant ar addysg. Dylent blygu eu pennau mewn cywilydd heddiw. Mae'n rhyfeddol eu bod wedi dod yma ac yn ddigon hy i hyd yn oed gychwyn dadl ar addysg.

**David Davies:** Oni dderbynia'r Aelod fod y swm o arian a werir ar addysg fel cyfran o CMC wedi gostwng ers i Lafur fod mewn Llywodraeth?

**Peter Law:** Gwrandawaf ar y Blaid Geidwadol sydd yn cynrychioli, yn fy nhyb i, griw o jolihetwyr gwleidyddol. Maent yn gamblwyr ac yn bobl anfoddog. Yr wyf yn gorfod gwrandao arnynt bob wythnos. Dyma'r bobl sydd yn gyfrifol am yr ysgolion adfeiliedig y mae'n rhaid inni ymdrin â hwy. Dyma'r bobl a gyflwynodd yr ysgolion a

maintained schools.

**Glyn Davies and Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**Peter Law:** I am giving way to Jonathan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In referring to malcontents, has Peter talked to headteachers, governors or the teaching unions who deliver education services in Wales? I would rather listen to them than members of the Cabinet who spend their time on the fifth floor of this building. They are the ones who know about what is going on in schools, not the people who sit on cosy town hall sofas, colleagues of yours in Blaenau Gwent and throughout the rest of Wales, who make decisions about schools when they do not set foot in a school. We need to be looking more imaginatively about how money reaches schools. We want their concerns and complaints recognised.

11:35 a.m.

**Peter Law:** I have nothing but the highest regard for trade unions, teachers and professionals who look after our children. I respect their views. My comments referred to Conservative Party Assembly Members. We remember the Redwood subsidy for England. The Conservatives talk about money and we must remember how much money was sent back by John Redwood. Do you remember those days when we subsidised England? Do you remember the nursery vouchers that the Conservatives wanted to implement? Thankfully, we were able to save Wales from having to suffer those vouchers. That was what they were going to do for education.

The Conservatives talk about local authorities, but local authorities are the democratically elected representatives of the people. People in local authorities were elected by the ballot box, first past the post. They were not elected on a lottery system like some Conservative Members here. These local education authorities have acted in the interests of the people of their communities. We would expect the Conservatives to be against them because they have always been

gynhelir â grant hynny sydd yn peri rhwyg.

**Glyn Davies a Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Peter Law:** Ildiaf i Jonathan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Wrth gyfeirio at bobl anfoddog, a siaradodd Peter â phenaethiaid, llywodraethwyr neu'r undebau athrawon sydd yn cyflwyno gwasanaethau addysg yng Nghymru? Byddai'n well gennyf wrando arnynt hwy nag ar aelodau o'r Cabinet a dreulia eu hamser ar bumed llawr yr adeilad hwn. Hwy yw'r rhai a wŷr am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd mewn ysgolion, nid y bobl sydd yn eistedd ar soffas cyfforddus mewn neuaddau tref, eich cydweithwyr ym Mlaenau Gwent a thrwy weddill Cymru, sydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau am ysgolion pan nad ydynt byth yn tywyllu ysgolion. Rhaid inni edrych yn fwy dychmygus ar y ffordd y mae arian yn cyrraedd ysgolion. Yr ydym am i'w pryderon a'u cwynion gael eu cydnabod.

**Peter Law:** Nid oes gennyf ond y parch mwyaf at undebau llafur, athrawon a'r bobl broffesiynol sydd yn gofalu am ein plant. Parchaf eu safbwyntiau. Yr oedd fy sylwadau'n cyfeirio at Aelodau Ceidwadol o'r Cynulliad. Cofiwn gymhorthdal Redwood i Loegr. Siarada'r Ceidwadwyr am arian a rhaid inni gofio faint o arian a anfonwyd yn ôl gan John Redwood. A gofiwch y dyddiau hynny pan oeddem yn darparu cymhorthdal i Loegr? A gofiwch y talebau meithrin yr oedd y Ceidwadwyr am eu gweithredu? Diolch byth, llwyddasom i achub Cymru rhag gorfod dioddef y talebau hynny. Dyna'r hyn yr oeddynt yn mynd i'w wneud dros addysg.

Siarada'r Ceidwadwyr am awdurdodau lleol, ond cynrychiolwyr y bobl a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd yw awdurdodau lleol. Etholwyd y bobl mewn awdurdodau lleol drwy'r blwch pleidleisio, y cyntaf heibio'r postyn. Ni chawsant eu hethol drwy system loteri fel rhai o'r Aelodau Ceidwadol yma. Gweithredodd yr awdurdodau addysg lleol hyn er budd pobl eu cymunedau. Byddem yn disgwyl i'r Ceidwadwyr fod yn eu herbyn oherwydd maent bob amser wedi bod yn

centralists, and they have never appreciated local democracy and have always attacked it. That is the difference. Therefore, what we are hearing today is important for our communities and schools.

The Minister has told us that there is provision for an increase of £91 million, that local education authorities' overall budgets increased by £92 million, that school delegated budgets rose by £100 million. These are big figures and these issues are important. That is what is making the difference as far as the future of our children is concerned. That is the important point. It is all about partnership. I agree that the key responsibility for school funding and the associated budgetary decisions, probably rests with local government. We do not need hypothecation because we are going to have policy agreements, and we will work with our partners in local government to deliver the best quality and best value regime. As we have said on many occasions, that will ensure that we have the opportunity to see that best value.

The figures that are quoted for Wales are good, even though London is not included in the figures. We have a higher average than most of England. We are moving forward strongly to reach our targets. Therefore, all of these issues are positive for the people of Wales. I am delighted to support the Minister today. We are on course to provide better quality education for all the people of Wales. That is good for our children and good for our education system. It is a system of which we can be proud.

**Glyn Davies:** My greatest disappointment when I was campaigning in the 1997 General Election was how difficult it was to engage with schoolteachers in Montgomeryshire. It seemed to me then, and does now, that the desire to shape the lives of young people—which attracts people into the teaching profession—lies naturally with instinctive Conservative philosophy: a belief in a stable society and a belief in instilling into young people the initiative, creativity and

ganolwyr, ac ni werthfawrogasant ddemocratiaeth leol byth ac maent bob amser wedi ymosod arni. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth. Felly, mae'r hyn a glywn heddiw yn bwysig i'n cymunedau a'n hysgolion.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym fod darpariaeth ar gyfer cynnydd o £91 miliwn, bod cynnydd o £92 miliwn mewn cyllidebau cyffredinol awdurdodau addysg lleol, bod cynnydd o £100 miliwn mewn cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion. Mae'r rhain yn ffigurau mawr ac mae'r materion hyn yn bwysig. Dyna sydd yn gwneud y gwahaniaeth cyn belled ag y mae dyfodol ein plant dan sylw. Dyna'r pwynt pwysig. Mae'r cyfan yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth. Cytunaf fod cyfrifoldeb allweddol dros gyllid ysgolion a'r penderfyniadau cyllidebol cysylltiedig yn gorwedd gyda llywodraeth leol yn ôl pob tebyg. Nid oes arnom angen pridiannu gan y bydd gennym gytundebau polisi, a gweithiwn gyda'n partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol i gyflwyno'r gyfundrefn ansawdd gorau a gwerth gorau. Fel y dywedasom lawer gwaith, bydd hynny'n sicrhau y cawn gyfle i weld y gwerth gorau hwnnw.

Mae'r ffigurau a ddyfynnir ar gyfer Cymru yn dda, er na chynhwysir Llundain yn y ffigurau. Mae gennym gyfartaledd uwch na'r rhan fwyaf o Loegr. Symudwn ymlaen yn hyderus i gyrraedd ein targedau. Felly, mae'r materion hyn i gyd yn gadarnhaol i bobl Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch iawn o gefnogi'r Gweinidog heddiw. Yr ydym ar y ffordd i ddarparu addysg o ansawdd well ar gyfer holl bobl Cymru. Mae hynny'n dda i'n plant ac yn dda i'n system addysg. Mae'n system y gallwn ymfalchio ynddi.

**Glyn Davies:** Pan oeddwn yn ymgyrchu yn Etholiad Cyffredinol 1997 fy siom fwyaf oedd pa mor anodd oedd cyfathrebu ag athrawon ysgol yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Ymddangosai imi ar y pryd, fel yn awr, fod yr awydd i drefnu bywydau pobl ifanc—sydd yn denu pobl i'r proffesiwn dysgu—yn rhan naturiol o athroniaeth Geidwadol reddfol: cred mewn cymdeithas sefydlog a chred y dylid trwytho pobl ifanc yn y fenter, y creadigrwydd a'r hyder i fynd allan i'r byd i



confidence to go out into the world to be successful, and not to be dependent on the state.

The Conservative group in the Assembly is lucky to have Jonathan Morgan as our education spokesman. He is an able young man who has transformed our relationship as a party with the education sector in Wales. He has transformed our success in encouraging students to think Conservative again, and they are flocking to the Conservative banner in huge numbers in all of our universities. It is no surprise that Jonathan Morgan is leading us with such success when we compare his thinking and panache with the rather stale, old thinking displayed by the Minister.

**David Melding:** Will you stop the disgraceful rumour that is going around the Chamber that Jonathan's mother wrote your speech?

**Glyn Davies:** Yes, I will. That was a pity because I was just getting into full flow.

With craven obsequiousness, the Minister bows down before the Labour controlled councils that have so mismanaged our education system for decades. It comes to something when we have to look across Offa's Dyke, because even David Blunkett is more in tune with common sense and the public mood than the Assembly's Lib-Lab coalition.

I have been approached by many headteachers concerned about the funding of their schools. They do not fully understand the funding fog that surrounds the way in which this administration allocates its education budget. However, they know only too well that money is not flowing through to them at the rate that they were led to believe it would. Even more importantly, it is not flowing through to them at the rate they believe it is doing in England and Scotland. The concern that I would like to raise with the Minister today is that there is widespread acceptance that schools in Wales are not receiving the same degree of funding as

lwyddo, ac i beidio â bod yn ddibynnol ar y wladwriaeth.

Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr y Cynulliad yn ffodus i gael Jonathan Morgan fel ein llefarydd dros addysg. Mae'n ŵr ifanc galluog a drawsffurfiodd ein perthynas fel plaid â'r sector addysg yng Nghymru. Trawsffurfiodd ein llwyddiant drwy annog myfyrwyr i feddwl yn Geidwadol unwaith eto, ac maent yn tyrru at faner y Ceidwadwyr yn eu niferoedd yn ein holl brifysgolion. Nid yw'n syndod fod Jonathan Morgan yn ein harwain gyda'r fath lwyddiant pan gymharwn ei ddull o feddwl a'i rwysg â'r hen ddull, eithaf diflas o feddwl a ddangosir gan y Gweinidog.

**David Melding:** A wnewch roi taw ar y si gwarthus sydd yn mynd o gwmpas y Siambr mai mam Jonathan a ysgrifennodd eich araith?

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaf. Mae hynny'n drueni oherwydd yr oeddwn yn mynd i hwyliau.

Gydag agwedd gwas llwfr, mae'r Gweinidog yn ymgrymu o flaen y cynghorau a reolir gan Lafur a gamreolodd ein system addysg ers degawdau. Mae'n sefyllfa druenus pan fydd yn rhaid inni edrych y tu hwnt i Glawdd Offa, gan fod gan David Blunkett hyd yn oed yn fwy o synnwyr cyffredin ac yn gallu uniaethu mwy â barn y bobl na chlymblaid y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad.

Mae llawer o benaethiaid wedi cysylltu â mi yn bryderus ynghylch cyllid eu hysgolion. Nid ydynt yn deall yn iawn y niwl cyllido sydd yn cwmpasu'r ffordd y dyranna'r weinyddiaeth hon ei chyllideb addysg. Fodd bynnag, gwyddant yn iawn nad yw arian yn llifo atynt ar y raddfa y cawsant eu harwain i gredu y byddai. Yn bwysicach fyth, nid yw'n llifo atynt ar y raddfa y credant y mae'n ei wneud yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Hoffwn godi'r pryder gyda'r Gweinidog heddiw fod pawb yn derbyn nad yw ysgolion yng Nghymru'n cael yr un faint o gyllid ag ysgolion yn Lloegr. Efallai y ceisiwch ddadlau, Weinidog, fel y gwnaethoch o'r blaen, nad

schools in England. You may well try to argue, Minister, as you have done previously, that this is not true. However, you cannot argue that that is what headteachers in Powys believe and what professional publications are saying about poor funding in Wales. That will lead to teachers looking more to England for employment, and even more to Scotland, now that a generous settlement has been agreed for teachers north of Hadrian's Wall.

Headteachers are deeply concerned about losing ambitious staff to England and have an even deeper concern about attracting new staff in their place. The failure of this Lib Lab coalition to match the direct funding mechanisms that are in place for schools in England is causing, and will continue to cause, huge damage to the education system in Wales, for which you will be responsible. Minister, go and talk to the headteachers in Powys. Go and talk to your opposite number at Westminster. Take your scissors to the ideological suspenders by which you dangle at the mercy of your local authority comrades. Give the money direct to schools. Give the power to teachers, governors and parents. Open your ears and listen, open your eyes and see, before it is too late and before any more damage is done.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae ansicrwydd wedi bod yn rhemp yn ein hysgolion ers sawl blwyddyn, ansicrwydd ynglŷn ag arian i gadw staff, i brynu adnoddau angenrheidiol ac i gynnal a chadw adeiladau, heb sôn am yr ansicrwydd sydd yn deillio o fïwrocratiaeth a newidiadau yn y cwricwlwm. Yr ydym yn byw mewn oes lle y mae ysgolion yn symud o un cyfnod o bryder i'r llall, gydag ychydig o seibiant rhyngddynt wrth i flaengareddau Blunkett gyrraedd i leddfu'r boen tan y tro nesaf. Yn Lloegr, mae Ofsted newydd feirniadu'r dryswch presennol ym myd addysg a achoswyd gan amrywiadau rhwng blaengareddau a cheisiadau. Mae'r dryswch hwnnw wedi dwysáu effeithiau niweidiol yr amrywiadau anesboniadwy hynny ar waith athrawon.

yw hyn yn wir. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ddadlau mai dyna farn penaethiaid ym Mhowys a dyna'r hyn a ddywed cyhoeddiadau proffesiynol am gyllido gwael yng Nghymru. Bydd hynny'n arwain at athrawon yn edrych yn fwy tuag at Loegr am waith, a hyd yn oed yn fwy tuag at yr Alban, yn awr gan y cytunwyd ar setliad hael i athrawon i'r gogledd o Wal Hadrian.

Mae penaethiaid yn pryderu'n fawr ynghylch colli staff uchelgeisiol i Loegr ac maent yn poeni hyd yn oed yn fwy ynghylch denu staff newydd yn eu lle. Mae methiant y glymblaid hon rhwng y Blaid Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gyfateb i'r mecanweithiau ariannu uniongyrchol sydd yn eu lle ar gyfer ysgolion yn Lloegr yn achosi, a bydd yn parhau i achosi, niwed mawr iawn i'r system addysg yng Nghymru, a chi fydd yn gyfrifol am hynny. Ewch i siarad â phenaethiaid ym Mhowys, Weinidog. Ewch i siarad â'ch swyddog cyfatebol yn San Steffan. Ewch â'ch siswrn a thorrwch y llinynnau ideolegol yr ydych yn hongian wrthynt ar drugaredd eich cymheiriaid yn yr awdurdodau lleol. Rhowch yr arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Rhowch y pŵer i'r athrawon, y llywodraethwyr a'r rhieni. Agorwch eich clustiau a gwrandewch, agorwch eich llygaid a gwelwch, cyn iddi fynd yn rhy hwyr a chyn y gwneir rhagor o niwed.

**Owen John Thomas:** Uncertainty has been rife in our schools for many years, uncertainty about funding to retain staff, to buy necessary resources and to maintain buildings, notwithstanding the uncertainty caused by bureaucracy and changes in the curriculum. Ours is an age where schools go from one period of anxiety to another, with a short respite in between as Blunkett's initiatives arrive to ease the pain until the next time. In England, Ofsted has just criticised the current confusion in education caused by variations between initiatives and bids. That confusion has intensified the damaging effects of those inexplicable variations on teachers' work.

Er y gosodir targedau penodol i athrawon, nid oes safonau cenedlaethol cymaradwy y gellid eu defnyddio i benderfynu ar yr arian y dylid ei wario ar ein hysgolion. Nid oes mesur swyddogol, felly, o anghenion addysg. Rhaid i ysgolion faglu ymlaen, a cheisio cadw eu hanghenion beunyddiol rhag mynd i sefyllfa o argyfwng drwy ddefnyddio arian a dderbyniasant ar gyfer blaengaredd penodol. Mae pob grant a roddir i ysgolion ar gyfer blaengareddau Blunkett yn gyfle i ddefnyddio'r cyfryngau a chyhoeddi mewn llythrennau bras y bydd ysgolion yn derbyn rhagor o arian. Twyll yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallai dull syml, clir a theg o ddsbarthu arian roi sicrwydd cyllidol i ysgolion heb y baliw a'r lol a geir dan y drefn bresennol.

Clywsom lawer o sôn am y dryswch a berir gan y gwahaniaethau rhwng swm yr arian y pen a werir gan awdurdodau addysg lleol. Rhai o'r rhesymau dros y gwahaniaethau hynny yw teneurwydd poblogaeth, cyflwr ac oed adeiladau ysgolion ac ansawdd bywyd. Yn ôl y Comisiwn Archwilio, mae'r diffyg tryloywder yn y gyfundrefn bresennol o rannu arian addysg yn ei gwneud yn anodd i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau. Dywed adroddiad y Comisiwn fod angen herio'r gwahaniaethau hyn ond, yn anffodus, golyga'r diffyg tryloywder yn y gyfundrefn gyllido nad yw'r fath her yn bosibl o hyd.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriaf at yr angen i ailwampio'r gyfundrefn gyllido o'r cychwyn, gan ddechrau gyda fformwla Barnett a'r gyfran ohoni a ddaw i Gymru ar gyfer addysg. Mae dadansoddiad yr Athro David Reynolds yn y rhifyn cyfredol o *Agenda* yn dangos y gwahaniaeth sylweddol yn yr arian a werir yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â Lloegr. Pe byddai'r arian yn cael ei ddyrannu yn ôl poblogaeth ac anghenion yn hytrach nag ar sail poblogaeth yn unig, byddai'r cynnydd sydd ei angen yng Nghymru i sicrhau cyfran deg hyd yn oed yn uwch. Mae'n amlwg i Ofsted, yr Athro Reynolds, undebau athrawon a llawer ohonom yma ei bod yn hen bryd inni newid y modd y caiff addysg ei chyllido o'r gwraidd i'r brig. Fe'ch anogaf i

Even though specific targets are set for teachers, there are no comparable national standards that can be used to decide how much funding each school should receive. Therefore, we do not have an official measure of the requirements of education. Our schools have to cope as best they can and try to prevent their daily needs from reaching crisis point by using money provided for a specific initiative. Each grant given to schools as part of a Blunkett initiative is an opportunity to use the media and make the headlines by announcing that schools will receive more money. That is utter deceit. However, a simple, clear, and fair system of distributing money could provide schools with financial security without the ballyhoo and nonsense of the present system.

We have heard much talk about the confusion caused by the variations in per capita spending between local education authorities. Some of the reasons for those variations are population sparsity, the condition and age of school buildings and quality of life. According to the Audit Commission, the lack of transparency in the present system of allocating education funds makes it difficult to tackle the problems. The Commission's report states that we need to challenge these variations but, unfortunately, lack of transparency in the funding system means that such a challenge is not always possible.

Finally, I refer to the need to revamp the funding system from start to finish, starting with the Barnett formula and the proportion of it that comes to Wales for education. Professor David Reynolds' analysis in the current issue of *Agenda* shows the substantial difference in the amount of money spent in Wales compared with England. If the money was allocated according to population and need rather than on the basis of population only, the increase that is needed in Wales to ensure an equitable share would be even higher. It is evident to Ofsted, to Professor Reynolds, to teachers' unions and to several of us here that it is high time that we changed how education is funded from the bottom up. I urge you to support amendments 1, 4, 5, 6,

gefnogi gwelliannau 1, 4, 5, 6, 7 ac 8. Dylai'r Cynulliad roi arweiniad ar y mater hwn.

7 and 8. The Assembly should lead on this issue.

11:45 a.m.

**David Melding:** I declare an interest as chair of the governing body of Meadowbank Special School. The Welsh Conservative Party trusts schools, school staff and governors. This process started nearly 10 years ago with the local management of schools, which was a significant and popular initiative. Scepticism was expressed then by the established interests, but it has brought a transformation in how schools are governed and their capacity to respond to change and to advance best practice and innovation.

**David Melding:** Datganaf fuddiant fel cadeirydd corff llywodraethu Ysgol Arbennig Meadowbank. Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn ymddiried mewn ysgolion, staff yr ysgolion a'r llywodraethwyr. Dechreuodd y broses hon bron i 10 mlynedd yn ôl gyda rheolaeth leol ar ysgolion, a oedd yn fenter arwyddocaol a phoblogaidd. Mynegwyd amheuaeth ar y pryd gan y buddiannau sefydledig, ond trawsnewidiodd y modd y llywodraethir ysgolion a'u gallu i ymateb i newid ac i hyrwyddo arfer da ac arloesedd.

In my experience on a governing body, schools sometimes have to use resources from their own reserves even when responding to school inspection action plans rather than turn to the LEA to fund essential safety work through the capital programme, for example. This local delegation can be crucial, not just to advancing educational standards but to meet central issues such as health and safety provision, as expressed in inspection teams' reports. What we are discussing today is at the heart of education. It is not just a fancy additional provision.

O'm profiad i ar gorff llywodraethu, weithiau rhaid i ysgolion ddefnyddio adnoddau o'u cronfeydd wrth gefn hyd yn oed wrth ymateb i gynlluniau gweithredu arolygiad o'r ysgol yn hytrach na throi at yr AALl i ariannu gwaith diogelwch hanfodol drwy'r rhaglen gyfalaf, er enghraifft. Gall y dirprwyo lleol hwn fod yn dyngedfennol, nid yn unig i hyrwyddo safonau addysgol ond i gwrdd ag anghenion canolog fel y ddarpariaeth iechyd a diogelwch, fel y mynegir yn adroddiadau'r timau arolygu. Mae'r hyn a drafodwn heddiw wrth wraidd y byd addysg. Nid darpariaeth ychwanegol ffansi yw hyn.

Although we have not talked much about them, LEAs have an important role. As someone with experience of special educational needs, I would not downplay this. I would like to see LEAs advance and increase the standard of SEN provision and concentrate on what they can do on a regional basis to a level of excellence that we would all welcome. In the past I have expressed support for such things as the increase in mainstream provision so that special educational needs are met within mainstream schools. There have been good policy developments on this and I must acknowledge that some LEAs have been sensitive and constructive in what they have achieved in these areas.

Er na siaradasom lawer amdanynt, mae gan AALl rôl bwysig. Fel rhywun sydd â phrofiad o anghenion addysgol arbennig, ni fyddwn yn bychanu hyn. Hoffwn weld AALl yn hyrwyddo ac yn codi safon y ddarpariaeth AAA ac yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn y gallant ei wneud yn rhanbarthol hyd at lefel o ragoriaeth y byddem i gyd yn ei chroesawu. Yn y gorffennol mynegais gefnogaeth i bethau fel cynnydd yn y ddarpariaeth brif ffrwd fel y gellir diwallu anghenion addysgol arbennig o fewn ysgolion prif ffrwd. Cafwyd datblygiadau polisi da ar hyn a rhaid imi gydnabod bod rhai AALl wedi bod yn sensitif ac yn adeiladol yn yr hyn a gyflawnasant yn y meysydd hyn.

The Assembly can express its commitment to education. We, apparently, have a

Gall y Cynulliad fynegi ei ymrwymiad i addysg. Yn ôl pob golwg, mae gennym

Government that is determined to advance education on a triplicate pattern. We have heard the Prime Minister express this. Why should the Assembly be frustrated in its commitment to education by decisions taken by local authorities? If we declare that we want certain levels of resources to go to schools and to earmark a certain level of expenditure, why should that not go directly to schools? I cannot see how that compromises the role of LEAs and local authorities. It gives force to decisions taken in a devolved Assembly. Devolution has, after all, transformed the political governance of this country. This is an important point on which we should linger.

Devolution allows us to develop best practice in Wales, to make it common practice and, perhaps, set an example to the rest of the country. We hope that the Children's Commissioner will also do this. As we now determine these things and we call the shots, devolution could also mean that we could be mired in institutionalised interest and not advance as other parts of the country do. A better education system in Wales than in England is not inevitable now that we have devolution. We have the ability to influence the way education develops in Wales, but we need to use those powers fully and we must be aware of the fact that developments in Wales may not go apace with those that may occur in England, Northern Ireland or Scotland. We must use our powers with imagination and determination. That means we cannot simply take the special pleading of particular parties and not go ahead with an exciting, innovative development. We must trust people, governors, staff and schools and give them the power to deliver higher standards in our schools and not leave that to local education authorities or to policies set in this august Chamber. Let us make devolution work to best effect and let us give more power to schools, headteachers and to the governing bodies.

Lywodraeth sydd yn benderfynol o hyrwyddo addysg ar batrwm triphlyg. Clywsom y Prif Weinidog yn mynegi hyn. Pam y dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn rhwystredig yn ei ymrwymiad i addysg gan benderfyniadau a wneir gan awdurdodau lleol? Os datganwn ein bod am i lefelau penodol o adnoddau fynd i ysgolion a chlustnodi lefel benodol o wariant, pam na ddylai hynny fynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion? Ni allaf weld sut y mae hynny'n peryglu rôl AALl ac awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n rhoi grym i benderfyniadau a wneir mewn Cynulliad datganoledig. Wedi'r cyfan, trawsffurfiodd datganoli lywodraethu gwleidyddol y wlad hon. Mae hwn yn bwynt pwysig y dylem dreulio amser yn ei drafod.

Galluoga datganoli inni ddatblygu arfer gorau yng Nghymru, ei wneud yn arfer cyffredin ac, o bosibl, gosod esiampl i weddill y wlad. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Comisiynydd Plant yn gwneud hyn hefyd. Gan mai ni sydd erbyn hyn yn pennu'r pethau hyn a ni sydd â'r awdurdod, gallai datganoli hefyd olygu y gallem fod mewn trybini o ran buddiannau sefydliadol ac nid yn datblygu fel rhannau eraill o'r wlad. Nid yw'n anochel fod gennym system addysg well yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr yn awr fod gennym ddatganoli. Mae gennym y gallu i ddylanwadu ar y ffordd y datblyga addysg yng Nghymru, ond mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r pwerau hynny i'r eithaf a rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith efallai na fydd datblygiadau yng Nghymru yn digwydd mor gyflym â'r rheini a all ddigwydd yn Lloegr, Gogledd Iwerddon neu'r Alban. Rhaid inni ddefnyddio ein pwerau yn ddychmygus a chyda phenderfyniad. Golyga hynny na allwn yn syml gymryd erfyniadau arbennig pleidiau penodol a pheidio â bwrw ymlaen â datblygiad arloesol, cyffrous. Rhaid inni ymddiried ym mhobl, llywodraethwyr, staff ac ysgolion a rhoi iddynt y pŵer i gyflwyno safonau uwch yn ein hysgolion ac nid gadael hynny i awdurdodau addysg lleol neu i bolisiau a lunnir yn y Siambr fawreddog hon. Gadewch inni sicrhau bod datganoli yn gweithio mor effeithiol â phosibl a gadewch inni roi mwy o bŵer i ysgolion, penaethiaid ac i gyrff llywodraethu.

**Peter Black:** I declare an interest as a Swansea councillor and a school governor. There is a strange feeling of unreality in participating in a debate where the Welsh Conservatives are calling for extra money to be spent on education. For those of us who were councillors in the 1980s and 1990s, the irony is acute. In those two decades, we saw an unprecedented squeeze on local government finance that led to real cuts in services.

**David Melding** *rose—*

**Peter Black:** I will not give way. I remember year after year of budget discussions that led to schools having to absorb pay rises, teachers taking early retirement or being made redundant, class sizes rising, headteachers relying on supermarkets for computers and vital building maintenance and capital work being allowed to slip further behind. If there is a crisis in education funding, its roots lie in those years of Tory parsimony. If there was a gap between England and Wales, it originated from decisions taken by Conservative Secretaries of State for Wales who had no roots in this country, and who, at least in one case, sent money back to the Treasury rather than invest it in children's education. That kind of underspending is not easy to reverse, even in four years. However, a start has been made. As a school governor and a councillor today, the crisis is not—

**The Presiding Officer:** Are you giving way to Alun Cairns?

**Peter Black:** No. The Tories will have a chance to respond afterwards. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Peter Black:** That is not to say that the Labour Government could not have done better; it could. However, the partnership Government of this Assembly is committed to education and to funding it properly. That

**Peter Black:** Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd yn Abertawe ac fel llywodraethwr ysgol. Ceir ymdeimlad rhyfedd o afrealiti wrth gymryd rhan mewn dadl lle mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn galw am wario arian ychwanegol ar addysg. I'r rheini ohonom a oedd yn gynghorwyr yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au, mae'r eironi yn ingol. Yn ystod y ddau ddegawd hynny, gwelsom wasgfa ddiglyffelyb ar gyllid llywodraeth leol a arweiniodd at doriadau gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau.

**David Melding** *a gododd—*

**Peter Black:** Nid ildiaf. Flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn cofiaf am drafodaethau ar gyllid a arweiniodd at ysgolion yn gorfod ymdopi â thalu codiadau cyflog, athrawon yn ymddeol yn gynnar neu'n cael eu diswyddo, maint dosbarthiadau'n codi, penaethiaid yn dibynnu ar archfarchnadoedd am gyfrifiaduron a gwaith cynnal a chadw hanfodol ar adeiladau a gwaith cyfalaf yn cael eu hesgeuluso. Os oes argyfwng mewn ariannu addysg, plannwyd y gwreiddiau yn y blynyddoedd hynny o gybydd-dod Toriaidd. Os cafwyd bwlch rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, deilliodd o benderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd gan Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol dros Gymru, nad oedd ganddynt wreiddiau yn y wlad hon, ac a anfonodd, o leiaf mewn un achos, arian yn ôl i'r Trysorlys yn hytrach na'i fuddsoddi mewn addysg plant. Nid yw'r math hwnnw o danwariant yn hawdd i'w wydroi, hyd yn oed mewn pedair blynedd. Fodd bynnag, dechreuwyd ar y gwaith. Fel llywodraethwr ysgol a chynghorydd heddiw, nid yw'r argyfwng—

**Y Llywydd:** A ildiwch i Alun Cairns?

**Peter Black:** Na wnaif. Caiff y Toriaid gyfle i ymateb wedyn. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Peter Black:** Nid yw hynny'n golygu na allai'r Llywodraeth Lafur fod wedi gwneud yn well; gallai fod wedi gwneud yn well. Fodd bynnag, mae Llywodraeth bartneriaeth y Cynulliad hwn wedi ymrwymo i addysg ac

is reflected in our budget. The Conservative mistrust of local democracy has not changed. They want us to run everything from the Assembly because they have Members and a profile in Cardiff Bay, but only a few councillors in Wales. That is not acceptable to the majority in this Chamber, who, although they may have reservations about the way that some councils are run, recognise that councillors are elected by local people and are accountable to them for their actions. That is why it is right that spending decisions, whether on education or social services, are made locally to take account of local circumstances. Our job is to provide the resources and the framework in which those decisions can be made and that is what we are doing. This motion also demonstrates that the Conservatives do not understand devolution. As a result of devolution, we do not have comparable spending patterns in England and Wales. Devolution is about Wales doing its own thing. That means aspiring to better quality services, higher levels of achievement, but also, greater freedom for local councils, which can help us achieve our targets through policy agreements and through the pressure that their electorate exerts on them.

Liberal Democrat councils piloted local management of schools. If we go further—and envisaged by the Tories—and pay money directly to schools, we will, effectively, have done away with LEAs. Wales has a disproportionate number of small schools, many of which are isolated. They would not be able to cope with the paperwork and the responsibility if LEA's were abolished. The policy would penalise small, rural schools. The Assembly's budget has allocated substantial additional resources for education. Nearly £300 million is available over three years to tackle the problems of inadequate buildings. There is also additional revenue funds of £87 million over three years for education, which we envisage will be used to reduce junior class sizes, improve the performance of pupils at key stage 3 and support under-performing schools. That is additional to the extra 5.6 per cent for local

i'w ariannu'n gywir. Adlewyrchir hynny yn ein cyllideb. Ni newidiodd drwgdybiaeth y Ceidwadwyr o ddemocratiaeth leol. Dymunant inni redeg popeth o'r Cynulliad am fod ganddynt Aelodau ac amlygrwydd ym Mae Caerdydd, ond dim ond ychydig o gynghorwyr yng Nghymru. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol i'r mwyafrif yn y Siambr hon, sydd, er bod ganddynt amheuan am y ffordd y caiff rhai cynghorau eu rhedeg, yn cydnabod yr etholir cynghorwyr gan bobl leol a'u bod yn atebol iddynt am eu gweithrediadau. Dyna pam ei bod yn iawn y gwneir penderfyniadau ar wariant, pa un a ydynt ar addysg neu wasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn lleol i ystyried amgylchiadau lleol. Ein gwaith ni yw darparu'r adnoddau a'r fframwaith ar gyfer gwneud y penderfyniadau hynny a dyna'r hyn a wnawn. Dengys y cynnig hwn hefyd nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn deall datganoli. O ganlyniad i ddatganoli, nid oes gennym batrymau gwario cymaradwy yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae datganoli'n ymwneud â Chymru'n gwneud pethau yn ei ffordd ei hun. Golyga hynny ddyheu am wasanaethau o ansawdd well, lefelau cyrhaeddiad uwch, ond hefyd, mwy o ryddid i gynghorau lleol, a all ein helpu i gyflawni ein targedau drwy gytundebau polisi a thrwy'r pwysau a rydd eu hetholwyr arnynt.

Cynghorau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a ragbrofodd reoli ysgolion yn lleol. Os awn ymlaen—fel y rhagwela'r Toriaid—a thalu arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, byddwn, mewn gwirionedd, wedi cael gwared ag AALL. Mae gan Gymru nifer anghymesur o ysgolion bach, llawer ohonynt yn ynysig. Ni allent ymdopi â'r gwaith papur a'r cyfrifoldeb pe dilëid AALL. Byddai'r polisi'n cosbi ysgolion gwledig, bach. Dyrannodd cyllideb y Cynulliad adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol i addysg. Mae bron i £300 miliwn ar gael dros dair blynedd i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau adeiladau annigonol. Ceir hefyd arian refeniw ychwanegol o £87 miliwn dros dair blynedd ar gyfer addysg, y rhagwelwn y caiff ei ddefnyddio i ostwng maint dosbarthiadau iau, gwella perfformiad disgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 a chynnal ysgolion sydd yn tangyflawni. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at y 5.6 y cant

government next year.

As Jane Davidson said, DfEE allocates a large proportion of its funding to the Assembly by direct grant. We allocate nearly all our funding via the local government funding settlement. As has been said, provisional figures for 2000-01 on a pupil basis indicated that Welsh councils have budgeted to spend an average of £2,870 per pupil. The English average, excluding London, is lower than that at £2,840. Again, the Welsh average is higher than in eight of the 10 English regions. Those figures show that the charges made by the Conservatives and others are false and that there is no justification for the direct funding that is called for in this motion. As a Democrat, I ask you to oppose this motion.

11:55 a.m.

**Nick Bourne:** All Members recognise that this issue is very important. I also commend the Minister on her honesty because she seemed to recognise that there was a fundamental difference between the Labour Party and the Conservatives on this. Furthermore, inherent in Plaid Cymru's comments, which were also honest, was a great difference of opinion. We trust schools and headteachers to spend their money in consultation with their staff, governors and parents. The Labour Party and Plaid Cymru do not.

However, what sticks in my craw is the Liberal Democrats' attitude. I will deal, for a moment, with the least important part of the debate. The Liberal Democrats did the most extraordinary cartwheels. I thought that they would say nothing. They are better when they say nothing because we can then assume that they are ignorant on the issue. However, when they get up to say something, it is embarrassing in the extreme. When this was debated previously, the current Minister for Culture warmly supported payment going directly to schools through the conduit of the local education authorities. Apparently now, that is bad

ychwanegol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol y flwyddyn nesaf.

Fel y dywedodd Jane Davidson, dyranna'r Adran Addysg a Chyflogaeth gyfran fawr o'i chyllid i'r Cynulliad drwy grant uniongyrchol. Dyrannwn bron y cyfan o'n cyllid drwy setliad cyllid llywodraeth leol. Fel y dywedwyd, dangosodd ffigurau dros dro ar gyfer 2000-01 ar sail disgybl fod cynghorau Cymru wedi cyllido i wario £2,870 y disgybl ar gyfartaledd. Mae cyfartaledd Lloegr, ac eithrio Llundain, yn is na hynny ar £2,840. Unwaith eto, mae'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru yn uwch nag yn wyth o'r 10 rhanbarth yn Lloegr. Dengys y ffigurau hynny mai ffug yw'r cyhuddiadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr ac eraill ac nid oes cyfiawnhad dros y cyllido uniongyrchol y gelwir amdano yn y cynnig hwn. Fel Democrat, gofynnaf ichi wrthwynebu'r cynnig hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'r holl Aelodau'n cydnabod bod y mater hwn yn bwysig iawn. Cymeradwyaf y Gweinidog hefyd am ei gonestrwydd oherwydd ymddengys iddi gydnabod bod gwahaniaeth sylfaenol rhwng y Blaid Lafur a'r Ceidwadwyr ar hyn. At hynny, yr oedd gwahaniaeth barn sylweddol yn sylwadau Plaid Cymru, a oedd hefyd yn onest. Ymddiriedwn yn yr ysgolion a'r penaethiaid i wario eu harian trwy ymgynghori â'u staff, llywodraethwyr a rhieni. Nid yw'r Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru yn fodlon gwneud hynny.

Fodd bynnag, agwedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sydd yn mynd o dan fy nghroen. Ymdriniaf, am eiliad, â rhan fwyaf dinod y ddadl. Bu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn olwyn-droi'n rhyfeddol. Tybiais na fyddent yn dweud dim. Maent yn well pan na ddywedant ddim oherwydd wedyn gallwn dybio eu bod yn anwybodus am y mater. Fodd bynnag, pan godant i ddweud rhywbeth, mae'n codi cywilydd mawr arnoch. Pan drafodwyd hyn yn flaenorol, rhoddodd y Gweinidog presennol dros Ddiwylliant groeso cynnes i daliadau yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion drwy sianeli'r awdurdodau addysg lleol. Erbyn



news. They have already made a U-turn today on the National Museums and Galleries of Wales—

**Jenny Randerson** *rose*—

**Nick Bourne:** I will give way in a moment.

They have made a U-turn today on the National Museums and Galleries of Wales, we should not be surprised that they are now making one on schools. I begin to see why they need these special advisers, but my only objection is that they are being paid for out of the public purse in addition to the money that the Liberal Democrat group gets in the Assembly.

**Jenny Randerson:** I did not respond when a member of your group made a comment suggesting that I had no concern for my granny. Although, I consider that to be just as bad as any other comment. That phrase has strong moral implications. It is extremely rude and is unacceptable in this Chamber. However, I feel obliged to repeat what Jane Davidson said, that the mechanism this year is the same as last year's, and therefore, I stand by my comments last year because they relate to this year in exactly the same way.

**Nick Bourne:** As I thought, that was a cartwheel dressed up as a policy with vision. However, the reality is there for everyone to see—they have done a total cartwheel. I am sorry that she has had a sense of humour bypass on the 'selling her granny' comment. She will find that that comment is in currency throughout the country and that most people would not take offence. However, that is a matter for the Presiding Officer —

**Jenny Randerson** *rose*—

**Nick Bourne:** I will not give way on that point, because I have a limited amount of time—

hyn, mae'n debyg, newyddion drwg yw hynny. Gwnaethant dro pedol eisoes heddiw ar Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru—

**Jenny Randerson** *a gododd*—

**Nick Bourne:** Ildiaf yn y funud.

Gwnaethant dro pedol heddiw ar Amgueddfeydd ac Orielau Cenedlaethol Cymru, ni ddylem synnu eu bod yn awr yn gwneud un ar ysgolion. Yr wyf yn dechrau gweld pam bod angen yr ymgynghorwyr arbenigol hyn arnynt, ond fy unig wrthwynebiad yw eu bod yn cael eu talu allan o bwrs y wlad yn ychwanegol at yr arian a gaiff grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Cynulliad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid ymatebais pan wnaeth aelod o'ch grŵp sylw a awgrymodd nad oeddwn yn poeni am fy nain. Er yr ystyriaf bod hwnnw cynddrwg ag unrhyw sylw arall. Mae gan y cymal hwnnw oblygiadau moesol cryf. Mae'n hynod anghwrtais ac yn annerbyniol yn y Siambr hon. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod yn rhaid imi ailddweud yr hyn a ddywedodd Jane Davidson, sef bod y mecanwaith eleni yr un ag yr oedd y llynedd, ac felly, yr wyf yn glynu at y sylwadau a wneuthum y llynedd gan eu bod yn berthnasol yn yr un modd i eleni.

**Nick Bourne:** Fel y tybiais, yr oedd honno'n olwyndro a addurnwyd fel polisi â gweledigaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r realiti yno i bawb ei weld—maent wedi olwyndroi'n llwyr. Mae'n flin gennyf nad oedd ganddi'r synnwyr digrifwch i dderbyn y sylw am 'werthu ei nain'. Bydd yn canfod bod y sylw hwnnw'n cylchredeg ledled y wlad ac ni fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn teimlo sarhad. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n fater i'r Llywydd—

**Jenny Randerson** *a gododd*—

**Nick Bourne:** Nid ildiaf ar y pwynt hwnnw, oherwydd mae fy amser yn brin—

**Jenny Randerson:** Presiding Officer, I believe that the indication that someone would sell his or her grandmother is as serious as calling someone a liar. [*Laughter.*]

**Presiding Officer:** Order. I will not rule on this matter in the middle of a speech.

**Nick Bourne:** The rest of us can try to speculate what Mike German's granny would look like, and I do not think that he would take offence to my comment, but we will have to find that out later.

I will continue with the more serious issue in this debate relating to whether money should go directly to schools or to local education authorities. We received a letter that was addressed to a LEA suggesting, in a phrase that I found repugnant, that it was not the policy of the administration to give money to schools in plain, brown paper envelopes. Why not? Because we do not trust them or because the administration does not trust them? That attitude is very old Labour is it not? Perhaps, that is back in fashion after yesterday. We will have to ask its business manager whether that will have implications on how things are run here. I suspect that it is a case of 'big brother' or rather 'big sister' in the shape of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, and there is no offence intended by that remark.

However, this is about much more than semantics; it is about whether schools can be trusted to react to local needs. We know that the money is not going directly to schools. In Powys, for example, 75 per cent of the money either goes directly to schools or is flowed through to them. That is far less than the Vale of Glamorgan and, in fairness, Torfaen, which pass on 84 per cent.

**Cynog Dafis:** Bu cyfeiriad y bore yma at safbwyntiau Cymdeithas y Prifathrawon Uwchradd a Chymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon ynghylch taliadau uniongyrchol i ysgolion, ac y mae'r cyfeiriad hwnnw'n gywir. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i bawb ddeall bod yr undebau athrawon eraill yn cefnogi

**Jenny Randerson:** Lywydd, credaf fod nodi y byddai rhywun yn gwerthu ei nain mor ddifrifol â galw rhywun yn gelwyddgi. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ddyfarnaf ar y mater hwn yng nghanol araith.

**Nick Bourne:** Gall y gweddill ohonom geisio dyfalu sut olwg fyddai ar nain Mike German, ac ni chredaf y byddai'n teimlo sarhad oherwydd fy sylw, ond bydd rhaid inni ganfod hynny'n ddiweddarach.

Parhaf gyda'r mater mwy difrifol yn y ddadl hon sydd yn ymwneud ag a ddylai arian fynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion neu i awdurdodau addysg lleol. Derbyniasom lythyr a gyfeiriwyd at AALI yn awgrymu, mewn cymal a oedd yn wrthun i mi, nad oedd yn bolisi gan y weinyddiaeth i roi arian i ysgolion mewn amlenni papur brown, plaen. Pam lai? Am nad ydym ni'n ymddiried ynddynt neu am nad yw'r weinyddiaeth yn ymddiried ynddynt? Onid yw'r agwedd honno yn hynod o hen Lafur? Efallai bod hynny'n ffasiynol unwaith eto ar ôl ddoe. Bydd yn rhaid inni ofyn i'w rheolwr busnes a fydd gan hynny oblygiadau ar sut y rhedir pethau yma. Tybiaf ei fod yn achos o 'frawd mawr' neu'n hytrach 'chwaer fawr' ar ffurf y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ac ni fwriedir unrhyw sarhad gan y sylw hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn ymwneud â llawer mwy na semanteg; mae'n ymwneud ag a ellir ymddiried mewn ysgolion i ymateb i anghenion lleol. Gwyddom nad yw'r arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion. Ym Mhowys, er enghraifft, mae 75 y cant o'r arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion neu caiff ei lifo atynt. Mae hynny'n llawer llai na Bro Morgannwg, ac, â bod yn deg, Tor-faen, sydd yn trosglwyddo 84 y cant.

**Cynog Dafis:** Reference was made this morning to the opinions of the Secondary Heads Association and the National Association of Headteachers on direct payments to schools, and that reference is correct. However, everyone must understand that the other teaching unions support

taliadau i ysgolion drwy awdurdodau addysg lleol ac mai hwy sydd yn cynrychioli i'r mwyafrif o bobl sy'n gweithio mewn addysg, mewn ysgolion.

**Nick Bourne:** That is a fair point and I have not tried to suggest that this is not a genuine debate, on a genuine issue. I recognise that Plaid Cymru and the Labour Party take a different stance from the Welsh Conservative Party and that there are, no doubt, individuals who support their viewpoints. However, it remains the case that most parents and schools—and I have the evidence here, certainly from Powys—would favour money going directly to the schools so that they can decide on their priorities. Surely, that is what devolution is about? Why does the administration not feel able to trust local schools to deal with their own money? That is at the nub of this issue. When Rosemary Butler was Secretary for Education and Children, the money was passed directly to the schools from local authorities. The Liberal Democrats approved of that, but they are now doing cartwheels. The administration needs to answer a simple question: why does it not trust headteachers and schools to make decisions that affect their own areas?

**Y Llywydd:** A wnaiff yr holl athrawon cofrestredig sefyll?

**Mick Bates, Christine Chapman, Cynog Dafis, Andrew Davies, Ron Davies, Sue Essex, Michael German, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder ac Owen John Thomas a gododd.**

payments to schools through LEAs and that they represent the majority of people working in education, in schools.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg ac ni cheisiais awgrymu nad yw hon yn ddadl wirioneddol, ar fater gwirioneddol. Sylweddolaf fod safbwynt Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur yn wahanol i Blaid Geidwadol Cymru ac, yn ddiamau, bod unigolion sydd yn cefnogi eu safbwyntiau. Fodd bynnag, erys y ffaith y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o rieni ac ysgolion—ac mae gennyf y dystiolaeth yma, yn sicr o Bowys—yn ffafrio arian yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion fel y gallant benderfynu ar eu blaenoriaethau. Onid dyna yw ystyr datganoli? Pam na theimla'r weinyddiaeth y gall ymddiried yn yr ysgolion lleol i ymdrin â'u harian eu hunain? Dyna sydd wrth wraidd y mater hwn. Pan oedd Rosemary Butler yn Ysgrifennydd Addysg a Phlant, trosglwyddwyd yr arian yn uniongyrchol i'r ysgolion gan yr awdurdodau lleol. Cymeradwyodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hynny, ond maent yn awr yn olwyn-droi. Mae angen i'r weinyddiaeth ateb cwestiwn syml: pam nad yw'n ymddiried yn yr ysgolion a'r penaethiaid i wneud penderfyniadau sydd yn effeithio ar eu hardaloedd eu hunain?

**The Presiding Officer:** Will all the registered teachers stand?

**Mick Bates, Christine Chapman, Cynog Dafis, Andrew Davies, Ron Davies, Sue Essex, Michael German, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder and Owen John Thomas rose.**

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 1: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David

Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 30, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 9.  
Amendment 2: For 30, Abstain 14, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.  
 Amendment 3: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 4: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 5: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth

Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.  
 Amendment 6: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter

Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8.  
 Amendment 7: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter



Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 8: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd

Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*this National Assembly:*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. welcomes the Labour-Liberal Democrat Partnership Government's proposals to allocate extra money to local authorities over the next three years in order to:*

*1. yn croesawu cynigion Llywodraeth Partneriaeth Llafur-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i ddyrannu arian ychwanegol i'r awdurdodau lleol dros y tair blynedd nesaf er mwyn:*

*reduce class sizes;  
fund training grants for new primary school teachers;  
invest in the upgrade of school buildings;  
re-introduce free school milk for all pupils at key stage 1;*

*lleihau maint dosbarthiadau;  
ariannu grantiau hyfforddi ar gyfer athrawon cynradd newydd;  
buddsoddi mewn uwchraddio adeiladau ysgol;  
ail-gyflwyno llaeth ysgol yn rhad ac am ddim i'r disgyblion yng nghyfnod allweddol 1;*

*2. notes that, in 2000-01, provisional figures show that schools in England outside the London area received an average of £2,840 per pupil, compared with £2,870 per pupil in Wales;*

*2. yn nodi bod y ffigurau dros dro ar gyfer 2000-01 yn dangos bod ysgolion yn Lloegr, y tu allan i ardal Llundain, wedi derbyn £2,840 y disgybl ar gyfartaledd, o'i gymharu â £2,870 y disgybl yng Nghymru;*

*3. welcomes the work being undertaken by the National Assembly and the Welsh Local Government Association to examine and address the issue of the wide variation in per pupil funding between Welsh authorities;*

*3. yn croesawu'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, i archwilio a delio â'r amrywiaeth eang yn yr arian sy'n cael ei wario y pen ar ddisgyblion gan yr awdurdodau yng Nghymru;*

*4. welcomes the focus on improved outcomes based on shared priorities, being introduced by policy agreements between local authorities and the National Assembly; and*

*4. yn croesawu'r canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau gwell yn seiliedig ar rannu blaenoriaethau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno gan gytundebau polisi rhwng yr awdurdodau lleol a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol; ac*

*5. calls upon the Government of Wales to provide comprehensive and objective data so that a clear understanding is possible of funding levels and patterns in Wales and of comparisons between Wales and the other countries of the UK.*

*5. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ddarparu data cynhwysfawr a gwrthrychol, fel bod dealltwriaeth glir o'r lefelau a'r patrymau cyllid yng Nghymru a'r cymariaethau rhwng Cymru a gwledydd eraill y DU.*

*Cynnig wedi ei ddiwygio: O blaid 29, Ymatal 14, Yn erbyn 9.  
Amended motion: For 29, Abstain 14, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

12:05 p.m.

**Dadl Fer  
Short Debate**

**Tai yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru  
Housing in Rural Wales**

**Dafydd Wigley:** Atgoffaf y Cynulliad mai **Dafydd Wigley:** I remind the Assembly that

dadl ynglŷn â phroblemau tai gwledig, nid am unrhyw gynghorydd sir, yw hon. Pwysleisiaf fod unrhyw awgrym y dylid monitro unigolion sydd yn symud i Gymru yn annerbyniol. Mae Simon Glyn wedi ymddiheuro am ei sylwadau. Fel yr awgrymodd Tony Blair mewn cyd-destun arall ddoe, pan fo unigolyn yn disgyn ar ei fai, dylem dderbyn ei ymddiheuriad yn raslon.

Pwysleisiaf hefyd, fel y gwneuthum ar bob cyfle pan oeddwn yn llywydd Plaid Cymru, ein bod yn ystyried pawb sydd yn byw yng Nghymru yn ddinasyddion Cymreig cydradd, beth bynnag fo'u lliw, hil, iaith neu grefydd. Ni ddylai polisi cyhoeddus wahaniaethu ar y fath sail. Glynaf at yr egwyddorion hynny o hyd.

Byddaf yn rhoi cyfle i Ron Davies a Janet Davies gyfrannu at y dadl pan fyddaf wedi gorffen, yn unol â'r ceisiadau a dderbyniais.

Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle amserol hwn i osod gerbron y Cynulliad y problemau ac anawsterau sydd yn wynebu pobl ifanc, yn arbennig, wrth geisio cael tai mewn ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru, megis Dwyfor yn fy etholaeth i. Codaf y mater hwn o ganlyniad i drafodaeth yng Nghyngor Sir Gwynedd ac adroddiad a gyflwynwyd i bwyllgor perthnasol y cyngor. Mae'n broblem economaidd, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol. Mae'n ymwneud â hawl sylfaenol, sef hawl y genhedlaeth nesaf i gael byw, os y dymuna, yn y gymuned y cafodd ei magu ynddi. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Aelodau Cynulliad sydd yn cynrychioli ardaloedd poblog yn amddiffyn yr hawl i blant Merthyr, dyweder, gael byw ym Merthyr, neu blant Casnewydd gael byw yng Nghasnewydd, os y dymunant hynny. Pam, felly, na ddylai plant Garn Fadrun fyw yng Ngarn Fadrun, neu blant Tudweiliog gael yr hawl i fyw yn Nhudweiliog, os y dymunant hynny? Onid yw hyn yn rhan o'u treftadaeth, ac yn hawl cynhenid iddynt?

Y gwir amdani yw bod pwerau economaidd heddiw yn bygwth eu hamddifadu o'r hawl hwn. Dyletswydd pob haen o lywodraeth yw

this debate is about the problems of rural housing, not about any county councillor. I emphasise that any suggestion that individuals who move into Wales should be monitored is unacceptable. Simon Glyn has apologised for his remarks. As Tony Blair suggested in another context yesterday, when an individual accepts blame, we should accept his apology gracefully.

I also emphasise, as I did at every opportunity when I was president of Plaid Cymru, that we consider everyone who lives in Wales as equal Welsh citizens, whatever their colour, race, language or religion. Public policy should not differentiate on such a basis. I continue to stand by those principles.

I will afford Ron Davies and Janet Davies an opportunity to contribute to the debate when I have finished, in line with the requests that I received.

I am glad of this timely opportunity to place before the Assembly the problems and difficulties that face young people, in particular, in attempting to obtain homes in rural areas of Wales, such as Dwyfor in my constituency. I raise this matter as a result of discussion in Gwynedd County Council and a report that was presented to the relevant council committee. It is an economic, social and cultural problem. It involves a fundamental right, namely the right of the next generation to live, if it so wishes, in the community in which it was raised. I am sure that Assembly Members who represent populous areas would defend the right of Merthyr children, for example, to live in Merthyr, or Newport children to live in Newport, if they so wish. Why, therefore, should the children of Garn Fadrun not live in Garn Fadrun, or the children of Tudweiliog not have the right to live in Tudweiliog, if they so wish? Is this not a part of their heritage, and their inherent right?

The truth is that economic powers today threaten to deprive them of this right. It is the duty of government at every level to rein in

ceisio ffrwyno neu gyfeirio ffactorau economaidd er mwyn gwarchod yr hawliau cymdeithasol hyn. Nid problemau newydd yw'r rhain, ond maent yn gwaethygu heddiw wrth i'r gagendor dyfu rhwng lefel incwm a chyfoeth llawer o bobl yn y dinasoedd a lefel incwm llawer o bobl, yn enwedig pobl ifanc, yng nghefn gwlad.

Nid yw'r broblem yn ymwneud â Chymru yn unig. Sylwais ar adroddiad gan ohebydd materion amgylcheddol *The Guardian*, Paul Brown, ar 6 Ionawr a nodai

'The trend of rich people buying up all the available housing in the countryside and forcing poorer young families to move to cities is increasing dramatically, according to research.'

Mae'r broblem yn bodoli y tu allan i Gymru, ond mae'n broblem arbennig yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru. Mae'r ardaloedd yn Lloegr sydd wedi wynebu'r un broblem wedi cymryd camau i geisio ymdopi â'r broblem. Mae angen inni wneud hynny yng Nghymru hefyd. Er enghraifft, yr oedd tŷ ar werth yn ddiweddar ar lethrau'r Wyddfa. Y pris gofyn oedd tua £125,000, am dŷ a oedd ymhell o fod yn blasdy. Yr oedd rhywun o'r ardal yn awyddus i'w brynu ac yn cynnig hyd at £100,000 amdano—y mwyaf y gallai ei fforddio—ond gwerthwyd y tŷ am bris uwch ac, os deallaf yn iawn, y bydd yn troi'n dŷ haf. Nid yw gwerthu tŷ am £100,000 yn anghyffredin yng Nghaerdydd. Caiff tai teras ym Mharc y Rhath eu gwerthu am tua £80,000. Fodd bynnag, mae £100,000 yn ffortiwn yng nghefn gwlad Gwynedd ac y tu hwnt i gyrraedd llu o bobl ifanc. Mae hyn yn deillio o'r gwahaniaeth enfawr rhwng lefelau incwm a gwerth eiddo dinasoedd megis Caerdydd a phentrefi gwledig Llŷn ac Eifionydd. Mae hyn hefyd yn wir am rannau o Ddyfed.

Gwelir hyn yn y ffigurau cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen. Yng Ngwynedd yn 1996, £7,678 y pen oedd y ffigur. Yng Nghaerdydd, £10,715 y pen oedd y ffigur, ac yn Wrecsam a'r glannau, £11,593 y pen oedd y ffigur. Yr oedd incwm y pen 40 y cant yn uwch yng Nghaerdydd nag yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r gwaith sydd ar gael mewn ardal megis Dwyfor yn aml yn dymhorol ac ar gyflog isel. Os yw trigolion yr ardaloedd

or direct economic factors in order to protect these social rights. These problems are not new, but they are worsening today as the gulf widens between the level of income and wealth of many people in the cities and that of many people, especially young people, in rural areas.

The problem not only concerns Wales. I noticed a report by *The Guardian's* environment correspondent, Paul Brown, on 6 January that noted

The problem exists outside of Wales, but it is a particular problem in Wales's rural areas. The areas in England that faced the same problem have taken steps to try to cope with it. We also need to do that in Wales. For example, a house was for sale recently on the slopes of Snowdon. The asking price was about £125,000, for a house that was far from being a palace. Somebody from the area was keen to buy it and offered up to £100,000 for it—the most he could afford—but the house was sold for a higher price, and if I understand correctly, it will become a holiday home. Selling a house for £100,000 is not uncommon in Cardiff. Terraced houses in Roath Park are sold for about £80,000. However, £100,000 is a fortune in rural Gwynedd and beyond the reach of many young people. This arises from the huge difference in income levels and property value of cities such as Cardiff and the rural villages of Llyn and Eifionydd. That is also true of parts of Dyfed.

This can be seen in the figures for gross domestic product per capita. In Gwynedd in 1996, the figure was £7,678 per capita. In Cardiff, the figure was £10,715 per capita, and in Wrexham and the coast the figure was £11,593 per capita. Income per capita was 40 per cent higher in Cardiff than in rural areas. The work available in an area such as Dwyfor is often seasonal and poorly paid. If the inhabitants of these areas travel to

hyn yn teithio i'w gwaith—ac weithiau y mae'n rhaid iddynt deithio gymaint â 40 millitr bob ffordd—mae pris petrol yn llyncu rhan sylweddol o'u cyflog. Ar y gorau, felly, i weithwyr cyffredin sydd yn byw yn yr ardaloedd hyn, mae bywyd yn anodd. Pan geisiant brynu tŷ, mae bron yn amhosibl.

Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd llawer yn rhentu ty. Bu hen gyngor gwledig Llŷn yn flaengar yn codi clystyrau bach o dai cyngor mewn pentrefi megis Aberdaron, Llaniestyn a Chwilog. Erbyn hyn, fodd bynnag, mae llawer o'r tai cyngor hyn wedi eu gwerthu ac nid ydynt ar gael i'w gosod. Yn Nwyfor, mae cymaint â 30 y cant o'r stoc tai cyngor wedi ei werthu ers 1980. Ym Meddgelert, o 16 tŷ cyngor a oedd yno yn wreiddiol, mae 12 wedi eu gwerthu. Dim ond pedwar sydd ar ôl. Mae wyth allan o 16 tŷ cyngor wedi eu gwerthu yn Nhudweiliog. Dyma ffrwyth polisiau Thatcheridd yn mynd i galon ein cymunedau gwledig. Mae'r cyfle i rentu yn breifat mewn pentref fel Aberdaron yn isel, oherwydd caiff y rhent ei seilio ar y farchnad ar gyfer ymwelyr yr haf. Ni all teuluoedd bach gydag incwm wythnosol o tua £250—a chofir bod gan 40 y cant o boblogaeth Gwynedd incwm is na hynny—brynu tai yn y pentrefi hyn. O ganlyniad, wynebant broblemau mawr. Ni allant brynu na rhentu tai. Eu hunig ddewis yn aml yw symud o'u cynefin i drefi neu ddinasoedd. Er mai dim ond i Gaernarfon y bydd rhai yn symud, bydd eraill yn symud ymhellach i ffwrdd.

12:15 p.m.

**Rod Richards** *rose*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Ni chymeraf ymyriad. Yr wyf am barchu cyfyngiadau amser y ddadl fer.

Mae hyn yn amddifadu pentrefi o deuluoedd ifanc y fro. Arwain hynny at ostyngiad yn nifer y plant mewn ysgolion gwledig, sydd yn rhoi pwysau ar i'r ysgolion hynny gau. Mewn rhai pentrefi, mae cymaint â 40 y cant o'r tai eisoes yn dai haf. Pan ddigwydd hynny, bydd incwm siop y pentref yn gostwng, bydd y swyddfa bost mewn perygl o gau a bydd busnes yn crebachu yn y gaeaf. Dyma hanfod y problemau enfawr sydd yn

work—and sometimes they have to travel as much as 40 miles each way—the price of petrol swallows a significant part of their salary. At best, therefore, for ordinary workers living in these areas, life is hard. When they try to buy a house, it is almost impossible.

In the past, many people rented houses. The former Lleyrn rural council was progressive in building small clusters of council houses in villages such as Aberdaron, Llaniestyn and Chwilog. By now, however, many of these council houses have been sold and are not available to let. In Dwyfor, as much as 30 per cent of the council housing stock has been sold since 1980. In Beddgelert, of the 16 original council houses, 12 have been sold. Only four are left. Eight out of 16 council houses have been sold in Tudweiliog. This is the result of Thatcherite policies striking at the heart of our rural communities. The opportunity to rent privately in a village such as Aberdaron is low, because the rent is based on the market for summer visitors. Small families with a weekly income of £250—and we must remember that 40 per cent of the population of Gwynedd have an income lower than that—cannot buy houses in these villages. As a result, they face great problems. They cannot buy nor rent houses. Often, their only choice is to move from their own area to towns or cities. Although some only move to Caernarfon, others move further away.

**Rod Richards** *a gododd*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** I will not take an intervention. I will respect the time limitations of the short debate.

This deprives villages of the area's young families. That leads to a decrease in the number of children in rural schools, which puts pressure on those schools to close. In some villages, as many as 40 per cent of the houses are already holiday homes. When that happens, the income of the village shop will decrease, there will be a risk of the post office closing and business will dry up in winter. That is the thrust of the huge

wynebu cefn gwlad.

Caiff lefel incwm isel hefyd ei adlewyrchu yng nghyflwr y tai. Yng Ngwynedd, cafodd 47 y cant o'r stoc tai eu hadeiladu cyn 1919, o'i gymharu â 32 y cant yng Nghymru gyfan. Yn 1991, yr oedd 38 y cant o'r tai yng Ngwynedd heb o leiaf un o'r cyfleusterau sylfaenol, o'i gymharu ag 19 y cant yng Nghymru gyfan. Mae'r ffigurau gwaethaf i'w gweld ym Mhen Llyn.

Beth yw'r ateb felly? Yn y tymor hir, mae hyn yn cynnig sialens i wella'r economi a sicrhau dewis eang o waith ar gyflogau da. Fodd bynnag, os disgwyliwn am y cyfnod hir, bydd y cymunedau hyn wedi marw. Rhaid cymryd camau eraill yn awr. Mae Cyngor Gwynedd wedi edrych yn ofalus ar y posibiladau. Ymddengys bod saith o newidiadau polisi a allai leddfu, os nad dileu, y broblem. Cydnabyddaf i rai o bwyntiau'r cyngor ymddangos yn 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl Cymru', y papur ymgynghorol a gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth yn ddiweddar. Yr oeddwn yn falch o nodi fod y papur hwnnw yn cydnabod natur a maint y broblem wledig. Oni bai am y cyfyngiadau amser, byddwn yn dyfynnu o baragraff 6.5 y papur, sydd yn cyfeirio at y stoc tai cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, fe dynnaf sylw at argymhelliad 46, a ddywed

'Ystyrir mai diboblogi cymunedau a phrynu ail gartrefi yw'r prif fygythiad i'r iaith Gymraeg.'

Croesawaf hefyd yr ymatebion yn y papur i argymhellion eraill, yn arbennig y rhai ynglŷn â chynlluniau perchenogaeth cost isel, gwell cydnabyddiaeth o amddifadedd gwledig, yr angen i wella'r arolwg cyflwr stoc tai, newid rheolau cynllunio i ddarparu eithriad gwledig ac ystyried ffactorau ieithyddol o fewn y gyfundrefn gyfreithiol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen mwy o ymroddiad gan yr adran i droi'r argymhellion hyn yn bolisi gweithredol. Gobeithiaf y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol ateb y pwyntiau hynny yn ei ymateb i'r ddadl.

Croesawaf hefyd gyhoeddiad Edwina Hart

problems facing rural areas.

Low income is also reflected in the condition of housing. In Gwynedd, 47 per cent of the housing stock was built prior to 1919, compared to 32 per cent in Wales as a whole. In 1991, 38 per cent of housing in Gwynedd was without at least one of the basic amenities, compared to 19 per cent in Wales as a whole. The worst figures are found on the Llyn Peninsula.

What is the answer therefore? In the long term, this offers a challenge to improve the economy and to ensure a wide choice of employment with good wages. However, if we wait for the long term, these communities will have perished. Other steps must be taken now. Gwynedd Council has considered the possibilities carefully. It appears that seven policy changes could alleviate, if not solve, the problem. I acknowledge that some of the council's points appeared in 'Better Homes for People in Wales', the consultation paper published recently by the Government. I was pleased to note that that paper acknowledged the nature and extent of the rural problem. If it were not for time limitations, I would quote paragraph 6.5 of the paper, which refers to the social housing stock. However, I will draw attention to recommendation 46, which states

'Depopulation of communities and the purchase of second homes are seen as the main threat to the Welsh language.'

I also welcome the responses in the paper to other recommendations, particularly those regarding low cost ownership schemes, better recognition of rural deprivation, the need to improve the housing stock condition survey, changing planning rules in order to provide a rural exemption and considering linguistic factors within the legal set-up. However, a greater commitment is required from the department to turn these recommendations into operational policy. I hope that the Deputy Minister for Local Government can answer those points in his response to the debate.

I also welcome Edwina Hart's announcement

ddoe ynglŷn â *flexible homebuy*. Faint o arian newydd a gaiff ein cynghorau ar gyfer hyn? Gofynnaf hynny yn sgîl yr hyn a ddigwyddodd i gyllid tai yn ystod y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Yn 1995-96, os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd y ffigur ar gyfer cyfalaf tai yng Nghymru tua £300 miliwn. Erbyn 1999-2000, yr oedd wedi disgyn i £196 miliwn. Dim ond £199 miliwn a fydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon o arian i ddechrau atgyweirio ein stoc tai, heb sôn am ariannu cynlluniau newydd. Yr ydym angen tai da am rent rhesymol yn ein pentrefi gwledig. Gan fod nifer y tai cyngor wedi gostwng, mae angen prynu tai o'r sector preifat am bris y farchnad neu adeiladu tai er mwyn eu gosod i ddiwallu anghenion lleol. Nid wyf yn llwyr ddeall pam na chaiff cynghorau eu hannog a'u cynorthwyo i wneud hyn. Bu cyfnod ar ddechrau'r 1990au pan ddigwyddai hynny i ryw raddau. Prynodd Cyngor Gwynedd nifer o dai i'w gosod yn y cyfnod hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, peidiodd hyn â bod yn bolisi yn ddiweddar ac nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ei annog.

O ganlyniad, mae mater adnoddau yn codi. Rhaid sicrhau bod pob ceiniog a ddaw o werthu tai cyngor yn cael ei ail-fuddsoddi er mwyn sicrhau bod tai ar gael i'w gosod i bobl yn y gymuned. Mae hefyd angen i awdurdodau lleol weithredu cynllun o'r math a fodolai rai blynnyddoedd yn ôl i alluogi tenantiaid tai cyngor sydd â'r hawl i brynu, i brynu tai yn y sector preifat. Drwy hynny, gwarchodir y tai cyngor fel eu bod ar gael i'w rhentu. Yn ogystal, os caiff tai eu hadeiladu i'w gosod, rhaid defnyddio amodau cynllunio i warchod defnydd o'r tai. Rhaid caniatáu i gynghorau fenthyg arian o'r Trysorlys ar gyfradd llog resymol gyda gwahaniaeth gwerth net y benthygiad, yn erbyn gwerth y ty, yn sefyll yn erbyn eu cyllideb cyfalaf. Byddai hynny'n llawer mwy ymarferol iddynt.

Trof yn awr at yr angen i alluogi pobl ar incwm cyffredin i brynu eiddo yn eu pentrefi ac yng nghefn gwlad. Golyga hyn brynu eiddo sydd eisoes yn bodoli neu a adeiladwyd yn bwrpasol i ddiwallu anghenion lleol. Nodaf fod Scottish Homes, er enghraifft, wedi darparu grant o 33 y cant

yesterday on flexible homebuy. How much new money will be given to our councils for this? I ask that question in view of what has happened to funding for housing during recent years. In 1995-96, if I recall correctly, the figure for housing capital in Wales was about £300 million. By 1999-2000, it had fallen to £196 million. Only £199 million will be available next year. That is not enough money to start repairing our housing stock, let alone fund new schemes. We need good housing for a reasonable rent in our rural villages. As the number of council houses has decreased, houses from the private sector must be bought at market value or houses must be built in order for them to be let to satisfy local needs. I do not completely understand why councils are not encouraged and assisted to do this. There was a period at the beginning of the 1990s when that happened to an extent. Gwynedd Council bought many houses to let during that period. However, this has ceased to be policy recently and the Government has not encouraged it.

As a result, the issue of resources arises. We must ensure that every penny that comes from selling council houses is re-invested in order to ensure that houses are available to be let to people in the community. Local authorities also need to implement the kind of scheme that existed some years ago to enable tenants in council houses who have the right to buy, to buy houses in the private sector. That scheme safeguards council housing to be let. In addition, if housing is built to be let, planning conditions must be used to safeguard the use of that housing. Councils must be allowed to borrow money from the Treasury at a reasonable interest rate with the net difference in the value of the loan, against the worth of the house, standing against their capital budget. That would be much more practical for them.

I now turn to the need to enable people on an ordinary income to buy property in their villages and in the countryside. This means buying property that already exists or that was built specifically to meet local needs. I note that Scottish Homes, for example, has provided a 33 per cent grant for some years



ers rhai blynyddoedd i helpu pobl leol mewn ardaloedd cefn gwlad i brynu tai. Mae'n werth edrych ar gynllun yr Alban.

to help local people in rural areas to buy housing. It is worth considering Scotland's scheme.

O ran y stoc tai presennol, â'u prisiau'n rhy uchel i brynwyr lleol, mae angen datblygu cynlluniau rhanberchenogaeth fel y cyfeiriwyd atynt ym mhapur y Llywodraeth. Mae angen gwneud hynny'n fuan i ddatrys y broblem hon.

Regarding the current housing stock, where prices are too high for local buyers, part-ownership schemes, such as those referred to in the Government paper, need to be developed. That needs to be done soon to solve this problem.

Mae angen hefyd edrych ar y gorchymynion sydd yn bodoli. Mae angen pwerau i reoli newid tai annedd yn dai haf. Byddai hyn yn bosibl o fewn pwerau'r Cynulliad: mae Offeryn Statudol Rhif 418 o dan Orchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Datblygu Caniataëdig Cyffredinol) 1995 yn caniatáu hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Byddai gofyn creu dosbarth defnydd newydd categori C4, efallai, yn Rhan C o Atodiad B o'r Gorchymyn, sef bod tŷ haf yn wahanol i annedd cyffredin. Byddai angen caniatâd cynllunio wedyn i droi tŷ annedd yn dŷ haf a gellid rheoli hyn yn ôl yr amgylchiadau lleol.

The existing orders also need to be examined. Powers are needed to control the conversion of dwellings into holiday homes. This would be possible within the Assembly's powers: Statutory Instrument No. 418 under the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) Order 1995 allows that. I hope that the Government will move in that direction. There would need to be a new category of use created, C4, perhaps, in Part C of Annex B of the Order, that holiday homes are distinct from ordinary dwellings. It would then be necessary to have planning permission to convert a dwelling into a holiday home and this could be controlled according to local circumstances.

O safbwynt adeiladu tai o'r newydd i'w gwerthu, rhaid cofio, mewn llawer o ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol, fod terfyn ar faint o dir sydd ar gael. Felly, mae'n bwysig bod y tir sydd ar gael yn mynd i ddiwallu anghenion lleol ac nid yn gwaethygu'r broblem. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn fodlon ymateb i hynny hefyd.

In terms of building new housing for sale, it must be remembered that in many areas of outstanding natural beauty there is a limit to the amount of available land. Therefore, it is important that any available land is used to meet local needs and does not exacerbate the problem. I hope that the Government will also be willing to respond to that.

Dylid edrych ar gynllun y Parc Cenedlaethol a fabwysiadwyd yn 1998 yn Ardal y Llynnoedd yn Lloegr sydd yn dweud yn syml

We should look at the National Park's scheme, adopted in 1998 in the Lake District of England, which simply states

'All new-build housing is only approved subject to local occupancy conditions.'

Os gellid gwneud hynny yn Ardal y Llynnoedd, mae modd ei wneud yng Nghymru.

If it can be done in the Lake District, it can be done in Wales.

I gloi, yr ateb yn y tymor hir yw atgyfnerthu'r economi wledig. Yn y cyfamser, mae mawr angen cymryd camau penodol i warchod hawliau trigolion ifanc ar

To close, the long-term answer is to strengthen the rural economy. In the meantime, there is a great need to take specific steps to safeguard the rights of

incwm isel yn y pentrefi gwledig, er mwyn iddynt gael parhau i fyw yn eu cymunedau. Gobeithiaf y cawn ymateb gan y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol i'r pwyntiau manwl a godais, a sicrwydd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod difrifoldeb y broblem, ac yn fodlon gweithredu'n fuan i gyflawni cyfiawnder cymdeithasol i drigolion gwledig.

**Ron Davies:** First, although the housing problem that Dafydd described is most evident in rural areas of Wales, it is not restricted to rural areas. Many of the problems—although not the Welsh-language dimension; to which I shall come—also exist in my constituency, and others. It stems from the variable economic performance that we have in Wales. I was glad that Dafydd acknowledged that.

Our problem is that as that economic gap is growing, and Wales's economies are diverging, the problems will become more serious. In rural areas, there is the problem of supply, quality and house prices, and these impact most heavily on young people, as he identified. Too often the result is outward migration, which further undermines the ability of those areas to sustain or regenerate themselves economically. We have this vicious circle of decline that we must address. That is at the heart of the problem. It is a central problem of employment variation and income levels.

Secondly—and I am conscious of the time constraint—there is a problem in rural Welsh speaking areas. Dafydd referred to the problems in the communities his constituency. We all acknowledge the difficulties that they have, where the trends of employment and income mean that house sales operate in a way that prevents young people from buying houses in their own communities and so they move out. That process undermines the continued existence of those communities as viable Welsh speaking communities. That is a real

young people on low incomes in rural villages, so that they may continue to live in their communities. I hope that we will have a response from the Deputy Minister for Local Government to the detailed points that I have raised, and an assurance that the Government will recognise the gravity of the problem, and that it will be willing to take early action to achieve social justice for those living in rural areas.

**Ron Davies:** Yn gyntaf, er bod y broblem tai a ddisgrifiwyd gan Dafydd fwyaf amlwg yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru, nid yw'n gyfyngedig i ardaloedd gwledig. Mae llawer o'r problemau—ond nid dimensiwn yr iaith Gymraeg, y deuf at hynny wedyn—hefyd yn bodoli yn fy etholaeth i, ac mewn etholaethau eraill. Deillia o'r perfformiad economaidd amrywiol sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed Dafydd yn cydnabod hynny.

Y broblem sydd gennym yw y daw'r problemau'n fwy difrifol wrth i'r bwlch economaidd hwnnw dyfu, ac wrth i economïau Cymru ymwahanu. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ceir problemau gyda chyflenwad, ansawdd a phrisiau tai, a chaiff y rhain effaith fawr ar bobl ifanc, fel y nododd. Yn rhy aml, arweinia hyn at bobl yn mudo o'u cynefin, sydd yn tanseilio ymhellach allu'r ardaloedd hynny i gynnal neu i adfer eu hunain yn economaidd. Mae gennym y cylch dieflig hwn o ddirywiad y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae hynny wrth wraidd y broblem. Mae'n broblem ganolog o amrywiad mewn cyflogaeth a lefelau incwm.

Yn ail—ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r cyfyngiadau amser—mae problem mewn ardaloedd gwledig Cymraeg eu hiaith. Cyfeiriodd Dafydd at y problemau a geir yng nghymunedau ei etholaeth ef. Mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod yr anawsterau sydd ganddynt, lle y golyga tueddiadau cyflogaeth ac incwm y gweithreda'r broses o werthu tai mewn ffordd sydd yn atal pobl ifanc rhag prynu tai yn eu cymunedau eu hunain ac felly symudant o'r ardal. Tanseilia'r broses honno fodolaeth barhaus y cymunedau hynny fel cymunedau hyfyw Cymraeg eu hiaith. Mae

problem.

I regret the comments made by Councillor Simon Glyn last week that have received so much publicity. Those comments were intemperate and divisive. However, we should realise that no political party has a monopoly on stupid comments. The worst aspect of Councillor Glyn's comments was that they diverted attention away from the real problem, which is manifest in parts of north and some parts of west Wales. I quote briefly from 'Putting Wales First'. I do not bestow magical properties on the document, which underlines the coalition, but it has one or two useful elements. This is what it says about the Welsh language:

'We will encourage mutual respect both for those who are English speaking and those who are Welsh speaking....Throughout Welsh life there must be equal recognition of both languages—in practice as well as in theory.'

Those are easy words—words are always easy. The difficult part comes when you try to translate those words into action. In the Economic Development Committee, we will consider the national economic development strategy for Wales over the coming weeks and months. I have no doubt that, during that process, Dafydd, we, in the Economic Development Committee and the Assembly, will have to face those hard choices. Will we take the decisions that will mean that life improves for two thirds of the people of Wales, not only in rural Wales, but also in industrial south-east Wales, who do not enjoy the same standards and quality of economic and social life as other people in Wales? Will we ensure that we put in place the economic and social policies that will act to eliminate that disparity? That is the real question that we must address.

**Janet Davies:** One major issue is the difference in regional economic prosperity.

hynny'n broblem wirioneddol.

Gresynaf o glywed y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan y Cynghorydd Simon Glyn yr wythnos diwethaf a gafodd gymaint o gyhoeddusrwydd. Yr oedd y sylwadau hynny'n eithafol ac yn peri rhwyg. Fodd bynnag, dylem sylweddoli nad oes gan unrhyw blaid wleidyddol fonopoli ar sylwadau twp. Yr agwedd waethaf ar sylwadau'r Cynghorydd Glyn yw iddynt dynnu sylw oddi ar y broblem wirioneddol, sydd yn amlwg mewn rhannau o ogledd Cymru a rhai rhannau o orllewin Cymru. Dyfynnaf yn fyr o'r ddogfen 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'. Ni ddywedaf fod nodweddion hudol gan y ddogfen, sydd yn sail i'r glymblaid, ond mae un neu ddwy o elfennau defnyddiol ganddi. Dyma'r hyn a ddywed am yr iaith Gymraeg:

'Byddwn yn annog parch o'r naill ochr â'r llall tuag at y rheini sy'n siarad Cymraeg a'r rheini sy'n siarad Saesneg....Ym mywyd Cymru drwyddo draw, rhaid rhoi cydnabyddiaeth gydradd i'r ddwy iaith – yn ymarferol yn ogystal ag mewn theori.'

Mae'n hawdd dweud y geiriau hynny—mae bob amser yn hawdd dweud pethau. Daw'r rhan anodd pan geisiwch droi'r geiriau hynny yn weithredoedd. Yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, ystyriwn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol ar gyfer Cymru dros yr wythnosau a'r misoedd i ddod. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf, Dafydd, y bydd yn rhaid inni, yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, wynebu'r dewisiadau anodd hynny, yn ystod y broses honno. A gymerwn benderfyniadau a olyga y bydd bywyd dwy ran o dair o bobl Cymru yn gwella, nid yn unig yng Nghymru wledig, ond hefyd yn ne ddwyrain Cymru ddiwydiannol, nad ydynt yn mwynhau'r un safonau ac ansawdd o fywyd economaidd a chymdeithasol â phobl eraill yng Nghymru? A sicrhawn y sefydlwn y polisïau economaidd a chymdeithasol a fydd yn helpu i ddileu'r anghyfartaledd hwnnw? Dyna'r cwestiwn gwirioneddol y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef.

**Janet Davies:** Un mater pwysig yw'r gwahaniaeth o ran ffyniant economaidd

This difference is causing problems throughout the United Kingdom, in places such as East Anglia, as well as in Wales, and it places a burden on Assembly Members who develop rural economic policy, which will be crucial. The Welsh language is an extra dimension, and the Assembly is putting a lot of support and resources into the Welsh language, that could be wasted if young Welsh speakers in rural areas have to move out. It is short-sighted if we do not ensure that they are able, if they wish, to stay in those areas.

I thank Edwina Hart for her statement yesterday to the Local Government and Housing Committee about raising the level of support through the low cost home option scheme for young people in rural areas, and for her readiness to take on my suggestion that she should look at what is happening in Scottish rural areas, where, as Dafydd mentioned, they are allocating a high percentage of the grant.

I also thank Ron, for recognising that every party has got the odd intemperate Member.

**The Deputy Minister for Local Government (Peter Black):** I begin by thanking Dafydd Wigley for raising this issue. It is an important issue and the opportunity to debate it today is helpful, to the Assembly and to those areas that suffer in the way that he has identified. Dafydd has rightly identified a number of problems, which I will briefly sum up: the distortion of local markets in rural and coastal areas, caused by immigration and the purchase of second homes; younger households forced to leave home communities because of the lack of jobs and affordable homes; and an issue, identified by Ron Davies and Dafydd Wigley of the pressure on the Welsh language from inward and outward migration.

We need to develop policies that contribute to the long-term sustainability of all communities in Wales. We recognise that the Welsh language is fundamental to the cohesion of many rural communities.

rhanbarthol. Achosa'r gwahaniaeth hwn broblemau ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, mewn lleoedd fel East Anglia, yn ogystal ag yng Nghymru, a rhydd faich ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad sydd yn datblygu polisi economaidd gwledig, a fydd yn hanfodol. Mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn ddimensiwn ychwanegol a rhydd y Cynulliad lawer o gymorth ac adnoddau i'r iaith Gymraeg, a allai fod yn wastraff os bydd yn rhaid i siaradwyr Cymraeg ifanc symud o'r ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'n gibddall os na sicrhawn y gallant aros yn yr ardaloedd hynny, os dymunant wneud hwnnw.

Diolchaf i Edwina Hart am ei datganiad ddoe i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai am godi'r lefel o gymorth drwy'r cynllun opsiwn tai cost isel ar gyfer pobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig, ac am ei pharodrwydd i dderbyn fy awgrym y dylai edrych ar yr hyn sydd yn digwydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn yr Alban, lle, fel y crybwyllodd Dafydd, y dyrannant ganran uchel o'r grant.

Diolchaf hefyd i Ron, am gydnabod bod ambell Aelod eithafol gan bob plaid.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol (Peter Black):** Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Dafydd Wigley am godi'r mater hwn. Mae'n fater pwysig ac mae'r cyfle i'w ddadlau heddiw yn ddefnyddiol, i'r Cynulliad ac i'r ardaloedd hynny sydd yn dioddef yn y ffordd a nododd. Nododd Dafydd, yn gywir, nifer o broblemau, y'u crynhoaf yn fyr: gwyrdroad marchnadoedd lleol mewn ardaloedd gwledig ac ardaloedd arfordirol, wedi'i achosi gan fewnfudo a phobl yn prynu ail gartrefi; pobl iau yn gorfod gadael eu cymunedau genedigol oherwydd prinder swyddi a thai y gallant eu fforddio; a mater, a nodwyd gan Ron Davies a Dafydd Wigley sef y pwysau sydd ar yr iaith Gymraeg oherwydd bod pobl yn mudo i mewn ac allan o'r ardaloedd.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu polisiau sydd yn cyfrannu at gynaliadwyedd tymor hir pob cymuned yng Nghymru. Cydnabyddwn fod yr iaith Gymraeg yn hanfodol i gydlyniad llawer o gymunedau gwledig. Fodd bynnag,

However, we must not forget that similar pressures exist, as has been said, in some rural areas where the Welsh language is not in common use.

The Assembly is committed to devolved responsibility and local accountability. That is why 70 per cent of the capital resources made available to local authorities is not hypothecated, and 80 per cent of the social housing grant budget is placed at the disposal of authorities so that they can commission housing associations to undertake housing schemes that target local needs. Therefore, authorities in Wales can deploy substantial resources according to locally determined priorities. This is not necessarily a resource issue. One or two units in the right place can make a substantial contribution to social and cultural sustainability. We must develop a better understanding of needs in rural areas, which is especially difficult when those needs are not easily seen. We are hearing criticism from parts of Wales—

12:25 p.m.

**Glyn Davies:** I was interested to hear your comments because this issue brought me into local government 30 years ago. I cared so deeply about how young people are forced to leave their communities. The planning authority, of which I was chairman, developed a concept of local needs settlements, which created opportunities in comparatively low cost sites. They were only available to local people to build on them. Would you approve of such a scheme and encourage the Government to take it forward?

**Peter Black:** There will be a wider consultation as part of the national housing strategy to consider issues like rural housing. If you respond to that consultation along those lines, we will consider your suggestion, its feasibility and practicality, and whether we can take it on board. I am more than happy to give that undertaking.

As I said, we are hearing criticism from parts of Wales, most recently from Gwynedd, that areas are under pressure because of the

rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod pwysau tebyg yn bodoli, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig lle na ddefnyddir yr iaith Gymraeg yn gyffredinol.

Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i gyfrifoldeb datganoledig ac atebolrwydd lleol. Dyna'r rheswm pam na phriddiannir 70 y cant o'r adnoddau cyfalaf sydd ar gael i'r awdurdodau lleol, ac y rhoddir 80 y cant o'r gyllideb grant tai cymdeithasol i'r awdurdodau fel y gallant gomisiynu cymdeithasau tai i ymgymryd â chynlluniau tai sydd yn targedu anghenion lleol. Felly, gall awdurdodau Cymru ddefnyddio adnoddau sylweddol yn ôl blaenoriaethau a bennir yn lleol. Nid yw hyn yn fater adnoddau o reidrwydd. Gall un neu ddwy o unedau yn y lle cywir wneud cyfraniad sylweddol tuag at gynaliadwyedd cymdeithasol a diwylliannol. Rhaid inni ddatblygu dealltwriaeth well o anghenion ardaloedd gwledig, sydd yn arbennig o anodd pan na welir yr anghenion hynny yn hawdd. Clywn feirniadaeth gan rannau o Gymru—

**Glyn Davies:** Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf glywed eich sylwadau oherwydd i'r mater hwn ddod â mi i lywodraeth leol 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Gofidiwn gymaint am sut y gorfodir pobl ifanc i adael eu cymunedau. Datblygodd yr awdurdod cynllunio, yr oeddwn yn gadeirydd arno, gysyniad o setliadau anghenion lleol, a greodd gyfleoedd mewn safleoedd â chost gymharol isel. Dim ond pobl leol a allai adeiladu arnynt. A fydech yn cymeradwyo cynllun o'r fath ac yn annog y Llywodraeth i'w ddatblygu?

**Peter Black:** Bydd ymgynghori ehangach fel rhan o'r strategaeth dai genedlaethol i ystyried materion fel tai gwledig. Os ymatebwch i'r broses ymgynghori ar y llinellau hynny, ystyriwn eich awgrym, ei ddichonoldeb a'i ymarferoldeb, a pha un ai a allwn ei dderbyn. Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon addo gwneud hynny.

Fel y dywedais, clywn feirniadaeth o rannau o Gymru, o Wynedd yn fwyaf diweddar, fod ardaloedd o dan bwysau oherwydd ei bod yn

difficulty for people to find affordable homes in their communities. To a large extent, local councils have Assembly-provided resources and the ability to direct them to start tackling that problem. We are committed to finding additional ways to assist them, but it is important that we first identify specific problems. That means looking at communities, identifying the demand and comparing it with supply. Local authorities are best placed to do this and we can provide financial assistance to undertake these needs' surveys.

**Alun Pugh:** Do you agree that immigration has benefited Wales hugely? As a son of the Rhondda, I know how much the Italians contributed to our community. Today, we have Somalis, Pakistanis, Japanese as well as the English, and we are the richer for them all. Do you believe that when senior Members of Plaid Cymru, in senior positions of authority begin to talk about the English threatening our way of life and English pensioners being a burden on Welsh society, that we must be clear about what it is—racism, pure and simple?

I welcome Dafydd Wigley's statement. He has an impeccable equal opportunities record, but Simon Glyn is making major housing decisions today. Why does Plaid Cymru allow a racist to remain in an important post? If he will not go, then a party that is serious about equal opportunities should push him out.

**Peter Black:** As an immigrant myself, I am happy to confirm that immigration has an important role to play.

New developments of housing for rent and low cost home ownership can and do provide a solution for local needs in some cases. Related planning issues are being considered alongside the recommendations of the land use planning forum as part of a wider review of planning guidance. Hopefully, the issues raised by Dafydd Wigley will be taken up and considered as part of that review. In many rural locations, new development would not necessarily be welcomed and

anodd i bobl ddod o hyd i gartrefi y gallant eu fforddio yn eu cymunedau. I raddau helaeth, mae gan gynghorau lleol adnoddau a ddarperir gan y Cynulliad a'r gallu i'w cyfeirio er mwyn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd ychwanegol o'u cynorthwyo, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn nodi problemau penodol yn gyntaf. Golyga hynny edrych ar gymunedau, nodi'r galw a'i gymharu â'r cyflenwad. Awdurdodau lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i wneud hyn a gallwn ddarparu cymorth ariannol i gynnal yr arolygon anghenion hyn.

**Alun Pugh:** A gytunwch y bu mewnfudo o fudd mawr i Gymru? Fel mab o'r Rhondda, gwn faint y cyfrannodd yr Eidalwyr at ein cymuned. Heddiw, mae gennym Somaliaid, Pacistaniaid a Siapaneaidd, ynghyd â'r Saeson, ac yr ydym yn gyfoethocach oherwydd eu bod i gyd yma. A gredwch, pan ddechreuau uwch Aelodau o Blaid Cymru, mewn uwch swyddi o awdurdod, ddweud bod y Saeson yn bygwth ein ffordd o fyw a bod pensiynwyr Seisnig yn faich ar y gymdeithas Gymreig, fod yn rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â beth ydyw—hiliaeth llwyr?

Croesawaf ddatganiad Dafydd Wigley. Mae enw di-fai ganddo o ran cyfle cyfartal, ond gwna Simon Glyn benderfyniadau tai pwysig heddiw. Pam y caniatâ Plaid Cymru i berson hiliol aros mewn swydd bwysig? Os nad ymddiswydda, dylai plaid sydd o ddifrif ynglŷn â chyfle cyfartal ei orfodi i fynd.

**Peter Black:** Fel mewnfudwr fy hunan, yr wyf yn falch o gadarnhau bod gan fewnfudo rôl bwysig i'w chwarae.

Gall datblygiadau newydd o ran tai i'w rhentu a pherchenogaeth cartrefi cost isel ddatrys anghenion lleol mewn rhai achosion ac fe wnânt hynny. Ystyrir materion cynllunio cysylltiedig ar y cyd ag argymhellion y fforwm cynllunio defnydd tir fel rhan o adolygiad ehangach o arweiniad cynllunio. Gobeithio y caiff y materion a godwyd gan Dafydd Wigley eu trafod a'u hystyried fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw. Mewn llawer o leoliadau gwledig, ni fyddai

Dafydd referred to the problem of national parks and areas of outstanding natural beauty. That is especially true where there are existing properties for sale.

It is right to say, as Dafydd said, that economic renewal is an important solution. However, I also noted his comment on the right to buy. I am not in favour of abolishing that. I do not think that to limit the rights of tenants to buy their own property is a solution. We must find other, more positive solutions. We must avoid trying to ringfence communities to prevent non-Welsh speakers or non-locals from buying properties. Our solutions must concentrate on empowering local people and focusing resources effectively, so that they can remain in their own communities.

Existing properties in village centres are frequently the preferred choice and, sometimes, the only choice for local people and incomers alike. We cannot control the market nor should we try to do so. However, we can try to create a climate where local interests can compete on a more equal footing.

Partnerships between registered social landlords and local authorities have helped to sustain rural communities and we wish to ensure that they continue to do so. They have the desire and capability to respond to the needs of their communities, if we do our bit to remove obstacles to progress.

Yesterday, Edwina Hart announced two measures designed to help people in rural areas to gain access to existing village housing and, where appropriate, new housing to rent or buy at affordable prices.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A wnewch chi gadarnhau y bydd adnoddau ariannol ychwanegol ar gael i'r cynghorau fydd yn gweithredu'r cynllun cyntaf a gyhoeddwyd gan Edwina ddoe?

**Peter Black:** I confirm that Edwina stated

datblygu newydd yn cael ei groesawu o reidrwydd a chyfeiriodd Dafydd at y broblem o barciau cenedlaethol ac ardaloedd o harddwch naturiol eithriadol. Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir lle mae tai ar werth.

Mae'n wir i ddweud, fel y dywedodd Dafydd, bod adnewyddu economaidd yn ateb pwysig. Fodd bynnag, nodais hefyd ei sylw am yr hawl i brynu. Nid wyf o blaid diddymu hynny. Ni chredaf fod cyfyngu ar hawliau tenantiaid i brynu eu heiddo eu hunain yn ateb. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i atebion eraill, mwy cadarnhaol. Rhaid inni osgoi ceisio clustnodi cymunedau er mwyn atal pobl di-Gymraeg neu bobl nad ydynt yn bobl leol rhag prynu eiddo. Rhaid i'n hatebion ganolbwyntio ar roi pŵer i bobl leol a thargedu adnoddau yn effeithiol, fel y gallant aros yn eu cymunedau.

Yn aml, tai presennol yng nghanol pentrefi yw'r hoff ddewis ac, weithiau, yr unig ddewis i bobl leol a mewnfudwyr fel ei gilydd. Ni allwn reoli'r farchnad ac ni ddylem geisio gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, gallwn geisio creu hinsawdd lle y gall buddiannau lleol gystadlu mewn ffordd fwy cyfartal.

Mae partneriaethau rhwng landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ac awdurdodau lleol wedi helpu i gynnal cymunedau gwledig a dymunwn sicrhau eu bod yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae'r awydd a'r gallu ganddynt i ymateb i anghenion eu cymunedau, os gwnawn ein rhan i gael gwared â'r rhwystrau sydd yn atal cynnydd.

Ddoe, cyhoeddodd Edwina Hart ddau fesur wedi'u hanelu at helpu pobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig i gael tai presennol mewn pentrefi a, lle y bo'n briodol, i gael tai newydd i'w rhentu neu i'w prynu am brisiau y gallant eu fforddio.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Will you confirm that additional financial resources will be available to the councils that will implement the first scheme announced by Edwina yesterday?

**Peter Black:** Cadarnhaf y nododd Edwina y

that additional resources would be made available to implement that scheme.

I will briefly refer to the two measures that Edwina announced. First, on housing to rent, where local authorities identify the need, registered social landlords can purchase and renovate existing properties to let at affordable rents, using a combination of social housing grant and private borrowing.

The National Assembly only pays social housing grant for schemes that comply with its published design quality standards. Although they allow a degree of compromise for existing and renovated dwellings, there is evidence from some local authorities and registered social landlords that the need to comply can prevent access to the only property available in some rural locations. Some properties, because of their size and construction, cannot be made to meet modern standards at a reasonable cost, if at all.

Our design quality standards were published following consultation with Welsh registered social landlords, local government and others. They are good standards and should not be set aside lightly. However, there may be a case for their relaxation in rural locations where there is no practical alternative. We will, therefore, consult with registered social landlords, local government and other interested parties on the extent to which and the circumstances in which relaxation of space standards may be acceptable. The cost of purchasing and renovating village houses may be so high that it is not financially viable for registered social landlords under the current grant regime. Therefore, we may also have to consider the case for more generous grant support. We will put this consultation process into place over the next fortnight and we aim to implement any changes arising from the consultation early in the coming financial year.

Capital allocation is, of course, available to local councils for housing. That will also be

byddai adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael i weithredu'r cynllun hwnnw.

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at y ddau fesur a gyhoeddwyd gan Edwina. Yn gyntaf, o ran tai i'w rhentu, lle y noda awdurdodau lleol yr angen, gall landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig brynu ac adnewyddu tai presennol i'w gosod ar renti y gellir eu fforddio, gan ddefnyddio cyfuniad o grant tai cymdeithasol a benthyciadau preifat.

Dim ond i gynlluniau sydd yn cydymffurfio â'i safonau ansawdd dylunio cyhoeddedig y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn talu grant. Er eu bod yn caniatáu rhywfaint o gyfaddawdu ar gyfer anheddau presennol ac anheddau sydd wedi'u hadnewyddu, ceir tystiolaeth gan rai awdurdodau lleol a rhai landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig y gall yr angen i gydymffurfio rwystro mynediad at yr unig eiddo sydd ar gael mewn rhai lleoliadau gwledig. Oherwydd eu maint a'r ffordd y'u hadeiladwyd, ni ellir addasu rhai tai i gydymffurfio â safonau modern am gost resymol, os o gwbl.

Cyhoeddwyd ein safonau ansawdd dylunio ar ôl ymgynghori â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig Cymru, llywodraeth leol ac eraill. Safonau da ydynt ac ni ddylid eu diystyru. Fodd bynnag, gellir bod achos i'w llacio mewn lleoliadau gwledig lle nad oes dewis ymarferol arall. Felly, ymgynghorwn â landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig, llywodraeth leol a phobl eraill â diddordeb yn y mater ar i ba raddau ac ym mha amgylchiadau y byddai'n dderbyniol llacio safonau gofod. Gall y gost o brynu ac adnewyddu tai mewn pentrefi fod mor uchel fel nad yw'n ymarferol yn ariannol ar gyfer landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig o dan y gyfundrefn grant bresennol. Felly, mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried hefyd yr achos ar gyfer cymorth grant mwy hael. Sefydlwn y broses ymgynghorol hon dros y pythefnos nesaf a bwriadwn weithredu unrhyw newidiadau sydd yn deillio o'r broses ymgynghorol yn y flwyddyn ariannol i ddod.

Mae dyraniad cyfalaf ar gael i gynghorau lleol ar gyfer tai, wrth gwrs. Caiff hynny ei



increased over the next three years. I agree that resources would be greater if the Government's borrowing rules were relaxed. However, that is not yet forthcoming. Councils can choose how they spend that money, which includes spending it on new housing, if they believe that it is a good use of resources. Money is available for registered social landlords to build new homes in rural areas if they wish.

Our low cost home ownership scheme can provide home ownership opportunities as an alternative to rent for people who are unable to afford a suitable property unaided. Under the scheme, registered social landlords can provide an interest free equity mortgage that is recovered when the property is sold or transferred to a new owner. However, the current, minimum homebuy equity share of 70 per cent will, for many people on rural incomes, place even the cheapest homes within reasonable distance of their work, beyond their reach.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are running out of time. Will you give way to Janet Davies?

**Peter Black:** Yes, as long as she is brief.

**Janet Davies:** You said that additional resources would be made available for that equity scheme, but I have just read Edwina's notes and I cannot find any mention of that. Are you saying now that additional resources will be available?

**Peter Black:** Yes. We hope to consider that issue and see what resources can be made available.

As I have said, money is available for registered social landlords to build new homes also in rural areas. The money will be made available through the capital allocations announced in the budget. The current minimum homebuy equity share of 70 per cent will place many homes beyond people's reach. We must take account of the fact that, in many instances, they are competing with the second home market. The

gynyddu hefyd dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Cytunaf y byddai mwy o adnoddau ar gael pe byddai'r Llywodraeth yn llacio ei rheolau benthyca. Fodd bynnag, ni ddigwydd hynny eto. Gall cynghorau ddewis sut y gwariant yr arian hwnnw, gan gynnwys ei wario ar dai newydd, os credant fod hynny yn ffordd dda o ddefnyddio adnoddau. Mae arian ar gael ar gyfer landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig er mwyn iddynt adeiladu cartrefi newydd os dymunant wneud hynny.

Gall ein cynllun perchenogaeth tai cost isel ddarparu cyfleoedd i bobl na allant fforddio eiddo addas heb gymorth i fod yn berchen ar dai fel dewis arall yn lle rhentu. O dan y cynllun, gall landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig ddarparu morgais ecwiti di-log y gellir ei adfer pan werthir y tŷ neu pan drosglwyddir y tŷ i berchennog newydd. Fodd bynnag, ar gyfer llawer o bobl ar incymau gwledig, rhydd y lleiafswm cyfran ecwiti prynu tŷ presennol o 70 y cant hyd yn oed y cartrefi rhataf sydd o fewn pellter rhesymol o'u gwaith, y tu hwnt i'w cyrraedd

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym yn brin o amser. A ildiwch i Janet Davies?

**Peter Black:** Gwnaf, os bydd yn fyr.

**Janet Davies:** Dywedasoeh y byddai mwy o adnoddau ar gael ar gyfer y cynllun ecwiti hwnnw, ond yr wyf newydd ddarllen nodiadau Edwina ac ni allaf ddod o hyd i unrhyw sôn am hynny. A ddywedwch yn awr y bydd adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael?

**Peter Black:** Gwnaf. Gobeithiwn ystyried y mater hwnnw i weld pa adnoddau a all fod ar gael.

Fel y dywedais, mae arian ar gael i landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig adeiladu cartrefi newydd mewn ardaloedd gwledig hefyd. Bydd yr arian ar gael drwy'r dyraniadau cyfalaf a gyhoeddwyd yn y gyllideb. Rhydd y lleiafswm cyfran ecwiti prynu tŷ presennol o 70 y cant lawer o gartrefi y tu hwnt i gyrraedd pobl. Rhaid inni ystyried y ffaith eu bod yn cystadlu yn y farchnad ail gartrefi, mewn llawer o

minimum equity share will be reduced to 50 per cent for homebuy in rural communities. This could reduce typical mortgage payments by up to £80 per month, when compared with the existing homebuy scheme. A local authority and the registered social landlord providing the equity mortgage will be able to agree local residency or employment criteria for applicants to suit local circumstances. This is a scheme that can benefit other areas in the appropriate circumstances.

In taking these actions, we believe that the Government of Wales is aiming to provide local authorities with practical means as well as resources to tackle the problem. The administration is open to all suggestions and ideas of how to deal with the problems of rural areas. The National Assembly is consulting on a national housing strategy. Part of that consultation relates to rural housing and we will consider all submissions sent to us.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi gau'r sesiwn yn ffurfiol, gan ei bod yn ddydd Santes Dwynwen, hoffwn longyfarch Aelod ieuengaf y Cynulliad, Jonathan Morgan, ar ei ddyweddïad ag Emily Tuttiett.

achosion. Gostyngir y lleiafswm cyfran ecwiti i 50 y cant i brynu tŷ mewn cymunedau gwledig. Gallai hyn ostwng taliadau morgais nodweddiadol hyd at £80 y mis, o'i gymharu â'r cynllun prynu tŷ presennol. Gall awdurdod lleol a'r landlord cymdeithasol cofrestredig sydd yn darparu'r morgais ecwiti gytuno ar feini prawf o ran byw'n lleol neu feini prawf cyflogaeth ar gyfer ymgeiswyr er mwyn gweddu i'r amgylchiadau lleol. Mae hyn yn gynllun a all fod o fudd i ardaloedd eraill yn yr amgylchiadau priodol.

Wrth gymryd y camau hyn, credwn fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn anelu at roi i awdurdodau lleol ffyrdd ymarferol ynghyd â'r adnoddau er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Mae'r weinyddiaeth yn agored i bob awgrym a syniad o ran sut i ddelio â'r problemau a geir mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn yngynghori ar strategaeth tai genedlaethol. Mae rhan o'r broses ymgynghorol honno yn ymwneud â thai gwledig ac ystyriwn bob un o'r cyflwyniadau a anfonir atom.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I close the session formally, as it is Saint Dwynwen's day, I would like to congratulate the Assembly's youngest Member, Jonathan Morgan, on his engagement to Emily Tuttiett.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.43 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 12.43 p.m.*