



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 24 Mai 2006
Wednesday, 24 May 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|--|
| 3 | Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio
Election of a Planning Decision Committee |
| 4 | Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister |
| 23 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau
Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills |
| 39 | Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig
Revised Business Statement |
| 41 | Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog
Delegation of Functions under the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 to the First Minister |
| 57 | Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006
Approval of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006 |
| 59 | Cymeradwyo Rheolau Trafnidiaeth a Gweithfeydd (Gweithdrefn Ceisiadau a Gwrthwynebiadau) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26
Approval of the Transport and Works (Applications and Objections Procedure) (England and Wales Rules 2006 under Standing Order No. 26 |
| 60 | Trefniadau'r Cynulliad i Gydweithredu â Busnesau
The Assembly's Arrangements for Co-operation with Business |
| 96 | Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion |
| 97 | Dadl Fer: Ennyn Diddordeb Pobl Ifanc Heddiw: Pleidleisio yn 16?
Short Debate: Engaging the Youth of Today: Votes at 16? |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio
Election of a Planning Decision Committee**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod
propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales resolves *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn
penderfynu*

1. that a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee (2) 2006-4, be established in accordance with Standing Order No. 17 of the Assembly to discharge those functions of the Assembly in respect of the matters identified in the schedule to this motion which are indicated in respect of each matter in that schedule, and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that committee;

1. bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio (2) 2006-4, yn cael ei sefydlu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17 y Cynulliad i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y materion y cyfeirir atynt yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn a nodir yng nghyswllt pob mater yn yr atodlen honno, a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yng nghyswllt y rheiny'n cael eu dirprwyo i'r pwyllgor hwnnw;

2. that the members of that committee be:

2. mai aelodau'r pwyllgor hwnnw fydd:

Carwyn Jones (Chair), Glyn Davies, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody.

Carwyn Jones (Cadeirydd), Glyn Davies, Jocelyn Davies, Tamsin Dunwoody.

3. that the committee shall cease to exist when the chair of the committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.16 or on 30 June 2006, whichever is the earlier;

3. bod y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 17.16 neu ar 30 Mehefin 2006, pa un bynnag a fydd gyntaf;

4. that if the committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then, in that event, the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Minister.

4. os bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyr penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna, yn yr achos hwnnw, dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, yng nghyswllt mater o'r fath, i'r Prif Weinidog.

Schedule

Atodlen

Called-in planning application under section 77 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by Wm Morrison plc & Shoparama Ltd for a food store and associated car parking at former Brown-Lenox site, adjacent to A470, Pontypridd.

Cais cynllunio a alwyd i mewn dan adran 77 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gan Wm Morrison ccc a Shoparama Cyf. am siop fwyd a maes parcio cysylltiol yn hen safle Brown-Lenox, ger yr A470, Pontypridd.

Planning appeal under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 by

Apêl cynllunio dan adran 78 Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 gan Morbaine Cyf. am

Morbaine Ltd for a class A1 food store, petrol filling station/car wash, parking and associated services and facilities at Pontypridd rugby club, Sardis road, Pontypridd. (NDM3060) *siop fwyd dosbarth A1, gorsaf betrol/golchfa geir, maes parcio a gwasanaethau a chyfleusterau cysylltiol yng nghlwb rygbi heol Sardis, Pontypridd. (NDM3060)*

*Cynnig (NDM3060): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3060): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister

The Presiding Officer: Question 1, **Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, OAQ0762(LGP), has been withdrawn. OAQ0762(LGP), yn ôl.

Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Ymatebol The Responsiveness of Public Services

Q2 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Will the Minister update us on her policies for increasing the responsiveness of public services in Mid and West Wales? OAQ0771(LGP)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): Our vision for high-quality, responsive public services was set out in 'Making the Connections'. We are trying to get joined-up services centred on citizens and communities particularly, and on making the most of our resources. We now have a five-year action plan, 'Delivering the Connections', which was published in June 2005.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for that response. I am sure that she is aware that a private company is providing a helicopter at a hugely discounted rate to the Wales Air Ambulance Charitable Trust for June, July and August, which will operate out of Powys. I encourage the Minister, perhaps together with Brian Gibbons, the Minister for Health and Social Services, to look sympathetically at providing some funding after that three-month trial, if it is successful. We know that, of 3,000 emergency calls made in Powys last year, a third of them were life-threatening. To cover the area from north to south with an air ambulance has been very difficult, but this would make a real difference.

Sue Essex: It is an interesting trial, and I hope that it proves to be positive. I will certainly take up your point and speak to Brian at the end of that trial, to see what we think.

Elin Jones: Yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ddoe, clywsom am y perygl i swyddfeydd post. Fel Gweinidog, gallech chi annog llywodraeth leol a chynghorau sir i dderbyn taliadau treth mewn swyddfeydd post. A wnewch chi hynny?

C2 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru sy'n fwy ymatebol? OAQ0771(LGP)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Amlinellwyd ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ymatebol o safon uchel yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau gwasanaethau unedig sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddinasyddion a chymunedau yn arbennig, ynghyd â gwneud y gorau o'n hadnoddau. Yn awr mae gennym gynllun gweithredu pum mlynedd, 'Cyflawni'r Cysylltiadau', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mehefin 2005.

Nick Bourne: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn ymwybodol y bydd cwmni preifat yn darparu hofrennydd am gyfradd dipyn yn is i Ymddiriedolaeth Elusenol Ambiwlans Awyr Cymru ym Mehefin, Gorffennaf ac Awst, a fydd yn gweithredu allan o Bowys. Anogaf y Gweinidog, efallai ynghyd â Brian Gibbons, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, i ystyried darparu rhywfaint o gyllid ar ôl y cyfnod prawf tri mis hwnnw, os bydd yn llwyddiannus. Gwyddom, o 3,000 o alwadau brys a wnaed ym Mhowys y llynedd, fod traean yn ymwneud â sefyllfaoedd a oedd yn bygwth bywyd. Mae cwmpasu'r ardal o'r gogledd i'r de gydag ambiwlans awyr wedi bod yn anodd, ond byddai hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol.

Sue Essex: Mae'n brawf diddorol, a gobeithio y bydd yn gadarnhaol. Ystyriaf eich pwynt yn sicr, a siaradaf â Brian ar ddiwedd y prawf hwnnw, i weld beth yr ydym yn ei feddwl.

Elin Jones: During questions to the First Minister yesterday, we heard of the threat to post offices. As Minister, you could encourage local government and county councils to allow tax payments to be made at post offices. Will you do that?

Sue Essex: I will certainly consider it if you have some background to give me. I was listening to the discussion yesterday, but if you have anything else that you wish to add to that, I am prepared to take it up with my local government colleagues.

Sue Essex: Gwnaf ystyried hynny yn sicr os oes gennych ryw faint o gefndir i'w roi imi. Yr oeddwn yn gwrandao ar y drafodaeth ddoe, ond os oes gennych unrhyw beth arall yr hoffech ei ychwanegu at hynny, yr wyf yn fodlon trafod hynny gyda'm cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3, OAQ0768(LGP), has been withdrawn.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ0768(LGP), yn ôl.

Cyflawni Targedau Achieving Targets

Q4 Jonathan Morgan: What discussions has the Minister had with Welsh local authorities regarding their progress in achieving their targets? OAQ0759(LGP)

C4 Jonathan Morgan: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gydag awdurdodau lleol Cymru am eu cynnydd i gyflawni eu targedau? OAQ0759(LGP)

Sue Essex: I concluded a policy agreement specifically targeting performance with each local authority in 2004-05. They set out the improvements that councils should deliver by 2007, as agreed by us. The performance of all 22 local authorities in 2004-05 was sufficiently strong for them to receive the second instalment of the performance incentive grant.

Sue Essex: Lluniai gytundeb polisi yn targedu perfformiad yn benodol gyda phob awdurdod lleol yn 2004-05. Gosodwyd allan y gwelliannau y dylai cyngorau eu cyflawni erbyn 2007, fel y cytunwyd arnynt gennym. Yr oedd perfformiad pob un o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol yn 2004-05 yn ddigon cryf iddynt gael ail ran y grant cymell perfformiad.

Jonathan Morgan: Recycling and how household waste is to be collected in future is very much on the minds of local authorities. However, the news that the Assembly Government is considering charging for the collection of black rubbish bags has been met with some concern among the public, not least by many of our constituents in Cardiff. What consideration is the Government giving to assisting people on fixed incomes who already have grave difficulty in meeting their financial commitments?

Jonathan Morgan: Mae ailgylchu a sut y mae gwastraff cartrefi i gael ei gasglu yn y dyfodol yn pwysu'n fawr ar feddyliau awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, mynegwyd cryn bryder gan y cyhoedd yn dilyn y newyddion bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystyried codi tâl am gasglu bagiau sbwriel du, yn anad neb gan nifer o'n hetholwyr yng Nghaerdydd. Pa fath o gymorth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried ei roi i bobl ag incwm sefydlog sydd eisoes yn ei chael yn anodd iawn bodloni eu hymrwymadau ariannol?

Sue Essex: How we hit those really quite strong but necessary recycling targets and get some cultural changes to take place is an interesting issue, is it not? In many areas of the world, financial 'penalties' or 'incentives' are used. As I understand it, although I will check with Carwyn, our philosophy is still not to use financial penalties to try to achieve that change of culture, because, as you rightly said, for some people, that charge does not seem fair.

Sue Essex: Mae sut y cyflawnwn y targedau eithaf cryf ond angenrheidiol hynny ar gyfer ailgylchu a sicrhau rhai newidiadau diwylliannol yn fater diddorol, onid yw? Mewn llawer rhan o'r byd, defnyddir 'cosbau' neu 'gymhellion' ariannol. Fel y deallaf, er y byddaf yn holi Carwyn, ein hathroniaeth ni o hyd yw peidio â defnyddio cosbau ariannol i geisio cyflawni'r newid diwylliant hwnnw, oherwydd, fel yr oeddech yn gywir yn dweud, i rai pobl nid yw'r tâl

hwnnw'n ymddangos yn deg.

That is not, in my view, the best way forward. Most local authorities, in fairness, are moving away from black plastic bags, and are making recycling and composting easier. That kind of encouragement and support for change, from what I have seen across Wales, has been the main approach used by local authorities.

Yn fy marn i, nid dyna'r ffordd orau ymlaen. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol, i fod yn deg, yn rhoi'r gorau i ddefnyddio bagiau plastig du, ac yn ei gwneud yn haws ailgylchu a chompostio. O'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei weld ledled Cymru, y math hwnnw o anogaeth a chefnogaeth i newid yw'r prif ddull gweithredu wedi bod gan awdurdodau lleol.

David Lloyd: Have all local authorities achieved their target of 1 per cent efficiency savings? If so, at what cost is that to front-line services, such as schools?

David Lloyd: A yw pob awdurdod lleol wedi cyrraedd ei darged o 1 y cant mewn arbedion effeithlonrwydd? Os felly, beth yw cost hynny i wasanaethau rheng flaen, megis ysgolion?

Sue Essex: Local authorities are in the process of collecting information on how they have achieved those 1 per cent savings. There should not be a cost to front-line services, because so much support has been given, particularly in terms of procurement. You heard in the committee meeting last week about some of the good schemes that are being done. I would have thought that most local authorities would be able to hit those targets in procurement in the first year or two. Some are going beyond procurement, and looking at other areas. So, it is not automatically the case, as you imply, that meeting efficiency targets equals front-line cuts.

Sue Essex: Mae awdurdodau lleol wrthi'n casglu gwybodaeth am y ffordd y maent wedi sicrhau'r arbedion hynny o 1 y cant. Ni ddylai fod cost i wasanaethau rheng flaen, oherwydd rhoddwyd cymaint o gymorth, yn enwedig ym maes caffael. Yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf clywsoc'h am rai o'r cynlluniau da a weithredir. Byddwn wedi meddwl y gallai'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol gyrraedd y targedau hynny o ran caffael yn y flwyddyn gyntaf neu'r ail. Mae rhai yn mynd y tu hwnt i gaffael, ac yn edrych ar feysydd eraill. Felly, nid yw cyrraedd targedau effeithlonrwydd yn cyfateb i doriadau mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen o reidrwydd, fel yr awgrymwyd.

David Lloyd: What instructions have you issued to local authority finance officers as regards the implementation of the 1 per cent efficiency cuts?

David Lloyd: Pa gyfarwyddiadau yr ydych wedi eu rhoi i swyddogion cyllid awdurdodau lleol ar weithredu'r toriadau effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant?

Sue Essex: I will have to check, but I believe that there was a guidance note. There is certainly a template now for recording efficiency cuts. There have been many discussions, seminars, and so on, about what counts as efficiency. There have been some good indications in terms of schemes, particularly in education, where you can achieve efficiencies by working together. That gives people better value for money, which is what we all want to see. In many cases, it also results in better outputs.

Sue Essex: Bydd yn rhaid imi gadarnhau hynny, ond credaf fod yna nodyn cyfarwyddyd. Yn sicr mae templed yn bodoli yn awr i gofnodi toriadau effeithlonrwydd. Cynhaliwyd sawl trafodaeth, seminar, ac ati, ar yr hyn sy'n cyfrif fel effeithlonrwydd. Cafwyd rhai arwyddion da o ran cynlluniau, yn enwedig ym maes addysg, lle y gallwch sicrhau effeithlonrwydd drwy gydweithio. Rhydd hynny fwy o werth yr arian i bobl, sef yr hyn yr ydym i gyd am ei weld. Mewn llawer achos, mae hefyd yn arwain at well canlyniadau.

David Melding: Minister, you will know

David Melding: Weinidog, fe wyddoch o

from last week's committee meeting that the Welsh Local Government Association has been looking at ways of promoting joint working, and regional working in particular. While I commend this document—it is very candid, in fairness—it is also testament to the fact that we have been encouraging regional working since 1994, but that it has not yet taken off. Is it time to think about ways of compelling authorities to work together?

Sue Essex: I am not sure that we have really put our full force behind encouraging regional working since 1994. My view is that, post local government reorganisation, with the creation of 22 local authorities, many of the regional arrangements that had existed previously were lost, for all sorts of reasons, although a few survived, and are still in operation today. The WLGA's document was very honest. There has been a positive change of culture, across the political spectrum, in the WLGA around how they can best work together to achieve the agenda to which everyone, I think, signs up. We have been prepared to support that idea with regional co-ordinators. Getting those regional groupings together has been significant, and the WLGA and the 22 local authorities should be commended on that.

David Melding: I do not disagree with a word of what you have said; it is just the urgency of trying to move along this road. If we take the question that my colleague, Jonathan Morgan, put to you about waste management and refuse collection, is it not the case that, if we want to see recycling rates increase—it is not uncommon for that rate to be 50 per cent or more on the continent—we need a regional approach? There is no way that capital development can take place unless it is done on a regional basis. Yet, in committee, one of the first things that we hear from representatives of local government is that barriers exist because of accountability problems and even 'sovereignty' problems, whatever that might mean—it is a frightening word. You need to sweep these barriers away, and do so with aplomb and action. We need to see you take the field and get going, rather than saying, after 12 years, that the old structures have gone and you are hoping that new ones are emerging.

gyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi bod yn edrych ar ffyrdd i hyrwyddo cydweithio, a gweithio rhanbarthol yn arbennig. Er fy mod yn cymeradwyo'r ddogfen hon—mae'n agored iawn, i fod yn deg—mae hefyd yn tystio inni fod yn annog gweithio rhanbarthol er 1994, ond nad yw wedi ei roi ar waith eto. A yw'n bryd meddwl am ffyrdd i orfodi awdurdodau i gydweithio?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr ein bod wedi mynd ati o ddifrif i annog gweithio rhanbarthol er 1994. Yn fy marn i, yn sgîl ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol, a chreu 22 o awdurdodau lleol, collwyd llawer o'r trefniadau rhanbarthol a oedd wedi bodoli cyn hynny, am bob math o resymau. Ond mae rhai wedi parhau ac yn dal ar waith heddiw. Roedd dogfen CLILC yn onest iawn. Gwelwyd newid cadarnhaol mewn diwylliant, ar draws y sbectrum gwleidyddol, yn CLILC o ran y ffordd y gall gydweithio'n well i gyflawni'r agenda y mae pawb wedi cytuno arni, mi gredaf. Yr ydym wedi bod yn barod i gefnogi'r syniad hwnnw gyda chydgyssylltwyr rhanbarthol. Yr oedd sefydlu'r grwpiau rhanbarthol hynny'n gam arwyddocaol, a dylid cymeradwyo CLILC a'r 22 awdurdod lleol am wneud hynny.

David Melding: Nid wyf yn anghytuno â gair o'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud; y broblem yw ein bod yn ceisio symud ar hyd y llwybr hwn ar frys. Os ystyriwn y cwestiwn a ofynnodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Jonathan Morgan, ichi ynghylch rheoli gwastraff a chasglu sbwriel, onid yw'n wir, os ydym am weld cyfraddau ailgylchu yn cynyddu—nid yw'n anghyffredin i'r gyfradd honno fod yn 50 y cant neu fwy ar y Cyfandir—fod angen i ni weithredu'n rhanbarthol? Ni all datblygiad cyfalaf ddigwydd nes caiff ei wneud yn rhanbarthol. Eto, yn y pwyllgor, un o'r pethau a glywn gan gynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol yw bod rhwystrau'n bodoli oherwydd problemau'n ymwneud ag atebolrwydd a hyd yn oed problemau'n ymwneud â 'sofraniaeth', beth bynnag yw ystyr hynny—mae'n air sy'n codi braw arnaf. Mae angen ichi gael gwared ar y rhwystrau hyn, a gwneud hynny'n gadarn. Mae angen inni eich gweld yn bwrw ati, yn hytrach na dweud, ar ôl 12 mlynedd, fod yr hen strwythurau wedi diflannu a'ch bod yn

gobeithio bod rhai newydd yn datblygu.

Sue Essex: You change your tune, do you not? If I suggested directing the Vale of Glamorgan Council to do things, you would be the first to leap up, saying how appalling it was that I was undermining democracy. I go back to your point about recycling rates. Sad person that I am, I have taken a keen interest in this issue in the past. You must increase the recycling rates and find a market for recyclates. If that is out of balance, you will just get paper and plastic mountains and not achieve anything. Many local authorities are progressing along a line that takes the second point on board.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych wedi newid eich cân, onid ydych? Pe byddwn yn awgrymu cyfarwyddo Cyngor Bro Morgannwg i wneud pethau, chi fyddai'r cyntaf i neidio ar eich traed a dweud pa mor ofnadwy ydoedd fy mod yn tanseilio democratiaeth. Af yn ôl at eich pwynt ynghylch cyfraddau ailgylchu. Yr wyf wedi ymddiddori'n fawr yn y mater hwn yn y gorffennol, sy'n drist. Rhaid ichi gynyddu'r cyfraddau ailgylchu a dod o hyd i farchnad ar gyfer deunydd eildro. Os na fydd cydbwysedd, dim ond mynyddoedd o bapur a phlastig a gewch ac ni chyflawnir dim. Mae llawer i awdurdod lleol yn dilyn llwybr sy'n ystyried yr ail bwynt.

2.10 p.m.

You referred to regional facilities going ahead. We, in central Government, and the Welsh Local Government Association, are undertaking a lot of work to achieve a coming together of regional facilities. However, I remind all AMs that when planning applications for regional facilities come in, wherever they may be proposed, there will undoubtedly be local reaction. In fairness, local authorities are trying to think through the responsibility of having these major facilities and the questions that will automatically be asked in relation to their location. So, I hope that Members' enthusiasm for being directional is there when it comes to supporting local authorities that volunteer to go ahead with regional facilities. We will wait and see on this one, David. [*Interruption.*]

Cyfeirich at gyfleusterau rhanbarthol yn cael eu datblygu. Yr ydym ni, mewn Llywodraeth ganolog, a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn gwneud llawer o waith i uno cyfleusterau rhanbarthol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn atgoffa pob AC pan fydd ceisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer cyfleusterau rhanbarthol yn cael eu cyflwyno, lle bynnag y gallant gael eu cynnig, y bydd ymateb lleol yn ddiau. I fod yn deg, mae awdurdodau lleol yn ceisio ystyried y cyfrifoldeb o gael y cyfleusterau mawr hyn a'r cwestiynau a gaiff eu gofyn yn awtomatig ynghylch eu lleoliad. Felly, gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n frwdfrydig dros fod yn gyfeiriol pan fydd angen cefnogi awdurdodau lleol sy'n gwirfoddoli i gyflwyno cyfleusterau rhanbarthol. Arhoswn i weld ynghylch hynny, David. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Yesterday, I drew the attention of Members yet again to our wonderful acoustics. Everything that you say will be taken down and may be used—you know how the rest of it goes.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ddoe, tynnais sylw'r Aelodau unwaith eto at ein hacwsteg ardderchog. Caiff popeth a ddywedwch ei gofnodi a gellir ei ddefnyddio—fe wyddoch y gweddill.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Minister, one local authority that is struggling to meet its targets is Blaenau Gwent. The report of the Blaenau Gwent advisory group says that the authority had a limited understanding of the scale of organisational and cultural change required and of how to lead and achieve it. Do you agree that this

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Weinidog, un o'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n ei chael yn anodd cyrraedd ei dargedau yw Blaenau Gwent. Dywed adroddiad grŵp cynghori Blaenau Gwent mai prin yw dealltwriaeth yr awdurdod o raddau'r newid sefydliadol a diwylliannol sydd ei angen a sut i arwain a chyflawni hynny. A gytunwch nad

does not paint a flattering picture of the leadership of that council?

Sue Essex: I think that you are wrong. I do not have the figures for Blaenau Gwent in front of me, but, in terms of its performance, I think that it is one of the strongest authorities, if not the strongest. I will send you the figures. I realise that Blaenau Gwent is being focused upon at this time, so I will choose my words carefully. We have seen recognition by the authority of where faults lay a couple of years ago, and these were primarily in corporate governance and social services. We have seen a huge turnaround with the help of the advisory board, so much so that the board feels that its job there is done. A change of culture, operation, process and responsibility has taken place, and I suspect that we will be looking to use Blaenau Gwent as an example of best practice.

Michael German: I refer to the report of the advisory board, dated 18 May, which is not a significant amount of time ago. The report is littered with the word 'leadership', and it says that an area for continuing work by the board is the development of the leadership team as a role model for cultural change within the organisation. In other words, that is still to be achieved. Do you not think that now is the time for new faces and new ideas in the council?

Sue Essex: No. It is not for you or me to say that. Yours is another party that trumpets local democracy and people's freedom to choose, but now you are suggesting that we should impose things on the leadership of that council and make changes. I think that you should look at the constitution to see how local authorities are elected. We should all respect the fact that they are elected by local people and have autonomy. I am surprised that you do not seem to respect that, Mike.

The impression that you gave is not the one that I have been getting from the advisory board. There are, of course, things that need to be continued; time did not stop on 18 May, or any other date. The advisory board has been forcibly saying that significant change has taken place in the authority, and, as a role

yw hyn yn creu darlun cadarnhaol o arweinyddiaeth y cyngor hwnnw?

Sue Essex: Credaf eich bod yn anghywir. Nid yw'r ffigurau ar gyfer Blaenau Gwent o'm blaen, ond, o ran ei berfformiad, credaf mai ef yw un o'r awdurdodau cryfaf, os nad y cryfaf. Anfonaf y ffigurau atoch. Sylweddolaf fod y sylw ar Flaenau Gwent ar hyn o bryd, felly dewisaf fy ngeiriau yn ofalus. Gwelwyd yr awdurdod yn cydnabod pwy neu beth oedd ar fai rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, ac ym meysydd llywodraethu corfforaethol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol y gwelwyd hynny'n bennaf. Gwelsom newid enfawr gyda help y bwrdd cynghori, i'r graddau bod y bwrdd yn teimlo bod ei waith ar ben. Bu newid diwylliant, y ffordd o weithredu, y broses a'r cyfrifoldeb, a chredaf y byddwn yn ystyried defnyddio Blaenau Gwent fel enghraifft o arfer gorau.

Michael German: Cyfeiriaf at adroddiad y bwrdd cynghori, dyddiedig 18 Mai, nad yw ymhell iawn yn ôl. Defnyddir y gair 'arweinyddiaeth' drwy'r adroddiad, a dywed mai un o'r meysydd lle y mae angen i'r bwrdd wneud gwaith parhaus yw datblygu'r tîm arwain fel model rôl ar gyfer newid diwylliannol yn y sefydliad. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae angen cyflawni hynny o hyd. Oni chredwch mai dyma'r amser i weld wynebau newydd a syniadau newydd yn y cyngor?

Sue Essex: Na. Nid eich lle chi na mi yw dweud hynny. Mae eich plaid chi yn un arall sy'n bloeddio am ddemocratiaeth leol a rhyddid pobl i ddewis, ond yn awr yr ydych yn awgrymu y dylem orfodi pethau ar dîm arwain y cyngor a gwneud newidiadau. Credaf y dylech edrych ar y cyfansoddiad i weld sut y caiff awdurdodau lleol eu hethol. Dylem i gyd barchu'r ffaith eu bod yn cael eu hethol gan bobl leol a bod ganddynt ymreolaeth. Yr wyf yn synnu nad ydych fel pe baech yn parchu hynny, Mike.

Mae'r argraff a roddwyd gennych yn wahanol i'r argraff a gefais i gan y bwrdd cynghori. Wrth gwrs, mae angen i rai pethau barhau; ni stopiodd amser ar 18 Mai, nac ar unrhyw ddyddiad arall. Mae'r bwrdd cynghori wedi bod yn datgan yn rymus fod newid sylweddol wedi digwydd yn yr

model for change, it is important. Other authorities are facing similar problems, and our approach of being supporting and working together with the Wales Audit Office and other experts seems to be a good one. The approach has been one of supporting and mainstreaming change within local authorities, and I will certainly be looking to develop that in other authorities, whatever their political complexion.

awdurdod, ac fel model rôl ar gyfer newid mae'n bwysig. Mae awdurdodau eraill yn wynebu problemau tebyg, ac ymddengys fod ein dull o fod yn gefnogol a chydweithio â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ac arbenigwyr eraill yn un da. Mae'r dull gweithredu wedi canolbwyntio ar gefnogi a phrif-ffrydio newid mewn awdurdodau lleol, a byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried datblygu hynny mewn awdurdodau eraill, waeth beth fo'u cyfansoddiad gwleidyddol.

Gwella Gwasanaethau Lleol Cyngor Sir y Fflint Improving Flintshire County Council's Public Services

Q5 Sandy Mewies: What measures has the Minister taken to support Flintshire County Council in improving the services that it has delivered since 2003? OAQ0775(LGP)

C5 Sandy Mewies: Pa fesurau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i gefnogi Cyngor Sir y Fflint wrth wella'r gwasanaethau y mae wedi'u darparu er 2003? OAQ0775(LGP).

Sue Essex: I concluded a policy agreement with Flintshire County Council in January 2005 setting out the improvements that the council will deliver by 2007, as agreed with the Assembly. The council's performance in 2004-05 was sufficiently strong for it to receive the second instalment of the performance incentive grant of around £1.5 million.

Sue Essex: Lluniais gytundeb polisi gyda Chyngor Sir y Fflint ym mis Ionawr 2005 yn pennu'r gwelliannau y bydd y cyngor yn eu cyflawni erbyn 2007, fel y cytunwyd gyda'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd perfformiad y cyngor yn 2004-05 yn ddigon cryf iddo gael ail randaliad y grant cymell perfformiad o ryw £1.5 miliwn.

Sandy Mewies: Flintshire County Council is currently developing a customer service strategy to coincide with the Assembly strategy for public services, as outlined in 'Making the Connections' and 'Delivering the Connections'. The council is considering how to best allocate resources so that appropriate provision is made for its policy for improvement. How is the Welsh Assembly Government supporting Flintshire's drive to strategically improve customer services?

Sandy Mewies: Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn datblygu strategaeth gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid i gyd-fynd â strategaeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel y'i hamlinellir yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' a 'Cyflawni'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae'r cyngor yn ystyried y ffordd orau i ddyrannu adnoddau fel y gellir sicrhau darpariaeth briodol ar gyfer ei bolisi gwella. Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cefnogi ymgais sir y Fflint i wella gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid yn strategol?

Sue Essex: We hope that some of the extra money can underpin some of the developments there. I am pleased to hear that the council is developing, alongside, I think, a few other authorities, a customer service strategy. As you said, that accords with 'Making the Connections' and giving the public confidence in services. I am sure that through the north Wales regional group that we referred to earlier—the WLGA working group, which we are supporting through the regional co-ordinator—some of these

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn gobeithio y gall rhywfaint o'r arian ychwanegol ategu rhai o'r datblygiadau yno. Yr wyf yn falch clywed bod y cyngor yn datblygu, ochr yn ochr â rhai awdurdodau eraill, mi gredaf, strategaeth gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid. Fel y dywedech, mae hynny'n unol â 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' ac yn rhoi hyder i'r cyhoedd mewn gwasanaethau. Yr wyf yn siŵr, drwy grŵp rhanbarthol gogledd Cymru y cyfeirich ato'n gynharach—gweithgor CLILC, yr ydym yn ei gefnogi drwy'r cydlynnydd

schemes can be rolled out and developed in particular local authorities. It may well be useful, if Flintshire has taken the lead on this, for it to develop partners outside of its borders. I hope to meet Flintshire council fairly soon, and we can discuss that then.

Mark Isherwood: On behalf of local people who have asked for my help, I have repeatedly raised concerns with you about the services provided by Flintshire County Council, and on each occasion you have failed to intervene. The council now faces a multi-million pound deficit, redundancies, unrepaired council houses, cuts in services, the suspension of its housing director, the early retirement of its leader, chief executive and county secretary, continuing serious allegations, and yet another public interest report. Will you please explain to the people of Flintshire why you fail to act?

Sue Essex: You paint a picture of Flintshire that I do not recognise—that is why. Also, you may have noticed that as Ministers we do not constantly leap into local authorities and take services off them. That is not how we do things. It is certainly not the best way forward in my view. That has been borne out by the intervention work done on social services.

Going back to Sandy's question, and my answer to it, Flintshire has demonstrated quite a strong performance on its performance indicators. Fourteen out of the 21 milestones have either been met or exceeded. I think that that is above average. Perhaps that is why people are not out on the streets protesting in Flintshire, or knocking on my door demanding that I do what you said.

Eleanor Burnham: I would like to see the Flintshire that you see, as the casework that I am involved with, along with Mark Isherwood, paints a very bleak picture. One particular family would very much like your help. They have been battling with Flintshire council for the last 14 years. I wrote to the Flintshire chief executive some months ago,

rhanbarthol—y gellir cyflwyno a datblygu rhai o'r cynlluniau hyn mewn awdurdodau lleol penodol. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol, os yw sir y Fflint wedi cymryd yr awenau yn hyn, iddo feithrin partneriaid y tu allan i'w ffiniau. Yr wyf yn gobeithio cyfarfod â chyngor sir y Fflint yn y dyfodol agos, a gallwn drafod y mater hwnnw bryd hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Ar ran pobl leol sydd wedi gofyn am fy help, yr wyf yn gyson wedi mynegi pryderon gyda chi am y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint, ac nid ydych wedi ymyrryd ar unrhyw un o'r achlysuron hynny. Mae'r cyngor yn awr yn wynebu diffyg o filiynau o bunnoedd, diswyddiadau, tai cyngor heb eu hatgyweirio, toriadau mewn gwasanaethau, gwahardd ei gyfarwyddwr tai dros dro, ymddeoliad cynnar ei arweinydd, ei brif weithredwr ac ysgrifennydd y sir, honiadau difrifol parhaus ac adroddiad arall ar les y cyhoedd. A eglurwch wrth bobl sir y Fflint pam yr ydych yn methu â gweithredu?

Sue Essex: Nid yw eich disgrifiad o sir y Fflint yn un sy'n gyfarwydd imi—dyna pam. Hefyd, efallai eich bod wedi sylwi nad ydym, fel Gweinidogion, yn ymyrryd yn gyson yng ngwaith awdurdodau lleol ac yn cymryd gwasanaethau oddi arnynt. Nid dyna'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu. Yn sicr, nid dyna'r ffordd orau ymlaen yn fy marn i. Cadarnhawyd hyn gan y gwaith ymyrryd a wnaed ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol.

I ddychwelyd at gwestiwn Sandy, a'r ateb a roddais iddo, mae sir y Fflint wedi dangos perfformiad cryf ar y cyfan yn ei ddangosyddion perfformiad. Mae 14 o'r 21 o gerrig milltir naoll ai wedi eu cyflawni neu eu rhagori. Credaf fod hynny'n well na'r cyfartaledd. Efallai mai dyna pam nad yw pobl allan ar y strydoedd yn protestio yn sir y Fflint, neu'n curo ar fy nrws yn mynnu fy mod yn gwneud yr hyn a ddywedwch.

Eleanor Burnham: Hoffwn weld sir y Fflint fel yr ydych chi'n ei gweld, gan fod y gwaith achos yr wyf yn gysylltiedig ag ef, ynghyd â Mark Isherwood, yn creu darlun llwm iawn. Byddai un teulu penodol yn falch iawn o'ch cymorth. Maent wedi bod yn brwydro yn erbyn cyngor sir y Fflint ers 14 mlynedd. Ysgrifennais at brif weithredwr sir y Fflint rai

asking him to explain how much money the council had misused in trying to get out of helping the Finnegan family. I then asked how much it would have cost to have put the family's situation right in the first place. I never received a reply. However, now that the chief executive has retired, on quite a healthy package, I would like to know what you are doing to ensure that Flintshire does improve.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a meeting of Flintshire County Council. Minister, you may like to answer the general points. I do not want further references to individuals; such matters can be pursued elsewhere.

Sue Essex: I am sure that there are vehicles to explore those matters. However well a local authority performs, there are bound to be cases—we all hear of them—where a family slips through the net, and the performance is not good. Like you, we take up those issues. However, what you are talking about is the fundamental non-running of the local authority, and, in fairness, I do not see that. I regularly meet the WLGA and we go through such issues, and any worries about Flintshire are not at the top of the list.

misoedd yn ôl yn gofyn iddo esbonio faint o arian a gamddefnyddiwyd gan y cyngor i geisio osgoi helpu'r teulu Finnegan. Yna, gofynnais faint y byddai wedi'i gostio i unioni sefyllfa'r teulu yn y lle cyntaf. Nid wyf wedi cael ateb. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y prif weithredwr yn awr wedi ymddeol, ar becyn cymharol swmpus, hoffwn wybod beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod sir y Fflint yn gwella.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid cyfarfod o Gyngor Sir y Fflint yw hwn. Weinidog, efallai yr hoffech ateb y pwyntiau cyffredinol. Nid wyf am glywed cyfeiriadau pellach at unigolion; gellir trafod materion o'r fath mewn mannau eraill.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn siŵr fod yna ffyrdd i archwilio'r materion hynny. Waeth pa mor dda yw perfformiad awdurdod lleol, mae achosion yn rhwym o godi—yr ydym i gyd yn clywed amdanynt—lle y bydd teulu'n llithro drwy'r rhwyd a'r perfformiad heb fod yn dda. Fel chithau, yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn sôn am y diffygion sylfaenol yn y ffordd y caiff yr awdurdod lleol ei redeg, ac i fod yn deg nid wyf yn gweld hynny. Byddaf yn cyfarfod â CLILC yn rheolaidd a byddwn yn trafod materion o'r fath, ac nid oes unrhyw bryderon ynglŷn â sir y Fflint ar frig y rhestr.

2.20 p.m.

Cynghorau Cymuned Community Councils

Q6 Irene James: Will the Minister make a statement about supporting community councils in Wales? OAQ0742(LGP)

C6 Irene James: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogi cynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru? OAQ0742(LGP)

Sue Essex: Welsh Assembly Government policy aims to develop capacity and enhance the role of community and town councils as locally elected statutory bodies. Measures already being implemented include sponsorship of One Voice Wales; addressing diverse training and awareness needs; inclusive consultations on relevant issues; and encouraging partnerships with principal authorities.

Sue Essex: Nod polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw datblygu gallu a gwella rôl cynghorau cymuned a chynghorau tref fel cyrff statudol wedi eu hethol yn lleol. Mae mesurau sydd eisoes yn cael eu gweithredu yn cynnwys noddi Un Llais i Gymru; mynd i'r afael ag anghenion hyfforddiant ac ymwybyddiaeth amrywiol; ymgynghori cynhwysol ar faterion perthnasol; ac annog partneriaethau gyda phrif awdurdodau.

Irene James: Do you agree that community

Irene James: A ydych yn cytuno bod

councils play a vital role in local democracy, and make a huge contribution, on a local level, to improving community service and representation? Do you also agree that strengthening the profile of community councils in Wales is important to ensure the formation of local community development policy?

Sue Essex: Yes. That is why we are taking forward the recommendations of the Aberystwyth report, which took a fundamental look at the role of community and town councils. I appreciate that some councils want to stay small and do what is important on their patch; however, others have quite ambitious programmes for where they want to go. Recently, I met one of Janice Gregory's local community councils, which has done some tremendous work on promoting its local area. It was pleasing to see that it had gone forward and made progress in this way.

Janet Davies: The Assembly Government was proactive in establishing One Voice Wales as a single community council association for Wales. Despite being charged much higher membership fees for this association than for the previous two main associations, a number of community councils have had great difficulty in accessing services, even for basic and general things, such as asking for guidance on a risk assessment policy. What action can you take to remedy this, considering your Government was influential in establishing the association?

Sue Essex: One Voice Wales went ahead with not only our support but with the Assembly's support in general. It was thought that there was literally a need to have one voice when it came to community councils—an organisation that could do the things that you said and also be a promotional voice. We all know that it had a slow start, for various reasons, and I understand that, but I have had meetings with the organisation, on worries about progress and on what can be done about it. Our officials have been supporting One Voice Wales in a few areas to make sure that it gets on track in terms of things that it should deliver. I understand that membership—I

cynghorau cymuned yn rhan hanfodol o ddemocratiaeth leol ac yn gwneud cyfraniad enfawr, ar lefel leol, at wella gwasanaethau a chynrychiolaeth gymunedol? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd ei bod yn bwysig atgyfnerthu proffil cynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru i sicrhau llunio polisiau datblygu cymunedol lleol?

Sue Essex: Ydwyf. Dyna pam yr ydym yn gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Aberystwyth, a oedd yn rhoi golwg sylfaenol ar rôl cynghorau cymuned a chynghorau tref. Sylweddolaf fod rhai cynghorau'n dymuno aros yn fach a gwneud yr hyn sy'n bwysig yn eu hardal hwy; fodd bynnag, mae gan eraill raglenni cymharol uchelgeisiol o ran yr hyn yr hoffent ei wneud. Cefais gyfarfod y ddiweddar ag un o gynghorau cymuned lleol Janice Gregory, sydd wedi gwneud gwaith eithriadol i hyrwyddo ei ardal leol. Yr oedd yn bleser gweld ei fod wedi bwrw ati ac wedi gwneud cynnydd fel hyn.

Janet Davies: Yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhagweithiol wrth sefydlu Un Llais i Gymru fel un gymdeithas cynghorau cymuned i Gymru. Er bod y ffioedd aelodaeth ar gyfer y gymdeithas hon lawer yn uwch nag ar gyfer y ddwy brif gymdeithas flaenorol, mae nifer o gynghorau cymuned wedi cael anhawster mawr i allu cael gwasanaethau, hyd yn oed ar gyfer pethau sylfaenol a chyffredinol fel gofyn am arweiniad ar bolisi asesu risg. Pa gamau y gallwch eu cymryd i unioni'r sefyllfa, o gofio dylanwad eich Llywodraeth wrth sefydlu'r gymdeithas?

Sue Essex: Cyflwynwyd Un Llais i Gymru gyda'n cefnogaeth ni, ond hefyd gyda chefnogaeth gyffredinol y Cynulliad. Teimlid bod angen un llais yn llythrennol wrth gynrychioli cynghorau cymuned—sefydliad a fyddai'n gallu gwneud yr hyn a ddywedwch a bod yn llais hyrwyddo hefyd. Gwyddom i gyd mai araf fu'r cychwyn, am amrywiol resymau, a gallaf ddeall hynny. Ond yr wyf wedi cael cyfarfodydd gyda'r sefydliad, ynglŷn â phryderon am gynnydd a'r hyn y gellir ei wneud yn ei gylch. Mae ein swyddogion wedi cefnogi Un Llais i Gymru mewn rhai ardaloedd er mwyn sicrhau ei fod ar y trywydd cywir mewn pethau y dylai eu cyflawni. Deallaf fod yr aelodaeth—nid wyf

have not seen the up-to-date figures, post May—is still running at around three quarters of Wales's town and community councils.

Laura Anne Jones: Is the Assembly Government providing any support or incentives for Welsh communities that do not have a community council to set up such an organisation? Do you not agree that an incentive could lie in giving community councils more powers?

Sue Essex: They have quite a lot of powers—they do, for a start, have precept powers. As I said to Irene, some communities in Wales do not want community councils, and they have made that clear. Some communities want their community councils to operate in a fairly limited way, which suits those communities. Others, particularly town councils, are strong players which would, perhaps, like to have contracts on service delivery with the primary authorities, which are the county councils or the county borough councils.

The community strategy, which every unitary authority in Wales has a duty to prepare, is a good way of engaging with community councils and also of picking up any embryonic interests that may exist on the ground. Certainly, with our support, in terms of town clerks and support for One Voice Wales, bodies are there for small, embryonic groups to contact if they want to form a council; they will be helped and supported.

The Presiding Officer: Question 7, OAQ0757(LGP), has been withdrawn.

wedi gweld y ffigurau diweddaraf, er mis Mai—yn cynnwys tua thri chwarter cynghorau tref a chymuned Cymru o hyd.

Laura Anne Jones: A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi unrhyw gymorth neu gymhellion i gymunedau yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt gyngor cymuned i gychwyn sefydliad o'r fath? Onid ydych yn cytuno y gallai rhoi mwy o bwerau i gynghorau cymuned fod yn gymhelliant?

Sue Essex: Mae ganddynt gryn dipyn o bwerau—i ddechrau, mae ganddynt bwerau praesept. Fel y soniais wrth Irene, nid yw rhai cymunedau yng Nghymru yn dymuno cael cynghorau cymuned, ac maent wedi gwneud hynny'n glir. Mae rhai cymunedau'n awyddus i'w cynghorau cymuned weithredu mewn ffordd gymharol gyfyngedig, sy'n gweddu i'r cymunedau hynny. Mae eraill, yn enwedig cynghorau tref, yn gyfranogwyr cryf a fyddai, efallai, yn awyddus i gael contractau ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau gyda'r prif awdurdodau, sef y cynghorau sir neu'r cynghorau bwrdeistref sirol.

Mae'r strategaeth gymunedol y mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob awdurdod unedol yng Nghymru i'w pharatoi yn ffordd dda i ymgysylltu â chynghorau cymuned a dod i wybod hefyd am unrhyw ddi-ddordebau cychwynnol a all fod ar lawr gwlad. Yn sicr, gyda'n cefnogaeth ni, o ran clerod tref a'r gefnogaeth ar gyfer Un Llais i Gymru, mae yna gyrff y gall grwpiau bach, cychwynnol gysylltu â hwy os ydynt am sefydlu cyngor; cânt eu cynorthwyo a'u cefnogi.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7, OAQ0757(LGP), yn ôl.

Gwella Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol Improving Local Government Funding

Q8 Irene James: What action has the Minister taken to improve local government funding in Wales? OAQ0741(LGP)

C8 Irene James: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cymryd i wella cyllid llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? OAQ0741(LGP)

Sue Essex: To use the figure for 1999 as a starting point—predating my time in this job—local government funding has time increased by 50 per cent.

Sue Essex: I ddefnyddio'r ffigur ar gyfer 1999 fel man cychwyn—cyn imi ymgymryd â'r swydd hon—mae cyllid llywodraeth leol wedi cynyddu 50 y cant yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Irene James: I understand that the most recent report of the distribution sub-group is due to be completed next month, containing formula changes that were deferred for 12 months to allow for their impact to be properly considered. Do you agree that it is equally important to retrospectively assess the impact of formula changes to ensure that they deliver socially just outcomes for all parts of Wales?

Sue Essex: The way that the local government formula is put together is extremely complicated. I could take several questions in the time that I would take to answer that question.

First, in terms of formula changes, we will try to get them as right as we can for 2008-09, when the three-year settlement begins. In terms of your second point, about whether or not they are up to date and accurate, they have to be up to date in core information and data that goes in, whether it is census data, pupil numbers or whatever. Secondly, if there are major issues about the indicators, they are put in front of the distribution sub-group and considered. I am certainly on course to look at sparsity and deprivation in a fundamental way to make sure that the spending meets the need in both of those areas. In due course, when we have that information, it will be formulated into the formula.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad gan Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru, ym mis Mawrth, ar dlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol yng ngefn gwlad Cymru. Dengys yr adroddiad batrwm tebyg o ran tlodi mewn ardaloedd yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru, de-orllewin Cymru, a'r Cymoedd, sy'n groes i'r patrwm a welir yn y mynegai amddifadedd lluosog diweddaraf. A ydych wedi ystyried casgliadau'r adroddiad hwn, ac a fyddwch yn eu hystyried yn y dyfodol wrth ddosrannu elfennau cyllid ar gyfer amddifadedd i lywodraeth leol?

Sue Essex: I am certainly aware of the report although I have not read it in detail. I take the points that you have made. From your description, it accords to the Objective 1 area.

Irene James: Deallaf fod disgwyl i adroddiad diweddaraf yr is-grŵp dosbarthu gael ei gwblhau fis nesaf, i gynnwys newidiadau yn y fformiwla a ohirwyd am 12 mis er mwyn caniatáu ystyried ei heffaith yn briodol. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod lawn mor bwysig asesu effaith y newidiadau yn y fformiwla yn olyddol er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn darparu canlyniadau sy'n gymdeithasol deg i bob rhan o Gymru?

Sue Essex: Mae'r ffordd y mae'r fformiwla llywodraeth leol yn cael ei llunio yn gymhleth iawn. Gallwn gymryd nifer o gwestiynau yn yr amser y byddai'n ei gymryd i ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw.

Yn gyntaf, o ran y newidiadau yn y fformiwla, ceisiwn sicrhau eu bod mor gywir â phosibl ar gyfer 2008-09, pan fydd y setliad tair blynedd yn cychwyn. O ran eich ail bwynt, p'un a ydynt yn gywir ac yn gyfredol, rhaid iddynt fod yn gyfredol o ran y wybodaeth a'r data craidd a ddefnyddir, boed yn ddata o'r cyfrifiad, niferoedd disgyblion, neu beth bynnag. Yn ail, os daw materion pwysig i'r amlwg yn ymwneud â'r dangosyddion, fe'u cyflwynir gerbron yr is-grŵp dosbarthu a chânt eu hystyried. Yn sicr, yr wyf yn bwriadu ystyried teneurwydd y boblogaeth ac amddifadedd mewn ffordd sylfaenol er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwariant yn diwallu'r anghenion yn y ddau faes hynny. Maes o law, pan fydd gennym y wybodaeth honno, caiff ei defnyddio yn y fformiwla.

Alun Ffred Jones: In March, the Wales Rural Observatory published a report on poverty and social exclusion in rural Wales. The report identifies similar patterns of poverty in areas of north-west Wales, south-west Wales, and the Valleys, which contradict the pattern identified in the latest index of multiple deprivation. Have you considered the conclusions of this report, and will you be taking these on board when you allocate funding targeted at deprivation to local government?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn sicr yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad er nad wyf wedi ei ddarllen yn fanwl. Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwyntiau a wnewch. O'ch disgrifiad, mae'n cyd-fynd â'r

This look at deprivation will be right across the piece; it will include rural, valley and traditional urban areas. During that work, we will pick up as much information as we can. We do not use the index of multiple deprivation to a great extent in the formula because it is a relative distribution, which has some questions around it. What we were trying to do—and this was in my reference to Irene—was to get some more information about our understanding of need to spend to tackle deprivation and dispersal. That is what will be the nature of that work. We will certainly use anything that the Wales Rural Observatory has come up with that is relevant.

Alun Cairns: Does the Minister think that council tax has now lost all its credibility? Some pensioners who have a band D property pay 21 per cent of their income in council tax. Do you think that that is acceptable?

Sue Essex: I have not heard Mr Cameron coming up with a view yet that says that he will get rid of council tax. It was your Government's invention, so I find your comment to be strange. In Chamber discussions around council tax, your colleagues have never moved away from the idea that a property tax is the most sensible way forward. If you are making policy on the hoof, or if there has been a policy change at the centre, it would be interesting for us to know; or perhaps this is an Alun Cairns proposal that Mr Cameron might like to pick up.

The key issue around council tax is volatility. I have always mentioned two things, the first of which is the volatility of increases, in particular, which have made it difficult for people to understand why council tax should suddenly shoot up by 10 or 12 per cent. Quite understandably, that makes it difficult for them to plan. In the last few years, we have kept that rate down. I have had some criticism from you, but I defend what I have done because we have managed to stabilise the council tax level. The second thing that I always mention is council tax benefit. I have been strong in saying that the council-tax

ardal Amcan 1. Bydd y broses hon o ystyried amddifadedd yn cwmpasu'r cyfan; bydd yn cynnwys ardaloedd gwledig, ardaloedd y cymoedd ac ardaloedd trefol traddodiadol. Yn ystod y gwaith hwnnw, byddwn yn casglu cymaint o wybodaeth ag y gallwn. Nid ydym yn defnyddio'r mynegai amddifadedd lluosog i raddau helaeth yn y fformiwla gan ei fod yn ddosbarthiad cymharol, ac mae rhai cwestiynau'n codi yn ei gylch. Yr hyn yr oeddem yn ceisio'i wneud—a chyfeiriais at hyn yn fy ateb i Irene—oedd cael mwy o wybodaeth am ein dealltwriaeth o'r angen i wario er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a gwasgariad. Dyna fydd natur y gwaith hwnnw. Yn sicr, byddwn yn defnyddio unrhyw ddeunydd perthnasol sydd gan Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru.

Alun Cairns: A yw'r Gweinidog o'r farn fod y dreth gyngor wedi colli ei hygredd yn llwyr erbyn hyn? Mae rhai pensynwyr sydd ag eiddo ym mand D yn talu 21 y cant o'u hincwm mewn treth gyngor. A ydych yn credu bod hynny'n dderbyniol?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf wedi clywed Mr Cameron yn sôn eto ei fod yn bwriadu cael gwared o'r dreth gyngor. Eich Llywodraeth chi a greodd y dreth, felly, mae eich sylw yn un rhyfedd. Mewn trafodaethau am y dreth gyngor yn y Siambr, nid yw eich cyd-Aelodau erioed wedi symud o'r syniad mai treth eiddo yw'r ffordd fwyaf synhwyrol ymlaen. Os ydych yn llunio polisi ar fympwy, neu os bu newid polisi yn y canol, hoffem glywed amdano; neu efallai mai cynnig Alun Cairns yw hwn yr hoffai Mr Cameron ei ddefnyddio.

Y prif fater o ran y dreth gyngor yw y gall newid yn annisgwyl. Yr wyf bob amser wedi sôn am ddau beth. Y cyntaf yw'r ffaith na ellir rhag-weld lefel y cynnydd, yn arbennig, sydd wedi ei gwneud yn anodd i bobl ddeall pam y dylai'r dreth gyngor gynyddu'n sydyn 10 neu 12 y cant. Yn ddigon dealladwy, mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn anodd iddynt gynllunio. Yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf yr ydym wedi llwyddo i reoli'r gyfradd honno. Cefais fy meirniadu rywfaint gennyh, ond yr wyf yn amddiffyn yr hyn a wneuthum gan ein bod wedi llwyddo i sefydlogi lefel y dreth gyngor. Yr ail beth y

benefit regime needs to change to pick up pensioners on low and fixed incomes in particular. I will continue to push for that and I shall continue to work for better take-up of council tax benefit.

byddaf bob amser yn sôn amdano yw'r budd-dal treth gyngor. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn gadarn fod angen i'r system budd-dal treth gyngor newid er mwyn ystyried pensiynwyr ar incymau isel a sefydlog yn benodol. Byddaf yn parhau i bwysu am hynny ac yn parhau i weithio i sicrhau cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n gwneud cais am fudd-dal treth gyngor.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 9, OAQ773(LGP), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 9, OAQ773(LGP), has been withdrawn.

2.30 p.m.

Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yng Ngheredigion Public Services in Ceredigion

C10 Elin Jones: Pa gynlluniau newydd sydd gan y Gweinidog i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Ngheredigion yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf? OAQ0747(LGP)

Q10 Elin Jones: What new plans does the Minister have to improve public services in Ceredigion during the next 12 months? OAQ0747(LGP)

Sue Essex: We have set out our vision for high-quality, responsive services, as I said to Nick, in 'Making the Connections'. We are also supporting the delivery of these services by providing some £90 million—in revenue support grant and non-domestic rates—of Assembly Government funding to Ceredigion, in particular. It had a 5.6 per cent increase in 2005-06, which is considerably above the Welsh average.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym wedi gosod allan ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau ymatebol o safon, fel y dywedais wrth Nick, yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi darparu'r gwasanaethau hyn drwy ddarparu tua £90 miliwn—mewn grant cynnal refeniw ac ardrethi annomestig—o gyllid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i Geredigion, yn arbennig. Bu cynnydd o 5.6 y cant yn 2005-06, sy'n sylweddol uwch na chyfartaledd Cymru.

Elin Jones: Bu i chi gyhoeddi cytundeb adeiladu yn ddiweddar ar gyfer swyddfa newydd eich Llywodraeth yn y gogledd. Pryd ydych chi'n rhagweld cyhoeddi cytundeb tebyg ar gyfer adeiladu'r swyddfa newydd yn Aberystwyth ar gyfer eich Llywodraeth, ac a oes gennych amserlen ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw?

Elin Jones: You recently announced a building contract for your new Government Office in north Wales. When do you foresee announcing a similar contract for the construction of the new Government office in Aberystwyth, and do you have a timetable for that work?

Sue Essex: The Aberystwyth office was always programmed to come behind the Llandudno one. I cannot give you the exact date, but the completion should be within a few months—four to six months—of the Llandudno Junction office. If it differs from that, I will write to you. However, progress is being made, and we are fairly hopeful that we will meet the original date that we set.

Sue Essex: Y bwriad erioed oedd y byddai swyddfa Aberystwyth yn cael ei chwblhau ar ôl un Llandudno. Ni allaf roi'r union ddyddiad ichi, ond dylai fod wedi ei chwblhau ychydig misoedd—pedwar i chwe mis—ar ôl swyddfa Cyffordd Llandudno. Os bydd yn wahanol i hynny, ysgrifennaf atoch. Fodd bynnag, mw yna gynnydd, ac yr ydym yn lled obeithiol y byddwn yn bodloni'r dyddiad gwreiddiol a osodwyd gennym.

Nick Bourne: Has the Minister had any discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services about the financial position of Bronglais hospital trust, and, in particular, the proposals in 'Designed to Deliver', which would result in considerable downgrading of services at Bronglais hospital? I was recently contacted by a 90-year-old constituent who already faces a round trip of 11 hours to Singleton for treatment. Many more constituents of similar age would face that sort of journey time if services in Bronglais were downgraded. What discussions, if any, has the Minister had with Brian Gibbons?

Nick Bourne: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol ynghylch sefyllfa ariannol ymddiriedolaeth ysbyty Bron-glais, ac yn arbennig y cynigion yn 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', a fyddai'n arwain at israddio gwasanaethau'n sylweddol yn ysbyty Bron-glais? Cysylltodd etholwr 90 oed â mi'n ddiweddar sydd eisoes yn wynebu taith gyflawn o 11 awr i Singleton i gael triniaeth. Byddai llawer mwy o etholwyr o oed tebyg yn wynebu teithiau o'r fath pe bai gwasanaethau ym Mron-glais yn cael eu hisraddio. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Brian Gibbons, os o gwbl?

Sue Essex: I have regular discussions with Brian, as you can imagine, on NHS finance, which include references and keeping up to date with the situation in all trusts in Wales. On your second point about proposals for reconfiguration, which I believe is the generally accepted term, we all know that they are out for consultation. I understand people's worries, and I am sure that Brian does too. However, they are out for consultation, and all comments received, whether from individuals or from organisations, will be carefully considered by the Minister for Health and Social Services. I am sure that he will take into consideration those difficult journeys that some people are worried about.

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Brian, fel y gallwch ddychmygu, am gyllid y GIG, sy'n cynnwys cyfeiriadau a'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa ym mhob ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru. O ran eich ail bwynt ynglŷn â chynigion ar gyfer ail-gyflunio, a chredaf mai dyna yw'r term a dderbynnir yn gyffredinol, yr ydym wrthi'n ymgynghori arnynt. Gallaf ddeall pryderon pobl, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod Brian yn eu deall hefyd. Fodd bynnag, bydd ymgynghori arnynt, a chaiff yr holl sylwadau a ddaw i law, boed gan unigolion neu sefydliadau, eu hystyried yn ofalus gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ystyried y teithiau anodd hynny y mae rhai pobl yn pryderu amdanynt.

Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol Llywodraeth y DU
UK Government Department for Communities and Local Government

Q11 Jonathan Morgan: Has the Minister yet met with colleagues at the UK Government Department for Communities and Local Government? OAQ0772(LGP)

C11 Jonathan Morgan: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cyfarfod â chydweithwyr yn Adran Cymunedau a Llywodraeth Leol llywodraeth y DU? OAQ0772(LGP)

Sue Essex: I shall be meeting Phil Woolas on 8 June.

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn cyfarfod â Phil Woolas ar 8 Mehefin.

Jonathan Morgan: When you meet Phil Woolas, you should perhaps take the opportunity to meet Angela Smith, who, as one of the Parliamentary Under-Secretaries of State, is responsible for—and I like this term—local government intervention and engagement. On behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, perhaps you could

Jonathan Morgan: Pan fyddwch yn cyfarfod â Phil Woolas, efallai y dylech hefyd fanteisio ar y cyfle i gyfarfod ag Angela Smith, sydd, fel un o'r Is-grifenyddion Seneddol, yn gyfrifol—ac yr wyf yn hoffi'r term hwn—am ymyrryd ac ymgysylltu â llywodraeth leol. Ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, efallai y

learn more from the UK Government about how it deals with problems in social services in local authorities in England. Local authorities in England have a better rate of intervention, a better and more obvious way of intervening, where social services departments have failed in English local authorities, in stark comparison to the Minister's approach here in Wales.

Sue Essex: I am not sure what you are referring to. I met Angela many times when she was a Minister at the Northern Ireland Office. What we have put in place in Wales has been the work that has been done through a concordat of understanding through the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales, which I am sure you would not want to undermine or diminish in any way, because it is an important organisation that has had a big impact. Therefore, there is that concordat of understanding, and there is an intervention protocol. We referred to that kind of intervention early on. In addition, I am very positive about the work that the Welsh Local Government Association is doing, with our financial support, around social services, standards, support, and best practice. That is being led by Meryl Gravell. Again, I challenge anything in England to compare with that work, which will be at the cutting edge of intervention and support.

gallech ddysgu mwy gan Lywodraeth y DU ynglŷn ag ymdrin â phroblemau mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr. Mae gan awdurdod lleol yn Lloegr well cyfradd ymyrryd, ffordd well a mwy amlwg o ymyrryd, lle mae adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi methu mewn awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr, i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr i ddull y Gweinidog yma yng Nghymru.

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr at beth yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Cyfarfûm ag Angela droeon pan oedd yn Weinidog yn Swyddfa Gogledd Iwerddon. Yr hyn a roddwyd ar waith gennym yng Nghymru yw'r gwaith a wnaed drwy gongordat cyd-ddealltwriaeth drwy Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru. Mae'n siŵr na fydddech yn dymuno tanseilio na bychanu honno mewn unrhyw ffordd, gan ei fod yn sefydliad pwysig sydd wedi cael effaith fawr. Felly, lluniwyd y concordat cyd-ddealltwriaeth hwnnw, a phrotocol ymyrryd. Cyfeiriwyd at y math hwnnw o ymyriad yn gynharach. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn gadarnhaol iawn am y gwaith y mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn ei wneud, gyda'n cymorth ariannol, o ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, safonau, cymorth ac arfer gorau. Arweinir hynny gan Meryl Gravell. Unwaith eto, heriaf unrhyw waith sy'n mynd rhagddo yn Lloegr i'w gymharu â'r gwaith hwnnw, a fydd yn arloesi ym maes ymyrryd a chymorth.

Diwygio Ardrethi Busnes Business Rate Reforms

Q12 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on business rate reforms? OAQ0740(LGP)

C12 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddiwygio ardrethi busnes? OAQ0740(LGP)

Sue Essex: We have undertaken an extensive consultation on business rate relief. There have been several useful and innovative suggestions as a result, and we are now considering the options before making a decision on any potential new scheme.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori'n helaeth am ryddhad ardrethi busnes. O ganlyniad, cafwyd llawer awgrym defnyddiol ac arloesol, ac yr ydym yn awr yn ystyried y dewisiadau cyn gwneud penderfyniad am unrhyw gynllun newydd posibl.

Jenny Randerson: As you know, a quarter of the most deprived areas in Wales are located in Cardiff, Newport and the Vale of Glamorgan. Business rate relief on a much wider scale than is currently available would be a welcome new initiative from the

Jenny Randerson: Fel y gwyddoch, mae chwarter yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru yng Nghaerdydd, Casnewydd a Bro Morgannwg. Byddai rhyddhad ardrethi busnes ar raddfa lawer ehangach nag ar hyn o bryd yn fenter newydd gan y Llywodraeth a

Government. Can you give us news of when you expect to be able to introduce any possible changes? I have had constituents contact me again recently on this issue, from areas that are being completely decimated by the big increase in business rates that has occurred in the last year or so. Can you tell us whether you are looking at the situation where hardship relief can be given to businesses, rather than simply small business rate relief?

Sue Essex: In Cardiff, we have experienced what we have referred to as hot spots, which occurred post the revaluation; they had an impact on small businesses and I, as Minister, looked into those. This did not just apply to Cardiff, but we experienced quite a few hot spots in Cardiff. I am probably looking at September in terms of coming forward because, as you will appreciate, it is complicated. I take your point about hardship relief. There has been a lot of discussion with local authorities about the fact that this, up until now, has not always been used. We have been spending £17.5 million—and that was in 2004-05; it might be higher for 2005-06—on the rural relief scheme, and yet there are other parts of Wales that have not been getting the help that they deserve. I have very much taken those points on board.

fyddai cael croeso mawr. A allwch roi newyddion inni pryd y disgwyliwch allu cyflwyno unrhyw newidiadau posibl? Mae etholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi eto'n ddiweddar am y mater hwn, o ardaloedd sy'n dioddef yn enbyd oherwydd y cynnydd mawr mewn ardrethi busnes a welwyd yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. A allwch ddweud wrthym a ydych yn edrych ar y sefyllfa lle gellir rhoi rhyddhad i fusnesau oherwydd caledi, yn hytrach na rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach yn unig?

Sue Essex: Yng Nghaerdydd, yr ydym wedi profi'r hyn y cyfeiriwyd atynt fel ardaloedd lle mae problemau, a ddiwyddodd ar ôl yr ail-werthuso. Cawsant effaith ar fusnesau bach, ac fel y Gweinidog ymchwiliais i'r rheini. Nid i Gaerdydd yn unig yr oedd hyn yn berthnasol, ond yr oedd nifer o ardaloedd yng Nghaerdydd lle'r oedd problemau. Mae'n debyg mai ym mis Medi y byddaf yn gallu gweithredu, oherwydd fel y byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi mae'n fater cymhleth. Derbynïaf eich pwynt am ryddhad caledi. Bu llawer o drafod gydag awdurdodau lleol am y ffaith nad yw hyn, hyd yma, wedi ei ddefnyddio bob amser. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gwario £17.5 miliwn—a hynny yn 2004-05; efallai y bydd yn uwch yn 2005-06—ar y cynllun rhyddhad gwledig, ac eto mae rhannau eraill o Gymru heb gael y cymorth y maent yn ei haeddu. Yr wyf yn sicr wedi cydnabod y pwyntiau hynny.

Cytundebau Polisi â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot Policy Agreements with Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council

Q13 Gwenda Thomas: Will the Minister give an update on the policy agreements between the Welsh Assembly Government and Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council? OAQ0778(LGP)

C13 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cytundebau polisi rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot? OAQ0778(LGP)

Sue Essex: We have concluded the first round of the policy agreement for Neath Port Talbot, and, similar to my answer for Flintshire, the performance for 2004-05 was sufficiently strong for it to receive just over £1.5 million.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym wedi cwblhau cylch cyntaf y cytundeb polisi ar gyfer Castell-nedd Port Talbot, ac fel fy hateb ar gyfer sir y Fflint, roedd y perfformiad ar gyfer 2004-05 yn ddigon cryf iddo gael ychydig dros £1.5 miliwn.

Gwenda Thomas: I understand from Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council that, following the introduction of the policy

Gwenda Thomas: Caf ar ddeall gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, yn dilyn cyflwyno'r cytundebau polisi, fod

agreements, a positive relationship has continued with the Welsh Assembly Government, and that, in all areas, positive outcomes have been achieved to date. The 2005-06 outcomes are due to be analysed shortly. Will you join me, Minister, in commending the authority's commitment to achieving a greater level of compliance with the generic equality standards for local government in Wales?

Sue Essex: Neath Port Talbot, along with lots of other councils, has embraced this way forward of working together and trying to push up standards in absolutely key areas such as attendance at secondary schools, children leaving school without accommodation and homelessness. These are real bread-and-butter performance areas on which we want local authorities to deliver. Partnership sometimes seems like a soft way, but if it is done in a positive way, it can work, and that has certainly been the case with Neath Port Talbot.

perthynas gadarnhaol wedi parhau gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a bod canlyniadau cadarnhaol wedi'u gweld hyd yma ym mhob maes. Disgwylir i ganlyniadau 2005-06 gael eu dadansoddi cyn hir. A ymunwch â mi, Weinidog, i longyfarch ymrwymiad yr awdurdod i sicrhau mwy o gydymffurfio â'r safonau cydraddoldeb cyffredinol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: Mae Castell-nedd Port Talbot, ynghyd â nifer o gynghorau eraill, wedi croesawu'r ffordd hon ymlaen o weithio gyda'n gilydd a cheisio codi safonau mewn meysydd cwbl allweddol, megis presenoldeb mewn ysgolion uwchradd, plant yn gadael yr ysgol heb lety, a digartrefedd. Mae'r rhain yn feysydd perfformiad hollol sylfaenol lle yr ydym yn dymuno i awdurdodau lleol gyflawni. Weithiau mae partneriaeth yn ymddangos yn ffordd hawdd i wneud pethau, ond os caiff ei wneud mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, gall weithio, ac mae hynny'n sicr yn wir am Castell-nedd Port Talbot.

Gostyngiad Ardrethi Busnes Business Rate Relief

Q14 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on business rate relief in Wales? OAQ0777(LGP)

Sue Essex: This follows on from Jenny's question and, as I said, we have gone out to consultation on that work. I have the document with me. We are analysing the consultation and, hopefully, we will come up with a way forward later on this year.

Laura Anne Jones: The question has already been asked by Jenny Randerson, but, because I too am constantly contacted by constituents about this problem and because small businesses in my area of south-east Wales, and throughout Wales, are suffering, I urge you to address this issue now.

Sue Essex: We cannot address it now because there is a complicated process to go through to make changes. As I said, we have gone out to consultation, and I respect that consultation. A lot of people have taken the time to give their views. We held four

C14 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ryddhad ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru? OAQ0777(LGP)

Sue Essex: Mae hyn yn dilyn o gwestiwn Jenny, ac fel y dywedais, yr ydym wrthi'n ymgynghori am y gwaith hwnnw. Mae'r ddogfen gennyf yma. Yr ydym yn dadansoddi'r ymgynghori, a gobeithio y gallwn bennu ffordd ymlaen yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Laura Anne Jones: Gofynnwyd y cwestiwn gan Jenny Randerson eisoes, ond gan fod fy etholwyr yn cysylltu â mi o hyd am y broblem hon, a chan fod busnesau bach yn fy ardal i, sef y de-ddwyrain, ac ar hyd a lled Cymru yn dioddef, apelïaf arnoch i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn awr.

Sue Essex: Ni allwn fynd i'r afael ag ef yn awr oherwydd mae proses gymhleth i fynd drwyddi er mwyn gwneud newidiadau. Fel y dywedais, yr ydym wrthi'n ymgynghori, ac yr wyf yn parchu'r ymgynghori hwnnw. Mae nifer o bobl wedi mynd i'r drafferth o fynegi

seminars on this across Wales; we had organised three but had to hold a fourth to meet the need. Therefore, it is not for me, as Minister, to disregard the views of other people. I am sure that you will reflect on the use of the word 'now', but you have my word that we will be considering it.

eu safbwyntiau. Cynhaliwyd pedwar seminar ar hyn ledled Cymru; yr oeddem wedi trefnu tri seminar, ond bu'n rhaid inni gynnal pedwar er mwyn diwallu'r angen. Felly, nid fy ngwaith i fel Gweinidog yw diystyru safbwyntiau pobl eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ystyried defnyddio'r geiriau 'yn awr', ond rhoddaf fy ngair ichi y byddwn yn ei ystyried.

The Presiding Officer: As question 15, OAQ0776(LGP), has been withdrawn, Minister, you have answered all the questions that were on your list today.

Y Llywydd: Gan fod cwestiwn 15, OAQ0776(LGP) wedi'i dynnu yn ôl, yr ydych wedi ateb pob cwestiwn a oedd ar eich cyfer chi heddiw, Weinidog.

2.40 p.m.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills

Gwasanaethau i Blant ag Anawsterau Dysgu Services for Children with Learning Difficulties

Q1 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on services available to children with learning difficulties in Wales? OAQ889(ELL)

C1 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i blant ag anawsterau dysgu yng Nghymru? OAQ889(ELL)

The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson): The 'Special Educational Needs Code of Practice for Wales', published in 2002, outlines the statutory framework and explains the procedures to be adopted in support of pupils with special educational needs. We are currently developing an inclusion policy and performance framework for Wales that supports all children and young people, including those with special educational needs.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson): Mae 'Cod Ymarfer Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Cymru', a gyhoeddwyd yn 2002, yn rhoi amlinelliad o'r fframwaith statudol ac yn esbonio'r gweithdrefnau i'w mabwysiadu i gynorthwyo disgyblion sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yr ydym wrthi'n datblygu fframwaith polisi a pherfformiad cynhwysiant i Gymru sy'n cynorthwyo plant a phobl ifanc i gyd, gan gynnwys y rheini sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

Laura Anne Jones: What support and funding is available for children who may have severe learning difficulties or autism and acute needs, who may need extra help or even one-to-one tuition?

Laura Anne Jones: Pa gymorth a chyllid sydd ar gael i blant sydd ag anawsterau dysgu dwys hwyrach neu awtistiaeth ac anghenion aciwt y gall fod angen cymorth ychwanegol arnynt, neu hyd yn oed hyfforddiant un i un?

Jane Davidson: Each local authority works with its schools and parents to assess children's individual needs. If children need a statement to ensure that specific provision is made available to them, the legal framework is as outlined in my answer.

Jane Davidson: Mae pob awdurdod lleol yn gweithio gyda'i ysgolion a rhieni i asesu anghenion unigol plant. Os bydd angen datganiad ar blant i sicrhau bod darpariaeth benodol ar gael iddynt, mae'r fframwaith cyfreithiol fel yr amlinellir yn fy ateb.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod cryn drafodaeth wedi ei chynnal yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran priodoldeb ysgolion arbennig ar gyfer plant ag anghenion dwys. Y ddadl ar yr ochr arall yw bod rhai yn credu na ddylai ysgolion arbennig fodoli ac y dylem wneud ysgolion prif ffrwd yn norm. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf beth yw safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch y ddadl honno?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi ei gwneud yn glir yn ystod cyfnod y Llywodraeth hon bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi ysgolion arbennig ac ysgolion sy'n cefnogi plant drwy agenda cynhwysiant.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I am sure the Minister is aware that there has been considerable debate in recent years about the appropriateness of special schools for children with acute needs. The other side of the debate is that some people believe we should not have special schools at all and that we should make mainstream schools the norm. Can the Minister tell me where the Assembly Government stands on that debate?

Jane Davidson: We have made it clear during this period of this Government that the Assembly Government supports special schools and schools that support children with an inclusion agenda.

Perfformiad Ysgolion (TGAU) Schools' Performance (GCSE)

Q2 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the performance of schools in Wales at GCSE level? OAQ881(ELL)

Jane Davidson: More pupils gain good GCSEs and a smaller proportion leave full-time education without recognised qualifications every year in Wales. Performance has improved year on year since 1998; the percentage of pupils gaining five or more good GCSEs has risen by 6 percentage points to just over 52 per cent last year.

Mark Isherwood: At the school with the highest number of pupils receiving free school meals in Wales, at 62 per cent, namely the Dylan Thomas Community School in Swansea, just 14 per cent of pupils achieved five A* to C passes at GCSE. However, at the school with the highest number of pupils receiving free school meals in England and Wales, at 83 per cent, namely St Paul's Community School in London, 59 per cent of pupils achieved five A* to C passes at GCSE. Why do you think that that is the case, Minister? Why is it that, according to figures obtained by the *Times Educational Supplement* under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, schools in England with a high number of pupils receiving free school meals are outperforming equivalent

C2 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad ysgolion yng Nghymru ar lefel TGAU? OAQ881(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae mwy o ddisgyblion yn ennill cymwysterau TGAU da a chyfran lai yn gadael addysg amser llawn heb gymwysterau cydnabyddedig bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru. Mae perfformiad wedi gwella bob blwyddyn er 1998; mae canran y disgyblion a gafodd bump neu ragor o gymwysterau TGAU da wedi codi 6 phwynt canran i ychydig dros 52 y cant y llynedd.

Mark Isherwood: Yn yr ysgol sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o ddisgyblion yn cael cinio ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru, sef 62 y cant, yn Ysgol Gymunedol Dylan Thomas yn Abertawe, 14 y cant yn unig o ddisgyblion a gafodd bum gradd A* i C ar lefel TGAU. Fodd bynnag, yn yr ysgol sydd â'r nifer fwyaf o ddisgyblion sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru a Lloegr, sef 83 y cant, sef Ysgol Gymunedol St Paul's yn Llundain, cafodd 59 y cant o ddisgyblion bum gradd A* i C ar lefel TGAU. Pam y mae hynny wedi digwydd, yn eich barn chi, Weinidog? Pam, yn ôl ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd yn y *Times Educational Supplement* o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, y mae ysgolion yn Lloegr lle mae nifer fawr o ddisgyblion yn cael cinio ysgol am ddim yn perfformio'n

schools in Wales three times over?

Jane Davidson: There is an easy answer to that question: if you look at the performance of individual local authorities in Wales, you will see substantial variation. Neath Port Talbot, as an authority, has the sixth-greatest level of deprivation in Wales, yet it outperforms a number of other authorities with lower levels of deprivation; that is down to the authority's commitment and huge amount of support for its schools for GCSE and other agendas. What we have seen in England, particularly through the Excellence in Cities programme, is similar targeted support for schools in highly disadvantaged areas, with high levels of pupils receiving free school meals. That is why the Assembly Government has put the RAISE funding in place.

Owen John Thomas: Rhwng 1999-2000 a 2004-05, yr oedd gan ysgolion cyfun cyfrwng Cymraeg gyfartaledd o 61.3 y cant o ddisgyblion yn ennill pum cymhwyster TGAU gyda graddau A* i C. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i geisio perswadio pobl yn Lloegr i gael mwy o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg?

Jane Davidson: Nid wyf yn gallu perswadio pobl yn Lloegr, ond yr wyf yn gallu perswadio pobl o Loegr, sydd wedi symud i Gymru, i anfon eu plant i ysgolion Cymraeg. Yr wyf yn falch o weld, yn y de-ddwyrain yn enwedig, llawer mwy ohonynt yn gwneud hynny.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ870(ELL), yn ôl.

well nag ysgolion cyfatebol yng Nghymru, a hynny deirgwaith yn fwy?

Jane Davidson: Mae ateb hawdd i'r cwestiwn hwnnw: os edrychwch ar berfformiad awdurdodau lleol unigol yng Nghymru fe welwch amrywiad sylweddol. Mae gan Gastell-nedd Port Talbot, fel awdurdod, y chweched lefel uchaf o ran amddifadedd yng Nghymru, ac eto mae'n perfformio'n well na nifer o awdurdodau eraill sydd â lefelau amddifadedd is; ymrwymiad yr awdurdod a'r cymorth mawr i'w ysgolion ar gyfer TGAU ac agendâu eraill sy'n gyfrifol am hynny. Yr hyn a welsom yn Lloegr, yn arbennig drwy'r rhaglen Rhagoriaeth mewn Dinasoedd, yw cymorth tebyg yn targedu ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig iawn, gyda niferoedd mawr o ddisgyblion yn cael cinio ysgol am ddim. Dyma pam mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi cyllid Rhagori ar waith.

Owen John Thomas: Between 1999-2000 and 2004-05, an average of 61.3 per cent of pupils in Welsh-medium comprehensive schools achieved five A* to C grades at GCSE. Do you have any plans to try to persuade people in England to have more Welsh-medium schools?

Jane Davidson: I cannot persuade people in England, but I can persuade people from England, who have moved to Wales, to send their children to Welsh-medium schools. I am pleased to see that many more of them, particularly in the south-east, are doing so.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3, OAQ870(ELL), has been withdrawn.

Penaethiaid Ysgolion Headteachers

Q4 William Graham: What action is the Minister taking to ensure that a sufficient number of headteachers are appointed in Wales? OAQ854(ELL)

Jane Davidson: In Wales, we are developing a healthy pool of well-qualified headteachers. Almost 900 practitioners have gained the mandatory National Professional

C4 William Graham: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod nifer ddigonol o benaethiaid ysgolion yn cael eu penodi yng Nghymru? OAQ854(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn datblygu cronfa iach o benaethiaid sydd â chymwysterau da. Mae bron 900 o ymarferwyr wedi ennill y Cymhwyster

Qualification for Headship. With a throughput of up to 170 per annum, it is anticipated that up to 1,700 aspiring headteachers will hold the qualification by 2010.

William Graham: As you know, some 600 headteachers will retire in the next five years. Will the targets that you have just announced be met?

Jane Davidson: Considering the fact that we will have more than 1,000 people trained for headship by the end of the summer term, and with the requirements on the selection criteria indicating that those who undertake the course must be seeking headship in the next three years, they will.

William Graham: Do you propose to reduce red tape for headteachers, thereby making such positions more attractive to applicants?

Jane Davidson: I continue to work with headteachers and others in looking at reducing bureaucracy. In fact, only this morning, I met the school workload advisory panel, and we are jointly issuing guidelines to schools that are agreed by directors of education, the school workload advisory panel and us to help to tackle some of the red-tape issues.

Denise Idris Jones: Having heard your answer to William Graham, I feel that it is important that teachers who aspire to become deputy heads know the way to do that. I have been asked for that kind of advice in many schools in north Wales. Do you therefore agree that teachers must be encouraged to progress in this way, and how can we ensure that teachers are well informed of their career opportunities?

Jane Davidson: It is important that people realise the career opportunities that are available. Of course, from the Assembly Government, we pay the full costs of those people who follow the NPQH programmes. The numbers speak for themselves. To have more than 1,000 people qualified with the new qualification by the end of this summer—not all of whom are seeking

Proffesiynol Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Prifathrawiaeth, sy'n gymhwyster gorfodol. Gyda hyd at 170 o ymarferwyr y flwyddyn yn dilyn y cwrs, rhagwelir y bydd hyd at 1,700 o ddarpar benaethiaid yn meddu ar y cymhwyster erbyn 2010.

William Graham: Fel y gwyddoch, bydd tua 600 o benaethiaid yn ymddeol yn ystod y pum mlynedd nesaf. A gaiff y targedau a gyhoeddwyd gennych eu cyflawni?

Jane Davidson: O gofio y bydd gennym fwy na 1,000 o bobl wedi'u hyfforddi ar gyfer prifathrawiaeth erbyn diwedd tymor yr haf, a chyda gofynion y meini prawf dewis yn nodi bod yn rhaid i'r rheini sy'n dilyn y cwrs ymgeisio am swydd pennaeth yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf, caiff y targedau eu cyflawni.

William Graham: A ydych yn cynnig lleihau'r fiwrocratiaeth i benaethiaid, ac felly sicrhau bod swyddi o'r fath yn fwy deniadol i ymgeiswyr?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn parhau i weithio gyda phenaethiaid ac eraill i ystyried lleihau biwrocratiaeth. A dweud y gwir, cyfarfûm â'r panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion y bore yma, ac yr ydym yn cyd-gyhoeddi canllawiau i ysgolion wedi eu cytuno gan gyfarwyddwyr addysg, y panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion a ninnau i helpu mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau biwrocratiaeth.

Denise Idris Jones: Ar ôl clywed eich ateb i William Graham, credaf ei bod yn bwysig fod athrawon sy'n dymuno bod yn ddirprwy benaethiaid yn gwybod sut i wneud hynny. Gofynnwyd imi am y math hwnnw o gyngor mewn llawer ysgol yn y gogledd. Felly, a ydych yn cytuno bod yn rhaid annog athrawon i ddatblygu fel hyn, a sut y gallwn sicrhau bod athrawon yn cael gwybodaeth ddigonol am eu cyfleoedd gyrfa?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bwysig i bobl fod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfleoedd gyrfa sydd ar gael. Wrth gwrs, o safbwynt Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn talu costau llawn y bobl hynny sy'n dilyn rhaglenni CPCP. Mae'r niferoedd yn llefaru drostynt eu hunain. Bydd cael dros 1,000 o bobl sydd â'r cymhwyster newydd erbyn diwedd yr haf hwn—nid ydynt i gyd am fod yn benaethiaid

headship at present—when we have only around 2,000 schools in Wales, demonstrates that we are putting the investment in and that we will have the pool of people there.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Da yw gwybod eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r beichiau a osodir ar brifathrawon oherwydd gwaith papur, a'ch bod yn trafod y mater. A wnewch chi dderbyn y ffaith foel fod y baich gwaith papur wedi cynyddu ar brifathrawon yn ystod eich cyfnod yn Weinidog, yn hytrach na lleihau?

Jane Davidson: Credaf ei bod hi'n bwysig gweithio gyda'r undebau a'r panel cynghori ar lwyth gwaith ysgolion i leihau'r gwaith diangen. Yr wyf yn parhau i weithio gyda hwy i wneud yr agenda'n glir.

ar hyn o bryd—pan nad oes ond tua 2,000 o ysgolion yng Nghymru yn dangos ein bod yn buddsoddi ac y bydd gennym gronfa o bobl ar gael.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is good to know that you are aware of the burdens on headteachers because of paperwork, and that you are discussing the matter. Will you accept the bare fact that the burden of paperwork on headteachers has increased during your time as Minister, rather than decreased?

Jane Davidson: I believe it is important to work with the unions and the school workload advisory panel to reduce unnecessary work. I continue to work with them to make the agenda clear.

Ariannu Ysgolion Gwledig The Funding of Rural Schools

Q5 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister update us on her budget priorities for funding in rural schools? OAQ871(ELL)

Jane Davidson: School budgets are decided by local authorities, supported by funding provided by the Assembly through the local government revenue settlement. Since 2002-03, we have also provided additional funding to authorities for small and rural schools to support innovation and collaboration, the community use of school premises and support for headteachers.

Nick Bourne: The Minister will probably be aware of Pentlepoir County Primary School in my constituency—I know that she cannot comment on the particular case—which is threatened with closure in 2007. It is an excellent school, and its pupils will have to travel some distance to another school if it does close. What is the Minister doing generally to ensure that local authorities are aware of the sums that are available because of the budget concessions won by opposition parties in the last budget round to assist rural schools?

Jane Davidson: The grant for rural and small schools has been available since 2002. The concession won in the last round was to bring

C5 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am ei blaenoriaethau cyllidebol ar gyfer ariannu ysgolion gwledig? OAQ871(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Awdurdodau lleol sy'n pennu cyllidebau ysgolion, a gaiff eu hategu gan y Cynulliad drwy'r setliad refeniw lywodraeth leol. Er 2002-03 yr ydym hefyd wedi rhoi arian ychwanegol i awdurdodau fel y gall ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig gefnogi arloesedd a chydweithredu, er mwyn i gymunedau ddefnyddio ysgolion ac er mwyn rhoi cymorth i benaethiaid.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n debyg y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod am Ysgol Gynradd Sirol Pentlepoir yn fy etholaeth i—gwn na all wneud sylwadau ar yr achos penodol—lle mae bygythiad i'w chau yn 2007. Mae'n ysgol wych, a bydd yn rhaid i'w disgyblion deithio cryn bellter i ysgol arall os bydd yn cau. Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud yn gyffredinol i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn ymwybodol o'r symiau sydd ar gael yn sgîl consesiynau'r gyllideb a enillwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau yn y cylch cyllideb diwethaf er mwyn helpu ysgolion gwledig?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r grant i ysgolion gwledig ac ysgolion bach ar gael er 2002. Nod y consesiwn a enillwyd yn y rownd

the three separate grants back under one budget heading while retaining all the purposes for which the grant could be made available. Authorities are fully aware of all the budget options available, and they have a duty to ensure that they spend sufficient funding in their areas to ensure that education provision of a quality that they would want to see is provided.

Janet Ryder: You have just detailed several things that that small rural grant has to cover—and it is a small grant when you consider the number of small schools in Wales—yet you have simply extended the things that have to be included in that when you sent out the information to authorities about the RAISE budget.

2.50 p.m.

It says that to identify those schools that are eligible, you will exclude those with fewer than 50 pupils on the roll, because of their eligibility for small and rural schools grants. You expect the small schools grant to pick up the vital work that you have identified in supporting those pupils most in need. It seems that you are pursuing policies that are set and will lead to the closure of all schools in Wales with fewer than 50 pupils. Why are you going against your own Government's policies of inclusion and discriminating against pupils in smaller schools?

Jane Davidson: We have never discriminated against pupils in smaller schools in any way. In order for schools to qualify for the RAISE programme, at least 20 per cent of the total cohort must be eligible for free school meals. Small schools do not have that kind of percentage, and are already supported by the small and rural schools grant. The Assembly Government has made it clear that it is up to local authorities to look at school provision in their areas. They have a job in which they should be supported by Assembly Members from all parties, to ensure that they have the right number of schools and the right standard of education for the children in their area.

ddiwethaf oedd dod â'r tri grant ar wahân yn ôl o dan un pennawd cyllideb gan gadw'r holl resymau dros fodolaeth y grant. Mae awdurdodau'n gwbl ymwybodol o'r holl ddewisiadau cyllideb sydd ar gael, ac mae'n ddyletswydd arnynt i sicrhau eu bod yn gwario digon o arian yn eu hardaloedd i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth addysg o'r safon y maent am ei gweld.

Janet Ryder: Yr ydych newydd fanylu ar nifer o bethau y mae'n rhaid i'r grant gwledig bach hwnnw eu cwmpasu—ac mae'n grant bach pan ystyriwch nifer yr ysgolion bach yng Nghymru—ond y cyfan yr ydych wedi'i wneud yw ymestyn y pethau y mae'n rhaid eu cynnwys ynddo pan anfonwyd y wybodaeth gennych am y gyllideb Rhagori i awdurdodau.

Mae'n dweud, er mwyn nodi'r ysgolion hynny sy'n gymwys, y bydd yn rhaid ichi eithrio'r ysgolion hynny sydd â llai na 50 o ddisgyblion ar y gofrestr, am eu bod yn gymwys i gael grantiau ysgolion bach a grantiau ysgolion gwledig. Yr ydych yn disgwyl i'r grant ysgolion bach ariannu'r gwaith hanfodol a nodwyd gennych o ran cefnogi'r disgyblion hynny sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Ymddengys eich bod yn mynd ar drywydd polisiau sefydledig a fydd yn arwain at gau pob ysgol yng Nghymru sydd â llai na 50 o blant. Pam yr ydych yn mynd yn erbyn polisiau eich Llywodraeth eich hun ar gynhwysiant ac yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn disgyblion mewn ysgolion llai?

Jane Davidson: Nid ydym erioed wedi gwahaniaethu yn erbyn disgyblion mewn ysgolion llai mewn unrhyw ffordd. Er mwyn i rai ysgolion fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y rhaglen Rhagori, rhaid i o leiaf 20 y cant o'r garfan gyfan fod yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim. Nid oes gan ysgolion bach y math hwnnw o ganran, a chânt eu cefnogi eisoes gan grantiau ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ei gwneud yn glir mai penderfyniad awdurdodau lleol yw adolygu'r ddarpariaeth i ysgolion yn eu hardaloedd. Mae ganddynt dasg lle y dylai Aelodau Seneddol o bob plaid fod yn eu cefnogi, er mwyn sicrhau bod ganddynt y nifer cywir o ysgolion a'r safon

gywir o addysg ar gyfer y plant yn eu hardal.

Janet Ryder: Thank you for that answer. As you have made clear, you are intent on giving that money to schools with over 20 per cent of their pupils in receipt of free school meals. I draw your attention to Rhodri Morgan's words in Plenary yesterday, when he said that schools with more than 20 per cent of pupils eligible for free school meals definitely need help. Therefore, why will schools such as Ysgol Coed Menai, with more than 53 per cent of its pupils eligible for free school meals, and Ysgol Hafod Lon, with more than 42 per cent of its pupils eligible for free school meals, not receive a penny of this money because they are schools of fewer than 50 pupils?

Janet Ryder: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Fel yr ydych wedi gwneud yn glir, yr ydych yn benderfynol o roi'r arian hwnnw i ysgolion lle mae dros 20 y cant o'u disgyblion yn cael cinio ysgol am ddim. Tynnaf eich sylw at eiriau Rhodri Morgan yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe, pan ddywedodd fod angen cymorth yn bendant ar ysgolion lle mae mwy nag 20 y cant o'r disgyblion yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim. Felly, pam na fydd ysgolion fel Ysgol Coed Menai, lle mae mwy na 53 y cant o'r disgyblion yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim, ac Ysgol Hafod Lon, lle mae mwy na 42 y cant o'r disgyblion yn gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim, yn cael yr un ddimai o'r arian hwn am eu bod yn ysgolion sydd â llai na 50 o ddisgyblion?

Jane Davidson: Because they already benefit from the additional funding. You must remember that £4.1 million is available for the small and rural schools of Wales, but the total amount in the RAISE programme, to cover the large cohorts in all of the schools of Wales, is £16 million. So, a quarter of the equivalent of funding is already going to the smallest schools in Wales. We want to see local authorities using that money wisely and well.

Jane Davidson: Am eu bod eisoes yn elwa o'r arian ychwanegol. Rhaid ichi gofio bod £4.1 miliwn ar gael i ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig Cymru, ond y cyfanswm yn y rhaglen Rhagori, i gynnwys y carfanau mawr ym mhob un o ysgolion Cymru, yw £16 miliwn. Felly, mae chwarter yr arian eisoes yn mynd i'r ysgolion lleiaf yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am weld awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw'n ddoeth ac yn dda.

Peter Black: Your stricture to your fellow Cabinet members not to interfere in the reorganisation proposals of local authorities has been noted. On rural schools, many rural areas—and Powys is a good case in point—have to cut their schools' budgets and put schools in very difficult situations. You have already explained that most of those schools would not be eligible for the RAISE grant. How then will the deprived children in those rural areas benefit when the £4.1 million that you have distributed around Wales is not sufficient to make up the shortfall in funding that those schools already suffer?

Peter Black: Nodwyd eich anogaeth i gyd-Aelodau eich Cabinet beidio ag ymyrryd yn y cynigion i ad-drefnu awdurdodau lleol. O ran ysgolion gwledig, rhaid i nifer o ardaloedd gwledig—ac mae Powys yn enghraifft dda yma—dorri eu cyllidebau ysgol a rhoi ysgolion mewn sefyllfaoedd anodd iawn. Yr ydych eisoes wedi esbonio na fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r ysgolion hynny'n gymwys i gael y grant Rhagori. Sut, felly, y bydd y plant difreintiedig yn yr ardaloedd gwledig hynny yn elwa pan nad yw'r £4.1 miliwn yr ydych wedi'i ddsbarthu ledled Cymru yn ddigon i wneud iawn am y diffyg mewn ariannu y mae'r ysgolion hynny yn ei ddiodef eisoes?

Jane Davidson: It is important to point out that the local government settlement was £3.5 billion—a 5.1 per cent increase. For every year that I have been Minister, the Labour Assembly Government has consistently delivered an increase to local authorities that is normally double the level of inflation.

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bwysig egluro mai'r setliad llywodraeth leol oedd £3.5 biliwn—cynnydd o 5.1 y cant. Bob blwyddyn ers imi fod yn Weinidog mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn gyson wedi rhoi cynnydd i awdurdodau lleol, sydd fel rheol yn ddwywaith lefel chwyddiant. Rhaid i'ch

Your discussions must remain with those local authorities in how much they allocate to education from an unhypothecated budget.

Peter Black: You are right to say that it is an unhypothecated budget, but you also withheld 1 per cent of that money—£33 million—from local government, £16 million of which should have gone to schools. The money that you now have for the RAISE programme is slightly less than £16 million, yet that money is being distributed to specific schools only; as a result, many other schools are losing out. Do you accept that those schools are struggling to make ends meet, and that local authorities do not have the resources to assist them in making up the difference?

Jane Davidson: It is entirely incorrect to say that any money was withheld from the local government budget. The local government budget, as delivered by my colleague, Sue Essex, in a non-hypothecated way, was £3.5 billion and it was a 5.1 per cent increase. The RAISE money came from an additional allocation, provided by a Labour Chancellor focused on social justice, and we intend to support his view.

trafodaethau barhau gyda'r awdurdodau lleol hynny o ran faint y maent yn ei ddyrannu i addysg o gyllideb sydd heb ei neilltuo.

Peter Black: Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud mai cyllideb heb ei neilltuo ydyw, ond cadwyd 1 y cant o'r arian hwnnw yn ôl gennyh—£33 miliwn—oddi wrth lywodraeth leol, a dylai £16 miliwn ohono fod wedi mynd i ysgolion. Mae'r arian sydd gennyh ar gyfer y rhaglen Rhagori bellach ychydig yn llai nag £16 miliwn, ond eto dim ond i ysgolion penodol y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei roi; o ganlyniad, mae nifer o ysgolion eraill ar eu colled. A ydych yn derbyn bod yr ysgolion hynny'n cael trafferth i gael dau ben llinyn ynghyd, ac nad yw'r adnoddau gan awdurdodau lleol i'w helpu i wneud iawn am y diffyg?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n gwbl anghywir dweud bod unrhyw arian wedi ei gadw'n ôl o gyllideb llywodraeth leol. Cyfanswm cyllideb llywodraeth leol, fel y cyhoeddwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex, mewn ffordd heb ei neilltuo oedd £3.5 biliwn ac yr oedd hynny'n gynnydd o 5.1 y cant. Daeth yr arian Rhagori o ddyraniad ychwanegol, a roddwyd gan Ganghellor Llafur sy'n canolbwyntio ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a bwriadwn gefnogi ei farn.

Cyllid ar gyfer Myfyrwyr Anabl Funding for Disabled Students

Q6 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on funding for disabled students? OAQ849(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Local education authority estimates inform allocations for special schools and out-of-county placements. Assessments of need inform funding for additional support in mainstream further education and work-based learning. Exclusively designed further education courses are funded formulaically. Specialist residential further education placements are funded as per the special educational needs code of conduct, and a disabled students' allowance operates in higher education.

Jenny Randerson: As you know, Skill Wales provides advice and promotes

C6 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllid ar gyfer myfyrwyr anabl? OAQ849(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Amcangyfrifon awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n llywio dyraniadau i ysgolion arbennig a lleoliadau y tu allan i'r sir. Mae asesiadau o anghenion yn llywio'r arian ar gyfer cymorth ychwanegol mewn addysg bellach brif-ffrwd a dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith. Caiff cyrsiau addysg bellach sydd wedi eu creu'n arbennig eu hariannu ar ffurf fformiwla. Caiff lleoliadau addysg bellach preswyl arbenigol eu hariannu yn ôl cod ymddygiad anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac mae lwfans myfyrwyr anabl ar gael mewn addysg uwch.

Jenny Randerson: Fel y gwyddoch, mae Sgîl Cymru yn rhoi cyngor i fyfyrwyr anabl

opportunities for disabled students in post-16 education and training. It is part of a UK-wide organisation but it is the only branch throughout the four home nations that does not receive regular funding from Government. It currently has three-year, non-Governmental funding, which expires next year. Do you recognise the need for it to have certainty of funding in the future? Do you also recognise that, in order to achieve your aim of improving access for all, additional support for disabled students is essential, and such an organisation provides valuable assistance?

Jane Davidson: I recognise that additional support for disabled students is essential, and there are good arrangements in Wales for putting that support in place. Uniquely, for example, in Wales, the subject funding allocation for identified learners with moderate or profound learning difficulties or disabilities receives an uplift of 90 per cent or 200 per cent, depending on the severity of the learning difficulty, under our new national planning and funding system. We also have a good record in terms of disabled students participating in our colleges and in university. I am happy to look at the particular issue in terms of Skill, but we work closely with the Disability Rights Commission on advice in Wales.

mewn addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 ac yn hyrwyddo cyfleoedd ar eu cyfer. Mae'n rhan o sefydliad y DU gyfan, ond dyma'r unig gangen yn y DU nad yw'n cael arian rheolaidd gan y Llywodraeth. Ar hyn o bryd, mae ganddo arian anllywodraethol am dair blynedd, sy'n dod i ben y flwyddyn nesaf. A ydych yn cydnabod bod angen iddo gael sicrwydd arian yn y dyfodol? A ydych yn cydnabod hefyd, er mwyn ichi gyrraedd eich nod o wella mynediad i bawb, fod cymorth ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr anabl yn hanfodol, a bod sefydliad o'r fath yn darparu cymorth gwerthfawr?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod cymorth ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr anabl yn hanfodol, ac mae yna drefniadau da yng Nghymru ar gyfer gweithredu'r cymorth hwnnw. Er enghraifft, yng Nghymru, yn unigryw, mae'r dyraniad arian pwnc i ddysgwyr y nodwyd bod ganddynt anawsterau dysgu cymedrol neu ddifrifol yn codi 90 y cant neu 200 y cant, yn ôl difrifoldeb yr anhawster dysgu, o dan ein system genedlaethol newydd o gynllunio ac ariannu. Mae gennym record dda hefyd o ran nifer y myfyrwyr anabl sydd yn ein colegau ac yn y brifysgol. Yr wyf yn fodlon edrych ar y mater penodol o ran Sgîl Cymru, ond yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd o ran cyngor yng Nghymru.

Darpariaeth Addysg (Rhondda Cynon Taf) Education Provision (Rhondda Cynon Taf)

Q7 Leanne Wood: Will the Minister make a statement on education provision in Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ834(ELL)

C7 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth addysg yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ834(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Rhondda Cynon Taf currently has six nursery schools; 125 primary schools, including 24 infant, 10 junior, 13 Welsh medium, four Roman Catholic schools and two Church in Wales schools; and 23 secondary schools, four of which are Welsh medium, one of which is Roman Catholic and one of which is Church in Wales.

Jane Davidson: Mae gan Rhondda Cynon Taf chwe ysgol feithrin ar hyn o bryd; 125 o ysgolion cynradd, gan gynnwys 24 o ysgolion babanod, 10 o ysgolion iau, 13 o ysgolion Cymraeg, pedair ysgol Gatholig a dwy Ysgol yr Eglwys yng Nghymru; a 23 o ysgolion uwchradd, pedair ohonynt yn ysgolion Cymraeg, un yn ysgol Gatholig ac un yn ysgol yr Eglwys yng Nghymru.

Leanne Wood: You did not mention any adult education that you provide. Do you agree that the closure of computer classes in Tonypany demonstrates that your

Leanne Wood: Nid ydych wedi sôn am yr addysg i oedolion yr ydych yn ei darparu. A gytnwch fod cau'r dosbarthiadau cyfrifiaduron yn Nhonypany yn dangos mai

Government has little commitment to adult education in the Rhondda, particularly with reference to older people? Will you further agree to look into the situation at Tonypany with a view to getting those courses up and running again?

Jane Davidson: If you had wanted an answer on adult education, you might have made the question more specific, and I would certainly have mentioned adult education. Adult education is a matter for the partnership between the local authority and the college. I am happy to look into issues of any decrease in computer provision in Tonypany, but I also know that, ultimately, the increase in computer provision that we are seeing across Wales strongly demonstrates our commitment to provision, particularly in disadvantaged areas of information and communications technology.

Leighton Andrews: Are you aware that there are computer classes throughout the Rhondda and that many libraries there are providing computers for adults to use to learn on? Do you recall that when you announced the pilot scheme for free school meals a few years ago, the then Plaid Cymru controller of the Rhondda Cynon Taf council did not apply to be part of that pilot scheme? The free school meals initiative is now being taken up wholeheartedly by several schools in Rhondda Cynon Taf.

Jane Davidson: Education in Rhondda Cynon Taf is going from strength to strength, and I am delighted at the take-up of free school meals that is coming forwards. It is important to say that this Assembly Government has funded computer provision in libraries across Wales to enable people to have computer access.

3.00 p.m.

David Melding: Do you agree that education provision in Rhondda Cynon Taf would be improved by the work of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee on SEN provision, in terms of looking at the statementing process, and supporting children with SEN and those with more mild or moderate needs? Do you agree that we need to consider special needs provision as

prin yw ymrwymiad eich Llywodraeth i addysg oedolion yn Rhondda, yn enwedig o ran pobl hŷn? A gytunwch hefyd i ystyried y sefyllfa yn Nhonypany i geisio adfer y cyrsiau hynny eto?

Jane Davidson: Pe baech am gael ateb am addysg oedolion, dylech fod wedi gofyn cwestiwn mwy penodol, a byddwn wedi sôn am addysg oedolion. Mae addysg oedolion yn fater i'r bartneriaeth rhwng yr awdurdod lleol a'r coleg. Yr wyf yn fodlon edrych ar faterion unrhyw ostyngiad yn narpariaeth y gwersi cyfrifiaduron yn Nhonypany, ond gwn hefyd, yn y pen draw, fod y cynnydd yn y ddarpariaeth cyfrifiaduron a welwn ledled Cymru yn dangos yn amlwg ein hymrwymiad i ddarpariaeth, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd sy'n ddifreintiedig o ran technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn ymwybodol bod dosbarthiadau cyfrifiaduron ar gael ledled Rhondda a bod nifer o lyfrgelloedd yno yn darparu cyfrifiaduron i oedolion eu defnyddio i ddysgu? A gofiwch, pan gyhoeddwyd y cynllun peilot gennych ar gyfer cinio ysgol am ddim rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, na wnaeth rheolwr cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf o Blaid Cymru ar y pryd gais i fod yn rhan o'r cynllun hwnnw? Bellach mae nifer o ysgolion yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn manteisio ar y fenter cinio ysgol am ddim.

Jane Davidson: Mae addysg yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn mynd o nerth i nerth, ac yr wyf yn falch gweld bod nifer y disgyblion sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim yn cynyddu. Mae'n bwysig dweud bod y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon wedi ariannu darparu cyfrifiaduron mewn llyfrgelloedd ledled Cymru i alluogi pobl i ddefnyddio cyfrifiaduron.

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno y byddai gwaith y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar ddarpariaeth AAA, o ran ystyried y broses o roi datganiad, a chynorthwyo plant sydd ag AAA a'r rheini sydd â mân anghenion ac anghenion mwy cymedrol yn gwella'r ddarpariaeth addysg yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni ystyried bod y ddarpariaeth

providing a centre of expertise and excellence that often sustains support in mainstream schools?

Jane Davidson: I agree that there is some good special educational needs provision in RCT, both in mainstream schools and in special schools. Like many others, I am sure that you will welcome the fact that we have put an additional £5.1 million into ensuring that the expertise in special schools is brought into the mainstream to ensure the best kind of support for children with moderate learning needs.

anghenion arbennig yn darparu canolfan arbenigedd a rhagoriaeth sy'n aml yn cynnal cymorth mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd?

Jane Davidson: Cytunaf fod darpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig dda yn RhCT, mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd ac mewn ysgolion arbennig. Fel sawl un arall, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn croesawu'r ffaith ein bod wedi buddsoddi £5.1 miliwn ychwanegol i sicrhau bod yr arbenigedd mewn ysgolion arbennig yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r brif ffrwd er mwyn sicrhau'r cymorth gorau i blant sydd ag anghenion dysgu cymedrol.

Addysg Anghenion Arbennig (Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru) Special Needs Education (Mid and West Wales)

Q8 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on special needs education in Mid and West Wales? OAQ853(ELL)

C8 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am addysg anghenion arbennig yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ853(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Carmarthenshire, Powys, Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire local education authorities are responsible for the provision of SEN education in their areas. The Education Act 1996 and the Special Educational Needs and Disability Act 2001 form the statutory basis for educational provision for children with SEN. In addition, the SEN code of practice for Wales provides practical guidance.

Jane Davidson: Awdurdodau addysg lleol Sir Gaerfyrddin, Powys, Ceredigion a Sir Benfro sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu addysg AAA yn eu hardaloedd. Mae Deddf Addysg 1996 a Deddf Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig ac Anabled 2001 yn darparu sail statudol ar gyfer y ddarpariaeth addysgol i blant ag AAA. Yn ogystal, mae cod ymarfer AAA Cymru yn darparu canllawiau ymarferol.

Lisa Francis: I am sure that you will agree that it is imperative that the annual reports of a child's joint special needs education review are made available to parents in a proper and formal way, and are not hastily written out on a piece of foolscap, which is what one particular parent recently told me had happened? Parents should not have to endure the anguish of nagging and cajoling SEN co-ordinators to provide information that they have a statutory right to receive. This is just one of the issues that I have raised with your Government about the Tŷ Aran special needs unit in Dolgellau. Your colleague, the Minister with responsibility for children, recently wrote to me to say that you are looking into these matters. Time does not stand still for these children, whose development, in this respect, is being hindered as a result of the neglect and irresponsibility of the local education

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol sicrhau bod yr adroddiadau blynyddol am gyd-adolygiad addysg anghenion arbennig plentyn ar gael i rieni mewn ffordd briodol a ffurfiol, nid wedi eu hysgrifennu'n frysiog ar ddarn o ffwlsgap, fel y dywedodd un rhiant penodol wrthyf a oedd wedi digwydd yn ddiweddar? Ni ddylai rhieni orfod dioddef y boen o boeni a chymell cydlynwyr AAA i ddarparu gwybodaeth y mae ganddynt hawl statudol i'w chael. Dim ond un o'r materion a godais gyda'ch Llywodraeth mewn perthynas ag uned anghenion arbennig Tŷ Aran yn Nolgellau yw'r mater hwn. Ysgrifennodd eich cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am blant, ataf yn ddiweddar i ddweud eich bod yn ymchwilio i'r materion hyn. Nid yw amser yn sefyll yn llonydd i'r plant hyn. Mae eu datblygiad hwy, yn y cyd-destun hwn, yn cael ei atal oherwydd esgeulustod a

authority.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Is there a question in this speech?

Lisa Francis: There is a question, Llywydd. When is the Minister going to act on this matter?

Jane Davidson: The responsibility remains with the local education authority, and, quite clearly, the statutory framework allows parents to issue complaints in terms of any issues around compliance with the guidance. All authorities are required to have parent resolution services to support any disagreements between parents and the local authority.

In terms of the particular case that you mentioned, I will ask my officials to brief me on that.

Catherine Thomas: At the recent special educational needs conference that I hosted in Llanelli, which you attended, it became clear that parents and SEN co-ordinators are concerned about the scarcity of educational psychologists. As you are aware, such psychologists are essential to the statementing process, and play an essential role in the educational assessment of children with SEN. What is the Government doing to address this scarcity, not only in Mid and West Wales, but throughout Wales?

Jane Davidson: We need a number of professionals, including speech and language therapists, as well as education psychologists, to improve provision through the medium of Welsh and English across Wales. The Government has put extra investment into further opportunities for training, but it will take some time before we see the fruits of that. We continue to look hard at these issues, and I work closely with my colleague, Dr Brian Gibbons, on this.

gweithredu anghyfrifol gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A oes cwestiwn yn yr araith hon?

Lisa Francis: Mae yna gwestiwn, Lywydd. Pryd y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu gweithredu ar y mater hwn?

Jane Davidson: Yr awdurdod addysg lleol sy'n gyfrifol o hyd, ac mae'n gwbl amlwg fod y fframwaith statudol yn caniatáu i rieni gyflwyno cwynion am unrhyw faterion sy'n ymwneud â chydymffurfio â'r canllawiau. Mae'n ofynnol i bob awdurdod gael gwasanaethau datrys anghydfodau i rieni i ymdrin ag unrhyw achos o anghytuno rhwng rhieni a'r awdurdod lleol.

O ran yr achos penodol a grybwyllwyd gennych, gofynnaf i'm swyddogion roi'r cefndir imi am hynny.

Catherine Thomas: Yn y gynhadledd ar anghenion addysgol arbennig yn ddiweddar a drefnais yn Llanelli, a lle yr oeddech yn bresennol, daeth yn amlwg fod rhieni a chydlynwyr AAA yn pryderu am brinder seicolegwyr addysgol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae seicolegwyr o'r fath yn hanfodol i'r broses o roi datganiad, ac yn rhan hanfodol o'r gwaith o wneud asesiad addysgol o blant sydd ag AAA. Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i fydn i'r afael â'r prinder hwn, nid yn unig yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, ond ledled Cymru?

Jane Davidson: Mae angen nifer o weithwyr proffesiynol arnom, gan gynnwys therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith, yn ogystal â seicolegwyr addysg, er mwyn gwella'r ddarpariaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg ledled Cymru. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud buddsoddiad ychwanegol mewn cyfleoedd hyfforddi pellach, ond fe gymer cryn amser cyn y bydd hynny'n dwyn ffrwyth. Yr ydym yn parhau i ystyried y materion hyn yn fanwl, ac yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Dr Brian Gibbons, ar hyn.

Hyrwyddo Criced yn Ysgolion Cymru Promoting Cricket in Welsh Schools

Q9 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister **C9 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y

make a statement on how the Assembly Government is promoting cricket in Welsh schools? OAQ888(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Cricket is not a statutory requirement of the curriculum and the Welsh Assembly Government does not promote one type of game or sport in schools over any other. However, over 5,000 Welsh schoolchildren took part in Dragon Sport Cricket last year, which was funded by the Assembly.

Laura Anne Jones: I am sure that you agree that it is disappointing that only 10 per cent of state schools play cricket. Schools should not have to rely on kit-bag donations from charities, such as the Lord's Taverners, in order to have these facilities and to give children the opportunity to play cricket. Minister, how are you looking to encourage the development of the sporting facilities needed to play cricket and similar sports in schools, and to improve those that are already there? The facilities of many of the schools that I visit are in a state of disrepair or are nonexistent. This is at a time when there are high levels of childhood obesity in Wales.

Jane Davidson: As part of physical education in schools, pupils should be provided with the opportunity to develop skills in throwing and striking a ball at all key stages, and a number of schools use cricket to deliver that requirement. The Cricket Board of Wales is already developing a range of initiatives aimed at encouraging the participation of school-aged children. There are 70 clubs running junior sides, with over 7,000 boys and 500 girls taking part. My colleague, Alun Pugh, is looking at extending Dragon Sport to secondary schools, so you may want to ask for a list of schools that play cricket and visit those.

Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn hyrwyddo criced yn ysgolion Cymru? OAQ888(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Nid yw criced yn un o ofynion statudol y cwricwlwm, ac nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyrwyddo un math o gêm neu chwaraeon mewn ysgolion dros unrhyw fath arall. Fodd bynnag, cymerodd dros 5,000 o blant ysgol o Gymru ran yng Nghriced Campau'r Ddraig y llynedd, a ariannwyd gan y Cynulliad.

Laura Anne Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch ei bod yn siomedig mai dim ond 10 y cant o ysgolion y wladwriaeth sy'n chwarae criced. Ni ddylai ysgolion orfod dibynnu ar gael offer chwarae fel rhoddion gan elusennau, megis Lord's Taverners, er mwyn cael y cyfleusterau hyn a rhoi'r cyfle i blant chwarae criced. Weiniog, sut y bwriadwch annog datblygu'r cyfleusterau chwaraeon angenrheidiol i chwarae criced a chwaraeon tebyg mewn ysgolion, ac i wella'r rhai sydd yma eisoes? Mae cyfleusterau nifer o'r ysgolion y byddaf yn ymweld â hwy mewn cyflwr truenus neu'n hollol absennol. Mae hyn ar adeg o lefelau uchel o ordeudra ymhlith plant yng Nghymru.

Jane Davidson: Fel rhan o addysg gorfforol mewn ysgolion, dylai disgyblion gael y cyfle i ddatblygu sgiliau taflu a tharo pêl ym mhob cyfnod allweddol, ac mae nifer o ysgolion yn defnyddio criced i gyflawni'r gofyniad hwnnw. Mae Bwrdd Criced Cymru eisoes yn datblygu amrywiaeth o fentrau sy'n anelu at annog plant o oed ysgol i gymryd rhan. Mae gan 70 o glybiau dimau iau, a thros 7,000 o fechgyn a 500 o ferched yn cymryd rhan. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Pugh, yn ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o ehangu Campau'r Ddraig i ysgolion uwchradd, felly efallai yr hoffech ofyn am restr o'r ysgolion sy'n chwarae criced ac ymweld â'r rheini.

Cynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin The Duke of Edinburgh's Award Scheme

Q10 Lorraine Barrett: Will the Minister make a statement on the number of pupils currently participating in the Duke of Edinburgh's Award scheme? OAQ891(ELL)

Jane Davidson: It is estimated that almost

C10 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am nifer y disgyblion sy'n cymryd rhan ar hyn o bryd yn nghynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin? OAQ891(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Amcangyfrifir bod yn agos i

25,000 young people in Wales are currently participating in the award. While the Duke of Edinburgh's Award collects statistics on the numbers of young people who are participating in the award, it does not break these down into participating groups, such as pupil numbers.

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for that response, Minister. I think that I should have said 'young people' not 'pupils', but I am grateful for your response.

This year is the fiftieth anniversary of the Duke of Edinburgh's Award scheme, and approximately 60 young people are doing their award at the Caer Castell youth club in Rumney, many of whom would not expect to achieve much in the way of qualifications. Will you join me in congratulating them, particularly those who have been chosen to dance at an award celebration day at Oakwood this summer? Will you accompany me one evening on a visit to Caer Castell youth club to see the excellent work that it does?

Jane Davidson: I would be very happy to go back to Caer Castell youth club, which I have not visited for a number of years. It is also important to say that the Welsh baccalaureate is good at encouraging active engagement in the Duke of Edinburgh's Award, and 12 of the pilot centres are currently using the award in the qualifications route, which may be of particular interest to young people coming through the youth-club route. Of the 31 centres delivering the Welsh baccalaureate, 27 are using elements of the Duke of Edinburgh's Award in one way or another. So, it is an important opportunity for our young people.

25,000 o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun ar hyn o bryd. Er bod cynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin yn casglu ystadegau am nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n cymryd rhan yn y cynllun, nid yw'n rhannu'r niferoedd hyn yn grwpiau sy'n cymryd rhan, megis nifer disgyblion.

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Credaf y dylwn fod wedi dweud 'pobl ifanc' yn hytrach na 'disgyblion', ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich ymateb.

Eleni mae cynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin yn dathlu ei hanner canmlwyddiant, ac mae tua 60 o bobl ifanc yn ymgeisio am y wobr yng nghlwb ieuenctid Caer Castell yn Nhredelerch, er na fyddai disgwyl i lawer ohonynt gyflawni llawer o ran cymwysterau. A ymunwch â mi i'w llongyfarch, yn arbennig y rheini a ddewiswyd i ddawnsio mewn diwrnod dathlu gwobrau yn Oakwood yn ystod yr haf eleni? A ddewch gyda mi un noson i ymweld â chlwb ieuenctid Caer Castell i weld y gwaith ardderchog a wneir ganddo?

Jane Davidson: Byddwn yn fwy na pharod dychwelyd i glwb ieuenctid Caer Castell gan nad wyf wedi bod yno ers sawl blwyddyn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud bod gan fagloriaeth Cymru ran i'w chwarae wrth annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yng nghynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin, ac mae 12 o'r canolfannau peilot yn defnyddio'r wobr ar hyn o bryd fel rhan o'r llwybr cymwysterau, a all fod o ddiddordeb arbennig i bobl ifanc sy'n dilyn y llwybr clwb ieuenctid. O'r 31 o ganolfannau sy'n darparu bagloriaeth Cymru, mae 27 yn defnyddio elfennau o gynllun Gwobrau Dug Caeredin mewn rhyw ffordd. Felly, mae'n gyfle pwysig i'n pobl ifanc.

Y 'Cynllun Gweithredu Rhianta' The 'Parenting Action Plan'

Q11 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister make a statement on the 'Parenting Action Plan'? OAQ884(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Our 'Parenting Action Plan' was published in December 2005. It sets out what the Assembly Government is doing to

C11 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y 'Cynllun Gweithredu Rhianta'? OAQ884(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Cyhoeddwyd ein 'Cynllun Gweithredu Rhianta' ym mis Rhagfyr 2005. Mae'n gosod allan yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth

ensure that parents in Wales receive the advice and support that they need to raise their children confidently. A progress report will be published later this year.

Sandy Mewies: As we know, parents carry out an incredibly important task; I can vouch for that as a parent. I welcome this action plan, which seeks to raise the profile of parenting in Wales and increase the amount of support available to parents. There are a number of organisations operating in Flintshire, funded by Cymorth, that do valuable work in supporting parents—schemes such as Home-Start and Sure Start. Can you tell me what work will be undertaken with local authorities to ensure that the parenting action plan is implemented and promoted throughout Wales?

Jane Davidson: We have made significant additional funding available to the children and young people's partnerships under the Cymorth fund, both for this financial year and the next. The partnerships have allocated an additional £2.4 million to family support in their plans for this year, which is a 74 per cent increase on last year. So, we work closely with local authorities in terms of looking at how they deliver on those plans.

y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod rhieni yng Nghymru yn cael y cyngor a'r cymorth angenrheidiol i fagu eu plant yn hyderus. Cyhoeddir adroddiad cynnydd yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Sandy Mewies: Fel y gwyddom, mae gan rieni dasg ryfeddol o bwysig i'w chyflawni; gallaf warantu hynny fel rhiant. Croesawaf y cynllun gweithredu hwn, sy'n ceisio codi proffil rhianta yng Nghymru a chynyddu'r cymorth sydd ar gael i rieni. Mae nifer o sefydliadau yn gweithredu yn sir y Fflint, wedi'u hariannu gan Cymorth, sy'n gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr i gefnogi rhieni—cynlluniau megis Home-Start a Chychwyn Cadarn. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pa waith a wneir gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau y caiff y cynllun gweithredu rhianta ei weithredu a'i hyrwyddo ledled Cymru?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi rhyddhau swm sylweddol o arian ychwanegol i'r partneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc o dan gronfa Cymorth, ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon a'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae'r partneriaethau wedi dyrannu £2.4 miliwn ychwanegol i gymorth i deuluoedd yn eu cynlluniau ar gyfer eleni, sef cynnydd o 74 y cant ers y llynedd. Felly, yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos gydag awdurdodau lleol o ran edrych ar y ffordd y maent yn darparu'r cynlluniau hynny.

Addysgofal Cyfrwng Cymraeg Welsh-medium Educare

C12 Owen John Thomas: Faint o blant dan dair oed sy'n derbyn addysgofal cyfrwng Cymraeg mewn canolfannau plant integredig? OAQ883(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Ar hyn o bryd, mae oddeutu 300 o lefydd addysgofal ar gael i blant dan dair oed sy'n gysylltiedig â chanolfannau integredig, gan gynnwys darpariaeth ategol a darpariaeth wedi ei rhwydweithio. Eleni, bydd 10 canolfan integredig arall yn agor. Nid yw gwybodaeth am nifer y plant sy'n defnyddio'r llefydd hyn ar gael eto.

Owen John Thomas: Fe ffoniaf di yr wythnos nesaf.

Q12 Owen John Thomas: How many children under three receive Welsh-medium educare at integrated children's centres? OAQ883(ELL)

Jane Davidson: At the moment, there are around 300 educare places for children under three years of age, which are linked to integrated centres, including satellite and networked provision. Ten more integrated centres will open this year. Information on the number of children using these places is not yet available.

Owen John Thomas: I will telephone you next week.

3.10 p.m.

Fel y gwyddoch, mae plant ifanc iawn yn dysgu'n gyflym ac yn dysgu mwy. Dywedir eu bod yn dysgu, efallai, chwe gwaith cymaint â phlant 15 mlwydd oed. Felly, mae cyfle gwych i ychwanegu iaith ychwanegol at yr iaith sydd eisoes ganddynt. Yn achos Cymru, wrth gwrs, Cymraeg fyddai'r iaith honno. Felly, pa gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau bod darpariaeth addysgofal yn cael ei chynyddu i fod ar gael i fwyafrif y plant, os nad pob plentyn yng Nghymru?

Jane Davidson: Dim ond un elfen o'r system yw'r canolfannau integredig. Credaf y caiff y mwyafrif eu haddysg mewn ysgolion babanod neu drwy Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. Yn agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae agweddau dwyieithog yn y cwricwlwm i'r plant ieuengaf. Yr wyf hefyd yn annog pobl i ddefnyddio addysg Gymraeg.

As you know, young children learn quickly and learn more. It is said that they learn six times as much as 15-year-olds. Therefore, there is an excellent opportunity to add an additional language to their current language. In the case of Wales, that language would be Welsh, of course. Therefore, what steps are you taking to ensure that education provision is increased so that it will be available to the majority of children, if not all children in Wales?

Jane Davidson: The integrated centres are only one aspect of the system. I believe the majority receive their education in nursery schools or through Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin. In the Assembly Government agenda, bilingual aspects are in the curriculum for the youngest children. I also encourage people to use Welsh-language education.

Cyrsiau Cymraeg ym Mhrifysgolion Cymru Welsh-medium Courses at Welsh Universities

C13 David Lloyd: Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynglŷn ag ehangu'r ddarpariaeth o gyrsiau Cymraeg ym mhrifysgolion Cymru? OAQ862(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Rhwng yr haf a'r hydref y llynedd, bu i mi gyfarfod ag is-ganghellor a chorff llywodraethu pob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Yr oedd darpariaeth gyfrwng Gymraeg yn eitem barhaol ar agendâu'r cyfarfodydd hyn.

David Lloyd: Yn dilyn hynny, beth a wnewch i hyrwyddo dysgu meddygaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, oherwydd nid yw'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd?

Jane Davidson: Yr oeddwn yn croesawu ymestyn y ddarpariaeth addysg feddygol gydag ysgol yn y Gogledd ac un yn Abertawe hefyd. Mae Abertawe yn hoffi rhoi darpariaeth Gymraeg. Mae prosiect yn ei le ar hyn o bryd i gefnogi hyn.

Q13 David Lloyd: What recent discussions has the Minister had on extending the provision of Welsh-medium courses at Welsh universities? OAQ862(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Between last summer and last autumn, I met the vice-chancellors and governing bodies of every higher education institution in Wales. Welsh-medium provision was a standing item on the agendas for these meetings.

David Lloyd: Following on from that, what are you doing to promote the teaching of medicine through the medium of Welsh, because that is not happening at present?

Jane Davidson: I welcomed the extension in provision for medical education with the new school in north Wales and also in Swansea. Swansea enjoys making Welsh-medium provision. A project is currently in place to support this.

Datganiad Busnes Diwygiedig **Revised Business Statement**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I come forward with a revised business statement, in accordance with Standing Orders No. 5.4 and No. 5.5. The draft statement can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ychydig symudiad sydd wedi bod yn y ddarpariaeth yn y datganiad busnes. Yr ydym yn falch eich bod wedi sylweddoli bod rhai pethau y dymunwn eu gweld yn cael eu trafod ar ôl y toriad. Mynegaf ein pryder nad ydych wedi gwneud amser ar gyfer trafodaeth ar ffigurau Eurostat, oherwydd teimlwn fod y rheiny'n bwysig. Mae'n iawn i ni, fel Cynulliad, gael eu hystyried. Pe bai'r ffigurau wedi dangos cynnydd, byddai'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud datganiad. Credaf ei bod yn iawn eich bod yn gwneud datganiad er bod y ffigurau yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir.

Lisa Francis: We welcome your assurance, Minister, that you will be delivering an oral statement on the examinations issue after the recess, as well as an oral statement on the police restructuring. However, I would ask again that you see it within your wisdom to offer a statement on the situation, which I told you about yesterday, of the Llanelli lady who had to wait for an ambulance to take her to Harefield hospital for a lung transplant. The ambulance was delayed for an agonising length of time. I appreciate that you say that that is a matter for the ambulance trust to deal with, but, as I said, these issues are affecting people up and down Wales, particularly in Llanelli where the other two ambulances that should have been available were already on call. This is a matter that needs addressing most urgently.

Peter Black: Like the other two parties, we welcome the oral statements on the police and on the university lecturers' strike action. They will be much looked forward to,

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cyflwynaf ddatganiad busnes diwygiedig, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 a Rhif 5.5. Gosodwyd y datganiad draft ar y Siambwrwe o dan ddogfennau ategol.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We welcome the small movement that has occurred in the provision contained in the business statement. We are pleased that you have realised that there are some issues that we wish to see discussed after the recess. I express our concern that you have not made time available for a discussion of the Eurostat figures, because we feel they are important. It is quite right for us, as an Assembly, to consider them. Had the figures shown an increase, the Minister would have made a statement. It is right that you should make a statement although the figures are going in the wrong direction.

Lisa Francis: Croesawn eich sicrwydd, Weinidog, y byddwch yn cyflwyno datganiad llafar ar fater arholiadau ar ôl y toriad, yn ogystal â datganiad llafar ar ailstrwythuro'r heddlu. Fodd bynnag, gofynnwn eto ichi arfer eich doethineb a chynnig datganiad am y sefyllfa y soniais wrthy ch amdano ddoe, lle bu'n rhaid i wraig o Lanelli aros am ambiwlans i'w chludo i ysbyty Harefield am lawdriniaeth i drawsblannu ysgyfaint. Bu'n rhaid iddi aros am gyfnod annioddefol cyn i'r ambiwlans gyrraedd. Sylweddolaf eich bod yn dweud mai mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ymdrin ag ef yw hwn, ond fel y dywedais, mae'r materion hyn yn effeithio ar bobl ym mhob cwr o Gymru, yn arbennig yn Llanelli lle yr oedd y ddau ambiwlans arall a ddylai fod ar gael eisoes allan ar alwad. Mae angen ymdrin â'r mater hwn ar frys mawr.

Peter Black: Fel y ddwy blaid arall, croesawn y datganiadau llafar am yr heddlu ac am streic y darlithwyr prifysgol. Edrychwn ymlaen yn fawr atynt, gan fod

because we need to ask some serious questions about both those issues. We remain eternally disappointed that you have yet again failed to find time for our no named day motion on the music development fund. However, I am sure that that may be possible in future business statements.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I am pleased that Members support this revised business statement. I do not intend to repeat what I said in response to many issues that were raised yesterday.

The exam debates issue, and the present dispute, is not a matter for the Welsh Assembly Government. However, as I said yesterday, the Minister is having discussions, not only with higher education institutions, but also with the unions. If the dispute is not resolved, as I said, she will come back to the Chamber after recess to update Members. The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration will be equally engaged in issues around police restructuring over the recess, and, as I said, she will come back and report on those developments.

However, I am disappointed that some of the points to which I responded yesterday have been raised again. We cannot keep repeating issues. I have said that operational issues must be raised elsewhere. I am sure, Lisa, that you will raise issues in particular regarding the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. On your issues, Ieuan, it is the rise of 0.6 per cent in the gross value added per head in terms of west Wales and the Valleys that links it over the 75 per cent. We would not have got that money if we had not got that result. You will have an opportunity when we have a scheduled debate on 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' to make your points, and I am sure that you will do so on other occasions too.

I am glad that we can move forward with this revised business statement.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. As you appreciate, I am not much entertained either by these business statement exercises, or by repeating things that were said yesterday.

angen inni ofyn rhai cwestiynau difrifol am y ddau fater hynny. Mae'n siom parhaus inni eich bod unwaith eto wedi methu cael amser ar gyfer ein cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd modd gwneud hynny mewn datganiadau busnes yn y dyfodol.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn falch bod yr Aelodau'n cefnogi'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig hwn. Ni fwriadaf ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais mewn ymateb i nifer o faterion a godwyd ddoe.

Nid mater i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw'r ddadl ynglŷn ag arholiadau, a'r anghydfod presennol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais ddoe, mae'r Gweinidog yn cael trafodaethau nid yn unig gyda sefydliadau addysg uwch, ond hefyd gyda'r undebau. Os na ellir datrys yr anghydfod, fel y dywedais daw yn ôl i'r Siambr ar ôl y toriad i roi'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yr un mor brysur hefyd yn trafod materion ynglŷn ag ailstrwythuro'r heddlu yn ystod y toriad, ac fel y dywedais, daw yn ôl i roi adroddiad ar y datblygiadau hynny.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siomedig fod rhai o'r pwyntiau yr ymatebais iddynt ddoe wedi cael eu codi eto. Rhaid inni beidio â chodi'r un materion dro ar ôl tro. Dywedais fod yn rhaid codi materion gweithredol rywle arall. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Lisa, y byddwch yn codi materion yn enwedig o ran Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru. Ar y materion a godwyd gennych chi, Ieuan, y cynnydd o 0.6 y cant yn y gwerth gros ychwanegol y pen o ran y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd sy'n ei godi dros 75 y cant. Ni fyddem wedi cael yr arian hwnnw oni bai am y canlyniad hwnnw. Cewch gyfle pan drefnir dadl ar 'Cymru: Economi Lewyrchus' i wneud eich pwyntiau, ac fe wnewch hynny ar adewgau eraill hefyd, mae'n siŵr.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn gallu bwrw ymlaen â'r datganiad busnes diwygiedig hwn.

Y Llywydd: Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Fel y byddwch yn deall, nid wyf yn hoff iawn o'r ymarferion datganiadau busnes hyn, nac o ailadrodd pethau a ddywedwyd ddoe.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes diwygiedig.
Revised business statement adopted.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 i'r Prif
Weinidog
Delegation of Functions under the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 to the First
Minister**

Motion (NDM3061): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained within the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. After 'cannot be so delegated' insert:

and except for those under section 11 of the Act (in relation to the power to give financial assistance to enable or facilitate the provision of air transport services and/or facilities).

Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. After 'cannot be so delegated' insert:

and those under section 5 of the Act (relating to the power to establish joint transport authorities).

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1) (b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained within the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM3061)

Cynnig (NDM3061): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ar ôl 'na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw' rhoi:

a'r rhai dan adran 11 y Ddeddf (sy'n ymwneud â'r pŵer i roi cymorth ariannol i alluogi neu hwyluso darparu gwasanaethau a/neu gyfleusterau trafndiaeth awyr).

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ar ôl 'na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw' rhoi:

a'r rhai dan adran 5 y Ddeddf (sy'n ymwneud â'r pŵer i sefydlu cyd-awdurdodau trafndiaeth).

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62 (1) (b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl

y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.
(NDM3061)

The Transport (Wales) Act 2006, which received Royal Assent in February of this year, provides the National Assembly for Wales with additional powers in the field of transport, which, together with the Railways Act 2005, enable the Welsh Assembly Government to develop and implement an integrated transport system for Wales. As this is a significant piece of legislation, and one that reflects well on the policy-making capacity of the Assembly, I pay tribute to my predecessor, Sue Essex, as Minister with responsibility for transport, and, in particular, to members of the former Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, chaired by Richard Edwards, who made a significant contribution towards policy-making in this area, and laid the foundations for this Act.

This Act will make the development of transport in Wales a core task of the Assembly Government, by, in the first case, placing a statutory duty on the Government to develop and implement policies for the promotion of safe, integrated, sustainable, efficient, and economic transport facilities and services. It will also ensure that transport services and facilities are planned, and implemented on a regional basis, to more effectively meet people's travel needs. Wales's four transport consortia are already working with us on developing those embryonic regional transport plans.

The Act will also set up a new public transport users' committee to ensure that passengers' voices are heard, bringing together passengers from all transport modes in one forum. It will also enable the Assembly Government to establish, by Order, a joint transport authority, if the voluntary arrangements, under the transport consortia for joint working, fail to deliver. It will also enable the Assembly Government to secure public transport services in areas where they would not otherwise be provided, and also enable the Government to provide support for airlines and airport operators providing services in Wales, and to and from Wales.

Mae Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006, a gafodd y Cydsyniad Brenhinol ym mis Chwefror eleni, yn rhoi pwerau ychwanegol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ym maes trafndiaeth. Mae hynny, ynghyd â Deddf y Rheilffyrdd 2005, yn galluogi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu a gweithredu system drafndiaeth integredig i Gymru. Gan fod hwn yn ddarn pwysig o ddeddfwriaeth, ac yn un sy'n adlewyrchiad da o allu'r Cynulliad i lunio polisi, yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'm rhagflaenydd, Sue Essex, fel y Gweinidog a oedd â chyfrifoldeb dros drafndiaeth, ac yn arbennig i aelodau cyn Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Richard Edwards, a wnaeth gyfraniad sylweddol at lunio polisi yn y maes hwn, a gosod y sylfeini ar gyfer y Ddeddf hon.

Bydd y Ddeddf hon yn gwneud datblygu trafndiaeth yng Nghymru yn un o dasgau craidd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy osod dyletswydd statudol ar y Llywodraeth, yn y lle cyntaf, i ddatblygu a gweithredu polisiau i hyrwyddo cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau trafndiaeth diogel, integredig, cynaliadwy, effeithlon a darbodus. Bydd hefyd yn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau a chyfleusterau trafndiaeth yn cael eu cynllunio, a'u gweithredu'n rhanbarthol, i ddiwallu anghenion teithio pobl yn fwy effeithiol. Mae pedwar consortiwm trafndiaeth Cymru eisoes yn gweithio gyda ni ar ddatblygu'r cynlluniau trafndiaeth rhanbarthol cynnar hynny.

Bydd y Ddeddf hefyd yn sefydlu pwyllgor newydd i ddefnyddwyr trafndiaeth gyhoeddus i sicrhau bod llais teithwyr yn cael ei glywed, gan ddwyn ynghyd yn un fforwm deithwyr o bob math o drafndiaeth. Bydd hefyd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sefydlu, drwy Orchymyn, awdurdod trafndiaeth ar y cyd, os bydd y trefniadau gwirfoddol, o dan y consortia trafndiaeth ar gyfer cydweithio, yn methu cyflawni'r hyn a ddymunir. Bydd hefyd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau gwasanaethau trafndiaeth gyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd lle na fyddent yn cael eu darparu fel arall, a hefyd i'r Llywodraeth roi

cymorth i gwmnïau hedfan a gweithredwyr meysydd awyr sy'n darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, i Gymru ac o Gymru.

Under the Act, the National Assembly for Wales's powers will be enhanced. Together with the Railways Act 2005, it represents one of the, if not the, largest transfers of powers to this institution. However, there will be no transfer of existing non-devolved functions. Therefore, we see this as a considerable enhancement of our legal powers.

O dan y Ddeddf, bydd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cael rhagor o bwerau. Ynghyd â Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, mae hwn yn un o'r trosglwyddiadau pŵer mwyaf i'r sefydliad hwn, os nad y mwyaf. Fodd bynnag, ni throsglwyddir y swyddogaethau nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli ar hyn o bryd. Felly, yn ein barn ni, mae hyn yn ychwanegu cryn dipyn at ein pwerau cyfreithiol.

3.20 p.m.

As with all such motions for delegations, nothing will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the Assembly's authority or, indeed, reduce the role of Assembly committees. If this motion is carried as drafted, I will continue my practice of including any significant issues relating to transport in Wales in my monthly report to the Enterprise, Innovations and Networks Committee and in discussions in committee.

Fel gyda phob cynnig o'r fath ar gyfer dirprwyo swyddogaethau, ni fydd dim yn effeithio ar oruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad, nac yn wir yn lleihau rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Os derbynnir y cynnig hwn fel y mae wedi ei ddrafftio, byddaf yn parhau fy arfer o gynnwys unrhyw faterion o bwys ynghylch trafndiaeth yng Nghymru yn fy adroddiad misol i'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ac mewn trafodaethau yn y pwyllgor hwnnw.

Furthermore, I point out to Members that the Wales transport strategy, and any secondary legislation falling out of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 that the Assembly Government decides to enact, will be debated and voted on in Plenary. That would include the setting up of any joint transport authorities, which would require legislation that the Assembly and its committees would play a full role in taking forward. The Act also explicitly provides that the Wales transport strategy—one of the primary duties of this Act—must be approved by Plenary, and that any decision to refuse to approve a regional transport plan would also have to be taken in Plenary.

At hynny, tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at y ffaith y caiff strategaeth trafndiaeth Cymru, ac unrhyw is-ddeddfwriaeth yn deillio o Ddeddf Trafndiaeth (Cymru) 2006 y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn penderfynu ei gwneud, eu trafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a'u cyflwyno ar gyfer pleidlais. Byddai hynny'n cynnwys sefydlu unrhyw awdurdodau trafndiaeth ar y cyd, a fyddai'n gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth y byddai'r Cynulliad a'i bwyllgorau yn chwarae rhan lawn yn y broses o'i datblygu. Mae'r Ddeddf hefyd yn darparu'n benodol fod yn rhaid i strategaeth trafndiaeth Cymru—sef un o brif ddyletswyddau'r Ddeddf hon—gael ei chymeradwyo gan y Cyfarfod Llawn, ac y byddai'n rhaid i unrhyw benderfyniad i wrthod cymeradwyo cynllun trafndiaeth rhanbarthol hefyd gael ei wneud yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

Janet Davies: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. After 'cannot be so delegated' insert:

Janet Davies: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ar ôl 'na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw' rhoi:

and except for those under section 11 of the Act (in relation to the power to give financial assistance to enable or facilitate the provision of air transport services and/or facilities).

Plaid Cymru supports the provisions of the Act, as far as they go. As the Minister has said, the Act operates together with the Railways Act 2005, and it will operate in the context of the present Government of Wales Bill when it becomes an Act. The Assembly Government needs powers to decide on, and to implement, a comprehensive transport strategy, but, in my view, the Act fails to do this; it is inadequate.

The Transport (Wales) Act 2006 places upon the Assembly a duty of:

‘promotion and encouragement of safe, integrated, sustainable, efficient and economic transport ... services’.

It has provisions that allot the responsibility to set up executive and consultative bodies. The Railways Act 2005 gives powers to decide upon, and run, the Wales and borders franchise, but does not give other powers, such as the power to make decisions on rail infrastructure. Some of the big powers that Wales needs are missing between those two Acts. That has to be understood if the value of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 is to be properly assessed.

Interestingly, the Government of Wales Bill includes a Schedule with 50 lines of exceptions in its transport section—more than in any other section. It will severely limit the potential effectiveness of the Assembly Government, and it lacks many of the levers that we need to make physical communications in Wales both effective and acceptable. It is true that the Assembly Government can contribute financially, in some instances, with the agreement of appropriate authorities, but those contributions come out of the block grant, and at the expense of other services. There is no special transfer of moneys for this—there is for the franchise, but not for other things.

a'r rhai dan adran 11 y Ddeddf (sy'n ymwneud â'r pŵer i roi cymorth ariannol i alluogi neu hwyluso darparu gwasanaethau a/neu gyfleusterau trafnidiaeth awyr).

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi darpariaethau'r Ddeddf, cyn belled ag y maent yn mynd. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae'r Ddeddf yn gweithredu ar y cyd â Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, a bydd yn gweithredu yng nghydestun Mesur presennol Llywodraeth Cymru pan ddaw'n gyfraith gwlad. Mae angen pwerau ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i benderfynu strategaeth drafnidiaeth gynhwysfawr, a'i gweithredu. Ond yn fy marn i, mae'r Ddeddf yn methu â gwneud hyn; mae'n annigonol.

Mae Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 yn gosod dyletswydd ar y Cynulliad:

i hyrwyddo ac annog gwasanaethau trafnidiaeth diogel, integredig, cynaliadwy, effeithlon a darbodus.

Ynnddi mae darpariaethau ar gyfer dyrannu'r cyfrifoldeb dros sefydlu cyrff gweithredol ac ymgynghorol. Mae Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 yn rhoi pwerau i benderfynu masnachfrait Cymru a'r gororau a'i gweithredu, ond nid yw'n rhoi pwerau eraill, megis y pŵer i benderfynu'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd. Mae rhai o'r pwerau mawr y mae ar Gymru eu hangen yn eisiau rhwng y ddwy Ddeddf hynny. Rhaid deall hynny er mwyn asesu gwerth Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 yn gywir.

Yn ddiddorol ddigon, mae Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnwys Atodlen gyda 50 llinell o eithriadau yn ei adran ar drafnidiaeth—mwy nag unrhyw adran arall. Bydd yn cyfyngu'n enfawr ar effeithiolrwydd posibl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac nid yw'n cynnwys nifer o'r pwerau y mae arnom eu hangen i wneud cysylltiadau yng Nghymru yn effeithiol ac yn dderbyniol. Mae'n wir bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu cyfrannu'n ariannol, mewn rhai achosion, gyda chytundeb yr awdurdodau priodol, ond daw'r cyfraniadau hynny o'r grant bloc, ac ar draul gwasanaethau eraill. Nid oes trosglwyddiadau arian arbennig ar gyfer hyn—gwneir hynny yn achos y fasnachfrait, ond nid ar gyfer pethau eraill.

I turn to the Plaid Cymru amendment. If supported, it would keep the power to give financial assistance to air transport with the Assembly. We are asking for this because climate change is probably the biggest challenge ever in human history. Air transport is a highly significant contributor to the carbon emissions that are driving climate change, and the Assembly must take responsibility for actions that can increase emissions, and do so as openly as possible. I have heard the Minister's promises, but things could change in the future, and financial assistance to air transport can certainly increase the number of services and carbon emissions. I also add that the amendment does not rule out financial assistance completely.

This morning, I was reading a report from the all-party environment group of MPs, which has criticised the UK Government for being laggards, not leaders, on climate change. It mentions its efforts to limit emissions from transport, and that it needs to be more ambitious. It seems to me that the Assembly Government may not just be failing in ambition, but that it has powers in this Act to add positively to emissions. Given that these MPs have said that the UK is unlikely to meet its target to reduce emissions by 20 per cent by 2010, it almost seems as though the Assembly Government is determined to help the UK Government to fail.

Alun Cairns: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. After 'cannot be so delegated' insert:

and those under section 5 of the Act (relating to the power to establish joint transport authorities).

The Transport (Wales) Act 2006 has a number of positive implications that will help to improve the influence that the Welsh Assembly Government can have on transport issues in Wales. However, we wish to express concern about section 5 of the Act, relating to joint transport authorities. In initial pre-legislative scrutiny, and later, it was clear that the costings for the joint transport

Trof at welliant Plaid Cymru. Pe bae'n cael ei cefnogi, byddai'n cadw'r pŵer i roi cymorth ariannol i drafnidiaeth awyr yn nwylo'r Cynulliad. Yr ydym yn gofyn am hyn oherwydd mae'n debyg mai newid yn yr hinsawdd yw'r her fwyaf y mae'r byd wedi'i hwynebu erioed. Mae trafnidiaeth awyr yn cyfrannu gryn dipyn at ollyngiadau carbon sy'n achosi newid yn yr hinsawdd, a rhaid i'r Cynulliad ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am weithredoedd a allai gynyddu gollyngiadau, a hynny mewn ffordd mor agored â phosibl. Clywais addewidion y Gweinidog, ond gallai pethau newid yn y dyfodol, a gallai cymorth ariannol i drafnidiaeth awyr yn sicr gynyddu nifer y gwasanaethau a gollyngiadau carbon. Hoffwn ychwanegu hefyd nad yw'r gwelliant yn gwrthod cymorth ariannol yn gyfan gwbl.

Y bore yma, yr oeddwn yn darllen adroddiad gan y grŵp hollbleidiol o ASau ar yr amgylchedd, sydd wedi beirniadu Llywodraeth y DU am fod ar ei hôl hi, yn hytrach nag ar y blaen, o ran newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n sôn am ei hymdrechion i gyfyngu gollyngiadau oherwydd trafnidiaeth, a bod angen iddi fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol. Ymddengys imi fod y Cynulliad nid yn unig yn dangos diffyg uchelgais ond bod ganddo yn y Ddeddf hon bwerau i ychwanegu at y gollyngiadau. O gofio bod yr ASau hyn wedi dweud bod y DU yn annhebygol o gyrraedd ei thargedau i leihau gollyngiadau 20 y cant erbyn 2010, ymddengys bron fel petai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn benderfynol o helpu Llywodraeth y DU i fethu.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ar ôl 'na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw' rhoi:

a'r rhai dan adran 5 y Ddeddf (sy'n ymwneud â'r pŵer i sefydlu cyd-awdurdodau trafnidiaeth).

Mae i Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 nifer o oblygiadau cadarnhaol a fydd yn helpu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gael mwy o ddylanwad ar faterion trafnidiaeth yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, hoffem fynegi pryder ynglŷn ag adran 5 o'r Ddeddf, sy'n ymwneud ag awdurdodau trafnidiaeth ar y cyd. Yn y broses graffu gychwynol cyn deddfu, ac yn ddiweddarach, yr oedd yn

authorities, and the influence that they would have, were being questioned by many, from all parties. The Minister stated in his introduction that he would report any significant issue to the respective committee, which would be the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee. The problem with that is that many people outside the Assembly have expressed concerns about the workings of the committee, and opportunities to scrutinise the Minister in that committee are extremely limited. What confidence can we have that the Minister will bring significant issues to the committee when, in the past, that sort of promise has been made, but rarely delivered? In the lead up to the last general election, we were told that any significant announcement would be made to the committee, before it went in a press release and was made public, but that was ignored on a regular basis.

While we are in this position, without all the information about joint transport authorities, we see an inconsistent Welsh Assembly Government that, on the one hand, seeks to abolish quangos, but, on the other, seeks the power to introduce more. In reality, the Minister could take that co-ordinating role and operate in a positive manner because there are only 22 authorities in Wales that need to be co-ordinated, when, at an English level, where there are so many more local authorities, it would be difficult to do. The purpose of devolution is to put the power in the hands of the Assembly, not in the hands of one Minister, when he can do the work from an influential position in the first instance. That is why we have tabled this amendment.

Michael German: We welcome the transfer of power that comes with this Act, although it has been a long time coming—I hope that that does not mean that all our trains and buses will be late in the same way as this Act has been late arriving.

The problem, which I think has been expressed by Janet Davies, is the patchwork quilt that we find in the powers. It re-expresses the problem that we have seen with all these Bills—they finish part of the patchwork, but leave others unmade. I would

amlwg bod nifer, o bob plaid, yn amau'r costiau ar gyfer yr awdurdodau trafniadaeth ar y cyd, a'r dylanwad a gaent. Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei gyflwyniad y byddai'n cyflwyno adroddiad ar unrhyw fater o bwys i'r pwyllgor priodol, sef y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau. Y drwg yw bod nifer o bobl y tu allan i'r Cynulliad wedi mynegi pryderon ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae'r pwyllgor yn gweithredu, a phrin iawn yw'r cyfleoedd i graffu ar waith y Gweinidog yn y pwyllgor hwnnw. I ba raddau y gallwn fod yn hyderus y bydd y Gweinidog yn codi materion o bwys yn y pwyllgor, o gofio bod addewid o'r fath wedi ei wneud yn y gorffennol ond anaml y cadwyd ato? Yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf, dywedwyd wrthym y byddai unrhyw gyhoeddiad pwysig yn cael ei wneud i'r pwyllgor cyn ei gyhoeddi mewn datganiad i'r wasg ac i'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol, ond anwybyddwyd hynny'n rheolaidd.

Tra byddwn yn y sefyllfa hon, heb yr holl wybodaeth am awdurdodau trafniadaeth ar y cyd, gwelwn fod Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn anghyson, ar y naill law yn ceisio diddymu cwangos, ond ar y llaw arall yn ceisio'r pŵer i gyflwyno rhagor. Y gwir yw y gallai'r Gweinidog ymgymryd â'r rôl gydlyn honno a gweithredu'n gadarnhaol am mai dim ond 22 o awdurdodau y mae angen eu cydlynu yng Nghymru. Byddai'n anodd gwneud hynny yn Lloegr, lle mae cymaint mwy o awdurdodau lleol. Diben datganoli yw rhoi'r pŵer yn nwylo'r Cynulliad, nid yn nwylo un Gweinidog, lle mae gan hwnnw ddylanwad i wneud y gwaith yn y lle cyntaf. Dyna pam y cyflwynwyd y gwelliant hwn gennym.

Michael German: Croesawn y pwerau a drosglwyddir yn y Ddeddf hon, er inni orfod aros yn hir amdanynt—gobeithio nad yw hynny'n golygu y bydd ein holl drenau a'n bysiau'n cyrraedd yn hwyr fel y mae'r Ddeddf hon wedi bod yn hwyr yn cyrraedd.

Y broblem, a fynegwyd gan Janet Davies, mi gredaf, yw'r clytwaith o bwerau a welwn. Mae'n mynegi drachefn y broblem a welwyd yn yr holl Fesurau hyn—maent yn gorffen rhan o'r clytwaith, ond yn gadael darnau eraill heb eu gwneud. Byddai'n dda gennyf

like the Minister, when he replies to this debate, to indicate where the gaps are, as he sees them, in the provision of what is essential, namely an integrated transport system for Wales. I would like to know where he feels that those powers still limit the way in which he can act. Those may be in terms of measures or Bills—or whatever you will want to call them after next year—or that some powers will still be reserved for the Westminster Government unless we can achieve an overarching settlement in an Act of Parliament next year or in a transfer via the Orders in Council route.

It strikes me that we are taking one step towards what will be the appropriate powers to provide that integrated transport system. Buses must meet the trains, trains must be met by buses, and we must ensure that we have a network to ensure that they work together properly. I do not think that we have that route map yet, which is what we need. Apart from those points, we are happy to support the motion as drafted and the amendments.

Carl Sargeant: Today, I think that we should welcome the fact that the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 is coming to the Assembly as part of devolved Government. This is one of the largest pieces of legislation that we have received at the Assembly, since it was established, and I think that that is something that all groups should celebrate because we are having the opportunity to make choices and to decide on important issues in the transport economy of Wales.

3.30 p.m.

I must raise with the Minister section 1 on the general transport duty, which refers to the development of policies for the promotion and encouragement of safe, integrated, sustainable transport. Now that the Act is coming to the Assembly, we will have the opportunity to scrutinise the Minister more clearly. I welcome that, particularly with regard to a case in my constituency relating to the A494 and the A55, which is receiving great publicity, and I support residents in the decisions surrounding the A494. The

pe bai'r Gweinidog, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon, yn dweud wrthym ble y mae'r bylchau, yn ei farn ef, wrth ddarparu'r hyn sy'n hanfodol, sef system drafnidiaeth integredig i Gymru. Hoffwn wybod ble y mae'r pwerau hyn, yn ei farn ef, yn dal i gyfyngu'r ffordd y gall weithredu. Gallai'r rheini olygu mesurau neu Fesurau—neu beth bynnag y cânt eu galw ar ôl y flwyddyn nesaf—neu y bydd rhai pwerau wedi'u cadw'n ôl o hyd i Lywodraeth San Steffan oni allwn gael setliad cyffredin mewn Deddf Seneddol y flwyddyn nesaf, neu mewn trosglwyddiad drwy gyfrwng Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor.

Yr hyn sy'n fy nharo i yw ein bod yn cymryd un cam tuag at yr hyn a fydd yn bwerau addas i ddarparu'r system drafnidiaeth integredig. Rhaid cael bysiau i gyd-fynd ag amseroedd trenau, ac fel arall, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym rwydwaith a fydd yn sicrhau eu bod yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd yn dda. Ni chredaf fod y map llwybr hwnnw gennym eto, a dyna beth sydd arnom ei angen. Ar wahân i'r pwyntiau hynny, yr ydym yn fwy na pharod i gefnogi'r cynnig fel y mae wedi ei ddrafftio a'r gwelliannau.

Carl Sargeant: Heddiw, credaf y dylem groesawu'r ffaith fod Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 yn dod i'r Cynulliad fel rhan o Lywodraeth ddatganoledig. Mae hwn yn un o'r darnau mwyaf o ddeddfwriaeth a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad ers ei sefydlu. Credaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth y dylai pob grŵp ei ddathlu, gan ein bod yn cael y cyfle i wneud dewisiadau ac i benderfynu ar faterion sy'n bwysig yn economi trafnidiaeth Cymru.

Rhaid imi godi gyda'r Gweinidog yr adran 1 ar y ddyletswydd drafnidiaeth gyffredinol, adran sy'n cyfeirio at ddatblygu polisïau ar gyfer hyrwyddo ac annog trafnidiaeth ddiogel, gyfannol, gynaliadwy. Gan fod y Ddeddf yn dod i'r Cynulliad, cawn gyfle i graffu'n fwy eglur ar waith y Gweinidog. Croesawaf hynny, yn arbennig mewn cysylltiad ag achos yn fy etholaeth i yn ymwneud â'r A494 a'r A55, sy'n cael llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r trigolion yn y penderfyniadau'n ymwneud â'r

Transport (Wales) Act 2006 gives us a clearer and more concise opportunity, despite Alun Cairns's comments on scrutiny of the Minister, to do this with the Minister in committee.

John Marek: I confine my remarks to the support of amendment 1, which is about whether we will give the Minister the power to subsidise air transport passenger services in Wales. I do not believe that we should give him that power. He did say, in his opening remarks, that he would be open to scrutiny in committee and that everything would be open and so on, but it would be difficult, if he has decided to give a company public money to run air services, for any committee or Plenary meeting to muster a majority to stop that happening. Plenary ought to keep this power unto itself, and if the Minister should want to throw public money away in subsidising air services in Wales, then he should come to Plenary and ask our permission.

There are two major reasons for this. The first is that of the environment. The visibility of the damage that aeroplanes do is now above the horizon, and it will become an increasingly important point as time goes on, and not just in Wales, but everywhere. Are air fares too cheap, and is our planet in danger because of the amount of air travel and the noxious fumes that air transport emits? I am not arguing for no air travel, but I am trying to argue for control, and we can have that control if Plenary decides not to give this particular power to the Minister.

Carl Sargeant: Will the Member be walking to Gibraltar, then? [*Laughter.*]

John Marek: That is a typically fatuous comment, of course.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This debate is not about international or inter-European air travel—if, indeed, Gibraltar is a European region; it is entirely about air services in Wales. As far as I am aware, Ynys Môn is not Gibraltar.

A494. Mae Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 yn rhoi cyfle mwy eglur a chryno inni, er gwaethaf sylwadau Alun Cairns ynghylch craffu ar y Gweinidog, i wneud hyn gyda'r Gweinidog yn y pwyllgor.

John Marek: Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i gefnogi gwelliant 1, sef a ydym i roi pŵer i'r Gweinidog roi cymhorthdal i wasanaethau trafndiaeth awyr i deithwyr yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn credu y dylem roi'r pŵer hwnnw iddo. Yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, dywedodd y byddai'n agored i graffu yn y pwyllgor ac y byddai popeth yn agored, ac ati. Ond byddai'n anodd, os yw wedi penderfynu rhoi arian cyhoeddus i gwmni redeg gwasanaethau awyr, i unrhyw bwyllgor neu Gyfarfod Llawn sicrhau mwyafriif i rwystro hynny rhag digwydd. Dylai'r Cyfarfod Llawn gadw'r pŵer hwn iddo'i hun, a phe bai'r Gweinidog am wastraffu arian cyhoeddus drwy roi cymhorthdal i wasanaethau awyr yng Nghymru, dylai ddod i'r Cyfarfod Llawn i ofyn am ein caniatâd.

Mae dau brif reswm am hyn. Y cyntaf yw'r amgylchedd. Mae'r difrod y mae awyrennau'n ei wneud yn glir i bawb erbyn hyn, a bydd yn bwynt cynyddol bwysig gydag amser, ac nid yng Nghymru'n unig, ond ym mhobman. A yw prisiau teithiau awyr yn rhy rad, ac a yw ein planed mewn perygl oherwydd yr holl deithiau awyr a'r mygdarth gwenwynig y mae trafndiaeth awyr yn ei greu? Nid wyf yn dadlau yn erbyn teithiau awyr yn gyfan gwbl, ond yr wyf yn ceisio dadlau dros reolaeth, a gallwn gadw'r rheolaeth honno os penderfyna'r Cyfarfod Llawn beidio â rhoi'r pŵer penodol hwn i'r Gweinidog.

Carl Sargeant: A fydd yr Aelod yn cerdded i Gibraltar, felly? [*Chwerthin.*]

John Marek: Dyna sylw nodweddiadol ynfyd, wrth gwrs.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid trafodaeth ynghylch teithiau awyr rhyngwladol na rhyng-Ewropeaidd yw hon—os yw Gibraltar, yn wir, yn rhanbarth Ewropeaidd; trafodaeth ynghylch gwasanaethau awyr yng Nghymru ydyw. Hyd y gwn, nid Gibraltar yw Ynys Môn.

John Marek: I think that you make my case for me. The Labour Party, as usual, is laughing, but I will come to the point about snouts in the trough in a minute.

My first argument is that there are environmental considerations that will become increasingly important as time goes on, and we should not allow the Minister to use his powers to subsidise air services in Wales.

My second point is that this is Labour Party members with their snouts in the trough again. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Well, they have plenty of snouts in the trough with secret donations and proposals to make the donors Members of the House of Lords. We only have to talk about the Deputy Prime Minister to know where public money is spent and whether it is being spent properly. I do not think that we have any lessons to learn from the Labour Party.

If the Minister subsidises air services from Cardiff to Hawarden, Cardiff to Valley, or to other places in north Wales, is he prepared to say that he will not use them and that he will use his own ticket, not subsidised by public money. Is he prepared to give a commitment on behalf of the Government that these air services will be subsidised for business reasons and not for public reasons? I suspect that the Government wants these services because members of the Cabinet would love to go from Cardiff—and they are nearly all from Cardiff, or near Cardiff—to north-east or north-west Wales. Even if they were to give me an absolute guarantee that they would not benefit personally from these air services, I would still be in favour of amendment 1; I shall not vote against it, but I might just be tempted to abstain. However, I do not think that they will give me such a guarantee; they are here to please themselves on this matter— [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Oh, yes, but not in any corrupt way, because it is a perfectly proper way for them to do it. However, I believe that they are here to please themselves in this regard, when they should be arguing for a proper train service between north and south Wales that the ordinary working men and women of Wales can use, and not just those who are privileged to have public service jobs and

John Marek: Credaf eich bod yn dadlau fy achos. Yn ôl yr arfer, mae'r Blaid Lafur yn chwervthin, ond dof at y pwynt ynghylch cael y swch yn y cafn mewn munud.

Fy nabl gyntaf yw bod ystyriaethau amgylcheddol a fydd yn gynyddol bwysig gydag amser, ac ni ddylem ganiatáu i'r Gweinidog ddefnyddio'i bwerau i roi cymhorthdal i wasanaethau awyr yng Nghymru.

Fy ail bwynt yw mai enghraifft arall yw hyn lle mae aelodau'r Blaid Lafur â'u swch yn y cafn. [AELODAU CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Wel, mae ganddynt ddigon o sychau yn y cafn gyda'r rhoddion cyfrinachol a'r cynigion i wneud y rhoddwyr yn Aelodau o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Nid oes angen inni ond sôn am y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn Llundain i wybod ble y gwerir arian cyhoeddus ac a yw'n cael ei wario'n iawn. Ni chredaf fod gennym ddim i'w ddysgu gan y Blaid Lafur.

Os bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi cymhorthdal i wasanaethau awyr o Gaerdydd i Benarlâg, o Gaerdydd i'r Fali, neu i leoedd eraill yn y gogledd, a yw'n barod i ddweud na fydd yn eu defnyddio ac y bydd yn defnyddio'i docyn ei hun, heb gymhorthdal arian cyhoeddus? A yw'n barod i ymrwymo ar ran y Llywodraeth mai am resymau busnes y rhoddir cymhorthdal i'r gwasanaethau hyn, nid am resymau cyhoeddus? Yr wyf yn tybio bod y Llywodraeth am gyflwyno'r gwasanaethau hyn oherwydd y byddai aelodau'r Cabinet wrth eu boddau yn mynd o Gaerdydd—ac maent bron i gyd o Gaerdydd, neu o gyffiniau Caerdydd—i'r gogledd-ddwyrain neu i'r gogledd-orllewin. Hyd yn oed pe byddent yn rhoi sicrwydd llwyr imi na fyddent yn elwa'n bersonol o'r gwasanaethau awyr hyn, byddwn yn dal o blaid gwelliant 1. Ni fyddaf yn pleidleisio yn ei erbyn, ond gallwn gael fy nhemtio i ymatal. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu y byddant yn rhoi sicrwydd felly imi; maent yma i'w plesio eu hunain ar y mater hwn—[AELODAU CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] O, ydynt, ond nid mewn ffordd lygredig, oherwydd mae'n ffordd gwbl briodol iddynt wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, credaf eu bod yma i'w plesio eu hunain yn hyn, pan ddylent fod yn dadlau dros gael gwasanaeth trên iawn rhwng y de a'r gogledd y gall pobl gyffredin Cymru ei ddefnyddio, nid dim ond y rhai

whose tickets are paid for by the public sector.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I am pleased that Members, with varying degrees of enthusiasm, welcome this piece of legislation. I will make a few general points before I respond to the amendments and questions. The legislation is a very significant enhancement of the Assembly's powers, and, along with the Railways Act 2005, it is the largest transfer of power since the Assembly was set up. I make an explicit reference to the Railways Act 2005 because the draft Transport (Wales) Bill, as originally framed, included sections of the Railways Act 2005. However, because of the timescale of the railway industry review instigated by the former Secretary of State for Transport, Alistair Darling, the clauses were taken out, which partly answers the question in relation to timing asked by Mike German.

I am very comfortable with the powers that this institution and this Government will have once the delegation goes through, in terms of our ability to deliver on an integrated transport policy and improving transport services in Wales.

I am not sure about Alun Cairns's point about scrutiny—he may have been listening to the Presiding Officer's comments over the weekend about scrutiny. However, it is not a matter for Ministers to decide how Members and committees should take forward scrutiny. This piece of legislation was a first in many ways, not least of which as a piece of joint scrutiny between what was then the Economic Development and Transport Committee and the Welsh Affairs Select Committee. As a Minister, I felt that that process, as well as our internal processes, produced a very good piece of legislation that was subject to very effective scrutiny. The fact that the legislation, to my knowledge, went through all the processes—

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Andrew Davies: I will give way in a minute.

sy'n ddigon breintiedig i gael swyddi ym maes gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a'r sector cyhoeddus yn talu am eu tocynnau.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Yr wyf yn falch bod Aelodau, er bod eu brwdfrydedd yn amrywio, yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Cynigiau ychydig bwyntiau cyffredinol cyn ymateb i'r gwelliannau a'r cwestiynau. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn cynyddu pwerau'r Cynulliad yn sylweddol iawn, ac ar y cyd â Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, dyma'r achos mwyaf o drosglwyddo pŵer ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 gan fod drafft Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru), fel y'i lluniwyd yn wreiddiol, yn cynnwys rhannau o Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd amserlen yr adolygiad o'r diwydiant rheilffyrdd a gychwynwyd gan y cyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth, Alistair Darling, tynnwyd y cymalau allan. Mae hynny'n ateb yn rhannol y cwestiwn a ofynnodd Mike German ynghylch amseru.

Yr wyf yn gyfforddus iawn ynglŷn â'r pwerau a fydd gan y sefydliad hwn a'r Llywodraeth hon ar ôl dirprwyo hyn, o ran ein gallu i weithredu polisi trafndiaeth integredig a gwella gwasanaethau trafndiaeth yng Nghymru.

Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â phwynt Alun Cairns am graffu—efallai iddo wrando ar sylwadau'r Llywydd dros y penwythnos ynghylch craffu. Fodd bynnag, nid mater i Weinidogion yw penderfynu sut y dylai Aelodau a phwyllgorau fwrw ymlaen gyda chraffu. Yr oedd y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn unigryw mewn sawl ffordd, yn bennaf gan fod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig wedi craffu arni ar y cyd. Fel Gweinidog, teimlwn fod y broses honno, yn ogystal â'n prosesau mewnol ni, wedi cynhyrchu deddfwriaeth dda iawn y craffwyd arni'n effeithiol iawn. Mae'r ffaith fod y ddeddfwriaeth, hyd y gwn i, wedi mynd drwy'r holl brosesau—

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Andrew Davies: Ildiaf yn y man.

The fact that the legislation went through all the processes in the House of Commons and the House of Lords unamended reflects the quality of the legislation.

In terms of reporting, I made it clear in my opening remarks that if there was a proposal, and I use the word 'if' advisedly, to establish a joint transport authority, it would only come forward if the current voluntary arrangements did not work. That would require legislation, therefore it would not be a question of me reporting to committee that I intended to set up a joint transport authority. On that basis, the committee and Plenary would be fully involved in the legislation and it would also be subject to full public consultation.

Alun Cairns: The Minister made the point that it is not a matter for Ministers to influence the scrutiny that opposition Members may undertake. However, would the Minister accept that he has made public many announcements about policy changes that have been significant on an all-Wales basis, and significant to the committee, which were not made available to the committee before being made public? Therefore, those prior announcements have prevented the committee from scrutinising decisions, because they had already been made.

Andrew Davies: With all due respect, I am speaking to the Conservative amendment, which you are clearly not doing. The amendment specifically refers to the establishment of a joint transport authority. If you want to amend something else, you should have tabled an amendment to that effect, but you have not done that.

Alun Cairns: With the greatest respect, it seems that the Minister criticised my point about the scrutiny of the committee. The amendment was tabled because of our experience of his attitude towards the committee and because we do not have the confidence that he will bring statements to the committee first.

Mae'r ffaith fod y ddeddfwriaeth wedi mynd drwy'r holl brosesau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ac yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi heb ei gwella yn adlewyrchu safon y ddeddfwriaeth.

O ran cyflwyno adroddiadau, gwneuthum yn eglur yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, pe byddai cynnig, a dywedaf hynny'n bwylllog, i greu cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth, câi'r cynnig hwnnw ei gyflwyno dim ond os na fyddai'r trefniadau gwirfoddol presennol yn gweithio. Byddai angen deddfwriaeth i wneud hynny, felly, nid mater o gyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor yn dweud fy mod yn bwriadu sefydlu cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth fyddai hynny. Ar sail hynny, byddai gan y pwyllgor a'r Cyfarfod Llawn ran llawn yn y ddeddfwriaeth, a byddai hefyd yn destun ymgynghori cyhoeddus llawn.

Alun Cairns: Esboniodd y Gweinidog nad mater i Weinidogion yw dylanwadu ar graffu gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, a fyddai'r Gweinidog yn derbyn ei fod wedi gwneud llawer i ddatganiad cyhoeddus ynghylch newidiadau polisi sy'n arwyddocaol o ran Cymru gyfan, ac yn arwyddocaol i'r pwyllgor, newidiadau na hysbyswyd y pwyllgor amdanynt cyn eu cyhoeddi? Mae'r rhag-ddatganiadau hynny felly wedi rhwystro'r pwyllgor rhag craffu ar benderfyniadau am eu bod eisoes wedi eu gwneud.

Andrew Davies: Gyda phob dyledus barch, siarad ar welliant Ceidwadol yr wyf fi, rhywbeth nad ydych chi'n ei wneud, yn amlwg. Mae'r gwelliant yn cyfeirio'n benodol at sefydlu cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth. Os hoffech wella rhywbeth arall, dylech fod wedi cyflwyno gwelliant i'r perwyl hwnnw. Ond nid ydych wedi gwneud hynny.

Alun Cairns: Gyda phob parch, mae'n ymddangos bod y Gweinidog yn beirniadu fy mhwynt ynghylch craffu yn y pwyllgor. Cyflwynwyd y gwelliant oherwydd ein profiad ni o'i agwedd tuag at y pwyllgor, ac am nad ydym yn hyderus y bydd yn dod â datganiadau i'r pwyllgor yn gyntaf.

Andrew Davies: I do not think that you have added to anything that you said previously, and I stand by my point. If I were to propose a joint transport authority, it would have to go through the full legislative process, within the competence of the Assembly, and be subject to full public consultation. I stand by what I have said.

Andrew Davies: Nid wyf yn credu eich bod wedi ychwanegu dim at yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn gynharach, a daliaf at fy mhwynt. Pe byddwn am gynnig cyd-awdurdod trafndiaeth, byddai'n rhaid i hynny fynd drwy'r broses ddeddfwriaethol lawn, o fewn gallu'r Cynulliad, a byddai'n destun ymgynghori cyhoeddus llawn. Daliaf at yr hyn a ddywedais.

3.40 p.m.

On the other transport issue, I must clarify that it is not just about internal services. Some comments have been made about internal air services. It impacts on the ability to establish a route development fund as well as on the possible subsidy of internal air services under a public service obligation, which we have sought and acquired from the UK Government. However, on the route development fund that I have set up, do Members seriously want every commercial decision, not just by us but by Cardiff airport and any air operator, about possible support for any route, whether it be from Cardiff to Brussels, or to any other destination within the European Union, to come to the Assembly for approval? That would be the effect of the amendment that Plaid Cymru proposes. You would probably have to disclose confidential financial information about that arrangement.

O ran y mater trafndiaeth arall, rhaid imi egluro nad yw hyn yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau mewnol yn unig. Cafwyd rhai sylwadau ynghylch gwasanaethau awyr mewnol. Mae'n effeithio ar ein gallu i sefydlu cronfa datblygu llwybrau yn ogystal â'r chymhorthdal posibl i wasanaethau awyr o dan rwymedigaeth gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yr ydym wedi gofyn amdani ac wedi ei chael gan Lywodraeth y DU. Fodd bynnag, o ran y gronfa datblygu llwybrau yr wyf wedi ei sefydlu, a yw Aelodau mewn gwirionedd am i bob penderfyniad masnachol, nid gennym ni yn unig, ond gan faes awyr Caerdydd ac unrhyw weithredwr teithiau awyr, ynghylch cael cymorth ariannol posibl i unrhyw lwybr, boed o Gaerdydd i Frwsel, neu i unrhyw gyrchfan arall yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ddod atom i'r Cynulliad i'w gymeradwyo? Dyna fyddai effaith y gwelliant y mae Plaid Cymru'n ei gynnig. Mae'n debyg y byddai'n rhaid ichi ddatgelu gwybodaeth ariannol gyfrinachol ynghylch y trefniant hwnnw.

The Conservative Party has been saying for a long time that we need to enhance services from Cardiff airport internationally—people in north Wales can access international services through Liverpool and Manchester airports—but the effect of this, particularly at Cardiff airport, would be that it would become a bureaucratic process and every individual application for financial support would have to come to the Assembly. It would be bureaucratic and time-consuming, and the message to the industry would be that Wales is not a good place to do business. It is often pointed out to us that Scotland, in terms of its powers, is something to aspire to. The development of route development funding in Scotland has been extremely successful in opening up international routes as well as those in Europe.

Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn dweud ers amser maith fod angen inni wella gwasanaethau o faes awyr Caerdydd yn rhyngwladol—mae gwasanaethau rhyngwladol ar gael i bobl yn y gogledd drwy feysydd awyr Lerpwl a Manceinion. Ond effaith hyn, yn enwedig ym maes awyr Caerdydd, fyddai creu proses fiwrocraidd, a byddai'n rhaid i bob cais unigol am gymorth ariannol ddod i'r Cynulliad. Byddai'n fiwrocraidd ac yn mynd ag amser, ac yn cyfleu neges i'r diwydiant nad yw Cymru'n lle da iawn i gynnal busnes. Dywedir wrthym yn aml fod sefyllfa'r Alban, o ran pwerau, yn rhywbeth y dylem anelu ati. Mae datblygu'r gronfa datblygu llwybrau yn yr Alban wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn i agor llwybrau rhyngwladol yn ogystal â llwybrau yn Ewrop.

John Marek only talked about subsidy for one particular transport mode. He ignores the fact that significant subsidy is going into bus and rail services in Wales. Whenever I have heard him speak, I have not seen a self-denying ordinance in terms of stopping using railway services because they have a significant public subsidy, and one that is well in excess of what is proposed to be invested for an internal air service. I have said on many occasions that the role of politicians is to do good and to do no harm, and we have to operate as politicians. I note the comments that John Marek made. We know him to be a man of the greatest principle, integrity and probity and I assume that, as Carl Sargeant said, from now on, operating under self-denying ordinance, he will not use any air services in his activities, whether personally or as a politician.

John Marek: Point of order.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That is not a point of order and the Minister is not giving way.

John Marek: It is a disgrace.

The Presiding Officer: Order. If there is a legitimate point of order—and the Deputy Presiding Officer should be able to judge that for himself before he raises it—I will call him.

Andrew Davies: I propose this delegation of functions unamended to the Assembly. It will make a significant contribution towards delivering transport services to all the people of Wales, irrespective of where they live. I commend it.

John Marek: Point of order. I seek your advice, Presiding Officer. I apologise for interrupting earlier but when a Member, in his speech, names another Member, is it not normal courtesy to allow that Member to intervene if he or she wishes to do so? [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I will respond to that point. I do not normally give advice and I do not think that I need to give it in this case. It is entirely up to the Member speaking

Yr oedd John Marek yn sôn am gymhorthdal mewn un maes trafndiaeth penodol. Mae'n anwybyddu'r ffaith fod cymhorthdal sylweddol yn mynd i'r gwasanaethau bws a rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Bob tro yr wyf wedi ei glywed yn siarad, ni chlywais am reol sy'n ei atal rhag defnyddio gwasanaethau rheilffordd gan eu bod yn cael cymhorthdal cyhoeddus sylweddol, a hwnnw lawer yn uwch na'r hyn y cynigir ei fuddsoddi ar gyfer gwasanaeth awyr mewnol. Yr wyf wedi dweud droeon mai gwaith gwleidyddion yw gwneud daioni a pheidio â gwneud niwed, ac mae'n rhaid inni weithredu fel gwleidyddion. Nodaf y sylwadau a wnaeth John Marek. Gwyddom ei fod yn ŵr o egwyddor, hygrededd a chywirdeb, a thybiaf, fel y dywedodd Carl Sargeant, na fydd o hyn ymlaen yn defnyddio unrhyw wasanaethau awyr, yn bersonol nac fel gwleidydd.

John Marek: Pwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hwnnw'n bwyt o drefn ac nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

John Marek: Mae'n gywilyddus.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os oes pwynt dilys o drefn—a dylai'r Dirprwy Lywydd allu barnu hynny drosto'i hun cyn ei godi—fe'i galwaf.

Andrew Davies: Cynigiau y cynnig hwn i ddirprwyo swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad heb ei wella. Bydd yn gyfraniad sylweddol at ddarparu gwasanaethau trafndiaeth i bawb yng Nghymru, ble bynnag y maent yn byw. Fe'i cymeradwyaf.

John Marek: Pwynt o drefn. Hoffwn gael eich cyngor, Lywydd. Ymddiheuraf am dorri ar draws yn gynharach, ond pan fydd Aelod yn ei araith yn enwi Aelod arall, onid cwrtseisi arferol yw iddo ganiatáu i'r Aelod hwnnw ymyrryd os yw am wneud hynny? [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ymatebaf i'r pwynt hwnnw. Nid wyf yn rhoi cyngor fel rheol, ac ni chredaf fod angen imi wneud hynny yn yr achos hwn. Mater i'r Aelod sy'n siarad yn

whether or not he or she gives way. I heard nothing in what the Minister said that was disorderly; otherwise, I would have intervened myself.

Leighton Andrews: Point of order. If a Member is speaking in a debate on transport and is sponsored by a rail union, do you think that he or she should declare an interest?

The Presiding Officer: The interest will be clear in the register of Members' interests. I will review this matter and take further advice, but I do not believe that the sponsorship of a union, which is declared in the register, needs to be declared again during a debate. However, it would be appropriate for that information to be indicated once at the beginning of a debate, particularly if the Member is proposing an amendment or speaking to a motion.

Alun Cairns: Further to that point of order, if we were to pursue the point of order that Leighton Andrews has just raised, surely any Labour Member, or any other Member, receiving support from the Transport and General Workers' Union, for example, or any other general union, would be barred from speaking in almost any debate. It is a dangerous precedent that is being considered.

John Marek: Further to that point of order, the Minister asked whether I will have a self-denying ordinance regarding using intra-Wales air services. I can give you that assurance: I will not be using those services.

On the vexatious comment made by Leighton Andrews—and I think that he was referring to me—it may help Plenary if I stated that I am not sponsored by the National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers. He should stop trying to make trouble so that we can get on with our business.

unig yw ildio neu beidio. Ni chlywais ddim afreolus yn yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Pe bawn wedi clywed rhywbeth felly, byddwn wedi ymyrryd fy hun.

Leighton Andrews: Pwynt o drefn. Os bydd Aelod yn siarad mewn dadl ar drafnidiaeth ac yntau wedi'i noddi gan undeb rheilffyrdd, a ydych yn credu y dylai ef neu hi ddatgan buddiant?

Y Llywydd: Bydd y buddiant yn glir yng nghofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau. Byddaf yn adolygu'r mater hwn ac yn cymryd cyngor pellach, ond ni chredaf fod angen ailddatgan nawdd undeb mewn dadl os bydd wedi'i ddatgan yn y gofrestr. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n briodol nodi'r wybodaeth honno unwaith ar ddechrau dadl, yn enwedig os bydd yr Aelod yn cynnig gwelliant neu'n siarad o blaid cynnig.

Alun Cairns: Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, petawn yn mynd ar drywydd y pwynt o drefn sydd newydd ei godi gan Leighton Andrews, oni fyddai unrhyw Aelod Llafur, neu unrhyw Aelod arall, sy'n cael cefnogaeth gan Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol, dyweder, neu unrhyw undeb cyffredinol arall, yn cael ei atal rhag siarad mewn bron pob dadl? Yr ydym yn ystyried cynsail peryglus.

John Marek: Yn ychwanegol at y pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gofynnodd y Gweinidog a oes gennyf reol sy'n fy atal rhag defnyddio gwasanaethau awyr y tu mewn i Gymru. Gallaf eich sicrhau o hynny: ni fyddaf yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny.

O ran sylw blinderus Leighton Andrews—a chredaf ei fod yn cyfeirio ataf fi—efallai y byddai o gymorth i'r Cyfarfod Llawn os dywedaf nad wyf wedi fy noddi gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Gweithwyr Rheilffordd, Morwrol a Thrafnidiaeth. Dylai ymatal rhag ceisio creu trafferth er mwyn inni allu mynd ymlaen â'n busnes.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
 Amendment 2: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri

Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3061): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained within the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated.

Cynnig (NDM3061): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.

*Cynnig (NDM3061): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.
 Motion (NDM3061): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny

Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006
 Approval of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006**

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3062)

I propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2006 in relation to the draft the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3063)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes neb am siarad ar y mater hwn, felly symudwn ymlaen at y pleidleisiau.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3062)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru,

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3063)

The Presiding Officer: No-one wishes to speak on this issue, so we will move to the votes.

*Cynnig (NDM3062): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion (NDM3062): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM3063): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.

Motion (NDM3063): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 5.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David

Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheolau Trafnidiaeth a Gweithfeydd (Gweithdrefn Ceisiadau a Gwrthwynebiadau) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 26
Approval of the Transport and Works (Applications and Objections Procedure) (England and Wales Rules 2006 under Standing Order No. 26)**

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I propose that:

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 26, agrees that the Secretary of State makes the Transport and Works (Applications and Objections Procedure) (England and Wales) Rules 2006, which was laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2006. (NDM3064)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes neb am siarad ar y mater hwn, felly symudwn ymlaen at y bleidlais.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog 26, yn cytuno bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gwneud y Rheolau Trafnidiaeth a Gweithfeydd (Gweithdrefn Ceisiadau a Gwrthwynebiadau) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3064)

The Presiding Officer: No-one wishes to speak on this issue, so we will move to the vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3064): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3064): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

3.50 p.m.

Trefniadau'r Cynulliad i Gydweithredu â Busnesau The Assembly's Arrangements for Co-operation with Business

Motion (NDM3065): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3065): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly under Standing Order
 No. 6.6(xiii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol
 Sefydlog Rhif 6.6(xiii):*

*1. notes the transparent way in which the
 Assembly Government conducts its relations
 with business;*

*1. yn nodi'r ffordd dryloyw y mae
 Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnal ei
 pherthynas â'r byd busnes;*

*2. recognises the continuing need to work
 with the business sector and trade unions in
 developing policy.*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i weithio
 gyda'r sector busnes ac undebau llafur wrth
 ddatblygu polisi.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis.
 Delete the word 'transparent' in point 1.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Dileu'r gair
 'dryloyw' ym mhwynt 1.

- Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the First Minister to do everything in his power to make it more difficult for manufacturing jobs to be relocated overseas, by improving the rights of workers in Wales.*
- Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to publish its success rate in clawing back grant aid awarded to companies who have subsequently abandoned Wales.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to prioritise investment in indigenous businesses.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to pay particular attention to the food and food-processing industries in light of recent job losses.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to put in place an early-warning system for businesses facing job losses, so that the Welsh Assembly Government can take early action to help to mitigate job losses.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to implement a green jobs strategy.*
- Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar y Prif Weinidog i wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i'w gwneud yn fwy anodd i swyddi gweithgynhyrchu gael eu hadleoli dramor, drwy wella hawliau gweithwyr yng Nghymru.*
- Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi i ba raddau y mae wedi llwyddo i adfachu cymorth grant a ddyfarnwyd i gwmnïau a gefnodd ar Gymru wedi hynny.*
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i fuddsoddi mewn busnesau cynhenid.*
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi sylw penodol i'r diwydiannau bwyd a phrosesu bwyd, yn wyneb y colledion swyddi diweddar.*
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu system rhybudd cynnar ar gyfer busnesau sy'n wynebu colledion swyddi, fel bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gallu gweithredu ar fyrder i helpu i liniaru colledion swyddi.*
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithredu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd.*

Amendment 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the new Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks has the same cachet and brand appeal as the Welsh Development Agency.

Amendment 9 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the relevant Assembly subject committees to consider matters raised at the Business Partnership Council and to make recommendations to the Minister accordingly.

Amendment 10 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for a reorganisation of the Business Partnership Council.

Amendment 11 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make a written or oral Assembly statement on calls and demands made by the Business Partnership Council.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Lisa Francis, amendments 2, 3, 4, and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 6, 7, and 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I propose that:

the National Assembly under Standing Order No. 6.6(xiii):

1. notes the transparent way in which the Assembly Government conducts its relations with business;

2. recognises the continuing need to work with the business sector and trade unions in developing policy. (NDM3065)

Gwelliant 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod gan yr Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yr un statws ac apêl brand ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar bwyllgorau pwnc perthnasol y Cynulliad i ystyried materion a godir yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ac i gyflwyno argymhellion i'r Gweinidog yn unol â hynny.

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw am ad-drefnu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes.

Gwelliant 11 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig neu lafar i'r Cynulliad am alwadau a gofynion a wneir gan y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw Lisa Francis, gwelliannau 2, 3, 4, a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 6, 7, ac 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Cynigiad fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6(xiii):

1. yn nodi'r ffordd dryloyw y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnal ei pherthynas â'r byd busnes;

2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i weithio gyda'r sector busnes ac undebau llafur wrth ddatblygu polisi. (NDM3065)

I welcome the opportunity to debate this issue, because I believe that it allows us to discuss how the Assembly Government is openly and successfully engaging with business in Wales. The Business Partnership Council, which was established in 1999, is just one facet of our engagement with the wider business sector. It is an important forum for the exchange of views about the health and prospects of the Welsh economy. We engage fully in formal consultation as well as informal liaison with a range of business representatives and organisations.

The Business Partnership Council provides vital insights into issues and concerns, and provides us with an early warning of any issues. It has also been instrumental in bringing together both sides of business—the employer's side and that of the employees, through the trade unions—enabling them, in many cases, to present consensus views on issues of significant common interest, for example, skills, transport, health and safety issues in the workplace, and energy. An independent review of the Business Partnership Council in late 2004 noted that business organisations in the rest of the UK are envious of the access to politicians that their Welsh colleagues enjoy.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.52 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.52 p.m.*

In 2001, we established, and continue to support, the Wales Social Partners Unit, which provides an information and monitoring service to social partners and advises the Assembly Government on how best to consult, as well as involving social partners in policy development. The Wales Trades Union Congress and business organisations acknowledge that, without the unit, they would not have the capacity to provide quality input to the work of the Assembly, not least of which is releasing the opportunities provided by European structural funds.

It is vital, in developing future policy, that we engage actively with the private sector. It is important that we focus our resources on sustaining the wealth-creating base within Wales. Therefore, business must influence

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod y mater hwn, oherwydd credaf ei fod yn caniatáu inni drafod y modd agored a llwyddiannus y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymgysylltu â busnesau yng Nghymru. Dim ond un enghraifft o'n cyswllt â'r sector busnes ehangach yw'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes, a sefydlwyd yn 1999. Mae'n fforwm pwysig i gyfnewid barn am sefyllfa a rhagolygon economi Cymru. Yr ydym yn ymwneud yn llawn ag ymgynghori ffurfiol yn ogystal â chyswllt anffurfiol ag amrywiaeth o gynrychiolwyr a sefydliadau busnes.

Mae'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yn rhoi cipolwg hanfodol ar faterion a phryderon, gan roi rhybuddion cynnar inni am unrhyw broblemau. Mae hefyd wedi bod yn allweddol i ddwyn ynghyd dwy ochr y byd busnes—ochr y cyflogwr ac ochr y cyflogeion, drwy gyfrwng yr undebau llafur—a'u galluogi, mewn sawl achos, i gyflwyno'r farn gyffredin am faterion o ddiddordeb, er enghraifft, sgiliau, trafniadaeth, materion iechyd a diogelwch yn y gweithle ac ynni. Nodwyd mewn adolygiad annibynnol o'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ddiwedd 2004 fod sefydliadau busnes yng ngweddill y DU yn eiddigeddus o'r modd y mae gwleidyddion ar gael i'w cymheiriaid yng Nghymru.

Yn 2001, sefydlwyd Uned Partneriaid Cymdeithasol Cymru ac yr ydym yn parhau i'w chefnogi. Mae'r Uned hon yn darparu gwasanaeth gwybodaeth a monitro i bartneriaid cymdeithasol, gan gynghori Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y ffordd orau i gynnwys ac ymgynghori â phartneriaid cymdeithasol ym maes datblygu polisi. Mae Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur yng Nghymru a sefydliadau busnes yn cydnabod na fyddai ganddynt y gallu, heb yr uned, i gyfrannu'n sylweddol at waith y Cynulliad gan gynnwys, yn bennaf, ryddhau'r cyfleoedd a ddarperir gan gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop.

Mae'n hanfodol inni gysylltu mewn ffordd ragweithiol â'r sector preifat wrth ddatblygu polisiau'r dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig inni ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau ar gynnal y sylfaen yng Nghymru i greu cyfoeth. Felly,

policy as well as the deployment of structural funds and other business support measures.

The business sector and trade unions have played a key role in the current European structural fund programmes. Both are well represented on the post-2006 external stakeholders groups and on the five expert work streams set up to inform the development of the new programmes—the main one, of course, being the convergence programme. A full, formal consultation on the operational programme, which is the new name for the single programming document, for convergence will take place in the summer, and will be followed in the autumn by consultations on regional competitiveness and employment programmes and the cross-border programme with Ireland, which is the successor to the INTERREG programme.

The United Kingdom and the Netherlands are the only member states to have levered in a significant amount of private match funding during the current structural funds programme. At the latest calculation, over 36 per cent of match funding came from the private sector. The regulations for the next round of structural funds have yet to be finalised, and discussions are ongoing over the option to include private sector match funding at a programme level.

In addition to these structured arrangements, as a Minister, I meet with business organisations regularly—the Federation of Small Businesses, the Confederation of British Industry, the Institute of Directors and many others—as well as the Wales TUC and individual trade unions to discuss issues of concern to them. During the merger of the ASPBs, I had nearly 100 meetings with various individuals and organisations in the business sector.

In response to the announcement made by the First Minister in July 2004, the CBI, in its first response, suggested that we should develop key performance indicators for my new merged Department of Enterprise, Innovation and Networks. As a consequence, we now have a key performance indicator group, which continues to meet to develop a

rhaid i fyd busnes ddylanwadu ar bolisi yn ogystal ag ar ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol a mesurau eraill i gynorthwyo busnes.

Mae'r sector busnes a'r undebau llafur wedi chwarae rhan allweddol yn y rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd cyfredol. Mae'r ddwy ochr wedi'u cynrychioli'n dda yn y grwpiau rhanddeiliaid allanol ar ôl 2006 ac yn y pum ffrwd gwaith arbenigol a sefydlwyd i gynorthwyo wrth ddatblygu'r rhaglenni newydd. Y brif raglen, wrth gwrs, yw'r rhaglen gydgyfeirio. Bydd ymgynghori ffurfiol llawn ar y rhaglen weithredol, sef yr enw newydd ar gyfer y ddogfen raglennu sengl, ar gyfer cydgyfeirio yn yr haf. Ac yn yr hydref bydd ymgynghoriadau am gystadleurwydd rhanbarthol a rhaglenni cyflogaeth a'r rhaglen drawsffiniol ag Iwerddon, sef olynydd y rhaglen INTERREG.

Y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Iseldiroedd yw'r unig aelod-wladwriaethau sydd wedi ysgogi swm sylweddol o arian cyfatebol preifat yn ystod y rhaglen gyfredol o gronfeydd strwythurol. Yn ôl y cyfrif diweddaraf, daeth dros 36 y cant o'r arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat. Nid yw'r rheoliadau ar gyfer y cylch nesaf o gronfeydd strwythurol wedi'u pennu'n derfynol eto, ac mae trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt am y dewis i gynnwys arian cyfatebol gan y sector preifat ar lefel rhaglen.

Yn ogystal â'r trefniadau strwythuredig hyn, byddaf fi, fel Gweinidog, yn cyfarfod â sefydliadau busnes yn rheolaidd—y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr a llawer un arall—yn ogystal â TUC Cymru ac undebau llafur unigol i drafod materion sy'n peri pryder iddynt. Yn ystod cyfnod uno'r CCNCau, cefais ymron i 100 o gyfarfodydd ag unigolion a sefydliadau yn y sector busnes.

Mewn ymateb i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog yng Ngorffennaf 2004, awgrymodd y CBI, yn ei ymateb cyntaf, y dylem ddatblygu dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol ar gyfer fy Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau sydd newydd ei huno. O ganlyniad, mae gennym yn awr grŵp dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol sy'n

framework for the future.

I take this opportunity to place on record my thanks for the invaluable contributions and support given by CBI Wales, the Institute of Directors, the Federation of Small Businesses, the various chambers in Wales, the Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors, the Engineering Employers' Federation and many others, through their membership of the KPI group.

We have just discussed the transfer of functions and the Transport (Wales) Act 2006 (Commencement) Order 2006. The Assembly Government continues to develop a strong relationship with transport operators in Wales. Examples of how we are achieving this are through the Welsh Transport Forum, which I chair, and the Wales freight group, chaired by Callum Couper of Associated British Ports, which, in turn, reports to the Welsh Transport Forum. I also meet regularly with the Confederation of Passenger Transport, the bus industry's trade association, to discuss issues of mutual interest. We have also worked with the business sector, the Wales TUC, EEF Cymru, and the Wales health and safety manufacturers' forum, among other partners, to develop a corporate health standard. The standard was developed to help to tackle the escalating costs of ill health to the Welsh economy, estimated at around £500 million per year. The Welsh Assembly Government awards the standard to those organisations that have demonstrated a commitment to improving the health of their workforce.

Another area in which we work closely with the business community is in the continued attempt to improve small and medium-sized enterprises' access to public sector procurement. In fact, only this morning I chaired the meeting of the business procurement taskforce. We are looking at ways in which we can create a more level playing field in Wales to allow Welsh-based companies to access the considerable annual amounts—approximately £4 billion per year—of goods and services procured on an annual basis in Wales.

parhau i gyfarfod i ddatblygu fframwaith ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i gofnodi fy niolch am gyfraniadau a chymorth amhrisiadwy CBI Cymru, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, yr amrywiol siambrau yng Nghymru, Sefydliad Brenhinol y Syrfewyr Siartredig, Ffederasiwn y Cyflogwyr Peirianyddol a nifer o rai eraill drwy gyfrwng eu haelodaeth o grŵp KPI.

Yr ydym newydd drafod trosglwyddo swyddogaethau Gorchymyn Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006 (Cychwyn) 2006. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i ddatblygu perthynas gref â gweithredwyr trafniadaeth yng Nghymru. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau o'r modd yr ydym yn gwneud mae Fforwm Trafnidiaeth Cymru, yr wyf yn gadeirydd arno, a grŵp cludo nwyddau Cymru o dan gadeiryddiaeth Callum Couper o Associated British Ports. Mae hwnnw, yn ei dro, yn atebol i Fforwm Trafnidiaeth Cymru. Byddaf hefyd yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r Cydffederasiwn Cludiant Teithwyr, cymdeithas fasnach y diwydiant bysiau, i drafod materion sydd o fudd cyffredin. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gweithio gyda'r sector busnes, TUC Cymru, EEF Cymru, a fforwm gweithgynhyrchwyr iechyd a diogelwch Cymru, ymhlith partneriaid eraill, i ddatblygu safon iechyd gorfforaethol. Datblygwyd y safon i helpu mynd i'r afael â chostau cynyddol salwch i economi Cymru, sef amcangyfrif o ryw £500 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn dyfarnu'r safonau i'r sefydliadau hynny sydd wedi dangos ymrwymiad i wella iechyd eu gweithluoedd.

Ymhlith y meysydd yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r gymuned fusnes ynddynt y mae'r ymgais barhaus i wella gallu mentrau bach a chanolig i fanteisio ar gaffael yn y sector cyhoeddus. Yn wir, y bore yma bŵm yn cadeirio cyfarfod o'r tasglu caffael busnes. Yr ydym yn edrych ar ffyrdd i greu cyfleoedd mwy cyfartal yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod y symiau blynyddol sylweddol—oddeutu £4 biliwn y flwyddyn—o nwyddau a gwasanaethau a gaffaelir bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru ar gael i gwmnïau yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: In terms of the business procurement taskforce meeting that the Minister chaired this morning, would he say that that was an open meeting, and were members of the media or the public invited to attend?

Andrew Davies: No, it was not a public meeting. It is not like the Business Partnership Council in that respect; the taskforce meets in private. A considerable amount of work has been achieved. In fact, one of the recommendations that I made to the taskforce this morning was à propos your earlier comments about the transfer of functions debate; I would wish to report to committee on what has been achieved to date on this crucial area of opening up our procurement processes for the wider benefits of the Welsh economy. As I said, the business procurement taskforce has done some considerable work. Businesses fully engage, with membership including the Wales TUC, CBI, the Federation of Small Businesses, and the chambers of commerce.

As a Government, the First Minister and all Ministers are committed to working and strengthening our relationship with the business sector, whether on the employers' or the employees' side. Contrary to some claims, we intend to—and I believe that in practice we do—carry out a real commitment to working in the true spirit of partnership, to listen to and to act on the concerns of business, where we can. As a further illustration, at the Business Partnership Council in July 2005, Business Wales expressed concerns about businesses' ability to engage as fully as it would like in contributing to taking forward the Wales spatial plan. Working with the Wales Social Partners Unit and Business Wales, a way forward has been found. Business panels have been set up in each of the six spatial plan areas and these have regular meetings with officials to comment on current spatial plan work, as well as an opportunity to have more in-depth discussions on key subjects, such as skills and transport.

4.00 p.m.

Alun Cairns: O ran cyfarfod y tasglu caffael busnes y bu'r Gweinidog yn ei gadeirio y bore yma, a fyddai'n dweud ei fod yn gyfarfod agored, ac a wahoddwyd aelodau o'r cyfryngau neu'r cyhoedd i fod yn bresennol?

Andrew Davies: Na fyddwn, nid oedd yn gyfarfod cyhoeddus. Nid yw'n debyg i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yn yr ystyr honno; bydd y tasglu'n cyfarfod y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig. Gwnaed cryn dipyn o waith. Yn wir, yr oedd un o'r argymhellion a wneuthum i'r tasglu y bore yma yn ymwneud â'ch sylwadau cynharach am y ddatl ar drosglwyddo swyddogaethau. Hoffwn gyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar yr hyn a gyflawnwyd hyd yma yn y maes hanfodol hwn o ehangu ein prosesau caffael er budd ehangach economi Cymru. Fel y dywedais, mae'r tasglu caffael busnes wedi gwneud gwaith digon sylweddol. Mae busnesau'n ymgysylltu'n llawn ag aelodau, gan gynnwys TUC Cymru, CBI, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a siambrau masnach.

Fel Llywodraeth, mae'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidogion i gyd wedi ymrwymo i weithio a chryfhau ein perthynas â'r sector busnes, boed ar ochr y cyflogwyr neu ar ochr y cyflogeion. Yn groes i rai honiadau, yr ydym—a chredaf ein bod yn gwneud hyn yn ymarferol—yn bwriadu cyflawni ymrwymiad gwirioneddol i weithio yn ôl gwir ysbryd partneriaeth, gwrandao ar bryderon busnesau a gweithredu arnynt lle gallwn. Fel prawf pellach, yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yng Ngorffennaf 2005, yr oedd Busnes Cymru yn mynegi pryderon am gallu busnesau i ymgysylltu mor llawn ag y byddai'n dymuno wrth gyfrannu at gynllun gofodol Cymru a'i ddatblygu. Drwy weithio gydag Uned Partneriaid Cymdeithasol Cymru a Busnes Cymru, cafwyd ffordd ymlaen. Sefydlwyd paneli busnes ym mhob un o'r chwe ardal cynllun gofodol, a bydd cyfarfodydd rheolaidd â swyddogion i gyflwyno sylwadau am waith cynllunio gofodol cyfredol, yn ogystal â manteisio ar y cyfle i gael trafodaethau manylach ar bynciau allweddol, fel sgiliau a thrafnidiaeth.

Those measures are obviously under the current constitutional legislative settlement. Looking to the future, however, the Government of Wales Bill contains a new clause that strengthens the Assembly Government's commitments to business. The Assembly, as a legislature, already has a duty to consult business, which has helped in fostering good exchanges of information and views. However, during consultation with business representatives and trade unions, it has become clear that there was significant support for placing a greater emphasis on business, and the duty to consult with business, in the Government of Wales Bill. As a result, provision has now been inserted into the Bill requiring Welsh Ministers to produce a business scheme setting out how we propose to take account of business interests, whether as employers or as employees, when exercising our functions, including how we propose to consult.

This will bring our duties with regard to business much more closely in line with those that already apply to local government, as well as the voluntary sector, and will build on the successful relationships that have developed since 1999.

To conclude, support for these amendments in the Bill had our full encouragement, and reflects the good relationship that we as a Government have with business in Wales. It reflects the dialogue that we have, particularly between the CBI and the TUC in Wales, and the Welsh Assembly Government and the Wales Office.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 1: delete the word 'transparent' in point 1.

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the relevant Assembly subject committees to consider matters raised at the Business Partnership Council and to make recommendations to the Minister accordingly.

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Mae'r mesurau hyn yn amlwg o dan y setliad deddfwriaethol cyfansoddiadol cyfredol. Fodd bynnag, i edrych i'r dyfodol, mae Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnwys cymal newydd sy'n cryfhau ymrwymiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fusnes. Mae gan y Cynulliad, fel deddfwrfa, ddyletswydd eisoes i ymgynghori â busnesau, sydd wedi helpu meithrin dull da o gyfnewid gwybodaeth a safbwyntiau. Fodd bynnag, wrth ymgynghori â chynrychiolwyr busnesau ac undebau llafur, daeth yn glir fod cefnogaeth gref i roi mwy o bwyslais ar fusnesau, a'r ddyletswydd i ymgynghori â busnesau, ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru. O ganlyniad, mae'r Mesur bellach yn cynnwys darpariaeth i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i Weinidogion Cymru gynhyrchu cynllun busnes yn gosod allan sut y bwriadwn ystyried buddiannau busnesau, boed fel cyflogwyr neu gyflogaethau, wrth arfer ein swyddogaethau, gan gynnwys sut y bwriadwn ymgynghori.

Bydd hyn yn dod â'n dyletswyddau o ran busnes yn nes at y rheini sydd eisoes yn berthnasol i lywodraeth leol, yn ogystal â'r sector gwirfoddol, a bydd yn adeiladu ar y berthynas lwyddiannus sydd wedi datblygu er 1999.

I gloi, rhoesom ein cefnogaeth lawn i'r gwelliannau hyn yn y Mesur, ac mae'n adlewyrchu'r berthynas dda rhyngom fel Llywodraeth a busnesau yng Nghymru. Mae'n adlewyrchu'r ddeialog sydd gennym, yn enwedig rhwng y CBI a'r TUC yng Nghymru, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Swyddfa Cymru.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 1: Dileu'r gair 'dryloyw' ym mhwynt 1.

Cynigiad welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwnt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar bwyllgorau pwnc perthnasol y Cynulliad i ystyried materion a godir yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ac i gyflwyno argymhellion i'r Gweinidog yn unol â hynny.

Cynigiad welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwnt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls for a reorganisation of the Business Partnership Council.

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make a written or oral Assembly statement on calls and demands made by the Business Partnership Council.

When the Assembly first debated the establishment of the Business Partnership Council, in order to meet the requirements of section 115 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, there was a great deal of optimism. It was exciting and innovative, and one of the parts of the Act that was included to satisfy the concerns of the business community. It meant that the business community could have input into policy, that it could offer scrutiny of some of the decision making, and that the Assembly could get exceptionally close to business, and, hopefully, develop an agenda suitable for business. The result was the Business Partnership Council.

That was what it was meant to be, but, in reality, it was the hoax of the time. The sad fact is that most members of the Business Partnership Council have grave concerns about the council and its purpose. Many issues are highlighted, raised and discussed, but they lead to nothing. Of course, you could not have a Welsh Assembly Government bound by any calls made by the Business Partnership Council, because that would not be a democratic forum. However, the discussions of the Business Partnership Council need to lead to something. They need to feed into the policy-making process, or, at least, the concerns aired deserve the right to be fed into the decision-making and the scrutiny agendas of the relevant subject committee.

The purpose of amendment 9 is to call for that shift. That would give the Business Partnership Council a much clearer purpose. Any concerns aired, raised and discussed could then feed into policy for proper promotion by the relevant subject committee, and for acceptance or rejection by the Minister. It would then have played its part in

yn galw am ad-drefnu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes.

Cynigïaf welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig neu lafar i'r Cynulliad ar alwadau a gofynion a wneir gan y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes.

Pan drafododd y Cynulliad sefydlu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes am y tro cyntaf, er mwyn bodloni gofynion adran 115 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yr oedd llawer iawn o optimistiaeth. Yr oedd yn gyffrous ac yn arloesol, ac yn un o'r rhannau yn y Ddeddf a gynhwyswyd i fodloni pryderon y gymuned fusnes. Yr oedd yn golygu y gallai'r gymuned fusnes gyfrannu at bolisïau, gallai graffu ar wneud rhai penderfyniadau, a gallai'r Cynulliad sefydlu perthynas agos iawn â busnesau, a'r gobaith oedd y gallai ddatblygu agenda addas ar gyfer busnesau. Y canlyniad oedd y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes.

Dyna'r bwriad, ond mewn gwirionedd twyll oedd y cyfan. Y ffaith drist yw bod y rhan fwyaf o aelodau'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yn pryderu'n fawr am y cyngor a'i ddiben. Tynnir sylw at nifer o faterion, cânt eu codi a'u trafod, ond nid ydynt yn arwain at ddim. Wrth gwrs, ni allech gael Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a oedd yn cael ei rhwymo gan unrhyw alwadau gan y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes, oherwydd na fyddai hynny'n fforwm democrataidd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i drafodaethau'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes arwain at rywbeth. Mae angen iddynt fwydo i mewn i'r broses gwneud polisïau, neu o leiaf mae'r pryderon a godir yn haeddu cael eu bwydo i mewn i'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau ac agendâu craffu'r pwyllgor pwnc perthnasol.

Diben gwelliant 9 yw galw am y newid hwnnw. Byddai hynny'n rhoi diben llawer cliriach i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes. Gallai unrhyw bryderon a gâi eu mynegi, eu codi a'u trafod gael eu bwydo wedyn i i mewn i bolisïau er mwyn eu hyrwyddo'n briodol gan y pwyllgor pwnc perthnasol, a'u derbyn neu eu gwrthod gan y Gweinidog.

the legislative, or pre-legislative, process.

That is part of the reason why attendance at the Business Partnership Council by its members is exceptionally low. Comments were made at the weekend about pointless meetings, and I have spoken to several business organisations and business people who attend the Business Partnership Council who feel that the council's meetings are among the meetings highlighted in those comments about Assembly Members, other organisations and officials wasting their time. At present, the council does not serve the purpose that it was intended to serve, nor does it meet all the hopes raised at the outset, when the Business Partnership Council was established to meet the requirement of section 115 of the Government of Wales Act 1998.

It is interesting to note that the Welsh Assembly Government claims in its motion to be transparent. However, the Minister goes on to highlight some task and finish groups, of which very few—and there are many of them—meet in public, publish their minutes, or use Nolan principles to appoint their members. Therefore, the use of the word 'transparent' does not stack up.

There are concerns among the members of the business partnership council, as I highlighted. One of those concerns has been made clear in a statement from the Confederation of British Industry, which recognises that some positive steps have been made by the Welsh Assembly Government, but says that, to date, the duty to consult with business has been undertaken in a patchy fashion. Explicitly, probably the biggest change for the Assembly was the merger of the quangos, and the statement highlights that hardly anyone was consulted in relation to that substantial decision. The Minister highlights the comments of the CBI and says that the Government is now setting up key performance indicators, but in making such a major shift in policy, he did not even have the courtesy to ask business what it thought. There was widespread objection to the decision and the announcement that the First Minister made in July 2004, but business,

Byddai wedi gwneud ei ran felly yn y broses ddeddfwriaethol, neu gyn-ddeddfwriaethol.

Mae hynny'n rhan o'r rheswm pam mae presenoldeb ei aelodau yn y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes yn eithriadol o isel. Gwnaed sylwadau ar y penwythnos am gyfarfodydd dibwrpas, ac yr wyf wedi siarad â nifer o sefydliadau busnes a phobl fusnes sy'n mynychu'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes ac sydd o'r farn fod cyfarfodydd y cyngor ymhlith y cyfarfodydd y tynnwyd sylw arnynt yn y sylwadau hynny fod Aelodau'r Cynulliad, sefydliadau a swyddogion eraill yn gwastraffu eu hamser. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r cyngor yn cyflawni'r diben a fwriadwyd iddo, ac nid yw ychwaith yn bodloni'r holl obeithion a godwyd ar y cychwyn, pan sefydlwyd y Cyngor Partneriaeth Busnes i fodloni gofyniad adran 115 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998.

Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn honni yn ei chynnig ei bod yn dryloyw. Fodd bynnag, aiff y Gweinidog ymlaen i dynnu sylw at rai grwpiau gorchwyl a gorffen. Ychydig iawn ohonynt—ac mae nifer ohonynt—sy'n cwrdd yn gyhoeddus yn cyhoeddi eu cofnodion neu'n defnyddio egwyddorion Nolan i benodi eu haelodau. Felly, nid yw defnyddio'r gair 'tryloyw' yn taro deuddeg.

Mae pryderon ymhlith aelodau'r cyngor partneriaeth busnes, fel y dywedais. Gwnaed un o'r pryderon hynny yn eglur mewn datganiad gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, sy'n cydnabod bod rhai camau cadarnhaol wedi'u cymryd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ond dywed fod y ddyletswydd i ymgynghori â busnesau hyd yma wedi ei chyflawni'n anghyson. Yn arbennig, mae'n debyg mai'r newid mwyaf ar gyfer y Cynulliad oedd uno'r cwangos, a dywed y datganiad nad ymgynghorwyd â bron neb am y penderfyniad pwysig hwnnw. Mae'r Gweinidog yn tynnu sylw at sylwadau'r CBI, a dywed fod y Llywodraeth bellach yn sefydlu dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol. Ond wrth wneud newid mawr o'r fath mewn polisi, nid oedd ganddo'r cwrtseisi hyd yn oed i ofyn i fusnesau am eu barn hwy. Bu gwrthwynebiad cyffredinol i'r penderfyniad ac i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog ym mis Gorffennaf 2004, ond

being business, accepted the reality and tried to move forward.

It would be interesting if there were any challenges as to whether the Minister met the obligations under section 115 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. Concerns have been highlighted by a large number of business communities with regard to some of the transport priorities—the Minister specifically mentioned transport. For example, business has called, for a long time, for an eastern link from Cardiff bay to the M4. Business has expressed concern about basic skills, but it seems as though the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Minister is not party to these discussions or consultations with business. If she is, she has not listened or acted.

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the First Minister to do everything in his power to make it more difficult for manufacturing jobs to be relocated overseas, by improving the rights of workers in Wales.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to publish its success rate in clawing back grant aid awarded to companies who have subsequently abandoned Wales.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to prioritise investment in indigenous businesses.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to pay particular attention to the food and food processing industries in light of recent job losses.

gan mai busnes yw busnes, derbyniwyd y realiti a cheisiwyd symud ymlaen.

Byddai'n ddiddorol pe bai unrhyw un yn herio'r cwestiwn a oedd y Gweinidog yn bodloni'r rhwymedigaethau o dan adran 115 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Tynnwyd sylw at bryderon gan nifer fawr o gymunedau busnes ynglŷn â rhai o'r blaenoriaethau trafndiaeth—soniodd y Gweinidog am drafndiaeth yn arbennig. Er enghraifft, mae busnesau wedi galw, ers amser hir, am ffordd gyswllt ddwyreiniol o fae Caerdydd i'r M4. Mae busnesau wedi mynegi pryder am sgiliau sylfaenol, ond ymddengys nad yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn rhan o'r trafodaethau neu'r ymgynghoriadau hyn â busnesau. Os yw'n rhan ohonynt, nid yw wedi gwranddo na gweithredu.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y Prif Weinidog i wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i'w gwneud yn fwy anodd i swyddi gweithgynhyrchu gael eu hadleoli dramor, trwy wella hawliau gweithwyr yng Nghymru.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi i ba raddau y mae wedi llwyddo i adfachu cymorth grant a ddyfarnwyd i gwmnïau a gefnodd ar Gymru wedi hynny.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i fuddsoddi mewn busnesau cynhenid.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi sylw penodol i'r diwydiannau bwyd a phrosesu bwyd, yn wyneb y colledion swyddi diweddar.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio at y gwelliannau hyn i ddechrau. Mae gwelliant 2 yn cyfeirio at hawliau gweithwyr a datganiadau a wnaed gan undebwyr yn Vauxhall a Glynebwy wrth iddynt golli swyddi. Mae siaradwyr o du'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud pethau tebyg yn y Siambr, sef bod angen cryfhau hawliau gweithwyr yn unol â rheolau a deddfau Ewropeaidd. Bod yn ddauwynebog yw hynny: mae Tony Blair, Gordon Brown a'r Plaid Lafur wedi sefyll yn erbyn rhoi'r un hawliau i'n gweithwyr ni â sydd gan weithwyr Ewrop. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa. Maent yn sefyll ysgwydd wrth ysgwydd â'r Torïaid ar y pwynt hwnnw. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd gwelliant 2 yn cael cefnogaeth lethol yr Aelodau Lafur heddiw, os mai dyna yw eu cred.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn cyfeirio at dryloywder, sef y galw i gyhoeddi'r ffigurau ar adfachu cymorth lle mae amodau'r grant wedi eu torri. Gan fod galw cyson am ddatgan pwy sy'n derbyn grantiau cyhoeddus, mae'n deg fod hynny yn digwydd hefyd.

O ran gwelliant 4, drwy ddechrau ar y cynllun Banc Gwybodaeth i Fusnes, mae'r Llywodraeth yn cydnabod mai creu ac atgyfnerthu busnesau cynhenid yw'r unig ffordd i wynebu gwyntoedd croesion globaleiddio. Dyna bregeth gyson Plaid Cymru ers cenedlaethau, ac yr ydym bellach yn gweld synnwyr a grym y ddadl, wrth i gwmniau tramor di-wreiddiau symud oddi yma. Yr oedd canolbwyntio ar dwf y cwmnïau hynny yn rhan o'n maniffesto ar gyfer yr etholiad diwethaf. Mae stori gwaith Continental Teves UK Cyf yng Nglynebwy yn enghraifft berffaith o hyn yn digwydd. Dyma waith proffidiol yng Nghymru yn gweld colli swyddi oherwydd bod y prif gwmini yn yr Almaen yn diogelu'r ffatri yn ei wlad ei hun. Problem Cymru erioed yw ein bod wedi creu cyfoeth dros eraill—o Fynydd Parys ym Môn i chwareli Eryri a phyllau glo a gweithfeydd haearn Clwyd a de Cymru. Hyd y daw chwildro i'r sefyllfa honno, byddwn ar drugaredd y gwyntoedd croesion hynny sydd yn chwythu o dro i dro.

Mae gwelliant 5 yn cyfeirio yn benodol at y diwydiant prosesu bwyd. 'Gwerth ychwanegol' fu'r gri ers blynnyddoedd, ond

I will refer to these amendments at the outset. Amendment 2 refers to workers' rights and statements made by unionists in Vauxhall and Ebbw Vale when jobs were lost there. Speakers on the Government side have made similar comments in the Chamber, that is, that workers' rights need to be strengthened in accordance with European rules and regulations. That is being two-faced: Tony Blair, Gordon Brown and the Labour Party have stood against giving to our workers the same rights as European workers have. That is the situation. They stand shoulder to shoulder with the Tories on that point. Therefore, I hope amendment 2 will have the overwhelming support of Labour Members today, if that is what they believe.

Amendment 3 refers to transparency, that is, the demand to publish figures on the claw-back of aid when grant conditions have been broken. As there is regular demand to declare who receives public grants, it is fair that that also happens.

On amendment 4, by starting with Knowledge Bank for Business, the Government recognises that creating and strengthening indigenous businesses is the only way to face the crosswinds of globalisation. Plaid Cymru has consistently preached that message for generations, and we are now seeing the sense and the force of the argument, as overseas companies without roots in Wales move away from here. Our manifesto for the last election included a focus on the growth of those companies. The story of the Continental Teves UK Ltd plant in Ebbw Vale is a perfect example of this happening. It is a profitable plant in Wales which is experiencing job losses because the German parent company is safeguarding the factory in its own country. Wales's problem always has been that we create wealth for others, from Parys Mountain in Anglesey to the quarries of Snowdonia, and the coal mines and iron works of Clwyd and south Wales. Until that situation is reversed, we will be at the mercy of the crosswinds that blow from time to time.

Amendment 5 refers specifically to the food-processing industry. 'Added value' has been the call for years, but with abattoirs and

wrth weld lladd-dai a hufenfeydd yn cau un ar ôl y llall, codir cwestiwn difrifol pa mor agos mae'r Llywodraeth at y busnesau hynny. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf weld nad yw'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros amaeth a chefn gwlad yma i wrando ar y sylwadau hyn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn am gynnal arolwg o'n lladd-dai—gallaf ddweud wrtho, am ddim, bod sefyllfa pob un yn fregus, a maint yr elw yn fach iawn neu'n absennol. Os wnaiff un arall gau, bydd yn ddamniol ac yn arwydd o fethiant llwyr y Gweinidog yn y maes.

4.10 p.m.

The motion that is before us today—a parliamentary equivalent, I suppose, to being savaged by a dead sheep—is pretty anodyne and harmless in its own little way, but is it accurate? The Minister has already referred to the response from the CBI, which represents one wing of the business world. It talks of the duty to consult being carried out in a rather patchy fashion. With reference to the decision about the WDA and the WTB, the response states that that was done with virtually no consultation with anyone—so much for section 115 and the duty to consult.

The proof of the pudding is in the eating and the Government, understandably, talks about the drop in unemployment and other, more favourable figures, but the wider picture is grim. The M4 corridor and east Wales have boomed, but is that due to the actions of the Welsh Assembly Government? The truth is that the figures for west Wales and the Valleys are dismal. I was told by Rhodri Morgan last year, 'You wait until next year: the rise in employment will start to show through'. Next year has arrived and it has not. Between 2002 and 2003, there was even been a slight drop in the GDP per capita figures. The percentage is still lower than the 1997-98 figure, which was 76 per cent of the average GDP per capita of the EU of 25 member states. This is pretty desperate stuff; it is a failure and there is no other word for it. The Welsh Assembly Government has let the people of rural Wales and the Valleys down, through ineptitude and pie-in-the-sky, wishful thinking.

creameries closing one after another, a serious question arises about how close the Government is to those businesses. I am sorry to see that the Minister with responsibility for agriculture and the countryside is not here to listen to these comments. The Minister talks of a survey of our abattoirs—I can tell him, free of charge, that the situation of each and every one of them is fragile, and the profit margins are either very small or non-existent. If another one closes, it will be damning and a sign of the Minister's total failure in this regard.

Mae'r cynnig sydd ger ein bron heddiw—sy'n cyfateb o'r safbwynt seneddol, dybiwn i, i gael eich llarpio gan ddafad farw—yn gymharol ddiniwed yn ei ffordd fach ei hun, ond a yw'n gywir? Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cyfeirio at yr ymateb gan y CBI, sy'n cynrychioli un adain o'r byd busnes. Mae'n cyfeirio at gyflawni'r ddyletswydd i ymgynghori mewn ffordd ddigon anghyson. O ran y penderfyniad am WDA a'r Bwrdd Croeso, mae'r ymateb yn dweud bod hynny wedi ei wneud heb ymgynghori â fawr neb—dyna werth adran 115 a'r ddyletswydd i ymgynghori.

Wrth ei flas mae profi pwddin, ac mae'r Llywodraeth, yn ddealladwy, yn siarad am y lleihad mewn diweithdra a ffigurau eraill mwy ffafriol, ond mae'r darlun ehangach yn ddiflas. Mae coridor yr M4 a dwyrain Cymru wedi ffynnu, ond a yw hynny o ganlyniad i weithredoedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Y gwir amdani yw bod y ffigurau ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn isel. Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan wrthyf y llynedd, 'Arhoswch chi tan y flwyddyn nesaf: byddwch yn dechrau gweld y cynnydd mewn cyflogaeth'. Mae'r flwyddyn nesaf wedi cyrraedd ac ni welsom hynny. Rhwng 2002 a 2003, bu hyd yn oed ychydig ostyngiad yn ffigurau'r CMC y pen. Mae'r ganran yn dal yn is na'r ffigur yn 1997-98, a oedd yn 76 y cant o'r CMC cyfartalog y pen o'r UE o 25 aelod-wladwriaeth. Mae hyn yn anobeithiol iawn; mae'n fethiant, ac nid oes gair arall amdano. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi siomi pobl Cymru wledig a'r Cymoedd, drwy anfedruswydd, breuddwyd gwrach a gobaith ofer.

I call on the Welsh Assembly Government to review its working methods and to support some of our amendments, where, according to its own statements, it has supported what is proposed in them in the past.

Michael German: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 6: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to put in place an early warning system for businesses facing job losses, so that the Welsh Assembly Government can take early action to help mitigate job losses.

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to implement a green jobs strategy.

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that the new Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks has the same cachet and brand appeal as the Welsh Development Agency.

The test of this motion lies in the following question: you may be meeting with business representatives, but are you listening to business? That is the crucial question that we need to ask of the Minister today. On the tests that have been set so far, the answer is 'at times'—sometimes 'yes' and sometimes 'no'. Listening to business does not mean that you have to agree with or support everything that it tells you; it means that you should consult and take the time and put in the effort to hear what business has to say.

The problem is that there are different interpretations of what consultation means. At its weakest, it could mean that you send out letters to people and expect them to write back to you. It might mean that you hear from a deputation, or have a meeting with

Galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu ei dulliau gweithredu a chefnogi rhai o'n gwelliannau lle mae, yn ôl ei datganiadau ei hun, wedi cefnogi'r hyn a gynigiwyd ynddynt yn y gorffennol.

Michael German: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 6: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sefydlu system rhybudd cynnar ar gyfer busnesau sy'n wynebu colledion swyddi, fel bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gallu gweithredu ar fyrder i helpu i liniaru colledion swyddi.

Cynigïaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i weithredu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd.

Cynigïaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod gan yr Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yr un statws ac apêl brand ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru.

Mae prawf y cynnig hwn yn y cwestiwn canlynol: efallai eich bod yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr busnes, ond a ydych yn gwrando ar fusnesau? Dyna'r cwestiwn hanfodol y mae'n rhaid i ni ei ofyn i'r Gweinidog heddiw. O ran y profion a osodwyd hyd yma, yr ateb yw 'ar adegau'—weithiau 'ydym' ac weithiau 'nac ydym'. Nid yw gwrando ar fusnesau'n golygu bod yn rhaid ichi gytuno â phopeth a ddywedant wrthy ch na'i gefnogi; mae'n golygu y dylech ymgynghori a chymryd amser a gwneud ymdrech i wrando ar yr hyn sydd gan fusnesau i'w ddweud.

Y broblem yw bod yna ddehongliadau gwahanol o'r hyn a olygir wrth ymgynghori. Ar y lleiaf, gallai olygu eich bod yn anfon llythyrau at bobl a disgwyl iddynt ysgrifennu'n ôl atoch. Gallai olygu eich bod yn clywed gan ddirprwyaeth, neu'n cyfarfod

people, or call people together to hear what they have to say. However, what matters is whether you can act to allay people's fears, so that they believe that their voice has been listened to.

The test in legislation is that the current Government of Wales Bill does not say that you have to consult with business in same way as you have to consult with the voluntary sector or local government. Why are there different sets of rules in the legislation for consultation with those two sectors and for consultation with business? Why is that difference in the consultation that we have with business, and that which we have with local government and the voluntary sector, being carried over into the new Act? Surely, it would be better to have consistency. Perhaps the Minister could tell us whether he sought that consistency in the changes that are now being made to the Bill and whether he believes that it is right that there should be an equality of action in that regard.

The business partnership council is the main vehicle for the relationship with business—if it is not, perhaps it should be. That should be a matter on which the Minister has to answer. That will change next year with the new Government of Wales Act and, if that is incorporated, it means that the Government will be responsible for carrying out the consultation with business and the business partnership council, and Members of the National Assembly who are not members of the Government will not be members of the business partnership council, as we are now. It has always appeared to me to be a strength that we can peer in and see what the Minister is doing. It also has, perhaps, a slightly restrictive aspect, in that the Minister is cautious in talking to business, knowing full well that he has opposition Members alongside him. Does the Minister approve of the change, which will be with us next year, whereby only the Government will be talking and only the Government will be seen at those meetings? Ought there not be another method by which business can talk to the National Assembly, be that through our committees or whatever?

â phobl, neu'n galw pobl at ei gilydd i glywed yr hyn sydd ganddynt i'w ddweud. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw a allwch weithredu i liniaru ofnau pobl, er mwyn iddynt gredu bod rhywun wedi gwrandao ar eu llais.

Y prawf mewn deddfwriaeth yw'r ffaith nad yw Mesur cyfredol Llywodraeth Cymru yn dweud bod yn rhaid ichi ymgynghori â busnes fel y mae'n rhaid ichi ymgynghori â'r sector gwirfoddol neu lywodraeth leol. Pam mae rheolau gwahanol yn y ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer ymgynghori â'r ddau sector hynny ac ar gyfer ymgynghori â busnesau? Pam mae'r gwahaniaeth hwnnw yn yr ymgynghori a wnawn â busnes, a'r ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol a'r sector gwirfoddol, yn cael ei drosglwyddo i'r Ddeddf newydd? Mae'n siŵr y byddai'n well cael cysondeb. Efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a geisiodd sicrhau'r cysondeb hwnnw yn y newidiadau sy'n cael eu gwneud yn awr yn y Mesur, ac a yw'n credu ei bod yn iawn y dylid cael cydraddoldeb gweithredu yn hynny.

Y cyngor partneriaeth busnes yw'r prif offeryn ar gyfer y berthynas â busnes—os nad felly, efallai y dylai fod. Dylai hwnnw fod yn fater y mae'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog ateb amdano. Bydd hynny'n newid y flwyddyn nesaf gyda Deddf newydd Llywodraeth Cymru, ac os caiff honno ei hymgorffori, mae'n golygu y bydd y Llywodraeth yn gyfrifol am gynnal yr ymgynghori â busnes a'r cyngor partneriaeth busnes, ac ni fydd Aelodau o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r Llywodraeth yn aelodau o'r cyngor partneriaeth busnes, fel sy'n digwydd yn awr. Mae'n ymddangos imi erioed yn arwydd o gryfder ein bod yn gallu syllu i mewn a gweld yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud. Mae i hynny efallai agwedd fymryn yn gyfyngedig hefyd am fod y Gweinidog yn ofalus wrth siarad â busnes, gan wybod yn dda fod Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wrth ei benelin. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cymeradwyo'r newid a ddaw i rym flwyddyn nesaf, lle mae'r Llywodraeth yn unig a fydd yn siarad a'r Llywodraeth yn unig a fydd i'w gweld yn y cyfarfodydd hynny? Oni ddylai fod ffordd arall i fusnesau allu siarad â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, boed drwy ein pwyllgorau neu beth bynnag?

I raise the matter of private sector match funding for European structural funds next year as a supplementary point because the Minister mentioned it in his opening remarks. It is a crucial and worrying point, as only the United Kingdom and the Netherlands have used private sector match funding with any consistency. Of course, the problem is that, if you do not secure a change of heart from the European Union so that we can continue to use match funding from the private sector, one or both of two things will be the net consequence when it comes to next year's round of European funding: either the intervention rate will fall, which means that the amount of public sector match funding will have to rise, and the amount of European funding will have to fall, with the consequence of a lack of connection with the business sector; or, alternatively, and perhaps more worrying, the National Assembly's block grant will have to put more match funding in without the secure funding coming from the UK Government. That is the other worrying aspect; that we may be forced to put in a bigger portion.

Our amendments call on the Assembly to put in place an early-warning system. I spoke of this when we had the statement on Continental Teves last week. If we have people who can recognise what is happening in the business community, and a system whereby we would hear and read more clearly, perhaps we will be more aware in the future.

On the implementation of a green jobs strategy, we know that there are green jobs to be had in Wales, and you could develop the promotion of that with business by having a green jobs network, which would be helpful.

Finally, there is the matter of the WDA. If you were listening, you would have heard what business said, but you did not ask its representatives, so you they could not say anything. It was meant to be a consultation exercise, but it did not happen, and business still feels sore about the abolition of the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board without even asking its views.

Yr wyf am sôn am arian cyfatebol y sector preifat ar gyfer cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd y flwyddyn nesaf fel pwynt ategol gan fod y Gweinidog wedi sôn amdano yn ei sylwadau agoriadol. Mae'n bwynt allweddol sy'n peri pryder, gan mai dim ond y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Iseldiroedd sydd wedi bod yn gyson wrth ddefnyddio arian cyfatebol y sector preifat. Wrth gwrs, y broblem yw os na allwn sicrhau y bydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn newid ei feddwl er mwyn inni allu parhau i ddefnyddio arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat, bydd yn golygu mai un neu'r ddau o ddau beth fydd y canlyniad net o'r cylch cyllid Ewropeaidd flwyddyn nesaf. Naill ai bydd y gyfradd ymyrryd yn gostwng, sy'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid i swm yr arian cyfatebol o'r sector preifat godi, a swm y cyllid Ewropeaidd ostwng gan achosi diffyg cysylltiad â'r sector busnes; neu fel arall, ac efallai'n fwy pryderus, bydd yn rhaid i grant bloc y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfrannu mwy o arian cyfatebol heb gyllid sicr gan Lywodraeth y DU. Dyna'r agwedd arall sy'n peri pryder; fel hynny galleu gael ein gorfodi i gyfrannu mwy.

Mae ein gwelliannau yn galw ar y Cynulliad i roi system rhybudd cynnar ar waith. Soniais am hyn pan gawsom y datganiad am Continental Teves yr wythnos diwethaf. Os oes gennym bobl sy'n gallu adnabod yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gymuned fusnes, a system lle y byddem yn clywed ac yn darllen yn gliriach, efallai y byddwn yn fwy ymwybodol yn y dyfodol.

O ran gweithredu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd, gwyddom fod swyddi gwyrdd ar gael yng Nghymru, a gallech ddatblygu hyrwyddo hynny gyda busnes drwy sefydlu rhwydwaith swyddi gwyrdd, a fyddai'n ddefnyddiol.

Yn olaf mae mater WDA. Os oeddech yn gwranddo, byddech wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedodd busnesau, ond ni wnaethoch ofyn i'w cynrychiolwyr, felly, ni allent ddweud dim. Ymgynghori ydoedd y bwriad, ond ni ddigwyddodd hynny, ac mae busnesau'n teimlo'n flin o hyd ynglŷn â diddymu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru heb hyd yn oed ofyn am eu safbwyntiau.

Christine Chapman: I have several points to raise, the first being that of the Welsh Assembly Government's influence on disability and business issues. I would be grateful if the Minister could clarify how his new department will work with the disability sector to unlock the huge potential that undoubtedly exists among people with disabilities. The potential is so often wasted. To take visual impairments, for example, I heard the quite shocking statistic quite recently that 75 per cent of people with a visual impairment and who are of working age are not in employment: that is unacceptable.

We know that the UK Government is currently carrying out a review of Remploy, and we await the outcome of this review. This is one example, I suppose, but there are many other ways in which we can support more disabled people into employment. I hope that the business partnership will give real consideration to this area.

On self-employment among disabled people, I met representatives of Disability Wales last week and discussed the Enter project, which provides free business support and advice to disabled people who wish to become self-employed. There is uncertainty about its future, but I would be interested in hearing of the Minister's commitment to pursue all available routes to work with the disability sector to promote employment opportunities for disabled people.

Another aspect of this debate is the attitude of businesses to disabilities, as there is definitely room for improvement in this regard. Again, further clarification on this would be welcome. For example, how are you seeking to raise awareness among employers of Jobcentre Plus's Access to Work scheme, which offers practical and financial support to employers who recruit disabled people?

4.20 p.m.

On social enterprises, I am aware that much work has been undertaken on developing and supporting social enterprises by my colleague Edwina Hart and the Deputy Minister, Huw Lewis, through the social enterprise strategy.

Christine Chapman: Mae gennyf nifer o bwyntiau i'w codi, ac mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â dylanwad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar faterion yn ymwneud ag anabledd a busnes. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog egluro sut y bydd ei adran newydd yn gweithio gyda'r sector anabledd i sicrhau cyflawni'r potensial enfawr sy'n bodoli yn ddi-au ymhlith pobl ag anableddau. Caiff y potensial ei wastraffu mor aml. Ystyriwn bobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg, er enghraifft. Clywais yr ystadegyn syfrdanol yn ddiweddar fod 75 y cant o'r bobl sydd â nam ar eu golwg ac sydd o oed gweithio yn ddi-waith: mae hynny'n annerbyniol.

Gwyddom fod Llywodraeth y DU yn cynnal adolygiad o Remploy ar hyn o bryd ac arhoswn am ganlyniad yr adolygiad hwn. Mae hon yn un enghraifft, dybiwn i, ond mae llawer ffordd arall y gallwn gefnogi mwy o bobl anabl i ddechrau gweithio. Gobeithio y bydd y bartneriaeth fusnes yn ystyried y maes hwn o ddifrif.

O ran hunan-gyflogaeth ymysg pobl anabl, cwrddais â chynrychiolwyr o Anabledd Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf a thrafod y prosiect Enter, sy'n rhoi cymorth a chynghor busnes am ddim i bobl anabl sydd am fod yn hunan-gyflogedig. Mae ansicrwydd ynglŷn â'i ddyfodol, ond byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed am ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i fynd ar drywydd yr holl lwybrau sydd ar gael i weithio gyda'r sector anabledd er mwyn hyrwyddo cyfleoedd cyflogaeth i bobl anabl.

Agwedd arall ar y ddadl hon yw agwedd busnes at anableddau, gan fod lle i wella yn sicr yn hyn o beth. Unwaith eto, byddwn y croesawu eglurhad pellach ar hyn. Er enghraifft, sut y byddwch yn ceisio cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth cyflogwyr o gynllun Mynediad at Waith y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, sy'n cynnig cymorth ymarferol ac ariannol i gyflogwyr sy'n recriwtio pobl anabl?

O ran mentrau cymdeithasol, gwn fod llawer o waith wedi ei wneud ar ddatblygu a chefnogi mentrau cymdeithasol gan fy nghyd-Aelod Edwina Hart a'r Dirprwy Weinidog, Huw Lewis, drwy'r strategaeth

I would be interested to know how the new Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks can forge links with the sector, particularly in the poorer parts of Wales. The social economy is an important part of growing an economy which has social and environmental benefits, and it needs to be supported accordingly.

The Assembly Government should continue its record of working very closely with trade unions, as they share many of the same values and ambitions, particularly the belief that high-quality public services are as relevant today as they have ever been. I declare an interest as secretary of the Unison Labour group. I am proud of the close relationship with the trade union movement in Wales, and it is important that policy is developed in partnership with the unions. We are unique in Wales in that we have a close relationship, and I am pleased that we have made such progress.

Mark Isherwood: I endorse the comments made about disabled people and social enterprise, and the recognition that customers are external and internal. As Henry Ford stated, if business was just making a profit, it would die, but if business does not make a profit, it will also die. Business is about getting things done. The Assembly Government must, therefore, not ignore businesses if we want Wales to improve its economic performance relative to the United Kingdom, and to create the wealth needed to achieve the social policy objectives which many of us share across the Chamber.

The economic environment in which Welsh business operates is largely dictated by UK Government policy. We must, therefore, be concerned about comments made at a meeting hosted by the Statistics Commission last week in London, which stated that Gordon Brown has presided over a catastrophic destruction of the public's confidence in official economic data, resulting from his redefinition of his rule for public balance of off-balance sheet liabilities and the measurement of public-sector productivity, where the current system simply allows Ministers to spin the numbers

mentrau cymdeithasol. Byddai gennyf ddi-ddordeb gwybod sut y gall yr Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau newydd greu cysylltiadau â'r sector, yn arbennig yn yr ardaloedd tlotaf yng Nghymru. Mae'r economi gymdeithasol yn rhan bwysig o ddatblygu economi lle mae buddiannau cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol, ac mae angen ei chefnogi yn unol â hynny.

Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad barhau ei record o weithio'n agos iawn gydag undebau llafur, gan fod ganddynt hwy hefyd nifer o'r un gwerthoedd ac uchelgeisiau, yn arbennig y gred fod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon mor berthnasol heddiw ag erioed. Datganaf fuddiant fel ysgrifennydd y grŵp Llafur Unsain. Yr wyf yn falch o'r berthynas agos â mudiad yr undebau llafur yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig datblygu polisi mewn partneriaeth ag undebau. Yr ydym yn unigryw yng Nghymru o ran bod gennym berthynas agos, ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd o'r fath.

Mark Isherwood: Cefnogaf y sylwadau a wnaed am bobl anabl a menter gymdeithasol, a'r gydnabyddiaeth fod cwsmeriaid yn allanol ac yn fewnol. Fel y dywedodd Henry Ford, os gwneud elw'n unig y mae busnes, bydd yn marw, ond os nad yw busnes yn gwneud elw, bydd hefyd yn marw. Mae busnes yn golygu cyflawni. Felly, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad beidio ag anwybyddu busnesau os ydym am i Gymru wella'i pherfformiad economaidd o'i chymharu â'r Deyrnas Unedig, a chreu'r cyfoeth sydd ei angen i gyflawni'r amcanion polisi cenedlaethol y mae nifer ohonom yn eu rhannu ar draws y Siambr.

Caiff yr amgylchedd economaidd lle mae busnesau yng Nghymru yn gweithredu ei bennu i raddau helaeth gan bolisi Llywodraeth y DU. Felly, rhaid inni bryderu am y sylwadau a wnaed mewn cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd gan y Comisiwn Ystadegau yr wythnos diwethaf yn Llundain, a oedd yn dweud mai Gordon Brown fu'n gyfrifol am ddinistrio hyder y cyhoedd mewn data economaidd swyddogol, oherwydd ei ailddiffiniad o'i reol ar gyfer cydbwysu'n gyhoeddus atebolrwyddau nad ydynt ar y fantolen, a mesur cynhyrchiant y sector cyhoeddus, lle y mae'r system bresennol yn

to fit their story. How familiar that sounds in the context of the Labour Welsh Assembly Government.

CBI Wales states—

Jeff Cuthbert: Presumably, it also sounds familiar to you, because the Conservative Government changed the basis of calculating the unemployed at least 23 times.

Mark Isherwood: I quote directly from a meeting held last week, mainly from a gentleman who ran the predecessor of the Office for National Statistics for 10 years during that period. He was stating how much worse matters had become since Labour took office in 1997.

Alun Cairns: It might help the Assembly if Jeff Cuthbert were to recognise that the changes made under the Conservative Government were based on recommendations by the International Labour Organisation.

Mark Isherwood: CBI Wales states—and we have heard much reference to that organisation—that the Assembly Government declares itself to be supportive of business, but that this is often the case, and that it does not often carry over into other policy areas or ministerial portfolios. As we have heard, the decision to scrap the WDA and the Wales Tourist Board without consultation called into question the Assembly Government's existing duty to consult with business. The Assembly Government's proposal to relocalise business rates in Wales disregards warnings from business that this would have a damaging impact on Welsh business, placing it as a disadvantage.

The CBI and TUC Wales are to be congratulated on successfully lobbying for an amended clause within the new Government of Wales Bill to strengthen the duty to consult with business, but the Assembly Government should also agree a scheme with the business sector setting out how it will work with business with measures for success. Assembly legislation should be

caniatáu i Weinidogion addasu'r rhifau i gydfynd â'u stori. Mae hynny'n swnio mor gyfarwydd yng nghyd-destun Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru.

Dywed CBI Cymru—

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n debyg ei fod hefyd yn swnio'n gyfarwydd i chi, gan fod y Llywodraeth Geidwadol wedi newid y sail ar gyfer cyfrif pobl ddi-waith o leiaf 23 o weithiau.

Mark Isherwood: Dyfynnaf yn uniongyrchol o gyfarfod a gynhaliwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, yn bennaf gan ŵr bonheddig a fu'n rhedeg y sefydliad a ragflaenodd y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol am 10 mlynedd yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Yr oedd yn dweud cymaint y mae pethau wedi gwaethygu ers i'r blaidd Lafur ddod i rym yn 1997.

Alun Cairns: Hwyrach y byddai o gymorth i'r Cynulliad pe bai Jeff Cuthbert yn cydnabod bod y newidiadau a wnaed o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn seiliedig ar argymhellion gan y Sefydliad Llafur Rhyngwladol.

Mark Isherwood: Dywed CBI Cymru—a chlywsom lawer o sôn am y sefydliad hwnnw—fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn datgan ei bod yn cefnogi busnes, ond bod hyn yn aml yn wir, ac nad yw'n aml yn ymestyn i feysydd polisi na phortffolios gweinidogion eraill. Fel yr ydym wedi'i glywed, yr oedd y penderfyniad i ddiddymu WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru heb ymgynghori yn amau dyletswydd bresennol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymgynghori â busnes. Mae cynnig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ail-leoli ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru yn diystyru rhybuddion gan fusnesau y byddai hyn yn cael effaith niweidiol ar fusnesau yng Nghymru, gan eu rhoi o dan anfantais.

Dylid llongyfarch y CBI a TUC Cymru am llobio'n llwyddiannus am gymal diwygiedig ym Mesur newydd Llywodraeth Cymru i atgyfnerthu'r ddyletswydd i ymgynghori â busnesau. Ond dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd gytuno ar gynllun gyda'r sector busnes i osod allan sut y bydd yn gweithio gyda busnesau ynghyd â ffyrdd i fesur llwyddiant. Dylai deddfwriaeth y

subject to an assessment of its impact on businesses, and there must be greater engagement with businesses during the pre-consultation stages, where the Assembly Government not only listens but also hears what business is saying.

The time for urgent action is now, with Wales having lower prosperity than any other UK country or region, despite European structural funding. That urgent action must involve the private sector in discussions over the next tranche of convergence funds. It must address the need to attract more Welsh people into entrepreneurial activities in Wales. At present, only 3.9 per cent of the Welsh-born population still resident in Wales is engaged in entrepreneurial activity in Wales, compared with 8 per cent of immigrants from England.

Unemployment has risen to 5 per cent over the year to March and there is now no-one in employment in one in five Welsh, working-age households. Productivity growth and business investment have fallen and the UK has slipped from fourth to thirteenth position in the international competitiveness league. As Cardiff Business School states, for much of the 1980s and early 1990s, Wales was one of the most successful regions in the EU in attracting inward investment. The UK was second only to the US internationally in terms of inward investment and 22 per cent of that came to Wales. However, Wales has now slipped from first to, I believe, ninth position in terms of inward investment into the United Kingdom. The hard truth is that Wales needs to create an additional 2,000 VAT registrations each year just to catch up with the UK average. Fewer than half of 737 Welsh businesses, according to a CBI Wales survey, have introduced new products or services over the previous three years. To achieve growth, we will also need a skilled economy but a third of young people working in Wales are not in any form of education or training and growing numbers leaving school are not going into work, education or training.

Cynulliad fod yn amodol ar asesiad o'i heffaith ar fusnesau, a dylid cael mwy o ymgysylltu â busnesau yn ystod y camau cyn ymgynghori, lle y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad nid yn unig yn gwranddo ond hefyd yn clywed yr hyn y mae busnesau yn ei ddweud.

Nawr yw'r amser i weithredu ar frys, gan fod gan Gymru lefel ffyniant is nag unrhyw wlad neu ranbarth arall yn y DU, er gwaethaf cyllid strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Rhaid i'r camau gweithredu brys hynny gynnwys y sector preifat mewn trafodaethau am y gyfran nesaf o gronfeydd cydgyfeirio. Rhaid iddynt fynd i'r afael â'r angen i ddenu mwy o Gymry i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau entrepreneuriaidd yng Nghymru. Ar hyn o bryd, 3.9 y cant yn unig o'r boblogaeth sy'n hanu o Gymru ac sy'n byw yng Nghymru o hyd sy'n cymryd rhan mewn gweithgarwch entrepreneuriaidd yng Nghymru, o'i chymharu ag 8 y cant o fewnfudwyr o Loegr.

Mae diweithdra wedi codi i 5 y cant yn ystod y flwyddyn hyd at fis Mawrth, a bellach mae un teulu o bob pump yng Nghymru o oed gweithio yn ddi-waith. Mae twf cynhyrchiant a buddsoddiadau busnes wedi gostwng, ac mae'r DU wedi gostwng o'r pedwerydd safle i'r trydydd safle ar ddeg yn y gynghrair cystadleurwydd rhyngwladol. Fel y dywed Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd, am y rhan fwyaf o'r 1980 a dechrau'r 1990au, Cymru oedd un o'r rhanbarthau mwyaf llwyddiannus yn yr UE o ran denu mewnfuddsoddiad. O ran mewnfuddsoddi, y DU oedd y rhanbarth gorau yn rhyngwladol, ar wahân i UDA, a deuai 22 y cant o hynny i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae Cymru wedi gostwng o'r safle cyntaf i'r nawfed safle, mi gredaf, o ran mewnfuddsoddiad i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Y gwir amdani yw fod angen i Gymru greu 2,000 o gofrestriadau TAW ychwanegol y flwyddyn i gyfateb i gyfartaledd y DU. Llai na hanner 737 o fusnesau yng Nghymru sydd wedi cyflwyno cynhyrchion neu wasanaethau newydd dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, yn ôl arolwg gan CBI Cymru. Er mwyn cael twf, bydd arnom angen economi fedrus, ond nid yw traean y bobl ifanc sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru yn cael unrhyw fath o addysg na hyfforddiant, ac mae niferoedd cynyddol yn gadael yr ysgol heb fod yn mynd i waith, addysg na hyfforddiant.

The most competitive regions of the United Kingdom are those that are least dependent on the public sector and we cannot sustain a situation in Wales where public expenditure represents almost 60 per cent of gross domestic product, shoring up the economy as manufacturing employment has plummeted to be replaced by retail jobs in out-of-town shopping centres. Record levels of investment in public services cannot continue indefinitely. There is an urgent need for Wales to stimulate the private sector to create quality jobs. Without that, the risk is that Wales will not only fail to close the prosperity gap but will also lose the competitive edge that many of our private businesses have developed during the last two decades.

Y rhanbarthau mwyaf cystadleuol yn y Deyrnas Unedig yw'r rheini sy'n dibynnu llai ar y sector cyhoeddus, ac ni allwn gynnal sefyllfa yng Nghymru lle mae gwariant cyhoeddus yn cyfateb i bron 60 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, gan gynnal yr economi wrth i gyflogaeth mewn gweithgynhyrchu ostwng a chael ei disodli gan swyddi manwerthu mewn canolfannau siopa y tu allan i'r trefi. Ni all y lefelau uchaf erioed o fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus barhau yn ddiidiwedd. Mae angen i Gymru ysgogi'r sector preifat i greu swyddi o safon, a hynny ar frys. Heb hynny, y perygl yw y bydd Cymru nid yn unig yn methu â chau'r bwlch o ran ffyniant, ond y bydd hefyd yn colli'r fantais gystadleuol y mae nifer o'n busnesau preifat wedi'i datblygu yn ystod y ddau ddegawd diwethaf.

The bottom line is that, if efficient Government is like a traditional pub serving quality ale at a fair price, this Welsh Assembly Government is like a theme pub serving sub-standard beer, sticking in a coloured umbrella and charging double the price.

Y gwir amdani yw hyn: os yw Llywodraeth effeithlon fel tafarn draddodiadol sy'n gwerthu cwrw o safon am bris teg, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel tafarn thema sy'n gwerthu cwrw is na'r safon, yn ei weini ag ymbarél lliwgar gan godi dwywaith y pris.

Leighton Andrews: I can see that Mark has been to the Campaign for Real Ale reception. I declare an interest in that my wife is the CBI representative on the programme monitoring committee for Objective 1.

Leighton Andrews: Gallaf weld bod Mark wedi bod yn nerbyniad yr Ymgyrch dros Gwrw Go Iawn. Yr wyf yn datgan buddiant gan mai fy ngwraig yw cynrychiolydd CBI ar bwyllgor monitro'r rhaglen ar gyfer Amcan 1.

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Alun Cairns: A ildiwch?

Leighton Andrews: It was only a harmless aside, but I will give way.

Leighton Andrews: Sylw diniwed oedd hynny, ond fe ildiaf.

Alun Cairns: I seek clarification on the point about the CAMRA reception. Will you pledge your support to CAMRA because of the excellent support that it has given Welsh industry and will you congratulate the makers of award-winning beers?

Alun Cairns: Ceisiaf esboniad ar y pwynt am dderbyniad CAMRA. A wnewch addo cefnogi CAMRA oherwydd y gefnogaeth ardderchog y mae wedi'i rhoi i'r diwydiant yng Nghymru, ac a wnewch longyfarch y gwneuthurwyr sydd wedi ennill gwobrau ?

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. So far, things have been in order, but they are likely to be out of order if this continues.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Hyd yn hyn, mae pethau wedi bod mewn trefn, ond maent yn debygol o fynd allan o reolaeth os bydd hyn yn parhau.

Leighton Andrews: I am certainly happy to endorse award-winning Welsh ales. While we are on the subject, I also congratulate Councillor Jeff Williams of the Baglan Hotel in Treherbert for organising a recent meeting to ensure the re-launch of CAMRA in the Rhondda.

Perhaps I can now get back to the debate. The whole process of consultation in terms of business has been one of the unique elements that the Assembly has had from the beginning. I remember the debates on the Government of Wales Bill when those clauses were being lobbied for. It was a tribute to the business community in Wales that, during the referendum campaign, unlike in 1979, business did not come out in any organised way and oppose devolution, but supported it. Perhaps that has been reflected in the clause that was put into that Bill and in the fact that the CBI, in its briefing today, said that, to the Assembly's credit, the CBI is able to access Ministers and AMs easily, at often quite short notice, and on a range of policy issues. That is a recognition that, in general terms, that relationship is working well. [*Interruption.*]

I appreciate that it says elsewhere in the briefing that the relationship across the Government as a whole is patchy. I am not entirely surprised at that. I would expect it to be stronger in the area of economic development than in other areas of the Government's portfolio because the relationships are on a more ongoing basis. There are areas where the relationship with business needs to grow, and the skills agenda is a particularly important element of that.

It is also worth saying that, in its briefing, the CBI recognises that there has been significant progress in transport, which is an area of great concern to business. That is also important. However, with some fairly notable exceptions among business organisations and companies, I do not believe that business in general makes the most of the opportunities that it has to meet Assembly Members, to provide us with briefings on key issues.

4.30 p.m.

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn sicr yn fodlon ardystio cwrw Cymreig sydd wedi ennill gwobrau. Gan ein bod yn sôn am hynny, hoffwn longyfarch hefyd y Cynghorydd Jeff Williams o Westy Baglan yn Nhreherbert am drefnu cyfarfod yn ddiweddar i sicrhau ail-lansio CAMRA yn Rhondda.

Efallai y caf ddychwelyd yn awr at y ddadl. Mae'r holl broses ymgynghori o ran busnes wedi bod yn un o'r elfennau unigryw yn y Cynulliad o'r cychwyn. Cofiaf y dadleuon ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru pan oedd lobïo am y cymalau hynny. Yr oedd yn deyrnged fawr i'r gymuned fusnes yng Nghymru nad oedd busnesau, yn ystod ymgyrch y refferendwm, yn gwrthwynebu datganoli mewn ffordd drefnus, yn wahanol i 1979, ond yn ei gefnogi. Efallai fod hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu yn y cymal a gynhwyswyd yn y Mesur a bod y CBI mewn gwirionedd yn ei sesiwn friffio heddiw wedi dweud, er clod i'r Cynulliad, fod y CBI yn gallu troi at Weinidogion ac ACau yn hawdd, ar fyr rybudd weithiau, ac ar amrywiaeth o faterion polisi. Mae hynny'n gydnabyddiaeth fod y berthynas honno'n gweithio'n dda ar y cyfan. [*Ymyriad.*]

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod nodyn mewn man arall yn y sesiwn friffio fod y berthynas ar draws y Llywodraeth gyfan yn anghyson. Nid yw hynny'n syndod mawr imi. Byddwn yn disgwyl iddi fod yn gryfach ym maes datblygu economaidd nag mewn meysydd eraill ym mhorthffolio'r Llywodraeth, gan fod y berthynas ar sail fwy parhaus. Mae yna feysydd lle y mae angen i'r berthynas â busnes dyfu, ac mae'r agenda sgiliau yn elfen arbennig o bwysig yn hynny.

Mae'n werth dweud hefyd fod y CBI, yn ei sesiwn friffio, yn cydnabod bod cynnydd sylweddol wedi digwydd mewn trafndiaeth, sy'n faes sy'n peri cryn bryder i fusnesau. Mae hynny hefyd yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, heblaw am rai eithriadau cymharol nodedig ymysg sefydliadau a chwmnïau busnes, nid wyf yn credu bod busnesau ar y cyfan yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd sydd ganddynt i gwrdd ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad, i roi sesiynau briffio inni ar faterion allweddol.

As a member of the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee, it is rare for me to receive briefings from business in advance. Sometimes I receive something from the CBI and occasionally from one or two other organisations, but it is a rare occurrence to be briefed in advance of meetings. That is not the situation that pertains in more established parliamentary institutions. I hope that the formal and informal engagement of business with the Assembly will deepen in the future.

I congratulate the CBI and the TUC on their lobbying for a new clause in the Government of Wales Bill, which we discussed in the Committee on the Government of Wales Bill. It was one of the few issues on which there was unity around the table, in that we recognised the proposals that were coming forward. I am glad that that clause is there, as it strengthens the Assembly Government's commitment to business and requires it to develop a business scheme.

Another area in which the business community has been successful in influencing Government policy is the development of key performance indicators for the merged departments, which resulted from the quangos coming in. Those KPIs were worked up by members of the CBI in discussion with the Welsh Assembly Government, and they are to be welcomed.

My colleague, Christine Chapman, referred to Remploy. I visited its factory in Porth on Friday. The company now runs a lot of innovative initiatives. The factory in Dinas, for example, is now engaged in e-cycling and in the management of IT assets for a wide range of well-known UK companies and the Department for Work and Pensions. I encourage all Assembly Ministers to think about using the factory for e-cycling when they have data storage issues that need to be taken care of. I hope that Ministers will look into that as a viable operation. The company is also involved in recycling white goods. There has been a step change in the quality of the work that is going on in Remploy factories. In the past, people have often had a patronising attitude towards Remploy and the kind of work that it has done. However, this facility is undertaking high-value-added

Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, anaml y byddaf yn cael gwybodaeth gan fusnesau ymlaen llaw. Weithiau caf rywbeth gan y CBI a chan un neu ddau sefydliad arall yn achlysurol, ond anaml iawn y caf fy mriaffio cyn cyfarfodydd. Nid dyna'r sefyllfa mewn sefydliadau seneddol mwy sefydledig. Gobeithio y bydd ymwneud ffurfiol ac anffurfiol busnesau â'r Cynulliad yn dwysáu yn y dyfodol.

Hoffwn longyfarch y CBI a'r TUC ar eu gwaith lobïo i gael cymal newydd ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, a drafodwyd gennym yn y Pwyllgor ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr oedd yn un o'r ychydig faterion lle yr oedd unfrydedd yn yr ystyr ein bod yn cydnabod y cynigion a gyflwynwyd. Yr wyf yn falch fod y cymal hwnnw yno, gan ei fod yn atgyfnerthu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fusnes ac yn galw arni i ddatblygu cynllun busnes.

Un maes arall lle mae'r pwyllgor busnes wedi bod yn llwyddiannus wrth ddylanwadu ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth yw datblygu dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol ar gyfer yr adrannau sydd wedi'u huno, o ganlyniad i ymgorffori'r cwangos. Lluniwyd y dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol hynny gan aelodau'r CBI drwy drafod gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a dylid eu croesawu.

Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Christine Chapman, at Remploy. Ymwelais â'i ffatri yn y Porth ddydd Gwener. Mae'r cwmni'n trefnu nifer o fentrau arloesol erbyn hyn. Er enghraifft, mae'r ffatri yn Ninas yn ymwneud ag e-gylchu, ac mae'n rheoli asedau TG ar gyfer amrywiaeth eang o gwmnïau adnabyddus yn y DU a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau. Hoffwn annog holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad i ystyried defnyddio'r ffatri ar gyfer e-gylchu pan fydd ganddynt broblemau storio data i'w datrys. Gobeithio y bydd Gweinidogion yn ystyried hynny fel gweithrediad ymarferol. Mae'r cwmni hefyd yn ymwneud ag ailgylchu nwyddau gwynion. Bu newid sylweddol yn ansawdd y gwaith a wneir yn ffatrioedd Remploy. Yn y gorffennol yr oedd gan bobl yn aml agwedd nawddoglyd tuag at Remploy a'r math o waith a wneid ganddo. Fodd bynnag, mae'r

work, which I hope will be encouraged.

Finally, we talk a lot about partnership and consultation in this institution. Partnership has to be more than just dialogue and meetings to discuss issues; it has to be embedded in practice across Government. That is an issue that the CBI and other agencies have validly raised.

Eleanor Burnham: I attended the north Wales CBI dinner last week, and it is obvious that there is much work for the Government to do to assist businesses, and small businesses in particular. Co-operation between Government and business is vital in identifying and targeting areas of growth within the economy in order to provide assistance for small businesses to expand further. Another reason why the Welsh Liberal Democrats are calling for a green jobs strategy is that there is much scope for growth within the renewable energy and recycling sectors.

Co-operating with the business sector in terms of education and training is also key. Education should include further education, which, despite the Government's assertions, is having a lean time in Wales. It is important culturally and socially, and is crucial in equipping people with the skills to embark on their careers and to be ready to enter the workplace. Businesses have qualification requirements in terms of the people whom they wish to employ, and they sometimes find that the education system is not equipping would-be employees with the skills that they want and need. It is important that the focus on co-operation with business includes the trade unions, and the social economy, including the co-operative and community enterprise sectors, as well as the voluntary sector, which I know, from various meetings that I have had, feels slightly left out in the cold in terms of funding. All these are part of a greater economic whole, which takes into account the health and wellbeing of employees and their communities.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Mae gennyf

cyfleuster hwn yn gwneud gwaith sy'n ychwanegu gwerth sylweddol, a gobeithio y caiff hyn ei annog.

Yn olaf, yr ydym yn sôn llawer am bartneriaeth ac ymgynghori yn y sefydliad hwn. Rhaid i bartneriaeth olygu mwy na deialog a chyfarfodydd i drafod materion; rhaid iddi fod yn rhan annatod o arferion ar draws y Llywodraeth. Mae hwn yn fater sydd wedi ei godi'n briodol gan y CBI ac asiantaethau eraill.

Eleanor Burnham: Bûm yng nghinio CBI y gogledd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae'n amlwg bod llawer o waith i'r Llywodraeth ei wneud i gynorthwyo busnesau, a busnesau bach yn arbennig. Mae'n hanfodol bod y Llywodraeth a busnesau yn cydweithredu i nodi a thargedu meysydd twf yn yr economi er mwyn darparu cymorth i fusnesau bach ehangu ymhellach. Un rheswm arall pam y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn galw am strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd yw bod llawer o gyfle am dwf yn y sectorau ynni adnewyddadwy ac ailgylchu.

Mae cydweithredu â'r sector busnes o ran addysg a hyfforddiant hefyd yn allweddol. Dylai addysg gynnwys addysg bellach, sy'n mynd drwy gyfnod anodd yng Nghymru er gwaethaf honiadau'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n bwysig yn ddiwylliannol ac yn gymdeithasol, ac yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod gan bobl y sgiliau i gychwyn eu gyrfaoedd ac i fod yn barod i gychwyn yn y gweithle. Mae gan fusnesau ofynion cymwysterau o ran y bobl y maent am eu cyflogi, ac weithiau byddant yn gweld nad yw'r system addysg yn darparu'r sgiliau y mae eu heisiau a'u hangen ar ddarpar gyflogeion. Mae'n bwysig i'r ffocws ar gydweithredu â busnesau gynnwys yr undebau llafur, a'r economi gymdeithasol, gan gynnwys y sectorau mentrau cydweithredol a chymunedol, yn ogystal â'r sector gwirfoddol. Gwn, o amrywiol gyfarfodydd a gefais, fod y sector gwirfoddol yn teimlo allan ohoni o ran cyllid. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn rhan o gyfanrwydd economaidd, sy'n cymryd i ystyriaeth iechyd a lles cyflogeion a'u cymunedau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I

ddiddordeb etholaethol penodol yng nghydestun cynnwys gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Cyfeiriwyd at hyn yn gynharach gan Alun Ffred Jones. Yr ydym yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi sylw penodol i'r diwydiannau bwyd a phrosesu bwyd am fod nifer o swyddi wedi eu colli yn y sector hwn yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf. Credaf fod Alun Ffred wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith bod dyfodol nifer o gwmnïau yn y sector hwn yn hynod o fregus a bod nifer o resymau am hynny. Y rheswm cyntaf yw bod nifer o ladd-dai yn gwneud ychydig iawn o elw erbyn hyn ac mae prisiau uchel tanwydd wedi achosi costau ychwanegol, yn ogystal â'r rheoliadau newydd ar wastraff. Mae nifer o ffactorau eraill hefyd yn effeithio ar hyn, fel mewnfurion a'r prisiau isel mae'r archfarchnadoedd yn eu mynnu bellach gan y lladd-dai a'r ffermwyr.

Gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog ystyried dau beth. Yn gyntaf, heb unrhyw amheuaeth, mae angen help tymor byr ar y sector oherwydd, pe baem yn colli mwy o ladd-dai yng Nghymru, byddem yn colli un arf pwysig arall wrth werthu nwyddau, sef eu bod wedi eu cynhyrchu a'u lladd yng Nghymru ac felly yn gallu cael eu marchnata fel cig o Gymru. Mae'n hynod o bwysig bod y Gweinidog yn ystyried yn ddwys iawn yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud i roi rhywfaint o gymorth i gwmnïau yn y sector. Mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi colli 500 o swyddi yn y sector hwn yn y misoedd diwethaf yng ngorllewin a gogledd Cymru wedi tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd y sector i'r ardaloedd hynny ac wedi dangos pa mor fregus y gall yr economi wledig fod ar adegau.

Yn ail, pan fydd yr economi wledig mor ddibynnol ar un sector, mae hi'n anodd iawn cael swyddi mewn diwydiannau eraill oherwydd y problemau yn ymwneud â dod o hyd i waith amgen. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried sut all y Llywodraeth gynorthwyo ardaloedd gwledig yn y gorllewin a'r gogledd i ehangu eu sylfaen economaidd.

Mae hynny'n mynd â ni at Amcan 1. Bu siom aruthrol ar ôl cyhoeddiad y ffigurau diweddaraf gan Eurostat. Deallaf pam nad yw'r Gweinidog am gael trafodaeth am hynny yn y Cynulliad. Maent yn dangos, unwaith yn rhagor, fethiant y Llywodraeth i

have a specific constituency interest that relates to the content of amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Alun Ffred Jones referred to this point earlier. We call on the Government to pay particular attention to the food and food processing industries in light of the fact that many jobs have been lost in this sector over the last few months. I believe Alun Ffred referred to the fact that a number of companies in this sector face an uncertain future, and there are many reasons for that. The first reason is that many abattoirs now have very small margins, and the high cost of fuel has been an additional burden, along with the new regulations on waste. A number of other factors impact on this, such as imports and the low prices that the supermarkets now demand from abattoirs and farmers.

We ask the Minister to consider two things. First, without a doubt, the sector needs short-term assistance, because if we lose more abattoirs in Wales we will lose another important tool in the sale of the product, which is that it had been produced and slaughtered in Wales and could therefore be marketed as Welsh meat. It is exceptionally important for the Minister to consider carefully what needs to be done to give some assistance to companies in this sector. The fact that we have lost 500 jobs in this sector over the past few months in west and north Wales has highlighted the importance of the sector to those areas and how vulnerable the rural economy can be.

Secondly, when the rural economy is so dependent on one sector, it is difficult to secure jobs in other industries because of the problems of finding alternative work. I ask the Minister to consider how the Government can assist rural businesses in the north and the west to broaden their economic base.

That leads me naturally on to Objective 1. There was massive disappointment following the publication of the latest Eurostat figures. I understand why the Minister does not wish to have a discussion on this in the Assembly. They demonstrate, once again, the

fynd i'r afael â chodi lefelau GDP yn y gorllewin ac yn y Cymoedd. Nid oeddem yn disgwyl i'r ffigur fynd i lawr rhwng 2002 a 2003 o 77 i 75.8. Fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, mae'n is na'r ffigur yn 1997 pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur i rym yn Llundain. Mae angen inni ailedrych ar y ffordd y defnyddir yr arian cydgyfeirio yn y rownd nesaf. Mae'r cwestiwn sut mae'r cynllun hwn yn cael ei ariannu yn dychwelyd i'r agenda. Yr wyf wedi cwestiynu'r Prif Weinidog yn aml iawn ar bwnc arian cyfatebol, a gwyddom—

Jeff Cuthbert: I am grateful to you for giving way. I am sure that it is no surprise to you that the way in which the convergence funding will be used will be considered very carefully, and shortly. However, in terms of the current funding, have you spoken to many of the partnerships that put forward and develop many good projects that have clearly benefited local people? Criticism is heaped upon them, but people do not look at the positive things that are being done.

4.40 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The problem is not with the partnerships, but with the strategy adopted by this Government. I hear constant criticism from business about the way in which this has been done. When I visited a company in my constituency about two years ago, I was asked how on earth it could access Objective 1 money. I was told that the company was not able to access the money because of the labyrinthine way in which the Government had organised the system. Jeff may have an opportunity to come back, if he wants to contribute further to the debate. However, that is my experience.

To return to the issue of match funding, I recognise that the Government keeps saying that no worthwhile project will be lost and that it will look again at the way in which match funding is used. However, let us be clear about this: under the existing round, by 2007, £450 million will be taken out of education and health expenditure in order to secure match funding. In other words, had that money not been used for match funding, it would have been available to education and health. If you look at how education and

Government's failure to raise GDP levels in west Wales and the Valleys. We did not expect the figure to go down between 2002 and 2003 from 77 to 75.8. As Alun Ffred said, it is lower than it was in 1997 when the Labour Government came to power in London. We need to look again at the way in which convergence funds are used in the next round. The question of how this scheme is funded comes back onto the agenda. I have questioned the First Minister frequently on the matter of match funding, and we know—

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad ydych yn synnu y bydd y modd y defnyddir yr arian cydgyfeirio yn cael ei ystyried yn ofalus iawn, ac yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, o ran yr ariannu presennol, a ydych wedi siarad â nifer o'r partneriaethau sydd wedi cyflwyno a datblygu nifer o brosiectau da sy'n amlwg wedi bod o fudd i bobl leol? Cânt eu beirniadu'n llym, ond nid yw pobl yn edrych ar y pethau cadarnhaol sy'n cael eu gwneud.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid y partneriaethau yw'r broblem, ond y strategaeth a fabwysiadwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon. Clywaf feirniadaeth gyson gan fusnesau ynghylch y modd y gwnaed hyn. Pan ymwelais â chwmmi yn fy etholaeth tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, gofynnwyd i mi sut ar y ddaear y gallai gael gafael ar arian Amcan 1. Dywedwyd wrthyf nad oedd y cwmni'n gallu cael gafael ar yr arian oherwydd y modd dryslyd yr oedd y Llywodraeth wedi trefnu'r system. Efallai y caiff Jeff gyfle i ddod yn ôl, os yw'n dymuno cyfrannu ymhellach at y drafodaeth. Fodd bynnag, dyna fy mhrofiad i.

I ddychwelyd at arian cyfatebol, yr wyf yn cydnabod fod y Llywodraeth yn dweud o hyd na chaiff unrhyw brosiect gwerth chweil ei golli ac y bydd yn ailedrych ar y ffordd y defnyddir arian cyfatebol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni fod yn glir ynghylch hyn: o dan y cylch presennol, erbyn 2007 caiff £450 miliwn ei dynnu o'r gwariant ar addysg ac iechyd er mwyn sicrhau arian cyfatebol. Hynny yw, pe na byddai'r arian hwnnw wedi ei ddefnyddio fel arian cyfatebol, byddai wedi bod ar gael i addysg ac iechyd. Os

health spending is organised, you will see that we are slowly but surely seeing the effect of the Barnett squeeze on these areas and are, therefore, unable to deliver the services that we want to deliver. I urge the Government to look again at match funding.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): Despite what has been said, I think that we, as a Government, have a very good and commendable record on engagement with the business community since 1999. There are colleagues here this afternoon from other business organisations, and at least one from the Federation of Small Businesses. Through formal and informal methods of consultation, and through structured and unstructured channels of communication, we have established a good system of consultation. Leighton Andrews's speech was well made. This is not just about dialogue and discussion: it is also about action. As I demonstrated in my opening remarks, we have been successful in engaging with the business community, and in a practical way. For example, we have established the Wales social partners unit. Business often complains, with some justification, that it is constantly asked for its views on a wide range of policy areas, and, with fairly limited resources in terms of research, it is an issue for it to be able to respond to all consultations. Nevertheless, through the Wales social partners unit, we have done a lot of good work and have been successful in helping business to influence decisions on European structural funding, not least of which relates to the ability to access that funding.

We also have a good record on engagement with the private sector in terms of delivery. We again heard Alun Ffred's mantra—like, presumably, Goebbels, he seems to believe that if you repeat something often enough it becomes the received wisdom. If you look at the employment record since 1999, west Wales and the Valleys has outperformed the rest of Wales in terms of reduction in unemployment and employment growth, and in terms of earnings growth. I knew that the leader of the opposition would bang on about

edrychwch ar y ffordd y mae gwariant ar addysg ac iechyd yn cael ei drefnu, fe welwch ein bod yn araf ond yn sicr yn gweld effaith gwasgfa Barnett ar y meysydd hyn, ac felly nid ydynt yn gallu darparu'r gwasanaethau yr ydym am iddynt eu darparu. Anogaf y Llywodraeth i edrych eto ar arian cyfatebol.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Er yr hyn a ddywedwyd, credaf fod gennym ni, fel Llywodraeth, record dda iawn a chlodwiw o ymgysylltu â'r gymuned fusnes er 1999. Mae unigolion yma heddiw o sefydliadau busnes eraill, ac o leiaf un o'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach. Drwy ddulliau ffurfiol ac anffurfiol o ymgynghori, a thrwy sianeli cyfathrebu wedi a heb eu strwythuro, yr ydym wedi sefydlu system dda o ymgynghori. Cyflwynodd Leighton Andrews ei araith yn dda. Nid deialog a thrafodaeth yn unig sy'n bwysig yn hyn: rhaid gweithredu hefyd. Fel y dangosais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, buom yn llwyddiannus wrth ymgysylltu â'r gymuned fusnes, a hynny mewn ffordd ymarferol. Er enghraifft, sefydlwyd uned partneriaid cymdeithasol Cymru. Bydd busnesau'n cwyno'n aml, gyda chryn gyfiawnhad, eu bod yn cael eu holi'n gyson am eu safbwyntiau am amrywiaeth eang o feysydd polisi, a chydag adnoddau cymharol gyfyngedig ar gyfer ymchwil maent yn cael anhawster i ymateb i bob ymgynghoriad. Er hynny, drwy uned partneriaid cymdeithasol Cymru yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer o waith da ac wedi llwyddo i helpu busnesau i ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau am arian strwythurol Ewropeaidd, yn anad dim mewn cysylltiad â gallu cael yr arian hwnnw.

Mae gennym record dda hefyd o ran ymwneud â'r sector preifat o ran darparu. Clywsom fantra Alun Ffred unwaith eto—fel Goebbels, mae'n debyg, mae fel pe bae'n credu os byddwch yn ailadrodd rhywbeth ddigon o weithiau y bydd pobl yn ei gredu. Os edrychwch ar y record o ran cyflogaeth er 1999, mae'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd wedi perfformio'n well na gweddill Cymru o ran gostyngiad mewn diweithdra a thwf mewn cyflogaeth, ac o ran twf mewn enillion. Gwyddwn y byddai arweinydd yr wrthblaid

GVA, but he forgets to mention that these figures are several years old. The Conservatives like to refer to the past, and I often think that they live in the past. Ieuan wants to talk about figures that are three or four years old. However, I am talking about delivery over a longer period, since 1999. You need to look at indicators such as employment growth, average weekly earnings and gross disposable household income. Over the past few years, and certainly since 1999, Wales has done extremely well and has outperformed the rest of the UK in many areas, and west Wales and the Valleys have done better than that overall performance. We have a good record.

The point about the fact that we, as a Government, did not consult business or other stakeholders on the abolition of the ASPBs has been made on several occasions. We have said, 'Yes, we accept the fact that we did not consult'. However, we felt that that was a point of principle. I have said that I have had nearly 100 meetings now with business organisations about the shape and culture of the new organisation, and how it will deliver services. From that moment in July 2004, we have engaged significantly with business. My department, for example, reflects the fruits of that consultation.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You refer to the point of principle—what is it?

Andrew Davies: We felt, as a point of principle, that those services should be directly accountable and delivered by the Government, and directly accountable for delivering the services provided by the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, Education and Learning Wales and others. That was a fundamental point of principle. Some of us remember that famous day when you stood up and said, 'We will not be happy until every quango in Wales has been abolished'. We remember it, even if you choose not to. That is in sharp contrast to what is happening with your colleagues north of the border, where, I understand, the Scottish nationalists are now following our

yn brolio am y GYC, ond anghofiodd grybwyll bod y ffigurau hyn wedi eu casglu lawer blwyddyn yn ôl. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn hoff o gyfeirio at y gorffennol, a chredaf yn aml eu bod yn byw yn y gorffennol. Mae Ieuan am drafod ffigurau a gasglwyd dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi'n sôn am ddarpariaeth dros gyfnod hwy, er 1999. Mae angen ichi edrych ar ddangosyddion fel twf mewn cyflogaeth, enillion wythnosol cyfartalog ac incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario. Dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, ac yn bendant er 1999, mae Cymru wedi gwneud yn arbennig o dda ac wedi perfformio'n well na gweddill y DU mewn llawer maes, ac mae'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd wedi gwneud yn well na'r perfformiad cyffredinol hwnnw. Mae gennym record da.

Nodwyd droeon y ffaith na wnaethom, fel Llywodraeth, ymgynghori â busnesau na rhanddeiliaid eraill ar ddiddymu'r CCNC. Yr ydym wedi dweud, 'Ydym, yr ydym yn derbyn y ffaith na fuom yn ymgynghori'. Fodd bynnag, teimlem mai mater o egwyddor oedd hynny. Yr wyf wedi dweud imi gael bron i 100 o gyfarfodydd bellach gyda sefydliadau busnes ynglŷn â ffurf a diwylliant y sefydliad newydd, a sut y bydd yn darparu gwasanaethau. O'r foment honno ym mis Gorffennaf 2004, yr ydym wedi ymgysylltu'n sylweddol â busnes. Mae fy adran i, er enghraifft, yn adlewyrchu ffrwyth yr ymgynghori hwnnw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at y pwynt o egwyddor—beth yw hwnnw?

Andrew Davies: Yr oeddem yn teimlo, fel pwynt o egwyddor, y dylai'r gwasanaethau hynny fod yn atebol yn uniongyrchol ac yn cael eu darparu gan y Llywodraeth, ac yn atebol yn uniongyrchol am ddarparu'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, ac eraill. Yr oedd hynny'n bwynt sylfaenol o egwyddor. Gall rhai ohonom gofio'r diwrnod hwnnw pan fu ichi godi a dweud, 'Ni fyddwn yn fodlon nes bydd pob cwango yng Nghymru wedi'i ddiddymu'. Cofiw'n hynny, hyd yn oed os ydych chi'n dewis peidio. Mae hynny'n hollol wahanol i'r hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'ch cyd-aelodau i'r gogledd o'r ffin, lle mae

policy on getting rid of the quango state. If you have fond memories of those days under the Tories, then fine. However, Ieuan, you still have not engaged with that, and you are clearly uncomfortable with the challenge.

Therefore, we have a good record of consulting with business. It is not just about the process; on outcomes, we are working hard and engaging with business, including on European structural funds. Danuta Hübner, the European Commissioner for regional development, has commended us as a Government on the way in which we have handled the current Objective 1 and European-funded programmes. Other officials, such as Manfred Beschel, have said that, to the best of their knowledge, the engagement with the private sector in Wales is second to none—certainly in terms of the contribution through match funding. They do not know of any other part of the European Union where the private sector has been so engaged. We have been successful in doing so.

There were many other detailed questions, for example on disability groups. We feel that we are doing that as a Government. I will write to you, Christine, giving more detail on that issue, as well as on social enterprise.

To conclude, none of the amendments is worthy of support, and, as a Government, we recommend that they be rejected. As a Government, we are seriously engaging with business, we have a good record to tell, and the amendments do not add any value.

cededlaetholwyr yr Alban, yr ywf ar ddeall, bellach yn dilyn ein polisi o ddileu'r wladwriaeth cwangos. Os oes gennych atgofion melys o'r dyddiau hynny o dan y Toriaid, popeth yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, Ieuan, nid ydych wedi ymgysylltu â hynny, ac yr ydych yn amlwg yn anghyffyrddus â'r her.

Felly, mae gennym record dda o ymgynghori â busnesau. Nid â'r broses yn unig y me hyn yn ymwneud; o ran canlyniadau, yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed ac yn ymgysylltu â busnesau, gan gynnwys ar gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop. Mae Danuta Hübner, y Comisiynydd Ewropeaidd dros ddatblygu rhanbarthol, wedi ein cymeradwyo fel Llywodraeth am y modd yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r rhaglen Amcan 1 bresennol a'r rhaglenni eraill sy'n cael arian Ewropeaidd. Mae swyddogion eraill, fel Manfred Beschel, wedi dweud bod y cysylltiad â'r sector preifat yng Nghymru, hyd yn gwyddant, heb ei ail—yn arbennig o ran y cyfraniad drwy arian cyfatebol. Ni wyddant am unrhyw ran arall o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd lle yr ymgysylltwyd cymiant â'r sector preifat. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny.

Cafwyd nifer o gwestiynau manwl eraill, er enghraifft, am grwpiau anabledd. Teimlwn ein bod yn gwneud hynny fel Llywodraeth. Ysgrifennaf atoch, Christine, i roi mwy o fanylion ar y mater hwnnw, yn ogystal ag ar fenter gymdeithasol.

I gloi, nid oes yr un o'r gwelliannau yn haeddu cael ei gefnogi, ac fel Llywodraeth yr ydym yn argymhell eu gwrthod. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn ymgysylltu o ddifrif â busnesau, mae gennym record dda i'w hardodd, ac nid yw'r gwelliannau'n ychwanegu dim gwerth.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 13, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.
Amendment 2: For 13, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 3: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 13, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 4: For 13, Abstain 8, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 13, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 5: For 13, Abstain 8, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark

Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 6: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

4.50 p.m.

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 7: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice

Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 8: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 9: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine

Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 11, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 10: For 11, Abstain 9, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
 Amendment 11: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3065): to propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order
 No. 6.6(xiii):*

*1. notes the transparent way in which the
 Assembly Government conducts its relations
 with business;*

*2. recognises the continuing need to work
 with the business sector and trade unions in*

Cynnig (NDM3065): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol
 Sefydlog Rhif 6.6(xiii):*

*1. yn nodi'r ffordd dryloyw y mae
 Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnal ei
 pherthynas â'r byd busnes;*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i weithio
 gyda'r sector busnes ac undebau llafur wrth*

developing policy.

ddatblygu polisi.

Cynnig (NDM3065): O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.

Motion (NDM3065): For 27, Abstain 0, Against 21.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.19(v), postpones the short debate NDM3066 from Mick Bates scheduled for today, and takes the short debate NDM2975 from Eleanor Burnham, postponed from 29 March, in its place.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.19(v), yn gohirio dadl fer NDM3066 gan Mick Bates a oedd i'w chynnal heddiw, ac yn cymryd dadl fer NDM2975 gan Eleanor Burnham, a ohiriwyd ar 29 Mawrth, yn ei lle.

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Ennyn Diddordeb Pobl Ifanc Heddiw: Pleidleisio yn 16? Engaging the Youth of Today: Votes at 16?

Eleanor Burnham: Probably because of the short notice, I have not been approached by anyone requesting to contribute, but I would be happy to let anyone who wishes to do so to engage in the debate.

I believe that nothing makes a politician more nervous that uncertainty, as we have just experienced, and few things are more uncertain than young people. You never

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'n debyg oherwydd y rhybudd byr, nid oes neb wedi dod ataf yn gofyn am gael cyfrannu, ond byddwn yn fodlon caniatáu i unrhyw un sydd am wneud hynny gymryd rhan yn y ddadl.

Credaf nad oes dim yn gwneud gwleidydd yn fwy nerfus nag ansicrwydd, fel yr ydym newydd weld, a phrin yw'r pethau sy'n fwy ansicr na phobl ifanc. Ni fyddwch byth yn

know what they will ask next. Every year, I visit Deeside College and other venues with other Assembly Members to be grilled by young students at their Any Questions events. In fact, the questions that students ask often make the press pack look tame.

I believe that we have already lost one generation of young people, and we are about to lose another. After two Assembly elections, turnout has dropped from 46 per cent in 1999 to 38 per cent in 2003. Research shows clearly that there is now a turnout generation gap across the democratic world. We need to stop talking ideas and start debating solutions. I do not have all the answers, but bringing 16 and 17-year-olds into the political process may be one good solution.

The question that is often asked is, 'Why should we give young people the right to vote?'. This is totally wrong. The real question should be, 'Why should we not allow young people the vote?'. Pick an issue, any issue—Live 8, AIDS, the Iraq war, successive campaigns on the Welsh language—and you will see that young people were, and are, at the heart of these campaigns. Their enthusiasm, knowledge, passion and idealism are a refreshing change from the normal politics. Teenagers often put us to shame—almost daily.

Young adults are already making political decisions every day—they are vegetarians, they go to benefit gigs or they buy fair-trade products. Therefore, why are they denied the ultimate tool of anyone who wants to make a real difference: the right to vote? Is it because they are not smart enough? Are they too inexperienced? Perhaps they do not know enough about politics. I do not think so. Not long ago, the same arguments were being used to stop women and working men from having the vote.

Young adults already have rights, as we know. They can get married, pay tax, join the army and fight for their country. What we

gwybod beth fyddant yn ei ofyn nesaf. Bob blwyddyn, byddaf yn ymweld â Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy a mannau eraill gydag Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad i gael ein holi gan fyfyrwyr ifanc yn eu digwyddiadau Unrhyw Gwestiwn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r cwestiynau a ofynnir gan y myfyrwyr yn aml yn gwneud i'r wasg ymddangos yn ddof.

Credaf ein bod eisoes wedi colli un genhedlaeth o bobl ifanc, ac yr ydym ar fin colli un arall. Ar ôl dau etholiad Cynulliad, mae'r ganran a bleidleisiodd wedi gostwng o 46 y cant yn 1999 i 38 y cant yn 2003. Mae ymchwil yn dangos yn glir fod bwch cenhedlaeth bellach o ran y ganran sy'n pleidleisio ar draws y byd democrataidd. Mae angen inni roi'r gorau i siarad am syniadau a dechrau trafod atebion. Nid yw'r holl atebion gennyf, ond hwyrach y byddai cynnwys pobl 16 a 17 oed yn y broses wleidyddol yn un ateb da.

Y cwestiwn a ofynnir yn aml yw, 'Pam y dylem roi'r hawl i bobl ifanc bleidleisio?'. Mae hyn yn gwbl anghywir. Y cwestiwn cywir yw 'Pam na ddylem ganiatáu i bobl ifanc bleidleisio?'. Dewiswch bwnc, unrhyw bwnc—Live 8, AIDS, rhyfel Irac, ymgyrchoedd dilynol dros yr iaith Gymraeg—a gwelwch fod pobl ifanc wrth wraidd yr ymgyrchoedd hyn yn awr ac yn y gorffennol. Mae eu brwdfrydedd, eu gwybodaeth, eu hangerdd a'u delfrydiaeth yn newid braf o wleidyddiaeth arferol. Mae pobl yn eu harddegau yn aml yn codi cywilydd arnom—bron bob dydd.

Mae oedolion ifanc eisoes yn gwneud penderfyniadau gwleidyddol bob dydd—maent yn llysieuwyr, yn mynd i gigiau elusennol neu'n prynu nwyddau masnach deg. Felly, pam gwrthod yr arf eithaf i unrhyw un sydd am wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol: yr hawl i bleidleisio? Ai am nad ydynt yn ddigon galluog? A ydynt yn rhy ddibrofiad? Efallai nad ydynt yn gwybod digon am wleidyddiaeth. Nid wyf yn credu hynny. Ychydig yn ôl defnyddid yr un dadleuon i atal merched a dynion o a oedd yn gweithio rhag pleidleisio.

Mae gan oedolion ifanc hawliau eisoes, fel y gwyddom. Gallant briodi, talu trethi, ymuno â'r fyddin ac ymladd dros eu gwlad. Yr hyn

need is a common age of maturity that reflects the responsibilities of young adults, and not the current confusion of responsibility without representation—that is, no taxation without representation, as the Suffragettes thought. Compulsory citizenship classes alone will not solve the problem. The gap between citizenship lessons and voting is counterproductive. What is the point of teaching them about something that they cannot do for another few years?

Young people are born and raised as consumers, particularly in this age. If something is not immediately relevant to them, they move on. Just look at the efforts and lengths to which advertisers will go to, to get young people's attention. We are not making anywhere near that level of effort in politics. Is it any wonder that their attention is elsewhere?

Some of our best politicians—or perhaps I should just say 'some of our politicians'—started young: Charles Kennedy, Dafydd Elis-Thomas, and Neil Kinnock to name a few, and William Hague, of course.

Laura Anne Jones: And me.

Eleanor Burnham: Yes, Laura Anne, of course—and so on and so forth. If you look back through their lives, you will see an interest sparked at an early age. There are so many other things competing for the attention of today's youth that we are losing our best and brightest to other pursuits.

Disillusionment is a threat to a growing, healthy democracy. Exclusion in any form is the ally of disillusion. Give young people a stake in our democracy and we will empower and involve them in a productive way. Get people to vote while they are young and it could be the habit that they keep for the rest of their lives; leave it until they are 18 and we could lose them forever. The great Prime Minister, Benjamin Disraeli, once said that youth is the trustee of prosperity. We need to show more trust in our young people, not less. We need to give them a greater say in how the country is run.

sydd ei angen arnom yw oedran aeddfedrwydd cyffredin sy'n adlewyrchu cyfrifoldebau oedolion ifanc, nid y dryswch presennol o gyfrifoldeb heb gynrychiolaeth—hynny yw, dim trethiant heb gynrychiolaeth, fel y credai'r Swffragetiaid. Ni fydd dosbarthiadau dinasyddiaeth gorfodol yn datrys y broblem. Mae'r bwllch rhwng gwersi dinasyddiaeth a phleidleisio yn wrthgynhyrchiol. Pa ddiben eu haddysgu am rywbeth na allant ei wneud am rai blynyddoedd i ddod?

Caiff pobl ifanc eu geni a'u magu fel defnyddwyr, yn enwedig yn yr oes hon. Os nad yw rhywbeth yn berthnasol iddynt ar unwaith, maent yn symud ymlaen. Edrychwch ar yr ymdrechion a'r drafferth gan hysbysebwyd i dynnu sylw pobl ifanc. Nid ydym yn gwneud dim byd tebyg i hynny ym myd gwleidyddiaeth. A yw'n syndod fod eu sylw ar bethau eraill?

Dechreuodd rhai o'n gwleidyddion gorau—neu efallai y dylwn ddweud 'rhai o'n gwleidyddion'—yn ifanc: Charles Kennedy, Dafydd Elis-Thomas a Neil Kinnock i enwi rhai yn unig, a William Hague, wrth gwrs.

Laura Anne Jones: A minnau.

Eleanor Burnham: Ie, Laura Anne, wrth gwrs—ac ati, ac ati. Os edrychwch yn ôl drwy eu bywydau, fe welwch ddiddordeb a ddechreuodd yn gynnar. Mae cynifer o bethau eraill yn cystadlu am sylw ieuencid heddiw fel ein bod yn colli'n pobl ifanc orau a mwyaf disglair i ddiddordebau eraill.

Mae dadrithio yn fygythiad i ddemocratiaeth iach sy'n tyfu. Mae pob math o allgáu yn arwain at ddadrithio. Rhowch ran i bobl ifanc yn ein democratiaeth, a byddwn yn eu grymuso a'u cynnwys mewn ffordd gynhyrchiol. Os bydd pobl yn pleidleisio pan fyddant yn ifanc, gallai fod yr arferiad a gadwant am weddill eu hoes; gadewch hynny nes iddynt gyrraedd 18 oed a gallem eu colli am byth. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog enwog Benjamin Disraeli unwaith mai pobl ifanc yw ymddiriedolwyr ffyniant. Mae angen inni ddangos i'n pobl ifanc ein bod yn ymddiried ynddynt yn fwy, nid yn llai. Mae angen inni roi mwy o lais iddynt yn y ffordd y caiff y wlad ei rhedeg.

It is wrong to say that young people are the future; they are the here and now, affected by every decision that we make. I give way to Laura Anne.

Laura Anne Jones: Sorry to interrupt—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You are not allowed to make an intervention.

Eleanor Burnham: I beg your pardon. I give her permission to speak afterwards.

Young people are the here and now, affected by every decision that we make, particularly here in the Assembly. Young adults will be a part of the future, but it is the decisions that we make now that will determine that future.

Change happens painfully slowly in the UK. After all, it was only in 1969 that the voting age was lowered to 18—some of us will remember that, but perhaps not as clearly as others. Thirty-seven years later, we have our Assembly and a chance to create the kind of politics that we want. We should lead the way in engaging young people. Lowering the voting age is the natural progression in electoral reform. Wales should lead the way on that. Think what a difference allowing young people to vote in Assembly elections could have. What would the risk be? We just might engage a few more people, for heaven's sake.

Young people grow up far quicker now than in our generation. Eighteen may have been an appropriate age of adulthood in 1969, but not now. A line has to be drawn somewhere and 16 seems to be the best compromise. By the age of 16, most young people are making decisions that some of us never faced until we were in our 20s. If we cannot protect young people from the world, we should at least give them a stake in it.

Giving young adults the vote would not give

Nid yw'n iawn dweud mai pobl ifanc yw'r dyfodol; maent yn rhan o'r presennol, ac mae pob penderfyniad a wnawn yn effeithio arnynt. Ildiaf i Laura Anne.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar draws—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni chaniateir ichi ymyrryd.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Rhoddaf ganiatâd ichi siarad yn ddiweddarach.

Mae pobl ifanc yn rhan o'r presennol, ac mae pob penderfyniad a wnawn, yn enwedig yma yn y Cynulliad, yn effeithio arnynt. Bydd oedolion ifanc yn rhan o'r dyfodol, ond y penderfyniadau a wnawn yn awr fydd yn pennu'r dyfodol hwnnw.

Mae newid yn digwydd yn boenus o araf yn y DU. Wedi'r cyfan, dim ond yn 1969 y gostyngwyd yr oedran pleidleisio i 18—bydd rhai ohonom yn cofio hynny, ond efallai nid mor glir ag eraill. Ddwly flynedd ar bymtheg ar hugain yn ddiweddarach, mae gennym ein Cynulliad a chyfle i greu'r math o wleidyddiaeth yr ydym am ei chael. Dylem arwain y ffordd wrth ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc. Gostwng yr oedran pleidleisio yw'r cam naturiol nesaf mewn diwygio etholiadol. Dylai Cymru arwain y ffordd yn hynny. Meddyliwch faint o wahaniaeth y gallai caniatáu i bobl ifanc bleidleisio yn etholiadau'r Cynulliad ei gael. Beth fyddai'r perygl? Efallai, efallai y gallem ennyn diddordeb ychydig yn fwy o bobl, yn enw'r nefoedd.

Mae pobl ifanc yn tyfu lawer yn gyflymach yn awr nag yn ein cenhedlaeth ni. Efallai mai 18 oedd oed priodol oedolaeth yn 1969, ond nid heddiw. Rhaid tynnu llinell rywle, ac mae'n ymddangos mai 16 yw'r cyfaddawd gorau. Erbyn iddynt gyrraedd 16 oed, mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc yn gwneud penderfyniadau nad oedd rhai ohonom yn eu hwynebu tan oeddem yn ein hugeiniau. Os na allwn amddiffyn pobl ifanc rhag y byd, dylem o leiaf roi rhan iddynt ynddo.

Ni fyddai rhoi'r bleidlais i oedolion ifanc yn

any one political party a big advantage, as young people are too independent for one group to have a monopoly on their minds. What it would do is force us to talk about issues that we would not normally talk about and rethink those that we do. Some senior politicians have said that they would be willing to give 16-year-olds the vote, if they demanded it. If 50,000 16-year-olds marched on Westminster, perhaps the only thing that they would get would be an anti-social behaviour order, and not a ballot paper.

5.00 p.m.

Do we only ever listen when people are forced to rise up like the suffragettes, or could we, for once, give people the rights to which they are entitled because it is just to do so and the right thing for us at the National Assembly to do in 2006? Am I being too idealistic? Maybe I am, but I believe that Welsh politics could use a bit more youth input and idealism.

I have given permission to Laura Anne to speak, Deputy Prime Minister.

Jonathan Morgan: You have been upgraded, Dirprwy Lywydd. [*Laughter.*]

Eleanor Burnham: Deputy Presiding Officer, sorry.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Do finish your speech.

Eleanor Burnham: I have finished.

Laura Anne Jones: I wanted to agree with you in one respect, Eleanor, in that we need to see more young people involved in politics. It is worrying to people of all ages, across parties and across the country, that young people are not engaging in politics. It is a challenge that faces us all as elected representatives, whether AMs, MPs or MEPs or whatever.

One way of engaging young people is to vote them into the political game. I was elected to this Chamber in my twenties, as were other

rhwi mantais fawr i unrhyw un blaid wleidyddol, gan fod pobl ifanc yn rhy annibynnol i un grŵp fynd â'u bryd. Yr hyn a wnâi fyddai ein gorfodi i drafod materion na fyddem fel rheol yn eu trafod, ac ailfeddwl am y rhai y byddwn yn eu trafod. Mae rhai gwleidyddion hŷn wedi dweud y byddent yn fodlon rhoi'r bleidlais i bobl 16 oed pe baent yn gofyn amdani. Pe byddai 50,000 o bobl 16 oed yn gorymdeithio i San Steffan, efallai mai'r unig beth a gaent fyddai gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, nid papur pleidleisio.

Ai dim ond pan fydd yn rhaid i bobl greu terfysg fel y swffragetaid y byddwn yn gwrando, neu a allem, am unwaith, roi'r hawliau i bobl sydd â'r hawl i'w cael am mai gwneud hynny yw'r peth cyfiawn a chywir i ni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei wneud yn 2006? A wyf yn rhy ddelfrydyddol? Hwyrach fy mod, ond credaf y gallai cyfraniad a delfrydiaeth pobl ifanc fod o fudd i wleidyddiaeth Cymru.

Yr wyf wedi caniatáu i Laura Anne siarad, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr ydych wedi'ch dyrchafu, Ddirprwy Lywydd. [*Chwerthin.*]

Eleanor Burnham: Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gorffennwch eich araith.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf wedi gorffen.

Laura Anne Jones: Yr oeddwn am gytuno â chi ar un peth, Eleanor, sef bod angen inni weld mwy o bobl ifanc yn cymryd rhan mewn gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'n peri pryder i bobl o bob oed, ar draws pleidiau ac ar draws y wlad, nad yw pobl ifanc yn dangos diddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'n her sy'n wynebu pob un ohonom fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig, boed yn ACau, ASau neu ASEau neu beth bynnag.

Un ffordd i ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc yw eu hethol i'r byd gwleidyddol. Cefais fy ethol i'r Siambr hon yn fy ugeiniau, yn debyg i

Members in the Chamber. That sends a positive message to the electorate, and young people are more likely to sit up and take notice if someone of the same age, to whom they can relate, is doing something and making a difference in politics.

I do not agree with lowering the voting age to 16; that is too young. However, something for you to think about, Eleanor, is that you can vote at the age of 18, but you cannot stand for election until you are 21. If you advocate voting at the age of 16, are you saying that people should be able to stand for election at 16 as well? I do not think that that is appropriate for 16-year-olds to have the vote, but I do think that school councils are going a long way towards sending out a positive message and making the people of Wales sit up and take notice of politics a lot more, so that must be welcomed.

The Deputy Minister for Local Government and Public Services (Christine Chapman): I thank Eleanor Burnham for bringing this important issue before us, and Laura Anne for her contribution. The issue of engaging the youth of today and allowing voting at the age of 16 first confronted the Assembly when it featured in the recommendations in the report of the Commission on Local Government Electoral Arrangements in Wales, which you may remember better as the Sunderland report. More recently, it was a recommendation of the POWER inquiry, which was an independent inquiry into Britain's democratic processes. The inquiry report was published in March, I believe, and I know that it took evidence in Wales. I am pleased that this was one of the recommendations.

The Assembly Government generally supported voting at the age of 16, based on the argument that, at the age of 16, a young person can choose to leave full-time education and enter the labour market. He or she will then, in due course, become liable to pay income tax. A 16-year-old may also marry without parental consent and establish a family. These are all attributes of citizenship that are already recognised by law, and they may raise the presumption that 16-year-olds should be entitled to vote. We

Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr. Mae hynny'n anfon neges gadarnhaol i etholwyr, ac mae pobl ifanc yn fwy tebygol o gymryd sylw os bydd rhywun o'r un oed y gallant ymdeimlo â hwy yn gwneud rhywbeth ac yn gwneud gwahaniaeth ym myd gwleidyddiaeth.

Ni chytunaf y dylid gostwng yr oed pleidleisio i 16; mae hynny'n rhy ifanc. Fodd bynnag, rhywbeth ichi feddwl amdano, Eleanor, yw y gallwch bleidleisio yn 18 oed, ond ni allwch sefyll fel ymgeisydd nes byddwch yn 21 oed. Os ydych o blaid pleidleisio'n 16 oed, a ydych yn dweud y dylai pobl allu sefyll fel ymgeiswyr yn 16 oed hefyd? Ni chredaf ei bod yn briodol i bobl ifanc 16 oed allu pleidleisio, ond credaf fod cynghorau ysgol yn gwneud llawer i gyfleu neges gadarnhaol a gwneud i bobl Cymru gymryd llawer mwy o sylw o wleidyddiaeth, felly, dylid croesawu hynny.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Lywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus (Christine Chapman): Diolch i Eleanor Burnham am gyflwyno'r mater pwysig hwn, ac i Laura Anne am ei chyfraniad. Wynebodd y Cynulliad y mater o ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc heddiw a chaniatáu i bobl 16 oed bleidleisio pan nodwyd yn argymhellion gyntaf yn adroddiad y Comisiwn ar Drefniadau Etholiadol Llywodraeth Leol yng Nghymru. Hwyrach y byddwch yn ei gofio'n well fel adroddiad Sunderland. Yn ddiweddarach, yr oedd yn un o argymhellion ymchwiliad POWER, sef ymchwiliad annibynnol i brosesau democrataidd Prydain. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad yr ymchwiliad ym mis Mawrth, mi gredaf, a gwn iddo gymryd tystiolaeth yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch fod hwn yn un o'r argymhellion.

Ar y cyfan, yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi pleidleisio yn 16 oed, ar sail y ddadl y gall pobl ifanc, yn 16 oed, ddewis gadael addysg llawn amser ac ymuno â'r farchnad lafur. Yna, maes o law, byddant yn atebol i dalu treth incwm. Yn ogystal, gall pobl 16 oed briodi heb ganiatâd eu rhieni a dechrau teulu. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn nodweddion mewn dinasyddiaeth a gydnabyddir eisoes o dan y gyfraith, a gallant godi'r rhagdybiaeth y dylai fod gan bobl ifanc 16 oed yr hawl i bleidleisio. Cefnogwn

support measures that improve young people's knowledge and understanding of local government and local democracy, and I believe that a sense of civic duty is an important factor in determining whether people choose to vote, and there have been indications of a decline in that sense of civic duty, especially among young people.

It is imperative to build into the educational development of young people an appreciation of the importance of voting as they begin to assume their responsibilities as citizens. Also, I believe that it is a mistake to allow a lengthy period to elapse between the minimum school-leaving age and the age of entitlement to vote. Some people—Laura Anne mentioned this—have concerns about the maturity of 16 to 17-year-olds and their capacity to use their vote responsibly, and this was reflected in the arguments considered by the Electoral Commission when it decided not to propose allowing voting at the age of 16 when it proposed reducing the age of candidacy to 18. I also accept that one effect of the franchise being extended in this way might be to depress turnout percentages further, as large numbers of young people may not take immediate advantage of a new entitlement to vote. Nevertheless, the balance of the argument is clearly in favour of the franchise being extended in this way.

Peter Black: I agree that we should extend the franchise in this way. It might be useful, perhaps in a year or two, to visit the Isle of Man, which has just voted to reduce the age of voting to 16, to monitor what is happening there and to gather evidence that we could use to persuade the Westminster Government.

Christine Chapman: That is an excellent idea, and I hope that we can look at that, because the age of voting is also lower in other areas.

As Members will know, it is not within the powers of the Assembly to change the minimum voting age; these provisions are contained within the UK Government's Representation of the People Act 1983. Having said that, it would be unrealistic to

fesurau sy'n gwella gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth pobl ifanc o lywodraeth leol a democratiaeth leol, a chredaf fod ymdeimlad o ddyletswydd ddinesig yn ffactor pwysig wrth benderfynu a yw pobl yn dewis pleidleisio. Cafwyd arwyddion o ostyngiad yn yr ymdeimlad hwnnw o ddyletswydd ddinesig, yn enwedig ymhlith pobl ifanc.

Mae'n hanfodol cynnwys gwerthfawrogiad o bwysigrwydd pleidleisio yn natblygiad addysgol pobl ifanc wrth iddynt ddechrau ymgymryd â'u cyfrifoldebau fel dinasyddion. Credaf hefyd mai camgymeriad yw caniatáu cyfnod hir rhwng yr oedran ifancaf ar gyfer gadael yr ysgol a'r oedran pan fydd gan bobl hawl i bleidleisio. Mae rhai pobl—soniodd Laura Anne am hyn—yn pryderu ynghylch aeddfedrwydd pobl ifanc 16 a 17 oed a'u gallu i ddefnyddio'u pleidlais yn gyfrifol. Adlewyrchwyd hyn yn y dadleuon a ystyriwyd gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol pan benderfynodd beidio â chynnig caniatáu i bobl ifanc 16 oed bleidleisio pan gynigiodd ostwng yr oed pan ellir sefyll fel ymgeisydd i 18. Derbyniaf hefyd y gallai ymestyn yr etholfraint fel hyn ostwng y canrannau sy'n pleidleisio ymhellach, oherwydd efallai na fydd niferoedd mawr o bobl ifanc yn manteisio ar unwaith ar eu hawl newydd i bleidleisio. Serch hynny, mae'n amlwg fod y ddadl o blaid ymestyn yr etholfraint fel hyn.

Peter Black: Cytunaf y dylem ymestyn yr etholfraint fel hyn. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol, ymhen blwyddyn neu ddwy, hwyrach, i ymweld ag Ynys Manaw, sydd newydd bleidleisio dros ostwng oed pleidleisio i 16, er mwyn monitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd yno a chasglu tystiolaeth y gallem ei defnyddio i ddarbwylllo Llywodraeth San Steffan.

Christine Chapman: Mae hwnnw'n syniad ardderchog, a gobeithio y gallwn ystyried hynny gan fod yr oed pleidleisio hefyd yn is mewn ardaloedd eraill.

Fel y gŵyr Aelodau, nid yw o fewn pwerau'r Cynulliad i newid yr oed pleidleisio ifancaf; cynhwysir y darpariaethau hyn yn Neddf Cynrychiolaeth y Bobl 1983 Llywodraeth y DU. Wedi dweud hynny, byddai'n afrealistig credu y byddai gostwng yr oed pleidleisio yn

believe that a reduction in the voting age would be more than just part of the solution with regard to involving more young people in the democratic process. The Electoral Administration Bill currently before the UK Parliament proposes to reduce the age of candidacy in elections to 18, which should mean that, for the Assembly elections next year and the local government elections in 2008, 18 to 20-year-olds could consider putting themselves forward for election.

Laura Anne made this point, and I urge all parties to consider ways in which they could encourage young members or potential members of their parties to stand for election in the coming years. Laura Anne is the youngest Assembly Member, and this is also about role models. It is not a party-political issue; there is a consensus in the Assembly that all political parties need to look creatively and innovatively at the barriers to young people entering politics. We need to do that. Even having a handful of young people elected to local government in Wales could help to bring about a significant shift in diversity. It would bring into the council chambers people whose views on council facilities, services, education, crime and the local environment might be radically different from the established norms, and which would be based on experiences that most other councillors could not have shared. It is important that we get a diversity of people, including young people, in local government.

Officials are working with the WLGA on a campaign to increase diversity among candidates in the 2008 local government elections, and they will be in touch with all parties as part of the campaign. The intention is to start late in the summer with a conference and then produce literature and publicity material to encourage local campaigns. Youth organisations, as well as equality and voluntary organisations, will be included in this work.

If you look back a few years, the 1960s, the 1970s and, to an extent, the 1980s, were times of considerable political activity of one type or another. The proportion of young people who voted was also higher then, and that is the challenge for us all. However, I do

fwy na dim ond rhan o'r ateb o ran cynnwys mwy o bobl ifanc yn y broses ddemocrataidd. Mae'r Mesur Gweinyddiaeth Etholiadol sydd gerbron Senedd y DU ar hyn o bryd yn cynnig gostwng yr oed pan ellir sefyll fel ymgeisydd mewn etholiadau i 18, a dylai hynny olygu, ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf ac etholiadau llywodraeth leol yn 2008, y gallai pobl ifanc 18 i 20 oed ystyried cyflwyno'u hunain fel ymgeiswyr.

Gwnaeth Laura Anne y pwynt hwn, ac anogaf bob plaid i ystyried ffyrdd y gallent annog aelodau ifanc neu ddarpar aelodau eu pleidiau i sefyll fel ymgeiswyr yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Laura Anne yw'r Aelod Cynulliad ifancaf, ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â modelau rôl hefyd. Nid mater plaid ydyw; mae cytundeb barn yn y Cynulliad fod angen i bob plaid wleidyddol ystyried yr hyn sy'n rhwystro pobl ifanc rhag ymuno â byd gwleidyddiaeth yn greadigol ac yn arloesol. Mae angen inni wneud hynny. Gallai ethol llond llaw o bobl ifanc hyd yn oed i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru helpu sicrhau newid mawr o ran amrywiaeth. Byddai hefyd yn golygu bod pobl yn siambrau'r cyngor y gallai eu barn ar gyfleusterau'r cyngor, gwasanaethau, addysg, troseddau a'r amgylchedd lleol fod yn wahanol iawn i'r farn sefydledig, yn seiliedig ar brofiadau na allai'r rhan fwyaf o gynghorwyr eraill fod wedi'u cael. Mae'n bwysig cael amrywiaeth o bobl, gan gynnwys pobl ifanc, mewn llywodraeth leol.

Mae swyddogion yn gweithio gyda CLILC ar ymgyrch i gynyddu amrywiaeth ymhlith ymgeiswyr yn etholiadau llywodraeth leol 2008, a byddant yn cysylltu â phob plaid fel rhan o'r ymgyrch. Y bwriad yw dechrau drwy gynnal cynhadledd ddiwedd yr haf, ac wedyn cynhyrchu deunydd darllen a chyhoeddusrwydd i annog ymgyrchoedd lleol. Caiff sefydliadau ieuenctid, yn ogystal â sefydliadau cydraddoldeb a sefydliadau gwirfoddol, eu cynnwys yn y gwaith hwn.

Os edrychwch yn ôl ychydig flynyddoedd, yr oedd yr 1960au a'r 1970au, a'r 1980au i raddau, yn gyfnodau o weithgarwch gwleidyddol sylweddol o ryw fath neu'i gilydd. Yr oedd cyfran y bobl ifanc a bleidleisiai hefyd yn uwch bryd hynny, a

not believe that young people are less interested in political issues now than they were then. The report of the POWER inquiry dispelled that myth. Whatever your views on the matter, a huge number of young people participated in the demonstrations against the Iraq war, as Eleanor mentioned. There are also other big political issues with which young people are involved. However, we need to tackle the problem of young people being turned-off from traditional political activity and from voting. As Eleanor reminded us, less than 40 per cent of 18 to 24-year-olds voted in the last two general elections.

5.10 p.m.

Citizenship education is a key element of personal and social education, which is a statutory part of the basic curriculum for all children of compulsory school age. This is potentially a good mechanism for getting more and more young people engaged in voting and politics. It should help to produce constitutionally literate school leavers, which is important. It is about encouraging young people to think, to debate and to question. There are so many other distractions for young people to contend with, compared with, say, a generation ago. Ever since the Assembly was established, the Assembly Government has made a point of talking and listening to young people. I remind you that there are good organisations such as Funky Dragon that do an awful lot to ensure that we keep in touch with young people. It is not tokenistic; it is about real engagement.

We need to find ways of tapping into the mindset of young people who are happy to raise money for charity, to participate in sponsored races, attend Band Aid concerts, march in anti-war demonstrations and who are concerned for the future of their environment and have a voice to be listened to.

I thought that the Electoral Commission took an overly cautious approach when it decided not to recommend a reduction in the voting

dyna'r her i ni bob un. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf fod gan bobl ifanc lai o ddiddordeb mewn materion gwleidyddol yn awr nag a oedd ganddynt bryd hynny. Chwalodd adroddiad ymchwiliad POWER y myth hwnnw. Beth bynnag yw eich barn am y mater, cymerodd nifer fawr o bobl ifanc ran yn y protestiadau yn erbyn rhyfel Irac, fel y soniodd Eleanor. Mae yna faterion gwleidyddol mawr eraill hefyd y mae pobl ifanc yn cymryd rhan ynddynt. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem fod pobl ifanc yn colli diddordeb mewn gweithgarwch gwleidyddol traddodiadol a phleidleisio. Fel y'n hatgoffwyd gan Eleanor, pleidleisiodd llai na 40 y cant o bobl ifanc 18 i 24 oed yn y ddau etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf.

Mae addysg dinasyddiaeth yn un o elfennau allweddol addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, sy'n rhan statudol o'r cwricwlwm sylfaenol i bob plentyn o oed ysgol gorfodol. Mae hwn yn ddull da posibl i sicrhau bod nifer cynyddol o bobl ifanc yn pleidleisio ac yn dangos diddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth. Dylai helpu darparu pobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr ysgol yn gyfarwydd â materion cyfansoddiadol, sy'n bwysig. Mae, golygu annog pobl ifanc i feddwl, dadlau a chwestiynu. Mae cynifer o bethau eraill yn gallu tynnu sylw pobl ifanc, o'u cymharu â chenedlaeth yn ôl, dyweder. Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi mynd ati i siarad â phobl ifanc a gwrandio arnynt. Fe'ch atgoffaf fod sefydliadau da fel y Ddraig Ffyni yn gwneud llawer iawn i sicrhau ein bod yn cysylltu â phobl ifanc. Nid symbolaeth ydyw; mae'n golygu ymgysylltu go iawn.

Mae angen inni gael ffyrdd i fanteisio ar safbwyntiau pobl ifanc sy'n fodlon codi arian at elusennau, cymryd rhan mewn rasys wedi'u noddi, mynychu cyngherddau Band Aid, gorymdeithio mewn protestiadau yn erbyn y rhyfel, ac sy'n pryderu am ddyfodol eu hamgylchedd ac sydd â llais y dylid gwrandio arno.

Yr oeddwn o'r farn fod y Comisiwn Etholiadol yn rhy ofalus pan benderfynodd beidio ag argymhell gostwng yr oedran

age. I am not sure whether such an element of risk is involved here. Voting at the age of 16 and 17 could have become a focus of school activity for the majority who are still in education—something to be talked about, to stimulate debate and discussion. If fewer people overall are voting than we would like, that would send a message to us all. It is a challenge for us all.

The best way of ensuring that 16-year-olds become entitled to vote would be for them to demand it rather than its being given to them from above, and that means engaging with them in a way that makes them see the importance of democratic politics.

In conclusion, this is a challenge for all of us and for many others outside. I thank Eleanor once again for her choice of topic for the short debate.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That concludes business for this afternoon.

pleidleisio. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes yr un elfen o risg yma. Gallai pleidleisio yn 16 neu 17 oed fod yn ganolbwynt gweithgarwch ysgol i'r mwyafrif sy'n dal—rhywbeth i siarad amdano ac i ysgogi dadl a thrafodaeth. Os oes llai o bobl yn gyffredinol yn pleidleisio nag yr hoffem ei weld, byddai hynny'n anfon neges at bob un ohonom. Mae'n her i ni bob un.

Y ffordd orau i sicrhau bod gan bobl ifanc 16 oed yr hawl i bleidleisio fyddai iddynt ofyn am hynny yn hytrach na'i roi iddynt, ac mae hynny'n golygu ymgysylltu â hwy mewn ffordd sy'n gwneud iddynt sylweddoli pwysigrwydd gwleidyddiaeth ddemocratiaidd.

I gloi, mae hon yn her i ni bob un ac i nifer o bobl eraill y tu allan. Diolch i Eleanor unwaith eto am y testun a ddewisodd ar gyfer y ddadl fer.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.11 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.11 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)