



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 24 Ionawr 2007**  
**Wednesday, 24 January 2007**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- |    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3  | Cwestiynau am Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid<br>Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister                                                                                                              |
| 23 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau<br>Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills                                                                                 |
| 41 | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 42 | Y Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans<br>Ambulance Services                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 81 | Dadl Fer: Teimlo'n Ddiogel<br>Short Debate: Feeling Safe                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 90 | Dadl Fer: De Caerdydd a Phenarth—o Gamlas Sir Forgannwg i Fae Caerdydd—yn<br>Dal i Ehangu Cyfleoedd<br>Short Debate: Cardiff South and Penarth—from Glamorganshire Canal to Cardiff<br>Bay—Still Extending Opportunities |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy yn ddi yn y Siambra. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau am Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

### **Y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax**

**Q1 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the Minister make a statement on council tax increases since 1997? OAQ1059(LGP)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** The average annual increase in band D council tax since 1997-98 is 7.6 per cent. The last two financial years have seen the lowest council tax rises since council tax was introduced in Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I know that the Minister is aware of the deep sense of unease felt in Anglesey at its extremely low local government settlement, which is the lowest in Wales. She will have met the leader of the council and council officials, and they will have explained to her the difficulties that that will impose. As an avid reader of the *Daily Post*, she will have seen, on page two of today's paper, a prediction that Anglesey faces a 5 per cent council tax rise. That is substantially higher than the average expected for Wales. Does the Minister accept that the increased pressures that the council faces, as a result of issues such as the Penhesgyn tip, of which I know she is aware, mean that the council is in an extremely invidious position? Anglesey has the lowest settlement, and yet it is being forced, if it is to maintain services, to increase council tax at a rate way above the average. Will she reconsider the settlement for Anglesey?

**Sue Essex:** I cannot reconsider the settlement, as it was voted on by the Assembly, and there is no way that I can overturn an Assembly decision. As you know, I have spent some time with Anglesey representatives and I understand the pressures that the council faces. We do not know what

**C1 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am godiadau yn y dreth gyngor er 1997? OAQ1059(LGP)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Y cynnydd blynnyddol cyfartalog yn y dreth gyngor ym mand D er 1997-98 yw 7.6 y cant. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ariannol diwethaf cafwyd y cynnydd lleiaf yn y dreth gyngor ers ei chyflwyno yng Nghymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r anfodlonrwydd mawr a deimlir yn Ynys Môn a'i setliad llywodraeth leol isel iawn, sef yr isaf yng Nghymru. Bydd wedi cyfarfod ag arweinydd y cyngor a swyddogion y cyngor, a byddant wedi esbonio'r anawsterau a ddaw iddi yn sgil hynny. Fel un o ddarllenwyr brwd y *Daily Post*, bydd wedi gweld rhagfynegiad ar dudalen dau yn y papur heddiw fod Ynys Môn yn wynebu cynnydd o 5 y cant yn y dreth gyngor. Mae hynny'n sylweddol uwch na'r cynnydd cyfartalog a ddisgwylir i Gymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod y pwysau cynyddol sy'n wynebu'r cyngor, o ganlyniad i faterion fel tomen Penhesgyn, y gwn ei bod yn ymwybodol ohoni, yn golygu bod y cyngor mewn sefyllfa annymunol iawn? Ynys Môn sy'n cael y setliad isaf, ond eto i gyd mae'n cael ei gorfodi i gynyddu'r dreth gyngor ar gyfradd lawer uwch na'r cyfartaedd os yw i gadw gwasanaethau. A wnaiff ailystyried y setliad ar gyfer Ynys Môn?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allaf ailystyried y setliad gan fod y Cynulliad bleidleisio drosto, ac ni allaf newid penderfyniad a wnaed gan y Cynulliad. Fel y gwyddoch, treuliais amser gyda chynrychiolwyr Ynys Môn a deallaf y pwysau sy'n wynebu'r cyngor. Ni wyddom beth fydd y dreth gyngor gyfartalog yng

the average council tax will be in Wales, but I do know that it is a difficult year for Anglesey, so I have looked at why that should be. We all agreed the formula and its distribution, and we know that there will be swings and roundabouts every year when you put changes into the formula. However, one of the formula's key drivers, as I said before, is population figures. Anglesey's real problem is that it had—if you will excuse the tautology—a higher than average decrease in the number of primary and secondary school pupils, and in primary school pupils entitled to free school meals. It also had a lower than average increase in its elderly population. These things really matter, as they are some of the key drivers of change within the formula.

I have done some research on Anglesey's situation and, in terms of the period since 1999, as a whole, Anglesey has had above-average settlements. I know that it is difficult for the council this year, but you will see that this is a situation of swings and roundabouts. Across the whole period, Anglesey has had more than the average—53.5 per cent as compared with 51.9 per cent. Most treasurers understand the dips and swells of the way in which the formula operates. However, as I say, I have had discussions and have shared information with Anglesey council. It is also important that we look forward, as we are talking about a three-year settlement. The issue of where the council can achieve savings, in terms of efficiencies, over the next few years will come into play, but we would all agree that economic development in Anglesey, to boost population levels and incomes, would be the best thing that could happen.

**David Melding:** Do you accept that, over a 10-year period, average annual council tax increases of 8 per cent have led to dramatically higher bills, undermining public confidence in the tax? It is a property tax and, therefore, in taxation terms, is fairly regressive, as it is not closely related to income.

**Sue Essex:** That is why I have been so concerned, as you know, to keep council tax

Nghymru, ond gwn ei bod yn flwyddyn anodd i Ynys Môn, felly, yr wyf wedi ystyried y rhesymau dros hynny. Gwnaethom i gyd gytuno ar y fformiwla a'r dull o'i dosbarthu, a gwyddom y bydd manteision ac anfanteision bob blwyddyn pan newidiwch y fformiwla. Fodd bynnag, un o'r ffactorau allweddol sy'n symbylu'r fformiwla, fel y dywedais eisoes, yw ffigurau'r boblogaeth. Problem wirioneddol Ynys Môn—os maddeuwch yr ailadrodd—yw iddi weld lleihad uwch na'r cyfartaledd yn nifer y disgyblion mewn ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion uwchradd, ac yn nifer y disgyblion ysgol gynradd sydd â hawl i gael cinio ysgol am ddim. Cafodd gynnydd is na'r cyfartaledd yn nifer y bobl oedrannus hefyd. Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn bwysig, oherwydd dyma rai o'r ffactorau allweddol sy'n symbylu newid yn y fformiwla.

Gwneuthum rywfaint o ymchwil i sefyllfa Ynys Môn, ac yn y cyfnod er 1999 mae Ynys Môn wedi cael setliadau uwch na'r cyfartaledd ar y cyfan. Gwn ei bod yn anodd i'r cyngor eleni, ond fe welwch fod manteision ac anfanteision. Yn ystod y cyfnod cyfan, mae Ynys Môn wedi cael mwy na'r cyfartaledd—53.5 y cant o'i gymharu â 51.9 y cant. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o drysoryddion yn deall bod y ffordd y mae'r fformiwla'n gweithredu yn gyfnewidiol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, cefais drafodaethau ac yr wyf wedi rhannu gwybodaeth gyda chyngor Ynys Môn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni edrych ymlaen, gan ein bod yn sôn am setliad tair blynedd. Bydd y mater ble y gall y cyngor wneud arbedion, mewn effeithlonrwydd, yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf yn dod i'r amlwg, ond byddem i gyd yn cytuno mai datblygu economaidd yn Ynys Môn fyddai'r peth gorau a allai ddigwydd, er mwyn rhoi hwb i lefelau'r boblogaeth ac incwm.

**David Melding:** A dderbyniwch fod cynnydd blynnyddol cyfartalog o 8 y cant yn y dreth gyngor, dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd, wedi arwain at filiau sy'n sylweddol uwch, gan danseilio ffydd y cyhoedd yn y dreth? Treth eiddo ydyw, ac felly, fel treth mae'n eithaf atchweliadol gan nad yw'n gysylltiedig iawn ag incwm.

**Sue Essex:** Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod mor awyddus, fel y gwyddoch, i sicrhau bod y

increases low, and is why I took the step, a few years ago, of consulting on the principles. As I said, in the last two years—you can look at the figures—there was a growth of 3.8 per cent in 2005-06 and 4.5 per cent in 2006-07, and I am asking people to keep their increases to 5 per cent or below this year. You can compare that with some previous years, particularly—you would be surprised if I did not allude to this—the years when a Tory Government first introduced council tax. I will repeat what I have said many times in the Assembly: unreasonable and excessive rises have given council tax, as a property tax, a bad name. Since I have been Minister, I have been clear in saying that I do not like to see the massive swings in council tax rises that some authorities have delivered in the past. That is why I am trying to ensure a consistent pattern, and I hope that will be the case this year.

cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn isel, a dyna pam yr ymgynghorais ar yr egwyddorion rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Fel y dywedais, yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf—gallwch edrych ar y ffigurau—bu cynnydd o 3.8 y cant yn 2005-06 a 4.5 y cant yn 2006-07, ac yr wyf yn gofyn i bobl sicrhau bod eu cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn 5 y cant neu lai eleni. Gallwch gymharu hynny â chynnydd yn y gorffennol, yn enwedig y blynyddoedd pan gyflwynodd Llywodraeth Doriad y dreth gyngor am y tro cyntaf—byddech yn synnu pe na byddwn wedi cyfeirio at hynny. Yr wyf am ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais lawer tro yn y Cynulliad: mae cynnydd afresymol ac eithafol wedi rhoi enw drwg i'r dreth gyngor, fel treth eiddo. Ers imi fod yn Weinidog, yr wyf wedi dweud yn glir nad wyf yn hoffi gweld amrywiadau anferth yn y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor a wnaed gan rai awdurdodau yn y gorffennol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn ceisio sicrhau patrwm cyson, a gobeithio y bydd hynny'n digwydd eleni.

**David Melding:** I welcome that admission, although it took you quite a long time to make it. Do the maths—these bills have gone up by roughly two thirds since your party came to power in Westminster, and the Welsh Assembly Government then continued this policy. The revaluation that you undertook also caused public confidence in this tax to be further undermined. What do you believe is now appropriate in terms of revaluation? I think that you stated in writing to the Lyons inquiry that there should be regular property reviews. I broadly accept that, in principle, but I do not believe that they should be frequent. What is meant by ‘regular’? Will we see reviews every other year or will they follow a more reasonable timescale?

**Sue Essex:** I do not know why you use the word ‘admission’. I was quite proud of the fact that it was 3.8 to 4.5 per cent, in contrast to the figures that we had when we had a Secretary of State for Wales of a Tory persuasion. You need to go back and look at history, and compare that with where we are now. [*Interruption.*] It is not a silly point, David; it is an honest one. I have been very honest and come absolutely clean to local authorities over the last few years about the fact that we are trying to keep council tax

**David Melding:** Croesawaf y cyfaddefiad hwnnw, er ichi gymryd amser maith i'w ddweud. Gwnewch y symiau—mae'r biliau hyn wedi codi tua dwy ran o dair ers i'ch plaid ddod i rym yn San Steffan, ac yna parhaodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru â'r polisi hwn. Tanseiliodd yr ailbrisiad a wnaed gennych hyder y cyhoedd yn y dreth hon ymhellach. Yn eich barn chi, beth sy'n briodol bellach o ran ailbrisio? Credaf ichi ddweud yn ysgrifenedig wrth ymchwiliad Lyons y dylid gwneud adolygiadau rheolaidd o eiddo. Derbyniad hynny'n gyffredinol, fel egwyddor, ond ni chredaf y dylent fod yn rheolaidd. Beth a olygir wrth ‘rheolaidd’? A fydd adolygiadau bob yn ail flwyddyn, ynteu a fyddant yn dilyn amserlen fwy rhesymol?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn pam yr ydych yn defnyddio'r gair 'cyfaddefiad'. Yr oeddwn yn eithaf balch o'r ffaith mai 3.8 i 4.5 y cant oedd y ffigurau, yn wahanol i'r ffigurau a gawsom pan oedd ein Hysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn Dori. Mae angen ichi edrych ar yr hanes, a chymharu hynny â'n sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. [*Torri ar draws.*] Nid yw'n bwynt gwirion, David; mae'n bwynt gonest. Yr wyf wedi bod yn onest iawn ac wedi dweud y cyfan wrth awdurdodau lleol yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf

increases to a reasonable level. On revaluation, you have a question later on, which we well may reach, but I think that the big problem with the revaluation that we did was the huge gap between your having introduced the legislation in 1991, or whenever it was, and the revaluation—you did not make any provision for revaluation. If you admit—to use your word—that there should be regular revaluations, then it would have been nice for your Government to have admitted that at the time and included it in the legislation.

ein bod yn ceisio sicrhau bod y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn rhesymol. O ran ailbrisio, mae gennych gwestiwn yn ddisweddgarach, ac efallai y cyrhaeddwn y cwestiwn hwnnw, ond credaf mai'r prif broblem o ran yr ailbrisiad a wnaed gennym oedd y bwlc anferth rhwng cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth yn 1991, neu pryd bynnag oedd hynny, a'r ailbrisiad—ni wnaethoch chi ddim darpariaeth ar gyfer ailbrisio. Os ydych yn cyfaddef—yr wyf yn defnyddio'ch gair chi—y dylid cael ailbrisadau rheolaidd, byddai'n dda o beth pe bai eich Llywodraeth chi wedi cyfaddef hynny ar y pryd a'i gynnwys yn y ddeddfwriaeth.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, in their efforts to keep council tax down, local authorities have found that their resources are being seriously stretched, especially with regard to adult services. The Social Services Inspectorate for Wales states that almost all, if not all, local authorities in Wales spend more on adult services than your formula dictates. We all know that this is not just a Welsh issue, and that there are not just problems because of an ageing population—the Welsh Local Government Association has identified that there is increasing pressure because national health service patients are being discharged more quickly from hospital into the care of social services. What discussions have you had with the WLGA on a more realistic funding formula for future years? I accept that you will not change the allocations for this year.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, yn eu hymdrehion i gadw'r dreth gyngor yn isel, mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gweld bod eu hadnoddau'n cael eu hymestyn yn sylweddol, yn enwedig o ran gwasanaethau i oedolion. Mae Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru yn dweud bod bron pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, os nad pob un, yn gwario mwy ar wasanaethau i oedolion nag y mae eich fformiwla'n ei bennu. Gwyddom oll nad mater i Gymru'n unig yw hyn, ac nad gyda phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio'n unig y mae'r problemau—mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi dweud bod pwysau cynyddol am fod cleifion y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn cael eu rhyddhau'n gynharach o'r ysbty i ofal gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda CLILC ar fformiwla ariannu fwy realistig ar gyfer y dyfodol? Derbyniaf na fyddwch yn newid y dyraniadau ar gyfer eleni.

**Sue Essex:** You say that it is my formula, but it is our formula; I go to great lengths to ensure that my colleagues in local government are content with that formula. I have always made it clear that I am happy for there to be changes, as long as there is a legitimate basis for making them. I have also made it clear to local government since I have been Minister that there is a need to put more money into social care. I have been pleased that local authorities across Wales have done that. In terms of your valid point about an ageing population, it is clear to me that in the future we will need to put more money into these areas. It is not just the elderly, but older teenagers and young adults,

**Sue Essex:** Dywedwch mai fy fformiwla i ydyw, ond ein fformiwla ni ydyw; yr wyf yn ymdrechu'n fawr i sicrhau bod fy nghydaelodau mewn llywodraeth leol yn fodlon ar y fformiwla honno. Yr wyf wedi gwneud yn glir erioed fy mod yn fodlon gwneud newidiadau, cyhyd ag y bydd sail ddilys dros eu gwneud. Ers imi fod yn Weinidog, yr wyf hefyd wedi ei gwneud yn glir wrth lywodraeth leol fod angen buddsoddi mwy o arian ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf wedi bod yn falch gweld bod awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru wedi gwneud hynny. O ran eich pwnt diliys am boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, mae'n amlwg imi y bydd angen inni fuddsoddi mwy o arian yn y meysydd

who require proper care, and carers need respite. I have no doubt that this will need to be high on the agenda when we plan for public spend. To reassure you, the work that is going to be done on dispersal and deprivation will be done on education and social services second, so it will pick up on those important areas of need. That will undoubtedly mean that the standard spending assessment—and remember that the SSA is always a year out of date, as that is the nature of formula—will go up; I would be very surprised if it does not go up in accordance with that.

hyn yn y dyfodol. Nid ar yr henoed yn unig y mae angen gofal priodol, ond pobl ym mlynnyddoedd olaf eu harddegau ac oedolion ifanc, ac mae angen seibiant ar ofalwyr. Nid oes amheuaeth gennyf na fydd angen i hyn gael blaenoriaeth pan fyddwn yn cynllunio ar gyfer gwariant cyhoeddus. I dawelu eich meddwl, caiff y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud ar wasgariad ac amddifaddedd ei wneud ar addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ail. Felly, bydd yn amlyu'r meysydd pwysig hynny o angen. Bydd hynny'n golygu, yn ddiau, y bydd yr asesiad o wariant safonol—a chofiwch fod yr asesiad o wariant safonol bob amser flywyddyn ar ei hôl hi, am mai dyna natur y fformiwl—a yn codi; byddwn yn synnu'n fawr pe na bai'n codi'n unol â hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** I call John Marek.

**Sue Essex:** Llywydd, I have one last point. Jenny, you asked about what we are doing. Clearly, the pooled budgets, which will come in in line with the Beecham review will give us a major means of equalising finances in relation to NHS and social care. Sorry, Llywydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** It was a very useful point, if I may say so.

2.10 p.m.

**John Marek:** Is the Minister aware that, when the Labour Government took office in 1997, the average council tax was less than £500 and that it is now well over £1,000? Is she aware that this swingeing increase is only partly accounted for by inflation, which has accounted for a fraction of the more than doubling of council tax that has happened since her Government has been in office? Why is she taxing Welsh people so heavily?

**Sue Essex:** Local authorities are responsible for council tax. It would have been fairer to point out the additional money that we have put in to support local government over the years, and local government would admit to that. In a mature society, we all have to understand—and Jenny's points were legitimate—that, as time goes on, the needs

**Y Llywydd:** Galwaf ar John Marek.

**Sue Essex:** Lywydd, mae gennyf un pwynt olaf. Jenny, yr oeddech yn holi am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud. Yn amlwg, bydd y cyllidebau wedi'u cyfuno, a gaiff eu cyflwyno'n unol ag adolygiad Beecham, yn ffordd bwysig igoedd y gallu i'r GIG a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr oedd yn bwynt defnyddiol iawn, os caf ddweud hynny.

**John Marek:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod y dreth gyngor yn llai na £500 ar gyfartaledd pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur i rym yn 1997, a'i bod ymhell dros £1,000 erbyn hyn? A yw'n ymwybodol mai dim ond rhannol gyfrifol yw chwyddiant am y cynnydd enfawr hwn, ac nad yw'n cyfrif ond am gyfran fach iawn o'r dyblu yn y dreth gyngor ers i'w Llywodraeth ddod i rym? Pam mae hi'n trethu pobl Cymru mor drwm?

**Sue Essex:** Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am y dreth gyngor. Byddai wedi bod yn decach tynnu sylw at yr arian ychwanegol yr ydym wedi'i fuddsoddi i gefnogi llywodraeth leol dros y blynnyddoedd, a byddai llywodraeth leol yn cyfaddef hynny. Mewn cymdeithas aeddfed, rhaid inni ddeall bob un—ac yr oedd pwyntiau Jenny yn ddilys—

of local populations increase. Many of the services that local authorities deliver are core services around education, social care and areas such as leisure; people's expectations and needs have changed over this time and, understandably, have gone up. Therefore, it would not be surprising in many ways if council tax and local taxation was increasing. If people want services, local authorities have to respond. The important thing for people in this situation, namely the taxpayers, is that they are getting value in terms of services and that there is accountability and consideration of services and council tax levels.

fd anghenion poblogaethau lleol yn cynyddu gydag amser. Mae nifer o'r gwasanaethau y mae awdurdodau lleol yn eu darparu yn wasanaethau craidd sy'n cwmpasu addysg, gofal cymdeithasol a meysydd fel hamdden; mae disgwyliadau ac anghenion pobl wedi newid yn ystod y cyfnod hwn, ac maent wedi codi, sy'n hollol ddealladwy. Felly, ni fyddai'n syndod mewn llawer ffordd pe bai'r dreth gyngor a threthi lleol yn cynyddu. Os yw pobl am gael gwasanaethau, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ymateb. Y peth pwysig i bobl yn y sefyllfa hon, sef y trethdalwyr, yw eu bod yn cael gwerth o ran gwasanaethau, a bod yna atebolrwydd ac ystyriaeth i wasanaethau a lefelau'r dreth gyngor.

### Praesept yr Heddlu Police Precept

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on police precept increases? OAQ1063(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Police authorities in Wales are currently considering their budgets and associated precept levels for 2007-08. The average police precept in Wales increased from £138 in 2005-06 to £145 in 2006-07, which is an increase of 5 per cent.

**Janet Ryder:** The chief constable of North Wales Police claims that Government policies have led directly to a reduction in the budget of that police force of £2 million in 2006-07 and that a similar policy for 2007-08 will lead to a cut of another £3 million, which would mean that community beat managers, or local beat bobbies to you and me, would be withdrawn from front-line services. That is happening now. Those front-line officers are being taken off the streets in north Wales and are being put into desk jobs to take the place of those who have had to leave. Do you agree with his claim that the cause of the problem lies not with the police but with the Governments in London and Cardiff and do you agree with him when he says that the Government has got police finance into a dreadful mess and that it seems to be in complete denial?

**Sue Essex:** I have had conversations with Mr

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am godiadau ym mhraecept yr heddlu? OAQ1063(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae awdurdodau heddlu Cymru wrthi'n ystyried eu cyllidebau a'r lefelau praecept cysylltiedig ar gyfer 2007-08. Cynyddodd praecept cyfartalog yr heddlu yng Nghymru o £138 yn 2005-06 i £145 yn 2006-07, sy'n gynnydd o 5 y cant.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae prif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn honni bod polisiau'r Llywodraeth wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at ostyngiad o £2 filiwn yng nghyllideb yr heddlu hwnnw ar gyfer 2006-07, ac y bydd polisi tebyg ar gyfer 2007-08 yn arwain at ostyngiad o £3 miliwn arall. Byddai hynny'n olygu y byddai rheolwyr rhawd y gymuned, neu heddwelision lleol i chi a mi, yn cael eu tynnu'n ôl o wasanaethau rheng flaen. Mae hynny'n digwydd yn awr. Mae'r swyddogion rheng flaen hynny'n cael eu tynnu oddi ar y strydoedd yn y gogledd ac yn gor fod gweithio mewn swyddfeydd i gymryd lle'r rhai sydd wedi gor fod gadael. A gytunwch â'i honiad nad yr heddlu sy'n gyfrifol am y broblem, ond y Llywodraethau yn Llundain ac yng Nghaerdydd? Ac a ydych yn cytuno ag ef pan ddywed fod y Llywodraeth yn gyfrifol am greu llanast yng nghyllid yr heddlu, a'i bod fel pe bai'n gwadu'r peth yn llwyr?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi siarad â Mr

Brunstrom and colleagues from the North Wales Police Authority, and I am aware of some of Mr Brunstrom's claims. I think, in fairness, that he would say that a lot of that discussion is for the Home Office rather than for the Assembly Government. The Assembly Government helps to support community safety and other police activities across Wales.

It is up to the North Wales Police Authority to make decisions about priorities of spend, but I know that there are some questions on that in north Wales. I would have thought that taking community constables off the beat was probably the last thing that you would want to do as a police authority, even if you did have to make savings. North Wales has benefited from the funding floor that the Home Office put in. That is just to put a degree of perspective on this. In fact, it receives £8.5 million over and above what the formula allocation would give it. Therefore, in some ways, north Wales is being dealt with and considered, in the England and Wales context, to its advantage, but I understand that Mr Brunstrom has a continual argument with the Home Office and the level to which it is funding.

**Ann Jones:** It is true, as Janet said, that the chief constable has decided to remove 24 front-line officers from the streets and to put them into the control room to block off the vacancies there that he feels he cannot fill. Do you think that the North Wales Police Authority should allow him to do that, given that you have just announced that it has benefited from the funding floor? Do you think that measures that the chief constable is seeking to introduce, such as baseball caps for police officers, a mounted police section to police the crowds at Wrexham Football Club matches, and the translation of his own weblog—which he says will stop the media from having a go at him, but, in fact, the media use it to have a go at him—should not be on his list of priorities? His priority should be to honour the commitment that he made when he asked people to give him a copper for a copper—and I do not like using that phrase, but that is what he coined when council tax payers gave him a 136 per cent increase for community beat bobbies to be

Brunstrom a chydweithwyr o Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol o rai o honiadau Mr Brunstrom. I fod yn deg, credaf y byddai'n dweud mai mater i'r Swyddfa Gartref yw llawer o'r drafodaeth honno yn hytrach na Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn helpu cefnogi diogelwch cymunedol a gweithgareddau eraill yr heddlu ledled Cymru.

Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am wneud penderfyniadau am flaenoriaethu gwariant, ond gwn fod rhai cwestiynau yngylch hynny yn y gogledd. Byddwn yn tybio mai'r peth olaf y byddai awdurdod heddlu am ei wneud fyddai tynnu cwnstabliaid cymunedol oddi ar y stryd, hyd yn oed pe bai'n rhaid ichi arbed arian. Mae'r gogledd wedi elwa o'r terfyn ariannu isaf a weithredwyd gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Dim ond gosod pethau yn eu cyd-destun yw hynny. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'n cael £8.5 miliwn yn uwch nag a fyddai dyraniad y fformiwlâ'n ei roi. Felly, mewn ffordd mae'r gogledd yn cael ei ystyried yng nghyd-destun Cymru a Lloegr, sy'n fanteisiol iddo. Ond deallaf fod gan Mr Brunstrom ddadl barhaus â'r Swyddfa Gartref a'i lefel ariannu.

**Ann Jones:** Mae'n wir, fel y dywedodd Janet, fod y prif gwnstabl wedi penderfynu tynnu 24 o swyddogion rheng flaen oddi ar y strydoedd, a'u rhoi yn yr ystafell reoli i lenwi'r swyddi gwag yno y mae'n teimlo na all eu llenwi. A ydych yn credu y dylai Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ganiatáu iddo wneud hynny, o gofio'ch bod newydd gyhoeddi ei fod wedi elwa o'r terfyn ariannu isaf? Oni chredwch y dylai mesurau y y mae'r prif gwnstabl yn dymuno'u cyflwyno, fel capiau pêl fas i swyddogion yr heddlu, heddlu ar gefn ceffylau i blismona'r dorf yng ngemau Clwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam, a chyflieithiad o'i we-log ei hun—a fydd, meddai, yn rhoi taw ar feirniadaeth y cyfryngau ohono ond sydd, mewn gwirionedd, hyn cael ei ddefnyddio gan y cyfryngau i'w feirniadu—gael eu hepgor o'i restr blaenoriaethau? Dylai osod fel ei flaenoriaeth yn awr barchu'r ymrwymiad a wnaeth pan ofynnodd i bobl am fwy o arian i'r heddlu, a phan dalodd trethdalwyr 136 y cant yn fwy o dreth gyngor er mwyn cael

placed in every electoral ward in north Wales. Do you think that that should remain his priority and that of the North Wales Police Authority, or is it right to withdraw those officers from the streets?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before the Minister answers that, I would just say that I regard some of those comments as operational matters for North Wales Police and the police authority.

**Sue Essex:** It is a matter for the police authority, and it has to answer to the people whom it represents. However, it also has to respond to the public's requirements, and community safety has been identified as a key area, as measured by the Home Office. I am sure that people in north Wales will make their views known.

I also point out that the police precept for band D in north Wales is around £167, which is the highest in Wales. I was in north Wales last Friday, and I understand that people have concerns about council tax and police precept levels. It is a fine line to tread, but public authorities must try to give people the right services while keeping a fair level of taxation.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Whatever you said, I am sure that you will agree with me that the funding deficits have actually emanated from the Home Office's bungling; it is trying to force something upon us, and we thank you and Edwina for countering it. However, as far as I am aware, the Home Office creams off—or whatever the technical term is—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Top-slice.’] Yes, that is right. It top-slices quite a lot of money from the police to send back to English urban areas.

In view of the Beecham agenda of sharing back-office costs—and I understand that 35 officers have been taken off the front line to do these jobs—what are you doing to help North Wales Police to continue to put bobbies on the beat, which, after all, as you know, is what everyone in north Wales wants?

heddweision rhawd y gymuned ym mhob ward etholiadol yn y gogledd. A ydych yn credu y dylai hynny barhau'n flaenoriaeth iddo ef ac i Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, neu a yw'n gywir tynnu'r swyddogion hynny oddi ar y strydoedd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, hoffwn ddweud fy mod yn ystyried mai materion gweithredol i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru a'r awdurdod heddlu yw rhai o'r sylwadau hynny.

**Sue Essex:** Mater i'r awdurdod heddlu yw hwn, a rhaid iddo ateb i'r bobl y mae'n eu cynrychioli. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddo hefyd ymateb i ofynion y cyhoedd, a nodwyd diogelwch cymunedol yn un o'r meysydd allweddol, fel y cânt eu mesur gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl yn y gogledd yn gwneud eu barn yn hysbys.

Hoffwn nodi hefyd bod praesept yr heddlu ar gyfer band D yn y gogledd tua £167, sef yr uchaf yng Nghymru. Yr oeddwn yn y gogledd ddydd Gwener diwethaf, a deallaf fod pobl yn pryderu ynglŷn â lefelau'r dreth gyngor a phraesept yr heddlu. Mae'n ffin denau, ond rhaid i awdurdodau cyhoeddus ddarparu'r gwasanaethau cywir i bobl ac eto sicrhau lefel deg o drethiant.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Boed â fo am hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch â mi bod y prinder arian wedi deillio mewn gwirionedd o'r blerwch gan y Swyddfa Gartref; mae'n ceisio gorfodi rhywbeth arnom, a diolch i chi ac i Edwina am ei wrthwnebu. Fodd bynnag, hyd y gwn i mae'r Swyddfa Gartref yn mynd â rhywfaint ohono—neu pa derm technegol bynnag a ddefnyddir—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Brigdorri.’] Ie, dyna'r term. Mae'n brigdorri cryn dipyn o'r arian oddi ar yr heddlu i'w anfon yn ôl i ardaloedd trefol yn Lloegr.

Yn sgîl agenda Beecham ar rannu costau swyddfa gefn—a deallaf fod 35 o swyddogion wedi'u cymryd oddi ar y rheng flaen i wneud y swyddi hyn—beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i helpu Heddlu Gogledd Cymru i barhau i roi heddweision ar y strydoedd, sef yr hyn y mae pawb yn y gogledd yn ei ddymuno, fel y gwyddoch?

**Sue Essex:** It is up to the North Wales Police Authority to make operational decisions, and my experience of talking to people in north Wales is that they say that having bobbies on the beat—to use the colloquial term—is at the top of their list of priorities. I am sure that the police authority understands that, and will keep it in mind as the most important factor. However, that is clearly up to it.

The formula is England and Wales wide, and takes factors such as deprivation into account, including the need to spend on crime-fighting, as well as rural factors such as dispersal, which concerns have been expressed about in the discussions that I have had. The three police authorities in Wales that have come below the floor—that is, the three other than South Wales Police—have actually been pulled up, so each one has benefited. I know that North Wales Police has benefited to the tune of £8.5 million above what it would have got under the formula. Therefore, there has been some adjustment, and I hope that that will reassure you.

**Sue Essex:** Cyfrifoldeb Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yw gwneud penderfyniadau gweithredol, ac yn fy mhrofiad i mae pobl yn y gogledd yn dweud bod cael heddwreision ar y stryd ar frig eu rhestr o flaenoriaethau. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod yr awdurdod heddlu yn deall hynny, ac y bydd yn cadw hynny mewn cof fel y ffactor pwysicaf. Fodd bynnag, penderfyniad yr awdurdod yw hynny, yn amlwg.

Mae'r fformiwlau ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr, ac mae'n ystyried ffactorau megis amddifadedd, sy'n cynnwys yr angen am wario ar ymladd troseddau, yn ogystal â ffactorau gwledig fel gwasgaru. Mynegwyd pryderon am hynny yn y trafodaethau yr wyf wedi'u cael. Mae'r tri awdurdod heddlu yng Nghymru sydd o dan y terfyn ariannu isaf—hynny yw, y tri ar wahân i Heddlu De Cymru—wedi eu tynnu i fyny, ac felly maent i gyd wedi elwa. Gwn fod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi cael £8.5 miliwn yn fwya'r hyn y byddai wedi'i gael o dan y fformiwlau. Felly, gwelwyd rhywfaint o addasu, a gobeithio y bydd hynny'n tawelu'ch meddwl.

### Diwygio Etholiadol Electoral Reform

**Q3 Janet Davies:** What recent discussions has the Minister held with UK Ministers regarding electoral reform? OAQ1061(LGP)

**Q3 Janet Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion y DU ynglŷn â diwygio etholiadol? OAQ1061(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Measures introduced in the Electoral Administration Act 2006 will be replicated by the Secretary of State in the representation of the people Order, which determines the conduct of the Assembly. My officials are kept informed of developments by the Department for Constitutional Affairs, which is represented on the elections planning group.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y mesurau a gyflwynwyd yn Neddff Gweinyddu Etholiadol 2006 yn cael eu cynnwys eto gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yng Ngorchymyn cynrychiolaeth y bobl, sy'n pennu ymddygiad y Cynulliad. Caiff fy swyddogion y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd am ddatblygiadau gan yr Adran Materion Cyfansoddiadol, a gynrychiolir ar y grŵp cynllunio etholiadau.

**Janet Davies:** Do you agree that all political parties should have open and transparent arrangements, including separate funding units for Wales?

**Janet Davies:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai fod gan bob plaid wleidyddol drefniadau agored ac eglur, gan gynnwys unedau ariannu ar wahân i Gymru?

**Sue Essex:** If your supplementary question alludes to your press release of yesterday or the day before, I can only give you an answer based on personal opinion. I thought that that

**Sue Essex:** Os yw eich cwestiwn atodol yn cyfeirio at eich datganiad i'r wasg ddoe neu echdoe, dim ond ateb ar sail barn bersonol y gallaf ei wneud. Fy marn i oedd bod hynny'n

was taking separation too far, and I think that most people in Wales would agree.

2.20 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One change to the electoral process currently being recommended—or certainly mooted—is the possibility that the Assembly election votes on 3 May will not be counted after the polls close, but on the Friday. Scotland has two sets of elections on the same day—the local and parliamentary elections—both of which will be counted on the Thursday night, once the polls close. Do you share my concern about this possibility and do you agree with many in the Chamber who feel that, in the interests of democracy, the people of Wales have a right to know who their Assembly Members will be as quickly as possible after the polls close?

**Sue Essex:** Not only do I share your concerns, but I made that point very forcibly at the recent election planning group meeting and the representatives of the political parties present felt the same, as did the Presiding Officer's representative and the chair of the committee. For those of us at the coalface of the election, it will be distressing to have to wait. I am not standing this time, but we all know what it is like; once you have been through such a gruelling day, you want to know that result as soon as possible.

The sticking point is the verification of the postal votes. There were a couple of officials in that meeting, who I respect because they are experienced electoral administrators, and there is nervousness about the machinery that will undertake the verification of the postal votes. However, I feel that despite that nervousness, the presumption that we would have the count on the night proves to be the most important because all of us who have gone through elections for many years know that the count is a relatively speedy process. There may be recounts and sometimes elections have to be stopped at 3 or 4 a.m., but the presumption would be that, after the verification—agreeing the final number of votes is the lengthy part of the process—the

mynd â gwahanu yn rhy bell, a chredaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yng Nghymru'n cytuno.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un newid yn y broses etholiadol sy'n cael ei argymhell ar hyn o bryd—neu sy'n cael ei grybwyl, yn sicr—yw'r posiblwydd na fydd pleidleisiau etholiad y Cynulliad ar 3 Mai yn cael eu cyfrif ar ôl i'r gorsafoedd pleidleisio gau, ond yn hytrach ar y dydd Gwener. Bydd yr Alban yn cynnal dau etholiad ar yr un diwrnod—yr etholiadau lleol a'r rhai seneddol—a chaiff y naill a'r llall eu cyfrif ar y nos Iau, ar ôl i'r gorsafoedd pleidleisio gau. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu am y posiblwydd hwn, ac a ydych yn cytuno â nifer yn y Siambra sy'n teimlo bod gan bobl Cymru, er budd democratiaeth, yr hawl i wybod pwysig fydd eu Haelodau Cynulliad cyn gynted â phosibl ar ôl i'r gorsafoedd pleidleisio gau?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf nid yn unig yn pryderu, fel chithau, ond mynegais y pwyt hwnnw'n gryf iawn yng nghyfarfod y grŵp cynllunio etholiadau a gynhalwyd yn ddiweddar. Yr oedd cynrychiolwyr y pleidiau gwleidyddol a oedd yn bresennol, a chynrychiolydd y Llywydd a chadeirydd y pwyllogor, o'r un farn. I'r rheini ohonom sydd ar reng flaen yr etholiad, bydd yr aros yn achosi gofid. Ni fyddaf yn sefyll y tro hwn, ond gwyddom bob un sut brofiad ydyw; ar ôl diwrnod mor flinedig, yr ydych am wybod y canlyniad hwnnw cyn gynted â phosibl.

Yr hyn sy'n destun anghytuno yw diliysu pleidleisiau drwy'r post. Yr oedd rhai swyddogion yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yr wyf yn eu parchu am eu bod yn weinyddwyr etholiadol profiadol, ac mae yn a nerfusrwydd ynglŷn â'r peirianwaith a fydd yn diliysu pleidleisiau drwy'r post. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf y nerfusrwydd hwnnw, teimlaf mai'r rhagdybiaeth y byddem yn cynnal y cyfrif ar y noson yw'r un bwysicaf, gan fod pob un ohonom sydd wedi sefyll mewn etholiadau dros y blynnyddoedd yn gwybod bod y cyfrif yn broses gymharol gyflym. Gall fod ailgyfrif ac weithiau rhaid rhoi'r gorau i etholiadau am 3 neu 4 o'r gloch y bore, ond y rhagdybiaeth fyddai, ar ôl y broses ddiliysu—cytuno ar nifer y pleidleisiau

count, particularly in an Assembly election, will be relatively quick. I could not foresee a situation whereby anyone would see those ballot boxes open, with all the votes falling out, would see where the crosses were and make a pretty informed guess, and then the votes would all be put back in the boxes and nothing would be accounted for on the following morning. Therefore, we have left it with the returning officers and the electoral administrators to think about these points; I presented my view very strongly. I can understand their worries, but once they have the relatively important software and they try things out, my suspicion is that the verification process will not be as onerous as they anticipate.

**Janice Gregory:** You will know about the serious problems that there have been Bridgend County Borough Council's electoral services department. For those of us who will be standing in this year's Assembly election, will you ensure that you are confident that any difficulties in this area have been resolved and that we can be confident that the election will be run properly this time?

**Sue Essex:** I point out that Wales has a good record on electoral procedures and business, apart from the Bridgend incident, which was a shame because, throughout Wales, we have a clear record of things being done fairly and in a way that is beyond suspicion.

On Bridgend, I hope that past problems have now been resolved. As you say, it was a serious issue and people must have the utmost confidence in electoral conduct. I will speak to my officials again to ensure that everyone feels confident that past misdemeanours will not be repeated.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4  
OAQ1064(LGP) is withdrawn.

terfynol yw'r rhan hiraf yn y broses—y byddai'r broses gyfrif, yn enwedig yn etholiad y Cynulliad, yn un gymharol gyflym. Ni allwn ragweld sefyllfa lle y byddai neb yn gweld y blychau pleidleisio hynny ar agor, a'r holl bleidleisiau'n disgyn allan, ac yn gweld ble yr oedd croesau ac yn bwrw amcan cymharol ddeallus. Yna byddai'r pleidleisiau'n cael eu rhoi yn ôl yn y blychau ac ni fyddai cyfrif yn cael ei roi am ddim byd fore trannoeth. Felly, yr ydym wedi gofyn i'r swyddogion canlyniadau a'r gweinyddwyr etholiadol ystyried y pwyntiau hyn; cyflwynais fy marn yn gryf iawn. Gallaf ddeall eu pryderon, ond pan fyddant wedi cael y feddalwedd gymharol bwysig ac yn ei rhoi ar waith, nid wyf yn credu y bydd y broses ddilysu mor feichus ag y maent yn ei ragweld.

**Janice Gregory:** Fel y gwyddoch, cafwyd problemau difrifol yn adran gwasanaethau etholiadol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr. I'r rheini ohonom a fydd yn sefyll yn etholiad y Cynulliad eleni, a wnewch chi sicrhau eich bod yn hyderus fod unrhyw anawsterau yn yr ardal hon wedi'u datrys ac y gallwn ni fod yn hyderus y caiff yr etholiad ei gynnal yn briodol y tro hwn?

**Sue Essex:** Hoffwn egluro bod gan Gymru record dda o ran gweithdrefnau a busnes etholiadol, ar wahân i'r digwyddiad ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Yr oedd hynny'n drueni, oherwydd ledled Cymru mae gennym record dda o bethau'n cael eu gwneud yn deg ac mewn ffordd sydd y tu hwnt i ddrwgdybiaeth.

O ran Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, gobeithio bod y problemau a gafwyd yn y gorffennol wedi'u datrys. Fel y dywedwch, yr oedd yn fater difrifol, a rhaid i bobl fod yn holol hyderus am y ffordd y cynhelir etholiadau. Byddaf yn siarad â'm swyddogion eto i sicrhau bod pawb yn teimlo'n hyderus na fydd y camymddwyn a welwyd yn y gorffennol yn cael ei ailadrodd.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4  
OAQ1064(LGP) yn ôl.

**Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus**  
**Improving Public Services**

**Q5 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on how Welsh Assembly Government policies have improved public services in Wales? OAQ1070(LGP)

**Q5 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ1070(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The First Minister reported on improvements to public services in his First Minister's report for 2006. Just to give a flavour of that, we are trebling capital investment in the health service and training more doctors, nurses and other health professionals in Wales than ever before. We have also achieved a huge reduction in the long waiting times for treatment.

**Sue Essex:** Cyflwynodd y Prif Weinidog adroddiad ar welliannau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn adroddiad y Prif Weinidog am 2006. I roi blas o hynny, yr ydym yn treblu'r cyfalaf sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac yn hyfforddi mwy o feddygon, nyrssys a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yng Nghymru nag erioed o'r blaen. Yr ydym hefyd wedi sicrhau gostyngiad mawr yn yr amseroedd aros hir am driniaeth.

**Mick Bates:** I am certain that some of those measures will be greeted with great pleasure, but I will address the decline in Powys County Council's funding relative to other Welsh councils over the past years. According to other formula changes, Powys could lose another £6 million. How do you expect an extremely rural council like Powys to deliver quality public services when the cumulative formula changes have such a negative impact on its ability to do so?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff rhai o'r mesurau hynny groeso mawr, ond af i'r afael â'r lleihad yng nghyllid Cyngor Sir Powys o'i gymharu â chynghorau eraill yng Nghymru dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Yn unol â newidiadau eraill yn y fformiwlau, gallai Powys golli £6 miliwn arall. Sut yr ydych yn disgwyl i gyngor gwledig iawn fel Powys ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon pan fydd y newidiadau cronnol yn y fformiwlau yn cael effaith mor negyddol ar ei allu i wneud hynny?

**Sue Essex:** You will have heard my answers to some of the other questions. We work the formula right across Wales and across the political parties in order to make it fair. The interesting thing is that, when you do it in an anonymous way, you can put those changes in without necessarily knowing the implications for individual authorities. That is an extremely fair way to do it.

**Sue Essex:** Byddwch wedi clywed fy atebion i rai o'r cwestiynau eraill. Yr ydym yn gweithredu'r fformiwlau ar draws Cymru gyfan ac ar draws y pleidiau gwleidyddol i'w gwneud yn deg. Y peth diddorol, pan wneir hynny mewn ffordd anhysbys, yw y gallwch gyflwyno'r newidiadau hynny heb wybod, o reidrwydd, y goblygiadau i awdurdodau unigol. Mae hynny'n ffordd deg iawn o'i wneud.

Powys has a high percentage of support per head; I think that it is about fifth or sixth in this regard. I will check it out for you so that you know. It may not be quite as high as that. However, I think that it is the highest of all of the rural authorities. Gwynedd is higher because, although it is mainly rural in terms of geography, it has a strong urban population, which Powys does not have. Therefore, it still has a high level of per-head

Mae Powys yn cael canran uchel o gymorth y pen; credaf ei fod tua'r pumed neu'r chweched yn hynny. Byddaf yn cadarnhau hynny er mwyn i chi wybod. Efallai nad yw mor uchel â hynny. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai dyma'r ganran uchaf o'r holl awdurdodau gwledig. Mae Gwynedd yn uwch oherwydd, er ei bod yn ardal wledig yn bennaf o ran daearyddiaeth, mae ganddi boblogaeth drefol gref nad yw i'w chael ym Mhowys. Felly,

support from the Assembly Government. However, I realise that there are costs; Glyn raised some of these last week. There are difficult costs for an authority like Powys. That is why we were keen under 'Making the Connections' to support some of its bids—the linked bids with Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire, and other authorities—to get a cross-boundary service delivery and cross-boundary contracts, which will reduce the cost per unit in many of the areas. In fairness to Powys, it understands that. I have had conversations with both the leader and the chief executive, who know that they have a difficult situation with regard to their schools. I think that Powys has around 28 per cent surplus places. That is difficult for it to deal with, but it knows that it has to make moves on it to ensure that it is using resources in the best way.

**David Lloyd:** Minister, how many local authorities are likely to meet the April job evaluation deadline in terms of the equal pay legislation?

**Sue Essex:** That is unknown, because there are two elements of implementing the equal pay legislation: the job evaluation and putting in place the re-assessed pay for the jobs post April and dealing with the backpay. In terms of dealing with the backpay, only three local authorities have applied for capitalisation. That does not mean that others will not do deal with it; some authorities who have not applied for capitalisation may have adequate reserves. That does not mean that there may not be some authorities that will implement the job evaluation without dealing with backpay. I will not be able to give you an accurate answer on that until a few weeks after the deadline.

**David Lloyd:** On to the backpay aspect, are you confident that authorities have the funding resources to meet that?

**Sue Essex:** Each one has had the responsibility of looking at that. Both Jane and I have spent a lot of time visiting and talking to local authorities and meeting representatives of the WLGA, the unions and so on to try to ascertain what the cost of backpay might be for local authorities and

mae'n parhau i gael lefel uchel o gymorth y pen gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolaf fod yna gostau; soniodd Glyn am rai o'r costau hyn yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae yna gostau anodd i awdurdod fel Powys. Dyna pam yr oeddem yn awyddus o dan 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' i gefnogi rhai o'i cheisiadau—y ceisiadau ar y cyd â Cheredigion, sir Gaerfyrddin, ac awdurdodau eraill—i gael gwasanaethau trawsffiniol a chontractau trawsffiniol, a fydd yn lleihau'r gost fesul uned mewn nifer o'r ardaloedd. Er tegwch i Bowys, mae'n deall hynny. Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r arweinydd a'r prif weithredwr, sy'n ymwybodol eu bod yn wynebu sefyllfa anodd o ran eu hysgolion. Credaf fod gan Bowys tua 28 y cant o leoedd gwag. Mae'n sefyllfa anodd i'r sir, ond mae'n gwybod bod angen iddi gymryd camau i sicrhau ei bod yn defnyddio adnoddau yn y ffordd orau.

**David Lloyd:** Weinidog, sawl awdurdod lleol sy'n debygol o fodloni'r terfyn amser ym mis Ebrill ar gyfer gwerthuso swyddi o ran y ddeddfwriaeth ar gyflog cyfartal?

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw hynny'n wybyddus, gan fod dwy elfen yn gysylltiedig â gweithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth cyflog cyfartal: gwerthuso swyddi a gweithredu'r cyflog wedi ei ailasesu ar gyfer y swyddi ar ôl mis Ebrill, a delio â'r ôl-gyflog. O ran delio â'r ôl-gyflog, dim ond tri awdurdod lleol sydd wedi gwneud cais am gyfalafiad. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na fydd awdurdodau eraill yn delio â hyn; mae'n bosibl bod gan rai awdurdodau nad ydynt wedi gwneud cais am gyfalafiad ddigon o arian wrth gefn. Mae'n ddigon possibl y bydd rhai awdurdodau'n gwerthuso swyddi heb ddelio ag ôl-gyflog. Ni fyddaf yn gallu rhoi ateb cywir ichi ar hynny tan ychydig wythnosau ar ôl y terfyn amser.

**David Lloyd:** O ran ôl-gyflog, a ydych yn hyderus bod gan awdurdodau yr arian i'w dalu?

**Sue Essex:** Mae pob awdurdod wedi bod yn gyfrifol am edrych ar hynny. Mae Jane a minnau wedi treulio llawer o amser yn ymweld ag awdurdodau lleol, yn siarad â hwy ac yn cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr CLILC, yr undebau ac ati i geisio gweld beth all cost yr ôl-gyflog fod i awdurdodau lleol, a sut y

how they should go ahead. As you will know, I have tried to encourage local authorities to move as fast as they can on this. If they need capitalisation, which is my part of the equation, then they should put in the bids. I have been disappointed that we have received only three. However, we have spoken to a few additional authorities that we thought might be able to put in a bid, but they have not done so. It is important that they move on this.

In fairness to local authorities, there are some practical difficulties around agreements with trade unions locally and nationally. The Welsh public sector unions that I have spoken to have been extremely good and extremely understanding; they want to move this forward for their members, but we realise that there is a whole England, Scotland and Wales dimension to this, which sometimes makes progress slow.

**Bryngle Williams:** Minister, I am sure that you have read the recent report on Gypsy/Travellers produced by the University of Birmingham, which highlighted the poor provision of services by local authorities in north Wales. Regrettably, Flintshire has 10 unauthorised sites and only one is provided by the local authority. What are you doing to ensure that local authorities provide official sites where they are needed so that we can reduce the number of illegal sites and encampments on private land?

**Sue Essex:** I will take you back a few weeks to the other side of Christmas, Brynle, when, as you know—or perhaps you have forgotten—I put the extra capital money into this for local authorities to do just what you said. Therefore, I hope that you agree that that was a good move.

2.30 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Michael German):** One way in which you can provide public services with

dylent symud ymlaen. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi ceisio annog awdurdodau lleol i symud ymlaen ar hyn cyn gynted â phosibl. Os oes angen cyfalafiad arnynt, sef fy rhan i yn yr hafaliad, yna dylent gyflwyno'r ceisiadau. Yr wyf wedi bod yn siomedig mai dim ond tri chais yr ydym wedi'u cael. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi siarad â rhai awdurdodau eraill a allai gyflwyno cais, yn ein barn ni, ond nid ydynt wedi gwneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig iddynt weithredu ar hyn.

Er tegwch i awdurdodau lleol, maent yn wynebu rhai anawsterau ymarferol o ran cytundebau gydag undebau llafur yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol. Mae'r undebau llafur yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy wedi bod yn dda iawn ac yn amyneddgar iawn; maent am weithredu ar y mater hwn ar gyfer eu haelodau, ond sylweddolwn fod hyn yn cynnwys Cymru, Lloegr a'r Alban, sydd weithiau'n arafu'r cynydd.

**Bryngle Williams:** Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi darllen yr adroddiad yn ddiweddar ar Sipsiwn/Teithwyr a gynhyrchwyd gan Brifysgol Birmingham ac a oedd yn tynnu sylw at safon wael y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol yn y gogledd. Yn anffodus, mae gan sir y Fflint 10 o safleoedd heb eu hawdurdodi ac un yn unig sy'n cael ei ddarparu gan yr awdurdod lleol. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn darparu safleoedd swyddogol lle y mae eu hangen, fel y gallwn leihau nifer y safleoedd a'r gwersyloedd anghyfreithlon ar dir preifat?

**Sue Essex:** Hoffwn fynd â chi yn ôl ychydig wythnosau cyn y Nadolig, Brynle, pan roddais, fel y gwyddoch—neu efallai eich bod wedi anghofio—yr arian cyfalaf ychwanegol ar gyfer hyn er mwyn i awdurdodau lleol wneud yr union beth yr oeddech yn sôn amdano. Felly, gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno i hynny fbod yn gam da.

**Arweinydd Democraidaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Un ffordd o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gyda

some certainty, particularly local services, is to give them certainty over the method of their funding. Sir Michael Lyons was charged with the job of looking at local government funding, and he was then given a supplementary job, which postponed the decision of making arrangements that would help local authorities in Wales to understand their future. Then, just before Christmas, when we were expecting his report, extra work was added again. Do you not think that it would have been better had this matter been dealt with and concluded by the end of the second Assembly, so that the electors of Wales could make a decision based on it?

**Sue Essex:** In fairness to us, yes, that would have helped; there is no doubt about it. However, there was a general agreement that these extra areas that the Chancellor asked Sir Michael Lyons to look at gave him a much wider prospectus, and one that I think he was on record as welcoming. We all expect his report to come out around the time of the budget, in March.

As regards what we have done about certainty of funding, as we have discussed this afternoon—and as, I guess, you will discuss many times in future—there are always changes to the formula. That is inevitable. Our population numbers have changed, and that is a big driver of the formula. It is understandable that the figures change every year when the data come in. I have done my best to give local authorities as much certainty as I can. Everything now is open and transparent in a way that it never was in the past. We all sit around a table together and we share the information. Therefore, regardless of whether local government likes the outcomes when it sees the final figures, there is a general understanding of, and respect for, the fact that I have done my best to make that process transparent. When we get to the three-year-funding streams, there will be as much stability as we can get. We have an agreement on what will be stable and where adjustments will be made year on year, depending on the figures.

rhywfaint o sicrwydd, yn enwedig gwasanaethau lleol, yw drwy roi sicrwydd iddynt ynglŷn â dull eu hariannu. Syr Michael Lyons a gafodd y dasg o ystyried ariannu llywodraeth leol, ac yna cafodd dasg arall, a ohiriodd y penderfyniad o wneud trefniadau a fyddai'n helpu awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i ddeall eu dyfodol. Yna, ychydig cyn y Nadolig, pan oeddym yn disgwyl cael ei adroddiad, rhoddwyd rhagor o waith eto iddo. Oni chredwch y byddai wedi bod yn well ped ymdrinnid â'r mater hwn erbyn diwedd yr ail Gynulliad, fel y gallai etholwyr Cymru wneud penderfyniad yn seiliedig arno?

**Sue Essex:** I fod yn deg â ni, cytunaf, byddai hynny wedi bod o gymorth; heb os nac oni bai. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd cytundeb cyffredinol fod y meysydd ychwanegol hyn y gofynnodd y Canghellor i Syr Michael Lyons eu hystyried wedi rhoi cylch gorchwyl llawer ehangach iddo, gorchwyl yr oedd yn ei chroesawu'n gyhoeddus, mi gredaf. Yr ydym i gyd yn disgwyl iddo gyhoeddi ei adroddiad tuag adeg y gyllideb, ym mis Mawrth.

O ran yr hyn a wnaethom ynglŷn â sicrwydd ariannu, fel yr ydym wedi ei drafod y prynhawn yma—ac fel y byddwch yn ei drafod lawer gwaith yn y dyfodol, mi dybiaf—mae'r fformiwla'n newid o hyd. Mae hynny'n anochel. Mae ein ffigurau ynglŷn â'r boblogaeth wedi newid, ac mae hynny'n ysgogydd mawr o ran y fformiwla. Mae'n ddealladwy bod y ffigurau'n newid bob blwyddyn pan ddaw'r data i mewn. Gwneuthum fy ngorau i roi cymaint o sicrwydd â phosibl i awdurdodau lleol. Mae popeth yn agored ac yn eglur erbyn hyn mewn modd na fu erioed yn y gorffennol. Byddwn i gyd yn eistedd o amgylch bwrdd gyda'n gilydd gan rannu'r wybodaeth. Felly, p'un a fydd a yw llywodraeth leol yn hoffi'r ffigurau terfynol neu beidio pan fydd yn eu gweld, mae'n deall ac yn parchu'r ffaith imi wneud fy ngorau i sicrhau bod y broses honno'n eglur. Pan ddown at y ffrydiau ariannu tair blynedd, byddwn yn sicrhau cymaint o sefydlogrwydd ag y gallwn. Yr ydym wedi dod i gytundeb ynglŷn â'r hyn a fydd yn sefydlog a'r hyn a gaiff ei addasu o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, gan ddibynnu ar y ffigurau.

**Michael German:** Does it not concern you, Minister, that we will have the report at a time that will make it almost impossible to discuss the merits or demerits of any proposals in the National Assembly? Would it not have been better to have the report before us now, so that we could debate the future of local government finance well in advance of the elections, instead of its becoming an issue that we will interpret during the election campaign without having had a substantive debate on it in the Chamber? It seems to me that the general postponement of these issues has not been in the interests of Wales but rather in the interests of England, where extra matters have been added to suit them.

**Sue Essex:** Commissioning the report was to support the Chancellor in his dealings with the budget at a UK level. I think that everyone finds that completely understandable—I know that you do not, but I think that most other people do. We have had lots of discussions around the area that Lyons was dealing with: the committee made a report; Sir Michael Lyons has been here; the committee went up to see him; and I have given my response. I think that the issues will be around methods and forms of taxation, and not about quanta of money. Most of the debate here, and most of the issues for local government, will be about the money that they will have to deliver services. Therefore, I do not imagine that there will be a great deal of angst when you come back in May. I am sure that those of you who do come back will make that an early priority in your discussions, as you are perfectly entitled to do.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 6  
OAQ1037(LGP) is withdrawn.

**Michael German:** Onid yw'n achosi pryder ichi, Weinidog, y byddwn yn cael yr adroddiad ar adeg pan fydd hi bron yn amhosibl trafod manteision neu anfanteision unrhyw gynigion yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Oni fyddai wedi bod yn well pe baem wedi cael yr adroddiad ger ein bron yn awr, fel y gallem drafod dyfodol ariannu llywodraeth leol ymhell cyn yr etholiadau, yn hytrach nag i hynny fod yn fater y byddwn yn ei ddehongli yn ystod yr ymgyrch etholiadol heb gael trafodaeth wirioneddol arno yn y Siambra? Ymddengys imi mai er budd Lloegr, lle yr ychwanegwyd materion ychwanegol er mwyn eu bodloni, yn hytrach nag er budd Cymru y gwnaed y penderfyniad i ohirio'r materion hyn yn gyffredinol.

**Sue Essex:** Diben comisiynu'r adroddiad oedd helpu'r Canghellor yn ei ymwneud â'r gyllideb ar lefel y DU. Credaf fod pawb yn derbyn hynny'n llwyr—gwn nad ydych chi'n ei dderbyn, ond credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ei dderbyn. Cawsom lawer o drafodaethau am y maes yr oedd Lyons yn ymdrin ag ef: cyflwynodd y pwylgor adroddiad; bu Syr Michael Lyons yma; aeth y pwylgor i'w weld; ac yr wyf wedi ymateb. Credaf mai ynglŷn â dulliau a mathau o drethiant yn hytrach na faint o arian a godir y bydd materion yn codi. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r ddadl yma, a'r rhan fwyaf o'r materion sy'n codi i lywodraeth leol, yn ymwneud â'r arian a gânt i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Felly, ni chredaf y bydd rhyw gyffro mawr pan ddewch yn ôl ym mis Mai. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y rheini ohonoch a fydd yn dychwelyd yn rhoi blaenoriaeth gynnar i hynny yn eich trafodaethau, ac mae gennych berffaith hawl i wneud hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 6  
OAQ1037(LGP) yn ôl.

### Rhyddhad Ardrethi Busnesau Gwledig Rural Business Rate Relief

**Q7 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on rural business rate relief in Mid and West Wales? OAQ1047(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** The National Assembly for Wales has approved legislation to close the rural rate relief scheme and to introduce a

**Q7 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ryddhad ardrethi busnesau gwledig yn Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ1047(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru wedi cymeradwyo deddfwriaeth i roi terfyn ar y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi

small business rate relief scheme from 1 April 2007, which will apply to businesses across Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** I know that you will agree that entrepreneurship is important, but small businesses are the backbone of that, especially in Mid and West Wales. Do you not think that it is concerning that, under your Government, only businesses with a rateable value of £2,000 or less will receive a 50 per cent discount on their rates? Do you agree with the Federation of Small Businesses that setting this level so low means that a great many businesses will be unable to benefit from it? That is especially the case since the 2005 re-evaluation. Many important newly established small businesses in Mid and West Wales have already written to me to complain about this. They are already talking about having to make cuts, possibly by letting go of employees or by cutting back on production, and therefore overheads. My concern is that that will discourage any future reinvestment by those businesses in a very important developing area. Do you not think that you should have realised that high property rental values do not necessarily denote wealthy or vibrant businesses?

**Sue Essex:** I think that you are confusing two things. Your last point is made on the basis of revaluation and how businesses are revalued. I have made the point that I am not particularly happy with rental values being used as a basis for assessing business. However, that is different from the business rate relief scheme, which I introduced. I do not remember the Federation of Small Businesses saying that it was so low. As an organisation working on behalf of small businesses, of course the FSB would argue for the threshold to go up. I would do the same in its place, and you would expect the FSB to do so. However, it was extremely pleased that we were introducing a small business rate relief scheme. More than half of businesses in Wales get relief from this scheme. More than half, Lisa, so it is no good shaking your head, because those are the figures.

I have found that people have spent a long time consulting very openly on this. Of

gwledig, a chyflwyno cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnesau bach o 1 Ebrill 2007, a fydd yn gymwys i fusnesau ledled Cymru.

**Lisa Francis:** Gwn y byddwch yn cytuno bod entrepreneuriaeth yn bwysig, ond busnesau bach yw conglfaen hynny, yn enwedig yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Oni chredwch ei bod yn achos pryder mai dim ond busnesau sydd â gwerth ardrothol o £2,000 neu lai fydd yn cael disgownt o 50 y cant ar eu hardrethi, o dan eich llywodraeth chi? A gytunwch â Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach fod pennu'r lefel hon mor isel yn golygu y bydd llawer iawn o fusnesau'n methu â manteisio ar hyn? Mae hynny'n arbennig o wir ers yr ailbrisio yn 2005. Mae nifer o fusnesau bach pwysig sydd newydd eu sefydlu yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin eisoes wedi ysgrifennu ataf i gwyno am hyn. Maent eisoes yn sôn am orfod gwneud toriadau, hwyrach drwy ddileu swyddi neu gynhyrchu llai, a gorbenion drwy hynny. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhryderu i yw y bydd hynny'n darbwyllo'r busnesau hynny i beidio ag ailfuddsoddi yn y dyfodol, a hynny mewn maes pwysig sy'n datblygu. Oni chredwch y dylech fod wedi sylweddoli nad yw gwerthoedd rhentu eiddo mawr o reidrwydd yn dynodi busnesau llewyrchus na bywiog?

**Sue Essex:** Credaf eich bod yn cymysgu daw beth. Gwnaed eich pwnt olaf ar sail ailbrisio a sut y caiff busnesau eu hailbrisio. Yr wyf wedi esbonio nad wyf yn fodlon iawn â defnyddio gwerthoedd rhentu fel sail i asesu busnesau. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n wahanol i'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau, a gyflwynwyd gennylf. Ni chofiaf fod Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach wedi dweud ei fod mor isel. Fel sefydliad sy'n gweithio ar ran busnesau bach, byddai'r Ffederasiwn, wrth reswm, yn dadlau dros godi'r trothwy. Byddwn innau'n gwneud hynny yn ei lle, a byddech yn disgwyl i'r Ffederasiwn wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn hynod falch ein bod yn cyflwyno cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach. Mae dros hanner y busnesau yng Nghymru yn cael rhyddhad o dan y cynllun hwn. Dros hanner, Lisa, felly peidiwch ag ysgwyd eich pen, oherwydd dyna'r ffigurau.

Cefais fod pobl wedi treulio amser maith yn ymgynghori'n agored iawn ynglŷn â hyn.

course we would like to give an unlimited amount; we would all like to do that. We have had this discussion before on the budget, and we had a mature and reasonable discussion in committee. No amendments were tabled, because the general view was that this was a good attempt to get a consistent scheme across Wales that did not depend on where the boundary fell.

In a year or two years' time, we shall monitor this—and I shall not be here, but I have given that commitment. It is the first time that we have had a small business rate relief scheme and a post office relief scheme in Wales, and so they need to be monitored. My impression is that people are very pleased. We shall have to wait and see how it works, and, if needs be, I am sure that there are people here who can make minor amendments. We have put £17.2 million in the budget for this, which is a lot of money to provide relief. Instead of being churlish, one should say, 'Let us see how this goes', and support it.

Wrth reswm, hoffem fod wedi rhoi swm diderfyn; hoffai pob un ohonom wneud hynny. Cawsom y drafodaeth hon o'r blaen ynglŷn â'r gyllideb, a chawsom drafodaeth aeddfed a rhesymol yn y pwylgor. Ni chyflwynwyd unrhyw welliannau, oherwydd y farn gyffredinol oedd bod hon yn ymgais dda i gael cynllun cyson ledled Cymru nad oedd yn dibynnu ar ffiniau.

Ymheneblwyddyn neu ddwy, byddwn yn ei fonitro—ac ni fyddaf fi yma, ond yr wyf wedi gwneud yr addewid hwnnw. Dyma'r tro cyntaf inni gynnig cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach a chynllun rhyddhad i swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru, ac felly mae angen eu monitro. Yr argraff a gefais oedd fod pobl yn falch iawn. Amser a ddengys sut y bydd yn gweithio, ac os bydd angen, mae yma bobl, yr wyf yn sicr, a all wneud mân welliannau. Yr ydym wedi neilltuo £17.2 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer hyn, sy'n swm mawr i ddarparu rhyddhad. Yn lle bod yn anfoddog, dylai rhywun ddweud, 'Cawn weld sut y bydd hyn yn gweithio', a'i gefnogi.

### **Ardrethi Busnes Business Rates**

**Q8 Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of business rates? OAQ1071(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** On a similar subject, from 1 April 2007, the majority of businesses in Wales are likely to be in receipt of small business or other statutory relief. Future changes to the non-domestic rating system will be considered in the light of the Lyons report. As we discussed earlier with Mike, that is likely to be published in March.

**Kirsty Williams:** When you introduce the new small business rate relief scheme, you will be aware that, although the number of businesses that can apply for this will increase as it removes the population basis for applications, some businesses used to receiving rate relief may not qualify, although a hardship grant is available to compensate those businesses. You said that you would undertake to write to authorities to issue guidance on how they should apply this. I am concerned that there are certain

**Q8 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol ardrethi busnes? OAQ1071(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Ar fater tebyg, ar ôl 1 Ebrill 2007 mae'r rhan fwyaf o fusnesau yng Nghymru yn debygol o gael rhyddhad busnesau bach neu fath arall o ryddhad statudol. Caiff newidiadau yn y system ardrethi annomesig yn y dyfodol eu hystyried yng ngoleuni adroddiad Lyons. Fel y trafodwyd yn gynharach gyda Mike, mae hwnnw'n debygol o gael ei gyhoeddi ym mis Mawrth.

**Kirsty Williams:** Pan fyddwch yn cyflwyno'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi newydd i fusnesau bach, fe wyddoch, er y bydd nifer y busnesau a all wneud cais am hyn yn cynyddu wrth iddo ddileu sail poblogaeth ar gyfer ceisiadau, efallai na fydd rhai busnesau a arferai gael rhyddhad ardrethi yn gymwys, er bod grant caledi ar gael i'r busnesau hynny i wneud iawn am hynny. Dywedasoch y byddech yn ysgrifennu at awdurdodau i roi canllawiau ar y ffordd y dylent ddefnyddio hyn. Yr wyf yn pryderu

elements in Powys County Council that are unwilling to put forward the money that, as a local authority, it needs in order to draw down the money that you are offering to give Powys, and that that will be detrimental to businesses in Brecon and Radnorshire. Will you confirm that you have written to local authorities and tell us what guidance you have given them to ensure that they access the money available to businesses that may suffer hardship?

**Sue Essex:** I thought that this was a sensible way to deal with those businesses that you described. I wrote to all local authorities on 17 January. I would be happy to send you a copy of the letter, so that you can see it for yourself.

bod rhai elfennau yng Nghyngor Sir Powys yn anfodlon cynnig yr arian y bydd angen iddo'i gynnig, fel awdurdod lleol, er mwyn hawlio'r arian yr ydych yn cynnig ei roi i Bowys, ac y bydd hynny'n niweidiol i fusnesau ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed. A wnewch chi gadarnhau eich bod wedi ysgrifennu at awdurdodau lleol a dweud wrthym pa ganllawiau a roesoch iddynt i sicrhau eu bod yn hawlio'r arian sydd ar gael i fusnesau a all wynebu caledi?

**Sue Essex:** Yr oeddwn yn credu bod hon yn ffordd synhwyrol i ymdrin â'r busnesau hynny a ddisgrifiwch. Ysgrifennais at bob awdurdod lleol ar 17 Ionawr. Byddwn yn fodlon anfon copi o'r llythyr atoch, fel y gallwch ei weld eich hun.

### Cefnogi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Lleol Supporting Local Public Services

**Q9 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister outline Assembly Government measures to support local public services in Montgomeryshire? OAQ1069(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** We have moved from Wales to Montgomeryshire, so I am sure that you feel comfortable now, Mick. Powys will receive £170 million in Assembly Government funding for 2007-08, which is an increase of 3.7 per cent on 2006-07. We also announced an extra £1.28 million of funding in June 2006 to improve access to NHS dentistry in Powys and across the other local health boards in the Mid and West Wales region.

**Q9 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu mesurau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus lleol yn sir Drefaldwyn? OAQ1069(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydym wedi symud o Gymru i sir Drefaldwyn, felly, byddwch yn teimlo'n gyfforddus yn awr, Mick, mae'n siŵr. Caiff Powys £170 miliwn o arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2007-08, sef cynnydd o 3.7 y cant o'i gymharu â 2006-07. Cyhoeddwyd hefyd £1.28 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol ym mis Mehefin 2006 i'w gwneud yn haws cael gwasanaethau deintyddiaeth y GIG ym Mhowys ac ar draws y byrddau iechyd lleol eraill yn rhanbarth y canolbarth a'r gorllewin.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for the answer, Minister. I think that I addressed the issues of Powys's position in my first question about public services, so I would now like to examine the work undertaken within your Cabinet when you come to decide on your relocation strategy. It has a massive impact in areas of low-wage economies, such as Powys.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch am yr ateb, Weinidog, Credaf imi ymdrin â sefyllfa Powys yn fy nghwestiwn cyntaf ynglyn â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Felly, hoffwn yn awr ystyried y gwaith a wneir yn eich Cabinet pan fyddwch yn penderfynu'ch strategaeth adleoli. Mae'n cael effaith enfawr mewn ardaloedd lle mae economi cyflog isel, megis Powys.

2.40 p.m.

Government jobs are extremely sustainable and, therefore, are helpful in providing public services. Recently, we argued about our

Mae swyddi'r llywodraeth yn hynod gynaliadwy, ac felly maent yn ddefnyddiol i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yn

losses in Machynlleth, but we are now threatened with losing a further 47 jobs in the Welshpool tax office. What discussions have taken place in the Cabinet to decide how we could bring some continuity to employment through public services in extremely rural areas such as Powys?

ddiweddgar, cawsom ddadl ynglŷn â'r swyddi a gollwyd ym Machynlleth, ond yr ydym bellach yn wynebu bygythiad o golli 47 o swyddi eraill yn swyddfa dreth y Trallwng. Pa drafodaethau a fu yn y Cabinet i benderfynu sut y gallem sicrhau rhywfaint o barhad cyflogaeth drwy wasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn ardaloedd gwledig iawn megis Powys?

**Sue Essex:** That is a fair point, and you will have heard the First Minister's answer yesterday. On our relocation strategy, there was a movement of jobs from Machynlleth to Aberystwyth, which is not too far away. I know that there were some concerns, but I believe that they have, largely, abated now. One interesting thing that we must do with the spatial plan, particularly looking at central Wales, is try to focus on ensuring that there is sustainable employment in those key settlements, which can be accessed by a dispersed community in rural areas. It is a shame to lose any jobs—I understand that. However, if that happens, we need to ensure that we have the right priorities to try to direct and support work going in to those areas that matter. Working with local authorities, we can take a much more proactive approach to those key settlements and towns that will provide employment.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg, a byddwch wedi clywed ateb y Prif Weinidog ddoe. O ran ein strategaeth adleoli, symudwyd swyddi o Fachynlleth i Aberystwyth, nad yw'n rhy bell. Gwn fod yna rai pryderon, ond credaf eu bod wedi lleddfu erbyn hyn. Un peth diddorol y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud gyda'r cynllun gofodol, yn enwedig wrth edrych ar y canolbarth, yw ceisio canolbwytio ar sicrhau bod cyflogaeth gynaliadwy yn yr aneddiadau allweddol hynny, sydd o fewn cyrraedd i gymuned wasgaredig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'n drueni colli unrhyw swyddi—deallaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, os digwydd hynny, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym y blaenoriaethau cywir i geisio cyfeirio a chefnogi swyddi sy'n mynd i'r ardaloedd hynny sy'n bwysig. O weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol, gallwn fod lawer yn fwy rhagweithiol o ran yr aneddiadau a'r trefi allweddol hynny a fydd yn darparu cyflogaeth.

### **Gwella Mynediad i Wasanaethau Cyhoeddus Improving Access to Public Services**

**Q10 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on improving access to public services for older people in Wales? OAQ1041(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** As set out in 'Delivering Beyond Boundaries', we will encourage the development of single entry points to services for all citizens. A good example for older people is Link-age Wales, which is a joint Assembly Government/Department for Work and Pensions initiative with local government, which will initially concentrate on maximising the take-up of benefits.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Thank you for your answer. Do you agree that creating a more

**Q10 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynglŷn â gwella gallu pobl hŷn yng Nghymru i gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ1041(LGP)

**Sue Essex:** Fel sydd wedi ei osod allan yn 'Cyflawni Ar Draws Ffiniau', byddwn yn annog datblygu pwyntiau mynediad unigol i wasanaethau ar gyfer pob dinesydd. Enghraift dda i bobl hŷn yw Cysyllt-oed, sy'n fenter ar y cyd rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynlluniad/yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a llywodraeth leol, a fydd yn canolbwytio i ddechrau ar sicrhau bod y nifer mwyaf posibl yn gwneud cais am fudd-daliadau.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Diolch am eich ateb. A gytunwch fod creu fframwaith gwasanaeth

responsive, citizen-focused and effective public service framework in Wales, as set out in 'Making the Connections', must be at the centre of public service improvements across Wales? Would you also agree that piloting free train travel for older people, as the Welsh Assembly Government is doing through the Conwy valley, along with free bus travel, demonstrates a continued commitment to delivering for older people across Wales?

**Sue Essex:** The free bus travel scheme continues to get much applause and a good response from older people. I do not know about you, but I travel on the buses in my area, and I know that it gives people enormous pleasure to get their passes and access the bus service. The other day, I was talking to a pensioner who travels all over south Wales on the bus and has an enormous amount of fun; he said that he would not have done that without his free bus pass. Your point on 'Making the Connections' is about this idea of trying to get one-stop-shop approaches for people, particularly older people, to save them from having to go from pillar to post, from phone to phone, and from number to number. That is what Link-age is trying to do; if older people are entitled to benefits, it ensures that they can take them up, as well as any associated benefits. Having that one-stop shop and being able to sit down face to face with someone to go through that is a useful way of going forward, dealing with older people. Therefore, there are some good initiatives around that will enhance the lives of older people.

cyhoeddus mwy ymatebol, effeithiol sy'n canolbwytio ar ddinasyddion yng Nghymru, fel sydd wedi ei osod allan yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', yn gorfod bod yn ganolog i welliannau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ledled Cymru? A gytunwch hefyd fod treialu teithiau trêñ am ddim i bobl hŷn, fel y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud yn nyffryn Conwy, ynghyd â theithiau bws am ddim, yn dangos ymrwymiad parhaus i ddarparu ar gyfer pobl hŷn ledled Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r cynllun teithio ar fws am ddim yn parhau i gael llawer o ganmoliaeth ac ymateb da gan bobl hŷn. Wn i ddim amdanoch chi, ond byddaf fi'n teithio ar y bysiau yn fy ardal, a gwn ei fod yn rhoi pleser mawr i bobl gael eu tocynnau bws ac i ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth bysiau. Y diwrnod o'r blaen, yr oeddwn yn siarad â phensiynwr sy'n teithio o amgylch y de i gyd ar y bws a dywedodd ei fod yn cael llawer iawn o hwyl; dywedodd na fyddai wedi gwneud hynny heb ei docyn bws am ddim. Mae eich sylw am 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn ymwneud â'r syniad o geisio cael gwasanaethau siop-un-stop ar gyfer pobl, yn enwedig pobl hŷn, i'w harbed rhag gorfod mynd o biler i bost, o ffôn i ffôn, ac o rif i rif. Dyna y mae Cysyllt-oed yn ceisio'i wneud; os oes gan bobl hŷn hawl i gael budd-daliadau, mae'n sicrhau y gallant eu cael, yn ogystal ag unrhyw fudd-daliadau cysylltiedig. Mae cael y siop-un-stop honno, a gallu eistedd i lawr wyneb yn wyneb â rhywun i esbonio hynny, yn ffordd ddefnyddiol i fynd ati i ddelio â phobl hŷn. Felly, mae yna rai mentrau da ar waith a fydd yn gwella bywydau pobl hŷn.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills

### Dysgu Dinasyddiaeth Citizenship Education

**Q1 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the teaching of citizenship in Wales? OAQ1181(ELL)

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** Citizenship education is embraced by the personal and social education framework. I announced on 8 January a consultation on a

**C1 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddysgu dinasyddiaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1181(ELL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Caiff addysg dinasyddiaeth ei chynnwys yn y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Ar 8 Ionawr cyhoeddais ymgynghoriad ar

proposed revised framework, which has active citizenship as one of its five key themes. That consultation period is until 30 March.

**Ann Jones:** I hope that you are aware, Minister, that the Local Government and Public Services Committee has published a report on electoral arrangements in Wales. While the committee was taking evidence, we discovered some examples of good practice in teaching democracy and politics in schools, and a general recognition that citizenship teaching and developing young people's political literacy are important aspects of education. However, it is clear that other European countries have much greater levels of political engagement. Our report recommends that we should look at teaching political literacy, and that that should specifically include teaching about political parties, as well as young people's role in the democratic process.

We go on to say that schools should be inviting voluntary, private and public service organisations, including political parties, to talk about the basic political concepts that we expect young people to consider when casting their vote. What plans do you have to ensure that young people in Wales recognise the vital role that they will play in the democratic process and that they will have the skills to participate fully in the future?

**Jane Davidson:** The committee may decide to respond to the consultation on the personal and social education curriculum. We make it clear, in the active citizenship pillar of the curriculum, that learners should explore their rights and responsibilities in a democratic society, as underpinned by the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child, that learners should be encouraged and equipped to participate in community life through service and actions that promote the wellbeing of the community, and that learners need to develop a political literacy that enables them to make effective decisions and judgments in relation to political and legal systems. We know that there has been a huge increase in issues around debating in

gynnig fframwaith diwygiedig, sy'n cynnwys dinasyddiaeth weithredol yn un o'i bum thema allweddol. Bydd y cyfnod ymgynghori hwnnw'n parhau tan 30 Mawrth.

**Ann Jones:** Gobeithio eich bod yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, fod y Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Llywodraeth Leol wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad ar drefniadau etholaethol yng Nghymru. Tra oedd y pwylgor yn cymryd tystiolaeth, daethom o hyd i enghreifftiau o arfer da wrth addysgu democratiaeth a gwleidyddiaeth mewn ysgolion, a chydabyddiaeth gyffredinol fod addysgu dinasyddiaeth a datblygu ymwybyddiaeth wleidyddol pobl ifanc yn agweddu pwysig ar addysg. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg fod gan wledydd eraill yn Ewrop lawer mwy o ymgysylltu gwleidyddol. Mae ein hadroddiad yn argymhell y dylem edrych ar gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth wleidyddol, ac y dylai hynny'n benodol gynnwys addysgu am bleidiau gwleidyddol, yn ogystal â'r rôl pobl ifanc yn y broses ddemocrataidd.

Awn ymlaen i ddweud y dylai ysgolion fod yn gwahodd sefydliadau gwirfoddol, preifat a chyhoeddus, gan gynnwys pleidiau gwleidyddol, i siarad am y cysyniadau gwleidyddol sylfaenol y disgwyliwn i bobl ifanc eu hystyried wrth bleidleisio. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn cydnabod y rhan hanfodol a fydd ganddynt yn y broses ddemocrataidd, a bod ganddynt y sgiliau i gyfranogi'n llawn yn y dyfodol?

**Jane Davidson:** Efallai y bydd y pwylgor yn penderfynu ymateb i'r ymgynghori am y cwricwlwm addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Yn y rhan o'r cwricwlwm sy'n sôn am ddinasyddiaeth weithgar, dywedwn yn glir y dylai dysgwyr archwilio'u hawliau a'u cyfrifoldebau mewn cymdeithas ddemocrataidd, fel y caint eu tanategu gan Gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn, y dylid annog a galluogi dysgwyr i fod yn rhan o fywyd cymunedol drwy wasanaeth a gweithredoedd sy'n hyrwyddo lles y gymuned, a bod angen i ddysgwyr ddatblygu llythrennedd wleidyddol sy'n eu galluogi i wneud penderfyniadau a llunio barn effeithiol am systemau gwleidyddol a chyfreithiol. Gwyddom fod

Wales, and, through the Welsh baccalaureate, there has been a lot of engagement in political systems, as young people explore the relationship between Wales, Europe and the world. The Assembly Government will be responding, through Sue Essex, in March.

**Jocelyn Davies:** How do you view the idea that all children in Welsh schools should learn our national anthem? If you like that idea, what are you prepared to do about it, and what about making it compulsory?

**Jane Davidson:** I generally resist the notion that the first way to engage with people is to say that something is to become compulsory. I would warmly welcome the notion that all children in Wales should be given the opportunity to learn the national anthem.

**William Graham:** You will know that Welsh Conservatives believe in teaching citizenship, that is, not only educating pupils about their rights but also engendering responsibility for a healthy lifestyle, the respect of other people's rights, property and the neighbourhood environment. Do you therefore agree that had Conservative policies been followed the increase in truancy and fixed-term exclusions noted in the report today from Estyn would not have happened?

**Jane Davidson:** No, I do not. The point, in terms of looking at the PSE curriculum on which the question is based, is that pupils should be encouraged and equipped to demonstrate commitment to their community. They should participate and they should understand issues around service and actions that promote the wellbeing of the community, but we must look at ensuring that we have the right curriculum for all pupils to ensure that they both attend and respond better in school. This consultation covers the ages of three to 19, and I am a great believer that providing the right kind of curriculum, as we have been moving together towards with all-party support in Wales, over the last few years, will contribute to that.

cynnydd enfawr wedi bod mewn materion yn ymwneud â thrafodaethau yng Nghymru, a thrwy fagloriaeth Cymru bu llawer o ymwneud â systemau gwleidyddol, wrth i bobl ifanc archwilio'r berthynas rhwng Cymru, Ewrop a'r byd. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymateb, drwy Sue Essex, ym mis Mawrth.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Beth yw eich barn am y syniad y dylai pob plentyn mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru ddysgu ein hanthem genedlaethol? Os ydych yn hoffi'r syniad hwnnw, beth ydych yn barod i'w wneud amdano, a beth am ei wneud yn orfodol?

**Jane Davidson:** Ar y cyfan, nid wyf o blaidd y cysniad mai'r ffordd gyntaf o ymgysylltu â phobl yw dweud bod rhywbeth yn mynd i fod yn orfodol. Byddwn yn croesawu'n fawr y syniad y dylai pob plentyn yng Nghymru gael y cyfle i ddysgu'r anthem genedlaethol.

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn credu mewn addysgu dinasyddiaeth, hynny yw, nid yn unig addysgu disgyblion am eu hawliau, ond hefyd meithrin ymdeimlad o gyfrifoldeb am ffordd iach o fyw, parchu hawliau ac eiddo pobl eraill ynghyd ag amgylchedd y gymdogaeth. A ydych felly'n cytuno, pe byddai polisiau Ceidwadol wedi cael eu dilyn, na fyddai'r cynnydd mewn triwantiaeth a'r gwahardd am gyfnodau penodol a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad gan Estyn heddiw wedi digwydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Y pwynt, wrth edrych ar y cwricwlwm ABCh y mae'r cwestiwn yn seiliedig arno, yw y dylid annog a galluogi disgyblion i ddangos eu hymrwymiad i'w cymunedau. Dylent gymryd rhan ynddynt a deall materion yn ymwneud â gwasanaeth a gweithredoedd sy'n hyrwyddo lles y gymuned. Ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym y cwricwlwm cywir i bob disgybl er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn mynchy'u'r ysgol ac yn ymateb yn well yn yr ysgol. Mae'r ymgynghori hwn yn trafod plant a phobl ifanc rhwng tair a 19 oed, ac yr wyf yn credu'n gryf y bydd darparu'r math cywir o gwricwlwm, fel yr ydym wedi bod yn symud tuag ato gyda'n gilydd gyda chefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yng Nghymru, dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, yn

cyfrannu at hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 OAQ1200(ELL) has been transferred for written answer.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 2 OAQ1200(ELL) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### Cyfnod Allweddol 3 Key Stage 3

**Q3 David Melding:** What plans does the Minister have to review key stage 3 education policy? OAQ1170(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** I announced on 8 January a consultation on proposals for revised key stage 3 curriculum and assessment arrangements. These proposals promote an approach that is more learner-centred, focused on skills, builds on key stage 2 and the foundation phase, and links effectively with the 14-19 learning pathways programme as part of the three to 19 curriculum.

**David Melding:** Thank you for that reply, Minister. I also welcome your written Cabinet statement on the literacy and numeracy levels of secondary-age pupils. I was somewhat disappointed that key stage 3 is only mentioned well into the text and that you focus on achievement at GCSE. I understand why you did that, however, unless we see skills improving at key stage 3, we will still have problems. Estyn has recently said that your previous policy, Aiming for excellence, has been fairly successful, but I think that it gives it two cheers, instead of three. We have to aim to improve the skills of the key set of pupils who are still left out during that difficult transfer from primary to secondary school—some boys, in particular, find it difficult.

**Jane Davidson:** It would take a churlish reader of the Estyn report to say that it only gave two cheers, because it says that the Aiming for Excellence programme has made a significant contribution to helping schools and local education authorities to raise standards in key stage 3.

**C3 David Melding:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i adolygu polisi addysg cyfnod allweddol 3? OAQ1170(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Ar 8 Ionawr cyhoeddais ymgynghoriad am gynigion ar gyfer diwygio'r gwricwlwm cyfnod allweddol 3 a threfniadau asesu. Mae'r cynigion hyn yn hyrwyddo dull sy'n canolbwytio'n fwy ar y dysgwr, yn canolbwytio ar sgiliau, yn adeiladu ar gyfnod allweddol 2 a'r cyfnod sylfaen, ac yn cysylltu'n effeithiol â'r rhaglen llwybrau dysgu 14-19 fel rhan o'r cwricwlwm o dair i 19 oed.

**David Melding:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'ch datganiad Cabinet ysgrifenedig ar lefelau llythrenedd a rhifedd disgyblion uwchradd. Cefais fy siomi mai prin yw'r cyfeiriad at gyfnod allweddol 3 a'ch bod yn canolbwytio ar gyflawniadau TGAU. Yr wyf yn deall pam y gwnaethoch hynny. Fodd bynnag, oni welwn fod sgiliau'n gwella yng nghyfnod allweddol 3, bydd problemau'n parhau. Yn ddiweddar, dywedodd Estyn fod eich polisi blaenorol, Anelu at Ragoriaeth, wedi bod yn wedol llwyddiannus, ond credaf ei fod yn rhoi dwy seren iddo, yn lle tair. Rhaid inni anelu at wella sgiliau'r disgyblion allweddol hynny sy'n cael eu gadael allan o hyd yn ystod y broses anodd honno o drosglwyddo o'r ysgol gynradd i'r ysgol uwchradd—mae rhai bechgyn, yn enwedig, yn ei chael hi'n anodd.

**Jane Davidson:** Darllenyydd taeogaidd fyddai'n dweud mai dim ond dwy seren a roddodd adroddiad Estyn, oherwydd mae'n dweud bod y rhaglen Anelu at Ragoriaeth wedi cyfrannu'n sylweddol at helpu ysgolion ac awdurdodau addysg lleol i godi safonau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3.

In particular, the report concludes that the areas for improvement identified in the initial report have been important drivers in the gains secured in this period in the percentage of pupils reaching the expected levels of attainment in the core subjects by the end of the key stage, and in the standards pupils achieve in lessons, and the quality of teaching as assessed by Estyn. However, I would not underestimate the challenge of the task. We have been determined to ensure that all schools undertake the quality mark to demonstrate their commitment to literacy and numeracy, and Wales outperforms other parts of the UK in that. We far outperform other parts of the UK in terms of the key skills agenda.

By having an all-age basic skills strategy, we remain determined to carry on dealing with these issues for the future. At the launch of her annual report for 2005-06, today, the chief inspector said that all of us would still want to see higher performance in the core subject indicator, but she commended the fact that the increase had been 2 per cent, after some years on a plateau. We are definitely moving in the right direction.

Yn arbennig, daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad fod y meysydd i'w gwella a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad cychwynnol wedi chwarae rhan bwysig o'r gwaith o lywio'r enillion a sicrhawyd yn ystod y cyfnod hwn o ran canran y disgyblion sy'n cyrraedd y lefelau cyrhaeddiad a ddisgwylir yn y pynciau craidd erbyn diwedd y cyfnod allweddol, ac yn y safonau a gyrhaeddir gan ddisgyblion mewn gwersi, ac ansawdd y dysgu fel y cafodd ei asesu gan Estyn. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn bychanu'r her sydd yn y dasg. Yr ydym wedi bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn ymgymryd â'r ansawdd i ddangos ei hymrwymiad i lythrennedd a rhifedd, ac mae Cymru'n perfformio'n well na rhannau eraill o'r DU yn hynny. Yr ydym yn perfformio lawer yn well na rhannau eraill o'r DU o ran yr agenda sgiliau allweddol.

Drwy lunio strategaeth sgiliau sylfaenol ar gyfer pob oed, yr ydym yn dal yn benderfynol o ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn y dyfodol. Wrth lansio'i hadroddiad blynnyddol ar gyfer 2005-06 heddiw, dywedodd y prif arolygydd y byddem i gyd am weld perfformiad uwch yn y dangosydd pynciau craidd o hyd, ond canmolodd y ffaith mai 2 y cant fu'r cynnydd, ar ôl bod ar lefel wastad am rai blynnyddoedd. Yr ydym yn sicr yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

### **Hyrwyddo Dysgu Gydol Oes Promoting Lifelong Learning**

**Q4 Denise Idris Jones:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to promote lifelong learning in Wales?  
OAQ1185(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** My department is in the process of implementing detailed marketing strategies to improve participation in lifelong learning in Wales. These include marketing specific products and provision, working with key partners to promote learning, and using data on participation to monitor progress.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Do you agree that enabling and encouraging people across Wales to take up education and lifelong learning opportunities is central to making Wales a learning country? Do you also agree

**C4 Denise Idris Jones:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru?  
OAQ1185(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae fy adran wrthi'n gweithredu strategaethau marchnata manwl i gynyddu cyfranogiad ym maes dysgu gydol oes yng Nghymru. Ymhlieth y rhain mae marchnata cynnrych a darpariaethau penodol, gweithio gyda phartneriaid allweddol i hyrwyddo dysgu, a defnyddio data am y niferoedd sy'n cyfranogi er mwyn monitro cynnydd.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A ydych yn cytuno bod galluogi ac annog pobl ledled Cymru i fanteisio ar gylleoedd addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn rhan ganolog o wneud Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod

that charging for bus transport by certain local authorities for pupils of sixth-form age to attend certain further education colleges—in my case, Llandrillo College—is a regressive step that will discourage the take-up of further education in Wales, especially vocational education?

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of the overarching approach of adult learning as a contribution to making Wales a learning country, I think that the work that we have done with the National Institute of Adult Continuing Education, for example, on adult learners' week, and others, is particularly important in encouraging adults to come into learning and to stay in learning. I hope that Members will take the opportunity to look at the new Learning Choices facility, which is part of the Careers Wales website. From anywhere in Wales, you can look for a course and find out where it is carried out and at what level. That will provide huge new opportunities for learners to start to look at their own learning.

In terms of transport for post-16 learners, local authorities are required to produce transport plans for their post-16-year-olds. Funding for the whole of the 14-19 agenda has gone up from £8.5 million in this financial year, to over £32 million in the next financial year. We fully appreciated that some of that will need to be used for transport, to ensure that we are able to widen young people's opportunities. It is essential that local authorities and others ensure that they do not put any bar in the way when our agenda is about opening up opportunities for learning.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, you have talked about promoting lifelong learning and the opportunities for it, yet the colleges are saying that the emphasis in their funding streams is directing the funding to the 14-19 courses and restricting the money that is available for lifelong learning and therefore they are having to withdraw lifelong learning courses. What assessment have you made of the number of courses that have been affected by this shift in emphasis of funding, which is a direct initiative of your Government to fund the 14-19 pathways at the cost of lifelong learning?

codi tâl ar ddisgyblion chweched dosbarth sy'n mynychu colegau addysg bellach penodol—Coleg Llandrillo yn fy achos i—am deithio ar fysiau awdurdodau lleol penodol yn gam yn ôl, a fydd yn annog pobl i beidio â manteisio ar gyfleoedd addysg bellach yng Nghymru, yn enwedig addysg alwedigaethol?

**Jane Davidson:** O ran yr ymagwedd gyffredinol at addysg oedolion fel cyfraniad at wneud Cymru'n wlad sy'n dysgu, credaf fod y gwaith a wnaed gennym gyda'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Addysg Barhaus i Oedolion, er enghraifft, ar yr wythnos addysg oedolion, ac eraill, yn bwysig iawn wrth annog oedolion i ddechrau dysgu a pharhau i wneud hynny. Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n achub ar y cyfle i edrych ar y cyfleuster Dewisiadau Dysgu newydd, sy'n rhan o wefan Gyrfa Cymru. O unrhyw fan yng Nghymru, gallwch edrych am gwrs a gweld ble y caiff ei gynnal ac ar ba lefel. Bydd hynny'n rhoi cyfleoedd newydd enfawr i ddysgwyr ddechrau edrych ar eu haddysg eu hunain.

O ran cludo dysgwyr ôl-16, mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol lunio cynlluniau cludiant ar gyfer dysgwyr ôl-16. Mae'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer yr agenda 14-19 gyfan wedi cynyddu o £8.5 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon i fwy na £32 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Yr oeddem yn sylweddoli'n iawn y bydd angen i rywfaint o'r arian hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer cludiant, er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn ehangu cyfleoedd pobl ifanc. Mae'n hanfodol i awdurdodau lleol ac eraill sicrhau na fyddant yn codi unrhyw rwystr pan yw'n hagenda ni'n ymwneud ag agror cyfleoedd dysgu.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, yr ydych wedi sôn am hyrwyddo dysgu gydol oes a'r cyfleoedd sydd ynghlwm â hynny, ac eto mae'r colegau'n dweud mai'r pwyslais yn eu ffrydianu yw defnyddio'r arian ar gyfer cyrsiau 14-19 a chyfyngu'r arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes. O ganlyniad i hynny, maent yn gorfol rhoi'r gorau i gynnig cyrsiau dysgu gydol oes. Pa asesiad a wnaed gennych o nifer y cyrsiau y mae'r newid hwn mewn pwyslais ariannu wedi effeithio arnynt, sy'n fenter uniongyrchol gan eich Llywodraeth i ariannu llwybrau 14-19 ar draul dysgu gydol oes?

**Jane Davidson:** That is absolutely not the case. The legislation requires, and always has required, delivery of education for 16 to 19-year-olds, so there has been no shift in emphasis. A duty is laid down in terms of learning for 16 to 19-year-olds, so that continues to be the emphasis. The £32.5 million that is being made available in the next financial year is additional funding for the 14-19 agenda. At the moment, I am waiting for the area network development plans, which are partnerships between local authorities, colleges and work-based learning providers in their areas, to demonstrate how they are going to use that additional funding to collaborate effectively in the interests of learners.

**Janet Ryder:** As you know, the increase in the further education colleges' funding stream was mainly taken up in funding the last phase of the pay and pension scheme—there was little money in there for growth. The money that is going into further education, as every principal seems to tell me, is going towards providing courses for 16 to 19-year-olds. Colleges do not have any other funding available to provide the lifelong learning courses that are so important to your Government to help it to achieve its aims in many of the neediest communities—it is the community outreach courses that are being cut. What assessment have you made as to how many of those courses are being cut because of funding cuts?

**Jane Davidson:** I say to you again that the legislation remains exactly as delivered in the Learning and Skills Act 2000. The legislation with regard to prioritisation of funding has not changed in any way whatsoever. We have funded additionally in terms of the pay deal for FE lecturers, supported by the whole Assembly, and we are funding additionally in terms of contributions towards provision for 14 to 19-year-olds.

**William Graham:** Do you have any plans to further strengthen the links between lifelong learning institutions and business and industry?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid dyna'r achos o gwbl. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol darparu addysg i bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 oed, ac mae bob amser wedi gwneud hynny. Felly, ni fu unrhyw newid yn y pwyslais. Mae dyletswydd wedi ei gosod o ran dysgu ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 oed, felly, dyna'r pwyslais o hyd. Mae'r £32.5 miliwn sydd ar gael yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf yn arian ychwanegol ar gyfer yr agenda 14-19. Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn aros am y cynlluniau datblygu rhwydwaith ardal, sef partneriaethau rhwng awdurdodau lleol, colegau a darparwyr dysgu yn seiliedig ar waith yn eu hardaloedd, i ddangos sut maent yn bwriadu defnyddio'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw i gydweithio'n effeithiol er lles dysgwyr.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel y gwyddoch, defnyddiwyd y cynnydd yn ffrwd ariannu colegau addysg bellach yn bennaf i ariannu'r cam olaf yn y cynllun cyflogau a phensiynau—nid oedd llawer o arian ar gael ar gyfer twf. Mae'r arian a fuddsoddir mewn addysg bellach, fel y mae pob pennaeth, mae'n ymddangos, yn ei ddweud wrthyf, yn mynd tuag at ddarparu cyrsiau i bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 oed. Nid oes arian arall ar gael o gwbl i golegau i ddarparu'r cyrsiau dysgu gydol oes sydd mor bwysig i'ch Llywodraeth i'w helpu i gyrraedd ei nodau yn nifer o'r cymunedau mwyaf anghenius—y cyrsiau allgymorth cymunedol sy'n cael eu cwtogi. Pa asesiad a wnaed gennych o faint o'r cyrsiau hynny sy'n cael eu cwtogi oherwydd cwtogi'r arian?

**Jane Davidson:** Dywedaf wrthych eto fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn dal fel y cafodd ei darparu yn y Ddeddf Dysgu a Sgiliau 2000. Nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â blaenoriaethu arian wedi newid mewn unrhyw ffordd o gwbl. Yr ydym wedi darparu arian ychwanegol o ran y cytundeb cyflog ar gyfer darlithwyr addysg bellach, ac yr ydym yn darparu arian ychwanegol o ran cyfrannu at y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer disgyblion rhwng 14 a 19 oed.

**William Graham:** A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i atgyfnerthu'r cysylltiadau rhwng sefydliadau dysgu gydol oes a busnes a diwydiant ymhellach?

**Jane Davidson:** I am keen, in the context of responding to Lord Sandy Leitch's report to Gordon Brown, for us to look substantially at the relationship between what is publicly funded and what skills and qualifications people acquire. As I said in the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's last meeting, Lord Sandy Leitch's proposition that only those courses that are delivering qualifications that are supported by employers through the sector skills councils should be publicly funded for the future resonates strongly with me, and we have already started work on looking at that so that we do not end up with young people becoming half a plumber, when they would like to become a full plumber.

**William Graham:** Do you not share my concern, particularly in relation to Lord Leitch's first report, that the majority of people now seeking employment do not have qualifications of any kind?

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of work going on in Wales, Lord Leitch was very complimentary about our employer pledge, whereby employers, working alongside employees, most notably through the Wales Union Learning Fund, ensure that employees achieve good basic skills. That must be fundamental to how we drive up future skill levels. I was pleased that he has advocated to UK Government Ministers that the first action that they should take is to take forward the employer pledge. Officials are coming to Wales shortly to talk to my officials about taking that forward in England.

**Peter Black:** In the Estyn report published today, the chief inspector once more draws attention to problems with work-based training. Nearly half of training providers still have unsatisfactory standards, compared to 28 per cent last year. This problem has been highlighted in previous reports; this is possibly the third year that the issue has been highlighted. What action are you taking to redress this imbalance?

**Jane Davidson:** Yng nghyd-destun ymateb i adroddiad yr Arglwydd Sandy Leitch i Gordon Brown, yr wyf yn awyddus inni edrych yn fanwl ar y berthynas rhwng yr hyn a ariennir yn gyhoeddus a'r sgiliau a'r cymwysterau y mae pobl yn eu hennill. Fel y dywedais yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, mae cynnig yr Arglwydd Sandy Leitch mai dim ond y cyrsiau hynny sy'n arwain at gymwysterau a gefnogir gan gyflogwyr drwy'r cynghorau sgiliau sector a ddylai gael eu hariannu'n gyhoeddus, yn cael fy nghefnogaeth i yn bendant, ac yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau gweithio ar edrych ar hynny er mwyn i ni beidio â chael pobl ifanc sy'n hanner plwmwyr pan fyddent yn hoffi bod yn blymwyr llawn.

**William Graham:** Onid ydych yn pryderu fel finnau, yn enwedig mewn perthynas ag adroddiad cyntaf yr Arglwydd Leitch, nad oes gan y mwyafrif o bobl sy'n chwilio am waith yn awr gymwysterau o fath yn y byd?

**Jane Davidson:** O ran gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen yng Nghymru, yr oedd yr Arglwydd Leitch yn llawn camoliaeth am ein haddewid i gyflogwyr, lle mae cyflogwyr, drwy weithio ochr yn ochr â chyflogion, yn enwedig drwy Gronfa Ddysgu Undebau Cymru, yn sierhau bod cyflogion yn meithrin sgiliau sylfaenol da. Rhaid i hynny fod yn rhan sylfaenol o'r broses o godi lefelau sgiliau yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod wedi dweud wrth Weinidogion Llywodraeth y DU mai'r cam cyntaf y dylent ei gymryd yw gweithredu'r addewid i gyflogwyr. Bydd swyddogion yn dod i Gymru cyn hir i siarad â'm swyddogion i am ddatblygu hynny yn Lloegr.

**Peter Black:** Yn yr adroddiad gan Estyn a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, mae'r prif arolygydd yn tynnu sylw unwaith eto at broblemau'n ymwneud â hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith. Mae gan bron hanner darparwyr hyfforddiant safonau anfoddhaol o hyd, o'u cymharu â 28 y cant y llynedd. Tynnwyd sylw at y broblem hon mewn adroddiadau blaenorol; efallai mai dyma'r drydedd flwyddyn i sylw gael ei roi i'r broblem. Pa gamau a gymerir gennych i gywiro'r anghydbwysedd hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** We now have the provider performance reviews in place, which ensure that all those who do not achieve the standards that we see as minimum from the Estyn perspective are given a chance either to improve or do not have public funding in future. We have high-quality standards that will be delivered from 2008.

It is important that the figures that you gave, mentioning the increase from 28 per cent to 45 per cent at the bottom of the Estyn assessments for work-based learning, are complemented by improved figures at the top end for work-based learning, from 14 per cent to 45 per cent. We are therefore also seeing dramatic improvements, and I maintain this Government's commitment that poor delivery will not be funded.

**Peter Black:** I am happy to acknowledge where there has been improvement, because it is important that we get improvement in this sector. However, as regards those providers who have been inspected and have had unsatisfactory reports about them from the inspector, can you give us an assurance that action is being taken in relation to them, that there is a review procedure in place, and that, if necessary, you will carry out the threat not to fund them if improvement does not happen?

3.00 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Yes, I can give you that assurance, as was reported to committee.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r adolygiadau o berfformiad darparwyr ar waith gennym yn awr, sy'n sicrhau bod y rheini nad ydynt yn cyrraedd y safonau sy'n ofynnol ym marn Estyn yn cael cyfle i wella, neu'n colli allan ar arian cyhoeddus yn y dyfodol. Mae gennym safonau uchel a gaiff eu cyflwyno o 2008 ymlaen.

Mae'n bwysig i'r ffigurau a roddwyd gennych, ac sy'n crybwyl y cynnydd o 28 y cant i 45 y cant ar waelod asesiadau Estyn ar gyfer dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, yn cael eu hategu gan ffigurau gwell ar y brig ar gyfer dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, o 14 y cant i 45 y cant. Felly, yr ydym ni hefyd yn gweld gwelliannau sylweddol, ac yr wyf yn parhau ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth hon na fydd darpariaeth wael yn cael ei hariannu.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn ddigon parod i gydnabod meysydd lle bu gwelliant, oherwydd mae'n bwysig gweld gwelliant yn y sector hwn. Fodd bynnag, o ran y darparwyr hynny a arolygwyd ac a gafodd adroddiadau anfoddhaol gan yr arolygydd, a allwch ein sicrhau bod camau'n cael eu cymryd mewn perthynas â hwy, fod yna weithdrefn adolygu ar waith, ac os oes angen, y byddwch yn gwireddu'r bygythiad i beidio â'u cyllico oni fydd gwelliant?

**Jane Davidson:** Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw ichi, fel y dywedwyd yn y pwylgor.

### Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg Welsh-medium Education

**Q5 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of Welsh-medium education in mid and west Wales? OAQ1167(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Education predominantly or partly through the medium of Welsh is fairly widely available in the counties in question, both at primary and secondary level. I expect all local education authorities to monitor demand for Welsh-medium places and organise their schools as effectively as possible.

**C5 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ1167(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae addysg sy'n bennaf neu'n rhannol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar gael yn weddol eang yn y siroedd dan sylw, ar lefel gynradd ac uwchradd. Yr wyf yn disgwyl i bob awdurdod addysg lleol fonitro'r galw am leoedd cyfrwng Cymraeg a threfnu eu hysgolion mor effeithiol â phosibl.

**Lisa Francis:** You know how important it is for village schools to be kept open in our Welsh-language heartlands, which is important in keeping the Welsh language alive. At Llanfihangel-ar-Arth in Carmarthenshire, a school hall association that was formed in the wake of the school closure found that grants were available to develop it as a community centre, but had not been available to repair the toilets, which would have enabled it to stay open as a school. It appears that your Government's budgeting rules mean that the money could be used for a community centre, but not for a school. What discussions have you had with your Cabinet colleagues to address that kind of funding anomaly, which could save from closure many schools that some local authorities may be inclined to do away with?

**Jane Davidson:** I will make several points in response to that. It is up to local authorities at the local level to ensure that they have the right number of schools in the right places for the pupils that they have in their area. There are two challenges in this: first, many schools are based on communities that were vigorous perhaps two centuries ago, but the centres of some communities have moved for the future; and secondly, there is a dramatic decrease in the number of children in Wales, which will lead, if action is not taken, to over 113,000 empty places in our schools by 2013-14.

These are the challenges that local authorities have to rise to—not whether there is funding available to mend school toilets. If the local authority determines that a school is in an appropriate place, and needs support, then our increased school buildings grant would enable that support to be given.

**Catherine Thomas:** Minister, Ysgol y Strade in Llanelli recently received an excellent inspection report from Estyn, the main findings of which highlight that the school has many outstanding features. The school gained grade 1 in all seven key areas inspected; this is a rare achievement, and, statistically, this is the best inspection result achieved by any school in Wales under the new arrangements. Will you join me,

**Lisa Francis:** Fe wyddoch mor bwysig yw cadw ysgolion pentref ar agor yn ein bröydd Cymraeg, sy'n bwysig o ran cadw'r iaith Gymraeg yn fyw. Yn Llanfihangel-ar-arth yn sir Gaerfyrddin, darganfu cymdeithas neuadd ysgol a ffurfiwyd yn sgil cau'r ysgol fod grantiau ar gael i'w datblygu fel canolfan gymunedol. Ond nid oedd y grantiau ar gael i atgyweirio'r toiledau, a fyddai wedi galluogi'r lle i ddal ar agor fel ysgol. Ymddengys fod rheolau cyllidebu eich Llywodraeth yn golygu y gellid defnyddio'r arian ar gyfer canolfan gymunedol, ond nid ar gyfer ysgol. Pa drafodaethau a fu rhyn goch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet i fynd i'r afael â'r math hwnnw o anghysondeb cyllido, a allai atal cau nifer o ysgolion y gall rhai awdurdodau lleol fod yn awyddus eu dileu?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf am wneud nifer o bwyntiau i ymateb i hynny. Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yn lleol yw sicrhau bod ganddynt y nifer cywir o ysgolion yn y mannau cywir ar gyfer y disgyblion sydd ganddynt yn eu hardal. Mae yma ddwy her: yn gyntaf, mae nifer o ysgolion yn seiliedig ar gymunedau a oedd yn fywiog ddwy ganrif yn ôl, effallai, ond mae canol rhai cymunedau wedi symud ar gyfer y dyfodol; ac yn ail, mae lleihad sylweddol yn nifer y plant yng Nghymru, a fydd yn arwain at fwy na 113,000 o leoedd gwag yn ein hysgolion erbyn 2013-14, oni chymerir camau.

Dyma'r heriau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ymateb iddynt—nid a oes cyllid ar gael i atgyweirio toiledau ysgolion. Os bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn penderfynu bod ysgol mewn man priodol, a bod angen cymorth arni, yna byddai ein grant uwch ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion yn golygu y gellid rhoi'r cymorth hwnnw.

**Catherine Thomas:** Weinidog, cafodd Ysgol y Strade yn Llanelli adroddiad arolygu ardderchog gan Estyn yn ddiweddar, ac mae'r prif ddarganfyddiadau'n pwysleisio bod gan yr ysgol nifer o nodweddion rhagorol. Enillodd yr ysgol radd 1 ym mhob un o'r saith maes allweddol a arolygwyd; mae hwn yn llwyddiant prin, ac yn ystadegol dyma'r canlyniad arolygu gorau a gafwyd gan unrhyw ysgol yng Nghymru o

Minister, in congratulating Mr Geraint Roberts, the headteacher of Ysgol y Strade, on his commitment and dedication, his excellent staff, his talented pupils, and on the support of governors and parents? I am sure that you will agree that this is an outstanding achievement that is worthy of praise.

**Jane Davidson:** One of the interesting aspects of the chief inspector's new report is the idea of operating a traffic-light system so that people can see at a glance the quality of the schools that have been inspected in the previous year. All schools that achieve grade 1s across the board in the inspection process should be congratulated, and I am absolutely delighted to support your congratulations for the particular achievements of Ysgol y Strade.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, in your earlier answer to Lisa Francis you mentioned the buildings fund and the extra money that you have put in to ensure that schools will eventually be made fit for purpose. Does your department monitor whether county councils are investing that money equitably between the Welsh-medium and English-medium sectors? I ask because governors at a Welsh-medium primary school in Llanelli have put it to me that they feel that English-medium developments in their area are being disproportionately favoured. I can only say that they have put that to me—I cannot demonstrate that it is the case—but I wonder if you monitor the relative balance of capital investment in Welsh-medium and English-medium schools. We know that there was a time when Welsh-medium schools tended to be in older nineteenth-century buildings, but, hopefully, that time is long gone. What steps are you taking to ensure that the concerns that those parents and governors have raised with me are addressed for the future? As I said, I cannot comment on whether they are accurate in what they say, but I have every reason to believe that their concerns are genuine.

**Jane Davidson:** I would be grateful if you could write to me about those particular

dan y trefniadau newydd. A ymunwch â mi, Weinidog, i longyfarch Mr Geraint Roberts, penaeth Ysgol y Strade, ar ei ymrwymiad a'i ymroddiad, ei staff rhagorol, ei ddisgyblion dawnus, a chymorth llywodraethwyr a rhieni? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod hwn yn llwyddiant rhagorol sy'n haeddu camoliaeth.

**Jane Davidson:** Un o'r agweddau diddorol ar adroddiad newydd y prif arolygydd yw'r syniad o weithredu system goleuadau traffig er mwyn i bobl weld ar unwaith ansawdd yr ysgolion a arolygwyd yn y flwyddyn flaenorol. Dylid llonyfarch pob ysgol sy'n ennill graddau 1 ym mhob maes yn y broses arolygu, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd yn ategu'ch llonyfarchion am lwyddiant penodol Ysgol y Strade.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, yn eich ateb yn gynharach i Lisa Francis, yr oeddech yn sôn am y gronfa adeiladau a'r arian ychwanegol a roesoch i sicrhau y bydd ysgolion yn addas at y diben yn y pen draw. A yw eich adran yn monitro a yw cynghorau sir yn buddsoddi'r arian hwnnw'n gyfartal rhwng y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg a'r sector cyfrwng Saesneg? Gofynnaf hynny am fod llywodraethwyr mewn ysgol gynradd Gymraeg yn Llanelli wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo bod datblygiadau drwy gyfrwng y Saesneg yn eu hardal yn cael blaenoriaeth anghymesur. Yr unig beth y gallaf ei ddweud yw eu bod wedi dweud hynny wrthyf—ni allaf ddangos bod hynny'n wir—ond a ydych yn monitro'r cydbwyssedd cymharol hwn mewn buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg ac ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg. Gwyddom fod yna adeg pan oedd ysgolion Cymraeg yn tuedd i fod mewn adeiladau hŷn o'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, ond gobeithio bod yr amser hwnnw wedi hen fynd. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a fynegwyd wrthyf gan y rhieni a'r llywodraethwyr hynny ar gyfer y dyfodol? Fel y dywedais, ni allaf ddweud a ydynt yn gywir yn yr hyn a ddywedant, ond mae gennyf bob rheswm i gredu bod eu pryderon yn ddilys.

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallich ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r pryderon

concerns, which my officials can then take up with Carmarthenshire council. I will then be able to respond to you. In broad terms, we require all local authorities to have an asset management plan, which considers all buildings on the basis of need—it is the need of the building that is the primary tool in terms of school refurbishment. Obviously, it is then a matter of what the building needs to do for the pupils who will experience life there. Some of you will have seen information in the press today about the publication of the Estyn report that demonstrates that the new buildings that we are seeing being built throughout Wales contribute hugely to improved education systems. My department focuses on ensuring that local authorities keep, as far as possible, to the spend and the timetables that they have outlined to us.

**Christine Gwyther:** Will you join me in welcoming the new county primary school being built in Narberth, in my constituency? This is not being built as a Welsh-language school or as an English-language school, but as a truly bilingual school. In areas where that is possible, truly bilingual education will mean that we do not hear any more comments about Welsh-language schools getting this or English-language schools getting that. The parents, governors, staff and children of the Narberth school are proud of the fact that, even though they might have separate lessons, they play, participate in sport and live happily together.

**Jane Davidson:** As a parent of children who have been in a similar school, I can say that that arrangement has worked extremely effectively. We are always pleased to see the building of new schools. It is also important to say that, in many of our rural counties, where there has been opposition to the closure of schools, when people see the new facilities created in an area school—crèche and nursery facilities, provision for adults after school and for young people post the statutory school age and so on—they have broadly been welcomed. It is crucial that we provide lifelong learning opportunities in our community focused schools system.

penodol hyn, ac yna gall fy swyddogion eu trafod gyda chyngor sir Caerfyrddin. Yna gallaf roi ateb ichi. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bob awdurdod lleol feddu ar gynllun rheoli asedau, sy'n ystyried pob adeilad ar sail angen—yr angen am yr adeilad yw'r brif ddyfais o ran adnewyddu ysgolion. Yn amlwg, mae'n fater wedyn o'r hyn y mae angen i'r adeilad ei wneud ar gyfer y disgylion a fydd yn treulio amser yno. Bydd rhai ohonoch wedi gweld gwybodaeth yn y wasg heddiw am gyhoeddi adroddiad Estyn sy'n dangos bod yr adeiladau newydd a gaiff eu hadeiladu ledled Cymru yn cyfrannu'n fawr iawn at systemau addysg gwell. Mae fy adran yn canolbwytio ar sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol, gymaint â phosibl, yn cadw at y gwariant a'r amserlenni a amlinellwyd ganddynt inni.

**Christine Gwyther:** A ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r ysgol gynradd sirol newydd sy'n cael ei hadeiladu yn Arberth, yn fy etholaeth? Nid yw hon yn cael ei hadeiladu fel ysgol Gymraeg nac ysgol Saesneg, ond fel ysgol wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Mewn ardaloedd lle mae hynny'n bosibl, bydd addysg wirioneddol ddwyieithog yn golygu na fyddwn yn clywed rhagor o sylwadau am ysgolion Cymraeg yn cael hyn neu ysgolion Saesneg yn cael y llall. Mae rhieni, llywodraethwyr, staff a phlant ysgol Arberth yn falch o'r ffaith, er eu bod yn cael gwersi ar wahân o bosibl, eu bod yn chwarae, yn cymryd rhan mewn chwaraeon ac yn byw'n hapus gyda'i gilydd.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel mam i blant a aeth i ysgol debyg, gallaf ddweud bod y trefniant hwnnw wedi gweithio'n effeithiol iawn. Yr ydym bob amser yn falch o weld ysgolion newydd yn cael eu hadeiladu. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud, yn nifer o'n siroedd gwledig, lle bu gwrthwynebiad i gau ysgolion, pan fydd pobl yn gweld y cyfleusterau newydd sy'n cael eu creu mewn ysgol ardal—cyfleusterau crèche a meithrinfa, darpariaeth i oedolion ar ôl yr ysgol ac ar gyfer pobl ifanc ar ôl oedran ysgol statudol, ac ati—yn gyffredinol, maent wedi eu croesawu. Mae'n hanfodol inni ddarparu cyfleoedd dysgu gydol oes yn ein system ysgolion bro.

**Astudio y tu allan i Gymru**  
**Studying Outside Wales**

**C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr union ddiffiniad o fyfyrwr neu fyfyrwraig sy'n astudio cwrs y tu allan i Gymru oherwydd nad yw'r cwrs hwnnw ar gael yng Nghymru? OAQ1195(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o'r materion cyfreithiol sy'n ein hatal rhag darparu cymorth ychwanegol tuag at ffioedd dysgu ar gyfer cyrsiau y tu allan i Gymru. Yr ydym yn ymchwilio i'r hyn y gellid ei wneud ar gyfer myfyrwyr sy'n dewis astudio y tu allan i Gymru.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwn. Yr argraff y mae llawer ohonom wedi'i gael yw eich bod wedi caniatáu i'r trafferthion cyfreithiol eich atal rhag gwneud unrhyw beth i gynorthwyo pobl nad ydynt yn gallu cael mynediad i gwrs yng Nghymru am nad yw'r cwrs hwnnw ar gael, ac sy'n gorfol astudio mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig neu hyd yn oed ymhellach na hynny. Mae mater o gyflawnder sylfaenol yn y sefyllfa hon. I fynd ymhellach, ac i edrych ar sefyllfa pobl sy'n cael eu gwrrhod ar gyfer cyrsiau yng Nghymru—yr wyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am Ysgol Feddygol Prifysgol Caerdydd—a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder mai dim ond 38 y cant o'r myfyrwyr sy'n astudio meddygaeth yno sy'n dod o Gymru? Oni ddylem fod yn hyrwyddo cyfle myfyrwyr o Gymru i gael mynediad i'r coleg hwnnw, gan eu bod wedyn yn fwy tebygol o ymarfer yng Nghymru wedi iddynt gymhwys? Mae llawer o bobl yn cael eu gwrrhod ac felly'n gorfol astudio meddygaeth mewn gwledydd eraill, ond caint eu cosbi oherwydd na allant gael unrhyw fath o gymorth.

**Jane Davidson:** There are two things to say. I welcomed the cross-party support in 2005 for not proceeding with any scheme that was likely to be challenged in the courts. It is important that I remind people why we had to look at those legal difficulties—the information was given to the leaders of all parties—and you may wish to remind

**Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the exact definition of a student who is studying a course outside Wales because that course is not available in Wales? OAQ1195(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** All parties in the Assembly are aware of the legal issues that prevent us from providing additional tuition fee support for courses outside Wales. We are investigating what might be done for students wishing to study outside Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am pleased to hear that you are looking into this issue. The impression many of us have had is that you have allowed these legal difficulties to prevent you from doing anything to assist people who cannot access courses in Wales because those courses are not available, and who then have to study in other parts of the United Kingdom, or even further afield. There is a fundamental question of justice here. To go further, and to look at the position of people who are rejected for courses in Wales—I am thinking particularly of Cardiff University Medical School—do you share my concern that only 38 per cent of the students studying there are from Wales? Should we not be promoting opportunities for students from Wales to access that college, as they are then more likely to practise in Wales when they have qualified? Many people are rejected, so they have to study medicine in other countries, but they are penalised as they are unable to obtain any support.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae dau beth i'w ddweud. Yr oeddwn yn croesawu'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn 2005 am beidio â gweithredu unrhyw gynllun a oedd yn debygol o gael ei herio yn y llysoedd. Mae'n bwysig imi atgoffa pobl pam yr oedd yn rhaid inni edrych ar yr anawsterau cyfreithiol hynny—rhoddwyd y wybodaeth i arweinwyr

yourselves of that in detail. Under European law, we cannot discriminate between students from different member states, so we cannot provide additional financial support only to Welsh students studying in England; we would also have to provide additional support to all those coming from the EU studying in England. That was not an outcome that any of us would have wanted to see, but a responsible Assembly does not make irresponsible decisions with Welsh public money. This Government will continue not to do so.

3.10 p.m.

I asked the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales for information on any major course that was important in the Welsh context that could not be studied in Wales, and the only course that it has come up with in this context at the moment is veterinary science. There were 30 first year veterinary science students from Wales on courses in England in 2004-05. So, we need to continue to look at this issue, but we will not take a decision that would see money from Wales being spent in ways that will not benefit Wales.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I agree with the Minister that we do not wish to act illegally, but I recall the discussions that took place between the party leaders in the aftermath of the decision not to have top-up fees, on which the Government graciously gave way. At that time, as the First Minister will recall, we looked at the courses—the most important or popular of which is veterinary science, as you outlined—that Welsh students cannot study in Wales. There was an undertaking to publish the details of the courses in question—such as some languages or nautical engineering—so that we could investigate whether or not we could do anything in relation to those students. This happened over a year ago, and we should not lose sight of this issue, because it is important for those students, although they are relatively few in number, that we consider whether there is anything that we can legally do and to get lawyers' advice on it. That is why we were pursuing the issue. Can you

pob plaid—a hwyrach y byddwch am atgoffa'ch hunain o fanylion hynny. Yn ôl cyfraith Ewrop, ni allwn wahaniaethu rhwng myfyrwyr o wahanol aelod wladwriaethau, felly, ni allwn roi cymorth ariannol ychwanegol i fyfyrwyr o Gymru'n unig sy'n astudio yn Lloegr. At hynny, byddai'n rhaid inni roi cymorth ychwanegol i bawb sy'n dod o'r UE i astudio yn Lloegr. Ni oedd hynny'n ganlyniad y byddai'r un ohonom am ei weld, ond nid yw Cynulliad cyfrifol yn gwneud penderfyniadau anghyfrifol ynghylch arian cyhoeddus Cymru. Bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn dal i beidio â gwneud hynny.

Gofynnais i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru am wybodaeth am unrhyw brif gwrs a oedd yn bwysig yn y cyd-destun Cymreig ac na ellid ei astudio yng Nghymru, a'r unig gwrs a nodwyd ganddo ar hyn o bryd, yn y cyd-destun hwn, yw gwyddorau milfeddygaeth. Yr oedd 30 o fyfyrwyr gwyddorau milfeddygaeth blwyddyn gyntaf o Gymru ar gyrsiau yn Lloegr yn 2004-05. Felly, mae angen inni ddal i edrych ar y mater hwn, ond ni fyddwn yn gwneud penderfyniad a fyddai'n gweld arian o Gymru yn cael ei wario mewn ffyrdd na fyddant o fudd i Gymru.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog nad ydym yn dymuno gweithredu'n anghyfreithlon, ond cofiaf y trafodaethau a fu rhwng arweinwyr y pleidiau ar ôl y penderfyniad i beidio â chael ffioedd atodol, yr ildiodd y Llywodraeth yn raslon iddo. Bryd hynny, fel y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cofio, edrychwyd ar y cyrsiau—a'r gwyddorau milfeddygaeth yw'r pwysicaf neu'r mwyaf poblogaidd ohonynt, fel yr amlinellwyd gennych—nad yw myfyrwyr o Gymru'n gallu eu hastudio yng Nghymru. Yr oedd addewid i gyhoeddi manylion y cyrsiau dan sylw—megis rhai ieithoedd neu beirianneg môr—er mwyn inni allu archwilio a allem wneud unrhyw beth mewn perthynas â'r myfyrwyr hynny. Digwyddodd hyn dros flwyddyn yn ôl, ac ni ddylem anghofio'r mater hwn, gan ei fod yn bwysig i'r myfyrwyr hynny, er eu bod yn gymharol brin o ran nifer, inni ystyried a oes unrhyw beth y gallwn ei wneud yn gyfreithiol a chael cyngor cyfreithwyr arno. Dyna pam yr ydym yn mynd ar drywydd y mater. A allwch roi

give us a timescale as to when you hope to be able to address that issue, because it has already taken over a year?

**Jane Davidson:** There are a number of difficulties in this issue, and that is why we need to keep it in perspective. We also needed to look at where those courses were necessary and useful in the Welsh context, so that we could justify arrangements, such as, for example, post-university relief for students when they came back to Wales in a particular context. We have asked HEFCW to do more work on this issue, and I am hopeful that that will be produced before the end of this Assembly term, because it is important, as it was a decision of all parties.

It is also important that we do not rewrite history on top-up fees. We made the commitment in our manifesto not to have top-up fees in this Assembly term, and we have delivered on it.

amserlen inni pryd y gobeithiwch allu mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw, gan ei fod wedi cymryd dros flwyddyn eisoes.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae yna nifer o anawsterau o ran y mater hwn, a dyna pam mae angen inni ei gadw mewn perspectif. Yn ogystal, yr oedd angen inni ystyried ble yr oedd y cyrsiau hynny yn angenreidiol ac yn ddefnyddiol yn y cyd-destun Cymreig, er mwyn inni allu cyflawnhau trefniadau megis, er enghraifft, rhyddhad ar ôl y brifysgol i fyfyrwyr pan fyddent yn dychwelyd i Gymru mewn cyd-destun penodol. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i CCAUC wneud rhagor o waith ar y mater hwn, a gobeithio y bydd hynny'n cael ei gynhyrchu cyn diwedd tymor y Cynulliad hwn, gan ei fod yn bwysig gan ei fod yn benderfyniad gan bob plaid.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni beidio ag ail-greu hanes o ran ffioedd atodol. Gwnaethom yr ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto i beidio â chael ffioedd atodol yn nhymor y Cynulliad hwn, ac yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny.

### **'Cau'r Bwlch'** **'Narrowing the Gap'**

**Q7 Irene James:** Will the Minister make a statement about 'Narrowing the Gap' in the performance of schools? OAQ1158(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** 'The Learning Country: Vision into Action' sets out our agenda for education in Wales, including a commitment to continue the focus on school improvement. Our primary objective is to improve the performance of all pupils and schools in Wales through the promotion of partnership working and collaborative action, and initiatives such as raising attainment and individual standards in education.

**Irene James:** Do you agree that ensuring equally effective learning opportunities for young people throughout Wales must be our priority? There are large variations still prominent between local authority areas in Wales in terms of five A to C grades at GCSE. What action is being taken to target resources at these areas of greatest poverty where results are compromised, and, dare I say, which are not funded at the best level?

**C7 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am 'Gau'r Bwlch' ym mherfformiad ysgolion? OAQ1158(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu: Gweledigaeth ar Waith' yn gosod allan ein hagenda ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys ymrwymiad i barhau i ganolbwytio ar wella ysgolion. Ein prif amcan yw gwella perfformiad pob disgybl ac ysgol yng Nghymru drwy hyrwyddo gweithio mewn partneriaeth a chamau gweithredu ar y cyd, a mentrau megis codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg.

**Irene James:** A gytunwch y dylem roi blaenoriaeth i sicrhau cyfleoedd dysgu yr un mor effeithiol i bobl ifanc ledled Cymru? Mae amrywiadau mawr yn amlwg o hyd rhwng ardaloedd awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru o ran pum gradd TGAU A i C. Pa gamau a gymerir i dargedu adnoddau at yr ardaloedd hyn lle mae'r tlodi mwyaf a lle mae canlyniadau'n cael eu peryglu? Os caf ddweud, nid yw'r ardaloedd hyn yn cael eu

hariannu ar y lefel orau.

**Jane Davidson:** The gap in performance between local education authorities is reducing, and that is crucially important to us. From later this year, the new partnership arrangements between local authorities and schools over school improvement, and the responsibility for driving that agenda, will be in place. I was delighted that, in terms of significant progress in 2006, Wrexham went up 7.3 percentage points, Blaenau Gwent went up 6.1 percentage points and Merthyr Tydfil went up 5.1 percent points compared to the previous years. These are very important increases for children in those areas.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 8, OAQ1189(ELL), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r bwlch mewn perfformiad rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol yn lleihau, ac mae hynny'n hollbwysig inni. Gan ddechrau yn ddiweddarach eleni, bydd y trefniadau partneriaeth newydd rhwng awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion o ran gwella ysgolion, a'r cyfrifoldeb dros hybu'r agenda honno, ar waith. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn, o ran y cynnydd mawr yn 2006, fod cynnydd o 7.3 y cant yn Wrecsam, bod cynnydd o 6.1 y cant ym Mlaenau Gwent, a chynnydd o 5.1 y cant ym Merthyr Tudful o'i gymharu â'r blynnyddoedd blaenorol. Mae hyn yn gynnydd pwysig i blant yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 8, OAQ1189(ELL), has been transferred for written answer.

### Gwersi Cymraeg Welsh Lessons

**C9 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gamau mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i ddarbwyllo awdurdodau lleol a chyrff perthnasol eraill i gynnal gwersi Cymraeg ar gyfer oedolion am bris a all roi hwb sylweddol i bolisi 'Iaith Pawb'? OAQ1218(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod y rôl bwysig y mae Cymraeg i oedolion yn ei chwarae i greu Cymru ddwyieithog. Yn 2006 a 2007, byddwn yn gwario £5.6 miliwn ar Gymraeg i oedolion. Fodd bynnag, mae polisiau addysg bellach i ddysgwyr, ar wahân i bobl 16 i 19-oed, yn fater i ddarparwyr addysg bellach ac addysg uwch.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng gwahanol ranbarthau Cymru. Dysgir Cymraeg i oedolion mewn chwe rhanbarth ac mae costau'r myfyrwyr sy'n mynchu'r dosbarthiadau hyn yn amrywio o £50 i £105 am ddau dymor ar draws Cymru. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cysoni hyn mewn ffordd a fydd yn hwyluso myfyrwyr neu oedolion i gael mynediad at ddysgu sgiliau Cymraeg mewn ysgolion nos a dydd. Beth a wnewch i hyrwyddo hynny?

**Q9 Owen John Thomas:** What steps is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to persuade local authorities and other relevant bodies to provide Welsh lessons for adults for a nominal sum to provide a substantial boost to the aims of 'Iaith Pawb'? OAQ1218(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly Government recognises the important role that Welsh for adults plays in creating a bilingual Wales. In 2006-07 we will be spending £5.6 million on Welsh for adults. However, further education policies for learners, other than 16 to 19-year-olds, are a matter for further and higher education providers.

**Owen John Thomas:** As you know, there are significant differences between the different regions of Wales. Welsh is taught to adults in six regions, and the cost to the students attending those classes for two terms varies from £50 to £150 across Wales. It is important that we standardise this in a way which will help students or adults to access courses to learn Welsh skills at night schools and day schools. What are you doing to promote that?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae 25,500 o bobl yn astudio'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mae llawer o bobl yn hapus gyda'r system. Nid yw'r ffioedd yn uchel—maent yn amrywio fel arfer rhwng £1 yr awr ac ychydig dros £2 yr awr. Yn ogystal, mae nifer o gyrsiau am ddim ar gael ym mhob rhan o Gymru o ganlyniad i arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac Ewrop. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys cyrsiau i roi blas ar ddysgu'r Gymraeg ar gyfer rhieni i annog pobl i fynychu cyrsiau eraill. Mae'r cyrsiau hynny'n llwyddiannus iawn. Bwriad cyrsiau am ddim yw annog pobl i fynd ymlaen i gyrsiau eraill.

**Lisa Francis:** Acen provides a wonderful website for online Welsh learners. How much funding does the Welsh Assembly Government give to Acen and what criteria does Acen need to comply with to secure that funding in the future?

**Jane Davidson:** I will have to ask my colleague, Alun Pugh, to write to you on that.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 10 OAQ1194(ELL) i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**Jane Davidson:** There are 25,500 people currently studying Welsh as a second language. Therefore, there are many people who are happy with the system. The fees are not high—they usually vary between £1 an hour and just over £2 an hour. In addition, many courses are available free of charge in all parts of Wales as a result of Welsh Assembly Government and European funding. These include taster courses for parents to encourage people to attend other courses. Those courses are extremely successful. Free courses are intended to encourage people to progress to other courses.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae Acen yn darparu gwefan ardderchog i ddysgwyr Cymraeg ar-lein. Faint o gyllid y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei roi i Acen, a pha feini prawf y mae angen i Acen gydymffurfio â hwy i sicrhau'r cyllid hwnnw yn y dyfodol?

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ofyn i'm cyd-Aelod, Alun Pugh, ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 OAQ1194(ELL) is transferred for written answer.

### Cyllido Ysgolion The Funding of Schools

**Q11 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of schools in Powys? OAQ1176(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Funding for school budgets is provided through the local government revenue settlement. Powys local authority received £163.9 million in revenue support grant this year, which is an increase of 5.7 per cent and is above the Welsh average of 5.1 per cent. Powys only increased its education budget by 2.7 per cent, which is 2.1 per cent below its education indicator-based assessment.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that detailed response. As someone who regularly visits schools in Powys, I know that their staff feel that they are being short-changed in one way or another. I remind you of the National Audit Office's report, which recognised that

**C11 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido ysgolion ym Mhowys? OAQ1176(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Darperir cyllid ar gyfer cyllidebau ysgolion drwy setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol. Cafodd awdurdod lleol Powys £163.9 miliwn o grant cynnal refeniw eleni, sy'n gynnydd o 5.7 y cant ac sy'n uwch na chyfartaledd Cymru o 5.1 y cant. Cynyddodd Powys ei chyllideb addysg 2.7 y cant yn unig, sydd 2.1 y cant yn is na'i asesiad addysg ar sail dangosyddion.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb manwl hwnnw. Fel rhywun sy'n ymweld yn rheolaidd ag ysgolion ym Mhowys, gwn fod eu staff yn teimlo nad ydynt yn cael chwarae teg. Hoffwn eich atgoffa o adroddiad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol, a oedd yn

improvements were needed in terms of information sharing, presentation and clarity. I am sure that you are aware that the funding fog remains.

A key issue for me is the need to bring continuity to the budgetary process, whatever the level. Why, at this stage in the Assembly's development, do we not have a three-year budget in place so that we can offer security to schools? As you know, fluctuations in the formula and pupil numbers cause chaos annually.

**Jane Davidson:** I have just given you the clarity and you can take that to your schools. That will demonstrate clearly where the responsibility lies.

3.20 p.m.

On the three-year budget, I point out that it has been said on several occasions in the Chamber by my colleague, the Finance Minister, that three-year budgets will be introduced from 2008. That has been welcomed by all. We have also given a commitment that they will be introduced in education.

#### **Astudio Ieithoedd Tramor** **The Study of Foreign Languages**

**Q12 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to encourage the study of foreign languages? OAQ1211(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Our national modern foreign languages strategy, 'Languages Count', sets out our approach to promoting the learning of languages so that they empower individuals, promote cultural understanding and diversity, and help to build outward-looking businesses that create wealth.

**Val Lloyd:** I would like to focus on children of primary school age. Evidence shows that introducing another language early in a child's life makes it easier to learn it. Many European countries already teach foreign languages at that stage of a child's education. Would you give an update on the pilot

cydnabod bod angen gwelliannau mewn rhannu gwybodaeth, cyflwyno ac eglurder. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod y niwl cyllico yno o hyd.

Mater allweddol i mi yw'r angen am sicrhau parhad yn y broses gyllidebol, waeth beth fo'r lefel. Pam, yn ystod y cam hwn yn natblygiad y Cynulliad, nad oes gennym gyllideb tair blynedd ar waith er mwyn inni allu rhoi sicrywydd i ysgolion? Fel y gwyddoch, mae amrywiadau yn y fformiwl a niferoedd disgylion yn achosi anhrefn bob blwyddyn.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf newydd roi'r eglurder ichi, a gallwch drosglwyddo'r eglurder hwnnw i'ch ysgolion. Bydd hynny'n arwydd clir pwy sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb.

O ran y gyllideb tair blynedd, egluraf fod fy nghyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog Cyllid, wedi dweud droeon yn y Siambr y bydd cyllidebau tair blynedd yn cael eu cyflwyno o 2008. Croesawyd hynny gan bawb. Yr ydym hefyd wedi ymrwymo i'w cyflwyno ym maes addysg.

#### **Astudio Ieithoedd Tramor** **The Study of Foreign Languages**

**C12 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i annog pobl i astudio ieithoedd tramor? OAQ1211(ELL)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ein strategaeth genedlaethol 'Ieithoedd sy'n Cyfrif' ar gyfer ieithoedd modern tramor yn gosod allan ein dull o annog pobl i ddysgu ieithoedd er mwyn grymuso unigolion, hyrwyddo dealltwriaeth ac amrywiaeth diwylliannol, a helpu adeiladu busnesau sy'n creu cyfoeth ac sydd â gorwelion ehangach.

**Val Lloyd:** Hoffwn ganolbwytio ar blant oed ysgol gynradd. Dengys dystiolaeth fod cyflwyno iaith arall yn gynnar ym mywyd plentyn yn ei gwneud yn haws ei dysgu. Mae llawer o wledydd yn Ewrop eisoes yn addysgu ieithoedd tramor yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw yn addysg plentyn. A allech roi'r

project run with key stage 2 pupils across Wales, particularly any action taken as a result of the findings?

**Jane Davidson:** A total of 105 primary schools in 21 clusters have been involved in the pilot, that is, around 2,500 pupils. It has been very successful. The work that Ron Dearing is doing with regard to his interim report on languages suggests that there must be a greater emphasis in primary school. We also have languages as part of the baccalaureate, so, in Wales, not only do you have the opportunities through the traditional GCSE or A-level routes as well as the new languages ladders that we introduced last September, but there is a language-learning component in the Welsh baccalaureate that keeps the language issue alive.

wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y prosiect peilot sydd ar waith gyda disgyblion cyfnod allweddol 2 ledled Cymru, yn arbennig unrhyw gamau a gymerwyd o ganlyniad i'r darganfyddiadau?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae cyfanswm o 105 o ysgolion cynradd mewn 21 clwstwr wedi bod yn cymryd rhan yn y prosiect peilot, hynny yw, tua 2,500 o ddisgyblion. Mae wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Mae'r gwaith y mae Ron Dearing yn ei wneud o ran ei adroddiad interim ar ieithoedd yn awgrymu ei bod yn rhaid rhoi mwy o bwyslais mewn ysgolion cynradd. Mae gennym ieithoedd hefyd yn rhan o'r fagloriaeth, felly, yng Nghymru, nid yn unig y mae gennych y cyfleoedd drwy llwybrau TGAU neu safon Uwch traddodiadol yn ogystal â'r llwybrau ieithoedd newydd a gyflwynwyd gennym fis Medi diwethaf, ond mae yna elfen o ddysgu iaith ym magloriaeth Cymru sy'n cadw'r mater iaith yn fyw.

### Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Carl Sargeant:** It is with sadness that I draw your attention to Standing Order No. 7.2, which states that Members shall not use language that is offensive, discriminatory, or which causes offence to other Members or to any other person. Yesterday, my colleague from north Wales, Eleanor Burnham, made reference to 'the Japs'. I find that totally inappropriate language for her to be using in the Chamber or anywhere else inside or outside this establishment. Racist comments have come under the spotlight recently in relation to comments made by Jade Goody. Such comments are wholly inappropriate and I ask that you look into this matter. I tried to raise this with the Deputy Presiding Officer yesterday, but he said that he did not hear the comment. However, it is clearly in the Record today. It is a totally inappropriate use of language.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have read the Record. Whereas I do not believe that there was, in what appeared yesterday from Eleanor Burnham, any offensive intent, I think that it is appropriate that we use full and proper terms for all nationalities so that there is no implied insensitivity. We would

**Carl Sargeant:** Yn anffodus, rhaid imi dynnu'ch sylw at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2, sy'n dweud na chaiff Aelodau ddefnyddio iaith sy'n sarhaus, sy'n wahaniaethol, neu sy'n achosi sarhad i Aelodau eraill neu i unrhyw unigolyn arall. Ddoe, cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod o'r gogledd, Eleanor Burnham, at 'y Japs'. Mae hynny, yn fy marn i, yn iaith gwbl amhriodol iddi ei defnyddio yn y Siambr neu unrhyw le arall y tu mewn neu'r tu allan i'r sefydliad hwn. Mae sylwadau hiliol wedi cael sylw mawr yn ddiweddar mewn perthynas â sylwadau a wnaed gan Jade Goody. Mae sylwadau felly'n gwbl amhriodol, a gofynnaf ichi ymchwilio i'r mater hwn. Ceisiais godi'r mater gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd ddoe, ond dywedodd na chlywsai'r sylw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg yn y Cofnod heddiw. Mae'n ddefnydd hollol amhriodol o iaith.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi darllen y Cofnod. Er nad wyf yn credu bod unrhyw fwriad i sarhau yn yr hyn a ddywedodd Eleanor Burnham ddoe, credaf ei bod yn briodol inni ddefnyddio termau llawn a chywir am bob cenedl i osgoi unrhyw awgrym o ansensitifrwydd. Ni fyddem am gael ein

not want to be called ‘butts’, ‘Taffs’ or ‘Welshies’ or by any other expression that people sometimes use.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Further to that point of order, I obviously apologise unreservedly. I had no intention of causing offence in my one-minute, very rushed speech in which I referred to Japanese trains and the high-speed Maglev train. I would like to note that British people are often referred to as ‘Brits’, but I certainly had no intention of making a slur on the Japanese; I was, in fact, eulogising about their wonderful train system.

**The Presiding Officer:** I hope that I did not imply in my remark that I thought that there was offence.

Mewn geiriau eraill, Eleanor, yr oeddech yn mynd fel trêñ ar y pryd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Oeddwn.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.24 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.24 p.m.*

### **Y Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Ambulance Services**

Motion (NDM3411): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the Wales Audit Office report—‘Ambulance Services in Wales’—which was laid in the Table Office on 4 December 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to examine how the role of the air ambulance service can be further developed.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the development of a detailed action plan to implement the recommendations of*

galw’n ‘butts’, ‘Taffs’ na ‘Welshies’ nac unrhyw ymadroddion eraill y bydd pobl weithiau’eu defnyddio.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yn ychwanegol at y pwyt hwnnw o drefn, yr wyf wrth gwrs yn ymddiheuro’n llwyr. Nid oedd yn fwriad gennyf achosi unrhyw sarhad yn fy arraith munud o hyd a wnaed ar frys, pan gyfeiriais at drenau Japaneaidd a’r trêñ Maglev cyflym. Hoffwn ddweud bod pobl yn aml yn cyfeirio at Brydeinwyr fel ‘Brits’, ond nid oedd yn fwriad gennyf achosi unrhyw anfri i’r Japaneaid; canmol eu system drenau ardderchog yr oeddwn i, mewn gwirionedd.

**Y Llywydd:** Gobeithio nad awgrymais yn fy sylw fy mod yn credu bod unrhyw sarhad.

In other words, Eleanor, you were going like a train at the time.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, I was.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.24 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.24 p.m.*

### **Y Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Ambulance Services**

Cynnig (NDM3411): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi Adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru—‘Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans yng Nghymru’—a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Rhagfyr 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwyt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i edrych ar sut y mae modd datblygu ymhellach ar rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwyt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu manwl i roi argymhellion yr adroddiad a’r*

*the report and measures identified in the ambulance service's own modernisation plan.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to fully fund the Welsh ambulance service's modernisation plan.*

Amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to provide a timetable for implementing fully the recommendations requiring Government action contained in the report.*

Amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to ensure the development of specialist expertise in the commissioning of ambulance services at all levels.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 3 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the Wales Audit Office report—'Ambulance Services in Wales'—which was laid in the Table Office on 4 December 2006. (NDM3411)*

I welcome the opportunity to discuss in Plenary the Wales Audit Office report into the Wales Ambulance Service NHS Trust. I hope that the Assembly will support the motion. I take this opportunity to thank Jeremy Colman and the Wales Audit Office team for completing this report so quickly. I know that he was considering looking into the ambulance service in advance of the

*camau a nodir yng nghynllun moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei hun ar waith.*

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyllido'n llawn gynllun moderneiddio gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru.*

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'n llawn argymhellion yr adroddiad sy'n mynnu bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu.*

Gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod arbenigedd arbenigol yn cael ei ddatblygu wrth gomisiyny gwasanaethau ambiwlans ar bob lefel.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn nodi Adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru—'Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans yng Nghymru'—a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Rhagfyr 2006. (NDM3411)*

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r cynnig. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i Jeremy Colman a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am gwblhau'r adroddiad hwn mor gyflym. Gwn ei fod yn ystyried

motion of 20 June 2006, which the Assembly passed. He, and other parties in the Assembly, showed their willingness to work flexibly together to deliver a worthwhile report that was in line with the motion and was eventually endorsed by the Assembly.

ymchwilio i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans cyn y cynnig a wnaed ar 20 Mehefin 2006, a dderbyniwyd gan y Cynulliad. Dangosodd ef, a phleidiau eraill yn y Cynulliad, eu parodrwydd i gydweithio mewn ffordd hyblyg er mwyn cyflwyno adroddiad gwerthfawr a oedd yn unol â'r cynnig a gymeradwywyd yn y pen draw gan y Cynulliad.

The Audit Committee met on 14 December 2006, and took evidence from Jeremy Colman, Alan Murray, from the ambulance service, and the head of the Assembly's Department for Health and Social Services. I now await the Audit Committee's recommendations, and look forward to receiving and reviewing them. I have already looked carefully at the WAO report and its recommendations. Those, along with the Audit Committee's recommendations, will help us consider where we need to focus our attention. As you know, I have already given my commitment to supporting the modernisation of the ambulance service in Wales. The WAO report found that several significant problems that have persisted over a number of years can be resolved, provided key internal and external challenges are dealt with.

Cyfarfu'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ar 14 Rhagfyr 2006, gan gymryd dystiolaeth gan Jeremy Colman, Alan Murray, gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a phennaeth Adran Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y Cynulliad. Arhosaf yn awr am argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at eu cael a'u hadolygu. Yr wyf eisoes wedi edrych yn ofalus ar adroddiad SAC a'i argymhellion. Bydd yr argymhellion hynny, ynghyd ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio, yn ein helpu i ystyried ble y mae angen inni ganolbwytio ein sylw. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf eisoes wedi ymrwymo i gefnogi'r broses o foderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Darganfu adroddiad SAC y gellir datrys nifer o broblemau sylweddol sydd wedi bodoli ers blynnyddoedd, cyn belled ag y rhoir sylw i heriau mewnol ac allanol.

On Kirsty Williams's amendment 1, which calls on the Assembly Government to examine how the role of the air ambulance service can be further developed, the modernisation plan will highlight the need to review the services of the ambulance service, including land and air ambulances. The WAO report noted that the trust had already started to address many of the issues as part of the plan, and, on that basis, I support the amendment.

O ran gwelliant 1 gan Kirsty Williams, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i archwilio sut y gellir datblygu rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr ymhellach, bydd y cynllun moderneiddio yn tynnu sylw at yr angen am adolygu gwasanaethau'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gan gynnwys cerbydau ambiwlans tir ac awyr. Yr oedd adroddiad SAC yn dweud bod yr ymddiriedolaeth eisoes wedi dechrau mynd i'r afael â nifer o'r materion fel rhan o'r cynllun, ac ar y sail honno yr wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant.

It is also important that we recognise that the report identified considerable strengths within the trust. Those include the fact that the ambulance trust in Wales currently operates within a new strategic framework, which was set up by the Assembly Government and which applies to the whole of the NHS and that the trust's being a single trust since 1999 is a distinctive advantage. That is seen as a strength by the WAO, as it means that there is core stability. The trust is

Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni gydnabod bod yr adroddiad wedi nodi cryfderau sylweddol yn yr ymddiriedolaeth. Mae'r rheini'n cynnwys y ffaith fod yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn gweithredu o fewn fframwaith strategol newydd, a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac sy'n berthnasol i'r GIG cyfan, a bod y ffaith fod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi gweithredu fel un ymddiriedolaeth er 1999 yn fantais sylweddol. Cryfder yw hynny, ym marn

not going through a merger, and it is not going through organisational change, unlike virtually every other ambulance trust in England. Having said that, it is acknowledged that greater operational responsibility needs to be devolved to the regional levels in the trust, and the trust is putting in place a strengthened tier of management at that level.

There is not a problem of resources, according to the report. The trust has not been underfunded—a 35 per cent increase in operational funding between 2003-04 and 2005-06 is clear evidence of that—and it has not been starved of capital in the past. However, the report shows that the resources provided to the trust should be used in a much better way to deliver a service that is well up to the standards that people in Wales can reasonably expect. Therefore, the report concludes that best use was not made of the money that was provided.

The report contains 28 recommendations for improving the service. Assembly officials will be working with the trust to consider and address those, in conjunction with the trust's wider modernisation plan and the Assembly's wider health strategies, for example, 'Designed for Life' and the delivering emergency care services project.

On Jocelyn Davies's amendment 5, which calls on the Assembly Government to ensure the development of specialist expertise in the commissioning of ambulance services at all levels, the report acknowledges that a move towards a single commissioner in 2003 strengthened the expertise available, and the WAO commented positively on that. However, more work is needed to sharpen up commissioning activity, and to link it more effectively with regional implementation, particularly in the context of the DECS strategy. The Assembly Government is currently reviewing commissioning arrangements along with a move towards regional commissioning. We are therefore committed to ensuring that we

SAC, gan fod hynny'n golygu bod yna sefydlogrwydd craidd. Nid yw'r ymddiriedolaeth yn destun proses uno, ac nid yw'n mynd drwy newid sefydliadol, yn wahanol i bron pob ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans arall yn Lloegr. Wedi dweud hynny, cydnabyddir bod angen datganoli mwy o gyfrifoldeb gweithredol i'r lefelau rhanbarthol yn yr ymddiriedolaeth, ac mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn sefydlu haen gryfach o reolwyr ar y lefel honno.

Nid oes problem adnoddau, yn ôl yr adroddiad. Nid yw'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi ei thanariannu—mae cynydd o 35 y cant mewn cyllid gweithredol rhwng 2003-04 a 2005-06 yn dystiolaeth amlwg o hynny—ac ni chafodd ei hamddfadiad o gyfalaf yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, dengys yr adroddiad y dylid defnyddio'r adnoddau a ddarperir i'r ymddiriedolaeth mewn ffordd lawer gwell i ddarparu gwasanaeth sy'n bodloni'r safonau y gall pobl yng Nghymru eu disgwyl yn rhesymol. Felly, daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad na wnaed y defnydd gorau o'r arian a ddarparwyd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys 28 o argymhellion ar gyfer gwella'r gwasanaeth. Bydd swyddogion y Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth i ystyried yr argymhellion hynny ac i ymdrin â hwy, ar y cyd â chynllun moderneiddio ehangach yr ymddiriedolaeth a strategaethau iechyd ehangach y Cynulliad, er enghraift, 'Cynllun Oes' a'r prosiect darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys.

O ran gwelliant 5 gan Jocelyn, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau datblygu arbenigedd ym maes comisiynu gwasanaethau ambiwlans ar bob lefel, mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod bod y broses o symud tuag at un comisiynydd yn 2003 wedi atgyfnerthu'r arbenigedd a oedd ar gael, ac mae SAC wedi gwneud sylwadau cadarnhaol ar hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae angen gwneud mwy o waith i firenio gweithgarwch comisiynu, ac i'w gysylltu'n fwy effeithiol â'r broses weithredu ranbarthol, yn arbennig yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrthi'n adolygu'r trefniadau comisiynu ynghyd â symud tuag at comisiynu rhanbarthol. Felly, yr ydym wedi

have an improved and more specialist expertise in the commissioning arena and, for that reason, I support the amendment.

We will support Kirsty Williams's amendment 2, which calls for the development of a detailed action plan to implement the report's recommendations and measures identified in the ambulance service's own modernisation plan, and Jocelyn Davies's amendment 4, which calls on the Assembly Government to provide a timetable for implementing the recommendations. We are committed to drawing up an action plan for those recommendations that are the Assembly Government's responsibility, and I would expect to know that the trust is preparing an action plan for the implementation of its modernisation proposals. Therefore, as I said, I am content to support those amendments.

3.30 p.m.

The Auditor General for Wales believes that the draft modernisation plan of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust board addresses all the crucial challenges that need to be faced to turn the service around. It is also suggested that the ambulance service needs some time to get on with the work of modernisation without undue political interference. I agree that we need to give it space to get on with the urgent work in hand, but the situation will need constant monitoring by the Assembly Government and our mainstream accountability frameworks.

In response to Jocelyn Davies's amendment 3, which calls on the Assembly Government to fully fund the Welsh ambulance service's modernisation plan, the inquiry found evidence of the trust's requiring further capital investment to develop its infrastructure. The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to providing the capital funding for the ambulance service and is aware that the modernisation plan is expected to identify the need for more significant capital investment.

The trust's revised strategic outline

ymrwymo i sicrhau bod gennym fwy o arbenigedd a gwell arbenigedd yn y maes comisiynu, ac am y rheswm hwnnw cefnogaf y gwelliant.

Byddwn yn cefnogi welliant 2 gan Kirsty Williams, sy'n galw am ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu manwl i roi argymhellion yr adroddiad ar waith a'r camau a nodwyd yng nghynllun moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei hun, a gwelliant 4 gan Jocelyn Davies, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'r argymhellion. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i lunio cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer yr argymhellion hynny y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanyst, a byddwn yn disgwyl gwybod bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer gweithredu ei chynigion moderneiddio. Felly, fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi'r gwelliannau hynny.

Mae Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru o'r farm fod drafft y cynllun moderneiddio gan fwrdd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â'r holl heriau pwysig y mae angen eu hwynebu i drawsnewid y gwasanaeth. Awgrymir hefyd fod angen amser ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i ymgymryd â'r gwaith moderneiddio heb ymyriadau gwleidyddol amhriodol. Cytunaf fod angen inni roi cyfle iddo fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith brys sy'n ei wynebu, ond bydd angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'n fframweithiau atebolwydd prif-fwrwd fonitro'r sefyllfa'n barhaus.

Mewn ymateb i welliant 3 gan Jocelyn Davies, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ariannu cynllun moderneiddio gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru yn llwyr, gwelodd yr ymchwiliad dystiolaeth fod angen buddsoddiad cyfalafl ychwanegol ar yr ymddiriedolaeth i ddatblygu ei sealwaith. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu'r cyllid cyfalafl ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac mae'n ymwybodol bod disgwyl i'r cynllun moderneiddio nodi bod angen buddsoddiad cyfalafl mwy sylweddol.

Mae rhaglen amlinellol strategol ddiwygiedig

programme is currently being considered by Assembly Government officials and, along with other objectives, will clearly set out the link between the modernisation plan and the individual schemes requiring capital investment. In addition, in October, in north Wales, I announced capital investment of £16 million, particularly targeted at boosting emergency and patient care vehicles. To that end, I look forward to seeing the publication of the modernisation plan later this month, as well as the recommendations of the Audit Committee. I am confident that all aspects of the trust's performance will improve in future under the leadership of Alan Murray, with the Assembly Government's support.

In conclusion, this is a very useful report, because it provides us with opportunities to learn the lessons of the past, it gives us some indication of the direction in which we need to travel to improve the service, and it allows us to have a benchmark against which we can measure that improvement as it is delivered.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to examine how the role of the air ambulance service can be further developed.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the development of a detailed action plan to implement the recommendations of the report and measures identified in the ambulance service's own modernisation plan.*

I thank the Minister for indicating that he will support these amendments. We support and welcome the auditor general's report. I believe that this very lengthy report justifies fully our concerns, which we have long voiced, about the running of the ambulance service. It should not be forgotten that the Government opposed the holding of this

yr ymddiriedolaeth wrthi'n cael ei hystyried gan swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd. Ynghyd ag amcanion eraill, bydd yn gosod allan yn glir y cysylltiad rhwng y cynllun moderneiddio a'r cynlluniau unigol lle mae angen buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Yn ogystal, ym mis Hydref yn y Gogledd cyhoeddais fuddsoddiad cyfalaf o £16 miliwn, wedi ei dargedu'n arbennig at wella cerbydau brys a cherbydau gofal cleifion. I'r diben hwnnw, edrychaf ymlaen at weld y cynllun moderneiddio'n cael ei gyhoeddi'n ddiweddarach y mis hwn, yn ogystal ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd pob agwedd ar berfformiad yr ymddiriedolaeth yn gwella yn y dyfodol o dan arweinyddiaeth Alan Murray, gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

I gloi, mae hwn yn adroddiad defnyddiol iawn, oherwydd mae'n rhoi cyfleoedd inni ddysgu gwersi'r gorffennol, mae'n rhoi syniad inni o'r cyfeiriad y mae angen inni symud i wella'r gwasanaeth, ac mae'n ein galluogi i gael meinchnod inni allu ei ddefnyddio i fesur y gwelliant hwnnw wrth iddo ddigwydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i edrych ar sut y mae modd datblygu ymhellach ar rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu manwl i roi argymhellion yr adroddiad a'r camau a nodir yng nghynllun moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei hun ar waith.*

Diolch i'r Gweinidog am nodi y bydd yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn. Yr ydym yn cefnogi ac yn croesawu adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol. Credaf fod yr adroddiad hirfaith hwn yn llwyr gyflawnhau ein pryderon, a fyngwyd gennym ers cryn amser, am y ffordd y caiff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei redeg. Rhaid cofio bod y

inquiry, and it is only because the Minister happened to vote in the wrong way by accident that we have it. We are very grateful to him for that. I have examined this report as a member of both the Audit Committee and the Health and Social Services Committee, and, although this debate refers to the Wales Audit Office report, I think it important that we do not forget the equally damning report by Healthcare Inspectorate Wales.

Turning to our amendment 1, we believe that the air ambulance service is important in planning for the future role of the ambulance service. It should fit not only with other ambulance services, but also with other healthcare services generally. Our amendment 2, for obvious reasons, calls for a detailed action plan. This is a very detailed report, and it is essential that we have transparency on the speed of delivery and on how progress is made, which may not be as we would hope.

The modernisation plan takes into account most of the key criticisms raised in the auditor general's report. However, given the trust's record, the Assembly Government must ask itself whether it will be successfully implemented, and so monitoring is the key to ensuring that that happens. We must remember that the ambulance trust produced a five-year strategy in 2005 without any clear plans for its implementation; that has been ditched and totally superseded, so the previous plans do not have a very happy history.

One issue for the Government today is the report's criticism that the previous Minister for health failed to appoint people to the board who knew anything about ambulances, and that the board was allowed to meet only five times a year. That has changed lately, but the Government as a body must bear responsibility for appointments to the board and ensure that the board does its job. The report states that internal and external

Llywodraeth wedi gwrthwynebu cynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn, ac mai oherwydd bod y Gweinidog wedi digwydd pleidleisio'r ffordd anghywir yn ddamweiniol y digwyddodd hyn. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iawn iddo am hynny. Yr wyf wedi archwilio'r adroddiad hwn fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ac fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac er mai at adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru y mae'r ddadl hon yn cyfeiro, credaf ei bod yn bwysig inni bedio ag anghofio'r adroddiad gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru a oedd lawn mor ddamniol.

I droi at ein gwelliant 1, credwn fod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr yn bwysig wrth gynllunio ar gyfer rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y dyfodol. Dylai gydwedu, nid yn unig â gwasanaethau ambiwlans eraill, ond hefyd â gwasanaethau gofal iechyd eraill yn gyffredinol. Mae ein gwelliant 2, am resymau amlwg, yn galw am gynllun gweithredu manwl. Mae hwn yn adroddiad manwl iawn, ac mae'n hanfodol sicrhau tryloywder o ran cyflymder gweithredu a sut y gwneir cynnydd, nad yw, efallai, fel y byddem yn ei obeithio.

Mae'r cynllun moderneiddio yn ystyried y rhan fwyaf o'r beirniadaethau allweddol a godwyd yn adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried record yr ymddiriedolaeth, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ofyn iddi hi ei hun a yw'n cael ei weithredu'n llwyddiannus, ac felly mae monitro'n allweddol i sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Rhaid inni gofio bod yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans wedi cynhyrchu strategaeth bum mlynedd yn 2005 heb unrhyw gynlluniau clir ar gyfer ei gweithredu; cafodd honno ei gwrtihod a'i disodli'n llwyr, felly nid oes hanes hapus iawn i'r cynlluniau blaenorol.

Un mater i'r Llywodraeth heddiw yw'r feirniadaeth yn yr adroddiad fod y Gweinidog blaenorol dros iechyd wedi methu â phenodi pobl i'r bwrdd a oedd yn gwybod unrhyw beth am gerbydau ambiwlans, ac mai pum gwaith y flwyddyn y caniateid i'r bwrdd gyfarfod. Mae hynny wedi newid yn ddiweddar, ond rhaid i'r Llywodraeth fel corff dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb am benodiadau i'r bwrdd a sicrhau bod y bwrdd yn gwneud

governance has been weak, and it makes the point that there should have been greater involvement and engagement in tackling the problems. The signs have been there for years, but the Minister failed to look at all far in seeking the causes of the problems.

There is a clear picture of inadequate leadership, and I will now tackle the key issue of how you turn bad management into good. There are good signs that a strong leadership team is being recruited, but middle management is now a key issue. How do you train middle managers all at once in an organisation that has had poorly trained middle management until now? The same point applies to the lower tiers of management. That is a tricky issue and, when we have examined the issues in committee, that has been acknowledged at every stage.

Clearly, we have now got over the uncertainty of the position of the chief executive, which is very much to be welcomed because it had a destabilising effect. However, poor management led to a culture of blame, high levels of sickness absence, and a failure to praise staff, to listen to their concerns, or to act on their concerns.

We want to see the Welsh ambulance service working with other emergency services, which would lead to an integrated and better service. In particular, we are keen to see greater co-operation with the fire service. As the report says, the delivering emergency care services strategy and other proposed changes to the national health service will have a major impact on the ambulance service, so it must not be seen in isolation. The auditor general is cautiously optimistic about the future; however, he did say that, of the 50 to 60 reports that he has produced, this one was by far the most critical. Although the new chief executive has presented a very persuasive case, he freely admits to major challenges, including low staff morale when he is requiring them to make major changes in work patterns; management training; financial challenges simply because money was wasted in the past; capital and estate modernisation; and a period of rapid change

ei waith. Mae'r adroddiad yn dweud bod prosesau llywodraeth fewnol ac allanol wedi bod yn wan, ac mae'n pwysleisio diffyg cyfranogi ac ymgysylltu wrth fynd i'r afael â'r problemau. Mae'r arwyddion wedi bod yn amlwg ers blynnyddoedd, ond methodd y Gweinidog ag edrych ymhell iawn wrth chwilio am achosion y problemau.

Mae yma ddarlun clir o arweinyddiaeth annigonol, ac ymdriniaf yn awr â'r mater allweddol o'r ffordd y gellir troi rheolaeth wael yn rheolaeth dda. Mae yna arwyddion da fod tîm arweinyddiaeth cryf yn cael ei recriwtio, ond mae rheolwyr canol bellach yn fater allweddol. Sut mae hyfforddi rheolwyr canol i gyd ar unwaith mewn sefydliad lle nad oedd hyfforddiant digonol i'w reolwyr canol hyd yn hyn? Mae'r un peth yn wir am yr haenau is o reolwyr. Mae hynny'n fater dyrys, ac wrth archwilio'r materion yn y pwylgor yr ydym wedi cydnabod hynny ar bob cam.

Yn amlwg, yr ydym bellach wedi datrys ansicrwydd swydd y prif weithredwr, a dylid croesawu hynny am fod y sefyllfa honno wedi achosi ansefydlogrwydd. Fodd bynnag, arweiniodd rheolaeth wael at ddiwylliant o feio, lefelau uchel o absenoldeb salwch, a methiant i ganmol staff, gwrando ar eu pryderon, a gweithredu ar y pryderon hynny.

Yr ydym am weld gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru yn gweithio gyda gwasanaethau brys eraill, gan arwain at wasanaeth gwell a mwy integredig. Yn arbennig, yr ydym yn awyddus i weld mwy o gydweithredu â'r gwasanaeth Tân. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, bydd y strategaeth i gyflwyno gwasanaethau gofal brys a newidiadau eraill sy'n cael eu hargymhell i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn cael dylanwad mawr ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, felly ni allwn ei ystyried ar wahân. Mae'r archwilydd cyffredinol yn dfal yn obeithiol am y dyfodol; fodd bynnag, o'r 50 i 60 o adroddiadau a gynhyrchwyd ganddo, dywedodd mai dyma oedd yr un mwyaf beirniadol o bell ffordd. Er bod y prif weithredwr newydd wedi cyflwyno achos darbwylol iawn, mae'n cyfaddef bod heriau mawr o'i flaen, gan gynnwys moral isel y staff ac yntau'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt newid eu patrymau gwaith yn sylweddol; hyfforddi rheolwyr; heriau ariannol am fod

in other NHS services. I hope that it can be done.

arian wedi ei wastraffu yn y gorffennol; moderneiddio cyfalaf ac ystadau; a chyfnod o newid cyflym mewn gwasanaethau eraill yn y GIG. Gobeithio y gellir gwneud hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jenny, you referred to Jeremy Colman's words in committee, but it is also fair to note that he said that his commendation of the review that the ambulance trust is undertaking was as good as it gets from an auditor. It is important to note that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Jenny, yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at eiriau Jeremy Colman yn y pwylgor, ond mae hefyd yn deg dweud bod ei gymeradwyaeth o'r adolygiad y mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn ei wneud crystal ag a geir gan archwilydd. Mae'n bwysig nodi hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is important—

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n bwysig—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You must wind up.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Jenny Randerson:** I certainly will. It is very important indeed to note that because, although the signs are good, the situation will not turn around over night. That is the important thing that we and the public have to accept.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwnaf, yn sicr. Mae'n bwysig iawn nodi hynny gan na fydd y sefyllfa, er bod yr arwyddion yn gadarnhaol, yn newid dros nos. Dyna'r peth pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni a'r cyhoedd ei dderbyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*calls on the Assembly Government to fully fund the Welsh ambulance service's modernisation plan.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyllido'n llawn gynllun moderneiddio gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*calls on the Assembly Government to provide a timetable for implementing fully the recommendations requiring Government action contained in the report.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'n llawn argymhellion yr adroddiad sy'n mynnu bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*calls on the Assembly Government to ensure the development of specialist expertise in the commissioning of ambulance services at all levels.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod arbenigedd arbenigol yn cael ei ddatblygu wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau ambiwlans ar bob lefel.*

I begin by associating myself with the thanks that have already been expressed to the auditor general and his team for a comprehensive and extremely valuable report. I would submit to the Assembly that

Dechreuaf drwy ymgysylltu â'r diolch a fynegwyd eisoes i'r archwilydd cyffredinol a'i dîm am adroddiad cynhwysfawr a gwerthfawr iawn. Awgrymaf wrth y Cynulliad fod yr adroddiad yn cyflawnhau

the report vindicates the need for this inquiry and, however inadvertently the Minister participated in allowing it to happen, I am grateful for his positive response to its outcome. Though he may not have wanted it in the first place, he is certainly being positive about it now. Joking aside, I feel that we were vindicated in asking for an inquiry, and this report will provide a sound footing on which to put right the problems that have existed in the past.

As has already been said, the report is damning. It is the most critical report the auditor general has ever produced, as he said himself. However, it is positive in that he is cautiously optimistic about the new management of the service ensuring that issues are addressed. We share that cautious optimism, but Jenny Randerson is right to point out that there is no room for complacency. While I understand the Minister's point about maintaining a light touch and letting the management get on with it, ultimately, the Assembly Government is politically responsible and will need to monitor the situation carefully, as the Minister acknowledged.

3.40 p.m.

Our amendments were tabled in order to ensure that the Assembly Government plays its part and does what is needed to ensure that the ambulance service is supported in making the changes demanded in this report. We are grateful to the Minister for supporting those amendments.

Amendment 3, on finance, is self-explanatory. As the Minister has rightly said, there is nothing to suggest that the service is underfunded in its revenue, but there are capital issues to be addressed. The service has to take responsibility for adequately managing its own funds, but it must have the resources to deliver. The capital modernisation plan will be important, and, in that context, I am glad that the Minister has made that commitment today.

It is vital that the Government plays its part.

bod angen cynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn, a waeth pa mor ddamweiniol oedd cyfraniad y Gweinidog wrth ganiatáu iddo ddigwydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ei ymateb cadarnhaol i'w ganlyniadau. Er nad oedd am i'r peth ddigwydd yn y lle cyntaf, hwyrach, mae'n bendant yn gadarnhaol erbyn hyn. Heb wamalu, yr wyf yn teimlo bod gennym gyfiawnhad dros ofyn am ymchwiliad, a bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn sail gadarn ar gyfer unioni'r problemau sydd wedi bodoli yn y gorffennol.

Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, mae'r adroddiad yn ddamniol. Dyma'r adroddiad mwyaf beirniadol a gynhyrchwyd gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol erioed, fel y dywedodd ei hun. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gadarnhaol gan ei fod yn lled obeithiol y bydd rheolwyr newydd y gwasanaeth yn sicrhau mynd i'r afael â'r materion. Yr ydym yn rhannu'r gobaith gofalus hwnnw, ond mae Jenny Randerson yn gywir i ddweud na ddylem orffwys ar ein rhwyfau. Er fy mod yn deall pwynt y Gweinidog o gadw hyd braich a gadael i'r rheolwyr reoli, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn y pen draw, sy'n wleidyddol gyfrifol, a bydd angen iddi fonitro'r sefyllfa'n ofalus, fel y cydnabu'r Gweinidog.

Cynigiwyd ein gwelliannau er mwyn sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn chwarae ei rhan ac yn gwneud yr hyn sy'n ofynnol i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cael ei gynorthwyo i wneud y newidiadau y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn eu mynnu. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gefnogi'r gwelliannau hynny.

Mae gwelliant 3, ar gyllid, yn ei esbonio'i hun. Fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei ddweud, yn gywir ddigon, nid oes dim sy'n awgrymu na chaiff y gwasanaeth ddigon o arian refeniw, ond mae angen mynd i'r afael â materion cyfalaf. Rhaid i'r gwasanaeth fod yn gyfrifol am reoli ei gyllid ei hun yn ddigonol, ond rhaid iddo gael yr adnoddau i wneud hynny. Bydd y cynllun moderneiddio cyfalaf yn bwysig, ac yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud yr ymrwymiad hwnnw heddiw.

Mae'n hanfodol i'r Llywodraeth chwarae ei

The weight of evidence is overwhelming, and we are glad that the Minister shows no signs of picking and choosing which aspects of the report he wants to respond to. In that context, I am also glad that he will support amendment 4. We will need a detailed timetable, because the amount of work that this report estimates is needed to turn the ambulance service around is huge. Things cannot be achieved overnight, as Jenny Randerson rightly said, but our constituents will expect us to see a timetable for delivery. We are glad that the Minister has committed today to providing that.

Our amendment 5 was tabled in response to an issue that was raised when the chair and chief executive of the ambulance service attended a meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee recently, to discuss the report and the modernisation plan. The point that they put across was that, if the service is to raise its game, it needs to know clearly which services commissioners are actually commissioning—that is, what we want them to do both in the emergency service and the patient transport service. As an aside, I would like to welcome the ambulance service's proposal to separate the emergency service from the patient care service that provides transport. They are two distinct services, and it would be for the benefit of both to have them managed discretely in the ambulance service. It is vital that commissioners know what they are doing. There need to be expert commissioners, whether at local, national or regional level. In his speech, I think that the Minister acknowledged that, while work has been done, there remains more to be done.

We deliberately phrased our amendment in a way that was not prescriptive, because we are aware of the review that the Minister is undertaking. There will also be issues to be addressed as the ambulance service strengthens its regional management capacity. Therefore, we did not intend to be prescriptive about where commissioning should happen or who should do it, but I am glad that the Minister has acknowledged today that, if we are to have an effective way forward, we will need specialist expertise in

rhan. Mae pwysau'r dystiolaeth yn eithriadol, ac yr ydym yn falch nad yw'r Gweinidog i'w weld yn dewis a dethol pa agweddau ar yr adroddiad y bydd yn ymateb iddynt. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, yr wyf hefyd yn falch y bydd yn cefnogi gwelliant 4. Bydd arnom angen amserlen fanwl, am fod y gwaith y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amcangyfrif y bydd ei angen i drawsnewid y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn anferthol. Ni ellir cyflawni hyn dros nos, fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson, ond bydd ein hetholwyr yn disgwyli amserlen gennym ar gyfer ei gyflawni. Yr ydym yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi ymrwymo heddiw i sicrhau hynny.

Cynigiwyd ein gwelliant 5 mewn ymateb i fater a godwyd pan fu cadeirydd a phrif weithredwr y gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn cyfarfod gyda'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddiweddar, i drafod yr adroddiad a'r cyllun moderneiddio. Y pwynt a gyflwynwyd ganddynt oedd bod angen i'r gwasanaeth wybod yn union pa wasanaethau y mae comisiynwyr yn eu comisiynu mewn gwirionedd os yw am wella'i ddarpariaeth—sef yr hyn yr ydym am iddynt ei wneud yn y gwasanaeth brys a'r gwasanaeth cludo cleifion. Yn ychwanegol, hoffwn groesawu cynnig y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i wahanu'r gwasanaeth brys a'r gwasanaeth gofal cleifion sy'n darparu cludiant. Maent yn ddaus wasanaeth gwahanol, a byddai o fantais i'r ddaus gael eu rheoli ar wahân o fewn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae'n hanfodol i'r comisiynwyr wybod beth maent yn ei wneud. Mae angen comisiynwyr arbenigol, boed ar lefel leol, genedlaethol neu ranbarthol. Yn ei arraith, credaf fod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod, er bod gwaith wedi'i wneud, fod angen gwneud mwy eto.

Aethom ati i eirio ein gwelliant mewn ffordd nad oedd yn orchymynnol, oherwydd yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r adolygiad sy'n cael ei wneud gan y Gweinidog. Bydd materion i fynd i'r afael â hwy hefyd wrth i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gryfhau ei allu i reoli'n rhanbarthol. Felly, nid oedd yn fwriad gennym i fod yn orchymynnol o ran ble y dylid comisiynu na'r sawl a ddylai gomisiynu, ond yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod heddiw y bydd arnom angen arbenigedd ym maes comisiynu

commissioning ambulance services, as well as in providing them.

In conclusion, we are all agreed that this is a valuable report. It vindicates many of the concerns that many of us have raised over the past few years, based on issues that our constituents have brought to us. It is evident today that there will be cross-party support for the report's recommendations. That is important, because the service needs to be able to plan ahead, regardless of the outcome of the next election. The Minister's support for all the amendments today bodes well for a cross-party, consensual approach; that was certainly reflected in the health committee when we discussed the matter.

It is time for a change for the better in the ambulance service. This report lays a firm foundation that will enable the service to make a lasting difference through its modernisation plan. It will be the responsibility of us all, as politicians, to ensure that the service gets the support that it needs. I am happy to commit Plaid Cymru to that support today. I thank the Minister once again for supporting our amendments.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate and to support the motion. The Wales Audit Office notes in the report that,

'There have been historical weaknesses in internal governance concerning the Trust Board...There is a particular need to develop greater clarity of the Board's role, responsibility and decision making'.

I refer you to the report published earlier this month by Healthcare Inspectorate Wales, named 'Special Assurance Review of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust', in which it is recognised that the trust has a child protection policy. I understand that that policy is in line with Welsh Assembly Government guidance, and is the responsibility of the child protection working group, a sub-group of the clinical governance sub-committee. Minister, do you have confidence in the ambulance trust board\_to

gwasanaethau ambiwlans, yn ogystal ag arbenigedd wrth eu darparu, os ydym i sicrhau ffordd effeithiol ymlaen.

I gloi, yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno bod hwn yn adroddiad gwerthfawr. Mae'n cyfiawnhau rhai o'r pryderon a godwyd gan nifer ohonom dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf, ar sail materion a gyflwynwyd gan ein hetholwyr. Mae'n amlwg heddiw y bydd cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mae hynny'n bwysig, gan fod angen i'r gwasanaeth allu gynllunio ymlaen, waeth beth fydd canlyniad yr etholiad nesaf. Mae cefnogaeth y Gweinidog i'r holl welliannau heddiw yn argoel'i'n dda o ran ymagwedd drawsbleidiol, gydsyniol; adlewyrchwyd hynny'n sicr yn y pwylgor iechyd pan fuom yn trafod y mater.

Mae'n bryd newid er gwell yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gosod seiliau cadarn a fydd yn galluogi'r gwasanaeth i wneud gwahaniaeth parhaol drwy ei gynllun moderneiddio. Ein cyfrifoldeb bob un, fel gwleidyddion, fydd sicrhau y caiff y gwasanaeth y gefnogaeth iy mae arno ei hangen. Yr wyf yn falch o ymrwymo Plaid Cymru i'r gefnogaeth honno heddiw. Diolch unwaith eto i'r Gweinidog am gefnogi ein gwelliannau.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon a chefnogi'r cynnig. Dywed Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn yr adroddiad,

'Cafwyd gwendidau hanesyddol ym maes llywodraethu mewnol yn ymwneud â Bwrdd yr Ymddiriedolaeth...Yn benodol, mae angen egluro rôl, cyfrifoldeb a phroses gwneud penderfyniadau'r Bwrdd yn well'.

Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach yn y mis gan Arolgyaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru, sef 'Arolwg Sicrwydd Arbennig Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru', sy'n cydnabod bod gan yr ymddiriedolaeth bolisi amddiffyn plant. Deallaf fod y polisi hwnnw'n cyd-fynd â chanllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac mai cyfrifoldeb y gweithgor amddiffyn plant ydyw, sef un o is-grwpiau'r is-bwylgor llywodraethu clinigol. Weinidog, oes

deliver on child protection? Will you seek to ensure that the review of the roles and responsibilities of the board will include a focus on the need to raise awareness among personnel of child protection issues?

The policy recognises that safeguarding the welfare of children includes that of unborn children and young people up to the age of 18. It aims to assist all ambulance staff in recognising when a child might be at risk. The policy also includes a clear and concise reporting process for any alleged or suspected cases of abuse. It is also welcome that any contractors who provide a service on behalf of the trust, together with volunteers, are included in this policy. While not wishing to detract from the Wales Audit Office report on the ambulance service, I hope, Minister, that you will seek to encourage the ambulance service trust to further develop the pro-active approach that it has taken with regard to any vulnerable children that its staff might be called upon to treat.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I will start by congratulating the auditor general and his team on a very thorough report. This is one of those occasions when the media will find the debate fairly dull, because we are not having a blazing row. There is a lot of support for what the auditor general has completed and for the modernisation plan that Alan Murray and his team have compiled.

There is always a danger, when reports are almost two months out of date, that when we get around to debating them, things will have moved on. They have moved on fairly quickly. I was impressed by the speed at which the ambulance service was able to put its modernisation plan together to tackle many of the challenges and problems that are alluded to in this thorough audit report. It is the most critical of the reports that the auditor has produced and it highlights some glaring failures. It is worth reminding ourselves of the number of problems that are alluded to in the report, namely the lack of strategic governance, ineffective governance, weak

gennych chi hyder ym mwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans i weithredu ar amddiffyn plant? A fyddwch yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd adolygu rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r bwrdd yn cynnwys canolbwytio ar yr angen am wneud personel yn fwy ymwybodol o faterion amddiffyn plant?

Mae'r polisi'n cydnabod bod diogelu lles plant yn cynnwys lles plant heb eu geni a phobl ifanc hyd at 18 oed. Ei nod yw helpu holl aelodau staff ambiwlans i wybod pryd y gall plentyn fod mewn perygl. Mae'r polisi hefyd yn cynnwys proses hysbysu glir a chryno ar gyfer unrhyw achosion honedig neu amheus o gam-drin. Mae'n galonogol hefyd bod unrhyw gontactwyr sy'n darparu gwasanaeth ar ran yr ymddiriedolaeth, ynghyd â gwirfoddolwyr, yn cael eu cynnwys yn y polisi hwn. Er nad wyf am dynnu oddi ar adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn ceisio annog y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i ddatblygu ymhellach yr ymagwedd ragweithiol a fabwysiadwyd ganddo o ran unrhyw blant sy'n agored i niwed ac y gall staff gael eu galw i'w trin.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Dechreuaf drwy longyfarch yr archwilydd cyffredinol a'i dîm am adroddiad trylwyr iawn. Mae hwn yn un o'r achlysuron hynny pan fydd y ddadl y cyfryngau'n ystyried hon yn ddadl ddiflas, gan nad ydym yn dadlau'n ffyrnig. Mae llawer iawn o gefnogaeth i'r hyn y mae'r archwilydd cyffredinol wedi ei gwblhau, ac i'r cynllun moderneiddio y mae Alan Murray a'i dîm wedi ei lunio.

Mae perygl o hyd, pan fydd adroddiadau wedi'u cyhoeddi ers yn agos i ddau fis, y bydd pethau wedi symud yn eu blaenau erbyn i ni ddechrau eu trafod. Maent wedi symud yn eu blaenau yn eithaf cyflym. Mae'r ffordd gyflym yr aeth y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ati i lunio ei gynllun moderneiddio i fynd i'r asael â nifer o'r heriau a'r problemau y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad archwilio trylwyr hwn wedi creu argraff arnaf. Hwn yw'r adroddiad mwyaf beirniadol o'r holl adroddiadau y mae'r archwilydd wedi eu cynhyrchu, ac mae'n tynnu sylw at rai methiannau amlwg. Mae'n werth ein hatgoffa'n hunain o nifer y problemau y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad,

leadership, poor systems and infrastructure, problems with organisational culture, and management failures. Some of the other issues that were brought out in the report, which we discussed in Audit Committee, related to the way in which money—capital money in particular—was spent. That money had been wasted by individuals in the past. Those problems have set the scene for the need for the ambulance service to respond as quickly as it did.

Those of us in the Assembly Chamber want assurances from the Assembly Government that it will take this report seriously and respond to the challenges that it throws out, and that it will provide every support to Alan Murray and his team to put that modernisation plan into action, because the people of Wales certainly deserve a better ambulance service than they have had in recent years. It is right and proper that the Assembly Government and other political parties take that challenge seriously.

One worrying issue came out during the Audit Committee's consideration of the report when we were challenging the chief executive of NHS Wales. From the evidence given to the Audit Committee, it became clear that until the present chief executive of NHS Wales was appointed, there were no firm data sets or performance management data relating to the ambulance service that they were aware of. In essence, with the restructuring of the ambulance service back in 1998, it was allowed to progress its work without anyone at official level compiling performance management data on how it was running. It was not until the current chief executive of NHS Wales was appointed that data were firmed up. Clearly, there were problems at Welsh Assembly Government official level—the Assembly Government simply did not take much notice of what was going on in the ambulance service. That is a criticism, and one that I think that the Assembly Government has to respond to.

I am delighted that the Minister has said that he will allow the ambulance service room to

sef y diffyg llywodraethu strategol, llywodraethu anfeifeithiol, arweinyddiaeth wan, systemau a seilwaith gwael, problemau o ran diwylliant sefydliadol, a methiannau rheolwyr. Yr oedd rhai o'r materion eraill y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn yr adroddiad, ac a drafodwyd gennym yn y Pwyllgor Archwilio, yn ymneud â'r modd yr oedd arian—arian cyfalaf yn enwedig—yn cael ei wario. Yr oedd yr arian hwnnw wedi ei wastraffu gan unigolion yn y gorffennol. Oherwydd y problemau hynny y bu'n rhaid i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ymateb mor gyflym ag a wnaeth.

Mae'r rheini o honom yn Siambwr y Cynulliad am i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ein sicrhau y bydd yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i'r adroddiad hwn ac yn ymateb i'r heriau sy'n codi ynddo, ac y bydd yn rhoi pob cefnogaeth i Alan Murray a'i dîm i roi'r cynllun moderneiddio hwnnw ar waith, oherwydd mae pobl Cymru yn sicr yn haeddu gwell gwasanaeth ambiwlans nag a gawsant dros y blynnyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'n iawn ac yn briodol fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a phleidiau gwleidyddol eraill yn ymateb i'r her honno o ddifrif.

Daeth un mater sy'n peri gofid i'r golwg wrth i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ystyried yr adroddiad pan oeddem yn herio prif weithredwr GIG Cymru. O'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, daeth yn amlwg, nes i brif weithredwr presennol GIG Cymru gael ei benodi, nad oeddent yn ymwybodol o unrhyw setiau data cadarn na data rheoli perfformiad cadarn yn ymneud â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn y bôn, wrth ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ôl yn 1998, caniatwyd iddo wneud ei waith heb i neb ar lefel swyddogol lunio data rheoli perfformiad ar y ffordd yr oedd yn gweithio. Ni chafwyd data mwy pendant nes i brif weithredwr presennol GIG Cymru gael ei benodi. Yn amlwg, yr oedd problemau ar lefel swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—yn sym, nid oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi llawer o sylw i'r hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth, ac yn un y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymateb iddo, mi gredaf.

Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi dweud y bydd yn rhoi rhwydd hynt i'r

manoeuvre in order to implement its plan. However, he is right that we need to ensure that the progress of that plan is monitored effectively, because failure to monitor in the past has allowed the ambulance service to get into the state that it is in today.

3.50 p.m.

**William Graham:** Although I acknowledge that plans are in motion, do you share my concern that for those who need cardiac treatment early treatment is vital yet, in rural areas, we are getting ever lower response times?

**Jonathan Morgan:** There is no doubt that the new chief executive of the service recognises that meeting response times is of absolute urgency. It is only right that people whose lives are in danger should be able to expect an ambulance to arrive as quickly as possible, and within the target response times.

From talking to the ambulance service, it is clear that it knows that it has a challenge to change the culture of the service, to invest in ambulance stock and other equipment, to change the pattern of work, and to start meeting response time targets. We also need to have confidence that the new chief executive is being well supported by his board because, in the past, it is been too easy for people in the ambulance service to step back from taking difficult decisions. We now have a chief executive who is well supported by new people, and those people recognise that there is a challenge that they have to meet.

The people of Wales expect an ambulance service that is efficient, quick, and highly professional, and rightly so. Those who work in the ambulance service—the paramedics and technicians, who are dedicated individuals—expect to work with safe and modern equipment and in an environment in which they are truly valued, not just by patients, but by those who run the ambulance service. Only following the appointment the latest chief executive of the ambulance service have we finally discovered how much

gwasanaeth ambiwlans weithredu ei gynllun. Fodd bynnag, mae ef yn iawn fod angen inni sicrhau bod hynt y cynllun hwnnw yn cael ei fonitro'n effeithiol, oherwydd methiant i fonitro yn y gorffennol sydd wedi caniatau i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gyrraedd ei gyflwr presennol.

**William Graham:** Er fy mod yn cydnabod bod cynlluniau ar waith, a ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod triniaeth gynnar yn hanfodol i bobl sydd ag angen triniaeth gardiaidd, ac eto, mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'r amseroedd ymateb yn mynd yn waeth ac yn waeth?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn sicr, mae prif weithredwr newydd y gwasanaeth yn cydnabod bod bodloni amseroedd ymateb yn fater brys. Nid yw ond yn iawn i bobl sydd â'u bywydau mewn perygl allu disgwyl i ambiwlans gyrraedd mor gyflym â phosibl, ac o fewn yr amseroedd ymateb targed.

Wrth siarad â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae'n amlwg ei fod yn gwybod bod yna her iddo newid diwylliant y gwasanaeth, buddsoddi mewn cerbydau ambiwlans ac offer arall, newid y patrwm gwaith, a dechrau cyrraedd targedau amseroedd ymateb. Mae angen inni fod yn hyderus hefyd fod y prif weithredwr newydd yn cael ei gefnogi'n dda gan ei fwrrdd, oherwydd yn y gorffennol mae wedi bod yn rhy hawdd i bobl yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans beidio â gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Mae gennym brif weithredwr bellach sy'n cael ei gefnogi'n dda gan bobl newydd, ac mae'r bobl hynny'n cydnabod bod yna her y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei hateb.

Mae pobl Cymru'n disgwyl gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n effeithlon, yn gyflym ac yn broffesiynol iawn, ac mae'n briodol disgwyl hynny. Mae'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans—y parameddygon a'r technegwyr, sy'n unigolion ymroddedig—yn disgwyl gweithio gydag offer diogel a modern, ac mewn amgylchedd lle y caint eu gwerthfawrogi mewn gwirionedd, nid yn unig gan gleifion, ond gan y rhai sy'n rhedeg y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Dim ond ar ôl penodi prif weithredwr diweddaraf y

of a problem there is for this Government and the ambulance service to resolve. It is clear now that, with the new modernisation plan, the future of the ambulance service in Wales should be rosy, provided that the Assembly Government keeps its part of the bargain and provides the resources and support necessary to allow Alan Murray and his team to ensure that we get the ambulance service that we need in this country.

**Christine Gwyther:** I will focus on some of the associated services that can either help our ambulance service or in some cases, sadly, militate against its work.

I welcome Assembly funding for defibrillators in such places as shopping centres and railway stations because, coming back to other Members' remarks, it is that early intervention that will make the difference between people surviving or, sadly, dying before they reach hospital.

I will focus on something that happened at Glangwili Hospital last Monday, 15 January. I have been given permission by the family of Mr Jenkins, who was the patient in question, and by Mr Jenkins himself, to use his name in the Chamber. On Monday 15 January, Mr Jenkins's daughter, Mrs Rees, had to force access to Mr Jenkins's house, because she had been unable to contact him by telephone. It transpired that Mr Jenkins had fallen the previous night and had spent all night on the floor. He is diabetic and had been unwell, and he was eventually diagnosed as also having pneumonia. The situation was very serious for Mr Jenkins and his family. The ambulance came in good time indeed, and Mr Jenkins's family are full of praise for way in which the paramedics dealt with him and his condition. Having arrived within a reasonable time, the ambulance took Mr Jenkins to Glangwili's accident and emergency department. At 11 a.m. on Monday morning, having reached accident and emergency, the paramedics tried to book Mr Jenkins in, only to be told that there was a queue. Nobody from the accident and emergency department or admissions came

gwasanaeth ambiwlans yr ydym wedi gweld maint y broblem y mae angen i'r Llywodraeth hon a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei datrys. Mae'n amlwg yn awr, gyda'r cynllun moderneiddio newydd, y dylai dyfodol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru fod yn llewyrchus, ar yr amod bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cadw at ei gair ac yn darparu'r adnoddau a'r gefnogaeth angenrheidiol, fel y gall Alan Murray a'i dim sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gwasanaeth ambiwlans y mae arnom ei angen yn y wlad hon.

**Christine Gwyther:** Canolbwytiaf ar rai o'r gwasanaethau cysylltiedig a all naill ai helpu ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans neu, mewn rhai achosion, yn anffodus, filwrio yn erbyn ei waith.

Croesawaf arian y Cynulliad ar gyfer diffibrilwyr mewn lleoedd fel canolfannau siopa a gorsafoedd rheilffordd, oherwydd, i gyfeirio'n ôl at sylwadau Aelodau eraill, yr ymyrryd cynnar hwnnw a fydd yn sicrhau bod pobl yn byw neu, yn anffodus, yn marw cyn cyrraedd yr ysbyty.

Canolbwytiaf ar rywbed a ddigwyddodd yn Ysbyty Glangwili ddydd Llun diwethaf, 15 Ionawr. Cefais ganiatâd gan deulu Mr Jenkins, y claf dan sylw, a chan Mr Jenkins ei hun, i ddefnyddio ei enw yn y Siambwr. Ddydd Llun 15 Ionawr, bu'n rhaid i Mrs Rees, merch Mr Jenkins, dorri i mewn i dŷ Mr Jenkins am ei bod wedi methu cysylltu ag ef dros y ffôn. Daeth yn amlwg fod Mr Jenkins wedi syrthio y noson gynt a'i fod wedi treulio'r noson gyfan ar y llawr. Mae'n ddiabetig, ac yr oedd wedi bod yn anhwylus. Yn y pen draw cafwyd ei fod yn dioddef hefyd gan niwmonia. Yr oedd y sefyllfa'n ddifrifol iawn i Mr Jenkins a'i deulu. Daeth yr ambiwlans mewn da bryd, ac nid oes gan deulu Mr Jenkins ond canmoliaeth i'r parameddygon am y deliwyd ag ef a'i gyflwr. Ar ôl cyrraedd o fewn amser rhesymol, aeth yr ambiwlans â Mr Jenkins i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nglangwili. Am 11 a.m. ar fore Llun, ar ôl cyrraedd yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ceisiodd y parameddygon drosglwyddo Mr Jenkins i ofal yr ysbyty, ond dywedwyd wrthynt bod ciw. Ni ddaeth neb o'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys nac o'r adran

out to assess Mr Jenkins, although the paramedics kept him under constant supervision, so the family never felt that Mr Jenkins's life was in peril. Having waited outside for four hours in an ambulance, Mr Jenkins was admitted to the accident and emergency department and, thereafter, to the medical assessment unit. He was subsequently put in Dewi ward and is receiving excellent treatment there. However, the questions that family want me to address to the Carmarthenshire NHS Trust, which I have done by letter, and to you, Brian, are as follows. Why did Mr Jenkins have to wait for four hours outside the accident and emergency department in an ambulance? Why did nobody from the hospital come out to assess Mr Jenkins's condition? At what point—and this is crucial to the whole debate—does a patient officially transfer from the care of the ambulance trust into the care of the health trust and become the patient of that health trust? When is a patient registered officially?

Mr Jenkins's ordeal is worrying, but what was more worrying to his family was the fact that his ambulance was one of five parked outside the accident and emergency department, all with patients waiting to be admitted for at least four hours. Mrs Rees, Mr Jenkins's daughter, has heard that this is a regular occurrence and I have also heard that from other constituents. What was the hold-up in the system, and how can this be avoided in the future? I have written to Carmarthenshire NHS Trust to ask how its system can be adapted so that patients move through more swiftly to prevent a hold-up at the accident and emergency entry point. In reality, what that did was to take five ambulances away from potentially critically ill patients and from where they should have been around west Wales. As a local Member, I would not want to see such a situation ever again. I am told that this has also happened at Withybush Hospital, and it would be instructive to hear whether or not this is a regular occurrence at other hospitals.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Eight members of opposition parties have indicated that they wish to speak and, normally, to

derbyniadau i asesu Mr Jenkins, er i'r parameddygon gadw llygad arno drwy gydol yr amser, felly nid oedd y teulu'n teimlo bod bywyd Mr Jenkins mewn perygl o gwbl. Ar ôl aros y tu allan am bedair awr mewn ambiwlans, cafodd Mr Jenkins ei dderbyn i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac yna i'r uned asesu meddygol. Wedyn aeth i ward Dewi ac mae'n cael triniaeth ardderchog yno. Fodd bynnag, dyma'r cwestiynau y mae'r teulu am imi eu gofyn i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin, ac yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny drwy lythyr, ac i chi, Brian. Pam yr oedd yn rhaid i Mr Jenkins aros am bedair awr y tu allan i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys mewn ambiwlans? Pam na ddaeth neb o'r ysbyty allan i asesu cyflwr Mr Jenkins? Pryd—ac mae hyn yn hollbwysig i'r ddadl gyfan—y bydd cleifion yn trosglwyddo'n swyddogol o ofal yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans i ofal yr ymddiriedolaeth iechyd ac yn dod yn un o gleifion yr ymddiriedolaeth iechyd honno? Pryd y caiff claf ei gofrestru'n swyddogol?

Mae profiad Mr Jenkins yn peri gofid, ond yr hyn a oedd yn peri mwy o ofid i'w deulu oedd y ffaith fod ei ambiwlans ef yn un o bump a oedd wedi eu parcio y tu allan i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, a phob un yn cynnwys claf a oedd wedi bod yn aros i gael ei dderbyn am o leiaf bedair awr. Mae Mrs Rees, merch Mr Jenkins, wedi clywed bod hyn yn digwydd yn aml, ac yr wyf fi hefyd wedi clywed hynny gan etholwyr eraill. Pam yr oedi yn y system, a sut y gellir osgoi hyn yn y dyfodol? Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Ymddiriedolaeth GIG sir Gaerfyrddin i ofyn sut y gellir addasu ei system er mwyn i gleifion symud ymlaen ynghynt i atal y dagfa wrth gael eu derbyn i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd hyn yn golygu bod pum ambiwlans yn cael eu hatal rhag bod ar gael ar gyfer cleifion a allai fod yn ddifrifol wael, a heb fod lle dygent fod o amgylch gorllewin Cymru. Fel Aelod lleol, ni fyddwn am weld sefyllfa o'r fath byth eto. Dywedir wrthyf bod hyn wedi digwydd yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg hefyd, a byddai'n dda clywed a yw hyn yn digwydd yn rheolaidd mewn ysbytai eraill.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae wyth aelod o'r gwrthbleidiau wedi dangos eu bod am siarad, ac fel rheol, er mwyn sicrhau dadl gytbwys,

ensure a balanced debate, I would not call everyone. However, because this is an important debate I will try to call everyone, but expedition is necessary and succinct speeches would be welcome.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ceisiaf ufuddhau i'ch cais a gosod tôn ar gyfer Aelodau eraill. Mae'r ffordd y mae'r Cynulliad wedi arwain ar y mater hwn yn engraifft dda o'r ffordd y dylai'r Cynulliad weithredu yn effeithiol. Mae'r penderfyniad a wnaethpwyd yn y Siambra yn gywir o ran cynnal ymchwiliad i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans; bydd pleidlais y Gweinidog yn rhan o chwedloniaeth y lle hwn, ond beth bynnag ei gymhelliaid, yr oedd ei bleidlais yn un gywir, oherwydd yr oedd angen ymchwiliad.

Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo holl aelodau'r pwylgor am y ffordd y maent wedi ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Nid oes yr un Aelod wedi ceisio manteisio ar y trafodaethau i wneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol—maent wedi canolbwytio ar ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r sefyllfa a cheisio sicrhau ei bod yn gwella. Yr oedd Jeremy Colman, yr archwilydd cyffredinol, a Dr Peter Higson, prif weithredwr Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru, yn bresennol yng nghyfarfod y pwylgor yr wythnos diwethaf, a chyflwynwyd dau adroddiad ganddynt. Yr oedd Alan Murray a Stuart Fletcher o'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans hefyd yn bresennol. Gofynnwyd cwestiynau manwl a beirniadol yn y cyfarfod, ond llwyddodd pob un ohonom i gytuno yn y pen draw â Jeremy Colman a Peter Higson a ddywedodd eu bod yn teimlo erbyn hyn fod y cynllun moderneiddio yn mynd i'r afael â'r holl broblemau sylfaenol sydd wedi bodoli o fewn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Mae nifer o Aelodau, megis Jenny Randerson, Helen Mary Jones a Jonathan Morgan, wedi dweud y dylem fod yn ochelgar, ac mae hynny'n gywir. Dylai'r Llywodraeth hefyd fod yn ochelgar a monitro'n fanwl yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Dywedodd Jeremy Colman a Peter Higson bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ganiatáu rhyddid i'r ymddiriedolaeth sicrhau ei bod yn gallu symud ymlaen gyda'r cynllun moderneiddio, a gwn fod y Gweinidog yn

ni fyddwn yn galw ar bawb. Fodd bynnag, gan fod hon yn ddadl bwysig, ceisiaf alw ar bawb, ond mae angen bod yn gyflym, a byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi areithiau cryno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will try to adhere to your request and set the tone for other Members. The way in which the Assembly led on this issue has been a good example of how the Assembly should operate effectively. The decision taken in the Chamber was the correct decision in terms of holding an inquiry into the ambulance service; the Minister's vote will go down in the folklore of this place, but whatever his motive, the vote was correct, because we needed an inquiry.

As Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I applaud all members of that committee for the way they have dealt with this issue. Not a single Member has attempted to take advantage of the discussions to make political points—they have concentrated on responding positively to the situation and have tried to ensure that the position improves. Jeremy Colman, the auditor general, and Dr Peter Higson, chief executive of Healthcare Inspectorate Wales, were present at the committee meeting last week, and they presented two reports. Alan Murray and Stuart Fletcher from the ambulance trust were also present. Detailed and critical questions were asked at the meeting, but we all managed to agree ultimately with Jeremy Colman and Peter Higson, who said that they now feel that the modernisation plans are getting to grips with all the fundamental problems that have existed within the ambulance service.

A number of Members, such as Jenny Randerson, Helen Mary Jones and Jonathan Morgan, have said that we should be cautious, and that is correct. The Government should also be cautious and monitor closely what is happening. Jeremy Colman and Peter Higson said that the Government must allow the trust the freedom to ensure that it can progress with its modernisation plan, and I know that the Minister agrees and that he is aware of this role. It is a responsible role of a

cytuno a'i fod yn ymwybodol o'r rôl hon. Mae'n rôl gyfrifol i Lywodraeth gymryd o ran peidio ag ymyrryd yn ormodol, ond sicrhau ar yr un pryd bod y datblygiadau yn digwydd.

Codais y pwynt gydag Alan Murray yn y pwylgor mai nid dim ond y gwasanaeth ambiwlans sydd o dan oruchwyliaeth, gan fod methiant y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y gorffennol wedi arwain at roi pwysau ychwanegol ar rai o'r gwasanaethau brys eraill, sydd wedi gorfod ymateb i alwadu yr oedd yn amhosibl i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ymateb iddynt. Yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau nad yw rhai o'r gwasanaethau brys eraill, yn enwedig yr heddlu, yn cael eu dal yn y sefyllfa hon yn y dyfodol.

4.00 p.m.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad a'r ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymateb iddo. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ei barodrwydd bob amser i ymateb yn gadarnhaol ac i fod yn agored i drafodaethau yn y maes hwn.

Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Ddirprwy Lywydd, fy mod wedi llwyddo i uffuddhau i'ch cais.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have indeed, and I hope that your example is followed.

**Nick Bourne:** I will do my best to follow the example, and the tone, set by Rhodri Glyn; as always, he has blazed a trail.

I thank the Minister on two counts. First, as has rightly been said, he is the person who gave us the inquiry, as a result of his legendary vote. [Interruption.] Indeed, and Jane Hutt, although I think that Jane's was probably an abstention. I think that that will go down as the right decision, whatever motivated you to hit that button. Secondly, I thought that the Minister's response was appropriate and positive, and I thank him for that. Clearly, there is an agreed course of action going forward.

Government not to interfere too much while ensuring at the same time that developments occur.

I raised the point with Alan Murray in committee that it is not just the ambulance service which is under scrutiny, because the failures of the ambulance service in the past have led to additional pressures on some of the other emergency services, which have had to respond to calls to which the ambulance service could not respond. I very much hope that the Minister will ensure that some of these other emergency services, particularly the police, are not placed in that position in the future.

I applaud the report and the way in which the Minister has responded to it. As Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, I am grateful to the Minister for his willingness at all times to respond positively and to be open to discussion in this field.

I hope, Deputy Presiding Officer, that I have succeeded in adhering to your request.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Fe wnaethoch yn wir, a gobeithio y dilynir eich esiampl.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwnaf fy ngorau i ddilyn yr esiampl, a'r naws a osodwyd gan Rhodri Glyn; fel bob amser, mae wedi torri cwys newydd.

Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Gweinidog ar ddau gyfrif. Yn gyntaf, fel y dywedwyd, a hynny'n briodol, ef a roddodd yr ymchwiliad inni, o ganlyniad i'w bleidlais chwedlonol. [Torri ar draws.] Yn wir, a Jane Hutt, er mai pleidlais ymatal oedd pleidlais Jane, mi gredaf. Credaf y bydd hynny'n cael ei dderbyn fel y penderfyniad cywir, waeth beth oedd eich ysgogiad. Yn ail, yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod ymateb y Gweinidog yn briodol ac yn gadarnhaol, ac yr wyf yn diolch iddo am hynny. Yn amlwg, mae camau gweithredu wedi eu cytuno yn mynd yn eu blaen.

The Auditor General for Wales has identified some serious issues, historically, regarding the ambulance service in Wales: the poor performance standards, the high-profile procurement failures, and severe management instability that we have seen in recent times. He also highlighted the claim made by Roger Thayne, one of the interim chief executive officers, that the service was in crisis. I think that we are through that now. The leadership being provided by Alan Murray is wholly appropriate and beneficial, and we are now set for a period where we can see sustained improvements.

We clearly need the investment that has been highlighted in terms of capital and revenue, which is roughly half and half—£69 million of capital; £63 million of revenue—over a period of 10 years. That is vital. Again, I welcome the Minister's indication that he will accept these principles.

In 'Time to Make a Difference', when it finally appears, Alan Murray is clearly cognisant of the problems that we face, and he sets out how we can achieve a clinically effective emergency medical service. That is certainly what this is about.

In parenthesis, to endorse what Christine Gwyther has said, this is—although not related specifically to the ambulance service—a much broader issue about the integration and doubling together of the services. That is certainly true; not just in terms of Withybush and Glangwili hospitals, but also at the Royal Gwent, Morriston and other hospitals in Wales. It is a problem that we need to look at, because no matter how well we build up this service—as I hope that we will—it depends on effective discharge of patients from the ambulance into the hospital. If ambulances are caught up like that, and if patients are perhaps not receiving the care and attention that they would get in the hospital, we are not addressing the problem of follow-through from the ambulance service. Will the Minister also take up that point? I am sure that Members from all parties and throughout Wales will endorse the points that are being made. It is an issue that certainly needs to be addressed.

Mae Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru wedi nodi rhai materion difrifol, yn hanesyddol, yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru: y safonau perfformiad gwael, y methiannau amlwg ym maes caffaol, a'r ansefydlogrwydd difrifol o ran rheolwyr a welwyd yn ddiweddar. Tynnodd sylw hefyd at yr honiad a wnaed gan Roger Thayne, un o'r prif swyddogion gweithredol dros dro, fod y gwasanaeth mewn argyfwng. Credaf fod hynny bellach y tu ôl inni. Mae'r arweiniad a ddarperir gan Alan Murray yn gwbl briodol a llesol, ac yr ydym bellach yn barod am gyfnod lle y gallwn weld gwelliannau cyson.

Yn amlwg, mae arnom angen y buddsoddiad y tynnwyd sylw ato o ran cyfalaf a refeniw, sydd tua hanner a hanner—£69 miliwn o gyfalaf; £63 miliwn o refeniw—dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Unwaith eto, croesawaf arwydd y Gweinidog y bydd yn derbyn yr egwyddorion hyn.

Yn 'Amser i Wneud Gwahaniaeth'/'Time to Make a Difference' pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi yn y pen draw, mae Alan Murray yn amlwg yn ymwybodol o'r problemau a wynebwn, ac mae'n gosod allan sut y gallwn sicrhau gwasanaeth meddygol brys sy'n glinigol effeithiol. Dyna'n sier y mae a wnelo hyn ag ef.

Mewn cromfachau, i gefnogi'r hyn y mae Christine Gwyther wedi'i ddweud—er nad yw'n ymwneud yn benodol â'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans—mae hwn yn fater ehangach o lawer ynghylch integreiddio a chyfuno'r gwasanaethau. Yn sicr, nid yw hynny'n wir; nid o ran Ysbyty Llwynhelyg ac Ysbyty Glangwili'n unig, ond hefyd o ran Ysbyty Brehinol Gwent, Ysbyty Treforys ac ysbytai eraill yng Nghymru. Mae'n broblem y mae angen inni ei hystyried, oherwydd waeth pa mor dda yr adeiladwn y gwasanaeth hwn—fel y gobeithiwn wneud—mae'n dibynnu ar ryddhau cleifion o'r ambiwlans i'r ysbyty yn effeithiol. Os caiff cerbydau ambiwlans eu rhwystro fel hynny, ac os nad yw cleifion yn cael y sylw y byddent yn ei gael yn yr ysbyty, nid ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o ddilyn ymlaen o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymdrin â'r pwynt hwnnw hefyd? Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau o bob plaid ledled Cymru yn ardystio'r pwyntiau a wneir. Mae'n fater y

mae angen mynd i'r afael ag ef yn sicr.

I hope that I have followed the example that was set, Deputy Presiding Officer.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** To better extent as far as time is concerned.

**Kirsty Williams:** The report before us clearly demonstrates that there was a consistent failure to achieve performance targets in the trust, particularly in south-east Wales and in rural areas. You do not get more rural than Brecon and Radnorshire, and you do not get poorer response times than those that my constituents have had to endure. In Powys, 44 per cent of category A calls—emergency life-threatening calls—are reached within the target time of eight minutes, which is 10 per cent below the Welsh average. Only 47 per cent of calls reach the incident within nine minutes, and only 50 per cent reach the incident within 10 minutes. While those two minutes may not seem much to us here in the Chamber, if you are the victim of an accident or a relative, standing next to that casualty, those two minutes must feel like the longest minutes of your life.

In my constituency, we have regularly seen police patrol cars picking up casualties in desperation after repeated calls to ambulance call centres have not resulted in an ambulance appearing on the scene. Ambulances based in Ystradgynlais, at the top of the Swansea valley, regularly respond to calls in Glasbury-on-Wye and Newbridge-on-Wye, because of a lack of paramedic cover in the more rural parts of my constituency. For those of you who are not acquainted with the geography of my constituency, that is the same as a Llanelli-based ambulance being required to respond to a call in Cardiff.

This is not a criticism of the staff of the ambulance service in Brecon and Radnorshire; they have been put in an impossible position, and they have often had to work in horrible circumstances. The ambulance station in Llandrindod Wells has long been condemned as unfit for purpose,

Gobeithio fy mod wedi dilyn yr esiampl a osodwyd, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** I raddau gwell o ran amser.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r adroddiad ger ein bron yn amlwg yn dangos bod methiant cyson i gyrraedd targedau perfformiad yn yr ymddiriedolaeth, yn arbennig yn y de-ddwyrain ac mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Nid oes unman sy'n fwy gwledig na Brycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, ac nid oes yn unman amseroedd ymateb gwaeth na'r rhai y mae fy etholwyr i wedi gorfod eu goddef. Ym Mhowys, caiff 44 y cant o alwadau categori A—galwadau brys lle mae bywyd mewn perygl—eu cyrraedd o fewn yr amser targed o wyth munud, sydd 10 y cant yn is na chyfartaledd Cymru. Dim ond 47 y cant o alwadau sy'n cyrraedd y digwyddiad ymhen naw munud, a dim ond 50 y cant sy'n cyrraedd y digwyddiad ymhen 10 munud. Er nad yw'r ddwy funud hynny, hwyrach, yn ymddangos yn llawer i ni yma yn y Siambra, os ydych wedi dioddef mewn damwain, neu'n berthynas sydd wrth ymyl y dioddefwr hwnnw, rhaid bod y ddwy funud hynny'n teimlo fel y munudau hiraf yn eich bywyd.

Yn fy etholaeth i, yr ydym wedi gweld ceir patrŵl yr heddlu yn codi pobl wedi'u hanafu sydd mewn cyfyng gyngor ar ôl i ambiwlans fethu ag ymddangos ar ôl galwadau dirifedi i ganolfannau galwadau ambiwlans. Mae cerbydau ambiwlans yn Ystradgynlais, yn rhan uchaf cwm Tawe, yn ymateb yn rheolaidd i alwadau yn y Clas ar Wy a'r Bontnewydd ar Wy, oherwydd prinder parameddygon yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf gwledig yn fy hetholaeth. I'r rhai ohonoch nad ydych yn gyfarwydd â daearyddiaeth fy etholaeth, mae hynny yr un peth ag ambiwlans sydd yn Llanelli yn gorfod ymateb i alwad yng Nghaerdydd.

Nid wyf yn beirniadu staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed; maent wedi eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa amhosibl, ac yn aml maent wedi gorfod gweithio mewn amgylchiadau ofnadwy. Mae'r orsaf ambiwlans yn Llandrindod wedi'i chondemnio ers tro fel un sy'n anaddas at y

and recently we have, at last, seen the ambulance trust move staff out of horrible bases in Bronllys and Builth Wells, as they try to find more appropriate places for them to work from. When I last visited the Llandrindod station—that is, when I was still allowed to visit ambulance stations, because subsequently all my requests for visits have been declined by the trust—I found a station that did not have separate toilet facilities for male and female workers, and that had no shower facilities whatsoever. Can you imagine returning from a particularly dirty accident and not being able to shower when you get back to base?

**Janet Davies:** I think that 15 out of 19 ambulance stations in Wales are not considered up to standard by the health and safety executive, and that has been the case for a number of years now. Do you agree that that is just not acceptable, and that if capital is to be spent replacing them, then proper business plans and a proper strategy must be in place?

**Kirsty Williams:** I agree with all of that, and I also think that there is an opportunity to look at relocating all the emergency services onto one site. I know that in Llandrindod Wells, for instance, it would be great if we could have a new station at which both the fire and ambulance services could be accommodated. In a world of ever-shrinking public money, we must look at how we can best use that money by co-locating services. At a time when we are asking the ambulance staff to substantially change their working practices—and past chief executives have sometimes portrayed ambulance staff as finding it particularly difficult to accept change—we must invest in them and show that we appreciate them.

Greater coverage, improvements to accident and emergency departments—as highlighted by Christine Gwyther—and changes in the role of paramedics, rather than relying on the traditional scoop and run model, will all make a difference to response times in my constituency. However, I am fearful that we

diben, ac yn ddiweddar yr ydym, o'r diwedd, wedi gweld yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn symud staff o ganolfannau ofnadwy ym Mronllys a Llanfair-ym-Muallt, wrth iddynt geisio dod o hyd i fannau mwy priodol iddynt weithio ohonynt. Pan ymwelais â gorsaf Llandrindod ddiwethaf—hynny yw, pan oedd gennyl yr hawl o hyd i ymweld â gorsafoedd ambiwlans, oherwydd yn dilyn hyn, gwrthodwyd fy holl geisiadau am ymweliadau gan yr ymddiriedolaeth—gwelais orsaf nad oedd ynddi gyfleusterau toiled ar wahân ar gyfer y merched a'r dynion a oedd yn gweithio yno, a lle nad oedd unrhyw gyfleusterau cawod o gwbl. A allwch ddychmygu dychwelyd o ddamwain arbennig o frwnt heb allu cael cawod ar ôl cyrraedd y ganolfan?

**Janet Davies:** Credaf bod 15 o'r 19 gorsaf ambiwlans yng Nghymru yn cael eu hystyried fel rhai sy'n methu cyrraedd y safon yn ôl yr awdurdod gweithredol iechyd a diogelwch, ac mae hynny wedi bod yn wir ers blynnydoedd bellach. A gytunwch nad yw hynny'n dderbynol, ac os bwriedir gwario cyfalaf i'w hadnewyddu, ei bod yn rhaid rhoi cynlluniau busnes a strategaeth briodol ar waith?

**Kirsty Williams:** Cytunaf â hynny i gyd, a chredaf hefyd fod cyfle i ystyried symud yr holl wasanaethau brys i un safle. Gwn yn Llandrindod, er enghraifft, y byddai'n wych pe gallem gael gorsaf newydd i gynnwys y gwasanaethau tân ac ambiwlans. Mewn byd lle mae arian cyhoeddus yn prysur leihau, rhaid inni ystyried y ffordd orau i ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw drwy gydleoli gwasanaethau. Ar adeg pan ofynnwn i staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans newid eu harferion gwaith yn sylweddol—ac mae prif weithredwyr yn y gorffennol weithiau wedi portreadu staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fel pobl sy'n ei chael hi'n arbennig o anodd derbyn newid—rhaid inni fuddsoddi ynddynt a dangos ein bod yn eu gwerthfawrogi.

Bydd cwmpasu ardal fwy, gwelliannau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys—fel yr oedd Christine Gwyther yn tynnu sylw—a newidiadau yn rôl parameddygon, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar y model traddodiadol o gludo cleifion ar frys, i gyd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i amseroedd ymateb yn fy etholaeth. Fodd

in Brecon and Radnorshire, and in rural Wales more generally, will be last in the queue for the investment that becomes available.

Turn briefly to the air ambulance, geography means that not all ambulances will be able to get to a shout within eight minutes in my constituency, and that is why we are so reliant on the air ambulance. The new mid Wales air ambulance service based at Welshpool began on 15 June of last year, and last month it was announced that this temporary trial would become permanent. However, that puts a great deal of pressure on local volunteers to keep that ambulance in the air. The figures demonstrate that we need it: it has responded to 300 calls in seven months, which is 43 calls per month. It has responded to some high-profile calls, such as the tragic drowning accident during the Royal Welsh Agricultural Show last year, as well as road accidents and riding accidents; its most recent shout, on 14 January, saw it respond to a 14-year-old boy who was injured in a rugby game in Builth Wells. It cannot be right, in a country as rich as ours, that we are relying on tin-rattling to keep that vital service in the air. It must become a fully fledged part of the main ambulance service in Wales, and if nothing else comes out of this report, I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will see fit to properly invest in air ambulance services.

**David Lloyd:** Within the time constraints I will concentrate on one facet, and that is the role of the ambulance service in the national health service reconfiguration. The access that patients have to hospital treatment in an emergency is always a key consideration when discussing any hospital reconfiguration. The effect of closing hospital departments and moving them elsewhere should, therefore, be an important consideration for the ambulance service centrally. It should be fully involved from the start in discussions about any possible reconfiguration. For instance, access times for brain-injured people are crucial to the debate surrounding the future of the adult neurosurgery unit at

bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus mai ni ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, ac yng Nghymru wledig yn fwy cyffredinol, fydd yr olaf i gael y buddsoddiad a fydd ar gael.

I droi'n gyflym at yr ambiwlans awyr, mae daearyddiaeth yn golygu na fydd pob ambiwlans yn gallu cyrraedd galwad cyn pen wyth munud yn fy etholaeth i, a dyna pam ein bod mor ddibynnol ar yr ambiwlans awyr. Dechreuodd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr newydd sydd yn y Trallwng yn y canolbarth ar 15 Mehefin y llynedd, a'r mis diwethaf cyhoeddwyd y byddai'r cynllun peilot hwn dros dro yn dod yn gynllun parhaol. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n rhoi cryn bwysau ar wirfoddolwyr lleol i gadw'r ambiwlans hwnnw yn yr awyr. Dengys y ffigurau fod angen yr ambiwlans arnom: mae wedi ymateb i 300 o alwadau mewn saith mis, sy'n 43 o alwadau y mis. Mae wedi ymateb i rai galwadau amlwg iawn, megis y ddamwain foddi drasig yn ystod Sioe Amaethyddol Frenhinol Cymru y llynedd, yn ogystal â damweiniau ar y ffordd a damweiniau marchogaeth. Ar ei alwad ddiweddaraf, ar 14 Ionawr, fe'i gwelwyd yn ymateb i fachgen 14 oed a oedd wedi'i anafu mewn gêm rygbi yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Nid yw'n iawn ein bod ni, mewn gwlad mor gyfoethog, yn dibynnu ar gasglwyr arian i gadw'r gwasanaeth hanfodol hwnnw yn yr awyr. Rhaid iddo ddod yn rhan lawn o'r prif wasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Os na fydd dim arall yn deillio o'r adroddiad hwn, gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn penderfynu buddsoddi'n briodol mewn gwasanaethau ambiwlans awyr.

**David Lloyd:** O fewn y cyfyngiadau amser, byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar un elfen, sef rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y broses o ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae gallu cleifion i gael triniaeth yn yr ysbty mewn achos brys bob amser yn ystyriaeth allweddol wrth drafod unrhyw broses o ailgyflunio ysbty. Felly, dylai effaith cau adrannau ysbty a'u symud i fan arall fod yn ystyriaeth bwysig i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ganolog. Dylid ei gynnwys yn llawn o'r cychwyn mewn trafodaethau am unrhyw ailgyflunio possibl. Er enghraifft, mae amseroedd mynediad o bobl sydd wedi cael anaf i'r ymennydd yn allweddol i'r ddadl ynglŷn â dyfodol yr uned niwrolawdriniaeth i

Morriston in Swansea; they must have access to prompt treatment in a neurosurgery unit within the so-called golden hour or golden two hours in order to get the best results. People in Ceredigion and Pembroke injured in severe car accidents or cliff falls have that coverage now with neurosurgery at Morriston. However, the same people will have difficulty in accessing neurosurgery in Cardiff within that same golden two hour limit, providing a new challenge for both the air ambulance and its land-based cousin.

4.10 p.m.

In addition, separating neurosurgery from the burns and plastics department at Morriston—when people in horrific accidents need the services of neurosurgery and burns and plastics—means more ambulances travelling back and forth along the M4, transferring patients, when both units could be on one site. Those sorts of discussions on configuration should be central. The ambulance service should be involved from the start and not as an afterthought or not at all. So, in conclusion, paramedic ambulance staff deserve our praise for their dedication and commitment; the ambulance service has a pivotal role to play in any service change in the NHS and should be a central partner in all the discussions from the start.

**Mark Isherwood:** As we have heard, this audit report highlights the urgent need for a draft modernisation report or plan to enable the Welsh ambulance trust board to succeed. The service saw five different bosses over the last year and three chief executives over just a three-month period. NHS statistics reveal that, between July and September last year, just 54 per cent of ambulances achieved an eight-minute target to respond to the most serious cases—that is a fall from the previous quarter and is well below the Assembly Government's target.

oedolion yn Nhrefforys yn Abertawe; rhaid iddynt allu cael triniaeth gyflym mewn uned niwrolawdriniaeth o fewn yr awr euraid neu'r ddwy awr euraid honedig er mwyn cael y canlyniadau gorau. Caiff pobl yng Ngheredigion a Phenfro sy'n cael eu hanafu mewn damweiniau car difrifol, neu wrth syrthio o glogwyni, eu cynnwys bellach gan uned niwrolawdriniaeth yn Nhrefforys. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr un bobl yn cael anhawster i allu niwrolawdriniaeth yng Nghaerdydd o fewn yr un terfyn amser euraid hwnnw o ddwy awr, sy'n gosod her newydd i'r ambiwlans awyr a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ar y tir.

Yn ogystal, mae gwahanu niwrolawdriniaeth a'r adran llosiadau a phlastigion yn Nhrefforys—lle mae angen i bobl mewn damweiniau difrifol iawn gael triniaeth gan yr uned niwrolawdriniaeth a'r uned llosiadau a phlastigion—yn golygu bod mwy o gerbydau ambiwlans yn teithio yn ôl ac ymlaen ar hyd yr M4, yn trosglwyddo cleifion, pan allai'r ddwy uned fod ar yr un safle. Dylai'r mathau hynny o drafodaethau ar gyflunio fod yn ganolog. Dylai'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ymwneud â hyn o'r cychwyn, nid fel ôl-ystyriaeth neu ddim o gwbl. Felly, i gloi, mae staff ambiwlans parameddygol yn haeddu ein clod am eu hymroddiad a'u hymrwymiad; mae gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans rôl hollbwysig mewn unrhyw newid mewn gwasanaeth yn y GIG, a dylai fod yn bartner canolog ym mhob trafodaeth o'r cychwyn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel y clywsom, mae'r adroddiad archwilio hwn yn tynnu sylw at yr angen brys am adroddiad neu gynllun moderneiddio drafft i alluogi bwrdd ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru i lwyddo. Cafodd y gwasanaeth bum penneth gwahanol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a thri phrif weithredwr yn ystod cyfnod o dri mis yn unig. Yn ôl ystadegau'r GIG, rhwng mis Gorffennaf a mis Medi y llynedd, dim ond 54 y cant o gerbydau ambiwlans a gyrhaeddodd y targed o ymateb cyn pen wyth munud i'r achosion mwyaf difrifol—mae hynny'n ostyngiad o'i gymharu â'r chwarter blaenorol, ac mae'n is o lawer na tharged Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

The auditor general's report has highlighted the long-standing lack of direction as well as weaknesses in leadership that have led to the long-standing poor performance of the service. Inflexible ambulance crew shift patterns have led to the service not matching peak demands for ambulances and patient-care services, even though the overall staff and revenue resources appeared to be adequate. Management failures have left the service with an inadequate fleet of ambulances and, earlier this month, a report by the Healthcare Inspectorate Wales found that lives must have been lost because of poor performance by the Welsh ambulance service. That followed claims by acting chief executive, Roger Thayne, who resigned after two months in the post, that the trust was in crisis and that these failings meant that 500 people were dying unnecessarily each year. Although Healthcare Inspectorate Wales stated that it was difficult to determine whether this estimate was accurate, it added that there was clearly room for significant improvement.

The appointment of Alan Murray as chief executive last August was welcomed, and rightly so, particularly given his record of turning around the Merseyside ambulance service after it was labelled the worst in England. However, it is clear that this Assembly Government has been the victim rather than the master or mistress of events. It has reacted to the growing crisis rather than planning ahead to manage the necessary change—caught like a rabbit in headlights.

During the Audit Committee's evidence-taking session on 14 December, the auditor general agreed with me that the ambulance service's management culture looked like something from 30 years ago. He added that the strongly unionised workforce was not a bad thing in itself, but having reasonably well-organised, effective unions and weak management is not a good situation; those are his words and not mine.

Mae adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol wedi tynnu sylw at y diffyg cyfeiriad maith yn ogystal â gwendidau mewn arweinyddiaeth a arweiniodd at y perfformiad gwael maith yn y gwasanaeth. Mae patrymau sifftiau anhyblyg i griwiau ambiwlans wedi golygu nad yw'r gwasanaeth yn cyd-fynd â galwadau cyfnodau brig am wasanaethau cerbydau ambiwlans a gofal cleifion, er bod yr adnoddau staff a refeniw cyffredinol i'w gweld yn ddigonol. Mae methiannau rheolwyr wedi gadael y gwasanaeth gyda fflyd annigonol o gerbydau ambiwlans, ac yn gynharach y mis hwn gwelodd adroddiad gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru fod marwolaethau'n sicc wedi digwydd oherwydd perfformiad gwael gan wasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Daeth hyn yn sgil honiadau gan y prif weithredwr dros dro, Roger Thayne, a ymddeolodd ar ôl deufis yn y swydd, fod yr ymddiriedolaeth mewn argyfwng a bod y methiannau hyn yn golygu bod 500 o bobl yn marw'n ddiangen bob blwyddyn. Er bod Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru wedi dweud ei bod yn anodd gweld a oedd yr amcangyfrif hwn yn gywir ai peidio, ychwanegodd fod lle yn amlwg i wella'n sylweddol.

Croesawyd y ffaith fod Alan Murray wedi'i benodi yn brif weithredwr fis Awst diwethaf, a hynny'n hollool gywir, yn arbennig o gofio'i hanes yn trawsnewid y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nglannau Mersi, ar ôl i hwnnw gael ei alw y gwaethaf yn Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn wedi bod yn dioddef y digwyddiadau yn hytrach na bod yn feistr neu'n feistres drostynt. Mae wedi ymateb i'r argyfwng cynyddol yn hytrach na chynllunio i'r dyfodol i reoli'r newid angenrheidiol—wedi'i pharlysu gan ofn.

Yn ystod sesiwn casglu tystiolaeth gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar 14 Rhagfyr, cytunodd yr archwilydd cyffredinol â mi fod diwylliant rheoli'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn edrych fel rhywbeth a welid 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Ychwanegodd nad oedd y gweithlu, a oedd yn gryf o blaidd undebaeth, yn beth drwg ynddo'i hun, ond nad oedd cael undebau effeithiol a chymharol drefnus a rheolwyr gwan yn sefyllfa dda; ei eiriau ef yw'r rheini, nid fy ngeiriau i.

Referring to the lack of basic management information, I asked Alan Murray when the trust would stop being generously funded to provide poor services and start matching the supply of resources with the need for services. In response, he stated that they had already made significant strides. A review of staff rotas is being conducted with the agreement of the staff of representative organisations. They already have new deployment plans, to an extent, but the real challenge is compliance with those plans, which will require training at management as well as at staff levels.

He also rightly stated that staff would not comply with the plan if they were not involved in its development and, as I commented at the committee, sharing corporate goals with employees is vital if something is to work. As Alan Murray has stated, there is a genuine passion and desire among staff to improve the service. I also mention that this has highlighted the need for us to roll-out access to automatic defibrillators in the community for people suffering cardiac arrest.

The auditor general concludes that successful delivery of the trust's draft modernisation plan will address those of his recommendations that fall to the trust for action. So, with leadership, strategic direction and internal efficiency, they can and they must succeed.

**Eleanor Burnham:** This report obviously highlights the long-standing problems that everyone else has mentioned. I am particularly concerned about the failings in the infrastructure, including the information and communications technology and the fleet itself. I hope that the new fleet of ambulances will put this problem right.

I was impressed by Alan Murray when we met him with the Minister last September in Anglesey. I hope that his enthusiasm and motivation will bring everything up to speed, because we have all received details of incidents, which I do not have time to go into today. However, I think that blockages in

Gan gyfeirio at y prinder gwybodaeth reoli sylfaenol, gofynnais i Alan Murray pryd y byddai'r ymddiriedolaeth yn rhoi'r gorau i i gael arian hael am ddarparu gwasanaethau gwael, a dechrau gwneud i'r cyflenwad adnoddau ateb yr angen am wasanaethau. Mewn ymateb, dywedodd eu bod eisoes wedi gwneud camau breision. Mae adolygiad o rotas staff ar y gweill gyda chytundeb staff y sefydliadau cynrychioli. Mae ganddynt gynlluniau adleoli newydd eisoes, i raddau, ond yr her wirioneddol yw cydymffurfio â'r cynlluniau hynny, a fydd yn gofyn am hyfforddiant ar lefel rheolwyr yn ogystal ag ar lefel staff.

Dywedodd hefyd, yn holol gywir, na fyddai staff yn cydymffurfio â'r cynllun os na chaent eu cynnwys yn ei ddatblygiad, ac fel y dywedais yn y pwylgor, mae rhannu nodau corfforaethol gyda chyflogeion yn hanfodol os yw rhywbeth i weithio. Fel y dywedodd Alan Murray, mae angerdd ac awydd gwirioneddol ymhlih staff i wella'r gwasanaeth. Soniaf hefyd fod hyn wedi tynny sylw at yr angen inni sicrhau bod modd i bobl sy'n dioddef gan ataliad y galon allu cael diffibrilwyr yn y gymuned.

Daw'r archwilydd cyffredinol i'r casgliad y bydd cyflawni cynllun moderneiddio drafft yr ymddiriedolaeth yn llwyddiannus yn mynd i'r afael â'r argymhellion hynny ganddo y mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn gyfrifol am eu gweithredu. Felly, gydag arweiniad, cyfeiriad strategol ac effeithlonrwydd mewnol, gallant lwyddo a rhaid iddynt lwyddo.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amlwg yn tynnu sylw at y problemau maith y mae pawb arall wedi'u crybwyl. Yr wyf yn arbennig o bryderus am y methiannau yn y seilwaith, gan gynnwys y dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, a'r fflyd ei hun. Gobeithio y bydd y fflyd newydd o gerbydau mbiwlans yn unioni'r broblem hon.

Creodd Alan Murray argraff dda arnaf pan gawsom gyfarf gydag ef a'r Gweinidog fis Medi diwethaf yn Ynys Môn. Gobeithio y bydd ei frwdfrydedd a'i gymhelliaid yn golygu y byddwn yn gwneud llawer o gynnydd, oherwydd yr ydym i gyd wedi cael manylion am ddigwyddiadau nad oes gennylf

accident and emergency departments are particularly problematic across the north Wales region.

amser i sôn amdanynt heddiw. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod rhwystrau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn creu llawer o broblemau ar draws rhanbarth y gogledd yn arbennig.

I have a small concern with regard to satellite navigation. I trust that it will be of the best quality, particularly after having read a horrifying story in the UK papers at the end of last year about a geographically challenged ambulance team that took a circuitous and wrong route across London via Manchester. Therefore, I hope, Minister, that you will ensure that the system will be of the very best quality, because there have been some horror stories about navigation systems. Thank you.

Yr wyf yn pryderu ychydig ynghylch llywio â lloeren. Hyderaf y bydd y system o'r safon orau, yn enwedig ar ôl darllen y stori ddychrynllyd ym mhapurau newydd y DU ddiwedd y llynedd am dim ambiwlans heb lawer o wybodaeth am ddaearyddiaeth a gymerodd y ffordd anghywir a chwmpasog ar draws Llundain, a hynny drwy Fanceinion. Felly, gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd y system o'r safon orau, oherwydd cafwyd straeon dychrynllyd am systemau llywio. Diolch.

**Bryngle Williams rose—**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Have you finished, Eleanor?

**Eleanor Burnham:** No but Brynle can carry on.

**Bryngle Williams:** Briefly, I would like to highlight the importance of satellite navigation in rural areas. For some reason—and I have taken this up with Edwina Hart—I have three postcodes.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** You must have a large house. [Laughter.]

**Bryngle Williams:** You may make light of it, but it is a serious situation. I have three postcodes and I have had incidences because of that. Therefore, this situation needs to be sorted.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for that interesting and intriguing revelation, Brynle. I am keen to have an assurance from the Minister that the satellite navigation system will be adequate, because, as Brynle has just pointed out, it is extremely important, particularly in rural areas.

**Jocelyn Davies:** The public is, quite rightly, highly supportive of the ambulance service and those who work within it. However, as a member of the Audit Committee, I was concerned to read in the Wales Audit Office

**Bryngle Williams a gododd—**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ydych wedi gorffen, Eleanor?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Nac ydw, ond gall Brynle barhau.

**Bryngle Williams:** Yn fyr, hoffwn dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd llywio â lloeren mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Am ryw reswm—ac yr wyf wedi codi hyn gydag Edwina Hart—mae gennyf dri chod post.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Rhaid bod gennych dŷ mawr. [Chwerthin.]

**Bryngle Williams:** Mae'n ddigon hawdd ichi chwerthin, ond mae'n sefyllfa ddifrifol. Mae gennyf dri chod post ac mae hyn wedi peri broblemau. Felly, mae angen unioni'r sefyllfa hon.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch am y datgeliad didorol a rhyfedd hwnnw, Brynle. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd y system llywio â lloeren yn ddigonol, oherwydd, fel y mae Brynle newydd ei ddweud, mae'n hynod o bwysig, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae'r cyhoedd, yn gywir ddigon, yn gefnogol iawn i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'r rheini sy'n gweithio ynddo. Fodd bynnag, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio, yr oeddwn yn pryderu wrth

report that the trust has not spent public funds well. Although the public wants to see our ambulance service well resourced, the trust has a responsibility to ensure that it gets good value for money.

To get a well-equipped, modern service with the resources available, you must spend wisely. This has not always been the case. An example of that is the recent purchase of 46 ambulances, which were bought because the condition of the fleet was of concern, but the new vehicles turned out not to be fully fit for purpose and were a poor buy. It must be very demoralising for staff when their badly needed new ambulances are not usable and the trust simply cannot ask for more funds unless it demonstrates that the money will be well spent. The trust's record on this has been poor and the report highlights several more examples of poor and potentially unlawful procurement, driven mainly by the desire to spend money before the end of the financial year. Perhaps the Minister will tell us when he and his officials became aware of those problems and why those weaknesses were allowed to continue into 2006.

I remind the Minister of what he told the Health and Social Services Scrutiny Subcommittee in July 2005. He said:

'If the ambulance service does not seem to be capable of taking on the improvement agenda, then, as part of our performance management regime in the Assembly, there will be an escalator for interventions from us at the centre'.

He also said:

'Patients in Wales are entitled to have a quality service, if the management will not change, we will have to act'.

That appeared to indicate that a more hands-on approach would be adopted. The Minister must say what he did following that

ddarllen yn adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru nad yw'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwario arian cyhoeddus yn effeithiol. Er bod y cyhoedd am weld digon o adnoddau'n cael eu rhoi i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae gan yr ymddiriedolaeth gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau ei bod yn cael gwerth da am yr arian.

Er mwyn cael gwasanaeth modern a phriodol gyda'r adnoddau sydd ar gael, rhaid gwario'n ddoeth. Nid yw hyn wedi digwydd bob tro. Un enghraifft o hyn yw'r fflyd o 46 o gerbydau ambiwlans a brynwyt yn ddiweddar gan fod cyflwr y fflyd yn achosi pryder. Ond yn y pen draw, nid oedd y cerbydau newydd yn gwbl addas at y diben, ac felly nid oeddent yn fuddsoddiad da. Mae'n siŵr fod staff yn digalonni pan na allant ddefnyddio eu cerbydau ambiwlans newydd yr oedd dirfawr angen amdanyst. Ac ni all yr ymddiriedolaeth ofyn am ragor o arian oni fydd yn gallu dangos y caiff yr arian ei wario'n dda. Nid oes gan yr ymddiriedolaeth record dda yn hyn, ac mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw ar lawer enghraifft arall o gaffael gwael a allai fod yn anghyfreithlon, a hynny wedi ei ysgogi'n bennaf gan y dyhead i wario arian cyn diweddu flwyddyn ariannol. Efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym pryd y daeth ef a'i swyddogion i wybod am y problemau hyn, a pham y caniatawyd i'r gwendar hynny barhau i mewn i 2006.

Hoffwn atgoffa'r Gweinidog o'r hyn a ddywedodd wrth yr Is-bwylgor Craffu Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Gorffennaf 2005. Meddai:

Os nad yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i'w weld yn gallu ymgorfod i'r agenda wella, yna, fel rhan o'n cyfundrefn rheoli perfformiad yn y Cynulliad, bydd mwy o ymyrryd gennym ni yn y canol.

Dywedodd hefyd:

Mae gan gleifion yng Nghymru yr hawl i gael gwasanaeth o safon, ac os na fydd y rheolwyr yn newid, bydd yn rhaid inni weithredu.

Yr oedd hynny fe pe'n awgrymu mabwysiadu dull mwy uniongyrchol. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddweud yr hyn a wnaeth ar ôl y datganiad

statement other than to say that he was not responsible and to resist the idea of this inquiry.

Patients in my region of South Wales East have suffered greatly as that area has some of the worst response times. GPs have lost confidence in the service. We should acknowledge that the public holds the ambulance staff and the paramedics in high esteem but, to be effective, the service must have the right equipment so that staff can do their jobs properly. Therefore, Minister, will you undertake to ensure that you will no longer tolerate public money being wasted and, in relation to procurement, that you will take the hands-on approach that you appear to have promised in 2005?

4.20 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** I support the idea of regional commissioning. I hope that, for those of us who live in rural areas, it will provide the answer, because we are geographically compromised, as Kirsty Williams mentioned earlier.

In Ceredigion, there are three emergency ambulances, stationed at Aberystwyth, New Quay and Lampeter. If there is a major road traffic accident or trauma incident involving transfer to Morriston Hospital in Swansea, it can take one of those ambulances out of the county for up to five hours, and longer, as Christine Gwyther mentioned, if there are problems with queues while offloading patients.

Staff at Bronglais District General Hospital in Aberystwyth frequently have to blue-light ambulances for transferring emergencies to larger hospitals. That means that they dial 999 directly to get the ambulance, because, otherwise, they are apparently asked a plethora of questions about who will pay for that service to transfer a patient. Imagine that it is for a six-year-old child with severed fingers in need of microsurgery at Morriston Hospital; we cannot expect our NHS staff to go through that rigmarole of 20 questions.

hwnnw, yn hytrach na dweud nad oedd yn gyfrifol ac ymwrthod â syniad yr ymchwiliad hwn.

Mae cleifion yn fy rhanbarth i yn y deddwyraint wedi dioddef yn ddifawr gan mai yn yr ardal honno y mae rhai o'r amseroedd ymateb gwaethaf. Mae meddygon teulu wedi colli hyder yn y gwasanaeth. Dylem gydnabod bod gan y cyhoedd barch at staff ambiwlans a'r parameddygon, ond i fod yn effeithiol rhaid i'r gwasanaeth gael y cyfarpar cywir fel y gall staff wneud eu gwaith yn iawn. Felly, Weinidog, a sicrhewch na fyddwch mwyach yn goddef gweld arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wastraffu, ac o ran caffael y byddwch yn mabwysiadu dull uniongyrchol yr ymddengys ichi ei addo yn 2005?

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r syniad o gomisiynu rhanbarthol. Gobeithio, i'r rheini ohonom sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mai dyna fydd yr ateb, oherwydd yr ydym dan anfantais yn ddaearyddol, fel y soniodd Kirsty Williams yn gynharach.

Yng Ngheredigion, mae yna dri ambiwlans brys, yn Aberystwyth, yn y Ceinewydd ac yn Llanbedr Pont Steffan. Os bydd damwain fawr ar y ffordd neu ddigwyddiad trawma sy'n galw am drosglwyddo cleifion i Ysbyty Treforys yn Abertawe, gall olygu cymryd un o'r cerbydau ambiwlans hynny allan o'r sir am hyd at bum awr a mwy, fel y dywedodd Christine Gwyther, os bydd problemau gyda chiwiau wrth ollwng cleifion yn yr ysbyty.

Yn aml, rhaid i staff yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Dosbarth Bron-glais ddefnyddio'r golau glas ar gerbydau ambiwlans i drosglwyddo achosion brys i ysbytai mwy. Mae hynny'n golygu eu bod yn deialu 999 yn uniongyrchol i gael yr ambiwlans, oherwydd, fel arall, yn ôl y sôn, gofynnir llu o gwestiynau iddynt ynghylch pwy fydd yn talu am y gwasanaeth hwnnw i drosglwyddo claf. Dychmygwch hynny'n digwydd i blentyn chwe oed sydd â'i fysedd sydd wedi'u torri'n wael ac angen microlawdriniaeth arno yn Ysbyty Treforys; ni allwn ddisgwyl i'n staff yn y GIG orfod ateb llu o gwestiynau fel yna.

The air ambulance needs further development. People often seem to think that the air ambulance is the answer to everything, but not any kind of helicopter can land just anywhere, and during transfers, trauma teams often need to be on board. Aberystwyth, by helicopter, is less than an hour from Morriston Hospital, but it often takes five hours to set that up. It is not unusual for helicopters flying from Aberystwyth to Morriston Hospital to have to be scrambled from Prestwick in Scotland.

If the future of the service is to be sustainable in mid and west Wales, there must be more interdepartmental working across the NHS. It is completely unrealistic, unintelligent even, to write a report suggesting the relocation of some maternity services and 24-hour emergency surgery from a lynchpin hospital like Bronglais to a centre near Carmarthen, without factoring in the sort of impact that that change would have on our ambulance service. Yet, that is what happened this time last year. Minister, if we want the ambulance service to be fit for purpose in the future, we must never allow that kind of thing to happen again.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I thank Assembly Members for their constructive and helpful debate.

Probably the first thing that everyone wants reassurance on is that this will not happen again. They will also want to know why we can be optimistic that change will occur on this occasion. We know from the report that the basic funding system of the ambulance service is adequate in terms of the volume of investment that is going into the service. However, capital is needed, and we have given our commitment to meeting those capital requirements, obviously in line with the business cases submitted for that, as the audit office reported.

However, for other issues, it is really not a case of money, because the audit office's report is littered with examples of good money going after bad, and the failure of

Mae angen datblygu'r ambiwlans awyr ymhellach. Mae pobl yn aml fel pe baent yn meddwl mai'r ambiwlans awyr yw'r ateb i bopeth, ond ni all pob math o hofrennydd lanio ym mhobman, ac wrth drosglwyddo cleifion, mae angen cael timau trawma yn aml ar yr hofrennydd. Mae'n cymryd llai nag awr i deithio mewn hofrennydd o Aberystwyth i Ysbyty Treforys, ond yn aml bydd yn cymryd pum awr i drefnu hynny. Nid yw'n anarferol gorfod galw hofrennydd o Prestwick yn yr Alban i hedfan o Aberystwyth i Ysbyty Treforys.

Er mwyn gallu cynnal y gwasanaeth yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn y dyfodol, rhaid sicrhau bod adrannau'n cydweithio ar draws y GIG. Mae'n holol afrealistig, yn anneallus hyd yn oed, ysgrifennu adroddiad yn awgrymu y dylid symud rhai gwasanaethau mamolaeth a llawdriniaeth frys 24 awr o ysbyty hanfodol fel Bron-glais i ganolfan ger Caerfyrddin, heb ystyried y math o effaith y byddai'r newid hwnnw'n ei chael ar ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Eto, dyna a ddigwyddodd yr adeg hon y llynedd. Weinidog, er mwyn i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans fod yn addas at y diben yn y dyfodol, ni ddylid caniatau i'r fath beth ddigwydd eto.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Hoffwn ddiolch i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am eu trafodaeth adeiladol a defnyddiol.

Mae'n debyg mai'r peth cyntaf yr hoffai pawb gael sicrwydd yn ei gylch yw na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto. Byddant hefyd am gael gwybod pam y gallwn fod yn obeithiol y bydd newid yn digwydd y tro hwn. Gwyddom o'r adroddiad fod system ariannu sylfaenol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ddigonol o ran maint y buddsoddiad yn y gwasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cyfalaf, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fodloni'r gofynion cyfalaf hynny, yn amlwg yn unol â'r achosion busnes a gyflwynwyd ar gyfer hynny, fel y dywedodd y swyddfa archwilio.

Fodd bynnag, o ran materion eraill, nid achos o arian ydyw mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd mae adroddiad y swyddfa archwilio'n frith o enghreifftiau o daflu arian da ar ôl arian

management to use it effectively. There was a failure of leadership and vision, and I think that everyone acknowledges that that leadership and vision seems to be there now. Equally, the governance within the organisation was woefully weak. That is why particular attention is being given to the governance arrangements in the ambulance service. The service needs to acknowledge this. Indeed, it is partly the reason why a more thorough root-and-branch governance review is going on in the health service at the moment, led by David Richards, because we acknowledge that governance problems are not unique to the ambulance service.

People described how the ambulance service needs to modernise and said that we need to move from the service being essentially a scoop-and-run, or transport, service, to being a mobile clinical service. That is very much part of the modernisation programme and, having met with staff in the ambulance service, it is clear that they are committed to that type of change in the service. That sense of frustration has existed for many years. However, one of the points that Alan Murray made in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting last week was that, with regard to measuring the ambulance service's performance, it is not just a case of looking at the quantitative performance, in terms of 60 per cent within eight minutes and so on. We really have to start looking at performance in a more holistic way, and we must be much more focused on the performance outcome, in terms of the quality of the service. For example, the work that is going on on thrombolysis is an indication of that.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brian, given your acknowledgement that simply looking at response times is not an adequate way of measuring ambulance service performance, and the fact that that can actually skew investment, because, in the past, the ambulance service has invested in areas where it can meet targets rather than in other areas, will you be looking at a new performance management system that can look at outcomes as well as response times, and which leads to a system where

drwg, a methiant y rheolwyr i'w ddefnyddio'n effeithiol. Cafwyd diffyg arweinyddiaeth a gweledigaeth, a chredaf fod pawb yn cydnabod bod yr arweinyddiaeth a'r weledigaeth hynny yn bodoli erbyn hyn. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd y llywodraethu o fewn y sefydliad yn ddifrifol o wan. Dyna pam y rhoddir sylw penodol i'r trefniadau llywodraethu yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae angen i'r gwasanaeth gydnabod hyn. Yn wir, dyna'r rheswm yn rhannol pam mae adolygiad llywodraethu cynhwysfawr mwy trylwyr yn mynd ymlaen yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ar hyn o bryd, o dan arweiniad David Richards, oherwydd yr ydym yn cydnabod nad yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn unig y mae problemau llywodraethu.

Mae pobl wedi disgrifio sut y mae angen i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans foderneiddio, gan ddweud bod angen inni symud oddi wrth wasanaeth cludo cleifion yn y bôn, i wasanaeth clinigol symudol. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r rhaglen foderneiddio, ac ar ôl cwrdd ag aelodau o staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae'n amlwg eu bod wedi ymrwymo i'r math hwnnw o newid yn y gwasanaeth. Mae'r ymdeimlad hwnnw o rwystredigaeth yn bodoli ers blynnyddoedd. Fodd bynnag, un o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Alan Murray yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf oedd, o ran mesur perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ei fod yn golygu mwy nag edrych ar y perfformiad meintiol, o ran 60 y cant cyn pen wyth munud, ac ati. Rhaid inni ddechrau edrych ar berfformiad mewn modd mwy cyfannol, a rhaid inni ganolbwytio llawer mwy ar ganlyniad y perfformiad, o ran ansawdd y gwasanaeth. Er enghraifft, mae'r gwaith sy'n mynd ymlaen ym maes thrombolysis yn dangos hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brian, gan eich bod wedi cydnabod nad yw edrych ar amseroedd ymateb yn unig yn ffodd ddigonol o fesur perfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a'r ffaith y gall hynny ddylanwadu ar fuddsoddiad mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd, bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, yn yn gorffennol, wedi buddsoddi mewn meysydd lle y gall gyrraedd targedau yn hytrach nag mewn meysydd eraill, a fyddwch yn edrych ar system newydd o reoli perfformiad a all edrych ar ganlyniadau yn ogystal ag

paramedics actually know what happened to the patients that they took into hospital? It is often the case that they do not know what later happens to those patients.

**Brian Gibbons:** Again, Kirsty covers a point that was emphasised strongly, not only in the Wales Audit Office's report, but in the report by the Healthcare Inspectorate Wales: the weakness of clinical audit and performance audit in the organisation. Clearly, if there was a more resilient audit process in place, this type of feedback would be made available. Indeed, the recommendation that the clinical lead in the ambulance service should be a full-time officer is fully recognised. The executive director of NHS Direct is going to have responsibility for governance issues too. That point is well made.

In the context of rural Wales, looking at the way in which the ambulance service is suggesting that it should modernise, some of the most imaginative and innovative ideas are coming forward in relation to the way in which the ambulance service will deliver in rural areas. Certainly, the old traditional system of highly skilled, highly motivated, professional staff sitting in ambulance stations waiting for a call will no longer exist. These people are too committed and too skilled for that, and the role of the ambulance service in rural Wales will change radically as the modernisation process is outlined.

I was surprised and disappointed to hear the story that Chris Gwyther recounted. As she was recounting the story—and it was no courtesy to her—I was looking to see what the audit report said on the turnaround times at Glangwili and Withybush hospitals. According to the figures in the report, those hospitals were performing better than the Welsh average. Clearly, there is something seriously wrong if the reports that you have given us today are anything other than an aberration.

**Christine Gwyther:** The point that has been made to me by my constituents is that it is the point at which the patient is registered at the

amseroedd ymateb, ac sy'n arwain at system lle mae parameddygon yn gwybod beth a ddigwyddodd i'r cleifion yr aethant â hwy i'r ysbyty? Yn aml, ni fyddant yn gwybod beth sy'n digwydd i'r cleifion hynny'n ddiweddarach.

**Brian Gibbons:** Unwaith eto, mae Kirsty yn sôn am bwynt a bwysleisiwyd yn gryf, nid yn unig yn adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ond hefyd yn yr adroddiad gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru: gwendid archwiliadau clinigol ac archwiliadau o berfformiad yn y sefydliad. Yn amlwg, pe bai proses archwilio gadarnach ar waith, byddai'r math hwn o adborth ar gael. Yn wir, cydnabyddir yn llawn yr argymhelliaid y dylai arweinydd clinigol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fod yn swyddog llawn amser. Bydd gan gyfarwyddwr gweithredol Galw Iechyd Cymru gyfrifoldeb dros faterion llywodraethu hefyd. Gwneir y pwynt hwnnw'n eglur iawn.

Yng nghyd-destun Cymru wledig, o edrych ar y ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn awgrymu y dylai foderneiddio, caiff rhai o'r syniadau mwyaf creadigol ac arloesol eu cylwyno mewn perthynas â darparu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yn sicr, ni fydd yr hen system draddodiadol o staff proffesiynol, medrus iawn a chryf eu cymhelliaid yn eistedd mewn gorsafoedd ambiwlans yn aros am alwad yn bodoli mwyach. Mae'r bobl hyn yn rhy ymroddedig a medrus, a bydd rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru wledig yn newid yn sylweddol wrth i'r broses foderneiddio gael ei hamlinellu.

Cefais fy synnu a'm siomi o glywed y stori a adroddodd Chris Gwyther. Wrth iddi adrodd y stori—ac nid oherwydd unrhyw anghwrteisi ar fy rhan i—yr oeddwn yn edrych i weld beth yr oedd yr adroddiad archwilio yn ei ddweud am yr amseroedd trin cleifion yn ysbytai Glangwili a Llwynhelyg. Yn ôl ffigurau'r adroddiad, yr oedd yr ysbytai hynny'n perfformio'n well na chyfartaedd Cymru. Mae'n amlwg bod rhywbeth mawr o'i le os nad yw'r hyn yr oeddech yn sôn amdano yn rhywbeth holol anarferol.

**Christine Gwyther:** Dywedodd fy etholwyr wrthyf mai pryd y caiff y claf ei gofrestru yn ysbyty ymddiriedolaeth y GIG sy'n bwysig.

NHS trust hospital that matters. If they are still in the ambulance and have not been registered, they are not a statistical problem, although, of course, they are a problem in reality. That could be skewing the figures, and I am very concerned that that may be the case.

**Brian Gibbons:** We need to look into that, as I said, because, if the data are not correct and accurate, clearly that is worse than useless.

**Catherine Thomas:** You made reference to the Carmarthenshire trust; do you understand the concerns of my constituents, who are fighting plans to relocate emergency surgery facilities to Carmarthen? Although they have complete faith in the paramedics who would care for them, they would face a journey of 25 miles from Llanelli to Carmarthen. Given the current state of the service, do you not agree and understand that this only adds to their fears?

**Brian Gibbons:** The point that Catherine raises is important, because, if any changes were to be made to the present arrangements at Llanelli, it would be vital to be clear about where patients would move.

4.30 p.m.

Patients travelling 25m could be problematic, particularly if there are hospitals far closer to the patients. If there were any changes—and if there were any change in Llanelli—I would hope and expect that there would be a clear picture of the time and distance, and the ability of the ambulance service to deliver in response. I do not think that we can just leave the service to make a decision and then hope that it will be all right on the night, for the very reason that you said. We need to have that certainty and clarity in advance of any final decision. You are aware that concern about the ambulance service has been at the heart of much local concern on this particular issue.

Time is probably running out—

Os ydynt yn dal yn yr ambiwlans ac os nad ydynt wedi eu cofrestru, nid ydynt yn broblem ystadegol. Ond wrth gwrs, maent yn broblem mewn gwirionedd. Gallai hynny ddylanwadu ar y ffigurau, ac yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr mai felly y mae.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae angen inni edrych ar hynny, fel y dywedais, oherwydd os nad yw'r data'n gywir, mae hynny'n amlwg yn waeth na ddiwerth.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at ymddiriedolaeth sir Gaerfyddin; a ydych yn deall pryderon fy etholwyr, sy'n brwydro yn erbyn cynlluniau i symud cyfleusterau llawdriniaethau brys i Gaerfyddin? Er eu bod yn ymddiried yn llwyr yn y parameddygon a fyddai'n gofalu amdanyst, byddent yn wynebu taith o 25 milltir o Lanelli i Gaerfyddin. O ystyried cyflwr presennol y gwasanaeth, onid ydych yn cytuno ac yn deall mai dim ond ychwanegu at eu hofnau y mae hyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r pwynt y mae Catherine yn ei godi yn bwysig, oherwydd pe bai unrhyw newidiadau yn y trefniadau presennol yn Llanelli, byddai'n rhaid bod yn eglur ynghylch ble y byddai cleifion yn symud.

Gallai cleifion sy'n teithio 25m fod yn broblem, yn enwedig os oes ysbtyai sydd lawer yn nes at y cleifion. Pe bai unrhyw newidiadau—a phe bai unrhyw newid yn Llanelli—byddwn yn gobeithio ac yn disgwyl y byddai darlun clir o'r amser a'r pellter, a gallu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i ddarparu'r ymateb hwnnw. Ni chredaf y gallwn adael i'r gwasanaeth wneud penderfyniad ac yna obeithio y bydd popeth yn iawn ar y pryd, am yr union reswm a nodwyd gennych. Rhaid inni gael y sicrwydd a'r eglurder hwnnw cyn unrhyw benderfyniad terfynol. Gwyddoch fod pryder am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi bod wrth wraidd nifer o bryderon gan bobl leol ynghylch y mater penodol hwn.

Mae'n siŵr bod yr amser yn dod i ben—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have nine minutes, Minister.

**Brian Gibbons:** In conclusion, I want to touch on the point that Dai Lloyd raised, in acknowledging the importance of the ambulance service. In view of that acknowledgement, it is surprising that he has asked on a few occasions why it was necessary for me to ask further questions of Health Commission Wales, particularly in view of the vital strategic importance of the ambulance service. Indeed, if we are going to look at service reconfiguration, we need to know the capacity and resilience of the ambulance service. I think that Dai Lloyd has answered his own question eloquently and aptly today: we need the results of the review of the ambulance service, the modernisation programme, and its implications for service reconfiguration before any informed decisions can be made.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennych naw munud, Weinidog.

**Brian Gibbons:** I gloi, yr wyf am gyfeirio at y pwynt a godwyd gan Dai Lloyd, wrth gydnabod pwysigrwydd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Oherwydd gydnabyddiaeth honno, mae'n rhyfedd ei fod wedi gofyn droeon pam yr oedd angen imi ofyn cwestiynau pellach ynghylch Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yn enwedig o gofio pwysigrwydd strategol hanfodol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn wir, os ydym i edrych ar ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth, mae angen inni wybod beth yw gallu a gwydnwch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Credaf fod Dai Lloyd wedi ateb ei gwestiwn ei hun yn huawdl ac yn briodol heddiw: mae angen inni gael canlyniadau'r adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y rhaglen foderneiddio, a'i goblygiadau ar gyfer ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth cyn y gellir gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau doeth.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 2: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Amendment 4: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle

Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick

Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor

Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew

Davies, Glyn

Davies, Janet

Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue

Francis, Lisa

German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William

Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwin

Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred

Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Elin

Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Trish

Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David

Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle

Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3411 as amended: to propose Cynnig NDM3411 fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig that bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. notes the Wales Audit Office report—‘Ambulance Services in Wales’—which was laid in the Table Office on 4 December 2006;
2. calls on the Assembly Government to examine how the role of the air ambulance service can be further developed;
3. calls for the development of a detailed action plan to implement the recommendations of the report and measures identified in the ambulance service’s own modernisation plan;
4. calls on the Assembly Government to fully fund the Welsh ambulance service’s modernisation plan;
5. calls on the Assembly Government to provide a timetable for implementing fully the recommendations requiring Government action contained in the report; and
6. calls on the Assembly Government to ensure the development of specialist expertise in the commissioning of ambulance services at all levels.

Cynnig NDM3411 fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. yn nodi Adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru—‘Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans yng Nghymru’—a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Rhagfyr 2006;
2. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i edrych ar sut y mae modd datblygu ymhellach ar rôl y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr;
3. yn galw am ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu manwl i roi argymhellion yr adroddiad a'r camau a nodir yng nghynllun moderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ei hun ar waith;
4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyllido'n llawn gynllun moderneiddio gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru;
5. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'n llawn argymhellion yr adroddiad sy'n mynnu bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu; ac
6. yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod arbenigedd arbenigol yn cael ei ddatblygu wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau ambiwlans ar bob lefel.

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William

Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Amended motion carried.*

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Teimlo'n Ddiogel Feeling Safe

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** This short debate is the one that was postponed on 29 October. The short debate scheduled for today will begin at 5 p.m., and there will be a cut-off at that time. Although this is not today's official short debate, it is still a short debate, and so the relevant procedure will apply—apart from the one condition that we must finish by 5 p.m..

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae Mick Bates wedi gofyn am gael siarad, ac os bydd yma, caiff wneud hynny.

Wrth sôn am ‘deimlo’n ddiogel’ yr wyf yn cyfeirio at deimlo’n ddiogel yn ein cartrefi ac yn ein cymunedau. Dechreuaf gyda ffaith ddiddorol—diddorol i mi, beth bynnag. Yr

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y ddadl fer hon yw'r un a ohiriwyd ar 29 Hydref. Bydd y ddadl fer a drefnwyd ar gyfer heddiw yn dechrau am 5 p.m., a bydd y trafodaethau'n dod i ben bryd hynny. Er nad hon yw'r ddadl fer swyddogol heddiw, mae'n ddadl fer o hyd, ac felly bydd y weithdrefn berthnasol yn gymwys—ar wahân i'r un amod ei bod yn rhaid inni orffen erbyn 5.p.m.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mick Bates has asked to speak, and if he is present, he may do so.

In talking of ‘feeling safe’ I refer to feeling safe in our homes and communities. I will begin with an interesting fact—at least, it is interesting to me. Gwynedd Council sought

oedd Cyngor Gwynedd yn holi barn tenantiaid tai cyngor yn ddiweddar am allanoli tai. Gofynnwyd iddynt ba bynciau a beth oedd yn eu poeni. Yn rhyfedd ddigon, nid cyflwr eu tai a ddaeth i'r brig ond pryder am fân droseddu a'r hyn sy'n cael ei alw bellach yn 'ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol'. Dyna'r pwnc a oedd yn poeni'r rhan fwyaf o'r tenantiaid.

Os ydych yn credu'r ystadegau—ac nid oes gennyf reswm i beidio—yr eironi yw bod y ffigurau swyddogol yn dangos bod nifer y troseddau a gyflawnwyd ar draws Prydain wedi gostwng ers 1995, ar wahân i droseddu treisiol. Eto i gyd, yn ôl arolwg troseddu Prydain, mae dwy ran o dair o'r boblogaeth yn credu bod lefelau trosedd wedi cynyddu dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Mae hwnnw'n ffigur od iawn, onid e? Mae llawer o droseddu yn digwydd nad yw'n dod at sylw'r heddlu, yn rhannol am fod pobl yn credu ei fod yn ormod o drafferth i gysylltu â pherson amhersonol ar ben ffôn y dyddiau hyn. Hyd yn oed wedyn, mae'r ffigurau yn od: mae pobl yn teimlo'n llai diogel er bod ffigurau swyddogol yn awgrymu ein bod yn byw mewn cymdeithas y mae llai o droseddu ynnddi.

Beth bynnag y bo'r ffeithiau, mae canfyddiad pobl yn hollbwysig. Mae bai ar wleidyddion am hyn; yr ydym yn codi ofnau ac yn hel bwganod er mwyn ymddangos yn fwy *macho* na'r blaid nesaf. Mae'r wleidyddiaeth dabloid hon wedi arwain at sefyllfa anffodus lle mae pobl hŷn yn enwedig yn teimlo nad yw'n ddiogel iddynt fynd allan wedi iddi nosi, a lle mae gweld grwpiau o bobl ifanc wedi'u hel at ei gilydd yn dychryn pobl sydd, fel arall, yn hollol gall a rhesymol. Mae Llywodraeth Tony Blair wedi creu 3,000 o droseddau newydd ers 1997 ac wedi cyflwyno 24 Mesur troseddol.

Mae nifer y bobl yn ein carchardai wedi codi ers canol y 1990au o 47,000 i 80,000 erbyn hyn. Dyma'r lefelau uchaf o ddigon yn holl wleidydd Ewrop, ac eto mae pobl yn teimlo'n llai diogel nag erioed. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr, ond felly y mae hi. Yn sicr, mae llawer gormod o bobl yn ein carchardai. Yr oeddwn yn trafod gydag un o uwch-swyddogion Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn ddiweddar, ac fe gyfeiriodd hi yn arbennig at

the views of its council house tenants recently about externalising stock. They were asked what concerned them. Surprisingly, it was not the condition of their houses that came out, but concern about petty crime and what is now called 'anti-social behaviour'. That is what worried the majority of the tenants.

If you believe the statistics—and I have no reason not to believe them—it is ironic that the official figures show that the number of crimes, apart from cases of violent crime, committed across Britain has fallen since 1995. Yet, according to the British crime survey, two thirds of the population believe that crime levels have increased over the past two years. That is an odd figure, is it not? Many cases of crime do not come to the attention of the police, partly because people believe that it is too much trouble to contact someone who is impersonal and at the end of the phone these days. Even then, the figures are odd: people feel less safe even though the official figures suggest that we live in a society with less crime.

Whatever the facts, people's perception is very important. Politicians are to blame for this; we frighten and create bogies in order to seem more macho than the next party. This tabloid-style of politics has led to an unfortunate situation whereby older people, especially, feel that it is not safe for them to go out after dark, and people who are otherwise sensible and reasonable are frightened when they see groups of young people gather. Tony Blair's Government has created 3,000 new crimes since 1997 and has introduced 24 crime Measures.

The number of people in our prisons has risen since the mid 1990s, from 47,000 to 80,000. These are by far the highest levels in the whole of Europe, and yet people feel less safe than ever. It does not make sense, but that is how it is. There are certainly too many people in our prisons. We had a discussion with one of the senior officers from North Wales Police recently, and she referred specifically to women who were sent to

ferched a oedd yn cael eu hanfon i garchar am wahanol droseddau sy'n ymwneud â thwyll ariannol. Ei barn hi oedd y byddai'n fwy buddiol o lawer inni roi'r bobl hyn ar waith yn y gymuned yn hytrach na'u taflu i garchardai gorlawn lle nad oes nac amser nac arian i roi sylw na hyfforddiant iddynt.

Gweledigaeth Plaid Cymru yn y pen draw yw datganoli pwerau'r Swyddfa Gartref i senedd go iawn yng Nghymru. Wrth gwrs, byddai'n rhaid datganoli'r drefn gyfreithiol ar yr un pryd, a byddai hwnnw'n arwydd o genedl hunanhyderus go iawn. Mewn dadl ddiweddar yn y Siambr, cafodd ein galwad i ddatganoli gwasanaeth yr heddlu gefnogaeth gref drawsbleidiol. Mae'r un parodrwydd hefyd i'w glywed gan uwch-swyddogion yr heddlu a rhai o'n huwch-farnwyr. Mae'n bosibl wedyn y gallem ailedrych o ddifrif ar sut yr ydym yn ymwneud â throseddu a'n hymateb iddo, gan obeithio y byddwn yn taflu llai o bobl i garchardai, ac yn ceisio delio gyda nhw mewn ffodd fwy rhesymol ac adeiladol yn lle.

I ddod yn ôl at y presennol, un datblygiad sydd wedi cael cefnogaeth helaeth gan y cyhoedd yw plismona cymunedol; yr ydym wedi bod yn galw amdano ers degau o flynyddoedd ac mae'r heddlu bellach fel pe bai'n cydnabod bod gwella'r cysylltiad rhwng plismyn a'r bobl ar y stryd yn hollbwysig i'w hygrededd ac i godi hyder pobl—yn enwedig, efallai, yr henoed a'r rhai mwyaf bregus.

4.40 p.m.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld datblygiad diweddar yn nyffryn Nantlle, lle bydd rhingyll lleol o Gaernarfon yn dod i'r ardal fel plismon cymunedol. Mae hwnnw'n dangos pwysigrwydd y gwaith hwn i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Mae hyn yn dilyn gwaith ardderchog y diweddar PC Nesfield a fu farw yn llawer rhy ifanc yr haf diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, wrth inni weld y datblygiad hwn, clywn fod Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn cael ei orfodi i dynnu llawer o'r plismyn cymunedol yn ôl i'r swyddfeydd canolog i wneud gwaith clergol, gan nad oes arian ar gael i gynnal y gwasanaeth sydd wedi profi ei hun mor boblogaidd a llwyddiannus.

prison for crimes to do with fraud. It was her opinion that it would be more beneficial for us to put these people to work in the community rather than throw them into overcrowded prisons, where there is neither the time nor the money to give them any attention or training.

Plaid Cymru's ultimate vision is to devolve the powers of the Home Office to a real parliament in Wales. Of course, the legal system would have to be devolved at the same time, and that would be a sign of a really self-confident nation. In a recent debate in the Chamber, our call to devolve the police service received strong cross-party support. The same willingness is also to be heard among senior police officers and some of our senior judges. It is therefore possible for us seriously to reconsider how we deal with crime and our response to it, and hopefully, we could throw fewer people into prison and try to deal with them in a more reasonable and constructive way.

To come back to the present, one development which has received wide public support is community policing; we have been calling for this for decades, and the police now seem to recognise that improving the connection between policemen and people on the street is vital to their credibility and to improving people's confidence—especially, perhaps, elderly people and the most vulnerable.

I was pleased to see a recent development in the Nantlle valley, where a local sergeant from Caernarfon will be coming to the area as a community policeman. That shows the importance of this work to North Wales Police. It follows the excellent work done by the late PC Nesfield, who died at such a young age last summer. However, as this development is taking place, we hear, unfortunately, that North Wales Police Authority is being forced to bring many community policemen back into the central office to do clerical work, as there is insufficient money available to maintain the service which has proved to be so popular and successful.

Barn Plaid Cymru yw bod angen ailsefydlu'r cyswllt byw rhwng yr heddlu â phobl ar y stryd. Wrth gwrs, deallwn fod galwadau eraill ar amser yr heddlu, a derbyniaf na allwn fynd yn ôl i'r 1950au pan oedd plismon ym mhob pentref, bron. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r heddlu ddod allan o'u byncars moethus yn eu swyddfeydd newydd i adenill hyder pobl a dod i adnabod eu pobl.

Dychwelaf yn awr at y syniad o gymunedau diogel. Nid mater o gael mwy o blismyn ydyw, mewn gwirionedd, er y gallai hynny gyfrannu at gynyddu hyder. I gael cymunedau diogel, rhaid cael cymunedau byw a bywiog, sef cymunedau lle mae pethau'n digwydd, lle mae siopau, swyddfeydd post, ysgolion, swyddi, tafarndai, capeli, eglwysi, mannau cyfarfod, a chlybiau chwaraeon. Yr wyf yn deall na allwch gael pob un o'r rhain ym mhob cymuned, ond, heb y sefydliadau hynny lle mae pobl yn rhwydweithio ac yn cynnal ei gilydd, mae'n hawdd i'r elfennau dinistriol gael y llaw uchaf. Dyna pam fod y duedd i ganoli ein gwasanaethau—ac yr wyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am siopau mawr—yn gallu tanseilio ein cymdeithasau. Os nad yw'n cymunedau yn lleoedd y mae ein pobl a'n teuluoedd ifanc yn dymuno byw ynddynt, nid oes ots faint o blismyn sydd ar y stryd, bydd problemau difrifol.

Dyweddodd un plismon cymunedol wrthyf y diwrnod o'r blaen mai'r gelyn pennaf yn ei ward arbennig ef oedd diffyg uchelgais ymysg pobl ifanc a diffyg awydd i wella'u hunain. Os nad ydym yn disgwyl gwell, ni ddaw gwelliant. Mater o hunanfalchder ydyw a pharch tuag atom ni ein hunain ac at eraill. Efallai bod llawer ohonom yn cymryd pethau felly yn ganiataol, ond yr wyf yn bryderus fod gwerthoedd traddodiadol o'r fath wedi'u colli mewn rhai teuluoedd, neu hyd yn oed mewn cymunedau cyfan. Rhaid i ni anelu at gael cymunedau lle y gall pobl symud o gwmpas yn rhydd ac yn ddi-ofn yn ein mannau cyhoeddus ac o fewn eu cartrefi, a hynny heb boeni am eu diogelwch personol nac am ddiogelwch y sawl sydd yn eu gofal—ac yr wyf yn meddwl am blant a phobl hŷn yn hynny o beth.

Plaid Cymru's view is that the active link between the police and people on the street needs to be re-established. Of course, we understand that there are other calls on police time, and I accept that we cannot go back to the 1950s when there was a policeman in almost every village. However, the police must come out of the luxurious bunkers in their new offices and regain people's confidence and get to know them.

I return now to the idea of safe communities. It is not a matter of having more policemen, although that could contribute towards increasing confidence. To have safe communities, you must have real and vital communities where things happen, where there are shops, post offices, schools, jobs, pubs, chapels, churches, meeting places, and sports clubs. I understand that you cannot have all of those things in every community, but, without such places where people network and support each other, it is easy for the destructive elements to gain the upper hand. That is why the tendency to centralise our services—and I am thinking especially of large shops here—can undermine our communities. If communities are not places where our people and young families wish to live, however many policemen you have on the street, there will be serious problems.

One community policeman told me the other day that the main threat in his particular ward was the lack of ambition among young people, and their lack of desire to improve themselves. If we do not expect better, there will be no improvement. It is a matter of having pride in yourself and respect for yourself and for others. Perhaps many of us take such things for granted, but I am concerned that such traditional values have been lost in some families, or even in whole communities. We must aim to have communities where people can move around freely and without fear in our public places and in their homes, and without fearing for their personal safety and for the safety of those in their care—and I am thinking of children and elderly people here.

Canmolaf y gwaith a wnaed ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Bangor gan y Dr Judy Hutchings ar waith yr Athro Carolyn Webster Stratton, a gwn fod ymdrech i gyflwyno'r gwaith hwn yn ein hysgolion. Mae Gwynedd yn flaenllaw o ran sicrhau bod plant yn dysgu i ymddwyn a pharchu'i gilydd, a hynny cyn dechrau sôn am ddysgu unrhyw ffeithiau iddynt. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gyflwyno'r rhaglen hon yn ein holl ysgolion. Dengys hyn fod gwendidau mawr yn ein cymdeithas, gan fod angen cyflwyno'r math hwn o ddisgyblaeth i blant sy'n dod i mewn i'n hysgolion. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r plant yn gallu ymddwyn—ac nid wyf yn sôn am bawb, wrth gwrs, dim ond am leiafrif a fydd, yn y pen draw, yn mynd ymlaen i fod yn droseddwyr.

Yr wyf am orffen drwy gyfeirio at un peth sy'n gymaint o symptom o gamymddygiad a throsedd ag yw'n rheswm amdano, sef camddefnyddio cyffuriau, gan gynnwys alcohol, wrth gwrs. Efallai y dylwn bledio yn euog o'i gamddefnyddio ar rai achlysuron fy hun. Mae canran uchel o'r rhai sydd yn ein carchardai yno oherwydd eu bod angen troseddu ac aildroseddu er mwyn talu am y cyffuriau y maent yn gaeth iddynt. O ran anhhrefn cymdeithasol a thrais, mae yfed gormod yn ganolog. Nid oes angen athrylith i ddeall hynny; nid oes angen ond mynd allan ar y stryd yn unrhyw un o'n prif drefi ar nos Sadwrn i weld hynny.

Mae bai ar lywodraethau, ar lysoedd, ar yr heddlu ac arnom ni fel cymdeithas. Yr ydym wedi creu cymdeithas lle mae alcohol yn hanfodol i bob achlysur cyhoeddus, a lle mae alcohol yn ffasiynol ac yn llawer rhy hawdd i gael gafaol arno. Rai blynnyddoedd yn ôl, bûm mor wirion ag i wrthwynebu'r ffaith, ar gais y trigolion lleol, fod caffi a siop bentref yn ceisio am drwydded i werthu alcohol. Ond, y gwir amdan i oedd bod yr heddlu a'r llys yn holol gefnogol. Mae'n od gennyl glywed wedyn yr heddlu yn cwyno bod alcohol a'i gamddefnydd yn broblem ymysg pobl ifanc a phlant; wrth gwrs ei bod yn broblem, achos, erbyn hyn, mae'n hawdd cael gafaol arno.

Y ffaith yw bod gwerthu alcohol yn fwy proffidiol i siopau bach bellach nag yw gwerthu dim byd arall. Felly, mae'n beryglus inni feio pobl ifanc a phlant am

I applaud the work done at the University of Wales, Bangor, by Dr Judy Hutchings on the work of Professor Carolyn Webster Stratton. I know that efforts are being made to introduce this work into our schools. Gwynedd is at the forefront in terms of ensuring that children learn to behave and to respect each other, and that before teaching them any facts. I hope we can introduce this programme into our schools. This shows that there are major weaknesses in society, because this kind of discipline need to be taught to children coming into our schools. At present, the children cannot behave—and I am not talking about everyone, of course, only about a minority that will, in the end, go on to become criminals.

I will finish by referring to something that is as much a symptom of bad behaviour and crime as it is a reason for it, namely the misuse of drugs, including alcohol, of course. Perhaps I myself should plead guilty to misusing that on some occasions. A high percentage of those in our prisons are there because they need to commit and recommit crime in order to pay for the drugs to which they are addicted. Excessive drinking is central to social disorder and violence. It does not take a genius to understand that; you only have to go out on the street in any of the main towns on a Saturday night to see it.

The fault lies with government, courts, the police and with us as society. We have created a society where alcohol is essential for all public events, and where alcohol is fashionable and far too easy to obtain. Some years ago, I was foolish enough to try to object, at the request of local residents, to an application by a village shop and cafe for a licence to sell alcohol. However, the reality of the situation was that the police and the courts supported the application. I find it strange that the police then complain about the problem of alcohol misuse among children and young people. Of course it is a problem, because these days it is easy to obtain alcohol.

The fact of the matter is that selling alcohol now brings in more profit for small shops than selling anything else. Therefore, it is dangerous for us to blame children and young

gamtdefnyddio alcohol tra'u bod yn dilyn esiampl yr oedolion y maent yn eu gweld o'u cwmpas. Dyna'r diwylliant yr ydym yn byw ynddo, ac mae'n rhaid inni newid hwnnw os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â chreu cymunedau diogel lle y gallwn ni wir ddweud ein bod yn rhydd, a lle'r ydym eisiau byw.

Wrth gloi, nid wyf yn honni fy mod wedi cynnig atebion, ond yr wyf yn credu fy mod wedi cyfeirio at ddau beth pwysig, sef y syniad y dylai plismona ddod yn llawer nes at y bobl, a bod yn rhaid inni newid ein hagwedd at gyffuriau a chamdefnyddio cyffuriau, gan gynnwys alcohol. Mae'n rhaid inni roi llawer mwy o gefnogaeth i'r rhai sydd wedi syrthio'n gaeth i gyffuriau yn hytrach na'u cosbi a'u taflu'n ôl i'r carchar dro ar ôl tro. O ran ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, yn sicr, mae'n rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth am y ffaith ei bod hi mor hawdd cael gafael ar alcohol a'i fod mor ffasiynol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Members could not normally expect to catch my eye if they have not been here for the whole of the opening speech. However, I understand that there has been confusion, with our having two short debates today. Exceptionally, therefore, I will call Mick Bates.

**Mick Bates:** I do apologise; I was working from an earlier copy of the agenda, on which this debate was listed as item 5.

Thank you for allowing me to speak in this debate, Alun, and for raising the issue of feeling safe in our communities. I will raise two issues on the back of this. You referred to the night-time economy and drinking, and I believe that we, as Members, should increase the pressure that we exert to have alcohol treated on the same basis as drug abuse. More money must be spent on giving advice on that problem. I hope that the Deputy Minister will mention that issue in his reply, as it is important that we get the money for that.

The second issue is that of safety in rural Wales: because of a lack of police, it is difficult to police sparsely populated areas, yet we are subject to a great deal of crime from other areas. It is possible to make us

people for misusing alcohol when all they are doing is following the example set by adults. That is the culture in which we live, and we must change that if we are serious about creating safe communities, where we can honestly say that we are free and where we want to live.

In closing, I do not claim to have offered solutions, but I believe I have raised two important points: the idea that policing should be brought much closer to the people, and that we must change our attitude to drugs, including alcohol, and their misuse. We must provide much more support for those who have fallen foul of drugs, rather than penalise them and throw them into prison time after time. We certainly have to do something, in terms of anti-social behaviour, to deal with the fact that it is so easy to obtain alcohol and that it is so fashionable.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni allai Aelodau ddisgwyl dal fy sylw fel rheol os nad oeddent yma ar gyfer yr araith agoriadol gyfan. Fodd bynnag, deallaf fod yna ddryswn, gan ein bod yn cael dwy ddadl fer heddiw. Fel eithriad, felly, galwaf Mick Bates.

**Mick Bates:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; yr oeddwn yn gweithio o gopi cynharach o'r agenda, lle y rhestrwyd y ddadl hon fel eitem 5.

Diolch am adael imi siarad yn y ddadl hon, Alun, ac am godi mater teimlo'n ddiogel yn ein cymunedau. Byddaf yn codi dau fater ynglŷn â hyn. Cyfeiriech at economi'r nos ac yfed, a chredaf y dylem, fel Aelodau, gynyddu'r pwysau a rown ar drin alcohol ar yr un sail â chamdefnyddio cyffuriau. Rhaid gwario mwy o arian ar roi cyngor am y broblem honno. Gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn sôn am y mater hwnnw yn ei ymateb, oherwydd mae'n bwysig inni gael yr arian ar gyfer hynny.

Yr ail fater yw diogelwch yng Nghymru wledig. Oherwydd prinder heddlu, mae'n anodd plismona ardaloedd prin eu poblogaeth, ond eto yr ydym yn gweld llawer iawn o droseddu yn ein hardaloedd gan bobl

feel safer by using the automatic vehicle recognition system that most police cars have. We need that on all the main highways into rural parts of Wales. In that way, we can discourage criminals. To give you a good example of that, the system is used extensively during the week of the Royal Welsh Show. Previously, there used to be an influx of quite a few criminals, but they have been discouraged by the use of automatic vehicle recognition. It is important, in this day and age, when we do not seem to be able to get more policemen on the beat to make us feel safer, that we make use of technology to do that.

o ardaloedd eraill. Mae'n bosibl gwneud inni deimlo'n fwy diogel drwy ddefnyddio'r system adnabod rhifau cerbydau'n awtomatig sydd yn y rhan fwyaf o geir heddlu. Mae angen hynny ar bob priffordd i mewn i ardaloedd gwledig Cymru. Fel hynny, gallwn geisio atal pobl rhag troseddu. I roi enghraifft dda ichi o hynny, defnyddir y system yn helaeth yn ystod wythnos y Sioe Frenhinol. Cyn hynny, yr oedd cryn nifer o droseddwyr yn dod i mewn i'r ardal, ond maent wedi eu hatal drwy ddefnyddio dulliau adnabod rhifau cerbydau'n awtomatig. Mae'n bwysig yn y byd sydd ohoni, pan nad ydym fel pe baem yn gallu cael rhagor o heddweision ar y rhawd i'n gwneud i deimlo'n fwy diogel, inni ddefnyddio technoleg i wneud hynny.

**The Deputy Minister for Communities (Huw Lewis):** I thank Alun Ffred for raising the issue of crime, and particularly for his focus on the perception of crime, as well as on crime itself. That is an important series of points to make. Although Alun Ffred was not being prescriptive in his solutions, there were certain similarities between what he was calling for and the Government's respect agenda and what Labour in Wales is doing surrounding these issues.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Gymunedau (Huw Lewis):** Diolch i Alun Ffred am godi mater troseddu, ac yn arbennig am ganolbwytio ar ganfyddiad trosedd, yn ogystal â'r drosedd ei hun. Mae'n gyfres bwysig o bwyntiau i'w codi. Er nad oedd Alun Ffred yn benodol yn ei atebion, yr oedd ychydig debygrwydd rhwng yr hyn yr oedd yn galw amdano ac agenda parch y Llywodraeth, a'r hyn y mae Llafur yng Nghymru yn ei wneud mewn cysylltiad â'r materion hyn.

4.50 p.m.

You would expect me, as a Government spokesperson, to be able to tell you why the fear of being a victim of crime should be falling, given extra police, extra investment, and new pilot projects, but bald statistics do not always address the reasons why people feel as they do about crime, as Alun Ffred has said. We have to recognise that. People have a right to feel safe in their homes and communities. It is an issue that touches everyone—rich or poor, young or old. Anyone can fall victim to crime.

Fel llefarydd ar ran y Llywodraeth, byddech yn disgwyl imi allu dweud wrthych pam y dylai pobl deimlo'n llai ofnus ynglŷn â throseddu, o gofio'r heddlu ychwanegol, y buddsoddi ychwanegol, a'r cynlluniau peilot newydd. Ond nid yw ystadegau moel bob amser yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhesymau pam mae pobl yn teimlo fel y maent ynglŷn â throseddu, fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred. Rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Mae gan bobl yr hawl i deimlo'n ddiogel yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau. Mae'n fater sy'n cyffwrdd â ni bob un—yn gyfoethog neu'n dlawd, yn hen neu'n ifanc. Gall unrhyw un ddioddef trosedd.

While responsibility for law and order has not been devolved to the Welsh Assembly Government, many of the most important levers in relation to creating safer communities are in our hands. Every effort is made to ensure that creating safe

Er nad yw cyfrifoldeb dros gyfraith a threfn wedi'i ddatganoli i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mae nifer o'r ffactorau pwysicaf wrth greu cymunedau mwy diogel yn ein dwylo ni. Gwneir pob ymdrech i sicrhau bod creu cymunedau mwy diogel yn cael ei brif-

communities is mainstreamed in all areas of Assembly policy making. Every measure that we undertake, in health, education, planning, youth training, business, transport and housing, demonstrates—we hope—our commitment to making Wales safer.

I said at the start that people should be feeling safer. Consider the following statistics. The risk of being a victim of crime is at its lowest since the British crime survey began in 1981. Welsh crime rates are falling faster than in England—a 3 per cent drop compared to a 1 per cent drop last year. The number of police in Wales has never been higher—there were 7,599 in March 2006, which is an increase of 331 officers compared to the March 2003 figure. That is the highest number of active police officers since the 1830s and the days of the Bow Street runners. Although welcome, these developments are not the answer to crime and anti-social behaviour on their own. As Alun Ffred has said, making people feel safe is a different beast altogether. I think that it will always come back, in some form or other, to the old idea of bobbies on the beat or variations on that theme. Here are many of the answers, I hope, to the points that Alun Ffred has raised.

By 2008, every area in England and Wales will benefit from a dedicated, visible, accessible, and responsive neighbourhood policing team. This is Labour's initiative, and it is what Alun Ffred is calling for. However, I have to tell him that this is what Labour is implementing. It will mean that everybody will know who their local police officers are and how to contact them. They will have a real say in local policing issues and setting local policing priorities, and they will know how well their police are doing locally in tackling crime and anti-social behaviour. Community involvement in setting police and local safety agendas will be key to breaking the discontinuity between falling crime figures and increasing public concern. Alun Ffred has identified it; Labour is doing it.

The Assembly Government is also focusing

ffrydio ym mhob maes creu polisi yn y Cynulliad. Mae pob mesur a wnaeon, ym meysydd iechyd, addysg, cynllunio, hyfforddi pobl ifanc, busnes, trafnidiaeth a thai, yn dangos—gobeithio—ein hymrwymiad i wneud Cymru'n fwy diogel.

Dywedais ar y dechrau y dylai pobl deimlo'n fwy diogel. Ystyriwch yr ystadegau canlynol. Mae'r risg o ddioddef troedd ar ei hisaf ers i arolwg troseddu Prydain ddechrau yn 1981. Mae cyfraddau troseddu Cymru yn gostwng yn gyflymach na rhai Lloegr—gostyngiad o 3 y cant o'i gymharu ag 1 y cant y llynedd. Mae mwy o heddlu yng Nghymru nag erioed o'r blaen—yr oedd 7,599 ym mis Mawrth 2006, sef cynnydd o 331 o swyddogion o'i gymharu â ffigur mis Mawrth 2003. Dyna'r nifer mwyaf o swyddogion heddlu gweithredol ers yr 1830au a dyddiau'r Bow Street runners. Er bod y datblygiadau hyn i'w croesawu, nid ydynt yn ateb i droseddu ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ynddynt eu hunain. Fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, mae gwneud i bobl deimlo'n fwy diogel yn rhywbeth holol wahanol. Credaf y byddwn yn dychwelyd bob amser, mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd, at yr hen syniad o heddlu ar y rhawd neu rywbeth cyffelyb. Dyma nifer o'r atebion, gobeithio, i'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Alun Ffred.

Erbyn 2008, ym mhob ardal yng Nghymru a Lloegr, bydd tîm heddlu cymunedol ymroddedig, gweladwy, cyfleus ac ymatebol. Dyna yw menter Llafur, a'r hyn y mae Alun Ffred yn galw amdano. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud wrtho mai dyna y mae Llafur yn ei weithredu. Golyga y bydd pawb yn gwybod pwy yw eu swyddogion heddlu lleol a sut i gysylltu â hwy. Bydd ganddynt lais gwirioneddol mewn materion plismona lleol a gosod blaenoriant plismona lleol, a byddant yn gwybod pa mor dda y mae eu heddlu yn ei wneud yn lleol wrth fynd i'r afael â throedd du ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Bydd cynnwys y gymuned wrth osod agendâu heddlu a diogelwch lleol yn allweddol i gau'r bwlc rhwng ffigurau troseddu sy'n gostwng a phryder cynyddol ymhlieth y cyhoedd. Mae Alun Ffred wedi rhoi ei fys arno; mae Llafur yn ei wneud.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn

efforts and funding on three key strategies—all clearly linked to community safety but dealing with issues that, almost without exception, all individuals in Wales will have been touched by in one way or another.

First is a strategy to tackle domestic abuse. There are serious long-term effects from domestic abuse, not only for the victim but for wider family members. The poster campaign in the milling area on 16 January showed us that this is a problem that impacts on people across Wales, the UK and the world.

Second is the youth offending strategy, prepared jointly with the Youth Justice Board for England and Wales. The strategy aims to put in place measures to prevent and tackle youth offending at an early stage. The Assembly Government is providing substantial funding—£12.9 million between 2006 and 2009—to the 22 community safety partnerships in Wales to assist with funding local projects aimed at youth crime prevention and reduction.

Third is the substance misuse strategy—and here are some answers to some of Mick Bates's points—to put in place education and prevention measures, treatment programmes, and tackle the availability of illegal drugs and the impact of binge drinking.

To return to the notion of community involvement in setting community priorities, we must mention in passing the increasingly important role of Communities First. I hope that in those areas covered by Communities First the partnerships will play a key role in this regard. Our Partnerships and Communities Together system for influencing the focus of the policing will underpin, develop and strengthen the link between the community's priorities and police activities, and I hope that Alun Ffred's party will change its attitude towards the way that the Communities First programme is developing in this regard, and in other regards, across Wales. The programme is all about local partnerships setting their own priorities, and community safety must and, indeed, does form an essential part of that—

canolbwytio ymdrechion ac arian ar dair prif strategaeth—bob un yn gysylltiedig â diogelwch cymunedol, ond yn mynd i'r afael â materion sydd, bron yn ddieithriad, wedi cyffwrdd â phob unigolyn yng Nghymru mewn rhyw fodd neu'i gilydd.

Yn gyntaf mae strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â cham-drin yn y cartref. Mae effeithiau hirdymor difrifol o gam-drin domestig, nid yn unig ar y dioddefwr, ond ar aelodau eraill o'r teulu. Dangosodd yr ymgyrch bosteri yn y neuadd ar 16 Ionawr inni fod hyn yn broblem sy'n effeithio ar bobl ledled Cymru, y DU a'r byd.

Yn ail mae'r strategaeth troseddau ieuencid, sydd wedi'i pharatoi ar y cyd â Bwrdd Cyflawnder Ieuencid Cymru a Lloegr. Nod y strategaeth yw gosod mesurau i atal troseddu gan bobl ifanc yn cynnar a mynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi arian sylweddol—£12.9 miliwn rhwng 2006 a 2009—i 22 o bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru i'w cynorthwyo i ariannu prosiectau lleol, sy'n anelu at atal a lleihau troseddu ymhliith ieuencid.

Yn drydydd mae'r strategaeth ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau—a dyma rai atebion i rai o bwyntiau Mick Bates—i roi mesurau addysg ac atal ar waith, yn ogystal â rhagleni triniaeth, mynd i'r afael â gallu cael cyffuriau anghyfreithlon, ac effaith goryfed mewn pyliau.

I ddychwelyd at y syniad o gynnwys cymunedau wrth osod blaenoriaethau cymunedol, rhaid inni sôn yn fyr am rôl gynyddol bwysig Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Gobeithio yn yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n cael eu cynnwys mewn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf y bydd y partneriaethau'n chwarae rhan allweddol yn hyn. Bydd ein system Partneriaethau a Chymunedau Ynghyd ar gyfer dylanwadu ar ffocws yr heddlu yn ategu, yn datblygu ac yn cryfhau'r cysylltiad rhwng blaenoriaethau'r gymuned a gweithgareddau'r heddlu. Gobeithio y bydd plaid Alun Ffred yn newid ei hagwedd at y ffordd y mae rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn datblygu yn hyn, ac mewn ffyrdd eraill ledled Cymru. Mae'r rhaglen yn ymwneud â phartneriaethau lleol yn gosod eu blaenoriaethau eu hunain, a rhaid i

right from the beginning, it was a key theme in Communities First.

Building strong and safe communities in Wales is a long-term task for everyone, and I will just say, Alun Ffred, that that includes the media as well as politicians. I hope that everyone here would agree that the perception of crime and the reality of crime demand a responsible media to communicate the reality to our communities. It is a task for everyone. It takes sustained action by local people, working with local partnerships, as well as the Welsh Assembly Government, to bring about change. This is a complex area, a hard business, and it will take a long time. I am afraid that a simple call for devolution of Home Office functions will not cut it; it is far more complicated, but Labour is ready for that complicated task.

ddiogelwch cymunedol fod yn rhan hanfodol o hynny, ac yn wir, felly y mae—o'r dechrau, yr oedd yn thema allweddol o ran Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Mae meithrin cymunedau cryf a diogel yng Nghymru yn dasg hirdymor i bawb, a dywedaf yn fyr, Alun Ffred, fod hynny'n cynnwys y cyfryngau yn ogystal â gwleidyddion. Gobeithio y bydd pawb yma'n cytuno bod y canfyddiad o droseddu a realiti troseddu yn gofyn am gyfryngau cyfrifol i gyfleoedd gwirionedd i'n cymunedau. Mae'n dasg i bawb. Mae'n gofyn am weithredu cyson gan bobl leol, drwy weithio gyda phartneriaethau lleol, yn ogystal â chyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i sicrhau newid. Mae'n faes cymhleth, yn fusnes anodd, a bydd yn cymryd amser maith. Yr wyf yn ofni na fydd galw am ddatganoli swyddogaethau'r Swyddfa Gartref yn tycio; mae'n fwy cymhleth o lawer, ond mae Llafur yn barod am y dasg gymhleth honno.

### **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

#### **De Caerdydd a Phenarth—o Gamlas Sir Forgannwg i Fae Caerdydd—yn Dal i Ehangu Cyfleoedd Cardiff South and Penarth—from Glamorganshire Canal to Cardiff Bay—Still Extending Opportunities**

**Lorraine Barrett:** I have agreed that Owen John Thomas can have a minute in which to speak. I thought that this topic would appeal to him; I knew that he would be the one who would want to say something about the Glamorganshire canal. I also thank those who have chosen to stay for the graveyard shift.

I have chosen this topic to highlight the huge contribution my constituency has made, and continues to make, to the economy of Cardiff and Wales, but to also remind us that none of it would have been possible without the sheer hard work and sacrifice of the workers in the iron and coal industries over two centuries.

We are all aware of how this area once served as the economic hub of Wales, and to this end still plays a big part, but we sit here today in what has become the political and administrative hub of Wales. This area has always had a presence on the international map—not because of Shirley Bassey, but as

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf wedi cytuno y gall Owen John Thomas gael munud i siarad. Credais y byddai'r tema hon yn apelio ato; gwn mai ef fyddai'r un a fyddai am ddweud rhywbeth ynghylch camlas Sir Forgannwg. Diolch hefyd i'r rheini sydd wedi dewis aros ar gyfer y sifft hwyr.

Yr wyf wedi dewis y pwnc hwn i dynnu sylw at y cyfraniad enfawr y mae fy etholaeth wedi ei wneud, ac yn yn dal i'w wneud, i economi Caerdydd a Chymru, ond hefyd i'n hatgoffa na fyddai dim wedi bod yn bosibl heb waith caled ac aberth y gweithwyr yn y diwydiannau haearn a glo dros ddwy ganrif.

Gwyddom i gyd sut y bu'r ardal hon yn ganolfan economaidd gynt i Gymru, ac i'r perwyl hwn mae'n parhau i chwarae rhan fawr, ond eisteddwon yma heddiw yn yr hyn sydd wedi dod yn ganolfan weinyddol Cymru. Mae'r ardal hon wedi bod ar y map rhwngwladol erioed—nid oherwydd Shirley

Europe's largest waterfront development, and formerly as the largest coal-exporting port in the world.

Just across the way sits the magnificent Coal Exchange, where the world's first £1 million cheque was signed. In 1910, Captain Scott made his final voyage from Cardiff docks, and Marconi broadcast the first radio signal in the world across water from nearby Lavernock Point, which is soon to become part of my constituency.

The unique history and connections between Cardiff and the Valleys run deep—and, not least because I am from the Rhondda and represent a Cardiff constituency, I am keeping that link alive.

In 1794 the Glamorganshire canal was developed to bring iron down from Merthyr to Cardiff docks, and later the Taff vale railway brought coal from the Rhondda and Cynon valleys. At this point I thank one Philip Evans for his website—just type ‘Rhondda valleys’ into Google and you will find this website and others that he runs—and it turns out that we were in school together in Ynyshir back in the 1950s, but he now lives in Anglesey. I also want to thank Alan George and his website, alangeorge.co.uk, for a wealth of information about the canal and its links to Cardiff docks. One of the photographs on Alan’s website is of a notice put up alongside the canal warning people of the things they cannot do there, such as fishing, throwing stones and washing their sheep or horses; I think that they would get an anti-social behaviour order today.

Coal at that time was what oil is today, and in 1913 over 10 million tonnes of coal was exported from Cardiff. The development of this busy industry brought with it many jobs for people across the south Wales region, and with the jobs came seafarers of various nationalities, and, although life was hard, many of them made south Wales their home. We also had the East Moors steelworks within eyeshot of this building, casting its black smoke across the city from the late 1800s.

The coal and steel industries declined and the area fell into decay. Needless to say,

Bassey, ond fel datblygiad glan-dŵr mwyaf Ewrop, a chyn hynny fel y porthladd allforio glo mwyaf yn y byd.

Ar draws y ffordd mae'r Gyfnewidfa Lo wych, lle y llofnodwyd y siec gyntaf yn y byd am £ filiwn. Yn 1910 hwyliodd Capten Scott ar ei daith olaf o ddociau Caerdydd, a darlledodd Marconi y signalau radio cyntaf yn y byd dros ddŵr o Drwyn Larnog gerllaw, a fydd yn rhan o'm hetholaeth i n fuan.

Mae'r hanes a'r cysylltiadau unigryw rhwng Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd yn ddwfn—ac yr wyf am gadw'r cysylltiadau hynny'n fyw, yn rhannol am fy mod yn hanu o Rhondda ac yn cynrychioli etholaeth yng Nghaerdydd.

Yn 1794 datblygwyd camlas Sir Forgannwg i ddod â haearn o Ferthyr i ddociau Caerdydd, ac yn ddiweddarach daeth rheilffordd Taff Vale â glo o gwm Rhondda a chwm Cynon. Ar y pwynt hwn, diolchaf i Philip Evans am ei wefan—teipiwch ‘Rhondda valleys’ yn Google ac fe ddowch o hyd i'r wefan hon ac eraill y mae'n eu cynnal—mae'n debyg ein bod yn yr ysgol gyda'n gilydd yn Ynys-hir yn ôl yn y 1950au, ond mae ef yn byw yn Sir Fôn bellach. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i Alan George a'i wefan, alangeorge.co.uk, am gyfoeth o wybodaeth am y gamlas a'i chysylltiadau â dociau Caerdydd. Mae un o'r ffotograffau ar wefan Alan o arwydd a osodwyd wrth ymyl y gamlas yn rhybuddio pobl am y pethau na allent eu gwneud yno, megis pysgota, taflu cerrig a golchi eu defaid neu eu ceffylau; tybiaf y byddent yn cael gorchymyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol heddiw.

Yr oedd glo bryd hynny mor bwysig ag yw olew heddiw, ac yn 1913 allforiwyd dros 10 miliwn o dunelli o lo o Gaerdydd. Daeth datblygiad y diwydiant prysur hwn â nifer o swyddi i bobl ar draws y de, a chyda'r swyddi daeth morwyr o wahanol genhedloedd. Er bod bywyd yn anodd, gwnaeth nifer ohonynt eu cartrefi yn ne Cymru. Yr oedd gennym weithfeydd dur East Moors hefyd o fewn tafliad carreg i'r adeilad hwn, yn taflu ei fwg du ar draws y ddinas o ddiwedd y 1800au.

Crebachodd y diwydiannau glo a dur a dirywio a wnaeth yr ardal. Afraid dweud, yr

unemployment was rife, but the people remained proud, as did their sense of community. In time, regeneration came in the form of Cardiff Bay Development Corporation, supported by the Labour-controlled South Glamorgan council and its then leader Lord Jack Brooks, who also served as deputy chairman of the corporation, and by Alun Michael, MP for this area, who championed the development of the barrage, which turned the bay into a freshwater lake, becoming the catalyst for attracting private and public investment, the success of which we can see around us.

5.00 p.m.

It is this change, from exploiting the benefits of the geographical location of the bay in exporting a valuable resource, to attracting the type of investment that can turn an area around and provide opportunities and jobs for local people, as well as those who travel down the M4, A470, A4232, or the Porth bypass, that is helping to collect millions of pounds of investment to connect the Valleys with Cardiff. The fact that the National Assembly is located here is testament to that change.

Even more recently inward investment in my constituency has come from a variety of companies. The G24i multi-million pound investment in Rumney will bring 300 jobs. With funding from the Assembly Government, Cardiff Recycling Ltd is expanding, and the new Paramount offices in St Mellons, also supported by the Government, is an example of the latest green technology that we must embrace if we are to tackle the damage being done to our environment. These developments prove that Wales is an attractive place to do business, and I am proud that this Welsh Assembly Government is supporting and enabling our economy to grow and prosper in such a way.

It has enabled the area to become modern, vibrant and cosmopolitan. Not only is this an area of business and economic interests, it is also a place of art, culture, cuisine—quite a lot of that—sport and recreation. It has become a must-do in any tourist guide to

oedd diweithdra'n gyffredin, ond cadwodd y bobl eu hunan-barch, ynghyd â'u hymdeimlad o gymuned. Dros amser, daeth adfywiad ar ffurf Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, a gefnogwyd gan gyngor De Morganwg o dan reolaeth Llafur a'i arweinydd ar y pryd, yr Arglwydd Jack Brooks, a fu hefyd yn ddirprwy gadeirydd y gorfforaeth, ac Alun Michael, AS dros yr ardal hon a hyrwyddodd ddathlygiad y morglawdd a drodd y bae'n llyn dŵr croyw. Daeth hwnnw yn ei dro yn gyfrwng i ddenu buddsoddi preifat a chyhoeddus. Gallwn weld llwyddiant hynny o'n cwmpas heddiw.

Y newid hwn, o fanteisio i'r eithaf ar leoliad daearyddol y bae i allforio adnodd gwerthfawr, i ddenu'r math o fuddsoddiad a all drawsnewid ardal gan ddarparu cyfleoedd a swyddi i'r bobl leol yn ogystal â'r rheini sy'n teithio i lawr yr M4, yr A470, A4232, neu ffordd osgoi'r Porth, sy'n gyfrifol am helpu casglu'r miliynau o bunnoedd o fuddsoddiad i gysylltu'r Cymoedd â Chaerdydd. Mae'r ffaith mai yma y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn dyst i'r newid hwnnw.

Yn ddiweddarach fyfyr, mae amrywiaeth o gwmniau wedi mewnfuddsoddi yn fy etholaeth. Daw'r buddsoddiad G24i gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd yn Rhymni â 300 o swyddi yn ei sgîl. Gydag arian gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae Cardiff Recycling Ltd yn ehangu, ac mae swyddfeydd newydd Paramount yn Llaneirwg, sydd hefyd yn cael eu cefnogi gan y Llywodraeth, yn enghraift o'r dechnoleg werdd ddiweddaraf y mae angen inni ei mabwysiadu i fynd i'r afael â'r niwed a wneir i'n hamgylchedd. Mae'r datblygiadau hyn yn profi bod Cymru'n lle deniadol i wneud busnes, ac yr wyf yn ymfalchiö fod y Llywodraeth y Cynulliad presennol yn cefnogi ac yn galluogi ein heonomi i dyfu a ffynnu yn y fath fodd.

Mae wedi galluogi'r ardal i droi'n ardal fwy modern, bywiog a chosmopolitaidd. Yn ogystal â bod yn ardal fusnes a buddiannau economaidd, mae hefyd yn ardal o bwys o safbwyt y celfyddydau, diwylliant, bwyd—cryn lawer o hynny—chwaraeon a hamdden.

south Wales. We have the Wales Millennium Centre, Welsh National Opera and the Millennium Stadium, which is now seen regularly on television screens across the world. We have the international sports village which will be a 2012 Olympic training venue, with a massive leisure and water complex, and a national canoe and rafting centre for those brave enough to try it. All this is in what was Cardiff docks.

So, as one would expect, the local area has physically changed beyond recognition, although we still have steel production across the road from the Assembly, albeit on a smaller scale, and Associated British Ports is still operating in the docks with goods being exported and imported from all parts of the world. However, nearby Communities First areas are testament to the challenges still facing us as a result of the decline of the heavy industries. To this end, some headway has been made, but there is still a lot to do, particularly for young people.

The fact that the city of Cardiff can stand proudly alongside any modern comparative city in the world is due in no small part to the vast regeneration that this area has experienced. It enhances the image and economic wellbeing of Cardiff and Wales, and it still offers opportunities to the people in the Rhondda and Merthyr areas that gave Cardiff its opportunities 200 years ago.

We are essentially, and I think justly, a proud nation; the positive contribution we make as part of the United Kingdom is something of which we should be proud. The UK is a better place for having Wales as part of it and Wales is a better place for being part of the UK, as the recent £6 billion investment announced last week for nearby St Athan demonstrates.

All these things combine to make Cardiff South and Penarth a great place to live, study, work and visit. Some of the developments still to come will further enhance those opportunities, such as the barrage road across the Roath basin, the Bascule bridge which

Mae wedi dod yn gyrchfan y mae'n rhaid ei chynnwys mewn unrhyw lawlyfr twristiaid ar y de. Mae gennym Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru a Stadiwm y Mileniwm a welir yn rheolaidd ar sgriniau teledu ledled y byd. Mae gennym y pentref chwaraeon rhngwladol a fydd yn lleoliad hyfforddi i'r Gemau Olympaidd yn 2012, gyda datblygiad hamdden a dŵr enfawr a chanolfan canwio a rafftio i'r rheini sy'n ddigon dewr i roi cynnig arni. Hyn i gyd yn yr hyn a oedd yn ddociau Caerdydd.

Felly, fel y byddai rhywun yn ei ddisgwyli, mae'r ardal leol wedi newid yn syfrdanol, er bod dur yn parhau i gael ei gynhyrchu nid nepell o'r Cynulliad, er ar raddfa lai, ac mae Associated British Ports yn dal i weithio yn y dociau a nwyddau'n cael eu hallforio a'u mewnsforio o bedwar ban byd. Fodd bynnag, mae ardaloedd Cymunedau'n Gyntaf cyfagos yn dyst i'r heriau sy'n parhau i'n hwynebu oherwydd dirywiad y diwydiannau trwm. I'r perwyl hwn, gwnaed rhywfaint o gynnydd, ond erys llawer i'w wneud o hyd, yn enwedig dros bobl ifanc.

Mae'r ffaith y gall dinas Caerdydd sefyll gyfleoedd ag unrhyw ddinas fodern gymharol yn y byd i'w phriodoli i raddau helaeth i'r adfywio aruthrol a fu yn yr ardal hon. Mae'n ychwanegu at ddelwedd a lles economaidd Caerdydd a Chymru gan barhau i gynnig cyfleoedd i bobl yn ardaloedd Rhondda a Merthyr, sef yr ardaloedd hynny a roddodd y cyfleoedd i Gaerdydd 200 mlynedd yn ôl.

Yr ydym yn genedl falch yn y bôn, a hynny'n holol gyfiawn, mi gredaf; mae'r cyfraniad cadarnhaol y gallwn ei wneud fel rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn rhywbeth y dylem ymfalchio ynddo. Mae'r DU yn lle gwell gyda Chymru yn rhan ohoni, ac mae Cymru yn lle gwell o fod yn rhan o'r DU, fel y dystia'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf ynglŷn â'r buddsoddiad gwerth £6 biliwn yn Sain Tathan.

Mae hyn oll gyda'i gilydd yn golygu bod De Caerdydd a Phenarth yn lle gwych i fyw, astudio, gweithio ac ymweld ag ef. Bydd rhai o'r datblygiadau sydd eto i ddod yn ychwanegu fwywfwy at y cyfleoedd hynny, fel ffordd y morglawdd ar draws basn y Rhath, y

will connect the sports village to Penarth marina and the Penarth headland walkway, which will open up green tourism opportunities and encourage healthier lifestyles. It is a shame that the former Conservative Vale of Glamorgan Council wasted seven years and that work on the walkway has not even started.

In summing up, the city of Cardiff and its surrounding area of south-east Wales is still firmly united with the waterfront of Cardiff bay, which has always had a dramatic impact on the people of Wales. As we sit here today, I do not need to tell you that that impact is still being felt.

We have experienced the highs and the lows of industry, manufacturing and regeneration. The ability to turn fortunes around, to improve an area to such an extent as we see around us today, is remarkable. In my view, the process of devolution has helped, and will continue to help, to cement that trend, not just here but for the whole of Wales for a long time to come, and all because the Glamorganshire canal was built to connect with Cardiff bay.

**Owen John Thomas:** Diolch i Lorraine am roi cyfle i mi i gyfrannu ar bwnc sy'n agos at fy nghalon. Crybwylloedd ddatblygiadau cyffrous diweddar, fel y twnnel o dan Butetown sy'n cysylltu â ffyrrd i Fro Morgannwg a Chroes Cwrlwys. Soniodd hefyd am y morglawdd, y Cynulliad, Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru a'r llu o leoedd bwyta, ac yn y blaen, sydd wedi adnewyddu'r ardal hon mewn ffordd na fyddai llawer ohonom wedi'i hystyried yn bosibl; yr ydym yn croesawu hynny.

Y mae hen adeiladau hefyd wedi goroesi, megis adeilad y Lanfa ac adeiladau'r dociau. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael cydwysedd a'n bod yn gallu cyfuno'r gorau o'r gorffennol gyda datblygiadau cyffrous heddiw. Yr oedd y bobl a benderfynodd gladdu o dan goncrit yr hen fynedfa i'r gamlas yn Philistiaid—pa bynnag blaid yr oeddynt yn perthyn iddi, nid oedd angen gwneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cyfuno'r pethau gorau o'r gorffennol gyda'r pethau gorau o'r presennol, er mwyn sicrhau bod Caerdydd yn ddinas ryngwladol a

bont Wrthbwys a fydd yn cysylltu'r pentref chwaraeon â marina Penarth, a llwybr pentir Penarth a fydd yn dod â chyfleoedd twristiaeth werdd ac yn annog ffyrrd iachach o fyw. Mae'n drueni bod hen Gyngor Bro Morgannwg Ceidwadol wedi gwastraffu saith mlynedd ac nad yw'r gwaith ar y llwybr wedi dechrau hyd yn oed.

I grynhoi, mae dinas Caerdydd ac ardal y deddwyrain yn dal yn un ag ardal glan-dŵr bae Caerdydd, sydd wedi cael effaith fawr erioed ar bobl Cymru. Wrth inni eistedd yma heddiw, nid oes angen imi ddweud wrthych fod yr effaith honno'n parhau heddiw.

Gwelsom ddyddiau da a dyddiau gwael mewn diwydiant, gweithgynhyrchu ac adfywio. Mae'r gallu i drawsnewid pethau, i wella ardal i'r graddau a welwn o'n cwmpas heddiw, yn hynod. Yn fy marn i, mae proses ddatganoli wedi helpu, a bydd yn parhau i helpu, i atgyfnerthu'r duedd honno, nid yma'n yn unig, ond drwy Gymru gyfan am amser maith i ddod, a hynny oherwydd bod camlas Morgannwg wedi ei hadeiladu fel dolen i gysylltu â bae Caerdydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** I thank Lorraine for giving me the opportunity to contribute on a subject which is close to my heart. She mentioned recent exciting developments, such as the tunnel under Butetown which links up with roads to the Vale of Glamorgan and Culverhouse Cross. She also mentioned the barrage, the Assembly, the Wales Millennium Centre and all the restaurants, and so on, that have rejuvenated this area in a way that many of us would not have thought possible; we welcome that.

Old buildings have also survived, such as the Pierhead and the dock buildings. This balance is important, as is the ability to combine the best of the past with exciting modern developments. Those who decided to bury the entrance to the old canal under concrete were Philistines—whatever party they belonged to; that was not necessary. It is important that we combine the best of the past with the best of the modern era, in order to ensure that Cardiff is an exciting and cosmopolitan city with the potential to be a dynamo to drive the economy of the whole of

chyffrous â'r potensial i fod yn ddeinamo i yrru economi Cymru gyfan ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I thank Lorraine for bringing forward the short debate on Cardiff bay. As she effectively pointed out, the economy and environment of this area of Wales has seen a remarkable transformation over the last few decades. The area is now universally held up as a model for regeneration for other parts, not just of the UK, but of the rest of Europe.

The regeneration began in the 1980s with the Atlantic Wharf development in the area around Bute East Dock and the Penarth Dock marina village development. In 1987, the Cardiff Bay Development Corporation was set up and charged with the task of developing a strategic approach to the regeneration of around 1,092 ha of land in the docklands area. That approach had a number of key objectives: reuniting Cardiff city centre with its waterfront, ensuring a superb environment in which people could live, work and play, bringing forward a mix of developments to provide a wide-range of opportunities and stimulating residential development to provide homes for a cross-section of the population. Those goals were reflected in the regeneration strategy adopted by the corporation in 1988, including the construction of the barrage and the creation of a 200 ha, or 500 acre, freshwater lake. The strategy also identified some major projects around the inner harbour and the bay created by the barrage, as well as a north-south continental-style boulevard to reunite the waterfront with the city centre. Clearly, the development and the achievements have been significant, as Lorraine has pointed out.

If you look at the evaluation of what has been achieved, it is a remarkable study. In December 2003, the Assembly Government commissioned independent consultants, ESYS, to evaluate the effectiveness of those achievements since the wind-up of the CBDC. ESYS concluded that efforts to regenerate Cardiff bay had successfully tackled widespread market failure in land, housing and commercial property markets. Indeed, private sector investment has been

Wales for the future.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Diolch i Lorraine am gyflwyno'r ddadl fer ar fae Caerdydd. Fel y dywedodd yn hynod effeithiol, mae economi ac amgylchedd y rhan hon o Gymru wedi'u trawsnewid yn aruthrol dros yr ychydig ddegawdau diwethaf. Bellach, mae'r ardal yn un a ystyri'r yn gyffredinol fel model o adfywio i Ewrop gyfan, yn ogystal â rhannau eraill o'r DU.

Dechreuodd yr adfywio yn y 1980au gyda datblygiad Glanfa Iwerydd yn yr ardal o amgylch Doc Dwyreiniol Bute, a datblygiad pentref marina Doc Penarth. Yn 1987 sefydlwyd Corfforaeth Datblygu Bae Caerdydd, a'i chylch gorchwyl oedd datblygu dull strategol o adfywio oddeutu 1,092 hectar o dir yn ardal y dociau. Yr oedd sawl amcan allweddol i'r dull hwnnw: ailgysylltu canol dinas Caerdydd â glan y dŵr, gan sicrhau amgylchedd ragorol i bobl fyw, gweithio a hamddena, gan sicrhau cymysgedd o ddatblygiadau i gynnig ystod helaeth o gyfleoedd a datblygiadau preswyl cyffrous i ddarparu tai i groestoriad o'r boblogaeth. Adlewyrchwyd y nodau hynny yn y strategaeth adfywio a fabwysiadwyd gan y gorfforaeth yn 1988, gan gynnwys codi'r morglawdd a chreu llyn dŵr croyw 200 hectar neu 500 erw. Yr oedd y strategaeth hefyd yn nodi rhai prosiectau mawr o amgylch yr harbwr mewnol a'r bae a grëwyd gan y morglawdd, yn ogystal â rhodfa ar ffurf Ewropeaidd o'r gogledd i'r de i ailgysylltu glan y dŵr â chanol y ddinas. Yn amlwg, mae'r datblygiad a'r llwyddiannau wedi bod yn aruthrol, fel y dywedodd Lorraine.

Os edrychwch ar werthusiad o'r hyn a gyflawnwyd, mae'n astudiaeth ryfeddol. Yn Rhagfyr 2003, comisiynwyd ESYS, ymgynghorwyr annibynnol, gan y Cynulliad i werthuso effeithlonrwydd yr hyn a gyflawnwyd ers dirwyn corfforaeth datblygu bae Caerdydd i ben. Daeth ESYS i'r casgliad bod yr ymdrechion i adfywio bae Caerdydd wedi mynd i'r afael yn llwyddiannus â methiant yn y farchnad o ran tir tai ac eiddo masnachol. Yn wir, mae'r buddsoddiad gan y

substantial. The original target for PSI when CBDC was set up was £1.2 billion over the lifetime of the regeneration project. That was subsequently increased to £1.4 billion in 1996. In fact, the evaluation estimated that the lifetime PSI for the regeneration of Cardiff bay is now £1.5 billion to £1.7 billion. Net public sector expenditure of £630 million meant a public to private ratio of just over 1:2. That is a substantial return on public sector investment. Taking account of future potential, including the international sports village that Lorraine mentioned, the PSI could indeed rise to nearly £1.9 billion. It also concluded that the estimated number of permanent jobs created will exceed the target of 29,000, taking account of potential future developments.

5.10 p.m.

Looking at those developments and at Assembly Government activities, recent years have seen significant changes in the economic landscape of Cardiff bay, with the establishment of increasing knowledge-intensive industries, such as the £90 million investment in the BT internet and data centre, which was supported by the Assembly Government through regional selective assistance. This data centre is significant and provides a range of managed services for business throughout the UK and has been a real shot in the arm for the ICT sector in Wales.

FIS Software Ltd, an inward investor, manages integrated software and IT solutions from its global headquarters just a stone's throw away from the Assembly on Pierhead Street. The developers of Trident Park, the site of the former NEG works, are proposing to develop a knowledge innovation park exploiting BT's twenty-first century network, which is being piloted in Cardiff and south Wales. The Assembly Government aims to develop this vibrant sector and help the Welsh economy in its transformation to a knowledge-driven future.

Again, within a stone's throw of this

sector preifat wedi bod yn sylweddol. Y targed gwreiddiol ar gyfer buddsoddiad gan y sector preifat pan sefydlwyd y gorfforaeth oedd £1.2 biliwn dros gyfnod y prosiect adfywio. Cynyddwyd hynny yn ei dro i £1.4 biliwn yn 1996. Yn wir, amcangyfrifai'r gwerthusiad bod y sector preifat wedi buddsoddi £1.5 biliwn i £1.7 biliwn yn ystod cyfnod y prosiect. Gyda gwariant net gan y sector cyhoeddus o £630 miliwn, golygai hynny gymhareb gyhoeddus breifat o ychydig dros 1:2. Mae hynny'n gryn elw o fuddsoddi gan y ector preifat. O gofio potensial y dyfodol, gan gynnwys y pentref chwaraeon rhyngwladol a grybwylodd Lorraine, gallai buddsoddiad y sector preifat godi i ryw £1.9 biliwn yn wir. Yn ogystal, daeth i'r casgliad y byddai'r amcangyfrif o nifer y swyddi parhaol a grëir yn fwy na'r targed o 29,000, o ystyried datblygiadau possibl yn y dyfodol.

Gan edrych ar y datblygiadau hynny ac ar weithgareddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae'r blynnyddoedd diwethaf wedi gweld newidiadau sylweddol yn nhirwedd economaidd bae Caerdydd, gyda sefydlu diwydiannau gwybodaeth cynyddol fel y buddsoddiad gwerth £90 miliwn yng nghanolfan rhyngrwyd a data BT, a gefnogwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol. Mae'r ganolfan ddata hon yn arwyddocaol ac mae'n darparu amrywiaeth o wasanaethau wedi'u rheoli ar gyfer busnesau ledled y DU, a bu'n hwb gwirioneddol i'r sector TGCh yng Nghymru.

Mae'r mewnfuddsoddwr FIS Software Ltd yn rheoli ei fusnes TG a meddalwedd integredig o'i bencadlys byd-eang daflriad carreg o'r Cynulliad ar Stryd Pierhead. Mae datblygwyr Parc Trident, hen safle gwaith NEG, yn cynnig datblygu parc arloesedd gwybodaeth, gan fanteisio ar rwydwaith BT ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain sy'n cael ei dreialu yng Nghaerdydd a'r de. Nod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw datblygu'r sector bywiog hwn gan helpu economi Cymru wrth drawsnewid i ddyfodol ym maes gwybodaeth.

Unwaith eto, nid nepell o'r adeilad hwn,

building, the Roath basin development will build on the exciting @Wales project and provide the potential for a creative industries hub. It will also be a centre for the expanding sectors of healthcare and life science, kick-started by the development of a new technium. The completion of these developments will also provide the much needed pedestrian and cycle access to the northern end of the barrage. Growth in the financial services sector has also been evidenced by substantial redevelopments by Lloyd's TSB, BAA and the Bank of Ireland in Dumballs Road and in Callaghan Square.

Our strategy for Cardiff bay has also ensured a strong role for traditional industries and the needs of local communities. The Assembly Government has joined Cardiff County Council and the Scarman Trust in funding the Switch project in south Cardiff. Switch is a community-based ICT learning project, which takes place within communities, to increase ICT take-up and head off the real danger of a digital divide between the haves and the have-nots. For example, there are three such projects in Butetown. We believe that it is essential for the communities to share in the continued development of Cardiff bay. The joint venture between the Assembly Government and Cardiff council to develop the successful Dumballs Road construction and skills centre is tangible evidence of the priority that we attach to this objective.

Looking around the bay at the new and ongoing developments, it is clear that Cardiff bay continues to be attractive to investors and developers. We have established sound working partnerships with both Cardiff and the Vale of Glamorgan councils to deliver benefits and development. I am confident that this will progress into the future.

As Lorraine so eloquently pointed out, the transformation of this part of Wales has been truly remarkable. We are resolved as a Government to ensure that we make the most of the substantial investment that has taken place, including our own Wales Millennium Centre and the Senedd. We shall ensure that Cardiff bay continues to develop as a vibrant,

bydd datblygiad basn y Rhath yn adeiladu ar brosiect cyffrous @Wales gan ddarparu cyfle i greu canolbwyt i'r diwydiannau creadigol. Bydd hefyd yn ganolfan i'r sectorau hynny ym maes gofal iechyd a gwyddoniaeth bywyd sy'n tyfu ac a gafodd hwb gan ddatblygiad techniwm newydd. Bydd cwblhau'r datblygiadau hyn hefyd yn creu'r llwybrau i gerddwyr a beicwyr y mae cymaint o'u hangen ym mhen gogleddol y morglawdd. Mae'r twf yn y sector gwasanaethau ariannol hefyd i'w weld yn sgîl aildatblygiad sylweddol gan Lloyd's TSB, BAA, a Bank of Ireland yn Ffordd Dumballs ac yn Sgwâr Callaghan.

Mae ein strategaeth ar gyfer bae Caerdydd hefyd wedi sicrhau rôl gref i ddiwydiannau traddodiadol ac anghenion cymunedau lleol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymuno â Chyngor Sir Caerdydd ac Ymddiriedolaeth Scarman i ariannu prosiect Switch yn y de. Mae Switch yn brosiect dysgu TGCh cymunedol sy'n digwydd mewn cymunedau i hybu'r niferoedd sy'n manteisio ar TGCh ac sy'n ceisio dileu'r perygl gwirioneddol o agendor digidol rhwng y rhai breintiedig a'r rhai difreintiedig. Er enghraift, mae tri phrosiect o'r fath yn Butetown. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol i'r cymunedau gael rhan yn natblygiad parhaus bae Caerdydd. Mae'r fenter ar y cyd rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyngor Caerdydd i ddatblygu canolfan sgiliau ac adeiladu lwyddiannus ar Ffordd Dumballs yn dystiolaeth glir o'r flaenoriaeth a roddwn i'r amcan hwn.

O edrych o amgylch y bae ar y datblygiadau newydd a'r rheini sydd ar y gweill, mae'n amlwg bod bae Caerdydd yn dal yn ddeniadol i fuddsoddwyr a datblygwyr. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu partneriaethau gwaith cadarn gyda chyngorau Caerdydd a Bro Morgannwg i sicrhau buddiannau a datblygiadau. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd hyn yn parhau yn y dyfodol.

Fel y dywedodd Lorraine mor groyw, mae'r trawsnewidiad yn y rhan hon o Gymru wedi bod yn rhyfeddol. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo fel Llywodraeth i sicrhau y byddwn yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar y buddsoddiad sylweddol a gafwyd, gan gynnwys Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru a'r Senedd ei hun. Byddwn yn sicrhau bod bae Caerdydd yn dal i

safe, attractive, impressive and sustainable environment, ensuring that we can all benefit from the outstanding natural and built environment that is such a key feature of our capital city.

ddatblygu fel amgylchedd bywiog, diogel, deniadol, trawiadol a chynaliadwy, gan sicrhau y gallwn i gyd fanteisio ar yr amgylchedd naturiol a'r amgylchedd adeiledig rhagorol sy'n nodwedd mor allweddol yn ein prifddinas.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That concludes business for today.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.14 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.14 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)

Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)