



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 23 Tachwedd 2004**

**Tuesday, 23 November 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 27 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 31 Pwynt o Drefn  
Point of Order
- 31 Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr  
Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar TB mewn Gwartheg  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment,  
Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on Bovine TB
- 44 Hysbysiad gan y Prif Weinidog am Rwymedigaeth wrth gefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif  
21.23—Cais Llundain i Gynnal y Gemau Olympaidd  
Notification by the First Minister of a Contingent Liability under Standing Order No.  
21.23—the London Olympic Bid
- 58 Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25  
Motion to Approve Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
- 60 Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a  
Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau  
Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004  
The Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities)  
(Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Local Authorities (Alternative  
Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004
- 70 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor) a'r  
Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004  
Approval of the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council Tax  
(Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004
- 77 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Polisiâu'r Llywodraeth ar Iechyd  
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The Government's Policies on Health

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefaryd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Croesawaf y ddirprwyaeth o aelodau Pwyllgor Amgylchedd a Datblygu Gwledig Senedd yr Alban sydd wedi ymuno â ni ers deuddydd, ac sydd yn y Siambr heddiw. Croeso mawr i chi.

**The Presiding Officer:** I welcome the delegation of members of the Scottish Parliament's Environment and Rural Development Committee, who have been with us for the past two days, and who are in the Chamber today. A very warm welcome to you.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad The Assembly Learning Grant**

**Q1 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the meaning of the term 'demand-led' in relation to the Assembly learning grant? (OAQ39626)

**C1 Peter Black:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar ystyr y term 'yn dibynnu ar y galw' yng nghyd-destun grant dysgu'r Cynulliad? (OAQ39626)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** It means just what it says on the tin. All students who apply for the Assembly learning grant and meet the eligibility criteria will receive the appropriate level of award. The same will apply to the education maintenance allowances announced last week, which will also be demand-led.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae'r ystyr yn amlwg ohono'i hun. Bydd yr holl fyfyrwyr sy'n ymgeisio am grant dysgu'r Cynulliad ac yn bodloni'r meini prawf yn cael y swm priodol o arian. Bydd hynny'n wir hefyd am y lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, a fydd hefyd yn dibynnu ar y galw.

**Peter Black:** I always understood, in terms of the budget, that 'demand-led' meant that where you had an increase in demand, you had to provide the money for it. However, despite a 13 per cent increase in demand for Assembly learning grants, the budget has been cut. Do you not believe that it would be better to use any surplus in the budget to increase the amount of grant payable to students and to widen the eligibility for it?

**Peter Black:** Yn ôl yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ddeall erioed, yr oedd 'yn dibynnu ar y galw', yng nghyd-destun y gyllideb, yn golygu, os byddai cynnydd yn y galw, y byddech yn gorfod darparu arian ar ei gyfer. Fodd bynnag, er bod 13 y cant yn fwy o alw am grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, mae'r gyllideb wedi'i thorri. Oni chredwch mai gwell fyddai defnyddio'r hyn sy'n weddill yn y gyllideb i gynyddu maint y grant y gellir ei dalu i fyfyrwyr ac i ehangu'r cymhwyster i'w gael?

**The First Minister:** We have set the eligibility criteria. This, as I said, is not the only demand-led service: we also have education maintenance allowances, despite your best efforts to delay them last week—although I am sure that you have thought the better of that by now. They all meet the same

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi pennu'r meini prawf cymhwyster. Fel y dywedais, nid hwn yw'r unig wasanaeth sy'n dibynnu ar y galw: mae gennym lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg hefyd, er ichi wneud eich gorau glas i'w hatal yr wythnos diwethaf—er fy mod yn siŵr eich bod wedi newid eich meddwl am

demand for less well-off students to be assisted to stay on in school or in full-time further education, and then to move on, availing themselves of Assembly learning grants. You must remember that you do not set a budget in the same way with regard to demand-led services. What you have, in essence, is a guesstimate and not a budget. You do not set the amount that you will spend, saying that you will not spend any more. It is a guess of what the demand will be. When we introduced the Assembly learning grant, we wildly overestimated the number of people who would apply for it. The reason for that was that, in higher education, people were used to applying for student grants, but the same was not true in further education. We have struggled to market the scheme to eligible students in further education, but it is starting to come through now. We believe that we have made an accurate estimate but, in the end, it is no more than that. However many students apply, they will get it. Do not worry about that, and do not worry students about it either.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you not agree that Assembly learning grants and education maintenance allowances will make a massive difference to learners in Wales, particularly those from less well-off families? Furthermore, is it not a shame that, once again, opposition parties are more concerned with rules and procedures than with delivery?

**The First Minister:** I find it extraordinary that they are trying to prevent the effective marketing of education maintenance allowances and Assembly learning grants to those aged 16 to 18—and people above 18 years of age with regard to Assembly learning grants for higher and further education. We know what the problem is: people from less well-off families do not stay on in school or in full-time further education, or avail themselves of opportunities in higher or further education, because they somehow feel that it is not for them. We are trying to make this easy for them. The procedural criticisms only serve to reduce the number of people from less well-off families who avail

hynny bellach. Maent oll yn ateb yr un galw am roi cymorth i fyfyrwyr llai cefnog gael aros yn yr ysgol neu mewn addysg bellach lawn amser, ac wedyn symud ymlaen, gan wneud defnydd o grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Rhaid ichi gofio na phennir y gyllideb yn yr un modd o ran y gwasanaethau sy'n dibynnu ar y galw. Yr hyn a geir, yn y bôn, yw amcangyfrif yn hytrach na chyllideb. Ni fyddwch yn pennu'r swm a wariwch, gan ddweud na wariwch fwy na hynny. Amcangyfrif o'r galw ydyw. Pan gyflwynasom grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, bu inni oramcangyfrif y nifer a fyddai'n gwneud cais amdano. Y rheswm am hynny oedd bod rhai mewn addysg uwch yn gyfarwydd ag ymgeisio am grantiau myfyrwyr, ond nid oedd hynny'n wir am y rhai mewn addysg bellach. Fe'i cawsom yn anodd marchnata'r cynllun ymysg myfyrwyr cymwys mewn addysg bellach, ond mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n dechrau dwyn ffrwyth yn awr. Credwn ein bod wedi gwneud amcangyfrif cywir ond, yn y diwedd, nid yw'n ddim mwy na hynny. Pa bynnag nifer o fyfyrwyr a wnaiff gais, byddant yn ei gael. Peidiwch â phoeni am hynny, a pheidiwch â pheri gofid i fyfyrwyr am hynny ychwaith.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Oni chytunwch y bydd grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad a lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg yn gwneud gwahaniaeth aruthrol i ddysgwyr yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rhai o deuluoedd llai cefnog? At hynny, onid yw'n drueni bod y gwrthbleidiau, unwaith eto, yn ymboeni'n fwy ynghylch rheolau a gweithdrefnau nag y maent am y gallu i fynd â'r maen i'r wal?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu eu bod yn ceisio atal marchnata effeithiol ar lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg a grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ymysg pobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed—a rhai dros 18 mlwydd oed yn achos grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ar gyfer addysg bellach ac uwch. Gwyddom beth yw'r broblem: nid yw pobl ifanc o deuluoedd llai cefnog yn aros yn yr ysgol neu mewn addysg bellach lawn amser, neu'n achub ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael iddynt mewn addysg bellach ac uwch, gan eu bod yn teimlo rywsut nad rhywbeth iddynt hwy yw hynny. Yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud hyn yn hawdd iddynt. Y cwbl a wnaiff y beirniadaethau ar weithdrefn yw peri y bydd llai o bobl o

themselves of the opportunities that we are providing. Opposition parties should be ashamed of the way that they are holding back students from less well-off families from trying to crack the problem of unequal participation in post-16 and post-18 education.

**Janet Ryder:** Would you like to explain to the 17-year-olds who cannot apply for education maintenance allowances how it is that opposition parties have been unfair to them, when it was your Government which, last week, refused to even consider bringing in a specific, one-year grant to enable 17-year-olds to apply for them? You did that because, in the words of your Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, 'they do not do that in England'. We are in Wales. Opposition parties have asked you to introduce a specific, one-year grant to enable 17-year-olds to apply for financial assistance. Will you consider it?

**The First Minister:** You start with 16-year-olds; next year, it will be 16 and 17-year-olds, and the year after that it will be 16, 17 and 18-year-olds. That is why we are receiving money over and above the Barnett formula, again on a demand-led basis. The more people who apply for it, the more will get it. We are getting that money on a special basis from Gordon Brown. Presumably Plaid Cymru would reject it on the grounds that it comes from a national source, which you want to have nothing to do with. This could not be afforded in an independent Wales and you need to explain that, because you are in danger of contradicting your own policies and justification for existence as a nationalist party. We have got additional funding for education maintenance allowances, which will come in for two years, and then three years, on an unlimited basis, which will be demand-led. We have to market the scheme effectively to children from less well-off families where there is no tradition of staying on in schools after 16 or 18 and encourage them to enter full-time higher education or near full-time further education.

**David Davies:** Your initial overestimate

deuluoedd llai cefnog yn achub ar y cyfleoedd a gynigiwn. Dylai'r gwrthbleidiau deimlo cywilydd ynglŷn â'r modd y maent yn atal myfyrwyr o deuluoedd llai cefnog rhag ceisio datrys y broblem o ran cyfranogi anghyfartal mewn addysg ôl-16 ac ôl-18.

**Janet Ryder:** A Gareth egluro i'r rhai 17 flwydd oed na allant ymgeisio am lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg ym mha fodd y bu'r gwrthbleidiau'n annheg â hwy, gan mai'ch Llywodraeth chi, yr wythnos diwethaf, a wrthododd hyd yn oed ystyried cyflwyno grant penodol am un flwyddyn fel y gallai rhai 17 flwydd oed ymgeisio amdanynt? Gwnaethoch hynny oherwydd, yng ngeiriau'ch Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, 'nid ydynt yn gwneud hynny yn Lloegr'. Yng Nghymru yr ydym ni. Mae'r gwrthbleidiau wedi gofyn ichi gyflwyno grant penodol am un flwyddyn fel y gall rhai 17 flwydd oed ymgeisio am gymorth ariannol. A wnewch ystyried hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dechreuir â rhai 16 flwydd oed; y flwyddyn nesaf, fe'u cynigir i rai 16 a 17 flwydd oed, a'r flwyddyn ar ôl hynny, i rai 16, 17 a 18 mlwydd oed. Dyna pam yr ydym yn derbyn arian ar ben yr hyn a geir drwy fformiwla Barnett, yn ôl y galw, unwaith eto. Po fwyaf y nifer a wnaiff ymgeisio amdano, y mwyaf a fydd yn ei gael. Yr ydym yn cael yr arian hwnnw drwy drefniant arbennig gan Gordon Brown. Mae'n debyg y byddai Plaid Cymru yn ei wrthod am ei fod yn dod o ffynhonnell genedlaethol, nad ydych am ymwneud dim ag ef. Ni ellid fforddio hyn mewn Cymru annibynnol a rhaid ichi egluro hynny, gan eich bod mewn perygl o wrth-ddweud eich polisiau'ch hun a'r cyfiawnhad dros eich bodolaeth fel plaid genedlaethol. Cawsom gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg, a gyflwynir ar gyfer dwy flynedd, ac wedyn tair blynedd, heb gyfyngiad, a arweinir gan y galw. Rhaid inni farchnata'r cynllun yn effeithiol ymysg plant o deuluoedd llai cefnog lle nad oes traddodiad o aros yn yr ysgol ar ôl cyrraedd 16 a 18 oed a'u cymell i dderbyn addysg uwch lawn amser neu addysg bellach sydd bron yn llawn amser.

**David Davies:** Oherwydd y goramcangyfrif a

means that there is extra money in the pot. Why can you not use that money to help 17-year-olds? Why do you now intend to move the money out of that pot into another area of spending, presumably so that you can announce something favourable for the press and bask in a few headlines? Is it not time for you to concentrate on looking after those 17-year-olds who also need that money?

**The First Minister:** David, your great political heroine, Margaret Thatcher, was the person who took away education maintenance allowances when she was Secretary of State for Education, some 30 years ago. She is still your heroine even though you probably know that she was the person who removed free milk in schools and education maintenance allowances. We will not take any lessons from you and your heroine, Margaret Thatcher, until you say that you are sorry for what she did 30 years ago. Labour has now reintroduced this scheme to help less well-off children stay on in education in the same numbers and proportions as those from middle-class families, for whom it is the expected thing to do.

wnaethoch ar y dechrau, mae arian ychwanegol yn y coffrau. Pam na allwch ddefnyddio'r arian hwnnw i helpu rhai 17 flwydd oed? Pam yr ydych yn awr yn bwriadu tynnu'r arian o'r maes hwnnw a'i roi mewn maes gwariant arall, a hynny, mae'n debyg, fel y gallwch gyhoeddi rhywbeth ffafriol i'r wasg ac ymhyfrydu mewn ychydig o benawdau newyddion? Onid yw'n bryd ichi ganolbwyntio ar ofalu am y rhai 17 flwydd oed y mae arnynt angen yr arian hwnnw hefyd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** David, eich arwres wleidyddol fawr, Margaret Thatcher, oedd yr un a ddygodd ymaith lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg, tua 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n dal i fod yn arwres gennych er y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, mai hi a ddygodd ymaith laeth am ddim mewn ysgolion a lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg. Ni chymerwn unrhyw wersi gennych chi a'ch arwres, Margaret Thatcher, hyd nes yr ymddiheurwch am yr hyn a wnaeth 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae Llafur wedi ailgyflwyno'r cynllun hwn yn awr i helpu plant llai cefnog i aros mewn addysg i'r un graddau ag y mae'r rhai o deuluoedd dosbarth canol, lle y mae disgwyl i blant wneud hynny.

### **Yr Henoed a Phobl Eraill sy'n Agored i Niwed The Elderly and Other Vulnerable Persons**

**Q2 Sandy Mewies:** What support is the Government providing to elderly and other vulnerable persons across Wales? (OAQ39621)

**C2 Sandy Mewies:** Pa gymorth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei ddarparu ar gyfer yr henoed a phobl eraill sy'n agored i niwed ledled Cymru? (OAQ39621)

**The First Minister:** We have several policies in place for this purpose, including improved joint working across health and social care, the establishment of the unified assessment process, the emerging national service framework for older people, our unique strategy for older people, and our commitment to establish an older people's commissioner.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae sawl polisi ar waith gennym i'r diben hwn, gan gynnwys gwell cydweithio rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, sefydlu'r broses asesu unedig, y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hŷn sy'n cael ei ddatblygu, ein strategaeth unigryw ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a'n hymrwymiad i sefydlu comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

**Sandy Mewies:** In my constituency of Delyn, the Flint and District Lions club has been running an innovative campaign to support elderly and vulnerable people. It is called the message in a bottle campaign.

**Sandy Mewies:** Yn fy etholaeth i, sef Delyn, bu clwb Llewod y Fflint a'r Cylch yn cynnal ymgyrch arloesol i helpu pobl oeddrannus a rhai sy'n agored i niwed. Ymgyrch neges mewn potel yw'r enw arni. Gellir gadael

Important information regarding prescribed drugs and so forth can be left in people's fridges so that they can be accessed by emergency services. Some 3,000 bottles have been distributed so far. Could you and the Minister for Health and Social Services look into the campaign to determine whether the Welsh Assembly Government could provide further support?

**The First Minister:** We are always interested in such new practical ideas, which will help those who are cared for. Some may not be cared for by members of their own families but by a rota of carers, or perhaps they may be single and looking after themselves but occasionally may need additional assistance from carers or community nurses or doctors, who come in to the house. It sounds like a sensible idea. Perhaps we can get more details about it and then we can see whether it should be spread through the rest of Wales.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** More than 18,000 people in Wales, mostly elderly, have been waiting more than six months for their first out-patient appointment with an orthopaedic consultant. The figure for the whole of England is 279. While most of us might be aware of those rather staggering figures, even more shocking is that there are more Welsh patients waiting for appointments in English hospitals than there are English patients. Are you proud of this record, First Minister? If not, why will you not now take this opportunity to apologise and change your policy?

**The First Minister:** You are quite right that orthopaedic out-patient waiting lists, especially in Cardiff and Swansea, are too long; we hope to bring them down. You will be aware of the major progress that has been made on the in-patient and day-case waiting lists in bringing down long waits for orthopaedic treatment, but we need to do more on the out-patient waiting lists.

gwybodaeth bwysig am gyffuriau a ragnodwyd ac yn y blaen yn oergelloedd pobl fel y gall gwasanaethau argyfwng ei chael. Dosbarthwyd tua 3,000 o boteli hyd yma. A allech chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ymchwilio i'r ymgyrch hon i ganfod a allai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynnig cymorth pellach?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym bob amser yn ymddiddori mewn syniadau ymarferol newydd o'r fath, a fydd o gymorth i'r rhai sy'n derbyn gofal. Efallai fod rhai nad ydynt yn derbyn gofal gan aelodau o'u teuluoedd eu hunain ond gan nifer o ofalwyr yn ôl rota, neu efallai eu bod yn sengl ac yn gofalu amdanynt eu hunain ond bod arnynt angen cymorth ychwanegol o bryd i'w gilydd gan ofalwyr neu nyrsys cymunedol neu feddygon, a ddaw i'w cartrefi. Mae'n ymddangos yn syniad synhwyrol. Efallai y bydd modd inni gael rhagor o fanylion amdano ac wedyn gallwn weld a ddylid ei ledaenu ledled Cymru.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae mwy na 18,000 o bobl yng Nghymru, y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn bobl oedrannus, wedi bod yn disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis am eu hapwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol gydag ymgynghorydd orthopedig. Y ffigur ar gyfer Lloegr gyfan yw 279. Er y gŵyr y rhan fwyaf ohonom am y ffigurau eithaf syfrdanol hynny, mae'n debyg, yr hyn sy'n fwy brawychus yw bod mwy o gleifion o Gymru'n disgwyl am apwyntiadau mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr nag sydd o gleifion o Loegr. A ydych yn falch o'r record hon, Brif Weinidog? Os nad ydych, pam na wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn yn awr i ymddiheuro a newid eich polisi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn hollol gywir wrth ddweud bod y rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion orthopedig allanol yn rhy hir, yn enwedig yng Nghaerdydd ac Abertawe; yr ydym yn gobeithio eu gostwng. Gwyddoch am y cynnydd mawr a wnaed ar y rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion mewnol ac achosion dydd o ran lleihau'r arosiadau hir am driniaeth orthopedig, ond rhaid inni wneud mwy o waith ar y rhestrau aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** First Minister, these are truly staggering figures. You are not doing anything to reduce them because they are going up—they are not coming down. Since Labour came to power, the number of people on waiting lists in Wales has almost doubled from 169,000 to 310,000. By 2007, you will have had double the money that was previously available to spend on the health service; the amount has risen from £2.7 billion in 1997 to £5.5 billion in 2007. You have wasted that money, First Minister; you have buried your head in the sand, and you are not prepared to acknowledge that this is a real issue. Instead of considering these issues on the margins, will you tell us what your long-term strategy for reducing waiting lists in Wales is?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I will repeat it yet again, although I think that I have told you a dozen times before. It is to make a second offer of treatment available to anyone who has been waiting over 18 months. That will reduce to 12 months on 31 March next year. We expect all trusts and local health boards in Wales to achieve that 12-month waiting-list target for out-patients and day cases. You ask what we are doing about a long-term strategy for increasing capacity in the health service to deal with orthopaedic waiting lists, which are particularly long and difficult in the Cardiff and Swansea areas. The answer is to create more capacity, which means training more surgeons and medics. I think that I have mentioned before that we have an 89 per cent increase in the intake into our medical schools in the current phase. This also involves capital investment; I think that only last week it was mentioned that Llandough hospital has just begun construction of its orthopaedic treatment centre, which will increase the number of orthopaedic surgeries and other treatments carried out from January 2006. Similarly, a building programme will shortly commence at St Woolos in Newport, for the same purpose.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** You have uttered those

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Brif Weinidog, mae'r ffigurau hyn yn wirioneddol syfrdanol. Nid ydych yn gwneud dim i'w lleihau gan eu bod yn codi—nid ydynt yn gostwng. Ers i Lafur ddod i rym, mae nifer y rhai sydd ar restrau aros yng Nghymru wedi dyblu bron o 169,000 i 310,000. Erbyn 2007, byddwch wedi cael dwywaith gymaint o arian ag a oedd ar gael o'r blaen i'w wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd; mae'r swm wedi codi o £2.7 biliwn yn 1997 i £5.5 biliwn yn 2007. Yr ydych wedi gwastraffu'r arian hwnnw, Brif Weinidog; yr ydych wedi cuddio'ch pen yn y tywod, ac nid ydych yn barod i dderbyn bod hyn yn fater o bwys. Yn hytrach nag ystyried y materion ymylol hyn, a wnewch ddweud wrthym beth yw eich strategaeth dymor hir i leihau rhestrau aros yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'i hailadroddaf unwaith eto, er fy mod yn credu imi ddweud hyn wrthych ddwsin o weithiau o'r blaen. Y bwriad yw gwarantu ail gynnig o driniaeth i unrhyw un a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis. Bydd hynny'n gostwng i 12 mis ar 31 Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Disgwyliwn i'r holl ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol yng Nghymru gyrraedd y targed hwnnw o 12 mis ar gyfer rhestrau aros cleifion allanol ac achosion dydd. Yr ydych yn holi pa beth a wnawn ynghylch strategaeth dymor hir i roi mwy o allu i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ymdrin â rhestrau aros orthopedig, sy'n arbennig o hir a thrafferthus yn ardaloedd Caerdydd ac Abertawe. Yr ateb yw creu mwy o gapasiti, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod yn rhaid hyfforddi mwy o lawfeddygon a meddygon. Credaf imi ddweud o'r blaen fod 89 y cant yn fwy o fyfyrwyr yn cael eu derbyn i'n hysgolion meddygol ar hyn o bryd. Mae hyn hefyd yn golygu buddsoddi cyfalaf; credaf nad oes ond wythnos wedi mynd heibio ers y cyfeiriwyd at y ffaith bod ysbyty Llandochau wedi dechrau codi ei ganolfan driniaeth orthopedig, fel y cyflawnir mwy o lawdriniaethau orthopedig a thriniaethau eraill o Ionawr 2006. Yn yr un modd, bydd rhaglen adeiladu'n dechrau cyn hir yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw yng Nghasnewydd, i'r un pwrpas.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydych wedi yngan y



warm words since 1999, but waiting lists are still going up. Nothing that you have said today gives us confidence that, by 2008, you will be able to match the English promise of a wait of 18 weeks between the GP's surgery and the operating table. How can you tell us that your strategy comes anywhere near to matching the promise in England? What you have told us today will not address that in any real way. There are 310,000 people on a waiting list in Wales today. Those are human problems; people have been waiting in pain month after month. How can you look them in the eye, given the kind of policy that you have been pursuing?

**The First Minister:** Your synthetic indignation and incoherent ramblings are no substitute for a health policy. You call my reference to capital building programmes 'warm words'. One of them has already been let, and the other, in St Woolos, is about to be let, and they are in line with the recommendations of the Edwards commission on how to address the particularly serious problems with the orthopaedic waiting lists in south-east Wales. I have referred to the increase of 89 per cent in the student intake into our medical schools. That is not 'warm words', but fact: there is an increase in the number of medics who will be trained in Wales and available to us to expand the NHS workforce. However, that does not happen overnight. When you increase the intake at a medical school, there are six years before those students qualify, and at least another six before those students can become consultant surgeons.

Therefore, there is an element of the supertanker about this; we all accept that and we have to ensure that, when we make a promise, we deliver on it. The waiting lists are coming down through the use of the 18-month second offer guarantee scheme, which will reduce to 12 months on 31 March next year. That is the answer: increased targets, and achieving those targets, increased capital building programmes and increased intake into our medical schools, and, similarly, increased intake for nurses, physiotherapists and the other paramedical staff on whom the NHS and its patients depend.

geiriau cysurus hynny er 1999, ond mae'r rhestrau aros yn dal i fynd yn hwy. Nid oes dim a ddywedasoeh heddiw'n rhoi unrhyw le inni gredu y byddwch, erbyn 2008, yn gallu rhoi'r un addewid ag a wneir yn Lloegr o 18 wythnos o aros rhwng gweld y meddyg teulu a derbyn llawdriniaeth. Sut y gallwch ddweud wrthym fod eich strategaeth yn dod yn agos at gyflawni'r un addewid ag a geir yn Lloegr? Ni fydd yr hyn a ddywedasoeh wrthym heddiw'n ymateb i hynny o ddirif. Mae 310,000 o bobl ar restr aros yng Nghymru heddiw. Problemau sy'n effeithio ar bobl yw'r rhain; bu pobl yn aros mewn poen fis ar ôl mis. Sut y gallwch edrych ym myw eu llygaid, yng ngolwg y math o bolisi y buoch yn ei ddilyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wnaiff eich dieter ffug a'ch sylwadau digyswllt y tro yn lle polisi iechyd. Dywedwch mai 'geiriau cysurus' yw fy nghyfeiriad at raglenni adeiladu cyfalaf. Mae un ohonynt wedi'i gosod eisoes, ac mae'r llall, yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw, ar fin cael ei gosod, ac maent yn unol ag argymhellion comisiwn Edwards ar sut i ymdrin â'r problemau arbennig o ddirifol sy'n ymwneud â'r rhestrau aros orthopedig yn y De-ddwyrain. Cyfeiriais at y ffaith bod 89 y cant yn fwy o fyfyrwyr yn cael eu derbyn i'n hysgolion meddygol. Nid 'geiriau cysurus' yw'r rhain, ond ffeithiau: bydd mwy o feddygon yn cael eu hyfforddi yng Nghymru a bydd mwy ar gael i ni fel y gallwn ehangu gweithlu'r GIG. Fodd bynnag, ni ddigwydd hynny dros nos. Os derbynnir mwy i ysgol feddygol, bydd chwe blynedd cyn i'r myfyrwyr hynny ymgymhwyso, ac o leiaf chwe blynedd arall cyn y gall y myfyrwyr hynny ddod yn llawfeddygon ymgynghorol.

Felly, cymer gryn amser i newid hyn; yr ydym oll yn derbyn hynny a rhaid inni sicrhau y cyflawnwn ein haddewidion. Mae'r rhestrau aros yn gostwng drwy ddefnyddio cynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig ar ôl 18 mis, a fydd yn gostwng i 12 mis ar 31 Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Dyna'r ateb: targedau uwch, a chyrraedd y targedau hynny, mwy o raglenni adeiladu cyfalaf a derbyn mwy i'n hysgolion meddygol, ac, yn yr un modd, derbyn mwy i'w hyfforddi'n nyrsys, ffisiotherapyddion a staff parameddygol eraill y mae'r GIG a'i gleifion yn dibynnu arnynt.

### Ysgolion Bach mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Small Schools in Rural Areas

**Q3 Mick Bates:** What is the Assembly Government doing to help small schools in rural areas stay open? (OAQ39627)

**The First Minister:** The provision of school places is a matter for local authorities. We do not seek to influence local decisions on particular schools. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has an appellate role in determining on individual applications for school closures by local authorities if there are objections to those closures, which there sometimes are. However, it may surprise you to learn that, quite frequently, there are no objections to proposed school closures. The Welsh Assembly Government does expect all authorities to ensure that all children have access to high-quality provision and to tackle the waste of resources inherent in growing numbers of surplus places in rural and urban areas.

**Mick Bates:** That is particularly complacent, especially your use of the words 'waste of resources'. Your Government is fond of gimmicks such as the child trust fund. Why do you not use that money now to help children in rural communities by saving rural schools? When these kids get to be 18, you will be taking that money away from them in the form of tuition fees.

**The First Minister:** I fear that was another example of synthetic indignation. If you have a policy on rural schools, then you must present it before the Assembly so that people can judge what you have to offer. Over the past 20 years or so, about three rural schools per year have closed, without any objection to 50 per cent of the closures. We give guidance to local authorities, they make their decisions, and if there are objections they are presented to Jane Davidson as the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. Local authorities must decide how best to deliver the national curriculum across areas with a sparse population, but where there is a strong affection for the local school. It is a difficult

**C3 Mick Bates:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i helpu ysgolion bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig i aros yn agored? (OAQ39627)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae darparu lleoedd mewn ysgolion yn fater i awdurdodau lleol. Ni cheisiwn ddylanwadu ar benderfyniadau lleol ynghylch ysgolion penodol. Mae rôl apeliadol gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wrth benderfynu ar geisiadau penodol i gau ysgolion gan awdurdodau lleol os oes gwrthwynebiad i'w cau, fel y ceir weithiau. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddwch yn synnu o glywed na cheir gwrthwynebiad, yn eithaf aml, i gynlluniau i gau ysgolion. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn disgwyl i'r holl awdurdodau sicrhau bod darpariaeth o ansawdd da ar gael i bob plentyn, ac iddynt ymdrin â'r gwastraff adnoddau sydd ynglŷn â'r niferoedd cynyddol o leoedd dros ben a geir mewn ardaloedd gwledig a threfol.

**Mick Bates:** Mae hynny'n arbennig o ddifater, yn enwedig eich defnydd o'r geiriau 'gwastraff adnoddau'. Mae'ch Llywodraeth yn hoff o gimigau fel y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant. Pam na ddefnyddiwch yr arian hwnnw'n awr i helpu plant mewn cymunedau gwledig drwy achub ysgolion gwledig? Pan fydd y plant hynny'n 18 oed, byddwch yn mynd â'r arian hwnnw oddi arnynt ar ffurf ffioedd dysgu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae arnaf ofn mai enghraifft arall o ddieter ffug oedd honno. Os oes gennych bolisi ar ysgolion gwledig, rhowch ef gerbron y Cynulliad fel y gellir barnu'r hyn sydd gennych i'w gynnig. Dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, fwy neu lai, tua thair ysgol wledig sydd wedi cau bob blwyddyn, ac ni fu gwrthwynebiad yn achos hanner ohonynt. Rhoddwn ganllawiau i awdurdodau lleol, gwnânt eu penderfyniadau, ac os oes gwrthwynebiadau fe'u cyflwynir i Jane Davidson fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gorfod penderfynu ar y modd gorau i gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol mewn ardaloedd tenau eu poblogaeth, ond os hoffir

political decision for the local authority, which is double banked by the ability to appeal to the Minister if people object to the proposed closure. The Minister makes a decision on educational grounds, not on financial grounds. The decision is based on whether the authority has consulted properly, according to due process, and is making a sensible suggestion in terms of providing better education, not just to save money.

**Helen Mary Jones:** To spare you any synthetic indignation—I assure you that some of the indignation on this side of the Chamber about some of your policies is far from synthetic—on a more factual matter, would you regard a school with 50 pupils as automatically being a small school and not viable? If you do not agree with that perspective—I certainly do not—what is your view of Carmarthenshire County Council’s proposal to shut all schools in the county with less than 50 pupils, regardless of how isolated they are?

**The First Minister:** I am not aware of any cut-off point in the guidance. It is Carmarthenshire County Council’s decision to make, and it is up to the local community to decide whether it accepts that decision, or whether it wishes to object to an individual school closure proposal. The sparsity of the population and the proximity of an alternative school would be the factors borne in mind when people decide whether to object, and would also be a determining factor for the Minister, and whether it would be reasonable to expect children of a certain age to travel a certain distance in order to access an alternative school.

**Lisa Francis:** ‘Iaith Pawb’ clearly states that the availability of education through the medium of Welsh has increased steadily in recent years, and that that is an aim your Government wants to encourage. In Carmarthenshire, where up to 40 small schools may close, what assessment has your Government made of the impact this could have on your vision of a truly bilingual nation?

**The First Minister:** My understanding from the press coverage from this morning or

yr ysgol leol yn fawr, mae’r penderfyniad gwleidyddol yn un anodd i’r awdurdod lleol, a chaiff ei ailwirio gan fod modd apelio i’r Gweinidog os oes gwrthwynebiad i’r bwriad i gau. Gwnaiff y Gweinidog benderfyniad ar sail addysgol, nid ar sail ariannol. Gwneir y penderfyniad ar ôl canfod a yw’r awdurdod wedi ymgynghori’n iawn, gan ddilyn y broses briodol, ac a yw’n cynnig awgrym synhwyrol o ran darparu gwell addysg, ac nid i arbed arian yn unig.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Er mwyn eich arbed rhag unrhyw ddieter ffug—yr wyf yn eich sicrhau bod peth o’r dieter yr ochr hon i’r Siambr ynghylch rhai o’ch polisïau ymhell o fod yn ffug—ar fater mwy ffeithiol, a ystyriech ysgol ac ynddi 50 o ddisgyblion yn ysgol fach nad yw’n ddichonadwy o’r herwydd? Os na chytunwch â’r safbwynt hwnnw—nid wyf fi yn sicr—beth yw eich barn am fwriad Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin i gau’r holl ysgolion yn y sir sydd â llai na 50 o ddisgyblion, ni waeth pa mor anghysbell y maent?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn am unrhyw derfyn yn y canllawiau. Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin sydd i benderfynu ar hyn, a lle’r gymuned leol yw penderfynu a yw’n derbyn y penderfyniad hwnnw, neu a yw’n dymuno gwrthwynebu bwriad i gau ysgol benodol. Teneurwydd y boblogaeth ac agosrwydd ysgol arall fyddai’r ffactorau i’w dal mewn cof wrth benderfynu a ddylid gwrthwynebu, a byddai’r Gweinidog yn eu hystyried hefyd wrth benderfynu, ynghyd â barnu a fyddai’n rhesymol disgwyl i blant o ryw oed deithio rhyw bellter er mwyn cyrraedd ysgol arall.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae ‘Iaith Pawb’ yn datgan yn glir fod y gallu i gael addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg wedi cynyddu’n gyson yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a bod eich Llywodraeth yn dymuno hybu’r amcan hwnnw. Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, lle y gallai hyd at 40 o ysgolion bach gau, pa asesiad a wnaeth eich Llywodraeth o’r effaith y gallai hynny ei chael ar eich gweledigaeth o genedl wirioneddol ddwyieithog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf o’r sylw a roddwyd i hyn yn y wasg y bore yma

yesterday—I cannot remember which—was that 13 of the 19 new primary schools planned for Carmarthenshire to replace some of those proposed to close, will be Welsh-medium or bilingual schools. You are right to draw attention to the fact that if there is a village school serving a Welsh-speaking community, it is a matter to be borne in mind regarding whether a great travelling distance to a new school would disrupt that pattern of a Welsh-medium school serving a Welsh-speaking community. It is a fair point.

However, when Jane Davidson visited the new school at Llanboidy recently, which replaced three previous schools, there was strong support in general for the way that that exercise had been handled, and in terms of the children's access to the best possible new facilities in a strongly Welsh-speaking community, such as Llanboidy. If you replace three previous schools with one brand new school, it does not always mean death and destruction to the Welsh language as spoken in that local community.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 4 (OAQ 39641) yn ôl.

neu ddoe—ni allaf gofio pa un—bydd 13 o'r 19 o ysgolion cynradd newydd y bwriedir eu cael yn sir Gaerfyrddin i gymryd lle'r rhai y bwriedir eu cau, yn rhai cyfrwng Cymraeg neu ddwyieithog. Mae'n briodol ichi dynnu sylw at y ffaith, os oes ysgol bentref sy'n gwasanaethu cymuned Gymraeg, y dylid ystyried a fyddai taith bell i ysgol newydd yn amharu ar y patrwm hwnnw o gael ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg yn gwasanaethu cymuned Gymraeg. Mae'n bwynt teg.

Fodd bynnag, pan ymwelodd Jane Davidson yn ddiweddar â'r ysgol newydd yn Llanboidy, a oedd wedi cymryd lle tair ysgol flaenorol, cafodd fod llawer o gefnogaeth yn gyffredinol i'r modd y trafodwyd y mater hwnnw, ac o ran gallu'r plant i gael y cyfleusterau newydd gorau posibl mewn cymuned lle y mae'r Gymraeg yn gryf, fel Llanboidy. Os rhoddir un ysgol newydd sbon yn lle tair ysgol flaenorol, nid yw hynny bob amser yn golygu y rhoddir ergyd farwol i'r Gymraeg fel iaith lafar yn y gymuned leol honno.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4 (OAQ 39641) has been withdrawn.

### **Blaenoriaethau Deddfwriaeth Legislation Priorities**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** What priority areas for legislation has the First Minister identified in any discussion with colleagues ahead of the next Queen's Speech? (OAQ39646)

**The First Minister:** I discuss with my Cabinet colleagues early in each calendar year which proposals on future legislative should be agreed at Cabinet and then put to the Assembly in our annual debate on this exercise, which takes place every March. The Secretary of State for Wales is then informed of those priorities. However, this year, we wrote a supplementary letter to the Secretary of State for Wales, following the Assembly debate in October on the Richard commission proposals. Therefore, there is nothing to stop you having an additional bite at the cherry, which is what we have done during 2004.

**C5 Janet Ryder:** Pa feysydd y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u nodi fel blaenoriaethau o ran deddfwriaeth, mewn unrhyw drafodaethau â'i gydweithwyr cyn araith nesaf y Frenhines? (OAQ39646)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddaf yn trafod gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet ar ddechrau pob blwyddyn galendr pa gynigion ar ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol y dylid cytuno arnynt yn y Cabinet a'u rhoi gerbron y Cynulliad wedyn yn ein dadl flynyddol ar yr ymarferiad hwn, sy'n digwydd bob mis Mawrth. Wedyn hysbysir Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru am y blaenoriaethau hynny. Fodd bynnag, eleni, ysgrifenasom lythyr atodol at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, yn dilyn y ddadl yn y Cynulliad ym mis Hydref ar gynigion comisiwn Richard. Felly, nid oes dim i atal rhywun rhag rhoi ail gynnig arni, a dyna a wnaethom yn ystod 2004.

2.20 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** As we have heard today, 10 out of the 37 Bills put forward by the Queen are to do with law and order. We all heard David Blunkett over the weekend raising several other issues regarding further measures, reputedly and reportedly, to combat terrorism, such as trial without jury. Do you not agree that that is all part of the climate of fear that the Labour Party is trying to use to restrict civil liberties, which, once taken away, are hard to get back, as well as to replicate George Bush's successes in the American election? Will you ensure that we are given adequate time in Plenary to debate these issues and their undoubted effect on everyday life in Wales?

**The First Minister:** There are only a few months left before the likely date of a general election—although it could go on for another 18 months or so. However, depending on how long the parliamentary session or sessions are before the next general election, many Bills will be put forward. I understand that 28 Bills are listed for passage, but, if the election is in March—sorry, in early May—it is most unlikely that all those Bills will have time to get through. I would have thought that the important thing for Wales is how many Wales-only Bills get through. We are still hopeful that the two Bills that went through draft scrutiny last year will be able to get through in the short parliamentary session that most people assume will take place over the next four or five months.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I am tempted to ask which date in March it was that you nearly disclosed. On the Queen's Speech, you will have seen that the sovereign referred to extending the power of hospitals to act for themselves, foundation-type status, and the right of patients to choose—like patients' passports. They have had some qualified success in England, compared with the dire position here. Are you now giving serious consideration to such passports in Wales so that we can get some of those 300,000 people off waiting lists?

**Janet Ryder:** Fel y clywsom heddiw, mae 10 o'r 37 o Fesurau y soniwyd amdanynt gan y Frenhines yn ymwneud â chyfraith a threfn. Clywodd pawb David Blunkett dros y penwythnos yn codi sawl mater arall ynghylch mesurau pellach i ymladd yn erbyn terfysgaeth, yn ôl y sôn, fel achos llys heb reithgor. A ydych yn cytuno bod hyn oll yn rhan o'r hinsawdd o ofn y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn ceisio'i defnyddio i gyfyngu ar hawliau sifil, y bydd yn anodd eu hadfer ar ôl eu colli, ac i efelychu llwyddiant George Bush yn yr etholiad yn America? A wnewch sicrhau y cawn ddigon o amser mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i drafod y materion hyn a'r effaith y maent yn sicr o'i chael ar fywyd pob dydd yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes ond ychydig fisoedd tan ddyddiad tebygol yr etholiad cyffredinol—er y gallai fod ymhenn rhyw 18 mis wedyn. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl hyd y sesiwn neu'r sesiynau seneddol cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, bydd llawer o Fesurau'n cael eu rhoi gerbron. Deallaf fod 28 o Fesurau wedi'u rhestru i fynd drwy'r Senedd, ond, os bydd yr etholiad ym mis Mawrth—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ar ddechrau Mai—mae'n annhebygol iawn y bydd digon o amser i'r holl Fesurau hynny fynd drwodd. Y peth pwysig i Gymru, yn fy marn i, yw nifer y Mesurau i Gymru'n unig a i'ff drwodd. Yr ydym yn dal yn obeithiol y bydd y ddau Fesur y craffwyd ar y drafftiau ohonynt y llynedd yn gallu mynd drwodd yn ystod y sesiwn seneddol byr a geir, yn nhyb y rhan fwyaf o bobl, dros y pedwar neu bum mis nesaf.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Caf fy nhemtio i ofyn pa ddyddiad ym Mawrth y bu bron ichi ei ddatgelu. Ynghylch Araith y Frenhines, byddwch wedi gweld bod y Frenhines wedi cyfeirio at ehangu pŵer ysbytai i weithredu drostynt eu hunain, statws tebyg i un ysbytai sefydledig, a hawl cleifion i ddewis—yn debyg i basportau cleifion. Cawsant rywffaint o lwyddiant yn Lloegr, o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa enbyd a geir yma. A ydych yn ystyried o ddifrif cael pasportau o'r fath yng Nghymru fel y gallwn dynnu rhai o'r 300,000 oddi ar restrau aros?

**The First Minister:** I thought for a moment that you were going to tell us what you would do in the unlikely event of the Conservatives being elected, including this extraordinary promise to close down the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency office in Swansea with the loss of over 5,000 jobs, which I read about in *The Sunday Telegraph*.

On health measures, there is an important undertaking to bring in a health White Paper, with a Bill to follow, although that would probably be after the general election, which would have a considerable impact on Wales regarding smoking. On choice in hospitals, which you were good enough to say—although maybe your English colleagues have not said it—you believe has had a qualified amount of success in getting people off waiting lists in England, we are succeeding in getting people off waiting lists through the second offer guarantee scheme, which will come down to 12 months after 31 March. The important aspect is the huge numbers of people who go into hospital in Wales through the accident and emergency route—I believe that it is over 1 million people. That is over a third of our population. Therefore, 55 per cent of the hospital intake in Wales is through the accident and emergency route, compared with 35 per cent in England. The important aspect is how we assess those people, either before they get into hospital, by strengthening the primary care system, or immediately after they get into hospital, through medical assessment units. I strongly recommend that you visit the first unit in Britain, which is regarded as a benchmark, at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, some 10 miles from here.

**Nick Bourne:** To return to a theme that you have used before, I look forward to the time when you can put questions to me, but, at the moment, you are supposed to be answering mine. You have not answered my question about the 300,000 people on waiting lists. I did say that England has had a qualified success—the situation there is not as dire as it is in Wales; I use my words carefully. During your time as First Minister, there has been an increase of 85 per cent in the number of people waiting for hospital treatment—that is

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credais am eiliad eich bod am ddweud wrthym yr hyn a wnaech os câi'r Ceidwadwyr eu hethol, er annhebyced hynny, gan gynnwys yr addewid ryfeddol i gau swyddfa'r Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau yn Abertawe gan beri colli 5,000 o swyddi, y darllenais amdani yn *The Sunday Telegraph*.

Ynghylch mesurau ar iechyd, mae ymgymriad pwysig i gyflwyno Papur Gwyn ar iechyd a Mesur i ddilyn, er ei bod yn debygol mai ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol y bydd hynny, a gâi gryn effaith ar Gymru mewn cysylltiad ag ysmegu. Ynghylch dewis mewn ysbytai, y buoch mor garedig â dweud—er nad yw'ch cymheiriad yn Lloegr wedi dweud hyn o bosibl—eich bod yn credu y bu rhywfaint o lwyddiant arno o ran tynnu pobl oddi ar restrau aros yn Lloegr, yr ydym yn llwyddo i dynnu pobl oddi ar restrau aros drwy gynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig, a fydd yn gostwng i 12 mis ar ôl 31 Mawrth. Yr agwedd bwysig ar hyn yw'r nifer enfawr o bobl a aiff i'r ysbyty yng Nghymru drwy'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys—credaf ei fod yn fwy nag 1 miliwn o bobl. Mae hynny'n fwy nag un rhan o dair o'n poblogaeth. Felly, mae 55 y cant o'r rhai a dderbynnir i ysbytai yng Nghymru yn dod drwy'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys, o'i gymharu â 35 y cant yn Lloegr. Yr agwedd bwysig ar hyn yw'r modd yr ydym yn asesu'r bobl hynny, un ai cyn iddynt ddod i'r ysbyty, drwy wella'r system gofal sylfaenol, neu'n syth wedi iddynt ddod i'r ysbyty, drwy unedau asesu meddygol. Yr wyf yn eich cymell yn daer i ymweld â'r uned gyntaf ym Mhrydain, a ystyrir yn feincnod, yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, sydd tua 10 milltir oddi yma.

**Nick Bourne:** Gan ailgydio mewn thema yr ydych wedi'i defnyddio o'r blaen, edrychaf ymlaen at yr adeg y cewch chi ofyn cwestiynau i mi, ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr ydych chi i fod i ateb rhai gennyf fi. Nid ydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn a ofynnais am y 300,000 o bobl sydd ar restrau aros. Dywedais fod Lloegr wedi cael rhywfaint o lwyddiant—nid yw'r sefyllfa yno mor enbyd â'r un a geir yng Nghymru; yr wyf yn dewis fy ngeiriau'n ofalus. Yn ystod eich cyfnod yn Brif Weinidog, mae'r nifer sy'n disgwyl am

dire. You are not offering anything to these people. The position worsens month on month, compared with what you are saying—you are trying to say that it is getting better, but it is getting worse. You have withdrawn a debate on the second offer guarantee scheme, presumably because it is not working. What will you do to get some of these 300,000 people—one in 10 of the Welsh population—off a waiting list?

**The First Minister:** It is because one third of the Welsh population—not one tenth, but one third—goes into hospital through the accident and emergency doors that we have a problem in ensuring that you can operate proper throughput when it comes to the operating theatres. More people attend hospital via that route than go in for elective surgery.

You are quite wrong to say that no progress is being made in this area—the progress in reducing long waits has been considerable in the past two years, and we are proud of that. In comparing the health service in England with that in Wales, you tend not to mention those areas in which England does not stand comparison with us, as I have mentioned before. For some reason, you seem to have considerable difficulty in this regard—I can see the leader of the opposition almost choking on his lunch over this matter. However, because you find it so difficult, I must tell you that MRSA rates, for example, appear to be 50 per cent higher in England than in Wales based on current figures, and, likewise, the infant mortality rate appears to be 20 per cent lower in Wales than in England or Scotland. These figures, which you find difficult to cope with, indicate that the Welsh health service has a great deal to be proud of.

**Nick Bourne:** To come back to the point, it is on your watch and on the watch of the Minister for Health and Social Services that the position in Wales is worse than almost anywhere else in the free world. More people are on waiting lists per head of population in Wales than anywhere else, and that is on your

driniaeth mewn ysbyty wedi codi 85 y cant—mae hynny'n resynus. Nid ydych yn cynnig unrhyw beth i'r bobl hyn. Mae'r sefyllfa'n gwaethygu o fis i fis, yn wahanol i'r hyn yr ydych chi'n ei ddweud—yr ydych chi'n honni ei bod yn gwella, ond mae'n gwaethygu. Yr ydych wedi tynnu dadl ar gynllun gwarant yr ail gynnig yn ôl a hynny, mae'n debyg, am nad yw'n llwyddo. Pa beth a wnewch i dynnu rhai o'r 300,000 hyn—un o bob 10 o boblogaeth Cymru—oddi ar y rhestrau aros?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Am fod un rhan o dair o boblogaeth Cymru—nid un rhan o 10, ond un rhan o dair—yn mynd i'r ysbyty drwy'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys y mae gennym broblem o ran sicrhau trwygyrch iawn mewn theatrau llawdriniaeth. Mae mwy'n mynd i'r ysbyty ar hyd y llwybr hwnnw na drwy fynd yno i gael llawdriniaeth ddewisol.

Yr ydych yn camgymryd yn llwyr wrth ddweud na wneir cynnydd yn y maes hwn—gwnaed cryn gynnydd ar leihau arosiadau hir yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, ac yr ydym yn falch o hynny. Wrth gymharu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr â'r un yng Nghymru, tueddwch i beidio â sôn am y meysydd hynny lle nad yw Lloegr yn gwneud cystal â ni, fel y dywedais o'r blaen. Am ryw reswm, ymddengys eich bod yn cael cryn drafferth yn hyn o beth—gallaf weld arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn tagu ar ei ginio bron ynghylch y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, gan eich bod yn ei chael mor anodd, rhaid imi ddweud wrthyhch fod cyfraddau MRSA, er enghraifft, yn ymddangos eu bod yn 50 y cant yn uwch yn Lloegr nag yng Nghymru yn ôl y ffigurau cyfredol, ac, yn yr un modd, ymddengys fod cyfradd marwolaeth babanod yn 20 y cant yn is yng Nghymru nag y mae yn Lloegr neu'r Alban. Mae'r ffigurau hyn, yr ydych yn cael trafferth delio â hwy, yn dangos bod gan y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru lawer i ymfalchïo ynddo.

**Nick Bourne:** Er mwyn dod yn ôl at y pwynt, chi a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol sy'n gyfrifol bod y sefyllfa'n waeth yng Nghymru nag ym mron unman arall yn y byd rhydd. Mae mwy o bobl ar restrau aros am bob pen o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru nag yn unman

watch. Those are the figures with which I am concerned, that is the subject of my question, and you have not said anything to give any reassurance to those 300,000 people who will probably also choke on their lunch when they hear you suggest that everything in the garden is rosy. What hope can you offer to that one in 10 of the Welsh population?

**The First Minister:** The times for long waits are coming down. You do not accept that, but it is true: they are coming down and great progress is being made. As I have said, it is a matter of how one handles the one in three of the Welsh population, which is a far larger figure than the one you mentioned, who go into hospital via the accident and emergency route. It may not fit with Conservative mathematics, but when I was in school, 1 million was three times greater than the 300,000 to which you referred. We dealt with those 1 million, which is a proportionately far greater number of the population than attend hospital through the accident and emergency route in England. You keep shaking your head: you obviously have difficulties in coping with these concepts because you are a one-club golfer on this issue. All you want to mention is the numbers of people on waiting lists: you will not mention the progress being made on the long waits, and neither will you mention the MRSA figures, where the situation in England is 50 per cent worse than in Wales, and you will not mention the infant mortality rates, which are 20 per cent better in Wales than in England, because you cannot cope with good news about the Welsh national health service.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Today's announcement in the Queen's Speech must be a disappointment to you given the meagre return of two Bills from the seven asked for. While listening to Peter Hain make the Queen's Speech this morning—because it was he who made the announcement before the Queen actually got into her carriage—one realised that we were going to get two Bills, with the rejection of the five other Bills that you put forward. Does not the Queen's Speech today demonstrate once more how inadequate the constitutional settlement is for Wales, and

arall, a'ch cyfrifoldeb chi yw hynny. Dyna'r ffigurau y pryderaf yn eu cylch, dyna destun fy nghwestiwn, ac nid ydych wedi dweud unrhyw beth i dawelu meddwl y 300,000 hynny a fydd hefyd yn tagu ar eu cinio, yn ôl pob tebyg, o'ch clywed yn awgrymu bod popeth yn hyfryd. Pa obaith y gallwch ei gynnig i'r un ym mhob 10 o boblogaeth Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r amseroedd aros hir yn byrhau. Nid ydych yn derbyn hynny, ond mae'n wir: maent yn gostwng a gwneir cynnydd mawr. Fel y dywedais, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r modd y trafodir yr un ym mhob tri o boblogaeth Cymru, sy'n ffigur mwy o lawer na'r un y cyfeiriasoch ato, a aiff i'r ysbyty drwy'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys. Efallai nad yw'n cyd-fynd â mathemateg y Ceidwadwyr, ond pan oeddwn i yn yr ysgol, yr oedd 1 miliwn dair gwaith yn fwy na'r 300,000 yr ydych chi'n cyfeirio ato. Yr ydym wedi delio â'r 1 miliwn hynny, sy'n gyfran fwy o lawer o'r boblogaeth nag a aiff i'r ysbyty drwy'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys yn Lloegr. Yr ydych yn dal i ysgwyd eich pen: mae'n amlwg eich bod yn ei chael yn anodd deall y cysyniadau hyn gan mai dim ond un gân sydd gennych ar y mater hwn. Nid ydych ond am sôn am y niferoedd sydd ar restrau aros: ni soniwch am y cynnydd a wneir ar yr arosiadau hir, nac am y ffigurau ar MRSA, lle mae'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr yn 50 y cant yn waeth nag yng Nghymru, ac ni soniwch am gyfraddau marwolaeth babanod, sy'n 20 y cant yn well yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, am na allwch ddygymod â newyddion da am y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae'r cyhoeddiad heddiw yn Araith y Frenhines yn sicr o fod wedi peri siom i chi gan mai dim ond dau Fesur a gafwyd o'r saith a geisiwyd. Wrth wrando ar Peter Hain yn traddodi Araith y Frenhines y bore yma—gan mai ef a wnaeth y cyhoeddiad cyn i'r Frenhines gychwyn am y Senedd—y sylweddolwyd mai dau Fesur a gaem, a bod y pum Mesur arall a roesoch gerbron wedi'u gwrthod. Onid yw Araith y Frenhines heddiw'n dangos unwaith eto mor annigonol ydyw'r setliad cyfansoddiadol i Gymru, a chymaint yw ein hangen am weithdrefn



how much we need a proper law-making procedure so that the Bills that you wanted can be put before the National Assembly to be passed in the year that you want them to be made?

**The First Minister:** It used to be one Bill every decade, and now it is two a year. I think that you should recognise that we have never had two Bills in a year; although one of them is not mentioned in the Queen's Speech, I understand that it will be in the hopper for the remaining term—even if it is such a short term. You mentioned a lack of progress, but clearly, if a 500 per cent increase is not progress, I do not know what is. This is a measure of how well we work with our Westminster colleagues in getting Bills through by going from one every 10 years pre-devolution to one every year, and now two. Whether it will now be two every year, we do not know, but there are certainly two this year, and you should welcome that. I do not mind you having a little bit of a go, but you should recognise that we have never had two Bills before, Mike, and you really ought to say, 'Well, that is something for which we can give a pat on the back for the level of co-operation between Labour in the Assembly and Labour in Westminster'.

With regard to next year, there are some huge issues. Will we, on the assumption that Labour is elected with a working majority, have a Government of Wales amendment Act in the first session? I hope that we will, because that is at the heart of what we have been discussing over the last months. On smoking, you will know from the White Paper on public health published last week that, at the end of the six-month consultation, the Government has agreed the wording that we wanted by which it is clear that we will get an enabling clause to enable the Assembly to determine what happens about smoking in public places. That will be devolved to us, on the assumption that Labour is re-elected. That is also a pretty big issue for us to get our teeth into next year.

2.30 p.m.

**Michael German:** I hope that we can look for the clear leadership that you just

ddeddfu briodol fel y gellir rhoi'r Mesurau yr oeddech yn eu dymuno gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'w derbyn yn y flwyddyn yr oeddech am weld eu gwneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Arferai fod yn un Mesur bob degawd, ac mae bellach yn ddau y flwyddyn. Credaf y dylech gydnabod na chawsom erioed ddau Fesur mewn blwyddyn; er na fu sôn am un ohonynt yn Araith y Frenhines, deallaf y bydd yn yr hopran ar gyfer y tymor sy'n weddill—hyd yn oed os bydd yn dymor byr. Cyfeiriasoch at ddiffyg cynnydd, ond beth yw cynnydd o 500 y cant os nad cynnydd? Mae hyn yn dangos mor dda yw'r cydweithio rhyngom a'n cymheiriaid yn San Steffan wrth hyrwyddo Mesurau gan ein bod wedi newid o gael un bob 10 mlynedd cyn datganoli i gael un bob blwyddyn, a dau erbyn hyn. Ni wyddom a geir dau bob blwyddyn, ond mae dau eleni, yn sicr, a dylech groesawu hynny. Nid oes gwahaniaeth gennyf os cynigiwch ychydig o feirniadaeth, ond dylech gydnabod na chawsom erioed ddau Fesur o'r blaen, Mike, a dylech ddweud, 'Wel, dyna rywbeth y gallwn ei ganmol oherwydd maint y cydweithrediad rhwng Llafur yn y Cynulliad a Llafur yn San Steffan'.

Gyda golwg ar y flwyddyn nesaf, mae rhai materion anferth. Gan gymryd y caiff Llafur ei ethol gyda mwyafrif digonol, a gawn Ddeddf diwygio Llywodraeth Cymru yn y sesiwn gyntaf? Gobeithiaf y byddwn, gan fod hynny wrth wraidd yr hyn y buom yn ei drafod dros y misoedd diwethaf. Ynghylch ysmegu, gwyddoch oherwydd y Papur Gwyn ar iechyd cyhoeddus a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf fod y Llywodraeth, ar ôl y chwe mis o ymgynghori, wedi cytuno ar y geiriad yr oeddem am ei gael sy'n egluro y cawn gymal galluogi fel y gall y Cynulliad benderfynu ar yr hyn a ddigwydd ynghylch ysmegu mewn manau cyhoeddus. Datganolir hynny i ni, gan gymryd y caiff Llafur ei ailethol. Mae hwnnw hefyd yn fater o gryn sylwedd inni ei drafod y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Michael German:** Gobeithiaf y cawn yr arweiniad clir yr ydych newydd ei fynegi

expressed in that you think we need an amendment to the Government of Wales Act 1998. Can you tell us—at last—whether or not you will be campaigning for primary legislative powers for the National Assembly, so that the seven Bills put forward and approved in March 2004 could be passed. There is no reason why we could not have that number of Bills in one year. Surely, First Minister, the present legislative log-jam means that Wales is waiting. Just as we have heard about the waiting lists, we have to wait for this Queen's Speech. We are still waiting for action on the housing crisis, on which you put forward a Bill. We are waiting for action on real powers for local councils, action to boost tourism in Wales, and action to help the elderly—all of which you have put forward for Bills. Why are we always waiting for these measures in Wales, when we could do them properly? If you were to give us that leadership, we could have the same power as they have in Scotland to pass these Bills in the year that you want them. It is not as if it is all our programme. It is your programme that we are talking about. Will you give us that leadership?

**The First Minister:** You underestimate what has been achieved in today's Queen's Speech. There are two Wales-only bills which, hopefully, will be passed in normal form, over the next four or five months. Only one is mentioned in the speech, but there are always a few which are not mentioned, as this would overload the speech. In addition, there are 11 Welsh powers contained in the other Bills. Clearly, the 26 other Bills mentioned for this session will not all get through. They will be lucky to get half of those through in a short session. However, 11 have Welsh provisions within the England and Wales, United Kingdom or Great Britain provision.

Therefore, there is a great deal of additional Welsh material. It is not always just about Wales-only Bills. The smoking measure is of enormous import to the relationship between citizens and the health service in Wales, and

wrth ddweud eich bod yn credu bod angen diwygio Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. A allwch ddweud wrthym—o'r diwedd—a fyddwch yn ymgyrchu dros gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, fel y gellid derbyn y saith Mesur a gyflwynwyd ac a gymeradwywyd ym Mawrth 2004. Nid oes unrhyw reswm pam na allem gael nifer felly o Fesurau mewn un flwyddyn. Yn sicr, Brif Weinidog, mae'r dagfa ddeddfu bresennol yn golygu bod Cymru'n gorfod disgwyl. Yn union fel y rhestrau aros y clywsom amdanynt, rhaid i ni ddisgwyl am yr araith hon gan y Frenhines. Yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl am weithredu ynghylch yr argyfwng tai, sef y mater y rhoesoch Fesur gerbron yn ei gylch. Yr ydym yn disgwyl camau i gael pwerau go iawn i gynghorau lleol, camau i hybu twristiaeth yng Nghymru, a champau i helpu'r henoed—y rhoesoch Fesurau gerbron i ymdrin â hwy bob un. Pam yr ydym bob amser yn gorfod disgwyl am y mesurau hyn yng Nghymru, pan y gallem ni eu trafod yn iawn? Pe rhoddech arweiniad o'r fath i ni, caem yr un pŵer ag sydd ganddynt yn yr Alban i dderbyn y Mesurau hyn yn y flwyddyn yr ydych yn eu dymuno. Nid ein rhaglen ni'n unig ydyw hon, wedi'r cwbl. Eich rhaglen chi yr ydym yn sôn amdani. A wnewch gynnig arweiniad o'r fath i ni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn bychanu'r hyn a gyflawnwyd yn Araith y Frenhines heddiw. Mae dau Fesur i Gymru'n unig, a gaiff eu derbyn yn y modd arferol, gobeithio, dros y pedwar neu bum mis nesaf. Dim ond un y cyfeirir ato yn yr araith, ond mae bob amser rai nad oes sôn amdanynt, gan y byddai gormod i'w gynnwys yn yr araith fel arall. Ar ben hynny, ceir 11 o bwerau i Gymru yn y Mesurau eraill. Wrth gwrs, ni fydd pob un o'r 26 o Fesurau eraill a grybwyllwyd ar gyfer y sesiwn hwn yn mynd drwodd. Gwnânt yn dda i gael eu hanner drwodd mewn sesiwn byr. Fodd bynnag, mae 11 yn cynnwys darpariaethau i Gymru o fewn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr, y Deyrnas Unedig neu Brydain Fawr.

Gan hynny, mae llawer iawn o ddeunydd ychwanegol i Gymru. Nid Mesurau i Gymru'n unig yw'r cwbl sydd dan sylw. Mae'r mesur sy'n ymwneud ag ysmegu yn un sydd o bwys aruthrol i'r berthynas rhwng

how people try to participate more in controlling and improving their own health. This will not be in a Wales-only Bill, but in an England and Wales Bill with a clause enabling the Assembly to determine for the people of Wales what we do about smoking in public places.

If this is passed—if Labour wins the election—it will be a big issue. We should not become obsessed only with Wales-only Bills in primary legislation, when enabling clauses can also bring forward matters which the general public will consider as hugely important.

**Michael German:** I seek your confirmation, First Minister, that you believe that the Bills that you have put forward could and should be put forward promptly. We know that we have had to wait for the Transport (Wales) Bill, which should be announced today. It has been the third time of asking, and it was so out of date when the White Paper was produced that it had to be withdrawn and rewritten. You have also asked for a tidying-up exercise in relation to ELWa and the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. You asked in March for this to be tidied-up, and asked Parliament to assist you in dealing with that. By July, you wanted to abolish ELWa, so the need disappeared. Why can you not see that the programme that you put forward last March could be done by the National Assembly? With clear leadership from you, we could do that job. Will you tell us now whether or not you will be campaigning within your party so that we will get that primary legislative power as you described in your Bills in March?

**The First Minister:** Indeed. As a party, on the assumption that Labour wins a third successive term—which is a big ask—we have committed to produce a White Paper soon after the election, which will describe two possible routes to enhance the legislative powers of this Assembly. One of those may involve no implementation until 2011 and will be subject to a referendum, and will involve the Scottish-type powers that you

dinasyddion a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, a'r modd y mae pobl yn ceisio cymryd rhan mwy wrth reoli a gwella eu hiechyd eu hunain. Nid Mesur i Gymru'n unig fydd hwnnw, ond un ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr ac ynddo gymal i alluogi'r Cynulliad i benderfynu dros bobl Cymru yr hyn a wnawn ynghylch ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus.

Os caiff hynny ei dderbyn—os gwnaiff Llafur ennill yr etholiad—bydd yn fater pwysig. Ni ddylem ymboeni'n ormodol ynghylch Mesurau i Gymru'n unig mewn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, gan fod cymalau galluogi hefyd yn fodd i hyrwyddo materion y bydd y cyhoedd yn eu hystyried yn dra phwysig.

**Michael German:** Ceisiaf gadarnhad gennyhych, Brif Weinidog, y credwch y gellid ac y dylid cyflwyno'r Mesurau a roesoch gerbron yn fuan. Gwyddom ein bod wedi gorfod disgwyl am Fesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru), a ddylai gael ei gyhoeddi heddiw. Dyma'r trydydd tro inni ofyn amdano, ac yr oedd mor ddyddiedig erbyn llunio'r Papur Gwyn fel y bu'n rhaid ei dynnu'n ôl a'i ailysgrifennu. Yr ydych hefyd wedi gofyn am waith tacluso mewn cysylltiad ag ELWa a Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru. Gofynasoch am dacluso hynny ym mis Mawrth, a gofynasoch i'r Senedd eich helpu i ymdrin â hynny. Erbyn mis Gorffennaf, yr oeddech am ddiddymu ELWa, felly yr oedd yr angen wedi diflannu. Sut na welwch y byddai modd i'r rhaglen a gyflwynasoch fis Mawrth diwethaf gael ei chyflawni gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? O gael arweiniad pendant gennyhych chi, gallem wneud y gwaith hwnnw. A wnewch ddweud wrthym yn awr a fyddwch yn ymgyrchu o fewn eich plaid fel y cawn y pŵer deddfu sylfaenol hwnnw a ddisgrifiasoch yn eich Mesurau ym mis Mawrth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir. Fel plaid, gan gymryd y bydd Llafur yn ennill trydydd tymor yn olynol—sy'n gryn dasg—yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i gynhyrchu Papur Gwyn yn fuan ar ôl yr etholiad, a fydd yn disgrifio dwy ffordd bosibl i wella pwerau deddfu'r Cynulliad hwn. Mae un ohonynt na cheir gweithredu arni tan 2011, o bosibl, a bydd yn amodol ar refferendwm, ac yn cynnwys pwerau fel y rhai a geir yn yr Alban y

have mentioned, namely unrestricted primary legislative powers in the devolved areas. We believe that the second route can be achieved by 2007. I tend to favour that route, as we can have access to enhanced legislative powers, if not the full Scottish model, four years earlier.

cyfeiriasoch atynt, sef pwerau deddfu sylfaenol digyfyngiad yn y meysydd a ddatganolwyd. Credwn y gellir cyflawni yr ail ffordd erbyn 2007. Yr wyf yn tueddu i ffafrio'r ffordd honno, gan y cawn fynediad at well pwerau deddfu, os nad y cwbl a geir yn yr Alban, bedair blynedd yn gynharach.

### **Y Mesur Iechyd Meddwl Drafft The Draft Mental Health Bill**

**Q6 David Melding:** Has the First Minister's administration responded to the consultation on the draft Mental Health Bill? (OAQ39638)

**C6 David Melding:** A yw gweinyddiaeth Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad ar y Mesur Iechyd Meddwl drafft? (OAQ39638)

**The First Minister:** The Minister for Health and Social Services made a written submission to the joint House of Commons and House of Lords scrutiny committee on 1 November. That response conveyed her views on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government and also reflected the views of stakeholders. I understand that the Minister will give evidence to that joint-committee on 15 December, and I believe that you have also been invited to do so as Chair of the Health and Social Services Committee.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyflwynodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol sylwadau ysgrifenedig i gyd-bwyllgor craffu Tŷ'r Cyffredin a Thŷ'r Arglwyddi ar 1 Tachwedd. Yr oedd yr ymateb hwnnw'n cyfleu ei barn ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a hefyd yn adlewyrchu barn rhanddeiliaid. Deallaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi tystiolaeth i'r cyd-bwyllgor hwnnw ar 15 Rhagfyr, a chredaf eich bod chithau wedi cael gwahoddiad i wneud hynny fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

**David Melding:** Do you share the view of many Assembly Members and many mental health community representatives that any change in the law should be driven by the need for therapy and the right to treatment, and should be light on the necessary coercive elements that must be available in law to us? The draft Bill does not currently meet those criteria.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn rhannu barn llawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad a llawer o gynrychiolwyr y gymuned iechyd meddwl y dylai unrhyw newid i'r gyfraith gael ei ysgogi gan yr angen am therapi a'r hawl i gael triniaeth ac na ddylai roi pwys ar yr elfennau gorfodol angenrheidiol y mae'n rhaid iddynt fod ar gael i ni o dan y gyfraith? Nid yw'r Mesur drafft yn bodloni'r meini prawf hynny ar hyn o bryd.

**The First Minister:** I agree that it is a difficult circle to square. There is a need to protect the public against 'potentially dangerous' and potentially untreatable people with behavioural disorders, such as psychopathic conditions and so on. The detention of such people runs contrary to traditional approaches to mental health, but there is widespread demand to try to ensure that society is protected from such people in advance of them doing anything that their psychopathic condition might drive them to do. How do you do that while also ensuring that you preserve the tradition of treating

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf ei bod yn anodd cysoni'r ddau beth. Mae angen diogelu'r cyhoedd rhag rhai 'a allai fod yn beryglus' ac a allai fod yn amhosibl eu trin gan fod anhwylder ymddygiad arnynt, fel anhwylderau seicopathig ac yn y blaen. Mae cadw pobl o'r fath dan orchymyn yn mynd yn groes i ddulliau traddodiadol o ymdrin ag iechyd meddwl, ond mae llawer o alw am geisio sicrhau y caiff cymdeithas ei diogelu rhag pobl o'r fath cyn iddynt wneud unrhyw beth y gallai eu hanhwylder seicopathig eu gyrru i'w wneud. Sut y gwneir hynny gan sicrhau y cedwir y traddodiad o drin pobl a'u

people and detaining them for that purpose and not for any other reason? It is a difficult issue. I believe that the new draft Bill, which is being considered by the joint committee, is better than the first draft, but may not meet all the objections on the grounds that you have given.

**Kirsty Williams:** I assure you that the new draft Bill is no better than the original that was placed before us. Do you accept that those who suffer from mental illness are much more likely to harm themselves than anyone else? In order to help you square your circle, the Government needs to introduce a criminal justice Bill to deal with the tiny section of the population that may be of danger to other people and to introduce a mental health Bill to treat those who suffer mental illness in a proper, liberal and caring fashion instead of the draconian Bill that is currently before Parliament.

**The First Minister:** You have made some strong points. However, I do not agree that the Bill is not an improvement on the previous draft. People will argue about this until the cows come home, but, when the Government withdrew the original Bill, it took on board that there was massive opposition in the mental health community regarding community psychiatric nurses, psychiatrists and so on. In many ways, the key question that Jane Hutt has put to the joint committee is about manpower and womanpower in that regard. If you are short of psychiatrists—there is a chronic shortage in this country—what is the point of basing a Bill on a *modus operandi* that will call for a considerable increase in the number of psychiatrists? There are considerable implications in terms of staff shortages, and the Government must show how it will solve that problem, otherwise the Bill will not be workable in its current form.

cadw i'r diben hwnnw ac nid am unrhyw reswm arall? Mae'n fater anodd. Credaf fod y Mesur drafft newydd, sy'n cael ei ystyried gan y cyd-bwyllgor, yn well na'r drafft cyntaf, er nad yw efallai'n ateb yr holl wrthwynebiadau a wnaed ar y sail a nodasoch.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau nad yw'r Mesur drafft newydd yn ddim gwell na'r un cyntaf a roddwyd ger ein bron. A ydych yn derbyn bod y rhai sy'n dioddef salwch meddwl yn llawer mwy tebygol o niweidio eu hunain na neb arall? Er mwyn eich helpu i gysoni'r ddau beth, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno Mesur cyfiawnder troseddol i ddelio â'r gyfran fach o'r boblogaeth a allai fod yn berygl i bobl eraill a chyflwyno Mesur iechyd meddwl i drin y rhai sy'n dioddef salwch meddwl mewn modd priodol, rhyddfrydig a gofalgar yn lle'r Mesur didostur sydd gerbron y Senedd ar hyn o bryd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaethoch bwyntiau cryf. Er hynny, ni chytunaf nad yw'r Mesur yn well na'r drafft blaenorol. Bydd pobl yn dadlau am hyn hyd byth, ond, pan wnaeth y Llywodraeth dynnu'n ôl y Mesur gwreiddiol, derbyniodd fod gwrthwynebiad aruthrol ymysg y rhai sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd meddwl mewn cysylltiad â nyrsys seiciatrig cymunedol, seiciatryddion ac yn y blaen. Ar lawer ystyr, mae'r prif gwestiwn a gododd Jane Hutt yn y cyd-bwyllgor yn ymwneud â'r gweithlu a fydd yn ymwneud â hynny. Os oes prinder seiciatryddion—mae prinder ofnadwy yn y wlad hon—i beth y seilir Mesur ar ddull gweithredu a fydd yn galw am gynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y seiciatryddion? Ceir goblygiadau sylweddol o ran prinder staff, a rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ddangos sut y gwnaiff ddatrys y broblem honno neu, fel arall, ni fydd y Mesur yn ymarferol ar ei ffurf bresennol.

### Mesur Hapchwarae The Gambling Bill

**C7 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar oblygiadau'r Mesur Hapchwarae o safbwynt Cymru? (OAQ39650)

**Q7 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the implications of the Gambling Bill for Wales? (OAQ39650)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn yn ystyried goblygiadau'r Mesur Hapchwarae yng Nghymru yn ofalus iawn wrth iddo deithio drwy brosesau deddfwriaethol y Senedd.

**David Lloyd:** A gytnwch â Peter Hain, Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, pan ddywedodd y byddai mynychu 'mega casino' yn gyfle gwych i'r teulu gael diwrnod gogoneddus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Clywais dros ginio iddo ddweud hynny. Mae ei ddisgrifiad yn fater personol. Nid oes gennyf brofiad o'r fath leoedd. Bu imi ymweld â Las Vegas am bedair awr pan yn fyfyrwr, ond ni fûm mewn casino. Yr oeddwn yn cerdded ar hyd y strydoedd ac yr oedd hi'n boeth iawn, ond nid oedd y casinos ar agor yn ystod y dydd. Mae'n bwysig nad yw pobl yn cynhyrfu ynglŷn ag ail ddrafft y Mesur y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon wedi ei gyhoeddi yn dilyn gwrthwynebiad i'r drafft cyntaf, sy'n gostwng y nifer amcangyfrifedig o'r 'mega casinos' hyn. Os agorir wyth ohonynt fel rhan o'r cynllun peilot, efallai y bydd un yng Nghymru os bydd unrhyw awdurdod lleol yn croesawu cael un yn ei ardal. Deallaf fod Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn awyddus i weld un yn agor yn yr ardal, a fydd yn allwedd i ddatgloi y posibilrwydd o gael pentref chwaraeon rhyngwladol rhyw ddwy filltir i'r gorllewin o'r fan hon.

**Lorraine Barrett:** If a mega casino were to come to Wales, will you give an assurance that you will speak to the various trade unions, as I have, to ensure that the employees of the proposed mega casinos get the best deal possible, within the terms and conditions of their employment?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that you raised this matter, Lorraine, partly because your constituency is the likeliest location for a mega casino, if we are right to assume that the new administration in Cardiff is as keen as the previous administration on seeing a mega casino as the key to unlocking the potential of an international sports village. The casino would help to generate trade and subsidise some of the loss-making facilities

**The First Minister:** We will carefully consider the implications of the Gambling Bill in Wales at it makes its passage through Parliament.

**David Lloyd:** Do you agree with Peter Hain, the Secretary of State for Wales, who claimed that visiting a mega casino would be a great opportunity for families to have a wonderful day out?

**The First Minister:** I heard over lunch that he had said that. His description is a personal matter. I have no experience of such places. I visited Las Vegas for four hours as a student, but I did not visit a casino. I walked the streets and it was very hot, but the casinos were not open during the day. It is important that people do not panic about the second draft of the Bill published by the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport following opposition to the first draft, which will limit the estimated number of mega casinos to be opened. If eight are opened as part of the pilot scheme, perhaps one will be in Wales if a local authority chooses to welcome one to its area. I understand that Cardiff County Council is eager to see one opening in its area, which will be vital in unlocking the vision of establishing an international sports village some two miles to the west of here.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Os ceid casino mawr yng Nghymru, a wnewch roi sicrwydd y siaradwch â'r gwahanol undebau llafur, fel y gwneuthum i, i sicrhau y bydd gweithwyr y casinos mawr arfaethedig yn cael y fargen orau posibl, o dan amodau a thelerau eu cyflogaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn, Lorraine, a hynny'n rhannol am mai yn eich etholaeth chi y mae casino mawr yn fwyaf tebygol o gael ei leoli, os ydym yn iawn wrth gymryd bod y weinyddiaeth newydd yng Nghaerdydd mor awyddus â'r un flaenorol i weld casino mawr fel yr allwedd i ddatblygu'r potensial o gael pentref chwaraeon rhyngwladol. Byddai'r casino o gymorth i greu masnach ac yn

and would be a replacement for the Empire pool and so on. I have seen figures for mega casinos that imply that they could employ anything from 400 to over 1,000 people, and we would want to be certain that they were protected properly as employees, with proper representation. We do not want a casual army of people drifting in and out for an hour here and there—they must be properly employed people.

**Jenny Randerson:** You rightly point out that there is planning permission for one such mega casino, as part of the sports village that was instigated by the previous Labour administration in Cardiff. However, you will know that the UK Government's proposal is to deny local government a role in licensing super casinos. Will you give a commitment that you will fight for the legislation to include the devolution of powers to Wales, so that we can have a separate system that will allow local residents a voice and allow a key role for local authorities to decide whether they want mega casinos?

**The First Minister:** There are several issues here. One is whether Parliament will give its consent to mega casinos at all and, if so, would it be done on the basis of a pilot group of eight casinos, as we are now given to understand. Would that get through Parliament? Secondly, we, as an Assembly, would then have to decide whether a mega casino was a special-use category, which would require an amendment to our planning regulations. That would come before us. Thirdly, Carwyn Jones would have the job of determining whether a mega casino application should be called in, and whether it contravened an urban development plan. Finally, it would be up to the local authority, because frequently authorities will be the landlord.

I am not sure what you were trying to say in your preamble about planning permission, because Labour is no longer in charge of Cardiff County Council; another party is in charge, and it will have to make up its mind. We understand that the new council has not changed the policy, and that it also sees the mega casino as something that could be at the heart of the attempt to unlock the potential of

sybsideiddio rhai o'r cyfleusterau sy'n gwneud colled a chymerai le pwll nofio'r Empire ac yn y blaen. Gwelais ffigurau am gasinos mawr sy'n awgrymu y gallent gynnig gwaith i nifer o tua 400 i fwy na 1,000, a byddem am fod yn sicr y caent eu diogelu'n iawn fel gweithwyr, a bod ganddynt gynrychiolaeth iawn. Nid ydym am weld llu o weithwyr achlysurol yn mynd a dod gan weithio awr yma ac acw—rhaid iddynt fod yn weithwyr a gyflogir mewn modd priodol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Fel y nodasoch, mae caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer un casino mawr o'r fath, i fod yn rhan o'r pentref chwaraeon a gymhellwyd gan y weinyddiaeth Lafur flaenorol yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, gwyddoch mai bwriad Llywodraeth y DU yw gwrthod rôl i lywodraeth leol wrth drwyddedu casinos mawr. A wnewch ymrwymo i ymladd i beri y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth yn cynnwys datganoli pwerau i Gymru, fel y gallwn gael system ar wahân a fydd yn rhoi llais i drigolion lleol ac yn cynnig rôl allweddol i awdurdodau lleol gael penderfynu a ydynt am gael casinos mawr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae sawl mater yn codi yn hyn o beth. Un ohonynt yw a fydd y Senedd yn caniatáu casinos mawr o gwbl ac, os bydd, a wneid hynny ar yr amod y ceid grŵp rhagbrofol o wyth casino, fel yr ydym wedi'i gael ar ddeall yn awr. A gâi hynny ei dderbyn gan y Senedd? Yn ail, byddem ni, fel Cynulliad, yn gorfod penderfynu wedyn a oedd casinos mawr yn ddosbarth defnydd arbennig, fel y byddai'n rhaid newid ein rheoliadau cynllunio. Deuai hynny ger ein bron. Yn drydydd, câi Carwyn Jones y gwaith o benderfynu a ddylid galw i mewn cais am gasino mawr, ac a oedd yn groes i gynllun datblygu trefol. Yn olaf, mater i'r awdurdod lleol fyddai hyn, gan mai awdurdodau fydd y landlord mewn llawer achos.

Nid wyf yn sicr beth a oedd gennych dan sylw wrth sôn am ganiatâd cynllunio yn eich rhagymadrodd, gan nad Llafur sydd wrth y llyw bellach yng Nghyngor Sir Caerdydd; plaid arall sydd wrth y llyw, a byddai'n gorfod penderfynu. Deallwn nad yw'r cyngor newydd wedi newid y polisi, a'i fod hefyd yn ystyried y casino mawr yn rhywbeth a allai fod yn ganolog i'r ymgais i ddatblygu

an international sports village. In the end, it is up to the local authority. If it owns the land, it must decide whether it wants to sell the land, how much it would get for the land, and to what extent that would unlock local potential. If I may put it like this—excuse the pun—is it worth the gamble?

potensial pentref chwaraeon rhyngwladol. Yn y pen draw, mater i'r awdurdod lleol ydyw. Os mai ef sydd biau'r tir, rhaid iddo benderfynu a yw am werthu'r tir, pa swm a gâi am y tir, ac i ba raddau y byddai hynny'n datblygu potensial yr ardal. Os caf ei roi fel hyn—maddeuwch y mwysair—a yw'n werth mentro?

### **Fframwaith Arfaethedig ar gyfer Deddfwriaeth y Cynulliad Proposed Framework for Legislation for the Assembly**

**Q8 Jocelyn Davies:** What discussions has the First Minister held with his colleagues at Westminster regarding the practicality of his proposed framework for legislation for the Assembly, drawing on section 13.2 of the Richard commission report, 13.2 plus? (OAQ39651)

**C8 Jocelyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cynnal â'i gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch pa mor ymarferol yw ei fframwaith arfaethedig ar gyfer deddfwriaeth y Cynulliad, gan weithio ar sail adran 13.2 o adroddiad comisiwn Richard, 13.2 a mwy? (OAQ39651)

**The First Minister:** In all the discussions that I have had with colleagues in Westminster and in Whitehall, no-one has raised any objections on the grounds of practicality.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn yr holl drafodaethau a gefais gyda'm cymheiriaid yn San Steffan ac yn Whitehall, nid oes neb wedi gwrthwynebu ar sail ymarferoldeb.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Many people have described 13.2 plus as unworkable, or a ridiculous compromise. Will you assure us today that Peter Hain and Westminster officials fully support your plan?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae llawer o bobl wedi dweud nad yw dull 13.2 a mwy yn ymarferol, neu wedi'i alw'n gyfaddawd chwerthinllyd. A wnewch ein sicrhau heddiw fod Peter Hain a swyddogion yn San Steffan yn llwyr gefnogi'ch cynllun?

**The First Minister:** That is a slightly different matter. You asked whether there were any objections on the grounds of practicality, and I said that none have been uncovered so far. We are proceeding on the grounds that the Labour Party conference made a decision on the basis of the Labour Party consultation. Work on preparing the White Paper is now proceeding in Westminster and Whitehall so that it can be published, incorporating a dramatic change after a referendum or a more evolutionary approach without a referendum, which would perhaps be available four years earlier than full primary powers. People have sometimes referred to that as 13.2 plus. That will be in the White Paper. There will then be six months of consultation, and a final decision will be made around October 2005.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r mater hwnnw braidd yn wahanol. Gofynasoch a fu unrhyw wrthwynebiadau ar sail ymarferoldeb, a dywedais na chafwyd yr un hyd yma. Yr ydym yn mynd rhagom ar y sail bod cynhadledd y Blaid Lafur wedi gwneud penderfyniad yng ngoleuni'r ymgyngori gan y Blaid Lafur. Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo'n awr ar baratoi'r Papur Gwyn yn San Steffan ac yn Whitehall fel y gellir ei gyhoeddi, a bydd yn cynnwys newid sylweddol ar ôl refferendwm neu ddull gweithredu mwy graddol heb refferendwm, a allai fod ar gael bedair blynedd yn gynharach na phwerau sylfaenol llawn. Y mae rhai wedi galw hynny o bryd i'w gilydd yn ddull 13.2 a mwy. Bydd hynny yn y Papur Gwyn. Wedyn ceir chwe mis o ymgyngori, a gwneir penderfyniad terfynol tua mis Hydref 2005.

### **Trafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Discussions with the Secretary of State**



**C9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y trafodaethau y bydd yn eu cynnal â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol cyn araith nesaf y Frenhines yn Senedd y Deyrnas Unedig? (OAQ39652)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cymeraf mai nid yr araith nesaf ond Araith y Frenhines a fu dair neu bedair awr yn ôl yr ydym yn sôn amdani. Gan ddilyn penderfyniad y Cynulliad a fabwysiadwyd fis Mawrth diwethaf, yr wyf wedi cynnal nifer o drafodaethau o'r fath. Mae dau o'r Mesurau y gofynasom amdanynt wedi eu cynnwys yn yr araith a draddodwyd am 11.20 a.m..

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi dweud yn y gorffennol mai'r opsiwn a ffafrywyd ganddo yw rhoi pwerau deddfu llawn i'r Cynulliad, a ydyw'n gallu rhoi awgrym inni ym mha Araith y Frenhines, ym mha flwyddyn, y cynhwysir Mesur i roi'r pwerau hyn i'r Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ystyried hyn o safbwynt cyfreithiol cul, dim ond Senedd San Steffan, yn ôl y diffiniad arferol, sydd â phwerau deddfu llawn. Nid oes gan Senedd yr Alban hyd yn oed, ar un ystyr, bwerau deddfu llawn, ond yn hytrach maent yn rhai eilaidd. Nid ystod y pwerau sy'n bwysig, ond pa mor berthnasol y maent. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod yn trafod, yng nghyd-destun refferendwm, gweithredu'n debycach i'r Alban. Mae'n haws trafod y mater drwy ddefnyddio cymhariaeth gyda'r Alban neu gyda chyfundrefn arall gan ei bod yn helpu pobl i ddeall y sefyllfa'n well. Gallwn hefyd gael trefniant y byddai modd i ni weithredu yn y Cynulliad nesaf o 2007 ymlaen, a fyddai'n llai dramatig, ond yn tyfu'n fwy naturiol o'n pwerau deddfwriaethol presennol.

### **Adleoli Milwyr Cymreig yn Irac The Redeployment of Welsh Soldiers in Iraq**

**C10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa sylwadau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cyflwyno i'w gydweithwyr yn San Steffan ynghylch adleoli milwyr Cymreig yn Irac? (OAQ39648)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi cynnal

**Q9 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on his discussions with the Secretary of State ahead of the next Queen's Speech in the UK Parliament? (OAQ39652)

**The First Minister:** I take it that we are not talking about the next Queen's Speech, but the one that was made three or four hours ago. Following the Assembly's resolution, which was adopted last March, I have had several such discussions. Two of the Bills that we sought have been included in the speech that was delivered at 11.20 a.m..

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Given that the First Minister has previously stated that his preferred option would be to give the Assembly full law-making powers, can he give us some idea which Queen's Speech, in which year, will include a Bill to give the Assembly these powers?

**The First Minister:** In a narrow legal sense, only the Westminster Parliament, according to the usual definition, has full law-making powers. Even the Scottish Parliament, in one sense, does not have full law-making powers, but rather secondary powers. The relevance of the powers that we have is the important factor, rather than their extent. That is why we have been discussing, in the context of a referendum, moving towards the Scottish model. It is easier to discuss the issue by using a comparison with Scotland or other administrations as it aids people's understanding. We could also opt for a system that we could implement in the next Assembly from 2007, which would be less dramatic, but which would evolve more naturally from our current legislative powers.

**Q10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What representations has the First Minister made to colleagues at Westminster regarding the redeployment of Welsh soldiers in Iraq? (OAQ39648)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any

trafodaethau penodol ar y mater hwn gyda chydweithwyr yn San Steffan. Mae'r Queen's Dragoon Guards, neu'r Welsh Cavalry fel y'u gelwir, yn recriwtio nifer o filwyr o Gymru. Mae rhai o'r milwyr yn rhan o grŵp y Black Watch sydd yng nghanol Irac ar hyn o bryd. Dymunwn yn dda iddynt gan obeithio'u gweld yn dychwelyd yn ddiogel i Gymru ar ddiwedd eu cyfnod yno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried y pryder am filwyr o Gymru yn Irac, onid yw'n gyfrifoldeb arnoch fel Prif Weinidog i gynnal y trafodaethau hynny? A ydych wedi llunio barn erbyn hyn am y rhyfel hwn gydag Irac? Clywsom mai'r rheswm dros y rhyfel oedd arfau dinistriol nas canfuwyd. A ydych bellach yn derbyn mai camgymeriad oedd y rhyfel hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pan fydd dynion neu fenywod yn ymuno â'r lluoedd arfog, maent yn ymwybodol o'r posibilrwydd y cânt eu hanfon i fannau lle byddant mewn perygl. Pan fyddwn yn sôn am gatradd o Gymru neu lu sy'n recriwtio nifer o bobl o Gymru, yr ydym, wrth gwrs, yn gobeithio y dônt yn ôl yn ddiogel. Dyna'r peth pwysig. Derbyniwn fod milwyr yn wynebu perygl wrth fynd i fannau penodol, ond mae hwn yn risg sy'n berthnasol i bawb sy'n ymuno â'r lluoedd arfog. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Welsh Cavalry yn dychwelyd yn ddiogel o Irac cyn bo hir.

**Glyn Davies:** In any discussions on this issue with Westminster, have you expressed our total admiration for, and appreciation of, the young soldiers and military personnel who make a huge commitment, which sometimes involves loss of life, on our behalf?

**The First Minister:** The risk is implicit in everything that the armed forces do. Several Welsh soldiers have lost their lives, and the military police have lost almost six of their Welsh personnel in Iraq. However, this is no different to the loss of life elsewhere. It is immensely painful for communities and, above all, for families. The loss of life is a matter of immense sadness, even though the soldiers signed up to the risk. Territorial Army personnel are also on duty in Iraq, and among them are some of the Assembly's civil servants. In all cases, we are confident that

specific discussions on this matter with Westminster colleagues. The Queen's Dragoon Guards, or the Welsh Cavalry as they are known, draws a number of its recruits from Wales. Some of the guards are part of the Black Watch battle group currently deployed in central Iraq. We wish them well and hope to see them return safely to Wales at the end of their deployment.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given the concern about Welsh soldiers in Iraq, do you not consider it your duty, as First Minister, to hold those discussions? Have you now formed an opinion on the war in Iraq? We were told that the reason for going to war was the weapons of mass destruction that have not been found. Do you now accept that the war was a mistake?

**The First Minister:** When you join the armed forces, you are fully aware of the fact that you may be deployed to danger zones. When we talk about Welsh soldiers or a regiment that recruits a large number of personnel from Wales, we, of course, hope that they will all return safely. That is what is important. We recognise that soldiers face dangerous situations, but this is a risk accepted by all those who join the armed forces. We very much hope that the Welsh Cavalry returns safely from Iraq before too long.

**Glyn Davies:** Mewn unrhyw drafodaethau a gawsoch ar y mater hwn gyda San Steffan, a ydych wedi mynegi ein hedmygedd llwyr a'n gwerthfawrogiad o'r milwyr ifanc a'r staff milwrol sy'n gwneud ymrwymiad aruthrol, sydd weithiau'n golygu colli einioes, ar ein rhan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae perygl ynghlwm wrth bopeth a wnaiff y lluoedd arfog. Mae sawl milwr o Gymru wedi colli ei fywyd, ac mae'r heddlu milwrol wedi colli bron chwech o'u staff o Gymru yn Irac. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn yn wahanol i golli bywyd mewn mannau eraill. Mae'n peri gofid enbyd i gymunedau ac, yn fwy na neb, i deuluoedd. Mae colli bywyd yn destun tristwch mawr, er bod y milwyr yn deall bod perygl. Mae staff y Fyddin Dirigaethol ar ddyletswydd yn Irac hefyd, ac mae rhai o weision sifil y Cynulliad yn eu mysg. Ym mhob achos, yr ydym yn

they will conduct themselves honourably, and we wish them all a safe return.

hyderus y byddant yn ymddwyn yn anrhydeddus, a dymunwn ddychweliad diogel iddynt oll.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I have changes to report to this week's business. The motion to approve the Food (Pistachios from Iran) (Emergency Control) (Wales) Order has been withdrawn, as has tomorrow's motion to debate the second offer scheme.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae gennyf newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Bwyd (Cnau Pistasio o Iran) (Rheolaeth Frys) (Cymru) wedi'i dynnu'n ôl, fel y mae'r cynnig yfory i gael dadl ar gynllun yr ail gynnig.

2.50 p.m.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb, under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, it has been determined under Standing Order No. 24.6 that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the General Teaching Council for Wales (Additional Functions) (Amendment) Order 2005, the General Teaching Council for Wales (Functions) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, the Education (Information About Individual Pupils) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 and the Products of Animal Origin (Third Country Imports) (Wales) Regulations 2005.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi ar y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr, o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, penderfynwyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6 nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Gorchymyn Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau Ychwanegol) (Diwygio) 2005, Rheoliadau Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru (Swyddogaethau) (Diwygio) 2005, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwybodaeth am Ddisgyblion Unigol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 a Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion sy'n Tarddu o Anifeiliaid (Mewnforion Trydydd Gwledydd) (Cymru) 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 Aelod yn ei wrthwynebu. Galwaf felly ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that at least 10 Members object to it. I therefore call the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly adopts the business statement.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi gofyn am ddadl ar y gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru. Mae angen dadl ar hyn yn y Siambr. Mae cydnabyddiaeth bod pobl sydd

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You will be aware that we have asked for a debate on mental health services in Wales. We need a debate on this in the Chamber. It is recognised that people suffering from mental health problems

yn dioddef o broblemau iechyd meddwl yn cael eu hunain mewn sefyllfa lle mae eu hawliau sylfaenol yn aml yn cael eu tanseilio, a hyd yn oed pan fyddant yn derbyn triniaeth, mae eu dymuniadau fel unigolion yn aml yn cael eu hanwybyddu'n llwyr.

find themselves in a position where their fundamental rights are frequently undermined, and even when they receive treatment, their wishes as individuals are often ignored.

Mae hefyd bryder mawr ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth sydd yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer plant sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Mae adroddiadau yn datgan mai'r cyfan y mae plant a phobl ifanc yn ei dderbyn yn aml yw cyffuriau i'w tawelu yn hytrach na'r gwasanaeth sydd ei angen arnynt. A wneuch ymrwymo i ddadl ar y pwnc pwysig hwn?

There is also great concern regarding the service provided for children with mental health problems. Reports tell us that, often, all these children and young people receive are drugs to calm them down instead of the service that they need. Will you commit to a debate on this important subject?

Bu ichi gyhoeddi yr wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn cael dadl ar gynllun yr ail gynnig i bobl sydd ar restrau aros am dros 18 mis. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn dweud wrthym bob wythnos fod hyn yn newyddion da i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Pam, felly, ydych wedi tynnu'r ddadl honno o agenda yfory? Byddwn yn trafod ein hamserlen o ran y pwyllgorau pwnc ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf yn hytrach na'r pwnc hollbwysig hwn, sydd yn newyddion da i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, yn ôl y Prif Weinidog. A yw hyn yn golygu na chredwch fod newyddion da i'w dweud am y cynllun ail gynnig hwn bellach? Yr wyf yn cael ar ddeall mai eich rhesymeg yw, gan fod ein dadl plaid leiafrifol y prynhawn yma ar iechyd, ni ddylai'r amserlen am y ddau ddiwrnod nesaf gynnwys eitem arall ar iechyd. A yw'n bolisi newydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i beidio â chynnwys eitem arall yn yr amserlen ar bwnc penodol, bob tro y mae'r gwrthbleidiau yn cynnig dadl ar y pwnc hwnnw?

You announced last week that we will have a debate on the second offer scheme for those people who are on a waiting list for more than 18 months. The First Minister tells us week in, week out that this is good news for the health service in Wales. Why have you therefore pulled that debate from tomorrow's agenda? We are to discuss our subject committee timetable for the next six months instead of this important subject, which, according to the First Minister, is good news for the health service. Does this mean that you no longer believe that there is any good news to be reported on this second offer scheme? I understand that your reasoning is that, because our minority party debate this afternoon is on health, the timetable for the next two days should not include another item on health. Is it a new Government of Wales policy that every time opposition parties propose a debate, no other item on the subject of that debate will be tabled for that week?

**David Melding:** I also find it strange that you have pulled the debate on the second offer scheme. I am slightly relieved that it will be rescheduled, so that we will at least have an opportunity, albeit a postponed opportunity, to discuss this issue. The methodology that you have followed is bizarre, and certainly not original. It is a curious decision and, if this is the way in which you are going to behave in future, that needs to be clarified, because this has a whiff of the vindictive about it.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf finnau'n ei chael braidd yn rhyfedd eich bod wedi dileu'r ddadl ar gynllun yr ail gynnig. Yr wyf ychydig yn llawenach o gael gwybod y caiff ei hailamserlennu, fel y cawn gyfle o leiaf, er mai un a ohiriwyd ydyw, i drafod y pwnc hwn. Mae'ch dull o weithredu'n un rhyfedd, ac nid yw'n wreiddiol, yn sicr. Mae'n benderfyniad rhyfedd ac, os mai fel hyn y byddwch yn ymddwyn yn y dyfodol, rhaid egluro hynny, gan fod naws ddialgar i hyn.

I welcome the fact that you have responded to our request to schedule a debate on mental

Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod wedi ymateb i'n cais am amserlennu dadl ar wasanaethau

health services. That is your 'good cop' side, and I am grateful for it. However, I am disappointed, if not surprised, that you will not schedule a statement on the costs of the new Assembly building. These costs have spiralled faster under your Government than NHS waiting lists, which is quite an achievement. The public deserves a public explanation.

**Kirsty Williams:** I do not share David Melding's curiosity as to why the Government decided yesterday to delay the debate on the second offer scheme. The reason is obvious. Why would you want your Minister for Health and Social Services slammed two days in a row? Undoubtedly, that is what will happen when the figures for the second offer scheme are revealed. Holding off that debate until January will not spare the Government's blushes.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that a statement in the Chamber on creative industries is important. Members need the opportunity to question the Minister on that issue. I also ask the Business Minister to reconsider the Welsh Liberal Democrats' request for an oral statement on the relocation of Welsh Assembly Government offices. A written statement was quietly released last week, but it has caused huge disquiet among staff in the existing offices. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believed that the purpose of the policy was to move jobs out of Cardiff, not to move rural jobs from Llandrindod Wells and Newtown to Aberystwyth, or jobs from around north Wales to the new north Wales office. The sooner the Minister clarifies that situation, the better.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** Rhodri Glyn, you will no doubt be pleased that I have discussed your request for a debate on mental health with the Minister for Health and Social Services, and she has agreed to a debate on that issue when time can be found for it. I will let you know the date next week. I am sure that the issue that you highlighted relating to children will be a part of that debate. On the second offer scheme, I informed Rhodri and David in the

iechyd meddwl. Yr agwedd fwy ar eich cymeriad yw hynny, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar amdani. Er hynny, yr wyf wedi fy siomi, er nad fy synnu, na wnewch amserlennu datganiad ar gostau adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Mae'r costau hyn wedi codi'n gynt o dan eich Llywodraeth na rhestrau aros y GIG, ac mae hynny'n gryn gamp. Mae'r cyhoedd yn haeddu cael eglurhad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn wahanol i David Melding, nid wyf yn chwilfrydig ynghylch y rheswm y penderfynodd y Llywodraeth ddoe y gwnâi ohirio'r ddadl ar gynllun yr ail gynnydd. Mae'r rheswm yn amlwg. Pam y byddech am weld eich Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol o dan y lach ddau ddiwrnod yn olynol? Mae'n sicr mai hynny a ddigwydd pan ddatgelir y ffigurau am gynllun yr ail gynnydd. Ni fydd gohirio'r ddadl honno tan fis Ionawr yn arbed wyneb y Llywodraeth.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn credu ei bod yn bwysig cael datganiad yn y Siambr ar ddiwydiannau creadigol. Rhaid i Aelodau gael cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog ar y pwnc hwnnw. Yr wyf hefyd yn gofyn i'r Trefnydd ailystyried cais Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru am ddatganiad llafar ar ail-leoli swyddfeydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Cyhoeddwyd datganiad ysgrifenedig yn ddisylw'r wythnos diwethaf, ond mae wedi peri anesmwythyd mawr ymysg staff yn y swyddfeydd presennol. Yr oedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn tybio mai diben y polisi oedd symud swyddi o Gaerdydd, nid symud swyddi yng nghefn gwlad o Landrindod a'r Drenewydd i Aberystwyth, neu swyddi o rannau o'r Gogledd i'r swyddfa newydd yn y Gogledd. Gorau po gyntaf y gwnaiff y Gweinidog egluro'r sefyllfa.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Rhodri Glyn, byddwch yn sicr o fod yn falch o glywed fy mod wedi trafod eich cais am ddadl ar iechyd meddwl gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'i bod wedi cytuno i gael dadl ar y pwnc hwnnw pan ellir canfod amser ar ei chyfer. Rhoddaf wybod i chi am y dyddiad yr wythnos nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y mater sy'n ymwneud â phlant y tynasoch sylw ato'n rhan o'r ddadl honno. Ynghylch cynllun yr ail gynnydd,

Business Committee this morning why the Government saw fit not to table a motion on that for tomorrow, and I do not intend to repeat myself. I also said that time would be found early in the new year to debate the scheme, and I will—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Tell us why.’] I will inform the party business managers when the debate will take place next Tuesday.

On the new building, a written statement was issued on 16 November, providing an update on the budgets for the new Assembly building. The Finance Minister will also be taking questions next week on this issue. On creative industries, I said this morning that a written statement had been issued. I believed that that satisfied you. I have not had time to discuss with Andrew Davies whether he wishes to bring the issue to Plenary, but I will do so.

hysbysais Rhodri a David yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma pam yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn gweld yn dda peidio â chyflwyno cynnig ar hynny ar gyfer yfory, ac ni fwriadaf ailadrodd hynny. Dywedais hefyd y canfyddir amser ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd i gael dadl ar y cynllun, a byddaf— [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘Eglurwch y rheswm i ni.’] Rhoddaf wybod i reolwyr busnes y pleidiau pa bryd y cynhelir y ddadl ddydd Mawrth nesaf.

Ynghylch yr adeilad newydd, cyhoeddwyd datganiad ysgrifenedig ar 16 Tachwedd, a roddodd y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cyllidebau ar gyfer adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn ateb cwestiynau ar y mater hwn hefyd yr wythnos nesaf. Ynghylch diwydiannau creadigol, dywedais y bore yma fod datganiad ysgrifenedig wedi'i gyhoeddi. Credais i hynny eich bodloni. Ni chefais gyfle i drafod ag Andrew Davies a yw'n dymuno dwyn y mater hwn gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn, ond gwnaf hynny.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Janet Davies:** My vote was recorded. However, the light started flashing again, just as you closed the vote. [*Interruption.*] It was perfectly all right before you lot messed it up. [*Laughter.*]

**Janet Davies:** Cofnodwyd fy mhleidlais. Fodd bynnag, dechreuodd y golau fflachio eto, fel yr oeddech yn cau'r bleidlais. [*Torri ar draws.*] Yr oedd yn berffaith iawn cyn i'ch criw chi wneud llastr ohono. [*Chwerthin.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Technical attention has been paid to your voting equipment, and it is working properly, as was everyone else's.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhoddwyd sylw technegol i'ch cyfarpar pleidleisio, ac mae'n gweithio'n iawn, fel yr oedd un pawb arall.

### **Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar TB mewn Gwartheg Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report on Bovine TB**

**The Minister for the Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I welcome the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's report of the inquiry into bovine tuberculosis. I am pleased that the committee could achieve cross-party consensus on what is one of the most difficult and contentious animal health problems that we currently face in Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Croesawaf adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar yr ymchwiliad i dwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg. Yr wyf yn falch bod y pwyllgor wedi gallu cael consensws trawsbleidiol ar un o'r problemau mwyaf dyrys a dadleuol sy'n ymwneud ag iechyd anifeiliaid yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd.

3.00 p.m.

The Welsh Assembly Government recognises the need to control the spread of this disease. Earlier this year, public consultation on developing a UK-wide, sustainable TB strategy highlighted the importance of protecting those clean areas of Wales from bovine tuberculosis. Development of the new UK strategy on bovine tuberculosis is underway. It is expected to be published early in 2005. The principles of cost sharing, partnership working, and prevention rather than cure, as set out in the animal health and welfare strategy, will also underpin the TB strategy.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydnabod yr angen i reoli ymlediad y clefyd hwn. Yn gynharach eleni, yn yr ymgynghori cyhoeddus a gafwyd ynghylch datblygu strategaeth gynaliadwy ar TB ar gyfer y DU gyfan, tynnwyd sylw at bwysigrwydd diogelu'r rhannau hynny o Gymru lle na chafwyd achosion o dwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg. Mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu strategaeth newydd y DU ar dwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg yn mynd rhagddo. Disgwylir ei chyhoeddi ar ddechrau 2005. Bydd egwyddorion o ran rhannu costau, gweithio ar y cyd, ac atal yn hytrach na gwella, fel y'u nodir yn y strategaeth ar iechyd a lles anifeiliaid, yn sail i'r strategaeth TB hefyd.

Turning now to the Welsh perspective, Members were, no doubt, pleased to learn from the written statement that I have accepted all of the report's recommendations. Furthermore, I have already acted to implement some of them, for example, by setting up a Wales TB action group, which held its first meeting on 4 November and is keen to progress with advising me on taking forward the report's key recommendations. Membership of the group, which is led by a representative of the State Veterinary Service, provides a genuine balance between industry and wildlife interests.

In preparing this response, I have received input from external organisations, including the farming unions and the Countryside Council for Wales. These organisations, which are represented on the TB action group, have signalled their willingness to work in partnership. They will also be providing advice to support the Assembly Government in taking forward and implementing the majority of the committee's recommendations. My prime concern is to introduce measures that are practical, proportional and sustainable, while taking account of the TB action group's advice.

The State Veterinary Service has a key role to play. Consequently, my officials are involving it closely in the work that needs to be done to implement these recommendations. Under the guidance of the Chief Veterinary Officer for Wales, the service is rolling out a programme of work to tighten the testing regime and reduce the spread of the disease into new areas. These more rigorous measures will also more closely align controls with the relevant European directive governing intra-European-community trade in bovine animals. Now that these short-term measures are being implemented, the State Veterinary Service will be better placed to improve the detection of TB by testing those areas where the disease is established more regularly, giving herd owners more flexibility as to when a test can be done, spending more time tackling the disease, and targeting potential areas of disease before it spreads to other

Gan droi'n awr at yr agwedd Gymreig, mae'n siŵr bod Aelodau'n falch o gael gwybod o'r datganiad ysgrifenedig fy mod wedi derbyn holl argymhellion yr adroddiad. At hynny, yr wyf eisoes wedi cymryd camau i roi rhai ohonynt ar waith, er enghraifft, drwy sefydlu grŵp gweithredu ar TB i Gymru, a gynhaliodd ei gyfarfod cyntaf ar 4 Tachwedd ac sy'n awyddus i wneud cynnydd wrth fy nghynghori ynghylch y modd i hyrwyddo prif argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mae aelodaeth y grŵp, a arweinir gan gynrychiolydd o'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol, yn cynnig gwir gydbwysedd rhwng buddiannau'r diwydiant a rhai sy'n ymwneud â bywyd gwylt.

Wrth baratoi'r ymateb hwn, cefais fewnbn gan gyrff allanol, gan gynnwys undebau'r ffermwyr a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae'r cyrff hyn, a gynrychiolir ar y grŵp gweithredu ar TB, wedi nodi eu bod yn barod i weithio ar y cyd. Byddant hefyd yn cynnig cyngor i helpu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo a gweithredu ar y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor. Yr hyn sydd bwysicaf gennyf yw cyflwyno mesurau sy'n ymarferol, yn gymesur ac yn gynaliadwy, gan ystyried y cyngor a gaf gan y grŵp gweithredu ar TB.

Mae rôl allweddol i'w chwarae gan y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol. O ganlyniad, mae fy swyddogion yn rhoi rhan flaenllaw iddo yn y gwaith y mae'n rhaid ei wneud i roi'r argymhellion hyn ar waith. O dan gyfarwyddyd Prif Swyddog Milfeddygol Cymru, mae'r gwasanaeth yn cyflawni rhaglen waith i dynhau'r trefniadau profi a lleihau ymlediad y clefyd i ardaloedd newydd. Bydd y mesurau llymach hyn yn peri y bydd y rheolaethau hefyd yn fwy cyson â'r gyfarwydddeb Ewropeaidd berthnasol sy'n llywodraethu'r fasnach wartheg oddi mewn i'r gymuned Ewropeaidd. Gan fod y mesurau tymor byr hyn wedi'u rhoi ar waith bellach, bydd y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol mewn gwell lle i ddarganfod TB drwy gynnal profion yn fwy rheolaidd yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle y mae'r clefyd wedi ymsefydlu, gan dreulio mwy o amser yn mynd i'r afael â'r clefyd, a chan dargedu ardaloedd lle y gallai'r clefyd ymddangos cyn iddo ymledu



cattle or wildlife.

I have made it clear in my written response that dead, dying and road-kill wildlife will be collected and tested outside hotspot areas. This should provide additional surveillance information to inform the work of the State Veterinary Service in identifying new areas of disease where wildlife infection could be a potential component.

The implementation of pre-movement testing and increasing the frequency of testing raises significant issues for the industry, the private veterinary practices and the State Veterinary Service. I will therefore consult on the details in spring 2005. The committee report recommended the introduction of several measures aimed at improving communication between the farming community and the Assembly Government. I have already decided to introduce a dedicated helpline and TB information packs for farmers.

The committee also suggested that I should implement the recommendations of the independent husbandry panel. Many of those are currently the subject of further research. The remaining relate to actions for farmers, so my officials are currently devising proposals to support farmers in taking measures that limit cattle and wildlife interactions.

The use of the gamma interferon test for all herd breakdowns was recommended. Introduction of improved diagnosis of TB in cattle is a major objective of the wide-ranging GB research programme being undertaken in relation to bovine tuberculosis. The potential use of the gamma interferon test, as a supplement to the skin test, is being fully explored as part of a trial of eligible herds across Wales. The level of farmer involvement in this trial is key to its success and I have and continue to take measures to raise awareness and interest in the trial, in order to encourage widespread participation by eligible herd owners.

ymysg gwartheg eraill neu anifeiliaid gwyllt.

Yr wyf wedi egluro yn fy ymateb ysgrifenedig y bydd anifeiliaid gwyllt sy'n farw, ar fin marw neu wedi'u lladd ar ffyrdd yn cael eu casglu a'u profi y tu allan i'r ardaloedd lle y ceir problem TB. Dylai hynny fod yn fodd i gynnig gwybodaeth ychwanegol, er cadw gwyliadwriaeth, a fydd yn goleuo gwaith y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol o ganfod ardaloedd lle y gallai heintiad gan anifeiliaid gwyllt fod wedi cyfrannu at achosion o'r clefyd.

Mae'r bwriad i gyflwyno profion cyn symud gwartheg ac i wneud profion yn amlach yn codi materion o bwys i'r diwydiant, y practisiau milfeddygol preifat a'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol. Gan hynny, ymgynghoraf ynghylch y manylion yng ngwanwyn 2005. Yr oedd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn argymhell cyflwyno sawl mesur a oedd â'r bwriad o wella'r cyfathrebu rhwng y rhai sy'n ymwneud â ffermio a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf eisoes wedi penderfynu cyflwyno llinell gymorth bwrpasol a pheccynau gwybodaeth am TB i ffermwyr.

Awgrymodd y pwyllgor hefyd y dylwn roi ar waith argymhellion y panel annibynnol ar hwsmonaeth. Gwneir ymchwil pellach ynghylch llawer ohonynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r rhai sy'n weddill yn ymwneud â chymryd gan ffermwyr, felly mae fy swyddogion wrthi'n paratoi cynigion i helpu ffermwyr i gymryd camau sy'n cyfyngu ar y cysylltiadau rhwng gwartheg ac anifeiliaid gwyllt.

Argymhellwyd y dylid defnyddio'r prawf am gama interfferon ar gyfer pob buches sydd wedi'i heintio â TB. Cyflwyno gwell dulliau o ganfod TB mewn gwartheg yw un o brif amcanion y rhaglen ymchwil bell-gyrhaeddol ym Mhrydain Fawr sy'n ymwneud â thwbercwlosis mewn gwartheg. Ymchwilir yn drwyadl i'r posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio'r prawf am gama interfferon, i ategu'r prawf ar groen, fel rhan o ragbrawf ar fuchesaau cymwys ledled Cymru. Mae llwyddiant y rhagbrawf yn dibynnu ar y graddau y bydd ffermwyr yn cymryd rhan ynddo ac yr wyf wedi cymryd camau, ac yn dal i'w cymryd, i hybu ymwybyddiaeth ac ennyn diddordeb yn

y rhagbrawf, er mwyn annog nifer helaeth o berchnogion y buchesau cymwys i gymryd rhan.

Where there is no evidence to support a movement-to-movement transmission, then an investigation into the major species of wildlife known to carry the disease will take place within 2km of the breakdown. If it is then found that the wildlife reservoir contains bovine TB, the decision to take any further action must lie with the Minister.

Os na cheir tystiolaeth i ddangos mai yn sgîl symud gwartheg y trosglwyddwyd yr haint, gellir ymchwilio wedyn i'r prif rywogaethau anifeiliaid gwyllt y gwyddys eu bod yn cario'r clefyd o fewn dau gilomedr i'r fuches sydd wedi'i heintio. Os ceir wedyn fod y gronfa bywyd gwyllt yn cynnwys TB buchol, y Gweinidog fydd yn penderfynu ar unrhyw gamau pellach sydd i'w cymryd.

The establishment of an intensive treatment area is a key recommendation, which poses a number of challenges. The TB action group has already considered the implications of this recommendation and advised that due to scientific complexity and uncertainty, a project group should be set up to consider the management of an intensive treatment area, in the light of current and emerging scientific evidence.

Mae'r argymhelliad i sefydlu ardal driniaeth ddwys yn un allweddol, sy'n codi sawl her. Mae'r grŵp gweithredu ar TB eisoes wedi ystyried goblygiadau'r argymhelliad hwn ac wedi argymhell y dylid sefydlu grŵp prosiect, oherwydd natur gymhleth ac ansicr yr ystyriaethau gwyddonol, i ystyried y dull o reoli ardal driniaeth ddwys, yng ngoleuni'r dystiolaeth wyddonol bresennol a'r hyn a ddaw i'r golwg.

I have provided significant funding for TB control measures over the next three financial years. Funding has been made available to assist with implementation of preventative measures aimed at controlling and reducing the incidence of disease. However, as recognised in the committee inquiry report and in line with the principles of the animal health and welfare strategy, it is not for Government alone to incur all the costs as farmers will benefit from the introduction of measures to reduce the geographical spread of disease. I have asked my officials to proceed on the basis that wherever possible and appropriate, costs will be shared between Government and others.

Yr wyf wedi darparu cyllid sylweddol ar gyfer mesurau i reoli TB dros y tair blwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Darparwyd cyllid i helpu i roi mesurau ataliol ar waith sydd â'r amcan o reoli a lleihau nifer achosion y clefyd. Fodd bynnag, fel y cydnabyddir yn adroddiad y pwyllgor ar yr ymchwiliad ac yn unol ag egwyddorion y strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid, ni fydd y Llywodraeth yn dwyn yr holl gostau ar ei phen ei hun gan y bydd ffermwyr yn cael budd o gyflwyno mesurau i gyfyngu ar ymlediad daearyddol clefydau. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion fynd rhagddynt gan dybio y bydd costau'n cael eu rhannu rhwng Llywodraeth ac eraill, lle bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl ac yn briodol.

The committee recognised that this is a complex problem and that there are a number of challenges in taking forward its recommendations. I believe that a good start has already been made. Achieving control of this disease demands commitment, compromise and co-operation from all those involved. It requires a positive, partnership approach.

Cydnabu'r pwyllgor fod y broblem hon yn un gymhleth a bod sawl her i'w hwynebu wrth hyrwyddo ei argymhellion. Credaf fod dechrau da wedi bod ar hyn eisoes. Os yw'r clefyd hwn i'w reoli, rhaid wrth ymrwymiad, cymrodeddu a chydweithredu ar ran pawb sy'n gysylltiedig. Mae'n gofyn dull gweithredu cadarnhaol ar y cyd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am prepared to welcome this statement. It is much more positive and somewhat different in tone from

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn barod i groesawu'r datganiad hwn. Mae'n llawer mwy cadarnhaol ac yn eithaf gwahanol o ran

certain aspects of the written statement that you issued last week. You said that you were sure that we were pleased that you had accepted all the recommendations. We were pleased, but having read that statement further, there were some issues for concern, particularly regarding the detailed responses to the sub-recommendations under recommendation 2—you are either rejecting them or taking a rather negative approach towards them. In particular, those relating to gamma interferon testing and to the possibility of limited wildlife testing and limited removal in areas where new breakdowns cannot be attributed to cattle and cattle transmission.

Some of us felt that last week's statement appeared to be less than transparent and honest. After today's statement, I am afraid that the present situation is still somewhat confused. I will press you for further clarity on certain issues. Even in today's statement, you refer to taking forward the majority of the committee's recommendations, and I have listened carefully to your words. Can you reassure us that you understand that the committee's recommendations and proposals will only work if they are implemented as a package? You refer in your statement to the difficulty of gaining not only cross-party consensus on this sensitive issue, but more importantly perhaps, consensus across stakeholders. There is consensus for the package, and it is not appropriate to start picking and choosing recommendations. Can you clarify what you mean by the majority of the committee's recommendations? Will you implement all of them as a package?

On the two specific points—do you stand by the approach to gamma interferon testing outlined in your written statement last week, or do you stand by the more positive approach that you have taken today? Regarding wildlife testing and removal, do you stand by the approach taken in the written statement or do you stand by what you have said today? I hope that you stand by the approaches that you have taken today.

ei oslef i rai agweddau ar y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyhoeddasoch yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedasoch eich bod yn siŵr y byddem yn falch eich bod wedi derbyn yr holl argymhellion. Yr oeddem yn falch ond, a minnau wedi darllen y datganiad hwnnw ymhellach, yr oedd rhai materion a barai bryder, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â'r ymatebion manwl i'r is-argymhellion o dan argymhelliad 2—yr ydych un ai'n eu gwrthod neu'n cymryd agwedd negyddol braidd tuag atynt, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â phroffion am gama interfferon a'r posibilrwydd o gynnal profion cyfyngedig ar anifeiliaid gwyllt ac o ddifa cyfyngedig mewn ardaloedd lle na ellir priodoli heintiadau newydd i drosglwyddo ymysg gwartheg.

Yr oedd rhai ohonom yn teimlo nad oedd y datganiad a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn gwbl dryloyw a gonest. Ar ôl y datganiad heddiw, mae arnaf ofn bod y sefyllfa bresennol yn dal i fod braidd yn ddryslyd. Pwysaf arnoch am eglurhad pellach ar rai materion. Hyd yn oed yn y datganiad heddiw, cyfeiriwch at hyrwyddo'r rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor, ac yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud ar eich geiriau. A allwch ein sicrhau eich bod yn deall na fydd argymhellion a chynigion y pwyllgor ond yn llwyddo os cânt eu rhoi ar waith fel pecyn? Cyfeiriwch yn eich datganiad at yr anhawster o gael consensws trawsbleidiol ar y mater sensitif hwn a hefyd, yn bwysicach efallai, at gael consensws ymysg y rhanddeiliaid. Mae consensws o blaid y pecyn, ac nid yw'n briodol dechrau dewis a dethol argymhellion. A allwch egluro'r hyn a olygwch wrth sôn am y rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor? A wnewch roi'r cwbl ohonynt ar waith fel pecyn?

Ynghylch dau bwynt penodol—a ydych yn dal at y safbwynt ar broffion am gama interfferon a nodwyd yn eich datganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf, neu a ydych yn dal at y safbwynt mwy cadarnhaol a gymerasoch heddiw? Ynghylch profion ar anifeiliaid gwyllt a'u difa, a ydych yn dal at y safbwynt a gymerasoch yn y datganiad ysgrifenedig neu a ydych yn dal at yr hyn a ddywedasoch heddiw? Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn dal at y safbwyntiau a gymerasoch heddiw.

By appearing to take one approach in your written statement last week, particularly on those two sensitive issues, and taking another approach today, do you accept that you have caused unnecessary confusion and concern? Will you apologise to the Assembly and, more importantly, to the rural communities that are affected by TB for that confusion and concern, and reassure them that you will be taking forward the full package of recommendations in the positive light that you appear to be showing us today?

Drwy gymryd un safbwynt yn eich datganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf, yn enwedig ynghylch y ddau fater sensitif hynny, a chymryd safbwynt gwahanol heddiw, i bob golwg, a ydych yn derbyn eich bod wedi peri dryswch a gofid diangen? A wnewch ymddiheuro i'r Cynulliad ac, yn bwysicach, i'r cymunedau gwledig y mae TB yn effeithio arnynt am beri'r dryswch a'r gofid hwnnw, a'u sicrhau y byddwch yn hyrwyddo'r holl argymhellion yng ngolwg y farn gadarnhaol yr ymddengys eich bod yn ei hamlygu heddiw?

3.10 p.m.

**Carwyn Jones:** I am not sure that there is a difference regarding the gamma interferon test between the written statement and what I have said today. It is clear that the gamma interferon test is being taken forward. The current situation regarding the gamma interferon test is that it is used in conjunction with the skin test in order to validate the use of gamma interferon in future. The difficulty thus far is that there is only a small pool of gamma interferon results, which currently prevents us from taking a definite view regarding its effectiveness. We need to ensure that more farmers take up the option of a gamma interferon test. The way in which the tests are currently carried out is that some animals are not tested—there has to be a controlled herd, so that we can measure the success of the gamma interferon test against animals that do not have that test.

**Carwyn Jones:** Ni chredaf fod gwahaniaeth o ran y prawf am gama interfferon rhwng y datganiad ysgrifenedig a'r hyn a ddywedais heddiw. Mae'n amlwg bod y prawf am gama interfferon yn cael ei hyrwyddo. Y sefyllfa bresennol o ran y prawf am gama interfferon yw y caiff ei ddefnyddio ar y cyd â'r prawf ar groen er mwyn dilysu'r defnydd o gama interfferon yn y dyfodol. Y drafferth hyd yma yw nad oes ond nifer bach o ganlyniadau ar ôl profi am gama interfferon, fel na allwn ffurfio barn bendant ar hyn o bryd ynghylch ei effeithiolrwydd. Rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd mwy o ffermwyr yn dewis cael profion am gama interfferon. Ni wneir prawf ar rai anifeiliaid o dan y drefn bresennol—rhaid cael buches safonol, fel y gallwn fesur llwyddiant y prawf am gama interfferon yn erbyn anifeiliaid na chaiff y prawf hwnnw.

There are strict criteria under which farmers are offered the gamma interferon test. At present, only 50 per cent, roughly, of farmers take up that offer—I want to get that up to 100 per cent. Over the next few weeks and months I want to find ways of doing that, as it will help us tremendously in terms of getting a larger pool of results from which we can draw conclusions.

Mae meini prawf caeth ar gyfer cynnig y prawf am gama interfferon i ffermwyr. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond tua 50 y cant o ffermwyr sy'n derbyn y cynnig hwnnw—yr wyf am godi hynny i 100 y cant. Dros yr wythnosau a'r misoedd nesaf, yr wyf am ganfod dulliau o wneud hynny, gan y bydd hynny o gymorth aruthrol i ni o ran cael cronfa fwy o ganlyniadau y gallwn ddod i gasgliadau ar ei sail.

The difficulty with the recommendations on wildlife is that it is not necessarily the sentiment behind what was said in the recommendations, but the practical way in which this particular recommendation could be carried forward, particularly in terms of

Mae anhawster ynglŷn â'r argymhellion ar anifeiliaid gwyllt nad yw'n ymwneud gymaint â'r teimlad sy'n sail i'r argymhellion, ond â'r dull o roi'r argymhelliad penodol hwn ar waith yn ymarferol, yn enwedig o ran eich diffiniad o

what you define as a major species of wildlife. That will have to be done. Secondly, a definition will have to be found of how we determine the prevalence of disease, as mentioned in the recommendation. Thirdly, a way forward would have to be found in terms of how you physically test the animals, how many animals you need to test, what animals you would test, how you would ensure that that testing takes place, and how you would capture the animals to test them.

I have been reluctant to commit further than that at this stage, because I wanted to ensure that what is proposed is practical. Having said that, however, I wanted to ensure that the message went out that I would like to see this happening as long as it is practically possible. The work will be carried out now to ensure that that is practically possible. A decision will then have to be made as to how we interpret those results; no decision has yet been made on that. Further discussions will have to be carried out before we decide how we use that data, in particular whether or not in the future—and it is literally whether or not in the future—a cull of any wildlife species would be justified. We are not at that stage yet; that is an open question, and it depends on the practicality of being able to carry out these tests and what their results are.

**Brynle Williams:** I welcome the Minister's comments, and I am pleased that he has accepted all the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's recommendations. However, to progress this matter forward and tackle it, it is imperative that these issues are resolved in a constructive, cross-party manner, where all viewpoints are considered. It is important, Minister, that we send out a strong signal to the farming community that we are finally doing something about it in the Assembly, and that we are taking immediate action to tackle bovine TB. I support the committee's recommendation to tackle this issue holistically and pragmatically, which is the only way forward.

The committee's recommendations touched on working in partnership with all stakeholder groups—I could not agree more. With the continuing sharing of information,

brif rywogaethau o anifeiliaid gwyllt. Bydd yn rhaid gwneud hynny. Yn ail, bydd yn rhaid pennu modd i fesur pa mor gyffredin yw'r clefyd, fel y nodir yn yr argymhelliad. Yn drydydd, bydd yn rhaid penderfynu ar y dull ffisegol o gynnal prawf ar yr anifeiliaid, ar nifer yr anifeiliaid y mae'n rhaid cynnal prawf arnynt, pa anifeiliaid y gwneid prawf arnynt, sut y byddid yn sicrhau y cynhelir profion, a sut y byddid yn dal yr anifeiliaid i gynnal prawf arnynt.

Bûm yn amharod i ymrwymo ymhellach na hynny ar hyn o bryd, gan fy mod am sicrhau bod yr hyn a gynigir yn ymarferol. Wedi dweud hynny, fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn am sicrhau bod neges yn mynd ar led i'r perwyl y carwn weld hyn yn digwydd cyhyd ag y bo'n ymarferol. Cyflawnir gwaith yn awr i sicrhau y bydd yn ymarferol. Bydd yn rhaid penderfynu wedyn ar y modd y byddwn yn dehongli'r canlyniadau hynny; ni wnaed penderfyniad ar hynny hyd yma. Bydd yn rhaid cynnal trafodaethau pellach cyn inni benderfynu ar y modd y defnyddir y data hynny, yn enwedig ynghylch a fyddai cyfiawnhad o gwbl yn y dyfodol dros ddifa unrhyw rywogaeth bywyd gwyllt. Nid aethom mor bell â hynny eto; mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn agored, ac mae'n dibynnu ar ein gallu i gynnal y profion hynny a pha ganlyniadau a geir ohonynt.

**Brynle Williams:** Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn falch ei fod wedi derbyn holl argymhellion Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn cael cynnydd ar y mater hwn a mynd i'r afael ag ef, mae'n hollbwysig i'r materion hyn gael eu datrys mewn modd adeiladol, trawsbleidiol, lle yr ystyrir pob safbwynt. Mae'n bwysig, Weinidog, inni ddweud yn glir wrth ffermwyr ein bod am wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch o'r diwedd yn y Cynulliad, a'n bod yn cymryd camau ar unwaith i ymdrin â TB mewn gwartheg. Cefnogaf argymhelliad y pwyllgor y dylid ymdrin â'r mater hwn mewn modd cyfannol a phragmatig, gan mai honno yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen.

Cyfeiriwyd yn argymhellion y pwyllgor at weithio ar y cyd â'r holl grwpiau sy'n rhanddeiliaid—cytunaf yn llwyr. Drwy barhau i rannu gwybodaeth, ceid dull

the approach will be strengthened, and the success rate will be higher. It is important that the Minister has committed the Welsh Assembly Government to authorise an intensive treatment area in hotspots that have experienced prolonged problems with TB. I believe that the cost of this will be met by the Welsh Assembly Government, which I welcome. I look forward to hearing recommendations from the Wales TB action group, which is advising on establishing a project group to take the work forward.

The next recommendation notes that the Welsh Assembly Government would incrementally roll out the intensive treatment to other areas in Wales. This would be done if it was suitable in controlling TB. The costing issues need to be considered as soon as possible, as informal discussions have suggested that the funding could be shared, possibly, between the farming industry and the Welsh Assembly Government.

For progress to be made, it is essential that the Welsh Assembly Government establishes a Wales TB action group to deliver short-term measures to tackle TB in cattle and to investigate long-term measures. I understand that the membership should be small, but it is important that no interested party should be excluded. For this committee to be effective, regular reports should be made available and publicised to stakeholders. It was important that everyone concerned supported the fact that longer term and larger scale investigations, such as vaccine development and trials, continue to be undertaken in the UK.

However, I welcome the fact that the full consultation will be conducted in the spring of 2005 to discuss the increases in testing in clean areas from every four years to every two years, and the implementation of pre-movement testing across Wales.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cewch ofyn cwestiwn i gloi.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch yn fawr—thank you.

gweithredu mwy cadarn, a cheid mwy o lwyddiant. Mae'n bwysig bod y Gweinidog wedi rhwymo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i awdurdodi creu ardal driniaeth ddwys mewn mannau y cafwyd problemau ers amser maith mewn cysylltiad â TB. Credaf mai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fydd yn dwyn y gost am hynny, a chroesawaf hynny. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed argymhellion gan y grŵp gweithredu ar TB i Gymru, sy'n rhoi cyngor ynghylch sefydlu grŵp prosiect i hyrwyddo'r gwaith hwn.

Mae'r argymhelliad nesaf yn nodi y byddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ehangu'r driniaeth ddwys yn raddol i ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru. Gwneid hynny os cafwyd ei fod yn ddull addas o reoli TB. Bydd yn rhaid ystyried y materion sy'n ymwneud â phrisio cyn gynted ag y bo modd, gan fod trafodaethau anffurfiol wedi awgrymu y gallai'r diwydiant ffermio a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ariannu hyn ar y cyd, o bosibl.

Er mwyn gwneud cynnydd, mae'n hollbwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sefydlu grŵp gweithredu ar TB i Gymru i gymryd camau tymor byr i ymdrin ag achosion o TB mewn gwartheg ac i ymchwilio i fesurau tymor hir. Deallaf fod yr aelodaeth yn debygol o fod yn fach, ond mae'n bwysig na chaiff unrhyw barti cysylltiedig ei gau allan. Os yw'r pwyllgor hwn i fod yn effeithiol, rhaid rhoi adroddiadau rheolaidd i randdeiliaid a darparu cyhoeddusrwydd ar eu cyfer. Yr oedd yn bwysig bod pawb sy'n gysylltiedig o blaid parhau i gynnal ymchwiliadau ehangach, tymor hir, fel y rhai i ddatblygu a rhagbrofi brechlynnau, yn y DU.

Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y ffaith y cynhelir ymgynghoriad llawn yng ngwanwyn 2005 i drafod cynnal profion mewn ardaloedd lle na chafwyd achosion o TB bob dwy flynedd, yn hytrach na phob pedair blynedd, ac y bydd profion cyn symud gwartheg yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ledled Cymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You may close with a question.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch yn fawr.

It is worth a try. Would it be possible to use some of the agricultural colleges, and Gelli Aur in particular, as a hotspot or similar area for bio-security purposes and, in that regard, to use some of the Farming Connect model farms, Minister?

**Carwyn Jones:** Where there is expertise that we need to tap in to, we will, of course, utilise that.

**Mick Bates:** That was an interesting written statement from Brynle.

**Glyn Davies:** He will have to do better than that.

**Mick Bates:** Yes, he definitely will. He will be all ad-lib as usual.

Helen already exposed the weakness in the statement. While you publish cross-party support and the fact that everybody is signing up to this, you must remember that this is not the first time that you have made a statement about TB and promised us action. I believe—looking beyond the reason why we have not had that action—that it is because you have not committed substantial capacity, and funding in particular, to resolve the issues. We must pay credit to the work of Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, who has certainly raised a greater awareness of the problem in your party, leading ultimately to some fine recommendations in the committee report, which you rightly suggest is cross party.

However, in looking at this matter, there is still much aspirational work to be undertaken. For example, you made it clear in your written response that dead, dying and road-kill wildlife will be collected and tested outside hotspots. According to your written statements, however, that—and I hope you will confirm this—will be dependent on new criteria written by your officials in order to identify new hotspots. You lead us to believe, in this statement, that that will automatically happen. Can you confirm that, or is it really dependent on new criteria? As we move forward, you will consult on the issue of implementation of pre-movement testing next year. This is not rocket science; people have

Mae'n werth rhoi cynnig arni. A fyddai modd defnyddio rhai o'r colegau amaethyddol, ac un y Gelli Aur yn benodol, fel ardal sydd â phroblem TB neu ardal debyg i ddibenion bioddiogelwch ac, yn hynny o beth, ddefnyddio rhai o ffermydd enghreifftiol Cyswllt Ffermio, Weinidog?

**Carwyn Jones:** Os oes arbenigedd y mae angen inni wneud defnydd ohono, byddwn yn sicr o wneud hynny, wrth gwrs.

**Mick Bates:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n ddatganiad ysgrifenedig diddorol gan Brynle.

**Glyn Davies:** Bydd yn rhaid iddo wneud yn well na hynny.

**Mick Bates:** Bydd, yn sicr. Bydd yn adlibio am y gorau yn ôl ei arfer.

Mae Helen eisoes wedi amlygu'r diffyg yn y datganiad. Er y cyhoeddwyd fod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i hyn a bod pawb yn cytuno arno, rhaid ichi gofio nad hwn yw'r tro cyntaf ichi wneud datganiad am TB ac addo cymryd camau. Yr wyf yn credu—gan edrych y tu hwnt i'r rheswm na welsom y camau hynny—fod hynny wedi digwydd am nad ydych wedi neilltuo capasiti sylweddol, a chyllid yn benodol, i ddatrys y materion sydd dan sylw. Rhaid inni ganmol gwaith Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, sy'n sicr wedi hybu ymwybyddiaeth o'r broblem hon yn eich plaid, fel y cafwyd rhai argymhellion gwych yn y diwedd yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, sy'n un trawsbleidiol, fel y dywedwyd.

Fodd bynnag, wrth edrych ar y mater hwn, mae llawer iawn o waith uchelgeisiol i'w gyflawni. Er enghraifft, eglurasoch yn eich datganiad ysgrifenedig y bydd anifeiliaid gwyllt sy'n farw, ar fin marw ac wedi'u lladd ar y ffordd yn cael eu casglu a'u profi y tu allan i ardaloedd sydd â phroblem TB. Yn ôl eich datganiadau ysgrifenedig, fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n dibynnu—a gobeithiaf y gwnewch gadarnhau hyn—ar feini prawf newydd a lunnir gan eich swyddogion er mwyn canfod ardaloedd newydd sydd â phroblem TB. Yr ydych yn ein harwain i gredu, yn y datganiad hwn, y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn awtomatig. A allwch gadarnhau hynny, neu a yw'n dibynnu ar feini prawf

been talking about this for years. Let us have proper pre-movement testing, so that we know whether animals, as well as wildlife, spread the disease. However, you will not consult until 2005. There seems to be a lack of action, Minister.

You go on to say that you will establish a TB helpline. That is excellent, but where is the joined-up thinking in your Government? Currently, your Government is getting rid of the rural stress initiative, and getting rid of the capacity created by the rural outreach programmes. Where is the joined-up thinking? You are committing to a new helpline and getting rid of other people who actually deliver that.

3.20 p.m.

You rightly say that gamma interferon tests are currently not being well used, and you will encourage farmers to use more tests. Where will you test? As you know, the test needs to be done within 24 hours of taking blood, but we do not have the capacity. If you will be encouraging testing, how will you overcome that problem? Your statement talks of exploration of new issues, and you furthermore talk of testing the wildlife reservoir. If those wildlife reservoirs contain bovine TB, you say that the decision to take any further action must lie with the Minister. You should clarify what that means. Will you be prepared to remove that wildlife, on the basis of this statement? You are raising great expectation in the industry that there will be removal in these hotspots.

**Carwyn Jones:** To deal with the last point first, it is far too early to say what would happen were we to get the scientific information that we would expect from testing wildlife. The reason why it is made clear that the decisions lie with the Minister is because it is the Minister who will take

newydd mewn gwirionedd? Wrth inni symud ymlaen, byddwch yn ymgynghori ar y dull o gynnal profion cyn symud gwartheg y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid oes unrhyw beth newydd yn hyn; bu sôn am hyn ers blynyddoedd. Gadewch inni gael profion cyn symud priodol, fel y cawn wybod a yw anifeiliaid fferm, yn ogystal ag anifeiliaid gwyllt, yn lledaenu'r clefyd. Fodd bynnag, ni wnewch ymgynghori tan 2005. Ymddengys fod diffyg gweithredu, Weinidog.

Aethoch ymlaen i ddweud y byddwch yn sefydlu llinell gymorth ar TB. Mae hynny'n rhagorol, ond ym mhle y mae'r meddwl cydgysylltiedig yn eich Llywodraeth? Ar hyn o bryd, mae'ch Llywodraeth yn cael gwared ar y fenter i atal straen yng nghefn gwlad, ac yn cael gwared ar y capasiti a grëwyd gan y rhaglenni allgymorth yng nghefn gwlad. Ym mhle y mae'r meddwl cydgysylltiedig? Yr ydych yn ymrwmo i gael llinell gymorth newydd ac yn cael gwared ar bobl eraill sy'n darparu hynny ar hyn o bryd.

Fel y dywedwch, a hynny'n gywir, ni wneir defnydd da o brofion am gama interfferon ar hyn o bryd, a byddwch yn annog ffermwyr i ddefnyddio mwy o brofion. Ym mhle y gwnewch y profion? Fel y gwyddoch, rhaid gwneud y prawf o fewn 24 awr ar ôl cymryd gwaed, ond nid oes gennym y gallu i wneud hynny. Os byddwch yn hyrwyddo profion, sut y gwnewch ddatrys y broblem honno? Mae eich datganiad yn cyfeirio at ymchwil i faterion newydd, a soniwch ymhellach am gynnal profion ar y gronfa bywyd gwyllt. Os ceir TB buchol yn y cronfeydd bywyd gwyllt hynny, dywedwch mai'r Gweinidog fydd yn penderfynu ar unrhyw gamau pellach. Dylech egluro ystyr hynny. A fyddwch yn barod i ddifa'r anifeiliaid gwyllt hynny, ar sail y datganiad hwn? Yr ydych yn creu disgwyliad mawr yn y diwydiant y ceir difa yn yr ardaloedd sydd â phroblem TB.

**Carwyn Jones:** Gan ymdrin yn gyntaf â'r pwynt olaf a wnaethoch, mae'n rhy fuan o lawer i ddweud beth a ddigwyddai pe caem y wybodaeth wyddonol a ddisgwyliem drwy gynnal profion ar anifeiliaid gwyllt. Y rheswm yr eglurir mai'r Gweinidog fydd yn penderfynu ar hyn yw mai'r Gweinidog a



responsibility for it and take the flak or the praise for it. That is the way that it has to be. In terms of what that decision might be, it is far too early to speculate in the absence of any evidence, and I am not prepared to do so. However, for the avoidance of doubt, the decision in terms of what to do with the evidence garnered from testing wildlife, would not be that of the action group, but it would be my decision, which I think is right and proper.

We have committed money this year, as I already mentioned, in terms of dealing with bovine TB. The money is not aimed purely at compensation, but it has been allocated to start dealing with the problem.

I join you in paying tribute to Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey and the work that she has done. It will be important that she plays a continuing role with regard to these issues, given the expertise that she has developed.

We are looking at consultation on pre-movement testing and other forms of testing in the spring. The reason for not doing so until then is that I anticipate that the action group will draw up proposals which will go to consultation. There will be a short period of consultation and we will be looking to implement those proposals between the spring and the summer. It is important that there are proposals, which will take a little time to draw up—at least two, if not three months—to put before the industry. There is no point in drawing up a consultation document which simply asks for views on pre-movement testing and annual testing. People will then, quite rightly, ask us about how exactly the system operates. It is right that we put that before them.

The TB hotline has been set up. We have not closed any other lines, although there have been question marks over funding in certain areas. The TB hotline is established and it is a commitment that we have put forward and met as a result of the committee's recommendations.

We are examining capacity in terms of the gamma interferon tests, but if all farmers had taken up the tests, and if we had a 100 per

fydd yn cymryd y cyfrifoldeb am hynny a'r feirniadaeth neu'r clod amdano. Felly y mae'n rhaid iddo fod. O ran beth fyddai'r penderfyniad hwnnw, mae'n rhy fuan o lawer i ddyfalu gan nad oes unrhyw dystiolaeth, ac nid wyf yn barod i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel na fydd ansicrwydd, dywedaf nad y grŵp gweithredu a benderfynai ar yr hyn a wneid â'r dystiolaeth a geid o wneud profion ar anifeiliaid gwyllt, ond myfi, a chredaf fod hynny'n gwbl briodol.

Yr ydym wedi neilltuo arian eleni, fel yr wyf wedi dweud eisoes, i ddelio â TB mewn gwartheg. Nid ar gyfer iawndal yn unig y mae'r arian hwn, ond fe'i dyrannwyd fel y gellir dechrau ymdrin â'r broblem hon.

Ymunaf â chi i dalu teyrnged i Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey a'r gwaith a gyflawnodd. Bydd yn bwysig iddi ddal i gymryd rhan wrth drafod y materion hynny, yng ngolwg yr arbenigedd y mae wedi'i feithrin.

Yr ydym yn edrych ar ymgynghori ar brofion cyn symud gwartheg a mathau eraill o brofion yn y gwanwyn. Y rheswm dros beidio â gwneud hynny'n gynt yw y rhagwelaf y bydd y grŵp gweithredu yn paratoi cynigion y ceir ymgynghori arnynt. Bydd cyfnod ymgynghori byr a byddwn yn gobeithio rhoi'r cynigion hynny ar waith rhwng y gwanwyn a'r haf. Mae'n bwysig y ceir cynigion, y cymer ychydig amser i'w paratoi—o leiaf ddau, os nad tri mis—i'w rhoi gerbron y diwydiant. Nid oes diben paratoi dogfen ymgynghori nad yw ond yn gofyn barn am brofion cyn symud gwartheg a phrofion blynyddol. Bydd pobl yn ein holi wedyn, yn gwbl briodol, sut yn union y bydd y system yn gweithio. Mae'n briodol inni roi hynny ger eu bron.

Mae'r llinell gymorth ar TB wedi'i sefydlu. Nid ydym wedi cau unrhyw linellau eraill, er y bu amheuaeth ynghylch ariannu mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mae'r llinell gymorth ar TB wedi'i sefydlu ac mae'n ymrwymiad yr ydym wedi'i gyflwyno a'i gyflawni o ganlyniad i argymhellion y pwyllgor.

Yr ydym yn ystyried y gallu i gynnal profion am gama interfferon, ond pe byddai'r holl ffermwyr wedi derbyn y profion, a phob un

cent return rate, the capacity would have been made available. I do not anticipate that there will be any difficulties in that regard if we achieve a volunteering rate of around 100 per cent in respect of the gamma interferon tests.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** I thank the Minister and Mick Bates for their kind words. As you are all aware, this is a terrible disease which we have been determined, as a committee, to address—if not to fully eradicate, at least to reduce its incidence—and I note that the Minister also discusses preventative measures in his oral statement.

There are a number of issues which I would like to discuss today. First, will the TB action group have the drive and authority to carry through the significant number of decisions which it will be involved in implementing? The wildlife reservoir issue, quite rightly, remains with you. Secondly, will you give a commitment today, Minister, to push through legislation or any legislative change which may be required to assist the implementation of the committee's full recommendations in tackling bovine TB? Thirdly, will you look at specifically funding the provision of additional laboratory testing facilities to allow for gamma interferon testing, particularly a mobile testing unit which could therefore be used in areas designated as intensive treatment areas, which would assist in a rapid turnaround of test results both for avian and bovine TB as well as gamma interferon and therefore assist us in gathering data and being able to tackle the full range of the disease?

Finally, Minister, I know that you will go out to consultation on pre-movement testing. However, if we do not follow the route of pre-movement testing, which I would prefer, will we have annual testing?

**Carwyn Jones:** First, it will be exceptionally important that the action group has momentum and drive. It will also be important that the recommendations of the action group carry authority. I always keep under review how that authority and drive might be maintained and improved.

ohonynt wedi ymateb, byddid wedi darparu ar gyfer hynny. Ni ragwelaf y bydd unrhyw anawsterau yn hynny o beth os gallwn sicrhau y bydd tua 100 y cant o'r ffermwyr yn gwirfoddoli i wneud y profion am gama interfferon.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog ac i Mick Bates am eu geiriau caredig. Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, clefyd ofnadwy yw hwn y buom yn benderfynol, fel pwyllgor, o fynd i'r afael ag ef—i ostwng nifer yr achosion o leiaf, os na ellir ei ddileu'n llwyr—a nodaf fod y Gweinidog hefyd yn trafod mesurau ataliol yn ei ddatganiad llafar.

Mae sawl mater y carwn eu trafod heddiw. Yn gyntaf, a fydd y grŵp gweithredu ar TB yn meddu ar y penderfyniad a'r awdurdod i gyflawni'r nifer sylweddol o benderfyniadau y bydd ganddo ran yn eu gweithredu? Chi biau penderfynu ar fater y gronfa bywyd gwyllt, a hynny'n gwbl briodol. Yn ail, a wnewch ymrwymo heddiw, Weinidog, i hyrwyddo deddfwriaeth neu unrhyw newid i ddeddfwriaeth a allai fod yn ofynnol i roi holl argymhellion y pwyllgor ar waith wrth ymdrin â TB mewn gwartheg? Yn drydydd, a wnewch ystyried rhoi arian yn benodol ar gyfer darparu cyfleusterau profi ychwanegol mewn labordai ar gyfer profion am gama interfferon, yn enwedig uned brofi symudol y gellid ei defnyddio felly mewn ardaloedd a ddynodwyd yn ardaloedd triniaeth ddwys, fel y gellid cael canlyniadau'n gyflym o brofion am TB mewn adar a gwartheg yn ogystal â gama interfferon gan y byddai hynny'n gymorth i gasglu data ac i fynd i'r afael â'r clefyd yn ei holl agweddau?

Yn olaf, Weinidog, gwn y byddwch yn ymgynghori ar brofion cyn symud gwartheg. Fodd bynnag, os na phenderfynwn gael profion o'r fath, a fyddai'n well gennyf fi, a gawn brofion blynyddol?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, bydd yn hollbwysig i'r grŵp gweithredu feddu ar rym a phenderfyniad. Bydd hefyd yn bwysig i argymhellion y grŵp gweithredu fod yn rhai awdurdodol. Byddaf bob amser yn adolygu'r modd y gellir cynnal a hyrwyddo'r awdurdod a'r penderfyniad hwnnw.

Secondly, in terms of legislation, if there are legislative changes that can be made which will be beneficial in dealing with bovine TB, that legislation will be pursued.

Thirdly, the laboratory testing facilities belong to DEFRA, not us. However, if the action group decides that we need to increase testing facilities, we will consider this, discuss it with DEFRA and see whether there are ways forward in terms of increasing laboratory testing facilities.

Finally, the exercises in respect of testing, will be in the form of a regime which is as effective as possible without stifling the normal market patterns of the farming industry. We would have to examine pre-movement testing, for example, and the advantages that it would give us in terms of disease control against the effect that that may have on the farming industry. We must also consider annual testing if pre-movement testing is found to be impractical. These are all currently hypothetical questions and it will be important to consult on these issues in early spring.

**William Graham:** How will the measures announced today promote a healthier wildlife population and allow for farm animals, agriculture in general, and wildlife in particular to be of reasonable benefit to all?

**Carwyn Jones:** We want to ensure that we have healthy populations of wildlife and farmed animals. We know that there are links between wildlife and farmed animals, although they are not entirely clear. For example, a Government scientist who gave evidence to the inquiry suggested that all warm-blooded animals are potential TB carriers. If you take that conclusion to its extreme, a suggestion may be made that we should cull domestic cats. That is extreme and not something that I would advocate. However, it shows how important it is to tread carefully when considering the issue of establishing a wildlife reservoir and whether or not to consider the culling of animals. The jury is currently out on that, and it must be considered over the next few months.

Yn ail, gyda golwg ar ddeddfwriaeth, os gellir newid deddfwriaeth mewn modd a fydd o fantais i ymdrin â TB mewn gwarheg, eir ynghylch cael y ddeddfwriaeth honno.

Yn drydydd, mae'r cyfleusterau profi mewn labordai'n eiddo i Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, nid i ni. Er hynny, os penderfyna'r grŵp gweithredu fod angen inni gael mwy o gyfleusterau profi, ystyriwn hynny, a'i drafod â DEFRA a gweld a fydd modd cael rhagor o gyfleusterau profi mewn labordai yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, cynhelir y profion o dan gyfundrefn a fydd mor effeithiol ag y bo modd heb amharu ar batrymau arferol y diwydiant ffermio mewn cysylltiad â marchnadoedd. Byddai'n rhaid inni ymchwilio i brofion cyn symud gwartheg, er enghraifft, gan gymharu'r manteision a gaem o hynny â'i effaith bosibl ar y diwydiant ffermio. Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried cynnal profion blynyddol os ceir bod profion cyn symud gwartheg yn anymarferol. Cwestiynau damcaniaethol yw'r rhain i gyd ar hyn o bryd a bydd yn bwysig ymgynghori ar y materion hyn ddechrau'r gwanwyn.

**William Graham:** Sut y bydd y mesurau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw'n hyrwyddo poblogaeth bywyd gwyllt iachach ac yn caniatáu i anifeiliaid fferm, amaethyddiaeth yn gyffredinol, a bywyd gwyllt yn benodol ddod â budd rhesymol i bawb?

**Carwyn Jones:** Yr ydym am sicrhau bod gennym boblogaethau iach o anifeiliaid gwyllt ac anifeiliaid fferm. Gwyddom fod cysylltiadau rhwng anifeiliaid gwyllt ac anifeiliaid fferm, er nad ydynt yn gwbl glir. Er enghraifft, awgrymodd un o wyddonwyr y Llywodraeth a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad y gallai'r holl anifeiliaid twymwaed gario TB. Os ewch â'r casgliad hwnnw i'r pen draw, gellid awgrymu y dylem ddifa cathod domestig. Mae hynny'n eithafol ac ni fyddwn yn dadlau o blaid hynny. Fodd bynnag, dengys hynny mor bwysig ydyw i droedio'n ofalus wrth ystyried sefydlu cronfa bywyd gwyllt ac a ddylid ystyried difa anifeiliaid. Ni phenderfynwyd ar hynny eto, a bydd yn rhaid ei ystyried dros y misoedd nesaf.

**Hysbysiad gan y Prif Weinidog am Rwymedigaeth wrth gefn o dan Reol  
Sefydlog Rhif 21.23—Cais Llundain i Gynnal y Gemau Olympaidd  
Notification by the First Minister of a Contingent Liability under Standing  
Order No. 21.23—the London Olympic Bid**

**The First Minister:** I wish, and am duty bound, to make a statement under Standing Order No. 21.23 regarding a contingent liability relating to London's bid to host the 2012 Olympic and Paralympic games. London's bid was formally submitted to the International Olympic Committee on 15 November, and included the good news for Wales that the Millennium Stadium has been chosen to host some of the qualifying games in the football tournaments for men and women.

Members may find it helpful if I explained the background to this statement. In May this year, London was shortlisted as one of the five candidate cities to host the 2012 games, the others being New York, Paris, Madrid and Moscow. Since then, we have been working closely with the Department for Culture, Media and Sport and London 2012, the company established to prepare the bid, on the preparation of London's candidate file, which is the formal bid document. The file sets out in detail how the games will be financed, the long-term legacy that they would leave for London and the rest of the UK, the facilities and services that would be provided and the UK's economic and political climate.

In terms of financing the games, the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport and the Mayor of London have agreed a package that makes an allowance for up to £2.375 billion of public funding. That will be made up of: £1.5 billion from the National Lottery, including income from a new Olympic lottery game to run from next year if the bid is successful; £625 million from the Greater London Authority, drawn from a council tax precept on London council tax payers; and £250 million from the London Development Agency.

The candidate file also contains certain guarantees that the IOC requires from Government, most of which fall to the UK

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddymuniad gennyf ac yn ddyletswydd arnaf wneud datganiad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 21.23 ynghylch rhwymedigaeth wrth gefn mewn cysylltiad â chais Llundain i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd a Pharalympaidd yn 2012. Cyflwynwyd cais Llundain yn ffurfiol i'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol ar 15 Tachwedd, ac yr oedd ynddo newyddion da i Gymru gan fod Stadiwm y Mileniwm wedi'i ddewis i gynnal rhai o'r gemau rhagbrofol yn y twrnameintiau pêl-droed i ddynton a menywod.

Gallai fod o gymorth i Aelodau os egluraf y cyd-destun i'r datganiad hwn. Ym mis Mai eleni, rhoddwyd Llundain ar y rhestr fer fel un o'r pum darpar ddinas i gynnal y gemau yn 2012, a'r lleill yw Efrog Newydd, Paris, Madrid a Moscow. Ers hynny, buom yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon a Llundain 2012, y cwmni a sefydlwyd i baratoi'r cais, wrth baratoi'r ffeil ar gyfer cais Llundain, sef y ddogfen ymgeisio ffurfiol. Mae'r ffeil yn nodi'n fanwl y modd y caiff y gemau eu hariannu, yr hyn a adewid ganddynt yn y tymor hir i Lundain a gweddill y DU, y cyfleusterau a'r gwasanaethau a ddarperid a hinsawdd economaidd a gwleidyddol yn y DU.

O ran ariannu'r gemau, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon a Maer Llundain wedi cytuno ar becyn sy'n caniatáu gwario hyd at £2.375 biliwn o arian cyhoeddus. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys: £1.5 biliwn o'r Loteri Genedlaethol, gan gynnwys incwm o gêm loteri Olympaidd newydd a fydd yn rhedeg o'r fwyddyn nesaf os bydd y cais yn llwyddiannus; £625 miliwn oddi wrth Awdurdod Llundain Fwyaf, a dynnir o braesept treth gyngor ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn Llundain; a £250 miliwn oddi wrth Asiantaeth Datblygu Llundain.

Mae ffeil yr ymgeisydd hefyd yn cynnwys rhai gwarantau y mae'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol yn mynnu eu cael gan

Government. However, given that Wales will host some qualifying events, such as those in the Millennium Stadium, I was asked to provide letters on the administration's behalf lending our support to the bid and guaranteeing respect towards the Olympic charter and the host city charter as regards Wales, that the investment in healthcare required to support the hosting of Olympic events is compatible with our current plans, and support for measures taken by the Prime Minister and the Home Secretary to ensure the safe and peaceful celebration of the 2012 Olympic games in Wales. Similar guarantees were sought from Scottish Ministers. As events will no longer be held in Northern Ireland, Ministers there are not required to sign any guarantees.

Members will appreciate that the wording of the guarantees required careful consideration in the context of devolution. The process took time, and the IOC's deadline for submission of the bid was 15 November. I signed the guarantees on 29 October. While the financial implications are impossible to quantify at this early stage, we concluded that the signing of the guarantees represents a contingent liability that could exceed £100,000, and it is therefore a transaction that is notifiable to the Assembly.

3.30 p.m.

Given the lengthy negotiations that led up to us agreeing to the guarantees, it was not possible, given the IOC's impending deadline, to follow the normal notification procedures under Standing Order No. 21.16. I therefore agreed to sign up to the guarantees using the executive procedure.

At this stage, we have no way of knowing what the IOC might require with regard to traffic restrictions around the Millennium Stadium, such as those that are currently put in place for major rugby and football matches. Therefore, we cannot yet determine what the provision of such hypothetical requirements will cost, and neither can we be certain what proportion of any costs arising

Lywodraeth, y daw'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt i ran Llywodraeth y DU. Fodd bynnag, gan fydd Cymru'n cynnal rhai cystadlaethau rhagbrofol, fel y rhai yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm, gofynnwyd imi ddarparu llythrau ar ran y weinyddiaeth yn datgan ein cefnogaeth i'r cais ac yn gwarantu parch gan Gymru at y siarter Olympaidd a siarter y ddinas sydd am gynnal y gemau, bod y buddsoddi mewn gofal iechyd sy'n ofynnol i gynnal y cystadlaethau Olympaidd yn cydfynd â'n cynlluniau presennol, a chefnogaeth i gamau a gymerwyd gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref i sicrhau y gellir dathlu cynnal gemau Olympaidd 2012 yn ddiogel ac yn heddychlon yng Nghymru. Ceisiwyd gwarantau tebyg gan Weinidogion yr Alban. Gan na chynhelir cystadlaethau bellach yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, nid yw'n ofynnol i Weinidogion yno lofnodi unrhyw warantau.

Fel y bydd Aelodau'n deall, bu'n rhaid ystyried geiriad y gwarantau'n ofalus yng nghyd-destun datganoli. Yr oedd y broses wedi cymryd amser, a dyddiad cau'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cais oedd 15 Tachwedd. Llofnodais y gwarantau ar 29 Hydref. Er nad oes modd mesur maint y goblygiadau ariannol yn y cyfnod cynnar hwn, daethom i'r casgliad bod llofnodi'r gwarantau'n golygu rhwymedigaeth wrth gefn a allai fod yn fwy na £100,000, ac felly mae'n drafodiad y mae'n rhaid hysbysu'r Cynulliad amdano.

Yng ngolwg y negodiadau hirfaith a fu cyn inni gytuno i roi'r gwarantau, a chan fod dyddiad cau'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol yn dynesu, ni fu modd dilyn y gweithdrefnau hysbysu arferol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 21.16. Cytunais felly i lofnodi'r gwarantau gan ddefnyddio'r weithdrefn weithredol.

Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes modd inni wybod pa gyfyngiadau ar draffig y gallai'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol eu gofyn o gwmpas Stadiwm y Mileniwm, fel y rhai a roddir ar waith yn awr ar gyfer gemau rygbi a phêldroed mawr. Gan hynny, ni allwn bennu eto beth fydd cost darparu ar gyfer gofynion damcaniaethol o'r fath, ac ni allwn fod yn sicr ychwaith pa gyfran o unrhyw gostau a

from the respective guarantees might fall to the Assembly, to the Millennium Stadium plc or to Cardiff County Council. In an effort to minimise the risks to our resources, we have obtained an undertaking from the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport that the United Kingdom Government will consider any extraordinary costs that might, in principle, fall to us in relation to hosting the events at the Millennium Stadium. While this does not specifically state that the United Kingdom Government will meet these costs, we will make a strong case for it to do so.

Pe na baem wedi arwyddo'r gwarantau hyn, byddai cais Llundain, heb os nac oni bai, wedi ei wanhau yn sylweddol. Wrth ystyried y cais, bydd y Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol yn awyddus i weld mynegiad clir o gefnogaeth ledled y Deyrnas Unedig. Cefnogwn gais Llundain yn frwdfrydig, oherwydd byddai cais llwyddiannus yn creu cyfle unigryw i athletwyr o Gymru, yn ddynion a merched, gystadlu am fedalau Olympaidd o dan yr amgylchiadau mwyaf ffafriol posibl—byddent yn gyfarwydd â'r tywydd, ni fyddent yn bell o'u cartrefi, a byddent yn derbyn cefnogaeth mwyafrif llethol y dorf. Ni fyddem yn awyddus i gollir cyfle hwnnw ar gyfer ein pobl ifanc, na'r cyfle i ni ddarganfod y Lynn Davies nesaf yn 2012—os nad yw Nicole Cooke neu David Davies, y nofiwr, yn ennill medalau aur yn 2008.

Pe bai Cymro neu Gymraes yn ennill medal aur yng ngemau Olympaidd 2012 yn Llundain, byddai hynny'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol at godi proffil Cymru ar draws y byd chwaraeon. Fodd bynnag, byddai'r lles y gallem elwa arno yn dilyn llwyddiant yng ngemau Olympaidd Llundain yn mynd ymhellach na'r byd chwaraeon yn unig. Byddai diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru hefyd yn gallu denu ymwelwyr ychwanegol ar gefn cael y gemau Olympaidd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ymwelwyr o'r sector rhyngwladol lle yr ydym yn wan yn draddodiadol. Byddai cwmnïau o Gymru yn y sectorau adeiladu, gweithgynhyrchu a gwasanaeth yn gallu cystadlu am fusnes gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd a fyddai ar gael pe bai cais Llundain yn llwyddiannus.

godai o'r gwarantau perthnasol a allai ddod i ran y Cynulliad, Stadiwm y Mileniwm ccc neu Gyngor Sir Caerdydd. Er mwyn lleihau'r risgiau i'n hadnoddau, cawsom ymgymieriad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon y bydd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ystyried unrhyw gostau eithriadol a allai ddod i'n rhan, mewn egwyddor, mewn cysylltiad â chynnal y cystadlaethau yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Er na nodir yn hynny y bydd Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn talu'r costau hynny, byddwn yn dadlau'n gryf am iddi wneud hynny.

Had we not signed these guarantees, it would undoubtedly have significantly weakened London's bid. In considering the bid, the International Olympic Committee will want to see a clear demonstration of support from across the United Kingdom. We enthusiastically support London's bid, because a successful bid would provide a unique opportunity for sportsmen and women from Wales to compete for Olympic medals under the most favourable conditions possible—they would be acclimatised, at minimum distance from their homes, and they would receive the support of the vast majority of the crowd. We would not want to rob our young people of that opportunity or ourselves of the opportunity to discover the next Lynn Davies in 2012—if Nicole Cooke or David Davies, the swimmer, do not win gold medals in 2008.

If a Welshman or woman were to win a gold medal in the Olympic games in London in 2012, it would give a huge boost to Wales's profile on the world sporting stage. However, the potential benefits of London being successful in its bid to host the Olympic games would extend far beyond the world of sport. The Welsh tourism industry could also attract additional visitors were the Olympic games to visit Wales, especially visitors from the international sector where we are traditionally weak. Welsh companies in the construction, manufacturing and service sectors could compete for the multi-million pound contracts that would be on offer were London's bid to prove successful.

As regards making a statement notifying the Assembly as soon as possible after authorising the notifiable transaction, we did this, having given Members advance notice in the business statement of our intention. The Assembly was notified on 16 November, the day after the bid was formally submitted to the International Olympic Committee, that a statement would be made today. I request that the Assembly support the bid and help Wales to go for gold in 2012, on the greatest sporting stage that the world of sport has to offer.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pe bai'r gemau Olympaidd yn dod i Lundain yn 2012, byddai hynny'n ddigwyddiad o bwys, a byddem am roi pob cefnogaeth i bobl ifanc o Gymru a fyddai'n cymryd rhan yn y gemau hynny, i elwa ar y profiad arbennig hwnnw. I'r graddau hynny, yr ydym yn cefnogi'r hyn a ddywed y Prif Weinidog, mewn egwyddor.

Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf nifer o gwestiynau, rhai cwestiynau cyffredinol ac eraill yn benodol am y datganiad. Byddem yn disgwyl ein bod ni, fel Cymry, yn cyfrannu rhywfaint yn barod tuag at gost y gemau Olympaidd. Gan fod £1.5 biliwn yn cael ei neilltuo o'r loteri genedlaethol i ariannu'r cais, byddem yn disgwyl bod cyfran o arian y loteri o Gymru yn hynny. Yr oeddwn am wneud y pwynt cyffredinol hwnnw i ddechrau.

Yn ail, yr oedd y datganiad yn cyfeirio at ddefnyddio Stadiwm y Mileniwm ar gyfer gemau pêl-droed dynion a merched. Byddwn am weld mwy o ddefnydd o gyfleusterau yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi bwysleisio a chadarnhau eich cefnogaeth i ddefnyddio cyfleusterau yn y Gogledd, er enghraifft ym maes hwylio? Hoffwn wybod a fydd hyn yn rhan o'r cynllun a gyflwynir gyda'r cais. Yr ydych wedi enwi Stadiwm y Mileniwm, ond byddai'n dda i weddill Cymru pe baech yn cadarnhau eich cefnogaeth bersonol i gynnal digwyddiadau yn y Gogledd.

Er nad ydych yn gallu dweud faint o arian a warantwyd, a wnewch chi sicrhau, pe bai'r cais yn llwyddiannus, fod yr arian a neilltuir o bwrs cyhoeddus y Cynulliad yn cael ei wario ar ddigwyddiadau yng Nghymru? Nid oeddwn yn hapus gyda geiriad gwarant yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, y

Gyda golwg ar wneud datganiad yn hysbysu'r Cynulliad cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar ôl awdurdodi'r trafodiad hysbysadwy, gwnaethom hynny, gan ein bod wedi rhoi rhybudd o flaen llaw i Aelodau yn y datganiad busnes am ein bwriad. Hysbyswyd y Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd, drannoeth cyflwyno'r cais yn ffurfiol i'r Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol, y gwneid datganiad heddiw. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r cais a helpu Cymru i ddod i'r brig yn 2012, ar y llwyfan mwyaf a geir ym myd chwaraeon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The staging of the Olympic games in London in 2012 would be an important event, and we would want to fully support the young people from Wales who would participate in those games to ensure that they could benefit from that special experience. To that extent, we support what the First Minister has said, in principle.

However, I have a number of questions, some of which are general and others which refer specifically to the statement. We would expect that we, the people of Wales, are already contributing towards the costs of the Olympic games. As £1.5 billion of national lottery money has been allocated to fund the bid, we would expect that that includes a proportion of lottery money from Wales. I wanted to make that general point first.

Secondly, the statement referred to the use of the Millennium Stadium for men's and women's football. We would like to see greater use of facilities in Wales. Will you re-emphasise and reiterate your support for the use of facilities in north Wales, for example in staging sailing events? I would like to know whether this will be included in the plan to be submitted with the bid. The Millennium Stadium has been named, but it would be good for the rest of Wales if you were to confirm your personal support for the hosting of events in north Wales.

Even though you cannot say how much funding has been guaranteed, will you ensure that, if the bid is successful, the money allocated from the Assembly's public purse is spent on events in Wales? I was not happy with the wording of the undertaking given by the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and

Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon.

The undertaking given by the Secretary of State is weak. Your statement says that there is an undertaking that the UK Government

‘will consider any extraordinary costs that might in principle fall to us in relation to hosting the events at the Millennium Stadium.’

However, there is no guarantee that it will even do this. Therefore, exactly what assurance have you received?

Yn olaf, mae gennyf bwynt am ddyled a allai ddeillio o'r gemau. Gwyddom fod Athen a nifer o fannau a gynhaliodd y gemau wedi wynebu dyledion. Ni fyddwn yn dymuno gweld arian o goffrau'r Cynulliad yn cael ei neilltuo i warantu colledion gemau Llundain.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Diolch am y gefnogaeth gyffredinol. Nid wyf yn cytuno â'r gosodiad bod arian y loteri yn cael ei ddefnyddio i ariannu'r cais. Yn ôl y wybodaeth sydd gennyf, nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae'r cais yn cael ei ariannu gan gyllid yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, awdurdod datblygu Llundain a'r sector preifat. Os wyf yn anghywir ynglŷn â hynny, fe ysgrifennaf atoch.

O ran Stadiwm y Mileniwm a pham mae'n cael ei drin yn wahanol, er enghraifft, i wersylloedd hyfforddi ar gyfer digwyddiadau hwylio yn Abersoch, Pwllheli neu Borthmadog, mae'r cais yn cynnwys yr ymrwymiad y caiff rowndiau cyn-derfynol y cystadleuthau pêl-droed i fenywod a dynion eu cynnal yn y stadiwm. Ynghylch gwerylloedd hyfforddi, rhaid gwneud ceisiadau gwahanol. Gall ardaloedd sy'n dymuno cymryd rhan wneud cais i gynnal gwerylloedd hyfforddi yn y tair neu bedair blynedd cyn y gemau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A ydych yn cefnogi hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai'n rhaid inni ystyried sut y gallem helpu ardaloedd i wneud hynny. Mae hwn yn fusnes mawr. Y broblem yw bod rhai o'r timau mawr yn

Sport.

Mae'r ymgymeriad a roddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn un gwan. Yn eich datganiad, dywedir bod ymgymeriad y bydd Llywodraeth y DU

yn ystyried unrhyw gostau eithriadol a allai ddod i'n rhan, mewn egwyddor, mewn cysylltiad â chynnal y cystadlaethau yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm.

Er hynny, nid oes gwarant y gwnaiff hynny hyd yn oed. Felly, pa sicrwydd yn union a gawsoch?

Finally, I have a point on the debt that could be generated. Athens and other host cities faced debts as a result of the games. We would not want to see Assembly funding used as a guarantee against any losses incurred by the London games.

**The First Minister:** Thank you for your general support. I do not agree with the statement that lottery money has been used to fund the bid. The information that I have shows that this is not the case. The bid is being funded by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, the London Development Agency and the private sector. If I am wrong about that, I will write to you.

In terms of the Millennium Stadium and why it is being treated differently to, for example, training camps for sailing events in Abersoch, Pwllheli or Porthmadog, the bid contains an undertaking that the semi-final rounds of the men's and women's football competitions will be held in the stadium. Separate bids must be made for training camps. Areas wishing to take part will be able to submit bids to host training camps in the three to four years leading up to the games.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Is this something that you support?

**The First Minister:** We would have to consider how we could help areas to do this. This is big business. The problem is that some of the big teams expect to be funded by



disgwyl i ardaloedd dalu amdanynt oherwydd y fantais economaidd a ddaw yn eu sgîl. Os yw ardal yn dymuno croesawu timoedd Unol Daleithiau America neu Rwsia, mae disgwyl i'r ardal dalu amdanynt, a gallai hyn fod yn gostus.

3.40 p.m.

Dyma pam mae'r ddau berson sydd wedi bod yn aelodau o grŵp y rhanbarthau a'r cenhedloedd—ac mae un o'r Gogledd, sef David MacLean ac un o'r De, sef John Lister—yn eistedd ar y pwyllgor hwnnw. Ni allech gael dau berson sydd yn fwy gwybodus am gysylltu hyn â busnes a gwneud elw o chwaraeon, a gallent roi llawer o gymorth i unrhyw ardal neu safle yn y diwydiant twristiaeth sydd yn credu y gallai gystadlu i fod yn wersyll hyfforddi.

Yr ydym yn hollol gytûn ynglŷn â'r gwarantau. Nid gwarant cyffredinol am gost gemau'r Olympaidd ydyw, ond gwarant sydd yn ymwneud â'r elfen o gemau'r Olympaidd sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru, sef y gemau pêl droed yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm.

O ran geiriad y gwarant a'r ffaith nad yw'r hyn y mae'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon yn fodlon talu amdano yn hollol gadarn, nid oes gennym sicrwydd, ond mae'r adran wedi derbyn mai mater i ni a'r adran ei drafod yw sut yr ydym yn delio â'r costau hyn. Bydd yn fater o resymeg a'n gallu i ddadlau y dylai rhai o'r costau annisgwyl gwmpo ar yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ac nid arnom ni. Mae'r adran wedi derbyn yr egwyddor mai mater o ddadlau rhyngddi hi a ni yw hwn yn hytrach na mater ohonom ni yn derbyn y costau. Felly, bydd yn rhaid inni ddadlau gyda'r adran yn ôl yr egwyddorion sydd wedi'u gosod yn y geiriad sydd gennym.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the First Minister for this statement. We will support this. The news about the Millennium Stadium is good for Wales. We will give this appropriate support in the Chamber, and Laura Anne Jones, our spokesperson on this subject, will give her support in committee.

their host locations in return for the financial benefit that they bring to those areas. If a location wanted to host the American or Russian teams, it would have to foot the bill, and this could prove to be quite expensive.

This is why the two people who have been members of the regions and nations group—one is from north Wales, namely David MacLean and one is from south Wales, namely John Lister—sit on that committee. You could not have two people who are more knowledgeable about linking this with business and making profit from sports, and they could give any region or complex in the tourism industry, which felt that it could compete to become a host for training camps, a great deal of assistance.

We totally agree on the guarantees. It is not a general guarantee for the cost of the Olympic games but a guarantee appertaining to the element of the Olympic games taking place in Wales, namely the football matches in the Millennium Stadium.

On the wording of the guarantee and the fact that it is not set in stone as regards what the Department for Culture, Media and Sport is willing to pay for, we do not have an assurance, but it has accepted that this is a matter to be negotiated between us and the department as to how we should deal with these costs. It will be a matter of reasoning and of our ability to argue that some of the unexpected costs should fall on the DCMS and not on us. The department has accepted the principle that this is a matter of negotiation between it and us and that it is not a matter of our accepting the costs. Therefore, we will have to argue with the DCMS according to the principles set in the wording that we have.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ddatganiad. Byddwn yn cefnogi hyn. Mae'r newyddion am Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn dda i Gymru. Rhown gefnogaeth briodol i hyn yn y Siambr, a bydd Laura Anne Jones, ein llefarydd ar y pwnc hwn, yn rhoi ei chefnogaeth yn y pwyllgor.

There are clear benefits here in terms of sport tourism, the economy generally and fitness and health. I accept that there is no lottery implication in the bid, but if the games happen in London, I hope that an assessment will be made of the impact that that might have on lottery funding and of the possible knock-on effect on events and on the funding of organisations and so on in Wales. I would welcome reassurance on that.

On the facilities—and it is terrific news about the Millennium Stadium—are we pushing the case of the velodrome, and for events such as sailing and shooting to be held in north and mid Wales, as the leader of Plaid Cymru said? We have a range of facilities that could be used, and I hope that we are getting in at an early opportunity to push the case for those.

I would welcome comments from the First Minister on the possible knock-on effect that a successful bid for a London Olympic games in 2012 might have on a Welsh bid for the Commonwealth games in 2014. This has not been touched upon. It is being suggested in some quarters that this move might weaken our bid for the Commonwealth games. I hope that that is not the case, and I would welcome reassurance on it.

I thank the First Minister again for the statement and urge him to keep us informed as appropriate on any developments. I would be grateful if he would deal with the points that I have raised.

**The First Minister:** I am grateful for your general support, and I will try to deal with your points. If I miss any out, we will check the Record tomorrow, and I will write you a supplementary letter on them and place it in the Library.

You are right about lottery money not being used to fund the bid, but if London is successful, a lottery contribution would be made, as I mentioned. Our percentage share of the £340 million sport lottery contribution towards delivering the games would be invested wholly in Wales to strengthen the

Mae manteision amlwg yn hyn o beth o ran twristiaeth chwaraeon, yr economi'n gyffredinol a ffitrwydd ac iechyd. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad oes unrhyw gysylltiad rhwng y loteri a'r cais, ond os cynhelir y gemau yn Llundain, yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwneir asesiad o'r effaith bosibl o hynny ar gyllid y loteri ac o'r effeithiau dilynol posibl ar ddigwyddiadau ac ar yr ariannu ar gyfer cyrff ac yn y blaen yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn falch o gael sicrwydd ar hynny.

Ynghylch y cyfleusterau—ac mae hwn yn newydd gwych am Stadiwm y Mileniwm—a ydym yn hyrwyddo achos y felodrom, ac yn dadlau o blaid cynnal cystadlaethau fel hwylio a saethu yn y Gogledd a'r Canolbarth, fel y dywedodd arweinydd Plaid Cymru y dyldid? Mae gennym amryw o gyfleusterau y gellid eu defnyddio, a gobeithiaf ein bod yn achub ar y cyfle i gyflwyno'r achos drostynt yn gynnar.

Byddwn yn falch o glywed sylwadau gan y Prif Weinidog am yr effaith ddilynol bosibl a geid, os bydd y cais i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd yn Llundain yn 2012 yn llwyddiannus, ar gais gan Gymru i gynnal gemau'r Gymanwlad yn 2014. Ni chyfeiriwyd at hyn. Awgrymir mewn rhai cylchoedd y gallai'r cam hwn wanhau ein cais i gynnal gemau'r Gymanwlad. Gobeithiaf nad yw hynny'n wir, a byddwn yn falch o gael sicrwydd o hynny.

Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog eto am y datganiad ac fe'i hanogaf i roi gwybod inni am unrhyw ddatblygiadau, fel y bo'n briodol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gwnaiff drafod y pwyntiau a godais.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cefnogaeth gyffredinol, a cheisiaf ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Os byddaf yn methu rhai, gwiriwn y Cofnod yfory, ac anfonaf lythyr atodol atoch yn eu cylch a'i osod yn y Llyfrgell.

Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud na ddefnyddir arian y loteri i ariannu'r cais, ond os bydd Llundain yn llwyddo, gwneir cyfraniad gan y loteri, fel y dywedais. Byddai ein canran o'r cyfraniad o £340 miliwn o'r loteri chwaraeon tuag at gynnal y gemau'n cael ei buddsoddi'n gyfan gwbl yng

overall UK proposition. I realise that there are concerns about the impact that a successful bid might have on lottery funding for existing good causes in Wales. Alun Pugh will keep a close eye on that, and it will feature strongly in all of the discussions with the Secretary of State over the next seven or eight years if the bid is successful.

Both Ieuan and you mentioned that it is good to have this news about the Millennium Stadium being chosen to host qualifying events in men's and women's football tournaments, but you also asked about other strong sports facilities in Wales, such as sailing, the new velodrome and so on. It will be up to local authorities, private sector owners of sports complexes such as the Celtic Manor or whatever, to decide whether they want to bid for training camps. The biggest teams expect to have facilities largely free of charge. It can therefore become competitive. The USA always expects a subsidy for the biggest team, because it brings so much spending power with it, but there will be other areas where we will expect to maximise, provided that we get something out of it. We are not going to say, 'Have the velodrome for six months leading up to the Olympics, there will be no Welsh cyclists in it and all these teams will be allowed in'. That would not be popular with Welsh cyclists, who themselves would expect to use the velodrome to prepare for going for gold in the 2012 Olympics. This must be dealt with carefully, given the fact that training camps are a competitive issue, and the tradition has arisen that the biggest teams expect to have the facilities almost free of charge. The smaller ones do not, and that may be one area where we might gain some benefit.

On the Commonwealth games in 2014, I believe, Nick—you may disagree—that going for that would be regarded as greedy by the international community; it would not be possible to have two multi-sports games of that nature in the same overall jurisdiction. Wales is part of the United Kingdom and that is how it would be viewed worldwide. If the London bid is successful, my inclination

Nghymru i ategu'r fenter gyffredinol yn y DU. Sylweddolaf fod pryderon ynghylch yr effaith bosibl ar gyllid y loteri ar gyfer yr achosion da presennol yng Nghymru, pe bai'r cais yn llwyddiannus. Bydd Alun Pugh yn cadw golwg barcud ar hynny, a bydd lle amlwg i hynny yn yr holl drafodaethau â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros y saith neu wyth mlynedd nesaf os bydd y cais yn llwyddiannus.

Gwnaeth Ieuan a chi ddweud mai peth da yw clywed y newyddion hyn am ddewis Stadiwm y Mileniwm i gynnal cystadlaethau rhagbrofol yn y twrnameintiau pêl-droed i ddynion a menywod, ond gwnaethoch holi hefyd am gyfleusterau chwaraeon amlwg eraill yng Nghymru, fel y rhai ar gyfer hwylio, y felodrom newydd ac yn y blaen. Lle awdurdodau lleol, perchnogion canolfannau chwaraeon yn y sector preifat fel y Celtic Manor ac yn y blaen, fydd penderfynu a ydynt am ymgeisio i gael gwrsylloedd hyfforddi. Mae'r timau mwyaf yn disgwyl cael cyfleusterau'n rhad ac am ddim gan mwyaf. Felly, gall fod yn fater cystadleuol. Mae UDA bob amser yn disgwyl cael cymhorthdal gan mai ei thîm hi yw'r un mwyaf, am ei fod yn dod â chymaint o bŵer gwario yn ei sgîl, ond bydd meysydd eraill lle disgwylwn fanteisio i'r eithaf, ar y amod y cawn rywbeth ohono. Ni fyddwn yn dweud, 'Cymerwch y felodrom am chwe mis cyn y gemau Olympaidd, ni fydd unrhyw feicwyr o Gymru yno a chaiff yr holl dimau hyn ei ddefnyddio'. Ni fyddai hynny'n boblogaidd gan feicwyr o Gymru, a ddisgwyliai gael defnyddio'r felodrom eu hunain i baratoi ar gyfer cystadlaethau yn y gemau Olympaidd yn 2012. Rhaid delio â hyn yn ofalus, gan fod gwrsylloedd hyfforddi'n fater cystadleuol, ac mae traddodiad wedi codi bod y timau mwyaf yn disgwyl cael y cyfleusterau'n rhad ac am ddim bron. Nid ydyw'r rhai llai, ac efallai y caem rywfaint o fantais o hynny.

Ynghylch gemau'r Gymanwlad yn 2014, yr wyf fi'n credu, Nick—efallai yr anghytunwch—y byddai gwneud cais am hynny'n cael ei ystyried yn farus gan y gymuned ryngwladol; ni ellid cael dwy set o gemau ag amryfal chwaraeon o'r math hwnnw yn yr un awdurdodaeth gyffredinol. Mae Cymru'n rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac felly y câi ei hystyried drwy'r byd. Os bydd

would be to put a bid for the Commonwealth games on ice for another four years, and consider bidding for it in 2018. That does not mean that we do not support the London bid wholeheartedly—we do. The Olympics is 10 times bigger than the Commonwealth games, and its profile is probably 50 times bigger worldwide. However, if the London bid is not successful, we will have learnt an enormous amount from the bidding process, which will be of benefit to us if we mount a bid for the Commonwealth games in 2014. I believe that the Scots take roughly the same view.

**Michael German:** First, I give the Liberal Democrats' support to London's bid. I cannot think of a city that is more diverse than London. It is home to hundreds of different languages and communities; there cannot be another city in the world to which people from countries around the world could come and feel at home. However, that is also a part of the problem that we face. The size of London and its diverse nature lends itself to a compact Olympic games. The challenge for Wales is what profile it can gain as a result. That is a profile, as you rightly said, in terms of the construction of buildings, our companies, and tourism and a knowledge and understanding of Wales. We must examine the proposal in more depth. Clearly, as has been said, there will be a knock-on effect on the lottery funding should the games go to London. Lottery funding is declining in the United Kingdom as more and more people turn away from the lottery; the amount of money is not rising in real terms. Therefore, I am glad that you made a statement about Sportslot, that the Sportslot contribution that would have come to Wales anyway will remain in Wales, because that is significant. What is your understanding of the split between the amount of lottery funding in the new lottery, if London is successful, to host the games, and the existing lottery? We know that we would be challenged by the new lottery in terms of the amounts coming to Wales.

3.50 p.m.

Out of £1.5 billion of lottery funding, one would expect, under normal circumstances,

Llundain yn llwyddo yn ei chais, tueddwn i feddwl y dylid rhoi'r cais am gynnal gemau'r Gymanwlad o'r neilltu am bedair blynedd arall, ac ystyried gwneud cais amdanynt yn 2018. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad ydym yn llwyr gefnogi cais Llundain—yr ydym yn gwneud. Mae'r gemau Olympaidd yn 10 gwaith yn fwy na gemau'r Gymanwlad, ac mae'n debyg eu bod yn 50 gwaith yn fwy adnabyddus drwy'r byd. Er hynny, os na fydd cais Llundain yn llwyddo, byddwn wedi dysgu llawer iawn o'r broses ymgeisio, a fydd o fantais i ni os gwnawn gais i gynnal gemau'r Gymanwlad yn 2014. Credaf mai tebyg yw barn yr Albanwyr.

**Michael German:** Yn gyntaf, datganaf gefnogaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gais Llundain. Ni allaf feddwl am yr un ddinas sydd mor amrywiol ag y mae Llundain. Mae'n gartref i gannoedd o wahanol ieithoedd a chymunedau; ni all fod yr un ddinas arall yn y byd y gallai pobl dyrru iddi o wledydd ar draws y byd a theimlo'n gartrefol ynddi. Er hynny, mae hynny'n un agwedd ar y broblem a wynebwn. Mae maint Llundain a'i natur amrywiol yn addas i gynnal gemau Olympaidd cryno. Yr her i Gymru yw pa amlygrwydd y gall ei ennill o ganlyniad. Amlygrwydd yw hynny, fel y dywedwch, sy'n ymwneud â chodi adeiladau, ein cwmnïau, a thwristiaeth a gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth o Gymru. Rhaid inni edrych ar y cynnig yn fanylach. Fel y dywedwyd, mae'n amlwg y ceir effaith ddilynol ar gyllid y loteri os daw'r gemau i Lundain. Mae cyllid y loteri'n lleihau yn y Deyrnas Unedig wrth i fwyfwy o bobl droi oddi wrth y loteri; nid yw swm yr arian yn codi o ran ei wir werth. Felly, yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi gwneud datganiad am Sportlot, gan ddweud y bydd y cyfraniad a gâi Cymru gan Sportlot beth bynnag yn aros yng Nghymru, gan fod hynny'n bwysig. Beth a ddeallwch am y rhaniad rhwng maint y cyllid loteri yn y loteri newydd, os bydd Llundain yn llwyddiannus, i gynnal y gemau, a'r loteri bresennol? Gwyddom y byddai'r loteri newydd yn peri anhawster i ni o ran y symiau a ddeuai i Gymru.

O'r £1.5 biliwn o gyllid y loteri, byddai rhywun yn disgwyl, o dan amgylchiadau

that £75 million would come to Wales. That is the kind of challenge that we face. What analysis of that has been done? Also, do you know whether Wales will get the profile it needs from this bid, represented by the amount of impact that we have, not only in qualifying games, but major events? As I said, the problem with London is that it lends itself to compact games, therefore, the amount of major events that would take place with the major broadcasters outside of London is relatively limited. I also question you on the liabilities to Cardiff and Wales, particularly to the Millennium Stadium. We are all aware of what happens when there is a major event in Cardiff—there are police costs and enormous traffic problems. Dealing with traffic problems is a big issue for Cardiff and we will probably experience such problems this weekend, when Cardiff will be put to the test in that respect. If the London bid is successful, do you think that there is a case to be made by the Welsh Assembly Government for transport infrastructure work in Cardiff to be included in a bid in order to ease the problems and make it possible for the Olympic games to come to London and other areas in UK?

**The First Minister:** You asked many questions; I will do my best to answer them all. You are right that a city like London has a much better chance of winning the Olympic bid if it puts forward a compact bid. You get many ticks in boxes if six or seven of the major sporting facilities are within walking distance of each other. I do not think that Paris offers that, although its bid is strong in many other ways. However, because London's site for the games is in an area of brownfield land, everything can be constructed so that it is within reasonable walking and cycling distance. You may say that that makes the London Olympics an east-London compact, zone-based Olympics. That is one of the reasons why qualifying tournaments for the football are the easiest events to take outside London to Scotland and Wales, which is the proposal—not the final match, but the qualifying games. However, they may also attract large crowds, although possibly not as large as for the

arferol, y deuai £75 miliwn i Gymru. Dyna'r math o her a wynebwn. Pa ddadansoddiad a wnaed o hynny? Hefyd, a wyddoch a gaiff Cymru'r lle amlwg y mae arni ei angen drwy'r cais hwn, gan fesur hynny yn ôl maint yr effaith a gawn, nid yn unig o ran cynnal gemau rhagbrofol, ond o ran y cystadlaethau mawr? Fel y dywedais, y broblem sydd ynglŷn â Llundain yw ei bod yn addas i gynnal gemau cryno, felly nifer cymharol fach o gystadlaethau mawr a gynhelid y tu allan i Lundain a'r darlledwyr mwyaf yn bresennol. Fe'ch holaf hefyd ynghylch yr atebolrwydd a ddaw i ran Caerdydd a Chymru, yn enwedig mewn cysylltiad â Stadiwm y Mileniwm. Gwyddom oll beth a ddigwydd pan geir digwyddiad mawr yng Nghaerdydd—mae costau ar gyfer yr heddlu a phroblemau mawr mewn cysylltiad â thraffig. Bydd y gallu i ddelio â phroblemau sy'n ymwneud â thraffig yn fater o bwys i Gaerdydd ac mae'n debyg y profwn broblemau o'r fath y penwythnos hwn, pan fydd Caerdydd ar brawf yn hynny o beth. Os bydd cais Llundain yn llwyddiannus, a ydych yn credu y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddadlau y dylid cynnwys gwaith ar y seilwaith trafndiaeth yng Nghaerdydd yn y cais er mwyn lleddfu'r problemau a galluogi'r gemau Olympaidd i ddod i Lundain a rhannau eraill o'r DU?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gofynasoch lawer o gwestiynau; gwnaf fy ngorau i ateb pob un ohonynt. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod gwell cyfle i ddinas fel Llundain lwyddo yn ei chais i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd os bydd yn cyflwyno cais cryno. Cewch fantais fawr os yw chwech neu saith o'r prif gyfleusterau chwaraeon o fewn pellter cerdded i'w gilydd. Ni chredaf fod Paris yn cynnig hynny, er bod ei chais yn un cryf mewn sawl modd arall. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y safle y mae Llundain yn ei gynnig ar gyfer y gemau mewn ardal tir llwyd, gellir codi'r holl adeiladau fel eu bod o fewn pellter rhesymol i'w gilydd ar droed neu ar feic. Gallech ddweud y byddai hynny'n peri i'r gemau Olympaidd yn Llundain fod yn rhai cryno sydd wedi'u lleoli mewn rhan o ddwyrain Llundain. Dyna un o'r rhesymau mai'r twrnameintiau pêl-droed rhagbrofol yw'r cystadlaethau hawsaf i'w cynnal y tu allan i Lundain yn yr Alban a Chymru, sef yr hyn a gynigir—nid y gêm derfynol, ond y

Wales versus New Zealand match, which attracted over 74,000 spectators.

The experience of New South Wales and the rest of Australia in 2000, and Greece in 2004, was that there was a huge increase in the number of international visitors, not all of whom went to the Olympics. There are numerous business events which are arranged in the same country or within 100 or 150 miles of the games. Therefore, there will undoubtedly be enormous opportunities for business conferences and cultural events. The Olympics is much more than a traditional sporting event now; there is always a parallel set of cultural Olympics that takes place at the same time, or in the same year at least, in the same country. We have to ensure that we maximise the opportunities in that regard. Business conferences and exhibitions will mysteriously take place within 100 to 200 miles of the Olympics. An enhanced flow of tourists will visit the UK and we have to ensure, especially given Wales's strength in activity tourism, that we get our maximum share of visitors.

You asked an interesting question about lottery funding, but your figures are somewhat out of date. People did get bored with the lottery around two or three years ago, but it was revamped and now the lottery take has seen a sustained rebirth for the past two years. Therefore, I am not sure that, if the Olympic lottery game is successful, there would be less money for good causes. However, it must be monitored and, if the London bid is successful, Alun Pugh will be in constant contact with Tessa Jowell on that matter over the next seven or eight years. If I have left anything out of my answer, I will write to you after further consultation with Alun.

On your final point on infrastructure in Cardiff, I would be surprised if Olympic-qualifying tournaments attracted crowds as big those we had on Saturday in that outstanding, but ultimately slightly unsuccessful, sporting encounter between

gemau rhagbrofol. Er hynny, gallent hwy ddenu torfeydd mawr hefyd, er nad rhai cymaint â'r rhai yn y gêm rhwng Cymru a Seland Newydd o bosibl, gan fod honno wedi denu mwy na 74,000 i'w gwyllo.

Y profiad a gafodd De Cymru Newydd a gweddill Awstralia yn 2000, a Gwlad Groeg yn 2004, oedd bod cynnydd mawr yn nifer yr ymwelwyr o wledydd tramor, nad aethant i gyd i'r gemau Olympaidd. Trefnir nifer mawr o ddigwyddiadau busnes yn yr un wlad neu o fewn 100 neu 150 o filltiroedd i'r gemau. Gan hynny, mae'n sicr y ceir cyfleoedd rhagorol i gynnal cynadleddau busnes a digwyddiadau diwylliannol. Mae'r gemau Olympaidd yn beth llawer amgenach na digwyddiad chwaraeon traddodiadol yn awr; cynhelir cystadlaethau Olympaidd diwylliannol i gyd-fynd â hwy bob amser, ar yr un adeg, neu yn yr un flwyddyn o leiaf, yn yr un wlad. Rhaid inni sicrhau y manteisiwn i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a geir yn hynny o beth. Bydd cynadleddau busnes ac arddangosfeydd yn cael eu cynnal, yn anesboniadwy, o fewn 100 i 200 milltir i'r gemau Olympaidd. Daw mwy o ymwelwyr i'r DU a rhaid inni sicrhau, yn enwedig yng ngolwg rhagoriaeth Cymru ym maes twristiaeth gweithgareddau, y cawn y gyfran fwyaf posibl o'r ymwelwyr.

Gofynasoch gwestiwn diddorol am gyllid y loteri, ond mae'ch ffigurau braidd yn hen. Gwnaeth pobl flino ar y loteri tua dwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl, ond fe'i hailwampiwyd ac mae derbyniadau'r loteri wedi codi'n gyson dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. Gan hynny, nid wyf yn credu, os bydd y gêm loteri Olympaidd yn llwyddiannus, y byddai llai o arian ar gyfer achosion da. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cadw golwg ar hynny ac, os bydd cais Llundain yn llwyddiannus, bydd Alun Pugh mewn cysylltiad yn gyson â Tessa Jowell ynghylch y mater hwnnw dros y saith neu wyth mlynedd nesaf. Os wyf wedi gadael unrhyw beth allan o'm hateb, ysgrifennaf atoch ar ôl ymgynghori ymhellach ag Alun.

Ynghylch y pwynt olaf a wnaethoch am seilwaith yng Nghaerdydd, byddwn yn synnu pe denai trwrnameintiau rhagbrofol y gemau Olympaidd dorfeydd mor fawr â'r rhai a gawsom ddydd Sadwrn yn yr ornest ragorol honno, a fu rhywfaint yn aflwyddiannus yn y

Wales and New Zealand. I think that only the final game would attract 74,000 people, and that we would be talking about crowds of up to 50,000, which could probably be handled easily without additional infrastructure support. The International Olympic Committee may take a different view and may request further work to be done to meet its standards, and we would have to meet those when its requirements were clarified.

**John Griffiths:** Many opportunities will come to Wales and its people as a result of a successful Olympic bid. It is important that we maximise those benefits: the possible benefits for Welsh athletes competing near to home, and spectators. Hopefully, many people from Wales will have the opportunity to go along to watch the Olympic games, both at the Millennium Stadium and perhaps in London itself. The use of the Millennium Stadium will provide opportunities to raise the profile of Wales and, hopefully, benefit tourism.

Companies in Wales can also bid for the business opportunities available. What work will be done to ensure that those benefits are maximised? Will there be advice and support for businesses in Wales with regard to the opportunities available and how they can best take advantage of them? Will we make representations as to how we could best facilitate the attendance of Welsh spectators in London, for example, and ensure that those opportunities are available widely across the social spectrum?

Returning to the velodrome, which is in Newport East, will the Welsh Assembly Government support any bid by the local authority, in terms of providing advice and encouragement, for the velodrome to be used for training purposes in the run-up to the Olympic games, should it decide to make such a bid?

**The First Minister:** I will start with the last question first. It is interesting, as the velodrome is not a free-standing facility—it is in the middle of a complex of facilities of an extraordinary kind. It is rather like a micro version of what is proposed for east London for the Olympics itself. That means that Newport Borough Council, as the owner of

diwedd, rhwng Cymru a Seland Newydd. Credaf mai dim ond y gêm derfynol a ddenai 74,000 o bobl, ac mai torfeydd o hyd at 50,000 a geid, y gellid eu trafod yn rhwydd yn ôl pob tebyg, heb gael cymorth ar gyfer seilwaith ychwanegol. Efallai mai gwahanol fydd barn y Pwyllgor Olympaidd Rhyngwladol a gallai ofyn am wneud gwaith pellach i gyrraedd ei safonau, a byddem yn gorfod eu cyrraedd pan eglurid ei ofynion.

**John Griffiths:** Daw llawer o gyfleoedd i ran Cymru a'i phobl os bydd y cais i gynnal y gemau Olympaidd yn llwyddiannus. Mae'n bwysig inni wneud y mwyaf o'r manteision hynny: y manteision posibl i athletwyr o Gymru wrth gystadlu'n agos i gartref, ac i wylwyr. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd llawer o bobl o Gymru'n cael cyfle i fynd i weld y gemau Olympaidd, yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm ac efallai yn Llundain ei hun. Bydd y defnydd o Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn cynnig cyfleoedd i hybu amlygrwydd Cymru a gobeithio yn hybu twristiaeth.

Gall cwmnïau yng Nghymru hefyd ymgeisio i achub ar y cyfleoedd busnes sydd ar gael. Pa waith a wneir i sicrhau y ceir y mwyaf o'r manteision hynny? A roddir cyngor a chymorth i fusnesau yng Nghymru gyda golwg ar y cyfleoedd sydd ar gael a'r modd gorau iddynt fanteisio arnynt? A gyflwynwn sylwadau ynghylch y modd gorau inni hwyluso presenoldeb gan wylwyr o Gymru yn Llundain, er enghraifft, a sicrhau bod y cyfleoedd hynny ar gael ar draws y sbectrwm cymdeithasol?

Gan droi'n ôl at y felodrom, sydd yn Nwyrain Casnewydd, a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogi unrhyw gais a wneir gan yr awdurdod lleol, drwy gynnig cymorth ac anogaeth, am gael defnyddio'r felodrom i ddibenion hyfforddi yn y cyfnod cyn y gemau Olympaidd, os penderfyna wneud cais o'r fath?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymdriniaf â'r cwestiwn olaf yn gyntaf. Mae hyn yn ddi-ddorol, gan nad yw'r felodrom yn gyfleuster sy'n sefyll ar ei ben ei hun—mae ar ganol cyfadeilad o gyfleusterau o fath eithriadol. Mae'n eithaf tebyg i fersiwn bach o'r hyn a gynigir yn nwyrain Llundain ar gyfer y gemau Olympaidd eu hunain. Oherwydd hynny,

most of those facilities, with some input from the Sport Council for Wales and so forth, could decide that it wants to bid to have a medium-sized delegation there, covering tennis, athletics, cycling and so on, taking advantage of the fact that there are so many sporting facilities close together there. As I recall, the Greek cycling team was based in Newport for the run-up to the Athens Olympics, because the Athens velodrome was not ready. The Newport velodrome was the most similar cycling facility to it.

There is an opportunity there, if Newport decides to bid, but it will be a hard negotiation, because people want the earth from you for the privilege of hosting them. They do not want to pay you for it; you are supposed to do it for the honour of hosting them. Therefore, it is a difficult negotiation to undertake, particularly with some of the bigger and more commercial countries. Regarding your other point about maximising business opportunities, I do not think we can do better than having the two representatives that we have on the Olympics nations and regions committee in John Liston and David Mclean. I am sure that they would be anxious to help any business persons that wanted to get in on the act, if the London bid were successful, in terms of bidding for either service contracts, building contracts or products of different kinds associated with the Olympics.

Regarding attendance, if we are still waiting in 2012 for the next Lynn Davies as an individual winner, if Nicole Cooke or David Davies have not won in 2008, the whole point of a home Olympics only 150 miles from Wales is that, with crowd support and with British-type weather, there is the best possible opportunity for an individual from these islands to win Olympic gold, as Lynn Davies did in Tokyo in 1964, in rain that he said was similar to the rain in Nant-y-moel. It means that the athletes will not be far from home, and will have crowd support. I hope to be one of the spectators; I will put my name down for a ticket shortly, as I have never been to the Olympics.

gallai cyngor bwrdeistref Casnewydd, ac yntau'n berchen ar y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfleusterau hynny, benderfynu, o gael rhywfaint o gymorth gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru ac yn y blaen, ei fod yn dymuno ymgeisio i gael dirprwyaeth o faint canolig yno, a fyddai'n cynnwys tennis, athleteg, seiclo ac yn y blaen, gan fanteisio ar y ffaith bod cynifer o gyfleusterau chwaraeon yno sy'n agos at ei gilydd. Os cofiaf yn iawn, yr oedd tîm seiclo Gwlad Groeg wedi'i leoli yng Nghasnewydd yn y cyfnod cyn y gemau Olympaidd yn Athen, gan nad oedd felodrom Athen yn barod. Felodrom Casnewydd oedd y cyfleuster seiclo a oedd debycaf iddo.

Mae cyfle ar gael, os bydd Casnewydd yn penderfynu ymgeisio, ond bydd y negodi'n waith caled, gan fod pobl am gael y byd gennych am y ffraind o gael eu presenoldeb. Nid ydynt am dalu i chi amdano; chi sydd i fod i wneud hynny'n gyfnewid am y ffraind o'u croesawu. Felly, mae'n waith negodi anodd, yn enwedig yn achos rhai o'r gwledydd mwyaf a mwyaf masnachol. Gyda golwg ar y pwynt arall a wnaethoch am amlhau'r cyfleoedd busnes, ni chredaf y gallwn ragori ar gael y ddau gynrychiolydd sydd gennym ar bwyllgor cenedloedd a rhanbarthau'r gemau Olympaidd, sef John Liston a David Mclean. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent yn awyddus i helpu unrhyw bobl busnes a oedd am gael cymryd rhan, os bydd cais Llundain yn llwyddiannus, o ran ymgeisio am gontractau am wasanaethau, contractau adeiladu neu gynhyrchion o wahanol fathau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gemau Olympaidd.

Ynghylch ymbresenoli, os byddwn yn dal i ddisgwyl yn 2012 am gael gweld y Lynn Davies nesaf yn ennill fel unigolyn, os na fydd Nicole Cooke neu David Davies wedi ennill yn 2008, y peth pwysicaf ynghylch cael gemau Olympaidd cartref nad yw ond 150 milltir o Gymru yw, o gael cefnogaeth gan y dorf a hynny yn y math o dywydd a geir ym Mhrydain, y ceir y cyfle gorau posibl i unigolyn o'r nysoedd hyn ennill medal aur Olympaidd, fel y gwnaeth Lynn Davies yn Tokyo yn 1964, yng nghanol glaw y dywedodd ei fod yn debyg i'r glaw yn Nant-y-moel. Mae'n golygu na fydd yr athletwyr yn bell oddi cartref, a chânt gefnogaeth gan y dorf. Gobeithiaf y byddaf ymhlith y



gwylwyr; gwnaf gais am docyn cyn hir, gan na fûm erioed yn y gemau Olympaidd.

**Carl Sargeant:** As you are aware, when Liverpool was awarded Cultural Capital of Europe status, there were clear benefits for north east Wales, particularly Flintshire. While it is important that we support the Millennium Stadium and the bid to hold such events, would you also agree that is important to support the people in north Wales, particularly with regard to training grounds such as Shotton Steel Football Club training ground, and possibly the Racecourse ground in Wrexham, which could be potential venues?

**The First Minister:** It is not just a matter of the Racecourse ground, but the fact that next to it is the North East Wales Institute, which has halls of residence and academic facilities. If Wrexham Borough County Council chose, it could mount a bid to host a training camp in the run-up to the games, subject to the caveats I made in response to earlier questions; these are hard-nosed commercial negotiations, and many local authorities will take one look at it, and then look askance. However, if you have a complex of facilities where people can live in a training camp—and it may not be just in the Olympic run-up year, it can be in previous years—many Olympic federations from the 200 countries that take part in this, and from the 120 countries that take part in the Paralympics, which may have increased to 160 or 180 countries by then, would be looking at how to acclimatise their athletes to British-type weather. They may want to come in 2009, 2010, and 2011, as well as in the three or four months before the games. If you have a good complex, that is the time to offer it, not necessarily just in the run-up to the Olympics, but at any point in the previous three or four years.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel y gwyddoch, pan gafodd Lerpwl statws Prifddinas Diwylliant Ewrop, cafwyd manteision sicr i'r Gogledd-ddwyrain, ac i sir y Fflint yn enwedig. Er ei bod yn bwysig inni gefnogi Stadiwm y Mileniwm a'r cais i gynnal cystadlaethau o'r fath, a gytunech hefyd ei bod yn bwysig cefnogi pobl yn y Gogledd, yn enwedig o ran y meysydd hyfforddi fel un Clwb Pêl-droed Shotton Steel, a'r Cae Ras yn Wrecsam o bosibl, lle y gellid cynnal cystadlaethau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid y Cae Ras yn unig sydd dan sylw, gan fod Athrofa Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru gerllaw, lle y mae neuaddau preswyl a chyfleusterau academiaidd. Pe dewisai Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam wneud hynny, gallai gyflwyno cais i gynnal gwersyll hyfforddi yn y cyfnod cyn y gemau, o dan yr amodau a nodais mewn ymateb i gwestiynau cynharach; mae'r rhain yn negodiadau masnachol anodd, a byddai llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn cael cip ar hyn, ac wedyn yn edrych yn ddrwgdybus arno. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennych gyfleusterau mewn cyfateilad lle y gall pobl fyw mewn gwersyll hyfforddi—ac efallai nad yn y flwyddyn cyn y gemau Olympaidd yn unig y byddai hynny, gallai fod yn y blynyddoedd cynt—byddai llawer o ffederasiynau Olympaidd o'r 200 o wledydd sy'n cymryd rhan yn hyn, ac o blith y 120 o wledydd sy'n cymryd rhan yn y gemau Paralympaidd, y gallai eu nifer fod wedi codi i 160 neu 180 erbyn hynny, yn ystyried sut i beri i'w hathletwyr ymgynffino â'r math o dywydd a geir ym Mhrydain. Efallai y byddant am ddod yn 2009, 2010, ac yn 2011, yn ogystal â'r tri neu bedwar mis cyn y gemau. Os oes gennych gyfateilad da, dyna'r adeg y dylid ei gynnig, nid yn y cyfnod cyn y gemau Olympaidd yn unig o reidrwydd, ond ar unrhyw adeg yn ystod y tair neu bedair blynedd cynt.

4.00 p.m.

**Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25**  
**Motion to Approve Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004 on the draft regulations, the Education (Listed Bodies) (Wales) Order 2004; and*

*1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff Rhestredig) (Cymru) 2004, a*

*b) approves the Education (Listed Bodies) (Wales) Order 2004, which is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff Rhestredig) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 3 November 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004;*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 3 November 2004; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004; a*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004; and*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004; a*

*2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office, and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004 on the draft regulations, the Feeding Stuffs, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) and the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2004, and*

*2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004 ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Porthiant, Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi) a Phorthiant (Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2004; a*

*b) approves the Feeding Stuffs, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) and the Feeding Stuffs (Enforcement) (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) Regulations 2004, which are made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Porthiant, Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi) a Phorthiant (Gorfodi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 3 November 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004;*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y*

*Office on 3 November 2004; and*

*Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004; a*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004. (NDM2176)*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2176)*

*Cynnig (NDM2176): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2176): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004**  
**The Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2177 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 1 i NDM2179 yn enw David Melding.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections. I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2177 and amendment 1 to NDM2179 both in the name of David Melding.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 5 November 2004. (NDM2177)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2177)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) approves that the Local Authorities Executive Arrangements (Functions and Responsibilities) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Trefniadau Gweithrediaeth Awdurdodau Lleol (Swyddogaethau a Chyfrifoldebau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 5 November 2004;*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Tachwedd 2004;*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004; a*

iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004. (NDM2178)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004. (NDM2179)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*b) approves that the Local Authorities (Alternative Arrangements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 are made in accordance with:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004;*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004; and*

*iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 November 2004. (NDM2180)*

These regulations are being taken together for debate because they are interconnected. The functions and responsibilities regulations and the alternative arrangements regulations include similar provisions, but the former apply to councils operating executive arrangements and the latter apply to those operating what is known as the fourth option.

iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2178)

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2179)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Trefniadau Amgen) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004;*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004; a*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2180)*

Cynhelir dadl ar y rheoliadau hyn gyda'i gilydd gan eu bod yn gydgyssylltiedig. Mae'r rheoliadau ar swyddogaethau a chyfrifoldebau a'r rhai ar drefniadau amgen yn cynnwys darpariaethau tebyg, ond mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â chynghorau sydd â threfniadau gweithrediaeth ac mae'r olaf yn ymwneud â'r rhai sy'n rhedeg ar yr hyn a

elwir yn bedwerydd dewis.

Some of you will be aware that these two sets of regulations have had something of a chequered history. They cover the complex area of which functions must be, must not be, may not be or should not be solely for the board or executive to decide upon. The full regulations that these regulations would amend include long lists of functions that are essential for the smooth functioning of a council.

My original intention was to make more amendments to the existing regulations but we had the unfortunate circumstance of an electronic consultation not being received by most of its planned recipients. We do not know how or why this happened, but when it came to light it was necessary to vastly reduce the planned amendments down to those areas, such as the council tax base and licensing, where there was a degree of urgency and a relative lack of controversy. The Welsh Local Government Association and the Local Government and Public Services Committee have expressed their satisfaction with the regulations as they stand. Unfortunately, however, as I have said, we will have to return to those other issues on which we intended to consult at a later date, and there may be a need to consider more amendments later this year, or next year.

In summary, these two sets of regulations propose the following issues. They will allow councils to decide whether to make the setting of the council tax base an executive or board function. They ensure that establishing a licensing committee is a matter for the full council, and that councils may choose whether other licensing functions should be matters for the full council or its executive or board. In the case of councils operating the fourth option, there is also a provision allowing the licensing committee to establish sub-committees, which is an essential step given the inevitable increase in work brought about by the Licensing Act 2003. They make the task of registering motor salvage operators one for the full council. They clarify that the full council, not the executive or board, has responsibility for appointing

Gŵyr rhai ohonoch fod hanes eithaf brith i'r ddwy set hyn o reoliadau. Maent yn ymdrin â'r maes cymhleth o ba swyddogaethau y dylai neu na ddylai'r bwrdd neu'r weithrediaeth benderfynu arnynt ar ei ben ei hun. Mae'r rheoliadau llawn y byddai'r rheoliadau hyn yn eu diwygio'n cynnwys rhestrau hir o swyddogaethau sy'n hollbwysig i gyngor allu rhedeg yn llyfn.

Fy mwriad gwreiddiol oedd gwneud rhagor o newidiadau i'r rheoliadau presennol ond cawsom ddigwyddiad anffodus lle y cafwyd ymgynghoriad electronig nas derbyniwyd gan y rhan fwyaf o'r rhai y'i bwriadwyd ar eu cyfer. Ni wyddom sut y digwyddodd hynny, na phaham, ond pan ddaeth hynny i'r amlwg bu'n rhaid cwtogi'n llym ar y newidiadau arfaethedig fel eu bod yn ymdrin â'r meysydd hynny, fel sylfaen y dreth gyngor a thrwyddedu, lle yr oedd rhywfaint o frys a chymharol ychydig o ddadlau yn eu cylch. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Phwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus wedi dweud eu bod yn fodlon ar y rheoliadau fel ag y maent. Er hynny, gwaetha'r modd, fel y dywedais, bydd yn rhaid inni ddod yn ôl at y materion eraill hynny y bwriadusom ymgynghori arnynt yn y dyfodol, ac efallai y bydd yn rhaid ystyried rhagor o newidiadau yn ddiweddarach eleni, neu'r flwyddyn nesaf.

I grynhoi, mae'r ddwy set hyn o reoliadau yn cynnig y materion a ganlyn. Byddant yn caniatáu i gynghorau benderfynu a ydynt am wneud y broses o bennu sylfaen y dreth gyngor yn swyddogaeth i'r weithrediaeth neu'r bwrdd. Maent yn sicrhau y bydd sefydlu pwyllgor trwyddedu'n fater i'r cyngor llawn, ac y gallai cynghorau ddewis a ddylai swyddogaethau trwyddedu eraill fod yn faterion i'r cyngor llawn neu i'w gweithrediaeth neu eu bwrdd. Yn achos cynghorau sy'n gweithredu ar sail y pedwerydd dewis, mae darpariaeth hefyd sy'n caniatáu i'r pwyllgor trwyddedu sefydlu is-bwyllgorau, ac mae hynny'n gam hollbwysig gan ei bod yn anorfod y ceir mwy o waith yn sgîl Deddf Trwyddedu 2003. Maent yn peri i'r dasg o gofrestru gweithredwyr adfer cerbydau modur fod yn

senior staff and agreeing strategic financial matters. Councils operating the fourth option will now be able to delegate some full council functions to area committees, whereas previously they were confined to board functions. I should point out, however, that this does not include functions where legislation has made clear that these functions are to be dealt with by the authority as a whole. Finally, there are some tidying amendments to the lists of strategic plans that must be considered by the executive or board and the full council.

These proposals are not contentious but they are necessary to assist with the smooth running of local government. On the Tories' amendment that notes the greater freedom given to local authorities to decide on their own political management structures, I think that you have the wrong set of regulations. I do not blame you, as there are many alternatives and other names, but it is my hunch that you meant this for another time and another set of regulations. I therefore urge Members not to support that amendment.

The amendment to NDM2179 is on scrutiny arrangements, and clearly, these regulations are not about scrutiny. I understand why you are proposing the amendment, but you cannot amend an aspect that is not in the regulations. I hope that you would perhaps withdraw them to save us from voting on them.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I point out to the Minister and to Members that these amendments are in order.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2177 in the name of David Melding. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the greater freedom given to local authorities to decide on their own political management structures.*

I propose amendment 1 to NDM2179 in the name of David Melding. Add as a new point

un i'r cyngor llawn. Maent yn egluro mai'r cyngor llawn, nid y weithrediaeth neu'r bwrdd, sy'n gyfrifol am benodi staff uwch ac am gytuno ar faterion ariannol strategol. Bellach gall cynghorau sy'n gweithredu ar sail y pedwerydd dewis ddirprwyo rhai o swyddogaethau'r cyngor llawn i bwyllgorau ardal—dim ond swyddogaethau'r bwrdd y gallant eu dirprwyo o'r blaen. Dylwn nodi, er hynny, nad yw hyn yn cynnwys swyddogaethau y mae deddfwriaeth wedi pennu eu bod i'w trafod gan yr awdurdod cyfan. Yn olaf, ceir rhai newidiadau er tacluso i'r rhestrau o gynlluniau strategol y mae'n rhaid iddynt gael eu hystyried gan y weithrediaeth neu'r bwrdd a'r cyngor llawn.

Nid yw'r cynigion hyn yn ddadleuol ond rhaid eu cael er mwyn hwyluso gweithrediad llywodraeth leol. Ynghylch gwelliant y Torïaid sy'n nodi'r rhyddid helaethach a roddir i awdurdodau lleol gael penderfynu ar eu trefniadau rheoli gwleidyddol eu hunain, credaf eich bod â'ch golwg ar y set anghywir o reoliadau. Ni welaf fai arnoch, gan fod llawer o rai eraill ac o enwau eraill, ond yr wyf yn amau eich bod wedi bwriadu hyn ar gyfer adeg arall a set arall o reoliadau. Gan hynny, anogaf Aelodau i beidio â chefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Mae'r gwelliant i NDM2179 yn ymwneud â threfniadau craffu, ac mae'n amlwg nad yw'r rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud â chraffu. Deallaf pam yr ydych yn cynnig y gwelliant, ond ni allwch newid agwedd nad yw yn y rheoliadau. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn barod i'w tynnu'n ôl, efallai, fel na fyddwn yn gorfod pleidleisio arnynt.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog ac Aelodau at y ffaith bod y gwelliannau hyn mewn trefn.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2177 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r rhyddid ychwanegol a roddir i awdurdodau lleol i benderfynu ar eu strwythurau rheoli gwleidyddol eu hunain.*

Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2179 yn new David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd

at the end of the motion:

*notes that these regulations do not prevent local authority scrutiny committees from being established which are dominated by the governing party.*

I only wish to say that, in my view, the amendments are in order and make important points.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I need no further support. These amendments are in order.

**David Lloyd:** Mae'r trefniadau hyn wedi bod yn destun trafodaethau lu dros y blynyddoedd, a thestun ambell adolygiad pwyllgor. Cefnogaf y cynnig hwn, a'r gwelliannau.

**Michael German:** I welcome the proposals, particularly with regard to the alternative arrangements regulations. Members from Gwynedd and Powys may find it useful to know that there is now a proposal to allow a full council to devolve powers to an area committee. That is a useful move for those who are great believers in devolution, particularly beyond the river Taff.

Secondly, on what you call the 'chequered history' of these regulations, Minister, there would be more, as you rightly say, and important changes that you made, and wanted to make, that would allow the full council to discuss a greater range of issues than provided for in these motions, which are small scale at present. Can you tell us when you expect to be able to introduce the new regulations, which will be the same as these but with a longer list?

Finally, maybe the original legislation is at fault, but can you tell us why it is that, unless you put forward a set of regulations of this sort, everything goes to the cabinet or to the board? In other words, it is the exceptions that the full council receives. Is there not a case for it being the other way round, whereby the full council would have everything unless designated to the board or the executive?

ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi nad yw'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhwystro sefydlu pwyllgorau craffu mewn awdurdodau lleol sydd dan reolaeth y blaid lywodraethol.*

Nid wyf ond am ddweud bod y gwelliannau mewn trefn, yn fy ngolwg i, a'u bod yn gwneud pwyntiau pwysig.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes arnaf angen cefnogaeth bellach. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn mewn trefn.

**David Lloyd:** These arrangements have been subject to many debates over the years, and subject to the occasional committee review, also. I support this motion, and the amendments.

**Michael German:** Croesawaf y cynigion hyn, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r rheoliadau ar drefniadau amgen. Efallai y bydd yn fuddiol i Aelodau o Wynedd a Phowys wybod bod cynnig yn awr i ganiatáu i gyngor llawn ddatganoli pwerau i bwyllgor ardal. Mae hynny'n newid buddiol yng ngolwg y rhai sy'n gweld gwerth mawr mewn datganoli, yn enwedig y tu draw i afon Taf.

Yn ail, ynghylch yr hyn a alwch yn 'hanes brith' y rheoliadau hyn, Weinidog, byddai mwy ohonynt, fel y dywedwch, a newidiadau pwysig a wnaethoch, ac y dymunosoch eu gwneud, a ganiatâi i'r cyngor llawn drafod amrediad ehangach o faterion nag y darperir ar ei gyfer yn y cynigion hyn, sydd ar raddfa fach ar hyn o bryd. A allwch ddweud wrthym pa bryd y disgwyliwch allu cyflwyno'r rheoliadau newydd, a fydd yr un fath â'r rhain ond bod y rhestr yn hwy?

Yn olaf, efallai fod diffyg yn y ddeddfwriaeth wreiddiol, ond a allwch ddweud wrthym pam, os na chyflwynir set o reoliadau o'r math hwn, yr aiff popeth at y cabinet neu'r bwrdd? Mewn geiriau eraill, yr eithriadau a gaiff y cyngor llawn. Onid oes dadl dros beri iddo fod fel arall, fel y câi'r cyngor llawn bob dim oni châi ei ddynodi ar gyfer y bwrdd neu'r weithrediaeth?



**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** To start with Mike's points, in terms of the area committees, obviously, for somewhere like Powys, which has a committee structure, that will be helpful. In terms of your point on the exceptions, it is my understanding that that is the way the legislation is, but we can certainly check the presumption that it is done by the cabinet or board and then make the exceptions. On the other elements, which make quite a long list, it is a matter of relations to trading standards and a whole range of information, which I can let you have. My officials informed me that it will be next year, so I assume that, early next year, we will consult on those and be able to take them through.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Gan ddechrau â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Mike, gyda golwg ar y pwyllgorau ardal, mae'n amlwg, yn achos rhywle fel Powys, sydd â strwythur pwyllgorau, y bydd hynny'n fuddiol. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaethoch am eithriadau, felly y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth, yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, ond, yn sicr, gallwn ffrwyno'r rhagdybiaeth bod rhywbeth i'w wneud gan y cabinet neu'r bwrdd a bod yr eithriadau i'w pennu wedyn. Ynghylch y materion eraill, sy'n gwneud rhestr eithaf hir, mae'n ymwneud â'r cysylltiadau â safonau masnach ac amryfal fathau o wybodaeth, y gallaf ei rhoi i chi. Mae fy swyddogion wedi fy hysbysu mai y flwyddyn nesaf y gwneir hyn, felly cymeraf y byddwn yn ymgynghori ar y rheini ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf ac y byddwn yn gallu eu cwblhau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2177): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2177): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.10 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2178): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2178): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael I  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Randerson, Jenny I  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2179): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM2179): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2180): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2180): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor)  
 a'r Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio)  
 2004**

**Approval of the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council  
 Tax (Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2181 in the name of David Melding.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2181 yn enw David Melding.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council Tax (Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 3 November 2004. (NDM2181)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor) a'r Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2181)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16*

*a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r*

*November 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council Tax (Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, and*

*b) approves that the Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) and Council Tax (Prescribed Classes of Dwellings) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 are made in accordance with:*

*i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 3 November 2004; and*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 15 November 2004. (NDM2182)*

In order to prepare their budgets for next year, local authorities need to estimate the council tax yield element of their funding. In calculating the tax yield, authorities make reference to their tax base which must be calculated in accordance with the provisions of The Local Authorities (Calculation of Council Tax Base) (Wales) Regulations 1995, and must take into consideration the reduction in council tax due to certain discounts.

The purpose of the regulations proposed today is threefold. First, the regulations allow any changes that authorities make to the discount for prescribed classes of dwellings to be taken into account in the council tax base calculations. Secondly, they introduce a minor change to earlier regulations prescribing a new class 'C' for long-term empty homes. The change ensures that those earlier regulations make reference to the appropriate sub-section of the Local Government Act 2003 which allows local authorities to reduce or end the council tax discount for prescribed dwellings as intended. Thirdly, they update the existing regulations to allow local authorities to use the valuation thus compiled following the revaluation exercise as the basis for the tax base estimates.

The regulations are primarily concerned with

*Cynulliad ar 16 Tachwedd 2004 mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor) a'r Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004, a*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor) a'r Dreth Gyngor (Dosbarthau Rhagnodedig ar Anheddau) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Tachwedd 2004; a*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Tachwedd 2004. (NDM2182)*

Er mwyn paratoi eu cyllidebau ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, rhaid i awdurdodau lleol amcangyfrif maint yr elfen o'u cyllid a gânt o'r dreth gyngor. Wrth gyfrifo'r swm a godir drwy'r dreth, mae awdurdodau'n cyfeirio at eu sylfaen dreth y mae'n rhaid ei chyfrifo'n unol â darpariaethau Rheoliadau'r Awdurdodau Lleol (Cyfrifo Sylfaen y Dreth Gyngor) (Cymru) 1995, a rhaid iddynt ystyried y gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor o ganlyniad i rai disgowntiau.

Pwrpas triphlyg sydd i'r rheoliadau a gynigir heddiw. Yn gyntaf, mae'r rheoliadau'n caniatáu ystyried unrhyw newidiadau a wnaiff awdurdodau i'r disgownt ar gyfer dosbarthau rhagnodedig ar anheddau wrth gyfrifo sylfaen y dreth gyngor. Yn ail, maent yn cyflwyno mân newid i reoliadau cynharach sy'n rhagnodi dosbarth 'C' newydd ar gyfer cartrefi sy'n wag am dymor hir. Mae'r newid yn sicrhau bod y rheoliadau cynharach hynny'n cyfeirio at is-adran berthnasol Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003 sy'n caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol leihau neu derfynu'r disgownt ar y dreth gyngor ar gyfer anheddau rhagnodedig fel y bwriadwyd. Yn drydydd, maent yn diweddarau'r rheoliadau presennol fel y caiff awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r prisiad a gasglwyd felly ar ôl yr ailbrisiad yn sail i amcangyfrifon o sylfaen y dreth.

Mae'r rheoliadau'n ymwneud yn bennaf â

amending existing regulations to ensure that they are brought fully into line with the changes in the Local Government Act 2003. The Local Government and Public Services Committee recommended approval of the regulations without amendment.

David Melding's amendment is right to point out that the changes introduced in the Act provide local authorities with greater freedom on discounts. With this comes the responsibility to use these freedoms for the benefit of the authority's area, such as bringing long-term empty properties into use. As these regulations are about changes to tax bases and do not specifically relate to the introduction of the discounts, we feel that the amendment is unnecessary and recommend that it be rejected.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2181 in the name of David Melding. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the greater freedom given to local authorities to decide on council tax discount levels.*

I observe that this amendment is even more relevant to the debate than the previous two amendments that I proposed to earlier motions.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** We did not endorse the revaluation exercise, but as it is going ahead, we support the aims of these regulations and the proposal to exclude second homes, namely prescribed dwellings classes A and B, from the relief scheme. However, this raises serious concerns. When Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales proposed a piece of subordinate legislation to create a specific use class for second homes, we were told that this was impractical. However, these regulations depend on defining such a category of housing. I do not understand how this category of dwellings can be defined for one piece of legislation but is apparently undefinable for the purpose of controlling the numbers. It raises questions as to whether this part of the regulations can be applied consistently throughout Wales. It may be open to challenge. In committee, the Minister said that the identification of second homes

diwygio'r rheoliadau presennol i sicrhau y byddant yn gwbl gyson â'r newidiadau yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003. Mae Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus wedi argymhell cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau heb eu newid.

Mae gwelliant David Melding yn nodi'n gywir fod y newidiadau a gyflwynir yn y Ddeddf yn rhoi mwy o ryddid i awdurdodau lleol mewn cysylltiad â disgowntiau. Yn sgîl hynny ceir cyfrifoldeb i arfer rhyddid o'r fath er budd ardal yr awdurdod, i wneud defnydd o eiddo sy'n wag am dymor hir, er enghraifft. Gan fod y rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud â newidiadau i sylfeini treth a heb fod yn ymwneud yn benodol â chyflwyno'r disgowntiau, teimlwn fod y gwelliant yn ddiangen ac yr ydym yn argymhell ei wrthod.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2181 yn enw David Melding. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi'r rhyddid ychwanegol a roddir i awdurdodau lleol i benderfynu ar lefelau gostyngiad y dreth gyngor.*

Nodaf fod y gwelliant hwn hyd yn oed yn fwy perthnasol i'r ddadl hon nag yr oedd y ddau welliant blaenorol a gynigiais i gynigion cynharach.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Nid oeddem yn cefnogi'r ailbrisiad, ond gan ei fod yn mynd yn ei flaen, cefnogwn amcanion y rheoliadau hyn a'r bwriad i eithrio ail gartrefi, sef dosbarthau rhagnodedig A a B ar anheddau, o'r cynllun rhyddhad. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn codi pryderon mawr. Pan gynigiodd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales eitem is-ddeddfwriaeth i greu dosbarth defnydd penodol ar gyfer ail gartrefi, dywedwyd wrthym nad oedd hynny'n ymarferol. Er hynny, mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn dibynnu ar y gallu i ddiffinio categori tai o'r fath. Nid wyf yn deall sut y gellir diffinio'r categori anheddau hwn ar gyfer un eitem ddeddfwriaeth tra ymddengys nad oes modd ei ddiffinio i'r diben o reoli'r niferoedd ohonynt. Mae hefyd yn codi cwestiynau ynghylch a ellir cymhwyso'r rhan hon o'r rheoliadau'n gyson ledled Cymru. Gallai fod yn agored i'w herio. Yn y pwyllgor,



was a matter for individual local authorities. Will the Minister confirm that all local authorities do not, as a matter of course, keep consistent lists of the number of second or holiday homes in their areas? In a report commissioned by the Welsh Assembly Government in 2002 on second and holiday homes, a recommendation was made that local authorities should present data on second homes to the Government and that it should then publish national statistics. Are those figures being collected and published and, if not, why not?

**Michael German:** I have two points to make. The first relates to the nature of the discounts and I seek the Minister's view. The fewer council tax discounts that a local authority offers, the smaller the amount of money that it will receive from the Welsh Assembly Government. The more council tax discounts that an authority offers, the more money that it will receive from the Government. Is there something wrong there? Does the Minister think that there is a way to make that more reflective of need?

My second point relates to dates. These regulations will come into effect tomorrow whereas, in previous years, such regulations have had a billing and calculation date of 1 November. Is it correct that from next year you will be reverting to 31 October and 1 November? If that is the case, would it not have been more sensible to bring these regulations forward a month earlier, which would allow the same dates to apply to local authorities throughout Wales?

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I am glad that Glyn believes his amendment to be relevant. If he is happy, that is all that matters.

**Glyn Davies:** Mike German thinks so too.

**Sue Essex:** Two of you think that it is relevant; great.

On Alun Ffred's points, these regulations refer to long-term empty homes, which are not the same as second homes. You must

dywedodd y Gweinidog fod dynodi ail gartrefi'n fater i'r awdurdodau lleol eu hunain. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau nad yw'r holl awdurdodau lleol yn cadw rhestrau cyson o nifer yr ail gartrefi neu gartrefi gwyliau yn eu hardaloedd, fel mater o drefn? Mewn adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn 2002 ar ail gartrefi a chartrefi gwyliau, argymhellwyd y dylai awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno data ar ail gartrefi i'r Llywodraeth ac y dylai hi wedyn gyhoeddi ystadegau cenedlaethol. A yw'r ffigurau hynny'n cael eu casglu a'u cyhoeddi ac, os nad ydynt, pam hynny?

**Michael German:** Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w gwneud. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â natur y disgowntiau a cheisiaf farn y Gweinidog. Po leiaf y nifer o ddisgowntiau y mae awdurdod lleol yn eu cynnig ar y dreth gyngor, lleiaf fydd swm yr arian a gaiff gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Po fwyaf y nifer o ddisgowntiau y mae awdurdod yn eu cynnig ar y dreth gyngor, mwyaf o arian a gaiff gan y Llywodraeth. A oes rhywbeth o'i le yn hyn o beth? A yw'r Gweinidog yn credu bod modd peri i hynny adlewyrchu'r angen yn well?

Mae'r ail bwynt sydd gennyf yn ymwneud â dyddiadau. Daw'r rheoliadau hyn i rym yfory er bod rheoliadau o'r fath, mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol, yn nodi 1 Tachwedd fel y dyddiad archebu a chyfrifo. A yw'n wir y byddwch yn mynd yn ôl at 31 Hydref a 1 Tachwedd o'r flwyddyn nesaf? Os felly, oni fuasai'n fwy synhwyrol dwyn y rheoliadau hyn gerbron fis yn gynharach, fel y gellid cymhwyso'r un dyddiadau i awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru?

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Yr wyf yn falch bod Glyn yn credu bod ei welliant yn berthnasol. Os yw ef yn fodlon, dyna'r cwbl sy'n cyfrif.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae Mike German yn credu hynny hefyd.

**Sue Essex:** Mae dau ohonoch yn meddwl ei fod yn berthnasol; ardderchog.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Alun Ffred, mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn cyfeirio at gartrefi sy'n wag dros dymor hir, ac nid ydynt yr un

refer questions on second homes, changes of use and the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987 to Carwyn Jones.

On Mike's points, I will write to you on whether the discounts affect the council tax base. Most authorities have a relatively small number of such homes in their areas. I do not think that we need to get too exercised about that. On the date, I will get back to you on whether this is a permanent or a one-off change. This affects the revaluation process, which is why we brought the regulations forward now. As you know, only a few people are dealing with the council tax issue, and they have managed to get this out in time for local authorities to use. That is why we brought it forward and why it will operate from tomorrow.

4.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

fath ag ail gartrefi. Rhaid ichi gyfeirio cwestiynau am ail gartrefi, newid defnydd a Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Dosbarthiadau Defnydd) 1987 i sylw Carwyn Jones.

Ar bwyntiau Mike, ysgrifennaf atoch ynghylch a yw'r disgowntiau'n effeithio ar sylfaen y dreth gyngor. Cymharol fach yw nifer y cartrefi o'r fath sydd gan y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau yn eu hardaloedd. Ni chredaf fod angen inni orgynhyrfu am hynny. Ynghylch y dyddiad, rhoddaf wybod i chi a yw hyn yn newid parhaol neu'n un dros dro. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar y broses ailbrisio, a dyna pam y dygasom y rheoliadau gerbron yn awr. Fel y gwyddoch, nifer fach sy'n delio â mater y dreth gyngor, ac maent wedi llwyddo i gyflwyno hyn mewn pryd fel y gall awdurdodau lleol ei ddefnyddio. Dyna pam y dygasom ef gerbron a pham y bydd ar waith o yfory ymlaen.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2181): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM2181): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*  
*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2182): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2182): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.21 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.21 p.m.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru)  
Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

**Polisïau'r Llywodraeth ar Iechyd  
The Government's Policies on Health**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of David Lloyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw David Lloyd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose that

*nad oes gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru unrhyw hyder ym mholisïau'r Llywodraeth ar iechyd. (NDM2175)*

*the National Assembly for Wales has no confidence in the Government's policies on health. (NDM2175)*

Ein cyfrifoldeb ni, fel y prif wrthblaid, yw cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn o ddiffyg hyder ym mholisïau iechyd Llywodraeth Cymru. Fe'i gwnaf yn gwbl glir, ar y dechrau, mai sôn yr ydym am ein diffyg hyder ym mholisïau iechyd y Llywodraeth, ac yr ydym yn dal Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd yn gyfrifol am y polisïau hynny. Nid ydym yn sôn am unigolion.

It is our responsibility, as the main opposition party, to propose this motion of no confidence in the Government of Wales's health policies. I state categorically, at the outset, that this is a motion of no confidence in the Government's health policies, and we hold the Government of Wales in its entirety responsible for those policies. We are not talking about individuals.

Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach ein bod yn anwybyddu newyddion da o ran rhai o bolisïau honedig-lwyddiannus Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr wyf yn barod i gydnabod bod elfennau o'r polisïau'n gweithio ac yn llwyddo, ond rhaid pwysleisio mai cyfyngedig yw eu nifer. Yr wyf yn barod i dderbyn y bu cynnydd mewn triniaethau ar y galon a thriniaethau cataract, ac i gydnabod y cyfraddau isel o ran marwolaethau plant bach. Yr wyf hyd yn oed yn barod i ystyried y newyddion da o ran MRSA, ond os yw'r newyddion mor dda â hynny, pam nad ydych yn barod i ryddhau'r ffigurau fesul ysbyty a fesul ymddiriedolaeth?

The First Minister said earlier that we ignore good news on some of the Government of Wales's allegedly successful policies. I am willing to acknowledge that some elements of the policies work and are successful, but I must emphasise that they are limited in number. I am willing to accept that there has been an increase in cardiac and cataract surgery, and to acknowledge the low infant mortality rates. I am even willing to consider good news with regard to MRSA, but if the news is that good, why are you not willing to release the figures for each hospital and each trust?

Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod yn dweud nad ydym ni yn barod i drafod newyddion da. Brynhawn yma, dewisodd y Trefnydd dynnu yn ôl y cynnig yr oeddem i fod i'w drafod yfory ar gynllun yr ail gynnig ar ôl 18 mis. Yr ydych chi, Brif Weinidog, yn dadlau bod hynny yn newyddion da. Os yw'n newyddion da, pam nad ydych yn barod i'w drafod yn y Siambr? Brif Weinidog, chi sy'n gwrthod trafod newyddion da.

It is interesting that you say that we are not willing to discuss good news. This afternoon, the Business Minister chose to withdraw a motion on the 18-month second offer guarantee scheme that was scheduled to be debated tomorrow. You, First Minister, have argued that that is good news. If it is good news, why are you not willing to discuss it in the Chamber? First Minister, you are the one who is refusing to discuss good news.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you not think that it is good news, and should you not congratulate the Labour Government on the fact that 44,000 people in Wales have received digital hearing aids?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn barod i gydnabod hynny hefyd, ond y gwir amdani yw bod rhestrau aros Cymru wedi cynyddu yn echrhdus o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A yw Rhodri hefyd yn sylweddoli, er bod cymaint o bobl wedi derbyn offer clyw digidol, rhaid i etholwr i mi, sy'n 93 oed, ddisgwyl dros flwyddyn cyn cael un?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r patrwm hwnnw i'w weld yn sicr yng Nghymru. Nid oes gan ymddiriedolaeth Caerfyrddin y cyfarpar hwn. Yn debyg i feysydd eraill, mae'r ddarpariaeth yn dibynnu ar god post. Mae hon yn sefyllfa annerbyniol.

Yr wyf am barhau i drafod y ffigurau. Yr ydym yn sôn am ffigurau sydd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Yn 1997, pan ddaeth Llywodraeth Lafur i rym yn San Steffan, yr oedd ychydig dros 100,000 yn aros am apwyntiad ysbyty. Erbyn hyn, mae'r ffigur wedi cynyddu i 237,000. Yn 1999, wrth i Lywodraeth Cymru ddechrau ar ei gwaith, yr oedd 65,000 yn aros am driniaeth yn yr ysbyty. Erbyn hyn, mae'r ffigur wedi cynyddu i 72,000. Pa newyddion da sydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'r bobl hynny?

First Minister, you referred to synthetic indignation. Are you telling me that those on waiting lists, many of whom are waiting in pain, are suffering from synthetic indignation? I certainly hope that this is not the case.

**Brian Gibbons:** On waiting lists and good news, would you welcome the fact that there has been an increase of more than a 20 per cent in the number of out-patients seen within six months in the last three to four years?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As you well know, Brian—and I just quoted the figures—waiting lists and times are increasing in

**Lorraine Barrett:** Oni chredwch mai newyddion da yw bod 44,000 o bobl yng Nghymru wedi cael cymhorthion clywed digidol, ac oni ddylech longyfarch y Llywodraeth Lafur ar hynny?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am also willing to acknowledge that, but the fact of the matter is that waiting lists in Wales have increased at an alarming rate under this Labour Government.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Does Rhodri also realise that, although so many people have received digital hearing aids, a constituent of mine, who is 93 years of age, must wait over a year for such a hearing aid?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** That pattern can certainly be seen in Wales. The Carmarthenshire trust does not have this equipment. Like other areas, provision is dependent on one's post code. This situation is unacceptable.

I will stay with the figures for a while. We are talking about figures that have increased dramatically. When Labour came to power in Westminster in 1997, just over 100,000 people were waiting for a hospital appointment. The total has now reached 237,000. When the Government of Wales took office in 1999, 65,000 people were waiting for hospital treatment. This figure is now 72,000. Does the Government of Wales have good news for these people?

Brif Weinidog, cyfeiriasoch at ddieter ffug. A ydych yn dweud wrthyf fod y rhai sydd ar restrau aros, y mae llawer ohonynt yn aros mewn poen, yn dioddef gan ddieter ffug? Yr wyf yn gwir obeithio nad ydych.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ynghylch rhestrau aros a newyddion da, a wnewch groesawu'r ffaith bod cynnydd o fwy nag 20 y cant wedi bod yn nifer y cleifion allanol a welir o fewn chwe mis yn y tair i bedair blynedd diwethaf?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y gwyddoch, Brian—ac yr wyf newydd ddyfynnu'r ffigurau—mae rhestrau ac amseroedd aros ar

Wales. The fact of the matter is that more people are waiting, and waiting longer. They can see the progress made by a Labour Government in England. Why can this progress not be made in Wales? Why should the people of Wales have a second-rate service?

**Carl Sargeant** *rose*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will take an intervention from the directly elected Member for Alyn and Deeside.

**Carl Sargeant:** For a moment, I thought that we were going to have a constructive debate but, yet again, what we have is a Plaid Cymru farce. Two weeks ago, in a blaze of publicity, you said that this was an issue of national importance and urgency. It has taken you two weeks to bring this important issue to the Chamber—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an intervention.

**Carl Sargeant:** It is obviously not important to you and your Plaid Cymru colleagues. Will you answer the question? [*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Carl, will you conclude your intervention?

**Carl Sargeant:** Instead of whingeing perpetually, tell us how you propose to deal with the situation? You do not have any proposals, and this debate is another Plaid Cymru farce.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given that you have only been here for just over a year, I will point out to you that I do not schedule Plenary business. If I were in that position, I would have ensured that the subject was brought to the Chamber far earlier. You talk about opposition parties carping, whingeing and complaining. However, in terms of the amount of money invested in the health service in Wales and how it is invested, the Wanless report states that

gynnydd yng Nghymru. Y gwir amdani yw bod mwy o bobl yn disgwyl, ac yn disgwyl yn hwy. Gallant weld y cynnydd a wnaeth Llywodraeth Lafur yn Lloegr. Pam na ellir gwneud cynnydd o'r fath yng Nghymru? Pam y dylai pobl Cymru gael gwasanaeth eilradd?

**Carl Sargeant** *a gododd*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Derbyniatf ymyriad gan yr Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy.

**Carl Sargeant:** Am eiliad, tybiais y caem ddadl adeiladol ond, unwaith eto, yr hyn a gawn yw ffars o eiddo Plaid Cymru. Bythefnos yn ôl, yng nghanol cyhoeddusrwydd llachar, dywedasoeh fod y mater hwn yn un brys a oedd o bwys cenedlaethol. Cymerodd bythefnos ichi godi'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn y Siambr—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'n amlwg nad yw'n bwysig i chi ac i'ch cyd-Aelodau ym Mhlaid Cymru. A wnewch ateb y cwestiwn? [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Carl, a wnewch orffen eich ymyriad?

**Carl Sargeant:** Yn hytrach na chwyno'n ddiwedd, dywedwch wrthym sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdrin â'r sefyllfa. Nid oes gennych unrhyw gynigion, a ffars arall o eiddo Plaid Cymru yw'r ddadl hon.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gan na fuoch yma ond am ychydig yn fwy na blwyddyn, tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith nad myfi sy'n amserlennu busnes y Cyfarfod Llawn. Pe byddwn mewn lle i wneud hynny, byddwn wedi sicrhau y cawsai'r pwnc ei godi yn y Siambr yn llawer cynt. Soniwch am wrthbleidiau'n gweld bai, yn swnian ac yn cwyno. Fodd bynnag, wrth gyfeirio at faint yr arian a fuddsoddiwyd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru a'r modd y gwneir hynny, dywed adroddiad Wanless nad yw

'Wales does not get as much out of its health 'Cymru'n cael cymaint o fudd ag y dylai

spending as it should'

allan o'i gwariant ar iechyd'

and places

a'i bod yn rhoi

'unsustainable pressure on the acute sector'.

'pwysau anghynaliadwy ar y sector aciwt'.

These are not my words, but those of the Wanless report. The Audit Commission in Wales's report states that:

Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rhain, ond geiriau adroddiad Wanless. Dywed adroddiad y Comisiwn Archwilio yng Nghymru:

'Although the health services in Wales will continue to need the additional resources already allocated to it, and the further planned extra finance, increasingly, the issue is that the money is not being used effectively.'

'Er y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn parhau i fod angen yr adnoddau ychwanegol sydd wedi eu dyrannu iddo, a'r arian ychwanegol sydd wedi ei gynllunio, yn gynyddol y mater dan sylw yw nad yw'r arian yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn modd effeithiol.'

This is the crux of the matter and the challenge to the Government. Carl, you constantly tell us that you are a directly elected Member, but let me tell you that you are directly elected to represent each of your constituents. What do you say to those who attend your surgeries to tell you that they have been on a waiting list, in pain, for 18 months? Do you tell them not to whinge, to get back in the queue and that the health service is doing fine?

Dyna graidd y mater a dyna'r her i'r Llywodraeth. Carl, yr ydych yn dweud wrthym byth a beunydd eich bod yn Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol, ond gadewch imi ddweud wrthyich eich bod wedi'ch ethol yn uniongyrchol i gynrychioli pob un o'ch etholwyr. Beth a ddywedwch wrth y rhai a ddaw i'ch cymorthfeydd i ddweud wrthyich iddynt fod yn disgwyl ar restr aros, mewn poen, am 18 mis? A fyddwch yn dweud wrthynt am beidio â chwyno, ac am fynd yn ôl i'r ciw a bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gwneud yn iawn?

This is the challenge to Members, and let all of Labour's directly elected Members show us that they are not being used by the Labour Government to justify its failed policy, by standing up for their constituents.

Dyma'r her i Aelodau, a gadawer i bob un o'r Aelodau Llafur a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol ddangos inni nad ydynt yn cael eu defnyddio gan y Llywodraeth Lafur i gyfiawnhau ei pholisi ffaeledig, drwy sefyll o blaid eu hetholwyr.

4.30 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** Will you give way?

**Carl Sargeant:** A wnewch ildio?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I have taken one intervention; my time is coming to an end.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn un ymyriad; mae fy amser yn dod i ben.

The amount of money spent on the health service in Wales since 1997 has increased dramatically. By 2007, it will have doubled. Is that money being spent well? The Wanless report, the auditor's report, the British Medical Association, health professionals and Jon Owen Jones, a Labour Member of Parliament, tell us that the money is not being spent well, and that is why we propose this

Mae'r swm a gaiff ei wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru er 1997 wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol. Erbyn 2007, bydd wedi dyblu. A yw'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario'n iawn? Dywed adroddiad Wanless, adroddiad yr archwilydd, Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a Jon Owen Jones, Aelod Seneddol Llafur, nad yw'r arian yn cael ei



motion of no confidence in the Labour Party's policies.

**David Lloyd:** I propose amendment 1. After 'the National Assembly for Wales', insert

*believes that paediatric neurosurgery should remain in Swansea and*

I will concentrate on the part of the Labour Assembly Government's health policy that is looking to centralise specialised medical services for Wales in Cardiff or, more likely in, Bristol for south Wales, and in Liverpool and Manchester, as already happens, for north Wales.

This policy threatens Swansea's long-established reputation as a regional centre of medical excellence, covering the populations of mid and west Wales as well as those of Swansea and Neath. Health Commission Wales recommends closing the paediatric neurosurgery unit in Morriston Hospital and moving it to Cardiff, but the report has a looming sentiment that if Cardiff does not come up to scratch, paediatric neurosurgery will end up in Bristol, as paediatric nephrology and paediatric cardiology have already done. These are specialised services for Wales, but they are in Bristol, which means trauma, travel and cost for families from west Wales. England has 14 large regional centres of excellence—

**Brian Gibbons:** Can you explain whether, if these services were to be centralised in Swansea, we would be more likely to retain paediatric neurosurgery in south Wales, particularly as the majority of people in south Wales would probably be more likely to go to Bristol for reasons of geographical access?

**David Lloyd:** That is rubbish. Geographical access works both ways. What about people in Ceredigion or Pembrokeshire? I take it that you will vote to close the centre in Swansea this afternoon.

wario'n iawn, a dyna pam y cynigiwn y cynnig hwn o ddiffyg hyder ym mholisiau'r Blaid Lafur.

**David Lloyd:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Dileu popeth a rhoi yn ei le:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu y dylai niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig aros yn Abertawe ac nad oes ganddo unrhyw hyder ym mholisiau'r Llywodraeth ar iechyd.*

Canolbwyntiaf ar y rhan honno o bolisi iechyd Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad sy'n ceisio canoli gwasanaethau meddygol arbenigol i Gymru yng Nghaerdydd neu, yn fwy tebygol, ym Mryste ar gyfer y De, ac yn Lerpwl a Manceinion, fel y gwnaed eisoes, ar gyfer y Gogledd.

Mae'r polisi hwn yn bygwth yr enw da a fu gan Abertawe ers amser maith fel canolfan ragoriaeth feddygol ranbarthol, sy'n gwasanaethu pobl y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn ogystal â phobl Abertawe a Chastell-nedd. Mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn argymhell cau'r uned niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Ysbyty Treforys a'i symud i Gaerdydd, ond ceir barn fygythiol yn yr adroddiad y bydd niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn symud i Fryste yn y diwedd, os na fydd Caerdydd yn cyrraedd y safon, fel y digwyddodd eisoes yn achos neffroleg bediatrig a chardioleg bediatrig. Gwasanaethau arbenigol ar gyfer Cymru yw'r rhain, ond maent ym Mryste, ac mae hynny'n peri pryder, cost a'r angen i deithio yn achos teuluoedd o'r Gorllewin. Mae gan Loegr 14 o ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol—

**Brian Gibbons:** A allwch egluro, os câi'r gwasanaethau hyn eu canoli yn Abertawe, a fyddem yn fwy tebygol o gadw niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn y De, yn enwedig gan fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl y De'n fwy tebygol o fynd i Fryste am resymau sy'n ymwneud â mynediad daearyddol?

**David Lloyd:** Nonsens yw hynny. Mae mynediad daearyddol yn gweithio'r ddwy ffordd. Beth am y rhai yng Ngheredigion neu sir Benfro? Cymeraf y byddwch yn pleidleisio o blaid cau'r ganolfan yn Abertawe y prynhawn yma.

England has 14 large regional centres of excellence, and patients are hardly ever more than one hour away from such a centre. Our geography is different, Brian—look at a map. This model does not do for Wales. If regional centres start deserting Swansea, large areas of mid and west Wales will be two, three or more hours away from the centre at Cardiff or Bristol. To ensure anywhere near reasonable coverage for our children in Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire, paediatric neurosurgery, burns and plastics, thoracic surgery and so on must remain in Swansea.

**Brian Gibbons:** Will you give way?

**David Lloyd:** Keep digging, Brian.

**Brian Gibbons:** Anybody listening to Dai Lloyd would think that he never learned the lessons of cardiac surgery for children in Bristol. This lack of consistency in terms of recognising the critical mass needed to provide specialist services is appalling, and I suggest that David Lloyd's contribution is putting children across south Wales seriously at risk.

**David Lloyd:** There have been some pathetic interventions in Plenary over the years, and that ranks among them.

What about the children of Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire? We only have two regional centres of excellence: in Cardiff and Swansea. The population of north Wales has suffered for years from having to travel for hours for treatment and having to be content with the occasional consultant visits from Liverpool—

**Val Lloyd:** I know that you share my attachment to a good regional service at Swansea, but we must not have that at the expense of quality care for children. You are being disingenuous. The report on paediatric neurosurgery does not suggest that the whole of the service should be lost; the emergency side would be retained.

Mae gan Loegr 14 o ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol mawr, a phrin yw'r cleifion hynny sydd â mwy nag un awr o daith i gyrraedd canolfan o'r fath. Mae ein daearyddiaeth yn wahanol, Brian—edrychwch ar fap. Ni thycia'r model hwn i Gymru. Os bydd canolfannau rhanbarthol yn dechrau gadael Abertawe, bydd rhannau helaeth o'r Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin yn ddwy neu dair awr neu fwy oddi wrth y ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd neu Fryste. Os ydym i sicrhau gwasanaeth derbyniol i'n plant yng Ngheredigion ac yn sir Benfro, rhaid i niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig, triniaeth ar gyfer llosgiadau a phlastigion, llawdriniaeth thorasig ac yn y blaen, gael aros yn Abertawe.

**Brian Gibbons:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**David Lloyd:** Daliwch i dyllu, Brian.

**Brian Gibbons:** Wrth wrando ar Dai Lloyd, byddai rhywun yn tybio nad yw wedi dysgu'r gwersi a gafwyd yn achos llawdriniaeth gardiaidd ar gyfer plant ym Mryste. Mae'r diffyg cysondeb o ran cydnabod yr angen am fâs critigol er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau arbenigol yn gywilyddus, ac awgrymaf fod cyfraniad David Lloyd yn peri perygl difrifol i blant ledled y De.

**David Lloyd:** Cafwyd rhai ymyriadau truenus yn y Cyfarfod Llawn dros y blynyddoedd, ac mae hwnnw ymysg y gwaethaf.

Beth am blant Ceredigion a sir Benfro? Nid oes gennym ond dwy ganolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol: yng Nghaerdydd ac yn Abertawe. Mae pobl y Gogledd wedi dioddef am flynyddoedd o orfod teithio am oriau i gael triniaeth a gorfod bodloni ar ambell ymweliad gan ymgynghorydd o Lerpwl—

**Val Lloyd:** Gwn eich bod yn rhoi cymaint o bwys ag yr wyf fi ar gael gwasanaeth rhanbarthol da yn Abertawe, ond ni ddylem ei gael ar draul gofal o ansawdd da i blant. Yr ydych yn annidwyll. Nid yw'r adroddiad ar niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn awgrymu y dylid cael gwared ar y gwasanaeth cyfan; bwriedir cadw'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer achosion brys.

**David Lloyd:** What about the critical mass? The unit is being shut because it does not treat enough cases, yet the fig leaf says that it is alright to treat just 10 emergency cases a year. That makes no philosophical sense. Read it properly.

With no regional centres of excellence in north Wales, people have to make do with occasional consultant visits from Liverpool, with little or no community services and no aftercare. Why should children in Wales not have the same access time for treatment as children in England? Explain that, Brian. We need a Welsh solution to a Welsh problem. We need to develop more regional centres of excellence, not lose the ones we have. We need to counter centralisation because of our geography. We already have the worst health statistics and the longest waiting lists.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** You keep going on about access times, Dai, and the children of Pembrokeshire. I live in Pembrokeshire and am a mother of five children. We use a helicopter to get our children to emergency services. Can you explain that?

**David Lloyd:** A charity ambulance takes two hours to get to Swansea and it takes even longer to get to Cardiff and Bristol by helicopter. Patients in Wales suffer a double whammy. They wait longer to be seen in the first place, as we have just heard in Rhodri Glyn's excellent contribution, and they travel far longer to get treatment, having waited far longer in the first place. We need a Welsh health policy—a made-in-Wales solution that does not just routinely follow England. I know of the argument about the critical mass of population required to provide treatment, Brian, but think creatively, Deputy Minister. Build up regional centres of excellence here, using the population of Liverpool and Bristol as required. It does not all have to be one way.

This is a political policy decision. I appeal to Assembly Members of all parties, but

**David Lloyd:** Beth am y màs critigol? Caer yr uned am nad yw'n trin digon o achosion, ac eto dywed y ddeilen ffigys mai iawn yw trin dim ond 10 o achosion brys y flwyddyn. Nid oes unrhyw synnwyr yn hynny. Darllenwch ef yn iawn.

Gan nad oes unrhyw ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol yn y Gogledd, rhaid i bobl fodloni ar ambell ymweliad gan ymgynghorydd o Lerpwl, heb fawr ddim gwasanaethau cymunedol a dim ôl-ofal. Pam na ddylai plant yng Nghymru gael triniaeth o fewn yr un amser â phlant yn Lloegr? Eglurwch hynny, Brian. Rhaid cael ateb Cymreig i broblem Gymreig. Rhaid datblygu rhagor o ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol, yn hytrach na cholli'r rhai sydd gennym. Rhaid gwrthwynebu canoli oherwydd ein daearyddiaeth. Gennym ni y mae'r ystadegau iechyd gwaethaf a'r rhestrau aros hwyaf eisoes.

**Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey:** Yr ydych yn sôn yn ddi-baid am amseroedd mynediad, Dai, ac am blant sir Benfro. Yr wyf yn byw yn sir Benfro ac yn fam i bump o blant. Defnyddiwn hofrennydd i fynd â'n plant i dderbyn gwasanaethau brys. A allwch chi egluro hynny?

**David Lloyd:** Mae ambiwlans elusen yn cymryd dwy awr i gyrraedd Abertawe a chymer yn hwy byth i gyrraedd Caerdydd a Bryste mewn hofrennydd. Mae cleifion yng Nghymru'n profi ergyd ddwbl. Maent yn aros yn hwy i gael eu gweld yn y lle cyntaf, fel yr ydym newydd glywed yng nghyfraniad rhagorol Rhodri Glyn, a rhaid iddynt deithio'n bellach i gael triniaeth, a hwythau wedi disgwyl yn hwy yn y lle cyntaf. Rhaid cael polisi iechyd Cymreig—ateb a wnaed yng Nghymru nad yw'n dilyn Lloegr fel mater o drefn. Deallaf y ddadl am y màs critigol y mae ei angen i ddarparu triniaeth, Brian, ond meddylwch mewn modd creadigol, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Datblygwch ganolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol yma, gan ddefnyddio poblogaethau Lerpwl a Bryste yn ôl y gofyn. Nid oes raid i bopeth fynd i'r un cyfeiriad.

Penderfyniad gwleidyddol ar bolisi yw hwn. Apeliat at Aelodau Cynulliad o bob plaid,

particularly those Members covering Ceredigion, Pembrokeshire, Carmarthen, as well as Swansea, Neath and Aberavon, to vote to retain paediatric neurosurgery in Swansea. This is your chance now, Brian. Shut up and vote properly. Government here has an honourable record of rejecting experts' reviews. It has already rejected the Richard commission. Keep it up, reject this one, and vote to retain paediatric neurosurgery in Swansea.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call other speakers, I do not want this debate to become bad tempered, and it is well on the way to becoming so. I appeal for short speeches, made in a calm manner, so that we have something serious to consider after they are made.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A few months ago, a constituent of mine was told that she would have to wait 17 weeks for a mammogram. That was a shock to many Members and the media who felt that that was an incredible length of time to be told to wait for such an important scan. Another constituent of mine from the north of the city was also told to wait 17 weeks for a mammogram. She is in her 30s, and has since been diagnosed with breast cancer. I use that purely as an example to highlight the fact that Wales, in some respects, has a third-world service. We are not seeing the developments within our NHS that we would expect as Assembly Members, taxpayers, constituents, patients, doctors and nurses. That case, and the case of Theresa Debono a few months ago, highlights the extent of the misery for some people.

It does not end there. We have heard the staggering waiting list figures—the global figure is somewhere in the region of 309,000. There are as many people living in the capital city in Wales as there are on a waiting list in Wales. That is an astonishing statistic when compared with the situation in England and most countries in western Europe. It is something, regardless of the second offer scheme, that the Government has not been able to get to grips with, and there are many

ond yn enwedig y rhai sy'n gwasanaethu Ceredigion, sir Benfro, Caerfyrddin, yn ogystal ag Abertawe, Castell-nedd ac Aberafan, am iddynt bleidleisio i gadw niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Abertawe. Dyma'ch cyfle'n awr, Brian. Byddwch ddistaw a phleidleisiwch yn iawn. Mae gan y Llywodraeth hon record anrhydeddus ar wrthod adolygiadau gan arbenigwyr. Mae eisoes wedi gwrthod adolygiad comisiwn Richard. Daliwch ati, gwrthodwch hwn, a phleidleisiwch i gadw niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig yn Abertawe.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar siaradwyr eraill, nid wyf am weld y ddatl hon yn mynd yn un ddrwg ei thymmer, ac mae'n agos iawn at fod felly. Apeliaf am areithiau byr, a draddodir yn bwylllog, fel y bydd gennym rywbeth o bwys i'w ystyried ar ôl eu traddodi.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, dywedwyd wrth un o'm hetholwyr y byddai'n gorfod disgwyl 17 wythnos i gael mamogram. Rhoddodd hynny ysgytwad i lawer o Aelodau ac i'r cyfryngau a deimlai fod hynny'n gyfnod anghygoel o hir i orfod disgwyl i gael sgan pwysig o'r fath. Dywedwyd wrth un arall o'm hetholwyr yng ngogledd y ddinas y byddai'n gorfod disgwyl 17 wythnos i gael mamogram. Mae dros ei 30, a chanfuwyd ers hynny fod canser y fron arni. Nid wyf ond yn defnyddio hynny fel enghraifft i ddangos fod y gwasanaeth mewn rhai meysydd yng Nghymru yn debycach i'r hyn a geir yn y trydydd byd. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn datblygu fel y disgwyliem fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, trethdalwyr, etholwyr, cleifion, meddygon a nyrsys. Mae'r achos hwnnw, ac un Theresa Debono ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, yn dangos cymaint yw dioddefaint rhai pobl.

Ond, mae mwy na hynny. Clywsom ffigurau syfrdanol y rhestrau aros—mae'r cyfanswm tua 309,000. Mae cynifer yn byw ym mhrifddinas Cymru ag sydd ar restr aros yng Nghymru. Drwy gymharu'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru â'r un yn Lloegr a'r rhan fwyaf o wledydd gorllewin Ewrop, sylweddolwn fod yr ystadegyn yn syfrdanol. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi llwyddo i fynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros, beth bynnag am gynllun yr ail gynnig, ac mae llawer y gallai ei wneud i

things it could be doing to resolve this situation.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I do not minimise the worry and fear of anyone who suspects that they have cancer—I can understand that. However, looking at the broader picture, if the position is as bad as you suggest, what about the situation in Caerphilly Local Health Board? At the end of March this year, 47 people were waiting for in-patient treatment for longer than 18 months. That is now down to three people and, by next month, it will be down to nil. Furthermore, no-one in the borough was classified as a delayed transfer of care as of the census day this month. Does that not prove that the policies by this Government and implemented locally are working?

4.40 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am more than happy to recognise that there has been success in certain areas, but it is sad, when you consider south-east Wales, that it does not happen in areas such as Blaenau Gwent and Torfaen. Caerphilly may be on its own, but when you consider the rest of Wales and the global figure, the situation in Wales is very bad.

I am confused about one point: there are 309,000 people waiting for treatment, and yet only recently did the Minister decide to take any action in terms of the second offer scheme. Even the Wanless report suggests that immediate and urgent action should be taken by the Minister, but the Minister has failed to heed its suggestions. The report mentions considering out-of-Wales options to alleviate the waiting list problem, yet Jane Hutt fails to recognise the importance of what the Wanless report states.

Consider cardiac patients—they are having to wait upwards of 10 months for treatment. If you are waiting for a triple heart bypass, the last thing you want to do is wait 10 months for what could be life-saving surgery. Yet, we know for a fact that in England, there is so much spare capacity that the Assembly Government could pay to eliminate the waiting list in Wales by treating Welsh patients in England. Patients would not have

ddatrys y sefyllfa hon.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Nid wyf yn bychanu'r poen a'r ofn a brofa pobl sy'n amau bod canser arnynt—gallaf ddeall hynny. Er hynny, gan edrych ar y sefyllfa gyffredinol, os ydyw cyn waethed ag yr awgrymwch, beth am y sefyllfa ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili? Ddiwedd Mawrth eleni, 47 a fu'n disgwyl am driniaeth fel cleifion mewnol yn hwy na 18 mis. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi disgyn i dri bellach ac, erbyn y mis nesaf, ni fydd neb yn disgwyl. At hynny, ni chofnodwyd yr un achos o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal yn y fwrdeistref ar ddiwrnod y cyfrifiad y mis hwn. Onid yw hynny'n profi bod polisiau'r Llywodraeth hon a roddir ar waith yn lleol yn llwyddo?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn fodlon iawn cydnabod bod llwyddiant wedi bod mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond peth trist, wrth ystyried y De-ddwyrain, yw na ddigwydd hynny mewn ardaloedd fel Blaenau Gwent a Thor-faen. Efallai fod Caerffili yn wahanol, ond pan ystyriwch weddill Cymru a'r cyfanswm, mae'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru'n wael iawn.

Mae un pwynt yn peri dryswch i mi: mae 309,000 o bobl yn disgwyl am driniaeth, ac eto, dim ond yn ddiweddar y penderfynodd y Gweinidog gymryd unrhyw gamau drwy gynllun yr ail gynnig. Mae adroddiad Wanless hyd yn oed yn awgrymu y dylai'r Gweinidog gymryd camau brys ar unwaith, ond methodd y Gweinidog â chymryd sylw o'i awgrymiadau. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am ystyried dewisiadau y tu allan i Gymru i liniaru problem y rhestr aros, ac eto mae Jane Hutt yn methu â chydabod pwysigrwydd yr hyn a ddywed adroddiad Wanless.

Ystyriwch gleifion cardiaidd—maent yn gorfod disgwyl 10 mis a mwy i gael triniaeth. Os ydych yn disgwyl i gael llawdriniaeth ddargyfeiriol driphlyg ar y galon, y peth olaf y mae arnoch ei eisiau yw gorfod disgwyl 10 mis am lawdriniaeth a allai achub eich bywyd. Ac eto, gwyddom fod cymaint o gapasiti dros ben yn Lloegr fel y gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dalu i ddileu'r rhestr aros yng Nghymru drwy drin cleifion o

to wait for more than two or three months to get treated in England, but Health Commission Wales has been told by the Government that it is only allowed to operate within the agreed financial envelope, namely within the budget that has been agreed for Health Commission Wales. If that budget were expanded, you could treat the people who are waiting by sending them across to England, which has the spare capacity.

Even your own Members of Parliament—not Conservative, Plaid Cymru or Liberal Democrat MPs, but Labour MPs—who are now terrified of losing their seats at the next general election, have been saying that the policies pursued by this Government, not just the Minister, but endorsed by the Cabinet and supported by the First Minister, are wrong for Wales and are leading to real misery for those people who are waiting for treatment. This cannot continue, which is why this motion has been tabled by colleagues today.

It is easy for the Government to blame everyone else. You can blame doctors and nurses, and blame patients for being sicker, although the Audit Commission has stated that sickness levels in Wales have nothing to do with the problem. You can blame opposition politicians, but you have to accept that you, as the Government, are responsible for how the NHS in Wales is being developed.

I will make some useful suggestions. First, you should start to ring-fence elective capacity. It is ridiculous that there is a list of 309,000 people waiting. That list gets longer because of accident and emergency crises leading to operations being ditched at the last minute. Start ring-fencing elective capacity. You should introduce a minimum waiting time for procedures—

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brian, I must first get through the list.

Gymru yn Lloegr. Ni fyddai cleifion yn gorfod disgwyl yn hwy na dau neu dri mis i gael eu trin yn Lloegr, ond mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud wrth Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru na chaiff ond gweithredu o fewn yr amlen ariannol a gytunwyd, sef o fewn y gyllideb a gytunwyd ar gyfer Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. O ddarparu cyllideb fwy, gallech drin y rhai sy'n disgwyl drwy eu hanfon i Loegr, lle y mae capasiti ar gael.

Mae hyd yn oed eich Aelodau Seneddol eich hun—nid ASau y Ceidwadwyr, Plaid Cymru na'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, ond ASau Llafur—sydd bellach yn ofni colli eu seddau yn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf, wedi bod yn dweud bod y polisiau a ddilynir gan y Llywodraeth hon, nid yn unig gan y Gweinidog, ond y rhai a gadarnhawyd gan y Cabinet ac a gefnogir gan y Prif Weinidog, yn rhai sy'n anghywir i Gymru ac yn peri gwir ddiodefaint i'r rhai sy'n disgwyl i gael triniaeth. Ni all hyn barhau, a dyna pam y cyflwynwyd y cynnig hwn gan gyd-Aelodau heddiw.

Mae'n beth hawdd i'r Llywodraeth roi bai ar bawb arall. Gallwch feio meddygon a nyrsys, a beio cleifion am fod yn salach, er bod y Comisiwn Archwilio wedi dweud nad oes a wnelo lefelau salwch yng Nghymru ddim â'r broblem. Gallwch feio gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau, ond rhaid ichi dderbyn mai chi, fel y Llywodraeth, sy'n gyfrifol am y modd y datblygir y GIG yng Nghymru.

Gwnaf rai awgrymiadau buddiol. Yn gyntaf, dylech ddechrau clustnodi capasiti ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ddewisol. Peth hurt yw bod rhestr aros o 309,000. Mae'r rhestr honno'n mynd yn hwy gan fod argyfyngau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn peri i lawdriniaethau gael eu gohirio ar y funud olaf. Dechreuwch glustnodi capasiti ar gyfer llawdriniaethau dewisol. Dylech gyflwyno amser aros byrraf ar gyfer triniaethau—

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brian, rhaid imi orffen y rhestr yn gyntaf.

You should introduce a minimum waiting time for procedures and make use of private finance initiatives, which your colleagues in England seem happy to do, to attract extra finance to the NHS in order to develop capacity. You should be commissioning cardiac surgery out of Wales, in England, and you should stop interfering in the clinical judgments of the NHS. We should leave the running of the NHS to the expertise of its staff. You should set the overall strategy and stop interfering on a day-to-day basis.

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am running out of time, Brian, so I cannot take your intervention.

Finally, it is a real pity and a great irony that, the party that apparently created the NHS and maintains its support for it, is also the party that is set to destroy the NHS in Wales .

**Peter Black:** Thank you for allowing me a few minutes to express my support for the amendment to this motion on paediatric neurosurgery. There is a huge strength of feeling in Swansea and west Wales about this proposal, and I hope that the Minister for Health and Social Services will take that into account when she makes the decision, which is now in her hands, following the rejection of the proposals by the two community health councils in Swansea and Neath Port Talbot. I have asked Jane Hutt about many issues relating to the sustainability of the existing proposals, particularly emergency operations. If you are to argue that the present service is not sustainable because few operations are undertaken, it is difficult to then argue that an emergency service is sustainable on the basis of even fewer operations. The Minister must have a substantive answer to that question.

Secondly, on the option of having a Swansea-based service, no assessment was made of that in the Health Commission Wales report—

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**Peter Black:** I do not have time to give way, Brian. I will quickly make these points and

Dylech gyflwyno amser aros byrraf ar gyfer triniaethau a defnyddio mentrau cyllid preifat, fel y mae'ch cymheiriaid yn Lloegr yn ddigon bodlon gwneud yn ôl pob golwg, i ddod â mwy o gyllid i'r GIG er mwyn datblygu capasiti. Dylech gomisiynu llawdriniaethau cardiaidd y tu allan i Gymru, yn Lloegr, a dylech roi'r gorau i ymyrryd â phenderfyniadau clinigol y GIG. Dylem adael y gwaith o redeg y GIG i arbenigedd ei staff. Dylech osod y strategaeth gyffredinol a rhoi'r gorau i ymyrryd o ddydd i ddydd.

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae fy amser yn dod i ben, Brian, felly ni allaf dderbyn ymyriad gennyh.

Yn olaf, mae'n drueni ac yn eironi mawr mai'r blaid a greodd y GIG, mae'n debyg, ac sy'n dal i'w gefnogi, yw'r blaid sy'n debygol o ddinistrio'r GIG yng Nghymru .

**Peter Black:** Diolch i chi am ganiatáu ychydig funudau imi fynegi cefnogaeth i'r gwelliant i'r cynnig hwn ar niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig. Mae teimladau cryf iawn yn Abertawe a'r Gorllewin ynghylch y bwriad hwn, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystyried hynny pan wnaiff y penderfyniad, sydd yn ei dwylo hi bellach, wedi i'r ddau gyngor iechyd cymuned yn Abertawe a Chastell-nedd Port Talbot wrthod y cynnig. Yr wyf wedi holi Jane Hutt ynghylch llawer o faterion sy'n ymwneud â chynaliadwyedd y cynnig presennol, yn enwedig llawdriniaethau brys. Os ydych am ddadlau nad yw'r gwasanaeth presennol yn gynaliadwy am mai ychydig o lawdriniaethau a gyflawnir, anodd yw dadlau wedyn fod gwasanaeth brys yn gynaliadwy ar sail llai byth o lawdriniaethau. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog gynnig ateb o sylwedd i'r cwestiwn hwnnw.

Yn ail, ynghylch y dewis o gael gwasanaeth wedi'i leoli yn Abertawe, ni wnaed asesiad o hynny yn adroddiad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru—

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Peter Black:** Nid oes gennyf amser i'w roi, Brian. Yr wyf am wneud y pwyntiau hyn yn

then conclude.

No assessment of that was made in the Health Commission Wales report. Will the Minister make an assessment of that before she makes her decision? It is important that that is looked at. The concern in Swansea is about the future viability of specialist services at Morriston Hospital. There is also concerns about the burns unit, and the fact that it is now being proposed that paediatric neurosurgery move to Cardiff is fuelling those concerns. Can the Minister assure us that she is aware of those concerns, and will she take them into account when she makes her decisions?

**Val Lloyd:** When he opened the debate, Rhodri Glyn graciously acknowledged what he called a limited number of good news stories. However, time and again, the opposition parties choose to focus on the negatives, but do not talk about the ongoing good news stories. Every day, thousands of people receive first-rate services from all corners of the NHS, although I, too, acknowledge that there are individual cases that do not work out as planned. Such cases must always be reviewed to prevent a recurrence. The hard work of the dedicated staff should not be undermined or disparaged. I wish to place on record my support for their continued hard work and professionalism.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that if we had gone for five years with a Labour Government in the Assembly, and not had any good news stories, your health policy would be in an even worse mess than it is now? Everyone acknowledges that small progressive steps have been taken in the health service. However, the overriding picture is of a health policy that is failing Wales and its people, failing to bring down waiting lists and failing to meet the demand that is out there. You are being criticised not just by the opposition parties in the Assembly, but by your own colleagues within the Labour Party. It is about time that this Assembly Labour Government stood up, held up its hands and said 'Yes, we should start to do things better'.

**Val Lloyd:** There are many good news stories. I have acknowledged that not

gyflym cyn terfynu.

Ni wnaed asesiad o hynny yn adroddiad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog asesu lleoli'r gwasanaeth yn Abertawe cyn penderfynu? Mae'n bwysig ystyried hynny. Mae pryder yn Abertawe ynghylch pa mor ddichonadwy y bydd gwasanaethau arbenigol yn Ysbyty Treforys yn y dyfodol. Mae pryderon hefyd ynghylch yr uned losgiadau, ac mae'r bwriad a geir yn awr i symud niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig i Gaerdydd yn dwysáu'r pryderon hynny. A all y Gweinidog ein sicrhau ei bod yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon hynny, ac a wnaiff eu hystyried pan wnaiff ei phenderfyniad?

**Val Lloyd:** Wrth agor y ddatl, cydnabu Rhodri Glyn yn garedig yr hyn a alwodd yn nifer bach o storïau newyddion da. Er hynny, dro ar ôl tro, mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n dewis canolbwyntio ar yr agweddau negyddol, ac nid ydynt yn sôn am y newyddion da a ddaw yn gyson. Bob dydd, mae miloedd o bobl yn manteisio ar wasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf ym mhob rhan o'r GIG, er fy mod innau'n cydnabod bod rhai achosion nad ydynt yn diweddu fel y bwriadwyd. Rhaid adolygu achosion o'r fath i sicrhau na fyddant yn digwydd eto. Ni ddylid tanseilio na dibrisio gwaith caled y staff ymroddedig. Dymunaf ddatgan ar goedd fy nghefnogaeth i'w gwaith caled a'u proffesiynoldeb parhaus.

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn cytuno, pe cawsem bum mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad heb unrhyw storïau newyddion da, y byddai'ch polisi ar iechyd yn fwy o lanastr nag ydyw? Mae pawb yn cydnabod bod rhai camau bach ymlaen wedi'u cymryd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Er hynny, yr hyn a welir yn bennaf yw polisi ar iechyd sy'n gwneud cam â Chymru a'i phobl, yn methu â chwotgi rhestrau aros ac yn methu ag ateb y galw. Fe'ch beirnedir nid yn unig gan y gwrthbleidiau yn y Cynulliad, ond gan eich cymheiriaid eich hunain yn y Blaid Lafur. Mae'n hen bryd i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad sefyll ar ei thraed, codi ei dwylo a dweud 'Ie, dylem ddechrau gwneud pethau'n well'.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae tipyn o newyddion da. Yr wyf wedi cydnabod nad yw popeth yn



everything is perfect, but the glass is not half empty but nearly full: the 44,000 people whose quality of life has improved because of digital hearing aids are a case in point, as has already been mentioned. This week alone, I have been contacted separately by two families within my constituency, not known to me, who wanted to speak to me with the express intention of putting on record their praise for the speedy and responsive care that they received from the NHS. Let us not forget that people such as these are the majority in Wales.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you give way?

**Val Lloyd:** I would like to get a little further in my speech as time is short, Eleanor. I will come back to you, hopefully.

The Government's policies are delivering real solutions. The 60 per cent overall increase in funding for the health service in the last four years is allowing us to build more and better hospitals, deliver better primary healthcare centres and increase our investment in better equipment.

I welcome the recent £30 million announced by the Minister to boost frontline services. I note that this is shared out among the regions, as well as going towards national services such as public access to defibrillators. Of that money, the £3.7 million coming to Swansea will be used to finance needed services there, and improve the quality of care, for example, in relation to the day care centre in Singleton Hospital, increased renal dialysis centres and a new medical assessment centre, which is desperately needed at Morriston Hospital. They will provide better services and care for patients in Swansea and the region that it serves.

Patient care is paramount and our priority is to provide a sustainable, safe and high-quality service that meets the present and future needs of patients across Wales. Providing safe services is the principal objective of both policy makers and health professionals. A previous speaker mentioned Derek Wanless, but he also said that a

berffaith, ond nid hanner gwag y mae'r gwydr ond bron yn llawn: un enghraifft o hynny yw'r 44,000 o bobl sydd ag ansawdd bywyd gwell oherwydd cymhorthion clywed digidol, fel y dywedwyd eisoes. Yr wythnos hon, mae dau deulu yn fy etholaeth, nad wyf yn eu hadnabod, wedi cysylltu â mi ar wahân yn unswydd i ddatgan eu canmoliaeth i'r gofal cyflym ac ymatebol a gawsant gan y GIG. Na foed inni anghofio mai pobl felly yw'r mwyafrif yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Val Lloyd:** Carwn barhau â'm haraith am ychydig gan fod amser yn brin, Eleanor. Deuaf yn ôl atoch, yr wyf yn gobeithio.

Mae polisiâu'r Llywodraeth yn sicrhau atebion go iawn. Mae'r cynnydd cyffredinol o 60 y cant yn y cyllid ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y pedair blynedd diwethaf yn caniatáu inni adeiladu mwy o ysbytai, a rhai gwell, cynnig gwell canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol a buddsoddi mwy mewn offer gwell.

Croesawaf gyhoeddiad diweddar y Gweinidog am £30 miliwn i hybu gwasanaethau yn y rheng flaen. Nodaf fod hyn i'w rannu ymysg y rhanbarthau, a'i fod i'w roi hefyd tuag at wasanaethau cenedlaethol fel diffribrilwyr i'r cyhoedd. O'r arian hwnnw, defnyddir y £3.7 miliwn a ddaw i Abertawe i ariannu gwasanaethau y mae eu hangen yma, ac i wella ansawdd gofal, er enghraifft, mewn cysylltiad â'r ganolfan gofal dydd yn Ysbyty Singleton, rhagor o ganolfannau dialysis arenol a chanolfan asesu meddygol newydd, y mae taer angen amdani yn Ysbyty Treforys. Byddant yn darparu gwell gwasanaethau a gofal i gleifion yn Abertawe ac yn y rhanbarth a wasanaetha.

Mae gofal am gleifion o'r pwys mwyaf a'r flaenoriaeth sydd gennym yw darparu gwasanaeth cynaliadwy, diogel o ansawdd da sy'n diwallu anghenion cleifion ledled Cymru yn awr ac yn y dyfodol. Darparu gwasanaethau diogel yw prif amcan y llunwyr polisi a'r gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol. Cyfeiriodd siaradwr blaenorol

holistic approach must be taken, and investment must be made in long and short-term outcomes in order to create a sustainable health service. We are addressing both of these in our 10-year strategic plan, which, to remind you all, was endorsed by Derek Wanless.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As you are referring to strategy, perhaps I could quote Tony Calland, who said at the British Medical Association conference in Llandudno:

4.50 p.m.

‘The BMA is losing patience with the lack of strategic direction and planning—putting the Assembly Government on notice that their support in the future will become dependent on results and improvement in the service to patients.’

That sounds different from what you are saying.

**Val Lloyd:** Just as statistics can be used to illustrate anything, so can quotations. I also have a quotation from the BMA, which states that,

‘In regards to out-of-hours services the main systems are, in the main, working very well right across Wales’.

Time is pressing. Wanless also said that health should not be used as a political football. I have not had time to go into as many examples as I would like, but the ones that I have mentioned only begin to scratch the surface of Labour’s holistic health strategy, and show why I will not support this motion.

**Janet Ryder:** As has already been said, the loss of services in Swansea will mean that large areas of south Wales will have little or no access to service coverage in their own areas. In many service areas in north Wales, services are commissioned from outside Wales. One area of concern in north Wales is the provision of neurological and

at Derek Wanless, ond dywedodd ef hefyd fod rhaid dilyn dull gweithredu cyfannol, a bod rhaid buddsoddi mewn canlyniadau tymor hir a thymor byr er mwyn creu gwasanaeth iechyd cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â’r ddau fater hynny yn ein strategaeth 10 mlynedd. Fe’ch atgoffaf y cefnogwyd y strategaeth honno gan Derek Wanless.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gan eich bod yn cyfeirio at strategaeth, efallai y caf ddyfynnu geiriau Tony Calland, a ddywedodd yng nghynhadledd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn Llandudno:

Mae’r BMA yn colli amynedd oherwydd y diffygion o ran strategaeth a chynllunio—ac mae’n rhybuddio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y bydd ei chefnogaeth yn y dyfodol yn amodol ar gael canlyniadau a gwelliannau yn y gwasanaeth i gleifion.

Mae hynny’n swnio’n wahanol i’r hyn yr ydych chi’n ei ddweud.

**Val Lloyd:** Yn union fel y gellir defnyddio ystadegau i ddangos rhywbeth, felly y mae yn achos dyfyniadau. Mae gennyf finnau eiriau o eiddo’r BMA i’w dyfynnu, sef

Gyda golwg ar wasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol, mae’r systemau’n gweithio’n dda iawn, at ei gilydd, ledled Cymru.

Mae amser yn brin. Dywedodd Wanless hefyd na ddylid defnyddio iechyd fel pêl droed wleidyddol. Ni chefais ddigon o amser i ymdrin â chynifer o enghreifftiau ag y dymunaswn, ond nid yw’r rhai yr wyf wedi cyfeirio atynt ond yn rhai o blith llawer o agweddau ar strategaeth iechyd gyfannol Llafur, a dangosant pam na chefnogaf y cynnig hwn.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, bydd colli gwasanaethau yn Abertawe yn golygu na fydd gan ardaloedd helaeth o’r De fawr ddim gwasanaethau lleol. Mewn sawl maes gwasanaeth yn y Gogledd, comisiynir gwasanaethau y tu allan i Gymru. Un maes sy’n peri pryder yn y Gogledd yw gwasanaethau niwrolegol a niwrolawfeddyol.

neurosurgery services. The standard of care received from specialists is excellent, but the availability of services is poor. All services are commissioned from the Walton Centre for Neurology in Liverpool. Specialists hold clinics weekly. However, there are 12-month waiting lists for new neurology referrals. In England, patients must be seen within 16 weeks, which will fall to 13 weeks next year, despite per capita health spending being higher in Wales than in England.

To improve services, a detailed three-year plan was drawn up, the core of which was to provide one extra neurologist a year for three years. The first phase provided extra sessions at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. The North Wales Health Authority then reneged on its agreement to implement phase 2, which would have been a new post at Ysbyty Gwynedd, because of medico-legal concerns. Ironically, one of the larger legal settlements at Ysbyty Gwynedd arose from the lack of neurology input.

Paralysis set in with the demise of the health authority, and the case was then taken up by the specialists themselves with Health Commission Wales. So far, Health Commission Wales has not made any proposals whatsoever. As recently as May 2004, there was still debate as to which body was responsible for funding neurology services, and, after a long-standing initial assumption, it was agreed that it was Health Commission Wales. I quote from a communication from one of those specialists:

‘I regard the situation as very unsatisfactory and the waiting times are definitely worsening month on month.’

It has always been assumed that, as specialist care was provided in Liverpool, should specialist hospital care be needed, that too would be provided in Liverpool. However, that is not the case. On 6 August, Jim Roberts was admitted to hospital in Wrexham. His usual doctor, from Liverpool, was unable to attend Wrexham Maelor Hospital, and when

Mae safon y gofal a geir gan arbenigwyr yn rhagorol, ond mae argaeledd y gwasanaethau'n wael. Comisiynir yr holl wasanaethau yng nghanolfan niwroleg Walton yn Lerpwl. Mae arbenigwyr yn cynnal clinigau bob wythnos. Fodd bynnag, mae cleifion niwrolegol a atgyfeirir o'r newydd yn gorfod disgwyl 12 mis. Yn Lloegr, rhaid gweld cleifion cyn pen 16 wythnos, a bydd y cyfnod yn gostwng i 13 wythnos y flwyddyn nesaf, er bod mwy o wariant y pen ar iechyd yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr.

Er mwyn gwella gwasanaethau, paratowyd cynllun tair blynedd manwl, a'r prif fwriad ynddo oedd darparu un niwrolegydd ychwanegol y flwyddyn am dair blynedd. Yn y cyfnod cyntaf, cynhaliwyd sesiynau ychwanegol yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Wedyn, torrodd Awdurdod Iechyd Gogledd Cymru ei gytundeb i roi cam 2 ar waith, sef swydd newydd yn Ysbyty Gwynedd, oherwydd pryderon ynghylch materion meddygol-gyfreithiol. Yn eironig, yr oedd un o'r setliadau cyfreithiol mwyaf yn Ysbyty Gwynedd yn ganlyniad i ddiffyg mewnbwn niwrolegol.

Ni welwyd unrhyw ddatblygiadau ar ôl diddymu'r awdurdod iechyd, a chodwyd y mater hwn wedyn gan yr arbenigwyr eu hunain gyda Chomisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Hyd yma, nid yw Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi cyflwyno unrhyw gynigion o gwbl. Mor ddiweddar â Mai 2004, yr oedd dadlau o hyd ynghylch pa gorff a oedd yn gyfrifol am ariannu gwasanaethau niwrolegol, ac, er tybio o'r dechrau mai felly y dylai fod, cytunwyd yn y diwedd mai Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru a ddylai wneud. Dyfynnaf y geiriau hyn o neges oddi wrth un o'r arbenigwyr:

Credaf fod y sefyllfa'n dra anfodddhaol ac mae'r amseroedd aros yn sicr yn gwaethygu o fis i fis.

Rhagdybiwyd erioed, gan mai o Lerpwl y darperid gofal arbenigol, pe bai angen gofal arbenigol mewn ysbyty, y darperid hwnnw hefyd yn Lerpwl. Fodd bynnag, nid felly y mae. Ar 6 Awst, derbyniwyd Jim Roberts i'r ysbyty yn Wrecsam. Nid oedd ei feddyg arferol, o Lerpwl, yn gallu dod i Ysbyty Maelor Wrecsam, a phan ofynnwyd am wely

a bed was requested for Jim in Liverpool, where specialist care could be provided, doctors responded that there was not a cat in hell's chance of him getting into Liverpool as there are never any beds. The inappropriate nature of care that Jim received resulted in him eventually being sectioned, and has left him and his family badly affected. Jim's case would have been greatly eased had there been a specialist Parkinson's nurse in Wrexham.

That case has caused much uneasiness among Parkinson's sufferers and their families in the Wrexham area, where there are over 400 people diagnosed with Parkinson's disease, all of whom must rely on services from Liverpool. They had assumed that, should it be required, support and a hospital place would be available from Liverpool. They no longer have faith that that will be the case. It is now time for this Government to give proper direction. As suggested by specialists, the Government should instruct Health Commission Wales to come forward with a plan to develop neurological services, fully supported by specialist nurses, in north Wales.

I will also refer to Shropdoc. According to Wrexham's contract with Shropdoc, there should be access to triage in Shrewsbury, plus two doctors available, who, between them, undertake consultations at centres in Wrexham or Oswestry, and will undertake home visits if necessary.

**Ann Jones:** You have moved on, and I want to just pull you back to the specialist nurses.

I listened with interest to what you said about the lack of a specialist nurse in the North East Wales NHS Trust. Do you agree that the Parkinson's disease specialist nurse operating out of the Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust is doing a marvellous job? Perhaps, instead of always looking over that way, we should be looking at what is going on.

While I am on my feet, will you join me in congratulating the Minister on the £13 million in capital expenditure for the north

i Jim yn Lerpwl, er mwyn iddo gael gofal arbenigol, ateb y meddygon oedd nad oedd yr un gobaith iddo gael lle yn Lerpwl gan na fydd byth unrhyw welyau ar gael. Oherwydd natur anaddas y gofal a gafodd Jim, cafodd ei anfon i'r ysbyty yn y diwedd, ac mae hynny wedi cael effaith ddrwg arno ef a'i deulu. Gallesid trafod achos Jim yn haws o lawer pe buasai nyrs sy'n arbenigo ar glefyd Parkinson yn Wrecsam.

Mae'r achos hwnnw wedi peri llawer o anesmwythyd ymysg rhai sy'n dioddef clefyd Parkinson a'u teuluoedd yn ardal Wrecsam, lle y mae dros 400 o bobl y canfuwyd bod clefyd Parkinson arnynt, y mae pob un ohonynt yn gorfod dibynnu ar wasanaethau o Lerpwl. Yr oeddent wedi cymryd y byddai cymorth a lle ar gael mewn ysbyty yn Lerpwl pe bai angen hynny. Bellach, nid ydynt yn teimlo'n ffyddiog o hynny. Mae'n bryd yn awr i'r Llywodraeth hon gynnig yr arweiniad sydd ei angen. Fel yr awgrymodd arbenigwyr, dylai'r Llywodraeth gyfarwyddo Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru i gyflwyno cynllun i ddatblygu gwasanaethau niwrolegol yn y Gogledd, gyda chymorth nyrsys arbenigol.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at Shropdoc. Yn ôl y contract sydd gan Wrecsam â Shropdoc, dylai gofal fod ar gael yn ôl blaenoriaeth yn Amwythig, ynghyd â dau feddyg a fydd rhyngddynt yn cynnig ymgynghoriadau mewn canolfannau yn Wrecsam neu Groesoswallt, ac a fydd yn ymweld â chleifion yn eu cartrefi os oes angen.

**Ann Jones:** Yr ydych wedi symud ymlaen, ond yr wyf am fynd â chi'n ôl at y nyrsys arbenigol.

Gwrandewais gyda diddordeb ar yr hyn a ddywedasoch am ddiffyg nyrs arbenigol yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru. A gytunwch fod y nyrs sy'n arbenigo ar glefyd Parkinson sy'n gweithio o Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol? Yn hytrach nag edrych i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw bob tro, efallai y dylem edrych ar yr hyn sy'n mynd ymlaen.

Tra wyf ar fy nhraed, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y Gweinidog ar y £13 miliwn o wariant cyfalaf ar gyfer ysgol hyfforddiant

Wales medical training school? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Do not groan. That school will give us some training positions, some enhanced teaching positions and, hopefully, it will take us forward.

**Janet Ryder:** If you talk to the Parkinson's nurse at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd, as I have often done, you will find that she is doing a very good job, but is over-stretched. She has to try to cover the Wrexham area.

Let us look at Shropdoc and its record. Low as the level of service that I have just mentioned seems, it is even worse when in operation. When Mr Len Willett's wife was taken ill during the night, he was told that only two doctors were on call to cover, not just Wrexham, but the Shropshire area as well, one of whom was the doctor answering his call, while the other was in Oswestry and would be unable to get to Wrexham in any case. Mr Willett was advised to telephone back every two hours, and after three calls, he was informed that there might be a doctor at Pendine Park, by which time Mr Willett, himself a sufferer from Parkinson's disease, was too ill to take his wife to the clinic. When Mrs Jones telephoned to request a home visit for her seriously-ill husband, she was told to take him to Pendine, which she duly did. She wrapped him up warmly and took him to the clinic where the less-than-courteous doctor told her to stop wasting his time, to take her husband home and to keep him warm. Mr Jones was admitted to hospital later that night with acute pneumonia. Regrettably, he has since died. Those are only two of the many examples of the effect of the poor out-of-hours service in Wrexham. The Government must review the service offered by that provider and ensure that people, not just in Wrexham, but throughout Wales, are getting adequate cover for their out-of-hours service.

**Kirsty Williams:** There seems to be an illness in Wales today that primarily affects those in charge of health policy. The symptoms, I am afraid to report, are quite alarming and include recurrent urges to promise small, ineffective pots of money to a

meddygol y Gogledd? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Peidiwch ag ochneidio. Bydd yr ysgol honno'n cynnig lleoedd hyfforddi i ni, swyddi dysgu gwell ac, yr wyf yn gobeithio, bydd yn rhoi hwb ymlaen i ni.

**Janet Ryder:** Os siaradwch â'r nyrs sy'n arbenigo ar glefyd Parkinson yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd, fel y gwneuthum yn aml, cewch ei bod yn gwneud gwaith da iawn, ond ei bod wedi'i gorymestyn. Rhaid iddi geisio gwasanaethu ardal Wrecsam.

Gadewch inni edrych ar Shropdoc a'i record. Er ised yr ymddengys lefel y gwasanaeth yr wyf newydd gyfeirio ati, mae'n waeth byth pan fydd ar waith. Pan aeth gwraig Mr Len Willett yn sâl yn y nos, dywedwyd wrtho mai dim ond dau feddyg a oedd ar alwad i wasanaethu, nid yn unig Wrecsam, ond ardal sir Amwythig hefyd, ac mai un ohonynt oedd y meddyg a oedd yn ateb ei alwad, a bod y llall yng Nghroesoswallt ac na allai gyrraedd Wrecsam pa un bynnag. Cynghorwyd Mr Willett i ffonio'n ôl bob dwy awr, ac ar ôl gwneud tair galwad, dywedwyd wrtho ei bod yn bosibl bod meddyg yn Pendine Park, ond erbyn hynny yr oedd Mr Willett, sy'n dioddef clefyd Parkinson, yn rhy sâl i fynd â'i wraig i'r clinig. Pan ffoniodd Mrs Jones i ofyn am i feddyg ddod i'w chartref at ei gŵr sy'n ddifrifol wael, cafodd gyfarwyddyd i fynd ag ef i Pendine, a hynny a wnaeth. Fe'i lapiodd yn gynnes a mynd ag ef i'r clinig lle y dywedodd y meddyg wrthi'n llai na chwrtais am beidio â gwastraffu ei amser, ac am fynd â'i gŵr adref a'i gadw'n gynnes. Derbyniwyd Mr Jones i'r ysbyty'n ddiweddarach y noson honno gan ddioddef o niwmonia difrifol. Gwaetha'r modd, bu farw ers hynny. Dim ond dwy o blith llawer o enghreifftiau yw'r rhain o effaith y gwasanaeth gwael a gynigir y tu allan i oriau arferol yn Wrecsam. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth adolygu'r gwasanaeth a gynigir gan y darparwr hwnnw a sicrhau bod digon o ofal ar gael i bobl, nid yn unig yn Wrecsam, ond ledled Cymru, yn y gwasanaeth a geir y tu allan i oriau arferol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ymddengys fod salwch yng Nghymru heddiw sy'n effeithio'n bennaf ar y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am bolisiau iechyd. Mae arnaf ofn bod y symptomau'n eithaf brawychus ac maent yn cynnwys ysfeydd rheolaidd i addo symiau bach ac aneffeithiol

variety of initiatives, an outbreak of task groups to deal with painful decisions, permanent loss of strategic vision, painful shocks every month when the new waiting list figures are released, and, then, a violent, trembling reaction to anyone pointing out the failings of the current policy.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Can you indicate whether this unfortunate group of people is covered under the Mental Health Bill?

**Kirsty Williams:** I am glad to report, Jonathan, that the disease is not incurable, although, like many medical conditions, it requires the sufferer to accept the diagnosis before improvement can take place, and there has been precious little of that in the second Assembly.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Would you say that the £100 million pledged for the new hospital for the Rhymney valley is a small initiative that will not be of great benefit to the people of that area? For 25 years, we have agitated for that hospital. There was no chance of it under the Conservatives, who closed hospitals, but now we have it under this Government.

**Kirsty Williams:** Jeff, I will believe it when I see it. As with many capital initiatives, as reported yesterday with regard to developments in primary care, there are huge obstacles to overcome before any of that money is actually spent. However, if we can accept that the situation exists, maybe we can go on.

A central plank in the Government's response was for Edwina Hart to call in Derek Wanless to undertake a strategic report for the Government in Wales. The Minister's response to that was to initiate 22 Wanless action plans via the local health boards. I am surprised that Val said that Derek Wanless has commended the Welsh Assembly Government's approach to his report because, when he spoke at a conference in Newport on Thursday, he said that he was unaware of what the Welsh Government's response to his report was. When he was informed of the 22 implementation plans, he was incredibly

ar gyfer amryw o fentrau, pyllau o sefydlu grwpiau gorchwyl i ddelio â phenderfyniadau anodd, colli gweledigaeth strategol yn barhaol, ysgytiadau poenus bob mis pan gyhoeddir y ffigurau newydd ar restrau aros, ac, wedyn, adwaith ffyrnig a chrynedig i unrhyw un sy'n tynnu sylw at ddiffygion y polisi presennol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A allwch ddweud a yw'r grŵp anffodus hwn yn dod o dan y Mesur Iechyd Meddwl?

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud, Jonathan, fod modd gwella ar ôl y clefyd, ond, yn yr un modd â sawl anhwylder arall, rhaid i'r claf dderbyn y diagnosis cyn y ceir gwella, ac ychydig iawn o hynny a welwyd yn yr ail Gynulliad.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A ddywedech fod y £100 miliwn a addawyd ar gyfer yr ysbyty newydd i gwm Rhymni'n fenter fach na ddaw â llawer o les i bobl yr ardal honno? Er 25 mlynedd, buom yn ymgyrchu dros gael yr ysbyty hwnnw. Nid oedd unrhyw obaith o hynny o dan y Ceidwadwyr, a oedd yn cau ysbytai, ond mae gennym obaith bellach o dan y Llywodraeth hon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Jeff, credaf hynny pan welaf ef. Yn yr un modd â sawl menter cyfalaf, fel yr adroddwyd heddiw mewn cysylltiad â datblygiadau mewn gofal sylfaenol, rhaid goresgyn rhwystrau mawr cyn y caiff dim o'r arian hwnnw ei wario. Fodd bynnag, os gallwn dderbyn bod y sefyllfa'n bodoli, efallai y gallwn symud ymlaen.

Un o'r prif elfennau yn ymateb y Llywodraeth oedd y ffaith i Edwina Hart alw ar Derek Wanless i lunio adroddiad strategol ar gyfer y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Ymateb y Gweinidog i hynny oedd galw am 22 o gynlluniau gweithredu Wanless drwy'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr wyf yn synnu bod Val wedi dweud bod Derek Wanless wedi canmol dull Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o drafod ei adroddiad oherwydd, pan siaradodd mewn cynhadledd yng Nghasnewydd ddydd Iau, dywedodd na wyddai beth oedd ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i'w adroddiad. Pan hysbyswyd ef am y 22 o gynlluniau

surprised and alarmed that that was the approach being taken, especially when it was noted that none of those plans has any process of evaluation attached to them. We do not even know that what is being proposed will work.

5.00 p.m.

**Val Lloyd:** I am sure that you are correct in what you quote Derek Wanless as saying, but you are not quoting what I said correctly. I referred to the previous 10-year plan. Perhaps, when the Record of Proceedings is published tomorrow, you will care to look at it.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am prepared to look at it, but having heard from the horse's mouth itself on Thursday, I am also prepared to accept what Derek Wanless says about what is happening in the health service.

Moving on from Wanless, let us look at the second offer scheme. There is some sense in what the Minister is trying to achieve with her second offer scheme: to tackle those waiting a long time. However, in doing so, she has taken her eye off the ball. If you compare the mean waiting figures across England and Wales, for the third quarter of 2003-04, the median wait in Wales overtook that of England for the first time. While there may be fewer people in danger of waiting longer than 18 months, the average wait for people in Wales is longer. It is longer than it was in 1997, 2000, and 2001. For the first time, the median wait is now worse than that it is in England. You have taken your eye off the ball. You have solved a few problems for longer waiters, but, meanwhile, the average patient in Wales is waiting longer. These are Government figures, which are available.

The second offer scheme is making people, on average, wait longer than they previously did. The second offer scheme itself does not add up. If one looks at the figures, for instance, how cis it that in Cardiff and the Vale, more people were treated than referred?

gweithredu, synnodd ac arswydodd yn fawr wrth ddeall mai hwnnw oedd y dull gweithredu a fabwysiadwyd, yn enwedig pan nodwyd nad oedd proses werthuso yn rhan o'r cynlluniau hynny. Ni wyddom hyd yn oed a fydd yr hyn a gynigir yn gweithio.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn dyfynnu geiriau Derek Wanless yn gywir, ond nid ydych yn dyfynnu'r hyn a ddywedais i'n gywir. Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at y cynllun 10 mlynedd blaenorol. Efallai, pan gyhoeddir Cofnod y Trafodion yfory, y bwrwch olwg arno.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf yn barod i fwrw golwg arno ond, a minnau wedi cael hyn o lygad y ffynnon ddydd Iau, yr wyf hefyd yn barod i dderbyn yr hyn a ddywed Derek Wanless am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Gan symud ymlaen o adroddiad Wanless, gadewch inni fwrw golwg ar gynllun yr ail gynnig. Mae rhywfaint o synnwyr yn yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio'i gyflawni drwy gynllun yr ail gynnig: ymdrin â'r nifer sy'n disgwyl am amser maith. Fodd bynnag, wrth wneud hynny, mae wedi colli gafael ar bethau. Os cymherir y ffigurau aros cymedrig ledled Cymru a Lloegr, ar gyfer trydydd chwarter 2003-04, gwelir bod yr arhosiad canolrifol yng Nghymru yn hwy nag ydyw yn Lloegr am y tro cyntaf. Er y dichon fod llai o bobl mewn perygl o ddisgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis, mae'r arhosiad cyfartalog i bobl yng Nghymru yn hwy. Mae'n hwy nag yr oedd yn 1997, 2000, a 2001. Am y tro cyntaf, mae'r arhosiad canolrifol yn waeth nag y mae yn Lloegr. Yr ydych wedi colli gafael ar bethau. Yr ydych wedi datrys ychydig o broblemau i rai sy'n aros yn hwy, ond, yn y cyfamser, mae arhosiad cleifion yng Nghymru wedi mynd yn hwy ar gyfartaledd. Ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yw'r rhain, ac maent ar gael i'w gweld.

Mae cynllun yr ail gynnig yn peri bod pobl yn disgwyl yn hwy, ar gyfartaledd, nag yr oeddent o'r blaen. Nid yw cynllun yr ail gynnig yn gwneud synnwyr. Wrth edrych ar y ffigurau, mae rhywun yn gofyn, er enghraifft, sut y mae, yng Nghaerdydd a'r

The figures simply do not make sense. Again, these are Government figures. The evaluation of the scheme is in an absolute mess because the figures do not add up. There have been a huge number of people who have declined the second offer, but no-one knows why. This has been a particular problem in the Swansea area. The Government has admitted that it does not know what is going wrong with the scheme and it is now employing the services of MORI to telephone people to ask them what is happening. All I can hope is that these people have not been through the telephone preference survey because if they do not answer the first telephone call, they are regarded as non-contactable and no-one ever bothers with them again.

However, the scheme has a guarantee of success because all those people who decline the offer—as outlined in the Minister's report, which will come before the Health and Social Services Committee tomorrow—no longer appear on the waiting list. This is a crafty way of making the current waiting lists appear much better than they are, and no money has to be spent to do it. Fantastic.

The truth is, people's perceptions are that the health service is failing them. When people receive treatment, they appreciate what they are given. However, for too many, for too long, they are waiting.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have judged this debate to be an important debate. This has been proved by nearly every speaker taking well over their time, and by the many interventions. The debate needs to be balanced, therefore I will call David Melding to speak for three minutes, the Minister will then speak for the Executive for the normal time, and Ieuan Wyn Jones will then have seven minutes to wind up for Plaid Cymru.

**David Melding:** My main criticism of the Government is that it lacks imagination and has failed to adopt properly innovative procedures. It is crass, of course, to say that it has failed in every respect and to exaggerate our criticisms. Much of what has happened in the NHS reflects developments in medicine

Fro, fod mwy o bobl wedi cael eu trin nag a gafodd eu hatgyfeirio? Nid yw'r ffigurau'n gwneud synnwyr o gwbl. Unwaith eto, ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yw'r rhain. Mae'r gwerthuso ar y cynllun yn gwbl ddi-drefn am nad yw'r ffigurau'n adio'n gywir. Mae nifer mawr o bobl wedi gwrthod yr ail gynnig, ond ni wya'r neb paham. Cafwyd y broblem hon yn ardal Abertawe'n benodol. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cyfaddef na wya'r beth sy'n mynd o'i le yn y cynllun ac yn awr mae'n defnyddio gwasanaethau MORI i ffonio pobl i ofyn iddynt beth sy'n digwydd. Nid wyf ond yn gobeithio nad yw'r bobl hyn wedi'u trafod drwy'r arolwg o ddewisiadau dros y teleffon oherwydd, os nad atebant yr alwad deleffon gyntaf, bernir na ellir cysylltu â hwy ac ni fydd neb yn trafferthu cysylltu â hwy eto.

Er hynny, mae'r cynllun yn sicr o lwyddo oherwydd ni fydd yr holl bobl hynny sy'n gwrthod y cynnig—fel y nodir yn adroddiad y Gweinidog, a ddaw gerbron y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yfory—yn ymddangos ar y rhestr aros wedyn. Dyma ddull cyfrwys i beri i'r rhestrau aros presennol ymddangos yn well o lawer nag y maent, ac ni raid gwario unrhyw arian i wneud hynny. Anhygoel.

Y gwir amdani yw bod pobl yn credu bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn eu hesgeuluso. Pan gaiff pobl driniaeth, maent yn ei gwerthfawrogi. Fodd bynnag, mae gormod o lawer ohonynt yn disgwyl, a hynny'n rhy hir.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Bernais fod y ddadl hon yn un bwysig. Profwyd bod hynny'n wir gan fod bron bob siaradwr wedi defnyddio mwy o amser nag a neilltuwyd iddo, a chan y nifer mawr o ymyriadau. Rhaid i'r ddadl fod yn un gytbwys, felly galwaf David Melding i siarad am dri munud, bydd y Gweinidog wedyn yn siarad ar ran y Weithrediaeth am yr amser arferol, a chaiff Ieuan Wyn Jones saith munud wedyn i gloi ar ran Plaid Cymru.

**David Melding:** Fy mhrif feirniadaeth ar y Llywodraeth yw ei bod yn ddiddychymyg a'i bod wedi methu â mabwysiadu gweithdrefnau arloesol addas. Peth twp, wrth gwrs, fyddai dweud ei bod wedi methu ym mhob peth a gorliwio ein beirniadaethau. Mae llawer o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn y GIG



and staff commitment. Any Government gets some things right, therefore, a sense of balance is appropriate. However, it is the right of the opposition to call the Government to account for some of its fundamental decisions. The Member for Caerphilly condemned a previous Conservative Government for closing more hospitals than it had opened. I remind him that that is part of modern practice and that the performance of his Government has been no different. You can check the Library's statistics: a study on the subject was conducted a few years ago. Hospitals close and hospitals open. If the Minister had followed the practice followed in England, more hospitals would have opened in Wales. There is an obdurate refusal within the administration to enthusiastically take up the private finance initiative option of funding hospitals, which has been damaging. We may find that some communities have to wait much longer for new hospitals than they would have otherwise.

I am baffled by the priorities pursued in terms of free prescriptions. That policy will cost at least £32 million, because that is the revenue that we will lose when we have free prescriptions. We do not know how behaviour will be affected when people realise that they can have free prescriptions; they will perhaps request more medicine and seek referral more often than they would have otherwise. I have heard estimates that this policy will cost as much as £50 million when demand increases, as it inevitably will to some extent. You must ask yourselves why you are pursuing a policy that allows the 15 per cent of us who currently have incomes that are high enough for us to be required to pay for prescriptions to be given this subsidy. This policy transfers wealth to this group of relatively well-off people when up to £50 million could be spent more effectively in another area. The Minister must answer that question.

The second offer scheme is a pale imitation of what is being offered in England, where a policy to provide patients with services has been driven forward, to take them to where there is spare capacity, to support them and to ensure that, where appropriate, relatives are

yn adlewyrchu datblygiadau mewn meddygaeth ac yn ymroddiad y staff. Mae pob Llywodraeth yn cael rhai pethau'n iawn, felly rhaid wrth rywfaint o gydbwysedd. Fodd bynnag, mae gan y gwrthbleidiau hawl i alw'r Llywodraeth i gyfrif am rai o'i phenderfyniadau sylfaenol. Gwnaeth yr Aelod dros Gaerffili gollfarnu Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol am gau mwy o ysbytai nag a agorodd. Yr wyf yn ei atgoffa bod hynny'n batrwm cyffredin erbyn hyn ac nad yw ei Lywodraeth wedi cymryd camau gwahanol. Cewch wirio'r ystadegau yn y Llyfrgell: cynhaliwyd astudiaeth ar y pwnc rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Mae ysbytai'n cau ac mae ysbytai'n agor. Pe byddai'r Gweinidog wedi dilyn yr arfer a geir yn Lloegr, byddai mwy o ysbytai wedi agor yng Nghymru. Mae'r weinyddiaeth yn ystyfnig o ran gwrthod ymgymryd yn frwdfrydig â'r dewis o ariannu ysbytai drwy fenter cyllid preifat, a bu hynny'n niweidiol. Efallai y cawn fod rhai cymunedau'n gorfod disgwyl yn hwy o lawer i gael ysbytai newydd nag y byddent fel arall.

Yr wyf yn methu â deall y blaenoriaethau a ddilyniir o ran cynnig presgripsiynau am ddim. Bydd y polisi hwnnw'n costio o leiaf £32 miliwn, gan mai hwnnw yw'r refeniw a gollwn pan gawn bresgripsiynau am ddim. Ni wyddom ba effaith a geir ar ymddygiad pobl pan sylweddolant y cânt bresgripsiynau am ddim; efallai y byddant yn gofyn am fwy o feddyginiaethau ac yn ceisio cael eu hatgyfeirio'n amlach nag a wnaent fel arall. Clywais amcangyfrif y bydd y polisi hwn yn costio cymaint â £50 miliwn pan fydd y galw'n cynyddu, fel y bydd yn sicr o wneud i ryw raddau. Rhaid ichi ymholi pam yr ydych yn dilyn polisi sy'n caniatáu cymhorthdal o'r fath i'r 15 y cant ohonom y mae ein hincwm yn ddigon mawr ar hyn o bryd fel y gellir mynnu ein bod yn talu am bresgripsiynau. Mae'r polisi hwn yn trosglwyddo cyfoeth i'r grŵp hwn o bobl weddol gefnog tra gellid gwario hyd at £50 miliwn yn fwy effeithiol mewn maes arall. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw.

Mae cynllun yr ail gynnig yn efelychiad sâl o'r hyn a gynigir yn Lloegr, lle yr hyrwyddwyd polisi i ddarparu gwasanaethau i gleifion, i fynd â hwy i ble bynnag y ceir capasiti dros ben, i'w cynorthwyo ac i sicrhau, os yw'n briodol, y caiff perthnasau

able to travel with them. The independent sector has been used there—a firm in Newport has been used extensively, but it has never been allocated a scrap of work in Wales—and officials have done something that is effective and imaginative. We need to make more use of the private and independent sectors to deliver our NHS services.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am not surprised about what has happened today. Rhodri Glyn and opposition colleagues tried to ignite fire and fury a few weeks ago and have done so again today. Shouting louder does not convince in terms of credible scrutiny—it is right to scrutinise the Government, particularly regarding how it is managing its national health service. We had a good week last week as we had a great deal of consensus. No one could accuse the Government of not investing in the NHS's capacity to deliver our reforms through our new day-case units and as a result of the £30 million investment. None of the opposition Members could deny how pleased Community Pharmacy Wales was when it heard of my commitment to the community pharmacy contract, which I announced last week. I hope that nobody would deny the fact that the Royal College of Midwives in London gave its top award to Bro Morgannwg NHS Trust last week. Midwives there won the award for putting evidence into practice at the new birthing centre at Neath Port Talbot Hospital. They were runners up in some categories and shortlisted in all categories. Nobody could deny the pleasure shown at St David's Hospice in Llandudno on Friday when I presented it with a £500,000 cheque, or deny that people at Llandudno General Hospital said that the facilities there were the best in the country. Let us consider the progress and the success.

Rhodri Glyn referred to 1997, therefore let us consider the current staffing situation: there has been an increase of 16,900 staff since 1997, which is a 24.6 per cent increase. Could any of the opposition parties have

deithio gyda hwy. Defnyddiwyd y sector annibynnol yn y fan honno—gwnaed defnydd helaeth o fusnes yng Nghasnewydd, ond ni chafodd erioed yr un pwt o waith yng Nghymru—a gwnaeth swyddogion rywbeth effeithiol a llawn dychymyg. Rhaid inni wneud mwy o ddefnydd o'r sectorau preifat ac annibynnol i redeg ein gwasanaethau GIG.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Nid wyf yn synnu at yr hyn a ddigwyddodd heddiw. Ceisiodd Rhodri Glyn a chyd-Aelodau yn y gwrthbleidiau godi twrw ychydig wythnosau'n ôl a gwnaethant yr un peth eto heddiw. Nid yw gweiddi'n uwch yn argyhoeddiadol o ran craffu credadwy—iawn yw craffu ar waith y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig wrth drafod ei dull o reoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Cawsom wythnos da yr wythnos diwethaf gan fod llawer iawn o gonsensws yn ein plith. Ni allai neb gyhuddo'r Llywodraeth o beidio â buddsoddi yng ngallu'r GIG i gyflawni ein diwygiadau drwy ein hunedau achosion dydd newydd ac o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad o £30 miliwn. Ni allai'r un o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau wadu mor falch yr oedd Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru pan glywodd am fy ymrwymiad i'r contract ar gyfer fferylliaeth gymunedol, a gyhoeddais yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn gobeithio na wrthodai neb gydnabod bod Coleg Brenhinol y Bydwagedd yn Llundain wedi rhoi ei brif wobwr i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg yr wythnos diwethaf. Gwnaeth bydwagedd yn y fan honno ennill y wobwr am roi tystiolaeth ar waith yn y ganolfan geni newydd yn Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Yr oeddent yn ail mewn rhai categorïau ac ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer pob un. Ni allai neb wadu'r pleser a fynegwyd yn Hosbis Dewi Sant yn Llandudno ddydd Gwener pan gyflwynais siec am £500,000 iddo, neu wadu bod rhai yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llandudno wedi dweud mai'r cyfleusterau yno oedd y rhai gorau yn y wlad. Gadewch inni ystyried y cynnydd a'r llwyddiant.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at 1997, felly gadewch inni ystyried y sefyllfa staffio gyfredol: bu cynnydd o 16,900 yn nifer y staff er 1997, sef cynnydd o 24.6 y cant. A allasai unrhyw un o'r gwrthbleidiau gyflawni

delivered that? No, they could not. This has been delivered through investment from the Labour Governments in Westminster and in the Assembly. You would not have been able to deliver the 842 specialist registrars training places and the 89 per cent increase in medical students between 1999 and 2005. The number of GP training places has increased from 110 in 1999 to 136 in 2003. The number of training places for cardiologists has increased from 19 to 42. There are new clinical schools in Swansea and, as Ann said, in north Wales. This is all good news. It is about improvements and progress. We have carried out work to tackle inequality.

5.10 p.m.

I am surprised that Plaid Cymru never mentions work that I believe is crucial to social justice and in tackling inequality—it no longer comes into their debates—that is, the fact that we now have ethnic minorities projects. The barefoot project in Cardiff bay reaches 800 people with advice and support on diabetes services, the Dharkan project in Newport has developed blood pressure monitoring services and advice clinics for the Bangladeshi community, and the ‘Heart Attack’ project: the active living strategy in Rhondda Cynon Taf has screened over 3,000 people who live in Communities First areas. You never mention those projects or acknowledge the work that we are doing to tackle health inequalities. Our twin-track approach also includes moves to improve services.

We must drive up improvements in health and social care, but also look at primary care. I never hear you talk about primary care now—you used to, Dai, in the early days. What about the Cynon valley support unit that serves Rhondda Cynon Taf? There are 12 salaried GPs, nine of whom are women, six nurses are being recruited, and salaried GPs are developing specialist interests in all the chronic conditions.

We are tackling waiting times. Why do you

hynny? Na allasent. Cyflawnwyd hyn drwy fuddsoddi gan y Llywodraethau Llafur yn San Steffan ac yn y Cynulliad. Ni allasech sicrhau'r 842 o leoedd hyfforddi ar gyfer cofrestryddion arbenigol a'r cynnydd o 89 y cant yn nifer y myfyrwyr meddygol rhwng 1999 a 2005. Mae nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi i feddygon teulu wedi codi o 110 yn 1999 i 136 yn 2003. Mae nifer y lleoedd hyfforddi i gardiolegwyr wedi codi o 19 i 42. Mae ysgolion clinigol newydd yn Abertawe ac, fel y dywedodd Ann, yn y Gogledd. Mae hyn oll yn newyddion da. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwelliannau a chynnydd. Yr ydym wedi mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb.

Synnaf nad yw Plaid Cymru byth yn sôn am waith y credaf ei fod yn hollbwysig i sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb—nid oes sôn amdano yn ei dadleuon bellach—hynny yw, y ffaith bod gennym prosiectau ar gyfer lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn awr. Mae prosiect Troednoeth ym mae Caerdydd yn rhoi cyngor a chymorth i 800 o bobl ynghylch gwasanaethau diabetes, mae prosiect Dharkan yng Nghasnewydd wedi datblygu gwasanaethau i fonitro pwysau gwaed a chlinigau cynghori ar gyfer pobl Bangladeshi, ac mae prosiect ‘Trawiad ar y Galon’: y strategaeth byw bywyd gweithgar yn Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi sgrinio mwy na 3,000 o bobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Ni fyddwch byth yn sôn am y prosiectau hynny nac yn cydnabod y gwaith a wnawn i ymdrin ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Mae ein dull gweithredu deul hefyd yn cynnwys camau i wella gwasanaethau.

Rhaid inni hyrwyddo gwelliannau mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac ystyried gofal sylfaenol hefyd. Ni fyddaf byth yn eich clywed yn sôn am ofal sylfaenol yn awr—yr oeddech yn arfer gwneud, Dai, yn y dyddiau cynnar. Beth am uned gymorth cwm Cynon sy'n gwasanaethu Rhondda Cynon Taf? Mae yno 12 o feddygon teulu cyflogedig, a naw ohonynt yn fenywod, mae chwech o nyrsys yn cael eu recriwtio, ac mae meddygon teulu cyflogedig yn meithrin diddordebau arbenigol yn yr holl anhwylderau cronig.

Yr ydym yn ymdrin ag amseroedd aros. Pam

think that we have a second offer scheme? Over 4,000 people have been offered treatment—1,100 have been offered treatment in our hospitals, but we are also using the private sector and hospitals in England, as you well know. People are pleased that they have received a second offer and that they are getting treatment.

**Mark Isherwood:** You referred to increased expenditure, and, clearly, there has been a massive increase. Can you therefore tell me why I should have a new digital hearing aid and receive excellent treatment in accident and emergency departments, as I did earlier this year, but at the expense of an 1,100 per cent increase in out-patient waiting times, causing constituents in places such as Alyn and Deeside to write to me because they are in pain, when you have given local health boards an 18-month waiting target? That is the reality in your NHS today.

**Jane Hutt:** You rightly recognise, Mark, the importance of our accident and emergency units. As the First Minister said earlier, over 1 million people attend accident and emergency units every year—a huge percentage of our population. That is 53,600 more than six years ago, and 88 per cent are seen, treated and discharged in four hours. It means that we have 5,000 emergency admissions every week, and as a result of that pressure we brought Derek Wanless in.

We tackled delayed transfers of care. No-one has mentioned delayed transfers of care this afternoon because the number of delays is going down. When there is good news and progress, you do not discuss it here. If we look at delayed transfers of care, there was a 28 per cent fall in the number of delays between January and October. Do you not recognise, Rhodri Glyn, that that is the result of investment and it releases beds in order for people to be treated?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, you are clearly showing the failure of your policies. You have answered one problem, delayed

y credwch fod cynllun yr ail gynnig gennym? Mae mwy na 4,000 o bobl wedi cael cynnig triniaeth bellach—cynigiwyd triniaeth i 1,100 yn ein hysbytai ni, ond yr ydym hefyd yn defnyddio'r sector preifat ac ysbytai yn Lloegr, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn. Mae pobl yn falch o gael yr ail gynnig a'u bod yn cael triniaeth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cyfeiriasoch at wariant uwch, ac, wrth gwrs, bu cynnydd aruthrol. A allwch ddweud wrthyf, felly, pam y dylwn gael cymorth clywed digidol a thriniaeth ragorol mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, fel y cefais yn gynharach eleni, ond hynny ar draul cynnydd o 1,100 y cant yn yr amseroedd aros ar gyfer cleifion allanol, sy'n peri i etholwyr mewn manau fel Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy ysgrifennu ataf am eu bod mewn poen, a chithau wedi gosod targed o 18 mis ar gyfer arosiadau i fyrdau iechyd lleol? Felly y mae yn eich GIG chi heddiw.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydych yn cydnabod fel y dylech, Mark, pa mor bwysig yw ein hunedau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach, daw mwy nag 1 filiwn o bobl i unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys bob blwyddyn—canran helaeth o'n poblogaeth. Dyna 53,600 yn fwy nag a gafwyd chwe blynedd yn ôl, a bydd 88 y cant ohonynt yn cael eu harchwilio, eu trin a'u rhyddhau o fewn pedair awr. Mae'n golygu ein bod yn trafod 5,000 o achosion brys bob wythnos, ac o ganlyniad i'r pwysau hynny y gwnaethom alw Derek Wanless.

Yr ydym wedi ymdrin ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. Nid oes neb wedi sôn am oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal y prynhawn yma gan fod nifer yr achosion o oedi yn gostwng. Pan geir newyddion da a chynnydd, nid ydych yn ei drafod yma. Os edrychwn ar oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, gwelwn fod 28 y cant o ostyngiad yn nifer yr achosion o oedi rhwng Ionawr a Hydref. Oni welwch, Rhodri Glyn, fod hynny'n ganlyniad i fuddsoddi a'i fod yn rhyddhau gwelyau fel y gall pobl gael eu trin?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, yr ydych yn dangos yn eglur fethiant eich polisiau. Yr ydych wedi datrys un broblem, oedi wrth

transfers of care, by putting £22 million into it—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sandy, why are you standing up? Only one person should be standing at a time.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** However, your efficiency targets mean that the hospitals must take beds out. Those beds are some of the 500 that have been lost while you have been in charge of health in Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** The 28 per cent reduction—306 delays—involves people who do not need to be in hospital any more; they can be transferred to a more appropriate setting. That is progress.

Jonathan likes to undermine and belittle. If he read the statistics, he would see that only 10 people were waiting more than six months for cardiac surgery at the end of September at Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, which is in his region. Read the statistics. Kirsty, you should look at them as well. Of course the people who have not taken up the second offer still appear in the statistics, but they will be treated, and there will be capacity for that to happen because other people have come off the list, having accepted the second offer. Why do you not acknowledge the progress that we have made in terms of falls in waiting times across the board?

**Sandy Mewies:** Thank you for giving way to me, Minister. I have a problem with people not being able to see me in the Chamber.

One problem that has become apparent today is that people do not see that you must now look at health and social care in a holistic way. On delayed transfers of care, there has been a 50 per cent cut in delays in Flintshire and Wrexham as a result of the extra money that the local health boards have received and the Assembly's strategic agenda. Also £3.77 million has been allocated to care and repair schemes. Perhaps the Members on the other side of the Chamber have forgotten about those who have had to go into care.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an intervention, therefore it must be brief.

drosoglwyddo gofal, drwy roi £22 filiwn at hynny—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Sandy, pam yr ydych yn sefyll? Dim ond un a gaiff sefyll ar y tro.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Er hynny, oherwydd eich targedau ar effeithlonrwydd, rhaid i'r ysbytai gael gwared ar welyau. Mae'r gwelyau hynny ymysg y 500 a gollwyd tra buoch yn gyfrifol am iechyd yng Nghymru.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r 28 y cant o ostyngiad—306 o achosion o oedi—yn ymwneud â rhai nad oes angen iddynt fod mewn ysbyty bellach; gellir eu trosglwyddo i le mwy addas. Peth felly yw cynnydd.

Mae Jonathan yn hoffi tanseilio a bychanu. Pe darllenai'r ystadegau, gwelai mai dim ond 10 o bobl a oedd wedi aros yn hwy na chwe mis am lawdriniaeth ar y galon ddiwedd Medi yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, sydd yn ei ranbarth. Darllenwch yr ystadegau. Kirsty, dylech chi eu hastudio hefyd. Mae'r rhai sydd heb dderbyn yr ail gynnig yn dal i ymddangos yn yr ystadegau, wrth gwrs, ond byddant yn cael eu trin, a bydd digon o gapasiti ar gyfer hynny gan y bydd eraill wedi dod oddi ar y rhestr, ar ôl derbyn yr ail gynnig. Pam na chydabyddwch y cynnydd a wnaethom o ran gostyngiadau yn yr amseroedd aros yn gyffredinol?

**Sandy Mewies:** Diolch i chi am ildio, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd gan nad yw pobl yn gallu fy ngweld yn y Siambr.

Un broblem a ddaeth i'r amlwg heddiw yw nad yw pobl yn sylweddoli bod rhaid ystyried iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn gyfannol. Ynghylch oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, mae 50 y cant yn llai o oedi yn sir y Fflint a Wrecsam o ganlyniad i'r arian ychwanegol a gafodd y byrddau iechyd lleol ac agenda strategol y Cynulliad. Hefyd, dyrannwyd £3.77 miliwn i gynlluniau gofal a thrwsio. Efallai fod yr Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr wedi anghofio am y rhai sydd wedi gorfod cael eu derbyn i ofal.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn, felly rhaid iddo fod yn fyr.

**Sandy Mewies:** They have to go into care because they cannot run their homes any longer. This was a disgraceful situation that occurred frequently under the previous Government. I believe—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had long enough.

**Jane Hutt:** The links to housing are key, and we need to consider this in a joined-up way as part of the social justice agenda and in order to tackle health inequalities. It is also about how we invest in day-case surgery units in order to reduce the number of day-case in-patients. This was one of the Wanless report's messages. We need to improve throughput and activity, which is why we are investing in the new units. Over the next three years, there will be a massive increase in investment in buildings and equipment—from £107 million to £309 million. We have the hospitals in Caerphilly, Cynon valley, Ebbw Vale, Rhondda, and Porthmadog. Six new catheter laboratories will open over the next year, which include those to be opened in Tenby and Holywell, and there are discussions for provision in Merthyr. We are taking this forward, and the provision will be delivered. This sums up the twin-track approach adopted since the Assembly elections 18 months ago. How can the opposition talk about limited progress? Despite the bad-news merchants of the opposition parties, people outside the Assembly know that progress has been made.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Will you take an intervention?

**Jane Hutt:** No. Rhodri Glyn says that he is not in the business of discussing good news but, as Minister for Health and Social Services, I am. As Val said, this is about the good treatment that people receive every day. Wales is in the lead on the treatment of eye disease, and we received an optometry award this year. We are also in the lead on chronic illnesses such as asthma, arthritis, cancer and mental ill health, and we have abolished prescription charges. Wales is in the lead on

**Sandy Mewies:** Rhaid iddynt gael eu derbyn i ofal am na allant redeg eu cartrefi mwy. Yr oedd hon yn sefyllfa warthus a godai'n aml o dan y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Credaf—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cawsoch ddigon o amser.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cysylltiadau â maes tai yn hollbwysig, a rhaid inni ystyried hyn mewn modd cydgysylltiedig fel rhan o'r agenda ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â'r modd y buddsodwn mewn unedau llawdriniaeth ar gyfer achosion dydd er mwyn lleihau nifer y cleifion mewnol a gaiff eu trin fel achosion dydd. Dyma un o'r negeseuon a oedd yn adroddiad Wanless. Rhaid inni hybu trwygyrch a gweithgarwch, a dyna pam yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn yr unedau newydd. Dros y tair blynedd nesaf, bydd cynnydd aruthrol yn y buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ac offer—o £107 miliwn i £309 miliwn. Cawn ysbytai yng Nghaerffili, cwm Cynon, Glynebwy, Rhondda, a Phorthmadog. Agorir chwe labordy cathetrau dros y flwyddyn nesaf, gan gynnwys rhai yn Ninbych-y-pysgod a Threffynnon, a cheir trafodaethau ynghylch darpariaeth ym Merthyr Tudful. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo hyn, a chwblheir y ddarpariaeth. Mae hyn yn dangos y dull deuol a fabwysiadwyd ers etholiadau'r Cynulliad 18 mis yn ôl. Sut y gall y gwrthbleidiau sôn am gynnydd cyfyngedig? Er gwaethaf y rhai sy'n lledaenu newyddion drwg yn y gwrthbleidiau, mae pobl y tu allan i'r Cynulliad yn gwybod y gwnaed cynnydd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** A wnewch chi dderbyn ymyriad?

**Jane Hutt:** Na wna. Dywed Rhodri Glyn nad ei waith ef yw sôn am newyddion da, ond mae i mi fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedodd Val, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r driniaeth dda a gaiff pobl bob dydd. Mae Cymru ar y blaen o ran trin clefydau'r llygad, a chawsom wobwr am optometreg eleni. Yr ydym ar y blaen hefyd wrth drin anhwylderau cronig fel asthma, arthritis, canser a salwch meddwl, ac yr ydym wedi diddymu taliadau

national neo-natal screening and, with our digital hearing aid schemes, working in partnership with the voluntary sector. Having considered the report of Health Commission Wales, which met last week, I will take into account the community health council's views on paediatric neurosurgery and announce my decision tomorrow.

In conclusion, given that Rhodri Glyn quoted Derek Wanless, I will say that he challenged us to move forward in a spirit of consensus with a reform agenda.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up, as you have had 10 minutes.

**Jane Hutt:** Let us have constructive opposition, and let us unite in our support for hard-working staff. The opposition parties have a responsibility not to undermine and belittle progress, but to acknowledge it, and to welcome the opportunities that devolution has brought for the health of the people of Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ofni bod datganiad diwethaf y Gweinidog yn gwbl anghywir. Yn anffodus, mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru wedi gwaethygu ers dyddiau cyntaf datganoli yn 1999, a hynny oherwydd nad oes gan y Llywodraeth strategaeth i ymdrin â rhestrau aros. Clywsom sawl rheswm heddiw pam mae pobl wedi colli hyder ym mholisi iechyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn 1999, addawodd Llafur na fyddai neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis am apwyntiad allanol. Mae 75,256 o bobl yn aros ar y rhestr honno. Dywedwyd na fyddai neb yn disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am driniaeth mewn ysbyty, ond mae 1,172 yn aros. Mae ffigurau rhestrau aros Cymru yn sgandal. Maent yn waeth na'r rhai yn Lloegr a'r Alban.

There are 18,254 people in Wales waiting more than six months for out-patient orthopaedic and trauma appointments. There are 279 such people in the whole of England. These figures are an absolute disgrace. If we performed as well as England, the figure should be 50, not 18,254. We are being outperformed significantly on all specialities

presgripsiwn. Mae Cymru ar y blaen ar sgrinio cenedlaethol ar gyfer babanod newydd-anedig ac ar ein cynlluniau cymhorthion clywed digidol, drwy weithio ar y cyd â'r sector gwirfoddol. Ar ôl ystyried adroddiad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, a gyfarfu yr wythnos diwethaf, ystyriaf farn y cyngor iechyd cymuned ar niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig a chyhoeddaf fy mhenderfyniad yfory.

I gloi, gan fod Rhodri Glyn wedi dyfynnu Derek Wanless, dywedaf ei fod wedi ein herio i symud ymlaen drwy gonsensws gydag agenda i ddiwygio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi gloi, gan eich bod wedi cael 10 munud.

**Jane Hutt:** Gadewch inni gael gwrthwynebiad adeiladol, a gadewch inni uno o blaid ein staff gweithgar. Mae gan y gwrthbleidiau gyfrifoldeb i beidio â thanseilio a bychanu cynnydd, ond i'w gydnabod, a chroesawu'r cyfleoedd a gafwyd drwy ddatganoli ar gyfer iechyd pobl Cymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am afraid that the Minister's final statement was completely incorrect. Unfortunately, the health service in Wales has deteriorated since the advent of devolution in 1999 because the Government has no strategy to deal with waiting lists. We have heard several reasons today as to why people have lost confidence in the Assembly Government's health policies. In 1999, Labour pledged that no-one would wait more than six months for an out-patient appointment. A total of 75,256 people are now on this list. We were also told that no-one would wait more than 18 months for hospital treatment, but 1,172 are waiting. Waiting list figures in Wales are a scandal. They are worse than those in England and Scotland.

Mae 18,254 o bobl yng Nghymru a fu'n disgwyl yn hwy na chwe mis i gael apwyntiad fel cleifion allanol ar gyfer triniaethau orthopedig a thrawma. Mae 279 o bobl o'r fath drwy Loegr gyfan. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n gwbl warthus. Pe gwnaem gystal â Lloegr, 50 fyddai'r ffigur hwnnw, nid 18,254. Perfformir yn well o lawer na ni

other than cataract surgery. These include ear, nose and throat, general surgery, gynaecology and neurosurgery. Whatever speciality you care to mention, waiting lists in Wales are horrendous. The Government's first line of defence is that things are getting better. After seven years of a Labour Government, things are getting worse. Things are getting worse despite the fact that more money is being spent on health in Wales. In 1997, the health budget was £2.7 billion: by 2007, it will be £5.5 billion. Waiting lists have doubled despite the fact that spending on health has doubled. What has happened to that money? This Government has wasted it.

yn yr holl arbenigaethau heblaw llawdriniaeth ar gataractau. Ymysg y rhain y mae llawdriniaeth ar y glust, y trwyn a'r gwddf, llawdriniaeth gyffredinol, gynecoleg a niwrolawdriniaeth. Ni waeth pa arbenigaeth sydd dan sylw, mae'r rhestrau aros yng Nghymru'n drychinebus. Amddiffyniad cyntaf y Llywodraeth bob tro yw dweud bod pethau'n gwella. Ar ôl saith mlynedd o Lywodraeth Lafur, mae pethau'n mynd yn waeth. Mae pethau'n gwaethygu er bod mwy o arian yn cael ei wario ar iechyd yng Nghymru. Yn 1997, £2.7 biliwn oedd y gyllideb iechyd: erbyn 2007, bydd yn £5.5 biliwn. Mae rhestrau aros wedi dyblu er bod y gwariant ar iechyd wedi dyblu. Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r arian hwnnw? Mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i wastraffu.

5.20 p.m.

There have been four critical Audit Commission reports on this Government's health policy. The latest says:

'Although the health service in Wales will continue to need the additional resources already allocated to it, and the further planned extra finance, increasingly the issue is that the money is not being used effectively.'

The scale of Labour's failure on health is truly staggering and is a monumental failure in anyone's language. The health budget has doubled, yet many more people are waiting in pain for treatment. In 1997, before the Labour Government was elected, the total number on waiting lists in Wales was 169,000 or 5.6 per cent of the population. In 1999, when the Labour Government was elected to this Assembly, it had gone up to 200,000, or 6.6 per cent of the population. In 2004, the figure is 310,000, or 10 per cent of Wales's population. For five of the last seven years, this Minister for Health and Social Services—and for four of them, this First Minister—has been in charge of the health budget. In that time, 100,000 more people in Wales have gone onto the waiting lists, and they are waiting longer for treatment. This Minister has presided over a catastrophic rise in waiting lists. Every one of those extra 100,000 are people who have to wait, in pain,

Cafwyd pedwar adroddiad beirniadol gan y Comisiwn Archwilio ar bolisi iechyd y Llywodraeth hon. Dywed y diweddaraf:

Er y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn parhau i fod angen yr adnoddau ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd iddo eisoes, a'r cyllid ychwanegol y bwriedir ei roi iddo ymhellach, y mater sy'n dod yn fwyfwy i'r amlwg yw na ddefnyddir yr arian yn effeithiol.

Mae'r graddau y mae Llafur wedi methu ar iechyd yn gwbl syfrdanol ac mae'n fethiant dybryd, pa olwg bynnag a gymerir arno. Mae'r gyllideb iechyd wedi dyblu, ac eto mae mwy o bobl yn disgwyl mewn poen i gael triniaeth. Yn 1997, cyn ethol y Llywodraeth Lafur, cyfanswm y rhai ar restrau aros yng Nghymru oedd 169,000 neu 5.6 y cant o'r boblogaeth. Yn 1999, pan etholwyd y Llywodraeth Lafur i'r Cynulliad hwn, yr oedd wedi codi i 200,000, neu 6.6 y cant o'r boblogaeth. Yn 2004, y ffigur yw 310,000, neu 10 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru. Yn ystod pump o'r saith mlynedd diwethaf, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hwn—ac yn ystod pedair o'r blynyddoedd hynny, y Prif Weinidog hwn—a fu'n gyfrifol am y gyllideb iechyd. Yn yr amser hwnnw, mae 100,000 yn fwy o bobl yng Nghymru wedi mynd ar y rhestrau aros, ac maent yn disgwyl yn hwy am driniaeth. Bu'r Gweinidog hwn wrth y llyw yn ystod



for longer than anyone in England or Scotland. That is the direct responsibility of the Minister for Health and Social Services, and it is the general responsibility of this Cabinet and First Minister.

What is the Government's excuse? Every time that you ask it—

**Brynle Williams:** Can we turn all these facts and figures into reality? Virtually every week we discuss health and yet our postbags are getting fuller and fuller. Last week it was on a dental issue. A young man in north Wales almost lost his life through not being able to see a dentist. We are quoting figures and throwing them at one another, but we are not reducing the waiting lists, and it is a fact that people are living in continuous pain. It is time that Members in this Chamber did something about that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The reality, Brynle, is that the 100,000 extra people on the waiting list represent 100,000 human beings in Wales. These are individual stories of people who have been let down by this Government. The Minister blames us for letting down the staff of the health service. It is the Minister who is letting down the staff because, if they were given the tools to do the job, they could reduce the waiting lists that this Government has created.

What about the lack of dentists in the NHS in many parts of Wales? Brynle mentioned the young boy from Denbigh. What about these long waiting lists for dentists? It is now virtually impossible to find an NHS dentist with an open list in any part of north Wales. These problems are mounting.

The Minister asked us to be a constructive opposition. As a responsible opposition, we have a responsibility to draw this failure to the attention of the people of Wales. How do we change the situation? First, the Government must apologise for the mess that it has created in the health service. Secondly, it must acknowledge that things have to change. Minister, throwing money at the

cynnydd trychinebus yn y rhestrau aros. Mae pob un o'r 100,000 o'r bobl ychwanegol hynny'n gorfod disgwyl, mewn poen, yn hwy nag unrhyw un yn Lloegr neu'r Alban. Mae hyn yn gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac yn gyfrifoldeb cyffredinol i'r Cabinet hwn ac i'r Prif Weinidog.

Beth yw esgus y Llywodraeth? Bob tro y gofynnir iddi—

**Brynle Williams:** A gawn droi'r holl ffeithiau a ffigurau hyn yn gig a gwaed? Trafodwn iechyd bron bob wythnos ac eto mae ein sachau llythrau'n mynd yn llawnach o hyd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, mater deintyddol a oedd dan sylw. Bu bron i ddyn ifanc yn y Gogledd golli ei fywyd am nad oedd wedi gallu gweld deintydd. Dyfynnwn ffigurau a'u taflu at ein gilydd, ond nid ydym yn lleihau'r rhestrau aros, ac mae'n wir bod pobl yn byw mewn poen parhaus. Mae'n bryd i Aelodau yn y Siambr hon wneud rhywbeth ynghylch hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Y gwir amdani, Brynle, yw bod y 100,000 o bobl ychwanegol ar y rhestr aros yn cynrychioli 100,000 o fodau dynol yng Nghymru. Maent yn hanesion am unigolion a gafodd gam gan y Llywodraeth hon. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ein beio am wneud cam â staff y gwasanaeth iechyd. Y Gweinidog sy'n gwneud cam â'r staff oherwydd, pe caent yr offer i wneud y gwaith, gallent leihau'r rhestrau aros a greodd y Llywodraeth hon.

Beth am brinder y deintyddion yn y GIG mewn sawl rhan o Gymru? Cyfeiriodd Brynle at y bachgen ifanc o Ddinbych. Beth am y rhestrau aros hir i weld deintydd? Mae bron yn amhosibl bellach weld deintydd GIG sydd â lle ar ei restr mewn unrhyw ran o'r Gogledd. Mae'r problemau hyn ar gynydd.

Gofynnodd y Gweinidog inni fod yn wrthblaid adeiladol. Fel gwrthblaid gyfrifol, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i dynnu'r methiant hwn i sylw pobl Cymru. Ym mha fodd y newidiwn y sefyllfa? Yn gyntaf, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ymddiheuro am y llanastr a wnaeth yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Yn ail, rhaid iddi gydnabod bod rhaid i bethau newid. Weinidog, nid yw taflu arian at y gwasanaeth

health service does not solve the problem. You have wasted billions of pounds from the Treasury, and the waiting lists are getting higher. Adopt a clear, national strategy to reduce waiting lists, with clear targets. Once you have set the targets, stop meddling with micromanagement, and let the hospitals get on with the job.

We need a change of policy. So far, we have had no indication that this Government is prepared to change. Let the Assembly say today that we, at least, have no confidence in this Government's health policy.

iechyd yn fodd i ddatrys y broblem. Yr ydych wedi gwastraffu biliynau o bunnoedd a gafwyd gan y Trysorlys, ac mae'r rhestrau aros yn mynd yn hwy. Mabwysiadwch strategaeth genedlaethol glir i leihau rhestrau aros, ac iddi dargedau pendant. Wedi ichi osod y targedau, rhwch y gorau i fusnesu drwy feicoreoli, a gadewch i'r ysbytai fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith.

Mae arnom angen newid polisi. Hyd yma, ni welsom unrhyw arwydd bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i newid. Gadewch i'r Cynulliad ddweud heddiw nad oes gennym ni, o leiaf, unrhyw hyder ym mholisi'r Llywodraeth hon ar iechyd.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 12, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 34.  
Amendment 1: For 12, Abstain 8, Against 34.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, David

Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2175): O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Motion (NDM2175): For 25, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 concludes this afternoon's business. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.27 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.27 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)