



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 23 Tachwedd 2000**

**Thursday 23 November 2000**

## Cynnwys *Contents*

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd<br><i>Questions to the Minister for Economic Development</i>   |
| 12  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau<br><i>Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities</i>   |
| 21  | Datganiad ar Lid yr Ymennydd<br><i>Statement on Meningitis</i>  |
| 28  | Pwyntiau o Drefn<br><i>Points of Order</i>  |
| 31  | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru (Penodi) 2000<br><i>Approval of the Children's Commissioner for Wales (Appointments) Regulations 2000</i>   |
| 39  | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000<br><i>Approval of the NHS (General Dental Services) Amendment (Wales) Regulations 2000</i> |
| 44  | Gwella Adeiladau Ysgolion<br><i>Upgrade of School Buildings</i>   |
| 96  | Dadl Fer: Rôl Ynni Adnewyddadwy yn y Dyfodol<br><i>Short Debate: The Future Role of Renewable Energy</i>  |
| 110 | Pwynt o Drefn<br><i>Point of Order</i>  |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Questions to the Minister for Economic Development**

### **Prosiectau Twristiaeth a Chronfeydd Amcan 1 Tourism Projects and Objective 1 Funds**

**C1 Cynog Dafis:** Sut mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd yn bwriadu sicrhau y bydd prosiectau twristiaeth yn elwa ar gronfeydd Amcan 1? (OAQ7993)

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** Tourism projects can benefit in a number of ways from Objective 1 funds. Tourism businesses, as small and medium-sized enterprises, can benefit from many areas of the Objective 1 programme including grant support, equity investment, loan support, business support, marketing support and the provision of appropriate premises for small scale tourism ventures. Tourism projects related to training and enhancing skills at all levels are also widely supported in the programme. In addition, tourism is recognised as an important sector for promoting local economic development in rural areas. However, it is now the monitoring committee's responsibility to ensure delivery of the programme, which includes tourism activities.

**Cynog Dafis:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno mai camgymeriad mawr yn y strategaeth Amcan 1 oedd peidio â rhoi blaenoriaeth i dwristiaeth? Twristiaeth yw un o brif ddiwydiannau ardal Amcan 1, ac mae'n ddiwydiant sydd yn tyfu ar lefel fyd-eang. Mae hyn wedi achosi cryn ddiacter a chwerwder yn y sector hwnnw. Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu gwneud yn iawn am y mater hwn a rhoi hyder yn ôl i'r sector a sicrhau hefyd fod twristiaeth ddiwylliannol a threfnadaeth yn cael eu datblygu fel atyniadau o ansawdd uchel yn ardal Amcan 1?

**Michael German:** You are correct that at the start of the Objective 1 programme negotiations there was an expectation that tourism would be widely supported. However, the European Commission was not

**Q1 Cynog Dafis:** How will the Minister for Economic Development ensure that tourism projects will benefit from Objective 1 funds? (OAQ7993)

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Gall prosiectau twristiaeth elwa ar gronfeydd Amcan 1 mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Gall busnesau twristiaeth, fel mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint, elwa ar sawl maes o'r rhaglen Amcan 1 gan gynnwys cymorth grant, buddsoddi ecwiti, cymorth benthyciad, cymorth busnes, cymorth marchnata a darparu adeiladau priodol ar gyfer mentrau twristiaeth bach. Rhoddir cymorth eang hefyd i brosiectau twristiaeth sydd yn ymwneud â hyfforddi a gwella sgiliau ar bob lefel yn y rhaglen. Yn ogystal, cydnabyddir twristiaeth fel sector pwysig wrth hyrwyddo datblygiad economaidd lleol mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar y pwyllgor monitro bellach i sicrhau y cyflwynir y rhaglen, sydd yn cynnwys gweithgareddau twristiaeth.

**Cynog Dafis:** Does the Minister agree that a great mistake in the Objective 1 strategy was not to give priority to tourism? It is one of the main industries in the Objective 1 area, and is a growing industry on a global level. This has caused a great deal of anger and bitterness in the sector. How does the Minister intend to compensate for this and put confidence back into the sector and ensure also that cultural tourism and heritage are developed as high quality attractions in the Objective 1 area?

**Michael German:** Mae'n wir mai'r disgwyliad ar ddechrau trafodaethau'r rhaglen Amcan 1 oedd y byddai twristiaeth yn cael ei chefnogi'n helaeth. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn

convinced that the case had been made for substantial support for tourism and was particularly critical of large tourism infrastructure projects. We have to start from where we are now and it is clear that the economic benefits of tourism are a major driver in the Objective 1 programme to improving the economic sustainability of jobs in Wales. It is important that tourism as an economic driver should be included in all the programmes, including development of small companies and training and promoting local economic development. We can bring these elements together through that method. I hope that the monitoring committee will seriously consider that matter.

**Lynne Neagle:** I welcome the commitment that you have given to look at this, but are you aware that there have been particular problems for tourism projects in the Valleys in accessing Objective 1? A key project in my constituency, Big Pit, was not able to access Objective 1 funds. Will you agree to look at that as a matter of urgency because there are specific problems with the programme complement in relation to projects in the Valleys?

**Michael German:** I am concerned that we should look at industrial heritage as one of the tourism products of Wales. I will be visiting Big Pit in the next few weeks with officials from the Wales Tourist Board as well as civil servants to see the problems at first hand. There are two vital elements in prompting tourism. One is to ensure that we market Wales effectively and properly and the second one is to ensure that we have a product, namely Wales, which is capable of being seen on a holistic level. The industrial heritage of south Wales is a suitable tourism product and it needs enhancing.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I accept what Lynne Neagle says about the Valleys, but it is also true of west Wales. There is massive potential in that area that could benefit from Objective 1 funds. I am concerned that it will slip through the net and that we will lose sight of its massive economic, cultural and social potential. What are you doing to facilitate funding for projects such as the Fishguard

argyhoeddedig y cyflwynwyd achos o blaid darparu cymorth sylweddol i dwristiaeth ac yr oedd yn arbennig o feirniadol o brosiectau seilwaith twristiaeth mawr. Rhaid inni ddechrau o'n sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n amlwg bod buddiannau economaidd twristiaeth yn un o'r prif ffactorau sydd yn llywio'r rhaglen Amcan 1 i wella cynaliadwyedd economaidd swyddi yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig y dylid cynnwys twristiaeth fel llywiwr economaidd ymhob un o'r rhaglenni, gan gynnwys datblygu cwmnïau bach a hyfforddi a hyrwyddo datblygiad economaidd lleol. Gallwn ddod â'r elfennau hyn ynghyd drwy'r dull hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyllgor monitro yn ystyried y mater hwnnw o ddifrif.

**Lynne Neagle:** Croesawaf yr ymrwymiad gennych i ystyried hyn, ond a ydych yn ymwybodol y bu problemau penodol o ran prosiectau twristiaeth yn y Cymoedd ynglŷn â chael mynediad i Amcan 1? Ni lwyddodd un o'r prosiectau allweddol yn fy etholaeth i, Pwll Mawr, i gael arian Amcan 1. A gytnwch i ystyried hynny ar fyrder gan fod problemau penodol gydag elfennau o'r rhaglen mewn perthynas â phrosiectau yn y Cymoedd?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn awyddus y dylem ystyried treftadaeth ddiwydiannol fel un o gynnyrch twristiaeth Cymru. Byddaf yn ymweld â Phwll Mawr yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf gyda swyddogion o Fwrdd Croeso Cymru yn ogystal â gweision sifil i weld y problemau yn uniongyrchol. Mae dwy elfen hanfodol wrth roi hwb i dwristiaeth. Un yw sicrhau ein bod yn marchnata Cymru yn effeithiol ac yn gywir a'r ail yw sicrhau bod gennym gynnyrch, sef Cymru, y gellir ei ystyried ar lefel gyfannol. Mae treftadaeth ddiwydiannol de Cymru yn gynnyrch twristiaeth addas ac mae angen ei wella.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywed Lynne Neagle am y Cymoedd, ond mae'r un peth yn wir am orllewin Cymru. Mae potensial enfawr yn yr ardal honno a allai elwa ar gronfeydd Amcan 1. Pryderaf y bydd yn syrthio drwy'r rhwyd ac y byddwn yn colli golwg ar ei photensial economaidd, diwylliannol a chymdeithasol enfawr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau arian ar gyfer

last invasion centre that was here this week?

prosiectau megis canolfan ymosodiad olaf Abergwaun a fu yma yr wythnos hon?

**Michael German:** As you know, the monitoring committee has determined that such issues will be dealt with in co-ordination with local areas. I hope that they will reconsider the potential for tourism throughout Wales. It is a matter of great importance to us that tourism is given support, and that it is seen as a method of raising our gross domestic product across Wales. It is of great value to us and it is a part of our economy that needs sustaining and supporting. The Objective 1 programme, as other structural funds programmes, can give a great deal of support, and I hope that the monitoring committee sees tourism of great importance.

**Michael German:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r pwyllgor monitro wedi penderfynu ymdrin â materion o'r fath ar y cyd ag ardaloedd lleol. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn ailystyried y potensial ar gyfer twristiaeth ledled Cymru. Mae'n bwysig iawn inni y rhoddir cefnogaeth i dwristiaeth, ac y caiff ei hystyried fel dull o gynyddu ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth ledled Cymru. Mae o werth mawr inni ac mae'n rhan o'n heconomi y mae angen ei chynnal a'i chefnogi. Gall y rhaglen Amcan 1, fel rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol eraill, roi llawer iawn o gymorth, a gobeithiaf fod y pwyllgor monitro yn ystyried twristiaeth fel rhywbeth sydd o bwys mawr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 2 yn ôl.

9:15 a.m.

### **Mynd i'r Afael â Phroblem Anweithgarwch Economaidd yng Nghymru Tackling Economic Inactivity in Wales**

**Q3 Richard Edwards:** What steps is Michael German taking to tackle the problem of economic inactivity in Wales? (OAQ7920)

**C3 Richard Edwards:** Pa gamau mae Michael German yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â phroblem anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru? (OAQ7920)

**Michael German:** Wales has an unacceptable legacy of significantly higher rates of inactivity than the UK average among its working age population. That means that far too many people are not achieving their potential earnings and lifestyle. The competitiveness of the Welsh economy is therefore restrained.

**Michael German:** Mae gan Gymru etifeddiaeth annerbyniol o gyfraddau sylweddol uwch o anweithgarwch na chyfartaledd y DU ymhlith ei phoblogaeth o oedran gweithio. Golyga hyn fod llawer gormod o bobl nad ydynt yn cyflawni eu potensial o ran enillion a ffordd o fyw. Felly cyfyngir ar allu cystadleuol economi Cymru.

This is a complex issue, and its solution will involve a broad mix of policy responses, some of which are reserved to the UK Government. However, under its economic development portfolio, the Assembly has the challenge of growing and attracting sufficient good quality jobs to Wales to attract people back into the labour market. We must also tackle the other significant reasons for inactivity and place an emphasis on encouraging and helping people who are sick or disabled to re-engage in work.

Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth, a bydd ei ddatrys yn gofyn am gymysgedd eang o ymatebion polisi, y mae rhai ohonynt yn ymwneud â Llywodraeth y DU. Fodd bynnag, o dan ei bortffolio datblygu economaidd, un o sialensau'r Cynulliad yw datblygu a denu digon o swyddi safonol i Gymru i ddenu pobl yn ôl i'r farchnad lafur. Rhaid inni hefyd fynd i'r afael â'r rhesymau arwyddocaol eraill dros anweithgarwch a rhoi pwyslais ar annog a helpu pobl sydd yn sâl neu'n anabl i ailymuno â'r byd gwaith.

**Richard Edwards:** As you know, thanks to the Labour Government, unemployment has radically decreased in Pembrokeshire, as elsewhere in Wales. However, as you said, economic inactivity—that is, the numbers of people not registered as being available for work—remains high. That being so, meeting the challenging targets set for increasing gross domestic product per capita in the national economic development strategy will be difficult. How do you propose to do that?

**Michael German:** The Economic Development Committee and I are currently reviewing the national economic development strategy. A consultation exercise will be held, which will be reviewed at the beginning of the new year. We must look at this multifaceted problem in a multifaceted way. There are social economy issues, such as childcare and debt, which credit unions can help to support. Perhaps one way of looking at the social economy is as a transitional economy, helping people back on the rungs of the ladder of returning to work. The process that we must undertake will ensure that the one-third gap in GDP per capita between west Wales and the Valleys and the rest of the UK is reduced. However, that will require a multifaceted approach, some of the levers for which are outside of the National Assembly's control.

**Glyn Davies:** In order to reduce and prevent economic inactivity in Powys in particular, I am sure that you will agree that it is vital that tier 3 funding is available. What is the latest position on that and what steps are you taking to ensure that such funding becomes available in Powys?

**Michael German:** I am particularly keen that we should have a tier 3 scheme in Wales. Negotiations are continuing on that, and we are debating vigorously with the UK Government as to whether we will have a separate tier 3 scheme in Wales.

**Richard Edwards:** Fel y gwyddoch, diolch i Lywodraeth Lafur, gostyngodd diweithdra yn sylweddol yn Sir Benfro, fel mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedaso, erys anweithgarwch economaidd—hynny yw, nifer y bobl nad ydynt wedi'u cofrestru fel pobl sydd ar gael i weithio—yn uchel. Â'r sefyllfa felly, bydd cwrdd â'r targedau heriol a osodwyd ar gyfer cynyddu'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen yn y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol yn anodd. Sut y bwriadwch wneud hynny?

**Michael German:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a minnau wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn adolygu'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol. Cynhelir ymarfer ymgynghorol, a gaiff ei adolygu ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd. Rhaid inni ystyried y broblem amlochrog hon mewn ffordd amlochrog. Mae materion economi cymdeithasol, megis gofal plant a dyled, y gall undebau credyd helpu i'w cynnal. Efallai mai un ffordd o ystyried yr economi gymdeithasol yw fel economi drosiannol, sydd yn helpu pobl ifanc i ddringo'r ysgol o ddychwelyd i'r gwaith. Bydd y broses y mae'n rhaid inni ymgymryd â hi yn sicrhau gostyngiad yn y bwch o draean yn y CMC y pen rhwng gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd a gweddill y DU. Fodd bynnag, bydd hynny'n gofyn am ymagwedd amlochrog, y mae rhai o'i dulliau gweithredu y tu allan i reolaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Glyn Davies:** Er mwyn lleihau ac atal anweithgarwch economaidd ym Mhowys yn benodol, yr wyf yn siwr y cytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol bod arian haen 3 ar gael. Beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yn hynny o beth a pha gamau a gymerwch i sicrhau bod arian o'r fath ar gael ym Mhowys?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus inni gael cynllun haen 3 yng Nghymru. Mae'r trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt ar hynny, ac yr ydym wrthi'n cynnal trafodaethau bywiog gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch a fydd gennym gynllun haen 3 ar wahân yng Nghymru.

**Cynlluniau Gweithredu Rhanbarthol, Is-ranbarthol a Lleol**  
**Regional, Sub-regional and Local Action Plans**

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will Michael German make a brief statement on the resources available between the regional, sub-regional and local action plans within the Objective 1 programme? (OAQ7995)

**Michael German:** The Programme Monitoring Committee decided on 16 October that the Welsh European Funding Office should work with partnerships to deliver and develop six priority action plans, building on the work carried out by the regional partnerships. In conjunction with the 15 local action plans, these will provide a strategic framework within which projects can be funded, so as most effectively deliver the outputs of the programme. Indicative allocations to partnerships are being made only in those measures where there is a specific local focus. However, since the meeting of the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee, the Chair of the committee and I have established a task and finish group. Its challenge is to produce a paper for the next committee meeting on 15 December that will address this matter.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will quote directly a letter that has been sent jointly from the Objective 1 partnership and forum in Carmarthenshire. It raises a number of concerns about these issues and states:

‘We look forward to receiving your response to the above and would hope that you will be in a position to reassure the partnership that positive steps are now being taken to overcome the many concerns that have been expressed.’

Does the Minister accept that the establishing of this task and finish group is an admission by the administration that it has bungled Objective 1? His predecessor failed to address these issues. Is he now in a position to answer the simple, basic questions about where and how you apply for Objective 1 funding and what happens to the application when it is submitted?

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff Michael German ddatganiad byr ynghylch yr adnoddau sydd ar gael rhwng y cynlluniau gweithredu rhanbarthol, is-ranbarthol a lleol o fewn rhaglen Amcan 1? (OAQ7995)

**Michael German:** Penderfynodd y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglenni ar 16 Hydref y dylai Swyddfa Ariannu Ewropeaidd Cymru gydweithio â phartneriaethau i gyflwyno a datblygu chwe chynllun gweithredu blaenoriaeth, gan adeiladu ar y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y partneriaethau rhanbarthol. Mewn cydweithrediad â'r 15 o gynlluniau gweithredu lleol, byddant yn darparu fframwaith strategol y gellir ariannu'r prosiectau o'i fewn, i gyflwyno cynnyrch y rhaglen yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol. Dim ond yn y mesurau hynny lle ceir ffocws lleol penodol y gwneir dyraniadau dangosol i bartneriaethau. Fodd bynnag, ers cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1, mae Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor a minnau wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Yr her iddo yw cynhyrchu papur ar gyfer cyfarfod nesaf y pwyllgor ar 15 Rhagfyr a fydd yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hoffwn ddyfynnu'n uniongyrchol o lythyr a anfonwyd ar y cyd gan bartneriaeth a fforwm Amcan 1 yng Nghaerfyrddin. Mae'n codi nifer o bryderon am y materion hyn gan ddatgan:

‘Edrychwn ymlaen at dderbyn eich ymateb i'r uchod a gobeithiwn y byddwch mewn sefyllfa i sicrhau'r bartneriaeth fod camau cadarnhaol yn cael eu cymryd yn awr i oresgyn yr amryw bryderon a fynegwyd.’

A dderbynia'r Gweinidog fod sefydlu'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen hwn yn gyfaddefiad gan y weinyddiaeth ei bod wedi gwneud cawl o Amcan 1? Methodd ei ragflaenydd ag ymdrin â'r materion hyn. A yw bellach mewn sefyllfa i ateb y cwestiynau syml, sylfaenol am ymhle a sut y dylid gwneud cais am arian Amcan 1 a beth sydd yn digwydd i'r cais pan gaiff ei gyflwyno?

**Michael German:** You will be pleased to know that the author of the letter is a member of the task and finish group.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** He is not.

**Michael German:** A member of the task and finish group is a significant member of the forum that supports the Camarthenshire programme.

Partners around Wales have significant anxieties. I have explained that to the Economic Development Committee. The task and finish group's purpose is to suggest how to deal with the architecture and structures of the Objective 1 programme. I have been in post, as you know, for just five weeks. I hope that you recognise that those five weeks—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Michael German:** I note that some Assembly Members would prefer me not to take action. Those who would prefer me not to take action can keep shouting. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**Peter Rogers:** Do you agree that the bureaucratic arrangements within the Objective 1 programme structures do nothing to encourage the full participation of the business sector, which is used to efficiency?

**Michael German:** The procedures, which are largely European-driven, are complex and can sometimes seem daunting to those who have to deal with them. The private sector, unlike the voluntary and the public sectors in Wales, has not been geared up to handling applications and inquiries in this manner. It has always seemed to me appropriate that the private sector should put in place its own mechanism for helping to support—*[Interruption.]* Shall I wait for the mobile phone to finish?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is out of order to play electronic instruments of any kind in the Chamber.

**Nick Bourne:** I apologise.

**Michael German:** Byddwch yn falch o glywed bod awdur y llythyr yn aelod o'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nac ydyw.

**Michael German:** Mae aelod o'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn aelod pwysig o'r fforwm sydd yn cefnogi rhaglen Sir Gaerfyrddin.

Mae gan bartneriaid ledled Cymru bryderon sylweddol. Eglurais hynny i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd. Diben y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yw awgrymu sut i ymdrin â chyfansoddiad a strwythurau'r rhaglen Amcan 1. Dim ond ers pum wythnos y bŵm yn fy swydd, fel y gwyddoch. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn sylweddoli y bu'r pum wythnos—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Michael German:** Nodaf y byddai'n well gan rai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i mi beidio â gweithredu. Gall y rheini y byddai'n well ganddynt i mi beidio â gweithredu barhau i weiddi. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.]

**Peter Rogers:** A gytunwch na wna'r trefniadau biwrocataidd o fewn strwythurau rhaglen Amcan 1 ddim i annog cyfranogiad llawn y sector busnes, sydd wedi arfer ag effeithlonrwydd?

**Michael German:** Mae'r gweithdrefnau, sydd yn deillio'n bennaf o Ewrop, yn gymhleth a gallant godi ofn weithiau ar y rheini sydd yn gorfod ymdrin â hwy. Yn wahanol i'r sector gwirfoddol a'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, nid yw'r sector preifat wedi cael ei baratoi i ddelio â cheisiadau ac ymholiadau yn y fath fodd. Yr wyf bob amser wedi ystyried ei bod yn briodol y dylai'r sector preifat sefydlu ei ddull ei hun ar gyfer helpu i gynorthwyo—*[Torri ar draws.]* A ddylwn aros i'r ffôn symudol dawelu?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae allan o drefn i chwarae unrhyw offerynnau electronig yn y Siambr hon.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymddiheuraf.



**The Presiding Officer:** I did not realise that the leader of the Welsh Conservatives was to blame for the interruption. I welcome his apology. Minister, please continue.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oeddwn yn sylweddol mai arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru oedd ar fai am dorri ar draws. Croesawaf yr ymddiheuriad hwn. Parhewch os gwelwch yn dda, Weinidog.

**Michael German:** It has always been my view that the private sector should have a support mechanism in place to enable it to interpret the complexities of European structural fund programmes, explain them more attractively and to assist it to engage with them fully. I am taking that matter forward.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf o'r farn o'r cychwyn y dylai fod dull cymorth ar gael i'r sector preifat i'w alluogi i ddehongli cymhlethdodau'r rhaglenni cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd, i'w hegluro'n fwy deniadol ac i'w gynorthwyo i gymryd rhan lawn ynddynt. Yr wyf wrthi'n gweithredu ar y mater hwnnw.

### **Gweithwyr y mae Pencadlysoedd eu Cwmnïau y tu allan i Gymru Employees whose Company Headquarters are Outside Wales**

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gefnogaeth y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gallu ei rhoi i weithwyr sydd yn gweithio i gwmnïau y mae eu pencadlysoedd y tu allan i Gymru? (OAQ7941)

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** What support can the National Assembly give to employees who work for companies whose headquarters are outside Wales? (OAQ7941)

**Michael German:** The Assembly has stated its intention to invest more in people and lifelong learning by March 2003, so that everyone, young people in particular, can gain the range of knowledge and skills necessary for them to fulfil their potential and prosper in the new economy. Part of our strategy is to encourage more employers to invest in learning. That includes promoting standards through Investors in People, encouraging employers to collaborate in learning with support from their national training organisations, and encouraging unions to influence the take-up of learning at work through the Wales union learning fund. Projects are taking place in public and private sectors that involve all types of employees. They cover such matters as key and basic skills, establishing work-based learning centres and training union members to become learning mentors and to pass on their skills and knowledge to colleagues.

**Michael German:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi datgan ei fwriad i fuddsoddi mwy mewn pobl a dysgu gydol oes erbyn mis Mawrth 2003, fel y gall pawb, pobl ifanc yn benodol, feithrin yr ystod o wybodaeth a sgiliau sydd ei hangen arnynt i gyflawni eu potensial ac i ffynnu yn yr economi newydd. Rhan o'n strategaeth yw annog mwy o gyflogwyr i fuddsoddi mewn dysgu. Mae hynny'n cynnwys hyrwyddo safonau drwy Fuddsoddwyr mewn Pobl, annog cyflogwyr i gydweithredu mewn dysgu gyda chymorth gan eu sefydliadau hyfforddi cenedlaethol, ac annog undebau i ddylanwadu ar bobl i fynd ati i ddysgu yn y gwaith drwy gronfa dysgu undeb Cymru. Mae prosiectau yn mynd rhagddynt yn y sector cyhoeddus a phreifat sydd yn cynnwys pob math o gyflogeion. Maent yn cwmpasu materion fel sgiliau allweddol a sylfaenol, sefydlu canolfannau dysgu yn y gwaith a hyfforddi aelodau o undebau i ddod yn fentoriaid dysgu ac i drosglwyddo eu sgiliau a'u gwybodaeth i'w cydweithwyr.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae pryder mawr mewn nifer o ddiwydiannau yng Nghymru oherwydd y bygythiad i lawer o swyddi. Mae enwau Corus, Sony, Panasonic, DARA—yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Afioneg Amddiffyn—a Sain Tathan yn dod i'r meddwl yn syth. Yn

**Owen John Thomas:** There is great concern in several industries in Wales because of the threat to many jobs. The names Corus, Sony, Panasonic, DARA—the Defence Avionics Repair Agency—and St Athan come to mind immediately. In the case of each of these

achos pob un o'r sefydliadau hyn, gwneir y penderfyniadau allweddol y tu allan i Gymru, yn aml y tu allan i Brydain, ac weithiau y tu allan i Ewrop hyd yn oed. Pa strategaeth sydd gan Gabinet y Cynulliad i ddylanwadu ar reolwyr y cwmnïau a'r sefydliadau hyn?

**Michael German:** We must send a clear message to these companies that we want to see our economy grow, particularly in higher added value jobs. To do that, we need to anchor down those companies by the provision of solid supplier chains and clustering of companies with similar ambitions. That means engaging with indigenous companies, so that those overseas companies will be in an economic environment that makes it unlikely that they will want to leave. Yesterday, I launched the Accelerate Wales programme, which provides £4.5 million of Assembly money, plus European money, to assist in supplier chain development in the motor vehicle component manufacturing sector. That is how we can encourage and hold down those larger companies. What we must provide is a high level of skills and investment in new products and in the products that people will want in 10 and 15 years' time.

**Peter Black:** Given the importance of where headquarters are located to economic development and the jobs and economic activity that can grow around them, would you support the call for the Assembly to locate the headquarters of its own organisations, for example, the National Council for Education and Training for Wales, outside of Cardiff, to stimulate economic activity in those areas? CETW could be located in Swansea, for instance.

**Michael German:** The question is, of course, about spreading economic development around Wales. It is the stated ambition in the Objective 1 single programming document. It is also included in the Assembly's instructions to the Welsh Development Agency that there should be a spread of jobs throughout Wales. That ambition must be satisfied and pressure must be maintained.

9:25 a.m.

organisations, key decisions are made outside Wales, often outside Britain, and sometimes outside Europe even. What strategy does the Assembly Cabinet have to influence the managers of these companies and organisations?

**Michael German:** Rhaid inni anfon neges glir i'r cwmnïau hyn ein bod am weld ein heconomi yn tyfu, yn arbennig mewn swyddi gwerth ychwanegol uwch. Er mwyn gwneud hynny, mae angen inni angori'r cwmnïau hynny drwy ddarparu cadwyni cyflenwyr cadarn a chlystyru cwmnïau ag uchelgeisiau tebyg. Golyga hynny gysylltu â chwmnïau cynhenid, fel y bydd y cwmnïau tramor hynny mewn amgylchedd economaidd sydd yn ei gwneud yn annhebygol y byddant am adael. Ddoe, lansiais y rhaglen Cyflymu Cymru, sydd yn darparu £4.5 miliwn o arian y Cynulliad, ac arian Ewropeaidd, i gynorthwyo wrth ddatblygu cadwyni cyflenwyr yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu cydrannau cerbydau modur. Dyna sut y gallwn annog a chadw'r cwmnïau mwy hynny. Rhaid inni ddarparu lefel uchel o sgiliau a buddsoddiad mewn cynnyrch newydd ac yn y cynnyrch y bydd ar bobl eu heisiau ymhen 10 a 15 mlynedd.

**Peter Black:** O gofio pwysigrwydd lleoliad pencadlysoedd i ddatblygiad economaidd a'r swyddi a'r gweithgarwch economaidd a all dyfu o'u cwmpas, a fydddech yn cefnogi'r cais i'r Cynulliad leoli pencadlys ei sefydliadau ei hun, er enghraifft, Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant i Gymru, y tu allan i Gaerdydd, i ysgogi gweithgarwch economaidd yn yr ardaloedd hynny? Er enghraifft, gellid lleoli CETW yn Abertawe.

**Michael German:** Mae'r cwestiwn, wrth gwrs, yn ymwneud â lledaenu datblygiad economaidd ledled Cymru. Dyna'r uchelgais a nodir yn nogfen rhaglennu sengl Amcan 1. Fe'i nodir hefyd yng nghyfarwyddiadau'r Cynulliad i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru y dylai swyddi gael eu dosbarthu ledled Cymru. Rhaid bodloni'r uchelgais honno a chynnal y pwysau.

## **Marchnata Cymru fel Lle Da i Dwristiaid Marketing Wales as a Tourism Destination**

**C6 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A wnaiff Michael German ddatganiad ynghylch y swm sydd yn cael ei fuddsoddi dramor yn y gwaith o farchnata Cymru fel lle da i dwristiaid ddod i ymweld ag ef? (OAQ8004)

**Michael German:** The Wales Tourist Board currently has a budget of £1.3 million for overseas marketing. This will be substantially more if the Assembly approves the proposed significant increase in the Wales Tourist Board's budget later this month. That would bring £4.65 million additional money, over £20 million in total. Much of that additional money will be spent on marketing.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cynnydd yng nghyllideb y Bwrdd Croeso. Fodd bynnag, a ydych yn cydnabod mai un o'n prif anghenion ar hyn o bryd yn y maes twristiaeth yw marchnata Cymru dramor? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael â phrif weithredwr a chadeirydd y Bwrdd Croeso i sicrhau bod rhan sylweddol o'r cynnydd hwnnw yn mynd yn benodol at farchnata Cymru dramor? A ydych hefyd wedi cael trafodaethau ag Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain i sicrhau y caiff Cymru mwy o chwarae teg ar y llwyfan rhyngwladol?

**Michael German:** I have had discussions with the British Tourist Authority and the Wales Tourist Board on this matter. As I explained in answer to an earlier question, the two things that matter most in terms of tourism for Wales are where its markets lie and how to market and promote Wales within and outside the United Kingdom. A significant number of visitors are from the United Kingdom, but an increasing number come from outside the UK. I impressed upon the Wales Tourist Board that that was an essential feature of driving Wales in marketing terms. I made it clear that a significant proportion of the additional money would be spent on external marketing. In respect of the British Tourist Authority, we made it clear that we hope to set targets regarding the amount of promotion work it carries out for Wales. We remain to be convinced that it will undertake that task, but

**Q6 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will Michael German make a statement on the amount being invested overseas in marketing Wales as a tourism destination? (OAQ8004)

**Michael German:** Ar hyn o bryd mae gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru gyllideb o £1.3 miliwn ar gyfer marchnata tramor. Bydd hon yn sylweddol fwy os cymeradwya'r Cynulliad y cynnydd arwyddocaol arfaethedig yng nghyllideb Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn ddiweddarach y mis hwn. Byddai hynny'n dod â £4.65 miliwn o arian ychwanegol, sef cyfanswm o dros £20 miliwn. Gwerir llawer o'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw ar farchnata.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** We welcome the increase in the Wales Tourist Board's budget. However, do you acknowledge that one of our main needs in tourism at the moment is to market Wales overseas? What discussions have you had with the chief executive and the chairman of the Wales Tourist Board to ensure that a substantial part of that increase goes specifically towards marketing Wales overseas? Have you also had discussions with the British Tourist Authority to ensure that Wales is given a fair crack of the whip on the international stage?

**Michael German:** Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gydag Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Fel yr eglurais mewn ateb i gwestiwn cynharach, y ddau beth pwysicaf o ran twristiaeth i Gymru yw lleoliad ei marchnadoedd a sut i farchnata a hyrwyddo Cymru o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig a'r tu allan iddi. Daw nifer sylweddol o ymwelwyr o'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond daw nifer cynyddol ohonynt o'r tu allan i'r DU. Pwysleisiais i Fwrdd Croeso Cymru fod hynny'n nodwedd hanfodol o ran llywio Cymru yn nhermau marchnata. Eglurais y câi cyfran sylweddol o'r arian ychwanegol ei wario ar farchnata allanol. O ran Awdurdod Twristiaeth Prydain, eglurasom ein bod yn gobeithio gosod targedau yn gysylltiedig â swm y gwaith hyrwyddo a wneir ganddo ar ran Cymru. Nid ydym wedi ein darbwylllo hyd yn hyn y bydd yn ymgymryd â'r dasg honno, ond eglurais mai dyma y mae'r

I made it clear that that is what this Assembly expects. Cynulliad yn ei ddisgwyl.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

### **Arian Ychwanegol ar gyfer Amddiffynfeydd Arfordirol ac Atal Llifogydd Additional Money for Coastal and Flood Defences**

**Q1 David Davies:** Will the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities be making additional money available for coastal and flood defences in Wales? (OAQ7946)

**C1 David Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau sicrhau arian ychwanegol ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd arfordirol ac atal llifogydd yng Nghymru? (OAQ7946)

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I appreciate your interest in this question, David, bearing in mind the flooding problems in your constituency. I will make an announcement on the additional funds for flood and coastal defences in Wales in due course, when we have a better picture of the level of need.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Gwerthfawrogaf eich diddordeb yn y cwestiwn hwn, David, o gofio'r problemau llifogydd yn eich etholaeth. Byddaf yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd ac amddiffynfeydd arfordirol yng Nghymru ymhen amser, pan fydd gennym ddarlun gwell o lefel yr angen.

**David Davies:** Are you aware that the Environment Agency has been looking at a floodgate device which will hold back two tonnes of water and be the equivalent of 70 sandbags? It is interested in buying and distributing them. Are you aware of this device and would you support giving extra money to the agency if it felt that this device would be of use in preventing further flooding?

**David Davies:** A ydych yn ymwybodol y bu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn ystyried dyfais ffloidiart a fydd yn dal dwy dunnell o ddŵr yn ôl, sef cyfwerth â 70 o fagiau tywod? Mae ganddi diddordeb yn eu prynu a'u dosbarthu. A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r ddyfais hon ac a fydddech o blaid rhoi arian ychwanegol i'r asiantaeth pe teimlai y byddai'r ddyfais hon o ddefnydd wrth atal llifogydd pellach?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for drawing that to my attention. I will certainly discuss that with Sue Essex, the Minister for Environment. We need to look carefully at anything that could help to alleviate the position of poor householders who are affected by flooding. I will take this into account when I make any decisions regarding future financial provision.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch am dynnu fy sylw at hynny. Byddaf yn sicr yn ei drafod gyda Sue Essex, y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd. Mae angen inni ystyried yn ofalus unrhyw beth a allai helpu i liniaru sefyllfa'r deiliaid cartrefi anffodus yr effeithir arnynt gan lifogydd. Ystyriaf hyn wrth wneud unrhyw benderfyniadau o ran darpariaeth ariannol yn y dyfodol.

**Mick Bates:** Extra money is welcome. However, I found considerable confusion among people regarding who is responsible in this situation, whether it is the drainage board, local authorities, water companies or the Environment Agency. Can you tell us to which organisation you will allocate money

**Mick Bates:** Croesewir arian ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, canfyddais fod pobl yn ansicr iawn ynglŷn â phwy sydd yn gyfrifol yn y sefyllfa hon, ai'r bwrdd draenio, awdurdodau lleol, cwmnïau dŵr neu Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. A allwch ddweud wrthym i ba sefydliad y byddwch yn dyrannu arian i atal

to prevent flooding?

**Edwina Hart:** Sue Essex and myself are discussing what we can do in terms of financial resources with everybody that is involved, such as the Environment Agency and Welsh local government. We have not yet made a decision about the allocation of the £3 million. As we indicated, we must consider what reports are coming in. We hope next week to have a full position report from the Environment Agency. I have also asked Welsh local government to talk to me about the issues to which you refer, particularly in respect of what has happened with drainage in houses. As I made clear to Janet Ryder in the Chamber last week, this is bigger than anybody imagined, which has been highlighted by the unfortunate circumstances. It is key—and I have discussed this with Sue Essex—that we do not necessarily make short-term projects, but long-term projects. We have to look at it in terms of Welsh local government over a number of years and of what it can do, and in terms of the Environment Agency, to look at the key areas that it needs to examine in terms of defences.

I agree with Sue that we will probably make a further statement on this when the picture becomes clear from all the organisations that we have consulted with, and that we will update the Assembly. This is of enormous interest to Members of all political parties.

**Janet Ryder:** Local authorities and emergency services qualify for funding under Bellwin. Does the Environment Agency qualify for funding under that scheme, due to the extra burdens it faced recently? Also, will you look again at its budget for next year because that agency will be responsible for putting in the defences? Will you reconsider its budget to ensure that it is robust enough to enable them to do the job that they need to do?

**Edwina Hart:** Unfortunately there has been a history of underspending on provision in 1999-2000. Substantial funding was provided

llifogydd?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Sue Essex a minnau wrthi'n trafod yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yn nhermau adnoddau ariannol gyda phawb sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r sefyllfa, megis Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a llywodraeth leol Cymru. Nid ydym wedi gwneud penderfyniad eto ynglŷn â dyrannu'r £3 miliwn. Fel y nodwyd gennym, rhaid inni ystyried pa adroddiadau sydd yn cael eu cyflwyno. Gobeithiwn y bydd adroddiad llawn ar y sefyllfa ar gael gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yr wythnos nesaf. Gofynnais hefyd i lywodraeth leol Cymru drafod y materion y cyfeiriwch atynt, yn arbennig o ran yr hyn a ddigwyddodd gyda draenio mewn tai. Fel yr eglurais i Janet Ryder yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf, mae hyn yn fwy nag y dychmygwyd, ac fe'i amlygwyd gan yr amgylchiadau anffodus. Mae'n allweddol—ac yr wyf wedi trafod hyn â Sue Essex—na chyflwynwn brosiectau tymor byr o reidrwydd, ond prosiectau tymor hir. Rhaid inni ei ystyried yn nhermau llywodraeth leol Cymru dros nifer o flynyddoedd a'r hyn y gall ei wneud, ac yn nhermau Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, i ystyried y meysydd allweddol y mae angen iddi eu harchwilio yn nhermau amddiffynfeydd.

Cytunaf â Sue y byddwn fwy na thebyg yn gwneud datganiad pellach ar hyn pan gawn ddarlun cliriach gan bob un o'r sefydliadau yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy, ac y byddwn yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad. Mae hyn o ddiddordeb enfawr i Aelodau pob plaid wleidyddol.

**Janet Ryder:** Mae awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaethau brys yn gymwys i gael arian o dan Bellwin. A yw Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gymwys i gael arian o dan y cynllun hwnnw, yn sgîl y baich ychwanegol arni yn ddiweddar? Hefyd, a ailystyriwch ei chyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf gan y bydd yr asiantaeth honno yn gyfrifol am sefydlu'r amddiffynfeydd? A ystyriwch ei chyllideb i sicrhau ei bod yn ddigon cadarn i'w galluogi i wneud y gwaith y mae angen iddi ei wneud?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn anffodus bu hanes o danwario ar ddarpariaeth yn 1999-2000. Darparwyd arian sylweddol i setlo cais

for the settlement of a major contractual claim. Forward projections of capital works expenditure provided by the Environment Agency and local authorities did not justify a higher provision. We are looking at the issue of how we can deal with additional funds in this area and I will come back to the National Assembly on this.

As far as I am aware, the Environment Agency does not qualify for the Bellwin scheme. However, I will confirm that with my officials and advise you if I have not given the Assembly correct information

cytundebol mawr. Nid oedd y rhagfynegiadau o wariant ar waith cyfalaf a ddarparwyd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a'r awdurdodau lleol yn cyfiawnhau darpariaeth uwch. Yr ydym yn ystyried sut y gallwn ddelio ag arian ychwanegol yn y maes hwn a byddaf yn trafod hyn gyda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol maes o law.

Cyhyd ag y gwn i, nid yw Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd yn gymwys ar gyfer cynllun Bellwin. Fodd bynnag, cadarnhaf hynny gyda fy swyddogion a rhoddaf wybod ichi os nad yw'r wybodaeth gywir wedi'i rhoi i'r Cynulliad.

### **Arian i Hyrwyddo Trosglwyddo i Betrol Sylffwr Isel Iawn Money to Facilitate the Changeover to Ultra Low Sulphur Petrol**

**Q2 David Davies:** Will additional money be available within the Assembly's budget for grants for independent petrol retailers to facilitate the changeover to ultra low sulphur petrol? (OAQ7945)

**Edwina Hart:** No.

**David Davies:** Does the Minister share my frustration at the headline-grabbing antics of her colleague, the Chancellor of the Exchequer, who made an announcement that this fuel would be encouraged, but then does nothing to ensure that it is made available to consumers in Wales?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not share your concerns, David, as you know. However, you raised the important issue of independent petrol stations. We do not believe that there will be any significant cost to the retailers of converting their existing forecourt hardware for the sale of ultra low sulphur petrol. Therefore we do not believe that any assistance is required. If Members have concerns in the future about this, particularly in rural areas, they are welcome to raise them with me.

**Kirsty Williams:** I have concerns about the prospects of small independent retailers in rural areas. The partnership agreement mentions increasing business rate relief for rural businesses. Do you not think that including single petrol stations in the community would be a good way of

**C2 David Davies:** A fydd arian ychwanegol ar gael o fewn cyllideb y Cynulliad i dalu grantiau i adwerthwyr petrol annibynnol i'w helpu i newid i betrol sylffwr isel iawn? (OAQ7945)

**Edwina Hart:** Na fydd.

**David Davies:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy rhwystredigaeth yn sgîl ymdrechion ei chydweithiwr, Canghellor y Trysorlys, i ddal y penawdau drwy gyhoeddi y byddai'r tanwydd hwn yn cael ei annog, ond yna'n gwneud dim i sicrhau ei fod ar gael i ddefnyddwyr yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni rannaf eich pryderon, David, fel y gwyddoch. Fodd bynnag, codasoch y mater pwysig o orsafoedd petrol annibynnol. Ni chredwn y bydd unrhyw gost sylweddol i'r adwerthwyr yn sgîl addasu caledwedd eu gorsafoedd presennol i werthu petrol swlffwr isel iawn. Felly ni chredwn bod angen unrhyw gymorth. Os bydd gan yr Aelodau unrhyw bryderon yn y dyfodol yn hyn o beth, yn arbennig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, mae croeso iddynt eu codi gyda mi.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae gennyf bryderon am y rhagolygon i adwerthwyr annibynnol bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Crybwylla'r cytundeb partneriaeth ryddhad treth busnes cynyddol i fusnesau gwledig. Oni chredwch y byddai cynnwys gorsafoedd petrol sengl yn y gymuned yn ffordd dda o ddefnyddio

deploying some of that money to ensure that they are there for the future?

**Edwina Hart:** Clearly, we could look at that. However, it is not just in rural areas; there are also small independent stations in urban areas. Not all urban areas are near to Tesco, Sainsbury's or big chains that sell petrol. This is a wider issue, which I am minded to look at further.

**Cynog Dafis:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod mai un o eironiau mawr y sefyllfa yw bod y prisiau petrol uchaf mewn ardaloedd o incwm isel sydd yn dibynnu fwyaf ar y car ar gyfer symudoledd? Mae hyn yn broblem wirioneddol mewn ardaloedd gwledig a gwasgaredig. A allwch drefnu astudiaeth o hyn i fesur maint y broblem ac ystyried sut i leddfu'r broblem ar wahanol lefelau, er enghriaft, drwy gymorth i ddod â mathau newydd o danwydd i ardaloedd gwledig, megis nwy petroliwm hylifedig, petrol sylffwr isel ac yn y blaen; ac astudiaeth ar sut y gellid darparu cymorth i wneud hyn ar lefel Gymreig, yn ogystal ag ar lefel Brydeinig?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you, that suggestion merits further investigation about what we can do as a National Assembly in respect of the issues that you have raised. I will consider what you have said to me today and come back to you to see if there is anything positive that I can do to examine the impact on Wales, and how it could link into other issues across the UK.

rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw i sicrhau eu bod yno ar gyfer y dyfodol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn amlwg, gallem ystyried hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yn unig yn yr ardaloedd gwledig y digwydd hyn; mae gorsafoedd annibynnol bach hefyd mewn ardaloedd trefol. Nid yw pob ardal drefol yn agos i Tesco, Sainsbury neu gadwyni mawr sydd yn gwerthu petrol. Mae hwn yn fater ehangach, y bwriadaf ei ystyried ymhellach.

**Cynog Dafis:** Does the Minister recognise that one of the great ironies of the situation is that the highest petrol prices are in the areas of lowest income where the dependency on the car for mobility is at its greatest? That is a real problem in rural and sparse areas. Could you organise a study of this to measure the extent of the problem and to consider how to alleviate this problem at different levels, for example, through assistance in introducing new types of fuel into rural areas, such as liquified petroleum gas, low sulphur petrol and so on; and a study on how assistance could be provided to do that on a Welsh level and also a British level?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch, mae'r awgrym hwnnw yn haeddu ymchwiliad pellach ynglŷn â'r hyn y gallwn ni ei wneud fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran y materion a godwyd gennych. Ystyriaf yr hyn a ddywedasoeh wrthyf heddiw gan ddod yn ôl atoch i weld a oes unrhyw beth cadarnhaol y gallaf ei wneud i archwilio'r effaith ar Gymru, a sut y gellid ei gysylltu â materion eraill ledled y DU.

### Y Frwydr yn erbyn Hiliaeth yng Nghymru Combating Racism in Wales

**Q3 Richard Edwards:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the combating of racism in Wales? (OAQ7931)

**Edwina Hart:** The Assembly is committed to tackling racism. We intend to lead by example and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, in partnership with the Public and Commercial Services Union, is looking into how the recommendations of the Macpherson report on the death of Stephen Lawrence impact on the Assembly. A

**C3 Richard Edwards:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar y frwydr yn erbyn hiliaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ7931)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael â hiliaeth. Bwriadwn arwain drwy esiampl ac mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, mewn partneriaeth â'r Undeb Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, yn ystyried sut mae argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson ar farwolaeth Stephen Lawrence yn effeithio ar y Cynulliad.

detailed action plan will be produced, which will include measures to tackle institutional racism in the Assembly.

Cynhyrchir cynllun gweithredu manwl, a fydd yn cynnwys mesurau i fynd i'r afael â hiliaeth sefydliadol yn y Cynulliad.

9:25 a.m.

**Richard Edwards:** You will agree that education must play a crucial part in combating racism. Do you also agree that appropriate early years education is most critical? We need training for teachers and governors and mandatory record keeping, but above all we need to catch children at their youngest, when they are most receptive and impressionable, so that they learn tolerance and respect for all their fellows regardless of race, creed, or any other distinguishing factor as a matter of course.

**Richard Edwards:** Fe gytnwch fod yn rhaid i addysg chwarae rhan holl bwysig wrth drechu hiliaeth. A gytnwch hefyd fod addysg blynyddoedd cynnar briodol yn holl bwysig? Mae angen inni hyfforddi athrawon a llywodraethwyr a chadw cofnodion gorfodol, ond yn anad dim mae angen inni addysgu plant pan fyddant mor ifanc â phosibl, pan fônt fwyaf parod i dderbyn a chael eu dylanwadu, er mwyn iddynt ddysgu goddefgarwch a pharch tuag at eu cyfoedion waeth beth fo'u hil, cred, neu unrhyw ffactor gwahaniaethol arall fel mater o drefn.

**Edwina Hart:** You have outlined a view shared by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. Yesterday it discussed its attitude to racism and the importance of tackling racism early in the education system. When the officials' working group has finished its document, which I hope will be available to the Committee by the end of January, we can consider the recommendations that deal with all these aspects. We will probably need to put more flesh on the bones before putting these recommendations forward to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning for implementation across the board in Wales.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydych wedi amlinellu barn a rennir gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Ddoe bu'n trafod ei agwedd tuag at hiliaeth a phwysigrwydd mynd i'r afael â hiliaeth yn gynnar yn y system addysg. Pan fydd gweithgor y swyddogion wedi gorffen ei ddogfen, y gobeithiaf y bydd ar gael i'r Pwyllgor erbyn diwedd mis Ionawr, gallwn ystyried yr argymhellion sydd yn delio â'r holl agweddau hyn. Fwy na thebyg y bydd angen inni roi mwy o gnawd ar yr esgryn cyn cyflwyno'r argymhellion hyn i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i'w gweithredu yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** On racist incidents in educational establishments, I am sure that the Minister will agree that we must have a robust system of data collection, so that those incidents are properly recorded.

**David Melding:** O ran digwyddiadau hiliol mewn sefydliadau addysgol, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen system gadarn o gasglu data arnom, er mwyn i'r digwyddiadau hynny gael eu cofnodi'n gywir.

**Edwina Hart:** I concur with David's comments. If we do not know what the incidents are and if we cannot identify on a local education authority basis where these incidents occur, we will not be able to assist LEAs or schools to stamp out racism.

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf â sylwadau David. Os na wyddwn beth yw'r digwyddiadau ac os na allwn nodi lleoliad y digwyddiadau hyn ar sail awdurdodau addysg lleol, ni allwn gynorthwyo AALI neu ysgolion i gael gwared ar hiliaeth.

**John Griffiths:** Would you join me in welcoming the UK Government's review of the voucher scheme for asylum seekers? Asylum seekers coming to Wales will be less likely to suffer stigma, harassment and attack

**John Griffiths:** A ymunwch â mi wrth groesawu adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU o'r cynllun talebau ar gyfer ceiswyr lloches? Bydd ceiswyr lloches a ddaw i Gymru yn llai tebygol o ddioddef stigma, aflonyddwch ac



if that review results in the scrapping of the voucher system.

**Edwina Hart:** I welcome the review. It is clear from the questions that I have been asked in the National Assembly that the National Assembly for Wales has considerable concerns about the voucher system and the stigmatisation of asylum seekers. I am sure that the National Assembly will want us, as an administration, to respond to that review.

**Helen Mary Jones:** What is your view of the impact of Cardiff City and County Council's withdrawal of community based services from Butetown, including the closure of the New Employ agency and the local Citizens' Advice Bureau, on the capacity of that local community—which is important to us as those people are our neighbours—to resist racism and to insist on their rights? Will you undertake, perhaps wearing both your local government hat and your equality of opportunity hat, to discuss this matter with Cardiff council as a matter of urgency?

**Edwina Hart:** There are issues to do with the circumstances that you outline that are a matter for Cardiff City and County Council as the local authority. In general, it is essential to consider building capacity within black and ethnic minority communities. That should be broadly supported by both central and local government.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 4 has been withdrawn.

ymosodiad os ceir gwared ar y system talebau o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad.

**Edwina Hart:** Croesawaf yr adolygiad. Mae'n amlwg o'r cwestiynau a ofynnwyd imi yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru bryderon sylweddol am y cynllun talebau a stigmatiddio ceiswyr lloches. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am inni, fel gweinyddiaeth, ymateb i'r adolygiad hwnnw.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Beth yw eich barn am yr effaith a gaiff Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd wrth dynnu gwasanaethau cymunedol yn ôl o Butetown, gan gynnwys cau'r asiantaeth Cyflogi Newydd a'r Ganolfan Cyngori leol, ar allu'r gymuned leol honno—sydd yn bwysig inni gan fod y bobl hynny yn gymdogion inni—i wrthod hiliaeth ac i fynnu eu hawliau? A addawch, efallai gan wisgo eich het llywodraeth leol a'ch het cydraddoldeb cyfle, i drafod y mater hwn gyda Chyngor Caerdydd ar fyrder?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae materion ynghlwm wrth yr amgylchiadau a amlinellwch sydd yn fater i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd fel yr awdurdod lleol. Yn gyffredinol, mae'n hanfodol ystyried adeiladu gallu o fewn cymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Dylai llywodraeth ganolog a llywodraeth leol gefnogi hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 4 yn ôl.

### **Y Fenter Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative**

**Q5 Richard Edwards:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the private finance initiative in Wales? (OAQ7930)

**Edwina Hart:** The forward programme for Plenary includes a debate on 5 December on the conclusions from the consultation exercise that took place this summer. I hope that that debate will allow Members to discuss their views on PFI at an early stage and that the debate will take the issue forward in Wales.

**C5 Richard Edwards:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar y fenter cyllid preifat yng Nghymru? (OAQ7930)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r flaen raglen ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn yn cynnwys dadl ar 5 Rhagfyr ar y casgliadau o'r ymarfer ymgynghori a ddigwyddodd yr haf hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl honno yn caniatáu i'r Aelodau drafod eu safbwyntiau ar y fenter cyllid preifat yn gynnar ac y bydd y ddadl yn symud y mater yn ei flaen yng Nghymru.

**Richard Edwards:** I hope that you do not mind my expressing my view, and that you will excuse my being off-message. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Do you share my concerns, and those of many others, that mortgaging public facilities in this way does not offer best value for the public?

**Edwina Hart:** I am answering questions today as the Minister with responsibility for finance. I undertook the consultation because I shared some of your concerns on PFI, and I wanted to ensure that I knew everyone else's views. However, we must recognise, Richard, that significant PFI projects have been undertaken in Wales, such as Chepstow community health hospital, Baglan general hospital, and the school in Ceredigion that I am opening in December. The dualling of the A55 in north Wales and the building of Bute Avenue in Cardiff are also PFI projects. There is a role for public-private partnerships, but it is up to us as an Assembly to consider what that role is. That is why I will detail what has happened during the consultation period in the debate. I will then ask the Assembly and its Committees, if the Assembly is agreeable to that, to examine in detail some of the issues that have arisen, particularly in health and local government, regarding PFI. On the basis of the discussion in December, I suggest that we can go forward to make policy in this area. There must be a degree of consensus on how we want public-private partnerships to proceed in Wales.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Was it not interesting, Edwina, where the opposition to and where the support for PFI came from in this Chamber? Will you elaborate on the reply that you gave to Janet Ryder earlier, when you said that you are considering using PFI for building and repairing council housing? Further to Richard Edwards's point, there may be short-term benefits in using PFI to get things moving, but does Edwina not accept that this only shores up problems for cash-strapped local councils in the long term? Should we not look at this in terms of repayment in 10 and 15 years' time, not just

**Richard Edwards:** Gobeithiaf nad oes gwahaniaeth gennyh fy mod yn mynegi fy safbwynt, ac y byddwch yn fy esgusodi am godi pwynt amherthnasol [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] A rannwch fy ngofidiau, a gofidiau llawer o bobl eraill, nad yw gwario adnoddau cyhoeddus yn y ffordd hon yn cynnig y gwerth gorau i'r cyhoedd?

**Edwina Hart:** Atebaf gwestiynau heddiw fel y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros gyllid. Ymgymerais â'r ymgynghoriad gan fy mod wedi rhannu rhai o'ch pryderon ar y fenter cyllid preifat, ac yr oeddwn am sicrhau fy mod yn gwybod barn pawb arall. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod, Richard, yr ymgymeryd â phrosiectau Menter Cyllid Preifat arwyddocaol yng Nghymru, megis ysbyty iechyd cymuned Cas-gwent, ysbyty cyffredinol Baglan, a'r ysgol yng Ngheredigion y byddaf yn ei hagor yn Rhagfyr. Mae gwneud yr A55 yng ngogledd Cymru yn ffordd ddeuol ac adeiladu Rhodfa Bute yng Nghaerdydd hefyd yn brosiectau Menter Cyllid Preifat. Mae rôl i bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat, ond mater i ni fel Cynulliad yw ystyried beth yw'r rôl honno. Dyna pam yr âf i fanlyu ar yr hyn a ddigwyddod yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori yn y ddadl. Byddaf wedyn yn gofyn i'r Cynulliad a'i Bwyllgorau, os yw'r Cynulliad yn gytûn ar hynny, archwilio rhai o'r materion a gododd yn fanwl, yn arbennig materion iechyd a llywodraeth leol, o safbwynt y fenter cyllid preifat. Ar sail y drafodaeth yn Rhagfyr, awgrymaf y gallwn fwrw ymlaen i wneud polisiau yn y maes hwn. Rhaid bod rhywfaint o gytundeb ar sut y dymunwn i bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat ddatblygu yng Nghymru.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Onid oedd yn ddiddorol, Edwina, o ble y daeth y gwrthwynebiad i'r fenter cyllid preifat a'r gefnogaeth iddi yn y Siambr hon? A wnewch ymhelaethu ar yr ymateb a roddasoch i Janet Ryder yn gynhych, pan ddywedasoch eich bod yn ystyried defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat ar gyfer adeiladu ac atgyweirio tai cyngor? Ymhellach i bwynt Richard Edwards, gall fod manteision tymor byr i ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat i roi hwb ymlaen i bethau, ond oni dderbynia Edwina mai dim ond ategu problemau a wna hyn i gynghorau lleol sydd yn brin o arian yn y tymor hir? Oni

in terms of trying to release money now?

ddylem edrych ar hyn yn nhermau ad-dalu ymhen 10 a 15 mlynedd, ac nid yn unig yn nhermau ceisio rhyddhau arian yn awr?

**Edwina Hart:** There are no cash-strapped local councils in Wales now that I have announced my local government settlement. I am aware of the concerns that have been expressed regarding payments over time. Like you, I have read all the academic surveys and heard what has been said in universities. I have an honest and upfront approach to this. I have put the matter out for consultation and I have asked for people's views. I will bring back the outcome to the Assembly. I will make further recommendations, which will involve further work for Assembly Committees and I want to try to take the matter forward. It is essential to look at all options to tackle the backlog of repairs on public housing estates. People have been accused of going too far down the stock transfer line. I am now being accused of being wrong because I want to investigate another option. We must look at all options honestly and transparently and allow democratic decisions to be taken at local levels on how people wish to proceed.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes cynghorau lleol sydd yn brin o arian yng Nghymru yn awr fy mod wedi cyheoddi fy setliad llywodraeth leol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon a fynegwyd o safbwynt taliadau dros amser. Fel chi, darllenais yr holl arolygon academiaidd a chlywais yr hyn a ddywedwyd mewn prifysgolion. Mae gennyf ymagwedd onest ac agored tuag at hyn. Rhoddais y mater yn agored i ymgynghoriad a gofynnais am farn pobl. Dof â'r canlyniad yn ôl i'r Cynulliad. Gwnaf argymhellion pellach, a fydd yn golygu rhagor o waith i Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad a dymunaf geisio gweithredu'r mater. Mae'n hanfodol edrych ar yr holl ddewisiadau i fynd i'r afael â'r llwyth o waith atgyweirio sydd yn aros i'w wneud mewn ystadai tai cyngor. Cyhuddwyd pobl o fynd yn rhy bell tuag at drosglwyddo stoc. Fe'm cyhuddir bellach o fod yn anghywir gan y dymunaf ymchwilio i ddewis arall. Rhaid inni edrych ar yr holl ddewisiadau yn onest ac yn eglur a chaniatáu i benderfyniadau democrataidd ynglŷn â sut y dymuna pobl fwrw ymlaen gael eu gwneud ar lefel leol.

**Nick Bourne:** It is always good to see Edwina Hart embracing good ideas like PFI. I hope that it has not done serious damage to her future leadership prospects.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae bob amser yn dda gweld Edwina Hart yn croesawu syniadau da fel y fenter cyllid preifat. Gobeithiaf nad yw wedi peri niwed difrifol i'w rhagolygon fel arweinydd yn y dyfodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is about the private finance initiative not about the leadership of the Welsh Labour Party.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn ymwneud â'r fenter cyllid preifat ac nid ag arweinyddiaeth y Blaid Lafur Gymreig.

**Nick Bourne:** It is about what a good idea this is, which is only underlined by Richard Edwards's opposition to it. That stresses how good it must be. Will the minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities consider the possibility of using PFI for improvements to the A40?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n ymwneud â pha mor dda yw'r syniad, a dim ond tanlinellu hynny y mae gwrthwynebiad Richard Edwards iddo. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio pa mor dda y mae'n rhaid iddo fod. A wnaiff y gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ystyried y posibilrwydd o ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat ar gyfer gwelliannau i'r A40?

**Edwina Hart:** I take on board any suggestions regarding road improvement. I will discuss this matter further if it is a priority. This is not a question of embracing public-private partnerships but of being

**Edwina Hart:** Cynhwysaf unrhyw awgrymiadau yn ymwneud â gwelliannau i'r ffyrdd. Trafodaf y mater hwn ymhellach os yw'n flaenoriaeth. Nid yw'n fater o groesawu partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat ond yn fater

realistic about them. I am not saying that it is my preferred option, but that is one that I wish to discuss further in the National Assembly.

o fod yn realistig yn eu cylch. Ni ddywedaf mai dyma'r dewis sydd orau gennyf, ond mae'n un y dymunaf ei drafod ymhellach yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

### **Cymorth y Dreth i Wasanaethau Allweddol mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Rate Relief for Key Services in Rural Areas**

**Q6 Mick Bates:** What funding is allocated to provide rate relief for key services in rural areas as approved in the partnership agreement? (OAQ7988)

**C6 Mick Bates:** Pa arian sydd yn cael ei neilltuo i roi cymorth y dreth i wasanaethau allweddol mewn ardaloedd gwledig fel ag a gymeradwyir yn y cytundeb partneriaeth? (OAQ7988)

**Edwina Hart:** No funding is specifically set aside for the rural rate relief scheme. The Assembly largely meets the cost of the scheme from the non-domestic rating pool. Councils meet 25 per cent of any discretionary relief locally, through council tax. In 1999-2000, the costs falling to the Assembly were around £554,000. We are already following up our commitment in 'Putting Wales First' by considering how to give, and the costs of giving, more relief to small businesses that provide vital services to rural communities.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oes dim arian wedi'i neilltuo'n benodol ar gyfer cynllun cymorth y dreth mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae'r Cynulliad yn talu am y cynllun i raddau helaeth o gronfa'r dreth annomestig. Bydd cynghorau yn talu am 25 y cant o unrhyw gymorth diamod yn lleol, drwy'r dreth gyngor. Yn 1999-2000, yr oedd y costau ar y Cynulliad oddeutu £554,000. Yr ydym eisoes yn gweithredu ein hymrwymiad yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' drwy ystyried sut i roi, a chostau rhoi, cymorth ychwanegol i fusnesau bach sydd yn cyflawni gwasanaethau hanfodol i gymunedau gwledig.

**Mick Bates:** In view of your earlier commitment to examine extra rate relief, when will you sit down with interested parties to allocate funds to achieve the extra rate relief that you have talked about this morning?

**Mick Bates:** Yng ngoleuni eich hymrwymiad gynharach i archwilio'r cymorth treth ychwanegol, pa bryd y byddwch yn eistedd gyda phartïon â diddordeb i ddyrannu cyllid i gyflawni'r cymorth treth ychwanegol y siaradasoch amdano y bore yma?

**Edwina Hart:** As part our wider consultation on local government finance, we have said that we will consider extending the rural rate relief scheme to cover other types of businesses, such as pubs and petrol stations. There will be a consultation process. We are also consulting on a rate relief scheme to help farmers diversify into wide-ranging non-agricultural activity.

**Edwina Hart:** Fel rhan o'n hymgyngoriad ehangach ar gyllid llywodraeth leol, dywedasom yr ystyriwn ymestyn cynllun cymorth y dreth i ardaloedd gwledig i gwmpasu mathau eraill o fusnesau, megis tafarnau a gorsafoddd petrol. Bydd proses ymgynghori. Yr ydym hefyd yn ymgynghori ar gynllun cymorth y dreth i helpu ffermwyr arallgyfeirio i weithgareddau eang nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag amaethyddiaeth.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you agree that the fact that the transitional rate relief scheme is not available to businesses in Wales that have a rateable value of over £25,000—it is available to such businesses in England—puts those businesses at a huge disadvantage and means that businesses in Wales are threatened as a result of your Government's

**Glyn Davies:** A gytunwch fod y ffaith nad yw'r cynllun cymorth treth trosiannol ar gael i fusnesau yng Nghymru sydd â gwerth trethadwy dros £25,000—mae ar gael i fusnesau o'r fath yn Lloegr—yn rhoi'r busnesau hynny o dan anfantais enfawr ac yn golygu y bygythir busnesau yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i bolisiâu eich Llywodraeth?

policies?

9:45 a.m.

**Edwina Hart:** No.

**Lynne Neagle:** Do you agree, Edwina, that it is not only small businesses in rural areas that are struggling? We face significant challenges in town centres in the south Wales Valleys. That is the message that I have heard from local traders in Pontypool and Blaenavon. Therefore, will you consider measures to promote regeneration in town centres in the Valleys and other urban areas?

**Edwina Hart:** It is important that regeneration happens throughout Wales. While walking through some of the town centres in some of Wales's urban areas it is obvious that they are ripe for regeneration. We must try to get more small businesses active in those areas. It is important that people live in those town centres because, if they do not, we know what could happen in terms of crime and graffiti.

**Elin Jones:** A all y Gweinidog egluro mater sydd yn peri dryswch i'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig ac, yn wir, i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig? Mae'r ddogfen bartneriaeth 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' yn addo £10 miliwn y flwyddyn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer Tir Gofal. Mae eich cyllideb ddrafft yn addo £9 miliwn ychwanegol dros dair blynedd. Pa un sydd yn gywir?

**Edwina Hart:** It is over a three-year period. I will have to consult the partnership document and my budget papers to confirm that. However, I think that it is over three years.

**Edwina Hart:** Na wnaif.

**Lynne Neagle:** A gytunwch, Edwina, nad busnesau bach mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn unig sydd yn ei chael hi'n anodd? Yr ydym yn wynebu heriau sylweddol yng nghanol trefi yng Nghymoedd de Cymru. Dyna'r neges a glywais gan fasnachwyr lleol ym Mhont-y-pŵl ac ym Mlaenafon. Felly, a fyddwch yn ystyried mesurau i hybu adfywio yng nghanol trefi yn y Cymoedd ac mewn ardaloedd trefol eraill?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'n bwysig bod adfywio yn digwydd ledled Cymru. Wrth gerdded drwy ganol rhai trefi mewn rhai o ardaloedd trefol Cymru mae'n amlwg eu bod yn barod i'w hadfywio. Rhaid inni geisio sicrhau bod rhagor o fusnesau bach yn weithredol yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn byw yng nghanol y trefi hynny oherwydd, os na wnant, gwyddom beth allai ddigwydd o ran troseddau a graffiti.

**Elin Jones:** Can the Minister clear a matter that is causing confusion to the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee and, indeed, to the Minister for Rural Affairs? The partnership document 'Putting Wales First' promises an additional £10 million per year for Tir Gofal. Your draft budget promises an additional £9 million over three years. Which is correct?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae dros gyfnod o dair blynedd. Rhaid imi edrych ar y ddogfen bartneriaeth a'm papurau cyllideb i gadarnhau hynny. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai dros tair blynedd ydyw.

### **Datganiad ar Lid yr Ymennydd Statement on Meningitis**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am grateful for the opportunity to make a short statement on a matter of considerable public concern: the sad death from meningitis, over the weekend, of Mrs Morgan, a dinner lady at Ynysboeth

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i wneud datganiad byr ar fater o gryn bryder cyhoeddus: marwolaeth drist Mrs Morgan, goruchwylwraig cinio yn Ysgol y Babanod Ynysboeth yn Aberpennar, o lid yr

Infants School in Mountain Ash.

I am sure that all Members will join me in extending our sympathy to the family. At this stage, the strain of the disease involved has not been identified. It will take several days for that to be confirmed. A four-year-old boy from the same school has also been the victim of meningitis. In his case we know that it was meningitis B. I am pleased to say that I understand that he is making a good recovery.

There are a number of other current cases that do not appear to have any relationship to each other. A young baby girl from the Rhondda, also admitted to hospital, is stable and satisfactory, and soon to be weaned from the ventilator that has helped with breathing difficulties. Meningitis is diagnosed but the strain has not yet been identified. A child from the Aberdare area is a probable case of meningitis but not confirmed, and is doing well in hospital. In addition, a child from Swansea, whose diagnosis is not yet confirmed is on antibiotics and doing well. A student in Swansea was diagnosed with meningitis C about 10 days ago. In all these cases, we are not aware of any vaccine failure.

The experts in Bro Taf Health Authority, which covers the area of Ynysboeth school, cannot say at this stage whether the two cases in the school are linked. However, the health authority is acting in accordance with agreed precautionary procedures and has provided antibiotics for the other children and staff in the school. I know from the reports I have received that some have called for the wider administering of antibiotics. The medical advice on this is quite clear: administering of antibiotics should be limited to those most likely to be at risk. Wider use can become self-defeating because of the possibility of a build-up of resistance and the possibility of allergy to the antibiotic. I understand the concerns of parents who have felt unable to return their children to the school. The health authority is meeting with the parents and listening to their concerns. However, I hope that they will listen to the advice of the medical professionals who are keeping in close touch with the situation.

ymennydd dros y penwythnos.

Yr wyf yn siwr yr ymuna'r holl Aelodau â mi wrth estyn ein cydymdeimlad â'r teulu. Ar hyn o bryd, ni nodwyd pa fath o lid yr ymennydd ydoedd. Bydd yn cymryd nifer o ddiwrnodau cyn y caiff hynny ei gadarnhau. Bu bachgen pedair mlwydd oed o'r un ysgol hefyd yn dioddef o lid yr ymennydd. Yn yr achos hwn gwyddom mai straen B o lid yr ymennydd ydoedd. Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud y deallaf ei fod yn gwella.

Mae nifer o achosion eraill ar hyn o bryd nad ymddengys fod unrhyw berthynas rhyngddynt â'i gilydd. Mae baban bach o'r Rhondda, a dderbyniwyd i'r ysbyty hefyd, yn sefydlog ac yn foddhaol, ac yn fuan caiff ei thynnu oddi ar y gwyntyllwr sydd wedi ei helpu i anadlu. Cafwyd bod llid yr ymennydd arni ond ni nodwyd pa fath eto. Mae plentyn o ardal Aberdâr yn dioddef o lid yr ymennydd o bosibl ond heb ei gadarnhau, ac yn gwneud yn dda yn yr ysbyty. Hefyd, mae plentyn o Abertawe, na chadarnhawyd yr afiechyd eto, ar wrthfotigau ac yn gwneud yn dda. Cafwyd bod straen C o lid yr ymennydd ar fyfyrwr o Abertawe tua 10 diwrnod yn ôl. Yn yr holl achosion hyn, nid ydym yn ymwybodol o unrhyw fethiant o ran brechu.

Ni all yr arbenigwyr yn Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf, sydd yn cynnwys ardal ysgol Ynysboeth, ddweud ar hyn o bryd a oes cysylltiad rhwng y ddau achos yn yr ysgol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r awdurdod iechyd yn gweithredu yn unol â gweithdrefnau rhagofalus y cytunwyd arnynt ac wedi darparu gwrthfotigau ar gyfer y plant a'r staff eraill yn yr ysgol. Gwn o'r adroddiadau a dderbyniais fod rhai wedi galw am ddarparu gwrthfotigau yn ehangach. Mae'r cyngor meddygol ar hyn yn eithaf clir: dylid cyfyngu rhoi gwrthfotigau i'r rheini sydd fwyaf tebygol o fod mewn perygl. Gall defnydd ehangach fod yn hunandrechol oherwydd y posibilrwydd o gryfhau ymwrthedd a phosibilrwydd alergedd i'r gwrthfotig. Deallaf bryderon y rhieni a deimlodd na allent adael i'w plant ddychwelyd i'r ysgol. Mae'r awdurdod iechyd yn cyfarfod â'r rhieni ac yn gwrandao ar eu pryderon. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y byddant yn gwrandao ar gyngor y gweithwyr

meddygol proffesiynol sydd yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r sefyllfa.

Meningitis C vaccination is an important new protection, and approximately 92 per cent of the target population have already received it. That has resulted in a considerable reduction in cases. Unfortunately, there remains no vaccine against meningitis B, and vigilance is essential against the possibility that children are being infected with that disease. Wherever that possibility arises, health authorities will act swiftly in accordance with established guidelines.

Mae brechiad llid yr ymennydd C yn amddiffyniad newydd pwysig, ac eisoes mae tua 92 y cant o'r boblogaeth darged wedi'i gael. O ganlyniad, mae'r achosion wedi lleihau'n sylweddol. Yn anffodus, ni cheir brechiad yn erbyn llid yr ymennydd B o hyd, ac mae gwyliadwriaeth yn hanfodol yn erbyn y posibilrwydd bod plant yn cael eu heintio gan y clefyd hwnnw. Lle bynnag y digwydd y posibilrwydd hwnnw, bydd awdurdodau iechyd yn gweithredu ar frys yn unol â chanllawiau sefydledig.

**David Lloyd:** Croesawn ddatganiad Jane. Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu yn Abertawe. Y dyddiau hyn, yr wyf yn gweithio mewn practis ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Abertawe, lle trawyd y myfyriwr yn sâl 10 niwrnod yn ôl.

**David Lloyd:** We welcome Jane's statement. I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner in Swansea. These days, I work in a practice at the University of Wales Swansea, where the student was taken ill 10 days ago.

Yn naturiol, ar adeg fel hon, mae ein teimladau gyda'r teuluoedd sydd yng nghanol yr achosion hyn. Mae achosion newydd o lid yr ymennydd bob amser yn achosi braw a dychryn ymhlith y dioddefwyr a'r sawl sydd yn eu trin. Mae'r gofal a'r pryder sydd yn deillio o hyn yn hawdd i'w ddeall.

Naturally, at a time like this, our feelings are with the families at the centre of these cases. New cases of meningitis always cause fear and torment to sufferers and those who treat them. The care and the concern that arises from this is easy to understand.

Fel y dywedodd Jane, nid oes brechiad eto yn erbyn straen B o lid yr ymennydd. Mae llid yr ymennydd yn taro'n ysbeidiol ac mae'n fwy cyffredin yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf. Mae angen bod yn wylidwrus ynglŷn â'r symptomau, yn enwedig yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys pen tost drwg iawn, chwydu a brech o smotiau gwaed nad ydynt yn diflannu wrth roi pwysau ar y croen. Mae'r gwar hefyd yn stiff.

As Jane said, there is currently no vaccination against the B strain of meningitis. Meningitis strikes intermittently and is more common during the winter months. Vigilance is needed with regard to the symptoms, especially at this time of year. These include a severe headache, vomiting, and a rash of blood spots that do not disappear when pressure is applied to the skin. The neck is also stiff.

Dyna'r darlun clasurol, ond pan dueddwn i weld achosion yn gynnar, nid yw'r darlun yn glasurol o bell ffordd. Mae'r arwyddion cynnar yn aneglur ac yn anodd i'w dadansoddi gan eu bod yn debyg i symptomau annwyd neu ffliw. Yr her sydd o'n blaenau fel meddygon yw cael y penderfyniad yn iawn bob tro.

That is the classic picture, but when we tend to see cases early, the picture is not classic by a long way. The early signs are unclear and difficult to analyse because they are similar to the symptoms of the common cold or flu. The challenge facing us as doctors is to get the diagnosis right every time.

Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn deall bod brechiad llwyddiannus yn erbyn straen C o lid yr ymennydd. Mae'r mwyafrif o achosion llid yr ymennydd yn dal i gael eu hachosi gan

It is important that everybody understands that there is an effective vaccination against the C strain of meningitis. The majority of cases of meningitis are still caused by the B

straen B, nad oes brechiad eto yn ei erbyn. Y neges yw i bawb fod yn wylriadwrus.

**Christine Chapman:** I thank Jane for her statement. I pass on my deepest condolences to the family of Carol Morgan, the member of staff at Ynysboeth Infants School, who sadly passed away this week. She was a much-loved dinner lady at the school. I am pleased that the two children affected in the Cynon Valley are making a speedy recovery. This week, Abercynon, in my constituency, is a community in shock and in a certain amount of fear. It is a close community and parents and children at the school have been understandably worried at the occurrence of meningitis in the area. The community is looking for reassurances and answers. Reassurances are needed that the meningitis that struck this week will not further endanger the lives of children and answers are needed as to what is the best way to deal with the aftermath of this tragedy.

I attended a meeting with the parents of the schools where, as you said, health officials from Bro Taf Health Authority urged parents to send their children to school as normal and distributed antibiotics to children. Those parents are still understandably concerned and are still unsure about the safety of sending their children to school. Will you join with me, Jane, in reassuring parents that all medical advice points to the fact that the children should be at school? It is the safest place to be at this time and children should not be kept at home. Will you also give further reassurances to the community that the best medical evidence meant that the wholesale distribution of antibiotics to the community and, in particular, to the children at the junior school would not have been appropriate? Evidence shows that that could put the wider community at risk. The situation is very difficult, as you can imagine and as Dai has said. Vigilance remains the key watchword for all parents and any signs of meningitis—we have mentioned a stiff neck, a rash and so on—must be treated with swift action. I ask health authorities and local authorities to help parents to understand how they can be vigilant. Will you continue to commission research into this illness, its effects and how we can do our best to beat it? We need to know more about meningitis and

strain, against which there is no vaccination. The message is for everyone to be vigilant.

**Christine Chapman:** Diolchaf i Jane am ei datganiad. Trosglwyddaf fy nghydymdeimlad dwysaf i deulu Carol Morgan, yr aelod o staff yn Ysgol y Babanod Ynysboeth, ar achlysur trist ei marwolaeth yr wythnos hon. Yr oedd yn oruchwylwraig cinio hoffus iawn. Yr wyf yn falch bod y ddau blentyn yr effeithiwyd arnynt yng Nghwm Cynon yn gwella'n gyflym. Yr wythnos hon, mae Abercynon, yn fy etholaeth, yn gymuned sydd wedi cael ysgytwad ac sydd wedi'i harswydo i raddau. Mae'n gymuned glòs a bu rhieni a phlant yn yr ysgol wrth reswm yn bryderus am achosion o lid yr ymennydd yn yr ardal. Mae'r gymuned yn ceisio sicrwydd ac atebion. Mae angen cadarnhad na fydd yr achos o lid yr ymennydd a gafwyd yr wythnos hon yn peryglu bywydau plant ymhellach ac mae angen atebion i'r ffordd orau i ymdrin â chanlyniad y drychineb hon.

Mynychais gyfarfod gyda rhieni'r ysgolion lle, fel y dywedasoch, yr anogodd swyddogion iechyd o Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf y rhieni i anfon eu plant i'r ysgol fel arfer a dosbarthwyd gwrthfotigau i'r plant. Wrth reswm, mae'r rhieni hynny yn dal yn bryderus ac yn dal yn ansicr ynglŷn â pha mor ddiogel ydyw i anfon eu plant i'r ysgol. A wnewch ymuno â mi, Jane, i sicrhau rhieni bod pob cyngor meddygol yn cyfeirio at y ffaith y dylai'r plant fod yn yr ysgol? Dyna'r lle mwyaf diogel i fod ynddo ar hyn o bryd ac ni ddylid cadw plant gartref. A wnewch chi hefyd sicrhau'r gymuned ymhellach fod y dystiolaeth feddygol orau yn golygu na fyddai dosbarthu gwrthfotigau ar raddfa eang i'r gymuned ac, yn arbennig, i'r plant yn yr ysgol iau wedi bod yn briodol? Dengys dystiolaeth y gallai hynny roi'r gymuned ehangach mewn perygl. Mae'r sefyllfa'n anodd iawn, fel y gallwch ddychmygu ac fel y dywedodd Dai. Bod yn wylriadwrus sydd yn allweddol i bob rhiant a rhaid trin unrhyw arwyddion o lid yr ymennydd—crybwyllwyd gwar stiff, brech ac ati—ar frys. Gofynnaf i awdurdodau iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol helpu rhieni i ddeall sut y gallant fod yn wylriadwrus. A fyddwch yn parhau i gomisiynu ymchwil i'r salwch hwn, ei effeithiau a sut y gallwn wneud ein gorau i'w drechu? Mae angen inni wybod rhagor am lid



how we can beat it. Research will help us to do that, so that we can prevent another community going through what Abercynon is going through this week.

9:55 a.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I am grateful to Dr Dai Lloyd and Christine Chapman for their comments and contributions. I thank Dai Lloyd, as a general practitioner, for alerting the Assembly to how we should be vigilant about the symptoms of meningitis and, particularly in the winter months, about identifying the minor symptoms of meningitis B that can be linked to flu or cold at the start but then develop into more severe symptoms. It is a time of worry and fear for people in the community, the medical profession, healthcare workers and those who work in schools.

I also thank Christine Chapman for her comments. I know that she has been closely involved with this school. The Assembly joins her in extending condolences to the staff and the village community. This has been shattering for the school and the community. We understand the shock and fear that Christine described. Many other Assembly Members have unfortunately been involved in similar situations in their communities over the past few years. We must be vigilant and ensure that as much awareness education as possible emerges through all channels. We discussed this in the Assembly last year, when we updated our management of communicable diseases, particularly in relation to meningitis.

I understand that 22 of the 130 pupils attended the school yesterday, Christine. We hope that more have returned today and that there will be full attendance on Monday. As Christine said, it is the best and safest place to be. I hope that, as the Assembly is raising and discussing this issue, parents in the community will be reassured about the importance of following medical advice. The concerns about resistance and allergy to antibiotics—if it is extended beyond the precautionary arrangements in terms of distributing antibiotics to those children—must be taken on board and understood. I will

yr ymennydd a sut y gallwch ei drechu. Bydd ymchwil yn ein helpu i wneud hynny, fel y gallwn rwystro cymuned arall rhag gorfod mynd drwy'r hyn y mae Abercynon yn mynd drwyddo yr wythnos hon.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Dr Dai Lloyd a Christine Champan am eu sylwadau a'u cyfraniadau. Diolchaf i Dai Lloyd, fel meddyg teulu, am rybuddio'r Cynulliad i fod yn wylidwrus ynghylch symptomau straen B o lid yr ymennydd y gellir ei gysylltu â'r ffliw neu annwyd ar y cychwyn ond yna'n datblygu symptomau mwy difrifol, a hynny'n arbennig yn ystod y gaeaf. Mae'n adeg o bryder ac ofn i bobl yn y gymuned, y proffesiwn meddygol, gweithwyr gofal iechyd a'r rheini sydd yn gweithio mewn ysgolion.

Diolchaf hefyd i Christine Chapman am ei sylwadau. Gwn iddi fod mewn cysylltiad agos â'r ysgol hon. Ymuna'r Cynulliad â hi wrth estyn cydymdeimlad i'r staff a chymuned y pentref. Bu'n ysgytwol i'r ysgol a'r gymuned. Deallwn y sioc a'r ofn a ddisgrifiodd Christine. Mae llawer o Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad yn anffodus wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â sefyllfaoedd tebyg yn eu cymunedau yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd a aeth heibio. Rhaid inni fod yn wylidwrus a sicrhau y codir cymaint o ymwybyddiaeth â phosibl drwy bob cyfrwng. Trafodwyd hyn yn y Cynulliad y llynedd, pan ddiweddarwyd ein dull o reoli clefydau heintus, yn arbennig o ran llid yr ymennydd.

Deallaf mai 22 allan o'r 130 o ddisgyblion a fynychodd yr ysgol ddoe, Christine. Gobeithiwn fod rhagor wedi dychwelyd heddiw ac y bydd pawb yn bresennol ddydd Llun. Fel y dywedodd Christine, dyna'r lle gorau a'r lle mwyaf diogel i fod. Gobeithiaf y bydd rhieni, wrth i'r Cynulliad godi'r mater hwn a'i drafod, yn dawelach eu meddwl ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd dilyn cyngor meddygol. Rhaid ystyried a deall y pryderon am ymwrthedd ac alergedd i wrthfotigau—os caiff ei ymestyn y tu hwnt i'r trefniadau rhagofalus o ran dosbarthu gwrthfotigau i'r plant hynny. Adroddaf yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ar

report back to the Assembly on the research that is being undertaken on meningitis B, which is still a killer in Wales unfortunately. However, at least we can now immunise against meningitis C, which is also a killer. Ninety two per cent of the target population has already been vaccinated. I am grateful for the opportunity to present these issues and I thank Members for their contributions.

**David Melding:** I respectfully offer my sympathy to those affected by this latest outbreak of meningitis. As Members have already said, there is a great fear of this disease in the community because it appears so random and unpredictable. It places parents in an awful dilemma. Although they naturally want to act in the best interests of their children, they are generally confused as to what is the best course of action to take. Therefore, it is essential that the Assembly sends out a clear message of support for the health authority's work in its efforts to advise the public and for the effective precautionary measures that it has taken. We must be clear about what the best advice is for clinical practice.

**Kirsty Williams:** On behalf of the Liberal Democrat group, I extend condolences to the families concerned in the tragic case of the dinner lady and the families of the children who have been affected. We welcome the great success in rolling out the meningitis C vaccine programme. We have overcome initial difficulties with vaccine supplies. However, a small part of the target population remains unvaccinated. When do we hope to make progress on that? What action are the health authorities taking to increase public awareness of the symptoms of meningitis? It is that vigilance that provides the ultimate security for families and individuals. Also, from a layman's point of view, there seems to be a high incidence of meningitis in communities in the south Wales valleys. Will Jane join with Christine Chapman and I in calling for further research into why those communities are so badly affected?

**Geraint Davies:** I join other Members in

yr ymchwil sydd yn cael ei wneud ar straen B o lid yr ymennydd, sydd yn dal i ladd yng Nghymru yn anffodus. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf gallwn bellach frechu yn erbyn straen C o lid yr ymennydd, sydd hefyd yn lladd. Brechwyd 92 y cant o'r boblogaeth darged eisoes. Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyflwyno'r materion hyn a diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau.

**David Melding:** Gyda pharch cydymdeimlaf â'r rheini yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan yr achos diweddaraf hwn o lid yr ymennydd. Fel y dywedodd yr Aelodau eisoes, mae'r gymuned yn ofni'r afiechyd hwn yn fawr iawn gan yr ymddengys mor ddiamcan ac anrhagweladwy. Mae'n rhoi rhieni mewn cyfyng-gyngor ofnadwy. Er eu bod yn naturiol yn dymuno gweithredu er lles gorau eu plant, maent mewn penbleth yn gyffredinol o ran y cam gorau i'w gymryd. Felly, mae'n hanfodol bod y Cynulliad yn cyfleu neges glir o gefnogaeth i waith yr awdurdod iechyd yn ei ymdrechion i gynghori'r cyhoedd ac yn y mesurau rhagofalus effeithiol a gymerodd. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynghylch y cyngor gorau ar gyfer arfer clinigol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Ar ran grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, estynnaf fy nghydymdeimlad i'r teuluoedd dan sylw yn yr achos trychinebus hwn o'r oruchwylwraig cinio a theuluoedd y plant yr effeithiwyd arnynt. Croesawn y llwyddiant ysgubol o gyflawni rhaglen frechu ar gyfer straen C o lid yr ymennydd. Goresgynnwyd anawsterau cychwynnol gyda chyflenwadau brechu. Fodd bynnag, erys rhan fach o'r boblogaeth darged heb ei brechu. Pryd y gallwn obeithio gwneud cynnydd ar hynny? Pa gamau y mae'r awdurdodau iechyd yn eu cymryd i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd o symptomau llid yr ymennydd? Yr wyliadwriaeth honno sydd yn cynnig y diogelwch eithaf i deuluoedd ac unigolion. Hefyd, o safbwynt y dyn cyffredin, ymddengys fod yr achosion aml o lid yr ymennydd mewn cymunedau yng nghymoedd de Cymru yn uchel. A wnaiff Jane ymuno â Christine Chapman a minnau i alw am ragor o ymchwil i'r rheswm pam yr effeithir mor wael ar y cymunedau hynny?

**Geraint Davies:** Ymunaf â'r Aelodau eraill i

expressing sympathy to the family, the school and the community as a whole. We have had enough of meningitis in the Valleys. We should undertake some research to find out why it occurs in our communities in particular. I also congratulate Bro Taf Health Authority in instigating precautionary measures so swiftly at Ynysboeth school. That is to be welcomed. On the incident in the Rhondda, I congratulate the parents, who were so vigilant with that particular case. They took their daughter to the surgery, then to Llwynypia hospital and then in the car to the University Hospital of Wales, Heath, because I understand that there was no ambulance available. I am glad to say that that baby is stable and improving. It proves that we must be vigilant at all times and I join Kirsty in asking you when will we have the 100 per cent immunisation for meningitis C?

**Jane Hutt:** As David, Kirsty and Geraint stated, clarity is vital. The health authority has acted swiftly and has also built on our work to revise the guidelines on dealing with meningitis scares and incidents of meningitis, which was revised last year. This is a concern and a matter for the health authority and the local authority, and they have worked together closely on these incidents over the last week or so. The health authority took a lead and I am grateful for the comments that have been made about Bro Taf Health Authority's constructive role in this respect.

On the meningitis C campaign, GPs are now immunising those young people or children who were not vaccinated during the first stages, or who perhaps were not able to be vaccinated when they were treating their school or community. That also applies to students. In Swansea, students who did not take advantage of the meningitis C vaccination prior to entry are being encouraged to take advantage of it in their first year. We must ensure that our campaign to encourage parents and students to come forward continues in order to reach that 100 per cent for which Geraint and Kirsty rightly called. We need to raise the profile of picking up on those who fell through for one reason or another from the initial target campaign, and that will be very much through primary

fynegi cymdymdeimlad â'r teulu, yr ysgol a'r gymuned gyfan. Cawsom ddigon ar lid yr ymennydd yn y Cymoedd. Dylem ymgymryd â rhywfaint o ymchwil i ganfod pam ei fod yn digwydd yn ein cymunedau ni yn arbennig. Hoffwn longyfarch Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf hefyd am gychwyn mesurau rhagofalus mor gyflym yn ysgol Ynysboeth. Rhaid croesawu hynny. O ran yr achos yn y Rhondda, hoffwn longyfarch y rhieni, a oedd mor wylidwrus yn yr achos arbennig hwnnw. Aethant â'i merch i'r feddygfa, yna i ysbyty Llwynypia ac yna yn y car i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru, y Mynydd Bychan, am nad oedd ambiwlans ar gael yn ôl a ddeallaf. Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud bod y baban yn sefydlog ac yn gwella. Mae'n profi bod rhaid inni fod yn wylidwrus bob amser ac ymunaf â Kirsty i ofyn ichi pryd y byddwn yn cael brechu 100 y cant ar gyfer straen C o lid yr ymennydd?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y datganodd David, Kirsty a Geraint, mae eglurder yn hanfodol. Gweithredodd yr awdurdod iechyd yn gyflym a hefyd adeiladodd ar ein gwaith i ddiwygio'r canllawiau wrth ymdrin ag achosion brawychus o lid yr ymennydd, a ddiwygiwyd y llynedd. Mae hwn yn bryder ac yn fater i'r awdurdod iechyd a'r awdurdod lleol, a gweithiasant yn agos gyda'i gilydd ar yr achosion hyn yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf. Rhoddodd yr awdurdod iechyd arweiniad ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd am rôl adeiladol Awdurdod Iechyd Bro Taf o safbwynt hyn.

O ran yr ymgyrch straen C o lid yr ymennydd, mae meddygon teulu erbyn hyn yn imiwneiddio'r bobl ifanc neu blant nad oedd modd eu brechu pan oeddent yn trin eu hysgol neu gymuned. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i fyfyrwyr. Yn Abertawe, anogir myfyrwyr na fanteisiodd ar y brechiad yn erbyn straen C o lid yr ymennydd cyn mynd yno i fanteisio arno yn ystod eu blwyddyn gyntaf. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr ymgyrch i annog rhieni a myfyrwyr i ddod ymlaen yn parhau er mwyn cyrraedd y 100 y cant hwnnw y galwodd Geraint a Kirsty amdano yn gyfiawn. Mae angen inni godi proffil y gwaith o ddod o hyd i'r rheini a fethodd ag ymateb i'r ymgyrch darged gyntaf am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd, a gwneir hynny drwy ofal sylfaenol a meddygaeth gyffredinol.

care and general practice.

Geraint, you described how parents in the Rhondda were able to save their child through their swift action. We must ensure that the information that we provide is updated in terms of how parents should react, how schools should be vigilant and how communities can be aware. Perhaps I can follow this up to see how we can ensure that that information, in the form of booklets and through all our health awareness and health promotion workers in our community, this is at the forefront so that vigilance is maintained in our communities. That also applies to the research. I will undertake to provide the Assembly, perhaps initially in the Library, with all the research that has been undertaken into meningitis B, and also whether there is research in relation to particular areas where it appears to be more prevalent, such as the south Wales valleys.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Do you agree that there is also a need to raise awareness among mature students, who may be parents themselves, of the wisdom of protecting themselves and, therefore, their families as well?

**Jane Hutt:** That is a good point, Gwenda, and we will ensure that that is also fed through to the health authorities.

Geraint, fe ddisgrifiasoch sut y llwyddodd rhieni yn y Rhondda i arbed eu plentyn drwy weithredu ar frys. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr wybodaeth a ddarparwn wedi'i ddiweddarau o ran sut y dylai rhieni ymateb, sut y dylai ysgolion fod yn wylidwrus a sut y dylai cymunedau fod yn ymwybodol. Efallai y gallaf fynd ar ôl hyn i weld sut y gallwn sicrhau bod yr wybodaeth honno, ar ffurf llyfrynnau a thrwy ymwybyddiaeth iechyd a hybu iechyd yn ein cymuned, yn flaenoriaeth fel y cynhelir gwyliadwriaeth yn ein cymunedau. Mae hynny hefyd yn berthnasol i'r ymchwil. Ymgymeraf i ddarparu ar gyfer y Cynulliad, yn y Llyfrgell i gychwyn o bosibl, yr holl ymchwil a wnaethpwyd ynglŷn â straen B o lid yr ymennydd, a hefyd a wneir ymchwil mewn perthynas ag ardaloedd arbennig lle yr ymddengys yn fwy cyffredin, fel cymoedd de Cymru.

**Gwenda Thomas:** A gytnwch hefyd fod angen codi ymwybyddiaeth ymhlith myfyrwyr hŷn, a all fod yn rhieni eu hunain, o ddoethineb diogelu eu hunain ac, felly, eu teuluoedd hefyd?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt da, Gwenda, a sicrhawn y caiff y neges honno hefyd ei hanfon i'r awdurdodau iechyd.

### Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Rod Richards:** Pwynt o drefn. Hoffwn gael arweiniad gennych, Lywydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.34, sydd yn ymwneud â'r amser y mae'n rhaid i Aelodau cyffredin y Cynulliad hwn aros am atebion ysgrifenedig i gwestiynau. Ar 17 Hydref, cyflwynais gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, Chwaraeon a'r Gymraeg, ac ar 20 Hydref cyflwynais gwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn dal i aros am atebion i fwyafrif y cwestiynau hyn. Ai esiampl arall yw hyn o drahauster y Cabinet yn dilyn y trahauster a welsom ddydd Mawrth gan y Prif Weinidog pan ruthrodd drwy ddatganiad mewn modd na welais erioed o'r blaen?

**Andrew Davies:** I am cited on these issues. I

**Rod Richards:** Point of order. I would like your guidance, Presiding Officer, under Standing Order No. 6.34, which deals with the time that ordinary Members of this Assembly must wait for written answers to questions. On 17 October, I tabled questions to the Minister for Culture, Sport and the Welsh Language, and on 20 October I tabled questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services. I am still waiting for answers to most of these questions. Is this another example of the Cabinet's arrogance following the arrogance shown on Tuesday by the First Minister when he rushed through a statement in a way that I have never witnessed before?

**Andrew Davies:** Cyfeiriwyd y materion hyn

will consult my colleagues and find out what the situation is and report back to Rod.

ataf. Ymgynghoraf â'm cyd-Aelodau i weld beth yw'r sefyllfa ac adrodd yn ôl i Rod.

10:05 a.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, I endorse the comments that have been made. Even when we receive answers, the date for answering them is stated as being five days after they were submitted. Therefore, if those answers are passed on to constituents, that date may give them the impression that the delay is the fault of our offices.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cefnogaf y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd. Hyd yn oed pan dderbyniwn atebion, mynegir y dylid eu hateb ymhen pum niwrnod ar ôl eu cyflwyno. Felly, os trosglwyddir yr atebion hynny i'n hetholwyr, gall y dyddiad hwnnw roi'r argraff iddynt mai ein swyddfeydd ni sydd ar fai am yr oedi.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, cyflwynais gyfres o gwestiynau ar Estyn ym Medi ar ôl i ni ddychwelyd o doriad yr haf. Bu'n rhaid i mi aros tan 10 Tachwedd am yr atebion. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol. Yn ogystal, mae amharodrwydd ar adegau i ddarparu atebion clir a chyflawn a hoffwn wybod a yw'n ddyletswydd ar Weinidogion i roi atebion cyflawn i gwestiynau Aelodau?

**Cynog Dafis:** Further to that point of order, I tabled a series of questions about Estyn in September after we returned from the summer recess. I had to wait until 10 November for the answers. That is not acceptable. Furthermore, there is an unwillingness to provide clear and comprehensive answers and I would like to know if it is the Ministers' responsibility to give full answers to Members' questions?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Rod Richards am roi gwybodaeth i mi ar hyn. Mae gofyn cwestiynau llafar ac ysgrifenedig yn gyfrifoldeb ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad fel y mae darparu atebion yn gyfrifoldeb ar Weinidogion. Nid mater i'r sawl sydd yn llywyddu yw cynnwys yr atebion, ond y mae'r parodrwydd i rannu gwybodaeth yn briodol ac yn gyson â Rheolau Sefydlog ac, yn arbennig, yn gyson â'n canllawiau a'n protocol ynghylch rhannu gwybodaeth. Mae'n briodol bod atebion yn cynnwys cymaint o wybodaeth ag sydd yn ymarferol bosibl.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Rod Richards for informing me of this. Asking questions in oral and written form is the responsibility of Assembly Members in the same way as providing answers is the responsibility of Ministers. The content of the answers is not a matter for the person in the Chair, but the willingness to share information is appropriate and consistent with Standing Orders and, specifically, consistent with our guidance and protocol on sharing information. It is appropriate that answers contain as much information as is practicably possible.

Mae pwysau ymarferol ar swyddogion i ddarparu atebion oherwydd pwysau gwaith a byddem i gyd yn cydnabod hynny. Er hynny, ni fyddwn yn cymeradwyo defnyddio pwysau gwaith fel rheswm i beidio ag ateb cwestiynau yn amserol pan fo hynny'n bosibl. Fy anhawster i yw gwahaniaethu rhwng pwysau gwaith yn arwain at arafwch yn y drefn, ac amharodrwydd i ateb oherwydd natur y cwestiwn. Nid fy nyletswydd i yw dyfarnu ar y mater hwn. Rhoddwyd datganiad clir gan y Trefnydd a bydd yn ateb ymhellach i Aelodau ar hyn.

There are practical pressures on officials to provide answers because of pressure of work, and we would all recognise that. However, I would not approve of using pressure of work as a reason not to answer questions in a timely way whenever that is possible. My difficulty is to differentiate between pressure of work leading to delays in the system, and unwillingness to provide answers because of the nature of the question. It is not my duty to rule on this matter. The Minister for Assembly Business gave a clear statement and he will respond further to Members on this.

**Nick Bourne:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 18 on the Record and further to the debate on the partnership Government's intentions regarding business in the Chamber. In Plenary on 21 September, the First Minister referred to the waiting list position that was, at that stage, unpublished, and claimed that I should have known about it. He apologised to me after Plenary, stating that his comment was inadvertent and he suggested that I raise it today so that he would be able to correct the statement and apologise. In his absence, perhaps, the Minister for Assembly Business can do so.

**Andrew Davies:** As Nick said, Rhodri was apologetic about this because when he made his statement, he was not aware that the figures had not been published. He did not mean any discourtesy to Members and wishes to place his apologies on record.

**The Presiding Officer:** I welcome that statement on behalf of the First Minister, who has apologised to me and the Assembly for not being present today because he is attending an important regional conference in Barcelona.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 6.3 on question time in Plenary. I seek clarification on our responsibilities as individuals not to make statements that are factually incorrect or possibly slanderous and could be liable to action from other bodies. For example, in a question to Edwina Hart earlier, Helen Mary stated that Cardiff City and County Council had closed New Employ. That is not factually correct. Will you advise us on our responsibilities here because we are not protected by parliamentary privilege and must, therefore, be careful about what we say?

**The Presiding Officer:** We are protected by parliamentary privilege.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Further to that point of order, I understand that we are protected by privilege, but on this occasion, I did not need to use it because the offices are closed, the service is not ongoing—

**Nick Bourne:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 18 ar y Cofnod ac ymhellach i'r ddatl ar fwriadau'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth o safbwynt busnes yn y Siambr. Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 21 Medi, cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at sefyllfa'r rhestr aros a oedd, ar y pryd, heb ei chyhoeddi, a honnodd y dylwn fod wedi gwybod amdani. Ymddiheurodd imi ar ôl y Cyfarfod Llawn, gan fynegi bod ei sylw yn esgeulus ac awgrymodd imi ei godi heddiw fel y gallai gywiro'r datganiad ac ymddiheuro. Yn ei absenoldeb, efallai y gall y Trefnydd wneud hynny.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedodd Nick, yr oedd Rhodri yn ymddiheuro am hyn oherwydd pan wnaeth ei ddatganiad, nid oedd yn ymwybodol nad oedd y ffigurau wedi eu cyhoeddi. Nid oedd yn bwriadu bod yn anghwrtais i'r Aelodau a dymuna gofnodi ei ymddiheuriadau.

**Y Llywydd:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwnnw ar ran y Prif Weinidog, a ymddiheurodd imi a'r Cynulliad am beidio â bod yn bresennol heddiw oherwydd ei fod yn mynychu cynhadledd ranbarthol bwysig yn Barcelona.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 ar amser cwestiynau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Ceisïaf eglurhad ar ein cyfrifoldebau fel unigolion i beidio â gwneud datganiadau sydd yn ffeithiol anghywir neu o bosibl yn enllibus ac a allai fod yn atebol i weithredu gan gyrff eraill. Er enghraifft, mewn cwestiwn i Edwina Hart yn gynharach, mynegodd Helen Mary fod Dinas a Chyngor Sir Caerdydd wedi cau New Employ. Nid yw hynny'n ffeithiol wir. A wnewch ein cynghori ar ein cyfrifoldebau yma gan nad yw braint seneddol yn ein diogelu a rhaid inni, felly, fod yn ofalus am yr hyn a ddywedwn?

**Y Llywydd:** Cawn ein diogelu gan fraint seneddol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, deallaf y cawn ein diogelu gan fraint, ond ar yr achlysur hwn, nid oedd angen imi ei defnyddio oherwydd fod y swyddfeyd ar gau, nid yw'r gwasanaeth yn parhau—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sorry, but—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'n flin gennyf, ond—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not an opportunity to continue a question that we heard earlier by other means. This should be a point of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cyfle yw hwn i barhau cwestiwn a glywsom yn gynharach drwy ffordd arall. Dylai hwn fod yn bwynt o drefn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I accept that, but I make the point that I was asked to raise this question by residents of Butetown, who believe that it is closed—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Derbyniaf hynny, ond gwnaf y pwynt y gofynnwyd imi godi'r cwestiwn hwn gan drigolion Butetown, sydd yn credu ei fod wedi cau—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members will not use points of order in a disorderly fashion. I have discovered a growing tendency to do so over recent weeks, as we approach Christmas.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chaiff Aelodau ddefnyddio pwyntiau o drefn mewn modd anhrefnus. Darganfyddais dueddiad cynyddol i wneud hynny yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, wrth i'r Nadolig agosáu.

On privilege, we are covered by an equivalent of parliamentary privilege under the Government of Wales Act 1998. However, there have been many cases in the past when Members have been taken to task for making allegations; therefore, there is a responsibility on all Members to ensure that allegations are not made, either against other Members in this Chamber or against outside bodies. I will check the Record and return to this point, if necessary.

O ran braint, fe'n cwmpesir gan fraint gyfwerth â braint seneddol o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd nifer o achosion yn y gorffennol pan geryddwyd Aelodau am wneud honiadau; felly, mae cyfrifoldeb ar bob Aelod i sicrhau na wneir honiadau, naill ai yn erbyn Aelodau eraill yn y Siambr hon neu yn erbyn cyrff allanol. Byddaf yn gwirio'r Cofnod a dychwelyd at y pwynt hwn, os bydd angen.

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru (Penodi) 2000 Approval of the Children's Commissioner for Wales (Appointments) Regulations 2000**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Children's Commissioner for Wales (Appointment) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru (Penodi) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000.*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Order, the Children's Commissioner for Wales (Appointment) Regulations 2000, laid in the*

*(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ar Orchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru (Penodi) 2000, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7*

*Table Office on 7 November 2000;*

*(b) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000.*

These appointment regulations are the second piece of Assembly legislation to come forward under the Care Standards Act 2000 in respect of the office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The establishment of the post of commissioner is one of the Assembly's flagship policies and good progress is being made in the recruitment and selection process. Interviews are scheduled to take place on 4 December and we hope to announce a formal appointment in Plenary before Christmas.

Assembly legislation is necessary to enable the formal appointment to be made to set the terms of office and provide for circumstances in which the commissioner ceases to hold office, or may be removed from office. The regulations provide for the formal appointment to be made by the First Minister, which reflects the need for a clear and direct line of accountability in the making of appointments to and removal from public office. In line with the recommendations of the Health and Social Services Committee, the regulations provide for the appointment to be based on consensus and consultation. They stipulate that the First Minister must take into account the advice of any committee established to advise on appointment, the views of children and those of the formal selection panel on candidates interviewed. The Health and Social Services Committee's recommendations on the desirability of a fixed period of office to maximise the independent operation of the office has also been followed as the legislation establishes a seven-year term of office and no eligibility for reappointment.

The regulations also seek to underpin the independence of the office by reflecting the Committee's recommendations on the grounds for removal from office. The First Minister may relieve the commissioner of office prior to the expiry of the term of office only at the request of the commissioner, on the ground of misbehaviour or if the

*Tachwedd 2000;*

*(b) yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000.*

Y rheoliadau penodi hyn yw'r ail ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad i'w gynnig o dan Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000 mewn perthynas â swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Mae sefydlu swydd y comisiynydd yn un o bolisiau arloesol y Cynulliad a gwneir cynnydd da yn y broses recriwtio a dewis. Trefnwyd y cyfweiliadau ar gyfer 4 Rhagfyr a gobeithiwn gyhoeddi penodiad ffurfiol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn y Nadolig.

Mae deddfwriaeth y Cynulliad yn angenrheidiol er mwyn galluogi gwneud penodiad ffurfiol i osod telerau'r swydd a darparu ar gyfer amgylchiadau pan fydd y comisiynydd yn rhoi'r gorau i ddal y swydd, neu efallai'n cael ei symud o'r swydd. Mae'r rheoliadau yn darparu dull er mwyn i Brif Weinidog Cymru wneud y penodiad ffurfiol, sydd yn adlewyrchu'r angen am linell glir ac uniongyrchol o atebolrwydd wrth wneud penodiadau i swyddi cyhoeddus a symud pobl o'r swyddi. Yn unol ag argymhellion y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae'r rheoliadau yn darparu dull er mwyn i'r penodiad fod yn seiliedig ar gonsensws ac ymgynghoriad. Mynnant fod y Prif Weinidog yn ystyried cyngor unrhyw bwyllgor a sefydlwyd i roi cyngor ar y penodiad, barn plant a barn y panel dethol ffurfiol ar yr ymgeiswyr a gyfwelir. Dilynwyd hefyd argymhellion y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar fantais cyfnod penodedig i'r swydd er mwyn sicrhau i'r eithaf y gweithredir y swyddfa yn annibynnol gan fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn sefydlu tymor o saith mlynedd yn y swydd heb ryddid i ailbenodi.

Ceisio'r rheoliadau hefyd ategu natur annibynnol y swydd drwy adlewyrchu argymhellion y Pwyllgor ar y rhesymau dros symud rhywun o'r swydd. Dim ond ar gais y comisiynydd, ar sail camymddygiad, neu os yw'r comisiynydd yn analluog, oherwydd diffyg corfforol neu feddyliol, i gyflawni'r dyletswydd y gall Prif Weinidog Cymru



commissioner is incapable, by virtue of physical or mental infirmity, of performing his or her functions.

In summary, the regulations seek to uphold the independence of the Children's Commissioner while recognising the need for clear and direct line of accountability in the making of a public appointment and removal from public office.

**Helen Mary Jones:** In warmly welcoming this Order and commending it to the Assembly, I will make brief remarks about the process of appointment that this Order sets out.

Many of us who campaigned hard for the Assembly did so in the hope that, not only would it create different policies for the people of Wales, but that it would also do things differently. The Assembly has been criticised for not doing enough of that and I share some of that frustration. However, this Order and the process that it sets out is a positive example of what can be done, and is perhaps, an example of the Assembly at its best because this is a radical policy, implemented innovatively.

A broadly representative group of children and young people from all over Wales convened by Children in Wales has already met in a conference and has selected 15 of their number to participate in the process of appointing the commissioner. This group will meet on 2 December and, in consultation with experienced staff, will design a process to enable them to test the candidates for the post. The candidates will spend the following working day with children and young people. We will then send their views on each candidate to the Committee—we are not asking them to make a selection because that would be inappropriate—and they will send us two representatives to advise and inform us on the formal process.

10:15 a.m.

This radical and innovative process has not been easy to set up. It presents enormous challenges to all of us involved: politicians, officials, children's organisations and above

ryddhau'r comisiynydd o'i swydd cyn i dymor y swydd ddod i ben.

Yn gryno, ceisia'r rheoliadau gadarnhau annibyniaeth y Comisiynydd Plant tra'n cydnabod yr angen am linell glir ac uniongyrchol o atebolrwydd wrth wneud penodiad cyhoeddus a symud rhywun o swydd gyhoeddus.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Wrth groesawu'r Gorchymyn hwn yn frwd a'i gymeradwyo i'r Cynulliad, gwnaf sylwadau byr ar y broses benodi a nodir gan y Gorchymyn hwn.

Gwnaeth llawer ohonom a ymgyrchodd yn galed dros y Cynulliad hynny yn y gobaith y byddai, nid yn unig yn creu polisiau gwahanol ar gyfer pobl Cymru, ond y byddai hefyd yn gwneud pethau yn wahanol. Beirniadwyd y Cynulliad am beidio â gwneud digon o hynny a rhannaf rywfaint o'r rhwystredigaeth honno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gorchymyn hwn a'r broses a noda yn enghraifft gadarnhaol o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud, ac mae, o bosibl, yn enghraifft o'r Cynulliad ar ei orau gan fod hwn yn bolisi radical, wedi'i weithredu'n flaengar.

Mae grŵp cynrychioliadol bras o blant a phobl ifanc o bob cwr o Gymru a alwyd ynghyd gan Blant yng Nghymru eisoes wedi cyfarfod mewn cynhadledd ac wedi dethol 15 o'u plith i gyfranogi yn y broses o benodi'r comisiynydd. Bydd y grŵp hwn yn cyfarfod ar 2 Rhagfyr ac, mewn ymgyngoriad â staff profiadol, yn cynllunio proses i'w galluogi i brofi'r ymgeiswyr am y swydd. Bydd yr ymgeiswyr yn treulio'r diwrnod gwaith canlynol gyda phlant a phobl ifanc. Byddwn wedyn yn anfon eu sylwadau ar bob ymgeisydd i'r Pwyllgor—ni ofynnwn iddynt ddewis oherwydd byddai hynny'n amhriodol—a byddant yn anfon dau gynrychiolydd i'n cynghori a'n hysbysu ar y broses ffurfiol.

Ni fu'r broses radical a blaengar hon yn hawdd i'w sefydlu. Mae'n cyflwyno sawl her enfawr i bawb ohonom sydd yn ymwneud â'r mater: gwleidyddion, swyddogion,

all, perhaps, the children and young people. I am confident that we will get it right and that we will make a better appointment because of it.

This is a radical departure from the bad old Conservative days of public appointments: the pat on the shoulder to the great and the good, as they are usually referred to. I would be more likely to call them the usual suspects. It is an excellent example of an open process and—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I would be happy to take an intervention, but all this muttering is annoying. If you were in my class when I was a schoolteacher, I would have sent you out, starting with David Davies.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members are only removed by an Assembly vote.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I only said if they were in my class, Llywydd. It is entirely in your hands.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Willingly to you, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** You cannot be as grateful that I am not in your class as I am that you are not my teacher.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I would not be too sure of that. It is probably about 50:50. To bring us back to the serious issues, this is an excellent example of an open process that sets service users at the heart of an appointment that affects them. It is a process of which I and other members of the appropriate Committees have been proud to be a part. The Assembly should be proud of the process and I hope that they will be proud of the outcome. I hope that we will see the courage that the Government of Wales has shown over this innovative process replicated in other policy areas. It is in sharp contrast to the mouse-like timidity and numbing inertia that we see too often in other fields.

sefydliadau plant ac uwchlaw pawb, o bosibl, y plant a'r bobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn hyderus y byddwn yn llwyddo ac y gwnawn benodiad gwell o'r herwydd.

Mae hwn yn newid cyfeiriad radical o'r hen ddyddiau Ceidwadol o benodiadau cyhoeddus: curo cefn y mawrion a'r parchus, fel y cyfeirir atynt fel arfer. Byddwn yn fwy tebygol o gyfeirio atynt fel 'yr un hen rai'. Mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o broses agored—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Byddwn yn hapus i gymryd ymyriad, ond peth diflas yw'r holl fwmian hwn. Pe baech yn fy nosbarth pan oeddwn yn athrawes, byddwn wedi eich anfon allan o'r dosbarth, gan ddechrau gyda David Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond drwy bleidlais y Cynulliad y symudir Aelodau allan.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dim ond pe baent yn fy nosbarth a ddywedais, Lywydd. Mae yn eich dwylo chi yn llwyr.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ar bob cyfrif, i chi, Alun.

**Alun Cairns:** Ni allwch fod mor ddiolchgar nad wyf yn eich dosbarth ag yr wyf i nad chi yw fy athrawes.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni fyddwn mor siŵr o hynny. Tua 50:50 yw hi, mae'n debyg. I ddychwelyd at y materion difrifol, mae hon yn enghraifft ragorol o broses agored sydd yn gosod defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth wrth wraidd penodiad sydd yn effeithio arnynt. Mae'n broses yr wyf i ac aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgorau priodol wedi bod yn falch o fod yn rhan ohoni. Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn falch o'r broses a gobeithiaf y byddant yn falch o'r canlyniad. Gobeithiaf y gwelwn y dewrder a ddangosodd Llywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn â'r broses flaengar hon yn cael ei haildrodd mewn meysydd polisiâu eraill. Mae'n hollol groes i'r diffyg hyder simsan a'r syrthni marwaidd a welir yn rhy aml o lawer mewn meysydd eraill.

I end my contribution by making a direct appeal to the Westminster Government and echo the words of the Cabinet. Rhodri Morgan and Jane Hutt assure us that they are getting the message. The Children's Commissioner is one of the best things that this National Assembly has done. Tony Blair, if you have any commitment to making devolution work and to the good name of this Assembly, give us the legislative time to complete this task.

**Kirsty Williams:** I welcome the Order that the Minister for Health and Social Services has brought forward. It accurately reflects the desires of the Health and Social Services Committee and its joint working with the former Pre-16 Education Committee in terms of the role of the Children's Commissioner and the important appointment process that bends over backwards to involve as many young people, children and organisations that represent them, as far as possible.

**David Melding:** I hope that the Executive will not feel undermined by my warm commendation of its work in this area. I am grateful to the Minister for Health and Social Services and the First Minister for their close attention to the deliberations of the Health and Social Services Committee. This Order reflects the spirit of those deliberations, in particular the fact that the commissioner will serve a non-renewable long-term 7 years. This measure will greatly strengthen the independence of the Children's Commissioner, which is the most vital element of this post for its future function. I warmly recommend this Order to the Assembly.

**Jane Hutt:** The Assembly should be proud of its achievements. I was recently invited to Northern Ireland to speak about our work on the Children's Commissioner and on play and our development of a children and young people framework. When you travel and hear people commenting on how much we are doing in Wales and that we are streets ahead of the rest of the United Kingdom and Northern and Southern Ireland, I feel proud to return in the knowledge that the Assembly is doing something different, as Helen Mary

Terfynaf fy nghyfraniad drwy wneud apêl uniongyrchol i Lywodraeth San Steffan ac adleisiaf eiriau'r Cabinet. Mae Rhodri Morgan a Jane Hutt yn ein sicrhau eu bod yn cael y neges. Y Comisiynydd Plant yw un o'r pethau gorau a wnaeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn. Tony Blair, os oes gennych unrhyw ymrwymiad i wneud i ddatganoli weithio ac ymrwymiad i enw da y Cynulliad hwn, rhowch inni'r amser deddfu i gwblhau'r dasg hon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf y Gorchymyn a gyflwynwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Adlewyrcha'n gywir ddymuniadau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r cydweithio rhyngddo â'r cyn Bwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn nhermau rôl y Comisiynydd Plant a'r broses benodi bwysig sydd yn gwneud ei gorau glas i gynnwys cynifer o bobl ifanc, plant a sefydliadau sydd yn eu cynrychioli, cyn belled ag y bo modd.

**David Melding:** Gobeithiaf na theimla'r Weithrediaeth ei bod yn cael ei thanseilio gan fy nghymeradwyaeth gynnes o'i gwaith yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac i'r Prif Weinidog am eu sylw manwl i drafodaethau'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Adlewyrcha'r Gorchymyn hwn natur y trafodaethau hynny, yn arbennig y ffaith y bydd y comisiynydd yn gwasanaethu 7 blynedd tymor hir na ellir ei adnewyddu. Bydd y mesur hwn yn cryfhau annibyniaeth y Comisiynydd Plant yn fawr, sef elfen fwyaf hanfodol y swydd hon o ran ei swyddogaeth yn y dyfodol. Cymeradwyaf y Gorchymyn hwn yn frwd i'r Cynulliad.

**Jane Hutt:** Dylai'r Cynulliad fod yn falch o'i gyflawniadau. Fe'm gwahoddwyd i Ogledd Iwerddon yn ddiweddar i siarad am ein gwaith ar y Comisiynydd Plant ac ar chwarae a'n gwaith yn datblygu fframwaith plant a phobl ifanc. Wrth i rywun deithio a chlywed pobl yn gwneud sylwadau ar gymaint a wnawn yng Nghymru a'n bod ymhell ar y blaen i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig a Gogledd a De Iwerddon, teimlaf falchder o ddychwelyd gan wybod bod y Cynulliad yn gwneud rhywbeth gwahanol, fel y dywedodd

said. It is a positive example of what can be done and let us all be proud of it.

However, we must await the time when we make this appointment. The few weeks ahead of us are a time of planning. We must think of those children and young people who will be part of this process of helping us make a public appointment. It is a serious responsibility for them. They have already spent a day—as Helen Mary Jones said—considering their role and electing and choosing a representative group of young people from all parts of Wales, including looked-after young people who have experienced the care system. Let us remember the ‘Lost in Care’ report and the fact that the first two recommendations were that we should have an independent children’s commissioner. That is why it is important that the voices of looked-after children as well as the voices of other young people are heard in Wales. It will be a radical new way of making public appointments. I have sought to ensure consensus and full consultation every step of the way. This is about inclusive politics for the good of our children and young people. That is why it is critical that we stick together—and we have done so—for the credibility of this appointment.

I thank Helen Mary Jones, Kirsty Williams and David Melding for their remarks. I also thank Lorraine Barrett, who is a member of the appointment panel, which represents the views of the former Pre-16 Education Committee as well as the Health and Social Services Committee. More than one committee came together to gather evidence on the establishment of the Children’s Commissioner.

Two independent advisers will join us on the day following the weekend when the young people will be putting the candidates through an interesting experience. It is important that that process is part of the appointment. We will have two young people joining us at the formal interviewing appointment process on the Monday. It is important that the young people will be there as part of the team. They will also be asking questions. It is breaking new ground. I know, David, that you have

Helen Mary. Mae’n enghraifft gadarnhaol o’r hyn y gellir ei wneud a gadewch inni i gyd fod yn falch ohono.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni aros am yr adeg pan wnawn y penodiad hwn. Mae’r ychydig wythnosau o’n blaenau yn adeg i gynllunio. Rhaid inni feddwl am y plant a’r bobl ifanc hynny a fydd yn rhan o’r broses hon o’n helpu i wneud penodiad cyhoeddus. Mae’n gyfrifoldeb dwys arnynt. Treuliasant ddiwrnod eisoes—fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones—yn ystyried eu rôl ac yn ethol a dewis grŵp cynrychioliadol o bobl ifanc o bob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys pobl ifanc y gofelir amdanynt sydd wedi cael profiad o’r system gofal. Rhaid inni gofio am yr adroddiad ‘Ar Goll mewn Gofal’ a’r ffaith mai’r ddau argymhelliad cyntaf oedd y dylem gael comisiynydd plant annibynnol. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig clywed lleisiau plant y gofelir amdanynt yn ogystal â lleisiau pobl ifanc eraill yng Nghymru. Bydd yn ffordd newydd radical o wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus. Ceisiais sicrhau consensws ac ymgynghoriad llawn bob cam o’r ffordd. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth gynhwysol er lles ein plant a’n pobl ifanc. Dyna pam ei bod yn holl bwysig inni fod yn unol—a gwnaethpwyd hynny—er hygredd y penodiad hwn.

Diolchaf i Helen Mary Jones, Kirsty Williams a David Melding am eu sylwadau. Diolchaf hefyd i Lorraine Barrett, sydd yn aelod o’r panel penodi, sydd yn cynrychioli barn y cyn Bwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn ogystal â’r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Daeth mwy nag un pwyllgor at ei gilydd i gasglu tystiolaeth ar sefydlu’r Comisiynydd Plant.

Bydd dau ymgynghorydd annibynnol yn ymuno â ni ar y diwrnod yn dilyn y penwythnos pan fydd y bobl ifanc yn tywys yr ymgeiswyr drwy brofiad diddorol. Mae’n bwysig bod y broses honno yn rhan o’r penodiad. Bydd dau berson ifanc yn ymuno â ni yn y broses benodi ffurfiol ar y dydd Llun. Mae’n bwysig y bydd y bobl ifanc yno yn rhan o’r tîm. Byddant hefyd yn gofyn cwestiynau. Mae’n torri tir newydd. Gwn, David, eich bod wedi croesawu’r ffordd y

welcomed the way that we are making public appointments. David sits on our health appointments panel—as does Kirsty—and has expressed strongly to me that this is a good way of making appointments. Again, I hope that that view is shared across all parties. The Government of Wales has sought this new way, which is more inclusive and much fairer in terms of making public appointments that are so important to Wales.

Finally, Helen Mary, I am determined that we extend the powers, but this is the first major step that we are taking in improving these regulations to make our appointments of a children's commissioner. We must be proud and stand up for what we are doing in Wales for our children and young people.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

gwnawn benodiadau cyhoeddus. Eistedda David ar ein panel penodiadau iechyd—fel Kirsty—ac mae wedi mynegi'n gadarn wrthyf fod hon yn ffordd dda o wneud penodiadau. Unwaith eto, gobeithiaf y rhennir y farn honno ar draws pob plaid. Daeth Llywodraeth Cymru o hyd i'r ffordd newydd hon, sydd yn fwy cynhwysol ac yn decach o lawer o ran gwneud penodiadau cyhoeddus sydd mor bwysig i Gymru.

Yn olaf, Helen Mary, yr wyf yn benderfynol ein bod yn ymestyn y pwerau, ond hwn yw ein cam pwysig cyntaf o ran gwella'r rheoliadau hyn i wneud ein penodiadau ar gyfer comisiynydd plant. Rhaid inni fod yn falch a chefnogi'r hyn a wnawn yng Nghymru dros ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar  
the approval of the Order. gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

10:25 a.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol  
 Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000  
 Approval of the NHS (General Dental Services) Amendment (Wales) Regulations 2000**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of The National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000.*

I also propose that

Cynigiaf hefyd fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*(a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee relating to the draft Order, The National Health Service (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2000 laid in the Table Office on 7 November; and*

*(a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ar Orchymyn drafft Rheoliadau Gwasanaethau Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2000 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd; a*

*(b) approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2000.*

*(b) yn cymeradwyo gwneud y Gorchymyn yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2000.*

These regulations further amend the National Health Service (General Dental Services) Regulations 1992, which regulate the terms on which general dental services are provided under the National Health Service Act 1977.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn diwygio ymhellach Reoliadau Gwasanaethau Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) 1992, sydd yn rheoleiddio'r telerau y darperir y gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol oddi

The regulations introduce commitment payments, which is a new scheme to reward dentists' loyalty to the NHS, in response to this year's recommendation by the Doctors and Dentists Pay Review Body. Point of treatment checks is a new obligation for dentists to seek evidence in support of a claim that a patient is entitled to exemption from or omission of dental charges, and to record, on the dentist's claim for payment for the treatment provided, when such evidence has not been seen.

In recalled attendance claims, there is a new requirement for a form to be completed when a dentist makes a claim for payment after being recalled to provide emergency treatment outside practice hours, and for that form to be signed by the patient, or by the person responsible for the patient. The regulations also provide amendments to the circumstances in which records must be produced for inspection, and a requirement for separate claim forms to be completed for treatment given by assistants.

The scheme for commitment payments grows from the recommendation of the Doctors and Dentists Pay Review Body that additional funding of £20 million per annum should be provided for a scheme designated to improve the retention and motivation of general dental practitioners in the NHS in England, Scotland and Wales. The share that Wales will receive is expected to deliver approximately £1 million to NHS family dentists. General dental practitioners are free to decide whether or not to provide NHS services. It is right to encourage and reward dentists to have a long-term high-level commitment to the NHS. This will, in turn, help patients by maintaining and strengthening the general dental service.

It has taken considerable time to agree all the details of the scheme, but it has been backdated to 1 April 2000. As a consequence, payments for two quarters are now overdue. Provided this Order is passed today, details of the scheme can be published and the arrears can be paid in early December. Point of treatment checks, introduced by this Order,

tanynt o dan Ddeddf Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol 1977. Cyflwynna'r rheoliadau daliadau ymrwymiad, sydd yn gynllun newydd i wobrwyo teyrngarwch deintyddion i'r NHS, mewn ymateb i argymhelliad gan y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Meddygon a Deintyddion eleni. Mae gwiriadau pwynt triniaeth yn ymrwymiad newydd i ddeintyddion geisio tystiolaeth i gefnogi cais bod gan glaf yr hawl i gael ei eithrio neu i beidio â gorfod talu am driniaeth ddeintyddol, ac i gofnodi, ar gais y deintydd am daliad am y driniaeth a roddwyd, pan na welwyd tystiolaeth o'r fath.

Mewn ceisiadau adalw presenoldeb, mae gofyniad newydd i gwblhau ffurflen pan wna deintydd gais am daliad ar ôl cael ei adalw i roi triniaeth frys y tu allan i oriau arferol y practis, ac i'r ffurflen honno gael ei llofnodi gan y claf, neu gan y sawl sydd yn gyfrifol am y claf. Darpara'r rheoliadau hefyd ddiwygiadau i'r amgylchiadau lle mae'n rhaid cyflwyno cofnodion i'w harchwilio, a gofyniad am gwblhau ffurflenni cais ar wahân ar gyfer triniaeth a roddwyd gan gynorthwyyr.

Deillia'r cynllun am daliadau ymrwymiad o argymhelliad gan y Corff Adolygu Cyflog Meddygon a Deintyddion y dylid darparu cyllid ychwanegol o £20 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer cynllun a bennwyd i wella'r ffordd o gadw ac ysgogi ymarferwyr deintyddol cyffredinol yn yr NHS yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Chymru. Disgwylir y bydd y gyfran a dderbynia Cymru yn dosbarthu tua £1 miliwn i ddeintyddion teulu yr NHS. Mae ymarferwyr deintyddol cyffredinol yn rhydd i benderfynu pa un a ydynt yn darparu gwasanaethau NHS ai peidio. Mae'n iawn annog a gwobrwyo deintyddion i ymrwymo ar lefel uchel am dymor hir i'r NHS. Bydd hyn, yn ei dro, yn helpu cleifion drwy gynnal a chryfhau'r gwasanaeth deintyddol cyffredinol.

Mae wedi cymryd cryn amser i gytuno ar holl fanylion y cynllun, ond bydd ôl-daliad i 1 Ebrill 2000. O ganlyniad, mae taliadau am ddau chwarter yn ddyledus erbyn hyn. Ar yr amod y derbynnir y Gorchymyn hwn heddiw, gellir cyhoeddi manylion y cynllun a thalu'r ôl-daliadau yn gynnar yn Rhagfyr. Mae gwiriadau pwynt triniaeth, a gyflwynir gan y



are part of a comprehensive anti-fraud agenda. Every pound that the NHS loses due to evasion of patient charges is a pound less spent on patient care. Many dentists already seek evidence to ensure that only those who are entitled to exemption or omission do not pay NHS dental charges. We wish to extend this good practice nationally, to ensure that those genuinely entitled to free treatment do not pay any charges. In return, dentists will receive additional remuneration to reflect any extra administrative burden—10 pence per claim for exemption, and a one-off payment of £100 to cover staff training costs.

In future, when a patient claims to be exempt from paying NHS dental charges, the dentist must ask for evidence. The new checks will not affect those who are honestly claiming help with their dental care costs, but will deter people from making false claims. Treatment will not be refused when someone does not produce evidence in the surgery, but claims submitted to the dental practice board when no evidence is seen, will be subject to a higher level of scrutiny. An information pack is being produced and will be issued to every dental practice prior to the new arrangement coming into force. Information leaflets and posters will be distributed to dental practices, to inform those entitled to exemption from or omission of NHS dental charges that evidence will be requested to support their claim. Similar checks were introduced into pharmacies in Wales in April last year, and the net increase in patient charge revenue for the first year of operation, was more than £1 million—another £1 million to be spent on patient care.

The Order also makes minor changes to the rules on the completion of dental claim forms, and introduces a new form for use when a dentist has to reopen his or her surgery to deal with an emergency at a time when the practice is normally closed. These changes will deter fraud, and are needed to ensure that those dealing with cases of fraud can obtain prompt access to the appropriate records.

Gorchymyn hwn, yn rhan o agenda wrth-dwyll gynhwysfawr. Mae pob punt a golla'r NHS oherwydd bod claf yn osgoi'r taliadau yn bunt yn llai i'w gwario ar ofal cleifion. Mae llawer o ddeintyddion eisoes yn chwilio am dystiolaeth i sicrhau mai dim ond y sawl sydd â'r hawl i eithrio sydd ddim yn talu unrhyw daliadau deintyddol NHS. Dymunwn estyn yr arfer da hwn yn genedlaethol, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r sawl sydd â'r hawl gwirioneddol i driniaeth yn rhad ac am ddim yn talu unrhyw daliadau. Am hynny, bydd deintyddion yn derbyn tâl ychwanegol i adlewyrchu unrhyw bwysau gweinyddol ychwanegol—10 ceiniog am bob cais i eithiro, a thaliad untro o £100 i gwmpasu costau hyfforddi staff.

Yn y dyfodol, pan wneir cais gan glaf i gael ei eithrio rhag talu am driniaeth ddeintyddol yr NHS, rhaid i'r deintydd ofyn am dystiolaeth. Ni fydd y gwiriadau newydd yn effeithio ar y rheini sydd yn ceisio help yn onest i dalu am eu costau gofal deintyddol, ond bydd yn atal pobl rhag gwneud ceisiadau ffug. Ni wrthodir triniaeth pan na chyflwynir tystiolaeth yn y feddygfa, ond bydd ceisiadau a gyflwynir i'r bwrdd practis deintyddol pan na welir tystiolaeth, yn agored i archwiliad ar lefel uwch. Cynhyrchir pecyn gwybodaeth ac fe'i cyflwynir i bob practis deintyddol cyn i'r trefniant newydd ddod i rym. Caiff taflenni gwybodaeth a phosteri eu dosbarthu i bractisau deintyddol, i hysbysu'r sawl sydd â'r hawl i gael ei eithrio neu nad yw'n gorfod talu am gostau deintyddol yr NHS y gofynnir am dystiolaeth i gefnogi ei gais. Cyflwynwyd gwiriadau tebyg i fferyllfeydd yng Nghymru yn Ebrill y llynedd, ac yr oedd y cynnydd net o ran derbyniadau taliadau cleifion yn ystod y flwyddyn gyntaf o'u gweithredu, yn fwy nag £1 filiwn—£1 filiwn arall i'w gwario ar ofal cleifion.

Gwna'r Gorchymyn fân newidiadau hefyd i'r rheolau ar gwblhau ffurflenni cais deintyddol, a chyflwyna ffurflen newydd i'w defnyddio pan fydd yn rhaid i ddeintydd ailagor ei f/meddygfa i ymdrin ag achos brys ar adeg pan fydd y practis fel rheol ar gau. Bydd y newidiadau hyn yn atal twyll, ac mae eu hangen i sicrhau y gall y rheini sydd yn ymdrin ag achosion o dwyll gael mynediad ar unwaith i'r cofnodion priodol.

**David Lloyd:** Yr ydym ni, fel plaid, yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn a'u pwyslais ar wobrwyo deintyddion am eu teyrngarwch i'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r rhai ohonom sydd yn credu y dylai deintyddiaeth fod yn rhan ganolog o'n gwasanaeth iechyd yn croesawu dyfodiad y rheoliadau hyn. Hefyd, croesawn ofyn i ddeintyddion gwblhau ffurflenni am eu gwaith a chadw cofnod ohonynt er mwyn iddynt gael eu harchwilio'n ddiweddarach. Mae hynny'n bwysig hefyd.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Liberal Democrats welcome these Orders. While we recognise that we need to have regulations, we urge caution in case of overburdening practitioners with too much paperwork. We must keep a careful check on that.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Dai and Kirsty, for welcoming these regulations. We need to ensure that dentists keep their records. We will reward them financially and give them support in terms of the administrative burden, the training of staff and with the information that will be distributed to patients. I am grateful for the support for those regulations.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the Order.

**David Lloyd:** We, as a party, support these regulations and their emphasis on rewarding dentists for their commitment to the health service. Those of us who believe that dentistry should be central to our health service welcome these regulations. We also welcome the requirement that dentists complete forms about their work and keep them on record so that they can be examined at a later date. That is also important.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn croesawu'r Gorchmynion hyn. Er ein bod yn cydnabod bod angen rheoliadau arnom, mynnwn bwyll rhag ofn y gorlwythir ymarferwyr gan ormod o waith papur. Rhaid inni wirio hynny'n ofalus.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch, Dai a Kirsty, am groesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod deintyddion yn cadw eu cofnodion. Fe'u gwobrwyn yn ariannol a rhoddwn gefnogaeth iddynt o ran y pwysau gweinyddol, hyfforddi staff a'r wybodaeth a ddosberthir i gleifion. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y gefnogaeth i'r rheoliadau hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar ewyddor y Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion adopted.*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar  
the approval of the Order. gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Feld, Val  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Gareth

Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion adopted.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.29 a.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.29 a.m.*

### **Gwella Adeiladau Ysgolion Upgrade of School Buildings**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendments 3,4,5,6 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 3,4,5,6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly notes and welcomes the significant increases in capital expenditure for schools proposed in the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities' draft budget laid in the Table Office on 19 October 2000.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi ac yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant cyfalaf i ysgolion a gynigiwyd yng nghyllideb ddrafft y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2000.*

Thank you for the opportunity to speak to the motion that welcomes the significant increases in capital expenditure for schools that were proposed by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities in her provisional budget published on 19 October. That budget reflects the commitment in the partnership agreement. The details that I will discuss later in this speech demonstrate how we are now able to move forward on this important agenda. I know that Members agree that the

Diolch ichi am y cyfle i sôn am y cynnig sydd yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer ysgolion a gynigiwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ei chyllideb dros dro a gyhoeddwyd ar 19 Hydref. Adlewyrchodd y gyllideb honno yr ymrwymiad yn y cytundeb partneriaeth. Dengys y manylion y byddaf yn eu trafod yn ddiweddarach yn yr araith hon sut y gallwn symud ymlaen yn awr ar yr agenda bwysig hon. Gwn y cytuna'r Aelodau fod cyflwr

poor condition of many of our school buildings in Wales is a matter of great concern. This is not an isolated problem that affects a few schools but a serious problem that affects many schools in every local authority in Wales. It is not just about the present generation of schoolchildren and their teachers; it is also about future generations.

The reason for the problem is straightforward. It is a failure over many years to invest in maintaining, refurbishing and replacing school buildings. The fact that educational achievements continue to improve despite poor physical conditions is testament to the determination of teachers to do their best for their pupils. I commend them for that. Teachers and pupils should not be put in this situation. In the twenty-first century they should have proper surroundings in which to teach and learn. Since 1997, and particularly since the establishment of the National Assembly, one of our highest priorities has been to ensure that schools in Wales receive the funding that they need and to ensure that the poor condition of buildings is addressed. It will take time to resolve the backlog of school building problems. There are no quick answers, but we must be ambitious if we are to make changes. 'Betterwales.com' sets the objective of ensuring that all schools are in good physical shape and properly maintained by 2010. That is underpinned in 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership Agreement for the People of Wales' by the commitment to provide significant additional funding.

10:35 a.m.

We have already started on the work, and I now announce further assistance. Members are aware that additional funding of £9.9 million is being made available this year for education, as a result of Chancellor's pre-budget report. I have indicated that I intend for approximately £7.9 million of that money to be available to improve school standards, including meeting the full cost of leadership group restructuring. I am discussing the delivery of those plans with the Welsh Local Government Association, but I assure

gwael llawer o adeiladau ein hysgolion yng Nghymru yn fater o bryder mawr. Nid yw hon yn broblem unigryw sydd yn effeithio ar ychydig o ysgolion ond yn hytrach mae'n broblem ddifrifol sydd yn effeithio ar lawer o ysgolion ym mhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Nid yw'n ymwneud â'r genhedlaeth bresennol o blant ysgol a'u hathrawon yn unig; mae'n ymwneud hefyd â chenedlaethau i ddod.

Mae'r rheswm dros y broblem yn syml. Methiant dros lawer o flynyddoedd ydyw i fuddsoddi mewn cynnal a chadw ac adnewyddu adeiladau ac adeiladu rhai newydd. Mae'r ffaith bod cyflawniadau addysgol yn parhau i wella er gwaethaf y cyflwr ffisegol gwael yn dyst i benderfyniad yr athrawon i wneud y gorau dros eu disgyblion. Canmolaf hwy am hynny. Ni ddylid rhoi athrawon a disgyblion yn y sefyllfa honno. Yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain dylent gael amgylchedd priodol i addysgu a dysgu ynddo. Ers 1997, ac yn arbennig ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, un o'n blaenoriaethau mwyaf fu sicrhau bod ysgolion yng Nghymru yn cael yr arian sydd ei angen arnynt a sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â chyflwr gwael yr adeiladau. Cymer amser i ddatrys yr ôl-groniad o broblemau gydag adeiladau ysgolion. Nid oes atebion cyflym i hyn, ond rhaid inni fod yn uchelgeisiol os ydym am wneud newidiadau. Mae 'Gwellcymru.com' yn pennu'r nod o sicrhau bod pob ysgol mewn cyflwr ffisegol da ac yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n dda erbyn 2010. Ategir hynny yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Cytundeb Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru' gan yr ymrwymiad i ddarparu arian ychwanegol sylweddol.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi dechrau ar y gwaith, a chyhoeddaf gymorth pellach yn awr. Mae'r Aelodau yn ymwybodol bod arian ychwanegol o £9.9 miliwn ar gael eleni ar gyfer addysg, o ganlyniad i adroddiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb. Nodais fy mod yn bwriadu sicrhau bod tua £7.9 miliwn o'r arian hwnnw ar gael i wella safonau ysgolion, gan gynnwys talu cost lawn ailstrwythuro arweinyddiaeth grwpiau. Yr wyf yn trafod y modd y cyflawnir y cynlluniau hynny â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ond

Members that that money will go to the schools.

I am setting aside £2 million of the additional funding as a possible contribution towards the cost of upgrading the premises of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. That is a regional centre for the education of autistic children, which is run by Denbighshire County Council. I am sure that that announcement is welcome across all parties in Wales. When I became Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, even before I left my office in the Presiding Office, I received two letters about Brondyffryn from Labour Members, and as soon I reached my new office, I received letters from other Members. I hope that that will be strongly supported by the Assembly. The school caters for pupils from 12 local authorities, including the English authorities that send pupils there because of the quality of provision. I am looking to Denbighshire County Council and other local authorities that use the school to contribute significantly to cost of the project. The Shirley Foundation may also provide resources. All-party discussions must take place, and I will inform Members in due course of the content of the financial package. I hope that you all welcome this extra provision for special education in north Wales.

Overall resources for school capital investment have begun to grow. Since 1997, £50 million has been provided through the New Deal for Schools programme. Two thousand projects have been funded. The majority of those are small-scale projects, such as new roofs, windows, heating and water systems, although they do not feel like small-scale projects to people in schools that have benefit from them. They are significant because they address real needs. Medium-sized projects, such as new library and laboratory facilities, and large projects that provide new schools, have also been funded. The latest large project was the new Rose Hayworth Primary School in Blaenau Gwent. It replaces three old schools and is being officially opened today.

sicrhaf yr Aelodau y bydd yr arian hwnnw yn mynd i'r ysgolion.

Rhoddaf £2 filiwn o'r arian ychwanegol o'r neilltu fel cyfraniad posibl tuag at y gost o wella adeiladau Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. Canolfan ranbarthol ar gyfer addysg plant awtistig yw honno, a gaiff ei rhedeg gan Gyngor Sir Ddinbych. Yr wyf yn siwr bod pob plaid yng Nghymru yn croesawu'r cyhoeddiad hwnnw. Pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, hyd yn oed cyn imi adael fy swydd yn Swyddfa'r Llywydd, derbyniais ddau lythyr am Frondyffryn gan Aelodau o'r Blaid Lafur, a chyn gynted ag y cyrhaeddais fy swyddfa newydd, derbyniais lythyrau gan Aelodau eraill. Gobeithiaf y caiff hynny gefnogaeth gref gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r ysgol yn darparu ar gyfer disgyblion o 12 awdurdod lleol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau Lloegr sydd yn anfon disgyblion yno oherwydd ansawdd y ddarpariaeth. Disgwyliaf i Gyngor Sir Ddinbych ac awdurdodau lleol eraill sydd yn defnyddio'r ysgol gyfrannu'n sylweddol at gost y prosiect. Efallai y bydd y Shirley Foundation yn darparu adnoddau hefyd. Rhaid i drafodaethau pob plaid gael eu cynnal, a hysbysaf yr Aelodau maes o law am gynnwys y pecyn ariannol. Gobeithiaf fod pob un ohonoch yn croesawu'r ddarpariaeth ychwanegol hon ar gyfer addysg arbennig yng ngogledd Cymru.

Mae adnoddau cyffredinol ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn ysgolion wedi dechrau cynyddu. Ers 1997, darparwyd £50 miliwn drwy raglen y Fargen Newydd i Ysgolion. Ariannwyd dwy fil o brosiectau. Mae'r mwyafrif ohonynt yn brosiectau ar raddfa fechan, fel toeau, ffenestri, systemau gwresogi a dŵr newydd, er nad ydynt yn teimlo fel brosiectau ar raddfa fechan i'r bobl yn yr ysgolion sydd yn elwa ohonynt. Maent yn arwyddocaol oherwydd ymdriniant ag anghenion gwirioneddol. Ariannwyd brosiectau o faint canolig hefyd, fel llyfrgell newydd a chyfleusterau newydd ar gyfer labordai, a phrosiectau mawr sydd yn darparu ysgolion newydd. Y prosiect mawr diweddaraf oedd Ysgol Gynradd newydd Rose Hayworth ym Mlaenau Gwent. Mae'n cymryd lle tair hen ysgol ac fe'i hagarir yn swyddogol heddiw.

It is not true to suggest, as Jonathan Morgan's amendment seeks to do, that there has been no notable improvement in the general condition of schools in Wales. The opposite is the case and, therefore, I will not support his amendment. Many schools are seeing much needed and long overdue improvements but, sadly, the legacy left by years of under-investment means that there is still a long way to go. The Welsh Local Government Association has suggested that there is a backlog of work worth approximately £350 million, around half of which involves capital investment. The definition that the WLGA uses for that is 'excluding replacement buildings'. As it acknowledges, the information that it has from authorities is patchy.

Over the past few months, Assembly officials have visited all local authorities to discuss the state of their school buildings and the plans that they have to tackle the work that needs to be done. Several conclusions emerged from those discussions. Few, if any, authorities, have comprehensive and up-to-date assessments of the condition of school buildings and no authorities yet have asset management plans that enable them to prioritise work that needs to be done. Several authorities have scope to rationalise school estate by removing surplus places, and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee is discussing that issue.

Given the patchy state of knowledge, it is difficult to assess accurately the scale of investment needed. Based on the intelligence that we have, the investment needed could be as much as £800 million, or put another way, an investment of around a £100 million a year is needed if we are to reach the 2010 'Betterwales.com' target. Once authorities have completed their condition survey and the asset management plans that we have now called for from the Assembly, I hope, next year, that we will have a much clearer picture of what needs to be done. I will be working with the Welsh Local Government Association to ensure that local authorities and the Assembly have the full picture and

Nid yw'n wir awgrymu, fel y ceisia gwelliant Jonathan Morgan ei wneud, na fu unrhyw welliant nodedig yng nghyflwr cyffredinol ysgolion yng Nghymru. Y gwrthwyneb sydd yn wir ac felly, ni chefnogaf ei welliant. Mae llawer o ysgolion yn gweld gwelliannau yr oedd eu hangen yn fawr ac y bu hir ddisgwyl amdanynt ond, yn anffodus, mae'r hyn a adawyd inni ar ôl blynyddoedd o danfuddsoddi yn golygu bod gennym lawer o ffordd i fynd eto. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi awgrymu bod gwaith gwerth tua £350 miliwn wedi ôl-gronni, a bod hanner y swm hwn yn gysylltiedig â buddsoddiad cyfalaf. Y diffiniad a ddefnyddia Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar gyfer hynny yw 'ac eithrio adeiladau newydd'. Fel y mae'n cydnabod, mae'r wybodaeth a gafodd gan yr awdurdodau yn fylchog.

Dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, mae swyddogion y Cynulliad wedi ymweld â phob awdurdod lleol i drafod cyflwr adeiladau eu hysgolion a'r cynlluniau sydd ganddynt i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith y mae angen i wneud. Yn sgîl y trafodaethau hynny daethpwyd i sawl casgliad. Prin yw nifer yr awdurdodau, os o gwbl, sydd ag asesiadau cynhwysfawr a diweddar o gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion ac nid oes gan un awdurdod eto unrhyw gynlluniau i reoli asedau sydd yn eu galluogi i flaenoriaethu gwaith y mae angen ei wneud. Mae cyfle gan sawl awdurdod i ad-drefnu ystadau ysgolion drwy gael gwared ar leoedd dros ben, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn trafod y mater hwnnw.

O gofio cyflwr bylchog yr wybodaeth, mae'n anodd asesu'n gywir faint o fuddsoddi sydd ei angen. Yn seiliedig ar yr wybodaeth sydd gennym, gallai'r buddsoddiad sydd ei angen fod cymaint â £800 miliwn, neu o'i roi mewn ffordd arall, mae angen buddsoddiad o tua £100 miliwn y flwyddyn os ydym i gyrraedd y targed 'Gwellcymru.com' 2010. Unwaith y bydd awdurdodau wedi cwblhau eu harolwg cyflwr a'r cynlluniau rheoli asedau yr ydym wedi galw amdanynt yn awr gan y Cynulliad, gobeithiaf, y flwyddyn nesaf, y bydd gennym ddarlun cliriach o lawer o'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud. Byddaf yn gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol a'r

the right policies to address the problem. I hope that Members will also be able to give their full endorsement to the importance of this policy in Wales to tackle previous under-investment.

Jocelyn Davies argues in her amendment 3 that the level of provision envisaged in the draft budget, in particular, in the proposals for 2001-02, is insufficient to address the backlog. She quotes a figure of £325 million, which the WLGA has used in the past, and the increased funding figure of £5.9 million. I cannot support her amendment because these figures are in isolation and do not consider the overall package that has been accepted by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in terms of the funding available for capital investment in schools. The increased levels of funding that are already in place and are planned for the future will enable us to move significantly to meeting the 'Betterwales.com' target. To remind Members, in 1999-2000, overall capital funding available for schools was £70 million. In the current year it is £97 million. In 2001-02, it dips to £86 million, but increases to £100 million in 2002-03 and to £107 million in 2003-04. That is £293 million over three years. As I indicated, this annual level of investment will need to be maintained to continue to the end of the decade.

The proposals in the draft budget will provide the improved and sustained investment that Jocelyn calls for in amendment 4. I will support that amendment. My immediate concern is to ensure that local authorities can plan ahead and are able to deliver in accordance with the Assembly's priorities and the wishes of their own communities for investment in school. This is about committing the appropriate amount of their resources to capital work in schools and gearing up their organisations to deliver much larger programmes. This year, local authorities expect to fund around £45 million of investments in their own resources compared to a notional all-Wales allocation of general capital funding for education at £44 million. Next year, it increases to £55 million. I expect authorities' investment to rise accordingly given the priority they attach

Cynulliad y darlun llawn a'r polisïau cywir i ymdrin â'r broblem. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau hefyd yn gallu rhoi eu cefnogaeth lawn i bwysigrwydd y polisi hwn yng Nghymru i fynd i'r afael â thanfuddsoddi blaenorol.

Dadleua Jocelyn Davies yn ei gwelliant 3 bod lefel y ddarpariaeth a ragwelir yn y gyllideb ddrafft, yn arbennig, yn y cynigion ar gyfer 2001-02, yn annigonol i ymdrin â'r gwaith sydd wedi ôl-gronni. Dyfynna ffigur o £325 miliwn, y mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi ei ddefnyddio yn y gorffennol, a'r ffigwr cyllido cynyddol o £5.9 miliwn. Ni allaf gefnogi ei gwelliant gan fod y ffigurau hyn ar eu pen eu hunain ac nid ydynt yn ystyried y pecyn cyffredinol a dderbyniwyd gan y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar gyfer buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn ysgolion. Bydd y lefelau cynyddol o arian sydd eisoes yn weithredol ac a fwriedir ar gyfer y dyfodol yn ein galluogi i symud yn sylweddol tuag at gyrraedd targed 'Gwellcymru.com'. Er mwyn atgoffa'r Aelodau, yn 1999-2000, yr arian cyfalaf cyffredinol ar gyfer ysgolion oedd £70 miliwn. Yn y flwyddyn gyfredol mae'n £97 miliwn. Yn 2001-02, mae'n gostwng i £86 miliwn, ond yn cynyddu i £100 miliwn yn 2002-03 ac i £107 miliwn yn 2003-04. Mae hynny'n £293 miliwn dros dair blynedd. Fel y nodais, bydd angen cynnal y lefel flynyddol hon o fuddsoddi er mwyn parhau hyd ddiwedd y degawd.

Bydd y cynigion yn y gyllideb ddrafft yn darparu'r buddsoddiad gwell a chynaliadwy y geilw Jocelyn amdano yng ngwelliant 4. Byddaf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw. Fy mhryder uniongyrchol yw sicrhau y gall awdurdodau lleol gynllunio ymlaen llaw ac y gallant gyflawni yn unol â blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad a dymuniadau eu cymunedau eu hunain ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn ysgolion. Mae hyn yn ymwneud ag ymrwymo'r swm cywir o'u hadnoddau i waith cyfalaf mewn ysgolion a pharatoi eu sefydliadau i gyflawni rhaglenni mwy o lawer. Eleni, mae disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol ariannu tua £45 miliwn o fuddsoddiadau yn eu hadnoddau eu hunain o'u cymharu â dyraniad tybiannol Cymru gyfan o arian cyfalaf cyffredinol ar gyfer addysg o £44 miliwn. Y flwyddyn nesaf, cynyddu i £55 miliwn. Disgwyliaf i fuddsoddiadau'r awdurdodau godi'n unol â



to school investment. I expect the authorities whose investment in school buildings is running at a low level to review their priority. However, authorities' progress in spending the additional £26.8 million allocated earlier this year has been disappointing. Most of the funds—£20 million—must be rolled over into 2001-02. Authorities have also fallen short by about £5 million in spending New Deals for School funding provided over three financial years to 31 March 2000.

I cannot support Jocelyn's amendment 5, which expresses disappointment about the overall level of funding for 2000-02. We discussed that in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee last week, and Members agreed that we should be calling for additional funding in the second year once we had the strategic planning structures in place. I am committed to doing that and I am happy to accept the Committee's proposal, but in the absence of that, and with the demonstration that we already have the shortfall in the funding in local authorities in Wales now, I cannot support that amendment.

Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2 asks that the potential of private finance initiative should be used to the full for schools. I support his amendment. There are 10 school projects in the PFI programme. The first, Penweddig in Aberystwyth, started in September. We have committed £140 million to the funding of these projects not only including the capital totals I have quoted. We also know of other public-private partnerships. I was pleased to open the new Alexandra County Primary School in Wrexham on 1 November, which was a public-private partnership with Asda. I hope other local authorities can follow that kind of lead.

To finish, Jocelyn raises—

**Ron Davies:** I raise a point on Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2. I would be grateful if you clarified why you recommend that we should support it. I fully accept the rationale that we use PFI. There is a PFI in my own constituency of which I am supportive.

hynny o gofio'r flaenoriaeth a briodolant i fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion. Disgwyliaf i'r awdurdodau hynny nad ydynt yn buddsoddi llawer mewn adeiladau ysgolion adolygu eu blaenoriaeth. Fodd bynnag, bu'r cynnydd a wnaeth awdurdodau wrth wario'r £26.8 miliwn ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd yn gynharach eleni yn siomedig. Rhaid i'r rhan fwyaf o'r arian—£20 miliwn—gario ymlaen i 2001-02. Mae awdurdodau hefyd wedi methu o tua £5 miliwn o ran gwario arian y Fargen Newydd ar gyfer Ysgolion a ddarparwyd dros dair blynedd ariannol i 31 Mawrth 2000.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 5 Jocelyn, sydd yn mynegi siom ynghylch lefel gyffredinol yr arian ar gyfer 2000-02. Trafodasom hynny yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wythnos diwethaf, a chytunodd yr Aelodau y dylem fod yn galw am arian ychwanegol yn yr ail flwyddyn ar ôl inni roi'r strwythurau cynllunio strategol ar waith. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i wneud hynny ac yn hapus i dderbyn cynnig y Pwyllgor, ond yn absenoldeb hynny, a chyda'r prawf sydd gennym eisoes o'r diffyg ariannol mewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, ni allaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Gofynna gwelliant Jonathan Morgan y dylid defnyddio potensial y fenter cyllid preifat i'r eithaf ar gyfer ysgolion. Cefnogaf ei welliant. Mae 10 prosiect ysgol yn rhaglen y fenter cyllid preifat. Dechreuodd y cyntaf, Penweddig yn Aberystwyth, ym mis Medi. Ymrwymasom £140 miliwn i ariannu'r prosiectau hyn gan gynnwys nid yn unig y cyfansymiau cyfalaf a ddyfynnais. Gwyddom hefyd am bartneriaethau cyhoeddus-breifaf eraill. Yr oeddwn yn falch o agor Ysgol Gynradd Sirol newydd Alexandra yn Wrecsam ar 1 Tachwedd, a oedd yn bartneriaeth gyhoeddus-breifaf gydag Asda. Gobeithiaf y gall awdurdodau lleol eraill ddilyn y math hwnnw o arweiniad.

I orffen, cyfyd Jocelyn—

**Ron Davies:** Codaf bwynt am welliant 2 Jonathan Morgan. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech egluro pam yr argymhellwch y dylem ei gefnogi. Derbyniaf yn llawn y rhesymeg ein bod yn defnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat. Mae menter cyllid preifat yn fy etholaeth ac

However, the amendment goes much further. It suggests that we should press the full potential for PFI on the basis that this is the only way that capital investment in schools can be maintained. That is clearly not the case.

10:45 a.m.

**Jane Davidson:** We will support the amendment because we have supported PFI and will continue to support the PFI initiatives based on the 10 school projects that are in the PFI programme. The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities has already told you that we will have a full debate on PFI on 5 December when she will review the consultation.

Jocelyn raises two further issues in her amendments 6 and 7—the role of LEAs and the application of sustainability. Jocelyn, I am happy to confirm the strategic role of LEAs. I am a strong supporter of working with local government. We have partnership agreements between local government and the Assembly and they are responsible for all capital investment in schools except in voluntary aided schools when they work in partnership with the church authorities and the National Assembly, and we have also put extra funding in there. I am particularly keen to support your proposal on sustainability. As you already know, the consultation on the supply of school places is also considering whether or not we can expand opportunities for other use of schools. I see the community schools of the future as local schools for local communities, and I look forward to the school of the future being a community resource. I am, therefore, happy to support this amendment.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose amendment 1. Insert after ‘19 October 2000’:

*but regrets that there has not been a noticeable improvement in the general condition of Welsh schools in the last three and a half years.*

I also propose amendment 2. At the end of

yr wyf yn gefnogol iawn iddi. Fodd bynnag, â'r gwelliant yn bellach o lawer. Awgryma y dylem bwysu am botensial llawn ar gyfer y fenter cyllid preifat ar y sail mai dyma'r unig ffordd y gellir cynnal buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion. Yn amlwg, nid felly y mae.

**Jane Davidson:** Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant am ein bod wedi cefnogi'r fenter cyllid preifat a byddwn yn parhau i gefnogi mentrau cyllid preifat yn seiliedig ar y 10 prosiect ysgol sydd yn y rhaglen menter cyllid preifat. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau eisoes wedi dweud wrthyf y cawn ddadl lawn ar y fenter cyllid preifat ar 5 Rhagfyr pan fydd yn adolygu'r ymgynghoriad.

Cyfyd Jocelyn ddau fater arall yn ei gwelliannau 6 a 7—rôl AALlau a chymhwyso cynaliadwyedd. Jocelyn, yr wyf yn falch o allu cadarnhau rôl strategol AALlau. Yr wyf yn gefnogwr brwd i weithio gyda llywodraeth leol. Mae gennym gytundebau partneriaethau rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r Cynulliad ac maent yn gyfrifol am bob buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion heblaw mewn ysgolion a gynorthwyir yn wirfoddol pan weithiant mewn partneriaeth ag awdurdodau'r eglwys a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yr ydym wedi rhoi arian ychwanegol yno hefyd. Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i gefnogi eich cynnig ar gynaliadwyedd. Fel y gwyddoch eisoes, mae'r ymgynghori ar gyflenwi lleoedd mewn ysgolion hefyd yn ystyried a allwn ehangu'r cyfleoedd i ddefnyddio ysgolion mewn ffyrdd eraill. Gwelaf ysgolion cymunedol y dyfodol fel ysgolion lleol ar gyfer cymunedau lleol, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ysgol y dyfodol yn gweithredu fel adnodd cymunedol. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiau welliant 1. Ychwaneger ar ôl ‘19 Hydref 2000’:

*ond yn gresynu na fu gwelliant amlwg yng nghyflwr cyffredinol ysgolion Cymru yn y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf.*

Cynigiau welliant 2 hefyd. Ar ddiwedd y

the motion add:

*and encourages the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and local authorities in Wales to utilise the full potential of the private finance initiative to ensure that the level of capital investment in schools is maximised.*

I am grateful to the Government of Wales for tabling this important debate because it gives the Assembly its first full opportunity to debate this critical issue. We have debated it once before in a short debate, but this longer debate will hopefully give Members a chance to outline their own constituency problems and highlight where we could be making substantial improvements.

The state of school buildings is nothing less than essential for our children's education. As the Minister rightly said earlier on, so many schools in Wales are doing tremendously well in improving education standards and pupil attainment. It sometimes makes you wonder how they are able to do so bearing in mind the state of some of those buildings. Poor conditions can inhibit learning, and I wonder, if some school buildings were in a much better condition, how much more improved our pupils would be in achieving their education qualifications. If children and teachers are distracted by leaky roofs or draughty classrooms they can hardly concentrate exclusively on teaching and understanding. As Members, we all visit schools and we understand only too well the need for new buildings, for swift repairs and for the money to reach schools as quickly as possible.

Amendment 1 deals with the three and a half years of the Labour Government thus far. Before the election, we were told that Labour would dramatically improve the condition of our schools. We were told that school buildings would be unrecognisably improved. Given this claim, when I have been visiting our nation's schools, I have asked heads and teachers and governors whether the general condition of their school is better now than it was three and a half years ago. The resounding answer is no. I am sure that many people who visit schools find the same.

cynnig, ychwaneger:

*ac yn annog y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i fanteisio'n llawn ar botensial y fenter cyllid preifat er mwyn sicrhau cymaint o gynnydd â phosibl yn y cyfalaf a fuddsoddir mewn ysgolion.*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Lywodraeth Cymru am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon oherwydd rhydd y cyfle llawn cyntaf i'r Cynulliad ddadlau'r mater holl bwysig hwn. Yr ydym wedi ei drafod unwaith o'r blaen mewn dadl fer, ond bydd y ddadl hwy hon gobeithio yn rhoi cyfle i'r Aelodau amlinellu eu problemau etholaethol eu hunain gan amlygu ble y gallem fod yn gwneud gwelliannau sylweddol.

Nid yw cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion yn ddim llai na hanfodol ar gyfer addysg ein plant. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gywir yn gynharach, mae cymaint o ysgolion yng Nghymru yn gwneud yn eithriadol o dda wrth wella safonau addysg a chyflawniad disgyblion. Weithiau gwna ichi feddwl sut y gallant wneud hynny o gofio cyflwr rhai o'r adeiladau hynny. Gall amodau gwael rwystru dysgu a thybiaf, pe bai rhai adeiladau ysgolion mewn cyflwr gwell o lawer, faint gwell fyddai ein disgyblion wrth gyflawni eu cymwysterau addysg. Os tynnir sylw plant ac athrawon gan doeau yn gollwng neu ystafelloedd dosbarth drafftig oer prin y gallant ganolbwyntio'n unig ar addysgu a deall. Fel Aelodau, mae pob un ohonom yn ymweld ag ysgolion a deallwn ond yn rhy dda yr angen am adeiladau newydd, atgyweiriadau cyflym a'r arian i gyrraedd ysgolion cyn gynted â phosibl.

Mae gwelliant 1 yn ymdrin â thair blynedd a hanner cyntaf Llywodraeth Lafur hyd yn hyn. Cyn yr etholiad, dywedwyd wrthym y byddai Llafur yn gwella cyflwr ein hysgolion yn ddramatig. Dywedwyd wrthym y câi adeiladau ysgolion eu gwella'n aruthrol. O gofio'r honiad hwn, pan fûm yn ymweld ag ysgolion ein gwlad, yr wyf wedi gofyn i bennaethiaid ac athrawon a llywodraethwyr a yw cyflwr cyffredinol eu hysgol yn well yn awr nag yr oedd dair blynedd a hanner yn ôl. Yr ateb ysgubol yw nac ydyw. Yr wyf yn siwr bod llawer o bobl sydd yn ymweld ag

ysgolion yn clywed yr un peth.

**Huw Lewis:** Is it not odd that during the last budget round, the Welsh Conservatives said clearly that they would only support extra finances for agriculture and health? Does that not mean that your amendment 1 somewhat lacks credibility when you talk about the last three and a half years? Had we not better talk about how to put right the last 20 years of underinvestment in our schools?

**Huw Lewis:** Onid yw'n rhyfedd i Geidwadwyr Cymru ddatgan yn eglur yn ystod y cylch cyllideb diwethaf y byddent ond yn cefnogi arian ychwanegol ar gyfer amaethyddiaeth ac iechyd? Oni olyga hynny fod eich gwelliant 1 ychydig yn brin o hygrededd pan siaradwch am y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf? Oni fyddai'n well inni siarad am sut i unioni'r tanfuddsoddiad a fu yn ein hysgolion dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf?

**Jonathan Morgan:** As you know, Huw, I have been arguing in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee for some time, along with colleagues from other parties—noticeably from Plaid Cymru—that we ought to be looking carefully at the amount of money that we spend in total on our schools, not just to ensure the current repairs, but to prepare for those repairs that will be incurred in the future. At its last full meeting the Committee noted with some concern the overall levels of expenditure that would be incurred by the Assembly on school buildings. We have therefore used every opportunity to express our concern about those funding levels and we will continue to do so.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Fel y gwyddoch, Huw, bîm yn dadlau yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ers peth amser, ynghyd â chyd-Aelodau o bleidiau eraill—yn amlwg o Blaid Cymru—y dylem fod yn edrych yn ofalus ar gyfanswm yr arian a wariwn ar ein hysgolion, nid yn unig i sicrhau yr atgyweiriadau cyfredol, ond i baratoi ar gyfer yr atgyweiriadau hynny y bydd yn rhaid talu amdanynt yn y dyfodol. Yn ei gyfarfod llawn diwethaf nododd y Pwyllgor gyda pheth pryder lefelau cyffredinol y gwariant a fyddai'n cael eu gwario gan y Cynulliad ar adeiladau ysgolion. Felly, defnyddiasom bob cyfle i fynegi ein pryder ynghylch y lefelau ariannu hynny a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

I will move on to the 20-year claim. Although I am sure that other Members will indicate that this is the Conservative Party's fault, I disagree. Members who have visited schools know that there has been no step change or any radical improvement. We have had many promises and rhetoric. We have had partnership documents, vision documents and the 'Betterwales.com' document. We need to see the extra money reaching our schools. It is no good to assume that we send money to local authorities and that they will have the good nature and ability to improve school buildings. It is headteachers, governors, parents and pupils who will improve school buildings. We cannot rely on this money sitting in town halls. I urge the Minister to ensure that this money reaches our schools as quickly as possible.

Symudaf ymlaen i'r honiad 20 mlynedd. Er fy mod yn siwr y bydd Aelodau eraill yn nodi mai bai'r Blaid Geidwadol yw hyn, anghytunaf. Mae'r Aelodau sydd wedi ymweld ag ysgolion yn gwybod na fu unrhyw newid nac unrhyw welliant radical. Cawsom lawer o addewidion a rhethreg. Cawsom ddogfennau partneriaeth, dogfennau gweledigaeth a'r ddogfen 'Gwellcymru.com'. Mae angen inni weld yr arian ychwanegol yn cyrraedd ein hysgolion. Waeth heb â chymryd yn ganiataol ein bod yn anfon arian i awduroadau lleol a bod ganddynt y rhadlondeb a'r gallu i wella adeiladau ysgolion. Y penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr, rhieni a disgyblion yw'r rhai a fydd yn gwella adeiladau ysgolion. Ni allwn ddibynnu ar yr arian hwn yn eistedd mewn neuaddau trefi. Anogaf y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod yr arian hwn yn cyrraedd ein hysgolion mor gyflym â phosibl.

I welcome the new and additional money for

Croesawaf yr arian newydd ac ychwanegol ar

school buildings. That, along with the private finance initiative, is the only sensible way in which we can improve school buildings. I am pleased that the Minister will support my amendment 2 on the private finance initiative. However, we must recognise that we do not have a magic wand. The opposition is right to point out that the increases have been greatly exaggerated by the Liberal-Labour administration as a way of selling the partnership agreement. That agreement does not identify any true additional money beyond that which Westminster has previously agreed.

The reality, as pointed out in amendments 3 and 5, which we will support, is that the increase will not even clear the £350 million backlog of school repairs which was outlined by the Welsh Local Government Association. Because of that, we will support amendment 4, which calls for sustained investment in schools. We firmly believe that, if we identify true additional money for schools, it should be ring-fenced, perhaps in the form of a special grant report. We would not allow local authorities to siphon off money from additional money that the Assembly has sent them and spend it in areas other than education, as has happened in the past. The former Pre-16 Education Committee will testify that, when we received the figures from local education authorities, the £90 million that was made additional was not completely spent on education but used, in some case, for roads and other local services. Education money must be spent on education, not diverted into other areas of public services.

As I said, I am pleased that amendment 2 on the private finance initiative will be supported. A Conservative Government started the private finance initiative scheme, which has led to large increases in investment in schools across Wales. I am sure that all parties—except for Richard Edwards, who has jumped ship to the official opposition party—will support the private finance initiative as a responsible method of providing money that is truly additional to the extra money that the Assembly has allocated to schools.

gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Hon yw'r unig ffordd synhwyrol, ynghyd â'r fenter cyllid preifat, y gallwn wella adeiladau ysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Gweinidog yn cefnogi fy ngwelliant 2 ar y fenter cyllid preifat. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod nad oes gennym ffon hud. Mae'r wrthblaid yn gywir i nodi y gorliwiwyd y codiadau yn fawr gan weinyddiaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur fel ffordd o werthu'r cytundeb partneriaeth. Nid yw'r cytundeb hwnnw yn nodi unrhyw arian ychwanegol gwirioneddol y tu hwnt i'r hyn y cytunodd San Steffan arno yn flaenorol.

Y realiti, fel y nodwyd yng ngwelliannau 3 a 5, a gefnogwn, yw na fydd y cynnydd hyd yn oed yn clirio'r gwaith atgyweirio ysgolion o £350 miliwn sydd wedi cronni a amlinellwyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Oherwydd hynny, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 4, sydd yn galw am fuddsoddiad cynaliadwy mewn ysgolion. Credwn yn gryf, er mwyn nodi arian ychwanegol gwirioneddol ar gyfer ysgolion, y dylid ei glustnodi, efallai ar ffurf adroddiad grant arbennig. Ni fyddem yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol seiffno arian o arian ychwanegol yr anfonodd y Cynulliad atynt a'i wario ar feysydd heblaw addysg, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Bydd y cyn Bwyllgor Addysg Cyn-16 yn tystio, pan gawsom y ffigurau gan awdurdodau addysg lleol, na chafodd y £90 miliwn, a sicrhawyd yn ychwanegol, ei wario ar addysg yn llwyr ond cafodd ei ddefnyddio, mewn rhai achosion, ar gyfer ffyrdd a gwasanaethau lleol eraill. Rhaid gwario arian addysg ar addysg, ac ni ddylid ei ddargyfeirio i feysydd eraill o wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn falch y caiff gwelliant 2 ar y fenter cyllid preifat ei gefnogi. Llywodraeth Geidwadol a ddechreuodd y cynllun menter cyllid preifat, sydd wedi arwain at gynnydd mawr mewn buddsoddiad mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn siwr y bydd pob plaid—heblaw Richard Edwards, sydd wedi newid i'r wrthblaid swyddogol—yn cefnogi'r fenter cyllid preifat fel dull cyfrifol o ddarparu arian sydd yn wirioneddol ychwanegol at yr arian ychwanegol a ddyrannwyd gan y Cynulliad i'r ysgolion.

Earlier in the debate, Huw Lewis mentioned the last 20 years, which is a predictable cry from opposition parties. The current backlog of school repairs is not the Conservative Party's fault. It cannot be ignored that the backlog stems from at least four decades of under investment from the Conservative Party and the Labour Party. We cannot assume that the last 15 or 20 years have caused the sort of damage that has clearly been incurred since the early 1950s.

**Peter Black:** You are arguing about the need for extra money and the fact that we have not proposed any extra money to that coming from Westminster. Are you proposing that the Assembly should have tax-raising powers so that that money could be raised in Wales? How many school buildings could have been fixed with the money that John Redwood sent back to the Treasury?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Perhaps you will ask the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities at the end of the financial year how much of an underspend we will incur, and whether that will be kept as a rollover or whether she will send it back to Westminster. It is interesting that Peter Black mentions this. In his short debate in the Chamber on the backlog of school repairs, he recognised the £350 million backlog. He said that all measures should be taken to raid the budget surplus of 'between £5 billion and £20 billion' that the Chancellor has. He also said that he and his colleagues would do everything possible to ensure that Gordon Brown would give more money to Wales in excess of that which had been allocated. I do not know whether those discussions have been fruitful. I doubt that the Liberal Democrats have even discussed this with their partnership colleagues, or indeed whether he has been to London to lobby the Chancellor, but I will take any other interventions that he wishes to make.

10:55 a.m.

Many of these buildings that are now severely damaged were constructed in the 1950s. I was lucky enough to be educated in a primary school that was constructed in

Yn gynharach yn y ddadl, soniodd Huw Lewis am yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, sydd yn floedd ddisgwyliadwy gan y gwrthbleidiau. Nid bai'r Blaid Geidwadol yw'r gwaith atgyweirio mewn ysgolion sydd wedi ôl-gronni ar hyn o bryd. Ni ellir anwybyddu'r ffaith bod y gwaith hwn sydd wedi ôl-gronni yn deillio o bedair degawd o leiaf o danfuddsoddi gan y Blaid Geidwadol a'r Blaid Lafur. Ni allwn dybio mai'r 15 neu'r 20 mlynedd diwethaf sydd wedi achosi'r math o ddifrod a fu ers dechrau'r 1950au.

**Peter Black:** Yr ydych yn dadlau ynghylch yr angen am arian ychwanegol a'r ffaith nad ydym wedi cynnig bod unrhyw arian yn ychwanegol at hynny yn dod o San Steffan. A gynigiwch y dylai'r Cynulliad gael pwerau codi trethi fel y gellid codi'r arian yng Nghymru? Sawl adeilad ysgol y gellid bod wedi ei hatgyweirio gyda'r arian a anfonodd John Redwood yn ôl i'r Trysorlys?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Efallai y gofynnwch i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol faint o danwario y byddwn yn ei wynebu, ac a gedwir hynny fel swm treiglol neu a gaiff ei anfon yn ôl i San Steffan. Mae'n ddiddorol bod Peter Black yn sôn am hyn. Yn ei ddadl fer yn y Siambr ar y gwaith atgyweirio ysgolion sydd wedi ôl-gronni, cydnabu'r £350 miliwn sydd wedi ôl-gronni. Dywedodd y dylid mynd ati o ddifrif i ysbeilio gwarged y gyllideb o 'rhwng £5 biliwn ac £20 biliwn' sydd gan y Canghellor. Dywedodd hefyd y byddai ef a'i gyd-Aelodau yn gwneud popeth posibl i sicrhau bod Gordon Brown yn rhoi mwy o arian i Gymru yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a ddyrannwyd. Ni wn a fu'r trafodaethau hynny yn llwyddiannus. Mae'n amheus gennyf a drafododd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hyn hyd yn oed gyda'u cyd-Aelodau yn y bartneriaeth, neu yn wir a fu ef yn Llundain i lobio'r Canghellor, ond cymeraf unrhyw ymyriadau eraill y dymuna eu gwneud.

Adeiladwyd llawer o'r adeiladau hyn sydd bellach wedi eu difrodi'n ddifrifol yn y 1950au. Yr oeddwn yn ddigon ffodus i gael fy addysgu mewn ysgol gynradd a

1906; with adequate maintenance, I think that it will last at least another 100 years. The buildings of the turn of the century were far more adequate and sturdy than the nonsense constructed in the early 1950s. Those are the buildings that are causing the problem, not the late Victorian buildings that were constructed at the turn of the twentieth century. The 40 years of problems and bad maintenance have led to our current position, not the 15 or 20 years of Conservative governments that the Labour Party and others wish to point to.

**Val Feld:** Will Jonathan come with me to St Thomas Primary School in my constituency, which was built in the middle of the last century and has water running down the walls, where the local authority has tried to patch over many years, to see the impact of the 18 years when there was no investment in school buildings? I would be delighted to take you, if you would like to come along.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Equally, I would be delighted to take all Members to Trelai Primary School in Caerau in Cardiff where a building that was constructed in the early 1950s suffered at least four decades of under-investment, by governments and by local governments who did not pass on the money that was given to them for school buildings. Incidentally I would quickly point out that the Conservative Party actually invested in excess of £1,000 million. I would like to know from our local authorities where that money went, whether it went on schools and where the money was actually spent. Perhaps I could also take you, Val, to Rhiwbina Junior School, which was raised to the ground by fire. A promise was made that it would be reconstructed by September 2001, which is now postponed until September 2002. So we have had severe difficulties, not just 15 or 20 years, but over the past four and a half decades. We must contend with these problems.

I will push on because I am have already exceeded 10 minutes, my apologies Deputy Presiding Officer.

I want to ask the Minister something specific about the budget: whether you would address

adeiladwyd yn 1906; gyda gwaith cynnal a chadw digonol, credaf y bydd yn para o leiaf 100 mlynedd arall. Yr oedd adeiladau troad y ganrif yn llawer mwy digonol a chadarn na'r sothach a adeiladwyd ar ddechrau'r 1950au. Dyna'r adeiladau sydd yn achosi'r broblem, nid yr adeiladau ar ddiwedd oes Fictoria a adeiladwyd ar droad yr ugeinfed ganrif. Mae'r 40 mlynedd o broblemau a gwaith cynnal a chadw gwael wedi arwain at ein sefyllfa bresennol, nid y 15 neu'r 20 mlynedd o lywodraethau Ceidwadol y dymuna'r Blaid Lafur ac eraill gyfeirio atynt.

**Val Feld:** A wnaiff Jonathan ddod gyda mi i Ysgol Gynradd St Thomas yn fy etholaeth, a adeiladwyd yng nghanol y ganrif ddiwethaf ac sydd â dŵr yn rhedeg i lawr y muriau, lle mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi ceisio eu trwsio dros dro dros lawer o flynyddoedd, i weld effaith y 18 mlynedd pan na fuddsoddwyd o gwbl mewn adeiladau ysgolion? Byddwn yn falch i fynd â chi, os hoffech ddod gyda mi.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn yr un modd, byddwn yn falch o fynd â phob Aelod i Ysgol Gynradd Trelái yng Nghaerau yng Nghaerdydd lle y dioddefodd adeilad a adeiladwyd ar ddechrau'r 1950au bedwar degawd o leiaf o danfuddsoddi, gan lywodraethau a chan lywodraethau lleol na throsglwyddodd yr arian a roddwyd iddynt ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Gyda llaw, hoffwn nodi'n gyflym fod y Blaid Geidwadol wedi buddsoddi mwy na £1,000 miliwn mewn gwirionedd. Hoffwn wybod gan ein hawdurdodau lleol i ble yr aeth yr arian hwnnw, pa un a gafodd ei wario ar ysgolion ai peidio a ble y gwariwyd yr arian mewn gwirionedd. Efallai y gallem fynd â chi, Val, i Ysgol Gynradd Rhiwbeina, a losgwyd yn ulw. Gwnaethpwyd addewid y byddai'n cael ei hailadeiladu erbyn Medi 2001, ond bellach fe'i gohiriwyd tan fis Medi 2002. Felly cawsom anawsterau difrifol, nid dros 15 neu 20 mlynedd yn unig, ond dros y pedwar degawd a hanner diwethaf. Rhaid inni ymgodymu â'r problemau hyn.

Af ymlaen oherwydd yr wyf eisoes wedi mynd y tu hwnt i 10 munud, ac ymddiheuraf Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Yr wyf am ofyn cwestiwn penodol i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â'r gyllideb: a fydddech yn

a proposal for the establishment of an exceptional capital fund, with additional resources. That would allow schools that have suffered a catastrophic event that rendered the building unusable, such as a fire, flooding, or the discovery of asbestos, to bid for funds to get it rebuilt quickly. In many cases, local authorities that are faced with the complete reconstruction of a building half way through their financial planning cycle cannot find the money to rebuild those buildings for their pupils. It would be ideal if the National Assembly for Wales could have a specific fund available for such emergencies and disasters.

I am not convinced by Jocelyn Davies's amendment 6, which mentions the strategic role of local education authorities. There is a strategic role for our schools and governors, namely those who know where the damage is. These people, in their day-to-day management of schools, know where construction, repairs and improvements are needed to improve their pupils' education.

We can no longer debate the state of computer technology in our schools without considering the damp and damaged classrooms within which we expect our computer technology to be sited. We can no longer effectively debate class sizes while ignoring class buildings and we cannot effectively debate recruiting teachers when we expect them to teach in sub-standard buildings. This is not just about buildings; it has an incredible affect over a wide range of education and school services. We have an opportunity to make a difference, so I suggest that we get on with the work.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call on Gareth Jones to propose amendments 3, 4, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiaf welliant 3. Dilëer y gair 'sylweddol' ac ychwaneger ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*ac yn nodi fod y cynnydd o £5.9 miliwn yn y gwariant cyfalaf i ysgolion ond yn prin grafu wyneb y gwerth £325 miliwn o waith*

ymdrin â chynnig i sefydlu cronfa gyfalaf eithriadol, gydag adnoddau ychwanegol. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu i'r ysgolion hynny sydd wedi dioddef digwyddiad trychinebus a wnaeth yr adeilad yn anefnyddiol, megis tân, llifogydd, neu ddarganfod asbestos, wneud cynnig am arian i'w hailadeiladu'n gyflym. Mewn llawer o achosion, ni all awdurdodau lleol sydd yn wynebu'r gwaith o ailadeiladu adeilad yn llwyr hanner ffordd drwy eu cylch cynllunio ariannol ddod o hyd i'r arian i ailadeiladu'r adeiladau hynny ar gyfer eu disgyblion. Byddai'n ddelfrydol pe gallai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael cronfa arbennig ar gyfer argyfyngau a thrychinebau o'r fath.

Nid yw gwelliant 6 Jocelyn Davies, sydd yn sôn am rôl strategol awdurdodau addysg lleol, yn fy argyhoeddi. Mae rôl strategol ar gyfer ein hysgolion a'n llywodraethwyr, yn bennaf y rheini a wŷr ble mae'r difrod. Gŵyr y bobl hynny, wrth reoli ysgolion o ddydd i ddydd, ble mae angen gwneud y gwaith adeiladu, atgyweirio a gwella er mwyn gwella addysg eu disgyblion.

Ni allwn ddadlau bellach am gyflwr technoleg gwybodaeth yn ein hysgolion heb ystyried yr ystafelloedd dosbarth llaith sydd mewn cyflwr gwael y disgwyliwn i'n technoleg gyfrifiadurol gael ei lleoli ynddynt. Ni allwn ddadlau bellach am faint dosbarthiadau yn effeithiol tra'n anwybyddu adeiladau dosbarth ac ni allwn ddadlau am recriwtio athrawon yn effeithiol pan ddisgwyliwn iddynt ddysgu mewn adeiladau is na'r safon. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud ag adeiladau'n unig; mae'n effeithio'n anhygoel ar ystod eang o wasanaethau addysg a gwasanaethau ysgolion. Mae gennym gyfle i wneud gwahaniaeth, felly awgrymaf ein bod yn mynd ymlaen â'r gwaith.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar Gareth Jones i gynnig gwelliannau 3, 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Gareth Jones:** I propose amendment 3. Delete 'significant' and insert at end of motion:

*and notes that the £5.9 million increase in capital expenditure for schools barely scratches the surface of the £325 million*



*atgyweirio mewn ysgolion sydd yn ôl Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn disgwyl cael ei wneud.* *backlog in school repairs, as estimated by the WLGA.*

Cynigiad welliant 4. Ychwaneger cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 4. Add as new clause at end of motion:

*yn ymrwymo i wella a chynnal lefel y buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion yng Nghymru.* *commits itself to providing improved and sustained investment in school buildings in Wales.*

Cynigiad welliant 5. Ychwaneger cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 5. Add as new clause at end of motion:

*yn nodi ei siom y bydd cyfanswm yr arian cyfalaf a neilltuir ar gyfer addysg yn 2001-02 bron £12 miliwn yn is na'r hyn a neilltuwyd yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol.* *notes its disappointment that overall capital funding for education in 2001-02 will be lower than the current financial year by almost £12 million.*

Cynigiad welliant 6. Ychwaneger cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 6. Add as new clause at end of motion:

*yn cydnabod y rôl strategol bwysig y mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn parhau i'w chwarae wrth ddyrannu arian ar gyfer atgyweirio ysgolion yng Nghymru.* *recognises the important strategic role that local education authorities continue to play in allocating funding for school repairs in Wales.*

Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwaneger cymal newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 7. Add as new clause at end of motion:

*wrth ddyrannu gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer ysgolion yn y dyfodol, yn rhoi ystyriaeth drylwyr i:* *in allocating future capital expenditure for schools, gives thorough consideration to:*

- a) *egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd;* a) *the principles of sustainability;*
- b) *ganiatáu i'r gymuned ehangach ddefnyddio cyfleusterau ysgolion.* b) *the use by the wider community of school facilities.*

Datganiad fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig ac aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy. Croesawaf y newyddion da a gawsom gan y Gweinidog am Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. Dymunwn yn dda i'r ysgol hon yn y dyfodol. I declare an interest as a registered teacher and as a member of Conwy County Borough Council. I welcome the good news that we heard from the Minister about Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. We wish this school well in the future.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn tynnu sylw at un o brif wendidau ein gwasanaeth addysg yng Nghymru heddiw. Mae'n deg cydnabod ymdrech y Llywodraeth i unioni'r cam a gwneud iawn am flynyddoedd lawer o danfuddsoddi yn adeiladau ein hysgolion. Mae'r feirniadaeth yn adroddiad diweddaraf Estyn yn llym ar hyn ac yn dweud y cyfan. Er enghraifft, ym mwy na hanner yr ysgolion, This debate draws attention to one of the main weaknesses of our education system in Wales today. It is only right that we recognise the Government's effort to rectify the harm done and compensate for many years of underinvestment in our school buildings. The criticism in Estyn's latest report is damning on this and says it all. For example, in more than half the schools,

caiff diffygion yn yr adeiladau a'r ystafelloedd dosbarth effaith negyddol ar y safonau cyflawniad ac ar ansawdd yr addysg a ddarperir.

Ymhlith y problemau y cyfeirir atynt mewn ysgolion cynradd mae canran arwyddocaol o ystafelloedd dosbarth yn rhy fach i nifer y disygbllion, diffyg neuadd ysgol dderbyniol, problemau ag ansawdd cyffredinol ffabrig yr adeilad a chyfleusterau tai bach gwael. Yn yr ysgolion uwchradd, mae gwyddoniaeth, technoleg gwybodaeth ac addysg gorfforol ymhlith y pynciau mwyaf cyffredin a ddysgir mewn adeiladau ac ystafelloedd anfodddhaol. Mae'r dystiolaeth yno. Mae'r pynciau uchod yn allweddol, ond nid yw'n syndod mai ymhlith y rheini yn y sector uwchradd y mae safonau yn is na'r disgwyl. Mae'n profi'n ddi-os fod y Cynulliad yn iawn i ystyried gwariant ar wella adeiladau ysgolion yn un o'i brif flaenoriaethau.

Pe gadewid y sefyllfa druenus hon i ddirywio, byddai iechyd ein plant a'n hathrawon yn dioddef, byddai morâl yn isel a byddai safonau yn gostwng ymhellach. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon. Hefyd, yn ôl adroddiad Estyn, mae'r ffaith bod rhai ysgolion yn orlawn ac eraill â lleoedd gwag yn deillio o bolisi Thatcheriaid sydd yn gorfodi ysgolion i gystadlu am ddisygbllion, ac felly am gyllid. Byddai Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn diddymu'r math hwnnw o gystadlu diangen a niweidiol. Ni allwn ond gobeithio y bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dylanwadu ar eu partneriaid yn hyn o beth. O'r hyn a glywais neithiwr yn araith y Prif Weinidog arall, y mae ef o'r diwedd yn dechrau gweld y goleuni.

Yr ydym ni fel plaid yn cytuno â'r cynnig mewn egwyddor, ond fel y gwelwch o'n gwelliannau, teimlwn fod gan y Llywodraeth beth ffordd i fynd os yw am ddatrys y broblem sydd yn deillio o etifeddiaeth Thatcher. Yr etifeddiaeth honno sydd yn andwyo ac yn niweidio addysg ein plant ac, yn ôl Estyn, yn dal i danseilio gwaith da ein hathrawon. Mae gwelliant I Jonathan Morgan yn ein hatgoffa bod y weinyddiaeth wedi llaesu dwylo yn ystod y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf ar y mater o fuddsoddi

deficiencies in the buildings and classrooms have a negative effect on the standards of achievement and on the quality of education provided.

Among the problems that are referred to in primary schools are a significant percentage of classrooms that are too small for the number of pupils, a lack of an adequate school hall, problems with the general quality of the building's fabric and poor toilet facilities. In secondary schools, science, information technology and physical education are among the most common subjects that are taught in inadequate buildings and rooms. The evidence is there. Those subjects are of key importance, but it is no surprise that those are the subjects in the secondary sector where standards are lower than the expectation. It proves without a doubt that the Assembly is right to consider expenditure on improving school buildings as one of its main priorities.

If this woeful situation were left to deteriorate, the health of our children and teachers would suffer, morale would be low and standards would decline further. That is a fact. We must address this problem. Also, according to Estyn's report, the fact that some schools are overflowing while others have unfilled places stems from a Thatcherite policy that forces schools to compete for pupils, and therefore for finance. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales would abolish that kind of unnecessary and damaging competition. We can only hope that the Liberal Democrats will bring some influence to bear on their partners in this respect. From what I heard last night in the Prime Minister's speech, he seems to be seeing the light at last.

As a party we agree with the motion in principle, but as you see from our amendments, we feel that the Government has some way to go if it is to resolve the problem that stems from the Thatcher legacy. It is that legacy that harms and damages our children's education and, according to Estyn, still undermines our teachers' good work. Jonathan Morgan's amendment I reminds us that the administration has rested on its laurels during the last three and a half years on the matter of investing in school

mewn adeiladau ysgolion, a byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant.

**Huw Lewis:** You say that Labour has rested on its laurels, but is Plaid Cymru not coming rather late to this party, Gareth? It is interesting to note that in your amendments to the budget debate on 26 October, Plaid Cymru made no mention of this aspect of education. You made no mention of this aspect of education in your amendments to last year's draft budget, and you made no mention of school buildings in your 1999 manifesto for the National Assembly. Are you not coming rather late to the ball?

**Gareth Jones:** Na, ni chredaf hynny o gwbl. Mae'r targed o £3.5 miliwn, efallai £800 miliwn bellach, wedi ein poeni ni fel plaid, ac yn sicr yr ydym wedi gwneud datganiadau lu ar y math hwn o wendid yn y system addysg.

Cytunwn mewn egwyddor â'r cynnig, ond fel y gwelwch o'r gwelliannau, teimlwn fod gan y Llywodraeth beth ffordd i fynd, a rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r etifeddiaeth Thatcheridd yn ein hysgolion. Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 2 Jonathan Morgan, gan ein bod, o ran egwyddor, yn ymwrthod â pholisi o fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau os yw hynny'n golygu dibynnu ar gyfalaf preifat. Gall hynny fod yn fendith mewn rhai ardaloedd lle nad oes dewis arall, a bydd yn rhaid anrhydeddu'r cytundebau hynny y cytunwyd arnynt eisoes. Byddai'n dda inni gofio'r hen ddywediad nad oes y ffasiwn beth â chinio am ddim.

11:05 a.m.

Mae'r gair 'menter' yn ddo'i hun yn ein hatgoffa o'r hyn ydyw: rhywbeth gydag elfen o berygl, perygl ymrwymadau ariannol tymor hir a pherygl agor y drysau i breifateiddio'r gwasanaeth addysg, gan gynnwys cyflogi athrawon. Ar wahân i hynny, byddai dibynnu ar gyfundrefn o'r fath yn golygu y byddai rhai ysgolion yn ennill yn y tymor byr ar draul ysgolion eraill na fyddai'n denu cyfalaf preifat. Gallai hyn arwain at sefyllfaoedd lle byddai rhai ysgolion yn dioddef, yn dod yn anhoblogaidd ac yn cyfrannu at broblemau cymunedol dwys ac anghydraddoldeb yn y

buildings, and we will support the amendment.

**Huw Lewis:** Dywedwch fod Llafur wedi llaesu dwylo, ond onid yw Plaid Cymru yn ymuno â'r parti braidd yn hwyr, Gareth? Mae'n ddiddorol nodi yn ein gwelliannau i'r ddadl ar y gyllideb ar 26 Hydref, na soniodd Plaid Cymru o gwbl am yr agwedd hon ar addysg. Ni soniasoch am yr agwedd hon ar addysg yn eich gwelliannau i gyllideb ddrafft y llynedd, ac ni soniasoch am adeiladau ysgolion yn eich maniffesto ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn 1999. Onid ydych yn dod braidd yn hwyr i'r ddawns?

**Gareth Jones:** No, I do not think so at all. The target of £3.5 million, perhaps £800 million by now, has worried us as a party, and we have certainly made several statements on this sort of weakness in the education system.

We agree in principle with the motion, but as you see from the amendments, we feel that the Government has some way to go, and we must get to grips with the Thatcherite legacy in our schools. We cannot support Jonathan Morgan's amendment 2, as we refute, in principle, a policy of investing in buildings if that means reliance on private capital. That can be a blessing in some areas where there is no other choice, and we must honour those commitments that have already been agreed. We would also do well to remember the saying that there is no such thing as a free lunch.

The word 'initiative' in itself reminds us of what it is: something with an element of risk, the risk of long-term financial commitments and the risk of opening the door to privatising the education service, including the employment of teachers. Apart from that, depending on such a system would mean that some schools would gain in the short term at the expense of other schools that would not attract private capital. This could lead to situations where some schools would suffer, become unpopular and contribute to severe social problems and inequality in educational provision. This is a fact and it could happen.

ddarpariaeth addysgol. Mae hyn yn ffaith a gallai ddigwydd.

Mae hwn yn bolisi Thatcheriaid: gall lwyddo yn y tymor byr ond yn y tymor hir mae iddo ei ansicrwydd a'i wendidau. Mae'n ofid nad yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur, o bawb, yn gweld hynny ac yn cefnu ar bolisi sydd yn gwobrwyo rhai ysgolion ac yn esgeuloso eraill. Mae'r polisi'n cyfrannu at ymrianiad cymdeithasol ac mae'n esgus dros danfuddsoddi gan y Llywodraeth.

Mae'r gwelliannau a gynigiwn yn rhoi mwy o gydbwysedd i'r cynnig gwreiddiol ac maent yn adlewyrchiad llawer tecach o realiti polisiau'r bartneriaeth. Mae'r defnydd o'r gair 'sylweddol', yn ein tyb ni yn gamarweiniol gan nad yw'r cynnydd o £5.9 miliwn yng nghyfalaf ysgolion ond yn crafu wyneb y £325 miliwn, o leiaf, sydd ei angen i atgyweirio ein hysgolion. Oherwydd y diffyg buddsoddi dros y tair blynedd diwethaf mae'r ffigur hwnnw bellach yn agosach at £500 miliwn. Dyna oedd y ffigur a oedd gen i. Mae Jane wedi cyfeirio at £800 miliwn.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn bwysig gan y byddai'n ymrwymo'r Cynulliad unwaith ac am byth i fuddsoddi cyson a chynaliedig mewn adeiladau ysgolion yn hytrach na dilyn y dull mympwyol, anstrategol ac adweithiol a ddefnyddir ar hyn o bryd. Bydd y rhan helaethaf o'r arian ychwanegol hwn yn dibynnu ar y system o fidio, gydag un ysgol neu awdurdod yn bidio yn erbyn y llall. Gallai hynny greu problemau.

Mae'r ffaith fod yr arian a werir y flwyddyn nesaf £12 miliwn yn llai na gwariant eleni yn tanlinellu'r anghysondeb sydd yn y rhaglen wariant ar hyn o bryd. Nodir ein siomiant ar y pwynt hwn yng ngwelliant 5.

Mae gwelliant 6 yn cydnabod rôl strategol bwysig yr awdurdodau lleol o ddyrannu gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer atgyweirio ysgolion Cymru. Mae'n bwysig, gan ei fod yn nod gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid i dargedu pob ceiniog yn ofalus, bod cydgyllunio â'r awdurdodau lleol yn mynd rhagddo yn effeithiol a thryloyw. Mae Jonathan yn awyddus i ysgolion unigol ymgymryd â'r baich hwn, ond mae'n ddrutach mynd ati y

This is a Thatcherite policy: it can succeed in the short term but in the long term it has its uncertainties and weaknesses. It is a cause for concern that the Labour Government, of all people, does not see that and abandon a policy that rewards some schools and neglects others. The policy contributes to social division and it is an excuse for under investment by the Government.

The amendments that we propose give more balance to the original motion and are a much fairer reflection of the reality of the partnership's policies. The use of the word 'significant' is, in our opinion, misleading since the increase of £5.9 million in school capital only scratches the surface of the £325 million, at least, needed to repair our schools. Because of the lack of investment over the last three years, that figure is now nearer £500 million. That was the figure that I had. Jane has referred to £800 million.

Amendment 4 is important as it would commit the Assembly once and for all to consistent and sustained investment in school buildings rather than following the current ad-hoc, unstrategic and reactive method. Most of this additional money will depend on a bidding system, with one school or local authority bidding against the other. That could create problems.

The fact that the money that will be spent next year is £12 million less than this year's spending emphasises the inconsistency in the current spending programme. Our disappointment on this point is noted in amendment 5.

Amendment 6 recognises the strategically important role of the local authorities in allocating capital spending for repairing schools in Wales. It is important, since the Minister for Finance aims to target every penny carefully, that joint planning with local authorities is carried out effectively and transparently. Jonathan is eager for individual schools to take on this burden, but it is more expensive to do it in that way. Schools would

ffordd honno. Byddai ysgolion yn elwa o well dealltwriaeth a chynllunio gydag awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae'n rhaid ichi ystyried yn ofalus y trywydd y byddwch yn ei ddilyn. Rhaid edrych ar y bartneriaeth hon a chael gwell dealltwriaeth gydag awdurdod addysg lleol ac ysgolion.

Mae'r gwelliant olaf, gwelliant 7, yn atgoffa'r Llywodraeth a ninnau fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, o'n hymrwymiad i ddatblygiad cynaliadwy yn y deunyddiau a ddefnyddir i adeiladu ysgolion newydd, i greu swyddi yn y gymuned leol, i ddefnyddio deunyddiau ac ynni adnewyddol ac, wrth gwrs, i sicrhau y gall y gymuned leol ddefnyddio ysgolion ar gyfer eu gweithgareddau. Byddai hynny'n hyrwyddo'r ymdeimlad o fod yn gynhwysol ac yn gosod sylfeini cadarn i ddysgu gydol oes gyda'r bwriad o wella ansawdd bywyd a lleihau neu ddiddymu unrhyw ymranid cymdeithasol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Eight people have expressed a desire to speak. That means five minutes each, which includes time for interventions. I allowed Members who proposed amendments as much time as they wanted, and they spoke for 10 minutes. However, I consulted the Presiding Officer, who informed me that the recommended time for proposing amendments is only five minutes. We had enough time this morning so there was no problem, but I emphasise that the time limit is normally five minutes. In future, if there is not enough time, then Members proposing amendments should limit themselves to five minutes.

**Ann Jones:** I welcome Jane's statement on behalf of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. I must have been one of the first Members to beat your trip to its door as the new Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. I thank you warmly for visiting the school and for responding promptly to its needs. I am sure that this announcement will be warmly received—as it was in the Chamber by those of us who have worked hard on behalf of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn—at the school by the headteacher, Dr Toman, the staff and, not least, the parents and pupils. For them, this is the start of an exciting project that will enable them to improve the quality of education and

benefit from better understanding and planning with local education authorities. You must consider carefully the direction that you will take. We must look at this partnership and achieve better understanding with local education authorities and schools.

The final amendment, amendment 7, reminds the Government and us, as Assembly Members, of our commitment to sustainable development in the materials used to build new schools, to create jobs in local communities, to use renewable materials and energy and, of course, to ensure that local communities can use schools for their activities. That would promote the feeling of inclusivity and would set firm foundations for lifelong learning with the aim of improving quality of life and reducing or abolishing any social division.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae wyth person wedi mynegi eu bod am siarad. Mae hynny'n golygu pum munud yr un, sydd yn cynnwys amser ar gyfer ymyriadau. Caniateais i'r Aelodau a gynigiodd welliannau gymaint o amser ag y dymument, a siaradasant am 10 munud. Fodd bynnag, ymgynghorais â'r Llywydd, a ddywedodd wrthyf mai'r amser a argymhellir ar gyfer cynnig gwelliannau yw pum munud yn unig. Yr oedd gennym ddigon o amser y bore yma felly nid oedd problem, ond pwysleisiaf mai'r terfyn amser yw pum munud fel arfer. Yn y dyfodol, os nad oes digon o amser, yna dylai'r Aelodau sydd yn cynnig gwelliannau gyfyngu eu hunain i bum munud.

**Ann Jones:** Croesawaf ddatganiad Jane ar ran Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. Rhaid mai fi oedd un o'r Aelodau cyntaf i guro eich taith i'w drws fel y Gweinidog newydd dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Diolchaf yn gynnes ichi am ymweld â'r ysgol ac am ymateb yn brydlon i'w hanghenion. Yr wyf yn siwr y croesewir y cyhoeddiad hwn yn gynnes—fel y'i croesawyd yn y Siambr gan y rheini ohonom a fu'n gweithio'n galed ar ran Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn—yn yr ysgol gan y pennaeth, Dr Toman, y staff ac nid lleiaf, y rhieni a'r disgyblion. Iddynt hwy, dyma ddechrau prosiect cyffrous a fydd yn eu galluogi i wella ansawdd yr addysg a chyflwr

conditions in the school. I am glad that you praised the standard of education that those children received in those appalling conditions. That is a result of the commitment of staff and parents.

On Jonathan Morgan's amendment 1, there has been an improvement in the state of school buildings and I am disappointed that he does not recognise that. We can all visit schools in our areas or across the nation, and we can always find the bad schools, which still have crumbling roofs and leaking windows. However, the New Deal for Schools has provided a start. Jane mentioned the 2,000 projects that have been funded under that programme, some of which are in schools in my constituency. They are small projects but they are vital for those schools. Replacing windows and leaking roofs is important to schools because it means not only that they are no longer draughty and that they are dry, but that the children can display their work on classroom walls without it being ruined. That is a vital part of education and learning for children, particularly in primary schools. Such small projects are important.

Some projects under the New Deal for Schools have provided safer playgrounds. That means that playtimes are no longer abandoned due to tarmac holding puddles in a shower of rain. The tarmac is now safer than it was. Therefore, there are improvements. We have a long way to go and not everything in the garden is rosy, but we should pay tribute to the fact that we have started. The commitment of teaching staff and parents never fails to amaze me. When you visit a school on a Friday afternoon just as the parents are collecting their children, you often find teachers donning their overalls and armed with paintbrushes and pots of paint, attempting to make their classrooms brighter for the following week. We must recognise that level of commitment and make clear that they should not be expected to do that. I hope that, as a result of the investment over the next three years for improvements in school, that will be a thing of the past.

yr ysgol. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi canmol safon yr addysg a gafodd y plant hynny o dan yr amgylchiadau ofnadwy hynny. Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i ymrwymiad y staff a'r rhieni.

O ran gwelliant 1 Jonathan Morgan, bu gwelliant yng nghyflwr adeiladau ysgolion ac yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw'n cydnabod hynny. Gall pob un ohonom ymweld ag ysgolion yn ein hardaloedd neu ledled y wlad, gan ddod o hyd i ysgolion gwael bob amser, sydd â thoeau yn adfeilio a ffenestri yn gollwng dŵr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Fargen Newydd i Ysgolion wedi dechrau'r broses. Soniodd Jane am y 2,000 o brosiectau a ariannwyd o dan y rhaglen honno, y mae rhai ohonynt mewn ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i. Prosiectau bach ydynt ond maent yn holl bwysig i'r ysgolion hynny. Mae gosod ffenestri a thoeau newydd yn bwysig i ysgolion gan ei fod yn golygu nid yn unig nad ydynt bellach yn ddrafftig a'u bod yn sych, ond y gall plant arddangos eu gwaith ar furiau'r ystafelloedd dosbarth heb iddo gael ei ddifetha. Mae honno'n rhan holl bwysig o addysg a dysgu i blant, yn arbennig mewn ysgolion cynradd. Mae prosiectau bach o'r fath yn bwysig.

Mae rhai prosiectau o dan y Fargen Newydd i ysgolion wedi darparu ierdydd chwarae mwy diogel. Golyga hynny nad yw amserau chwarae bellach yn dod i ben yn gynnar am fod y tarmac yn dal pyllau o ddŵr mewn cawod o law. Mae'r tarmac bellach yn fwy diogel nag y bu. Felly, mae gwelliannau. Mae gennym lawer o ffordd i fynd eto ac nid yw pethau'n fêl i gyd, ond dylem dalu teyrnged i'r ffaith ein bod wedi dechrau. Nid yw ymrwymiad athrawon a rhieni yn peidio â'm rhyfeddu. Pan ymwelwch ag ysgol ar brynhawn dydd Gwener wrth i'r rhieni gasglu eu plant, fe welwch yr athrawon yn aml yn rhoi eu hoferôls amdanynt a, chyda brwshis paent a photiau paent, yn ceisio gwneud i'w hystafelloedd dosbarth edrych yn well ar gyfer yr wythnos ganlynol. Rhaid inni gydnabod y lefel honno o ymrwymiad ac egluro na ddylid disgwyl iddynt wneud hynny. Gobeithiaf, o ganlyniad i'r buddsoddiad dros y tair blynedd nesaf ar gyfer gwelliannau mewn ysgolion, y bydd hynny'n perthyn i'r oes o'r blaen.

There is an enormous task ahead of us to tackle the backlog of maintenance. Much work remains to be done in many of our schools. I urge the authorities responsible for such schools to complete an audit and a review of the state of their school buildings and forward the information to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning so that we can ensure that the most needy receive the most help. We must examine that. It is not a case of those who shout loudest get most; we must be fair across the board. I urge local authorities to follow the Assembly's lead. As our priority is tackling this, I hope that local authorities will now invest the money that has come centrally in their education budgets. I thank you again, Jane, on behalf of the children of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn and our area. If we ever get a new building, I will push for it to be named the Jane Davidson Hall.

11:15 a.m.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome the money that has been made available today for Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. I first raised this issue regarding the state of the buildings at Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn and the need to develop a centre of excellence about a year ago in a short debate. That idea was supported by other north Wales Members. I am pleased that I was able to have that short debate and, subsequently, to table a statement of opinion calling for this pocket of money. I am pleased that you have responded to that today. I welcome it and the encouragement that it will give to parents and pupils of the school.

Today's debate is timely and I welcome it, because there can be little doubt that current approaches to improving our school buildings are inadequate and are having no tangible effect. Funding levels over many years, despite what other parties have said, have been totally inadequate. Authorities have had to divert money from capital programmes to bolster the sums available for school capital investment. There is doubt about whether or not the best use of resources is being made and we must consider that fact. Much of the money currently spent on upgrading school

Mae tasg enfawr o'n blaenau i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith cynnal a chadw sydd wedi ôl-gronni. Mae llawer o waith eto i'w wneud mewn llawer o'n hysgolion. Anogaf yr awdurdodau sydd yn gyfrifol am ysgolion o'r fath i gwblhau archwiliad ac adolygiad o gyflwr adeiladau eu hysgolion a chyflwyno'r wybodaeth i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes fel y gallwn sicrhau bod y rhai mwyaf anghenus yn cael y cymorth mwyaf. Rhaid inni ymchwilio i hynny. Nid mater o'r rheini sydd yn bloeddio fwyaf sydd yn cael y mwyaf; rhaid inni fod yn deg yn gyffredinol. Anogaf awdurdodau lleol i ddilyn arweiniad y Cynulliad. Gan mai ein blaenoriaeth yw mynd i'r afael â hyn, gobeithiaf y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn awr yn buddsoddi'r arian a ddaeth o'r canol yn eu cylliebau addysg. Diolchaf ichi eto, Jane, ar ran plant Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn a'n hardal. Os byth y cawn adeilad newydd, byddaf yn ymgyrchu dros ei alw yn Neuadd Jane Davidson.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf yr arian a sicrhawyd heddiw ar gyfer Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. Codais y mater ynglŷn â chyflwr adeiladau Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn a'r angen i ddatblygu canolfan ragoriaeth am y tro cyntaf tua blwyddyn yn ôl mewn dadl fer. Cefnogwyd y syniad hwnnw gan Aelodau eraill gogledd Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi gallu cael y ddadl fer honno ac, o ganlyniad, fy mod wedi gallu cyflwyno datganiad barn yn galw am y boced hon o arian. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi ymateb i hynny heddiw. Croesawaf hynny a'r anogaeth y bydd yn ei rhoi i rieni a disgyblion yr ysgol.

Mae'r ddadl heddiw yn un amserol ac fe'i croesawaf, oherwydd nid oes llawer o amheuaeth bod y dulliau cyfredol o wella adeiladau ein hysgolion yn annigonol ac na chânt unrhyw effaith wirioneddol. Bu'r lefelau ariannu dros lawer o flynyddoedd, er gwaethaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y pleidiau eraill, yn hollol annigonol. Mae awdurdodau wedi gorfod dargyfeirio arian o raglenni cyfalaf i ategu'r symiau sydd ar gael ar gyfer buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion. Mae amheuaeth ynghylch a wneir y defnydd gorau o'r adnoddau ai peidio a rhaid inni ystyried y

buildings goes towards achieving the minimum acceptable standards rather than fulfilling a strategic approach and securing lasting improvements. Often, as other speakers have said, partial repairs and improvements are made, leaving many things undone. It is easy to spend a penny to save a pound, but, unfortunately, if you do not replace the slate that is missing from the roof, you may end up having to replace the whole roof.

We can all testify to the appalling state of school buildings throughout Wales. One of the leading secondary schools in Wales, Ysgol Brynhyfryd in Ruthin, for example, has over 15 mobile classrooms, some of which are in appalling conditions. It has a corridor that is almost permanently closed due to a leaking roof. There is a primary school in Ruthin that houses all of its junior and nursery school classes in mobile classrooms. Those are just two examples, but there are similar situations throughout Wales. Despite the appalling physical conditions, the standard of education in those schools is excellent, but how much better it could be, and how much higher staff morale would be, if we could get to grips with the problems in our school buildings. I welcome the new money that has been made available, but I fear that, without a strategic plan preceded by a full audit, it will merely be papering over the cracks. One south Wales school has resorted to covering over the cracks with a shower curtain.

Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales does not expect that, as ‘Betterwales.com’ states, by 2010 all school buildings will be in good physical shape and properly maintained, if a patchwork approach is continued. There is a need, as Jane said, for a more strategic and planned approach to capital projects, and with a view to achieving this, authorities are being encouraged to develop asset management plans. These plans would serve as an audit of the situation in each school authority and would inform the National Assembly and its Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities and Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning of authorities’ various needs. The Assembly

ffaith honno. Â llawer o’r arian a gaiff ei wario ar wella adeiladau ysgolion ar hyn o bryd tuag at gyflawni’r isafswm safonau derbynol yn hytrach na chyflawni ymagwedd strategol a sicrhau gwelliannau parhaol. Yn aml, fel y dywedodd llefarwyr eraill, gwneir gwaith atgyweirio a gwelliannau rhannol, gan adael llawer o bethau heb eu gwneud. Mae’n hawdd gwario ceiniog i arbed punt, ond, yn anffodus, os na brynwch lechen newydd yn lle’r un sydd ar goll o’r to, efallai y bydd yn rhaid ichi osod to newydd yn y pen draw.

Gall pob un ohonom dystio i gyflwr gwarthus adeiladau ysgolion ledled Cymru. Mae gan un o’r ysgolion uwchradd arweinidol yng Nghymru, Ysgol Brynhyfryd yn Rhuthun, er enghraifft, fwy na 15 o ystafelloedd symudol, ac mae rhai ohonynt mewn cyflwr gwarthus. Mae ganddi goridor sydd ar gau bron yn barhaol am fod y to yn gollwng. Mae ysgol gynradd yn Rhuthun lle mae pob dosbarth cynradd a meithrin mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth symudol. Dwy enghraifft yn unig yw’r rheini, ond mae sefyllfaoedd tebyg ledled Cymru. Er gwaethaf yr amgylchiadau ffisegol gwarthus, mae safon yr addysg yn yr ysgolion hynny yn rhagorol, ond byddai cymaint gwell, a byddai ysbryd y staff cymaint yn uwch, pe bawn yn gallu mynd i’r afael â’r problemau yn adeiladau ein hysgolion. Croesawaf yr arian newydd a sicrhawyd, ond mae arnaf ofn, heb gynllun strategol wedi ei ragflaenu gan archwiliad llawn, mai papuro dros y craciau fydd hyn yn unig. Mae un ysgol yn ne Cymru wedi troi at ddefnyddio llen gawod i guddio’r craciau.

Nid yw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn disgwyl, fel y nodi ‘Gwellcymru.com’, y bydd pob adeilad ysgol yn 2010 mewn cyflwr ffisegol da ac yn cael eu cynnal a’u cadw’n gywir, os parheir i arddel ymagwedd glytwaith. Fel y dywedodd Jane, mae angen ymagwedd fwy strategol a chynlluniedig tuag at brosiectau cyfalaf, a chyda’r bwriad o gyflawni hyn, anogir awdurdodau i ddatblygu cynlluniau rheoli asedau. Byddai’r cynlluniau hyn yn gweithredu fel archwiliad o’r sefyllfa ym mhob awdurdod ysgol ac yn hysbysu’r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a’i Weinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a’r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am anghenion amrywiol yr awdurdodau.



would be in a better position to judge the merits of the investment in school buildings. That is not to call for yet more bureaucracy, but not enough information is held centrally by the National Assembly on the state of our school buildings. It is not a question of giving local government responsibility to the National Assembly, but if there is to be effective and well-guided leadership from the Assembly on this matter, that leadership needs to be better informed about the extent of the job in hand.

Authorities want a greater degree of certainty and security in capital programmes, following long periods recently when capital projects were restricted. Despite the high hopes of many, the private finance initiative does not appear to be the answer. While the successful bidders celebrate the expensive initiatives in their areas, the majority of Welsh schools in severe disrepair will not attract PFI funding and will continue to hope for reliable, sustained and increased investment from the National Assembly. I welcome the proposal for a strategic plan. I look forward to us being able to get to grips with this bad underfunding and lack of capital investment in schools.

**Peter Law:** I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this important debate. This is an opportunity for us to celebrate the message in Jane Davidson's statement: that we are moving forward to achieve something positive for our young people. They are the most important people. They are tomorrow's generation and we want them to have decent facilities, because the least we can do is provide them with a good education, with decent facilities and modern schools. That is what Jane's statement is all about. It comes as a result of an excellent comprehensive spending review from a Labour UK Government. I pay tribute to that Government, which I support. That money is cascaded and today's statement tells us that £293 million, nearly £300 million, will be invested in schools over the next three years, which is long overdue. It is fair to say that much good work has been carried out in the last three years.

Byddai'r Cynulliad mewn gwell sefyllfa i farnu rhinweddau buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Nid galw am ragor o fiwrocratiaeth yw hynny, ond ni chedwir digon o wybodaeth yn ganolog gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gyflwr adeiladau ein hysgolion. Nid yw'n gwestiwn o roi cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol ar ysgwyddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ond er mwyn cael arweinyddiaeth effeithiol wedi ei harwain yn dda gan y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn, mae angen i'r arweinyddiaeth honno fod yn fwy gwybodus ynglŷn â maint y gwaith dan sylw.

Mae awdurdodau am gael mwy o sicrwydd a diogelwch mewn rhaglenni cyfalaf, yn dilyn cyfnodau hir yn ddiweddar pan gyfyngwyd ar brosiectau cyfalaf. Er gwaethaf gobeithion mawr llawer, nid ymddengys mai'r fenter cyllid preifat yw'r ateb. Er bod y cynigwyr llwyddiannus yn dathlu'r mentrau drud yn eu hardaloedd, ni fydd y mwyafrif o ysgolion Cymru y mae angen eu hatgyweirio'n ddifrifol yn denu arian y fenter cyllid preifat a pharhânt i obeithio am fuddsoddiad dibynadwy, cynaliadwy a chynyddol gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Croesawaf y cynnig am gynllun strategol. Edrychaf ymlaen inni allu mynd i'r afael â'r tanariannu gwael hwn a'r diffyg buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion.

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddatl bwysig hon. Mae hwn yn gyfle inni ddathlu'r neges yn natganiad Jane Davidson ein bod yn symud ymlaen i gyflawni rhywbeth cadarnhaol i'n pobl ifanc. Hwyt-hwy yw'r bobl bwysicaf. Hwyt-hwy yw cenhedlaeth yfory ac yr ydym am iddynt gael cyfleusterau da, oherwydd y peth lleiaf y gallwn ei wneud yw rhoi addysg dda iddynt, gyda chyfleusterau da ac ysgolion modern. Dyna beth sydd wrth wraidd datganiad Jane. Daw o ganlyniad i adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU. Talaf deyrnged i'r Llywodraeth honno, a gefnogaf. Rhaeadrir yr arian hwnnw a dywed y datganiad heddiw wrthym y caiff £293 miliwn, bron £300 miliwn, ei fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Bu hir ddisgwyl am hynny. Mae'n deg dweud bod llawer o waith da wedi cael ei wneud yn y tair blynedd diwethaf.

I am delighted and proud that the Minister mentioned that today a new school has been opened in Blaenau Gwent, the Rose Hayworth school, which we call the millennium school. It is being opened as a result of Labour Government policies. Labour recognised all those decades of mismanagement and lack of investment from the Conservatives, who had the audacity to table amendment 1. I do not know how they had the nerve to even write that amendment, bearing in mind what we have to live with today as a result of their policies. However, that is the reality of politics.

A situation is developing where class sizes are being reduced to 30 and all four-year-olds are receiving nursery education. These commitments were made in 1997, when the Labour Government came into power. We can carry those commitments through with a Welsh approach. That is what is so important about Jane's statement. I welcome her announcement. I welcome her announcement on Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn in Denbighshire and congratulate her on that. I share Members' joy about that, because those children are the most vulnerable in society and they need that support. She has made a great decision.

I turn to today's amendments. I have dealt with some of them already, because we are discussing figures and many things can be said about figures, but at the end of the day, £300 million is a commitment to getting things right for our communities. The private finance initiative is mentioned. PFI is one option that is available, but let us not throw ourselves overboard on PFI. We have used it because we needed to use it where appropriate. However, at the same time, we need to have confidence in our local education authorities. They play the most important role as the strategic planners in those areas on educational matters. We must ensure that they have the funding to be able to provide the much needed new developments in our communities.

Other Members have referred to their constituencies, and in my own constituency of Blaenau Gwent, I have received a list of up

Yr wyf wrth fy modd ac yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi sôn heddiw bod ysgol newydd wedi agor ym Mlaenau Gwent, ysgol Rose Hayworth, a alwn yn ysgol y mileniwm. Fe'i hagarir o ganlyniad i bolisiau Llywodraeth Lafur. Cydnabu Llafur yr holl ddegawdau hynny o gamreolaeth a diffyg buddsoddiad gan y Ceidwadwyr, oedd â'r haerllugrwydd i gyflwyno gwelliant 1. Ni wn sut yr oedd ganddynt y wyneb i ysgrifennu'r gwelliant hwnnw hyd yn oed, o gofio'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddiodef heddiw o ganlyniad i'w polisiau hwy. Fodd bynnag, dyna realiti gwleidyddiaeth.

Mae sefyllfa yn datblygu lle y caiff maint dosbarthiadau eu gostwng i 30 a chaiff pob plentyn pedair blwydd oed addysg feithrin. Gwnaethpwyd yr ymrwymadau hyn yn 1997, pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur i rym. Gallwn gyflawni'r ymrwymadau hynny gydag ymagwedd Gymreig. Dyna beth sydd mor bwysig am ddatganiad Jane. Croesawaf ei chyhoeddiad ynglŷn ag Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn yn Sir Ddinbych a hoffwn ei llongyfarch ar hynny. Rhannaf lawenydd yr Aelodau ynglŷn â hynny, gan mai'r plant hynny yw'r rhai mwyaf bregus mewn cymdeithas ac mae angen y gefnogaeth honno arnynt. Gwnaeth benderfyniad gwyh.

Trof at welliannau heddiw. Ymdriniais â rhai ohonynt eisoes, gan ein bod yn trafod ffigurau a gellir dweud llawer o bethau am ffigurau, ond ar ddiwedd y dydd, mae £300 miliwn yn ymrwymiad i wneud pethau'n iawn ar gyfer ein cymunedau. Sonnir am y fenter cyllid preifat. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat yn un opsiwn sydd ar gael, ond gadewch inni beidio â mynd dros ben llestri ynglŷn â'r fenter. Fe'i defnyddiasom gan fod angen inni ei defnyddio lle bo hynny'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, ar yr un pryd, mae angen inni gael hyder yn ein hawdurdodau addysg lleol. Chwaraeant y rôl bwysicaf fel y cynllunwyr strategol yn y meysydd hynny sydd yn canolbwyntio ar faterion addysgol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod yr arian ganddynt i allu darparu'r datblygiadau newydd sydd eu hangen yn ddirfawr yn ein cymunedau.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at eu hetholaethau, ac yn fy etholaeth i ym Mlaenau Gwent, cefais restr o hyd at £30

to £30 million of work that needs to be completed. This includes extensions in Georgetown Primary School in Tredegar and Deighton Primary School in Tredegar, where £1 million is needed to replace the demountables. It includes the refurbishment of Abertillery Primary and Nursery School and major refurbishment in Waunlwyd Primary School, Cwm Primary School, Willowtown Infant and Nursery School, Briery Hill Primary School, Glyncoed Junior School, Beaufort Hill Primary School, Garnlydan Primary School and Blaina Infants School. These are the most socially deprived people—

**Ron Davies:** There is an election coming up, is there?

**Peter Law:** I want Members to hear, because these deprived people are never mentioned anywhere. Today, as their representative, I am mentioning them in the National Assembly. I want them to know that we, and the Minister, are focused on making funding available to them and to other communities in Wales that have not had a fair deal for so many years.

Today, we can rejoice in the Minister's statement, which is another milestone in positive development. This is a Labour UK Government working with a Labour Government of Wales—with a couple of additions. However, generally, it is the work of the Labour Government of Wales.

I agree with the point about sustainability. If sustainability had been on the agenda of the last Tory Government, we would not have to replace some of the schools that it built only 20 years ago. This problem reflects why sustainability is so important. We have an opportunity to provide decent facilities and a positive future for young people. That is what we owe the generations of tomorrow. I support the motion.

11:25 a.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I start by affirming my personal support for the partnership Government. I know that the partnership brew is not to

miliwn o waith y mae angen ei wneud. Mae hyn yn cynnwys estyniadau yn Ysgol Gynradd Georgetown yn Nhredegar ac Ysgol Gynradd Deighton yn Nhredegar, lle mae angen £1 filiwn i brynu cabanau newydd. Mae'n cynnwys adnewyddu Ysgol Gynradd ac Ysgol Feithrin Abertyleri a gwaith adnewyddu mawr yn Ysgol Gynradd Waunlwyd, Ysgol Gynradd Cwm, Ysgol Babanod ac Ysgol Feithrin Willowtown, Ysgol Gynradd Briery Hill, Ysgol Iau Glyncoed, Ysgol Gynradd Beaufort Hill, Ysgol Gynradd Garnlydan ac Ysgol Babanod y Blaenau. Dyma'r bobl fwyaf gymdeithasol-ddifreintiedig—

**Ron Davies:** Mae etholiad ar y gweill, onid oes?

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf am i'r Aelodau glywed, gan na sonnir byth am y bobl ddifreintiedig hyn yn unman arall. Heddiw, fel eu cynrychiolydd, soniaf amdanynt yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yr wyf am iddynt wybod ein bod ninnau, a'r Gweinidog, yn canolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod arian ar gael iddynt hwy ac i gymunedau eraill yng Nghymru nad ydynt wedi cael bargaen deg ers cymaint o flynyddoedd.

Heddiw, gallwn lawenhau yn natganiad y Gweinidog, sydd yn garreg filltir arall mewn datblygiad cadarnhaol. Dyma Lywodraeth Lafur y DU yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru—gydag ychydig o ychwanegiadau. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, gwaith Llywodraeth Lafur Cymru ydyw.

Cytunaf â'r pwynt ynglŷn â chynaliadwyedd. Pe bai cynaliadwyedd wedi bod ar agenda y Llywodraeth Doriadaidd ddiwethaf, ni fyddem yn gorfod adeiladu ysgolion newydd yn lle'r rhai a adeiladodd ond 20 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'r broblem hon yn adlewyrchu pam bod cynaliadwyedd mor bwysig. Mae gennym gyfle i ddarparu cyfleusterau da a dyfodol cadarnhaol i bobl ifanc. Dyna yw ein dyled i genedlaethau yfory. Cefnogaf y cynnig.

**Alun Pugh:** Dechreuaf drwy gadarnhau fy nghefnogaeth bersonol i'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Gwn nad yw'r bartneriaeth at

everyone's taste—on Tuesday we heard much about Lloyd George—but any brew that is 28 parts Aneurin Bevan, six parts Lloyd George and no parts John Redwood is fine by me. One feature of any coalition is an agreement on a common programme. The Liberal Democrats wanted free prescriptions for under 25-year-olds, Welsh Labour insisted on free bus travel for pensioners, but both parties agreed that the Tory legacy of crumbling schools must be addressed.

The Government of Wales is today confirming a major programme of school building upgrades. As a former teacher, I have vivid memories of teaching A-level courses in a damp, chilly portakabin. The improvements will take time, but for pupils and teachers, they cannot come soon enough. It is tempting, in a debate such as this, to go for a few column inches in the *Denbigh Free Press* and to detail, once again, my concerns about Ysgol Brynhyfryd in Ruthin. It is a school with fine teaching and leadership that is trying to broaden its curriculum in a field of portakabins, in a sea of mud. However, an Assembly debate needs to be more strategic than simply stating concerns for individual schools, important though they are. We need to consider—and no-one in this session has yet done so—what type of accommodation is most appropriate for a twenty-first century school. We must do more than simply fix Tory leaks.

What type of learning accommodation best suits the information age? What type of accommodation—

**David Davies:** Point of order. We are not called the 'Tory Party'. The party of the Member speaking would be the first to complain if we did not use correct terminology.

**Delyth Evans:** That is not a point of order.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for the advice. You heard what was said, Alun.

ddant pawb—ar ddydd Mawrth clywsom lawer am Lloyd George—ond mae unrhyw bartneriaeth sydd yn 28 rhan o Aneurin Bevan, chwe rhan o Lloyd George a dim un rhan o John Redwood yn iawn o'm rhan i. Un nodwedd o unrhyw glymblaid yw cytundeb ar raglen gyffredin. Yr oedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am roi presgripsiynau am ddim i bobl o dan 25 oed, mynnodd Llafur Cymru gael tocynnau bws am ddim i bensiywyr, ond cytunodd y ddwy blaid bod yn rhaid ymdrin â phroblem ysgolion yn dadfeilio a etifeddasom gan y Torïaid.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru heddiw yn cadarnhau rhaglen fawr o waith gwella adeiladau ysgolion. Fel cyn athro, mae gennyf atgofion byw o addysgu cyrsiau safon uwch mewn caban llaith, oer. Cymer y gwelliannau amser, ond i'r disgyblion a'r athrawon, ni allant ddod yn ddigon buan. Caf fy nhentio, mewn dadl fel hon, i fynd am golofn fechan yn y *Denbigh Free Press* a chrybwyll, unwaith yn rhagor, fy mhryderon am Ysgol Brynhyfryd yn Rhuthun. Mae'n ysgol gydag athrawon ac arweinyddiaeth dda sydd yn ceisio ehangu ei chwricwlwm mewn cae o gabanau, mewn môr o fwd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i ddadl y Cynulliad fod yn fwy strategol na dim ond nodi pryderon am ysgolion unigol, er eu bod yn bwysig. Mae angen inni ystyried—ac nid oes neb yn y sesiwn hon wedi gwneud hynny eto—pa fath o adeilad sydd fwyaf priodol ar gyfer ysgol yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Rhaid inni wneud mwy nag unioni'r hyn a achoswyd gan y Torïaid.

Pa fath o adeilad dysgu sydd yn gweddu orau i'r oes wybodaeth? Pa fath o adeilad—

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Nid y 'Blaid Doriadd' yw ein henw. Plaid yr Aelod sydd yn siarad ar hyn o bryd fyddai'r cyntaf i gwyno pe na bawn yn defnyddio'r derminoleg gywir.

**Delyth Evans:** Nid pwynt o drefn yw hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Diolch ichi am y cyngor. Fe glywsoch yr hyn a ddywedwyd, Alun.

**Alun Pugh:** They may be called 'Conservatives' but the party's official website address last year was [www.tory.com](http://www.tory.com). I do not quite understand, therefore, what David is trying to say.

What type of accommodation best supports the learning process when computing, television and telecoms merge? What type of accommodation best supports teachers when their role is more that of a learning coach, rather than a talking textbook? Replacing 12 portakabins with a modern teaching block containing 12 classrooms would be a huge improvement. It would also be a strategic mistake. I want to place on record my support for learning centres in secondary schools. They are locations that offer a pupil-centred experience to complement teacher-led activities. Properly equipped learning centres would contain large numbers of multi-media personal computers with a reasonable bandwidth connection to the internet. They would also contain a balanced mixture of academic and support staff. Learning centres can provide a huge, cost-effective input into the learning process, and a foundation for subsequent episodes of information and communication technology-based lifelong learning. They do not need to follow the operating constraints of the school day or the school year, and are one way of closing the digital divide. Learning centres can also be a community resource.

My main concern is that 22 small local education authorities, with precious little experience of building new schools, will use an outdated and inappropriate nineteenth century learning model as the basis for a twenty-first century building programme, insofar as the theory and practice of learning models impacts at all on the consciousness of local authority building departments. A twenty-first century building programme must be about clicks and mortar, not just bricks and mortar. The Assembly must take an intellectual lead in this process, providing expertise as well as money.

I speak with experience on this matter,

**Alun Pugh:** Efallai y gelwir hwy'n 'Geidwadwyr' ond cyfeiriad gwefan swyddogol y blaid y llynedd oedd [www.tory.com](http://www.tory.com). Felly nid wyf yn deall yn hollol beth mae David yn ceisio ei ddweud.

Pa fath o adeilad sydd yn cefnogi'r broses ddysgu orau pan fydd cyfrifiadura, teledu a thelathrebu yn cyfuno? Pa fath o adeilad sydd yn cefnogi athrawon orau pan fydd eu rôl yn golygu bod yn fwy o hyfforddwr dysgu, yn hytrach na gwerslyfr llafar? Byddai adeiladu bloc addysgu modern yn cynnwys 12 o ystafelloedd dosbarth yn lle 12 caban yn welliant mawr. Byddai hefyd yn gamgymeriad strategol. Yr wyf am gofnodi fy nghefnogaeth dros ganolfannau dysgu mewn ysgolion uwchradd. Maent yn lleoliadau sydd yn cynnig profiad sydd yn canolbwyntio ar y disgybl i ategu gweithgareddau o dan arweiniad yr athro. Byddai canolfannau dysgu â'r offer cywir yn cynnwys nifer fawr o gyfrifiaduron personol amlgyfrwng gyda chysylltiad ystod rhesymol â'r rhyngwyd. Byddent hefyd yn cynnwys cymysgedd cytbwys o staff academaidd a staff cymorth. Gall canolfannau dysgu ddarparu mewnbwn enfawr, cost-effeithiol i'r broses ddysgu, a bod yn sail ar gyfer datblygiadau dilynol o dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu yn seiliedig ar ddysgu gydol oes. Nid oes angen iddynt ddilyn cyfyngiadau gweithredol y diwrnod ysgol neu'r flwyddyn ysgol, ac mae'n un ffordd o gau'r bwlch digidol. Gall canolfannau dysgu fod yn adnodd cymunedol hefyd.

Fy mhrif bryder yw y bydd 22 o awdurdodau addysg lleol bach, heb fawr ddim profiad o adeiladu ysgolion newydd, yn defnyddio model dysgu hen ffasiwn ac amhriodol o'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg yn sail ar gyfer rhaglen adeiladu o'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, i'r graddau bod theori ac arfer modelau dysgu yn effeithio ar ymwybyddiaeth adrannau adeiladu awdurdod lleol o gwbl. Rhaid i raglen adeiladu o'r unfed ganrif ar hugain ymwneud â chliciau a mortar, nid â briciau a mortar yn unig. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad fod yn arweinydd deallusol yn y broses hon, gan ddarparu arbenigedd yn ogystal ag arian.

Siaradaf o brofiad ar y mater hwn, gan fy

having commissioned learning centres in a former life. It is unusual for politicians to confess to mistakes, least of all in Plenary. However, I would like to share with you two of my mistakes, which, as a nation, we should not repeat. First, is the buying of equipment that is barely adequate to do today's job—the Siemens' syndrome. As a result, teachers and learners could become understandably frustrated with the learning experience offered in such centres. Under-investing in slow networks makes no financial or educational sense. Secondly, and crucially, is the under-estimation of the cultural changes and of the staff development required to support teachers in a transformed role. That is not just a problem for teachers, of course. You only need to ask a doctor or lawyer about the impact of the internet, when a patient or client arrives armed with a sheaf of material collected from the web and starts asking searching questions. When you are no longer the gatekeeper to knowledge, you must rethink your approach to the process.

Finally, I thank Jane Davidson for a welcome and prompt response to the problems of Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. It is right that the Assembly does not immerse itself in the detail of every school in Wales, but this special school demands a regional approach and leadership. You have done precisely that, Jane. The parents, pupils and staff will be delighted at this morning's announcement, as am I.

**Ron Davies:** I agree with Alun Pugh's comments. This is a welcome statement. We should all commend the fact that our Labour Government is investing so much money in education. However, I take issue with him on one point. This is not a product of a partnership. We do not have to thank the Liberal Democrats for what is, essentially, a Labour programme. It is inconceivable to think that anybody would have opposed this expenditure. It has even been welcomed by the Conservative Party, I understand. Our genuflections in the direction of the Liberal Democrats, therefore, should not be too humble.

mod wedi comisiynu canolfannau dysgu mewn bywyd cynharach. Mae'n anarferol i wleidyddion gyfaddef camgymeriadau, heb sôn am wneud hynny mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn rannu dau o'm camgymeriadau â chi, na ddylem, fel cenedl, eu hailadrodd. Yn gyntaf, prynu offer nad yw prin yn ddigonol i wneud gwaith heddiw—syndrom Siemens. O ganlyniad, gallai athrawon a dysgwyr fynd yn rhwystredig iawn â'r profiad dysgu a gynigir mewn canolfannau o'r fath a hynny'n ddealladwy. Nid yw tanfuddsoddi mewn rhwydweithiau araf yn gwneud unrhyw synnwyr ariannol nac addysgol. Yn ail, ac yn holl bwysig, tanbrisir y newidiadau diwylliannol a'r datblygiad staff sydd ei angen i gefnogi athrawon mewn rôl newydd. Nid problem i athrawon yn unig yw hon, wrth gwrs. Gofynnwch i feddyg neu gyfreithiwr am effaith y rhyngwrld, pan fydd claf neu gleient yn cyrraedd gyda bwndel o ddeunydd wedi ei gasglu o'r we ac yn dechrau gofyn cwestiynau treiddgar. Pan nad ydych bellach yn geidwad porth i wybodaeth, rhaid ichi ailfeddwl eich ymagwedd tuag y broses.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i Jane Davidson am ymateb prydlon, sydd i'w groesawu i broblemau Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn. Mae'n iawn nad yw'r Cynulliad yn ymgolli ym manylion pob ysgol yng Nghymru, ond mae'r ysgol arbennig hon yn galw am ymagwedd ac arweinyddiaeth ranbarthol. Dyna'r union beth yr ydych wedi ei wneud, Jane. Bydd y rhieni, y disgyblion a'r staff wrth eu boddau wrth glywed y cyhoeddiad y bore yma, fel yr wyf innau.

**Ron Davies:** Cytunaf â sylwadau Alun Pugh. Mae croeso i'r datganiad hwn. Dylai pob un ohonom ganmol y ffaith bod ein Llywodraeth Lafur yn buddsoddi cymaint o arian mewn addysg. Fodd bynnag, anghytunaf ag ef ar un pwynt. Nid cynnyrch partneriaeth yw hyn. Nid oes yn rhaid inni ddiolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am yr hyn sydd, yn y bôn, yn rhaglen y blaid Lafur. Mae'n anhygoel meddwl y byddai unrhyw un wedi gwrthwynebu'r gwariant hwn. Fe'i croesawyd hyd yn oed gan y Blaid Geidwadol, fel y deallaf. Felly ni ddylem blygu glin yn ormodol, i gyfeiriad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

I well remember travelling around my constituency with John Redwood, when he was Secretary of State for Wales, and pointing out to him the crumbling fabric of the schools, particularly Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni and Lewis' Boys School in Pengam. Those schools were in a dreadful state and obviously the first priority for any expenditure. Yet we were not able to get that expenditure from the Government. We had to wait until 1997 and for a change of Government. It was in such circumstances that I, and many other Labour Party members, came to accept the principle of the private finance initiative as an expedient. I take issue with amendment 2, and I have asked Jane for an explanation as to why she wants us to support it. I hope that she will be able to return to that in her closing speech and give us a more convincing answer. Amendment 2 seeks to turn PFI from being a short-term expedient into an elevated principle. I cannot accept that, because PFI is not a principle that I want to endorse. I accepted it as a necessary evil in the post-John Redwood, William Hague period, but I am not prepared to endorse it now as a principle and as something that should continue indefinitely.

Amendment 2 is flawed. No-one can argue that PFI represents a solution to the problem of finding expenditure for schools. At best, it is a short-term measure. All the analysis shows that PFI can last for a period of perhaps 10 years. Once you exceed that period, the repayments are such that you will find that it would have been better to have funded the expenditure from the public sector in the first place. I accept PFI as a short-term expedient. The schools that I mentioned are about to embark on what will be an exciting PFI, which I welcome and support. However, I am not blind to the fact that if we had had conventional public sector funding for those schools, we would not have had to endure a tortuous two years of waiting and negotiating. The schools could have been built two years ago and would be on-stream by now. We should not, therefore, recognise PFI as a solution, and I am disappointed that we are being asked to support an amendment that suggests that.

Cofiaf deithio o amgylch fy etholaeth gyda John Redwood, pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, gan ddangos ffabrig adfeiliog yr ysgolion, yn arbennig Ysgol Gyfun Cwm Rhymni ac Ysgol Lewis i Fechgyn ym Mhngam. Yr oedd yr ysgolion hynny mewn cyflwr ofnadwy ac yn amlwg dyma oedd y flaenoriaeth gyntaf ar gyfer unrhyw wariant. Ac eto ni lwyddasom i gael y gwariant hwnnw gan y Llywodraeth. Bu'n rhaid inni aros tan 1997 ac am y newid mewn Llywodraeth. O dan amgylchiadau o'r fath y deuthum i, a llawer o aelodau eraill y Blaid Lafur, i dderbyn egwyddor y fenter cyllid preifat fel ateb i'r broblem. Rhaid imi anghytuno â gwelliant 2, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i Jane esbonio pam y mae am inni ei gefnogi. Gobeithiaf y gall ddychwelyd at hynny yn ei haraith gloi gan roi ateb mwy pendant inni. Ceisia gwelliant 2 droi'r fenter cyllid preifat o fod yn ateb tymor byr yn egwyddor aruchel. Ni allaf dderbyn hynny, gan nad yw'r fenter cyllid preifat yn egwyddor yr wyf am ei chymeradwyo. Fe'i derbyniais fel drwg angenrheidiol yn y cyfnod yn dilyn John Redwood a William Hague, ond nid wyf yn barod i'w gymeradwyo yn awr fel egwyddor ac fel rhywbeth a ddylai barhau yn ddiderfyn.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn wallus. Ni all neb ddadlau bod y fenter cyllid preifat yn ateb i'r broblem o ddod o hyd i wariant ar gyfer ysgolion. Ar y gorau, mesur tymor byr ydyw. Dengys yr holl ddadansoddi y gall y fenter cyllid preifat barhau am gyfnod o 10 mlynedd efallai. Unwaith yr ewch y tu hwnt i'r cyfnod hwnnw, bydd yr ad-daliadau yn golygu y byddech yn gweld y byddai wedi bod yn well pe baech wedi ariannu'r gwariant o'r sector cyhoeddus yn y lle cyntaf. Derbyniaf y fenter cyllid preifat fel ateb tymor byr. Mae'r ysgolion y soniais amdanynt ar fin cychwyn ar yr hyn a fydd yn fenter cyllid preifat gyffrous, yr wyf yn ei chroesawu ac yn ei chefnogi. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn ddall i'r ffaith na fyddem wedi gorfod dioddef dwy flynedd arteithiol o aros a negodi, pe baem wedi cael arian confensiynol y sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer yr ysgolion hynny. Gellid bod wedi adeiladu'r ysgolion hynny ddwy flynedd yn ôl a byddem ar y trywydd iawn erbyn hyn. Ni ddylem, felly, gydnabod y fenter cyllid preifat fel ateb, ac yr wyf yn siomedig y

gofynnir inni gefnogi gwelliant sydd yn awgrymu hynny.

11:35 a.m.

Amendment 2 also states that PFI is a way of maximising investment in education. It is nothing of the sort. The Government can maximise expenditure in education in half a dozen different ways. It can divert expenditure from other areas. If it were minded to, it could raise taxes, although I am not sure that that is necessary under the present economic circumstances. I am not sure that my party would thank me for suggesting that that is an option. However, it is an option if we want to maximise expenditure on education. We could use the resources that are currently being held by central Government; we could release those funds. Therefore, we do not have to go down the PFI route to maximise expenditure on education.

My third reservation is that amendment 2 does not suggest that there are any difficulties with PFI. However, there are enormous difficulties with PFI. The management of PFI presents great difficulty for local authorities that are trying to embark on those partnerships. It creates enormous difficulty for the teaching and the non-teaching staff who work in our schools. I am not convinced that PFI offers a solution. The arrangements being put in place to protect the interests of non-teaching staff, who are an important part of the school regime are not adequate. I am not diminishing the value of teachers, but non-teaching staff are just as important, ensuring that the fabric of the school is maintained and that ancillary services are available to provide a good education. PFI does not take their interests into consideration, and I am afraid that this amendment does not acknowledge those difficulties either.

In the past, we have all had to accept unpalatable decisions—indeed, we now have a partnership Government. [*Laughter.*] I thought that the purpose of a partnership Government was to avoid us having to take these unpalatable decisions. Why are we now being told that we must reach an

Noda gwelliant 2 hefyd fod y fenter cyllid preifat yn ffordd o amlhau'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg. Nid oes â wnelo dim â hynny. Gall y Llywodraeth amlhau'r gwariant ar addysg mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Gall neilltuo gwariant o feysydd eraill. Os teimlai felly, gallai godi trethi, er nad wyf yn siŵr bod angen gwneud hynny o dan yr amgylchiadau economaidd presennol. Nid wyf yn siŵr y byddai fy mhlaid yn diolch imi am awgrymu hynny fel opsiwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n opsiwn os dymunen amlhau gwariant ar addysg. Gallem ddefnyddio'r adnoddau a gynhelir ar hyn o bryd gan Lywodraeth ganolog; gallem ryddhau'r arian hwnnw. Felly, nid oes rhaid inni fynd ar drywydd y fenter cyllid preifat er mwyn amlhau gwariant ar addysg.

Fy nhrydedd amheuaeth yw nad awgryma gwelliant 2 fod unrhyw anawsterau ynghlwm wrth y fenter cyllid preifat. Fodd bynnag, mae anawsterau enfawr ynghlwm wrth y fenter cyllid preifat. Mae rheoli'r fenter cyllid preifat yn creu anawsterau mawr i awdurdodau lleol sydd yn ceisio dechrau'r partneriaethau hynny. Crea anawsterau enfawr ar gyfer y staff addysgu a'r staff nad ydynt yn addysgu sydd yn gweithio yn ein hysgolion. Nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod y fenter cyllid preifat yn cynnig ateb. Nid yw'r trefniadau a sefydlir er mwyn diogelu buddiannau staff nad ydynt yn addysgu, sydd yn rhan bwysig o drefn ysgolion, yn ddigonol. Nid wyf yn bychanu gwerth athrawon, ond mae'r staff nad ydynt yn addysgu yr un mor bwysig, gan sicrhau y cynhelir yr adeilad a bod gwasanaethau ategol ar gael i ddarparu addysg dda. Nid ystyria'r fenter cyllid preifat eu buddiannau hwy, ac ofnaf nad yw'r gwelliant hwn yn cydnabod yr anawsterau hynny ychwaith.

Yn y gorffennol, bu'n rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn penderfyniadau annymunol—yn wir, mae Llywodraeth bartneriaeth gennym bellach. [*Chwerthin.*] Credais mai diben Llywodraeth bartneriaeth oedd ein hatal rhag gorfod gwneud y penderfyniadau annymunol hynny. Pam y dywedir wrthym yn awr bod



accommodation with the Conservative Party? It is bad enough having to— No, it is not. Our present arrangement with the Liberal Democrats gives us security. It is a welcome arrangement. [*Laughter.*] However, I thought that we could now put aside the need to do squalid little deals with minority parties. There can be no political reason—

**Nick Bourne:** Will you give way?

**Ron Davies:** Talking about squalid little— Of course I will.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to Ron Davies for moving back. I was going to ask him while he delivered his speech whether he could take a step backwards so that we over here could watch the face of the Labour Chief Whip.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have had six minutes, Ron.

**Ron Davies:** During the past half an hour or an hour, I have had an interesting discussion with the Labour Chief Whip about the purpose of our decision to support the Tory amendment. Under these circumstances, we should be strong enough as a Labour Party and as a Liberal Democrat-Labour Party coalition to resist the blandishments of the Conservative Party on this occasion. We have enough strength to say that PFI is something that we have had to accept in the short term. It is an expedient. We should not be prepared to elevate it into a worthwhile principle.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I was astounded to read Jonathan Morgan's amendment 1. It should read: we regret that no improvement was made to the condition of schools in Wales between 1979 and 1997 when the Conservatives had 18 long years to make a real difference. I do not want to be totally negative, but it was a bit rich. Leaking roofs, disgusting mould and mildew do not occur overnight. Taken over a 21-year period, three and half years is overnight.

It is important that we have an audit so that we know from where are starting. Jane

yn rhaid inni gymodi â'r Blaid Geidwadol? Mae'n ddigon gwael gorfod— Nac ydyw. Rhydd ein trefniant presennol gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sicrwydd inni. Croesawn y trefniant. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, credais y gallem bellach anghofio am yr angen i daro bargeinion bach annifyr gyda'r pleidiau lleiafrifol. Ni all fod unrhyw reswm gwleidyddol—

**Nick Bourne:** A wnewch ildio?

**Ron Davies:** A sôn am bethau bach annifyr—Gwnaf, wrth gwrs.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Ron Davies am symud yn ôl. Yr oeddwn yn mynd i ofyn iddo pe gallai gymryd cam yn ôl wrth iddo gyflwyno ei araith fel y gallem ni yma wyllo wyneb Prif Chwip y Blaid Lafur.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydych wedi cael chwe munud, Ron.

**Ron Davies:** Yn ystod yr hanner awr neu'r awr ddiwethaf, cefais drafodaeth ddiddorol gyda Phrif Chwip y Blaid Lafur am bwrras ein penderfyniad i gefnogi gwelliant y Toriaid. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, dylem fod yn ddigon cryf fel Plaid Lafur ac fel clymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Blaid Lafur i wrthsefyll gweniaith y Blaid Geidwadol ar yr achlysur hwn. Yr ydym yn ddigon cryf i ddweud bod y fenter cyllid preifat yn rhywbeth y bu'n rhaid inni ei derbyn yn y tymor byr. Ateb dros dro ydyw. Ni ddylem fod yn barod i'w dyrchafu yn egwyddor gwerth chweil.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Cefais fy syfrdanu wrth ddarllen gwelliant 1 Jonathan Morgan. Dylai ddarllen: mae'n ddrwg gennym na wnaethpwyd unrhyw welliant i gyflwr ysgolion Cymru rhwng 1979 a 1997 pan gafodd y Ceidwadwyr 18 mlynedd i wneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol. Nid wyf am fod yn hollol negyddol, ond yr oedd ychydig yn haerllug. Ni ddigwydd toeon sydd yn gollwng dŵr, llwydni a malltod ffaidd dros nos. Gan ystyried cyfnod o 21 mlynedd, cyfnod dros nos yw tair blynedd a hanner.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynnal archwiliad fel y gwyddom o ble y dechreuwn. Mae Jane

Davidson is always keen to do that. We must all urge our LEAs to complete the asset management plans by 2002 at the latest so that we can plan properly to get best and real value from this investment.

I was concerned to hear Jane say that some LEAs have not yet spent the £20 million. If they have not been able to spend that yet, what difficulties will they have in spending £300 million? Will your officials be there to give LEAs help with planning to spend that money efficiently? I concur with Alun Pugh's comment that 22 small authorities will have difficulties. It is a shame that these small authorities were established during the local government reorganisation. It is important that money does not sit in the dusty vaults but improves the built environment of our schools so that all our children, as Peter Law has said, have the best start in life.

**Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**Lorraine Barrett:** I was going to say that I agree with Jonathan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Funding is important. You recognised that £20 million, which was given to local authorities, has not been spent as we anticipated. In addition, last year the Government allocated an extra £70 million for education in Wales. We assumed that that money was for schools. However, on close analysis it was clear that £55 million of the £70 million went into local authorities' coffers and disappeared to meet some of their existing commitments. Only £15 million—and this was confirmed by the officials—went to schools. If we allocate such large amounts of money, surely that money must go to schools. It cannot go to butter-up local authorities that have not met their existing commitments as they were duty-bound to do.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I do not agree with most of what Jonathan said. With regard to the £20 million, I wonder whether it was because schools and LEAs had not prepared plans, such as the asset management programme, that the Committee is asking them to establish. I am glad to hear that £20 million

Davidson bob amser yn awyddus i wneud hynny. Rhaid inni annog ein AALLau i gwblhau'r cynlluniau rheoli asedau erbyn 2002 fan bellaf fel y gallwn gynllunio'n briodol i gael y gwerth gorau a'r gwerth gwirioneddol o'r buddsoddiad hwn.

Yr oeddwn yn bryderus o glywed Jane yn dweud nad yw rhai AALLau wedi gwario'r £20 miliwn eto. Os nad ydynt wedi llwyddo i wario hynny eto, pa anawsterau a gânt wrth wario £300 miliwn? A fydd eich swyddogion yno i helpu'r AALLau i gynllunio i wario'r arian hwnnw yn effeithlon? Cytunaf â sylw Alun Pugh y caiff 22 o awdurdodau bach anawsterau. Mae'n drueni y sefydlwyd yr awdurdodau bach hyn pan ad-drefnwyd llywodraeth leol. Mae'n bwysig nad yw arian yn aros yn y celloedd llychlyd ond ei fod yn gwella adeiladau ein hysgolion fel bod pob un o'n plant yn cael y dechrau gorau mewn bywyd, fel y dywedodd Peter Law.

**Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Lorraine Morgan:** Yr oeddwn am ddweud fy mod yn cytuno â Jonathan.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae ariannu yn bwysig. Cydnabuasoed na wariwyd yr £20 miliwn a roddwyd i awdurdodau lleol yn y ffordd a ddisgwyliasom. Yn ogystal, dyrannodd y Llywodraeth £70 miliwn ychwanegol y llynedd ar gyfer addysg yng Nghymru. Tybiasom mai ar gyfer ysgolion yr oedd yr arian hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ei ddadansoddi'n glir, yr oedd yn amlwg i £55 miliwn o'r £70 miliwn fynd i goffrau'r awdurdodau lleol a diflannodd i dalu rhai o'u hymrwymadau cyfredol. Dim ond £15 miliwn—a chadarnhawyd hyn gan y swyddogion—a aeth i'r ysgolion. Os dyrannwn gymaint o arian, onid oes rhaid i'r arian hwnnw fynd i'r ysgolion. Ni all fynd tuag at fodloni'r awdurdodau lleol nad ydynt wedi cwrdd â'u hymrwymadau cyfredol fel yr oeddent yn rhwym i'w wneud.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Ni chytunaf â'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan. Ynglŷn â'r £20 miliwn, tybed a oedd hynny'n wir gan nad oedd ysgolion ac AALLau wedi paratoi cynlluniau, megis y rhaglen rheoli asedau, y mae'r Pwyllgor yn gofyn iddynt ei sefydlu. Mae'n dda gennyf glywed y gellir

can be carried forward and will not be sent back. I agree with what Jonathan said about headteachers, teachers and schools having a part to play in this. However, it must be done in a working partnership with the LEAs. The money would probably not be spent properly if it was fragmented and sent out to every single school. How on earth can individual schools tender for the massive jobs that will need to be done? There would be total chaos. How could we audit the work at the end of 2010 as to what exactly had been done? Therefore, I disagree with Jonathan.

In trying to get all this work done by 2010, Jane, we must ensure that work is carried out by approved building companies. A school in Penarth that had a new roof some eight years ago is still suffering from a leaking roof. We have not been able to contact the builders to get them back to repair the work. We do not want to throw good money after bad. When we are looking at new schools being built as opposed to repairs, we must give imaginative thought as to how those schools might be able to accommodate and serve the wider community.

Members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee went to Ceredigion last weekend. We talked about small schools and learned how they play a vital role in the life of smaller village communities. If we are starting from scratch with new buildings, we should not lose the opportunity for them to fulfil their full potential. Huw and I, as members of the former Pre-16 Education Committee, visited Perthcelyn Infants School in Mountain Ash. It is a wonderful example of a new school that embraces the wider community. Every part of the community has the opportunity, and are welcome to go to that school for day classes, evening classes and young mothers' classes. It does work. Security is not a problem for the children in the school.

**Edwina Hart:** Would you also not agree, Lorraine, that it is important when we consider school buildings that we also consider disabled access to school buildings? That should also be a priority when you consider alterations to school buildings and, in particular, when you consider new

dwyn £20 miliwn ymlaen ac na chaiff ei anfon yn ôl. Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan fod gan benaethiaid, athrawon ac ysgolion ran i'w chwarae yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ei wneud mewn partneriaeth weithredol gyda'r AALLau. Mae'n debyg na fyddai'r arian yn cael ei wario'n gywir pe câi ei rannu a'i anfon i bob ysgol unigol. Sut ar y ddaear y gall ysgolion unigol dendro am y gwaith mawr y bydd angen ei wneud? Byddai anhrefn llwyr. Sut gallem archwilio'r gwaith ar ddiwedd 2010 i weld yn union beth a wnaethpwyd? Felly, anghytunaf â Jonathan.

Wrth geisio gwneud yr holl waith hwn erbyn 2010, rhaid inni sicrhau y cyflawnir y gwaith gan gwmnïau adeiladu cymeradwy. Parha ysgol ym Mhenarth a gafodd do newydd tuag wyth mlynedd yn ôl i ddioddef o do sydd yn gollwng dŵr. Ni allem gysylltu â'r adeiladwyr er mwyn iddynt ddychwelyd i atgyweirio'r gwaith. Nid ydym am daflu arian da ar ôl y drwg. Pan ystyriwn adeiladu ysgolion newydd yn hytrach na'u hatgyweirio, rhaid inni feddwl yn greadigol am sut y gallai'r ysgolion hynny fodloni a gwasanaethu'r gymuned ehangach.

Aeth aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i Geredigion y penwythnos diwethaf. Siaradasom am ysgolion bach a dysgasom sut y chwaraeant rôl hanfodol ym mywyd cymunedau pentrefi llai. Os dechreuwn o'r dechrau gydag adeiladau newydd, ni ddylem golli'r cyfle iddynt gyflawni eu potensial llawn. Ymwelais i a Huw, fel aelodau o'r hen Bwyllgor Addysg Cyn 16 ag Ysgol Fabanod Perthcelyn yn Aberpennar. Mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o ysgol newydd sydd yn cwmpasu'r gymuned ehangach. Caiff pob rhan o'r gymuned y cyfle, ac mae croeso iddynt fynd i'r ysgol ar gyfer dosbarthiadau yn ystod y dydd, dosbarthiadau nos a dosbarthiadau i famau ifanc. Mae'n llwyddo. Nid yw diogelwch yn broblem i'r plant yn yr ysgol.

**Edwina Hart:** Oni chytunwch hefyd, Lorraine, ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn ystyried mynediad i'r anabl i adeiladau ysgolion pan ystyriwn adeiladau ysgolion? Dylai hynny fod yn flaenoriaeth pan ystyrir y newidiadau i adeiladau ysgolion a phan ystyrir adeiladau newydd yn arbennig, fel y

buildings, so that children can be fully integrated into mainstream schooling.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I agree. Some of our Victorian schools are listed buildings. It can be almost impossible to provide total access for wheelchairs or children or parents with mobility problems. Access must be a priority and wherever possible we must ensure full access.

I began my contribution a little churlishly, so I will end it in the same way. I challenge every Member from every party in the Chamber today to say that this is a wonderful investment. We congratulate the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning for taking this gigantic step forward.

11:45 a.m.

**Peter Black:** I declare an interest as a member of Swansea City and County Council and also as a school governor. I have listened to the debate and enjoyed the contributions, particularly those from Ron Davies and Peter Law, who are important add-ons to our partnership Government in Wales.

**Peter Law:** We are right behind you, Peter. [*Laughter.*]

**Peter Black:** That is what worries me.

The Liberal Democrats have long been committed to tackling the backlog in upgrading school buildings. Unlike Plaid Cymru, we included this important policy in our manifesto. We want to deal with this issue. I presented a short debate on it, sections of which Jonathan Morgan kindly quoted, which I will address shortly.

As part of the debate on the comprehensive spending review, the Liberal Democrats proposed an amendment to that motion, highlighting the need to invest in school buildings. We are pleased that that was taken on board in the partnership agreement and in the budget, which came before us in draft form some weeks ago, and which we will approve in full in the next few weeks.

gellir integreiddio'r plant i addysg prif ffrwd.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Cytunaf. Mae rhai o'n hysgolion Fictoraidd yn adeiladau rhestredig. Gall fod bron yn amhosibl darparu mynediad llawn ar gyfer cadeiriau olwyn neu blant neu rieni sydd ag anawsterau symud. Rhaid i fynediad fod yn flaenoriaeth a rhaid inni sicrhau mynediad llawn lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl.

Dechreuais fy nghyfraniad ychydig yn anfoesgar ac fe'i gorffennaf yn yr un modd. Heriaf bob Aelod o bob plaid yn y Siambr heddiw i ddweud bod hyn yn fuddsoddiad rhagorol. Llongyfarchiadau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am gymryd y cam enfawr hwn ymlaen.

**Peter Black:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe a hefyd fel llywodraethwr ysgol. Gwrandewais ar y ddadl a mwynheais y cyfraniadau, yn enwedig y rheini gan Ron Davies a Peter Law, sydd yn ychwanegiadau pwysig i'n Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yng Nghymru.

**Peter Law:** Yr ydym y tu ôl i chi, Peter. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Peter Black:** Dyna'r hyn sydd yn fy mhoeni.

Bu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith sydd wedi pentyrru o ran uwchraddio adeiladau ysgolion. Yn annhebyg i Blaid Cymru, fe wnaethom gynnwys y polisi pwysig hwn yn ein maniffesto. Yr ydym am ddelio â'r mater hwn. Cyflwynais ddadl fer arno, y bu Jonathan Morgan mor garedig â dyfynnu adrannau ohoni. Ymdriniaf â hynny cyn bo hir.

Fel rhan o'r ddadl ar yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, cynigiodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol welliant i'r cynnig hwnnw, gan amlygu'r angen i fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Yr ydym yn falch i hynny gael ei gynnwys yn y cytundeb partneriaeth ac yn y gyllideb, a gyflwynwyd inni ar ffurf drafft rai wythnosau yn ôl, ac y'i cymeradwywn yn llawn yn yr

ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

Jonathan quoted what I said about the need for the UK Government to raid its surplus in the budget and to ask Gordon Brown to give some of that money to school buildings. We are pleased that he did that as part of the comprehensive spending review. My only regret is that it took three and a half years. However, that money is now available to us and it is up to the National Assembly for Wales and the partnership Government to spend that money in the best way that we can and to make the much-needed investment in school buildings around Wales.

Dyfynnodd Jonathan yr hyn a ddywedais am yr angen i Lywodraeth y DU ysbeilio yr arian sydd ganddi dros ben yn y gyllideb a gofyn i Gordon Brown roi rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw i adeiladau ysgolion. Yr ydym yn falch iddo wneud hynny fel rhan o'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant. Yr unig beth yr wyf yn edifar amdano yw ei fod wedi cymryd tair blynedd a hanner. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arian hwnnw ar gael inni erbyn hyn a phenderfyniad Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yw gwario'r arian hwnnw yn y ffordd orau bosibl a buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion ledled Cymru, y mae gwir angen amdano.

Jane Davidson highlighted an important issue on the backlog of maintenance and repair. When I researched this matter for my short debate, I realised that it is difficult to define the problem in terms of money across the whole of Wales, and in terms of where repairs are needed, what information local authorities have on school buildings, and the quality of that information.

Amlygodd Jane Davidson fater pwysig ynglŷn â'r gwaith sydd wedi pentyrru o ran gwaith cynnal a chadw ac atgyweirio. Pan ymchwiliais i'r mater hwn ar gyfer fy nadl fer, sylweddolais ei bod yn anodd diffinio'r problemau o ran arian ledled Cymru ac, o ran lle mae angen gwaith atgyweirio, pa wybodaeth sydd gan yr awdurdodau lleol am adeiladau ysgolion, ac ansawdd yr wybodaeth honno.

The first thing that I discovered was that the Assembly did not hold any of that information and had not been collecting it centrally. That is a major omission and one of the reasons why government in Wales has not previously got to grips with this. The information has not been available to the Assembly, and the necessary work has been left to councils, which have been told to get on with the repairs by using the resources that we gave them. That is not good enough and the extra sum of £293 million that is being provided as part of the budget—no small sum by any stretch of the imagination—is one way of tackling that problem.

Y peth cyntaf a ddarganfûm oedd nad oedd y Cynulliad yn cadw unrhyw ran o'r wybodaeth honno ac nad oedd wedi bod yn ei chasglu'n ganolog. Mae hynny'n hepgoriad mawr ac yn un o'r rhesymau pam nad yw'r llywodraeth yng Nghymru wedi mynd i'r afael â hyn yn flaenorol. Ni fu'r wybodaeth ar gael i'r Cynulliad, a gadawyd y gwaith angenrheidiol i'r cynghorau, y gofynnwyd iddynt ymgymryd â'r atgyweiriadau drwy ddefnyddio'r adnoddau a roddasom iddynt. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da ac mae'r swm ychwanegol o £293 miliwn a ddarperir fel rhan o'r gyllideb—nad yw'n swm bach o bell ffordd—yn un ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno.

I welcome Jane's comment about councils needing to carry out a proper assessment, and I welcome the fact that the Assembly is trying to get proper asset management plans and proper surveys of the state of school buildings around Wales. If we do not know the nature of the problem, we cannot deal with it. The councils should also be aware of the problem. When we make that money

Croesawaf sylwadau Jane am yr angen i'r cynghorau gyflawni asesiad priodol, a chroesawaf y ffaith fod y Cynulliad yn ceisio cael cynlluniau rheoli asedau priodol ac arolygon priodol o gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion ledled Cymru. Os na wyddom natur y broblem, ni allwn ddelio â hi. Dylai'r cynghorau fod yn ymwybodol o'r broblem hefyd. Pan ddsbarthwn yr arian hwnnw,

available, we can reasonably expect that it will be given to the schools that need it and that we can invest in them as early as possible. There is concern that £20 million of the money made available this year has not yet been spent and may have to be rolled over. Councils need to get their act together on this. I hope that we can discuss with them ways in which they can ensure that the extra money is spent within a reasonable period of time, and that they can gear up their own people to ensure that.

Plaid Cymru's amendments seem to say that £293 million is not enough. They talk about the differences between the current year's budget and the money that has been put aside for next year. If I remember correctly, Gareth called for a specific allocation over and above the money provided by the Chancellor. It is difficult to do that because only the Chancellor can give us the money to spend. We do not have tax-raising powers.

In this budget, we have put aside a sum of money, stating that it is for school buildings. That should meet those concerns. The extra money that was allocated this year was a one-off payment which was given to schools in England and Wales by the Chancellor and which naturally came down to the Assembly. The money allocated next year is a significant increase on the budget approved last year and which Plaid Cymru helped to pass by abstaining during the vote. If the Chancellor is willing to give another one-off allocation in the next few months, possibly just before a general election—that is up to him—we will spend that money. I am sure that Jane could find plenty of ways to spend any extra money that is given to us.

Plaid Cymru has in recent weeks called for extra money for housing and school buildings. While it is difficult to disagree with the sentiments and the worthiness of those goals, it has not yet told us where it would get the money to spend on those issues. It is easy as an opposition to call for immediate extra funding. It is not so easy to say from where the funding will come.

mae'n rhesymol inni ddisgwyl y caiff ei roi i'r ysgolion sydd ei angen ac y gallwn fuddsoddi ynddynt cyn gynted â phosibl. Ceir pryder ynghylch y ffaith nad yw £20 miliwn o'r arian a ddosbarthwyd eleni wedi'i wario eto ac efallai y bydd angen ei ddwyn ymlaen. Mae angen i gynghorau benderfynu beth i'w wneud ynglŷn â hyn. Gobeithio y gallwn drafod gyda hwy ffyrdd o sicrhau y gwerir yr arian ychwanegol o fewn cyfnod rhesymol, ac y gallant annog eu pobl eu hunain i sicrhau hynny.

Ymddengys y dywed gwelliannau Plaid Cymru nad yw £293 miliwn yn ddigon. Siaradant am y gwahaniaethau rhwng cyllideb y flwyddyn bresennol a'r arian a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Os cofiaf yn gywir, galwodd Gareth am ddyraniad penodol uwchlaw'r arian a ddarparwyd gan y Canghellor. Mae'n anodd gwneud hynny oherwydd dim ond y Canghellor a all roi yr arian inni ei wario. Nid oes gennym bwerau codi treth.

Yn y gyllideb hon, neilltuasom arian, gan ddatgan ei fod ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Dylai hynny fodloni y pryderon hynny. Yr oedd yr arian ychwanegol a neilltuwyd eleni yn daliad unigol a roddwyd i ysgolion yng Nghymru a Lloegr gan y Canghellor ac a ddaeth i lawr yn naturiol i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r arian a ddyrennir y flwyddyn nesaf yn sylweddol uwch na'r gyllideb a gymeradwywyd y llynedd ac yr helpodd Plaid Cymru i'w chaniatáu drwy ymatal yn ystod y bleidlais. Os yw'r Canghellor yn fodlon rhoi dyraniad unigol arall yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, cyn etholiad cyffredinol posibl—ei benderfyniad ef yw hynny—gwariwn yr arian hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallai Jane ddod o hyd i lawer o ffyrdd o wario unrhyw arian ychwanegol a roddir inni.

Galwodd Plaid Cymru yn yr wythnosau diwethaf am arian ychwanegol ar gyfer tai ac adeiladau ysgolion. Er ei bod yn anodd anghytuno â theimladau a haeddiant y nodau hynny, nid yw wedi dweud wrthym eto o ble y câi'r arian i'w wario ar y materion hynny. Mae'n hawdd i wrthblaid alw am arian ychwanegol ar unwaith. Nid yw mor hawdd dweud o ble y daw'r arian.

**Cynog Dafis** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before Cynog intervenes, Peter, you are well over time.

**Cynog Dafis:** Peter, a ydych chi'n cyd-weld â'n dadansoddiad bod y setliad sydd yn dod i Gymru, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y math o bolisiâu economaidd ac ariannol a ddilynir yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol, yn annigonol? Dylem fod yn pwysleisio o hyd ac o hyd yr angen am setliad tecach sydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion yng Nghymru. Un ffordd o wneud hynny yw cyfeirio at y diffygion mewn rhaglenni o'r math hwn, gan gynnwys rhaglenni cyfalaf.

**Peter Black:** We can always spend more money. You will know that the Liberal Democrats federally have a commitment to reform the Barnett formula to ensure that Wales gets more money. Unless Plaid Cymru has plans for a new breed of money tree that it will plant in Wales once it has pulled the drawbridge up, we must work with the resources that we have and spend that money.

**Helen Mary Jones** *rose*—

**Peter Black:** I cannot take any more interventions because I am running out of time. It is important that we consider amendment 2 on the private finance initiative. I am agnostic about PFI. We need to ensure that any private finance initiative scheme that we introduce has to be done in the proper way. We will support this amendment, largely because it recognises the reality that we face at the moment that PFI schemes are in progress, including in Ceredigion which Cynog previously represented as an MP and represents now as a regional Assembly Member. We must recognise that PFI is in progress. We need to look at the way in which PFI is operating to try to ensure that we get the best possible deal.

**John Griffiths:** The condition of our school buildings is important to education in Wales. That is beyond dispute. Teachers should be able to concentrate on teaching rather than

**Cynog Dafis** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn i Cynog ymyrryd, Peter, yr ydych wedi mynd ymhell dros yr amser a oedd gennych.

**Cynog Dafis:** Peter, do you agree with our analysis that the settlement coming to Wales, especially in the context of the type of economic and fiscal policies that are followed in the United Kingdom, is insufficient? We should emphasise again and again the need for a fairer settlement that reflects our needs in Wales. One way of doing that is to refer to the deficiencies in programmes of this sort, including capital programmes.

**Peter Black:** Gallwn bob amser wario mwy o arian. Gwyddoch fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ffederal wedi ymrwymo i ddiwygio fformwla Barnett er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael mwy o arian. Oni bai fod cynlluniau gan Blaid Cymru ar gyfer math o goeden arian newydd y bydd yn ei phlannu yng Nghymru ar ôl iddi godi'r bont, rhaid inni weithio gyda'r adnoddau sydd gennym a gwario'r arian hwnnw.

**Helen Mary Jones** *a gododd*—

**Peter Black:** Ni allaf dderbyn unrhyw ymyriadau eraill gan fod amser yn brin. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried gwelliant 2 ar y fenter cyllid preifat. Yr wyf yn agnostig ynglŷn â'r fenter cyllid preifat. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod rhaid i unrhyw gynllun menter cynllun preifat a gyflwynwn gael ei wneud yn y ffordd gywir. Cefnogwn y gwelliant hwn, yn bennaf gan ei fod yn cydnabod y realiti a wynebwn ar hyn o bryd bod cynlluniau menter cyllid preifat ar y gweill, gan gynnwys yng Ngheredigion a gynrychiolwyd gan Cynog fel AS yn y gorffennol ac a gynrychiola bellach fel Aelod Cynulliad rhanbarthol. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod y fenter cyllid preifat ar waith. Mae angen inni edrych ar y ffordd y mae'r fenter cyllid preifat yn gweithredu er mwyn sicrhau y cawn y fargen orau bosibl.

**John Griffiths:** Mae cyflwr adeiladau ein hysgolion yn bwysig i addysg yng Nghymru. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i amheuaeth. Dylai athrawon allu canolbwyntio ar ddysgu yn

coping with problems caused by inadequate buildings which is the case far too often, unfortunately. Staff, pupils and parents must be able to see our commitment to education from the state of school buildings, through ongoing and future improvements. Attractive, functional and well-maintained premises will send the correct message that the Government of Wales values education and is determined to continue the improvement in standards. This will reinforce the commitment of pupils, staff and parents. I welcome the increase in funding in line with Welsh Labour's Assembly manifesto. There is much to be done after 18 years of Tory Government underfunding, which Jonathan Morgan correctly anticipated would feature—

hytrach nag ymdopi â phroblemau a achosir gan adeiladau annigonol sydd yn wir yn llawer rhy aml, yn anffodus. Rhaid i staff, disgyblion a rhieni allu gweld ein hymrwymiad i addysg o gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion, drwy welliannau parhaus a gwelliannau yn y dyfodol. Anfona adeiladau deniadol, ymarferol a gaiff eu cynnal a'u cadw'n dda y negeseuon cywir bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn rhoi gwerth ar addysg a'i bod yn benderfynol o barhau â'r gwelliant mewn safonau. Atgyfnertha hyn ymrwymiad disgyblion, staff a rhieni. Croesawaf y cynnydd mewn arian yn unol â manifesto Plaid Lafur Cymru ar gyfer y Cynulliad. Mae llawer i'w wneud ar ôl 18 mlynedd o danariannu gan y Llywodraeth Doriaidd, a rhagwelodd Jonathan Morgan yn gywir y byddai hyn yn nodwedd—

**David Davies:** Point of order. Can we have some consistency in the rules on what people are called? Could you ask the socialists over there to stop referring to us as 'the Tories' and to call us the Conservative Party of Wales?

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. A allwn gael mwy o gysondeb yn y rheolau ar yr hyn y caiff pobl eu galw? A allwch ofyn i'r sosialwyr draw yna ymatal rhag cyfeirio atom fel 'y Toriaid' ac i'n galw yn Blaid Geidwadol Cymru?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Two wrongs and improper procedure in Plenary does not make a right. John, you will have heard David. Please continue.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw dau ddrwg a gweithdrefn amhriodol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn gwneud un da. John, clywsoch David. Parhewch os gwelwch yn dda.

**John Griffiths:** I welcome any references to me as a socialist, at any time. [LABOUR ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear'.]

**John Griffiths:** Croesawaf unrhyw gyfeiriadau ataf fel sosialydd, unrhyw bryd. [AELODAU LLAFUR O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch'.]

11:55 a.m.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you agree that when a Government has been in office for almost a full term—three and a half years—references to the previous 18 years are nothing more than a cloak for its inaction?

**Glyn Davies:** Pan fu Llywodraeth mewn grym am dymor llawn bron—tair blynedd a hanner—a gytunwch mai dim ond mantell ar gyfer diffyg gweithredu yw cyfeirio at y 18 mlynedd flaenorol?

**John Griffiths:** No, because things have improved and, as you heard from Jane earlier, they are continuing to improve. Glyn's comment is a bit rich, given that the Conservatives are still harking back to the so-called winter of discontent in the late 1970s.

**John Griffiths:** Nac ydwyf, gan fod pethau wedi gwella a pharhânt i wella, fel y clywsoch gan Jane yn gynharach. Mae sylw Glyn ychydig yn annheg, gan ystyried bod y Ceidwadwyr yn parhau i draethu am y gaeaf o anffodlonrwydd fel y'i gelwir ar ddiwedd y 1970au.

**Rod Richards:** If John Griffiths does not

**Rod Richards:** Os nad oes ots gan John



mind being called a socialist, I wonder if he minds being called a bolshevik? He spoke about 18 years of underfunding, but how many local authority buildings are inadequate in Wales? How many local authority roofs are leaking in Wales? I will tell him: none, because money that the Conservative Government allocated to school buildings was spent on local authority buildings, namely, all those Taj Mahals across Wales. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear'.]

**John Griffiths:** First, Rod, we could all be colourful in our political descriptions, and I could be colourful as far as you are concerned, but I will stick to the subject matter.

It is obvious that local education authorities have been forced to be reactive rather than proactive in educational and financial terms. That was not a sensible way to proceed, but unfortunately that is what had to happen because of the underfunding that was largely due to 18 years of Conservative Government.

**Janet Ryder:** On Rod Richards's intervention, if he is talking about the grand state of council buildings, perhaps he should consider his former constituency of Clwyd West, and the state of the council buildings in Ruthin, where council employees are working under very poor conditions.

**Rod Richards:** Point of order. I have never been the Member of Parliament for Clwyd West and, therefore, I have never had responsibility for Ruthin.

**John Griffiths:** Newport County Borough Council has supplemented extra Assembly funding with its own resources to achieve significant improvement in school buildings, but it has not been possible to have an adequate, structured and planned maintenance programme, which is needed.

Jonathan Morgan anticipated references to the 18 years under the Conservative Government, and it is an appropriate debate in which to do so. The Conservatives invited

Griffiths gael ei alw'n sosialydd, tybed a oes ots ganddo gael ei alw'n folsieffic? Siaradodd am 18 mlynedd o danariannu, ond faint o adeiladau awdurdodau lleol sydd yn annigonol yng Nghymru? Faint o doean awdurdodau lleol sydd yn gollwng dŵr yng Nghymru? Fe ddywedaf wrtho: dim un, oherwydd gwariwyd arian a ddyrannodd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol i adeiladau ysgolion ar adeiladau'r awdurdodau lleol, sef bob un o'r Taj Mahals hynny ledled Cymru. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch'.]

**John Griffiths:** Yn gyntaf, Rod, gallai pob un ohonom ddefnyddio disgrifiadau gwleidyddol lliwgar, a gallwn fod yn lliwgar amdanoch chi, ond glynaf at y pwnc dan sylw.

Mae'n amlwg y gorfodwyd awdurdodau addysg lleol i fod yn adweithiol yn hytrach na rhagweithiol o ran addysg ac arian. Nid oedd hynny'n ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen, ond bu'n rhaid i hynny ddigwydd yn anffodus oherwydd y tanariannu a oedd yn bennaf o ganlyniad i 18 mlynedd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol.

**Janet Ryder:** Ynglŷn ag ymyriad Rod Richards, os yw'n sôn am gyflwr gwych adeiladau cyngor, efallai y dylai ystyried ei hen etholaeth sef Gorllewin Clwyd, a chyflwr adeiladau'r cyngor yn Rhuthun, lle y gweithia staff y cyngor o dan amodau gwael iawn.

**Rod Richards:** Pwynt o drefn. Ni fŷm erioed yn Aelod Seneddol dros Orllewin Clwyd ac, felly, ni fŷm erioed yn gyfrifol am Rhuthun.

**John Griffiths:** Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Casnewydd wedi atodi arian ychwanegol oddi wrth y Cynulliad gyda'i adnoddau ei hun er mwyn gwella adeiladau ysgolion yn sylweddol, ond ni fu'n bosibl cael rhaglen gynnal a chadw ddigonol strwythuredig ac wedi'i chynllunio, sydd ei hangen.

Rhagwelodd Jonathan Morgan gyfeiriadau at y 18 mlynedd o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, ac mae'n ddadl briodol i wneud hynny. Fe'i gwahoddwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr

it with their statement of opinion yesterday that praised Margaret Thatcher's positive transformation of Wales. The Welsh people have no truck with that at all. I tabled an amendment to that statement of opinion, which, I anticipate, will get widespread support.

Her legacy, like so much of the Tory legacy, is determined by a valuing of private rather than state provision because so many of those Conservative MPs in those Conservative Governments tended to send their children to private schools. They simply did not care enough about state schools. Only now, under a Welsh Labour Government, have we seen a year-on-year fall in infant class sizes. The Tories did not care because class sizes in the private sector were not too large.

**David Davies:** Point of order. There should be consistency on this, Dirprwy Lywydd. I was picked up for referring to one party incorrectly as the 'Lib Dems', which distracted me from my speech. [*Laughter.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Members should refer to parties by their correct names.

**John Griffiths:** What I said is entirely in line with the Conservative philosophy: to those who have will be given, and from those who have not will be taken away. When John Redwood was Secretary of State for Wales, he boasted of returning over £100 million to the Treasury, implicitly stating that it was not needed for state schools—be it for buildings or anything else—in Wales. The Conservatives' recent statement of opinion in the Assembly shows that they have not learnt anything.

The UK Labour Government rightly abolished the assisted places scheme subsidy for private schools. More measures should follow to achieve educational equality and to redistribute resources to the state sector. I would like to see the Assembly urge in Westminster accordingly and do anything that it can in that direction.

gyda'u datganiad barn ddoe a oedd yn canmol y ffordd y trawsnewidiwyd Cymru yn gadarnhaol gan Margaret Thatcher. Ni chytuna pobl Cymru â hynny o gwbl. Cyflwynais welliant i'r datganiad barn hwnnw, a rhagwelaf y caiff ei gefnogi'n eang.

Penderfynir ar ei hetifeddiaeth, fel cymaint o etifeddiaeth y Torïaid, drwy roi gwerth ar ddarpariaeth breifat yn hytrach na darpariaeth y wladwriaeth gan fod cymaint o'r ASau Ceidwadol hynny yn y Llywodraethau Ceidwadol hynny yn tueddu i anfon eu plant i ysgolion preifat. Nid oeddent yn poeni digon am ysgolion y wladwriaeth o gwbl. Dim ond yn awr, o dan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru, y gwelsom ostyngiad flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ym maint dosbarthiadau babanod. Nid oedd y Torïaid yn poeni gan nad oedd maint dosbarthiadau yn y sector preifat yn rhy fawr.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Dylai fod cysondeb ynglŷn â hyn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Fe'm beirniadwyd oherwydd imi gyfeirio at un blaid yn anghywir fel y 'Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol', a dynnodd fy sylw oddi ar fy araith. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylai Aelodau gyfeirio at bleidiau gan ddefnyddio eu henwau cywir.

**John Griffiths:** Mae'r hyn a ddywedais yn cydymffurfio â'r athroniaeth Geidwadol yn llwyr: rhoddir i'r rheini sydd â digon a chymerir gan y rheini nad oes unrhyw beth ganddynt. Pan oedd John Redwood yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ymfalchiodd ei fod wedi dychwelyd mwy na £100 miliwn i'r Trysorlys, gan ddatgan yn bendant nad oedd ei angen ar gyfer ysgolion y wladwriaeth—boed ar gyfer adeiladau neu unrhyw beth arall—yng Nghymru. Dengys datganiad barn diweddar y Ceidwadwyr yn y Cynulliad na ddysgasant unrhyw beth.

Diddymodd Llywodraeth Lafur y DU yn briodol gymhorthdal cynllun lleoedd â gynorthwyir ar gyfer ysgolion preifat. Dylai mwy o fesurau ddilyn er mwyn cyflawni cydraddoldeb addysgol ac er mwyn aildosbarthu adnoddau i sector y wladwriaeth. Hoffwn weld y Cynulliad yn annog San Steffan i'r perwyl hwnnw ac yn

gwneud unrhyw beth a allai yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw.

Thankfully, the dark days of Tory rule are over and we have a Government of Wales that is committed to improving school buildings in Wales, as the increases proposed in the draft budget testify.

Yn ffodus, mae diwrnodau tywyll rheolaeth y Toriaid wedi dod i ben ac mae gennym Lywodraeth yng Nghymru sydd yn ymrwymedig i wella adeiladau ysgolion Cymru, fel y tystia'r codiadau a gynigir yn y gyllideb ddrafft.

**Richard Edwards:** I do not want to raise the spectre of the private finance initiative again. It suffices to say that I do not dissent from Ron Davies's well-chosen comments. I thank Jane warmly for taking such swift action to ensure that the costs of leadership group arrangements are being fully met. Headteachers in my constituency, who were concerned that they were being disadvantaged compared to their colleagues elsewhere in the UK, will be reassured by this clear evidence of your commitment to their wellbeing and your acknowledgement of the vital role that they play in shaping our country's future.

**Richard Edwards:** Nid wyf am godi trychiolaeth y fenter cyllid preifat eto. Mae'n ddigonol dweud nad anghytunaf â sylwadau gofalus Ron Davies. Diolchaf i Jane yn gynnes am gymryd camau mor gyflym i sicrhau y bodlonir costau trefniadau'r grŵp arweinyddiaeth yn llawn. Caiff ysgolion penaethiaid yn fy etholaeth, a oedd yn pryderu eu bod yn dioddef anfantais o'u cymharu â'u cydweithwyr yng ngweddill y DU, sicrwydd gan y dystiolaeth glir hon o'ch ymrwymiad i'w lles a'ch bod yn cydnabod y rôl hanfodol a chwaraeant wrth lunio dyfodol ein gwlad.

**Alun Cairns:** I appreciate that time is tight, and I will be as brief as possible. It is a sad admission of failure when, after three and a half years of Labour Government, Labour seeks to hark back to the 18 previous years of Conservative rule. I notice that the motion, and other Members have mentioned this, discusses the investment in education and the capital expenditure over recent years. The massive success of the growing Welsh-medium primary education sector in Wales was a policy of the last Conservative Government. There is a Welsh-medium primary school, Ysgol Gymraeg Bryn y Môr, in Swansea that has received some investment in capital expenditure. However, the investment that it received is the conversion of a storage cupboard into a staff tearoom and the conversion of the former staff tearoom into a classroom for pupils. Is this the kind of investment that has taken place over the last three and a half years that the Labour Government is talking about? Strangely enough, the City and County of Swansea then sought to rectify this problem. In its wisdom, it made an application to the Assembly last year to build a new school, which is further recognition of the success of the Conservative policy to expand Welsh-

**Alun Cairns:** Gwerthfawrogaf fod amser yn brin, a byddaf mor fyr â phosibl. Cyfaddefiad trist o fethiant ydyw pan geisia'r Blaid Lafur gyfeirio'n ôl at yr 18 mlynedd flaenorol o reolaeth Geidwadol, ar ôl tair blynedd a hanner o Lywodraeth Lafur. Sylwaf fod y cynnig yn trafod y buddsoddiad mewn addysg a'r gwariant cyfalaf dros y blynyddoedd diweddar, a chrybwyllwyd hyn gan Aelodau eraill. Un o bolisiau'r Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf oedd llwyddiant enfawr y sector addysg gynradd Gymraeg yng Nghymru sydd yn tyfu. Mae ysgol gynradd Gymraeg, Ysgol Gymraeg Bryn y Môr, yn Abertawe a gafodd rywfaint o fuddsoddiad mewn gwariant cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, y buddsoddiad a gafodd yw newid storfa yn ystafell de ar gyfer staff a newid yr hen ystafell de yn ystafell ddisbarth ar gyfer disgyblion. Ai dyna'r math o fuddsoddiad a ddigwyddodd dros y tair blynedd a hanner ddiwethaf y mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn cyfeirio ato? Yn rhyfedd ddigon, ceisiodd Dinas a Sir Abertawe unioni'r broblem hon wedyn. Yn ei ddoethineb, gwnaeth gais i'r Cynulliad y llynedd i adeiladu ysgol newydd, sydd yn gydnabyddiaeth bellach o lwyddiant y polisi Ceidwadol i ehangu addysg gynradd Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, gwrthodwyd y

medium primary education. However, the National Assembly rejected that submission. Would the private finance initiative not have been an excellent way of achieving a new school for the pupils of Swansea?

**Jane Davidson:** I thank Members for their excellent contributions to the debate, in particular the way in which all parties have welcomed our initiative to invest extra money into school buildings over the next few years. Jonathan Morgan said that Members would highlight their constituency problems, and they did. I will take note of those problems. However, I want to assure all Members—as not everyone contributed to the debate—that we are moving down the asset management planning route so that we do not only have opportunities in the Assembly to highlight the case of individual schools here and there, as Alun Pugh rightly pointed out. We should look to local authorities to co-operate with us to identify on which schools work needs to be done, and then focus on that work.

**Rod Richards** *rose—*

12:05 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** I will not give way. I will make more points on funding. Since becoming a Minister, I have said that I am keen to ensure that everything that we do is based on evidence. That is important. It would be helpful, when other parties table amendments, if they were also based on evidence. If we consider what has been spent over the last three and a half years, we have had additional capital funding for schools through New Deal of £62 million over five years. Edwina announced £26.8 million of extra funding in March. We have had capital allocations of £44 million this year and there will be £54 million next year. We also have the private finance initiative of £140 million. As a conservative estimate, if you take those amounts of money over three and a half years, we have spent something in the region of £250 million on capital spend. To say that there is no discernible improvement indicates that your wit is not great enough to pick up that kind of spending. The fact that we have an underspend in the New Deal money from this year indicates strongly that we must

cyflwyniad hwnnw gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Oni fyddai'r fenter cyllid preifat wedi bod yn ffordd ardderchog o gael ysgol newydd ar gyfer disgyblion Abertawe?

**Jane Davidson:** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau ardderchog at y ddadl, yn enwedig y ffordd y croesawodd pob plaid ein menter i fuddsoddi arian ychwanegol mewn adeiladau ysgolion dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Dywedodd Jonathan Morgan y byddai Aelodau yn amlygu problemau eu hetholaethau, ac fe wnaethant. Nodaf y problemau hynny. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf sicrhau pob Aelod—gan na chyfrannodd pawb at y ddadl—ein bod yn symud ar hyd y trywydd cynllunio rheoli asedau fel bod gennym nid yn unig gyfleoedd yn y Cynulliad i amlygu achos ysgolion unigol yma ac acw, fel y nododd Alun Pugh yn briodol. Dylem ddisgwyl i'r awdurdodau lleol gydweithio â ni er mwyn nodi pa ysgolion y mae angen gwaith arnynt, ac yna canolbwyntio ar y gwaith hwnnw.

**Rod Richards** *a gododd—*

**Jane Davidson:** Ni fyddaf yn ildio. Gwnaf fwy o sylwadau ar ariannu. Ers dod yn Weinidog, dywedais fy mod yn awyddus i sicrhau bod popeth a wnawn yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol, pan fydd pleidiau eraill yn cyflwyno gwelliannau, pe byddent hwy yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth hefyd. Os ystyriwn yr hyn a wariwyd yn ystod y tair blynedd a hanner ddiwethaf, cawsom arian cyfalaf ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion drwy'r Fargen Newydd sydd yn £62 miliwn dros bum mlynedd. Cyhoeddodd Edwina £26.8 miliwn o arian ychwanegol ym mis Mawrth. Cawsom ddyraniadau cyfalaf o £44 miliwn eleni a bydd £54 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r fenter cyllid preifat o £140 miliwn gennym hefyd. Fel amcangyfrif ceidwadol, os cymerwch yr arian hwnnw dros dair blynedd a hanner, gwariasom tua £250 miliwn ar wariant cyfalaf. Mae dweud nad oes gwelliant amlwg yn nodi nad yw eich meddwl yn ddigon chwim i nodi gwariant o'r fath. Noda'r ffaith ein bod wedi tanwario arian y Fargen Newydd eleni yn gryf bod

follow the strategic planning route. I acknowledge everybody who suggested that.

Jonathan made a particular bid for exceptional capital. The exceptional circumstances such as fire are covered by insurance, and it would be inappropriate for this Assembly to hold money back when we want to deliver it to schools. Gareth, when we played with the figures from the Welsh Local Government Association, I estimated some £800 million because we do not have the evidence. That brings us back to getting the evidence. I am confident—as we all find whenever we do an audit—that that figure could double. Realistically, we need to look at the evidence on paper before we make any determination about local authorities' priorities. I particularly welcome Janet's commitment to asset management planning as a way forward. We had a patchwork approach before. I know that local authorities have tried hard to deliver the money, but it has been difficult because of the problems of receiving the evidence information.

I take Lorraine's point about approved builders. One factor that was a problem during the recent floods was cowboys looking to rebuild in Wales. A strategic investment rebuilding programme will send out a strong message. I will be engaging with local government on that. I particularly welcome Alun Pugh's contribution about the school of the future. Some of our schools are over 100 years old and in many ways, although our philosophy is changing, the delivery of education has not changed a great deal from a 100 years ago. As a modern, forward thinking Assembly, particularly one which is about to pick up this issue in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, we must start thinking more imaginatively about the use of our buildings and the use of new technology and community resources. I welcome that that was included in today's debate so that we can start to think of it for the future.

Edwina, there are particular issues about disabled access and I welcome your intervention. I want to ensure that, wherever possible, we adopt the new guidelines on

rhaid inni ddilyn y trywydd cynllunio strategol. Cydnabyddaf bawb a awgrymodd hynny.

Gwnaeth Jonathan gynnig arbennig am gyfalaf eithriadol. Cwmpesir yr amgylchiadau eithriadol megis tân gan yswiriant, ac ni fyddai'n briodol i'r Cynulliad ddal arian yn ôl pan ydym am ei roi i ysgolion. Gareth, pan chwaraeasom gyda'r ffigurau gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, amcangyfrifais tua £800 miliwn gan nad yw'r dystiolaeth gennym. Daw hynny â ni yn ôl at gael y dystiolaeth. Yr wyf yn hyderus—fel y mae pob un ohonom pan gynhaliwn archwiliad—y gallai'r ffigur hwnnw ddyblu. I fod yn realistig, mae angen inni edrych ar y dystiolaeth ar bapur cyn inni ddod i unrhyw benderfyniad am flaenoriaethau awdurdodau lleol. Croesawaf yn arbennig ymrwymiad Janet i gynllunio rheoli asedau fel ffordd ymlaen. Bu ymagwedd glytwaith gennym o'r blaen. Gwn fod awdurdodau lleol wedi ymdrechu'n galed i gyflwyno'r arian, ond bu'n anodd oherwydd y problemau wrth gael y wybodaeth ynghylch tystiolaeth.

Derbyniaf bwynt Lorraine am adeiladwyr cydnabyddedig. Un ffactor a fu'n broblem yn ystod y llifogydd diweddar oedd cowbois yn ceisio ailadeiladu yng Nghymru. Bydd rhaglen ailadeiladu buddsoddi strategol yn anfon neges gryf. Siaradaf â llywodraeth leol ynglŷn â hynny. Croesawaf yn arbennig gyfraniad Alun Pugh am ysgol y dyfodol. Mae rhai o'n hysgolion yn hŷn na 100 mlwydd oed ac mewn llawer o ffyrdd, er bod ein hathroniaeth yn newid, nid yw'r gwaith o ddarparu addysg wedi newid llawer ers 100 mlynedd. Fel Cynulliad modern, blaengar, yn enwedig un sydd ar fin trafod y mater hwn yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, rhaid inni ddechrau meddwl yn fwy creadigol am y defnydd a wneir o'n hadeiladau a'r defnydd o dechnoleg newydd ac adnoddau cymunedol. Croesawaf y ffaith y cynhwyswyd hynny yn y ddatl heddiw fel y gallwn ddechrau ei ystyried ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Edwina, mae materion penodol am fynediad i'r anabl a chroesawaf eich ymyriad. Dymunaf sicrhau y mabwysiadwn y canllawiau newydd ar fynediad i'r anabl ar

disabled access for all new buildings and we can then take that forward.

**Edwina Hart:** I apologise for intervening at this late stage, but do you agree—as I have already indicated in questions today—that we have a review of PFI, that our position on the Tory amendment must be taken in the context, and that I will be discussing it in Plenary on 5 December?

**Jane Davidson:** I will make my position on PFI clear in a moment. Before I do that, I welcome what Richard Edwards said about the leadership money. I tried to release the facts to the press that we were fully funding the leadership cost in Wales—

**Rod Richards:** I wish to make a helpful point. I know that Jane has visited Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, and she will recognise that school's particular problems because it is a regional centre of excellence. Does she recognise that under the present policy, there is a policy gap in terms of capital funding for that kind of school? Will she consider the possibility of capital funding for that school directly from the Assembly? Denbighshire—as she knows—is not in a position to do that.

**Jane Davidson:** You clearly were not in the Chamber when I made the announcement that I am specifically allocating money to Brondyffryn, that we are specifically looking at a policy which addresses regional centres in terms of special educational provision, and that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee will be receiving a presentation on the outcome of the pilot project on 14 January.

To return briefly to leadership—

**Brian Hancock** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** Deputy Presiding Officer, I am in your hands. I am happy to take interventions, but I must get through these points.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** By all means take this intervention, but I want you to keep to 10 minutes if possible.

gyfer pob adeilad newydd, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, ac wedyn gallwn ddwyn hynny ymlaen.

**Edwina Hart:** Ymddiheuraf am ymyrryd mor hwyr, ond a gytnwch—fel y nodais eisoes mewn cwestiynau heddiw—y dylem adolygu'r fenter cyllid preifat, bod rhaid ystyried ein barn ar y gwelliant Toriaidd yn y cyd-destun ac y'i trafodaf yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 5 Rhagfyr?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwnaf fy marn ar y fenter cyllid preifat yn glir mewn munud. Cyn imi wneud hynny, croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Richard Edwards am arian yr arweinyddiaeth. Ceisiais ryddhau'r ffeithiau i'r wasg ein bod yn ariannu cost yr arweinyddiaeth yng Nghymru yn llawn—

**Rod Richards:** Hoffwn wneud pwynt defnyddiol. Gwn fod Jane wedi ymweld ag Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, a bydd yn cydnabod problemau penodol yr ysgol honno gan ei bod yn ganolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol. A yw'n cydnabod bod bwlbwch polisi o ran arian cyfalaf ar gyfer ysgol o'r fath o dan y polisi presennol? A ystyria'r posibilrwydd o roi arian cyfalaf i'r ysgol honno yn uniongyrchol o'r Cynulliad? Nid yw Sir Ddinbych—fel y gwyr—mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n amlwg nad oeddech yn y Siambr pan gyhoeddais fy mod yn dyrannu arian i Frondyffryn yn benodol, ein bod yn ystyried yn benodol bolisi sydd yn ymdrin â chanolfannau rhanbarthol o ran darpariaeth addysgol arbennig, ac y caiff y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyflwyniad ar ganlyniad y prosiect peilot ar 14 Ionawr.

I ddychwelyd yn fyr at arweinyddiaeth—

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Ddirprwy Lywydd, fe ddilynaf eich cyfarwyddyd chi. Yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn ymyriadau, ond rhaid imi siarad am y pwyntiau hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Derbyniwch yr ymyriad hwn, ar bob cyfrif, ond yr wyf am i chi gadw at 10 munud os yn bosibl.

**Brian Hancock:** There are schools that provide services over a wider area. The capital costs for those schools are usually borne by the individual host local authority. I congratulate Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn in its success, but there are other schools that are in an equally important situation, and provide an education for children who need equal support, and those local authorities are under equal pressures. Will you now look to the future, and look to those regional schools and provide for them on an equal footing?

**Jane Davidson:** I have just said, Brian, that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee will receive a presentation about the outcome of the pilots across Wales in terms of special educational provision. I want to make my view clear: I strongly support educating people who need special educational support in buildings of the highest possible standard. I am sure that the whole Assembly would endorse that. We need to work with local government on those issues, alongside the investment in schools that are managed totally for those local authorities. I am acutely aware of the problem as demonstrated in Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, and I am keen that we examine ways of helping out there in the future.

I return quickly to leadership, to make this clear. We are funding the full costs of leadership in Wales, that is £3.1 million. I reviewed this because there was so much concern about it and because it was tied up with all the discussions about the court case on performance-related pay. I am pleased to announce that we are funding the leadership costs in full. I put this on the intranet on Friday, before I announced it to Governors Wales on Saturday. I thought that it was appropriate to announce it to governors because they have responsibility for the schools' budgets. I hope that this allayed many of our schools' fears, not only about the staff costs, but about capital costs also.

I shall finish on the vexed question of private finance initiative. I accept that it is a vexed

**Brian Hancock:** Ceir ysgolion sydd yn darparu gwasanaethau dros ardal ehangach. Fel arfer, yr awdurdod lleol unigol lle lleolir yr ysgolion sydd yn ysgwyddo'r costau cyfalaf ar gyfer yr ysgolion hynny. Llongyfarchaf Ysgol Brondyffryn am ei llwyddiant, ond mae ysgolion eraill sydd mewn sefyllfa yr un mor bwysig, ac sydd yn darparu addysg i blant y mae angen yr un cymorth arnynt, ac mae'r awdurdodau lleol hynny o dan yr un pwysau. A edrychwch yn awr i'r dyfodol, ac i'r ysgolion rhanbarthol hynny, gan ddarparu adnoddau cyfartal ar eu cyfer?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf newydd ddweud, Brian, y caiff y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyflwyniad am ganlyniad y prosiectau peilot ledled Cymru o ran darpariaeth addysgol arbennig. Hoffwn wneud fy safbwynt yn glir: cefnogaf yn gryf y gwaith o addysgu'r bobl y mae angen cymorth addysgol arbennig arnynt mewn adeiladau o'r safon uchaf posibl. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Cynulliad cyfan yn cymeradwyo hynny. Mae angen inni gydweithio â llywodraeth leol ar y materion hynny, ochr yn ochr â'r buddsoddiad yn yr ysgolion a reolir ar gyfer yr awdurdodau lleol hynny. Yr wyf yn hynod ymwybodol o'r problemau fel a amlygir yn Ysgol Plas Brondyffryn, ac yr wyf yn awyddus ein bod yn archwilio ffyrdd o helpu yno yn y dyfodol.

Dychwelaf yn gyflym at arweinyddiaeth, i wneud hyn yn glir. Ariannwn gostau llawn yr arweinyddiaeth yng Nghymru, sef £3.1 miliwn. Adolygais hyn oherwydd y bu cymaint o bryderu ynglŷn ag ef ac oherwydd y'i cysylltwyd â'r holl drafodaethau am yr achos llys ar dâl ar sail perfformiad. Mae'n dda gennyf gyhoeddi ein bod yn ariannu costau'r arweinyddiaeth yn llawn. Rhoddais hyn ar y fewnrwyd ddydd Gwener, cyn ei gyhoeddi i Lywodraethwyr Cymru ddydd Sadwrn. Teimlais ei bod yn briodol ei gyhoeddi i lywodraethwyr gan mai hwy sydd yn gyfrifol am gyllidebau'r ysgolion. Gobeithiaf y lleddfodd hyn lawer o bryderon ein hysgolion, nid yn unig am gostau'r staff, ond am gostau cyfalaf hefyd.

Gorffennaf ar fater dadleuol y fenter cyllid preifat. Derbyniaf ei fod yn fater dadleuol.

question. I can understand why a number of people—

**Geraint Davies** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** I will not take any more interventions because I have been asked to finish within my 10 minutes.

Many people have asked me why I want to support this amendment at this time. I remind Members that we are in a round of PFI bids at the moment. That is my only commitment to PFI as Minister. I am committed to making those ones work. I want to make it clear to everyone in the Chamber that that is the end of my commitment. It could be negative in terms of the seven schools that we are hoping to get out of this process if we were to send a signal out today that we were not supportive of PFI, when discussions—particularly, for example, in my own constituency—are at a fairly delicate level, in terms of bringing together the local authorities and the private sector partnerships, when we want this particular round to work. I make it clear that my commitment ends there. Any other discussion about PFI is a matter for the Finance Minister and debate in the Assembly. As Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, my commitment is to these schools which are going through the PFI process at the moment.

I ask Members to do the following: reject amendment 1, support amendment 2, reject amendment 3, support amendment 4, reject amendment 5, support amendment 6, support amendment 7 and then support the motion. This motion recognises that we have put a fantastic contribution into school buildings and our commitment is supported across all parties. I shall look to you as Members to engage with your local authorities to prioritise this issue in the future.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the vote, it has been noted that some Members have forgotten to declare an interest during the debate. Will any Members wishing to declare an interest please stand up so that the Clerk can note your names?

Gallaf ddeall pam bod nifer o bobl—

**Geraint Davies** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Ni dderbyniaf ragor o ymyriadau oherwydd gofynnwyd imi orffen o fewn fy 10 munud.

Gofynnodd llawer o bobl imi pam y dymunaf gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn yn awr. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau ein bod yng nghanol cylch o gynigion menter cyllid preifat ar hyn o bryd. Dyna fy unig ymrwymiad i'r fenter cyllid preifat fel Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod y rheini yn gweithio. Dymunaf ei gwneud yn glir i bawb yn y Siambr mai dyna ddiwedd fy ymrwymiad. Gallai fod yn negyddol o ran y saith ysgol yr ydym yn gobeithio eu cael yn sgîl y broses hon pe anfonem neges heddiw na chefnogwn y fenter cyllid preifat, pan fo'r trafodaethau—yn arbennig, er enghraifft, yn fy etholaeth fy hun—braidd yn fregus, o ran dod â'r awdurdodau lleol a phartneriaethau y sector preifat ynghyd, pan ddymunwn sicrhau bod y cylch penodol hwn yn gweithio. Gwnaf yn glir fod fy ymrwymiad yn gorffen yno. Mae unrhyw drafodaeth arall am y fenter cyllid preifat yn fater i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid a dadl yn y Cynulliad. Fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i'r ysgolion hyn sydd ym mynd drwy broses y fenter cyllid preifat ar hyn o bryd.

Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau wrthod gwelliant 1, cefnogi gwelliant 2, gwrthod gwelliant 3, cefnogi gwelliant 4, gwrthod gwelliant 5, cefnogi gwelliant 6, cefnogi gwelliant 7 ac wedyn cefnogi'r cynnig. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn cydnabod ein bod wedi gwneud cyfraniad aruthrol tuag at adeiladau ysgolion a chefnogir ein hymrwymiad ar draws pob un o'r pleidiau. Byddaf yn apelio arnoch fel Aelodau i drafod â'ch awdurdodau lleol er mwyn blaenoriaethu'r mater hwn yn y dyfodol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw'r bleidlais, nodwyd bod rhai Aelodau wedi anghofio datgan buddiant yn ystod y ddadl. A wnaiff unrhyw Aelodau sydd yn dymuno datgan buddiant sefyll fel y gall y Clerc nodi eich enwau?



12:15 a.m.

**Michael German:** What interests do we need to declare?

**Michael German:** Pa fuddiannau y mae angen inni eu datgan?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That is entirely a matter for you.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae hynny'n fater i chi yn llwyr.

**Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Peter Black, Christine Chapman, Cynog Dafis, Jane Davidson, Andrew Davies, Geraint Davies, Janet Davies, Ron Davies, Val Feld, Michael German, William Graham, Gareth Jones, Huw Lewis, David Lloyd, Alun Pugh, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas** *rose—*

**Lorraine Barrett, Mick Bates, Peter Black, Christine Chapman, Cynog Dafis, Jane Davidson, Andrew Davies, Geraint Davies, Janet Davies, Ron Davies, Val Feld, Michael German, William Graham, Gareth Jones, Huw Lewis, David Lloyd, Alun Pugh, Jenny Randerson, Janet Ryder, Owen John Thomas** *a gododd—*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I can see that some people are confused over declarations. We will consider whether we can declare interests in a different way in future. I think that for education debates, certainly, this needs to be reviewed. We will now move to a vote.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gallaf weld bod rhai pobl wedi drysu ynglŷn â datganiadau. Ystyriwn a allwn ddatgan buddiannau mewn ffordd wahanol yn y dyfodol. Credaf fod angen adolygu hyn ar gyfer dadleuon addysg, yn sicr. Symudwn yn awr at bleidlais.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Amendment 1: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 28, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 16.  
Amendment 2: For 28, Abstain 7, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Feld, Val  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Law, Peter  
Middlehurst, Tom

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 29*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Jane Davidson  
Davies, Andrew

Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant  
Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 5: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bates, Mick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Jane Davidson  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 44, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 6: For 44, Abstain 8, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Amendment 7: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Davies, Ron

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*notes and welcomes the significant increases in capital expenditure for schools proposed in the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities' draft budget laid in the Table Office on 19 October 2000 and encourages the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and local authorities in Wales to utilise the full potential of the private finance initiative to ensure that the level of capital investment in schools is maximised;*

*commits itself to providing improved and sustained investment in school buildings in Wales;*

*recognises the important strategic role that local education authorities continue to play in allocating funding for school repairs in Wales; and*

*in allocating future capital expenditure for schools, gives thorough consideration to:*

- a) the principles of sustainability;*
- b) the use by the wider community of school facilities.*

*yn nodi ac yn croesawu'r cynnydd sylweddol mewn gwariant cyfalaf i ysgolion a gynigiwyd yng nghyllideb ddrafft y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Hydref 2000 ac yn annog y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i fanteisio'n llawn ar botensial y fenter cyllid preifat er mwyn sicrhau cymaint o gynnydd â phosibl yn y cyfalaf a fuddsoddir mewn ysgolion;*

*yn ymrwymo i wella a chynnal lefel y buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion yng Nghymru;*

*yn cydnabod y rôl strategol bwysig y mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn parhau i'w chwarae wrth ddyrannu arian ar gyfer atgyweirio ysgolion yng Nghymru; ac*

*wrth ddyrannu gwariant cyfalaf ar gyfer ysgolion yn y dyfodol, yn rhoi ystyriaeth drylwyr i:*

- a) egwyddorion cynaliadwyedd;*
- b) ganiatáu i'r gymuned ehangach ddefnyddio cyfleusterau ysgolion.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 29, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 8.*

*Amended motion: For 29, Abstain 15, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Neagle, Lynne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Melding, David  
Cairns, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Richards, Rod

Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion adopted.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Rôl Ynni Adnewyddadwy yn y Dyfodol The Future Role of Renewable Energy**

**Phil Williams:** I am delighted to be lucky in the draw for the short debate during the week of the den Haag climate conference. I will allow Mick Bates and David Davies to make short contributions.

When I spoke on climate change some months ago, I made two predictions. I predicted an increase in rainfall and a time when ice over the North Pole would disappear. I said that that would be a serious warning. I had not expected both predictions to be confirmed so soon. However, there is a silver lining to this dark cloud: the popular media are at last making the link between carbon dioxide, global warming and the recent storms and floods.

Last Sunday, *Panorama* made that connection and urged us to strengthen our flood defences and planning rules. However, adaptation to the new climate will not be enough. If climate change ever kicks into

**Phil Williams:** Mae'n bleser gennyf fod yn ddigon ffodus i gyflwyno testun y dadl fer yn ystod wythnos cynhadledd den Haag ar hinsawdd. Byddaf yn caniatáu i Mick Bates a David Davies i wneud cyfraniadau byr.

Pan siaradais ar newid yn yr hinsawdd ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, rhagwelais ddau beth. Rhagwelais gynnydd yn lefel y glawriad ac amser pan fyddai rhew ym Mhegwn y Gogledd yn diflannu. Dywedais y byddai hynny'n rhybudd difrifol. Nid oeddwn wedi disgwyl i'r rhagolygon hynny gael eu cadarnhau mor fuan. Fodd bynnag, mae yna oleuni y tu ôl i'r cwmwl tywyll hwn: mae'r cyfryngau poblogaidd o'r diwedd wedi canfod y cyswllt rhwng carbon deuocsid, cynhesu byd-eang a'r stormydd a'r llifogydd diweddar.

Ddydd Sul diwethaf, llwyddodd *Panorama* i wneud y cyswllt hwnnw a'n hannog i atgyfnerthu ein hamddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd a'n rheolau cynllunio. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd addasu i ymdopi â'r



positive feedback, our highest river defences will seem pathetic. Adaptation must be matched by mitigation.

There was a depressing fatalism shown in that *Panorama* programme. It is true that, because oceans respond slowly, the full effects of what we have already done will not be felt for 50 years. There is worse to come. However, if we do nothing to cut carbon dioxide emissions drastically, it will be much worse. The global imperative is to cut carbon dioxide emissions by a factor of two, but if we are to allow industrial expansion in the poorest countries, we must cut our emissions by a factor of three. That is the bad news.

The good news is that there is no technical problem in achieving this. The availability of clean, renewable energy far exceeds the reserves of fossil fuel. However, there is a political problem. We, as politicians, should ask what we should do to tackle this problem. First, we must set realistic targets for the growth of renewable energy to convince the public that it is possible to cut our use of fossil fuel without sacrificing comfort and convenience.

Let us consider our demand for electricity. In Wales, we take about 16 terrawatt hours a year from the national grid, of which about 12 come from fossil fuel sources and four from nuclear power. To reduce carbon dioxide emissions, the first step is to reduce electricity consumption. Reduction is not an alternative to renewable energy generation, as some campaigners against windfarms argue, but it is the first priority. We must eliminate wastage by improving house insulation, by using low energy light bulbs, by demanding that every refrigerator and freezer on sale are highly efficient, by placing cathode-ray oscilloscopes with low energy monitors and so on. It would be technically easy to reduce our demand for electricity by at least 25 per cent. Then we would only require 12 terrawatt hours a year. If, initially, four

hinsawdd newydd yn ddigonol. Os bydd newid yn yr hinsawdd yn creu adborth cadarnhaol, bydd ein hamddiffynfeydd uchaf ar afonydd yn ymddangos yn druenus. Rhaid i addasiadau fynd law yn llaw â lleddfu.

Dangoswyd tyngheddiaeth dorcalonnus yn y rhaglen *Panorama*. Mae'n wir i ddweud, am fod cefnforoedd yn ymateb yn araf, ni ddaw effeithiau llawn yr hyn yr ydym eisoes wedi'i wneud i'r amlwg am 50 mlynedd. Mae gwaeth i ddod. Fodd bynnag, os na wnawn unrhyw beth i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yn sylweddol, bydd pethau'n llawer gwaeth. Yr hyn sydd yn hollbwysig, ar raddfa fyd-eang yw cael gostyngiad o ffactor o ddau mewn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, ond os ydym am ganiatáu ehangiad diwydiannol yn y gwledydd tlotaf, rhaid inni gael gostyngiad o ffactor o dri yn ein gollyngiadau. Dyna yw'r newyddion drwg.

Y newyddion da yw nad oes unrhyw broblem dechnegol sydd yn ein hatal rhag gwneud hyn. Mae'r ynni glân ac adnewyddadwy sydd ar gael yn fwy o lawer na'r cronfeydd o danwydd ffosil. Fodd bynnag, mae yna broblem wleidyddol. Dylem ni, fel gwleidyddion, ofyn beth y dylem ni ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon. Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni osod targedau realistig ar gyfer twf ynni adnewyddadwy er mwyn argyhoeddi'r cyhoedd ei bod yn bosibl lleihau'r defnydd a wnawn o danwydd ffosil heb aberthu cysur a chyfleustra.

Gadewch inni ystyried ein galw am drydan. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn defnyddio tua 16 awr terrawatt y flwyddyn o'r grid cenedlaethol, a daw tua 12 o'r rhain o ffynonellau tanwydd ffosil a phedwar o bŵer niwclear. Er mwyn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, y cam cyntaf yw lleihau'r defnydd a wneir o drydan. Nid yw lleihau'n ddewis amgen i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, fel y dadleua rhai ymgyrchwyr yn erbyn ffermydd gwynt, ond dyna'r flaenoriaeth gyntaf. Rhaid inni atal gwastraff drwy wella dulliau o inswleiddio tai, defnyddio bylbiau golau ynni isel, drwy sicrhau bod pob oergell a rhewgell sydd ar werth yn effeithlon iawn, drwy osod osgilosgopau pelydryn cathod gyda monitoriaid ynni isel ac ati. Byddai'n hawdd yn dechnegol i leihau ein galw am drydan 25

terrawatt hours still came from nuclear power, the remaining 8 hours would be shared between fossil fuel and renewable energy sources.

To achieve the target of reducing carbon dioxide emission from electricity generation by a factor of three, we need to generate four terrawatt hours a year from renewable energy. How do we do that before 2010? Wind power could contribute more than half of that total. Wales is ideal for the use of wind power, which is now a mature and competitive technology.

12:25 p.m.

**Delyth Evans:** Do you agree that with the current number of windfarm applications and contracts in Wales, particularly in mid Wales, there is a danger of disproportionate development to the detriment of landscape conservation and tourism? If the future is offshore windfarms, which many people now accept, should we not encourage companies to accept and look into that new technology and seek, in the meantime, to minimise the impact of land-based wind technology?

**Phil Williams:** We should set a limit of 2,000 turbines rated at 500 kilowatts, for example, including offshore turbines, because that would generate 2.6 terrawatt hours, more than half way to our target. However, that must be done by a proper, spatial strategy. We should proceed rapidly to establish that, but in the meantime, the clock is ticking away and good schemes should still be approved.

The second measure is hydro-electricity. There is a limit to the total power that we can generate in this way, but with several local schemes such as those proposed in the Dyfi Valley, which were, again, opposed on so-called environmental grounds initially, we would have no difficulty in generating about half a terrawatt hour.

y cant o leiaf. Yna byddem ond yn defnyddio 12 awr terrawatt y flwyddyn. Pe byddai pedair awr terrawatt yn parhau i ddod o bŵer niwclear ar y dechrau, byddai'r wyth awr sydd yn weddill yn cael eu rhannu rhwng tanwydd ffosil a ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy.

Er mwyn cyrraedd y targed o gael gostyngiad o ffactor o dri mewn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid a ddaw o gynhyrchu trydan, mae angen inni gynhyrchu pedair awr terrawatt y flwyddyn o ynni adnewyddadwy. Sut gallwn ni wneud hynny cyn 2010? Gallai pŵer gwynt gyfrannu mwy na hanner y cyfanswm hwnnw. Mae Cymru'n lleoliad delfrydol ar gyfer defnyddio pŵer gwynt, sydd bellach yn dechnoleg aeddfed a chystadleuol.

**Delyth Evans:** A gyfunwch, o ystyried nifer y ceisiadau a'r contractau presennol sydd ar y gweill ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt, yn arbennig yng nghanolbarth Cymru, bod yna berygl y ceir datblygiad anghymesur a gaiff effaith andwyol ar gadwraeth tirwedd a thwristiaeth? Os mai ffermydd gwynt alltraeth yw'r dyfodol a dderbynnir bellach gan nifer o bobl, oni ddylem fod yn annog cwmnïau i dderbyn ac i ymchwilio i'r dechnoleg newydd honno a cheisio, yn y cyfamser, sicrhau bod technoleg gwynt ar y tir sydd yn yn cael yr effaith leiaf posibl?

**Phil Williams:** Dylem osod uchafswm o 2,000 tyrbin 500 cilowat, er enghraifft, yn cynnwys tyrbinau alltraeth, oherwydd y byddai hynny yn cynhyrchu 2.6 awr terrawatt, sydd dros hanner ffordd at ein targed. Fodd bynnag, dylid gwneud hynny drwy strategaeth ofodol briodol. Dylem weithredu'n gyflym er mwyn sefydlu hynny ond, yn y cyfamser, mae'r amser yn prysur fynd heibio a dylid parhau i gymeradwyo cynlluniau da.

Yr ail fesur yw trydan dŵr. Mae yna derfyn i gyfanswm y pŵer y gallwn ei gynhyrchu yn y dull hwn, ond gyda sawl cynllun lleol fel y rhai a gynigiwyd yn Nyffryn Dyfi, a gafodd eu gwrthwynebu, unwaith eto, ar sail amgylcheddol honedig i ddechrau, ni chaem unrhyw anhawster i gynhyrchu tua hanner awr terrawatt.

The third mature technology, which is also controversial, is based on biomass, using forestry waste and short-term coppicing. This produces carbon dioxide, but it is an acceptable form of renewable energy, because that carbon dioxide will have recently been removed from the atmosphere. I would like to see biomass power stations with an output of between 15 and 20 megawatts. That is the optimum size. Four of those would generate 0.7 terrawatt hours. To all intents and purposes, we could reach our targets by 2010, and at the same time produce substantial income for rural areas.

By 2020, we must set ourselves new targets to meet the day when nuclear power stations are decommissioned. We must start planning for that now, by sponsoring the research and development necessary to use other alternatives including the immense power of the sea. We are, after all, a peninsular facing the Atlantic. It is strange that with the second highest tides in the world, we have not yet employed tidal power, which is a mature and competitive technology. A Severn barrage would produce almost twice our reduced electricity demand and solve the problem in one go. However, a Severn barrage would have large and uncertain effects on the environment and commercial traffic. We should not consider it until we fully understand the effect of tidal barrages, but it is good to know that as a last resort, we have, on our doorstep, renewable energy to meet all our long-term needs.

Taking a more cautious approach, we might consider small estuary barrages. An estuary barrage would produce an annual output of about 0.2 terrawatt hours and provide extra flood protection at the same time. However, it would affect established interests. Therefore, I would prefer consideration of a more ambitious project that would avoid conflict with long established and valid interests. An offshore tidal generator has been proposed, for example, near Rhyl, by Tidal Electric Incorporated. It would enclose 50 square kilometres of sea, but its annual

Mae'r drydedd dechnoleg aeddfed, sydd hefyd yn ddadleuol, yn seiliedig ar fio-màs, sydd yn defnyddio gwastraff coedwigaeth a choedlannu tymor byr. Mae hyn yn cynhyrchu carbon deuocsid, ond mae'n ddull derbyniol o ynni adnewyddadwy, oherwydd y bydd y carbon deuocsid hwnnw newydd gael ei dynnu o'r atmosffer. Hoffwn weld gorsafoedd pŵer bio-màs gydag allbwn o rhwng 15 ac 20 megawat. Dyna'r maint mwyaf ffafriol. Byddai pedwar o'r rhain yn cynhyrchu 0.7 awr terrawatt. I bob pwrpas, galleu gyrraedd ein targed erbyn 2010, a chynhyrchu incwm sylweddol i ardaloedd gwledig ar yr un pryd.

Erbyn 2020, rhaid inni osod targedau newydd i ni ein hunain er mwyn paratoi ar gyfer y dydd pan gaiff gorsafoedd pŵer eu datgomiynu. Rhaid inni ddechrau cynllunio ar gyfer hynny yn awr, drwy noddi'r ymchwil a'r datblygiad angenrheidiol er mwyn defnyddio dulliau amgen gan gynnwys pŵer aruthrol y môr. Yr ydym, wedi'r cyfan, yn orynys sydd yn wynebu'r Iwerydd. Mae'n rhyfedd, o ystyried fod gennym yr ail lanw uchaf yn y byd, nad ydym wedi defnyddio pŵer llanw eto, sydd yn dechnoleg aeddfed a chystadleuol. Byddai morglawdd ar draws Môr Hafren yn cynhyrchu bron ddwywaith ein galw gostyngol am drydan, ac yn datrys y broblem ar unwaith. Fodd bynnag, byddai morglawdd ar draws Môr Hafren yn cael effaith ansicr a sylweddol ar yr amgylchedd a thrafnidiaeth fasnachol. Ni ddylem ystyried hynny nes ein bod yn deall effaith morgloddiau llanwol yn llwyr, ond braf yw gwybod bod gennym, ar garreg ein drws, fel y dewis olaf, ynni adnewyddadwy a fyddai'n diwallu ein holl anghenion tymor hir,.

Drwy fabwysiadu ymagwedd sydd yn fwy gochelgar, galleu ystyried morgloddiau ar draws aber afonydd bach. Byddai morglawdd aber yn cynhyrchu allbwn blynyddol o tua 0.2 awr terrawatt ac yn darparu mwy o ddiogelwch rhag llifogydd ar yr un pryd. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n effeithio ar fuddiannau sefydledig. Felly, byddai'n well gennyf ystyried prosiect mwy uchelgeisiol a fyddai'n osgoi gwrthdaro gyda buddiannau sefydledig a dilys. Cynigiwyd lleoli generadur llanw alltraeth, er enghraifft, ger y Rhyl, gan Tidal Electric Incorporated. Byddai

output would be 2.8 terrawatt hours. A feature of an offshore tidal generator is that the cost effectiveness increases steadily with size and the scheme becomes more economic for a larger system, so it is not easy to set up a pilot scheme. However, I believe that the proposal is worth considering with a properly funded engineering study to provide realistic costs. If we are to do that, the time to do it is now.

This does not end the power that we will be able to draw from the sea. This week, a commercial wave generator started operating in Scotland. Wave generators show great promise and the total wave energy pounding the beaches of Wales is enormous, but we must remember—and this applies to all offshore developments—that wave generators would mean massive engineering structures close to the shore. Underwater turbines driven by strong sea currents would be more visually acceptable. There has been a suggestion that a prototype could go to Wylfa. There is no doubt that there, or in the Menai, or in Bardsey Sound, for example, we would find the strong currents to make such a project successful and make an important contribution.

Time is running out, and I have not yet mentioned solar energy. Solar heating, through solar panels or through building design, is now a reliable technique that should be a standard feature of all new buildings, especially public ones. Photovoltaic generation of electricity is also a mature technology, but it is not yet economically competitive. In Wales, we have the largest PV array in the UK. PV generation is still expensive but it has reached the stage where, if the market were large enough, it would be cheap enough to attract a large market.

Looking forward to 2020, there is no fundamental technical problem, in Wales at least, in meeting the target. If we succeed, we will also gain major economic benefits. This industrial sector is more likely to expand over the next 20 years than any other sector that

hynny'n amgáu 50 cilomedr sgwâr o'r môr, ond byddai ei allbwn blynyddol yn 2.8 awr terrawatt. Un o nodweddion cynhyrchydd llanw alltraeth yw bod cost-effeithiolrwydd hyn yn cynyddu'n raddol gyda maint a daw'r cynllun yn fwy economaidd ar gyfer system fwy, felly nid yw'n hawdd sefydlu cynllun peilot. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y cynnig yn werth ei ystyried gydag astudiaeth beirianeg a ariannwyd yn briodol i ddarparu'r costau realistig. Os ydym am wneud hynny, yn awr yw'r amser i'w wneud.

Nid dyna'r unig bŵer y gallwn ei dynnu o'r môr. Yr wythnos hon, dechreuodd generadur tonnau masnachol weithredu yn yr Alban. Gallai generaduron tonnau fod yn addawol iawn ac mae cyfanswm yr ynni a gynhyrchir gan donnau'n torri ar draethau Cymru yn enfawr, ond dylem gofio—ac mae hyn yn berthnasol i bob math o ddatblygiad alltraeth—y byddai generaduron tonnau'n arwain at adeiladau peirianeg enfawr yn agos at y lan. Byddai tyrbinau tanddwr a yrrir gan gerhyntau cryf y môr yn fwy derbynol yn weledol. Awgrymwyd y gellid cyflwyno prototeip yn yr Wylfa. Yn ddiau, mae yno gerhyntau, ac yn y Fenai a Swnt Enlli, sydd yn ddigon cryf i sicrhau bod y prosiect yn llwyddo ac yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig.

Mae amser yn brin, ac nid wyf wedi crybwyll ynni'r haul eto. Bellach, mae gwresogi drwy ynni'r haul, drwy baneli heulol neu drwy gynllun adeiladau yn dechnoleg ddibynadwy a ddylai fod yn nodwedd safonol o bob adeilad newydd, yn arbennig rhai cyhoeddus. Mae cynhyrchu trydan drwy ddull ffotofoltaidd hefyd yn dechnoleg aeddfed, ond nid yw'n gystadleuol yn economaidd eto. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym y casgliad ffotofoltaidd mwyaf yn y DU. Mae cynhyrchu trydan drwy ddulliau ffotofoltaidd yn parhau i fod yn ddrud ond mae bellach wedi cyrraedd pwynt lle, pe bai'r farchnad yn ddigon mawr, byddai'n ddigon rhad i ddenu marchnad fawr.

Gan edrych ymlaen i 2020, nid oes unrhyw broblem dechnegol sylfaenol, yng Nghymru o leiaf, i gwrdd â'r targed. Pe llwyddem, byddem hefyd yn sicrhau manteision economaidd mawr. Mae'r sector diwydiannol hwn yn fwy tebygol o ehangu yn ystod yr 20

you could name. In Denmark, renewable energy already employs 15,000 people, and it is becoming a significant industry in Wales. Last night, we had an enthusiastic meeting of the National Assembly for Wales's renewable energy group, with over 50 members representing companies and groups from all parts of Wales. However, it is an industry that needs support and encouragement.

If we set targets that are realistic and acceptable to the public, we must then complete a coherent strategy. That will have a spatial component, and I am convinced that wind power would not have aroused such irrational opposition if the first generation of windfarms had been carefully sited. We have large areas of upland in Wales, where I am sure that windfarms would be acceptable to the vast majority of people. However, this will need careful planning, as does the timescale of development. During the next 10 years, while we proceed with the development of wind power, hydro-electricity schemes, biomass and solar heating, we must start the preliminary work for the next generation of technologies. That would involve a partnership of our engineering companies, community enterprises, universities and the Assembly.

Finally, what immediate action can the Assembly take? Above all, we can set positive planning guidelines, with a presumption in favour of renewable energy. We must set new guidelines for the Countryside Council for Wales that do not put such an emphasis on the aesthetic interpretation of visual impact. It is appalling that, despite numerous opportunities to take a lead in this work and to reap the benefits of it, post-devolution Wales is developing an anti-environmental reputation, with all recent planning applications for renewable energy projects being called in. We have a fantastic opportunity to use the Assembly's powers to promote work of global significance, and at the same time install a firm pillar in our economic development strategy. It is vital that we seize that opportunity.

mlynedd nesaf o'i gymharu ag unrhyw sector arall y gallech ei enwi. Yn Nenmarc, mae'r diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy eisoes yn cyflogi 15,000 o bobl, ac mae'n prysur ddatblygu'n ddiwydiant arwyddocaol yng Nghymru. Neithiwr, cynhaliodd grŵp ynni adnewyddadwy Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gyfarfod brwdfrydig, gyda thros 50 o aelodau yn cynrychioli cwmnïau a grwpiau o bob rhan o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddiwydiant sydd angen cefnogaeth ac anogaeth.

Os gosodwn dargedau sydd yn realistig ac yn dderbyniol i'r cyhoedd, rhaid inni wedyn gwblhau strategaeth gydlynus. Bydd cydran ofodol i hyn, ac yr rwyf yn argyhoeddedig na fyddai pŵer gwynt wedi creu cymaint o wrthwynebiad afresymol petai'r genhedlaeth gyntaf o ffermydd gwynt wedi'u lleoli'n ofalus. Mae gennym ardaloedd eang o ucheldir yng Nghymru, lle yr wyf yn sicr y byddai ffermydd gwynt yn dderbyniol i'r mwyafrif llethol o bobl. Fodd bynnag, bydd angen cynllunio hyn yn ofalus, yn ogystal â llunio amserlen y gwaith datblygu. Yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf, tra byddwn yn parhau i ddatblygu pŵer gwynt, cynllunio trydan dŵr, bio-màs a gwresogi drwy ynni'r haul, rhaid inni ddechrau ar waith rhagarweiniol ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf o dechnolegau. Byddai hynny'n golygu partneriaeth rhwng ein cwmnïau peirianeg, mentrau cymunedol, prifysgolion a'r Cynulliad.

Yn olaf, pa gamau gweithredol all y Cynulliad eu cymryd ar unwaith? Yn anad dim, gallwn sefydlu canllawiau cynllunio cadarnhaol, sydd yn gwyro o blaid ynni adnewyddadwy. Rhaid inni osod canllawiau newydd ar gyfer Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru nad ydynt yn rhoi cymaint o bwyslais ar ddehongliad esthetig yr effaith weledol. Mae'n warthus, er gwaethaf sawl cyfle i gymryd rhan flaenllaw yn y gwaith hwn ac elwa yn ei sgîl, bod Cymru ddatganoledig yn datblygu enw am fod yn wrth-amgylcheddol, gyda'r holl geisiadau cynllunio diweddar am brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy'n cael eu galw i mewn. Mae gennym gyfle gwych i ddefnyddio pwerau'r Cynulliad i hyrwyddo gwaith ag iddo arwyddocâd byd-eang, tra'n gosod colofn gadarn yn ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd ar yr un pryd. Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn manteisio i'r eithaf ar

y cyfle hwnnw.

**Mick Bates:** I thank Phil for allowing me to contribute to this important debate. I was pleased to hear him mention the cross-party inclusive work being undertaken in the Assembly in the renewable energy group to encourage and promote the use of renewable energy. As he rightly said, it has provided a good forum in Wales for the formation of networks that will ensure that the needs of the industry are met by the Assembly.

**Mick Bates:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Phil am ganiatáu i mi gyfrannu at y ddatl bwysig hon. Yr oeddwn yn falch o'i glywed yn crybwyll y gwaith traws-bleidiol sydd ar waith yn y Cynulliad yn y grŵp ynni adnewyddadwy i annog a hyrwyddo'r defnydd o ynni adnewyddadwy. Fel y dywedodd, a hynny'n gywir, mae wedi darparu trafodaeth dda yng Nghymru er mwyn creu'r rhwydweithiau a fydd yn sicrhau y bydd y Cynulliad yn diwallu anghenion y diwydiant.

I will address two issues. One directly relates to attitudes in the Assembly. The other relates to the way forward, because there is no such thing as a benign impact. Any actions have an environmental impact. The Assembly must provide long-term commitment and motivation, and encourage partnerships and good communication to ensure that the renewable energy industry grows. We must also ensure that, when we finally have our renewable energy strategy, an organisation is put in place to drive forward the creation of a Welsh renewable energy industry. As I have said on many occasions, the Welsh Development Agency should become the Welsh Sustainable Development Agency. A renewable energy group should be sited in it to promote good planning guidelines. Its first words to developers should be, 'How can we help site and build this industry?' We must adopt that attitude.

Trafodaf ddau fater. Cyfeiria un yn uniongyrchol at ymagweddau yn y Cynulliad. Mae'r llall yn ymwneud â'r ffordd ymlaen, gan nad oes y fath beth ag effaith ddiwed. Caiff unrhyw gamau a gymerir effaith ar yr amgylchedd. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad ddarparu ymrwymiad a chymhelliant tymor hir, ac annog partneriaethau a chyfathrebu da er mwyn sicrhau bod y diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy yn tyfu. Rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd, ar ôl inni sefydlu ein strategaeth ynni adnewyddadwy, y sefydlir sefydliad i fynd â'r gwaith o greu diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru yn ei flaen. Fel y crybwyllais ar sawl achlysur, dylai Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ddod yn Awdurdod Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru. Dylid lleoli grŵp ynni adnewyddadwy o'i mewn er mwyn hyrwyddo canllawiau cynllunio da. Dylai eiriau cyntaf i ddatblygwyr gynnwys, 'Sut gallwn ni helpu i leoli ac adeiladu'r diwydiant hwn?' Rhaid inni fabwysiadu'r agwedd honno.

12:35 p.m.

The other issue relates to how we ensure that communities accept this development. There is a massive job of education to be done here and we must make the link between local energy consumption and the impact on the global environment. Last night, as Phil mentioned, we had a report from Awel Aman Tawe, a community windfarm project, and the Dyfi Eco-Valley Partnership. We heard that only 1.5 per cent of all our renewable energy is based in communities, whereas, in Denmark, 80 per cent of the communities that produce renewable energy are involved directly in that production and benefit from it.

Mae'r mater arall yn ymwneud â sut yr ydym am sicrhau bod cymunedau'n derbyn y datblygiad hwn. Mae tasg addysgu enfawr o'n blaen a rhaid inni sefydlu'r cyswllt rhwng y defnydd a wneir o ynni yn lleol a'r effaith ar yr amgylchedd byd-eang. Neithiwr, fel y crybwyllodd Phil, cawsom adroddiad gan Awel Aman Tawe, prosiect fferm wynt gymunedol, a Phartneriaeth Dyfi Eco-Valley. Clywsom mai dim ond 1.5 y cant o'n holl ynni adnewyddadwy sydd yn seiliedig mewn cymunedau, tra bod 80 y cant o'r cymunedau sydd yn cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yn Nenmarc yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'i

I believe that, through community regeneration and involvement, we will build this industry in Wales.

One of the speakers last night pointed out that the future is bright because our young citizens have excellent role models, namely the Teletubbies, who are wind-powered. [*Interruption.*] Obviously not many Members watch the Teletubbies. The Assembly must take the lead with a positive attitude. It is important that our Ministers provide that lead through a strategy and planning guidelines that will assist developers to invest in Wales.

**David Davies:** I will resist the temptation to make comparisons between the Teletubbies being wind-powered and Members of certain political parties in the Assembly.

I am grateful for the opportunity to speak on this subject, and I make it clear that the Conservative Party supports the sentiments expressed by Phil Williams. We accept that climate change is occurring as a result of misuse of the environment and that we must take steps to remedy that. Some of the solutions proposed by Phil would need careful consideration. The scheme in Scotland has, apparently, been successful so far, but I would have grave concerns about wave-powered generation schemes along the south Wales coastline. It is a beautiful coastline—I have surfed it for many years—and we could greatly damage tourism in Wales by locating such schemes along the coast. We must be careful. Likewise with barrages. A barrage in Newport was suggested a few years ago and there were concerns that that could have led to flooding all the way up the Usk Valley. These matters must be considered carefully. However, we need to come up with imaginative ideas and, to use a current phrase, think outside the box.

On windfarms, I wonder whether anybody has considered the possibility of offering people whose homes are in the vicinity of

gynhyrchu ac yn elwa o hynny. Credaf y byddwn yn adeiladu diwydiant o'r fath yng Nghymru drwy adfywio cymunedau a'u cynnwys yn y broses.

Nododd un o'r siaradwyr neithiwr fod y dyfodol yn ddisglair gan fod gan ein dinasyddion ifanc fodelau rôl gwyach, sef y Teletubbies, sydd yn defnyddio pŵer gwynt. [*Torri ar draws.*] Yn amlwg, nid yw llawer o'r Aelodau'n gwylio'r Teletubbies. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad gymryd yr awennau gydag agwedd gadarnhaol. Mae'n bwysig bod ein Gweinidogion yn darparu'r arweiniad hwnnw drwy strategaeth a chanllawiau cynllunio a fydd yn cynorthwyo datblygwyr i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru.

**David Davies:** Ceisiaf ymwrthod â'r demtasiwn i gymharu'r Teletubbies sydd yn cael eu pweru gan wynt ac Aelodau o bleidiau gwleidyddol penodol yn y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar o gael y cyfle i siarad am y pwnc hwn, a phwysleisiaf fod y Blaid Geidwadol yn cefnogi'r farn a fynegwyd gan Phil Williams. Derbyniwn fod newidiadau'n digwydd i'r hinsawdd o ganlyniad i gamddefnyddio'r amgylchedd a rhaid inni gymryd camau gweithredol i adfer hynny. Byddai angen ystyriaeth ofalus o rai o'r datrysiadau a gynigiwyd gan Phil. Ymddengys bod y cynllun yn Yr Alban wedi bod yn llwyddiannus hyd yma, ond byddai gennyf amheuan cryf ynglŷn â chynlluniau cynhyrchu pŵer drwy donnau ar hyd arfordir de Cymru. Mae'n arfordir prydfferth iawn—yr wyf wedi syrffio yno ers blynyddoedd lawer—a gallai lleoli cynlluniau o'r fath ar hyd yr arfordir greu niwed mawr i dwristiaeth yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus. Yn yr un modd â chyda morgloddiau. Awgrymwyd morglawdd yng Nghasnewydd ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl a mynegwyd pryderon y gallai hynny arwain at lifogydd yr holl ffordd ar hyd Dyffryn Wysg. Rhaid ystyried y materion hyn yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ganfod syniadau dyfeisgar a chan ddefnyddio ymadrodd cyfredol, meddwl y tu hwnt i'r ffiniau.

Ar ffermydd gwynt, tybed a oes unrhyw un wedi ystyried y posibilrwydd o gynnis ynni rhatach i bobl sydd â chartrefi yn agos at

windfarms cheaper energy. That might encourage them to think more positively about planning applications. On planting more forests, we must find ways of encouraging farmers to diversify, possibly by placing an expectation on companies that may be responsible for polluting the environment to contribute financially to a scheme that would allow farmers to grow forests. There are all sorts of ways of encouraging better use of the environment.

Finally, I recently went on a tour of the National Botanic Garden of Wales. It was excellent because when I was being taken around, the guide made it clear that, although all sorts of imaginative methods to reuse energy are used there, that is not done with only the environment in mind; there are sound commercial reasons for doing so. We must move renewable energy away from its image of people with beards and sandals—no offence, Phil—to people who wear pinstripe suits and think about money. That way, we can make a difference.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economic Development (Michael German):** I have offered Richard Edwards an opportunity to intervene whenever he wishes to do so.

I reassure the Assembly that the Cabinet welcomes this debate. With the eyes of the world on climate change discussions in the Hague this week, and following our sustainable development debate last week, the timing could not be more opportune. All governments must treat as a priority ensuring reliable and competitively priced energy for their citizens, while ameliorating global warming and other environmental problems. I strongly reject any assertion that we do not treat those issues seriously enough.

The Assembly now has a sustainable development scheme, which fully recognises the potential and importance of clean energy and energy conservation. In 'Betterwales.com', despite energy policy not being a devolved function, we have highlighted the need for a new strategic energy framework. In 'Putting Wales First',

ffermydd gwynt. Gallai hynny eu hannog i edrych yn fwy ffafriol ar geisiadau cynllunio. O ran plannu mwy o goedwigoedd, rhaid inni ganfod ffyrdd o annog ffermwyr i arallgyfeirio, o bosibl drwy ddisgwyl i gwmnïau a allai fod yn gyfrifol am lygru'r amgylchedd gyfrannu'n ariannol i gynllun a fyddai'n galluogi ffermwyr i dyfu coedwigoedd. Mae pob mathau o ffyrdd yn bodoli er mwyn annog pobl i wneud gwell defnydd o'r amgylchedd.

Yn olaf, yn ddiweddar euthum o amgylch Gardd Fotanegol Cymru. Yr oedd yn wych oherwydd wrth i mi gael fy nhywys o amgylch, pwysleisiodd y tywysydd, er bod yna ddulliau dyfeisgar yn bodoli er mwyn ail-ddefnyddio'r ynni a ddefnyddir yno, ni wneir hyn gyda dim ond yr amgylchedd mewn golwg; mae rhesymau masnachol dilys dros wneud hynny. Rhaid inni symud ynni adnewyddadwy i ffwrdd o'r ddelwedd o bobl â barf a sandalau—heb fod yn amharchus i chi Phil—i bobl sydd yn gwisgo siwt streipen fain ac sydd yn meddwl am arian. Drwy wneud hynny, gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth.

**Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru a'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Michael German):** Yr wyf wedi cynnig cyfle i Richard Edwards ymyrryd pryd bynnag y dymuna wneud hynny.

Hoffwn sicrhau'r Cynulliad bod y Cabinet yn croesawu'r dadl hon. Wrth i lygaid y byd ganolbwyntio ar drafodaethau ar newidiadau hinsawdd yn yr Hague yr wythnos hon, ac yn dilyn ein dadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yw wythnos diwethaf, ni allai'r amseru fod yn well. Rhaid i bob llywodraeth drin sicrhau ynni dibynadwy am bris cystadleuol i'w dinasyddion, tra'n lleddfu cynhesu byd-eang a phroblemau amgylcheddol eraill, fel blaenoriaeth. Anghytunaf yn gryf ag unrhyw honiad nad ydym yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn ddigon difrifol.

Bellach, mae gan y Cynulliad gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, sydd yn cydnabod yn llawn botensial a phwysigrwydd ynni glân ac arbed ynni. Yn 'Gwellcymru.com', er nad yw polisi ynni'n swyddogaeth a ddatganolwyd, yr ydym wedi pwysleisio'r angen am fframwaith ynni strategol newydd. Yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf', pwysleisiwyd ein bod yn



we have made clear that we are firmly committed to ensuring that economic growth is environmentally and socially sustainable. We have added the commitment to develop a Wales biomass strategy, specifically to exploit forest residues and short-rotation coppice developments. The Assembly has commissioned studies on the potential for biomass growth in Wales, and the Forestry Commission continues to look at these opportunities from the forests of Wales perspective. The Assembly has commissioned a multi-consortium led by SEL to study the opportunities for Wales across the board. Sue Essex announced the formation of a working group last week to look at the spatial planning aspects of renewables development. The Assembly's all-party sustainable energy lobby group has been formed under the chairmanship of my colleague, Mick Bates. Clean energy development and energy infrastructure investment have their own measures in the Objective 1 programme. We are doing a great deal.

**Richard Edwards:** I commend Mick Bates in particular for the drive and energy that he has shown in promoting this subject across parties in the Assembly and outside. I want to draw attention to a couple of innovative renewable energy initiatives in the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park. I want to do so in particular to demonstrate that national parks can be positive about renewable energy, despite a reputation to the contrary on account of opposition to industrial-scale wind power stations. The national park authority is funding with moneys—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I hate to interrupt you, but this must be an intervention, not a speech. If you wanted to speak, you needed permission from the proposer of the topic for debate. Please try to keep to an intervention.

**Richard Edwards:** I understood from Mike that he would give me a minute.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Carry on.

**Richard Edwards:** The national park authority is funding with moneys from the

gwbl ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod twf economaidd yn gynaliadwy yn amgylcheddol ac yn gymdeithasol. Ychwanegasom yr ymrwymiad i ddatblygu strategaeth bio-màs i Gymru, sydd yn cyfeirio'n benodol at ddefnyddio gweddillion coedwigoedd a datblygiadau coedlannau cylchdro byr. Comisiynodd y Cynulliad astudiaethau ar botensial twf bio-màs yn Nghymru, ac mae'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yn parhau i edrych ar y cyfleoedd hyn o safbwynt coedwigoedd Cymru. Comisiynodd y Cynulliad aml-gonsortiw m o dan arweinyddiaeth SEL i astudio'r cyfleoedd sydd yn bodoli ar gyfer Cymru yn gyffredinol. Cyhoeddodd Sue Essex yr wythnos diwethaf y caiff gweithgor ei sefydlu er mwyn edrych ar agweddau cynllunio datblygiad deunyddiau adnewyddadwy. Ffurfiwyd y grŵp lobbïo traws-bleidiol ar ynni cynaliadwy o dan gadeiryddiaeth fy nghyd-Aelod, Mick Bates. Mae gan ddatblygiadau ynni glân a buddsoddiad seilwaith ynni eu mesurau eu hunain yn rhaglen Amcan 1. Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer iawn.

**Richard Edwards:** Hoffwn ganmol Mick Bates yn arbennig am y penderfyniad a'r egni a ddangosodd wrth hyrwyddo'r pwnc hwn ar draws yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad a thu hwnt. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at rai mentrau ynni adnewyddadwy arloesol ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Sir Benfro. Yr wyf am wneud hynny yn benodol er mwyn dangos y gall parciau cenedlaethol fod yn bositif ynglŷn ag ynni adnewyddadwy, er gwaethaf enw drwg i'r gwrthwyneb am iddynt wrthwynebu gorsafoedd pŵer gwynt ar raddfa fawr. Mae awdurdod y parc cenedlaethol yn cyllido gydag arian—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid wyf am dorri ar eich traws, ond rhaid i hyn fod yn ymyriad, nid araith. Os oeddech am siarad, roedd angen ichi gael caniatâd gan y sawl a gynigiodd y pwnc i'w ddadlau. Ceisiwch gadw at ymyriad.

**Richard Edwards:** Deellais gan Mike ei fod yn barod i roi munud imi.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Parhewch.

**Richard Edwards:** Mae awdurdod y parc cenedlaethol yn cyllido gydag arian o gronfa

Assembly's new environment development fund, and elsewhere, an innovative approach to generating electricity by harnessing tidal flows. It is based on a hydraulic accumulator system, with several turbines linked into one generator to ensure that significant amounts of power are recovered. The project itself will develop a prototype that will be trialled probably in the Milford Haven waterway. Among the benefits of this approach to tidal power generation are that there is no environmental disturbance, it contains no pollutants, it is unaffected by fouling and it is also unaffected by waves or storms. The park is also looking into a potential project that uses sawdust in a pelleting process, which could be used as a biofuel as part of a general approach to ensuring that wood use is maximised as an energy resource. I am sure that Mike would agree that there is an urgent need for effective technologies that can guarantee a sustainable supply and efficient use of energy in the medium to long term. Onshore wind power is important, but there needs to be greater encouragement of a broader mix of renewables including solar, hydro, offshore wind and biomass schemes. It is important that the market should not be monopolised by onshore wind generation.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before Mike German resumes, I draw your attention to the fact that Standing Orders mention intervening. I have been advised—it is a fine point—that during debate, interventions must normally be limited, short and to the point. Clearly, this may not always be the case. I hope that you have said all you wanted to say, Richard. We will return to the matter again if necessary.

**Michael German:** This National Assembly must secure the strongest economic development policies to underpin growth and prosperity for Wales. However, we must do this in a way that is fully consistent with protecting our environment and conserving the natural beauty of our country.

I turn now to putting renewable energy into context. Accepting Phil's immediate point that reduction of energy use is a first step, we

datblygiadau amgylcheddol newydd y Cynulliad, ac o ffynonellau eraill, ymagwedd arloesol tuag at gynhyrchu trydan drwy reoli llif llanw. Mae'n seiliedig ar system cronol hydrolig, gyda nifer o dyrbinnau'n cysylltu ag un generadur er mwyn sicrhau yr adferir symiau sylweddol o bŵer. Bydd y prosiect ei hun yn datblygu prototeip a gaiff ei dreialu yn nyfirffordd Hwlffordd mae'n debyg. Ymhlith y manteision a ddaw yn sgîl yr ymagwedd hon tuag at gynhyrchu pŵer llanw yw nad amherir ar yr amgylchedd, nid yw'n cynnwys unrhyw lygrwyr, nid effeithir arno gan fudreddi na thonnau neu stormydd. Mae'r parc hefyd yn ymchwilio i brosiect arfaethedig sydd yn defnyddio llwch llif mewn proses beledu, y gellid ei ddefnyddio fel biodanwydd yn rhan o ymagwedd gyffredinol tuag at sicrhau y defnyddir pren i'w lawn botensial fel adnodd ynni. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddai Mike yn cytuno bod angen dybryd am dechnolegau effeithiol a all warantu cyflenwad cynaliadwy a defnydd effeithlon o ynni yn y tymor canolig i'r tymor hir. Mae pŵer gwynt ar y lan yn bwysig, ond mae angen mwy o anogaeth o ran defnyddio cymysgedd ehangach o ddeunyddiau adnewyddadwy gan gynnwys cynlluniau ynni'r haul, ynni dŵr, gwynt alltraeth a chynlluniau bio-màs. Mae'n bwysig na ddylai cynhyrchu gwynt ar y lan gael y monopoli ar y farchnad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn i Mike German barhau, tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith bod y Rheolau Sefydlog yn crybwyll ymyrryd. Fe'm cynghorwyd—ac mae'n bwynt da—y dylai ymyriadau, yn ystod dadleuon, fod yn fyr a chryno fel arfer. Yn amlwg, efallai na fydd hyn yn ymarferol bob amser. Gobeithiaf eich bod wedi dweud y cyfan yr ydych am ei ddweud Richard. Dychwelwn i'r mater eto os bydd angen.

**Michael German:** Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hwn sicrhau'r polisiau datblygu economaidd cryfaf i ategu twf a ffyniant i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wneud hyn mewn ffordd sydd yn gyson â diogelu ein hamgylchedd a diogelu harddwch naturiol ein gwlad.

Hoffwn droi yn awr at roi ynni adnewyddadwy yn ei gyd-destun. Gan dderbyn pwynt sylfaenol Phil bod lleihau'r

must look at where we are at present. The total electricity supplied to Welsh consumers is around 15 to 16 terrawatt hours per annum. In addition, there is a further 50 or so terrawatt hours per annum supplied by gas to Wales, effectively in the form of heat rather than electrical energy. At the moment, it is estimated that Wales produces about 0.8 terrawatt hours per annum of electricity from renewable sources, mainly wind and hydro sources. Current best estimates indicate that we would do extremely well to increase this to between the target of two to four terrawatt hours—that is 10 to 25 per cent of consumption—by 2010. We must all declare our intention to do our best to achieve these levels.

12:45 p.m.

However, it still means that we will be dependent for the majority of supplies on gas, coal and nuclear power sources, either directly from Wales or indirectly through the national electricity grid. That is why, to succeed in achieving our sustainable development ambitions, we must focus on the production of clean energy from whatever source. I expect this to be reflected in our discussions next year on a strategic energy framework for Wales. Those discussions should also consider security and pricing issues. For example, gas has many attractions as a fuel. However, overdependence on a fuel that varies as dramatically in price as gas does—from 9p to 28p per therm over the past year alone—is a matter of strategic concern, especially as Wales still has an important and viable coal industry.

On the change to renewable energy, per se, anyone who knows even a little about the subject realises the complexities of these issues, not only in respect of technological, agricultural, environmental and planning problems, but also with regard to financing regulation and an ever-changing commercial scene. Next year, the new electricity trading arrangements, the climate change levy, the suppliers' renewables obligation and, probably, new capital grant schemes for offshore windfarms and biomass plants will

defnydd a wneir o ynni yn gam cyntaf, rhaid inni edrych ar ein sefyllfa bresennol. Cyfanswm y trydan a gyflenwir i ddefnyddwyr yng Nghymru yw tua 15 i 16 awr terrawatt y flwyddyn. Yn ogystal, cyflenwir tua 50 awr terrawatt y flwyddyn drwy nwy i Gymru, ar ffurf gwres yn hytrach nag ynni trydanol. Ar hyn o bryd, amcangyfrifir bod Cymru'n cynhyrchu tua 0.8 awr terrawatt y flwyddyn o drydan o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy, ffynonellau gwynt a dŵr yn bennaf. Dengys yr amcangyfrifon gorau cyfredol y byddai'n fanteisiol iawn inni gynyddu hyn i'r targed o rhwng dwy i bedair awr terrawatt—sef tua 10 i 25 y cant o'r hyn a ddefnyddir—erbyn 2010. Rhaid inni oll ddatgan ein bwriad i wneud ein gorau i gyflawni'r lefelau hyn.

Fodd bynnag, parha i olygu y byddwn yn dibynnu ar nwy, glo a ffynonellau ynni niwclear am y mwyaf o gyflenwadau, naill ai'n uniongyrchol o Gymru, neu'n anuniongyrchol drwy'r grid trydan cenedlaethol. Dyna pam, er mwyn llwyddo i gyflawni ein dyheadau datblygu cynaliadwy, rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar gynhyrchu ynni glân o ba bynnagffynhonnell. Disgwyliaf i hyn gael ei adlewyrchu yn ein trafodaethau y flwyddyn nesaf ar fframwaith ynni strategol i Gymru. Dylai'r trafodaethau hynny hefyd ystyried materion diogelwch a phrisiau. Er enghraifft, mae nwy yn opsiwn deniadol fel tanwydd am sawl rheswm. Fodd bynnag, mae gorddibyniaeth ar danwydd sydd yn amrywio cymaint mewn pris fel y gwna nwy—o 9c i 28c fesul therm yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig—yn fater o bryder strategol, yn arbennig am fod gan Gymru ddiwydiant glo pwysig a hyfyw o hyd.

O ran newid i ynni adnewyddadwy, ynddo'i hun, mae unrhyw un sydd yn deall ychydig am y pwnc yn ymwybodol o natur gymhleth y materion hyn, nid yn unig o ran y problemau technegol, amaethyddol, amgylcheddol a chynllunio, ond hefyd o ran rheoli ariannol a sefyllfa fasnachol fythol gyfnewidiol. Y flwyddyn nesaf, daw'r trefniadau masnachu trydan newydd, y dreth newid hinsawdd, cyfrifoldeb deunyddiau adnewyddadwy i gyflenwyr, a, mwy na thebyg, cynlluniau grant cyfalaf newydd ar

come into force.

This is a fearfully complex world in which we must tread carefully. However, it is clear that, in the short term, there are considerable opportunities for more electricity to be produced in Wales by onshore wind, hydroelectric and thermal solar systems and, if it is a sensible way to proceed, through municipal waste incineration. However, in the medium term—two to seven years—there are major opportunities for energy from biomass, from forest wastes especially in the early stages and, later, from energy crops, and from offshore windfarms, providing environmentally acceptable sites can be found. In the longer term, as well as the exciting but currently expensive promise of photovoltaics, we hope that Wales, with its unique energy heritage, climate and geography, could be a world leader in some of the marine technologies that have been mentioned today, such as tidal barrages, tidal streams and the use of wave power. In the long term, these may offer considerable promise to fill the energy gap that will develop as ageing nuclear power stations are not replaced.

A clear plan will be needed to seize these opportunities and ensure that we move forward into a world where more and more electricity can be generated locally and, where possible, incorporated into associated heat uses to ensure the highest possible efficiencies. It is interesting to note that some of the most exciting technological advances in energy, as in communications, electronics and biology, are micro in scale. There are exciting and rapid developments in solar panels, wind turbines, fuel cells and domestic boilers. These generate electricity, as well as heat, in the home. These technologies do not need the same kind of capital investment as old style mega power stations. While they produce less energy per installation, micro power plants can be more efficient, as they do not need high voltage transmission lines, which link the supplier to the user.

gyfer ffermydd gwynt alltraeth a gweithfeydd bio-màs, i rym.

Mae hwn yn faes cymhleth iawn ac mae'n rhaid inni droedio'n ofalus. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwgbod cyfleoedd sylweddol, yn y tymor byr, i fwy o drydan gael ei gynhyrchu yng Nghymru gan systemau gwynt ar y tir, systemau trydan dŵr a systemau ynni'r haul thermol ac, os yw hyn yn ffordd gall o fynd ymlaen, drwy losgi gwastraff dinesig. Fodd bynnag, yn y tymor canolig—rhwng dwy a saith blynedd—mae cyfleoedd sylweddol ar gyfer ynni o fio-màs, o wastraff coedwigoedd, yn arbennig yn y cyfnodau cynnar ac, yn ddiweddarach i gnydau ynni, ac o ffermydd gwynt alltraeth, ar yr amod y gellir canfod safleoedd sydd yn dderbyniol yn amgylcheddol. Yn y tymor hwy, yn ogystal â'r addewid cyffrous, ond drud ar hyn o bryd am ddulliau ffotofoltaidd, ein gobaith yw y gall Cymru, gyda'i threftadaeth ynni, hinsawdd a daearyddiaeth unigryw, fod yn arweinydd rhyngwladol yn rhai o'r technolegau morol a grybwyllwyd heddiw, fel morgloddiau llanw, llifoedd llanw a'r defnydd o bŵer tonnau. Yn y tymor hir, gallai'r rhain gynnig addewid sylweddol i lenwi'r bwlch ynni a ddaw i'r amlwg wrth inni beidio adeiladu gorsafoedd ynni niwclear newydd yn lle'r rhai sydd yn heneiddio.

Bydd angen cynllun clir er mwyn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn a sicrhau ein bod yn symud ymlaen i fyd lle gellir cynhyrchu mwy a mwy o drydan yn lleol a, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, ei ymgorffori i wresogi cysylltiedig er mwyn sicrhau'r effeithlonrwydd uchaf posibl. Mae'n ddiddorol nodi bod rhai o'r datblygiadau technolegol mwyaf cyffrous ym maes ynni, fel ym maes cyfathrebu, electroneg a bioleg, ar raddfa micro. Ceir datblygiadau cyffrous a chyflym gyda phaneli ynni'r haul, tyrbinnau gwynt, celloedd tanwydd a boeleri domestig. Cynhyrcha'r rhain drydan, yn ogystal â gwres yn y cartref. Nid oes angen yr un buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar y technolegau hyn o'u cymharu â'r hen orsafoedd pŵer enfawr. Er eu bod yn cynhyrchu llai o ynni fesul gosodiad, gall gweithfeydd pŵer micro fod yn fwy effeithlon, am nad oes angen llinellau trosglwyddo foltedd uchel arnynt, sydd yn cysylltu'r cyflenwr â'r defnyddiwr.

We must therefore consider new ideas and be proactive in this field. To do that, we must work in partnership with the research and development community; supply, distribution and generation companies; consumer groups; local authorities; farmers; the Forestry Commission; environmental groups and the Department of Trade and Industry—as we have in the past on the Baglan Bay and Anglesey energy conservation projects.

The formation of Sue Essex's spatial planning renewables working group will be a good, partnership-enhancing step forward, as will the extensive discussions which I hope will take place in all Assembly Committees, as we develop an overall strategic energy framework for Wales. The National Assembly must work within existing planning legislation. We must gauge every scheme that comes before us in the context of current laws. It will be important to supply technical support to local authorities to ensure that their development plans are robust enough to undertake the demands that this will place on them. The Assembly is therefore helping to establish structures to ensure that we work within planning legislation.

We need to support the industry. The new national economic development strategy must take on board how we can give the maximum amount of support to companies that are seeking to develop in this sector. There is an opportunity, given Wales's energy heritage, to produce companies that could be at the cutting edge, not just of research and development, but of making these products competitive and commercially viable. Therefore, I hope that our new economic development strategy encompasses those prospects.

We need a renewable energy industry in Wales that will flourish. There are great opportunities for that to happen. There is great interest in the industry, which we will encourage and build upon. Wales has the opportunity to be a global showcase for clean energy production and to develop, in the longer term, a significant supply industry in new, renewable technologies. However, we

Felly, mae angen inni ystyried syniadau newydd a bod yn broactif yn y maes hwn. I wneud hynny, rhaid inni weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r gymuned ymchwil a datblygu, y cwmnïau cyflenwi, dosbarthu a chynhyrchu; grwpiau defnyddwyr; awdurdodau lleol; ffermwyr; y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth; grwpiau amgylcheddol a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant—fel y gwnaethom yn y gorffennol ar brosiectau cadwraeth ynni ym Mae Baglan ac ar Ynys Môn.

Bydd sefydlu gweithgor cynllunio gofodol deunyddiau adnewyddadwy Sue Essex yn gam ymlaen buddiol a fydd yn gwella partneriaethau, fel y bydd y trafodaethau helaeth y gobeithiaf y bydd yn digwydd ym mhob un o Bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, wrth inni ddatblygu fframwaith ynni strategol i Gymru gyfan. Rhaid i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol weithio o fewn y ddeddfwriaeth gynllunio gyfredol. Rhaid inni fesur pob cynllun a ddaw ger ein bron yng nghyd-destun y cyfreithiau cyfredol. Bydd yn bwysig darparu cymorth technegol i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sicrhau bod eu cynlluniau datblygu yn ddigon cadarn i ymdopi â'r gofynion y bydd hyn yn ei olygu. Felly, mae'r Cynulliad yn helpu i sefydlu strwythurau i sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio o fewn deddfwriaeth gynllunio.

Mae angen inni gefnogi'r diwydiant. Rhaid i'r strategaeth datblygu economaidd cenedlaethol ystyried sut y gallwn roi cymaint o gymorth â phosibl i gwmnïau sydd yn ceisio datblygu yn y sector hwn. Mae cyfle, o ystyried treftadaeth ynni Cymru, i gynhyrchu cwmnïau a allai fod ar flaen y gad yn y dechnoleg newydd, nid yn unig o ran ymchwil a datblygu, ond o ran gwneud y cynnyrch hyn yn gystadleuol ac yn ymarferol yn fasnachol. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd ein strategaeth datblygu economaidd newydd yn cwmpasu'r rhagolygon hynny.

Mae arnom angen diwydiant ynni adnewyddadwy yng Nghymru a fydd yn ffynnu. Mae cyfleoedd gwych er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd. Mae diddordeb mawr yn y diwydiant, y byddwn yn ei annog ac yn adeiladu arno. Mae gan Gymru gyfle i fod yn esiampl i'r byd ym maes cynhyrchu ynni glân a datblygu, yn y tymor hwy, diwydiant cyflenwi arwyddocaol ym maes technolegau

need to proceed prudently, gathering and utilising the best information that we can on the way. If we get it wrong, it will not only do a great disservice to the citizens of Wales but to the citizens of the world, with their ever increasing energy requirements and environmental problems. They look to us to set an example.

adnewyddadwy newydd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni gamu'n ofalus, gan gasglu a defnyddio'r wybodaeth orau y gallwn ar hyd y ffordd. Os gwnawn gamgymeriadau, bydd nid yn unig yn gwneud niwed i ddinasyddion Cymru ond i ddinasyddion y byd hefyd, gyda'u gofynion ynni fythol gynyddol a phroblemau amgylcheddol. Disgwyliant i ni osod esiempl.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Rosemary Butler:** Point of order. It is important that when someone holds two positions, we know in what capacity they are speaking. On two occasions, you have called Mike German to speak as the Deputy First Minister, but he spoke in the short debate as the Minister for Economic Development. We should get that right in future.

**Rosemary Butler:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae'n bwysig pan fo rhywun yn dal dwy swydd, ein bod yn gwybod yn rhinwedd pa swydd y maent yn siarad. Ar ddau achlysur, yr ydych wedi galw ar Mike German i siarad fel Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru, ond siaradodd yn y ddadl fer fel y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd. Dylem gael hynny'n iawn yn y dyfodol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I stand corrected. That brings our proceedings today to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cydnabyddaf y cywiriad. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.49 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.49 p.m.*