



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher 23 Hydref 2002**

**Wednesday 23 October 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiwn Brys: Streic y Gwasanaeth Tân  
*Urgent Question: Fire Service Strike*
- 11 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd  
*Questions to the Minister for Economic Development*
- 21 Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid  
*Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister*
- 31 Datganiad ar Uwchgynhadledd y Ddaear yn Johannesburg  
*Statement on the Earth Summit in Johannesburg*
- 44 Datganiad ar Gefnogi Plant a Rhieni yng Nghymru  
*Statement on Supporting Children and Parents in Wales*
- 56 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2002  
*Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2002*
- 57 Cymeradwyo'r Cynllun Cyhoeddi  
*Approval of the Publication Scheme*
- 77 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 78 Dadl Fer: Cau Ysgolion Bach yng Nghymru  
*Short Debate: Closing Small Schools in Wales*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

### **Streic y Gwasanaeth Tân Fire Service Strike**

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** What contingency plans are being put in place by the Government of Wales to ensure the safety of the people of Wales during any strike period by the fire service? (EAQ19919)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The UK Government, via the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, has primary responsibility for managing the consequences of industrial action by firefighters in England and Wales, which is expected to commence next week. The Welsh Assembly Government does not have policy or pay responsibility for the fire service in Wales. Firefighters in Wales are employed by the three fire authorities, with some employed on a retained basis. The UK Government has put in place plans to provide emergency fire cover across the UK during periods of strike action by firefighters. The deployment of these resources is the responsibility of the military in consultation with the fire service. Wales will get its fair share of these resources based on anticipated needs, degree of risk and so on. There cannot be any question of the military being able to replicate the current firefighting and rescue capability provided by the fire brigades; it will simply minimise as far as possible the danger to human life and limb. Public safety will at all times be paramount. The UK Government is also planning a public safety information campaign to coincide with strike action. This will concentrate on minimising the dangers arising from chip pan fires, the inappropriate use of fireworks, smoking while almost asleep at home, driving at excessive speeds and so on.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pa gynlluniau wrth gefn sy'n cael eu gweithredu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau diogelwch pobl Cymru yn ystod unrhyw gyfnod pan fydd y gwasanaeth tân ar streic? (EAQ19919)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru (Rhodri Morgan)** Mae gan Lywodraeth y DU, drwy Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, y prif gyfrifoldeb dros reoli canlyniadau gweithredu diwydiannol gan ddiffoddwyr tân yng Nghymru a Lloegr, y disgwylir iddo ddechrau yr wythnos nesaf. Nid oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru o ran polisi na chyflogau. Cyflogir diffoddwyr tân yng Nghymru gan dri awdurdod tân, gyda rhai yn cael eu cyflogi fel gweithwyr wrth gefn. Gweithredodd Llywodraeth y DU gynlluniau gwasanaeth tân brys ledled y DU yn ystod cyfnodau o weithredu diwydiannol gan ddiffoddwyr tân. Y fyddin, mewn ymgynghoriad â'r gwasanaeth tân, sy'n gyfrifol am y defnydd a wneir o'r adnoddau hyn. Bydd Cymru yn cael ei chyfran deg o'r adnoddau hyn yn seiliedig ar yr angen a ragwelir, graddau'r risg ac yn y blaen. Nid oes unrhyw sail dros gredu y gall y fyddin roi'r un ddarpariaeth â'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub a ddarperir gan y brigadau tân ar hyn o bryd; bydd ond yn lleihau y perygl i bobl gymaint â phosibl. Bydd diogelwch y cyhoedd bob amser yn flaenaf. Mae Llywodraeth y DU hefyd yn cynllunio ymgyrch i hyrwyddo gwybodaeth am ddiogelwch y cyhoedd i gyd-daro â'r gweithredu diwydiannol. Bydd hyn yn canolbwyntio ar leihau'r perygl sy'n deillio o danau sosbenni sglodion, defnydd amhriodol ar dân gwyllt, ysmygu pan ar fin mynd i gysgu yn y cartref, gyrru ar gyflymdra gormodol ac ati.

The Wales national emergency co-ordination arrangements, developed in the light of previous emergencies, will form the basis of our response to the effects of the strike. Operational activities will be co-ordinated by the military, the police and fire services from three joint-operation control centres in each of the fire service areas, that is north Wales, mid and west Wales and south Wales. The Welsh Assembly Government has already activated its emergency co-ordination centre at Cathays park. It will act as a conduit for information between the military, other emergency services, health and social services departments and other areas of local government affected by the strike, to minimise its effect on public service provision and safety.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank the First Minister for that detailed reply. I acknowledge that the Government of Wales does not have direct responsibility for discussions between the employers and the firefighters. However, does the First Minister agree that the National Assembly should do everything it can to urge the United Kingdom Government and the employers to return to the negotiating table? If there is anything that can be done between now and 29 October to avert a strike, then we should direct all our energies to that end. Will he urge the United Kingdom Government to re-open meaningful negotiations with the Fire Brigades Union? Such negotiations should be on the basis of an independent review that is regarded as such by the Fire Brigades Union, and one that actually values the true worth of a firefighter's job. Will he acknowledge that, when the original pay review was set up in 1978, the work of a firefighter was different to today's situation? Today, they are professional people doing a dangerous job for which they should be paid a worthwhile wage.

Does the First Minister share my view that the United Kingdom Government should spend as much time trying to avert the strike as it appears to be devoting to trying to deal with its effects? Does he also agree that he should urgently meet with the Secretary of State for Wales to express the view of the

Bydd trefniadau cydgysylltu argyfyngau cenedlaethol Cymru, a ddatblygwyd yng ngoleuni argyfyngau blaenorol, yn sylfaen i'n hymateb i effeithiau'r streic. Caiff gweithgaredd gweithredol eu cydgysylltu gan y fyddin, yr heddlu a'r gwasanaethau tân o'r tair canolfan reoli ar y cyd ym mhob un o'r ardaloedd gwasanaeth tân, hynny yw gogledd Cymru, canol a gorllewin Cymru a de Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eisoes wedi rhoi ei chanolfan cydgysylltu argyfyngau ar waith ym mharc Cathays. Drwy'r ganolfan hon y trosglwyddir gwybodaeth rhwng y fyddin, y gwasanaethau brys eraill, adrannau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a meysydd eraill o lywodraeth leol yr effeithir arnynt gan y streic, i leihau ei heffaith ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a diogelwch.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ateb manwl hwnnw. Cydnabyddaf nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros drafodaethau rhwng y cyflogwyr a'r diffoddwyr tân. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud popeth yn ei allu i gymell Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a'r cyflogwyr i ddychwelyd at y bwrdd negodi? Os oes unrhyw beth y gellir ei wneud rhwng nawr a 29 Hydref i osgoi streic, yna dylem gyfeirio'n holl ymdrechion i'r diben hwnnw. A wnaiff gymell Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i ailagor trafodaethau ystyrllon gydag Undeb y Brigadau Tân? Dylai negodiadau o'r fath fod yn seiliedig ar yr adolygiad annibynnol a gyfrifir yn un felly gan Undeb y Brigadau Tân, ac un sy'n gwerthfawrogi gwerth gwirioneddol swydd y diffoddwr tân. A wnaiff gydnabod bod gwaith diffoddwr tân yn wahanol pan sefydlwyd yr adolygiad gwreiddiol o gyflogau yn 1978 i sefyllfa heddiw? Heddiw, maent yn bobl broffesiynol yn gwneud gwaith peryglus y dylent gael cyflog gwerth chweil amdano.

A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cydfynd â mi y dylai Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dreulio cymaint o amser yn ceisio osgoi'r streic ag y mae'n treulio yn ceisio ymdrin â'u heffeithiau yn ôl pob golwg? A yw hefyd yn cytuno y dylai gwrdd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar frys i fynegi barn

National Assembly to the United Kingdom Government, were the National Assembly to agree a clear message today calling for an early resolution to this dispute that would not force firefighters into a strike that no-one wants? If it comes to the worst and the strike cannot be averted, can he assure us that he will provide us with regular updates as to how the crisis is being managed?

**The First Minister:** In asking for the Assembly to play a role in re-opening the pay talks, you ask to re-open the devolution settlement. This is not a devolved matter and there is no point in pretending that we have devolved responsibility for employment or pay and conditions of firefighters. If you want to participate in a debate of that kind then you should not have resigned your seat at Westminster—you might have lost it anyway—as it is a matter for Members of Parliament at Westminster. If you want to be an MP, stand to be elected as such. If you want to be an Assembly Member, then deal with the issues that are devolved to us. Your original question relates to devolved matters—how we handle the emergency support arrangements to minimise the effects on public services in Wales of any strike action that may take place next week and after that. I thought that that was what you were going to talk about. Unfortunately, you could not resist the temptation to pretend that the Assembly is the House of Commons and that we would discuss non-devolved matters. It is for us to discuss the serious issue of handling and co-ordinating information between the emergency services. If you want to stray into other issues, then there is another democratic institution 150 miles to the east to which you should have stood to be elected. I thought that we would discuss the matters which are our proper province.

**Ann Jones:** I declare an interest as an out-of-trade Fire Brigades Union member and as someone who was involved in the only national strike in the history of the fire service—I hope it stays that way. I experienced a range of emotions 25 years

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, pe bai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cytuno heddiw ar neges glir yn galw am ddatrys ar yr anghydfod hwn yn fuan mewn ffordd na fyddai'n gwthio'r diffoddwyr tân i streic nad oes neb yn dymuno ei gweld yn digwydd? Os daw hi i'r gwaethaf ac na ellir osgoi'r streic, a all ein sicrhau y bydd yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd inni ar sut y mae'r argyfwng yn cael ei reoli.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Wrth ofyn am i'r Cynulliad chwarae rhan mewn ailagor y trafodaethau cyflog, yr ydych yn gofyn am ailagor y setliad datganoli. Nid yw hwn yn fater a ddatganolwyd ac nid oes unrhyw bwynt mewn rhoi'r argraff fod gennym gyfrifoldeb datganoledig dros gyflogaeth neu gyflog ac amodau diffoddwyr tân. Os ydych am gyfranogi mewn dadl o'r fath yna ni ddylech fod wedi ymddiswyddo o San Steffan—efallai y byddech chi wedi colli eich sedd beth bynnag—gan ei fod yn fater i Aelodau Seneddol yn San Steffan. Os ydych am fod yn AS, sefwch i gael eich ethol yn un felly. Os ydych am fod yn Aelod Cynulliad yna ymdriniwch â'r materion sydd wedi'u datganoli i ni. Mae eich cwestiwn gwreiddiol yn ymwneud â materion datganoledig—sut y byddwn yn trafod y trefniadau cymorth mewn argyfwng i leihau effaith ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i unrhyw streic a all ddigwydd yr wythnos nesaf ac ar ôl hynny. Meddyliais mai am hynny yr oeddech yn mynd i siarad. Yn anffodus, ni allech chi wrthsefyll y demtasiwn i esgus mai Tŷ'r Cyffredin yw'r Cynulliad ac y byddem yn trafod materion na chawsant eu datganoli. Mater i ni yw trafod pwnc difrifol ymdrin â gwybodaeth a'i chydgysylltu rhwng y gwasanaethau brys. Os ydych am grwydro i sôn am faterion eraill, yna mae sefydliad democrataidd arall 150 milltir i'r dwyrain y dylech chi fod wedi sefyll i gael eich ethol iddo. Mi dybiais y byddem yn trafod y materion sy'n diriogaeth briodol i ni.

**Ann Jones:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod heb fod mewn swydd o Undeb y Brigadau Tân ac fel rhywun a oedd yn rhan o'r unig streic genedlaethol yn hanes y gwasanaeth tân—gobeithiaf y bydd hi'n aros felly. Profais ystod o emosiynau 25 mlynedd yn ôl, y bwm

ago, some of which I relived with colleagues over the weekend. Firefighters and control staff will experience the same range of emotions this time. I know that none of them will have taken the decision lightly to vote 'yes' in this ballot. They are fully aware of the consequences. Do you agree that this dispute, as with the dispute in 1977, will only—and can only—be resolved by the national joint council of employers? The employers must get back around the negotiating table with the Fire Brigades Union to negotiate a re-banding of the pay formula. Will you urge those employers—and I stress employers, not the UK Government—to come to the negotiating table to discuss this before next Tuesday?

2:10 p.m.

Following the Government announcement that there will be no additional funding to support a significant pay increase, do you understand the widespread cynicism that rightly or wrongly exists among FBU members in the principality as regards the independence of the inquiry? Will you do everything possible to avert a strike on 29 October 2002?

**The First Minister:** We all agree that no-one wants this strike. However, I cannot stray into matters relating to how we should settle the strike, or into the situation with regard to the three consortia of local authorities in Wales, which effectively form the three fire authorities. That is not an issue for us. The Bain review has been set up in order to provide some form of additional lubrication in the system to try to head off industrial action.

As Ieuan said earlier, no-one wants this strike. However, this is not a matter for the Assembly. The ambulance service is a matter for us, but the fire and police services are not. Let us be clear on that. We are responsible for the ambulance service, the fire service is a matter for the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister and the police service is a matter for the Home Office—that is how responsibility for the emergency services has been divided between the UK Government and the Assembly. If this was an ambulance dispute, I would have answers to those questions. The

yn ailfyw rhai ohonynt gyda chydweithwyr dros y penwythnos. Bydd diffoddwyr tân a'r staff rheoli yn profi'r un ystod o emosiynau y tro hwn. Gwn na fydd unrhyw un ohonynt wedi dod i benderfyniad i bleidleisio 'ie' yn y bleidlais hon yn ddifeddwl. Maent yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r canlyniadau. A gytunwch y caiff yr anghydfod hwn, fel gydag anghydfod 1977, ei ddatrys yn unig—a dyna'n unig all ddigwydd—gan gydgyngor cenedlaethol y cyflogwyr? Rhaid i'r cyflogwyr ddechwyn at y bwrdd negodi gydag Undeb y Brigadau Tân i negodi ail-fandio'r fformiwla gyflog. A wnewch chi annog y cyflogwyr hynny—a phwysleiswch gyflogwyr, nid Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig—i ddod at y bwrdd negodi i drafod hyn cyn dydd Mawrth nesaf?

Yn dilyn cyhoeddiad y Llywodraeth na fydd arian ychwanegol i gefnogi cynnydd sylweddol yng nghyflogau, a ddeallwch y siniciaeth gyffredinol sy'n bodoli yn gam neu'n gymwys ymhlith aelodau'r Undeb yng Nghymru o ran annibyniaeth yr ymchwiliad? A wnewch chi bopeth o fewn eich gallu i osgoi streic ar 29 Hydref 2002?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunwn oll nad oes neb am gael y streic hon. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf grwydro i sôn am faterion sy'n ymwneud â sut y dylem ddatrys y streic, nac am y sefyllfa o ran y tri chonsortia o awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, sydd i bob pwrpas yn ffurfio'r tri awdurdod tân. Nid yw hynny'n fater i ni. Sefydlwyd adolygiad Bain er mwyn ystwytho'r system ychydig i geisio lleihau perygl gweithredu diwydiannol.

Fel y dywedodd Ieuan yn gynharach, nid oes neb am gael y streic hon. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hwn yn fater i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn fater i ni, ond nid yw'r gwasanaethau tân na'r heddlu yn faterion i ni. Gadewch i ni fod yn glir ynglŷn â hynny. Yr ydym ni yn gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, mae'r gwasanaeth tân yn fater i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac mae'r heddlu yn fater i'r Swyddfa Gartref—dyna sut y mae'r cyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaethau brys wedi ei rannu rhwng Llywodraeth y DU a'r

fire service is not a devolved matter, so it is best left to the independent review and to the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister. We must get on with the job of minimising risk to public safety in Wales—to life and limb—in conjunction with the direct providers of emergency cover.

**William Graham:** Can you redouble the efforts that you have outlined this afternoon and ask the Prime Minister and the Deputy Prime Minister about the disdain they have showed towards the Welsh Local Government Association and the Local Government Association as employers? It should have been left to those bodies to negotiate this settlement; I am confident that they would have done so with the goodwill of the Fire Brigades Union. This matter has been taken out of the employers' hands. Why has that happened? I note that you endorse the Fire Brigades Union's comments that it is prepared to allow its members to react in the event of a major emergency. Will you ask the Prime Minister and Deputy Prime Minister why they did not trust the employers, who were aware of all aspects of this situation? This is the first firefighters' strike since the days of the Callaghan Government; it must be averted.

**The First Minister:** Again, this is outside the Assembly's competence. I would like a supplementary that relates to the emergency question. As I understand the situation, the Bain review's purpose is to add to the employers' ability to conduct its normal industrial relations and wage negotiations, not to subtract from it. The Bain review was set up because of the breakdown in negotiations. It is looking at ways of providing some kind of pay formula as happened in 1977. It is also considering how to restructure the fire authorities. That is why we have submitted evidence to the Bain review, although not on the issue of pay.

**Peter Black:** All Members want to avoid this dispute if possible. If the strike goes ahead, the Assembly will have concerns regarding emergency planning and local government's

Cynulliad. Pe bai hwn yn anghydfod yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, byddai gennyf atebion i'r cwestiynau hynny. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth tân yn fater datganoledig, felly mae'n well ei adael i'r adolygiad annibynnol ac i Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Rhaid inni fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o leihau'r risg i ddiogelwch pobl Cymru—y risg o gael eu lladd neu'u hanafu—mewn cysylltiad â'r rhai sy'n gyfrifol yn uniongyrchol am ddarpariaeth frys.

**William Graham:** A wnewch chi ddyblu'r ymdrechion a amlinellwyd gennych y prynhawn yma a holi'r Prif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynglŷn â'r dirmyg a ddangoswyd ganddynt at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol fel cyflogwyr? Y cyrrff hynny a ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am negodi'r setliad hwn; yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent wedi gwneud hynny gydag ewyllys da Undeb y Brigadau Tân. Aethpwyd â'r mater hwn o ddwylo'r cyflogwyr. Pam y digwyddodd hynny? Nodaf eich bod yn cadarnhau sylwadau Undeb y Brigadau Tân ei fod yn barod i ganiatáu i'w aelodau ymateb pe bai argyfwng mawr. A wnewch chi ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog pam nad oeddent yn ymddiried yn y cyflogwyr, a oedd yn ymwybodol o bob agwedd ar y sefyllfa hon? Hon yw streic gyntaf y diffoddwyr tân ers dyddiau Llywodraeth Callaghan; rhaid ei harbed rhag digwydd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Unwaith eto, mae hyn y tu hwnt i allu'r Cynulliad. Hoffwn gael cwestiwn atodol sy'n ymwneud â'r cwestiwn brys. Deallaf mai diben adolygiad Bain yw ychwanegu at allu'r cyflogwyr i gynnal eu cysylltiadau diwydiannol arferol a'i negodiadau cyflog, nid i'w tanseilio. Sefydlwyd adolygiad Bain oherwydd i'r trafodaethau fethu. Mae'n edrych ar ffyrdd o roi rhyw fath o fformiwla gyflog fel a ddigwyddodd yn 1977. Mae hefyd yn ystyried sut i ailstrwythuro'r awdurdodau tân. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno tystiolaeth i adolygiad Bain, er na wnaethom hynny ar fater cyflog.

**Peter Black:** Mae pob Aelod am osgoi'r anghydfod hwn os yw'n bosibl. Os bydd y streic yn digwydd, bydd gan y Cynulliad bryderon ynglŷn â chynllunio at argyfwng a

capacity in emergency planning. The availability of Green Goddesses is not sufficient to maintain the current emergency-service coverage across Wales. There are also significant concerns about the expertise available to the army if it stands in for the fire brigade, particularly in terms of traffic accidents. The fire brigade has considerable expertise in cutting people out of crashed vehicles. The army does not have such expertise and that may lead to more amputations and a greater burden on the national health service. How does the Assembly plan to deal with those concerns?

**The First Minister:** Such cover would not just be provided by the Green Goddesses, there would also be retained firefighters. Geographically, the fire service in Wales has an extensive element of retained firefighters. It is not clear, because of overlapping areas, whether that means that they will not be on strike at all, but there are large areas of Wales which are likely to be less affected because of the retained firefighters who are not members of the Fire Brigades Union and who are not involved in the industrial dispute. There is also a breathing apparatus rescue teams capability available from the three military services. They will support the Green Goddesses where a rescue capability is required. There are also regional equipment support teams, which will provide enhanced capability in support of Green Goddess crews and the breathing apparatus rescue teams. There will not just be some 800 Green Goddesses covering the whole of the UK. Certain places, such as the oil refineries in Wales, have their own fire brigades that provide a highly specialised service for the company which employs them, such as Texaco, because of the particularly flammable nature of their industrial processes. Therefore, one should not think that we are solely dependent on the Green Goddesses.

However, you are right to raise the point that additional burdens could be thrown on the health, ambulance, police and social services. That is why we have already activated the emergency planning centre in Cathays park.

gallu llywodraeth leol i gynllunio at argyfwng. Nid yw'r *Green Goddesses* sydd ar gael yn ddigon i gynnal y ddarpariaeth gwasanaeth brys bresennol ledled Cymru. Mae hefyd bryderon sylweddol ynglŷn â'r arbenigedd sydd gan y fyddin os bydd yn cymryd lle y gwasanaeth tân, yn arbennig o ran damweiniau ffyrdd. Mae gan y gwasanaeth tân gryn arbenigedd mewn rhyddhau pobl o gerbydau a fu mewn gwrthdrawiad. Nid oes gan y fyddin yr arbenigedd hwnnw a gallai hynny arwain at i fwy o achosion lle mae pobl yn colli coes neu fraich, ac at dreth fwy ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Sut y bwriada'r Cynulliad ymdrin â'r pryderon hyn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni fyddai gwasanaeth o'r fath yn cael ei roi gan y *Green Goddesses* yn unig ond byddai hefyd y diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn. Yn ddaearyddol mae gan y gwasanaeth tân yng Nghymru elfen helaeth o ddiffoddwyr tân wrth gefn. Nid yw'n eglur, oherwydd ardaloedd sy'n gorgyffwrdd, a fyddant ar streic o gwbl, ond mae'n debyg y bydd effaith lai ar rannau helaeth o Gymru oherwydd y diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn nad ydynt yn aelodau o Undeb y Brigadau Tân ac nad ydynt yn rhan o'r anghydfod diwydiannol. Hefyd y mae timau achub sy'n arbenigo mewn defnyddio offer anadlu ar gael gan y tri gwasanaeth milwrol. Byddant yn cefnogi'r *Green Goddesses* lle y bo angen cefnogaeth o ran achub. Ceir hefyd dimau cefnogi rhanbarthol sydd ag offer arbenigol, a fydd yn rhoi mwy o gapasiti i gefnogi criwiau'r *Green Goddesses* â'r timau achub ag offer anadlu. Nid rhyw 800 o *Green Goddesses* fydd yn gwasanaethu'r DU gyfan yn unig. Mae gan rai lleoedd, megis y purfeydd olew yng Nghymru, eu diffoddwyr tân eu hunain sy'n darparu gwasanaeth arbenigol iawn i'r cwmni sy'n eu cyflogi, megis Texaco, oherwydd natur fflamadwy iawn eu prosesau diwydiannol. Felly, ni ddylem feddwl ein bod yn llwyr ddibynnol ar y *Green Goddesses*.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gywir i godi'r pwynt y gallai pwysau ychwanegol gael eu rhoi ar wasanaethau iechyd, ambiwlans, yr heddlu a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Dyna pam yr ydym eisoes wedi rhoi'r ganolfan gynllunio at argyfwng ym Mharc Cathays ar



waith.

**Pauline Jarman:** I was disappointed with how you tried to abrogate your responsibilities earlier by inferring that Members should seek seats in the House of Commons rather than in the Assembly. In light of your response, what is your Government's role and responsibility concerning the safety and welfare of the people of Wales in times of crisis?

**The First Minister:** I am not abrogating responsibilities, but rather stating the Assembly's responsibilities. If you want to contest that, you must put to me your interpretation of the devolution settlement and how you believe that it involved the transfer of fire service responsibilities for Wales. You do not seem ready to make any suggestions about that and therefore I assume that you accept my definition. You are wrong to say that I am abrogating my responsibilities; I merely restated our responsibilities. We have a responsibility to co-ordinate responses to any side-effects of a strike on the other emergency services. We are responsible for the flow of information between the police and the health services, which will have additional burdens, and the ambulance service, which will have particular additional burdens, with the military and the fire service management. They will have a key role in advising the military, police, ambulance and health and social services. Someone will have to co-ordinate that. That will be our responsibility, which that is why we have activated our emergency planning centre in Cathays park.

**Peter Law:** Although the regulatory control of the fire services is a UK matter and lies with London, our concern about community safety embraces everyone in Wales. The fire service professionals protect our communities daily. To date, they hold the moral high ground in the public's eye, after two years of protracted negotiations where the firefighters still feel that they have not had a fair deal. I feel that they are right and that they should have a fairer deal on pay and conditions. They risk their lives for us daily. Will you consider meeting the Fire Brigades Union in

**Pauline Jarman:** Yr oeddwn wedi fy siomi gan y ffordd y gwnaethoch geisio dirymu eich cyfrifoldebau yn gynharach drwy awgrymu y dylai Aelodau geisio seddau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin yn hytrach nag yn y Cynulliad. Yn wyneb eich ymateb, beth yw rôl a chyfrifoldeb eich Llywodraeth o ran diogelwch a lles pobl Cymru pan fo argyfwng?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn dirymu cyfrifoldebau, ond yn hytrach yn datgan cyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad. Os ydych am herio hynny, bydd yn rhaid ichi roi'ch dehongliad chi o setliad datganoli imi, gan esbonio sut y credwch ei fod yn golygu bod cyfrifoldebau dros y gwasanaeth tân wedi'u trosglwyddo i Gymru. Ymddengys nad ydych yn barod i wneud unrhyw awgrymiadau am hynny ac felly yr wyf yn cymryd eich bod yn derbyn fy niffiniad i. Yr ydych yn anghywir i ddweud fy mod yn dirymu fy nghyfrifoldebau; ailddatgan ein cyfrifoldebau a wneuthum. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i gydgyssylltu yr ymateb i unrhyw effeithiau ar wasanaethau brys eraill o ganlyniad i streic. Yr ydym yn gyfrifol am y llif gwybodaeth rhwng yr heddlu a'r gwasanaethau iechyd, a fydd â beichiau ychwanegol, a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y bydd ganddo feichiau ychwanegol arbennig, gyda'r fyddin a rheolwyr y gwasanaeth tân. Bydd ganddynt rôl allweddol i gynghori'r fyddin, yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'r gwasanaethau iechyd a chymdeithasol. Bydd yn rhaid i rywun gydgyssylltu hynny. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni fydd hynny a dyna pam yr ydym wedi rhoi ein canolfan cynllunio at argyfwng ym Mharc Cathays ar waith.

**Peter Law:** Er bod rheolaeth reoleiddiol y gwasanaeth tân yn fater i'r DU ac yn nwylo Llundain, mae ein pryder am ddiogelwch y gymuned yn cynnwys pawb yng Nghymru. Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol y gwasanaeth tân yn diogelu ein cymunedau yn ddyddiol. Hyd yma mae ganddynt y fantais yn foisol yng ngolwg y cyhoedd, ar ôl dwy flynedd o negodiadau maith lle mae'r diffoddwyr tân yn parhau i deimlo nad ydynt wedi cael eu trin yn deg. Teimlaf eu bod yn iawn ac y dylent gael bargaen well o ran cyflog ac amodau. Maent yn mentro eu bywyd drosom

Wales to listen to its views? Perhaps that will further enlighten you in any comments you may wish to make to the Deputy Prime Minister and the UK Minister of State with responsibility for fire. There is a helpful conduit from the National Assembly, through you as First Minister, to the UK Government. Any information that you can gain from those discussions would be beneficial in trying to avert a strike and make our communities safer.

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree. Many of my friends in and outside politics are members of the Fire Brigades Union—including the Assembly Member for the Vale of Clwyd. It is an important union. However, I have not been asked to meet the union. It is conscious of the issues that it faces, namely whether or not to meet the Bain review, whether or not it should provide emergency cover—the meeting of the FBU executive is still taking place, if it has not finished in the last 15 minutes—and what is the relationship between the union and retained firefighters, whose presence is important in large areas of Wales. I am not sure about the situation in your constituency, Peter. Many of us will discover next week, perhaps, for the first time what the balance between full-time FBU firefighters and retained or part-time firefighters is.

It is up to the union to consider whether or not it should meet with me. I think that the fact that it has not made that request indicates that it is conscious of where this issue will or will not be resolved.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have allowed twice the amount of time usually allowed for an urgent question because of the importance of today's question. The allowing of an urgent question is at the Presiding Officer's discretion.

bob dydd. A wnewch chi ystyried cyfarfod ag Undeb y Brigadau Tân yng Nghymru i glywed ei safbwynt? Efallai y bydd hynny'n eich rhoi ar ben y ffordd o ran unrhyw sylwadau yr hoffech eu trosglwyddo i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a Gweinidog Gwladol y DU sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros y gwasanaeth tân. Mae sianel ddefnyddiol o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwoch chi fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, at Lywodraeth y DU. Byddai unrhyw wybodaeth y gallech chi ei chael o'r trafodaethau hynny yn fuddiol wrth ceisio osgoi streic a gwneud ein cymunedau'n fwy diogel.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf. Mae llawer o'm cyfeillion y tu mewn a'r tu allan i wleidyddiaeth yn aelodau o Undeb y Brigadau Tân—yn cynnwys Aelod y Cynulliad dros Ddyffryn Clwyd. Mae'n undeb pwysig. Fodd bynnag, ni ofynnwyd imi gyfarfod â'r undeb. Mae'n ymwybodol o'r materion a wyneba, sef pa un ai i gwrdd ag adolygiad Bain ai peidio, a pha un a ddylai ddarparu gwasanaeth mewn argyfwng—mae cyfarfod pwyllgor gwaith Undeb y Brigadau Tân yn parhau, os nad yw wedi dod i ben yn y 15 munud diwethaf—a beth yw'r berthynas rhwng yr undeb a'r diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn, y mae eu presenoldeb yn bwysig mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r sefyllfa yn eich etholaeth chi, Peter. Bydd llawer ohonom yn cael gwybod yr wythnos nesaf, efallai, am y tro cyntaf beth yw'r cydbwysedd rhwng diffoddwyr tân llawn amser Undeb y Brigadau Tân a'r diffoddwyr tân rhan amser neu sydd wrth gefn.

Penderfyniad yr undeb ydyw pa un a ddylai gyfarfod â mi ai peidio. Credaf fod y ffaith na wnaeth y cais hwnnw yn dangos bod yr undeb yn ymwybodol o ble y caiff y mater hwn ei ddatrys ai peidio.

**Y Llywydd:** Caniateais ddwywaith yr amser a ganiateir fel arfer i gwestiwn brys oherwydd pwysigrwydd cwestiwn heddiw. Caniateir cwestiwn brys yn ôl disgrisiwn y Llywydd.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd Questions to the Minister for Economic Development

### Masnach Cymru Welsh Trade

**Q1 Alun Cairns:** From where does Wales derive its biggest share of trade? (OAQ19546)

**C1 Alun Cairns:** O ble y mae Cymru'n cael y rhan fwyaf o'i masnach? (OAQ19546)

**The Minister for Economic Development (Andrew Davies):** During the first quarter of 2002, trade with the European theatre accounted for 76 per cent of all Welsh exports, at a total of £1,077 million. Germany continues to be our largest individual export market, with £250 million of export trade undertaken there. The United States of America is second to the European Union, with £105 million of trade undertaken in the same quarter.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd (Andrew Davies):** Yn ystod chwarter cyntaf 2002, yr oedd masnach â gwledydd Ewrop yn cyfrif am 76 y cant o holl allforion Cymru, sef cyfanswm o £1,077 miliwn. Yr Almaen yw ein marchnad allforio unigol fwyaf o hyd, gyda gwerth £250 miliwn o fasnach allforio yn digwydd yno. Mae Unol Daleithiau America yn ail i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gwnaed gwerth £105 miliwn o fasnach yno yn ystod yr un chwarter.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister share with us the total cost, including staffing, of running Wales's international overseas offices, or Welsh embassies as they are better known? How does this compare with the amount of inward investment and trade between Wales and the countries in which offices are being established? Does he recognise that our largest market is in the UK and that money spent on offices overseas would be better spent on developing better, more efficient trade relationships with companies based in the UK, rather than providing excuses for junkets all over the world?

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym beth yw cyfanswm costau, gan gynnwys costau staffio, swyddfeydd rhyngwladol tramor Cymru, neu lysgenadaethau Cymru, fel y'u gelwir yn amlach na pheidio? Sut y mae'r ffigur hwn yn cymharu â chyfanswm y mewnfuddsoddiad a'r fasnach rhwng Cymru a'r gwledydd lle y sefydlir swyddfeydd? A yw'n cydnabod mai yn y DU y mae ein marchnad fwyaf ac y byddai'n well pe bai'r arian a werir ar swyddfeydd tramor yn cael ei wario ar feithrin cysylltiadau masnach gwell, mwy effeithlon â chwmnïau yn y DU, yn hytrach na rhoi esgus i bobl jolihotian i bedwar ban byd?

**Carwyn Jones:** Tiny minds again.

**Carwyn Jones:** Meddyliau bach unwaith eto.

**Andrew Davies:** I agree with the Business Minister's remark. I presume that the Economic Development Committee's trip to America was a fact-finding mission. When Ministers go abroad, however, their trips are junkets. [*Interruption.*]

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf â sylw'r Trefnydd. Cymeraf mai taith ar gyfer ymchwil oedd taith y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd i America. Fodd bynnag pan fydd Gweinidogion yn mynd dramor, jolihotian ydyw. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The election has not started yet.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r etholiad wedi dechrau eto.

**Andrew Davies:** The only critics of the Assembly Government's establishing of these international centres have been the

**Andrew Davies:** Yr unig bobl sydd wedi beirmiadu penderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sefydlu'r canolfannau

Conservatives. I have received nothing but praise from businesses in Wales. Tectonic International in Merthyr Tydfil praised the efforts made by WalesTrade International and myself on the company's behalf at the Label Expo exhibition in Chicago. If Wales is to play a major role in the global economy, it must have a high profile and we must give resources and support to Welsh companies in terms of export trade.

**Brian Gibbons:** I find Alun Cairns's supplementary question amazing because I accompanied him to Dublin—

**Peter Rogers:** Ask a question.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter Rogers, I do not require assistance from colleagues from north Wales when presiding in this chair.

**Brian Gibbons:** Does Alun not agree that, at the meeting in Dublin on the Irish Republic's economic development, the role of overseas offices was shown to be crucial in making the type of links that brought foreign direct investment into Ireland and kicked off the Celtic tiger economy?

**Andrew Davies:** Exactly. When you visit America, you realise what a high profile the Irish, the Irish Government, Irish companies, the Scots and Scottish companies have there. If we are to pull our weight in the global economy, we must be out there battling on behalf of Welsh companies, which is what we are doing.

**Elin Jones:** Beth yw eich strategaeth, Weinidog, i fanteisio ar y potensial o fasnach ychwanegol a fydd yn deillio o wledydd dwyrain Ewrop yn ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd?

**Andrew Davies:** We are considering our international trade strategy—the strategic document is currently out for consultation, although the consultation ends tomorrow. The responses that we receive will inform our trade strategy, in terms of considering growth sectors, and central-eastern and southern European countries could be key in that

rhyngwladol hyn yw'r Ceidwadwyr. Dim ond canmoliaeth a gefais gan fusnesau yng Nghymru. Mae Tectonic International ym Merthyr Tudful wedi canmol ymdrechion MasnachCymru Rhyngwladol a minnau ar ran y cwmni yn arddangosfa Label Expo yn Chicago. Er mwyn i Gymru chwarae rhan flaenllaw yn yr economi fyd-eang, rhaid iddi gael proffil uchel a rhaid inni roi adnoddau a chefnogaeth i gwmnïau yng Nghymru o ran y fasnach allforio.

**Brian Gibbons:** Synnaf at gwestiwn atodol Alun Cairns gan fy mod wedi mynd i Ddilyn yn ei gwmi ef —

**Peter Rogers:** Gofynnwch gwestiwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Peter Rogers. Nid oes angen i gyd-Aelodau o'r gogledd fy nghynorthwyo pan fyddaf yn llywyddu o'r gadair hon.

**Brian Gibbons:** Oni chytuna Alun fod y cyfarfod yn Nulyn am ddatblygu economaidd Gweriniaeth Iwerddon wedi dangos bod rôl swyddfeydd tramor yn hollbwysig i wneud y math o gysylltiadau a ddenodd fuddsoddi uniongyrchol o dramor i Iwerddon ac a ysbardunodd economi'r teigr Celtaidd?

**Andrew Davies:** Yn union. Pan fyddwch yn ymweld ag America, fe welwch pa mor uchel yw proffil y Gwyddelod, Llywodraeth Iwerddon, cwmnïau o Iwerddon, yr Albanwyr a chwmmnïau o'r Alban yno. Er mwyn inni dynnu ein pwysau yn yr economi fyd-eang, rhaid inni fynd allan i frwydro ar ran cwmnïau Cymru, a dyna yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud.

**Elin Jones:** What is your strategy, Minister, to exploit the potential additional trade that will arise from eastern European countries joining the European Union?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn ystyried ein strategaeth fasnach ryngwladol—yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar y ddogfen strategol ar hyn o bryd, ond daw'r ymgynghoriad i ben yfory. Bydd yr ymateb a gawn yn llywio ein strategaeth fasnach, o ran ystyried sectorau twf, a gallai gwledydd canol-ddwyrain a de Ewrop fod yn allweddol yn hynny o beth. Yn

regard. In addition, the Cabinet sub-committee on Wales in the world is examining regions within such countries with which we could establish strategic partnerships. We may well concentrate on central-eastern and southern Europe.

**Mick Bates:** Following the encouraging result of Ireland's referendum on the Nice treaty, it is important that we target countries that are likely to join the European Union. Will you assure us that our offices abroad will be targeted in a way that will get the best value from them, and that they will not just be planted in capital cities?

**Andrew Davies:** We are a small country with limited resources and must therefore target our efforts. That is as true for exports, trade missions and international trade as for any other activity that we undertake. The bottom line must be to encourage Welsh companies—the most productive and those with the highest growth potential—to exploit overseas opportunities.

ogystal, mae is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar Gymru yn y byd yn edrych ar ranbarthau o fewn gwledydd o'r fath y gallem sefydlu partneriaethau strategol â hwy. Mae'n ddigon posibl y byddwn yn canolbwyntio ar ganol-ddwyrain a de Ewrop.

**Mick Bates:** Yn dilyn canlyniad calonogol refferendwm Iwerddon ar gytundeb Nice, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn targedu gwledydd sy'n debygol o ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. A wnewch chi roi sicrwydd inni y caiff ein swyddfeydd dramor eu targedu er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn rhoi'r gwerth gorau, ac na chânt eu lleoli mewn prifddinasoedd yn unig?

**Andrew Davies:** Gwlad fach ydym gydag adnoddau cyfyngedig ac felly rhaid inni dargedu ein hymdrechion. Mae hynny yr un mor wir am allforion, teithiau masnach a masnach ryngwladol ag ydyn am unrhyw weithgarwech arall yr ymgymernw ag ef. Y peth pwysicaf yw annog cwmnïau o Gymru—y rhai mwyaf cynhyrchiol a'r rhai â'r potensial mwyaf i dyfu—i fanteisio ar gyfleoedd tramor.

### **Diwydiannau Morol Cynhenid Indigenous Marine-based Industries**

**Q2 Brian Gibbons:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to support indigenous marine-based industries? (OAQ19553)

**Andrew Davies:** As a country bordered by water on three sides, we must maximise the potential of our natural assets. Marine-based industries are able to exploit the full range of opportunities available to business provided by the Assembly Government and its agencies. Those include assistance with business development provided by the Welsh Development Agency, Finance Wales, regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grants, funding from Objective 1 and financial instrument for fisheries guidance programmes, and scope for help with marketing and promotion from the Wales Tourist Board.

**Brian Gibbons:** Wales certainly has plenty of water and coastline. Do you agree that there are already good examples of marine-

**C2 Brian Gibbons:** Beth mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i gefnogi diwydiannau morol cynhenid? (OAQ19553)

**Andrew Davies:** Fel gwlad ac iddi ddŵr o'i hamgylch ar dair ochr, rhaid inni fanteisio i'r eithaf ar ein hasedau naturiol. Gall diwydiannau morol fanteisio ar yr ystod lawn o gyfleoedd a gynigir i fusnesau gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i hasiantaethau. Ymhlith y rhain mae cymorth i ddatblygu busnes a ddarperir gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Cyllid Cymru, cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, arian Amcan 1 a'r offeryn ariannol ar gyfer rhaglenni cyfarwyddo pysgodfeydd, a chyfle i fusnesau gael cymorth gan Fwrdd Croeso Cymru wrth farchnata a hyrwyddo eu hunain.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr mae gan Gymru ddigon o ddŵr ac arfordir. A gytunwch fod enghreifftiau da o ddiwydiant morol yn

based industry, such as the excellent development at Dragon Sea Bait Ltd in Port Talbot, in my constituency? As outlined in the meeting we both attended at the University of Wales, Swansea, the medical potential of marine biology needs to be explored and developed further.

**Andrew Davies:** For some time, we have not really maximised the use of our coastlines. You mentioned Dragon Sea Bait Ltd—at your invitation I will soon visit the company, which has exciting plans to expand to Pendine in west Wales. That could create a significant number of new jobs. The meeting we attended at Swansea Clinical School last Monday was about how to relate marine biology to medical research and development. The medical industry is one of the growth sectors in the knowledge economy for the twenty-first century, and we need to invest increased resources in exploiting our natural advantages in this regard.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r gwaith ardderchog a wneir ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Bangor ar botensial y môr. A yw wedi ei argyhoeddi bod cyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru—yn enwedig Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a'r brifysgol—yn cydweithio'n ddigon agos i sicrhau y gwreiddir unrhyw botensial sy'n deillio o'r ymchwil ym Mangor i greu gwaith a datblygiad economaidd?

**Andrew Davies:** To be frank, Dafydd, we have a long way to go to fully exploit the huge potential of our higher education institutions. That is certainly true of Bangor. I visited Anglesey recently, at the invitation of the local Member of Parliament, and met the local authority to see how we could develop the local economy. One point I made was that the authority needs to work more closely with the university. Since then, meetings have been held to explore that possibility. The centre researching marine environments in Bangor is a world-class facility and we need to maximise its potential, but we have a long way to go to do that.

bodoli eisoes, megis datblygiad ardderchog Dragon Sea Bait Ltd ym Mhort Talbot, yn fy etholaeth i? Fel y nodwyd yn y cyfarfod a fynychwyd gan y ddau ohonom ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Abertawe, mae angen ymchwilio i botensial meddygol bioleg forol a'i datblygu ymhellach.

**Andrew Davies:** Ers peth amser, nid ydym mewn gwirionedd wedi defnyddio ein harfordiroedd i'r eithaf. Bu ichi sôn am Dragon Sea Bait Ltd—ar eich gwahoddiad, byddaf yn ymweld â'r cwmni cyn bo hir. Mae ganddo gynlluniau cyffrous i agor canolfan ym Mhentywyn yn y gorllewin. Gallai hynny greu nifer sylweddol o swyddi newydd. Yr oedd y cyfarfod a fynychwyd gennym yn Ysgol Glinigol Abertawe ddydd Llun diwethaf yn ymwneud â sut i gysylltu bioleg forol â gwaith ymchwil a datblygu meddygol. Mae'r diwydiant meddygol yn un o'r sectorau twf yn yr economi wybodaeth yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ac mae angen inni fuddsoddi mwy o adnoddau i ymelwa ar ein manteision naturiol yn hyn o beth.

**Dafydd Wigley:** The Minister will be aware of the excellent work done at the University of Wales, Bangor on the potential of the sea. Is he convinced that public bodies in Wales—particularly the Welsh Development Agency and the university—work sufficiently closely to ensure that any potential for jobs and economic development arising out of the research at Bangor is realised?

**Andrew Davies:** A bod yn onest, Dafydd, mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn inni wireddu potensial enfawr ein sefydliadau addysg uwch. Yn sicr mae hynny'n wir am Fangor. Ymwelais ag Ynys Môn yn ddiweddar, ar wahoddiad yr Aelod Seneddol lleol, a chyfarfûm â'r awdurdod lleol i weld sut y gallem ddatblygu'r economi leol. Un pwynt a wneuthum oedd bod angen i'r awdurdod gydweithio'n agosach â'r brifysgol. Ers hynny, cynhaliwyd cyfarfodydd i ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd hwnnw. Mae'r ganolfan sy'n ymchwilio i amgylcheddau morol ym Mangor yn gyfleuster o'r radd flaenaf, ac mae angen inni wireddu ei photensial i'r eithaf, ond mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn y byddwn yn gwneud hynny.

**Val Lloyd:** Trinity House Buoy and Lighthouse Service has had a depot at The King's Dock, Swansea for the last 77 years. It provides the main west coast base for Trinity House operations and is an important marine-based industry. Restructuring proposals by Trinity House suggest a downgrading of the depot at Swansea and centralisation of facilities on a single site on the east coast of England. Will you give an update on any discussions that you might have had to date regarding this situation, and on any assistance that could be provided to prevent job losses at Swansea?

**Val Lloyd:** Bu depo gan Wasanaeth Bwiau a Goleudai Trinity House yn Noc y Brenin, Abertawe ers 77 mlynedd. Hon yw prif ganolfan gweithrediadau Trinity House ar yr arfordir gorllewinol ac mae'n ddiwydiant morol pwysig. Awgryma cynigion ailstrwythuro Trinity House y bwriedir israddio'r depo yn Abertawe a chanoli cyfleusterau ar un safle ar arfordir dwyreiniol Lloegr. A wnewch chi roi'r newyddion diweddaraf am unrhyw drafodaethau a gawsoch hyd yma o bosibl o ran y sefyllfa hon, ac am unrhyw gymorth y gellid ei roi i atal diswyddiadau yn Abertawe?

2:30 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** As you point out, Trinity House has been undertaking an analysis of its current operations, of which there are six in total throughout the Isles. Its proposals were intended to go before the board on 14 November, although that will not be the case now. I have asked officials to take this matter up with Trinity House and the Department for Transport, which will be dealing with the final recommendations. We must ensure that Swansea's interests are not disregarded, because it has developed huge expertise in that area.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y nodwch, mae Trinity House wedi bod yn cynnal dadansoddiad o'i weithrediadau presennol, y mae ganddo chwech ohonynt i gyd ar draws ynysoedd Prydain. Bwriadodd gyflwyno ei gynigion gerbron y bwrdd ar 14 Tachwedd, ond ni fydd hynny'n digwydd bellach. Gofynnais i swyddogion godi'r mater hwn gyda Trinity House a'r Adran dros Drafnidiaeth, a fydd yn ymwneud â'r argymhellion terfynol. Rhaid inni sicrhau na chaiff buddiannau Abertawe eu hanwybyddu, gan ei bod wedi datblygu arbenigedd mawr yn y maes hwnnw.

### **Rhaglen Band Eang Cymru Broadband Wales Programme**

**Q3 Christine Chapman:** Will the Minister make a statement of progress about the Broadband Wales programme? (OAQ19548)

**C3 Christine Chapman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar hynt y rhaglen Band Eang Cymru? (OAQ19548)

**Andrew Davies:** Since I launched the Broadband Wales action plan in July, a number of things have happened. An additional £15 million has been secured for the programme via the Finance Minister's draft budget statement, bringing the total money available to £115 million. The satellite subsidy scheme to bring down the cost of broadband for businesses is operational and the 'try before you buy' broadband demonstration is now available. Recruitment of staff for the Assembly Government's Broadband Wales Unit is underway, and information days are being held across Wales during this month and November to raise awareness and

**Andrew Davies:** Ers imi lansio cynllun gweithredu Band Eang Cymru ym mis Gorffennaf, digwyddodd sawl peth. Neilltuwyd £15 miliwn yn ychwanegol ar gyfer y rhaglen drwy ddatganiad cyllideb ddrafft y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, gan roi cyfanswm o £115 miliwn a neilltuir. Mae'r cynllun cymhorthdal i loerennau ar gyfer gostwng pris band eang i fusnesau ar waith ac mae prawf band eang 'profi cyn prynu' ar gael erbyn hyn. Dechreuwyd recriwtio staff ar gyfer Uned Band Eang Cymru Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a chynhelir diwrnodau gwybodaeth ledled Cymru yn ystod y mis hwn ac ym mis Tachwedd er mwyn codi ymwybyddiaeth a dealltwriaeth o

understanding of the Broadband Wales action plan.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that, in addition to the huge benefits it offers for business, broadband offers a wealth of applications in the home, including video, music and educational facilities? It can help adults to educate themselves and can assist children with their schoolwork. Do you agree that we need to ensure that people are aware that they can register their interest with BT on its website and help bring broadband into our Valleys communities?

**Andrew Davies:** I agree that there is lack of understanding about the benefits of broadband and the methods and companies that can supply it. That is why the programmes that will be run by the Broadband Wales Unit and its partners are so vital. Over the next 18 months, much of the unit's work will involve demand-stimulation activities, for example, raising awareness about what broadband can do for companies, where to get it and how much it costs. All of this will be done in an independent and impartial way. We also plan to place a Broadband Wales representative in each of the four regions of Wales to help raise demand at a local level.

**David Melding:** It is important that broadband technology is available throughout Wales, particularly in the more disadvantaged areas. However, do you agree that how companies use this technology is also important, and that we must improve business skills in that regard so that this wonderful new technology is used to maximum advantage?

**Andrew Davies:** I agree. One of the problems at present is that most companies in Wales are not aware of broadband's potential. I am not sure of the latest figures but, for example, earlier this year in Cardiff, 80 per cent of companies had notional access to ADSL broadband but only 1 per cent had actual access at that time—the percentage has increased since. A huge effort must be undertaken to raise awareness of broadband. It can transform small companies' operations,

gynllun gweithredu Band Eang Cymru.

**Christine Chapman:** A gytunwch y bydd band eang, yn ogystal â'r manteision enfawr a ddaw yn ei sgîl i fusnesau, yn cynnig cyfoeth o ddefnyddiau i gartrefi, gan gynnwys cyfleusterau fideo, cerddoriaeth ac addysgol? Gall helpu oedolion i addysgu eu hunain a gall fod o gymorth i blant gyda'u gwaith ysgol. A gytunwch fod angen inni sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith y gallant gofrestru eu diddordeb ar wefan BT gan helpu i ddod â band eang i'n cymunedau yn y Cymoedd?

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf fod diffyg dealltwriaeth o fanteision band eang a'r dulliau a'r cwmnïau a all ei gyflenwi. Dyna pam y bydd y rhaglenni a gynhelir gan Uned Band Eang Cymru a'i phartneriaid yn holl bwysig. Yn ystod y 18 mis nesaf, bydd llawer o waith yr uned yn ymwneud â gweithgareddau i ysgogi'r galw, er enghraifft, codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r hyn y gall band eang ei wneud i gwmnïau, ble y gellir cael gafael arno a faint y mae'n ei gostio. Caiff hyn oll ei wneud mewn ffordd annibynnol a diduedd. Yr ydym hefyd yn bwriadu penodi cynrychiolydd Band Eang Cymru ym mhob un o'r pedwar rhanbarth yng Nghymru i helpu i ysgogi'r galw yn lleol.

**David Melding:** Mae'n bwysig bod technoleg band eang ar gael ledled Cymru, yn arbennig yn yr ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch fod y ffordd y mae cwmnïau'n defnyddio'r dechnoleg hon hefyd yn bwysig, a bod rhaid inni wella sgiliau busnes yn hynny o beth er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn manteisio ar y dechnoleg newydd wych hon i'r eithaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Cytunaf. Un o'r problemau a wynebwn ar hyn o bryd yw nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o gwmnïau yng Nghymru yn ymwybodol o botensial band eang. Ni wn y ffigurau diweddaraf ond, er enghraifft, yn gynharach eleni yng Nghaerdydd, yr oedd gan 80 y cant o gwmnïau fynediad damcaniaethol i fand eang ADSL ond dim ond 1 y cant a oedd â mynediad gwirioneddol bryd hynny—mae'r ganran wedi cynyddu ers hynny. Rhaid gwneud ymdrech fawr i godi



in terms of marketing, sales and communication.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Will you join me in welcoming the provision of broadband access for Buckley and surrounding communities in my constituency? Do you agree that we should welcome the BT registration scheme, which enables potential users to log an interest in ordering the service and to trigger its introduction when the 200 potential user threshold is reached? Will you encourage other potential broadband providers to take similar proactive initiatives?

**Andrew Davies:** I applaud BT's efforts to increase demand for broadband. One of our current problems, as I have just indicated to David, is that the demand for broadband is still low. Therefore, anything that the telecommunications companies can do is to be welcomed. However, one of the problems in Wales is that there is not much of a market for broadband. BT and NTL are the monopoly providers in many areas, which is why we will invest £115 million in rolling out broadband to areas in Wales that do not currently have access to this new technology.

**Phil Williams:** I understand that discussions are ongoing to establish an international standard for broadband communication. It is certain that this will be much faster than ADSL and probably at least 10 megabits per second. What steps are you taking in the Broadband Wales programme to ensure that the information technology infrastructure installed is future-proof and will allow for a large expansion in the bandwidth to be carried in the future without needing a totally new infrastructure investment, given that that is a requirement that only one of the available technologies can guarantee?

**Andrew Davies:** You may be surprised to hear it, but I agree with your fundamental assumption, Phil. That is why we have not been technology-prescriptive in our Broadband Wales plan. We have taken a technology-neutral line because the technology is developing so quickly. The officials already working on this are very

ymwybyddiaeth o fand eang. Gall drawsnewid gweithrediadau cwmnïau bach, o ran marchnata, gwerthiannau a chysylltiadau.

**Tom Middlehurst:** A ymunwch â mi i groesawu darpariaeth mynediad band eang ym Mwcle a'r cymunedau o'i hamgylch yn fy etholaeth i? A gytunwch y dylem groesawu cynllun cofrestru BT, sy'n galluogi darpar ddefnyddwyr i nodi diddordeb mewn archebu'r gwasanaeth ac ysgogi BT i gyflwyno'r gwasanaeth ar ôl cyrraedd trothwy o 200 o ddarpar ddefnyddwyr? A wnewch chi annog darpar ddarparwyr band eang eraill i gyflwyno mentrau rhagweithiol cyffelyb?

**Andrew Davies:** Cymeradwyaf ymdrechion BT i hybu'r galw am fand eang. Un o'r problemau a wynebwn ar hyn o bryd, fel yr wyf newydd ei ddweud wrth David, yw bod y galw am fand eang yn isel o hyd. Felly, rhaid croesawu unrhyw beth y gall cwmnïau telathrebu ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, un o'r problemau yng Nghymru yw nad oes llawer o farchnad ar gyfer band eang. BT a NTL yw'r unig ddarparwyr mewn sawl ardal a dyna pam y byddwn yn buddsoddi £115 miliwn i gyflwyno band eang i ardaloedd yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt fynediad i'r dechnoleg newydd hon ar hyn o bryd.

**Phil Williams:** Deallaf fod trafodaethau'n mynd rhagddynt i bennu safon ryngwladol ar gyfer cysylltiadau band eang. Yn sicr bydd hyn yn llawer cynt nag ADSL ac o leiaf 10 megabeit yr eiliad yn ôl pob tebyg. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd drwy raglen Band Eang Cymru i sicrhau y bydd y seilwaith technoleg gwybodaeth a osodir yn addas yn y dyfodol ac y bydd modd estyn lled band yn sylweddol yn y dyfodol heb angen buddsoddi mewn seilwaith cwbl newydd, o gofio bod hynny'n ofyniad na all ond un o'r technolegau sydd ar gael ei warantu?

**Andrew Davies:** Efallai y byddwch yn synnu at glywed hyn, ond cytunaf â'ch tybiaeth sylfaenol, Phil. Dyna pam nad ydym wedi pennu technoleg benodol yn ein cynllun Band Eang Cymru. Buom yn niwtral o ran y math o dechnoleg i'w defnyddio gan fod technoleg yn datblygu mor gyflym. Mae'r swyddogion sydd eisoes yn gweithio ar hyn yn

aware of the need to future-proof the roll-out of broadband. However, as I said, the technology is developing rapidly. It was only a few years ago that ISDN was regarded as state-of-the-art, but it is now considered to be old technology and insufficient for modern communications. I agree with your fundamental point.

**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call the next question, at this point I formally welcome our colleagues from Cornwall, who are here studying our electronic democracy. We are pleased to see you. [*Applause.*]

ymwybodol iawn o'r angen i sicrhau y bydd y band eang a gyflwynir yn addas yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, mae'r dechnoleg yn datblygu'n gyflym. Dim ond ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, ISDN oedd y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf ond erbyn hyn credir ei bod yn hen dechnoleg sy'n annigonol ar gyfer cysylltiadau cyfoes. Cytunaf â'ch pwynt sylfaenol.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw'r cwestiwn nesaf, hoffwn groesawu ein cyd-wleidyddion o Gernyw sydd yma i astudio ein democratiaeth electronig. Yr ydym yn falch o'ch gweld chi yma. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

### **Ehangu Meysydd Awyr Cymru Expansion of Welsh Airports**

**Q4 Peter Black:** What discussions has the Minister had regarding the expansion of Welsh airports? (OAQ19544) [R]

**C4 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch ehangu meysydd awyr Cymru? (OAQ19544) [R]

**Andrew Davies:** Presiding Officer, I understood that this question had been transferred for written answer by the Minister for Environment.

**Andrew Davies:** Lywydd, deallais fod y cwestiwn hwn wedi'i drosglwyddo ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd.

**The Presiding Officer:** If it has been transferred, we have not been notified of it.

**Y Llywydd:** Os yw wedi'i drosglwyddo, ni chawsom ein hysbysu.

**Andrew Davies:** In that case, I will answer the question. I have been in regular contact with the airports in Wales, particularly Cardiff international airport, which is why we were so delighted that the Team Wales approach was able to secure the coming of British Midlands' low-cost airline, bmi baby, to Wales. One big problem that we have faced in Wales is the limited number of destinations served by our airports. Given our geography and the problems in terms of road and rail transport between the north and the south, air transport will become increasingly important.

**Andrew Davies:** Os felly, atebaf y cwestiwn. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn cysylltiad cyson â'r meysydd awyr yng Nghymru, yn arbennig â maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, a dyna pam yr oeddem mor falch bod y dull Tîm Cymru o weithredu wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod cwmni awyrennau cost isel British Midlands, sef bmi baby, yn dod i Gymru. Un broblem fawr yr ydym wedi'i hwynebu yng Nghymru yw'r nifer cyfyngedig o gyrchfannau y mae ein hawyrennau yn hedfan iddynt. O ystyried ein daearyddiaeth a'r problemau o ran trafndiaeth ffyrdd a rheilffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, daw trafndiaeth awyr yn gynyddol bwysig.

A working group into air travel and airport provision in Wales was set up by my colleague, Sue Essex. We will consider its recommendations and how we can support not only individual airports, but also airlines, in terms of improving travel within and outside Wales.

Sefydlwyd gweithgor i ymchwilio i ddarpariaeth teithio awyr a meysydd awyr yng Nghymru gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Sue Essex. Byddwn yn ystyried argymhellion y gweithgor a sut y gallwn gynorthwyo nid yn unig feysydd awyr unigol, ond hefyd gwmmniau awyrennau, o ran gwella teithio o fewn a'r tu allan i Gymru.

**Peter Black:** Although there has been speculation about a new airport at Severnside, do you not think that it would benefit the economic development of large parts of Wales if we were to strengthen the existing airport provision at smaller airports such as Swansea and Welshpool?

**Andrew Davies:** I have put on record my views about Severnside. It was not recommended by the Department for Transport in its White Paper. It would only support it—and the Assembly takes the same view—if the existing provision at Cardiff or Bristol airports reached saturation point or if the airports went out of business. That is some way off. As I indicated, I support the development of Swansea airport. I was delighted to fly to Dublin from Swansea on a recent ministerial visit. We have given the airport support in the form of regional selective assistance to help to develop facilities there.

**David Melding:** Minister, may I present you with a bouquet and congratulate you on the part you played to increase the number of scheduled flights at Cardiff international airport through the advent of bmi baby? It is important that such developments take place. Perhaps you would like to return the compliment, now that we are in a non-partisan mode. Do you welcome the publication of the draft Conservative manifesto, which commits to a new airport access road to Cardiff international airport?

2:40 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Access is not one of Cardiff international airport's big problems. At most times of the day you can reach Cardiff international airport within 15 minutes from the M4. I have got lost several times trying to get to Bristol international airport but I have never got lost going to Cardiff international airport. Clearly there are problems with transport, and that is why my ministerial colleague, Sue Essex, supports a rail and bus link to the airport. However, the major problem with Cardiff international airport was the limited number of destinations offered, not the access.

**Peter Black:** Er bod dyfalu ynglŷn â maes awyr newydd yng Nglan Hafren, oni chredwch y byddai o fudd i ddatblygiad economaidd rhannau helaeth o Gymru pe byddem yn cryfhau'r ddarpariaeth bresennol mewn meysydd awyr llai megis Abertawe a'r Trallwng?

**Andrew Davies:** Mae fy marn i ynglŷn â Glan Hafren wedi'i chofnodi. Nis argymhellwyd gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth yn ei Phapur Gwyn. Dim ond os bydd y ddarpariaeth bresennol ym meysydd awyr Caerdydd neu Fryste wedi tyfu i'w heithaf neu os bydd y meysydd awyr yn mynd i'r wal y bydd yn ei gefnogi, ac mae'r Cynulliad yn cyd-fynd â'r safbwynt hwnnw. Nid yw hynny ar fin digwydd. Fel y nodais, cefnogaf ddatblygiad maes awyr Abertawe. Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf hedfan i Ddulyn o Abertawe ar ymweliad gweinidogol diweddar. Rhoesom gymorth i'r maes awyr ar ffurf cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i helpu i ddatblygu'r cyfleusterau sydd yno.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, a allaf roi clod ichi a'ch llongyfarch am eich rhan yn y gwaith o gynyddu nifer yr hediadau rheolaidd ym maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd drwy ddyfodiad bmi baby? Mae'n bwysig bod datblygiadau o'r fath yn digwydd. Efallai yr hoffech fy nghanmol innau hefyd, gan ein bod yn trafod mewn ysbryd amhleidiol. A ydych yn croesawu cyhoeddi maniffesto drafft y Ceidwadwyr, sy'n ymrwymo i adeiladu ffordd fynediad newydd i faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid yw mynediad yn un o brif broblemau maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd. Gallwch gyrraedd maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd o fewn 15 munud o'r M4 ar y rhan fwyaf o adegau o'r dydd. Yr wyf wedi mynd ar goll sawl gwaith tra'n ceisio cyrraedd maes awyr rhyngwladol Bryste ond nid wyf erioed wedi mynd ar goll wrth fynd i faes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd. Yn amlwg, mae problemau o ran trafnidiaeth, a dyna pam mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, yn cefnogi cysylltiad rheilffordd a bws i'r maes awyr. Fodd bynnag, prif broblem maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd oedd y

nifer cyfyngedig o gyrchfannau yr oedd awyrennau'n hedfan iddynt, nid y mynediad.

### **Cynhyrchu Dur yn Nghaerdydd Steel-making in Cardiff**

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the prospects for steel-making in Cardiff? (OAQ19534)

**Andrew Davies:** The receiver appointed by Allied Steel and Wire, KPMG, has informed us that a party has expressed interest in the former ASW plant in Cardiff, and entered into an exclusivity agreement with the receiver on 17 September. Those negotiations continue. There may be several weeks of complex negotiations ahead but we remain optimistic that steel-making will continue in Cardiff, and we will continue to do everything in our power to secure that end.

**Owen John Thomas:** Notwithstanding the restrictions placed on governments within the European Union on supporting steel-making plants and their former employees, are you satisfied that you have investigated all means of gaining the maximum possible financial compensation for former Allied Steel and Wire employees, and of ensuring that the plant is re-used for its original purpose?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes. We are confident that, working with the UK Government, we have explored all avenues of support for ASW with the European Commission. European rules on support for the steel industry are restrictive. However, in terms of support for the workers, we were pleased that the Department of Trade and Industry was successful in including ASW workers in the iron and steel employees re-adaptation benefits scheme. Unfortunately, that has not been possible for the nail factory workers, but, as you know from the meeting I had with the union, we are exploring ways in which it might be possible to include some, if not all, of those who worked in the nail factory, in ISERBS.

**Jonathan Morgan:** When the redundancies at Corus were announced, Mike German chaired a meeting of the executive group of

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y posibiladau o ran gwaith dur yng Nghaerdydd? (OAQ19534)

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r derbynnydd a benodwyd gan Allied Steel and Wire, KPMG, wedi dweud wrthym bod rhywun wedi mynegi diddordeb yn hen weithfeydd ASW yng Nghaerdydd, ac wedi llunio cytundeb cyfyngedig â'r derbynnydd ar 17 Medi. Mae'r negodiadau hynny'n parhau. Efallai y bydd sawl wythnos o negodiadau cymhleth eto ond yr ydym yn hyderus o hyd y bydd gwaith dur yn parhau yng Nghaerdydd, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau'r nod hwnnw.

**Owen John Thomas:** Er gwaethaf y cyfyngiadau a osodir ar lywodraethau o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar gynorthwyo gweithfeydd dur a'u cyn gyflogeion, a ydych yn fodlon eich bod wedi ymchwilio i'r holl ffyrdd o gael yr iawndal mwyaf posibl i gyn-gyflogeion Allied Steel and Wire, ac o sicrhau yr ailddefnyddir y gweithfeydd at eu diben gwreiddiol.

**Andrew Davies:** Ydwyf. Yr ydym yn hyderus ein bod, gan weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU, wedi ystyried pob ffordd o roi cymorth i ASW gyda'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Mae'r rheolau Ewropeaidd ar roi cymorth i'r diwydiant dur yn ein cyfyngu. Fodd bynnag, o ran cymorth i'r gweithwyr, yr oeddem yn falch bod yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wedi llwyddo i gynnwys gweithwyr ASW yn y cynllun budd-daliadau ailaddasu ar gyfer cyflogeion haearn a dur. Yn anffodus ni fu hynny'n bosibl ar gyfer y gweithwyr yn y ffatri hoelion, ond, fel y gwyddoch o'r cyfarfod a gefais gyda'r undeb, yr ydym yn ymchwilio i ffyrdd o gynnwys rhai, os nad pob un, o'r rheini a oedd yn gweithio yn y ffatri hoelion, yn y cynllun.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Pan gyhoeddwyd y diswyddiadau yn Corus, cadeiriodd Mike German gyfarfod o grŵp gweithredol y tasglu

the all-Wales steel taskforce. Will this group reconvene to discuss the ASW position?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in response to Owen John Thomas, we are still confident that the receiver's negotiations with the potential purchaser will re-establish production at the Cardiff plant, and that re-bar—reinforced bars used in the construction industry—will continue to be produced there. It is premature to talk about a taskforce being set up at this stage.

dur i Gymru gyfan. A fydd y grŵp hwn yn ailymgynnull i drafod sefyllfa ASW?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Owen John Thomas, yr ydym yn hyderus o hyd y bydd negodiadau'r derbynydd â'r darpar brynwr yn arwain at ailgychwyn cynhyrchu dur yn y gweithfeydd yng Nghaerdydd, ac y parheir i gynhyrchu re-bar—sef bariau dur wedi'u hatgyfnerthu a ddefnyddir yn y diwydiant adeiladu—yno. Mae'n rhy gynnar i siarad am sefydlu gweithlu ar hyn o bryd.

## **Cwestiynau ar Gyllid i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Finance to the Finance Minister**

### **Archwilio Gwariant Audit of Expenditure**

**C1 David Lloyd:** Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu archwilio'r modd y gwerir y cynnydd yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad? (OAQ19577)

**The Finance Minister (Edwina Hart):** All Assembly expenditure is subject to audit in the usual way.

**David Lloyd:** Pwy benderfynodd y dylid gofyn i Derek Wanless archwilio'r gwariant iechyd?

**Edwina Hart:** Derek Wanless is not an auditor. He will advise us on future strategy. That was a Cabinet decision.

**Mick Bates:** We all welcome the extra money in your budget but I also welcome your prudence. Whatever role you give to Derek Wanless, it is important that somebody examines the effectiveness of the expenditure. Can you tell us when Derek Wanless will start his work?

**Edwina Hart:** I am currently holding discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services about the composition of the team that will assist Derek Wanless, and how we will manage the process at an official level. The process will involve not only Assembly officials but Welsh Local Government Association officials and others.

**Q1 David Lloyd:** How does the Minister intend to audit the expenditure of increases in the Assembly's budget? (OAQ19577)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Edwina Hart):** Archwilir holl wariant y Cynulliad yn y ffordd arferol.

**David Lloyd:** Whose decision was it to ask Derek Wanless to audit health expenditure?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw Derek Wanless yn archwiliwr. Bydd yn ein cyngori ar strategaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol. Penderfyniad y Cabinet oedd hwnnw.

**Mick Bates:** Yr ydym oll yn croesawu'r arian ychwanegol yn eich cyllideb ond yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu eich doethineb. Pa rôl bynnag a roddwch i Derek Wanless, mae'n bwysig bod rhywun yn archwilio effeithiolrwydd y gwariant. A allwch ddweud wrthym pryd y bydd Derek Wanless yn cychwyn ar ei waith?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn cynnal trafodaethau â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn ag aelodaeth y tîm a fydd yn cynorthwyo Derek Wanless, a sut y byddwn yn rheoli'r broses ar lefel swyddogion. Bydd y broses yn cynnwys nid yn unig swyddogion y Cynulliad ond hefyd swyddogion

We must ensure that the appropriate advice mechanism is in place. I hope that, in the course of the next few weeks, Jane Hutt will make an announcement on this to the Health and Social Services Committee.

**David Melding:** You have told us that increases in the health budget for 2004-05 and 2005-06 will be dependent on an adequate response to the Wanless report. Will the Minister for Health and Social Services be responsible for that response, will it be you who audits whether that response is appropriate, and under what circumstances will you tell the Minister to work harder on using health expenditure effectively?

**Edwina Hart:** I do not think that I could tell Jane Hutt to work any harder than she is doing at present. She has done a marvellous job in respect of health and social services and we have seen real improvements in delivery across Wales. This is a Cabinet initiative, and the First Minister, Jane Hutt and I will be involved in making any recommendations to the Cabinet on this expenditure.

Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac eraill. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y dull cynghori priodol ar waith. Gobeithiaf, dros yr wythnosau nesaf, y bydd Jane Hutt yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar hyn i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

**David Melding:** Dywedasoeh wrthym y bydd cynnydd yn y gyllideb iechyd ar gyfer 2004-05 a 2005-06 yn amodol ar ymateb priodol i adroddiad Wanless. A fydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gyfrifol am yr ymateb hwnnw, ai chi fydd yn archwilio pa un ai a yw'r ymateb hwnnw yn briodol ai peidio, ac o dan ba amgylchiadau y byddwch yn dweud wrth y Gweinidog am weithio'n galetach ar ddefnyddio gwariant iechyd yn effeithiol?

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chredaf y gallwn ddweud wrth Jane Hutt am weithio'n galetach nag y gwna ar hyn o bryd. Mae wedi gwneud gwaith ardderchog o ran iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac yr ydym wedi gweld gwelliannau gwirioneddol o ran darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny ar draws Cymru. Menter y Cabinet yw hon, a bydd y Prif Weinidog, Jane Hutt a minnau yn gweithio ynghyd wrth wneud unrhyw argymhellion i'r Cabinet ar y gwariant hwn.

### **Neilltuo Arian Allocating Funding**

**Q2 Brian Hancock:** What is the process of prioritisation when allocating funding in the Assembly budget? (OAQ19573)

**Edwina Hart:** The budget planning round is the process by which decisions on resource allocations are reached. That process takes account of Cabinet priorities, those of the Subject Committees and those of the Assembly's key partners.

**Brian Hancock:** Will you explain your prioritisation when, last year, you awarded £1 million over one year for the regeneration of coalfield communities, while £45 million over three years was awarded in England? What priority have you given coalfield communities this year?

**Edwina Hart:** Following extensive representations from the Coalfields

**C2 Brian Hancock:** Beth yw'r broses flaenoriaethu wrth neilltuo arian yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad? (OAQ19573)

**Edwina Hart:** Gwneir penderfyniadau ar neilltuo adnoddau yn ystod cylch cynllunio'r gyllideb. Mae'r broses honno yn ystyried blaenoriaethau'r Cabinet, blaenoriaethau'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc a blaenoriaethau partneriaid allweddol y Cynulliad.

**Brian Hancock:** A wnewch chi esbonio eich blaenoriaethu yng nghyd-destun y ffaith ichi ddyfarnu £1 filiwn dros flwyddyn ar gyfer adfywio cymunedau glofaol y llynedd, tra rhoddwyd £45 miliwn dros dair blynedd yn Lloegr? Pa flaenoriaeth yr ydych wedi'i rhoi i gymunedau glofaol eleni?

**Edwina Hart:** Yn dilyn nifer helaeth o sylwadau gan Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r

Regeneration Trust, via Peter Law and other Members, I have made excellent provision in year one of my budget. The Local Government and Housing Committee indicated that it wants me to ensure an increase in years two and three for the Coalfields Regeneration Trust. I anticipate a letter from the Chair of that Committee regarding this matter, and I will consider the representations before preparing my final budget.

**David Ian Jones:** In terms of prioritisation, you will be aware that spending on cancer research in Wales is among the lowest in the UK, and it is approximately one-fifteenth of the expenditure in Scotland. What will you do to remedy this situation, and are you prepared to commit Assembly funds to establish a Welsh tissue bank?

**Edwina Hart:** These are issues on which I will consult with Jane Hutt, who regards cancer treatment a priority area. I will consider any representations that she makes.

Meysydd Glo, drwy Peter Law ac Aelodau eraill, yr wyf wedi gwneud darpariaeth ardderchog ym mlwyddyn gyntaf fy nghyllideb. Nododd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ei fod am imi sicrhau cynnydd ym mlynnyddoedd dau a thri ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo. Yr wyf yn rhagweld y bydd llythyr oddi wrth Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor hwnnw ar y mater hwn, a byddaf yn ystyried y sylwadau cyn paratoi fy nghyllideb derfynol.

**David Ian Jones:** O ran blaenoriaethu, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gwario ar ymchwil cancer yng Nghymru ymysg yr isaf yn y DU, a'i fod oddeutu un rhan o 15 o'r gwariant yn yr Alban. Beth a wnewch i unioni'r sefyllfa hon, ac a ydych yn barod i neilltuo arian y Cynulliad i sefydlu banc meinwe yng Nghymru?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r rhain yn faterion y byddaf yn ymgynghori arnynt â Jane Hutt, sy'n ystyried trin cancer fel mater o flaenoriaeth. Byddaf yn ystyried unrhyw sylwadau a wna.

### **Gwariant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru (Dyffryn Clwyd) Welsh Assembly Government Expenditure (Vale of Clwyd)**

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the way in which Welsh Assembly Government expenditure has benefited the Vale of Clwyd? (OAQ19524)

**Edwina Hart:** Welsh Assembly Government expenditure has benefited the Vale of Clwyd through all-Wales programmes and support for specific investments. These include support for investment to create more than 2,000 jobs; investment in key public services ranging from cancer care to transport; support for community projects; and a higher than average increase in funding for Denbighshire due to the new formula for distributing funds to local government.

**Ann Jones:** I welcome the budget statement you made last week, particularly as it included additional money for deprived areas. The areas in the Vale of Clwyd that will benefit from that funding are most grateful. Do you agree that we need to empower

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y mae gwariant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dod â manteision i Ddyffryn Clwyd? (OAQ19524)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Dyffryn Clwyd wedi elwa o wariant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy raglenni i Gymru gyfan a chymorth ar gyfer buddsoddiadau penodol. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys cymorth i fuddsoddi i greu mwy na 2,000 o swyddi; buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus allweddol yn amrywio o ofal cancer i drafnidiaeth; cymorth i brosiectau cymunedol; a chynnydd uwch na'r cyfartaledd o ran ariannu i Sir Ddinbych oherwydd y fformiwla newydd ar gyfer dosbarthu arian i lywodraeth leol.

**Ann Jones:** Croesawaf y datganiad cyllideb a wnaethoch yr wythnos diwethaf, yn arbennig am ei fod yn cynnwys arian ychwanegol i ardaloedd difreintiedig. Mae'r ardaloedd yn Nyffryn Clwyd a fydd yn elwa o'r arian hwnnw yn ddiolchgar iawn. A gytunwch fod

communities in such areas to ensure that they drive their own priorities? Do you also agree that we should do all we can to ensure that members of those communities come forward with exciting projects?

**Edwina Hart:** I was pleased to meet a representative of one of those communities yesterday with you. It is important that local people feel that they have a part to play in community issues. We must ensure the right balance between the role and responsibility of local government and the role and responsibility of local groups and communities in community regeneration.

**Gareth Jones:** Yn ôl argymhellion eich cyllideb ddrafft, nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru ond am wario £1 filiwn y flwyddyn dros y tair blynedd nesaf ar grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. A gytunwch ei bod yn amlwg na fydd hyn yn ddigon i adfywio economi'r Gogledd, a Chonwy yn enwedig? Ni fydd ychwaith yn ddigon i helpu'r mentrau bach a chanolig eu maint, sef mwyafrif y busnesau yn fy etholaeth, lle ceir y cyflogau cyfartalog isaf ym Mhrydain Fawr.

**Edwina Hart:** I do not agree with your premise. There is sufficient money in the budget to deal with all of the issues outlined. We will stand on our record—we have given enormous support to small businesses, and industry in general, across Wales since we have been in charge of this administration.

yn rhaid inni alluogi cymunedau mewn ardaloedd o'r fath i weithredu ar eu blaenoriaethau eu hunain? A gytunwch hefyd y dylem wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau bod aelodau'r cymunedau hynny yn cyflwyno prosiectau cyffrous?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o gyfarfod â chynrychiolydd un o'r cymunedau hynny yn eich cwmni chi ddoe. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl leol yn teimlo bod ganddynt ran i'w chwarae mewn materion cymunedol. Rhaid inni sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng rôl a chyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol a rôl a chyfrifoldeb grwpiau a chymunedau lleol mewn adfywio cymunedol.

**Gareth Jones:** According to your draft budget proposals, the Government of Wales only intends to spend £1 million per annum over the next three years on the Assembly investment grant. Do you agree that this will obviously not be sufficient to regenerate the north Wales economy, particularly in Conwy? Neither will it be sufficient to assist the small and medium-sized enterprises that account for the majority of businesses in my constituency, which has the lowest average earnings in Great Britain.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni chytunaf â'ch gosodiad. Mae digon o arian yn y gyllideb i ymdrin â'r holl faterion a amlinellwyd. Barnwch ni ar ein gweithredoedd—rhesom gymorth aruthrol i fusnesau bach, a diwydiant yn gyffredinol, ledled Cymru ers inni fod yn rhedeg y weinyddiaeth hon.

### **Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad New Assembly Building**

**C4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud beth yw'r diweddaraf ynghylch adeilad newydd y Cynulliad? (OAQ19576)

**Edwina Hart:** On 16 May 2002, Schal International Management Ltd was appointed as the new multi-disciplinary project management team. Schal's first task was to undertake a fundamental review of the project. The project manager has recommended a procurement route that will select two companies from those short listed.

**Q4 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister provide an update on the latest developments regarding the new Assembly building? (OAQ19576)

**Edwina Hart:** Ar 16 Mai 2002, penodwyd Schal International Management Ltd fel y rheolwr prosiect amlddisgyblaethol newydd. Tasg gyntaf Schal oedd cynnal adolygiad sylfaenol o'r prosiect. Argymhellodd rheolwr y prosiect lwybr caffael gan y rheolwr prosiect a fydd yn dewis dau gwmni o'r rheini sydd ar y rhestr fer. Gwahoddir y



These companies will be invited to develop and cost the design of the building. The final selection will be made on the basis of the design and the cost plans submitted. On the programme, the invitation to tender document will be issued today, and the two final tenderers will be announced in January 2003. It is envisaged that the successful tenderer will be formally announced prior to next year's summer recess. I will clarify the use of the verb 'envisage': I cannot say that I will make the announcement, because I do not know whether I will be an Assembly Member or the Minister with responsibility for the project at that time.

2:50 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr eglurhad hwnnw o sefyllfa gyfredol yr adeilad. Fodd bynnag, beth sydd i gyfrif am yr oedi ers dros ddwy flynedd ar y prosiect hwn? Onid y gwir amdani yw nad yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi eich cefnogi ar hyn, nad yw wedi dangos unrhyw arweiniad, ac y dylai adeilad newydd y Cynulliad fod yn fater y dylai dderbyn cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol amdano? Unwaith eto, mae wedi cefnu ar benderfyniad gwleidyddol.

**Edwina Hart:** I have full support from all my Cabinet colleagues on the new building. We are committed to the Assembly's decision to have a new building. The time delay is due to other factors. I have taken professional advice to ensure certainty in terms of design and costs, and that is the only reason why there has been a delay. I regret that we will not be on-site before the Assembly election, because some Members will want to play politics with this issue.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Given the excellent progress that is being made on the Wales Millennium Centre, what have you done to try to improve the timescale for the new Assembly building?

**Edwina Hart:** The Wales Millennium Centre has also had timescale difficulties, if you consider its original timescale. I was concerned when I received the professional advice, and I asked for further advice on the timescale, and tried to reduce it as much as

cwmnïau hyn i ddatblygu a phennu cost yr adeilad. Gwneir y dewis terfynol ar sail y dyluniad a'r cynlluniau costau a gyflwynir. O ran y rhaglen, cyflwynir y ddogfen yn rhoi gwahoddiad i dendro heddiw, a chyhoeddir y ddau gynigiwr terfynol ym mis Ionawr 2003. Rhagwelir y cyhoeddir y cynigiwr llwyddiannus yn ffurfiol cyn toriad yr haf y flwyddyn nesaf. Egluraf y defnydd o'r ferf 'rhagweld': ni allaf ddweud yn sicr mai myfi fydd yn gwneud y cyhoeddiad oherwydd ni wn a fyddaf yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad neu'n Weinidog â'r cyfrifoldeb dros y prosiect yr adeg honno.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am grateful for that explanation of the current situation regarding the building. However, what accounts for the delay of over two years on this project? Is it not true that the First Minister has not supported you on this, that he has not shown any leadership, and that the new Assembly building is a matter for which he should accept direct responsibility? Once again, he has turned his back on a political decision.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gennyf gefnogaeth lawn fy nghyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet ynglŷn â'r adeilad newydd. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i benderfyniad y Cynulliad i gael adeilad newydd. Mae'r oedi hwn o ganlyniad i ffactorau eraill. Yr wyf wedi ceisio cyngor proffesiynol er mwyn cael sicrwydd o ran y gwaith dylunio a'r costau, a dyna'r unig reswm pam y bu oedi. Mae'n edifar gennyf na fyddwn ar y safle cyn etholiad y Cynulliad, oherwydd bydd ambell Aelod am droi'r dŵr i'w felin ei hun.

**Lorraine Barrett:** O ystyried y cynnydd ardderchog a wneir ar Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru, beth a wnaethoch chi i wella'r amserlen ar gyfer adeilad newydd y Cynulliad?

**Edwina Hart:** Cafodd Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru anawsterau o ran ei hamserlen hefyd, os ystyriwch ei hamserlen wreiddiol. Yr oeddwn yn pryderu pan gefais gyngor proffesiynol, a gofynnais am gyngor pellach ar yr amserlen, gan geisio ei lleihau cymaint

possible. I would have liked to see us on-site before the Assembly election. However, professional advice says that that is not possible, and I have accepted that advice.

**Alun Cairns:** Are today's revelations on the Assembly building not the ultimate illustration of failure, indecision, dithering and lack of leadership? It highlights a lack of management skills. Costs have spiralled from £12 million to £40 million, the completion of the project has been delayed by several years, and the architect has been sacked but may be re-appointed, although we will not know for sure because the Assembly Government has decided to kick the issue into the long grass until after the next Assembly election. Children are suffering while waiting for operations. When will the First Minister show leadership and cancel the building once and for all? The people of Wales do not want a purpose-built palace to suit the First Minister's ego, they want more doctors, more nurses, and better facilities for children.

**Edwina Hart:** They would also like better opposition from the Welsh Conservatives. That contribution, from the Welsh Conservatives, is interesting. They always say that they are the party of business, and that they understand the business community. I have taken expert advice from the private sector in reaching this decision, not just from civil servants. I have spoken to consultants, and I have received expert advice from people who are used to managing large-scale projects, which I have chosen to take; they have told me that this is the way forward.

On withdrawing from the project, surely you recognise that we have a duty to Grosvenor Waterside, including legal obligations, and that it would be expensive if we were to withdraw from them, as you are aware from my answers to previous questions on this matter. You also have the hypocrisy to draw on the health agenda. I did not hear your party or your leader welcoming the good news on health last week. Health is on the agenda when it suits you—when you talk about the building. The new building is just

â phosibl. Byddwn wedi hoffi ein gweld ar y safle cyn etholiad y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, dywed cyngor proffesiynol nad yw hynny'n bosibl, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn y cyngor hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Onid yw datgeliadau heddiw ynglŷn ag adeilad y Cynulliad ond yn ddarlun amlwg o fethiant, diffyg penderfyniad, petruso a diffyg arweinyddiaeth? Mae'n amlygu prinder sgiliau rheoli. Mae'r costau wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol o £12 miliwn i £40 miliwn, mae dyddiad cwblhau'r prosiect wedi'i ohirio sawl blwyddyn, a diswyddwyd y pensaer, ond mae'n bosibl y caiff ei ailbenodi, er na wyddom yn bendant oherwydd bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi penderfynu gosod y mater i'r naill ochr tan ar ôl etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad. Mae plant yn dioddef tra'n aros am lawdriniaethau. Pryd y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn dangos arweinyddiaeth ac yn rhoi'r gorau i'r adeilad unwaith ac am byth? Nid yw pobl Cymru am gael palas unswydd i foddio ego'r Prif Weinidog. Yr hyn sydd ei angen arnynt yw mwy o feddygon, mwy o nyrsys a gwell cyfleusterau i blant.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddent hefyd am gael gwell gwrthwynebiad gan Geidwadwyr Cymru. Mae'r cyfraniad hwnnw, gan Geidwadwyr Cymru, yn ddiddorol. Maent bob amser yn dweud mai hwy yw'r blaid fusnes, ac mae hwy sy'n deall y gymuned fusnes. Yr wyf wedi cael cyngor arbenigol gan y sector preifat er mwyn gwneud y penderfyniad hwn, nid gan weision sifil yn unig. Yr wyf wedi siarad ag ymgynghorwyr, a chefais gyngor arbenigol gan bobl sy'n gyfarwydd â rheoli prosiectau mawr, yr wyf wedi dewis ei dderbyn; dywedasant wrthyf mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen.

O ran tynnu'n ôl o'r prosiect, mae'n siŵr eich bod yn cydnabod bod gennym ddyletswydd i Grosvenor Waterside, yn cynnwys rhwymedigaethau cyfreithiol, ac y byddai'n gostus iawn pe byddem yn penderfynu tynnu'n ôl wrthynt, fel y gwyddoch o'm hatebion i gwestiynau blaenorol ar y mater hwn. Yr ydych hefyd yn rhagrithio i gyfeirio at yr agenda iechyd. Ni chlywais eich plaid chi na'ch arweinydd yn croesawu'r newyddion da ynglŷn ag iechyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr ydych yn gosod iechyd ar yr

the issue for you, because you are an anti-devolution party, and do not want it.

**Ron Davies:** I hope, Minister, that you accept that that does not apply to me. However, every time you accept advice it leads to further delay. You are well motivated on this issue, but if you cast your mind back nearly three years ago, when the present administration was formed, we had a site, we had money available, we had an architect, we had consultants, we had contractors, we had the will of the National Assembly, and the project was ready to go. Since then we have wasted hundreds of thousands of pounds on consultants, legal fees and an abortive attempt at seeking an adjudication against the architect. We are now in a situation whereby we do not have an architect, consultants, a project manager, a builder or a design. We do not know what the building will contain, how much it will cost or when work on it will start. Is the Minister confident that this project will be started and completed?

**Edwina Hart:** I am confident that the project will be started and completed. I am responsible for picking up all the pieces of this project. A design competition was held and since then we have had to address many issues, such as the fact that the plot of land was too small for the building. I have explained all those reasons to the Assembly, as well as the rationale that I want to ensure cost certainty in terms of the building. I have now been advised to consider a different procurement route, which I believe to be the right route to deliver the project. Ultimately, we will have a building of which we can be proud and, more importantly, we will know that we got the process right. I do not want our situation to be like that in Scotland, where the cost of the new building is derided in the press. I want this to be a sound project. In political terms, it would have been much easier for me if we had gone along with the existing arrangements and had the arguments at the end. However, as Finance Minister, it would have been dishonest of me to have

agenda yn ôl eich mympwy—pan fyddwch yn siarad am yr adeilad. Yr adeilad newydd yw'r union fater i chi, oherwydd eich bod yn blaid sydd yn erbyn datganoli, ac nad ydych yn ei ddymuno.

**Ron Davies:** Gobeithiaf, Weinidog, eich bod yn derbyn nad yw hynny'n berthnasol i mi. Fodd bynnag, bob tro yr ydych yn derbyn cyngor mae'n arwain at oedi pellach. Yr ydych yn frwdfrydig iawn ynghylch y mater hwn, ond os cofiwch y sefyllfa bron dair blynedd yn ôl, pan ffurfiwyd y weinyddiaeth bresennol, yr oedd gennym safle, yr oedd arian ar gael gennym, yr oedd gennym bensaer, yr oedd gennym ymgynghorwyr, yr oedd gennym gontractwyr, yr oedd gennym ewyllys y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac yr oedd y prosiect yn barod i'w ddatblygu. Ers hynny, yr ydym wedi gwastraffu cannoedd ar filoedd o bunnoedd ar ymgynghorwyr, ffioedd cyfreithiol ac ymgais ofer i ofyn am ddyfarniad yn erbyn y pensaer. Yr ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa lle nad oes gennym bensaer, ymgynghorwyr, rheolwr prosiect, adeiladwr na dylunydd. Ni wyddom beth fydd yr adeilad yn cynnwys, beth fydd ei gost neu pryd fydd y gwaith arno yn dechrau. A yw'r Gweinidog yn hyderus y caiff y prosiect hwn ei gychwyn a'i gwblhau?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn hyderus y caiff y prosiect ei gychwyn a'i gwblhau. Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am bob agwedd ar y prosiect hwn. Cynhaliwyd cystadleuaeth ddylunio ac ers hynny bu'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â llawer o faterion, megis y ffaith bod y darn o dir yn rhy fach ar gyfer yr adeilad. Yr wyf wedi egluro'r holl resymau hynny i'r Cynulliad, yn ogystal â'r rhesymeg fy mod am gael sicrwydd o ran cost yr adeilad. Fe'm cyngorwyd bellach i ystyried llwybr caffael gwahanol, sef y llwybr cywir i gyflwyno'r prosiect, yn fy marn i. Yn y pen draw, bydd gennym adeilad y gallwn fod yn falch ohono ac, yn bwysicach, byddwn yn gwybod ein bod wedi dewis y broses gywir. Ni ddymunaf i'n sefyllfa ni fod yn debyg i sefyllfa'r Alban, lle caiff cost yr adeilad newydd ei wawdio yn y wasg. Dymunaf i hwn fod yn brosiect dilys. O ran gwleidyddiaeth, byddai wedi bod yn llawer haws i mi pe baem wedi dilyn y trefniadau presennol a chael y dadleuon ar y diwedd. Fodd bynnag, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, byddai wedi bod yn anonest i mi

done that and I was not prepared to do it.

wneud hynny ac nid oeddwn yn barod i'w wneud.

**Peter Black:** We would not be in this mess if different decisions had been taken in 1998. Why has there been such a long time between the sacking of the original contractor, the readvertising of the contract and the appointment of a new contractor? When will that appointment be made?

**Peter Black:** Ni fyddem yn y picil hwn pe bai penderfyniadau gwahanol wedi'u gwneud yn 1998. Pam y bu cymaint o amser rhwng diswyddo'r contractiwr gwreiddiol, ailhysbysebu'r contract a phenodi contractwr newydd? Pryd y caiff y penodiad ei wneud?

**Edwina Hart:** I hope that the shortlist will be narrowed down to two tenderers in January. Those two tenderers will then be given time to consider the design and provide a cost certainty. The final appointment, as I indicated, will then be made in the summer. I, too, regret that this process could not be speeded up. However, the advice of civil servants and the project manager—we do have a project manager, Ron—is that this is the only way forward if we are to have cost certainty. It would be nice if work on the building had started, but it has not. We must follow the best process and ensure value for money for the National Assembly.

**Edwina Hart:** Gobeithiaf y caiff y rhestr fer ei chwtdgi i ddau dendr ym mis Ionawr. Yn dilyn hynny, rhoddir amser i'r ddau gynigiwr ystyried y dyluniad a rhoi sicrwydd o ran costau. Gwneir y penodiad terfynol, fel y dywedais, yn ystod yr haf. Mae'n edifar gennyf fi hefyd nad oedd yn bosibl cyflymu'r broses hon. Fodd bynnag, ym marn y gweision sifil a'r rheolwr prosiect—mae gennym reolwr prosiect, Ron—dyma'r unig ffordd ymlaen er mwyn inni gael sicrwydd o ran costau. Byddai'n dda pe bai'r gwaith ar yr adeilad wedi dechrau, ond nid felly. Rhaid inni ddilyn y broses orau a sicrhau gwerth am arian ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

### Prosiectau Menter Cyllid Preifat Private Finance Initiative Projects

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** What percentage of the Assembly's revenue budget is being used to pay for PFI projects? (OAQ19575)

**C5 Janet Ryder:** Pa ganran o gyllideb refeniw'r Cynulliad sy'n cael ei ddefnyddio i dalu am brosiectau mentrau cyllid preifat? (OAQ19575)

**Edwina Hart:** It is 0.7 per cent.

**Edwina Hart:** Y ffigur yw 0.7 y cant.

**Janet Ryder:** In response to a question on PFI on 16 October, you stated that you would provide details of the PFI projects in which the Assembly is involved on the Assembly's website. However, the only details available on the OSIRIS contract to supply computer equipment is the length of the contract, which is seven years. Will you publish the full financial details of this contract?

**Janet Ryder:** Mewn ymateb i gwestiwn ar PFI ar 16 Hydref, bu ichi ddweud y byddech yn rhoi manylion am brosiectau PFI y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud â hwy ar wefan y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr unig fanylion sydd ar gael ar gontract OSIRIS i gyflenwi offer cyfrifiadurol yw hyd y contract, sef saith mlynedd. A wnewch chi gyhoeddi manylion ariannol llawn y contract hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** It was the Welsh Office, not the National Assembly for Wales, which entered into the OSIRIS contract. I believe that it did so in 1996.

**Edwina Hart:** Y Swyddfa Gymreig, ac nid Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, a luniodd gontract OSIRIS. Yr wyf ar ddeall iddi wneud hynny yn 1996.

**David Davies:** You now recognise that PFI—which is a Conservative policy—is a useful way of delivering capital projects such

**David Davies:** Yr ydych bellach yn cydnabod bod PFI—sy'n bolisi Ceidwadol—yn ffordd ddefnyddiol o gyflawni prosiectau

as new schools, hospitals and trunk roads. However, if the percentage of the annual budget that is spent on PFI increases by too much, it will restrict future spending. Will you tell us, therefore, what the optimum level is in your opinion?

**Edwina Hart:** I have never considered the optimum level. I take every project on its merit, and consider affordability in terms of revenue streams. Therefore, I do not have a justifiable figure for you.

cyfalaf megis ysgolion, ysbytai a phriffyrdd newydd. Fodd bynnag, os bydd y ganran o'r gyllideb flynyddol a warir ar PFI yn cynyddu gormod, bydd yn cyfyngu ar wariant yn y dyfodol. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym, felly, beth yw'r lefel orau yn eich barn chi?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid wyf erioed wedi ystyried y lefel orau. Yw wyf yn ystyried pob prosiect yn ôl ei rinweddau, gan ystyried fforddiadwyedd o ran llifioedd refeniw. Felly, nid oes gennyf ffigur cyfiawnadwy ichi.

### **Defnydd o Fentrau Cyllid Preifat yn y Dyfodol Future Use of Private Finance Initiatives**

**Q6 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future use of private finance initiatives to provide schools and hospitals in Wales? (OAQ19522)

**Edwina Hart:** As I have indicated, we take a pragmatic approach to the use of PFI in Wales. It will be used where there are clear and demonstrable advantages for the public.

**John Griffiths:** I appreciate that pragmatic approach, which often favours direct public provision. Will you consider how the Welsh Assembly Government can develop a borrowing capacity—by issuing bonds, for example—to increase our ability to fund new schools and hospitals cost-effectively?

**Edwina Hart:** We use the most effective mechanisms to ensure the necessary capital. As demonstrated in last week's budget, I can allocate money for schools and hospitals using the Treasury settlement. Therefore, the conventional mechanism is useful. However, PFI is also useful, and the new PFI schemes in the Newport area are advantageous to your constituency.

**David Ian Jones:** When will you make an announcement on the PFI application to develop three schools in Llanrwst, Llandudno and Conwy? The project is causing much concern in those areas.

**Edwina Hart:** The National Assembly has received the business case, and I am currently

**C6 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio mentrau cyllid preifat yn y dyfodol i ddarparu ysgolion ac ysbytai yng Nghymru? (OAQ19522)

**Edwina Hart:** Fel yr wyf wedi nodi, mae gennym ymagwedd bragmatig tuag at y defnydd o PFI yng Nghymru. Caiff ei ddefnyddio lle ceir manteision clir a dangosadwy i'r cyhoedd.

**John Griffiths:** Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r ymagwedd bragmatig honno, sy'n aml yn ffafrio darpariaeth gyhoeddus uniongyrchol. A wnewch chi ystyried sut y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddatblygu gallu benthyca—drwy gyhoeddi bondiau, er enghraifft—i gynyddu ein gallu i ariannu ysgolion ac ysbytai newydd mewn dull cost effeithiol?

**Edwina Hart:** Defnyddiwn y dulliau mwyaf effeithiol o sicrhau'r cyfalaf angenrheidiol. Fel y dangoswyd yng nghyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf, gallaf ddyrannu arian i ysgolion ac ysbytai drwy ddefnyddio setliad y Trysorlys. Felly, mae'r dull confensiynol yn ddefnyddiol. Fodd bynnag, mae PFI hefyd yn ddefnyddiol, ac mae'r cynlluniau PFI newydd yn ardal Casnewydd o fudd i'ch etholaeth.

**David Ian Jones:** Pryd y byddwch yn gwneud cyhoeddiad ar gais PFI i ddatblygu tair ysgol yn Llanrwst, Llandudno a Chonwy? Mae'r prosiect yn peri llawer o bryder yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r achos busnes wedi dod i law, ac yr wyf yn cael cyngor ar hyn o bryd

taking advice on the financial aspects of this project. I only deal with the PFI issues; I do not deal with any others. I hope that a decision will be announced in the next few weeks.

**Jocelyn Davies:** What is your response to the report by the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants, which concluded that, if the real cost of borrowing in the public sector was applied, most PFI projects would fail the value-for-money test?

3:00 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I was delighted to meet the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants and discuss its interesting report on PFI. I expressed my views on how it looked at the public sector comparator. The report has considerable merit, and I recommend that Members read it with regard to the issue of PFI.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 7 (OAQ19516) yn ôl.

ar yr agweddau ariannol ar y prosiect hwn. Deliaf â materion sy'n ymwneud â PFI yn unig; ni ddeliaf â materion eraill. Gobeithiaf y cyhoeddir penderfyniad yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Beth yw eich ymateb i'r adroddiad gan Gymdeithas y Cyfrifwyr Ardystiedig Siartredig, a ddaeth i'r casgliad y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r prosiectau PFI yn methu'r prawf gwerth am arian, ped ystyridd cost wirioneddol benthyca yn y sector cyhoeddus?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oedd yn bleser gennyf gwrdd â Chymdeithas y Cyfrifwyr Siartredig Ardystiedig a thrafod ei hadroddiad diddorol ar PFI. Mynegais fy marn ar y ffordd yr oedd yn edrych ar y cymharydd sector cyhoeddus. Mae i'r adroddiad rinweddau sylweddol, ac argymhellaf fod yr Aelodau yn ei ddarllen mewn perthynas â PFI.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 7 (OAQ19516) has been withdrawn.

### Fformiwla Barnett Barnett Formula

**C8 Owen John Thomas:** Pa gyswllt a wnaed â'r Trysorlys ynghylch adolygiad posibl o fformiwla Barnett? (OAQ19517)

**Edwina Hart:** My position on the Barnett formula is a matter of public record. I refer you to the transcript of my evidence to the House of Lords Constitution Committee in May, which is available on the House of Lords internet site.

**Owen John Thomas:** Does the Minister agree with the First Minister that Wales would not be worse off under a revised Barnett formula? Also, is she working with him to win a new Barnett formula, based on need as well as population?

**Edwina Hart:** The First Minister and I agree on the Barnett formula. We both believe that the success of Barnett plus in the comprehensive spending review indicates the

**Q8 Owen John Thomas:** What representations have been made to the Treasury concerning a possible revision of the Barnett formula? (OAQ19517)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae fy marn i ynghylch fformiwla Barnett yn gyhoeddus. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y trawsgrifiad o'm tystiolaeth i Bwyllgor Cyfansoddiad Tŷ'r Arglwyddi ym mis Mai, sydd ar gael ar wefan Tŷ'r Arglwyddi.

**Owen John Thomas:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â'r Prif Weinidog na fyddai Cymru ar ei cholled o dan fformiwla Barnett ddiwygiedig? Yn ogystal, a yw'n gweithio gydag ef i ennill fformiwla Barnett newydd, yn seiliedig ar angen yn ogystal â phoblogaeth?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Prif Weinidog a minnau yn cytuno ar fformiwla Barnett. Mae'r ddau ohonom o'r farn bod llwyddiant Barnett a mwy yn yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr

flexibility of the UK Government in recognising particular needs in Wales.

**David Ian Jones:** Can you confirm a cautious approach in the event of a review of the Barnett formula to avoid any disbenefits that might arise, particularly bearing in mind those areas of Wales that do not benefit from Objective 1 status?

**Edwina Hart:** The Barnett formula is complex. We must be aware of issues that might arise in the context of English devolution, particularly in the north of England, were we to revise Barnett. I agree that there should be a cautious approach.

o wariant yn nodi hyblygrwydd Llywodraeth y DU wrth gydnabod anghenion penodol yng Nghymru.

**David Ian Jones:** A allwch gadarnhau y byddwch yn gweithredu'n bwylllog os caiff fformiwla Barnett ei hadolygu er mwyn osgoi unrhyw anfanteision a allai godi, yn enwedig o gofio'r ardaloedd hynny yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn elwa ar statws Amcan 1?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae fformiwla Barnett yn gymhleth. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o faterion a allai godi yng nghyd-destun datganoli yn Lloegr, yn enwedig yng ngogledd Lloegr, pe baem yn penderfynu diwygio Barnett. Cytunaf fod angen bod yn bwylllog.

### **Datganiad ar Uwchgynhadledd y Ddaear yn Johannesburg Statement on the Earth Summit in Johannesburg**

**The First Minister:** Members will be aware that I attended the United Nations world summit on sustainable development as part of the UK delegation between 30 August and 5 September. While in Johannesburg, I was also able to meet my opposite numbers in the KwaZulu-Natal state government in Durban, and from there travel to Australia to join a WalesTrade International export mission to New South Wales.

The summit provided the first opportunity to benchmark the work we have done in Wales on sustainable development against the best in the world and to showcase that work to other regions, countries and non-governmental organisations. The participative and imaginative way in which we are seeking to make sustainable development a reality for the ordinary citizens of Wales was widely acknowledged. Ministers from other regional-tier governments were especially struck by the clear and succinct nature of our scheme and action plan and by the efforts we were making to mainstream sustainable development in policy and programme decisions, and by the Assembly's legal duty on sustainable development. I was able to bring our groundbreaking work in areas such as 'Cymru Ar-Lein', 'Farming for the Future', the waste strategy and 'A Winning Wales' to their attention. My primary

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol imi fynychu uwchgynhadledd fyd-eang y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy fel rhan o ddirprwyaeth y DU rhwng 30 Awst a 5 Medi. Tra yn Johannesburg, cyfarfum â'm gweinidogion cyfatebol yn llywodraeth talaith KwaZulu-Natal yn Durban, ac oddi yno teithiais i Awstralia i ymuno â chyrch allforio MasnachCymru Rhyngwladol i Dde Cymru Newydd.

Rhoddodd yr uwchgynhadledd y cyfle cyntaf i feincnodi'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gennym yng Nghymru ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn erbyn y goreuon yn y byd ac i ddangos y gwaith hwnnw i ranbarthau, gwledydd a sefydliadau anllywodraethol eraill. Cydnabuwyd y ffordd gyfranogol a llawn dychymyg yr ydym yn mynd ati i geisio gwireddu'r freuddwyd o ddatblygu cynaliadwy i ddinasyddion cyffredin Cymru yn eang. Creodd natur eglur a chryno ein cynllun a'r cynllun gweithredu a'r ymdrechion a wnawn i brif-ffrydio datblygu cynaliadwy mewn penderfyniadau ar bolisiau a rhaglenni, a dyletswydd gyfreithiol y Cynulliad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy argraff arbennig ar Weinidogion o lywodraethau rhanbarthol eraill. Yr oeddwn yn gallu dwyn ein gwaith arloesol mewn meysydd fel 'Cymru Ar-Lein', 'Ffermio ar gyfer y Dyfodol', y strategaeth wastraff a 'Cymru'n

purpose at the summit was to co-host and chair an inaugural meeting of 25 regional governments from around the world. This event would not have taken place without the leadership of Wales and the other core regions, and without a partnership with Stakeholder Forum for our Common Future, which facilitated the conference. I would like to thank all those who made it possible.

That regional government conference took place side-by-side with the main environment and sustainable development summit of 107 sovereign governments. Our smaller conference reached agreement on the 'Gauteng Declaration', Gauteng being the state in which Johannesburg is located. It is a statement of principles for action and the basis for an international network of regions committed to sustainable development. We established a number of new relationships through the conference, and I held a bilateral meeting with the Basque Premier as a direct result of our involvement. The Basque Country has offered to host the next summit meeting of the 25 network regions in March 2003. In addition to the conference, I spoke about the Welsh approach to openness and transparency in government at a business seminar in conjunction with the Cambridge programme for industry, making the parallels between business accountabilities and political transparency. I went on to meet and debate the business approach to sustainability with Mark Moody-Stuart, the former chief executive officer at Shell Group and now chair of the World Business Council for Sustainable Development and the incoming chair of the Anglo-American Corporation—one of the world's largest mining houses. I also visited the WaterDome, the huge global conference and exhibition centre on the water industry, where I was struck by the scope for north-south co-operative projects involving government and business. There was also considerable interest in the not-for-profit Glas Cymru model as one possible answer to the burning issue around the world of public or private sector water and sewerage services.

Ennill' i'w sylw. Fy mhrif ddiben yn yr uwchgynhadledd oedd cyd-gynnal a chyd-gadeirio'r cyfarfod cyntaf o 25 llywodraeth rhanbarthol o bob cwr o'r byd. Ni fyddai'r digwyddiad hwn wedi cael ei gynnal oni bai am arweinyddiaeth Cymru a'r rhanbarthau craidd eraill, ac oni bai am y bartneriaeth â'r Fforwm Rhanddeiliaid ar gyfer ein Dyfodol Cyffredin, a hwylusodd y gynhadledd. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a wnaeth hyn yn bosibl.

Cynhaliwyd y gynhadledd i lywodraethau rhanbarthol ochr yn ochr â'r brif uwchgynhadledd amgylchedd a datblygu cynaliadwy a oedd yn cynnwys 107 o lywodraethau sofran. Daeth ein cynhadledd lai i gytundeb ar 'Ddatganiad Gauteng', oherwydd lleolir Johannesburg yn nhalaith Gauteng. Datganiad o egwyddorion i weithredu arnynt ydyw ac mae'n sail ar gyfer rhwydwaith rhyngwladol o ranbarthau sy'n ymrwymedig i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Bu inni greu sawl perthynas newydd drwy gyfrwng y gynhadledd, a chynhelais gyfarfod dwyffordd â Phrif Weinidog Gwlad y Basg o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'n cyfranogiad. Mae Gwlad y Basg wedi cynnig cynnal yr uwchgynhadledd nesaf o'r 25 o ranbarthau rhwydwaith ym mis Mawrth 2003. Yn ogystal â'r gynhadledd, siaradais am yr ymagwedd Gymreig tuag at fod yn agored a thryloyw mewn llywodraeth mewn seminar fusnes ar y cyd â rhaglen Caergrawnt ar gyfer diwydiant, gan ddangos y tebygrwydd rhwng atebolrwydd mewn busnes a thryloywder gwleidyddol. Euthum ymlaen i gyfarfod â Mark Moody-Stuart, cyn brif weithredwr Grŵp Shell sydd bellach yn gadeirydd Cyngor Busnes y Byd ar Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy ac yn gadeirydd newydd ar yr Anglo-American Corporation—un o'r cwmnïau cloddio mwyaf yn y byd a thrafodais yr ymagwedd fusnes tuag at gynaliadwyedd gydag ef. Ymwelais hefyd â'r WaterDome, y ganolfan gynadledda ac arddangos fyd-eang anferthol ar y diwydiant dŵr, lle'm trawyd gan y potensial ar gyfer prosiectau cydweithredol rhwng y de a'r gogledd sy'n cynnwys llywodraeth a busnesau. Yr oedd cryn ddiddordeb hefyd yn y model nad yw'n gwneud elw, Glas Cymru, fel un ateb posibl i'r pwnc llosg sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau dŵr a charthffosiaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus neu'r



sector preifat.

As part of the events organised by the International Union for Conservation of Nature, I joined Simon Upton, the chair of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development roundtable on sustainable development, to give a seminar on the ecological footprint, organised by its inventor, Mathis Wackernagel. I was able to present our adoption of the footprint as an official indicator—I believe that we are the first country to do so—to an interested audience of international non-governmental organisations.

We were fortunate in being represented in South Africa by 10 young people from Wales. I met them to learn what they felt about the conference, and to hear what lessons they wished to bring back to Wales. I was deeply impressed by their eloquence, passion and interest in the subject. They were a credit to Wales and are a good omen for our future ability to take forward sustainable development. One of them, James Watkins from Neath, aged 13, appeared on the breakfast show on SABC, the main South African television channel, and did himself, Neath and his country, credit.

One of my tasks at the summit was to convey messages from the stakeholder conference in Cardiff in April 2002 that we jointly organised with the World Wildlife Fund Cymru and Oxfam Cymru. As a result of the success of that event—a reflection of the strength of grassroots involvement in sustainable development across Wales—we had a £3,000 surplus, which I was able to present to the eco-city project in a local township, Ivory Park, which is halfway between Johannesburg and Pretoria. The money paid for solar panels for the new community centre. That township visit was moving and brought home to me that sustainable development is not some optional extra for the chattering classes in rich countries, but a real response to issues of poverty and underdevelopment. This high veldt area of South Africa has cold winter nights and high levels of child bronchial problems due to the use of coal fires, with little protection to prevent children from

Fel rhan o'r digwyddiadau a drefnwyd gan yr Undeb Cenedlaethol ar gyfer Cadwraeth Natur, ymunais â Simon Upton, cadeirydd fforwm drafod y Gymdeithas Cydweithrediad a Datblygu Economaidd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, i roi seminar ar yr ôl-troed ecolegol, a drefnwyd gan ei ddyfeisiwr, Mathis Wackernagel. Cyflwynais y modd yr aethom ati i fabwysiadu'r ôl-troed fel dangosydd swyddogol—credaf mai ni yw'r wlad gyntaf i wneud hynny—i gynulleidfha chwilfrydig o sefydliadau anllywodraethol rhyngwladol.

Yr oeddem yn ffodus inni gael ein cynrychioli yn Ne Affrica gan 10 o bobl ifanc o Gymru. Cyfarfum â hwy er mwyn clywed eu teimladau am y gynhadledd, a chlywed pa wersi yr hoffent ddod yn ôl gyda hwy i Gymru. Crewyd cryn argraff arnaf gan eu huawdledd, eu hangerdd a'u diddordeb yn y pwnc. Yr oeddent yn glod i Gymru ac mae'n argoeli'n dda i'n gallu i roi datblygu cynaliadwy ar waith yn y dyfodol. Ymddangosodd un ohonynt, James Watkins o Gastell Nedd, sy'n 13 oed, ar sioe frecwast SABC, prif sianel deledu De Affrica, ac yr oedd yn glod iddo'i hun, Castell Nedd a'i wlad.

Un o'm tasgau yn yr uwchgynhadledd oedd cyfleu negeseuon o'r gynhadledd rhanddeiliaid yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Ebrill 2002 y gwnaethom ei threfnu ar y cyd â Chronfa Bywyd Gwyllt y Byd Cymru ac Oxfam Cymru. O ganlyniad i lwyddiant y digwyddiad hwnnw—sy'n adlewyrchiad o gryfder y cyfranogiad ar lawr gwlad mewn datblygu cynaliadwy ledled Cymru—yr oedd gennym warged o £3,000, ac fe'i cyflwynais i brosiect dinas ecolegol mewn treflan leol, Ivory Park, sydd hanner ffordd rhwng Johannesburg a Pretoria. Talodd yr arian am baneli haul ar gyfer y ganolfan gymunedol newydd. Yr oedd yr ymweliad hwnnw â'r faestref yn emosiynol ac fe'm tarodd nad rhywbeth moethus diangen ar gyfer pobl freintiedig mewn gwledydd cyfoethog yw datblygu cynaliadwy, ond ymateb gwirioneddol i faterion sy'n ymwneud â thlodi a diffyg datblygiad. Caiff yr ardal welltir uchel hon o Dde Affrica nosweithiau oer yn y gaeaf ac mae yno lefelau uchel o

breathing in excessive amounts of coal dust and fumes.

I would not have been able to have such a full and successful programme if it had not been for the co-operative and partnership approach that we have used to take forward our work on sustainable development. I am especially grateful to WWF Cymru and Oxfam Cymru for their support in organising the programme. Oxfam Cymru was also involved in a meeting I held with the Treatment Action Campaign where we discussed the gravity of the HIV/AIDS threat in southern Africa.

Overall, the summit confirmed the importance of sustainable development in new policy directions, and as a major new part of Wales's brand image abroad and other countries' perceptions of us. It also confirmed the role of our legal duty and the ecological footprint policy tool. These are significant drivers of our future Team Wales effort. I will be joining the December post-Johannesburg summit conference in Swansea. Stakeholders will come together to debate their experience of the summit and how this should be taken forward in Wales. Finally, Jonathan Porritt, the chair of the UK Sustainable Development Commission, has stated that he will put anyone who doubts that sustainable development can be made a reality on the train to Cardiff. We have a real lead in this area, but we must work hard to maintain it.

**Janet Davies:** I thank the First Minister for his report. It was clearly an exciting summit. I was pleased that three students and a teacher from my local comprehensive school, Ysgol Gyfun Llanhari, received funding to attend the summit, and I declare an interest as a governor of the school.

There was some divergence in the newspaper reports regarding the summit. There were good reports, but others suggested that the summit barely met the Kyoto targets. However, rather than argue about that, it is important that Wales pushes ahead with

broblemau broncaidd ymysg plant oherwydd y defnydd o dannau glo, ac nid oes fawr o amddiffyniad i atal plant rhag anadlu gormod o lwch a mygdarth glo.

Ni fyddwn wedi gallu cael rhaglen mor llawn a llwyddiannus oni bai am yr ymagwedd gydweithredol a'r ymagwedd o bartneriaeth a ddefnyddiwyd gennym er mwyn mynd â'n gwaith ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy rhagddo. Yr wyf yn arbennig o ddiolchgar i WWF Cymru ac Oxfam Cymru am eu cymorth gyda threfnu'r rhaglen. Yr oedd Oxfam Cymru hefyd yn rhan o gyfarfod a gynhelias gyda'r Ymgyrch Weithredu ar Driniaeth lle trafodwyd difrifoldeb bygythiad HIV/AIDS yn ne Affrica.

Yn gyffredinol, cadarnhaodd yr uwchgynhadledd bwysigrwydd datblygu cynaliadwy o ran cyfeiriadau polisi newydd, ac fel rhan newydd bwysig o ddelwedd brand Cymru dramor ac o ganfyddiadau gwledydd eraill ohonom. Cadarnhaodd hefyd rôl ein dyletswydd gyfreithiol a'r ddyfais polisi ôl-troed ecolegol. Mae'r rhain yn ysgogwyr arwyddocaol i ymdrech Tîm Cymru yn y dyfodol. Byddaf yn ymuno ag ôl-gynhadledd uwchgynhadledd Johannesburg yn Abertawe ym mis Rhagfyr. Bydd rhanddeiliaid yn dod ynghyd i drafod eu profiadau o'r uwchgynhadledd a sut y dylid datblygu hyn yng Nghymru. Yn olaf, dywedodd Jonathan Porritt, cadeirydd Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy y DU, y bydd yn rhoi unrhyw un sy'n amau na ellir gwireddu datblygu cynaliadwy ar y trê'n i Gaerdydd. Yr ydym ar flaen y gad yn y maes hwn, ond mae'n rhaid inni weithio'n galed i'w gynnal.

**Janet Davies:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am ei adroddiad. Yr oedd yn amlwg yn uwchgynhadledd gyffrous. Yr oeddwn yn falch bod tri myfyriwr o'm hysgol uwchradd leol, Ysgol Gyfun Llanhari, wedi cael arian i fynychu'r uwchgynhadledd, a datganaf fuddiant fel un o lywodraethwyr yr ysgol.

Yr oedd rhywfaint o wahaniaeth barn yn yr adroddiadau yn y papurau newydd ynghylch yr uwchgynhadledd. Cafwyd adroddiadau da, ond awgrymodd adroddiadau eraill mai prin y cyrhaeddwyd targedau Kyoto. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na dadlau am hynny,

meeting targets, setting agendas and putting resources into achieving those targets. We all know that sustainable development is written into the Government of Wales Act 1998. I will ask the First Minister a question that I wanted to ask him last Tuesday in a supplementary question. I asked the Business Minister the same question yesterday, but he was unable to answer. What action are you, First Minister, taking on the additional sustainable development indicators? It is important that the environment is made to work for the economy of Wales. This week I visited Davies Brothers (Waste) Ltd's thermal conversion and gasification plant near Porthcawl. That company recycles waste and hopes soon to convert waste to energy, using 93 per cent of the unsorted waste stream. That will be impressive, if it happens. What action are you talking to proactively seek and encourage such developments? That firm has had no public funding but is doing a good job.

3:10 p.m.

You referred to the good example that Wales sets in terms of openness and transparency. Unfortunately, I receive many complaints and communications about the Assembly Government and one quango, concerning their lack of openness and transparency on the Llandudno school that will be built on contaminated land. What will you do to ensure that that openness and transparency is real and is seen to be real by the people of Wales? At least then I would not receive so many complaints. We need to go ahead and make Wales green, clean and open.

**The First Minister:** You are right that we should not dwell too much on the summit's results, although it was successful—with the possible exception of energy conservation and renewable energy—as regards water, proper sanitation, depleted fisheries, reducing biodiversity loss and using chemicals so that they do not harm the environment.

Regarding your question about progress on

mae'n bwysig bod Cymru yn bwrw ati i gyrraedd targedau, pennu agendâu a chlustnodi adnoddau i gyflawni'r targedau hynny. Gwyddom oll fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn rhan o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Gofynnaf gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog yr oeddwn yn awyddus i'w ofyn iddo ddydd Mawrth diwethaf mewn cwestiwn atodol. Gofynnais yr un cwestiwn i'r Trefnydd ddoe, ond ni allodd ateb. Pa gamau yr ydych chi, Brif Weinidog, yn eu cymryd ar y dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy ychwanegol? Mae'n bwysig bod yr amgylchedd yn gweithio er budd economi Cymru. Yr wythnos hon ymwelais â gweithfa trosi a nweiddio thermol Davies Brothers (Waste) Ltd ger Porthcawl. Mae'r cwmni hwnnw'n ailgylchu gwastraff ac mae'n gobeithio troi gwastraff yn ynni cyn bo hir, gan ddefnyddio 93 y cant o'r llif gwastraff na ddidolwyd. Bydd hynny'n drawiadol, os bydd yn digwydd. Pa gamau a ydych yn eu cymryd i edrych am ddatblygiadau o'r fath a'u hannog. Ni dderbyniodd y cwmni hwnnw unrhyw arian cyhoeddus, ond mae'n gwneud gwaith da.

Cyfeiriasoch at yr esiampl dda y mae Cymru yn ei gosod o ran bod yn agored ac yn dryloyw. Yn anffodus, derbyniaf nifer o gwynion a gohebiaeth ynghylch Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac un cwango, yn ymwneud â'r ffaith nad ydynt yn agored nac yn dryloyw o ran yr ysgol yn Llandudno a gaiff ei hadeiladu ar dir llygredig. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau eich bod yn agored ac yn dryloyw mewn gwirionedd a bod pobl Cymru yn gweld hynny? O leiaf wedyn ni fyddwn yn derbyn cymaint o gwynion. Mae angen inni fynd ati a gwneud Cymru yn wyrdd, yn lân ac yn agored.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud na ddylem bendroni gormod am ganlyniadau'r uwchgynhadledd, er ei bod yn llwyddiannus—ac eithrio cadwraeth ynni ac ynni adnewyddadwy o bosibl—o ran dŵr, glanweithdra priodol, pysgodfeydd wedi gwagio, lleihau colledion o ran bioamrywiaeth a defnyddio cemegau fel nad ydynt yn niweidio'r amgylchedd.

O ran eich cwestiwn am y cynnydd ar y

the sustainable development tool, you will know Janet, from previous comments in the Assembly, that we were awarded a special responsibility role for pushing this forward with the other sub-national levels of government units across Europe, under the innovative actions programmes. We will support an independent Welsh sustainable development forum. Similarly, Jane Davidson established an advisory panel on education for sustainable development. We have also agreed a compact with the Welsh Local Government Association to co-operate on sustainable development. However, the recognition from Europe that we have a special role in that regard, and the fact that it is willing to fund us to network with the other regions, indicates that our work is recognised by others. Perhaps it is more important than our recognising that we are taking these issues forward if others say, 'You are in the lead, so you will lead the other regions of Europe through this difficult learning process of putting sustainable development into action.'

You mentioned a particular waste processing company in a former quarry at Tythegston, not far from Cardiff. I have not visited the Davies Brothers operation. Some are enthusiastic about it and say, after visiting the site, 'I have seen the future; and it works'. Others say that it is an intermediate process. You will always get different scientific and engineering views about the right way forward in terms of re-using municipal waste. However, I will ensure that Sue Essex or I write to you with our analysis of the pros and cons of the Davies Brothers' approach to waste and recycling.

Finally, on transparency and openness, an enormous amount of information was disclosed on the Llandudno schools project by Conwy County Borough Council in relation to the proposals for a replacement site for the present Ysgol John Bright. Much information has been released but it would have been released more quickly had the demand for the information been more specific and less catch-all. That was the only problem with releasing the information,

ddyfais datblygu cynaliadwy, fe wyddoch Janet, o'r sylwadau blaenorol yn y Cynulliad, inni dderbyn cyfrifoldeb arbennig dros ddatblygu hyn ynghyd â'r unedau o lywodraeth is-genedlaethol eraill ledled Ewrop, o dan y rhaglenni camau blaengar. Byddwn yn cefnogi fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy annibynnol yng Nghymru. Yn yr un modd, sefydlodd Jane Davidson banel ymgynghorol ar addysg ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cytuno ar gompact gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn cydweithio ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gydnabyddiaeth gan Ewrop bod gennym rôl arbennig yn hynny o beth, a'r ffaith ei bod yn barod i'n hariannu i rwydweithio â'r rhanbarthau eraill, yn arwydd fod ein gwaith yn cael ei gydnabod gan eraill. Efallai ei fod yn bwysicach na'n bod ni'n cydnabod ein bod yn datblygu'r materion hyn os yw eraill yn dweud, 'Yr ydych ar y blaen, felly byddwch yn arwain rhanbarthau eraill Ewrop drwy'r broses ddysgu anodd hon o roi datblygu cynaliadwy ar waith.'

Soniasoch am gwmni prosesu gwastraff arbennig mewn hen chwarel yn Llandudwg, nepell o Gaerdydd. Nid wyf wedi ymweld â chwmni Davies Brothers. Mae rhai yn frwdfrydig amdano ac wedi dweud, ar ôl ymweld â'r safle, 'Yr wyf wedi gweld y dyfodol; ac mae'n gweithio'. Dywed eraill mai proses ganolraddol ydyw. Byddwch bob amser yn cael barn wyddonol a barn beirianeg wahanol am y ffordd gywir ymlaen o ran aildefnyddio gwastraff bwrdeistrefol. Fodd bynnag, rhoddaf sicrwydd y bydd Sue Essex neu minnau yn ysgrifennu atoch gyda'n dadansoddiad o fanteision ac anfanteision ymagwedd Davies Brothers tuag at wastraff ac ailgylchu.

Yn olaf, o ran tryloywder a bod yn agored, datgelwyd swm anferth o wybodaeth am brosiect ysgolion Llandudno gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy mewn perthynas â'r cynigion ar gyfer safle newydd yn lle safle presennol Ysgol John Bright. Rhyddhawyd llawer o wybodaeth ond byddai wedi cael ei ryddhau'n gyflymach pe bai'r galw am y wybodaeth wedi bod yn fwy penodol ac yn llai eang. Dyna oedd yr unig broblem o ran rhyddhau'r wybodaeth, oherwydd yr oedd yn

because all the information had to be analysed to check that the Data Protection Act 1998 was not breached by mentioning individuals whose rights could have been adversely affected. That must be carefully checked when you release a large volume of information. Those matters are on-going. We believe that we acted honourably, quickly and in line with our transparency obligations. We would compare favourably with any governmental unit at any level in Europe.

**John Griffiths:** First, congratulations on representing Wales at such a worthwhile event—albeit with somewhat disappointing results, at least in the short term—in which Wales enjoyed a high profile, demonstrating the progress we have made on the sustainable development front. On your meeting with the Treatment Action Campaign in South Africa, which is doing much good work in trying to get the South African Government to take the AIDS crisis seriously, will you raise with the UK Government the failure of the South African President, Thabo Mbeki to acknowledge the link between HIV and AIDS in order to try to improve the situation in South Africa?

On the reform of the common agricultural policy, will you urge the UK Government and the European Union to give their full regard to the important effect of agricultural subsidies on the home markets of the agricultural sectors of developing countries? We know that there is also a commodity crisis in the developing world, and at the last meeting of the all-party group on international development, which I now chair, Mike German put forward useful ideas on how we could develop fair trade in Wales. Will you investigate how this could be taken forward?

Finally, Jon Townley of Oxfam Cymru is in the public gallery today; he is accompanied by the Oxfam GB official, Omar De Rocha, who is based in Perambuco, a region in Brazil that has signed up to the Gauteng declaration. I know that Oxfam Cymru is keen that the voice of civil society in the regions of developing countries is given prominence in taking the declaration and its

rhaid dadansoddi'r holl wybodaeth er mwyn sicrhau nad oedd Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 yn cael ei thorri drwy enwi unigolion y gellid bod wedi effeithio'n andwyol ar eu hawliau. Mae'n rhaid gwirio hynny'n ofalus pan fyddwch yn rhyddhau swm mawr o wybodaeth. Mae'r materion hynny yn parhau. Credwn inni weithredu'n anrhydeddus, yn gyflym ac yn unol â'n dyletswyddau tryloywder. Byddem yn cymharu'n ffafriol ag unrhyw uned lywodraethol ar unrhyw lefel yn Ewrop.

**John Griffiths:** Yn gyntaf, llongyfarchiadau ar gynrychioli Cymru mewn digwyddiad mor fuddiol—er â chanlyniadau siomedig, yn y bydymor o leiaf—lle y rhoddwyd proffil uchel i Gymru, gan ddangos y cynnydd a wnaethom yn y maes datblygu cynaliadwy. O ran eich cyfarfod â'r Ymgyrch Weithredu ar Driniaeth yn Ne Affrica, sy'n gwneud llawer o waith da i geisio cael Llywodraeth De Affrica i gymryd yr argyfwng AIDS o ddifrif, a wnewch chi godi methiant Arlywydd De Affrica, Thabo Mbeki, i gydnabod y cyswllt rhwng HIV ac AIDS gyda Llywodraeth y DU, er mwyn ceisio gwella'r sefyllfa yn Ne Affrica?

O ran diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, a wnewch chi annog Llywodraeth y DU a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i roi ystyriaeth lawn i'r effaith bwysig a gaiff cymorthdaliadau amaethyddol ar farchnadoedd cartref sectorau amaethyddol gwledydd sy'n datblygu? Gwyddom fod argyfwng nwyddau yn y byd sy'n datblygu hefyd, ac yn y cyfarfod diwethaf o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar ddatblygu rhyngwladol, yr wyf bellach yn gadeirydd arno, cyflwynodd Mike German syniadau defnyddiol ynghylch sut y gallwn ddatblygu masnach deg yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi ymchwilio i sut y gellid datblygu hyn?

Yn olaf, mae Jon Townley o Oxfam Cymru yn yr oriel gyhoeddus heddiw; yn gwmni iddo mae swyddog Oxfam Prydain Fawr, Omar De Rocha, sydd wedi ei leoli yn Perambuco, rhanbarth ym Mrasil a lofnododd ddatganiad Gauteng. Gwn fod Oxfam Cymru yn awyddus i roi amlygrwydd i lais cymdeithas sifil yn rhanbarthau'r gwledydd sy'n datblygu o ran datblygu'r datganiad hwn

activities forward. Can you assure us that prominence will be given to those organisations?

**The First Minister:** I do not share your view that the summit was a major disappointment. Agreement was not achieved on some areas, but that is not surprising with 107 sovereign states taking part—I know how difficult it was trying to negotiate the wording between just 25 sub-national tiers when I chaired a session. It must have been exceptionally difficult to try to get 107 countries to sign up to exactly the same text. Excepting the issue of renewable energy, I believe that the summit made major progress.

On AIDS, Thabo Mbeki, as we all know, now publicly says that he accepts the link between HIV and AIDS, as medics throughout the world do. However, a huge problem remains in South Africa as, privately, people still do not believe this. The worst part about that is that babies who inherit HIV from their mothers do not receive the treatment they need; the old wives' tales to the effect that you are more likely to get AIDS from the injection than be prevented from getting it has swept through the townships. That is a tragedy for the future of South Africa.

On the relationship between the first and third world in terms of commodity prices and the reform of the common agricultural policy, this will be one of the biggest issues of this weekend's summit of the Presidents and Prime Ministers of the 15 European Union member states, with observers from the accession states, in Copenhagen. The Doha summit attempted to gain agreement between the first, second and third world on trade terms for importing food into Europe, without dumping heavily subsidised European exports on non-European markets, which is not a sensible way forward. However, as we know from President Chirac's recent statements, France's national interests are strongly in favour of deferring the long-awaited and much needed reform of the common agricultural policy for as long as possible. This is now connected to the issue of British rebate, accession and eastward enlargement. Wales has an interest in all of

a'i weithgareddau. A allwch chi ein sicrhau y rhoddir amlygrwydd i'r sefydliadau hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn cyd-fynd â'ch safbwynt bod yr uwchgynhadledd yn siom fawr. Ni ddaethpwyd i gytundeb ar rai meysydd, ond nid yw hynny'n syndod pan fo 107 o wladwriaethau sofran yn cymryd rhan—gwn pa mor anodd oedd trafod y geiriad rhwng 25 o haenau is-genedlaethol yn unig pan gadeiriais sesiwn. Mae'n siŵr y bu'n eithriadol o anodd ceisio cael 107 o wledydd i gytuno ar yr un testun yn union. Ac eithrio ynni adnewyddadwy, credaf fod yr uwchgynhadledd wedi gwneud cynnydd mawr.

O ran AIDS, fel y gwyddom, dywed Thabo Mbeki yn gyhoeddus bellach ei fod yn derbyn bod cysylltiad rhwng HIV ac AIDS, fel y gwna meddygon ledled y byd. Fodd bynnag, mae problem anferth yn dal i fodoli yn Ne Affrica gan nad yw pobl, yn breifat, yn dal i gredu hyn. Y peth gwaethaf am hynny yw'r ffaith nad yw babanod sy'n etifeddu HIV gan eu mamau yn cael y driniaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt; lledaenodd y goel gwrach eich bod yn fwy tebygol o gael AIDS oddi wrth y pigiad yn hytrach na'i fod yn ei atal drwy'r maestrefi. Mae hynny'n drychineb i ddyfodol De Affrica.

O ran y berthynas rhwng y byd cyntaf a'r trydydd byd yn nhermau prisiau nwyddau a diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, bydd hwn yn un o'r materion pwysicaf yn uwchgynhadledd Arlywyddion a Phrif Weinidogion 15 aelod-wladwriaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, sy'n cael ei chynnal y penwythnos hwn, gydag arsylwyr o'r gwladwriaethau sy'n ymuno, yn Copenhagen. Ceisiodd uwchgynhadledd Doha gael cytundeb rhwng y byd cyntaf, yr ail fyd a'r trydydd byd o ran telerau masnachu ar gyfer mewnforio bwyd i Ewrop, heb waredu allforion Ewropeaidd sy'n derbyn cymorthdaliadau mawr ar farchnadoedd nad ydynt yn farchnadoedd Ewropeaidd. Nid yw hynny'n ffordd synhwyrol ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddom o ddatganiadau diweddar Arlywydd Chirac, mae buddiannau cenedlaethol Ffrainc yn gryf o blaid gohirio'r broses hirddisgwyliedig a mawr ei hangen o ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin

those issues.

cyhyd â phosibl. Cysylltir hyn yn awr â'r mater Prydeinig sy'n ymwneud ag ad-dalu, ymuno ac ehangu tua'r dwyrain. Mae gan Gymru fuddiant ym mhob un o'r materion hynny.

3:20 p.m.

Finally, on fair trade and its implications for areas such as north-eastern Brazil, I am pleased to say that, among the 25 regions that signed the Gauteng declaration were five regions of Brazil, including some from the poorer parts in the north-east. It was crucial to reaching across the five continents that the Brazilian regions were so well represented in our regional network. I do not know in which state Pernambuco is, but there was representation from states with different levels of economic development in Brazil. They have a different perspective because of where they are located, what produce they have and to where they wish to export in Europe and North America. We had an interesting discussion on what sustainable development means in a Brazilian context and on what it means in the context of wealthier areas such as Europe and Australia.

Yn olaf, o ran masnach deg a'i goblygiadau i ardaloedd megis gogledd-ddwyrain Brasil, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod pum rhanbarth o Frasil, gan gynnwys rhai o'r rhannau tlotaf yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, ymysg y 25 rhanbarth a lofnododd ddatganiad Gauteng. Yr oedd yn allweddol i'r broses o ymestyn ar draws y pum cyfandir fod rhanbarthau Brasil wedi eu cynrychioli mor dda yn ein rhwydwaith rhanbarthol. Ni wn ym mha dalaith y mae Pernambuco, ond gwn fod cynrychiolaeth o daleithiau ym Mrasil sydd â lefelau gwahanol o ddatblygiad economaidd. Mae ganddynt safbwynt gwahanol oherwydd eu lleoliad, yr hyn y maent yn ei gynhyrchu a lle y maent yn dymuno allforio yn Ewrop a Gogledd America. Cawsom drafodaeth ddiddorol ar yr hyn a olyga datblygu cynaliadwy yng nghydestun Brasil a'r hyn a olyga yng nghydestun ardaloedd cyfoethocach megis Ewrop ac Awstralia.

**David Davies:** I also visited a township in South Africa earlier this year, though I did so at my own expense. Members of the African National Congress took me around the township and also to the new Ford Motor Company site there. They made the point that such global companies were bringing wealth and education to the area. Was that lesson learned by the delegates at the Johannesburg junket? It looked to many critics as though the conference was simply a platform for every trendy, left-of-centre, politically correct group in the world to gather and throw abuse at globalisation, multinational companies, America, McDonalds or whatever happened to be the trendy cause of the day. Many of those targets of abuse could actually drag the third world out of its poverty. With hindsight, given the actions of those people—who booed down American ministers while cheering on the illegal dictator in Zimbabwe—would not your time have been better spent pursuing sustainable development policies at home?

**David Davies:** Ymwelais innau hefyd â maestref yn Ne Affrica yn gynharach eleni, er imi dalu am hynny o'm piced fy hun. Fe'm tywyswyd o amgylch y faestref a safle newydd Ford Motor Company yno hefyd gan aelodau o Gyngres Genedlaethol Affrica. Gwnaethant y pwynt fod cwmnïau byd-eang o'r fath yn dod â chyfoeth ac addysg i'r ardal. A ddysgwyd y wers honno gan y cynrychiolwyr yn sbloet Johannesburg? Ymddangosai i sawl beirniad mai llwyfan yn unig oedd y gynhadledd i bob grŵp asgell chwith ffasiynol, gwleidyddol gywir yn y byd i ymgynnull a gwaradwyddo bydoli, cwmnïau cydwladol, America, McDonalds neu beth bynnag arall oedd achos ffasiynol y dydd. Gallai nifer o'r targedau hynny a waradwyddwyd lusgo'r trydydd byd allan o'i dlodi. O edrych yn ôl, o ystyried gweithredoedd y bobl hynny—a fwiodd weinidogion o America tra'n cymeradwyo yr unben anghyfreithlon yn Zimbabwe—oni fyddai'n well pe baech wedi mynd ar drywydd polisiau datblygu cynaliadwy gartref?

**The First Minister:** You were obviously not listening when I mentioned that I addressed a business seminar in conjunction with the Cambridge programme for industry. It had high participation from business, law and accountancy sectors in Johannesburg. I am not sure that Mark Moody-Stuart—the former chief executive of Shell and the incoming chairman of the Anglo-American Corporation—would qualify as a trendy lefty, David. Perhaps you drafted your question before you heard my statement. The important aspect of the environment summit is that people from every walk of life were there. The private sector was strongly represented at that summit, as were the non-governmental organisations and people from poor countries, medium-poor countries and rich countries. The point is to bridge the five continents and connect the different stakeholders—the ordinary citizens, the non-governmental organisations, the environmental fanatics as well as private business—to get an agreement on measures to prevent the planet from sinking under the weight of its own pollution over the next 50 years. You cannot achieve that with the non-governmental organisations alone. Nor can you do it with only governments or the private sector. If you can get them all to agree on a text and a way forward, then there is a chance of doing something constructive to ensure that the planet is fit to live on in 50 to 100 years' time.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch am eich datganiad ac am godi proffil Cymru. Cefnogwn unrhyw ddatblygiad. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch y dylem barhau i alw am drefniant byd-eang newydd i roi mwy o gymorth ariannol i'r gwledydd tlotaf ac i'r prosiectau amgylcheddol sydd fwyaf ei angen? Hefyd, a gytunwch fod angen gwelliant sylweddol ar sefydliadau rhyngwladol, hynny yw, bod angen ymgorffori amcanion datblygu cynaliadwy o fewn Corff Masnachu'r Byd, y Gronfa Ariannol Ryngwladol a Banc y Byd i sicrhau y bydd economïau'r dyfodol mewn gwell cyflwr i helpu'r bobl dlotaf?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r cyrff rhyngwladol hynny yn dysgu, rhai yn

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n amlwg nad oeddech yn gwrando pan soniais fy mod wedi annerch seminar busnes ar y cyd â rhaglen Caergrawnt ar gyfer diwydiant. Cymerodd nifer fawr o bobl o sectorau busnes, cyfraith a chyfrifo Johannesburg ran ynddo. Nid wyf yn sicr os y gellid ystyried Mark Moody-Stuart—cyn brif weithredwr Shell a chadeirydd newydd Anglo-American Corporation—fel rhywun asgell chwith ffasiynol, David. Efallai ichi ddrafftio eich cwestiwn cyn ichi glywed fy natganiad. Yr agwedd bwysig ar uwchgynhadledd yr amgylchedd yw fod pobl o bob cefndir yno. Cynrychiolwyd y sector preifat yn gryf yn yr uwchgynhadledd honno, yn ogystal â'r sefydliadau anllywodraethol a phobl o wledydd tlawd, gwledydd cymharol dlawd a gwledydd cyfoethog. Y pwynt yw adeiladu pontydd rhwng y pum cyfandir a chysylltu'r rhanddeiliaid gwahanol—y dinasyddion cyffredin, y sefydliadau anllywodraethol, y penboethion amgylcheddol yn ogystal â busnesau preifat—er mwyn cytuno ar fesurau i atal y blaned rhag suddo o dan bwysau ei llygredd ei hun dros y 50 mlynedd nesaf. Ni allwch gyflawni hynny gyda sefydliadau anllywodraethol yn unig. Ni allwch ei gyflawni ychwaith gyda llywodraethau neu'r sector preifat yn unig. Os llwyddwch i gael bob un ohonynt i gytuno ar destun a ffordd ymlaen, yna mae cyfle i wneud rhywbeth adeiladol i sicrhau y bydd y blaned yn addas i fyw arni ymhen 50 neu 100 mlynedd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for this statement and for raising the profile of Wales. We support any development. However, do you agree that we should continue to call for a new worldwide deal to give more financial aid to the poorest countries and to the environmental projects that most need it? Also, do you agree that significant improvements are needed within international organisations, that is to say that the aims of sustainable development need to be incorporated into the World Trade Organisation, the International Monetary Fund and the World Bank to ensure that the economies of the future are better equipped to help the poorest people?

**The First Minister:** Those international bodies are learning, some more quickly than



gyflymach na'i gilydd. Efallai fod Corff Masnachu'r Byd yn llusgo y tu ôl i'r gweddill. Credaf eu bod yn deall bod yn rhaid ceisio ymgorffori egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy i'w dull o gynnal busnes, er mai cyrff masnachol ydynt. Pan roir arian ar fenthyg, y nod yw iddo gael ei dalu yn ôl. Ni allwch wneud y broses yn rhy garedig neu'n or-gydymdeimladol am fod yn rhaid ailgylchu'r arian i roi benthygiadau i eraill ymhen rhyw 10 mlynedd.

O ran cynnwys yr amgylchedd yn y trafodaethau ar fasnach, mae pawb yn cytuno mai ad-drefnu'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yw'r cwestiwn pwysicaf o ran masnach deg rhwng y byd cyfoethog a'r byd tlawd. Ni wn a yw'n bosibl ad-drefnu'r CAP yn ystod y trafodaethau ar ehangu Ewropeaidd. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n angenrheidiol os ydym am sicrhau tegwch rhwng cyfandiroedd a gwledydd y byd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym yn falch eich bod wedi cynrychioli Cymru yn yr uwchgynhadledd. Yr oedd yn glôd i Gymru, ac yr oedd yn gynhadledd bwysig. Fel y dywedasoch, yr ydym yn sôn am gynlluniau i sicrhau bod y blaned hon yn goroesi a'n bod yn gallu dileu unrhyw fygythiad iddi. A gytunwch bod tair elfen hollbwysig o ran datblygu cynaliadwy? Mae trafndiaeth, ynni adnewyddadwy a chynllunio yn bwysig, ac eto, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi methu â datblygu polisiâu cynaliadwy yn y meysydd polisi hynny. Ni wnaeth ddim o ran trafndiaeth. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi galw i mewn bob cais am brosiectau ynni adnewyddadwy—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'ch cyfraniad yn rhy hir. Y drefn y cytunwyd arni ynglŷn â datganiadau yw bod prif siaradwr pob grŵp yn cael ei alw, a bod cyfle wedyn i Aelodau ychwanegu cwestiynau cryno a chael atebion cryno er mwyn i bawb gael siarad.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Hanner brawddeg sydd gennyf ar ôl.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydych wedi cael tair brawddeg eisoes. Hanner brawddeg fer os gwelwch yn dda.

others. Perhaps the World Trade Organisation is lagging behind the rest. I believe that they understand the need to incorporate the principles of sustainable development into their business practices, even though they are commercial bodies. When money is lent, the aim is to recoup that loan. This process cannot be carried out in too generous or over-sympathetic a way because you must try to recycle that money to provide others with loans in 10 years' time.

On bringing the environment into discussions on trade, everyone agrees that the renegotiation of the common agricultural policy within the European Union is the most important question in relation to fair trade between affluent nations and poorer nations. I do not know whether we will be able to renegotiate the CAP during the negotiations on European enlargement. However, that is vital if we are to ensure fairness between the world's continents and nations.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We are pleased that you represented Wales at the summit. It was a credit to Wales, and it was an important summit. As you said, we are talking about schemes to ensure the survival of this planet, and efforts to remove any threat that it faces. Do you agree that there are three vital elements in terms of sustainable development? Transport, renewable energy and planning are important, and yet your Government has failed to develop sustainable policies in that regard. It has done nothing on transport. The Minister has called in every application for sustainable energy projects—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Your contribution is too long. The agreed procedure for statements is that the main speaker from each group is called, and there is then an opportunity for Members to ask succinct questions and receive succinct answers so that everyone can speak.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I only have half a sentence left.

**The Presiding Officer:** You have already had three sentences. A brief half sentence please.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio at gynllunio ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Penfro, lle mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwrthod cynllun unedol, sydd yn ceisio datblygu—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hyn i fod yn berthnasol i Johannesburg. Nid oes gan Lywodraeth Cymru awdurdod dros Johannesburg, ac nid yw Sir Benfro yn Johannesburg.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn derbyn y cyhuddiad ein bod wedi methu â dilyn egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy yn ein polisiau trafniadaeth, gwastraff a chynllunio. Bwriadwn sefydlu cynllun gofodol lleol dros Gymru.

**Lynne Neagle:** Thank you for your statement, Rhodri. Following on from John's earlier question, despite the progress that was made at the summit, it was disappointing that more progress was not made on the reform of global trade, and in particular, the agriculture market. Will you give the clearest possible indication to the Minister with responsibility for agriculture that this Labour-led Welsh Assembly Government will not tolerate inaction on the reform of common agricultural policy, and that this administration will be the strongest voice in the United Kingdom in calling for justice for the world's poor?

**The First Minister:** There are two issues to consider, which are timely in light of the summit meeting this weekend of the 15 heads of government in Copenhagen. The summit will discuss what progress can be made on the linked issues of CAP reform and the enlargement of the EU to include eastern Europe. It must also be conscious of obligations arising from the Doha summit on better access for third world trade into Europe, North America, Australia and other developed countries and preventing the dumping of subsidised agricultural produce, thereby disrupting the sometimes fragile agricultural markets of the third world. I assure you that Mike German and myself made clear, in preparation meetings yesterday for the Copenhagen summit this weekend,

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I was referring to planning in the Pembrokeshire Coast National Park, where the Government of Wales has rejected a unitary plan, which tries to develop—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is supposed to relate to Johannesburg. The Government of Wales has no authority over Johannesburg, and Pembrokeshire is not in Johannesburg.

**The First Minister:** I do not accept the accusation that we have failed in implementing the principles of sustainable development in our transport, waste, and planning policies. We intend to put in place a spatial plan on a local level throughout Wales.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Rhodri. Gan ddilyn ymlaen o gwestiwn cynharach John, er gwaetha'r cynnydd a wnaed yn yr uwchgynhadledd, yr oedd yn siomedig na wnaethpwyd rhagor o gynnydd ar ddiwygio masnach fyd-eang, a'r farchnad amaethyddol yn arbennig. A wnewch chi roi'r arwydd amlycaf posibl i'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros amaethyddiaeth na fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a arweinir gan Lafur, yn goddef diffyg gweithredu ar ddiwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin, ac mai'r weinyddiaeth hon fydd y llais cryfaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig a fydd yn galw am gyfiawnder i dlodion y byd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae dau fater i'w hystyried, sy'n amserol o gofio am uwchgynhadledd y 15 o benaethiaid llywodraeth yn Copenhagen y penwythnos hwn. Bydd yr uwchgynhadledd yn trafod pa gynnydd y gellir ei wneud ar y materion cysylltiedig sy'n ymwneud â diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin ac ehangu'r UE er mwyn cynnwys dwyrain Ewrop. Rhaid iddo hefyd fod yn ymwybodol o'r oblygiadau sy'n deillio o uwchgynhadledd Doha ar well mynediad ar gyfer masnach y trydydd byd i Ewrop, Gogledd America, Awstralia a gwledydd datblygedig eraill a rhwystro'r broses o ddymPIO cynnyrch amaethyddol a noddwyd gan bwrs y wlad, gan darfu ar farchnadoedd amaethyddol y trydydd byd, sydd weithiau'n fregus. Fe'ch sicrhaf fy mod

that those are our strongly held views. The CAP must be reformed to prevent the dumping of subsidised agricultural exports into third world countries.

**Mick Bates:** Congratulations, First Minister, on again putting Wales at the forefront of sustainable development. I was greatly heartened by your reference to the young people from Wales. Will you make a commitment to retain their enthusiasm by creating a youth sustainable development forum to run alongside other fora that we wish to see in Wales to ensure that we truly retain our position as a world leader on this?

3:30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I felt privileged to work with those 10 young people, who made their presence felt in the Johannesburg summit. I believe that they had life-changing experiences in meeting hundreds of young people from different backgrounds in different areas of Johannesburg. The children from Llanharry who accompanied me to the township of Ivory Park will certainly have had extraordinary, unforgettable experiences.

On your question about how we are going to continue to involve young people, such as those who accompanied me to Johannesburg—who all came from different educational backgrounds—and others with whom they will be in contact, as I mentioned, Jane Davidson is establishing an advisory panel on education for sustainable development. Your suggestion on establishing a youth forum on sustainable development could be tied to that or linked to Sue Essex's support for an independent Welsh sustainable development forum, which would come under our patronage. We need to do what you have suggested, Mick, and maintain the enthusiasm of those 10 young people so that they can enthuse hundreds of others.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i'r Prif Weinidog am ei

i a Mike German, mewn cyfarfodydd paratoi ddod ar gyfer uwchgynhadledd Copenhagen y penwythnos hwn, wedi egluro mai hon yw ein barn gref. Rhaid diwygio'r CAP er mwyn atal allforion amaethyddol sy'n derbyn cymhorthdal rhag cael eu gwaredu ar wledydd y trydydd byd.

**Mick Bates:** Llongyfarchiadau, Brif Weinidog, ar roi Cymru unwaith eto ar flaen y gad ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Fe'm calonogwyd yn fawr gan eich cyfeiriad at bobl ifanc o Gymru. A wnewch chi ymrwymiad i gynnal eu brwdfrydedd er mwyn creu fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy i ieuenctid a fydd yn rhedeg ochr yn ochr â fforymau eraill y dymunwn eu gweld yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cynnal ein safle fel arweinydd byd-eang ar hyn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oedd yn fraind cael gweithio â'r 10 o bobl ifanc hynny, y teimlwyd eu presenoldeb yn uwchgynhadledd Johannesburg. Credaf iddynt gael profiadau a fydd yn newid eu bywydau drwy gyfarfod â channoedd o bobl ifanc o gefndiroedd gwahanol mewn ardaloedd gwahanol yn Johannesburg. Bydd y plant o Lanhari a ymunodd â mi ar y daith i faestref Ivory Park yn sicr o fod wedi cael profiadau hynod a bythgofiadwy.

O ran eich cwestiwn ynghylch sut yr ydym yn mynd i barhau i gynnwys pobl ifanc, fel y rhai a ddaeth yn gwmmi i mi i Johannesburg—bob un ohonynt o gefndir addysgol gwahanol—ac eraill y byddant yn cysylltu â hwy, fel y soniais, mae Jane Davidson yn sefydlu panel ymgynghorol ar addysg ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Gellir cydblethu eich awgrym ar gyfer sefydlu fforwm ieuenctid ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy â hynny neu ei gysylltu â chefnogaeth Sue Essex ar gyfer fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy annibynnol yng Nghymru, a fyddai'n dod o dan ein nawdd ni. Mae angen inni wneud yr hyn a awgrymwyd gennych chi, Mick, a chynnal brwdfrydedd y 10 person ifanc hynny er mwyn iddynt drosglwyddo'r brwdfrydedd hwnnw i gannoedd o blant a phobl ifanc eraill.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the First

ddatganiad ac am ei arweiniad rhyngwladol, sy'n destun balchder inni oll.

Minister for his statement and for his international leadership, which is a source of pride to us all.

### **Datganiad ar Gefnogi Plant a Rhieni yng Nghymru Statement on Supporting Children and Parents in Wales**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** This statement is on supporting children and parents to find positive alternatives to physical punishment and I am pleased to be giving it during parents' week. The recent observations of the United Nations committee on the rights of the child concluded that current UK legislation does not comply with the principles of the UN convention. It recommended that corporal punishment in families and all other contexts should be prohibited in law. It concluded that action should be taken to promote non-violent forms of discipline and respect for children's rights to human dignity, including through public education programmes. I will write to John Denham expressing the Welsh Assembly Government's support for these views. The UN committee acknowledged the Assembly Government for endorsing the UN convention in its framework for children and young people.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r datganiad hwn yn ymwneud â chefnogi plant a rhieni i ddod o hyd i dulliau cadarnhaol o gosbi ar wahân i gosb gorfforol ac mae'n bleser gennyf wneud y datganiad hwn yn ystod yr wythnos i rieni. Daeth sylwadau diweddar pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn i'r casgliad nad yw deddfwriaeth gyfredol y DU yn cydymffurfio ag egwyddorion cytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig. Argymhellodd y dylid gwahardd cosb gorfforol ymhlith teuluoedd ac ym mhob cyd-destun arall o dan y gyfraith. Daeth i'r casgliad y dylid cymryd camau i hyrwyddo mathau di-drais o ddisgyblaeth a pharch tuag at hawliau plant i urddas, gan gynnwys rhaglenni addysg i'r cyhoedd. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at John Denham yn mynegi cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r safbwyntiau hyn. Rhoddodd pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig gydnabyddiaeth i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am gymeradwyo cytundeb y Cenhedloedd Unedig yn ei fframwaith ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc.

I also wish to look for ways in which we can build on our current actions within the scope of our devolved powers. Our approach needs to be based on supporting positive parenting, whatever the legal position is. The key is to support parents and others who care for children and to promote positive relationships in families. We must seek to change social attitudes so that physically punishing children is no longer considered acceptable in any context.

Yr wyf hefyd am inni edrych am ffyrdd o adeiladu ar ein camau presennol o fewn cwmpas ein pwerau datganoledig. Dylai ein hymagwedd fod yn seiliedig ar gefnogi rhianta cadarnhaol, beth bynnag fo'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol. Yr allwedd yw cefnogi rhieni ac eraill sy'n gofalu am blant a hyrwyddo perthynas gadarnhaol mewn teuluoedd. Rhaid inni geisio newid agweddau cymdeithasol fel na chaiff cosbi plant yn gorfforol bellach ei ystyried yn dderbyniol mewn unrhyw gyd-destun.

We all know that bringing up children can be highly demanding. We must ensure that parents and carers have the necessary information and advice on effective ways of addressing their children's behaviour. These should include positive alternatives to physical discipline.

Gŵyr pawb ohonom y gall magu plant fod yn waith caled iawn. Rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff rhieni a gofalwyr y wybodaeth a'r cyngor angenrheidiol ar ffyrdd effeithiol o fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad eu plant. Dylai'r rhain gynnwys dulliau cadarnhaol gwahanol i ddisgyblaeth gorfforol.

Our approach in Wales needs to build on the action that we are undertaking on this issue. Approving minimum standards for childminders means that physical punishment is now banned in every area of public care and all regulated children's services. It is also unlawful to inflict corporal punishment on pupils in maintained, non-maintained and nursery schools in Wales.

Many Sure Start schemes in Wales are supporting local parenting and advice initiatives. I wish to see widespread development of such programmes. The unified fund, Cymorth, that will incorporate Sure Start funding from next year, will receive over £21 million extra over the next three years to help achieve that. This is closely linked to our measures to tackle child poverty, to improve access to play and childcare provision and to widen parent participation in employment and lifelong learning. We need to build on this foundation and examine other policy areas through which this issue can be addressed, such as aspects of the personal and social education framework in schools that cover family and social relationships.

Physically punishing children also has wider general relevance in respect of violence in relationships. The Assembly's working group on domestic violence and violence against women has recommended widening the definition of domestic violence to include violence in relationships between parents and children. I am writing to the Home Office and to Ministers in the other devolved administrations in support of this change.

Many Members across all parties attended the workshop organised in the Assembly in July by 'Sdim Curo Plant!, the Children are Unbeatable! Cymru campaign. I hope that the campaign will continue its efforts to raise awareness on this issue and to promote a wide public debate on ways to reduce physical punishment. We heard Mali Nilsson speak of the experience in Sweden of introducing a ban into its parents' code, a

Rhaid i'n hymagwedd ni yng Nghymru adeiladu ar y camau a gymerwn ar y mater hwn. Mae cymeradwyo isafswm safonau ar gyfer gwarchodwyr plant yn golygu bod cosb gorfforol bellach wedi'i gwahardd ym mhob maes o ofal cyhoeddus a phob gwasanaeth i blant sydd wedi'i reoleiddio. Mae hefyd yn anghyfreithlon i ddefnyddio cosb gorfforol yn erbyn disgyblion mewn ysgolion a gynhelir, ysgolion nas cynhelir ac ysgolion meithrin yng Nghymru.

Mae nifer o gynlluniau Cychwyn Cadarn yng Nghymru yn cefnogi mentrau magu plant a mentrau rhoi cyngor lleol. Hoffwn weld rhaglenni o'r fath yn datblygu ar raddfa eang. Bydd y gronfa unedig, Cymorth, a fydd yn ariannu Cychwyn Cadarn o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen, yn derbyn dros £21 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros y tair blynedd nesaf er mwyn helpu i gyflawni hynny. Cysylltir hyn yn agos â'n mesurau i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ymhlith plant, gwella mynediad i ddarpariaeth chwarae a gofal plant ac ehangu cyfranogiad rhieni mewn cyflogaeth a dysgu gydol oes. Mae angen inni adeiladu ar y sylfaen hon ac ystyried meysydd polisi eraill y gellir eu defnyddio i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, megis agweddau ar y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol mewn ysgolion sy'n cwmpasu'r teulu a chydberthynas gymdeithasol.

Mae perthnasedd cyffredinol ehangach hefyd i gosbi plant yn gorfforol o ran trais mewn perthynas. Mae gweithgor y Cynulliad ar drais yn y cartref a thrais yn erbyn menywod wedi argymhell ehangu'r diffiniad o drais yn y cartref i gynnwys trais yn y berthynas rhwng rhieni a phlant. Yr wyf yn ysgrifennu at y Swyddfa Gartref ac at Weinidogion yn y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig i gefnogi'r newid hwn.

Mynychodd llawer o Aelodau o bob plaid y gweithdy a drefnwyd gan y Cynulliad ym mis Gorffennaf, sef ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant!. Gobeithio y bydd yr ymgyrch yn parhau â'i hymdrechion i godi ymwybyddiaeth ynghylch y mater hwn a hyrwyddo dadl gyhoeddus eang ar ffyrdd o leihau cosb gorfforol. Clywsom Mali Nilsson yn siarad am brofiad Sweden o gyflwyno gwaharddiad i'w chod ar gyfer rhieni, sef cod cyfraith sifil

civil law code governing family law. This was coupled with a universal and widespread information and advice campaign. Over the 20 years since the ban, no parent has been criminalised and the use of physical punishment has decreased dramatically. We can learn important lessons from the Swedish model to help us achieve the necessary changes in Wales. In this context, I am announcing today that the Assembly Government is developing a parents' code for Wales, working with Children in Wales and the National Family and Parenting Institute. The code, although not based in legislation, will provide guidance on a range of issues around positive parenting and family relationships.

One key way in which the Government can help to instigate social change is to set expectations which can then shape behaviour. Our code will also help in that way. It will provide advice and assistance and will embody a set of expectations about the way in which children are treated, contributing actively to the already-changing climate of opinion in Wales. To this end, we have provided £50,000 a year for a parenting support project jointly run by the institute and Children in Wales, which recruited a worker in June for a three-year period. The first materials contributing to the code will be produced in spring 2003. The project is developing a parenting forum, *fforwm magu plant*, consisting of statutory agencies including education, health and social services, voluntary organisations, parents' groups and youth offending teams. The forum will build a network of organisations, which will work together to ensure that parents can access advice and information individually and in groups when needed. The group will support the development and effective application of the parents' code and consider ways of providing direct advice and support by telephone.

The Welsh Assembly Government is tackling the issue through these steps. The experience of other countries shows that this is not a short-term matter. We need to begin by deciding that physical punishment is not an appropriate method for parents and carers to

sy'n rheoli cyfraith deuluol. Yr oedd hyn ynghyd ag ymgyrch gwybodaeth a chyngor gyffredinol ac eang. Yn yr 20 mlynedd ers y gwaharddiad, nid erlynwyd unrhyw riant ac mae'r defnydd o gosb gorfforol wedi gostwng yn sylweddol. Gallwn ddysgu gwersi pwysig o fodel Sweden i'n helpu i gyflawni'r newidiadau angenrheidiol yng Nghymru. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, cyhoeddaf heddiw fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn datblygu cod rhieni ar gyfer Cymru, gan weithio gyda Plant yng Nghymru a'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Deuluoedd a Magu Plant. Bydd y cod, er na fydd yn ddeddfwriaeth, yn rhoi arweiniad ar ystod o faterion yn ymwneud â rhianta cadarnhaol a pherthynas o fewn teuluoedd.

Un ffordd allweddol y gall y Llywodraeth helpu i ysgogi newid cymdeithasol yw gosod disgwyliadau a all ddylanwadu ar ymddygiad. Bydd ein cod hefyd yn helpu i'r perwyl hwnnw. Bydd yn darparu cyngor a chymorth ac yn cynnwys set o ddisgwyliadau ynghylch y ffordd y dylai plant gael eu trin, gan gyfrannu at yr hinsawdd o farn sydd eisoes yn newid yng Nghymru. I'r perwyl hwn, yr ydym wedi darparu £50,000 y flwyddyn ar gyfer prosiect cefnogi magu plant a fydd yn cael ei gynnal ar y cyd gan y sefydliad a Plant yng Nghymru, sydd wedi recriwtio gweithiwr ym mis Mehefin am dair blynedd. Caiff y deunyddiau cyntaf sy'n cyfrannu at y cod eu cynhyrchu yng ngwanwyn 2003. Mae'r prosiect yn datblygu fforwm magu plant sy'n cynnwys asiantaethau statudol gan gynnwys addysg, iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, sefydliadau gwirfoddol, grwpiau rhieni a thimau troseddu ieuencid. Bydd y fforwm yn datblygu rhwydwaith o sefydliadau, a fydd yn cydweithio i sicrhau y gall rhieni gael gafael ar gyngor a gwybodaeth yn unigol ac mewn grwpiau pan fydd eu hangen arnynt. Bydd y grŵp yn cefnogi'r gwaith o ddatblygu a chymhwyso'r cod ar gyfer rhieni yn effeithiol ac yn ystyried ffyrdd o ddarparu cyngor a chymorth uniongyrchol dros y ffôn.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater drwy'r camau hyn. Dengys profiad gwledydd eraill nad mater byr dymor yw hwn. Mae angen inni ddechrau drwy benderfynu nad yw cosb gorfforol yn ddull priodol i rieni a gofalwyr ei fabwysiadu yn eu

adopt in their relationships with children. We accepted long ago that physically punishing adults is inappropriate. Those standards should be applied to our children. This is an essential start to the process of debate and practical action that can lead to changes in thinking, attitude and behaviour regarding how we bring up our children in Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Mater sy'n ymwneud â chefnogi plant a rhieni yw hwn gan fod magu plant yn sialens sylweddol. Mae nifer o fudiadau yn y byd Cristnogol a thu hwnt sy'n cefnogi rhieni ac yn rhoi cymorth iddynt gyda'u dyletswyddau anodd. Maent hefyd yn hybu datblygu'r sgiliau sydd eu hangen i ymdopi â magu plant. O gofio'r pwysau aruthrol sydd ar rieni yn aml, pa fesurau ychwanegol a geir i helpu rhieni ddatblygu sgiliau rheoli plant?

O gofio sylwadau'r Cenhedloedd Unedig ar sut yr ydym yn trin plant yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar y pwysau y bydd yn ei roi ar Lywodraeth San Steffan ar y pwynt hwn?

Beth yw rôl y Cynulliad wrth gefnogi penderfyniadau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn dilyn y datganiad hwn? Dylem gryfhau rôl y comisiynydd neu, o leiaf, beidio â thanseilio ei rôl mewn materion megis codi ysgolion ar hen domenni ysbwriel.

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn, ond yn holi am fanylion ar y ffordd ymlaen.

**Jane Hutt:** I am glad that you welcome the statement, Dai. Thirty-three Members from all parties signed up to the Children are Unbeatable! campaign. There is widespread support for the direction that we are taking—based on the important issue of positive parenting—within our devolved powers. I mentioned the importance of Sure Start and the interesting developments across Wales. The Sure Start programme in Gwynedd piloted the incredible years parenting programme, which is already proving successful. That programme aims to improve relationships and sets up support groups to help people. With the additional £21 million for Sure Start programmes, we will see the benefits of that investment across Wales, but

perthynas â phlant. Derbyniasom ers peth amser fod cosbi oedolion yn gorfforol yn amhriodol. Dylid cymhwyso'r safonau hynny i'n plant. Mae hyn yn ddechrau hollbwysig i'r ddadl ac i gamau ymarferol a all arwain at newid agwedd ac ymddygiad ynghylch sut yr ydym yn magu ein plant yng Nghymru.

**David Lloyd:** I welcome the Minister's statement. This issue involves supporting children and parents as parenting is a considerable challenge. Many Christian and non-Christian organisations support and help parents with their difficult duties. They also promote the development of the skills needed to cope with parenting. Given the enormous pressure that parents often face, what additional measures are in place to help parents to develop child management skills?

Bearing in mind the United Nations' comments on how children are treated in the UK, will the Minister expand upon what pressure she will bring to bear on the Westminster Government on this point?

What is the Assembly's role in supporting the decisions of the Children's Commissioner for Wales following this statement? We should strengthen the commissioner's role or, at least, not undermine his role in matters such as building schools on former rubbish tips.

We welcome this statement, but ask for details on the way forward.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn croesawu'r datganiad, Dai. Dangosodd 33 o Aelodau o bob plaid eu cefnogaeth i'r ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant!. Mae cryn gefnogaeth i'r camau yr ydym yn eu cymryd—yn seiliedig ar y mater pwysig o rianta cadarnhaol—o fewn ein pwerau datganoledig. Soniais am bwysigrwydd Cychwyn Cadarn a'r datblygiadau diddorol ledled Cymru. Cynhaliodd Cychwyn Cadarn Gwynedd beilot rhaglen y blynyddoedd anhygoel, sydd eisoes yn llwyddiant. Nod y rhaglen honno yw gwella cydberthynas a sefydlu grwpiau cefnogi i helpu pobl. Gyda'r £21 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer rhaglenni Cychwyn Cadarn, byddwn yn gweld manteision y buddsoddiad hwnnw ledled

that work must be on the ground. The Welsh Assembly Government aims to provide support through resources as well as through the commitment contained in today's statement. We provide support via publications, through the parenting forum, Children in Wales, working with the National Family and Parenting Institute and the new forum that comprises a range of professionals engaged daily with children and parents at the sharp end. That will all contribute towards realising those changes. We are embarking upon a process of public education, understanding and awareness.

3:40 p.m.

In the draft budget, we have increased the funding for the office of the Children's Commissioner for Wales by another £500,000 million, which will help support that important role. His office has supported our approach towards the Children are Unbeatable! campaign, and the aims of positive parenting. I will make representations to the UK Government Minister about these issues based on the findings of the meeting of the United Nations committee on the rights of the child on 4 October. It clearly set out its remit in terms of the UN convention on the rights of the child, which the Assembly has already embraced and endorsed. That has also been shared with my colleagues in other devolved administrations.

**Christine Chapman:** I welcome this statement. You know my position and that of the Children are Unbeatable! alliance in that we are in favour of legal reform to give children equality in law and to ban physical punishment. I am also pleased that, since I initiated my short debate in January, much discussion has focused on this important issue. Do you agree that the Assembly should be seen to be leading the debate rather than merely following popular opinion? We know that there will be a debate on the recent UN report in Westminster tomorrow and MPs will follow the Assembly's views with interest.

This campaign must not be about demonising

Cymru, ond rhaid i'r gwaith hwnnw gael ei wneud ar lawr gwlad. Nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw darparu cymorth drwy adnoddau yn ogystal â thrwy'r ymrwymiad a gynhwysir yn y datganiad heddiw. Darparwn gymorth drwy gyhoeddiadau, y fforwm magu plant, Plant yng Nghymru, drwy weithio gyda'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Deuluoedd a Magu Plant a'r fforwm newydd sy'n cynnwys ystod o weithwyr proffesiynol sy'n ymwneud yn ddyddiol â phlant a rhieni, a hynny'n uniongyrchol. Bydd hynny oll yn cyfrannu tuag at wireddu'r newidiadau hynny. Yr ydym yn dechrau ar broses o addysg, dealltwriaeth ac ymwybyddiaeth gyhoeddus.

Yn y gyllideb ddrafft, yr ydym wedi ychwanegu £500,000 miliwn arall at gyllid swyddfa Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Bydd hynny'n helpu i gefnogi'r rôl bwysig honno. Mae ei swyddfa wedi cefnogi ein hymagwedd tuag at yr ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant!', ac amcanion rhianta cadarnhaol. Gwnaf sylwadau i Weinidog Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y materion hyn sy'n seiliedig ar ganfyddiadau cyfarfod pwyllgor y Cenedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn ar 4 Hydref. Noda'n glir ei gylch gwaith mewn perthynas â chytundeb y Cenedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn, y mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi'i dderbyn a'i gymeradwyo. Rhannwyd hynny hefyd â'm cydweithwyr mewn gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Gwyddoch fy safbwynt i a safbwynt y gynghrair 'Sdim Curo Plant!', sef ein bod o blaid diwygio'r gyfraith i roi cydraddoldeb i blant o ran y gyfraith ac i wahardd cosb gorfforol. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch, ers fy nadl fer ym mis Ionawr, i lawer o'r drafodaeth ganolbwyntio ar y mater pwysig hwn. A gytunwch y dylai'r Cynulliad gael ei weld fel corff sy'n arwain y ddadl yn hytrach na dim ond dilyn y farn gyhoeddus? Gwyddom y bydd dadl ar adroddiad diweddar y Cenedloedd Unedig yn San Steffan yfory a bydd Aelodau Seneddol yn dilyn safbwyntiau'r Cynulliad gyda diddordeb.

Nid gwneud i rieni edrych yn wael yw



parents, but supporting them to adopt better, more positive ways of dealing with their children. We should also acknowledge that much is to be learned from other countries that have already banned the physical punishment of children.

I welcome the fact that the UN report congratulated the Assembly for adopting regulations prohibiting corporal punishment in all forms of day care, including childminding. Will you give assurances that the Assembly will continue to prioritise this issue, perhaps considering more evidence-based research as well as children's perspectives?

**Jane Hutt:** We must pay tribute to Christine for raising this issue in the short debate, and to the Children are Unbeatable! Cymru alliance. Work has been undertaken across all parties—with professionals, parents, and children and young people.

I hope that, as a result of this statement and the responses from Members, the Assembly can be seen to be leading the debate—and it is a debate. This is the start of a process of discussion and public education. My commitment to developing a parents' code clearly shows the will of the Assembly Government, which I hope is backed by all Members. We aim to follow the guidance and recognise good practice in other countries.

Sweden has had its parents' code for over 20 years, yet no criminal action has been taken against any parent during that time. Its emphasis is on engaging, educating and supporting parents, children and young people. We have much to learn from other countries, but Sweden's parents' code has shown us the way. We are using our powers, but my statement today is a more distinctive development. With our limited powers in Wales, we have already taken measures acknowledged by the UN committee on the rights of the child. In developing this parenting code in partnership with parents, children and young people, we will take another step forward.

**David Melding:** Minister, I ask you to

pwrpas yr ymgyrch hon, ond eu cefnogi i fabwysiadu ffyrdd gwell, mwy cadarnhaol o ymdrin â'u plant. Dylem hefyd gydnabod bod llawer i'w ddysgu o wledydd eraill sydd eisoes wedi gwahardd cosbi plant yn gorfforol.

Croesawaf y ffaith i adroddiad y Cenhedloedd Unedig longyfarch y Cynulliad am fabwysiadu rheoliadau yn gwahardd cosb gorfforol mewn pob math o ofal dydd, yn cynnwys gwarchod plant. A roddwch sicrwydd y bydd y Cynulliad yn parhau i roi blaenoriaeth i'r mater hwn, gan ystyried o bosibl mwy o ymchwil yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth yn ogystal â safbwyntiau plant?

**Jane Hutt:** Rhaid inni dalu teyrnged i Christine am godi'r mater hwn yn y ddadl fer, ac i gynghrair 'Sdim Curo Plant! Gwnaethpwyd gwaith ar draws pob plaid—gyda phobl broffesiynol, rhieni, a phlant a phobl ifanc.

Gobeithiaf, o ganlyniad i'r datganiad hwn a'r ymatebion gan yr Aelodau, y caiff y Cynulliad ei weld fel corff sy'n arwain y ddadl—ac mae yn ddadl. Dyma ddechrau proses drafod ac addysg gyhoeddus. Mae fy ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cod ar gyfer rhieni yn dangos yn glir ewyllys Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sydd gobeithio yn cael cefnogaeth pob Aelod. Ein nod yw dilyn yr arweiniad a chydnabod arfer da mewn gwledydd eraill.

Mae gan Sweden god ar gyfer rhieni ers dros 20 mlynedd, ond ni ddygwyd achos troseddol yn erbyn unrhyw riant yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Mae ei bwyslais ar gynnwys, addysgu a chefnogi rhieni, plant a phobl ifanc. Mae gennym lawer i'w ddysgu o wledydd eraill, ond mae cod Sweden ar gyfer rhieni wedi dangos y ffordd inni. Yr ydym yn defnyddio ein pwerau, ond mae fy natganiad i heddiw yn ddatblygiad mwy penodol. Gyda'n pwerau cyfyngedig yng Nghymru, yr ydym eisoes wedi cymryd camau a gydnabuwyd gan bwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn. Wrth ddatblygu'r cod hwn ar gyfer rheini mewn partneriaeth â rhieni, plant a phobl ifanc, cymerwn gam arall ymlaen.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi

respond to the official Conservative Party position on this matter. First, support for parents is fundamental, and I was pleased to hear you emphasise that in your statement. Nurturing children is a precious undertaking—perhaps the greatest task of people’s lives. Those of us with no parental responsibilities must be reticent in telling others how they should bring up their children. Children need appropriate discipline so that they can develop and use their talents fully. If they are not given that order in their lives, it has a detrimental effect when they become adolescents and young adults.

Secondly, the Conservative Party is not convinced that mild chastisement should be a matter for the law. I note your comments on Sweden, that it has been unlawful to smack children there for the last 20 years, but that that law has never been invoked. Why legislate if, when it comes to prosecutions, it is a dead letter law?

Thirdly, the Assembly should concentrate on areas under its control. The Assembly does not have direct responsibility for these matters, though it may express its opinion and feed that into Parliament if the issue is discussed there.

On a personal note, many people may know—if they take an interest in the subject—that I attended the Children are Unbeatable! meeting and signed its petition. I believe that it is not right that the law distinguishes between assaults on adults and those on children. It is also something of a contradiction to say that chastisement is mild—it is often referred to as ‘a tap’—but necessary. If it is so mild, alternative methods should be just as efficacious.

Beyond the zone of mild chastisement, we know that physical abuse can escalate and can become severe. Cases have recently been heard in the courts—which thankfully now tend to be dismissed—of parent or guardians using the defence of reasonable chastisement when children have been beaten black and blue with implements. That is completely unacceptable. If the British Government were to make smacking unlawful, it would send a signal to those who might use more

ymateb i safbwynt swyddogol y Blaid Geidwadol ar y mater hwn. Yn gyntaf, mae cefnogaeth i rieni yn hollbwysig, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o’ch clywed yn pwysleisio hynny yn eich datganiad. Mae magu plant yn gyfrifoldeb gwerthfawr—y dasg fwyaf o bosibl ym mywydau pobl. Dylai’r rheini ohonom sydd heb gyfrifoldebau magu plant fod yn dawedog o ran dweud wrth eraill sut y dylent fagu eu plant. Mae angen disgyblaeth briodol ar blant er mwyn iddynt allu datblygu a defnyddio eu doniau yn llawn. Os na roddir y drefn honno iddynt yn eu bywydau, caiff effaith andwyol pan ddeuant i lasoed neu’n oedolion ifanc.

Yn ail, nid yw’r Blaid Geidwadol yn argyhoeddedig y dylai cosbedigaeth ysgafn fod yn fater i’r gyfraith. Nodaf eich sylwadau ar Sweden, sef iddi fod yn anghyfreithlon i daro plant yno am yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf, ond ni chafodd y gyfraith honno erioed ei galw i rym. Pam deddfu os nad oes grym i’r gyfraith hon pan ddaw i erlyn rhywun?

Yn drydydd, dylai’r Cynulliad ganolbwyntio ar feysydd o dan ei reolaeth. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros y materion hyn, er y gall fynegi ei farn a bwydo’r farn honno i’r Senedd os trafodir y mater yno.

Ar nodyn personol, efallai fod llawer o bobl yn gwybod—os oes ganddynt ddiddordeb yn y pwnc—imi fynychu’r cyfarfod ‘Sdim Curo Plant! a llofnodi’r ddeiseb. Ni chredaf ei bod yn gywir i’r gyfraith wahaniaethu rhwng ymosodiadau ar oedolion a’r rhai ar blant. Mae dweud bod cosbedigaeth—y cyfeirir ati’n aml fel ‘tap’—yn ysgafn ond yn angenrheidiol yn groesddweud. Os yw mor ysgafn, dylai dulliau amgen fod yr un mor effeithiol.

Y tu hwnt i ffiniau cosbedigaeth ysgafn, gwyddom y gall cam-drin corfforol waethygu a mynd yn ddifrifol. Clywyd achosion mewn llysoedd yn ddiweddar—sydd erbyn hyn yn tueddu i gael eu diystyru, diolch i’r drefn—o rieni neu warcheidwaid yn defnyddio’r amddiffyniad o gosbedigaeth resymol pan fydd plant wedi’u curo’n ddu las gydag offer. Mae hynny’n gwbl annerbyniol. Pe bai Llywodraeth Prydain yn gwneud taro yn anghyfreithlon, byddai’n anfon neges i’r

aggressive forms of violence that it will not be condoned. We banned corporal punishment in prisons many years ago, and it was abolished in schools in 1986, which is progressive. Public opinion may well move quickly on this issue.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for that considered response, David. I appreciate that you gave the official Conservative Party line, as well as your personal views. As you said, being a parent is the greatest task of our lives, and to understand that role is one of the main aims of this statement. We hope, in developing this parents' code, to learn how to be good parents. All Members who are parents will know that some skills can be learned, which is why advice and guidance is so important, particularly during pressurised times bringing up children.

The code recognises that using violence and smacking children and young people is not the best way of teaching them to behave well. They are more likely to learn that violence is an acceptable way of getting what you want, which is not true. We want to find the best way of instilling respect for adults and acceptance of values. There are many non-physical ways to encourage or to punish children. We must develop that understanding. We must start with young people. Many young parents benefit from the Sure Start schemes, which were developed with highly skilled professionals—child psychologists, who work at the sharp end, know how we can learn parenting skills and how to ensure that we develop our children in terms of their behaviour and instil our values in them. You put your personal position clearly. As you said, what is mild chastisement? It is difficult to define. Our view is that if we start by saying that it is unacceptable but work with people, communities, parents and children to find ways of supporting them in raising children and in their understanding of managing behaviour, we will hopefully see that change in behaviour. It is already coming through. The fact that we have such good cross-party support for that approach demonstrates that. Thank you for your personal commitment, David, because that is reflected carefully and

rheini a fyddai o bosibl yn defnyddio dulliau mwy treisgar na chaiff hynny ei oddef. Gwaharddwyd cosb gorfforol mewn carchardai flynyddoedd yn ôl ac fe'i diddymwyd mewn ysgolion yn 1986, sy'n gam ymlaen. Mae'n bosibl iawn y bydd y farn gyhoeddus yn symud yn gyflym ar y mater hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb ystyrion hwnnw, David. Gwerthfawrogaf ichi roi safbwynt swyddogol y Blaid Geidwadol, yn ogystal â'ch barn bersonol. Fel y dywedaso, bod yn rhiant yw tasg fwyaf ein bywydau, a deall y rôl honno yw un o brif amcanion y datganiad hwn. Y gobaith, wrth ddatblygu'r cod hwn i rieni, yw dysgu sut i fod yn rhieni da. Bydd pob Aelod sy'n rhieni yn gwybod y gellir dysgu rhai sgiliau, a dyna pam bod cyngor ac arweiniad mor bwysig, yn arbennig yn ystod cyfnodau pan fo rhywun o dan bwysau wrth fagu plant.

Mae'r cod yn cydnabod nad defnyddio trais a tharo plant a phobl ifanc yw'r ffordd orau i'w dysgu i ymddwyn yn dda. Maent yn fwy tebygol o ddysgu bod trais yn ffordd dderbyniol o gael eu ffordd eu hunain, rhywbeth nad yw'n wir. Yr ydym am ddod o hyd i'r ffyrdd gorau o ennyn parch tuag at oedolion a derbyn gwerthoedd. Mae sawl ffordd anghorfforol o annog neu gosbi plant. Rhaid inni ddatblygu'r ddealltwriaeth honno. Rhaid inni ddechrau gyda phobl ifanc. Mae llawer o rieni ifanc yn elwa ar gynlluniau Cychwyn Cadarn, a ddatblygwyd gyda phobl broffesiynol sy'n meddu ar uwch sgiliau—seicolegwyr plant, sy'n gweithio yn y maes, sy'n gwybod sut y gallwn ddysgu sgiliau magu plant a sut i sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu ein plant o ran eu hymddygiad a meithrin ein gwerthoedd ynddynt. Yr ydych yn mynegi eich safbwynt personol yn glir. Fel y dywedaso, beth yw cosbedigaeth ysgafn? Mae'n anodd ei diffinio. Ein barn ni yw os dechreuwn drwy ddweud ei bod yn annerbyniol ond gweithio gyda phobl, cymunedau, rhieni a phlant i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o'u cefnogi wrth fagu plant ac yn eu dealltwriaeth o reoli ymddygiad, gobeithio y gwelwn y newid hwnnw mewn ymddygiad. Mae eisoes yn dechrau dod i'r amlwg. Mae'r ffaith bod gennym gymaint o gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol dda i'r ymagwedd honno yn dangos hynny. Diolch ichi am eich

clearly in your points; we also acknowledge the Conservative Party's position.

3:50 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** I welcome the Minister's statement on developing a parents' code in Wales. The physical punishment of children is wrong. It is not even an effective way of modifying children's behaviour. However, as we have heard, parenting is an incredibly difficult job. Sleep deprivation, combined with a child's uncanny knack for knowing exactly what will wind you up, takes even the most calm and unstressed parents close to the edge. If anyone knows how to stop a 13-month-old child from biting everybody, I would be glad to hear from them. However, from my experience over the last year, I believe that we need practical ways of supporting individuals and giving information to parents about what they can do to address their children's bad behaviour and to apply the boundaries that children need to feel secure, nurtured and loved. Children need to realise how they must interact in the world.

It was a great surprise to me that although I was given much information when my daughter was born—from how to speak Welsh with my child to what to feed her—there was no information about how to cope with her behaviour. The time when your nice, cute, little baby turns into a terrible toddler is the very time when you have less interaction with healthcare professionals. Instead of getting your usual monthly visit from the health visitor, you are told that he or she does not need to see you for another year. The time when you need to begin to address these childcare issues is the very time when your contact with healthcare professionals and health visitors, who are key, seems to come to an end.

Many of our initiatives tend to target young parents and those who live in deprived areas. That demonstrates a negative attitude toward the ability of young people and those who live in deprived circumstances to be parents. Physical punishment does not acknowledge

ymrwymiad personol, David, oherwydd adlewyrchir hynny'n ofalus ac yn glir yn eich pwyntiau; yr ydym hefyd yn cydnabod safbwynt y Blaid Geidwadol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog ar ddatblygu cod ar gyfer rhieni yng Nghymru. Mae cosbi plant yn gorfforol yn gamwedd. Nid yw hyd yn oed yn ffordd effeithiol o gymedroli ymddygiad plant. Fodd bynnag, fel y clywsom, mae magu plant yn waith anodd tu hwnt. Mae diffyg cwsg, ynghyd â dawn gynhenid plentyn o wybod yn union beth fydd yn eich cynhyrfu, yn gwthio hyd yn oed y rhieni mwyaf digynnwrf a hamddenol i ymyl y dibyn. Os oes unrhyw un yn gwybod sut i atal plentyn 13 mis oed rhag brathu pawb, byddwn yn falch o'ch cyngor. Fodd bynnag, o'm profiad i dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, credaf fod angen ffyrdd ymarferol o gefnogi unigolion a rhoi gwybodaeth i rieni ynghylch yr hyn y gallant ei wneud i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad drwg eu plant ac i osod y ffiniau sydd eu hangen ar blant er mwyn teimlo'n ddiogel a theimlo eu bod yn cael eu magu a'u caru. Mae angen i blant sylweddoli sut y mae'n rhaid iddynt ryngweithio yn y byd.

Yr oedd yn syndod mawr i mi er imi gael llawer o wybodaeth pan aned fy merch—o sut i siarad Cymraeg â'm plentyn i beth i'w rhoi iddi i'w fwyta—nad oedd unrhyw wybodaeth am sut i ymdopi â'i hymddygiad. Yr adeg pan fydd eich baban bach hyfryd, pert yn troi'n blentyn bach drygionus yw'r union adeg pan gewch lai o gyswllt â gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol. Yn hytrach na chael eich ymweliad misol arferol gan yr ymwelydd iechyd, dywedir wrthyhch nad oes angen iddo ef neu hi eich gweld am flwyddyn arall. Yr adeg pan fydd angen ichi ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r materion gofal plant hyn yw'r union adeg pan ymddengys fod eich cyswllt â gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol ac ymwelwyr iechyd, sy'n allweddol, yn dod i ben.

Mae llawer o'n mentrau yn tueddu i dargedu rhieni ifanc a'r rheini sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Mae hynny'n dangos agwedd negyddol tuag at allu pobl ifanc a'r rheini sy'n byw mewn amgylchiadau difreintiedig i fod yn rhieni. Mae cosb

economic divides. You are as likely to find children from privileged backgrounds being hit, as you are children from reduced circumstances. We need to consider a universal way of supporting parents, rather than relying on targeting specific groups. Parenting is difficult, no matter what your profession or economic status, and you need support to do it.

Finally, Minister, how will you address your concerns to your London colleagues—beginning with the Minister of State for Community, Jacqui Smith? She is misguided on this subject. Do you agree that Government initiatives to support parents and discourage them from physically punishing their children are undermined by any such defence of reasonable chastisement? The Westminster Government is sending mixed messages and we will only get to the root of the problem when that defence of reasonable chastisement is removed. We need to outlaw the smacking of children.

**Jane Hutt:** This parents' code is universal. It is for all parents in Wales and they should all be engaged in discussions on its development. We must also recognise that we should focus our resources and attention on the parents that need the most support—from young parents, including teenage parents, to parents who may not have job opportunities or other opportunities in their lives. Focusing on populations and communities with particular needs is important, but we must also remember that our children and young people's framework is applicable to children and young people of all ages and of all communities. Everyone will benefit from the extra funding in our childcare strategy, and the play policy, of which I spoke yesterday, is important for all children and parents in Wales. We will take a universal approach. Your point is important, but we must also target our resources effectively across Wales. It is about opening up opportunities for parents as well as children, as, often, pressure on parents is caused by a lack of opportunity. As I have said, I have written to John Denham on widening the definition of domestic violence, which is an important dimension of our joint work, and I will also

gorfforol yn digwydd ym mhob dosbarth cymdeithasol. Yr ydych yr un mor debygol o ganfod plant o gefndiroedd breintiedig yn cael eu taro â phlant o gefndiroedd llai breintiedig. Mae angen inni ystyried ffordd gyffredinol o gefnogi rhieni, yn hytrach na dibynnu ar dargedu grwpiau penodol. Mae magu plant yn anodd, waeth beth yw eich proffesiwn neu'ch statws economaidd, ac mae angen cefnogaeth arnoch i wneud hynny.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, sut y byddwch yn cyfleu eich pryderon i'ch cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain—gan ddechrau gyda'r Gweinidog Gwladol dros Gymunedau, Jacqui Smith? Mae hi wedi'i chamarwain ar y pwnc hwn. A gytnwch fod mentrau gan y Llywodraeth i gefnogi rhieni a'u hannog rhag cosbi eu plant yn gorfforol yn cael eu tanseilio gan unrhyw amddiffyniad o'r fath o gosbedigaeth resymol? Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn anfon negeseuon dryslyd. Dim ond pan roddir y gorau i amddiffyn cosbedigaeth resymol y byddwn yn dod at wraidd y broblem. Mae angen inni wneud taro plant yn anghyfreithlon.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cod hwn ar gyfer rhieni yn un cyffredinol. Mae ar gyfer pob rhiant yng Nghymru a dylent oll gymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau ar ei ddatblygiad. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod y dylem ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau a hoelio ein sylw ar y rhieni sydd angen y gefnogaeth fwyaf—o rieni ifanc, gan gynnwys rhieni yn eu harddegau, i rieni nad oes ganddynt gyfleoedd swyddi neu gyfleoedd eraill yn eu bywydau. Mae canolbwyntio ar boblogaethau a chymunedau ag anghenion penodol yn bwysig, ond rhaid inni gofio hefyd bod ein fframwaith ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc yn berthnasol i blant a phobl ifanc o bob oed ac o bob cymuned. Bydd pawb yn elwa ar yr arian ychwanegol yn ein strategaeth gofal plant, ac mae'r polisi chwarae, y soniais amdano ddoe, yn bwysig i bob plentyn a phob rhiant yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn cymryd ymagwedd gyffredinol. Mae eich pwynt yn bwysig, ond rhaid inni hefyd dargedu ein hadnoddau yn effeithiol ledled Cymru. Mae'n golygu cyflwyno cyfleoedd i rieni yn ogystal â phlant, oherwydd, yn aml, achosir pwysau ar rieni oherwydd diffyg cyfleoedd. Fel y dywedais, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at John Denham ar ehangu'r diffiniad o drais yn y cartref, sy'n

write to him following the meeting of the United Nations committee on the rights of the child. It is also important that Members of Parliament, across the parties, have also signed up to the Children are Unbeatable! campaign, which they will discuss tomorrow in a Westminster Hall debate. A strong change of opinion is developing across the board and I am sure that this will be reflected in Westminster discussions.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have less than five minutes and, therefore, I plead for brief questions—and answers if possible, Minister.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Thank you, Minister, for this welcome statement. I endorse much of what has been said and ask you to consider the possibility of holding an Assembly debate on these issues. I welcome your words on the Government of Wales's approach and what you are doing in relation to the UK Government, but I believe that your hand would be greatly strengthened if you had an Assembly resolution behind you. Therefore, as the code of practice for parents is developed, will you give us an opportunity to debate it?

**Jane Hutt:** I am sure that we will take that into account.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Have you had discussions with your colleague, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, about the role that education can play in making young people aware of the benefits of having children later in life? I know that there are some not-so-young parents in the Chamber who have had a culture shock, but it must be doubly hard when you become a parent in your teenage years, as you said, Minister.

**Jane Hutt:** The personal and social education framework is the most appropriate policy arena in which to consider that point, and I shall discuss it with Jane Davidson.

**Gareth Jones:** Wedi'r holl sôn am asiantaethau, a chymorth i rieni a phlant yn enwedig, a ydych yn cytuno mai'r ffordd orau ymlaen fyddai grymuso grym statudol y comisiynydd plant fel y gall gyflawni ei

ddimensiwn pwysig i'n gwaith ar y cyd, a byddaf hefyd yn ysgrifennu ato yn dilyn cyfarfod o bwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod Aelodau Seneddol, o bob plaid, wedi ymuno â'r ymgyrch 'Sdim Curo Plant!, y byddant yn ei thrafod yfory mewn dadl yn Neuadd San Steffan. Mae newid barn mawr yn datblygu yn gyffredinol ac yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff hyn ei adlewyrchu yn y trafodaethau yn San Steffan.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae gennym lai na phum munud ac, felly, erfyniaf am gwestiynau byr—ac atebion byr os yn bosibl, Weinidog.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch, Weinidog, am y datganiad hwn sydd i'w groesawu. Cefnogaf lawer o'r hyn a ddywedwyd a gofynnaf ichi ystyried y posibilrwydd o gynnal dadl yn y Cynulliad ar y materion hyn. Croesawaf eich geiriau ar ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cymru a'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud mewn perthynas â Llywodraeth y DU, ond credaf y byddai eich sefyllfa'n llawer cryfach pe bai gennych benderfyniad y Cynulliad y tu ôl ichi. Felly, wrth i'r cod ymarfer ar gyfer rhieni gael ei ddatblygu, a roddwch gyfle inni gynnal dadl arno?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn ystyried hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ydych wedi cael trafodaethau â'ch cyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, am y rôl y gall addysg ei chwarae wrth wneud pobl ifanc yn ymwybodol o fanteision cael plant yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd? Gwn fod rhai rhieni nad ydynt mor ifanc â hynny yn y Siambr sydd wedi cael sioc, ond mae'n siŵr ei bod ddwywaith gwaeth os byddwch yn dod yn rhiant yn eich arddegau, fel y dywedaso, Weinidog.

**Jane Hutt:** Y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol yw'r arena polisi mwyaf priodol i ystyried y pwynt hwnnw, a byddaf yn ei drafod â Jane Davidson.

**Gareth Jones:** Following all the talk of agencies, and assisting parents and children in particular, do you agree that the best way forward would be to strengthen the children's commissioner's statutory powers so that he

waith, sydd yn berthanasol i'r maes o dan sylw heddiw, yn well?

**Jane Hutt:** As I said in my earlier response to Dai Lloyd's point, we are increasing the children's commissioner's budget. We have secured vital primary legislation to ensure that the children's commissioner has powers relating not just to devolved functions but also to non-devolved functions. That was a tremendous achievement and the UN committee on the rights of the child has recognised that having a children's commissioner puts us in the forefront in the UK. I meet with the commissioner regularly, his office is doing good work, and we are constantly searching for ways to learn from and extend that work.

**John Griffiths:** Congratulations on moving this important agenda forward. The UN committee has highlighted the need to make progress in the UK. Wales is making more progress than elsewhere in the UK, and I welcome that. Will you monitor the progress and effects of the code? As you say, political leadership is vital, and we must send the right messages. If we could monitor the code's progress, we might be in a better position to judge whether or not a legal ban is necessary in future to send the clear message that hitting children is unacceptable.

**Jane Hutt:** We are developing a parenting forum, *fforwm magu plant*, which includes a range of organisations. It will take this work forward and develop the code. I am sure that we will return to this subject in the Assembly and I will monitor its progress. As the issue is about public education, attitude and awareness, I believe that it will be the subject of wide public debate.

**Gwenda Thomas:** On the wider aspect of parenting, particularly regarding children in need and children in care, do you agree that the Waterhouse recommendation that refers to the corporate parenting role of local authority members should be uniformly and consistently implemented among all local authorities in Wales and that there should be

can carry out his duties, which are relevant to this area, more effectively?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb cynharach i bwynt Dai Lloyd, yr ydym yn cynyddu cyllideb y comisiynydd plant. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau deddfwriaeth sylfaenol hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod gan y comisiynydd plant bwerau sy'n ymwneud nid yn unig â swyddogaethau datganoledig ond hefyd â swyddogaethau sydd heb eu datganoli. Yr oedd hynny yn gamp aruthrol ac mae pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau'r plentyn wedi cydnabod bod cael comisiynydd plant yn ein rhoi ar flaen y gad yn y DU. Yr wyf yn cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â'r comisiynydd, mae ei swyddfa'n gwneud gwaith da, ac yr ydym yn edrych yn gyson am ffyrdd o ddysgu o'r gwaith hwnnw a'i ymestyn.

**John Griffiths:** Llongyfarchiadau ar symud yr agenda bwysig hon ymlaen. Mae pwyllgor y Cenhedloedd Unedig wedi amlygu'r angen i wneud cynnydd yn y DU. Mae Cymru'n gwneud mwy o gynnydd nag unrhyw le arall yn y DU, a chroesawaf hynny. A fyddwch yn monitro cynnydd ac effeithiau'r cod? Fel y dywedwch, mae arweiniad gwleidyddol yn hollbwysig, a rhaid inni anfon y negeseuon cywir. Pe gallem fonitro cynnydd y cod, efallai y byddem mewn gwell sefyllfa i farnu pa un a oes angen gwaharddiad cyfreithiol yn y dyfodol er mwyn anfon neges glir bod taro plant yn annerbyniol.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym yn datblygu fforwm magu plant, sy'n cynnwys ystod o sefydliadau. Bydd yn arwain y gwaith hwn yn ei flaen ac yn datblygu'r cod. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn dychwelyd at y pwnc hwn yn y Cynulliad a byddaf yn monitro ei gynnydd. Gan fod y mater yn ymwneud ag addysg, agwedd ac ymwybyddiaeth gyhoeddus, credaf y bydd yn destun dadl eang ymysg y cyhoedd.

**Gwenda Thomas:** O ran yr agwedd ehangach ar fagu plant, yn arbennig plant mewn angen a phlant mewn gofal, a gytunwch y dylai argymhelliad Waterhouse sy'n cyfeirio at rôl gorfforaethol magu plant aelodau o awdurdodau lleol gael ei weithredu yn unffurf ac yn gyson ymhlith pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru ac y dylai

coherent strategies in place to ensure cross-boundary liaison?

**Jane Hutt:** That is an important point and I entirely endorse the Waterhouse recommendation. This is also relevant to the parents' code and will reinforce our backing for a universal approach to a corporate parenting responsibility across local authorities. I hope to discuss this with you in the Local Government and Housing Committee in due course.

strategaethau cydlynol fod ar waith i sicrhau cyswllt traws-ffiniol?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig a chymeradwyaf argymhelliad Waterhouse yn gyfan gwbl. Mae hyn hefyd yn berthnasol i'r cod ar gyfer rhieni a bydd yn atgyfnerthu ein cefnogaeth i ymagwedd gyffredinol tuag at gyfrioldeb corfforaethol magu plant ar draws awdurdodau lleol. Gobeithiaf drafod hyn gyda chi yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai maes o law.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2002  
Approval of the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuff) (England and Wales) (Amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2002**

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.10 yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Uchafswm y Lefelau o Waddod mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) 2002 ar eu ffurf ddrafft, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Hydref 2002. (NDM1185)*

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 23.10, approves the draft Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuff) (England & Wales) (amendment) (No. 2) Regulations 2002, laid in the Table Office on 15 October 2002. (NDM1185)*

*Cynnig (NDM1185): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM1185): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan



Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.59 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.59 p.m.*

### **Cymeradwyo'r Cynllun Cyhoeddi Approval of the Publication Scheme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendment 3 in the name of David Melding.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliant 3 yn enw David Melding.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly adopts as its scheme, under section 19 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000, the publication scheme which was laid in the Table Office on 15 October 2002. (NDM1182)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn mabwysiadu'r cynllun cyhoeddi y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Hydref 2002, fel ei gynllun o dan adran 19 Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. (NDM1182)*

On 13 November 2001, the Lord Chancellor announced that section 19 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 would come into force in November 2002 for the first wave of public bodies, which included the National Assembly for Wales and Whitehall departments. Section 19 imposes a duty on every public authority covered by the Act to adopt, maintain, publish and review a scheme approved by the information commissioner relating to the publication of information by the authority. Section 19 requires that the scheme specifies the classes of information that the authority publishes or intends to publish, the manner of publication and whether or not the information is available to the public free of charge or on payment of a fee. The scheme, therefore, requires the authority to outline the information that it commits to publishing. Section 19 also requires us to have regard for public interest in making information available and providing reasons for decisions. As part of

Ar 13 Tachwedd 2001, cyhoeddodd yr Arglwydd Ganghellor y byddai adran 19 Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 yn dod i rym ym mis Tachwedd 2002 ar gyfer y don gyntaf o gyrff cyhoeddus, a oedd yn cynnwys Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac adrannau Whitehall. Mae adran 19 yn gosod dyletswydd ar bob awdurdod cyhoeddus a gwmpesir gan y Ddeddf i fabwysiadu, cynnal, cyhoeddi ac adolygu cynllun wedi ei gymeradwyo gan y comisiynydd gwybodaeth yn ymwneud â chyhoeddi gwybodaeth gan yr awdurdod. Mae adran 19 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r cynllun nodi'r dosbarthiadau o wybodaeth y mae'r awdurdod yn eu cyhoeddi neu'n bwriadu eu cyhoeddi, y dull o gyhoeddi ac a yw'r wybodaeth ar gael i'r cyhoedd am ddim neu drwy dalu ffi. Felly, mae'r cynllun yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r awdurdod amlinellu'r wybodaeth y mae'n ei chyhoeddi. Mae adran 19 hefyd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni ystyried budd y cyhoedd wrth sicrhau bod y wybodaeth ar gael a darparu

this process, we went out to full consultation on the draft publication scheme. We are not aware of any Government department or any other public body that has done the same. Consultation began on 2 July 2002, and 128 key bodies were directly consulted. The consultation paper and draft scheme were made available on the National Assembly's website.

Members will recall that the publication scheme was debated in Plenary on 11 July, when Members were given the opportunity to comment on the draft scheme and were asked to note that it would be further edited and amplified. They were also asked to approve the proposed mechanism for submission of the scheme to the information commissioner and for final approval by the National Assembly.

The consultation period ended on 27 August. Nine consultation responses were received, including ones from the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds, the Disability Rights Commission in Wales and the Commission for Racial Equality Wales. All consultation responses were carefully considered by officials, and in many cases, further material was added to the scheme. For example, classes of information were added with reference to the annual report on the Welsh Assembly Government's compliance with the Welsh language scheme, the work programmes of the National Assembly's Subject Committees and the National Assembly's resource accounts. Items were also added to the draft classes, for example, the First Minister's annual report, and the voluntary sector scheme annual report. Taking such changes into account, together with other work undertaken by the National Assembly, the number of classes increased from 65 at consultation stage to 103 in the version we see today. Fifteen of the 18 classes that cover information to be released for the first time were added during this stage.

The enhanced version retains a user-friendly format with classes of information listed

rhesymau dros benderfyniadau. Fel rhan o'r broses hon, cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad llawn gennym ar y cynllun cyhoeddi drafft. Nid ydym yn ymwybodol o unrhyw adran o'r Llywodraeth nac unrhyw gorff cyhoeddus arall sydd wedi gwneud yr un peth. Dechreuodd yr ymgynghori ar 2 Gorffennaf 2002, ac ymgynghorwyd yn uniongyrchol â 128 o gyrff cyhoeddus. Sicrhawyd bod y papur ymgynghori a'r cynllun drafft ar gael ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Bydd yr Aelodau yn cofio i'r cynllun cyhoeddi gael ei drafod yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 11 Gorffennaf, pan roddwyd cyfle i'r Aelodau roi sylwadau ar y cynllun drafft a gofynnwyd iddynt nodi y câi ei olygu ymhellach a'i helaethu. Gofynnwyd iddynt gymeradwyo hefyd y dull arfaethedig o gyflwyno'r cynllun i'r comisiynydd gwybodaeth ac am gymeradwyaeth derfynol gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori i ben ar 27 Awst. Derbyniwyd naw ymateb ymgynghori, gan gynnwys rhai gan Gyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Gwarchod Adar, Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd Cymru a Chomisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol Cymru. Ystyriwyd pob ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad yn ofalus gan swyddogion, ac mewn sawl achos, ychwanegwyd deunydd pellach at y cynllun. Er enghraifft, ychwanegwyd dosbarthiadau o wybodaeth gan gyfeirio at yr adroddiad blynyddol ar gydymffurfiaid Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru â'r cynllun iaith Gymraeg, rhaglenni gwaith Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a chyfrifon adnoddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ychwanegwyd eitemau hefyd at y dosbarthiadau drafft, er enghraifft, adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog, ac adroddiad blynyddol cynllun y sector gwirfoddol. O ystyried newidiadau o'r fath, ynghyd â gwaith arall a wnaed gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, cynyddodd nifer y dosbarthiadau o 65 yn ystod y cam ymgynghori i 103 yn y fersiwn a welwn heddiw. Ychwanegwyd 15 o'r 18 dosbarth sy'n cwmpasu gwybodaeth i'w rhyddhau am y tro cyntaf yn ystod y cam hwn.

Mae'r fersiwn newydd yn cynnwys fformat sy'n hwylus i ddefnyddwyr gyda

under headings arranged in alphabetical order in English and Welsh. Explanatory information has been added to each class, which was prepared or checked by a freelance copywriter to ensure that it had been written in plain language. We are not aware of any other public body that has followed this procedure.

The scheme now includes 18 classes containing information that will be available for the first time under the scheme from November, or at a specified later date. These classes include: a list of information that we disclose as a result of requests received under the code and the environmental information regulations; a reference list of the grant schemes that we operate; a directory of research projects; and the agendas, minutes and papers of the monthly management meetings of the Assembly's executive board.

As set out in the motion carried in Plenary on 11 July, I submitted the National Assembly's publication scheme to the information commissioner in September in line with the commissioner's approved timetable. I am pleased to confirm that the information commissioner's office has confirmed that the National Assembly's publication scheme has been approved for four years, after which time the National Assembly will be required to re-submit the publication scheme for further approval. The publication scheme will now be printed and made available in every local library, in further and higher education institutions and in citizens advice bureaux. The scheme will also be made available on the National Assembly's website. In parallel with the release of the scheme, a new online publications catalogue will be launched, which is a database of National Assembly publications, which the public can interrogate fully in English and Welsh. I ask today that you give your final approval to this publication scheme by supporting the motion.

I will now turn to the amendments. Amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan note that there has been no direct

dosbarthiadau o wybodaeth wedi eu rhestru o dan benawdau yn nhrefn yr wyddor yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Ychwanegwyd gwybodaeth esboniadol at bob dosbarth, a baratowyd neu a wiriwyd gan ysgrifennwr copi'n gweithio ar ei liwt ei hun er mwyn sicrhau ei fod wedi ei ysgrifennu mewn iaith syml. Nid ydym yn ymwybodol o unrhyw gorff cyhoeddus arall sydd wedi dilyn y weithdrefn hon.

Mae'r cynllun bellach yn cynnwys 18 o ddsbarthiadau yn cynnwys gwybodaeth a fydd ar gael am y tro cyntaf o dan y cynllun o fis Tachwedd, neu ar ddyddiad penodol yn ddiweddarach. Mae'r dosbarthiadau hyn yn cynnwys: rhestr o wybodaeth a ddatgelwn o ganlyniad i'r ceisiadau a dderbyniwyd o dan y cod a'r rheoliadau gwybodaeth amgylcheddol; rhestr gyfeirio o'r cynlluniau grant a weithredir gennym; cyfeirlyfr o brosiectau ymchwil; ac agendâu, cofnodion a phapurau cyfarfodydd rheoli misol bwrdd gweithredol y Cynulliad.

Fel y nodwyd yn y cynnig a dderbyniwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 11 Gorffennaf, cyflwynais gynllun cyhoeddi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i'r comisiynydd gwybodaeth ym Medi yn unol ag amserlen gymeradwy'r comisiynydd. Mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau bod swyddfa'r comisiynydd gwybodaeth wedi cadarnhau bod cynllun cyhoeddi'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi ei gymeradwyo am bedair blynedd, ac ar ôl hyn bydd yn ofynnol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ailgyflwyno'r cynllun cyhoeddi am gymeradwyaeth bellach. Caiff y cynllun cyhoeddi ei argraffu yn awr a bydd ar gael ymhob llyfrgell leol, mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach ac uwch ac mewn canolfannau cynghori. Bydd y cynllun ar gael hefyd ar wefan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Ar y cyd â rhyddhau'r cynllun, caiff catalog o gyhoeddiadau ar-lein newydd ei lansio, a fydd yn gronfa ddata o gyhoeddiadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, y gall y cyhoedd ei darllen yn llawn yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Gofynnaf ichi heddiw roi eich cymeradwyaeth derfynol i'r cynllun cyhoeddi hwn drwy gefnogi'r cynnig.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Noda gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan na fu unrhyw addewid uniongyrchol i

undertaking to publish information on the progress of the new Assembly Chamber or on the development of what he describes as new Assembly embassies. Information on either of these subjects could be published under existing classes of information in the scheme. Papers or progress reports distributed to Plenary, National Assembly Committees, Sub-Committees, the Cabinet or the monthly meetings of the executive board on the new Chamber or the development of the so-called embassies will be published automatically, subject to any exemptions under the code. The spirit of the amendments is already covered in the code. I therefore do not support these amendments as they are superfluous. The subjects referred to are not suitable for inclusion as individual classes of information. All classes must be published for the scheme's lifetime.

I turn to amendment 3 in the name of David Melding, which notes that there is no provision to publish the allowances claimed by each Assembly Member. The National Assembly publishes information on the total sum of allowances paid to Assembly Members in accordance with Standing Order No. 3. I remind Members of Standing Order No. 3.3, which states:

'The Presiding Officer shall make arrangements for the publication of information for each financial year about the total of sums paid by the Assembly to its current Members and its former Members'.

The classes of information contained within the publication scheme that relate to Assembly Members' allowances accord with Standing Order No. 3. This amendment is a matter for Standing Orders rather than for the publication scheme itself. If the Assembly wishes to alter its stance and decide to publish allowances claimed by individual Assembly Members, that should be done through the amending of Standing Orders. We have debated this matter before, and my concerns regarding the Data Protection Act 1998 are well known. I looked at the Act today. Although I did not study it fully, it appears that there are difficulties involved in releasing information on the salaries of Assembly Members' support staff. If those staff or their salaries can be identified from

gyhoeddi gwybodaeth am gynnydd Siambr newydd y Cynulliad nac am ddatblygiad yr hyn a ddisgrifia fel llysgenadaethau newydd y Cynulliad. Gellid cyhoeddi gwybodaeth am y naill bwnc neu'r llall o dan ddosbarthiadau presennol gwybodaeth yn y cynllun. Caiff papurau neu adroddiadau ar gynnydd a ddsberthir i'r Cyfarfod Llawn, Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yr Is-bwyllgorau, y Cabinet neu gyfarfodydd misol y bwrdd gweithredol ar y Siambr newydd neu ddatblygiad y llysgenadaethau fel y'u gelwir, eu cyhoeddi'n awtomatig, yn amodol ar unrhyw eithriadau o dan y cod. Cwmpesir ysbryd y gwelliannau eisoes yn y cod. Felly ni chefnogaf y gwelliannau hyn gan eu bod yn ddiangen. Nid yw'r pynciau y cyfeirir atynt yn addas i'w cynnwys fel dosbarthiadau unigol o wybodaeth. Rhaid i bob dosbarth gael ei gyhoeddi ar gyfer oes y cynllun.

Trof at welliant 3 yn enw David Melding, sy'n nodi nad oes unrhyw ddarpariaeth i gyhoeddi'r lwfansau a hawlir gan bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Cyhoedda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wybodaeth am gyfanswm y lwfansau a delir i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau am Reol Sefydlog Rhif 3.3, sy'n nodi:

'Bydd y Llywydd yn trefnu cyhoeddi gwybodaeth am bob blwyddyn ariannol ynghylch cyfanswm y symiau a delir gan y Cynulliad i'w Aelodau presennol a'i gyn-Aelodau'.

Mae'r dosbarthiadau o wybodaeth a gynhwysir yn y cynllun cyhoeddi sy'n ymwneud â lwfansau Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cyd-fynd â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 3. Mater i'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn hytrach nag i'r cynllun cyhoeddi ei hun yw'r gwelliant hwn. Os yw'r Cynulliad yn dymuno newid ei safbwynt ac yn penderfynu cyhoeddi'r lwfansau a hawlir gan Aelodau unigol o'r Cynulliad, dylid gwneud hynny drwy newid y Rheolau Sefydlog. Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn o'r blaen, ac mae fy mhryderon o ran Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 yn hysbys i bawb. Edrychais ar y Ddeddf heddiw. Er nad astudiais hi yn llawn, ymddengys fod anawsterau ynghlwm wrth ryddhau gwybodaeth am gyflogau staff cymorth Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Os gellir enwi'r staff

the data, that data should not be processed unless certain conditions are met. The definition of 'processed' includes the dissemination of information to the public domain. There are six conditions in schedule 2 to the Data Protection Act 1998. If any one of them were met, that information could be released. From my reading of the schedule to the Act, those conditions do not apply to Assembly Members' support staff.

4:10 p.m.

Assembly Members' contracts contain the implied term that, in taking up our responsibilities, our salaries will be published and be known in the public domain. That does not apply—

**David Melding:** The Minister has referred to his interpretation of the law. Has he discussed the matter with his colleagues in Northern Ireland, Scotland and with the chairman of the Public Accounts Committee in Westminster to determine whether they agree with his interpretation that there are inhibitions as regards publishing these allowances?

**Carwyn Jones:** I have not taken this matter up with them. However, my concern is that, if support staff's salaries can be identified, processing that data would technically amount to a breach of the Data Protection Act 1998 unless there is an express term in the contract drawn-up between the staff and the Assembly Members who employ them. I do not know what legal structures apply in Scotland or Northern Ireland. David Melding has raised this matter several times and he may wish to pursue it himself. I have outlined the difficulties and we have discussed this matter many times before in the Chamber. I refer you back to my original comment, that this is a matter for Standing Orders. If they need to be changed, that should be the subject of a different debate.

I will therefore not support amendment 3, as what it proposes is a matter for Standing Orders rather than for the publication scheme and there may also be legal ambiguity attached to it. It is for the Assembly to decide

hynny neu'r cyflogau hynny o'r data, ni ddylid prosesu'r data hwnnw oni fodlonir rhai amodau. Mae'r diffiniad o 'brosesu' yn cynnwys lledaenu gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd. Ceir chwe amod yn atodlen 2 i Ddeddf Diogelu Data 1998. Pe bai unrhyw un ohonynt yn cael ei fodloni, gellid rhyddhau'r wybodaeth honno. O ganlyniad i ddarllen yr atodlen i'r Ddeddf, nid yw'r amodau hynny yn berthnasol i staff cymorth Aelodau'r Cynulliad.

Mae contractau Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cynnwys y term ymhlyg y caiff ein cyflogau, wrth i ni ymgymryd â'n dyletswyddau, eu cyhoeddi ac y byddant yn hysbys i'r cyhoedd. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol—

**David Melding:** Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at ei ddehongliad o'r gyfraith. A yw wedi trafod y mater gyda'i gyd-Aelodau yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, yr Alban a chyda chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn San Steffan i benderfynu a ydynt yn cytuno â'i ddehongliad fod gwaharddiadau o ran cyhoeddi'r lwfansau hyn?

**Carwyn Jones:** Nid wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda hwy. Fodd bynnag, fy mhryder i yw y byddai prosesu'r data hwnnw yn gyfystyr yn dechnegol â thorri Deddf Diogelu Data 1998, pe gellir nodi cyflogau staff cymorth, oni bai fod term pendant yn y contract a luniwyd rhwng y staff ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad sy'n eu cyflogi. Ni wn pa strwythurau cyfreithiol sydd yn berthnasol yn yr Alban neu yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Mae David Melding wedi codi'r mater hwn sawl gwaith ac efallai y bydd yn dymuno ymdrin ag ef ei hun. Yr wyf wedi amlinellu'r anawsterau a thrafodwyd y mater hwn gennym sawl gwaith o'r blaen yn y Siambr. Hoffwn eich cyfeirio'n ôl at fy sylw gwreiddiol, sef ei fod yn fater i'r Rheolau Sefydlog. Os oes angen eu newid, dylai hynny fod yn destun dadl wahanol.

Felly, ni chefnogaf welliant 3, gan fod yr hyn a gynigia yn fater i'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn hytrach na'r cynllun cyhoeddi ac efallai fod amwysedd cyfreithiol ynghlwm wrtho. Y Cynulliad fydd yn penderfynu a yw'n

whether it wishes to amend its Standing Orders on another occasion.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Members will note that three debates, including this one, remain and it is already 4.10 p.m. I must protect the time for the short debate, and for the important debate on the annual report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity which follows this one. I would therefore like this debate to finish at 4.30 p.m., but that depends on how many Members wish to speak. I will not confine Members to speak for only three minutes, but if they could thus limit their speeches, they would be doing the Assembly a service this afternoon.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in my name. Amendment 1: add a new point:

*notes with concern that there has been no undertaking to publish information on the progress of the new Assembly Chamber.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point:

*further notes the lack of provision to publish information on the development of the new Assembly 'embassies'.*

To respond to the Minister's comments, I tabled the amendments in order to underline two issues that have not been subject to the greatest amount of openness in the Chamber. We have requested many times that Ministers make meaningful and worthwhile statements—we have not had any this week—on issues of great public importance, such as the construction of the new Assembly building. We have not had a Cabinet statement on that subject in this Chamber. We had a response to a question on the new Assembly building this afternoon but a debate on it has not been held for some months. We believe that the Government is keeping the new Assembly building situation as closely under wraps as possible. Only through the leaking of information or press speculation have we managed to get an extended answer to a question on the matter this afternoon.

There is a similar situation with the new

dymuno newid ei Reolau Sefydlog ar achlysur arall.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Bydd yr Aelodau yn sylwi bod tair dadl, gan gynnwys hon, yn weddill ac mae eisoes yn 4.10 p.m. Rhaid imi gadw amser ar gyfer y ddadl fer, ac ar gyfer y ddadl bwysig ar adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal sy'n dilyn y ddadl hon. Felly hoffwn i'r ddadl hon orffen erbyn 4.30 p.m., ond dibynna hynny ar sawl Aelod sy'n dymuno siarad. Ni chyfyngaf yr Aelodau i siarad am dair munud yn unig, ond pe gallent gyfyngu eu hareithiau, byddent yn gwneud cymwynas â'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi â phryder na chafwyd addewid i gyhoeddi gwybodaeth ar ddatblygiad Siambr newydd y Cynulliad.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi ymhellach y diffyg darpariaeth i gyhoeddi gwybodaeth ar ddatblygu 'llysgenadaethau' newydd y Cynulliad.*

I ymateb i sylwadau'r Gweinidog, cyflwynais y gwelliannau er mwyn pwysleisio dau fater na chawsant eu trafod yn agored iawn yn y Siambr. Gofynasom sawl gwaith i'r Gweinidogion wneud datganiadau ystyrlon a gwerthfawr—ni chawsom rai yr wythnos hon—ar faterion sydd o bwys mawr i'r cyhoedd, megis codi adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Ni chawsom ddatganiad Cabinet ar y pwnc hwnnw yn y Siambr hon. Cawsom ymateb i gwestiwn ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad y prynhawn yma ond ni chynhaliwyd dadl arno ers rhai misoedd. Credwn fod y Llywodraeth yn cadw sefyllfa adeilad newydd y Cynulliad ynghudd gymaint â phosibl. Dim ond drwy ddatgelu gwybodaeth neu ddamcaniaethu ar ran y wasg yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gael ateb estynedig i gwestiwn ar y mater y prynhawn yma.

Ceir sefyllfa debyg gyda llysgenadaethau

Assembly embassies, as I term them, which will be established in various parts of the world, no doubt to satisfy the ego of our 'Wales abroad (rarely here) Minister'. I assume that he has left to catch an early flight, given that he is not in the Chamber. Why are the details of these embassies scarce? Why are we not told about how much these embassies will cost and what they will do for the National Assembly for Wales? If this is about open government and processes, then Members should be allowed access to those details. The public will want to know why several million pounds will be spent every year to support Government embassies around the world. Though the Minister dismisses the amendments, they underline that the detail given on these two issues has been limited. Ministers have been reluctant to make statements in Plenary outlining the detailed position on those issues.

Another point concerns the publication of Cabinet statements made outside of Plenary. A significant amount of time is allocated for statements in Plenary, but often those statements are not of significant policy. Yesterday's statement on play policy was a waste of 30 minutes that could have been used to discuss more interesting policies that were more relevant to government. Let us take the education portfolio, for example. On numerous occasions the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning has issued written Cabinet statements despite there being sufficient time to make those statements in Plenary. A classic example is the statement on the £18 million increase in the education budget to cope with teachers' threshold payments. That was linked to the performance-related pay system introduced by the Government. The statement on that allocation was made outside of Plenary and released in written form just as we were heading into recess. It is all very well to make information available via the computer system, but it should have been presented in Plenary for Members to scrutinise it openly and transparently. What is the point of us sitting here twice a week if such statements are not made in Assembly time?

newydd y Cynulliad, fel y'u galwaf, a gaiff eu sefydlu mewn gwahanol rannau o'r byd, yn ddiau er mwyn bodloni ego ein 'Gweinidog Cymru dramor' (nad yw yma'n aml). Tybiaf ei fod wedi gadael er mwyn dal awyren, gan nad yw yn y Siambr. Pam mae manylion y llysgenadaethau hyn mor brin? Pam na chawn wybod beth fydd cost y llysgenadaethau hyn a beth fyddant yn ei wneud i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru? Os yw hyn a wnelo â llywodraeth agored a phrosesau agored, yna dylid caniatáu i'r Aelodau weld y manylion hynny. Bydd cyhoedd am wybod pam y caiff sawl miliwn o bunnoedd ei gwario bob blwyddyn i gefnogi llysgenadaethau'r Llywodraeth ledled y byd. Er bod y Gweinidog yn gwrthod y gwelliannau, pwysleisiant fod y manylion a roddwyd am y ddau fater hyn wedi bod yn gyfyngedig. Bu Gweinidogion yn amharod i wneud datganiadau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn amlinellu'r safbwynt manwl ar y materion hynny.

Pwynt arall o bryder yw'r modd y cyhoeddir datganiadau'r Cabinet y tu allan i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Neilltuir cryn amser ar gyfer datganiadau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, ond yn aml nid yw'r datganiadau hynny o bolisi arwyddocaol. Gwastraff o 30 munud fu'r datganiad ddoe ar bolisi chwarae y gellid bod wedi eu defnyddio i drafod polisiau mwy diddorol a oedd yn fwy perthnasol i lywodraeth. Cymerwch y portffolio addysg, er enghraifft. Ar sawl achlysur mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi cyhoeddi datganiadau ysgrifenedig ar ran y Cabinet er bod digon o amser i wneud y datganiadau hynny yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Enghraifft dda o hyn yw'r datganiad ar y cynnydd o £18 miliwn yn y gyllideb addysg i ymdopi â thaliadau trothwy athrawon. Cysylltwyd hynny â'r system cyflog ar sail perfformiad a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth. Gwnaed y datganiad ar y dyraniad hwnnw y tu allan i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ac fe'i rhyddhawyd ar ffurf ysgrifenedig pan oeddem ar fin torri. Mae'n hawdd sicrhau bod y wybodaeth ar gael drwy'r system gyfrifiadurol, ond dylid bod wedi ei chyflwyno mewn Cyfarfod Llawn er mwyn i'r Aelodau graffu arni mewn modd agored ac eglur. Beth yw diben eistedd yma ddwywaith yr wythnos os na wneir datganiadau o'r fath yn ystod amser y

Cynulliad?

Also this week, we saw the announcement—

Hefyd, yr wythnos hon, gwelsom y cyhoeddiad—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is a debate about a publication scheme. I advise you to keep to the subject.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dadl ar gynllun cyhoeddi yw hon. Awgrymaf eich bod yn cadw at y pwnc.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am keeping to the topic of openness and transparency. I am discussing the publication and announcement of Government statements in such a way that Members can scrutinise them. The document before us is full of platitudes and promises about what the Government will publish and how it will keep the public and Assembly Members informed. However, this week saw another example of an announcement being made on an allocation of money to an interesting education policy objective. The statement was not made to us; it was given to the press late on Monday evening. The press had the detail on Monday evening while we did not get it until yesterday afternoon. What is the point of a publication scheme if we are not privy to such information? It is all very well to inform the press of what is happening, but elected Members are being ignored every week despite this long-winded document that has been produced jointly, no doubt, by the Presiding Office and the Cabinet.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn cadw at y pwnc o fod yn agored ac eglur. Yr wyf yn trafod cyhoeddi datganiadau'r Llywodraeth yn y fath fodd fel y gall yr Aelodau graffu arnynt. Mae'r ddogfen ger ein bron yn llawn ystrydebau ac addewidion ynghylch yr hyn y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei gyhoeddi a sut y bydd yn hysbysu'r cyhoedd ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn rheolaidd. Fodd bynnag, gwelwyd enghraifft arall yr wythnos hon o gyhoeddiad ar ddyraniad arian i amcan polisi addysg diddorol. Ni wnaed y datganiad i ni; fe'i rhoddwyd i'r wasg yn hwyr nos Lun. Yr oedd y manylion gan y wasg nos Lun ond ni chawsom ni'r datganiad tan brynhawn ddoe. Beth yw diben cynllun cyhoeddi os na wyddom am wybodaeth o'r fath? Mae'n iawn hysbysu'r wasg am yr hyn sy'n digwydd, ond caiff Aelodau etholedig eu hanwybyddu bob wythnos er gwaethaf y ddogfen hirwyntog hon a gynhyrchwyd ar y cyd, yn ddiaw, gan Swyddfa'r Llywydd a'r Cabinet.

**Mick Bates:** In the interests of openness and transparency, when did the Welsh Conservative Party become full supporters of open government and of the Assembly?

**Mick Bates:** Er mwyn bod yn agored ac eglur, pryd daeth Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn llwyr gefnogol i lywodraeth agored a'r Cynulliad?

**Jonathan Morgan:** You are not a member of the Business Committee. Its members will no doubt tell you that I always argue that Ministers should make statements on substantive policy issues such as the job losses at Allied Steel and Wire and Dewhirst, and problems in social services and education. Openness and transparency means that Ministers should come to this Chamber, which was democratically elected according to the rules you wanted, Mick, and give us statements and information so that we can inform our constituents of what is happening in Government. I will not be lectured at by the Liberal Democrats.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid ydych yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Busnes. Bydd ei aelodau yn ddiaw yn dweud wrthyf fy mod bob amser yn dadlau y dylai Gweinidogion wneud datganiadau ar faterion polisi o bwys megis y swyddi a gollwyd yn Allied Steel and Wire a Dewhirst, a phroblemau mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg. Ystyr bod yn agored ac eglur yw y dylai Gweinidogion ddod i'r Siambr hon, a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd yn ôl y rheolau yr oeddech yn eu dymuno, Mick, a rhoi datganiadau a gwybodaeth i ni fel y gallwn hysbysu ein hetholwyr am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Llywodraeth. Nid wyf am glywed pregeth gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.



Finally, I will support amendment 3, tabled by my colleague, David Melding. It is important that we follow Scotland and Northern Ireland and the views of the Public Accounts Committee in this. It is important that there is transparency about how we spend public money in support of our duties as Assembly Members. Minister, this is not about publishing Members'—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have had six minutes. Time is short and you are doing a disservice to the other Members. Do finish quickly.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I did accept an intervention.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You had an extra minute for that.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We would not publish the salaries of Assembly Members' support staff. All that we would need to do is to publish the overall subsistence amounts claimed by Assembly Members. It is about being open and transparent. The Assembly should publish allowances claimed by individual Assembly Members.

4:20 p.m.

**David Melding:** I propose amendment 3 in my name. Add a new point:

*notes with regret that no provision exists to publish the allowances claimed by each Assembly Member.*

Forty-six Assembly Members have voluntarily published their allowances, for the second year running, I think. It is obviously a trend. I do not believe that Members who have published such details have committed an unlawful act. The Minister should not give us his own interpretation of the law, but that of Assembly law officers. It is not appropriate to refer to the law casually as the Minister did. Allowances are published in the Scottish Parliament and staff salary levels are given. Allowances are also published in the Northern Ireland Assembly, and there cost allowances for the whole office are

I gloi, cefnogaf welliant 3, a gyflwynwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn dilyn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon a safbwyntiau'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn hyn o beth. Mae'n bwysig bod yn eglur ynghylch y modd y gwariwn arian cyhoeddus i gefnogi ein dyletswyddau fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Weinidog, nid yw hyn a wnelo â chyhoeddi—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cael chwe munud. Mae amser yn brin ac yr ydych yn gwneud cam â'r Aelodau eraill. Dewch i ben yn gyflym.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Derbyniais ymyriad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cawsoch funud ychwanegol ar gyfer hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ni fyddem yn cyhoeddi cyflogau staff cymorth Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Y cyfan y byddai angen inni ei wneud fyddai cyhoeddi'r symiau cynhaliaeth cyffredinol a hawlir gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae a wnelo â bod yn agored ac eglur. Dylai'r Cynulliad gyhoeddi lwfansau a hawlir gan Aelodau unigol y Cynulliad.

**David Melding:** Cynigiau gwelliant 3 yn fy enw i. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd:

*yn nodi gyda gofid nad oes darpariaeth i gyhoeddi'r lwfansau a hawlir gan bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad.*

Cyhoeddodd 46 o Aelodau'r Cynulliad eu lwfansau yn wirfoddol, am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol, fe dybiaf. Mae ar gynnydd, mae'n amlwg. Nid yw'r Aelodau sydd wedi cyhoeddi manylion o'r fath wedi cyflawni gweithred anghyfreithlon yn fy marn i. Ni ddylai'r Gweinidog roi ei ddehongliad ei hun inni o'r gyfraith, ond dehongliad swyddogion cyfraith y Cynulliad. Nid yw'n briodol cyfeirio at y gyfraith yn ddiraddo fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog. Cyhoeddir lwfansau yn Senedd yr Alban a rhoddir lefelau cyflogau staff. Cyhoeddir lwfansau hefyd yng Nghynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, ac yno cyhoeddir lwfansau cost ar gyfer y swyddfa

published, rather than individual salaries. Local authorities in Wales, at our insistence, must publish members' allowances and, as I mentioned in my intervention earlier, the chair of the Public Accounts Committee has now stated firmly that the allowances of Members of Parliament should be published. Therefore, there is a growing view that these figures should be made available to the public. It is particularly disappointing that, of the new devolved institutions, the Assembly is the only establishment that has thrown a dark cloak over this aspect of its business. Assembly Members have been let down by some Ministers and officers who have not taken this issue forward seriously and given us an opportunity to vote on the issue. That is why I have had to use the mechanism of tabling an amendment today.

The issues of confidentiality raised could be addressed. I have never said that we should publish individual salary figures for each Assembly Member's office, as Scotland does. We could publish an overall figure for office costs, as is the case in Northern Ireland. Northern Ireland also gives an accurate description of the travelling costs that each Northern Ireland Assembly Member claims, and reminds people that those Members who live a long way away from Belfast will, naturally, claim more in travelling costs. These matters can be addressed appropriately, and publishing such figures has not led to a backlash of public opinion in Northern Ireland or in Scotland.

This is a matter of trust. Do we trust our electorate to interpret these figures fairly? I claim an amount that is close to the full allowance because I need to do so to do my job effectively. Any Member that does not claim a large part of his or her allowance is probably not serving their electorate effectively. Our allowance levels are appropriate, and it is appropriate that Members should have a capital allowance for a flat or house in Cardiff if they live a long way away. I am fortunate that I live so close that, not only do I not qualify for the allowance, I can comfortably get home to my bed every night.

These costs are perfectly legitimate and we

gyfan, yn hytrach na chyflogau unigol. Rhaid i'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, yn ôl ein gorchymyn, gyhoeddi lwfansau eu haelodau ac, fel y soniais yn fy ymyriad yn gynharach, mae cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus wedi datgan yn gadarn yn awr y dylai lwfansau Aelodau Seneddol gael eu cyhoeddi. Felly, mae barn gynyddol y dylai'r ffigurau hyn fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Mae'n siomedig iawn mai'r Cynulliad yw'r unig sefydliad, o blith y sefydliadau datganoledig newydd, sydd wedi cuddio'r agwedd hon ar ei fusnes. Siomwyd Aelodau'r Cynulliad gan rai Gweinidogion a swyddogion na ddatblygodd y mater hwn o ddifrif ac na roddodd gyfle inni bleidleisio ar y mater. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi gorfod defnyddio'r dull o gyflwyno gwelliant heddiw.

Gellid mynd i'r afael â'r materion cyfrinachedd a godwyd. Ni ddywedais erioed y dylem gyhoeddi ffigurau cyflog unigol ar gyfer pob un o swyddfeydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad, fel y gwna'r Alban. Gallem gyhoeddi ffigur cyffredinol ar gyfer costau swyddfa, fel y gwneir yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Rhydd Gogledd Iwerddon ddisgrifiad cywir hefyd o'r costau teithio a hawlir gan bob Aelod o Gynulliad Gogledd Iwerddon, ac mae'n atgoffa pobl y bydd yr Aelodau hynny sy'n byw gryn bellter o Belfast, yn naturiol, yn hawlio mwy mewn costau teithio. Gellir ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn briodol, ac nid yw cyhoeddi ffigurau o'r fath wedi arwain at adlach o farn gyhoeddus yng Ngogledd Iwerddon nac yn yr Alban.

Mater o ymddiried yw hyn. A ydym yn ymddiried yn ein hetholwyr i ddehongli'r ffigurau hyn yn deg? Hawliaf swm sy'n agos at y lwfans llawn gan fod angen imi wneud hynny er mwyn gwneud fy swydd yn effeithiol. Nid yw unrhyw Aelod nad yw'n hawlio rhan fawr o'i lwfans yn gwasanaethu eu hetholaeth yn effeithiol. Mae lefelau ein lwfansau yn addas, ac mae'n briodol y dylai'r Aelodau gael lwfans cyfalaf ar gyfer fflat neu dŷ yng Nghaerdydd os ydynt yn byw yn bell i ffwrdd. Yr wyf yn ffodus fy mod yn byw mor agos fel nad wyf yn gymwys i gael y lwfans ac y gallaf yn hawdd gyrraedd fy ngwely bob nos.

Mae'r costau hyn yn hollol deg a dylem fod

should be proud to tell people how we use the money. We should publish the information, because we are not afraid of it and do not want to hide it. We claim to be an exemplar of open government and freedom of information, but we do not publish the same sort of information that our colleagues in Northern Ireland and Scotland do and, to draw an analogy, that we require local government members in Wales to publish.

The Minister has made some more accommodating noises in response to my argument and I personally believe that he would like us to go further. It is unfortunate that the administration has not brought a separate debate on this matter before the Assembly. We could then have voted on the issue. However, I believe that my amendment is perfectly legitimate because the current publication scheme only refers to allowances and salaries in their totality. My amendment clearly refers to publishing the allowance claimed by each individual Member. It does not refer to the body corporate, but to each elected Member. That is different; I was disappointed that the Minister has chosen to throw some confusion on that. He refers to Standing Orders, which may be significant. If he commits to giving time in the Chamber to move an amendment to Standing Orders, I will do so after checking that the legal position is, as I suspect, quite clear, and that we can publish these figures without fear of legal action. Our record in this area has been dark and miserable; it is about time that daylight was thrown on this matter. I urge Members to support my amendment.

**Owen John Thomas:** Who was it that said, I think you protest too much? The Plaid Cymru group in the National Assembly always urges its Members to declare details of their salaries and allowances. We do this in the absence of a ruling from the Local Government and Housing Committee, which, I understand, is seeking clarification on whether publishing details of salaries and allowances might be a breach of the Data Protection Act 1998. In the meantime, we will continue to release these details; however, in the absence of a legal ruling, we will abstain on David Melding's amendment

yn falch o ddweud wrth bobl sut y defnyddiwn yr arian. Dylem gyhoeddi'r wybodaeth, oherwydd nad ydym yn ei hofni ac nid ydym am ei chuddio. Honnwn ein bod yn enghraifft wych o lywodraeth agored a rhyddid gwybodaeth, ond ni chyhoeddwn yr un fath o wybodaeth a gyhoeddir gan ein cyd-aelodau yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban ac, er mwyn dangos cymhariaeth, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i aelodau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ei chyhoeddi.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud rhai synau caredig mewn ymateb i'm dadl ac yn bersonol credaf yr hoffai inni fynd ymhellach. Mae'n anffodus nad yw'r weinyddiaeth wedi dwyn dadl ar wahân ar y mater hwn gerbron y Cynulliad. Gallem wedyn fod wedi pleidleisio ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y gwelliant yn hollol deg oherwydd dim ond at lwfansau a chyflogau yn eu cyfanrwydd y mae'r cynllun cyhoeddi cyfredol yn cyfeirio. Mae fy ngwelliant yn amlwg yn cyfeirio at gyhoeddi'r lwfans a hawlir gan bob Aelod unigol. Nid yw'n cyfeirio at y corff cyfan, ond at bob Aelod etholedig. Mae hynny'n wahanol; fe'm siomwyd gan y ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi dewis drysu pethau. Cyfeiria at y Rheolau Sefydlog, a allai fod yn arwyddocaol. Os yw'n addo rhoi amser yn y Siambr i gynnig gwelliant i'r Rheolau Sefydlog, gwnaf hynny ar ôl cadarnhau bod y sefyllfa gyfreithiol yn eithaf clir, fel y tybiaf, ac y gallwn gyhoeddi'r ffigurau hyn heb ofni y caiff camau cyfreithiol eu cymryd. Bu ein hanes yn y maes hwn yn dywyll a diflas; mae'n bryd edrych ar y mater mewn golau dydd. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi fy ngwelliant.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pwy ddywedodd, credaf eich bod yn protestio gormod? Mae grŵp Plaid Cymru yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bob amser yn annog ei Aelodau i ddatgan manylion am eu cyflogau a'u lwfansau. Gwnawn hyn yn absenoldeb dyfarniad gan y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, sydd, fel y deallaf, yn ceisio eglurhad ar a allai cyhoeddi manylion cyflogau a lwfansau dorri Deddf Diogelu Data 1998. Yn y cyfamser, byddwn yn parhau i ryddhau'r manylion hyn; fodd bynnag, yn absenoldeb dyfarniad cyfreithiol, byddwn yn ymwrthod â gwelliant 3 David Melding.

3.

**Peter Black:** It is important when we debate this document that we do not underestimate what the National Assembly has already achieved. The National Assembly has been a pioneer of open government and freedom of information. Few Governments around the world publish Cabinet minutes and agendas in such a short period of time, and fewer still make them accessible to all on the internet. This scheme puts us at the forefront of elected parliamentary bodies around the world, and we should be proud of that.

A key part of this scheme is the information asset register and the undertaking to publish a list of the broad fields in which the Assembly has powers and responsibilities. People cannot access information if they do not know what is available or where to look. That is why I welcome this asset register. I was fascinated by the Conservatives' amendments to this motion. Amendments 1 and 2 are covered by the scheme already, though how the Tories have the nerve to demand information on the new building when they refuse to attend briefing meetings defeats me. I wonder whether the fact that David Melding, rather than his group's Business Manager, has tabled amendment 3 indicates that he does not have the full support of Conservative Assembly Members. I have published my allowances in the last two years, and I understand that the vast majority of AMs have also published their details this year.

**Jonathan Morgan:** David told you that; you were not listening.

**Peter Black:** I was listening. However, the publication of this information has implications for staff privacy and data protection, and should therefore remain voluntary. As a member of the House Committee, I have had advice that it may not be lawful for the Presiding Officer to publish it without the consent of those affected. It is also questionable how much light is cast upon the effective use of public money by publication. What matters are effective regulation, audit and scrutiny, and I have not heard any suggestion that that is not in place.

**Peter Black:** Mae'n bwysig, wrth drafod y ddogfen hon inni beidio â thanbriso'r hyn a gyflawnwyd eisoes gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Bu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn arloesol o ran llywodraeth agored a rhyddid gwybodaeth. Prin yw'r Llywodraethau ledled y byd sy'n cyhoeddi cofnodion ac agendâu Cabinet mewn cyfnod mor fyr o amser, a phrinnach fyth yw'r rhai sy'n eu gwneud yn hygyrch i bawb ar y rhyngwyd. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn ein rhoi ar y blaen i gyrff seneddol etholedig ledled y byd, a dylem fod yn falch o hynny.

Rhan allweddol o'r cynllun hwn yw'r gofrestr asedau gwybodaeth a'r addewid i gyhoeddi rhestr o'r meysydd cyffredinol y mae gan y Cynulliad bwerau a chyfrifoldebau ynddynt. Ni all pobl gael gafael ar wybodaeth os na wyddant ymhle y mae ar gael neu ble i edrych amdani. Dyna pam y croesawaf y gofrestr asedau hon. Yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu at welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr i'r cynnig hwn. Cwmpeisir gwelliannau 1 a 2 gan y cynllun eisoes, er na ddeallaf sut y mae'r Torïaid mor hyf â mynnu gwybodaeth am yr adeilad newydd pan wrthodant fynychu cyfarfodydd briffio. Tybed a yw'r ffaith bod David Melding, yn hytrach na Rheolwr Busnes ei grŵp, wedi cyflwyno gwelliant 3 yn awgrymu nad yw Aelodau Ceidwadol y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi'n llawn. Yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi fy lwfansau yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, a deallaf fod y mwyafrif helaeth o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi eu manylion hwythau eleni hefyd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Dywedodd David hynny wrthy; nid oeddech yn gwrando.

**Peter Black:** Yr oeddwn yn gwrando. Fodd bynnag, mae cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth hon â goblygiadau i breifatrwydd staff a diogelu data a dylai, felly, aros yn wirfoddol. Fel aelod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ, cefais gyngor na fyddai'n gyfreithiol, efallai, i'r Llywydd ei chyhoeddi heb ganiatâd y rheini y mae'n effeithio arnynt. Mae'n ddadleuol hefyd faint o oleuni a deflir ar y defnydd effeithiol o arian cyhoeddus drwy gyhoeddi. Rheoleiddio, archwilio a dull craffu effeithiol yw'r hyn sydd ei angen, ac ni chlywais unrhyw awgrym nad yw ar waith.

**David Melding:** I proposed amendment 3 in a personal capacity, as an Assembly Member. I did not seek my group's endorsement, although I believe that all the Conservatives present will support it. However, that is their personal decision. On confidentiality, we could use the Northern Ireland model, because they do not publish individual salaries. Therefore, there is a model that we could put into effect. It is not rocket science.

**Peter Black:** As I have said, David, I have published my expenses, as have other Assembly Members. The issue is whether it should be forced upon Assembly Members. That should not happen. Effective scrutiny, regulation and audit are key to ensuring that public money is spent properly. The figures published in newspapers—certainly as they appeared in the *South Wales Echo*—cast little light on Assembly Members' activities. That is the issue here.

The idea of the Conservative Party fighting for freedom of information is still difficult to grasp. It was more than happy to let Wales be governed by a closed Government of quangos, appointed with minimal openness and little accountability. Some in the group still seem to believe that we should return to this system.

To conclude, I will highlight a few points of concern about this scheme. First, on the difficulties experienced by many individuals and organisations in accessing information on the Assembly website, there are delays in consultation documents appearing on the website or being placed in obscure nooks and crannies where they are missed or difficult to find. Some seem not to appear on the website at all. It is universally held outside the Assembly that our website is not easy to use. It needs to be revisited to improve access.

4:30 p.m.

My second concern is about the amount and nature of information available on private finance initiative schemes, to which this

**David Melding:** Cynigiais welliant 3 o safbwynt personol, fel Aelod Cynulliad. Ni cheisiais gymeradwyaeth fy ngrŵp, er y credaf y bydd pob Ceidwadwr sy'n bresennol o'i blaid. Fodd bynnag, eu penderfyniad personol hwy yw hynny. O ran cyfrinachedd, gallem ddefnyddio enghraifft Gogledd Iwerddon, oherwydd nid ydynt yn cyhoeddi cyflogau unigol. Felly, mae enghraifft y gallem ei rhoi ar waith. Nid yw'n gymhleth.

**Peter Black:** Fel y dywedais, David, yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi fy nhreuliau, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw pa un a ddylai gael ei orfodi ar Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Ni ddylai hynny ddigwydd. Mae craffu, rheoleiddio ac archwilio effeithiol yn allweddol i sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario'n briodol. Nid yw'r ffigurau a gyhoeddir mewn papurau newydd—yn sicr, fel yr ymddangosasant yn y *South Wales Echo*—yn taflu llawer o oleuni ar weithgareddau Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Dyna'r broblem yma.

Mae'r syniad o'r Blaid Geidwadol yn ymladd am ryddid gwybodaeth yn anodd ei ddeall o hyd. Yr oedd yn fwy na bodlon gadael i Gymru gael ei rheoli gan Lywodraeth gaëdig o gwangos, wedi eu penodi gyda chyn lleied o dryloywder â phosibl a heb fawr ddim atebolrwydd. Cred rhai yn y grŵp o hyd y dylem ddychwelyd at y system hon.

I gloi, amlygaf rai pwyntiau sy'n achosi pryder ynghylch y cynllun hwn. Yn gyntaf, o ran yr anawsterau a brofir gan lawer o unigolion a sefydliadau wrth gael gafael ar wybodaeth ar wefan y Cynulliad, ceir oedi cyn i ddogfennau ymgynghori ymddangos ar y wefan neu cânt eu gosod mewn cilfachau tywyll lle na cânt eu gweld neu lle y mae'n anodd dod o hyd iddynt. Mae'n debyg nad yw rhai yn ymddangos ar y wefan o gwbl. Credir yn gyffredinol y tu allan i'r Cynulliad nad yw ein gwefan yn hawdd ei defnyddio. Mae angen ei hailystyried er mwyn gwella ymnediad.

Fy ail bryder yw maint a natur y wybodaeth sydd ar gael ar gynlluniau menter cyllid preifat, y cyfeiria'r ddogfen hon atynt.

document refers. I accept that matters of commercial confidentiality are involved, but, after contracts are signed, more information could be made available on costs and, specifically, on the calculations involved around the public sector comparator that led to the decision to opt for PFI in the first place. If this information is too sensitive, then some form of scrutiny needs to be set up to examine it. It is only thus that we can ensure that we are getting value for money from PFI schemes. Some form of mechanism along these lines would improve the scheme before us today. I hope that the Minister can take action to address these concerns, and, with these two caveats, I welcome this scheme.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will try to be as concise as possible as time is pressing. On accessing information electronically, will the Minister give an undertaking this afternoon that access to information on the Assembly website will be made easier for organisations to find? I am sure that he is aware that several organisations, especially in the voluntary sector, feel that it is difficult to get that information. As Peter said, much of the information is out-dated, and some of it does not even appear on the website.

On people who need to access the legislation that is passed in the Assembly, I am sure that the Minister would agree that it is virtually impossible to get that information at present. Unless you know the title of the legislation you cannot find it anywhere. It would be quite easy to list those pieces of legislation under 'titles', so that people can access them. There is some movement towards that, and I hope that the Minister can give an undertaking on that.

On the Conservative Party's amendments, the new building should not have been raised during this debate. Information about the new building should be given in a statement during a debate in the Chamber. I hope that we will have that debate soon so that we can have that information. It is hardly surprising that there is a fence around the site of the new

Derbyniaf fod hyn yn ymwneud â materion cyfrinachedd masnachol, ond, ar ôl i gontractau gael eu llofnodi, gellir sicrhau bod mwy o wybodaeth ar gael am gostau ac, yn benodol, ar y cyfrifiadau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cymharydd sector cyhoeddus a arweiniodd at y penderfyniad i ddewis y fenter cyllid preifat yn y lle cyntaf. Os yw'r wybodaeth hon yn rhy sensitif, yna mae angen sefydlu rhyw fath o ddull craffu er mwyn ei harchwilio. Dim ond wedyn y gallwn sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwerth am arian o gynlluniau menter cyllid preifat. Byddai dull o'r fath yn gwella'r cynllun ger ein bron heddiw. Gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog weithredu i ymdrin â'r pryderon hyn, a chyda'r ddau gafeat hyn, croesawaf y cynllun hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ceisiaf fod mor gryno â phosibl gan fod amser yn brin. O ran cael gafael ar wybodaeth yn electronig, a wnaiff y Gweinidog addo y prynhawn yma y caiff camau eu cymryd i'w gwneud yn haws i sefydliadau ddod o hyd i wybodaeth ar wefan y Cynulliad? Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn ymwybodol bod sawl sefydliad, yn enwedig yn y sector gwirfoddol, yn ei chael hi'n anodd cael y wybodaeth honno. Fel y dywedodd Peter, mae llawer o'r wybodaeth yn amherthnasol erbyn hyn, ac mae rhywfaint ohoni nad yw hyd yn oed yn ymddangos ar y wefan.

O ran pobl y mae angen iddynt gael gafael ar y ddeddfwriaeth a gaiff ei phasio yn y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno ei fod bron yn amhosibl cael y wybodaeth honno ar hyn o bryd. Oni bai eich bod yn gwybod teitl y ddeddfwriaeth ni allwch ddod o hyd iddi yn unman. Byddai'n eithaf hawdd rhestru'r darnau hynny o ddeddfwriaeth o dan 'deitlau', fel y gall pobl gael gafael arnynt. Bu ychydig o ddatblygiad i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, a gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi addewid ar hynny.

O ran gwelliannau'r Blaid Geidwadol, ni ddylid bod wedi codi pwnc yr adeilad newydd yn ystod y ddadl hon. Dylai gwybodaeth am yr adeilad newydd gael ei rhoi mewn datganiad yn ystod dadl yn y Siambr. Gobeithiaf y cawn y ddadl honno'n fuan fel y gallwn gael y wybodaeth honno. Nid yw'n syndod bod ffens o amgylch safle'r

building when Rhodri Morgan has been sitting on that fence for the last two years.

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I thank Members for their contributions this afternoon. I will refer to three matters. First, on information in electronic format, and especially the dissemination of information for the Legislation Committee, these matters are kept under constant review. They are not entirely in the province of the Government, but are matters that need to be taken up with the Presiding Office also. We need to ensure that information is as easy to access as possible. Work is constantly being done to ensure that that is the case. I am aware of the difficulty with the legislation that comes via the Legislation Committee. There is some difficulty and effort is needed to access the information, and it could be made easier. That is in hand.

I am grateful to Owen John for his prepared statement on Plaid Cymru's position on amendment 3. I will deal with that after I have dealt with Jonathan Morgan's amendments 1 and 2. Jonathan has said himself that, in effect, these amendments are not relevant to today's debate, but are a protest at how business has been handled. He mentions the Assembly Chamber, on which information will be made available to Members as the Finance Minister is able to do so. On the Assembly embassies, as he calls them—

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to the Minister for responding to the comments made about the delays to the new Assembly debating Chamber. However, there is a web page about the new Chamber that has not been updated for a considerable number of months. Why is that?

**Carwyn Jones:** I believe that that is a matter for the Presiding Office—I will be corrected if I am wrong. If it has not been updated I am sure that that will be looked at.

The embassies, as Jonathan calls them, have already been referred to. I fail to understand why the Conservatives' approach to marketing Wales is that we should hide in a

adeilad newydd pan fo Rhodri Morgan wedi bod yn eistedd ar y ffens honno am y ddwy flynedd diwethaf.

**Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau y prynhawn yma. Cyfeiriaf at dri mater. Yn gyntaf, o ran gwybodaeth ar ffurf electronig, ac yn enwedig o ran lledaenu gwybodaeth ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Deddfau, adolygir y materion hyn yn gyson. Nid ydynt ym maes y Llywodraeth yn llwyr, ond maent yn faterion y mae angen eu trafod hefyd gyda Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y wybodaeth mor hygyrch â phosibl. Gwneir gwaith cyson i sicrhau mai dyna sy'n digwydd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r anhawster gyda'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n dod drwy'r Pwyllgor Deddfau. Ceir peth anhawster ac mae angen ymdrechu i gael gafael ar y wybodaeth, a gellid gwneud hynny'n haws. Mae hynny o dan reolaeth.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Owen John am ei ddatganiad parod ar safbwynt Plaid Cymru ar welliant 3. Deliaf â hynny ar ôl imi ddelio â gwelliannau 1 a 2 Jonathan Morgan. Mae Jonathan ei hun wedi dweud, yn y bôn, nad yw'r gwelliannau hyn yn berthnasol i ddadl heddiw, ond yn wrthdystiad yn erbyn y modd yr ymdriniwyd â busnes. Mae'n sôn am Siambr y Cynulliad, y bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn rhoi gwybodaeth amdani i'r Aelodau, yn ôl ei gallu. O ran llysgenadaethau'r Cynulliad, fel y geilw ef hwy—

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ymateb i'r sylwadau a wnaed am yr oedi o ran Siambr ddadlau newydd y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ceir tudalen ar y Siambr newydd ar y we nas diweddarwyd ers rhai misoedd. Pam felly?

**Carwyn Jones:** Credaf mai mater i Swyddfa'r Llywydd yw hwnnw—caf fy nghywiro os wyf yn anghywir. Os na chafodd ei diweddarau yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff y mater ei unioni.

Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at y llysgenadaethau, fel y'u gelwir gan Jonathan. Ni ddeallaf pam mai cuddio mewn cornel a gadael i bobl eraill wneud y gwaith ar ein rhan yw ymagwedd y

corner and let other people do the work for us. Many communities in Wales suffer greatly from poverty, including Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tydfil, and much of the upper Valleys. We owe it to those communities to have bases in countries where money is available for investment in order to draw investment to those areas. To do otherwise would be a dereliction of our duty to those who live in the most deprived areas of Wales. Your suggestion that we should simply sit back and hope that the money comes to us, without going out to look for it as Ireland and Scotland do—and Scotland is not an independent state—would cause the people of Wales great concern. Those who live in the upper Valleys, and in other parts of Wales, would have serious questions about such a policy.

On amendment 3, the goalposts have moved slightly in that David now states that we should publish the overall level of allowances that we claim. Many Members do that; I am one of them. However, it is unfair to reveal allowances in such a way that the salaries of our staff would be revealed. That could happen. Many of us only employ one and a half members of staff, because that is all that we can afford out of the office costs allowance. If you publish the overall amount it would be possible for those members of staff to work out each other's salaries by subtracting their own. That would clearly be a breach of confidentiality. As far as those staff are concerned, it is most unfair. It is right that we as Assembly Members accept that our salaries are published, but I believe that the same rule does not apply to those who work for us, even though they are paid out of the public pot. If that were the case, it would also apply to doctors, teachers and anybody else who is paid out of the public purse.

**David Melding:** Northern Ireland publishes overall office costs. Those costs range from the salaries paid to staff, to the envelopes that you have to buy, to the rent that you pay, to the telephone bill. In that aggregation of costs, it is impossible to work out salary levels.

**Carwyn Jones:** I accept that. That is a new

Ceidwadwyr tuag at farchnata Cymru. Mae llawer o gymunedau yng Nghymru yn dioddef yn enbyd o dlodi, gan gynnwys Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tudful a llawer o'r Cymoedd uchaf. Er mwyn y cymunedau hynny, dylem sicrhau bod canolfannau gennym mewn gwledydd lle mae arian ar gael i'w fuddsoddi er mwyn denu buddsoddiad i'r ardaloedd hynny. Byddai gwneud fel arall yn esgeuluso ein dyletswydd i'r rhai sy'n byw yn ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru. Byddai eich awgrym y dylem laesu dwylo a gobeithio y daw'r arian atom, heb i ni orfod mynd i edrych amdano fel y gwna Iwerddon a'r Alban—ac nid yw'r Alban yn wlad annibynnol—yn peri pryder mawr i bobl Cymru. Byddai gan y rhai sy'n byw yn y Cymoedd uchaf ac mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, gwestiynau difrifol i'w gofyn ynghylch polisi o'r fath.

O ran gwelliant 3, mae'r pyst wedi symud ychydig gan fod David yn awr yn dweud y dylem gyhoeddi lefel gyffredinol y lwfansau a hawliwn. Gwna llawer o'r Aelodau hynny; yr wyf fi yn un ohonynt. Fodd bynnag, mae'n annheg datgelu lwfansau yn y fath fodd fel y byddai'n datgelu cyflogau ein staff. Gallai hynny ddigwydd. Dim ond un aelod a hanner o staff a gyflogir gan lawer ohonom gan na allwn fforddio mwy na hynny o'r lwfans costau swyddfa. Os cyhoeddych y swm cyffredinol byddai'n bosibl i'r aelodau staff hynny weithio cyflogau ei gilydd allan drwy ddidynnu eu cyflogau hwy eu hunain. Byddai hynny yn amlwg yn dor-cyfrinachedd. O ran y staff hynny mae'n annheg iawn. Mae'n iawn ein bod ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn derbyn bod ein cyflogau yn cael eu cyhoeddi, ond ni chredaf fod yr un rheol yn berthnasol i'r rhai sy'n gweithio i ni, er y cânt eu talu o bwrs y wlad. Pe bai hynny'n wir, byddai hefyd yn berthnasol i feddygon, athrawon ac unrhyw un arall a delir o bwrs y wlad.

**David Melding:** Mae Gogledd Iwerddon yn cyhoeddi costau swyddfa cyffredinol. Mae'r costau hynny yn amrywio o'r cyflogau a delir i staff, i'r amlenni y mae'n rhaid ichi eu prynu, i'r rhent a dalwch, i'r bil ffôn. Wrth gyfuno'r costau hynny, mae'n amhosibl gweithio lefelau cyflog allan.

**Carwyn Jones:** Derbyniat hynny. Mae



argument that you have put forward, which appears to overcome the difficulty with regard to the Data Protection Act 1998. However, it is a matter for the Assembly to decide in considering Standing Orders. It should not be decided upon today in considering the publication scheme. You are free to table a motion to amend Standing Orders so that allowances are published in this way. That is open to any Assembly Member, and can be taken forward. I know that you have corresponded with the Presiding Office on this, and you and I have discussed this matter many times, publicly and privately. If you are suggesting that overall allowances should be published, that can properly be put forward for the Assembly's view. However, today is not the day for that to happen.

**David Melding:** I am grateful to the Minister for giving way again. That is helpful. Will you provide time in the Assembly for me to propose this? For over 18 months I have tried to get the Assembly to discuss this issue. If it is best done by an attempt to amend Standing Orders, which would take a two-thirds majority vote in favour to pass—which is quite a test—that is what we should do. I have tabled a no named day motion in the past. It did not get time for a debate. Similarly, if I propose that Standing Orders be amended, unless you give me time, it will not get discussed.

**Carwyn Jones:** If you approach me formally on that, I will consider your request. You have made a formal request here, I also ask you to make it in writing so that the matter can be fully considered. I understand your argument and point of view. However, to say that we have a dark and miserable record in the Chamber is to over-salt the meat. We have a proud record on openness, and this publication scheme is an example of that. We can say emphatically that we are among the most open Government structures in western Europe, if not the most open Government structure. We are far in advance of what happens in most Whitehall departments and other devolved administrations. We are certainly far in advance of what happens in

honno'n ddadl newydd a gyflwynwyd gennych, sydd wedi goresgyn yr anhawster o ran Deddf Diogelu Data 1998 yn ôl pob tebyg. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r Cynulliad benderfynu arno ydyw wrth ystyried Rheolau Sefydlog. Ni ddylid dod i benderfyniad arno heddiw wrth ystyried y cynllun cyhoeddi. Mae gennych hawl i gyflwyno cynnig i ddiwygio Rheolau Sefydlog fel y gellir cyhoeddi lwfansau yn y ffordd hon. Mae hynny'n agored i unrhyw Aelod o'r Cynulliad, a gellir gweithredu ar hynny. Gwn eich bod wedi gohebu â Swyddfa'r Llywydd ar hyn, ac yr ydych chi a minnau wedi trafod y mater sawl gwaith, yn gyhoeddus ac yn breifat. Os ydych yn awgrymu y dylid cyhoeddi lwfansau cyffredinol, gellir cyflwyno hynny'n briodol ar gyfer barn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, nid heddiw yw'r diwrnod i hynny ddiwydd.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio eto. Mae hynny o gymorth. A ddarparwch amser yn y Cynulliad er mwyn i mi gynnig hyn? Yr wyf wedi ceisio cael y Cynulliad i drafod y mater hwn am 18 mis. Os mai'r ffordd orau o wneud hyn yw drwy ymdrechu i ddiwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog, a fyddai'n golygu mwyafrif pleidlais o ddwy ran o dair o blaid er mwyn llwyddo—sy'n dipyn o her—dyna'r hyn y dylem ei wneud. Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod yn y gorffennol. Ni chafodd amser ar gyfer dadl. Yn yr un modd, os cynigiau y dylid diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog, ni chaiff y mater ei drafod oni roddwch amser i mi.

**Carwyn Jones:** Os cysylltwch â mi yn ffurfiol ar y mater hwnnw, gwnaf ystyried eich cais. Gwnaethoch gais ffurfiol yma, a gofynnaf ichi wneud hynny yn ysgrifenedig hefyd fel y gellir ystyried y mater yn llawn. Deallaf eich dadl a'ch safbwynt. Fodd bynnag, mae dweud bod gennym hanes tywyll a diflas yn y Siambr yn gorddweud. Mae gennym hanes balch o fod yn agored ac mae'r cynllun cyhoeddi yn enghraifft o hynny. Gallwn ddweud yn bendant ein bod ymhlith y strwythurau Llywodraeth mwyaf agored yng ngorllewin Ewrop, os nad y mwyaf agored. Yr ydym ymhell ar y blaen i'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn rhan fwyaf o adrannau Whitehall a gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Yn sicr yr ydym ar y blaen i'r hyn sy'n

other western European Governments, at state and regional level. We should be proud of that. We should reject the words 'dark' and 'miserable', which arise out of a disagreement over the publication of one part of Assembly allowances. We can be proud of this publication scheme. It will make it easier for the people of Wales to engage with the Assembly Government and to relate to what happens in the Chamber. We can be proud of that. I ask the Assembly to reject any suggestion that there is any secrecy here. The publication scheme will go forward as a shining beacon to the rest of western Europe in terms of what can be done when an Assembly such as this decides that it wishes to be as open as possible.

digwydd mewn Llywodraethau eraill yng ngorllewin Ewrop, ar lefel gwlad a rhanbarth. Dylem fod yn falch o hynny. Dylem wrthod y geiriau 'tywyll' a 'diflas', sy'n deillio o anghytundeb ynghylch cyhoeddi un rhan o lwfansau'r Cynulliad. Gallwn fod yn falch o'r cynllun cyhoeddi hwn. Bydd yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl Cymru gysylltu â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac ymagweddu â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Siambr. Gallwn fod yn falch o hynny. Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod unrhyw awgrym fod unrhyw gyfrinachedd yma. Bydd y cynllun cyhoeddi yn datblygu fel arweinydd ysbrydoledig i weddill gorllewin Ewrop o ran yr hyn y gellir ei wneud pan fydd Cynulliad megis hwn yn penderfynu ei fod am fod mor agored â phosibl.

4:40 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.  
Amendment 1: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, David Ian  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.  
 Amendment 2: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 3, Ymatal 16, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 3: For 3, Abstain 16, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid: Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted for: The following Members voted against:

Jones, David Ian  
 Melding, David

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick

Morgan, Jonathan

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment rejected.*

*Cynnig (NMD1182): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NMD1182): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, David Ian  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Law, Peter  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Business Minister (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that **Y Trefnydd (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.10, postpones the debate on the annual report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity until next Tuesday, 29 October.* *y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.10, yn gohirio'r ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal hyd ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 29 Hydref.*

I propose this motion in view of the need to protect the time for the short debate and the fact that we had an urgent question today, which causes difficulty with timing. I have informed the other party business managers of my intention to do this.

Cynigiau y cynnig hwn o gofio'r angen i gadw amser ar gyfer y ddadl fer a'r ffaith inni gael cwestiwn brys heddiw, sy'n creu anhawster gyda'r amseru. Yr wyf wedi hysbysu rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau eraill o'm bwriad i wneud hyn.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n ofynnol imi

required to put this motion to the vote, but it will only be carried if fewer than 10 Members object to it. ofyn ichi bleidleisio ar y cynnig hwn, ond dim ond os bydd llai na 10 Aelod yn ei wrthwynebu y caiff ei dderbyn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Procedural: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gibbons, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, David Ian  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Law, Peter  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Cau Ysgolion Bach yng Nghymru The Closure of Small Schools in Wales**

**David Davies:** I am delighted to have the **David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i

opportunity to raise this issue this afternoon. I will allow time for Jonathan Morgan, Phil Williams, Mick Bates and Delyth Evans to contribute.

This issue is of particular concern to me because of how closures have been forced through in my own constituency of Monmouth. I do not apologise for the fact that I will highlight those in particular. I am pleased that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is replying to this debate in person. Minister, these schools can only close with your consent and I hope that we can persuade you to support parents and teachers in their fight to keep these schools open.

It is not only the decision to close schools that has caused anger, but the manner in which decisions have been made, which flies in the face of the principles of accountability and local democracy. Over the past 18 months, a consultation process took place on the future of several schools and parents were constantly told that councillors would listen to their views. They have made their views perfectly clear: they wanted their schools to remain open. Every one of those parents wants what is best for their children. If the local education authority and councillors think that they can improve on the current levels of education, the onus must be on them to prove it and satisfy parents in that regard, rather than simply railroading through any changes that they wish to make. As the numbers present in the public gallery and in the neuadd today demonstrate, the council has manifestly failed to make its case, and a closure programme in Monmouthshire will undermine the local education authority's ability to give parents confidence in educational standards.

In Abergavenny, particular concern has been expressed about the closure of two infant schools—Park Street Infants and Croesonen Infants. These are excellent schools with good Estyn reports, and Croesonen Infants is a grade one school. The LEA officials and councillors were the first to admit in a public meeting that both these schools deliver excellent standards. Both are situated in the heart of the catchment areas they serve and, as Members can see this afternoon, have the

godî'r mater hwn y prynhawn yma. Caniataf amser i Jonathan Morgan, Phil Williams, Mick Bates a Delyth Evans gyfrannu.

Mae'r mater hwn yn destun pryder arbennig i mi oherwydd y modd y mae cynlluniau i gau ysgolion wedi cael ei gwthio drwodd yn fy etholaeth i ym Mynwy. Nid ymddiheuraf am dynnu sylw yn arbennig at y rheini. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ateb y ddadl hon yn bersonol. Weinidog, dim ond gyda'ch caniatâd chi y gall yr ysgolion hyn gau a gobeithiaf y gallwn eich darbwyllo i gefnogi rhieni ac athrawon yn eu brwydr i gadw'r ysgolion hyn ar agor.

Nid yn unig y penderfyniad i gau ysgolion sydd wedi achosi dicter, ond y modd y gwnaed penderfyniadau, sydd yn gwbl groes i egwyddorion atebolrwydd a democratiaeth leol. Dros y 18 mis diwethaf cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad ar ddyfodol nifer o ysgolion a dywedwyd yn gyson wrth rieni y byddai cynghorwyr yn gwrando ar eu barn. Mynegasant eu barn yn gwbl eglur: yr oeddent am i'w hysgolion aros ar agor. Mae pob un o'r rhieni hynny am gael y gorau i'w plant. Os yw'r awdurdod addysg lleol a chynghorwyr yn credu y gallant wella ar y lefelau addysg presennol, mae dyletswydd arnynt i brofi hynny a bodloni rhieni yn hynny o beth, yn hytrach na gwthio unrhyw newidiadau y maent am eu gwneud drwodd. Fel y dengys y niferoedd sy'n bresennol yn yr oriel gyhoeddus ac yn y neuadd heddiw, mae'r cyngor yn amlwg wedi methu â chyflwyno ei achos a bydd rhaglen cau ysgolion yn Sir Fynwy yn tanseilio gallu'r awdurdod addysg lleol i roi hyder i rieni mewn safonau addysgol.

Yn y Fenni, mynegwyd pryder arbennig am gau dwy ysgol babanod—Ysgol Babanod Park Street ac Ysgol Babanod Croesonen. Mae'r rhain yn ysgolion ardderchog a gafodd adroddiadau da gan Estyn, ac mae Ysgol Babanod Croesonen yn ysgol o'r radd flaenaf. Yr oedd swyddogion yr AALL a'r cynghorwyr gyda'r cyntaf i gyfaddef mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus bod y ddwy ysgol hon yn darparu safonau ardderchog. Lleolir y ddwy yng nghanol y dalgylchoedd y maent yn eu

overwhelming support of parents, teachers and children. If there were a financial reason for closing these schools, I could understand the decision. However, it has always been maintained that there is no financial incentive to do this and that finance does not come into it. Therefore, the reasons are far from clear.

Two good schools are to be closed. Parents will be expected to trust the education authority to deliver a comparable standard of education from all-through primary schools, despite the fact that one of those schools will be located on the site of Llwynu Infants School, which faces significant challenges, despite the good efforts of the excellent staff there. Local confidence has been further undermined by the fact that councillors do not support the closure decisions. On 25 July, councillors showed that they had listened to local people, and voted for an option that would have maintained Park Street and Croesonen as infants schools, preserved nearby Harold Road school as a junior school, and developed a brand new school on the site of the current Llwynu Infants School—a solution that would have satisfied everyone. It was always understood that the council cabinet would adhere to the council's wishes. However, a few days later, the incoming cabinet from a different political party—I will not say which one, because I will not allow this to become a political debate—threw out the decision that had been made by a majority of councillors, and voted for an option that would lead to the closure of the Park Street and Croesonen schools. Such a decision makes a mockery of the principle of local democracy. Local authorities and local councillors should represent the people who elect them, not rule over them.

A few miles away, three more infant schools—Llanfair Kilgeddin Church in Wales Primary School, Llanover Primary School, and Llanfoist Primary School—are being closed and replaced by a large all-through primary school to be built on the site of a school at Govilon. Some of these schools have had surplus places, as measured by the Assembly's formula, but all offered a good standard of education. Moreover, they offered a safe and friendly environment for youngsters embarking on their school lives.

gwasanaethu, ac fel y gwêl yr Aelodau y prynhawn yma, cânt gefnogaeth ysgubol gan rieni, athrawon a phlant. Pe bai rheswm ariannol dros gau yr ysgolion hyn, gallwn ddeall y penderfyniad. Fodd bynnag, dadleuwyd yn gyson nad oes cymhelliant ariannol dros wneud hyn ac nad yw cyllid yn ffactor. Felly, nid yw'r rhesymau yn eglur o gwbl.

Bwriedir cau dwy ysgol dda. Bydd disgwyl i rieni ymddiried yn yr awdurdod addysg i gyflwyno safon gymharol o addysg mewn ysgolion cynradd i fabanod ac i blant iau, er gwaethaf y ffaith y bydd un o'r ysgolion hyn wedi ei lleoli ar safle Ysgol Babanod Llwynu, sy'n wynebu heriau sylweddol, er gwaethaf ymdrechion da y staff ardderchog sydd yno. Tanseiliwyd hyder lleol ymhellach gan y ffaith nad yw'r cynghorwyr yn cefnogi'r penderfyniadau i gau'r ysgolion. Ar 25 Gorffennaf, dangosodd cynghorwyr eu bod wedi gwrandao ar bobl leol, gan bleidleisio am y dewis fyddai wedi cadw Park Street a Croesonen fel ysgolion babanod, cadw ysgol Heol Harold gerllaw fel ysgol iau, a datblygu ysgol newydd sbon ar safle presennol ysgol Babanod Llwynu—ateb a fyddai wedi bodloni pawb. Yr oedd wedi cael ei dderbyn erioed y byddai cabinet y cyngor yn parhau dymuniadau'r cyngor. Fodd bynnag, rai diwrnodau yn ddiweddarach, taflodd y cabinet newydd o blaid wleidyddol wahanol—ni ddywedaf pa un, oherwydd ni chaniatâf i'r ddadl hon droi'n ddadl wleidyddol—y penderfyniad a wnaed gan fwyafrif y cynghorwyr o'r neilltu gan bleidleisio dros ddewis a fyddai'n arwain at gau ysgolion Park Street a Chroesonen. Mae penderfyniad o'r fath yn mynd yn groes i egwyddor democratiaeth leol. Dylai awdurdodau lleol a chynghorwyr lleol gynrychioli'r bobl a'u hetholodd, nid rheoli drostynt.

Ychydig filltiroedd i ffwrdd, mae tair ysgol fabanod arall—Ysgol Gynradd yr Eglwys yng Nghymru Llanfair Cilgedin, Ysgol Gynradd Llanofor Fawr, ac Ysgol Gynradd Llanffwyst—yn cael eu cau gydag ysgol gynradd fawr i fabanod a phlant iau yn cael ei chodi yn eu lle ar safle ysgol yng Ngofilon. Bu gan rai o'r ysgolion hyn leoedd gwag, fel y mesurwyd yn ôl fformiwla'r Cynulliad, ond yr oedd pob un ohonynt yn cynnig safon dda o addysg. Yn ogystal yr oeddent yn cynnig amgylchedd diogel a chyfeillgar i blant oedd yn dechrau ar



Developing this new school in Govilon will mean large numbers of four, five and six-year-olds being packed off on buses on a journey of several miles in each direction, along winding country lanes. These children will no longer be taken to schools holding their mum or dad's hand, they will be packed off on buses, which is not good enough for children of that age. It is also an absurd decision from the point of view of transport costs and the effect that travelling those distances will have on young children. In the case of Llanfoist Primary School, parents are rightly angry about the fact that they were given the impression that any new school would be built in their village, which is more centrally placed. The council's sudden and mysterious change of heart has not given them a fair chance to make their case.

I also draw the Minister's attention to the proposed merger of the Osbaston Infants and Osbaston Juniors schools in Monmouth. These are two distinct schools, located 100 yards apart—no-one can understand how a merger of these schools could possibly improve the service they offer. They are successful schools, with excellent inspection reports, few surplus places, and modern, good quality buildings. Transfer from one school to the other is seamless. The only possible advantage of a merger would be a small cost benefit, which must be measured against the risk that such changes could lead to a decline in the high standards of those schools.

4:50 p.m.

There can be nothing more important to any of us than the education of our children. If a school is failing, we should consider closing it and moving children elsewhere. However, where is the logic in closing good schools that offer a high standard of education? Monmouthshire County Council and the local education authority are determined to proceed with these proposals. I do not understand why. You are our last hope, Minister, and that is why I chose this topic today. The fate of these schools rests in your hands. You will have to take the decision, and you will have a simple choice: either follow the advice of LEA officials and a small nucleus of council cabinet members, or heed the voices of parents, pupils,

eu bywydau ysgol. Bydd datblygu'r ysgol hon yng Ngofilon yn golygu nifer fawr o blant pedair, pump a chwe blwydd oed yn cael eu rhoi ar fysiau ar daith o nifer o filltiroedd bob ffordd, ar hyd ffyrdd gwledig troellog. Ni fydd y plant hyn bellach yn cael eu cludo i ysgolion yn dal dwylo eu mam neu eu tad, byddant yn cael eu pacio ar fysiau, ac nid yw hyn yn ddigon da i blant o'r oedran hwn. Mae hefyd yn benderfyniad ffôl o safbwynt costau trafniadaeth a'r effaith a gaiff teithio'r pellteroedd hyn ar blant ifanc. Yn achos Ysgol Gynradd Llanffwyst, mae rhieni yn iawn i fod yn ddig ynglŷn â'r ffaith iddynt gael yr argraff y byddai unrhyw ysgol newydd yn cael ei chodi yn eu pentref hwy, sy'n fwy canolog. Nid yw'r ffaith i'r cyngor newid ei feddwl yn sydyn a rhyfedd wedi rhoi cyfle teg iddynt i gyflwyno eu hachos.

Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog hefyd at y bwriad i uno Ysgol Fabanod Osbaston ac Ysgol Gynradd Osbaston yn Nhrefynwy. Mae'r rhain yn ddwy ysgol ar wahân, wedi'u lleoli ganllath oddi wrth ei gilydd—ni all unrhyw un ddeall sut y gall uno'r ysgolion hyn wella'r gwasanaeth a gynigir ganddynt mewn unrhyw fodd. Maent yn ysgolion llwyddiannus gydag adroddiadau arolygiad ardderchog, ychydig o leoedd dros ben, ac adeiladau modern o safon dda. Mae'r broses o drosglwyddo o un ysgol i'r llall yn ddi-fwlch. Unig fantais bosibl uno fyddai mantais fechan o ran cost, y mae'n rhaid ei mesur yn erbyn y risg y gallai newidiadau o'r fath arwain at ddirywiad yn safonau uchel yr ysgolion hynny.

Nid oes dim sy'n bwysicach i unrhyw un ohonom nag addysg ein plant. Os yw ysgol yn methu, dylem ystyried ei chau a symud y plant i rywle arall. Fodd bynnag pa reswm sydd dros gau ysgolion da sy'n cynnig safon uchel o addysg? Mae Cyngor Sir Fynwy a'r awdurdod addysg lleol yn benderfynol o fwrw ymlaen â'r cynigion hyn. Ni ddeallaf pam. Chi yw ein gobaith olaf, Weinidog, a dyna paham y dewisais y pwnc hwn heddiw. Mae tynged yr ysgolion hyn yn eich dwylo. Bydd yn rhaid i chi wneud y penderfyniad, a bydd gennych ddewis syml: naill ai dilyn cyngor swyddogion yr AALl a chnewllyn bach o aelodau o gabinet y cyngor, neu wrando ar lais rhieni, disgyblion, athrawon a chynghorwyr etholedig megis y

teachers and elected councillors such as those in the public gallery and the neuadd this afternoon. All we ask is that, when you receive the closure orders, you consider the circumstances carefully and remember the years of loyal service that these schools have provided to their communities. We ask you to remember the generations of four and five-year-olds who have taken their first steps into the protective environment of an infants school a few yards from their front door. Who on earth would want to send their four-year-old to catch a bus to a huge school miles away from home?

Whatever the so-called experts say about the benefits of all-through primary schools today, they may well say the opposite tomorrow. When those school gates slam shut for the last time, they will stay shut forever. You have the power to prevent that from happening. On behalf of everyone present today, and many others in Monmouthshire, I ask you to reject any orders to close these schools. Let them stay open, Minister, and offer many more years of good service for future generations of children. *[Applause.]*

**Jonathan Morgan:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservatives, I thank David for bringing this issue to the Assembly's attention this afternoon. He has led the campaign to keep these schools in his constituency open magnificently. We support him in his efforts. Small schools throughout Wales are closed quickly. There is no presumption against closure, and the Minister is all too ready to play a part in these closures. Small schools are often the hub of small communities in Wales and are vital in supporting them. Many of the schools deliver on the curriculum; they may do so in small classrooms and with few teachers, but they meet Estyn's requirements. Small schools can be much more expensive to run. However, along with that cost comes benefits to the local community and to the parents, whose children are educated in their local school. We should support small rural schools, not close them.

**Phil Williams:** I am grateful to David Davies for the opportunity to present one aspect of the

rhieni yn yr oriel gyhoeddus a'r neuadd y prynhawn hwn. Yr unig beth a ofynnwn, pan dderbyniwch y gorchmynion cau, yw eich bod yn ystyried yr amgylchiadau yn ofalus ac yn cofio'r blynyddoedd o wasanaeth teyrngar roddwyd gan yr ysgolion hyn i'w cymunedau. Gofynnwn i chi gofio'r cenedlaethau o blant pedair a phump oed sydd wedi cymryd eu camau cyntaf i mewn i amgylchedd gwarchodol ysgol babanod ychydig lathenni o garreg eu drws. Pwy yn y byd mawr fyddai am anfon eu plentyn pedair oed i ddal bws i fynd i ysgol enfawr filltiroedd o'u cartref?

Beth bynnag a ddywed yr arbenigwyr bondigrybwyll am fanteision ysgolion cynradd i fabanod a phlant iau heddiw, efallai y byddant yn dweud y gwrthwyneb yfory. Pan fydd gatiau yr ysgolion hyn yn cau am y tro olaf, byddant yn aros ar gau am byth. Mae gennych y grym i atal hynny rhag digwydd. Ar ran pawb sydd yma heddiw, a llawer rhagor yn Sir Fynwy, gofynnaf i chi wrthod unrhyw orchmynion i gau'r ysgolion hyn. Gadewch iddynt aros ar agor, Weinidog, a chynnig llawer rhagor o flynyddoedd o wasanaeth da ar gyfer cenedlaethau o blant i'r dyfodol. *[Cymeradwyaeth.]*

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ar ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru, diolchaf i David am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma. Mae wedi arwain yr ymgyrch i gadw'r ysgolion hyn yn ei etholaeth ar agor yn wych. Cefnogwn ef yn ei ymdrechion. Caiff ysgolion bach ledled Cymru eu cau yn gyflym. Nid oes rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn cau, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn llawer rhy barod i chwarae rhan yn y cau hwn. Mae ysgolion bach yn aml yn ganolfannau cymunedau bach Cymru ac maent yn hanfodol i'w cynnal. Mae llawer o'r ysgolion yn cyflawni'r cwricwlwm; efallai eu bod yn gwneud hynny mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth bach a chydag ychydig o athrawon, ond maent yn diwallu gofynion Estyn. Gall ysgolion bach fod yn llawer mwy costus i'w rhedeg. Fodd bynnag, ynghyd â'r costau hynny daw manteision i'r gymuned leol a'r rhieni y mae eu plant yn cael eu haddysgu yn eu hysgol leol. Dylem gefnogi ysgolion bach gwledig nid eu cau.

**Phil Williams:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i David Davies am y cyfle hwn i gyflwyno un agwedd

proposed reorganisation of schools in Abergavenny. Plaid Cymru's prime concern in any decision on school closure is the quality of education provided. We only oppose a closure when we are certain that it will damage the quality of the education offered. One consequence of the proposed scheme would be the relocation of Ysgol Gymraeg y Fenni. As a member of a family that spoke Monmouth Welsh, the success of Welsh-medium schools in Monmouthshire gives me great pleasure. Ysgol Gymraeg y Fenni is a great success. As a Welsh-medium school, it has a wide catchment area for pupils and teachers. Its current location is ideal. I understand that the parents' association's preference is that it remains at its present site. However, the important point, which unites everyone in this debate, is that the association, along with many people in Abergavenny, does not feel that its views and concerns have been properly considered—at least not by the council cabinet, if not by the county council as a whole. For that reason alone, we should ask the county council to undertake a fuller consultation, to take the views of the vast majority of people into account, and to reconsider its stance.

**Mick Bates:** I am grateful to David for introducing this important topic. The Welsh Liberal Democrats support the parents and teachers in their campaign to keep their schools open, for all the reasons that have been highlighted. Our leader in the Assembly, Mike German, has slammed the proposals to close these schools. However, there is a political dimension to this and we must remember that Monmouthshire council has a Labour cabinet. More lobbying is required to ensure that all county councillors vote against these proposals. I do not think that it is a closed game. We must also remember that it was the Conservatives who first introduced these proposals.

To end on a positive note, the partnership Government has adopted our policy and has introduced funding to help such schools restructure. The message that we must convey to the county council today is that the partnership Government has given £60,000, I believe, to Monmouthshire council to aid restructuring. Unfortunately, once these schools close, they will never reopen.

ar yr adrefnu arfaethedig i ysgolion yn y Fenni. Prif bryder Plaid Cymru mewn unrhyw benderfyniad ar gau ysgolion yw ansawdd yr addysg gynigir. Dim ond pan fyddwn yn gwbl sicr y bydd y cau yn niweidiol i ansawdd yr addysg a gynigir y byddwn yn ei wrthwynebu. Un o ganlyniadau'r cynllun arfaethedig fyddai adleoli Ysgol Gymraeg y Fenni. Fel aelod o deulu a siaradai Gymraeg Sir Fynwy, mae llwyddiant ysgolion Cymraeg yn Sir Fynwy yn rhoi pleser mawr i mi. Mae Ysgol Gymraeg y Fenni yn llwyddiant mawr. Fel ysgol Gymraeg, mae ganddi ddalgylch eang ar gyfer disgyblion ac athrawon. Mae ei lleoliad presennol yn ddelfrydol. Deallaf mai'r dewis sydd orau gan y gymdeithas rhieni yw ei bod yn aros ar ei safle presennol. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt pwysig, sy'n uno pawb yn y ddadl hon, yw nad yw'r gymdeithas rieni ynghyd â llawer o bobl y Fenni, yn teimlo bod ei barn a'i phryderon wedi cael eu hystyried yn iawn—nid gan gabinet y cyngor beth bynnag, os nad y cyngor sir cyfan. Am y rheswm hwnnw'n unig, dylem ofyn i'r cyngor sir gynnal ymgynghoriad ehangach i ystyried barn y mwyafrif llethol o bobl, ac i ail ystyried ei safbwynt.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn ddioghar i David am gyflwyno'r pwnc pwysig hwn. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r rhieni a'r athrawon yn eu hymgyrch i gadw eu hysgolion ar agor, am bob un o'r rhesymau a amlygwyd. Mae Mike German, ein harweinydd yn y Cynulliad, wedi condemnio'r cynigion i gau'r ysgolion hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae dimensiwn gwleidyddol i hyn a dylem gofio bod gan gyngor Sir Fynwy gabinet Llafur. Mae angen mwy o lobïo i sicrhau bod yr holl gynghorwyr sir yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynigion hyn. Nid wyf yn credu mai dyma ddiwedd y mater. Rhaid inni hefyd gofio mai'r Ceidwadwyr oedd y cyntaf i gyflwyno'r cynigion hyn.

I gloi ar nodyn cadarnhaol, mabwysiadodd y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth ein polisi ac mae wedi cyflwyno arian i helpu ysgolion o'r fath i ailstrwythuro. Y neges y mae'n rhaid inni ei chyfleu i'r cyngor sir heddiw yw bod y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth wedi rhoi £60,000, mi gredaf, i gyngor Sir Fynwy i gynorthwyo gydag ailstrwythuro. Yn anffodus unwaith y bydd yr ysgolion hyn yn cau ni fyddant byth

yn ailagor.

**Delyth Evans:** Yn wahanol i Mick Bates, yr wyf am ymrwnged â'r demtasiwn i wneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol. Mae unrhyw lywodraeth leol neu genedlaethol sy'n gorfod penderfynu ar ddyfodol ysgolion yn wynebu'r un problemau. Nid oes un plaid yn well nag unrhyw blaid arall wrth ddelio â phroblem anodd dyfodol ysgolion bach, â niferoedd plant yn lleihau mewn sawl cymuned.

Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod gan ysgolion bach a gwledig ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn mywyd cymuned. Bu Richard Edwards a minnau yn ymgyrchu i gadw ysgolion bach ar agor yn Sir Benfro. Methiant fu ein hymdrechion, ac yr oedd yn resyn gennyf am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn parhau'r modd yr ystyriodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr achosion. Nid oedd modd anghytuno â'r broses. Nid yw'r Gweinidog mewn sefyllfa rwydd pan fo'n rhaid iddi ystyried yr achosion hyn, sy'n cynnwys pob math o ffactorau.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod y Cynulliad wedi datblygu polisi newydd ar ysgolion gwledig a bach. Mae'r ddogfen bolisi yn werthfawr, ac mae'n pwyleisio'r egwyddor mai gallu ysgol i ddarparu addysg o safon uchel i ddisgyblion sy'n ganolog i bob penderfyniad. Mae'n bwysig i bawb ddeall hynny.

Hoffwn weld mwy o bwysau ar awdurdodau lleol i ystyried ysbryd y polisi newydd hwn. Ni chredaf eu bod yn ymateb yn ddigonol i arweiniad y Cynulliad ar ddyfodol ysgolion bach. Hoffwn eu gweld yn gweithio'n fwy dygn i ddiogelu ysgolion o fewn y polisi newydd a ddatblygwyd yn y Cynulliad dan arweiniad y Gweinidog.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am grateful for all contributions to this debate. I welcome the visitors who are in the public gallery for this important debate. There is a rich variety of school provision in Wales. What works in Newport would not necessarily work in Newbridge-on-Wye, and that is why local education authorities are responsible for the supply of school places

**Delyth Evans:** Unlike Mick Bates, I will resist the temptation to make political points. Any local or national government that must decide on the future of schools faces the same problems. No one party is better than the others in terms of dealing with the difficult issue of the future of small schools, while the number of children is decreasing in many communities.

We all accept that small and rural schools play an important part in community life. Richard Edwards and I campaigned to keep small schools open in Pembrokeshire. We failed in our efforts, and I regret that. However, I respect the way in which the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning considered the cases. The process was beyond reproach. The Minister is not in an easy position when she must consider these cases, which include all kinds of factors.

It is important to acknowledge that the Assembly has developed a new policy on rural and small schools. The policy document is valuable, and it emphasises the principle that all decisions should be based on a school's ability to provide a high standard of education. It is important that everyone understands that.

I would like to see more pressure on local authorities to consider the spirit of this new policy. I do not believe that they are responding sufficiently to the Assembly's lead on the future of small schools. I would like to see them work harder to safeguard schools within the new policy developed in the Assembly under the Minister's guidance.

**Y Gweinidog Dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr holl gyfraniadau i'r ddadl hon. Croesawaf yr ymwelwyr sydd yn yr oriel gyhoeddus ar gyfer y ddadl bwysig hon. Ceir amrywiaeth gyfoethog o ddarpariaeth ysgolion yng Nghymru. Nid yw'r hyn sy'n gweithio yng Nghasnewydd o reidrwydd yn gweithio yn y Bontnewydd ar Wŷ, a dyna paham y mae awdurdodau addysg lleol yn gyfrifol am y cyflenwad o leoedd mewn

and for planning where those places should be located. There is no doubt that local education authorities are in the best position to plan for the education of young people in their areas.

I have deliberately not set a minimum acceptable size for schools because local circumstances vary. There is no fixed point at which a school ceases to be viable. During the first week of this school term, I set myself the task of visiting all local education authorities in Wales. I want to consider as many schools as possible during this grand tour. I have now visited 20 of the 22 authorities, and I have been generally impressed by what I have seen. I have visited urban and rural authorities, and I have seen large and small schools. I was looking for examples of good practice in several policy areas that we have been pursuing. I was heartened to see that good work is being done in large and small schools alike.

There are over 1,600 primary schools in Wales. Almost 500 of those could be considered as small, as they have fewer than 90 pupils. About 14 per cent of Wales's primary schools have 50 pupils or less, compared with only 4 per cent in England. As expected, more than half of Wales's small primary schools are in four of the most rural authorities in Wales. Over 70 per cent of Ceredigion's primary schools are small. Almost 70 per cent of Carmarthenshire and Gwynedd schools are small, and over 60 per cent of schools in Powys are small.

5:00 p.m.

We have not adopted a policy that small schools should close. Some small schools are excellent. Evidence from Estyn reports and standard assessment tests shows that, in Wales, small schools on average perform no better and no worse than large schools. Nevertheless, small schools face particular challenges in terms of curriculum delivery. Teaching a class of up to 30 children with a seven-year age range is a challenge I would not relish. Another fact is that small schools tend to be more costly to run. Also, small schools are sometimes housed in unsatisfactory buildings that are expensive to

ysgolion ac am gynllunio lle y dylai'r lleoedd hynny gael eu lleoli. Nid oes amheuaeth mai'r awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i gynllunio ar gyfer addysg pobl ifanc yn eu hardaloedd.

Ni phennais isafswm maint derbyniol ar gyfer ysgolion yn fwriadol oherwydd bod amgylchiadau lleol yn amrywio. Nid oes pwynt penodol pan fo ysgol yn peidio â bod yn ymarferol i'w gweithredu. Yn ystod wythnos gyntaf y tymor ysgol hwn, gosodais y dasg imi fy hun o ymweld â phob awdurdod addysg lleol yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am ystyried cynifer o ysgolion â phosibl yn ystod y daith fawr hon. Yr wyf yn awr wedi ymweld ag 20 o blith y 22 o awdurdodau, ac yn gyffredinol wedi cael argraff dda o'r hyn a welais. Ymwelais ag awdurdodau trefol a gwledig, ac yr wyf wedi gweld ysgolion mawr a bach. Yr oeddwn yn edrych am enghreifftiau o arfer da mewn sawl maes polisi y buom yn eu dilyn. Fe'm calonogwyd o weld bod gwaith da yn digwydd mewn ysgolion mawr a bach fel ei gilydd.

Mae dros 1,600 o ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru. Gellid ystyried bron 500 o'r rheini fel rhai bach, gan fod ganddynt lai na 90 o ddisgyblion. Mae gan tua 14 y cant o ysgolion cynradd Cymru 50 o ddisgyblion neu lai, o gymharu â dim ond 4 y cant yn Lloegr. Fel y disgwyliid, mae rhagor na hanner ysgolion cynradd bach Cymru mewn pedwar o'r awdurdodau mwyaf gwledig yng Nghymru. Mae dros 70 y cant o ysgolion cynradd Ceredigion yn ysgolion bach. Mae bron 70 y cant o ysgolion Sir Gaerfyrddin a Gwynedd yn ysgolion bach, a thros 60 y cant o ysgolion Powys.

Nid ydym wedi mabwysiadu polisi y dylid cau ysgolion bach. Mae rhai ysgolion bach yn ardderchog. Mae tystiolaeth o adroddiadau Estyn a phroffion asesu safonol yn dangos nad yw ysgolion bach, yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd yn perfformio'n well nac yn waeth nag ysgolion mawr. Serch hynny, mae ysgolion bach yn wynebu heriau arbennig yn y gwaith o gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm. Mae dysgu dosbarth o hyd at 30 o blant gydag ystod oedran o saith mlynedd yn her na fyddai'n dda gennyf. Ffaith arall yw bod ysgolion bach yn tueddu i fod yn fwy costus i'w rhedeg. Hefyd, mae ysgolion bach weithiau mewn adeiladau anfodddhaol sy'n

heat and keep in repair.

Some authorities, as you are all well aware, have been undertaking strategic reviews of the schools serving their areas. We have encouraged authorities to undertake strategic reviews because they are under an obligation to meet the needs of their areas as cost-effectively as possible. They owe that to the electorate and to the learners in their communities. Those authorities must improve and strengthen educational standards. They must tackle issues such as surplus capacity, poor quality buildings and effective curriculum delivery. Sometimes, that means that authorities make the tough decision that the closure of a small school is the best way to meet their aims.

However, it would be a total exaggeration to say, as Jonathan implied, that large numbers of small schools in Wales have been closed or are lined up for closure. I have just been through the figures: over the last 10 years, two or three small schools a year have been closed in Wales. Those closures often occurred with public support because people liked the alternative. Not all those proposals have come to the Secretary of State or to the Assembly for decision. Therefore I reject the idea that the Minister acts all too readily to close schools.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will you join me in congratulating the members of Powys County Council who overturned the council board's decision to close Trecastle and Libanus primary schools? Those small schools are now progressing through this term with a brighter future. That is an example that disproves what Jonathan said and shows that small schools are being kept open.

**Jane Davidson:** I can no more congratulate Powys County Council than I can comment on current proposals in Monmouthshire because I have a quasi-judicial role as Minister. I wish to clarify the process of how a case reaches the Assembly Minister for decision. The important point is that the county council is best placed to consider proposals. However, it must carry out its legal obligations effectively. Given my quasi-judicial role in determining any

gostus i'w gwresogi a'u cadw mewn cyflwr da.

Mae rhai awdurdodau, fel y gwyddoch yn dda, wedi cynnal adolygiadau strategol o'r ysgolion sy'n gwasanaethu eu hardaloedd. Yr ydym wedi annog awdurdodau i gynnal adolygiadau strategol oherwydd bod rheidrwydd i ddiwallu anghenion eu hardaloedd mor gost effeithiol â phosibl. Mae arnynt ddyletswydd i'w hetholwyr i wneud hynny ac i ddysgwyr yn eu hardaloedd. Rhaid i'r awdurdodau hynny wella a chryfhau safonau addysgol. Rhaid iddynt fynd i'r afael â materion megis gormod o gapasiti, adeiladau mewn cyflwr gwael a chyflwyno'r cwricwlwm yn effeithiol. Weithiau, golyga hynny bod awdurdodau yn gwneud penderfyniad anodd mai cau ysgol fach yw'r ffordd orau iddynt gyflawni eu hamcanion.

Fodd bynnag, byddai'n ormodiaith llwyr i ddweud, fel yr awgrymodd Jonathan, bod niferoedd mawr o ysgolion bach yng Nghymru wedi'u cau, neu ar fin cael eu cau. Yr wyf newydd edrych ar y ffigurau: dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf caewyd dwy neu dair ysgol fach yng Nghymru. Digwyddodd hynny yn aml gyda chefnogaeth y cyhoedd oherwydd bod pobl yn hoffi'r dewis amgen. Ni ddaeth un o'r cynigion hynny gerbron yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol na'r Cynulliad i ddyfarnu arnynt. Felly gwrthodaf y syniad bod y Gweinidog yn rhy barod i gymryd camau i gau ysgolion.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch yr aelodau o Gyngor Sir Powys a wydrodd benderfyniad bwrdd y cyngor i gau ysgolion cynradd Trecastell a Libanus? Mae'r ysgolion bach hynny yn mynd rhagddynt y tymor hwn gyda dyfodol mwy llewyrchus. Mae hynny'n enghraifft sy'n gwrthbrofi yr hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan ac mae'n dangos bod ysgolion bach yn cael eu cadw ar agor.

**Jane Davidson:** Ni allaf longyfarch Cyngor Sir Powys yn fwy nag y gallaf wneud sylw ar gynigion presennol Sir Fynwy gan fod gennyf rôl lled-farnwrol fel Gweinidog. Hoffwn esbonio'r broses o sut y bydd achos yn cyrraedd Gweinidog y Cynulliad i benderfynu arno. Y pwynt pwysig yw mai'r cyngor sir sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ystyried cynigion. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid iddo gyflawni ei swyddogaethau cyfreithiol yn effeithiol. O gofio fy rôl lled-farnwrol mewn penderfynu ar unrhyw gynigion

statutory proposals that are opposed, it is not appropriate for me to comment on any proposals until I have considered all the evidence and can issue a reasoned decision that takes into account the views of all concerned. In this instance, Monmouthshire County Council has not formally published proposals, and we are not in a position to predict what they will be.

It is important that everyone in the Chamber fully understands the process. The statutory process for proposals to close, open or alter any type of school gives maximum opportunity for local people to have their say. The democratically elected members of a local authority must first be convinced that there is a good case for change before beginning the statutory process. All interested parties in the local area must then be consulted, and alternatives to closure considered. Views must be taken into account before a decision is made to publish a statutory notice. Once notices are published, anyone may object, and objectors have two months in which to make their objections to the local authority. If objections are made, the proposal comes to the Minister for determination. Whenever I am called upon to determine any proposal, I take account of a range of factors and decide each case on its merits, taking account of all objections.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Jane Davidson:** I said that I wanted to outline the process.

I will only approve a proposal to close a school, small or otherwise, if I am convinced that to do so serves the best interests of the children concerned. Top of my list of criteria when determining on closure proposals is the impact on educational standards. That will remain my over-riding concern. I pay close attention to whether there is surplus capacity and whether a school is needed, and I look critically at the effect closure might have on the time children spend travelling to school. I take into account financial implications. Cost savings are a factor in favour of a proposal if

statudol a wrthwynebir, nid yw'n briodol i mi wneud sylw ar unrhyw gynigion hyd nes fy mod wedi ystyried y dystiolaeth i gyd ac yn gallu cyflwyno penderfyniad yr wyf wedi ei bwysu a'i fesur sy'n ystyried barn pawb dan sylw. Yn yr achos hwn, nid yw Cyngor Sir Fynwy wedi cyhoeddi cynigion yn ffurfiol, ac nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i ragweld beth fyddant.

Mae'n bwysig bod pawb yn y Siambr yn deall y broses yn llawn. Mae'r broses statudol ar gyfer cynigion i gau, agor neu newid unrhyw fath o ysgol yn rhoi'r cyfle mwyaf posibl i bobl leol gael dweud eu barn. Rhaid i aelodau awdurdod lleol a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd gael eu darbwyllo yn gyntaf bod achos da dros newid cyn dechrau'r broses statudol. Wedyn rhaid ymgynghori â phob un o'r carfannau perthnasol yn yr ardal leol ac ystyried cynlluniau amgen. Rhaid i farnau gael eu hystyried cyn i benderfyniad gael ei wneud i gyhoeddi hysbysiad statudol. Unwaith y bydd hysbysiad yn cael ei gyhoeddi, gall unrhyw un wrthwynebu, ac mae gan wrthwynebwyr ddeufis i gyflwyno eu gwrthwynebiadau i'r awdurdod lleol. Os caiff gwrthwynebiadau eu cyflwyno, daw'r cynnig gerbron y Gweinidog i'w benderfynu. Pryd bynnag y gofynnir imi benderfynu ar unrhyw gynnig, ystyriaeth ystod o ffactorau a phenderfynu bob achos yn ôl ei deilyngdod, gan gymryd pob gwrthwynebiad i ystyriaeth.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Jane Davidson:** Dywedais fy mod am amlinellu'r broses.

Dim ond os byddaf yn argyhoeddedig y byddai gwneud hynny o fudd i'r plant perthnasol y byddaf yn cymeradwyo cynnig i gau ysgol, boed yn fach neu fel arall. Ar ben fy rhestr o feini prawf wrth benderfynu ar gynigion i gau ysgolion mae'r effaith ar safonau addysgol. Bydd hynny'n parhau yn brif bryder imi. Rhoddaf sylw manwl i weld a oes lleoedd dros ben ac a oes angen yr ysgol, ac edrychaf yn feiriadol ar yr effaith y gallai cau'r ysgol ei gael ar yr amser a dreulia'r plant yn teithio i'r ysgol. Byddaf yn rhoi ystyriaeth i oblygiadau ariannol. Mae arbedion cost yn ffactor o blaid

that enables authorities to make better use of finite resources in the interests of pupils.

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Jane Davidson:** Cost savings are not—  
[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has a right to be heard, and she is not giving way.

**Jane Davidson:** Cost savings are not an end in themselves. I consider carefully the views of objectors and the impact that a school closure might have on the local community. Finally, but definitely not of least importance, I need to know whether alternatives to closure have been examined and why they have been rejected by the local authority, if that is the case.

This brings me to the options to which I referred at the outset. On my grand tour, I have seen some interesting work in small rural schools, particularly in Ceredigion. As I said earlier, closure is not the only option when it comes to small rural schools. I visited Llandysul Community Primary School last week and saw at first hand an exciting project to improve the working of the rural schools in the area. Four schools within five miles of each other have created a cluster, which enables them to share resources, experiences and expertise. Three of the schools are small, with the smallest having fewer than 20 pupils. A teacher at that school faces the prospect of preparing tailored lessons for perhaps only two pupils in an age group. Such teachers bear a heavy burden in terms of preparation time and can feel isolated as they cope with this task, which is multiplied by seven without the back-up resources normally associated with larger schools. During the last year, teachers involved in this project have been able to share work schemes and lesson plans, co-ordinate INSET days, and use the expertise of colleagues. This sharing of resources has freed up time, which is one of the most valuable resources of all.

cynnig os yw hynny'n galluogi awdurdodau i wneud gwell defnydd o adnoddau cyfyngedig er lles y disgyblion.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw arbedion cost yn—  
[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae gan y Gweinidog yr hawl i gael ei chlywed, ac nid yw'n ildio.

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw arbedion cost yn ddiben ynddynt eu hunain. Byddaf yn rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i farn gwrthwynebwyr a'r effaith y gallai cau ysgol ei chael ar y gymuned leol. Yn olaf, ond nid yn lleiaf o ran pwysigrwydd, mae angen i mi wybod a archwiliwyd dewisiadau heblaw cau a pham y cawsant eu gwrthod gan yr awdurdod lleol, os mai dyna'r sefyllfa.

Daw hyn â mi at y dewisiadau y cyfeiriais atynt ar y dechrau. Yn ystod fy nhaith, gwelais beth gwaith diddorol mewn ysgolion bach gwledig, yn enwedig yng Ngheredigion. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nid cau yw'r unig ddewis pan ddaw i ysgolion bach gwledig. Ymwelais ag Ysgol Gynradd Gymunedol Llandysul yr wythnos diwethaf a gwelais yn bersonol brosiect cyffrous i wella gweithrediad ysgolion gwledig yr ardal. Mae pedair ysgol o fewn pum milltir i'w gilydd wedi creu clwstwr, sy'n eu galluogi i rannu adnoddau, profiadau ac arbenigedd. Mae tair o'r ysgolion yn fach, gyda'r lleiaf â llai na 20 o ddisgyblion. Bydd athro yn yr ysgol honno yn wynebu'r dasg o baratoi gwersi wedi'u teilwra ar gyfer dau yn unig efallai o ddisgyblion mewn grŵp oedran. Mae athrawon o'r fath yn cario baich drom o ran amser paratoi a gallant deimlo'n ynysig wrth ymdopi â'r dasg hon, sy'n cael ei luosi seithgwaith drosodd heb yr adnoddau wrth gefn sydd fel arfer yn cael eu cysylltu ag ysgolion mwy. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf cafodd athrawon a fu'n ymwneud â'r prosiect hwn gyfle i rannu cynlluniau gwaith a phatrymau gwersi, cydlynu diwrnodau HMS, a defnyddio arbenigedd eu cydweithwyr. Mae'r dull hwn o rannu adnoddau wedi rhyddhau amser, sy'n un o'r adnoddau mwyaf gwerthfawr.



The project was all the more interesting because the schools have invested in *dolen dysgu*—a learning link—which uses video-conferencing facilities to link the schools. This has opened up a whole host of opportunities for children in small peer groups in the schools involved. By using the *dolen dysgu*, year-group teaching can be delivered to all the children in the four schools. This has broadened their horizons, because they make new contacts and benefit from the expertise and energy of different teachers. This is an imaginative approach taken by the local education authority with the largest proportion of small schools in Wales. It acknowledged that a better solution was required to its current arrangements. This is a fascinating project from which others might learn.

A further model that has been tried successfully in other local authorities is that of federation. It is necessary to follow statutory procedures to bring about this change. Federation usually involves the closure of a number of schools and the establishment of a new federated school, using all the existing school sites. There are a number of models: infants might occupy one site and juniors another; pupils might travel to different sites for part of the curriculum; and teachers might exchange for part of the week so that curriculum expertise can be exploited to the full. Individual models can be tailored to suit local needs.

**Pauline Jarman** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of Delyth's point, guidance is statutory and is therefore taken fully into account when decisions are made. In our recent guidance circular on school organisation proposals, I indicated clearly that the case for closing a school needs to be robust. Where proposals come to me for determination, I expect to see that alternatives to closure have been actively considered. I will check whether options such as federation, clustering or collaboration with other schools have been considered. I will expect LEAs to consider the scope for information and communications technology links as a way of improving joint working. I will also

Yr oedd y prosiect hyd yn oed yn fwy diddorol byth oherwydd bod yr ysgolion wedi buddsoddi yn *dolen dysgu*, sy'n defnyddio cyfleusterau fideo-gynadledda i gysylltu'r ysgolion â'i gilydd. Cyflwynodd hyn bob math o gyfleoedd i blant mewn grwpiau bach o gyfoedion yn yr ysgolion sy'n rhan o'r prosiect. Trwy ddefnyddio *dolen dysgu*, gellir cyflwyno addysgu grŵp blwyddyn i'r holl blant yn y pedair ysgol. Mae hyn wedi ehangu eu gorwelion oherwydd gwnânt gysylltiadau newydd ac elwant ar arbenigedd ac egni gwahanol athrawon. Mae hyn yn ymagwedd llawn dychymyg a weithredwyd gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol sydd â'r ganran uchaf o ysgolion bach yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yn cydnabod bod angen gwell ateb i'w drefniadau presennol. Mae hwn yn brosiect diddorol iawn y gall eraill ddysgu ohono.

Model arall a gafodd ei brofi'n llwyddiannus mewn awdurdodau lleol eraill yw ffedereiddio. Mae'n angenrheidiol dilyn gweithdrefnau statudol i wneud y newid hwn. Mae ffedereiddio weithiau'n golygu cau nifer o ysgolion a sefydlu ysgol newydd wedi'i ffedereiddio, gan ddefnyddio yr holl safleoedd ysgol presennol. Mae nifer o fodelau: gall babanod fod ar un safle a phlant iau ar safle arall; gall disgyblion deithio i wahanol safleoedd ar gyfer rhan o'r cwricwlwm; a gall athrawon gyfnewid am ran o'r wythnos er mwyn manteisio i'r eithaf ar arbenigedd cwricwlwm. Gellir teilwra modelau unigol i fod yn addas ar gyfer anghenion lleol.

**Pauline Jarman** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** O ran pwynt Delyth, mae arweiniad yn statudol a bydd yn cael ei ystyried yn llawn pan fydd penderfyniadau yn cael eu gwneud. Yn ein cylchlythyr arweiniad diweddar ar gynigion trefniadaeth ysgol, dangosais yn glir bod angen i'r achos dros gau ysgol fod yn gadarn. Pan fydd cynigion yn dod ataf i'w penderfynu, disgwyliaf weld bod y dewisiadau amgen wedi cael eu hystyried o ddfrif. Byddaf yn edrych i weld a ystyriwyd opsiynau megis ffedereiddio, clystyru neu gydweithio ag ysgolion eraill. Byddaf yn disgwyl i AALLau ystyried y cyfle i gael cysylltiadau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu fel ffordd o wella cydweithio. Byddaf hefyd yn disgwyl cael rhesymau cadarn pam nad yw AALLau wedi

expect to be given sound reasons for LEAs not pursuing such options before I will agree that closure is the appropriate course of action.

**Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** It is because we recognise the particular difficulties facing rural schools that we have allocated extra funding to authorities in this financial year and next to enable them to develop imaginative solutions to local problems. A total of £2 million is available this year and the draft budget provides for this to increase to £3.5 million next year. We have not been prescriptive about how it should be spent. Some authorities are allocating funds to collaborative working, and others are looking to relieve the administrative burden on headteachers by employing administrative workers. The grant can be tailored to suit local needs.

I have written to all Members this week to set out my position on school closures, particularly small school closures. I cannot promise you that I will never again agree a proposal to close a small school. To do that would not always be in the interests of children living and learning in rural areas. What I can promise you is that I will apply stringent tests to each proposal that comes to me and decide each one on its merits, taking full account of every piece of information.

I want the best education for all children, in all areas of Wales. That is my overriding concern and it will continue to guide my decisions.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you advise us how many local authority proposals to close a school you have rejected since you came to office?

**Jane Davidson:** I cannot advise you of that at the moment, but I can send you the information. Two proposals to close schools came to me for determination this year. In my quasi-judicial role, taking account of all the factors, I supported the local authority decision in those cases. Previously, I have opposed two local authority decisions to close schools. However, the important point

mynd ar drywydd opsiynau o'r fath cyn i mi gytuno bod cau yn gam gweithredu priodol.

**Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Rhoddwyd arian ychwanegol i awdurdodau yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon a'r nesaf i'w galluogi i ddatblygu atebion dyfeisgar i broblemau lleol oherwydd ein bod yn cydnabod yr anawsterau arbennig sy'n wynebu ysgolion gwledig. Mae cyfanswm o £2 filiwn ar gael eleni ac mae'r gyllideb ddrafft yn caniatáu i hyn gynyddu i £3.5 miliwn y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid ydym wedi bod yn benodol am y ffordd y dylid ei wario. Mae rhai awdurdodau yn neilltuo cyllid ar gyfer cydweithio, ac eraill yn edrych am ffyrdd i ysgafnhau baich gweinyddol ar bennaethiaid trwy gyflogi gweithwyr gweinyddol. Gall y grant gael ei deilwra i gwrdd ag anghenion lleol.

Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob Aelod yr wythnos hon i esbonio fy safbwynt ar gau ysgolion, yn enwedig cau ysgolion bach. Ni allaf addo ichi na fyddaf byth eto yn cytuno ar gynnig i gau ysgol fach. Ni fyddai gwneud hynny bob amser er lles y plant sy'n byw ac yn dysgu yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Yr hyn y gallaf ei addo ichi yw y byddaf yn cymhwyso profion llym wrth edrych ar bob cynnig a ddaw ger fy mron ac yn penderfynu ar bob un ar ei deilyngdod, gan roi ystyriaeth lawn i bob darn o wybodaeth.

Yr wyf am gael yr addysg orau i bob plentyn ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Dyna yw fy mhrif bryder a bydd hynny'n parhau i lywio fy mhenderfyniadau.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ein hysbysu sawl cynnig gan awdurdod lleol i gau ysgol a wrthodwyd gennych ers i chi gychwyn ar eich swydd?

**Jane Davidson:** Ni allaf eich hysbysu o hynny ar hyn o bryd, ond gallaf anfon y wybodaeth atoch. Daeth dau gynnig i gau ysgolion ataf i benderfynu arnynt eleni. Yn fy rôl lled-farnwrol, gan ystyried y ffactorau i gyd, cefnogais benderfyniad yr awdurdod lleol yn y ddau achos hynny. Cyn hynny, gwrthwynebais ddau benderfyniad awdurdodau lleol i gau ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt pwysig yw bod pob achos

is that each case is considered on its merits. The Minister has a quasi-judicial role. The Assembly's policy is to encourage federation and networking between schools and, additionally, to fund small schools, rural schools and local authorities to look imaginatively at different solutions. I want the best education for all children in all areas of Wales. That is my over-riding concern as Minister, and that principle will continue to guide my decisions. Everyone in the Chamber today, Members and otherwise, can be assured that they will have a fair hearing in terms of any proposals that come to me for determination in my quasi-judicial capacity.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

yn cael ei ystyried yn ôl ei deilyngdod. Mae gan y Gweinidog rôl lled-farnwrol. Polisi'r Cynulliad yw annog ffedereiddio a rhwydweithio rhwng ysgolion ac, yn ogystal â hynny, ariannu ysgolion bach, ysgolion gwledig ac awdurdodau lleol i edrych yn ddyfeisgar ar atebion gwahanol. Yr wyf am gael yr addysg orau i bob plentyn ymhob rhan o Gymru. Dyna fy nghyfrifoldeb pennaf fel Gweinidog a bydd yr egwyddor honno yn parhau i lywio fy mhenderfyniadau. Gall pawb yn y Siambr heddiw, yn Aelodau ac fel arall, fod yn sicr y cânt wrandawriad teg o ran unrhyw gynigion a ddaw ataf i'w penderfynu yn fy rôl lled-farnwrol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.10 p.m.  
The session ended at 5.10 p.m.*