



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth, 21 Medi 2004**

**Tuesday, 21 September 2004**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |    |  |
|----|--|
| 3  | Datganiad gan y Llywydd<br>Statement by the Presiding Officer  |
| 3  | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Questions to the First Minister  |
| 28 | Cwestiwn Brys: Gwasanaethau Llawfeddygaeth Niwrolegol Bediatrig<br>Urgent Question: Paediatric Neurosurgical Services  |
| 34 | Datganiad Busnes<br>Business Statement   |
| 38 | Datganiad ar Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn, Sain Tathan<br>Statement on the Defence Aviation Repair Agency, St Athan   |
| 51 | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order  |
| 54 | Gohirio Rheolau Sefydlog<br>Suspension of Standing Orders  |
| 55 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau<br>Addysg (Cynlluniau Ariannol AALI) (Cymru) 2004<br>Approval of the School Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Education<br>(LEA Financial Schemes) (Wales) Regulations 2004 |
| 78 | Ymchwiliad Clywch<br>The Clywch Inquiry  |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n bleser arbennig gennyf groesawu Llefarydd Senedd Queensland, Awstralia, yr Anrhydeddus Ray Hollis. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** It gives me great pleasure to welcome the Speaker of the Queensland Parliament of Australia, the Honourable Ray Hollis. [*Applause.*]

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Mynd i'r Afael â Hiliaeth Combating Racism**

**Q1 Val Lloyd:** Would the First Minister outline action taken to combat racism in Wales? (OAQ37566)

**C1 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu'r camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â hiliaeth yng Nghymru? (OAQ37566)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The recent murder of Kalan Karim in Swansea reminds us of the responsibility which we all share to combat racism in Wales. I know that many political parties were represented at the vigil held in his memory in Swansea on 11 September, shortly after the tragic event. As First Minister, I contributed a message in which I reaffirmed the determination of the Welsh Assembly Government to tackle racism wherever and whenever it manifests itself in Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae llofruddio Kalan Karim yn Abertawe'n ddiweddar yn ein hatgoffa o'r cyfrifoldeb sydd gan bob un ohonom i ymladd yn erbyn hiliaeth yng Nghymru. Gwn fod cynrychiolwyr o sawl plaid wleidyddol wedi mynychu'r wylnos a gynhaliwyd er cof amdano yn Abertawe ar 11 Medi, yn fuan ar ôl y digwyddiad trist. Fel Prif Weinidog, anfonais neges yn ailddatgan bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n benderfynol o fynd i'r afael â hiliaeth pa bryd bynnag ac ym mha le bynnag y digwydd yng Nghymru.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not need to remind Members that this case is sub judice and I would welcome it if references were not made to this particular case. Broader questions are in order.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes angen imi atgoffa Aelodau fod yr achos hwn yn nwylo'r gyfraith a byddwn yn falch pe na cheid cyfeiriadau at yr achos penodol hwn. Mae cwestiynau mwy cyffredinol mewn trefn.

**Val Lloyd:** Swansea has a proud history of being a city that welcomes refugees. It opened its doors to many Chilean refugees in the 1970s, and those fleeing Saddam Hussein in the 1980s and 1990s. Would you join me in commending the support that you just mentioned, the recent well-attended vigil, and the forthcoming rally, as tangible expressions of the anti-racist feeling of the vast majority of Swansea's citizens?

**Val Lloyd:** Mae gan Abertawe hanes anrhydeddus o fod yn ddinas sy'n croesawu ffoaduriaid. Agorodd ei drysau i lawer o ffoaduriaid o Chile yn y 1970au, a rhai a ffodd rhag Saddam Hussein yn y 1980au a'r 1990au. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ganmol y gefnogaeth yr ydych newydd ei chrybwyll, yr wylnos ddiweddar lle y bu llawer yn bresennol, a'r rali sydd i'w chynnal cyn hir, fel mynegiant pendant o'r ymdeimlad gwrth-hiliol ymysg y mwyafrif llethol o

ddinasyddion Abertawe?

**The First Minister:** I agree. In the light of the event and the fears that that is bound to cause that there is an underlying tide of racism in our communities, we can only resolve to work closely with black and ethnic minority communities and their leaders to try to overcome those fears. We have held many such discussions with religious and cultural leaders of black and ethnic minority communities in Wales. I fully endorse what you say about the proud tradition of our seaports, which have long received and made welcome black and ethnic minorities from all over the world in connection with the maritime trade. More recently, they have done so as political events have caused an increase in the number of asylum seekers and refugees to Wales. I wish to re-emphasise that you can never justify attacks on people because of their colour.

**Leanne Wood:** Do you agree that the political climate in which the asylum debate is taking place is promoting racist attitudes? New Labour's Home Secretary, David Blunkett, is encouraging racism through his use of words such as 'swamping', and through his policies, such as imprisoning asylum seekers and racist immigration legislation. Do you stand by the policies of New Labour's Home Secretary on asylum seekers or will you take this opportunity to distance yourself from him?

**The First Minister:** There will always be two views on the best way to reduce racism. The Home Secretary's approach is to provide reassurance that immigration is watched closely by the Government and that it has a grip on any possible abuse. There is another view, which tends to say that the kind of language that you described can, if it is repeated in the wrong way and out of context by certain newspapers and so on, play on the minds of people who are attracted to racist views and, even worse, to racist aggressive action. Whichever view you take, it is important that you should never condone or pander to racist attitudes and always combat them. There is nothing easier than to seek cheap votes by pandering to racist attitudes,

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Yng ngolwg y digwyddiad hwn a'r ofnau y mae'n sicr o'u hachosi fod teimlad cyffredinol o hiliaeth yn ein cymunedau, ni allwn ond penderfynu cydweithio'n agos â chymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig a'u harweinwyr i geisio trechu'r ofnau hynny. Cynaliasom sawl trafodaeth o'r fath gydag arweinwyr crefyddol a diwylliannol cymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yng Nghymru. Llawn gymeradwyaf yr hyn a ddywedasoeh am draddodiad anrhydeddus ein porthladdoedd, sydd ers amser maith wedi derbyn a chroesawu pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig o bob rhan o'r byd mewn cysylltiad â masnach forol. Gwnaethant hynny, yn fwy diweddar, am fod digwyddiadau gwleidyddol wedi peri cynnydd yn nifer y ceiswyr lloches a'r ffoaduriaid sy'n dod i Gymru. Dymunaf ailbwyseisio na ellir byth gyfiawnhau ymosodiadau ar bobl oherwydd lliw eu croen.

**Leanne Wood:** A ydych yn cytuno bod cyddestun gwleidyddol y ddadl ar loches yn hyrwyddo ymagweddau hiliol? Mae Ysgrifennydd Cartref Llafur Newydd, David Blunkett, yn hybu hiliaeth drwy ddefnyddio geiriau fel 'gorlethu', a thrwy ei bolisiau, fel carcharu ceiswyr lloches a llunio deddfwriaeth hiliol ar fewnfudo. A ydych yn arddel polisiau Ysgrifennydd Cartref Llafur Newydd ar geiswyr lloches neu a wnewch achub ar y cyfle hwn i ymbellhau oddi wrtho?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd gwahaniaeth barn bob amser am y modd gorau i waredu hiliaeth. Dull yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yw rhoi sicrwydd bod y Llywodraeth yn cadw llygad barcud ar fewnfudo a'i bod yn mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw gamarfer posibl. Mae barn arall, sy'n tueddu i ddweud y gall y math o iaith a ddisgrifiwch, os ailadroddir hi'n anghywir neu y tu allan i'w chyd-destun gan rai papurau newydd ac yn y blaen, ddylanwadu ar feddyliau rhai sy'n cael eu denu at safbwyntiau hiliol ac, yn waeth byth, at weithredu ymosodol hiliol. Pa bynnag safbwynt a gymerir, mae'n bwysig na ddylid byth oddef neu foddio ymagweddau hiliol ac y dylid ymladd yn eu herbyn bob amser. Nid oes dim sydd haws na cheisio ennill

but if you seek votes in that way, you are undermining the principle of democracy. You may get a few votes from that, but you undermine democracy when you do it.

**William Graham:** I am grateful for your remarks. You will know that all parties in the Assembly condemn racism in all its forms. Could we have an update at an appropriate time on the Commission for Racial Equality programme, 'Race equality in Wales: The agenda for change 2004-2006'?

**The First Minister:** I will have to write to you on that. I know that we have seconded staff to the racial equality councils, which come under the umbrella of the Commission for Racial Equality in Wales, to ensure that they can implement their plans locally. We continue to make progress with the Assembly's own race equality scheme, in close consultation with the CRE.

pleidleisiau rhwydd drwy foddio ymagweddau hiliol, ond os ceisir pleidleisiau drwy wneud hynny, tanseilir egwyddor democratiaeth. Efallai y daw ychydig bleidleisiau o wneud hynny, ond tanseilir democratiaeth yn y broses.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau. Gwyddoch fod pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn condemnio hiliaeth o bob math. A allem gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar adeg briodol am raglen y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, 'Cydraddoldeb hiliol yng Nghymru: Yr agenda dros newid 2004-2006'?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch ynghylch hynny. Gwn ein bod wedi secondio staff i'r cynghorau cydraddoldeb hiliol, sydd dan adain y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol yng Nghymru, i sicrhau y byddant yn gallu rhoi eu cynlluniau ar waith yn lleol. Yr ydym yn dal i wneud cynnydd ar gynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y Cynulliad, gan ymgynghori'n gyson â'r comisiwn.

### **Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995 The Disability Discrimination Act 1995**

**Q2 Glyn Davies:** What plans does the First Minister have to ensure that the Mid-Wales Trunk Road Agency takes note of the Disability Act when responding to statutory consultation on planning applications? (OAQ37584)

**The First Minister:** The Mid-Wales Trunk Road Agency and those officers of Powys County Council who act as its agents have been appropriately trained in the Disability Discrimination Act 1995 and take it into account when considering and responding on our behalf to planning inquiries and consultations.

**Glyn Davies:** Recently, the local planning authority was required to refuse an application by a high street bank in Machynlleth to install disabled access, even though the pavement is wide, there is similar disabled access at a high street bank close by, and another high street bank wants to install disabled access soon. Do you agree that it is unreasonable to prevent high street banks

**C2 Glyn Davies:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i sicrhau bod Asiantaeth Priffyrdd y Canolbarth yn ystyried y Ddeddf Anabledd wrth ymateb i ymgynghoriad statudol ar geisiadau cynllunio? (OAQ37584)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Asiantaeth Priffyrdd y Canolbarth a'r swyddogion hynny yng Nghyngor Sir Powys sy'n gweithredu fel asiantiaid iddi wedi'u hyfforddio'n briodol yn Neddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995 ac yn ei chadw mewn cof wrth ystyried ac ymateb ar ein rhan i ymchwiliadau ac ymgynghoriadau cynllunio.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn ddiweddar, bu'n ofynnol i'r awdurdod cynllunio lleol wrthod cais gan fanc ar y stryd fawr ym Machynlleth i osod mynedfa i bobl anabl, er bod y palmant yn llydan, bod mynedfa debyg i bobl anabl mewn banc cyfagos ar y stryd fawr, a bod banc arall ar y stryd fawr yn dymuno gosod mynedfa i bobl anabl cyn hir. A ydych yn cytuno mai afresymol yw atal banciau'r stryd

from installing disabled access just because a trunk road runs through the town?

**The First Minister:** The Mid-Wales Trunk Road Agency, acting in its highway liaison role, advised Powys County Council planning authority not to agree to the application, and the planning authority accepted that advice and rejected the application. I understand that the bank still has the opportunity to construct an appropriate access ramp within its property. This may be more expensive for the bank, and it may take up some of its business space, but that alternative is available to it.

**Mick Bates:** I was interested to hear that reply. I am sure that you are aware, First Minister, of the Disabled Persons Transport Advisory Committee, which makes excellent recommendations in relation to consultations on transport. Since 70 per cent of disabled people have difficulty in walking, one recommendation is that there should be a bus stop every 400m on developments. What are you and your Government doing to co-ordinate the work of your Ministers to ensure that such recommendations, which greatly assist disabled people, can be implemented?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that that is a matter of compliance with the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, the deadline for which is coming up shortly, or an advisory issue. That is, it is a recommendation that may never be mandatory, but which is thought to be a good idea in terms of access. How disabled people are to get improved access to the facilities that non-disabled people take for granted is a vexed issue. For example, there is an issue as to whether low-ramped buses are always the answer: some people do not like them and prefer adapted taxis, while others prefer to use Motability and to acquire an adapted vehicle. There are a wide variety of answers, which will suit different people. Providing bus stops every 400m will suit one particular group, provided that that is linked to low-level bus access, so that wheelchair users can get on and off the bus. It is an important issue.

fawr rhag gosod mynedfa i'r anabl dim ond am fod cefnffordd yn rhedeg drwy'r dref?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Asiantaeth Priffyrdd y Canolbarth, yn ei rôl fel cysylltydd ynghylch priffyrdd, a gynghorodd Gyngor Sir Powys i beidio â chytuno i'r cais, a derbyniodd yr awdurdod cynllunio y cyngor hwnnw a gwrthod y cais. Yr wyf yn deall bod cyfle o hyd gan y banc i wneud ramp mynediad addas yn yr adeilad. Gallai hynny fod yn ddrotach i'r banc, a gallai gymryd rhywfaint o'i le gweithio, ond mae'r dewis hwnnw ar gael iddo.

**Mick Bates:** Yr oedd o ddiddordeb imi glywed yr ateb hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, am y Pwyllgor Ymgynghorol ar Gludiant Pobl Anabl, sy'n gwneud argymhellion rhagorol mewn cysylltiad ag ymgynghoriadau ynghylch trafndiaeth. Gan fod 70 y cant o bobl anabl yn ei chael yn anodd cerdded, un argymhelliad yw y dylid cael arhosfan bysiau bob 400 metr mewn datblygiadau. Beth yr ydych chi a'ch Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i gyd-drefnu gwaith eich Gweinidogion fel bod modd rhoi argymhellion o'r fath ar waith, gan eu bod o gymorth mawr i bobl anabl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r mater hwnnw'n ymwneud â chydymffurfio â Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995, y daw'r cyfnod cydymffurfio i ben cyn hir, ynteu a yw'n fater ymgynghorol. Hynny yw, mae'n argymhelliad na fydd byth yn orfodol o bosibl, ond y tybir ei fod yn syniad da o ran mynediad. Mae'r modd y gall pobl anabl gael gwell mynediad i'r cyfleusterau y mae rhai nad ydynt yn anabl yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol yn fater dyrys. Er enghraifft, mae dadlau ynghylch ai bysiau â ramp isel yw'r ateb ym mhob achos: nid yw pawb yn eu hoffi ac mae'n well gan rai dacsis a addaswyd, tra bo'n well gan eraill ddefnyddio Motability a chael cerbyd a addaswyd. Mae amrywiaeth eang o atebion, a fydd yn ateb gofynion gwahanol bobl. Bydd darparu arosfannau bysiau bob 400 metr yn addas i un grŵp penodol, ar yr amod bod hynny'n gysylltiedig â mynedfeydd isel i fysiau, fel y gall defnyddwyr cadair olwynion fynd ar y bws a dod oddi arno. Mae'n bwnc pwysig.

**Cydyfrifoldebau'r Cabinet  
Collective Cabinet Responsibility**

**Q3 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on collective Cabinet responsibility? (OAQ37580)

**C3 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gydyfrifoldebau'r Cabinet? (OAQ37580)

**The First Minister:** The guidance is set out in the Ministerial Code. I will choose a paragraph at random to give you a flavour of it. Paragraph 2.22 reads:

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nodir y canllawiau yn y Cod i'r Gweinidogion. Dewisaf baragraff ar hap i roi blas ohono i chi. Mae paragraff 2.22 yn dweud:

'Collective responsibility requires that Ministers should be able to express their views frankly in the expectation that they can argue freely in private while maintaining a united front when decisions have been reached.'

'Mae cydyfrifoldeb yn gofyn y dylai'r Gweinidogion allu mynegi eu barn yn onest gan ddisgwyl y gallant ddadlau'n rhydd yn breifat gan gadw wyneb unedig ar ôl i benderfyniadau gael eu cymryd.'

**Jocelyn Davies:** Last week, Jon Owen Jones raised the issue of a Cardiff constituent having to wait 17 weeks for a mammogram. He described the response of your Minister for Health and Social Services as pathetic. Under the doctrine of collective Cabinet responsibility, does that make the entire Cabinet pathetic?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, tynnodd Jon Owen Jones sylw at achos etholwr yng Nghaerdydd sy'n gorfod disgwyl 17 wythnos i gael mamogram. Dywedodd fod ymateb eich Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn druenus. Gan ddilyn egwyddor cydyfrifoldeb y Cabinet, a yw hynny'n golygu bod y Cabinet cyfan yn druenus?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not know how long it took you to think up that remark. I will not offer you the same adjective as you are trying to offer, as that would break the post-summer-recess goodwill in the Assembly. Jane Hutt has made clear her views that the service available to people requiring mammograms in Cardiff and the Vale is totally unacceptable. Meetings have been held today to try to put it right. It is not acceptable that people have to wait 17 weeks for a service where the set standard is 10 days. You will find that seven of Wales's 12 trusts are meeting that target in at least 90 per cent of cases; five are not doing so. However, Cardiff stands out. Where Jon Owen Jones was not right was in presenting this as a Wales versus England issue; it is not. It is a case of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust being well below the standard of the rest of Wales. It must put that right, and that is why Jane Hutt made her remarks.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn pa mor hir a gymerodd ichi feddwl am y sylw hwnnw. Ni chynigiais yr un ansoddair i chi ag yr ydych chi'n ceisio'i gynnig, gan y byddai hynny'n rhoi terfyn ar yr ewyllys da yn y Cynulliad wedi toriad yr haf. Mae Jane Hutt wedi nodi'n glir ei bod o'r farn bod y gwasanaeth sydd ar gael i rai y mae arnynt angen mamogramau yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro yn gwbl annerbyniol. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfodydd heddiw i geisio cywiro hynny. Nid yw'n dderbyniol bod pobl yn gorfod disgwyl 17 wythnos am wasanaeth y gosodwyd safon o 10 niwrnod ar ei gyfer. Mae saith o'r 12 ymddiriedolaeth yng Nghymru'n cyrraedd y targed hwnnw yn o leiaf 90 y cant o achosion; mae pump nad ydynt yn gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae Caerdydd yn sefyll allan. Yr oedd Jon Owen Jones yn gwneud camgymeriad drwy bortreadu hyn fel mater lle y mae Cymru'n gwrthgyferbynnu â Lloegr; nid ydyw. Mae'n wir bod safon Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn is

o lawer na'r safon yng ngweddill Cymru. Rhaid iddi gywiro hynny, a dyna pam y gwnaeth Jane Hutt ei sylwadau.

**John Griffiths:** Cabinet collective responsibility and unity are important to the good and effective governance of Wales, and in bringing benefits to Wales. Would you agree that a recent example of strong Assembly Government representations bringing benefits to Wales is this week's announcement of some 600 Office for National Statistics jobs relocating to Newport? This recognises the impressive performance of the existing Office for National Statistics, Patent Office and United Kingdom Passport Service staff in Newport, and the great attractions and strengths of the city of Newport.

**The First Minister:** Indeed. The designation of the Newport office—which already employs 1,300 people—as the headquarters of the ONS, increasing the number of employees to 2,000 over the next few years, is a major feather in the cap not only of Newport, but also of Wales. I have heard people ask why these jobs are going to Newport. The reason is that the ONS already has 1,300 people there in an efficient campus. People will say that this is not an Objective 1 area. However, Objective 1 Wales starts immediately to the north of Newport, and a large number of the current staff, and future staff, of the ONS will undoubtedly have their homes in Objective 1 areas, such as Torfaen and Caerphilly, and other areas further afield.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Sylwais fod Eluned Morgan wedi beirniadu'r cynnig yr ydych yn ei alw yn gynnis 13.2+ yn ystod eich cynhadledd ddiweddar, gan ddweud ei fod yn gwbl anymarferol. Cyn yr haf, dywedasoch wrthyf nad oedd y mater hwn wedi'i drafod gan y Cabinet. A yw eich Cabinet yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn ai peidio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y Cabinet yn trafod y mater cyn y ddadl lawn yn y Siambr ar 6 Hydref. Felly, trafodir y mater yng

**John Griffiths:** Mae cydgyfrifoldeb ac undod y Cabinet yn bwysig er lles llywodraethu da ac effeithiol yng Nghymru, ac wrth ddod â buddion i Gymru. A gytunech mai un enghraifft ddiweddar o'r modd y mae sylwadau cryf gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dod â buddion i Gymru yw'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos hon am adleoli tua 600 o swyddi'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol yng Nghasnewydd? Mae hyn yn cydnabod perfformiad rhagorol staff presennol y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, y Swyddfa Batentau a Gwasanaeth Pasport y Deyrnas Unedig yng Nghasnewydd, ac i atyniadau a chryfderau mawr dinas Casnewydd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir. Mae dynodi'r swyddfa yng Nghasnewydd—sydd eisoes yn cyflogi 1,300 o bobl—yn bencadlys y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, gan beri cynnydd o 2,000 yn nifer y gweithwyr dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, yn glod mawr i Gasnewydd, ac i Gymru hefyd. Yr wyf wedi clywed rhai'n gofyn pam y mae'r swyddi hyn yn mynd i Gasnewydd. Y rheswm am hynny yw bod gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol 1,300 o bobl yno eisoes yn gweithio mewn campws effeithlon. Dywed rhai nad ardal Amcan 1 yw hon. Er hynny, mae Cymru Amcan 1 ar y trothwy tua'r gogledd o Gasnewydd, ac mae'n sicr y bydd nifer fawr o staff presennol y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, a'r staff fydd yn gweithio yno yn y dyfodol, yn rhai sydd â'u cartrefi mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1, fel Tor-faen a Chaerffili, ac ardaloedd eraill tu hwnt i hynny.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I noticed that Eluned Morgan, during your recent conference, criticised the proposal that you call proposal 13.2+, claiming that it is completely impractical. Before the summer, you told me that this matter had not been discussed by the Cabinet. Does your Cabinet support this proposal or not?

**The First Minister:** The Cabinet will discuss this matter before the full debate to be held in the Chamber on 6 October. Therefore, the



nghyfarfod nesaf y Cabinet. Dyna pryd y bydd y Cabinet yn gweithredu'r egwyddor o gymryd cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw y byddwn wedi trafod y mater. Byddwn yn disgwyl i bob un ohonom gefnogi'r egwyddorion a basiwyd gan gynhadledd y Blaid Lafur wythnos i ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Un o'r opsiynau sydd wedi'u trafod yw'r cynnig a wnaed gennych dan 13.2+. Mae cadeirydd comisiwn Richard, yr Arglwydd Richard, yn ddilornus o'r cynnig hwn, ac yn dweud na chaiff fyth ei dderbyn gan y Senedd. Nid oes gan y cynnig hwn lawer o ffrindiau bellach, Brif Weinidog; os oes ganddo unrhyw ffrindiau ar wahân i chi, pwy yw'r bobl hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd pawb yn cael dewis pan gaiff y Papur Gwyn ei gyhoeddi yn weddol gyflym ar ôl i ni gael mwyafrif gweithredol—gobeithio, o'n hochr ni—yn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf. Mae hynny'n amod ar gyfer cyhoeddi'r Papur Gwyn. Bydd y Papur Gwyn yn cynnwys dewis, a mwy nag un opsiwn. Un opsiwn yw'r un sydd wedi'i seilio ar 13.2+, ac opsiwn arall—y byddai'n rhaid iddo gael ei gefnogi mewn refferendwm—fyddai symud i bwerau deddfu sylfaenol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I assume that you have put forward this proposal for public debate. You are the only one publicly supporting it. I cannot find any other document on record, or any other individual who has come out publicly, in support of it. You appointed Lord Richard to chair this commission; he has rejected your proposal. He spent £1 million of public money, sanctioned by you, on discussing the Assembly's powers and you have come up with something written on the back of a fag packet—a tuppenny-ha'penny proposal—that no-one is discussing. Why do you not simply accept defeat and withdraw the proposal? It is an embarrassment to you, is it not?

**The First Minister:** Anything but. I lead the largest party in Wales and I guess you would swap your election results for mine any day. As the largest party in Wales, we held a special conference on this matter and much to

issue will be discussed at the next Cabinet meeting. That is when the principle of collective Cabinet responsibility will come into play. The important point is that we will have discussed the matter. I would expect all of us to support the principles passed by the Labour Party conference a week last Saturday.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** One of the options that have been discussed is the proposal that you made under 13.2+. The chair of the Richard commission, Lord Richard, is scornful of this proposal, saying that it will never be accepted by Parliament. This proposal does not have many friends, First Minister; if it has any friends apart from you, who are they?

**The First Minister:** We will all have a choice when the White Paper is published shortly after we have—hopefully, from our point of view—gained an operational majority at the next general election. That is a prerequisite for publishing the White Paper. The White Paper will include a choice, and more than one option. One of those options is the one based on 13.2+, and another option—which would have to be supported in a referendum—would be to move towards primary law-making powers.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cymeraf eich bod wedi rhoi'r cynnig hwn gerbron fel y caiff fod yn destun trafod cyhoeddus. Chi yw'r unig un sy'n ei gefnogi'n gyhoeddus. Ni allaf ddod o hyd i unrhyw ddogfen gyhoeddus arall yn cefnogi'r cynnig, neu unrhyw un arall sydd wedi'i gefnogi'n gyhoeddus. Chi a benododd yr Arglwydd Richard yn gadeirydd ar y comisiwn hwn; mae wedi gwrthod eich cynnig. Gwariodd £1 filiwn o arian cyhoeddus, gyda'ch sêl bendith chi, ar drafod pwerau'r Cynulliad ac yr ydych chi wedi dyfeisio rhywbeth pitw—cynnig gwerth ceiniog a dimai—nad oes neb yn ei drafod. Pam na dderbyniwch eich bod wedi'ch trechu a thynnu'r cynnig yn ôl? Mae'n destun cywilydd i chi, onid yw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** I'r gwrthwyneb. Yr wyf fi'n arwain y blaid fwyaf yng Nghymru ac mae'n debyg gennyf y byddech chi'n falch iawn o gael ffeirio'ch canlyniadau etholiadol chi am fy rhai i. Fel y blaid fwyaf yng

your chagrin and that of the media, 100 per cent of the Labour Party supported the proposal of a White Paper, which would include the two proposals that I have mentioned.

The principle behind this is terribly simple: it is about how quickly and how far you want things to change. If you want change to be far-reaching—a move to primary legislative powers, but subject to a referendum and certain other considerations—it would probably not be in place in time for the next Assembly elections. Therefore, it would not take effect until May 2011. The other choice is to propose a change, which is short of that, excluding a referendum, that would be in place by May 2007. In the White Paper, those two principles will be available for consultation by the people of Wales, with a final decision to be made, we presume, in the first session of the new Parliament on the assumption—which I am sure that many of us share—that Labour wins an outright working majority at the next general election.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I have a question on the collective responsibility of the Cabinet in relation to higher education and the push towards less institutions in Wales—

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Fewer institutions.

**Nick Bourne:** Thank you, fewer institutions in Wales. I have heard figures from 13 to eight cited. Is that the collective view of the Cabinet and, if so, what lies behind that thinking?

**The First Minister:** These are autonomous institutions, therefore, although you can apply the 'stick and carrot' principle to them, there is no way that you can mandate changes. It is fair to say that everyone in the Cabinet is extremely pleased about the merger between the University of Wales College of Medicine and Cardiff University, which took legal effect on 1 August. However, the merger that appeared to be progressing well between the University of

Nghymru, cynaliasom gynhadledd arbennig ar y mater hwn ac, er mawr siom i chi ac i'r cyfryngau, rhoddodd y Blaid Lafur ei chefnogaeth unfrydol i'r cynnig i gael Papur Gwyn, a byddai hwnnw'n cynnwys y ddau gynnig yr wyf wedi'u crybwyll.

Mae'r egwyddor sy'n sail i hyn yn ofnadwy o syml: mae'n ymwneud â pha mor gyflym a pha mor bell y mae rhywun am weld pethau'n newid. Os ydych am gael newid pellgyrhaeddol—symud tuag at bwerau deddfu sylfaenol, ond yn amodol ar refferendwm ac ystyriaethau eraill—ni fyddai'n debygol o fod yn barod ar gyfer etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Gan hynny, ni fyddai mewn grym tan fis Mai 2011. Y dewis arall yw cynnig newid, nad yw'n gymaint â hynny, heb gynnal refferendwm, a fyddai mewn grym erbyn mis Mai 2007. Cynhwysir y ddwy egwyddor yn y Papur Gwyn, a fydd ar gael i bobl Cymru ymgynghori arnynt, a gwneir penderfyniad terfynol, fe dybiwn, yn sesiwn cyntaf y Senedd newydd, gan ragdybio—fel y mae llawer ohonom, yr wyf yn siŵr—y bydd Llafur yn ennill mwyafrif digonol yn yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae gennyf gwestiwn sy'n ymwneud â chydgyfrifoldeb y Cabinet mewn cysylltiad ag addysg uwch a'r ymdrech i gael sefydliadau llai yng Nghymru—

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Llai o sefydliadau.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i chi, llai o sefydliadau yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi clywed crybwyll ffigurau o 13 i wyth. Ai dyna yw cydfarn y Cabinet yw honno ac, os dyna ydyw, beth yw sail y farn honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Sefydliadau ymreolus yw'r rhain, felly, er y gellir cymhwyso egwyddor 'y ffon a'r abwyd' atynt, nid oes modd gorfodi newidiadau. Teg yw dweud bod pawb yn y Cabinet yn falch dros ben ynghylch cyfuno Coleg Meddygaeth Prifysgol Cymru a Phrifysgol Caerdydd, a ddaeth i rym yn gyfreithiol ar 1 Awst. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyfuno yr oedd yn ymddangos ei fod yn mynd rhagddo'n dda rhwng Prifysgol Morgannwg ac Athrofa Prifysgol

Glamorgan and the University of Wales Institute Cardiff has fallen apart. There is nothing that we can do about that, which is a pity. It is their decision, not ours; we cannot mandate that merger.

However, there is a £40 million incentive fund to encourage mergers, which represents the carrot, but you cannot penalise institutions that do not want to merge. The reason for merging is simple: to reduce overheads. That means fewer bursars, fewer student welfare officers, fewer vice chancellors and so on. If those overheads can be reduced, then there will be more money in the front-line.

**Nick Bourne:** A comparison was previously made, as you will be aware, with Scotland. You have often stated, along with other Ministers, that it has 13 institutions and on a comparative basis, we would have eight. That is not the case. Scotland has 20 and, if a comparison is made based on the numbers at those institutions, Wales should have 12, which will be the case when the college of medicine merger is complete. I asked my question because, previously—and I think that you received a letter from Higher Education Wales on this issue—we have been acting on the basis of misleading information, as I think you would have to accept.

**The First Minister:** You may be right about the figures. I cannot remember them because there has been extensive correspondence between the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, which proposed the original figure, the Assembly and, now, Higher Education Wales. However, the principle remains the same: we need to reduce overheads, but we do not have the ability to command the reduction of such overheads by forcing colleges to merge. It is desirable that they should merge, because they would have lower overheads and thereby have more money to spend on new academic facilities and courses.

2.20 p.m.

There are questions of viability, the amount of financial pressure they face and what

Cymru Caerdydd wedi methu. Nid oes dim y gallwn ei wneud ynghylch y sefyllfa, ac mae hynny'n drueni. Hwyl biau penderfynu, nid ni; ni allwn orfodi'r cyfuno hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, mae cronfa anogaeth o £40 miliwn i hybu cyfuno, a honno yw'r abwyd, ond ni ellir cosbi sefydliadau nad ydynt yn dymuno cyfuno. Mae'r rheswm dros gyfuno'n un syml: lleihau costau cyffredinol. Mae hynny'n golygu llai o fwrsariaid, llai o swyddogion lles myfyrwyr, llai o is-gangellorion ac yn y blaen. Os gellir lleihau'r costau cyffredinol hynny, bydd mwy o arian yn y rheng flaen.

**Nick Bourne:** Gwnaed cymhariaeth o'r blaen, fel y gwyddoch, â'r Alban. Yr ydych wedi dweud yn aml, fel y gwnaeth Gweinidogion eraill, fod 13 o sefydliadau ganddi hi ac, ar sail cymhariaeth, mai wyth a fyddai gennym ni. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Ugain sydd gan yr Alban ac, os cymharir ar sail y niferoedd sydd yn y sefydliadau hynny, 12 a ddylai fod gan Gymru. Dyna fydd y nifer yng Nghymru ar ôl cwblhau'r cyfuno â'r coleg meddygaeth. Gofynnais y cwestiwn hwn oherwydd, o'r blaen—a chredaf eich bod wedi cael llythyr oddi wrth Addysg Uwch Cymru ar y mater hwn—buom yn gweithredu ar sail gwybodaeth gamarweiniol, fel y byddech yn gorfod derbyn, yr wyf yn credu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Efallai'ch bod yn gywir ynghylch y ffigurau. Ni allaf eu cofio oherwydd bu llawer o ohebu rhwng Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, a gynigiodd y ffigur gwreiddiol, y Cynulliad ac, yn awr, Addysg Uwch Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr un yw'r egwyddor: rhaid inni leihau costau cyffredinol, ond ni allwn roi gorchymyn i leihau'r costau hynny drwy orfodi colegau i gyfuno. Byddai'n ddymunol iddynt gyfuno, oherwydd byddai ganddynt gostau cyffredinol is a mwy o arian i'w wario ar gyfleusterau a chyrsgiau academiaidd newydd.

Mae cwestiynau'n codi o ran dichonoldeb, maint y pwysau ariannol a wynebant a'r

impact there will be on research assessment ratings, which is one of the reasons why, for example, the University of Wales, Bangor and North East Wales Institute merger seems to have been put on the backburner for now. As I said, the UWIC and University of Glamorgan merger is definitely off for quite a long period. However, one merger has taken place and, as I remember, a substantial sum out of the £40 million to £45 million—some £8 million or £10 million—was put in as an incentive and it is also available to other colleges. The rest of that £45 million, other than the sum already allocated to encourage the merger between Cardiff University and the medical school, is sitting there waiting. It is a carrot to encourage mergers, the reduction of overheads and the return of money to the front-line of education. We can encourage mergers, but we cannot force them.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** Ten weeks have passed since you last answered questions in the Chamber. Will you tell us what your Government has done in that intervening period to make life better for the people of Wales?

**The First Minister:** I turned up here every Tuesday, as you know, but you did not turn up to ask me the questions, so that would be the reason why I did not answer them. We have seen a continued fall in unemployment in Wales and you will have heard the announcement about education results, which indicate that the speed of advance of Welsh school pupils during the last five years, since the Assembly was established, is 10 per cent greater than that of pupils in England. Even though England is doing extremely well, we are doing better. That all happened during the summer, and we have voiced our approval of the huge efforts of Welsh schoolchildren and their teachers. It bodes well for the future that, even though England is doing well, we can do even better in improving on the number of good quality GCSEs that are being obtained by Welsh schoolchildren.

**Michael German:** I am rather surprised that you did not tell us about the money that you will have to chuck in to relieve the pain and misery that council tax payers in Wales will

effaith a geir ar yr asesiad o ymchwil, sef un o'r rhesymau y mae'r cyfuno rhwng Prifysgol Cymru, Bangor ac Athrofa Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru, er enghraifft, wedi'i roi o'r neilltu am y tro. Fel y dywedais, mae'r cyfuno rhwng Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru Caerdydd a Phrifysgol Morgannwg wedi'i ohirio am gyfnod eithaf hir. Serch hynny, mae un cyfuniad wedi digwydd ac, yn ôl yr hyn a gofiai, cyfrannwyd swm sylweddol o'r £40 miliwn i £45 miliwn—tua £8 miliwn neu £10 miliwn—fel anogaeth ac mae hwnnw ar gael hefyd i golegau eraill. Mae gweddill y £45 miliwn hwnnw, heblaw am y swm a ddyrannwyd eisoes i hybu'r cyfuno rhwng Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r ysgol feddygol, yn barod i gael ei wario. Mae'n abwyd i hyrwyddo cyfuno, lleihau costau cyffredinol a rhoi arian yn ôl yn y rheng flaen byd addysg. Gallwn hybu cyfuno, ond ni allwn ei orfodi.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae 10 wythnos wedi mynd heibio ers ichi ateb cwestiynau yn y Siambr ddiwethaf. A ddywedwch wrthym beth a wnaeth eich Llywodraeth yn y cyfamser i wella bywyd pobl Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deuthum yma bob dydd Mawrth, fel y gwyddoch, ond ni ddaethoch chi i ofyn y cwestiynau, felly dyna'r rheswm na wneuthum eu hateb. Gwelsom ostyngiad pellach yn nifer y di-waith yng Nghymru ac fe fyddwch wedi clywed y cyhoeddiad am ganlyniadau addysg, sy'n dangos bod cynnydd disgyblion ysgol yng Nghymru yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yn 10 y cant yn fwy nag ymhlith disgyblion yn Lloegr. Er bod Lloegr yn gwneud yn dda dros ben, yr ydym ni'n gwneud yn well. Digwyddodd hynny i gyd yn ystod yr haf, ac yr ydym wedi datgan ein cymeradwyaeth i ymdrechion aruthrol plant ysgol Cymru a'u hathrawon. Er bod Lloegr yn gwneud yn dda, mae'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y dyfodol y gallwn ni wneud yn well byth o ran rhagori ar nifer y canlyniadau TGAU da a gaiff plant ysgol yng Nghymru.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn synnu braidd na ddywedasoch wrthym am yr arian y byddwch yn gorfod ei roi at liniaru'r boen a'r gofid y bydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yng

suffer as a result of rebanding by up to two bands. Given that your Government in London has kicked the review of council tax into the long grass—rebanding in England will take place in 2007, compared with 2004-05 in Wales—will you tell us whether your colleagues in London would not be so keen to push this issue into the long grass if they had been faced with rebanding this year?

**The First Minister:** This is a great example of honest politics. Rebanding should be done fairly often. If it is left to drag on, then when it is eventually done, as is legally required, the shock when the figures emerge can be quite considerable. We have left it some 10 or 12 years already and that is a long time. It should be done every seven years so that the shock is not so great. Your point about rebanding is that it is the shock horror effect of the figures that has the greatest impact. However, provided that the quantum of money raised from council tax payers remains the same, and all house prices go up by the same amount across Wales and everybody goes up one band, then it has no impact on how much council tax is paid. What happens when some areas' house prices increase more than others is that some people will gain and others will lose. You cannot have losers in a rebanding exercise without an equal number of gainers. If the total quantum raised by council tax increases, it will still not have an impact, because it is about the differential between how much an individual's house value has increased and how much the average has increased. However, there will obviously be gainers and losers.

**Michael German:** As I understand it, four out of 10 people in Wales will be losers and you have put some money in to try to ease the pain. We are two years ahead of England, which is not rebanding until 2007. The whole issue of council tax and local government finance has been kicked into the long grass. Should not your honest answer be that you have had to provide money because your colleagues in London have postponed the whole operation for two years and you are now faced with difficulties in Wales? People will be faced with an increased whammy of an even more unfair tax and the differential

Nghymru yn eu dioddef o ganlyniad i'w codi dau fand yn uwch. Gan fod eich Llywodraeth yn Llundain wedi bwrw'r adolygiad o'r dreth gyngor o'r neilltu—bydd yr ailfandio yn digwydd yn Lloegr yn 2007, yn hytrach na 2004-05 fel y bu yng Nghymru—a ddywedwch wrthym a fuasai'ch cymheiriaid yn Llundain yn llai eiddgar am fwrw'r mater hwn o'r neilltu pe buasent yn wynebu ailfandio eleni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn enghraifft wych o wleidyddiaeth onest. Dylid ailfandio'n eithaf aml. Os gadewir iddo lusgo ymlaen, pan wneir ef yn y diwedd, fel y mae'r gyfraith yn mynnu, gellir cael cryn ysgytwad pan ddaw'r ffigurau i'r golwg. Yr ydym wedi'i adael am ryw 10 neu 12 mlynedd yn barod ac mae hynny'n gyfnod maith. Dylid ei wneud bob saith mlynedd fel na fydd cymaint o ysgytwad. Y pwynt a wnaethoch am ailfandio yw mai'r ysgytwad a berir gan y ffigurau sy'n cael yr effaith fwyaf. Fodd bynnag, cyn belled ag y bo'r swm o arian a godir ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor yn aros yr un fath, a bod yr holl brisiau tai yn codi'r un maint ledled Cymru a bod pawb yn codi un band, ni chaiff effaith ar swm y dreth gyngor a delir. Yr hyn sy'n digwydd pan yw'r prisiau tai mewn rhai ardaloedd yn codi'n fwy nag mewn eraill yw y bydd rhai pobl ar eu hennill ac eraill ar eu colled. Ni ellir cael rhai sydd ar eu colled wrth ailfandio heb gael yr un nifer o rai sydd ar eu hennill. Os bydd y cyfanswm a godir drwy'r dreth gyngor yn fwy, ni chaiff hynny effaith ychwaith, gan ei fod yn ymwneud â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng maint y cynnydd yng ngwerth tŷ rhywun a'r cynnydd ar gyfartaledd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg y bydd rhai'n ennill ac eraill yn colli.

**Michael German:** Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, bydd pedwar o bob 10 o bobl Cymru ar eu colled ac yr ydych chi wedi rhoi rhywfaint o arian i leddfu'r boen. Yr ydym ddwy flynedd o flaen Lloegr, nad yw'n ailfandio tan 2007. Mae holl fater y dreth gyngor a chyllid llywodraeth leol wedi'i fwrw o'r neilltu. Oni ddylech ateb yn onest drwy ddweud eich bod wedi gorfod darparu arian gan fod eich cymheiriaid yn Llundain wedi gohirio'r holl waith am ddwy flynedd a'ch bod chi bellach yn wynebu anawsterau yng Nghymru? Caiff pobl fwy o ergyd gan dreth annhecach byth a bydd y gwahaniaeth rhwng y tlodion, a fydd

between the poor, who will have to pay more for their council services, and the more affluent people in Wales will be even greater.

**The First Minister:** The poor may well be better off as a result of this. It will depend on where they live and whether their house value has increased by less or more than the Welsh average. The real issue is to try to encourage more people to apply for council tax benefit. If people feel that the shoe is pinching unfairly, then it may be that they are eligible for council tax benefit but are not applying for it. The broad-brush figures are that some 50 per cent of people who are eligible for council tax benefit do not apply for it, for some reason. If we can get everybody who, in principle, is eligible for council tax benefit to apply for and get that benefit, the 'poor' that you describe as being hit by a double whammy would find that they were not hit by a double whammy because they would be receiving benefit.

yn gorfod talu mwy am eu gwasanaethau cyngor, a'r rhai mwy cefnog yng Nghymru yn fwy byth.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd yn well ar y tlodion o ganlyniad i hyn. Bydd yn dibynnu ar y man y maent yn byw ac a yw gwerth eu tŷ wedi codi o lai neu o fwy na'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Y peth pwysig yw ceisio annog mwy o bobl i ymgeisio am fudd-dal treth gyngor. Os yw pobl yn teimlo bod yr esgid fach yn gwasgu'n annheg, mae'n bosibl eu bod yn gymwys i gael budd-dal treth gyngor ac nad ydynt wedi ymgeisio amdano. Y ffigurau'n fras yw bod tua 50 y cant o'r rhai sy'n gymwys i gael budd-dal y dreth gyngor nad ydynt yn ymgeisio amdano, am ryw reswm. Os gallwn beri i bawb sy'n gymwys, mewn egwyddor, i gael budd-dal y dreth gyngor ymgeisio amdano a'i gael, byddai'r 'tlodion' y dywedwch eu bod yn cael ergyd ddwbl yn cael nad oedd hynny'n digwydd gan y byddent yn cael budd-dal.

### **Strategaeth Troseddwy'r Ifanc Cymru Gyfan The All-Wales Youth Offending Strategy**

**Q4 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the all-Wales youth offending strategy? (OAQ37557)

**The First Minister:** Edwina Hart, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, has met the new chair of the Youth Justice Board, Professor Rod Morgan of the University of Bristol. They discussed an approach based on the view that where additional custodial places for young people are needed in Wales, they are best provided in small and local units.

**Gwenda Thomas:** There are several references in the strategy to custodial sentencing and the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration made a clear statement that, although custody will sometimes be necessary, it must be a last resort. Therefore, what discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government had with the Youth Justice Board to ascertain the board's current position on its intention to establish a secure training centre in Glyn Neath, in my constituency?

**C4 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar strategaeth troseddwy'r ifanc i Gymru gyfan? (OAQ37557)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, wedi cwrdd â chadeirydd newydd y Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid, yr Athro Rod Morgan o Brifysgol Bryste. Trafodasant dull o weithredu sy'n seiliedig ar y farn mai gwell, os oes angen darparu mwy o leoedd i gadw pobl ifanc yng Nghymru, yw gwneud hynny mewn unedau bach a lleol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae sawl cyfeiriad yn y strategaeth at ddedfrydau o garchariad a gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ddatganiad pendant i'r perwyl mai carcharu fydd y dewis olaf, er y bydd yn angenrheidiol weithiau. Gan hynny, pa drafodaethau a gafodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru â'r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid i ganfod safbwynt presennol y bwrdd ar ei fwriad i sefydlu canolfan hyfforddi gadarn yng Nglyn-nedd, yn fy etholaeth?

**The First Minister:** You are absolutely right that custody is, in principle, a last resort for the irreducible minimum for whom other programmes simply will not work. However, I will not go further than the reference that I made to the discussions that Edwina Hart has conducted with Professor Morgan of Bristol university, the incoming chair of the Youth Justice Board, and the indication that he, like Edwina, inclines towards the view that custodial places are best provided in small and local units, because the Youth Justice Board has not reached anything like a decision with regard to the specific project to which you referred.

**Laura Anne Jones:** It is widely recognised that drug abuse is a factor that can lead to young people becoming offenders. I am therefore concerned that the Assembly Government has recently withdrawn funding from a Teen Challenge organisation in Abergavenny. First Minister, Teen Challenge has a higher than average success rate in reforming addicts, in an area that has a higher than average number of hard drug users. If you agree with Mrs Hart that prevention is better than cure, then surely you would agree that the Welsh Assembly Government should support organisations such as Teen Challenge?

**The First Minister:** I understand that the decision to refuse funding to Teen Challenge is itself being challenged by Teen Challenge—if I can talk plainly without descending into gobbledygook. The appeal is currently being heard, so the game is not over yet.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud mai carcharu yw'r dewis olaf, mewn egwyddor, i'r lleiafrif anlleihadwy na wnaiff rhaglenni eraill weithio ar ei gyfer. Er hynny, nid af ymhellach na'r cyfeiriad a wneuthum at y trafodaethau y mae Edwina Hart wedi'u cynnal gyda'r Athro Morgan o brifysgol Bryste, sef cadeirydd newydd y Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid, a'r ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos ei fod ef, fel Edwina, yn tueddu at y farn mai gwell yw darparu lleoedd cadw mewn unedau bach a lleol, gan nad yw'r Bwrdd Cyfiawnder Ieuenctid yn agos at wneud penderfyniad mewn cysylltiad â'r prosiect penodol y cyfeiriasoch ato.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fod camddefnyddio cyffuriau'n ffactor a all beri i bobl ifanc droi'n droseddwyr. Yr wyf yn bryderus, gan hynny, am fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi tynnu cyllid yn ôl yn ddiweddar oddi wrth gorff Teen Challenge yn y Fenni. Brif Weinidog, mae Teen Challenge yn cael gwell llwyddiant ar gyfartaledd wrth beri diwygiad ymhlith rhai sy'n gaeth i gyffuriau, a hynny mewn ardal sydd â nifer uwch na'r cyfartaledd o rai sy'n defnyddio cyffuriau cryf. Os cytunwch â Mrs Hart mai gwell rhwystro'r clwyf na'i wella, oni chytunech y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogi cyrff fel Teen Challenge?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn deall bod y penderfyniad i wrthod cyllid i Teen Challenge yn cael ei herio gan Teen Challenge yn ei dro—os caf siarad yn blaen heb ddechrau siarad ffiloreg. Mae'r apêl yn cael gwrandawriad ar hyn o bryd, felly nid yw popeth ar ben eto.

### **Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol Local Government Funding**

**Q5 David Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on local government funding? (OAQ37563)

**The First Minister:** In 2004-05, local government in Wales is receiving over £3.1 billion from the Assembly Government through the local government revenue support grant and some £500 million in

**C5 David Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar gyllid llywodraeth leol? (OAQ37563)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn 2004-05, mae llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'n cael mwy na £3.1 biliwn oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drwy grant cynnal refeniw llywodraeth leol a thua £500 miliwn ar ffurf

specific grants. This represents an increase of 5.2 per cent over the figure for 2003-04, after adjusting for transfers of responsibility.

**David Davies:** The First Minister gave quite a full response to Mike German in an answer to a similar question, but he failed, in my opinion, to answer one rather salient point. Perhaps he can answer in a simple 'yes' or 'no' format whether the Assembly will increase local government funding to every local authority by an amount equivalent to inflation, plus any additional costs that fall on those local authorities, regardless of the percentage of houses that have moved one, two or three bands or more in that local authority area.

**The First Minister:** That was worded in such careful detail that it would probably be better if I wrote to you, or asked Sue Essex to write to you. Let me give it my best shot, David. As I understand it, the provisions made subsequent to the Valuation Office Agency rebanding exercise are that Sue has given an undertaking that no individual household will have an increase of more than one band in year one—if the valuation puts you up two bands, your valuation will only increase by one band in year one. Where that has an impact on the collected resources available to the local authority, it raises the issue of whether we should reconsider the formula. However, it is early days, and that would require detailed work with the Welsh Local Government Association and depend on whether it would be willing to reopen the formula. I am not sure. As this subject is currently being negotiated it would be better if Sue or I gave you a considered reply, giving the latest position.

**David Lloyd:** Pa fesurau trosiannol sydd ar waith i helpu'r bobl a fydd yn gorfod talu llawer mwy o dreth gyngor wedi'r ailfandio?

2.30 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Atebais y cwestiwn hwnnw eisoes, mewn ffordd. Lle bydd asesiad o werth y tŷ wedi codi mwy nag un band, mae Sue wedi addo y bydd y mesur yn cael ei weithredu yn y flwyddyn gyntaf fel na fydd neb yn codi dau fand—un band ar y

grantiau penodol. Mae hynny'n 5.2 y cant yn fwy na'r ffigur ar gyfer 2003-04, ar ôl addasu ar gyfer cyfrifoldebau a drosglwyddwyd.

**David Davies:** Rhoddodd y Prif Weinidog ymateb eithaf llawn i Mike German mewn ateb i gwestiwn tebyg ond, yn fy marn i, methodd ag ateb un pwynt eithaf amlwg. Efallai y gall ateb yn syml drwy ddweud 'bydd' neu 'na fydd' ynghylch a fydd y Cynulliad yn cynyddu cyllid llywodraeth leol ar gyfer pob awdurdod lleol o swm sy'n cyfateb i chwyddiant, ynghyd ag unrhyw gostau ychwanegol a ddaw i ran yr awdurdodau lleol hynny, beth bynnag fo'r ganran o dai a gododd un, dau neu dri band neu'n fwy yn ardal yr awdurdod lleol hwnnw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Geiriwyd hwnnw mor fanwl fel mai gwell, yn ôl pob tebyg, fyddai imi ysgrifennu atoch, neu ofyn i Sue Essex ysgrifennu atoch. Gadewch imi roi cynnig arni, David. Fel yr wyf fi'n ei ddeall, y darpariaethau a wnaed ar ôl yr ailfandio gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio yw bod Sue wedi ymgymryd na fydd yr un cartref yn codi o fwy nag un band ym mlwyddyn un—os yw'r prisio yn eich codi dau fand, ni fydd y prisiad ar eich cyfer ond yn codi o un band ym mlwyddyn un. Os yw hynny'n effeithio ar gyfanswm yr adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r awdurdod lleol, mae'n peri inni feddwl a ddylem ailystyried y fformiwla. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gynnar eto, a byddai hynny'n gofyn gwaith manwl gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac yn dibynnu ar ei pharodrwydd i ailedrych ar y fformiwla. Nid wyf yn sicr. Gan fod y pwnc hwn yn destun negodi ar hyn o bryd, byddai'n well i Sue neu fi roi ateb ystyriol i chi, gan ddweud beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf.

**David Lloyd:** What transitional measures are in place to help those who will have to pay much more council tax as a result of the rebanding?

**The First Minister:** I have already answered that question, in a way. Where the assessment of a house's value increases by more than one band, Sue has promised that a measure will be in place in the first year to ensure that no one will go up two bands—no one will jump



mwyaf y bydd pobl yn codi yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Credwn y bydd hynny yn helpu pobl sydd wedi cael tipyn o sioc yn ystod yr haf gan yr asesiad newydd o werth eu tai.

**Nick Bourne:** When the revaluation exercise was announced, we supported it and expressed concern that there would be more losers than winners. The Minister told us that, roughly—I appreciate that it cannot be absolutely mathematically equated—there would be as many winners as there would be losers. That is patently not the case as, throughout Wales, 33 per cent are losers and only 8 per cent are gainers. Why is that, and what is the Government doing about it?

**The First Minister:** It is a matter for the Valuation Office Agency as to why that is not the case. However, if the overall quantum of money raised through council tax were to remain exactly the same, it would have no impact on the overall level required from council tax payers. The differential factor would be that, if the average council tax band valuation had gone up by 40 per cent, some people's houses will have gone up by 80 per cent, while other people's houses will have not gone up at all and so the ones at the bottom would be the gainers, and the ones at the top would be the losers. The overall quantum, however, would be the same. That is not the same as the numbers being the same, of course.

more than one band in the first year. We believe that that measure will help those who had a bit of a shock during the summer as a result of the new assessment of their house value.

**Nick Bourne:** Pan gyhoeddwyd y byddai ailbrisiad, gwnaethom ei gefnogi a datgan pryder y byddai mwy ar eu colled nag ar eu hennill. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrthym y byddai cynifer o enillwyr ag o gollwyr, yn fras—sylweddolaf na all fod yn gwbl gyfartal yn fathemategol. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir oherwydd, ledled Cymru, mae 33 y cant ar eu colled a dim ond 8 y cant sydd ar eu hennill. Pam y mae hynny, a beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yn ei gylch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisiog yw pam nad felly y mae. Fodd bynnag, pe byddai cyfanswm yr arian a godid drwy'r dreth gyngor yn aros yn union yr un fath, ni châi effaith ar y swm cyffredinol y byddai'n rhaid ei godi ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor. Y ffactor sy'n peri gwahaniaeth yw, os oedd prisiad o'r band cyfartalog ar gyfer y dreth gyngor wedi codi o 40 y cant, y bydd tai rhai pobl wedi codi o 80 y cant, tra bydd tai pobl eraill heb godi o gwbl ac felly y rhai ar y gwaelod a fyddai ar eu hennill, a'r rhai yn y pen uchaf a fyddai ar eu colled. Yr un fyddai'r swm cyffredinol, fodd bynnag. Nid yw hynny yr un peth â phe byddai'r rhifau yr un fath, wrth gwrs.

### Dyled Bersonol Personal Debt

**Q6 Sandy Mewies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the social and economic consequences of personal debt in Wales? (OAQ37622)

**The First Minister:** We are concerned about over-indebtedness, which can have substantial costs for individuals and our wider society. In December 2003, Edwina Hart, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, and her Deputy Minister, Huw Lewis, undertook a review to consider the scale and nature of over-indebtedness in Wales. This review is due to be completed next month, and it will set out recommendations for further action.

**C6 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ganlyniadau cymdeithasol ac economaidd dyled bersonol yng Nghymru? (OAQ37622)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch gorddyled, a all beri costau sylweddol i unigolion ac i'n cymdeithas yn gyffredinol. Yn Rhagfyr 2003, ymgymerodd Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a'i Dirprwy Weinidog, Huw Lewis, ag adolygiad i ystyried maint a natur gorddyled yng Nghymru. Mae'r adolygiad hwn i fod i gael ei gwblhau y mis nesaf, a bydd yn cynnig argymhellion ar gyfer camau pellach.

**Sandy Mewies:** With so many different financial services on offer, the risk of sliding into unmanageable debt is greater than ever before, especially for those who are financially illiterate. This is a great threat to the young. Will you join me, therefore, in welcoming the action taken by Flint High School, in my Delyn constituency, and its partners in Communities First, the Citizens Advice Bureaux, and the Basic Skills Agency, to introduce a course on the management of money, which gives financial literacy to year 10 pupils? Huw Lewis, the Deputy Minister, visited it during the recess. Will your Government examine the possibility of extending such courses across Wales? Also, will you join me in welcoming the chair of Flintshire County Council, who is visiting the Assembly today, and who, I am sure, will be interested in your response?

**The First Minister:** I am grateful to you for informing me about that. It is important that we remember just how much soliciting of debt currently takes place. I get junk mail virtually every day from some credit card company offering to extend me credit. I do a lap of honour if no junk mail comes through my letterbox on a particular day. I do not know if that happens to other people. It is important, however, to realise that some people get into debt. They fall into the hands of loan sharks, and we need to be able to give the people of Wales an alternative to those loan sharks. We can provide that alternative through the credit union movement and the debt rescue scheme, which has already been introduced and which enables people to get out of the grip of loan sharks by going to the credit union. I strongly commend the particular programme that you mentioned as being introduced in Flintshire schools. It is never too soon for young people to learn how to fend off this problem of indebtedness when credit seems terribly easy and when there are so many different ways of obtaining loans. You are always told that they are affordable and that you will never notice the easy repayment terms. That is okay for one loan, but if you have four, then you do notice them.

**Sandy Mewies:** Gan fod cynifer o wahanol wasanaethau ariannol ar gynnig, mae'r perygl o fynd i ddyledion trwm yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen, yn enwedig i'r rhai sy'n anwybodus ynghylch arian. Mae hyn yn fygythiad mawr i'r ifanc. A wnewch ymuno â mi, felly, i groesawu'r camau a gymerwyd gan Ysgol Uwchradd y Fflint, yn fy etholaeth, sef Delyn, a'i phartneriaid yn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, y Canolfannau Cyngor ar Bopeth, a'r Asiantaeth Sgiliau Sylfaenol, i gyflwyno cwrs ar reoli arian, sy'n dysgu disgyblion ym mlwyddyn 10 am y modd i drafod arian? Daeth Huw Lewis, y Dirprwy Weinidog, i'w weld yn ystod y toriad. A wnaiff eich Llywodraeth ymchwilio i'r posibilrwydd o ymestyn cyrsiau o'r fath ledled Cymru? Hefyd, a wnewch ymuno â mi i groesawu cadeirydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint, sy'n ymweld â'r Cynulliad heddiw, ac a fydd yn ymddiddori yn eich ymateb, yr wyf yn siŵr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i chi am roi gwybod i mi am hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni gofio cynifer o gynigion a geir i fynd i ddyled ar hyn o bryd. Caf lythyrau sgrwtsh bron bob dydd oddi wrth ryw gwmni cardiau credyd neu'i gilydd yn cynnig credyd i mi. Byddaf yn llawenhau os na ddaw unrhyw lythyrau sgrwtsh drwy'r twll llythyrau ambell ddiwrnod. Ni wn a yw hynny'n digwydd i bobl eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod rhai pobl yn mynd i ddyled. Maent yn mynd i afael usurwyr, a rhaid inni allu cynnig dewis arall i bobl Cymru yn lle'r usurwyr hynny. Gallwn gynnig y dewis hwnnw drwy fudiad yr undebau credyd a'r cynllun achub rhag dyled, sydd eisoes wedi'i gyflwyno ac sy'n galluogi pobl i ddianc rhag gafael usurwyr drwy fynd at yr undeb credyd. Mawr gymeradwyaf y rhaglen benodol y dywedasoeh ei bod yn cael ei chyflwyno mewn ysgolion yn sir y Fflint. Nid yw byth yn rhy gynnar i bobl ifanc ddechrau dysgu sut i ochel y broblem hon o ddyledusrwydd pan yw credyd yn ymddangos yn ddewis hawdd a phan fo cynifer o wahanol ddulliau i gael benthyciadau. Dywedir wrthyech bob tro eu bod yn fforddiadwy ac na fyddwch byth yn sylwi ar y telerau ad-dalu hawdd. Mae hynny'n iawn os mai un benthyciad sydd gennych, ond os oes gennych bedwar, byddwch yn sylwi arnynt.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mortgages are a large part of personal debt. In 2001, only 1 per cent of borrowers took out a mortgage of four times their salary or more. That figure has now risen to 7 per cent, and is still rising. House prices are putting massive pressure on families, and you will be aware that the price rises in Cardiff are excessive, where land prices have risen considerably. Council tax rebanding will add to this phenomenal pressure on families. You said earlier that this will not necessarily affect the poor; in Cardiff, as you well know, areas such as Cathays, which are not rich areas, have been disproportionately affected by price rises and council tax rebanding increases. Will you reconsider your disastrous policy to introduce this rebanding this year?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure what alternative you are offering in the property tax field. Putting off the evil day when you do your rebanding is fool's gold, because the shock will be greater if you leave it 15 years instead of 12. The only regret that I would express, in a way, is that we did not do this three or four years ago, because doing it more frequently would mean less of a shock. On your point regarding areas such as Cathays, which I know well, although not as well as you do, several other factors are at work there, namely the takeover of the conventional residential population because of the higher value that can be gained by selling a house for student occupation than for family occupation, because the tax position is totally different. Sadly, this tends to drive values up and families out. Therefore, the Cathays ward has other problems in addition to those that you mentioned.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that we need to market the credit unions hard, because there is a clear capitalist response to this issue, which is to provide loans at reasonable rates of interest?

**The First Minister:** I agree. When John Hume was interviewed after he won the Nobel Peace Prize, he was asked what he had

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae morgeisiau'n rhan fawr o ddyled bersonol. Yn 2001, dim ond 1 y cant o fenthycwyr a gododd forgais a oedd yn bedair gwaith gymaint â'u cyflog neu'n fwy. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi codi i 7 y cant bellach, ac mae'n dal i godi. Mae prisiau tai'n rhoi pwysau aruthrol ar deuluoedd, a byddwch yn ymwybodol bod y codiadau mewn prisiau yng Nghaerdydd yn ormodol, lle y mae prisiau tir wedi codi'n sylweddol. Bydd ailfandio'r dreth gyngor yn ychwanegu at y pwysau syfrdanol hyn sydd ar deuluoedd. Dywedasoeh yn gynharach na fydd hyn yn effeithio ar y tlodion o reidrwydd; yng Nghaerdydd, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, mae ardaloedd fel Cathays, nad ydynt yn ardaloedd cyfoethog, wedi'u heffeithio'n anghymesur gan godiadau mewn prisiau a chodiadau drwy ailfandio'r dreth gyngor. A wnewch ailystyried eich polisi trychinebus i gyflwyno'r ailfandio hwn eleni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr pa ddewis arall yr ydych yn ei gynnig ym maes trethi ar eiddo. Cynnig ffug gysur yw gohirio'r diwrnod anffodus y gwneir yr ailfandio, gan y bydd yr ysgytwad yn fwy os gadewir ef am 15 mlynedd yn lle 12. Yr unig ofid a fynegwn, ar ryw ystyr, yw na wnaethom hyn dair neu bedair blynedd yn ôl, gan y byddai ei wneud yn amlach yn peri llai o ysgytwad. Ynghylch y pwynt a wnaethoch am ardaloedd fel Cathays, yr wyf yn ei adnabod yn dda, er nad cystal ag yr ydych chi, mae sawl ffactor arall ar waith yn y fan honno, sef disodli'r boblogaeth breswyl gyffredin gan fod modd cael pris gwell drwy werthu tŷ ar gyfer deiliadaeth gan fyfyrwyr yn hytrach nag ar gyfer deiliadaeth gan deuluoedd, gan fod y sefyllfa o ran treth yn gwbl wahanol. Gwaetha'r modd, mae hyn yn tueddu i wthio gwerthoedd yn uwch a gyrru teuluoedd allan. Felly, ceir problemau eraill yn ward Cathays ar ben y rhai y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni farchnata'r undebau credyd yn gryf, gan fod ymateb cyfalafol amlwg i'r mater hwn, sef darparu benthyciadau ar gyfraddau llog rhesymol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Pan gyfwelwyd John Hume wedi iddo ennill Gwobr Heddwch Nobel, gofynnwyd iddo ym

done that he was most proud of, and he said that it was setting up the Derry Credit Union. Three quarters of Derry's population were signed up to it and it had resources of £40 million in the bank 20 or 30 years after he set it up. It also prevented Derry descending, despite its heavy unemployment, into social catastrophe.

mha un o'i gyflawniadau yr oedd yn ymfalchïo fwyaf, a dywedodd mai sefydlu Undeb Credyd Dinas y Deri oedd hynny. Yr oedd tri chwarter poblogaeth Dinas y Deri wedi ymuno ag ef ac yr oedd ganddo £40 miliwn o adnoddau yn y banc 20 neu 30 mlynedd wedi iddo'i sefydlu. Yn ogystal â hynny, ataliodd drychineb gymdeithasol yn Ninas y Deri, er gwaethaf y diweithdra mawr a oedd yno.

### **Gweithio y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol yn y GIG Out-of-Hours Working in the NHS**

**Q7 Kirsty Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on out-of-hours working in the NHS? (OAQ37571)

**C7 Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch gweithio y tu allan i'r oriau arferol yn y GIG? (OAQ37571)

**The First Minister:** The new general medical services contract for GPs provides that responsibility for out-of-hours medical services will transfer from the individual general practitioner practice to local health boards by 31 December 2004 at the latest. I am pleased to report to the Assembly that local health boards are making excellent progress, and all the new services are scheduled to be in place by the middle of November—six weeks before the deadline.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n amod yn y contract gwasanaeth meddygol cyffredinol newydd ar gyfer meddygon teulu y bydd y cyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau meddygol y tu allan i oriau arferol yn cael ei drosglwyddo o bractis yr ymarferwr cyffredinol ei hun i fyrddau iechyd lleol erbyn 31 Rhagfyr 2004 fan bellaf. Yr wyf yn falch o hysbysu'r Cynulliad bod byrddau iechyd lleol yn gwneud cynnydd rhagorol, a bod yr holl wasanaethau newydd wedi'u hamserlennu i fod ar waith erbyn canol Tachwedd—chwe wythnos cyn pryd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is the First Minister aware that one third of GPs have withdrawn from out-of-hours cover of community hospitals, following the refusal of the Minister for Health and Social Services to negotiate a national pay deal on this matter? How does the First Minister believe that the potential loss of community hospital beds will reduce waiting lists and bedblocking in NHS Wales and lead to a sustainable future for our community hospitals?

**Kirsty Williams:** A wŷr y Prif Weinidog fod un rhan o dair o'r meddygon teulu wedi tynnu allan o'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau arferol ar gyfer ysbytai cymunedol, wedi i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrthod negodi cytundeb cyflog cenedlaethol ar y mater hwn? Ym mha fodd y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn rhagweld y bydd y posibilrwydd o golli gwelyau mewn ysbytai cymunedol yn lleihau rhestrau aros a blocio gwelyau yn GIG Cymru ac yn arwain at ddyfodol cynaliadwy i'n hysbytai cymunedol?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether that is the same issue, but I will arrange for Jane Hutt to write to you on it.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr ai'r un mater yw hwnnw, ond trefnaf i Jane Hutt ysgrifennu atoch yn ei gylich.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that every effort should be made to publicise changes to the service, given that, in my area, there is already a high incidence of inappropriate self-referrals to the accident

**Christine Chapman:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylid gwneud pob ymdrech i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'r newidiadau i'r gwasanaeth, gan fod llawer o achosion eisoes, yn fy ardal i, o rai sy'n gwneud cais

and emergency department? Will you ensure that you and the health Minister closely monitor the new service, particularly in the early stages?

**The First Minister:** I agree. Inappropriate self-referral to accident and emergency departments is a curse of the Welsh health service, because, as we know, some 55 per cent of hospital attendances are through the accident and emergency route, compared with 35 per cent in England. That makes hospitals far more difficult to run, because too many people coming in inappropriately through that route tends to knock out elective surgery sessions. Any fears arising from the loss of out-of-hours services could make the problem worse. In the meantime, Wales has pioneered an approach of undertaking consultant triage, virtually at the door, at the Royal Glamorgan Hospital, and I believe that the Royal Gwent Hospital and Morriston Hospital have also taken this up in their accident and emergency departments. That is a pioneering Welsh answer to a particular Welsh problem, but it is applicable in every hospital in the UK.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A fydddech yn cytuno bod cael gweld meddyg teulu o fewn oriau gwaith ac oddi allan i oriau gwaith yn eithriadol o bwysig i gleifion ledled Cymru? A fydddech hefyd yn cytuno y byddai wedi bod yn ddoethach i gyfeirio'r 6,000 o bobl ledled Prydain a fydd yn derbyn llythyr i'w rhybuddio y gallent fod wedi'u heintio gyda vCJD at eu meddygon teulu er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y profion perthnasol cyn eu bod yn derbyn llythyr a allai godi braw amynt?

2.40 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn ysgrifennu at bobl weithiau yn ddiffygiol o ran ymateb i gleifion a'u hofnau, neu efallai i bobl sydd eisiau profion er mwyn dangos nad cleifion mohonynt. Weithiau, gall fod yn llythyr eithaf caled. Nid wyf wedi gweld y llythyr hwn, ac nid oes gennyf wybodaeth amdano,

amhriodol drostynt eu hunain am gael eu derbyn i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys? A wnewch sicrhau y byddwch chi a'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn cadw llygad barcud ar y gwasanaeth newydd, yn enwedig ar y dechrau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Mae ceisiadau amhriodol i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn felltith ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, oherwydd, fel y gwyddom, daw tua 55 y cant o'r rhai sy'n ymbresenoli mewn ysbytai ar hyd y llwybr damweiniau ac achosion brys, o'i gymharu â 35 y cant yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n peri ei bod yn llawer anos rhedeg ysbytai oherwydd, os daw gormod o bobl i mewn ar y llwybr hwnnw, mae hynny'n tueddu i ddisodli sesiynau llawfeddygaeth ddewisol. Gallai unrhyw bryderon sy'n codi yn sgîl colli gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol beri i'r broblem waethygu. Yn y cyfamser, mae Cymru wedi arloesi dull o flaenoriaethu gan ymgynghorwyr, wrth y drws bron, yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg, a chredaf fod Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent ac Ysbyty Treforys wedi ymgymryd â hyn hefyd yn eu hadrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Dyna ateb Cymreig arloesol i broblem Gymreig benodol, ond mae'n berthnasol i bob ysbyty yn y DU.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Would you agree that the availability of a GP within working hours and outside those hours is extremely important to patients throughout Wales? Would you also agree that it would have been wiser to refer the 6,000 people throughout Britain who are to be sent a letter warning them that they may have been infected by vCJD to their GPs to ensure that they have the appropriate tests before they receive a letter that could cause them great anxiety?

**The First Minister:** The way in which the national health service writes to people, on occasion, leaves much to be desired in terms of responding to the fears of patients, or those who may need tests in order to show that they are not patients. On occasion, that letter can be quite frightening. I have not seen this letter, and have no information about it, but I

ond ymchwiliad i'r mater a byddaf i neu Jane Hutt yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â hyn pan fyddaf wedi cael y wybodaeth.

will look into the matter. Jane Hutt or I will write to you regarding this issue once I have received that information.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Bearing in mind the number of accidents that occur at night, do you share my concern that the number of vacancies in the Welsh ambulance service doubled between September last year and March this year? What does your Government intend to do to help remedy the situation, which, in terms of providing out-of-hours service and cover, particularly for elderly residents who may need medical assistance, makes life difficult for the ambulance service?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Gan gofio am y nifer o ddamweiniau sy'n digwydd yn y nos, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder bod nifer y swyddi gwag yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru wedi dyblu rhwng mis Medi y llynedd a mis Mawrth eleni? Beth y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ei wneud i helpu i gywiro'r sefyllfa, sydd, o ran darparu gwasanaeth a gofal y tu allan i oriau arferol, yn enwedig ar gyfer trigolion oedranus y gallai fod arnynt angen cymorth meddygol, yn peri trafferthion i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans?

**The First Minister:** The Welsh ambulance service is a crucial part of our health service. That is different from 20 years ago when we did not have paramedics. They can undertake assessments and can give you life-saving clot busters if you have had a cardiac arrest, provided that they have been trained to do that. There is therefore a great deal of training and upgrading of the entire profession. I am not aware of the problem of vacancy levels, and I do not know whether that is caused by many staff members being taken off for thrombolysis training. However, I will ensure that the Welsh ambulance service, Jane Hutt, or I write to you.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru'n rhan hollbwysig o'n gwasanaeth iechyd. Nid felly yr oedd 20 mlynedd yn ôl pan nad oedd gennym barameddygon. Gallant wneud asesiadau a rhoi moddion i chwalu tolchenni gwaed i achub eich bywyd os cawsoch ataliad ar y galon, ar yr amod eu bod wedi'u hyfforddi i wneud hynny. Felly ceir llawer iawn o hyfforddi a gwella yn y proffesiwn cyfan. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r broblem ynghylch nifer y swyddi gwag, ac ni wn ai'r achos am hynny yw bod llawer o aelodau staff wedi'u tynnu oddi wrth eu gwaith i gael hyfforddiant mewn thrombolysis. Fodd bynnag, sicrhaf y bydd gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru, Jane Hutt neu fi'n ysgrifennu atoch.

### **Cyllid Addysg ar gyfer Ysgolion Education Funding for Schools**

**Q8 Mark Isherwood:** Will the First Minister make a statement on education funding for schools? (OAQ37559)

**C8 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch cyllid addysg ar gyfer ysgolion? (OAQ37559)

**The First Minister:** I am sure that you will have taken note of the excellent news that I gave about this year's GCSE results, which came out in August. Funding for schools is a matter for individual local authorities to determine. They must take account of the views of their school budget forum—a recent initiative that has attempted to take away some of the heat in the argument about schools budgeting in Wales. An analysis of budgets set for 2004-05 was provided to the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi nodi'r newyddion rhagorol a roddais am y canlyniadau TGAU eleni, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Awst. Mater i'w benderfynu gan yr awdurdodau lleol eu hunain yw cyllid i ysgolion. Rhaid iddynt ystyried barn eu fforwm cyllideb ysgolion—menter ddiweddar sydd wedi ceisio tawelu rywfaint ar y dadlau am gyllidebu ysgolion yng Nghymru. Rhoddwyd dadansoddiad o gyllidebau a bennwyd ar gyfer 2004-05 i'r

Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in July.

**Mark Isherwood:** How would you respond to Labour MP, Ian Lucas, who has complained that the Labour Welsh Assembly Government has not passed on sufficient education funds to Wrexham County Borough Council in its local government funding formula—a formula described in a Flintshire County Council document as flawed, because it fails to meet the needs of north-east Wales?

**The First Minister:** Wrexham had an 8.2 per cent increase in net schools expenditure, and a 10.2 per cent increase in gross schools expenditure, which includes central grants, which is £3,985 per pupil on gross schools expenditure. I understand that the results in Wrexham were a good leap forward on last year's results, and the pupils and teachers and everyone involved in schools education in Wrexham are to be congratulated, and not deplored.

**Carl Sargeant:** As one of the directly elected Members for Alyn and Deeside, education funding in Flintshire is significantly important to me. However, let that not distract us from the excellent set of A-level and GCSE results that were produced this year by an excellent and exceptional set of pupils. To examine this further, will the Government meet with me so that we can examine the issues in detail and explore how we may reduce the funding gap between local authorities?

**The First Minister:** I am happy to do that. The figures for Flintshire show that net schools budget expenditure was up by 7.5 per cent, compared with 8.2 per cent in Wrexham. However, the gross schools expenditure, including central grants, was up 10.8 per cent, which is higher than the Wrexham figure of 10.2 per cent. The overall actual spend was £3,752 per pupil on gross schools expenditure. Flintshire results were good this year and we must ensure that they continue to go in the right direction, because Flintshire is important as a powerhouse of the Welsh economy.

Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Gorffennaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Sut y byddech yn ymateb i AS Llafur, Ian Lucas, sydd wedi cwyno nad yw'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru Lafur wedi trosglwyddo digon o gyllid addysg i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam yn ei fformiwla gyllido ar gyfer llywodraeth leol—fformiwla a alwyd yn un ddiffygiol mewn dogfen o eiddo Cyngor Sir y Fflint, gan ei bod yn methu â diwallu anghenion y Gogledd-ddwyrain?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cafodd Wrecsam gynnydd o 8.2 y cant yn ei wariant ysgolion net, a chynnydd o 10.2 y cant yn ei wariant ysgolion crynswth, sy'n cynnwys grantiau canolog, sef £3,985 y disgybl ar wariant ysgolion crynswth. Deallaf fod y canlyniadau yn Wrecsam yn well o lawer na'r rhai y llynedd, a dylid llongyfarch y disgyblion a'r athrawon a phawb sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysg ysgolion yn Wrecsam, ac nid gresynu atynt.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel un o'r Aelodau a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, mae cyllid addysg yn sir y Fflint yn bwysig iawn i mi. Fodd bynnag, na foed i hynny dynnu ein sylw oddi wrth y canlyniadau Safon Uwch a TGAU ardderchog a gafwyd eleni gan ddisgyblion rhagorol ac eithriadol. Er mwyn ymchwilio ymhellach i hyn, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth gwrdd â mi fel y gallwn edrych ar y materion dan sylw yn fanwl ac ymchwilio i'r modd y gallwn leihau'r bwlch cyllido rhwng awdurdodau lleol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddaf yn falch o wneud hynny. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer sir y Fflint yn dangos bod y gwariant net ar gyllidebau ysgol wedi codi o 7.5 y cant, o'i gymharu ag 8.2 y cant yn Wrecsam. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y gwariant crynswth ar ysgolion, gan gynnwys grantiau canolog, yn 10.8 y cant yn fwy, sy'n uwch na'r ffigur ar gyfer Wrecsam, sef 10.2 y cant. Gwir gyfanswm y gwariant oedd £3,752 y disgybl yn y gwariant crynswth ar ysgolion. Cafwyd canlyniadau da eleni yn sir y Fflint a rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn dal i fynd i'r cyfeiriad iawn, gan fod sir y Fflint yn rym pwysig yn economi Cymru.

## Prisiau Gwasanaeth Dŵr Water Service Prices

**Q9 Brian Gibbons:** Has the First Minister had any discussions with Dŵr Cymru about its proposed above-inflation price increases for water service? (OAQ37561)

**The First Minister:** I have not, but Carwyn Jones has, as the Minister with responsibility for the environment, which includes responsibility for the water industry. Other parties are involved, including consumer advocacy groups, some of whom have a statutory role, and some of whom have a more informal role. They have protested strongly about the impact on Welsh consumers of the high increases proposed by Welsh Water—Dŵr Cymru. We know on what it will spend the money, but, on the other hand, it is hard for people to pay those bills.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that you would agree that the proposed 13 per cent increase in water bills, and British Gas's proposed 12 per cent plus increase in gas bills, are completely contrary to the spirit of the Assembly's social inclusion agenda. Do you not agree that we need a more open and transparent system for setting water and gas prices and a regulatory system that is much more vigorous in dealing with the issue of social responsibility in order to reign in these free-market buccaneers who seem to be more interested in exploiting people who cannot afford to pay for their services?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure whether you can apply the term 'free-market buccaneers' to Dŵr Cymru as it is a non-profit-making body, although it can be applied to the gas and electricity companies that you mentioned. It is important that we recognise what happened following the privatisation of the water industry, when water prices in Wales shot up and doubled quickly. The water company in Wales then went belly up and became a not-for-profit, bond-financed, new type of stakeholder-based company which, during its first four years, introduced low price increases compared to other water companies. Now

**C9 Brian Gibbons:** A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Dŵr Cymru ynghylch ei fwriad i godi prisiau'r gwasanaeth dŵr yn uwch na chwyddiant? (OAQ37561)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf fi, ond y mae Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros yr amgylchedd, sy'n cynnwys cyfrifoldeb dros y diwydiant dŵr. Mae partïon eraill yn gysylltiedig â hyn, gan gynnwys grwpiau eiriolaeth cwsmeriaid, y mae gan rai ohonynt rôl statudol, ac eraill rôl fwy anffurfiol. Maent wedi protestio'n gryf ynghylch yr effaith ar ddefnyddwyr yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r codiadau mawr y mae Welsh Water—Dŵr Cymru yn eu cynnig. Gwyddom ar ba beth y bydd yn gwario'r arian, ond, ar y llaw arall, mae'n anodd i bobl dalu'r biliau hynny.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech fod y cynnydd arfaethedig o 13 y cant mewn biliau dŵr, a'r cynnydd o fwy na 12 y cant y mae Nwy Prydain yn ei gynnig mewn biliau nwy, yn gwbl groes i ysbryd agenda'r Cynulliad ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Oni chytunwch fod arnom angen system fwy agored a thryloyw ar gyfer pennu prisiau dŵr a nwy a system rheoleiddio sy'n ymdrin yn llawer mwy egnïol â mater cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol er mwyn ffrwyno'r ysbeilwyr hyn yn y farchnad rydd yr ymddengys ei bod yn bwysicach ganddynt fanteisio ar bobl na allant fforddio talu am eu gwasanaethau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a ellid cymhwyso'r term 'ysbeilwyr yn y farchnad rydd' at Dŵr Cymru gan mai corff nad yw'n gwneud elw ydyw, er y gellir ei gymhwyso at y cwmnïau nwy a thrydan y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod yr hyn a ddigwyddodd wedi preifateiddio'r diwydiant dŵr, pan gododd prisiau dŵr yng Nghymru i'r entrychion a dyblu mewn byr dro. Wedyn aeth y cwmni dŵr yng Nghymru i'r gwellt a thro'i'n fath newydd o gwmni nad oedd yn bod er mwyn gwneud elw a oedd yn seiliedig ar randdeiliaid ac yn cael ei gyllido drwy fondiau, ac a gyflwynodd godiadau ym mhrisiau dŵr, yn ystod ei bedair blynedd



there is a catching-up exercise and the regulator has allowed Dŵr Cymru to increase prices well above average increases. They were already high, but they are now increasing even more, and although they are not as high as those in south-west England, I believe that they are the second highest in Great Britain.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You mentioned the fact that Dŵr Cymru is a not-for-profit company. I urge your Government to hold further discussions with it regarding these proposed pay rises and to remind it that political parties in the Assembly were prepared to support its establishment to protect consumers in Wales and not to allow them to be exploited, as they seem to be under these proposed increases.

**The First Minister:** I believe that you mean price rises and not pay rises; I think that you were referring to the directors.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yes.

**The First Minister:** What they claim is that if you use 1999 as a start date, given the fact that they introduced low increases in their initial four-year term, and then high increases in the second term, during the two terms together there was a real increase of 1 per cent compared to the 3 per cent introduced by other water companies. However, it is hard to accept that as they are using 1999 as a start date. Their initial social inclusion agenda, which involved getting the Assembly on side by introducing low increases, has been thrown out of the window—there is no two ways about that. Carwyn has met with them and conveyed this message strongly. In the end, this is a matter for the regulator, who has decreased the company's original increases but has still accepted the case for further infrastructure investment, which must be financed by the bonds. That is why the current increases will be introduced. It is a catch-up exercise following Dŵr Cymru's low increases during its first four years.

cyntaf, a oedd yn isel o'u cymharu â rhai cwmnïau dŵr eraill. Yn awr ceir ymgais i oddiweddyd ac mae'r rheoleiddiwr wedi caniatáu i Dŵr Cymru godi ei brisiau ymhell uwchlaw'r cynnydd cyfartalog. Yr oeddent yn uchel eisoes, ond maent yn codi'n uwch byth yn awr, ac er nad ydynt gyn uchod â'r rhai yn ne-orllewin Lloegr, credaf mai hwy yw'r ail uchaf ym Mhrydain Fawr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cyfeiriasoch at y ffaith mai cwmni nad yw'n bod er mwyn gwneud elw yw Dŵr Cymru. Anogaf eich Llywodraeth i gynnal trafodaethau pellach ag ef mewn cysylltiad â'r codiadau cyflog arfaethedig hyn ac i'w atgoffa yr oedd pleidiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad yn barod i gefnogi ei sefydlu er mwyn gwarchod defnyddwyr yng Nghymru a pheidio â chaniatáu ymelwa arnynt, fel a ddigwydd o gael y codiadau arfaethedig hyn, yn ôl pob golwg.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf mai codiadau mewn prisiau a olygwch ac nid codiadau cyflog; tybiaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at y cyfarwyddwyr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ydwyf.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Eu honiad hwy yw os cymerir 1999 yn ddyddiad dechrau, gan mai codiadau bach yr oeddent wedi'u cyflwyno yn eu tymor cyntaf o bedair blynedd, a chodiadau mawr yn yr ail dymor, fod gwir gynnydd o 1 y cant yn ystod y ddau dymor gyda'i gilydd o'i gymharu â'r 3 y cant a gyflwynwyd gan gwmnïau dŵr eraill. Fodd bynnag, anodd yw derbyn hynny gan eu bod yn cymryd 1999 fel dyddiad dechrau. Mae eu hagenda gwreiddiol ar gynhwysiant cymdeithasol, a oedd yn golygu cael cefnogaeth gan y Cynulliad drwy gyflwyno codiadau bach, wedi'i bwrw o'r neilltu—nid oes dwywaith am hynny. Mae Carwyn wedi cwrdd â hwy a chyfleu'r neges hon yn bendant. Yn y pen draw, mae'n fater i'r rheoleiddiwr, sydd wedi gostwng codiadau gwreiddiol y cwmni ond sy'n dal i dderbyn y ddadl dros gael mwy o fuddsoddi yn y seilwaith, y mae'n rhaid ei gyllido drwy'r bondiau. Dyna pam y cyflwynir y codiadau presennol. Ymgais i oddiweddyd ydyw yn dilyn y codiadau bach a gyflwynodd Dŵr Cymru yn ystod ei bedair blynedd cyntaf.

### Cau Swyddfeydd Post Post Office Closures

**Q10 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the impact of post office closures on communities? (OAQ37568)

**The First Minister:** I believe that everyone in the Assembly accepts that post office closures can have a serious negative impact on communities. That is why Edwina Hart introduced the post office development fund, which has provided funding of £4.1 million to 105 post offices across Wales. These branches have been given the opportunity to become more commercial, to improve their security, if that is a problem, to change their layouts, to address aesthetic and structural factors, and so on. It has been an extremely successful scheme and I am sure that it will continue.

**Peter Black:** Given that the post office closure process has worked its way through the whole of Wales, do you think that there would be any value in the Welsh Assembly Government conducting a proper evaluation of the post offices that have been closed and considering the communities that have lost post offices? We can then assess the future of the post office fund and see what other support can be made available to communities in terms of transport links and so on so that people can access the post offices that are still open.

**The First Minister:** I agree with your comments. The principles are fairly simple. The Department of Trade and Industry has a rural post office anti-closure fund of £450 million for the whole of the UK. We tend to concentrate our resources on other post offices that can be at risk and which would serve a valuable social function. Post Office Ltd, nevertheless, is hoping to close many post offices in urban areas where they are closer than 1 mile to each other. However, a great deal depends on community support and whether there is an active sub-postmaster or sub-postmistress who sees a future for their post office business and will give it a go with support from either the Assembly or, if it is in a rural area, from the DTI. You must have an active business enterprise that is

**C10 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar effaith cau swyddfeydd post ar gymunedau? (OAQ37568)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf fod pawb yn y Cynulliad yn derbyn bod cau swyddfeydd post yn gallu effiethio'n ddifrifol ar gymunedau. Dyna pam y cyflwynodd Edwina Hart y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, sydd wedi darparu £4.1 miliwn o gyllid i 105 o swyddfeydd post ledled Cymru. Mae'r canghennau hyn wedi cael cyfle i ddod yn fwy masnachol, i wella eu diogeledd, os yw hynny'n broblem, i newid eu gosodiad, i ymdrin â ffactorau sy'n ymwneud ag estheteg ac adeiladwaith, ac yn y blaen. Bu'n gynllun tra llwyddiannus ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn parhau.

**Peter Black:** Gan fod y broses o gau swyddfeydd post wedi mynd rhagddi ledled Cymru, a gredwch y byddai'n fuddiol i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gynnal gwerthusiad iawn o'r swyddfeydd post a gaewyd ac ystyried y cymunedau a gollodd swyddfeydd post? Wedyn gallwn asesu dyfodol y gronfa swyddfeydd post a gweld pa gymorth arall y gellir ei gynnig i gymunedau o ran cysylltiadau trafniadaeth ac yn y blaen fel y gellir defnyddio'r swyddfeydd post sy'n dal i fod yn agored.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau. Mae'r egwyddorion yn eithaf syml. Mae gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant gronfa rhag cau swyddfeydd post gwledig o £450 miliwn ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Tueddwn i ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau ar swyddfeydd post eraill a all fod mewn perygl ac a allai gyflawni swyddogaeth gymdeithasol werthfawr. Er hynny, mae Swyddfa'r Post Cyf yn gobeithio cau llawer o swyddfeydd post mewn ardaloedd trefol lle y maent yn nes nag 1 filltir at ei gilydd. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer yn dibynnu ar y gefnogaeth a geir gan y gymuned ac a oes is-bostfeistr neu is-bostfeistres gweithgar sy'n gweld dyfodol i fusnes ei swyddfa bost ac yn fodlon rhoi cynnig arni gyda chymorth gan y Cynulliad neu, os ydyw mewn ardal wledig, gan y DTI.

supported by a particular postmaster or postmistress and is actively supported by the community.

Rhaid cael menter busnes weithredol sy'n cael ei redeg gan bostfeistr neu bostfeistres neilltuol a gefnogir gan y gymuned.

2.50 p.m.

### Cwmni Cig Arfon

**Q11 Brynle Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Cwmni Cig Arfon? (OAQ37573)

**C11 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar Gwmni Cig Arfon? (OAQ37573)

**The First Minister:** The closure of Cwmni Cig Arfon has had a significant impact on the local community, as well as on farmers across north Wales who supplied the company with its livestock. I hope that a buyer can be found, and we stand ready to assist the process in any way we can.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cau Cwmni Cig Arfon wedi cael effaith fawr ar y gymuned leol, yn ogystal â ffermwyr ledled y Gogledd a gyflenwai dda byw i'r cwmni. Gobeithiaf y gellir dod o hyd i brynwr, ac yr ydym wrth law'n barod i hybu'r broses mewn unrhyw fodd a allwn.

**Brynle Williams:** Many farmers are owed a lot of money, and some in my constituency are owed as much as £32,000. The Welsh Development Agency has poured in money for the last three years and more. Despite us having a seat on the WDA board, this situation was not forecast. Can you assure me that something will be done about the big hole left by the closure, and will you tell us what is being done at present?

**Brynle Williams:** Mae symiau mawr o arian yn ddyledus i lawer o ffermwyr, ac mae cymaint â £32,000 yn ddyledus i rai yn fy etholaeth. Mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi rhoi symiau mawr dros y tair blynedd diwethaf a chyn hynny. Er bod gennym sedd ar fwrdd y WDA, ni ragwelwyd y sefyllfa hon. A allwch fy sicrhau y gwneir rhywbeth ynghylch y bwch mawr a adawyd drwy ei gau, ac a wnewch ddweud wrthym beth a wneir ar hyn o bryd?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about your reference to the WDA, because we provided the grant of £600,000 via the processing and marketing grant scheme to help set up the new abattoir on the Cibyn industrial estate in Caernarfon. The company did not approach the WDA for assistance before the administrator was called in. However, the key issue now is to find a new buyer, and we stand ready and willing to help a buyer who could create a viable enterprise on the site.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch eich cyfeiriad at y WDA, gan ein bod wedi rhoi'r grant o £600,000 drwy'r cynllun grant prosesu a marchnata i helpu i sefydlu'r lladd-dy newydd yn ystâd ddiwydiannol Cibyn yng Nghaernarfon. Ni ddaeth y cwmni at y WDA i gael cymorth cyn galw am y gweinyddwr. Fodd bynnag, y peth pwysig yn awr yw dod o hyd i brynwr, ac yr ydym wrth law'n barod i helpu prynwr a allai greu busnes dichonadwy ar y safle.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** O gofio pwysigrwydd y lladd-dy i'r diwydiant amaethyddol yn yr ardal, a chan obeithio y cawn ni hyd i brynwr â diddordeb yn y safle, a ydych yn barod i ddweud yn gyhoeddus y prynhawn yma y bydd adran Andrew Davies yn rhoi cymhorthdal i ailagor lladd-dy ar y safle hwn?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Given the abattoir's importance to the local agriculture industry, and in the hope that we find someone interested in purchasing the site, are you prepared to state publicly this afternoon that Andrew Davies's department will provide grant aid to help re-establish an abattoir on this site?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os bydd prynwr yn gymwys i dderbyn grant prosesu a

**The First Minister:** If a purchaser meets the processing and marketing grant criteria, he or

marchnata, bydd yn derbyn yr arian hwnnw er mwyn ailsefydlu'r cwmni a, thrwy hynny, achub swyddi.

she will receive that money in order to re-establish the company and therefore save jobs.

### **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

#### **Gwasanaethau Llawfeddygaeth Niwrolegol Bediatrig Paediatric Neurosurgical Services**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi derbyn cwestiwn brys gan Dai Lloyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.34.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have accepted an urgent question from Dai Lloyd under Standing Order No. 6.34.

**David Lloyd:** Will the Minister for Health and Social Services make a statement on the future provision of paediatric neurosurgical services in Wales? (EAQ37947)

**David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad ar ddarparu gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol? (EAQ37947)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** The national commissioning advisory board of Health Commission Wales will consider a report on the future configuration of paediatric neurosurgery in south Wales at its meeting tomorrow. The report contains the outcome of an independent option appraisal conducted under the leadership of Mr Glenn Neil-Dwyer, a former president of the Society of British Neurological Surgeons. The option appraisal was informed by an independent clinical audit conducted by Mr Paul May, a senior consultant paediatric neurosurgeon from outside Wales. The report recommends that paediatric neurosurgery in south Wales should be based on one site at the University Hospital of Wales in Cardiff, but with provision for emergency paediatric neurosurgery at Morrision Hospital as appropriate. I look forward to the outcome of the board's deliberation.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Bydd bwrdd ymgynghorol cenedlaethol ar gomisiynu Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn ystyried adroddiad ar y trefniant a geir yn y dyfodol ar gyfer llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn y De yn ei gyfarfod yfory. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys y canlyniad i werthusiad annibynnol o ddewisiadau a gynhaliwyd o dan arweiniad Mr Glenn Neil-Dwyer, un o gyn-lywyddion Cymdeithas Llawfeddygon Niwrolegol Prydain. Gwnaed y gwerthusiad o ddewisiadau yng ngoleuni archwiliad clinigol annibynnol a gynhaliwyd gan Mr Paul May, uwch lawfeddyg niwroleg bediatrig ymgynghorol o'r tu allan i Gymru. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell y dylid lleoli llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn y De ar un safle yn Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru yng Nghaerdydd, ond gyda darpariaeth ar gyfer llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig frys yn Ysbyty Treforys fel y bo'n briodol. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y canlyniad i drafodion y bwrdd.

**David Lloyd:** As you said, Health Commission Wales recommends that paediatric neurosurgery in south Wales should be based on one site in Cardiff, with the provision of emergency neurosurgery, as appropriate. This will mean a maximum of only 10 children per year being treated in Morrision Hospital, and not by dedicated paediatric neurosurgeons. In other words, the present paediatric neurosurgery unit in

**David Lloyd:** Fel y dywedaso, mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn argymhell y dylai llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig yn y De gael ei lleoli ar un safle yng Nghaerdydd, gan ddarparu llawfeddygaeth frys, fel y bo'n briodol. O ganlyniad i hyn, dim ond 10 o blant y flwyddyn ar y mwyaf a drinnir yn Ysbyty Treforys, ac ni wneir hynny dan law rhai sydd wedi'u neilltuo i lawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig. Mewn geiriau eraill,

Morrison will close. The Minister will recall the uproar that greeted this proposal two years ago. Last Friday's public announcement has led to similar uproar. I will not rehearse the arguments, only to say that people feel betrayed. What happened to all the talk of managed clinical networks? What happened to all the talk of partnerships between Cardiff and Swansea? The HCW report contains the looming sentiment that if Cardiff is not up to the mark, paediatric neurosurgery services for Wales will be provided in Bristol. How does the Minister intend to safeguard these services for the children of Wales?

The Minister knows that we have seen—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is an urgent question, not a debate. A number of questions have been asked.

**David Lloyd:** I will cut to the chase with my final question.

**The Presiding Officer:** I think that the chase has already been cut.

**Jane Hutt:** This question is premature, Dai, because the board will meet tomorrow. The board is led by the most senior people in the profession in the UK and is supported by key stakeholders, which include parents' groups. The conclusion answers one of the most fundamental concerns of the original Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales report, which we all recall. There was great concern in Swansea that emergency paediatric neurosurgery should be retained at Morrison Hospital. That is what this report recommends, and it will be discussed by the commissioning board tomorrow. As we have said before, planned elective neurosurgery procedures need to go where the best possible service can be provided. The recommendation is that it should be provided in Cardiff. I think that the provision of emergency services in Morrison Hospital has been welcomed.

**Val Lloyd:** I am pleased to have the

bydd yr uned llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig bresennol yn Nhreforys yn cau. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio'r stŵr a gododd yn sgîl y cynnig hwn ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Mae'r cyhoeddiad ddydd Gwener diwethaf wedi peri stŵr cyffelyb. Nid ailadroddaf y dadleuon, a'r cwbl a ddywedaf yw bod pobl yn teimlo eu bod wedi'u bradychu. Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r holl sôn am rwydweithiau clinigol rheoledig? Beth a ddigwyddodd i'r holl sôn am bartneriaethau rhwng Caerdydd ac Abertawe? Mae adroddiad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn cynnwys y bygythiad y bydd gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig i Gymru'n cael eu darparu ym Mryste os na fydd Caerdydd gystal â'r disgwyl. Sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu diogelu'r gwasanaethau hyn i blant Cymru?

Gŵyr y Gweinidog ein bod wedi gweld—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cwestiwn brys yw hwn, nid dadl. Gofynnwyd sawl cwestiwn.

**David Lloyd:** Af at wraidd y mater yn fy nghwestiwn olaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf fod hynny wedi digwydd eisoes.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn gynamserol, Dai, gan mai yfory y bydd y bwrdd yn cwrdd. Arweinir y bwrdd gan y rhai uchaf yn y proffesiwn yn y DU ac fe'i cynorthwyir gan randdeiliaid allweddol, gan gynnwys grwpiau rhieni. Mae'r casgliad yn ymateb i un o'r pryderon mwyaf sylfaenol yn adroddiad gwreiddiol Comisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, yr ydym oll yn ei gofio. Yr oedd teimlad cryf yn Abertawe y dylid cadw llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig frys yn Ysbyty Treforys. Felly y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn argymhell, a thrafodir hynny gan y bwrdd comisiynu yfory. Fel y dywedasom o'r blaen, rhaid gwneud llawdriniaethau niwrolegol dewisol cynlluniedig yn y man y gellir cynnig y gwasanaeth gorau posibl. Yr argymhelliad yw y dylid ei ddarparu yng Nghaerdydd. Credaf fod y darparu ar wasanaethau brys yn Ysbyty Treforys wedi'i groesawu.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael cyfle i

opportunity to speak and it is important that we do not descend into making this a political knockabout as was the intention earlier—children’s services are much too important. As you said, one reason for establishing the new commission was that the previous Specialised Health Service Commission for Wales report had not consulted service users nor used a full option appraisal. This time there has been a full appraisal and—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The request for a question applies to Val Lloyd, as in the case of Dai Lloyd.

**Val Lloyd:** Do you agree that the prime consideration should, at all times, be the health, safety and welfare of children in all parts of south Wales, and will you give an assurance that there will be no reduction in the quality of service?

**Jane Hutt:** I give you my reassurance. In terms of appraisal, the two units in south Wales are the smallest in England and Wales. Combined, they are the second smallest, after the unit in Hull. In fact, most units are much larger. As the editorial in *The Western Mail* said, we want to ensure that we provide safe services for children in Wales. You have my assurance on that.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you agree that in commissioning specialist services for children or adults, the overwhelming concern must be one of safety and clinical governance and that we should pay due regard to the findings of such reports as those of Kennedy and Carlisle? If this particular service is to be changed, what assurances can you give that there will be adequate retrieval services for patients who may have to travel to Cardiff? Also, what help, support and assistance will be provided to parents, whose children are treated in Cardiff, who might want to stay with their children or need financial assistance to travel considerable distances from their homes to the unit in Cardiff?

**Jane Hutt:** It is relevant to refer to the Kennedy report. It is clearly stated in the recommendations that will be presented to the board tomorrow that specialist care must

siarad ac mae’n bwysig inni beidio â throi hyn yn golbio gwleidyddol fel y bwriadwyd gwneud yn gynharach—mae gwasanaethau i blant yn llawer rhy bwysig. Fel y dywedasoch, un rheswm dros sefydlu’r comisiwn newydd oedd bod yr adroddiad blaenorol gan Gomisiwn Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru heb ymgynghori â defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a heb werthuso’r holl ddewisiadau. Y tro hwn cafwyd gwerthusiad llawn a—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae’r cais am gwestiwn yn berthnasol i Val Lloyd, fel yr oedd yn achos Dai Lloyd.

**Val Lloyd:** A ydych yn cytuno mai’r hyn y dylid ei ystyried yn bennaf, bob tro, yw iechyd, diogelwch a lles plant ym mhob rhan o’r De, ac a wnewch roi sicrwydd na fydd unrhyw ostyngiad yn ansawdd y gwasanaeth?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau o hynny. O ran y gwerthuso, y ddwy uned yn y De yw’r rhai lleiaf yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Gyda’i gilydd, hwy yw’r ail leiaf, ar ôl yr uned yn Hull. A dweud y gwir, mae’r rhan fwyaf o’r unedau’n fwy o lawer. Fel y dywedodd yr erthygl olygyddol yn *The Western Mail*, yr ydym am sicrhau ein bod yn darparu gwasanaethau diogel i blant yng Nghymru. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi o hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** A ydych yn cytuno mai’r hyn y dylid ymboeni yn ei gylch yn bennaf wrth gomisiynu gwasanaethau arbenigol ar gyfer plant neu oedolion, yw diogelwch a llywodraethu clinigol ac y dylem dalu sylw dyledus i ddarganfyddiadau adroddiadau fel rhai Kennedy a Carlisle? Os yw’r gwasanaeth penodol hwn i gael ei newid, pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y bydd gwasanaethau digonol i gludo cleifion a allai orfod teithio i Gaerdydd? Hefyd, pa gymorth a chefnogaeth a roddir i rieni, y caiff eu plant eu trin yng Nghaerdydd, a allai ddymuno aros gyda’u plant neu a allai fod ag angen cymorth ariannol i deithio cryn bellter o’u cartrefi i’r uned yng Nghaerdydd?

**Jane Hutt:** Perthnasol yw cyfeirio at adroddiad Kennedy. Nodir yn glir yn yr argymhellion a gyflwynir i’r bwrdd yfory fod rhaid canoli gofal arbenigol mewn nifer

be concentrated in a limited number of services where the staff have the necessary skills, expertise and experience. In terms of managing this and taking it forward, neurosurgeons in Cardiff and Swansea have worked closely together in the last 18 months to improve the care of children requiring their specialist skills. The care for children treated in Morrision Hospital has improved and there is a guideline for the treatment of children with serious head injuries. This guideline has been agreed and implemented, and it clarifies the roles of each of the hospitals in relation to Morrision and the University Hospital of Wales in the care of emergency cases. It also identifies those children who need to receive emergency neurosurgery at Morrision and those who need to travel to the University Hospital of Wales. Developing the protocol and working together over the past 18 months has been important. The combined workload in both centres equates to less than two cases per week, which includes elective and emergency operations. Over 400 people have been involved in this process of weighting the criteria of the option appraisal. I reassure you Kirsty, that, in the option appraisal and discussions, adequate support for children and their parents is paramount in the thinking about and involvement of the small number of parents who have to travel.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cawsom ymgynghoriad ar y mater hwn ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Y pryd hwnnw, gwrthodwyd y bwriad i drosglwyddo'r gwasanaeth hanfodol hwn i Gaerdydd yn gyffredinol gan bobl yn ne Cymru. A ydych wedi'ch argyhoeddi bod modd cynnal safon y gwasanaeth yn Ysbyty Treforys os yw'r arbenigedd hwn i'w drosglwyddo i Gaerdydd, er mwyn sicrhau bod y bobl hynny y mae arnynt angen triniaeth ar frys—ac y mae'r cyfnod clinigol hwn o ddwy awr yn sylfaenol—yn cael y gwasanaeth o'r ansawdd uchaf yn Ysbyty Treforys?

3.00 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** I certainly am. I refer to my answer to Kirsty's question. The neurosurgeons are working closely together. In effect, it is a network that has developed between Cardiff and Swansea, which is key

cyfyngedig o wasanaethau lle y mae'r staff yn meddu ar y medrau, yr arbenigedd a'r profiad angenrheidiol. O ran rheoli hyn a'i hyrwyddo, mae llawfeddygon niwrolegol yng Nghaerdydd ac Abertawe wedi cydweithio'n agos yn y 18 mis diwethaf i wella'r gofal am y plant hynny y mae arnynt angen eu medrau arbenigol. Mae'r gofal am blant a drinnir yn Ysbyty Treforys wedi gwella ac mae canllaw ar gyfer trin plant a gafodd anafiadau difrifol i'r pen. Cytunwyd ar y canllaw hwn ac fe'i rhoddwyd ar waith, ac mae'n egluro rolau'r naill ysbyty a'r llall mewn cysylltiad â gofalu am achosion brys yn Ysbyty Treforys ac Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Mae hefyd yn nodi'r plant hynny sydd ag angen llawdriniaeth niwrolegol frys yn Nhreforys a'r rhai y mae'n rhaid iddynt deithio i Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru. Bu'r cydweithio a'r gwaith o ddatblygu'r protocol dros y 18 mis diwethaf yn bwysig. Mae llwyth gwaith y ddwy ganolfan gyda'i gilydd yn cyfateb i lai na dau achos yr wythnos, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys llawdriniaethau dewisol a rhai brys. Mae mwy na 400 o bobl wedi ymwneud â'r broses hon o bwysoli'r meini prawf ar gyfer y gwerthusiad o ddewisiadau. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau, Kirsty, fod yr angen i roi cymorth digonol i blant a'u rhieni wedi cael y lle blaenaf, yn y gwerthusiad o ddewisiadau a'r trafodaethau, wrth ystyried y nifer fach o rieni sy'n gorfod teithio a'r rhan a gymerant.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A consultation was held on this matter two years ago. At that time, the people of south Wales were, for the most part, opposed to plans to move this essential service to Cardiff. Are you convinced that it is possible to maintain the level of service at Morrision Hospital if this specialism is transferred to Cardiff, in order to ensure that those people who need the treatment urgently—and this clinical period of two hours is fundamentally important—will be able to receive services of the highest quality in Morrision Hospital?

**Jane Hutt:** Ydwyf, yn sicr. Cyfeiriaf at fy ateb i gwestiwn Kirsty. Mae'r llawfeddygon niwrolegol yn cydweithio'n agos. I bob pwrpas, mae'n rhwydwaith a ddatblygodd rhwng Caerdydd ac Abertawe, sy'n allweddol

to securing specialist services for patients in Wales. We engaged fully in discussions on this when the original report was prepared. This is about how to safeguard and improve the care of children, whose treatment requires these specialist skills. The fact that the commissioning board is considering the recommendation to keep emergency services in Morriston is an indication of the backing for those services and a response to the consultation that we want to safeguard and support them along with the service in Cardiff in partnership with colleagues.

**Alun Cairns:** The workload and risks have not changed since the first decision was made around two years ago. If this transfer takes place, will this not be one of the biggest turns that the Welsh Assembly Government has undertaken since the last Assembly election? Senior Government Ministers on the frontbench opposed the transfer at that time. I hope that they continue to oppose it today.

**Jane Hutt:** I hope that we can put children's safety and the specialist skills that children need in Wales at the forefront. Assembly Members could have taken up the option of being briefed by Professor Ken Woodehouse. Please have regard for the professional skills that we have at our disposal in Wales, including a world authority on paediatric neurosurgery. You need not question the type of expertise and experience, which has been brought to bare through working with stakeholders and parents to ensure that we provide the best and safest services for our children—a small number of children, as I said—who require these specialist services.

A key point in response to Dai's earlier question, is that emergency services for children are staying in Swansea. If a child falls off his or her bike in Swansea, he or she will go straight to Morriston Hospital, where those emergency services will be provided. I am disappointed in the Assembly, if it wishes to undermine the important recommendation to go before the board tomorrow, given the expertise, consultation, option appraisal and

i sicrhau gwasanaethau arbenigol i gleifion yng Nghymru. Cymerasom ran lawn mewn trafodaethau ar hyn pan baratowyd yr adroddiad gwreiddiol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r modd i ddiogelu a gwella'r gofal am blant, y mae eu triniaeth yn gofyn y medrau arbenigol hyn. Mae'r ffaith bod y bwrdd comisiynu'n ystyried yr argymhelliad i gadw gwasanaethau brys yn Nhreforys yn dangos y gefnogaeth i'r gwasanaethau hynny ac yn ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad sy'n dangos ein bod am eu diogelu a'u cefnogi ynghyd â'r gwasanaeth yng Nghaerdydd mewn partneriaeth â chymheiriaid.

**Alun Cairns:** Nid yw'r llwyth gwaith a'r risgiau wedi newid ers y penderfyniad cyntaf tua dwy flynedd yn ôl. Os digwydd y trosglwyddo hwn, onid hyn fydd un o'r troeon pedol mwyaf a wnaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ers etholiad diwethaf y Cynulliad? Yr oedd uwch Weinidogion y Llywodraeth ar y fainc flaen yn gwrthwynebu'r trosglwyddo bryd hynny. Gobeithiaf y byddant yn dal i'w wrthwynebu heddiw.

**Jane Hutt:** Gobeithiaf y gallwn roi'r lle blaenaf i ddiogelwch plant a'r medrau arbenigol y mae ar blant eu hangen yng Nghymru. Gallai Aelodau Cynulliad fod wedi cymryd y dewis o gael eu briffio gan yr Athro Ken Woodehouse. Byddwch cystal â pharchu'r doniau proffesiynol sydd ar gael i ni yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys un o awdurdodau'r byd ar lawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bediatrig. Nid oes angen ichi amau'r math o arbenigedd a phrofiad, a roddwyd ar waith drwy weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid a rhieni, i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r gwasanaethau gorau a mwyaf diogel i'n plant—nifer fach o blant, fel y dywedais—sydd ag angen y gwasanaethau arbenigol hyn.

Un pwynt allweddol mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn a ofynnodd Dai yn gynharach, yw bod gwasanaethau brys i blant yn aros yn Abertawe. Os bydd plentyn yn disgyn oddi ar ei feic yn Abertawe, eir ag ef yn syth i Ysbyty Treforys, lle y darperir y gwasanaethau brys hynny. Yr wyf wedi fy siomi gan y Cynulliad, os yw'n dymuno tanseilio'r argymhelliad pwysig a aiff gerbron y bwrdd yfory, yng ngolwg yr



the recognition at our disposal, from, as I said, independent observers, such as those in *The Western Mail*, who stated that Wales desperately needed to maintain its children's services.

We cannot afford to lose any more to England and whether or not the children's unit is in Swansea or Cardiff is insignificant. In the wider scheme of things, that unit must be in Wales. I accept that message put forward by an independent observer based on professional expertise. On tomorrow's board meeting, I hope that it will be given due respect to consider these recommendations.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have two properly elected regional Members who might care to ask brief questions to which we might have succinct answers.

**Carl Sargeant:** Properly elected.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I choose my words carefully. I call Alun Cairns. Alun Cairns has already spoken. I call Peter Black.

**Peter Black:** These proposals have upheld your promise to retain emergency operations in Swansea, but given that all elective surgery will now be conducted in Cardiff and that there are no proposals to invest in paediatric intensive care beds in Swansea, how sustainable, in the long term, is that commitment? How will you ensure that your pledge to retain emergency surgery will not fall by the wayside?

**Jane Hutt:** I have given my commitment, but we have not yet heard from the board, which will consider the recommendations tomorrow. Therefore, as I have said, this question is premature. We need to hear from the board, which will also have feedback from the local health boards, which have been involved in the option appraisal together with the community health councils, which have been fully engaged in this process, as they were two years ago, when the original proposals came forward.

arbenigedd, yr ymgynghori, y gwerthusiad o ddewisiadau a'r gydnabyddiaeth a gynigir i ni, fel y dywedais, gan sylwebyddion annibynnol, fel y rhai yn *The Western Mail*, a ddywedodd fod ar Gymru daer angen cadw ei gwasanaethau plant.

Ni allwn fforddio colli rhagor i Loegr ac nid yw o bwys a fydd yr uned blant yn Abertawe neu yng Nghaerdydd. Ac edrych ar hyn yn gyffredinol, rhaid i'r uned honno fod yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn derbyn y genadwri honno gan sylwebydd annibynnol sy'n seiliedig ar arbenigedd proffesiynol. Ynghylch cyfarfod y bwrdd yfory, yr wyf yn gobeithio y rhoddir parch dyledus iddo fel y gall ystyried yr argymhellion hyn.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae gennyf ddau Aelod rhanbarthol a etholwyd yn briodol a allai ddymuno gofyn cwestiynau byr y gallem gael atebion cryno iddynt.

**Carl Sargeant:** A etholwyd yn briodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dewisais fy ngeiriau'n ofalus. Galwaf Alun Cairns. Mae Alun Cairns wedi siarad eisoes. Galwaf Peter Black.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r cynigion hyn wedi cadarnhau eich addewid i gadw llawdriniaethau brys yn Abertawe, ond gan y bydd yr holl llawdriniaethau dewisol yn cael eu cynnal yng Nghaerdydd bellach a chan nad oes cynigion i fuddsoddi mewn gwelyau gofal dwys pediatrig yn Abertawe, pa mor gynaliadwy, yn y tymor hir, yw'r ymrwymiad hwnnw? Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau na fydd eich addewid i gadw llawfeddygaeth frys yn cael ei fwrw o'r neilltu?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi ymrwymiad, ond ni clywsom eto gan y bwrdd, a fydd yn ystyried yr argymhellion yfory. Gan hynny, fel y dywedais, mae'r cwestiwn hwn yn gynamserol. Rhaid inni glywed gan y bwrdd, a gaiff adborth hefyd gan y byrddau iechyd lleol, a fu'n ymwneud â'r gwerthusiad o ddewisiadau ynghyd â'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned, a gymerodd ran lawn yn y broses, fel y gwnaethant ddwy flynedd yn ôl, pan ddaeth y cynigion gwreiddiol gerbron.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** There are two changes to today's business statement. The motion to elect Members to the Local Government Partnership Council has been postponed until a later date. The motion to approve the Water Act 2003 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order has been postponed until 9 November.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Mae dau newid i'r datganiad busnes heddiw. Mae'r cynnig i ethol Aelodau i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol wedi'i ohirio hyd ddyddiad diweddarach. Mae'r cynnig i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Dŵr 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) wedi'i ohirio tan 9 Tachwedd.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I draw Members' attention to the motion on 28 September to authorise the House Committee to take responsibility for the new Assembly building in due course. Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer determined that under Standing Order No. 24.6, the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Common Agricultural Policy Support Scheme (Modulation) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi ar y datganiad drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Tynnaf sylw Aelodau at y cynnig ar 28 Medi i awdurdodi Pwyllgor y Tŷ i ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb dros adeilad newydd y Cynulliad maes o law. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd y Dirprwy Lywydd o dan Reol Sefydlog 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Datgymhwysio rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Cynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Modwleiddio) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau TSE (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 a Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 yn ei wrthwynebu.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections.

Felly, galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

I therefore call on the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Y Llywydd:** Gwahoddaf un Aelod o bob grŵp i wneud sylwadau byr ar y datganiad busnes.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite one Member of each group to comment briefly on the business statement.

**David Lloyd:** I request a debate on the full financial implications of the rebanding of council tax and the transitional arrangements to help people on low fixed incomes who are facing an enormous rise in council tax, and the timescale for their implementation. Further to my urgent question earlier, I also request a full debate on the future provision of paediatric neurosurgical services in Wales. I am grateful that the urgent question was allowed today, but with all due respect, it is limited in scope, as there are huge ramifications to removing a regional centre of excellence from Swansea, not least in terms of what happens to the other regional centres of excellence in Swansea, such as the burns unit and the plastics unit. Finally, I support calls from other Members for a full debate on cancer services.

**Nick Bourne:** We wish to see two issues included in the business statement. First, a debate on cancer services following the unconscionable delay and the prospect of a 17-week wait that Theresa Debono from Cardiff Central has suffered. The guidelines for seeing a consultant state that patients should not wait more than 10 days. That matter has also been raised at Westminster, and it raises serious issues about cancer services in Wales in general. I hope that the Minister appreciates the importance of having a debate on that issue. Secondly, the issue which Dai has just raised, and which was also raised during questions, relates to the council tax re-evaluation and rebanding. We were told that there would be as many winners as losers. We know that that is not the case—33.4 per cent of people will experience an increase of one band or more and 8.4 per cent will go down one band. There is clearly nowhere near as many winners as losers. We need a debate on this issue to consider the financial plight of many people who will face massive bills when they receive their revalued council tax bills next year.

**Kirsty Williams:** I express concern on behalf of my group that the election to the Local Government Partnership Council did not take place today. In the past, the Assembly has

**David Lloyd:** Gofynnaf am ddadl ar holl oblygiadau ariannol yr ailfandio o'r dreth gyngor a'r trefniadau trosiannol i helpu pobl sydd ar incwm sefydlog isel sy'n wynebu cynnydd aruthrol yn y dreth gyngor, a'r amserlen ar gyfer eu gweithredu. Ymhellach i'm cwestiwn brys yn gynharach, gofynnaf hefyd am ddadl lawn ar ddarparu gwasanaethau llawfeddygaeth niwrolegol bedriatrig yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ganiatáu'r cwestiwn brys heddiw ond, gyda phob dyledus barch, mae iddo gwmpas cyfyngedig, a cheir canlyniadau pellgyrhaeddol o ran symud canolfan ragoriaeth ranbarthol o Abertawe a hynny, yn anad dim, oherwydd yr hyn a ddigwydd i'r canolfannau rhagoriaeth rhanbarthol eraill yn Abertawe, fel yr uned losgiadau a'r uned blastigion. Yn olaf, ategaf y galwadau gan Aelodau eraill am gael dadl lawn ar wasanaethau canser.

**Nick Bourne:** Dymunwn weld cynnwys dau fater yn y datganiad busnes. Yn gyntaf, dadl ar wasanaethau canser yn dilyn yr oedi afresymol a'r rhagolwg am arhosiad o 17 wythnos y mae Theresa Debono o Ganol Caerdydd wedi ei ddiodeff. Mae'r canllawiau ar gyfer gweld ymgynghorydd yn nodi na ddylai cleifion ddisgwyl yn hwy na 10 niwrnod. Mae'r mater hwnnw wedi'i godi yn San Steffan hefyd, ac mae'n codi cwestiynau pwysig ynghylch gwasanaethau canser yng Nghymru yn gyffredinol. Gobeithiaf fod y Gweinidog yn deall pa mor bwysig yw cael dadl ar y mater hwnnw. Yn ail, mae'r mater y mae Dai newydd ei godi, ac a godwyd hefyd yn ystod cwestiynau, yn ymwneud â'r ailbriso a'r ailfandio ar gyfer y dreth gyngor. Dywedwyd wrthym y byddai yr un faint ar eu hennill ac a fyddai ar eu colled. Gwyddom nad felly y mae—bydd 33.4 y cant o bobl yn codi un band neu fwy a bydd 8.4 y cant yn disgyn un band. Mae'n amlwg nad oes gymaint ar eu hennill agsydd ar eu colled. Rhaid inni gael dadl ar y mater hwn er mwyn ystyried trafferthion ariannol y nifer fawr o bobl a fydd yn wynebu biliau enfawr pan gânt eu biliau treth gyngor ailbrisedig y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mynegaf bryder ar ran fy ngrŵp na chafwyd yr etholiad i'r Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol heddiw. Yn y gorffennol, mae'r Cynulliad wedi rhoi pwys

placed great store on the importance of this august group of individuals and its working relationship with its Minister. I trust that the reluctance to elect these people today is not because of the much changed face of local government in Wales since the elections in June and the fact that the Labour Party no longer has a majority on the Welsh Local Government Association. I also trust that we will move as quickly as possible to elect this body. On the issue of rebanding, I can understand why the Business Minister and the Minister responsible for local government do not wish the Assembly to discuss this matter, given the dire consequences that many households in Wales are facing since the rebanding exercise. It is not adequate for the Minister to say that it will be discussed in committee alone, and I ask her to reconsider the request by all opposition parties for a debate in the Chamber.

3.10 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** As always, we welcome this business statement and common sense prevails. I request time to discuss mental health service provision in north Wales. On the back of comments made by Mr German regarding what Labour Party policies have done, I would like some time perhaps to discuss the free swimming initiative that the Labour Government implemented in Wales and the free bus travel service, another Labour policy initiative that was included in our manifesto promises. Also, Minister, I would like time to discuss the serious issue of positions and structure in the civil service, with reference to an announcement by the Welsh Liberal Democrats that they promise to axe 100,000 jobs if they get into power. That is what I think they meant to say, but the issue has been overshadowed by the Öpik versus Black fighting on the beaches in Bournemouth—there is obviously a massive party split.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** Thank you, Carl. First, I will go back to Dai, Kirsty and Nick on the impact of council tax revaluation. The Finance Minister does not have any plans to make a statement in Plenary at this stage. She issued a press notice on the transitional scheme in early

mawr ar y grŵp urddasol hwn o unigolion a'i berthynas waith â'i Weinidog. Hyderaf nad yw'r amharodrwydd i ethol y bobl hyn heddiw yn ganlyniad i'r newid mawr a fu mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ers yr etholiadau ym mis Mehefin a'r ffaith nad oes gan y Blaid Lafur fwyafrif bellach yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn hyderu y symudwn cyn gynted ag y bo modd i ethol y corff hwn. Ynghylch mater yr ailfandio, gallaf ddeall pam nad yw'r Trefnydd a'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros lywodraeth leol yn dymuno i'r Cynulliad drafod y mater hwn, yng ngolwg y canlyniadau enbyd i lawer teulu yng Nghymru ers yr ailfandio. Nid yw'n ddigon i'r Gweinidog ddweud y caiff ei drafod yn y pwyllgor yn unig, a gofynnaf iddi ailystyried y cais gan yr holl wrthbleidiau am ddatl yn y Siambr.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawn, fel y gwnawn bob amser, y datganiad busnes hwn a synnwyr cyffredin sy'n ennill y dydd. Gofynnaf am amser i drafod darparu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn y Gogledd. Yn sgîl sylwadau a wnaed gan Mr German mewn cysylltiad â'r hyn a wnaeth polisïau'r Blaid Lafur, carwn gael rhywfaint o amser efallai i drafod y fenter nofio am ddim a roddodd y Llywodraeth Lafur ar waith yng Nghymru a'r gwasanaeth teithio ar fysiau am ddim, un arall o fentrau polisi Llafur a oedd ymhlith ein haddewidion maniffesto. Hefyd, Drefnydd, carwn gael amser i drafod mater difrifol swyddi a strwythur y gwasanaeth sifil, gan gyfeirio at gyhoeddiad gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru eu bod yn addo torri 100,000 o swyddi os deuant i rym. Hynny yr oeddent yn bwriadu'i ddweud, yr wyf yn credu, ond mae'r mater wedi'i daflu i'r cysgod gan yr ymladd rhwng Öpik a Black ar y traethau yn Bournemouth—mae'n amlwg bod hollt fawr yn y blaid.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Diolch i chi, Carl. Yn gyntaf, af yn ôl at Dai, Kirsty a Nick ac effaith ailbriso'r dreth gyngor. Nid oes gan y Gweinidog Cyllid unrhyw fwriad i wneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar hyn o bryd. Rhoddodd ddatganiad i'r wasg am y cynllun trosiannol ddechrau Medi, os

September, if you remember, of which you had advance notice. You will have an opportunity to consider the associated legislation when it is brought forward in Plenary and the Minister will discuss the scheme with the subject committee when it meets this week.

On the Local Government Partnership Council—I welcome you back, Kirsty, we have missed you—the motion was withdrawn so that the additional nominations that were subsequently received could be considered. It will come forward again at the earliest opportunity and I hope that you are satisfied with that.

Dai, your list of requests was expansive and it has been heard. On the specific issue of cancer services, the Minister for Health and Social Services does not intend to make a statement on an operational matter that is the responsibility of the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust. Jane has already made her views known and they were echoed by the First Minister during questions today, as you would know if you were listening. A meeting of the south-east Wales health body has taken place this morning, and there are positive indications that a local solution to the difficulties in Cardiff and the Vale can be devised for speedy implementation.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What about Carl?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has responded.

cofiwch, a chawsoch rybudd o flaen llaw am hynny. Cewch gyfle i ystyried y ddeddfwriaeth gysylltiedig pan ddygir hi gerbron yn y Cyfarfod Llawn a bydd y Gweinidog yn trafod y cynllun gyda'r pwyllgor pwnc pan gyferfydd yr wythnos hon.

Ynghylch y Cyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol—fe'ch croesawaf yn ôl, Kirsty, yr ydym wedi'ch colli—tynnwyd y cynnig yn ôl fel y gellid ystyried yr enwebiadau ychwanegol a ddaeth i law wedyn. Daw gerbron eto ar y cyfle cynharaf a gobeithiaf eich bod yn fodlon ar hynny.

Dai, yr oedd eich rhestr o geisiadau'n un hir ac fe'i clywyd. Ynghylch mater penodol gwasanaethau canser, nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn bwriadu gwneud datganiad ar unrhyw fater gweithredol sy'n gyfrifoldeb i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Mae Jane wedi mynegi ei barn eisoes ac fe'i hategwyd gan y Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau heddiw, fel y gwyddech os oeddech yn gwrando. Bu cyfarfod o gorff iechyd y De-ddwyrain y bore yma, ac mae arwyddion pendant y bydd modd cael ateb lleol i'r anawsterau yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro i'w roi ar waith yn fuan.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Beth am Carl?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymateb.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 17.  
Motion: For 30, Abstain 10, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad ar Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn, Sain Tathan Statement on the Defence Aviation Repair Agency, St Athan**

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** Last Thursday, the Ministry of Defence announced the transfer of work from the Defence Aviation Repair Agency facility at St Athan in the Vale of Glamorgan to Royal Air Force Marham in Norfolk. The announcement is the result of the end-to-end review undertaken by the MOD regarding the location of future logistical support activity for air platforms. I cannot overstate our disappointment at the MOD's decision.

The review recommended that the repair and maintenance of aircraft could best be rationalised by concentrating it at main operating bases. The MOD has concluded that concentrating support for the Tornado GR4 aircraft at RAF Marham would provide best value for money compared with the alternative of concentrating on the DARA site at St Athan. The First Minister and I

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Ddydd Iau diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ei bod yn trosglwyddo gwaith o gyfleuster Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan ym Mro Morgannwg i orsaf yr Awyrlu Brenhinol yn Marham yn Norfolk. Mae'r cyhoeddiad yn ganlyniad i adolygiad cynhwysfawr gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn o leoliad y cymorth logistaidd ar gyfer awyrennau yn y dyfodol. Ni allaf orbwysleisio ein siom ym mhenderfyniad y weinyddiaeth.

Argymhelliad yr adolygiad oedd mai'r modd gorau i resymoli'r gwaith o atgyweirio a chynnal awyrennau fyddai ei ganoli yn y prif orsafoedd gweithredu. Daeth y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn i'r casgliad mai canoli'r cymorth ar gyfer awyrennau Tornado GR4 yn RAF Marham fyddai'n cynnig y gwerth gorau am arian o'i gymharu â'r dewis o'i ganoli yn safle Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau

believe that this is the wrong decision.

It is wrong for three key reasons. First, DARA was created in 1998 specifically because a civilian aerospace maintenance workforce was recognised as being substantially more cost effective than uniformed RAF personnel. Secondly, the decision runs counter to the overall programme of shifting public employment from the south and south-east of England to Wales, Scotland and the north of England. Thirdly, and most importantly, St Athan is a world-class facility due to the hard work of a highly skilled workforce that is a national asset recognised by commercial operators in the aerospace sector.

The First Minister has discussed this announcement with Adam Ingram, Minister of State for the Armed Forces, and has expressed our deep disappointment at the decision. The announcement will, of course, be subject to a formal consultation period with the trade unions. Once a final decision has been taken, detailed consultation on the implementation will follow. The transfer of work to RAF Marham means that 500 jobs would be lost at St Athan in 2005. However, sufficient defence work would remain at DARA St Athan to enable continued operations until 2008 to 2009.

I have every sympathy for the workers at St Athan and their families, who must feel badly let down and anxious for their futures. I have already spoken to senior trade union officials and will be visiting the site on Thursday to meet representatives of the workforce and management to discuss the way forward. I assure Members that the Welsh Assembly Government and its agencies stand ready to help those who are faced with redundancy as a result of this announcement. We recognise that there is now an urgent need to try to identify other opportunities for MOD work to be transferred to Wales in order for the MOD to deliver on its commitment to a secure future for St Athan. Having said that, I want to make it absolutely clear that the MOD's announcement does not reduce the Welsh

Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a minnau o'r farn bod y penderfyniad hwn yn anghywir.

Mae'n anghywir am dri phrif reswm. Yn gyntaf, crëwyd Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn 1998 yn benodol oherwydd cydnabod bod gweithlu cynnal awyrennau sifil yn fwy cost-effeithiol o lawer na staff lifreig yr Awyrlu Brenhinol. Yn ail, mae'r penderfyniad yn mynd yn groes i'r rhaglen gyffredinol o symud swyddi cyhoeddus o dde a de-ddwyrain Lloegr i Gymru, yr Alban a gogledd Lloegr. Yn drydydd, ac yn bwysicaf oll, mae'r cyfleuster yn Sain Tathan yn un sydd o'r radd flaenaf oherwydd gwaith caled y gweithlu tra medrus sy'n ased cenedlaethol a gydnabyddir gan weithredwyr masnachol yn y sector awyrofod.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi trafod y cyhoeddiad hwn gydag Adam Ingram, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros y Lluoedd Arfog, ac mae wedi mynegi ein siom ddirfawr yn y penderfyniad. Wrth gwrs, bydd cyfnod o ymgynghori ffurfiol ar y cyhoeddiad gyda'r undebau llafur. Ar ôl gwneud penderfyniad terfynol, ceir ymgynghori manwl ar y dull o'i roi ar waith. Mae trosglwyddo gwaith i RAF Marham yn golygu y collid 500 o swyddi yn Sain Tathan yn 2005. Er hynny, byddai digon o waith amddiffyn yn aros yn Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn Sain Tathan fel y gallai barhau i weithredu tan 2008 i 2009.

Mae gennyf bob cydymdeimlad â'r gweithwyr yn Sain Tathan a'u teuluoedd, sy'n sicr o deimlo'n siomedig dros ben ac yn bryderus ynghylch eu dyfodol. Yr wyf eisoes wedi siarad ag uwch swyddogion undeb llafur a byddaf yn ymweld â'r safle ddydd Iau i gwrdd â chynrychiolwyr y gweithlu a'r rheolwyr i drafod y ffordd ymlaen. Yr wyf yn sicrhau Aelodau bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hasiantaethau wrth law'n barod i helpu'r rhai sy'n wynebu eu diswyddo o ganlyniad i'r cyhoeddiad hwn. Cydnabyddwn fod taer angen yn awr geisio canfod cyfleoedd eraill i drosglwyddo gwaith y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn i Gymru fel y gall y weinyddiaeth gyflawni ei hymrwymiad i sicrhau dyfodol Sain Tathan. Wedi dweud hynny, dymunaf ddatgan yn bendant nad yw

Assembly Government's commitment to an aerospace centre of excellence at St Athan. The Ministry of Defence has invested £77 million and the Welsh Development Agency has invested £15 million in a substantial asset in the Vale of Glamorgan—that investment will not be wasted. Indeed, without that investment, we would be in a far worse position today, particularly in terms of attracting new commercial operations to the site.

We strongly believe that St Athan provides an extremely attractive proposition for employers seeking the best location for aerospace operations. I have instructed Team Wales, in particular the Welsh Development Agency, to redouble its efforts to attract new work to St Athan. We will need to attract a wider range of both civil and defence work to St Athan before today's announcement takes effect.

We have a world-class workforce already in place, with the skills and commitment needed to make a success of that process. The aerospace sector is of huge importance, not only to the economy of South Wales, but to Wales and the UK as a whole. Wales has attracted around 10 per cent of the UK's aerospace industry, and in the key and growing maintenance, repair and overhaul market, Wales is close to achieving a 40 per cent share of the UK market. We will do all that we can to ensure that we maintain and, if at all possible, increase this level of activity in Wales. Having secured the site for Wales, I am convinced that St Athan will play an important part.

In conclusion, I again extend my sympathy to all those affected at St Athan, and reiterate the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to continue with its plans to create an aerospace centre of excellence at St Athan, and secure a strong future for the aerospace sector in Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Cymeradwyaf a chytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedasoeh ynglŷn â difrifoldeb yr ergyd o golli'r cytundeb i'r gweithwyr yn Sain Tathan. Yr hyn sydd yn anhygoel am y cyhoeddiad hwn yw mai'r un Gweinidog,

cyhoeddiad y weinyddiaeth yn lleihau ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ganolfan ragoriaeth awyrofod yn Sain Tathan. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn wedi buddsoddi £77 miliwn ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wedi buddsoddi £15 miliwn yn yr ased sylweddol sydd ym Mro Morgannwg—ni wastreffir yr ased hwnnw. Yn wir, heb y buddsoddiad hwnnw, byddem mewn sefyllfa waeth o lawer heddiw, yn enwedig o ran denu gwaith masnachol newydd i'r safle.

Credwn yn gryf fod Sain Tathan yn ddeniadol dros ben i gyflogwyr sy'n ceisio'r lleoliad gorau i waith awyrofod. Yr wyf wedi cyfarwyddo Tim Cymru, ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn benodol, i ddyblu ei ymdrechion i ddenu gwaith newydd i Sain Tathan. Bydd yn rhaid inni ddenu mwy o amrywiaeth o waith sifil a gwaith amddiffyn i Sain Tathan cyn i'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed heddiw ddod i rym.

Mae gennym weithlu o'r radd flaenaf sydd eisoes ar waith, a chanddo'r medrau a'r ymroddiad y mae eu hangen i beri i'r broses honno lwyddo. Mae'r sector awyrofod o bwys aruthrol, nid yn unig i economi'r De, ond i Gymru ac i'r DU gyfan. Mae Cymru wedi denu tua 10 y cant o ddiwydiant awyrofod y DU ac, yn y farchnad allweddol a chynyddol ar gyfer gwaith cynnal a chadw, atgyweirio ac archwilio, mae Cymru bron â sicrhau cyfran o 40 y cant o'r farchnad yn y DU. Gwnawn bopeth a allwn i sicrhau y byddwn yn cadw ac, os oes modd, yn cynyddu gweithgarwch o'r fath yng Nghymru. Wedi cael y safle i Gymru, yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig y bydd Sain Tathan yn chwarae rhan o bwys.

I gloi, yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo eto â'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt yn Sain Tathan, ac yn ailddatgan ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i barhau â'i chynlluniau i greu canolfan ragoriaeth awyrofod yn Sain Tathan, ac i sicrhau dyfodol cadarn i'r sector awyrofod yng Nghymru.

**Elin Jones:** I commend and agree with your remarks on the severity of the blow that the loss of this contract will inflict on the workers at St Athan. The incredible thing about last week's announcement of the loss



Adam Ingram, a gyhoeddodd y gwariant o £77 miliwn ar y 'super hangar', y prosiect Draig Goch, ag a gyhoeddodd yr wythnos diwethaf fod DARA wedi colli cytundeb Tornado a 500 o swyddi. Nid oes amheuaeth bod cysylltiad amlwg rhwng gwaith DARA yn Sain Tathan a lleoli'r prosiect a llwyddiant Draig Goch yn yr ardal. Yr ydym yn gyfarwydd ag adrannau o'r Llywodraeth nad ydynt yn gwybod am yr hyn y mae adrannau arall yn eu gwneud, ond nid ydym mor gyfarwydd â'r un Gweinidog—Adam Ingram yn yr achos hwn—yn gwneud rhywbeth eleni heb gofio beth a gyhoeddodd y llynedd, gan wario £77 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus a £15 miliwn o arian y Cynulliad yn y broses.

of the Tornado contract and 500 jobs is that it was made by the same Minister, Adam Ingram, who originally announced the expenditure of £77 million on the Red Dragon 'super hangar' project. There is undoubtedly a connection between the work of DARA at St Athan and the location of the project and Red Dragon's success in the area. We are familiar with Government departments not knowing what other departments are doing, but we are not as familiar with one Minister—Adam Ingram in this case—doing something this year whilst forgetting what he announced last year, and spending £77 million of public money and £15 million of Assembly funding in the process.

Wrth gwrs, mae gwahaniaeth sylfaenol rhwng y cyhoeddiad o golli swyddi yn DARA Sain Tathan a'r cyhoeddiadau o golli swyddi yr ydym wedi eu wynebu yng Nghymru yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, oherwydd nid cwmni preifat sydd wedi cyhoeddi a phenderfynu ar hyn, eithr adran Lywodraeth y Gweinidog Llafur yn Llundain.

Of course, there is a fundamental difference between the announcement of job losses at DARA St Athan and other job losses announced in Wales in recent years, in that this decision was not made by a private company, but rather by the Labour Minister's Government department in London.

3.20 p.m.

Mae eich gallu fel Llywodraeth yng Nghymru i ddarbwylo'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain yn fwy na'ch gallu i ddarbwylo cwmni preifat. Yr ydych wedi dweud wrthom droeon cymaint yw'r manteision i Gymru o gael Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan. Ni welaf y manteision hynny yng nghyd-destun y cyhoeddiad hwn. Sawl cyfarfod a fuodd rhyngoch chi, neu'r Prif Weinidog, ac Adam Ingram i'w berswadio i gadw'r cytundeb Tornado yn Sain Tathan cyn y cyhoeddiad, a sawl llythyr neu ddogfen a anfonwyd wrthoch at Adam Ingram yn ystod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr a arweiniodd at y penderfyniad ar y cytundeb Tornado?

Your ability as the Government of Wales to persuade the Government in London is greater than your ability to persuade a private company. You have told us time and again of the great advantages to Wales of having a Labour Government in the Assembly and a Labour Government in Westminster. I do not see those advantages in the context of this announcement. How many meetings did you, or the First Minister, have with Adam Ingram to persuade him to keep the Tornado contract at St Athan prior to the announcement, and how many letters or documents did you send to Adam Ingram during the end-to-end review that led to the decision on the Tornado contract?

Your statement refers to your having instructed Team Wales to redouble its efforts to attract new work to St Athan. What does that mean in practice? Does it mean that you will now allocate twice as many Team Wales officers to work on attracting new jobs to St Athan, or will you be asking the current officers to work twice as hard? What does instructing Team Wales to redouble its efforts

Mae'ch datganiad yn cyfeirio at y ffaith eich bod wedi cyfarwyddo Tîm Cymru i ddyblu ei ymdrechion i ddenu gwaith newydd i Sain Tathan. Beth y mae hynny'n ei olygu'n ymarferol? A yw'n golygu y byddwch yn awr yn neilltuo dwywaith y nifer o swyddogion Tîm Cymru i'r gwaith o ddenu swyddi newydd i Sain Tathan, neu a fyddwch yn gofyn i'r swyddogion presennol weithio

in St Athan mean?

**Andrew Davies:** On communication, we have been in constant contact with the Ministry of Defence. We have had several conversations and meetings with MOD and Wales Office Ministers. I cannot give you a detailed response as to quantity, but I give Members an absolute assurance that the First Minister and I have been unstinting in lobbying the case for St Athan, not just over the last couple of months but over the whole of the Red Dragon project. One reason why we got over £90 million of investment in that project was our lobbying of the MOD. As I said in my statement, if we did not have this hangar, which we hope will be completed shortly, the position of DARA at St Athan would be significantly worse. We would not have that cutting edge asset that we will now be able to market even more vigorously than we have in the past.

In terms of activity, we have been extremely successful in attracting some of the major global aerospace companies to Wales. We hosted the international maintenance, repair and overhaul conference in Wales, as well as the exhibition. We have already attracted major companies to bring their operations to Wales. As I said, we have 40 per cent of the UK maintenance, repair and overhaul market. In global terms, the UK is second only to America in its stake in the global aerospace market. We have a good base upon which to build. Not only do we have the hangar in St Athan, which will be operational shortly, but we also have a highly skilled workforce which is second to none. British Aerospace's board came to Wales earlier this year and was complimentary about the quality of the workforce in its three facilities. Therefore, we feel that we have a good base upon which to build, and, in my meeting with the chief executive of the Welsh Development Agency yesterday, we outlined the companies that we are talking to, which will be visiting Wales shortly to look at the facility.

I assure you that this administration, under the First Minister, has stood up, and will

ddwywaith yn galetach? Beth y mae cyfarwyddo Tîm Cymru i ddyblu ei ymdrechion yn Sain Tathan yn ei olygu?

**Andrew Davies:** Ynghylch cyfathrebu, buom mewn cysylltiad yn gyson â'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Cawsom sawl sgwrs a chyfarfod â Gweinidogion y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn a Swyddfa Cymru. Ni allaf roi ateb manwl i chi am niferoedd, ond rhoddaf bob sicrwydd i Aelodau fod y Prif Weinidog a minnau wedi llobio'n ddi-baid gan ddadlau o blaid Sain Tathan, nid yn unig dros y misoedd diwethaf ond drwy gydol prosiect y Ddraig Goch. Un rheswm y cawsom fuddsoddiad o fwy na £90 miliwn yn y prosiect hwnnw oedd ein bod wedi llobio'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, pe na fyddai'r awyrendy hwn gennym, y gobeithiwn y caiff ei gwblhau cyn hir, byddai sefyllfa Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan yn waeth o lawer. Ni fyddai'r ased modern hwnnw gennym y byddwn yn awr yn gallu ei farchnata hyd yn oed yn fwy egniol nag a wnaethom yn y gorffennol.

O ran gweithgarwch, buom yn dra llwyddiannus wrth ddenu rhai o'r cwmnïau awyrofod rhyngwladol mwyaf i Gymru. Cynaliasom y gynhadledd ryngwladol ar gynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r arddangosfa. Yr ydym eisoes wedi denu cwmnïau mawr i ddod â'u gweithrediadau i Gymru. Fel y dywedais, mae gennym 40 y cant o'r farchnad ar gyfer cynnal a chadw, atgyweirio ac archwilio yn y DU. Yn y cyd-destun rhyngwladol, nid yw'r DU ond yn ail i America o ran ei chyfran o'r farchnad awyrofod ryngwladol. Mae gennym sylfaen dda i adeiladu arni. Yn ogystal â'r awyrendy yn Sain Tathan, a fydd ar waith cyn hir, mae gennym weithlu tra medrus sydd heb ei ail. Daeth bwrdd British Aerospace i Gymru'n gynharach eleni a chanmolodd ansawdd y gweithlu yn ei dri cyfleuster. Felly, teimlwn fod gennym sylfaen dda i adeiladu arni ac, yn fy nghyfarfod â phrif weithredwr Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ddoe, nodasom y cwmnïau yr ydym yn siarad â hwy, a fydd yn ymweld â Chymru cyn hir i weld y cyfleuster.

Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau bod y weinyddiaeth hon, o dan y Prif Weinidog, wedi sefyll o

stand up, for Wales. That is why we have record levels of investment in our public services and a diverse, dynamic economy for the first time in decades.

**Alun Cairns:** I thank you for your statement, the last line of which extends sympathy to the people who are about to lose their jobs. However, neither your sympathy nor disappointment will pay their mortgages. The reality is that the people working at St Athan have been let down by Labour. Government decisions have led to their losing, or being about to lose, their jobs. In your words, Minister, they

‘feel badly let down and anxious for their futures.’

That is a result of a Labour Government taking the decision.

However, what angers people in St Athan more than anything is the political manipulation and the capital that you and your Labour Party colleagues have sought to make out of project Red Dragon and of the DARA operation on several occasions. In February 2001, before the general election, you and your colleagues sought to capitalise on the announcement of project Red Dragon. In February 2003, before the Assembly election, this project was again trumpeted, as you claimed credit for project Red Dragon and DARA as the anchor tenant. However, the Labour Government in Westminster has now taken away your anchor tenant, or has taken away its long-term future. What do you have left? All this money is being spent on a white elephant. It may well be a state-of-the-art facility, but there is also a state-of-the-art facility in Prestwick, where there is also a runway, and there is a state-of-the-art facility at Woodford aerodrome. The reality is clear: there is overcapacity in this market, and you, along with your Ministry of Defence colleagues, have made massive investments in this area on the basis of a promise from Adam Ingram. However, these people have now been let down because that promise has been broken. The reality is that the viability of DARA in St Athan has been brought into question, as Adam Ingram said last week. He

blaid Gymru, ac y bydd yn dal i wneud hynny. Dyna pam y mae gennym y buddsoddi mwyaf erioed yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac economi amrywiol a deinamig am y tro cyntaf ers degawdau.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolchaf i chi am eich datganiad, y mae'r llinell olaf ohono'n estyn cydymdeimlad i'r rhai sydd ar fin colli eu swyddi. Er hynny, ni fydd na'ch cydymdeimlad na'ch siom yn talu eu morgesiau. Y gwir yw bod y gweithwyr yn Sain Tathan wedi'u siomi gan Lafur. Mae penderfyniadau gan Lywodraeth wedi peri eu bod yn colli, neu ar fin colli, eu swyddi. A defnyddio'ch geiriau chi, Weinidog, teimlant

‘yn siomedig dros ben ac yn bryderus ynghylch eu dyfodol.’

Mae hynny'n ganlyniad i benderfyniad gan Lywodraeth Lafur.

Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n digio pobl yn Sain Tathan yn fwy na dim yw'r ffdlan gwleidyddol a'r elw yr ydych chi a'ch cymheiriad yn y Blaid Lafur wedi ceisio ei gael o brosiect y Ddraig Goch ac o weithrediad Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn ar sawl achlysur. Yn Chwefror 2001, cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol, gwnaethoch chi a'ch cymheiriad geisio manteisio ar gyhoeddi prosiect y Ddraig Goch. Yn Chwefror 2003, cyn etholiad y Cynulliad, tynnwyd sylw eto at y prosiect hwn, gan eich bod yn hawlio clod am brosiect y Ddraig Goch a'r asiantaeth fel y prif denant. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan wedi mynd â'ch prif denant oddi yno'n awr, neu wedi peri nad oes iddo ddyfodol tymor hir. Beth sydd gennych ar ôl? Mae'r holl arian yn cael ei wario ar eliffant gwyn. Mae'n ddigon posibl ei fod yn gyfleuster gyda'r mwyaf modern, ond mae cyfleuster gyda'r mwyaf modern yn Prestwick hefyd, lle y mae rhedfa yn ogystal, ac mae cyfleuster gyda'r mwyaf modern ym maes awyr Woodford. Mae'r gwir yn amlwg: mae gormod o gapasiti yn y farchnad hon, ac yr ydych chi, ynghyd â'ch cymheiriad yn y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn, wedi buddsoddi symiau anferth yn y maes hwn ar sail addewid gan Adam Ingram. Fodd bynnag, mae'r bobl hyn wedi'u siomi bellach gan fod

said that the long-term viability of the site has been brought into question.

What specific action will you take, Minister? I know that you are talking to operators, because they have been in touch with me. They also know that there is overcapacity in the civil aviation maintenance, repair and overhaul sector. That is quite obvious. They have you over a barrel because you have a white elephant—you have spent all this money and, in order to save face, you need to do something about it. One company that I know that the WDA has contacted is just going through the motions. What are you doing in terms of asking the Ministry of Defence for a refund of the WDA funding that has been spent in the area, and what specifically are you doing to try to save these jobs after these people have been let down so badly by Labour?

**Andrew Davies:** When one hears such an over-the-top response, one is at a loss sometimes to know how to respond. Overcapacity in the market? When we talk to aerospace companies across the world, they do not see overcapacity: what they are looking for is a highly skilled workforce in a growing sector. Admittedly, after 9/11 the aerospace sector went through a difficult period. However, if you talk to any of the leading players, whether in manufacturing or in maintenance, repair and overhaul, there is every indication that the market is growing. That is why, for example, maintenance, repair and overhaul operators are interested in the sector. Whether it is in civilian or in defence work, there is a growing demand for the skills of the people at St Athan.

Using the words 'political manipulation' is rather crass, given that diatribe. Welsh Labour has been standing up for Wales. As I said in my response to Elin Jones, we have secured a significant investment from the MOD, as well as a contribution from ourselves through the WDA into a state-of-the-art maintenance, repair and overhaul

yr addewid honno wedi'i thorri. Y gwir yw bod amheuaeth wedi codi ynghylch dichonadwyedd DARA yn Sain Tathan, fel y dywedodd Adam Ingram yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd fod amheuaeth wedi codi ynghylch dichonadwyedd y safle yn y tymor hir.

Pa gamau penodol a gymerwch, Weinidog? Gwn eich bod yn siarad â gweithredwyr, gan iddynt fod mewn cysylltiad â mi. Maent oll yn gwybod bod gormod o gapasiti yn y sector cynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio awyrennau sifil. Mae hynny'n gwbl amlwg. Yr ydych ar eu trugaredd gan fod gennyh eliffant gwyn—yr ydych wedi gwario'r arian mawr hwn ac, er mwyn arbed eich wyneb, rhaid ichi wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Mae un cwmni y gwn fod y WDA wedi cysylltu ag ef yn gwneud dim ond cymryd arno wneud rhywbeth. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud o ran gofyn i'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ad-dalu'r WDA am y cyllid a wariwyd yn y maes hwn, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn benodol i geisio achub y swyddi hyn wedi i'r bobl hyn gael eu siomi gymaint gan Lafur?

**Andrew Davies:** Pan yw rhywun yn clywed y fath orymateb, mae'n methu â gwybod sut i ymateb weithiau. Gormod o gapasiti yn y farchnad? Pan siaradwn â chwmnïau awyrofod ledled y byd, ni welant hwy fod gormod o gapasiti: yr hyn y maent yn ei geisio yw gweithlu tra medrus mewn sector cynyddol. Rhaid cyfaddef bod y sector awyrofod wedi mynd drwy gyfnod anodd ers digwyddiadau 11 Medi. Er hynny, os siaradwch ag unrhyw un o'r prif gwmnïau, boed hynny ym maes gweithgynhyrchu neu gynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio, mae pob arwydd bod y farchnad ar gynnydd. Dyna pam, er enghraifft, y mae gweithredwyr cynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio'n ymddiddori yn y sector. Boed hynny mewn gwaith sifil neu waith amddiffyn, mae galw cynyddol am fedrau'r rhai yn Sain Tathan.

Affwysol braidd yw defnyddio'r geiriau 'ffidlan gwleidyddol', yng ngolwg yr ymosodiad hwnnw. Mae Llafur Cymru wedi bod yn sefyll o blaid Cymru. Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb i Elin Jones, yr ydym wedi sicrhau buddsoddiad sylweddol gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn, yn ogystal â chyfraniadau gennym ni drwy'r WDA mewn

facility at St Athan. It is the Tories who are constantly talking Wales down. I remind colleagues, including the opposition Members who are still in the Chamber, that, between 1979 and 1997, 20,000 manufacturing jobs a year were lost to Wales. Since this administration started in Government in 1999, it has created, on average, 20,000 jobs a year. We are in the job of promoting Wales and developing the Welsh economy out of the ashes left by the Conservatives when they were in power.

cyfleuster cynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio gyda'r mwyaf modern yn Sain Tathan. Y Toriaid sy'n bychanu Cymru byth a hefyd. Yr wyf yn atoffa cyd-Aelodau, gan gynnwys Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau sy'n dal i fod yn y Siambr, fod 20,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu wedi'u colli bob blwyddyn, rhwng 1979 a 1997, yng Nghymru. Ers i'r weinyddiaeth hon ddod i rym yn 1999, mae wedi creu 20,000 o swyddi y flwyddyn, ar gyfartaledd. Ein hamcan ni yw hyrwyddo Cymru a chodi economi Cymru o'r lludw a adawyd gan y Ceidwadwyr pan oeddent mewn grym.

3.30 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** We sympathise with the workers at St Athan, but they do not want tea and sympathy; they want jobs. This is an interesting statement because it is a clear example of the red water that exists between the Assembly Government and the Westminster Government—this tide of water has now engulfed the workforce of St Athan.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cydymdeimlwn â'r gweithwyr yn Sain Tathan, ond nid geiriau o gysur y maent am eu cael; maent am gael swyddi. Mae hwn yn ddatganiad diddorol gan ei fod yn enghraifft glir o'r dŵr coch a geir rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth San Steffan—mae'r llanw hwn bellach yn amgylchynu'r gweithlu yn Sain Tathan.

You said that there was deep disappointment—that is the understatement of the year. It is a body blow to manufacturing in Wales and is a stunning example of a lack of joined-up thinking within the Westminster Government and between that Government and the Assembly Government. You boast to us about your clear links with the UK Government and about your friends in Westminster. However, they have let you down yet again, as they did regarding top-up fees and asylum seekers in prisons. They take you for granted and Wales is a soft touch when a problem such as this arises. As it stands, the investment in project Red Dragon represents poor value for money for taxpayers. The £50 million of funding provided by the Welsh Assembly Government has effectively been poured down the drain. Ten per cent of the UK aerospace industry is located in Wales and it is a key aspect of our future development of manufacturing. Manufacturing jobs in Wales are already being lost faster than they are in England. This is yet another example of our failure to compete and to establish ourselves on the UK stage and on the world stage.

Dywedasoch fod siom ddirfawr—dyna ddweud mwyaf cynnil y flwyddyn. Mae'n ergyd drom i weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru ac yn enghraifft syfrdanol o ddiffyg meddwl cydgysylltiedig o fewn Llywodraeth San Steffan a rhwng y Llywodraeth honno a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Ymfrostiawch wrthym ynghylch y cysylltiadau clir sydd rhyngoch a Llywodraeth y DU ac am eich ffrindiau yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, maent wedi'ch siomi eto byth, fel y gwnaethant mewn cysylltiad â ffioedd ychwanegol a cheiswyr lloches mewn carchardai. Maent yn eich cymryd yn ganiataol ac mae Cymru'n hawdd ei thrin pan yw problem fel hon yn codi. Fel y mae, mae'r buddsoddi ym mhrosiect y Ddraig Goch yn cynnig gwerth gwael am arian i drethdalwyr. Mae'r £50 miliwn o gyllid a roddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i daflu i bob pwrpas. Mae 10 y cant o ddiwydiant awyrofod y DU yng Nghymru ac mae'n agwedd hollbwysig ar ddatblygiad ein gweithgynhyrchu yn y dyfodol. Mae swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru eisoes yn cael eu colli'n gyflymach na'r rhai yn Lloegr. Dyma un enghraifft arall o'n methiant i gystadlu ac ennill ein lle ar lwyfan y DU a llwyfan y byd.

You continually emphasise the importance of the aerospace industry and its success. It is the jewel in our manufacturing crown, but it has been tarnished by this decision. Adam Ingram was nobbled by the men in uniform who were trying to save RAF jobs: that is the truth of the matter. Jobs in St Athan have been, and will be, lost because they must be moved to England in order to keep RAF jobs. When were you first made aware of this decision and how long before the announcement did you know about it? Reassurances were given when the first contract was lost last year that such a loss would not happen again. Those of us with a bit of common sense realised that that would not necessarily be the case, and I am sure that you did not necessarily believe those assurances. What contacts have been made in the intervening year to try to prevent this from happening again? Were you invited to participate in anything that could be called meaningful talks with the UK Minister in order to avoid this decision or were you simply told that the decision was a fait accompli? What specific measures have you asked Team Wales to undertake to attract fresh jobs to Wales? Given the uncertainty about the future of the Welsh Development Agency in adjusting to its new status, can you guarantee that it will be able to pursue fresh jobs with its usual entrepreneurial spirit?

**Andrew Davies:** It is difficult to engage with opposition party spokespeople when they refer to manufacturing rather than to the service sector and maintenance, repair and overhaul, which we are discussing today. Project Red Dragon is not a manufacturing—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I hope that Members will not fall into the bad habit of attempting to ask additional supplementary questions when they are seated.

**Andrew Davies:** We are talking about the service sector and not manufacturing. Manufacturing is important in the aerospace sector and I have already made that clear. We have been successful in attracting companies

Yr ydych yn rhoi pwyslais o hyd ar y diwydiant awyrofod a'i lwyddiant. Ef yw trysor pennaf ein diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, ond mae wedi'i lychwino gan y penderfyniad hwn. Cafodd Adam Ingram ei brynu gan y dynion mewn lifrai a oedd yn ceisio achub swyddi yn yr Awyrlu Brenhinol: dyna'r gwir amdani. Mae swyddi yn Sain Tathan wedi'u colli, a byddant yn cael eu colli, gan fod rhaid eu symud i Loegr i gadw swyddi yn yr Awyrlu Brenhinol. Pa bryd y cawsoch wybod am y penderfyniad hwn a pha mor hir cyn gwneud y cyhoeddiad yr oeddech yn gwybod amdano? Rhoddwyd sicrwydd pan gollwyd y contract cyntaf y llynedd na cheid colled o'r fath eto. Yr oedd y rhai ohonom sy'n meddu ar ychydig o synnwyr cyffredin yn sylweddoli nad felly y byddai o reidrwydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr nad oeddech o reidrwydd yn credu'r geiriau hynny o sicrwydd. Pa gysylltu a fu yn y flwyddyn ers hynny i atal hyn rhag digwydd eto? A gawsoch eich gwahodd i gymryd rhan mewn unrhyw beth y gellid ei alw'n drafodaethau ystyrlon gyda Gweinidog y DU er mwyn osgoi'r penderfyniad hwn neu a ddywedwyd wrthyh fod y penderfyniad wedi'i wneud doed a ddelo? Pa gamau penodol yr ydych wedi gofyn i Dîm Cymru eu cymryd i ddenu swyddi newydd i Gymru? Yng ngolwg yr ansicrwydd ynghylch dyfodol Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wrth iddo ymaddasu i'w statws newydd, a allwch warantu y bydd yn gallu ceisio swyddi newydd gyda'i fentergarwch arferol?

**Andrew Davies:** Anodd yw ymateb i lefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau pan gyfeiriant at weithgynhyrchu yn hytrach nag at y sector gwasanaethu a chynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio, sef yr hyn yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw. Nid gweithgynhyrchu yw prosiect y Ddraig Goch—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gobeithiaf na fydd Aelodau'n mynd i'r arfer drwg o geisio gofyn cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol a hwythau ar eu heistedd.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr ydym yn sôn am y sector gwasanaethu yn hytrach na gweithgynhyrchu. Mae gweithgynhyrchu'n bwysig yn y sector awyrofod ac yr wyf eisoes wedi egluro hynny. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i

such as British Aerospace to north Wales, and Nordam and Britax Rumbold to south Wales, with financial assistance from the Assembly Government. Companies such as Boeing are increasingly moving out of manufacturing into the crucial maintenance, repair and overhaul market because they can see that it is a more value added sector. The sector is growing in importance within the Welsh economy and globally. We have consistently made the case for project Red Dragon. I am delighted that we have the facility at St Athan. Were it not for the Labour administrations in Cardiff and in Westminster, the facility would not have been created. Had we adopted a confrontational attitude or decided to do Wales down, as the Conservatives did for so many years, we would not have the facility that we are now able to market aggressively.

In terms of our relationship and contact with the MOD and Westminster, I refer you to my reply to Elin Jones. We have made it clear that we disagree with the MOD's decision. We consider it to be the wrong decision. However, the fact that we disagree on one issue does not mean that we do not overwhelmingly agree with, or benefit from, decisions made by the Westminster Government. An announcement was made only yesterday of 600 jobs coming to Wales as a result of the Lyons review. We have lobbied the Westminster Government hard and made the case for Wales as a location for Government jobs. However, we disagree with the decision regarding DARA at St Athan. Our view was made public and made known at an early stage to the MOD.

**Jane Hutt:** I thank you for your swift response last week, Minister, when this unfortunate decision was made by the MOD. I also thank you and the First Minister for the unstinting support shown in the past few months. You and the First Minister have attended meetings with shop stewards, union officials and me to discuss these issues and to ensure that our representations are heard clearly. I had a meeting yesterday with the workforce, shop stewards, union officials and

ddenu cwmnïau fel British Aerospace i'r Gogledd, a Nordam a Britax Rumbold i'r De, gyda chymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae cwmnïau fel Boeing yn symud fwyfwy oddi wrth weithgynhyrchu ac i'r farchnad hollbwysig ar gyfer cynnal, atgyweirio ac archwilio gan eu bod yn ei weld yn sector sydd â mwy o werth ychwanegol. Mae'r sector yn dod yn bwysicach yn economi Cymru a ledled y byd. Yr ydym wedi dadlau'n gyson dros brosiect y Ddraig Goch. Yr wyf wrth fy modd bod y cyfleuster yn Sain Tathan gennym. Oni bai am y gweinyddiaethau Llafur yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan, ni fyddai'r cyfleuster wedi'i greu. Pe baem wedi cymryd agwedd wrthdrawiadol neu wedi penderfynu gwneud cam â Chymru, fel y gwnaeth y Ceidwadwyr am flynyddoedd lawer, ni fyddem yn meddu ar y cyfleuster yr ydym bellach yn gallu ei farchnata'n egniol.

O ran ein perthynas a'n cysylltiadau â'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn a San Steffan, fe'ch cyfeirïaf at fy ateb i Elin Jones. Eglurasom ein bod yn anghytuno â phenderfyniad y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Credwn fod y penderfyniad yn anghywir. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ffaith ein bod yn anghytuno ar un mater yn golygu nad ydym yn cytuno ran amlaf o lawer â phenderfyniadau gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, neu'n cael budd ohonynt. Gwnaed cyhoeddiad ddoe ddiwethaf am 600 o swyddi sy'n dod i Gymru o ganlyniad i adolygiad Lyons. Yr ydym wedi llobio Llywodraeth San Steffan yn galed ac wedi dadlau dros leoli swyddi Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Er hynny, anghytunwn â'r penderfyniad ynghylch DARA yn Sain Tathan. Cyhoeddwyd ein barn a rhoddwyd gwybod amdani'n gynnar i'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolchaf i chi am eich ymateb cyflym yr wythnos diwethaf, Weinidog, pan wnaed y penderfyniad anffodus hwn gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Diolchaf hefyd i chi a'r Prif Weinidog am y gefnogaeth ddi-ball a amlygwyd yn y misoedd diwethaf. Yr ydych chi a'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod mewn cyfarfodydd gyda siop-stiwardiaid, swyddogion undeb a mi i drafod y materion hyn ac i sicrhau y clywir ein sylwadau'n glir. Cefais gyfarfod ddoe gyda'r gweithlu, y siop-

a WDA representative to discuss the way forward. It is important that you have given an assurance that the £77 million invested in project Red Dragon will not be wasted. I know that you are due to talk to workforce representatives and management later this week. They will want to hear how we intend to ensure that the skilled workforce at DARA St Athan is sold in order to win civil and defence contracts in future. This is the optimism that they want to hear from you, Minister. I am grateful that you have already shared optimistic words with us today. Can you reassure me that, when you meet management on Thursday, you will consider the opportunities that DARA St Athan, the super hangar, the investment and the highly skilled workforce can provide to the local community, employment and the economy of Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** I can give you that assurance, Jane. Since the MOD's announcement last week, we have received inquiries regarding the facility at St Athan. Major overseas and UK-based companies recognise that DARA St Athan has a highly skilled workforce. I am determined, as is the First Minister, to ensure that we secure alternative work for the DARA workforce as soon as is humanly possible. However, it takes time to attract these types of jobs; they cannot be turned on and off like a tap. I reiterate the assurance given to all Members that we will do everything possible to exploit the vast potential at St Athan and to realise the original vision of an aerospace centre of excellence via project Red Dragon.

**David Melding:** Do you share my bitter disappointment that the RAF seems prepared to use Wales as the low-fly capital of Great Britain and, perhaps, western Europe, but is not prepared to continue to invest in Wales by maintaining a facility that seems to be completely justified on a commercial basis? With whom are you most disappointed—is it

stiwardiaid, swyddogion undeb a chynrychiolydd o'r WDA i drafod y ffordd ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi rhoi sicrwydd na fydd y £77 miliwn a fuddsoddwyd ym mhrosiect y Ddraig Goch yn cael ei wastraffu. Gwn eich bod i fod i siarad â chynrychiolwyr y gweithlu a'r rheolwyr yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. Byddant am glywed sut y bwriadwn sicrhau y bydd y gweithlu medrus yn Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn Sain Tathan yn cael ei farchnata er mwyn ennill contractau sifil ac amddiffyn yn y dyfodol. Dyma'r optimistiaeth y dymunant ei chlywed gennych chi, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod eisoes wedi rhannu geiriau o obaith gyda ni heddiw. A allwch fy sicrhau, pan gyfarfyddwch â'r rheolwyr ddydd Iau, y byddwch yn ystyried y cyfleoedd y gall Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn Sain Tathan, yr awyrendy mawr, y buddsoddiad a'r gweithlu tra medrus eu cynnig i'r gymuned leol, i gyflogaeth ac i economi Cymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi o hynny, Jane. Ers y cyhoeddiad gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yr wythnos diwethaf, yr ydym wedi cael ymholiadau ynghylch y cyfleuster yn Sain Tathan. Mae cwmnïau mawr yn y DU ac mewn gwledydd tramor yn cydnabod bod Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn Sain Tathan yn meddu ar weithlu tra medrus. Yr wyf yn benderfynol, fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog, i sicrhau y cawn waith arall i weithlu Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Er hynny, cymer amser i ddenu swyddi o'r mathau hyn; ni ellir eu cael yn ôl y gofyn. Ailddatganaf y sicrwydd a roddwyd i'r holl Aelodau y gwnawn bopeth a ellir i elwa ar y potensial aruthrol a geir yn Sain Tathan ac i gyflawni'r weledigaeth wreiddiol o ganolfan ragoriaeth awyrofod drwy brosiect y Ddraig Goch.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn rhannu'r siom fawr a deimlaf fod yr Awyrlu Brenhinol yn ymddangos ei fod yn barod i ddefnyddio Cymru fel y brif ganolfan ar gyfer hedfan isel ym Mhrydain Fawr ac, efallai, gorllewin Ewrop, ond nad yw'n barod i ddal i fuddsoddi yng Nghymru drwy gynnal cyfleuster y gellir ei gyfiawnhau'n llwyr ar



with your ministerial colleagues for not making an effective decision, or with the military for allowing its vested interest to be supreme?

**Andrew Davies:** I will not repeat the points made in the statement, other than to say that there seems to be an implication that the MOD's decision somehow reflects on the quality of the DARA workforce. That is not the case. The First Minister agrees that the MOD's decision to transfer the work to uniformed personnel at RAF Marham in East Anglia was wrong. As I said, despite our disappointment, we must bear in mind that we have a fantastic facility at St Athan, which includes the skilled workforce as well as the super hangar. We will do everything that we can to ensure that those faced with redundancy are provided with alternative employment as soon as is humanly possible.

3.40 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I welcome your statement and I acknowledge your commitment, and that of the rest of the Welsh Assembly Government, to do all that is possible to ensure the future of the work at St Athan. Do you accept the concern of the Amicus trade union that the RAF facilities are unlikely to be able to provide the type of deep and life-extending maintenance currently provided at St Athan? If, as suggested, this scenario proves to be correct, is there not a danger that the service will not be able to revert to St Athan because the highly-skilled workers could have been snapped up by aircraft maintenance operators elsewhere in the world?

**Andrew Davies:** We have been in constant touch with the unions, including Amicus and the Transport and General Workers' Union, over the last 18 months, as in the run-up to the announcement on project Red Dragon. We have constantly been in touch with them, with Jane Hutt as the local Assembly Member, working on making the case for project Red Dragon and for the DARA workforce. You have outlined a major concern. If alternative work is not provided,

sail fasnachol, yn ôl pob golwg? Ym mhwy yr ydych wedi siomi fwyaf—ai yn eich cyd-Weinidogion am beidio â gwneud penderfyniad effeithiol, ai yn y lluoedd arfog am ganiatáu i'w buddiant breintiedig gael y lle blaenaf?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid ailadroddaf y pwyntiau a wnaed yn y datganiad, heblaw am ddweud bod rhyw ensyniad, i bob golwg, fod penderfyniad y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn adlewyrchu rywsut ar ansawdd gweithlu Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn. Nid felly y mae. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod penderfyniad y weinyddiaeth i drosglwyddo gwaith i staff lifreig yn RAF Marham yn East Anglia yn anghywir. Fel y dywedais, er gwaethaf ein siom, rhaid inni gofio bod gennym gyfleuster gwych yn Sain Tathan, sy'n cynnwys y gweithlu medrus yn ogystal â'r awyrendy mawr. Gwnawn bopeth a allwn i sicrhau y bydd y rhai sy'n wynebu eu diswyddo'n cael gwaith arall cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Croesawaf eich datganiad a chydnabyddaf eich ymrwymiad chi, a gweddill Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, i wneud popeth a ellir i sicrhau dyfodol y gwaith yn Sain Tathan. A ydych yn cydnabod y pryder a fynegwyd gan yr undeb llafur Amicus i'r perwyl ei bod yn annhebygol y bydd cyfleusterau'r Awyrlu Brenhinol yn gallu cynnig y math o waith cynnal manwl a hirfaith a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd yn Sain Tathan? Os gwelir bod y senario hwn yn gywir, fel yr awgrymwyd, onid oes perygl na fydd y gwasanaeth yn gallu dod yn ôl i Sain Tathan gan y gallai'r gweithwyr tra medrus fod wedi'u bachu gan weithredwyr cynnal awyrennau mewn mannau eraill yn y byd?

**Andrew Davies:** Buom mewn cysylltiad parhaus â'r undebau, gan gynnwys Amicus ac Undeb y Gweithwyr Traftnidol a Chyffredinol, dros y 18 mis diwethaf, ac yn y cyfnod cyn y cyhoeddiad ar brosiect y Ddraig Goch. Buom mewn cysylltiad parhaus â hwy, a bu Jane Hutt, fel yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol, yn paratoi'r ddadl dros brosiect y Ddraig Goch a thros weithlu Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn. Yr ydych wedi amlinellu un pryder mawr. Os na ddarperir

those people will vote with their feet, because they are highly-skilled, in fairly scarce supply and many companies would see them as an attractive proposition. We are concerned that we will lose that pool of labour and will, therefore, do all that we can to ensure that we do not lose them by securing alternative work at the site.

**Leighton Andrews:** I have constituents who work at the DARA facility and this is deeply disappointing news for them. Do you agree that the way forward for St Athan is the active looking for new market opportunities, not the abject pessimism that we have heard from the Conservatives today?

**Andrew Davies:** They say that old habits die hard, Leighton. In this case they are the habits of a lifetime of talking Wales down and inflicting the economic damage that the Conservatives inflicted on this country. This administration is determined to create a dynamic economy, which we are doing. Two years ago, the steel industry in Wales was being written off: Corus shares could not be given away. Last week, we were able to congratulate Corus for being in the black for the first time. We have done it before: we turned Allied Steel and Wire around, and Corus has made major strides. We are not defeatist. We are not into pessimism; we are into optimism and talking Wales up.

**Carl Sargeant:** This is a huge blow for the employees of DARA St Athan and I express my concern, and those of my constituents in north Wales, for the workforce. I am glad that you are the Minister for economic development, as I am aware of your commitment to the workforce. While there is no immediate effect on DARA's Sealand factory, will you ensure that no-one takes their eye off the ball there, as it is a huge commitment in north Wales? We need to keep an eye on any effects on DARA in north Wales.

**Andrew Davies:** I give you that assurance.

gwaith arall, bydd y bobl hynny'n pleidleisio â'u traed, gan eu bod yn dra medrus ac yn eithaf prin a byddai llawer o gwmnïau'n eu hystyried yn gryn gaffaeliad. Pryderwn y byddwn yn colli'r gronfa lafur honno ac, felly, gwnawn bopeth a allwn i sicrhau nas collwn drwy sicrhau gwaith arall ar y safle.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae gennyf etholwyr sy'n gweithio yng nghyfleuster Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn ac mae hyn yn newydd siomedig iawn iddynt. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r hyn sy'n cynnig y ffordd ymlaen i Sain Tathan yw'r ymdrech i geisio cyfleoedd newydd yn y farchnad, ac nid y besimistiaeth resynus a glywsom gan y Ceidwadwyr heddiw?

**Andrew Davies:** Anodd yw colli hen arfer, yn ôl y sôn, Leighton. Yn yr achos hwn, arferion oes ydynt o fychanu Cymru a pheri'r niwed economaidd a barodd y Ceidwadwyr i'r wlad hon. Mae'r weinyddiaeth hon yn benderfynol o greu economi ddeinamig, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, yr oedd y diwydiant dur yng Nghymru'n cael ei gyfrif yn fethiant: ni welid bod unrhyw werth yng nghyfrannau Corus. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gallasom longyfarch Corus ar wneud elw am y tro cyntaf. Llwyddasom o'r blaen: gwnaethom weddnewid Allied Steel and Wire, ac mae Corus wedi cymryd camau mawr ymlaen. Nid gwangalonwyr ydym. Nid pesimistiaeth yw ein peth ni; optimiaeth yw ein peth ni a hyrwyddo Cymru.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae hon yn ergyd fawr i weithwyr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn Sain Tathan a mynegaf bryder ar fy rhan fy hun a'm hetholwyr yn y Gogledd dros y gweithlu. Yr wyf yn falch mai chi yw'r Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd, gan y gwn am eich ymrwymiad i'r gweithlu. Er nad oes unrhyw effaith uniongyrchol ar ffatri Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn Sealand, a wnewch sicrhau na fydd neb yn colli golwg ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y fan honno, gan fod yr ymgymieriad yn y Gogledd yn un enfawr? Rhaid inni gadw golwg ar unrhyw effeithiau ar yr asiantaeth yn y Gogledd.

**Andrew Davies:** Rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi o

That was one of the first questions that we asked the Ministry of Defence in terms of what was happening with DARA. We were delighted for Sealand. The MOD said in its statement that there were no implications for Sealand from this announcement. Since forming the administration in 1999, we have always taken the route of trying to protect any job in Wales where that is possible—certainly, as the Minister I have done that. We have done so before and on a range of operations. Where, however, we are faced with redundancies, we have an excellent record in helping those faced with redundancy into training and alternative employment. We have done it before and we will do it again.

hynny. Dyna oedd un o'r cwestiynau cyntaf a ofynasom i'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ynghylch yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd i Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn. Yr oeddem yn falch iawn dros Sealand. Dywedodd y weinyddiaeth yn ei datganiad nad oedd unrhyw oblygiadau i Sealand yn sgîl y cyhoeddiad hwn. Ers ffurfio'r weinyddiaeth yn 1999, yr ydym bob amser wedi ceisio amddiffyn pob swydd yng Nghymru lle y bo modd—yn sicr, yr wyf fi wedi gwneud hynny fel Gweinidog. Gwnaethom hynny o'r blaen ac mewn cysylltiad ag amryw o weithrediadau. Pan wynebwn ddiswyddiadau, fodd bynnag, mae gennym record ragorol o ran helpu'r rhai sy'n wynebu eu diswyddo i gael hyfforddiant a gwaith arall. Fe'i gwnaethom o'r blaen ac fe'i gwnawn eto.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**William Graham:** Point of order. I raise this point of order with some sadness as I allege a breach of the Ministerial Code. I refer to Standing Order No. 3.2—

**William Graham:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt o drefn hwn gyda pheth tristwch gan fy mod yn honni bod y Cod i'r Gweinidogion wedi'i dorri. Cyfeiriaf at Reol Sefydlog Rhif 3.2—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no requirement on you to raise a point of order in relation to the Ministerial Code. Should you wish to do so, you may pursue this through the usual procedures. However, if there is a point of order for me, I will be pleased to respond.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes angen ichi godi pwynt o drefn mewn cysylltiad â'r Cod i'r Gweinidogion. Os dymunwch wneud hynny, gallwch fynd ynghylch hyn drwy'r gweithdrefnau arferol. Fodd bynnag, os oes pwynt o drefn i mi, byddaf yn falch o ymateb.

**William Graham:** I would ask that you consider my request and make an appropriate ruling.

**William Graham:** Gofynnaf ichi ystyried fy nghais a rhoi dyfarniad priodol.

On 18 August 2004, I asked Andrew Davies, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, a question regarding the LG site in Newport. According to the convention, the answer should have been supplied to me by 25 August. On 31 August, I was sent a holding reply as the Minister was on leave. I eventually received a substantive reply on 15 September. However, three weeks earlier, on 25 August, the substantive reply was made available to BBC Wales. How did that come about and what is its relevance in terms of trust in the Assembly?

Ar 18 Awst 2004, gofynnais gwestiwn i Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ynghylch safle LG yng Nghasnewydd. Yn unol â'r confensiwn, dylai'r ateb fod wedi'i roi i mi erbyn 25 Awst. Ar 31 Awst, anfonwyd ateb dros dro ataf gan fod y Gweinidog ar wyliau. Cefais ateb ar y mater yn y diwedd ar 15 Medi. Fodd bynnag, dair wythnos cyn hynny, ar 25 Awst, darparwyd yr ateb ar y mater i BBC Cymru. Sut y digwyddodd hynny a beth yw ei berthnasedd o ran ymddiriedaeth yn y Cynulliad?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to William Graham for providing me with notice of this point of order so that I can address the matters for me, of which there are two. First, in accordance with our guidance on questions, Ministers have undertaken that an answer should be given to Members within eight days. This may, in rare cases, be a holding answer. I am content that you were provided with a holding reply within eight working days.

However, you have also highlighted a more serious issue. While I have the highest regard—perhaps not the highest, but a high regard—for the media, and the content of answers are not a matter for me, I take a negative view of information being made available to the media before it is provided to Assembly Members who have requested that information through the Assembly's procedures. The principle here is that questions embody the democratic practice of scrutiny and openness, which are essential components of the parliamentary process. Assembly questions are an important mechanism by which Ministers are formally made accountable to Members, which is why Ministers must answer to Members before they answer to anyone outside the Assembly. [*Interruption.*] Order. The case, if there is one, is not being helped by Members making various comments.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** In response to William's point of order and your statement, I agree that it would be highly inappropriate for information to be given to a press office or the media in advance of an Assembly Member, unless the question had been put by an AM to the press office. However, the question was put by William to me and, as he has been gracious enough to acknowledge, he was provided with a holding reply because I was on leave. At the same time, the press office received a query on this issue. The press office is not aware of questions that are asked of me by Members and neither should it be; questions to me are not a matter for the press office, but for me, my private office and officials. Therefore, the press office, understandably, got the information from officials—

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i William Graham am roi rhybudd i mi o'r pwynt o drefn hwn fel y gallaf ymdrin â'r materion sy'n berthnasol i mi, y ceir dau ohonynt. Yn gyntaf, yn unol â'n canllawiau ar gwestiynau, mae Gweinidogion wedi ymgymryd y dylid rhoi ateb i Aelodau cyn pen wyth niwrnod. Mewn rhai achosion prin, gall hwn fod yn ateb dros dro. Yr wyf yn fodlon bod ateb dros dro wedi'i roi i chi cyn pen wyth niwrnod gwaith.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydych hefyd wedi tynnu sylw at fater mwy difrifol. Er bod gennyf y parch mwyaf—efallai nid y mwyaf, ond parch mawr—at y cyfryngau, ac er nad yw cynnwys atebion yn fater i mi, anghymeradwyaf ddarparu gwybodaeth i'r cyfryngau cyn ei rhoi i Aelodau Cynulliad a geisiodd y wybodaeth honno drwy weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad. Yr egwyddor yma yw mai cwestiynau sy'n ymgorffori'r arfer democrataidd o graffu a gweithredu agored, sy'n elfennau annatod yn y broses seneddol. Mae cwestiynau Cynulliad yn fodd pwysig i beri i Weinidogion fod yn atebol i Aelodau, a dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i Weinidogion roi ateb i Aelodau cyn iddynt roi ateb i unrhyw un y tu allan i'r Cynulliad. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Nid ategir yr achos, os oes un, drwy wneud gwahanol sylwadau gan Aelodau.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Mewn ymateb i'r pwynt o drefn a gododd William a'ch datganiad chi, cytunaf mai tra amhriodol fyddai rhoi gwybodaeth i unrhyw swyddfa'r wasg neu i'r cyfryngau cyn ei rhoi i Aelod o'r Cynulliad, oni bai fod Aelod Cynulliad wedi gofyn y cwestiwn i swyddfa'r wasg. Fodd bynnag, rhoddodd William y cwestiwn i mi ac, fel y bu'n ddigon caredig i gydnabod, cafodd ateb dros dro gan fy mod ar wyliau. Ar yr un pryd, derbynodd swyddfa'r wasg ymholiad am y mater hwn. Ni wŷr swyddfa'r wasg am gwestiynau a ofynnir i mi gan Aelodau ac ni ddylai wybod; nid mater i swyddfa'r wasg yw'r cwestiynau a ofynnir i mi, ond i mi, fy swyddfa breifat a swyddogion. Felly, fel y gellid disgwyl, cafodd swyddfa'r wasg y wybodaeth gan swyddogion—

**Alun Cairns:** Did it take them 20 days to respond?

**Alun Cairns:** A gymerodd 20 diwrnod iddynt ymateb?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have already indicated that such interruptions are not helpful.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi nad yw ymyriadau o'r fath o gymorth.

**Andrew Davies:** The press office was doing its job. It answered the query in terms of how this issue was to be resolved. The substantive inquiry was to be resolved by me on my return. In the meantime, as William said, I answered his question when I returned from leave. The press office did not receive advance information in relation to William's question as the information provided was not in relation to a question from William to me, but from the press to the press office. Therefore, I understand the stricture, but, in my view, I and my press office have handled this appropriately.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr oedd swyddfa'r wasg yn gwneud ei gwaith. Atebodd yr ymholiad am y modd yr oedd y mater hwn i gael ei ddatrys. Yr oeddwn i fod i benderfynu ar yr ateb wedi imi ddychwelyd. Yn y cyfamser, fel y dywedodd William, atebais ei gwestiwn wedi imi ddod yn ôl ar ôl fy ngwyliau. Ni chafodd swyddfa'r wasg wybodaeth o flaen llaw mewn cysylltiad â chwestiwn William gan nad oedd y wybodaeth a roddwyd yn ymwneud â chwestiwn gan William i mi, ond ag un gan y wasg i swyddfa'r wasg. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn deall y feirniadaeth, ond, yn fy marn i, yr wyf fi a'm swyddfa ar gyfer y wasg wedi trafod hyn yn briodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Assembly will have heard the Minister's explanation.

**Y Llywydd:** Bydd y Cynulliad wedi clywed eglurhad y Gweinidog.

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, does the Minister now suggest that opposition Assembly Members will gain swifter and more effective answers if they start tabling questions to the Welsh Assembly Government's press office? That is the logical conclusion. It is outrageous that the press should be given privileged answers when AMs have to wait for them.

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, a yw'r Gweinidog yn awgrymu'n awr y bydd Aelodau Cynulliad y gwrthbleidiau yn cael eu hatebion yn gynt ac y byddant yn fwy effeithiol os dechreuant gyflwyno cwestiynau i swyddfa'r wasg Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Dyna'r casgliad rhesymegol. Mae'n warthus bod atebion breiniol yn cael eu rhoi i'r wasg tra bo Aelodau Cynulliad yn gorfod disgwyl amdanynt.

**The Presiding Officer:** I did not hear the Minister say that.

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chlywais y Gweinidog yn dweud hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We did.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwnaethom ni.

3.50 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Well, I did not. In my original ruling on this point of order, I made it clear that Assembly questions must be fully answered to Members before they are conveyed in any form outside the Assembly.

**Y Llywydd:** Wel, ni wneuthum i. Yn fy nyfarniad cyntaf ar y pwynt o drefn hwn, eglurais fod rhaid rhoi atebion llawn i gwestiynau Cynulliad i Aelodau cyn eu trosglwyddo ar unrhyw ffurf y tu allan i'r Cynulliad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Further to that point of order, I am aware that it is often the practice

**Jenny Randerson:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gwn ei bod yn aml yn arfer gan

for absent Ministers to ensure that someone else is able to answer a question on their behalf, unless it is something that involves information that would only be known by the individual concerned. While I am delighted that Ministers go on holiday—the longer the better in some cases—it would be a good idea if we could firm up the arrangements when Ministers are on holiday. I had two holding replies to simple and straightforward questions from the same Minister and that delay causes problems for Assembly Members seeking information.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Jenny Randerson for providing the Assembly with her ministerial experience and I am certain that the Minister, as well as the officials who advise and work for him in the Cabinet Secretariat, have heard that. We have aired this issue sufficiently and I hope that honour has been satisfied on all sides.

Weinidogion absennol sicrhau bod rhywun arall yn gallu ateb ar eu rhan, oni bai ei fod yn rhywbeth sy'n ymwneud â gwybodaeth na fyddai ond yn hysbys i'r unigolyn dan sylw. Er fy mod yn falch iawn bod Gweinidogion yn mynd ar wyliau—gorau po hwyaf mewn rhai achosion—byddai'n syniad da inni gryfhau'r trefniadau ar gyfer yr adeg yr aiff Gweinidogion ar wyliau. Cefais ddau ateb dros dro i gwestiynau syml oddi wrth yr un Gweinidog ac mae'r oedi hwnnw'n peri problemau i Aelodau'r Cynulliad sy'n ceisio gwybodaeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jenny Randerson am gyfrannu o'i phrofiad fel Gweinidog i'r Cynulliad ac yr wyf yn sicr bod y Gweinidog, yn ogystal â'r swyddogion sy'n ei gynghori ac yn gweithio gydag ef yn Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet, wedi clywed hynny. Yr ydym wedi gwyntyllu'r mater hwn ddigon a gobeithiaf fod pob ochr wedi'i bodloni.

### **Gohirio Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** Atgoffaf Aelodau fod angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair i bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwn iddo gael ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that a two-thirds majority is required if the motion is to be carried.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 37.5, agrees to suspend that part of Standing Order No. 6.3 (iv) requiring Ministers to answer oral questions at least once in every four weeks that the Assembly meets in Plenary to allow the Minister for Health and Social Services to answer oral questions on 6 October 2004 and the Finance Minister to answer Local Government and Public Services questions on 13 October 2004 and the timing of their questions to be revised thereafter. (NNDM2090)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5, yn cytuno i ohirio y rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3 (iv) sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Weinidogion ateb cwestiynau llafar o leiaf unwaith bob pedair wythnos pan fydd y Cynulliad yn cyfarfod mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i alluogi'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ateb cwestiynau llafar ar 6 Hydref 2004 a'r Gweinidog Cyllid i ateb cwestiynau am Lywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ar 13 Hydref 2004, a bod amseriad eu cwestiynau yn cael ei ad-drefnu wedi hynny. (NNDM2090)*

*Cynnig (NNDM2090): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NNDM2090): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004 a  
 Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Ariannol AAL) (Cymru) 2004  
 Approval of the School Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004 and the  
 Education (LEA Financial Schemes) (Wales) Regulations 2004**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod gwrthwynebiadau. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2085 yn enw Jocelyn

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless there are any objections. I see that there are no objections. I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2085 in the name of

Davies a gwelliant 1 i NDM2086 yn enwau Michael German, Peter Black a Kirsty Williams.

Cyn imi alw'r Gweinidog, hoffwn wneud datganiad ynglŷn â'r gwelliannau i Reoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004, gan fod rhai egwyddorion cyffredinol ynglŷn â'n ffordd ni o drin gwelliannau yn codi yng nghyswllt y gwelliannau yn y dadleuon hyn.

Mae'r gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn drafft sydd ger ein bron, yn enw Michael German, Kirsty Williams a Peter Black, mewn trefn. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi fy ysgogi i nodi rhai egwyddorion ar gyfer sut yr wyf yn bwriadu defnyddio fy nisgresiwn i grwpio a dethol gwelliannau i Orchmynion drafft yn y dyfodol.

Mae Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 24.15 a 24.16 yn nodi'r amgylchiadau y gall Aelodau gyflwyno gwelliannau i Orchmynion drafft. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.17 yn sefydlu y bydd unrhyw welliannau yn cael eu cymryd yn yr un drefn ag y maent yn ymwneud â thestun y Gorchymyn drafft. Mae Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.18 yn caniatáu i'r Llywydd benderfynu ar y drefn y caiff gwelliannau eu cymryd, pan fyddant yn codi yn yr un man yn nhestun Gorchymyn drafft, a pheidio â dethol gwelliannau lle mae'n ofynnol gwneud hynny i gynnal y busnes yn briodol.

Wrth arfer fy nisgresiwn yn y meysydd hyn, yr wyf, hyd yma, wedi bod yn hapus i ddethol ar gyfer trafodaeth pob gwelliant y derbyniodd y Swyddfa Gyflwyno eu bod mewn trefn.

Mae'r gwelliant heddiw yn cwmpasu rhan sylweddol o destun y Gorchymyn drafft ac yn cynnig gwelliannau i 12 rheoliad gwahanol o'i fewn. Yr wyf yn cydnabod y rhesymau am hyn, ac yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Aelodau dan sylw am fod eisiau rhoi cynnig amgen ystyrion gerbron y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, pe bai gwelliannau eraill wedi'u cyflwyno, gallai fod wedi bod yn anodd sefydlu'r drefn ar gyfer cymryd y gwelliannau ac yn ddryslyd i'r Aelodau pe baem wedi gallu gwneud hynny. Yn ei dro, gallai hyn fod wedi golygu mai'r unig opsiwn fyddai dad-ddethol gwelliannau oedd, fel arall, yn

Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 1 to NDM2086 in the names of Michael German, Peter Black and Kirsty Williams.

Before I call the Minister, I wish to make a statement on the amendments to the School Budget Shares Regulations (Wales) 2004, because there are some general principles as regards the way in which we deal with amendments that arise in relation to the amendments in these debates.

The amendment to the draft Order before us, in the names of Michael German, Kirsty Williams and Peter Black, is in order. However, it has prompted me to set out some principles for how I intend to use my discretion in grouping and selecting amendments to draft Orders in the future.

Standing Order Nos. 24.15 and 24.16 set out the circumstances under which Members may table amendments to draft Orders. Standing Order No. 24.17 establishes that any amendments shall be taken in the order in which they relate to the text of draft Order. Standing Order No. 24.18 allows the Presiding Officer to determine the order in which amendments which arise in the same place in the text of a draft Order are taken, and to decline to select amendments where the proper conduct of the business makes it appropriate to do so.

In exercising my discretion in these areas, I have, until now, been generally content to select for debate all of the amendments which have been accepted as being in order by the Table Office.

The amendment today ranges over a considerable part of the text of the draft Order and proposes amendments to 12 separate regulations within it. I recognise the reasons for this, and I commend the Members concerned for wanting to put before the Assembly a coherent alternative proposition. However, had other amendments been proposed, it could have been difficult to establish the order in which the amendments should be taken and confusing for Members had we been able to do so. This in turn could have left me with little choice but to deselect amendments that were otherwise perfectly



berffaith ddilys.

Mae'r broblem hon yn debygol o dyfu wrth i Aelodau brofi ffiniau pwerau deddfwriaethol presennol y Cynulliad yn fwyfwy. Mae symudiadau i roi mwy o bwerau i'r Cynulliad, pa mor gyfyng bynnag, neu i ehangu cwrpas ein pwerau presennol, hefyd yn debygol o gynyddu nifer y gwelliannau i Orchmynion drafft yr ydym yn eu hystyried.

Yng ngoleuni hyn, yr wyf wedi penderfynu y byddaf, yn y dyfodol, yn dethol ar gyfer trafodaeth y gwelliannau hynny sy'n ymwneud ag un rheoliad neu un paragraff o Orchmynion drafft yn unig. Fodd bynnag, lle bo Aelodau yn nodi yn y datganiad cost a phwrpas bod gwelliant yn rhan o gyfres sydd ag un bwriad—yn amodol ar ddarpariaethau Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.17 ac unrhyw ganllawiau eraill a gyhoeddwyd—yr wyf yn bwriadu grwpio'r gwelliannau hynny a'i gwneud yn ofynnol eu cynnig fel grŵp. Bydd hyn yn caniatáu i Aelodau gyflwyno grwpiau cydlynol o gynigion ag un pwrpas iddynt, a bydd yn osgoi'r perygl bod gwelliannau sydd fel arall yn ddilys yn cael eu dad-ddethol. Bydd hefyd yn sicrhau bod y broses o wneud penderfyniadau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn parhau i fod yn eglur i ni ac i'r bobl sy'n dilyn ein trafodaethau tu allan.

Os bydd gwelliant sy'n rhan o grŵp cydlynol yn methu, byddaf yn dad-ddethol gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp hwnnw. Effaith hynny fydd mai dim ond un bleidlais a gynhelir ar grŵp o welliannau lle nad yw gwelliannau unigol yn gwneud synnwyr o gwbl ond fel rhan o'r grŵp.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol imi wneud datganiad maith a chymhleth, ond y bwriad yw sicrhau eglurder. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Aelodau am fyfyrho arno fel, yr wyf yn sicr, y maent yn myfyrho ar bob datganiad a wnaif.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that statement, Presiding Officer, it is helpful. The Table Office advised us, when we tabled this amendment, that we might want to proceed in that way. We did not do so because we felt that the amendment was more coherent as one motion, but I understand that there could have been a problem with deselection. The

valid.

This problem is likely to grow as Members increasingly test the boundaries of the Assembly's current legislative powers. Moves, however limited, to provide the Assembly with greater powers, or widen the latitude under which our current powers can be exercised, are also likely to increase the number of amendments to draft Orders that we consider.

In the light of this, I have decided that in future I will select for debate only those amendments which relate to a single regulation or paragraph of a draft Order. However, where Members indicate in the statement of cost and purpose that an amendment is part of a series with a single intention—subject to the provisions of Standing Order No. 24.17 and any other guidance that has been issued—I intend to group those amendments and require them to be proposed as a group. This will allow Members to put forward coherent groups of proposals with a single purpose, and will avoid the risk of otherwise valid amendments being deselected. It will also ensure continued clarity of decision making in Plenary for us and for people on the outside who take an interest in our deliberations.

If an amendment that forms part of a coherent group is defeated, I will deselect other amendments in that group. The effect will be that there will only be a single vote on a group of amendments where individual amendments do not make sense except as part of that group.

I am aware that I have made a lengthy and complex statement, but the intention was to ensure clarity. I am sure that Members will wish to deliberate on that as, I am sure, they deliberate on every statement that I make.

**Peter Black:** Diolch i chi am y datganiad hwnnw, Lywydd, mae'n un defnyddiol. Fe'n cynghorwyd gan y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, pan gyflwynasom y gwelliant hwn, y gallem ddymuno gweithredu felly. Ni wnaethom hynny gan ein bod yn teimlo bod y gwelliant yn fwy cydlynol ar ffurf un cynnig, ond yr wyf yn deall y gallasai problem godi wrth

biggest problem here is that we do not undertake line-by-line scrutiny of legislation and, for that reason, we are in this situation. My sole purpose in tabling a single amendment was that I did not want to wear out the voting system too early in the session.

**The Presiding Officer:** I hope and pray that the voting system, following its recent treatment, is sufficiently robust. However, I am certain that this issue will be pursued further, as we progress with more detailed scrutiny of our regulations and legislation. If party business managers or Members wish to have further discussions in private about these matters and the statement that I made today, I would be pleased to meet them. The Business Committee, sitting as the procedure committee—I see the Chair of the Business Committee nodding—may wish to consider the matter further.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 29 June 2004. (NDM2085)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 13 July 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*2. approves that the Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 29 June 2004; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 July 2004. (NDM2086)*

I propose that

ddad-ddethol. Y broblem fwyaf yn hyn o beth yw nad ydym yn craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth fesul llinell ac, oherwydd hynny, yr ydym yn y sefyllfa hon. Fy unig amcan wrth gyflwyno un gwelliant oedd peidio â pheri gormod o draul ar y system bleidleisio yn rhy gynnar yn y sesiwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwir obeithio bod y system bleidleisio'n ddigon cadarn, ar ôl ei thrin yn ddiweddar. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr yr eir ynghylch y mater hwn ymhellach, wrth inni graffu'n fanylach ar ein rheoliadau a'n deddfwriaeth. Os yw rheolwyr busnes y pleidiau neu Aelodau'n dymuno cael trafodaethau pellach yn breifat am y materion hyn a'r datganiad a wneuthum heddiw, byddwn yn falch o gwrdd â hwy. Efallai y bydd y Pwyllgor Busnes, wrth eistedd fel pwyllgor ar weithdrefnau—gwelaf Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Busnes yn nodio—yn dymuno ystyried y mater ymhellach.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Mehefin 2004. (NDM2085)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Gorffennaf 2004 mewn perthynas â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r:*

*a) rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Mehefin 2004; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Gorffennaf 2004. (NDM2086)*

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Education (LEA Financial Schemes) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 7 July 2004. (NDM2087)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 13 July 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Education (LEA Financial Schemes) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

*2. approves that the Education (LEA Financial Schemes) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 7 July 2004; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 July 2004. (NDM2088)*

4.00 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2085 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Minister to establish an all-party group to examine the disparity of funding per pupil that exists between local authorities and explore the development of a common base-level funding.*

These regulations deal with the passing on of school budgets from local authorities to schools. When you talk to headteachers, the two topics that occur repeatedly are the difficulties of planning on a one-year cycle and the overall level of their budget. When the budget varies every year, it is difficult to plan for staffing and curriculum development. While there have been assurances that there would be a move to a three-year budget round, nothing to date has reached the schools. Therefore, Plaid Cymru

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor y Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Ariannol Awdurdodau Addysg Lleol) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Gorffennaf 2004. (NDM2087)*

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 13 Gorffennaf 2004, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Ariannol Awdurdodau Addysg Lleol) (Cymru) 2004; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Addysg (Cynlluniau Ariannol Awdurdodau Addysg Lleol) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Gorffennaf 2004; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Gorffennaf 2004. (NDM2088)*

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2085 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog i sefydlu grŵp trawsbleidiol i edrych ar y gwahaniaethau yn yr arian ar gyfer pob disgybl sy'n bodoli rhwng awdurdodau ac archwilio datblygu dull ariannu lefel sylfaen gyffredin.*

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo cyllidebau ysgol o awdurdodau lleol i ysgolion. Wrth siarad â phenaethiaid ysgol, y ddau bwnc sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro yw'r anawsterau a geir wrth gynllunio yn ôl cylch un flwyddyn a lefel gyffredinol eu cyllideb. Pan fo'r gyllideb yn amrywio bob blwyddyn, anodd yw cynllunio ar gyfer staffio a datblygu'r cwricwlwm. Er y rhoddwyd sicrwydd y byddid yn symud at gylch cyllideb tair blynedd, nid oes dim wedi cyrraedd yr ysgolion hyd yma. Felly, bydd

will support the Liberal Democrat amendment to try to ease that problem.

The other issue that is always raised is the budgets that schools receive. While there have been increases in the amount of money going into schools, there are still problems facing many schools. Heads can contribute to school budget fora, and a number say that they can make little headway in these fora against the officers because they have to agree to the budgets, and it is difficult to argue against the officers when they know what is happening in their schools but officers tell them something different. Budgets have been compared with those in England, and the Minister has produced figures to show that schools in Wales are equal to, if not ahead of, schools in England. However, when you talk to some heads, they find that comparison hard to accept, and if they do accept it, they then look for comparisons within Wales—and here there is a great deal of difference. Figures for 2002-03 show a gap of nearly £800 per pupil, which begs the question of whether a child in Flintshire is worth £800 less to educate than a child in Ceredigion. I was interested to hear Carl Sargeant's comments earlier and, going on those remarks, I am counting on his support for the amendment.

Some of the contrasts are startling. Average funding, from nearly £4,000 in Ceredigion to just over £3,000 in the vale of Glamorgan, shows an alarming difference. There will always be different costs for transport, for language and, most importantly, for small schools, and it would never be possible to create a completely level playing field, as the attempts by ELWa to create a common funding formula for sixth forms has proved. However, an average difference of nearly a £1,000 per head must be looked at. If Neath Port Talbot can be within £300 of the Ceredigion level on its average delegated budget, why is there a difference of £800 between Flintshire and Ceredigion? Does it really cost £500 more to educate a child in Neath Port Talbot than it does to educate a child in Flintshire? When this subject has

Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i geisio lleddfu'r broblem honno.

Y mater arall a godir bob tro yw'r cyllidebau y mae ysgolion yn eu cael. Er bod swm yr arian a aiff at ysgolion wedi cynyddu, mae llawer o ysgolion yn dal i wynebu problemau. Gall penaethiaid ysgol gyfrannu i fforymau cyllideb ysgolion, a dywed nifer ohonynt mai ychydig o gynnydd y gallant ei wneud yn y fforymau hyn yn erbyn y swyddogion gan fod rhaid iddynt gytuno ar y cyllidebau, ac anodd yw dadlau yn erbyn y swyddogion a hwythau'n gwybod beth sy'n digwydd yn eu hysgolion ond bod swyddogion yn dweud rhywbeth gwahanol wrthynt. Mae cyllidebau wedi'u cymharu â'r rhai yn Lloegr, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi dangos ffigurau i ddangos bod ysgolion yng Nghymru'n gwneud cystal â'r rhai yn Lloegr, os nad yn well. Fodd bynnag, wrth siarad â rhai penaethiaid ysgol, clywir eu bod yn ei chael yn anodd derbyn y gymhariaeth honno, ac os nad ydynt yn ei derbyn, chwiliant am gymariaethau oddi mewn i Gymru—ac yma ceir llawer iawn o wahaniaeth. Mae ffigurau ar gyfer 2002-03 yn dangos bod bwlch o ymron i £800 y disgybl, ac mae hynny'n peri i rywun ofyn a yw plentyn yn sir y Fflint yn werth £800 yn llai i'w addysgu na phlentyn yng Ngheredigion. Yr oedd o ddi-ddordeb imi glywed sylwadau Carl Sargeant yn gynharach ac, ar sail yr hyn a ddywedodd, yr wyf yn disgwyl iddo gefnogi'r gwelliant.

Mae rhai o'r gwrthgyferbyniadau'n syfrdanol. Gwelir gwahaniaeth arswydus yn y cyllido cyfartalog, o bron £4,000 yng Ngheredigion i ychydig dros £3,000 ym Mro Morgannwg. Bydd costau gwahanol bob amser ar gyfer trafndiaeth, iaith, ac, yn bwysicaf oll, ar gyfer ysgolion bach, ac ni fyddai byth yn bosibl creu sefyllfa gwbl gyfartal, fel y mae'r ymdrechion gan ELWa i greu fformiwla gyllido gyffredin ar gyfer cyfleusterau chweched dosbarth wedi profi. Er hynny, mae gwahaniaeth cyfartalog o bron £1,000 y pen yn mynnu sylw. Os gall Castell-nedd Port Talbot fod yn agosach na £300 i lefel Ceredigion yn ei gyllideb ddirprwyedig gyfartalog, pam y ceir gwahaniaeth o £800 rhwng sir y Fflint a Cheredigion? A yw'n costio £500 yn fwy i addysgu plentyn yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot nag ydyw i

been raised in past debates, it has been said that it is an area for local determination, which it still is. However, this Assembly is uniquely placed to examine the pan-Wales situation, and it is time that it did so.

There will never be a completely level playing field, and there will always be differences—and quite rightly so—to take into account not only specific regional needs but also the differing needs of small schools and so on. The argument that these differences have existed because of historical reasons, which is the explanation often given, is no longer tenable. We are nearly 10 years on from local government re-organisation, and nothing seems to be happening to narrow those gaps. That is why I believe that Carl will support the amendment, given his comments, because the present situation is simply not fair to parents, pupils or staff. They achieve remarkable results in Welsh schools: how much more could they achieve if they were funded fairly? To achieve any change, careful consideration must be given to the facts, and a consensus be built behind that change. Therefore, Plaid Cymru asks the Minister to establish a cross-party group outside the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee to look at the situation and outline a way forward. Perhaps a group can be established along the lines of the all-party group on smoking in public places. Something must be done, because the present situation is no longer acceptable.

**Peter Black:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM2086 in my name and the names of Michael German and Kirsty Williams. I propose that

*the Assembly resolves to adopt the following amendment to the draft the Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 29 June 2004:*

**Regulation 5 (2)** delete the words from 'redeterminations' onwards and replace with:

i) redeterminations,

addysgu plentyn yn sir y Fflint? Pan godwyd y mater hwn mewn dadleuon blaenorol, dywedwyd mai maes i'w benderfynu'n lleol ydyw, ac felly y mae o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cynulliad hwn mewn sefyllfa unigryw i ystyried y sefyllfa ledled Cymru, ac mae'n bryd inni wneud hynny.

Ni cheir byth sefyllfa gwbl gyfartal, a cheir gwahaniaethau bob amser—a hynny'n gwbl briodol—i ddiwallu anghenion rhanbarthol penodol a hefyd gwahanol anghenion ysgolion bach ac yn y blaen. Nid yw'r ddadl bod rhesymau hanesyddol dros y gwahaniaethau hyn, sef yr eglurhad a roddir yn aml, yn dal dŵr bellach. Aeth ymron i 10 mlynedd heibio ers ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol, ac nid yw'n ymddangos bod dim yn digwydd i gau'r bylchau hynny. Dyna pam y credaf y bydd Carl yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, yng ngolwg ei sylwadau, gan nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn deg â rhieni, disgyblion neu staff. Maent yn sicrhau canlyniadau rhyfeddol yn ysgolion Cymru: pa faint yn fwy y gallent ei gyflawni o gael eu cyllido'n deg? Er mwyn sicrhau unrhyw newid, rhaid ystyried y ffeithiau'n ofalus, a rhaid meithrin consensws o blaid y newid hwnnw. Gan hynny, mae Plaid Cymru yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog sefydlu grŵp trawsbleidiol y tu allan i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i ystyried y sefyllfa a nodi ffordd ymlaen. Efallai y gellir sefydlu grŵp tebyg i'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus. Rhaid gwneud rhywbeth, gan nad yw'r sefyllfa bresennol yn dderbyniol bellach.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM2086 yn fy enw i ac enwau Michael German a Kirsty Williams. Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad yn penderfynu mabwysiadu'r gwelliant canlynol i'r rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 29 Mehefin 2004:*

**Rheoliad 5 (2)** dileu'r holl eiriau o 'ailbenderfyniadau' ymlaen a rhoi yn eu lle:

i) ailbenderfyniadau,

ii) the correction of errors, or

iii) an additional payment to schools whose number of registered pupils has risen in the year in which shares are allocated for by more than a percentage or number designated by the local education authority but such amount must be used for that purpose or distributed to schools before the end of that financial year;

**Regulation 8 (1)** Delete all the words and replace with:

*In determining budget shares for primary and secondary schools and nursery schools, a local education authority must base their formula on either*

i) the mean number of registered pupils at or projected to be at those schools over the three year period of the year for which the budget shares are being calculated, the preceding and succeeding years or

ii) the mean number of registered pupils at or projected to be those schools for the year for which the budget shares are being allocated, weighted if the authority consider it appropriate in accordance with paragraph (8).

**Regulation 8 (3)** Delete.

**Regulation 8 (4)** Delete.

**Regulation 8 (5)** Delete.

**Regulation 8 (7)** Delete all the words and replace with:

*An authority shall consult with the headteachers of schools prior to, for the purposes of paragraph (8)(1), estimating the number of registered pupils at a school over the year for which the budget shares are made and the succeeding years.*

**Regulation 16 (1)** Delete.

**Regulation 16 (2)** Delete.

ii) cywiro gwallau, neu

iii) taliad ychwanegol i ysgolion y mae eu nifer o ddisgyblion cofrestredig wedi cynyddu yn ystod y flwyddyn y caiff cyfrannau eu dyrannu ar ei chyfer, o fwy na chanran neu nifer a bennwyd gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol, ond rhaid i'r swm hwnnw gael ei ddefnyddio at y diben hwnnw neu gael ei ddosbarthu i ysgolion cyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol honno;

**Rheoliad 8 (1)** Dileu'r holl eiriau a rhoi yn eu lle:

*Wrth benderfynu ar gyfrannau cyllideb ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd ac ysgolion meithrin, rhaid i awdurdod addysg lleol seilio ei fformiwla ar naill ai*

i) nifer cymedrig y disgyblion cofrestredig sydd yn yr ysgolion hynny neu a ragwelir fydd yn yr ysgolion hynny dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, sef y flwyddyn y caiff y cyfrannau cyllideb eu cyfrifo ar ei chyfer, y flwyddyn flaenorol a'r flwyddyn ganlynol; neu

ii) nifer cymedrig y disgyblion cofrestredig sydd yn yr ysgolion hynny neu a ragwelir fydd yn yr ysgolion hynny ar gyfer y flwyddyn y caiff y cyfrannau cyllideb eu dyrannu ar ei chyfer, wedi'i phwysoli, os bydd yr awdurdod yn ystyried bod hynny'n briodol, yn unol â pharagraff (8).

**Rheoliad 8 (3)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 8 (4)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 8 (5)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 8 (7)** Dileu'r holl eiriau a rhoi yn eu lle:

*Rhaid i awdurdod ymgynghori â phenaethiaid ysgolion ac, at ddibenion paragraff (8) (1), rhaid gwneud hynny cyn amcangyfrif nifer y disgyblion cofrestredig mewn ysgol yn ystod y flwyddyn y caiff y cyfrannau cyllideb eu dyrannu ar ei chyfer a'r blynyddoedd canlynol.*

**Rheoliad 16 (1)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 16 (2)** Dileu.

**Regulation 16 (3)** Delete all the words after 'partly' and insert:

*any reduction or increase in the school's budget share for the preceding financial year arising from the permanent exclusion of a pupil from the school or the admission to the school of a pupil permanently excluded from another maintained school.*

**Regulation 16 (4)** Delete.

**Regulation 18 (1)** Delete.

**Regulation 18 (2)** Delete.

We support the general principle of these regulations. The amendments being proposed by the Minister to the way in which LEAs are allowed to decide their school funding formula will bring improvements and will give local education authorities a great deal more flexibility. However, we believe that a more radical approach to school funding may be needed to provide the level of stability for which schools have been clamouring since the Assembly was founded, and before that. As Janet Ryder pointed out, there are significant differences in terms of funding per pupil between local authority areas, and schools face major problems when pupil numbers fluctuate and their budgets fluctuate accordingly. As a consequence, teachers have been made redundant and schools have struggled to make ends meet and to balance their budgets. Some local authorities have been forced to respond to that by allowing schools to go into deficit in a financial year and to carry that deficit over to future financial years. I am not pretending that this amendment will provide all the answers to that, but I believe that it will make a significant improvement in terms of giving headteachers some stability and an ability to plan ahead much more comprehensively and coherently than they can at present.

The amendments to these routines will allow local education authorities to base their school funding on a rolling three-year average of pupil numbers rather than on pupil

**Rheoliad 16 (3)** Dileu'r holl eiriau ar ôl 'rhannol' a rhoi yn eu lle:

*unrhyw ostyngiad neu gynnydd yng nghyfran cyllideb yr ysgol am y flwyddyn ariannol flaenorol sy'n deillio o wahardd disgybl yn barhaol o'r ysgol neu dderbyn i'r ysgol ddisgybl a waharddwyd yn barhaol o ysgol arall a gynhelir*

**Rheoliad 16 (4)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 18 (1)** Dileu.

**Rheoliad 18 (2)** Dileu.

Yr ydym o blaid egwyddor gyffredinol y rheoliadau hyn. Bydd y newidiadau a gynigir gan y Gweinidog i'r modd y caniateir i AALLau benderfynu ar eu fformiwla cyllido ysgolion yn peri gwelliannau ac yn rhoi llawer mwy o hyblygrwydd i awdurdodau addysg lleol. Er hynny, credwn y gallai fod angen ymdrin yn fwy radical â'r dull o gyllido ysgolion er mwyn cynnig y graddau o sefydlogrwydd y mae ysgolion yn galw amdanynt ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, a chyn hynny. Fel y nododd Janet Ryder, mae gwahaniaethau sylweddol o ran y cyllido y pen ar gyfer disgyblion cyd-rhwng ardaloedd awdurdod lleol, ac mae ysgolion yn wynebu problemau mawr pan yw nifer y disgyblion yn codi a gostwng a'u cyllideb yn codi ac yn gostwng yn unol â hynny. O ganlyniad i hynny, mae athrawon wedi'u diswyddo ac mae ysgolion wedi'i chael yn anodd cael deupen llinyn ynghyd a mantoli eu cyllideb. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi gorfod ymateb i hynny drwy adael i ysgolion fynd i ddyled mewn blwyddyn ariannol a chario'r diffyg drosodd i flynyddoedd ariannol dilynol. Nid wyf yn cymryd arnaf y bydd y gwelliant hwn yn cynnig yr holl atebion i hynny, ond credaf y bydd yn peri cryn welliant o ran rhoi rhywfaint o sefydlogrwydd i benaethiaid ysgol a'r gallu i gynllunio ymlaen yn llawer mwy cynhwysfawr a chydlynol nag y gallant ar hyn o bryd.

Bydd y newidiadau i'r rheolweithiau hyn yn caniatáu i awdurdodau addysg lleol seilio eu cyllid i ysgolion ar nifer cyfartalog y disgyblion dros gyfnod treiglol o dair

numbers for just one year. That will still provide the same funding for the same schools, but it will even out the peaks and troughs and make school budgets more stable and more predictable. My colleague Mick Bates, who may wish to contribute later on, initiated a short debate on school funding on 26 May, and much of his speech discussed the merits of three-year funding and how reducing uncertainty and instability in school budgets would improve school morale and results. In responding to that debate, the Minister agreed that three-year budgets would be beneficial for schools and pointed out how long her commitment to that cause had been. We would like to see three-year budgets being introduced so that, each year, a school would be told, not its budget for that year, but its budget for three years. That third-year budget would be rolled forward, becoming the year 2 budget and then the budget for the existing year, and so on. That way, proper long-term planning could take place. Sadly, this amendment is not about that, but it goes some way towards it within the confines of these regulations by introducing greater stability to school funding in Wales. It is not the system that we would like, but it is as close to it as we can get at present.

The amendment allows, but does not compel, councils to base their funding on a three-year average of pupil numbers rather than simply on one year of pupil numbers, as happens at present. The same sum of funding will go to the same number of schools. The change will not be biased towards schools of a certain size or of a certain type; it will simply smooth out, as I said, the troughs and peaks of school funding so that, regardless of whether school numbers, and thus funding, increase, decrease or stay much the same, school budgets will change more gradually and more predictably and will thus be more manageable. In any one year, some schools will gain from this and others will lose from it; if that did not change, there would be no purpose in seeking to amend these regulations. However, as most schools do not

blynedd yn hytrach nag ar nifer y disgyblion mewn un flwyddyn yn unig. Bydd hynny'n dal i roi'r un cyllid ar gyfer yr un ysgolion, ond bydd yn gwastatáu'r brigau a'r pantiau ac yn peri i gyllidebau ysgol fod yn fwy sefydlog a rhagweladwy. Gwnaeth fy nghyd-Aelod Mick Bates, a fydd efallai'n dymuno cyfrannu'n ddiweddarach, gyflwyno dadl fer ar gyllido ysgolion ar 26 Mai, ac yr oedd llawer o'i araith yn ymdrin â rhinweddau cyllido dros dair blynedd a'r modd y byddai lleihau ansicrwydd ac ansefydlogrwydd mewn cyllidebau ysgol yn rhoi hwb i'r galon mewn ysgolion ac yn gwella canlyniadau. Wrth ymateb i'r ddadl honno, cytunodd y Gweinidog y byddai cyllidebau tair blynedd yn llesol i ysgolion a nododd mor hir yr oedd ei hymrwymiad i'r achos hwnnw. Carem weld cyflwyno cyllidebau tair blynedd fel y dywedid wrth ysgol, bob blwyddyn, beth fyddai ei chyllideb ar gyfer tair blynedd, yn hytrach nag am flwyddyn. Byddai cyllideb y drydedd flwyddyn yn cael ei threiglo ymlaen, gan ddod yn gyllideb blwyddyn 2 ac wedyn yn gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyfredol, ac yn y blaen. Drwy wneud hynny, gellid cynllunio'n iawn ar gyfer y tymor hir. Gwaetha'r modd, nid yw'r gwelliant hwn yn ymwneud â hynny, ond mae'n cymryd ychydig gamau tuag ato o fewn cyfyngiadau'r rheoliadau hyn drwy gyflwyno mwy o sefydlogrwydd mewn cyllido i ysgolion yng Nghymru. Nid hon yw'r system y carem ei gweld, ond mae cyn agosed ati ag y gallwn fynd ar hyn o bryd.

Mae'r gwelliant yn caniatáu i gynghorau seilio eu cyllido ar nifer cyfartalog y disgyblion dros dair blynedd yn hytrach na nifer y disgyblion mewn un flwyddyn, fel a ddigwydd ar hyn o bryd, ond nid yw'n eu gorfodi i wneud hynny. Aiff yr un swm o gyllid at yr un nifer o ysgolion. Ni fydd y newid yn ffafrio ysgolion o faint penodol neu o fath penodol; ni fydd ond yn gwastatáu'r brigau a'r pantiau mewn cyllid i ysgolion, fel y dywedais, felly, ni waeth a fydd y niferoedd mewn ysgol, ac felly'r cyllid, yn cynyddu, yn gostwng neu'n aros yn eithaf tebyg, bydd cyllidebau ysgol yn newid yn fwy graddol ac yn fwy rhagweladwy a byddant felly'n haws eu rheoli. Mewn unrhyw flwyddyn, bydd rhai ysgolion ar eu hennill o'i herwydd ac eraill ar eu colled; pe na fyddai hynny'n newid, ni fyddai diben ceisio newid y rheoliadau hyn.



have a continually increasing or decreasing school population but simply see their pupil numbers bob around an average, the gain from one year will be cancelled out by the loss from the next, and vice versa. Therefore, I hope that the Minister will take this amendment on the basis on which it is proposed and that she will give it proper consideration and possibly support it.

We are happy to support the Plaid Cymru amendment 1 to NDM2085. It does not remove discretion from LEAs; it merely seeks to explore the reasons for the disparity in school funding across LEAs. As such, we believe that it can be supported and that it may provide data on why some schools are better funded than others.

4.10 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** I support these regulations. We hear much in the Assembly about the plight of small rural schools, their declining rolls and so forth, but this issue is not confined to rural parts of Wales; it is common in the most socially and economically deprived parts of our country. Many of these communities face an incessant drain in their population. Not only do they face the challenges of a declining population, but many of them face a disproportionate level of educational disadvantage, which compounds their problems. In this context, I was pleased to hear Janet Ryder's comments on Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and its spending record. That spending record is in a long Labour tradition in the Neath Port Talbot area of recognising educational disadvantage and putting the investment in place to tackle it. That investment shows year in, year out in the exam results of Port Talbot's schoolchildren. It should put the lie to the myth that is continually peddled in the Assembly, particularly by the Tories, that high-spending Labour authorities are not delivering. Neath Port Talbot is a high-spending authority that is delivering for our children.

Fodd bynnag, gan nad yw niferoedd y disgyblion yn y rhan fwyaf o ysgolion yn codi ac yn gostwng o hyd, ond yn hytrach yn siglo i fyny ac i lawr oddeutu'r cyfartaledd, bydd yr hyn a enillir mewn un flwyddyn yn cael ei ddileu gan y golled yn y nesaf, ac fel arall. Gan hynny, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd y gwelliant hwn ar y sail y'i cynigir ac y bydd yn ei ystyried yn iawn ac efallai'n ei gefnogi.

Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi gwelliant 1 Plaid Cymru i NDM2085. Nid yw'n tynnu disgresiwn oddi wrth AALlau; nid yw ond yn ceisio ymchwilio i'r rhesymau dros y gwahaniaeth rhwng y cyllido i ysgolion yn yr AALlau. Oherwydd hynny, credwn y gellir ei gefnogi ac y gallai gynnig data ar y rheswm y mae rhai ysgolion yn cael eu cyllido'n well nag eraill.

**Brian Gibbons:** Cefnogaf y rheoliadau hyn. Clywn lawer yn y Cynulliad am drafferthion ysgolion gwledig bach, y gostyngiad yn nifer eu disgyblion ac yn y blaen, ond nid yw'r mater hwn yn gyfyngedig i rannau gwledig Cymru; mae'n gyffredin yn y rhannau o'n gwlad sy'n fwyaf difreintiedig yn gymdeithasol ac yn economaidd. Mae llawer o'r cymunedau hyn yn gweld gostyngiad dibaid ym maint eu poblogaeth. Yn ogystal â wynebu'r heriau a geir yn sgîl y gostyngiad yn eu poblogaeth, mae llawer ohonynt yn wynebu anfantais addysgol sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd, ac mae hynny'n dwysáu eu problemau. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed sylwadau Janet Ryder am Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot a'i record gwario. Mae'r record gwario honno yn rhan o draddodiad Llafur hir yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot o gydnabod anfantais addysgol a buddsoddi i fynd i'r afael â hi. Gwelir canlyniad y buddsoddi hwnnw flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn yng nghanlyniadau arholiad plant ysgol Port Talbot. Dylai hynny ladd y stori a adroddir yn barhaus yn y Cynulliad, yn enwedig gan y Toriaid, nad yw awdurdodau Llafur uchel eu gwariant yn mynd â'r maen i'r wal. Mae Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn awdurdod sydd â gwariant uchel sy'n mynd â'r maen i'r wal er mwyn ein plant.

However, council tax payers must pay for that in the end. They will, hopefully, want to take part in the Assembly's social justice commitment to address that anomaly. Many of Wales's smaller schools exist on a narrow and precarious funding base.

**Mick Bates:** I understand what you are saying, Brian. However, to return to the amendment, which aims to bring more stability, with three years to budget, there is not a full regulatory appraisal because this is cost neutral. Therefore, while your points are valid, they do not refer directly to the rationale behind this amendment, which will bring greater stability, no matter where the school is located.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am coming to that. Many of the schools in the most deprived communities in Wales are in a precarious financial situation because of their small populations and because small changes in pupil numbers can have a significantly deleterious effect on their viability. The standing charges to run these schools do not change, but the level of funding that is available to the schools can vary quite dramatically from year to year. Therefore, we need to move to a situation whereby the funding of schools is less dependent on the number of pupils in those schools, and take greater recognition of the need to maintain the standing charges of those schools. Equally, the funding formula needs to recognise the educational disadvantage in these areas, and I am pleased to see the reference to deprivation in the allocation formula before us.

I sympathise with the point of view expressed in the Liberal Democrats' amendment, because there is a real risk of a shock effect from a small change in numbers in small schools. However, having spoken to the Minister about this, I am acutely aware that she is au fait with this concern and is taking it on board. I am sure that she will address this issue in her reply to this debate. This is an important change. Schools in the most deprived parts of Wales will be less dependent on student numbers for funding, and will move towards a more predictable

Fodd bynnag, rhaid i dalwyr y dreth gyngor dalu am hynny yn y diwedd. Gobeithir y byddant am fod â rhan yn ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol er mwyn ymdrin â'r anghysondeb hwnnw. Mae llawer o'r ysgolion llai yng Nghymru'n dibynnu ar sylfaen gyllid gyfyng ac ansicr.

**Mick Bates:** Yr wyf yn deall beth yr ydych yn ei ddweud, Brian. Fodd bynnag, gan droi'n ôl at y gwelliant, sy'n ceisio dod â mwy o sefydlogrwydd, drwy gyllidebu dros dair blynedd, nid oes gwerthusiad rheoliadol llawn am fod hyn yn niwtral o ran costau. Felly, er bod y pwyntiau a wnaethoch yn ddilys, nid ydynt yn cyfeirio'n uniongyrchol at sail resymegol y ddadl hon, a ddaw â mwy o sefydlogrwydd, ni waeth ym mhle y mae'r ysgol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn dod at hynny. Ceir sefyllfa ariannol ansicr yn llawer o'r ysgolion yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru oherwydd eu poblogaethau bach ac oherwydd y gall newidiadau bach yn niferoedd y disgyblion amharu'n ddirfawr ar eu dichonoldeb. Nid yw'r taliadau sefydlog ar gyfer rhedeg yr ysgolion hynny'n newid, ond gall lefel y cyllid a gaiff ysgolion amrywio'n eithaf trawiadol o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall. Gan hynny, rhaid inni gymryd camau fel y bydd y cyllido ar gyfer ysgolion yn llai dibynnol ar nifer y disgyblion yn yr ysgolion hyn, a rhoi mwy o gydnabyddiaeth i'r angen i gynnal taliadau sefydlog yr ysgolion hynny. Yn yr un modd, rhaid i'r fformiwla gyllido gydnabod yr anfantais addysgol yn yr ardaloedd hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch o weld y cyfeiriad at amddifadedd yn y fformiwla ddyrannu sydd ger ein bron.

Cydymdeimlaf â'r safbwynt a fynegir yng ngwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfodol, gan fod gwir berygl o gael ergyd drom yn sgîl newid bach yn y niferoedd mewn ysgolion bach. Fodd bynnag, a minnau wedi siarad â'r Gweinidog am hyn, yr wyf yn dra ymwybodol ei bod yn gyfarwydd â'r pryder hwn a'i bod yn ei ystyried. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn ei hymateb i'r ddadl hon. Mae hyn yn newid pwysig. Bydd ysgolion yn y rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Gymru'n llai dibynnol am eu cyllid ar nifer y myfyrwyr, a byddant yn

and stable funding stream. This will also provide the funds necessary to meet the educational needs of pupils in our most educationally disadvantaged areas.

**Mark Isherwood:** The Conservatives will support the Plaid Cymru amendment. We will abstain on the Liberal Democrat amendment, although we retain our commitment to three-year funding. In the dead language of state bureaucracy, we are told that these regulations relate to the factors that authorities must include in their formula for delegating funding to schools, when the reality is that this is about top-slicing further an education budget that has already been top-sliced and top-sliced again. The introduction of the requirement that local education authorities should distribute funding provided by ELWa for post-16 pupils in accordance with any conditions applied by ELWa must be viewed against the initial proposed allocation under the national planning and funding system, which would see a 4 per cent cut in post-16 LEA budgets across north Wales. The provision for schemes to set out restrictions on governing body powers to provide community facilities is a concern. Governing bodies should be given more powers to act independently in the interests of their schools and communities. The complete lack of an evidence base for these regulations is exposed by the following statement in the regulatory appraisal:

‘There may be some additional administrative work for LEAs when they reconfigure their budgets but this is not likely to be significant.’

How do we know that that will be the case? Where is the research and the analysis? It seems that this is to be yet another non-funded, ideological burden to be passed on to local authorities and the hard-pressed council tax payer.

Under the Welsh Assembly Government, revenue support grant is distributed to local authorities on the basis of a flawed and discriminatory funding formula that already

symud tuag at ffrwd cyllido mwy rhagweladwy a sefydlog. Bydd hyn hefyd yn darparu'r cyllid sydd ei angen i ddiwallu anghenion addysgol disgyblion yn yr ardaloedd sydd o dan yr anfantais addysgol fwyaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Byddwn yn ymatal ar welliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er ein bod yn parhau â'n hymrwymiad i gyllido dros dair blynedd. Yng ngeiriau dideimlad biwrocratiaeth wladol, dywedir wrthym fod y rheoliadau hyn yn ymwneud â'r ffactorau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau eu cynnwys yn eu fformiwla ar gyfer dirprwyo cyllid i ysgolion, ond y gwir yw bod hyn yn ymwneud â brig-dorri pellach ar gyllideb addysg sydd wedi'i brig-dorri dro ar ôl tro eisoes. Rhaid ystyried y bwriad i gyflwyno'r gofyniad i awdurdodau addysg lleol ddosbarthu cyllid a ddarparwyd gan ELWa ar gyfer disgyblion ôl-16 yn unol ag unrhyw amodau a osodir gan ELWa yng ngoleuni'r dyraniad arfaethedig gwreiddiol o dan y system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol, a barai doriad o 4 y cant yng nghyllidebau ôl-16 awdurdodau addysg ledled y Gogledd. Mae'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer cynlluniau i gyfyngu ar bwerau cyrff llywodraethu i ddarparu cyfleusterau cymunedol yn destun pryder. Dylid rhoi mwy o bwerau i gyrrff llywodraethu gael gweithredu'n annibynnol er budd eu hysgolion a'u cymunedau. Amlygir y ffaith nad oes unrhyw sylfaen dystiolaeth i'r rheoliadau hyn yn y datganiad a ganlyn yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol:

Efallai y bydd rhywfaint o waith gweinyddol ychwanegol i AALLau wrth iddynt ad-drefnu eu cyllidebau ond nid yw'n debygol o fod yn sylweddol.

Sut y gwyddom mai felly y bydd? Ym mhle y mae'r ymchwil a'r dadansoddiad? Ymddengys mai un baich ideolegol arall yw hwn, sydd heb ei gyllido, a gaiff ei drosglwyddo i awdurdodau lleol ac i dalwyr y dreth gyngor sydd o dan bwysau.

O dan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, dosbarthir y grant cynnal refeniw i awdurdodau lleol ar sail fformiwla gyllido ddiffygiol a gwahaniaethol sydd eisoes yn

fails to meet the actual cost of providing public services across Wales. This produces a system based on a postcode lottery: it funds schoolchildren on the basis of where they live rather than on the basis of what they need. Even the Labour MP for Wrexham, Ian Lucas, has written to Sue Essex questioning the low level of Welsh Assembly Government funding for his local authority, complaining that the Government does not pass on sufficient funds for education to Wrexham County Borough Council. I call on Flintshire's Labour MPs and Assembly Members to join their Wrexham colleague in the interests of their constituents. Where is the logic in this Welsh Assembly Government not telling local authorities how much of its revenue support grant must be spent on education or how much of its education budget must be spent on schools rather than in County Hall, and then dictating the maximum proportion of an incalculable school budget that must be based on so-called pupil-led factors and introducing a requirement for local education authorities to include in the formula a factor that reflects the incidence of social deprivation?

**Peter Black:** Given that the amendment is not about the amount of money going to schools but about how it is distributed and given your concerns regarding schools suffering as a result of pupil-led formulas, why are you abstaining on the amendment? We are seeking to achieve greater stability for schools, which I imagine would be one of your objectives, given your comments.

**Mark Isherwood:** Given the sheer complexity of the situation, we feel that those issues could be addressed by the Plaid Cymru amendment and a properly constituted cross-party body.

If a school in one county in Wales that has £900 more per pupil in its budget than a school in another county in Wales still cannot tackle the causes and educational consequences of social deprivation, how will throwing more money at it solve the problem? If a school in one county in Wales with £900 less per pupil in its budget than a school in another county in Wales is already

methu â thalu'r wir gost o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Mae hyn yn creu system sy'n seiliedig ar loteri codau post: mae'n cyllido plant ysgol yn ôl lle y maent yn byw yn hytrach nag ar sail eu hanghenion. Mae hyd yn oed yr AS Llafur dros Wrecsam, Ian Lucas, wedi ysgrifennu at Sue Essex gan holi ynghylch lefel isel y cyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'w awdurdod lleol, gan gwyno nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn trosglwyddo symiau digonol ar gyfer addysg i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam. Galwaf ar ASau ac Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur sir y Fflint i ymuno â'u cyd-aelod yn Wrecsam er budd eu hetholwyr. Pa ddiben sydd i'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hon beidio â dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol pa faint o'u grant cynnal refeniw y mae'n rhaid ei wario ar addysg neu ba faint o'u cyllideb addysg y mae'n rhaid ei wario ar ysgolion yn hytrach nag yn Neuadd y Sir, ac wedyn pennu'r gyfran fwyaf o gyllideb ysgol anghyfrifadwy y mae'n rhaid ei seilio ar ffactorau sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblion, fel y'u gelwir, a chyflwyno gofyniad i awdurdodau addysg lleol gynnwys ffactor yn y fformiwla sy'n adlewyrchu amllder amddifadedd cymdeithasol?

**Peter Black:** Gan nad yw'r gwelliant yn ymwneud â'r swm o arian a aiff i ysgolion ond yn hytrach â'r modd y'i dosbarthir, ac yng ngolwg eich pryderon ynghylch ysgolion sy'n dioddef o ganlyniad i fformiwla'u sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblion, pam yr ydych yn ymatal ar y gwelliant? Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau mwy o sefydlogrwydd i ysgolion, a thybiwn y byddai hynny'n un o'ch amcanion, yng ngolwg y sylwadau a wnaethoch.

**Mark Isherwood:** Oherwydd cymhlethdod y sefyllfa, teimlwn y gellid ymdrin â'r materion hynny drwy welliant Plaid Cymru a chorff trawsbleidiol a gyfansoddwyd yn briodol.

Os oes ysgol mewn un sir yng Nghymru sydd â £900 yn fwy y disgybl yn ei chyllideb nag sydd gan ysgol mewn sir arall yng Nghymru, a'r ysgol honno, er hynny, yn methu â mynd i'r afael ag achosion a chanlyniadau addysgol amddifadedd cymdeithasol, sut y bydd taflu mwy o arian ati'n fodd i ddatrys y broblem? Os oes ysgol mewn un sir yng Nghymru sydd â £900 yn llai y disgybl nag ysgol mewn sir

struggling to fund the basic costs of meeting the educational needs of its pupils, how can further cuts be just or sustainable? As Jane Davidson has stated, there is no causal link between school performance and the amount of money that local authorities spend. This comes from a Labour Party that derided any suggestions from the Conservative Party that public services cannot be improved by simply throwing money at them. A letter sent by a Flintshire school dated June 2004, of which I have received a copy, states that

‘the overall school budget has resulted in actual cuts having to be made again this year. We are already one of the lowest-funded secondary schools in Wales and England. The methodology for allocating monies for education is flawed.’

Schools such as this are facing death by 1,000 cuts. They have substandard buildings, cuts have been made in training and performance managements budgets, cuts have been forced on them by the under-funded teachers’ workload agreement and there are threats to post-16 budgets. The National Union of Teachers Cymru has revealed that a little more than a quarter of those trained in Wales to teach in primary schools have succeeded in securing contracts, and has highlighted the depressing prospect of school classes being taught by unqualified staff. In an e-mail sent to me, a teacher states that he feels

‘constantly undervalued by this idiotic government and more so now with their proposals concerning classroom assistants. I have been to university for 5 years and reject the fact that anyone who is not a qualified teacher is going to stand up in front of a class and undermine me by doing my job. Through no fault of my own I am still working as a supply teacher because I cannot secure a full time job at the moment due to the lack of vacancies in Wales but the classroom assistant will definitely do me out of a job.’

arall yng Nghymru, a’r ysgol honno eisoes yn ei chael yn anodd talu’r costau sylfaenol am ddiwallu anghenion addysgol ei disgyblion, sut y gellir cyfiawnhau neu ddygyddmod â thoriadau pellach? Fel y dywedodd Jane Davidson, nid oes cyswllt achosol rhwng perfformiad ysgol a’r swm o arian y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wario. Clywir hynny gan Blaid Lafur a wffiodd unrhyw awgrymiadau gan y Blaid Geidwadol na ellir gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy daflu arian atynt yn unig. Mae llythyr a anfonwyd gan ysgol yn sir y Fflint sy’n ddyddiedig Mehefin 2004, y cefais gopi ohono, yn datgan:

oherwydd maint cyllideb gyffredinol yr ysgol, bu’n rhaid gwneud toriadau eto eleni. Yr ydym eisoes ymhlith yr ysgolion uwchradd sy’n derbyn y lefel isaf o gyllid yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Mae’r fethodoleg ar gyfer dyrannu arian ar gyfer addysg yn ddiffygiol.

Mae ysgolion fel hon yn wynebu tranc araf a phoenus. Mae ganddynt adeiladau is-safonol, bu toriadau yn y cyllidebau hyfforddi a rheoli perfformiad, fe’u gorfodwyd i wneud toriadau o dan y cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith athrawon ac mae bygythiadau i gyllidebau ôl-16. Mae Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon Cymru wedi datgelu mai ychydig yn fwy na chwarter y rhai a hyfforddwyd yng Nghymru i ddysgu mewn ysgolion cynradd sydd wedi llwyddo i gael contractau, ac wedi tynnu sylw at y rhagolwg diflas o weld dosbarthiadau ysgol yn cael eu dysgu gan staff sydd heb gymwysterau. Mewn neges a anfonwyd ataf drwy’r e-bost, dywed athro ei fod yn teimlo ei fod

yn cael ei danbrizio o hyd gan y llywodraeth wirion hon ac yn fwy felly’n awr oherwydd ei chynigion ynghylch cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth. Bùm mewn prifysgol am bum mlynedd a gwrthodaf dderbyn y dylai unrhyw un nad yw’n athro cymwysedig gael sefyll o flaen dosbarth a’ m taseilio i wrth imi wneud fy ngwaith. Er nad oes bai arnaf fi am hynny, yr wyf yn dal i weithio fel athro llanw am na allaf sicrhau swydd amser llawn ar hyn o bryd oherwydd prinder y swyddi gwag yng Nghymru ond bydd y cynorthwy-ydd ystafell ddosbarth yn sicr o beri imi beidio â chael swydd.

The bottom line is that those local authorities that receive the least have the least to spend, and funding provided by central Government to local government should therefore reflect the actual cost of providing public services, and that alone. We cannot continue to top-slice council budgets on the basis of an unfair and damaging formula that ignores local needs. Issues relating to low income and deprivation should not be funded on the basis of geography and numbers of schoolchildren, but directly by central Government. It needs to be targeted, quantifiable, measurable and equitable.

4.20 p.m.

This Minister—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have allowed additional time for interventions, but you have now gone well over the five minutes allocated to speakers.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will try to focus on the motion and even to talk about it and the amendments. I wish to clarify my position for Janet Ryder as the regional Member. The motion relates to how the funding formula is delivered, not how funding is given. That is what we should concentrate upon.

**Mick Bates:** Do you agree with your Prime Minister, Tony Blair, that it is essential to introduce three-year funding, which he has committed to introducing in England?

**Carl Sargeant:** Jane Davidson runs the education system in Wales, and I fully endorse the actions of our Minister.

As I said, this is about how the funding formula is delivered, not about how funding is given. Like Neath Port Talbot, Flintshire features high in the funding issue: the county has one of the highest levels of support from the education budget. I have raised education funding with Sue Essex and Jane Davidson, and, along with my colleague, Sandy Mewies, we consult continuously on the subject. We should be focusing on the substance of this motion, not trying to make political points about other issues.

Yn y diwedd, yr awdurdodau lleol hynny sy'n cael y lleiaf sydd â'r lleiaf i'w wario, ac felly dylai'r cyllid y mae Llywodraeth ganolog yn ei roi i lywodraeth leol adlewyrchu'r wir gost o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a hynny'n unig. Ni allwn barhau i frig-dorri cyllidebau cyngor ar sail fformiwla annheg a niweidiol sy'n anwybyddu anghenion lleol. Ni ddylai materion sy'n ymwneud ag incwm isel ac amddifadedd gael eu cyllido ar sail daearyddiaeth a nifer y plant ysgol, ond yn uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth ganolog. Rhaid ei dargedu, a rhaid iddo fod yn fesuradwy ac yn deg.

Mae'r Gweinidog hwn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi caniatáu amser ychwanegol am ymyriadau, ond yr ydych bellach wedi mynd ymhell dros y pum munud a neulltuir i siaradwyr.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ceisiaf ganolbwyntio ar y cynnig a sôn amdano ef a'r gwelliannau hyd yn oed. Dymunaf egluro fy safbwynt i Janet Ryder fel yr Aelod rhanbarthol. Mae'r cynnig yn ymwneud â'r dull o weithredu'r fformiwla gyllido, nid y dull o gyllido. Ar hynny y dylem ganolbwyntio.

**Mick Bates:** A ydych yn cytuno â'r Prif Weinidog, Tony Blair, ei bod yn hollbwysig cyflwyno cyllido dros dair blynedd, fel y mae wedi ymrwymo i'w wneud yn Lloegr?

**Carl Sargeant:** Jane Davidson sy'n rhedeg y system addysg yng Nghymru, a llwyr gymeradwyaf weithredoedd ein Gweinidog.

Fel y dywedais, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r dull o weithredu'r fformiwla gyllido, nid â'r modd y rhoddir cyllid. Fel Castell-nedd Port Talbot, mae lle amlwg i sir y Fflint yn y ddadl ynghylch cyllido: y sir hon sy'n cael un o'r lefelau cymorth uchaf o'r gyllideb addysg. Yr wyf wedi codi mater cyllido addysg gyda Sue Essex a Jane Davidson, ac, ar y cyd â'm cyd-Aelod, Sandy Mewies, yr ydym yn ymgynghori'n barhaus ynghylch y mater hwn. Dylem ganolbwyntio ar sylwedd y cynnig hwn, heb geisio gwneud pwyntiau

gwleidyddol am faterion eraill.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I am pleased to reply to the points that are of relevance to this motion. I say that deliberately, because I came here this afternoon primarily to discuss issues relating to the Clywch inquiry. We originally allocated only 15 minutes to discuss both of these regulations because they have been the subject of consultation for 18 months, during which time no amendment has been made to either of the regulations. This is the last stage of the regulatory process, not a debate about school funding policy. Therefore, several of those Members who contributed have not addressed the issues before us at all. I am concerned with ensuring that these regulations, which have been fully consulted upon, lead to a reduction in the pupil-led factor from 75 per cent to 70 per cent, as local authorities want. The regulations will require local authorities to factor social deprivation into their funding formulae, as the Assembly wanted. Contrary to the garbage that we heard from Mark Isherwood, the regulations will ensure that schools receive the money allocated by ELWa for pupils under the national planning and funding system.

**David Davies:** Point of order. I seek your guidance, Presiding Officer, on whether the word 'garbage' constitutes courteous language?

**The Presiding Officer:** I believe that garbage is dealt with by Cardiff City Council. However, I ask the Minister to reconsider her use of that word.

**Jane Davidson:** I am happy to reconsider the use of the word, but I ask Members to draw their own conclusions about a six-minute contribution that was not relevant in any way.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** You have had six minutes.

On 22 October 2003, the committee was advised on the process of the regulations.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn falch o ymateb i'r pwyntiau sy'n berthnasol i'r cynnig hwn. Dywedaf hynny o fwriad, gan imi ddod yma y prynhawn yma'n bennaf i drafod materion sy'n ymwneud ag ymchwiliad Clywch. Yn wreiddiol, dim ond 15 munud a neilltuasom i drafod y ddwy set o reoliadau gan iddynt fod yn destun ymgynghori am 18 mis, ac yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw ni chynigiwyd yr un newid i'r naill set o reoliadau na'r llall. Cam olaf y broses rheoleiddio yw hwn, nid dadl am bolisi cyllido ysgolion. Gan hynny, mae sawl Aelod a gyfrannodd heb ymdrin â'r materion sydd ger ein bron o gwbl. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig i mi yw sicrhau y bydd y rheoliadau hyn, yr ymgynghorwyd yn llawn yn eu cylch, yn arwain at leihau'r ffactor sy'n seiliedig ar ddisgyblion o 75 y cant i 70 y cant, yn ôl dymuniad awdurdodau lleol. Bydd y rheoliadau yn mynnu y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cynnwys amddifadedd cymdeithasol fel ffactor yn eu fformiwlâu cyllido, yn ôl dymuniad y Cynulliad. Yn wahanol i'r sothach a glywsom gan Mark Isherwood, bydd y rheoliadau'n sicrhau bod ysgolion yn derbyn yr arian a ddyrannir gan ELWa ar gyfer disgyblion o dan y system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol.

**David Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Ceisiaf gyfarwyddyd gennych, Lywydd, ynghylch a yw'r gair 'sothach' yn cael ei gyfrif yn iaith anghwrtais.

**Y Llywydd:** Credaf mai Cyngor Dinas Caerdydd sy'n delio â hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried ei defnydd o'r gair hwnnw.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn falch o ailystyried y defnydd o'r gair, ond gofynnaf i Aelodau dynnu eu casgliadau eu hunain ynghylch cyfraniad o chwe munud nad oedd yn berthnasol mewn unrhyw fodd.

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Cawsoch chwe munud.

Ar 22 Hydref 2003, rhoddwyd gwybod i'r pwyllgor am broses y rheoliadau. Ni

Committee members did not ask questions and made no comments, but rather signalled that they were content for the regulations to proceed to Plenary for consideration. The regulations were brought before the committee as part of the list of forthcoming legislation on 17 March and 16 June. At no point was there anything but positive support for these changes from Members and consultees. In 18 months, no amendments have been proposed.

I now turn to the amendments. Jocelyn Davies's amendment 1 to the principle of the motion has no bearing on the motion itself, which is concerned with the approval of Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004. This should be raised at the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee because it is the appropriate all-party mechanism for discussing any education issue.

The Liberal Democrats' amendment 1 to regulation 5 (2) is unnecessary. Provision for that is already made under regulation 18, which allows the re-determination to be made during the course of the financial year. Amendments to regulations 8 (3) to 8 (7) are also unnecessary as they already give local authorities scope to cushion the impact on an individual school of a fall in budget of 5 per cent or more year-on-year and to re-determine budgets in-year when pupil numbers differ from those predicted.

Their amendment to regulations 16 (1) to 16 (4) would remove local authority discretion not to re-determine budget shares in-year, but to wait until the following year to make such adjustments, if the amounts were small or the removal of funding would make it difficult for the school to manage its budget for the remainder of the financial year.

On regulations 18 (1) and 18 (2), LEAs need discretion to make adjustments during the course of the financial year. Amending those regulations would remove an authority's discretion to make the changes at an appropriate time.

I have given my commitment on several

ofynnodd aelodau'r pwyllgor unrhyw gwestiynau ac ni wnaethant unrhyw sylwadau gan nodi, yn hytrach, eu bod yn fodlon i'r rheoliadau fynd ymlaen i'r Cyfarfod Llawn i'w hystyried. Ducpwyd y rheoliadau gerbron y pwyllgor fel rhan o'r rhestr o'r ddeddfwriaeth a oedd i ddod ar 17 Mawrth a 16 Mehefin. Ni chafwyd dim ar unrhyw adeg heblaw cefnogaeth bendant i'r newidiadau hyn gan Aelodau ac ymgynghoredigion. Drwy gydol y 18 mis, ni chynigiwyd unrhyw newidiadau.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau. Nid yw gwelliant 1 Jocelyn Davies i egwyddor y cynnig yn berthnasol i'r cynnig ei hun, sy'n ymwneud â chymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004. Dylid codi hyn yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gan mai hwnnw yw'r cyfrwng trawsbleidiol priodol i drafod unrhyw fater sy'n ymwneud ag addysg.

Mae gwelliant 1 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i reoliad 5 (2) yn ddiangen. Gwneir darpariaeth ar gyfer hynny eisoes o dan reoliad 18, sy'n caniatáu ailbenderfynu yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol. Mae gwelliannau i reoliadau 8 (3) i 8 (7) yn ddiangen hefyd gan eu bod eisoes yn rhoi cyfle i awdurdodau lleol leddfu'r effaith ar ysgol neilltuol os bydd ei chyllideb yn gostwng o 5 y cant neu fwy rhwng un flwyddyn a'r llall ac ailbenderfynu cyllidebau o fewn y flwyddyn os yw niferoedd y disgyblion yn wahanol i'r hyn a ragwelwyd.

Byddai eu gwelliant i reoliadau 16 (1) i 16 (4) yn dileu disgresiwn yr awdurdod lleol i beidio ag ailbenderfynu cyfrannau cyllideb o fewn y flwyddyn, ond i aros tan y flwyddyn ddilynol i wneud newidiadau o'r fath, os oedd y symiau'n fach neu os byddai tynnu'r cyllid oddi wrth yr ysgol yn peri ei bod yn anodd iddi reoli ei chyllideb dros weddill y flwyddyn ariannol.

Ynghylch rheoliadau 18 (1) a 18 (2), mae ar awdurdodau addysg angen disgresiwn i wneud newidiadau yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol. Byddai newid y rheoliadau hynny'n dileu disgresiwn yr awdurdod i wneud y newidiadau ar yr adeg briodol.

Yr wyf wedi rhoi ymrwymiad ar sawl



occasions to looking at how we could offer greater security of funding to schools over a three-year period. The Assembly Government has made a similar commitment to organisations across Wales. Amending regulations that have been fully consulted upon at their last legislative stage and providing a totally new proposal would make a mockery of the seriousness with which Government accords consultation. The changes will be introduced in 2005-06. LEAs will have to consult their budget fora.

achlysur i ystyried y modd y gallem gynnig mwy o sicrwydd o ran cyllido i ysgolion dros gyfnod o dair blynedd. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi ymrwymiad tebyg i gyrrff ledled Cymru. Byddai newid rheoliadau y bu ymgynghori llawn arnynt yn y cam deddfwriaethol olaf a gwneud cynnig hollol newydd yn tansilio ymagwedd ddifrif y Llywodraeth at ymgynghori. Cyflwynir y newidiadau yn 2005-06. Bydd awdurdodau addysg yn gorfod ymgynghori â'u fforymau cyllideb.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2085): O blaid 45, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2085): For 45, Abstain 10, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 10, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2086): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.*  
*Motion (NDM2086): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.30 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2087): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.  
Motion (NDM2087): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2088): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.  
 Motion (NDM2088): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.31 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.31 p.m.*

### **Ymchwiliad Clywch The Clywch Inquiry**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, amendments 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendments 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, gwelliannau 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliannau 6, 7, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. welcomes the Clywch inquiry report;*

*1. yn croesawu adroddiad ymchwiliad Clywch;*

*2. recognises the effort devoted by Peter Clarke and his team in conducting the Clywch inquiry; and*

*2. yn cydnabod ymdrechion Peter Clarke a'i dim yn cynnal ymchwiliad Clywch; ac*

*3. endorses the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Clywch recommendations to ensure that lessons are learned in safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children and young people.*  
 (NDM2089)

*3. yn cymeradwyo ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i argymhellion Clywch i sicrhau bod gwersi yn cael eu dysgu i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant a phobl ifanc.*  
 (NDM2089)

On 6 July, I promised Members that we would take the opportunity of debating our Assembly Government's response to the Clywch report in the Chamber in September. Today is that opportunity. I do not propose to take time this afternoon to reiterate the seriousness of the issues that led to the children's commissioner embarking upon his inquiry. It is suffice to say that we would all agree that they were extremely disturbing.

Ar 6 Gorffennaf, addewais i Aelodau y byddem yn achub ar y cyfle i gael dadl ar ymateb Llywodraeth ein Cynulliad i adroddiad Clywch yn y Siambr ym mis Medi. Ceir y cyfle hwnnw heddiw. Ni fwriadaf gymryd amser y prynhawn yma i ailddatgan mor ddifrifol yw'r materion a barodd i'r comisiynydd plant ddechrau ar ei ymchwiliad. Digon yw dweud y byddem oll yn cytuno eu bod yn peri pryder mawr. Rhaid

We must concentrate today—and our Assembly Government response does so—on the overwhelming need to ensure that all of the commissioner's recommendations are given full and serious consideration, so as to act where we properly should. As we make clear in our response, we have considered the commissioner's recommendations carefully and accept, or accept in principle, the great majority of them. In a small number of cases—some of which I shall mention shortly—we are accepting them for further consideration.

The children's commissioner and many of his team are with us today. It is appropriate that I thank them once again, on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, for the effort they dedicated to this inquiry and for bringing forward their recommendations to ensure that safeguards for children in Wales are of the highest quality. There is a great deal in the commissioner's report that applies to all child protection agencies and not just to education. There are lessons to be learned from this case that apply to social services, the police and to area child protection committees in general. Jane Hutt and I are committed to taking those lessons forward together.

We will shortly have new powers under the Children Bill that will enable us to improve and strengthen child protection structures and policies in Wales. In implementing those powers, we will want to take the commissioner's recommendations into account, along with those from other recent inquiries, including Lord Laming's report into the death of Victoria Climbié, and Sir Michael Bichard's report in the wake of the Soham tragedy to the Home Secretary on child protection procedures, including record keeping and information sharing. In doing so, we have not lost sight of recommendations made in the reports of Sir William Utting, Lord Carlile and Sir Ronald Waterhouse.

I wish to highlight two specific issues this afternoon. First, in our response to recommendation 21.8(iii) and 21.9 on the establishment of independent tribunals, the Assembly Government explains that setting up tribunals would not be straightforward and

inni ganolbwyntio heddiw—fel y mae ymateb Llywodraeth ein Cynulliad—ar y taer angen i sicrhau y caiff holl argymhellion y comisiynydd eu hystyried yn llawn ac o ddifrif, fel y gellir gweithredu lle bo hynny'n briodol. Fel yr eglurwn yn ein hymateb, yr ydym wedi ystyried argymhellion y comisiynydd yn ofalus ac yn derbyn, neu'n derbyn mewn egwyddor, y mwyafrif helaeth ohonynt. Mewn nifer bach o achosion—y cyfeiriaf at rai ohonynt cyn hir—yr ydym yn eu derbyn i'w hystyried ymhellach.

Mae'r comisiynydd plant a llawer o'i dîm gyda ni heddiw. Mae'n briodol imi ddiolch iddynt unwaith eto, ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, am eu gwaith mawr ar yr ymchwiliad hwn ac am gyflwyno eu hargymhellion i sicrhau'r mesurau diogelu gorau i blant yng Nghymru. Mae llawer iawn yn adroddiad y comisiynydd sy'n berthnasol i'r holl asiantaethau amddiffyn plant ac nid i addysg yn unig. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu o'r achos hwn sy'n berthnasol i wasanaethau cymdeithasol, i'r heddlu ac i bwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant yn gyffredinol. Mae Jane Hutt a minnau wedi ymrwymo i weithredu ar sail y gwersi hynny gyda'n gilydd.

Cyn hir cawn bwerau newydd o dan y Mesur Plant a fydd yn ein galluogi i wella a chryfhau strwythurau a pholisïau amddiffyn plant yng Nghymru. Wrth roi'r pwerau hynny ar waith, byddwn am ystyried argymhellion y comisiynydd, ynghyd â'r rhai o ymchwiliadau diweddar eraill, gan gynnwys adroddiad yr Arglwydd Laming ar farwolaeth Victoria Climbié, ac adroddiad Syr Michael Bichard i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn sgîl y digwyddiadau trist yn Soham ar weithdrefnau amddiffyn plant, gan gynnwys cadw cofnodion a rhannu gwybodaeth. Wrth wneud hynny, nid ydym wedi colli golwg ar argymhellion a wnaed yn adroddiadau Syr William Utting, yr Arglwydd Carlile a Syr Ronald Waterhouse.

Dymunaf dynnu sylw at ddau fater penodol y prynhawn yma. Yn gyntaf, yn ein hymateb i argymhelliad 21.8(iii) a 21.9 ar sefydlu tribiwnlysoedd annibynnol, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn egluro nad gwaith syml fyddai sefydlu tribiwnlysoedd ac yn nodi

sets out a number of the issues that must be considered in deciding whether this is an appropriate approach. These include the legal responsibilities of local education authorities and governing bodies as employers and the role of employment appeal tribunals, the legal responsibilities of local authorities under the Children Act 1989, and the need for an appropriate legislative vehicle in Parliament. I had a preliminary meeting last week with representatives of the parties listed in recommendation 21.9. There was recognition of the need to tackle the three key concerns identified by the commissioner—indeed a unanimous determination to do so.

We must remind ourselves of the concerns that the school community may be too small or incapable of undertaking impartial consideration of allegations of child abuse; that the governing body will not follow through with disciplinary consideration where a prosecution does not happen or fails; and that the governing body will not follow through with disciplinary procedures if a member of staff resigns. The group unanimously recognised that we cannot wait, and must explore ways of dealing with these concerns that do not require new primary legislation. I have agreed to meet all parties again at the turn of the year and, by then, I hope that you will have explored home-grown options and be in a position to table material for wider consultation in the context of new regulations on school staffing, under the Education Act 2002.

For the immediate term, circular 45/04 addresses two of the key issues: first, the failure of governing bodies to undertake disciplinary consideration where a prosecution does not proceed or fails—the new guidance makes it clear that the governing body staff disciplinary committee must consider and determine the case; and, secondly, the failure of governing bodies to complete consideration of disciplinary action if a staff member resigns. Under the new guidance, such consideration must always be completed so that the employer—the local education authority or the governing body—can fulfil its obligations under the Education (Supply of Information) (Wales) Regulations 2003 to notify the Assembly Government if it

sawl mater y mae'n rhaid ei ystyried wrth benderfynu a yw hyn yn ddull priodol o weithredu. Yn eu plith y mae cyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrff llywodraethu fel cyflogwyr a rôl tribiwnlysoedd apêl cyflogaeth, cyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol awdurdodau lleol o dan Ddeddf Plant 1989, a'r angen am gyfrwng priodol i ddeddfu yn y Senedd. Cefais gyfarfod rhagarweiniol yr wythnos diwethaf â chynrychiolwyr y partïon a restrir yn argymhelliad 21.9. Cydnabuwyd bod angen ymateb i'r tri thestun pryder pennaf a nodwyd gan y comisiynydd—yn wir, yr oedd penderfyniad unfrydol i wneud hynny.

Rhaid inni gofio am y pryderon y gallai cymuned yr ysgol fod yn rhy fach neu'n analluog i ystyried cyhuddiadau o gam-drin plant yn ddiuedd; na fydd y corff llywodraethu'n mynd ymlaen i ystyried disgyblu os na cheir erlyniad neu os yw'n methu; ac na fydd y corff llywodraethu'n mynd ymlaen â gweithdrefnau disgyblu os yw aelod staff yn ymddiswyddo. Cydnabu'r grŵp yn unfrydol na allwn aros, a bod rhaid inni ymchwilio i ddulliau o ymdrin â'r pryderon hyn nad ydynt yn gofyn deddfwriaeth sylfaenol newydd. Yr wyf wedi cytuno i gwrrd â'r holl bartïon eto ar droad y flwyddyn ac, erbyn hynny, yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch wedi ymchwilio i ddewisiadau o'ch eiddo eich hun ac y byddwch mewn lle i gyflwyno deunydd ar gyfer ymgynghori pellach yng nghyd-destun rheoliadau newydd ar staffio ysgolion, o dan Ddeddf Addysg 2002.

Ar gyfer y dyfodol agos, mae cylchlythyr 45/04 yn ymdrin â dau o'r materion pwysicaf: yn gyntaf, methiant cyrff llywodraethu i ystyried disgyblu os na cheir erlyniad neu os yw'n methu—mae'r canllawiau newydd yn egluro bod rhaid i bwyllgor disgyblu staff y corff llywodraethu ystyried a phenderfynu ar yr achos; ac, yn ail, methiant cyrff llywodraethu i gwblhau eu hystyriaeth i gamau disgyblu os yw aelod staff yn ymddiswyddo. O dan y canllawiau newydd, rhaid cwblhau ystyriaeth o'r fath ym mhob achos fel y gall y cyflogwr—yr awdurdod addysg lleol neu'r corff llywodraethu—gyflawni ei ymrwymadau o dan Reoliadau Addysg (Cyflenwi Gwybodaeth) (Cymru) 2003 i hysbysu



dismisses an individual or would have dismissed an individual for misconduct had they not resigned. The guidance in circular 45/04 also sets out clearly how allegations relating to child abuse should be handled, to take account of the commissioner's recommendation 21.7. This circular, work on which began following the Marjorie Evans case, will be published at the end of the month.

With the all-Wales child protection procedures, each LEA should have an effective policy, developed in partnership with local area child protection committees, on how to respond to concerns raised about individual pupils' welfare and allegations against staff. Our guidance, 'School Governing Bodies Complaints Procedures', addresses many of the commissioner's recommendations relating to complaints by children and their parents. Further guidance on dealing with pupils' complaints will be issued for consultation in November.

In his report the commissioner makes many recommendations that he considers would be best implemented if Wales and the other UK countries acted together. Specifically, they concern the need for specialist input on how abusers operate to be included as part of initial teacher training; the role of awarding bodies in safeguarding the welfare of children and young people; and the development of guidance on teaching and examining drama in schools and further education institutions. With Jane Hutt, I have written to the Secretary of State for Wales—who is responsible for liaising with the UK Government on such matters—to raise these cross-border issues and to consider how best we can take forward the implications. We have already written to the regulatory authorities in England, Northern Ireland and Scotland, inviting their participation in a steering group on the issues governing awarding bodies. The need to take forward the implications for initial teacher training in Wales and the UK has also been raised with the Secretary of State for Wales and the Secretary of State for Education and Skills.

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad os yw'n diswyddo unigolyn neu os byddai wedi diswyddo unigolyn am gamymddwyn pe na bai wedi ymddiswyddo. Mae'r canllawiau yng nghylchlythyr 45/04 yn nodi'n glir hefyd sut y dylid trafod cyhuddiadau sy'n ymwneud â cham-drin plant, er mwyn ystyried argymhelliad 21.7 y comisiynydd. Cyhoeddir y cylchlythyr hwn, y dechreuodd y gwaith arno ar ôl achos Marjorie Evans, ddiwedd y mis.

Gyda'r gweithdrefnau amddiffyn plant ar gyfer Cymru gyfan, dylai pob AAL feddu ar bolisi effeithiol, a ddatblygwyd ar y cyd â phwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant lleol, ar y modd i ymateb i bryderon a godir ynghylch lles disgyblion penodol a chyhuddiadau yn erbyn staff. Mae ein canllawiau, 'Gweithdrefnau Cwyno Cyrff Llywodraethu Ysgolion', yn ymdrin â llawer o argymhellion y comisiynydd ynghylch cwynion gan blant a'u rhieni. Cyhoeddir canllawiau pellach ar ddelio â chwynion gan ddisgyblion ar gyfer ymgynghori ym mis Tachwedd.

Yn ei adroddiad mae'r comisiynydd yn gwneud sawl argymhelliad y gellid ei weithredu orau, yn ei farn ef, pe byddai Cymru a gwledydd eraill y DU yn gweithredu gyda'i gilydd. Yn benodol, maent yn ymwneud â'r angen am gynnwys mewnbwn gan arbenigwyr ar y modd y mae camdrinwyr yn gweithredu yn rhan o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon; ar rôl cyrff arholi wrth ddiogelu lles plant a phobl ifanc; ac ar ddatblygu canllawiau ar ddysgu ac arholi drama mewn ysgolion a sefydliadau addysg bellach. Gyda Jane Hutt, yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru—sy'n gyfrifol am gydgyssylltu â Llywodraeth y DU ar faterion o'r fath—er mwyn codi'r materion trawsffiniol hyn ac ystyried y modd gorau inni drafod y goblygiadau. Yr ydym eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at yr awdurdodau rheoleiddio yn Lloegr, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban, gan eu gwahodd i gymryd rhan mewn grŵp llywio ar y materion sy'n llywodraethu cyrff arholi. Mae'r angen i ystyried y goblygiadau i hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon yng Nghymru a'r DU wedi'i godi hefyd gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a

Sgiliau.

In my earlier statement I drew Members' attention to the important work that Gwenda Thomas is undertaking on the safeguards review, established last December. We await action on the recommendations arising from the Bichard inquiry and, in view of that, while we understand the principle of the amendments tabled by the opposition, we commend the motion as unamended, to take account of all the actions and recommendations that the Assembly Government must act upon.

**David Davies:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add at the end of point 1:

*and calls for a full investigation into anyone implicated of negligence in their duties who is still working in the education sector.*

I express our sympathy for all those who suffered at the hands of John Owen, not only the children, but the parents as well. I welcome the fact that the Minister has responded promptly to the original statement and the fact that this is one of the first debates to be tabled after the summer recess. It is obvious that the Government is taking this matter seriously and there should be no criticism of the action that it is already taking. I am generally happy with the direction being taken to prevent a repeat of this tragedy. I appreciate that you will not support the amendment, and I will go along with that, but I tabled it because I would have welcomed some assurances that anyone responsible for failing to act over the initial allegations or, worse, for trying to cover them up, will not escape punishment, particularly if he or she is still working in the education sector. One of this report's most worrying parts was the last section in chapter 10, which details what happened when a WJEC examiner stopped an examination. It said that she was shocked to see a 15 or 16-year-old pupil naked and simulating sexual intercourse. That took place in a GCSE examination. Having drawn that incident to the attention of the WJEC and the headteacher, she was told to carry on with the examination.

Yn fy natganiad cynharach, tynnais sylw Aelodau at y gwaith pwysig y mae Gwenda Thomas yn ei wneud ar yr adolygiad o fesurau diogelwch, a sefydlwyd fis Rhagfyr diwethaf. Yr ydym yn disgwyl camau ar yr argymhellion a gododd o ymchwiliad Bichard ac, yng ngolwg hynny, er ein bod yn deall egwyddor y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau, cymeradwywn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio, er mwyn ystyried y camau gweithredu a'r argymhellion y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithredu arnynt.

**David Davies:** Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

*ac yn galw am ymchwiliad llawn i unrhyw un a gysylltir ag esgeuluster wrth ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau ac sy'n parhau i weithio o fewn y sector addysg.*

Mynegaf ein cydymdeimlad â phawb a ddioddefodd dan law John Owen, nid yn unig y plant, ond y rhieni hefyd. Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb yn brydlon i'r datganiad gwreiddiol a'r ffaith mai hon yw un o'r dadleuon cyntaf a gyflwynwyd ar ôl toriad yr haf. Mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif ac nid oes lle i feirniadu'r camau y mae'n eu cymryd eisoes. Yr wyf yn fodlon at ei gilydd ar y llwybr a ddilynir i atal trychineb o'r fath rhag digwydd eto. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli na wnewch gefnogi'r gwelliant, a derbynïaf hynny, ond fe'i cyflwynais am y byddwn wedi bod yn falch o gael rhyw sicrwydd na fydd unrhyw un sy'n gyfrifol oherwydd ei fethiant i weithredu ynghylch y cyhuddiadau gwreiddiol, neu, yn waeth, oherwydd ymgais i'w celu, yn dianc rhag cosb, yn enwedig os yw'n dal i weithio yn y sector addysg. Un o'r rhannau o'r adroddiad hwn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf yw'r adran olaf ym mhennod 10, sy'n disgrifio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd pan ataliwyd arholiad gan arholwr CBAC. Dywedodd ei bod wedi dychryn o weld disgybl 15 neu 16 mlwydd oed yn noeth ac yn dynwared cyfathrach rywiol. Digwyddodd hynny mewn arholiad TGAU. Wedi iddi dynnu sylw CBAC a phennaeth yr ysgol at y digwyddiad hwnnw, dywedwyd wrthi am fynd ymlaen â'r

arholiad.

4.40 p.m.

Further on in the report—I have the full version, so this is in chapter 15—there are details about another performance that was stopped, again by a WJEC examiner, due to its graphic nature. This is even more serious in that the examiner was taken to a room and told, apparently by the headteacher or by John Owen, that he would never be used by the WJEC to conduct examinations again because he had complained—and he never was used again by the WJEC. The WJEC has some questions to answer, and I want to make clear that no aspersions are being cast over the current management as it goes without saying that they had nothing to do with this matter. However, there is a concern that, since this issue goes back 20 years, it is feasible that some people who were involved then, and may have been party to sacking an examiner who complained, may still be working either for the WJEC or for another organisation. If they are still there, then they must face disciplinary action because they were negligent beyond belief or, possibly, even worse.

I ask the Minister whether she has given any consideration to at least putting some safeguards in place to ensure that unsuitable material such as that used by John Owen cannot be used in examinations again, particularly in the spheres of English, drama and sex education, which are vulnerable to something like this happening. We would all like to think that this was a unique event and that nothing like it could ever happen again, but we must cover all possibilities and make absolutely certain. I appreciate that it would be difficult to obtain some sort of central register of books, and there may even be complaints of censorship were we to try, but, surely, children's welfare must be the most important consideration.

The report also makes mention of what you could call institutional inertia towards disciplining or sacking teachers. If that is the case, then it must stop. We all acknowledge that the majority of teachers do an excellent job, are extremely hard-working and put much into the job. I would be first to

Yn ddiweddarach yn yr adroddiad—y fersiwn llawn sydd gennyf fi, felly mae hyn ym mhennod 15—mae manylion am berfformiad arall a ataliwyd, unwaith eto gan arholwr CBAC, oherwydd ei natur gignoeth. Mae hyn yn fwy difrifol byth gan fod yr arholwr wedi'i hebrwng i ystafell ac wedi'i hysbysu, gan bennaeth yr ysgol neu gan John Owen, mae'n ymddangos, na châi ei ddefnyddio byth eto gan CBAC i gynnal arholiadau gan ei fod wedi cwyno—ac nis defnyddiwyd byth eto gan CBAC. Mae gan CBAC rai cwestiynau i'w hateb, a dymunaf egluro nad ydym yn bwrw sen ar y rheolwyr presennol gan ei bod yn amlwg nad oedd a wnelont hwy ddim â'r mater hwn. Er hynny, mae pryder, gan fod y mater hwn wedi codi 20 mlynedd yn ôl, y gallai rhai a oedd yn gysylltiedig bryd hynny, ac a allasai fod â rhan mewn diswyddo arholwr a gwynodd, fod yn gweithio o hyd un ai i CBAC neu i gorff arall. Os ydynt yno o hyd, rhaid iddynt wynebu camau disgyblu gan iddynt fod yn hynod esgeulus neu'n waeth na hynny, o bosibl.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a yw wedi ystyried rhoi rhai mesurau diogelwch ar waith, o leiaf, i sicrhau na ddefnyddir eto ddeunydd anaddas fel yr hyn a ddefnyddiodd John Owen mewn arholiadau, yn enwedig ym meysydd Saesneg, drama ac addysg rhyw, lle y mae perygl i rywbeth fel hyn ddigwydd. Byddem oll yn hoffi meddwl mai digwyddiad unigryw oedd hwn ac na allai dim tebyg ddigwydd eto, ond rhaid inni wyllo rhag pob posibilrwydd a bod yn gwbl sicr. Sylweddolaf mai anodd fyddai cael rhyw fath o gofrestr ganolog o lyfrau, ac y gellid hyd yn oed cael cwynion am sensoriaeth pe baem yn ceisio gwneud hynny, ond rhaid i les plant fod yn brif ystyriaeth.

Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn hefyd am yr hyn y gellid ei alw'n syrthni sefydliadol mewn cysylltiad â disgyblu neu ddiswyddo athrawon. Os felly y mae, rhaid iddo ddod i ben. Yr ydym oll yn cydnabod bod y rhan fwyaf o athrawon yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol, eu bod yn gweithio'n galed dros

commend the work that they do, but where there are instances of teachers whose performance is not up to the required standard, the authorities and the General Teaching Council for Wales must play a part and be more willing to take disciplinary sanctions against people than they are at present. I am still not entirely satisfied, even after a meeting with the GTCW last week, that there is enough enthusiasm for dealing with teachers whose behaviour is not good enough.

In conclusion, Minister, you should be commended for the job that you are doing to tackle this issue and to prevent anything similar from happening again. We must all applaud Peter Clark for the thorough job that he did in the face of strident criticism from certain quarters. I am convinced that we will do everything possible to stop this from happening again, although, unfortunately, nothing that we can do can be absolutely certain of preventing another tragedy like this one, and that is the sad fact of the matter. However, I want to feel certain that all those who were involved in this matter originally, the guilty parties, those who turned a blind eye, are also punished for what they have done. We can do nothing now to help those who have suffered, but the only solace that we can give them is to show them all that we will not let this issue develop into a political slanging match, but that we will do everything possible to ensure that we never have a repeat of this tragedy.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: in point 2 delete 'recognises' and replace with 'applauds'.

I propose amendment 3. In point 2, after 'inquiry,' insert

*but regrets that the Children Bill, by not reflecting the wishes of all parties in this Assembly for the commissioner's remit to be extended to cover non-devolved services, will limit his flexibility in future inquiries*

I propose amendment 4. In point 3 delete

ben a'u bod yn ymroddedig i'w gwaith. Myfi fyddai'r cyntaf i ganmol eu gwaith, ond os ceir achosion o athrawon nad yw eu perfformiad yn cyrraedd y safon ofynnol, rhaid i'r awdurdodau a Chyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru chwarae rhan a bod yn barotach i gymryd camau disgyblu nag y maent ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig eto, hyd yn oed ar ôl cwrdd â Chyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, fod digon o frwdfrydedd dros ddelio ag athrawon nad yw eu hymddygiad gystal ag y dylai fod.

I gloi, Weinidog, dylid eich canmol am y gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn a sicrhau na fydd dim byd tebyg i hyn yn digwydd eto. Dylem i gyd ganmol Peter Clark am y gwaith trwyadl a wnaeth yn wyneb beirmiadaeth groch o rai cylchoedd. Yr wyf yn sicr y gwnawn bopeth a allwn i ofalu na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto, er nad oes dim y gallwn ei wneud, gwaetha'r modd, a fydd yn gwbl sicr o atal trychineb arall fel hon, a dyna'r gwir trist amdani. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gael bod yn sicr y bydd pawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn yn wreiddiol, y rhai euog, y rhai a gaeodd eu llygaid, yn cael eu cosbi hefyd am yr hyn a wnaethant. Ni allwn wneud dim yn awr i helpu'r rhai a ddioddefodd, ond yr unig gysur y gallwn ei gynnig yw dangos iddynt i gyd na wnawn adael i'r mater hwn droi'n ffrae wleidyddol, ond y gwnawn bopeth a allwn i sicrhau na cheir byth eto drychineb fel hon.

**Michael German:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ym mhwynt 2 dileu 'yn cydnabod' a rhoi yn ei le 'yn llongyfarch'.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ym mhwynt 2 ar ôl 'ymchwiliad', rhoi

*ond yn gresynu at y ffaith y bydd y Mesur Plant, drwy beidio ag adlewyrchu dymuniadau pob plaid yn y Cynulliad hwn i gyflwynu gwaith y Comisiynydd gael ei ymestyn i gynnwys gwasanaethau nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli, yn cyfyngu ar ei hyblygrwydd mewn ymchwiliadau yn y dyfodol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ym mhwynt 3 dileu 'yn

'endorses' and replace with 'notes'.

cymeradwyo' a rhoi yn ei le 'yn nodi'.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*believes that the Assembly Government should carry out and publish an annual audit of the implementation of the recommendations from child protection reports issued in Wales in recent years.*

*yn credu y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ymgymryd ag archwiliad blynyddol o ddull gweithredu argymhellion adroddiadau amddiffyn plant a gyhoeddwyd yng Nghymru yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf a'i gyhoeddi.*

We thank the children's commissioner for the thorough job that he has done and for the effort that he has put into it: it shows. The question that we must ask ourselves is: if we did not have a children's commissioner, would these facts be before us today? The answer is: probably not all of them, but maybe some, unfortunately.

Diolchwn i'r comisiynydd plant am ei waith trwyadl a'i egni wrth ei wneud: mae i'w weld yn amlwg. Y cwestiwn y mae'n rhaid inni ei ofyn i ni'n hunain heddiw yw: pe na fyddai gennym gomisiynydd plant, a fyddai'r ffeithiau hyn ger ein bron heddiw? Yr ateb yw: nid pob un ohonynt yn ôl pob tebyg, ond efallai rai, gwaetha'r modd.

When we received our briefings—and I know that the Minister also received briefings before the report was published—I came out of the room shaking and with a great sense of foreboding and concern. I do not believe that I have been so shaken by a report for many years, and that says something about the severity of the case that was being heard and also about the conclusions. One of the key issues that the commissioner mentioned, as we were leaving, was that this report is not so much about placing blame on those who may have had responsibility perhaps 10 or more years ago, but that it is far more about making changes to the structures of our society in order to protect future generations of young people and to ensure that this cannot occur again. It is in that spirit that the Ministers are to be commended for their joint response and for the fact that they have taken on board virtually all of the recommendations. They have raised questions on some of them, some of which I share and one of which I do not, but I will come to that later.

Pan gawsom ein briffio—a gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi cael ei briffio hefyd cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad—deuthum o'r ystafell dan grynu gydag ymdeimlad mawr o bryder a drwgargoel. Nid wyf yn credu imi gael fy ysgwyd cymaint gan adroddiad ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac mae hynny'n dangos mor ddifrifol oedd yr achos a glywyd a'r casgliadau hefyd. Un o'r prif faterion a grybwyllodd y comisiynydd, fel yr oeddem yn ymadael, oedd nad oedd yr adroddiad yn ymwneud yn ogymaint â rhoi bai ar y rhai a allai fod yn gyfrifol 10 mlynedd neu fwy yn ôl efallai, ond â'r bwriad llawer pwysicach o wneud newidiadau i'r strwythurau yn ein cymdeithas er mwyn amddiffyn cenedlaethau o bobl ifanc yn y dyfodol a sicrhau na all hyn ddigwydd eto. Yn hynny o beth, dylid canmol y Gweinidogion am eu cydymateb ac am y ffaith eu bod wedi derbyn bron y cwbl o'r argymhellion. Maent wedi codi amheuan ynghylch rhai ohonynt, ac mae rhai yr wyf yn eu rhannu ac un nad ydwyf, ond deuaif at hynny'n ddiweddarach.

The amendment on an annual Assembly debate on this matter is crucial. The Minister acknowledged that, in addition to the Clywch report, we have also had the Carlile, Laming, Bichard, Waterhouse and Utting reports. This is a complex area. All of these reports made statements about what we should do to protect our young people. The Government

Mae'r gwelliant ynghylch dadl flynyddol yn y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn yn un hollbwysig. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod inni gael, yn ogystal ag adroddiad Clywch, adroddiadau Carlile, Laming, Bichard, Waterhouse ac Utting. Maes cymhleth yw hwn. Cafwyd datganiadau ym mhob un o'r adroddiadau hynny am yr hyn y

accepts many of these recommendations and has put them into action. However, many are put into action in the sense of work that will take place in the future, the future guidance and direction that will be given and the future actions that will be taken. That is right because the Government needs time to bring forward those recommendations.

Some of the recommendations are not for the National Assembly, and, in their response, the Ministers acknowledge that there are matters for local government, the private sector, the media, the WJEC and so forth. In all of those matters, Ministers are saying, 'It is not our responsibility; it is the responsibility of others'. Surely the people of Wales look to the National Assembly to be the sounding board for what is happening. There are perhaps two ways in which that can be done. For the matters that are within the ambit of the Welsh Assembly Government, an annual report on how it has progressed on the recommendations of all these reports, what needs to be done and what continues to need to be done would be one way of ensuring that we discuss what is of public interest in the public domain. It matters to the public to hear that debate publicly.

On the matters that relate to other organisations, we heard about Gwenda's study, the safeguarding vulnerable children review, and that is one way in which these matters could be taken on board, but, again, the public concern is for a public debate. The best way forward may be for Assembly committees to call in evidence from those bodies and sectors that are affected by such domains, to once again give that reassurance and for that reassurance to be heard. There is a responsibility on all of us, not just the Government.

On overlapping responsibilities, a Government needs to be certain that its responsibilities are clearly defined. For example, in the context of what the Minister proposes in education, local authority and governing body relationships are important. However, the GTCW, in its comments, says that it can refer cases to the council directly if, for example, a school or a governing body

dylem ei wneud i amddiffyn ein pobl ifanc. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn llawer o'r argymhellion hynny ac wedi eu rhoi ar waith. Fodd bynnag, rhoddir llawer ohonynt ar waith ar ffurf gwaith a wneir yn y dyfodol, y canllawiau a'r cyfarwyddyd a roddir yn y dyfodol a'r camau a gymerir yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n briodol gan fod ar y Llywodraeth angen amser i gymryd camau ar yr argymhellion hynny.

Mae rhai argymhellion nad ydynt yn fater i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac, yn eu hymateb, mae'r Gweinidogion yn cydnabod bod materion i lywodraeth leol, y sector preifat, y cyfryngau, CBAC ac yn y blaen. Yn yr holl faterion hynny, mae Gweinidogion yn dweud, 'Nid ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw hynny; mae'n gyfrifoldeb i eraill'. Mae pobl Cymru yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod yn seinfwrdd i'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Mae dau fodd i wneud hynny o bosibl. Yn achos y materion sydd o dan ofal Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, byddai adroddiad blynyddol ar y cynnydd a wnaeth ar argymhellion yr holl adroddiadau hyn, yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, yn un modd i sicrhau ein bod yn trafod yr hyn sydd o ddiddordeb i'r cyhoedd yn y maes cyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig gan y cyhoedd glywed y ddadl honno'n gyhoeddus.

Ynghylch y materion sy'n ymwneud â chyrrff eraill, clywsom am astudiaeth Gwenda, yr adolygiad ar ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed, a dyna un modd posibl i ystyried y materion hyn, ond, unwaith eto, mae'n bwysig gan y cyhoedd gael dadl gyhoeddus. Efallai mai'r ffordd orau ymlaen fyddai i bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ofyn tystiolaeth gan y cyrrff a'r sectorau hynny y mae meysydd o'r fath yn effeithio arnynt, er mwyn rhoi'r sicrwydd hwnnw eto ac fel y gellir clywed y sicrwydd hwnnw. Mae hynny'n gyfrifoldeb i bob un ohonom, nid y Llywodraeth yn unig.

Ynghylch cyfrifoldebau sy'n gorgyffwrdd, rhaid i Lywodraeth fod yn sicr bod ei chyfrifoldebau wedi'u diffinio'n glir. Er enghraifft, yng nghyd-destun yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei gynnig mewn addysg, mae'r cysylltiadau rhwng awdurodau lleol a chyrrff llywodraethu yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, mae Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru yn dweud yn ei sylwadau y gall gyfeirio

is dragging its feet, as seems to be the case. Therefore, overlapping responsibilities need to be sorted out.

Ministers note the matter of false and malicious allegations, and, in an increasingly litigious society, it is important that people are not given comfort for making such allegations. Whatever happens, human rights must be safeguarded, and I am sure that the Ministers are aware of that.

I do not agree with the Minister on the time that it is taking to put in place the counselling and guidance that is essential for ensuring that this does not happen again.

We all owe a debt of gratitude to the children's commissioner. We should recognise that it is only through having a powerful children's commissioner with broad responsibilities, in a way that England will not have, that we will have the opportunity to examine these matters in depth. The people of Wales must be grateful that we have had that broad opportunity, and some of us may regret the fact that England will not have the same opportunity.

4.50 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 6: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Government to report back to Plenary at six-monthly intervals on all the recommendations in the report.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*consider a speedy and independent investigating regime in the cases of allegations of child abuse against teaching and non-teaching staff.*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Government to ensure that*

achosion i'r cyngor yn uniongyrchol os yw ysgol neu gorff llywodraethu yn llusgo ei draed, er enghraifft, fel y digwyddodd, mae'n ymddangos. Felly, rhaid rhoi trefn ar gyfrifoldebau sy'n gorgyffwrdd.

Mae Gweinidogion yn nodi'r mater sy'n codi mewn cysylltiad â chyhuddiadau ffug neu faleisus, ac, mewn cymdeithas sy'n fwyfwy cyfreithgar, mae'n bwysig na chaiff neb gysur o wneud cyhuddiadau o'r fath. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd, rhaid diogelu hawliau dynol, ac yr wyf yn sicr bod y Gweinidogion yn ymwybodol o hynny.

Ni chytunaf â'r Gweinidog ynghylch yr amser y mae'n ei gymryd i roi ar waith y cyngori a'r cyfarwyddyd sy'n hollbwysig i sicrhau na ddigwydd hyn eto.

Yr ydym oll yn ddyledus i'r comisiynydd plant. Dylem gydnabod mai dim ond drwy gael comisiynydd plant pwerus a chanddo gyfrifoldebau eang, yn wahanol i'r hyn a geir yn Lloegr, y cawn gyfle i ymchwilio i'r materion hyn yn fanwl. Mae pobl Cymru'n sicr o fod yn ddiolchgar inni gael cyfle i wneud hynny mewn modd cynhwysfawr, ac efallai y bydd yn ofid i rai ohonom na chaiff Lloegr yr un cyfle.

**Janet Ryder:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 6: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i gyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn bob chwe mis ar yr holl argymhellion yn yr Adroddiad.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn ystyried cyfundrefn ymchwilio gyflym ac annibynnol mewn achosion lle ceir honiadau o gam-drin plant yn erbyn staff dysgu a staff nad ydynt yn dysgu.*

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod*

*counselling services are available to all victims of sexual abuse.*

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Government to explore with the General Teaching Council the possibility of extending the powers of the GTC to include child protection issues in relation to the register of qualified teachers.*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that as a private company the WJEC is unaccountable to the people of Wales.*

As the other parties have done, Plaid Cymru welcomes this report and endorses the independence of the children's commissioner, without which this report, as has just been said, would not have been possible. Plaid Cymru also welcomes the recommendations and, while we appreciate the Government's response, we ask it to ensure that it develops and implements the recommendations as soon as possible. Given the timescales that the children's commissioner has set in these recommendations, we are calling for six-monthly reports—to come to committee or to Plenary—on how these recommendations are being progressed. I fully endorse Mike German's points on this issue.

This inquiry came about due to pressure brought by Plaid Cymru Members, Jocelyn Davies and Geraint Davies, and was only made possible by the unique role of the children's commissioner. As a party, we were pleased to put forward the initial idea of a children's commissioner in Wales. We endorse the many comments that have been made, and the fears expressed, that that role will be diluted by the passing of the Children Bill currently before Westminster. We call on all parties in the Assembly to bring every pressure possible to bear to ensure that that unique role of the children's commissioner is upheld.

Plaid Cymru acknowledges the queries that have been raised against the inquiry, but we

*gwasanaethau cwnsela ar gael i bawb sy'n dioddef camdriniaeth rywiol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ymchwilio gyda'r Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol (GTC) i'r posibilrwydd o estyn pwerau'r GTC i gynnwys materion amddiffyn plant mewn perthynas â'r gofrestr athrawon cymwysedig.*

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi nad yw CBAC fel cwmni preifat yn atebol i bobl Cymru.*

Fel y gwnaeth y pleidiau eraill, mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn ac yn cymeradwyo annibyniaeth y comisiynydd plant, gan na fyddai'r adroddiad hwn yn bosibl hebddi, fel y dywedwyd. Mae Plaid Cymru hefyd yn croesawu'r argymhellion ac, er ein bod yn deall ymateb y Llywodraeth, gofynnwn iddi sicrhau ei bod yn datblygu'r argymhellion ac yn eu rhoi ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Yng ngolwg yr amserlenni y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi'u gosod yn yr argymhellion hyn, yr ydym yn galw am gael adroddiadau chwemisol—i'r pwyllgor neu mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn—ar y cynnydd ar yr argymhellion hyn. Llawn gymeradwyaf y pwyntiau a wnaeth Mike German ar y mater hwn.

Cafwyd yr ymchwiliad hwn oherwydd pwysau gan Aelodau Plaid Cymru, Jocelyn Davies a Geraint Davies, a dim ond drwy rôl unigryw y comisiynydd plant y bu modd ei gynnal. Fel plaid, yr oeddem yn falch o gyflwyno'r syniad gwreiddiol i gael comisiynydd plant yng Nghymru. Ategwn y nifer fawr o sylwadau a wnaed, a'r ofnau a fynegwyd, y caiff y rôl honno ei gwanhau drwy basio'r Mesur Plant sydd gerbron yn San Steffan ar hyn o bryd. Galwn ar yr holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad i ddwyn pob pwysau posibl i sicrhau y bydd rôl unigryw y comisiynydd plant yn parhau.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cydnabod yr amheuan a fynegwyd ynghylch yr ymchwiliad, ond



feel that the memories of those abused, the contemporary reports of those who worked alongside, and the considerable unease that was expressed by some examiners—which was unfortunately overlooked at the time—justified this inquiry. We offer sympathy to those who were affected, be they young people or colleagues and, in common with many people, inside and outside this Chamber, we are determined that everything possible should be done to implement the recommendations and strengthen them where necessary.

This case highlights several issues apart from the horrendous abuse that occurred. The report details malpractice, cover up and bullying among fellow professionals, and a failure to take seriously complaints made by fellow professionals and young people and their families. It also showed cover ups to protect institutions and, possibly, reputations. It is on those issues that the Assembly must act. It is impossible to say that such things will never happen again, but, as an Assembly, we can ensure that proper procedures are in place to ensure that action is taken swiftly when allegations are made.

We must bear in mind that not all accusations are legitimate—some are, unfortunately, made maliciously. However, a system must be put in place to respond swiftly to allegations. The length of time that people must wait for allegations made against them to be heard is unjustified and is a cause of much concern among professionals. Those who attempt to report cases against fellow professionals must also feel secure that their allegations are taken seriously and are followed up. It is sometimes the case, unfortunately, that bullying among fellow professionals occurs, which prevents many cases being brought to light. Even following the Waterhouse report, we still do not have adequate whistleblowing procedures in place. Those procedures need to be wide ranging and go beyond education and social services into all areas. They need to give confidence to those who feel that they have the need to highlight issues, while protecting those against whom allegations are made until those claims are justified and acted on or dismissed.

teimlwn fod atgofion y rhai a gamdriniwyd, y adroddiadau cyfoes gan gydweithwyr, a'r anesmwythyd mawr a fynegwyd gan rai arholwyr—a anwybyddwyd ar y pryd, gwaetha'r modd—yn cyfiawnhau'r ymchwiliad hwn. Estynnwn ein cydymdeimlad i'r rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt, yn bobl ifanc neu'n gydweithwyr ac, yn yr un modd â llawer o bobl, y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Siambr, yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau y gwneir popeth a ellir i roi'r argymhellion ar waith a'u cryfhau os oes angen.

Mae'r achos hwn yn tynnu sylw at sawl mater heblaw'r gamdriniaeth ofnadwy a ddigwyddodd. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi camarfer, celu a bwlio ymysg cyd-athrawon, a methiant i gymryd o ddifrif cwynion a wnaed gan gydweithwyr proffesiynol a phobl ifanc a'u teuluoedd. Mae hefyd yn dangos bod celu wedi digwydd i amddiffyn sefydliadau ac, o bosibl, enw da. Ar y materion hynny y mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad weithredu. Ni ellir dweud na fydd pethau o'r fath yn digwydd byth eto, ond, fel Cynulliad, gallwn sicrhau bod gweithdrefnau priodol ar waith i ofalu y cymerir camau buan pan wneir honiadau.

Rhaid inni gofio nad yw'r holl gyhuddiadau'n ddilys—gwneir rhai gyda bwriad maleisus, gwaetha'r modd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid rhoi system ar waith i ymateb yn gyflym i honiadau. Ni ellir cyfiawnhau'r cyfnod o amser y mae pobl yn gorfod ei ddisgwyl i wrando cyhuddiadau a wneir yn eu herbyn ac mae hyn yn peri llawer o bryder ymysg gweithwyr proffesiynol. Rhaid hefyd i'r rhai sy'n ceisio adrodd am achosion yn erbyn eu cydweithwyr proffesiynol gael teimlo'n sicr bod eu honiadau'n cael eu cymryd o ddifrif a'u dilyn. Weithiau ceir bwlio ymysg gweithwyr proffesiynol, gwaetha'r modd, ac mae hynny'n rhwystr i ddwyn llawer o achosion i'r amlwg. Hyd yn oed ar ôl adroddiad Waterhouse, yr ydym yn dal i fod heb weithdrefnau digonol i ddatgelu camarfer. Rhaid i'r gweithdrefnau hynny fod yn bellgyrhaeddol a mynd y tu hwnt i addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i gynnwys pob maes. Rhaid iddynt ennyn hyder yn y rhai sy'n teimlo bod rhaid iddynt dynnu sylw at faterion, gan amddiffyn y rhai y gwneir cyhuddiadau yn eu herbyn hyd nes y profir yr

honiadau hynny ac y cymerir camau yn eu cylch neu eu gwrthod.

Many of our schools are close communities, which often include the governors; that is as it should be. However, it creates problems when such instances are reported. Therefore, we feel that any investigation system that is established needs to be independent and capable of delivering speedy responses in which everyone has confidence.

Mae llawer o'n hysgolion yn gymunedau clòs, sydd yn aml yn cynnwys y llywodraethwyr; felly y dylai fod. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n creu problemau pan geir adroddiadau am achosion o'r fath. Felly, teimlwn y dylai unrhyw system ymchwilio a sefydlir fod yn un annibynnol a chanddi'r gallu i roi ymatebion cyflym y mae pawb yn ymddiried ynddynt.

The developing role of the General Teaching Council should also be considered in this respect, as Mike German has said. It performs a monitoring role of professional conduct among registered teachers, which at present does not extend to cases concerning the welfare and safety of children. Plaid Cymru asks the Minister, together with the teaching council, to consider extending its remit to include all matters that might affect the registration of a teacher in Wales.

Dylid ystyried rôl ddatblygol Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru hefyd yn hyn o beth, fel y dywedodd Mike German. Mae'n cyflawni rôl monitro mewn cysylltiad ag ymddygiad proffesiynol athrawon cofrestredig, ond nid yw hynny'n cynnwys achosion sy'n ymwneud â lles a diogelwch plant ar hyn o bryd. Mae Plaid Cymru yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog, ynghyd â'r cyngor addysgu, ystyried ehangu ei gylch gwaith i gynnwys yr holl faterion a allai effeithio ar gofrestrriad athro yng Nghymru.

Until that time there will remain several cases that would warrant further investigation. I draw the Minister's attention to two such alleged cases, one involving alleged incidents of child abuse, bullying and cover up at Coleg Gwent and another involving the alleged cover-up of financial malpractice at Swansea Institute of Higher Education. I will forward the relevant files to the Minister and to the children's commissioner and ask them to establish inquiries into those issues.

Hyd nes y digwydd hynny, bydd sawl achos o hyd a deilynga ymchwilio ymhellach. Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at ddau achos honedig o'r fath, un ohonynt yn ymwneud â digwyddiadau honedig o gam-drin plant, bwlio a chelu yng Ngholeg Gwent ac un arall yn ymwneud â honiad o gelu camarfer ariannol yn Athrofa Addysg Uwch Abertawe. Anfonaf y ffeiliau perthnasol at y Gweinidog ac at y comisiynydd plant a gofyn iddynt gychwyn ymchwiliadau i'r materion hynny.

The WJEC's role is also crucial. It is currently a private, unaccountable company and many of its procedures are criticised in the report. It is essential that the Minister satisfies herself that procedures have been corrected. We owe it to the young people against whom these offences have occurred to ensure that we act on these recommendations swiftly.

Mae rôl CBAC yn hollbwysig. Cwmni preifat anatebol ydyw ar hyn o bryd a beirniadir llawer o'i weithdrefnau yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r Gweinidog gael sicrwydd bod gweithdrefnau wedi'u cywiro. Rhaid inni weithredu'n gyflym ar sail yr argymhellion hyn er mwyn y bobl ifanc y cyflawnwyd y troseddau hyn yn eu herbryn.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I commend the work of Peter Clarke and his team in conducting the inquiry and publishing the report. I contribute to this debate as chair of the safeguarding vulnerable children review group, which has begun to consider evidence that has been made available to it by many interested

**Gwenda Thomas:** Cymeradwyaf waith Peter Clarke a'i dîm wrth gynnal yr ymchwiliad a chyhoeddi'r adroddiad. Cyfrannaf i'r ddadl hon fel cadeirydd grŵp yr adolygiad ar amddiffyn plant sy'n agored i niwed, sydd wedi dechrau ystyried tystiolaeth a roddwyd iddo gan sawl grŵp a chorff sy'n

groups and organisations. The group is unique in that it is proactive rather than reactive and it intends to consider the safeguarding of children across the board. I do not disagree with amendments 5, 6 and 8 in principle, but I will not support them because I believe that they could prove to be too restrictive. Recommendation 21.1 of the children's commissioner's report refers to the need for the wishes of children to be considered, and my review group intends to include children and young people in its work. It is currently consulting with organisations such as Voices from Care and Funky Dragon as to the best way to do that. Evidence already being considered by the group clearly indicates that there is confusion regarding the number of recently published reports, such as the Waterhouse, Carlisle, Bichard, Utting and Laming reports, and the volume of important recommendations that have been made, most of which have been accepted for implementation. Since 1996, several hundred recommendations have been made regarding child protection and keeping up with all of them is a problem. We must now consider the fuller picture by collating all recent recommendations and identifying commonality, and the review group will attempt to do that.

The extent to which these recommendations are implemented must be assessed and the question regarding whether recommendations are being implemented and if not, why not, must be addressed. The joint ministerial response given today to the children's commissioner's important Clywch report must also be considered by the review group and given the serious consideration that it deserves. I suggest that the review group, under its terms of reference, should make recommendations regarding what it considers to be the best way of auditing and monitoring the implementation process and providing counselling services after it has benefited from listening to the views and advice of children and young people.

**Nick Bourne:** I do not intend to make a lengthy contribution, but it is important that we signal our complete support for the approach that both Ministers are taking. It is important that they know that they have the backing of every Assembly Member in the

gysylltiedig. Mae'r grŵp yn un unigryw i'r graddau ei fod yn rhagweithiol yn hytrach nag adweitheddol ac mae'n bwriadu ystyried y gwaith o amddiffyn plant yn gyffredinol. Nid anghytunaf â gwelliannau 5, 6 ac 8 mewn egwyddor, ond nis cefnogaf gan y credaf y gallent fod yn rhy gaethiwus. Mae argymhelliad 21.1 yn adroddiad y comisiynydd plant yn cyfeirio at yr angen i ystyried dymuniadau plant, ac mae fy ngrŵp adolygu'n bwriadu cynnwys plant a phobl ifanc yn ei waith. Mae'n ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd â chyrff fel Voices from Care a'r Ddraig Ffyni ynghylch y modd gorau i wneud hynny. Mae'r dystiolaeth sy'n cael ei hystyried yn barod gan y grŵp yn dangos yn glir fod dryswch oherwydd nifer yr adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, fel adroddiadau Waterhouse, Carlisle, Bichard, Utting a Laming, a nifer yr argymhellion pwysig a wnaed, y derbyniwyd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt i'w rhoi ar waith. Er 1996, gwnaed rhai cannoedd o argymhellion ynghylch amddiffyn plant ac anodd yw cadw golwg ar bob un ohonynt. Rhaid inni ystyried y darlun ehangach yn awr drwy gasglu'r holl argymhellion diweddar a chanfod yr hyn sy'n gyffredin rhyngddynt, a bydd y grŵp adolygu yn ceisio gwneud hynny.

Rhaid asesu'r graddau y rhoddir yr argymhellion hyn ar waith a rhaid gofyn a yw argymhellion yn cael eu rhoi ar waith ac, os nad ydynt, pam. Bydd yn rhaid hefyd i'r grŵp adolygu ystyried y cydymateb a roddwyd heddiw gan Weinidogion i adroddiad Clywch pwysig y comisiynydd plant a rhoi iddo'r ystyriaeth ddifrif y mae'n ei haeddu. Awgrymaf y dylai'r grŵp adolygu, yn unol â'i gylch gorchwyl, wneud argymhellion ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n ei ystyried yn ddull gorau o archwilio a monitro'r broses weithredu ac o ddarparu gwasanaethau cynghori wedi iddo gael y budd o wrando barn a chynngor plant a phobl ifanc.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud cyfraniad hir, ond mae'n bwysig inni ddangos ein cefnogaeth lwyr i ddull gweithredu'r ddau Weinidog. Mae'n bwysig iddynt gael gwybod bod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn eu cefnogi yn y gwaith pwysig

important work that they are undertaking. As others have indicated, we need to applaud the work carried out by the children's commissioner, Peter Clarke, by Maria Battle and the team, sometimes against an impossible background of criticism. They have done a considerable job of work and they deserve our thanks. As has also been said, it gives one pause to consider what would have happened if we did not have a children's commissioner—we might not be in our current position of being able to take necessary action.

We do not have a political angle on this. We will be endorsing the Government's approach, and not noting it, and therefore we will not support amendment 4. I agree with Mike German that it is important that we recognise that people will look to the Assembly to ensure that there is a joint approach on this issue and that Ministers, working with bodies such as the WJEC, local authorities and the media, which must answer for themselves, pull this together and report back to the Assembly so that we know that the appropriate action is being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government. The Ministers have the total support of my group for their approach. All Assembly Members must get behind the Government on this issue and give their total support.

5.00 p.m.

**Irene James:** This is a deeply disturbing report and, without doubt, there are lessons to be learned. Pupils, parents, the community and the teaching profession all have reason to feel betrayed. Of most concern is the fact that the systems designed to protect our children failed, and that is what we must focus on. Serious failings occurred.

I pay tribute to the work of the commissioner and his team. The report further highlights the importance of the children's commissioner's role in working to make Wales a safer place for our children and young people. I welcome the actions taken as part of Gwenda Thomas's review to safeguard vulnerable children.

As someone who has been involved with the

y maent yn ymgymryd ag ef. Fel y dywedodd eraill, dylem ganmol y gwaith a wnaed gan y comisiynydd plant, Peter Clarke, gan Maria Battle a'r tîm, a hynny weithiau yn wyneb beirniadaeth anodd. Gwnaethant waith sylweddol ac maent yn haeddu ein diolch. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes hefyd, mae'n peri i rywun feddwl beth a ddigwyddasai pe na bai gennym gomisiynydd plant—efallai na fyddem yn y sefyllfa bresennol o allu cymryd y camau angenrheidiol.

Nid oes gennym safbwynt gwleidyddol ar hyn. Byddwn yn cymeradwyo dull gweithredu'r Llywodraeth, ac nid yn ei nodi, ac felly ni chefnogwn welliant 4. Cytunaf â Mike German ei bod yn bwysig inni gydnabod y bydd pobl yn disgwyl i'r Cynulliad sicrhau y ceir gweithredu ar y cyd ar y mater hwn ac y bydd Gweinidogion, gan weithio gyda chyrff fel CBAC, awdurdodau lleol a'r cyfryngau, sy'n gorfod ateb drostynt eu hunain, yn rhoi trefn ar hyn ac yn adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad fel y cawn wybod bod camau priodol yn cael eu cymryd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae fy ngrŵp yn cefnogi'r Gweinidogion yn llwyr yn eu dull o weithredu. Rhaid i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad fod yn gefn i'r Llywodraeth ar y mater hwn a'i chefnogi'n llwyr.

**Irene James:** Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn peri pryder mawr ac, yn sicr, mae gwersi i'w dysgu. Mae gan ddisgyblion, rhieni, y gymuned ac athrawon le i deimlo eu bod wedi'u bradychu. Yr hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf yw bod systemau a ddyfeisiwyd i ddiogelu ein plant wedi methu, ac ar hynny y dylem ganolbwyntio. Cafwyd diffygion difrifol.

Talaf deyrnged i waith y comisiynydd a'i dîm. Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw eto at bwysigrwydd rôl y comisiynydd plant wrth ymdrechu i beri i Gymru fod yn lle diogelach i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc. Croesawaf y camau a gymerwyd fel rhan o adolygiad Gwenda Thomas i amddiffyn plant sy'n agored i niwed.

Fel un a fu'n gysylltiedig ag addysg plant ers

education of children for almost 30 years, I will focus on issues raised in the report relating to the teaching profession. It is vital that issues raised by this inquiry are included in the teacher training process, so that staff are fully aware of how abusers operate. School staff need to have the skills and confidence to detect signs of possible abuse and to take action. There is also a need to share information within and between organisations.

We need to address serious issues surrounding how drama is taught and how drama examinations are conducted post Clywch. We have a duty to ensure that children can access independent and confidential help and advice. Whistleblowing policies need to be considered, but I urge the Welsh Assembly Government not to lose sight of the interests of teachers and others who work with children. I recommend that the Welsh Assembly Government continues talking to teachers' representatives and other practitioners about how we can help to support dedicated, professional people to do their jobs and counter the risk of groundless allegations.

We have a duty to consider the inquiry's recommendations and answer the failings that resulted in this sad and distressing situation. We also have a duty to safeguard and protect the welfare of our children and young people.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel Aelodau eraill, yr wyf yn llongyfarch y comisiynydd a'i swyddfa am eu gwaith trylwyr yn yr achos hwn. Dengys yr achos bwysigrwydd amddiffyn annibyniaeth y comisiynydd plant a sicrhau bod ganddo'r gallu i ymwneud â phob elfen o fywydau plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r adroddiad yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd rhoi gwybod i blant a phobl ifanc mai at y comisiynydd plant y dylent droi gan mai ef sy'n diogelu ac yn hyrwyddo eu hawliau. Croesawaf y modd yr ymatebodd y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad a'r modd y derbyniodd fwyafrif helaeth yr argymhellion a'r ffaith y bydd yn ystyried rhai ohonynt ymhellach.

ymron i 30 mlynedd, canolbwytiaf ar faterion a godwyd yn yr adroddiad sy'n ymwneud ag athrawon. Mae'n hollbwysig cynnwys materion a godwyd drwy'r ymchwiliad hwn yn y broses hyfforddi athrawon, fel y bydd staff yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r modd y mae camdrinwyr yn gweithredu. Rhaid i staff ysgol feddu ar y medrau a'r hyder angenrheidiol i ddarganfod arwyddion o gamdriniaeth bosibl ac i gymryd camau. Hefyd mae angen rhannu gwybodaeth oddi mewn i gyrff a chyd-rhyngddynt.

Rhaid inni roi sylw i faterion pwysig sy'n ymwneud â'r dull o ddysgu drama ac o gynnal arholiadau drama yn sgîl ymchwiliad Clywch. Yr ydym dan ddyletswydd i ofalu y gall plant gael cymorth a chyngor annibynnol a chyfrinachol. Rhaid ystyried polisïau ar ddatgelu camarfer, ond anogaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i beidio â cholli golwg ar fuddiannau athrawon ac eraill sy'n gweithio gyda phlant. Yr wyf yn argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru barhau i siarad â chynrychiolwyr athrawon ac ymarferwyr eraill am y modd y gallwn helpu pobl ymroddedig a phroffesiynol i wneud eu gwaith a gwrthweithio'r perygl o gael honiadau di-sail.

Yr ydym dan ddyletswydd i ystyried argymhellion yr ymchwiliad a chywiro'r diffygion a arweiniodd at y sefyllfa drist a gofidus hon. Yr ydym hefyd dan ddyletswydd i warchod a diogelu lles ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I, like other Members, congratulate the commissioner and his office on the thoroughness of their work on this case. The case demonstrates the importance of protecting the commissioner's independence and ensuring that he has the ability to deal with all aspects related to the lives of children and young people. The report emphasises the importance of making children and young people aware of the fact that the children's commissioner safeguards and promotes their rights and that it is to him, therefore, that they should turn. I welcome the Government's response to the report, its acceptance of the vast majority of its recommendations and its willingness to give further consideration to others.

Mae fy unig gonsŷrn yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaethau fydd yn rhoi llais i bobl ifanc a chynnig cyngor iddynt. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar gyfraniad Gwenda Thomas, a chroesawaf sefydlu'r gweithgor a gadeirir ganddi. Yr wyf yn poeni am yr amser a gymer i sefydlu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Deallaf bwyslais Gwenda ar yr angen i fod yn bwyllog, ond nid wyf am weld oedi gormodol gan fod yr adroddiad yn amlygu pwysigrwydd y gwasanaethau a'r angen i'w sefydlu cyn gynted â phosibl. Credaf fod pawb sydd wedi darllen yr adroddiad ac wedi gwrandao ar sut y casglwyd y wybodaeth, nid yn unig yn gresynu at yr hyn a ddigwyddodd, ond wedi ymateb gydag elfen o anghredinedd. Mae'n anodd credu y gallai hyn fod wedi digwydd i gynifer o blant a phobl ifanc dros gyfnod mor hir ac nad oedd mesurau pendant wedi eu cymryd i'w hatal nag i wneud unrhyw un yn atebol tra'r oedd cynifer o bobl yn ymwybodol ohono.

Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod plant a phobl ifanc yn gwybod y bydd y gwasanaethau hyn ar waith cyn gynted â phosibl. Byddwn yn pwysu ar Jane Davidson i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Er enghraifft, mae argymhelliad yma'n nodi y dylid, o fewn tri mis i gyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn, sicrhau bod pob corff llywodraethu yn rhoi gwybod i blant yn ein hysgolion am y math o gymorth sydd ar gael iddynt, sef swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant, y llinellau cymorth, ac elusennau megis yr NSPCC. Ni wn a yw wedi bod yn ymarferol bosibl i wneud hynny eto, ond pwysleisaf y dylai ddigwydd cyn gynted â bo modd. Nid wyf yn beirniadu; deallaf fod problemau ymarferol ynghylch materion o'r fath, ond credaf y dylai'r systemau hyn fod ar waith ar frys.

Mae'n glir o'r adroddiad bod y modd yr aeth y comisiynydd ati i ddelio â'r sefyllfa hon yn dangos bod modd inni gael ymchwiliadau cynhwysfawr o dan ei law. Fel y gwyddom, wedi ymchwiliad Ronald Waterhouse, yr oedd nifer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Anogaf Jane Hutt—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod gan Jane Davidson ddiddordeb yn y maes hwn hefyd—i ystyried gofyn i'r comisiynydd ailystyried y sefyllfa hon. Derbyniaf fod Gwenda Thomas a'i gweithgor yn mynd i roi sylw iddi, ond credaf y gallai'r comisiynydd

My sole concern relates to the services intended to advise young people and give them a voice. I listened carefully to Gwenda Thomas's contribution, and I welcome the establishment of the working group under her chairmanship. I am concerned about the length of time it will take to establish these services. I appreciate Gwenda's emphasis on the need to take considered action, but I do not want to see excessive delay because the report stresses the importance of these services and the need to establish them as soon as possible. I think that all those who have read the report and listened to how the information was gathered, not only deplore what happened, but have responded with a sense of incredulity. It is difficult to believe that this could have happened to so many children and young people over such a long period of time and that no specific measures were put in place to stop it and to hold someone to account when so many people were aware of it.

It is extremely important that children and young people know that these services will be in place as soon as possible. I urge Jane Davidson to ensure that that happens. For example, one recommendation notes that, within three months of the report's publication, every governing body should let children in schools know about the help available to them, such as the children's commissioner's office, the helplines, and charities such as the NSPCC. I do not know whether it has been practicably possible to do that yet, but I emphasise that it should happen as soon as possible. I am not being critical; I understand that there are practical problems regarding such matters, but I believe that these mechanisms should be put in place as a matter of urgency.

It is clear from the report that the way in which the commissioner dealt with this situation shows that we can undertake comprehensive inquiries under his guidance. As we know, several questions remained unanswered following Ronald Waterhouse's inquiry. I encourage Jane Hutt—and I am sure that Jane Davidson has an interest in this matter—to consider asking the commissioner to reconsider this situation. I accept that Gwenda Thomas and her working group will be focusing on it, but I believe that the

ailystyried y materion hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn teimlo bod y pwyntiau a godwyd wedi cael ystyriaeth lawn.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad ac ymateb cadarnhaol y Gweinidog. Cais sydd gennyf felly i weithredu'r mesurau hyn gyda'r brys mwyaf posibl.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The commissioner's conclusions that certain adults in authority failed to protect children from abuse and failed to deal appropriately with their allegations are deeply concerning. From the outset, the Welsh Assembly Government has worked hard to protect children from such predators, which is why it has been committed to ensuring that hard reforms are implemented and strong lessons are learnt. It goes without saying that the report makes for extremely difficult reading. There are lessons for all of us here. The police, school staff and governors, the WJEC—I would remind the Assembly that I am a former employee of the WJEC—and the media can all take clear lessons from the commissioner's findings.

As Jane Davidson said, there are six core themes to the report and it is vital that these key issues are acted upon. The most important theme is the up-skilling of school staff so that they can detect signs of abuse early and take immediate action. It is also vital for robust systems to be put in place to facilitate rather than impede the sharing of information between organisations and, finally, it is vital for children to be able to access independent, confidential help and advice.

The Assembly Government has already acted on the report's recommendations. There is clearly more to do, but it would be churlish not to recognise that fact and demand more of the same. For example, the commissioner requested that the Government issue guidance within 12 months of the report's publication on how allegations of child abuse made against school staff be investigated. It is welcome that this month, guidance was issued to governing bodies on this very issue.

It is important that we create an environment

commissioner should reconsider these matters to ensure that people feel that the points raised were given full consideration.

I welcome the report and the Minister's positive response. I therefore request that these measures be implemented as a matter of the greatest urgency.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae casgliadau'r comisiynydd bod rhai oedolion mewn awdurdod wedi methu ag amddiffyn plant rhag camdriniaeth ac wedi methu â delio'n briodol â'u honiadau'n peri pryder mawr. O'r cychwyn, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gweithio'n galed i amddiffyn plant rhag rheibwyr o'r fath, a dyna pam yr ymrwymodd i sicrhau y ceir diwygiadau cadarn ac y dysgir gwersi pendant. Afraid dweud bod yr adroddiad yn ddeunydd darllen annymunol iawn. Mae gwersi i bob un ohonom yma. Gall yr heddlu, staff a llywodraethwyr ysgol, CBAC—yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Cynulliad fy mod yn gyn-weithiwr i CBAC—a'r cyfryngau oll ddysgu gwersi pendant o ddarganfyddiadau'r comisiynydd.

Fel y dywedodd Jane Davidson, mae chwe thema ganolog yn yr adroddiad ac mae'n hollbwysig gweithredu ynghylch y materion allweddol hyn. Y thema bwysicaf yw gwella medrau staff ysgol fel y gallant ddarganfod arwyddion o gamdriniaeth yn gynnar a chymryd camau ar unwaith. Mae hefyd yn hanfodol rhoi systemau cadarn ar waith i hwyluso yn hytrach na rhwystro'r rhannu ar wybodaeth rhwng cyrff ac, yn olaf, mae'n hollbwysig i blant allu cael cymorth a chyngor annibynnol a chyfrinachol.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes wedi gweithredu ar sail argymhellion yr adroddiad. Mae'n amlwg bod mwy i'w wneud, ond anfoesgar fyddai peidio â chydabod hynny a mynnu rhagor o weithredu tebyg. Er enghraifft, gofynnodd y comisiynydd am gyhoeddi canllawiau gan y Llywodraeth cyn pen 12 mis ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad ynghylch y dull o ymchwilio i honiadau o gam-drin plant yn erbyn staff ysgol. Mae i'w groesawu fod canllawiau wedi'u rhoi y mis hwn i gyrff llywodraethu ar yr union fater hwn.

Mae'n bwysig inni greu amgylchedd diogel

of safety for children. They must be free to be taught in safety and protected from harm, whatever its source. I am confident that the Assembly Government's reforms will correct the failures of our child protection services and ensure that the appropriate mechanisms are in place to safeguard children in the future.

5.10 p.m.

As a former employee of the WJEC, I welcome the establishment of a steering group to investigate what role examining bodies across the UK have with regard to child safety and protection and I look forward to its publication next July. The commissioner also calls for a national strategy to enable a provision for independent children's counselling services. The establishment of an advocacy unit this autumn is therefore good news. I hope that the group will ensure that services are effective and seamless in their aim of protecting children from harm. However, I stress that we must not overreact and do anything that damages the otherwise excellent work that is being done by schools and colleges with regard to teaching drama. In broad terms, the children's commissioner has conducted this report with complete independence. His aim was to ensure that children's voices influence our actions and the actions of the Assembly Government. It is clear today that the Assembly Government is 100 per cent committed to setting the mechanisms in place so that similar unacceptable failures do not, and cannot, happen again.

**Kirsty Williams:** When those of us who were here during the Assembly's first term were dealing with the creation of the children's commissioner post, and when we bestowed the powers to hold individual investigations upon that particular post, we did so in the hope, rather than in the expectation, that those powers would never need to be used. It is devastating, when reading this report, to discover how right the Assembly was to give those powers to the commissioner and how our hopes that those powers would never have to be used were cruelly dashed, but it was not as cruel as the treatment that was dished out to many

i'n plant. Rhaid iddynt fod yn rhydd i gael eu dysgu mewn diogelwch a chael eu hamddiffyn rhag niwed, o ba le bynnag y daw. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd diwygiadau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cywiro diffygion ein gwasanaethau amddiffyn plant ac yn sicrhau bod dulliau gweithredu priodol ar waith i ddiogelu plant yn y dyfodol.

Fel un o gyn-weithwyr CBAC, croesawaf sefydlu grŵp llywio i ymchwilio i rôl cyrff arholi ledled y DU mewn cysylltiad â diogelwch ac amddiffyn plant ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei gyhoeddiad fis Gorffennaf nesaf. Mae'r comisiynydd yn galw hefyd am strategaeth genedlaethol fel y gellir darparu gwasanaethau cynghori annibynnol ar gyfer plant. Gan hynny, mae sefydlu uned eiriolaeth yr hydref hwn yn newydd da. Gobeithiaf y bydd y grŵp yn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau'n effeithiol ac yn ddi-fwlch er mwyn cyflawni eu hamcan o amddiffyn plant rhag niwed. Er hynny, pwysleisiaf na ddylem orymateb na gwneud dim sy'n amharu ar y gwaith rhagorol a wneir fel arall gan ysgolion a cholegau, mewn cysylltiad â dysgu drama. A siarad yn gyffredinol, mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi paratoi'r adroddiad hwn yn gwbl annibynnol. Ei nod oedd sicrhau bod llais plant yn dylanwadu ar ein gweithredoedd ni a gweithredoedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n amlwg heddiw fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwbl ymroddedig i roi dulliau gweithredu ar waith fel na cheir methiannau annerbyniol tebyg yn y dyfodol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Pan fu'r rhai ohonom a oedd yma yn ystod tymor cyntaf y Cynulliad yn trafod sefydlu swydd y comisiynydd plant, a phan roesom y pwerau i gynnal ymchwiliadau penodol i'r swydd honno, gwnaethom hynny gan obeithio, yn hytrach na disgwyl, na fyddai byth angen defnyddio'r pwerau hynny. Teimlad ysgytwol, wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad, yw darganfod mor gywir y gweithredodd y Cynulliad wrth roi'r pwerau hynny i'r comisiynydd ac mor greulon y chwalwyd ein gobeithion na fyddai byth raid defnyddio'r pwerau hynny, ond nid oedd hynny mor greulon â'r driniaeth a gafodd llawer o blant a'u rhieni.



children and their parents.

I will concentrate in particular on the Liberal Democrat amendment that calls for an annual review of how we take forward the recommendations, not only of this report, but of the many other reports that we have seen and read. I will focus in particular on the recommendations with regard to a national strategy for counselling for children and the provision of information and advocacy services for children in Wales. We all wrung our hands here when we debated the 'Lost in Care' report and said that we would never allow anything like that to happen here in Wales again and that we would take the recommendations seriously and act upon them and not let people down. However, the last time that the Welsh Local Government Association came to the Health and Social Services Committee to comment on how it was implementing 'Lost in Care', we learnt that only seven of the 22 local authorities at that time had acted upon one of the report's key recommendations, namely that there should be an independent, dedicated children's complaints officer in each council. That is despite, as I said, the hand wringing and the goodwill that was shown by local authorities and the Assembly at that particular time.

My main concern about this report is what will happen to these recommendations and what the Minister will do to ensure that those partners and bodies over which the Assembly has direct control take these recommendations seriously and act upon them. I have seen nothing since the publication of 'Lost in Care' to show me that organisations sometimes take these recommendations seriously. While I agree, Gwenda, that we have had a plethora of recommendations and that it is difficult to keep track of them, that is not an excuse for the Assembly not to try to do so. It is vital that we have a mechanism in place to ensure that authorities and bodies do more than pay lip service to these recommendations and that they act upon them.

On counselling and advocacy, there are some

Canolbwyntiaf ar y gwelliant o eiddo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n galw am adolygiad blynyddol o'r modd y trafodwn yr argymhellion a geir, nid yn unig yn yr adroddiad hwn, ond yn y nifer mawr o adroddiadau eraill yr ydym wedi'u gweld a'u darllen. Ymdriniaf yn benodol â'r argymhellion sy'n ymwneud â strategaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer cynghori i blant a darparu gwasanaethau gwybodaeth ac eiriolaeth ar gyfer plant yng Nghymru. Gwnaethom oll wasgu'n dwylo pan gawsom ddafl ar adroddiad 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal' a dweud na wnaem byth adael i ddim tebyg ddigwydd yma yng Nghymru eto ac y cymerem yr argymhellion o ddifrif a gweithredu ar eu sail a pheidio â siomi pobl. Fodd bynnag, y tro diwethaf y daeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ddweud sut yr oedd yn rhoi 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal' ar waith, cawsom wybod mai dim ond saith o'r 22 o awdurdodau lleol a oedd wedi gweithredu, bryd hynny, ar un o brif argymhellion yr adroddiad, sef y dylid cael swyddog cwynion annibynnol neilltuedig ar gyfer plant ym mhob cyngor. Fel y dywedais, mae hynny er gwaethaf y gwasgu dwylo a'r ewyllys da a amlygwyd gan awdurdodau lleol a'r Cynulliad ar y pryd.

Yr hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf i mi ynghylch yr adroddiad hwn yw beth a ddigwydd i'r argymhellion hyn a beth a wnaiff y Gweinidog i sicrhau y bydd y partneriaid a'r cyrff hynny y mae'r Cynulliad yn eu rheoli'n uniongyrchol yn cymryd yr argymhellion hyn o ddifrif ac yn gweithredu ar eu sail. Ni welais ddim ers cyhoeddi 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal' i ddangos bod cyrff yn cymryd yr argymhellion hyn o ddifrif mewn unrhyw fodd. Er fy mod yn cytuno, Gwenda, inni gael gormodedd o argymhellion ac mai anodd yw cadw golwg arnynt, nid yw hynny'n esgus i'r Cynulliad beidio â cheisio gwneud hynny. Mae'n hollbwysig inni roi dull gweithredu ar waith i sicrhau bod awdurdodau a chyrff yn gwneud mwy na thalu gwasanaeth gwefusau i'r argymhellion hyn a'u bod yn gweithredu ar eu sail.

Ynghylch cynghori ac eiriolaeth, ceir rhai

wonderful advocacy schemes in Wales that provide wonderful services for children, but the services that children and young people receive depends upon where they happen to live and whether they are lucky enough to live in an area where these services are available. That is not good enough. Abuse exists in all parts of Wales—it is no respecter of boundaries or social class—and we must ensure that there is adequate advocacy for children across the nation. We must also ensure that complaints officers are present in local authorities. They are not there to deal solely with complaints from people who are in the direct care of local authorities. They could deal with all kinds of complaints that children may have and it would be an obvious place of contact for a parent or a child if they were concerned about issues at school.

On counselling, we have long discussed the inadequacies of children and adolescent mental health services in Wales. Counselling at an early stage can prevent children from having to enter that more intensive system later on—a system that really is not there for them to enter in the first place. If we put in place counselling that children can access in schools and communities, we will go a long way towards addressing the serious mental health issues that many of our young people face today. It is a challenging agenda to respond to, I appreciate that, but my main concern is that we had a similar debate here when we looked at ‘Lost in Care’ and I am not convinced that we have adequately responded, as a nation, to that report.

It boils down to how much respect we, as a society, give to young people, and how we regard and value young people. I sometimes think, especially in the last week, that we regard animal welfare as more important than children’s welfare. One wonders why we do not have people marching up and down when it comes to failures in child protection. That is not to make a political point about other issues: I am just saying that, as a society, we still grapple with how we respect and value young people. When one reads this report, one realises that we are letting our young people down again, and I hope that the

cynlluniau eiriolaeth gwych yng Nghymru sy’n darparu gwasanaethau gwych i blant, ond mae’r gwasanaethau y mae plant a phobl ifanc yn eu cael yn amrywio yn ôl y man y maent yn byw ac a ydynt yn ddigon ffodus i fyw mewn ardal lle y mae’r gwasanaethau hynny ar gael. Nid yw hynny’n ddigon da. Ceir camdriniaeth ym mhob rhan o Gymru—nid yw’n parchu ffiniau na dosbarthiadau cymdeithasol—a rhaid inni sicrhau bod eiriolaeth ddigonol ar gyfer plant ledled y wlad. Rhaid inni ofalu hefyd fod swyddogion cwynion ar gael mewn awdurdodau lleol. Maent yn gwneud mwy na delio â chwynion gan rai sy’n derbyn gofal uniongyrchol gan awdurdodau lleol. Gallent ddelio â phob math o gwynion gan blant a byddent yn bwynt cyswllt amlwg ar gyfer rhiant neu blentyn os oeddent yn bryderus ynghylch materion a oedd yn codi yn yr ysgol.

Ynghylch cynghori, buom yn trafod diffygion gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar gyfer plant a’r glasod yng Nghymru ers amser maith. Drwy ddarparu cynghori yn gynnar, gellir dileu’r angen i blant fynd i mewn i’r system ddwysach honno’n ddiweddarach—system nad yw ar gael iddynt yn y lle cyntaf, mewn gwirionedd. Os darparwn gynghori y gall plant ei dderbyn mewn ysgolion a chymunedau, gwnawn lawer i ymdrin â’r materion difrifol o ran iechyd meddwl y mae llawer o’n pobl ifanc yn eu hwynebu heddiw. Mae’n agenda ymestynnol, yr wyf yn sylweddoli hynny, ond yr hyn sy’n peri’r pryder mwyaf i mi yw inni gael dadl debyg yma pan ystyriasom ‘Ar Goll mewn Gofal’ ac nid wyf yn argyhoeddedig ein bod wedi ymateb yn ddigonol, fel cenedl, i’r adroddiad hwnnw.

Yn y bôn, mae hyn yn ymwneud â maint y parch a ddangoswn, fel cymdeithas, at bobl ifanc, a’r meddwl sydd gennym ohonynt. Byddaf yn meddwl weithiau, yn enwedig yn yr wythnos a aeth heibio, ein bod yn gweld lles anifeiliaid yn bwysicach na lles plant. Mae rhywun yn meddwl tybed pam na welwn bobl yn goymdeithio ynghylch methiannau wrth amddiffyn plant. Nid wyf yn gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol am faterion eraill wrth ddweud hynny: nid wyf ond yn dweud ein bod ni, fel cymdeithas, yn dal i ymgodymu â’r modd yr ydym yn parchu pobl ifanc. Wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad hwn, mae rhywun yn

Government will think carefully about how it can monitor the implementation of these recommendations.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I endorse the comments made by all colleagues, from all parts of the Assembly, about the commissioner's work and how much we value his contribution in what has been an extremely difficult and highly sensitive case. I also applaud the way in which the Government has responded, positively in the main, to the recommendations that the commissioner has made.

I will confine my remarks to a few of the recommendations and refer in particular to amendment 7, which refers to the investigatory process. Before that, I will deal with the recommendation to set up four new independent tribunals. The principle of having an independent tribunal should be sacrosanct. When allegations are made about highly sensitive matters such as child abuse—particularly in the context of this case—once an independent tribunal has been set up, you know that not only will justice be done, it will be seen to be done, because the tribunal is totally independent of the parties. It is an excellent idea. For my part, in terms of the practice, I cannot see why it is necessary to have four independent tribunals: you could have one tribunal with members from many different parts of Wales, so that if the tribunal is sitting in north-east Wales it can use representatives from that area. It is not necessary to have four tribunals. I understand the necessity for the Government to look at the implications of that, in terms of other stakeholders, but, as an overriding principle, the establishment of a tribunal should be sacrosanct.

On an earlier stage in the proceedings, the investigatory procedure, I disagree with the commissioner and I have told him my views. He has said that you can have an independent tribunal, but has suggested that responsibility for proceeding with the investigation should lie with the local education authority. What was the problem with the investigation that led to the commissioner's inquiry? The local

sylweddoli ein bod yn siomi ein pobl ifanc eto, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ystyried yn ofalus y modd y gall arolygu'r gwaith o weithredu'r argymhellion hyn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Cymeradwyaf y sylwadau a wnaed gan fy holl gyd-Aelodau, o bob rhan o'r Cynulliad, am waith y comisiynydd a chymaint yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi ei gyfraniad i'r hyn a fu'n achos anodd a thra sensitif. Cymeradwyaf hefyd y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb, a hynny'n gadarnhaol gan mwyaf, i'r argymhellion a wnaeth y comisiynydd.

Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i rai o'r argymhellion a chyfeirio'n benodol at welliant 7, sy'n cyfeirio at y broses ymchwilio. Cyn hynny, ymdriniaf â'r argymhelliad i sefydlu pedwar tribiwnlys annibynnol newydd. Dylai'r egwyddor o gael tribiwnlys annibynnol fod yn annhoradwy. Pan wneir honiadau ynghylch materion tra sensitif fel cam-drin plant—yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun yr achos hwn—ar ôl sefydlu tribiwnlys annibynnol, gwyddys nid yn unig y gwneir cyfiawnder, ond y gwelir i gyfiawnder gael ei wneud, gan fod y tribiwnlys yn gwbl annibynnol ar y partion. Mae'n syniad rhagorol. O'm rhan i, ynghylch y dull o'i roi ar waith, ni welaf pam y mae angen cael pedwar tribiwnlys annibynnol: gellid cael un tribiwnlys ac arno aelodau o lawer gwahanol ran o Gymru, fel y bydd y tribiwnlys, os yw'n eistedd yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, yn gallu defnyddio cynrychiolwyr o'r ardal honno. Nid oes rhaid cael pedwar tribiwnlys. Yr wyf yn deall yr angen i'r Llywodraeth ystyried goblygiadau hynny, mewn cysylltiad â rhanddeiliaid eraill, ond, fel egwyddor sylfaenol, dylai'r amcan o sefydlu tribiwnlys fod yn annhoradwy.

Ynghylch cam cynharach yn y trafodion, y weithdrefn ymchwilio, yr wyf yn anghytuno â'r comisiynydd ac yr wyf wedi rhoi gwybod iddo am fy marn. Mae wedi dweud y gellir cael tribiwnlys annibynnol, ond mae wedi awgrymu y dylai'r cyfrifoldeb dros fynd ymlaen â'r ymchwiliad fod yn nwylo'r awdurdod addysg lleol. Beth oedd o'i le ar yr ymchwilio a arweiniodd at ymchwiliad y

education authority had difficulties in acting quickly on the concerns of the children and their parents—complaints were made and they were not acted upon. I have always believed that where you have highly sensitive cases—I say this not only as an Assembly Member, but as someone who has been professionally involved in highly sensitive cases involving young children and vulnerable adults—you must have confidence in the integrity of the system. Once a complaint is made, that not only protects the person who makes the complaint, it also protects the innocent against whom bogus complaints are made, because the investigatory procedure and the tribunal are both independent. Minister, I ask you to not only look at the position of the independent tribunal, but also at the investigatory process. If we are to build a system that is robust, defensible and which can be seen to be just, then we need to do both.

5.20 p.m.

**Brynle Williams:** I take this opportunity to pay tribute to Mr Peter Clarke and his team, as many others have done, for their sterling work. It has given Members and the public plenty of data on which to base informed opinions about the whole sorry state of affairs. The commissioner's report states:

'No-one who heard the evidence I have heard in my Inquiry could, in good faith, harbour any doubts that Mr John Owen was guilty of serious acts of sexual impropriety against some pupils at Ysgol Gyfun Rhydfele. The evidence I have heard has established, on the balance of probabilities, that Mr Owen sexually abused pupils in his care over a number of years.

The Terms of Reference of my Inquiry do not require me to go further'.

That last line says it all. The terms of reference should have been broader and have allowed the commissioner to delve further and have the opportunity to investigate other named people who have had allegations made against them in the inquiry. We owe it to everyone involved, and to children in general, to ensure that all allegations are investigated, and that appropriate action is taken. We must

comisiynydd? Yr oedd yr awdurdod addysg lleol wedi'i chael yn anodd cymryd camau buan ynghylch pryderon y plant a'u rhieni—gwnaed cwynion ac ni weithredwyd yn eu cylch. Yr wyf wedi credu erioed, pan geir achosion tra sensitif—a dywedaf hyn nid yn unig fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad, ond fel un a fu'n ymwneud yn broffesiynol ag achosion tra sensitif a oedd yn gysylltiedig â phlant ifanc ac oedolion a oedd yn agored i niwed—rhaid gallu ymddiried yn uniondeb y system. Ar ôl gwneud cwyn, mae hynny'n amddiffyn y sawl a wnaeth y gŵyn, yn ogystal â rhai dieuog y gwneir cwynion ffug amdanynt, gan fod y weithdrefn ymchwilio a'r tribiwnlys ill dau'n annibynnol. Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi nid yn unig i ystyried lle'r tribiwnlys annibynnol, ond y broses ymchwilio hefyd. Os ydym i greu system sy'n gadarn, y gellir ei chyfiawnhau ac y gellir gweld ei bod yn gyfiawn, rhaid inni gael y ddau.

**Brynle Williams:** Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i Mr Peter Clarke a'i dîm, fel y gwnaeth llawer un arall, am eu gwaith ardderchog. Mae wedi rhoi digon o ddata i Aelodau ac i'r cyhoedd i ffurfio barn wybodus am y sefyllfa drist hon. Dywed adroddiad y comisiynydd:

'Ni all unrhyw un a glywodd y dystiolaeth a glywais i yn fy Ymchwiliad amau, â didwylledd, fod Mr John Owen yn euog o weithredoedd o anweddustra rhywiol difrifol yn erbyn rhai disgyblion yn Ysgol Gyfun Rhydfele. Mae'r dystiolaeth a glywais wedi dangos i Mr Owen, yn ôl pwysau tebygolrwydd, gam-drin disgyblion yn ei ofal yn rhywiol dros nifer o flynyddoedd.

Yn ôl Cylch Gorchwyl fy Ymchwiliad, nid yw'n ofynnol i mi fynd ymhellach'.

Mae'r frawddeg olaf yn dweud y cwbl. Dylasai'r cylch gorchwyl fod yn ehangach a bod wedi caniatáu i'r comisiynydd gloddio ymhellach a chael cyfle i ymchwilio ynghylch eraill a enwyd y gwnaed honiadau yn eu herbyn yn yr ymchwiliad. Er mwyn pawb a fu'n gysylltiedig, a phlant yn gyffredinol, rhaid inni sicrhau yr ymchwilir i'r holl honiadau, ac y cymerir camau

send out a strong signal to the people of Wales that we strongly support the work of the commissioner, and give him the opportunity to continue to undertake detailed work as and when necessary and without political interference.

I fully support Jonathan Morgan's amendment and hope that all party groups can vote with their conscience and not with their party line. This should not be a political issue, as we have heard said from all sides of the Chamber, and if we are to succeed in protecting young people from potential dangers, then we need to embrace all the recommendations and work together to ensure that a situation like this never happens again. It would be wonderful if a message could be sent from the Chamber this afternoon that every Member supports a further investigation into anyone implicated in negligence in their duties who is still working in the education sector. We must not allow children to be put at risk in their schools. If there are any elements of doubt over a person's conduct in this whole matter, then he or she must be investigated. I urge all Members to support the amendment.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As all other speakers have done, I, too, pay tribute to the commissioner and his team for their marvellous work under sometimes difficult circumstances. This inquiry clearly shows the effectiveness and independence of our commissioner, and I am sure that we as an Assembly are proud of him and his team and of what they have achieved.

I utterly refute any suggestion made anywhere that this inquiry was anything other than completely transparent and fair. Also, this inquiry gives the lie to any suggestion that might have been made in another place that our commissioner is anything other than highly effective and courageous, and demonstrates that he and his team are excellent value for money. It is vital that nothing should undermine our commissioner and his team in future. We remain concerned about the relationship with the new Children's Commissioner for England with regard to non-devolved matters and the effects that the Children Bill may have. That

priodol. Rhaid inni anfon neges glir at bobl Cymru ein bod yn cefnogi gwaith y comisiynydd i'r carn, a rhoi cyfle iddo barhau â gwaith manwl yn ôl yr angen a heb ymyrraeth wleidyddol.

Llwyf gefnogaf welliant Jonathan Morgan a gobeithiaf y bydd yr holl grwpiau plaid yn gallu pleidleisio yn ôl eu cydwybod ac nid yn ôl safbwynt eu plaid. Ni ddylai hyn fod yn fater gwleidyddol, fel y clywsom ddweud o bob ochr i'r Siambr, ac os ydym i lwyddo i ddiogelu pobl ifanc rhag peryglon posibl, rhaid inni groesawu'r holl argymhellion a chydweithio i sicrhau na fydd sefyllfa fel hon yn codi byth eto. Byddai'n wych os gellid anfon neges o'r Siambr y prynhawn yma i ddweud bod pob Aelod o blaid cael ymchwiliad pellach ynghylch unrhyw un sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn a esgeulusodd ei ddyletswyddau ac sy'n dal i weithio yn y sector addysg. Rhaid inni beidio â chaniatáu i blant gael eu rhoi mewn perygl yn eu hysgolion. Os oes unrhyw amheuaeth ynghylch ymddygiad rhywun yn y mater hwn drwyddo draw, rhaid ymchwilio yn ei gylch. Anogaf yr holl Aelodau i gefnogi'r gwelliant.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fel y gwnaeth yr holl siaradwyr eraill, yr wyf finnau'n talu teyrnged i'r comisiynydd a'i dîm am y gwaith rhagorol a wnaethant a hynny weithiau o dan amgylchiadau anodd. Mae'r ymchwiliad hwn yn dangos yn glir fod ein comisiynydd yn effeithiol ac yn annibynnol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni fel Cynulliad yn ymfalchïo ynddo ef a'i dîm a'r hyn a gyflawnasant.

Llwyf wrthodaf unrhyw awgrym a wnaed yn unman nad oedd yr ymchwiliad hwn yn un cwbl dryloyw a theg. Hefyd, mae'r ymchwiliad hwn yn gwrthbrofi unrhyw awgrym a allai fod wedi'i wneud mewn man arall nad yw ein comisiynydd yn dra effeithiol ac eofn, ac mae'n dangos ei fod ef a'i dîm yn rhoi gwerth rhagorol am arian. Mae'n hollbwysig nad oes dim yn tansilio ein comisiynydd a'i dîm yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym yn dal i fod yn bryderus ynghylch y berthynas â'r Comisiynydd Plant newydd dros Loegr mewn cysylltiad â materion nas datganolwyd ac effeithiau posibl y Mesur Plant. Fodd bynnag, wedi dweud hynny, yr

said, however, we have clearly demonstrated here that we can be proud of the fact that our commissioner has the right to establish inquiries without reference to Ministers. I believe that the Government Ministers strongly believe that that is the right approach for us to have taken in Wales, and I endorse Mike German's remarks in the hope that an English commissioner in future may gain similar independent powers.

I regret that the Ministers feel unable to accept our amendments, which were tabled in a supportive spirit. We are glad, however, that their overall response is so positive, and I am sure that, given their previous track record, no-one will be surprised, and we welcome that. I would like the Minister, in her summing up, to give further assurances on three specific points, if she feels able to do so.

First, I want the Minister to address the issues raised for the Assembly on this matter because of the relatively unaccountable nature of the WJEC. In their written response, the Ministers can only say, quite properly, that this is a matter for the WJEC, which is a real problem. However, in her opening address, the Minister said that the Government will liaise with the other bodies to which recommendations are made, and I ask that those in relation to the WJEC are carried out in the most robust manner possible.

On the Conservative amendment 1, will the Minister assure us that the Government will seek to ensure that anyone implicated in this matter in relation to negligence in their duties, who is still working in the education sector, will be fully investigated? That is vital if we are to have any credibility and if this report is to be taken forward effectively.

I would also like the Minister to assure us that the Assembly will receive regular reports on the implementation of these recommendations and that those reports will be made to the appropriate committees in detail but also to the Assembly as a whole, either on a six-monthly or on a 12-monthly

ydym wedi dangos yn glir yma y gallwn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith bod hawl gan ein comisiynydd i gychwyn ymchwiliadau heb droi at Weinidogion. Credaf fod Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth yn credu'n gryf mai hwn yw'r dull gweithredu priodol i ni yng Nghymru, ac ategaf sylwadau Mike German gan obeithio y bydd comisiynydd yn Lloegr yn cael pwerau annibynnol tebyg yn y dyfodol.

Mae'n ofid imi fod y Gweinidogion yn teimlo na allant dderbyn ein gwelliannau, a gyflwynwyd o ran cefnogaeth. Yr ydym yn falch, er hynny, fod eu hymateb cyffredinol mor gadarnhaol, ac yr wyf yn sicr, yng ngolwg eu hanes blaenorol, na fydd neb yn synnu at hynny, a chroesawn hynny. Byddwn yn falch pe byddai'r Gweinidog, wrth grynhoi, yn rhoi sicrwydd pellach ar dri phwynt penodol, os yw'n teimlo y gall wneud hynny.

Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog ymdrin â'r materion a ddygwyd i sylw'r Cynulliad mewn cysylltiad â hyn oherwydd natur gymharol anatebol CBAC. Yn eu hymateb ysgrifenedig, ni all y Gweinidogion ond dweud, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, mai mater i CBAC yw hyn, ac mae hynny'n peri problem wirioneddol. Fodd bynnag, yn ei hanerchiad agoriadol, dywedodd y Gweinidog y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cysylltu â'r cyrff eraill y rhoddir argymhellion iddynt, a gofynnaf am weithredu ar y rhai sy'n ymwneud â CBAC yn y modd cadarnaf posibl.

Ynghylch gwelliant 1 y Ceidwadwyr, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ceisio sicrhau yr ymchwiler yn llawn ynghylch unrhyw un sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn oherwydd esgeuluso ei ddyletswyddau sy'n dal i weithio yn y sector addysg? Mae hynny'n hollbwysig os ydym i gael unrhyw hygredd ac os yw'r adroddiad hwn i gael ei drafod yn effeithiol.

Carwn hefyd i'r Gweinidog ein sicrhau y bydd y Cynulliad yn cael adroddiadau rheolaidd ar weithredu'r argymhellion hyn ac y rhoddir adroddiadau manwl i'r pwyllgorau perthnasol a hefyd i'r Cynulliad cyfan, un ai bob chwe mis neu'n flynyddol. Yr ydym ni'n credu, oherwydd cymhlethdod a natur y

basis. We believe that, given the complexity and the nature of the issue, this should happen every six months. However, we must have a commitment to regular reporting.

I associate myself with many of Kirsty Williams's comments about some of the commitments that we have had in the past in relation to action that has or has not been taken. These are incredibly complicated matters, but I believe that, as an Assembly, we are all responsible for doing everything possible to ensure that, as far as is possible, such abuse—and I do not believe that any of us who read this report can have failed to be moved and deeply distressed by what we heard of the abuse and of the process of not being believed through which the children and parents had to go—is prevented in future and that when it occurs, and, sadly, we must accept that it may, it is exposed, investigated and stopped at once.

As a party, we welcome the lead that the National Assembly Government is taking in this regard, but the Assembly as a whole needs to take responsibility, and we must be sure that we can scrutinise the process. This is all of our business.

**Jonathan Morgan:** In the brief time that I have, I will congratulate the children's commissioner, as other colleagues have done, and his team in particular, but also thank the Queen's counsel to the inquiry, Mr Nicholas Cooke QC, for his expertise. In dealing with perhaps the most difficult of subject matters, this inquiry has outlined the gravity of the background to this matter. The seriousness of the recommendations that we have been given to consider demands the utmost urgency in terms of their implementation.

When considering a report of this nature, it is difficult to refer to all of the recommendations. Jeff Cuthbert has already referred to two that caught my eye, namely recommendations 21.29 and 21.30, relating to the need for a national strategy for the provision of an independent counselling service and to the promotion of the services that have a relationship with children, namely the NSPCC, ChildLine and so on, among young people in our schools so that they are

mater hwn, y dylai hynny ddigwydd bob chwe mis. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gael ymrwymiad i adrodd yn rheolaidd.

Ategef lawer o'r sylwadau a wnaeth Kirsty Williams ynghylch rhai o'r ymrwymadau a gawsom yn y gorffennol mewn cysylltiad â champau sydd wedi'u cymryd neu sydd heb eu cymryd. Materion anhygoel o gymhleth yw'r rhain, ond credaf fod cyfrifoldeb gennym i gyd, fel Cynulliad, i wneud popeth posibl i sicrhau, hyd y bo modd, y bydd camdriniaeth o'r fath—ac yr wyf yn sicr bod pob un ohonom a ddarllenodd yr adroddiad hwn wedi'i ysgwyd a'i dristáu'n ddirfawr gan yr hyn a glywsom am y cam-drin a'r profiad o beidio â chael eu credu a gafodd y plant a'r rhieni—yn cael ei hatal yn y dyfodol a phan ddigwydd, a, gwaetha'r modd, rhaid inni dderbyn y gallai ddigwydd, y caiff ei datgelu, y bydd ymchwilio iddi ac y rhoir terfyn arni ar unwaith.

Fel plaid, croesawn yr arweiniad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei roi yn hyn o beth, ond rhaid i'r Cynulliad ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb fel cyfangorff, a rhaid inni sicrhau y gallwn graffu ar y broses. Mae hynny'n fater i bob un ohonom.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf, llongyfarchaf y comisiynydd plant, fel y gwnaeth cyd-Aelodau eraill, a'i dîm yn benodol, ond diolchaf hefyd i gwmsler y Frenhines yn yr ymchwiliad, Mr Nicholas Cooke CF, am ei arbenigedd. Wrth ddelio â mater sydd efallai'n anos ei drin na'r un arall, mae'r ymchwiliad hwn wedi disgrifio difrifwch y cyd-destun i'r mater hwn. Mae difrifoldeb yr argymhellion a roddwyd inni i'w hystyried yn galw am weithredu gyda'r brys mwyaf.

Wrth ystyried adroddiad o'r natur hon, anodd yw cyfeirio at yr holl argymhellion. Mae Jeff Cuthbert wedi cyfeirio eisoes at ddau a ddaliodd fy llygad i, sef argymhellion 21.29 a 21.30, sy'n ymwneud â'r angen am strategaeth genedlaethol i ddarparu gwasanaeth cynghori annibynnol ac i hyrwyddo'r gwasanaeth sy'n ymwneud â phlant, sef yr NSPCC, ChildLine ac yn y blaen, ymysg pobl ifanc yn ein hysgolion fel y byddant yn ymwybodol o'r gwahanol

aware of the various avenues that they can take if they have concerns or complaints that they wish to make.

It is clear that, for many people who have been the subject of abuse or bullying, often the hardest task is being able to report it confidentially and to receive advice and support. Not knowing where to go can be extremely upsetting and distressing for young people who have been the victims of any form of abuse or bullying within the school service. As a governor of my old school, the Bishop of Llandaff Church in Wales High School, I am proud that we have been recognised for a brilliant initiative, called the 'worry web'. The school has taken forward this initiative, which provides an intranet service for children to report and record any concerns or incidents that would give rise to concern. Without this, many pupils would not perhaps have the stomach or the guts to report such incidents to the relevant authorities. Initiatives such as that, which schools can pioneer, must be commended and examined in terms of their effectiveness. I hope that the Assembly Government will do everything possible to facilitate the implementation of the recommendations outlined in Peter Clarke's report. It demonstrates that schools can bring forward a certain degree of initiative in providing avenues for children and young people to make those concerns to the proper authorities.

5.30 p.m.

To conclude, I am sad that John Owen has deprived the families and victims of a proper and fair hearing in a criminal court and has avoided a long spell in prison.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank all Members for their contributions. This has been an important debate, touching the lives of individual young people and drawing out some important general lessons for services and organisations in Wales. I welcome the consensus that has emanated from the debate, and the deep sense of shared shock in the Assembly. I also welcome the recognition, which has come from across the Assembly,

lwybrau y gallant eu dilyn os ydynt yn dymuno mynegi pryderon neu wneud cwynion.

Mae'n amlwg, yn achos llawer a gafodd eu cam-drin neu eu bwlio, mai'r dasg anoddaf yn aml yw gallu rhoi gwybod amdano'n gyfrinachol a chael cyngor a chefnogaeth. Mae methu â gwybod i ble y dylent fynd yn gallu peri poen a gofid mawr i bobl ifanc sydd wedi dioddef unrhyw fath o gamdriniaeth neu fwlio o fewn y gwasanaeth ysgolion. Fel un o lywodraethwyr fy hen ysgol, Ysgol Uwchradd Esgob Llandaf yr Eglwys yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cael cydnabyddiaeth am fenter wych a elwir yn 'worry web'. Yr ysgol sydd wedi hyrwyddo'r fenter hon, sy'n cynnig gwasanaeth mewnwyd fel y gall plant roi gwybod am unrhyw bryderon neu ddigwyddiadau a allai beri pryder, a'u cofnodi. Heb hynny, mae llawer o ddisgyblion na fyddent yn ddigon dewr efallai i roi gwybod am ddigwyddiadau o'r fath i'r awdurdodau perthnasol. Dylid canmol mentrau o'r fath, y gall ysgolion eu harloesi, ac ymchwilio iddynt i ganfod eu heffeithiolrwydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud popeth a allo i hwyluso'r gwaith o weithredu'r argymhellion a nodir yn adroddiad Peter Clarke. Mae'n dangos y gall ysgolion fentro i ryw raddau wrth gynnig llwybrau y gall plant a phobl ifanc eu dilyn i roi gwybod am y pryderon hynny i'r awdurdodau perthnasol.

I derfynu, testun tristwch i mi yw bod John Owen wedi amddifadu'r teuluoedd a'r rhai a ddiodeffodd o wrandawriad teg a phriodol mewn llys troseddau ac wedi osgoi tymor hir mewn carchar.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Bu hon yn ddadl bwysig, ac mae wedi cyffwrdd â bywydau pobl ifanc fel unigolion ac wedi tynnu sylw at rai gwersi cyffredinol sy'n bwysig i wasanaethau a chyrff yng Nghymru. Croesawaf y consensws a ddeilliodd o'r ddadl, a'r ymdeimlad dirfawr o'r ysgytwad a gafodd pawb yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth, a gafwyd o



of the importance of the children's commissioner's role, and the role that he has played in bravely taking forward the Clywch inquiry.

Today's debate has set out a joint-ministerial response, as well as the response of the whole Welsh Assembly Government, to those aspects of the commissioner's report that lie within our responsibility, with the commitment to take action, as we outlined. We are also reassuring people, Rhodri Glyn, that this is not about awaiting the outcome of, for example, the important safeguarding review that Gwenda Thomas is leading, but about taking forward actions, as Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, has indicated. We are ensuring that we can say today that that guidance is published; it is on the web and will be published shortly. That is less than a year on, as has been indicated in the report's recommendations.

Several issues also lie in my field of responsibility for social services. I will highlight one important key issue, coming through the Children Bill, which will allow us to establish local safeguarding children's boards, which will be statutory successors to the non-statutory area child protection committees. Under the Bill's proposals, all statutory agencies in these new boards will have a statutory duty to co-operate in arrangements to protect children from harm and neglect.

We recognise that no system can ever be completely foolproof; no set of policies or guidelines can offer an absolute guarantee against things going wrong. However, as Gwenda Thomas has recognised, this is a proactive report, which can bring about real changes. The recommendations will be taken into account in her review, testing many of the recommendations in consultation with children and young people. We welcome your contribution today, Gwenda.

We must ensure that we learn the lessons that the inquiry has highlighted, and that we embed those lessons in practice, in terms of the individuals and organisations that have responsibility in this field. On the points about recommendations to other bodies, such

bob rhan o'r Cynulliad, i bwysigrwydd rôl y comisiynydd plant, a'r rhan a chwaraeodd wrth hyrwyddo ymchwiliad Clywch mewn modd mor eofn.

Yn y ddadl heddiw, cyflwynwyd cydymateb gweinidogol, yn ogystal ag ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel cyfangorff, i'r agweddau hynny ar adroddiad y comisiynydd sy'n gyfrifoldeb i ni, ynghyd ag ymrwymiad i weithredu, fel y nodasom. Yr ydym hefyd yn sicrhau pobl, Rhodri Glyn, nad yw hyn yn fater o ddisgwyl canlyniad i'r adolygiad pwysig ar amddiffyn plant a arweinir gan Gwenda Thomas, er enghraifft, ond o gymryd camau, fel y nododd Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau y gallwn ddweud heddiw fod y canllawiau hynny wedi'u cyhoeddi; maent ar y we ac fe'u cyhoeddir cyn hir. Gwnaed hynny ymhen llai na blwyddyn, yn unol â'r hyn a nodwyd yn argymhellion yr adroddiad.

Mae sawl mater ym maes fy nghyfrifoldeb i dros wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Tynnaf sylw at un mater pwysig, a ddaw yn sgîl y Mesur Plant, a fydd yn caniatáu inni sefydlu byrddau diogelu plant lleol, a fydd yn olynwyr statudol i'r pwyllgorau ardal amddiffyn plant sy'n anstatudol. O dan gynigion y Mesur, bydd yr holl asiantaethau statudol yn y byrddau newydd hyn dan ddyletswydd statudol i gydweithredu mewn trefniadau i amddiffyn plant rhag niwed ac esgeulustod.

Yr ydym yn cydnabod na all yr un system fod yn gwbl ddi-feth; ni all yr un set o bolisiâu neu ganllawiau gynnig sicrwydd llwyr na fydd pethau'n mynd o'u lle. Fodd bynnag, fel y cydnabu Gwenda Thomas, adroddiad rhagweithiol yw hwn, sy'n gallu peri newidiadau go-iawn. Ystyrir yr argymhellion yn ei hadolygiad, a fydd yn rhoi prawf ar lawer o'r argymhellion drwy ymgynghori â phlant a phobl ifanc. Croesawn eich cyfraniad heddiw, Gwenda.

Rhaid inni ofalu ein bod yn dysgu'r gwersi y mae'r ymchwiliad wedi tynnu sylw atynt, a'n bod yn cynnwys y gwersi hynny mewn ymarfer, mewn cysylltiad â'r unigolion a'r cyrff sydd â chyfrifoldeb yn y maes hwn. Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaed am

as the WJEC, it is about leadership from this Government to ensure that we bring about the change that is needed for the future.

We have not specifically sought to comment on recommendations for other bodies, but we will ensure that, as part of our general oversight role, we hold regular discussions with them to monitor progress. That is one of the first points that David Davies made, as did Mike, Helen Mary, and others. I reassure the many Members, including Janet, Helen Mary and David, who have asked about the WJEC recommendations, for example, that it has already updated its child protection policy. It has met the children's commissioner and has updated its child protection guidance, and has drawn on the advice of child protection specialists. We will play an overseeing role in relation to those bodies.

To answer David Davies's first point, I give an assurance about action against allegations. As I said, circular 45/04 is now on the web and will be published shortly. It deals with handling allegations relating to child abuse and other allegations involving criminal action. It will also answer many of your points, Ieuan Wyn. The circular makes clear that, having established that an allegation against a member of staff relates to child abuse, the headteacher—or the chair of governors if an allegation is made against a headteacher—must consult the LEA officer designated to lead on child protection matters. They must refer all allegations of child abuse to the authorities that have the responsibility and statutory powers to investigate such matters, namely social services and the police. That covers some of the points raised by Helen Mary.

Many Members have rightly commented on the issues around recommendation 21.29, which refers to the provision of independent counselling services for children and young people, and we have accepted the recommendation for further consideration. This is about expanding the level of counselling and advocacy in education and

argymhellion i gyrff eraill, fel CBAC, mae hynny'n gofyn arweiniad gan y Llywodraeth hon i sicrhau y parwn y newid sydd ei angen ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Nid ydym wedi ceisio gwneud sylwadau penodol ar argymhellion i gyrff eraill, ond byddwn yn sicrhau, fel rhan o'n rôl gyffredinol o arolygu, y cynhaliwn drafodaethau rheolaidd â hwy i fonitro cynnydd. Dyna un o'r pwyntiau cyntaf a wnaeth David Davies, fel y gwnaeth Mike, Helen Mary, ac eraill. Yr wyf yn sicrhau'r nifer fawr o Aelodau, a Janet, Helen Mary a David yn eu plith, a holodd am yr argymhellion i CBAC, er enghraifft, sydd eisoes wedi diweddarau ei bolisi ar amddiffyn plant. Cyfarfu â'r comisiynydd plant ac mae wedi diweddarau ei ganllawiau ar amddiffyn plant, ac wedi cael cyngor gan arbenigwyr ar amddiffyn plant. Byddwn yn cyflawni rôl arolygu mewn cysylltiad â'r cyrff hynny.

I ateb y pwynt cyntaf a wnaeth David Davies, rhoddaf sicrwydd am y camau a gymerir ynghylch honiadau. Fel y dywedais, mae cylchlythyr 45/04 ar y we yn awr ac fe'i cyhoeddir cyn hir. Mae'n ymdrin â'r modd i drafod honiadau sy'n ymwneud â cham-drin plant a honiadau eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithredu troseddol. Bydd hefyd yn ateb llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch chi, Ieuan Wyn. Mae'r cylchlythyr yn egluro bod pennaeth yr ysgol, ar ôl cadarnhau bod honiad yn erbyn aelod staff yn ymwneud â cham-drin plant—neu gadeirydd y llywodraethwyr os gwneir honiad yn erbyn pennaeth ysgol—yn gorfod ymgynghori â swyddog yr AALL a enwebwyd i arwain ar faterion amddiffyn plant. Rhaid iddo gyfeirio pob honiad am gam-drin plant i'r awdurdodau sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb a'r pwerau statudol i ymchwilio i faterion o'r fath, sef y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r heddlu. Mae hynny'n ateb rhai o'r pwyntiau a gododd Helen Mary.

Mae sawl Aelod wedi gwneud sylwadau, a hynny'n briodol, ar y materion sy'n gysylltiedig ag argymhelliad 21.29, sy'n cyfeirio at ddarparu gwasanaethau cynghori annibynnol ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc, ac yr ydym wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad i'w ystyried ymhellach. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â darparu mwy o gynghori ac eiriolaeth mewn

the Assembly has established a specific unit to consider advocacy services across all sectors, including education, health and social services. Jane Davidson is also considering the current counselling models and those that are being developed locally, such as the Eye to Eye project in Rhondda Cynon Taf, to see whether we can take them forward. Learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds are also key in terms of personal support and a major part of our thinking in terms of how we deal with important points that have been made regarding providing information and complaints procedures. Peter Clarke's report, 'Telling Concerns', on the complaints services is vital in terms of responding to the Waterhouse report. The general view across the Assembly is that this will be a key point that Members will want to monitor in the relevant committees, namely the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and the Health and Social Services Committee. We will undertake to report back on that in our ministerial reports and there will be ongoing monitoring.

On the points that Kirsty and Mike made, we want to ensure that Members can properly scrutinise and monitor the many reports on child protection that come before us. Gwenda Thomas has helpfully recognised that in her review and she will be matching up the recommendations to ensure that we are taking this forward. The Assembly has given us a clear indication today of the importance and priority that it wishes to place on returning to this issue for scrutiny purposes.

I am glad that Irene and Jeff, as former teachers, spoke about the role of teaching and the importance of giving teachers the support that they need, referred to in recommendation 21.4. This is about the better schools fund and supporting multi-agency training for designated teachers and others in schools to ensure that they are given support and guidance. We also have forthcoming guidance on this issue. As Jane said in her opening speech, this is a joint-ministerial response. We will give all the commissioner's recommendations full and serious consideration. I thank you for this debate. This is about safeguarding the children of Wales.

addysg ac mae'r Cynulliad wedi sefydlu uned bwrpasol i ystyried gwasanaethau eiriolaeth ym mhob sector, gan gynnwys addysg, iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae Jane Davidson hefyd yn ystyried y dulliau cynghori presennol a'r rhai a ddatblygir yn lleol, fel prosiect Eye to Eye yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, i weld a oes modd inni eu datblygu. Mae llwybrau dysgu i rai 14 i 19 mlwydd oed yn bwysig hefyd yng nghydestun cymorth personol a buom yn eu hystyried yn helaeth wrth feddwl sut i ymdrin â phwyntiau pwysig a wnaed ynghylch darparu gwybodaeth a gweithdrefnau cwyno. Mae adroddiad Peter Clarke, 'Datgan Pryderon', ar y gwasanaethau cwynion yn hollbwysig o ran ymateb i adroddiad Waterhouse. Y farn unfrydol yn y Cynulliad yw y bydd hyn yn bwynt allweddol y bydd Aelodau am ei fonitro yn y pwyllgorau perthnasol, sef y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Ymgwymerwn i adrodd yn ôl ar hynny yn ein hadroddiadau gweinidogol a cheir monitro parhaus.

Ynghylch y pwyntiau a wnaeth Kirsty a Mike, yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd Aelodau'n gallu monitro a chraffu'n briodol ar y nifer mawr o adroddiadau ar amddiffyn plant a ddaw ger ein bron. Mae Gwenda Thomas wedi cydnabod hynny yn ei hadolygiad, a bydd hynny o gymorth, a bydd yn paru'r argymhellion i sicrhau y byddwn yn gweithredu ar hyn. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi dangos yn glir inni heddiw ei bod yn bwysig ganddo ddod yn ôl at y mater hwn fel blaenoriaeth er mwyn craffu arno.

Yr wyf yn falch bod Irene a Jeff, a hwythau'n gyn-athrawon, wedi sôn am y rôl sydd i ddysgu ac mor bwysig yw rhoi i athrawon y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen, y cyfeirir ato yn argymhellad 21.4. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r gronfa ysgolion gwell a chynnal hyfforddiant amlasiantaethol ar gyfer athrawon ac eraill a enwebir mewn ysgolion i sicrhau y cânt gymorth a chyfarwyddyd. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi canllawiau ar hyn hefyd cyn bo hir. Fel y dywedodd Jane yn ei haraith agoriadol, ymateb cydweinidogol yw hwn. Rhoddwn ystyriaeth lawn a difrif i holl argymhellion y comisiynydd. Diolchaf i chi am y ddadl hon. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â diogelu plant Cymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 2: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.  
 Amendment 4: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary

Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 5: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 6: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 7: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 8: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*



*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 9: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.  
Amendment 10: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2089): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2089): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.43 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.43 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)

Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)