



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 21 Mawrth 2006
Tuesday, 21 March 2006**

Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	4
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	30
Datganiad am y Contract Cyflenwi Ocsigen Statement on the Supply of Oxygen Contract	35
Datganiad am y Dreth Gyngor Statement on Council Tax	54
Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25	67
Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 2 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 25 Section 2 and No. 24.25	69
Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 25 Section 3	71
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Staffio Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Staffing of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2006	72
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 9 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006	76
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Addysg Sengl (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Single Education Plan (Wales) Regulations 2006.....	79
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Dileu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006	84
Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd, Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Fynwy (2006) o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 Approval of Directions to Cardiff Local Health Board, Swansea Local Health Board and Monmouthshire Local Health Board (2006) under Standing Order No. 29	87
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol): Datblygu Cynaliadwy Minority Party Debate (Liberal Democrat Party): Sustainable Development.....	90
Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion.....	117
Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru The Annual Report of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales	118

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Cefnogi Wythnos Genedlaethol Gwyddoniaeth Supporting the National Science Week

Q1 Val Lloyd: Will the First Minister give details of what the Welsh Assembly Government has done to support National Science Week? OAQ1394(FM)

C1 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi manylion am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei wneud i gefnogi Wythnos Genedlaethol Gwyddoniaeth? OAQ1394(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): National Science Week is a UK-wide event supported by the Department of Trade and Industry, BP and the Economic and Social Research Council. Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, launched it for Wales in Wrexham earlier this month, and we provide support for it via Techniquist and the national museum.

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Mae Wythnos Genedlaethol Gwyddoniaeth yn ddigwyddiad a gynhelir ar draws y DU ac a gefnogir gan yr Adran Diwydiant a Masnach, BP a'r Cyngor Ymchwil Economaidd a Chymdeithasol. Lanswyd yr wythnos ar gyfer Cymru yn Wrecsam yn gynharach y mis hwn gan Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ac yr ydym yn darparu cefnogaeth ar ei chyfer drwy Techniquist a'r amgueddfa genedlaethol.

Val Lloyd: As part of National Science Week, the Welsh auditions for the FameLab competition were held last Sunday at the National Waterfront Museum, Swansea. That competition aims to find new talent in science and communication, and is open to anyone working in the fields of science and engineering. Participants have three minutes to present any scientific topic in a way that will be understood by a general audience. I am sure that you agree that that is an excellent initiative, but what can the Welsh Assembly Government do to stimulate further discussion and the better understanding of science in Wales?

Val Lloyd: Fel rhan o Wythnos Genedlaethol Gwyddoniaeth, cynhaliwyd clyweliadau Cymru ar gyfer cystadleuaeth FameLab ddydd Sul diwethaf yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau, Abertawe. Nod y gystadleuaeth honno yw dod o hyd i dalent newydd ym maes gwyddoniaeth a chyfathrebu, a gall unrhyw un sy'n gweithio ym meysydd gwyddoniaeth a pheirianeg gystadlu. Mae gan y cyfranogwyr dri munud i gyflwyno unrhyw destun gwyddonol mewn ffordd a fydd yn cael ei deall gan gynulleidfa gyffredinol. Yr wyf yn sicr y cytunwch fod hwnnw'n gynllun ardderchog, ond beth y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i ysgogi rhagor o drafodaeth a gwell dealltwriaeth o wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: I certainly commend the initiative of the national museums—in the plural, as I should have said, as it included the National Waterfront Museum, Swansea. The initiative that you mentioned is particularly appropriate for that museum, as it is a museum of industry. We are now nearing the end of the consultation period on the

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr yr wyf yn canmol menter yr amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol—yn y llyuosog, fel y dylaswn ddweud, gan ei bod yn cynnwys Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau yn Abertawe. Mae'r fenter a grybwyllwyd gennych yn arbennig o briodol ar gyfer yr amgueddfa honno, gan mai amgueddfa ddiwydiant ydyw. Yr ydym yn

science policy for Wales document that I published several months ago. I believe that that offers an exciting future and a way forward for science in Wales, in terms of how it can be integrated with industry, health and the environment.

Mark Isherwood: With China now producing ever-growing numbers of science and engineering graduates, I know that you will agree that it is vital that we maintain our heritage of scientific excellence as we face the globalisation of the economy in the twenty-first century. What action do you propose to reverse the decline in the number of A-level students studying science, when the further education sector reports that zero growth in funding over the past three years has meant that increased demand for what was described to me as ‘soft-ology subjects’ has meant fewer science A-level students?

The First Minister: I do not have the figures to hand for A-level students, but I do have those for university students from Wales, and they vary considerably from year to year and from science to science. The current trend is for the numbers of those wishing to study the life sciences, including medicine, to go up quite sharply. Even within the mathematics, physics and engineering group, where there is a general decline, the numbers in the physical sciences group are, fortunately, rising. It will go up and down, and we recognise that there is a problem, particularly in the hard-edged sciences, such as maths and engineering. However, we believe that the wider curriculum choices at ages 14 to 19 will solve that problem, at least in part.

Mick Bates: In response to Val Lloyd’s question, First Minister, you mentioned the importance of educating children about the environment. I am sure that we would all like to retain Wales’s green environment. However, to do that, we need more than just one week of science; we need a whole year’s programme to educate people about the impact of climate change. Do you agree that that is vital, and will you tell us what your

awr yn agosáu at ddiwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori ar y ddogfen ar bolisi gwyddoniaeth i Gymru a gyhoeddwyd gennyf sawl mis yn ôl. Credaf fod honno’n cynnig dyfodol cyffrous a ffordd ymlaen i wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, o ran sut y gellir ei hintegreiddio gyda diwydiant, iechyd a’r amgylchedd.

Mark Isherwood: Gan fod Tsieina bellach yn cynhyrchu mwy a mwy o raddedigion gwyddoniaeth a pheirianeg, gwn y cytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol ein bod yn cynnal ein treftadaeth o ragoriaeth wyddonol wrth inni wynebu globaleiddio’r economi yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu hargymell i wrthdroi’r gostyngiad yn nifer y myfyrwyr lefel A sy’n astudio gwyddoniaeth, pan ddywed y sector addysg bellach fod y diffyg twf yn y cyllid dros y tair blynedd diwethaf wedi golygu bod y galw cynyddol am yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd wrthyf yn ‘bynciau hawdd-oleg’ wedi arwain at lai o fyfyrwyr gwyddoniaeth lefel A?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw’r ffigurau gennyf wrth law ar gyfer myfyrwyr lefel A, ond mae’r rhai ar gyfer myfyrwyr prifysgol o Gymru gennyf, ac maent yn amrywio’n sylweddol o flwyddyn i flwyddyn ac o wyddor i wyddor. Y duedd gyfredol yw bod y niferoedd sydd am astudio’r gwyddorau bywyd, gan gynnwys meddygaeth, yn codi’n eithaf dramatig. Hyd yn oed o fewn y grŵp mathemateg, ffiseg a pheirianeg, ble y mae dirywiad cyffredinol, mae’r niferoedd yn y grŵp gwyddorau ffisegol, yn ffodus, yn codi. Bydd yn mynd i fyny ac i lawr, ac yr ydym yn cydnabod bod problem, yn arbennig gyda’r gwyddorau pur, megis mathemateg a pheirianeg. Serch hynny, credwn y bydd y dewisiadau cwricwlaidd ehangach yn 14 a 19 oed yn datrys y broblem honno, yn rhannol o leiaf.

Mick Bates: Wrth ateb cwestiwn Val Lloyd, Brif Weinidog, soniasoch am bwysigrwydd addysgu plant am yr amgylchedd. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddem i gyd am gadw amgylchedd gwyrdd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn gwneud hynny, mae angen mwy nag wythnos o wyddoniaeth arnom; mae angen blwyddyn gyfan o raglen arnom i addysgu pobl am effaith y newid yn yr hinsawdd. A ydych yn cytuno bod hynny’n hanfodol, ac a wnewch

Government is doing to implement such a scheme?

ddweud wrthym beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i weithredu cynllun o'r fath?

The First Minister: If Mick directs his attention to the Record when it is published tomorrow, he will see that what I said in response to Val was also the answer to his question. It was not about the science week, but about the science policy. That document will integrate our science policy in the areas of education, including higher education, the environment, including sustainable development, and the economy, knowing the direct contribution that science can make to the knowledge economy.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os bydd Mick yn cyfeirio ei sylw at y Cofnod pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi yfory, bydd yn gweld mai'r hyn a ddywedais yn fy ateb i Val oedd yr ateb i'w gwestiwn yntau. Nid yr wythnos wyddoniaeth oedd dan sylw ond y polisi gwyddoniaeth. Bydd y ddogfen honno'n integreiddio ein polisi gwyddoniaeth ym meysydd addysg, gan gynnwys addysg uwch, yr amgylchedd, gan gynnwys datblygu cynaliadwy, a'r economi, o wybod am y cyfraniad uniongyrchol y gall gwyddoniaeth ei wneud i'r economi wybodaeth.

Nawdd Corfforaethol i Chwaraeon The Corporate Sponsorship of Sport

Q2 Laura Anne Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the corporate sponsorship of sport in Wales? OAQ1391(FM)

C2 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am nawdd corfforaethol i chwaraeon yng Nghymru? OAQ1391(FM)

The First Minister: I will take this opportunity—on behalf of the Assembly, I am sure—to congratulate our athletes in the Commonwealth Games in Melbourne, particularly our two gold medallists, Michaela Breeze and David Davies, who won his gold medal in the 1,500m swim this morning, and not forgetting the nine or 10 athletes who have won medals already or are in certain medal-winning positions.

Y Prif Weinidog: Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn—ar ran y Cynulliad, yr wyf yn sicr—i longyfarch ein hathletwyr yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad ym Melbourne, yn arbennig y ddau sydd wedi ennill medal aur, Michaela Breeze a David Davies, a enillodd ei fedal aur yn y ras nofio 1,500m y bore yma, a heb anghofio'r naw neu ddeg athletwr sydd eisoes wedi ennill medalau neu sy'n sicr o ennill medalau.

As regards your question, Sportsmatch Cymru is creating vital links between business and grass-roots sport. Wales's success in hosting and attracting high-profile events such as the Rugby World Cup in 1999, the Ryder Cup in 2010, the FA Cup Final—coming to Wales for yet another year—and the Wales Rally GB, is helping to generate some £50 million a year in sponsorship.

O ran eich cwestiwn, mae Sportsmatch Cymru yn creu cysylltiadau hanfodol rhwng busnes a chwaraeon ar lawr gwlad. Mae llwyddiant Cymru wrth groesawu a denu digwyddiadau sy'n cael sylw mawr megis Cwpan Rygbi'r Byd yn 1999, Cwpan Ryder yn 2010, Gêm Derfynol yr FA—a fydd yn dod i Gymru am flwyddyn arall—a Rali Cymru Prydain Fawr, yn helpu i gynhyrchu tua £50 miliwn y flwyddyn mewn nawdd.

Laura Anne Jones: As you are aware, businesses such as the Coca-Cola Company help with a lot of sporting initiatives, both at local and national level. For example, the Neighbourhood Watch Sports Trust has a three-year sponsorship programme from the Coca-Cola Company and South Wales

Laura Anne Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, mae busnesau megis Cwmni Coca-Cola yn helpu gyda nifer o gynlluniau chwaraeon, ar lefel leol a chenedlaethol. Er enghraifft, mae gan Ymddiriedolaeth Chwaraeon Gwarchod y Gymdogaeth raglen nawdd dair blynedd drwy Gwmni Coca-Cola a Heddlu De

Police. The trust arranges football coaching sessions and a tournament. Over three years, 12,000 children took part in this initiative and anti-social behaviour fell by 60 per cent in the areas covered. The company has also enabled Glamorgan Cricket Club to double its junior dragons membership—

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is First Minister's question time; it is not First-Minister-listens-to-speeches time.

Laura Anne Jones: I am giving him the background to my question. First Minister—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The First Minister requires no background; he has it all written down.

Laura Anne Jones: He will know what I am about to say, then.

How is the Assembly encouraging more companies to sponsor sports? How are you working with them to try to achieve the objectives set out in 'Climbing Higher'?

The First Minister: I refer not only to the Coca-Cola Company, which has been taking a lead in these issues, but to Norwich Union and its 'On Camp with Kelly Holmes' competition, to BHP Billiton, which heavily sponsors sports in all the countries in which it operates, including Wales, and to PDM Property Holdings Ltd, which helps to ensure that the Welsh Secondary Schools Association continues to be able to run the Welsh schools athletics championship and that Wales participates in the UK inter-country championships.

Cymru. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn trefnu sesiynau hyfforddiant pêl-droed a thwrnamaint. Dros dair blynedd, cyfrannodd 12,000 o blant at y fenter hon a chafwyd gostyngiad o 60 y cant mewn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn ardaloedd y cynllun. Mae'r cwmni hefyd wedi galluogi Clwb Criced Morgannwg i ddyblu nifer aelodau eu rhaglen dreigiau ifanc—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Amser gofyn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog yw hwn; nid amser i'r Prif Weinidog wrando ar areithiau.

Laura Anne Jones: Rhoi cefndir fy nghwestiwn iddo yr ydwyf. Brif Weinidog—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes angen cefndir ar y Prif Weinidog; mae'r cyfan ganddo ar bapur.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae'n gwybod beth yr wyf am ei ddweud, felly.

Sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn annog mwy o gwmnïau i noddi chwaraeon? Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gyda hwy i geisio cyflawni'r amcanion a bennir yn 'Dringo'n Uwch'?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriaf nid yn unig at Gwnni Coca Cola, sydd wedi bod yn cymryd yr awenau yn y materion hyn, ond at Norwich Union a'i gystadleuaeth 'On Camp with Kelly Holmes', at BHP Billiton, sy'n rhoi nawdd sylweddol i chwaraeon yn yr holl wledydd lle y mae'n gweithredu, gan gynnwys Cymru, ac at PDM Property Holdings Ltd, sy'n helpu i sicrhau bod Cymdeithas Ysgolion Uwchradd Cymru'n parhau i allu cynnal pencampwriaeth athletau ysgolion Cymru a bod Cymru'n cyfrannu at y pencampwriaethau rhwng gwledydd y DU.

Ymrwymadau Maniffesto nas Cyflawnwyd Manifesto Commitments not Achieved

Q3 Leanne Wood: Will the First Minister detail any manifesto commitments that have not been achieved? OAQ1374(FM)

The First Minister: The only manifesto commitment that has had to be amended since 2003 refers to the £75 million package of improved services for disabled people, now extended to include mental health

C3 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw ymrwymadau maniffesto nas cyflawnwyd? OAQ1374(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r unig ymrwymiad maniffesto y bu'n rhaid ei newid ers 2003 yn cyfeirio at y pecyn £75 miliwn o wasanaethau gwell i bobl anabl, sydd wedi ei ymestyn erbyn hyn i gynnwys dioddefwyr

sufferers and their carers for the first time, and the investment of almost £9 million in telecare and £12.5 million in new equipment, taking more of the least-well-off out of charging altogether.

Leanne Wood: There are many more broken promises than that. Can you cut out the waffle and tell us exactly how many promises you have broken, and list them?

The First Minister: That was a bit of goodwill from Leanne. I have to reply by saying—‘says you’. In political knockabout terms, you may wish to follow your leader in waving around a list of promises; however, when we examined that list closely, it did not include any broken manifesto pledges. If you want to make that allegation, stop chucking manure about and give us some facts.

Irene James: Would you agree that, with free school breakfasts now being rolled out to Trinant and Panside primary schools, for 81 pupils or more at each school, one of our key manifesto pledges is making a difference to children in my constituency? [*Interruption.*]

The First Minister: Everybody listening will have noted how much pain this manifesto pledge causes to opposition parties. They recognise that it is good news for children, especially in Wales’s deprived areas. Whenever they speak to teachers who are involved in implementing this, they will hear about the improved concentration and behaviour and the reduced truancy seen as a result. We avail ourselves of every opportunity to encourage more schools to take up this offer, as was seen recently in a letter from the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to school governors, saying, ‘Take up the offer, the money is there, get on with it, it is good for children and improves their ability to learn’.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Os mai ffeithiau y mae’r Prif

iechyd meddwl a’u gofaluwr am y tro cyntaf, a’r buddsoddiad o bron £9 miliwn yn maes tele-ofal a’r £12.5 miliwn mewn cyfarpar newydd, gan symud mwy o’r bobl sydd â lleiaf o fodd yn gyfan gwbl o’r grŵp talu.

Leanne Wood: Mae llawer mwy na hynny o addewidion wedi’u torri. A allwch roi’r gorau i’r gwag-siarad a dweud yn union wrthym sawl addewid yr ydych wedi’u torri, a’u rhestru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna dipyn bach o ewyllys da gan Leanne. Mae’n rhaid imi ateb drwy ddweud—‘meddech chi’. O ran ymrafael gwleidyddol, efallai eich bod am ddilyn eich arweinydd a chwifio rhestr o addewidion o gwmpas; fodd bynnag, pan edrychasom ar y rhestr honno’n fanwl, nid oedd yn cynnwys dim addewidion maniffesto a oedd wedi eu torri. Os ydych am wneud yr honiad hwnnw, rhowch y gorau i luchio baw a rhowch ffeithiau inni.

Irene James: A fyddech yn cytuno, wrth i frecwast am ddim gael ei gyflwyno yn ysgolion cynradd Trinant a Panside, ar gyfer 81 disgybl neu fwy ym mhob ysgol, fod un o brif addewidion ein maniffesto yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i blant yn fy etholaeth i? [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd pawb sy’n gwrandio wedi sylwi faint o boendod y mae’r addewid hwn yn y maniffesto yn ei beri i’r gwrthbleidiau. Maent yn sylweddoli ei fod yn newyddion da i blant, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd difreintiedig Cymru. Pryd bynnag y maent yn siarad ag athrawon sy’n gysylltiedig â gweithredu’r cynllun hwn, byddant yn clywed am y lefelau gwell o ymddygiad a chanolbwyntio a welir a llai o chwarae triwant yn ei sgîl. Yr ydym yn achub ar bob cyfle i annog mwy o ysgolion i fanteisio ar y cynnig hwn, fel y gwelwyd yn ddiweddar mewn llythyr oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes at lywodraethwyr ysgolion, yn dweud wrthynt ‘Manteisiwch ar y cynnig, mae’r arian yno, ewch ati, mae’n beth da i’r plant ac yn gwella eu gallu i ddysgu’.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): If it is facts that the First Minister is

Weinidog yn chwilio amdanynt, a yw'n cofio Tony Blair, yn 1999, yn dweud y byddai pawb yn cael mynediad lleol at ddeintydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol o fewn dwy flynedd? Beth ddigwyddodd i'r addewid hwnnw, Brif Weinidog?

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: That remains true. I believe that NHS Direct continues to enable people to get emergency dental treatment, in line with what Tony Blair said. It is important to note that huge changes are taking place in NHS dentistry, and the introduction of the personal dental services contract is enormously successful in securing NHS dentistry for the future.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae arnaf ofn mai *waffle* oedd hynny o hyd, Brif Weinidog. Y realiti yw ei bod yn amhosibl cael gwasanaeth gan ddeintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn Ynys Môn a siroedd eraill Cymru yn 2006, heb sôn am 2001 a'r addewid a wnaed gan Brif Weinidog y DU ar gyfer y flwyddyn honno. Nid wyf yn gwybod pryd y ffoniodd y Prif Weinidog NHS Direct ddiwethaf, ond, pan wnaed hyn gan un o fy etholwyr i o'r Fali, dywedwyd wrtho fod y deintydd GIG agosaf ato yn y Bermo. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn credu bod Tony Blair wedi gwireddu ei addewid?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydw, yn sicr. Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn edrych ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Tony Blair: os oes angen triniaeth ar rywun, mae gorfodaeth ar y byrddau iechyd lleol i'w darparu, a, drwy NHS Direct, cewch eich cyfeirio at driniaeth frys. O ran pobl sydd heb ddeintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd, oherwydd y newidiadau enfawr sy'n digwydd yn awr—a bydd y cytundeb newydd yn cael ei weithredu ymhen 11 diwrnod—mae llawer o aflerwch yn y system. Mae system newydd gwasanaethau deintyddol personol, a gyflwynwyd gan Brian Gibbons, wedi sicrhau lleoedd gyda deintyddion y gwasanaeth iechyd i 694,867 o gleifion a thua 200,000 o leoedd ychwanegol. Golyga hynny fod newid yn digwydd. Efallai fod pobl, yn ddigon naturiol, yn nerfus, ond mae rhai deintyddion yn nerfus ynghylch cytundeb sy'n cael gwared ar y *treadmill*, fel y cyfeiriwyd ato. Serch hynny, maent yn

looking for, does he recall Tony Blair, in 1999, saying that everyone would have access locally to a national health service dentist within two years? What happened to that pledge, First Minister?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n dal yn wir. Credaf fod NHS Direct yn parhau i alluogi pobl i gael triniaeth ddeintyddol frys, yn unol â'r hyn a ddywedodd Tony Blair. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod newidiadau enfawr yn digwydd yng ngwasanaeth deintyddol y GIG, ac mae cyflwyno'r contract gwasanaethau deintyddol personol yn hynod o lwyddiannus o ran sicrhau gwasanaeth deintyddol y GIG ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am afraid that you are still waffling, First Minister. The fact of the matter is that it is impossible to access NHS dentistry in Anglesey and other counties in Wales in 2006, never mind 2001 and the pledge made by the Prime Minister in relation to that year. I do not know when the First Minister last phoned NHS Direct, but, the last time a constituent of mine from Valley did so, he was told that the closest NHS dentist was in Barmouth. Does the First Minister believe that Tony Blair has fulfilled his promise?

The First Minister: Yes, I do. It is important that we look at what Tony Blair said: if anyone needs treatment, local health boards are obliged to provide it, and anyone requiring emergency treatment will be directed towards that provision through NHS Direct. As regards people who do not have access to an NHS dentist, because of the huge changes taking place—the new contract will become operational in 11 days' time—there is a great deal of untidiness in the system. The new personal dental services contract, introduced by Brian Gibbons, has already given 694,867 patients access to NHS dentists and provided approximately 200,000 additional places. This means that a shift is taking place. People may be nervous about this, and understandably so, but dentists are also nervous about a contract that gets rid of what was known as the treadmill. However, this is now bedding down, and the last few

dechrau sefydlu erbyn hyn, a bydd y diwrnodau diwethaf hyn hyd 1 Ebrill yn mynd heibio gan ddangos iddynt fod system PDS yn arbennig o addawol ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: All that I can say, First Minister, is that I am glad that you are not my geography teacher, because the distance between Valley and Bermo is substantial. Are you telling me that Tony Blair has delivered on his promise to give people access to NHS dentistry when my constituents have to travel 60 to 70 miles for the services of an NHS dentist? At my surgery last week, another constituent told me that when he rang NHS Direct he was told that, unless he needed emergency treatment, he would not be seen by an NHS dentist within 100 miles of his home. This is another broken promise by Labour on NHS dentistry, and the people of Wales understand that. Does the First Minister not know that NHS dentists will be leaving the NHS after 1 April because they are not happy with the contract? Under this Labour Government, the people of Wales will have to go private to get the services of a dentist. Is that not a shame on you?

The First Minister: The run-up to the signing of the new contract is a revolution in dentistry. Dentists wanted to get off the so-called treatment treadmill on which they only got paid for doing fillings and so on. They wanted that move, and we have secured it. However, they do not like some other aspects of the contract. You are implying, quite falsely, that the majority of dentists will leave the NHS on 1 April. As you will have seen from the recent survey of dentists in the Cardiff area—I do not have the exact figures with me—of the 50 or so questioned, some 8 were thinking of leaving the NHS. By and large, you are giving the classic opposition impression that because some dentists are leaving the NHS, all dentists are leaving. Under the new PDS contract, only a small minority is leaving. If dentists within this group are the only dentists in a certain area, they think that they can take all of their patients with them. That is where the change made by Brian Gibbons is crucial, because it

days running up to 1 April will show them that the PDS system is extremely promising for the future.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud, Brif Weinidog, yw fy mod yn falch nad ydych yn athro daearyddiaeth arnaf, oherwydd y mae pellter sylweddol rhwng y Fali a'r Bermo. A ydych yn dweud wrthyf fod Tony Blair wedi cadw ei addewid i roi mynediad i bobl at wasanaeth deintyddol dan y GIG pan fo raid i'm hetholwyr deithio 60 i 70 milltir i gael gwasanaeth deintyddol dan y GIG? Yn fy nghymhorthfa yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedodd etholwr arall wrthyf, pan ffoniodd NHS Direct, iddo gael gwybod na fyddai'n cael ei weld gan ddeintydd y gwasanaeth iechyd o fewn 100 milltir i'w gartref oni bai fod angen triniaeth frys arno. Dyma addewid arall y mae Llafur wedi'i thorri gyda golwg ar wasanaeth deintyddol y GIG, ac mae pobl Cymru'n deall hynny. Onid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod y bydd deintyddion y GIG yn gadael y GIG ar ôl Ebrill 1 oherwydd nad ydynt yn hapus â'r contract? Dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, bydd yn rhaid i bobl Cymru fynd yn breifat i gael gwasanaeth gan ddeintydd. Onid yw hynny'n codi cywilydd arnoch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r paratodau sy'n arwain at lofnodi'r contract newydd yn chwyldro ym maes deintyddiaeth. Yr oedd deintyddion am ddod oddi ar y *treadmill* triniaeth fel y cyfeirid ato ble nad oeddent ond yn cael eu talu am lenwi dannedd ac ati. Yr oeddent am wneud y symudiad hwnnw, ac yr ydym wedi sicrhau hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt yn hoffi rhai o agweddau eraill y contract. Yr ydych yn awgrymu, yn gwbl gyfeiliornus, y bydd y rhan fwyaf o ddeintyddion yn gadael y GIG ar 1 Ebrill. Fel y gwelsoch o'r arolwg diweddar o ddeintyddion yn ardal Caerdydd—nid yw'r union ffigurau gennyf—o'r 50 a holwyd, yr oedd rhyw 8 yn ystyried gadael y GIG. At ei gilydd, yr ydych yn rhoi argraff glasurrol y gwrthbleidiau bod pob deintydd yn gadael oherwydd bod rhai deintyddion yn gadael y GIG. Dan y contract GDP newydd, dim ond lleiafrif bach sy'n gadael. Os mai deintyddion o fewn y grŵp hwn yw'r unig ddeintyddion mewn ardal arbennig, credant y gallant fynd

means that the money released by those leaving is recycled and used to bring in new dentists. Dentists cannot assume that they have a monopoly in their area and that if they go private, all their patients must go private.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Some time ago, the First Minister asked for facts on broken promises, and helpfully supplied one himself, that on free homecare for the disabled. Irene very helpfully provided another, that on free school breakfasts, and we have just heard another on dentistry. Here is another one for you, First Minister, which has remained broken since 1999. Labour promised that at the end of its first term no-one would wait more than six months for out-patient treatment. Currently, there are 51,320 such people waiting. When do you expect to redeem that promise, which was made in 1999?

The First Minister: There has been a colossal amount of improvement in the NHS waiting times in the last 12 to 18 months, as you would be the first to recognise, if you want to look at the figures. We will continue to press down on the waiting lists and we hope to have an interim target achieved by a year from now, 31 March 2007, of waits of not more than eight months for out-patients and in-patients, and, by 2009, it is 26 weeks for all-up waits, including waits for diagnostics and therapies, which have never been counted before—the so-called hidden waiting lists.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Let us have a look at some of the broken promises that are in the pipeline, and about to be made. Last week, you admitted to my colleague, Peter Black, that your target of making all schools fit for purpose by 2010 will not be met. You spent a considerable amount of time, in answering the question, saying that it was all local authorities' fault. Then, the very next day, Wednesday, you said that your Government had cut the school capital investment grant by more than a third.

â'u holl gleifion gyda hwy. Dyna ble y mae'r newid a wnaethpwyd gan Brian Gibbons yn hanfodol, oherwydd y mae'n golygu bod yr arian a ryddheir gan y rhai sy'n gadael yn cael ei ailgylchu a'i ddefnyddio i gyflwyno deintyddion newydd. Ni all deintyddion ragdybio bod ganddynt fonopoli yn eu hardal ac os byddant yn mynd yn breifat, y bydd yn rhaid i'w holl gleifion fynd yn breifat.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Dro'n ôl, gofynnodd y Prif Weinidog am ffeithiau ynghylch addewidion a dorwyd, a bu'n ddigon caredig i grybwyll un ei hun, sef hwnnw am ofal cartref am ddim i'r anabl. Bu Irene mor garedig â rhoi un arall, sef hwnnw am frecwest ysgol am ddim, ac yr ydym newydd glywed un arall am ddeintyddiaeth. Dyma un arall i chi, Brif Weinidog, sydd wedi'i dorri byth ers 1999. Addawodd Llafur na fyddai neb erbyn diwedd ei thymor cyntaf yn aros mwy na chwe mis am driniaeth fel claf allanol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 51,320 o bobl o'r fath yn aros. Pa bryd y disgwyliwch gyflawni'r addewid hwnnw, a wnaethpwyd yn 1999?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cafwyd gwelliant aruthrol yn amseroedd aros y GIG yn y 12 i 18 mis diwethaf, fel y byddech chi yn anad neb yn cydnabod, os oes arnoch eisiau edrych ar y ffigurau. Byddwn yn parhau i gwtogi'r rhestrau aros a gobeithiwn gyrraedd targed interim ymhen blwyddyn, 31 Mawrth 2007, o arosiadau heb fod dros wyth mis i gleifion allanol a chleifion mewnol, ac, erbyn 2009, bydd yn 26 wythnos ar gyfer pob aros, gan gynnwys aros am ddiagnosteg a therapi, na chawsant eu cyfrif erioed o'r blaen—y rhestrau aros cudd, fel y'u gelwir.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Gadewch inni edrych ar rai o'r tor addewidion sydd ar y gweill, ac ar fin digwydd. Yr wythnos diwethaf, bu ichi gyfaddef wrth fy nghyd-Aelod, Peter Black, na chyrrhaeddir eich targed o sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn addas i'w phwrpas erbyn 2010. Treuliasoch gryn dipyn o amser, wrth ateb y cwestiwn, yn dweud mai bai'r awdurdodau lleol oedd hyn i gyd. Yna, drannoeth, ddydd Mercher, dywedasoch fod eich Llywodraeth wedi torri'r grant buddsoddi cyfalaf mewn

Can you tell me how you expect your promise to be met when you cut the budget like that?

The First Minister: I do not see how we can be accused of breaking a promise, when we have four years left to meet it. That shows how desperate opposition parties are to rabbit on about the issue of broken promises—they say that we have not achieved something that is due by 2010. Mike, perhaps you should look at your calendar—your lunar calendar, perhaps—and you can work out that 2010 is four years from now. The manifesto pledge in 2003 was to spend £560 million on improving school buildings. We are way ahead of that promise already, and there is still a year to go.

Michael German: Many organisations have already given evidence, and, almost without exception, have said that they are finding this very difficult, and do not see how you can meet that 2010 target. Your own body, Estyn, says that a number of local education authorities may not reach that target. If they are not going to reach that target, and if all the evidence is in front of you, and you are cutting the budget, will you meet that 2010 target?

The First Minister: The question for the local authorities is how they engage with the issue of modernising schools. You will be aware, as a former resident of Cardiff, of the difficulties that the Liberal-Democrat-led council has had in deciding upon which schools to modernise. We cannot force the local authority, whoever controls it—in the case of Cardiff, the Liberal Democrats—to say that it wishes to modernise certain schools, and wishes to use this very generous budget that we have given it in such and such a way. That is up to the authorities; we cannot force them to do that. It has given an extremely gloomy estimate of 2020. It is up to voters in Cardiff to decide whose fault that is. Is it the fault of the Liberal Democrat council, which has not really engaged with this issue and is saying that 2020 is good enough for it? That may not be good enough

ysgolion, a hynny o fwy na thraean. A allwch ddweud wrthyf sut y disgwylwch i'ch addewid gael ei gyflawni a chithau'n torri'r gyllideb fel hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni welaf sut y gellir ein cyhuddo o dorri addewid, a ninnau â phedair blynedd ar ôl i'w gyflawni. Mae hynny'n dangos mor anobeithiol yw'r gwrthbleidiau yn rhygnu ymlaen ar fater torri addewidion—maent yn dweud nad ydym wedi cyflawni rhywbeth sydd i fod i ddigwydd erbyn 2010. Mike, efallai y dylech edrych ar eich calendr—eich calendr lleuad, efallai—a gallwch weld bod 2010 ymhen pedair blynedd. Gwario £560 miliwn ar wella adeiladau ysgolion oedd yr addewid ym maniffesto 2003. Yr ydym ymhell ar y blaen i'r addewid hwnnw'n barod, ac mae blwyddyn i fynd o hyd.

Michael German: Mae sawl corff eisoes wedi rhoi tystiolaeth, a, bron yn ddieithriad, maent wedi dweud eu bod yn cael hyn yn anodd iawn, ac nad ydynt yn gweld sut y gallwch gyrraedd y targed hwnnw erbyn 2010. Dywed eich corff chi eich hun, Estyn, y bydd nifer o awdurdodau addysg lleol efallai'n methu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Os nad ydynt yn mynd i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw, ac os yw'r holl dystiolaeth o'ch blaen, a'ch bod yn cwtdogi'r gyllideb, a wnewch gyrraedd y targed hwnnw erbyn 2010?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y cwestiwn i'r awdurdodau lleol yw sut yr ânt i'r afael â chwestiwn moderneiddio ysgolion. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, fel un a fu'n byw yng Nghaerdydd, o'r anawsterau a gafodd y cyngor, sydd dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wrth benderfynu pa ysgolion i'w moderneiddio. Ni allwn orfodi'r awdurdod lleol, pwy bynnag sy'n ei reoli—yn achos Caerdydd, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—i ddweud ei fod yn dymuno moderneiddio ysgolion penodol, ac yn dymuno defnyddio'r gyllideb hael iawn hon yr ydym wedi'i rhoi iddo mewn rhyw fodd neu'i gilydd. Mater i'r awdurdodau yw hynny; ni allwn eu gorfodi i wneud hynny. Mae wedi rhoi amcangyfrif hynod besimistaidd o 2020. Mater i bleidleiswyr yng Nghaerdydd yw penderfynu bai pwy yw hynny. Ai bai'r cyngor Democratiaidd

for the people of Cardiff when it comes to them having the chance to vote on it.

Michael German: Of course, if you pull the rug from under their feet, and take away the budget, it is going to be much more difficult for authorities to meet that target. That seems sensible. If you say that authorities will have less money, and you stated on Wednesday that they would not have as much as you said that they would, after saying on Tuesday that it was all their fault, then, clearly, authorities will not be able to meet that target. That is the evidence from all the bodies coming in to give evidence to the Committee on School Funding.

Let me give you another, very current, example, First Minister. In the last year for which we have figures available, 44 school fires were caused by arson in Wales. If you want to make schools fit for purpose, you will have to install sprinkler systems, which is an additional 10 per cent on top of the cost of improving the quality of the buildings. How will you be able to create a modern school environment, with buildings with roofs that do not leak, and which have appropriate methods of dealing with fires, when we have such a huge backlog in repairs, and when all those giving evidence say that you will not reach this target?

The First Minister: I notice that you are not contesting what I said, which is that we are ahead of our manifesto commitment. Therefore, you are agreeing with me that the manifesto pledge has not been broken: we are ahead of the commitment to spend £560 million. I think that the figure is well over £600 million, and I am glad that you are not contesting that, and are accepting that what you are talking about has nothing to do with broken manifesto pledges. I am pleased to have your support on that.

2.20 p.m.

On the issue of arson, I do not know whether you are referring specifically to Penyrheol

Rhyddfrydol ydyw, sydd heb fynd i'r afael mewn gwirionedd â'r mater hwn ac sydd yn dweud bod 2020 yn ddigon da ganddo? Efallai na fydd hynny'n ddigon da gan bobl Caerdydd pan ddaw'r amser iddynt gael y cyfle i bleidleisio arno.

Michael German: Wrth gwrs, os tynnwch y carped oddi tan eu traed, a thynnu'r gyllideb i ffwrdd, mae'n mynd i fod yn llawer anos i awdurdodau gyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn gall. Os dywedwch y caiff awdurdodau lai o arian, a dywedasoeh ddydd Mercher na chaent gymaint ag y dywedasoeh y caent, ar ôl dweud ddydd Mawrth mai eu bai hwy oedd y cyfan, yna, yn amlwg, ni fydd awdurdodau'n gallu cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Dyna'r dystiolaeth gan bob corff sydd yn dod i mewn i roi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion.

Gadewch imi roi enghraifft arall amserol iawn i chi, Brif Weinidog. Yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ffigurau ar ei chyfer, achoswyd 44 o danau mewn ysgolion gan losgwyr bwriadol yng Nghymru. Os oes arnoch eisiau sicrhau bod ysgolion yn addas i'w pwrpas, bydd yn rhaid ichi osod systemau taenellu dŵr, sef 10 y cant yn ychwanegol ar ben cost gwella ansawdd yr adeiladau. Sut y byddwch yn gallu creu amgylchedd ysgol modern, gydag adeiladau a thoeau nad ydynt yn gollwng dŵr, a chyda dulliau priodol o ddelio â thanau, pan fo gennym ôl-groniad mor enfawr o waith atgyweirio, a phan fo pawb sy'n rhoi tystiolaeth yn dweud na wnewch gyrraedd y targed hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sylwaf nad ydych yn dadlau â'r hyn a ddywedais, sef ein bod ar y blaen i'n haddewid maniffesto. Felly, yr ydych yn cytuno â mi nad yw'r addewid maniffesto wedi'i dorri: yr ydym ar y blaen i'r ymrwymiad i wario £560 miliwn. Credaf fod y ffigur ymhell dros £600 miliwn, ac yr wyf yn falch nad ydych yn dadlau â hynny, a'ch bod yn derbyn nad oes a wnelo'r hyn yr ydych yn siarad amdano ddim â thorri addewidion maniffesto. Yr wyf yn falch o gael eich cefnogaeth yn hynny o beth.

Ar fater llosgi bwriadol, ni wn ai cyfeirio'n benodol yr ydych at Ysgol Gyfun Penyrheol

Comprehensive School in Gowerton. As these matters may come before the courts, I do not think that I am in a position to comment on those matters, which relate to suspected arson. That fire is an absolute tragedy for that community because children's art work for practical examinations, ready for GCSE, has gone up in flames, but I do not want to get involved in matters where the police are looking at a possible criminal offence.

yn Nhre-gŵyr. Gan y gallai'r materion hyn dddod gerbron y llysoedd, nid wyf yn meddwl fy mod yn gallu cyflwyno sylwadau ar y materion hynny, sydd a wnelont â llosgi bwriadol tybiedig. Mae'r tân hwnnw'n drychineb llwyr i'r gymuned honno oherwydd y mae gwaith celf plant ar gyfer arholiadau ymarferol, oedd yn barod ar gyfer TGAU, wedi llosgi'n ulw, ond nid oes arnaf eisiau trafod materion lle y bo'r heddlu'n edrych ar drosedd o bosibl.

Targedau ac Amcanion Economaidd **Economic Targets and Objectives**

Q4 Alun Cairns: Will the First Minister make a statement on any changes to the Welsh Assembly Government's economic targets and objectives? OAQ1389(FM)

C4 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw newidiadau i dargedau ac amcanion economaidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ1389(FM)

C12 Alun Ffred Jones: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i gyflwyno targedau economaidd newydd? OAQ1380(FM)

Q12 Alun Ffred Jones: What plans does the First Minister have to introduce new economic targets? OAQ1380(FM)

The First Minister: The consultation period finished on 28 February, on the tracking indicators that were set out in our new economic policy document, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', which was published last November and which, I understand, you commended in committee. Our approach is to track progress via a range of economic indicators—notably employment and earnings, both of which have increased significantly in recent years, in absolute terms and relative to other parts of the UK and the EU.

Y Prif Weinidog: Daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori i ben ar 28 Chwefror, ynglŷn â'r dangosyddion llwybro a amlinellwyd yn ein dogfen bolisi economaidd newydd, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', a gyhoeddwyd fis Tachwedd diwethaf ac a gymeradwywyd gennych chi, yn ôl a ddeallaf, yn y pwyllgor. Ein nod yw dilyn hynt y gwaith a wneir drwy amrediad o ddangosyddion economaidd—sef yn fwyaf nodedig, cyflogaeth ac enillion, sydd ill dau wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol yn y blynyddoedd diweddar, mewn termau absoliwt ac mewn cymhariaeth â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Alun Cairns: I regularly use this opportunity to remind the First Minister that despite all his policies and every promise that he has made that he would bridge the wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom, Wales is still the poorest part of the United Kingdom. Yesterday's *Financial Times* provided a pretty stark and frightening analysis of the progress that he has made. It states that the private sector economies of poorer regions are performing particularly poorly under Labour and while boom and bust might have been eliminated nationwide, it is alive and well in the regions. The article

Alun Cairns: Defnyddiaf y cyfle hwn yn rheolaidd i atgoffa'r Prif Weinidog, er gwaethaf ei holl bolisiau a phob addewid a wnaeth y byddai'n pontio'r bwlch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, mai Cymru yw rhan dlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig o hyd. Rhoddodd *Financial Times* ddoe ddadansoddiad eithaf du a dychrynlyd o'r cynnydd a wnaed. Dywed fod economïau sector preifat y rhanbarthau tlotaf yn perfformio'n arbennig o wael dan Lafur, a thra bo 'ffynnu a methu' wedi'i ddileu efallai ar lefel Brydeinig, mae'n fyw ac iach o hyd yn y rhanbarthau. Yna mae'r erthygl yn

then highlights the fact that so weak was the private sector divide in peripheral areas that while it accounted for 80 per cent of economic growth nationally, it brought only 72 per cent of growth in Scotland and 66 per cent of growth in Wales. The divide has grown more—

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is clearly catching along that bench. I ask for a question, please.

Alun Cairns: The divide has clearly grown more under the Labour Government and this First Minister's administration. When will he admit that he is failing and when will he recognise that his Government needs to change its policies?

The First Minister: In the last year that the Conservatives were in power, gross domestic product in Wales was £28.5 billion. From my discussions with our economic statisticians, I know that it is now over £40 billion, which is an awful lot more than £28.5 billion—you have to admit that. As regards the article in the *Financial Times*, my statisticians have also been looking at that and they believe that there are quite a lot of howlers in it, such as confusion between sectors of the economy. For example, the *Financial Times* automatically assumes that public administration, health, and education are the public sector, but that is not correct, and then it has automatically assumed that everything else is in the private sector. That is also not correct. I will get my statisticians to draft a letter for me to send to you and we may copy it to the *Financial Times*, perhaps illustrating the schoolboy howlers. Of course, because you think that it is bad news, you have leapt on it like a demented Victorian undertaker waiting for a bad winter, but I am afraid that that is a weekly performance from you.

Alun Ffred Jones: Nid wyf am ymddwyn fel claddwr gwallgof, ond yr wyf am ddychwelyd at yr erthygl. Y gwir yw eich bod wedi gosod targed ac wedi gwneud addewid y byddech yn codi lefelau CMC y pen i 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn 2010. Mae'r erthygl hon yn dangos bod y bwlch naill ai wedi cynyddu

tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod rhaniad y sector preifat mor wan mewn ardaloedd ymylol, er ei fod yn cyfrif am 80 y cant o dwf economaidd yn genedlaethol, nes na ddaeth â dim ond 72 y cant o dwf yn yr Alban a 66 y cant o dwf yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhaniad wedi tyfu'n fwy—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yn amlwg mae'n heintus ar hyd y fainc acw. Gofynnaf am gwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

Alun Cairns: Mae'r rhaniad yn amlwg wedi tyfu'n fwy dan y Llywodraeth Lafur a gweinyddiaeth y Prif Weinidog hwn. Pa bryd y gwnaiff gyfaddef ei fod yn methu a pha bryd y gwnaiff gydnabod bod angen i'w Lywodraeth newid ei pholisïau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn y flwyddyn olaf y bu'r Ceidwadwyr mewn grym, yr oedd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth yng Nghymru'n £28.5 biliwn. Yn ôl fy nhrafodaethau gyda'n hystadegwyr economaidd, gwn ei fod bellach dros £40 biliwn, sydd yn llawer iawn mwy na £28.5 miliwn—mae'n rhaid i chi gyfaddef hynny. O ran yr erthygl yn y *Financial Times*, mae fy ystadegwyr wedi bod yn edrych ar honno hefyd a chredant fod nifer go lew o gamau gwag ynddi, megis dryswch rhwng sectorau'r economi. Er enghraifft, tybia'r *Financial Times* yn awtomatig fod gweinyddu cyhoeddus, iechyd ac addysg yn y sector cyhoeddus, ond nid yw hynny'n gywir, ac yna mae wedi cymryd yn awtomatig fod popeth arall yn y sector preifat. Nid yw hynny'n gywir ychwaith. Gofynnaf i'm hystadegwyr ddrafftio llythyr imi i'w anfon atoch ac efallai y gwnawn gopi i'r *Financial Times*, gan danlinellu'r camgymeriadau plentyn ysgol, efallai. Wrth gwrs, oherwydd eich bod chi'n meddwl mai newyddion drwg ydyw, yr ydych wedi neidio arni fel claddwr Fictorianaidd gwallgof yn aros am aeaf drwg, ond mae arnaf ofn bod hynny'n berfformiad wythnosol gennych.

Alun Ffred Jones: I do not want to act like a demented undertaker, but I want to return to that article. The truth is that you set a target and promised that you would raise the GDP per capita to 90 per cent of the United Kingdom average by 2010. This article shows that the gap has either increased or has not narrowed at all. Is that not an indication

neu heb gau dim. Onid yw hynny yn arwydd o fethiant polisi? Beth bynnag yr ydych am ei ddweud am y ffigurau absoliwt, nid ydych wedi llwyddo i symud yn gyflym, os o gwbl, at yr addewid a wnaethoch ar ddechrau'r ddegawd hon.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn croesawu'r ffigurau ar y raddfa absoliwt—credaf eich bod newydd groesawu'r cynnydd o'r £28.5 miliwn yn y flwyddyn olaf yr oedd y Torïaid mewn grym. Yn awr, mae'r ffigur dros £40 miliwn. Nid targed oedd haneru'r hollt o ran y CMC y pen rhyngom ni a Phrydain Fawr, ond uchelgais. O ran 'WAVE', yr oedd yn rhywbeth newydd i Alun Cairns groesawu rhywbeth o ran ein polisiau economaidd, ond yr wyf yn deall iddo wneud hynny o ran cael y cymysgedd o ddangosyddion llwybro i fesur beth yw'r cysylltiad rhwng ein polisi ni ac a yw'r economi yn llwyddo neu'n methu.

Dyna'r peth pwysig. Nid oes pwynt mewn ceisio gosod uchelgeisiau neu dargedau am bethau nad ydynt o dan ein rheolaeth, er enghraifft, gwerth y bunt o'i chymharu â'r ewro neu'r ddoler. Yr hyn yr ydym yn gallu ei fesur o ran ein llwyddiant neu'n methiant yw sut y mae'r hyn yr ydym ni yn ei wneud yn cyfrannu at fethiant neu lwyddiant economi Cymru.

Denise Idris Jones: First Minister, I am sure that you and Alun Cairns will agree that the delivery of 500 jobs to Llandudno Junction, in my constituency, through the soon-to-be-built Welsh Assembly Government offices will provide a huge boost to the economy of Conwy and north Wales starting in July.

The First Minister: It is a crucial development for the whole of north Wales, because it is at the critical crossroads of north Wales, where the A470 and the A55 meet. What is important about it is the balance between the public sector and the private sector, in that having the Assembly's north Wales office there also opens up that site to private sector investment on the remainder of the site. I am sure that it will be a prestige site for private sector investment on top of the 500 jobs that you mentioned.

of policy failure? Whatever you say about the absolute figures, you have not succeeded in moving quickly, if at all, towards the promise that you made at the beginning of this decade.

The First Minister: I am glad that you welcome the absolute figures—at least I think that you just welcomed the increase from £28.5 million in the last year that the Tories were in power. The figure is now over £40 million. Halving the gap in the GDP per head between Wales and Great Britain was not a target, but an ambition. In terms of 'WAVE', it was a new thing for Alun Cairns to welcome something in terms of our economic policies, but I understand that he did that in terms of having a mixture of tracking indicators to measure the connection between our policy and whether the economy is succeeding or failing.

That is the important thing. There is no point in setting aims or targets for things over which we have no control, for example, the value of the pound against the euro or the dollar. What we can measure in terms of our success is how what we do contributes to the failure or success of the Welsh economy.

Denise Idris Jones: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch chi ac Alun Cairns y bydd sicrhau 500 o swyddi i Gyffordd Llandudno, yn fy etholaeth i, drwy'r swyddfeydd a adeiledir cyn hir i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn rhoi hwb enfawr i economi Conwy a'r gogledd gan ddechrau ym mis Gorffennaf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n ddatblygiad allweddol i'r gogledd i gyd, oherwydd y mae ar groesffordd allweddol y gogledd, lle y mae'r A470 a'r A55 yn cwrdd. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig amdano yw'r cydbwysedd rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat, gan fod cael swyddfa'r Cynulliad yn y gogledd yn y fan honno hefyd yn agor y safle hwnnw i fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat ar weddill y safle. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn safle o fri ar gyfer buddsoddiad y sector preifat ar ben y 500 o swyddi a grybwyllwyd gennych.

Nick Bourne: I can understand the First Minister's sensitivity about the *Financial Times* article; it is, after all, headed 'Forgotten Britain: how Labour has presided over a deepening divide'. It is against that background that he is clearly seeking to rubbish it. However, with regard to divergence in the Welsh and the UK economies as a whole, it is clear that between 1997 and 2003 the Gwent valleys experienced a decrease, falling from 66 per cent to 59 per cent of the UK average GDP per capita, and south-west Wales also experienced a decrease, falling from 67 per cent to 59 per cent of the UK average. Given your targets, First Minister, and this is what the question is about, are you not disappointed by those figures, which are within your control, and what are you doing to address the problem, because it goes straight against your target and is in reverse?

The First Minister: I am not the one rubbishing the article in the *Financial Times*. We mentioned the figures in the Government's official national statistic public sector employment trends, showing that Wales, far from having a high dependence on the growth of public sector employment, has the lowest public sector employment growth of any part of the United Kingdom. Ours is the only part of the United Kingdom in which private sector growth exceeds that in the public sector. It is up by 4 per cent in Wales in the public sector, and 10 per cent in the private sector. Naturally, when I saw that *Financial Times* article, I asked our statisticians how it fits with the statistics from public sector employment trends that I have been quoting. They said that there is a howler in the *Financial Times* article, because it assumes that everybody in public administration and health and education is in fact working in the public sector, and they are not. That is the reason for the howler.

Nick Bourne: The question was not about the howlers. You said that you were not rubbishing it, but then you accused it of schoolboy howlers, so it sounds to me as though you are. The question, as you well know, is about the divergence demonstrated in official figures, which shows that things

Nick Bourne: Gallaf ddeall sensitifrwydd y Prif Weinidog am yr erthygl yn y *Financial Times*; ei phennawd, wedi'r cwbl, yw 'Forgotten Britain: how Labour has presided over a deepening divide'. Yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw y mae yn amlwg yn ceisio'i phardduo. Fodd bynnag, o ran dargyfeiredd yn economïau Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig yn eu cyfanrwydd, mae'n glir bod gostyngiad wedi bod yng nghymoedd Gwent rhwng 1997 a 2003, o 66 y cant i 59 y cant o gyfartaledd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y Deyrnas Unedig y pen, a bod gostyngiad wedi bod yn ne-orllewin Cymru hefyd, o 67 y cant i 59 y cant o'r cyfartaledd Prydeinig. O ystyried eich targedau, Brif Weinidog, a dyma ddiben y cwestiwn hwn, onid ydych yn siomedig â'r ffigurau hynny, sydd o fewn eich rheolaeth, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ddatrys y broblem, oherwydd y mae'n mynd yn hollol yn erbyn eich targed ac yn groes iddo?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid fi yw'r un sydd yn wfftio'r erthygl yn y *Financial Times*. Bu inni grybwyll y ffigurau yn ystadegau cenedlaethol swyddogol y Llywodraeth ar dueddiadau cyflogaeth y sector cyhoeddus, sy'n dangos bod Cymru, ymhell o fod yn ddibynnol iawn ar dwf cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus, yn dangos y twf isaf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus o unrhyw ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Dyma'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig lle y mae twf y sector preifat yn fwy na thwf y sector cyhoeddus. Mae i fyny 4 y cant yng Nghymru yn y sector cyhoeddus, a 10 y cant yn y sector preifat. Yn naturiol, pan welais yr erthygl honno yn y *Financial Times*, gofynnais i'n hystadegwyr sut y mae'n cyd-fynd â'r ystadegau o dueddiadau cyflogaeth y sector cyhoeddus yr wyf wedi bod yn eu dyfynnu. Dywedasant hwy fod cam gwag yn erthygl y *Financial Times*, gan ei bod yn tybio bod pawb ym myd gweinyddu cyhoeddus ac iechyd ac addysg mewn gwirionedd yn gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac nid ydynt. Dyna'r rheswm dros y cam gwag.

Nick Bourne: Nid am y camau gwag yr oedd y cwestiwn. Dywedasoch nad oeddech yn ei phardduo, ond wedyn fe'i cyhuddasoch o gamgymeriadau plentyn ysgol, felly mae'n swnio i mi fel pe baech yn gwneud hynny. Y cwestiwn, fel y gwyddoch yn dda, yw am y dargyfeiredd a ddangoswyd mewn ffigurau

are going backwards in the Gwent valleys and in south-west Wales. You are not contesting those figures in the article, I think, as they are official figures. What are you doing about those? There are no schoolboy howlers there, unless the Treasury has got the figures wrong. What are you doing about it? There is more divergence in the British economy than in the economy of any of the other 30 member states of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, apart from Turkey. Does that not concern you?

The First Minister: Again, there are other schoolboy howlers in the article. I am not the one saying this. You keep saying that I am saying this, and that I am rubbishing the article: I am not. I was interested in the article, because it contradicted everything that we knew from other official statistics, and our statisticians say that the article is wrong. It commits some elementary errors. It is not economic research; it is journalistic research. Fair play, it makes an interesting read, but it does not fit in with the actual facts and figures. We all know that the Welsh economy has been growing healthily, and that is why our GDP has gone up from £28 billion to over £40 billion in the years since the Conservatives were in charge, and I am pleased to say that our employment growth is healthy and that ours is the only part of the UK in which private sector growth exceeds public sector growth. That totally contradicts what is in the *Financial Times* article.

Nick Bourne: I come back to the point, and you have not chosen to give any contrary statistics, that these are Treasury figures that demonstrate backwards movement in the Gwent valleys and in south-west Wales. You have not contested those figures, about which I have asked you twice, and twice you have failed to answer. Will you answer at the third time of asking? Are you concerned about those figures, which are on what used to be a target and is now an aspiration? These figures go against that, so are you concerned and

swyddogol, sydd yn dangos bod pethau'n mynd yn eu holau yng nghymoedd Gwent ac yn y de-orllewin. Nid ydych yn herio'r ffigurau hynny yn yr erthygl, fe gredaf, gan eu bod yn ffigurau swyddogol. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud am y rheini? Nid oes dim camgymeriadau plentyn ysgol yn y rheini, oni bai fod y Trysorlys wedi cyfeiliorni gyda'r ffigurau. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud am hynny? Mae mwy o ddargyfeiredd yn economi Prydain nag yn economi unrhyw un o'r 30 aelod-wladwriaeth arall o'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, ac eithrio Twrci. Onid yw hynny'n peri pryder ichi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Eto, mae camgymeriadau eraill sy'n gamgymeriadau plentyn ysgol yn yr erthygl. Nid fi yw'r un sydd yn dweud hyn. Yr ydych yn dweud a dweud mai fi sydd yn dweud hyn, ac mai fi sydd yn wfftio'r erthygl: nid felly. Yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb yn yr erthygl, oherwydd yr oedd yn mynd yn groes i bopeth a wyddem oddi wrth ystadegau swyddogol eraill, a dywed ein hystadegwyr fod yr erthygl yn anghywir. Mae'n gwneud rhai camgymeriadau sylfaenol. Nid ymchwil economaidd ydyw; ymchwil newyddiadurol ydyw. Chwarae teg, mae'n ddarllen difyr, ond nid yw'n cyd-fynd â'r ffeithiau a'r ffigurau go iawn. Gŵyr pawb ohonom fod economi Cymru wedi bod yn tyfu'n iach, a dyna pam y mae ein cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth wedi codi o £28 biliwn i dros £40 biliwn yn y blynyddoedd ers pan fu'r Ceidwadwyr wrth y llyw, ac mae'n dda gennyf ddweud bod ein twf cyflogaeth yn iach ac mai dyma'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig lle y mae twf y sector preifat yn fwy na thwf y sector cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n mynd yn gwbl groes i'r hyn a geir yn erthygl y *Financial Times*.

Nick Bourne: Deuaf yn ôl at y pwynt, ac nid ydych wedi dewis rhoi dim ystadegau sydd yn gwrth-ddweud hyn, mai ffigurau'r Trysorlys yw'r rhain sy'n dangos symudiad tuag yn ôl yng nghymoedd Gwent ac yn y de-orllewin. Nid ydych wedi herio'r ffigurau hynny, yr wyf wedi'ch holi amdanynt ddwy waith, ac yr ydych chithau ddwy waith wedi methu ateb. A wnewch ateb ar y trydydd cais? A ydych yn bryderus am y ffigurau hynny, sydd ar yr hyn a arferai fod yn darged ac sydd bellach yn ddyhead? Mae'r ffigurau

what are you going to do about them?

hyn yn mynd yn erbyn hynny, felly a ydych yn bryderus, a beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud amdanynt?

The First Minister: It never was a target. It was always an aspiration, and that is nothing new, as that has been made clear for the past five years. It is important that we realise that the economy of Wales is making very good progress; it is growing relative to other parts of the country. I do not have the *Financial Times* article in front of me as regards the particular point that you raise, but I will write to you on it.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fu erioed yn darged. Dyhead fu erioed, ac nid yw hynny'n ddim byd newydd, gan fod hynny wedi'i wneud yn glir ers pum mlynedd bellach. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli bod economi Cymru'n gwneud cynnydd da iawn; mae'n tyfu o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o'r wlad. Nid yw erthygl y *Financial Times* gennyf o'm blaen mewn perthynas â'r pwynt penodol a godir gennyh, ond ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn ag ef.

2.30 p.m.

Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru The Government of Wales Bill

Q5 Janet Davies What recent discussions has the First Minister held with UK Ministers regarding the Government of Wales Bill? OAQ1375(FM)

C5 Janet Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion y DU ynglŷn â Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru? OAQ1375(FM)

The First Minister: It has been the subject of regular meetings with UK Government Ministers, as you can imagine, and its implications for the future governance of Wales are matters of huge importance to us all. I am sure that you will be pleased to know that the Bill has completed its House of Commons stages, and it will have its Second Reading in the House of Lords tomorrow.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu'n destun cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU, fel y gallwch ddychmygu, ac mae ei oblygiadau i'r modd y llywodraethir Cymru yn y dyfodol yn faterion sydd o bwysigrwydd enfawr i ni i gyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn falch o glywed bod y Mesur wedi cwblhau ei gamau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ac y bydd yn cael ei Ail Ddarllenid yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yfory.

Janet Davies: In the Economic Development and Transport Committee last week, it was pointed out that the Legislative and Regulatory Reform Bill, which is going through the Houses of Parliament at the same time more or less, could have a significant effect on the Government of Wales Bill. How do you see that Bill affecting the proposals?

Janet Davies: Yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, nodwyd y gallai'r Mesur Diwygio Deddfwriaethol a Rheoleiddiol, sy'n mynd drwy'r Senedd fwy neu lai ar yr un pryd, gael effaith sylweddol ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru. Ym mha fodd yn eich barn chi y gallai'r Mesur hwnnw effeithio ar y cynigion?

The First Minister: I understand that Andrew Davies will submit a paper to the Economic Development and Transport Committee on this issue, given that it was raised last week. The major point was that the Constitution Committee of the House of Lords published its report commenting on the Government of Wales Bill, in particular Part 3, Orders in Council and Assembly measures,

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn deall y bydd Andrew Davies yn cyflwyno papur i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar y mater hwn, gan iddo gael ei godi yr wythnos diwethaf. Y prif bwynt oedd bod Pwyllgor Cyfansoddiad Tŷ'r Arglwyddi wedi cyhoeddi'i adroddiad yn gwneud sylwadau ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru, yn benodol Rhan 3, Gorchmynion y

and it described it as a 'sound' procedure. It is a very important conclusion for the specialist sub-committee of the House of Lords to reach a week or so before the Second Reading debate tomorrow.

Lisa Francis: A fortnight ago, Labour peer Lord Foulkes introduced a Bill in the House of Lords to prevent candidates from the Scottish Parliament from standing in directly elected constituencies as well as on regional party lists. The Government rejected the Bill even though they are the precise changes that will be enacted in the Government of Wales Bill which, as you reminded us, has its Second Reading in the House of Lords tomorrow. You must have discussed this matter and its implications for Wales with your colleague, Peter Hain. What did he say to you about this?

The First Minister: I hesitate to say 'different strokes, different folks', but it is relevant on this occasion. You should also look at the comments that have been made on the issue of dual candidacy by distinguished people from the world of Welsh politics, not including any from my party, because you would not necessarily trust those. Perhaps you should direct your remarks about the unacceptability of the present system and the confusion that it causes to Lord Crickhowell and Lord Carlile. Those words will carry some weight at least in the House of Lords at the Second Reading debate tomorrow.

Peter Black: Returning to the Order in Council procedure, one criticism of that particular procedure in the House of Lords and its similarity with the Legislative and Regulatory Reform Bill is that it is believed that it will, essentially, disempower Parliament and put too much power into the hands of one Minister. Given that the whole purport of the Government of Wales Bill is to create a viceroy in Peter Hain's office, and whoever succeeds him, are you comfortable with those provisions, and are you comfortable that there will be democratic accountability as to which decisions will be taken on the Orders in Council?

The First Minister: If you were to read the

Cyfrin Gyngor a mesurau'r Cynulliad, ac fe'i disgrifiodd fel gweithdrefn gadarn. Mae'n gasgliad pwysig iawn i is-bwyllgor arbenigol o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi ddod iddo ryw wythnos cyn dadl yr Ail Ddarlleniad yfory.

Lisa Francis: Bythefnos yn ôl, cyflwynodd yr Arglwydd Llafur, yr Arglwydd Foulkes Fesur yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi i atal ymgeiswyr o Senedd yr Alban rhag sefyll mewn etholaethau lle y ceir etholiad uniongyrchol yn ogystal ag ar restrau rhanbarthol y pleidiau. Gwrthodwyd y Mesur gan y Llywodraeth, er mai dyma'r union newidiadau a weithredir ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, sydd, fel y bu i chi ein hatgoffa, yn cael ei Ail Ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yfory. Rhaid eich bod wedi trafod y mater hwn a'i oblygiadau i Gymru gyda'ch cyd-aelod, Peter Hain. Beth a ddywedodd ef wrthy ch am hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn gyndyn o ddweud 'pawb at y peth y bo', ond mae'n berthnasol yn yr achos hwn. Dylech hefyd edrych ar y sylwadau a wnaed ar fater ymgeisio deuol gan bobl flaenllaw ym myd gwleidyddiaeth yng Nghymru, heb gynnwys dim un o'm plaid i, gan na fydddech o angenrheidrwydd yn ymddiried yn y rheini. Efallai y dylech gyfeirio'ch sylwadau ynghylch natur annerbyniol y system bresennol a'r dryswch a achosir ganddi at Arglwydd Crughywel a'r Arglwydd Carlile. Bydd y geiriau hynny o ryw bwys, o leiaf, yn nadl yr Ail Ddarlleniad yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi yfory.

Peter Black: Gan ddychwelyd at weithdrefn Gorchymyn y Cyfrin Gyngor, un feirniadaeth o'r drefn benodol honno yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, a'i thebygrwydd i'r Mesur Diwygio Deddfwriaethol a Rheoleiddiol yw y credir y bydd, yn ei hanfod, yn dirymu'r Senedd ac yn rhoi gormod o rym yn nwylo un Gweinidog. O ystyried mai holl bwrpas Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yw creu rhaglaw yn swyddfa Peter Hain, a phwy bynnag fydd yn ei olynu, a ydych yn gyfforddus â'r darpariaethau hynny, ac a ydych yn hapus y bydd atebolrwydd democrataidd o ran pa benderfyniadau a wneir ar Orchmynion y Cyfrin Gyngor?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pe bydddech yn darllen

Constitution Committee's report, you would see that it says—and this is straight down the line, and very good advice to the House of Lords prior to the Second Reading—that the Orders in Council procedure confers powers not on a Minister but on the Assembly. Given that the Assembly has scrutiny powers, it is a far healthier proposition to delegate power to the Assembly and not to the Minister, rather than anything that is implicit in the Legislative and Regulatory Reform Bill.

adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfansoddiadol, fe welech ei fod yn dweud—ac mae hyn yn ddi-flewyn ar dafod ac yn gyngor da iawn i Dŷ'r Arglwyddi cyn yr Ail Ddarlleniad—fod gweithdrefn Gorchmynion y Cyfrin Gyngor yn rhoi pwerau, nid i Weinidog ond i'r Cynulliad. O ystyried bod gan y Cynulliad bwerau craffu, mae'n gynnig llawer iachach dirprwyo grym i'r Cynulliad ac nid i'r Gweinidog, yn hytrach na dim byd sydd ymhlyg yn y Mesur Diwygio Deddfwriaethol a Rheoleiddiol.

Materion Trafnidiaeth yng Nghaerffili **Transport Issues in Caerphilly**

Q6 Jeff Cuthbert: What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government on transport issues in Caerphilly? OAQ1398(FM)

C6 Jeff Cuthbert: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â materion trafndiaeth yng Nghaerffili? OAQ1398(FM)

The First Minister: As you would expect, most of the recent discussions with the UK Government on matters relating to transport in Caerphilly and the rest of Wales have related to the transfer of responsibility in 11 days' time for the Arriva Trains Wales 15-year franchise from the Department of Transport to the Assembly.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y byddech yn disgwyl, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r trafodaethau diweddar gyda Llywodraeth y DU am faterion yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth yng Nghaerffili a gweddill Cymru wedi bod yn ymwneud â throsglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros fasnachfaint 15 mlynedd Trenau Arriva Cymru ymhen 11 diwrnod o'r Adran Drafnidiaeth i'r Cynulliad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Thank you for that reply. Do you agree that it is very important that we encourage people to leave their cars at home and use public transport, particularly rail transport? Furthermore, do you agree that the commitment of Arriva Trains to obtaining more rolling stock is welcome, as is the upgrading of the Rhymney valley line? Does this not demonstrate our commitment to rail transport in contrast to the years of Tory neglect?

Jeff Cuthbert: Diolch i chi am yr ateb hwnnw. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig iawn inni annog pobl i adael eu ceir gartref a defnyddio trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, yn enwedig trenau? Yn ogystal, a ydych yn cytuno bod ymrwymiad Trenau Arriva i gael mwy o drenau yn un i'w groesawu, fel y mae uwchraddio llinell cwm Rhymni hefyd? Onid yw hyn yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i drafnidiaeth rheilffyrdd yn groes i'r blynyddoedd o esgeuluso gan y Toriaid?

The First Minister: Absolutely. We are now able to say that services from Cardiff's Queen Street station to Bargoed will be running at a rate of three an hour throughout the day, which is a massive improvement on the service that had been available for decades. The investment of £3 million was funded by us, the EU, Caerphilly County Borough Council, Network Rail and so forth. That is a typical example of the way in which we are encouraging commuters to get out of their cars—or to get into their cars, but to

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae modd inni bellach ddweud y bydd gwasanaethau o orsaf Heol y Frenhines, Caerdydd i Fargoed yn rhedeg ar gyfradd o dri thrên yr awr gydol y dydd, sy'n welliant enfawr ar y gwasanaeth a oedd wedi bod ar gael ers degawdau. Ariannwyd y buddsoddiad o £3 miliwn gennym ni, yr UE, Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, Network Rail ac yn y blaen. Dyna enghraifft nodweddiadol o'r modd yr ydym yn annog cymudwyr i ddod allan o'u ceir—neu i fynd i'w ceir ond eu gadael yn y cyfleuster parcio

leave them at a park-and-ride facility, say, somewhere in the Rhymney valley—and use the frequent train services from Bargoed or any station below Bargoed into Queen Street station.

Jocelyn Davies: The Minister responsible for transport is on the record as saying that transport in all areas of the south east, including Caerphilly, will be affected by the construction of the proposed M4 relief road. In the 1990s, the estimated cost was something like £350 million. No-one believed that then, and no-one believes now that the cost remains the same. How much money from the public purse are you prepared to risk on this environmental disaster, and will you explain how it will encourage people to get out of their cars and onto the train?

The First Minister: It is a new one on me that Plaid is opposed to the M4 relief road. I do not know whether you are speaking on behalf of all of your colleagues in saying what you do. That will be noted. If you oppose the M4 relief road, the problem is that it is difficult to see much in the way of development going west of the Brynglas tunnel in future. That would mean that the strip of land between the Brynglas tunnel and the Severn bridge would be heavily developed, but that, west of that, because there would be no relief road, people would not be able to get there.

On the question of the costing, the broad thrust of the approval for the new road that we, as a Government, have given, subject to all the statutory procedures, is that it will be funded by the road user, and not by the taxpayer.

Irene James: Do you agree that Assembly investment of £11.6 million in transport infrastructure across Caerphilly County Borough Council is an essential boost to the local economy, and particularly for Blackwood and Newbridge in my constituency? Do you also agree that the reopening of the Blaenau Gwent-Ebbw Vale-Newport-Cardiff rail line is an essential component of an effective, integrated transport network for the people of Islwyn?

a theithio, rywle yng nghwm Rhymni, dyweder—a defnyddio'r gwasanaeth trenau aml o Fargoed neu unrhyw orsaf yn is i lawr na Bargoed, i orsaf Heol y Frenhines.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae cofnod i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth ddweud y bydd effaith ar drafnidiaeth ym mhob ardal yn y de-ddwyrain, gan gynnwys Caerffili, yn sgîl adeiladu ffordd liniaru arfaethedig yr M4. Yn y 1990au, yr oedd amcangyfrif y gost tua £350 miliwn. Nid oedd neb yn credu hynny ar y pryd, ac nid oes neb yn credu heddiw fod y gost yn parhau yr un peth. Faint o arian o'r pwrs cyhoeddus yr ydych yn barod i'w wastraffu ar y trychineb amgylcheddol hwn, ac a wnewch esbonio sut y bydd yn annog pobl i ddod allan o'u cerbydau a mynd ar y trê'n?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n newyddion i mi fod Plaid yn gwrthwynebu ffordd liniaru'r M4. Ni wn a ydych yn siarad ar ran eich holl gyd-Aelodau wrth ddweud yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Nodir hynny. Os ydych yn gwrthwynebu ffordd liniaru'r M4, y broblem yw ei bod yn anodd gweld rhyw lawer o ddatblygiad o unrhyw fath yn mynd i'r gorllewin o dwannel Bryn-glas yn y dyfodol. Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai'r llain o dir rhwng twannel Bryn-glas a phont Hafren yn cael ei ddatblygu'n ddwys, ond i'r gorllewin o'r fan honno, ni fyddai pobl yn gallu mynd yno, oherwydd diffyg ffordd liniaru.

O ran cwestiwn y gost, mae'r gefnogaeth gyffredinol ar gyfer y ffordd newydd yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth wedi'i rhoi, yn ddarostyngedig i'r holl weithdrefnau statudol, yn seiliedig ar y ffaith y bydd yn cael ei hariannu gan ddefnyddwyr y ffordd, ac nid gan drethdalwyr.

Irene James: A ydych yn cytuno bod buddsoddiad y Cynulliad o £11.6 miliwn mewn seilwaith trafnidiaeth ar draws Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili yn hwb hanfodol i'r economi leol, ac yn benodol i'r Coed Duon a Threcelyn yn fy etholaeth i? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod ailagor llinell reilffordd Blaenau Gwent-Glyn Ebwy-Casnewydd-Caerdydd yn elfen hanfodol mewn rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth integredig effeithiol ar gyfer pobl Islwyn?

The First Minister: Absolutely. In answering Jeff Cuthbert earlier, I concentrated on the Rhymney valley. You are quite right to raise with me the issue of what happens on the Sirhowy valley side of Caerphilly County Borough Council as you represent it. The key thing is that there is an existing line and we are achieving three services an hour on the Bargoed to Queen Street station stretch, but that the stretch that you are talking about is a railway line that was closed by Beeching 40 or 50 years ago, which we are reopening. We are proud to be an administration that is reopening railway lines. We have already done that in the Vale of Glamorgan, and we will soon be able to say that we have done that with the Ebbw valley railway, which runs right through the middle of your constituency.

William Graham: Will you commit to the Maesycwmmmer bypass, the A472, in the interests of economic development in south-east Wales?

The First Minister: There has been considerable development of roads in that area, but that is led by the county council. These are not trunk roads. I am aware that the Sirhowy Enterprise Way was funded through the transport grant. I think that £1.4 million was made available for that. It is a private finance initiative scheme that is due to open in a couple of months. That will improve the A4048/A472 strategic highway and enable the Oakdale Business Park to achieve its full potential.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn hollol. Wrth ateb Jeff Cuthbert yn gynharach, bu imi ganolbwyntio ar gwm Rhymni. Yr ydych yn hollol gywir wrth godi gyda mi y cwestiwn beth sy'n digwydd ar ochr cwm Sirhywi i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, gan eich bod yn ei gynrychioli. Y peth allweddol yw bod llinell yno eisoes ac yr ydym yn llwyddo i ddarparu tri gwasanaeth yr awr ar y darn rhwng Bargoed a gorsaf Heol y Frenhines, ond mae'r rhan yr ydych chi'n sôn amdani yn llinell reilffordd a gaewyd gan Beeching 40 neu 50 mlynedd yn ôl. Yr ydym yn falch o fod yn weinyddiaeth sy'n ailagor llinellau rheilffordd. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny ym Mro Morgannwg, ac yn fuan bydd modd inni ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud hynny gyda rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy, sy'n rhedeg yn union drwy ganol eich etholaeth.

William Graham: A wnewch ymrwymo i ffordd osgoi Maesycwmer, yr A472, er budd datblygiad economaidd yn y de-ddwyrain?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu datblygu sylweddol ar ffyrdd yn yr ardal honno, ond y cyngor sir sy'n arwain o ran hynny. Nid cefnffyrdd yw'r rhain. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod Ffordd Menter Sirhywi wedi'i hariannu drwy'r grant trafndiaeth. Credaf fod £1.4 miliwn wedi'i ddarparu ar gyfer hynny. Mae'n gynllun cyllid preifat sydd i fod i agor ymhen deufis. Bydd yn gwella priffordd strategol yr A4048/A472 ac yn galluogi Parc Busnes Oakdale i gyflawni'i botensial yn llawn.

Darparu Gwasanaethau Gofal The Provision of Care Services

Q7 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of care services? OAQ1376(FM)

The First Minister: Domiciliary services are provided to people who need social care and are the responsibility of the local authority. Continuing healthcare is provided when the nature, intensity or complexity of a person's needs makes care the responsibility of the NHS. Continuing healthcare may be provided in hospital, in a care home or in a person's own home. I declare an interest in that regard.

C7 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau gofal? OAQ1376(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Darperir gwasanaethau cartref ar gyfer pobl sydd ag angen gofal cymdeithasol sy'n gyfrifoldeb i'r awdurdod lleol. Darperir gofal iechyd parhaus pan fo natur, dwysedd neu gymhlethdod anghenion rhywun yn golygu mai cyfrifoldeb y GIG yw'r gofal. Gellir darparu gofal iechyd parhaus mewn ysbyty, mewn cartref gofal neu yng nghartref yr unigolyn ei hun. Yr wyf

yn datgan buddiant yn hynny o beth.

2.40 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: I thank the First Minister for declaring the blindingly obvious and refer him back to his broken promise on the delivery of free homecare, which I was astonished to hear him refer to in an earlier answer as 'a modified commitment'. Does the First Minister know the difference between a modified commitment and a broken promise, and will he agree, as Brian Gibbons's line manager, to meet representatives of the Coalition on Charging? It is inaccurate for the Minister for Health and Social Services to say that he has discussed this with it. He announced the change of decision to it and has subsequently refused to see its representatives or to look at the other evidence that they have. If he will not meet them, First Minister, will you, as people are angry and have been let down? 'Modified' indeed.

The First Minister: They will be if they listen to you, but others will be interested in the areas where we have gone beyond the manifesto commitment. While accepting what you say about not meeting the manifesto pledge *per se*, I reiterate that we are putting in £76 million over a three-year period, which is 54 per cent more than the amount of money originally targeted. That will bring new service users into what was not covered in the pledge, namely the areas of Alzheimer's disease, telecare and the provision of items for use in the home, such as commodes and so forth.

Helen Mary Jones: Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am ddatgan yr hyn sy'n gwbl amlwg ac yr wyf yn ei gyfeirio'n ôl at yr addewid a dorrwyd ganddo ynghylch cyflwyno gofal cartref yn rhad ac am ddim, yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu ei glywed yn cyfeirio ato mewn ateb blaenorol fel 'ymrwymiad a addaswyd'. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod y gwahaniaeth rhwng ymrwymiad a addaswyd ac addewid a dorrwyd, ac a fydd ef yn cytuno, fel rheolwr llinell Brian Gibbons, i gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr y Glymblaid Taliadau? Mae'n anghywir i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddweud ei fod wedi trafod hyn gyda'r Glymblaid. Fe gyhoeddodd y newid yn y penderfyniad iddi, ac wedi hynny mae wedi gwrthod gweld ei chynrychiolwyr nac edrych ar dystiolaeth arall sydd ganddynt. Os na wnaiff gyfarfod â hwy, Brif Weinidog, a wnewch chi wneud hynny, gan fod pobl yn ddig ac wedi cael eu siomi? 'Wedi ei addasu' myn brain i!

Y Prif Weinidog: Fe fyddant, os gwrandawant arnoch chi, ond bydd eraill â diddordeb yn y meysydd lle yr ydym wedi mynd y tu hwnt i ymrwymiad y maniffesto. Er fy mod yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedwch ynghylch peidio â chyflawni addewid y maniffesto *per se*, yr wyf yn ailadrodd ein bod yn cyfrannu £76 miliwn dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, sy'n 54 y cant yn fwy na'r swm o arian a dargedwyd yn wreiddiol. Bydd hynny'n dod â defnyddwyr gwasanaeth newydd i mewn i'r hyn nad oedd wedi'i gynnwys yn yr addewid, sef meysydd clefyd Alzheimer, tele-ofal a darparu eitemau ar gyfer eu defnyddio yn y cartref, megis comedau ac yn y blaen.

Staff Asiantaethau Nyrsio Preifat Private Nursing Agency Staff

Q8 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister make a statement on the employment of private nursing agency staff by NHS trusts? OAQ1387(FM)

C8 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyflogi staff asiantaethau nyrsio preifat gan ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG? OAQ1387(FM)

The First Minister: An all-Wales agency nurse project commenced in December 2004

Y Prif Weinidog: Dechreuodd prosiect nyrsys asiantaeth Cymru gyfan ym mis

and aims to develop and agree a standard service specification for the supply of temporary agency nursing staff to NHS Wales. An all-Wales contract for the supply of agency nursing staff should be awarded between September and October 2006.

Jenny Randerson: Employing nursing agency staff is an expensive way of employing staff for hard-pressed trusts. Another pressure on them is the cost of 'Agenda for Change'. The Minister for Health and Social Services tells me in a written answer today that he will provide £56.8 million to fund 'Agenda for Change' in the next financial year. Some trusts, however, maintain that that will not be enough to cover the costs of the process. Some trusts, such as North East Wales NHS Trust and Velindre NHS Trust, have assimilated less than 15 per cent of their staff so far. Do you have any information on why some trusts are so slow in the 'Agenda for Change' process? The suspicion could be that they are slowing down because they feel that they cannot afford it. If a trust comes to you or your Minister with a good case for their financial allocation for 'Agenda for Change' not being enough, will you listen?

The First Minister: 'Agenda for Change' has been a massive change and it covers an awful lot more of the professions working around medicine than just nurses, so it may be the case mix of the number of physiotherapists, pathology laboratory technicians and so forth that is affecting this figure that you say that you have quoted from the two trusts. The general drive of getting the deficit culture out of the NHS in Wales is a very important objective. People must not think that they can roll over deficits forever and a day; they have to work within the money allocated to them. We have had a recent estimate that we are looking at a possible deficit of some £21 million in the NHS in Wales. That is part of the attempt to get the deficit culture out of the NHS, and it is being strongly managed by not only the civil servants concerned but also by Brian Gibbons. We have to drive the deficit culture

Rhagfyr 2004 a'i nod yw datblygu a chytuno ar fanyleb gwasanaeth safonol ar gyfer cyflenwi staff nyrsio dros dro o asiantaethau i GIG Cymru. Dylai cytundeb Cymru gyfan i ddarparu staff nyrsio o asiantaethau gael ei ddyfarnu rhwng Medi a Hydref 2006.

Jenny Randerson: Mae cyflogi staff asiantaethau nyrsio'n ffordd ddurd o gyflogi staff ar gyfer yr ymddiriedolaethau sydd dan bwysau. Pwysau arall arnynt yw cost yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wrthyf mewn ateb ysgrifenedig heddiw y bydd yn darparu £56.8 miliwn i ariannu'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Mae rhai ymddiriedolaethau, fodd bynnag, yn mynnu na fydd hynny'n ddigon ar gyfer costau'r broses. Mae rhai ymddiriedolaethau, megis Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Felindre, wedi cymhathu llai na 15 y cant o'u staff hyd yn hyn. A oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth paham mae rhai ymddiriedolaethau mor araf ym mhroses yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'? Gallai rhywun amau eu bod yn arafu am eu bod yn teimlo na allant ei fforddio. Os daw ymddiriedolaeth atoch chi neu eich Gweinidog gydag achos da dros ddweud bod eu dyraniad ariannol ar gyfer yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn annigonol, a wnewch wrando?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' wedi bod yn newid enfawr ac mae'n cynnwys llawer mwy o'r proffesiynau sy'n gweithio ym maes meddygaeth na nyrsys yn unig, felly mae'n bosibl mai cymysgedd y niferoedd o ffisiotherapyddion, technegwyr labordai ac yn y blaen sy'n effeithio ar y ffigur hwn, sydd, meddech chi, wedi'i ddyfynnu gan ddwy ymddiriedolaeth. Mae'r ymgyrch gyffredinol i gael gwared â diwylliant y diffyg o GIG Cymru yn amcan hynod bwysig. Rhaid i bobl beidio â meddwl y gallant gynhyrchu diffyg yn dragwyddol, rhaid iddynt weithio o fewn yr arian a ddyrennir iddynt. Yr ydym wedi cael amcangyfrif yn ddiweddar ein bod yn edrych ar rywbeth fel £21 miliwn o ddiffyg yn GIG Cymru. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r ymgais i gael gwared â diwylliant y diffyg o GIG Cymru, ac mae'n cael ei reoli'n gadarn nid yn unig gan y gweision sifil sy'n gysylltiedig ond

out.

Jonathan Morgan: You will know that the Royal College of Nursing maintains that the ‘Agenda for Change’ programme has been underfunded to the tune of some £24 million. Will you confirm whether that funding gap is accepted by the Government and, if it is, is it being addressed in the figures that Brian Gibbons has given to Jenny Randerson?

The First Minister: I do not know whether we accept the RCN figure, but I will ensure that Brian Gibbons writes to you on that point. The important point is that we believe that the allocations that have been given to each of the trusts and local health boards are fair. The difference between those trusts that manage to live within their means and those that do not has nothing to do with additional cost, but simply with the quality of the management. That is the big difference.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn sôn am ddyled o £21 miliwn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, ond a dderbyniwch fod swyddfa'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi cydnabod bellach mai £70 miliwn yw'r cyfanswm? Nid yw hynny'n cynnwys y diffyg yn y cyllid ar gyfer ‘Agenda ar gyfer Newid’ y mae Jonathan Morgan wedi cyfeirio ato hyd yn oed. Mae'r ddyled, gan gynnwys y ddyled hanesyddol, lawer yn fwy na'r hyn yr ydych yn ei chydabod. A ydych yn barod i gydnabod hynny'n gyhoeddus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n hollol anghywir. Y diffyg yr ydym ni yn ei ragweld—[*Torri ar draws.*] Peidiwch â phwyntio at Brian Gibbons. Y mae ef a minnau yn hollol gytûn ynghylch y ffigurau. Nid oes ots faint yr ydych yn ei ddweud o'ch sedd, mae'r ffigurau yn aros yr un peth. O ran y diffyg yr ydym yn ei ragweld fydd yn bodoli ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, yr ydym yn ceisio—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae hyn yn hollol annerbyniol. Cyfeiriais at hyn sawl gwaith.

hefyd gan Brian Gibbons. Rhaid i ni gael gwared â diwylliant y diffyg.

Jonathan Morgan: Fe fyddwch yn gwybod bod Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys yn mynnu bod rhaglen yr ‘Agenda ar gyfer Newid’ heb ei hariannu'n ddigonol, a'i bod tua £24 miliwn yn brin. A wnewch gadarnhau a dderbynnir y bwllch cyllido hwnnw gan eich Llywodraeth, ac os ydyw'n cael ei dderbyn, a yw'n derbyn sylw yn y ffigurau a roes Brian Gibbons i Jenny Randerson?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn a ydym yn derbyn ffigur Coleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys, ond sicrhaf y bydd Brian Gibbons yn ysgrifennu atoch ar y mater hwnnw. Y pwynt pwysig yw ein bod yn credu bod y dyraniadau a roddwyd i bob un o'r ymddiriedolaethau a'r byrddau iechyd lleol yn deg. Nid oes a wnelo'r gost ychwanegol ddim â'r gwahaniaeth rhwng yr ymddiriedolaethau hynny sy'n llwyddo i fyw o fewn yr arian sydd ganddynt a'r rhai nad ydynt yn llwyddo i wneud hynny, ond yn hytrach mae'n ymwneud yn syml iawn ag ansawdd y rheoli. Hynny yw'r gwahaniaeth mawr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You talk about a debt of £21 million in the national health service in Wales, but will you accept that the office of the Minister for Health and Social Services has now acknowledged that the total is £70 million? That does not even include the deficit in the funding for ‘Agenda for Change’ to which Jonathan Morgan referred. The debt, including the historical debt, is far greater than you acknowledge. Are you willing to acknowledge that publicly now?

The First Minister: That is completely wrong. The deficit that we predict—[*Interruption.*] Do not point at Brian Gibbons. He and I are entirely agreed on the figures. It does not matter how much you speak from a sedentary position, the figures remain the same. In terms of the deficit that we predict will exist at the end of the year, we are trying—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is quite unacceptable. I have referred to this several

Mae'r acwsteg yn y Siambr mor berffaith fel y gellir, os ydych yn bytheirio o'ch sedd, eich clywed ym mhob rhan o'r ystafell. Efallai eu bod yn eich clywed yn yr awyr, hyd yn oed.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y ffigur rhwng £20 miliwn a £21 miliwn, sef 0.5 y cant o holl gyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

times. The acoustics in the Chamber are so perfect that, if you shout from your seat, everyone can hear you in every part of the room. They may even be able to hear you in the sky.

The First Minister: The figure will be between £20 million and £21 million, which is 0.5 per cent of the entire budget of the health service in Wales.

Addysg Prifysgol University Education

Q9 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of university education in Wales? OAQ1381(FM)

The First Minister: The Assembly Government's 'Reaching Higher' strategy charts a clear course for higher education in Wales until 2010. I am sure that you will have been pleased to note the £16 million that was awarded to Bangor, Aberystwyth and Cardiff universities for collaboration under the reconfiguration programme.

Janet Ryder: Your Government has been in power for nearly seven years now, and you have a document in front of you that sets an end date of 2010 for 'Reaching Higher'. Is that the end date that your Government is aiming at to produce a full Welsh-medium higher education system in Wales? If not, what is that end date?

The First Minister: There is never any particular end date for increasing the capacity for teaching subjects through the medium of Welsh when the numbers, the skills and the teaching materials are there. We all know the problem, which is that, for centuries, it has been possible to teach Welsh literature, theology and so forth through the medium of Welsh—that has expanded greatly over the last 100 years—but getting that into the area of nuclear physics is difficult. However, we will expand the provision. We are continuing to expand it, when the teaching materials become available and when the critical mass of students is available to study such subjects.

C9 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth addysg prifysgol yng Nghymru? OAQ1381(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae strategaeth 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch' y Cynulliad yn pennu llwybr clir ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru hyd at 2010. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch wedi bod yn falch o nodi'r £16 miliwn a roddwyd i brifysgolion Bangor, Aberystwyth a Chaerdydd ar gyfer cydweithredu o dan y rhaglen ailgyflunio.

Janet Ryder: Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi bod mewn grym ers bron saith mlynedd bellach, ac mae gennych ddogfen o'ch blaen sy'n rhoi 2010 fel dyddiad terfynol ar gyfer 'Ymgeisio yn Uwch'. Ai dyna'r dyddiad terfynol y mae eich Llywodraeth yn anelu ato i greu system addysg uwch cyfrwng Cymraeg gyflawn yng Nghymru? Os nad yw hynny'n wir, beth yw'r dyddiad terfynol hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes byth ddyddiad terfynol penodol ar gyfer cynyddu'r capasiti i ddsygu pynciau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg pan fo'r niferoedd, y sgiliau a'r deunyddiau dysgu yno'n barod. Gwyddom i gyd beth yw'r broblem, sef ei bod, ers canrifoedd, wedi bod yn bosibl dysgu llenyddiaeth Gymraeg, diwinyddiaeth ac yn y blaen drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg—mae hynny wedi ehangu'n sylweddol dros y 100 mlynedd diwethaf—ond mae gwneud hynny ym maes ffiseg niwclear yn anodd. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ehangu'r ddarpariaeth. Yr ydym yn parhau i'w hehangu, pan fydd y deunyddiau dysgu ar gael a phan fydd y màs critigol o fyfyrwyr ar gael i astudio pynciau o'r fath.

Cynllun Pasbort Ceffylau Horse Passport Scheme

Q10 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister provide an update on the horse passport scheme in Wales? OAQ1384(FM)

The First Minister: The Horse Passports (Wales) Regulations 2005 require all horses, ponies and donkeys in Wales to have a passport. The situation has not changed since my update on 24 January. However, I believe that the Royal Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals says that because of those regulations there have been fewer animal welfare problems in terms of the semi-feral ponies found on the Brecon Beacons and elsewhere in Wales this winter, despite it being so harsh.

Brynle Williams: Do you agree that the absence of a central database makes a mockery of the whole passport system and that it is an embarrassment to your Government that we have not been able to get this up and running?

The First Minister: There are a couple of issues there. There is the fact that there are seven Welsh-based passport-issuing organisations. They have supplied their mandatory data, but only two have provided any voluntary data. That may be what you are referring to. There are also these proposals to cover the wild or semi-feral populations, but no decision has yet been reached by the commission. In particular, we do not have anyone coming forward who is willing to cover the semi-feral population of ponies in the Brecon Beacons and the uplands of Glamorgan and Gwent.

C10 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynllun pasport ceffylau yng Nghymru? OAQ1384(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: O dan Reoliadau Pasportau Ceffylau (Cymru) 2005, rhaid i'r holl geffylau, merlod a mulod yng Nghymru fod â phasport. Nid yw'r sefyllfa wedi newid ers imi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi ar 24 Ionawr. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Atal Creulondeb i Anifeiliaid yn dweud, oherwydd y rheoliadau hynny, fod llai o broblemau lles anifeiliaid wedi bod gyda'r merlod lled-wyllt sydd ar y Bannau ac mewn ambell le arall yng Nghymru dros y gaeaf eleni, er ei bod mor arw.

Brynle Williams: A ydych yn cytuno bod diffyg cronfa ddata ganolog yn gwneud y system pasport gyfan yn destun sbort a bod y ffaith nad ydym wedi gallu sefydlu un yn peri annifyrrwch i'ch Llywodraeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi amryw o bwyntiau. Mae saith o sefydliadau yng Nghymru sy'n dosbarthu pasportau. Mae'r rhain wedi rhoi eu data gorfodol, ond dim ond dau sydd wedi darparu unrhyw ddata gwirfoddol. Efallai mai at hynny yr ydych yn cyfeirio. Hefyd mae'r cynigion hyn ar gyfer y poblogaethau gwyllt neu led-wyllt, ond nid yw'r comisiwn wedi gwneud dim penderfyniad eto. Yn benodol, nid oes neb sy'n fodlon darparu ar gyfer y boblogaeth o ferlod lled-wyllt yn y Bannau ac yn ucheldir Morgannwg a Gwent.

Cronfeydd Strwythurol Ewrop European Structural Funds

Q11 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister provide an update on progress with regard to the current round of European structural funds? OAQ1396(FM)

The First Minister: Structural funds are

C11 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd a wnaed yn y rownd gyfredol o gronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop? OAQ1396(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r cronfeydd

making a huge contribution to the regeneration of Wales and are contributing to its transformation into a vibrant country with a thriving economy. February figures show that nearly £1.5 billion has been invested in 2,700 projects, with a total of over £3.5 billion invested in projects in Wales.

Nick Bourne: Wales is officially the poorest region of the UK, with three of the bottom five sub-regions in the UK being in Wales, namely Ynys Môn, the Gwent Valleys and South Wales West, two of which I referred to earlier, with not much response. Is the First Minister concerned that, despite structural-fund spending, the divide between Wales and the rest of the UK is getting larger rather than smaller?

The First Minister: If you look at the figures for the four Objective 1 regions, you will have seen that the two urban regions, namely Merseyside and south Yorkshire, which have completed their thirteenth and fourteenth years in Objective 1, have done well, and that Wales has not done as well as they have, because it is only in its first phase of Objective 1. The real bottom marker is Cornwall, which has an extremely low GDP, although it is not a region as Wales is. It is obvious from that that areas that have high populations of retired people are experiencing difficulties compared with the urban areas. Those that are in their first phase of Objective 1 are not doing as well as those that are getting their second round of Objective 1 funding, such as south Yorkshire, Merseyside or the Irish Republic.

2.50 p.m.

Ailstrwythuro'r Heddlu Restructuring of the Police

C13 Eleanor Burnham: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ynglŷn ag ailstrwythuro'r heddlu? OAQ1385(FM)

The First Minister: I have had frequent discussions with the Government. I spoke to Charles Clarke, the Home Secretary, about

strwythurol yn gwneud cyfraniad aruthrol tuag at adfywio Cymru ac yn cyfrannu at ei gweddnewid yn wlad sy'n llawn bywyd gydag economi ffyniannus. Dengys ffigurau mis Chwefror fod bron £1.5 biliwn wedi'i fuddsoddi mewn 2,700 o brosiectau, gyda chyfanswm o dros £3.5 biliwn wedi'i fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Cymru yn swyddogol yw rhanbarth tlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig, gyda thri o'r pump is-ranbarth isaf yn y DU yng Nghymru, sef Ynys Môn, Cymoedd Gwent a Gorllewin De Cymru, a chyfeiriais at ddau o'r rhain yn gynharach ond ni chefais lawer o ymateb. Onid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn poeni, er gwaethaf y gwariant o dan y cronfeydd strwythurol, fod y bwlch rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU yn mynd yn fwy yn hytrach nag yn llai?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau ar gyfer y pedwar rhanbarth Amcan 1, byddwch wedi gweld bod y ddau ranbarth trefol, sef Glannau Mersi a de swydd Efrog, sydd wedi cwblhau eu trydedd flwyddyn ar ddeg a'u pedwaredd flwyddyn ar ddeg yn Amcan 1, wedi gwneud yn dda, ac nad yw Cymru wedi gwneud cystal, gan nad yw ond yn ei chyfnod Amcan 1 cyntaf. Yr isaf mewn gwirionedd yw Cernyw, sydd â chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth eithriadol isel, er nad yw'n rhanbarth, fel Cymru. Mae'n amlwg bod yr ardaloedd sydd â phoblogaeth uchel o bobl wedi ymddeol yn cael anhawster o'u cymharu â'r ardaloedd trefol. Nid yw'r rhai sydd yn eu cyfnod Amcan 1 cyntaf yn gwneud cystal â'r rhai sy'n derbyn eu hail rownd o gyllid Amcan 1, fel de swydd Efrog, Glannau Mersi neu Weriniaeth Iwerddon.

Q13 Eleanor Burnham: What recent discussions has the First Minister had with the Government in Westminster regarding the restructuring of the police? OAQ1385(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi bod yn trafod hyn yn gyson â'r Llywodraeth. Cefais air â Charles Clarke, yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, am

this issue last week, and the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, Edwina Hart, has had regular exchanges with Home Office Ministers and recently drew the Home Secretary's attention to the written statement that was laid before the Assembly two Fridays ago.

Eleanor Burnham: Gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, fod pryderon mawr, a rennir gennyf fi a fy etholwyr, ynglŷn ag Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Maent yn pryderu yn fawr am y dirywiad yn safon plismona, am y gost ac am y ffaith y bydd y dreth gyngor yn codi oherwydd praeseptau'r heddlu. Beth fydd y gost yng Nghymru, ac a yw'r gost yn cynnwys systemau technoleg gwybodaeth, oherwydd y mae pryderon ynglŷn â hynny hefyd? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw fy llais yn dda iawn heddiw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn deall. Lle mae lefel y praeseptau yn wahanol iawn rhwng ardaloedd awdurdodau lle bydd y cyfuno yn digwydd—er enghraifft, mae gan y gogledd braesept uchel, ac mae gan dde Cymru, yr hen sir Forgannwg, braesept isel—ac os oes angen mawr o ran plismona cymunedol—dylid ymdrin â hyn dros ddwy, dair, pedair neu pum mlynedd a symud drwy'r broses gyfuno er mwyn cael un praesept ar y diwedd. Y peth pwysicaf yw sicrhau bod y broses hon yn ddigonol ac yn cael ei gweld fel proses sy'n ddigonol i bob rhan o Gymru.

y mater hwn yr wythnos diwethaf, a bu'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, Edwina Hart, yn ei drafod yn rheolaidd â Gweinidogion y Swyddfa Gartref ac, yn ddiweddar, tynnodd sylw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref at y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyflwynwyd i'r Cynulliad ddau ddydd Gwener yn ôl.

Eleanor Burnham: You will be aware that there are major concerns, which I and my constituents share, with regard to North Wales Police Authority. They are very concerned about the decline in policing standards, about the cost and about the fact that council tax will rise because of police precepts. What will the cost be in Wales, and does that cost include information technology systems, because there are concerns about that too? I am sorry that my voice is not good today.

The First Minister: I understand. Where the level of precept is very different in the police authority areas where the merger will occur—for example, north Wales has a high precept, while south Wales, the former county of Glamorgan, has a low precept—and if community policing is a significant need, this should be dealt with over a period of two, three, four or five years by moving towards a single precept at the end of the merger process. The most important thing is to ensure that this process is adequate and will be seen to be adequate for all parts of Wales.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have one change to report to this week's business. The motion to elect Members to the planning decision committee has been withdrawn and will come forward next week with the motion to suspend Standing Order Nos. 17.4 to 17.6.

The business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda. Following the meeting of the Business Committee this morning, it has been determined that the following items of

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r cynnig i ethol Aelodau ar y pwyllgor penderfyniadau cynllunio wedi'i dynnu'n ôl ac fe'i cyflwynir yr wythnos nesaf ynghyd â'r cynnig i roi heibio Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 17.4 i 17.6.

Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, a ddylai fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at

subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources and Sums for Personal Requirements) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Education (Parenting Orders) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Anti-social Behaviour Act 2003 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2006; the Tuberculosis (Wales) Order 2006; the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000 (Commencement No. 8 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006; the Sheep and Goats (Records, Identification and Movement) (Wales) Order 2006. [*Laughter.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Members will know that, on a number of occasions, I have sought to get this procedure changed. We will not have it after 2007. Can we please leave it alone and not draw attention to the form of legislation that we sometimes have to pass. A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol ac, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf un aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol i ymateb yn fyr i'r cynnig.

Jane Hutt: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Hoffwn ddweud yn gyntaf, Weinidog, fy mod yn hynod o siomedig nad ydych wedi caniatáu dadl ar ddyledion yr ymddiriedolaethau iechyd a'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae hwn yn fater o bryder gwirioneddol ym mhob rhan o Gymru, a chredaf y dylid cael trafodaeth gynnar iawn yn y Cynulliad ar y mater.

Hefyd, yr wyf yn gobeithio y daw datganiad ar y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Mae cymaint o swyddi wedi cael eu colli bellach yn y maes hwn fel ei bod yn bwysig ein bod yn cael trafodaeth yn ei gylch. Mae Jocelyn Davies wedi codi nifer o faterion eraill gyda chi er mwyn sicrhau ein

bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Aesu Adnoddau a Symiau at Anghenion Personol) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Addysg (Gorchmynion Rhianta) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Deddf Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Twbercwlosis (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd ar gyfer Ceisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Deddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 8 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Defaid a Geifr (Cofnodion, Adnabod a Symud) (Cymru) 2006. [*Chwerthin.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Bydd yr Aelodau yn gwybod fy mod, droeon, wedi ceisio newid y weithdrefn hon. Ni fydd hi gennym ar ôl 2007. A allwn adael llonydd iddi a pheidio â thynnu sylw at y math o ddeddfwriaeth y mae'n rhaid inni weithiau ei phasio? Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, therefore I ask that the Minister formally moves the business statement and, under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call one member from each political group to respond briefly to the proposal.

Jane Hutt: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: First, we are extremely disappointed, Minister, that you have not agreed to a debate on the deficits of the health trusts and the local health boards. This is a matter of real concern in every part of Wales, and I believe that we should have an early discussion in the Assembly on the issue.

Furthermore, I hope that there will be a statement on the position of the manufacturing industry in Wales. Given that so many jobs have been lost in that sector, it is exceptionally important that we have a discussion on that. Jocelyn Davies has raised a number of other matters with you in order

bod yn cael dadleuon ar yr holl faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a'r dyledion y soniais amdanynt.

Gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyfeirio at Gemau'r Gymanwlad—ac yr ydym i gyd yn llongyfarch y ddau sydd wedi ennill medalau aur a'r rhai sydd wedi ennill medalau eraill—onid yw hi'n amser inni gael trefn yng Nghymru sy'n caniatáu inni ddatgan ein diolchgarwch iddynt ac i roi rhywbeth iddynt i ddiolch am eu gwasanaeth? Yr wyf yn sôn am ryw fath o system anrhydeddau. Nid ydym eisiau trefn debyg i'r un yn Lloegr, lle maent yn talu am yr anrhydeddau y maent yn eu derbyn. Yng Nghymru, dymunwn gael system sy'n caniatáu inni longyfarch ein pobl ifanc, sy'n gweithio mor galed, mewn ffordd y byddai pobl Cymru yn ei gwerthfawrogi.

Lisa Francis: It is courteous to thank you for what you have come back with today, Business Minister, but the Conservative group will not support the business statement. The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport told us in committee on 8 March, two weeks ago, that he would issue a statement on the transitional arrangements for appointing an arts council chair shortly. He said 'shortly', but he must be disorientated after his recent trip down under if he thinks that 'shortly' means after two weeks. The current chair will leave the post at the end of next week, on 31 March, and there is no-one to take over. The post has not been advertised and this happens at a most crucial time, when the arts in Wales are about to undergo a review. We cannot support this kind of dilatory process and high-handed arrogance.

The £71 million deficit in the NHS in Wales speaks for itself. Business Minister, if you do not think that that warrants an oral statement, then it speaks volumes about the arrogance that we have, sadly, come to associate with your Government. Similarly, following 250 job losses at Panasonic, a written statement is not enough—it simply does not cut it.

Peter Black: I support the previous business managers on the need for a debate on NHS

to ensure that we have a debate on all those issues relating to the manufacturing industry and the deficits to which I referred.

As the First Minister referred to the Commonwealth Games—and we all congratulate the two gold-medal winners and other medal winners—is it not time that we had a system in Wales that allows us to express our gratitude to them and to give them something in thanks for their service? I am talking about some kind of honours system. We do not want a system similar to that in England, whereby people pay for the honours that they receive. In Wales, we want a system that allows us to congratulate our young people, who work so hard, in a way that the people of Wales would appreciate.

Lisa Francis: Byddai'n gwrtais diolch ichi heddiw am yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i gyflwyno inni heddiw, Drefnydd, ond ni fydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon wrthym yn y pwyllgor ar 8 Mawrth, bythefnos yn ôl, y byddai'n gwneud datganiad am y trefniadau trosiannol ar gyfer penodi cadeirydd i gyngor y celfyddydau yn fuan. 'Yn fuan' a ddywedodd, ond rhaid ei fod wedi drysu braidd ar ôl ei daith i ochr draw'r byd yn ddiweddar os yw'n meddwl bod 'yn fuan' yn golygu ar ôl pythefnos. Bydd y cadeirydd presennol yn gadael ddiwedd yr wythnos nesaf, ar 31 Mawrth, ac nid oes neb i ddod yn ei le. Nid yw'r swydd wedi'i hysbysebu ac mae hyn yn digwydd ar adeg hollbwysig, pan fo'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru ar fin cael eu hadolygu. Ni allwn gefnogi proses mor araf deg na'r math hwn o drahauster awdurdodol.

Mae'r diffyg o £71 miliwn yn y GIG yng Nghymru yn siarad drosto'i hun. Drefnydd, os nad ydych yn meddwl bod hynny'n cyfiawnhau datganiad llafar, yna mae'n siarad cyfrolau am y trahauster yr ydym, yn anffodus, wedi dod i'w gysylltu â'ch Llywodraeth. Yr un modd, yn sgîl colli 250 o swyddi yn Panasonic, nid yw datganiad ysgrifenedig yn ddigon—ni wnaiff hyn y tro o gwbl.

Peter Black: Cefnogaf y rheolwyr busnes blaenorol o ran bod angen dadl am ddiffygion

deficits. It is important, given the impact that that could have on services, that we have a further discussion on this and a further opportunity to scrutinise the Minister on how this is impacting on the NHS in Wales.

I welcome the Minister's offer of a debate on the POWER commission next term. It is important that we have that. Furthermore, I reiterate the request that I made this morning for a statement on sprinklers in schools and how these should be financed. Given the events of the weekend and in terms of the general sustainability of our schools, the protection of education authority property and the work of pupils and staff, it is important that sprinkler systems are installed in all new schools and as part of any refurbishment work undertaken. It is important that we have some form of funding stream in addition to the school building improvement grant, which, as my colleague Mike German pointed out earlier, has been cut, so that that can be financed. I would welcome a statement or an opportunity to question the Minister on that issue.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): Your responses are extraordinary given that I have just calculated that I received 12 requests at Business Committee this morning on top of the 12 that I received last week; I have agreed to six in full and I am considering others. The point that Peter made on sprinkler systems in schools is very important. We are all concerned about what happened at the weekend and, as I said earlier, an appropriate response is being considered. We must have an appropriate response, and the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration and I have just been discussing the opportunities to report back next week on how we can bring forward a statement on sprinkler systems. That is a key point.

On your request for a statement on the funding deficit in the NHS in Wales, you must have been on the train from London alongside me yesterday, because there is a big issue in England on the deficit in the NHS, but there is nothing like that in Wales. You love to look at what is going on in

ariannol y GIG. Mae'n bwysig, ac ystyried yr effaith y gallai hynny ei chael ar wasanaethau, ein bod yn cael trafodaeth bellach ar hyn a chyfle pellach i graffu ar y Gweinidog ynghylch sut y mae hyn yn effeithio ar y GIG yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn croesawu cynnig y Gweinidog i gael dadl ar gomisiwn POWER y tymor nesaf. Mae'n bwysig inni gael hynny. Yn ogystal, hoffwn ailadrodd y cais a wneuthum y bore yma am ddatganiad am systemau taenu dŵr mewn ysgolion a sut y dylid talu amdanynt. Ac ystyried digwyddiadau'r penwythnos ac o ran cynaliadwyedd cyffredinol ein hysgolion, diogelu eiddo'r awdurdodau addysg a gwaith y disgyblion a'r staff, mae'n bwysig bod systemau taenu dŵr yn cael eu gosod ym mhob ysgol newydd ac fel rhan o unrhyw waith ailwampio a wneir. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym ryw fath o ffrwd gyllido yn ogystal â'r grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion, sydd, fel y soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mike German, yn gynharach, wedi'i gwtogi, fel y gellir talu amdanynt. Byddwn yn croesawu datganiad neu gyfle i holi'r Gweinidog ar y mater hwnnw.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae eich ymateb yn anhygoel o ystyried fy mod newydd weithio allan fy mod wedi derbyn 12 o geisiadau yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma yn ychwanegol at y 12 a dderbyniais yr wythnos diwethaf; yr wyf wedi cydsynio â chwech yn llawn ac yn ystyried eraill. Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Peter am systemau taenu dŵr mewn ysgolion yn un pwysig iawn. Yr ydym i gyd yn bryderus ynghylch yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y penwythnos ac, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae ymateb priodol yn cael ei ystyried. Rhaid inni roi ymateb priodol, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a minnau newydd fod yn trafod y cyfleoedd sydd gennym i adrodd yn ôl yr wythnos nesaf ar sut y gallwn wneud datganiad am systemau taenu dŵr. Mae'n bwynt allweddol.

Ynghylch eich cais am ddatganiad am y diffyg ariannol yn y GIG yng Nghymru, rhaid mai chi oedd wrth fy ymyl ar y trê'n o Lundain ddoe, oherwydd y mae cryn drafod yn Lloegr ar y diffyg yn y GIG, ond nid oes trafodaeth debyg yng Nghymru. Yr ydych wrth eich bodd yn edrych ar yr hyn sy'n

England, but the Minister for Health and Social Services made a statement on NHS finances on 15 February. There was an action point for Brian Gibbons to provide a note from the 8 March meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee, detailing the local health boards' actual and accumulative debts in due course. So, you will get that note, which is very important in terms of the response that was made on a statement on NHS funding.

On Ieuan's question, let us celebrate today's gold medals and Wales's team in the Commonwealth Games. What has been delivered is tremendous. Let us celebrate the fact that David Davies is not just a hero for the people of Barry, but he is a hero in Australia. [*Interruption.*]

3.00 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is worth listening to.

Jane Hutt: No non-Australian has won that 1,500m swimming race since 1954. I totally agree with Ieuan; let us celebrate the fact that we have such a winner. Let us invite him here for recognition. We need to look at how we recognise people. We must also remember Hayley Tullett, the Swansea runner, who won the bronze medal, which is really important. Let us turn this into smiles and good news across the Chamber and look at how we can honour them.

You may have had a late response, Ieuan, but there will be a debate on manufacturing. I do not know whether you heard that; there was, perhaps, a misunderstanding. The Minister has agreed to schedule time for debate on manufacturing during the course of the next session, so that is a positive response.

We do not intend to schedule time, Lisa, for a statement on the appointment system for the chair of the arts council and the transition arrangements, as we are complying with the terms of the Plenary motion of 1 February. The chair is a public appointment and interim

digwydd yn Lloegr, ond gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad am sefyllfa ariannol y GIG ar 15 Chwefror. Yr oedd yn cynnwys pwynt gweithredu ar gyfer Brian Gibbons i ddarparu nodyn o gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 8 Mawrth, yn manylu ar ddyledion gwirioneddol a chronnol y byrddau iechyd lleol maes o law. Felly, byddwch yn derbyn y nodyn hwnnw, sy'n bwysig iawn o ran yr ymateb a wnaed ar ddatganiad ynghylch cyllid y GIG.

Yng nghyswllt cwestiwn Ieuan, gadewch inni ddathlu'r medalau aur a enillwyd heddiw a thîm Cymru yng Ngemau'r Gymanwlad. Mae'r hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni yn wych. Gadewch inni ddathlu'r ffaith bod David Davies nid yn unig yn arwr i bobl y Barri, ond mae'n arwr yn Awstralia. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'n werth gwrandao ar hyn.

Jane Hutt: Nid oes neb nad yw'n Awstraliad wedi ennill y ras honno ers 1954. Cytunaf yn llwyr â Ieuan; gadewch inni ddathlu'r ffaith bod gennym enillydd o'r fath. Gadewch inni ei wahodd ef yma i'w longyfarch. Mae gofyn i ni ystyried ein ffordd o gydnabod pobl. Rhaid inni hefyd gofio am Hayley Tullett, y rhedwraig o Abertawe, a enillodd y fedal efydd, sydd yn wirioneddol bwysig. Gadewch i ni droi hyn yn destun gwên a newyddion da drwy'r holl Siambr, ac ystyried sut i'w hanrhydeddu hwy.

Efallai i chi gael ymateb hwyr, Ieuan, ond bydd dadl am weithgynhyrchu. Ni wn a glywsoch hynny; bu camddealltwriaeth, o bosibl. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cytuno i neilltuo amser ar gyfer dadl ar weithgynhyrchu yn ystod y sesiwn nesaf, felly mae hynny'n ymateb cadarnhaol.

Nid ydym yn bwriadu neilltuo amser, Lisa, ar gyfer datganiad am y system o benodi cadeirydd cyngor y celfyddydau a'r trefniadau trosiannol, gan ein bod yn cydymffurfio â geiriad y cynnig yng Nghyfarfod Llawn 1 Chwefror. Mae'r

arrangements will be announced shortly. In terms of taking this forward, we have delivered—as I said, we have delivered half of what was requested this morning.

We have time and cause for celebration today. Let us leave the business statement on that important positive point.

cadeirydd yn benodiad cyhoeddus a chyhoeddir trefniadau interim gyda hyn. O ran gweithredu hyn, yr ydym wedi cyflawni—fel y dywedais, yr ydym wedi cyflawni hanner yr hyn y gofynnwyd amdano y bore yma.

Mae gennym amser ac achos i ddathlu heddiw. Gadewch i ni adael y datganiad busnes ar y pwynt cadarnhaol pwysig hwnnw.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 26.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Datganiad am y Contract Cyflenwi Ocsigen Statement on the Supply of Oxygen Contract

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I will begin by putting the new oxygen contract into context. In 1999, the Department of Health asked the Royal College of Physicians to lead a multidisciplinary working party to devise

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Dechreuaf drwy osod y contract ocsigen yn ei gyd-destun. Yn 1999, gofynnodd yr Adran Iechyd i Goleg Brenhinol y Ffisigwyr arwain gweithgor aml-ddisgyblaethol i lunio

new clinical guidelines for the use of domiciliary oxygen. A number of these guidelines had implications for the content of the existing domiciliary oxygen service and for the way in which the service was delivered. It was clear that this vital resource, which had seen only one significant change in the past 50 years—the introduction of oxygen concentrators—had become out of date in terms of the service offered to patients and its cost-effectiveness.

Against this background, the then health Minister, Lord Hunt, decided that a review of the domiciliary oxygen service should take place. At that time, the service consisted principally of the provision of oxygen either from large cylinders supplied by community pharmacists or by way of an oxygen concentrator installed in the patient's home by a contractor.

Although community pharmacists were providing a reliable service with their supply, the modalities that GPs could prescribe under the NHS were severely limited. The newest and often best technologies were not often used unless the patient chose to purchase them independently. Patients were unable to access ambulatory oxygen that could significantly improve their quality of life.

So, where are we now? Following the introduction of the new home oxygen service on 1 February, Members will be only too aware from my statements, and from their own postbags, that a large number of issues have arisen with Air Products Ltd, many of which have been discussed at length in the Health and Social Services Committee and elsewhere.

The people involved in this new contract had a vision of a better service for patients, and there has been considerable disappointment over the first six weeks that this has not been realised. However, I remain convinced that this service will ultimately help patients to manage their symptoms better at home, in the workplace or at school, but not—most importantly—in hospital. We must reassure this vulnerable group of patients that this will

canllawiau clinigol newydd ar gyfer defnyddio ocsigen cartref. Yr oedd gan nifer o'r canllawiau hyn oblygiadau i gynnwys y gwasanaeth ocsigen cartref cyfredol ac i'r ffordd yr oedd y gwasanaeth yn cael ei ddarparu. Yr oedd yn amlwg bod yr adnodd hollbwysig hwn, nad oedd ond un newid arwyddocaol wedi digwydd iddo yn y 50 mlynedd diwethaf—cyflwyno crynodyddion ocsigen—wedi dod i ddiwedd ei oes o ran y gwasanaeth a gynigiai i gleifion a'i gost-effeithiolrwydd.

Yn wyneb hyn, penderfynodd y Gweinidog Iechyd ar y pryd, yr Arglwydd Hunt, y dylid cynnal adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ocsigen cartref. Bryd hynny, yr oedd y gwasanaeth, yn bennaf, yn golygu darparu ocsigen naill ai o silindrau mawr a ddarperid gan fferyllwyr cymunedol neu o grynodydd ocsigen wedi ei osod yng nghartref y claf gan gontractwr.

Er bod fferyllwyr cymunedol yn darparu gwasanaeth dibynadwy gyda'u cyflenwad, yr oedd y dulliau triniaeth yr oedd meddygon teulu yn gallu eu rhagnodi dan y GIG wedi eu cyfyngu'n ddifrifol. Yn aml, nid oedd y technolegau diweddaraf a gorau yn cael eu defnyddio onid oedd y claf yn dewis eu prynu drosto'i hun. Nid oedd cleifion yn gallu cael silindrau ocsigen symudol a allai wella ansawdd eu bywyd yn sylweddol.

Felly, beth yw'r sefyllfa erbyn hyn? Yn dilyn cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth ocsigen cartref newydd ar 1 Chwefror, bydd yr Aelodau yn gwybod yn iawn, yn sgîl fy natganiadau i a'r llythyrau y maent hwy eu hunain wedi eu cael, fod nifer fawr o broblemau wedi codi gydag Air Products Ltd, ac mae llawer ohonynt wedi eu trafod yn helaeth yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac mewn lleoedd eraill.

Gweledigaeth y bobl a oedd yn ymwneud â'r contract newydd hwn oedd gwell gwasanaeth ar gyfer cleifion, a thestun siom enbyd yn ystod y chwe wythnos gyntaf yw na wireddwyd y weledigaeth honno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn parhau'n argyhoeddedig y bydd y gwasanaeth hwn, yn y pen draw, yn helpu cleifion i reoli eu symptomau yn well yn eu cartref, yn y gweithle neu yn yr ysgol, ond nid—yn hollbwysig—mewn ysbyty.

be the case.

The new contract is UK-wide, and the problems experienced are not peculiar to Wales and are not confined to Air Products Ltd. Other suppliers used in England are experiencing similar difficulties. Air Products planned its capacity to meet double the normal demand in the number of patients, but this proved far less than was needed. At the start of February, its call centre experienced an unprecedented demand, with over 5,000 calls on one day. This led to much frustration among patients and health professionals alike, as they were unable to get through. Air Products has recruited, and is still recruiting, more staff to cope with the sharp increase in demand, not only in its call centre, but also to expand its delivery function.

Pharmacists have continued to operate the old system in tandem with the new to relieve the pressure on the new contractor. I continue to be grateful to those community pharmacists who have extended their service throughout February, and into March. This is typical of the professionalism of pharmacists in Wales, which we value so highly. WP10s will continue to be valid for oxygen until further notice. The continuity of supply to patients remains of paramount importance, and extra costs to achieve this will be met centrally by the NHS in Wales in the first instance.

Air Products is now fully meeting its commitments regarding hospital discharges and emergency provision. It has assimilated 1,815 patients in the last six weeks. This is in addition to nearly 3,000 patients in receipt of long-term oxygen therapy through the provision of concentrators in their home. The vast majority of these patients are now also having their back-up cylinders and any ambulatory oxygen prescribed through the new contractor.

Some patients are receiving more than one type of oxygen therapy, making the data

Rhaid inni sicrhau'r grŵp bregus hwn o gleifion mai felly y bydd hi.

Mae'r contract newydd ar lefel y DU gyfan, ac nid yw'r problemau a brofir yn benodol i Gymru ac nid ydynt wedi eu cyfyngu i Air Products Ltd. Mae cyflenwyr eraill a ddefnyddir yn Lloegr yn wynebu'r un problemau. Cynlluniodd Air Products ei gapasiti ar gyfer bodloni dwywaith yn fwy na'r galw arferol yn nifer y cleifion, ond profodd hyn yn llawer llai na'r hyn yr oedd ei angen. Ddechrau Chwefror, profodd eu canolfan alwadau alw na welwyd ei debyg o'r blaen, gyda dros 5,000 o alwadau mewn diwrnod. Esgrodd hyn ar rwystredigaeth sylweddol ymhlith cleifion a gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, fel ei gilydd, gan nad oedd modd iddynt gael ateb i'w galwadau. Mae Air Products wedi recriwtio, ac maent yn parhau i recriwtio, rhagor o staff i ateb y cynnydd syfrdanol yn y galw, nid dim ond yn ei ganolfan alwadau, ond hefyd er mwyn ehangu ei swyddogaeth darparu.

Mae fferyllwyr wedi parhau i redeg yr hen system ochr yn ochr â'r un newydd, er mwyn ysgafnhau'r pwysau ar y contractwr newydd. Yr wyf yn parhau'n ddiolchgar i'r fferyllwyr cymunedol hynny sydd wedi ymestyn eu gwasanaeth gydol mis Chwefror a hyd at fis Mawrth. Mae hyn yn nodweddiadol o broffesiynoldeb fferyllwyr yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn ei werthfawrogi'n fawr iawn. Bydd WP10s yn parhau'n ddilys ar gyfer ocsigen oni phennir yn wahanol. Parhau i ddarparu cyflenwad ar gyfer cleifion yw'r peth pwysicaf o hyd, a bydd y GIG yng Nghymru, yn ganolog, yn talu'r costau ychwanegol i gyflawni hyn, i ddechrau.

Mae Air Products bellach yn cyflawni ei ymrwymiad yn llwyr o ran rhyddhau pobl o ysbytai a darpariaeth frys. Mae wedi derbyn 1,815 o gleifion yn y chwe wythnos ddiwethaf. Mae hyn yn ychwanegol at y 3,000 o gleifion bron sy'n derbyn therapi ocsigen hirdymor drwy ddarparu crynodyddion yn eu cartref. I'r mwyafrif helaeth o'r cleifion hyn, mae eu silindrau wrth gefn ac unrhyw silindrau ocsigen symudol hefyd yn cael eu rhagnodi drwy'r contractwr newydd erbyn hyn.

Mae rhai cleifion yn derbyn mwy nag un math o therapi ocsigen, gan wneud y data'n

difficult to interpret. However, currently, Air Products estimates that it will eventually manage approximately 8,300 types of therapy. This contrasts with the figures provided to it before the contract commenced of 6,900 therapies.

The exact number of patients receiving therapy in Wales is harder to quantify. However, at the end of last week, it was thought that approximately a quarter of them were still relying on pharmacists to supply their needs. These are mainly patients who are regarded as low users and, as such, will take longer to re-present to their GPs.

An implementation group, consisting of the Department of Health, the Welsh Assembly Government, the NHS in England, and suppliers, is finalising a plan to address the problems that have emerged in the first few weeks of the new home oxygen service, and to get the next stage of the transition programme for the transfer of all patients to the new suppliers back on track. In addition, my officials also met with all the oxygen leads from the local health boards last week to get a true picture of the situation on the ground. The message is that, overall, things are improving, and that, although far from working properly, Air Products is now offering a more complete service than it was a few weeks ago. Local health boards are now hearing of far fewer supply problems.

I will continue to keep Members informed about the progress of this contract over the next few weeks. I am sure that, in the near future, we will have the world-class service that we were promised and that we expected.

Helen Mary Jones: I am grateful to the Minister for making this statement.

In his statement, the Minister talked of where we are now. Where we are now continues to be in a pretty serious mess, even if things have improved somewhat over recent weeks. I am sure that the Minister will acknowledge that a huge number of patients have been inconvenienced, and that many have been seriously distressed, and worse. This has

anodd ei ddehongli. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, amcangyfrifa Air Products y bydd, maes o law, yn rheoli tua 8,300 math o therapi. Mae hyn yn cyferbynnu â'r ffigurau o 6,900 o therapïau a roddwyd iddo cyn i'r contract ddechrau.

Mae'n anos nodi union nifer y cleifion sy'n derbyn therapi yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, credid bod tua'u chwarter yn dal i ddibynnu ar fferyllwyr i ddiwallu eu hanghenion. Mae'r rhain, yn bennaf, yn gleifion a ystyrir yn ddefnyddwyr ysgafn ac a fydd, o'r herwydd, yn cymryd mwy o amser i ailgyflwyno eu hunain i'w meddygon teulu.

Mae grŵp gweithredu, sy'n cynnwys yr Adran Iechyd, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y GIG yn Lloegr, a chyflenwyr, wrthi'n creu cynllun terfynol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn ystod wythnosau cyntaf y gwasanaeth ocsigen cartref newydd, a sicrhau bod cyfnod nesaf y rhaglen drosiannol ar gyfer trosglwyddo'r holl gleifion i'r cyflenwyr newydd yn dod yn ôl i drefn. Yn ogystal â hynny, cyfarfu fy swyddogion hefyd â phawb sy'n arwain o ran ocsigen ar y byrddau iechyd lleol yr wythnos diwethaf i gael darlun cywir o'r sefyllfa ar lawr gwlad. Y neges yw bod pethau, ar y cyfan, yn gwella a bod Air Products, er nad yn gweithio'n iawn o bellffordd, yn awr yn cynnig gwasanaeth mwy cyflawn nag a oedd rai wythnosau yn ôl. Mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol yn awr yn clywed am lawer llai o broblemau cyflenwi.

Parhaf i hysbysu'r Aelodau o hynt a helynt y contract hwn yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Yr wyf yn sicr, yn y dyfodol agos, y bydd gennym y gwasanaeth o safon fyd-eang a addawyd i ni ac yr oeddem yn ei ddisgwyl.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Gweinidog am wneud y datganiad hwn.

Yn ei ddatganiad, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y sefyllfa fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r sefyllfa honno'n parhau'n llanast eithaf difrifol, hyd yn oed os ydyw wedi gwella rhywfaint dros yr wythnosau diwethaf. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn bod nifer aruthrol o gleifion wedi wynebu anghyfleustra, a bod llawer wedi profi trallod

amounted to a massive failure.

The Minister reminded us of what the contract was intended to achieve. On what basis does he remain convinced that it will deliver better outcomes in the end for patients? It clearly has not so far. I press the Minister further on the exact nature of this contract. Looking at his statement, and listening carefully to what he said, one might assume that this is a joint contract between the Department of Health and the National Assembly Government. What we have not been able to get a straight answer from him about so far—we will hopefully be able to do so today—is whether or not there is a separate contract, negotiated jointly, although on the same terms, no doubt. Is it or is it not a separate contract? If he wished to do so, could he decide to cancel the contract with Air Products, and go back to the old system, which, if it was not as innovative as it might have been, was at least reliable, and people knew that they would get their supplies? How much further down this road do we have to go before he considers doing that, if he is able to do so?

3.10 p.m.

Is there a penalty clause attached to this contract or not? All three opposition health spokespeople asked him this at the last Health and Social Services Committee meeting and I was very concerned that he simply did not seem to know the answer. It is a fairly simple issue—is there a penalty clause or not? Can he tell us that today, and will he agree to implement or invoke it if there is such a clause? If there is no penalty clause, can he account for how such a major contract was let without one? I do not claim to be an expert in dealing with the private sector, but it is normal, with a contract of that size, to have some kind of penalty clause.

Will he ask the implementation group that he mentioned to consider, in the medium-term, and even longer-term, sub-contracting supplies through community pharmacies in those areas where Air Products cannot get to communities within four hours? In that

difficult, a gwaeth. Mae hyn wedi bod yn fethiant diymwad.

Atgoffwyd ni gan y Gweinidog o'r hyn yr oedd y contract i fod i'w gyflawni. Ar ba sail y mae ef yn parhau'n argyhoeddedig y bydd yn sicrhau gwell canlyniadau i gleifion yn y pen draw? Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny wedi digwydd hyd yma. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog ymhellach ynghylch union natur y contract hwn. O edrych ar ei ddatganiad, a gwrando'n astud ar yr hyn a ddywedodd, gallai dyn dybio bod hwn yn gontract ar y cyd rhwng yr Adran Iechyd a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr hyn nad ydym wedi llwyddo i gael ateb gonest ganddo amdano hyd yn hyn—a gobeithio y llwyddwn i wneud hynny heddiw—yw a oes cytundeb ar wahân, a negodwyd ar y cyd, ond ar yr un telerau, bid siŵr, yn bodoli ai peidio. A ydyw'n gontract ar wahân ai peidio? Pe bai ef yn dymuno gwneud hynny, a allai ddiddymu'r contract gydag Air Products a dychwelyd at yr hen system a oedd, er nad mor arloesol ag y gallasai fod, o leiaf yn ddibynadwy, gyda phobl yn gwybod y byddent yn derbyn eu cyflenwadau? I ba raddau y mae'n rhaid i'r sefyllfa ddirywio cyn iddo ystyried gwneud hynny, os yw'n gallu gwneud hynny?

A oes cymal cosb ynghlwm wrth y contract hwn ai peidio? Holodd holl lefarwyr iechyd y tair gwrthblaid ef am hyn yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac yr oeddwn yn bryderus iawn ei bod yn ymddangos nad oedd yn gwybod yr ateb. Mae'n fater gweddol syml—a oes cymal cosb ai peidio? A yw'n gallu dweud hynny wrthym heddiw, ac a wnaiff gytuno i'w weithredu neu ei sbarduno os oes cymal o'r fath yn bodoli? Os nad oes cymal cosb, a yw'n gallu esbonio sut y dyfarnwyd contract mor sylweddol heb un? Nid wyf yn honni bod yn arbenigwr ar ddelio â'r sector preifat, ond mae'n arferol, gyda chontract o'r maint hwnnw, fod rhyw fath o gymal cosb.

A wnaiff ofyn i'r grŵp gweithredu y cyfeiriodd ato ystyried, yn y tymor canolig, a hyd yn oed yn y tymor hwy, is-gontractio cyflenwadau drwy fferyllfeydd cymunedol yn yr ardaloedd hynny nad yw Air Products yn gallu eu cyrraedd o fewn pedair awr? Yn y

context, I associate myself with the Minister's comments about how flexible and supportive of their own communities the community pharmacies have been. One might have had some sympathy with them if they had said 'we have not got the contract anymore, so we are walking away from this'. They did not do that, for which they deserve all our gratitude, as well as the Minister's.

I press the Minister a little on the history, because it is important. Will he explain to us why the estimate of demand given was so wrong? Let us be honest, this is not the first time that we have had this kind of difficulty; we had it with the Cardiff out-of-hours contract being let in a similar way. The Minister, in his statement, referred to the figures provided to Air Products. Why were those figures so wildly wrong and who provided them? Can the Minister demonstrate that there has been an increase in demand? All the contacts that I have received from individuals who have been let down by this system have highlighted the fact that many of them had been delivered a perfectly sensible system for a number of years. Therefore, was there an increase in demand, or were the figures wrong? I submit to the Minister that both statements cannot be right.

Will the Minister confirm the extension of the transitional arrangements? The gossip has been that it will extend at least until July and his statement says that it will continue indefinitely; will he be a bit clearer with us about those transitional arrangements? Will the Minister also tell us what lessons he and his department have learnt from this debacle and convince us that we can be confident that, should a large contract of this nature be let by the NHS in Wales again, patients will not suffer in the way that they have on this occasion?

Brian Gibbons: You asked whether it would be worthwhile to go back to the old contract. The new contract offers a much wider range of products and a much more systematic and thorough regular assessment process for oxygen users, which was not previously available. I understand that, on the basis of many of the assessments that have taken

cyd-destun hwnnw, ategaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch pa mor hyblyg a chefnogol y bu'r fferyllwyr cymunedol i'w cymunedau eu hunain. Byddai dyn wedi deall, i raddau, pe baent wedi datgan 'nid ein contract ni ydyw bellach, felly yr ydym yn cefnu ar hyn'. Ni wnaethant hynny, ac mae gennym ni, a'r Gweinidog, le i ddiolch iddynt am hynny.

Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog fymryn am yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig. A wnaiff esbonio wrthym pam mae'r amcangyfrif o'r galw mor anghywir? Gadewch i ni fod yn onest, nid dyma'r tro cyntaf inni gael y math hwn o anhawster; digwyddodd pan ddyfarnwyd cytundeb y tu allan i oriau Caerdydd yn yr un modd. Yn ei ddatganiad, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffigurau a roddwyd i Air Products. Pam yr oedd y ffigurau hynny mor drychinebus o anghywir, a phwy a'u darparodd? A yw'r Gweinidog yn gallu dangos bod cynnydd wedi bod yn y galw? Mae'r holl unigolion a gafodd eu siomi â'r system hon a gysylltodd â mi wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod nifer ohonynt wedi derbyn system gwbl gall am nifer o flynyddoedd. Felly a oedd cynnydd yn y galw, neu a oedd y ffigurau'n anghywir? Awgrymaf wrth y Gweinidog nad oes modd i'r ddaud ddatganiad fod yn gywir.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod y trefniadau trosiannol wedi eu hymestyn? Yn ôl y sôn, fe'i hestynnir tan fis Gorffennaf, o leiaf, a dywed ei ddatganiad y bydd yn parhau am gyfnod amhenodol; a wnaiff ef fod ychydig yn fwy agored â ni ynglŷn â'r trefniadau trosiannol hynny? A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd ddweud wrthym pa wersi a ddysgodd ef a'i adran o'r llanast hwn, a'n hargyhoeddi y gallwn fod yn ffyddiog, pe bai contract mawr o'r math hwn yn cael ei ddyfarnu gan y GIG yng Nghymru eto, na fydd cleifion yn dioddef fel y gwnaethant y tro hwn?

Brian Gibbons: Gofynasoch a fyddai'n werth dychwelyd at yr hen contract. Mae'r contract newydd yn cynnig dewis llawer helaethach o gynhyrchion a phroses asesu reolaidd lawer mwy systematig a thrylwyr ar gyfer defnyddwyr ocsigen na'r hyn a gynigid gynt. Yr wyf yn deall, ar sail nifer o'r asesiadau a wnaed, fod lleiafrif sylweddol o

place, a considerable minority of people were in receipt of oxygen treatment that was probably not the best treatment modality for them. Indeed, they were transferred to alternative methods of treatment. I saw a very good pilot scheme in Blaenau Gwent about six weeks ago, which was, in many ways, an exemplar of how we would like this system to work. I met a number of people whose quality of life had been significantly improved having been through the assessment process led by a respiratory specialist, and a significant number of those patients were able to give up using oxygen. Going back to the old system, therefore, would not be a forward step, and the way we must do it is to make the present system work.

There is a separate contract here in Wales but, equally, this was a contract that was, by and large, led by procurement in the NHS in England. We were very much signed up to that procurement exercise. Therefore, although we were part of it, we were not the lead agency. We are happy that the overwhelming majority of urgent patients' needs are now being met by Air Products and, as I said in my statement, the information that we are now getting is that the people who are mainly using community pharmacists are people who have a lower level of demand. As I also said in my statement, my officials spoke to all oxygen leads in all LHBs last week and the number of specific complaints either from patients, contractors, GPs or pharmacists has been substantially reduced to a virtual trickle. Therefore, I assume that that is not an accurate estimate, but it is reasonable to say that people are now accessing oxygen on a reasonably satisfactory basis, even if it is not as originally envisaged in the contract.

We are committed to maintaining the WP10 system indefinitely, because, while you are right in that we would like to see the problem finally resolved by May, June or July—certainly by August—on the basis of our experience to date it would be inappropriate to be too dogmatic and we are committed to keeping it going. The single biggest problem that happened with the launch of this contract

bobl yn derbyn triniaeth ocsigen er nad triniaeth o'r fath, mae'n debyg, oedd yr un orau ar eu cyfer. Yn wir, fe'u trosglwyddwyd i ddulliau amgen o driniaeth. Gwelais gynllun peilot da iawn ym Mlaenau Gwent ryw chwe wythnos yn ôl a oedd, mewn sawl ffordd, yn batrwm o sut yr hoffem i'r cynllun hwn weithio. Cyfarfûm â nifer o bobl yr oedd ansawdd eu bywyd wedi gwella'n sylweddol yn dilyn proses asesu dan arweiniad arbenigwr anadlu, a llwyddodd nifer sylweddol o'r cleifion hynny i roi'r gorau i ddefnyddio ocsigen. Byddai dychwelyd at yr hen system, felly, yn gam yn ôl, a'r hyn y mae'n rhaid i ni ei wneud yw gwneud i'r system newydd weithio.

Ceir contract ar wahân yma yng Nghymru ond, yn yr un modd, yr oedd hwn yn contract a oedd, ar y cyfan, dan arweiniad caffael yn y GIG yn Lloegr. Yr oeddem yn rhwym wrth yr ymarferiad caffael hwnnw. Felly, er ein bod yn rhan ohono, nid ni oedd y brif asiantaeth. Yr ydym yn ffyddiog bod y rhan fwyaf o ddigon o anghenion cleifion brys yn cael eu diwallu gan Air Products erbyn hyn, ac, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, y wybodaeth yr ydym yn ei chael yn awr yw bod y bobl sy'n defnyddio fferyllwyr cymunedol, gan mwyaf, yn bobl sydd â lefel ysgafnach o alw. Fel y dywedais hefyd yn fy natganiad, bu fy swyddogion yn siarad â phawb sy'n arwain o ran ocsigen yn y BILlau i gyd yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae nifer y cwynton penodol gan gleifion, contractwyr, meddygon teulu neu fferyllwyr wedi lleihau'n sylweddol fel nad oes bron ddim yn dod drwodd. Felly, yr wyf yn cymryd nad yw'r amcangyfrif hwnnw'n gywir, ond rhesymol yw dweud bod pobl bellach yn cael ocsigen mewn modd gweddol dderbyniol, hyd yn oed os nad felly y'i rhagwelwyd yn wreiddiol yn y contract.

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i gadw'r system WP10 am gyfnod amhenodol, oherwydd, er eich bod yn gywir wrth ddweud y caredm weld datrys y broblem yn derfynol erbyn mis Mai, Mehefin neu Orffennaf—yn sicr erbyn mis Awst—ar sail ein profiad hyd yma, ni fyddai'n briodol bod yn rhy bendant ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i barhau â hi. Y broblem fwyaf a gafwyd wrth lansio'r

was the unanticipated demand on day one. In fairness to Air Products, it had anticipated a doubling of demand on day one, but instead of that, it was something in the order of a tenfold increase. That was not because there were 10 times as many patients in the system as had been anticipated, but that people were all ringing in on day one, rather than staging their requirements. Equally, a large number of practices faxed in their oxygen order forms on day one, rather than waiting for when the oxygen would normally be available.

To further compound the problem, a lot of the oxygen order forms did not include treatment details, which are required as part of the guidance that went out to prescribers. Consequently, Air Products had to try to contact a number of the people who ordered the oxygen supplies, and it took a considerable amount of time for it to get in contact with these prescribers, who, as I said, were more numerous than had been expected.

We need to have a full post-mortem to answer the specific questions, but it seems to me that the key breakdown in this was the inability to communicate properly with prescribers and users, in terms of the staged process by which they needed to engage with this service. There are lessons to be learned on communication from this, and, once we ensure that the supplies are flowing smoothly, we will have to carry out the necessary post-mortem.

The last point that you asked about was the penalty clause. My understanding is that there is not a specific penalty clause in the way that you mentioned in your question, although we clearly have to go back to the suppliers, working with the Department of Health in England, to see whether there are any means of redress.

Jonathan Morgan: I start by thanking the Minister for the statement. While I accept that it was difficult to predict the significant increase in the number of calls and queries coming forward, Minister, looking at the change from the GP service to the out-of-hours services should have at least indicated

contract hwn oedd y galw annisgwyl ar y diwrnod cyntaf. A bod yn deg ag Air Products, yr oedd wedi disgwyl cymaint ddwywaith o alw ar y diwrnod cyntaf, ond yn lle hynny, bu'r cynnydd tua dengwaith cymaint. Nid am fod cymaint ddengwaith o gleifion yn y system â'r hyn a ragwelwyd y bu hynny, ond am fod pawb wedi ffonio ar y diwrnod cyntaf, yn hytrach na diwallu eu hanghenion bob yn dipyn. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd nifer fawr o bractisiau wedi ffacio eu ffurflenni archebu ocsigen ar y diwrnod cyntaf, yn hytrach nag aros am yr adeg y byddai'r ocsigen ar gael fel arfer.

Dwysawyd y broblem ymhellach am fod llawer o ffurflenni archebu ocsigen nad oeddent yn cynnwys manylion y driniaeth, sydd yn ofynnol o dan y canllawiau a anfonwyd at bresgripsiynwyr. O ganlyniad, bu'n rhaid i Air Products geisio cysylltu â nifer o'r rhai a oedd wedi archebu'r cyflenwadau ocsigen, a chymerodd gryn amser iddo gysylltu â'r presgripsiynwyr hynny, a oedd, fel y dywedais, yn fwy niferus na'r disgwyl.

Rhaid inni gael ymchwiliad trwyadl i gael atebion i'r cwestiynau penodol, ond mae'n ymddangos i mi mai'r prif fethiant yn hyn o beth oedd yr anallu i gyfathrebu'n iawn â phresgripsiynwyr a defnyddwyr, o ran yr angen iddynt gysylltu â'r gwasanaeth hwn ar adegau gwahanol. Mae gwersi i'w dysgu o hyn ar gyfathrebu, ac, wedi inni sicrhau bod y cyflenwadau'n llifo'n esmwyth, bydd yn rhaid inni gynnal yr ymchwiliad angenrheidiol.

Y pwynt olaf yr holasoch yn ei gylch oedd y cymal cosbi. Yn ôl fel yr wyf yn deall hyn, nid oes cymal cosbi penodol o'r math y cyfeiriasoch ato yn eich cwestiwn, er y bydd yn rhaid inni fynd yn ôl at y cyflenwyr, wrth gwrs, gan weithio gyda'r Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr, i weld a oes unrhyw fodd i gael iawn.

Jonathan Morgan: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad. Er fy mod yn derbyn mai anodd oedd rhagweld y cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y galwadau a'r ymholiadau a gafwyd, Weinidog, o ystyried y newid o'r gwasanaeth gan feddygon teulu i'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol, dylid

that there would be a marked increase in the level of demand and a potential increase in the level of concern. When you look at this, thousands of older people have been left in a state of confusion and panic.

I have just been reading through a dossier of complaints and comments that we have received from the profession. One pharmacist in Merthyr stated that the changeover in this system was chaotic and that the oxygen company was reluctant to provide cylinders so that the pharmacy could provide a service to its patients, even after it acknowledged that it could not provide oxygen to those patients itself. There is a whole of series of quite damning indictments about how this handover has been handled by the health department. The relevant departments, whether in London or in Wales, ought to take some of the blame for how this transition between the old and new systems was managed.

I have five specific questions to put to you. First, we do not seem to be able to get to the bottom of some of the detail, but how many patients did not get their oxygen supply in the agreed timescale within which they should have had it delivered? Secondly, how long, on average, were those patients waiting beyond that agreed timescale? I know that it would vary between an hour, or maybe a couple of hours, to something more extreme, but do you know how long those patients were expected to wait on average?

3.20 p.m.

Thirdly, you have already referred to the issue of penalties and the fact that you do not know whether a penalty was incurred by the company for what appears to be a breach of contract. However, could you confirm to us the financial value of the contract to Air Products, specifically from the Welsh perspective? I assume that we are paying for it, and therefore we are entitled to know what the value of the contract is to Air Products.

Fourthly, on page 3 of your statement, you said that:

‘The continuity of supply to patients remains of paramount importance, and extra costs to

o leiaf fod wedi sylweddoli y byddai mwy o lawer o alw a mwy o bryderon, o bosibl. Rhaid cofio bod hyn wedi peri braw a dryswch i filoedd o bobl hŷn.

Yr wyf newydd fod yn darllen drwy ffeil o gwynion a sylwadau a gawsom gan fferyllwyr. Dywedodd un fferylllydd ym Merthyr Tudful fod anhrefn wrth newid i'r system hon a bod y cwmni ocsigen yn amharod i ddarparu silindrau fel y gallai'r fferyllfa gynnig gwasanaeth i'w chleifion, hyd yn oed wedi iddo gydnabod na allai ddarparu ocsigen i'r cleifion hynny ei hun. Mae nifer fawr o feirniadaethau damniol am y modd y mae'r adran iechyd wedi ymdrin â'r trosglwyddo hwn. Dylai'r adrannau perthnasol, boed yn Llundain neu yng Nghymru, dderbyn rhywfaint o'r bai am y modd y trefnwyd y newid o'r hen system i'r un newydd.

Mae gennyf bum cwestiwn penodol i'w gofyn i chi. Yn gyntaf, nid yw'n ymddangos ein bod yn gallu cael yr holl fanylion, ond pa nifer o gleifion a oedd heb gael eu cyflenwad ocsigen o fewn yr amser y cytunwyd arno? Yn ail, am ba hyd, ar gyfartaledd, y bu'r cleifion hynny'n disgwyl ar ôl yr amser y cytunwyd arno? Gwn y byddai'n amrywio rhwng awr, neu ddwy awr efallai, a chyfnod hwy o lawer, ond a wyddoch am ba hyd yr oedd disgwyl i'r cleifion hynny aros ar gyfartaledd?

Yn drydydd, yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio at fater cosbau a'r ffaith na wyddoch a gafodd y cwmni gosb am yr hyn sydd yn ymddangos yn dor-cytundeb. Fodd bynnag, a allwch gadarnhau beth yw gwerth ariannol y contract i Air Products, o safbwynt Cymru'n benodol? Yr wyf yn cymryd ein bod yn talu amdano, ac felly mae gennym hawl i wybod beth yw gwerth y contract i Air Products.

Yn bedwerydd, ar dudalen 3 yn eich datganiad, yr ydych yn dweud mai:

y peth pwysicaf o hyd yw sicrhau bod y cyflenwad i gleifion yn parhau, a bydd

achieve this will be met centrally by the NHS in Wales in the first instance.'

Can you confirm whether you have done any preliminary work to assess what the cost of that is likely to be?

Finally, do you accept that this chaotic affair—as described in a statement by that one particular pharmacist, and also in the statements of other pharmacists—has done a considerable amount of damage to the faith that pharmacists had in the Assembly Government's ability to handle this contract? Had it not been for the pharmacists, many thousands of patients in Wales would have been left high and dry.

Brian Gibbons: I certainly agree with the last point that you made: if we had not had the commitment to service from pharmacists, many patients would have been left high and dry. We certainly owe the community pharmacists a great deal. On the first two or three specific questions in terms of performance, I do not think that we have that information, even though I have asked for it. It has been difficult, not least because, as I said to Helen Mary, one of the big problems on day one was that a number of the home oxygen order forms did not have the proper prescribing information on them. When you are trying to work out why there was a delay in the system, if the prescribing details were not correct, where does the fault lie? It might seem a little invidious to blame Air Products if it was being asked to supply a product when the prescribing details, including the flow rates and so on, were not included, when flow rates were specifically required in the guidance that was given out. So it is difficult to give Jonathan answers to those specific questions.

The cost of the contract is of the order of £2 million to £2.5 million, as I recall. I will certainly write to Jonathan if that is not correct. However, I think that it is of that order. Again, it is difficult to estimate what the remedial costs will be. As the contract has been run out, we anticipated that, say, around 6,900 to 7,000 items of treatment would be

unrhyw gostau ychwanegol i gyflawni hynny'n cael eu talu'n ganolog gan y GIG yng Nghymru yn y lle cyntaf.

A allwch gadarnhau a ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw waith rhagarweiniol i asesu beth fydd y gost debygol?

Yn olaf, a ydych yn derbyn bod yr anhrefn hon—fel y'i disgrifiwyd mewn datganiad gan y fferylllydd hwinnw, a hefyd yn y datganiadau gan fferyllwyr eraill—wedi siglo cryn dipyn ar y ffydd a oedd gan fferyllwyr yng ngallu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i drafod y contract hwn? Oni bai am y fferyllwyr, byddai miloedd lawer o gleifion yng Nghymru wedi eu gadael heb ddim.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn sicr yn derbyn y pwynt olaf a wnaethoch: oni bai am ymrwymiad fferyllwyr i'r gwasanaeth, byddai llawer o gleifion wedi eu gadael heb ddim. Mae arnom ddyled fawr i'r fferyllwyr cymunedol, yn sicr. Ynghylch y ddau neu dri chwestiwn penodol cyntaf am berfformiad, nid wyf yn credu bod y wybodaeth honno gennym, er fy mod wedi gofyn amdani. Bu'n anodd, a hynny, yn anad dim, fel y dywedais wrth Helen Mary, am mai un o'r problemau mawr ar y diwrnod cyntaf oedd bod nifer o'r ffurflenni archebu ar gyfer ocsigen yn y cartref nad oeddent yn cynnwys gwybodaeth briodol ar gyfer presgripsiynu. Wrth geisio canfod pam y bu oedi yn y system, os nad oedd y manylion presgripsiynu'n gywir, ar bwy y mae'r bai? Gallai ymddangos braidd yn annheg rhoi'r bai ar Air Products os gofynnwyd iddo gyflenwi cynnyrch a bod y manylion ar gyfer presgripsiynu, gan gynnwys y cyfraddau llif ac yn y blaen, heb eu cynnwys, a'r canllawiau a ddsbarthwyd wedi gofyn yn benodol am gynnwys y cyfraddau llif. Felly mae'n anodd rhoi atebion i Jonathan ar y cwestiynau penodol hynny.

Mae cost y contract rhwng tua £2 filiwn a £2.5 miliwn, os cofiaf yn iawn. Byddaf yn sicr o ysgrifennu at Jonathan os nad yw hynny'n gywir. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn credu mai rhywbeth felly ydyw. Unwaith eto, anodd yw amcangyfrif beth fydd y costau i gywiro hyn. Wrth i'r contract gael ei roi ar waith, yr oeddem yn disgwyl y byddai rhwng

dispensed as part of this new contract. Clearly, when we are talking about ambulatory oxygen for people on concentrators, there will be some double counting, so it will be difficult to give a precise figure. On the basis of the current outturn in demand, that could easily end up being 20 per cent higher than our present estimates, although it is difficult to pin down.

As I said to Helen Mary, my understanding is that there is no specific penalty clause, but we will have to take stock of the situation to see whether there is a mechanism for redress. The basis of the redress will, I am sure, be the subject of argument as to where the liability for the system's failure to operate correctly on day one lies, if the number of people who tried to contact the service on day one was tenfold higher than anticipated, and whether one can say that Air Products was responsible for that on its own, and whether its information systems and ours were adequate. Those are the sorts of issues that will have to be resolved in trying to put this issue to bed, once we get the flow of the service running correctly to patients.

Jenny Randerson: I thank the Minister for the statement. When I became a member of the Health and Social Services Committee, I think that it was in my very first meeting that we discussed this contract, and I could not believe what I was hearing, because it was so obviously going to be a disaster. It was going to rely on a centralised system and on a call centre—all the things that flash warning signs—and it was going to replace a well-established locally-based system, based on pharmacists' knowledge of their customers, their patients and, indeed, their area—knowing that this crescent or that close runs off a particular road and so on. These are all the things that go wrong when you have a centralised system.

Minister, I have here a copy of your statement of 21 December, in which you confidently state that:

'Air Products have appointed a number of key staff to ensure a smooth transition to the new contract'.

tua 6,900 a 7,000 o eitemau triniaeth yn cael eu dosbarthu fel rhan o'r contract newydd hwn. Wrth gwrs, gan fod hyn yn ymwneud â silindrau ocsigen symudol ar gyfer rhai sydd yn defnyddio crynodyddion, bydd rhai wedi eu cyfrif ddwy waith, felly bydd yn anodd cynnig ffigur union. Ar sail yr alldro cyfredol o ran y galw, gallai'n hawdd fod 20 y cant yn fwy na'n hamcangyfrifon presennol, yn y diwedd, er ei bod yn anodd bod yn fanwl.

Fel y dywedais wrth Helen Mary, yn ôl fel yr wyf fi'n deall hyn, nid oes dim cymal cosbi penodol, ond bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried y sefyllfa er mwyn gweld a oes mecanwaith i gael iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y dadlau ar dalu iawn yn troi o gylch yr atebolrwydd dros fethiant y system i redeg yn gywir ar y diwrnod cyntaf, os oedd y nifer a geisiodd gysylltu â'r gwasanaeth ar y diwrnod cyntaf yn gymaint ddengwaith â'r disgwyl, ac a ellir dweud bod Air Products yn gyfrifol am hynny ar ei ben ei hun, ac a oedd ei systemau gwybodaeth ef a'n rhai ni'n ddigonol. Dyna'r math o faterion y bydd yn rhaid eu datrys wrth geisio delio â'r mater hwn, wedi inni sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn rhedeg yn iawn ar gyfer cleifion.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf yn diolch i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad. Pan ddeuthum yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr wyf yn credu mai yn y cyfarfod cyntaf un y bûm ynddo y trafodasom y contract hwn, ac ni allwn gredu'r hyn a glywn, gan ei bod mor amlwg y byddai'n troi'n drychineb. Yr oedd yn mynd i ddibynnu ar system ganoleddig ac ar ganolfan alwadau—yr holl bethau sydd yn seinio rhybudd—ac yr oedd yn mynd i gymryd lle system leol sefydledig, a oedd wedi ei seilio ar wybodaeth fferyllwyr am eu cwsmeriaid, eu cleifion ac, yn wir, eu hardal—gwybod bod rhyw heol neu'i gilydd yn arwain o ryw ffordd neilltuol ac yn y blaen. Dyma'r holl bethau sydd yn mynd o chwith os ceir system ganoleddig.

Weinidog, mae gennyf gopi yma o'ch datganiad ar 21 Rhagfyr, lle y dywedwch yn hyderus:

Mae Air Products wedi penodi nifer o staff allweddol i sicrhau y gellir troi'n ddidrafferth at ddefnyddio'r contract newydd.

You went on to say that,

‘I am confident that everyone involved in the implementation of this new contract is doing everything possible to ensure that patients get the maximum benefit from the changes.’

How did you manage to get it so wrong?

Questions about penalty clauses in the contract have already been asked. Can you at least tell us how much this fiasco has cost the NHS in Wales so far? How much additional money has your Government had to shell out to cover the failings of Air Products’ system?

I, too, have the quotations from pharmacists, and we must all repeat the thanks to the pharmacists who, after all, are losing business, and who have received less than co-operation in many cases from Air Products. They have experienced unwillingness on the part of Air Products to provide cylinders so that they could take them out to patients, and that is totally inexcusable. The first comment that I have contains just one word, ‘shambolic!!!’. Another much more descriptive comment states:

‘Sorry if this sounds a touch bitter: after listening to a customer crying on the phone begging for oxygen, and dealing with the relatives of a terminally-ill mother who had been waiting for oxygen for three days, my faith in the health system has been shattered.’

In addition, we have a comment that this has been

‘a shambles, leading to widespread panic, misunderstandings and anxiety, not just by patients, but by health professionals as well.’

It goes on to make a comment that I cannot repeat in this Chamber—but I am happy to show it to you afterwards, Minister.

On that issue, do you accept that a great deal of pharmacists’ goodwill has been lost, and that, at the least, Air Products should provide compensation to ensure that pharmacists do

Aethoch ymlaen i ddweud,

Yr wyf yn sicr bod pawb sydd yn ymwneud â rhoi’r contract newydd hwn ar waith yn gwneud popeth a ellir i sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael y budd mwyaf o’r newidiadau.

Sut y gwnaethoch gamgymryd mor arw?

Mae cwestiynau wedi eu gofyn eisoes am gymalau cosbi yn y contract. A allwch o leiaf ddweud wrthym beth fu cost y llanastr hwn i’r GIG yng Nghymru hyd yma? Faint o arian ychwanegol y bu’n rhaid i’ch Llywodraeth ei dalu oherwydd diffygion system Air Products?

Mae gennyf finnau sylwadau gan fferyllwyr i’w dyfynnu, a rhaid inni oll ailddatgan y diolch i’r fferyllwyr sydd, wedi’r cwbl, yn colli busnes, ac sydd heb gael cydweithrediad llawn mewn llawer achos gan Air Products. Maent wedi profi amharodrydd ar ran Air Products i ddarparu silindrau fel y gallent fynd â hwy at gleifion, ac mae hynny’n gwbl anfaddeuol. Mae’r sylw cyntaf sydd gennyf yn cynnwys un gair yn unig, ‘di-drefn!!!’. Yn ôl sylw arall sydd yn llawer mwy disgrifiadol:

Mae’n ddrwg gennyf os yw hyn yn swnio braidd yn chwerv: ar ôl gwrando ar gwsmer yn wylo ar y ffôn gan greffu am ocsigen, a delio â pherthnasau i fam sydd â salwch terfynol a fu’n aros am ocsigen am dridiau, mae fy ffydd yn y system iechyd wedi ei dryllio.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae gennym sylw sydd yn dweud bod hyn wedi bod

yn llanastr, sydd wedi peri braw, camddealltwriaeth a phryder cyffredinol, nid yn unig ar ran cleifion, ond ar ran gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol hefyd.

Aiff ymlaen i wneud sylw na allaf ei ailadrodd yn y Siambr hon—ond byddaf yn fodlon ei ddangos i chi wedyn, Weinidog.

Ynghylch y mater hwnnw, a ydych yn derbyn bod llawer iawn o ewyllys da fferyllwyr wedi ei gollu ac y dylai Air Products o leiaf dalu iawn i sicrhau na fydd fferyllwyr ar eu

not lose out? Many of these pharmacists are repeating the fact that they do not believe that they will be properly paid for their additional work. Indeed, they spent a lot of time before the end of their contract collecting in cylinders, only to find that they had to distribute them again, if they still had them.

You refer in your comments to Lord Hunt. If I were you, Minister, I would have harsh words with Lord Hunt, as he has clearly led you up the garden path. I have a simple question: could we have gone it alone? Legally, under the Assembly's powers, could we have made a different decision from that of England? It seems to me that, logically, we should have been able to do so, and that we should have been able to have a sensible, modernised system based on distribution by existing pharmacies. Perhaps you can explain to us why that might not be the case, if that is so.

3.30 p.m.

In your statement, you say that the newest and best technologies could not be used under the old system unless the patient chose to purchase them independently, and that the modalities that GPs could prescribe under the NHS were severely limited. Could this not have been modernised using distribution via pharmacies? Why was it necessary to go for a centralised production and distribution system by one company, which created a monopoly for that company? Was it necessary to go to that in order to modernise? Could we not have modernised using the old system?

You also say that you hope, ultimately—and I like the use of the word 'ultimately'—that this service will help patients to manage their symptoms better. Can you give a timescale for when you think that this will be sorted out? I stress that I am not pressing you to do this quickly, as the longer it is played, the better, but the longer the muddle goes on, the more it costs the NHS. From that point of view, we want it sorted, but not before every patient in Wales is able to get oxygen efficiently.

colled? Mae llawer o'r fferyllwyr hyn yn ailadrodd y ffaith nad ydynt yn credu y byddant yn cael eu talu'n briodol am eu gwaith ychwanegol. Yn wir, treuliasant lawer o amser cyn i'w contract ddod i ben yn casglu silindrau, a chael wedyn eu bod yn gorfod eu dosbarthu eto, os oeddent ganddynt o hyd.

Yr ydych yn cyfeirio yn eich datganiad at yr Arglwydd Hunt. Pe bawn i yn eich lle chi, Weinidog, byddwn yn ei dweud yn hallt wrth yr Arglwydd Hunt, gan ei bod yn amlwg ei fod wedi'ch camarwain. Mae gennyf gwestiwn syml: a fyddem wedi gallu ei wneud ar ein pennau ein hunain? Yn gyfreithiol, dan bwerau'r Cynulliad, a fyddem wedi gallu penderfynu'n wahanol i Loegr? Mae'n ymddangos i mi, yn rhesymegol, y dylem fod wedi gallu gwneud hynny, ac y dylem fod wedi gallu cael system synhwyrol, fodern a oedd wedi ei seilio ar ddosbarthu gan y fferyllfeydd presennol. Efallai y gallwch esbonio wrthym pam nad yw hynny'n bosibl, os mai felly y mae.

Yn eich datganiad, dywedwch na allai'r technolegau gorau a mwyaf newydd gael eu defnyddio o dan yr hen system oni bai fod y claf yn dewis eu prynu'n annibynnol, a bod cyfyngiadau mawr ar y dulliau y gallai meddygon teulu eu rhagnodi o dan y GIG. Oni ellid bod wedi moderneiddio hyn drwy ddosbarthu drwy fferyllfeydd? Pam oedd rhaid dewis system gynhyrchu a dosbarthu ganolog gan un cwmni, gan greu monopoli i'r cwmni hwnnw? A oedd yn rhaid mynd at hynny er mwyn moderneiddio? Oni allem fod wedi moderneiddio gan ddefnyddio'r hen system?

Dywedwch hefyd eich bod yn gobeithio, yn y pen draw—ac yr wyf yn hoffi'r defnydd o'r geiriau 'yn y pen draw'—y bydd y gwasanaeth hwn yn helpu cleifion i reoli eu symptomau yn well. A allwch roi amserlen ar gyfer pryd y tybiwch y rhoddir trefn ar hyn? Yr wyf yn pwysleisio nad wyf yn pwysio arnoch i wneud hyn yn gyflym, oherwydd po hwyaf y mae'n parhau, gorau'n y byd, ond po hwyaf y mae'r cawdel yn parhau, mwyaf yn y byd y mae'n ei gostio i'r GIG. O'r safbwynt hwnnw, yr ydym am iddo gael ei

ddatrys, ond nid nes bod pob claf yng Nghymru yn gallu cael ocsigen yn effeithlon.

You refer to the increased demand, but oxygen supply can mean life or death for a large number of people. There was bound to be anxiety over a change in the system, and it was obvious that that would lead to increased demand. That problem was then exacerbated by the lateness in the distribution of information to pharmacists, GPs and hospitals. I raised my concern relating to the lateness of the distribution of information with you back at the turn of the year. Do you have any plans to distribute further information to all the organisations and individuals involved to ensure that people have a complete understanding of the new system, before the final cut-off point when Air Products takes over entirely?

Brian Gibbons: I do not remember you advising me of the particular range of problems that occurred on 1 February. You raised some concerns, but the concerns that gave rise to the problems on 1 February were not the same problems as those that you have chosen to highlight in your speech today. It is not correct to say that the fundamental weakness in the system was the lack of local knowledge; the fundamental problem was the unanticipated level of demand on day 1, and the fact that a number of order forms were incorrectly completed.

There will not be a substantial additional cost up to the end of March and this financial year, because there is already a budget line for oxygen services in the NHS budget. Starting in April, additional costs will be incurred, which depend a little on the imponderable that we cannot quite answer at the moment, namely for how long community pharmacists will need to fill the gap. My officials contacted all local health boards last week, and the feedback that they had was that the people who are having the most difficulty accessing the system at the moment are the low users, and that Air Products is managing to catch up with the new urgent referrals and the people on long-standing contracts. My understanding is that something of the order of 70 per cent of the presented home oxygen order forms have

Cyfeiriwch at y cynnydd yn y galw, ond gall cyflenwad ocsigen olygu bywyd neu farwolaeth i nifer fawr o bobl. Yr oedd yn anochel y byddai pryder ynghylch newid y system, ac yr oedd yn amlwg y byddai'n arwain at fwy o alw. Cafodd y broblem honno ei dwysáu wedyn am fod y wybodaeth wedi cael ei dosbarthu'n hwyr i fferyllwyr, meddygon teulu ac ysbytai. Codais fy mhryder i fod y wybodaeth yn hwyr yn cael ei dosbarthu gyda chi ar droad y flwyddyn. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i ddsbarthu gwybodaeth bellach i'r holl sefydliadau ac unigolion y mae a wnelont â hyn i sicrhau bod gan bobl ddealltwriaeth lawn o'r system newydd, cyn y torbwynt terfynol pan fydd Air Products yn cymryd drosodd yn gyfan gwbl?

Brian Gibbons: Nid wyf yn cofio ichi fy hysbysu am yr ystod neilltuol o broblemau a ddigwyddodd ar 1 Chwefror. Codasoch rai pryderon, ond nid yr un yw'r pryderon a achosodd y problemau ar 1 Chwefror â'r rhai yr ydych wedi dewis tynnu sylw atynt yn eich araith heddiw. Nid yw'n gywir dweud mai'r gwendid sylfaenol yn y system oedd y diffyg gwybodaeth yn lleol; y broblem sylfaenol oedd lefel nad oeddid wedi ei rhagweld o alw ar y diwrnod cyntaf, a'r ffaith bod nifer o ffurflenni archebu wedi cael eu llenwi'n anghywir.

Ni fydd cost ychwanegol sylweddol hyd at ddiwedd mis Mawrth a'r flwyddyn ariannol hon, oherwydd y mae llinell wariant ar gyfer gwasanaethau ocsigen yng nghyllideb y GIG eisoes. Gan ddechrau ym mis Ebrill, wynebir costau ychwanegol, sy'n dibynnu rhyw ychydig ar y ffactor anfesuradwy na allwn ei ateb yn iawn ar y funud, sef am ba hyd y bydd angen i fferyllwyr cymunedol lenwi'r bwlch. Cysylltodd fy swyddogion â'r byrddau iechyd lleol i gyd yr wythnos ddiwethaf, a'r adborth a gawsant oedd mai'r bobl sy'n cael yr anhawster mwyaf i ddefnyddio'r system ar hyn o bryd yw'r defnyddwyr ysgafn, a bod Air Products yn llwyddo i ymdopi â'r achosion brys newydd sy'n cael eu hatgyfeirio a'r bobl sydd ar gontractau sydd wedi bodoli ers tro byd. Fy nealltwriaeth yw bod tua 70 y cant o'r

been processed by Air Products, which means that 30 per cent has yet to be done. There may still be some patients who have not yet accessed the service, simply because their oxygen requirements have not come on line.

I do not think that it would be possible to do as you said and simply hand the service over completely to community pharmacists, because one of the features of the new contract, which was part of the old contract, is that concentrators are supplied independently by contractors. Community pharmacists have not really been involved in the supply of oxygen concentrators. At the very best, if continuity is what you are aiming for, it would have been a perpetuation of a two-track system made up of a number of contractors—I think that there were three or four—supplying concentrators in Wales plus the community pharmacists.

One of the advantages—and the weakness—of this system is that there is a single supplier and a single contractor. In that way, it was thought that uniform standards of performance—good or bad—would be available, and there would be national standards for us in Wales. That is still the vision incorporated in the contract. There will be a single supplier, but that supplier will be tied in to a single quality assurance and a single standard of service.

You are right that it is reasonable to expect that pharmacists will not lose out in this. We will have to ensure that that does not happen. We could have done this separately from England but, as you may remember from my statement, this began in 1999, roughly when the Assembly was just coming into being and, consequently, the momentum had already built up. At any stage, we had the option to go our own way, but a decision was made. I have not really heard a convincing case for doing otherwise and, until the legal challenge was made against the contract being given to Air Products, I did not hear anyone making strong representations that this was the wrong way to go.

Clearly, pharmacists would not have been

ffurflenni archebu ocsigen cartref a gyflwynwyd wedi cael eu prosesu gan Air Products, sy'n golygu bod 30 y cant heb gael eu gwneud eto. Efallai fod rhai cleifion o hyd nad ydynt wedi defnyddio'r gwasanaeth eto, am y rheswm syml na fu angen ocsigen arnynt hyd yma.

Ni chredaf y byddai'n bosibl gwneud fel y dywedasoeh chi a throsglwyddo'r gwasanaeth yn gyfan gwbl i fferyllwyr cymunedol, oherwydd un o nodweddion y contract newydd, a oedd yn rhan o'r hen contract, yw bod crynodyddion yn cael eu cyflenwi'n annibynnol gan contractwyr. Nid yw fferyllwyr cymunedol wedi ymwneud mewn gwirionedd â chyflenwi crynodyddion ocsigen. Ar y gorau, os mai parhad yw'r hyn yr ydych yn ymgynraedd ato, byddai wedi golygu parhau â system dau drac gyda nifer o contractwyr—credaf fod tri neu bedwar—yn cyflenwi crynodyddion yng Nghymru yn ogystal â'r fferyllwyr cymunedol.

Un o fanteision—a gwendid—y system hon yw mai un cyflenwr ac un contractwr sydd. Drwy hynny, tybid y byddai safonau perfformiad unffurf—da neu ddrwg—ar gael, ac y ceid safonau cenedlaethol inni yng Nghymru. Dyna'r weledigaeth sydd wedi ei hymgorffori yn y contract o hyd. Bydd un cyflenwr, ond bydd y cyflenwr hwnnw'n cael ei glymu i un drefn sicrhau ansawdd ac un safon gwasanaeth.

Yr ydych yn iawn ei bod yn rhesymol disgwyl na fydd fferyllwyr ar eu colled yn hyn. Bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw hynny'n digwydd. Gallem fod wedi gwneud hyn ar wahân i Loegr ond, fel y cofiwch efallai o'm datganiad, dechreuodd hyn yn 1999, yn fras pan oedd y Cynulliad yn cael ei sefydlu ac, o ganlyniad, yr oedd y momentwm eisoes wedi datblygu. Yr oedd y dewis gennym ar unrhyw adeg i fynd ein ffordd ein hunain, ond gwnaethpwyd penderfyniad. Nid wyf mewn gwirionedd wedi clywed dadl sy'n argyhoeddi o blaid gweithredu'n wahanol a, hyd nes y daeth yr her gyfreithiol yn erbyn rhoi'r contract i Air Products, ni chlywais neb yn gwneud sylwadau cryf nad dyma'r ffordd iawn i fynd.

Yn amlwg, ni fyddai fferyllwyr wedi bod yn

happy because oxygen supply was going to be moved to another contractor. It is legitimate that they should argue their case as an interest group in this context. I did not hear a systematic case made that this was not the correct way to go. Although we can be wise with hindsight, people should be judged by what they said at the time, and no-one was suggesting that we should not be going down the road of this contract this time last year, two years ago, three years ago or even going back to 1999.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Although the clock is showing that we are more than five minutes over time on this item, because of the public interest and the number of Members who wish to speak and ask questions of the Minister, I will extend time to accommodate the four remaining Members who wish to speak, including the committee Chair.

Karen Sinclair: Thank you, Brian, for your statement. I wish to join others in thanking the community pharmacists for stepping into the breach when services broke down. I do not intend to reiterate the points made about costs and anxiety caused to patients, although I fully concur with all the points made about those concerns. However, I am concerned about whether the systems that are now in place are robust enough to reassure people that there will be no new crisis over Easter. That could be a pinch point because of the holidays.

Brian Gibbons: That is one of the reasons why it is important that we do not make any precipitate change to the system over the next few months: we must ensure that the parallel systems are in operation. It is a concern not only at Easter; there is a series of public holidays coming up after Easter. We want to be more than reassured, and, over the next six to eight weeks, we are more or less committed to keeping the two systems running in parallel precisely for the reason that you give.

3.40 p.m.

Christine Chapman: I will be brief. I thank you for this statement because this issue is

hapus gan fod y cyflenwad ocsigen yn mynd i gael ei symud at gontractwr arall. Mae'n deg iddynt ddadlau eu hachos fel grŵp buddiant yn y cyd-destun hwn. Ni chlywais achos systematig yn cael ei wneud nad dyma'r ffordd iawn i fynd. Er y gallwn fod yn ddoeth wrth edrych yn ôl, ni ddylid barnu pobl oherwydd yr hyn a ddywedasant ar y pryd, ac nid oedd neb yn awgrymu na ddylem fod yn mynd ar drywydd y contract hwn yr adeg hon y llynedd, ddwy flynedd yn ôl, dair blynedd yn ôl na hyd yn oed wrth fynd yn ôl i 1999.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Er bod y cloc yn dangos ein bod fwy na phum munud heibio i'n hamser ar yr eitem hon, oherwydd y diddordeb cyhoeddus a'r nifer o Aelodau sy'n dymuno siarad a gofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog, byddaf yn ymestyn yr amser er mwyn cynnwys y pedwar Aelod sydd ar ôl sy'n dymuno siarad, gan gynnwys Cadeirydd y pwyllgor.

Karen Sinclair: Diolch, Brian, am eich datganiad. Yr wyf am ymuno ag eraill i ddiolch i'r fferyllwyr cymunedol am gamu i'r adwy pan fethodd gwasanaethau. Nid wyf yn bwriadu ailadrodd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd am gostau a'r pryder a achoswyd i gleifion, er fy mod yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r holl bwyntiau a wnaethpwyd am y pryderon hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus a yw'r systemau sydd wedi cael eu sefydlu'n awr yn ddigon cryf i dawelu meddyliau pobl na cheir argyfwng newydd dros y Pasg. Gallai'r Pasg fod yn gyfnod o gyfyngder oherwydd y gwyliau.

Brian Gibbons: Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn gwneud dim newid byrbwyll i'r system dros y misoedd nesaf: rhaid inni sicrhau bod y systemau cyfochrog yn weithredol. Nid dros y Pasg yn unig y mae'n bryder; ceir cyfres o wyliau cyhoeddus ar ôl y Pasg. Yr ydym am gael mwy na thawelwch meddwl, a, thros y chwech i'r wyth wythnos nesaf, yr ydym fwy neu lai wedi ymrwymo i gadw'r ddwy system i redeg ochr yn ochr â'i gilydd am yr union reswm o roddasoch.

Christine Chapman: Byddaf yn fyr. Diolch ichi am y datganiad hwn oherwydd y mae'r

important. We are talking about very vulnerable people. Several of my questions have already been answered. However, you referred earlier to communication, so what is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to communicate to patients the improvements that have been made to the system that accompanies the contract? This is important for many people. I have found, from talking to constituents, that when this was initially mentioned many felt that it was an unnecessary change. That is why we need to explain the advantages, such as the fact that patients will be assessed in their homes to see whether they are receiving the best treatment. Could you clarify how these reviews of oxygen supply will be carried out in practice? I reiterate other Members' views that this is a serious issue. I welcome the progress, but I would like reassurances that you will monitor the situation carefully.

Brian Gibbons: There is no doubt that, for people who are prescribed oxygen in the long term, even the thought of their supply running out before their prescription is renewed creates a great sense of panic. People get frightened and alarmed if they think that there is any risk to the continuity of their oxygen supply. I understand people saying, 'Better the devil you know than the devil you don't', but I have seen the system work through proper assessments, and a large number of people on oxygen are probably using it sub-optimally, not properly. Equally, people may have been put on oxygen a long time ago when a more vigorous rehabilitation programme, which will be part of this new assessment process, could have been put in place. For a significant minority, the outcome will be greatly improved and, for a good few, there will be the prospect of a life without a dependency on oxygen cylinders if the therapy takes place. The specialist teams are led by respiratory specialists, so the level of expertise will be high.

It was always anticipated that the assessment process would not happen in the first month and that it could take 18 months to two years, or even a bit longer, for all current users to get through the assessment process. That will

mater hwn yn bwysig. Yr ydym yn siarad am bobl fregus iawn. Mae sawl un o'm cwestiynau wedi cael ei ateb yn barod. Fodd bynnag, cyfeiriasoch yn gynharach at gyfathrebu, felly beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i roi gwybod i gleifion am y gwelliannau sydd wedi cael eu gwneud i'r system sy'n cyd-fynd â'r contract? Mae hyn yn bwysig i lawer o bobl. Yr wyf wedi canfod, o siarad ag etholwyr, fod llawer yn teimlo, pan gafodd hyn ei grybwyll gyntaf, ei fod yn newid dianghenraid. Dyna pam mae angen inni esbonio'r manteision, megis y ffaith y caiff cleifion eu hasesu yn eu cartrefi i weld a ydynt yn cael y driniaeth orau. A allech egluro sut y bydd yr adolygiadau hyn o'r cyflenwad ocsigen yn cael eu cynnal yn ymarferol? Ailadroddaf farn Aelodau eraill fod hwn yn fater pwysig. Croesawaf y cynnydd, ond hoffwn gael sicrwydd y byddwch yn monitro'r sefyllfa yn ofalus.

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes amheuaeth, i bobl y rhagnodir ocsigen iddynt yn y tymor hir, nad yw hyd yn oed y syniad y gallai eu cyflenwad ddarod cyn i'w presgripsiwn gael ei adnewyddu yn creu teimlad mawr o banig. Mae pobl yn mynd yn ofnus ac yn dychryn os credant fod unrhyw risg i barhad eu cyflenwad ocsigen. Yr wyf yn deall pobl yn dweud, 'Gwell y drwg yr ydych yn gyfarwydd ag ef na'r drwg na wyddys amdano', ond yr wyf wedi gweld y system yn gweithio drwy asesiadau priodol, ac mae'n debygol iawn bod nifer fawr o bobl sydd ar ocsigen heb fod yn ei ddefnyddio ar ei orau, ac yn amhriodol. Yn yr un modd, efallai fod pobl wedi cael eu rhoi ar ocsigen amser maith yn ôl pan fyddai rhaglen adsefydlu fwy trylwyr, a fydd yn rhan o'r broses asesu newydd hon, wedi gallu cael ei rhoi ar waith. I leiafrif sylweddol, bydd y canlyniad yn llawer gwell ac, i gryn nifer, bydd posibilrwydd o fyw heb ddibynnu ar silindrau ocsigen os caiff y therapi ei ddarparu. Mae'r timau arbenigol yn cael eu harwain gan arbenigwyr anadlu, felly bydd lefel yr arbenigedd yn uchel.

Rhagwelwyd erioed na fyddai'r broses asesu yn digwydd yn y mis cyntaf ac y gallai gymryd 18 mis i ddwy flynedd, neu ychydig yn hwy hyd yn oed, i'r holl ddefnyddwyr cyfredol fynd drwy'r broses asesu. Bydd

be a fairly long, drawn-out process, but it was always anticipated that that would be the situation so that there would not be any excessive demands made on respiratory specialists, which would have been the case if all oxygen users had to be reassessed in the first week or month. That just could not be delivered, so it has always been anticipated that that reassessment would be over a couple of years.

Carl Sargeant: I accept your comments that, as of 1 February, an extreme demand was placed on Air Products for the delivery of the service. I am concerned that, although it was recognised that there was going to be an increase in the service provision, it ended up being tenfold. The problem was that Air Products did not have a what-if scenario, and there was a complete procedural failure. A constituent of mine phoned up and, on finally getting through to the 0800 number after three days, was told that her delivery would be that day, but they did not even take her name and address, which I found quite amazing. I understand that they were under immense pressure and, hopefully, we are over the hill with regard to that problem. Will you ensure that the 0800 numbers that are provided for patients are working correctly and that you have confidence in that system?

On the post-mortem exercise that you are hoping will take place and in terms of the extreme demand that was placed on Air Products, some people did not need oxygen that day but some did. That is what really concerns me: there was no checking of who needed it and who did not. That is an important lesson to be learned for the future. Hopefully, no-one lost their lives because of this important issue. However, we should learn from our mistakes and from those of the companies that have provided the service.

Brian Gibbons: In fairness to Air Products, it anticipated a doubling of demand. Whether or not you believe that foreseeing a doubling of demand was a reasonable safety net to put in, in hindsight, it clearly was not. However, before the scheme was launched, I do not think that I heard anyone saying that having a

honno'n broses weddol hir ac estynedig, ond rhagwelwyd erioed mai dyna fyddai'r sefyllfa er mwyn peidio â rhoi gofynion afresymol ar arbenigwyr anadlu. Dyna fyddai wedi digwydd pa byddai'n rhaid ailasesu'r holl ddefnyddwyr ocsigen yn yr wythnos neu'r mis cyntaf. Ni ellid cyflawni hynny, felly rhagwelwyd erioed y byddai'r ailasesu yn digwydd dros ryw ddwy flynedd.

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn derbyn eich sylwadau bod galwadau eithafol wedi cael eu rhoi ar Air Products ar 1 Chwefror i gyflenwi'r gwasanaeth. Yr wyf yn bryderus, er y cydnabuwyd y byddai cynnydd yn narpariaeth y gwasanaeth, fod y cynnydd hwnnw wedi bod yn gynnydd ar ei ddegfed. Y broblem oedd nad oedd gan Air Products senario beth-pe-bai, a chafwyd methiant gweithdrefnol llwyr. Ffoniodd un o'm hetholwyr ac, ar ôl cael ateb o'r diwedd ar y rhif 0800 ar ôl tri diwrnod, dywedwyd wrthi y câi ei phresgripsiwn ei ddanfôn y diwrnod hwnnw, ond ni wnaethant hyd yn oed gymryd ei henw a'i chyfeiriad, sy'n rhyfeddod llwyr i mi. Yr wyf yn deall eu bod o dan bwysau enfawr ac yr ydym, gobeithio, wedi cefnu ar y gwaethaf o ran y broblem honno. A wnewch sicrhau bod y rhifau 0800 a ddarperir i gleifion yn gweithio'n gywir a bod gennych hyder yn y system honno?

O ran yr ymarferiad post mortem yr ydych yn gobeithio y caiff ei gynnal ac o ran y galw eithafol a roddwyd ar Air Products, nid oedd angen ocsigen ar rai pobl y diwrnod hwnnw, ond yr oedd ei angen ar eraill. Dyna sy'n fy mhryderu'n bennaf: nid oedd dim gwirio i ganfod ar bwy yr oedd ei angen a phwy nad oedd ei angen arno. Mae honno'n wers bwysig i'w dysgu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gobeithiaf na chollodd neb eu bywydau oherwydd y mater pwysig hwn. Fodd bynnag, dylem ddysgu o'n camgymeriadau ni ac o gamgymeriadau'r cwmnïau a fu'n darparu'r gwasanaeth.

Brian Gibbons: A bod yn deg ag Air Products, yr oedd wedi rhagweld y byddai cymaint ddwywaith o alw. Pa un a ydych yn credu bod rhagweld cymaint ddwywaith o alw yn rhwyd ddiogelwch resymol i'w chynnwys ai peidio, o edrych yn ôl, mae'n amlwg nad ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, cyn

contingency plan for the doubling of demand was excessively meagre in terms of the provision that was made.

On one of your other points—a few other Members asked about this, but I do not think that I responded to them—local health boards have a key role to play in this, and they are very much on the front line in terms of delivering this contract. This is particularly true of oxygen leads in local health boards, and the important role that these leads play has certainly been brought to the fore—the role of some of those leads has probably been cast in fire because of the situation in which they found themselves.

I do not think that there was any problem with the 0800 number. The issue was that it was simply overwhelmed by the number of calls that it received. I do not think that the system crashed; it just could not cope with the demand in terms of the number of people contacting it. I understand that the complaints have tailed off, but if Members have concerns that they feel we are not aware of, we want to know about them, because that will provide us with important feedback in terms of when the dual running of the contract should come to an end.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fy mod wedi eich rhybuddio ym mis Medi y llynedd y byddai problemau yn codi yn sgîl y trosglwyddiad hwn, a'ch bod wedi fy sicrhau ar fwy nag un achlysur y byddai'r trosglwyddiad yn un llyfn ac nad oeddech yn rhagweld unrhyw drafferthion. Cymeraf eich bod am ailystyried y datganiadau hynny o hyder yn y trosglwyddiad erbyn hyn.

Bydd cyfle yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fore Iau i edrych yn fanylach ar y mater hwn, oherwydd y mae nifer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Hoffwn ofyn dau gwestiwn penodol. Ai gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y mae cytundeb Air Products ai peidio? A allwch chi ddweud ar ba ddyddiad y caiff y cytundeb hwn ei drosglwyddo yn ei

lansio'r cynllun, nid wyf yn tybio imi glywed neb yn dweud bod cael cynllun wrth gefn ar gyfer cymaint ddwywaith o alw yn gwbl annigonol o ran y ddarpariaeth a wnaethpwyd.

O ran un o'ch pwyntiau eraill—holodd ambell Aelod arall ynglŷn â hyn, ond nid wyf yn credu fy mod wedi ymateb iddynt—mae gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ran allweddol i'w chwarae yn hyn, ac maent yn sicr yn y rheng flaen o safbwynt cyflawni'r contract hwn. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir am arweinwyr ocsigen mewn byrddau iechyd lleol, ac mae'r rhan bwysig y mae'r arweinwyr hyn yn ei chwarae yn sicr wedi ei dwyn i'r amlwg—mae'n debyg bod rôl rhai o'r arweinwyr hyn wedi ei nodi'n bendant iawn oherwydd y sefyllfa y maent wedi canfod eu hunain ynddi.

Nid wyf yn credu bod dim problem â'r rhif 0800. Y broblem oedd bod cymaint o alwadau wedi cael eu gwneud. Nid wyf yn credu bod y system wedi chwalu; y broblem oedd ei bod yn methu â dygymod â'r holl bobl a oedd yn cysylltu â hi. Deallaf fod nifer y cwynion wedi lleihau, ond os oes gan yr Aelodau bryderon y maent yn teimlo nad ydym yn ymwybodol ohonynt, byddem yn hoffi cael gwybod amdanynt, oherwydd bydd yn rhoi adborth pwysig inni ynglŷn â pha bryd y dylai gweithrediad deuol y contract ddod i ben.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You will be aware that I warned you last September that problems would arise following this transfer, and that you assured me on more than one occasion that it would be a smooth transition and that you did not anticipate any difficulties. I assume that you will now want to reconsider those statements of confidence in the transfer.

There will be an opportunity in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting on Thursday morning to consider this issue in greater detail, because many questions remain unanswered. I wish to ask two specific questions. Is the Air Products contract with the Welsh Assembly Government or not? Can you give us a date on which this contract will be fully

gyflawnder i Air Products, neu a ydych yn gorfod cyfaddef y prynhawn yma na allwch chi roi'r dyddiad hwnnw ac na allwch chi ragweld ar hyn o bryd pryd fydd hynny'n bosibl?

Brian Gibbons: The contract is with us. You are right; it is impossible to give you a specific date. As I said, something in the order of 70 per cent of the presented home oxygen order forms have been processed by Air Products. Therefore, there is obviously a residue of 30 per cent. Everything is suggesting that there could be additional demand of anything up to 20 per cent in the system. If that is the case, then we do not know when these people are going to present their forms. We do not want to see a replication of the situation that occurred. If we ask community pharmacists not to prescribe any more oxygen, then we will go back to the situation that we had on 1 February.

In response to one of Carl's points, one of the problems that we had was that as soon as we went over to a single provider on 1 February, there was no safety net, apart from community pharmacist being willing to stand in the gap. Until we are sure that the Air Products operation is totally resilient, I am not going to draw any false lines in the sand. The time to hand over totally to Air Products is when we are sure that it is capable of delivering the contract. I do not want to be held as a hostage of fortune by stating a particular date because I do not think that will do patients any good. It will happen when the time is right. Hopefully, that will be sooner rather than later, but we have to be assured that the service is resilient. It is when we are assured that that is the case that we will be able to give a date. There will not be any macho promises until there is certainty in the system.

3.50 p.m.

Datganiad am y Dreth Gyngor Statement on Council Tax

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): Local authorities were required to set their budgets and associated council tax levels for 2006-07

transferred to Air Products, or do you have to admit this afternoon that you cannot give a date and that you cannot currently tell when that will be possible?

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r contract gyda ni. Yr ydych yn iawn; mae'n amhosibl rhoi dyddiad penodol ichi. Fel y dywedais, mae tua 70 y cant o'r ffurflenni archebu ocsigen cartref a gyflwynwyd wedi cael eu prosesu gan Air Products. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod 30 y cant ar ôl. Mae popeth yn awgrymu y gallai'r system wynebu cynnydd o hyd at 20 y cant yn y galw. Os yw hynny'n wir, yna nid ydym yn gwybod pa bryd y bydd y bobl hyn yn cyflwyno ffurflenni. Nid oes arnom eisiau gweld yr un sefyllfa'n codi eto. Os gofynnwn i fferyllwyr cymunedol beidio â rhoi rhagor o ocsigen ar bresgripsiwn, yna byddwn yn mynd yn ôl i'r sefyllfa a oedd gennym ar 1 Chwefror.

Mewn ymateb i un o bwyntiau Carl, un o'r problemau a oedd gennym oedd ein bod, cyn gynted ag yr aethom drosodd i un darparwr ar 1 Chwefror, heb rwyd ddiogelwch, ar wahân i fferyllwyr cymunedol a oedd yn fodlon sefyll yn y bwch. Hyd nes y byddwn yn sicr bod Air Products yn gwbl gadarn, nid wyf yn mynd i dynnu llinellau ffug yn y tywod. Yr adeg i drosglwyddo'n gyfan gwbl i Air Products yw pan fyddwn yn siŵr ei fod yn gallu cyflawni'r contract. Nid oes arnaf eisiau cael fy nal yn wystl ffawd drwy roi dyddiad penodol oherwydd nid wyf yn credu y bydd hynny o ddim budd i gleifion. Bydd yn digwydd pan fydd yn iawn i hynny ddigwydd. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n fuan, ond rhaid inni fod yn sicr bod y gwasanaeth yn gadarn. Dim ond pan fyddwn yn sicr o hynny y byddwn yn gallu rhoi dyddiad. Ni wneir dim addewidion *macho* hyd nes y bydd sicrwydd yn y system.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Yr oedd yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol bennu eu cyllidebau a'r dreth gyngor gysylltiedig ar

by 10 March. We have now received the relevant figures from all authorities in Wales, and I am pleased to be able to report to the Assembly that the average increase in council tax, including police and community council precepts, will be 4.5 per cent for 2006-07. This is in line with the increase in council tax in England. In Wales, it will be the second lowest average increase since the introduction of council tax, the lowest increase being 3.8 per cent for the current financial year.

These figures reflect the mature and responsible approach that has been adopted by local government to the budget-setting process. It also reflects the good final settlement provided by the Assembly Government.

The unitary authority element of the council tax will increase by an average of 4.4 per cent. Combined with the 5.1 per cent increase in Assembly support that I announced through the settlement, this provides local authorities with the funding to deliver the services that the people of Wales are entitled to expect. Nine authorities set increases of below 4 per cent, with Denbighshire setting the lowest increase at 2.1 per cent. Only two councils, Newport and the Vale of Glamorgan, agreed increases above 5 per cent. The highest increase set was the Vale of Glamorgan at 5.5 per cent.

Newport and the Vale of Glamorgan put forward arguments that they have traditionally set budgets below their standard spending assessments and, as a result, Newport has the second lowest council tax in Wales, while the Vale of Glamorgan has the sixth lowest. I therefore concluded that the circumstances this year did not warrant my using the reserve powers that I have available to limit budget and council tax increases. I felt it important to have discussions with the authorities to challenge their increases but, ultimately, local authorities are accountable to their electorate for the decisions that they make, and I would wish to intervene only in exceptional circumstances.

With regard to the police, all four of the

gyfer 2006-07 erbyn 10 Mawrth. Erbyn hyn yr ydym wedi derbyn y ffigurau perthnasol gan bob awdurdod yng Nghymru, ac mae'n dda gennyf allu dweud wrth y Cynulliad mai 4.5 y cant fydd y cynnydd cyfartalog yn y dreth gyngor, gan gynnwys praeseptau'r heddlu a'r cynghorau cymuned, ar gyfer 2006-07. Mae hyn yn cyfateb i'r cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn Lloegr. Yng Nghymru, hwn fydd y cynnydd cyfartalog lleiaf ond un ers cyflwyno'r dreth gyngor. Y cynnydd lleiaf oedd 3.8 y cant ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol.

Mae'r ffigurau hyn yn adlewyrchu'r agwedd aeddfed a chyfrifol a fabwysiadwyd gan lywodraeth leol tuag at y broses o bennu cyllidebau. Mae hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r setliad terfynol da a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Bydd cynnydd o 4.4 y cant ar gyfartaledd yn elfen awdurdodau unedol y dreth gyngor. O'i gyfuno â'r cynnydd o 5.1 y cant mewn cymorth gan y Cynulliad a gyhoeddais drwy'r setliad, mae hyn yn rhoi i awdurdodau lleol y cyllid i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau y mae gan bobl Cymru hawl i'w disgwyl. Pennwyd cynnydd o lai na 4 y cant gan naw awdurdod, a phennwyd y cynnydd lleiaf, sef 2.1 y cant gan sir Ddinbych. Dim ond dau gyngor, sef Casnewydd a Bro Morgannwg, a gytunodd ar gynnydd o fwy na 5 y cant. Pennwyd y cynnydd mwyaf, sef 5.5 y cant gan Fro Morgannwg.

Dadl Casnewydd a Bro Morgannwg oedd eu bod yn y gorffennol wedi pennu cyllidebau a oedd yn is na'u hasesiadau gwariant safonol. Casnewydd, o ganlyniad, sydd â'r dreth gyngor isaf ond un yng Nghymru, ac mae Bro Morgannwg yn chweched o'r gwaelod. Deuthum i'r casgliad felly nad oedd yr amgylchiadau eleni yn galw arnaf i ddefnyddio'r pwerau wrth gefn sydd gennyf i gyfyngu ar gynnydd mewn cyllidebau a threth gyngor. Teimlwn ei bod yn bwysig cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r awdurdodau er mwyn herio'u cynnydd ond, yn y pen draw, mae awdurdodau lleol yn atebol i'w hetholwyr am y penderfyniadau y maent yn eu gwneud, a dim ond mewn amgylchiadau eithriadol y byddwn yn dymuno ymyrryd.

O ran yr heddlu, pennodd pob un o'r pedwar

police authorities in Wales set precept increases of 5 per cent. As policing is a non-devolved issue, I stressed the importance of police authorities in Wales acting in line with the expectations set out by the Home Office for police authorities in England. I am pleased to report that rises of 5 per cent are in line with those expectations. In the lead-up to the budget setting, I had discussions with the police authorities, and I am aware that, in the case of Dyfed-Powys Police Authority, the transfer of police pensions out of the police grant created particular funding difficulties for 2006-07. Dialogue with officials on this matter is continuing. However, I am pleased that the authority recognised the need to act reasonably in setting its budget despite these difficulties.

The full details of the council tax figures for 2006-07 are contained in a statistical release to be issued on 23 March.

David Lloyd: I thank the Minister for her statement on council tax. Obviously, we have history here; we have some high levels of council tax, and there is huge cause for concern. I note the comments in the statement that this year has seen the second lowest average increase since the introduction of council tax, which, as we all recall from 1993, was originally introduced by the Conservatives. The council tax as a property-based tax is now being continued by New Labour.

It is worth noting that the average band D levels in local authorities such as Neath Port Talbot, Merthyr and Blaenau Gwent are well over £1,000 per year. That means that some of our poorest communities pay the most council tax. Furthermore, average council tax as a percentage of the state pension rose from 13.4 per cent in 1996-97 to 19.4 per cent in 2003-04, and has doubtless risen since, courtesy of rebanding.

A study by the University of Warwick last year revealed that one fifth of the people on the lowest incomes, after benefits and

awdurdod heddlu sydd yng Nghymru gynydd o 5 y cant ar gyfer eu praeseptau. Gan nad yw plismona wedi ei ddatganoli, pwysleisiais pa mor bwysig ydyw i awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru weithredu yn unol â'r disgwyliadau a bennwyd gan y Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer awdurdodau'r heddlu yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod cynnydd o 5 y cant yn unol â'r disgwyliadau hynny. Yn y cyfnod yn arwain at bennu'r cyllidebau, cynhaliats drafodaethau gydag awdurdodau'r heddlu, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol, yn achos Awdurdod Heddlu Dyfed-Powys, fod trosglwyddo pensiynau'r heddlu allan o grant yr heddlu wedi creu anawsterau ariannu penodol ar gyfer 2006-07. Yr ydym yn dal i drafod y mater hwn gyda'r swyddogion. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch bod yr awdurdod wedi cydnabod bod angen gweithredu'n rhesymol wrth bennu ei gyllideb er gwaetha'r anawsterau hyn.

Bydd manylion llawn ffigurau'r dreth gyngor ar gyfer 2006-07 i'w gweld mewn datganiad ystadegol a gyhoeddir ar 23 Mawrth.

David Lloyd: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ar y dreth gyngor. Mae'n amlwg bod hanes y tu ôl i hyn; mae gennym drethi cyngor uchel, ac mae cryn achos i bryderu. Yr wyf yn nodi'r sylwadau yn y datganiad mai'r cynnydd hwn eleni yw'r cynnydd cyfartalog lleiaf ond un ers cyflwyno'r dreth gyngor yn 1993, a hynny'n wreiddiol, fel y cofiwn i gyd, gan y Ceidwadwyr. Mae Llafur Newydd yn awr yn dal ati â'r dreth gyngor fel treth sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo.

Mae'n werth nodi bod y lefelau cyfartalog ym mand D mewn awdurdodau lleol fel Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Merthyr a Blaenau Gwent ymhell dros £1,000 y flwyddyn. Golyga hyn fod rhai o'n cymunedau tlotaf yn talu'r dreth gyngor uchaf. Yn ychwanegol at hyn, cododd y dreth gyngor gyfartalog fel canran o bensiwn y wladwriaeth o 13.4 y cant yn 1996-97 i 19.4 y cant yn 2003-04, ac mae'n siŵr ei bod wedi codi ers hynny, o ganlyniad i ailfandio.

Dangosodd astudiaeth gan Brifysgol Warwick y llynedd fod un o bob pump o'r bobl sydd â'r incwm isaf, ar ôl budd-daliadau

deductions, spend 4.6 per cent of their income on council tax, while one fifth of those on the highest incomes spend only 1.6 per cent of their pay on council tax. The question emanating from that is: is the Minister happy to continue to support the concept of council tax, which means that Assembly Members pay 2.1 per cent of their income on council tax and Assembly Ministers pay only 1.1 per cent of their income on council tax, while retired householders pay 6.2 per cent of their income on council tax?

Following on from that, it is the largely inadequate local government settlement of 5.1 per cent that puts the pressure on council tax levels. I know that the Welsh Local Government Association supports the Minister on the settlement, but, with the 1 per cent Gershon/‘Making the Connections’ efficiency savings kicking in, is the Minister happy that it looks as though individual school budgets in the coming year will be less than last year’s budget for the same schools?

Clearly, rebanding threw the issue of council tax into sharp focus. Taken with the low level of state pension and the current inadequate take-up of council tax benefit, in terms of affordability, will the Minister reconsider a system of local income tax that is based on the ability to pay? I will not go through the range of arguments in its favour again, but a system of local income tax operates in 12 other European countries, and we sometimes benefit from the experience of colleagues on the European mainland.

Will she further consider the issue of disregards, which has been raised in committee previously, in terms of disregarding those small occupational pensions, small war pensions and the like, which mean that pensioners have to pay for everything and do not qualify for any help?

Finally, on police funding, in addition to what the Minister has said about this, what progress has been made on the discussions on funding the police restructuring and the huge necessity, agreed across parties here, that the cost of the proposed restructuring does not

a didyniadau, yn gwario 4.6 y cant o’u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor, tra bo un o bob pump o’r rhai sydd â’r incwm uchaf yn gwario 1.6 y cant yn unig o’u cyflog ar y dreth gyngor. Y cwestiwn sy’n codi o hyn yw: a yw’r Gweinidog yn fodlon parhau i gefnogi’r cysyniad o dreth gyngor, sy’n golygu bod Aelodau’r Cynulliad yn gwario 2.1 y cant o’u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor a Gweinidogion y Cynulliad yn gwario dim ond 1.1 y cant o’u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor, tra bo deiliaid tai sydd wedi ymddeol yn gwario 6.2 y cant o’u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor?

Yn dilyn hynny, y setliad llywodraeth leol annigonol, at ei gilydd, o 5.1 y cant sy’n rhoi’r pwysau ar awdurdodau i godi’r dreth gyngor. Gwn fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru’n cefnogi’r Gweinidog ar fater y setliad, ond, wrth i arbedion effeithlonrwydd 1 y cant Gershon/‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’ ddod i rym, a yw’r Gweinidog yn fodlon ei bod yn ymddangos y bydd cyllidebau ysgolion unigol yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod yn llai na chyllideb y llynedd ar gyfer yr un ysgolion?

Mae ailfandio yn amlwg wedi gwneud inni edrych ar fater y dreth gyngor. Gyda phensiwn y wladwriaeth mor fach a chyn lleied o bobl yn gwneud cais am fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, o ran fforddiadwyedd, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried system treth incwm leol sy’n seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu? Nid wyf am fynd drwy’r ystod o ddadleuon o blaid hyn eto, ond mae system treth incwm leol yn cael ei gweithredu mewn 12 gwlad arall yn Ewrop, ac yr ydym weithiau’n elwa o brofiad cyfeillion ar dir mawr Ewrop.

A wnaiff hi hefyd ystyried mater diystyru, sydd wedi ei godi yn y pwyllgor o’r blaen, yng nghyswllt diystyru’r pensiynau galwedigaethol bach hynny, pensiynau rhyfel bach ac yn y blaen, sy’n golygu bod pensiynwyr yn gorfod talu am bopeth ac nad ydynt yn gymwys i dderbyn dim cymorth?

Yn olaf, o ran ariannu’r heddlu, yn ychwanegol at yr hyn y mae’r Gweinidog wedi ei ddweud am hyn, pa gynnydd sydd wedi ei wneud â’r trafodaethau ar ariannu ad-drefnu’r heddlu a’r rheidrwydd mawr, y mae pob un o’r pleidiau yma yn gytûn arno, i

fall on the council tax payers of Wales?

It is certain that local authorities face significant challenges in providing high-quality services within the current financial settlements. There are huge and escalating costs in taking care of looked-after children, local government pensions, waste management and school repairs. At the end of that day, local authorities can raise their own council tax. That tax-raising power is a power denied to the Assembly, but our local authorities have that power. However, raising council tax can, in itself, bring significant political fallout. I would value the Minister's clarification of my points.

Sue Essex: There is quite a lot there, but I will try to get through all of it. If I miss something out, I am sure that you will let me know.

It is interesting that you used the phrase, 'we have history here'. Yes, there is history—two years of the lowest council tax rises since council tax was introduced, and we should celebrate that. I am sure that the public appreciates that we and local government have made a genuine effort to ensure that we reach this figure today.

On rebanding, you talk about revaluation as though no-one other than the Welsh Assembly Government had anything to do with it. I do not think that you were a member of the committee at the time, but every party was represented during discussions on the 'Freedom and Responsibility in Local Government' document and when the rebanding was agreed in 2001. Everyone agreed—and I understand that your party does not necessarily agree with council tax—that if you have a property tax, you must have revaluation. I have not come across a country in the world that has a property tax and does not have revaluation. As difficult as that is to face up to and deal with, there is no doubt that that is the fair way of proceeding.

On whether or not we should have such a

sicrhau nad yw cost yr ad-drefnu arfaethedig yn disgyn ar ysgwyddau pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru?

Mae awdurdodau lleol yn sicr yn wynebu cryn her os ydynt am ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon uchel â'r setliadau ariannol cyfredol. Mae costau aruthrol a chynyddol ynghlwm wrth ofalu am blant sy'n derbyn gofal, pensiynau llywodraeth leol, rheoli gwastraff ac atgyweirio ysgolion. Yn y diwedd, gall awdurdodau lleol godi eu treth gyngor eu hunain. Mae'r pŵer hwn i godi trethi yn bŵer sydd wedi ei warafun i'r Cynulliad, ond mae'r pŵer hwn gan ein hawdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, gall codi treth gyngor, ynddo'i hun, arwain at anghytundeb gwleidyddol mawr. Byddwn yn falch pe bai'r Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi eglurhad ar fy mhwyntiau.

Sue Essex: Mae gennyh lawer o bwyntiau, ond yr wyf am geisio mynd drwyddynt i gyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn gadael imi wybod os byddaf heb gynnwys rhywbeth.

Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod wedi defnyddio'r ymadrodd, 'mae hanes y tu ôl i hyn'. Oes, mae hanes—dwy flynedd lle y gwelwyd y cynnydd lleiaf yn y dreth gyngor ers pan gyflwynwyd hi, a dylem fod yn falch o hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y cyhoedd yn gwerthfawrogi ein bod ni a llywodraeth leol wedi gwneud ymdrech wirioneddol i sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd y ffigur hwn heddiw.

O ran ailfandio, yr ydych yn siarad am ailbrisiu fel pe na bai a wnelo neb ar wahân i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddim â hyn. Nid wyf yn credu eich bod yn aelod o'r pwyllgor ar y pryd, ond cynrychiolwyd pob plaid yn ystod y trafodaethau ar y ddogfen 'Rhyddid a Chyfrifoldeb mewn Llywodraeth Leol' a phan gytunwyd ar yr ailfandio yn 2001. Yr oedd pawb yn cytuno—a deallaf nad yw eich plaid yn cytuno o reidrwydd â'r dreth gyngor—os oes gennyh dreth eiddo, fod rhaid ichi gael ailbrisiad. Ni wn am ddim un wlad yn y byd sydd â threth eiddo ond nad yw'n ailbrisiu. Er mor anodd yw wynebu hyn a delio â'r mater, heb os nac oni bai dyma'r ffordd deg o symud ymlaen.

Ynghylch y cwestiwn a ddylem gael system

system, as I said to your colleague, Janet Davies, Sir Michael Lyons is looking at the options of council tax, property tax and local income tax. I gave my view to the committee last week, and I think that that has been accepted. Next week, you will be considering your views. Therefore, there is not much point in going back over that.

4.00 p.m.

You say that 5.1 per cent in the revenue support grant is inadequate, but your party did not propose a larger sum in the budget discussions—nor did any other party. Let us be honest about this. The budget discussions went through in a joint way, because that is how the numbers worked in discussions on the draft budget. When Welsh local government said that it was reasonable—I remind you that the WLGA is not Labour-controlled; it is controlled by all local authorities as a mixture of Labour-led, Liberal-led, independent-led and Tory-led councils—there was a genuine belief that the 5.1 per cent was reasonable and that we had made a real attempt to look together at expenditure pressures.

I understand that, for poorer authorities, such as Neath and Merthyr Tydfil, which are some of the smaller ones, those levels of council tax are high. As you well know, that is why the formula that drives our RSG has deprivation as one of its key weighting elements. It is also why we top it up with the deprivation grant, and why many of our other formulae for special grants have deprivation as the core. We are trying to support smaller authorities in poorer areas in that way.

In terms of your point on schools, in that they have received a lower budget than in previous years, you know that school funding allocations across Wales, in every local authority, are driven by pupil numbers. That is the core element of the distribution of funding. If pupil numbers are decreasing, it inevitably affects school budgets. There is no way that you can camouflage that.

o'r fath ai peidio, fel y dywedais wrth eich cyd-Aelod, Janet Davies, mae Syr Michael Lyons yn edrych ar y dewisiadau, treth gyngor, treth eiddo a threth incwm leol. Rhoddais fy marn i'r pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, a chredaf fod hynny wedi'i dderbyn. Yr wythnos nesaf, byddwch yn ystyried eich sylwadau. Felly, nid oes llawer o bwrpas mewn mynd dros y tir hwnnw eto.

Yr ydych yn dweud bod 5.1 y cant yn y grant cynnal refeniw yn annigonol, ond ni chynigiodd eich plaid swm mwy yn nhrefodaethau'r gyllideb—ac ni wnaeth dim un blaid arall hynny ychwaith. Gadewch inni fod yn onest ynglŷn â hyn. Cynhaliwyd trafodaethau'r gyllideb ar y cyd, gan mai felly yr oedd y niferoedd yn gweithio mewn trafodaethau ar y gyllideb ddrafft. Pan ddywedodd llywodraeth leol Cymru ei fod yn rhesymol—hoffwn eich atgoffa nad yw CLILC yn cael ei rheoli gan Lafur; caiff ei rheoli gan gymysgedd o gynghorau sy'n cael eu harwain gan Lafur, y Rhyddfrydwyr, annibynwyr a Thoriaid—credid o ddifrif fod y 5.1 y cant yn rhesymol a'n bod wedi gwneud ymdrech deg i edrych gyda'n gilydd ar y pwysau ar wariant.

Deallaf, yn achos awdurdodau tlotach, megis Castell-nedd a Merthyr Tudful, sy'n rhai o'r rhai lleiaf, fod y lefelau hynny o dreth gyngor yn uchel. Fel y gwyddoch o'r gorau, dyna pam mae'r fformiwla sydd wrth wraidd ein GCR yn cynnwys amddifadedd fel un o'i brif elfennau pwysoli. Dyna hefyd pam yr ydym yn ychwanegu ato gyda'r grant amddifadedd, a pham mae llawer o'n fformiwlâu eraill ar gyfer grantiau arbennig ag amddifadedd yn ganolog iddynt. Yr ydym yn ceisio cynorthwyo awdurdodau llai mewn ardaloedd tlotach drwy wneud hynny.

O ran eich pwynt ynglŷn ag ysgolion, sef eu bod wedi derbyn cyllideb is nag yn y blynyddoedd blaenorol, gwyddoch fod dyraniadau cyllid i ysgolion ledled Cymru, ym mhob awdurdod lleol, yn cael eu rheoli gan niferoedd y disgyblion. Hynny yw elfen graidd dosbarthiad yr arian. Os yw niferoedd disgyblion yn gostwng, mae'n anochel bod hynny'n effeithio ar gyllidebau ysgolion. Nid oes modd cuddio hynny.

Gwenda raised issues of disregard last week at committee in terms of the Michael Lyons report. As I have learnt, she is an expert on issues of disregard, and made valuable points that can be passed on to Michael Lyons.

On council tax benefit, again, we have discussed this many times in committee and in the Chamber. I am firmly of the belief that that needs to be reformed, if we continue with a property tax, to ensure that it encompasses a wider group of people.

Finally, Edwina Hart is leading on police funding and restructuring but, as you will see if you look at how money comes through for police funding, it is a complicated process. Edwina Hart and I are of the firm opinion—as we have said in a response to Michael Lyons—that we need to decomplicate those funding streams and make them simpler to understand. I hope that that might be one of the issues that will come out of the Michael Lyons report.

David Melding: Despite your reasonable tone this afternoon, the truth of the matter remains that, since 1997, when the Labour Party first formed a Government in Westminster, and since 1999, when the Government was formed in Wales, council tax has nearly doubled. This has been the phenomenon that has undermined the confidence that people have in council tax as a property tax. Property taxes are useful and they are easy to collect, but they are not very fair in that they are not broadly related to income. Therefore, their use has to be moderate. You have undermined that principle by turning council tax, frankly, into a stealth tax. This was also reflected somewhat in rebanding when the yield increased. In general, people feel that although income tax has been kept at a certain level, tax rises have come in by the back door, through council tax. It is regressive because it relates much more to property than to disposable income.

You alluded to the Lyons review, which is testimony to the fact that you have

Yr wythnos diwethaf cododd Gwenda bwyntiau yn y pwyllgor yn ymwneud â diystyru o ran adroddiad Michael Lyons. Fel yr wyf wedi dod i ddeall, mae hi'n arbenigwraig ar faterion diystyru, a gwnaeth bwyntiau gwerthfawr y gellir eu cyfleu i Michael Lyons.

O ran budd-dal y dreth gyngor, unwaith eto, yr ydym wedi trafod hyn nifer o weithiau yn y pwyllgor ac yn y Siambr. Yr wyf yn bendant o'r farn bod angen ei ddiwygio, os ydym yn parhau gyda threth eiddo, i sicrhau ei fod yn cwmpasu grŵp ehangach o bobl.

Yn olaf, mae Edwina Hart yn arwain gyda'r gwaith o ariannu ac ailstrwythuro'r heddlu ond, fel y daw'n amlwg i chi os edrychych sut y mae'r arian yn ein cyrraedd ar gyfer yr heddlu, mae'n broses gymhleth. Mae Edwina Hart a minnau yn bendant o'r farn—fel y dywedasom mewn ymateb i Michael Lyons—fod angen inni symleiddio'r ffrydiau ariannu hynny a'u gwneud yn haws eu deall. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n un o'r pethau a gaiff sylw yn adroddiad Michael Lyons.

David Melding: Er gwaethaf eich agwedd resymol y prynhawn yma, y gwir yw, ers 1997, pan ffurfiodd y Blaid Lafur Lywodraeth gyntaf yn San Steffan, ac ers 1999, pan ffurfiwyd y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru, mae'r dreth gyngor wedi dyblu bron. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth sydd wedi tanseilio hyder pobl yn y dreth gyngor fel treth eiddo. Mae trethi eiddo'n ddefnyddiol ac yn hawdd eu casglu, ond nid ydynt yn deg iawn yn yr ystyr nad oes cysylltiad agos rhyngddynt ac incwm. Felly, rhaid i'r defnydd a wneir ohonynt fod yn gymedrol. Yr ydych wedi tanseilio'r egwyddor honno drwy droi'r dreth gyngor, a dweud y gwir, yn dreth lechwraidd. Adlewyrchwyd hyn hefyd i raddau yn yr ailfandio pan gynyddodd yr incwm o'r dreth. At ei gilydd, mae pobl yn teimlo, er bod treth incwm wedi'i chadw ar lefel benodol, fod codiadau treth wedi digwydd drwy'r drws cefn, trwy'r dreth gyngor. Mae'n gam yn ôl gan fod ganddi lawer mwy o gysylltiad ag eiddo nag ag incwm gwario.

Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at adolygiad Lyons, sy'n tystio i'r ffaith eich bod wedi tanseilio'r

undermined council tax and that you are looking for other means of raising revenue to fund local government. There would not be demand for a review had this situation not occurred in the last five or six years. However, to see some light in a pretty dark picture, you can make an argument for raising more of local government's revenue from local taxpayers as long as the central tax burden is proportionally reduced. However, the further expansion of council tax as a property tax would not be a fair way of shifting the burden of local government revenue from central to more local sources. We would have to use other tax-raising measures, because the risk of having too much on a property tax is dire.

I ask you again, Minister, to revisit the question of how those on low or fixed incomes are helped with what is a burdensome tax.

Sue Essex: You are on dangerous ground when you talk about Labour being the worst. The worst year for council tax payers was when William Hague—I know that it is hard to go back to this; it is painful for all of us—was the Tory Secretary of State for Wales. He dropped the bombshell of really raising council tax in Wales, because those were his instructions from his leader in London. If you look at the chart, for several years under the Tory regime, there were huge increases in Welsh council tax. In some cases, they almost trebled in one year. Therefore, you are on dangerous ground when you remind council tax payers of those dark Tory years.

What we have tried to do—certainly in the last few years—is smooth out that volatility of council tax movement; volatility always means up, does it not, and people find that hard to take. Therefore, the fact that, for these last two years, we have had the lowest increases is testament to what we have tried to do here as a Labour-led Government. Although it was difficult last year—and you will all recall that I set the principles—I am pleased that I have not had to do that this year. It is not in my nature to look for the 'c' word—capping—because it is a principle of

dreth gyngor a'ch bod yn chwilio am ffyrdd eraill o godi refeniw i ariannu llywodraeth leol. Ni fyddai galw wedi bod am adolygiad pe na bai'r sefyllfa hon wedi codi yn y pum neu chwe blynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn gweld peth goleuni mewn darlun digon tywyll, gallwch ddadlau dros godi mwy o refeniw llywodraeth leol gan drethdalwyr lleol cyhyd â bod gostyngiad cyfatebol ym maich y dreth ganolog. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai ehangu'r dreth gyngor ymhellach fel treth eiddo'n ffordd deg o drosglwyddo baich refeniw llywodraeth leol oddi wrth ffynonellau canolog i rai mwy lleol. Byddai'n rhaid inni ddefnyddio dulliau eraill o godi treth, gan fod cryn berygl y ceid gormod ar dreth eiddo.

Gofynnaf i chi eto, Weinidog, ailedrych ar y cwestiwn sut y gellir cynorthwyo'r rhai ar incwm isel neu sefydlog i dalu treth sy'n faich arnynt.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych ar dir peryglus pan ydych yn dweud mai Llafur yw'r gwaethaf. Y flwyddyn waethaf i dalwyr y dreth gyngor oedd pan oedd William Hague—gwn ei bod yn anodd inni fynd yn ôl at hyn; mae'n anodd i bob un ohonom—yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn Llywodraeth y Torïaid. Dychrynodd bawb trwy godi cymaint ar y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, oherwydd mai dyna oedd y cyfarwyddiadau a dderbyniodd oddi wrth ei arweinydd yn Llundain. Os edrychwch ar y siart, am sawl blwyddyn o dan gyfundrefn y Torïaid, gwelwyd cynnydd enfawr yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru. Mewn rhai achosion, gwelwyd hwy'n treblu bron mewn un flwyddyn. Felly, yr ydych ar dir peryglus wrth atgoffa talwyr y dreth gyngor o ddyddiau tywyll y Torïaid.

Yr hyn yr ydym wedi ymdrechu i'w wneud—yn sicr yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf—yw lleddfu anwadalwch y newidiadau i'r dreth gyngor; mae anwadalwch bob amser yn golygu codiadau, onid yw, ac mae pobl yn ei chael yn anodd derbyn hynny. Felly, mae'r ffaith ein bod, yn y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, wedi cael y codiadau lleiaf yn brawf o'r hyn yr ydym wedi ceisio'i wneud yma fel Llywodraeth sy'n cael ei harwain gan Lafur. Er ei bod yn anodd y llynedd—a byddwch i gyd yn cofio imi bennu'r egwyddorion—yr wyf yn falch nad wyf wedi gorfod gwneud

local democracy. However, we have sat down and discussed this. I have had fruitful discussions with local authorities about their budgets, and we have arrived at a figure. I understand that a 4.4 or 4.5 per cent average is difficult for some people, but it is a testament to the maturity of local government that we are now arriving at figures that are reasonable for people.

In addition, council tax levels in Wales are still about 25 per cent lower than in England, so there is still a high percentage of support by us from central Government. You say that it is a stealth tax; the words 'stealth tax' do not apply to council tax. It is the most obvious tax that people pay—everyone knows about council tax. People get their demands, they are not overjoyed, but it is clear what they have to pay.

The Michael Lyons review, which was set up by central Government, is essentially a review in England. However, I had no qualms or problems when he considered the balance of funding—that was a good piece of work that he started to do—and I have no qualms that his brief has been extended. I have no worries either as to what he may come up with. Despite everything—and there are advantages and attractions to a local income tax—on balance, a property tax, with the right protection for those on low and fixed incomes, and I always put those two together, is probably the best, but not the only, answer in local taxation. That was the basis of our support and submission to the Lyons review. Therefore, we will wait to see what he comes up with.

However, I would hope that you would join me in celebrating the fact that, for the second year running, we have the lowest council tax increase in Wales. That is a real achievement, with central and local Government working together.

Michael German: As we dig down into the municipal money pit, Minister, and look at

hynny eleni. Nid yw yn fy natur chwilio am y gair sy'n dechrau ag 'c'—capio—gan ei fod yn egwyddor mewn democratiaeth leol. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi eistedd a thrafod hyn. Yr wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau buddiol gydag awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â'u cyllidebau, a daethom at ffigur. Deallaf fod ffigur cyfartalog o 4.4 neu 4.5 y cant yn anodd i rai pobl, ond mae'n arwydd o aeddfedrwydd llywodraeth leol ein bod yn awr yn dod at ffigurau sy'n rhesymol i bobl.

Hefyd, mae lefelau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru'n parhau i fod tua 25 y cant yn is na Lloegr, felly mae canran uchel o gymorth gennym o hyd oddi wrth y Llywodraeth ganolog. Yr ydych yn dweud ei bod yn dreth lechwraidd; nid yw'r geiriau 'treth lechwraidd' yn wir am y dreth gyngor. Dyma'r dreth fwyaf amlwg y mae pobl yn ei thalu—mae pawb yn gwybod am y dreth gyngor. Mae pawb yn derbyn eu biliau treth, nid ydynt yn gwirioni o'u cael, ond mae'n amlwg faint sy'n rhaid iddynt ei dalu.

Adolygiad yn Lloegr yn y bôn yw adolygiad Michael Lyons, a sefydlwyd gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd gennyf amheuan na phroblem pan ystyriodd y cydbwysedd cyllid—yr oedd hwnnw'n ddarn da o waith y dechreuodd arno—ac nid yw'n fy mhoeni fod cwmpas ei waith wedi ei ymestyn. Nid wyf yn poeni ychwaith beth fydd ei gasgliadau. Er gwaethaf popeth—ac mae gan dreth incwm leol ei manteision a'i hatyniadau—at ei gilydd, treth eiddo, gyda mesurau digonol i gynorthwyo rhai ar incwm isel ac incwm sefydlog, ac yr wyf bob amser yn rhoi'r ddau hyn gyda'i gilydd, yw'r ateb gorau mae'n debyg, ond nid yr unig un, gyda golwg ar drethi lleol. Dyna oedd sail ein cefnogaeth a'n sylwadau i adolygiad Lyons. Felly, byddwn yn aros i weld beth fydd ei gasgliadau.

Fodd bynnag, byddwn wedi gobeithio y byddech yn ymuno â mi i ddathlu'r ffaith ein bod, am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol, wedi gweld y cynnydd isaf yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn gryn gamp, gyda Llywodraeth ganolog a lleol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd.

Michael German: Wrth inni dyrchu i lawr i'r twll arian bwrdeistrefol, Weinidog, ac

what has happened, it is clear that this is the second year of a regime that was intended, last year, to put in place strong measures to ensure that local authorities did not exceed a level that you wanted to set. Going so far as to lay out your principles was a way of showing the seriousness of your intent. I think that you would probably agree with that. You would expect this year, as it is the second year, that people would say, 'we know that she is going to do it if we do not knuckle down and get in line'. I do not doubt your resolve to try to keep the figures down, but it has been a determined effort to ensure that you put a cap on local authorities in a moral way even if you have not gone through the legislative route as yet.

edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd, mae'n amlwg mai hon yw ail flwyddyn cyfundrefn a oedd wedi ei bwriadu, y llynedd, ar gyfer cyflwyno mesurau cryf i sicrhau nad oedd awdurdodau lleol yn mynd y tu hwnt i lefel yr oeddech am ei phennu. Yr oedd mynd cyn belled ag amlinellu eich egwyddorion yn ffordd o ddangos difrifoldeb eich bwriad. Credaf y byddech yn debygol o gytuno â hynny. Byddech yn disgwyl eleni, gan mai hon yw'r ail flwyddyn, y byddai pobl yn dweud, 'gwyddom beth y bydd yn ei wneud os na fyddwn yn ufuddhau ac yn gwneud fel y mae'n dweud'. Nid wyf yn amau eich penderfyniad i geisio cadw'r ffigurau i lawr, ond mae wedi bod yn ymdrech benderfynol i sicrhau eich bod yn capio awdurdodau lleol mewn ffordd foisol hyd yn oed os nad ydych wedi dilyn y trywydd deddfwriaethol eto.

4.10 p.m.

Perhaps you could answer a fundamental question, which has been asked by Dai and David Melding. In the last decade, we have seen council tax double, yet average household income has only gone up by 50 per cent. In other words, for everyone who is on an average income, the amount of council tax that they have to pay has risen month on month, year on year. At the same time, local authorities have been given new duties, such as the new licensing laws, the increase in social care standards, increases in public-sector pay and the rising number of elderly people in need of long-term care, which have all helped to drive up local authority costs. So, local authority costs are rising. If you simply look at the energy bills of local authorities this year, there has been an increase of between 1 and 1.5 per cent for local government.

Efallai y gallwch ateb cwestiwn sylfaenol, a ofynnwyd gan Dai a David Melding. Yn y degawd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld y dreth gyngor yn dyblu, ond mae incwm cartrefi ar gyfartaledd wedi codi 50 y cant yn unig. Mewn geiriau eraill, yn achos pawb sy'n ennill incwm cyfartalog, mae swm y dreth gyngor y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei dalu wedi codi fis ar ôl mis, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Ar yr un pryd, mae awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod ymgymryd â dyletswyddau newydd, megis y deddfau trwyddedu newydd, y cynnydd mewn safonau gofal cymdeithasol, cynnydd yng nghyflogau'r sector cyhoeddus a chynnydd yn nifer y bobl hyn sydd angen gofal hirdymor, sydd i gyd wedi cyfrannu at gynyddu costau awdurdodau lleol. Felly, mae costau awdurdodau lleol yn codi. Os edrychwch ar filiau ynni'r awdurdodau lleol eleni, gwelwyd cynnydd rhwng 1 ac 1.5 y cant i lywodraeth leol.

What we have is a Minister trying to hold down the amount of increase in a system that is inherently unfair and, at the same time, the inflation rate for local councils is far in excess of the inflation rate that we see in the retail price index, which is 1.9 per cent. We know that local government costs are much higher than that; I have just illustrated the increase of 1 to 1.5 per cent in energy costs. I wonder whether the Minister could argue

Yr hyn sydd gennym yw Gweinidog sy'n ceisio cadw'r cynnydd i lawr mewn system sy'n sylfaenol annheg ac, ar yr un pryd, mae'r gyfradd chwyddiant i gynghorau lleol yn llawer uwch na'r gyfradd chwyddiant a welwn yn y mynegai prisiau manwerthu, sef 1.9 y cant. Gwyddom fod costau llywodraeth leol yn llawer uwch na hynny; yr wyf newydd dynnu sylw at y cynnydd o 1 i 1.5 y cant mewn costau ynni. Tybed a allai'r

well that the situation of people who are hit the hardest by council tax is improving. It is not. The poorer continue to get worse off and that is the reality of this particular taxation. The poorest members of society continue to suffer from council tax increases. Even 4.4 per cent, which is the average across Wales—and it depends where you are whether you are lucky enough to get below or above that—is more than some pensioners can manage. Ask them what the increase in their pensions is, and then consider 4.4 per cent.

Will the Minister consider something that the First Minister said when he was questioned on this some months ago? He said that the way to approach this problem, to make it less of a burden upon council tax payers, was perhaps to take out of local government some of the big spending issues, such as teachers' salaries and terms and conditions. I wonder whether it is in the mind of the Labour Party here to try to lift responsibility for teachers' pay out of local government. If so, local determination and the amount of money that local authorities would have to raise would be a lot less. Is that devolution going in the wrong direction? It cannot be right that just 0.7 per cent of Tony Blair's income goes on his council tax—I do not know how many houses he has to pay council tax on; there are quite a few—compared with 10 per cent of the annual income of most pensioners. Can the Minister explain whether she is considering radical surgery to the local government budget? Is that not the opposite of devolution than what is the intention of the National Assembly?

Sue Essex: I agree with some of your analysis. It was very interesting to read in a recent Joseph Rowntree Foundation report that there is a dramatic reduction in pensioner poverty. There are other things that the Chancellor Gordon Brown has done, in particular, that need to come into the picture. Although the funding of local government is devolved and council tax is a matter for local authorities, the role and attitude of central Government is crucial. The other thing that you are missing in this is the role of central Government and the Assembly, in that we have determinedly increased the provision of

Gweinidog ddadlau bod sefyllfa'r bobl yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf gan y dreth gyngor yn gwella? Nid yw'n gwella. Mae'r tlawd yn parhau i fynd yn dlotach a dyna ddagrau pethau yn achos y dreth arbennig hon. Mae aelodau tlotaf cymdeithas yn parhau i ddioddef o ganlyniad i gynnydd yn y dreth. Mae hyd yn oed 4.4 y cant, sef y cyfartaledd ledled Cymru—ac mae'n dibynnu ar ble yr ydych yn byw a ydych yn ddigon ffodus i ddod o dan neu dros hynny—yn fwy nag y gall rhai pensiyntwyr ei fforddio. Gofynnwch iddynt faint yw'r cynnydd yn eu pensiwn, ac yna meddyliwch am 4.4 y cant.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried rhywbeth a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog wrth gael ei holi ar y mater hwn rai misoedd yn ôl? Dywedodd mai'r ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, i'w gwneud yn llai o faich ar dalwyr y dreth gyngor, o bosibl oedd tynnu rhai o'r meysydd gwario mawr oddi ar lywodraeth leol, fel cyflogau a thelerau ac amodau athrawon. Tybed a yw'r Blaid Lafur yn ystyried tynnu'r cyfrifoldeb am gyflogau athrawon oddi wrth lywodraeth leol? Os yw hynny'n wir, byddai penderfyniadau lleol a swm yr arian y byddai'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ei godi'n llawer is. A yw hynny'n enghraifft o ddatganoli'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir? Ni all fod yn deg mai dim ond 0.7 y cant o incwm Tony Blair sy'n mynd tuag at ei dreth gyngor—ni wn faint o dai y mae'n talu'r dreth gyngor arnynt; mae sawl un—o'i gymharu â 10 y cant o incwm blynyddol y rhan fwyaf o bensiynwyr. A all y Gweinidog esbonio a yw hi'n ystyried newidiadau radical i gyllideb llywodraeth leol? Onid yw hynny'n gwbl groes i ddatganoli, felly beth yw bwriad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf â rhan o'ch dadansoddiad. Yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol iawn darllen mewn adroddiad diweddar gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree fod gostyngiad dramatig wedi bod mewn tlodi ymhlith pensiyntwyr. Mae angen cynnwys rhai pethau eraill y mae'r Canghellor Gordon Brown, yn fwyaf arbennig, wedi eu gwneud yn y darlun. Er bod cyllid llywodraeth leol wedi'i ddatganoli a bod y dreth gyngor yn fater i awdurdodau lleol, mae rôl ac agwedd y Llywodraeth ganolog yn allweddol. Y peth arall sydd yn eisiau yn eich dadl yw rôl y Llywodraeth ganolog a'r Cynulliad, yn yr

public services locally.

If you look at the way in which things are going within communities, we understand that, with an ageing population and more complicated demands on public services, people have to pay more money, but certainly Government has made a huge commitment to public expenditure in these areas. Across the piece, if you look at the money that we are now putting into public services, through the NHS, the local government settlement and a range of grants, the budget has grown enormously. That gives a better quality of life and makes us more able to deal with those factors that we know we need to come face to face with, such as the demands on social care. You need to recognise that, and, personally, I am proud of that. Increasing public expenditure and delivering, particularly for the most vulnerable people in our communities, is an important agenda in Wales. As I say, we have put money in a whole range of areas, not just the revenue settlement grant.

I would say that there has been a determined effort. Last year, I set the principles and I think that showed leadership from the Assembly Government, which was important. I know that it was appreciated by council tax payers, because we had to break the expectation in a small area of local government—it was not completely across local government—that there could be continued volatility in council tax levels. People found it very hard to plan their budgets and household expenditure when they did not know what levels of council tax they would have to deal with. There is a huge degree of realism among everyone that unreasonable, extended growth in council tax levels is not publicly acceptable. That has been reflected in the discussions that I have had with local government this year.

On your fundamental point about where the balance of funding should lie, which was the core of Michael Lyons's original brief, I am a great believer in the role of local government. Clearly, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is too, and that has been

ystyr ein bod wedi mynd ati i gynyddu darpariaeth gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn lleol.

Os edrychwch sut y mae pethau'n gweithio yn y cymunedau, yr ydym yn deall, gyda phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio a gofynion mwy cymhleth ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus, fod rhaid i bobl dalu mwy o arian, ond yn sicr mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud ymrwymiad enfawr i wariant cyhoeddus yn y meysydd hyn. Yn gyffredinol, ac ystyried yr arian yr ydym yn ei roddi i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, drwy'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, setliad llywodraeth leol ac amrywiol grantiau, mae'r gyllideb wedi tyfu'n aruthrol. Mae hynny'n sicrhau gwell ansawdd bywyd ac mae'n golygu ein bod yn fwy abl i ddelio â'r ffactorau hynny y gwyddom fod rhaid inni eu hwynebu, megis y galw am ofal cymdeithasol. Mae'n rhaid ichi gydnabod hynny, ac yn bersonol, yr wyf yn falch o hynny. Mae cynyddu gwariant cyhoeddus a chyflawni, yn enwedig o ran y bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau, yn agenda bwysig yng Nghymru. Fel yr wyf yn dweud, rhesom arian i amrywiol feysydd, ac nid i'r grant setliad refeniw'n unig.

Byddwn yn dweud bod ymdrech benderfynol wedi bod. Y llynedd, gosodais yr egwyddorion a chredaf i hynny ddangos arweiniad ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr oedd hynny'n bwysig. Gwn fod talwyr y dreth gyngor wedi gwerthfawrogi hynny, am inni orfod chwalu'r disgwyliadau mewn maes bach o lywodraeth leol—nid oedd yn ymwneud â llywodraeth leol i gyd—y gallai anwadalwch fynd rhagddo'n barhaus yn lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Roedd yn anodd i bobl gynllunio eu cyllidebau a gwariant yr aelwyd heb wybod beth fyddai lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Mae pawb yn deall yn dda iawn nad yw twf afresymol, estynedig yn y dreth gyngor yn dderbyniol gan y cyhoedd. Mae hynny wedi cael ei adlewyrchu yn y trafodaethau yr wyf wedi eu cynnal gyda llywodraeth leol eleni.

Ynghylch eich pwynt sylfaenol ynglŷn â ble y dylai cydbwysedd y cyllid fod, sef craidd briff gwreiddiol Michael Lyons, yr wyf yn gredwr mawr yn rôl llywodraeth leol. Felly hefyd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn hollol amlwg, ac mae hynny

reflected in many of our policies. I am also a great believer in the fact that if agreements are made nationally, in terms of pay agreements, of which the workload agreement was one, that money should be passed on to the local authorities. That has been done—100 per cent of payments have been passed down. We wait to see the outcome of Michael Lyons's report, but we have made it clear, as you know, in our report to him, which was discussed at committee last week, what the principles are and what the ethos is behind our relationship between local government and central Government.

You and I were both councillors at the same time at Cardiff council, and I think that both you and I have a strong belief in local democracy, and I know that that holds true for many Members here, across the political parties. Our backgrounds are in local government and we understand how important it is. What we have now, which is extremely useful for the people of Wales, is a much greater understanding of that relationship between local government and central Government and how we can work it out for the benefit of Wales, how we can match the money together and match the policies, so that, at the end of the day, those public services, which matter so much to people, are delivered seamlessly and give people value for money.

John Griffiths: Important principles are involved here in striking the balance between respecting local democracy and accountability, and placing some limitation on the ability of local authorities to raise council tax levels. In supporting your policy, Sue, I will just say that, within that balance, it is vital that local authorities can make decisions on the level of services that they wish to provide and that they then can raise the funds to provide those services. There must also be flexibility in the Assembly Government's approach that takes account of low levels of council tax and low historical levels of spend. I believe that that is what you have done in coming forward with this statement, and I hope that we continue with that approach.

Sue Essex: We have some degree of

wedi ei adlewyrchu mewn llawer o'n polisiau. Credaf yn gryf hefyd os gwneir cytundebau cenedlaethol, o ran cytundebau ynglŷn â thâl, y cytundeb llwyth gwaith yn eu plith, y dylid trosglwyddo'r arian i'r awdurdodau lleol. Dyna a wnaethpwyd—mae 100 y cant o'r taliadau wedi eu pasio ymlaen. Arhoswn i weld canlyniadau adroddiad Michael Lyons, ond yr ydym wedi ei gwneud yn glir, fel y gwyddoch, yn ein hadroddiad iddo, a drafodwyd yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, beth yw'r egwyddorion a beth yw ethos ein perthynas rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r Llywodraeth ganolog.

Yr oeddech chi a minnau'n gynghorwyr yn yr un cyfnod yng nghyngor Caerdydd, a chredaf fod gennych chi a minnau ein dau ffydd gref mewn democratiaeth leol, a gwn fod yr un peth yn wir am lawer o'r Aelodau sydd yma, ar draws y pleidiau gwleidyddol. Llywodraeth leol oedd ein cefndir ac yr ydym yn deall pa mor bwysig ydyw. Yr hyn sydd gennym yn awr, sy'n ddefnyddiol iawn i bobl Cymru, yw dealltwriaeth well o lawer o'r berthynas honno rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth ganolog a sut y medrwn weithio er lles Cymru, sut y medrwn roi'r arian ynghyd a rhoi'r polisiau ynghyd, fel y caiff y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hynny, sydd mor bwysig i bobl, eu cyflwyno'n llyfn gan roi gwerth am arian i bobl yn y pen draw.

John Griffiths: Mae egwyddorion pwysig ar waith yn hyn o beth o ran sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng parchu democratiaeth ac atebolrwydd lleol, a chyfyngu peth ar allu awdurdodau lleol i gynyddu lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Wrth gefnogi eich polisi, Sue, hoffwn ddweud, o fewn y cydbwysedd hwnnw, ei bod yn allweddol bod awdurdodau lleol yn gallu gwneud penderfyniadau ynglŷn â lefel y gwasanaethau yr hoffent eu darparu a'u bod wedyn yn gallu codi'r cyllid i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Hefyd mae'n rhaid sicrhau peth hyblygrwydd yn null gweithredu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n rhoi cyfrif am lefelau isel o dreth gyngor a lefelau gwariant hanesyddol isel. Credaf ichi wneud hynny wrth gyflwyno'r datganiad hwn, a gobeithiaf y medrwn barhau â'r dull hwnnw.

Sue Essex: Mae peth amrywiaeth, o 2.1 y

variation, from 2.1 per cent in Denbighshire, which is at the lowest level, to 5.5 per cent in the Vale of Glamorgan. I had discussions with both authorities and felt that it was perfectly fair and proper to respect that differential. I know that in Newport, which is below the standard spending assessment, there is a wish to move up the chain, as it were, in a moderated and reasonable way. That is the level of discussion that we are now at; we are not at loggerheads. The formula and everything else that is done to arrive at the revenue support grant is done extremely openly. The expenditure and the distribution groups involve the range of parties, and are across local government and other sectors. When we make the final decisions, everyone who needs to have been involved has been involved. That is the mature way in which we progress. It is not surprising that, at the end of that, we get a set of figures that everyone feels that they can live with.

4.20 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

1.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006 on the draft Brucellosis (Wales) Order 2006; and

1.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Brwselosis (Cymru) 2006; a

b) approves that the Brucellosis (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Brwselosis (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

(i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006;

(i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006;

- | | |
|---|---|
| <i>(ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2006; and</i> | <i>(ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2006; a</i> |
| <i>(iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006;</i> | <i>(iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006;</i> |
| <i>2.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006 on the draft the Enzootic Bovine Leukosis (Wales) Order 2006; and</i> | <i>2.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Lewcosis Buchol Ensootig (Cymru) 2006; a</i> |
| <i>b) approves that the Enzootic Bovine Leukosis (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:</i> | <i>b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Lewcosis Buchol Ensootig (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:</i> |
| <i>(i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006;</i> | <i>(i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006;</i> |
| <i>(ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2006; and</i> | <i>(ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2006; a</i> |
| <i>(iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006;</i> | <i>(iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006;</i> |
| <i>3.a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006 on the draft the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order 2006; and</i> | <i>3.a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2006; a</i> |
| <i>b) approves that the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 6) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 28 February 2006. (NDM2924)</i> | <i>b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 6) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2924)</i> |

*Cynnig (NDM2924): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2924): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 2 a Rheol
 Sefydlog Rhif 24.25
 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 25 Section 2 and No. 24.25**

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn. **The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25 and Standing Order No. 25 section 2:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25 adran 2:

1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006 on the draft the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 7) (Wales) Order 2006; and

1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2006; a

2) *approves that the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 7) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 28 February 2006. (NDM2925)*

2) *yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 7) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2925)*

*Cynnig (NDM2925): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2925): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 25 Adran 3
Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 25 Section 3**

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25.13:

approves the draft the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006; and notes the explanatory memorandum for this Order laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006. (NDM2926)

These regulations simply update the Pesticides (Maximum Residue Levels in Crops, Food and Feeding Stuffs) (England and Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005. They are updated on a regular basis, and I hope that they are reasonably uncontentious in their nature.

Y Llywydd: Mae'n ymddangos eu bod felly, Weinidog, oherwydd nid oes neb am siarad arnynt.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog 25.13:

yn cymeradwyo'r Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Lefelau Gweddillion Uchaf mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006; ac yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2926)

Y cwbl y mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ei wneud yw diweddarau Rheoliadau Plaleiddiaid (Lefelau Gweddillion Uchaf mewn Cnydau, Bwydydd a Phorthiant) (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) 2005. Cânt eu diweddarau'n rheolaidd, a gobeithiaf eu bod yn weddol annadleuol eu natur.

The Presiding Officer: It appears that they are, Minister, because no-one wishes to speak to them.

*Cynnig (NDM2926): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2926): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Staffio Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Staffing of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes:** Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Staffing of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2006. (NDM2927)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Staffio Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2927)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Staffing of Maintained Schools (Wales)

1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Staffio Ysgolion a Gynhelir

Regulations 2006; and

(Cymru) 2006; a

2) approves that the draft the Staffing of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

2) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau draft, Rheoliadau Staffio Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

(a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2006; and

(a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2006; a

(b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006; and

(b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006; ac

(c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2006. (NDM2928)

(c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2928)

These distinctive Welsh regulations provide a new framework for governing bodies to discharge their functions and responsibility for the appointment, conduct and discipline, including staff grievance and capabilities, suspension and dismissal, of staff in maintained schools. Much of the new regulations replicates the current provisions in the schedules to the Teaching and Higher Education Act 1998, but the distinctive Welsh agenda is supported by two new provisions requiring governing bodies to appoint an independent investigator and to appoint an independent non-governor member with voting rights on the staff disciplinary committee and the staff disciplinary appeal committee when dealing with allegations against staff involving child protection issues. That has also been included in these regulations, which form part of the Assembly Government's response to the recommendation of the Children's Commissioner for Wales's Clywch inquiry report.

Mae'r rheoliadau Cymreig neilltuol hyn yn cynnig fframwaith newydd i gyrff llywodraethu gyflawni'r swyddogaethau a'r cyfrifoldebau sydd ganddynt ar gyfer penodi, ymddygiad a disgyblu, gan gynnwys cwynion a gallu'r staff, atal a diswyddo staff mewn ysgolion a gynhelir. Mae llawer o'r rheoliadau newydd yn ailadrodd darpariaethau cyfredol atodlenni Deddf Addysgu ac Addysg Uwch 1998, ond ategir yr agenda Gymreig neilltuol gan ddwy ddarpariaeth newydd sy'n mynnu bod cyrff llywodraethu yn penodi ymchwilydd annibynnol ac yn penodi aelod annibynnol nad yw'n llywodraethwr gyda hawliau pleidleisio ar bwyllgor disgyblu'r staff ac ar bwyllgor apeliadau disgyblu'r staff wrth ddelio â honiadau yn erbyn y staff sy'n ymwneud â materion amddiffyn plant. Mae hynny wedi ei gynnwys yn y rheoliadau hyn hefyd, ac mae'n rhan o ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i argymhelliad Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn adroddiad ymchwiliad Clywch.

Governing bodies will be able to fulfil the requirement for independent investigation by using the Assembly-funded service, which will be in place by the time that the new requirement comes into force in September. The requirement to appoint a non-governor member with voting rights will commence on 1 April, the date that these regulations are due to come into force. I expect to issue guidance to governing bodies on the staffing regulations, including the appointment of suitable independent members to the staff disciplinary committee and staff disciplinary appeals committee, shortly. I invite Members

Bydd cyrff llywodraethu yn gallu cyflawni'r rheidrwydd i gynnal ymchwiliad annibynnol drwy ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth a gyllidir gan y Cynulliad, a fydd ar waith erbyn y daw'r rheidrwydd newydd i rym ym mis Medi. Bydd y rheidrwydd i benodi aelod nad yw'n llywodraethwr gyda hawliau pleidleisio'n dechrau ar 1 Ebrill, sef y dyddiad y disgwylir i'r rheoliadau hyn ddod i rym. Disgwyliaf gyhoeddi cyfarwyddyd i gyrff llywodraethu ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau staffio, gan gynnwys penodi aelodau annibynnol addas i bwyllgor disgyblu'r staff a phwyllgor apeliadau disgyblu'r staff, maes o law. Yr wyf yn gofyn

to approve the regulations.

Janet Ryder: Plaid Cymru will be supporting these regulations. As you say, they are in response to the 'Clywch' recommendations and we have been waiting some considerable time to see these enacted. Will you confirm that the independent members who are going to be invited to sit on governing bodies will be seen as totally independent of the governing body itself? How many individuals have you recruited to this scheme, and how will schools be notified of their availability and how to contact them? What will be the mechanism for that? Will it be according to need, or will schools be allocated a person who is responsible for their school as when the need arises?

William Graham: I welcome these measures, as outlined in the children's commissioner's report for the Clywch inquiry, particularly the recommendation for the governing body to appoint the independent investigator. As Janet Ryder said, the full implications of this must be properly spelled out to schools and, in particular, to staff, who may, at some time, be under investigation.

We also welcome the specifications on the selection and appointment procedures for heads and deputy heads of voluntary aided schools, together with the role and function of the diocesan officer with regard to their duties, which is usually the responsibility of the local education authority chief education officer.

Jane Davidson: We have explored these regulations in detail, through consultation and in committee. As I said in my introduction, the requirement to appoint the non-governor member with voting rights commences on 1 April, and the requirement for the investigation service commences in September. When the appropriate people have been appointed through the investigation service, we will report back to committee.

i'r Aelodau gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

Janet Ryder: Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Fel y dywedwch, ymateb y maent i argymhellion 'Clywch' a buom yn aros am amser maith i weld deddfu ynghylch y rheini. A wnewch gadarnhau yr ystyrir yr aelodau annibynnol a wahoddir i eistedd ar y cyrff llywodraethu yn hollol annibynnol ar y corff llywodraethu ei hun? Faint o unigolion yr ydych wedi eu recriwtio i'r cynllun hwn, a sut y caiff yr ysgolion eu hysbysu eu bod ar gael a sut y mae cysylltu â hwy? Ym mha fodd y gwneir hynny? A gaiff ei wneud yn ôl yr angen, neu a gaiff rhywun ei glustnodi ar gyfer ysgol a fydd yn gyfrifol am yr ysgol fel y bo angen?

William Graham: Croesawaf y mesurau hyn, fel y'u hamlinellir yn adroddiad y comisiynydd plant ar gyfer ymchwiliad Clywch, yn enwedig yr argymhelliad i'r corff llywodraethu benodi ymchwilydd annibynnol. Ys dywedodd Janet Ryder, mae'n rhaid cyflwyno goblygiadau hyn yn llawn i'r ysgolion ac yn arbennig felly, i'r staff, a allai fod yn destun ymchwiliad ar ryw adeg.

Croesawn hefyd fanylion y gweithdrefnau sy'n ymwneud â dewis a phenodi penaethiaid a dirprwy benaethiaid ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynhelir, ynghyd â rôl a swyddogaeth y swyddog esgobaethol o ran eu dyletswyddau, sydd fel arfer yn gyfrifoldeb i brif swyddog addysg yr awdurdod addysg lleol.

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi archwilio'r rheoliadau hyn yn fanwl, drwy ymgynghori ac yn y pwyllgor. Fel y dywedais yn fy nghyflwyniad, bydd y rheidrwydd i benodi'r aelod nad yw'n llywodraethwr gyda hawliau pleidleisio'n dechrau ar 1 Ebrill, a bydd y rheidrwydd yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth ymchwilio'n dechrau ym mis Medi. Pan fydd y bobl briodol wedi eu penodi drwy'r gwasanaeth ymchwilio, byddwn yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y pwyllgor.

*Cynnig (NDM2927): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2927): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2928): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2928): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick

Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 a Darpariaethau
Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006**
**Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 9 and Transitional
Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006**

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol **The Minister for Education and Lifelong
Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod **Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf *considers the principle of the Education Act*

Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2929)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006; a

2) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 9 a Darpariaethau Trosiannol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

(a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006; a

(b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2930)

Y Llywydd: Gwelaf nad oes neb am siarad ar yr eitem hon, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

2002 (Commencement No. 9 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 14 February 2006. (NDM2929)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 9 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006; and

2) approves that the draft the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 9 and Transitional Provisions) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

(a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006; and

(b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2006. (NDM2930)

The Presiding Officer: I see that no-one wishes to speak on this item, therefore we will move to the votes.

*Cynnig (NDM2929): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2929): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2930): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2930): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Addysg Sengl (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Single Education Plan (Wales) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Single Education Plan (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 14 February 2006. (NDM2931)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Addysg Sengl (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2931)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006 in relation to the draft the Single Education Plan (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Addysg Sengl (Cymru) 2006; a

2) approves that the draft the Single Education Plan (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

2) yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Cynllun Addysg Sengl (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

(a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 14

(a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa

February 2006; and

(b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 16 February 2006. (NDM2932)

These regulations take forward the Assembly Government's commitment to move to a more coherent policy and planning framework for local authorities. As a result, in conjunction with local authority partners, we have consulted on a much reduced framework of required strategies. One of these will be a children and young people's plan, which is a joint three-year strategic plan for local authorities and partner agencies that will set out the overall approach to all services for children and young people, including education. The intention is for these plans to be in place from 2008. However, in the interim, and as a stage in the process of moving to the new children and young people's plans, the requirement for the four main education plans—namely education and strategic plans, school organisation plans, behaviour support plans, and the early years and childcare development plans—has been removed under the provisions of the Children Act 2004. These regulations require local authorities instead to prepare and publish a plan that sets out the authorities' strategy for discharging their education responsibilities for children and young people from 1 September 2006 to 31 September 2008.

Janet Ryder: Plaid Cymru will support these plans, as it makes sense to draw everything together into one education plan.

4.30 p.m.

Will the plans contain a question to parents to ascertain the demand in each area for Welsh-medium education? If so, is it intended that the data will be collected in time for the following September? What role does the Minister intend looked-after children to play in these plans? Will we be able to set specific targets for looked-after children to monitor their development far more easily through the single education plans?

Gyflwyno ar 14 Chwefror 2006; a

(b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2932)

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn hybu ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i lunio fframwaith polisi a chynllunio mwy cydlynol ar gyfer yr awdurdodau lleol. O ganlyniad, ar y cyd â'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n bartneriaid inni, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ynghylch fframwaith llawer yn llai o strategaethau angenrheidiol. Ymhlith y rhain bydd cynllun y plant a'r bobl ifanc, sy'n gyd-gynllun strategol tair blynedd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol a'r asiantaethau sy'n bartneriaid a fydd yn gosod dull cyffredinol ar gyfer holl wasanaethau'r plant a'r bobl ifanc, gan gynnwys addysg. Bwriedir i'r cynlluniau hyn fod ar waith o 2008 ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, ac fel cam yn y broses o symud tuag at gynlluniau newydd y plant a'r bobl ifanc, mae'r rheidrwydd yn ymwneud â'r pedwar prif gynllun addysg—sef y cynlluniau addysg a strategol, cynlluniau trefniadaeth yr ysgolion, y cynlluniau cymorth ymddygiad, a chynlluniau datblygu'r blynyddoedd cynnar a gofal plant—wedi ei ddiddymu dan ddarpariaethau Deddf Plant 2004. Yn lle'r rheini mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn mynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn paratoi ac yn cyhoeddi cynllun a fydd yn gosod strategaethau'r awdurdodau ar gyfer cyflawni'r cyfrifoldebau sydd ganddynt ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc o 1 Medi 2006 hyd 31 Medi 2008.

Janet Ryder: Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r cynlluniau hyn gan ei bod yn synhwyrol dwyn popeth ynghyd mewn un cynllun addysg.

A fydd y cynlluniau'n cynnwys cwestiwn i rieni i ganfod beth yw'r galw ym mhob ardal am addysg Gymraeg? Os felly, a fwriedir casglu'r data mewn pryd ar gyfer y Medi canlynol? Pa ran y bwriada'r Gweinidog i blant sy'n derbyn gofal chwarae yn y cynlluniau hyn? A fydd modd inni osod targedau penodol ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal er mwyn monitro'u datblygiad yn llawer haws drwy'r cynlluniau addysg sengl?

Peter Black: I also welcome this. It is always very helpful when the number of plans that local education authorities and local councils in general have to produce is reduced. In particular, the amalgamation of the plans and the emphasis on partnership is very important. We must be careful not to lose focus in relying on a partnership plan as opposed to an LEA plan, and ensure that the local education authority continues to retain a lead as part of that development.

I particularly welcome the Minister's intention to move towards three-year planning. Is this move a precursor towards three-year funding, which will be a very important development that we need to bring in as soon as possible? Not only do we need to fund education authorities on a three-year basis, I would also hope that it would lead to schools also being funded on a three-year basis. Will the Minister give an indication of whether the new planning process will be an early start of that, and when a three-year funding framework can be put in place as a result?

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am grateful for Members' support for this approach. In terms of the issue around Welsh-medium education, I have previously reported to committee that the regulations include a requirement for LEAs to report on the demand for Welsh-medium places. LEAs must assess demand in order to report on it effectively. We recommend in the guidance that LEAs should carry out surveys to fulfil that requirement, and have included a sample survey that could be used for this purpose. Your colleague, Owen John Thomas, welcomed that approach, and the Welsh Language Board contributed towards the design of the survey.

The targets on looked-after children, which we reported on in the last committee, are in relation to the policy agreements, but we have set up a taskforce of officials on a cross-departmental basis to look at ways in which we can support looked-after children further.

Peter, in response to the question about a

Peter Black: Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu hyn. Mae bob amser o gymorth mawr pan gwtogir nifer y cynlluniau y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau addysg lleol a chynghorau lleol yn gyffredinol eu cynhyrchu. Yn fwyaf arbennig, mae cyfuno'r cynlluniau a'r pwyslais ar bartneriaeth yn bwysig iawn. Rhaid gofalu peidio â cholli ffocws wrth ddibynnu ar gynllun partneriaeth yn hytrach na chynllun AALI, a sicrhau bod yr awdurdod addysg lleol yn dal i gadw rhan flaenllaw fel rhan o'r datblygiad hwnnw.

Croesawaf yn arbennig fwriad y Gweinidog i symud tuag at gynllunio tair blynedd. A yw'r symudiad hwn yn rhagflaenydd i ariannu tair blynedd, a fydd yn ddatblygiad pwysig iawn y mae angen inni ei gyflwyno cyn gynted ag y bo modd? Nid yn unig y mae angen ariannu awdurdodau addysg ar sail tair blynedd, gobeithio hefyd y byddai'n arwain at ariannu ysgolion hwythau ar sail tair blynedd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi amcan a fydd y broses gynllunio newydd yn gychwyn cynnar ar hynny, a pha bryd y gellir sefydlu fframwaith ariannu tair blynedd yn sgîl hynny?

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth yr Aelodau i'r cam hwn. O ran cwestiwn addysg Gymraeg, yr wyf wedi adrodd i'r pwyllgor o'r blaen fod y rheoliadau'n cynnwys gofyniad ar i AALLau adrodd ar y galw am leoedd cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rhaid i AALLau asesu'r galw er mwyn adrodd arno'n effeithiol. Argymhellwn yn y canllawiau y dylai AALLau wneud arolygon i gyflawni'r gofyniad hwnnw, ac yr ydym wedi cynnwys arolwg enghreifftiol y gellid ei ddefnyddio i'r diben hwn. Croesawodd eich cyd-Aelod, Owen John Thomas, y dull hwnnw o fynd ati, a chyfrannodd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg at gynllun yr arolwg.

Mae'r targedau ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal, y rhoesom adroddiad amdanynt yn y pwyllgor diwethaf, yn ymwneud â'r cytundebau polisi, ond yr ydym wedi sefydlu tasglu o swyddogion ar draws adrannau i edrych ar ffyrdd y gallwn roi mwy o gefnogaeth i blant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Peter, mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn am ariannu

three-year approach, we always look in the planning function to enable authorities to have sufficient time to plan and carry out their functions. However, as I have reported to committee previously, looking at the delivery of a three-year mechanism to schools will depend on the outcomes of the work that Sue Essex is leading on three-year budgeting to local authorities.

tair blynedd, wrth gynllunio byddwn bob amser yn ceisio sicrhau y caiff awdurdodau ddigon o amser i gynllunio a chyflawni eu swyddogaethau. Fodd bynnag, fel yr wyf wedi adrodd i'r pwyllgor o'r blaen, bydd y modd yr edrychwn ar roi mecanwaith tair blynedd i ysgolion yn dibynnu ar ganlyniadau'r gwaith y mae Sue Essex yn ei arwain ar gyllidebau tair blynedd i awdurdodau lleol.

*Cynnig (NDM2931): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2931): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2932): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2932): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989
(Dileu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989
(Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 6 March 2006. (NDM2933)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Dileu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2933)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006 in relation to the draft Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006 ynghylch drafft y Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Dileu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006; a

2) approves that the draft Care Standards Act 2000 and the Children Act 1989 (Abolition of Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006 be made in accordance with:

2) yn cymeradwyo bod drafft y Rheoliadau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 a Deddf Plant 1989 (Dileu Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

(a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 March 2006; and

(a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mawrth 2006; a

(b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 March 2006. (NDM2934)

(b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2934)

This statutory instrument will abolish all the remaining fees, worth approximately £2.1 million, paid by the social care and independent healthcare services regulated by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales and Healthcare Inspectorate Wales. Roughly a third of all services still pay fees at present, including children's homes, care homes for adults and domiciliary care agencies.

Bydd yr offeryn statudol hwn yn diddymu'r holl ffioedd sydd ar ôl, sef gwerth rhyw £2.1 miliwn, a delir gan y gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol a gofal iechyd annibynnol a reoleiddir gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ac Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru. Mae tua thraean yr holl wasanaethau'n dal i dalu ffioedd ar hyn o bryd, gan gynnwys cartrefi plant, cartrefi gofal i oedolion ac

Consequently, these regulations will be greatly welcomed by the sector.

Helen Mary Jones: The Plaid Cymru group will support these regulations, which seem eminently sensible, serving as they do to prevent the unnecessary recirculation of public money being passed from one public body to another. Has the Minister looked at any other examples in his portfolio where that may be happening and where we may be able to save on administrative costs? There is a costly interface between health and social services. I would not expect the Minister to comment on that today, but I urge him to look for further opportunities to avoid unnecessary recirculation.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I would be happy to agree to that.

asiantaethau gofal cartref. O ganlyniad, bydd croeso mawr i'r rheoliadau hyn gan y sector.

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd grŵp Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, sy'n ymddangos yn gwbl gall, a hwythau'n atal trosglwyddo arian cyhoeddus yn ddiangen o un corff cyhoeddus i un arall. A ydyw'r Gweinidog wedi edrych ar unrhyw enghreifftiau eraill yn ei bortffolio lle y gall hynny fod yn digwydd a lle y gallwn arbed costau gweinyddol? Mae rhyng-gysylltiad costus rhwng iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog roi sylwadau ar hynny heddiw, ond fe'i hanogaf i edrych am gyfleoedd pellach i osgoi ailgylchredeg diangen.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Byddwn yn fodlon cytuno i wneud hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM2933): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2933): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2934): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2934): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David

Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd, Bwrdd Iechyd
 Lleol Abertawe a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Fynwy (2006) o dan
 Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29
 Approval of Directions to Cardiff Local Health Board, Swansea Local Health
 Board and Monmouthshire Local Health Board (2006) under
 Standing Order No. 29**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):

considers the principle of the Directions to Cardiff Local Health Board, Swansea Local Health Board and Monmouthshire Local Health Board (2006), a draft of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 14 March 2006. (NDM2935)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii) approves the Directions to Cardiff Local Health Board, Swansea Local Health Board and Monmouthshire Local Health Board (2006) which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 14 March 2006. (NDM2936)

I am pleased to commend these directions to

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):

yn ystyried egwyddor y Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd, Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Fynwy (2006), y gosodwyd copi drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2935)

Cynigïaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii) yn cymeradwyo'r Cyfarwyddiadau i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd, Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Fynwy (2006) a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 14 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2936)

Yr wyf yn falch o gymeradwyo'r

the Assembly. They will enable local health boards to take responsibility for commissioning health services in public sector prisons in Wales with effect from April 2006. In April 2003, the Assembly Government took responsibility for the transfer of funding for commissioning these services in public sector prisons. It will mean that the services available in prisons will be of equal quality to those available to the general public. This will cost something of the order of £3.1 million.

Helen Mary Jones: I support these directions and urge the Minister, once they come into force, to look with local health boards at what can be done to provide more effective drug rehabilitation services in our prisons. I am sure that we would all agree that that is a major health need.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I would be happy to agree to that.

cyfarwyddiadau hyn i'r Cynulliad. Byddant yn galluogi byrddau iechyd lleol i gymryd cyfrifoldeb am gomisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd yng ngharchardai'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru o Ebrill 2006 ymlaen. Yn Ebrill 2003, cymerodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb am drosglwyddo cyllid ar gyfer comisiynu'r gwasanaethau hyn yng ngharchardai'r sector cyhoeddus. Bydd yn golygu y bydd y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael mewn carchardai o ansawdd cyfartal â'r rhai sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol. Bydd hyn yn costio tua £3.1 miliwn.

Helen Mary Jones: Cefnogaf y cyfarwyddiadau hyn ac anogaf y Gweinidog, wedi iddynt ddod i rym, i edrych gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol ar beth y gellir ei wneud i ddarparu gwasanaethau mwy effeithiol i ailsefydlu camddefnyddwyr cyffuriau yn ein carchardai. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunai pawb ohonom fod hynny'n angen mawr o safbwynt iechyd.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Byddwn yn fodlon cytuno i wneud hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM2935): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2935): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark

James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2936): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2936): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) Minority Party Debate (Liberal Democrat Party)

Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development

Motion (NDM2937): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. believes that sustainable development should be at the heart of Government actions, not simply words, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

(a) publish an annual index in the sustainable development report, measuring clearly economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions;

(b) implement a green jobs strategy, with clear and measurable targets for success, similar to that pursued in Scotland;

(c) develop and publish energy efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new sub-point after (c):

Cynnig (NDM2937): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn credu mai datblygu cynaliadwy ddylai fod wrth wraidd gweithredoedd y Llywodraeth, nid geiriau'n unig, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

(a) cyhoeddi mynegai blynyddol yn yr adroddiad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn mesur yn glir y twf economaidd yn erbyn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid;

(b) rhoi ar waith strategaeth werdd ar gyfer swyddi, gyda thargedau clir a mesuradwy ar gyfer llwyddiant, yn debyg i'r hyn sydd ar y gweill yn yr Alban;

(c) datblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl (c):

recognise that sustainable development will not be achieved without an integrated transport strategy not based on the predict-and-provide model.

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new sub-point after (c):

ensure that the planning regime does not allow new developments unless:

i) their effect on climate change has been assessed; and

ii) they incorporate renewable energy features

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new sub-point after (c):

establish a body independent of Government to set and monitor targets for the reduction of greenhouse gases in Wales.

Amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to seek the powers over building regulations in order to ensure that all new homes are built to the highest standards of energy efficiency.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Mick Bates: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. believes that sustainable development should be at the heart of Government actions, not simply words, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

(a) publish an annual index in the sustainable development report, measuring clearly economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions;

(b) implement a green jobs strategy, with

cydnabod na chyflawnir datblygu cynaliadwy heb strategaeth drafnidiaeth integredig nad yw'n seiliedig ar y model rhagweld a darparu.

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl (c):

sicrhau nad yw'r gyfundrefn gynllunio yn caniatáu datblygiadau newydd onid yw:

i) eu heffaith ar newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi'i hasesu; a

ii) yn ymgorffori nodweddion ynni adnewyddadwy.

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl (c):

sefydlu corff sy'n annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth i bennu a monitro targedau ar gyfer lleihau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru.

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i geisio cael y pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladu er mwyn sicrhau bod pob cartref newydd yn cael ei adeiladu i'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Mick Bates: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn credu y dylai datblygu cynaliadwy fod wrth wraidd gweithredoedd y Llywodraeth, nid geiriau'n unig, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

(a) cyhoeddi mynegai blynyddol yn yr adroddiad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn mesur yn glir y twf economaidd yn erbyn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid;

(b) rhoi ar waith strategaeth werdd ar gyfer

clear and measurable targets for success, similar to that pursued in Scotland;

(c) develop and publish energy efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales. (NDM2937)

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to seek the powers over building regulations in order to ensure that all new homes are built to the highest standards of energy efficiency.

I am pleased to accept the amendments tabled by Plaid, and I offer the Labour Party the opportunity to vote in favour of our amendment 4.

The Assembly has a statutory duty to consider sustainable development in all that it does. We have a scheme, an action plan and annual reports that are debated in our Plenary sessions, but have these all been simply words and empty rhetoric? Has the Assembly's focus on, and commitment to, sustainable development made a real difference? Has there been measurable progress? Could more be done? Many officials have worked extremely hard to produce the action plan and the scheme, and I do not detract from their efforts.

4.40 p.m.

It is difficult to measure progress in sustainable development, because there is a need for a headline indicator that can be easily understood. An array of indicators might give a complex and complete understanding, but it does not provide an easily recognisable measurement or help to force the pace of change. A complex array of indicators dilutes the measurement of progress and, therefore, dilutes the pressure within the Assembly for progress.

I contrast that with the work in Scotland and the leadership provided by the Scottish Executive. In Scotland, the Government

swyddi, gyda thargedau clir a mesuradwy ar gyfer llwyddiant, yn debyg i'r hyn sydd ar y gweill yn yr Alban;

(c) datblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. (NDM2937)

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i geisio cael y pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladu er mwyn sicrhau bod pob cartref newydd yn cael ei adeiladu i'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Yr wyf yn falch o dderbyn y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y Blaid, a chynigiaf gyfle i'r Blaid Lafur bleidleisio o blaid ein gwelliant 4.

Mae gan y Cynulliad ddyletswydd statudol i ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy ym mhopeth a wna. Mae gennym gynllun, cynllun gweithredu ac adroddiadau blynyddol y cynhelir dadl arnynt yn ein Cyfarfodydd Llawn, ond ai dim ond geiriau a rhyethreg wag fu hyn i gyd? A ydyw ffocws y Cynulliad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a'i ymrwymiad iddo, wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth mewn gwirionedd? A symudwyd ymlaen mewn modd mesuradwy? A ellid gwneud rhagor? Mae llawer o swyddogion wedi gweithio'n eithriadol o galed i lunio'r cynllun gweithredu a'r cynllun, ac nid wyf yn bychanu eu hymdrechion.

Mae'n anodd mesur cynnydd mewn datblygu cynaliadwy, oherwydd y mae angen prif ddangosydd y gellir ei ddeall yn hawdd. Gallai amrediad o ddangosyddion roi dealltwriaeth gymhleth a chyflawn, ond nid yw'n rhoi mesuriad hawdd ymgyfarwyddo ag ef nac yn helpu i fwrw ati â'r newid. Mae amrediad cymhleth o ddangosyddion yn glastwreiddio'r broses o fesur cynnydd ac, felly, yn glastwreiddio'r pwysau o fewn y Cynulliad dros gynnydd.

Cyferbynnaf hynny â'r gwaith yn yr Alban a'r arweiniad a roddir gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban. Yn yr Alban, mae'r Llywodraeth yn

publishes an annual index measuring economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions. The index divides carbon dioxide emissions, as the equivalent mass of carbon in megatonnes, by the total gross value added for Scotland. The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that the Assembly Government should publish such an indicator for Wales.

If you look at the various indicators for Wales—the original indicators, the high-level summary indicators or the new framework indicators—you will see that none of them plots an economic indicator directly against an environmental indicator; they are all uncombined. None of these indicators attempts to bring together the two sides of sustainable development as one, as the Scottish indicator does. The Scottish Executive is clear on the relevance of this indicator, and its document states the need for a headline indicator to show decoupling.

‘Delivering a sustainable economy means decoupling growth from environmental pressure’.

I know that some people will see many difficulties in having a single indicator. Gross domestic product, for example, was not perfect; GVA is another attempt to refine a single, easily understandable measurement. However, we need this simple indicator so that we can scrutinise any Government’s progress towards achieving sustainable development.

I would question the Government’s ambition. I have long promoted, as have many others in the Chamber, the concept of the single, simple sustainable development indicator, and I question the Government’s lack of ambition in producing this indicator, which would force progress towards sustainable development and, as I have often heard from many Ministers here, showcase Wales as a leader in sustainable development. It seems to me that you prefer to stick to sustainable rhetoric, Minister.

cyhoeddi mynegai blynyddol yn mesur twf economaidd yn erbyn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Mae’r mynegai’n rhannu gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, ar ffurf y màs cyfwerth o garbon mewn megatunelli, â chyfanswm y gwerth gros a ychwanegir i’r Alban. Cred Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyhoeddi dangosydd o’r fath i Gymru.

Os edrychwch ar yr amryfal ddangosyddion i Gymru—y dangosyddion gwreiddiol, y dangosyddion cryno lefel uchel neu’r dangosyddion fframwaith newydd—gwelwch nad oes yr un ohonynt yn plotio dangosydd economaidd yn uniongyrchol yn erbyn dangosydd amgylcheddol; maent i gyd yn anghyfunedig. Nid oes yr un o’r dangosyddion hyn yn ceisio dwyn ynghyd ddwy ochr datblygu cynaliadwy fel un, fel y gwna dangosydd yr Alban. Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn glir ynghylch perthnasedd y dangosydd hwn, ac mae ei dogfen yn datgan yr angen am brif ddangosydd i ddangos datgysylltiad.

Mae sicrhau economi gynaliadwy’n golygu datgysylltu twf oddi wrth bwysau amgylcheddol.

Gwn y bydd rhai pobl yn gweld llawer o anawsterau o gael un dangosydd. Nid oedd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, er enghraifft, yn berffaith; mae gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn ymgais arall i fireinio un mesuriad hawdd ei ddeall. Fodd bynnag, mae angen y dangosydd syml hwn fel y gallwn graffu ar gynnydd unrhyw Lywodraeth tuag at gyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy.

Yr wyf yn amau uchelgais y Llywodraeth. Yr wyf ers tro yn hyrwyddo, fel llawer o rai eraill yn y Siambr, y cysyniad o un dangosydd datblygu cynaliadwy syml, a chwestiynaf ddiffyg uchelgais y Llywodraeth i gynhyrchu’r dangosydd hwn, a fyddai’n gwthio pethau ymlaen tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac, fel y clywais yn aml gan lawer o Weinidogion yma, yn rhoi llwyfan i Gymru fel arweinydd ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae’n ymddangos i mi fod yn well gennych lynu at rethreg gynaliadwy, Weinidog.

All right, there is currently a lack of power in some areas and my colleagues will deal with that, particularly in terms of building regulations and energy efficiency. I am sure that we all hope that, eventually, we will get to have those powers that will make the Assembly far more proactive in energy efficiency. However, I also believe that this Government lacks the vision to ensure that this motion is carried forward and that Wales becomes a leader in sustainable development. For example, we need vision in developing green industries and a green jobs strategy to push forward the sustainable development agenda and we need to help businesses to embrace this agenda and seize the opportunities that it provides. There are opportunities in the renewable energy and recycling sectors and in improved energy efficiency. Waste policies can also bring economic development. They are tangible and bring considerable benefits to businesses through cost savings.

As we know, vision without action is a daydream and, yes, there are daydreamers on the Government frontbench. Dream on, for example, if you think that the delivery of health in Wales is improving or that the incidence of child poverty has been reduced. Mind you, action without vision is a nightmare and there are those on the Government frontbenches who have suffered nightmares. Who would have thought that such a simple issue as school breakfasts would turn out to be a nightmare?

Jeff Cuthbert: Only for you.

Mick Bates: Some people over there are already saying, 'Mick, this is you daydreaming; you will never achieve these things in Wales for the people of Wales'. However, you are wrong. There are examples throughout Europe of areas and countries that have developed true sustainable development through their economies. Upper Austria is one example; it has developed there because the political will exists. Upper Austria is considered to be the most exemplary sustainable energy region in Europe. There, they develop biomass, hydro energy and solar thermal energy, and they have turned their commitment and political leadership into a vehicle for economic gain. Biomass is

lawn, mae diffyg grym ar hyn o bryd mewn rhai meysydd a gwnaiff fy nghyd-Aelodau ddelio â hynny, yn enwedig o ran rheoliadau adeiladu ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod ni i gyd yn gobeithio y cawn, yn y pen draw, y grymoedd hynny a fydd yn peri bod y Cynulliad yn llawer mwy rhagweithiol ym maes effeithlonrwydd ynni. Fodd bynnag, credaf hefyd nad oes gan y Llywodraeth hon y weledigaeth i sicrhau y caiff y cynnig hwn ei weithredu fel bod Cymru yn arweinydd ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy. Er enghraifft, mae angen gweledigaeth o ran datblygu diwydiannau gwyrdd a strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd i fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda datblygu cynaliadwy ac mae angen helpu busnesau i goleddu'r agenda hon a bachu'r cyfleoedd a gynigia. Mae cyfleoedd yn y sectorau ynni adnewyddadwy ac ailgylchu ac mewn gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni. Gall polisïau gwastraff beri datblygu economaidd hefyd. Maent yn ddiriaethol a deuant â manteision sylweddol i fusnesau drwy arbedion o ran costau.

Fel y gwyddom, breuddwyd gwrach yw gweledigaeth heb weithredu ac oes, mae breuddwydwyr ar fainc flaen y Llywodraeth. Daliwch i freuddwydio, er enghraifft, os ydych yn meddwl y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n gwella neu fod llai o dlodi ymysg plant. Cofiwch chi, mae gweithredu heb weledigaeth yn hunllef ac mae rhai ar feinciau blaen y Llywodraeth wedi dioddef hunllefau. Pwy fyddai wedi meddwl y byddai mater mor syml â brecwast mewn ysgolion yn troi'n hunllef?

Jeff Cuthbert: Dim ond i chi.

Mick Bates: Mae rhai pobl yn y fan acw yn dweud yn barod, 'Mick, dyma chi'n breuddwydio; ni wnewch byth gyflawni'r pethau hyn yng Nghymru dros bobl Cymru'. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn anghywir. Ceir enghreifftiau drwy Ewrop gyfan o ardaloedd a gwledydd sydd wedi sicrhau datblygu gwir gynaliadwy drwy eu heconomi. Mae Awstria uchaf yn un enghraifft; mae wedi datblygu yno oherwydd bod yr ewyllys gwleidyddol yno. Bernir mai Awstria uchaf yw'r rhanbarth mwyaf rhagorol yn Ewrop o ran ynni cynaliadwy. Yno, maent yn datblygu bio-màs, ynni dŵr ac ynni'r haul, ac maent wedi troi eu hymrwymiad a'u harweiniad gwleidyddol yn gyfrwng i sicrhau cynnydd

playing, and has played since 1994, an integral role in upper Austria's energy policy. It currently accounts for 14 per cent of its energy consumption. There are now 9,000 biomass installations and 250 district heating plans. The message is clear; if the political will is there, sustainable development can become a reality. The regional investment generated from this amounts to €60 million, and this has improved energy security.

economiaidd. Mae bio-màs wedi chwarae rhan ganolog ym mholisi ynni Awstria uchaf ers 1994. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n darparu 14 y cant o'r ynni y mae'n ei ddefnyddio. Bellach ceir 9,000 o weithfeydd bio-màs a 250 o gynlluniau gwresogi ardal. Mae'r neges yn glir: os oes ewyllys gwleidyddol, gellir cael datblygu cynaliadwy. Cafwyd €60 miliwn o fuddsoddiad rhanbarthol o ganlyniad i hyn, ac mae wedi rhoi mwy o sicrwydd o ran cyflenwadau ynni.

*Daeth Rhodri Glyn Thomas i'r Gadair am 4.48 p.m.
Rhodri Glyn Thomas took the Chair at 4.48 p.m.*

Let us contrast this with our nightmare in terms of planning for renewable energy, namely technical advice note 8, around which many people, including me, built great expectations. If ever vision and action needed to come together, it was in this regard. We needed a renewable energy policy that offered the chance to meet international carbon dioxide reduction targets and to create thousands of jobs. We all know the story. We ended up with one solution, which was large onshore wind developments.

Gadewch inni gymharu hynny â'r dryswch sydd gennym ni o ran cynllunio ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, sef nodyn cyngor technegol 8, yr oedd llawer o bobl, a minnau yn eu plith, yn disgwyl llawer ganddo. Os cafwyd enghraifft erioed lle'r oedd angen cyfuno gweledigaeth a gweithredu, yr oedd angen hynny yn hyn o beth. Yr oedd arnom angen polisi ynni adnewyddadwy a oedd yn cynnig cyfle i gyrraedd targedau rhyngwladol ar ostwng gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid a chreu miloedd o swyddi. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod yr hanes. Un ateb a oedd gennym yn y diwedd, sef datblygiadau ynni gwynt mawr ar y tir.

Glyn Davies *rose*—

Glyn Davies *a gododd*—

Mick Bates: I wish to finish this point.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn dymuno gorffen y pwynt hwn.

This solution seems even more naïve when many of us explained to the Government that these turbines would be built in places that did not have grid connections. Unbelievably, in mid Wales, particularly in my constituency of Montgomeryshire, we are supposed to use 500 MW of electricity from renewable sources—remember that the target for the whole of Wales is 800 MW—but there is no way of getting the electricity there.

Mae'r ateb hwn yn ymddangos yn fwy naif byth o gofio bod llawer ohonom wedi esbonio i'r Llywodraeth y câi'r tyrbinau hyn eu codi mewn mannau a oedd heb gysylltiad â'r grid. Yr hyn sydd yn anhygoel yw ein bod ni yn y canolbarth, ac yn fy etholaeth i, sir Drefaldwyn, yn benodol, i fod i ddefnyddio 500 MW o drydan o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy—cofiwch mai'r targed ar gyfer Cymru gyfan yw 800 MW—ond nid oes dim modd mynd â'r trydan yno.

Glyn Davies: You have agreed with my assessment of TAN 8 in the past, namely that it is a poor document that should be withdrawn and redrafted, simply because of its focus on one energy source. Do you agree that it is so defective that it should be withdrawn and redrafted in a more complete

Glyn Davies: Yr ydych wedi cyd-fynd â'm hasesiad o TAN 8 yn y gorffennol, sef ei bod yn ddogfen wael a ddylai gael ei thynnu'n ôl a'i hailddrafftio, am y rheswm am ei bod yn canolbwyntio ar un ffynhonnell ynni. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod mor ddiffygiol fel y dylid ei thynnu'n ôl a'i hailddrafftio'n fwy

and sensible way?

Mick Bates: I agree entirely with your assessment of TAN 8. One of the difficulties is that TAN 8 was not a single-issue document; it was written to cover the development of all renewable energy. My criticism is that we have not been able in Wales to develop policies that actually achieve the outcomes that upper Austria has achieved.

I see the Minister for the Environment, Planning and Countryside laughing to himself in response to these statements. I am sure that he is saying to himself, 'We can build all these turbines'. If you think that planning for large onshore windfarms is difficult, Minister, you wait until you have to build those grid towers through beautiful places such as Dolanog, or even through a national park. Where is the grid that can take 800 MW? It is in south Wales. Labour Assembly Members know what this is about in terms of making you push this into mid Wales.

Time moves on, and we need to see some changes to ensure that we achieve what we all wish to see, namely Wales becoming a showcase for sustainable development. As a party, we have always focused on the development of offshore windfarms. One reason for that is that, as technology moves on, it will become physically impossible to build onshore turbines because the blades will be so big as people demand increasingly larger turbines. We also have what is called an ecological budget, which includes three indicators relating to carbon dioxide emissions, a material flow analysis and an ecological footprint. These are the things that we should be considering in order to move forward. I hope that the Government will support our motion today.

4.50 p.m.

Y peth pwysicaf sydd angen i'r Llywodraeth ei wneud yw dangos heddiw ei bod yn deall yr angen i sicrhau cynnydd tuag at Gymru gynaliadwy. Yr unig ffordd o wneud hyn yw

trwyadl a synhwyrol?

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â'ch asesiad o TAN 8. Un o'r anawsterau oedd nad dogfen a oedd yn ymwneud ag un pwnc oedd TAN 8; fe'i hysgrifennwyd fel ei bod yn ymdrin â datblygu pob math o ynni adnewyddadwy. Y feirniadaeth sydd gennyf yw nad ydym wedi gallu datblygu polisiau yng Nghymru sydd yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau a gafodd Awstria uchaf.

Gwelaf fod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn chwerthin dan ei ddannedd mewn ymateb i'r datganiadau hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn dweud wrtho'i hun, 'Gallwn adeiladu'r holl dyrbinau hyn'. Os ydych yn credu ei bod yn anodd cynllunio ar gyfer ffermydd gwynt mawr ar y tir, Weinidog, arhoswch nes byddwch yn gorfod codi'r tyrau hynny ar gyfer y grid drwy leoedd prydferth fel Dolanog, neu hyd yn oed drwy barc cenedlaethol. Ym mhle y mae'r grid sydd yn gallu cymryd 800 MW? Yn y de. Mae Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn gwybod beth sydd dan sylw o ran peri ichi wthio hyn i'r canolbarth.

Mae amser yn symud ymlaen, a rhaid inni weld rhai newidiadau er mwyn cyflawni'r hyn y mae pob un ohonom am ei weld, sef bod Cymru'n dod yn esiampl ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Fel plaid, yr ydym wedi canolbwyntio bob amser ar ddatblygu ffermydd gwynt ar y môr. Un rheswm dros hynny yw y bydd yn dod yn amhosibl adeiladu tyrbinau ar y tir, wrth i'r dechnoleg ddatblygu, gan y bydd y llafnau mor fawr wrth i bobl alw am dyrbinau mwy o hyd. Mae gennym hefyd yr hyn a elwir yn gyllideb ecolegol, sydd yn cynnwys tri dangosydd sydd yn ymwneud â gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, dadansoddiad llif deunyddiau ac ôl-troed ecolegol. Dyma'r pethau y dylem eu hystyried er mwyn symud ymlaen. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi ein cynnig heddiw.

The most important thing for the Government to do is to show today that it understands the need to progress towards a sustainable Wales. The only way to achieve

drwy gyflwyno mynegai sy'n hawdd ei ddeall i fesur datblygu cynaliadwy. O ganlyniad, gall y cyhoedd yng Nghymru weld y cynnydd a wna'r Llywodraeth. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi troi dyletswydd statudol y Cynulliad i ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy yn eiriau gwag. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dod yn arbenigwyr mewn rhyw gynaliadwy yn lle datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae mynd yn wyrdd yn gyfle i'n cwmnïau yng Nghymru dorri costau, ymestyn i farchnadoedd newydd a rhoi hwb i'n heconomi er mwyn iddi fod cystal â'r goreuon yn Ewrop. Galwaf ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i ddefro i'r ddadl hon.

this is to introduce an easily understandable index in order to measure sustainable development. As a result, the Welsh public will be able to see the Government's progress. The Labour Assembly Government has turned a statutory duty to consider development into empty rhetoric. The Government has become an expert in the rhetoric of sustainability rather than sustainability itself. Going green is an opportunity for companies in Wales to cut costs, to reach new markets and to boost the economy so that it becomes as good as the best in Europe. I call on the Labour Assembly Government to wake up to these arguments.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl c:

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: add a new sub-point after c:

cydnabod na chyflawnir datblygu cynaliadwy heb strategaeth drafnidiaeth integredig nad yw'n seiliedig ar y model rhagweld a darparu.

recognise that sustainable development will not be achieved without an integrated transport strategy not based on the predict and provide model.

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl c:

I propose amendment 2. Add a new sub-point after c:

sicrhau nad yw'r gyfundrefn gynllunio yn caniatáu datblygiadau newydd onid yw:

ensure that the planning regime does not allow new developments unless:

i) eu heffaith ar newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi'i hasesu; a

i) their effect on climate change has been assessed; and

ii) eu bod yn ymgorffori nodweddion ynni adnewyddadwy.

ii) they incorporate renewable energy features

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu is-bwynt newydd ar ôl c:

I propose amendment 3. Add a new sub-point after c:

sefydlu corff sy'n annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth i bennu a monitro targedau ar gyfer lleihau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru.

establish a body independent of Government to set and monitor targets for the reduction of greenhouse gasses in Wales.

Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r drafodaeth hon. Yr ydym yn cefnogi cynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Hoffwn gyfeirio at ddau fater yn ein gwelliannau, gan ddechrau gyda thrafnidiaeth integredig. Credaf fod trafnidiaeth integredig yn ymwneud â datblygu'r economi yn ein hardaloedd ymylol, boed hynny yng Nghymoedd y de neu yn yr ardaloedd gwledig. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chysylltu

Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. We support the motion proposed by the Liberal Democrats. I would like to refer to two issues noted in our amendments, starting with integrated transport. I believe that integrated transport is linked to economic development in our peripheral areas, be that in the south Wales Valleys or in the rural areas. It is also related to bringing Wales together in a far more

ardaloedd Cymru gyda'i gilydd mewn ffordd llawer mwy ystyrlon. holistic manner.

Mae angen datblygu rhwydwaith y rheilffyrdd ymhellach i gario mwy o deithwyr, a hynny yn gyfforddus ac nid wedi eu pacio fel sardîns. Mae angen gwasanaeth bysiau sy'n clymu i mewn i'r gwasanaeth trenau. Nid yw adeiladu rheilffordd ynddo'i hun yn ddigon da. Yr oeddwn mewn cyfarfod neithiwr lle clywais brofiad person o'r Cymoedd sy'n hedfan o'r Rhws bob wythnos—efallai nad yw hynny'n gynaliadwy, ond mae hedfan yn rheolaidd yn ffordd o fyw erbyn hyn. Mae'r awyrennau sy'n hedfan o'r Rhws i Ewrop yn gadael yn gynnar yn y bore ac nid oes yr un trê'n o'r Cymoedd yn cyrraedd mewn pryd i gysylltu â'r gwasanaethau hynny. Felly, mae'r wraig hon yn dal i deithio yno mewn tacsî.

We need to develop the railway network in order to carry many more passengers, giving people a comfortable journey rather than their being packed in like sardines. We need a bus service that links with that rail service. Building a railway is not enough in itself. I was at a meeting last night where I heard the experience of a person from the Valleys who flies from Rhoose airport on a weekly basis—perhaps that is not sustainable, but that is a way of life these days. The flights from Rhoose to mainland Europe leave early in the morning and there are no trains from the Valleys that arrive in time to connect with those services. Therefore, this woman continues to travel there by taxi.

Teg yw nodi'r datblygiad mwy cadarnhaol sydd wedi digwydd. Yr ydym ni, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, wedi dadlau pwysigrwydd cael cysylltiadau rhwng y brifddinas a gweddill y wlad—y gorllewin, y canolbarth a'r gogledd. Mae'r diffygion yn y cyswllt rhwng y gogledd a'r de, yn enwedig y cysylltiadau rheilffordd a ffyrdd, yn parhau'n amlwg. Os ydych yn dod yma o'r gogledd i weithio ac yn ceisio cyrraedd erbyn y bore, rhaid ichi ddal y trê'n am 5 a.m. o Fangor. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg dweud bod y gwasanaeth newydd sy'n rhedeg bob dwy awr o'r gogledd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth ac yn gam ymlaen. Eto, mae'n bluen yn het y Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnydd o 25 y cant yn y defnydd a wneir o'r gwasanaeth hwnnw yn profi bod pobl yn barod i deithio ar drenau os yw'r gwasanaethau yn hwylus ac yn effeithiol.

It is only fair that we refer to the more positive development that has taken place. We, on this side of the Chamber, have argued the importance of links between the capital and the rest of the country—the west, mid Wales and the north. The deficiencies in the links between north and south, particularly the rail and road links, continue to be apparent. If you come here from the north to work and try to arrive by morning, you must catch a train at 5 a.m. from Bangor. However, it is fair to say that the new service that runs every two hours from the north has made a difference and is a step forward. Again, it is a feather in the Assembly's cap. The increase of 25 per cent in the usage of that service proves that people are prepared to use the trains if the services are convenient and reliable.

Yr ail fater yr oeddwn am ei godi yw'r angen inni weithredu'n ymarferol i brofi'n hygredded ym maes cynaliadwyedd. Yr oedd Mick yn llygad ei le pan ddywedodd fod gormod o siarad wedi digwydd. Cyfeiriaf, fel y gwnaeth Mick, at y profiad yn Awstria. Yng nghyfarfod diweddar grŵp ynni cynaliadwy y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, clywsom sôn am y gwaith ymarferol sy'n digwydd yn Awstria a gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop—cymaint mwy nag yn y wlad hon—i leihau dibyniaeth ar olew ac ar nwy. Nodwyd mai dim ond 40 o foeleri gwres canolog nwy

The second point that I want to raise is the need for us to take practical action to prove our credibility in the field of sustainability. Mick rightly said that there has been too much talk. I refer, as did Mick, to the experience in Austria. At a recent National Assembly sustainable energy group meeting, we heard about the practical work being done in Austria and other European countries to reduce dependence on oil and gas. It was noted that, in upper Austria, only 40 gas central heating boilers had been installed in houses in one year. That proves how little

a osodwyd mewn tai yn ystod un flwyddyn yn Awstria uchaf, ac mae hynny'n profi cyn lleied o ddibyniaeth sydd gan bobl yn yr ardal honno bellach ar olew a nwy.

Credaf ei bod yn hen bryd i ni feddu ar yr un math o agwedd yng nghyd-destun ein hadeiladau cyhoeddus a'n hysgolion gan roi rheoliadau ar waith sy'n golygu bod rhaid iddynt ddefnyddio ynni adnewyddadwy ac arbed ynni. Mae ffatri yn Wrecsam sy'n cynhyrchu paneli ffotofoltäig. Clywais Weinidogion yn ei chanmol i'r cymylau, ond nid oes dim yn ein rheoliadau adeiladu nac yn ein polisïau i annog y defnydd o'r math hwnnw o baneli yn ein hadeiladau cyhoeddus nac yn ein diwydiant preifat. Nodwyd hynny gan y CBI mewn cyfarfod diweddar. Felly, mae'n bryd inni gael mwy o weithredu ymarferol a llai o siarad er mwyn profi ein bod mewn gwirionedd yn credu yn ein dyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy.

Eleanor Burnham: The Welsh Liberal Democrats, as you heard from our main speaker, sincerely believe that promoting energy efficiency is vital as part of achieving a sustainable Wales, and it helps to not only reduce carbon dioxide emissions—today's buzzwords—but secure a viable energy and global future, which, given all the natural disasters around the world, is crucial.

I think back to my own childhood, which was unbelievable in sustainable development terms. I was brought up on a farm in Cynwyd, where my father would milk the cows with a tractor and we had lamps. Yes, I am that old, unfortunately. We did not have that much rubbish, and whatever rubbish we had, we disposed of ourselves. We also had our own water from a well, which was delicious. Thinking seriously about the issue, we were completely self-sustainable, and that is what we should aim for.

Notwithstanding the Senedd's wonderful eco-friendly status, of which we are proud, the Assembly Government needs to do more to promote energy efficiency in homes and businesses. The use of combined heat and

dependence they have on gas and oil.

It is about time that we adopted the same position in relation to our public buildings and schools and implemented regulations that require them to use renewable energy sources and save energy. There is a factory in Wrexham that produces photovoltaic panels. I have heard Ministers singing its praises, but there is nothing in our building regulations or in our policies to encourage the use of these kinds of panels in our public buildings or in our private industry. The CBI drew attention to that in a recent meeting. Therefore, it is about time that we saw more practical action and less talk in order to prove that we truly believe in our statutory duty to promote sustainable development.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y clywsoch gan ein prif siaradwr, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n credu'n ddiffuant ei bod yn hollbwysig hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni fel rhan o'r ymdrech i sicrhau Cymru gynaliadwy, ac yn ogystal â helpu i ostwng gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid—y geiriau ffasiynol heddiw—bydd yn sicrhau dyfodol dichonadwy o ran ynni a'r byd, sydd yn hollbwysig, o ystyried yr holl drychinebau naturiol o gwmpas y byd.

Yr wyf yn cofio fy mhлentyndod, a oedd yn wych o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. Fe'm maged ar fferm yng Nghynwyd, lle y byddai fy nhad yn godro'r buchod gyda thractor ac yr oedd lampau gennym. Ie, yr wyf cyn hyned â hynny, gwaetha'r modd. Nid oedd gennym fawr ddim ysbwriel a byddem yn cael gwared â hynny o ysbwriel a oedd gennym ein hunain. Caem ein dŵr ein hunain o ffynnon hefyd, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n hyfryd. Ac ystyried y mater o ddifrif, yr oeddem yn gwbl hunangynhaliol, a dyna'r hyn y dylem anelu ato.

Er bod y Senedd yn wych o ran ei statws eco-gyfeillgar, yr ymfalchïwn ynddo, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wneud rhagor i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn cartrefi a busnesau. Mae'r defnydd o wres a

power is one example of a step that we can take. With CHP, housing providers save money, increase their energy efficiency, have their properties protected against cold and damp, and have more satisfied tenants. Householders also get more affordable energy bills, which, let us be frank, is a big issue at the moment. President Putin holds the purse strings on gas, the price of which has soared. I think that they have increased by 40 per cent in the last 12 months, and that is getting serious. Energy and utility bills now cost more and cause more worries than mortgage charges used to in the good old days. We certainly need warmer homes in winter, and we have had a long and desperately cold winter this year.

We must consider the wider community benefits from lower overall pollution and enhanced local economic development. All new buildings could and should be designed and built to be environmentally friendly. The Assembly Government needs to press the UK Government on devolving building regulations to Wales so that they can be changed to include requirements on microgeneration and in-built green technologies. It does not take rocket science to do that, Minister.

We should start to live differently in our homes, but I agree that encouraging a sea change in lifestyle is not easy. However, solar access and the use of photovoltaic technology in building developments must be more actively encouraged and promoted and, quite frankly, at affordable prices. The message that energy efficiency is cost-effective needs to be better communicated to businesses and the public in general. Otherwise, human nature being what it is, people will not be easily persuaded to change their lifestyles unless they see something in it for themselves.

As Mick said, Scotland provides a very good example of sustainability. In March 2002, the Scottish Executive introduced improved Scottish building standards relating to the conservation of fuel and power. The new standards for housing specified requirements for reduced heat loss in the fabric of the

phŵer wedi eu cyfuno yn un enghraifft o'r camau y gallwn eu cymryd. O gael gwres a phŵer cyfunedig, mae darparwyr tai'n arbed arian, yn dod yn fwy ynni-ffeithlon, yn cadw eu tai rhag oerni a lleithder, ac yn peri i'w tenantiaid fod yn fwy bodlon. Mae deiliaid tai hefyd yn cael biliau ynni mwy fforddiadwy, sydd, a'i roi'n blwmp ac yn blaen, yn bwnc pwysig ar hyn o bryd. Yr Arlywydd Putin sy'n rheoli pris nwy, sydd wedi codi i'r entrychion. Yr wyf yn credu ei fod wedi codi 40 y cant yn y 12 mis diwethaf, ac mae hynny'n mynd yn beth difrifol. Mae biliau ynni a chyfleustodau'n costio mwy bellach ac yn peri mwy o bryder nag a oedd taliadau morgais yn yr hen ddyddiau dedwydd. Mae'n sicr bod arnom angen cartrefi cynhesach yn y gaeaf, ac yr ydym wedi cael gaeaf hir ac ofnadwy o oer eleni.

Rhaid inni ystyried y manteision mwy cyffredinol i'r gymuned o gael llai o lygredd yn gyffredinol a gwell datblygu economaidd lleol. Gellid a dylid cynllunio ac adeiladu pob adeilad newydd fel ei fod yn eco-gyfeillgar. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bwysio ar Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu i Gymru fel y gellir eu newid i gynnwys gofynion ynghylch microgynhyrchu ac ymgorffori technolegau gwyrdd. Nid oes angen dyfeisgarwch mawr i wneud hynny, Weinidog.

Dylem ddechrau byw'n wahanol yn ein cartrefi, ond yr wyf yn derbyn nad yw'n hawdd cymell newid mawr o ran ffordd o fyw. Er hynny, rhaid gwneud mwy i hybu a hyrwyddo camau i godi tai sydd yn agored i'r haul a defnyddio technoleg ffotofoltäig a hynny, rhaid dweud, am brisiau fforddiadwy. Rhaid cyfleu'n well i fusnesau a'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol fod effeithlonrwydd ynni'n gost-ffeithiol. Fel arall, o adnabod y natur ddynol, ni fydd yn hawdd darbwyllo pobl i newid eu ffordd o fyw oni bai eu bod yn gweld bod rhyw fantais iddynt hwy yn hynny.

Fel y dywedodd Mick, mae'r Alban yn esiampl dda iawn o ran cynaliadwyedd. Ym mis Mawrth 2002, cyflwynodd Gweithrediaeth yr Alban well safonau adeiladu ar gyfer yr Alban mewn cysylltiad ag arbed tanwydd a phŵer. Yr oedd y safonau newydd i dai'n pennu gofynion ar

building and for the improved energy efficiency of central heating boilers and controls for space heating and hot water. The Scottish Executive predicts energy savings of 25 per cent for a typical dwelling. Therefore, Minister, we need to be serious about this and you need to do what you can in Wales.

Lorraine Barrett: In supporting amendment 4, as I think I will, given the amount of profit made by developers, the least that they should be made to do is to build their houses and flats to the highest standard of energy efficiency. When I look around my constituency and see the huge amount of development going on, I wonder where the solar panels are and whether they have systems in place to recycle grey water for use in toilets, for instance.

5.00 p.m.

However, I would like to see this amendment go further and include home improvement schemes such as renewal area projects, or enveloping schemes, as they used to be called. There is a renewal area project currently ongoing in Penarth, and it seems to me to be a lost opportunity, when public money is used to provide new roofs, windows, doors and so on, not to use solar slates and to install wall insulation. I ask that consideration be given to this so that, when the Welsh Assembly Government gives grants to councils for this sort of home improvement, we get the best return for public money in order to protect our environment for the future.

Jenny Randerson: I will address the issue of the economy from the sustainability perspective because I believe that this Government has been woefully timid in encouraging the sectors of the economy particularly identified as those which are part of the sustainable development remit. Sustainability is virtually a unique gift—there are only three legislatures in the world which have to obey the sustainability agenda. We have a unique position within the UK, yet we are not making the most of it. When we look abroad, at Ireland, for example, and see its

gyfer lleihau'r gwres a gollir drwy'r adeiladwaith a gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni bwyleri gwresogi canolog a rheolaethau ar wresogi gofod a dŵr poeth. Mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn rhagweld y bydd arbedion ynni o 25 y cant ar gyfer annedd cyffredin. Felly, Weinidog, rhaid inni fod o ddifrif am hyn a rhaid ichi wneud yr hyn a allwch yng Nghymru.

Lorraine Barrett: Wrth gefnogi gwelliant 4, fel y gwnaif, yr wyf yn credu, o ystyried maint yr elw a wnaiff datblygwyr, y lleiaf y dylid eu gorfodi i'w wneud yw codi eu tai a'u fflatiau yn unol â'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni. Pan fyddaf yn edrych o gwmpas f'etholaeth ac yn gweld cymaint o ddatblygu, byddaf yn meddwl tybed lle y mae'r paneli solar a thybed a oes ganddynt systemau ar waith i ailgylchu dŵr llwyd i'w ddefnyddio mewn toiledau, er enghraifft.

Fodd bynnag, carwn weld y gwelliant hwn yn mynd ymhellach ac yn cynnwys cynlluniau gwella cartrefi megis prosiectau ardaloedd adfywio, neu gynlluniau amlennu, fel yr arferid eu galw. Mae prosiect ardal adfywio yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd ym Mhenarth, ac ymddengys i mi y collir cyfle, pan ddefnyddir arian cyhoeddus i ddarparu toeau, ffenestri, a drysau newydd ac yn y blaen, wrth beidio â defnyddio llechi solar ac insiwleiddio'r waliau. Gofynnaf am roi ystyriaeth i hyn fel, pan fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi grantiau i gynghorau ar gyfer y math hwn o welliannau i gartrefi, y cawn y gwerth gorau am arian cyhoeddus er mwyn gwarchod ein hamgylchedd ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: Rhoddaf sylw i bwnc yr economi o safbwynt cynaliadwyedd oherwydd fy mod yn credu i'r Llywodraeth hon fod yn druenus o swil o ran annog y sectorau hynny o'r economi a nodwyd yn arbennig fel rhai sydd yn rhan o'r cylch gorchwyl datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae cynaliadwyedd yn rhodd sydd bron yn unigryw—dim ond tri chorff deddfu yn y byd i gyd sydd yn gorfod ufuddhau i agenda cynaliadwyedd. Mae ein safle yn unigryw yn y DU, ac eto, nid ydym yn manteisio arno. Pan edrychwn dramor, ar Iwerddon, er

economic miracle and the sectors that it has developed, we should be looking at our own perspective and developing the sustainable development sectors, making the most of the legal obligations that we have.

If you read through the various economic development and sustainable strategies produced by the Assembly Government, there is a lack of concrete commitment. There are plenty of words and bald statements of commitment, but there are no detailed commitments or the action plans that we need in order to create exciting business opportunities.

We need to put green jobs at the heart of Wales's future prosperity and we need a green-jobs strategy. The consultation document for the new economic development strategy, the 'WAVE' document, fails to give proper prominence to green jobs. I believe that that highlights Labour's weak commitment to sustainable development. This is a wasted opportunity. I do not like to be the third Assembly Member to refer to Scotland and say that the Scots are doing it better, but they are doing it better on this issue. I would thoroughly recommend to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, if he were here, the Scottish green-jobs strategy which has a clear aim and vision backed up by a detailed framework and robust actions with targets and measures. Scotland has set up a green-jobs fund which totals £22 million over three years and it is looking at jobs in renewable energy, waste management, recycling, the use of recyclates, biofuels, construction and sustainable design, organic farming, tourism and cleaner technologies. Scotland has an all-around approach.

In recent months and years, we have lost thousands of jobs in manufacturing. We have also seen a downturn in the service sector. We are a small country competing in a global market. We cannot compete with the low wage economies and no-one in this Chamber would want to sell Wales as a low wage economy. We have to compete on those areas

enghraifft, a gweld ei gwyrrth economaidd a'r sectorau a ddatblygwyd ganddi, dylem fod yn edrych ar ein safbwynt ein hunain ac yn datblygu'r sectorau datblygu cynaliadwy, gan fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y goblygiadau cyfreithiol sydd gennym.

Os darllenwch drwy'r gwahanol strategaethau datblygu economaidd a chynaliadwy a gynhyrchwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae yno ddiffyg ymrwymiad cadarn. Mae digonedd o eiriau a datganiadau moel am ymrwymiad, ond nid oes ymrwymadau manwl na'r cynlluniau gweithredu y mae arnom eu hangen er mwyn creu cyfleoedd busnes cyffrous.

Rhaid inni roi swyddi gwyrdd wrth wraidd ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol ac mae arnom angen strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Nid yw'r ddogfen ymgynghori ar gyfer y strategaeth datblygu economaidd newydd, y ddogfen 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', yn rhoi amlygrwydd teilwng i swyddi gwyrdd. Credaf fod hynny'n amlygu ymrwymiad gwan Llafur i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Colli cyfle yw peth felly. Nid wyf yn hoffi'r ffaith mai fi yw'r trydydd Aelod Cynulliad i gyfeirio at yr Alban a dweud bod yr Albanwyr yn gwneud pethau'n well, ond maent yn gwneud pethau'n well ar y mater hwn. Byddwn yn cymeradwyo'n gryf i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, petai yma, strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd yr Alban sydd â nod a gweledigaeth glir, gyda fframwaith manwl yn gefn iddi a champau cadarn gyda thargedau a mesuriadau. Sefydlodd yr Alban gronfa swyddi gwyrdd sydd yn £22 miliwn dros dair blynedd ac mae'n edrych ar swyddi mewn ynni adnewyddadwy, rheoli gwastraff, ailgylchu, defnyddio deunydd eildro, biodanwydd, adeiladwaith a dylunio cynaliadwy, ffermio organig, twristiaeth a thechnolegau glanach. Mae'r Alban yn cymryd agwedd gynhwysfawr.

Dros y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd diwethaf, collasom filoedd o swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu. Gwelsom ddirywiad hefyd yn y sector gwasanaeth. Gwlad fach ydym, yn cystadlu mewn marchnad fyd-eang. Ni allwn gystadlu gyda'r economïau cyflog isel ac ni fyddai neb yn y Siambr hon am werthu Cymru fel economi cyflog isel. Rhaid inni

where we are strong; we have to claim our niche in order to claim Wales's natural advantages. We are one of just three governments worldwide with a legal obligation to sustainable development and we need to use this as a lever to improve our productivity. I believe that, so far, we have wasted our opportunities. Today's motion gives us the opportunity to go forward on a stronger footing than we have done before.

Brynle Williams: I welcome the opportunity to speak to this issue, and I thank the Liberal Democrats for highlighting a subject as important as sustainable development.

This issue needs to be treated with the highest priority by the Welsh Assembly Government. Despite commitments to cut greenhouse gas emissions and increase recycling, carbon emissions and landfill waste rates are higher now than when Labour took office.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.06 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.06 p.m.*

I support the creation of a green-jobs strategy. Wales has an enormous amount to gain if it can successfully develop this sector of the economy—in particular, renewable energies. Other Members have said that the potential of renewable energy is endless, if we simply use it. We must do this now, before it is too late. If Wales can build up expertise and specialised services in these areas, it will be well placed to meet, not only its own needs, but those of markets outside its borders.

Nid oes dim byd fel profiad personol. Yr wyf newydd godi tŷ. Yr hyn a oedd yn drist ofnadwy oedd nad oedd rheoliadau adeiladu'r cyngor yn sôn am unrhyw beth i helpu i gadw'r defnydd o ynni i lawr. Mae hynny'n drist ofnadwy. Mae'n 2006, a'r unig beth yr oedd y cyngor yn ei ddweud oedd bod rhaid gwneud gwerthusiadau inswleiddio.

Finally, I stress how important it is that the policy in different areas works towards the common goal of sustainable development. For example, if, on the one hand, local

gystadlu yn y meysydd hynny lle'r ydym yn gryf; rhaid inni hawlio ein lle er mwyn hawlio manteision naturiol Cymru. Ni yw un o ddim ond tair llywodraeth yn y byd gyda rhwymedigaeth gyfreithiol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a rhaid inni ddefnyddio hyn fel cyfrwng i wella ein cynhyrchiant. Credaf ein bod, hyd yma, wedi gwastraffu ein cyfleoedd. Mae'r cynnig heddiw yn rhoi cyfle inni symud ymlaen yn gadarnach nag yr ydym wedi gwneud o'r blaen.

Brynle Williams: Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad am y pwnc hwn, a diolchaf i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am ddwyn sylw at bwnc mor bwysig â datblygu cynaliadwy.

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru roi'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i'r mater hwn. Er gwaethaf ymrwymadau i gwtogi gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr ac ailgylchu mwy, mae gollyngiadau carbon a chyfraddau gwastraff tirlenwi yn uwch yn awr na phan ddaeth Llafur i rym.

Yr wyf yn cefnogi creu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Gall Cymru fod ar ei hennill yn aruthrol os gall lwyddo i ddatblygu'r sector hon o'r economi—yn arbennig ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae Aelodau eraill wedi dweud bod posibiladau ynni adnewyddadwy yn ddi-ben-draw, dim ond inni eu defnyddio. Rhaid inni wneud hynny'n awr, cyn iddi fynd yn rhy hwyr. Os gall Cymru fagu arbenigedd a gwasanaethau arbenigol yn y meysydd hyn, bydd mewn sefyllfa dda i fodloni nid yn unig ei hanghenion ei hun, ond marchnadoedd y tu hwnt i'w ffiniau.

There is nothing like personal experience. I have just built a house. What was terribly sad was that the council's building regulations made no mention of anything to help to keep down the energy consumption. That is terribly sad. It is 2006, and the only things that the council said that we had to undertake were insulation evaluations.

Yn olaf, carwn bwysleisio mor bwysig ydyw i bolisiau mewn gwahanol feysydd weithio tuag at yr un nod o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Er enghraifft, os bydd awdurdodau lleol, ar y

authorities work to reduce the volume of plastic waste in the environment—in particular, that from plastic bags—then it would be common sense to promote the use of biodegradable alternatives. From agriculture alone, we can grow fibres simply for producing or replacing plastic—flax is one, for which we already have a plant in north Wales. Doing so shows that sustainable development can bring a broad range of benefits to us in Wales, not only in improving our quality of life, but also in offering sustainable opportunities for the economy.

Glyn Davies: The subject of today's debate—sustainable development—is hugely important to the Assembly. However, the context for the debate, namely the impact of climate change, is probably the most important issue that faces the world. The argument about the fact of climate change has gone—there is a significant amount of climate change. There will always be a debate about the extent to which that is a natural phenomenon—because there is always a natural phenomenon with climate change—and the degree to which that is caused by man. We can look back; geologists will tell us about the Ice Age, when there was a huge change. We can also look back to more short-term historical issues. One can look back to eighteenth-century paintings, when people were skating on the River Thames; something has changed since then. We read that, in Roman times, they were making wine in the north of England. Clearly, there is a consistent change in the climate.

However, no-one can argue that, over the last century, there has been a steady increase in carbon dioxide in the atmosphere. That has to be of serious concern to us all, and we all have to take our responsibility for that. It is easy to consider this issue in world terms. The degree of growth in China and India is phenomenal, compared with the little that we can do, and many people tell me—not people participating in this debate—that the impact that we can have is so small that it is almost not worth contemplating. We would all disagree with that, because every citizen of the world must recognise that there is a real threat to our very existence and we must all

naill law, yn gweithio i leihau swm y gwastraff plastig yn yr amgylchedd—o fagiau plastig yn enwedig—synnwyr cyffredin fyddai hybu defnyddio dewisiadau bioddiraddiadwy. Drwy amaethyddiaeth yn unig, gallwn dyfu ffibrau er mwyn cynhyrchu plastig neu gymryd ei le—mae llin yn un, ac mae gennym waith yng ngogledd Cymru sydd eisoes yn gwneud hyn. Mae gwneud hyn yn dangos y gall datblygu cynaliadwy esgor ar fanteision lawer inni yng Nghymru, nid yn unig o ran gwella ansawdd ein bywyd, ond hefyd drwy gynnig cyfleoedd addas i'r economi.

Glyn Davies: Mae pwnc y ddadl heddiw—datblygu cynaliadwy—yn bwysig eithriadol i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, cyd-destun y ddadl, sef effaith y newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn ôl pob tebyg yw'r pwnc pwysicaf sy'n wynebu'r byd. Diflannodd y ddadl am fodolaeth y newid yn yr hinsawdd—mae'r hinsawdd yn newid yn sylweddol. Byddwn yn dal i gael dadleuon ynghylch y graddau y mae hynny yn ffenomen naturiol—oherwydd y mae ffenomen naturiol wastad ynghlwm â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd—ac i ba raddau y mae hynny'n cael ei achosi gan waith dyn. Gallwn edrych yn ôl; dywed daearegwyr wrthym am Oes yr Iâ, pan gafwyd newid enfawr. Gallwn edrych yn ôl hefyd at hanes mwy diweddar. Gall rhywun edrych yn ôl ar luniau o'r ddeunawfed ganrif, pan oedd pobl yn sgleftio ar Afon Tafwys; mae rhywbeth wedi newid ers hynny. Darllenwn eu bod, yn oes y Rhufeiniad, yn gwneud gwin yng ngogledd Lloegr. Yn amlwg, mae'r hinsawdd yn newid yn gyson.

Fodd bynnag, ni all neb ddadlau na chafwyd, dros y ganrif ddiwethaf, gynnydd cyson mewn carbon deuocsid yn yr atmosffer. Mae hynny'n rhwym o fod yn bryder difrifol inni oll, a rhaid inni oll ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am hynny. Hawdd yw ystyried y pwnc hwn mewn termau byd-eang. Mae cyfradd twf Tsieina ac India yn rhyfeddol, o'i gymharu â'r mymryn y gallwn ni ei wneud, a dywed llawer o bobl wrthyf—nid pobl sy'n cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon—fod yr effaith y gallwn ni ei chael mor fach fel nad yw bron yn werth ei ystyried. Byddem oll yn anghytuno â hynny, gan fod yn rhaid i bob dinesydd yn y byd sylweddoli bod gwir fygythiad i'n

take responsibility for that.

bodolaeth, a rhaid inni oll gymryd y cyfrifoldeb am hynny.

5.10 p.m.

I will touch on three points, the first of which is amendment 3. This is a very interesting amendment, but I think that it should go further. It is my view that issues relating to mitigating the impact of climate change will have to be taken outside the political arena. Because of the capacity for frustrating the will of Government on an issue that will inevitably be unpopular, there must be some sort of an agreement on this outside politics. A measurement of exactly what is happening in terms of carbon dioxide is an essential part of enabling that to happen. If that does not happen, it will become almost impossible for us to deal with this issue.

Soniaf am dri phwynt, a gwelliant 3 yw'r cyntaf. Mae hwn yn welliant diddorol iawn, ond tybiaf y dylai fynd ymhellach. Yn fy marn i, bydd yn rhaid mynd â'r pynciau sydd yn ymwneud â lliniaru effaith y newid yn yr hinsawdd allan o'r maes gwleidyddol. Oherwydd y gallu i rwystro ewyllys Llywodraeth ar fater a fydd o raid yn amhoblogaidd, rhaid cael rhyw fath o gytundeb am hyn y tu allan i wleidyddiaeth. Mae mesur beth yn union sy'n digwydd o ran carbon deuocsid yn rhan hanfodol o beri i hynny ddigwydd. Os na ddigwydd hynny, yna bydd bron yn amhosibl inni ymdrin â'r pwnc hwn.

Minor issues arise all the time. I spend the vast majority of my time in the Assembly on environment, planning and countryside issues and I find that new issues, on a relatively small scale, are consistently popping up. In the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting last week, we looked at the way in which councils are now introducing fortnightly waste collections in an effort to encourage recycling. Clearly, that will be unpopular, and is an opportunity to make capital out of a reduced service. Householders will be thinking, 'This is great', but that is an irresponsible attitude because we must promote recycling. If we do not, it is just not going to happen.

Mae mân bynciau yn codi byth a hefyd. Byddaf yn treulio'r rhan fwyaf o bellffordd o'm hamser yn y Cynulliad ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad, a sylwaf fod pynciau newydd, ar raddfa gymharol fach, yn dod i'r wyneb yn gyson. Ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yr wythnos diwethaf, buom yn edrych ar y ffordd y mae cynghorau bellach yn cyflwyno casglu gwastraff bob pythefnos mewn ymdrech i annog ailgylchu. Yn amlwg, bydd hyn yn amhoblogaidd, ac mae'n gyfle i fanteisio ar lai o wasanaeth. Bydd deiliaid tai yn meddwl, 'Mae hyn yn wych', ond agwedd anghyfrifol yw honno oherwydd rhaid i ni hybu ailgylchu. Oni wnawn, ni fydd yn digwydd o gwbl.

We must also find some way of taxing airline travel, which is a UK-wide issue. However, putting up air fares will be unpopular. There is easily an opportunity there, unless the decision is taken outside of politics, for stopping that. We can extend this argument to a number of other areas. I hope that the Chancellor, in his budget tomorrow, adjusts the taxation system with regard to fuel more than anything else. That will also be very unpopular with some parts of the community, but I hope that no-one takes advantage of that to make it difficult for the Chancellor to do something that deals with the issue of climate change.

Rhaid inni hefyd ganfod rhyw ffordd o drethu teithio mewn awyrennau, sydd yn fater i'r DU gyfan. Fodd bynnag, bydd codi prisiau teithiau awyr yn amhoblogaidd. Mae cyfle rhwydd yma i atal hynny, oni chymerir y penderfyniad y tu allan i wleidyddiaeth. Gallwn ymestyn y ddadl hon i nifer o feysydd eraill. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Canghellor, yn ei gyllideb yfory, yn addasu'r gyfundrefn drethi o ran tanwydd yn anad un peth arall. Bydd hyn hefyd yn amhoblogaidd iawn gyda rhai carfannau o gymdeithas, ond gobeithio na fydd neb yn cymryd mantais o hynny i'w gwneud yn anodd i'r Canghellor wneud rhywbeth a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â

The other big point is the nuclear debate, which is now starting. Many people are saying that the only real way of tackling this issue at a world level is to go down the nuclear route. I am unconvinced about that and I am very suspicious about it, but if it has a serious impact on our carbon footprint, as human beings, I will accept it. We must grasp the fact that there will have to be a serious debate in the open about this issue. It is taking place across all parties. I was reading yesterday about a former Scottish spokesman for the Liberal Democrats who is very pro-nuclear, so it is everywhere. The debate must be open, we must deal with it and decide whether this is something that we must accept if we are to deal with what is probably the greatest problem currently facing our world.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I thank the Liberal Democrats for bringing forward this debate on the important issue of sustainable development, and there are many things on which I sympathise with them. We are, as a Government, at the heart of sustainable development, and, as an institution, we can truly say that we are at the heart of sustainable development, housed as we are in this building, which is one of the most sustainable buildings in the whole of Europe.

I noted with some interest the Liberal Democrats' constant pushing of Scotland and the fact that there is a Liberal Democrat Minister in Scotland who is responsible for sustainable development. I am sure that it is a pure coincidence that they plugged Scotland so much.

Before I turn to the amendments, I will say that the body of the motion itself is ill-conceived and behind the times in many ways. The first part of the motion calls for GVA and greenhouse gases to be published. We published figures in the 2005 sustainable development report for GVA in Wales of £37.1 billion in 2003, and for the emissions of greenhouse gases of 12.8 million tonnes

chwestiwn y newid yn yr hinsawdd.

Y pwynt mawr arall yw'r ddadl niwclear, sydd yn awr yn dechrau. Dywed llawer mai'r unig ffordd wirioneddol o fynd i'r afael â'r pwnc hwn ar lefel fyd-eang yw dilyn y llwybr niwclear. Nid wyf wedi f'argyhoeddi am hynny, ac yr wyf yn amheus iawn yn ei gylch, ond os caiff effaith sylweddol ar ein hôl-troed carbon, fel bodau dynol, fe'i derbyniaf. Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith y bydd yn rhaid cael dadl ddifrifol ac agored am hyn. Mae'n digwydd ar draws y pleidiau. Yr oeddwn yn darllen ddoe am gyn-lefarydd yn yr Alban dros y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sydd yn gryf iawn o blaid niwclear, felly mae ym mhobman. Rhaid i'r ddadl fod yn agored, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hi a phenderfynu a yw hyn yn rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni ei dderbyn os ydym am fynd i'r afael â'r broblem fwyaf, o bosibl, sydd yn wynebu ein byd yn awr.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Diolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ar bwnc pwysig datblygu cynaliadwy, ac yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â hwy ar nifer o bwyntiau. Yr ydym, fel Llywodraeth, wrth wraidd datblygu cynaliadwy, ac fel sefydliad, gallwn ddweud yn ddiffuant ein bod wrth wraidd datblygu cynaliadwy, a ninnau yn yr adeilad hwn, sydd yn un o'r adeiladau mwyaf cynaliadwy yn Ewrop gyfan.

Sylwais gyda pheth diddordeb fod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn sôn am yr Alban byth a hefyd, a'r ffaith bod Gweinidog o Democrat Rhyddfrydol yn yr Alban sy'n gyfrifol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf yn siŵr mai cyd-ddigwyddiad llwyr yw'r ffaith iddynt ganu clodydd yr Alban mor groch.

Cyn imi droi at y gwelliannau, dywedaf fod y cynnig ei hun wedi ei lunio'n wael ac wedi dyddio mewn llawer ffordd. Geilw rhan gyntaf y cynnig am gyhoeddi GYC a nwyon tŷ gwydr. Cyhoeddassom ffigurau yn adroddiad datblygu cynaliadwy 2005 am GYC yng Nghymru o £37.1 biliwn yn 2003, ac am ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr o 12.8 miliwn tunnell o'r hyn sy'n cyfateb i garbon

carbon equivalent in 2002. It does not take a genius to read the two figures together. We will do the same again in the 2006 annual report. These figures are already available and perhaps the Liberal Democrats might like to look at them.

Mick Bates: Most of us are familiar with the fact that two separate figures were published. The difficulty that you cannot seem to get your head around, Minister, is that we want to put them together to provide a single indicator for sustainable development. That is our proposition in the motion, not that the figures are published separately.

Carwyn Jones: I find it astounding that the Liberal Democrats find it difficult to read two figures. What they are saying, effectively, is that they cannot understand two figures, therefore there must be one. The two figures are easy enough to understand, and I am sure that the majority of Members in this Chamber will understand quite clearly what the figures are meant to achieve.

I turn to green jobs. We all want to encourage activities and employment in areas that support, rather than undermine, sustainable development. There are many who know that a review of the business and environment action plan is under way, and that goes much broader than just looking at green jobs. Mention has been made of what is happening in Scotland, but its 'Going for green growth: a green jobs strategy for Scotland' simply addresses similar issues to the business and environment action plan in Wales. However, we have the advantage in Wales of the environmental goods and services programme, for which Scotland does not have a direct parallel. Therefore, we are ahead of Scotland in that regard. In addition, the expert panel on resources management for Wales is finalising recommendations for the delivery of a three-year plan on resources management. Its recommendations are expected to be available for consultation during the autumn.

The third point of the substantive motion calls for the publication of energy figures. Energy certificates for buildings are a requirement of the EU energy performance

yn 2002. Nid oes rhaid bod yn athrylith i ddarllen y ddau ffigur gyda'i gilydd. Gwnawn yr un peth eto yn adroddiad blynyddol 2006. Mae'r ffigurau hyn eisoes ar gael, ac efallai y carai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fwrw golwg arnynt.

Mick Bates: Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn gyfarwydd â'r ffaith bod dau ffigur ar wahân wedi eu cyhoeddi. Yr anhawster nad ydych fel petaech yn ei ddirnad, Weinidog, yw ein bod am eu rhoi at ei gilydd i roi un dangosydd ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Dyna a gynigiwn yn y cynnig, nid bod y ffigurau'n cael eu cyhoeddi ar wahân.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n fy syfrdanu bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei chael hi'n anodd darllen dau ffigur. Yr hyn y maent yn ei ddweud, i bob diben, yw na allant ddeall dau ffigur, felly rhaid cael un. Mae'r ddau ffigur yn ddigon hawdd eu deall, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y mwyafrif o'r Aelodau yn y Siambr hon yn deall yn ddigon clir yr hyn y mae'r ffigurau i fod i'w gyflawni.

Trof at swyddi gwyrdd. Yr ydym i gyd am annog gweithgareddau a chyflogaeth mewn meysydd sy'n cefnogi, yn hytrach na thanseilio, datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae llawer sy'n gwybod bod adolygiad o'r cynllun gweithredu busnes a'r amgylchedd ar y gweill, ac mae hynny'n llawer ehangach na dim ond edrych ar swyddi gwyrdd. Cyfeiriwyd at yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn yr Alban, ond nid yw ei 'Going for green growth: a green jobs strategy for Scotland' ond yn ymdrin â materion tebyg i'r cynllun gweithredu busnes a'r amgylchedd yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym ni yng Nghymru yn elwa o'r rhaglen nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol, nad oes gan yr Alban raglen sy'n cyfateb yn uniongyrchol iddi. Felly, yr ydym o flaen yr Alban yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Yn ogystal, mae'r panel arbenigol i Gymru ar reoli adnoddau yn cwblhau argymhellion ar gyfer cynllun rheoli adnoddau tair blynedd ar eu gwedd derfynol. Disgwylir y bydd ei argymhellion ar gael at ddibenion ymgynghori yn ystod yr hydref.

Mae trydydd pwynt y prif gynnig yn galw am gyhoeddi ffigurau ynni. Mae tystysgrifau ynni i adeiladau yn ofyniad o dan gyfarwyddeb perfformiad ynni adeiladau yr

of buildings directive. This directive came into force in January this year and the UK will have up to three years to implement the energy certification requirements. In public buildings, a certificate that outlines the energy performance of the building will have to be displayed in a prominent place. In the course of the next three years we will consider collating those figures and publishing them, but we are in the very early stages as yet. The next stage has to be to ensure that public buildings have energy certificates.

I will deal with the first amendment, which assumes that we already use a predict and provide model in developing transport strategy. We do not. Transport Wales's appraisal process looks at the full range of options and modes, including doing nothing, before decisions about schemes are taken. The predict and provide model did not feature in the 2001 transport framework, nor will it feature in our emerging transport strategy. That is worth emphasising, because the assumption is that that is the only principle upon which decisions are taken when it comes to strategy. I understand that a draft of the Wales transport strategy will be issued for public consultation in May of this year.

I turn to the second amendment, which is to do with planning. Once again, I cannot accept the premise behind the proposed amendment. Technical advice note 12 deals with design, and that TAN is meant to encapsulate what can be done to ensure energy efficiency in houses and to ensure that we build houses that are fit for purpose for the present and for the future. The planning system can only go so far. There is a need, of course, to address the way that houses are built via building regulations. That is being done at an England-and-Wales level at the moment, and we know about the code for sustainable building that is being developed.

Turning to amendment 3, I fail to see the point of having a separate body that will measure what has already been measured by

UE. Daeth y gyfarwydddeb hon i rym ym mis Ionawr eleni a bydd gan y DU hyd at dair blynedd i roi'r gofynion o ran tystysgrifau ynni ar waith. Mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus, bydd yn rhaid i dystysgrif sy'n amlinellu perfformiad ynni'r adeilad gael ei harddangos mewn man amlwg. Dros y tair blynedd nesaf byddwn yn ystyried casglu'r ffigurau hynny ynghyd a'u cyhoeddi, ond nid ydym ond yng nghyfnodau cynharaf y drefn hon ar hyn o bryd. Y cam nesaf o reidrwydd fydd sicrhau bod gan adeiladau cyhoeddus dystysgrifau ynni.

Yr wyf am ddelio â'r gwelliant cyntaf, sy'n rhagdybio ein bod eisoes yn defnyddio model rhagfynegi a darparu wrth ddatblygu strategaeth drafnidiaeth. Nid ydym yn gwneud hynny. Mae proses arfarnu Trafnidiaeth Cymru yn edrych ar yr holl opsiynau a moddau, gan gynnwys gwneud dim, cyn gwneud penderfyniadau am gynlluniau. Nid oedd y model rhagfynegi a darparu yn ymddangos yn fframwaith trafndiaeth 2001, ac ni fydd yn ymddangos ychwaith yn ein strategaeth drafnidiaeth sy'n dechrau ymffurfio yn awr. Mae'n werth pwysleisio hynny, oherwydd y rhagdybiaeth mai dyna'r unig egwyddor y seilir penderfyniadau arni wrth ymdrin â strategaeth. Deallaf y bydd drafft o strategaeth drafnidiaeth Cymru yn cael ei gyhoeddi er mwyn ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd ym mis Mai eleni.

Trof at yr ail welliant, sy'n ymdrin â chynllunio. Unwaith eto, ni allaf dderbyn y rhagosodiad y seiliwyd y gwelliant a gynigir arno. Mae nodyn cyngor technegol 12 yn delio â dylunio, ac mae'r TAN hwnnw i fod i grynhoi'r hyn y mae modd ei wneud i sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ynni mewn tai ac i sicrhau ein bod yn codi tai sy'n addas i'w pwrpas ar gyfer y presennol a'r dyfodol. Dim ond hyn a hyn y gall y gyfundrefn gynllunio ei gyflawni. Mae angen, rhoi sylw i'r ffordd y caiff tai eu codi drwy'r rheoliadau adeiladu, wrth gwrs. Mae hynny'n cael ei wneud ar lefel Cymru a Lloegr ar hyn o bryd, a gwyddom am y cod adeiladu cynaliadwy sy'n cael ei ddatblygu.

O droi at welliant 3, ni allaf weld diben cael corff ar wahân a fydd yn mesur yr hyn sydd eisoes wedi cael ei fesur gan rywun arall yng

someone else in Wales. We do not need another quango. We already have the benefit of independent advice on the sorts of reductions in greenhouse gases that we should be aiming for, for example from the Royal Commission on Environmental Pollution. Information on greenhouse gas emissions from within Wales is already provided independently by the National Environmental Technology Centre. There is no point in having a separate body in Wales to provide information that is already readily available, given the cost that it would entail.

I turn to the final amendment—amendment 4—which we will be supporting this afternoon, because we want to ensure that all homes are built to the highest standards of energy efficiency. In principle, we are happy to accept the devolution of building regulations, but we would have to look at the practicalities of what that would involve, which would include looking at the resource implications, and whether the resource implications would justify our acquisition of the powers. That is the position that we have adopted. However, I was amazed this afternoon to hear Mick Bates, in his opening address, suddenly having been converted against TAN 8. TAN 8 was welcomed by the Liberal Democrats and by Mick Bates before windfarms were proposed in the Montgomery constituency. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

Mick Bates: The Minister knows that what he has just put on the record is not true, because I have always taken a rational and fair view of TAN 8, and it was there, by your own admission, to encourage all sources of renewable energy. You have concentrated on one form of renewable energy, which you and I both know is a deflection that allows you not to spend any money on other sources that are more applicable to rural Wales—

5.20 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: And which are not appropriate in Montgomery. In July, when TAN 8 came out, I do not remember any criticism of it; in fact, it was widely

Nghymru. Nid oes angen cwango arall arnom. Yr ydym eisoes yn elwa o gael cyngor annibynnol am y mathau o ostyngiadau mewn nwyon tŷ gwydr y dylem fod yn anelu atynt, er enghraifft gan y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Lygredd Amgylcheddol. Mae gwybodaeth am ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru eisoes yn cael ei darparu'n annibynnol gan y Ganolfan Genedlaethol dros Dechnoleg Amgylcheddol. Nid oes diben cael corff ar wahân i Gymru i ddarparu gwybodaeth sydd eisoes ar gael yn hwylus, o gofio'r gost y byddai hynny yn ei golygu.

Trof at y gwelliant olaf—gwelliant 4—y byddwn yn ei gefnogi y prynhawn yma, oherwydd yr ydym am sicrhau bod pob cartref yn cael ei godi yn unol â'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mewn egwyddor, yr ydym yn fodlon derbyn datganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladu, ond byddai'n rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn y byddai hynny'n ei olygu yn ymarferol, a fyddai'n cynnwys edrych ar y goblygiadau o ran adnoddau, ac a fyddai'r goblygiadau o ran adnoddau yn cyfiawnhau inni ymgymryd â'r pwerau. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu y prynhawn yma o glywed bod Mick Bates, yn ei anerchiad agoriadol, wedi cael trôedigaeth sydyn yn erbyn TAN 8. Cafodd TAN 8 ei groesawu gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a chan Mick Bates cyn i ffermydd gwynt gael eu cynnig yn etholaeth Trefaldwyn. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

Mick Bates: Gŵyr y Gweinidog nad yw'r hyn y mae newydd ei ddweud ar goedd yn wir, oherwydd y mae gennyf safbwynt rhesymegol a theg tuag at TAN 8 erioed, ac yr oedd yno, yn ôl eich addefiad eich hun, i annog pob ffynhonnell o ynni adnewyddadwy. Yr ydych wedi canolbwyntio ar un ffurf ar ynni adnewyddadwy, y gwyddoch chi a minnau mai gwyrriad ydyw sy'n caniatáu ichi beidio â gwario dim arian ar ffynonellau eraill sy'n fwy cymwys i Gymru wledig—

Carwyn Jones: Ac nad ydynt yn briodol yn Nhrefaldwyn. Ym mis Gorffennaf, pan ymddangosodd TAN 8, ni chofiaf glywed dim beirniadaeth arno; yn wir, cafodd ei

welcomed. I spoke at a National Assembly sustainable energy group meeting and TAN 8 was widely welcomed. Wind is the most sustainable form of energy and, at that time, we were talking about a situation in which wind turbines were thought of as a marvellous addition to reducing climate change—it seems that that has changed.

Helen Mary Jones: I share your concern about Mick Bates's apparent change of heart, but I think that it might be appropriate, in the context of this debate, to draw the Chamber's attention to a certain local difficulty that you, Minister, had with an offshore windfarm.

Carwyn Jones: Quite so, and it was a position that I took long before I was a Minister. That was to do with particular circumstances there, but the one thing that I did not do was to change my mind, and that is the important point to remember here. It is sad that TAN 8 is suddenly seen as concentrating entirely on windfarms, because it does not—TAN 8 concentrates on renewable energy.

There was a harsh suggestion from Mick that wind turbines, which have now suddenly become very ugly, should all go to south Wales. Of course, there are at least two strategic search areas in south Wales, there is one in Carmarthenshire, one in Ceredigion, one in Denbighshire and one in Montgomeryshire. It can hardly be suggested, although I have heard it suggested by some, that this is a conspiracy against mid Wales. In fact, the strategic search areas are to be found across the whole of Wales and it is for local authorities to decide on whether windfarm applications should be allowed.

Finally, Llywydd, may I leave the Assembly with this thought? We were accused of being daydreamers in the Labour Party—that was the word used—and not people who took practical action on the ground. I will say this: the greatest daydream of all occurred when a Liberal leader stood on his feet and said, 'Go back to your constituencies, and prepare for

groesawu'n eang. Siaredais yng nghyfarfod grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a chafodd TAN 8 ei groesawu'n eang. Gwynt yw'r math mwyaf cynaliadwy o ynni a, bryd hynny, yr oeddem yn siarad am sefyllfa lle'r oedd tyrbinau gwynt yn cael eu hystyried yn ychwanegiad gwych er mwyn lleihau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd—mae'n ymddangos bod hynny wedi newid.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn rhannu eich pryder bod Mick Bates yn ôl pob golwg wedi newid ei feddwl, ond credaf ei bod yn briodol efallai, yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon, tynnu sylw'r Siambr at anhawster lleol neilltuol a gawsoch chi, Weinidog, gyda fferm wynt ar y môr.

Carwyn Jones: Yn union, ac yr oedd yn safbwynt a gymerais ymhell cyn imi fod yn Weinidog. Yr oedd a wnelo hynny ag amgylchiadau neilltuol yno, ond yr un peth nas gwneuthum oedd newid fy meddwl, a dyna'r pwynt pwysig i'w gofio yma. Mae'n drist bod TAN 8 yn cael ei weld yn sydyn fel rhywbeth sy'n canolbwyntio'n llwyr ar ffermydd gwynt, oherwydd nid yw'n gwneud hynny—mae TAN 8 yn canolbwyntio ar ynni adnewyddadwy.

Cafwyd awgrym cas gan Mick y dylai tyrbinau gwynt, sydd yn sydyn yn awr wedi troi'n hyll iawn, i gyd fynd i dde Cymru. Wrth gwrs, mae o leiaf ddwy ardal chwilio strategol yn ne Cymru, mae un yn sir Gaerfyrddin, un yng Ngheredigion, un yn sir Ddinbych ac un yn sir Drefaldwyn. Prin y gellir awgrymu, er fy mod wedi clywed hynny'n cael ei awgrymu gan rai, fod hyn yn gynllwyn yn erbyn y canolbarth. Yn wir, mae'r ardaloedd chwilio strategol i'w canfod ar draws Cymru gyfan a mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yw penderfynu a ddylai ceisiadau am ffermydd gwynt gael eu caniatáu.

Yn olaf, Lywydd, a gaf adael y Cynulliad gyda'r syniad hwn? Cawsom ein cyhuddo o fod yn freuddwydwyr yn y Blaid Lafur—dyna'r gair a ddefnyddiwyd—ac nid yn bobl sy'n gweithredu'n ymarferol ar lawr gwlad. Dywedaf hyn: digwyddodd y freuddwyd fwyaf ohonynt oll pan safodd arweinydd Rhyddfrydol ar ei draed a dweud, 'Ewch yn

Government’.

Michael German: The Minister clearly has not listened very hard, because colleagues all over Scotland and here have been on their way to Government, and we have been in Government. He must have missed it; I do not know why. He is trying to turn today’s debate into a sort of attack or defence—I do not quite know what mode he wants to be in. He is offering a defence of what he has already done, but he does not need to be that defensive, because this motion is intended to give added strength to the Minister. It is to give him extra things that he can do to make it more accessible to people who are already there, who need to know what is going on. You would think that his whole strategy was under threat. He has had two turns at this. In the first he said, ‘Of course, we are opposed to windfarms’, and in the second he said, ‘Of course, the policy is all about other forms of renewable energy’. You cannot have it both ways, Minister.

This motion calls for a clear headline indicator that combines the two tensions in our society. Glyn was absolutely right that there is a tension in our society between economic development and the pressure to grow and, on the other hand, the need for sustainable communities and a sustainable environment and economy. All the Minister has done is to say, ‘I have got two figures there and I am not going to put them anywhere near each other, because it might be seen as giving in to this motion’. For goodness’ sake, if that is all that is holding him back, that argument is of the weakest kind. If he wants to, he could simply say, ‘We will put them alongside each other and divide one by the other and make it clear that we are going to draw a graph and show how it is working in Wales, Scotland and England’, so that we all know where we are.

The point about this debate is that it is at the heart of what we do. Glyn was absolutely right: there is no more important debate. I object to the way in which the Minister has

ôl i’ch etholaethau, a pharatowch i lywodraethu’.

Michael German: Nid yw’r Gweinidog yn amlwg wedi gwranddo’n astud iawn, oherwydd y mae cyd-Aelodau ar hyd a lled yr Alban ac yma wedi bod yn paratoi i lywodraethu, ac wedi bod mewn Llywodraeth. Rhaid ei fod heb sylwi ar hynny; ni wn pam. Mae’n ceisio troi’r ddadl heddiw yn rhyw fath o ymosodiad neu amddiffyniad—ni wn yn iawn pa ddull y mae am ei ddefnyddio. Mae’n cynnig fel amddiffyniad yr hyn y mae wedi ei wneud yn barod, ond nid oes angen iddo fod mor amddiffynnol, oherwydd y mae’r cynnig hwn wedi ei fwriadu i roi nerth ychwanegol i’r Gweinidog. Mae’n rhoi iddo bethau ychwanegol y gall eu gwneud i wneud y sefyllfa’n fwy hygyrch i’r bobl sydd yno’n barod, y mae angen iddynt wybod beth sy’n digwydd. Byddech yn meddwl bod ei strategaeth gyfan o dan fygythiad. Mae wedi cael dau gynnig ar hyn. Yn y cyntaf dywedodd, ‘Wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn erbyn ffermydd gwynt’, ac yn yr ail dywedodd, ‘Wrth gwrs, mae a wnelo’r polisi yn llwyr â mathau eraill o ynni adnewyddadwy’. Ni allwch ei chael hi’r ddwy ffordd, Weinidog.

Mae’r cynnig hwn yn galw am brif ddangosydd clir sy’n cyfuno’r ddau densiwn yn ein cymdeithas. Yr oedd Glyn yn hollol gywir bod tensiwn yn ein cymdeithas rhwng datblygu economaidd a’r pwysau i dyfu ac, ar y llaw arall, yr angen am gymunedau cynaliadwy ac amgylchedd ac economi gynaliadwy. Y cyfan y mae’r Gweinidog wedi ei wneud yw dweud, ‘Mae gennyf ddau ffigur ac nid wyf yn mynd i’w rhoi ar gyfyl ei gilydd, oherwydd gallai hynny gael ei weld fel ildio i’r cynnig hwn’. Er mwyn popeth, os mai dyna’r cyfan sy’n ei ddal yn ôl, mae’r ddadl honno gyda’r gwannaf. Os yw’n dymuno, gallai ddweud yn syml, ‘Fe’u rhoddwn ochr yn ochr â’i gilydd a rhannu un â’r llall a’i gwneud yn glir ein bod yn mynd i wneud graff a dangos sut y mae’n gweithio yng Nghymru, yr Alban a Lloegr’, fel ein bod i gyd yn gwybod ble’r ydym.

Y pwynt am y ddadl hon yw ei bod yn ganolog i’r hyn a wnawn. Yr oedd Glyn yn hollol gywir: nid oes dadl bwysicach. Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu’r modd y mae’r Gweinidog

tried not to seek a cross-party agreement on this issue. There are two big issues facing our society: pensions and the environment. If any Government or political party thinks that it can solve those issues on its own, without consensus and broad agreement, then it is mistaken. I hope that the Minister will reflect on what he has tried to do this afternoon. The intention of this motion is to turn ambition, which we see in the documents, into action. We want to be able to count what can be counted and we want to count what is easy to understand. Those are the two fundamentals that lie behind this. Targets on green jobs are necessary, because if you do not count, you do not know where you are. I think that we also need to take that issue on board.

I say to the Minister that he is again engaging in diversionary tactics with regard to amendment 3. I will not speak to amendment 3, but, basically, it does not ask for a new body, but for an independent one. All it requires is an independent body to undertake this work. The Minister was full of high hopes, saying that it might take three years, and that in three years' time it will all be in place. Well, in three years' time, the world could be a very different place if we do not take action now.

I hope that Members will decide that what matters is what the Assembly can do together to address this crucial issue, and will vote for all the amendments and for the motion.

wedi ceisio peidio â chael cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y mater hwn. Mae dau fater mawr yn wynebu ein cymdeithas: pensiynau a'r amgylchedd. Os oes unrhyw Lywodraeth neu blaid wleidyddol yn credu y gall ddatrys y materion hynny ar ei phen ei hun, heb gonsensws a chytundeb cyffredinol, yna mae'n camgymryd. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn pwysu a mesur yr hyn y mae wedi ceisio ei wneud y prynhawn yma. Bwriad y cynnig hwn yw troi uchelgais, a welwn yn y dogfennau, yn weithredu. Yr ydym am allu cyfrif yr hyn y mae modd ei gyfrif ac yr ydym am gyfrif yr hyn sy'n hawdd ei ddeall. Dyna'r ddau beth sylfaenol sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Rhaid cael targedau o ran swyddi gwyrdd, oherwydd onid ydych yn cyfrif, ni allwch wybod ble'r ydych. Credaf fod angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny hefyd.

Dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog ei fod yn ceisio troi ein sylw eto mewn perthynas â gwelliant 3. Nid wyf am siarad am welliant 3, ond, yn y bôn, nid yw'n gofyn am gorff newydd, ond am un annibynnol. Y cyfan sy'n ofynnol yw corff annibynnol i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn. Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn llawn gobeithion mawr, yn dweud y gallai gymryd tair blynedd, ac ymhen tair blynedd y bydd popeth ar waith. Wel, ymhen tair blynedd, gallai'r byd fod yn lle gwahanol iawn oni weithredwn yn awr.

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau yn penderfynu mai'r hyn sy'n bwysig yw beth y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud i roi sylw i'r mater hollbwysig hwn, ac y byddant yn pleidleisio dros y gwelliannau i gyd a thros y cynnig.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 14, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 1: For 14, Abstain 9, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 14, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 14, Abstain 10, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

Gwelliant 4: O blaid 39, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 2.
Amendment 4: For 39, Abstain 10, Against 2.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Essex, Sue
Morgan, Rhodri

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM2937 as amended:

Cynnig NDM2937 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1) believes that sustainable development should be at the heart of Government actions, not simply words, and calls on the Welsh

1) yn credu mai datblygu cynaliadwy ddylai fod wrth wraidd gweithredoedd y Llywodraeth, nid geiriau'n unig, ac yn galw

Assembly Government to:

a) publish an annual index in the sustainable development report, measuring clearly economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions;

b) implement a green jobs strategy, with clear and measurable targets for success, similar to that pursued in Scotland;

c) develop and publish energy-efficiency ratings for public buildings in Wales; and

2) calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to seek the powers over building regulations in order to ensure that all new homes are built to the highest standards of energy efficiency.

ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) cyhoeddi mynegai blynyddol yn yr adroddiad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn mesur yn glir y twf economaidd yn erbyn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid;

b) rhoi ar waith strategaeth werdd ar gyfer swyddi, gyda thargedau clir a mesuradwy ar gyfer llwyddiant, yn debyg i'r hyn sydd ar y gweill yn yr Alban;

c) datblygu a chyhoeddi graddfeydd effeithlonrwydd ynni ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru; ac

2) yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i geisio cael y pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladu er mwyn sicrhau bod pob cartref newydd yn cael ei adeiladu i'r safonau uchaf o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amended motion: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion defeated.*

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Presiding Officer: I invite the Business Minister to propose a procedural motion to extend the meeting, following my declaration under Standing Order No. 6.21 that I am satisfied that insufficient time is available to debate the final business for today.

Y Llywydd: Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol i ymestyn y cyfarfod, yn dilyn fy natganiad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21 fy mod yn fodlon nad oes digon o amser ar gael i gynnal dadl ar ein busnes olaf heddiw.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 6.15 p.m.

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.15 p.m.

Y Llywydd: A oes 10 Aelod o blaid y cynnig? Gwelaf fod. Galwaf felly am bleidlais.

The Presiding Officer: Are there 10 Members in favour of the motion? I see that there are. I therefore call for a vote.

*Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.
Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Davies, Janet
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Neagle, Lynne
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru
The Annual Report of the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales**

Motion (NDM2938): to propose that	Cynnig (NDM2938): cynnig bod
<i>the National Assembly for Wales</i>	<i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru</i>
<i>acting under section 142 of the Health and Social Care (Community Health and Standards) Act 2003, notes the report of the Chief Inspector of Social Services 'Social Services in Wales 2004-05'.</i>	<i>gan weithredu dan adran 142 Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Iechyd Cymunedol a Safonau) 2003, yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Arolygydd Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol 'Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2004-05'.</i>
Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>calls on the Government to provide greater support for local authorities to establish a collaborative approach to improve social services.</i>	<i>yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddarparu mwy o gefnogaeth i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sefydlu dull gweithredu ar y cyd i wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.</i>
Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>Notes with concern the dramatic increase since 1998 of looked-after children.</i>	<i>Yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd dramatig ers 1998 yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal.</i>
Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that local authorities improve the percentage of looked-after children beginning with a care plan in place.</i>	<i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwella canran y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd â chynllun gofal yn ei le o'r cychwyn.</i>
Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>calls on the Welsh Local Government Association to ensure a sustained political priority towards the funding of social services.</i>	<i>yn galw ar Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i sicrhau blaenoriaeth wleidyddol barhaus o ran ariannu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.</i>
Amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Assembly Government to take action to improve staff recruitment and retention to achieve a workforce which is sufficient in numbers, skills and levels of qualification to ensure high-quality provision of social services.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Daives, gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Lisa Francis a gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Datganaf gyfyngiad amser ar siaradwyr. Bydd gan y Gweinidog 15 munud i agor a chloi'r ddadl a bydd gan y sawl sy'n cynnig y gwelliannau bum munud yr un. Bydd gan siaradwyr eraill dri munud yr un.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

acting under section 142 of the Health and Social Care (Community Health and Standards) Act 2003, notes the report of the Chief Inspector of Social Services 'Social Services in Wales 2004-05'. (NDM2938)

The report was published in January of this year and considered by the Health and Social Services Committee in February. This debate provides the Assembly with the opportunity to discuss the services and support provided through social services across Wales. These are important services, and we are all committed to achieving high-quality services that respond effectively to people's needs.

5.30 p.m.

About 150,000 people, just over 23,000 of them children and young people, received support from social services in 2004-05. The expenditure on these services stood at £987 million, 25 per cent of which was spent on children's services.

In last year's report, the chief inspector

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd ati i wella'r broses recriwtio a chadw staff er mwyn creu gweithlu sy'n ddigonol o ran niferoedd, sgiliau a lefelau cymwysterau i sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o ansawdd uchel.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Lisa Francis and amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I announce a time limit on speakers. The Minister will have 15 minutes to open and close the debate and those proposing amendments will have five minutes each. Other speakers will have three minutes each.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

gan weithredu dan adran 142 Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Iechyd Cymunedol a Safonau) 2003, yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Arolygydd Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol 'Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2004-05'. (NDM2938)

Cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad ym mis Ionawr eleni ac fe'i hystyriwyd gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Chwefror. Mae'r ddadl hon yn rhoi'r cyfle i'r Cynulliad i drafod y gwasanaethau a'r cymorth a ddarperir drwy'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar draws Cymru. Mae'r rhain yn wasanaethau pwysig, ac yr ydym i gyd wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau gwasanaethau o ansawdd uchel sy'n ymateb yn effeithiol i anghenion pobl.

Derbyniodd tua 150,000 o bobl, ychydig dros 23,000 ohonynt yn blant a phobl ifanc, gymorth gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn 2004-05. Yr oedd y gwariant ar y gwasanaethau hyn yn £987 miliwn, a gwariwyd 25 y cant o'r swm hwnnw ar wasanaethau plant.

Yn adroddiad y llynedd, cydnabu'r prif

recognised that there was much good practice taking place across Wales, but concluded that services overall were not of a standard with which we could be uniformly satisfied. He stated that the need for improvement must increase. He challenged authorities to give priority to bring this about and to develop ways of working together to share and learn from best practice. I have delivered this message strongly in all my dealings with social services authorities, and wish to recognise the leadership being shown by the Welsh Local Government Association and the Association of Directors of Social Services during the last year.

Strong leadership is also being shown in authorities such as Conwy and Flintshire, which have received commendable inspection outcomes, and particularly in Torfaen, which has shown in its recent review that it has made significant progress since the first review took place five years ago. There is also evidence that progress is being made by Cardiff and Blaenau Gwent authorities, where target setting and monitoring arrangements were put in place by the chief inspector under the protocol for responding to serious concern.

The commitment and dedication of staff is emphasised by the chief inspector, and I fully endorse his comments. Employers must continue to work together on a one-sector, one-workforce basis on the recruitment and retention of staff, and on improving qualification levels across the workforce. An improved-quality workforce will mean better services and improved quality for service users.

Particular service improvements are seen in the reduced delayed transfers of care, which are taking place from hospitals across Wales. The many examples of the new services that are designed to promote independence and arrangements to protect vulnerable adults are contributing to this. Areas that need particular attention are highlighted, including getting right back to basics in social work practice—in other words, making sure that the assessment and care management arrangements are correct, improving

arolygydd fod llawer o enghreifftiau o arferion da i'w gweld ledled Cymru, ond daeth i'r casgliad nad oedd y gwasanaethau at ei gilydd yn cyrraedd safon a oedd yn ei fodloni'n llwyr. Dywedodd fod rhaid i bethau wella. Heriodd yr awdurdodau i roi blaenoriaeth i gyflawni hyn a datblygu ffyrdd o weithio gyda'i gilydd i rannu a dysgu oddi wrth arferion gorau. Yr wyf wedi cyfleu'r neges hon yn ddiamwys yn fy holl drafodaethau gyda'r awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a hoffwn gydnabod yr arweiniad a ddangosir gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

Mae arweiniad cadarn i'w weld hefyd ymhlith awdurdodau megis Conwy a sir y Fflint, sydd wedi derbyn canlyniadau canmoladwy yn eu harolygiadau, ac yn enwedig Tor-faen, sydd wedi dangos yn ei arolwg diweddar ei fod wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol ers cynnal yr arolwg cyntaf bum mlynedd yn ôl. Mae tystiolaeth hefyd yn dangos bod awdurdodau Caerdydd a Blaenau Gwent yn gwneud cynnydd, lle y cyflwynwyd mesurau i bennu targedau a threfniadau monitro gan y prif arolygydd o dan y protocol i ymateb i bryderon difrifol.

Mae'r prif arolygydd wedi tynnu sylw at ymrwymiad ac ymroddiad y staff, ac yr wyf yn cymeradwyo ei sylwadau'n llwyr. Rhaid i gyflogwyr ddal ati i weithio gyda'i gilydd ar lefel un sector, un gweithlu o ran recriwtio a chadw staff, ac i wella lefelau cymwysterau ar draws y gweithlu. Bydd gweithlu o ansawdd gwell yn golygu gwasanaethau gwell ac ansawdd gwell i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

Gellir gweld gwelliannau penodol i wasanaethau yn y gostyngiad mewn oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, sy'n digwydd o ysbytai ledled Cymru. Mae'r enghreifftiau niferus o wasanaethau newydd sydd wedi eu cynllunio i hybu annibyniaeth a mesurau i amddiffyn oedolion bregus yn cyfrannu at hyn. Tynnir sylw at y meysydd lle y mae angen sylw arbennig, gan gynnwys mynd yn ôl at yr hanfodion mewn arferion gwaith cymdeithasol—mewn geiriau eraill, sicrhau bod y trefniadau asesu a rheoli gofal yn

management information and performance management in authorities, and focusing on good service outcomes.

Commissioning must improve, and inconsistencies in performance have to be tackled. The report shows some variability across Wales and highlights inconsistencies, particularly in children's services. High thresholds and insufficiently targeted preventative and support services for children and their families need to be dealt with in particular.

At the same time, services must be reshaped to meet the needs of the future. Social services and local government as a whole will need to strengthen their collaboration internally and across boundaries with their partners. Working better to get at the interface between health and social care will deliver the major improvements and outcomes for service users.

In conclusion, the challenges are great, but there is also much upon which we can build. I welcome the opportunity that the report provides to take a balanced view of the contribution that social services make, and I look forward to Members' contributions.

*Daeth Peter Black i'r Gadair am 5.33 p.m.
Peter Black took the Chair at 5.33 p.m.*

Helen Mary Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Government to provide greater support for local authorities to establish a collaborative approach to improve social services.

I begin my brief contribution to the debate by thanking the inspector and his team. The report provides us with a huge range of very important information, and it identifies areas where we need to take action. I am sure that we are all very grateful for that.

I will speak mainly to amendment 1, but I

gywir, gwella'r dull o reoli gwybodaeth a rheoli perfformiad mewn awdurdodau, a chanolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau da i wasanaethau.

Rhaid gwella comisiynu, a rhaid mynd i'r afael ag anghysonderau mewn perfformiad. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos rhywfaint o amrywiadau ar draws Cymru ac mae'n tynnu sylw at anghysonderau, yn enwedig o ran gwasanaethau plant. Yr hyn sydd angen delio â hwy yn arbennig yw trothwyon uchel a gwasanaethau ataliol a chefnogi i blant sydd heb eu targedu'n ddigonol.

Ar yr un pryd, rhaid ail-lunio gwasanaethau er mwyn diwallu anghenion y dyfodol. Bydd rhaid i wasanaethau cymdeithasol a llywodraeth leol yn eu cyfanrwydd gryfhau eu trefniadau cydweithredu mewnol ac ar draws ffiniau gyda'u partneriaid. Bydd gweithio'n well i gyrraedd at y rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn arwain at gyflawni'r prif welliannau a chanlyniadau i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

I gloi, mae'r heriau'n rhai sylweddol, ond hefyd mae llawer wedi'i wneud eisoes y gallwn adeiladu arno. Croesawaf y cyfle a geir yn yr adroddiad i gymryd golwg wrthrychol ar y cyfraniad y mae gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn ei wneud, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniadau'r Aelodau.

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddarparu mwy o gefnogaeth i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sefydlu dull gweithredu ar y cyd i wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad byr at y ddadl drwy ddiolch i'r adolygydd a'i dîm. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi amrywiaeth enfawr o wybodaeth bwysig inni, ac mae'n tynnu sylw at feysydd lle y mae angen inni weithredu. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn ddiolchgar am hynny.

Yr wyf am gyfeirio at welliant 1 yn bennaf,

will also touch on some other issues. With regard to amendment 1, the report, as the Minister said, highlights geographical variations in performance across a range of services. We cannot tolerate that in the long term, as I am sure we all agree. We must have a basic minimum provision of service across the whole country, and I refer Assembly Members back to the very moving contribution that Huw Lewis made in his debate about looked-after children, when he expressed sentiments with which we would all agree.

It is true that the Welsh Local Government Association is doing a lot of work with local authorities to promote more co-operative working, but we believe that the National Assembly Government needs to look at every opportunity to further promote that co-operation, and perhaps, eventually, insist on it. There are things that could be done through strengthened guidance and funding streams. The Minister will note that we have not been prescriptive in the amendment, but we urge him to accept it and to act seriously upon it. Some local authorities will never be big enough to deliver alone, and we need to see more of the good work that has been going on in promoting and sharing expertise, with different authorities taking leads on different crucial matters.

The document that we are all waiting for, 'Designed for Care', may give the Minister an opportunity to provide some of that guidance around more co-operative working between local authorities. I would be grateful if the Minister could tell us today when he hopes to publish that, because it seems that the focus is on 'Designed for Life' and on health when we need to focus on social care at the same time.

Children's services remain a major area of concern, and we are still failing children on a large scale. We are still unable to invest enough in preventative services in many counties, and there is still a real problem getting a high enough political and institutional priority across all authorities. I pay tribute to the WLGA for what it has done

and byddaf yn crybwyll rhai pwyntiau eraill hefyd. Gyda golwg ar welliant 1, mae'r adroddiad, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, yn tynnu sylw at amrywiadau daearyddol mewn perfformiad ar draws amrywiaeth o wasanaethau. Ni allwn oddef hynny yn y tymor hir, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno â hynny. Rhaid inni gael darpariaeth sylfaenol ar draws y wlad gyfan, a chyfeiriai Aelodau'r Cynulliad at y cyfraniad teimladwy a wnaeth Huw Lewis yn ei ddadl am blant sy'n derbyn gofal, pan fynegodd deimladau y byddem i gyd yn cytuno â hwy.

Mae'n wir bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru'n gwneud llawer o waith gydag awdurdodau lleol i hyrwyddo mwy o gydweithredu, ond credaf y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru edrych ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo'r cydweithrediad hwnnw ymhellach, ac efallai, yn y diwedd, fynnu bod hynny'n digwydd. Mae pethau y gellid eu gwneud drwy ganllawiau a ffrydiau ariannu cadarnach. Bydd y Gweinidog yn sylwi nad ydym wedi bod yn gyfarwyddol yn y gwelliant, ond yr ydym yn pwysu arno i'w dderbyn ac i weithredu o ddifrif arno. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol na fyddant fyth yn ddigon mawr i gyflawni ar eu pennau eu hunain, ac mae angen inni weld mwy o'r gwaith da sydd wedi bod yn digwydd i hyrwyddo a rhannu arbenigeddau, gyda gwahanol awdurdodau'n cymryd yr awenau mewn gwahanol agweddau allweddol.

Efallai y bydd y ddogfen yr ydym i gyd yn aros amdani, 'Cynllun Gofal', yn rhoi cyfle i'r Gweinidog gynnig peth o'r arweiniad hwnnw o ran mwy o gydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog yn gallu dweud wrthym heddiw pa bryd y mae'n gobeithio ei chyhoeddi, oherwydd y mae'n ymddangos bod y pwyslais yn cael ei roi ar 'Gynllun Oes' ac ar iechyd pan fo angen inni ganolbwyntio ar ofal cymdeithasol ar yr un pryd.

Mae gwasanaethau plant yn parhau'n faes sy'n destun pryder difrifol, ac yr ydym yn dal i fethu â chyflawni ar ran plant ar raddfa fawr. Nid ydym yn gallu buddsoddi digon mewn gwasanaethau ataliol mewn nifer o siroedd, ac mae problem wirioneddol yn bodoli o ran sicrhau bod hyn yn cael blaenoriaeth wleidyddol a sefydliadol ddigon

on promoting the political responsibility, but in the end I refer us back to Huw Lewis's comments about our being corporate parents. I still do not sense that we have a national understanding of that responsibility.

The Minister will be aware that the Children Act 2004 requires all local authorities to appoint an officer as the lead director for children and young people's services, and to designate a member as a lead member. What progress have local authorities made on delivering those requirements? How many local authorities have done that, and what guidance can the Minister provide to local authorities to ensure that they do it?

On adult services, the report highlights the real problems that we continue to have with the health and social care interface. Although there is some good news on delayed transfers of care, there is also some bad news. The Minister needs to address that much more vigorously. I am hugely concerned about the lack of national consistency, with local health boards assessing social and health needs in different ways across Wales. There is an urgent need for national standards to ensure that those decisions are compatible with the law. Many of them are not now, as we are, increasingly, discovering.

With regard to adult services, the inspectorate also notices that demographic changes will bring increased demand for services and the need to provide different sorts of services, emphasising prevention and promoting independence. I am sure that we would all agree with that perspective. However, does the Minister agree that changing and developing services should be about an increased investment rather than a reduced investment, and that any reprovisioning of services, particularly for older and vulnerable service users, needs to be done sensitively and consulted upon effectively?

uchel ar draws pob awdurdod lleol. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged i CLILC am yr hyn y mae wedi'i wneud i hyrwyddo cyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol, ond yn y diwedd cyfeiriaf yn ôl at sylwadau Huw Lewis amdanom fel rhieni corfforaethol. Nid wyf yn synhwyro bod gennym ddealltwriaeth genedlaethol eto o'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod Deddf Plant 2004 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i bob awdurdod lleol benodi swyddog fel y cyfarwyddwr arweiniol ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant a phobl ifanc, a dynodi aelod fel aelod arweiniol. Pa gynnydd y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi'i wneud o ran cyflawni'r gofynion hynny? Sawl awdurdod lleol sydd wedi gwneud hyn, a pha arweiniad y gall y Gweinidog ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn gwneud hynny?

O ran gwasanaethau i oedolion, mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at y problemau gwirioneddol yr ydym yn dal i'w hwynebu gyda'r rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Er bod peth newyddion da o ran yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, mae peth newyddion drwg hefyd. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog fynd ati'n fwy dygn i roi sylw i hynny. Yr wyf yn bryderus dros ben ynghylch y diffyg cysondeb cenedlaethol, gydag anghenion cymdeithasol ac iechyd yn cael eu hasesu mewn ffyrdd gwahanol gan y byrddau iechyd lleol ar draws Cymru. Mae angen brys am safonau cenedlaethol i sicrhau bod y penderfyniadau hynny'n gydnaws â'r gyfraith. Nid yw hynny'n wir yn achos llawer, fel yr ydym yn darganfod fwyfwy.

Gyda golwg ar wasanaethau i oedolion, mae'r arolygiaeth wedi nodi hefyd y bydd newidiadau demograffig yn arwain at fwy o alw am wasanaethau a'r angen i ddarparu gwahanol fathau o wasanaethau, a fydd yn rhoi pwyslais ar waith ataliol a hybu annibyniaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno â'r safbwynt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylai newid a datblygu gwasanaethau olygu cynnydd yn hytrach na gostyngiad yn y buddsoddi, a bod angen i unrhyw newid o ran darparu gwasanaethau, yn enwedig i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau hŷn a bregus, gael ei wneud mewn ffordd sensitif a bod ymgynghori effeithiol yn ei gylch?

In that context, is the Minister aware of the situation in Carmarthenshire, where the Labour and Independent administration has published plans in the newspapers to close some key day services without consulting staff or the press? Could the Minister or his officials look at that situation, because I believe that it may be in breach of some of his Government's guidance, particularly with regard to consultation? I am sure that we would all agree that changes to services must be made sensitively and, in the first place, in consultation with those who use them and the staff who provide them.

In the long term, we will need far greater investment, and we will all need to continue to give a high political priority to ensuring that all the issues raised in the inspectorate's report are effectively addressed. I trust that the Minister will give this priority. Inevitably, we talk a great deal about healthcare, but we need to give priority to social services, because those service users are often people who, for one reason or another, cannot speak effectively for themselves.

Plaid Cymru will support the other amendments and the motion.

Jonathan Morgan: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with concern the dramatic increase since 1998 of looked-after children.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that local authorities improve the percentage of looked-after children beginning with a care plan in place.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Local Government Association to ensure a sustained political priority towards the funding of social

Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a yw'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa yn sir Gaerfyrddin, lle y mae'r weinyddiaeth Lafur ac Annibynnol wedi cyhoeddi cynlluniau yn y papurau newydd i gau rhai gwasanaethau dydd allweddol heb ymgynghori â'r staff na'r wasg? A all y Gweinidog neu ei swyddogion edrych ar y sefyllfa honno, oherwydd yr wyf yn ofni y gall fod yn torri rhai o ganllawiau ei Lywodraeth, yn enwedig o ran ymgynghori? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod rhaid i newidiadau i wasanaethau gael eu gwneud mewn ffordd sensitif ac, yn y lle cyntaf, mewn ymgynghoriad â'r rhai sy'n eu defnyddio a'r staff sy'n eu darparu.

Yn y tymor hir, bydd rhaid wrth lawer mwy o fuddsoddiad, a bydd rhaid inni i gyd roi blaenoriaeth wleidyddol uchel i sicrhau ein bod yn delio'n effeithiol â'r holl bwyntiau sy'n codi yn adroddiad yr arolygiaeth. Hyderaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i hyn. Mae'n anochel ein bod yn trafod llawer ar ofal iechyd, ond rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth i wasanaethau cymdeithasol, oherwydd bod defnyddwyr y gwasanaethau yn aml yn bobl na allant, am ryw reswm neu'i gilydd, fynegi eu barn yn eglur.

Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r gwelliannau eraill a'r cynnig.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd dramatig ers 1998 yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwella canran y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd â chynllun gofal yn ei le o'r cychwyn.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i sicrhau blaenoriaeth wleidyddol barhaus o ran ariannu gwasanaethau

services.

I congratulate the Chief Inspector of Social Services and his team on their excellent work in attempting to raise standards in what is a tricky area of public services, not least because, in the past, many local authorities have not treated it with the highest political and financial priority. There are some notable improvements, although there are also some notable concerns.

I intend to concentrate purely on children's services. This is a substantial report, and it would be difficult to get to grips with all of the issues that the chief inspector has raised in the time available. However, children's services are fundamental, particularly when you examine the range of criticisms made in recent years of the way in which they have been developed.

5.40 p.m.

Our amendment 2 is on the growth in the number of looked-after children. In 1998, there were 3,000 looked-after children in Wales. That figure now stands at 4,315, which is a 44 per cent increase. We need to look at that in the context of several other issues, not least the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales report, of which we have all had copies and particularly page 21 of that report, which talks about the research that the inspectorate has done into the levels of care and planning in the care system. It surveyed 30 per cent of private and local authority children's homes in Wales and found that 14 per cent of them had inadequate arrangements for ensuring that healthcare needs were met, including access to appropriate support and advice. That underpins one of the reasons why Huw Lewis brought that piece of legislation to us last week. We need to look at this in the context of how services have been developed and of how care plans have been introduced. It is not only worrying that we have seen an increase in the number of children in care who are termed 'looked after', but a significant proportion of those looked-after children are still not receiving the sort of services that they deserve.

cymdeithasol.

Llongyfarchaf y Prif Arolygydd Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'i ddim am eu gwaith rhagorol wrth geisio codi safonau yn yr hyn sy'n faes anodd yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac nid yn unig am nad oedd llawer o awdurdodau lleol, yn y gorffennol, wedi rhoi digon o flaenoriaeth wleidyddol ac ariannol iddo. Bu rhai gwelliannau nodedig, er bod rhai pryderon nodedig yn aros hefyd.

Bwriadaf ganolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl ar wasanaethau plant. Mae hwn yn adroddiad sylweddol, a byddai'n anodd delio â'r holl bwyntiau a godwyd gan y prif arolygydd yn yr amser sydd ar gael. Fodd bynnag, mae gwasanaethau plant yn rhai sylfaenol, yn enwedig wrth ystyried yr holl feirniadaeth a gafwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf ynglŷn â'r ffordd y maent wedi cael eu datblygu.

Mae ein gwelliant 2 yn ymwneud â'r twf yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Yn 1998, yr oedd 3,000 o blant yn derbyn gofal yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw bellach yn 4,315, sy'n gynydd o 44 y cant. Mae angen inni edrych ar hyn yng nghyd-destun sawl mater arall, ac nid y lleiaf o'r rhain yw adroddiad Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru, adroddiad y mae pob un ohonom wedi derbyn copi ohono ac yn enwedig tudalen 21 yn yr adroddiad hwnnw, sy'n sôn am yr ymchwil a gynhaliwyd gan yr arolygiaeth i lefelau gofal a chynllunio yn y system gofal. Arolygwyd 30 y cant o gartrefi plant preifat ac awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru a gwelwyd bod gan 14 y cant ohonynt drefniadau annigonol i sicrhau bod anghenion gofal iechyd yn cael eu diwallu, gan gynnwys mynediad at gymorth a chynghor priodol. Mae hynny'n ategu un o'r rhesymau pam y daeth Huw Lewis â'r darn hwnnw o ddeddfwriaeth atom yr wythnos diwethaf. Rhaid inni edrych ar hyn yng nghyd-destun y ffordd y mae gwasanaethau wedi eu datblygu a sut y mae cynlluniau gofal wedi cael eu cyflwyno. Mae'n peri pryder nid yn unig ein bod wedi gweld cynnydd yn nifer y plant mewn gofal sy'n cael eu disgrifio fel rhai sy'n 'derbyn gofal', ond nid yw cyfran sylweddol o'r plant hynny sy'n derbyn gofal yn derbyn y math o

wasanaethau y maent yn eu haeddu.

We should also consider this in the context of the stability of placements. In his report, the Chief Inspector of Social Services says that, overall, the picture across Wales shows little change during the last year and in some areas there has been a deterioration in the stability of the arrangements that have been made by local authorities for those children for whom a care order is in place. That is worrying because the one thing that those young people require is an element of stability having gone through, in many circumstances, I suspect, a pretty dreadful ordeal.

Several children in Wales still do not have a care plan in place when they start their period of care as a looked-after child. We know that a care plan is in place for 79.4 per cent of the children but there is huge variation, as Helen Mary Jones pointed out, between local authorities in Wales. For example, it is exceptionally worrying that Cardiff provides a care plan for just over 50 per cent of those children starting a period of care, and 10 local authorities fall below the Wales average. We need to raise our game and that is why we tabled our amendment 3, which states that that needs to be improved and that more children in Wales need to have that care plan in place before they start their period in care.

Amendment 4 refers to the sustained political priority towards funding social services. We know that, in the past, local authorities have faced particular constraints in ensuring improved levels of funding for social services. I remember some of the joint reports into social services, which demonstrated that some authorities had been fairly stagnant in the past couple of years with regard to the level of funding that they put into children's services as well as adult services. I know that that situation is improving and that there are constraints, but we need to address this as an Assembly; otherwise, it will lead to unacceptable levels of care. We will not have the number of social care professionals and placements that we need and we will not be meeting our statutory obligations unless we

Dylem hefyd edrych ar hyn yng nghydestun sefydlogrwydd y lleoliadau. Yn ei adroddiad, dywed y Prif Arolygydd Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol nad oedd y darlun ar draws Cymru, at ei gilydd, wedi dangos llawer o newid yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ac mewn rhai ardaloedd gwelwyd dirywiad yn sefydlogrwydd y trefniadau a wnaethpwyd gan awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer y plant hynny sy'n destun gorchymyn gofal. Mae hyn yn peri pryder oherwydd yr un peth sydd ei angen ar y bobl ifanc hynny yw rhyw gymaint o sefydlogrwydd ar ôl dioddef profiadau ofnadwy, fe dybiaf, mewn llawer o amgylchiadau.

Mae llawer o blant yng Nghymru'n parhau heb gynllun gofal ar eu cyfer pan fyddant yn dechrau ar eu cyfnod gofal fel plentyn sy'n derbyn gofal. Gwyddom fod cynllun gofal ar gael ar gyfer 79.4 y cant o'r plant, ond mae amrywiadau enfawr, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones, rhwng gwahanol awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae'n peri pryder mawr fod Caerdydd yn darparu cynllun gofal ar gyfer dim ond mymryn dros 50 y cant o'r plant hynny sy'n dechrau ar gyfnod mewn gofal, ac mae 10 awdurdod o dan gyfartaledd Cymru. Rhaid inni wneud mwy o ymdrech, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ein gwelliant 3, sy'n datgan bod angen gwella hynny a bod rhaid i fwy o blant yng Nghymru gael cynllun gofal cyn iddynt ddechrau ar eu cyfnod mewn gofal.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn cyfeirio at y flaenoriaeth wleidyddol barhaus i gyllido gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Gwyddom, yn y gorffennol, fod awdurdodau lleol wedi wynebu cyfyngiadau penodol wrth geisio gwella lefelau cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Cofiaf rai o'r adroddiadau ar y cyd ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, a oedd yn dangos bod rhai awdurdodau wedi sefyll yn llonydd fwy neu lai dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf o ran lefel yr arian yr oeddent yn ei neilltuo i wasanaethau plant yn ogystal â gwasanaethau i oedolion. Gwn fod y sefyllfa honno'n gwella, ond rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hyn fel Cynulliad; fel arall bydd yn arwain at lefelau gofal annerbyniol. Ni fydd gennym y niferoedd o weithwyr gofal cymdeithasol proffesiynol a'r lleoliadau y bydd eu hangen

have that level of resource.

We will support the amendments tabled by other parties but we need to ensure that social care professionals are treated as such. They are professionals who deserve to be treated in the same way as we would treat other medical professionals. Wales cannot afford second best and that is what we have at the moment. Sadly, unless we cure this problem, the risks for the future are far too great to imagine.

Jenny Randerson: I propose amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to take action to improve staff recruitment and retention to achieve a workforce that is sufficient in numbers, skills and levels of qualification to ensure the high-quality provision of social services.

This amendment concentrates on the problems of workforce recruitment and retention, which are major challenges that run like a thread through the various Social Services Inspectorate for Wales reports that I read. The issue of recruiting good staff in the first place and keeping them is essential to running a good and efficient service. It is essential for staff morale and for getting the best staff, and for ensuring continuity of care, which is so important if we are to get a good standard of work in social services, both for children and older people.

I wish to concentrate on children's services first. One of the major concerns that we have all shared here is that there are few good reports from children's services inspections throughout Wales and that several departments are subject to special measures. Therefore, it was a pleasure to read the report that we received this morning on the review of children's services in Cardiff, which have been subject to special measures for a considerable period of time. Following the

arnom ac ni fyddwn yn bodloni ein rhwymedigaethau statudol oni fydd gennym y lefel honno o adnoddau.

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y pleidiau eraill ond rhaid sicrhau bod gweithwyr gofal cymdeithasol proffesiynol yn cael eu trin yn broffesiynol. Maent yn bobl broffesiynol sy'n haeddu cael eu trin yn yr un ffordd ag y byddem yn trin gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol. Ni all Cymru fforddio byw gyda'r ail orau a dyna'n union yr ydym yn ei wneud ar y funud. Yn anffodus, oni bai ein bod yn datrys y broblem hon, mae'r peryglon y gallwn fod yn eu hwynebu yn y dyfodol yn rhy ofnadwy i'w hystyried.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiad welliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd ati i wella'r broses recriwtio a chadw staff er mwyn creu gweithlu sy'n ddigonol o ran niferoedd, sgiliau a lefelau cymwysterau i sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o ansawdd uchel.

Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn canolbwyntio ar broblemau recriwtio a chadw gweithwyr, sy'n her sylweddol. Mae hyn yn llinyn sy'n rhedeg drwy'r gwahanol adroddiadau yr wyf wedi eu darllen gan Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru. Mae'n hanfodol recriwtio staff da yn y lle cyntaf ac yna'u cadw er mwyn rhedeg gwasanaeth da ac effeithlon. Mae'n hanfodol er mwyn ysbryd y staff ac er mwyn denu'r staff gorau, ac i sicrhau dilyniant gofal, sydd mor bwysig os ydym am gael safon dda o waith mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, i blant a phobl hŷn fel ei gilydd.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar wasanaethau plant yn gyntaf. Un o'r prif bryderon yr ydym i gyd wedi ei rannu yma yw mai ychydig o adroddiadau da a geir o arolygon gwasanaethau plant ledled Cymru a bod sawl adran yn destun mesurau arbennig. Felly, pleser oedd darllen yr adroddiad a gawsom y bore yma ar yr adolygiad o wasanaethau plant yng Nghaerdydd, a fu'n destun mesurau arbennig ers cryn amser. Ar ôl cyhoeddi'r adroddiad a ddangosai mai gan Gaerdydd yr

publication of the report that showed that Cardiff had the worst social services in, effectively, the UK, I think that we were all horrified, but it was not a surprise, because social services in Cardiff had been in a desperate situation for decades. It would appear that, at last, the situation has been sufficiently turned around for Cardiff to come out of special measures. At last, the inspectorate has enough confidence in the direction in which it is travelling not to have to repeat its visits with such regularity.

Cardiff has a long way to go; the situation is far from perfect.

Jonathan Morgan: Do you accept that the view of the review team was that many of the services are inconsistent? Admittedly, they are not poor, but they are inconsistent. That leads to many problems in terms of the way in which the authority can deliver its services. Therefore, the report was pointing in the right direction, but the services are nowhere near where they should be.

Jenny Randerson: You more or less delivered my next sentence for me. I had started by saying that there was a long way to go, and I was going to refer to the fact that there is uncertainty and inconsistency. However, efforts are being made, the financial commitment has been made after years of underfunding, and there are signs of hope for the future, which were sufficiently strong for the inspectorate to have more confidence. I think that that is a matter of great congratulation.

I wish to refer specifically to the concern that is expressed in the report regarding the increase in the number of looked-after children, which has been referred to already. We have a 1.5 per cent increase in Wales at a time when the numbers have gone down marginally in England. I would be interested in the Minister's comments on how we can try to deal with this situation across Wales, because it has such important knock-on effects on the demand for resources from social services departments. If a child gets into a situation where he or she has to become looked after, it means that the preliminary processes have failed.

oedd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gwaethaf ym Mhrydain, i bob pwrpas, yr wyf yn meddwl ein bod i gyd wedi dychryn, ond nid oedd yn syndod, oherwydd yr oedd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghaerdydd wedi bod mewn sefyllfa adfydus ers degawdau. Mae'n ymddangos, o'r diwedd, fod digon o welliant wedi bod yn y sefyllfa i Gaerdydd ddod allan o'r mesurau arbennig. O'r diwedd, mae gan yr arolygwyr ddigon o hyder yn y cyfeiriad y mae'n teithio iddo fel nad ydynt yn gorfod ailadrodd eu hymweliadau mor rheolaidd.

Mae gan Gaerdydd ffordd bell i fynd; mae'r sefyllfa ymhell o fod yn berffaith.

Jonathan Morgan: A dderbyniwch mai barn y tîm adolygu oedd bod llawer o'r gwasanaethau'n anghyson? Iawn, nid ydynt yn wael, ond maent yn anghyson. Mae hynny'n arwain at lawer o broblemau o ran y ffordd y gall yr awdurdod gyflwyno'i wasanaethau. Felly, yr oedd yr adroddiad yn pwyntio i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ond nid yw'r gwasanaethau fel y dylent fod o bellffordd.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydych wedi traddodi fy mrawddeg nesaf drosaf fwy na heb. Yr oeddwn wedi dechrau drwy ddweud bod ffordd bell i fynd, ac yr oeddwn yn mynd i gyfeirio at y ffaith bod ansicrwydd ac anghysondeb. Fodd bynnag, mae ymdrechion ar droed, mae'r ymrwymiad ariannol wedi'i wneud wedi blynyddoedd o danariannu, a cheir arwyddion bod gobaith ar gyfer y dyfodol, a oedd yn ddigon cryf i'r arolygwyr gael mwy o hyder. Credaf fod hynny'n destun cryn longyfarch.

Hoffwn gyfeirio'n benodol at y pryder a fynegir yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â'r cynnydd yn nifer y plant sydd yn derbyn gofal, y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes. Mae gennym gynnydd o 1.5 y cant yng Nghymru ar adeg pryd y mae'r niferoedd wedi gostwng fymryn yn Lloegr. Byddai gennyf ddiddordeb yn sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch sut y gallwn geisio delio â'r sefyllfa hon ar draws Cymru, oherwydd y mae iddi effeithiau canlyniadol mor bwysig ar y galw am adnoddau oddi wrth adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Os aiff plentyn i sefyllfa lle y mae'n rhaid iddo neu iddi dderbyn gofal, mae'n golygu bod y prosesau rhagarweiniol wedi methu.

The inspectorate refers to the importance of adoption. I welcome the comments in the report and the call for local authorities to pay more attention to adoption. I feel passionately about the importance of stability for young children who are facing the most intense difficulties. This is underlined by the reference to the need for more places with adoptive parents. That is the best form of stability that can be offered to many children. There has been an unwillingness in some local authorities to go for adoption for too long, and that needs to change.

On services for adults, we have said here often that the cuts in the Supporting People grant have caused specific problems for social services departments. The Government has not admitted that, but the report now confirms this. I welcome the fact that the shortage in care home placements has been highlighted as an issue that needs to be tackled, as has the interface between health and social care.

5.50 p.m.

While I welcome the increase in the number of people in receipt of direct payments, I hope that it goes up to over 1,000 next year, as people are able to take more control of their lives. However, I want a specific response from the Minister, if possible, in relation to the concern that is expressed here in relation to delayed transfers of care because of the patient's choice. Concern is expressed that patient choice is now a major reason for delayed transfers of care. Do you have any comments on how we can resolve that issue, Minister?

Val Lloyd: There can be no doubt that social services are a key local government service, and this is borne out by the fact that over 150,000 children, adults and older people received help in the year in question. This report provides encouraging evidence that progress has been made towards improving the quality and effectiveness of services across Wales. In particular, the WLGA and

Cyfeiria'r arolygiaeth at bwysigrwydd mabwysiadu. Croesawaf y sylwadau yn yr adroddiad a'r alwad ar i awdurdodau lleol roi mwy o sylw i fabwysiadu. Teimlaf i'r byw ynghylch pwysigrwydd sefydlogrwydd i blant ifanc sydd yn wynebu'r anawsterau mwyaf difrifol. Tanlinellir hyn gan y cyfeiriad at yr angen am fwy o leoedd gyda rhieni sy'n mabwysiadu. Dyna'r math gorau o sefydlogrwydd y gellir ei gynnig i lawer o blant. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn gyndyn o fynd ati i fabwysiadu ers gormod o amser, ac mae angen i hynny newid.

O ran gwasanaethau i oedolion, yr ydym wedi dweud yma'n aml fod y toriadau yn y grant Cefnogi Pobl wedi achosi problemau penodol i adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi cyfaddef hynny, ond mae'r adroddiad bellach yn cadarnhau hyn. Croesawaf y ffaith bod tynnu sylw wedi bod at y prinder lleoliadau mewn cartrefi gofal fel mater y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef, ynghyd â'r rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r cynnydd yn nifer y bobl sy'n derbyn taliadau uniongyrchol, gobeithiaf y cynyddu i dros 1,000 y flwyddyn nesaf, wrth i bobl allu cymryd mwy o reolaeth dros eu bywydau. Fodd bynnag, mae arnaf eisiau ymateb penodol gan y Gweinidog, os oes modd, ynghylch y pryder a fynegir yma ynglŷn ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal oherwydd dewis y claf. Mynegir pryder bod dewis y claf bellach yn un o'r prif resymau dros oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal. A oes gennych unrhyw sylwadau ynghylch sut y gallwn ddatrys y mater hwnnw, Weinidog?

Val Lloyd: Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn un o wasanaethau allweddol llywodraeth leol, ac ategir hyn gan y ffaith bod dros 150,000 o blant, oedolion a phobl hŷn wedi cael cymorth yn y flwyddyn dan sylw. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi tystiolaeth galonogol fod camau wedi eu cymryd tuag at wella ansawdd ac effeithiolrwydd gwasanaethau

the Association of Directors of Social Services have published a list of nine social service commitments, which have been adopted by local authorities. I see this initiative providing a powerful driver towards achieving the necessary improvements. However, as has been said, much more needs to be done. While restructuring and improvement in some local authorities is well under way, it seems as though others are finding it difficult to maintain basic standards.

The most important resource of any service is its people. One of the areas identified as being in need of improvement is that of the workforce. While the commitment of staff at all levels is highlighted, it seems that it is increasingly difficult to recruit and retain a sufficient number of appropriately qualified workers. Therefore, consideration must be given to the view that social work as a profession should be relaunched to help remedy this, with an emphasis on skills and the unique role of social workers, particularly in safeguarding vulnerable people, and their new regulated status.

Following the staff theme, local authorities have workforce plans, in line with the requirements of the social care workforce development programme. They are also required to set up development partnerships to help plan and deliver training. The number of qualified social services staff continues to increase, which is thanks, in no small measure, to the new degree in social work and the new bursary support scheme for those whom their employers cannot or will not support.

The value of social care services for children and young people has been mentioned, but they are under considerable pressure. The report points out that the standard of services is variable and that there are disparities between authorities. It goes without saying that this needs to be addressed. I find it sad that there is still an insufficient number of foster places; whatever an authority does seems to be capped elsewhere. The discrepancy between the quality of the assessment provided for disabled and non-

ledled Cymru. Yn benodol, mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi cyhoeddi rhestr o naw ymrwymiad o ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, sydd wedi'u mabwysiadu gan awdurdodau lleol. Teimlaf fod y fenter hon yn rhoi hwb sylweddol tuag at sicrhau'r gwelliannau angenrheidiol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwyd, mae angen gwneud llawer mwy. Tra bo ailstrwythuro a gwella yn digwydd mewn rhai awdurdodau lleol, mae'n ymddangos fel petai eraill yn ei chael yn anodd cynnal safonau sylfaenol.

Adnodd pwysicaf unrhyw wasanaeth yw ei bobl. Un o'r meysydd lle y gwelwyd bod angen gwelliant yw'r gweithlu. Er bod ymroddiad y staff ar bob lefel yn cael ei bwysleisio, mae'n ymddangos ei bod yn fwyfwy anodd recriwtio a chadw nifer ddigonol o weithwyr â'r cymwysterau priodol. Felly, rhaid ystyried y farn y dylid ail-lansio gwaith cymdeithasol fel proffesiwn i helpu i gywiro hyn, gyda phwyslais ar sgiliau a rôl unigryw gweithwyr cymdeithasol, yn enwedig o ran diogelu pobl fregus, a'u statws rheoleiddiedig newydd.

Gan ddilyn thema staffio, mae gan awdurdodau lleol gynlluniau gweithlu, yn unol â gofynion y rhaglen datblygu gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'n ofynnol hefyd iddynt sefydlu partneriaethau datblygu i helpu i gynllunio a gweithredu hyfforddiant. Mae nifer y staff gwasanaethau cymdeithasol cymwysedig yn dal i godi, diolch i raddau helaeth i'r radd newydd mewn gwaith cymdeithasol a'r cynllun cymorth bwrsari newydd i'r rhai y mae eu cyflogwyr yn methu â'u cynorthwyo neu'n gyndyn o wneud hynny.

Soniwyd am werth gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol i blant a phobl ifanc, ond maent dan gryn bwysau. Noda'r adroddiad fod safon gwasanaethau'n amrywio o awdurdod i awdurdod. Afraid dweud bod angen rhoi sylw i hyn. Testun tristwch i mi yw bod nifer annigonol o leoedd maeth o hyd; mae beth bynnag a wna awdurdod fel pe bai wedi'i gapio yn rhywle arall. Mae'r anghysondeb rhwng ansawdd yr asesiadau a ddarperir i blant anabl a rhai nad ydynt yn anabl yn peri pryder hefyd. Fodd bynnag, a cheisio bod yn

disabled children also causes concern. However, trying to be positive, I hope that the integrated children's services and the common assessment framework will help in that respect. The report, therefore, does not paint a perfect picture, but it shows that work is under way to improve social care provision.

Karen Sinclair: I would like to add my voice to that of the Minister in thanking Graham Williams and his team in the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales for producing this annual report. In our discussions on the report in the Health and Social Services Committee recently, there was cross-party agreement on many of the issues that we need to tackle across the whole gamut of social services, as highlighted in the report. The report is unambiguous in the message that it carries, and we should choose to accept it. It will help to inform and structure an important part of the debate on how we build social services for the future.

We could spend days discussing many of the issues raised in the report, and I have expressed my views on some of them at length, including the need to improve children's services in Wales. I agree with everything that Jonathan said in that regard. However, it is the issue of workforce planning and the development dealt with in section 2 of the report that I would like to raise today. Problems with recruitment and retention of social care staff has been a problem that all local authorities have faced for many years. The report, 'Social Work in Wales: A Profession to Value', produced by the Association of Directors of Social Services, highlighted the need to move this issue forwards by improving the overall profile of careers in social services and social care and by improving the support that the managers and professionals in the sector receive.

The social care workforce development programme, backed by £7.5 million in support from the Assembly Government, provides matched grant funding to support

gadarnhaol, gobeithiaf y bydd y gwasanaethau plant integredig a'r fframwaith asesu cyffredin yn helpu yn hynny o beth. Felly nid yw'r adroddiad yn cyflwyno darlun perffaith, ond mae'n dangos bod gwaith ar y gweill i wella darpariaeth gofal cymdeithasol.

Karen Sinclair: Hoffwn ychwanegu fy llais at lais y Gweinidog wrth ddiolch i Graham Williams a'i dîm yn Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru am gynhyrchu'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn. Yn ein trafodaethau ar yr adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ddiweddar, cafwyd cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar lawer o'r materion y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy ar draws rhychwant cyfan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, fel y tanlinellir yn yr adroddiad. Mae'r adroddiad yn ddiawys yn y neges y mae'n ei chyfleu, a dylem ddewis ei dderbyn. Bydd yn helpu i lywio a strwythuro rhan bwysig o'r ddadl ynghylch sut yr adeiladwn wasanaethau cymdeithasol ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Gallem dreulio diwrnodiau'n trafod llawer o'r materion a godir yn yr adroddiad, ac yr wyf wedi mynegi fy marn ar rai ohonynt yn helaeth, gan gynnwys yr angen i wella gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru. Cytunaf â phopeth a ddywedodd Jonathan yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr hoffwn ei godi heddiw yw cwestiwn cynllunio'r gweithlu a'r datblygiad a drafodir yn adran 2 yn yr adroddiad. Bu problemau recriwtio a chadw staff gofal cymdeithasol yn broblem y mae pob awdurdod lleol wedi'i hwynebu ers blynyddoedd. Pwysleisiodd yr adroddiad, 'Social Work in Wales: A Profession to Value', a luniwyd gan Gymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, yr angen i symud y mater hwn yn ei flaen drwy wella proffil cyffredinol gyrfaoedd mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol a thrwy wella'r cymorth a roddir i'r rheolwyr a'r gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y sector.

Mae rhaglen ddatblygu'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, gyda £7.5 miliwn o gymorth gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn darparu cyllid grant cyfatebol i gefnogi cyflogwyr

employers in improving the levels of skills and qualifications across the social services sector, and it is having an effect. In September 2004, 277 individuals were either training or on secondment. That is an increase of 22 per cent on 2003, and that has to be a real plus.

Together with other initiatives such as the new degree in social work available from September 2004, and the bursary scheme that sits alongside it, there are reasons to be hopeful about training more social workers. In training more locally based individuals, who already have roots and family ties to the local communities in which we need them to work, there surely is a greater chance of those individuals remaining within the service and we can reverse the poaching that goes on between authorities. This could often be older individuals, who are already in the service and whom we could support to up-skill so that we make use of their valuable experience for the good of the sector. By seconding them into training, we give them access to training while they retain a salary. I well remember when secondment was quite a normal route for people to go down. That is what William Graham refers to as a grow-your-own-timber argument, and it needs to be extended more fully.

I hope that the Minister takes this issue up in developing the policy paper, which I know that he is producing, setting out the Welsh Assembly Government's vision for social services, social care and related community services for the next decade, to sit alongside our 'Designed for Life' strategy. We need to be thinking about and doing these things now, because, by 2021, the number of older people in Wales is projected to increase 56 per cent on the present level, with one in three households in Wales including a person over 65 years of age. That will mean that—

Peter Black: Order. You must bring your comments to a close, Karen.

Karen Sinclair: I fully intend to.

wrth wella lefelau sgiliau a chymwysterau ar draws y sector gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac mae'n cael effaith. Ym Medi 2004, yr oedd 277 o unigolion naill ai'n hyfforddi neu ar secondiad. Dyna gynnydd o 22 y cant o'i gymharu â 2003, ac mae'n rhaid bod hynny'n beth da.

Ynghyd â mentrau eraill fel y radd newydd mewn gwaith cymdeithasol sydd ar gael ers Medi 2004, a'r cynllun bwrsari sy'n cyd-fynd â hi, mae rhesymau dros deimlo'n obeithiol ynglŷn â hyfforddi mwy o weithwyr cymdeithasol. Wrth hyfforddi mwy o unigolion sydd yn byw yn lleol, a chanddynt eisoes wreiddiau a chlymau teuluol gyda'r cymunedau lleol lle y mae eu hangen i weithio, siawns nad yw'n fwy tebygol y gwnaiff yr unigolion hynny aros o fewn y gwasanaeth ac y gallwn newid y sefyllfa lle y mae staff yn cael eu dwyn rhwng awdurdodau. Yn aml gallent fod yn unigolion hŷn, sydd eisoes yn y gwasanaeth, ac y gallem eu cynorthwyo i ddatblygu eu sgiliau fel ein bod yn gwneud defnydd o'u profiad gwerthfawr er lles y sector. Wrth eu secondio i gael hyfforddiant, rhown gyfle iddynt hyfforddi tra byddant yn dal i gael cyflog. Cofiaf yn dda adeg pan oedd secondiad yn llwybr eithaf arferol i bobl ei gymryd. Dyna'r hyn y cyfeiria William Graham ato fel dadl tyfu'ch coed eich hun, ac mae angen ei hymestyn yn llawnach.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydio yn y mater hwn wrth ddatblygu'r papur polisi, y gwn ei fod wrthi'n ei lunio, yn amlinellu gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gofal cymdeithasol a gwasanaethau cymunedol cysylltiedig ar gyfer y degawd nesaf, i gyd-fynd â'n strategaeth 'Cynllun Oes'. Mae angen meddwl am y pethau hyn a'u gwneud yn awr, oherwydd, erbyn 2021, rhagamcenir y bydd nifer y bobl hŷn yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 56 y cant ar y lefel bresennol, gydag un o bob tair aelwyd yng Nghymru'n cynnwys rhywun dros 65 mlwydd oed. Bydd hynny'n golygu bod—

Peter Black: Trefn. Rhaid i chi ddod â'ch sylwadau i ben, Karen.

Karen Sinclair: Mae'n fwiad gennyf wneud hynny.

A cross-cutting approach to tackle social care issues is needed, backed by all the political will that we can muster, so that everyone in Wales gets the social care that they deserve.

David Melding: I will focus on the situation and the challenges that we face in children's services, and particularly look at the experience of Cardiff. I must say, quite frankly, that I was surprised by the tone of the Minister and by the Liberal Democrat spokesperson in reflecting on the report into children's services in Cardiff, and concluding that satisfactory progress had been made. Some progress has been made, but I certainly do not think that it is satisfactory nor do I think that it merits the complacent judgment of the Minister that he can now remove the protocol from that authority. I well remember looking at changes in the inspection regime and whether an authority should be removed from the protocol if its children's services still remained at an unsatisfactory level. I was told that that would not happen, and that the pressure would not be taken off such an authority.

We have heard several references to Cardiff, but let me remind the Assembly of the current judgment that has just been concluded by the inspectorate, which is that this authority occupies the fourth lowest position on an index of 16 points—it is in the very lowest quartile, yet people here are concluding that they are pleased with the progress that has been made. I am not pleased. I accept that it has gone from absolute failure to a situation of great fragility, which is what this report concludes. Let us just go with the inspectors, rather than making the uncertain and, in my view, unjustified conclusion that now we are out of the woods with regard to improvement in Cardiff.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.59 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.59 p.m.*

I think that we need to put a stronger emphasis on ensuring that children's services in general are brought rapidly to a safe standard. That is not the case in Cardiff at the moment. It is the case for many children, and

Mae angen agwedd drawsbleidiol at ddelio â materion gofal cymdeithasol, a hynny'n cael ei gefnogi gan hynny a ellir o ewyllys gwleidyddol, fel bod pawb yng Nghymru'n cael y gofal cymdeithasol a haeddant.

David Melding: Canolbwyntiaf ar y sefyllfa a'r sialensiau a wynebwn yn ein gwasanaethau plant, gan edrych yn arbennig ar brofiad Caerdydd. Rhaid imi ddweud, yn gwbl onest, fy mod yn synnu at agwedd y Gweinidog ac at lefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wrth iddynt ymateb i'r adroddiad ar wasanaethau plant yng Nghaerdydd, a'u casgliad bod camau boddhaol wedi eu cymryd. Cafwyd rhyw gymaint o gynnydd, ond yn sicr nid wyf o'r farn bod y sefyllfa'n foddhaol na'i bod yn cyfiawnhau dyfarniad hunanfodlon y Gweinidog y gall bellach dynnu'r protocol oddi ar yr awdurdod hwnnw. Cofiaf yn dda edrych ar newidiadau yn y drefn arolygu ac a ddylid tynnu awdurdod allan o'r protocol pe bai ei wasanaethau i blant yn parhau ar lefel anfoddhaol. Dywedwyd wrthyf na ddigwyddai hynny, ac na fyddid yn tynnu'r pwysau oddi ar awdurdod o'r fath.

Yr ydym wedi clywed sawl cyfeiriad at Gaerdydd, ond gadewch imi atgoffa'r Cynulliad am farn yr arolygiaeth ar hyn o bryd, sef bod yr awdurdod hwn yn bedwerydd o'r gwaelod ar fynegai o 16 pwynt—mae yn y chwarterl isaf un, ac eto mae pobl yma'n dod i'r casgliad eu bod yn fodlon ar y camau a gymerwyd. Nid wyf fi'n fodlon. Derbyniaf ei fod wedi newid o fod yn fethiant llwyr i sefyllfa fregus iawn, sef yr hyn y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei gasglu. Gadewch inni gyd-fynd â'r arolygwyr, yn hytrach na dod i'r casgliad ansicr ac, yn fy marn i, casgliad nad oes cyfiawnhad iddo, ein bod bellach allan o'r gors o safbwynt gwelliannau yng Nghaerdydd.

Yr wyf yn meddwl bod angen inni roi pwyslais cryfach ar sicrhau bod gwasanaethau plant yn gyffredinol yn cael eu codi i safon ddiogel yn fuan. Nid yw hynny'n wir am Gaerdydd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n wir i

those services are commended, but we cannot rely on the general standard of services that are currently provided in the city and county of Cardiff. That is the position that we are in.

6.00 p.m.

Some of the judgments come in, in passing perhaps, because it naturally looks at issues such as the safety of the services, saying that partnership working, in particular, remains fragile. That is at the heart of safe social services. We need to be careful before we come to the sort of judgments that have been passed by other Members. However, it is only fair, in terms of balance, that I welcome the corporate and political support for improvement that is now to be seen in Cardiff. In trying to improve the standard of social services, it is part of the picture that you get all political parties to put in near the top of the agenda and fight hard for it. I have said some harsh things, but I have met the new executive member in charge of social services and he has my confidence. I think that he is committed to improving social services. However, that improvement has not yet occurred to the level that we need to say that we have safe children's services in Cardiff.

Sandy Mewies: One of the problems with social services, I am afraid, is that it is very much a cinderella service until people actually need a service. I agree with many of the things said today, particularly with Jonathan's view that we should think of people who work in social services as professionals who need to work through a professional hierarchy and receive a professional reward.

Having said that, I welcome this report from the chief inspector, saying that there are improvements. I am particularly impressed by the improvements made by Flintshire County Council. The chief inspector says that it is one of a number of councils in Wales setting higher standards for social services for others to follow. I hope that all Assembly Members will join me in congratulating the

lawer o blant, a chymeradwyir y gwasanaethau hynny, ond ni allwn ddibynnu ar safon gyffredinol y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd yn ninas a sir Caerdydd. Dyna'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi.

Gwneir rhai o'r dyfarniadau, efallai wrth basio, oherwydd, yn naturiol, mae'n edrych ar faterion fel diogelwch y gwasanaethau, ac yn dweud bod gweithio mewn partneriaeth, yn enwedig, yn parhau'n fregus. Mae hynny wrth wraidd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol diogel. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus cyn gwneud y math o ddyfarniadau sydd wedi eu gwneud gan Aelodau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg, a bod yn gytbwys, imi groesawu'r gefnogaeth gorfforaethol a gwleidyddol i wella sydd bellach i'w gweld yng Nghaerdydd. Wrth geisio gwella safonau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, un o'r elfennau yn hynny yw bod yr holl bleidiau gwleidyddol yn ei roi yn agos i frig yr agenda a chwffio'n galed drosto. Yr wyf wedi dweud ambell beth go lym, ond yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â'r aelod gweithredol newydd sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau cymdeithasol ac mae gennyf ffydd ynddo. Credaf ei fod wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Er hynny, nid yw'r gwelliant hwnnw wedi digwydd hyd yma hyd at y lefel sy'n angenrheidiol nes y gallwn ddweud bod gennym wasanaethau plant diogel yng Nghaerdydd.

Sandy Mewies: Un o'r problemau gyda gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, mae arnaf ofn, yw ei fod yn wasanaeth sy'n mynd yn angof nes bod ei angen ar bobl. Cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud heddiw, yn enwedig â barn Jonathan y dylem feddwl am bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fel gweithwyr proffesiynol a bod angen iddynt weithio drwy hierarchaeth broffesiynol a derbyn tâl proffesiynol.

Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn gan y prif arolygydd, sy'n dweud bod gwelliannau wedi digwydd. Gwnaed cryn argraff arnaf gan y gwelliannau a wnaed gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn dweud ei fod yn un o nifer o gynghorau yng Nghymru sy'n gosod safonau uwch ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i eraill eu dilyn. Gobeithio y bydd holl

council on that. Adult services are a critical part of the social services agenda. It will change and become even more valuable over time. Flintshire council, like the other authorities, has work to do but it has a sound base from which to progress.

While I praise Flintshire County Council, I recognise that there are patchy services in other parts of the country. We have to remember that we will never reach our targets on social services. Once we reach a target, that target has to be raised because you cannot provide a perfect social service. The need will always go up.

One point of concern to me—which has been mentioned by others—is the number of children who are still looked after by local authorities. It remains high and I am sad to see that. Mention is made in the report of the high cost of external and specialist placements. Actually, it is not just a financial cost; there is a real cost to these young people and to their families. In future, I hope that people can look at working together. Authorities should, perhaps, be looking at working together to provide places which are economical but meet the needs of these young people. It is vital that they should not be traipsed all over the country unless there is a specific need for them to move.

I welcome the fact that there is a new policy paper which will sit alongside 'Designed for Life', setting out the vision for health services. The chief inspector stresses throughout his report the need for transparency and co-operation between agencies. I hope that that will be a mantra that we quote continually, and I hope that it is successful. However, as I say, we will never reach our targets for social services. We must always be striving to improve.

Gwenda Thomas: I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this important debate and to support the motion and the amendments. I will concentrate my remarks

Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymuno â mi wrth longyfarch y cyngor ar hynny. Mae gwasanaethau i oedolion yn rhan greiddiol o'r agenda gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Bydd yn newid ac yn dod yn fwy gwerthfawr fyth gydag amser. Mae gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint, fel awdurdodau eraill, waith i'w wneud eto ond mae wedi gosod sylfaen gadarn i adeiladu arni.

Er fy mod yn canmol Cyngor Sir y Fflint, yr wyf yn cydnabod bod y gwasanaethau yn fratiog mewn rhannau eraill o'r wlad. Rhaid inni gofio na fyddwn byth yn cyrraedd ein targedau o ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Wedi inni gyrraedd targed, rhaid ei godi unwaith eto oherwydd ni allwch ddarparu gwasanaeth cymdeithasol perffaith. Bydd yr angen yn cynyddu o hyd.

Un pwynt sy'n achosi pryder imi—ac mae eraill wedi sôn amdano—yw nifer y plant sy'n dal i dderbyn gofal gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n uchel o hyd ac mae'n drist o beth. Sonnir yn yr adroddiad am gost uchel y lleoliadau allanol ac arbenigol. Mewn gwirionedd, nid cost ariannol yn unig ydyw; mae cost wirioneddol i'r bobl ifanc eu hunain ac i'w teuluoedd. Yn y dyfodol, gobeithio y gall pobl ystyried cydweithio. Efallai y dylai awdurdodau fod yn ystyried gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ddarparu lleoliadau sy'n economaidd ond hefyd yn diwallu anghenion y bobl ifanc hyn. Mae'n hanfodol nad ydynt yn cael eu llusgo ar hyd a lled y wlad oni bai fod angen penodol iddynt symud.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod gennym bapur polisi newydd i gyd-fynd â'r 'Cynllun Oes', yn cyflwyno'r weledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn pwysleisio drwy gydol ei adroddiad bod angen i asiantaethau fod yn fwy agored a chydweithredu mwy. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n arwyddair y byddwn yn cadw ato, a gobeithio y bydd yn llwyddo. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, ni fyddwn byth yn cyrraedd ein targedau yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Nid da lle gellir gwella ydyw o hyd.

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon ac i gefnogi'r cynnig a'r gwelliannau. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar ran 5 yn yr

on section 5 of the report, covering the development of children's services. I value the contribution that the chief inspector and his staff have made to the work of the safeguarding vulnerable children review. The chief inspector views safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children in need as demanding and complex, needing a whole-system's approach.

This report, together with the joint reviews conducted by SSIW in conjunction with the Wales Audit Office, continues to bring into sharp focus the annual performance evaluation of local authorities and its contribution to improving social services across Wales.

Notwithstanding the concerns that have been voiced this afternoon, the chief inspector notes that there has been an encouraging—and I use the word 'encouraging' rather than 'satisfactory'—improvement in children's services in local authorities since his last report, and that there were many examples of good practice by a committed workforce, at all levels. However, as Sandy said, he also notes that the numbers of looked-after children continue to be high across Wales, but that we do not want to bring this down for the wrong reason, and that the impact of the use of high-cost, external, and specialist placements is having an effect on budgets and resources in general.

To take that forward, in the last two years since the pilot scheme of the integrated children's system in Neath Port Talbot was launched, significant further advancements have been made in its development with partner agencies. Social services staff have endorsed the fact that the technological aspects of this system are advantageous in terms of performance management information, and that the potential to develop this information in line with the requirements is unlimited.

The development of a common assessment framework will, I hope, enhance multi-agency working, and provide a common framework, to enable information sharing between agencies to be facilitated more

adroddiad, yng nghyswllt datblygu gwasanaethau plant. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyfraniad a wnaeth y prif arolygydd a'i staff at waith yr adolygiad ar ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i niwed. Mae'r prif arolygydd yn ystyried bod diogelu a hybu lles plant mewn angen yn fater cymhleth a dyrys, ac yn rhywbeth sy'n gofyn am ddull gweithredu'n ymwneud â'r system gyfan.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn, ynghyd â'r cydadolygiadau a wnaed gan Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru ar y cyd â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, yn parhau i roi ffocws clir ar werthusiad perfformiad blynyddol yr awdurdodau lleol a'i gyfraniad at wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ar draws Cymru.

Er gwaetha'r pryderon a leisiwyd y prynhawn yma, mae'r prif arolygydd yn nodi bod gwelliant addawol—a defnyddiaf y gair 'addawol' yn hytrach na 'boddhaol'—wedi bod mewn gwasanaethau plant yn yr awdurdodau lleol ers ei adroddiad diwethaf, a'i fod wedi gweld enghreifftiau lu o arferion da gan weithlu ymroddedig, ar bob lefel. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Sandy, mae hefyd yn nodi bod nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn dal i fod yn uchel ar draws Cymru, ond nad ydym am leihau'r nifer hwn am y rheswm anghywir, a bod effaith defnyddio lleoliadau arbenigol ac allanol drud, yn ei dro, yn effeithio ar gyllidebau ac adnoddau yn gyffredinol.

A symud ymlaen o ran hynny, yn y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf ers lansio cynllun peilot y system plant integredig yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, cymerwyd camau breision pellach yng nghyswllt ei datblygiad gydag asiantaethau sy'n bartneriaid. Mae staff y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi ategu'r ffaith bod yr agweddau technolegol ar y system hon yn fanteisiol o ran gwybodaeth rheoli perfformiad, a bod y potensial i ddatblygu'r wybodaeth hon yn unol â'r gofynion yn ddi-ben-draw.

Bydd datblygu fframwaith asesu cyffredin, gobeithio, yn arwain at fwy o weithio aml-asiantaethol, ac yn darparu un fframwaith cyffredin, er mwyn hwyluso rhannu gwybodaeth rhwng asiantaethau. Drwy

easily. Using the integrated children's system, Neath Port Talbot has been able to develop a protocol and form that will fit with the suggested requirements of the common assessment framework. I congratulate the authority on what it has achieved.

I also welcome Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council's recent announcement that children's services will receive an extra £1 million in the next financial year. These resources will benefit looked-after children, and, in particular, disabled children requiring specialist support.

Finally, we should all remember that we have—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Gwenda, mae eich tri munud ar ben.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I thank all Members for a constructive debate. I concur with all the sentiments about the good work that the Social Services Inspectorate for Wales is doing; it is an important agency for change for the better in social services, as Sandy said.

We are considering draft guidance on the basis of the Children Act 2004. Hopefully, the implementation of that guidance, once the consultation has been taken on board, will see the development of children's champions and leads in local authorities, along the line of what Helen Mary asked for. Val Lloyd mentioned the overall assessment in adult social services, in terms of the unified assessment, which is crucial to getting the type of joined-up government that we need. Gwenda Thomas mentioned the unified assessment for children in Neath Port Talbot, which is an equally important development. Hopefully, based on that experience, we will pilot that unified assessment for children across four local authorities, with a view to complete that work over the next two years. That will then, hopefully, be rolled out across Wales, precisely for the reasons that Gwenda mentioned.

ddefnyddio'r system plant integredig, mae Castell-nedd Port Talbot wedi gallu datblygu protocol a dull a fydd yn ateb y gofynion sy'n cael eu hawgrymu gan y fframwaith asesu cyffredin. Hoffwn longyfarch yr awdurdod ar yr hyn y mae wedi llwyddo i'w wneud.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu cyhoeddiad diweddar Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot y bydd gwasanaethau plant yn derbyn £1 miliwn ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn ariannol i ddod. Bydd yr adnoddau hyn o fudd i blant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac, yn enwedig, i blant anabl sydd angen cymorth arbenigol.

Yn olaf, dylem i gyd gofio ein bod—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am sorry, Gwenda, your three minutes are up.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Diolch i'r Aelodau am ddadl adeiladol. Yr wyf yn cytuno â phopeth sydd wedi'i ddweud am y gwaith da sy'n cael ei wneud gan Arolygiaeth Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru; mae'n asiantaeth bwysig sy'n hybu newid er gwell yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, fel y dywedodd Sandy.

Yr ydym yn ystyried canllawiau drafft ar sail Deddf Plant 2004. Gobeithio y bydd gweithredu'r canllawiau hynny, wedi i sylwadau'r ymgynghori gael eu hystyried, yn arwain at ddatblygu hyrwyddwyr ac arweinwyr plant mewn awdurdodau lleol, ar batrwm yr hyn y gofynnodd Helen Mary amdano. Soniodd Val Lloyd am yr asesiad cyffredinol mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion, o ran yr asesu unedig, sy'n hanfodol i gael y math o lywodraeth gydgyssylltiedig sydd ei hangen arnom. Soniodd Gwenda Thomas am yr asesu unedig i blant yng Nghastell Nedd Port Talbot, sy'n ddatblygiad yr un mor bwysig. Gobeithio, ar sail y profiad hwnnw, y byddwn yn treialu'r asesu unedig hwnnw i blant ar draws pedwar awdurdod lleol, gyda golwg ar gwblhau'r gwaith yn y ddwy flynedd nesaf. Yna, gobeithio y bydd hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno ar draws Cymru gyfan, am yr union resymau y soniodd Gwenda amdanynt.

As Gwenda said, it is important that we have the information. When we have considered underperforming local authorities, particularly in the area of children's services, the single most consistent weakness, apart from a lack of leadership at all crucial levels, has been the lack of effective information and performance data. Unless we have effective performance data to monitor what is going on in local authorities, it is down to impression and anecdote, and the last person that you have spoken to. That is not the basis on which good-quality social services will be provided.

Many speakers raised concerns about looked-after children. That is a matter of concern. I am pleased that my colleague, Jane Hutt, in her role as Minister with responsibility for children, is commissioning work to look precisely into that issue, to try to bottom it out. Again, while the numbers of looked-after children are going up, a knee-jerk reaction to say that that is inherently wrong, without discriminating about the various factors that contribute to that, would be very risky.

6.10 p.m.

Helen Mary raised a point about consultation and care homes in Carmarthenshire. I am pleased to say that I have already received a letter on this issue from Catherine Thomas; I gather that she has visited St Paul's residential home and the care home in Crosshands. She has brought that matter to my attention and I will be asking my officials to look into that.

In terms of resources, since the Assembly was established, we have seen an increase in resources for social services of the order of 56 per cent, with a 90 per cent increase in spending on children's services, and virtually a 50 per cent increase in adult services. So, we are seeing a massive increase in resources, but that has been paralleled by increased levels of qualification, increased numbers of people going into training, as Members have said, and increases in the workforce number.

Finally, I turn to David Melding's point in

Fel y dywedodd Gwenda, mae'n bwysig bod y wybodaeth gennym. Wrth inni ystyried awdurdodau lleol sy'n tanberfformio, yn enwedig ym maes gwasanaethau plant, y gwendid mwyaf cyson ar wahân i ddiffyg arweiniad ar bob lefel bwysig, yw diffyg gwybodaeth effeithiol a data perfformiad. Os nad oes gennym ddata perfformiad effeithiol i fonitro'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn awdurdodau lleol, mae rhywun yn dibynnu ar argraff a hanesion, a'r person diwethaf y mae rhywun wedi siarad ag ef neu hi. Nid ar sail hynny y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o ansawdd da.

Mae nifer o siaradwyr wedi lleisio pryder ynghylch plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Mae'n fater sy'n peri pryder. Yr wyf yn falch bod fy nghyd-Aelod, Jane Hutt, yn ei rôl fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am blant, yn comisiynu gwaith i ymchwilio i'r union fater hwnnw, er mwyn ceisio canfod y rhesymau. Eto, er bod nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn cynyddu, byddai ymateb yn rhy fyrbyyll drwy ddweud bod rhywbeth hanfodol o'i le ar hynny, heb ddioli'r gwahanol ffactorau sy'n cyfrannu ato, yn beryglus iawn.

Cododd Helen Mary'r pwynt am ymgynghori a chartrefi gofal yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud fy mod eisoes wedi derbyn llythyr am hyn gan Catherine Thomas; deallaf ei bod wedi ymweld â chartref preswyl St Paul a'r cartref gofal yn Crosshands. Mae wedi tynnu fy sylw at y mater hwnnw a byddaf yn gofyn i'm swyddogion ymchwilio iddo.

O ran adnoddau, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd mewn adnoddau ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o tua 56 y cant, gyda chynnydd o 90 y cant yn y gwariant ar wasanaethau plant, a chynnydd o bron 50 y cant mewn gwasanaethau i oedolion. Felly, yr ydym yn gweld cynnydd aruthrol mewn adnoddau, ond i gyd-fynd â hynny cafwyd cynnydd mewn cymwysterau, mwy o bobl yn dewis hyfforddi, fel y mae Aelodau wedi dweud, a chynnydd hefyd yn nifer y gweithlu.

Yn olaf, trof at bwynt David Melding yng

relation to Cardiff. David has slightly misread what is in the report. The report fairly and accurately acknowledges the significant progress that is being made by Cardiff. I agree that there is a commitment to this in Cardiff, at all levels—not just from the political leadership, but also on opposition benches through the scrutiny process that is going on there—and that that is absolutely crucial in underpinning the governance. What has been agreed is that, subject to ongoing process, and particularly in relation to the point that I made to Gwenda Thomas, effective monitoring processes must be in place in Cardiff to demonstrate that the progress that has been achieved is consolidated and will continue over the next three to six months. If the improvement that we have seen over the last three years is consolidated, and there continues to be improvement, and if the monitoring and quality assurance is in place, then the chief inspector will make recommendations to me. Therefore, the decision in relation to Cardiff will be based on the evidence and the professional judgment of the inspectorate and will be made on the basis of progress and direction of travel in Cardiff.

David Melding: I assure the Minister that I have read the report with care and attention. The report says that this authority, for its children's services, remains in the lowest quartile on the grid.

The first message that you should be giving is that that is unsatisfactory and that the protocol will not be lifted until it is out of that quartile. Is that what you are saying?

Brian Gibbons: No. I am going to take the advice of the social services inspector, and he is asking whether Cardiff's trajectory of travel is one of improvement. I will ask whether he is happy that the monitoring processes are in place to underpin that improvement. If those questions cannot be answered in the affirmative, then the monitoring will take place. However, the document clearly states that no decision has been made. There are criteria, but those

ngghyswllt Caerdydd. Mae David wedi camddarllen yr hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad i raddau. Mae'r adroddiad yn cydnabod yn deg ac yn gywir fod cynnydd sylweddol yn cael ei wneud gan Gaerdydd. Cytunaf fod ymrwymiad i hyn yng Nghaerdydd, ar bob lefel—nid yn unig gan yr arweinwyr gwleidyddol, ond hefyd ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau drwy'r broses graffu sy'n digwydd yno—ac mae hynny'n gwbl greiddiol fel sail i lywodraethu. Yr hyn sydd wedi'i gytuno, yn ddarostyngedig i broses sy'n digwydd yn barhaus, ac yn enwedig yng nghyswllt y pwynt y soniais amdano wrth Gwenda Thomas, yw bod yn rhaid i brosesau monitro effeithiol fod ar waith yng Nghaerdydd i ddangos bod y cynnydd a wnaed yn cael ei atgyfnerthu ac yn parhau dros y tri mis i chwe mis nesaf. Os bydd y gwelliannau yr ydym wedi eu gweld dros y tair blynedd diwethaf yn cael eu hatgyfnerthu, ac yn parhau, ac os yw'r monitro a'r sicrhau ansawdd ar waith, yna bydd y prif arolygydd yn gwneud argymhellion imi. Felly, bydd y penderfyniad yng nghyswllt Caerdydd yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, a bydd barn broffesiynol yr arolygiaeth yn cael ei llunio ar sail cynnydd a'r cyfeiriad yr ydys yn mynd iddo yng Nghaerdydd.

David Melding: Gallaf sicrhau'r Gweinidog fy mod wedi darllen yr adroddiad yn bur fanwl a gofalus. Mae'r adroddiad yn dweud bod yr awdurdod hwn, o ran ei wasanaethau plant, yn parhau yn y chwarter isaf ar y grid.

Y neges gyntaf y dylech fod yn ei chyfleu yw bod hynny'n anfoddhaol ac na fydd y protocol yn cael ei godi hyd nes ei fod allan o'r chwarter hwnnw. Ai dweud hynny yr ydych?

Brian Gibbons: Nage. Yr wyf am dderbyn cyngor yr arolygydd gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a gofyn y mae ef a ydyw cyfeiriad y daith yng Nghaerdydd yn arwydd o welliant. Byddaf finnau'n gofyn a ydyw'n fodlon bod y prosesau monitro ar waith i fod yn sylfaen i'r gwelliant hwnnw. Oni ellir ateb y cwestiynau hynny yn gadarnhaol, yna bydd y monitro'n digwydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ddogfen yn nodi'n glir nad oes dim penderfyniad wedi'i wneud. Mae meini

criteria must be fulfilled before any final decision is made. The social services inspectorate is a key instrument for change, and it is only through local government working together, not in isolation, across boundaries and organisations, that we will get the type of health and social care that the people of Wales are entitled to receive.

prawf, ond rhaid i'r meini prawf hynny gael eu cyflawni cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad terfynol. Mae'r arolygiaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn gyfrwng allweddol i hybu newid, a dim ond os bydd awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd, ac nid ar eu pennau eu hunain, ar draws ffiniau a sefydliadau, y bydd gennym y math o ofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol y mae gan bobl Cymru yr hawl i'w gael.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 1: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Amendment 2: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 3: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William

Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 5: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM2888 as amended:

Cynnig NDM2888 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

acting under section 142 of the Health and gan weithredu dan adran 142 Deddf Iechyd a

<i>Social Care (Community Health and Standards) Act 2003, notes the report of the Chief Inspector of Social Services 'Social Services in Wales 2004-05';</i>	<i>Gofal Cymdeithasol (Iechyd Cymunedol a Safonau) 2003, yn nodi adroddiad y Prif Arolygydd Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol 'Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru 2004-05';</i>
<i>calls on the Government to provide greater support for local authorities to establish a collaborative approach to improve social services;</i>	<i>yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i ddarparu mwy o gefnogaeth i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn sefydlu dull gweithredu ar y cyd i wella gwasanaethau cymdeithasol;</i>
<i>notes with concern the dramatic increase since 1998 of looked-after children;</i>	<i>yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd dramatig ers 1998 yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal;</i>
<i>calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that local authorities improve the percentage of looked-after children beginning with a care plan in place;</i>	<i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwella canran y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd â chynllun gofal yn ei le o'r cychwyn;</i>
<i>calls on the Welsh Local Government Association to ensure a sustained political priority towards the funding of social services; and</i>	<i>yn galw ar Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i sicrhau blaenoriaeth wleidyddol barhaus o ran ariannu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol; ac</i>
<i>calls on the Assembly Government to take action to improve staff recruitment and retention to achieve a workforce which is sufficient in numbers, skills and levels of qualification to ensure high-quality provision of social services.</i>	<i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd ati i wella'r broses recriwtio a chadw staff er mwyn creu gweithlu sy'n ddigonol o ran niferoedd, sgiliau a lefelau cymwysterau i sicrhau y darperir gwasanaethau cymdeithasol o ansawdd uchel.</i>

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
 Amended motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's
 heddiw. proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.16 p.m.
 The meeting ended at 6.16 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)