



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales
(The Official Record)**

Dydd Mawrth, 19 Hydref 2004

Tuesday, 19 October 2004

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|----|--|
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister |
| 26 | Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement |
| 28 | Datganiad ar 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'—Dogfen Ymgynghorol ar Wasanaethau
Cyhoeddus
Statement on 'Making the Connections'—Consultation Document on Public Services |
| 42 | Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders |
| 46 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004 |
| 53 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Datgymhwysio rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004 |
| 56 | Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004
Approval of the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 |
| 61 | Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Rheoliadau Amgylchedd y Dŵr (Cyfarwyddeb Fframwaith
Dŵr) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2003 i Brif Weinidog Cymru
Delegation of the Functions of the Water Environment (Water Framework Directive)
(England and Wales) Regulations 2003 to the First Minister |
| 65 | Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order |
| 66 | Cynllun Gweithredu Effeithlonrwydd Ynni
The Energy Efficiency Action Plan |
| 99 | Pwynt o Drefn
Point of Order |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefaryd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Pwerau Deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad The Assembly's Legislative Powers

Q1 Jocelyn Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Assembly's legislative powers? (OAQ38463)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): As the agenda for today's business illustrates, the Assembly has a wide range of legislative powers deriving from many different Acts of Parliament.

Jocelyn Davies: The new Mental Health Bill proposed in Westminster is a draconian measure that will do nothing to improve mental health services in Wales. It will, however, significantly increase the number of patients subject to sectioning and reinforce outdated and deplorable stigmas. It also conflicts with Assembly policy. We need our own mental health Bill. Will you ensure, under your 13.2 plus plan, that you achieve framework legislation in this Bill?

The First Minister: You can never guarantee anything arising from a prospect in a year's time, perhaps, of an amendment to the Government of Wales Act 1998 which would provide framework powers along those lines. As regards the draft Mental Health Bill, Jane Hutt has invited stakeholders in Wales to submit their views on the draft, and we are now doing so. I do not have time to go into detail about the particular points in which this differs to what was in the last draft Bill, which was withdrawn. However, it is understood to be compliant with European human rights legislation, and has to be certified to that effect. It contains higher hurdles than the previous draft Bill with regard to what must be done before you can compulsorily give medication to people with schizophrenia who do not want medication, or before those with

C1 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar bwerau deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad? (OAQ38463)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Fel y dengys yr agenda ar gyfer busnes heddiw, mae gan y Cynulliad amrywiaeth eang o bwerau deddfwriaethol sy'n deillio o lawer o wahanol Ddeddfau seneddol.

Jocelyn Davies: Mae'r Mesur Iechyd Meddwl newydd a gynigiwyd yn San Steffan yn fesur didostur na wnaiff ddim i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru. Er hynny, bydd yn peri cynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y cleifion a gaiff eu hanfon i ysbytai meddwl ac yn ategu gwarthnodau hen ffasiwn a ffiaidd. Mae hefyd yn groes i bolisi'r Cynulliad. Mae arnom angen ein Mesur iechyd meddwl ein hunain. A wnewch chi sicrhau, o dan eich cynllun 13.2 a mwy, y bydd deddfwriaeth fframwaith yn y Mesur hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ellir gwarantu rhywbeth a allai ddeillio o'r posibilrwydd o gael newid ymhen blwyddyn i Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a roddai bwerau fframwaith o'r fath. Gyda golwg ar y Mesur Iechyd Meddwl drafft, mae Jane Hutt wedi gwahodd rhanddeiliaid yng Nghymru i gyflwyno eu barn am y drafft, ac yr ydym ni'n gwneud hynny'n awr. Nid oes gennyf ddigon o amser i fanylu am y pwyntiau penodol sy'n wahanol i'r hyn a oedd yn y Mesur drafft diwethaf, a dynnwyd yn ôl. Er hynny, deallir ei fod yn cydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd ar hawliau dynol, a rhaid ei wirio i'r perwyl hwnnw. Mae ynddo atalfeydd llymach nag a oedd yn y Mesur drafft blaenorol o ran yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei wneud cyn y gellir rhoi meddyginiaeth drwy orfod i rai sydd â sgitsoffrenia nad ydynt yn dymuno cael meddyginiaeth, neu cyn y gellir

a psychopathic disorder can be imprisoned for something that they might do rather than for something that they have done.

William Graham: Do you agree that Wales-only Bills should be promoted at the earliest opportunity to allow as much input from the Assembly as possible? Will you use your best offices to ensure that that happens?

The First Minister: That happens more now than before in the sense that it happens 12-months beforehand. When I began my political career 17 years ago, Bills were given two years' consideration, first in draft and then in real form. There is far greater opportunity now for proper scrutiny—not the old, unconstructive line-by-line scrutiny by politicians, but proper scrutiny by stakeholders in the Bill who really know about its potential impact. Had that existed in the late 1980s and early 1990s, we would have avoided some of the bad quality legislation that went through the House of Commons.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): One of the legislative powers that we do have is that over Assembly sponsored public bodies. In his latest article for the Institute of Welsh Affairs, Professor Kevin Morgan—a Labour supporter, and a prominent devolution proponent, who is in favour of legislative powers for the National Assembly—says that, unlike the processes that led to the creation of the Assembly, the bonfire of the quangos was made behind closed doors by an inner circle of Labour politicians, advisers and civil servants, and that such was the secrecy involved that it seemed more appropriate to a John Le Carré novel than to the Government that prides itself on being the most open in the western world. Do you agree with his analysis?

The First Minister: No. He is entitled to his view, but he is confusing this issue with the making of an announcement to the Assembly—which is right and proper, so that the Assembly can respond. That is what happened on 14 July. The legislation, when we bring it before the Assembly, will have

carcharu rhai sydd ag anhwylder seicopathig am rywbeth y gallent ei wneud yn hytrach nag am rywbeth a wnaethant eisoes.

William Graham: A ydych yn cytuno y dylid hyrwyddo Mesurau i Gymru'n unig ar y cyfle cynharaf fel y gellir rhoi cymaint o fewnbwn oddi wrth y Cynulliad ag y bo modd? A wnewch chi bob ymdrech i sicrhau y digwydd hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n digwydd yn amlach yn awr nag yr oedd o'r blaen, yn yr ystyr ei fod yn digwydd 12 mis o flaen llaw. Pan ddechreuais ar fy ngyrfa wleidyddol 17 mlynedd yn ôl, câi Mesurau eu hystyried am ddwy flynedd, ar ffurf ddrafft yn gyntaf ac wedyn ar eu ffurf derfynol. Mae llawer mwy o gyfle'n awr i graffu'n iawn ar Fesurau—nid yr hen graffu anadeiladol fesul llinell gan wleidyddion, ond craffu iawn gan randdeiliaid y Mesur sy'n gwybod yn iawn am ei effaith bosibl. Pe buasai hynny'n digwydd ddiwedd y 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, ni fyddai gennym rai o'r Deddfau gwael a aeth drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Un o'r pwerau deddfwriaethol sydd gennym yw hwnnw dros gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Yn ei erthygl ddiweddaraf ar gyfer y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig, dywed yr Athro Kevin Morgan—cefnogwr i Lafur, a dadleuwr blaenllaw dros ddatganoli, sydd o blaid cael pwerau deddfu i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—fod coelcerth y cwangos, yn wahanol i'r prosesau a arweiniodd at greu'r Cynulliad, wedi'i wneud y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig gan gylch dethol o wleidyddion Llafur, cynghorwyr a gweision sifil, ac mai cymaint oedd y cyfrinacholdeb fel yr ymddangosai'n fwy perthnasol i nofel gan John Le Carré nag i Lywodraeth sy'n falch o ddweud mai hi yw'r un fwyaf agored yn y byd gorllewinol. A ydych yn cytuno â'i ddadansoddiad?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nac ydwyf. Mae ganddo hawl i'w farn, ond mae'n cymysgu rhwng y mater hwn a rhoi datganiad i'r Cynulliad—sy'n beth iawn a phriodol, fel y gall y Cynulliad ymateb. Dyna a ddigwyddodd ar 14 Gorffennaf. Erbyn y down â'r ddeddfwriaeth gerbron y Cynulliad, byddwn

been consulted upon by the trade unions representing the employees most concerned, and by stakeholders with a particular interest in this matter. I did not recognise his description, although, like you, I was amused by the colourful language.

Michael German: We are told that you will make an announcement this afternoon on public services in Wales, and that that will be the subject of consultation until Christmas. That is the right way to go about a consultation exercise. It allows for a proper debate here in the National Assembly and across Wales. Have you learned a lesson from the secret way in which you abolished the quangos? Do you agree that the way in which you did it was damaging to the reputation and the integrity of your Government and to your leadership?

The First Minister: Anything but. You make an announcement, perfectly properly, first to the Assembly. I am sure that the complaints would be far louder had I made the announcement in any body other than the Assembly. It is true that in the hour or so before you make an announcement to the Assembly you try to telephone or have meetings with as many people as possible. However, that is the right and proper way. You cannot do it without making the announcement first to the Assembly. That is right and proper. The purpose of having this Assembly is to make announcements, so that they can be tested by opposition politicians like yourself, asking what I always hope will be penetrating questions. When we then come forward with legislation, some weeks or months later, you will have had time to digest the proposal and the reaction of those directly involved, either in the Assembly sponsored public bodies or in the public services—which we will discuss this afternoon—and to look at the detail of what is being proposed.

wedi ymgynghori arni gyda'r undebau llafur sy'n cynrychioli'r gweithwyr sy'n bennaf cysylltiedig â hi, a chyda rhanddeiliaid sydd â buddiant penodol yn y mater hwn. Nid oedd ei ddisgrifiad yn un cyfarwydd, er i mi, fel chithau, gael yr iaith liwgar yn ddifyr.

Michael German: Dywedir wrthym y byddwch yn gwneud cyhoeddiad y prynhawn yma am wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, ac y bydd ymgynghori ar hynny tan y Nadolig. Dyna'r modd iawn i ymgynghori. Mae'n caniatáu dadlau priodol yma yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a ledled Cymru. A ydych wedi dysgu gwrs o'r modd dirgel y gwnaethoch ddiddymu'r cwangos? A ydych yn cytuno bod y modd y gwnaethoch hynny wedi gwneud drwg i enw da ac uniondeb eich Llywodraeth ac i'ch arweinyddiaeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ddim o gwbl. Gwneir cyhoeddiad, yn gwbl briodol, i'r Cynulliad yn gyntaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r cwynion yn uwch o lawer pe bawn wedi rhoi'r cyhoeddiad i unrhyw gorff heblaw'r Cynulliad. Mae'n wir bod rhywun, yn yr awr neu ddwy cyn y gwneir y cyhoeddiad i'r Cynulliad, yn ceisio ffonio neu gwrdd â chynifer o bobl ag y bo modd. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r modd iawn a phriodol. Ni ellir gwneud hyn heb wneud cyhoeddiad i'r Cynulliad yn gyntaf. Mae hynny'n iawn ac yn briodol. Pwrpas cael y Cynulliad hwn yw gwneud cyhoeddiadau, fel y gall gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau fel chithau eu dadansoddi, drwy ofyn yr hyn yr wyf bob amser yn gobeithio y byddant yn gwestiynau treiddgar. Erbyn y down â'r ddeddfwriaeth gerbron, ymhen rhai wythnosau neu fisoedd, byddwch wedi cael amser i ystyried y cynnig ac ymateb y rhai sy'n uniongyrchol gysylltiedig, un ai yn y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad neu yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus—a drafodwn y prynhawn yma—ac i edrych ar fanylion yr hyn a gynigir.

Byw yn Iach Healthy Living

Q2 Jeff Cuthbert: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote and facilitate healthy living in Wales? (OAQ38436)

C2 Jeff Cuthbert: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo a hwyluso ffyrdd o fyw yn iach yng Nghymru? (OAQ38436)

The First Minister: As part of Health Challenge Wales, we have programmes to promote and facilitate healthy lifestyles. Specific lifestyle issues are addressed in 'Food and Well Being', the healthy and active lifestyles action plan and the strategic framework for promoting sexual health. We are also taking action to address smoking prevention and cessation and to develop healthy school environments.

Jeff Cuthbert: In view of the established link between unhealthy lifestyles and diseases such as type 2 diabetes, do you agree that we should target resources at people who lead inactive lifestyles, particularly young people? Furthermore, will you join me in applauding the work of the End Child Poverty organisation, which includes Barnados and the National Children's Homes, on the causes of unhealthy living and its effects on children from low income families?

The First Minister: Yes, indeed. This issue goes much wider than children, but tackling unhealthy lifestyles among children is the most important new challenge that we face. I am proud that on 8 November we will launch free swimming in leisure centres outside school holidays, to complement free swimming in school holidays. This will get people into the habit of using their hearts and lungs to the full, and getting out of breath while doing so, which expands your cardiovascular capacity, and which has major benefits later on for warding off type 2 diabetes. Your point would be recognised by every paediatrician in Wales. If you ask them about the problems that we are facing, they talk about the impending explosion in type 2 diabetes in 20 to 30 years' time, if we cannot get children out of the couch-potato lifestyle while they are young.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Last week, you asked me to accept that there were areas where the health service in Wales did better than the service in England and you referred to cataract operations. I have checked your record on hospital admissions and I could not find any

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel rhan o Her Iechyd Cymru, mae gennym raglenni i hybu a hyrwyddo ffyrdd o fyw iach. Ymdrinnir â materion penodol sy'n ymwneud â ffyrdd o fyw yn 'Bwyd a Lles', y cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer ffyrdd o fyw iach a gweithredol a'r fframwaith strategol ar gyfer hybu iechyd rhywiol. Yr ydym hefyd yn cymryd camau i ymdrin ag atal a rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu ac i ddatblygu amgylcheddau iach yn yr ysgol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yng ngolwg y cysylltiad profedig rhwng ffyrdd o fyw afiach a chlefydau fel diabetes math 2, a ydych yn cytuno y dylem anelu adnoddau at rai sydd â ffyrdd o fyw anweithredol, a phobl ifanc yn enwedig? At hynny, a wnewch ymuno â mi i ganmol gwaith y corff End Child Poverty, sy'n cynnwys Barnardo's a'r National Children's Homes, ar achosion byw'n afiach a'r effaith a gaiff ar blant o deuluoedd sydd ag incwm isel?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, yn wir. Mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud â mwy na phlant yn unig, ond yr angen i ymdrin â ffyrdd o fyw afiach ymysg plant yw'r her newydd bwysicaf a wynebwn. Yr wyf yn falch y byddwn ar 8 Tachwedd yn cyflwyno nofio am ddim mewn canolfannau hamdden y tu allan i wyliau ysgol, i gyd-fynd â nofio am ddim yn ystod gwyliau ysgol. Bydd hyn yn peri i bobl ddod i'r arfer o ddefnyddio eu calon a'u hysgyfaint yn llawn, a cholli eu gwynt wrth wneud hynny. Mae hynny'n cryfhau gallu cardiofasgwlaidd rhywun, gan ddod â buddion mawr yn ddiweddarach o ran atal diabetes math 2. Byddai pob pediatregydd yng Nghymru'n cydnabod y pwynt a wnaethoch. Os holir hwy am y problemau a wynebwn, soniant am y tebygolrwydd o gynnydd mawr yn nifer yr achosion o ddiabetes math 2 ymhen 20 i 30 mlynedd, os na allwn gael plant i newid eu ffordd o fyw eisteddog pan fônt yn ifanc.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynasoch imi dderbyn bod meysydd lle'r oedd y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n rhagori ar y gwasanaeth yn Lloegr a chyfeiriasoch at lawdriniaethau ar gataractau. Yr wyf wedi gwirio'r record sydd gennych ar dderbyn

other speciality where your record was better. I will give you typical examples: 3,935 patients have been waiting more than 12 months for orthopaedic surgery; 1,330 patients have been waiting more than 12 months for ear, nose and throat operations; and 2,081 patients have been waiting more than 12 months for general surgery in Wales. In these specialties, the total waiting list in England is 500, while the list in Wales goes on and on. Rather than scrabbling around for crumbs of comfort, why do you not simply accept that your record on health is appalling? Is it not time that you apologised?

The First Minister: Let me give you three sets of figures. Infant mortality rates—are you interested in them? I would have thought that you would be. They have come down in Wales from being higher than in England to being well under. Ieuan Wyn Jones, are you interested? The figures for infant mortality are 20 per cent lower in Wales than in England. I will not go into what that means to individual families. We discussed MRSA rates recently, and I believe that the figures are 11 per 10,000 patient bed days in Wales, 15 in Scotland and 17 in England. If you consider our ambitions, we have promised that patients will see an appropriate member of a primary care team within 24 hours compared with the 48-hour target in England. Why have we set that target? It is because we know what can be done by having better access to the primary care team in terms of stopping people flooding out the accident and emergency departments of our hospitals. Fifty-five per cent of those who go to hospital in Wales do so via the accident and emergency route, compared to 35 per cent in England. The more emphasis that we can put on primary care, the more we can get people to use the primary care service to the full instead of going into accident and emergency departments. If we can do that, it helps to stop accident and emergency patients crowding out those on waiting lists.

cleifion i ysbytai ac ni allwn ddod o hyd i unrhyw arbenigedd arall lle'r oedd eich record yn well. Rhoddaf enghreifftiau noweddiadol i chi: bu 3,935 o gleifion yn disgwyl yn hwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig; bu 1,330 o gleifion yn disgwyl yn hwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth ar y glust, y trwyn neu'r gwddf; a bu 2,081 o gleifion yn disgwyl yn hwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth gyffredinol yng Nghymru. Yn yr arbenigeddau hyn, cyfanswm y rhestr aros yn Lloegr yw 500, tra bo'r rhestr yng Nghymru'n ddiddiwedd. Yn hytrach na chrafu am fymryn o gysur, pam na dderbyniwch fod eich record ar iechyd yn warthus? Onid yw'n bryd ichi ymddiheuro?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gadewch imi roi tair set o ffigurau i chi. Cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod—a ydych yn ymddiddori ynddynt? Byddwn wedi tybio y byddech. Maent wedi gostwng yng Nghymru o fod yn uwch nag yn Lloegr i fod yn is o lawer. Ieuan Wyn Jones, a ydych yn ymddiddori yn hynny? Mae ffigurau marwolaethau babanod yn 20 y cant yn is yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Nid af i drafod yr hyn y mae hynny'n ei olygu i deuluoedd penodol. Trafodasom gyfraddau MRSA yn ddiweddar a chredaf mai'r ffigurau yw 11 fesul 10,000 o ddyddiau cleifion mewn gwelyau yng Nghymru, 15 yn yr Alban a 17 yn Lloegr. Os ystyriwch ein huchelgeisiau, yr ydym wedi addo y bydd cleifion yn gweld aelod perthnasol o dîm gofal sylfaenol o fewn 24 awr o'i gymharu â'r targed o 48 awr yn Lloegr. Pam yr ydym wedi gosod y targed hwnnw? Gwnaethom hynny am y gwyddom yr hyn y gellir ei wneud drwy gael gwell mynediad at y tîm gofal sylfaenol er mwyn atal pobl rhag llethu adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ein hysbytai. Mae 55 y cant o'r rhai sy'n mynd i'r ysbyty yng Nghymru'n gwneud hynny drwy fynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, o'i gymharu â 35 y cant yn Lloegr. Po fwyaf o bwyslais y gallwn ei roi ar ofal sylfaenol, mwyaf y gallwn beri i bobl ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth gofal sylfaenol i'r eithaf yn hytrach na mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Pe gallem wneud hynny, byddai o gymorth i atal cleifion adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys rhag disodli'r rhai sydd ar restrau aros.

2.10 p.m.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is no comfort to the 3,900 people waiting for orthopaedic surgery, the 1,300 people waiting for ear, nose and throat surgery and the 2,000 people waiting for general surgery for more than 12 months. What is your response to those people? You have not answered the question. Why do your targets mean that these people will be on the waiting lists for a considerable time? It is not just a matter of your record compared to England's; your record compared to Scotland's is appalling. Ninety-two per cent of patients are seen for their first appointment in England within six months. In Scotland, it is 87 per cent. In Wales, it is pathetically low at 56 per cent. Malcolm Chisholm, the Scottish Minister for Health and Community Care, lost his job because he could not reduce waiting lists and waiting times in Scotland. When will you do the decent thing and change your health policy and Minister?

The First Minister: You are obviously completely incapable of responding to any of the points that I made. I set you this challenge: are you interested in infant mortality rates? Evidently, you are not. You do not want to recognise the achievements made by mothers, working with professionals, in bringing down the cot death rate in Wales, which was such a major contributor to our having, three years ago, higher infant mortality rates than those in England. Infant mortality rates are now substantially lower in Wales than they are in England and in Scotland. You do not want to recognise that, because it is good news about the health service in Wales and you cannot bear to hear good news about the health service in Wales. Similarly, I mentioned our strategy in relation to MRSA and primary care services and the logic behind that. If you can get people to use primary care services by giving them guaranteed 24-hour access then they do not crowd accident and emergency departments. If they do not crowd accident and emergency departments, that prevents waiting list sessions from being cancelled, as they are now, because of medical outlier beds. That is the strategy, which is paying off.

On top of that, there are major achievements in reducing waiting lists, as I mentioned

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid yw hynny'n unrhyw gysur i'r 3,900 o bobl sy'n aros am lawdriniaeth orthopedig, y 1,300 o bobl sy'n disgwyl am lawdriniaeth ar y glust, y trwyn neu'r gwddf a'r 2,000 o bobl sy'n disgwyl am lawdriniaeth gyffredinol ers mwy na 12 mis. Beth a ddywedwch wrth y bobl hynny? Nid ydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn. Pam y mae'ch targedau'n golygu y bydd y bobl hyn ar y rhestrau aros am gryn amser? Nid yw'n fater o gymharu'ch record â'r un yn Lloegr yn unig; mae'ch record o'i chymharu ag un yr Alban yn warthus. Caiff 92 y cant o gleifion eu hapwyntiad cyntaf yn Lloegr o fewn chwe mis. Yn yr Alban, mae'r ffigur yn 87 y cant. Yng Nghymru, mae'r ffigur yn druenus o isel ar 56 y cant. Collodd Malcolm Chisholm, Gweinidog yr Alban dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymunedol, ei swydd am na allai ostwng rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros yn yr Alban. Pa bryd y gwnewch chi'r peth iawn a newid eich polisi iechyd a'ch Gweinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n amlwg na allwch ymateb i unrhyw un o'r pwyntiau a wneuthum. Gosodais yr her hon i chi: a ydych yn ymddiddori mewn cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod? Mae'n amlwg nad ydych. Nid ydych am gydnabod ymdrech mamau, ar y cyd â gweithwyr proffesiynol, wrth ostwng cyfradd marwolaethau yn y crud yng Nghymru, a gyfrannai gymaint at y ffaith bod gennym, dair blynedd yn ôl, gyfradd uwch na chyfradd Lloegr. Mae cyfraddau marwolaethau babanod bellach yn is o lawer yng Nghymru nag y maent yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban. Nid ydych am gydnabod hynny, gan ei fod yn newydd da am y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ac ni allwch oddef clywed newyddion da am y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Yn yr un modd, cyfeiriais at ein strategaeth ar MRSA a gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol a'r rhesymeg sy'n sail i hynny. Os gellir peri i bobl ddefnyddio gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol drwy roi warrant o fynediad o fewn 24 awr iddynt, ni fyddant yn llethu adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Drwy beidio â llethu adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ni chaiff triniaeth i bobl ar restrau aros ei chanslo, fel y digwydd yn awr, oherwydd gwelyau meddygol ychwanegol. Dyna'r strategaeth, ac mae'n llwyddo.

Yn ogystal â hynny, cafwyd cryn lwyddiant wrth leihau rhestrau aros, fel y dywedais yn

earlier. Five years ago, when we took over our responsibilities, people were routinely dying while waiting on the cardiac surgery waiting lists: that does not happen now. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. These matters should be pursued by means of supplementary questions, not by people shouting out. On that note, I shall call the leader of the Welsh Conservatives.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Thank you, Llywydd. First Minister, to bring us back to the questions on the waiting list position—we have not had any answers on this yet—more than 311,000 people are on a waiting list in Wales. That is one person in 10. More than one person in 100 has been on a waiting list for over a year. I am very interested in those statistics. Would you respond to the call that we have made today for an all-party group to be set up to consider waiting lists, since there has been a marked lack of progress on this over the whole period of the Assembly? That group would be an all-party group on a non-partisan basis, set up to consider this issue with a view to getting the figures down, because they are stubbornly high in Wales, but are not so stubbornly high in England or in Scotland.

The First Minister: You refuse to recognise the progress that has been made. I mentioned earlier that during the five and half years of the Assembly we have made huge improvements in cardiac surgery waits. People used to routinely die on cardiac surgery waiting lists, and now they do not. Similarly, in terms of long waits for orthopaedic treatment, we inherited an extremely difficult situation, but now a small number of people are waiting over 18 months for orthopaedic surgery, and the second offer scheme is kicking in. That scheme will mean that, by 1 April next year, no-one will wait more than 12 months for orthopaedic surgery, or any other forms of treatment for which there are long waits at the moment, without having a second offer of alternative treatment. Huge progress has been made on long waits. We accept that the waiting times are still too long: that is why we brought in the second offer at 18 months, and why we

gynharach. Bum mlynedd yn ôl, pan ymgymerasom â'n cyfrifoldebau, yr oedd yn beth cyffredin i bobl farw tra'r oeddent ar restrau aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon: nid yw hynny'n digwydd yn awr. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dylid trafod y materion hyn drwy ofyn cwestiynau atodol, nid drwy weiddi. Ar y nodyn hwnnw, galwaf arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Diolch i chi, Lywydd. Brif Weinidog, i ddod â ni'n ôl at gwestiynau ar sefyllfa'r rhestrau aros—ni chawsom unrhyw atebion ar hynny eto—mae mwy na 311,000 o bobl ar restrau aros yng Nghymru. Dyna un ym mhob 10. Bu mwy nag un ym mhob 100 ar restr aros am fwy na blwyddyn. Ymddiddoraf yn fawr yn yr ystadegau hynny. A wnewch chi ymateb i'r alwad a wnaethom heddiw am sefydlu grŵp trawsbleidiol i ystyried rhestrau aros, gan fod diffyg cynnydd amlwg wedi bod ar hyn dros holl gyfnod y Cynulliad? Byddai'r grŵp yn un amhleidiol a thrawsbleidiol a sefydlid i ystyried y mater hwn gyda golwg ar ostwng y ffigurau, gan eu bod yn ystyfnig o uchel yng Nghymru, ond heb fod mor ystyfnig o uchel yn Lloegr neu yn yr Alban.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn gwrthod cydnabod y cynnydd a wnaed. Dywedais yn gynharach ein bod wedi sicrhau gwelliannau aruthrol yn ystod pum mlynedd a hanner cyntaf y Cynulliad o ran cyfnodau aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Yr oedd yn beth cyffredin i bobl farw tra'r oeddent yn aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon, a bellach nid ydynt. Yn yr un modd, o ran cyfnodau aros hir am driniaeth orthopedig, etifeddwyd sefyllfa anodd tu hwnt, ond nifer fach sy'n disgwyl yn hwy na 18 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig bellach, ac mae cynllun yr ail gynnig yn dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Oherwydd y cynllun hwnnw, ni fydd neb, erbyn 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, yn disgwyl yn hwy na 12 mis am lawdriniaeth orthopedig, neu am fathau eraill o driniaeth y mae'n rhaid aros yn hir amdanynt ar hyn o bryd, heb gael ail gynnig o driniaeth arall. Gwnaed cynnydd aruthrol ar gyfnodau aros hir. Derbyniwn fod yr amseroedd aros yn rhy hir o hyd: dyna

have reset it to 12 months. Progress is already being made. It is difficult for you. If there is one thing that your health spokesman has right, it is that you do not know anything about this issue unless he tells you about it.

Nick Bourne: We seem to be getting under your skin, First Minister. It is clear that you are content with the position where people are waiting up to 10 months for cardiovascular treatment. In England, people do not wait four weeks for treatment. Your painting of the picture is dangerous complacency. You have not answered my specific question, but I infer that you are against an all-party group considering this issue. I want answers as to why we are in such a dire position in Wales and how we can put it right. Frankly, 10 months for cardiovascular treatment is unacceptable, despite your complacency about how things have improved. It is just not true.

The First Minister: You misheard the whispers of your health spokesman while you were preparing for your second question. The improvement achieved—which neither your health spokesman nor you are willing to accept—is to the position that we inherited five and a half years ago, in respect of the cardiac surgery waiting list. People were routinely dying on the cardiac surgery waiting list, but this does not happen now, due to the massive progress that has been, and continues to be made. We will soon be able to deal with the issue of cardiac surgery at eight months. This has been a massive area of improvement in Wales over the past five years and a half. We inherited an unacceptable situation which has improved, although you do not want to accept it.

Nick Bourne: I have a constituency postbag full of letters on this issue. I know of people who are forced to go private because of your attitude towards choice and not allowing people to be treated in England or overseas. The Minister for Health and Social Services cannot even give me figures on how many people are treated overseas, or are dying on the waiting list. Do not tell me that people are not routinely dying on the waiting list, as I

pam y cyflwynasom yr ail gynnig ar ôl 18 mis a pham y'i newidiwyd i 12 mis. Gwneir cynnydd eisoes. Mae derbyn hynny'n anodd ichi. Un peth y mae'ch llefarydd ar iechyd yn iawn yn ei gylch yw na wyddoch ddim am y mater hwn oni ddywed wrthy ch amdano.

Nick Bourne: Ymddengys ein bod yn dân ar eich croen, Brif Weinidog. Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn fodlon ar sefyllfa lle y mae rhai'n aros hyd at 10 mis am driniaeth gardiofasgwlaidd. Yn Lloegr, nid yw pobl yn disgwyl cymaint â phedair wythnos am driniaeth. Mae eich barn am y sefyllfa'n un peryglus o ddifater. Nid ydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn penodol a ofynnais, ond tybiaf eich bod yn erbyn cael grŵp trawsbleidiol i ystyried y mater hwn. Yr wyf am gael atebion ynghylch pam mae gennym sefyllfa mor druenus yng Nghymru a sut y gallwn ei chywiro. A siarad yn blwmp ac yn blaen, nid yw aros am 10 mis i gael triniaeth gardiofasgwlaidd yn dderbyniol, er gwaethaf eich difaterwch ynghylch y modd y mae pethau wedi gwella. Nid yw'n wir o gwbl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Camglywsoch sibrydion eich llefarydd ar iechyd wrth baratoi ar gyfer eich ail gwestiwn. Nid yw eich llefarydd ar iechyd na chithau'n barod i dderbyn ein bod wedi gwella'r sefyllfa, a etifeddwyd bum mlynedd a hanner yn ôl, mewn cysylltiad â'r rhestr aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon. Yr oedd yn beth cyffredin i bobl farw wrth aros am lawdriniaeth ar y galon, ond nid yw hynny'n digwydd yn awr, oherwydd y cynnydd aruthrol a wnaed ac a wneir o hyd. Cyn hir, byddwn yn gallu delio â mater llawdriniaeth ar y galon o fewn wyth mis. Bu gwelliant aruthrol yn y maes hwn yng Nghymru dros y pum mlynedd a hanner diwethaf. Etifeddasom sefyllfa annerbyniol sydd wedi gwella, er nad ydych am dderbyn hynny.

Nick Bourne: Mae gennyf sachaid o lythyrau oddi wrth etholwyr ar y mater hwn. Gwn am rai sy'n gorfod troi at driniaeth breifat oherwydd eich ymagwedd at ddewis a pheidio â gadael i bobl gael eu trin yn Lloegr neu mewn gwledydd tramor. Nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hyd yn oed yn gallu rhoi ffigurau i mi am y nifer sy'n cael eu trin mewn gwledydd tramor, neu'n marw wrth

know that that is not the case. You still have not responded to my request for an all-party group to look at this serious issue. Will you now respond?

The First Minister: You are getting grossly over-excited about the matter. If you knew of people who had died on the waiting list, I assume that you would have written to me or to Jane Hutt about it. As I am not aware of any letters from you on that matter, you should examine your conscience before starting to throw around such wild allegations. It is important that we recognise that the health service in Wales has made major strides, compared with how it was five and a half years ago. I have mentioned some of the many areas in which we have made major strides, such as cardiac surgery, MRSA, and infant mortality. These are major areas of achievement which have evolved from us being worse than England and Scotland, to being significantly better during 2002-03. I do not understand why opposition politicians have this aversion to good news about the Welsh health service.

aros am driniaeth. Peidiwch â dweud wrthyf nad yw'n beth cyffredin i bobl farw wrth aros am driniaeth, gan y gwn nad yw hynny'n wir. Nid ydych wedi ymateb eto i'm cais am grŵp trawsbleidiol i ystyried y mater difrifol hwn. A wnewch chi ymateb yn awr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn gorgynhyrfu'n arw ynghylch y mater hwn. Pe gwyddech am rai a fu farw wrth aros am driniaeth, tybiaf y byddech wedi ysgrifennu ataf fi neu at Jane Hutt am hynny. Gan na wn am unrhyw lythyrau oddi wrthyh yn sôn am y mater hwnnw, dylech chwilio'ch cydwybod cyn dechrau gwneud cyhuddiadau mor eithafol. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru wedi cymryd camau bras ymlaen, o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa bum mlynedd a hanner yn ôl. Yr wyf wedi sôn am rai o'r meysydd niferus lle y gwnaethom gynnydd mawr, fel llawdriniaeth ar y galon, MRSA, a marwolaethau babanod. Cyflawnwyd llawer yn y meysydd pwysig hyn, lle y datblygasom o fod yn waeth na Lloegr a'r Alban i fod yn well o lawer yn ystod 2002-03. Ni ddeallaf pam y mae gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau'n methu â dioddef clywed newyddion da am wasanaeth iechyd Cymru.

Grwpiau Cydweithredol Co-operatives

Q3 Lorraine Barrett: Will the First Minister make a statement on co-operatives in Wales? (OAQ38473)

The First Minister: Co-operative businesses have an important part to play in the Welsh economy and have been strongly supported by the Assembly Government. Symbolically, one could say that the Tower Colliery workers' co-operative set up some years before the Assembly was an inspiration to the Welsh nation, to know that they could do things for themselves, and was a forerunner of devolution itself.

Lorraine Barrett: There are many young co-operatives across the UK, but not so many in Wales at present. We see youngsters selling fair trade products, acquiring business skills and learning about co-operative and

C3 Lorraine Barrett: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar grwpiau cydweithredol yng Nghymru? (OAQ38473)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gan fusnesau cydweithredol ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn economi Cymru ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi llawer o gefnogaeth iddynt. A siarad yn symbolaidd, gallai rhywun ddweud bod menter gydweithredol gweithwyr Glofa'r Tŵr a sefydlwyd rai blynyddoedd cyn y Cynulliad yn ysbrydoliaeth i genedl y Cymry, gan ei bod wedi dangos iddynt fod modd gwneud pethau drostynt eu hunain, a bu'n rhagflaenydd i ddatganoli ei hun.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae llawer o fentrau cydweithredol o eiddo pobl ifanc ledled y DU, ond nid oes cynifer yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Gwelwn bobl ifanc yn gwerthu cynhyrchion masnach deg, yn meithrin

democratic working. Will you speak to your Cabinet to see how we can encourage young people in Wales to set up and learn more about the young co-operatives?

The First Minister: Yes, indeed. There is potential for using the co-operative model across a wide range of industries in all sorts of areas, whether it is the provision of childcare, or taking over post offices which fail as businesses because people want to retire. Young people can take over those businesses. We have heard of community public houses being established. There is currently a wide range of areas where people of all ages understand that the co-operative model is much better than the unemployment model, and are taking over companies which are going through, or where the owner wants to retire and is willing to do a deal with younger employees to take the business forward. The Wales Co-operative Centre is widely recognised as having expertise—and is in the lead in Britain—in how to fund, provide advice and secure other funding to get those types of businesses off the ground. It is a valuable business experience where people are getting involved at a young age in their careers.

Jonathan Morgan: The growth in recent years of credit unions—a form of co-operative—has been welcomed by many communities throughout Wales. One concern which has been raised with me, is the rate of interest that credit unions charge for the loans that they provide. A maximum of 12.68 per cent annual percentage rate can be charged for people taking out loans from credit unions. Have these concerns been raised with you, and are you aware of people who have been put off applying to the local credit union for support because of the concerns expressed regarding the maximum amount of interest that can be charged?

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: I have not heard about high rates of interest. I do not know whether there is a grading for risk, or whether credit unions charge more or less interest when money is taken out, after money has been put in and saved. This is a new issue to me, and I

sgiliau busnes ac yn dysgu am weithio cydweithredol a democrataidd. A wnewch chi siarad â'ch Cabinet i weld sut y gallwn annog pobl ifanc yng Nghymru i gychwyn mentrau cydweithredol a dysgu mwy amdanynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf, yn wir. Mae lle i ddefnyddio'r model cydweithredol mewn amrywiaeth mawr o ddiwydiannau ac ym mhob math o feysydd, boed hynny wrth ddarparu gofal plant, neu gymryd drosodd swyddfeydd post sy'n methu fel busnesau am fod pobl yn dymuno ymddeol. Gall pobl ifanc gymryd drosodd y busnesau hynny. Clywsom am sefydlu tafarnau cymunedol. Mae amrywiaeth mawr o feysydd ar hyn o bryd lle y mae rhai o bob oed yn deall bod y model cydweithredol yn well o lawer na diweithdra, ac yn cymryd drosodd cwmnïau sy'n mynd i drafferthion, neu rai lle y mae'r perchennog yn dymuno ymddeol ac yn barod i daro bargaen â gweithwyr iau er mwyn parhau â'r busnes. Mae llawer yn cydnabod bod Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru yn meddu ar arbenigedd—a'i bod ar y blaen ym Mhrydain—o ran sut i ariannu, rhoi cyngor a sicrhau cyllid arall i gychwyn busnesau o'r fath. Mae hwn yn cynnig profiad gwerthfawr o fusnes lle ac mae pobl yn cymryd rhan yn gynnar yn eu gyrfa.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae twf undebau credyd—sy'n fath o fenter gydweithredol—yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf wedi'i groesawu gan lawer o gymunedau ledled Cymru. Un pryder a godwyd gyda mi yw'r gyfradd llog y mae undebau credyd yn ei chodi ar y benthyciadau a roddant. Gellir codi cyfradd ganrannol flynyddol o hyd at 12.68 y cant ar rai sy'n cymryd benthyciadau gan undebau credyd. A godwyd y pryderon hynny gyda chi, ac a wyddoch am rai a drowyd oddi wrth geisio cymorth gan yr undeb credyd lleol oherwydd y pryderon a fynegwyd ynghylch y llog uchaf y gellir ei godi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chlywais am gyfraddau llog uchel. Ni wn a oes graddoli mewn cysylltiad â risg, neu a yw undebau credyd yn codi mwy neu lai o log pan dynnir arian, ar ôl ei dalu i mewn a'i gadw. Mae hyn yn fater newydd i mi, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe

would be grateful if you could write to me or Edwina Hart with details. People see credit unions as a great good, because they get people away from the grip of loan sharks. Even if you are already in their grip, you can release yourself by using credit union facilities. I hope that you are talking about an isolated example, and I would be interested to learn about it.

Brian Gibbons: In the Afan Community Credit Union in Neath Port Talbot, such interest rates are not the norm. Credit unions are an effective way for people to get credit, and I hope that Jonathan Morgan's comments will not put people off using them.

In my constituency, there are other types of co-operatives which are leading the way in regeneration, such as the Glyncorwg Ponds co-operative, which is an outstanding example of regeneration in one of the most deprived communities in Wales. Will you extend your best wishes to Gwynfi community co-operative, of which I am a member, and of which my wife is a director, on the twentieth anniversary of its establishment as a community co-operative this year? The co-operative gives a tremendous service to the local community in the upper Afan valley.

The First Minister: I will indeed extend my best wishes—communities such as Glangwynfi, Abergwynfi and Glyncorwg are classic examples of areas where a co-operative can thrive. They are areas where, with a few exceptions, such as the local GP perhaps, there will not be a large professional middle class. People are then thrown back on their own resources, and find that mutuality and the co-operative model works extremely well in such areas.

gallech ysgrifennu ataf fi neu at Edwina Hart i roi manylion. Mae pobl yn ystyried bod undebau credyd yn llesol iawn, gan eu bod yn tynnu pobl o afael usurwyr. Hyd yn oed os ydych wedi mynd i'w gafael eisoes, gallwch ymryddhau drwy ddefnyddio cyfleusterau undeb credyd. Gobeithiaf eich bod yn sôn am enghraifft anghyffredin, a byddai o ddiddordeb imi gael gwybod amdani.

Brian Gibbons: Yn Undeb Credyd Cymunedol Afan yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, nid yw cyfraddau llog o'r fath yn arferol. Mae undebau credyd yn fodd effeithiol i bobl gael credyd, a gobeithiaf na fydd sylwadau Jonathan Morgan yn troi pobl oddi wrth eu defnyddio.

Yn fy etholaeth, ceir mathau eraill o fentrau cydweithredol sy'n arwain y ffordd o ran adfywio, fel menter gydweithredol Glyncorwg Ponds, sy'n enghraifft ragorol o adfywio yn un o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. A wnewch roi'ch dymuniadau gorau i fenter gydweithredol gymunedol Gwynfi, yr wyf fi yn aelod ohoni, a'm gwraig yn gyfarwyddwr arni, ar ugainmlwyddiant ei sefydlu'n fenter gymunedol eleni? Mae'r fenter gydweithredol hon yn rhoi gwasanaeth gwyach i'r gymuned leol yng nghwm Afan uchaf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoddaf fy nymuniadau gorau, yn sicr—mae cymunedau fel Glangwynfi, Abergwynfi a Glyncorwg yn enghreifftiau rhagorol o ardaloedd lle gall menter gydweithredol ffynnu. Ardaloedd yw'r rhain lle na cheir dosbarth canol proffesiynol niferus, heblaw am rai eithriadau, fel y meddyg teulu lleol efallai. Felly, mae pobl yn gorfod dibynnu ar eu dyfeisgarwch eu hunain, ac yn cael bod cydymddibyniaeth a'r model cydweithredol yn llwyddo'n dda iawn mewn ardaloedd o'r fath.

Prosiect DAWN ym Mae Colwyn The DAWN Project in Colwyn Bay

Q4 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on any visits he has made to the DAWN project in Colwyn Bay? (OAQ38464)

C4 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ei ymweliadau â phrosiect DAWN ym Mae Colwyn? (OAQ38464)

The First Minister: I opened the DAWN Project in Colwyn Bay in December 2002. Although I have not been able to visit since, I know that its work plays an important role in addressing the needs of offenders and disadvantaged people. I am therefore delighted that it was awarded a European structural funds grant of £2.1 million on 20 September, which is just over half of the total project cost of £4.1 million, so that it can continue the excellent work that it has been doing since 2002.

Janet Ryder: You are right to acknowledge that this project is perhaps one of the leaders in its field in Wales. It is doing excellent work to rehabilitate those people who have suffered from drug and alcohol abuse. It deals with over 1,000 clients across the whole of north Wales. As you mentioned, it has had to rely on European funding for half of its funding to keep the project going. That project money has been confirmed this year, but it was only confirmed within two or three days of redundancy notices being issued to the 70 and more people who work on the project, leaving its 1,000 and more clients without any support in north Wales. Do you agree that a groundbreaking project of this kind, which has a proven record and which is doing excellent work, should now be given permanent funding so that the people who work on the project can continue planning and developing that service, as is right for north Wales?

The First Minister: In a way, you are asking for the impossible. I sympathise with your point that the voluntary sector in Wales has always lived on a degree of hand-to-mouth funding. Normally, the voluntary sector is glad to receive funding for any period longer than 12 months. Anyone in the Chamber who has worked in the voluntary sector will know that it is an annual process, as the end of the financial year approaches, to beg the local authority or the Assembly or whoever for additional funding. At least the DAWN project now has three years funding from this latest European fund grant. It will come across the same problem eventually, but that is part of the nature of voluntary sector work. It is not a mainstream service. It is providing something over and above the norm. If it

Y Prif Weinidog: Agorais brosiect DAWN ym Mae Colwyn yn Rhagfyr 2002. Er nad wyf wedi gallu ymweld ag ef ers hynny, gwn fod ei waith yn bwysig o ran diwallu anghenion troseddwr a rhai dan anfantais. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn falch iawn ei fod wedi cael grant o gronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd o £2.1 miliwn ar 20 Medi, sydd ychydig yn fwy na hanner cyfanswm cost y prosiect o £4.1 miliwn, fel y gall barhau â'r gwaith rhagorol a wnaeth er 2002.

Janet Ryder: Mae'n briodol ichi gydnabod mai'r prosiect hwn yw un o'r rhai mwyaf blaenllaw o bosibl yn ei faes yng Nghymru. Gwnaiff waith rhagorol i adsefydlu'r rhai a ddiodeffodd oherwydd camddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol. Mae'n delio â mwy na 1,000 o gleientiaid ledled y Gogledd. Fel y dywedaso, bu'n rhaid i'r prosiect ddibynnu ar arian Ewropeaidd ar gyfer hanner ei gyllid er mwyn parhau. Mae'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer y prosiect wedi'i gadarnhau eleni, ond ni chafodd ei gadarnhau tan dim ond dau neu dri diwrnod cyn anfon hysbysiadau diswyddo at y 70 a rhagor sy'n gweithio ar y prosiect, gan adael ei 1,000 a mwy o gleientiaid heb unrhyw gymorth yn y Gogledd. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai prosiect arloesol o'r math hwn, sydd â record brofedig ac sy'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol, gael ei gyllido'n barhaus yn awr fel y gall y rhai sy'n gweithio ar y prosiect barhau i gynllunio a datblygu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw, fel y bo'n briodol i'r Gogledd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar un ystyr, yr ydych yn gofyn yr amhosibl. Cydymdeimlaf â'r pwynt a wnaethoch i'r perwyl bod y sector gwirfoddol yng Nghymru wedi gorfod byw o'r llaw i'r genau erioed i ryw raddau o ran y cyllid y mae'n ei dderbyn. Fel arfer, mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn falch o dderbyn cyllid ar gyfer unrhyw gyfnod sy'n hwy na 12 mis. Gŵyr unrhyw un yn y Siambr a weithiodd yn y sector gwirfoddol mai proses flynyddol, wrth i ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol nesáu, yw erfyn ar yr awdurdod lleol neu'r Cynulliad neu bwy bynnag am gyllid ychwanegol. O leiaf y mae prosiect DAWN bellach wedi cael cyllid am dair blynedd drwy'r grant diweddaraf hwn o gronfa Ewropeaidd. Bydd yr un broblem yn ailgodi yn y diwedd, ond mae hynny'n rhan o natur

does become something that is worthy of being a mainstream service, the local authority would need to take it over, but it then ceases to be a voluntary sector project. That is how it has always been.

Brynle Williams: Do you believe that it is the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government, through its social justice portfolio, to fund such schemes promoting drug and alcohol rehabilitation? Would you agree that money seized due to the conviction of drug dealers should be ring-fenced and also used to help out this scheme?

The First Minister: I thought that that was the case; this is one of the most encouraging examples of how the British-Irish Council works. A proposal that was originally made law in the Irish Republic was copied, through the good offices of the British-Irish Council, and was brought into being in Britain. Edwina Hart and I were Ministers at the British-Irish Council when Tony Blair and the Home Secretary saw how the Irish system worked and subsequently introduced it here. My understanding is that it is ring-fenced for exactly that kind of work, but I will write to you if I am wrong.

Rhwydwaith y Llywodraethau Rhanbarthol dros Ddatblygu Cynaliadwy The Network of Regional Governments for Sustainable Development

C5 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi adroddiad ar hynt y cytundebau a wnaed gan rwydwaith y llywodraethau rhanbarthol dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy? (OAQ38465)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y mae rhwydwaith llywodraethau rhanbarthol dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy wedi cyhoeddi pum dogfen bolisi a saith datganiad. Mae cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy yn ymgorffori ein hymrwymiad i weithio tuag at y nodau a bennwyd yn y dogfennau polisi. Byddwn hefyd yn mabwysiadu'r strategaeth waith a'r rhaglen ar gyfer 2005-08 yn y cynulliad cyffredinol cyntaf ym mis Chwefror.

gwaith y sector gwirfoddol. Nid gwasanaeth prif ffrwd ydyw. Mae'n darparu rhywbeth ychwanegol at yr hyn sy'n arferol. Os gwnaiff rywbeth sy'n deilwng o fod yn wasanaeth prif ffrwd, byddai'r awdurdod lleol yn ei gymryd drosodd, ond wedyn byddai'n peidio â bod yn brosiect yn y sector gwirfoddol. Felly y bu erioed.

Brynle Williams: A ydych yn credu mai cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, drwy ei phortffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, yw ariannu cynlluniau o'r fath sy'n hyrwyddo adsefydlu mewn cysylltiad â chyffuriau ac alcohol? A gytunwch y dylai arian a atafaelir o ganlyniad i euogfarnu gwerthwyr cyffuriau gael ei glustnodi a'i ddefnyddio hefyd i roi cymorth i'r cynllun hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Tybiais mai felly yr oedd; dyma un o'r enghreifftiau mwyaf calonogol o waith y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig. Efelychwyd cynllun a wnaed yn Ddeddf yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon, drwy waith y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig, ac fe'i cychwynwyd ym Mhrydain. Yr oedd Edwina Hart a minnau'n Weinidogion yn y Cyngor Prydeinig-Gwyddelig pan welodd Tony Blair a'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref sut yr oedd y system Wyddelig yn gweithio ac fe'i cyflwynasant yma wedyn. Deallaf ei fod yn cael ei glustnodi ar gyfer yr union un math o waith â hynny, ond ysgrifennaf atoch os wyf yn anghywir.

Q5 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the First Minister give a progress report on the agreements reached by the network of regional governments for sustainable development? (OAQ38465)

The First Minister: The network of regional governments for sustainable development has published five policy papers and seven declarations. The sustainable development action plan incorporates our commitment to working towards the actions set in the policy papers. We will also be adopting the work strategy and programme for 2005-08 at the first general assembly in February.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Fel yr ydym yn gwybod, sefydlwyd y rhwydwaith yn Johannesburg ac yr oeddech chi yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a arweiniodd at ei sefydliad. Bu pedair cynhadledd ers Johannesburg, gan gynnwys yr un olaf yma yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Mawrth, lle yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn cymryd rhan, a Carwyn Jones yn cadeirio sesiwn. A fyddai modd drafftio adroddiad i nodi'r cytundebau a wnaed yn y gynhadledd yng Nghaerdydd ac efallai i roi crynodeb o sut y mae'r penderfyniadau hynny yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r sector cyhoeddus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes anghytundeb rhyngom ar hynny. Yr ydych yn gywir—sefydlwyd y rhwydwaith yn uwchgynhadledd Johannesburg ac yr oeddwn yn rhan o'r panel a gadeiriodd y sesiynau i'w sefydlu. Bu Carwyn yn cyd-gadeirio sesiwn yng nghynhadledd Caerdydd, lle daeth 300 o aelodau ynghyd o wahanol ranbarthau bob cyfandir. Byddaf yn ystyried eich cais gyda Carwyn er mwyn eich hysbysu ynghylch yr argymhellion a sut y gallwn eu gweithredu yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd nifer o'r cyrff sy'n gysylltiedig a'r maes hwn yn falch o gael gweld unrhyw benderfyniadau ac argymhellion a wnaed yn y gynhadledd.

Byddwch yn gwybod fod Tony Blair wedi gwneud araith a bwysleisiodd bwysigrwydd newid hinsawdd fel un o'r sialensau mawr sy'n wynebu'r byd heddiw. Fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, a ydych yn gweld yr angen i roi arweiniad yn y maes hwn—a deallaf fod cyfrifoldebau adrannol i'w hystyried—er mwyn sicrhau nad ystyrir y pwnc fel math o seilo amgylcheddol, ond rhywbeth y dylid ei integreiddio ar draws y meysydd polisi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs, ac yn enwedig o ran yr economi. Mae'n anodd datrys y broblem neu'r paradocs o geisio sicrhau twf economaidd a pheidio â dinistrio'r amgylchedd yn y broses i'n plant a phlant ein plant. Gan fod gennyf gymaint o wyrion a wyresau, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r angen i gynnal yr amgylchedd, nid yn unig er fy mwyn i fy hun, ond er mwyn fy mhlant a phlant fy mhlant. Mae'n rhaid inni ddod o

Ieuan Wyn Jones: As we know, the network was established in Johannesburg and you were part of the discussions that led to its creation. There have been four conferences since Johannesburg, including the most recent in Cardiff in March, in which the Government took part and where Carwyn Jones chaired one of the sessions. Would it be possible for a report to be drafted in order to outline the agreements made in the Cardiff conference and perhaps to give us a summary of how those decisions are being implemented in the public sector?

The First Minister: There is no disagreement between us on that. You are right—the network was established at the Johannesburg summit and I was part of the panel which chaired the sessions that established it. Carwyn was joint chair of a session in Cardiff when 300 members gathered from different regions on every continent. Carwyn and I will consider your request so that we can inform you on the recommendations and how we can implement them in the public sector.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure that several of the organisations involved in this field would be pleased to see any decisions and recommendations made in that conference.

You will know that Tony Blair made a speech which emphasised the importance of climate change as one of the greatest challenges facing the world today. As First Minister, do you see the need to give guidance in this area—and I understand that there are departmental responsibilities to consider—so that the issue is not seen as part of an environmental silo, but as something that should be integrated into all policy areas?

The First Minister: Of course, and particularly in relation to the economy. It is difficult to solve the problem or paradox of trying to establish economic growth without destroying the environment for our children and our children's children in the process. I have many grandchildren, so I am well aware of the need to protect the environment, not only for my sake, but for the sake of my children and my children's children. We must

hyd i fodd o annog cynnydd mewn swyddi heb ddinistrio'r amgylchedd oherwydd y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â charbon yn casglu yn yr amgylchedd.

Mick Bates: The declaration that followed the Cardiff conference stated that we would work with young people. What have you done since March to achieve that?

The First Minister: I do not have the details on that, Mick, but I will ensure that Carwyn or I will write to you.

2.30 p.m.

What was striking about the Johannesburg conference, which made it more than a sideshow to the main conference, was the active participation of young people, including young people from Wales who had managed to get to Johannesburg for that conference, and who found it a life-changing experience, as did I. Their commitment to continuing to try to create a planet that is fit for them to live in and to raise their children in 30, 40 or 50 years' time, was quite remarkable. Some of those people are still involved and they also attended the conference in Cardiff in March.

find a way of stimulating growth in jobs without destroying the environment as a result of problems related to carbon build-up in the atmosphere.

Mick Bates: Yn y datganiad a ddilynodd y gynhadledd yng Nghaerdydd, dywedwyd y byddem yn gweithio gyda phobl ifanc. Beth a wnaethoch ers mis Mawrth i gyflawni hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r manylion gennyf am hynny, Mick, ond sicrhaf y bydd Carwyn neu fi'n ysgrifennu atoch.

Yr hyn a oedd yn drawiadol am y gynhadledd yn Johannesburg, a barodd iddi fod yn amgenach nag atodiad i'r brif gynhadledd, oedd y rhan a gymerodd pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys pobl ifanc o Gymru a lwyddodd i gyrraedd Johannesburg ar gyfer y gynhadledd honno, ac a'i cafodd yn brofiad a newidiodd eu bywydau, fel y gwneuthum i. Yr oedd eu hymrwymiad i barhau i geisio creu byd sy'n addas iddynt fyw ynddo a magu eu plant ynddo ymhen 30, 40 neu 50 mlynedd, yn eithaf rhyfeddol. Mae rhai o'r bobl hynny'n dal yn weithgar a daethant i'r gynhadledd yng Nghaerdydd ym mis Mawrth hefyd.

Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg (Cefnogaeth i Rieni) Welsh-medium Education (Support for Parents)

C6 Owen John Thomas: Pa gamau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i gynnal arolwg cenedlaethol i ddarganfod faint o gefnogaeth sydd i addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ymhlith rhieni plant o dan tair oed? (OAQ38462)

Y Prif Weinidog: Comisiynwyd ymchwil gan Goleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, gan Adran Addysg a Hyfforddiant y Cynulliad. Nid arolwg yn gymaint ag archwiliad ydoedd, ond mae'r ddau beth yn debyg o ran ceisio darganfod beth yw'r cyflenwad a'r galw am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.

Owen John Thomas: Yr ydych yn ymwybodol bod creu Cymru ddwyieithog yn golygu defnyddio strategaeth genedlaethol. Yr ydych hefyd yn ymwybodol mai addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yw'r dull mwyaf effeithiol o gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n gallu siarad Cymraeg. Gan bod 21 mis wedi mynd

Q6 Owen John Thomas: What steps is the Government taking to hold a national survey to establish the support for Welsh-medium education among the parents of children under three years of age? (OAQ38462)

The First Minister: The Assembly's Training and Education Department commissioned research from Trinity College, Carmarthen. It was not a survey so much as an audit, but the two are similar in terms of attempting to establish the supply and demand for Welsh-medium education.

Owen John Thomas: You are aware that the creation of a bilingual Wales requires a national strategy. You are also aware that Welsh-medium education is the most effective method of increasing the number of Welsh-speakers. As 21 months have gone by since the publication of 'Iaith Pawb', and

heibio ers cyhoeddi 'Iaith Pawb', a phedair blynedd ers imi dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes at yr angen i gyfrif y galw am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a wnewch ystyried y mater hwn i ddarganfod beth neu bwy sy'n rhwystro cyflawni'r arolwg hwnnw, sy'n sylfaenol i unrhyw gynllun i greu Cymru ddwyieithog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Efallai y gallwch ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn hwnnw pan y byddwch yn fwy ymwybodol o fanylion archwiliad Coleg y Drindod, Caerfyrddin, a gwblhawyd fis Mawrth, y cyfeiriais ato wrth ateb eich cwestiwn cyntaf. Nid yw hynny'n union yr un peth â'r hyn y galwch amdano, ond yr oedd yn asesiad o sut mae'r cyflewngwad, hyd at fis Mawrth, yn ateb y galw. Credaf fod hynny'n cwrdd â rhyw 90 y cant o'r hyn y galwch amdano, a sicrhaf fy mod innau, neu'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â chynnwys a chanlyniadau archwiliad Coleg y Drindod.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn galw David Davies.

David Davies: Diolch, gwir anrhydeddus Lywydd. Brif Weinidog, a fydddech yn disgwyl llawer o gefnogaeth dros addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn sir Gaerfyrddin, ac, os felly, pam mae'r Llywodraeth yn cau cymaint o ysgolion bach yn yr ardal honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod David wedi dysgu sut y dylai aelod o'r werin gyfeirio at aelod o Dŷ'r Arglwyddi. Ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae pawb yn derbyn bod pob awdurdod addysg lleol yn gorfod edrych ar sut y maent yn cwrdd â gofynion y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Os ydynt am ailstrwythuro'u hysgolion, mae'r broses apelio yn golygu, os oes gwrthwynebiadau, y bydd yr apeliadau yn cael eu cyflwyno i Jane Davidson, fel y Gweinidog perthnasol. Nid y Llywodraeth sy'n siarad am ad-drefnu neu ailstrwythuro'r system addysg, ond yr awdurdodau addysg lleol eu hunain. Rhaid inni amddiffyn hawl y rhai sy'n gwrthwynebu i wneud apêl i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Peter Black: One of the issues with regard to the provision of Welsh-medium education is

four years since I drew the attention of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to the need to quantify the demand for Welsh-medium education, will you consider this issue to discover what or whom is preventing the completion of that survey, which is fundamental to any plan to create a bilingual Wales?

The First Minister: Perhaps you could return to that question when you are more aware of the details of the audit done by Trinity College, Carmarthen, to which I referred in answer to your first question, and which was completed in March. It is not exactly what you are calling for, but it is an assessment of how supply, up to March, is meeting demand. I believe that it satisfies about 90 per cent of what you are calling for, and I will ensure that either I, or the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, will write to you about the contents and conclusions of Trinity College's audit.

The Presiding Officer: I call David Davies.

David Davies: Thank you, right honourable Presiding Officer. First Minister, would you expect a great deal of support for Welsh-medium education in Carmarthenshire, and, if so, why is the Government closing so many small schools in that area?

The First Minister: I am pleased to see that David has learnt how a member of the proletariat should refer to a member of the House of Lords. With regard to the situation in Carmarthenshire, everybody accepts that all local education authorities must consider how they meet the requirements of the national curriculum. If they wish to restructure their schools, the appeals process means that, if there are objections, those appeals will be submitted to Jane Davidson, as the relevant Minister. It is not the Government that is talking about reorganising or restructuring the education system, but the local education authorities themselves. We must protect the right of those who object to appeal to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning.

Peter Black: Un o'r materion sy'n codi mewn cysylltiad â darparu addysg cyfrwng

that the demand for it is growing in many areas and local education authorities are having to provide new schools in many instances, but are having difficulties in accessing the capital to do so. Can the Welsh Assembly Government help LEAs with that, by specifically targeting capital for the provision of Welsh-medium education facilities?

The First Minister: This is a long-standing issue because Welsh-medium education cannot be provided on a smoothed-out basis. You have to start with one class in a school where classes will eventually cover five years. That will mean that there are many empty spaces initially and then, gradually, the school will fill up. That causes all kinds of different problems with regard to lumpy investment and so on. As you are probably aware, the overall schools capital budget in the draft budget proposals, about which more later, at least equal the £560 million that has been mentioned in previous manifestos and so on. Whether that will be adequate, I do not know. Most Welsh-medium schools are, of course, refurbished former general purpose schools, and that pattern will probably continue.

Cymraeg yw bod y galw amdani ar gynnydd mewn sawl ardal a bod awdurdodau addysg lleol yn gorfod darparu ysgolion newydd mewn llawer achos, ond yn ei chael yn anodd cael y cyfalaf i wneud hynny. A oes modd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru helpu AALlau yn hynny o beth, drwy bennu cyfalaf ar gyfer darparu cyfleusterau addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hyn yn fater sy'n bod ers tro gan na ellir darparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn wastad. Rhaid dechrau ag un dosbarth mewn ysgol lle bydd y dosbarthiadau'n ymestyn i bum mlynedd yn y pen draw. Oherwydd hynny, ceir llawer o leoedd gwag ar y dechrau ac yna, yn raddol, bydd yr ysgol yn llenwi. Mae hynny'n peri pob math o broblemau o ran buddsoddi anwastad ac yn y blaen. Fel y gwyddoch, yn ôl pob tebyg, mae cyfanswm y gyllideb cyfalaf ysgolion yng nghynigion y gyllideb ddrafft, y ceir mwy o sôn amdanynt yn ddiweddarach, yn gymaint o leiaf â'r £560 miliwn a grybwyllwyd mewn manifestos blaenorol ac yn y blaen. Ni wn a fydd hynny'n ddigon. Wrth gwrs, mae'r rhan fwyaf o ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn ysgolion a godwyd cynt i bwrpas cyffredinol a'u hadnewyddu, a bydd y patrwm hwnnw'n parhau, yn ôl pob tebyg.

Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru The Welsh Development Agency

Q7 Mark Isherwood: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Development Agency? (OAQ38440)

C7 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru? (OAQ38440)

The First Minister: I announced that the Welsh Development Agency will merge with the appropriate department of the Assembly Government by 1 April 2006, which is in approximately 18 months' time. A project is under way to determine the exact details of how this is to be accomplished, and the legislation required to implement this decision is being prepared.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyhoeddais y bydd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn cyfuno â'r adran briodol yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad erbyn 1 Ebrill 2006, sef ymhen tua 18 mis. Mae prosiect yn mynd rhagddo i bennu union fanylion y dull o gyflawni hynny, ac mae'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ofynnol i weithredu'r penderfyniad hwn yn cael ei pharatoi.

I commend the work of the WDA in chairing the body that has been looking at the issue in the Dee estuary with regard to shipping the first batch of operational Airbus wings, which eventually left on Sunday despite fog on Saturday. I am grateful to all the officials

Cymeradwyaf waith y WDA yn cadeirio'r corff a fu'n ystyried y mater a gododd yn aber Dyfrdwy sy'n ymwneud â chludo'r llwyth cyntaf o adenydd gweithredol yr Airbus, a adawodd ddydd Sul yn y diwedd er gwaethaf y niwl ar ddydd Sadwrn. Yr wyf yn

involved in ensuring that that went off, eventually, without a hitch.

Mark Isherwood: That was not my point, although I join you in your congratulations.

Given the concern expressed by business organisations such as the Federation of Small Businesses, the Confederation of British Industry and the Institute of Directors, that taking the WDA in-house will lead to the civil service taking over, a concern also expressed by Labour MP Gareth Thomas, how do you respond to the so-called consultation with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, which amounted to summoning business organisations to meetings and presenting them with a *fait accompli*? Does not good business practice mean all parties agreeing their diary dates, followed by meetings based on discussion and, wherever practicable, agreed action plans?

The First Minister: I have three points to make. First, it definitely will be a merger, and not a takeover, despite the fears expressed to that effect. Secondly, we have insisted, and will continue to insist, that the basic principle will be business as usual or better in all dealings with the business community in the run-up to the merger's taking effect and afterwards. Thirdly, many of the previous fears about the so-called civil service takeover were based on the myth that the civil service did not have private sector expertise. When we have explained which people from the private sector we have brought in to the economic development and transport department over the past year or so, people's fears are by and large put to rest.

Christine Chapman: To return to the WDA's policies, which is what most people are interested in, do you welcome the WDA's launch yesterday of its youth enterprise and entrepreneurship strategy, which I attended, along with Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning? This strategy will help the young people of Wales to become much more entrepreneurially active, thereby contributing to Wales's

ddiolchgar i'r holl swyddogion a fu'n ymwneud â sicrhau anfon hwnnw, yn y diwedd, yn ddiraffferth.

Mark Isherwood: Nid hwnnw oedd y pwynt a oedd gennyf, er fy mod yn ymuno â chi i estyn llongyfarchion.

Yng ngolwg y pryder a fynegwyd gan gyrff busnes fel y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, y bydd ymgorffori'r WDA yn arwain at ei gymryd drosodd gan y gwasanaeth sifil, sy'n bryder a fynegwyd hefyd gan yr AS Llafur Gareth Thomas, sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r ymgynghoriad bondigrybwyll gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, gan na wnaed mwy na galw cyrff busnes i gyfarfodydd a chyflwyno *fait accompli* iddynt? Onid yw arferion busnes da yn gofyn y bydd yr holl bartion yn cytuno ar ddyddiad, ac y ceir cyfarfodydd yn dilyn hynny ar sail trafodaeth ac, os oes modd, cynlluniau gweithredu a gytunwyd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gennyf dri phwynt i'w gwneud. Yn gyntaf, cyfuno, nid cymryd drosodd, fydd yn digwydd yn bendant, er gwaethaf yr ofnau a fynegwyd i'r perwyl hwnnw. Yn ail, yr ydym wedi mynnu, a byddwn yn dal i fynnu, mai'r egwyddor sylfaenol fydd busnes fel arfer neu well na hynny yn yr holl drafodion â phobl busnes cyn i'r cyfuno ddod i rym ac wedyn. Yn drydydd, yr oedd llawer o'r ofnau blaenorol ynghylch y cymryd drosodd honedig gan y gwasanaeth sifil yn seiliedig ar yr hen goel nad yw'r gwasanaeth sifil yn meddu ar arbenigedd y sector preifat. Wedi inni egluro pa rai o'r sector preifat y daethom â hwy i'r adran datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf, lleddfir ofnau pobl gan mwyaf.

Christine Chapman: Gan droi'n ôl at bolisiau'r WDA, sef yr hyn y mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ymddiddori ynddo, a ydych yn croesawu'r lansio ddoe gan y WDA ar ei strategaeth menter ac entrepreneuriaeth ieuenctid, y bûm yn bresennol ynddo, gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes? Bydd y strategaeth hon yn helpu pobl ifanc Cymru i ddod yn llawer mwy entrepreneuriaidd, gan gyfrannu at dwf a

growth and prosperity.

The First Minister: I agree with that strongly. It is all part of the issue of what you do with young people in school from the age of 14 onwards and how much emphasis you place on academic education as we understood it in my generation, and perhaps as you understood it in yours, too, Christine, as well as the extent to which you can persuade people that schools and employers should also value what might you might call enterprise in school as shown through teamwork, project work, entering business competitions, and engineering teamwork competitions. Taking part in such activities means that those pupils have a completely different attitude to life when they eventually leave the educational system and take up work. Trying to get away from the old-fashioned academic attitude that says that you either pass or fail is a part of inculcating a new spirit that will be of great benefit to the economy.

Elin Jones: A fydd rhai o gyfrifoldebau neu rannau o gyllideb yr awdurdod datblygu yn cael eu trosglwyddo i lywodraeth leol, yn benodol yn y meysydd hynny y mae llywodraeth leol eisoes yn weithredol ynddynt, megis datblygu cymunedol, datblygu trefol a datblygu isadeiledd, neu ai'ch bwriad yw canoli'r cwbl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr mai 'canoli' yw'r gair iawn, oherwydd ni fydd yn fwy canolog ei strwythur nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Mae gennym un corff Cymru gyfan yn y WDA yn awr, a bydd gennym un corff o hyd ar ôl i'r WDA uno ag adran datblygu economaidd y Llywodraeth. Felly, ni fydd yn fwy canolog nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Mae peidio â dweud 'byth' yn egwyddor bwysig mewn gwleidyddiaeth, ond nid oes gennym fwiad ar hyn o bryd i newid y strwythur a throsglwyddo rhai o gyfrifoldebau'r WDA i lywodraeth leol, a dywedais hynny wrth lywodraeth leol. Byddai hynny'n achosi cymhlethdod, a bydd yn ddigon anodd cyflawni'r ymgorfforiad fel ag y mae, heb gymhlethu pethau'n fwy drwy ystyried trosglwyddiadau i gyrff eraill gyda strwythurau eraill, ac ar lefelau eraill, megis llywodraeth leol.

ffyniant Cymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf yn gryf â hynny. Mae hyn i gyd yn ymwneud â mater yr hyn a wneir â phobl ifanc yn yr ysgol o 14 oed ymlaen a faint o pwyslais a roddir ar addysg academiaidd fel yr oeddem ni'n ei deall yn fy nghanedlaeth i, a chithau yn eich cenedlaeth chi, Christine, hefyd efallai, yn ogystal â'r graddau y gellir darbwyllo pobl y dylai ysgolion a chyflogwyr hefyd fawrbrisió'r hyn y gellid ei alw'n fenter yn yr ysgol fel y'i hamlygir drwy waith tîm, gwaith prosiect, ymgeisio mewn cystadlaethau busnes, a chystadlaethau gwaith tîm peirianeg. Drwy gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau o'r fath, bydd gan y disgyblion hynny ymagwedd gwbl wahanol at fywyd pan adawant y system addysgol yn y diwedd a dechrau gweithio. Mae'r ymgais i gefnu ar yr ymagwedd academiaidd hen ffasiwn sy'n dal bod rhywun un ai'n llwyddo neu'n methu yn rhan o'r gwaith o feithrin ysbryd newydd a fydd o les mawr i'r economi.

Elin Jones: Will any of the development agency's responsibilities or budget be transferred to local government, particularly in those areas in which local government is already active, such as community, urban and infrastructure development, or is it your intention to centralise the lot?

The First Minister: I am not sure that 'centralise' is the right word, because it will be no more centralised in its structure than it is now. We currently have one all-Wales body in the WDA, and we will still have one body following the WDA's merger with the Government's economic development department. Therefore, it will be no more centralised than it is at present. It is an important principle never to say 'never' in politics, but we have no plans at present to change the structure and transfer some of the WDA's responsibilities to local government, and I have told local government that. That would complicate matters, and it will be difficult enough to complete the merger as it is, without complicating matters further by considering transfers to other bodies with other structures and on other levels such as local government.

2.40 p.m.

Leighton Andrews: Do you agree that the appointment of the chief executive of the WDA, Gareth Hall, has been widely welcomed in the business community in Wales and that it is deeply disappointing to see attacks on that appointment from whatever quarter in the pages of *The Western Mail*?

The First Minister: I have not seen any attacks on the appointment of Gareth Hall. Like you, I thought that his appointment was so widely welcomed that the welcome was universal. He is well liked and highly respected for all the right reasons.

Jenny Randerson: Professor Kevin Morgan's article reminds us that, a few days after your announcement regarding the abolition of the WDA, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport issued a joint statement with the chair of the WDA, saying that the new organisation will be,

'the best of its kind, not only in the UK, but in Europe.'

Can you explain how you define 'the best in Europe'? Which European countries do you consider to be role models in this regard, and how will you measure your success or failure against this ambitious target?

The First Minister: To put it briefly, this is on the basis of the one-stop shop, namely that everything will be available from one port of call for potential clients, whether they are overseas or Welsh clients, or a combination of both. The techniques by which you would seek to measure success are well understood: they are known as benchmarking. You simply find out what is generally accepted as best practice, measure yourself against that and see if you can top it.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn cytuno bod penodiad Gareth Hall yn brif weithredwr y WDA wedi'i groesawu'n gyffredinol gan bobl fusnes yng Nghymru ac mai tra siomedig yw gweld ymosodiadau ar y penodiad hwnnw gan ba rai bynnag ar dudalennau *The Western Mail*?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni welais unrhyw ymosodiadau ar benodiad Gareth Hall. Fel chithau, tybiais fod croeso mor gyffredinol i'w benodi fel bod y croeso hwnnw'n unfrydol. Mae'n gymeradwy gan bawb ac mae parch mawr ato am yr holl resymau iawn.

Jenny Randerson: Mae erthygl yr Athro Kevin Morgan yn ein hatgoffa bod y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, ychydig ddyddiau ar ôl eich cyhoeddiad am ddi-ddymu'r WDA, wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ar y cyd â chadeirydd y WDA, yn dweud mai'r corff newydd fydd

y gorau o'i fath, nid yn unig yn y DU, ond yn Ewrop.

A allwch egluro'ch diffiniad o 'y gorau yn Ewrop'? Pa wledydd Ewropeaidd a ystyriwch yn batrymau yn hyn o beth, a sut y byddwch yn mesur eich llwyddiant neu fethiant yn erbyn y targed uchelgeisiol hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: A'i roi mewn byr eiriau, mae hyn yn seiliedig ar y siop un stop, sef y bydd popeth ar gael mewn un man i gleientiaid posibl, pa un a ydynt yn gleientiaid o wledydd tramor neu o Gymru, neu'n gyfuniad o'r ddau. Mae'r technegau a ddefnyddid i fesur llwyddiant yn dra dealliedig: fe'u gelwir yn feincnodi. Y cwbl a wneir yw darganfod yr hyn a dderbynnir yn gyffredinol yn arferion da, a'u defnyddio fel ffyn mesur i weld a ellir rhagori arnynt.

Masnach Cig Anghyfreithlon The Illegal Meat Trade

Q8 Brynle Williams: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to combat illegal meat imports and exports in and out of

C8 Brynle Williams: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â chig sy'n cael ei fewnforio i

Wales? (OAQ38474)

The First Minister: As you probably know, Brynle, the Welsh Assembly Government has policy responsibility for the control of illegal imports of meat into Wales, but, since April 2003, Her Majesty's Customs and Excise has had responsibility for combating the smuggling thereof. Trade within the European Union is not subject to this type of control, but exports to other countries require health certificates, negotiated by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs on a UK-wide basis.

Brynle Williams: I am concerned that a great deal of suitcase meat is coming in through Cardiff, I believe, and, regrettably, the perpetrators get away with a £50 fine and confiscation of the meat. It is time to confiscate passports, and we should be repatriating people who are bringing meat in from third-world countries. I do not know what your views are on this, First Minister, but something has to be done, and sooner rather than later.

The First Minister: You will be aware that Carwyn Jones attended the launch with HM Customs and Excise in Cardiff international airport—and I assume that you are talking about the airport and not the port—in November last year. Carwyn jointly launched the campaign with Customs and Excise, using the sales pitch that we hope will have penetrated into the minds of potential importers: 'If in doubt, leave it out.' In other words, do not bring in meat, even if you think that it might be a nice present for friends, or that it might help celebrate a wedding, for example. If in doubt, leave it out; do not bring it in. It is better to live with any difficulties that you may have over a party for which you promised to bring in exotic meat, than to have the fine and to suffer all the other consequences that could befall you.

Gymru, a'i allforio o Gymru, yn anghyfreithlon? (OAQ38474)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y gwyddoch, yn ôl pob tebyg, Brynle, Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb o ran polisi dros reoli mewnfurion cig anghyfreithlon i Gymru, ond, ers Ebrill 2003, Tollau Tramor a Chartref Ei Mawrhydi sy'n gyfrifol am gymryd camau yn erbyn eu smyglo. Nid yw masnach o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ddarostyngedig i reolaeth o'r fath, ond rhaid wrth dystysgrifau iechyd ar gyfer allforion i wledydd eraill, a negodir gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ledled y DU.

Brynle Williams: Pryderaf fod llawer iawn o gig yn dod drwy Gaerdydd mewn cesys dillad, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, a, gwaetha'r modd, y cwbl a gaiff y troseddwy'r yw £50 o ddirwy ac atafaelu'r cig. Mae'n bryd atafaelu pasportau, a dylem ddychwelyd pobl i'w gwlad eu hun os ceir eu bod yn dod â chig i mewn o wledydd y trydydd byd. Ni wn beth yw'ch barn am hyn, Brif Weinidog, ond rhaid gwneud rhywbeth, a hynny cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwyddoch fod Carwyn Jones wedi bod yn y cyfarfod lansio gyda Thollau Tramor a Chartref EM ym maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd—a chymeraf eich bod yn sôn am y maes awyr yn hytrach na'r porthladd—ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd. Cydlansiodd Carwyn yr ymgyrch gyda'r Tollau Tramor a Chartref, gan ddefnyddio'r perswâd y gobeithiwn ei fod wedi treiddio i feddwl mewnfurwyr dichonol: 'Os nad ydych yn sicr, peidiwch â'i gario'. Mewn geiriau eraill, peidiwch â dod â chig i mewn, hyd yn oed os credwch y gallai fod yn anrheg ddymunol i ffrindiau, neu y gallai fod o gymorth i ddathlu priodas, er enghraifft. Os nad ydych yn sicr, peidiwch â'i gario; peidiwch â dod ag ef i mewn. Gwell yw dygymod ag unrhyw anawsterau a gaech ynghylch parti yr oeddech wedi addo dod â chig dieithr ar ei gyfer na chael y ddirwy a dioddef yr holl ganlyniadau eraill a allai ddod i'ch rhan.

Canfyddiadau Adroddiad Comisiwn Richard The Findings of the Richard Commission Report

Q9 Lisa Francis: Will the First Minister **C9 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog

make a statement on the findings of the Richard commission report? (OAQ38476)

The First Minister: I have written to the Secretary of State for Wales summarising the Assembly's decisions, as reflected in the votes taken at the conclusion of our excellent debate on 6 October, and it is now for the Westminster Government to co-operate with us in taking these decisions forward.

Lisa Francis: The Richard commission's findings state that, in terms of time devoted to Assembly committees, there is a trade-off between policy development and effective scrutiny. In my opinion, having been an Assembly Member for just over a year, a three-week cycle does not allow us enough time to deal with committee business properly, especially when some committees, such as the Economic Development Committee, have swallowed up an additional portfolio, such as transport, and have become, in effect, super committees. This does not just bring Welsh Labour into disrepute but also, more importantly, the Assembly as an institution. What do you intend to do about that?

The First Minister: I believe in effective scrutiny, but you should not confuse effective scrutiny with the length of time taken over scrutiny. Having a proper separation between what you might call the committee's policy development roles, which are important and which have produced many good policies, and effective scrutiny is important for us all. However, it is not just about the time taken.

Helen Mary Jones: Will you acknowledge that it is probably only you and some of your Labour colleagues that believe that this three-week committee cycle is working? You are right that it is not just about time but about how that time is used. However, that time is inadequate, particularly in terms of getting subject committees to go out to the regions of Wales, a point that was raised with me yesterday by the voluntary sector in Llandrindod Wells. Given that the current levels of scrutiny are inadequate without primary powers, how on earth do you believe that we will be able to adequately scrutinise

ddatganiad ar ganfyddiadau adroddiad comisiwn Richard? (OAQ38476)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru gan grynhoi penderfyniadau'r Cynulliad, fel y'u hadlewyrchir yn y pleidleisiau a gymerwyd ar derfyn ein dadl ragorol ar 6 Hydref, a lle Llywodraeth San Steffan yn awr yw cydweithredu â ni i hyrwyddo'r penderfyniadau hynny.

Lisa Francis: Yn ôl canfyddiadau comisiwn Richard, ceir cyfaddawdu, yng nghyd-destun yr amser a neilltuir ar gyfer pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, rhwng datblygu polisi a chraffu effeithiol. Yn fy marn i, a minnau wedi bod yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad am ychydig dros flwyddyn, nid yw cylch tair wythnos yn rhoi digon o amser inni ymdrin â busnes pwyllgor yn iawn, yn enwedig gan fod rhai pwyllgorau, fel y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd, wedi llyncu portffolio ychwanegol, fel trafniadaeth, ac wedi troi, i bob pwrpas, yn uwchbwyllgorau. Nid yn unig y mae hyn yn dwyn anfri ar Lafur Cymru, ond mae hefyd, yn bwysicach, yn rhoi enw drwg i'r Cynulliad fel sefydliad. Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf mewn craffu effeithiol, ond ni ddylech gymysgu rhwng hynny a maint yr amser a gymerir i graffu. Mae gwahanu'n briodol rhwng yr hyn y gellid ei alw'n rolau datblygu polisi'r pwyllgor, sy'n bwysig ac wedi creu llawer o bolisiau da, a chraffu effeithiol yn bwysig i bob un ohonom. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymwneud â mwy na'r amser a gymerir.

Helen Mary Jones: A wnewch gydnabod mai chi a rhai o'ch cyd-Aelodau Llafur yw'r unig rai sy'n credu bod y cylch pwyllgorau tair wythnos hwn yn llwyddo? Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod a wnelo hyn â'r modd y defnyddir yr amser yn ogystal â maint yr amser sydd ar gael. Er hynny, mae'r amser hwnnw'n annigonol, yn enwedig o ran peri i bwyllgorau pwnc fynd allan i ranbarthau Cymru, sy'n bwynt a godwyd gyda mi ddoe gan y sector gwirfoddol yn Llandrindod. Gan fod y lefelau craffu presennol yn annigonol a ninnau heb bwerau sylfaenol, sut ar y ddaear y gallwch gredu y byddwn yn gallu craffu'n

any Government without additional Assembly Members when we get primary powers—and let us hope that it is ‘when’ and not ‘if’.

The First Minister: I declare a non-interest in that I am not a member of a subject committee. However, I agree that we are all in favour of getting the committees to meet outside Cardiff, and that they should go to locations outside the Assembly’s buildings. That is important. However, how you do that and what sort of cycle you need to permit that—it should be a more flexible cycle or a more fixed one, as I believe you commend—is a matter for the Panel of Chairs to discuss as to what is the best way to achieve it.

The Presiding Officer: Question 10 (OAQ38439) has been withdrawn.

ddigonol ar waith unrhyw Lywodraeth heb gael ychwaneg o Aelodau Cynulliad pan gawn bwerau sylfaenol—a gadewch inni obeithio mai ‘pan’ yw hynny ac nid ‘os’.

Y Prif Weinidog: Datganaf nad oes gennyf fuddiant gan nad wyf yn aelod o bwyllgor pwnc. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf ein bod oll o blaid peri i’r pwyllgorau gwrdd y tu allan i Gaerdydd, ac y dylent fynd i fannau y tu allan i adeiladau’r Cynulliad. Mae hynny’n bwysig. Er hynny, mae’r modd y gwneir hynny a pha fath o gylch y mae ei angen i ganiatáu hynny—dylai fod yn gylch mwy hyblyg neu’n gylch mwy sefydlog, fel yr ydych chi’n cymell, yr wyf yn credu—yn fater i’w drafod gan Banel y Cadeiryddion, o ran canfod y modd gorau i gyflawni hynny.

Y Llywydd: Mae cwestiwn 10 (OAQ38439) wedi’i dynnu yn ôl.

Lleihau Amseroedd Aros y GIG Reduce NHS waiting times

Q11 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on his Government’s efforts to reduce NHS waiting times? (OAQ38480)

The First Minister: Considerable progress has been made since 1999 and the Assembly Government is determined to reduce waiting times further. That is why we have brought in the 18-month second offer scheme, which will shortly change to a 12-month second offer scheme as of 31 March next year.

Nick Bourne: I wrote to you this morning about a constituent of mine, First Minister, whose case I have only just heard about. This 63-year-old constituent, who I will not name as I do not know whether he would be happy about that, has been waiting 18 months, in excruciating pain, for a hip replacement. I hope that you will pay attention to my letter and discuss it with the Minister for Health and Social Services. In the meantime, however, what hope can you offer to such people, of whom we know there are far too many?

The First Minister: Your constituent should be in receipt of a second offer. If that has not happened, that is a matter for his GP to take

C11 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar ymdrechion ei Lywodraeth i leihau amseroedd aros y GIG? (OAQ38480)

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaed cryn gynnydd ers 1999 ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn benderfynol o leihau amseroedd aros ymhellach. Dyna pam y cyflwynasom gynllun yr ail gynnig ar ôl 18 mis, a fydd yn troi cyn hir yn gynllun yr ail gynnig ar ôl 12 mis o 31 Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen.

Nick Bourne: Ysgrifennais atoch y bore yma, Brif Weinidog, am etholwr i mi yr wyf newydd glywed am ei achos. Bu’r etholwr 63 mlwydd oed hwn, nas enwaf gan na wn a fyddai’n fodlon ar hynny, yn aros am 18 mis, mewn poen dirdynol, am glun newydd. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn talu sylw i’r llythyr ac yn ei drafod gyda’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Yn y cyfamser, fodd bynnag, pa obaith y gallwch ei gynnig i bobl o’r fath, y gwyddom fod gormod o lawer ohonynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dylai’ch etholwr gael ail gynnig. Os na ddigwyddodd hynny, mae hynny’n fater i’w godi gan ei feddyg teulu

up with the local health board and health trust. However, I give you my undertaking that I will ensure that Jane Hutt and I give this matter our personal attention when we receive the letter, perhaps later this afternoon.

gyda'r bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, ymgymeraf i sicrhau y bydd Jane Hutt a mi'n rhoi sylw personol i'r mater hwn pan gawn y llythyr, yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma efallai.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I have just one change to report to this week's business. Following this statement, the First Minister will make a statement on the consultation document, 'Making the Connections', about delivering public services in Wales.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Nid oes gennyf ond un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Yn dilyn y datganiad hwn, bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud datganiad ar y ddogfen ymgynghorol 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', ynghylch y dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Further to this morning's deliberations in the Business Committee, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined, under Standing Order No. 24.6, that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Single Payment Scheme and Miscellaneous Direct Support Schemes (Appeals) (Wales) Regulations 2004, the Water Act 2003 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2004, the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Commencement) (Wales) Order 2004, the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004 (Firefighters' Pension Scheme) (Wales) Order 2004, the Council Tax (Liability for Owners) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004, and the Council Tax (Chargeable Dwellings, Exempt Dwellings and Discount Disregards) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2004.

Mae busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Ymhellach i'r trafodion y bore yma yn y Pwyllgor Busnes, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.6, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau is-ddeddfwriaeth a ganlyn i bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried yn helaethach: Rheoliadau Cynllun y Taliad Sengl ac Amrywiol Gynlluniau Cymorth Uniongyrchol (Apelau) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Deddf Dŵr 2003 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Deddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 (Cychwyn) (Cymru) 2004, Gorchymyn Deddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004 (Cynllun Pensiwn Diffoddwyr Tân) (Cymru) 2004, Rheoliadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Atebolrwydd Perchenogion) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004, a Gorchymyn y Dreth Gyngor (Anheddau Taladwy, Anheddau Esempt a Diystyru Gostyngiadau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

2.50 p.m.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae gennyf ddau bwynt. Yr wythnos diwethaf, bu i chi addo, Weinidog, y byddech yn dod yn ôl ataf ynglŷn â sefyllfa Friction Dynamics, ond ni

Alun Ffred Jones: I have two points. Last week, you promised, Minister, that you would come back to me on the Friction Dynamics situation, but I have not heard

chlywais gennych eto; gobeithio y byddaf cyn hir.

Yn ail, mae angen rhoi sylw i sefyllfa cwmni Antur Dwryrd Llŷn yn fy etholaeth. Arferai'r cwmni hybu gweithgarwch economaidd, ond, yn ddiweddar, fe'i rhoddwyd yn nwylo'r gweinyddwyr gyda dyledion o dros £1 miliwn. Mae llawer o gwmnïau lleol wedi colli arian oherwydd hyn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ddatganiad ar y mater? Yr oedd Antur Dwryrd Llŷn yn dibynnu'n llwyr ar arian a chytundebau cyhoeddus, ac, felly, os camddefnyddiwyd arian cyhoeddus—nid wyf yn gwneud unrhyw gyhuddiadau yn erbyn Antur Dwryrd Llŷn—credaf y dylai'r cyhoedd gael ateb. Galwaf ar y Prif Weinidog, neu unrhyw Weinidog arall, i sefydlu ymchwiliad swyddogol i'r hyn a ddigwyddodd. Croesawaf unrhyw sylwadau ar hynny gan y Trefnydd.

Jonathan Morgan: We requested this morning that you schedule a statement as soon as possible on the closure of Benefits Agency offices in Wales. I know that you have said that this is an operational matter for the Benefits Agency, but that does not stop the Assembly from discussing matters that are not necessarily within its remit. We also requested a statement on the trade dispute between Airbus and Boeing and the potential damage that could be done to Airbus at Broughton. Can you explain why the Government decided not to schedule a statement on that issue?

Kirsty Williams: We share the concerns regarding Benefits Agency office closures in north Wales; it is highly ironic that the Conservatives raised this issue when they closed so many themselves. We also wish to see a return to the issue of anti-social behaviour raised in response to previous business statements and the current shortfall in funding available to tackle the issue, as outlined by the Police Federation of England and Wales. I hope that you will reconsider scheduling a debate on that issue.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): On Alun's first point, I have e-mailed the business managers in that regard. I have no

from you as yet; I hope that I will do soon.

Secondly, the situation of Antur Dwryrd Llŷn in my constituency must be considered. The company used to promote economic activity, but it was recently placed in the hands of the administrators with debts of over £1 million. Many local companies have lost money as a result. Will the Minister for Economic Development and Transport make a statement on this issue? Antur Dwryrd Llŷn was entirely dependent on public money and contracts, and, therefore, if there has been any misuse of public money—I am not making any accusations against Antur Dwryrd Llŷn—I believe that the public deserve to be told. I call on the First Minister, or any other Minister, to establish an official inquiry into what has happened. I welcome any comments on that by the Business Minister.

Jonathan Morgan: Gwnaethom gais y bore yma ichi amserlennu datganiad cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar gau swyddfeydd yr Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau yng Nghymru. Gwn eich bod wedi dweud mai mater gweithredol i'r Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau yw hyn, ond nid yw hynny'n atal y Cynulliad rhag trafod materion nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn rhan o'i gylch gwaith. Gofynasom hefyd am ddatganiad ar yr anghydfod masnach rhwng Airbus a Boeing a'r niwed y gallai hynny ei beri i Airbus ym Mrychdyn. A allwch egluro pam y penderfynodd y Llywodraeth beidio ag amserlennu datganiad ar y pwnc hwnnw?

Kirsty Williams: Rhannwn y pryderon ynghylch cau swyddfeydd yr Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau yn y Gogledd; tra eironig yw mai'r Ceidwadwyr a gododd y mater hwn a hwythau wedi cau cynifer ohonynt. Yr ydym hefyd yn dymuno gweld trafod eto ar fater ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a godwyd mewn ymateb i ddatganiadau busnes blaenorol a'r prinder cyllid a geir ar hyn o bryd i ymdrin â'r mater hwn, fel y'i disgrifiwyd gan Ffederasiwn Heddlu Cymru a Lloegr. Gobeithiaf yr ailystyriwch amserlennu dadl ar y pwnc hwnnw.

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Ynghylch y pwynt cyntaf a wnaeth Alun, yr wyf wedi anfon neges drwy'r e-bost at y rheolwyr

plans to hold a debate on Friction Dynamics; it is an issue more appropriately addressed by oral or written questions. I will certainly take back the other request that you made today. However, as I have said to you before, if you inform me of issues before I make my statement, I can approach the Ministers.

Issues involving Benefits Agency offices are non-devolved, as you know, Jonathan. We continuously liaise with the Department for Work and Pensions and its agencies on policy matters. However, we cannot become involved in operational matters. I have been clear on that.

On the dispute between Boeing and Airbus and the statement that was requested, I do not intend to schedule time for a statement on this as there are no implications for us at this time. The UK Government is confident that any support that has been made available to Airbus is wholly consistent with European guidelines, which in turn are consistent with World Trade Organisation guidelines.

As I informed you last week, Kirsty, I do not currently intend to schedule Government time to debate anti-social behaviour.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Datganiad ar ‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’—Dogfen Ymgynghorol ar Wasanaethau Cyhoeddus Statement on ‘Making the Connections’—Consultation Document on Public Services

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The first four years of the Assembly were about setting up an entirely new form of democratic government in Wales. Our priority for the second term is our vision for public services and how they are designed and delivered in Wales. I am therefore publishing the Assembly Government’s policy document, ‘Making the Connections’, today, which sets out that vision. I have made arrangements for copies of the document to be circulated to all

busnes mewn cysylltiad â hynny. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw fwriad i gynnal dadl ar Friction Dynamics; mae’n fater y gellid ei drafod yn fwy priodol drwy gwestiynau llafar neu ysgrifenedig. Byddaf yn sicr o roi sylw i’r cais arall a wnaethoch heddiw. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais wrthyhych o’r blaen, os rhowch wybod i mi am faterion cyn imi wneud fy natganiad, gallaf holi’r Gweinidogion yn eu cylch.

Nid yw materion sy’n ymwneud â swyddfeydd yr Asiantaeth Budd-daliadau wedi’u datganoli, fel y gwyddoch, Jonathan. Yr ydym mewn cysylltiad yn barhaus gyda’r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a’i hasiantaethau ar faterion polisi. Er hynny, ni allwn ymwneud â materion gweithredol. Bûm yn glir am hynny.

Ynghylch yr anghydfod rhwng Boeing ac Airbus a’r datganiad a geisiwyd, ni fwriadaf neilltuo amser ar gyfer datganiad ar hyn gan nad oes unrhyw oblygiadau i ni ar hyn o bryd. Mae Llywodraeth y DU yn sicr bod unrhyw gymorth a roddwyd i Airbus yn gwbl gyson â chanllawiau Ewropeaidd, sydd yn eu tro’n gyson â chanllawiau Corff Masnach y Byd.

Fel y rhoddais wybod i chi yr wythnos diwethaf, Kirsty, nid wyf yn bwriadu neilltuo amser y Llywodraeth ar gyfer dadl ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ar hyn o bryd.

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Yr hyn a wnaed ym mhedair blynedd cyntaf y Cynulliad oedd sefydlu ffurf gwbl newydd o lywodraeth ddemocrataidd yng Nghymru. Ein blaenoriaeth ar gyfer yr ail dymor yw ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a’r dull o’u dyfeisio a’u darparu yng Nghymru. Gan hynny, yr wyf heddiw’n cyhoeddi dogfen bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’, sy’n nodi’r weledigaeth honno. Yr wyf wedi trefnu i

Members this afternoon. The Government is part way through a period of historically high and sustained public expenditure on our public services, with total spending almost doubling from just over £7 billion in 1999-2000 to nearly £14 billion in 2007-08 on current plans. As a result, we are seeing far better outcomes, with a sharp fall in unemployment, a sharp rise in the number of apprenticeship trainees, a sharp fall in the infant mortality rate, and a sharp rise in the numbers in training and subsequently employed by the NHS as doctors, nurses and other allied health professionals.

We need to improve the way in which services are delivered and to extract the maximum value from our spending. 'Making the Connections' brings together and builds on the different strands of thinking that we have been putting into practice since devolution. The result is an integrated approach that provides the basis for a five-year action plan for better public services.

Bydd hon yn rhaglen sylweddol, dan fy arweiniad i, a fydd yn ymestyn ar draws pob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ac yn cynnwys awdurdodau lleol, y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, cwangos a chyrrff eraill. Mae nifer o'n partneriaid eisoes yn gweithio ar bynciau llosg, a byddwn yn ymgynghori ac yn gweithio gyda hwy ar gynllun gweithredu dros y chwe mis nesaf. Byddaf yn cadeirio bwrdd gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus er mwyn arolygu'r rhaglen. Bydd cynrychiolwyr o'r prif sectorau hefyd yn aelodau o'r bwrdd, ochr yn ochr â Gweinidogion.

Our approach is based firmly on the view that the best outcomes in Wales will be delivered through collaboration and co-ordination, not competition. This fits with the nature of Wales as a small country and the people of Wales's strong sense of ownership of their public services. Four principles underpin our vision. The first is that to deliver responsive services, we need to place citizens and communities centre stage. The empowerment

gopïau o'r ddogfen gael eu dosbarthu i'r holl Aelodau y prynhawn yma. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi cychwyn ar gyfnod o wariant cyhoeddus uchel a pharhaus ar ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus na welwyd ei debyg ers tro, gan fod cyfanswm y gwariant wedi dyblu bron o ychydig yn fwy na £7 biliwn yn 1999-2000 i bron £14 biliwn yn 2007-08 ar y cynlluniau presennol. O ganlyniad, gwelwn ganlyniadau gwell o lawer, gyda gostyngiad sydyn mewn diweithdra, cynnydd sydyn yn nifer yr hyfforddeion sy'n dilyn prentisiaeth, gostyngiad sydyn yng nghyfradd marwolaethau babanod, a chynnydd sydyn yn nifer y rhai a gaiff eu hyfforddi a'u cyflogi wedyn gan y GIG fel meddygon, nyrsys ac eraill yn y proffesiynau sy'n berthynol i iechyd.

Rhaid inni wella'r dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau a chael y budd mwyaf posibl o'n gwariant. Mae 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn cyfuno ac yn ychwanegu at y gwahanol elfennau meddwl a roesom ar waith ers datganoli. O ganlyniad i hynny ceir dull gweithredu integredig sy'n sail i gynllun gweithredu pum mlynedd ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

This will be a major programme, which I will be leading and which runs across all public services, encompassing local authorities, the national health service, quangos and others. Many of our partners are already engaging with the issues and we will consult and work up the action plan with them over the next six months. I will be chairing a public services improvement board to oversee the programme. The board will also include representatives of the main sectors, sitting alongside Ministers.

Mae ein dull o weithredu wedi'i seilio'n gadarn ar y farn y sicrheir y canlyniadau gorau yng Nghymru drwy gydweithio a chydrefnu, nid drwy gystadlu. Mae hyn yn cydfynd â natur Cymru fel gwlad fach a'r ymdeimlad cryf o berchnogaeth sydd gan bobl Cymru ar eu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae pedair egwyddor yn sail i'n gweledigaeth. Y gyntaf yw bod angen inni roi dinasyddion a chymunedau ar ganol y

of the citizen and the community will drive the improvement. I use the term 'citizen' in its most inclusive sense as embracing everyone, and I use it to emphasise that the people of Wales are much more than customers of public services. They have the right to hold public services to account, and public service organisations have a duty to respond. Even more important is that the empowered citizens of Wales need to play their part, as pupils, parents, patients, or as members of the community in general, because users and producers must be on the same side to get the best results in public service delivery. In 'Making the Connections', we set out a range of practical actions to place citizens centre stage. These include better information about their needs and perceptions, stronger accountability, more flexibility, greater participation by citizens and communities in designing and planning services and better front-line access. Linked to this, we will set out our proposals for Cymru Ar-lein later this week.

The second principle is our commitment to equality and social justice. In 'Wales: A Better Country', we set out how we would target resources to those in greatest need. We also set out the ways in which public services need to reach out to the excluded and the vulnerable, placing particular emphasis on people and communities facing disadvantage.

The third principle is that by working together as the Welsh public service, existing bodies can achieve economies of scale and deliver better quality public services. We set out proposals for encouraging collaboration between bodies, for simplifying relationships and for reducing bureaucratic and regulatory burdens on the front line. My announcement in July about the mergers with the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board and Education and Learning Wales was part of the simplification agenda, and I expect to announce further decisions as regards other ASPBs next month.

llwyfan er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaethau sy'n ymatebol. Drwy alluogi'r dinesydd a'r gymuned yr hyrwyddir y gwelliant. Defnyddiaf y gair 'dinesydd' yn ei ystyr mwyaf cynhwysol fel un sy'n cwmpasu pawb, ac fe'i defnyddiaf er mwyn pwysleisio bod pobl Cymru'n llawer mwy na chwsmeriaid gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae ganddynt hawl i alw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i gyfrif, ac mae cyrff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o dan ddyletswydd i ymateb. Yn bwysicach byth, a hwythau wedi'u galluogi, rhaid i ddinasyddion Cymru chwarae eu rhan, fel disgyblion, rhieni, cleifion, neu fel aelodau o'r gymuned yn gyffredinol, gan fod rhaid i ddefnyddwyr a chynhyrchwyr fod ar yr un ochr i gael y canlyniadau gorau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', nodwn amryw o gamau gweithredu ymarferol i roi dinasyddion ar ganol y llwyfan. Yn eu plith y mae cael gwell gwybodaeth am eu hanghenion a'u canfyddiadau, atebolrwydd cryfach, mwy o hyblygrwydd, mwy o ran i ddinasyddion a chymunedau wrth ddyfeisio a chynllunio gwasanaethau a gwell mynediad at y rheng flaen. Mewn cysylltiad â hyn, byddwn yn nodi ein cynlluniau ar gyfer Cymru Ar-lein yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon.

Yr ail egwyddor yw ein hymrwymiad i gydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', nodasom y modd y byddem yn anelu adnoddau at y rhai mwyaf anghenus. Gwnaethom hefyd nodi ym mha fodd y dylai gwasanaethau cyhoeddus estyn allan at y rhai a allgaewyd a'r rhai sy'n agored i niwed, gan roi pwyslais penodol ar bobl a chymunedau sy'n profi anfantais.

Y drydedd egwyddor yw y bydd y cyrff presennol, drwy weithio gyda'i gilydd fel gwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymru, yn gallu sicrhau arbedion maint ac ansawdd gwell mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nodasom ein cynigion ar gyfer hybu cydweithio rhwng cyrff, ar gyfer symleiddio cysylltiadau ac ar gyfer lleihau beichiau biwrocraidd a rheoliadol yn y rheng flaen. Yr oedd y cyhoeddiad a wneuthum ym mis Gorffennaf ynghylch cyfuno ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn rhan o'r agenda ar gyfer symleiddio, a disgwyliaf gyhoeddi

penderfyniadau pellach am CCNC eraill y mis nesaf.

The fourth principle is our determination to ensure that people in Wales get the greatest possible value from investment in public services. We are setting a target of achieving £600 million a year in efficiency savings by 2010 across the public service and will put structures in place to help public services deliver those savings. These structures include Value Wales, a national procurement and support services office. This office is an Assembly Government business unit, not an ASPB. The origins of Value Wales lie in the successful Welsh procurement initiative, and it will work with agencies with a good track record such as Welsh Health Supplies. We will also expect public bodies to achieve efficiencies through sharing corporate support services and other initiatives. For example, I can confirm that the north Wales shared service project is now underway, looking at how business services for NHS bodies can be delivered more effectively.

Y bedwaredd egwyddor yw ein penderfyniad i sicrhau y caiff pobl Cymru'r gwerth mwyaf posibl o'r buddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym yn gosod targed o £600 miliwn y flwyddyn o arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd erbyn 2010 yn y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus drwyddo draw a sefydlwn fframweithiau i helpu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i sicrhau'r arbedion hynny. Un o'r fframweithiau hynny yw Gwerth Cymru, swyddfa gwasanaethau caffael a chefnogi genedlaethol. Uned fusnes yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw'r swyddfa hon, nid CCNC. Mae Gwerth Cymru yn deillio o'r fenter gaffael Cymru lwyddiannus, a bydd yn gweithio gydag asiantaethau sydd â record dda fel Cyflenwadau Iechyd Cymru. Byddwn hefyd yn disgwyl i gyrff cyhoeddus sicrhau effeithlonrwydd drwy rannu gwasanaethau cymorth corfforaethol a mentrau eraill. Er enghraifft, gallaf gadarnhau bod prosiect rhannu gwasanaethau'r Gogledd yn mynd rhagddo'n awr, i ystyried y modd y gellir darparu gwasanaethau busnes ar gyfer cyrff y GIG yn fwy effeithiol.

3.00 p.m.

This is a big change agenda and the support and engagement of the workforce and managers will be crucial. We shall keep in close touch with the trade unions as the action plan is shaped and implemented. Later this week, we will announce details of 'Public Service Management Wales', the origins of which is our pathfinding public services management initiative. Its role will be to develop a distinctively Welsh approach to developing public servants and managers in Wales.

Agenda ar gyfer newid mawr yw hwn a bydd yn hollbwysig sicrhau cefnogaeth ac ymrwymiad y gweithwyr a'r rheolwyr. Byddwn yn cadw mewn cysylltiad agos â'r undebau llafur wrth baratoi'r cynllun gweithredu a'i roi ar waith. Yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, byddwn yn cyhoeddi manylion 'Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Cymru', sy'n deillio o'n menter arloesol ar gyfer rheolwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ei rôl fydd datblygu dull gweithredu penodol Gymreig o ddatblygu gweision a rheolwyr cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Many of the actions will be implemented through existing spending programmes but we also need a dedicated budget. The Finance Minister has accordingly made provision for £32 million over the next three years to underpin the action plan.

Cymerir llawer o'r camau gweithredu drwy'r rhaglenni gwariant presennol ond mae arnom angen cyllideb neilltuol hefyd. Gan hynny, mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi darparu £32 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf i gynnal y cynllun gweithredu.

Mae agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn hollbwysig. Dim ond ar rai agweddau y gallaf

The 'Making the Connections' agenda is crucial. I can only provide details on some

roi manylion heddiw. Yr ydym am roi amser i Aelodau'r Cynulliad dreulio'r hyn a gyhoeddais heddiw a darllen y ddogfen. Byddwn yn rhoi amser ar gyfer dadl lawn tua diwedd y cyfnod ymgynghori.

I commend these proposals to the Assembly.

Y Llywydd: Gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi nodi y bydd amser i ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth yn fuan, ni fyddaf yn ymestyn y datganiad hwn i fwy na'r hanner awr safonol. Gofynnaf felly am gwestiynau cryno, os yw hynny'n bosibl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae cynnwys y datganiad hwn yn dangos bod eich blaenoriaethau fel Llywodraeth yn gwbl anghywir. Yr oeddwn yn edrych ymlaen at eich datganiad ar ddyfodol y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus am fy mod yn meddwl y caem ddatganiad clir—o'r diwedd—ar newid polisi mewn sawl maes. Y cyfan a wnaethoch heddiw oedd rhestru'r rhesymau strwythurol am yr angen i wneud newidiadau, yn hytrach nag edrych ar anghenion polisi.

Os edrychwch ar y datganiad, un paragraff byr yn unig sydd ynddo ar bolisi, sef y pedwerydd paragraff ar y dudalen gyntaf sy'n canmol y Llywodraeth am yr hyn y mae wedi llwyddo i'w wneud. Nid oes sôn am y problemau mawr yr wyf yn aml wedi cyfeirio atynt ynghylch y gwasanaeth iechyd, y ffaith bod y bwlch rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yn ehangu, diffyg arweiniad ar addysg Gymraeg, problemau o ran y system drafnidiaeth—gwn i, gystal ag unrhyw un, am y broblem fawr o deithio rhwng y De a'r Gogledd—a'r ffaith bod ffigurau digartrefedd yn echrydus o uchel ac wedi codi yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Dyna'r hyn yr oeddwn yn disgwyl ichi ei wneud ynghylch darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond yr hyn a glywsom oedd y bydd popeth yn newid, rywsut neu'i gilydd, os newidiwch y strwythurau ac os cewch ryw fath o raglen i wneud i bobl gydweithio'n well. Nid oes problem gyda hynny, Brif Weinidog, ond yr hyn a ddisgwyliasom gennyh oedd arweiniad ar newid polisi.

aspects today. We wish to allow time for Assembly Members to digest my announcement today and to read the document. We will provide time for a full debate towards the end of the consultation period.

Cymeradwyaf y cynigion hyn i'r Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: As the First Minister noted that there will be time scheduled soon for a debate in Government time, I will not extend this statement beyond the standard half an hour. I therefore ask for succinct questions, if possible.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The content of this statement demonstrates that your priorities as a Government are completely wrong. I was looking forward to your statement on the future of public services because I thought that we would have a clear statement—at last—on policy changes in several areas. All you have done today is go through the structural reasons as to why change is necessary, rather than considering policy requirements.

If you look at the statement, there is only one short paragraph on policy, namely the fourth paragraph on the first page which praises the Government's achievements. It does not mention the major problems to which I have often referred regarding the health service, the fact that the gap between rich and poor is widening, the lack of leadership on Welsh-medium education, problems with the transport system—and I know more than most about the problems of north-south travel—and also that the level of homelessness is appallingly high and has risen in the last few months and years.

These are the problems that I expected you to address in respect of delivering public services, but what we have heard is that everything will change, somehow or other, if you just change the structures and put some kind of a programme in place to get people to collaborate better with each other. There is no problem with that, First Minister, but what we had expected from you was some leadership on policy change.

I briefly refer to chapter seven, paragraph two, where you say instructively—

‘We will provide the structures, resources and incentives to see that the goals set out in this document are achieved.’

I expected you, First Minister, to tell us about leadership on policy. Why will you not lead on policy instead of tinkering with structures and terminology? Our health service is in an awful state, and the gap between the rich and the poor is increasing ever wider. Is it not time that you engage the Assembly with a real debate on policy instead of hiding behind your failures by tinkering constantly with these structures?

The First Minister: It is neither tinkering, nor is it constant. It is a major statement of the principles on which public services should be delivered. It involves an attempt to achieve greater efficiencies through being able to merge the big computer systems which will reduce the transactional costs of making payments to suppliers or paying wages across the public sector, trying to incentivise local government to do the same, if it wants to swap services, as some authorities are already doing. Cardiff County Council is doing so in providing the customer contact centre for Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council. We will want to use the levers that we have, the carrots that we have—if you like—to encourage that process.

You then apply those savings to front-line services. That is important because much more can be achieved if the citizen works alongside the professional. I quoted the example of what has been done in that area. How have we come from behind to being in front on GCSE pass rates, grades A to C, over the past five years? We were behind England, now we are ahead. England is not failing—we have overtaken England in the outside lane, as it were, by improving more than 10 per cent faster. We have gone from behind to being in front. That is not done by sharpening the commercial relationship of

Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at bennod saith, paragraff dau, lle y dywedwch yn addysgiadol—

‘Byddwn yn darparu’r strwythurau, yr adnoddau a’r cymhellion i sicrhau bod yr amcanion a osodwyd yn y ddogfen hon yn cael eu cyflawni.’

Brif Weinidog, yr oeddwn wedi disgwyl ichi sôn wrthym am arweiniad ar bolisi. Pam nad arweiniwch ar bolisi yn hytrach na thincran â strwythurau a therminoleg? Mae ein gwasanaeth iechyd mewn cyflwr ofnadwy, ac mae’r bwlch rhwng y tlawd a’r cyfoethog yn mynd yn fwy byth. Onid yw’n bryd ichi gynnwys y Cynulliad mewn dadl go iawn ar bolisi yn hytrach na chuddio y tu ôl i’ch methiannau drwy dincran yn barhaus â’r strwythurau hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid tincran ydyw ac nis gwneir yn barhaus. Mae’n ddatganiad o bwys o’r egwyddorion y dylid eu dilyn wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae’n golygu ymgais i sicrhau gwell effeithlonrwydd drwy allu cyfuno’r systemau cyfrifiadurol mawr a fydd yn lleihau’r costau gweithrediadol o dalu i gyflenwyr neu dalu cyflogau yn y sector cyhoeddus drwyddo draw, gan geisio annog llywodraeth leol i wneud yr un peth, os yw’n dymuno cyfnewid gwasanaethau, fel y gwnaiff rhai awdurdodau eisoes. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn gwneud hynny drwy ddarparu’r ganolfan cyswllt cwsmeriaid i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent. Byddwn am ddefnyddio’r dylanwad sydd gennym, yr abwyd sydd gennym—os caf ei roi felly—i hybu’r broses honno.

Troir yr arbedion hynny wedyn at wasanaethau rheng flaen. Mae hynny’n bwysig oherwydd gellir cyflawni llawer mwy os yw’r dinesydd yn gweithio ochr yn ochr â’r gweithiwr proffesiynol. Cyfeiriais at enghraifft o’r hyn a wnaed yn y maes hwnnw. Sut y daethom o fod ar ôl i fod ar y blaen o ran cyfraddau llwyddo TGAU, yn y graddau o A i C, dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf? Yr oeddem ar ôl Lloegr, bellach yr ydym ar y blaen. Nid yw Lloegr yn methu—yr ydym wedi mynd heibio i Loegr yn y lôn gyflym, fel petai, drwy wella 10 y cant yn gynt. Aethom o fod ar ôl i fod ar y blaen. Ni

challenge between pupil and teacher, or between schools. It is done by collaboration between teachers and school pupils, which is why we have come from behind to being in front.

That is a useful example for people to understand, as is the example of the infant mortality rate. That does not involve doctors doing things to parents and babies—it involves getting the co-operation of parents of neonates to persuade them to get their children to sleep on their backs to cut the rate of cot deaths. It has been so successful in Wales that it has brought our infant mortality rate, through citizen involvement alongside professionals, to being substantially better than the rate in England and Scotland. Those are examples of what can be done through collaboration and empowering the citizen. Front-line savings can be made, as a result of savings on the transactional aspect of buying bigger and better computers to pay all wages and salaries, if you empower citizens. That is what we want to do. If you empower citizens to work alongside professionals, such as doctors, midwives, health visitors, teachers or others in the world of education, an awful lot can be achieved in terms of better public services. It is not done to citizens, but rather with citizens. That is the big principle to which we are committing ourselves today, and which I commend to the Assembly and the people of Wales.

Nick Bourne: I thank the First Minister for the statement, such as it is. When I saw that you were going to make a statement on public services, I believed that we would have something constructive, getting down to the nitty-gritty of the way in which you would tackle some of the deep-seated problems that face Wales. No mention was made of reducing waiting lists in the health service, no mention of shortfalls in education and no mention of the level of council taxes. Once more, there is an obsession with structures and institutions. After five and a half years, the people of Wales are entitled to ask whether these key areas have improved, but all we have is what I expect is an expensive consultation on this document, and expensive structures being set-up which miss

wneir hynny drwy ddwysáu perthynas fasnachol yr her rhwng y disgybl a'r athro, neu rhwng y naill ysgol a'r llall. Gwneir hynny drwy gydweithio rhwng athrawon a disgyblion ysgol, a dyna pam y daethom o fod ar ôl i fod ar y blaen.

Mae honno'n enghraifft ddefnyddiol y gall pobl ei deall, yn yr un modd â'r gyfradd marwolaethau babanod. Nid yw hynny'n golygu gwneud pethau gan feddygon i rieni a babanod—mae'n golygu cael cydweithrediad gan rieni plant newydd-anedig i'w perswadio i beri i'w plant gysgu ar eu cefn er mwyn torri cyfradd marwolaethau yn y crud. Bu mor llwyddiannus yng Nghymru, drwy gynnwys dinasyddion ochr yn ochr â gweithwyr proffesiynol, fel bod ein cyfradd marwolaethau babanod yn well o lawer na'r un yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Dyna enghreifftiau o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud drwy gydweithio a galluogi'r dinesydd. Gellir cael arbedion yn y rheng flaen, o ganlyniad i'r agwedd weithrediadol o brynu cyfrifiaduron mwy a gwell i dalu'r holl gyflogau, os galluogir dinasyddion. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym am ei wneud. Os galluogir dinasyddion i weithio ochr yn ochr â gweithwyr proffesiynol, fel meddygon, bydwragedd, ymwelwyr iechyd, athrawon ac eraill ym myd addysg, gellir cyflawni llawer iawn o ran sicrhau gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ni wneir hyn i ddinasyddion ond, yn hytrach, gyda dinasyddion. Dyna'r egwyddor bwysig yr ydym yn ymrwymo iddi heddiw, ac a gymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad ac i bobl Cymru.

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am y datganiad, gyfryw ag ydyw. Pan welais eich bod yn bwriadu gwneud datganiad ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus, credais y caem rywbeth adeiladol, a fyddai'n ymdrin â manylion y modd yr aech i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau sylfaenol y mae Cymru'n eu hwynebu. Ni soniwyd am leihau rhestrau aros yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ni soniwyd am ddiffygion mewn addysg ac ni soniwyd am lefel y dreth gyngor. Unwaith eto, ceir obsesiwn â strwythurau a sefydliadau. Ar ôl pum mlynedd a hanner, mae gan bobl Cymru hawl i ofyn a yw'r meysydd allweddol hyn wedi gwella, ond y cwbl sydd gennym yw'r hyn y byddaf yn disgwyl iddo fod yn ymgynghoriad drud ar y ddogfen hon, a sefydlu strwythurau drud sy'n methu ag

the serious, deep-seated problems that we face as a nation.

Picking up on the first pillar that you mentioned regarding the way in which we must develop the agenda of being responsive, you should give more power to the health trusts and schools. Give less micromanagement power to the Ministers—the two Janes. It is only then that we will go forward. We do not need a consultation to establish a commitment to social justice. You talked about collaboration and co-operation, but the truth is that this Government has all its eggs in one basket. That collaboration and co-operation stops short of using the private sector, and English and overseas hospitals with public money to reduce waiting lists, but I cannot get any figures from the Minister on that.

A recent speech that you gave revealed much more than what we have in this document. You described those who deliver public services where there is a choice as knaves, and those who use those public services as pawns. I find that totally at odds with everything I believe in. We should cherish all who deliver a public service, in the voluntary, private or public sector. This obsession with doing things differently in Wales, in the belief that Wales is somehow totally different from every other nation on earth, let alone England, is abhorrent. You talk about value for money; we are entitled to ask about value for money when we see that one in 10 of the Welsh population is on a waiting list, and that one in 100 has been on a waiting list for over a year. This obsession with co-operation is, presumably—and I accept that this is only a rough analogy—the same as saying that we do not want a choice agenda, we want to drive Asda and Tesco up to the level of the Co-op. That is not the way we should be looking at public services in this country. This document is long on jargon, which is no substitute for action. Will the First Minister tell us how much this exercise will cost? I am deeply suspicious of it. The Welsh Assembly Government Titanic sails on, there is no-one on the bridge, but the First Minister is still intent on altering the restaurant menu.

ymdrin â'r problemau sylfaenol difrifol a wynebwn fel cenedl.

Ynghylch yr egwyddor gyntaf y cyfeiriasoch ato sy'n ymwneud â'r modd y mae'n rhaid inni ddatblygu'r agenda ar fod yn ymatebol, dylech roi mwy o bŵer i'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd a'r ysgolion. Rhowch lai o bŵer i feicoreoli i'r Gweinidogion—y ddwy Jane. Dim ond drwy wneud hynny y symudwn ymlaen. Nid oes arnom angen ymgynghoriad i gadarnhau'r ymrwymiad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Soniasoch am gydweithio a chydweithredu, ond y gwir amdani yw bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi rhoi ei hwyau i gyd yn yr un fased. Nid yw'r cydweithio a'r cydweithredu hwnnw'n mynd mor bell â defnyddio arian cyhoeddus yn y sector preifat, ac mewn ysbytai yn Lloegr ac mewn gwledydd tramor, i leihau rhestrau aros, ond ni allaf gael unrhyw ffigurau gan y Gweinidog ar hynny.

Mae araith a draddodasoch yn ddiweddar wedi datgelu llawer mwy nag a geir yn y ddogfen hon. Galwasoch y rhai sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus lle y mae dewis yn gnafon, a'r rhai sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hynny'n deganau yn nwylo rhywun arall. Caf fod hynny'n groes i'r cwbl a gredaf. Dylem ofalu'n dyner am bawb sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn y sector gwirfoddol, y sector preifat neu'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r obsesiwn hwn â gwneud pethau'n wahanol yng Nghymru, gan gredu bod Cymru rywsut yn gwbl wahanol i bob gwlad arall yn y byd, heb sôn am Loegr, yn wrthun. Soniwch am werth am arian; mae gennym hawl i holi ynghylch gwerth am arian pan welwn fod un ym mhob 10 o boblogaeth Cymru ar restr aros, a bod un ym mhob 100 wedi bod ar restr aros am fwy na blwyddyn. Gellir cymryd bod yr obsesiwn hwn â chydweithredu—ac yr wyf yn derbyn nad yw hyn ond yn gyffelybiaeth fras—yr un peth â dweud nad ydym am gael agenda ar gyfer dewis, ein bod am godi Asda a Tesco i lefel y Co-op. Nid felly y dylem edrych ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y wlad hon. Mae llawer o jargon yn y ddogfen hon, ac ni thycia hynny yn lle gweithredu. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym beth fydd cost yr ymarferiad hwn? Yr wyf yn amheus iawn ohono. Mae Titanic Llywodraeth Cynulliad

Cymru yn hwyllo ymlaen, nid oes neb wrth y llyw, ond mae'r Prif Weinidog yn dal i fod yn benderfynol o newid bwydlen y tŷ bwyta.

3.10 p.m.

The First Minister: Your speech was a lot of work for unemployed scriptwriters of failed film companies. You seem to have suffered some sort of attention-span deficit at the time that I gave the examples, which I then put in the document and repeated to Ieuan Wyn Jones. Looking at the level of expenditure in real terms, it is 70 per cent higher over the eight-year period from 1999 to 2007-08 than it was during the previous 10-year period when the Conservatives were in charge. Therefore, we are spending a great deal more. The question to ask is: how do we get the best value from that sustained, higher level of public expenditure in Wales since devolution? We must extract those additional savings.

Neither you nor Ieuan seem to have grasped the principle that there are ways of making efficiency savings from the use of latest technology and then transferring those savings into the front-line. You asked about figures. Again, I refer to your attention-span deficit because I gave you two figures, which you ignored because you were preparing your long and complex final, alleged joke. The figures I gave were £600 million and £32 million. The former was the figure for efficiency saving by 2010 and the latter was the estimated upfront cost because if you want to buy one big computer to replace five incompatible small computers, then unfortunately there is a redundancy issue in terms of disposing of the lesser technology to be replaced with a more efficient one. The £32 million figure is that which the Finance Minister has allocated for the upfront costs. There are sometimes redundancy costs, although we hope to avoid them, but we think that the £32 million is a reasonable stab at the likely initial cost in order to get at the efficiency savings which will follow.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd eich arraith yn golygu llawer o waith i awduron sgriptiau segur mewn cwmnïau ffilm aflwyddiannus. Ymddengys eich bod wedi dioddef gan ryw fath o fethiant i ganolbwyntio ar yr adeg y rhoddais yr enghreifftiau, a roddais yn y ddogfen wedyn a'u hailadrodd i Ieuan Wyn Jones. Edrychwch ar y lefel gwariant wirioneddol, mae'n 70 y cant yn uwch dros y cyfnod o wyth mlynedd o 1999 i 2007-08 nag yr oedd yn ystod y cyfnod 10 mlynedd blaenorol pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym. Felly, yr ydym yn gwario llawer mwy. Y cwestiwn y dylid ei ofyn yw: sut y gallwn gael y gwerth gorau o'r lefel barhaus uwch o wariant cyhoeddus a gafwyd yng Nghymru ers datganoli? Rhaid inni sicrhau'r arbedion ychwanegol hynny.

Nid yw'n ymddangos eich bod chi nac Ieuan wedi deall yr egwyddor bod llawer modd i arbed drwy effeithlonrwydd o ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf a throsglwyddo'r arbedion hynny wedyn i'r rheng flaen. Holasoch am ffigurau. Unwaith eto, fe'ch cyfeirïaf at eich diffyg sylw gan imi roi dau ffigur i chi, a anwybyddasoch gan eich bod yn paratoi'ch ffraetheb honedig olaf, hir a chymhleth. Y ffigurau a roddais i chi oedd £600 miliwn a £32 miliwn. Y cyntaf oedd y ffigur am arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd erbyn 2010 a'r olaf oedd yr amcangyfrif o'r gost o flaen llaw oherwydd, os ydych am brynu un cyfrifiadur mawr i gymryd lle pum cyfrifiadur bach anghyfaddas, mae mater yn codi, gwaetha'r modd, mewn cysylltiad ag offer diangen o ran y modd i gael gwared ar y dechnoleg israddol er mwyn cael un fwy effeithlon yn ei lle. Y ffigur o £32 miliwn yw'r swm y mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y costau o flaen llaw. Ceir costau oherwydd offer diangen weithiau, er ein bod yn gobeithio eu hosgoi, ond credwn fod y swm o £32 miliwn yn amcangyfrif rhesymol o'r gost gychwynnol er mwyn cael yr arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd a ddaw yn sgîl hynny.

Your misquoting of Julian Le Grand was

Yr oedd eich camddyfynnu o eiriau Julian Le

extraordinary. I do not think that you were at the lecture, but a printed version of it is available. Those were not my words, but the words of Professor Julian Le Grand of the London School of Economics. Quite simply, he said that you either rely on the hidden hand of the market or you involve the citizen in the direct sense. If you rely on competition or consumer choice and believe that the choice for public services is like the choice between failing supermarkets like Sainsbury's and successful ones like Tesco and Asda, then you are putting the citizen in the state of being the pawn and the service provider in the state of being the knave. In other words, the citizen is not involved or empowered and that is Julian Le Grand's interesting theory. Either you knew that I was quoting his words and deliberately did not want the Assembly to know—and that is on your conscience—or you did not understand it, in which case, I sometimes wonder what you could have been doing in academia because it is a simple issue: either something is a quotation or is not. That was a quotation and you need to consider the accuracy with which you look at the quotations from my speech.

The principle is simple: either you believe in the hidden hand of the market or in citizen empowerment. Consider the examples that I have given of citizen empowerment producing good results. It can be seen in apprenticeship training, in improved GCSE A to C passes, which used to be lower than in England and are now higher, or in the infant mortality rate, which used to be higher but is now substantially lower. The same is true of the unemployment figures, which used to be higher. You can see citizen empowerment in all the achievements that we have brought about. However, we must do better because we must make better use of this sustained increase, which, as I mentioned, is 70 per cent more sustained expenditure on public services in Wales in real terms as compared with the Conservative period.

Michael German: We agree with you on one issue, namely that the debate on public

Grand yn rhyfeddol. Ni chredaf eich bod yn bresennol yn y ddarlith, ond mae fersiwn printiedig ohoni ar gael. Nid myfi oedd biau'r geiriau hynny, ond yr Athro Julian Le Grand o Ysgol Economeg Llundain. Yn gwbl syml, dywedodd fod rhywun un ai'n dibynnu ar law guddiedig y farchnad neu'n cynnwys y dinesydd yn uniongyrchol. Os dibynnwch ar gystadlu neu ddewis y defnyddiwr gan gredu bod y dewis ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn debyg i'r dewis rhwng archfarchnadoedd aflwyddiannus fel Sainsbury's a'r rhai llwyddiannus fel Tesco ac Asda, yr ydych yn peri i'r dinesydd fod yn degan yn nwylo rhywun arall ac yn peri i ddarparwr y gwasanaeth yn y wladwriaeth fod yn gnaf. Mewn geiriau eraill, ni chaiff y dinesydd ei gynnwys na'i alluogi a dyna ddamcaniaeth ddiddorol Julian Le Grand. Un ai y gwyddech fy mod yn dyfynnu ei eiriau a'ch bod o fwriad am beidio â gadael i'r Cynulliad wybod hynny—ac mae hynny ar eich cydwybod—neu nid oeddech yn ei ddeall ac, os felly, yr wyf yn meddwl weithiau tybed beth a fuoch yn ei wneud yn y byd academaidd gan fod hyn yn fater syml: un ai y mae rhywbeth yn ddyfyniad neu nid ydyw. Dyfyniad oedd hwnnw a dylech ystyried pa mor fanwl yr ydych yn darllen y dyfyniadau o'm haraith.

Mae'r egwyddor yn un syml: un ai y credwch yn llaw guddiedig y farchnad neu mewn galluogi dinasyddion. Ystyriwch yr enghreifftiau a roddais o ganlyniadau da a gafwyd drwy alluogi dinasyddion. Gellir eu gweld mewn hyfforddi drwy brentisiaethau, mewn gwell canlyniadau TGAU ar raddau A i C, a arferai fod yn is na'r rhai yn Lloegr ac sydd bellach yn uwch, neu yng nghyfradd marwolaethau babanod, a arferai fod yn uwch ac sydd bellach yn is o lawer. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y ffigurau diweithdra, a arferai fod yn uwch. Gallwch weld y galluogi ar ddinasyddion yn yr holl gyflawniadau a barasom. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wneud yn well gan fod rhaid inni wneud gwell defnydd o'r cynnydd parhaus hwn, sef, fel y dywedais, 70 y cant yn fwy o wariant parhaus ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ôl ei wir werth nag yng nghyfnod y Ceidwadwyr.

Michael German: Cytunwn â chi ar un mater, sef bod y ddadl ar wasanaethau

services in Wales is not only about choice, but about access to high-quality public services. However, choice is only meaningful when everyone has access to good quality public services. This document will fall short of the mark, when you consider how many people in Wales are waiting for appointments to see a GP or consultant or even to have an operation. What of the parents who cannot get their children into the local school because it is closing? What of the people whose local post offices have been closed by a Labour Government and, crucially, what of those who are waiting to see an NHS dentist?

I am talking about access, and that is what this document should be addressing. I wonder, First Minister, when you talked this over with Tony Blair, whether you did so over a glass or two of clear red water. Have you spoken to the Prime Minister about this, and if so, what was his response? When he comes to Wales next year, as he surely will because of the general election he is about to announce, what will he be selling—his vision for the public services of the United Kingdom, or yours? I would be grateful if you could tell me whether that will be Gordon Brown's or Colin Milburn's vision when they visit Wales, if they do? Two things are needed to provide quality public services—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am not keen to start fighting any Westminster election, general or not, at this stage.

Michael German: I was about to come on to power and money, Presiding Officer, which are the two things that are needed to provide good quality public services. Changes must be made, and we need power to make those changes. There are some areas of good quality public services, such as free personal care for the elderly, where we are powerless to make changes. This document is silent on obtaining the powers that would ensure we can properly deal with the needs of the elderly. We want you to stand up for those powers, which are not advocated in this document. On the money, the document does

cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn ymwneud nid yn unig â dewis, ond â mynediad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da. Fodd bynnag, nid yw dewis ond yn ystyrllon os caiff pawb fynediad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da. Ni fydd y ddogfen hon yn cyrraedd y nod, yng ngolwg nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n disgwyl am apwyntiadau i weld meddyg teulu neu ymgynghorydd neu hyd yn oed i gael llawdriniaeth. Beth am y rhieni na allant gael lle i'w plant yn yr ysgol leol gan ei bod yn cau? Beth am y rhai y caewyd eu swyddfa bost leol gan Lywodraeth Lafur ac, yn hollbwysig, beth am y rhai sy'n disgwyl i weld deintydd GIG?

Yr wyf yn sôn am fynediad, a dyna'r hyn y dylai'r ddogfen hon ymdrin ag ef. Yr wyf yn meddwl tybed, Brif Weinidog, pan gawsoch sgwrs am hyn gyda Tony Blair, a wnaethoch hynny wrth gymryd gwydraid neu ddau o ddŵr coch clir. A ydych wedi siarad â'r Prif Weinidog am hyn, ac os ydych, beth oedd ei ymateb? Pan ddaw i Gymru y flwyddyn nesaf, fel y bydd yn sicr o wneud oherwydd yr etholiad cyffredinol y mae ar fin ei gyhoeddi, beth fydd yn ei werthu—ei weledigaeth ef ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y Deyrnas Unedig, neu'ch un chi? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gallech ddweud wrthyf ai hynny fydd gweledigaeth Gordon Brown neu Colin Milburn pan ddeuant i Gymru, os deuant? Mae angen dau beth i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn awyddus i ddechrau ymladd unrhyw etholiad ar gyfer San Steffan, boed yn un cyffredinol neu beidio, ar hyn o bryd.

Michael German: Yr oeddwn ar fin sôn am bŵer ac arian, Lywydd, sef y ddau beth y mae eu hangen i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da. Rhaid gwneud newidiadau, ac mae arnom angen pŵer i wneud y newidiadau hynny. Mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da mewn rhai meysydd, fel gofal personol am ddim i'r henoed, lle nad oes gennym bŵer i wneud newidiadau. Nid oes sôn yn y ddogfen hon am gael y pwerau a sicrhâi y gallem ymdrin yn briodol ag anghenion yr henoed. Yr ydym am eich gweld yn mynnu'r pwerau hynny, ac ni ddadleuir dros hynny yn

not necessarily give us any clues as to where the funds will come from. You mentioned £32 million. That £32 million is not easily spotted in the draft budget, which we will debate tomorrow. In which budget line is it contained? You then talk about £600 million worth of savings—some people might say cuts—that are to be made by 2010. You say that you will get £120 million from procurement, £120 million from using and developing better information and communications technology services, which will displace people. That amounts to £240 million. Where is the rest coming from? You mentioned reducing sickness absence, but will that make up the difference? Will you also tell us whether you have made any analysis of the number of public service jobs you expect to change as a result of that?

You are right to point out in the document the inequalities that exist in Wales because of our extra needs. Surely, First Minister, if we have extra needs, the Barnett squeeze is forcing us to have the same amount as people in other parts of the country who are richer than us. Is it not the case—I know that you believe it privately—that the Barnett squeeze means that we are getting the same as those areas in the United Kingdom that have far fewer problems than we have in Wales? Do we not now need to be arguing our case strongly for a reform of the funding system, so that we can address those inequalities, rather than shift the deckchairs around the Titanic? A reform of the funding system would ensure good quality public services with access for all, and not just for those who are lucky enough to get that money switched to them.

The First Minister: Two out of three of the opposition party leaders have now indulged in the Titanic cliché fetish that they seem to have at the moment. Let us be clear and correct a few of your errors, Mike. First, on the name Milburn, there are three famous Milburns—Alan Milburn, the Chancellor of the Duchy of Lancaster, Colin Milburn, to whom you referred, the swashbuckling batsman for Durham, and Jackie Milburn, the

y ddogfen hon. Ynghylch yr arian, nid yw'r ddogfen yn rhoi unrhyw awgrym i ni o ble y daw'r cyllid. Cyfeiriasoch at swm o £32 miliwn. Nid yw'n hawdd canfod y £32 miliwn hwnnw yn y gyllideb ddrafft, y cawn ddadl arni yfory. Ym mha linell yn y gyllideb y mae? Soniwch wedyn am wneud gwerth £600 miliwn o arbedion—toriadau y gallai rhai ei ddweud—erbyn 2010. Dywedwch y cewch £120 miliwn o gaffael, £120 miliwn o ddefnyddio a datblygu gwell gwasanaethau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu, a fydd yn cymryd lle pobl. Mae hynny'n dod i £240 miliwn. O ble y daw'r gweddill? Soniasoch am leihau absenoldeb oherwydd salwch, ond a fydd hynny'n cau'r bwlc? A wnewch ddweud wrthym hefyd a ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw ddadansoddiad o nifer y swyddi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y disgwyliwch eu newid o ganlyniad i hynny?

Mae'n briodol eich bod yn nodi yn y ddogfen yr anghydraddoldebau a geir yng Nghymru oherwydd ein hanghenion ychwanegol. Yn sicr, Brif Weinidog, os oes gennym anghenion ychwanegol, mae'r wasgfa oherwydd fformiwla Barnett yn ein gorfodi i gael yr un swm â rhai mewn rhannau eraill o'r wlad sy'n gyfoethocach na ni. Onid yw'n wir—gwn eich bod yn credu hyn yn breifat—fod y wasgfa oherwydd fformiwla Barnett yn golygu y cawn yr un swm â'r ardaloedd hynny yn y Deyrnas Unedig sydd â llawer llai o broblemau nag sydd gennym ni yng Nghymru? Oni ddylem ddadlau'n gryf yn awr dros ddiwygio'r system gyllido, fel y gallwn ymdrin â'r anghydraddoldebau hynny, yn hytrach na symud y cadeiriau cynfas ar fwrdd y Titanic? Byddai diwygio'r system gyllido'n fodd i sicrhau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd da gyda mynediad i bawb, ac nid yn unig i'r rhai sy'n ddigon ffodus i weld cyfeirio'r arian hwnnw atynt hwy.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae dau o blith tri arweinydd y gwrthbleidiau wedi amlygu'r gorhoffter ymddangosiadol sydd ganddynt ar hyn o bryd o ystrydeb y Titanic. Gadewch inni fod yn glir a chywiros rhai o'ch camgymeriadau, Mike. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch yr enw Milburn, mae tri Milburn enwog—Alan Milburn, Canghellor Dugiaeth Caerhirfryn, Colin Milburn, y cyfeiriasoch ato, sef y batiwr talog dros Durham, a Jackie

Newcastle United player, and the uncle of Bobby and Jackie Charlton. You were trying to refer to Alan Milburn, but you got overexcited.

On the issue of the two ways of delivering public services, it is perfectly respectable to argue that you should delegate more power to empower the management of business units by giving them responsibility for setting pay rates, human resources and finance. It is not right for Wales, but it is not the handiwork of the devil, as I made clear in my BBC lecture. There will always be different emphases in the delivery of public services, and we will consider which one works best. However, I am certain that the model that will work best in Wales, as proved by the examples that I have given, to which neither you, Ieuan nor Nick chose to refer, is that which empowers the citizen, and the benefits that can be reaped from that.

3.20 p.m.

To return to my reference to my visit to Finland, graphs there demonstrated that of the improvement in its cardiac mortality rates, some 30 per cent was from reduced animal fat consumption, 30 per cent from reduced salt consumption, 30 per cent from smoking reduction, around 5 per cent from improved exercise levels, and about 3 per cent was by faster ambulances; what happened inside the hospital only accounted for 2 per cent of the improvement. Most people would agree with those figures. If you empower citizens and get them to come with you on the matter of healthier lifestyles, you can have massive improvements in health that do not require anything to happen inside a hospital. That is paradoxical because, in the short term, all the pressure is to act on what is happening in hospitals, but the long-term gains are far greater if you can get people to adopt healthy lifestyles in order to reduce above-average coronary heart disease, morbidity and mortality levels.

You mentioned the money and although the full breakdown of the £600 million is not there, that is the estimate that we have made. You asked for more details than I am able to

Milburn, chwaraewr Newcastle United, ac ewythr Bobby a Jackie Charlton. Yr oeddech yn ceisio cyfeirio at Alan Milburn, ond gwnaethoch orgynhyrfu.

Ynghylch mater y ddau fodd i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, mae'n gwbl barchus dadlau y dylid dirprwyo mwy o bŵer i alluogi rheolwyr unedau busnes drwy roi cyfrifoldeb iddynt dros bennu cyfraddau tâl, adnoddau dynol a chyllid. Nid yw'n iawn i Gymru, ond nid gwaith y diafol ydyw, fel yr eglurais yn y ddarlith a draddodais i'r BBC. Ceir gwahanol bwyslais bob amser wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac ystyriwn ba un sy'n gweithio orau. Er hynny, yr wyf yn sicr mai'r model a fydd yn gweithio orau i Gymru, fel y profwyd gan yr enghreifftiau a roddais, na wnaethoch chi nac Ieuan na Nick ddewis cyfeirio atynt, yw'r un sy'n galluogi'r dinesydd, ac a ddaw â'r buddion y gellir eu cael o hynny.

Gan droi'n ôl at fy nghyfeiriad at fy ymweliad â'r Ffindir, yr oedd graffiau yn y fan honno ar y gwelliant yn ei gyfraddau marwolaethau cardiaidd yn dangos bod rhyw 30 y cant o hynny'n ganlyniad i fwyta llai o fraster anifeiliaid, 30 y cant yn ganlyniad i fwyta llai o halen, 30 y cant yn ganlyniad i lai o ysmegu, tua 5 y cant yn ganlyniad i well lefelau ymarfer, a thua 3 y cant yn ganlyniad i gael ambiwlansiau cyflymach; nid oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddai yn yr ysbyty ond yn gyfrifol am 2 y cant o'r gwelliant. Cytunai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl â'r ffigurau hynny. Os byddwch yn galluogi dinasyddion ac yn cael eu cefnogaeth ar fater ffyrdd o fyw iachach, gellir cael gwelliannau aruthrol mewn iechyd heb i unrhyw beth ddigwydd mewn ysbyty. Mae hynny'n baradoesaidd oherwydd, yn y tymor byr, mae'r holl bwysau ar weithredu ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn ysbytai, ond bydd yr enillion tymor hir yn llawer mwy os gallwch beri i bobl fabwysiadu ffyrdd o fyw iach er mwyn gostwng lefelau o glefyd coronaidd y galon, afiachusrwydd a marwolaeth sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd.

Soniasoch am yr arian ac er nad oes dadansoddiad llawn o'r £600 miliwn, dyna'r amcangyfrif a wnaethom. Gofynasoch am fwy o fanylion nag y gallaf eu rhoi y

give this afternoon about where that money will come from, but at least you have addressed yourself to the issue. If you can reduce transactional costs, that is e-procurement and the payment of wages on a big computer—based in Wales, not outsourced to India, I must add—that can work on behalf of the whole health service and much of local government. If you can recruit partners there, that is an efficient way of doing business. Ask management consultants who works in that area and 90 per cent of them will say, ‘that is the way to save money on transaction costs’, and then you can switch those resources to the front line. The figure of £32 million is the upfront cost of the computer system redundancies. We are not in a position to talk about the number of jobs that will be lost because, until you go into the details, you never know where there will be a technical redundancy situation, where two computer managers apply for one job, for example. One will not get it and then you must consider whether you have another vacancy for a computer manager in the organisation, before you start thinking about compulsory redundancy. There are also retraining opportunities within a large organisation such as the Welsh public sector.

On your question about access to public services, the contact centres established by Newport City Council and Cardiff County Council, which also provides for Blaenau Gwent, have been successful in developing access to information about public services, which is sometimes half the job. The denial of access is sometimes the result of poor information for the citizen. The service is there, but they do not know how to access it. However, if you gave them information through a good contact centre, they would be able to do exactly that—they would know where the shortest waiting list was, and if they found that the list was too long in a local hospital or trust, they could get the service from another source. The provision of greater and speedier information is a key part of this. Again, that is part of how the citizen can work in partnership, if empowered, rather than trying to shop between the public sector equivalents of Sainsbury’s and Tesco.

prynhawn yma ynghylch o ble y daw’r arian hwnnw, ond o leiaf yr ydych wedi rhoi sylw i’r pwnc hwnnw. Os gellir lleihau costau gweithrediadol, sef e-gaffael a thalu cyflogau ar gyfrifiadur mawr—sydd yng Nghymru, a heb ei leoli’n allanol yn India, rhaid imi ychwanegu—gall hwnnw weithio ar ran y gwasanaeth iechyd cyfan a rhan helaeth o lywodraeth leol. Os gellir recriwtio partneriaid yn y fan honno, mae hynny’n ddull effeithlon o weithredu. Os gofynnir i ymgynghorwyr rheoli sy’n gweithio yn y maes hwnnw, bydd 90 y cant ohonynt yn dweud, ‘dyna’r modd i arbed arian ar gostau gweithrediadol’, ac yna gellir troi’r adnoddau hynny at y rheng flaen. Y ffigur o £32 miliwn yw’r gost o flaen llaw ar gyfer systemau cyfrifiadurol diangen. Ni allwn sôn am nifer y swyddi a gollir oherwydd, hyd nes yr eir i’r manylion, ni ellir gwybod a fydd swyddi technegol yn ddiangen, lle y bydd dau reolwr cyfrifiaduron yn ymgeisio am un swydd, er enghraifft. Bydd un yn ei chael ac wedyn rhaid ystyried a oes swydd wag arall ar gyfer rheolwr cyfrifiaduron yn y corff, cyn dechrau ystyried diswyddo gorfodol. Mae cyfleoedd i ailhyfforddi hefyd mewn corff mawr fel y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Ynghylch y cwestiwn a ofynasoch am fynediad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus, mae’r canolfannau cyswllt a sefydlwyd gan Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd a Chyngor Sir Caerdydd, sydd hefyd yn darparu ar gyfer Blaenau Gwent, wedi llwyddo i ddatblygu mynediad i wybodaeth am wasanaethau cyhoeddus, a hynny weithiau yw deuparth y gwaith. Mae gwrthod mynediad yn ganlyniad weithiau i ddarparu gwybodaeth wael i’r dinesydd. Mae’r gwasanaeth ar gael, ond ni wyddant sut i fynd ato. Fodd bynnag, os rhowch wybodaeth iddynt drwy ganolfan gyswllt dda, gallent wneud yr union beth hwnnw—gwyddent ym mhle yr oedd y rhestr aros fyrraf, ac os caent fod y rhestr yn rhy hir mewn ysbyty neu ymddiriedolaeth leol, gallent gael y gwasanaeth yn rhywle arall. Mae darparu gwybodaeth helaethach a chyflymach yn rhan allweddol o hyn. Unwaith eto, mae hynny’n ymwneud â’r modd y gall y dinesydd weithio mewn partneriaeth, o gael ei alluogi, yn hytrach na cheisio dewis rhwng yr hyn sy’n cyfateb i Sainsbury’s a Tesco yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Leighton Andrews: Many of us will welcome the fact that you placed citizens and communities centre stage and confirmed the Assembly Government's support for equality and social justice. Do you agree that there is considerable research that suggests that the poorest communities have often suffered the poorest public services? In applying the principles of equality and social justice, will you ensure in your proposals for public services that we look again at the various formulae that distribute funds for public services in Wales to ensure that the poorest communities benefit in future from stronger public services?

Leighton Andrews: Bydd llawer ohonom yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod wedi rhoi dinasyddion a chymunedau ar ganol y llwyfan ac wedi cadarnhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o blaid cydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. A ydych yn cytuno bod cryn swm o ymchwil sy'n awgrymu mai'r cymunedau tlotaf a gafodd y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwaethaf mewn sawl achos? Wrth gymhwyso egwyddorion cydraddoldeb a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol, a wnewch sicrhau yn eich cynigion ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y byddwn yn ailedrych ar y gwahanol fformiwlâu sy'n dosbarthu cyllid ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru i sicrhau y bydd y cymunedau tlotaf yn cael budd o wasanaethau cyhoeddus cryfach yn y dyfodol?

The First Minister: I am not sure how far you expect me to go in terms of detail this afternoon. However, there is a general principle that if there is a deficit in the provision of public services, which is related to the deficit in demand from the so-called articulate middle classes compared with the less-articulate working classes and so on, that is precisely the kind of issue that we are committed to addressing. I am not in a position to answer this afternoon on exactly how you do that through a formula. However, that is the general principle and we will come back to it when we have done more work on the details and scope.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr pa mor bell yr ydych yn disgwyl imi fynd o ran manylu y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, mae egwyddor gyffredinol sy'n datgan os ceir diffyg yn y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau cyhoeddus, sy'n ymwneud â'r diffyg galw gan y dosbarth canol llafar, fel y'i gelwir, o'i gymharu â'r dosbarth gweithiol llai llafar, mai dyna'r union fath o fater yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ymdrin ag ef. Ni allaf, y prynhawn yma, roi ateb ynghylch yr union fodd y gwneir hynny drwy fformiwla. Er hynny, dyna'r egwyddor gyffredinol a deawn yn ôl ati wedi inni wneud rhagor o waith ar y manylion ac ar gwmpas y gwaith.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

1. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*
1. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004, ar y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd am Geisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; ac*
- b) *approves the Town and Country Planning (Fees for Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Ffioedd am Geisiadau a Cheisiadau Tybiedig) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004,*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004,*
- ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004;*
- ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004;*
2. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid, in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Food Safety (Act of Accession concerning the Czech Republic and other States) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*
2. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004, ar y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Diogelwch Bwyd (Deddf Ymaelodi ynghylch y Weriniaeth Tsiec a Gwladwriaethau Eraill) (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004, ac*
- b) *approves the Food Safety (Act of Accession concerning the Czech Republic and other States) (Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*
- b) *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Diogelwch Bwyd (Deddf Ymaelodi ynghylch y Weriniaeth Tsiec a Gwladwriaethau Eraill) (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2004,*
- i) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2004,*
- ii) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2004,*
- ii) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2004,*
- iii) *the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004;*
- iii) *y memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004;*
3. a) *considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*
3. a) *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004, ar y rheoliadau drafft Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004; a*

- b) approves the Feeding Stuffs (Sampling and Analysis) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Porthiant (Samplu a Dadansoddi) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2004,*
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2004,*
- ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 28 September 2004;*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Medi 2004.*
- 4. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid, in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Compulsory Purchase of Land (Written Representations Procedure) (National Assembly for Wales) Regulations 2004; and*
- 4. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004, ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Prynu Tir yn Orfodol (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru) 2004; a*
- b) approves the Compulsory Purchase of Land (Written Representations Procedure) (National Assembly for Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Prynu Tir yn Orfodol (Gweithdrefn Sylwadau Ysgrifenedig) (Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004,*
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004,*
- ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004,*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004,*
- iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004;*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004;*
- 5. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004, on the draft regulations, the Compulsory Purchase of Land (Prescribed Forms) (National Assembly for Wales) Regulations 2004; and*
- 5. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 12 Hydref 2004, ar y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Prynu Tir yn Orfodol (Ffurfiâu Rhagnodedig) (Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru) 2004; ac*
- b) approves the Compulsory Purchase of Land (Prescribed Forms) (National Assembly for Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Prynu Tir yn Orfodol (Ffurfiâu Rhagnodedig) (Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004,*
- i) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004,*
- ii) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 October 2004,*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Hydref 2004,*
- iii) the memorandum of correction laid in the*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau, a osodwyd*

Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd Members on 12 October 2004. (NDM2125) drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 12 Hydref 2004. (NDM2125)

*Cynnig (NDM2125): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2125): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004
Approval of the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2126 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2126 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004. (NDM2126)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004. (NDM2126)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004 in relation to the draft regulations, the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004; ac

2. approves that the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004,

a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004,

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004. (NDM2127)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004. (NDM2127)

These regulations set out the activities that a person can carry out if he or she has the health or physical capacity to do so. They also set out the procedures to be followed where it appears to a person's employer that he or she may no longer have the health or physical capacity to carry out an activity. The only material change from existing requirements is a relaxation of the restriction on those who have retired on the grounds of ill health. They will now be allowed to undertake certain non-teaching activities, such as acting as a classroom assistant. The regulations do not specify who may teach. They simply require that those working with children in education—in teaching and non-teaching roles, and regardless of whether they

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn nodi'r gweithgareddau y gall rhywun eu cyflawni os yw'n ddigon iach neu'n meddu ar y gallu corfforol i wneud hynny. Maent hefyd yn nodi'r gweithdrefnau sydd i'w dilyn os yw'n ymddangos i gyflogwr rhywun nad ydyw bellach yn ddigon iach neu'n meddu ar y gallu corfforol i gyflawni gweithgaredd. Yr unig newid o bwys i'r gofynion presennol yw'r llacio ar y cyfyngiad ar y rhai sydd wedi ymddeol ar sail iechyd gwael. Yn awr, caniateir iddynt ymgymryd â rhai gweithgareddau nad ydynt yn ymwneud â dysgu, fel gweithredu fel cynorthwy-ydd ystafell ddosbarth. Nid yw'r rheoliadau'n pennu pwy a gaiff ddysgu. Nid ydynt ond yn gofyn y bydd y rhai sy'n gweithio gyda

are qualified—must have the health and physical capacity to do their job. Issues of who may teach are covered in the specified work regulations, which the Assembly has already debated and passed. The specified work regulations make it clear that teachers and support staff are not interchangeable. Jocelyn Davies's amendment is therefore not relevant to this motion or to these regulations.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I believe that I heard the Minister say that the amendment was not relevant. If the amendment was not relevant, it would not have been accepted.

Jane Davidson: Thank you for your guidance. I will say, in that case, that Jocelyn Davies's amendment is not appropriate to this motion or these regulations.

The health standards regulations restate current provisions in a clearer and more accessible format. They have technical updates to fit with new regulations that the Assembly has recently made. They introduce the one small change that I have just referred to, which has already been implemented in England. This will maintain equality of opportunity in Wales for teachers who retire on the grounds of ill health. I therefore ask the Assembly to vote in support of the motion and to reject the amendment.

Janet Ryder: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2126 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that classroom assistants have a valuable role to play in aiding education delivery but believes that only registered, qualified and newly qualified teachers should teach up to and at the point of delivery.

These regulations open the door for teachers who have taken retirement on the grounds of ill health to return to the classroom as assistants. It is questionable whether retired teachers should return to the classroom at all, especially those who have taken retirement

phlant mewn addysg—fel athrawon ac mewn rolau nad ydynt yn ymwneud â dysgu, a pha un a ydynt yn gymwysedig ai peidio—yn ddigon iach ac yn meddu ar y gallu corfforol i wneud eu gwaith. Ymdrinnir â materion sy'n ymwneud â phwy a gaiff ddysgu yn y rheoliadau ar waith penodedig, y mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi cael dadl arnynt ac wedi'u derbyn. Mae'r rheoliadau ar waith penodedig yn egluro na ellir cyfnewid athrawon a staff cynorthwyol. Felly, nid yw gwelliant Jocelyn Davies yn berthnasol i'r cynnig hwn nac i'r rheoliadau hyn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Credaf imi glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud nad oedd y gwelliant yn berthnasol. Pe na fyddai'r gwelliant yn berthnasol, ni fyddai wedi'i dderbyn.

Jane Davidson: Diolch i chi am eich cyfarwyddyd. Os felly, dywedaf nad yw gwelliant Jocelyn Davies yn briodol i'r cynnig hwn nac i'r rheoliadau hyn.

Mae'r rheoliadau ar safonau iechyd yn ailddatgan y darpariaethau presennol ar ffurf eglurach a mwy hwylus. Mae ynddynt ddiweddariadau technegol i gyd-fynd â rheoliadau newydd a wnaeth y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar. Maent yn cyflwyno un newid bach yr wyf newydd gyfeirio ato, a wnaed eisoes yn Lloegr. Bydd hyn yn cadw cyfle cyfartal yng Nghymru i athrawon sy'n ymddeol ar sail iechyd gwael. Gofynnaf felly i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig a gwrthod y gwelliant.

Janet Ryder: Cynigiaf welliant 1 i NDM2126 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod gan gynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth rôl werthfawr yn helpu i ddarparu addysg, ond yn credu mai dim ond athrawon cofrestredig, cymwysedig a newydd gymhwyso ddylai addysgu hyd at ac ar y pwynt darparu.

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn agor y drws i athrawon a ymddeolodd ar sail iechyd gwael ddychwelyd i'r ystafell ddosbarth fel cynorthwywyr. Mae'n amheus a ddylai athrawon wedi ymddeol ddod yn ôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth o gwbl, yn enwedig y rhai

on the grounds of ill health. Should retired teachers return to the classroom when so many newly qualified teachers leave college without gaining teaching places, and are therefore unable to complete their induction year? I know that these regulations refer to the role that classroom assistants play, but there is now, unfortunately, a fine line between the roles of a classroom assistant and a qualified teacher. We should instead be looking to have regulations to allow newly qualified teachers to take up posts that would enable them to complete their induction year. Retired teachers have a wealth of experience, and it is a great shame that that is lost to education, and we are facing a situation whereby over 40 per cent of teachers will retire in the next 10 years, but does that justify allowing retired teachers, especially those who have taken retirement due to ill health, to re-enter the classroom environment?

The regulations relate to classroom assistants, and not to teachers, but I repeat that there is a fine line between the two. The Minister says that these regulations will bring us into line with England. Well, in England situations are developing whereby classroom assistants are taking the place of teachers; such situations should not be allowed to develop in Wales. Teaching assistants have a valuable role to play, but that role should not be to teach. In his recent Wales education lecture, Professor John Andrews said that it was his belief that only qualified teachers should be responsible for delivering teaching up to, and at, the point of delivery for every child. Therein lies the problem, because it can be argued that retired teachers are qualified teachers. Therefore, it is interesting that retired teachers will be restricted to only an assisting role—assisting or supporting teaching, assisting and supporting a child, administrative or organisational activities and activities that are ancillary to the provision of education. They are being ruled out of the first four activities in these regulations that other classroom assistants are allowed to carry out. That work is far reaching, and includes planning and preparing lessons, delivering lessons to children, and assessing the development, progress and attainment of children. A

a ymddeolodd ar sail iechyd gwael. A ddylai athrawon wedi ymddeol ddod yn ôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth a chynifer o athrawon sydd newydd ymgymhwyso'n gadael y coleg heb gael lle i ddysgu, ac felly'n methu â chwblhau eu blwyddyn ymsefydlu? Gwn fod y rheoliadau hyn yn cyfeirio at y rôl y mae cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth yn ei chwarae, ond nid oes fawr o wahaniaeth bellach, gwaetha'r modd, rhwng rôl y cynorthwy-ydd ystafell ddosbarth ac un yr athro cymwysedig. Yn lle hynny, dylem geisio rheoliadau sy'n caniatáu i athrawon sydd newydd ymgymhwyso gael ymgymryd â swyddi a'u galluogai i gwblhau eu blwyddyn ymsefydlu. Mae profiad helaeth gan athrawon wedi ymddeol, a thrueni mawr yw bod byd addysg yn colli hynny, ac yr ydym yn wynebu sefyllfa lle y bydd mwy na 40 y cant yn ymddeol yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf, ond a yw hynny'n cyfiawnhau gadael i athrawon wedi ymddeol ddod yn ôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth, yn enwedig y rhai a ymddeolodd oherwydd iechyd gwael?

Mae'r rheoliadau'n ymwneud â chynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth, ac nid ag athrawon, ond dywedaf eto mai ychydig a geir i wahaniaethu rhwng y ddau. Dywed y Gweinidog y bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn ein cysoni â Lloegr. Wel, yn Lloegr mae sefyllfaoedd yn codi lle y mae cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth yn cymryd lle athrawon; ni ddylid caniatáu i sefyllfaoedd o'r fath godi yng Nghymru. Mae rôl werthfawr gan gynorthwywyr dysgu, ond nid dysgu yw'r rôl honno i fod. Yn ei ddarlith ar addysg yng Nghymru'n ddiweddar, dywedodd yr Athro John Andrews mai ei farn ef oedd na ddylai neb ond athrawon cymwysedig fod yn gyfrifol am ddarparu dysgu, cyn a hyd at ei gyflwyno i bob plentyn. Yn hynny o beth y mae'r broblem, gan y gellir dadlau bod athrawon wedi ymddeol yn athrawon cymwysedig. Gan hynny, mae'n ddiddorol y cyfyngir athrawon wedi ymddeol i rôl gynorthwyol yn unig—helpu neu gefnogi dysgu, helpu a chefnogi plentyn, gweithgareddau gweinyddol neu drefniadol a gweithgareddau sy'n ategu'r gwaith o ddarparu addysg. Fe'u caeir allan o'r pedwar gweithgaredd cyntaf yn y rheoliadau hyn y caniateir i gynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth eraill eu cyflawni. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n bellgyrhaeddol, ac mae'n cynnwys cynllunio

classroom assistant can carry out these duties, apparently, without any training.

a pharatoi gwersi, rhoi gwersi i blant, ac asesu datblygiad, cynnydd a chyrhaeddiad plant. Gall cynorthwy-ydd ystafell ddosbarth gyflawni'r dyletswyddau hynny, gellir cymryd, heb gael unrhyw hyfforddiant.

3.30 p.m.

Plaid Cymru has made its stance on the role of classroom assistants clear in the Chamber before. We recognise the valuable work done by classroom assistants, but that work should be to support and enable a teacher to do his or her work, not to replace the teacher. I appreciate that these regulations would restrict the role of the returning teacher, but Plaid Cymru's amendment seeks to reaffirm the value of the work of classroom assistants in assisting, while reiterating our belief that only qualified, registered teachers should teach. If there is a need to employ more teachers to meet the workload agreement, then more teachers should be employed, particularly those who are leaving college without the prospect of work to complete their induction year. There is a great danger that classroom assistants could be used to provide teaching on the cheap, instead of being used to supplement and support the work done by registered, qualified teachers. Please support the amendment.

Mae Plaid Cymru wedi datgan ei safbwynt ar rôl cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth yn y Siambr o'r blaen. Cydnabyddwn y gwaith gwerthfawr a wnaiff cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth, ond eu priod waith yw cefnogi a hwyluso gwaith yr athro ac nid cymryd ei le. Sylweddolaf y byddai'r rheoliadau hyn yn cyfyngu ar rôl yr athro sy'n dychwelyd, ond mae gwelliant Plaid Cymru yn ceisio cadarnhau gwerth gwaith y cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth wrth helpu, gan ailddatgan ein cred na ddylai neb ond athrawon cymwysedig, cofrestredig gael dysgu. Os oes angen cyflogi rhagor o athrawon i gyflawni'r cytundeb ar lwyth gwaith, dylid cyflogi rhagor o athrawon, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n gadael y coleg heb obaith o gael gwaith i gwblhau eu blwyddyn ymsefydlu. Mae perygl mawr y gellid defnyddio cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth i ddysgu'n rhad, yn lle eu defnyddio i ategu a chefnogi'r gwaith a wnaiff athrawon cymwysedig, cofrestredig. Cefnogwch y gwelliant, os gwelwch yn dda.

David Davies: We are delighted to support the amendment, which is relevant and appropriate. The Conservative Party has been at the forefront of the campaign to stop New Labour from trying to get teaching on the cheap by putting classroom assistants in charge of classrooms. Although the Government says that there is supervision, when you pin that down, its idea of supervision amounts to a headteacher on the other side of the building with a sheet of paper saying what is to go on in the classroom. It mirrors what is happening in so many other areas of life in Britain: nursing auxiliaries are doing jobs previously done by nurses and community police officers are doing jobs previously done by policemen. Whenever the Government can get something done on the cheap, it will do so. We are not prepared to see that happening in education. Therefore, we will support the amendment.

David Davies: Yr ydym yn falch iawn o gefnogi'r gwelliant, sy'n un perthnasol a phriodol. Bu'r Blaid Geidwadol ar flaen yr ymgyrch i atal Llafur Newydd rhag ceisio cael dysgu'n rhad drwy roi gofal ystafelloedd dosbarth i gynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth. Er bod y Llywodraeth yn dweud bod goruchwyliaeth, pan ddiffinnir hynny, gwelir mai'r cwbl y mae hynny'n ei olygu iddi yw bod pennaeth ysgol ym mhen arall yr adeilad a chanddo ddalen o bapur sy'n nodi beth sydd i ddigwydd yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae'n adlewyrchu'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn sawl maes arall ym Mhrydain: mae cynorthwywyr nyrso'n gwneud gwaith a wneid cynt gan nyrsys ac mae swyddogion heddlu cymunedol yn gwneud gwaith a wneid cynt gan heddweision. Pryd bynnag y gall y Llywodraeth gael gwneud rhywbeth yn rhad, gwnaiff hynny. Nid ydym yn barod i weld hynny'n digwydd mewn addysg. Gan hynny, cefnogwn y gwelliant.

Is it not possible, Minister, that, as a result of these proposals, you could end up with a situation whereby somebody who has retired on the grounds of ill health, and who may possibly still be in receipt of a pension on those grounds, will nevertheless be able to continue as a classroom assistant, and, because of the regulations that the Labour Party is putting into place at the moment, will, in effect, be doing exactly the same job as he or she was doing previously? We are living in a bizarre and topsy-turvy world.

Peter Black: As David was speaking, it occurred to me that the Conservatives voted in favour of community support officers for the police. However, that is not what we are discussing today.

Like David Davies and Janet Ryder, I support the amendment, because the Welsh Liberal Democrats have signed up to the principle that only registered and qualified teachers should teach in classrooms and that the role of classroom assistants and higher classroom assistants should be one of support. That is a clear principle, which we sign up to.

I also support the regulations, because they are sensible. I listened to what Janet Ryder had to say, and most of it did not address her amendment but other issues altogether. However, in terms of the regulations, it seems to me that if there are experienced teachers who have retired through ill health but who can offer something back to the classroom, there is no reason why they should not be allowed to do so. One of the many problems that schools have faced over the last few years is that when experienced teachers have retired, the schools have tended to employ cheap and newly qualified teachers, and the school has lost teaching experience. If retired qualified teachers can return as classroom assistants and work with other teachers, that will add a new dimension to school life and will assist in the delivery of the curriculum. Therefore, I am happy to support the regulations as they are laid before us, but I am also happy to support the amendment, because we should support the principle of ensuring that only qualified

Onid yw'n bosibl, Weinidog, o ganlyniad i'r cynigion hyn, y gellid cael sefyllfa yn y diwedd lle y bydd rhywun a ymddeolodd ar sail iechyd gwael, ac a allai fod yn derbyn pensiwn ar y sail honno, yn gallu parhau fel cynorthwy-ydd ystafell ddosbarth, er hynny, ac, oherwydd y rheoliadau y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn eu rhoi ar waith ar hyn o bryd, y bydd yn gwneud yr union un gwaith, i bob pwrpas, ag a wnâi o'r blaen? Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd rhyfedd sydd â'i ben i lawr.

Peter Black: Fel yr oedd David yn siarad, digwyddais gofio bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi pleidleisio o blaid cael swyddogion cymorth cymunedol i'r heddlu. Fodd bynnag, nid hynny yr ydym yn ei drafod heddiw.

Fel David Davies a Janet Ryder, yr wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, gan fod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cytuno ar yr egwyddor na ddylai neb ond athrawon cofrestredig a chymwysedig gael dysgu mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth ac mai priod rôl cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth ac uwch-gynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth yw cefnogi. Mae honno'n egwyddor glir yr ydym yn cytuno arni.

Yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau, gan eu bod yn synhwyrol. Gwrandewais ar eiriau Janet Ryder, ac nid oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedodd yn ymwneud â'i gwelliant ond â materion cwbl wahanol. Fodd bynnag, gyda golwg ar y rheoliadau, ymddengys i mi, os oes athrawon profiadol sydd wedi ymddeol oherwydd iechyd gwael ond a all gynnig rhywbeth eto yn yr ystafell ddosbarth, nad oes rheswm pam na ddylid caniatáu iddynt wneud hynny. Un o'r problemau lu y mae ysgolion wedi'u hwynebu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yw bod yr ysgolion, wedi i athrawon profiadol ymddeol, wedi tueddu i gyflogi athrawon rhad sydd newydd ymgymhwysu, fel bod yr ysgol wedi colli profiad dysgu. Os gall athrawon cymwysedig wedi ymddeol ddod yn ôl fel cynorthwywyr ystafell ddosbarth, bydd hynny'n ychwanegu dimensiwn newydd at fywyd yr ysgol a bydd o gymorth i gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau fel y maent wedi'u cyflwyno i ni, ond yr wyf hefyd yn fodlon cefnogi'r gwelliant, gan y

teachers teach our children.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): It may be useful for me to read directly from the explanatory note in terms of what we are looking at in the regulations before us today. These are the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004, not the specified work regulations, to which David Davies and Janet Ryder spoke. I am grateful to Peter for speaking to the Education (Health Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2004. These regulations say explicitly that:

‘A person who is in receipt of a retirement pension on the grounds of ill health is to be treated as not having the health or physical capacity to carry out the first four activities in the above list,’—

the named list—

‘which are teaching activities.’

It explicitly states in the explanatory memorandum, which is available to all Members, what these regulations will do. I therefore propose these regulations and reject the amendment, which was an amendment for the specified work regulations, which we have already passed in the Assembly.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf am bleidlais ar y gwelliant, sydd, rhag ofn bod amheuaeth, mewn trefn.

dylem gefnogi'r egwyddor na ddylai neb ond athrawon cymwysedig gael dysgu ein plant.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Gallai fod yn fuddiol imi ddyfynnu o'r nodyn esboniadol yng nghyd-destun yr hyn yr ydym yn ei ystyried yn y rheoliadau sydd ger ein bron heddiw. Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004 yw'r rhain, nid y rheoliadau ar waith penodedig, y siaradodd David Davies a Janet Ryder amdanynt. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter am iddo siarad ar destun Rheoliadau Addysg (Safonau Iechyd) (Cymru) 2004. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn dweud yn glir:

‘Dylid trin person sy'n derbyn pensiwn ymddeol ar sail afiechyd fel pe na bai ganddo'r gynneddf gorfforol na'r iechyd i wneud y pedwar gweithgaredd cyntaf a restrir uchod,’—

y rhestr a enwyd—

sy'n weithgareddau addysgu.’

Datgenir yn glir yn y memorandwm esboniadol, sydd ar gael i'r holl Aelodau, beth a wnaiff y rheoliadau hyn. Gan hynny, yr wyf yn cynnig y rheoliadau hyn ac yn gwrthod y gwelliant, a oedd yn welliant i'r rheoliadau ar waith penodedig, yr ydym eisoes wedi'u derbyn yn y Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: I call for a vote on the amendment, which, in case there is any doubt, is in order.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2126): O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 18.
 Motion (NDM2126): For 36, Abstain 0, Against 18.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Isherwood, Mark
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2127): O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 17.
Motion (NDM2127): For 36, Abstain 0, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Datgymhwysio rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004 Approval of the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004. (NDM2128)

I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Datgymhwysio rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004. (NDM2128)

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004, in relation to the draft regulations, the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004; and*

2. *approves that the Disqualification from Caring for Children (Wales) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004,*

b) *regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 September 2004,*

c) *the memorandum of correction laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004. (NDM2129)*

Gwenda Thomas: These regulations have much to commend them, and I am pleased to support their approval. However, they may not be strong enough to prevent the likes of Ian Huntley from caring for children. Can you confirm that future regulations will fully address the findings of the Bichard inquiry?

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt): I am glad that Gwenda has raised this point in her role as chair of the safeguarding children review. These regulations address current concerns, but we are working closely with the UK Government to fully address the findings of the Bichard inquiry, and further primary or secondary legislation may follow in due course.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Datgymhwyso rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004; ac*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Datgymhwyso rhag Gofalu am Blant (Cymru) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004,*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Medi 2004,*

c) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004. (NDM2129)*

Gwenda Thomas: Mae llawer i'w ganmol yn y rheoliadau hyn, ac yr wyf yn falch o bleidleisio o blaid eu cymeradwyo. Er hynny, efallai na fyddant yn ddigon cryf i atal rhai tebyg i Ian Huntley rhag gofalu am blant. A allwch gadarnhau y bydd rheoliadau yn y dyfodol yn ymateb yn llawn i ganfyddiadau ymchwiliad Bichard?

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn falch bod Gwenda wedi codi'r pwynt hwn yn rhinwedd ei rôl fel cadeirydd yr adolygiad ar amddiffyn plant. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn ymateb i bryderon cyfredol, ond yr ydym yn cydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU i ymdrin yn llawn â chanfyddiadau ymchwiliad Bichard, a gallai deddfwriaeth sylfaenol neu is-ddeddfwriaeth ddilyn yn eu tro.

Cynnig (NDM2128): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2128): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2129): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2129): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004
Approval of the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004**

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): **The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I
Cynigiaf fod propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004. (NDM2130)

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004. (NDM2130)

Cynigiau fod

I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, ac a anfonwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r e-bost ar 12 Hydref 2004, mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004; ac

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee, laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 12 October 2004, in relation to the draft regulations, the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004; and

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau TSE (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2004 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

2. approves that the TSE (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2004 is made in accordance with:

a) y rheoliadau drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 5 Hydref 2004,

a) the draft regulations laid in the Table Office on 5 October 2004,

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Medi 2004. (NDM2131)

b) regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 27 September 2004. (NDM2131)

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will, of course, support these regulations, which are being brought into being partly as a result of European Community regulations and following the Minister's consultation last year. The Minister will, however, be aware that some concerns were raised in the course of his consultation, and I would be grateful if he could tell us how he intends to respond to those concerns.

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn, wrth gwrs, a hwythau'n cael eu cyflwyno'n rhannol o ganlyniad i reoliadau'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd ac yn sgîl ymgynghoriad y Gweinidog y llynedd. Fodd bynnag, gŵyr y Gweinidog fod rhai pryderon wedi'u mynegi yn ystod ei ymgynghoriad, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar os gallai ddweud wrthym sut y mae'n bwriadu ymateb i'r pryderon hynny.

3.40 p.m.

Concerns were raised about the effect of whole-flock genotyping, and of removing less-resistant genotypes, on local and rare breeds and organic and hefted flocks in Wales—hefted flocks are not as much of a problem in Wales as they are in parts of England and Scotland, but the issue remains. The Minister will also be aware that there are concerns that the—[*Interruption.*] Sorry, Presiding Officer, I was distracted momentarily by the First Minister, who was asking what a hefted flock was.

Mynegwyd pryderon ynghylch effaith genoteipio preiddiau cyfan, a dileu genoteipiau llai gwrthiannol, ar fridiau lleol a phrin ac ar breiddiau organig a rhai sy'n cadw at eu cynefin yng Nghymru—nid yw preiddiau sy'n cadw at eu cynefin yn gymaint o broblem yng Nghymru ag y maent mewn rhannau o Loegr a'r Alban, ond mae'r mater yn dal i sefyll. Gŵyr y Gweinidog hefyd fod pryderon—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, tynnwyd fy sylw am eiliad gan y Prif Weinidog, a holodd beth yw praidd sy'n cadw at ei gynefin.

The Presiding Officer: Order. If the First Minister wishes to meet any hefted flocks, he can visit Meirionnydd at any state of the tide. I will see him up on the Mignaint.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os yw'r Prif Weinidog yn dymuno cwrdd ag unrhyw breiddiau o'r fath, caiff ddod i Feirionnydd ar unrhyw adeg. Fe'i gwelaf ar ben y Mignaint.

Helen Mary Jones: I am sure that that would prove educational for the First Minister and help to ensure that his Government understands as much as possible about the needs of rural Wales.

The Minister will also be aware that the rates of compensation were deemed to be low, and the fact that independent valuations to set compensation would be at farmers' expense was raised with him. There was particular concern expressed about the effect of adhering to the requirements of agri-environmental schemes if flocks have to be cleared from the land for a period of time after scrapie has been discovered. I hope that the Minister will accept that the queries that I have raised are in the context of my supporting the regulations but having some concerns regarding how they will be implemented.

Mick Bates: On a point of information, a hefted flock usually stays in its place without thinking or straying—just look behind you, First Minister. [*Laughter.*] I have a couple of questions on the regulations, which are essential to meet European regulations. I note that the option that has been accepted, option 2, carries high costs, which will be borne by the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs. For how long will DEFRA cover those costs and will any costs fall upon the Assembly?

On the operation of the regulations on individual farms, there has been considerable talk about biosecurity in the aftermath of foot and mouth disease. In light of the fact that we hope to see the implementation of a fallen stock scheme some day, what biosecurity measures have been discussed? There is an absence of robust biosecurity measures within the regulatory appraisal.

Finally, what are the implications for the flocks affected by genotyping? Will farmers have to keep individually tagged records of their sheep? As the Minister knows, the European regulation on tagging sheep individually has not yet been accepted. There may be huge implications for genotyping if we do not accept individual tagging.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn siŵr y profai hynny'n beth addysgiadol i'r Prif Weinidog ac y byddai o gymorth i sicrhau bod ei Lywodraeth yn deall cymaint ag y bo modd am anghenion Cymru wledig.

Bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn ymwybodol bod y cyfraddau iawndal yn cael eu hystyried yn isel, a chodwyd gydag ef y ffaith y byddai prisiadau annibynnol i bennu iawndal yn digwydd ar draul y ffermwyr. Mynegwyd pryder neilltuol ynghylch yr effaith o ddal at ofynion cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol os yw preiddiau wedi'u clirio o'r tir am gyfnod penodol ar ôl darganfod clefyd y crafu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn fy mod wedi gwneud yr ymholiadau hyn yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fy mod yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn er bod gennyf rai pryderon ynghylch y modd y cânt eu rhoi ar waith.

Mick Bates: Er gwybodaeth, bydd praidd sy'n dal at ei gynefin fel arfer yn aros yn ei unfan heb feddwl na chrwydro—nid oes ond rhaid edrych y tu ôl i chi, Brif Weinidog. [*Chwerthin.*] Mae gennyf gwestiwn neu ddau am y rheoliadau, sy'n rhai hollbwysig i ufuddhau i reoliadau Ewropeaidd. Nodaf fod y dewis a dderbyniwyd, dewis 2, yn dwyn costau uchel yn ei sgîl, a delir gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig. Am ba hyd y bydd DEFRA yn talu'r costau hynny ac a ddaw unrhyw gostau i ran y Cynulliad?

Ynghylch gweithredu'r rheoliadau ar ffermydd penodol, bu cryn sôn am ddiogeledd biolegol yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau. Yng ngolwg y ffaith ein bod yn gobeithio gweld cynllun stoc marw yn cael ei roi ar waith ryw ddiwrnod, pa fesurau diogeledd biolegol a drafodwyd? Nid oes sôn am fesurau diogeledd biolegol cadarn yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol.

Yn olaf, pa oblygiadau sydd i'r preiddiau a effeithir gan genoteipio? A fydd ffermwyr yn gorfod cadw cofnodion am y tagiau ar bob un o'u defaid? Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, nid yw'r rheoliad Ewropeaidd ar dagio defaid yn unigol wedi'i dderbyn eto. Gallai'r goblygiadau o ran genoteipio fod yn rhai aruthrol os na dderbyniwn y gofyniad i dagio defaid unigol.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):

Members have asked many detailed questions, and I will provide detailed answers to them in writing. Organisations in Wales were consulted over seven weeks in November 2003. As a result of representations from the industry, a second consultation was held in June 2004 on the application of a derogation included in the EU regulation to allow non-pregnant ewe lambs of an unknown genotype to be introduced onto holdings until 2005. Stakeholders have been informed of progress on this issue through the magazine *Gwlad*, and a further article to publicise the launch of the scheme will feature in the November edition. It is correct that the national scrapie plan budget is held centrally by DEFRA, although we expect roughly a quarter of the budget to be spent in Wales. As I said, I will respond to Members' detailed queries in writing. It is important to remember that this is an important step forward in terms of dealing with a problem that we have had for many years. We are, hopefully, on the verge of being in a situation whereby the problem can be eliminated in the near future.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):

Mae Aelodau wedi gofyn sawl cwestiwn manwl, a rhoddaf atebion manwl iddynt mewn llythyr. Ymgynghorwyd â chyrrff yng Nghymru dros saith wythnos yn Nhachwedd 2003. O ganlyniad i sylwadau a gyflwynwyd gan y diwydiant, cynhaliwyd ail ymgynghoriad ym Mehefin 2004 ar y modd i gymhwyso rhanddirymiad a oedd yn rheoliad yr UE i ganiatáu cyflwyno ŵyn benyw nad ydynt yn feichiog o genoteip anhysbys i ddaliadau hyd 2005. Rhoddwyd gwybod i'r rhanddeiliaid am y cynnydd a wnaed ar y mater hwn drwy'r cylchgrawn *Gwlad*, a bydd erthygl bellach i hysbysebu lansio'r cynllun yn rhifyn mis Tachwedd. Mae'n wir bod cyllideb y cynllun clefyd y crafu cenedlaethol yn cael ei dal yn ganolog gan DEFRA, er ein bod yn disgwyl y caiff tua chwarter y gyllideb ei wario yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais, ymatebaf i gwestiynau manwl Aelodau mewn llythyr. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai cam pwysig ymlaen yw hwn o ran delio â phroblem a fu gennym ers blynyddoedd lawer. Gobeithio ein bod ar fin cyrraedd sefyllfa lle y gellir dileu'r broblem yn y dyfodol agos.

Cynnig (NDM2130): O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2130): For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2131): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2131): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane

Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau Rheoliadau Amgylchedd y Dŵr (Cyfarwyddeb
 Fframwaith Dŵr) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2003 i Brif Weinidog Cymru
 Delegation of the Functions of the Water Environment (Water Framework
 Directive) (England and Wales) Regulations 2003 to the First Minister**

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62(1)(b) o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (heblaw am y rhai hynny na ellir eu dirprwyo'n gyfreithiol) a gynhwysir yn Rheoliadau Amgylchedd y Dŵr (Cyfarwyddeb Fframwaith Dŵr) (Cymru a Lloegr) 2003. (NDM2122)

the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate to the First Minister all the functions of the National Assembly (save those which by law cannot be so delegated) contained in the Water Environment (Water Framework Directive) (England And Wales) Regulations 2003. (NDM2122)

Helen Mary Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Helen Mary Jones: Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

but notes that this transfer of functions would *ond yn nodi na fyddai angen trosglwyddo*

not have been necessary if the National Assembly had primary law-making powers.

We propose amendment 1 in order to draw attention to the fact that if the Assembly had primary legislative powers, we would not have to spend our time on endless transfers of functions and delegations of powers. We look forward to the day when the Assembly has the primary legislative powers that it needs and can spend its time on the substance of matters and on matters of substance, rather than on endless delegations and derogations.

We welcome the implementation of the framework directive and look forward to supporting the Minister in its full implementation in Wales. I draw the Minister's attention to one element of the water framework directive, namely the statement that EU member states must prevent further deterioration and enhance and restore the status of aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems and wetlands directly on aquatic ecosystems, with the aim of achieving good ecological status by 2015—[*Interruption.*] This is a matter of some amusement to some of my colleagues, including the leader of the Conservative group. The Countryside Council for Wales says that 72 per cent of marshy grassland sites of special scientific interest are in an unfavourable condition. This situation has not improved in the last five years. I seek an assurance from the Minister, particularly given the concerns already expressed about his budget lines in this regard, that he will, in implementing the directive, address the serious state of some of our marshland. There are practical, as well as ecological, reasons for doing this. One of the reasons is that marshland in good condition higher up river systems can prevent flooding further down those systems. Even though we may get bored and tired of Euro speak, this matter, like others covered by the water framework directive, is of great importance. We will support the Minister in the directive's implementation, but we look forward to the day when we do not have to spend so much time on delegations of functions.

swyddogaethau pe bai gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bwerau i wneud deddfwriaeth sylfaenol.

Cynigiwn welliant 1 er mwyn tynnu sylw at y ffaith na fyddem yn gorfod treulio ein hamser yn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau ac yn dirprwyo pwerau'n ddi-ddiwedd pe byddai'r Cynulliad yn meddu ar bwerau deddfu sylfaenol. Edrychwn ymlaen at y diwrnod y caiff y Cynulliad y pwerau deddfu sylfaenol y mae arno'u hangen ac y caiff dreulio ei amser ar sylwedd y materion ac ar faterion o sylwedd, yn hytrach nag ar ddirprwyo a rhanddirymu diddiwedd.

Croesawn y ffaith bod y gyfarwyddeb fframwaith hon yn cael ei rhoi ar waith ac edrychwn ymlaen at gefnogi'r Gweinidog wrth ei rhoi ar waith yn llawn yng Nghymru. Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at un elfen yn y gyfarwyddeb fframwaith dŵr, sef y datganiad bod rhaid i aelod wladwriaethau'r UE atal dirywiad pellach a gwella ac adfer ecosystemau dyfrol a thirrol a gwlyptiroedd sy'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar ecosystemau dyfrol, er mwyn sicrhau statws ecolegol da erbyn 2015—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae hyn yn peri cryn ddifyrrwch i rai o'm cyd-Aelodau, gan gynnwys arweinydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr. Dywed Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru fod 72 y cant o'r safleoedd ar laswelltir corsiog sydd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig yn anffafriol eu cyflwr. Ni fu gwella yn y sefyllfa hon yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Ceisiaf sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog, yn enwedig yn ngolwg y pryderon a fynegwyd eisoes ynghylch ei linellau cyllideb yn hyn o beth, y bydd, wrth roi'r gyfarwyddeb ar waith, yn ymdrin â chyflwr difrifol rhai o'n corstiroedd. Mae rhesymau ymarferol, yn ogystal â rhai ecolegol, dros wneud hynny. Un o'r rhesymau yw bod corstir sydd mewn cyflwr da ym mhen uchaf systemau afonydd yn gallu atal llifogydd yn is yn y systemau hynny. Er y gallem flino a diflasu ar jargon Ewropeaidd, mae'r mater hwn, ynghyd ag eraill y mae'r gyfarwyddeb fframwaith dŵr yn ymdrin â hwy, yn un sydd o bwys mawr. Cefnogwn y Gweinidog wrth iddo roi'r gyfarwyddeb ar waith, ond edrychwn ymlaen at y diwrnod na fyddwn yn gorfod treulio cymaint o amser ar ddirprwyo swyddogaethau.

Mick Bates: This framework is to be welcomed. I would like to hear from the Minister how the water framework will impact on diffuse pollution in terms of the new good environmental practice regulations, which are to be implemented in the mid-term common agricultural policy review.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): It is important to remember that this piece of legislation implements a European directive. Our structure means that we delegate powers to the First Minister and thereon in. Amendment 1 does not fully take into account that this is European, not Westminster, legislation. Therefore, I will not support the amendment, and I urge other Members to do likewise. We must transpose European directives into domestic law in Wales. This situation will not change. Even with primary legislative powers, we would still be liable to implement European Union law. I am unsure, therefore, what the amendment seeks to achieve.

Mick Bates: Mae'r fframwaith hwn i'w goesawu. Carwn glywed gan y Gweinidog am yr effaith a gaiff y fframwaith dŵr ar lygredd gwasgaredig yng nghyd-destun y rheoliadau newydd ar arferion amgylcheddol da, a roddir ar waith yn yr adolygiad canol tymor o'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae'n bwysig cofio bod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn rhoi cyfarwydddeb Ewropeaidd ar waith. Oherwydd y strwythur sydd gennym, yr ydym yn dirprwyo pwerau i'r Prif Weinidog ac ymlaen o hynny. Nid yw gwelliant 1 yn llwyr ystyried mai deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd yw hon, ac nid un o eiddo San Steffan. Gan hynny, ni chefnogaf y gwelliant, ac anogaf Aelodau eraill i wneud yr un modd. Rhaid inni roi cyfarwyddbau Ewropeaidd ar waith drwy gyfraith ddomestig yng Nghymru. Ni fydd y sefyllfa hon yn newid. Hyd yn oed o gael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol, byddem yn dal i fod yn atebol i weithredu cyfraith yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Nid wyf yn sicr, felly, beth yw pwrpas y gwelliant.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.
Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
German, Michael
Gwyther, Christine
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.

3.50 p.m.

Cynnig (NDM2122): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2122): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Kirsty Williams: Point of order. I raise this point under Standing Order No. 6.13 regarding the tabling of motions. Members will note that there is a section in italics on the agenda stating—

‘Nothing in this motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence...’

It is a caveat, which was placed at the inception of the National Assembly for Wales on delegations of functions, which is usually contained within the main body of the motion. I question the status of the words in italics as they currently appear. As far as I can see, they have the same status as the hyperlink, and forms no part of the motion. I seek clarification on the status of that part of the motion.

The Presiding Officer: This was a Government motion. My interpretation is that the motion stands as the main text, and that references to hyperlinks and other matters are not technically part of the motion as they appear. However, if there are graphical reasons why this has appeared, not textual reasons as originally drafted, I will investigate the matter. Clearly, the core wording of the motion, as it was proposed, was approved.

Kirsty Williams: Pwynt o drefn. Codaf y pwynt hwn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno cynigion. Bydd Aelodau'n nodi bod adran mewn teip italaidd ar yr agenda sy'n dweud—

‘Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth...’

Cafeat ydyw, a osodwyd adeg sefydlu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar ddirprwyaethau o swyddogaethau, ac fe'i ceir fel arfer ym mhrif gorff y cynnig. Yr wyf yn amau statws y geiriau mewn teip italaidd fel y maent yn ymddangos yn awr. Hyd y gwelaf fi, mae iddynt yr un statws â'r hypergyswllt, ac nid ydynt yn rhan o'r cynnig. Ceisïaf eglurhad ar statws y rhan honno o'r cynnig.

Y Llywydd: Cynnig o eiddo'r Llywodraeth oedd hwn. Fy nehongliad i yw bod y cynnig yn sefyll fel y prif destun, ac nad yw cyfeiriadau at hypergysylltau a materion eraill yn rhan yn dechnegol o'r cynnig fel y maent yn ymddangos. Fodd bynnag, os oes rhesymau graffegol dros ei ddangos fel hyn, ac nid rhesymau testunol fel y'i drafftwyd yn wreiddiol, ymchwiliad i'r mater. Mae'n amlwg bod geiriau craidd y cynnig, fel y'i cynigiwyd, wedi'u cymeradwyo.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.52 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.52 p.m.*

Cynllun Gweithredu Effeithlonrwydd Ynni The Energy Efficiency Action Plan

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1, 5 and 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendment 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 5 a 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the Welsh Assembly Government's energy efficiency plan for action entitled 'Energy Saving Wales'. (NDM2132)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu cynllun gweithredu effeithlonrwydd ynni Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sef 'Arbed Ynni Cymru'. (NDM2132)

This debate provides a timely opportunity to welcome today's launch of 'Energy Saving Wales'. When I made my energy statement last year, I stressed that greater energy efficiency was one of our key priorities, not only for businesses, but across every sector as we continue the drive toward a low carbon future. 'Energy Saving Wales' underlines our commitment to reducing carbon dioxide emissions and encouraging people from all walks of life to take positive action to save energy.

Mae'r ddadl hon yn cynnig cyfle amserol i groesawu lansio 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' heddiw. Pan wneuthum fy natganiad ar ynni y llynedd, pwysleisiais mai sicrhau gwell effeithlonrwydd ynni oedd un o'n prif flaenoriaethau, nid yn unig ar gyfer busnesau, ond ar gyfer pob sector arall wrth inni barhau i geisio dyfodol â charbon isel. Mae 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn amlygu ein hymrwymiad i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ac annog pobl o bob cefndir i gymryd camau pendant i arbed ynni.

Energy efficiency is fundamental to Wales becoming a global showcase where clean energy and energy conservation is concerned. Today's launch reflects the efficiency strand of our clean energy strategy. Its implementation represents one of the key ways in which we are delivering on our sustainability agenda. It is an agenda that I take very seriously. It is within that context that I welcome the launch of 'Energy Saving Wales'. I want to place on record my thanks to all those who have contributed to the consultation process. I believe that the result is an informative and illustrative document, which provides clear and concise messages relevant across all sectors.

Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni yn hanfodol os yw Cymru i ddod yn ffenestr siop i'r byd o ran ynni glân ac arbed ynni. Mae'r lansio heddiw'n adlewyrchu'r agwedd ar ein strategaeth ynni glân sy'n ymwneud ag effeithlonrwydd. O'i roi ar waith, hwn fydd un o'r prif ddulliau o gyflawni ein hagenda ar gynaliadwyedd. Mae'n agenda y rhoddaff bwys mawr iawn arni. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw y croesawaf lansio 'Arbed Ynni Cymru'. Yr wyf am ddatgan fy niolch i bawb a gyfrannodd i'r broses ymgynghori. Credaf fod y ddogfen a gafwyd o ganlyniad yn un eglurhaol sy'n llawn gwybodaeth ac yn cyfleu negeseuon clir a chryno sy'n berthnasol i bob sector.

In aiming to increase the general level of interest in energy efficiency, 'Energy Saving Wales' puts the focus upon all of us as individuals. As decision-makers, whether in the home, public sector, industry or commerce, we all have a contribution to

Wrth geisio ennyn mwy o ddiddordeb mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni'n gyffredinol, mae 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn canolbwyntio ar bob un ohonom fel unigolion. Fel penderfynwyr, boed hynny yn y cartref, yn y sector cyhoeddus, mewn diwydiant neu fasnach,

make. It challenges us to make behavioural changes, showing us the impact that the decisions we all make—as individuals, and collectively—on energy use, have on climate change. As well as alerting us to the environmental benefits of energy efficiency, ‘Energy Saving Wales’ points us to the green business and economic development opportunities afforded by sustainable development. There are clear synergies in this area with our goals and objectives in ‘Wales—A Better Country’ and our economic development strategy, ‘A Winning Wales’, as we continue to promote Wales as a green business location.

Our proposals to establish an energy saving portal will involve offering clear advice and support which will provide a one-stop shop for advice, information and support available in Wales. These are all sound reasons in welcoming ‘Energy Saving Wales’. The action plan also goes some way to highlight the excellent work already being undertaken by many agencies involved both in energy efficiency and small-scale renewable energy generation.

One example is Carbon Trust Wales, which is playing an active role in raising the profile of climate change and energy efficiency among businesses and the public sector. This afternoon will see the launch of its report ‘Energising Wales No 2’ which highlights its achievements. These achievements are helping Welsh businesses and the public sector to identify and implement measures to reduce carbon emissions by 500,000 tonnes of carbon dioxide per year and to cut costs by at least £35 million per year. I take this opportunity to announce that a proportion of landfill tax receipts will be used to provide additional support to Carbon Trust Wales. This additional support amounts to an extra £3.5 million over the next three years starting in the 2005-06 financial year, and represents a 56 per cent increase compared to its current budget allocation.

We have a good story to tell elsewhere. Real

mae gennym oll gyfraniad i’w wneud. Mae’n ein herio i newid ein hymddygiad, gan ddangos yr effaith y mae’r penderfyniadau a wnawn bob un—fel unigolion, ac ar y cyd—ynghylch defnyddio ynni, yn ei chael ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yn ogystal â thynnu’n sylw at y buddion amgylcheddol o geir o effeithlonrwydd ynni, mae ‘Arbed Ynni Cymru’ yn dangos inni’r cyfleoedd a geir o ran busnes gwyrdd a datblygu economaidd drwy ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae synergeddau amlwg yn y maes hwn â’n nodau a’n hamcanion yn ‘Cymru—Gwlad Well’ a’n strategaeth datblygu economaidd, ‘Cymru’n Ennill’, wrth inni barhau i hyrwyddo Cymru fel man i leoli busnesau gwyrdd.

Drwy ein cynlluniau i sefydlu porth i’r rhyngwyd ar arbed ynni, cynigir cyngor a chymorth pendant a bydd hon yn siop un stop ar gyfer y cyngor, yr wybodaeth a’r cymorth sydd ar gael yng Nghymru. Mae’r rhain i gyd yn rhesymau dilys dros groesawu ‘Arbed Ynni Cymru’. Mae’r cynllun gweithredu hefyd yn tynnu sylw i ryw raddau at y gwaith rhagorol a wneir eisoes gan sawl asiantaeth sy’n ymwneud ag effeithlonrwydd ynni a chynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach.

Un enghraifft yw Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon Cymru, sy’n cymryd camau i dynnu sylw busnesau a’r sector cyhoeddus at y newid yn yr hinsawdd ac effeithlonrwydd ynni. Bydd ei hadroddiad ‘Energising Wales No 2’ yn cael ei lansio y prynhawn yma ac mae hwn yn tynnu sylw at ei chyflawniadau. Mae’r cyflawniadau hyn yn helpu busnesau Cymru a’r sector cyhoeddus i bennu a gweithredu mesurau i leihau gollyngiadau carbon o 500,000 tonnall fetrig o garbon deuocsid y flwyddyn ac i dorri costau o £35 miliwn y flwyddyn o leiaf. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i gyhoeddi y bydd cyfran o’r derbyniadau o’r dreth tirlenwi yn cael ei defnyddio i roi cymorth ychwanegol i Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon Cymru. Bydd y cymorth ychwanegol hwn yn gymaint â £3.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros y tair blynedd nesaf gan ddechrau ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2005-06, ac mae’n golygu cynnydd o 56 y cant ar y dyraniad presennol iddi yn y gyllideb.

Mae gennym newyddion da i’w hadrodd am

progress is being made in terms of acting partners in the public, private and voluntary sectors, in setting Wales on a path towards a low carbon future, in making Wales a showcase for clean energy production and in acting to improve energy efficiency within the home and within the business environment. 'Energy Saving Wales' will help us build on that progress, and therefore its launch is something we should all join in welcoming.

I now turn to the amendments and briefly explain my reasons for rejecting them. As I said earlier, Energy Saving Wales highlights the work of agencies already engaged in promoting energy efficiency and in making the link between our actions and climate change, it stands to make a real contribution. It should be welcomed and I therefore reject amendment 1. I reject amendment 2 because the issue of monitoring renewable energy developments against our targets will be addressed in the forthcoming energy route map consultation exercise. On amendment 3, while I acknowledge that not everyone has access to the internet, 'Energy Saving Wales' does highlight the telephone and other services offered by agencies engaged in energy efficiency.

Glyn Davies: I am having difficulty understanding exactly what you meant when you rejected the Conservative amendment 2. What is this route map? Are you specifically ruling out the clause in the amendment in your route map, or are you saying you might come forward with the suggestion yourself?

Andrew Davies: We are currently looking at how we would develop our energy policy through the energy route map. The Cabinet discussed this issue yesterday, and we are developing proposals on how to take forward the action plan in terms of developing energy policy across all areas of renewable energy, and in terms of monitoring renewable energy against targets. That will be wrapped up within the document.

Regarding access to information services, the

bethau eraill. Gwneir cynnydd gwirioneddol gan bartneriaid gweithredol yn y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, wrth roi Cymru ar ben ffordd tuag at ddyfodol carbon isel, wrth beri i Gymru fod yn ffenestr siop ar gyfer cynhyrchu ynni glân ac wrth gymryd camau i wella effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref ac mewn busnesau. Bydd 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn ein helpu i hyrwyddo'r cynnydd hwnnw, ac felly dylem oll groesawu ei lansio.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliannau ac egluraf yn fyr pam yr wyf yn eu gwrthod. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn tynnu sylw at waith asiantaethau sydd eisoes yn hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni ac yn dangos y cysylltiad rhwng ein gweithredoedd a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, a bydd yn gwneud cyfraniad gwirioneddol. Dylid ei groesawu ac felly yr wyf yn gwrthod gwelliant 1. Gwrthodaf welliant 2 gan y byddir yn ymdrin â monitro datblygiadau ynni adnewyddadwy yn erbyn ein targedau yn yr ymgynghoriad ar y map ffyrdd ar ynni a gynhelir cyn hir. Ynghylch gwelliant 3, er fy mod yn cydnabod nad yw pawb yn gallu defnyddio'r rhyngwyd, mae 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn tynnu sylw at y gwasanaeth teleffon a'r gwasanaethau eraill a gynigir gan asiantaethau sy'n ymwneud ag effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd deall beth yn union yr oeddech yn ei olygu wrth wrthod gwelliant 2 y Ceidwadwyr. Beth yw'r map ffyrdd y cyfeiriasoch ato? A ydych yn dweud nad ystyriwch gynnwys y cymal sydd yn y gwelliant yn eich map ffyrdd, neu a ydych yn dweud y gallech gyflwyno'r awgrym eich hun?

Andrew Davies: Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn ystyried y modd y datblygw'n ein polisi ynni drwy'r map ffyrdd ar ynni. Trafododd y Cabinet y pwnc hwn ddoe, ac yr ydym yn datblygu cynigion ynghylch y modd i hyrwyddo'r cynllun gweithredu yng nghydestun polisi ynni sy'n datblygu ym mhob maes sy'n ymwneud ag ynni adnewyddadwy, ac yng nghydestun monitro ynni adnewyddadwy yn erbyn targedau. Caiff hynny ei gynnwys yn y ddogfen.

Ynghylch mynediad i wasanaethau

portal is another means of drawing attention to those services. Setting up an alternative telephone advisory service would duplicate what is already available. I therefore urge Members to reject amendment 3.

I also reject amendment 4. 'Energy Saving Wales' emphasises how simple energy efficiency measures can be adopted at little or no additional cost. We should ensure that those opportunities are seized first. We already sponsor Carbon Trust Wales, a commitment, as I have already indicated, which we are increasing substantially and the improvement of public buildings feature strongly in their programmes, as it does in the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside's sustainable development action plan. Beyond that, we must operate within present budget requirements while ensuring additional funds such as those that can be accessed from Europe are not overlooked.

4.00 p.m.

I also urge you to reject amendments 5 and 6. The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration recently indicated her desire to open a dialogue with the Deputy Prime Minister about the possible transfer of building regulations. The Minister has already announced the commissioning of a review that will focus on the adequacy of targeting the lowest income households and whether we are doing enough to lift those households out of fuel poverty. Her review and findings will be reported to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in due course. I ask you to support the motion unamended.

Elin Jones: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: dileu 'croesawu' a rhoi 'nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw am drosglwyddo pwerau dros reoliadau adeiladu, er mwyn hwyluso'r

gwybodaeth, mae'r borth i'r rhyngwyd yn fodd arall i dynnu sylw at y gwasanaethau hynny. Byddai sefydlu gwasanaeth ymgynghorol arall ar y teleffon yn dyblygu'r hyn sydd ar gael eisoes. Gan hynny, anogaf Aelodau i wrthod gwelliant 3.

Yr wyf hefyd yn gwrthod gwelliant 4. Mae 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' yn amlygu'r modd y gellir mabwysiadu mesurau effeithlonrwydd ynni syml heb fawr o gost ychwanegol. Dylem sicrhau yr achubir ar y cyfleoedd hynny'n gyntaf. Yr ydym eisoes yn noddi Ymddriedolaeth Garbon Cymru ac, fel yr wyf wedi nodi eisoes, yr ydym yn cynyddu ein hymrwymiad iddi'n sylweddol a rhoddir lle amlwg i welliannau i adeiladau cyhoeddus yn ei rhaglenni, fel y gwneir yng nghynllun gweithredu'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Ymhellach na hynny, rhaid inni weithredu yn ôl gofynion y gyllideb bresennol gan sicrhau nad esgeulusir ffynonellau ariannol eraill fel y rhai a geir yn Ewrop.

Yr wyf hefyd yn eich annog i wrthod gwelliannau 5 a 6. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi nodi ei hawydd yn ddiweddar i ddechrau deialog â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ynghylch y posibilrwydd o drosglwyddo rheoliadau adeiladu. Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cyhoeddi ei bod yn comisiynu adolygiad a fydd yn canolbwyntio ar ddarganfod a yw'r targedu ar deuluoedd â'r incymau isaf yn ddigonol ac a ydym yn gwneud digon i godi'r teuluoedd hynny o dlodi tanwydd. Rhoddir adroddiad ar yr adolygiad a'i ganfyddiadau i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio gyda hyn. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi'r cynnig heb ei ddiwygio.

Elin Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete 'welcomes' and replace with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls for the transfer of powers over building regulations in order to facilitate the

broses o ddatblygu tai sy'n rhatach ar ynni.

development of energy-efficient housing.

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i fynd ati ar frys i adolygu'r Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng tloedi tanwydd, ac adrodd yn ôl â'i ganfyddiadau i Bwyllgor o fewn chwe mis.

calls on the Labour Assembly Government to urgently review the home energy efficiency scheme to help tackle the fuel poverty crisis and report back its findings to Committee within six months.

Creu ynni, nid arbed ynni, sy'n cael sylw y cyhoedd, ond maent yn ddwy ochr yr un geiniog. Dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r galw am ynni wedi bod yn cynyddu'n sylweddol, ond nid yw'r datblygiad ynni adnewyddadwy wedi cadw i fyny gyda'r galw cynyddol am ynni. Dywedodd y Gweinidog wrth y *Cambrian News* yn ddiweddar nad oedd yn credu y byddai datblygiad y ffermydd gwynt presennol na'r rhai newydd sy'n bosibl o dan nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn arwain at leihau nwyon carbon deuocsid oherwydd y galw sy'n cynyddu.

It is energy generation that attracts public attention, and not energy saving, but they are two sides of the same coin. During recent years, the demand for energy has increased substantially, but the development of renewable energy has not kept pace with that increased demand for energy. The Minister told the *Cambrian News* recently that he did not believe that the development of the existing windfarms or new developments made possible under technical advice note 8 would lead to a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions because of the increasing demand.

Andrew Davies: I make a factual correction. The report in the *Cambrian News* was a gross distortion of what I said. I was asked a specific question by the reporter about the Aberthaw power station and I said that the insallation flue gas desulpharisation technology would lead to a reduction of sulphur dioxide, but would not lead to a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions. For whatever reason, the reporter chose to interpret that as me saying that the use of wind power or the contribution of wind power in Wales was not leading to a reduction in carbon dioxide. I did not say that; I was answering a question about Aberthaw.

Andrew Davies: Gwnaf gywiriad ffeithiol. Yr oedd yr adroddiad yn y *Cambrian News* yn llurguniad dybryd ar yr hyn a ddywedais. Gofynnwyd cwestiwn penodol imi gan y gohebydd am orsaf drydan Aberddawan a dywedais y byddai gosod y dechnoleg i dynnu sylffwr o nwyon y pibellau ffwrn yn arwain at leihau gollyngiadau sylffwr deuocsid, ond nad arweinai at leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Am ba bynnag reswm, dewisodd y gohebydd ddehongli fy ngeiriau fel pe byddwn yn dweud nad oedd y defnydd o ynni'r gwynt neu gyfraniad ynni'r gwynt yng Nghymru yn arwain at leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Ni ddywedais hynny; yr oeddwn yn ateb cwestiwn am Aberddawan.

Elin Jones: You would almost think that I had set that intervention up for the Minister's benefit. I am glad that he had the opportunity to correct that point and I am sure that he will raise it with the *Cambrian News* directly.

Elin Jones: Bron y gallech gredu fy mod wedi paratoi'r ymyriad hwnnw er budd y Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn falch iddo gael cyfle i gywiro'r pwynt hwnnw ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ei godi'n uniongyrchol gyda'r *Cambrian News*.

Wrth wrando ar y newyddion yn ystod y 24 awr ddiwethaf, mae'n amlwg bod ynni niwclear wedi ymddangos fel un o'r atebion

Listening to the news over the past 24 hours, it is clear that nuclear energy has been proposed as one solution for the increasing

ar gyfer y galw cynyddol am ynni. Mae'r ateb hwnnw'n cael ei gynnig gan Undeb y Gweithwyr Trafnidiaeth a Chyffredinol. 'Na' yw ateb Plaid Cymru a gobeithiaf y bydd pob plaid yn y Siambr yn defnyddio'r cyfle y mae'r ddadl briodol hon yn ei gyflwyno i ddatgan eu gwrthwynebiad clir i ddatblygiadau niwclear newydd yng Nghymru. Efallai fod ynni niwclear yn ticio'r bocs cywir o ran lleihau carbon deuocsid, ond y mae problemau diogelwch sylweddol iddo o ran prosesu ac yn enwedig o ran gwastraff ymbelydrol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd y cyfle unwaith eto i ddatgan yn glir safbwynt y Llywodraeth ar unrhyw atomfeydd niwclear newydd yng Nghymru.

Andrew Davies: In my energy statement in February 2003, I made clear that the Assembly did not support the development of any new nuclear power stations. We are eschewing the nuclear option for all the reasons with which I am sure everyone is familiar. Therefore, our policy has not changed.

Elin Jones: Bendigedig. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Llywodraeth yn rhannu barn Plaid Cymru nad yw ynni niwclear yn opsiwn ar gyfer unrhyw ddatblygiadau newydd yng Nghymru i greu ynni.

Ar y cynllun gweithredu, nid wyf yn anghytuno'n gryf ag unrhywbeth yn benodol, ond nid oes dim penodol o werth ynddo. Wrth wrando ar araith agoriadol y Gweinidog, yr oeddwn yn amau am eiliad fy mod wedi darllen yr adroddiad cywir. Hwn yw un o'r cynlluniau gwannaf a welais gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a dyna pam y byddwn yn pleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig, os na chaiff ein gwelliannau eu cefnogi, ac mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi cadarnhau na fydd y Llywodraeth yn eu cefnogi. Cael gwared ar y cynllun a dechrau eto fyddai'r opsiwn gorau. Mae angen newid sylweddol mewn polisi i gael unrhyw effaith ar leihau nwyon carbon deuocsid. Nid yw'r cynllun gweithredol, sy'n llawn bwriadau i rannu gwybodaeth a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth, i ddylanwadu ar yr ifanc ac i roi enghreifftiau o arferion da, yn ddigonol i sicrhau newid sylweddol o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Dylai cynllun gweithredol gynnwys pwyntiau

demand for energy. That solution has been proposed by the Transport and General Workers Union. Plaid Cymru's response to that is a 'no' and we hope that every party in the Chamber uses the opportunity that this relevant debate presents to declare their clear opposition to new nuclear developments in Wales. Nuclear energy may tick the right box in terms of reducing carbon dioxide, but there are very real safety concerns surrounding processing and particularly radioactive waste. I hope that the Minister will take the opportunity once again to restate the Government's view on any new nuclear power stations in Wales.

Andrew Davies: Yn fy natganiad ar ynni ym mis Chwefror 2003, eglurais nad oedd y Cynulliad o blaid datblygu unrhyw orsafoedd trydan niwclear newydd. Yr ydym yn osgoi y dewis o bŵer niwclear am yr holl resymau y mae pawb yn sicr o fod yn gyfarwydd â hwy. Gan hynny, nid yw ein polisi wedi newid.

Elin Jones: Wonderful. I am pleased that the Government shares Plaid Cymru's view that nuclear energy is not an option for any new energy generation developments in Wales.

On the action plan, I do not disagree strongly with anything in particular, but there is nothing specific of value in it. Listening to the Minister's opening speech, I doubted for a second that I had read the correct report. This is one of the weakest plans that I have seen from the Assembly Government and that is why we will vote against that motion, unless our amendments are supported, and the Minister has already confirmed that they will not be supported by the Government. Scrapping the plan and starting again would be the best option. We need a real step change in policy if any impact is to be made on reducing carbon dioxide emissions. The action plan, which is full of proposals to disseminate information and increase awareness, to influence the young and to give examples of good practice, is not sufficient to secure significant change in terms of energy efficiency.

An action plan should include specific action

gweithredu penodol, targedau penodol a dulliau penodol i fesur cynnydd. Nid oes yr un o'r rhain yn y cynllun hwn. Nid yw'n glir hyd yn oed faint o ynni a fydd yn cael ei arbed o weithredu rhai o'r syniadau yn y ddogfen. Faint o arbediad ynni fydd o borth rhyngwrwyd neu ymgyrch gyhoeddusrwydd? Nid wyf yn dweud na ddylai cynlluniau o'r fath fodoli, ond dylent fod yn ychwanegol at fesurau a fyddai'n cael effaith wirioneddol ar effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Os ystyriwn yr enghraifft o reoliadau adeiladu, dylai'r Llywodraeth hon fynnu rheolaeth lwyr dros reoliadau adeiladu yng Nghymru, a derbyniaf fod trafodaethau gyda San Steffan ar y mater hwn ar y gweill. Gobeithiaf y bydd y trafodaethau yn cynhyrchu atebion, yn wahanol i'r trafodaethau ar ddatganoli pwerau dros ynni adnewyddadwy a ffermydd gwynt sy'n cynhyrchu dros 50 megawatt i Gymru, sydd wedi dod i ben. Mae angen y pwerau hynny ar reoliadau adeiladu er mwyn sicrhau bod effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ganolog i adeiladau newydd. Os ystyriwn y fflatiau newydd sy'n cael eu hadeiladu yn mae Caerdydd, fel enghraifft o adeiladau newydd, rhaid sicrhau bod rheoliadau adeiladau yn rhan o unrhyw ddatblygiadau adeiladu newydd yng Nghymru.

Glyn Davies: I propose amendment 2 in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Add as a new point at end of motion:

requires the Government to publish annual interim renewable energy targets in addition to its 2010 and 2020 targets so that progress can be measured.

I will begin by welcoming the Assembly's focus on tackling climate change, on which we also held a debate last week. In general, there is cross-party agreement on the need to tackle this hugely important issue. Michael Howard, the leader of the Conservative Party, said in his speech last week, that he leads a party,

'which has consistently placed concern for the environment at the heart of its philosophy'.

points, specific targets and specific mechanisms to measure progress. Not one of those is included in this plan. It is not even clear how much energy will be saved in implementing some of the ideas contained in the document. How much energy saving will there be from an internet portal or a publicity campaign? I am not saying that such schemes should not exist, but they should be in addition to measures that would have a real impact on energy efficiency.

If we consider the example of building regulations, the Government should insist on full control over building regulations in Wales, and I accept that discussions with Westminster on that issue have begun. I hope that those discussions will result in answers, unlike the discussions on devolving powers for renewable energy and windfarms generating over 50 megawatts, which have ground to a halt. We need those powers over building regulations to ensure that energy efficiency is central to the construction of new buildings. If we consider the new flats that are being built in Cardiff bay, as an example of new builds, we must ensure that building regulations are part of any new building developments in Wales.

Glyn Davies: Cynigiaf welliant 2 yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi targedau interim blynyddol ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy, yn ychwanegol at ei dargedau ar gyfer 2010 a 2020, fel y gellir mesur y cynnydd.

Dechreuaf drwy groesawu'r pwys y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei roi ar fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd, y cynaliasom ddadl arni hefyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Ar y cyfan, mae cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar yr angen i fynd i'r afael â'r mater tra phwysig hwn. Dywedodd Michael Howard, arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol, yn ei araith yr wythnos diwethaf, ei fod yn arwain plaid

sydd wedi rhoi lle canolog erioed yn ei hathroniaeth i bryder ynghylch yr awyrgylchedd.

We would all agree with that. The Conservative philosophers that I most admire are Burke and Disraeli. I am not sure how fashionable Disraeli is now, but a key foundation of Edmund Burke's thinking was that the living are temporary possessors and life-renters of this world. I am sure that there is cross-party agreement on that, but within that, there is also plenty of room for interpretation.

Mick Bates: I do not doubt Glyn's sincerity when he talks about his party's commitment to the environment. However, how does he square that up with Oliver Letwin's announcement that he will cut £15 million from the environment budget, which will ultimately mean that Wales loses approximately £1 million?

Glyn Davies: I do not understand what you are getting at. We are talking today about a change in attitude, and all you can do is talk about money. That just highlights the hopeless inadequacy of Liberal Democrat thinking. Energy efficiency has a hugely important role, and I agree with the general objectives in the plan. Elin had a point when she said that the plan lacks specifics. I will touch upon one or two of them. First, I will make a policy suggestion, which may lead to the Minister achieving his global showcase. I believe that it is sensible to use fiscal measures to achieve objectives. Michael Howard, who is taking this issue seriously, has suggested that stamp duty may be amended to encourage people to invest in their own homes. That is worth exploring. In the Welsh context, we do not have tax-raising powers, but an amendment to the council tax regulations could be made, whereby a huge amount of money is spent on developing properties that are environmentally efficient, but there could be some sort of concession in council tax. That sort of fiscal measure can lead to great improvements.

4.10 p.m.

I highlight the fact that something is being delivered by private sector businesses. Televisions are one small example. If a Philips television is on standby, it uses about

Byddem oll yn cytuno â hynny. Yr athronwyr Ceidwadol a edmygaf fwyaf yw Burke a Disraeli. Nid wyf yn sicr pa mor ffasiynol yw Disraeli yn awr, ond un o brif sylfeini syniadol Edmund Burke oedd bod y rhai byw yn ddeiliaid dros dro ac yn rhentwyr bywyd ar y ddaear hon. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar hynny, ond o fewn hynny, mae digon o le hefyd i ddehongli.

Mick Bates: Nid wyf yn amau nad yw Glyn yn ddidwyll wrth sôn am ymrwymiad ei blaid i'r amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, sut y mae'n cysoni hynny â chyhoeddiad Oliver Letwin y bydd yn torri £15 miliwn oddi ar gyllideb yr amgylchedd, a fydd yn golygu y bydd Cymru'n colli tua £1 filiwn yn y pen draw?

Glyn Davies: Nid wyf yn deall beth sydd gennych dan sylw. Yr ydym yn sôn heddiw am newid agwedd, a'r cwbl y gallwch chi sôn amdano yw arian. Nid yw hynny ond yn amlygu'r diffyg alaethus ym meddwl y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae rôl bwysig dros ben i effeithlonrwydd ynni, a chytunaf ag amcanion cyffredinol y cynllun. Yr oedd Elin yn llygad ei lle pan ddywedodd fod diffyg manylion yn y cynllun. Cyfeiriaf at un neu ddau ohonynt. Yn gyntaf, gwnaf awgrym ar bolisi, a allai fod yn fodd i'r Gweinidog sicrhau bod ganddo ffenestr siop i'r byd. Credaf ei bod yn synhwyrol defnyddio mesurau cyllidol i gyrraedd amcanion. Mae Michael Howard, sy'n cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif, wedi awgrymu y gellid newid y dreth stamp i gymell pobl i fuddsoddi yn eu cartrefi. Mae'n werth ymchwilio i hynny. Yng nghyd-destun Cymru, nid oes gennym bwerau i godi trethi, ond gellid newid rheoliadau'r dreth gyngor, fel y gwarir swm enfawr o arian ar ddatblygu tai sy'n amgylcheddol effeithlon, ond gellid cael rhyw fath o gonsesiwn yn y dreth gyngor. Gall mesurau cyllidol o'r fath arwain at welliannau mawr.

Tynnaf sylw at y ffaith bod busnesau yn y sector preifat yn cyflawni rhywbeth. Un enghraifft fach o hynny yw setiau teledu. Os yw set deledu Philips wedi'i rhoi ar *standby*,

3 per cent of the electricity that it uses when it is operating, but nearly all other televisions use about 50 per cent. It is perfectly reasonable for us to say publicly that it would help the environment hugely if everybody bought a Philips television. I see no reason why I should not say that.

Innovation is another important objective. A new kettle has been invented in Britain that only boils the water that you need, no matter how much you put in it—if you press ‘1’, it produces enough water for one cup. It is a wonderful invention. If we reward that sort of innovation through Government policy and recognition, it will do more for the environment than any general Government initiative.

I return to targets, which is a matter that I raised last week. We must ensure that our targets are relevant. The much-reported target of 50 per cent—or 60 per cent by 2050—is completely meaningless. I was pleased to hear that the Minister is considering bringing forward a reconsideration of the targets. As I mentioned last week, the way in which targets can twist policy in a way that is not sensible concerns me hugely. We all want to achieve an advance, but we need an annual target to know exactly where we are going. The Labour Government, over the last five years, has not dealt with this issue with anything like the speed that it could have used. It has panicked and brought forward an objective that involves betting its entire farm on onshore wind, which is hugely damaging. Targets are twisting policy in a way that could damage the landscape of Wales. Only yesterday the issue of nuclear power was raised, and the coincidence is just too great. I am certain that the Government has realised that opposition to onshore wind power is growing across Wales, so it has asked its friends in the trade union movement to raise the spectre of nuclear power in order to force people to go down the road that it wants to follow. I am certain that that is happening. We want a clear strategy across the board that will take annual targets into account, so that we know exactly where we are going and how the Government is delivering and performing. If the Government does that, it will receive great support from the

defnyddia tua 3 y cant o'r trydan a ddefnyddia wrth weithio, ond mae bron bob set deledu arall yn defnyddio tua 50 y cant. Mae'n gwbl resymol inni ddweud yn gyhoeddus y byddai o les mawr i'r amgylchedd pe bai pawb yn prynu set deledu Philips. Ni welaf pam na ddylwn ddweud hynny.

Mae arloesi'n amcan pwysig arall. Dyfeisiwyd tegell newydd ym Mhrydain nad yw ond yn berwi hynny o ddŵr y mae arnoch ei angen, ni waeth pa faint a roddwch ynddo—os pwyswch ‘1’, mae'n berwi digon o ddŵr i lenwi un gwpan. Mae'n ddyfais wych. Os gwobrwywn arloesi o'r fath drwy bolisi a chydabyddiaeth Llywodraeth, gwnaiff fwy dros yr amgylchedd nag unrhyw fenter gyffredinol o eiddo'r Llywodraeth.

Trof yn ôl at dargedau, sy'n fater a godais yr wythnos diwethaf. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein targedau'n berthnasol. Mae'r targed o 50 y cant—neu 60 y cant erbyn 2050—y soniwyd llawer amdano yn gwbl ddiystyr. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod y Gweinidog yn ystyried ailedrych ar y targedau hynny'n gynt. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, testun pryder mawr i mi yw'r modd y gall targedau wyrdroi polisi mewn modd nad yw'n synhwyrol. Yr ydym oll am sicrhau cynnydd, ond rhaid inni gael targed blynyddol er mwyn gwybod i ba gyfeiriad yn union yr ydym yn mynd. Dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, nid yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi ymdrin â'r mater hwn mor gyflym ag y gallasai, o bell ffordd. Mae wedi dychryn ac wedi cyflwyno amcan sy'n golygu mentro'r cwbl ar ynni'r gwynt ar y tir, ac mae hynny'n dra niweidiol. Mae targedau'n gwyrddroi polisi mewn modd a allai amharu ar dirlun Cymru. Ddoe ddiwethaf, codwyd mater ynni niwclear, ac mae'n ormod o gyd-ddigwyddiad. Yr wyf yn sicr bod y Llywodraeth wedi sylweddoli bod y gwrthwynebiad i ynni'r gwynt ar y tir ar gynnydd ledled Cymru, felly mae wedi gofyn i'w ffrindiau ym mudiad yr undebau llafur godi bwgan ynni niwclear er mwyn gorfodi pobl i ddilyn yr un llwybr â hi. Yr wyf yn sicr fod hynny'n digwydd. Yr ydym am gael strategaeth glir yn gyffredinol a fydd yn ystyried targedau blynyddol, fel y gwyddom yn union i lle'r ydym yn mynd a sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn llwyddo ac yn perfformio.

Conservative Party.

Os gwnaiff y Llywodraeth hynny, caiff gefnogaeth fawr gan y Blaid Geidwadol.

Mick Bates: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

Mick Bates: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

welcomes the proposal of the Assembly Government to establish an internet portal but recognises that not everyone has access to the internet and therefore calls for the creation of a single advisory service called Energy Connect offering both telephone and website facilities.

yn croesawu cynnig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sefydlu porth i'r rhynggrwyd, ond yn cydnabod nad oes gan bawb y cyfleusterau i ddefnyddio'r rhynggrwyd ac felly'n galw am greu gwasanaeth cynghori unedig o'r enw Cyswllt Ynni, a fydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth dros y ffôn a thrwy wefan.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure that there is sufficient financial support to improve the energy efficiency of public buildings to achieve the aims of both 'Energy Saving Wales' and the sustainable development action plans.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod digon o gymorth ariannol ar gael i sicrhau bod adeiladau cyhoeddus yn defnyddio llai o ynni er mwyn cyflawni amcanion 'Arbed Ynni Cymru' a'r cynlluniau gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

There are three major issues for us to address in this debate. The first is that, undoubtedly, everyone accepts the Government's move towards renewable energy targets and its desire to save energy, which is a critical statement and one that we all welcome. The second issue concerns delivery and how those good intentions and aspirations are turned into reality, and the third is about whether there are sufficient funds in the budget to enable these targets to be met.

Mae tri phwnc pwysig inni eu trafod yn y ddadl hon. Y cyntaf yw bod pawb yn derbyn, yn ddi-os, fod y Llywodraeth yn symud tuag at dargedau ar ynni adnewyddadwy a'i bod yn dymuno arbed ynni, ac mae hynny'n ddatganiad hollbwysig yr ydym oll yn ei groesawu. Mae'r ail bwnc yn ymwneud â chyflawni a'r modd y gwiredir y bwriadau da a'r dyheadau hynny, ac mae'r trydydd yn ymwneud â a oes digon o arian yn y gyllideb fel y gellir cyrraedd y targedau hynny.

As Glyn said, no-one doubts your sincerity, Minister, in putting forward these aspirations, but in view of the fact that there are six Amicus members on the Labour benches, we could use a little clarity about its pro-nuclear stance. It is incumbent on you today to tell us whether those six Labour Members would like a nuclear power station to be built in their constituencies. Part of your party does not accept what opposition Members accept: your desire to reach your renewable energy target by not including nuclear power in the portfolio. We need clarity on that issue and I have written to you and the First Minister on it. I hope that those Labour Members who are members of the now pro-nuclear Amicus will make their positions clear.

Fel y dywedodd Glyn, nid oes neb yn amau eich didwylledd, Weinidog, wrth gyflwyno'r dyheadau hyn, ond yng ngolwg y ffaith bod chwe aelod o Amicus ar feinciau Llafur, byddem yn falch o gael ychydig o eglurhad ar ei safiad o blaid ynni niwclear. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnoch heddiw i ddweud wrthym a garai'r chwe Aelod Llafur hynny weld codi gorsaf drydan niwclear yn eu hetholaethau. Mae rhan o'ch plaid nad yw'n derbyn yr hyn y mae Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n ei dderbyn: eich awydd i gyrraedd eich targed ar ynni adnewyddadwy drwy beidio â chynnwys ynni niwclear yn y portffolio. Rhaid inni gael eglurhad ar y mater hwnnw ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch chi a'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gylch.

Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau Llafur hynny sy'n aelodau o Amicus, ac yntau bellach o blaid ynni niwclear, yn egluro eu safbwynt.

The report is well presented, but it lacks substance. Much of the information given in the report is excellent, but on page 16, which mentions planning and building design, there is an acceptance that TAN 8 and TAN 2 have been accepted in their current form and, as you well know, Minister, that is not the case. If TAN 2 were accepted, I think that some of the points that you made in those actions would actually be quite acceptable. However, they are not.

On the substantive point of how people get to know about what you are doing, the appendix lists in excess of 20 organisations. Minister, you have taken on board the importance of advice and announced that you will have a single energy portal on the internet, but I note with interest your rejection of the amendment for a telephone line as well. Such a line proved immensely successful for the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside when he accepted a proposal called Farming Connect. Previously, rural matters and the agricultural industry were subject to a great many organisations duplicating the selling of their wares—this is not an effective way to get the message across. If you have a single telephone contact and the internet portal, you will remove the need for each organisation to compete for space in the marketplace. The important issue is the consensus on reaching the target of 10 per cent and energy saving, which, I know, also has tremendous economic impacts. If possible, in your summing up, Minister, I would like you to explain why you will not remove duplication by organisations and allow a cohesive, coherent, single telephone access point via which private individuals or businesses can be directed—as with Farming Connect—to the relevant organisation, with the inquiry being followed through. All too often, the initial contact does not lead to an effective outcome, so you really must answer that point.

The other amendment refers to finance, on which Jenny Randerson will say more. However, last week, in the sustainable

Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi'i gyflwyno'n dda, ond mae diffyg sylwedd ynddo. Mae llawer o'r wybodaeth a roddir yn yr adroddiad yn rhagorol, ond ar dudalen 16, lle y mae sôn am gynllunio a dylunio adeiladau, cymerir bod TAN 8 a TAN 2 wedi'u derbyn ar eu ffurf bresennol ac, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, Weinidog, nid yw hynny'n wir. Os câi TAN 2 ei dderbyn, credaf y byddai rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch yn y camau gweithredu hynny'n eithaf derbyniol. Fodd bynnag, nid ydynt.

Ynghylch y pwynt pwysig am y modd y caiff bobl wybod am yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud, ceir rhestr o fwy na 20 o gyrff yn yr atodiad. Weinidog, yr ydych wedi derbyn ei bod yn bwysig rhoi cyngor ac wedi cyhoeddi y cewch un porth i'r rhyngwyd ar ynni, ond sylwaf gyda diddordeb eich bod yn gwrthod y gwelliant sy'n galw am linell deffon hefyd. Profodd llinell o'r fath yn llwyddiannus dros ben i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad pan dderbyniodd gynllun o'r enw Cyswllt Ffermio. O'r blaen, yr oedd llawer o gyrff a oedd yn ymwneud â materion gwledig a'r diwydiant amaethyddol yn dyblygu gwaith ei gilydd—nid yw hynny'n ddull effeithiol o gyfleu'r neges. Os cewch un cyswllt teleffon yn ogystal â'r porth i'r rhyngwyd, byddwch yn dileu'r angen i bob corff gystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd am le yn y farchnad. Y mater pwysig yw'r consensws ar gyrraedd targed o 10 y cant ac arbed ynni, y gwn a gaiff effeithiau economaidd aruthrol hefyd. Os oes modd, wrth ichi grynhoi, Weinidog, carwn ichi egluro pam na wnewch ddileu'r dyblygu gan gyrff a chaniatáu un pwynt mynediad trefnus a chydlynol a fyddai'n gyfrwng i gyfeirio unigolion neu fusnesau preifat—yn yr un modd â Cyswllt Ffermio—i'r cyrff perthnasol, ac i ddilyn yr ymholiad i'r pen. Yn rhy aml o lawer, nid yw'r cyswllt cyntaf yn arwain at ganlyniad effeithiol, felly rhaid ichi ateb y pwynt hwnnw.

Mae'r gwelliant arall yn cyfeirio at gyllid, y dywed Jenny Randerson ragor amdano. Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf, yn y cynllun

development action plan, we saw actual dates for the implementation of individual actions. I thought that that was admirable. In your plan, however, unless it is well hidden, I cannot see your date for implementation. Monitoring and evaluation will therefore be particularly important. None of this will take place, however, unless there is sufficient funding in the budget lines. You dismissed this by saying that there are simple little things that we can do. We deserve to know what those simple things are and who will pay for them. I do not believe that this plan has sufficient funding to ensure that you will achieve your admirable aspirations.

Christine Gwyther: It is important to accept the principles of global warming, and not only accept, but embrace, our international responsibilities for a low-carbon economy. This is my opportunity to state that that must never include a new nuclear site in Wales. The Minister's position is quite clear to me, a Labour backbencher, but I am sure that I speak for all my colleagues in saying that we will not support a regime that would introduce a new nuclear site in Wales. The Assembly has a clear principle of sustainable development, and that can never include burdening generations to come with crippling debt and having to clear up a mess that we created for a quick fix in our generation.

I will concentrate my remarks on energy efficiency measures and on how they can be improved. The energy saving trusts have produced excellent literature on savings in home energy consumption. This is the sort of guidance that must reach as many households as possible. I would like to see an escalation of direct advice to householders, as that would fit in with our Communities First policies for such advice to be centred on our poorest wards as a response to fuel poverty. However, I think that it should be rolled out to the whole of Wales. An internet portal will undoubtedly help in this respect, but I also ask that traditional home energy installers be encouraged to give householders the widest possible choice, which they do not always have at the moment, and that we target education and training at small and medium-sized enterprises operating in the field.

gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, gwelsom ddyddiadau penodol ar gyfer cymryd camau neilltuol. Credais fod hynny'n rhagorol. Yn eich cynllun chi, fodd bynnag, oni bai ei fod wedi'i guddio'n dda, ni allaf weld dyddiad ar gyfer ei weithredu. Gan hynny, bydd monitro a gwerthuso'n arbennig o bwysig. Ni cheir dim o hynny, fodd bynnag, os nad oes digon o gyllid yn llinellau'r gyllideb. Bu ichi wfftio hynny gan ddweud bod pethau bach syml y gallwn oll eu gwneud. Yr ydym yn haeddu cael gwybod beth yw'r pethau bach syml hyn a phwy a fydd yn talu amdanynt. Ni chredaf fod digon o gyllid ar gyfer y cynllun hwn i sicrhau y cyflawnwch eich dyheadau rhagorol.

Christine Gwyther: Mae'n bwysig derbyn hanfodion cynhesu byd-eang, ac nid yn unig dderbyn, ond croesawu, ein cyfrifoldebau rhyngwladol ar gyfer economi carbon isel. Mae hyn yn gyfle imi ddweud na ddylem byth gael safle niwclear newydd yng Nghymru. Mae safbwynt y Gweinidog yn gwbl glir i mi, fel meinciwr cefn Llafur, ond yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad ar ran fy holl gyd-Aelodau wrth ddweud na chefnogem Lywodraeth a gyflwynai safle niwclear newydd yng Nghymru. Mae'r Cynulliad yn arddel egwyddor bendant o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, ac ni all hynny byth olygu llethu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol â dyled andwyol a'u gorfodi i glirio llanastr a wnaethom ni er mwyn cael ateb sydyn yn ein cenhedlaeth ni.

Ymdriniaf yn bennaf â mesurau arbed ynni a'r modd y gellir eu gwella. Mae'r ymddiriedolaethau arbed ynni wedi cynhyrchu deunydd darllen rhagorol ar leihau'r defnydd o ynni yn y cartref. Rhaid i ganllawiau o'r fath gyrraedd cynifer o gartrefi ag y bo modd. Carwn weld mwy o gyngor uniongyrchol i ddeiliaid tai, gan y byddai hynny'n cyd-fynd â'n polisiau o dan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ar gyfer cyfeirio cyngor o'r fath i'n wardiau tlotaf fel ymateb i dlodi tanwydd. Er hynny, credaf y dylid ei ymestyn i gynnwys Cymru gyfan. Mae porth i'r rhyngwrwd yn sicr o fod o gymorth yn hynny o beth, ond yr wyf hefyd yn gofyn am gymell y rhai sy'n arfer gosod offer ynni mewn cartrefi i roi'r dewis mwyaf posibl i ddeiliaid tai, gan na chânt hynny bob amser ar hyn o bryd, ac am dargeddu addysg a hyfforddiant at fusnesau bach a chanolig eu

Energy efficient equipment has become more mainstream, and we must ensure that it not only makes economic sense to the householder, but that it also makes economic sense to the installer, because, if it takes longer to install, it harms its bottom line, and installers may be loth to recommend it.

4.20 p.m.

Big business has, for some time, been energy efficient; it has had to be. It has learned the hard way that the value of an improved bottom line and the real cost of out-of-control energy consumption is important to it as a business. However, the same message has not always filtered through to our small and medium-sized enterprises. I will not support the Liberal Democrats's amendment 3 to set up a discreet advice service, called Energy Connect, as we should aim to streamline business advice. I want an enhanced energy advice service, at the point of business contact and embedded in our targeted advice services, which will soon—let us not forget—be coordinated in-house and will, therefore, be scrutinised in-house. Backbenchers and Government have a direct input into that.

Therefore, SMEs have a vital role to play in reducing energy consumption; they also have a vital role to play in job creation in the energy efficiency sector. Up-skilling in installation will create more jobs and up-skilling in consumer advice will create and retain more jobs. We can use our already considerable skills base in fabrication and our emerging skills in research and development to manufacture, distribute and export the kit that we need to take forward our renewable energy programme.

I commend the use of energy efficiency measures in public buildings. The community facility at Skrinkle, near Manorbier in my constituency, has wood waste pellet stoves. They are welcoming, cheerful and provide local people with the example that they need to buy smaller stoves for their own homes. The refurbished Pembrokeshire Coast

maint sy'n gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Mae offer arbed ynni wedi dod yn fwy cyffredin, a rhaid inni sicrhau nid yn unig y gwnânt synnwyr economaidd i'r deiliad tŷ, ond y byddant hefyd yn gwneud synnwyr economaidd i'r sawl sy'n eu gosod, oherwydd, os cymer fwy o amser i'w gosod, mae'n gwneud drwg i'w helw, a gallai'r gosodwyr fod yn amharod i'w hargymell.

Bu busnesau mawr yn effeithlon o ran ynni ers cryn amser; bu'n rhaid iddynt fod. Maent wedi dysgu drwy brofiad fod gwell elw a gwir gost defnydd afreolus o ynni'n bwysig iddynt fel busnes. Er hynny, nid yw'r neges honno wedi cyrraedd ein busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ym mhob achos. Ni chefnogaf welliant 3 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i sefydlu gwasanaeth cynghori ar wahân, o'r enw Cyswllt Ynni, gan y dylem geisio symleiddio'r cyngor i fusnesau. Yr wyf am weld gwell gwasanaeth cynghori ar ynni, a roddir ar yr adeg y cysylltir â busnesau ac a gynhwysir yn ein gwasanaethau cynghori neilltuol, a fydd cyn hir—nac anghofier—yn cael eu cyd-drefnu'n fewnol ac a fydd, felly, yn destun craffu mewnol. Caiff meincwyr cefn a'r Llywodraeth fewnbwn uniongyrchol i hynny.

Felly, mae gan fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ran hollbwysig i'w chwarae wrth leihau'r defnydd o ynni; mae iddynt ran hollbwysig hefyd wrth greu swyddi yn y sector effeithlonrwydd ynni. Creir mwy o swyddi drwy wella sgiliau gosod a chaiff mwy o swyddi eu creu a'u cadw drwy wella sgiliau cynghori defnyddwyr. Gallwn ddefnyddio'r sylfaen sgiliau sylweddol sydd gennym eisoes i gynhyrchu a'r sgiliau sy'n datblygu ym maes ymchwil a datblygu i wneud, dosbarthu ac allforio'r offer y mae'n rhaid inni eu hyrwyddo drwy ein rhaglen ynni adnewyddadwy.

Cymeradwyaf y defnydd o fesurau arbed ynni mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus. Yn y cyfleuster cymunedol yn Skrinkle, ger Maenorbŷr yn fy etholaeth, ceir stofiau sy'n llosgi pelenni o wastraff coed. Maent yn ddymunol ac yn siriol ac yn gosod esiampl i bobl leol gan ddangos iddynt y dylent brynu stofiau llai ar gyfer eu cartrefi. Mae swyddfeydd

National Park Authority offices in Pembroke Dock are heated by biofuel, and they are another high-profile, highly visible example. That helps to promote and underpin the Pembrokeshire biofuel project, which supports producers and diversifies the local rural economy. That is the sort of virtuous circle that energy efficiency can provide in Wales. That is why I support the moves that the Minister has made so far, and I support him in extending the role that energy efficiency plays in Wales.

Brynle Williams: The Minister is on record as saying that

‘Fuel poverty has no place in our modern society.’

However, fuel poverty is here and will remain here unless your Governments in Wales and Westminster take radical action. The cost of central heating fuel has recently risen by 5p or 6p. That is outside our control, but we are now desperately trying to do something about fuel economy—saving fuel.

I recently built a home, and the planning contained no recommendations, from planning authorities or from my architect, on energy-saving resources. That is sad. The Assembly should be sending out the message: ‘Get this done.’

We need money for research and planning, but I believe, Minister, that you have nothing in your budget line for renewable energy—there is no increase. Flintshire County Council in my region will steal a march on many counties, as it intends to adopt the wonderful three villages project. That will be accessible to everyone, irrespective of circumstances, and is a move that must be welcomed. The council will work closely with local residents and will go into their homes to see how they can conserve energy locally. That must be done. It is a beginning, and, if this pilot scheme goes ahead, I believe that it will spread to other areas.

If we have to have wind turbines on land,

adnewyddedig Awdurdod Parc Cenedlaethol Arfordir Sir Benfro yn Noc Penfro yn cael eu gwresogi gan fiodanwydd, ac maent yn cynnig esiampl amlwg a thra gweladwy arall. Mae hynny o gymorth i hyrwyddo ac ategu prosiect biodanwydd sir Benfro, sy'n cynorthwyo cynhyrchwyr ac yn creu amrywiaeth yn yr economi wledig leol. Dyna'r math o gylch rhinweddol y gall effeithlonrwydd ynni ei greu yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y cefnogaf y camau a gymerodd y Gweinidog hyd yma, ac fe'i cefnogaf wrth iddo ehangu'r rôl y mae effeithlonrwydd ynni'n ei chwarae yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud ar goedd:

‘Nid oes lle i dlodi tanwydd yn ein cymdeithas fodern.’

Er hynny, mae tlodi tanwydd yn bod a bydd yn parhau os na fydd eich Llywodraethau yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan yn cymryd camau radical. Mae cost tanwydd gwresogi canolog wedi codi'n ddiweddar o 5c neu 6c. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth, ond yr ydym yn awr yn ymdrechu'n daer i wneud rhywbeth ynghylch arbed tanwydd.

Codais dŷ'n ddiweddar, ac ni chafwyd unrhyw argymhellion yn y cynlluniau, oddi wrth awdurdodau cynllunio neu gan fy mhensaer, ynghylch adnoddau arbed ynni. Mae hynny'n drueni. Dylai'r Cynulliad anfon y neges: ‘Cymerwch gamau ar hyn.’

Mae arnom angen arian ar gyfer ymchwil a chynllunio, ond credaf, Weinidog, nad oes gennyh ddim yn eich llinell gyllideb ar gyfer ynni adnewyddadwy—nid oes cynnydd. Bydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn fy rhanbarth yn achub y blaen ar sawl sir, gan ei fod yn bwriadu mabwysiadu prosiect rhagorol y tri phentref. Bydd ar gael i bawb, beth bynnag fo'u hamgylchiadau, ac mae'n gam y mae'n rhaid ei groesawu. Bydd y cyngor yn cydweithio'n agos â thrigolion lleol ac yn mynd i'w cartrefi i weld sut y gallant arbed ynni'n lleol. Rhaid gwneud hynny. Mae'n fan cychwyn, ac, os aiff y cynllun peilot hwn yn ei flaen, credaf y bydd yn ymestyn i ardaloedd eraill.

Os oes rhaid inni gael tyrbinau gwynt ar dir,

why can we not have local wind turbines for villages and small initiatives? Why can some of these turbines not be put in industrial areas where the power is required? That is not beyond the realms of possibility. I welcome initiatives in public buildings. Down in Pembrokeshire, I believe, Ysgol Gwauncaegurwen is reaching out. Am I right, Christine? I apologise; it is down in west Wales, I think. Its young people, the school, the council, and everyone are taking on this initiative and are showing that it can be done and that green energy can be produced.

In my field, agriculture, we are hearing that we do not need to produce food any more. However, we can produce renewable energy, biodiesel, fibres, and various crops like that. It just requires the will to get it done. There is no cheap fix to this. We must realise that we have to support these initiatives. There are 101 situations that can be aided.

Mark Isherwood: The Conservative Government introduced the Home Energy Conservation Act 1995, and a target of a 30 per cent improvement in energy efficiency on the then levels by 2010. Do you share my concern, therefore, that Labour has now reneged on 15 promises on domestic energy efficiency by reducing its equivalent target for carbon dioxide savings by 16 per cent at a time when overall carbon dioxide emissions are increasing, as the newsletter for the Association for the Conservation of Energy explains in detail? Do you share my suspicion that this is why the Welsh Assembly Government's draft budget this year has not provided any extra resources for home energy efficiency?

Brynle Williams: Thank you, Mark. Moving on—

Jenny Randerson: To clarify that point, although the home energy efficiency scheme was introduced under the Conservative Government, it was a Liberal Democrat MP, Diana Maddock, who introduced it as a private Member's Bill.

Brynle Williams: As a farmer, I am well

pam na allwn gael tyrbinau gwynt lleol ar gyfer pentrefi a mentrau bach? Pam na ellir rhoi rhai o'r tyrbinau mewn ardaloedd diwydiannol lle y mae angen yr ynni? Mae hynny'n gwbl bosibl. Croesawaf fentrau mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus. I lawr yn sir Benfro, yr wyf yn credu, mae Ysgol Gwauncaegurwen yn estyn allan. A wyf yn gywir, Christine? Ymddiheuraf; mae yn y Gorllewin, yr wyf yn credu. Mae ei phobl ifanc, yr ysgol, y cyngor, a phawb yn ymgymryd â'r fenter hon ac yn dangos y gellir ei gwneud a bod modd cynhyrchu ynni gwyrdd.

Yn fy maes i, sef amaethyddiaeth, clywn nad oes angen bellach inni gynhyrchu bwyd. Er hynny, gallwn gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy, biodiesel, ffeibrau a gwahanol gnydau o'r fath. Nid yw ond yn gofyn yr ewyllys i fynd â'r maen i'r wal. Nid oes ateb rhad i hyn. Rhaid inni sylweddoli ein bod yn gorfod cefnogi'r mentrau hyn. Mae cant a mil o sefyllfaoedd lle y gellir rhoi cymorth.

Mark Isherwood: Y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a gyflwynodd Ddeddf Arbed Ynni Cartref 1995, a tharged o sicrhau 30 y cant o welliant wrth arbed ynni ar y lefelau ar y pryd erbyn 2010. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder, felly, fod Llafur bellach wedi torri 15 addewid ar arbed ynni yn y cartref drwy ostwng y targed cyfatebol ar gyfer lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid 16 y cant ar adeg pan mae gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ar gynnydd yn gyffredinol, fel y mae cylchlythyr y Gymdeithas Arbed Ynni yn egluro'n fanwl? A ydych fel minnau'n amau mai dyma pam nad yw cyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru eleni wedi darparu unrhyw adnoddau ychwanegol ar gyfer arbed ynni yn y cartref?

Brynle Williams: Diolch i chi, Mark. Gan symud ymlaen—

Jenny Randerson: Er mwyn egluro'r pwynt hwnnw, er mai o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol y cyflwynwyd y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, AS y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, Diana Maddock, a'i cyflwynodd fel Mesur Aelod preifat.

Brynle Williams: Fel ffermwr, gwn yn iawn

aware of the problems that we face in relation to energy. It does not make sense that we are transporting food half way around the world, thus using vast amounts of carbon energy, and are cutting down forests overseas to produce food because we want to buy it cheap here. What do we then try to do in Europe? We try to rectify the problem. It does not make sense. We have the answer in our hands, Minister, as do you. However, we must promote not only windfarms but all manners of conservation.

Catherine Thomas: I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate, which I will approach from a social justice perspective. Energy efficiency is a key way of helping to fulfil this Government's social-justice-driven commitment to eliminate fuel poverty in Wales.

As someone who represents a constituency that includes four Communities First areas, as well as other areas with deep pockets of poverty, I know that energy efficiency is crucial and can make an enormous difference to many households—and can do so not only in my constituency, but throughout Wales. A staggering 220,000 Welsh households live in properties with poor standards of heating and insulation, which amounts to approximately 500,000 people being affected. These households spend nearly 10 per cent of their income just on heating—that is 10 per cent that they cannot afford. It is a sad reality that the most disadvantaged citizens of Wales occupy most of these homes, mainly the elderly, benefit-dependent families, the chronically sick, the disabled and the very young. These cold, damp houses, which are inadequately heated, have repeatedly been linked to ill health and early deaths among the most vulnerable people in society.

4.30 p.m.

Illnesses such as cardiovascular disease, respiratory illnesses, childhood asthma, flu and the common cold, to name a few, affect those who live in these poor conditions. I

am y problemau a wynebwn mewn cysylltiad ag ynni. Nid oes synnwyr mewn cludo bwyd hanner y ffordd o gwmpas y byd, gan ddefnyddio symiau enfawr o ynni carbon, ac mewn torri coedwigoedd mewn gwledydd tramor i gynhyrchu bwyd gan ein bod am ei brynu'n rhad yma. Beth y ceisiwn ei wneud wedyn yn Ewrop? Ceisiwn ddatrys y broblem. Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr. Mae'r ateb yn ein dwylo ni, Weinidog, ac yn eich dwylo chi. Fodd bynnag, nid ffermydd gwynt yn unig y dylem eu hyrwyddo, ond pob math o ddulliau arbed ynni.

Catherine Thomas: Croesawaf y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon, yr ymdriniaf â hi o safbwynt cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni'n fodd allweddol i gyflawni ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i ddileu tloidi tanwydd yng Nghymru, a ysgogir gan ei chred mewn cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

A minnau'n cynrychioli etholaeth ac ynddi bedair ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yn ogystal ag ardaloedd eraill lle y ceir llecynnau tlawd iawn, gwn fod effeithlonrwydd ynni'n hollbwysig ac y gall wneud gwahaniaeth mawr iawn i lawer o deuluoedd—a hynny nid yn unig yn fy etholaeth i, ond ledled Cymru. Mae'n syfrdanol bod 220,000 o deuluoedd yng Nghymru'n byw mewn tai sydd â safonau gwresogi ac insiwleiddio gwael, ac mae hynny'n golygu bod hyn yn effeithio ar tua 500,000 o bobl. Mae'r teuluoedd hyn yn gwario bron 10 y cant o'u hincwm ar wresogi'n unig—mae hynny'n 10 y cant na allant ei fforddio. Y gwir trist amdani yw mai dinasyddion mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru sy'n byw yn y rhan fwyaf o'r tai hyn, a hwythau gan mwyaf yn bobl oedrannus, yn deuluoedd sy'n dibynnu ar fudd-daliadau, yn rhai sydd â salwch cronig, yn bobl anabl ac yn bobl ifanc iawn. Mae'r tai oer a llaith hyn, sydd heb eu gwresogi'n ddigonol, wedi'u cysylltu dro ar ôl tro ag iechyd gwael a marwolaethau cynnar ymysg y rhai mwyaf bregus mewn cymdeithas.

Mae anhwylderau fel clefyd cardiofasgwlaidd, anhwylderau anadlu, asthma mewn plant, y ffliw a'r annwyd cyffredin, ac enwi dim ond rhai, yn effeithio

have visited many such homes in my constituency and have witnessed at first hand how inadequately heated homes can often cause, or at the very least contribute to, acute bronchial problems among children and our older citizens. Energy efficiency constitutes a major part of a rational solution to dealing with fuel poverty and could dramatically reduce the link between energy inefficient housing and ill health. Some 40 per cent of heat is lost through uninsulated walls, 20 per cent is lost through ventilation, and a further 20 per cent is lost through poorly insulated windows. The average household could save around £200 a year by taking measures to improve energy efficiency. Fitting cavity wall insulation could reduce heat loss by 60 per cent and could save the UK £670 million. The home energy efficiency scheme is a step towards our goal of ensuring a better Wales, and 28,000 Welsh households have already benefited from the grants provided through the programme. Partnership working on this is essential if the scheme is to succeed. Housing officers, health visitors, social workers and others must all look for signs of fuel poverty.

It is also our responsibility to significantly improve the energy efficiency of all residential accommodation, not just that which comes under the home energy efficiency scheme regulations. For example, taking simple measures such as switching off lights when leaving a room, using energy-efficient light bulbs and lowering the thermostat by just 1 degree can reduce home energy costs by 10 per cent. This would result in greatly improved standards of living and comfort, which is particularly important for individuals on low incomes, whose homes are often the hardest and the most expensive to heat. It is also important for people who have greater heating needs because of chronic illness or disability. The economic benefits of implementing energy efficiency measures will be significant. More importantly, many citizens will be comforted by knowing that they will be able to live in a home that is heated, and that their families can live healthier lives.

Let us not forget that the most extreme cases of fuel poverty may end in supplies being

ar y rhai sy'n byw yn yr amgylchiadau gwael hyn. Bwm mewn sawl cartref o'r fath yn fy etholaeth a gwelais â'm llygaid fy hun y modd y mae cartrefi a wresogir yn annigonol yn aml yn gallu achosi problemau bronciol difrifol ymysg plant a'r henoed, neu'n cyfrannu atynt o leiaf. Mae effeithlonrwydd ynni'n rhan bwysig o ateb rhesymol i ddelio â thlodi tanwydd a gallai leihau'n sylweddol y cyswllt rhwng tai sy'n aneffeithlon o ran ynni ac iechyd gwael. Collir tua 40 y cant o wres drwy waliau sydd heb eu hinsiwleiddio, collir 20 y cant drwy awyru, a cholli 20 y cant ar ben hynny drwy ffenestri sydd wedi'u hinsiwleiddio'n wael. Gallai'r teulu cyffredin arbed tua £200 y flwyddyn drwy gymryd camau i arbed ynni. Drwy insiwleiddio waliau dwbl, gellid colli 60 y cant yn llai o wres a gallai hynny arbed £670 miliwn i'r DU. Mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn gam tuag at ein nod o sicrhau Cymru well, ac mae 28,000 o deuluoedd yng Nghymru eisoes wedi cael budd o'r grantiau a ddarperir drwy'r rhaglen. Mae'n hollbwysig gweithio mewn partneriaeth os yw'r cynllun i lwyddo. Rhaid i swyddogion tai, ymwelwyr iechyd, gweithwyr cymdeithasol ac eraill chwilio am arwyddion tlodi tanwydd.

Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb hefyd i sicrhau gwelliant sylweddol yn effeithlonrwydd ynni'r holl dai preswyl, nid y rhai sy'n ddarostyngedig i reoliadau'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn unig. Er enghraifft, drwy gymryd camau syml fel diffodd goleuadau wrth fynd o ystafell, defnyddio bylbiau golau ynni-effeithlon a gostwng y thermostat o ddim ond 1 radd, gellir lleihau costau ynni cartref o 10 y cant. Arweiniai hynny at well safonau o lawer o ran byw a chysur, ac mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig i rai sydd ar incwm isel, gan mai eu cartrefi hwy yw'r rhai anoddaf a drutaf i'w gwresogi'n aml. Mae hefyd yn bwysig i rai sydd â mwy o anghenion o ran gwresogi oherwydd salwch cronig neu anabled. Ceir buddion economaidd sylweddol o roi mesurau arbed ynni ar waith. Yn bwysicach na hynny, caiff llawer o ddinasyddion gysur o wybod y gallant fyw mewn cartref sydd wedi'i wresogi, ac y gall eu teuluoedd fyw bywydau iachach.

Nac anghofier y gellir datgysylltu cyflenwadau yn y diwedd yn yr achosion

disconnected. In order to prevent distress, illness and, in extreme cases, death, we should support the end of energy supplies being disconnected as a result of debt. In Wales, during past years, disconnections of households from gas and electricity supplies have been rising, with an average of 1,200 disconnections carried out each year. This is an intolerable situation, which I have highlighted in the statement of opinion supported by Energywatch. We must put an end to disconnecting vulnerable households from their essential sources of heating, lighting and cooking. It is an unacceptable practice in twenty-first-century Wales and clearly contradicts the Government's energy efficiency plans and the social justice agenda that it embraces.

Jenny Randerson: I want to bring us back to the energy efficiency plan. Several speakers have been tempted into discussing energy conservation in general rather than this document in particular. That is not surprising because there is little in the document. It is an environmental embarrassment. It has been printed on thick, glossy paper and there are acres of white space where there should be information and a strategy. It is a glossy document, but it contains little. It is okay as far as it goes, but it is deeply disappointing. It is a Government information leaflet; it is not a strategy. It lacks depth and breadth and a commitment to bold ideas. The vision, as far as it goes, is okay. We can all sign up to that. However, it only goes one or two steps down the road. There is no detailed commitment to real change.

Individual organisations have carried out excellent work, but the job of the Minister and the Labour Assembly Government is to show leadership and bring this together. There is no coherent leadership here. To give you an example, the section on industry and commerce is made up of two glossy pages on which there is plenty of white space and three action points, one of which is to 'make better use of daylight'. The section on renewable energy states that, through TAN 8, the Government will encourage a positive attitude to micro-generation in planning authorities. Does the Minister for Economic

mwyaf eithafol o dlodi tanwydd. Er mwyn atal gofid, salwch ac, mewn achosion eithafol, marwolaeth, dylem fod o blaid atal datgysylltu cyflenwadau ynni o ganlyniad i ddyled. Yng Nghymru, yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, bu cynnydd yn nifer y teuluoedd y datgysylltwyd eu cyflenwadau nwy a thrydan, a datgysylltir 1,200 o gyflenwadau ar gyfartaledd bob blwyddyn. Ni ellir goddef sefyllfa o'r fath, y tynnais sylw ati yn y datganiad barn a gefnogwyd gan Golwg ar Ynni. Rhaid inni atal datgysylltu ffynonellau gwresogi, goleuo a choginio sy'n hanfodol i deuluoedd sy'n agored i niwed. Nid yw'r arfer hon yn dderbyniol yng Nghymru'r unfed ganrif ar hugain ac mae'n amlwg yn groes i gynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni'r Llywodraeth a'r agenda ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol y mae'n ei dilyn.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf am ddod â ni'n ôl at y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni. Mae sawl siaradwr wedi'i demtio i drafod arbed ynni'n gyffredinol yn hytrach na'r ddogfen hon yn benodol. Nid yw hynny'n syndod gan mai ychydig a geir yn y ddogfen. Mae'n destun cywilydd amgylcheddol. Fe'i hargraffwyd ar bapur tew, sgleiniog ac mae peth wmbredd o ofod gwag lle y dylid cael gwybodaeth a strategaeth. Dogfen sgleiniog ydyw, ond nid oes fawr ddim ynddi. Mae'n iawn, gyfryw ag ydyw, ond mae'n dra siomedig. Taflen wybodaeth gan Lywodraeth ydyw; nid yw'n strategaeth. Mae ynddi ddiffyg manylder ac ehangder a diffyg ymrwymiad i syniadau beiddgar. Mae'r weledigaeth, gyfryw ag ydyw, yn burion. Gallwn oll gytuno ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw ond yn cymryd cam neu ddau ar hyd y ffordd. Nid oes ymrwymiad manwl i wir newid.

Mae rhai cyrff wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol, ond gwaith y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yw dangos arweiniad a rhoi trefn ar hyn. Nid oes arweiniad trefnus yma. A rhoi un enghraifft i chi, mae'r adran ar ddiwydiant a masnach yn cynnwys dau dudalen sgleiniog lle y mae llawer o ofod gwag a thri phwynt gweithredu, ac un ohonynt yw 'gwneud gwell defnydd o olau dydd'. Mae'r adran ar ynni adnewyddadwy yn dweud y bydd y Llywodraeth, drwy nodyn cyngor technegol 8, yn hyrwyddo ymagwedd gadarnhaol at feicrogynhyrchu mewn awdurdodau cynllunio. A yw'r Gweinidog

Development talks to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, because TAN 8 is a planning document? When we discussed micro-renewable energy technologies, the Government told us that this did not relate to TAN 8 because that document addresses planning issues and windfarms, and said that the fact that it was not included in TAN 8 did not mean that it was not in favour of micro-generation but that its inclusion was not appropriate. According to that argument, other renewable energy sources do not have planning implications, which is why they are not covered by TAN 8. Therefore, this suggests a severe lack of joined-up thinking.

I turn to the section on householders. I recently spent a day with the Energy Saving Trust. Via a questionnaire, the trust asked people what they knew about the energy saving value of their homes. The responses displayed a disturbing lack of knowledge and understanding among householders. The very least that I had hoped to see in this document was a commitment to undertake a major public information campaign. Do Members remember the ELWa campaign, which used a giant jigsaw? Perhaps some Members want to forget that campaign. However, that is the kind of major television advertising campaign that we need, but the document does not commit to this. As amendment 3 suggests, we need a one-stop shop approach to tackle the situation.

The document only deals with energy in its narrowest sense. A link needs to be made with the other causes of climate change such as transport. Overall, this is a useful pamphlet, not an energy saving action plan. As a selection of handy hints, it is perfectly reasonable. I would have given it the title 'Handy Tips from your Friend Andrew Davies'. Do Members remember that a Government Minister—I do not recall which one—suggested during the three-day week that we could save energy by sharing baths? This document takes us along those lines. It is not a strategy. There is no vision, no timescale, no targets and no costings. As

dros ddatblygu economaidd yn siarad â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, oherwydd dogfen gynllunio yw nodyn cyngor technegol 8? Pan drafodasom dechnolegau ynni meicroadnewyddadwy, dywedodd y Llywodraeth wrthym nad oedd a wnelo hynny â nodyn cyngor technegol 8 gan fod y ddogfen honno'n ymdrin â materion cynllunio a ffermydd gwynt, a dywedodd nad oedd y ffaith ei fod heb ei gynnwys yn nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn golygu nad oedd o blaid meicrogynhyrchu ond nad oedd yn briodol ei gynnwys. Yn ôl y ddadl honno, nid oes goblygiadau o ran cynllunio i ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy eraill, a dyna pam nad ymdrinnir â hwy yn nodyn cyngor technegol 8. Felly, mae hynny'n awgrymu bod diffyg difrifol o ran meddwl cydgysylltiedig.

Trof at yr adran ar ddeiliaid tai. Treuliais ddiwrnod yn ddiweddar gyda'r Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni. Drwy holiadur, gofynnodd yr ymddiriedolaeth i bobl beth a wyddent am werth arbed ynni eu cartrefi. Yr oedd yr ymatebion yn amlygu diffyg gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth ymysg deiliaid tai a oedd yn peri pryder. Y lleiaf yr oeddwn wedi gobeithio'i weld yn y ddogfen hon oedd ymrwymiad i gynnal ymgyrch wybodaeth gyhoeddus helaeth. A yw Aelodau'n cofio ymgyrch ELWa, a ddefnyddiai lun jig-so anferth? Efallai fod rhai Aelodau'n dymuno anghofio'r ymgyrch honno. Er hynny, dyna'r math o ymgyrch hysbysebu fawr ar y teledu y mae arnom ei hangen, ond nid oes ymrwymiad i hynny yn y ddogfen. Fel y mae gwelliant 3 yn awgrymu, rhaid delio â'r sefyllfa hon drwy gael siop un stop.

Nid yw'r ddogfen ond yn ymdrin ag ynni yn ei ystyr fwyaf cyfyng. Rhaid creu cysylltiad ag achosion eraill y newid yn yr hinsawdd fel trafndiaeth. At ei gilydd, taflen ddefnyddiol yw hon, nid cynllun gweithredu ar arbed ynni. Fel detholiad o gynghorion buddiol, mae'n berffaith resymol. Rhoeswn iddo'r teitl 'Cynghorion Buddiol gan eich Cyfaill Andrew Davies'. A yw Aelodau'n cofio bod Gweinidog yn y Llywodraeth—ni chofiaf ba un—wedi awgrymu yn ystod yr wythnos dri diwrnod y galleu arbed ynni drwy fynd i'r bath gyda'n gilydd? Mae'r ddogfen hon yn cynnig pethau tebyg. Nid strategaeth ydyw. Nid oes ynddi na gweledigaeth, nac amserlen,

welcome as the Minister's statement about the Carbon Trust may be, it should have been included in the document and not made as an announcement in the Chamber today. There is no financial commitment for the future, no big ideas and no ambition. The elephant has laboured and brought forth a mouse.

Val Lloyd: It is easy for me or other Members to say, but what is needed is a culture shift, so that ways of saving energy become part of everyday life, in every sphere of life. Recycling has become embedded into our daily routine, and we must seek to replicate this in terms of the need to save energy. At present, saving energy is probably not top of a family's daily agenda and might be considered only after the shopping has been bought and the dog fed. As always, the best way to activate a culture change is through widespread information and education. A vital part of the plan, which I am pleased to see being addressed at this early stage, is the question of how to educate young people, within the school curriculum, about the benefits of saving energy.

Brynle referred to Gwauncaegurwen primary school, but his geography was slightly off target. I was encouraged to read about the action of the school, which is in the Neath constituency of my colleague, Gwenda Thomas, not in Pembrokeshire. The school has encouraged its young people to recognise, and act on, the problem. The project, which shows how photovoltaics can provide clean, renewable energy, has given the children first-hand experience and involved them at a practical level.

4.40 p.m.

Several schools in my constituency of Swansea East are eco-schools. This excellent scheme builds environmental awareness and related topics into the school curriculum and involves the whole school in developing environmentally friendly practices. Cwmrhydyceirw is such an eco-school and one of its current projects is aimed at saving energy. The children have developed a pupil

na thargedau, na phrasiadau. Er cymaint y mae datganiad y Gweinidog am yr Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon i'w groesawu, dylid bod wedi'i gynnwys yn y ddogfen yn hytrach na'i roi fel cyhoeddiad yn y Siambr heddiw. Nid oes unrhyw ymrwymiad ariannol ar gyfer y dyfodol, nac unrhyw syniadau mawr nac unrhyw uchelgais. Mae'r eliffant wedi llafurio ac wedi esgor ar lygoden.

Val Lloyd: Peth hawdd i mi neu Aelodau eraill yw dweud hyn, ond yr hyn y mae ei angen yw newid mewn arferion, fel bod dulliau o arbed ynni'n dod yn rhan o fywyd pob dydd, ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd. Mae ailgylchu wedi dod yn un o'n gorchwylion beunyddiol, a rhaid inni geisio ailadrodd hynny yng nghyd-destun yr angen i arbed ynni. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n debyg nad yw arbed ynni ar ben rhestr waith feunyddiol y teulu ac mae'n rhywbeth a ystyrid efallai ar ôl siopa a bwydo'r ci. Fel y bu erioed, y modd gorau i beri newid mewn arferion yw drwy ledaenu gwybodaeth ac addysg. Un rhan annatod o'r cynllun, yr wyf yn falch o weld ei bod yn cael ei thrafod ar y dechrau fel hyn, yw'r cwestiwn ynghylch y modd i addysgu pobl ifanc, o fewn y cwricwlwm ysgol, am y buddion a geir o arbed ynni.

Cyfeiriodd Brynle at ysgol gynradd Gwauncaegurwen, ond yr oedd yn methu braidd o ran ei wybodaeth ddaearyddol. Fe'm calonogwyd o ddarlenn am y camau a gymerodd yr ysgol, sydd yn etholaeth fy nghyd-Aelod Gwenda Thomas, sef Castell-nedd, yn hytrach na sir Benfro. Mae'r ysgol wedi annog ei phobl ifanc i gydnabod y broblem, a chymryd camau yn ei chylch. Mae'r prosiect, sy'n dangos sut y gall offer ffotofoltäig roi ynni glân, adnewyddadwy, wedi cynnig profiad uniongyrchol i'r plant ac wedi'u cynnwys ar lefel ymarferol.

Mae sawl ysgol yn fy etholaeth i, sef Dwyrain Abertawe, yn eco-ysgol. Mae'r cynllun rhagorol hwn yn corffori ymwybyddiaeth o'r amgylchedd a phynciau cysylltiedig yn y cwricwlwm ysgol ac yn cynnwys yr ysgol gyfan yn y gwaith o ddatblygu arferion sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd. Mae ysgol Cwmrhydyceirw yn un ysgol o'r fath ac amcan un o'i phrosiectau

patrol of classrooms to ensure that lights are switched off during break times, and energy and money saved. This may be a small initiative, but many things grow from small initiatives. The scheme is important, as it not only leads to tangible benefits for the school, but it teaches the children about why energy saving is important in a wider sense. By integrating policy objectives into education, long-term benefits are achieved.

This particular project also encourages involvement at all levels within schools and I congratulate the school governors who, following the example set by pupils, have now established their own eco-committee, which evolved, I think, from the naming and shaming of those leaving lights switched on.

Building on work within schools means that it is now possible to tap into other valuable resources such as youth councils and youth environmental groups. The information guides that have already been produced by the Assembly for schools and youth groups will be valuable tools for learning.

This action plan recognises that we have an opportunity to engage young people in the challenge to create more sustainable ways of saving energy. It is pleasing to note that action at national level is being replicated in constituencies throughout Wales, and I hope that the success of the eco-school project is now mirrored on other levels.

Janet Davies: From my memory, there have been 30 years of talking and writing about energy saving, efficiency and conservation. After 30 years, this document does not make a lot of progress on what has been said and written about for so long. It is difficult to see that this is being taken seriously as a priority. There are examples of good practice in the document and it is good to see these examples. However, there are other examples to take from the document, for instance, that

presennol yw arbed ynni. Mae'r plant wedi datblygu patrôl gan ddisgyblion o gwmpas yr ystafelloedd dosbarth i sicrhau y caiff goleuadau eu diffodd yn ystod yr amser chwarae, ac yr arbedir ynni ac arian. Er mai menter fach yw hon, mae llawer o bethau'n datblygu o fentrau o'r fath. Mae'r cynllun yn un pwysig, oherwydd yn ogystal â dod â manteision pendant i'r ysgol, mae'n dysgu'r plant am bwysigrwydd arbed ynni'n gyffredinol. Drwy integreiddio amcanion polisi mewn addysg, sicrheir buddion tymor hir.

Mae'r prosiect hwn hefyd yn annog rhai i gymryd rhan ar bob lefel yn yr ysgol, a llongyfarchaf lywodraethwyr yr ysgol sydd wedi dilyn esiampl y disgyblion ac wedi sefydlu eu pwyllgor ecolegol eu hunain bellach, a hynny o ganlyniad, yr wyf yn credu, i enwi a chywilyddio'r rhai a oedd yn gadael goleuadau ymlaen.

Drwy fanteisio ar y gwaith a wneir mewn ysgolion, mae bellach yn bosibl gwneud defnydd o adnoddau gwerthfawr eraill fel cynghorau ieuencid a grwpiau amgylcheddol pobl ifanc. Bydd y canllawiau gwybodaeth a gynhyrchwyd eisoes gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer ysgolion a grwpiau ieuencid yn arf gwerthfawr ar gyfer dysgu.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn yn cydnabod bod gennym gyfle i beri i bobl ifanc ymateb i'r her i greu dulliau mwy cynaliadwy o arbed ynni. Braf yw nodi bod camau a gymerir ar lefel genedlaethol yn cael eu haildrodd mewn etholaethau ledled Cymru, a gobeithiaf fod llwyddiant y prosiect eco-ysgolion yn cael ei adlewyrchu ar lefelau eraill yn awr.

Janet Davies: Hyd y cofiaf, bu 30 mlynedd o sôn ac ysgrifennu am arbed ynni, effeithlonrwydd a chadwraeth. Ar ôl 30 mlynedd, nid yw'r ddogfen hon yn gwneud llawer o gynnydd ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd ac a ysgrifennwyd dros gyfnod mor hir. Anodd yw credu bod hyn yn cael ei gymryd o ddifrif fel blaenoriaeth. Mae enghreifftiau o arferion da yn y ddogfen a da yw gweld yr enghreifftiau hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae enghreifftiau eraill y gellir eu cymryd o'r ddogfen, er enghraifft, mai

'Housing accounts for about 63% of energy

'Mae tai yn cyfrif am tua 63% o'r ynni a

consumed by buildings’.

It is possible, through building regulations, to address that for new buildings: it is possible for developers to install district heating systems and combined heat and power systems. However, most of our houses are existing ones. While the one-stop shop is welcome, it is difficult not only to obtain information about how to improve energy efficiency, but to find tradesmen able to do the work. If any Member has made inquiries about having a photovoltaic roof installed, you will know what I mean. It is not just the enormous cost of installing it, which is not feasible, it is also impossible to find anyone who will do it at a domestic level rather than, say, at a school level.

In terms of conservation, energy efficiency savings are important. However, there is no increase in that budget line whatsoever for next year or the following year. In real terms, this means a drop in the budget. With fuel costs increasing, more and more people will face fuel poverty.

Secondly, the document states that 70 per cent of the Assembly electricity is ‘green electricity’. I would like to know what this means. Perhaps the Minister will be able to explain. Is it a nominal greenness, or do we buy electricity that we know has been produced by green means? This needs some scrutiny.

The document refers to the various forms of renewable energy. I would like to know much a single form of renewable energy would produce, for example, tidal lagoons or biomass. We have had problems in the past in obtaining planning permission for biomass. In respect of nuclear energy, is it true that with a nuclear power plant, the application could go to the Department of Trade and Industry and neither the Assembly Government nor any Assembly Member would have a say in that matter? If that is the case, the commitment given to not having nuclear energy is rather disingenuous.

Many have talked about saving energy in

ddefnyddir gan adeiladau’.

Gellir ymdrin â hynny, drwy reoliadau adeiladu, yn achos adeiladau newydd: gall datblygwyr osod systemau gwresogi ardal a systemau gwres ac ynni cyfunol. Fodd bynnag, mae’r rhan fwyaf o’n tai’n sefyll yn barod. Er bod y siop un stop i’w chroesawu, mae nid yn unig yn anodd cael gwybodaeth am y modd i arbed mwy o ynni, ond yn anodd hefyd ddod o hyd i grefftwyr sy’n gallu gwneud y gwaith. Os oes unrhyw Aelod a wnaeth ymholiadau ynghylch gosod to ffotofoltäig, gŵyr am beth yr wyf yn sôn. Nid yn unig y mae’r gost o’i osod yn enfawr ac yn annichonol, ond mae hefyd yn amhosibl dod o hyd i rywun a wnaiff hynny mewn tŷ yn hytrach nag mewn ysgol, er enghraifft.

Yng nghyd-destun cadwraeth, mae arbedion drwy effeithlonrwydd ynni’n bwysig. Er hynny, nid oes unrhyw gynnydd o gwbl yn y llinell gyllideb honno ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf neu’r un wedyn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae hyn yn golygu bod y gyllideb yn mynd yn llai. Gan fod costau tanwydd ar gynnydd, bydd mwy a mwy o bobl yn wynebu tloedi tanwydd.

Yn ail, mae’r ddogfen yn datgan bod 70 y cant o drydan y Cynulliad yn ‘drydan gwyrdd’. Carwn gael gwybod beth y mae hynny’n ei olygu. Efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu egluro. A yw’n wyrdd mewn enw, neu a ydym yn prynu trydan y gwyddom ei fod wedi’i gynhyrchu drwy ddulliau gwyrdd? Mae angen craffu ar hynny.

Mae’r ddogfen yn cyfeirio at y gwahanol fathau o ynni adnewyddadwy. Carwn wybod pa faint o ynni a geir o fathau penodol o ddulliau cynhyrchu adnewyddadwy, er enghraifft, morlynnoedd llanwol neu fiomàs. Cawsom broblemau yn y gorffennol wrth gael caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer biomàs. Gyda golwg ar ynni niwclear, a yw’n wir, yn achos gorsaf drydan niwclear, y gallai’r cais fynd at yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ac na châi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad neu unrhyw Aelod o’r Cynulliad lais yn y mater hwnnw? Os felly y mae, mae’r ymrwymiad a roddwyd i beidio â chael ynni niwclear braidd yn anniffuant.

Mae llawer wedi sôn am arbed ynni drwy

simple ways. How do you do that? You must get people to take responsibility for switching off lights, or their television when they go to bed. The Assembly Government's policies should be bent towards helping people understand that they must take responsibility for their own lives, and must not rely on others.

I am disappointed in this report. I hope the Assembly Government is not back-tracking on this issue, but I am afraid that it is.

Sandy Mewies: I am delighted to welcome this energy efficiency action plan, which clearly spells out why we need to become more energy efficient, and ways in which we can achieve this. It will require every one of us, acting as individuals and with our organisations, to achieve these ambitions for Wales. Little things will be done on an individual level and if we do not do them, there is not a lot of point in doing the big things.

The action plan usefully illustrates how we can be energy efficient by just switching off lights or not leaving equipment on standby. I hope that everyone in the Assembly will support the great turn-off, organised by the Energy Saving Trust, between 25 and 31 October. On Friday, 29 October, between 2 p.m. and 3 p.m., we are asked to turn off any unnecessary appliances.

Janet Davies: How will we turn off the lights in the Assembly when the switches have been removed?

Sandy Mewies: I said that I hoped that everyone in the Assembly will do so, but perhaps you did not hear me.

This action plan also draws our attention to organisations which are supported by the Welsh Assembly Government, such as the EAGA partnership, which manages the home energy efficiency scheme. This organisation provides valuable information in our communities, as do many others like it. The depth of interest is there in our communities, and this was brought home to me recently

ddulliau syml. Sut y gwneir hynny? Rhaid peri i bobl dderbyn cyfrifoldeb dros ddiffodd goleuadau neu eu set deledu pan ânt i'r gwely. Dylid cyfeirio polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fel eu bod yn helpu pobl i ddeall bod rhaid iddynt ymgymryd â chyfrifoldeb dros eu bywydau eu hunain, ac na ddylent ddibynnu ar eraill.

Yr wyf wedi siomi yn yr adroddiad hwn. Gobeithiaf nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn troi ei chefn ar y mater hwn, ond mae arnaf ofn ei bod.

Sandy Mewies: Yr wyf yn falch iawn o groesawu'r cynllun gweithredu effeithlonrwydd ynni hwn, sy'n datgan yn glir pam y mae'n rhaid inni ddod yn fwy ynni-effeithlon, a'r modd y gallwn wneud hynny. Bydd angen i bob un ohonom, gan weithredu fel unigolion a chyda'r cyrff y perthynwn iddynt, gymryd camau i gyflawni'r uchelgeisiau hyn er mwyn Cymru. Gwneir pethau bach ar lefel yr unigolyn ac os na wneir hynny, nid oes fawr o ddiben gwneud y pethau mawr.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n dangos yn fuddiol sut y gallwn fod yn effeithlon o ran ynni dim ond drwy ddiffodd goleuadau neu beidio â gadael offer yn barod i weithio. Gobeithiaf y bydd pawb yn y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r diffodd mawr, a drefnir gan yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni, rhwng 25 a 31 Hydref. Ar ddydd Gwener, 29 Hydref, rhwng 2 p.m. a 3 p.m., gofynnir inni ddiffodd unrhyw offer nad oes eu hangen.

Janet Davies: Sut y diffoddwn y goleuadau yn y Cynulliad, a'r switsis wedi'u tynnu?

Sandy Mewies: Dywedais fy mod yn gobeithio y bydd pawb yn y Cynulliad yn gwneud hynny, ond efallai na chlywsoch fi.

Mae'r cynllun gweithredu hwn yn tynnu ein sylw hefyd at gyrff a gefnogir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel partneriaeth EAGA, sy'n rheoli'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Mae'r corff hwn yn darparu gwybodaeth werthfawr yn ein cymunedau, fel y gwnaiff llawer un arall tebyg iddo. Mae digon o ddiddordeb yn ein cymunedau, a sylweddolais hynny'n

when, together with my colleague David Hanson MP, I hosted the first ever energy awareness event in Wales. Expertise was provided by the EAGA partnership and organisations and individuals from across Flintshire came to Flint Pavilion to hear how grants for heating and improved insulation can be accessed. Those individuals took the information to the public and their own organisations.

In Flintshire, in my own constituency of Delyn, work worth nearly £200,000 was completed in the 12 months up to March this year. Two hundred and nine households were improved with work which ranged from central heating to little things like the installation of efficient light bulbs. Flintshire County Council has an energy conservation officer who was also present at the event. The officer pointed out that Flintshire County Council has undertaken a general efficiency survey covering about 8,000 council properties. As well as identifying the energy efficiency needs of homes, the survey looked at benefit receipt and will help identify whether work on a property qualifies for grant assistance. Ninety five per cent of homes requiring installations should have them by December. In 1997, 4,500 tenants were classed as fuel poor, but that figure has fallen to 1,000. It is an achievement, but there is a long way to go because we need to reduce that figure to zero. A key challenge will be to encourage registered social landlords to take similar action.

Work is being undertaken, and this action plan will underpin it, together with the strategy plan which is also being prepared. The action plan identifies other areas such as planning, building design and micro-generation, but detailed information can be gathered by those who need it. The target audience must be considered—a too detailed document with technical data would not be of interest to most people. In the conference that I arranged, people were interested, but wanted simple explanations. This plan is only part of a process which will continue in order for us to reach our targets. Minister, how will

ddiweddar pan lywyddais, gyda fy nghyd-aelod David Hanson AS, yn y digwyddiad cyntaf erioed i hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth o ynni yng Nghymru. Rhoddwyd gwybodaeth arbenigol gan bartneriaeth EAGA a daeth cyrff ac unigolion o bob rhan o sir y Fflint i Bafiliwn y Fflint i glywed sut y gellir cael grantiau ar gyfer gwresogi a gwell insiwleiddio. Aeth yr unigolion hynny â'r wybodaeth at y cyhoedd ac at eu cyrff eu hunain.

Yn sir y Fflint, yn fy etholaeth i, sef Delyn, cwblhawyd gwerth bron £200,000 o waith yn y 12 mis hyd at fis Mawrth eleni. Cafwyd gwelliannau i 209 o gartrefi a oedd yn amrywio o wresogi canolog i bethau bach fel gosod bylbiau golau effeithlon. Mae swyddog arbed ynni gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint a bu yntau'n bresennol yn y digwyddiad. Nododd y swyddog fod Cyngor Sir y Fflint wedi gwneud arolwg cyffredinol o effeithlonrwydd a oedd yn cynnwys tua 8,000 o dai cyngor. Yn ogystal â chanfod yr anghenion mewn cartrefi o ran effeithlonrwydd ynni, bu'r arolwg yn ystyried y budd-daliadau a dderbynnid a bydd o gymorth i weld a yw gwaith ar adeiladau'n gymwys ar gyfer cymorth grant. Mae'n debyg y bydd y gosodiadau yn 95 y cant o'r tai lle'r oedd eu hangen yn cael eu cwblhau erbyn mis Rhagfyr. Yn 1997, dynodwyd 4,500 o denantiaid yn rhai a oedd mewn tlodi tanwydd, ond mae'r ffigur hwnnw wedi gostwng i 1,000. Mae'n gyflawniad mawr, ond mae llawer iawn i'w wneud eto gan fod rhaid inni ddileu'r nifer hwnnw'n llwyr. Un her allweddol fydd annog landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig i gymryd camau tebyg.

Mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo, a bydd y cynllun gweithredu hwn yn ei ategu, fel y bydd y strategaeth sy'n cael ei pharatoi. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu'n nodi meysydd eraill fel cynllunio, dylunio adeiladau a meicrogynhyrchu, ond gall y rhai y mae arnynt angen gwybodaeth fanwl fynd ati i'w chasglu. Rhaid ystyried y gynulleidfa sydd dan sylw—ni fyddai dogfen orfanwl ac ynddi ddata technegol yn ennyn diddordeb yn y rhan fwyaf o bobl. Yn y gynhadledd a drefnais, yr oedd pobl yn ymddiddori yn hyn, ond yr oeddent am gael esboniadau syml. Nid yw'r cynllun hwn ond yn un rhan o broses a

evaluation and monitoring take place?

fydd yn parhau fel y gallwn gyrraedd ein targedau. Weinidog, sut y gwneir y gwerthuso a'r monitro?

4.50 p.m.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: I have listened to this afternoon's debate with great interest. I was particularly interested in Brynle's contribution. He named the wrong school, but there is a school in Preseli Pembrokeshire—Ysgol Preseli—which is investing in woodchip burning that will not only provide fuel for the school, but also for the community of Crymych. Therefore, significant projects are being undertaken in Pembrokeshire.

Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey: Yr wyf wedi gwranddo gyda diddordeb mawr ar y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Ymddiddorais yn benodol yng nghyfraniad Brynle. Enwodd yr ysgol anghywir, ond mae ysgol ym Mhreseli Sir Benfro—Ysgol Preseli—sy'n buddsoddi mewn offer llosgi asglodion coed a fydd nid yn unig yn darparu tanwydd ar gyfer yr ysgol, ond ar gyfer cymuned Crymych hefyd. Felly, ceir prosiectau pwysig yn sir Benfro.

We have heard that energy efficiency must be led by the public sector, by example or by the individual, but in fact, it should be led by all of us at all levels. Until we ensure that all levels of people across the board continue to carry out the action that they have undertaken so far, we must continue to publicise that. The new Assembly building has been mentioned on many occasions.

Clywsom fod rhaid i effeithlonrwydd ynni gael ei arwain gan y sector cyhoeddus, drwy esiampl neu gan yr unigolyn, ond mewn gwirionedd, dylai gael ei arwain gan bob un ohonom ar bob lefel. Hyd nes y sicrhawn y bydd pawb ar bob lefel yn dal i gymryd y camau a gymerasant hyd yma, bydd yn rhaid inni barhau i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i hynny. Soniwyd am adeilad newydd y Cynulliad ar sawl achlysur.

In Pembrokeshire, there are numerous examples of energy efficiency, one of which is Withybush Hospital. It has a combined heat and power generator, which has saved the hospital £23,000 in the first year. That is a public sector building, which has saved £23,000 of public sector funding, but energy efficiency measures can also represent a significant saving for industry. A prime example would be St David's Assemblies, which is quoted in the action plan, and is also in my constituency. Every part of that company's manufacturing and spare capacity is reused in one form or another and it has been awarded Green Dragon status as a result.

Yn sir Benfro, ceir sawl enghraifft o effeithlonrwydd ynni, ac un ohonynt yw Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Mae yno eneradur gwres ac ynni cyfunol, sydd wedi arbed £23,000 i'r ysbyty yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Adeilad sector cyhoeddus yw hwnnw, sydd wedi arbed £23,000 o arian y sector cyhoeddus, ond mae mesurau arbed ynni'n gallu sicrhau arbedion sylweddol i ddiwydiant hefyd. Un enghraifft ragorol yw St David's Assemblies, y cyfeirir ato yn y cynllun gweithredu, ac mae ef hefyd yn fy etholaeth. Ailddefnyddir pob rhan o gapasiti gweithgynhyrchu a chapasiti rhydd y cwmni hwnnw ar ryw ffurf neu'i gilydd a dyfarnwyd statws y Ddraig Werdd iddo o ganlyniad.

Pembrokeshire is outstanding. The West Wales Eco Centre has been in place for many years. It was innovative when it was first established and is now well-known in the county. It is used as a base by other organisations, such as Energy Saving Trust. The eco centre has already provided a one-stop shop and we must congratulate the Minister on creating a portal for other people

Mae sir Benfro yn eithriadol. Bu Eco-ganolfan Gorllwin Cymru ar waith ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Yr oedd yn fenter arloesol pan sefydlwyd hi ac mae bellach yn adnabyddus yn y sir. Fe'i defnyddir fel canolfan gan gyrff eraill, fel yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni. Mae'r eco-ganolfan eisoes wedi darparu siop un stop a dylem longyfarch y Gweinidog ar greu porth

to access that type of information, if they are not in as fortunate a position as we are in Pembrokeshire. If you can contact one place for information, you can seek to change your home environment as well as the wider environment in which you live. I was surprised that Brynle, who sits on the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee with me, complained about the planning process, but did not, presumably, include any renewable energy schemes in his own personal plan, which he could have done, in terms of his own building.

On the home energy efficiency and the home energy efficiency plus schemes, I ask the Minister to consider extending HEES plus, although this may well be a responsibility for the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration. A particular problem in Pembrokeshire are the old buildings with solid walls—installing cavity insulation is impossible and installing loft insulation is also difficult. The only option is to improve a gas or oil-fired heating system. However, that is more expensive than the £2,700 threshold for HEES plus or the £1,700 threshold for HEES. In Pembrokeshire, heating will probably not be through gas, because it is not one of the mains supplies in most of the area, but with liquefied natural gas, tidal power, the eco centre, the concentration on the environmentally friendly heating systems that we have in public sector buildings and with the energy technium, that is planned for Pembrokeshire, we are leading the way in terms of all forms of energy, and that must be congratulated. I congratulate not only the individuals in those organisations, but private individuals. For example, if you travel through the Gwaun valley, you will see a house with its own windmill, such is the dedication of the people of Pembrokeshire, for which they should be congratulated.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): It has been an interesting debate. As a point of clarification, many of the measures to which I referred in my opening speech, such as the home energy efficiency scheme and the

i'r rhyngwyd fel y gall pobl eraill gael gwybodaeth o'r fath, os nad ydynt mor ffodus ag yr ydym ni yn sir Benfro. Os gallwch gysylltu ag un man i gael gwybodaeth, gallwch newid amgylchedd eich cartref yn ogystal â'r amgylchedd ehangach lle'r ydych yn byw. Yr oeddwn yn synnu bod Brynle, sy'n eistedd gyda mi ar Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, wedi cwyno am y broses cynllunio, ond nad oedd, gellir cymryd, wedi cynnwys unrhyw gynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy yn ei gynllun ef, gan y gallai fod wedi gwneud hynny yn ei adeilad ei hun.

Ynghylch y cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref ac effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref a mwy, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried ehangu'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref a mwy, er ei bod yn ddigon posibl mai cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yw hyn. Un broblem benodol a geir yn sir Benfro yw'r hen adeiladau sydd â waliau solet—nid oes ceudod yn y waliau hynny y gellir ei insiwleiddio ac mae hefyd yn anodd insiwleiddio croglofftydd. Yr unig ddewis yw gwella'r system gwresogi â nwy neu olew. Fodd bynnag, mae'r gost o wneud hynny'n uwch na'r trothwy o £2,700 ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref a mwy neu'r trothwy o £1,700 ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Yn sir Benfro, nid oes tebygrwydd y defnyddir nwy i wresogi, gan nad oes prif gyflenwadau ohono yn y rhan fwyaf o'r ardal, ond gyda nwy naturiol hylifedig, ynni'r llanw, yr eco-ganolfan, y pwyslais ar systemau gwresogi sy'n ystyriol o'r amgylchedd yn adeiladau'r sector cyhoeddus a'r technium ynni arfaethedig ar gyfer sir Benfro, yr ydym yn arwain y ffordd ar bob math o ynni, a rhaid canmol hynny. Llongyfarchaf yr unigolion yn y cyrff hynny, ac unigolion preifat hefyd. Er enghraifft, os ewch drwy gwm Gwaun, gwelwch dŷ â'i felin wynt ei hun, gymaint yw ymroddiad pobl sir Benfro, a dylid eu llongyfarch ar hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Bu'n ddadl ddiddorol. Er mwyn cynnig eglurhad, mae llawer o'r mesurau y cyfeiriais atynt yn fy araith agoriadol, fel y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref a'r cynllun

sustainable development action plan, are the responsibility of my fellow Ministers. As I have already indicated, there is considerable progress in many other portfolios on our energy-efficiency aspirations. I reiterate that energy efficiency is a key strand of our energy policy, which is not to be implemented in isolation, but with other measures that we are introducing, particularly in terms of our commitment to renewable energy production. The route map, to which I referred earlier, will be issued for consultation, to take account of the larger energy agenda and some of the issues that have been raised today will be contained in that consultation document.

Partnership is key to successfully tackling the crucial issue of energy efficiency. As I have already mentioned, the work of Carbon Trust Wales, the Energy Saving Trust and many others, is welcome. The glossary, to which Mick Bates referred, lists most of the organisations that are involved in this initiative. Many of them are not Assembly Government bodies or Assembly sponsored public bodies. They are either charitable organisations, private sector or not-for-profit organisations, and, therefore, we do not have any direct control over their activities. However, I have already indicated the work of Carbon Trust Wales, and in terms of our commitment to energy efficiency, a 56 per cent increase in its funding signals our commitment to energy efficiency.

Mick Bates: On advice, I accept that many of those organisations are charitable organisations and are unconnected to Government. However, they spend much of their precious resources advertising themselves. Would it not be better if that pressure was alleviated by including all of those bodies in a free telephone line, which could then direct people to the relevant organisations, rather than every body listed in the glossary competing for their little bit of space? Let us direct people all through one portal, both telephone and internet, because not all households have internet facilities, and not everybody will be motivated to use it to look for their energy advice.

gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, yn gyfrifoldeb i'm cyd-Weinidogion. Fel yr wyf wedi nodi eisoes, gwneir cryn gynnydd mewn sawl portffolio arall ar ein dyheadau mewn cysylltiad ag effeithlonrwydd ynni. Ailddatganaf fod effeithlonrwydd ynni'n elfen allweddol yn ein polisi ynni, nas gweithredir ar wahân, ond ar y cyd â mesurau eraill a gyflwynwn, yn enwedig yng nghydestun ein hymrwymiad i gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Bydd y map ffyrdd, y cyfeiriais ato'n gynharach, yn cael ei gyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghori, er mwyn ystyried yr agenda ehangach ar ynni a bydd rhai o'r materion a godwyd heddiw wedi'u cynnwys yn y ddogfen ymgynghorol honno.

Rhaid wrth bartneriaeth i ymdrin yn llwyddiannus â mater hollbwysig effeithlonrwydd ynni. Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae gwaith Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon Cymru, yr Ymddiriedolaeth Arbed Ynni a sawl un arall, i'w groesawu. Yn y rhestr, y cyfeiriodd Mick Bates ati, nodir y rhan fwyaf o'r cyrff sy'n gysylltiedig â'r fenter hon. Mae llawer ohonynt nad ydynt yn gyrff sydd o dan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad neu'n gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Maent un ai'n gyrff elusennol, yn gyrff sector preifat neu'n gyrff di-elw, ac, felly, nid oes gennym unrhyw reolaeth uniongyrchol dros eu gweithgareddau. Er hynny, yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at waith Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon Cymru, ac o ran ein hymrwymiad i effeithlonrwydd ynni, mae'r cynnydd o 56 y cant yn y cyllid ar ei chyfer yn brawf o'n hymrwymiad i effeithlonrwydd ynni.

Mick Bates: Ynghylch cynghori, derbynïaf mai cyrff elusennol yw llawer ohonynt ac nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â Llywodraeth. Er hynny, gwariant lawer o'u harian prin yn eu hysbysebu eu hunain. Oni fyddai'n well lleihau'r baich drwy gynnwys yr holl gyrff hynny mewn llinell deffon am ddim, a allai gyfeirio pobl wedyn at y corff perthnasol, yn hytrach na bod pob corff a nodir yn y rhestr yn cystadlu am ychydig o le? Gadewch inni gyfeirio pawb drwy un porth, dros y teleffon a thrwy'r rhyngwrwyd, oherwydd nid yw pob teulu'n meddu ar gyfleusterau ar gyfer y rhyngwrwyd, ac ni fydd pawb yn teimlo cymhelliad i'w ddefnyddio i chwilio am yngor ar ynni.

Andrew Davies: As I said in my opening address, this is about simplification, not duplication. The establishment of an energy saving portal will go a long way towards providing greater simplification of the system. However, if there is scope for providing a more focused system and service, we will consider that.

Several Members made the point that we are talking about cultural change and a change in individuals and organisations' behaviour. The document highlights some tangible and meaningful ways in which we can embed and mainstream energy efficiency in everything that we do. If we successfully pursue energy efficiency, large and small scale, we can make significant strides in reducing our carbon dioxide emissions in Wales. This is the first step in a continuing process, as several Members have already said, and it still early days. However, it is an important step that will take us well down the path to ensuring the step changes that are needed in order to address the issues of climate change. It is important that we continue to address energy efficiency across all sectors, whether in the private, domestic or the public sector, and we are committed to doing that. I thank all Members for their contributions, and if I have been unable to respond to individual points, I will do so in writing.

Glyn Davies: During my speech, I made a clear reference to onshore windfarms. While I do not have a direct interest with regard to the motion or amendments, I have a potential family interest in onshore windfarms, and it is best therefore that I declare an interest.

Andrew Davies: Fel y dywedais yn fy anerchiad agoriadol, mae hyn yn ymwneud â symleiddio yn hytrach na dyblygu. Bydd sefydlu porth i'r rhyngwyd ar arbed ynni yn cyfrannu'n helaeth at symleiddio'r system ymhellach. Er hynny, os oes lle i ddarparu system a gwasanaeth mwy penodol, ystyriwn hynny.

Mae sawl Aelod wedi nodi ein bod yn sôn am newid mewn arferion a newid yn ymddygiad unigolion a chyrrff. Mae'r ddogfen yn tynnu sylw at rai dulliau pendant ac ystyrion o gynnwys ac ymgorffori effeithlonrwydd ynni ym mhopeth a wnawn. Os llwyddwn i hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd ynni, ar raddfa fach a mawr, gallwn gymryd camau bras i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Dyma'r cam cyntaf mewn proses barhaus, fel y mae sawl Aelod wedi dweud eisoes, ac nid yw hyn ond megis dechrau. Er hynny, mae'n gam pwysig a aiff â ni ymhell ar y ffordd i sicrhau'r newidiadau sylweddol y mae eu hangen i ymdrin â'r materion sy'n ymwneud â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n bwysig inni barhau i ymdrin ag effeithlonrwydd ynni ym mhob sector, yr un preifat, yr un domestig a'r un cyhoeddus, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wneud hynny. Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau, ac os na fu modd imi ymateb i bwyntiau penodol, gwnaf hynny mewn llythyr.

Glyn Davies: Yn ystod fy araith, cyfeiriais yn benodol at ffermydd gwynt ar y tir. Er nad oes gennyf fuddiant uniongyrchol mewn cysylltiad â'r cynnig neu'r gwelliannau, mae'n bosibl y bydd gan fy nheulu fuddiant mewn ffermydd gwynt ar y tir, a'r peth gorau, felly, yw imi ddatgan buddiant.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
Amendment 1: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.
 Amendment 2: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 45.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Francis, Lisa
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

5.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 16, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 3: For 16, Abstain 9, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.
Amendment 4: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40.
Amendment 5: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 40.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, David
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
 Amendment 6: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, David
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Law, Peter
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri

Wood, Leanne

Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2132): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 11.
Motion (NDM2132): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Helen Mary Jones: Point of order. During the vote on amendment 6, I am afraid that I may have inadvertently voted on the motion while I was still supposed to be voting on the amendments. I apologise.

Helen Mary Jones: Pwynt o drefn. Yn ystod y bleidlais ar welliant 6, mae arnaf ofn y gallwn fod wedi pleidleisio ar y cynnig drwy amryfusedd tra oeddwn yn dal i fod i bleidleisio ar y gwelliannau. Ymddiheuraf am hynny.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Your comments will stand on the record.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Bydd eich sylwadau wedi'u cofnodi.

That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.03 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.03 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)