



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mercher, 17 Tachwedd 2004**

**Wednesday, 17 November 2004**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid<br>Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister                   |
| 18  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes<br>Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning       |
| 31  | Cwestiwn Brys<br>Urgent Question  |
| 35  | Pwynt o Drefn<br>Point of Order   |
| 35  | Cynllun Gofodol Cymru<br>The Wales Spatial Plan   |
| 67  | Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru<br>The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales                    |
| 86  | Cynnig Trefniadol<br>Procedural Motion  |
| 88  | Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru: Parhad<br>The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales: Continued |
| 104 | Dadl Fer: Lefelau'r Dreth Gyngor yng Nghaerdydd<br>Short Debate: Council Tax Levels in Cardiff                                |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy yn ddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister**

### **Uwch Reolwyr Awdurdodau Lleol sy'n Fenywod Female Senior Management in Local Authorities**

**Q1 Mick Bates:** What is being done to increase the number of women in senior management in local authorities? (OAQ39385)

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** Thank you, Mick, for an interesting question. The Assembly Government is encouraging local authorities to improve their practices across all the equality strands, including the numbers of women in senior local government posts, through its sponsorship of the Welsh Local Government Association's equalities unit and through policy agreements. However, this is ultimately a matter for local government.

**Mick Bates:** I accept your final point, which is why I asked the question. When I look at the figures, I find that only 9 per cent of local authority chief executives are women; 29 per cent of NHS managers are women; 17 per cent of secondary school headteachers are women; there are no female chairs of police authorities or female chiefs of crown prosecution. These are shameful statistics. Do you agree that they are shameful, Minister, and that more action is needed to bring gender balance equality to all these positions?

**Sue Essex:** Yes; that is why I said that you asked an interesting question. Much more needs to be done. My experience in local government is that you have to take this through stages. Recruiting women in the first place is key, and a lot of work is being done on that. In terms of going up the senior management scale, schemes like the public sector management initiative, which bring women in and give them confidence, are important. Your question about police

**C1 Mick Bates:** Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y menywod sy'n uwch reolwyr mewn awdurdodau lleol? (OAQ39385)

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Diolch ichi, Mick, am gwestiwn didorol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn annog awdurdodau lleol i wella eu harferion ar draws holl feisydd cydraddoldeb, gan gynnwys nifer y menywod mewn uwch swyddi llywodraeth leol, drwy noddi uned cydraddoldebau Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a thrwy gytundebau polisi. Fodd bynnag, mater i lywodraeth leol yw hyn yn y pen draw.

**Mick Bates:** Derbyniad eich pwynt olaf, a dyna pam y gofynnais y cwestiwn. Pan edrychaf ar y ffigurau, gwelaf mai dim ond 9 y cant o brif weithredwyr awdurdodau lleol sy'n fenywod; mae 29 y cant o reolwyr y GIG yn fenywod; mae 17 y cant o benaethiaid ysgolion uwchradd yn fenywod; nid oes unrhyw fenywod yn gadeiryddion awdurdodau'r heddlu nac yn benaethiaid erlyn y goron. Mae'r ystadegau hyn yn warthus. Weinidog, a gytunwch eu bod yn warthus, a bod angen gwneud mwy i sicrhau cydbwyssedd rhwng y rhywiau yn yr holl swyddi hyn?

**Sue Essex:** Cytunaf; dyna pam y dywedais eich bod wedi gofyn cwestiwn didorol. Mae angen gwneud llawer mwy. Yn ôl fy mhrofiad i ym maes llywodraeth leol rhaid ichi fynd â hyn drwy gamau. Mae reciwtio menywod yn y lle cyntaf yn allweddol, ac mae llawer o waith yn cael ei wneud ar hynny. O ran cael dyrchafiadau i uwch swyddi rheoli, mae cynlluniau fel menter reoli'r sector cyhoeddus, sy'n rhoi cyfle a hyder i fenywod, yn bwysig. Yr oedd eich

authorities was striking. I have looked at the situation, and following our discussion today, I will talk at my next meeting with the WLGA and others about how we can raise the profile of women and ensure that we make an effort in those areas where women are not properly represented.

**Lisa Francis:** Establishing work-life balance is important with regard to this matter. We have seen a number of improvements, including improved maternity provision, adoption rights and maternity support leave, which go a long way to improving the situation. What measures is your Government taking to encourage local authorities to honour these commitments for men and women with caring responsibilities?

**Sue Essex:** I omitted the issue of equal pay in answer to Mick's question. It is also important that we mainstream equal pay throughout the public sector. It is part of the agreement on local government that we move towards single status and equal pay. When I announced the draft budget, I announced a huge increase in the provision for children from birth to seven years of age. A chunk of that is about trying to develop better childcare facilities. The work of the team that Brian Gibbons is leading is all about childcare. Inherent in your question is the idea that the public sector should be taking a lead. Many local authorities could look at the childcare provision they put in place for their employees and perhaps work with other public sector organisations to ensure that it is accessible.

cwestiwn ynglŷn ag awdurdodau'r heddlu yn drawiadol. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y sefyllfa, ac yn dilyn ein trafodaeth heddiw, byddaf yn siarad yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda CLILC ac eraill i weld sut y gallwn godi proffil menywod a sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud ymdrech yn y meysydd hynny lle na chaiff menywod eu cynrychioli'n briodol.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng bywyd a gwaith yn bwysig yn hyn o beth. Gwelsom nifer o welliannau, gan gynnwys gwell darpariaeth mamolaeth, hawliau mabwysiadu ac absenoldeb cymorth mamolaeth, sy'n gwneud llawer i wella'r sefyllfa. Pa fesurau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i annog awdurdodau lleol i gadw at yr ymrwymiadau hyn ar gyfer dynion a menywod sydd â chyfrifoldebau gofal?

**Sue Essex:** Anghofiais gyfeirio at gyflog cyfartal wrth ateb cwestiwn Mick. Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn prif ffrydio cyflog cyfartal drwy'r sector cyhoeddus. Rhan o'r cytundeb ar lywodraeth leol yw ein bod yn symud tuag at un statws a chyflie cyfartal. Pan gyhoeddais y gyllideb ddrafft, cyhoeddais gynnydd enfawr yn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer plant o'u geni hyd at saith mlwydd oed. Mae a wnelo rhan helaeth o hynny â cheisio datblygu gwell cyfleusterau gofal plant. Mae a wnelo holl waith y tîm y mae Brian Gibbons yn ei arwain â gofal plant. Rhan hanfodol o'ch cwestiwn yw'r syniad y dylai'r sector cyhoeddus fod yn arwain y blaen. Gallai llawer o awdurdodau lleol edrych ar y ddarpariaeth gofal plant y maent yn ei rhoi ar waith ar gyfer eu cyflogion gan weithio efallai gyda sefydliadau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus i sicrhau ei bod yn hygrych.

### Manteisio ar Fudd-daliadau'r Dreth Gyngor The Take-up of Council Tax Benefits

**Q2 Irene James:** Will the Minister make a statement on the take-up of council tax benefits? (OAQ39396)

**Sue Essex:** Around 267,000 people claim council tax benefit in Wales. Take-up appears highest among lone parents, at 91 to 98 per cent, and lowest among pensioners, at 57 to 63 per cent, and owner-occupiers, at 39

**C2 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad yngylch manteisio ar fudd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor? (OAQ39396)

**Sue Essex:** Mae tua 267,000 o bobl yn hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru. Ymddengys mai rhieni unigol sy'n manteisio fwyaf ar hyn, sef rhwng 91 a 98 y cant, ac ymhlið y nifer isaf sy'n manteisio

to 44 per cent. I am convening a working group of officials to act as a forum to see how we can get more people to take up the benefits for which they are undoubtedly eligible.

**Irene James:** Given the low take-up of council tax benefit across Wales, will you join me in encouraging those on low incomes, particularly pensioners in my constituency of Islwyn, to check their eligibility for council tax benefits and to ensure that they receive their entitlements? Do you also agree that opposition Members could spend their time more constructively promoting the take-up of this benefit in their regions rather than talking down the substantial additional funding that this Labour Welsh Assembly Government has provided to local authorities in Wales, and trying to evade the responsibilities of office in local government?

**Sue Essex:** I am sure that we all have constituents who are eligible but who do not take up these benefits. I spend a lot of time discussing with people why they do not apply for these benefits, and what we can do to encourage them to do so. There will be a new campaign from the Department for Work and Pensions, in that, when Gordon Brown puts out the extra winter fuel payment, there will be a form included. That is a good way of promoting this. You will know that when we provided our response on the balance of funding, we talked about changing the name of the council tax benefit. I think that the word 'benefit' tends to put people off from applying. I have found that to be the case. As an Assembly Member, I hold benefit take-up sessions, with my colleague, and that seems to help. It is about making people feel confident enough to ask, and about overcoming some of the fear factors.

**Glyn Davies:** Local government has a statutory duty to promote the take-up of housing benefit. The reality, as we have seen over the last few years, is that the level of take-up has gone down, and the record of the

arno mae pensiynwyr, rhwng 57 a 63 y cant, a pherchen-feddianwyr, rhwng 39 a 44 y cant. Yr wyf yn cynnull gweithgor o swyddogion i weithredu fel fforwm i weld sut y gallwn gael mwy o bobl i fanteisio ar y budd-daliadau y maent, yn ddi-au, yn gymwys i'w cael.

**Irene James:** O gofio mai nifer isel o bobl sy'n manteisio ar fudd-dal y dreth gyngor ledled Cymru, a ymunwch â mi i annog y rhai sydd ar incwm isel, yn arbennig pensiynwyr yn fy etholaeth i sef Islwyn, i gadarnhau eu bod yn gymwys i gael budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor ac i sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu hawliadau? A gytunwch hefyd y gallai Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau dreulio eu hamser yn fwy adeiladol yn ceisio cael pobl i fanteisio ar y budd-dal hwn yn eu rhanbarthau yn hytrach na bychanu'r arian ychwanegol sylweddol y mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei roi i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a cheisio osgoi cyfrifoldebau bod mewn grym mewn llywodraeth leol?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod gan bob un ohonom etholwyr sy'n gymwys ond nad ydynt yn manteisio ar y budd-daliadau hyn. Treulaf lawer o amser yn holi pobl pam nad ydynt yn gwneud cais am y budd-daliadau hyn, a beth y gallwn ei wneud i'w hannog i wneud hynny. Bydd ymgyrch newydd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn golygu y bydd ffurflen yn cael ei chynnwys gyda'r taliad tanwydd gaeaf ychwanegol, a gaiff ei gyhoeddi gan Gordon Brown. Mae hynny'n ffordd dda o hyrwyddo hyn. Fe wyddoch inni sôn am newid enw budd-dal y dreth gyngor, pan roesom ein hymateb ar y cydbwysedd cyllid. Credaf fod y gair 'budd-dal' yn tueddu i droi pobl yn erbyn y syniad o wneud cais. Dyna sy'n digwydd, hyd y gwelaf fi. Fel Aelod Cynulliad, cynhaliaf sesiynau manteisio ar fudd-daliadau, gyda'm cyd-Aelod, ac mae hynny'n helpu yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae a wnelo â gwneud i bobl deimlo'n ddigon hyderus i ofyn, a goresgyn rhai o'r ofnau sydd ynghlwm wrth hyn.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae gan lywodraeth leol ddyletswydd statudol i geisio cael pobl i fanteisio ar fudd-dal tai. Y realiti yw bod nifer y rhai sy'n gwneud hyn wedi gostwng, fel y gwelsom dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd

Labour Government is poor in this regard. What discussions are you having with local government at a Welsh Local Government Association level, or at the level of individual councils, to ensure that each council has a strategy to enable the poorest people in our society to receive the money to which they are entitled?

**Sue Essex:** I have taken this up with my colleagues in Westminster, with Nick Raynsford, and with the Treasury. I would like to see more proactive campaigns and changes in the regime. I am pleased that the DWP is using the distribution of the winter fuel payment as a means of doing this. In terms of local government, I do not think that there is a council in Wales that is not concerned about this. That is why every authority is signed up to the group that we have convened. We are trying to ensure that all the good ideas out there are pulled together, and that everyone can take them forward.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am pleased to hear your comments about the efforts being made by local government to improve take-up. Do you acknowledge that the fact that pensioners are at the 63 per cent level means that two out of five pensioners are not taking up the benefit? Those pensioners are likely to be the very people who are losing out on pension credits. Will you acknowledge that the system is clumsy and too complex for many people to deal with, particularly older people, especially when they find it difficult to get out and visit offices, and because they find using the phone complex as well?

**Sue Essex:** Like you, probably, I have sat down with older people and gone through forms and tried to explain them. We need to simplify the whole system; the language can be off-putting, as I said. It is essential for many older people that officers can come to their homes and sit down with them to demystify the forms. I know that local authorities do that, and I have arranged for that to happen myself. Elderly people feel secure in their home environment and can discuss their finances without feeling threatened. That is a core method of

diwethaf, ac mae record y Llywodraeth Lafur yn wael yn hyn o beth. Pa drafodaethau a gewch gyda llywodraeth leol ar lefel Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, neu ar lefel cynghorau unigol, i sicrhau bod gan bob cyngor strategaeth i alluogi'r bobl dlotaf yn ein cymdeithas i gael yr arian y mae ganddynt hawl iddo?

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda'm cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan, gyda Nick Raynsford, a chyda'r Trysorlys. Hoffwn weld mwy o ymgyrchoedd rhagweithiol a newidiadau yn y drefn. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn defnyddio dosbarthiad y taliad tanwydd gaeaf fel ffordd o wneud hyn. O ran llywodraeth leol, credaf fod hyn o bwys i bob cyngor yng Nghymru. Dyna pam y mae pob awdurdod yn cefnogi'r grŵp yr ydym wedi ei gynnll. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod yr holl syniadau da yn cael eu tynnu ynghyd, ac y gall pawb weithredu arnynt.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich sylwadau ar yr ymdrechion sy'n cael eu gwneud gan lywodraeth leol i gynyddu nifer y rhai sy'n manteisio ar y budd-dal. A ydych yn cydnabod bod y ffaith mai dim ond 63 y cant o bensiynwyr sy'n manteisio ar hyn yn golygu nad yw dau o bob pump ohonynt yn manteisio arno? Mae'n debyg mai'r pensiynwyr hynny yw'r rhai sydd ar eu colled o ran credydau pensiwn. A gydnabyddwch fod y system yn anodd ei thrin ac yn rhy gymhleth i lawer o bobl, yn arbennig pobl hŷn, yn enwedig pan fyddant yn cael anhawster i fynd allan a mynd i swyddfeydd, ac yn cael anhawster i ddefnyddio'r ffôn hefyd?

**Sue Essex:** Fel chi, mae'n siŵr, yr wyf wedi eistedd gyda phobl hŷn i ddarllen trwy'r ffurflenni a cheisio eu hegluro iddynt. Mae angen inni symleiddio'r system gyfan; gall yr iaith fod yn anodd ei deall, fel y dywedais. I lawer o bobl hŷn, mae'n hanfodol bod swyddogion yn dod i'w cartrefi ac yn darllen drwy'r ffurflenni gyda hwy i geisio eu hegluro. Gwn fod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud hynny, ac yr wyf wedi trefnu i hynny ddigwydd fy hun. Mae pobl oedrannus yn teimlo'n ddiogel yn eu cartref a gallant drafod eu sefyllfa ariannol heb deimlo o dan

overcoming some of the problems that you mentioned for many elderly people.

fygythiad. Mae hynny'n ddull sylfaenol o oresgyn rhai o'r problemau y soniais amdanynt a wynebir gan lawer o bobl oedrannus.

### Cynllun Gofodol Cymru The Wales Spatial Plan

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the ways in which the Wales spatial plan will take forward our vision for a sustainable future for Wales? (OAQ39382)

**Sue Essex:** The plan is subtitled 'People, Places, Futures'. It is about a sustainable future for communities in Wales, identifying the issues that we must work on jointly at a national and regional level, recognising that we must adapt solutions to be appropriate to longer-term local needs. The Assembly will debate the spatial plan this afternoon.

**Ann Jones:** While I welcome the acknowledgment in the plan that effective integrated transport systems are crucial to job creation and extending employment opportunities to excluded groups—and I think, in terms of my constituency, of the upper Denbigh and west Rhyl areas—do you agree that we need to ensure that the north-east Wales dynamic economy can be spread into central north Wales, and that that can only be achieved through targeted investment through the transportation grant, to allow people from these excluded groups to take up those employment opportunities?

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y ffordd y bydd cynllun gofodol Cymru yn datblygu ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol cynaliadwy i Gymru? (OAQ39382)

**Sue Essex:** Is-deitl y cynllun yw 'Pobl, Lleoedd, Dyfodol'. Mae a wnelo â dyfodol cynaliadwy i gymunedau yng Nghymru, gan nodi'r materion y mae'n rhaid inni eu trafod ar y cyd yn genedlaethol ac yn rhanbarthol, a chan gydnabod bod yn rhaid inni addasu atebion fel eu bod yn briodol i anghenion lleol tymor hwy. Bydd y Cynulliad yn trafod y cynllun gofodol y prynhawn yma.

**Ann Jones:** Er fy mod yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth yn y cynllun bod systemau trafnidiaeth integredig effeithiol yn hollbwysig i greu swyddi ac estyn cyfleoedd am gyflogaeth i grwpiau a gaiff eu hallgáu—a meddyliaf, o ran fy etholaeth i, am ardaloedd Dinbych uchaf a gorllewin y Rhyl—a gytunwch fod angen inni sicrhau y gellir lledaenu economi ddeinamig y Gogledd-ddwyrain i ganol y Gogledd, ac mai dim ond drwy fuddsoddiad wedi ei dargedu drwy'r grant trafnidiaeth y gellir cyflawni hynny, er mwyn caniatáu i bobl o'r grwpiau hynny a gaiff eu hallgáu fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hynny am gyflogaeth?

2.10 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** I commend the Deeside transport network, which I launched a few years ago. We did not know at that time whether or not it would work, although we thought that it would. It does exactly what you describe. It has been incredibly successful, because it is particularly useful for those people who do not have access to cars or who work shift patterns, where public transport is not convenient. It reaches into your constituency, beyond the concentrated urban areas and into rural areas, where people are more dispersed. Sandy and Carl will know more about this

**Sue Essex:** Cymeradwyaf rwydwaith trafnidiaeth Glannau Dyfrdwy, a lansais rai blynnyddoedd yn ôl. Ni wyddom ar y pryd a fyddai'n gweithio, er inni gredu y byddai. Mae'n gwneud yn union beth a ddisgrifiwch. Bu'n eithriadol o lwyddiannus, oherwydd mae'n arbennig o ddefnyddiol i'r bobl hynny nad oes car ar gael iddynt neu sy'n gwneud gwaith sifft, lle nad yw cludiant cyhoeddus yn gyfleus. Mae'n cyrraedd eich etholaeth chi, y tu hwnt i'r ardaloedd trefol poblog iawn ac i mewn i ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae pobl fwy ar wasgar. Bydd Sandy a Carl yn

than me, as they are more up to date on this issue, but all the information shows that this is successful in reaching out to the people whom we need to bring into employment and who need to feel that they are being catered for.

gwybod mwy am hyn na minnau, gan fod gwybodaeth fwy diweddar ganddynt am hyn, ond dengys yr holl wybodaeth fod hyn yn llwyddo i gyrraedd y bobl y mae angen inni ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth iddynt ac y mae angen iddynt deimlo ein bod yn darparu ar eu cyfer.

### Llywodraeth Leol yn Abertawe Local Government in Swansea

**Q4 Val Lloyd:** Would the Minister make a statement on the level of Assembly Government support for local government in Swansea? (OAQ39381)

**Sue Essex:** Based on the 2005-06 provisional settlement announced on 2 November, the City and County of Swansea Council will receive £246.3 million in non-hypotheccated funding from the National Assembly. This includes £2.2 million in performance incentive grant and £0.9 million in deprivation grant. Also, current estimates indicate that Swansea will receive £13 million in hypothecated funding through grants.

**Val Lloyd:** I welcome the increased funding for Swansea that you have outlined. All of this money is welcome, especially the extra money to tackle deprivation, which is important for many areas in my constituency. How will the Assembly track this money, to ensure that the funding is delivered to those with greatest need?

**Sue Essex:** Deprivation grant is non-hypotheccated, so how it is used is up to local authorities. However, much of the other funding to tackle deprivation that we provide—such as Communities First; I believe that you have three such wards in your constituency—is tracked, as it is hypothecated. This is shown through the system.

**David Lloyd:** Mae angen dros £40 miliwn i wella ysgolion Abertawe. O ble daw'r arian hwn?

**Sue Essex:** I presume that you mean capital money for buildings. In the budget, and before that, we announced considerable

**C4 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar lefel y cymorth a roddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i lywodraeth leol yn Abertawe? (OAQ39381)

**Sue Essex:** Yn seiliedig ar setliad dros dro 2005-06 a gyhoeddais ar 2 Tachwedd, bydd Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn cael £246.3 miliwn mewn arian heb ei glustnodi gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hyn yn cynnwys £2.2 miliwn mewn grant cymhell perfformiad a £0.9 miliwn mewn grant amddifadedd. Hefyd, dengys amcangyfrifon presennol y bydd Abertawe yn cael £13 miliwn mewn arian wedi'i glustnodi drwy grantiau.

**Val Lloyd:** Croesawaf yr arian cynyddol ar gyfer Abertawe a amlinellwyd gennych. Croesewir yr holl arian hwn, yn enwedig yr arian ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd, sy'n bwysig i lawer o ardaloedd yn fy etholaeth. Sut y bydd y Cynulliad yn dilyn hynt yr arian hwn, i sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei roi i'r rhai sydd â'r angen mwyaf?

**Sue Essex:** Nid yw grant amddifadedd wedi ei glustnodi, felly yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n penderfynu sut i'w wario. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o'r arian arall a ddarparwn i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd—megis Cymunedau yn Gyntaf; credaf fod gennych dair ward o'r fath yn eich etholaeth—yn cael ei olrhain, wrth iddo gael ei glustnodi. Dangosir hyn drwy'r system.

**David Lloyd:** Over £40 million is needed for school improvements in Swansea. Where will this money be found?

**Sue Essex:** Tybiaf eich bod yn golygu arian cyfalaf ar gyfer adeiladau. Yn y gyllideb, a chyn hynny, bu inni gyhoeddi swm

increased funding for school buildings; I believe that it will increase by around 8 per cent. This is a major tranche, which amounts to over £500 million across Wales. Local authorities can now plan to use this money, with prudential borrowing, for the renewal of their asset stock. I do not know what Swansea is doing, but some local authorities are looking at using the extra capital funding, plus prudential borrowing, to pay for major renewal schemes for educational buildings.

**Peter Black:** As you know, £733,000 has been top-sliced from the settlement for Swansea to ensure that other councils do not get anything less than a 3.5 per cent increase. One of those councils is Cardiff, which will receive an additional £4 million as a result. That is the equivalent of £9 for every band D council tax payer in Swansea. Rather than penalising council tax payers for the inadequacies of the formula, do you not believe that it would be better for the Assembly Government to put up this money, so that it can be used by councils like Swansea to improve services?

**Sue Essex:** You really are turning yourself on your head; I remind you that the Liberal Democrats were members of the partnership Government that fully supported the formula. I will also inform you, Peter—because you did not have the benefit of sitting through the committee meeting last week—that the 3.5 per cent floor was welcomed. You might like to tell some of your colleagues in Cardiff why you no longer think that that is appropriate.

sylweddol o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion; credaf y bydd yn cynyddu tua 8 y cant. Mae hyn yn gyfran fawr, sy'n rhoi mwy na £500 miliwn ledled Cymru. Gall awdurdodau lleol gynllunio yn awr sut i ddefnyddio'r arian hwn, gyda benthyca darbodus, er mwyn adnewyddu eu stoc asedau. Ni wn beth y mae Abertawe yn ei wneud, ond mae rhai awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried defnyddio'r arian cyfalaf ychwanegol, ynghyd â benthyca darbodus, i dalu am gynlluniau adnewyddu mawr ar gyfer adeiladau sy'n gysylltiedig ag addysg.

**Peter Black:** Fel y gwyddoch, cafodd £733,000 ei frigdori o'r setliad ar gyfer Abertawe i sicrhau nad yw cynghorau eraill yn cael unrhyw beth yn llai na chynnhydd o 3.5 y cant. Un o'r cynghorau hynny yw Caerdydd, a fydd yn cael £4 miliwn ychwanegol o ganlyniad. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i £9 ar gyfer pob talwr y dreth gyngor band D yn Abertawe. Yn hytrach na chosbi talwyr y dreth gyngor am annigonolrwydd y fformiwlau, oni chredwch y byddai'n well pe bai'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon yn rhoi'r arian hwn, fel y gall cynghorau fel Abertawe ei ddefnyddio i wella gwasanaethau?

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych, o ddifrif, yn dweud y gwrthwyneb i'r hyn a ddywedasoch o'r blaen; hoffwn eich atgoffa bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn aelodau o'r Llywodraeth Bartneriaeth a oedd yn gwbl gefnogol i'r fformiwlau. Fe'ch hysbysaf hefyd, Peter—oherwydd ni chawsoch y fantais o eistedd drwy gyfarfod y pwylgor yr wythnos diwethaf—i'r terfyn isaf o 3.5 y cant gael ei groesawu. Efallai yr hoffech ddweud wrth rai o'ch cyd-Aelodau yng Nghaerdydd pam na chredwch fod hynny'n briodol bellach.

### Perfformiad Awdurdodau Lleol The Performance of Local Authorities

**Q5 Brian Gibbons:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to measure the performance of local authorities in Wales? (OAQ39421)

**Sue Essex:** Local authorities have a duty to report performance against statutory performance indicators in their annual improvement plans. We are currently

**C5 Brian Gibbons:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fesur perfformiad awdurdodau lleol Cymru? (OAQ39421)

**Sue Essex:** Mae gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswydd i nodi perfformiad yn erbyn dangosyddion perfformiad statudol yn eu cynlluniau gwella blynnyddol. Yr ydym

consulting on a new performance measurement framework that is a uniquely Welsh approach to assessing the performance of local authorities in Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** As you will be aware, local government is a key partner in delivering the Welsh Assembly Government's agenda in Wales, so a good performance from local government is crucial. Some local authorities, such as Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, have an excellent record across most areas, but other authorities underperform. Will you ensure that local authorities that are underperforming will not be rewarded for their underperformance, but rather, expected to improve how they do their job?

**Sue Essex:** I commend Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council on leading the way in most areas. We have a series of different kinds of indicators at present. I believe that every local authority in Wales will sign up to the performance improvement grant; they will receive money for signing up to performance improvement this year, but if they do not meet the targets in subsequent years, the money will not be forthcoming.

We are quite open in our discussions with colleagues across Wales and some of the smaller local authorities will need to collaborate. Local authorities are increasingly recognising that fact. If they are to reach the performance levels that we and the public—that is most important of all—require of them, the only way to succeed, probably, is through working in collaboration. Schemes such as Excellence Wales, whereby local authorities can learn from one another, will be the way forward.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservative Group (Nick Bourne):** When assessing the performance of local authorities in Wales, will you bear in mind that the Labour Assembly Government has not been fully funding many of the initiatives that you have been pushing onto local government, such as the teachers' workload agreement? The Welsh Local Government Association says that it will cost £80 million, and, so far,

wrthi'n ymgynghori ar fframwaith mesur perfformiad newydd sy'n ymagwedd gwbl Gymreig tuag at asesu perfformiad awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae llywodraeth leol yn bartner allweddol yn y gwaith o gyflawni agenda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng Nghymru, felly mae perfformiad da gan lywodraeth leol yn hollbwysig. Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol, megis Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, record ragorol ar draws y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd, ond mae awdurdodau eraill yn tangyflawni. A sicrhewch na chaiff yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n tangyflawni eu gwobrwyd am hynny, ond yn hytrach, y disgwyli'r iddynt wella'r ffordd y gwnânt eu gwaith?

**Sue Essex:** Cymeradwyaf Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot am arwain y ffordd yn y rhan fwyaf o feisydd. Mae gennym gyfres o wahanol fathau o ddangosyddion ar hyn o bryd. Credaf y bydd pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn ymrwymo i'r grant gwella perfformiad; byddant yn cael arian am ymrwymo i wella perfformiad eleni, ond os na chyrhaeddant y targedau mewn blynhyddoedd i ddod, ni fydd yr arian ar gael.

Yr ydym yn eithaf agored yn ein trafodaethau gyda chydweithwyr ledled Cymru a bydd angen i rai o'r awdurdodau lleol llai o faint gydweithio. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn cydnabod y ffaith hon yn gynyddol. Er mwyn iddynt gyrraedd y lefelau perfformiad yr ydym ni a'r cyhoedd—dyna'r pwysicaf i gyd—yn gofyn iddynt eu cyrraedd, yr unig ffordd o lwyddo, mae'n siŵr, yw drwy gydweithio. Cynlluniau megis Rhagoriaeth Cymru, lle y gall awdurdodau lleol ddysgu oddi wrth ei gilydd, fydd y ffordd ymlaen.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Wrth asesu perfformiad awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a gofiwch nad yw'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad Lafur wedi bod yn ariannu llawer o'r mentrau yn llawn y buoch yn eu gwthio ar lywodraeth leol, megis y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon? Dywed Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y bydd yn costio £80 miliwn, a hyd yma, cynigiwyd tua £55 miliwn. Yna ceir

around £55 million has been offered. Then there are teachers' pensions, the national insurance increases and so on. Will you bear all those factors in mind when assessing the performance of local authorities?

**Sue Essex:** You can continue to perpetuate myths about these issues, but had you sat in committee on Wednesday, you would have heard very clearly how we considered expenditure pressures, including the teachers' workload agreement, and our response.

The Wales programme for improvement is very much about assessing performance. We do not necessarily see ourselves as a 'name-and-shame' regime here—this is about supporting local government to make necessary changes and use money wisely, which is why I return to the collaboration theme that I just mentioned, and which is reflected in the First Minister's document, 'Making the Connections'. This is how I see us improving public sector efficiency and local authorities' effectiveness in terms of using resources.

**Nick Bourne:** I am pleased that you are not in the name-and-shame game, but that did not seem to be the First Minister's approach yesterday—he was all too ready to equalise before the other side had scored by trying to blame local government in advance for the council tax increases that we will see because of the poor settlement. Indeed, there is no shame. It is not the fault of local authorities that you have not fully funded the initiatives that I mentioned—you have not fully funded the teachers' workload agreement and many other initiatives—but you then turn around, as the First Minister did yesterday, and blame local authorities for the very high increases that we are about to see in council taxes.

**Sue Essex:** First, the fundamental point is that we do not set council taxes. Secondly, you are flogging a dead horse here. Do not shake your head, Nick, because you were not in committee or at the partnership council meeting.

**Nick Bourne:** I am not a member of the

pensiynau athrawon, cynnydd yn yr yswiriant gwladol ac yn y blaen. A gofiwch yr holl ffactorau hynny wrth asesu perfformiad awdurdodau lleol?

**Sue Essex:** Gallwch barhau â'r mythau am y materion hyn, ond pe baech wedi eistedd yn y pwylgor ddydd Mercher, byddech wedi clywed yn glir iawn sut y bu inni ystyried pwysau o ran gwariant, gan gynnwys y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, a'n hymateb ni.

Mae a wnelo rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella lawer iawn ag asesu perfformiad. Nid ydym o reidrwydd yn ystyried ein hunain yn gyfundrefn 'enwi a chywilyddio' yma—mae a wnelo hyn â chefnogi llywodraeth leol i wneud newidiadau angenrheidiol a defnyddio'r arian yn ddoeth, a dyna pam y dychwelaf at y thema cydweithio yr wyf newydd ei chrybwyl, ac a adlewyrchir yn nogfen y Prif Weinidog 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Yn fy marn i, dyna sut y gallwn wella effeithlonrwydd y sector cyhoeddus ac effeithiolrwydd awdurdodau lleol o ran defnyddio adnoddau.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn falch nad ydych yn rhan o'r gyfundrefn enwi a chywilyddio, ond nid dyna oedd ymagwedd y Prif Weinidog ddoe yn ôl pob tebyg—yr oedd yn rhy barod i gyfartalu cyn i'r ochr arall sgorio drwy geisio beio llywodraeth leol ymlaen llaw am y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor a welwn yn awr oherwydd y setliad gwael. Yn wir, nid oes unrhyw gywilydd. Nid bai awdurdodau lleol ydyw nad ydych wedi ariannu'r mentrau a grybwylais yn llawn—nid ydych wedi ariannu'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon yn llawn na llawer o fentrau eraill—ond yna yr ydych yn newid eich meddwl, fel y gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ddoe, ac yn beio awdurdodau lleol am y cynnydd uchel iawn yr ydym ar fin ei weld yn y dreth gyngor.

**Sue Essex:** Yn gyntaf, y pwynt sylfaenol yw nad ni sy'n pennu'r dreth gyngor. Yn ail, yr ydych yn gwastraffu eich amser yn llwyr ar hyn. Peidiwch â siglo eich pen, Nick, oherwydd nid oeddech yn y pwylgor nac yng nghyfarfod y cyngor partneriaeth.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid wyf yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor

Local Government and Public Services Committee.

**Sue Essex:** No, but you could have asked your party colleagues who are.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. As I have explained many times in recent weeks, I do not take kindly to these additional supplementaries, even when they come from as distinguished a politician as the leader of the Welsh Conservative group.

**Sue Essex:** I am glad you think so, Llywydd.

2.20p.m.

I accept that you were not at committee, Nick, or at the partnership council meeting, but, on both occasions, I went through the expenditure report carefully in terms of financial pressures and our response to them. The teachers' workload agreement is the key initiative where there is a substantial difference, and I reminded everyone that the WLGA said this last year; it came up with figures that were far in excess of what we thought was the right figure to be included. We included that figure, and as far as I am concerned—and I have checked in many quarters—the workload agreement is being delivered. We will wait and see. Based on last year's assessment, we should get this year's assessment right.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I commend to the Minister the fascinating supplementary question from Brian Gibbons earlier today, in which he talked about performance and linking performance and money for local authorities. What is the level of money that the Welsh Assembly Government currently gives to local authorities for performance improvement and for assistance with performance? How much money is there within the local government formula, the revenue support grant settlement, for performance improvement?

**Sue Essex:** I can come back to you with a figure. However, as I understand it,

Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus.

**Sue Essex:** Nac ydych, ond gallech fod wedi gofyn i aelodau eich plaid sydd yn aelodau o'r pwylgor.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fel yr wyf wedi egluro sawl gwaith dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, nid wyf yn croesawu'r cwestiynau atodol ychwanegol hyn, hyd yn oed pan gânt eu gofyn gan wleidydd mor nodedig ag arweinydd grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru.

**Sue Essex:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn meddwl hynny, Lywydd.

Derbyniaf nad oeddech yn y pwylgor, Nick, nac yng nghyfarfod y cyngor partneriaeth, ond, ar y ddau achlysur, euthum drwy'r adroddiad ar wariant yn ofalus o ran pwysau ariannol a'n hymateb iddynt. Y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon yw'r fenter allweddol lle mae gwahaniaeth sylweddol ac atgoffais pawb i CLILC ddweud hyn y llynedd; lluniodd y ffigurau a oedd yn fwy o lawer na'r ffigur i'w gynnwys a oedd yn gywir yn ein barn ni. Bu inni gynnwys y ffigur hwnnw, ac o'm rhan i—ac yr wyf wedi gwirio hyn mewn sawl man—mae'r cytundeb llwyth gwaith yn cael ei gyflawni. Rhaid inni aros a gweld. Yn seiliedig ar asesiad y llynedd, dylem gael asesiad eleni yn gywir.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Cymeradwyaf i'r Gweinidog y cwestiwn atodol diddorol iawn gan Brian Gibbons yn gynharach heddiw, lle y soniodd am berfformiad ac am gysylltu perfformiad ac arian ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol. Faint o arian a rydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar hyn o bryd i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt wella perfformiad ac am gymorth gyda pherfformiad? Faint o arian sydd yno o fewn y fformiwl a llywodraeth leol, setliad y grant cynnal refeniw, ar gyfer gwella perfformiad?

**Sue Essex:** Gallaf ddod yn ôl atoch gyda ffigur. Fodd bynnag, fel y deallaf, ariennir

performance is funded through policy agreements and performance incentive grants. We put money into the WLGA, through Syniad in particular, as a way of helping to improve performance. We also put money into the Audit Commission and the Wales programme for improvement. Those are the obvious routes that are used. In terms of performance indicators, we need to look at them in the future to consider in what direction we will take them. As you know, funding is currently expressed in terms of need, and that is how the settlement works. Need is measured, and money goes out accordingly. However, it is important to note that there are many ways of incentivising performance other than through funding.

**Michael German:** I understand the point about using means of incentivisation other than just money. However, money is an important factor in incentivising those who perform well. Your understanding of the local government settlement is that it is based on need. My understanding is that most of the measures—increasingly complex though they are—are based on historic spending. That is, they are based on what was spent last year, with an element for inflation and for the new services that are to be provided. None of that helps to improve performance, does it, Minister? It does not reward those authorities that spend their money effectively and efficiently on their services, as opposed to those who have been simply high or low spenders in the past.

**Sue Essex:** That is true to a degree in the formula: in terms of how you measure need, past spending has been used to a certain extent to indicate that. However, you, Mike, sit on the Consultative Forum on Finance, the Local Government and Public Services Committee and the Partnership Council, and therefore you, and other Members, have an opportunity—I am open about this, and I have never said the formula or elements within it are untouchable—to contribute. You were at the same meeting as I was when we discussed the work programme for next year. You cannot have it both ways. If you have good ideas about how things should change, come forward with them by all means. I am

perfformiad drwy gytundebau polisi a grantiau cymell perfformiad. Rhoddwu arian i CLILC, drwy Syniad yn arbennig, fel ffordd o helpu i wella perfformiad. Rhoddwu arian hefyd i'r Comisiwn Archwilio a rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella. Dyna'r ffyrdd amlwg a ddefnyddir. O ran dangosyddion perfformiad, mae angen inni edrych arnynt yn y dyfodol i ystyried i ba gyfeiriad y byddwn yn mynd â hwy. Fel y gwyddoch, mynegir yr arian ar hyn o bryd yn nhermau angen a dyna sut y mae'r setliad yn gweithio. Caiff angen ei fesur, a rhoddir yr arian yn unol â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig nodi bod sawl ffordd o gymhell perfformiad heblaw drwy arian.

**Michael German:** Deallaf y pwynt ynglŷn â defnyddio dull cymell heblaw arian. Fodd bynnag, mae arian yn ffactor pwysig wrth geisio cymell y rhai sy'n perfformio'n dda. Yn ôl eich dealltwriaeth chi mae'r setliad llywodraeth leol yn seiliedig ar angen. Yn ôl fy nealltwriaeth i mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r mesurau—er mor gynyddol gymhleth ydynt—yn seiliedig ar wariant hanesyddol. Hynny yw, maent yn seiliedig ar yr hyn a wariwyd y llynedd, gydag elfen ar gyfer chwyddiant ac ar gyfer y gwasanaethau newydd sydd i'w darparu. Ond onid yw'n wir, Weinidog, nad oes yr un o'r mesurau hynny yn helpu i wella perfformiad? Nid yw'n gwobrwyd o'r awdurdodau hynny sy'n gwario eu harian yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon ar eu gwasanaethau, o'u cyferbynnu â'r rhai sydd naill ai wedi gwario llawer neu heb wario llawer yn y gorffennol.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n wir i ryw raddau yn y fformiwla: o ran sut yr ydych yn mesur angen, defnyddiwyd gwariant yn y gorffennol i ryw raddau i nodi hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych chi, Mike, yn aelod o'r Fforwm Ymgynghorol ar Gyllid, y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a'r Cyngor Partneriaeth, ac felly mae gennych chi, ac Aelodau eraill, gyfle—yr wyf yn agored ynglŷn â hyn, ac nid wyf erioed wedi dweud bod y fformiwla neu'r elfennau ynddi y tu hwnt i'ch cyrraedd—i gyfrannu. Yr oeddech yn yr un cyfarfod â minnau pan drafodwyd y rhaglen waith ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf gennym. Ni allwch ei chael hi ddwy ffordd. Os oes gennych

always open to good ideas. However, when you have the opportunity to make comments and choose not to, do not come back whingeing and moaning because matters have not changed.

syniadau da ynglŷn â sut y dylai pethau newid, mae croeso ichi eu nodi. Yr wyf bob amser yn barod i wrando ar syniadau da. Fodd bynnag, pan gewch y cyfle i wneud sylwadau a dewiswch beidio â gwneud hynny, peidiwch wedyn â swnian a chwyno am nad yw pethau wedi newid.

### Y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax

**Q6 Helen Mary Jones:** What discussions has the Minister held with colleagues at Westminster regarding replacing the council tax with a fair, progressive taxation system? (OAQ39417)

**Sue Essex:** All the evidence that we collected in our review of the balance of funding for local authorities in Wales, and that collected by the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, suggests that council tax should be retained, and that is the recommendation of the House of Commons select committee on local government finance.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am afraid that the 50 or more families, including many pensioners and families with young children, in Sandy Road, Llanelli—all of whom appealed against the rebanding of their council tax, as they feel they cannot afford the new council tax that they will be expected to pay—will be disappointed to hear that answer. You should look again at whether or not it is time to replace this unfair tax, which is based on a notional idea of what a person's home would fetch if they sold it, with a tax that is based on their ability to pay.

**Sue Essex:** I shall probably repeat what I have said in previous debates on this, namely that it is a complex issue and there is a debate about what tax should be used locally; that is what the balance of funding review is about. As I have said before, in the past I have been attracted to the idea of local income tax, because it is related to income, and, in that way, can be fairer. In terms of which direction we will take, we unfortunately hit all the snags that everyone across the world hits every time that they look at this in terms of a local tax. That is why people continually go back to a property tax. However, just to reassure you, Michael Lyons is doing this

**C6 Helen Mary Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael â'i chymheiriaid yn San Steffan ynghylch disodli system y dreth gyngor a rhoi system drethu deg a blaengar yn ei lle? (OAQ39417)

**Sue Essex:** Mae'r holl dystiolaeth a gasglwyd gennym yn ein hadolygiad o'r cydbwysedd cyllid ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a'r hyn a gasglwyd gan Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yn awgrymu y dylid cadw'r dreth gyngor, a dyna argymhelliaid pwylgor dethol Tŷ'r Cyffredin ar gyllid llywodraeth leol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ofnaf y bydd yr 50 neu fwy o deuluoedd, gan gynnwys llawer o bensiynwyr a theuluoedd â phlant bach, yn Heol Sandy, Llanelli—yr apeliodd pob un ohonynt yn erbyn ailfandio eu treth gyngor, gan nad ydynt yn credu y gallant fforddio'r dreth gyngor newydd y bydd disgwyl iddynt ei thalu—yn siomedig i glywed yr ateb hwnnw. Dylech edrych eto ar ba un a yw'n bryd inni ddisodli'r dreth annheg hon, sy'n seiliedig ar syniad tybiannol o werth cartref person pe bai'n cael ei werthu, a rhoi treth sy'n seiliedig ar eu gallu i dalu yn ei lle.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n debyg y gwnaf ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais mewn dadleuon blaenorol ar hyn, sef bod hyn yn fater cymhleth ac mae dadl ynglŷn â pha dreth y dyliid ei defnyddio'n lleol; dyna beth yw hanfod yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, yn y gorffennol mae'r syniad o dreth incwm leol wedi apelio ataf, oherwydd mae'n gysylltiedig ag incwm, ac, yn y ffordd honno, gall fod yn fwy teg. O ran pa gyfeiriad y byddwn yn mynd iddo, yr ydym yn anffodus yn wynebu'r holl rwystrau y mae pawb ledled y byd yn eu hwynebu bob tro yr ystyriant hyn o ran treth leol. Dyna pam y mae pobl yn dychwelyd at dreth eiddo

work—I do not know whether you are aware of this. Following the balance of funding report, Michael Lyons has been appointed to look further into the issue, and we will be speaking to him. I know that he will have meetings in Wales, and I will make him aware that people feel strongly that local income taxes are a better means of collecting local tax.

**Jonathan Morgan:** On revaluation, Minister, you said that there would be as many winners as there would be losers in this process. Yet, in Cardiff, for every house that has been moved down a band, 60 properties have been moved up a band. Will you now apologise for such an inaccurate statement?

**Sue Essex:** We made a statement of the expected outcome, based on the figures from the Valuation Office Agency. Neither I nor the valuation office made any prediction about what would happen in any one local authority area. That work is done by the Valuation Office Agency, it is not done by me, and you would not expect me to alter those figures—the figures are the figures, and we have to deal with them once they come through.

### **Cymorth i Gynghorwyr Support for Councillors**

**Q7 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about support for councillors in Wales? (OAQ39397)

**Sue Essex:** The Welsh Assembly Government commissioned ‘The Good Councillor’s Guide’, copies of which were issued last month to all community and town councillors in Wales, free of charge. The Assembly Government is also establishing a national training advisory group to put into place arrangements to meet the training needs of councillors and staff.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I welcome your comments and the Government’s response to the recent research study into community councils in Wales. Do you agree that reimbursing childcare and covering essential costs is vital if we are to widen participation

bob tro. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn tawelu eich meddwl, mae Michael Lyons yn gwneud y gwaith hwn—ni wn a ydych yn ymwybodol o hyn. Yn dilyn yr adroddiad ar gydbwysedd cyllid, penodwyd Michael Lyons i ymchwilio i’r mater ymhellach, a byddwn yn siarad gydag ef. Gwn y bydd yn dod i gyfarfodydd yng Nghymru, a byddaf yn dweud wrtho bod pobl yn teimlo’n gryf bod trethi incwm lleol yn ffordd well o gasglu trethi leol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** O ran ailbrisio, Weinidog, dywedasoch y byddai’r un nifer o bobl ar eu hennill â’r rhai a fyddai ar eu colled yn y broses hon. Ac eto, yng Nghaerdydd, am bob tŷ sydd wedi symud i lawr un band, mae 60 o gartrefi wedi symud i fyny un band. A ymddiheurwch yn awr am wneud datganiad mor anghywir?

**Sue Essex:** Gwnaethom ddatganiad ar y canlyniad disgwyliedig, yn seiliedig ar y ffigurau gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio. Ni wneuthum i na’r swyddfa brisio ddarogan beth fyddai’n digwydd mewn unrhyw ardal awdurdod lleol. Mae’r gwaith hwnnw yn cael ei wneud gan Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio, ac nid gennyl fi, ac ni fyddch yn disgwyl imi newid y ffigurau hynny—y ffigurau yw’r ffigurau, a rhaid inni ddelio â hwy unwaith y maent ar gael.

**C7 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch y cymorth a roddir i gynghorwyr Cymru? (OAQ39397)

**Sue Essex:** Comisiynwyd ‘Canllaw y Cynghorydd Da’ gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a rhoddwyd copïau ohono fis diwethaf i bob cynghorydd cymuned a thref yng Nghymru, am ddim. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn sefydlu grŵp cynghori hyfforddiant cenedlaethol i roi trefniadau ar waith i ddiwallu anghenion hyfforddi cynghorwyr a staff.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Croesawaf eich sylwadau ac ymateb y Llywodraeth i’r astudiaeth ymchwil ddiweddar ar gynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru. A gytunwch fod addalu gofal plant a thalu costau hanfodol yn hollbwysig er mwyn inni ehangu cyfranogiad

and improve representation, and encourage women to stand for community councils in Wales? Do you also agree that, as the first step in improving representation, widening access in community councils could be the catalyst to improve the low numbers of women representatives in office in local authorities across Wales?

**Sue Essex:** I do not know whether you started your political life as a community or town councillor, Denise—I suspect that you did from those comments. I suspect that a few Assembly Members did exactly the same. Widening access is important—it is a stepping stone. We would also like to see younger people coming in, as that may be an opportunity for them to put their feet into the water as a representative. Widening access was a continuing theme of the Aberystwyth report, and we have taken those recommendations on board. Your point about meeting the costs of carers, and so on, is important. It has been introduced for local authorities, and it needs to be widened to include community councils.

a gwella cynrychiolaeth, ac annog menywod i sefyll etholiad i gynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru? A gytunwch hefyd, fel y cam cyntaf tuag at wella cynrychiolaeth, y gallai ehangu mynediad mewn cymghorau cymuned gynyddu'r nifer isel o fenywod sy'n dal swyddi mewn awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru?

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn a wnaethoch ddechrau eich bywyd gwleidyddol fel cymhorydd cymuned neu dref, Denise—tybiaf ichi wneud hynny o'r sylwadau hynny. Tybiaf i rai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wneud yn union yr un peth. Mae ehangu mynediad yn bwysig—mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Hoffwn hefyd weld pobl iau yn dod i mewn, oherwydd gallai hynny fod yn gyfle iddynt ddechrau gael profiad drwy fod yn gynrychiolydd. Yr oedd ehangu mynediad yn thema barhaus yn adroddiad Aberystwyth ac yr ydym wedi ystyried yr argymhellion hynny. Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn â thalu costau gofalwyr, ac yn y blaen, yn bwysig. Fe'i cyflwynwyd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol, ac mae angen iddo gael ei ehangu i gynnwys cymghorau cymuned.

### **Y Setliad Llywodraeth Leol i Gyngor Sir Ynys Môn** **The Local Government Settlement for the Isle of Anglesey County Council**

**C8 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar effaith y setliad llywodraeth leol ar Gyngor Sir Ynys Môn? (OAQ39412)

**Sue Essex:** The provisional settlement announcement for 2005-06 indicated that the Isle of Anglesey County Council will receive around £85 million in Assembly support. Of this, £79.6 million is non-hypotheccated support, including £0.7 million in performance incentive grant and £0.5 million in deprivation grant. Hypothecated funding through specific grants accounts for approximately £5 million.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn eich datganiad ar 2 Tachwedd, dywedasoch fod cymghorau yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd, yn cael 5 y cant; credaf mai'r ffigur cywir yw 4.8 y cant, tra mai 3.8 y cant yw'r swm cywir yn Ynys Môn. Golyga hynny, os yw'r cyngor eisiau cadw gwasanaethau fel ag y maent, byddai'n rhaid iddo godi'r dreth gyngor i lefel cwbl

**Q8 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of the local government settlement on the Isle of Anglesey County Council? (OAQ39412)

**Sue Essex:** Nododd cyhoeddiad y setliad dros dro ar gyfer 2005-06 y bydd Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn yn cael tua £85 miliwn mewn cymorth gan y Cynulliad. O'r swm hwn, mae £79.6 miliwn ohono yn gymorth heb ei glustnodi, gan gynnwys £0.7 miliwn mewn grant cymhell perfformiad a £0.5 miliwn mewn grant amddifadedd. Mae arian heb ei glustnodi drwy grantiau penodol yn cyfrif am tua £5 miliwn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** In your statement on 2 November, you said that councils in Wales, on average, would receive 5 per cent; I believe that the correct figure is 4.8 per cent, whereas, in Ynys Môn, the correct sum is 3.8 per cent. That means that if the council wants to maintain services as they are, it will have to increase the council tax to a completely

annerbyniol, neu, os yw eisiau cadw'r dreth gyngor i lawr, rhaid iddo dorri yn ôl ar wasanaethau. Yn ychwanegol at hynny, bydd yn rhaid i 34.5 y cant o bobl yr ynys dalu treth ychwanegol oherwydd yr ailfandio. A ydych yn fodlon ail-edrych ar y setliad i'r cyngor?

2.30 p.m.

**Sue Essex:** This was the provisional settlement, and other moneys are coming. I mentioned Gordon Brown's money, and that is still to be allocated, because we have not agreed the distribution criteria. The 5 per cent is the overall figure. On the 4.8 per cent figure, there is 0.2 per cent in private finance initiative money. I do not think that Anglesey had benefited from that. However, that is an essential part of the distribution formula, is it not, to which everyone signs up. Indeed, you also had a member on the CFF. Some people will be above the average and others will fall below. I appreciate that, in Anglesey, with whose leader and chief executive I recently talked, the settlements are challenging—and that is the word that I used. However, that is how the distribution formula works.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gan gyfeirio at bwynt penodol, daeth y cyngor ag un mater i'm sylw sawl gwaith, sef y cynnydd a gafwyd yng nghost addysg anghenion arbennig. Dywed y cyngor wrthyf iddo wario £1.3 miliwn yn 2000, ond bod hynny wedi codi i £2.8 miliwn eleni. Nid oes arian ychwanegol yn y gyllideb y gwnaethoch ei chynnig sy'n gymesur â'r math hwnnw o gynnydd. A yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau ychwanegol sydd ar gynghorau i ddarparu gwasanaeth addysg anghenion arbennig, a pha help allwch ei roi i gynghorau sy'n dioddef fel hyn?

**Sue Essex:** We had a good discussion on this very problem when I visited Ynys Môn, and, in talking to councils across Wales, it has become clear that there is a difficult and often non-existent divide between special educational needs and childcare costs, which often amount to the same thing for families. I have two points to make. First, in looking at the expenditure pressures that were presented

unacceptable level, or, if it wants to keep the council tax down, it will have to cut back on services. In addition to that, 34.5 per cent of the island's population will have to pay additional tax because of rebanding. Are you willing to look again at the settlement for the council?

**Sue Essex:** Hwn oedd y setliad dros dro, ac mae arian arall ar y ffordd. Soniai am arian Gordon Brown, ac mae hwnnw eto i'w ddyrannu, oherwydd nid ydym wedi cytuno ar y meini prawf dosbarthu. Pump y cant yw'r ffigur cyffredinol. O ran y ffigur 4.8 y cant, mae 0.2 y cant yn arian y fenter cyllid preifat. Ni chredaf fod Ynys Môn wedi elwa ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n rhan hanfodol o'r fformiwla ddosbarthu, onid ydyw, y mae pawb yn ymrwymo iddi. Yn wir, yr oedd gennych aelod ar y Fforwm Ymgynghorol ar Gyllid hefyd. Bydd rhai pobl yn uwch na'r cyfartaledd ac eraill yn is nag ef. Gwerthfawrogaf fod y setliadau yn Ynys Môn, y bu imi siarad yn ddiweddar â'i arweinydd a'i brif weithredwr, yn heriol—a dyna'r gair a ddefnyddiais. Fodd bynnag, dyna sut y mae'r fformiwla ddosbarthu yn gweithio.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** To refer to one point in particular, the council has drawn one matter to my attention several times, namely the increase experienced in the cost of special needs education. The council tells me that it spent £1.3 million in 2000, but that that has risen to £2.8 million this year. Your proposed budget contains no additional money that is commensurate with that kind of increase. Is the Assembly Government aware of the additional pressures on councils to provide a special educational needs service, and what help can you give to councils that are suffering in this way?

**Sue Essex:** Cawsom drafodaeth dda ar y broblem hon pan ymwelais ag Ynys Môn, ac, wrth siarad â chynghorau ledled Cymru, daeth yn amlwg bod rhaniad anodd ac un nad yw'n bod yn aml rhwng costau anghenion addysgol arbennig a chostau gofal plant, sydd yn aml yn golygu'r un peth i deuluoedd. Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w gwneud. Yn gyntaf, wrth ystyried y pwysau o ran gwariant a

by the WLGA with regard to children, we are investing more money than was asked for. That is a reflection, through the Children First money, of the problem of drawing boundaries between the two problems. Secondly, on the exceptional pressures, which are real issues for small local authorities, we are looking at a different way of doing this, and this was a big part of the discussion that we had in Anglesey. Families can move around, suddenly putting real pressure on the budget, but then that pressure will move again to another area. We and the WLGA think that the way forward is through pooled budgets, which would deal with these sudden changes that might happen on a geographical basis or over a period of one or two years. That is a positive way of looking at this matter, and that work will be ongoing this year.

gyflwynwyd gan CLILC o ran plant, yr ydym yn rhyddhau mwy o arian na'r swm y gofynnwyd amdano. Adlewyrchiad yw hynny, drwy arian Plant yn Gyntaf, o'r broblem o wahanu'r ddwy broblem oddi wrth ei gilydd. Yn ail, o ran y pwysau eithriadol, sy'n broblemau gwirioneddol i awdurdodau lleol bach, yr ydym yn ystyried ffordd wahanol o wneud hyn, ac yr oedd hyn yn rhan fawr o'r drafodaeth a gawsom yn Ynys Môn. Gall teuluoedd symud o amgylch, gan roi pwysau sydyn gwirioneddol ar y gyllideb, ond yna bydd y pwysau hynny yn symud eto i ardal arall. Credwn ni a CLILC mai'r cyllidebau cyfun yw'r ffordd ymlaen, a fyddai'n ymdrin â'r newidiadau sydyn hyn a allai ddigwydd ar sail ddaearyddol neu dros gyfnod o un neu ddwy flynedd. Mae honno'n ffordd gadarnhaol o ystyried y mater, a bydd y gwaith hwnnw yn mynd rhagddo eleni.

## Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning

### Mesur Cludiant i'r Ysgol The School Transport Bill

**Q1 David Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on the school transport Act? (OAQ39443)

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** The School Transport Bill was introduced to Parliament on 14 October 2004. The Second Reading took place on 28 October and the committee stage in the House of Commons was held on 9 and 11 November. I will keep the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee informed of progress.

**David Davies:** Can you confirm that, if this legislation is enacted in Wales, parents will lose their current right to free school transport for their children if they live more than three miles away from a local school? Can you also confirm that this will mean more cars on roads for the school run, more children walking long routes to school along dangerous roads, more misery for rural dwellers and, in a few years' time, pupils probably having a better chance of sitting in James Bond's ejector seat than in getting a free place on a free school bus?

**C1 David Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y Ddeddf cludiant i'r ysgol? (OAQ39443)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cyflwynwyd y Mesur Cludiant i'r Ysgol i'r Senedd ar 14 Hydref 2004. Cafwyd yr Ail Ddarleniad ar 28 Hydref a chynhalwyd cam y pwyllgor yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ar 9 ac 11 Tachwedd. Byddaf yn hysbysu'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r cynnydd.

**David Davies:** A allwch gadarnhau, os daw'r ddeddfwriaeth hon i rym yng Nghymru, y bydd rhieni yn colli eu hawl bresennol i cael cludiant am ddim i'r ysgol ar gyfer eu plant os ydynt yn byw mwy na thair milltir i ffwrdd o ysgol leol? A allwch gadarnhau hefyd a fydd hyn yn golygu mwy o geir ar y ffyrdd i fynd â phlant i'r ysgol a'u casglu, mwy o blant yn cerdded pellter hir i'r ysgol ar hyd ffyrdd peryglus, mwy o ddiflaston i'r rhai sy'n byw yn y wlad, ac ymhen rhai blynnyddoedd, y bydd mwy o gyfle i ddisgyblion eistedd yn sedd alldaflu James

Bond nag eistedd ar fws ysgol am ddim?

**Jane Davidson:** No, I cannot confirm your description of the proposed legislation. The School Transport Bill will initially allow a small number of local education authorities to pilot innovative school transport arrangements. If these pilot schemes prove successful, the provisions can be rolled out to all local education authorities. However, the pilot schemes must be submitted by the local education authorities on the basis that they will reduce the number of cars on the school run.

**Catherine Thomas:** Do you agree that children should be consulted on what they deem to be safe routes to school and on the mode of transport that they use? On some occasions, they are expected to travel to school or walk routes with which they are not completely comfortable, as is currently the case in Tumble and Crosshands in my constituency. This issue is being raised by some children and parents, who are concerned about the routes that the children have to travel, and their voices must be heard.

**Jane Davidson:** The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to expanding the participation of young people in all our decision-making processes, and also in influencing the local authorities in their decision-making processes. We will be looking at guidance on the formal establishment of school councils in all schools in Wales in the year ahead, and we have established a participation unit in the Assembly to develop pupils' participation. I will ask the participation unit to look at the issues that you raise in terms of dialogue with other Cabinet Ministers.

**Janet Davies:** Pursuing the issue of free school transport and parents possibly having to pay under the Bill if it is enacted, how will you ensure that the pilot local authorities provide value for money to those parents, and how will you monitor those local authorities?

**Jane Davidson:** The provisions of the Bill will remove the present inequalities whereby all pupils living beyond statutory walking distance from school are entitled to free

**Jane Davidson:** Na, ni allaf gadarnhau eich disgrifiad o'r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig. Bydd y Mesur Cludiant i'r Ysgol yn caniatáu i nifer fach o awdurdodau addysg lleol ar y dechrau dreialu trefniadau arloesol ar gyfer cludiant i'r ysgol. Os bydd y cynlluniau peilot hyn yn llwyddiannus, gellir cyflwyno'r darpariaethau i bob awdurdod addysg lleol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol gyflwyno'r cynlluniau peilot ar y sail y byddant yn lleihau nifer y ceir ar y ffyrdd i fynd â phlant i'r ysgol a'u casglu.

**Catherine Thomas:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylid ymgynghori â phlant ar yr hyn sydd, yn eu barn hwy, yn llwybrau diogel i'r ysgol ac ar y dull cludiant a ddefnyddiant? Weithiau, disgwyllir iddynt deithio i'r ysgol neu gerdded ar hyd llwybrau nad ydynt yn gwbl gysurus â hwy, fel sy'n wir ar hyn o bryd yn y Tymbly a Crosshands yn fy etholaeth. Caiff y mater hwn ei godi gan rai plant a rhieni, sy'n gofiddio am y llwybrau y mae'n rhaid i'r plant deithio arnynt a rhaid i'w lleisiau gael eu clywed.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymrwymedig i ehangu cyfranogiad pobl ifanc ym mhob un o'n prosesau gwneud penderfyniadau, a hefyd wrth ddylanwadu ar awdurdodau lleol yn eu prosesau gwneud penderfyniadau. Byddwn yn ystyried canllawiau ar gyfer sefydlu cynghorau ysgol yn ffurfiol ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn i ddod, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu uned gyfranogi yn y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cyfranogiad disgyblion. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r uned gyfranogi edrych ar y materion a godwch o ran deialog gyda Gweinidogion eraill y Cabinet.

**Janet Davies:** Gan fynd ar drywydd cludiant i'r ysgol am ddim a rhieni o bosibl yn gorfol talu o dan y Mesur os caiff ei ddeddfu, sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau lleol peilot yn darparu gwerth am arian i'r rhieni hynny, a sut y byddwch yn monitro'r awdurdodau lleol hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Bydd darpariaethau'r Mesur yn dileu'r anghydraddoldebau presennol lle y bydd gan bob disgybl sy'n byw y tu hwnt i'r pellter cerdded statudol o'r ysgol yr hawl i

transport regardless of their ability to pay, but pupils within the statutory distance have no entitlement to assistance, even if they are from low income families, and in practice often have to travel to school by bus and pay fares.

Recent research indicates that more families with higher incomes receive free school transport than lower income families. We will also look, in terms of the committee's report on school transport, at developing the pilots in Wales. As with any initiative supported by the Assembly, we will monitor their effectiveness in terms of take-up and popularity, and will work with organisations such as belt up school kids and Stuart's Campaign to ensure that there are higher safety standards, for example, on buses participating in the pilot.

**Kirsty Williams:** Given the fact that you and Powys County Council are willing to close more rural schools in my constituency, will you guarantee that you will not see as innovative or retrograde any moves by Powys County Council to stop children receiving free school transport if they travel more than three miles to school? Do you acknowledge that in many rural areas, especially among farming families, it is seen as a stigma to take up a number of benefits, and that it is therefore difficult to assess whether someone has a low or high income?

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of any pilots that may come forward, we must remember that no pilots will be in place until September 2007, which is beyond the lifetime of this Assembly. We would want to ensure that local authorities applying for support from the Assembly under a pilot are fully cognisant of all the issues in their area.

gael cludiant am ddim pa un a allant dalu ai peidio, ond ni fydd gan ddisgyblion sy'n byw o fewn y pellter statudol unrhyw hawl i gymorth, hyd yn oed os ydynt yn dod o deuluoedd incwm isel, ac yn ymarferol yn gorfol teithio ar fws i'r ysgol yn aml a thalu am docyn.

Dengys ymchwil ddiweddar fod mwy o deuluoedd incwm uwch yn cael cludiant i'r ysgol am ddim na theuluoedd incwm is. O ran adroddiad y pwylgor ar gludiant i'r ysgol, byddwn hefyd yn ystyried datblygu'r cynlluniau peilot yng Nghymru. Fel gydag unrhyw fenter a gefnogir gan y Cynulliad, byddwn yn monitro eu heffeithiolrwydd o ran nifer y rhai sy'n manteisio ar hyn a'i boblogrwydd, a byddwn yn gweithio gyda mentrau megis 'belt up school kids' ac Ymgyrch Stuart i sicrhau bod safonau diogelwch uwch, er enghraifft, ar fysiau sy'n cymryd rhan yn y peilot.

**Kirsty Williams:** O gofio'r ffaith eich bod chi a Chyngor Sir Powys yn fodlon cau mwy o ysgolion gwledig yn fy etholaeth i, a warantwch na fyddwch yn ystyried unrhyw gamau gan Gyngor Sir Powys i atal plant rhag cael cludiant i'r ysgol am ddim os teithiant fwy na thair milltir i'r ysgol yn gam ymlaen neu yn ôl? A gydnabyddwch fod manteisio ar nifer o fudd-daliadau mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig, yn enwedig ymhliith teuluoedd sy'n ffermio, yn cael ei ystyried yn warth, ac felly ei bod yn anodd asesu a oes gan rywun incwm isel neu incwm uchel?

**Jane Davidson:** O ran unrhyw gynlluniau peilot a allai gael eu cyflwyno, rhaid inni gofio na fydd unrhyw gynlluniau peilot ar waith tan fis Medi 2007, sydd y tu hwnt i oes y Cynulliad hwn. Byddem am sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol sy'n gwneud cais am gymorth gan y Cynulliad o dan gynllun peilot yn gwbl gyfarwydd â'r holl faterion yn eu hardal hwy.

### Addysg a Hyfforddiant Pellach Further Education and Training

**Q2 Christine Chapman:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to encourage more young people into further education and training? (OAQ39507)

**C2 Christine Chapman:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i annog mwy o bobl ifanc i ddilyn addysg a hyfforddiant pellach? (OAQ39507)

**Jane Davidson:** The Welsh Assembly Government continues to encourage young people to take advantage of all learning opportunities. Our budget proposals will increase funding for Education and Learning Wales, while initiatives such as the educational maintenance allowance and 14-19 learning networks demonstrate our commitment to increasing the numbers of young people in education and training.

**Christine Chapman:** In the most recent Careers Wales school leaver destination statistics, the trend for an increasing number of young people in the former Mid Glamorgan area, to continue in full-time education and training after year 11 has levelled at 71.9 per cent. Yet, in Cynon Valley and Merthyr, the number of young people in this category is below this average. What commitment can you give to ensure that young people in poorer areas such as Cynon Valley and Merthyr will be supported to take advantage of the increasing opportunities in Wales, which you have mentioned?

**Jane Davidson:** We now have in place the new education maintenance allowance scheme. Pupils and college students alike will be able to collect their money in December, as a result of our implementation of the scheme. Also, we have increased support from the careers companies in terms of looking at the appropriate advice for young people. We are particularly keen that young people themselves, even if they do not have a computer at home, should use some of our community provision to access the new Careers Wales Online. With the support of virtual tutors and their schools' and careers companies' specialist advisers, they can be assisted in terms of defining some of their learning routes.

Excitingly, we have the big 14-19 agenda which looks at expanding opportunities and the parity of esteem between vocational and academic routes, with an additional £38 million by 2007 identified to take that agenda forward.

2.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn parhau i annog pobl ifanc i fanteisio ar bob cyfle i ddysgu. Bydd cynigion ein cyllideb yn cynyddu'r cyllid ar gyfer Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru tra bod mentrau fel y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysgol a'r rhwydweithiau dysgu 14-19 yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i gynyddu nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n dilyn addysg a hyfforddiant.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn ôl ystadegau diweddaraf Gyrfa Cymru ar ble y mae pobl ifanc yn mynd ar ôl gadael ysgol, mae'r duedd ymhlið nifer gynyddol o bobl ifanc yn hen ardal Morgannwg Ganol, i barhau mewn addysg a hyfforddiant llawn amser ar ôl blwyddyn 11 wedi gwastatáu ar 71.9 y cant. Ac eto, yng Nghwm Cynon a Merthyr, mae nifer y bobl ifanc yn y categori hwn yn is na'r cyfartaledd. Pa ymrwymiad y gallwch ei roi i sicrhau y caiff pobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd tlotach megis Cwm Cynon a Merthyr eu cefnogi i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd cynyddol yng Nghymru, y bu ichi eu crybwyl?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r cynllun lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg newydd ar waith gennym bellach. Bydd disgylion a myfyrwyr coleg fel ei gilydd yn gallu casglu eu harian ym mis Rhagfyr, o ganlyniad i weithredu'r cynllun. Hefyd, yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r gefnogaeth gan y cwmnïau gyrfaedd o ran edrych ar y cyngor priodol i bobl ifanc. Yr ydym yn arbennig o awyddus y dylai pobl ifanc eu hunain, hyd yn oed os nad oes ganddynt gyfrifiadur gartref, ddefnyddio peth o'r ddarpariaeth gymunedol i fanteisio ar wasanaeth newydd Gyrfa Cymru Ar-lein. Gyda chefnogaeth tiwtoriaid rhithwir a'u hysgolion a chyngorwyr arbenigol cwmnïau gyrfaedd, gellir eu helpu o ran diffinio rhai o'u llwybrau dysgu.

Mae'n gyffrous oherwydd mae gennym yr agenda fawr 14-19 sy'n edrych ar ehangu cyfleoedd a sicrhau parch cyfartal rhwng llwybrau galwedigaethol ac academaidd, gyda £38 miliwn ychwanegol erbyn 2007 wedi ei nodi i ddatblygu'r agenda honno.

**Janet Ryder:** You said in committee that 17-year-olds cannot apply for the education maintenance allowance this year. Had you treated the Order's passage through the Assembly differently, you might have allowed Assembly Members to come forward with a scheme to allow 17-year-olds to apply this year. Is it not a fact that the way in which you have dealt with this whole issue has restricted 17-year-olds in Wales from applying for that allowance this year and, therefore, have cost them money?

**Jane Davidson:** Not at all. As we have said on many occasions in Plenary and in committee, this is part of a wider scheme by the UK Government. I am proud to be a member of the party in the UK Government, which is giving additional money over and above the Assembly budget. The money for the education maintenance allowance does not come out of the Assembly's budget; it is additional money for the young people of Wales as a result of our partnership. You could not deliver that.

**Janet Ryder:** Bu ichi ddweud yn y pwylgor na all pobl ifanc 17 oed wneud cais am y lwfans cynhiliaeth addysg eleni. Pe baech wedi trin hynt y Gorchymyn drwy'r Cynulliad yn wahanol, efallai y byddech wedi gadael i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyflwyno cynllun i ganiatáu i bobl ifanc 17 oed wneud cais eleni. Onid yw'n wir bod y ffordd yr ydych wedi ymdrin â'r holl fater hwn wedi rhwystro pobl ifanc 17 oed yng Nghymru rhag gwneud cais am y lwfans hwnnw eleni, ac felly, wedi costio arian iddynt?

**Jane Davidson:** Ddim o gwbl. Fel y dywedasom sawl gwaith yn y pwylgor ac mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, mae hyn yn rhan o gynllun ehangach gan Lywodraeth y DU. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn aelod o'r blaid yn Llywodraeth y DU, sy'n rhoi arian yn ychwanegol at gyllideb y Cynulliad. Nid yw'r arian ar gyfer y lwfans cynhiliaeth addysg yn dod o gyllideb y Cynulliad; mae'n arian ychwanegol ar gyfer pobl ifanc Cymru o ganlyniad i'n partneriaeth. Ni allech gyflawni hynny.

### Absenoldeb o Ysgolion School Absenteeism

**Q3 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on absenteeism in schools in Wales? (OAQ39496)

**Jane Davidson:** During the last academic year, 9.4 per cent of half-day sessions were missed through authorised and unauthorised absence from secondary schools in Wales, the highest attendance level achieved for this sector. A total of 1.7 per cent of half-day sessions were missed through unauthorised absence. Figures for primary schools will be published in February 2005.

**C3 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar absenoldeb mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru? (OAQ39496)

**Jane Davidson:** Yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf, collwyd 9.4 y cant o sesiynau hanner diwrnod drwy absenoldeb awdurdodedig ac anawdurdodedig o ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru, y lefel presenoldeb uchaf a gyflawnwyd ar gyfer y sector hwn. Collwyd cyfanswm o 1.7 y cant o sesiynau hanner diwrnod drwy absenoldeb anawdurdodedig. Caiff ffigurau ar gyfer ysgolion cynradd eu cyhoeddi ym mis Chwefror 2005.

**Brynle Williams:** Many of my constituents have contacted me to say that their children feel unable to undertake formal qualifications and that they wish to take part in vocational learning. If we do nothing, this will possibly lead to further absenteeism. In light of that, will you agree to launch a pilot scheme on vocational studies for those aged 12 and older, which would provide an excellent

**Brynle Williams:** Mae llawer o'm hetholwyr wedi cysylltu â mi i ddweud bod eu plant yn teimlo na allant ymgymryd â chymwysterau ffurfiol a'u bod am gymryd rhan mewn dysgu galwedigaethol. Os na wnawn unrhyw beth, bydd hyn o bosibl yn arwain at fwy o absenoldebau. Yng ngoleuni hynny, a gytunwch i lansio cynllun peilot ar astudiaethau galwedigaethol i'r rhai 12 oed a

skills base in Wales in the future, make our young people more confident in their schooling and help them to excel in areas where they have a particular talent?

**Jane Davidson:** The curriculum for those aged 11 to 14 is broad and balanced. We have placed substantial additional investment into that to ensure that schools can capitalise on the good performance and attendance figures in our primary schools in Wales. In many ways, the answer to your question is similar to that which I gave to Christine on the 14-19 agenda, which we have been developing with all-party support over the past three years. It is about providing more vocational opportunities and considering how we can introduce industry standard qualifications for pre-16-year-olds that will enable them to move on and view their education as a meaningful part of the next stage of their learning in school or in college. I am happy to respond in terms of the curriculum for those aged 14 and older. Once that is in place, we will consider the impact of the agenda on those within the system who are younger.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that one of the main benefits of providing free school breakfasts in primary schools is that it will increase attendance and, therefore, help to reduce absenteeism?

**Jane Davidson:** There is already strong evidence from the existing breakfast clubs in Wales to indicate that that is the case. I urge all Members to consider that evidence.

**Peter Black:** While we recognise and support the additional money allocated for electronic registration, do you not accept that sometimes alternative curriculum measures can also have an effect on absenteeism? Will you consider increasing the funding from the Assembly Government for such measures, as part of your approach to tackle this issue?

**Jane Davidson:** The 14-19 agenda is about not having an alternative curriculum and providing one that is more fit for purpose for a wider cohort of young people in the education system. That is why the advice

hŷn, a fyddai'n darparu sail sgiliau ragorol yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, gan wneud ein pobl ifanc yn fwy hyderus yn yr ysgol a'u helpu i ragori mewn meysydd lle mae ganddynt dalent benodol?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r cwricwlwm i'r rhai 11 i 14 oed yn eang a chytwys. Yr ydym wedi gwneud buddsoddiad ychwanegol sylweddol i sicrhau y gall ysgolion fanteisio ar y ffigurau perfformiad a phresenoldeb da yn ein hysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru. Mewn sawl ffordd, mae'r ateb i'ch cwestiwn yn debyg i'r un a roddais i Christine ar yr agenda 14-19, y buom yn ei datblygu gyda chefnogaeth pob plaid dros y tair blynedd diwethaf. Mae a wnelo â darparu mwy o gylleoedd galwedigaethol ac ystyried ffyrdd y gallwn gyflwyno cymwysterau safon y diwydiant i bobl ifanc cyn iddynt gyrraedd 16 oed a fydd yn eu galluogi i symud ymlaen ac ystyried eu haddysg yn rhan ystyrion o'r cam nesaf o'u dysgu yn yr ysgol neu'r coleg. Yr wyf yn fodlon ymateb o ran y cwricwlwm i'r rhai 14 oed a hŷn. Pan fydd hynny ar waith, byddwn yn ystyried effaith yr agenda ar y rhai o fewn y system sy'n iau.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytunwch mai un o brif fanteision darparu brecwast ysgol am ddim mewn ysgolion cynradd yw y bydd mwy o blant yn bresennol ac, felly, bydd hyn yn helpu i leihau absenoldeb?

**Jane Davidson:** Eisoes mae dystiolaeth gref gan y clybiau brecwast presennol yng Nghymru yn nodi mai felly y mae. Anogaf pob Aelod i ystyried y dystiolaeth honno.

**Peter Black:** Er inni gydnabod a chefnogi'r arian ychwanegol sy'n cael ei ddyrannu ar gyfer cofrestru electronig, oni dderbyniwch y gall mesurau amgen y cwricwlwm gael effaith ar absenoldeb hefyd weithiau? A ystyriwch gynyddu'r cyllid gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer mesurau o'r fath, fel rhan o'ch ffordd i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae a wnelo'r agenda 14-19 â pheidio â chael cwricwlwm amgen a darparu un sy'n fwy addas at y diben i garfan ehangach o bobl ifanc yn y system addysg. Dyna pam y mae'r cyngor a roddir gan

given by the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales in its proposals for five to 16-year-olds carefully considers this issue. I am sure that you, like me, look forward to more detailed advice from ACCAC for us to consider in the future.

Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru yn ei gynigion ar gyfer plant pump i 16 oed yn ystyried y mater hwn yn ofalus. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi, fel fi, yn edrych ymlaen at gael cyngor manylach gan ACCAC inni ei ystyried yn y dyfodol.

### **Prentisiaethau yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy Apprenticeships in Alyn and Deeside**

**Q4 Carl Sargeant:** Would the Minister make a statement on apprenticeships in Alyn and Deeside? (OAQ39492)

**Jane Davidson:** Education and Learning Wales provides funding for apprenticeship programmes, which are supported through its network of providers. Deeside and Yale colleges provide significant support for apprentices at major employers such as Airbus by providing engineering and aeronautical training up to higher national certificate level qualifications.

**Carl Sargeant:** Will you agree to work with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to increase training provision in the Airbus industry in my constituency of Alyn and Deeside? As the funding body for the apprenticeship scheme, ELWa is key to the delivery of future improvements, so could you confirm the increase in grant in aid that will enable it to take this forward?

**Jane Davidson:** Following your meeting with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport and senior management at Airbus on 11 November, there are exciting prospects for the expansion of the apprenticeship programme. I know that ELWa has offered Airbus its full support in developing a business case.

On the second part of your question, the funding increases are as follows: as I reported to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee on 10 November, the indicative plans for ELWa increase by 5 per cent in 2005-06 and a further 6 per cent over the following two years. In my answer to Alun Ffred Jones on 13 October, I interpreted this as 6 per cent in each of the following two years, but corrected this in committee on 10

**C4 Carl Sargeant:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar brentisiaethau yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? (OAQ39492)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn darparu cyllid ar gyfer rhaglenni prentisiaethau, a gefnogir drwy ei rwydwaith o ddarparwyr. Mae colegau Glannau Dyfrdwy ac Iâl yn rhoi cymorth sylwedol i brentisiaethau sy'n gweithio i gyflogwyr mawr megis Airbus drwy ddarparu hyfforddiant peirianyddol ac awyrennol hyd at gymwysterau lefel dystysgrif genedlaethol uwch.

**Carl Sargeant:** A gytunwch i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i gynyddu'r ddarpariaeth o ran hyfforddiant yn y diwydiant Airbus yn fy etholaeth i sef Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy? Fel y corff ariannu ar gyfer y cynllun prentisiaethau, mae ELWa yn allweddol i sicrhau gwelliannau yn y dyfodol, felly a allech gadarnhau'r cynnydd yn y cymorth grant a fydd yn ei alluogi i ddatblygu hyn?

**Jane Davidson:** Yn dilyn eich cyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ac uwch reolwyr yn Airbus ar 11 Tachwedd, mae rhagolygon cyffrous ar gyfer ehangu'r rhaglen prentisiaethau. Gwn fod ELWa wedi cynnig ei gefnogaeth lawn i Airbus wrth ddatblygu achos busnes.

O ran ail ran eich cwestiwn, mae'r cynnydd mewn cyllid fel a ganlyn: fel y soniais wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 10 Tachwedd, mae'r cynlluniau dangosol ar gyfer ELWa yn cynyddu 5 y cant yn 2005-06 a 6 y cant pellach dros y ddwy flynedd ganlynol. Yn fy ateb i Alun Ffred Jones ar 13 Hydref, dehonglais hyn fel 6 y cant ym mhob un o'r ddwy flynedd ganlynol, ond cywirwyd hyn yn y pwylgor ar 10 Tachwedd. Y

November. The actual increases are 4 per cent in 2006-07 and 2 per cent in 2007-08, but that 2 per cent does not reflect the additional £38 million for the development of the 14 to 19 agenda.

**Mark Isherwood:** Many Deeside apprentices will welcome the news that Wrexham Football Club has been given a stay of execution by the High Court. Moving on from that, the apprenticeship scheme at Airbus, in partnership with Deeside College, is a great model of best practice. Nonetheless, the majority of apprenticeship applicants fail because of a lack of basic skills. There are now 65,000 young people who are economically inactive across Wales. What impact will the recent increase in Welsh economic inactivity have on young people who are not in work or education in Alyn and Deeside, and across north Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** ELWa has provided a training grant of £4.9 million to train apprentices in Airbus. The 2001 intake of apprentices, totalling 100, completed their training this month. Since 2001, ELWa has supported the training of over 370 apprentices at Airbus, and ELWa exceeded its all-Wales target of 14,000 people undergoing modern apprenticeships or the related modern skills diploma for adults at the end of 2003-04. The picture of modern apprenticeships in Wales is good.

cynnydd gwirioneddol yw 4 y cant yn 2006-07 a 2 y cant yn 2007-08, ond nid yw'r 2 y cant hwnnw yn ystyried y £38 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer datblygu'r agenda 14 i 19.

**Mark Isherwood:** Bydd llawer o brentisiaid Glannau Dyfrdwy yn croesawu'r newyddion bod yr Uchel Lys wedi gohirio gweithredu mewn perthynas â Chlwb Pêl-droed Wrecsam. Gan symud ymlaen o hynny, mae'r cynllun prentisiaeth yn Airbus, mewn partneriaeth â Choleg Glannau Dyfrdwy, yn fodel gwych o arfer gorau. Serch hynny, mae'r mwyafrif o ymgeiswyr am brentisiaethau yn methu oherwydd diffyg sgiliau sylfaenol. Bellach mae 65,000 o bobl ifanc yn economaidd anweithgar ledled Cymru. Pa effaith a gaiff y cynnydd diweddar o ran anweithgarwch economaidd Cymru ar bobl ifanc nad ydynt yn gweithio nac mewn addysg yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, a ledled y Gogledd?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae ELWa wedi darparu grant hyfforddi o £4.9 miliwn i hyfforddi prentisiaid yn Airbus. Cwblhaodd y prentisiaid a ddechreuodd yn 2001, sef 100 ohonynt, eu hyfforddiant y mis hwn. Ers 2001, mae ELWa wedi cefnogi hyfforddi dros 370 o brentisiaid yn Airbus, ac aeth ELWa y tu hwnt i'w darged ar gyfer Cymru gyfan o 14,000 o bobl yn gwneud prentisiaethau modern neu'r diploma sgiliau modern cysylltiedig i oedolion ar ddiwedd 2003-04. Mae'r darlun o brentisiaethau modern yng Nghymru yn dda.

### Cynlluniau i Ad-drefnu Ysgolion Plans to Reorganise Schools

**Q5 Glyn Davies:** What discussions has the Minister had with Carmarthenshire County Council about its plans to reorganise schools? (OAQ39480)

**Jane Davidson:** I met representatives of the authority on 11 November, and I was given a briefing on the general direction of their plans for investment in school buildings, as part of a wider meeting on education policy in the county. The authority gave a commitment that it would work within Assembly guidelines on reorganisation proposals. No individual proposals were

**C5 Glyn Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin ynghylch ei gynlluniau i ad-drefnu ysgolion? (OAQ39480)

**Jane Davidson:** Cyfarfum â chynrychiolwyr yr awdurdod ar 11 Tachwedd, a rhoddwyd gwybodaeth imi ar gyfeiriad cyffredinol eu cynlluniau ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion, fel rhan o gyfarfod ehangach ar bolisi addysg yn y sir. Rhoddodd yr awdurdod ymrwymiad y byddai'n gweithio o fewn canllawiau'r Cynulliad ar gynigion ad-drefnu. Ni thrafodwyd unrhyw

discussed.

**Glyn Davies:** It seems that the council's reorganisation plans could lead to the closure of up to 30 schools in Carmarthenshire—that is what has been reported. What guidance did you give to the council? I am pleased that you met its representatives on 11 November, but what guidance did you give on your opinion, and, indeed, what is your opinion? Although this is a matter for the council, and the councillors must be answerable to the electorate—we all accept that—surely, on such an important and fundamental issue, you must have given the councillors some indication of your view. Will you share that view and the guidance that you gave with us?

**Jane Davidson:** I recognise the need for authorities to address the pressing issue of the poor state of their school buildings. Carmarthenshire looked at issues concerning school buildings under the previous authority, and the evidence demonstrates that, of its 133 primary schools, 14 had no indoor toilets, 50 had no school communal areas such as a hall, 57 had no adequate playing fields, 38 had mobile classrooms, and 102 had no designated early-years accommodation. Clearly, at the beginning of the twenty-first century, the authority needs to address these issues. My guidance was that it needed to address these issues in the context of Assembly guidance.

**Christine Gwyther:** It is fair to say that no-one likes change, and I have spent a lot of time with the parents and teachers of the schools that have been threatened with closure in my constituency. Will you join me in congratulating the schoolteachers, parents and pupils of Ysgol Bro Brynach in Llanboidy, which had its official opening last weekend? The curriculum is being delivered in a wonderful new building, in a lovely setting, and in a fine atmosphere. Will you join me in congratulating those people?

2.50 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** The new Ysgol Bro Brynach is the result of bringing together the

gynigion unigol.

**Glyn Davies:** Ymddengys y gallai cynlluniau ad-drefnu'r cyngor arwain at gau hyd at 30 o ysgolion yn sir Gaerfyrddin—dyna a gofnodwyd. Pa ganllawiau a roesoch i'r cyngor? Yr wyf yn falch ichi gyfarfod â'i gynrychiolwyr ar 11 Tachwedd, ond pa ganllawiau a roesoch ar eich barn, ac, yn wir, beth yw eich barn? Er mai mater i'r cyngor yw hyn, a rhaid i'r cynghorwyr fod yn atebol i'r etholwyr—mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn hynny—mae'n siŵr, ar fater mor bwysig a sylfaenol, ichi roi rhyw awgrym o'ch barn i'r cynghorwyr. A rannwch y farn honno a'r canllawiau a roesoch iddynt gyda ni?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr angen i awdurdodau fynd i'r afael â mater pwysig cyflwr gwael eu hadeiladau ysgolion. Edrychodd sir Gaerfyrddin ar faterion yn ymwneud ag adeiladau ysgolion o dan yr awdurdod blaenorol a dengys y dystiolaeth, o'i 133 o ysgolion cynradd, nad oedd gan 14 ohonynt doiledau o fewn yr ysgol, nad oedd gan 50 o'r ysgolion unrhyw ardaloedd cyffredin megis neuadd, nad oedd gan 57 ohonynt feisydd chwarae digonol, fod gan 38 ohonynt ystafelloedd symudol ac nad oedd ystafelloedd penodedig ar gyfer y blynnyddoedd cynnar mewn 102 o ysgolion. Yn amlwg, ar ddechrau'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, mae angen i'r awdurdod ymdrin â'r materion hyn. Yn ôl fy nghanllawiau i, yr oedd angen iddo ymdrin â'r materion hyn yng nghyd-destun canllawiau'r Cynulliad.

**Christine Gwyther:** Mae'n deg dweud nad oes unrhyw un yn hoffi newid, ac yr wyf wedi treulio llawer o amser gyda rhieni ac athrawon yr ysgolion yn fy etholaeth sydd mewn perygl o gau. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch athrawon, rhieni a disgylion Ysgol Bro Brynach yn Llanboidy, a agorodd yn swyddogol y penwythnos diwethaf? Mae'r cwricwlwm yn cael ei gyflwyno mewn adeilad newydd gwych, mewn lleoliad hyfryd ac mewn awyrgylch braf. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y bobl hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Daeth Ysgol Bro Brynach newydd i fod drwy uno ysgolion Cwm-bach,

schools of Cwm-bach, Henllan Amgoed, Llangynin and Llanboidy. I can confirm that the 200 to 300 parents who attended the opening on Saturday were extremely happy with the new school, which has facilities for adults as well as separate nursery provision.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O edrych ar y broses, yr ydym yn sôn am gynllun dros 10 mlynedd ac am fuddsoddiad posibl o £10 miliwn yng ngwasanaeth addysg sir Gaerfyrddin. Mae pawb yn croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn gynllun enfawr a allai arwain at gau hyd at 40 o ysgolion yn y sir. A yw'n dderbyniol bod cabinet Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn ceisio gwthio'r cynllun drwy'r cyngor drwy gael cynghorwyr i gytuno mewn egwyddor cyn bwrrw ymlaen â'r cynllun heb ymgynghori'n llawn gyda'r cynghorwyr sydd, wedi'r cyfan, yn cynrychioli cymunedau'r sir?

**Jane Davidson:** I need to make it clear that a strategy is the responsibility of a local authority—that is its job. Any proper proposals for changes to the schools estate require their own consultation using Assembly guidelines. Members will know that if we are not satisfied with the way in which consultation has been handled, proposals will not be supported. There are statutory consultation mechanisms to be used.

#### **Manteisio ar Grantiau Dysgu'r Cynulliad** **The Take-up of Assembly Learning Grants**

**Q6 Jeff Cuthbert:** Would the Minister make a statement on the take-up of Assembly learning grants? (OAQ39449)

**Jane Davidson:** Figures published on 20 October show that there was a 13 per cent increase in applications during the last academic year of 2002-03 and a 9 per cent increase in successful allocations. This meant that some 20,600 students were awarded an Assembly learning grant. Particularly encouraging was the increase of 28 per cent in the number of further education students who successfully applied for the grant.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Do you agree that our record on Assembly learning grants along with our

Henllan Amgoed, Llangynin a Llanboidy. Gallaf gadarnhau bod y 200 i 300 o rieni a ddaeth i'r agoriad ddydd Sadwrn yn eithriadol o fodlon ar yr ysgol newydd, sydd â chyfleusterau i oedolion yn ogystal â darpariaeth ar wahân ar gyfer meithrinfa.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** To focus on the process, we are talking about a 10-year scheme and a possible investment of £10 million in Carmarthenshire's education service, which everyone welcomes. However, this is a major scheme that could lead to the closure of up to 40 schools in the county. Is it acceptable that the cabinet of Carmarthenshire County Council is trying to force the scheme through by trying to get councillors to agree in principle before proceeding with the scheme without full consultation with the very councillors who represent the county's communities?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae angen imi egluro mai cyfrifoldeb awdurdod lleol yw strategaeth—dyna ei waith. Mae angen iddynt gynnal eu hymgyngoriad eu hunain gan ddefnyddio canllawiau'r Cynulliad ar gyfer unrhyw gynigion priodol i newid ystad ysgol. Bydd Aelodau yn gwybod, os nad ydym yn fodlon ar y ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r ymgynghori, na chaiff y cynigion eu cefnogi. Mae dulliau ymgynghori statudol i'w defnyddio.

**C6 Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y niferoedd sydd wedi manteisio ar grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad? (OAQ39449)

**Jane Davidson:** Dengys y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd ar 20 Hydref fod cynnydd o 13 y cant wedi bod mewn ceisiadau yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf sef 2002-03 a chynnydd o 9 y cant mewn dyraniadau llwyddiannus. Golygai hyn i tua 20,600 o fyfyrwyr gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd y cynnydd o 28 y cant yn nifer y myfyrwyr addysg bellach a wnaeth gais llwyddiannus ar gyfer y grant yn arbennig o galonogol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A gytunwch fod ein record ar grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad ynghyd â'n

plans for education maintenance allowances show that Labour in Wales and in the UK gives priority to the needs of learners? Furthermore, do you agree that, while opposition parties squabble about rules and procedures, we are delivering for learners, especially those in greatest need?

**Jane Davidson:** It is true to say that Assembly learning grants, education maintenance allowances, individual learning accounts and company learning accounts are all part of a social justice agenda. We are determined to put in place, wherever possible, financial measures to encourage people either into learning, to stay in learning or to return to learning.

**Eleanor Burnham:** That is all very well, but, given the fact that you always stress the importance of using evidence-based information, why is it that, despite evidence of a 13 per cent increase in demand for this demand-led budget, you are greatly reducing the funding?

**Jane Davidson:** We are not reducing the funding, as has been explained to you, to your leader and to the Chair of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee previously. In the first year, we allocated a large budget to Assembly learning grants. With a demand-led budget, you do not know how many people will take up the opportunity available to them. When we discovered that the budget allocation was greater than the provision needed for the numbers taking up the opportunity, we moved money from the budget. However, this does not in any way decrease the opportunity. Anyone who is eligible for an Assembly learning grant in the further or higher education sectors will receive funding from the Welsh Assembly Government. I hope that you will not continue to be mischievous in deliberately misrepresenting this outcome. I also hope that you will ensure that your constituents, like mine, know that this funding is available to anyone eligible for an Assembly learning grant.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. No Members deliberately misrepresent, Minister.

cynlluniau ar gyfer lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg yn dangos bod Llafur yng Nghymru ac yn y DU yn rhoi blaenoraieth i anghenion dysgwyr? At hynny, a gytunwch, er bod y gwrthbleidiau yn cweryla ynglŷn â rheolau a gweithdrefnau, ein bod yn cyflawni ar gyfer dysgwyr, yn enwedig y rhai sydd â'r angen mwyaf?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n wir dweud bod grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad, lwfansau cynhaliaeth addysg, cyfrifon dysgu unigol a chyfrifon dysgu cwmniau oll yn rhan o agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o roi mesurau ariannol ar waith, lle y bo'n bosibl, i annog pobl i ddechrau dysgu neu i barhau i ddysgu neu i ddychwelyd i ddysgu.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae hynny'n iawn, ond, o gofio eich bod bob amser yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd defnyddio gwybodaeth ar sail tystiolaeth, pam yr ydych yn lleihau'r cyllid yn sylweddol, er gwaetha'r dystiolaeth o gynnydd o 13 y cant yn y galw am y gyllideb hon sy'n cael ei harwain gan y galw?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid ydym yn lleihau'r cyllid, fel yr eglurwyd i chi, i'ch arweinydd ac i Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o'r blaen. Yn y flwyddyn gyntaf, bu inni ddyrannu cyllideb fawr i grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad. Gyda chyllideb sy'n cael ei harwain gan y galw, ni wyddoch faint o bobl a fydd yn manteisio ar y cyfle sydd ar gael iddynt. Pan ddarganfuwyd bod dyraniad y gyllideb yn fwy na'r ddarpariaeth yr oedd ei hangen ar gyfer y nifer a oedd yn manteisio ar y cyfle, bu inni dynnu arian o'r gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hyn mewn unrhyw ffordd yn lleihau'r cyfle. Bydd unrhyw un sy'n gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad yn y sector addysg bellach neu addysg uwch yn cael cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gobeithiaf na fyddwch yn parhau i fod yn ddrygionus drwy gamgyfleu'r canlyniad hwn yn fwriadol. Gobeithiaf hefyd y byddwch yn sicrhau bod eich etholwyr yn gwybod, fel fy etholwyr innau, fod y cyllid hwn ar gael i unrhyw un sy'n gymwys i gael grant dysgu'r Cynulliad.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes unrhyw Aelod yn camgyfleu'n fwriadol, Weinidog.

**Jane Davidson:** I am grateful for your ruling. I am considering what word I could use in response to a Member who has deliberately continued to represent the policy inaccurately.

**The Presiding Officer:** I do not think much of that.

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich dyfarniad. Yr wyf yn ystyried pa air y gallwn ei ddefnyddio mewn ymateb i Aelod sydd wedi parhau i gyfleu'r polisi yn anghywir yn fwriadol.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid wyf yn rhyw fodlon ar hynny.

### Addysg Anghenion Arbennig Special-Needs Education

**Q7 Alun Cairns:** Would the Minister make a statement on special education needs? (OAQ39452)

**Jane Davidson:** The general situation has not changed since I responded to your previous question on this issue on 25 February. The special educational needs code of practice for Wales 2002 outlines the statutory framework in relation to meeting the needs of children and young people with special educational needs. I established the national steering group Wales to review specific aspects of special educational needs, and several consultation documents have already been issued.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the Minister recognise that an increased number of litigation cases are being brought against local education authorities and that she is in a position to take a strategic view to support those authorities and, more importantly, to do so in the interests of children's welfare and to save the taxpayer cost in the long term? Will she support increased funding to the General Teaching Council for Wales to fund specific training to enable teachers to identify special educational needs at a much earlier stage?

**Jane Davidson:** We have been taking a strategic approach to the issue of special educational needs. We have ensured that we know all the issues in all parts of Wales, and I am extremely grateful that the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's research will enable us to take that strategic response further. I was interested to see that the Estyn report published in June this year noted that most local authorities state in their strategic plans that they aim to reduce statements. We know that statementing is important in the special educational needs agenda, and we

**C7 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar addysg anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru? (OAQ39452)

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw'r sefyllfa gyffredinol wedi newid ers imi ymateb i'ch cwestiwn blaenorol ar y mater hwn ar 25 Chwefror. Mae cod ymarfer anghenion addysgol arbennig Cymru 2002 yn amlinellu'r fframwaith statudol mewn perthynas â diwallu anghenion plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Sefydlais grŵp llywio cenedlaethol Cymru i adolygu agweddau penodol ar anghenion addysgol arbennig, ac mae sawl dogfen ymgynghori eisoes wedi cael ei chyhoeddi.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod nifer gynyddol o achosion o ymgyfreitha yn cael eu dwyn yn erbyn awdurdodau addysg lleol a'i bod mewn sefyllfa i arddel barn strategol i gefnogi'r awdurdodau hynny ac, yn bwysicach na hynny, i wneud hynny er budd plant ac arbed cost i'r trethdalwyr yn yr hirdymor? A wnaiff gefnogi cyllid cynyddol i Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru i ariannu hyfforddiant penodol i alluogi athrawon i nodi anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gynharach o lawer?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd strategol tuag at anghenion addysgol arbennig. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau ein bod yn gwybod am bob mater ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ac yr wyf yn hynod ddiolchgar y bydd ymchwil y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ein galluogi i ddatblygu'r ymateb strategol hwnnw ymhellach. Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf weld bod yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Estyn ym mis Mehefin eleni yn nodi bod y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn nodi yn eu cynlluniau strategol eu bod yn anelu at leihau

will continue to work with local authorities in ensuring that they deliver the best provision.

On specific support and training for special educational needs teachers, I was interested to meet a young teacher from Coleg Gwent earlier this week. She had gone on to do teacher training in Newport, and she told me that her college, for example, encouraged primary school teachers to take the specialist course on special educational needs in order to become particularly job-worthy for the future. That was a positive statement. We will consider some of these issues in terms of our overall review of initial teacher training.

datganiadau. Gwyddom fod rhoi datganiadau yn bwysig yn yr agenda anghenion addysgol arbennig, a byddwn yn parhau i weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn rhoi'r ddarpariaeth orau.

O ran cymorth a hyfforddiant penodol ar diddorol oedd cwrdd ag athrawes ifanc o Goleg Gwent yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Yr oedd wedi mynd ymlaen i hyfforddi fel athrawes yng Nghasnewydd, a dywedodd wrthyf fod ei choleg, er enghraifft, yn annog athrawon ysgol gynradd i ddewis y cwrs arbenigol ar anghenion addysgol arbennig er mwyn meddu ar fwy o gyfleusteriau addas ar gyfer swyddi yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd hynny'n ddatganiad cadarnhaol. Byddwn yn ystyried rhai o'r materion hyn o ran ein hadolygiad cyffredinol o hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon.

### Cyrsiau Addysg Bellach Cyfrwng Cymraeg Welsh-medium Further Education Courses

**Q8 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about the availability of further education courses through the medium of Welsh? (OAQ39476)

**Jane Davidson:** ELWa inherited a mixture of activities from its predecessors, with pockets of strengths in certain areas. Through its activities, ELWa is laying firm foundations for improving delivery and widening opportunities for post-16 learners to learn through the medium of Welsh, not only in further education, but also in work-based training settings.

**Helen Mary Jones:** When ELWa comes under your direct control, will you take personal responsibility for ensuring that courses that colleges claim are Welsh-medium or bilingual, include Welsh-language delivery of learning and are not just English-language courses packaged with some social use of Welsh, which unfortunately is often the case at present?

**Jane Davidson:** I will want to ensure that, in response to our 'Iaith Pawb' objectives, we have a long-term strategy for non-higher-

**C8 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch y cyrsiau addysg bellach sydd ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg? (OAQ39476)

**Jane Davidson:** Etifeddodd ELWa gymysgedd o weithgareddau oddi wrth ei ragflaenwyr, gyda chryfderau mewn rhai meysydd. Drwy ei weithgareddau, mae ELWa yn gosod sylfeini cadarn ar gyfer gwella'r gwaith a gyflawnir ganddo ac ehangu cyfleoedd ar gyfer dysgwyr ôl-16 i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, nid yn unig mewn addysg bellach, ond hefyd mewn lleoliadau hyfforddiant seiliedig ar waith.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pan ddaw ELWa o dan eich rheolaeth uniongyrchol, a wnewch chi'n bersonol ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros sicrhau bod cyrsiau y mae colegau yn honni eu bod yn cael eu cynnal drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu eu bod yn gyrsiau dwyieithog, yn cael eu cyflwyno yn Gymraeg yn hytrach na chael eu cyflwyno yn Saesneg gyda rhywfaint o ddefnydd cymdeithasol o'r Gymraeg, sydd, yn anffodus, yn digwydd aml ar hyn o bryd?

**Jane Davidson:** Byddaf am sicrhau, mewn ymateb i amcanion 'Iaith Pawb', fod gennym strategaeth hirdymor ar gyfer darpariaeth

education, post-16 provision that delivers the kind of outcomes that we want.

**Lisa Francis:** I understand that Estyn and the National Foundation for Educational Research reports note that Welsh for adults is currently underfunded. That would include Wlpan-type immersion courses. The NFER report recommends doubling the financial allocation for Welsh for adults. ‘Iaith Pawb’, which you have mentioned, aims for a 5 per cent increase in the number of Welsh speakers by the next census. How will this be possible if ELWa does not adhere to the NFER report? Why has ELWa decided not to follow those recommendations, and what do you intend to do about that as Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning?

**Jane Davidson:** We may wish to look at the consultation on restructuring Welsh courses for adults, which was issued by ELWA on 1 November. That will finish on 7 January 2005, and you may wish to give me your responses to that.

addysg ôl-16 nad yw'n addysg uwch sy'n arwain at y math o ganlyniadau yr ydym am eu cael.

**Lisa Francis:** Deallaf fod adroddiadau Estyn a'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol er Ymchwil i Addysg yn nodi bod y ddarpariaeth o ran Cymraeg i oedolion wedi ei thanariannu ar hyn o bryd. Byddai hynny'n cynnwys cyrsiau dwys ar ffurf Wlpan. Mae adroddiad SCYA yn argymhell dyblu'r dyraniad ariannol ar gyfer Cymraeg i oedolion. Mae ‘Iaith Pawb’, y bu ichi ei chrybwyl, yn anelu at gynnydd o 5 y cant yn nifer y bobl sy'n siarad Cymraeg erbyn y cyfrifiad nesaf. Sut y bydd hyn yn bosibl os na fydd ELWa yn glynu wrth adroddiad SCYA? Pam mae ELWa wedi penderfynu peidio â dilyn yr argymhellion hynny, a beth y bwriadwch ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny fel y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes?

**Jane Davidson:** Efallai y byddwn am edrych ar yr ymgynghoriad ar ailstrwythuro cyrsiau Cymraeg i oedolion, a gyhoeddwyd gan ELWA ar 1 Tachwedd. Bydd hynny'n dod i ben ar 7 Ionawr 2005, ac efallai yr hoffech roi eich ymatebion i hynny imi.

## Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

### Brechlynnau BCG yn Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig BCG vaccines at Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of bacille calmette-guerin vaccines at Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig in Aberystwyth? (EAQ40033)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I am glad to answer this question.

3.00 p.m.

One hundred and six children were immunised against tuberculosis at Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig in Aberystwyth yesterday. One child later experienced breathing difficulties and 12 children reported feeling faint and unwell. All were taken to hospital, where one is being treated for anaphylaxis—a severe allergy. The other pupils have been

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y defnydd o frechlyn bacille calmette-guerin yn Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig, Aberystwyth? (EAQ40033)

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'n bleser gennylf ateb y cwestiwn hwn.

Cafodd 106 o blant eu himiwneiddio rhag twbercwlosis yn Ysgol Gyfun Penweddig yn Aberystwyth ddoe. Ar ôl hynny, cafodd un plentyn anawsterau anadlu, a nododd 12 o blant eu bod yn teimlo'n wanllyd ac yn sâl. Aethpwyd â phob un ohonynt i'r ysbyty, lle y mae un yn cael ei drin ar gyfer anaffylacsis—alergedd difrifol. Mae'r disgylion eraill

discharged. The national public health service is investigating the circumstances, and initial indications are that there are no grounds for suspecting that there is a fault with this batch of vaccine. I am glad to report that the child who remains in hospital is recovering well.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to the Minister for that answer. It is indeed the case that 12 pupils were admitted to Bronglais Hospital and that three have been discharged today. Dominic Hamer remains in hospital, but he is off the ventilator. As the Minister indicated, he is recovering—he has had lunch today. Although the batch in question has been isolated locally, I understand that it has not been isolated nationally and the Department of Health is continuing to vaccinate with this batch. I seek your reassurance that there are no implications from that. Clearly, we should be erring on the side of public safety. The teachers and the emergency services in Aberystwyth, and the ambulance service in particular, acted speedily—the school is close to the hospital—and I pay tribute to them for that. However, there are more serious concerns if this batch is still being used elsewhere in Wales or the United Kingdom.

Will the Minister also give her assurance that her officials are giving advice on the telephone, as appropriate? I know that that is happening in Ceredigion, and the information service for pupils and parents is operating efficiently. It is important that the vaccination programme continues, as it is clearly doing in Ceredigion, and it is important that we send out a message that this vaccination programme is important everywhere in the UK. A clear public health message must be conveyed that it is an important vaccine to combat the dreadful disease of TB. However, I seek reassurance from the Minister specifically on the batch that is still being used throughout the UK, and on the information issue.

**Jane Hutt:** This batch of vaccine has already been used extensively, as you know, without any reaction of this kind. I highlight the important role of the Medicines and

wedi'u rhyddhau o'r ysbyty. Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol yn ymchwilio, a dengys yr arwyddion cynnar nad oes sail dros amau bod y set hon o'r brechlyn yn ddiffygol. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi bod y plentyn sy'n dal i fod yn yr ysbyty yn gwella.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae'n wir i 12 o ddisgyblion gael eu derbyn i Ysbyty Bronglais a bod tri ohonynt wedi'u rhyddhau o'r ysbyty heddiw. Mae Dominic Hamer yn dal i fod yn yr ysbyty, ond nid yw ar y gwyntiedydd mwyach. Fel y nododd y Gweinidog, mae'n gwella—mae wedi cael cinio heddiw. Er bod y set dan sylw wedi'i nodi a'i thynnau'n ôl yn lleol, deallaf nad yw hynny wedi digwydd yn genedlaethol ac mae'r Adran Iechyd yn parhau i ddefnyddio'r set hon o'r brechlyn. Gofynnaf ichi ein sicrhau nad oes unrhyw oblygiadau i hynny. Mae'n amlwg y dylem roi blaenoriaeth i ddiogelwch y cyhoedd. Cymerodd yr athrawon a'r gwasanaethau brys yn Aberystwyth, a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn benodol, gamau cyflym—mae'r ysgol yn agos at yr ysbyty—a thalaf deyrnged iddynt am wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae pryderon mwy difrifol os yw'r set hon yn cael ei defnyddio o hyd mewn mannau eraill yng Nghymru neu'r Deyrnas Unedig.

A all y Gweinidog ein sicrhau hefyd fod ei swyddogion yn rhoi cyngor ar y ffôn, fel y bo'n briodol? Gwn fod hynny'n digwydd yng Ngheredigion, ac mae'r gwasanaeth gwybodaeth i ddisgyblion a rhieni yn gweithredu'n effeithlon. Mae'n bwysig bod y rhaglen frechu yn parhau, ac mae'n amlwg bod hynny'n digwydd yng Ngheredigion, ac mae'n bwysig inni gyfleo'r neges bod y rhaglen frechu hon yn bwysig ym mhob man yn y DU. Rhaid cyfleo neges iechyd cyhoeddus glir fod hwn yn frechlyn pwysig i fynd i'r afael â TB, sy'n glefyd ofnadwy. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ein sicrhau'n benodol o ran y set sy'n dal i gael ei defnyddio ledled y DU, ac ar y wybodaeth a ddarperir.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r set hon o'r brechlyn wedi'i defnyddio'n helaeth eisoes, fel y gwyddoch, heb unrhyw adwaith o'r math hwn. Pwysleisiaf rôl bwysig yr Asiantaeth

Healthcare Products Regulatory Agency. The agency must involve itself immediately in such circumstances—there is a yellow card scheme for any adverse reactions, and its initial assessment is that this is an isolated incident and that there is no reason to suspect a problem with the vaccine. However, it is monitoring the situation carefully and will take appropriate action if necessary. It is key that we follow that monitoring through with information for the public and the Assembly. These vaccines are extensively tested by their manufacturers, prior to licensing, for quality, safety and efficacy. Manufacturers must also submit samples of each batch and the results of their own tests for independent assessment before that batch can be released. The monitoring safety of all marketed medicines lies with the MHRA, but the national public health service in Wales, working with the Department of Health, is now monitoring this closely.

I am glad that your response has been about how this has been dealt with locally and the positive way in which parents have been informed and how the school and the hospital have managed this problem. I am also grateful that you recognise the importance of this programme. The risks of serious illness following natural infection far outweigh any possible risk from a vaccine with regard to TB. Anaphylaxis following immunisation is very rare—0.65 to 3 cases per 1 million doses. TB is a fatal illness and immunisation is vital, but we must ensure that concerns are fully aired and that they are dealt with in the public domain.

**Brian Gibbons:** There is no doubt that anaphylaxis is a frightening and serious reaction, but thankfully, it is exceedingly rare. As you said, the benefits of vaccination far outweigh the risks. However, do you believe that this is an opportunity to fully investigate this issue, with a view to giving proper reassurance about the general safety of vaccination, if that can be given? Is it also an opportunity to reinforce the importance that all people in giving vaccinations remain

Rheoleiddio Meddyginaethau a Chynhyrchion Gofal Iechyd yn hyn o beth. Rhaid i'r asiantaeth ymateb i amgylchiadau o'r fath ar unwaith—mae cynllun cerdyn melyn ar gyfer unrhyw adweithiau niweidiol, a'i hasesiad cychwynnol yw mai digwyddiad unigryw yw hwn ac nad oes unrhyw reswm dros amau bod problem gyda'r brechlyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n monitro'r sefyllfa yn ofalus a bydd yn cymryd camau priodol yn ôl yr angen. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn ategu'r gwaith monitro hwnnw drwy roi gwybodaeth i'r cyhoedd a'r Cynulliad. Caiff y brechlynnau hyn eu profi'n sylweddol gan eu gweithgynhyrchwyr, cyn eu trwyddedu, o ran eu hansawdd, eu diogelwch a'u heffeithlonrwydd. Rhaid i weithgynhyrchwyr gyflwyno samplau o bob set a chanlyniadau eu profion eu hunain er mwyn cynnal asesiad annibynnol hefyd cyn y gellir rhyddhau'r set honno. Yr asiantaeth rheoleiddio sy'n gyfrifol am fonitro diogelwch yr holl feddyginaethau a gaiff eu marchnata, ond mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol yng Nghymru, gan gydweithio â'r Adran Iechyd, yn monitro hyn yn ofalus bellach.

Yr wyf yn falch bod a wnelo eich ymateb â'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â hyn yn lleol a'r ffordd gadarnhaol yr hysbyswyd rhieni am y broblem a sut mae'r ysgol a'r ysbyty wedi ei rheoli. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar hefyd eich bod yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y rhaglen hon. Mae'r perygl o salwch difrifol ar ôl haint naturiol yn llawer mwy nag unrhyw berygl posibl yn sgîl brechlyn i atal TB. Mae achosion o anaffylacsis ar ôl imiwneiddio yn brin iawn—0.65 i 3 achos fesul 1 filiwn o frechiadau. Mae TB yn salwch angheul ac mae imiwneiddio yn hanfodol, ond rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff pryderon eu gwyntyllu'n llawn ac yr ymdrinnir â hwy yn gyhoeddus.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn ddi-au, mae anaffylacsis yn adwaith difrifol sy'n codi ofn, ond yn ffodus, mae'n brin iawn. Fel y dywedasoch, mae manteision brechu yn llawer mwy na'r peryglon. Fodd bynnag, a gredwch fod hyn yn gyfle i ymchwilio i'r mater hwn yn drylwyr, er mwyn rhoi sicrwydd priodol ynghylch diogelwch cyffredinol brechu, os gellir rhoi hynny? Onid yw'n gyfle hefyd i atgyfnerthu'r pwysigrwydd bod pawb sy'n rhoi brechlynnau wedi'u hyfforddi'n llawn i

fully trained in responding to such emergencies, because there is always a risk that the very rarity of these events may lead to skills being blunted. This may be a useful opportunity to remind people that they need to keep their skills up to date.

**Jane Hutt:** I agree. Following on from Nick Bourne's question, this is about public reassurance and the safety of vaccination across the board. I commented earlier today that in the early days of the Assembly, sadly, we were often here talking about meningitis outbreaks. Although that has not entirely left the agenda in terms of risk and ill health, immunisation against meningitis C has made a great difference to children's lives. However, we must ensure that our national public health service is properly trained and prepared for incidents such as this, however rare they may be.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf hefyd yn falch i glywed y newyddion fod disgryblion Ysgol Penweddig yn parhau i wella, yn enwedig Dominic Hamer, sydd allan o ofal dwys erbyn hyn. Mae'r digwyddiad hwn wedi bod yn dipyn o sioc i Ysgol Penweddig ac i'r gymuned leol. Derbyniaf fod ymchwiliad i'r digwyddiad yn mynd rhagddo, ond a wnewch chi sicrhau y caiff casgliadau'r ymchwiliad eu cyhoeddi unwaith y bydd wedi ei gwblhau? A wnewch chi ddatganiad pellach yn dilyn cwblhau'r ymchwiliad i gynnal hyder rhieni a phobl ifanc ym mrechiad BCG?

**Jane Hutt:** I give you my commitment to ensuring that the conclusions of the investigation are made public locally and nationally, because there will be concerns. Together, responsibly, we can ensure that the risk of such an adverse reaction—and I gave you the figures, which I hope are helpful—is very rare. We should also put this into perspective with regard to the risk of serious illness in relation to tuberculosis, in terms of the importance of the TB vaccination programme.

ymateb i achosion brys o'r fath, am fod perygl parhaus y gallai natur unigryw y digwyddiadau hyn olygu na fydd pobl yn meddu ar y sgiliau priodol i ymdrin â hwy. Efallai fod hwn yn gyfle defnyddiol i atgoffa pobl fod angen iddynt ddiweddar eu sgiliau yn rheolaidd.

**Jane Hutt:** Cytunaf. Gan ymateb i gwestiwn Nick Bourne, mae a wnelo hyn â rhoi sicrwydd i'r cyhoedd ac â diogelwch brechu yn gyffredinol. Dywedais yn gynharach heddiw inni siarad yn aml am achosion o lid yr ymennydd, yn anffodus, yn ystod dyddiau cynnar y Cynulliad. Er nad yw hynny wedi diflannu'n llwyr o ran risg a salwch, mae imiwneiddio rhag llid yr ymennydd C wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i fywydau plant. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sicrhau y caiff staff ein gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus cenedlaethol eu hyfforddi a'u paratoi'n briodol ar gyfer digwyddiadau fel hyn, er eu bod yn brin.

**Elin Jones:** I am also pleased to hear that the condition of the Ysgol Penweddig pupils continues to improve, particularly Dominic Hamer, who is now out of intensive care. This incident came as quite a shock to Ysgol Penweddig and the local community. I accept that an investigation into the incident is taking place, but will you ensure that the conclusions of that investigation are made public once it is complete? Will you make a further statement following the investigation's completion to uphold parents' and young people's confidence in the BCG vaccine?

**Jane Hutt:** Rhoddaf ymrwymiad ichi y byddaf yn sicrhau y caiff casgliadau'r ymchwiliad eu cyhoeddi'n lleol ac yn genedlaethol, oherwydd bydd pryderon yn codi o ganlyniad i hyn. Gyda'n gilydd, ac mewn ffyrdd gyfrifol, gallwn sicrhau bod y risg o adwaith niweidiol o'r fath—rhoddais y ffigurau ichi a gobeithiaf eu bod yn ddefnyddiol—yn brin iawn. Dylem hefyd roi hyn yn ei gyd-destun o ran y risg o salwch difrifol mewn perthynas â thwbercwlosis, o ran pwysigrwydd rhaglen frechu TB.

## Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to Standing Orders on the publication of information to the internet. It has been drawn to my attention that the last set of Cabinet minutes published on the internet were those for 5 July 2004. I understood that there was an expressed intention to publish Cabinet minutes after six weeks. There is a more recent set on the intranet, but that is not available to everyone. I hope that that will be dealt with.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am sure that the First Minister and the Cabinet will have heard your remarks. That is not directly a matter for me in relation to our business in the Chamber, but I am sure that the Government of Wales will always wish to provide as much information as possible on its part of the Assembly website.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r Rheolau Sefydlog ar roi gwybodaeth ar y rhyngrwyd. Tynnwyd fy sylw at y ffaith mai cofnodion 5 Gorffennaf 2004 oedd cofnodion olaf y Cabinet a roddwyd ar y rhyngrwyd. Yr oeddwn ar ddeall bod bwriad penodol i gyhoeddi cofnodion y Cabinet ar ôl chwe wythnos. Mae cofnodion diweddarach ar y fewnrwyd, ond nid yw'r rheini ar gael i bawb. Gobeithiaf yr ymdrinnir â hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Prif Weinidog a'r Cabinet wedi clywed eich sylwadau. Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi yn unioingyrchol o ran ein busnes yn y Siambra hon, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru bob amser am roi cymaint o wybodaeth â phosibl ar ei thudalennau ar wefan y Cynulliad.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.08 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.08 p.m.*

## Cynllun Gofodol Cymru The Wales Spatial Plan

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 4, 5 and 6 in the name of David Melding and amendments 7 and 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Before I call the Minister, I announce that I will impose a three-minute time limit on speakers, apart from the Minister and those who propose amendments. I have a list of around 15 speakers and three minutes each should enable everyone to contribute.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales welcomes the document 'People, Places, Futures' laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 10 November 2004, and adopts it as the spatial plan for Wales. (NDM2173)*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Daivd Melding a gwelliannau 7 ac 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Cyn imi alw'r Gweinidog, datganaf y byddaf yn gorfodi cyfyngiad amser o dri munud ar siaradwyr, ac eithrio'r Gweinidog a'r rhai sy'n cynnig y gwelliannau. Mae gennylf restr o tua 15 o siaradwyr, a dylai tri munud yr un olygu y bydd pawb yn gallu cyfrannu.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r ddogfen 'Pobl, Lleoedd, Dyfodol' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a anfonwyd drwy'r e-bost at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 10 Tachwedd 2004, ac yn ei mabwysiadu fel cynllun gofodol ar gyfer Cymru. (NDM2173)*

This is an exciting day for me: you do not often say that when speaking in Plenary, I can tell you, but it is exciting because we will, hopefully, agree on a first for Wales today, namely the production of the spatial plan, 'People, Places, Futures'.

3.10 p.m.

This sets a direction for Wales for the next 20 years. It is an important document, which gives geographical and spatial expression to many of our policies and, hopefully, for partners and others outside the Assembly who can respond to this challenge for the future. It has been an interesting time since the draft document was produced. We intended to use the draft document as a vehicle to get people thinking about the future of Wales. We did not intend it to be a blueprint and exclusively our plan—it was deliberately done in such a way as to get people thinking and to be enthusiastic, whatever their background, wherever they lived, or whatever age they were, about looking forward to the future of Wales. If nothing else, it has done that. Over the course of last year, people across Wales have been involved in thinking about their future, in small workshops and major seminars. People in Wales have been engaged and involved in this. As we roll this plan out over the next 12 months, we will, hopefully, continue to get that involvement and excitement from people across Wales.

In terms of the changes that have been made since the draft was produced, I will mention the few areas where there has been significant change. First, we have simplified the structure. Many of you will remember that the original document contained zones, layered in colours. That has been left out—it was helpful at the time, but it produced more items of debate than anything else. Secondly, those areas have been amended slightly. We have identified hubs and key centres within them, and added the idea of propositions and actions. That is in direct response to people's proposals for the plan. Therefore, for each regional area, there are propositions and actions.

Mae heddiw yn ddiwrnod cyffrous imi: nid yn aml y dywedwch hynny wrth siarad mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, mae hynny'n sicr, ond mae'n gyffrous gan y byddwn, gobeithio, yn cytuno ar rywbeth newydd i Gymru heddiw, sef cynhyrchu'r cynllun gofodol, 'Pobl, Lleoedd, Dyfodol'.

Mae hwn yn pennu cyfeiriad i Gymru ar gyfer yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'n ddogfen bwysig, sy'n rhoi mynegiant daearyddol a gofodol i lawer o'n polisiau a, gobeithio, i'n partneriaid ac eraill y tu allan i'r Cynulliad a all ymateb i'r her hon ar gyfer y dyfodol. Bu'n gyfnod diddorol ers i'r ddogfen ddrafft gael ei chyhoeddi. Ein bwriad oedd defnyddio'r ddogfen ddrafft fel ffordd o ysgogi pobl i feddwl am ddyfodol Cymru. Ni fwriadwyd iddi fod yn lasbrint ac yn gynllun i ni yn unig—fe'i gwnaed yn fwriadol mewn ffordd a fyddai'n ysgogi pobl i feddwl a dangos brwd frydedd yngylch edrych ymlaen at ddyfodol Cymru, waeth beth oedd eu cefndir, waeth lle yr oeddent yn byw, neu waeth beth oedd eu hoedran. Yn anad dim, llwyddodd yn hynny o beth. Drwy gydol y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bu pobl o bob cwr o Gymru yn meddwl am eu dyfodol, mewn gweithdai bach a seminarau mawr. Cynhwyswyd pobl Cymru a chymerasant ran yn y broses. Wrth inni gyflwyno'r cynllun hwn yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf, byddwn, gobeithio, yn parhau i ddenu'r cyfranogiad a'r cyffro hwnnw gan bobl ledled Cymru.

O ran y newidiadau a wnaed ers cynhyrchu'r ddogfen ddrafft, soniaf am yr ychydig feisydd lle y bu newid sylweddol. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym wedi symleiddio'r strwythur. Bydd llawer ohonoch yn cofio bod y ddogfen wreiddiol yn cynnwys parthau, mewn haenau o liwiau gwahanol. Mae hynny wedi'i hepgor—yr oedd yn ddefnyddiol ar y pryd, ond ysgogi dadl a wnaeth yn anad dim. Yn ail, diwygiwyd y ardaloedd hynny rywfaint. Yr ydym wedi nodi canolfannau a chanolfannau allweddol o'u mewn, ac wedi ychwanegu'r syniad o gynigion a chamau gweithredu. Gwnaed hynny fel ymateb uniongyrchol i gynigion pobl ar gyfer y cynllun. Felly, mae cynigion a chamau gweithredu ar gyfer pob ardal ranbarthol.

We have also given a clearer focus to the objectives for Wales at a national level, and the actions associated with them, as many people from outside Wales need to know what our vision is for Wales as a nation, and our direction. We have strengthened the demographic analysis underpinning the plan, which has produced some surprises. It has destroyed some of the well-held myths that have been perpetuated. I hope that a more integrated approach has been taken regarding the environment, particularly in relation to marine and coastal issues. Those are the core changes.

In terms of the content, core themes have been brought out. First, building sustainable communities is fundamental. It is about responding to changing demographic patterns, addressing social exclusion, improving health and wellbeing, and the quality of life in general. Secondly, it is about promoting a sustainable economy, building on Wales's strengths and using future economic drivers and tackling high inactivity rates by improving skills and opportunities. Thirdly, it is about valuing our environment. We know that Wales has a top-quality environment, and that some areas need better protection. We recognise that our environment is a key asset. The environment is basic to us: it is a life support to nature, as well as an important part of people's quality of life and the economy. We should use the environment as a life support for our economy, but it also has to be protected and nurtured for future generations to enjoy.

The plan is also about achieving sustainable access. To refer to Ann Jones's earlier question, integrated transport is key to the future of Wales. It is also about respecting the distinctiveness of Wales. Even though we are a small country, there is an amazing variety and diversity within Wales, which needs to be respected and supported. The Welsh language and culture is an important part of this distinctiveness.

Those are the themes at a national level. Within the plan, they have been broken up into regional areas—north-west Wales,

Rhosesom hefyd ffocws cliriach i'r amcanion ar gyfer Cymru ar lefel genedlaethol, a'r camau gweithredu cysylltiedig, gan fod angen i lawer o bobl o'r tu allan i Gymru wybod beth yw ein gweledigaeth i Gymru fel gwlad, a'n cyfeiriad. Yr ydym wedi atgyfnerthu'r dadansoddiad demograffig sy'n sail i'r cynllun, ac arweiniodd hynny at rai canlyniadau annisgwyl. Mae wedi chwalu rhai o'r hen gamdybiaethau. Gobeithiaf y mabwysiadwyd ymagwedd fwy integredig tuag at yr amgylchedd, yn arbennig o ran materion morol ac arfordirol. Dyna'r newidiadau craidd.

O ran y cynnwys, cyflwynwyd themâu craidd. Yn gyntaf, mae adeiladu cymunedau cynaliadwy yn hanfodol. Mae a wnelo ag ymateb i batrymau demograffig cyfnewidiol, ymdrin ag allgáu cymdeithasol, gwella iechyd a lles, ac ansawdd bywyd yn gyffredinol. Yn ail, mae a wnelo â hyrwyddo economi gynaliadwy, gan adeiladu ar gryfderau Cymru a defnyddio ysgogwyr economaidd y dyfodol a mynd i'r afael â chyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd uchel drwy wella sgiliau a chyfleoedd. Yn drydydd, mae a wnelo â gwerthfawrogi ein hamgylchedd. Gwyddom fod gan Gymru amgylchedd o'r radd flaenaf, a bod angen amddiffyn rhai ardaloedd yn well. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod ein hamgylchedd yn ased allweddol. Mae'r amgylchedd yn hollbwysig inni: mae'n cynnal byd natur, ac yn rhan bwysig o ansawdd bywyd pobl a'r economi. Dylem ddefnyddio'r amgylchedd i gynnal ein heonomi, ond rhaid ei ddiogelu hefyd a'i feithrin er mwyn i genedlaethau'r dyfodol allu ei fwynhau.

Mae a wnelo'r cynllun hefyd â chyflawni mynediad cynaliadwy. Gan gyfeirio at gwestiwn cynharach Ann Jones, mae trafnidiaeth integredig yn allweddol i ddyfodol Cymru. Mae a wnelo hefyd â pharchu natur arbennig Cymru. Er mai gwlad fach ydym, mae amrywiaeth anhygoel yng Nghymru, ac mae angen parchu a chynnal hynny. Mae'r iaith Gymraeg a diwylliant Cymru yn rhan bwysig o'r natur arbennig hon.

Dyna'r themâu ar lefel genedlaethol. Cawsant eu rhannu yn y cynllun yn ardaloedd rhanbarthol—y Gogledd-orllewin,

north-east Wales, central Wales, south-east Wales, Swansea bay, the Valleys, and Pembrokeshire and the Haven. I hope that people will appreciate that this is a more fleshed-out document than the draft. For all those who have taken the time to respond to consultations, it carefully covers the points that were raised. That was not easy, as we received a great diversity of views. We reached out to business, to the voluntary sector, to schools, and so on. Some of the comments were not necessarily compatible with one another. However, we are trying to represent those and bring them into the document.

I will make one point clear—this is a strategic plan. There are many important places in Wales that we will not have identified in the plan. However, no place in Wales, no matter its size or history, should feel left out. As we roll out the plan across the regional areas, local authorities can pick up some of the initiatives, and some of the places that are dear to their heart, and ensure that they are taken forward.

In terms of taking this plan forward, it is clear that this is a living document. I do not quite know how you deal with a living document, but we will certainly try, because we know that things are not static. This sets a direction. However, we must be vigilant about what is happening outside our borders and be aware of changes, and we must frequently go back and consider whether things need to be amended or changed. Therefore, we will work with colleagues outside our borders, and consider how we can work with everyone in Wales to take forward local priorities.

Importantly, again, there were many questions as to how this will be embedded in our work. This will be embedded. It was led by a sub-committee, which I chaired, and it has been endorsed by all Cabinet members—the Cabinet is 100 per cent behind this document. Therefore, it will be one of the key strategic documents that we use. It will also have statutory recognition under the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.

y Gogledd-ddwyrain, y Canolbarth, y Deddwyrain, bae Abertawe, y Cymoedd, a sir Benfro a'r Hafan. Gobeithiaf y bydd pobl yn gwerthfawrogi fod y ddogfen hon yn fwy cynhwysfawr na'r ddogfen ddrafft. I bawb a roddodd o'u hamser i ymateb i'r ymgynghori, mae'n ymateb yn ofalus i'r pwyntiau a godwyd. Nid oedd hynny'n hawdd, gan inni dderbyn amrywiaeth mawr o sylwadau. Gofynasom am farn busnesau, y sector gwirfoddol, ysgolion, ac yn y blaen. Nid oedd rhai o'r sylwadau o reidrwydd yn gydnaws â'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ceisio eu cynrychioli a'u cynnwys yn y ddogfen.

Hoffwn egluro un pwynt—cynllun strategol yw'r cynllun hwn. Mae llawer o leoedd pwysig yng Nghymru na chânt eu nodi yn y cynllun. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai unrhyw le yng Nghymru, waeth beth fo'i faint neu ei hanes, deimlo ei fod wedi'i hepgor. Wrth inni gyflwyno'r cynllun ar draws yr ardaloedd rhanbarthol, gall awdurdodau lleol ddewis rhai o'r mentrau, a rhai o'r lleoedd sy'n bwysig iddynt hwy, a sicrhau y cânt eu rhoi ar waith.

O ran datblygu'r cynllun hwn, mae'n amlwg mai dogfen fyw yw'r ddogfen hon. Ni wn yn union sut y dylid ymdrin â dogfen fyw, ond yn sicr fe geisiwn wneud hynny, gan ein bod yn gwybod nad yw'r sefyllfa yn sefydlog. Mae'r cynllun yn pennu cyfeiriad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gadw llygad ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd y tu allan i'n ffiniau a bod yn ymwybodol o newidiadau, a rhaid inni ailystyried yn rheolaidd pa un a oes angen diwygio neu newid pethau. Felly, byddwn yn gweithio gyda chyd-aelodau y tu allan i'n ffiniau, gan ystyried sut y gallwn gydweithio â phawb yng Nghymru i ddatblygu blaenoriaethau lleol.

Yn bwysig, unwaith eto, yr oedd llawer o gwestiynau o ran sut y caiff hyn ei gynnwys yn rhan sylfaenol o'n gwaith. Fe gaiff ei gynnwys. Fe'i gwnaed o dan arweiniad is-bwyllgor, a gadeiriwyd gennyl i, ac fe'i cymeradwywyd gan bob un o aelodau'r Cabinet—mae'r Cabinet yn gadarn o blaid y ddogfen hon. Felly, bydd yn un o'r dogfennau strategol allweddol a ddefnyddir gennym. Caiff hefyd ei chydhabod yn statudol o dan Ddeddf Cynllunio a Phrynu

Gorfodol 2004.

I recognise many of the points that have been made in the amendments. However, I will reassure people on some points. On the references to the head of the Valleys, Jocelyn, this has been given a greater prominence in this document following consultation with colleagues. However, the head of the Valleys is also part of the—

**Janet Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Sue Essex:** I am a little short of time, Janet. I will finish this and try to pick up on any points that you raise during the debate.

The head of the Valleys has been recognised as an area that needs to be given more emphasis. It is an area in which we need to invest, certainly in terms of the road and so on, and we will show the way forward on that. On amendment 3 on the north-south connections, that is in the document, but my colleague will make a further statement on transport strategy. On amendment 4, on technical advice note 8, that is a response to the TAN rather than an issue for the spatial plan. On quality landscapes, that is recognised in the plan.

On amendment 7—that old chestnut from the Liberals—you should understand this by now, Mick. I have been leading on the spatial plan because it is a strategic, interconnected document. As I have said, it has been led by the sub-committee that considered spatial planning and sustainable development.

Finally, I thank everyone who has been involved in this. The team that has worked on it has been extremely committed, and people inside and outside Wales have helped us. They are watching us—there is a huge amount of interest inside and outside Wales in how we might take this forward. I hope that all Assembly Members can support this document today—it would be lovely to say that this is an Assembly document. It is a first for Wales and it sets a new direction. It is about us all working together.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaed yn y gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, gallaf roi sicrwydd i bobl ar rai pwyntiau. O ran y cyfeiriadau at Flaenau'r Cymoedd, Jocelyn, rhoddwyd mwy o amlygrwydd i hyn yn y ddogfen hon yn dilyn ymgynghori â chyd-Aelodau. Fodd bynnag, mae blaenau'r Cymoedd hefyd yn rhan o—

**Janet Davies:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Sue Essex:** Mae amser braidd yn brin, Janet. Gorffennaf fy arraith a cheisiaf ymateb i unrhyw bwyntiau a godwch yn ystod y ddadl.

Cydnabuwyd blaenau'r Cymoedd fel ardal y mae angen rhoi mwy o bwyslais iddi. Mae'n ardal lle y mae angen inni fuddsoddi, yn sicr o ran y ffordd ac yn y blaen, a chymerwn yr awenau yn hynny o beth. O ran gwelliant 3 ar y cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De, mae hynny yn y ddogfen, ond gwneir datganiad pellach ar y strategaeth drafnidiaeth gan fy nghyd-Weinidog. O ran gwelliant 4, ar nodyn cyngor technegol 8, ymateb i'r nodyn yw hynny yn hytrach na mater sy'n ymrneud â'r cynllun gofodol. O ran tirluniau o ansawdd, caiff hynny ei gydnabod yn y cynllun.

O ran gwelliant 7—yr hen ffefrynn cyfarwydd gan y Rhyddfrydwyr—dylech ddeall hyn erbyn hyn, Mick. Cymerais yr awenau ar y cynllun gofodol gan mai dogfen strategol, rhngysylltiedig ydyw. Fel y dywedais, fe'i lluniwyd o dan arweiniad yr is-bwyllgor a ystyriodd cynllunio gofodol a datblygu cynaliadwy.

I gloi, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a fu'n rhan o'r broses hon. Yr oedd y tîm a fu'n gweithio arni yn ymrwymedig iawn, ac mae pobl o'r tu mewn a'r tu allan i Gymru wedi ein helpu. Maent yn ein gwyllo—mae diddordeb mawr yng Nghymru a'r tu allan iddi yn y ffordd y gellid datblygu'r cynllun. Gobeithiaf y gall pob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r ddogfen hon heddiw—byddai'n braff gallu dweud mai dogfen y Cynulliad ydyw. Mae'n rhywbeth newydd i Gymru ac mae'n pennu cyfeiriad newydd. Mae a wnelo â phawb yn cydweithio.

**David Lloyd:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: delete ‘welcomes the document’ and replace with ‘cautiously welcomes the revised document’.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the new areas with ‘socio-economic hubs’ and calls on the Labour Assembly Government to develop sustainable regional job targets within these areas and create a new socio-economic area covering the heads of the Valleys.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that north/south transport links have not been prioritised within the revised plan.*

Plaid Cymru welcomes the appearance of a national blueprint for the economic and social development of Wales as a national unit that is more than a planning document, but is a comprehensive vision of the way forward. This document, and its strategy map in particular, has improved since the draft. The socio-economic hubs are now far more realistic than the previous map detailing these areas. However, in having key centres and socio-economic hubs, we would like to see some prescription in terms of the expectation of national government as regards delivery—not just different colour schemes on a map, but an expectation of delivery in these key centres and socio-economic hubs. We need that in economic terms, say with regional job targets, and we need that in terms of the environment and sustainability, as well as in terms of transportation, with firm, costed expectations, say on integrated transport, in each of these socio-economic hubs.

3.20 p.m.

**David Lloyd:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Daives. Gwelliant 1: dileu ‘yn croesawu’r ddogfen’ a rhoi ‘yn croesawu â phwyll y ddogfen ddiwygiedig’ yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn nodi’r ardaloedd newydd â ‘chanolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol’ ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i ddatblygu targedau rhanbarthol cynaliadwy ar gyfer swyddi yn yr ardaloedd hyn a chreu ardal economaidd-gymdeithasol newydd ar gyfer blaenau’r Cymoedd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y ffaith nad yw’r cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y Gogledd a’r De yn cael blaenorriaeth yn y cynllun diwygiedig.*

Croesawa Plaid Cymru gyflwyniad glasbrint cenedlaethol ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru fel uned genedlaethol sy’n fwy na dogfen gynllunio, ond sy’n cynnig gweledigaeth gynhwysfawr o’r ffordd ymlaen. Mae’r ddogfen hon, a’i map strategaeth yn benodol, wedi gwella ers y fersiwn ddrafft. Mae’r canolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol bellach yn llawer mwy realistig na’r map blaenorol o’r ardaloedd hyn. Fodd bynnag, wrth gyflwyno canolfannau allweddol a chanolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol, byddem am weld disgwyliadau’r llywodraeth genedlaethol o ran eu cyflwyno—nid dim ond lliwiau gwahanol ar fap, ond y disgwyliadau o ran yr hyn a gyflwynir yn y canolfannau allweddol a’r canolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol hyn. Mae angen hynny arnom o ran yr economi, gyda thargedau swyddi rhanbarthol er enghraifft, ac mae angen hynny arnom o ran yr amgylchedd a chynaliadwyedd, yn ogystal ag o ran trafnidiaeth, gyda disgwyliadau cadarn, wedi’u costio, ar drafnidiaeth integredig er enghraifft, ym mhob un o’r canolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol hyn.

Vision is fine, but we need to secure delivery, not least because future grant allocations will no doubt be made on the basis of these socio-economic hubs.

On the theme of transport, a pivotal part of the national vision for Wales should be the urgent need to upgrade and improve north-south transport links. This is a recurring, age-old theme on which we have seen precious little delivery so far. Far greater priority should be given to north-south links in the spatial plan. Much is made of east-west links, but Wales is, and needs to be, far more than a mere scenic backdrop to two main arteries of east-west communication.

**Janet Davies:** Do you agree that there is one exception to the east-west link, and that it is important that there is a firm target date for every section of the Heads of the Valleys road to be dualled?

**David Lloyd:** Yes. The national blueprint should actively enable the joining up of various bits of transport infrastructure, and enable the joining up of our country through north-south transport links. That is the basis for our amendment 3.

Other speakers will, doubtless, address how this spatial plan sits with the myriad other plans and strategies in Wales, because it must fit in and deliver. With regard to delivery and costings in general, the budget line for the Wales spatial plan should appear under the Minister's own portfolio rather than—rather dismissively—under other Assembly main expenditure groups, as it does at present.

The children's commissioner notes in his annual report, which we will discuss later, the need for young people to become involved in this national spatial plan and national blueprint for development. Minister, what mechanisms do you have to enable young people to feed into the spatial plan, which is, after all, the national vision for the next 20 years?

Mae gweledigaeth yn iawn, ond mae angen dulliau cyflwyno cadarn arnom, yn arbennig o ystyried fwy na thebyg mai ar sail y canolfannau economaidd-gymdeithasol hyn y gwneir dyraniadau grant yn y dyfodol.

O ran thema trafnidiaeth, dylai'r angen brys i ddiweddu a gwella'r cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y Gogledd a'r De fod yn rhan ganolog o'r weledigaeth genedlaethol i Gymru. Mae'r thema hon yn un gyfarwydd sy'n codi dro ar ôl tro a, hyd yn hyn, prin fu'r canlyniadau a welwyd. Dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth llawer uwch i'r cysylltiadau rhwng y Gogledd a'r De yn y cynllun gofodol. Ceir llawer o sôn am y cysylltiadau rhwng y Dwyrain a'r Gorllewin, ond mae Cymru yn llawer mwy na chefn dir deniadol i ddwy brif ffordd gyswllt y Dwyrain a'r Gorllewin, ac mae angen iddi barhau felly.

**Janet Davies:** A gytunwch fod un eithriad i'r cyswllt rhwng y Dwyrain a'r Gorllewin, a'i bod yn bwysig penu dyddiad targed cadarn ar gyfer creu ffordd ddeuel ar hyd pob rhan o ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd?

**David Lloyd:** Gwnaf. Dylai'r glasbrint cenedlaethol alluogi i amrywiol rannau o'r sealwaith trafnidiaeth gael eu huno, a galluogi i'n gwlad gael ei huno drwy gysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y Gogledd a'r De. Dyna sail ein gwelliant 3.

Mae'n siŵr y bydd siaradwyr eraill yn ymdrin â chydnewedd y cynllun gofodol hwn â'r llu o gynlluniau a strategaethau eraill yng Nghymru, oherwydd rhaid iddo weddu a llwyddo i gyflawni. O ran dulliau cyflwyno a chost yn gyffredinol, dylai llinell y gyllideb ar gyfer cynllun gofodol Cymru ymddangos o dan bortffolio'r Gweinidog ei hun yn hytrach nac o dan brif grwpiau gwariant eraill y Cynulliad—sydd braidd yn ddiystyriol—fel y gwna ar hyn o bryd.

Noda'r comisiynydd plant yn ei adroddiad blynnyddol, a drafodir gennym yn ddiweddarach, yr angen i bobl ifanc fod yn rhan o'r cynllun gofodol cenedlaethol hwn a'r glasbrint cenedlaethol ar gyfer datblygu. Weinidog, pa ddulliau sydd ar waith gennych i alluogi pobl ifanc i gyfrannu at y cynllun gofodol, sydd, wedi'r cyfan, yn rhoi gweledigaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer yr 20

mlynedd nesaf?

Finally, with regard to health and social services, we all know that NHS Wales is a powerful economic driver. It is one of Wales's largest employers, and a supplier of highly-qualified professionals to all parts of Wales. However, there are plans afoot from Health Commission Wales that appear to encourage regional centres of medical excellence to desert Wales—and to desert Swansea in particular; I am talking about paediatric neurosurgery—with Wales becoming increasingly dependent on the regional centres of medical excellence in Bristol, Liverpool and Manchester. How does that square with the Wales spatial plan and its avowed intent of a national vision for Wales? If our amendments find favour with the Government, we shall support the Government's motion on the Wales spatial plan. If Plaid Cymru's amendments fall, however, we shall abstain in the vote on the final motion.

**Glyn Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for technical advice note 8 to reflect the aims of the spatial plan, which values the landscapes of Wales and notes the damage to landscapes that will be caused through the concentration of windfarms in strategic search areas.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the importance of agri-environment schemes in achieving the objectives of the spatial plan and notes the cost efficient way in which the Countryside Council for Wales has managed the Tir Gofal scheme.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes the contribution to the aims of the spatial plan of good transport links between north and south Wales and particularly the importance of investment in improved*

I gloi, o ran iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, gwyr pob un ohonom fod GIG Cymru yn ysgogwr economaidd pwerus. Mae'n un o'r cyflogwyr mwyaf yng Nghymru, ac yn cyflenwi gweithwyr proffesiynol cymwysedig iawn i bob cwr o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys bod cynlluniau ar droed gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru i annog canolfannau rhagoriaeth feddygol rhanbarthol i droi eu cefnau ar Gymru—ac i droi eu cefnau ar Abertawe yn benodol; yr wyf yn sôn am niwrofeddygaeth bediatrig—gyda Chymru yn dod yn gynyddol ddibynnol ar y canolfannau rhagoriaeth feddygol rhanbarthol ym Mryste, Lerpwl a Manceinion. Sut y mae hynny'n cyfateb â chynllun gofodol Cymru a'i fwriad cadarn o roi gweledigaeth genedlaethol i Gymru? Os bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi ein gwelliannau, byddwn yn cefnogi cynnig y Llywodraeth ar gynllun gofodol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, os bydd gwelliannau Plaid Cymru yn methu, byddwn yn ymatal yn y bleidlais ar y cynnig olaf.

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn galw ar i nodyn cyngor technegol 8 adlewyrchu amcanion y cynllun gofodol sy'n rhoi gwerth ar dirlun Cymru ac yn nodi'r niwed i'r tirlun yn sgil crynhoi'r ffermydd gwynt yn yr ardaloedd chwilio strategol.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn nodi pwysigrwydd y cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd o ran cyflawni amcanion y cynllun gofodol ac yn nodi dull cost-effeithiol Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru o reoli'r Cynllun Tir Gofal.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn nodi cyfraniad cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth da rhwng y Gogledd a'r De at amcanion y Cynllun Gofodol ac, yn arbennig, bwysigrwydd buddsoddi mewn gwella'r*

*north/south road links.*

I should begin by saying that I have always been deeply suspicious of grand visionary plans. I always think that the worst events in human history have occurred as a result of megalomaniacs pursuing grand visionary plans. However, I do not wish to compare the Minister with Mao, or indeed this plan with the cultural revolution or the great leap forward. In fact, I support the spatial plan, particularly in its current form; it has been simplified and is more understandable than it was. We will vote in favour of the plan, irrespective of whether the amendments are carried.

There are some general points to be made. Although I accept the Minister's point that it is a strategic plan, it must, however, link in with the sharp end of policies and politics. If the people of Wales, or, indeed, any of us, are to relate to it, it is extremely important that it remains flexible. The last thing that we want is a plan set in stone, because circumstances can change quickly, and it is important that the spatial plan has the capacity to change along with those circumstances.

Most of the media coverage that I have heard in advance of this debate has focused on immigration, on people moving to Wales and the impact that that might have on the Welsh language, and on the ability of those who have chosen not to move out of Wales to compete with those who move in—particularly with regard to affordable housing. That is a hugely important issue, and any debate on the social plan must always have the Welsh language and culture at its heart. I do not believe that a non-Welsh speaker is any less Welsh. It would be a huge problem if people thought that. It is true that Wales without a Welsh language would be very much a lesser country than it is at present—that is what makes us a distinct nation, and not just a region of Britain. The language and its culture are crucial to us.

The spatial plan must also be about economics, as it is the driver of most other issues and develops the ability to produce

*cysylltiadau ffyrdd rhwng y De a'r Gogledd.*

Dylwn ddechrau drwy nodi fy mod bob amser wedi bod yn amheus iawn o gynlluniau gweledigaethol mawr. Credaf i'r digwyddiadau gwaethaf yn hanes y ddynolryw ddigwydd am fod megalomaniaid yn ceisio gweithredu cynlluniau gweledigaethol mawr. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am gymharu'r Gweinidog â Mao, nac yn wir ei chynllun â'r chwyldro diwylliannol na'r naid fawr ymlaen. Yn wir, cefnoga y cynllun gofodol, yn arbennig ar ei ffurf bresennol; fe'i symleiddiwyd ac mae'n haws i'w ddeall na'r cynllun blaenorol. Byddwn yn pleidleisio o blaid y cynllun, pa un a gaiff y gwelliannau eu derbyn ai peidio.

Mae rhai pwyntiau cyffredinol i'w gwneud. Er fy mod yn derbyn pwynt y Gweinidog mai cynllun strategol ydyw, rhaid, er hynny, iddo gysylltu â pholisiau a gwleidyddiaeth rheng flaen. Er mwyn i bobl Cymru, neu, yn wir, unrhyw rai ohonom, uniaethu ag ef, mae'n bwysig iawn ei fod yn parhau'n hyblyg. Y peth olaf y byddem am ei weld fyddai cynllun anhyblyg, oherwydd gall amgylchiadau newid yn gyflym, ac mae'n bwysig i'r cynllun gofodol allu newid yn unol â'r amgylchiadau hynny.

Canolbwytiodd y rhan fwyaf o'r sylw a glywais yn y cyfryngau cyn y ddadl hon ar fewnfudo, ar bobl yn symud i Gymru a'r effaith y gallai hynny ei chael ar yr iaith Gymraeg, ac ar allu'r rheini sydd wedi dewis peidio â symud allan o Gymru i gystadlu â'r rhai sy'n symud i fewn—yn arbennig o ran tai fforddiadwy. Mae hynny'n fater pwysig iawn, a rhaid i unrhyw ddadl ar y cynllun cymdeithasol sicrhau bod yr iaith Gymraeg a diwylliant Cymru bob amser yn greiddiol iddi. Ni chredaf fod person di-Gymraeg yn llai Cymreig mewn unrhyw ffordd. Byddai'n broblem enfawr pe byddai pobl yn credu hynny. Mae'n wir y byddai Cymru heb yr iaith Gymraeg yn wlad llawer llai na'r wlad sydd ohoni—dyna beth sy'n rhoi natur arbennig i'n gwlaid, ac yn golygu nad dim ond rhanbarth o Brydain ydyw. Mae'r iaith a'i diwylliant yn hollbwysig inni.

Rhaid i'r cynllun gofodol hefyd ganolbwytio ar economeg, gan mai dyma sy'n llywio'r rhan fwyaf o faterion eraill ac

much of what the Government and this Assembly wants. I was particularly disappointed in the targets adopted, as a spatial plan must have realistic targets. To have a national economic development strategy, which must be at the heart of a spatial plan, with targets that are completely unachievable and make the document seem unreal, damages the spatial plan itself.

The spatial plan must be a tool for intervention. We are all interventionists to a greater or lesser degree. When people say that they are not interventionists, I do not believe it. The spatial plan must be part of the redistribution process that deals with disadvantaged areas of Wales. I do not agree—and never have done—with Plaid Cymru, which wants to see specific numbers and targets on that. However, I have always agreed that we should have the remit letter to economic development agencies, and should always have had that as an important part of its target. I worry that sometimes specific numbers and targets are twisted. We can alter the direction, but eventually there is a twisting of matters and investment which is not sensible, just to meet a target, which is a mistake.

The spatial plan must be about land use. I accept the Minister's point that it is a strategic document. It covers the whole Assembly's activities. However, land use is an important part. I sympathise greatly with the Liberal Democrat's amendment 7, that it should be the responsibility of the Minister responsible for planning. I can understand that the Minister responsible for finance has an important input into the spatial plan. I can understand why it currently remains the responsibility of Sue Essex because of the interest that she has taken. However, in the long term, the spatial plan would be better placed with the Minister responsible for planning particularly since the environment considerations run parallel. This is why we will support the Liberal Democrat amendment 7.

yn datblygu'r gallu i gynhyrchu llawer o'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad hwn yn anelu ato. Yr oeddwn yn siomedig iawn yn y targedau a fabwysiadwyd, gan fod yn rhaid i gynllun gofodol gynnwys targedau realistig. Mae pennu strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, sy'n gorfod bod yn ganolog i gynllun gofodol, gyda thargedau sy'n gwbl afrealistig i'w cyflawni ac yn gwneud i'r ddogfen ymddangos yn afreal, yn cael effaith andwyol ar y cynllun gofodol ei hun.

Rhaid i'r cynllun gofodol ddarparu dull o ymyrryd. Yr ydym oll yn ymyraethwyr i ryw raddau. Pan fydd pobl yn dweud nad ydynt yn ymyraethwyr, nid wyf yn eu credu. Rhaid i'r cynllun gofodol fod yn rhan o'r broses ailddosbarthu sy'n ymdrin ag ardaloedd difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Ni chytunaf—ac nid wyf erioed wedi cytuno—â Phlaid Cymru, sydd am weld niferoedd a thargedau penodol yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf bob amser wedi cytuno y dylem fod yn meddu ar lythyr cylch gwaith asiantaethau datblygu economaidd, ac y dylem fod wedi meddu ar hynny fel rhan bwysig o'i darged. Pryderaf weithiau fod niferoedd a thargedau penodol yn cael eu hymstumio. Gallwn newid cyfeiriad, ond yn y pen draw caiff materion eu hymstumio a cheir buddsoddiad nad yw'n synhwyrol, er mwyn cyrraedd targed, ac mae hynny'n gamgymeriad.

Rhaid i'r cynllun gofodol ymwneud â defnydd tir. Derbyniaf bwynt y Gweinidog mai dogfen strategol ydyw. Mae'n cwmpasu amrediad llawn gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae defnydd tir yn rhan bwysig. Cydymdeimlaf yn fawr â gwelliant 7 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sy'n nodi mai'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am y cynllun. Gallaf ddeall fod gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gyllid gyfraniad pwysig i'w wneud i'r cynllun gofodol. Gallaf ddeall pam mai cyfrifoldeb Sue Essex ydyw ar hyn o bryd oherwydd ei diddordeb ynddo. Fodd bynnag, yn yr hirdymor, byddai'n well pe byddai'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio yn gyfrifol am y cynllun gofodol, yn arbennig gan fod yr ystyriaethau amgylcheddol yn berthnasol hefyd. Dyna pam y byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 7 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

There are a number of other issues that I would like to pursue, particularly in relation to our amendments, but I see that my time is up.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 7: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to invest the responsibility for the Wales spatial plan in the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, who has responsibility for sustainable development.*

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the importance of empowering communities to play a substantial part in the management of their local environment and resources.*

I join previous speakers in welcoming the ruling out of a strategic plan for Wales. I congratulate the Minister on what is a great innovation, and the first in the UK. I focus on three issues, which are the vision, the action and integration. In terms of vision, I believe that the plan was something that Wales needed. I congratulate the Minister on putting together a better document than the original draft.

In terms of leadership, planning land use is a crucial factor. The first question within this visionary approach is about its legal status. It is important for us as Members, and particularly for planning authorities that have now compiled their unitary plans and will look at local development plans, that the legal status of this Wales spatial plan is understood when it comes to considering its implication on the unitary development plan and thereby on the local development plans. As you can see in our amendment 8, we congratulate you for using a process which provides empowerment and continual review of a situation. However, this point needs to be clarified.

Mae nifer o faterion eraill yr hoffwn eu trafod, yn arbennig o ran ein gwelliannau, ond gwelaf fod fy amser ar ben.

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 7: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi'r cyfrifoldeb am gynllun gofodol Cymru i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu cynaliadwy.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd grymuso cymunedau i chwarae rhan sylweddol yn y broses o reoli eu hamgylchedd a'u hadnoddau lleol.*

Ymunaf â'r siaradwyr blaenorol wrth groesawu'r ffaith bod cynllun gofodol yn cael ei gyflwyno i Gymru. Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog ar gynllun arloesol iawn, a'r cynllun cyntaf o'i fath yn y DU. Canolbwytiaf ar dri mater, sef y weledigaeth, y camau gweithredu ac integreiddio. O ran gweledigaeth, credaf fod y cynllun yn rhywbeth yr oedd ei angen ar Gymru. Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog am lunio dogfen well na'r ddogfen ddrafft wreiddiol.

O ran arweinyddiaeth, mae cynllunio'r defnydd o dir yn ffactor hanfodol. Mae a wnelo'r cwestiwn cyntaf o fewn yr ymagwedd weledigaethol hon â'i statws cyfreithiol. Mae'n bwysig inni fel Aelodau, ac yn arbennig i awdurdodau cynllunio sydd bellach wedi llunio eu cynlluniau unedol ac a fydd yn edrych ar gynlluniau datblygu lleol, bod statws cyfreithiol y cynllun gofodol hwn i Gymru yn ddealladwy wrth ystyried ei oblygiadau i'r cynllun datblygu unedol ac felly'r cynlluniau datblygu lleol. Fel y gallwch weld yn ein gwelliant 8, yr ydym yn eich llonyfarch am ddefnyddio proses sy'n grymuso ac yn adolygu sefyllfa yn barhaus. Fodd bynnag, mae angen egluro'r pwynt hwn.

In terms of action, the spatial plan provides a framework for action and the details given in the various sections are a useful guide. However, there are certain areas that need more clarity.

3.30 p.m.

The Institute of Chartered Accountants raised an issue about how this plan will bring forward an increase in the spreading of prosperity. That is vital in terms of sustainability, which we all accept this plan is about. If we consider the three famous parts of that, which are the environmental, social and the economic impact, simply placing coloured zones on a map does not necessarily guarantee or reach the vision in your first point, namely to ensure economic benefit in those areas.

The quangos, the Wales Tourist Board, the Welsh Development Agency and ELWa, are mentioned throughout this plan as agents of delivery. It is important that we understand, following the First Minister's announcement on 14 July, how their functions will relate to the plan and what impact their presence throughout Wales will have. We had an announcement on relocation yesterday. We need to understand how their roles fit in. Those bodies are important employers in Newtown in my constituency. Moving them would have a big economic impact in a constituency such as Montgomeryshire.

On integration, one of the great things about this is that we must see how a policy tool is used to integrate all the other plans, such as the sustainable development action plan, 'A Better Wales', this planning framework and all the technical advice notes that relate to the language action zones and so on. I am not aware that any work is currently being done to provide a computer database that will enable planners—they are at the sharp end as they sit in every county hall on committees with local people lobbying councillors on one hand and strategic pressures coming from the top on the other—to face the process of integrating all the strategies and policies. Most of us have sat in council chambers and know that the integration tool

O ran camau gweithredu, mae'r cynllun gofodol yn darparu fframwaith ar gyfer gweithredu ac mae'r manylion a nodir yn yr amrywiol adrannau yn ganllaw defnyddiol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen mwy o eglurder mewn perthynas â rhai meysydd penodol.

Cododd Sefydliad y Cyfrifwyr Siartredig fater ynghylch sut y bydd y cynllun hwn yn fuddiol o ran lledaenu ffyniant. Mae hynny'n hanfodol o ran cynaliadwyedd, yr ydym oll yn derbyn fel un o elfennau'r cynllun hwn. Os ystyriwn dair rhan enwog yr elfen honno, sef yr effaith amgylcheddol, yr effaith gymdeithasol a'r effaith economaidd, nid yw gosod parthau lliw ar fap o reidrwydd yn gwarantu nac yn cyflawni'r weledigaeth yn eich pwynt cyntaf, sef sicrhau budd economaidd yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

Sonnir am y cwangos, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru ac ELWa, drwy'r cynllun hwn fel asiantau cyflwyno. Mae'n bwysig inni ddeall, yn dilyn cyhoeddiad y Prif Weinidog ar 14 Gorffennaf, sut y bydd eu swyddogaethau yn berthnasol i'r cynllun a pha effaith a gaiff eu presenoldeb ledled Cymru. Clywsom gyhoeddiad ar adleoli ddoe. Mae angen inni ddeall sut y mae eu rolau yn rhan o'r broses. Mae'r cyrff hynny yn gyflogwyr pwysig yn y Drenwydd yn fy etholaeth. Byddai eu symud yn cael effaith economaidd fawr mewn etholaeth fel Sir Drefaldwyn.

O ran integreiddio, un o'r pethau gwych am hyn yw bod yn rhaid inni weld sut y caiff offeryn polisi ei ddefnyddio i integreiddio'r holl gynlluniau eraill, megis y cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, 'Gwell Cymru', y fframwaith cynllunio hwn a'r holl nodiadau cyngor technegol sy'n berthnasol i'r parthau gweithredu iaith ac ati. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod unrhyw waith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd i ddarparu cronfa ddata gyfrifiadurol a fydd yn galluogi cynllunwyr—hwy sydd yn y rheng flaen wrth iddynt eistedd ym mhob neuadd sir ar bwylgorau gyda phobl leol yn lobio cynghorwyr ar y naill law a phwysau strategol o'r brig ar y llaw arall—i wynebu'r broses o integreiddio'r holl strategaethau a

that is used will enable its success or otherwise.

The only issue that is missing from the integration process is the environment. Although the marine environment is briefly mentioned, there is no large section on this issue. The WWF has released figures that show that 40 per cent of Wales is missed out in this plan because we are responsible for the 200 miles of coastline around Wales. There should be a larger section on that. The impact of climate change, which is important in terms of strategic planning, is also overlooked.

Finally, how will we know when we have got there? How will you measure the success or otherwise of this plan? It is important that we move from having a pure economic base of measuring gross domestic product to having a basket of indicators that will allow the Minister responsible for planning—and you are aware of my views on that portfolio—to say, ‘look, the spatial plan—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time is up, Mick. The three-minute limit now comes into force. If Members take interventions, they have four minutes.

**Huw Lewis:** It is important to say that this is a good plan. The Minister has shown, and it has been welcomed, that she is a listening Minister. The difference in quality between the first and second drafts is evidence, as it should be. I wish to concentrate on the proper recognition of the role and the potential of the south Wales Valleys, an area in which a third of the population of Wales lives and, according to any socio-economic measure, around three-quarters of the country's problems are concentrated there. There is positive progress in the document towards recognising that. It recognises that it is crucial to capitalise on the development of the A465 and the Heads of the Valleys corridor, not just in terms of transport, but as an all-encompassing opportunity to improve and raise the area's prosperity. We need to

pholisiau. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o honom wedi eistedd mewn siambrau cynghorau ac yn gwybod mai'r dull integreiddio a ddefnyddir fydd yn arwain at ei lwyddiant neu ei fethiant.

Yr unig fater sydd ar goll o'r broses integreiddio yw'r amgylchedd. Er y sonnir yn gryno am yr amgylchedd morol, nid oes unrhyw adran fawr ar y mater hwn. Mae'r WWF wedi rhyddhau ffigurau sy'n dangos bod 40 y cant o Gymru wedi'i hepgor o'r cynllun hwn gan ein bod yn gyfrifol am yr arfordir 200 milltir o hyd o amgylch Cymru. Dylid cynnwys adran fawr ar hynny. Ni cheir sôn am effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd, sy'n bwysig o ran cynllunio strategol, ychwaith.

I gloi, sut y byddwn yn gwybod ein bod wedi llwyddo? Sut y byddwch yn mesur llwyddiant neu fethiant y cynllun hwn? Mae'n bwysig inni symud o sail gwbl economaidd o fesur cynyrrch mewnwladol crynswth i amrediad o ddangosyddion a fydd yn galluogi'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio—ac yr ydych yn ymwybodol o'm safbwytiau ar y portffolio hwnnw—i ddweud, ‘edrychwch, mae'r cynllun gofodol—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben, Mick. Mae'r terfyn tair munud yn dod i rym yn awr. Os bydd Aelodau yn derbyn ymyriadau, cân bedair munud.

**Huw Lewis:** Mae'n bwysig dweud bod y cynllun hwn yn gynllun da. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dangos ei bod yn Weinidog sy'n gwrando, a chroesawyd hynny. Y gwahaniaeth ansawdd rhwng y drafft cyntaf a'r ail ddrafft yw'r dystiolaeth, a hynny'n briodol. Hoffwn ganolbwytio ar roi cydnabyddiaeth briodol i'r rôl a photensial Cymoedd y De, ardal lle y mae traean poblogaeth Cymru yn byw ac, yn ôl unrhyw fesur economaidd-gymdeithasol, mae tua thri chwarter problemau'r wlad wedi'u crynhoi yno. Ceir cynnydd cadarnhaol yn y ddogfen tuag at gydnabod hynny. Mae'n cydnabod ei bod yn hanfodol manteisio ar waith i ddatblygu'r A465 a choridor ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, nid yn unig o ran trafnidiaeth, ond fel cyfle holl gynhwysfawr i wella a chynyddu ffyniant yr ardal. Mae

consider long and hard the track record of ELWa and the WDA in failing to recognise that until now. The successor personnel, whoever they may be, and the departments that become involved must change that mindset and recognise the importance of that Heads of the Valleys corridor.

It is also recognised, but not obsessively so, that there is a link on the coast between Cardiff, Newport and Swansea. We must recognise that that is important, but the monomaniacal approach towards that link, which has been part of the mindset of some of our ASPBs, must be broken. This is a symbiotic relationship, it is not about prosperity trickling down from the coast to the Valleys, but both regions feeding each other with opportunities for increased prosperity for the future. That is why I particularly welcome the idea of a networked city region, because it recognises that interdependence between the cities and the Valleys.

We must think again about this as being all-encompassing, covering transport, housing, health and, crucially, education and training. If I had one mild criticism of this document, in terms of the south-east region, it would be that education and training needs a greater emphasis. There is a clear and powerful emphasis on it in terms of south-west Wales, including the mention of a virtual university for that region, building on the excellent progress made in technia and higher education institutions. We also need that kind of thinking for the heads of the Valleys and the eastern Valleys.

I realise that my time is nearly up, Deputy Presiding Officer, I will finish by saying that I especially welcome the specific—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Sorry, but your time has now run out.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Y mae'r ddogfen yn welliant ar y fersiwn gyntaf, ond mae gweledigaeth genedlaethol gynhwysfawr yn absennol, ac mae diffyg targedau, amserlenni a meincnodau priodol yn dal i fod yn wendid sylfaenol. Cyfeiriaf yn fyr at dri pheth: y

angen inni ystyried yn ddwys record ELWa a'r WDA wrth fethu â chydnabod hynny tan yn awr. Rhaid i'r personol olynol, pwy bynnag fydd y rheini, a'r adrannau cysylltiedig newid y meddylfryd hwnnw a chydnabod pwysigrwydd corridor ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Cydnabyddir hefyd, er nad mewn ffordd obsesiynol, bod cyswllt ar yr arfordir rhwng Caerdydd, Casnewydd ac Abertawe. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod hynny'n bwysig, ond rhaid chwalu'r ymagwedd fonomaniacaidd tuag at y cyswllt hwnnw, a fu'n rhan o feddylfryd rhai o'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Cydberthynas symbiotig yw hon, nid oes a wnelo â rhaedr ffyniant o'r arfordir i'r Cymoedd, ond â'r ddua ranbarth yn bwydo ei gilydd gyda chyfleoedd ar gyfer ffyniant cynyddol yn y dyfodol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn croesawu'n arbennig y syniad o ranbarth â rhwydwaith o ddinasoedd, gan ei fod yn cydnabod y rhngddibyniaeth honno rhwng y dinasoedd a'r Cymoedd.

Rhaid inni ailystyried y ffaith bod y cynllun hwn yn hollogynhysol, gan gwmpasu trafnidiaeth, tai, iechyd ac, yn hanfodol, addysg a hyfforddiant. Pe byddai gennym un feirniadaeth fach o'r ddogfen hon, o ran rhanbarth y De-ddwyrain, y feirniadaeth honno fyddai bod angen rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar addysg a hyfforddiant. Ceir pwyslais clir a phwerus arno o ran y Gogledd-orllewin, gan gynnwys y cyfeiriad at brifysgol rithwir i'r rhanbarth hwnnw, gan adeiladu ar y cynydd ardderchog a wnaed mewn sefydliadau technia ac addysg uwch. Mae angen yr un meddylfryd arnom ar gyfer blaenau'r Cymoedd a Chymoedd y Dwyrain.

Sylweddolaf fod fy amser bron ar ben, Ddirprwy Lywydd, dof i ben drwy ddweud fy mod yn croesawu'n arbennig y—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyd, ond mae eich amser wedi dod i ben.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** The document is an improvement on the first version, but there is no comprehensive national vision, and the paucity of targets, timetables and appropriate benchmarks is still a fundamental weakness. I will refer briefly to three issues: the spatial

weledigaeth ofodol a'r map newydd, cymunedau cynaliadwy, a'r amgylchedd morol.

Mae'r map ar ei newydd wedd yn welliant sylweddol ar y fersiwn gyntaf, ac yr wyf yn cydnabod hynny. Mae'r rhanbarthau â'u canolfannau twf yn ddechrau addawol, er bod clymu ardal Aberconwy a Glannau Dyfrdwy gyda'i gilydd yn od a dweud y lleiaf. O edrych ar y Gogledd-orllewin, sydd o ddiddordeb arbennig i mi, mae'r rhanbarth wedi'i ganoli ar lannau'r Fenai, gan gwmpasu Môn, Arfon a Dwyfor hefyd, felly rhaid gofyn sut mae sicrhau nad yw'r holl dwf yn canoli ar ddinas Bangor, oherwydd ei leoliad ffafriol? A fydd adran ddatblygu'r Llywodraeth yn defnyddio'r cynllun i rwystro buddsoddi mewn safleoedd diwydiannol neu fusnes ym Mhen Llŷn, er enghraifft, am nad yw'n cysylltu'n uniongyrchol â'r Fenai? Nid oes awgrym sut y bydd Llangefni neu Caernarfon yn rhannu'r manteision sydd gan ardal Bangor.

Yn yr adran ar gymunedau cynaliadwy, un o'r pethau rhyfeddol yw'r pwyslais ar fewnfudo fel ateb i broblemau cymdeithasol. Nid cynaliadwyedd yw denu pobl i mewn i gynnal gwasanaethau mewn cymdeithas sy'n heneiddio—nid ar lefel Brydeinig na bydeang. Dylai'r ddogfen osod mwy o bwyslais ar ddatblygu sgiliau a hyfforddi pobl ar gyfer y swyddi angenreidiol, sicrhau dosbarthiad teg o swyddi drwy Gymru benbaladr, ac ar sicrhau bod cartrefi ar gael ar gyfer ein pobl ifanc. Nid yw'r ddogfen fel y mae yn gwneud hynny'n ddigonol. Mae brawddeg ar dudalen 9 sy'n cyfeirio at fewnfudo yn cyfrannu at hunaniaeth ardal, yna, yn yr un frawddeg, mae'n sôn bod angen ei reoli'n sensitif. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi enghraifft i mi o sut y gellid rheoli mewnfudo fel a nodir yn y ddogfen.

Mae cyfeiriad ar dudalen 26 at ddatblygu strategaethau ar gyfer ein hasedau morol. Gyda phob dyledus barch, mae absenoldeb cynllun gofodol ar gyfer yr ardaloedd morol ac arfordirol yn wendid mawr arall yn y ddogfen, fel y dywedodd Mick Bates. Rhaid inni gael Deddf forol a fydd yn caniatáu inni roi trefn ar y llanast cynllunio bresennol, a fydd yn cynnwys dod â phob datblygiad ynni

vision and the new map, sustainable communities, and the maritime environment.

The new map is a significant improvement on the first version, and I acknowledge that. The regions with their growth centres are a promising start, but linking Aberconwy with Deeside is a little odd to say the least. Looking at north-west Wales, which is of particular interest to me, the region is centred on the Menai Straits, but also encompasses Anglesey, Arfon and Dwyfor, therefore I must ask how we can ensure that all growth is not centred on the city of Bangor, because of its favourable location? Will the Government's development department use the scheme to stop investment in industrial or business parks in Pen Llŷn, for example, because it is not directly linked to the Menai Straits? There is no suggestion as to how Llangefni or Caernarfon will share the benefits enjoyed by the Bangor area.

In the section on sustainable communities, one of the strangest things is the emphasis on inward migration as a solution to social problems. Sustainability is not about attracting people into an area to support services in an ageing community—not on a British or a global level. The document should place a greater emphasis on developing skills and training people for essential jobs, ensuring a fair distribution of jobs throughout Wales and on ensuring that homes are available for our young people. The document as it stands does not do so adequately. There is a sentence on page 9 that refers to inward migration contributing to the identity of an area, then, in the same sentence, it says that it must be managed sensitively. I ask the Minister to give me an example of how inward migration can be managed as is noted in the document.

There is a reference on page 26 to developing strategies for our maritime assets. With all due respect, the lack of a spatial plan for the maritime and coastal regions is another great weakness in the document, as Mick Bates said. We must have a maritime Act that will allow us to sort out the present planning mess, which will include bringing all offshore renewable energy developments under

adnewyddadwy ar y môr o dan reolaeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau cydbwysedd â'r angen i warchod ein hamgylchedd sy'n hybu'r economi bysgota a thwristiaeth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog nodi a yw hi'n barod i ddechrau'r gwaith pwysig hwn yn y dyfodol agos?

**Christine Chapman:** Last January, I held a well attended public meeting in Aberdare where we discussed and responded to the draft spatial plan. Picking up on what Dai said, I was pleased that there were a number of older and younger people there, and there was great excitement about this blueprint for Wales. I am pleased that many of the issues raised by my constituents have been tackled and a commitment has been made to address the needs of Cynon Valley

3.40 p.m.

I will focus my comments on the south-east region. There is a perception among my constituents that all roads lead to Cardiff, with little priority given to the heads of the Valleys areas. There is also a fear that Valleys communities will simply become dormitory towns for Cardiff workers. This would destroy communities and leave those who cannot move away isolated, and this, in turn, would erode local services and facilities. This has been the pattern in the Valleys for many years. I am pleased that the head of the Valleys areas have been prioritised in the plan, and I echo many of the comments made by my colleague, Huw Lewis. I am also pleased that a commitment was made recently to the regeneration of Mountain Ash town centre. This is part of the uplift required in these areas, and the regeneration will do a lot to promote the Valleys.

We should not underestimate the impact of good public spaces and developing the cultural heritage of an area, which can help to build a more cohesive society. This is reflected in the spatial plan. I welcome the proposals to encourage a mix of housing. If the Valleys are to thrive, we not only need to encourage new companies to locate there, but encourage the entrepreneurs and directors to live in the area. We have too often seen companies come to the Valleys, only to find that their owners do not want to live there.

the Assembly's control to ensure a balance between the need to safeguard our environment and giving a boost to the fishing and tourism economy. Will the Minister note whether she is willing to start this important work in the near future?

**Christine Chapman:** Fis Ionawr diwethaf, cynhaliaiws gyfarfod cyhoeddus â nifer dda o bobl yno yn Aberdâr lle y bu inni drafod y cynllun gofodol drafat ac ymateb iddo. Gan barhau â'r hyn a ddywedodd Dai, yr oeddwn yn falch bod nifer o bobl hŷn ac iau yno, ac yr oedd cyffro mawr tuag at y glasbrint hwn i Gymru. Yr wyf yn falch yr aed i'r afael â llawer o'r materion a godwyd gan fy etholwyr ac y gwnaed ymrwymiad i ymdrin ag anghenion Cwm Cynon.

Canolbwytiaf fy sylwadau ar ranbarth y Deddwyrain. Ceir canfyddiad ymhlið fy etholwyr bod pob ffordd yn arwain at Gaerdydd, ac na roddir llawer o flaenoriaeth i ardaloedd blaenau'r Cymoedd. Ceir ofn hefyd y bydd cymunedau'r Cymoedd yn troi'n drefi cymudo i weithwyr Caerdydd. Byddai hyn yn dinistrio cymunedau ac yn ynysu'r rhai na allant symud i ffwrdd, a byddai hyn, yn ei dro, yn peri i wasanaethau a chyfleusterau lleol ddirywio. Dyma fu'r patrwm yn y Cymoedd ers sawl blwyddyn. Yr wyf yn falch bod ardaloedd blaenau'r Cymoedd yn cael blaenoriaeth yn y cynllun, ac ategaf lawer o'r sylwadau a wnaed gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Huw Lewis. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o'r ymrwymiad a wnaed yn ddiweddar i adfywio canol tref Aberpennar. Mae hyn yn rhan o'r hwb sydd ei angen yn yr ardaloedd hyn, a bydd y broses adfywio yn fuddiol iawn wrth hyrwyddo'r Cymoedd.

Ni ddylem danamcangyfrif effaith mannau cyhoeddus da a datblygu treftadaeth ddiwylliannol ardal, a all helpu i adeiladu cymdeithas fwy cydlynol. Caiff hyn ei adlewyrchu yn y cynllun gofodol. Croesawaf y cynigion i annog cymysgedd o dai. Er mwyn i'r Cymoedd ffynnu, yn ogystal ag annog cwmniau newydd i ymsefydlu yno, mae angen inni annog yr entrepreneuriaid a'r cyfarwyddwyr i fyw yn yr ardal. Yn rhy aml gwelsom gwmniau'n dod i'r Cymoedd, gan ganfod nad yw eu perchnogion am fyw yno.

We need to reverse this situation. As Huw said, we need to change the mindset about the Valleys and promote them as places to live and work and where people can have a good quality of life.

However, this is not just about bricks and mortar. I am pleased that the spatial plan recognises the importance of early investment in learning and health. Today, during a visit with Jane Hutt to Fernhill in my constituency for the launch of a food initiative, I was reminded that life expectancy for a three-year-old boy is lower in areas such as Cynon, Rhondda and Merthyr compared to Cardiff and Taff Ely. The spatial plan will help to turn the spotlight on what needs to be done.

**Bryngle Williams:** I support the plan in principle. In relation to amendment 4, we are putting too much emphasis on windfarms, and the Government is not taking enough of a lead on biofuels, fibre plants and wave and hydro power—the list is endless. Agri-environment schemes need to be placed higher up the Government's list of priorities. We need to work in partnership with the tourism industry, with hoteliers and other bodies. All bodies need to have a strong working relationship in order to provide as many opportunities as possible for people who live and work in Wales, as well as for those who visit the country.

**Glyn Davies:** Do you acknowledge that the Countryside Council for Wales's cost-effective administration of agri-environment schemes should be taken into account by the Government when it decides whether to incorporate the council, or any part of the council's work, into the civil service?

**Bryngle Williams:** I agree.

On amendment 6, I am sure that everyone would agree that transport between north and south Wales is important. We must remember that there is a vast area between the A55 and the M4. This needs to be addressed—

**Laura Anne Jones:** Do you share my concern about congestion on the M4,

Mae angen inni wyrdroi'r sefyllfa. Fel y dywedodd Huw, mae angen inni newid ein ffordd o feddwl am y Cymoedd a'u hyrwyddo fel mannau i fyw a gweithio a lle y gall pobl fwynhau ansawdd bywyd da.

Fodd bynnag, nid mater syml o frics a morter ydyw. Yr wyl yn falch bod y cynllun gofodol yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd buddsoddi'n gynnar mewn dysgu ac iechyd. Heddiw, yn ystod ymwelliad gyda Jane Hutt â Glynhedynog yn fy etholaeth ar gyfer achlysur lansio menter bwyd, fe'm hatgoffwyd bod disgwyliad oes bachgen tair blwydd oed yn is mewn ardaloedd fel Cynon, Rhondda a Merthyr o'u cymharu â Chaerdydd a Thaf Elái. Bydd y cynllun gofodol yn helpu i amlygu'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud.

**Bryngle Williams:** Cefnogaf y cynllun mewn egwyddor. O ran gwelliant 4, yr ydym yn rhoi gormod o bwyslais ar ffermydd gwynt, ac nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn chwarae rhan ddigon blaenllaw o ran biodanwyddau, planhigion ffibr ac ynni'r tonnau ac ynni dŵr—mae'r rhestr yn ddiddiwedd. Mae angen i gynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd fod yn uwch ar restr blaenorciaethau'r Llywodraeth. Mae angen inni weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r diwydiant twristiaeth, gyda pherchnogion gwestai a chyrrff eraill. Mae angen perthynas waith gadarn ar bob corff er mwyn rhoi cymaint o gyfleoedd â phosibl i bobl sy'n byw ac yn gweithio yng Nghymru, yn ogystal ag i'r rhai sy'n ymweld â'r wlad.

**Glyn Davies:** A gydnabyddwch y dylai'r Llywodraeth ystyried dull cost-effeithiol Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru o weinyddu cynlluniau amaeth-amgylchedd wrth benderfynu pa un a ddylid ymgorffori'r cyngor, neu unrhyw ran o waith y cyngor, i'r gwasanaeth sifil?

**Bryngle Williams:** Cytunaf.

O ran gwelliant 6, yr wyl yn siŵr y byddai pawb yn cytuno bod trafnidiaeth rhwng y Gogledd a'r De yn bwysig. Rhaid inni gofio bod ardal sylweddol rhwng yr A55 a'r M4. Mae angen ymdrin â hyn—

**Laura Anne Jones:** A rannwch fy mhryder ynghylch tagfeydd ar yr M4, yn arbennig yn

particularly in the Newport area? This road was originally built as a by-pass rather than a motorway. Do you agree that the economy of south Wales remains at risk from continued congestion on the M4?

**Bryngle Williams:** I agree.

One of the most important issues facing the Assembly is the desperate need for affordable housing. To start to achieve success, the National Assembly needs to work closely with local authorities in revamping their planning regulations. I know that that cannot be achieved overnight, but we need a commitment that it will be done.

A 10-year strategic plan is needed to make provision. In the last 20 years or so, inward migration into our villages has left us with a unique problem. The second generation of those people want to grow businesses in our communities, but they are being barred from the villages where they grew up because of the price of homes in those communities. The villages must grow, and we must help them to do that. If they do not grow, they will die and become dormitories for older people. This spatial plan is important, and it is pertinent in every way to our language and traditions.

**Ann Jones:** I rise to welcome this plan, and, like Huw Lewis, I believe that the Minister has listened to the consultation exercise and to the people who attended the roadshows. The many people at the roadshow that I attended came from a wide range of communities, and I am sure that their views were fed in.

We must all ensure that we play a part in making this document a living document and that we go back to our areas and ensure that we work across administrative boundaries for the benefit of all. I am proud that the Welsh Assembly Government is doing that, and I proud of what it is doing with its integrated transport policy. As I said earlier, that is key in getting people from the hard-to-reach groups in those areas in my constituency—and I run the risk of being parochial here, but the same will apply to other areas across Wales—to the economic hubs to ensure that

ardal Casnewydd? Adeiladwyd y ffordd hon yn wreiddiol fel ffordd osgoi yn hytrach na thraffordd. A gytunwch fod risg i economi'r De yn sgîl tagfeydd parhaus ar yr M4?

**Bryngle Williams:** Cytunaf.

Un o'r materion pwysicaf sy'n wynebu'r Cynulliad yw'r angen dybryd am dai fforddiadwy. Er mwyn dechrau cyflawni llwyddiant, mae angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gydweithio'n agos ag awdurdodau lleol i ailwampio eu rheoliadau cynllunio. Gwn na ellir cyflawni hynny dros nos, ond mae angen ymrwymiad y caiff ei wneud.

Mae angen cynllun strategol 10 mlynedd er mwyn gwneud darpariaeth. Yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd ddiwethaf, mae mewnfudo i'n pentrefi wedi creu problem unigryw. Mae ail genhedlaeth y bobl hynny am sefydlu busnesau yn ein cymunedau, ond mae prisiau cartrefi yn y pentrefi lle y cawsant eu magu yn eu rhwystro rhag ymsefydlu yn y cymunedau hynny. Rhaid i'r pentrefi dyfu, a rhaid inni eu helpu i wneud hynny. Oni thyfant, byddant yn marw ac yn troi'n drefi ymddeol i bobl hŷn. Mae'r cynllun gofodol hwn yn bwysig, ac mae'n berthnasol ym mhob ffordd i'n hiaith a'n traddodiadau.

**Ann Jones:** Codaf i groesawu'r cynllun hwn, ac, fel Huw Lewis, credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi gwrando ar yr ymgynghoriad ac ar y bobl a fynychodd y sioeau teithiol. Daeth y llu o bobl yn y sioe deithiol yr ymwelais â hi o amrywiaeth eang o gymunedau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr i'w sylwadau gael eu hastyried.

Rhaid i bob un ohonom sicrhau ein bod yn chwarae rhan wrth droi'r ddogfen hon yn ddogfen weithredol ac wrth ddychwelyd at ein hardaloedd a sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio ar draws ffiniau gweinyddol er budd i bawb. Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwneud hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch o'i gwaith gyda'i pholisi trafnidiaeth integredig. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae hynny'n allweddol i ddenu pobl o'r grwpiau anodd i'w cyrraedd yn yr ardaloedd hynny yn fy etholaeth—ac mae perygl imi fod yn blwyfol yn awr, ond bydd yr un peth

they benefit from the prosperous economy that is growing. That is happening nowhere more so than in north-east Wales, which is currently a growing economy. We must ensure that the central part of north Wales benefits from that, and it can do so through an integrated transport policy, as was mentioned earlier in terms of the Deeside shuttle. I want to see that being the way forward into those areas.

For north-east Wales, cross-border working is vital to ensuring that this plan becomes a working document and that we—

**Janet Ryder:** I have noted with interest that, in the run-up to this debate, much has been made about the emphasis that the Labour Party will place on inward migration. Given the comments of some of your colleagues, such as Gareth Thomas MP, on the effects of inward migration, and given the comments that have accompanied this document, namely that you will ensure that inward migrants such as myself come with the right attitude, how does the Labour Party intend to screen inward migrants to ensure that they have the right attitude before moving into Wales?

**Ann Jones:** I could be mischievous here, but I will not be. I will try to stick to what you said. I was coming on to cross-border working. I believe that people will move into Wales as they see a prosperous economy develop, and we must welcome them, because they will be part and parcel of our economy—I am sorely tempted to say something about screening, but it is not about that; it is about—

**Christine Gwyther:** Screaming.

**Ann Jones:** Yes, it is about screaming.

It is about making use of workforces and drawing from them. We can move across borders if they are broken down. It is about breaking down the barriers, and, particularly for north-east Wales, it is about the interaction between those barriers. I welcome

yn berthnasol i ardaloedd eraill ledled Cymru—i'r canolfannau economaidd er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn elwa ar yr economi ffyniannus sy'n tyfu. Mae hynny i'w weld yn amlwg yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, sy'n economi ar gynnydd ar hyn o bryd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod rhan ganolog y Gogledd yn elwa ar hynny, a gall wneud hynny drwy bolisi trafnidiaeth integredig, fel y crybwylwyd yn gynharach o ran gwennol Glannau Dyfrdwy. Yr wyl am weld hynny'n cael ei ddatblygu fel y ffordd ymlaen yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

O ran y Gogledd-ddwyrain, mae gweithio trawsffiniol yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod y cynllun hwn yn dod yn ddogfen weithredol a'n bod—

**Janet Ryder:** Nodais â diddordeb, yn ystod y cyfnod cyn y ddadl hon, y rhoddwyd llawer o sylw i'r pwyslais y bydd y Blaid Lafur yn ei roi ar fewnfudo. O ystyried sylwadau rhai o'ch cyd-Aelodau, megis Gareth Thomas AS, ar effeithiau mewnfudo, ac o ystyried y sylwadau a gyflwynwyd mewn perthynas â'r ddogfen hon, sef y byddwch yn sicrhau bod mewnfudwyr fel minnau yn meddu ar yr agwedd gywir, sut y mae'r Blaid Lafur yn bwriadu sgrinio mewnfudwyr er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn meddu ar yr agwedd gywir cyn iddynt symud i Gymru?

**Ann Jones:** Gallwn ddweud pethau direidus yn awr, ond ni wnaf hynny. Ceisiaf lyny at yr hyn a ddywedasoch. Yr oeddwn ar fin sôn am weithio trawsffiniol. Credaf y bydd pobl yn symud i Gymru wrth iddynt weld economi ffyniannus yn datblygu, a rhaid inni eu croesawu, gan y byddant yn rhan bwysig o'n heonomi—ac mae'n demtasiwn mawr gennyf sôn rhywfaint am sgrinio, ond nid oes a wnelo â hynny; mae a wnelo â—

**Christine Gwyther:** Sgrechian.

**Ann Jones:** Ie, mae a wnelo â sgrechian.

Mae a wnelo â defnyddio gweithluoedd a manteisio arnynt. Gallwn symud ar draws ffiniau os cânt eu dymchwel. Mae a wnelo â dymchwel y rhwystrau, ac, yn arbennig, i'r Gogledd-ddwyrain, mae a wnelo â'r rhwngweithio rhwng y rhwystrau hynny.

anything that will give my constituents in upper Denbigh and in the west ward of Rhyl the opportunity to benefit from that.

This is a good plan, and this is a good day for Wales. I am sure that the future for Wales, under this plan, is good, and we must work together to ensure that we can get all those aims out. I congratulate the Minister and her team for the way in which this document has been presented. It is a shame that the press has only concentrated on a small part of it, and not on the wider picture, which is what we are all trying to do.

3.50 p.m.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I also welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate about the practical application of the spatial plan. It is a strategic document, which rightly reflects devolved Wales's determination to develop a truly sustainable future, which is most welcome. Integration is key to getting best value from public spending, which taxpayers deserve and rightly expect. One issue of concern stems from evidence from the Netherlands, which concludes that spatial planning is most effective when the approach is bottom-up rather than top-down.

I will concentrate briefly on north Wales and pay tribute to the north Wales economic forum and its important work and influence. Psychologically and physically, north Wales often feels divorced from the rest of Wales, and that has been exacerbated by the recent local government settlement and the huge rebanding increases. Council tax in Denbighshire and Wrexham is unfair and disadvantageous compared with other council areas. That is pertinent, as it means that partnership with the Assembly on north Wales's future can be greatly hindered, not only by the day to day budgetary pressures but in its perceived lack of ability to respond adequately to the Assembly's vision.

North-west and north-east Wales have two

Croesawaf unrhyw beth a fydd yn rhoi'r cyfle i'm hetholwyr yn Ninbych uwch ac yn ward orllewinol y Rhyl elwa ar hynny.

Mae hwn yn gynllun da, ac mae hwn yn ddiwrnod da i Gymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod dyfodol Cymru, o dan y cynllun hwn, yn dda, a rhaid inni gydweithio i sicrhau y gallwn gyflawni pob un o'r nodau hynny. Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog a'i thîm am y ffordd y cyflwynwyd y ddogfen hon ganddynt. Mae'n drueni mai dim ond ar ran fach ohoni y mae'r wasg wedi canolbwytio, yn hytrach na'r darlun ehangach, sef yr hyn y mae pob un ohonom yn anelu ato.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawaf hefyd y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon am sut y gellir cymhwysôr cynllun gofodol yn ymarferol. Dogfen strategol ydyw, sy'n briodol yn adlewyrchu penderfyniad Cymru ddatganoledig i ddatblygu dyfodol gwirioneddol gynaliadwy, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Mae integreiddio yn allweddol er mwyn sicrhau'r gwerth gorau o wariant cyhoeddus, ac mae trethdalwyr yn haeddu hynny ac mae ganddynt hawl i'w ddisgwyl. Mae un mater o bryder yn deillio o dystiolaeth o'r Iseldiroedd, a ddaw i'r casgliad bod cynllunio gofodol yn fwyaf effeithiol pan fabwysiedir ymagwedd o'r bôn i'r brig yn hytrach nag o'r brig i bôn.

Soniaf ychydig am y Gogledd a thalaf deyrnged i fforwm economaidd y Gogledd a'i waith a'i ddyylanwad pwysig. Yn seicolegol ac yn ffisegol, mae'r Gogledd yn aml yn teimlo fel petai wedi'i hynysu o weddill Cymru, a gwaethygwyd hynny gan y setliad diweddar i lywodraeth leol a'r codiadau ailfandio enfawr. Mae'r dreth gyngor yn sir Ddinbych a Wrecsam yn annheg ac yn peri anfantais o gymharu ag ardaloedd cyngorau eraill. Mae hynny'n berthnasol, gan ei bod yn golygu y gall y bartneriaeth gyda'r Cynulliad ar ddyfodol y Gogledd gael ei rhwystro'n sylweddol, nid yn unig gan bwysau cyllidebol o ddydd i ddydd ond gan ei diffyg gallu canfyddedig i ymateb yn ddigonol i weledigaeth y Cynulliad.

Mae gan y Gogledd-orllewin a'r Gogledd-

distinctive cultures and challenges. According to recent Welsh Development Agency figures, further movement from Cheshire continues into Flintshire and Wrexham, but that does not yet aid north-west Wales's economy, which rightly has its own unique Welsh cultural identity. I am also concerned about rural sparsity issues. The delivery of health, education and social services needs an increased recognition of resource distribution. Far more weight is given to this matter in Scotland than in Wales. I am also concerned about the weak infrastructure assessment. If the spatial plan is to provide a context for guiding public and private investment decisions, more work must be done on transport, water, water waste, flood management—which is dear to my heart—energy networks and so on. In north Wales, as in other areas, transport is a key element. Travelling across north Wales is still problematic and long-winded, and travelling from north to south is even worse. This spatial plan is to be highly commended, but it should build upon the asset management work of local authorities to provide an evidence base for more informed funding decisions.

**Irene James:** I welcome this spatial development across Wales. I will restrain my comments to the south-east, and the south Wales Valleys areas. The Valleys have been spatially targeted before—targeted by the Tories for mass unemployment and poverty, destroying lives and local communities. Unfortunately, this legacy is pervasive and, as the plan recognises, the largest concentration of deprivation is in the upper south Wales Valleys. While the Assembly's economic development strategy, Communities First, and Objective 1 are reversing this legacy, ensuring the return of high-skilled jobs and employment, a spatially sensitive response to the decline in mining and heavy manufacturing in Wales is vital to secure and strengthen Valleys regeneration. The spatial plan also affords us the opportunity to recognise our greater cultural diversity in Wales and the Valleys. While the Welsh language is an important part of

ddwyrain ddau ddiwylliant gwahanol a dwy gyfres o heriau gwahanol. Yn ôl ffigurau diweddar gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, mae pobl yn parhau i symud o swydd Gaer i sir y Flint a Wrecsam, ond nid yw hynny'n cynorthwyo economi'r Gogledd-orllewin eto, sydd â'i hunaniaeth ddiwylliannol Gymreig unigryw ei hun. Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu am faterion sy'n ymwneud â theneurwydd y boblogaeth wledig. Er mwyn cyflawni ym maes iechyd, addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, mae angen gwell cydnabyddiaeth o'r broses dosbarthu adnoddau. Rhoddir llawer mwy o bwys i'r mater hwn yn yr Alban nac yng Nghymru. Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu am yr asesiad seilwaith gwan. Er mwyn i'r cynllun gofodol ddarparu cyd-destun ar gyfer llywio penderfyniadau buddsoddi cyhoeddus a phreifat, rhaid gwneud mwy o waith ar drafnidiaeth, dŵr, gwastraff dŵr, rheoli llifogydd—sy'n fater pwysig imi—rhwydweithiau ynni ac yn y blaen. Yn y Gogledd, fel mewn ardaloedd eraill, mae trafnidiaeth yn elfen allweddol. Mae teithio ar draws y Gogledd yn broblematig ac yn hirwyntog o hyd, ac mae teithio o'r Gogledd i'r De yn waeth byth. Dylid cymeradwyo'r cynllun gofodol hwn yn fawr, ond dylai adeiladu ar waith rheoli asedau awdurdodau lleol er mwyn darparu sail tystiolaeth ar gyfer penderfyniadau ariannu mwy hydrysog.

**Irene James:** Croesawaf y datblygiad gofodol hwn ledled Cymru. Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i'r De-ddwyrain, ac i ardaloedd Cymoedd y De. Targedwyd y Cymoedd yn ofodol yn y gorffennol—fe'u targedwyd gan y Torfaid ar gyfer diweithdra ar raddfa helaeth a thlodi, gan ddinistrio bywydau a chymunedau lleol. Yn anffodus, mae'r etifeddiaeth hon yn parhau ac, fel y cydnabu'r cynllun, mae'r amddifadedd mwyaf i'w weld yn rhan uchaf Cymoedd y De. Er bod strategaeth datblygu economaidd y Cynulliad, Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac Amcan 1 yn unioni'r problemau a etifeddwyd, gan sicrhau bod swyddi crefftus a chyflogaeth yn dychwelyd i'r ardal, mae ymateb gofodol sensitif i ddirywiad y diwydiant mwyngloddio a gweithgynhyrchu trwm yng Nghymru yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau ac atgyfherthu adfywiad y Cymoedd. Mae'r cynllun gofodol hefyd yn rhoi cyfre inni gydnabod ein hamrywiaeth diwylliannol

respecting the distinctiveness of Wales, the Labour history of the Valleys, the buildings, halls, libraries and communities built alongside the industrial heritage of south Wales, and support for their preservation, is of equal importance. Following the elections in June, which swept the nationalists out of Caerphilly and Rhondda Cynon Taf after five years of failure, lacklustre performance and no strategic vision for the Valleys, we have a renewed opportunity to work together in a better way for the people of south Wales. Despite some reservations, I have been contacted by Caerphilly council to welcome this strategic document and particularly the recognition of the increased role that Valleys towns could play in the future success of the south-east Wales area. I ask the Minister for her assurances that the implementation of this strategy will acknowledge the strategic work undertaken for the five counties strategy, which identified Caerphilly, Blackwood, Pontypool, Ebbw Vale, Newport and Cwmbran as priority town centres where opportunities should be actively sought.

Ultimately, this strategic vision provides a renewed focus for future development in Wales, which we should all embrace and support.

**Elin Jones:** Mewn egwyddor, cytunaf yn llwyr â'r bwriad i gynllunio'n ofodol. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi arddel ers amser yr angen am bolisi rhanbarthol yn seiliedig ar ganolfannau twf. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn dymuno mynd ymhellach na'r hyn sydd o'n blaen a hynny drwy osod targedau pendant i'r gwahanol ranbarthau, yn enwedig targedau creu swyddi. Byddai hynny'n gorfodi'r sector cyhoeddus i fuddsoddi i gwrdd â'r targedau hynny. Mae pob math o ystadegau yn dangos inni fod rhai o'r ardaloedd mwyaf gorllewinol neu ar flaenau'r Cymoedd yn gweld y buddsoddiad cyhoeddus lleiaf o ran creu swyddi.

Mae Plaid Cymru hefyd yn credu y dylid creu canolfan dwf benodol ar gyfer blaenau'r Cymoedd yn hytrach na chyflysu cymoedd penodol gyda dinasoedd penodol. Deallaf y

ehangach yng Nghymru a'r Cymoedd. Er bod yr iaith Gymraeg yn rhan bwysig o barchu natur arbennig Cymru, mae hanes Llafur y Cymoedd, yr adeiladau, y neuaddau, y llyfrgelloedd a'r cymunedau a adeiladwyd ochr yn ochr â threftadaeth ddiwylliannol y De, a'r gefnogaeth i'w cadw, yr un mor bwysig. Yn dilyn yr etholiadau ym mis Mehefin, a gafodd wared ar y cenedlaetholwyr o Gaerffili a Rhondda Cynon Taf ar ôl pum mlynedd o fethiant, perfformiad diddim a diffyg gweledigaeth strategol i'r Cymoedd, mae gennym gyfle o'r newydd i gydweithio'n well er budd pobl y De. Er gwaethaf rhai amheuon, cysylltodd cyngor Caerffili â mi i groesawu'r ddogfen strategol hon ac yn arbennig y gydnabyddiaeth a roddir i'r rôl gynyddol y gallai trefi'r Cymoedd ei chwarae yn llwyddiant ardal y De-ddwyrain yn y dyfodol. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd y bydd y broses o weithredu'r strategaeth hon yn cydnabod y gwaith strategol a wnaed fel rhan o strategaeth y pum sir, a nododd Caerffili, y Coed Duon, Pont-y-pŵl, Glynebwy, Casnewydd a Chwmbbrân fel canolfannau trefi y dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth iddynt ac y dylid chwilio am gyfleoedd ar eu cyfer.

Yn y pen draw, mae'r weledigaeth strategol hon yn rhoi ffocws newydd ar gyfer datblygu yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru, a dylem oll ei chroesawu a'i chefnogi.

**Elin Jones:** In principle, I agree entirely with the intention to undertake spatial planning. Plaid Cymru has called for a regional policy based on centres of growth for a long time, but we want to go further than the document before us this afternoon by setting specific targets for the various regions, particularly job-creation targets, which would then force the public sector to invest in order to meet those targets. All sorts of statistics show us that some of the most westerly regions, or those at the heads of the Valleys, see the least amount of public investment in terms of job creation.

Plaid Cymru also believes that a specific centre for growth should be created for the heads of the Valleys rather than linking specific valleys with specific cities. I

ddadl bod cysylltiadau a theithio naturiol rhwng y Cymoedd a'r dinasoedd ond wrth gyplysu'r Cymoedd gyda'r dinasoedd, caniateir i fuddsoddiad yn y dinasoedd gelu'r diffyg buddsoddiad yn y Cymoedd—hen batrwm sydd wedi amddifadu'r Cymoedd o fuddsoddiad ers blynnyddoedd.

O ran yr adran ar gymunedau cynaliadwy, gwrrthodaf yn llwyr y datganiad bod angen mewnfudo i gynnal ein cymunedau. Nid oes cyfeiriad yn y cymal hwn at yr angen i leihau allfudo. Gwyddom o'r cyfrifiad fod 22 y cant o'r rhai sy'n galw eu hunain yn Gymry yn byw tu allan i Gymru a bod 38 y cant o'r rhain yn raddedigion.

Dengys y ffigurau fod *brain drain* o Gymru. Ychydig o bwyslais a roddodd y Llywodraeth yn y ddogfen ar weithgaredd i geisio lleihau y llif hwnnw ac i sicrhau, fel sydd yn digwydd mor llwyddiannus yn Iwerddon, bod ymgais i ddenu pobl yn ôl i Gymru drwy'r cynllun Llwybro-Routes. Ni wneir hynny ar raddfa digon eang ar hyn o bryd.

Mae seilio strategaeth genedlaethol ar yr angen am fewnfudo, tra'n anwybyddu allfudo bron yn gyfan gwbl, yn anghyfrifol. Cyfeiriad at y cymalau gwbl ddiwerth a diystyr yn y ddogfen hon, fel yr angen am 'reolaeth sensitif' ar fewnfudo. I ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd Alun Ffred Jones, sut mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu rheoli mewnfudo a beth yn y byd yw ystyr y term 'sensitif' yn y cyd-destun hwnnw? Gyda'm tafod yn fy moch, i raddau, fe'ch atgoffaf mai'r person diwethaf i gyfeirio at reoli mewnfudo yng nghyd-destun Cymru oedd y Cynghorydd Simon Glyn.

Yn olaf, o ran materion sy'n ymwneud ag arfordir Ceredigion, a chan bod amser yn brin, croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog ddoe—fe'i crybwyllir yn y cynllun gofodol hefyd—bod Aberystwyth yn parhau yn lleoliad ar gyfer swyddfa ranbarthol i'r Cynulliad.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There is no more time available. I ask the Minister to wind up.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I only

understand the argument that there are natural links and routes between the Valleys and cities but linking the Valleys with cities allows investment in the urban areas to disguise the lack of investment in the Valleys themselves—an old pattern that has deprived the Valleys of investment for many years.

On the section on sustainable communities, I completely reject the assertion that we need inward migration to sustain our communities. There is no reference in this section to the need to reduce migration. We know from the census that 22 per cent of those who call themselves Welsh live outside Wales and that 38 per cent of these are graduates.

The figures show that there is a brain drain from Wales. The Government has placed little emphasis in the document on activity to try to reduce that flow and to ensure, as is happening so successfully in Ireland, that there is an attempt to attract people back to Wales through the Llwybro-Routes scheme. That is not done broadly enough at the moment.

Basing a national strategy on the need for inward migration, while ignoring migration almost completely, is irresponsible. I refer to the entirely meaningless phrases in this document, such as the need for 'sensitive management' of inward migration. Following on from what Alun Ffred Jones said, how does the Government intend to manage inward migration and what on earth is the meaning of the term 'sensitive' in that context? With my tongue slightly in my cheek, I remind you that the last person to refer to managing inward migration in Wales was Councillor Simon Glyn.

Finally, on a matter relating to the Ceredigion coastline, and since time is short, I welcome the statement made by the Minister yesterday—it is also mentioned in the spatial plan—that Aberystwyth is still proposed as a site for a regional Assembly office.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes rhagor o amser ar gael. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gloi'r ddadl.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Nid oes

have a brief amount of time in which to respond to a range of questions. Therefore, I will try to write to those whom I do not have time to answer.

First, I welcome the interesting debate. There were some positive contributions and interesting angles throughout Wales. The point on boundaries and rigid targets is a difficult one. Many of those regions and hubs on the map do not necessarily correspond to local authority boundaries or other areas where we normally collect statistics. Overall, we will consider ways in which we can monitor and measure the progress on this because it is not just about jobs, but a range of investment. Clearly, that work will need to be undertaken.

4.00 p.m.

On young people's involvement, we are keen to see them involved. The group involved with the sustainable development plan is a good example, as is Funky Dragon. They capture people's imagination. On the points raised by Huw, Irene, Christine and others about the importance of the Valleys, I hope that the plan does that for those communities. We are not walking away from communities where jobs and training are needed. I liked Huw's phrase about south-east Wales being a 'network city region'.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** It may be nothing more than a drafting amendment, but will you ensure that the key towns of the Caerphilly borough are included on the spatial vision map, and that due prominence is given to them as key centres?

**Sue Essex:** On Irene's point about the work undertaken in the five counties, in terms of taking this plan forward, these local authorities will be in the driving seat. There is a lot of enthusiasm in south-east Wales, and I know that authorities such as Caerphilly County Borough Council want to be involved. I assure you that we will consider the points raised as we roll the plan forward. It sends a positive message that south Wales will be networked and

gennyf lawer o amser i ymateb i amrywiaeth o gwestiynau. Felly, ceisiaf ysgrifennu at y rhai na fydd gennyf amser i'w hateb.

Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y ddadl ddiddorol hon. Cafwyd rhai cyfraniadau cadarnhaol a safbwytiau diddorol ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'r pwynt ynglŷn â ffiniau a thargedau caeth yn un anodd. Nid yw llawer o'r rhanbarthau a'r canolfannau hynny ar y map o reidrwydd yn cyfateb â ffiniau awdurdodau lleol nac ardaloedd eraill lle yr ydym yn casglu ystadegau fel arfer. Yn gyffredinol, byddwn yn ystyried ffyrdd y gallwn fonitro a mesur y cynnydd ar hyn gan nad oes a wnelo â swyddi yn unig, ond ag amrywiaeth o fuddsoddi. Yn amlwg, bydd angen ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwnnw.

O ran cyfranogiad pobl ifanc, yr ydym yn awyddus iddynt gael eu cynnwys. Mae'r grŵp sy'n ymwneud â'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy yn enghraifft dda, a'r Ddraig FfynCi hefyd. Maent yn llwyddo i danio dychymyg pobl. O ran y pwyntiau a godwyd gan Huw, Irene, Christine ac eraill o ran pwysigrwydd y Cymoedd, gobeithiaf fod y cynllun yn gwneud hynny i'r cymunedau hynny. Nid ydym yn troi ein cefnau ar gymunedau lle y mae angen swyddi ac hyfforddiant. Yr oeddwn yn hoffi ymadrodd Huw a nododd fod y De-ddwyrain yn 'rhanbarth rhwydwaith dinasoedd'.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae'n bosibl na fydd yn fwy na gwelliant drafftio, ond a sicrhewch fod trefi allweddol bwrdeistref Caerffili wedi'u cynnwys ar y map gweledigaeth ofodol, ac y rhoddir amlygrwydd priodol iddynt fel canolfannau allweddol?

**Sue Essex:** O ran pwynt Irene am y gwaith a wnaed yn y pum sir, o ran datblygu'r cynllun hwn, yr awdurdodau hyn fydd wrth y llyw. Ceir llawer o frwdfrydedd yn y De-ddwyrain, a gwn fod awdurdodau megis Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili yn awyddus i gymryd rhan. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn ystyried y pwyntiau a godwyd wrth inni gyflwyno'r cynllun. Mae'n cyfleo neges gadarnhaol y caiff y De ei rhwydweithio a'i hintegreiddio. Rhydd gyfleo i bobl, ble bynnag

integrated. It will give people an opportunity, wherever they live in the Valleys, to try to access jobs and services.

Mick, this is not just about planning. The easiest read across is to community strategies that local authorities have produced. It will be seen through planning and development plans, but you are missing the point if you do not understand that this is about a total sweep of activity. Huw's point about training is as important as some of the land use policies. It must come together.

I am keen to take forward the marine dimension to which some Members referred. There are limitations on how we could express that dimension in this plan, due to the issues of control and the complex nature of the marine environment and government. I discussed this issue with Christine Gwyther, and it is something we need to look at for the future, in Pembrokeshire and in other areas.

As I do not have much time left, I will pick up on the inward migration aspect, which has been misrepresented. We say clearly that we want to retain young people within Wales. We want to ensure that housing, facilities and training are available for people who want to stay here and we want to attract people back to Wales. We are currently undertaking such activities. The Llwybro scheme is important in contacting Welsh people living outside Wales so that they return and become part of a growing economy.

We know that we need to attract new people—this is crucial in health. The health service is successful at attracting people from England, the Philippines, Germany, Italy and beyond to Wales to study. They are also attracted to learn the language if they live in rural areas and the heartlands. However, we cannot walk away from issues regarding the future demography of Wales. If we are to help the Heads of the Valleys, we must increase the population in those areas. That is fundamental, and it is not our responsibility as a Government to walk away from that issue. It involves working with people on the ground to achieve that.

y maent yn byw yn y Cymoedd, i gael swyddi a gwasanaethau.

Mick, nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â chynllunio yn unig. Mae'n fwyaf perthnasol i strategaethau cymunedol a gynhyrchwyd gan awdurdodau lleol. Fe'i gwelir drwy waith cynllunio a chynlluniau datblygu, ond yr ydych yn methu'r pwynt oni ddeallwch ei fod yn cwmpasu amrediad cyfan o weithgarwch. Mae pwynt Huw ynglŷn â hyfforddiant yr un mor bwysig â rhai o'r polisiau defnyddio tir. Rhaid uno'r holl bethau hyn.

Yr wyf yn awyddus i ddatblygu'r dimensiwn morol y cyfeiriodd rhai Aelodau ato. Ceir cyfyngiadau o ran sut y gallem gyfleo'r dimensiwn hwnnw yn y cynllun hwn, oherwydd materion rheoli a natur gymhleth yr amgylchedd morol a rheoli. Trafodais y mater hwn gyda Christine Gwyther, ac mae'n rhywbeth y mae angen inni ei ystyried yn y dyfodol, yn sir Benfro ac mewn ardaloedd eraill.

Gan nad oes gennyf lawer o amser ar ôl, trafodaf yr agwedd ar fewnfudo, sydd wedi'i chamliwio. Nodwn yn glir ein bod am gadw pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod tai, cyfleusterau a hyfforddiant ar gael i'r bobl sydd am aros yma ac yr ydym am ddenu pobl i ddychwelyd i Gymru. Yr ydym wrthi ar hyn o bryd yn ymgymryd â gweithgareddau o'r fath. Mae'r cynllun Llwybro yn bwysig wrth gysylltu â Chymry sy'n byw y tu allan i Gymru er mwyn iddynt ddychwelyd a dod yn rhan o economi sy'n tyfu.

Gwyddom fod angen inni ddenu pobl newydd—mae hyn yn hanfodol ym maes iechyd. Mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn llwyddo i ddenu pobl o Loegr, Ynysoedd y Philipinos, yr Almaen, yr Eidal a thu hwnt i Gymru i astudio. Cânt eu denu hefyd i ddysgu'r iaith os byddant yn byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig a'r brôydd. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn droi ein cefnau ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â demograffi Cymru yn y dyfodol. Er mwyn inni helpu Blaenau'r Cymoedd, rhaid inni gynyddu'r boblogaeth yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae hynny'n hanfodol, ac nid yw'n gyfrifoldeb arnom ni fel Llywodraeth i droi ein cefnau ar y mater hwnnw. Mae'n golygu gweithio gyda phobl ar lawr gwlad i gyflawni

hynny.

In conclusion, I thank everyone who has worked with us. We have received a lot of support from both environment and business groups across the sectors to take this plan forward. I hope the spirit seen here today, and the spirit in which we have conducted the plan, will take us into an exciting time.

I gloi, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a fu'n gweithio gyda ni. Yr ydym wedi cael llawer o gefnogaeth gan grwpiau amgylcheddol a grwpiau busnes ar draws y sectorau o ran datblygu'r cynllun hwn. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr ysbryd a welwyd yma heddiw, a'r ysbryd y lluniwyd y cynllun ynddo, yn ein twyws i gyfnod cyffrous.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.*

*Amendment 1: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 39.*

*Amendment 2: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 39.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter	Barrett, Lorraine
Burnham, Eleanor	Bourne, Nick
Davies, Jocelyn	Cairns, Alun
German, Michael	Chapman, Christine
Jones, Alun Ffred	Cuthbert, Jeff
Jones, Elin	Davidson, Jane
Jones, Helen Mary	Davies, Andrew
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Davies, David
Lloyd, David	Davies, Glyn
Randerson, Jenny	Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Ryder, Janet	Essex, Sue
Thomas, Owen John	Francis, Lisa
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Gibbons, Brian
Williams, Brynle	Graham, William
Williams, Kirsty	Gregory, Janice
	Griffiths, John
	Gwyther, Christine
	Hart, Edwina
	Hutt, Jane
	Idris Jones, Denise
	Isherwood, Mark
	James, Irene
	Jones, Ann
	Jones, Carwyn
	Jones, Laura Anne
	Law, Peter
	Lewis, Huw
	Lloyd, Val
	Melding, David
	Mewies, Sandy
	Morgan, Jonathan
	Morgan, Rhodri
	Neagle, Lynne
	Pugh, Alun
	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 3: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Melding, David	Law, Peter
Morgan, Jonathan	Lewis, Huw
Randerson, Jenny	Lloyd, Val
Ryder, Janet	Mewies, Sandy
Thomas, Owen John	Morgan, Rhodri
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Neagle, Lynne
Williams, Brynle	Pugh, Alun
Williams, Kirsty	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 43.*  
*Amendment 4: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 43.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
Amendment 5: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 11, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.  
Amendment 6: For 11, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 17, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 7: For 17, Abstain 8, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 17, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 8: For 17, Abstain 9, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin

Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

4.10 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2173): O blaid 46, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM2173): For 46, Abstain 8, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1 and 8 in the name of David Melding, amendments 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 6 and 7 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. welcomes the third annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales; and*

*2. notes that the Minister for Health and Social Services will draw up a response and report to the National Assembly on this by 31 January 2005. (NDM2174)*

I am pleased to introduce Peter Clarke's third annual report. This year, the report notes that he has now reached the halfway stage of his seven-year tenure, and I wish to state, on behalf of us all, how much we value his work. I intend to respond formally, and in detail, to the report in the new year, but I will respond today to key points, particularly those that arise from last year's report.

In this year's report, Peter highlights the findings and recommendations of the Clywch inquiry—his first formal investigation. The inquiry concerned serious allegations of sexual abuse at a school, and how they were dealt with at the time. We published our initial response to his recommendations and

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 ac 8 yn enw David Melding, gwelliannau 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 6 a 7 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn croesawu trydydd adroddiad blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru; ac*

*2. yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn llunio ymateb ac adroddiad arno ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol erbyn 31 Ionawr 2005. (NDM2174)*

Mae'n blesar gennylgyflwyno trydydd adroddiad blynnyddol Peter Clark. Eleni, noda'r adroddiad ei fod bellach hanner ffordd drwy ei benodiad saith mlynedd, a hoffwn ddweud, ar ran pob un ohonom, cymaint yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi ei waith. Bwriadaf ymateb yn ffurfiol, ac yn fanwl, i'r adroddiad yn y flwyddyn newydd, ond ymatebaf heddiw i bwyntiau allweddol, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n codi o adroddiad y llynedd.

Yn yr adroddiad eleni, noda Peter ganfyddiadau ac argymhellion ymchwiliad Clywch—ei ymchwiliad ffurfiol cyntaf. Yr oedd yr ymchwiliad yn ymwneud â honiadau difrifol o gam-drin plant yn rhywiol mewn ysgol, a'r ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â hwy ar y pryd. Bu inni gyhoeddi ein hymateb

presented it to Plenary in September. We have already acted on some, for example, by publishing guidance on staff disciplinary procedures in schools and explaining how allegations of child abuse are to be handled. Other responses are in the course of being implemented. Similarly, we are taking comprehensive action in response to the recommendations directed at the Assembly Government in his report, 'Telling Concerns'. We have promised to ensure that children and young people will have access to an advocacy service in health, social care and education settings. We have set up an advocacy unit to provide strategic direction for the development of advocacy services for children and young people, and a task group, to support that commitment. As a result of our action, from June this year, children in need have had a statutory right to an advocacy service when making a complaint to a social services department. Each local authority in Wales now has a contract with an advocacy provider to deliver this service. We also fund ChildLine Wales to provide a national helpline to support the service.

Peter refers to his evidence that bullying persists as a problem for many children and young people, and Jane Davidson and I share his concern. We are taking action in several ways to deal with bullying. Our guidance sets out the need for all schools to have bullying policies that have been drawn up in full consultation with staff, pupils, parents and governors. To reinforce this, Jane will shortly be writing to all schools, reminding them of the need to follow this guidance and asking for examples of good practice that can be shared across Wales. In addition, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will ask all schools to submit their anti-bullying policies for assessment, to ensure that the guidance is being followed appropriately. Officials have begun work on information for children on how to respond to being bullied, and how to help their fellow pupils who are victims. This will be issued next year, once young people have been consulted on its contents.

cychwynnol i'w argymhellion a'i gyflwyno i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Medi. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gweithredu ar rai ohonynt, er enghraift, drwy gyhoeddi canllawiau ar weithdrefnau disgynblu staff mewn ysgolion ac esbonio sut y dylid ymdrin â honiadau o gam-drin plant. Mae ymatebion eraill yn cael eu gweithredu ar hyn o bryd. Yn yr un modd, yr ydym yn cymryd camau ynglŷn â phob agwedd ar yr argymhellion a gyfeiriwyd at Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei adroddiad, 'Datgan Pryderon'. Yr ydym wedi addo sierhau y bydd gwasanaeth eiriolaeth ar gael i blant a phobl ifanc mewn lleoliadau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu uned eiriolaeth i roi cyfeiriad strategol ar gyfer datblygu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth i blant a phobl ifanc, a grŵp gorchwyl, i helpu i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. O ganlyniad i'r camau a gymerwyd gennym, o fis Mehefin eleni, mae gan blant mewn angen hawl statudol i gael gwasanaeth eiriolaeth wrth wneud cwyn i adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Erbyn hyn, mae gan bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru gontract gyda darparwr eiriolaeth i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwn. Yr ydym hefyd yn ariannu ChildLine Cymru i ddarparu llinell gymorth genedlaethol i ategu'r gwasanaeth.

Cyfeiria Peter at ei dystiolaeth bod bwlio yn parhau i fod yn broblem i lawer o blant a phobl ifanc, ac mae Jane Davidson a minnau yn rhannu ei bryder. Yr ydym yn gweithredu mewn sawl ffordd i ymdrin â bwlio. Noda ein canllawiau fod angen i bob ysgol gael polisi yn ymwned â bwlio sydd wedi'i lunio ar ôl ymgynghori'n llawn â staff, disgynblion, rhieni a llywodraethwyr. Er mwyn atgyfnerthu hyn bydd Jane yn ysgrifennu at bob ysgol cyn hir, yn eu hatgoffa bod angen dilyn y canllawiau hyn ac yn gofyn am enghreifftiau o arferion da y gellir eu rhannu ledled Cymru. Yn ogystal, bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn gofyn i bob ysgol gyflwyno eu polisiau gwrrth-fwllo i'w hasesu, er mwyn sierhau y caiff y canllawiau eu dilyn yn gywir. Mae swyddogion wedi dechrau gweithio ar wybodaeth i blant ynglŷn â sut i ymateb os caint eu bwlio, a sut i helpu cyd-ddisgyblion sy'n cael eu bwlio. Caiff ei chyhoeddi y flwyddyn nesaf, ar ôl ymgynghori â phobl ifanc ar ei chynnwys.

Peter has been considering issues of access and transport, including travel to and from school, where the views of children point to variability in the quality of provision. Jane Davidson is leading on the work being undertaken to ensure that school transport is safe for all pupils. We must also learn the lessons of the tragic accident that occurred in my constituency two years ago, and I will shortly present the video on safety issues, which was produced by Stuart's Campaign, to the Cabinet committee for children and young people.

Peter has welcomed proposals in the School Transport Bill for local education authorities to pilot innovative travel schemes, and has endorsed our approach to school travel plans. Also, officials will shortly revise the guidance issued to local education authorities on school transport, to update it and to give it a proper focus on safety issues. Since the commissioner's last report, officials have carried out a survey of school transport provided by local authorities, which contributed to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee's policy review of school transport. We will issue revised guidance following the conclusion and report of the committee's review.

I was pleased to read of Peter's support for the report of the child poverty task group, which was chaired by Dr Charlotte Williams. I will bring the Assembly Government's child poverty strategy to Plenary in January. Peter also mentions the need for further development of services for parents and others who are involved in raising children. Again, I am pleased to report that this is in hand, following discussions, a few months ago, with Children in Wales and representatives of its parenting network, Fforwm Magu Plant, to discuss how best to take this forward. We have established a joint working group to prepare a parenting action plan for Wales. I hope to launch this action plan for consultation in early 2005.

On the amendments, I fully support

Mae Peter wedi bod yn ystyried materion ynglŷn â mynediad a chludiant, gan gynnwys teithio i'r ysgol ac oddi yno. Mae sylwadau plant yn awgrymu bod ansawdd y ddarpariaeth yn hyn o beth yn amrywio. Mae Jane Davidson yn arwain ar y gwaith a wneir i sicrhau bod cludiant i'r ysgol yn ddiogel i bob disgybl. Rhaid inni hefyd ddysgu'r gwersi o'r ddamwain drychinebus yn fy etholaeth ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a, chyn hir, byddaf yn cyflwyno fideo ar faterion diogelwch, a gynhyrchwyd gan Ymgurch Stuart, i bwyllgor y Cabinet ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc.

Mae Peter wedi croesawu cynigion yn y Mesur Cludiant i'r Ysgol i awdurdodau addysg lleol dreialu cynlluniau teithio arloesol, ac mae wedi cymeradwyo ein hymagwedd tuag at gynlluniau teithio ysgolion. Hefyd, cyn hir, bydd swyddogion yn diwygio'r canllawiau a roddir i awdurdodau addysg lleol ar gludiant i'r ysgol, i'w diweddar ac i sicrhau eu bod yn canolbwytio'n briodol ar faterion diogelwch. Ers adroddiad diwethaf y comisiynydd, mae swyddogion wedi cynnal arolwg o gludiant i'r ysgol a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol, a gyfrannodd at adolygiad polisi'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes o gludiant i'r ysgol. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi canllawiau diwygiedig ar ôl i'r pwyllgor gwblhau ei adolygiad a rhoi adroddiad arno.

Yr oedd yn dda gennyf ddarllen am gefnogaeth Peter i adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl ar dodi plant, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Dr Charlotte Williams. Cyflwynaf strategaeth tlodi plant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Ionawr. Mae Peter hefyd yn sôn am yr angen i ddatblygu ymhellach wasanaethau i rieni ac eraill sy'n magu plant. Unwaith eto, mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod hyn ar droed, yn dilyn trafodaethau, ychydig fisoeedd yn ôl, gyda Plant yng Nghymru a chynrychiolwyr o'i rhwydwaith rhianta, Fforwm Magu Plant, i drafod y ffordd orau o weithredu ar hyn. Yr ydym wedi sefydlu gweithgor ar y cyd i baratoi cynllun gweithredu rhianta i Gymru. Gobeithiaf lansio ymgynghoriad ar y cynllun gweithredu hwn ar ddechrau 2005.

O ran y gwelliannau, cefnogaf yn llwyr

amendment 1 and join David Melding and colleagues in congratulating Peter on the considerable contribution that he makes to safeguard the rights and interests of children and young people in Wales.

I cannot support amendments 2, 6 and 8. The Assembly Government's position on the powers of the Children's Commissioner for Wales has always been to support the extension of the full range of his powers to non-devolved matters. We must ensure that children and young people have a single point of contact when raising concerns. The important point now is to ensure that the arrangements in the Children Bill can be operated with the maximum of clarity.

I also reject amendments 3 and 7 on our 10-year strategy—'Everybody's Business'—to improve child and adolescent mental health services. I reiterate my commitment to implementing this strategy. As Peter said, this is a pioneering strategy. I have strengthened the implementation group and announced additional funding of £1.2 million for these services—particularly for emergency beds. Child and adolescent mental health services were also a key target for the service and financial framework and Children First. We also consulted with key professionals in child and adolescent mental health services to take this forward. A firm foundation has been laid for future improvement.

In respect of amendment 4 on the social care workforce, I share Peter Clarke's view on the fundamental importance of this issue. We addressed it together at a recent European social work action day held in the Assembly. The Assembly Government is working hard to address recruitment difficulties. The numbers in social work training have increased this year from 287 to 372, and, in addition, in September 2003—the latest date for which figures are available—over 200 people were being supported by their employers to undertake in-service training for a social work qualification. This is a grow-your-own approach, as part of our strategy to tackle recruitment and retention in Wales. Our work to secure and increase the

welliant 1 ac ymunaf â David Melding a'm cyd-Aelodau i longyfarch Peter ar y cyfraniad sylweddol a wna i amddiffyn hawliau a buddiannau plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliannau 2, 6 a 8. O ran pwerau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wastad wedi cefnogi estyn ystod lawn ei bwerau i faterion nas datganolwyd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan blant a phobl ifanc un pwynt cyswllt pan fyddant yn codi pryderon. Y pwynt pwysig yn awr yw sicrhau y gall y trefniadau yn y Mesur Plant gael eu rhoi ar waith gyda chymaint o eglurder â phosibl.

Gwrthodaf welliannau 3 a 7 hefyd ynglŷn â'n strategaeth 10 mlynedd—'Busnes Pawb'—i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Ailddatganaf fy ymrwymiad i weithredu'r strategaeth hon. Fel y dywedodd Peter, mae hon yn strategaeth arloesol. Yr wyf wedi atgyfnerthu'r grŵp gweithredu ac wedi cyhoeddi bod £1.2 miliwn o arian ychwanegol ar gael ar gyfer y gwasanaethau hyn—yn enwedig ar gyfer gwelyau brys. Yr oedd gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed hefyd yn un o dargedau allweddol i'r fframwaith gwasanaeth a chyllid a Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf. Bu inni hefyd ymgynghori â gweithwyr proffesiynol allweddol yng ngwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed i ddatblygu hyn. Gosodwyd sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer gwella'r gwasanaeth yn y dyfodol.

O ran gwelliant 4 ynglŷn â'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol, rhannaf farn Peter Clarke ynglŷn â pa mor hanfodol bwysig yw'r mater hwn. Bu inni ymdrin ag ef gyda'n gilydd mewn diwrnod gweithredu Ewropeaidd ar waith cymdeithasol a gynhalwyd yn ddiweddar yn y Cynulliad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n galed i fynd i'r afael ag anawsterau reciwtio. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n hyfforddi fel gweithwyr cymdeithasol wedi cynyddu eleni o 287 i 372, ac, yn ogystal, ym mis Medi 2003—y dyddiad diweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael—cafodd dros 200 o bobl gymorth gan eu cyflogwyr i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant mewn swydd i ennill cymhwyster gwaith cymdeithasol. Yr ydym yn mynd ati i

numbers also included the introduction, from September 2004, of new degree-level training and bursaries for students who are not supported by an employer. The degree-level training in social work is already taking us forward. I therefore reject that amendment.

Finally, on amendment 5, I agree that the children's commissioner should be able to present his annual report directly to Members. We now need to find a way for this to happen—it requires an amendment to Standing Orders—and I hope that a suitable change can be made. It is not a matter for me, as Minister, to take forward, therefore, technically, I cannot support it, but I certainly support the spirit of this amendment.

In conclusion, the report demonstrates powerfully the many aspects of children's lives with which Peter and his office are concerned, and the wide variety of ways in which he makes a significant impact on their behalf. This was our vision, when all parties worked together to establish this office. He is now achieving what we intended.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the speakers who will propose the amendments, I note that we have more speakers than time allows, I therefore appeal for expeditious speeches.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: in point 1, delete ‘; and’ and add:

*, and congratulates the commissioner and his office for their dedication to protecting the interests of children; and*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern the confusion caused by the proposed introduction of a UK commissioner with responsibility over*

ddatblygu staff ein hunain, fel rhan o'n strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â recriwtio a chadw yng Nghymru. Yr oedd ein gwaith i sicrhau a chynyddu'r niferoedd hefyd yn cynnwys cyflwyno, o fis Medi 2004, hyfforddiant newydd ar lefel gradd a bwrsariau i fyfyrwyr nad ydynt yn cael cymorth gan gyflogwr. Mae'r hyfforddiant ar lefel gradd ym maes gwaith cymdeithasol eisoes yn ein helpu i wneud cynnydd. Felly gwrrhodaf y gwelliant hwnnw.

Yn olaf, o ran gwelliant 5, cytunaf y dylai fod gan y comisiynydd plant yr hawl i gyflwyno ei adroddiad blynnyddol yn unioingyrchol i Aelodau. Yn awr, mae angen inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd—bydd angen diwygio'r Rheolau Sefydlog—a gobeithiaf y gellir gwneud newid addas. Nid yw hynny'n fater i mi, fel y Gweinidog, fynd i'r afael ag ef, felly, yn dechnegol, ni allaf ei gefnogi, ond yn sicr cefnogaf ysbryd y gwelliant hwn.

I gloi, dengys yr adroddiad yn rymus yr agweddu lawer ar fywydau plant y mae Peter a'i swyddfa yn ymwneud â hwy, a'r amrywiaeth mawr o ffyrdd y mae'n cael dylanwad mawr ar eu rhan. Dyna oedd ein gweledigaeth, pan weithiodd pob plaid gyda'i gilydd i sefydlu'r swyddfa hon. Mae bellach yn cyflawni'r hyn a fwriadwyd gennym.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar y siaradwyr a fydd yn cynnig y gwelliannau, nodaf fod gennym fwy o siaradwyr nag y bydd amser yn ei ganiatáu, felly apeliaf am areithiau byr.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 1, dileu ‘; ac’ac ychwanegu:

*, ac yn llonyfarch y comisiynydd a'i swyddfa ar eu hymroddiad i amddiffyn buddiannau plant; a*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiweddu y cynnig:

*yn nodi â phryder y dryswch sydd wedi'i achosi gan y bwriad i gyflwyno comisiynydd y DU fydd â chyfrifoldeb dros faterion a*

*reserved matters.*

I welcome the opportunity to debate the annual report of the children's commissioner and to discuss the significance to Wales of having our own children's commissioner. In moving amendments 1 and 8 in the name of David Melding, I pay tribute to Peter Clarke and his team for their dedication and commitment to the rights and wellbeing of our young people. I am delighted that the Minister has accepted amendment 1. I suggest, in the spirit of consensus, that when we debate future reports from the children's commissioner, the Government might wish to include these words in its motion in order to welcome those reports. I think that it is right and proper that motions include such tributes, particularly when the work undertaken by the children's commissioner is so valuable a contribution to the policy process with which we are all concerned.

4.20 p.m.

Secondly, I refer to the confusion that will arise with regard to the proposed UK children's commissioner—this relates to amendment 8. There is no doubt that there will be confusion. Peter Clarke, as the Children's Commissioner for Wales, has a remit that relates directly to the Assembly's devolved remit. Merely allowing the UK children's commissioner to respond to the relevant secretary of state on reserved issues will mean considerable confusion for people living in Wales, who will not know who to approach in order to complain or to raise points of concern. The operation of the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service, for example, will be devolved under the new Children Bill, and Peter Clarke will be able to comment on that. However, a person involved in family court proceedings may wish to complain about CAFCASS and would naturally address those concerns to Peter Clarke, while someone with a more general complaint about the operation of the court system could not approach him and would have to approach the UK children's commissioner. That is potentially a rather confusing scenario that people may encounter. I do not know whether this situation is the result of sloppily drafted legislation or of the antagonism of the

*gadwyd yn ôl.*

Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod adroddiad blynnyddol y comisiynydd plant a'r arwyddocâd i Gymru bod gennym ein comisiynydd plant ein hunain. Wrth gynnig gwelliannau 1 ac 8 yn enw David Melding, talaf deyrnged i Peter Clarke a'i dîm am eu hymroddiad a'u hymrwymiad i hawliau a lles ein pobl ifanc. Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn gwelliant 1. Awgrymaf, er mwyn cael consensws, pan drafodwn adroddiadau gan y comisiynydd plant yn y dyfodol, efallai y bydd y Llywodraeth am gynnwys y geiriau hyn yn ei chynnig er mwyn croesawu'r adroddiadau hynny. Credaf ei bod yn hollol briodol bod y cynigion yn cynnwys canmoliaeth o'r fath, yn enwedig pan fo'r gwaith a wneir gan y comisiynydd plant yn gyfraniad mor werthfawr i'r broses polisi yr ydym oll yn ymwneud â hi.

Yn ail, cyfeiriaf at y dryswch a fydd yn codi o ran y comisiynydd plant arfaethedig i'r DU—mae a wnelo hyn â gwelliant 8. Yn sicr, bydd dryswch. Mae gan Peter Clarke, fel Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, gylch gwaith sy'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â chylch gwaith datganoledig y Cynulliad. Bydd caniatáu i gomisiynydd plant y DU ymateb i'r ysgrifennydd gwladol perthnasol ar faterion a gadwyd yn ôl yn achosi cryn ddrysych i bobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru, na wyddant at bwy y dylid troi er mwyn gwneud cwyn neu godi pryderon. Caiff gweithrediad y Gwasanaeth Cyngori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd, er enghraift, ei ddatganoli o dan y Mesur Plant newydd, a bydd Peter Clarke yn gallu gwneud sylwadau ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, efallai y byddai rhywun sy'n rhan o achos llys teulu am gwyno ynglŷn â CAFCASS ac y byddai, wrth reswm, yn codi'r pryderon hynny gyda Peter Clarke. Ar y llaw arall, ni allai rhywun sydd â chwyn fwy cyffredinol ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae system y llysoedd yn gweithredu godi'r mater gydag ef a byddai'n rhaid iddo ef neu iddi hi godi'r mater gyda chomisiynydd plant y DU. Gallai hynny arwain o bosibl at sefyllfa ddryslyd braidd i bobl. Ni wn ai deddfwriaeth wedi'i drafftio'n wael ynteu gelynnaeth Arweinydd Tŷ'r

Leader of the House of Commons and the Secretary of State for Wales towards this institution. I hope that it is only the result of sloppy drafting or of a lack of understanding of this new devolved institution in Wales and the working arrangements of our children's commissioner. It makes perfect sense to change the Bill to allow Peter Clarke to report to the relevant office on reserved issues. That would clear up the confusion. The Government should be stronger in putting this point across to its colleagues in London.

I pay tribute to the work undertaken on the Clywch inquiry, which was a major piece of work and perhaps the most haunting that has been undertaken by the commissioner thus far. I hope that it is the last piece of work of this nature and that such a report will not have to be written in the future. I pay tribute to the commissioner for his huge contribution and to his team for its work on what must have been a difficult inquiry.

The report highlights many concerns and important issues, not least those relating to child and adolescent mental health services in Wales, as has been alluded to in other amendments. I raised this issue yesterday with the First Minister because of my concerns regarding a recent report that was published in the Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry. It highlights a survey of young people that demonstrates a huge and quite alarming growth in the incidence of mental health problems, particularly depression, among young people. The Government needs to consider that report as part of its ongoing work in developing its approach towards and policy on child and adolescent mental health.

The shortage of social workers, which is referred to in another amendment, is a huge problem in Wales. We have all read the damning reports on children's social services in Wales. How will the Minister enhance the status of this profession to encourage more people into social work in Wales? We cannot address the issues without tackling this concern.

Cyffredin ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru tuag at y sefydliad hwn sy'n gyfrifol am y sefyllfa hon. Gobeithiaf mai dim ond deddfwriaeth wedi'i drafftio'n wael neu ddifyg dealltwriaeth o'r sefydliad datganoledig newydd hwn yng Nghymru a threfniadau gwaith ein comisiynydd plant a arweiniodd at y sefyllfa hon. Mae'n gwneud synnwyr llwyr i newid y Mesur i ganiatáu Peter Clarke i roi adroddiad i'r swyddfa berthnasol ar faterion a gadwyd yn ôl. Byddai hynny yn cael gwared ar y dryswch. Dylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn fwy cadarn wrth gyfleu'r pwynt hwn i'w chyd-aelodau yn Llundain.

Talaf deyrnged i'r gwaith a wnaed ar gyfer ymchwiliad Clywch, a oedd yn waith pwysig iawn. Efallai mai dyna'r gwaith mwyaf ingol y mae'r comisiynydd wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn. Gobeithiaf mai hyn fydd y gwaith olaf o'i fath ac na fydd angen ysgrifennu adroddiad o'r fath byth eto yn y dyfodol. Talaf deyrnged i'r comisiynydd am ei gyfraniad mawr ac i'w dîm am ei waith ar yr hyn a fu'n ymchwiliad anodd, mae'n siŵr.

Noda'r adroddiad lawer o bryderon a materion pwysig, yn bennaf y rhai sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed yng Nghymru, fel y cyfeiriwyd atynt mewn gwelliannau eraill. Codais y mater hwn ddoe gyda'r Prif Weinidog oherwydd fy mhryderon ynglŷn ag adroddiad diweddar a gyhoeddwyd yn y Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry. Mae'n tynnu sylw at arolwg o bobl ifanc sy'n dangos cynnydd mawr a brawychus yn nifer y problemau iechyd meddwl, yn enwedig iselder ysbryd, ymhlið pobl ifanc. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ystyried yr adroddiad fel rhan o'i gwaith parhaus i ddatblygu ei hymagwedd tuag at iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed a'i pholisiau yn y maes hwnnw.

Mae prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol, y cyfeirir ato mewn gwelliant arall, yn broblem ddybryd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym oll wedi darllen yr adroddiadau damniol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol plant yng Nghymru. Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn codi statws y proffesiwn hwn er mwyn annog mwy o bobl i fynd yn weithwyr cymdeithasol yng Nghymru? Ni allwn ymdrin â'r materion a gyfyd heb fynd i'r afael â'r pryder hwn.

Finally, we look forward to the Government's detailed response to the report, which we hope will be thorough.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu fel pwynt 2 newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau yn unol â hynny:

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn eu trafodaethau â'u cydweithwyr yn Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch penderfyniad unfrydol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (NDM1939, 4 Mai 2004) y dylid ymestyn pwerau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru i gynnwys meysydd polisi sydd heb eu datganoli.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i neilltuo'r adnoddau sydd eu hangen i sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl effeithiol ar gyfer plant a'r glasoed neu i gyfaddef ei bod wedi cefnu ar ei strategaeth yn y maes hwn.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi â phryder fod y prinder gweithwyr cymdeithasol bellach yn argywng.*

Mae'n bleser gennyf groesawu yr adroddiad hwn a chefnogi ysbryd gwelliant 1, sy'n cydnabod y gwaith mawr a wnaeth y comisiynydd a'i staff yn ystod y tair blynedd a hanner diwethaf. Ni chynigiaf welliant 5, gan imi dderbyn sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ei bod yn cefnogi ysbryd y gwelliant hwnnw a bod gwaith ar y gweill i sicrhau y gall Peter Clarke siarad â'r Cynulliad cyfan mewn rhyw ffordd. Edrychwn ymlaen i weld y gwaith hwnnw'n dwyn ffrwyth a gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n digwydd. Gwn fod trefniadau eisoes wedi'u gwneud i alluogi Peter Clarke i siarad â phedwar o'r pwylgorau pwnc gyda'i gilydd, ac mae hwn yn gam yn y cyfeiriad cywir.

Esboniaf pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae gwelliant 2 yn ymwneud â chylch gwaith Comisiynydd

Yn olaf, edrychwn ymlaen at ymateb manwl y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad. Gobeithiwn y bydd yn un trylwyr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add as new point 2 and renumber accordingly:

*regrets that the Labour Assembly Government failed in its negotiations with its UK Government colleagues regarding the National Assembly's unanimous resolution (NDM1939, 4 May 2004) that the powers of the Children's Commissioner for Wales be extended over non-devolved areas of policy.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Labour Assembly Government to commit the necessary resources to ensure an effective child and adolescent mental health service or admit that it has abandoned its strategy in this area.*

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern the shortage of social workers now constitutes an emergency.*

It is my pleasure to welcome this report and to support the spirit of amendment 1, which acknowledges the important work undertaken by the commissioner and his staff over the last three and a half years. I will not move amendment 5, having been assured by the Minister that she supports the spirit of the amendment and that work is under way to ensure that Peter Clarke can address the whole Assembly in some way. I look forward to seeing that work coming to fruition and I hope that that will happen. I know that arrangements are already in place to enable Peter Clarke to talk to four of the subject committees together, and this is a step in the right direction.

I will explain why we tabled these amendments. Amendment 2 concerns the remit of the Children's Commissioner for

Plant Cymru. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig ein bod yn cyrraedd y sefyllfa y soniodd y Gweinidog amdan, lle bydd plant a phobl ifanc Cymru yn gwybod at bwy y dylent fyd i drafod unrhyw broblemau sydd ganddynt. Bydd y setliad presennol, gyda chomisiynydd Lloegr yn ymdrin â'r materion nas datganolwyd, yn creu sefyllfa gymhleth, ac fe fydd pobl yn ansicr. Cyfeiriodd Jonathan Morgan at y ffaith bod Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn ymdrin â materion ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ond y comisiynydd yn Lloegr fyddai yn gyfrifol am faterion cyfreithiol.

Yr oedd Jonathan yn gwbl gywir i dalu teyrnged i'r comisiynydd am y ffordd y bu iddo gynnal ymchwiliad Clywch, ond wynebodd broblemau hyd yn oed gyda'r ymchwiliad hwnnw—gan nad yw materion cyfreithiol a materion yn ymwneud â'r heddlu a darlledu wedi'u datganoli, yr oedd yn ddi-rym i ddelio â hwy. Mae'r comisiynydd wedi ei gwneud yn glir bod meddu ar y gallu i ymdrin â'r holl ystod o faterion sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc yn bwysig er mwyn ei alluogi i wneud ei swydd. Mae'n drueni mawr bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi methu â sefyll lan i Lywodraeth San Steffan, ac wedi methu ag ennill y dydd yn y ddadl sylfaenol, dyngedfennol hon ynglŷn â'r comisiynydd i blant a phobl ifanc. Yr ydym i gyd yn dweud mor bwysig oedd sefydlu'r swydd, felly yr oedd hefyd yn bwysig i ennill y ddadl hon. Yr oedd agwedd sarhaus Margaret Hodge tuag at y comisiynydd, Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cymru yn gwbl annerbynol.

O ran gwelliant 3 ar iechyd meddwl, yr wyf yn derbyn bod strategaeth, Weinidog, ac nid condemnio'r strategaeth yw'n bwriad—yr ydym yn ei chroesawu—ond rhaid cydnabod bod diffyg adnoddau.

The children's commissioner makes that quite clear.

'I regret to say that I am far less impressed with progress in the area of Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services.'

On your additional money, he says that it is

Wales. It is extremely important that we reach the position to which the Minister referred, where children and young people in Wales know to whom they should turn to discuss any problems that they might have. The current settlement, with England's commissioner dealing with non-devolved issues, will create a complex situation, and people will be confused. Jonathan Morgan referred to the fact that the Children's Commissioner for Wales deals with matters relating to social services, but the commissioner in England will be responsible for legal matters.

Jonathan was right to pay tribute to the commissioner for the way in which he conducted the Clywch inquiry, but he did encounter difficulties during the course of the investigation—as legal matters and those concerning the police and broadcasting are not devolved, he was powerless to deal with them. The commissioner has made it clear that having the ability to deal with the whole range of issues that affect children and young people is important in order to enable him to do his job. It is a great shame that the Assembly Government failed to stand up to the Westminster Government, and failed to win this fundamental important debate on our commissioner for children and young people. We all agree that it was important to establish this office, so it was also important to win this argument. Margaret Hodge's contemptuous attitude towards the commissioner, the National Assembly for Wales and the Government of Wales was completely unacceptable.

On amendment 3 on mental health, I accept that there is a strategy, Minister, and it is not our intention to condemn the strategy—we welcome it—but we must acknowledge the lack of resources.

Mae'r comisiynydd plant yn dweud hynny yn holol glir.

'Mae'n flin gennyf ddweud fy mod yn llawer llai bodlon ar y cynnydd ym maes Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl i Blant a Phobl Ifanc.'

O ran eich arian ychwanegol, dywed ei fod

'totally inadequate in the face of the continuing crisis in provision.'

He concludes by saying,

'I therefore repeat my plea of last year that the Assembly commit the necessary resources or publicly accept that it has abandoned its strategy.'

Far from congratulating you on your strategy, Minister, the commissioner is critical of the lack of resources. Quite honestly, if we say that the independence of his office and his opinions are important, we must take note of that criticism.

On social workers in child care, the commissioner says clearly that it is difficult to attract newly qualified social workers to children's services, and to retain them. That is a condemnation. However many social workers you train, you have to attract them to those jobs, and retain them. With those amendments, we are glad to welcome the report.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*deplores the failure of the UK Government to listen to the wish of the National Assembly that the responsibilities of the commissioner should be extended to non-devolved issues in Wales.*

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the continued need to highlight the lack of progress on child and adolescent mental health services and calls on the Minister to highlight how she is tackling this key issue in her response to the report.*

On Monday, the Children Bill received Royal Assent and became law. Although it is a welcome piece of legislation in some respects, it operates a scenario against which the Assembly voted, the commissioner

yn

'gwbl annigonol yn wyneb yr argyfwng sy'n parhau o ran darpariaeth.'

Mae'n gorffen drwy ddweud

'Rwyf felly'n adleisio cais y llynedd o'r galon i'r Cynulliad ymrwymo'r adnoddau angenrheidiol neu dderbyn yn gyhoeddus ei fod wedi cefnu ar ei strategaeth.'

Nid eich llonyfarch ar eich strategaeth a wna'r comisiynydd, Weinidog, yn hytrach, mae'n feirniadol o'r prinder adnoddau. A bod yn holol onest, os dywedwn fod annibyniaeth ei swyddfa a'i farn yn bwysig, rhaid inni gymryd sylw o'r feirniadaeth honno.

O ran gweithwyr cymdeithasol ym maes gofal plant, dywed y comisiynydd yn glir ei bod yn anodd denu gweithwyr cymdeithasol newydd gymhwys i wasanaethau plant, a'u cadw. Mae hynny yn gondemniad. Faint bynnag o weithwyr cymdeithasol yr ydych yn eu hyfforddi, rhaid ichi eu denu i'r swyddi hynny a'u cadw. Gyda'r gwelliannau hynny, yr ydym yn falch o groesawu'r adroddiad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth y DU i wrando ar ddymuniad y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ymestyn cyfrifoldebau'r comisiynydd i gynnwys materion sydd heb eu datganoli yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at yr angen i barhau i dynnu sylw at ddifyg datblygiad y gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i ddangos sut y mae'n mynd i'r afael â'r mater allweddol hwn yn ei hymateb i'r adroddiad.*

Ddydd Llun, cafodd y Mesur Plant Gydsyniad Brenhinol a daeth yn ddeddf. Er bod yn rhaid croesawu'r ddeddfwraeth i ryw raddau, mae'n gweithredu rhywbeth y mae'r Cynulliad wedi pleidleisio yn ei erbyn, y

argued, and the Liberal Democrats in Parliament tabled amendments. On 4 May 2004, the Assembly supported a cross-party amendment, proposed by all three opposition parties, which was rejected. I remind colleagues that the amendment said that the Assembly

'rejects the proposals in the Bill that the Children's Commissioner for England will have statutory functions over non-devolved matters affecting children and young people in Wales, and instead calls for the powers of the Children's Commissioner for Wales to be extended over those non-devolved areas of policy'.

4.30 p.m.

Labour in the Assembly abstained on the amendment, but it still became Assembly policy. Given that the Minister was unable to convince Labour colleagues in London of the importance of this matter, one cannot help but suspect that a more powerful message would have been conveyed had Labour Assembly Members voted for the amendment.

**Gwenda Thomas:** To clarify the matter, do you accept, as outlined on page 8 of the report, that

'The Children's Commissioner for Wales also has an additional power to consider and make representations to the National Assembly for Wales about any matter affecting the rights and welfare of children in Wales. This means that he can deal with issues outside the responsibility of the National Assembly, such as youth justice, the family courts'?

We must not send a message to children that they cannot approach the children's commissioner on this issue, because he has an important role as an access point.

**Kirsty Williams:** You know as well as I do, Gwenda, that the opportunity to strengthen the children's commissioner's powers has been missed. I am sorry that you do not share the views of your colleagues, Julie Morgan,

mae'r comisiynydd wedi dadlau yn ei erbyn, ac mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn y Senedd wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau yn ei gylch. Ar 4 Mai 2004, cefnogodd y Cynulliad welliant trawsbleidiol, a gynigwyd gan bob un o'r tair gwrthblaid, a wrthodwyd. Atgoffaf fy nhyd-Aelodau i'r gwelliant ddweud bod y Cynulliad

'yn gwrthod y cynigion yn y Mesur sy'n nodi y bydd Comisiynydd Plant Lloegr yn meddu ar swyddogaethau statudol dros faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli sy'n effeithio ar blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru, ac yn hytrach yn galw ar i bwerau Comisiynydd Plant Cymru gael eu hestyn i gynnwys y meysydd polisi hynny nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli.'

Bu i Lafur yn y Cynulliad ymatal ar y gwelliant, ond daeth yn bolisi gan y Cynulliad sut bynnag. O gofio bod y Gweinidog wedi methu ag argyhoeddi ei chyd-aelodau Llafur yn Llundain o bwysigrwydd y mater hwn, ni all rhywun ond credu y byddai neges fwy grymus wedi'i chyfleu pe bai Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad wedi pleidleisio dros y gwelliant.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Er mwyn cael eglurhad ynglŷn â'r mater, a dderbyniwch, fel y nodir ar dudalen 8 yr adroddiad

'Mae gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru bŵer ychwanegol i ystyried a chyflwyno achos i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ynghylch unrhyw fater sy'n effeithio ar hawliau a lles plant yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn golygu ei fod yn medru trafod materion y tu allan i gyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, er enghraift, cyfiawnder ieuengtid, y llysoedd teuluol'?

Rhaid inni beidio â rhoi'r neges i blant na allant gysylltu â'r comisiynydd plant ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, am fod ganddo rôl bwysig fel pwyt mynediad.

**Kirsty Williams:** Fe wyddoch cystal â minnau, Gwenda, fod y cyfre i gryfhau pwerau'r comisiynydd plant wedi'i golli. Mae'n drueni nad ydych yn cyd-fynd â'ch cyd-aelodau, Julie Morgan, Albert Owen,

Albert Owen, Huw Edwards, Martyn Jones, Martin Caton and Betty Williams. They believe that we have missed the opportunity to secure these powers for the children's commissioner. I regret that you do not share the concerns of your Labour colleagues in London.

There will be confusion among young people in Wales, caused by Labour in London. I refer you to the comments made by my colleague, Lord Thomas of Gresford, in his latest attempt, on 10 November, to reverse the ridiculous situation in which we now find ourselves. He gave the example of two children in a care home in Wales, one having been placed there by a Welsh local authority and the other under the social justice system. The children's commissioner would be able to investigate in the case of the first child, but he would have to ask his English counterpart to intervene in the case of the second, despite the fact that the latter does not have the power to instigate an investigation.

The other issue is benefits. The children's commissioner has made great play of his attempts to tackle child poverty in Wales. An important means of doing this would be the reform of the benefits system. However, the measures passed by Labour in London mean that the commissioner's ability in this regard has been strangled.

It is not just opposition Members and the children's commissioner who have objected to the provisions of the Children Bill. The Commission for Equality and Human Rights issued a statement regretting that the approach to recognising the need for its activities to be conducted on an all-Wales level regardless of devolution boundaries has not been extended to the work of the Children's Commissioner for Wales.

Finally, I refer to the joint statement on the Children Bill by the commissioners for young people in Northern Ireland, Scotland and Wales, who also regret the situation forced upon them. I challenge Labour Members, especially those who claim to represent the constituencies of Conwy, Cardiff North, Clwyd South and Gower, to join their Westminster colleagues who stood

Huw Edwards, Martyn Jones, Martin Caton a Betty Williams. Credant ein bod wedi colli'r cyfle i sicrhau'r pwerau hyn i'r comisiynydd plant. Gresynaf nad ydych yn rhannu pryderon eich cyd-aelodau Llafur yn Llundain.

Bydd dryswch ymhliith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru, a achosir gan Lafur yn Llundain. Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at y sylwadau a wnaed gan fy nghyd-aelod, yr Arglwydd Thomas o Gresffordd, yn ei ymgais ddiweddaraf, ar 10 Tachwedd, i unioni'r sefyllfa hurt yr ydym ynddi ar hyn o bryd. Rhoddodd yr enghraifft o ddau blentyn mewn cartref gofal yng Nghymru, y naill wedi cael ei roi yno gan un o awdurdodau lleol Cymru a'r llall o dan y system cyflawnder cymdeithasol. Byddai'r comisiynydd plant yn gallu ymchwilio i achos y plentyn cyntaf, ond byddai'n rhaid iddo ofyn i'r comisiynydd yn Lloegr ymyrryd yn achos yr ail blentyn, er nad oes gan hwnnw y pŵer i ddechrau ymchwiliad.

Y mater arall a gyfyd yw budd-daliadau. Mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi rhoi pwys mawr ar ei ymgais i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant yng Nghymru. Un ffordd bwysig o wneud hynny fyddai diwygio'r system budd-daliadau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mesurau y mae Lafur wedi'u pasio yn Llundain yn golygu bod gallu'r comisiynydd yn hyn o beth wedi'i atal.

Nid dim ond aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau a'r comisiynydd plant sydd wedi codi gwrthwynebiadau i ddarpariaethau'r Mesur Plant. Cyhoeddodd y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol ddatganiad yn gresynu nad oedd yr ymagwedd tuag at gydnabod bod angen i'w weithgareddau gael eu cynnal ar sail Cymru gyfan waeth beth fo terfynau datganoli wedi cael ei hestyn i waith Comisiynydd Plant Cymru.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriaf at y datganiad ar y cyd ar y Mesur Plant gan gomisiynwyr pobl ifanc yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, yr Alban a Chymru, sydd hefyd yn gresynu at y sefyllfa a orfodwyd arnynt. Heriaf yr Aelodau Llafur, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n honni eu bod yn cynrychioli etholaethau Conwy, Gogledd Caerdydd, De Clwyd a Gŵyr, i ymuno â'u cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan a wnaeth safiad

up to the Government and made their feelings well known.

I turn to amendment 7. The commissioner has highlighted several areas of concern again this year, and I will focus on child and adult mental health services. As we have heard, this issue was raised in last year's report, and the children's commissioner considered it necessary to show the lack of progress in this area once again. Rhodri Glyn quoted the relevant sections of the report, so I will not repeat them. However, I draw Members' attention to the fact that the budget papers brought before the last meeting of the Health and Social Services Committee virtually ignored the issue of professions allied to medicine. Neither did the papers focus on future funding in this area. I am glad that the Minister commented on the importance she places on the report's references to social workers. If she takes the issue so seriously and is so concerned about it, I would implore her to talk to the Business Minister to ensure that time is found to discuss it in the Chamber.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I appeal again for brief speeches.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I welcome the report and the opportunity, as Peter Clarke states, to take stock of what has been done, what we still have to do, and what we must prioritise for the future of young people in Wales. I look forward to being in the company of Mr Clarke in north Wales on Friday.

All Members recognise the importance of engaging young people in the political process. I commend the commissioner on his decision to involve children and young people far more directly in planning the work of the office.

Putting young people at the centre of the bullying policy review process is essential to ensure that young people have an ownership of the solution to bullying in schools. As a former teacher, I have seen the negative effects of bullying and firmly believe that peer support, mentoring and strong support

yn erbyn y Llywodraeth ac a fyngodd eu teimladau yn groch.

Trof at welliant 7. Mae'r comisiynydd wedi amlyu sawl maes sy'n achosi pryder unwaith eto eleni, a chanolbwytiaf ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant ac oedolion. Fel y clywsom, codwyd y mater hwn yn adroddiad y llynedd, a theimlodd y comisiynydd plant fod angen dangos y diffyg cynnydd a wnaed yn y maes hwn unwaith eto. Dyfynnodd Rhodri Glyn o adrannau perthnasol yr adroddiad, felly ni wnaef eu hailadrodd. Fodd bynnag, tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at y ffait bod papurau'r gyllideb a gyflwynwyd gerbron cyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi anwybyddu fwy neu lai y proffesiynau sy'n gysylltiedig â meddygaeth. Ni thrafodwyd yn fanwl ychwaith sut y cai'r maes hwn ei ariannu yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn falch i'r Gweinidog nodi pa mor bwysig yw'r cyfeiriadau yn yr adroddiad at weithwyr cymdeithasol, yn ei barn hi. Os yw'n cymryd y mater cymaint o ddifrif ac os yw mor bryderus amdano, byddwn yn erfyn arni i siarad â'r Trefnydd i sicrhau y neilltuir amser i'w drafod yn y Siambra.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Apeliaf unwaith eto am areithiau byr.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad a'r cyfle, fel y noda Peter Clarke, i gloriannu'r hyn a wnaed, yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud o hyd, a'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei flaenoriaethu ar gyfer dyfodol pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at fod yng nghwmni Mr Clarke yn y Gogledd ddydd Gwener.

Mae pob Aelod yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc yn y broses wleidyddol. Canmolaf y comisiynydd am ei benderfyniad i gynnwys plant a phobl ifanc yn llawer mwy uniongyrchol yn y broses o gynllunio gwaith y swyddfa.

Mae rhoi pobl ifanc yng nghanol y broses o adolygu'r polisi bwlio yn hanfodol i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn teimlo mai yn eu dwylo hwy y mae'r ateb i fwlio mewn ysgolion. Fel cyn-athrawes, yr wyf wedi gweld effeithiau negyddol bwlio ac yr wyf yn gredwr mawr mai cefnogaeth cyfoedion, mentora a

from the school are the most effective ways of confronting this issue. The huge workload placed on educational social workers, who sometimes work between three schools, does not help the situation. More social workers need to be trained in this area, as is mentioned in Mr Clarke's report. A coherent policy on bullying will only come through sharing best practice, recognising success and delivering what works to all schools.

chefnogaeth gref gan yr ysgol yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Nid yw'r llwyth gwaith enbyd a roddir ar ysgwyddau gweithwyr cymdeithasol addysgol, sydd weithiau yn gweithio rhwng tair ysgol, yn beth da yn hyn o beth. Mae angen i fwy o weithwyr cymdeithasol gael hyfforddiant yn y maes hwn, fel y crybwylwyd yn adroddiad Mr Clarke. Dim ond drwy rannu arfer gorau, cydnabod llwyddiant a chyflwyno'r hyn sy'n gweithio i bob ysgol y cawn bolisi cydlynol ar fwlio.

I am concerned that there is still much to be done to encourage schools to accept the gravity of this issue. I know, for example, from my association with its Bangor office helpline, that the National Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Children has offered to attend schools to provide workshops, advice and assistance but have received a sporadic response and have been invited mainly to those schools that have successful and established anti-bullying policies. It would encourage the opportunity to work more closely with, and offer advice at, schools where bullying is more prevalent.

Pryderaf fod llawer i'w wneud o hyd i annog ysgolion i dderbyn pa mor ddifrifol yw'r mater hwn. Gwn, er enghraifft, o'm cysylltiad â llinell gymorth ei swyddfa ym Mangor, fod y Gymdeithas Genedlaethol er Atal Creulondeb i Blant wedi cynnig mynd i mewn i ysgolion i gynnal gweithdai a rhoi cyngor a chymorth, ond prin y mae wedi cael ymateb a dim ond yr ysgolion hynny y mae ganddynt bolisiau gwrth-fwlio llwyddiannus a sefydledig sydd wedi ei gwahodd ar y cyfan. Byddai'n annog y cyfle i weithio'n agosach gydag ysgolion lle y mae achosion o fwlio yn fwy cyffredin, ac i gynnig cyngor iddynt.

Binge drinking and alcohol-related incidences have hit the headlines recently. The trend of alcohol abuse among young people needs to be addressed, and I would like the children's commissioner to join in this debate and to review actions to tackle this specific and difficult issue as part of a multi-agency, multi-pronged response. Parental advice is paramount, and, having been a year-11 mentor, I know that many parents are concerned about their children's drinking and need specific advice on how to deal with it. I welcome Mr Clarke's comment that there is a tremendous need for family-support services.

Mae pyliau o or-yfed a digwyddiadau yn ymwneud ag alcohol wedi cael llawer o sylw yn y cyfryngau yn ddiweddar. Mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r duedd ymhlið pobl ifanc i gamddefnyddio alcohol, a hoffwn pe bai'r comisiynydd plant yn ymuno â ni yn y ddadl hon ac yn adolygu'r camau i'w cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r mater penodol, anodd hwn fel rhan o ymateb amlasiantaeth sy'n mynd i'r afael â'r broblem o sawl cyfeiriad. Mae cyngor rhieni yn hollbwysig ac, ar ôl bod yn fentor blwyddyn 11, gwn fod llawer o rieni yn pryeru am y ffordd y mae eu plant yn yfed ac mae angen cyngor penodol arnynt ynghylch sut i ymdrin â hyn. Croesawaf sylw Mr Clarke fod angen dybryd am wasanaethau cymorth i deuluoedd.

I congratulate the commissioner and his team on the thorough and enthusiastic manner in which they have carried out their important role. Once again, they have conducted their duties in representing the causes of young people in Wales.

Llongyfarchaf y comisiynydd a'i dîm ar y ffordd drylwyr a brwd y maent wedi ymgymryd â'u rôl bwysig. Unwaith eto, maent wedi cyflawni eu dyletswyddau i gynrychioli achosion pobl ifanc yng Nghymru.

**David Davies:** I agree with that last

**David Davies:** Cytunaf â'r sylw olaf hwnnw

comment about the way in which Peter Clarke has represented the cause of young people in Wales. I give this report a qualified welcome, because I have not always agreed with everything that Peter Clarke has said, for example, his views on discipline and on whether there are any circumstances under which it is acceptable to smack children. It is interesting that this report contains so much about bullying, which is an issue in good schools as well as bad.

**Christine Chapman:** Will you give way?

**David Davies:** I will give way, but I will just finish my point. I like to give way to Labour Party Members, and I respect those who are able to make interventions.

Some children who are bullies might benefit from the sort of discipline that the children's commissioner sometimes tries to prevent.

**Christine Chapman:** Do you agree that there is a possibility—and I believe that research has been done on this—that bullying stems from children being beaten at home?

**David Davies:** I am not aware of that research, but I should think that that is likely. However, without a doubt—and I have seen this work effectively—the threat of physical action will stop children from bullying. Members may shake their heads, but I remember being punched in the face on one occasion by an older boy when waiting to get a glass of water when I first went to Bassaleg Comprehensive School, and the teacher went up to the person concerned, shook him three times and told him that if he ever did that again, he would, and I quote, ‘bloody well kick you through the wall backwards’. I assure you that he never did it again. Therefore, it was brutal but rather effective. Had that teacher been found doing that, he would have been disciplined and kicked out of his job, but he was a good teacher, and people did not mess around in his classes.

I want to keep this short, and I welcome most of what Peter Clarke said, so I will get to the positive side of it. As has been said, he has

yn glŷn â'r ffordd y mae Peter Clarke wedi cynrychioli achos pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn yn amodol, gan nad wyf bob amser wedi cytuno â phopeth y mae Peter Clarke wedi'i ddweud, er enghraift, ei farn ar ddisgyblaeth a pha un a oes unrhyw amgylchiadau lle y mae'n dderbyniol taro plant. Mae'n ddiddorol bod yr adroddiad hwn yn cynnwys cymaint am bwlio, sy'n broblem mewn ysgolion da yn ogystal ag mewn ysgolion gwael.

**Christine Chapman:** A ildiwrch?

**David Davies:** Ildiaf, ond hoffwn orffen fy mhwynt yn gyntaf. Yr wyf yn hoff o ildio i Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur, a pharchaf y rhai sy'n gallu ymyrryd.

Efallai y byddai'r math o ddisgyblaeth y mae'r comisiynydd plant yn ceisio ei atal weithiau yn gwneud daioni i rai plant sy'n bwlio eraill.

**Christine Chapman:** A gytunwch fod posiblwydd—a chredaf fod ymchwil i hyn wedi'i gwneud—mai un o achosion bwlio yw plant sy'n cael eu euro gartref?

**David Davies:** Ni wn am yr ymchwil honno, ond byddai hynny yn debygol, tybiwn i. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth—ac yr wyf wedi gweld hyn yn gweithio'n effeithiol—fod bygythiad o gosb gorfforol yn atal plant rhag bwlio. Gall Aelodau siglo eu pennau, ond cofiaf gael fy mhwnio yn fy wyneb unwaith gan fachgen hŷn wrth aros i gael gwydrait o ddŵr ar ôl imi ddechrau yn Ysgol Gyfun Basaleg. Aeth yr athro i fyny at yr unigolyn dan sylw, ei ysgwyd deirgwaith gan ddweud wrtho pe bai byth yn gwneud hynny eto, y byddai, a dyfynnaf ei eiriau, ‘yn dy gicio di drwy'r wal yn wysg dy gefn’. Gallaf roi sicrwydd ichi na wnaeth hynny byth eto. Felly, yr oedd yn ffordd gaiadd ond eithaf effeithiol o ymdrin â bwlio. Pe bai rhywun wedi gweld yr athro yn gwneud hynny, byddai wedi cael ei ddisgyblu a'i ddiswyddo, ond yr oedd yn athro da, ac nid oedd plant yn beiddio ymddwyn yn wael yn ei ddosbarthiadau ef.

Nid wyf am siarad yn hir, a chroesawaf y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedodd Peter Clarke, felly af ati i drafod yr ochr

been good at speaking out on issues that affect children's welfare, and whether we agree with him or not, he has done the job extremely well. The public perception is that most of his work this year has been taken up with the Clywch inquiry report.

4.40 p.m.

I know that there has been much more to it than that. However, on that point, I will make one statement. It is vital that the Government does everything possible to ensure that anyone who worked for the WJEC at the time that abuses of children took place, is rooted out. It is likely that some of those people are still working in educational organisations somewhere. The report referred to an institutional inertia within some local education authorities towards getting rid of some of the teachers who were not doing their job properly. I hope that we do not see that kind of institutional inertia towards rooting out people who stood aside while children were being abused. That is for the Minister to answer, not the Children's Commissioner, who has done his job well.

He has also done much more than that and I will highlight two other issues that he has spoken out about. First, the importance of allowing children to go to a school within their catchment area. We all supported the rule of 30 pupils to a class, because bringing down class sizes was important. However, one of the unintended consequences of that is that when children move into an area, school classes are sometimes full, and there has been little leeway to allow children that extra place, or to allow class sizes to rise from 30 pupils to 31 or 32 in some circumstances. We must look at that. We all agree that smaller class sizes are a good thing, but surely no-one wants a situation, which happens at present in many areas in Wales, where children are being ferried around in taxis, at great expense to local education authorities, because they are unable to go to the same local school as their friends.

Finally, I also welcome the way in which Peter Clarke has spoken out about the Home

gadarnhaol. Fel y dywedwyd, mae wedi bod yn dda o ran tynnu sylw at faterion sy'n effeithio ar les plant, a pha un a ydym yn cytuno ag ef ai peidio, mae wedi gwneud ei swydd yn hynod o dda. Y canfyddiad ymhlieth y cyhoedd yw bod y rhan fwyaf o'i waith eleni wedi bod ar adroddiad ymchwiliad Clywch.

Gwn fod llawer mwy i'w wneud na hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran y pwynt hwnnw, gwnaf un datganiad. Mae'n hollbwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i sicrhau y ceir gwared ar unrhyw un a oedd yn gweithio i CBAC pan gafodd y plant eu cam-drin. Mae'n debygol bod rhai o'r bobl hynny yn dal i weithio mewn sefydliadau addysgol rywle neu'i gilydd. Cyfeiriodd yr adroddiad at lesgedd sefydliadol o fewn rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol o ran cael gwared ar rai o'r athrawon nad oeddent yn gwneud eu gwaith yn iawn. Gobeithiaf na welwn y math hwnnw o lesgedd sefydliadol o ran cael gwared ar bobl a safodd o'r neilltu pan oedd plant yn cael eu cam-drin. Y Gweinidog fydd yn gorfod ateb hynny, nid y Comisiynydd Plant, sydd wedi gwneud ei waith yn dda.

Mae hefyd wedi gwneud llawer mwy na hynny a nodaf ddau fater arall y mae wedi tynnu sylw atynt. Yn gyntaf, pwysigrwydd gadael i blant fynd i'r ysgol yn eu dalgylch eu hunain. Bu inni oll gefnogi'r rheol o 30 o ddisgyblion mewn dosbarth, gan fod lleihau maint dosbarthiadau yn bwysig, Fodd bynnag, un o'r canlyniadau nas bwriadwyd yw bod dosbarthiadau ysgol yn llawn weithiau pan fydd plant yn symud i'r ardal, ac ni fu fawr hyblygrwydd o ran rhoi'r lle ychwanegol hwnnw i blant, neu ganiatáu i faint y dosbarth gynyddu o 30 o ddisgyblion i 31 neu 32 o dan rai amgylchiadau. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Cytunwn oll fod dosbarthiadau llai yn beth da, ond ni chredaf fod neb am weld sefyllfa, sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd mewn sawl ardal o Gymru, lle y caiff plant eu cludo mewn tacsis, ar gost fawr i awdurdodau addysg lleol, am na allant fynd i'r un ysgol leol â'i ffrindiau.

Yn olaf, croesawaf hefyd y ffordd y mae Peter Clarke wedi tynnu sylw at bolisi

Office's disgraceful policy of putting dangerous sex offenders into an open prison at Prescoed. There is a prison in the middle of Usk—this is not a case of nimbyism—the prison is right in our backyard in Monmouthshire. It is in the middle of the town, and it does not cause any problems. It has four high walls and bars everywhere and, as far as I am aware, no-one has ever escaped from it. What the people of the area object to is a policy of removing people from that secure environment and putting them into an environment from where they can simply walk out at any time they feel like it. Within 48 hours of that development, a convicted child rapist did just that. It is an abhorrent policy, and I welcome the fact that Peter Clarke has spoken out against it. I congratulate him and welcome his work. Yes, he speaks out for children at all times, and we need not always agree with every word he says, but he does his job with enthusiasm and he does it well.

**Janice Gregory:** As chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I am pleased to participate in today's debate. Earlier this year, the children's commissioner presented his report for 2002-03 to the Subject Committees. In the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, the ensuing debate was both constructive and inclusive. In case anyone has any doubts, and I am sure that I speak for all my colleagues on this side of the Chamber, I reiterate how proud I am to be a member of the party that introduced the post of the Children's Commissioner for Wales. However, I recognise that that initiative had all-party support, which was amply demonstrated when Peter Clarke and two of his assistant commissioners, Sara Reid and Rhian Davies, attended the meeting of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in June of this year.

The commissioner's report for 2002-03 highlighted tackling child poverty as one of his priority issues. This year's report acknowledges that much is being done to eradicate that scourge, but it warns against complacency. I emphasise that warning. We cannot rest until the issue of child poverty, like that of child labour in past centuries, is confined to the history books. This year's

gwarthus y Swyddfa Gartref o roi troseddwyr rhyw peryglus mewn carchar agored ym Mhrescoed. Mae carchar yng nghanol Brynbuga—felly nid mater o fod yn 'nimby' ydyw—mae'r carchar ar garreg y drws yn sir Fynwy. Mae yng nghanol y dref, ac nid yw'n achosi problemau. Mae pedwar mur uchel o'i amgylch a bariau ym mhobman a hyd y gwn i, nid oes neb erioed wedi dianc oddi yno. Yr hyn y mae pobl yr ardal yn ei wrthwynebu yw polisi o symud pobl o'r amgylchedd diogel hwnnw a'u rhoi mewn amgylchedd lle y gallant gerdded allan drwy'r drws pryd bynnag y dymuant. O fewn 48 awr i'r datblygiad hwnnw, dyna'n union a wnaeth treisiwr plentyn collfarnedig. Mae'n bolisi gwarthus, a chroesawaf y ffaith bod Peter Clark wedi ei feirniadu'n gyhoeddus. Fe'i llongyfarchaf a chroesawaf ei waith. Mae bob amser yn pledio achos plant ac nid oes raid inni gytuno â phob gair a ddywed, ond mae'n gwneud ei waith gyda brwd frydedd ac mae'n ei wneud yn dda.

**Janice Gregory:** Fel cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, mae'n bleser gennyl gymryd rhan yn y ddadl heddiw. Yn gynharach eleni, cyflwynodd y comisiynydd plant ei adroddiad ar gyfer 2002-03 i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Yn y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, yr oedd y ddadl a'i dilynnodd yn adeiladol ac yn gynhwysol. Rhag ofn bod neb yn amau hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn siarad dros bob un o'm cyd-aelodau ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr, dywedaf eto pa mor falch ydwyt fy mod yn aelod o'r blaid a gyflwynodd swydd Comisiynydd Plant Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn cydnabod i'r fenter honno gael cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol, a oedd yn amlwg iawn pan fynychodd Peter Clarke a dau o'i gomisiynwyr cynorthwyol, Sara Reid a Rhian Davies, gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ym mis Mehefin eleni.

Nododd adroddiad y comisiynydd ar gyfer 2002-03 mai mynd i'r afael â thodi plant yw un o'i flaenoriaethau. Mae'r adroddiad eleni yn cydnabod bod llawer yn cael ei wneud i ddileu hynny, ond mae'n rhybuddio rhag hunanfodlonrwydd. Pwysleisiaf y rhybudd hwnnw. Ni allwn fod yn fodlon nes bod tlodi plant, megis llafur plant yn y canrif oedd a fu, wedi hen ddiflannu. Mae'r adroddiad eleni

report highlights a number of issues relevant to the social justice and regeneration agenda. Not least of those is the plight of children of asylum seekers. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee will consider the whole issue of asylum seekers, and I am sure that issues surrounding child protection and asylum will loom large.

The report also highlights that young people's desire for respect from adult society has continued to be a theme from year to year. The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee empathises with that view. All too often, we hear of young people being criticised for hanging around street corners and making a general nuisance of themselves. It seems that, in some eyes, anti-social behaviour orders are directed at the under 20s. The excellent work undertaken by young people is often overlooked. It is about time that we redressed the balance. The committee and the Minister recognise that Communities First has a part to play. We must ensure that its potential is fully utilised.

Children's issues are cross-cutting and transcend almost all of the Assembly's responsibilities. A child's life does not recognise the boundaries of responsibilities that are represented by the various Welsh Assembly Government portfolios. That is why I am pleased that Members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee this morning agreed to join with their counterparts on the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, Health and Social Services Committee and Committee on Equality of Opportunity for a joint meeting in order to consider the children's commissioner's annual report.

However, I have one reservation on this development. Last year, each of the Subject Committees considered in detail every aspect of the commissioner's report that covered its own portfolio. A joint committee meeting may overlook some detail that this specialist forum would have identified. I recognise the need for an overarching response, but trust that it will not mitigate a Subject Committee wanting to invite the children's commissioner to appear before it to discuss specific aspects of his work. That view was

yn nodi nifer o faterion sy'n berthnasol i'r agenda cyflawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio. Un o'r materion pennaf yw sefyllfa druenus plant ceiswyr lloches. Bydd y Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ystyried ceiswyr lloches, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o drafod ar faterion o ran amddiffyn plant a lloches.

Noda'r adroddiad hefyd fod awydd pobl ifanc i ennyn parch oedolion wedi parhau i fod yn thema o'r un flwyddyn i'r llall. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn cydymdeimlo â'r safbwyt hwnnw. Yn rhy aml, clywn am bobl ifanc yn cael eu beirniadu am ymgynnnull ar gornel strydoedd ac am ymddwyn yn afreolus. Ymddengys, yng ngolwg rhai, fod gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol wedi'u hanelu at bobl o dan 20 oed. Yn aml caiff y gwaith ardderchog a wneir gan bobl ifanc ei anwybyddu. Mae'n hen bryd inni unioni hynny. Mae'r pwyllgor a'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod gan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ran i'w chwarae. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gwneir y defnydd gorau posibl ohoni.

Mae materion plant yn drawsbynciol ac yn rhychwantu bron pob un o gyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad. Nid yw bywyd plentyn yn cydnabod ffiniau'r cyfrifoldebau a gynrychiolir gan wahanol bortffolios Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch bod Aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi cytuno y bore yma i ymuno ag aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor Cyfartal am gyfarfod ar y cyd er mwyn ystyried adroddiad blynnyddol y comisiynydd plant.

Fodd bynnag, mae un amheuaeth gennys ynglŷn â'r datblygiad hwn. Y llynedd, ystyriodd pob Pwyllgor Pwnc yn fanwl bob agwedd ar adroddiad y comisiynydd a oedd yn ymwneud â'i bortffolio ei hun. Gall cyfarfod o gyd-bwyllgor golli rhyw fanylyn y byddai'r fforwm arbenigol hwn wedi'i nodi. Cydnabyddaf fod angen ymateb cyffredin, ond hyderaf na fydd hynny yn milwrio yn erbyn hawl Pwyllgor Pwnc i wahodd y comisiynydd plant i ymddangos ger ei fron i drafod agweddau penodol ar ei waith. Yr

shared by members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee this morning.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the next speaker, I must call the Minister at 4.53 p.m., but I would not consider it an abuse of Assembly procedure if any Member at that time wished to propose a 20-minute extension.

**Janet Ryder:** Like many Assembly Members, I have been grateful for the help and support that the children's commissioner has been able to offer the many people with whom I have worked over the last year. It was also a pleasure to sit on the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee when the commissioner gave evidence in the transport review, where he ably reflected the views of children and young people.

As many people have mentioned, one of the most high-profile aspects of the commissioner's work at the moment is the response to complaints of bullying. Peter Clarke has recommended that the Welsh Assembly Government expands its complaints procedures, which it is already issuing, to include guidance to schools that complaints of bullying by children and parents be treated as formal complaints. Will the guidance that is being issued require those complaints to be dealt with and treated as formal complaints?

Many have also highlighted the importance of ensuring that children have access to listening services, especially independent counsellors. That is equally important and the commissioner recommends that children and young people have the right to an independent advocate during and after the investigation of any complaints. Much of the work that has been undertaken has concentrated on children in care. There is a need to extend that service to all children and to include those who register complaints about bullying and need the guidance and support of someone outside the school environment.

Many children have also expressed concerns about bullying that occurs outside of school. In some respects, that is more difficult to deal

oedd cytundeb o ran hynny ymhlieth aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio y bore yma.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar y siaradwr nesaf, rhaid imi alw ar y Gweinidog am 4.53 p.m., ond ni fyddai'n gamddefnydd o weithdrefn y Cynulliad, yn fy marn i, pe bai unrhyw Aelod yn dymuno cynnig estyniad o 20 munud bryd hynny.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel llawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi bod yn ddiolchgar am y cymorth a'r gefnogaeth y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi gallu eu cynnig i lawer o bobl yr wyf wedi gweithio gyda hwy dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr oedd yn bleser hefyd fod yn bresennol yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes pan roddodd y comisiynydd dystiolaeth yn yr adolygiad o gludiant, lle y cyfleodd safbwytiau plant a phobl ifanc yn dda.

Fel y mae llawer o bobl wedi sôn, un o'r agweddu mwyaf proffil uchel ar waith y comisiynydd ar hyn o bryd yw'r ymateb i gwynion o fwlio. Mae Peter Clarke wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru estyn ei gweithdrefnau cwynion, y mae eisoes yn eu cyhoeddi, i gynnwys canllawiau i ysgolion ar drin cwynion o fwlio gan blant a rhieni fel cwynion ffurfiol. A fydd y canllawiau sy'n cael eu cyhoeddi yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r cwynion hynny gael eu trin fel cwynion ffurfiol?

Mae llawer wedi nodi hefyd bwysigrwydd sicrhau bod gwasanaethau gwrando ar gael i blant, yn enwedig cwnsleriaid annibynnol. Mae hynny yr un mor bwysig ac mae'r comisiynydd yn argymhell bod plant a phobl ifanc yn cael yr hawl i gael eiriolwr annibynnol yn ystod ac ar ôl ymchwiliad i unrhyw gwynion. Mae llawer o'r gwaith a wnaed wedi canolbwytio ar blant mewn gofal. Mae angen estyn y gwasanaeth hwnnw i bob plentyn a chynnwys y rhai sy'n cofrestru cwynion o fwlio ac y mae angen arweiniad a chymorth arnynt oddi wrth rywun y tu allan i'r ysgol.

Mae llawer o blant wedi mynegi pryderon hefyd ynglŷn â bwlio sy'n digwydd y tu allan i'r ysgol. Mewn sawl ffordd, mae'n anos

with. It is an extremely serious problem and today, we are waiting to hear how the Minister will approach that issue. All of this calls into question how seriously complaints by children are taken. While attitudes have changed greatly in recent times, there is a long way to go. We have heard interim Government responses to the Clywch report, but the Government has not yet responded to one recommendation that allegations of a serious nature, which might amount to disciplinary matters, should be investigated by a specialist personnel officer and dealt with by four new disciplinary tribunals, each with a legally qualified chair. A six-month deadline was placed on the response on that, which will run out in January, so can the Government indicate today how it will respond?

Finally, it would have been a great privilege to have heard the commissioner deliver the report himself. Next year, could he consider increasing problems related to the grooming of children and young people on the internet and on mobile telephones? It is a serious problem and there seems to be a loophole in the law and in the authority of different departments to deal with it. I would like the commissioner and the Minister to consider looking at that next.

4.50 p.m.

I echo everyone's concerns that it is a shame that legislation that has gone through Westminster will seek to weaken the position of the children's commissioner in Wales. It is a position which has the Assembly's full support, and a position which the Assembly would have liked to extend.

ymdrin â hynny. Mae'n broblem hynod ddifrifol a heddiw, yr ydym yn aros i glywed sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw. Mae hyn oll yn codi amheuon ynghylch i ba raddau y cymerir cwynion gan blant o ddifrif. Er bod agweddau wedi newid grym dipyn yn ddiweddar, mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd. Yr ydym wedi clywed ymatebion interim y Llywodraeth i adroddiad Clywch, ond nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb eto i argymhelliaid y dylai swyddog personél arbennig ymchwilio i honiadau difrifol, a allai fod yn faterion disgyblu, ac y dylai pedwar tribiwnlys disgyblu newydd, pob un â chadeirydd sy'n gymwysedig yn y gyfraith ymdrin â hwy. Rhoddyd terfyn amser o chwe mis i ymateb i hynny, a bydd hynny yn dod i ben ym mis Ionawr, felly a all y Llywodraeth ddweud heddiw sut y bydd yn ymateb?

Yn olaf, byddai wedi bod yn faint fawr clywed y comisiynydd yn cyflwyno ei adroddiad ei hun. Y flwyddyn nesaf, a allai ystyried rhoi mwy o sylw i broblemau o ran paratoi plant a phobl ifanc i bwrpas rhyw dros y rhyngrwyd a thrwy ddefnyddio ffonau symudol? Mae'n broblem ddifrifol ac ymddengys fod man gwan yn y gyfraith ac yn awdurdod gwahanol adrannau i ymdrin ag ef. Hoffwn pe bai'r comisiynydd a'r Gweinidog yn ystyried hynny nesaf.

Rhannaf innau bryderon pawb ei bod yn drueni y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth sydd wedi mynd drwy San Steffan yn ceisio gwanhau swydd y comisiynydd plant yng Nghymru. Mae'n swydd sy'n cael cefnogaeth lawn y Cynulliad, ac yn swydd yr hoffai'r Cynulliad fod wedi'i hestyn.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**David Melding:** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends this debate by 20 minutes.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Ten Members are needed to support the motion. I see that 10 Members do support it.

**David Melding:** Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ychwanegu 20 munud at hyd y ddadl hon.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gofyn i 10 Aelod gefnogi'r cynnig. Gwelaf fod 10 Aelod yn ei gefnogi.

**The Business Minister (Karen Sinclair):** I request that the bell be rung.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 6.24, at least three Members must request that the bell be rung. Do three Members support the request? I see that they do. Clerk, please ring the bell.

**Y Trefnydd (Karen Sinclair):** Gofynnaf i'r gloch gael ei chanu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.24, mae'n rhaid i o leiaf dri Aelod ofyn i'r gloch gael ei chanu. A oes tri Aelod sy'n cefnogi'r cais hwn? Gwelaf fod. Glerc, canwch y gloch.

*Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 50, Abstain 4, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru: Parhad The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales: Continued**

**Christine Chapman:** I endorse the comments made about the need to be vigilant about bullying. This is reflected in the commissioner's report, and I was pleased that he had chosen to prioritise this issue, given the trauma that some young people face when bullied.

I also welcome the emphasis on the notion of respect for children and young people. This is a theme that the children's commissioner has raised in previous reports. It is important that adults in general listen to children and young people about what worries them. Young people are often portrayed as instigators of crime and anti-social behaviour, and rarely as victims. However, a report from the NSPCC tells us that many young children are concerned about bullying outside of school. These are the kinds of issues which concern children, and it is about listening to children, which was the focus of the recent campaign.

There needs to be more balance in the way that young people are viewed as citizens who have rights. I pay tribute to the good work of the Assembly in involving young people in decision-making. The creation of Funky Dragon is a good example of this. We need to ensure that we do not just pay lip service to the notion of listening to children at all levels of policy-making, and this was highlighted by the commissioner.

Finally, I would not want this occasion to pass without taking the opportunity to pay tribute to the commissioner for the part he

**Christine Chapman:** Cymeradwyaf y sylwadau a wnaed am yr angen i fod yn wyliadwrus ynglŷn â bwlio. Mae hyn wedi'i adlewyrchu yn adroddiad y comisiynydd, ac yr oeddwn yn falch iddo ddewis rhoi blaenoriaeth i'r mater hwn, o gofio'r trawma a wyneba rhai pobl ifanc pan gânt eu bwlio.

Croesawaf hefyd y pwyslais ar y syniad o barch tuag at blant a phobl ifanc. Mae hon yn thema y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi'i chodi mewn adroddiadau blaenorol. Mae'n bwysig bod oedolion yn gyffredinol yn gwrando ar blant a phobl ifanc ynglŷn â'u pryderon. Yn aml caiff pobl ifanc eu portreadu yn droseddwyr ac yn rhai sy'n ymddwyn yn wrthgymdeithasol. Anaml iawn y cânt eu portreadu yn ddioddefwyr. Fodd bynnag, dywed adroddiad o'r NSPCC wrthym fod llawer o blant ifanc yn poeni am fwlio y tu allan i'r ysgol. Dyna'r mathau o faterion sy'n bwysig i blant, ac mae'n golygu gwrando ar blant, sef ffocws yr ymgyrch ddiweddar.

Mae angen mwy o gydbwysedd yn y ffordd y mae pobl ifanc yn cael eu hystyried yn ddinasyddion a chanddynt hawliau. Talaf deyrnged i waith da y Cynulliad i gynnwys pobl ifanc yn y broses gwneud penderfyniadau. Mae creu'r Ddraig Ffynchi yn engrrafft dda o hyn. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad ydym yn megis esgus gwrando ar blant ar bob lefel o lunio polisiau ac amlygwyd hyn gan y comisiynydd.

Yn olaf, hoffwn fachu ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i'r comisiynydd am y rhan a chwaraeodd yn y ddadl ynglŷn â tharo plant.

has played in the debate surrounding hitting children. Along with many of us in Wales, he will be disappointed with the UK Government's decision not to ban smacking completely. The existing position that we are left with will be unworkable, and equally confusing to parents. As the commissioner points out in the report, hitting is an ineffective approach to parenting. I do not agree with David Davies's view, because I think it is harmful. If we want our young children to grow up to be decent citizens, we should work towards a complete ban. I call on the commissioner to carry on the good work that he is doing in terms of the campaign, to ensure that children in future have equal protection.

**David Melding:** I congratulate the children's commissioner and his team for an excellent report, and commend their outstanding work on behalf of Wales's children. I also put on record my gratitude to the Minister for Health and Social Services for the decisions that she has taken over the years. We are now seeing the rewards of some good, profound thinking and a consensus approach. This report is gritty—it is full of uncomfortable facts for any government. It would not matter who was the governing party; it still makes for uncomfortable reading. It speaks volumes for the Minister that she encourages that sort of independence and that sort of advocacy on behalf of children. The report contains many points that tell us that we are on the right tracks and that our priorities are correct.

5.00 p.m.

I hope that the Assembly will evolve a mechanism to consider this report. It is rather unfortunate that we have had to go through a procedure to extend this debate, so that we barely get an hour to discuss it. The children of Wales are worth a full Plenary session of some form, and I hope that we can come up with a mechanism that will deliver that. Janice Gregory's remarks were also apposite that we should still allow the committees to work with the commissioner unilaterally.

I will restrict myself to two issues that have

Fel llawer ohonom yng Nghymru, bydd yn siomedig gyda phenderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i beidio â chyflwyno gwaharddiad llwyr ar daro plant. Bydd y sefyllfa sydd gennym bellach yn hollol anymarferol, ac yr un mor ddryslyd i rieni hefyd. Fel y noda'r comisiynydd yn yr adroddiad, mae taro plant yn ffordd aneffeithiol o fagu. Ni chytunaf â barn David Davies, am ei bod yn andwyol yn fy marn i. Os ydym am i'n plant ifanc dyfu i fyny yn ddinasyyddion da, dylem weithio tuag at waharddiad llwyr. Galwaf ar y comisiynydd i fwrw ati i wneud y gwaith da y mae'n ei wneud o ran yr ymgylch i sicrhau bod plant yn y dyfodol yn cael yr un diogelwch.

**David Melding:** Llongyfarchaf y comisiynydd plant a'i dîm ar adroddiad ardderchog a chanmolaf eu gwaith aruthrol ar ran plant Cymru. Hoffwn gofnodi hefyd fy niolch i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y penderfyniadau a wnaed ganddi dros y blynnyddoedd. Yr ydym bellach yn eu gweld yn dwyn ffrwyth ar ffurf syniadau dwfn, da a gweithredu drwy gonsensws. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn bigog—mae'n llawn ffeithiau annifyr i unrhyw lywodraeth. Ni fyddai gwahaniaeth pwy oedd y blaidd mewn grym, mae'n dal i beri anesmwythder ymhllith y rhai sy'n ei ddarllen. Mae'n dweud cyfrolau am y Gweinidog ei bod yn annog y math hwnnw o annibyniaeth a'r math hwnnw o eiriolaeth ar ran plant. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys llawer o bwyntiau sy'n dweud wrthym ein bod ar y trywydd iawn a bod ein blaenoriaethau yn gywir.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn datblygu ffordd o ystyried yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n anffodus braidd bod yn rhaid inni fynd drwy weithdrefn i estyn y ddadl hon, fel bod cwta awr gennym i'w drafod. Mae plant Cymru yn werth sesiwn Cyfarfod Llawn o ryw fath, a gobeithiaf y gallwn feddwl am ffordd a fydd yn cyflawni hynny. Yr oedd sylwadau Janice Gregory ynglŷn â chaniatau i'r pwylgorau weithio'n unigol gyda'r comisiynydd o hyd hefyd yn berthnasol.

Cyfngaf fy sylwadau i ddau fater nas

not been raised directly this afternoon. In many ways, they refer to that grey area where the commissioner can take some action, but which also involve issues on a UK basis, such as law and order and youth justice. First, it is still an absolute disgrace that we have children in prisons. This has been a problem for many years. We know that boys, in particular, but girls also, are at an incredible risk of suicide during the first few days that they are locked up. We have had long enough to sort this out. If we need secure places, we should commission them and not put children—and young people—in adult prisons. I do not care how they are separated; the fact that they are in that environment is completely inappropriate and is an abuse of their human rights. I hope that the children's commissioner will take this forward and tell us some uncomfortable truths in the year ahead.

The second issue is the sex trade. This is a most unpalatable subject, but, sometimes, we must speak directly about things that we find profoundly uncomfortable to even think about. There has been some recent activity, which the children's commissioner, together with other charities involved in children's welfare, has supported. They are right to focus on the issue of trafficking children and displaced children getting tied up into being sex slaves, as is often the case, or involved in the production of pornographic images. We do not know much about this subject—we do not know where it is done, or how many children are abused in this way. However, I am told that, literally, millions of images are available on the internet for those so depraved to seek them out. I am also told that much of the prostitution industry is fuelled by young people, as well as children.

I do not know whether this is a great problem in our cities, towns and villages. Does anybody know? However, we need some evidence on this subject, because there

codwyd yn uniongyrchol y prynhawn yma. Mewn sawl ffordd, maent yn ymwneud â'r meysydd annelwig hynny lle y gall y comisiynydd gymryd rhai camau, ond sydd hefyd yn cynnwys materion lle y gweithredir ar sail y DU, megis cyfraith a threfn a chyflawnder ieuengtid. Yn gyntaf, mae'n gwbl warthus o hyd ein bod yn carcharu plant. Bu hon yn broblem ers sawl blwyddyn. Gwyddom fod bechgyn, yn enwedig, ond merched hefyd, mewn perygl enbyd o ladd eu hunain yn ystod yr ychydig ddyddiau cyntaf ar ôl iddynt gael eu carcharu. Yr ydym wedi cael hen ddigon o amser i ddatrys y broblem hon. Os oes angen lleoedd diogel, dylem eu comisiynu a phedio â charcharu plant—a phobl ifanc—mewn carchardai i oedolion. Nid yw o bwys imi sut y cânt eu gwahanu; mae'r ffaith eu bod yn yr amgylchedd hwnnw yn gwbl amhriodol ac mae'n groes i'w hawlau dynol. Gobeithiaf y bydd y comisiynydd plant yn ymchwilio i hyn ac yn dweud wrthym yn ddi-flewyn ar dafod fel y mae pethau mewn gwirionedd yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod.

Yr ail fater yw'r fasnach mewn rhyw. Mae'r pwnc hwn yn un tra annymunol, ond, weithiau, rhaid inni siarad yn uniongyrchol am bethau y mae'n hynod annifyr inni hyd yn oed feddwl amdanynt. Bu rhywfaint o weithgarwch yn ddiweddar, a gefnogwyd gan y comisiynydd plant, ynghyd ag elusennau eraill sy'n ymwneud â lles plant. Mae'n briodol eu bod yn canolbwytio ar fasnachu mewn plant a'r broblem o ran plant wedi'u dadleoli sy'n cael eu gorfodi i fod yn gaethweision rhyw, fel sy'n digwydd yn aml, neu, eu gorfodi i gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o gynhyrchu delweddau masweddus. Ni wyddom ryw lawer am y pwnc hwn—ni wyddom ble y mae'n digwydd, neu faint o blant sy'n cael eu cam-drin yn y modd hwn. Fodd bynnag, dywedir wrthyf, fod miliynau o ddelweddau, yn llythrennol, ar gael ar y rhyngrwyd i'r rhai sydd mor anfoesol fel eu bod yn chwilio amdanynt. Dywedir wrthyf hefyd fod llawer iawn o'r diwydiant puteinio wedi'i gyflenwi gan bobl ifanc, yn ogystal â phlant.

Ni wn a yw hon yn broblem fawr yn ein dinasoedd, ein trefi a'n pentrefi. A wyr unrhyw un? Fodd bynnag, mae angen dystiolaeth arnom ynglŷn â'r pwnc hwn,

cannot be any greater abuse than taking away the right of children and young people to full and proper sexual development. We must tackle this area. It is rather analogous to bullying—it is not a subject that we necessarily focus on often, we feel that it is foreign to our experience, and we feel challenged and uncomfortable even asking or talking about this sort of subject. However, I hope that Peter Clarke will help us to focus on this sort of issue and get some coherent policy on it, starting with reliable data.

**Sandy Mewies:** I welcome this report from the commissioner and his team. I am amazed at the breadth of work that they have covered, knowing that the team is quite small and that resources are finite. They have gone from the Clywch report to ongoing themes such as bullying. Like other Members, I will say a little about bullying and the thematic approach that is being taken towards it.

I thoroughly agree with David Melding that young people and children should not be in prisons—it is entirely wrong. Perhaps, if David Davies looked at the research that is available, he will see that those people who perpetrate acts of violence or bullying or abuse, or whatever you call them, have often been victims themselves; it is a great majority. We should take note of this, otherwise we will go on perpetuating the cycle of violence from generation to generation.

There must be a thematic approach to bullying. Additionally, it is all very well sending out guidance to schools, or to anywhere else where bullying will take place, but people must also act on the guidance that has been given. It is no good having policies or conditions for this and that if people do not act when a complaint of bullying is made to them. It must be investigated completely.

The other point that interested me—and you may think that I am going from sublime to ridiculous, but I am not—is the commissioner's report, 'Lifting the Lid on the Nation's School Toilets'. It is true that, should you go to any school council meeting, most children or young people will tell you,

oherwydd, o ran cam-drin plant, nid oes dim byd yn waeth na mynd â hawl plant a phobl ifanc i ddatblygiad rhywiol llawn a phriodol oddi wrthynt. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r maes hwn. Mae'n eithaf tebyg i fwlio—nid yw'n bwnc yr ydym o reidrwydd yn canolbwytio arno ryw lawer, teimlwn ei fod yn ddeithir inni, ac mae'n beth heriol ac annifyr inni hyd yn oed holi neu siarad am bwnc o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd Peter Clarke yn ein helpu i ganolbwytio ar y math hwn o fater ac i gael rhyw fath o bolisi cydlynol arno, gan ddechrau gyda data dibynadwy.

**Sandy Mewies:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn oddi wrth y comisiynydd a'i dîm. Synnaf at faint o waith a gwmpaswyd ganddynt, o wybod bod y tîm yn eithaf bach ac nad oes ganddynt adnoddau diderfyn. Maent wedi symud o adroddiad Clywch i themâu cyfredol megis bwlio. Fel Aelodau eraill, soniaf ychydig am fwlio a'r ymagwedd thematig tuag ato.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â David Melding na ddylai pobl ifanc a phlant fod yn y carchar—mae'n gwbl amhriodol. Pe bai David Davies yn ystyried yr ymchwil sydd ar gael, efallai y bydd yn gweld bod y bobl hynny sy'n ymosod yn gorfforol ar eraill neu'n eu bwlio neu'n eu cam-drin, neu pa ddisgrifiad bynnag a fynnoch, yn aml wedi cael eu cam-drin eu hunain; y mwyafrif llethol ydyw. Dylem nodi hyn, fel arall bydd y cylch o drais yn parhau o un genhedlaeth i'r llall gennym.

Rhaid bod ymagwedd thematig tuag at fwlio. Yn ogystal, mae'n ddigon hawdd dosbarthu canllawiau i ysgolion, neu i le bynnag y bydd bwlio yn digwydd, ond rhaid i bobl weithredu hefyd ar y canllawiau a roddwyd. Nid oes diben mewn llunio polisiau neu amodau i'r hyn neu'r llall os nad yw pobl yn gweithredu ar ôl i rywun gwyno wrthynt am fwlio. Rhaid ymchwilio i'r gŵyn yn drylwyr.

Y pwyt arall a fu o ddiddordeb imi—ac efallai y credwch fy mod yn mynd o'r arddunol i'r chwerthinllyd, ond nid dyna fy mwriad—yw adroddiad y comisiynydd, 'Codi'r Clawr ar Doileau Ysgol y Genedl'. Mae'n wir, os ewch i unrhyw gyfarfod cyngor ysgol, y bydd y rhan fwyaf o blant

as one of their constant complaints, about the condition of the school toilets. It was ever thus, but it should stop now. The commissioner and his team have developed listening to young people and acting on what they say, which is a great advantage for them. The past has seen many ways of trying to involve children and young people, but they need to be heard or they will not contribute again, and the commissioner and his team have made a wonderful contribution in this regard.

People have made great play of the fact that the commissioner does not give 101 per cent praise to the Assembly. I hope that we never see the day when a commissioner gives 101 per cent endorsement of the actions of any Government. That is not the commissioner's job, because we can never be 100 per cent right—there is always room for improvement. I see the job of commissioner as being a critical friend, and I hope that the commissioner continues to challenge what we do because it is only by being challenged that we can make improvements.

The commissioner gave his views on child and adolescent mental health. I think that the Welsh Assembly Government has made good progress in this matter, but we have not reached the end of that road, and I look forward to seeing what we do in the future. I also look forward to hearing the comments of the Welsh Assembly Government on the other issues that have been raised. Once again, I commend this report and congratulate the commissioner and his team on their innovative work. Children and young people in Wales have a doughty champion.

**Mark Isherwood:** As a father of six and a grandfather to one—it is lovely to say that—I welcome this honest report from a principled commissioner and his team. His impartiality allowed him to tackle issues that have often remained unaddressed. This was highlighted in his May statement on schools' admissions policies. He said that the way in which schools and pupils are matched up should change, and that the current system of catchment areas is fundamentally flawed and does not take the needs of some children into account. Many parents—and, sadly, Flintshire parents in particular—have

neu bobl ifanc yn sôn wrthych am gyflwr toiledau'r ysgol, fel un o'r cwynion sy'n codi o hyd ganddynt. Felly y bu erioed, ond mae'n bryd i bethau newid. Mae'r comisiynydd a'i dîm wedi datblygu'r arfer o wrando ar bobl ifanc a gweithredu ar yr hyn a ddywedant, sy'n fantais fawr iddynt. Yn y gorffennol aethpwyd ati mewn sawl ffordd i geisio cynnwys plant a phobl ifanc, ond mae angen i bobl wrando arnynt neu ni fyddant yn cyfrannu eto, ac mae'r comisiynydd a'i dîm wedi gwneud cyfraniad gwych yn hyn o beth.

Mae pobl wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad yw'r comisiynydd yn canmol y Cynulliad ar bopeth a wna. Gobeithiaf na welwn byth y diwrnod pan fydd comisiynydd yn cymeradwyo popeth a wna unrhyw Lywodraeth. Nid dyna waith y comisiynydd, oherwydd ni allwn byth fod yn hollol iawn—mae lle i wella bob amser. Bod yn ffrind beirniadol yw gwaith comisiynydd yn fy nhyb i, a gobeithiaf fod y comisiynydd yn parhau i herio'r hyn a wnawn oherwydd dim ond drwy gael ein herio y gallwn wneud gwelliannau.

Rhoddodd y comisiynydd ei farn ar iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Credaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud cynnydd da yn hyn o beth, ond nid ydym wedi dod i ben y daith honno, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld yr hyn a wnawn yn y dyfodol. Edrychaf ymlaen hefyd at wrando ar sylwadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y materion eraill a godwyd. Unwaith eto, cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad hwn a llonyfarchaf y comisiynydd a'i dîm ar eu gwaith arloesol. Mae gan blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru gymwynaswr pybyr.

**Mark Isherwood:** A minnau'n dad i chwech o blant ac yn daid i un—mae'n braf dweud hynny—croesawaf yr adroddiad gonest hwn oddi wrth gomisiynydd egwyddorol a'i dîm. Mae ei ddiueddrwydd wedi ei gwneud yn bosibl iddo fynd i'r afael â materion sydd yn aml yn cael eu gadael heb eu trafod. Amlygwyd hyn yn ei ddatganiad ym mis Mai ar bolisiau derbyn i ysgolion. Dywedodd y dylai'r ffordd y caiff ysgolion a disgyblion eu paru newid, a bod y system dalgylch bresennol yn ddiffygol yn y bôn ac nad yw'n ystyried anghenion rhai plant. Mae llawer o rieni—rhieni sir y Fflint yn enwedig,

contacted me in despair over a rigid and inflexible policy that fails to take the needs of their children into account. It splits apart friends, primary classes and young communities, and it tells, rather than asks, headteachers what their admissions numbers should be. It is simply not good enough for the Welsh Assembly Government to deny responsibility or to look the other way on this issue.

Neither is it good enough to impose anti-bullying policies that are not applied logically. This report states that bullying makes children's lives a misery to the point of contemplating suicide, and it is therefore worrying that one young lady living in Wrexham, but relocated from primary school in Wrexham to primary school in Flintshire to escape bullying, should then have had to go to appeal to stay with her friends in a Flintshire high school rather than rejoin the bullies in her local high school.

This report states that there is much work to be done if Wales is to play its part in the goal to halve child poverty by 2010. However, as one Welsh housing professional recently put it to me, this Welsh Assembly Government is spending its social justice budget on symptoms rather than on cures. As a consequence, today's young people are the first generation since the industrial revolution to live in poorer housing accommodation than their parents. The Welsh Consumer Council reported this month that Wales could face a housing crisis. All that the Welsh Assembly Government offers, however, is projected social housing grant that, by 2008, will still be less than it was 11 years earlier in 1996-97. It is demanding more, but providing less. This Welsh Assembly Government claims that it is committed to ensuring distribution of resources according to need, while the children's commissioner has expressed concern about the lack of ring-fenced funding for the national service framework for children, launched by Jane Hutt last month.

gwaetha'r modd—wedi cysylltu â mi mewn anobaith llwyr oherwydd polisi anhyblyg sy'n methu ag ystyried anghenion eu plant. Mae'n gwahanu ffrindiau, dosbarthiadau ysgol gynradd a chymunedau ifanc oddi wrth ei gilydd, ac mae'n dweud wrth benaethiaid faint o blant y dylent eu derbyn yn hytrach na gofyn iddynt. Mae'n hollol annerbyniol bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymwrthod â'r cyfrifoldeb dros y mater hwn neu'n ei anwybyddu.

Nid yw'n dderbyniol ychwaith gorfodi polisiau gwrth-fwlio nad ydynt yn cael eu cymhwysyo'n rhesymegol. Noda'r adroddiad hwn fod bwlio yn peri cymaint o ofid i blant nes eu bod yn ystyried lladd eu hunain, ac felly mae'n achos pryder bod un ferch ifanc sy'n byw yn Wrecsam, ond a gafodd ei symud o ysgol gynradd yn Wrecsam i ysgol gynradd yn sir y Fflint i ddianc rhag bwlio, wedi gorfol apelio i aros gyda'i ffrindiau mewn ysgol uwchradd yn sir y Fflint yn hytrach nag ailymuno â'r plant a oedd yn ei bwlio yn ei hysgol uwchradd leol.

Noda'r adroddiad hwn fod llawer o waith i'w wneud er mwyn i Gymru chwarae ei rhan yn y nod o haneru tlodi plant erbyn 2010. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd un gweithiwr proffesiynol ym maes tai yng Nghymru wrthyf yn ddiweddar, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwario ei chyllideb cyflawnder cymdeithasol ar drin symptomau yn hytrach nag unioni'r broblem. O ganlyniad, pobl ifanc heddiw yw'r genhedaeth gyntaf ers y chwyldro diwydiannol i fyw mewn tai sy'n waeth eu cyflwr na thai eu rhieni. Mewn adroddiad y mis hwn nododd Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru y gallai Cymru wynebu argyfwng tai. Fodd bynnag, y cyfan a gynigia Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw grant tai cymdeithasol a ragamcanwyd a fydd, erbyn 2008, yn dal i fod yn llai nag ydoedd 11 mlynedd yn gynt yn 1996-97. Mae'n mynnu cael mwy, ond mae'n darparu llai. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn honni ei bod yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau y caiff adnoddau eu dosbarthu yn ôl angen, tra bod y comisiynydd plant wedi mynegi pryder ynglŷn â'r ffaith nad oes arian wedi'i glustnodi'n benodol ar gyfer y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant, a lansiwyd gan Jane Hutt fis diwethaf.

In January, and again in May, I referred to the plight of the Finegan family, who live near me in Flintshire, and who have given me permission to use their name today. Their children are being raised in substandard and sub-human conditions since the county council enforced a demolition order against the house next door. Their health and wellbeing is poor, and it is only the intervention of the children's commissioner that has given this family hope. However, the council is still ducking, diving and delaying over its proposal that two children should share a bedroom that is too small for a standard single bed because of the weakness of the commissioner's powers when they come up against determined opposition.

5.10 p.m.

This year's report again refers to the continuing crisis in child and adolescent mental health services provision. This bad situation was brought home to me in a letter sent to a parent from the Flintshire child and adolescent mental health service, which states that:

'Unfortunately, due to extremely high demand upon this service, we are currently operating strict service criteria, which excludes youngsters with the sorts of problems [your son] is presenting.'

After receiving another letter from the local NHS trust, the parent wrote to me again to say that the trust stated that it is:

'concentrating on life-threatening mental health disorders, suicidal ideation and serious self-harming....Do you know that there is a staggering amount of suicides in Asperger people? Is this what it is going to take to get [my son] help? I hope not. He has already self-harmed by rubbing a ten pence piece on his hand, breaking the skin, and an incident of head banging....You in the National Assembly are the only hope for some people, to be their champion. Please help.'

Ym mis Ionawr, ac unwaith eto ym mis Mai, cyfeiriai at drafferthion y teulu Finegan, sy'n byw yn agos imi yn sir y Fflint, ac sydd wedi rhoi caniatâd imi ddefnyddio eu henw heddiw. Mae eu plant yn cael eu codi o dan amgylchiadau ansafonol ac annynol ers i'r cyngor sir orfodi gorchymyn dymchwel yn erbyn y tŷ drws nesaf. Mae eu hiechyd a'u lles yn wael, a dim ond ymyriad y comisiynydd plant sydd wedi rhoi gobaith i'r teulu hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyngor yn dal i osgoi mynd i'r afael â'r mater ac i oedi ynglŷn â'i gynnig y dylai dau blentyn rannu ystafell wely sy'n rhy fach i wely sengl safonol oherwydd gwendid pwerau'r comisiynydd yn wyneb gwrthwynebiad penderfynol.

Mae adroddiad eleni yn cyfeirio unwaith eto at yr argyfwng sy'n parhau o ran y ddarpariaeth o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Sylweddolais pa mor wael oedd y sefyllfa hon ar ôl darllen llythyr at riant oddi wrth wasanaeth iechyd meddwl plant a glasoed sir y Fflint, sy'n nodi:

Yn anffodus, oherwydd y galw mawr iawn am y gwasanaeth hwn, yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn gweithredu meinu prawf llym ar gyfer y gwasanaeth, sy'n eithrio pobl ifanc gyda'r math o broblemau sydd gan [eich mab].

Ar ôl cael llythyr arall oddi wrth yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG leol, ysgrifennodd y rhiant ataf unwaith eto i ddweud bod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi dweud ei bod:

yn canolbwytio ar anhwylderau iechyd meddwl lle y mae bywyd unigolyn mewn perygl, lle y mae unigolyn yn meddwl am ladd ei hun a lle y mae achosion o hunan-niwed.... A wyddoch fod niferoedd aruthrol o bobl â syndrom Asperger yn lladd eu hunain? Ai dyna beth fydd yn rhaid digwydd cyn i [fy mab] gael cymorth? Gobeithio ddim. Mae eisoes wedi gwneud niwed iddo ei hun drwy rwbio darn deg ceiniog ar ei law, gan dorri'r croen, ac achos o daro ei ben....Chi yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw'r unig obaith i rai pobl, i bledio eu hachos. A wnewch chi helpu?

The commissioner states in his report that those whose key objective is to give children a voice have a major task ahead of them. Until this Welsh Assembly Government recognises that the children's commissioner is not a fig-leaf for its own inaction, which is too frequent in these areas, I regret that that major task will remain for the future.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** Thank you for the wide-ranging debate and the contributions made by Members of all parties. I am grateful that Rhodri Glyn Thomas agreed to withdraw amendment 5. We can look forward to new arrangements. I was also grateful for the points made by Janice Gregory and David Melding about how we can consider this in terms of addressing the issues that relate to committees specifically and to the Assembly as a whole. I am sure that Peter Clarke will have welcomed that discussion today.

On the relationship between the commissioners, which is the subject of amendments and debate today, I re-emphasise that the Assembly Government's priority for children, young people and the children's commissioner in Wales is to ensure that we implement arrangements that will ensure clarity in that relationship. I am determined to ensure that Peter can work effectively with the English commissioner. Again, I give my commitment to address this at ministerial and official levels. The interests of children and young people are key to this.

I have listened to Members' concerns about the child and adolescent mental health strategy and, in my opening remarks, I talked about the progress that we are making. I believe that a firm basis has been laid, and is being laid, for improvement to deliver those commitments. This is what people want. 'Everybody's Business' is a 10-year strategy, but we must deliver and account for those commitments. We owe this to the children and young people of Wales, and to the professionals who support them. That is why

Noda'r comisiynydd yn ei adroddiad fod gan y rhai sydd â'r amcan o roi llais i blant fel eu prif amcan dasg fawr o'u blaen. Hyd nes y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydnabod nad yw'r comisiynydd plant yn esgus dros beidio â gweithredu ei hun, rhywbeth sy'n digwydd yn rhy aml yn y meysydd hyn, credaf, gwaetha'r modd, y bydd y dasg fawr honno yn aros ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolch ichi am ddadl eang ei chwmpas a'r cyfraniadau a wnaed gan Aelodau o bob plaid. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod Rhodri Glyn Thomas wedi cytuno i dynnu gwelliant 5 yn ôl. Gallwn edrych ymlaen at drefniadau newydd. Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar hefyd am y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Janice Gregory a David Melding ynglŷn â'r ffordd y gallwn ystyried hyn o ran mynd i'r afael â'r materion sy'n ymwneud â phwyllgorau yn benodol a'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r Cynulliad cyfan. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Peter Clarke wedi croesawu'r drafodaeth honno heddiw.

O ran y berthynas rhwng y comisiynwyr, y cynigir gwelliannau yn ei chylch ac y'i trafodir heddiw, ailbwysleisiaf mai blaenoriaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i blant, pobl ifanc a'r comisiynydd plant yng Nghymru yw sicrhau ein bod yn gweithredu trefniadau a fydd yn sicrhau eglurder yn y berthynas honno. Yr wyf yn benderfynol o sicrhau y gall Peter weithio'n effeithiol gyda'r comisiynydd yn Lloegr. Unwaith eto, ymrwymaf i fynd i'r afael â hyn ar lefel gweinidogion a swyddogion. Mae buddiannau plant a phlant ifanc yn allweddol i hyn.

Yr wyf wedi gwrando ar bryderon Gweinidogion ynglŷn â strategaeth iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed ac, yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, soniais am y cynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud. Credaf fod sylfaen gadarn wedi'i gosod, ac yn cael ei gosod, ar gyfer gwelliannau a fydd yn arwain at gyflawni'r ymrwymiadau hynny. Dyna beth y mae pobl yn ei ddymuno. Mae 'Busnes Pawb' yn strategaeth 10 mlynedd, ond rhaid inni gyflawni'r ymrwymiadau hynny a rhoi cyfrif amdanynt. Mae dyletswydd arnom i wneud

I am strengthening the implementation group by meeting with the Royal College of Psychiatrists and the voluntary sector regularly, and with children and young people, such as those from Barnardo's with whom I met recently.

**Gwenda Thomas:** This week saw the publication of the progress report by consultants Marian Stuart and Catherine Baines on implementing the recommendations of the report by Sir William Uttings, 'People Like Us'. They recognise that the development and implementation of the Children First policy in Wales was a positive response to the Uttings report, and that much improvement has been achieved in many children services since the introduction of Children First in Wales.

Do you agree, Minister, that it is useful to highlight the link between this debate on the children's commissioner's 2003-04 report and the Welsh Assembly Government's continuing budgetary commitment to the Children First policy?

**Jane Hutt:** I am grateful that you have mentioned that report, which I am sure that Assembly Members will look forward to reading, which was produced to consider the progress of Sir William Uttings's work and report. As I said, in relation to children and adolescent mental health services, Children First is key to ensuring progress in terms of services for children at the sharp end. An increase of £40 million in the draft budget for Children First will back up and demonstrate our determination to make that difference. I thank you for that comment.

We have asked all our local health boards to develop costed plans, to be brought forward by October 2004. We are now considering those and how they can deliver sustainable child and adolescent mental health strategies. I know that I will be able to bring that back to the Assembly to be considered.

hyn er mwyn plant a phobl ifanc Cymru, ac er mwyn y gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n eu cynorthwyo. Dyna pam yr wyf yn atgyfnerthu'r grŵp gweithredu drwy gyfarfod â Choleg Brenhinol y Seociatryddion a'r sector gwirfoddol yn rheolaidd, a chyda phlant a phobl ifanc, megis y rhai o Barnardo's y cyfarfum â hwy yn ddiweddar.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wythnos hon cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad cynnydd gan yr ymgynghorwyr Marian Stuart a Catherine Baines ar weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad gan Syr William Uttings, 'People Like Us'. Cydnabyddant fod y broses o ddatblygu a gweithredu'r polisi Plant yn Gyntaf yng Nghymru yn ymateb cadarnhaol i adroddiad Uttings, a bod llawer o wasanaethau plant wedi gwella cryn dipyn ers cyflwyno Plant yn Gyntaf yng Nghymru.

A gytunwch, Weinidog, ei bod yn ddefnyddiol amlygu'r cyswllt rhwng y ddadl hon ar adroddiad 2003-04 y comisiynydd plant a'r ymrwymiad parhaus yng nghyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r polisi Plant yn Gyntaf?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am sôn am yr adroddiad hwnnw, y bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn edrych ymlaen at ei ddarllen, mae'n siŵr. Fe'i paratowyd i ystyried cynnydd gwaith ac adroddiad Syr William Uttings. Fel y dywedais, o ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, mae Plant yn Gyntaf yn allweddol i sierhau cynnydd o ran gwasanaethau i blant ar y rheng flaen. Bydd cynnydd o £40 miliwn yng nghyllideb ddrafft Plant yn Gyntaf yn ategu ac yn dangos ein penderfyniad i wneud gwahaniaeth o'r fath. Diolchaf ichi am y sylw hwnnw.

Yr ydym wedi gofyn i bob un o'n byrddau iechyd lleol ddatblygu cynlluniau wedi'u costio, i'w cyflwyno erbyn mis Hydref 2004. Yr ydym wrthi'n eu hystyried a'r ffordd y gallant ddarparu strategaethau iechyd meddwl cynaliadwy i blant a'r glasoed. Gwn y byddwn yn gallu cyflwyno hynny i'r Cynulliad ei ystyried.

**Helen Mary Jones:** On the child and adolescent mental health strategy, how do you respond to the commissioner's specific concern that, although it is a good strategy, it is not sufficiently resourced? There is no money in the draft budget line that I can identify that will enable the plans that you want local health boards to produce to be delivered.

**Jane Hutt:** The £1.2 million, which I mentioned in my opening speech, that has been allocated since last year specifically for child and adolescent mental health services is already making a difference. The £40 million that I said is in the draft budget for early intervention and Children First will also make a difference. It is the Assembly's responsibility to ensure that we take this forward through scrutiny and debate.

Members have raised a number of issues that are represented fully in Peter's report, particularly those related to bullying. They are important, and Denise mentioned her experience of bullying as a teacher. We must ensure that we highlight those issues. Janet Ryder was concerned about how children can complain. I assure you that a complaint made by a parent, a carer or a pupil about an incident or incidents of bullying should be handled under the school's complaints procedures to ensure that complaints are taken seriously and investigated appropriately. There will also be separate guidance on how children and young people can complain, which we will consult upon in the new year.

I was glad that Janice mentioned issues around asylum seekers. Although it is not a devolved issue, the Assembly Government is committed to ensuring that Wales plays its part in making educational and social provision available to asylum seekers and their children who arrive in the UK. This is the fourth successive year that we have made provision for those young people. Grant support continues to include provision, and that is a key issue for the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee.

Today's debate has been an opportunity to

**Helen Mary Jones:** O ran strategaeth iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, sut yr ymatebwch i bryder penodol y comisiynydd nad oes digon o adnoddau ar ei chyfer, er ei bod yn strategaeth dda? Nid oes dim arian yn llinell y gyllideb ddrafft y gallaf ei nodi a fydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i'r cynlluniau yr ydych am i'r byrddau iechyd lleol eu paratoi gael eu cyflawni.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r £1.2 miliwn, y soniais amdano yn fy araih agoriadol, sydd wedi'i neilltuo ers y llynedd yn benodol ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed eisoes yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Bydd y £40 miliwn y dywedais ei fod yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer ymyrryd yn gynnar a Plant yn Gyntaf yn gwneud gwahaniaeth hefyd. Mae cyfrifoldeb ar y Cynulliad hefyd i sicrhau ein bod yn datblygu hyn drwy graffu a thrafod.

Mae Aelodau wedi codi nifer o faterion a drafodir yn llawn yn adroddiad Peter, yn enwedig materion yn ymwneud â bwlio. Maent yn bwysig, a soniodd Denise am ei phrofiad o fwlio fel athrawes. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn tynnu sylw at y materion hynny. Yr oedd Janet Ryder yn pryderu ynglŷn â sut y gall plant gwyno. Fe'ch sicrhaf y dylid ymdrin â chwyn a wneir gan riant, gofalwr neu ddisgybl ynglŷn ag achos neu achosion o fwlio o dan weithdrefnau cwyno yr ysgol er mwyn sicrhau y caiff cwynion eu cymryd o ddifrif ac yr ymchwilir iddynt yn briodol. Bydd canllawiau ar wahân hefyd ar sut y gall plant a phobl ifanc gwyno, y byddwn yn ymgynghori arnynt yn y flwyddyn newydd.

Yr oeddwn yn falch i Janice sôn am faterion yn ymwneud â cheiswyr lloches. Er nad yw'n fater datganoledig, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i sicrhau bod Cymru yn chwarae ei rhan i sicrhau bod darpariaeth addysgol a chymdeithasol ar gael i geiswyr lloches a'u plant sy'n cyrraedd y DU. Dyma'r bedwaredd flwyddyn yn olynol yr ydym wedi gwneud darpariaeth ar gyfer y bobl ifanc hynny. Mae cymorth grant yn parhau i gynnwys darpariaeth, ac mae'n fater allweddol i'r Pwyllgor Cyflawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Bu'r ddadl heddiw yn gyfle i ailystyried

reconsider the important issue of our social workforce in Wales. Many have followed this through. It is important that Peter independently focuses on such an issue every year. Sandy Mewies said that she considered him to be a critical friend to Government. He and his office must also be independent in order to champion the rights of children and young people. He has rightly focused on social workers. Eighty-five more students have registered for social work training during the past year. We have ring-fenced £600,000 to support the development of the social care workforce with local authorities. The Care Council for Wales is also raising the profile of social work and placing it on a more professional footing. It is right that we bring that to the fore in responding to the report. I am making £3 million available this year to support social work students through bursaries.

Peter is committed to keeping in touch with the opinions of children and young people who are most excluded, and to show them respect in order to ensure that we understand how we can make a difference through our work, as we have through the children's national service framework for health.

This has been an opportunity for Members to raise other issues, such as alcohol abuse, which Denise raised, children in prisons, as David and Sandy mentioned, and the sex trade. We must inform Peter that these are the issues that have been raised and that I know Members are concerned about. We must ensure that we reflect on the report, and I will respond in full in the new year. Peter has been chosen to be president of the European Network of Children's Ombudspeople this year. We had a commissioners' annual meeting in Cardiff and a reception hosted by David Melding. We are proud of our commissioner's contribution on the European and world scenes in taking forward what was a cross-party commitment, delivered by the Welsh Assembly Government, since he started in this role over three years ago. Diolch. This is an important day for children and young people.

mater pwysig, ein gweithlu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae llawer wedi gweithredu ar hyn. Mae'n bwysig bod Peter yn canolbwyntio ar fater o'r fath yn annibynnol bob blwyddyn. Dywedodd Sandy Mewies ei bod yn ei ystyried yn ffrind beirniadol i'r Llywodraeth. Rhaid iddo ef a'i swyddfa fod yn annibynnol hefyd er mwyn hyrwyddo hawliau plant a phobl ifanc. Mae wedi canolbwyntio ar weithwyr cymdeithasol, a hynny'n briodol. Mae 85 yn fwy o fyfyrwyr wedi'u cofrestru ar gyfer hyfforddiant gwaith cymdeithasol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Yr ydym wedi clustnodi £600,000 i helpu i ddatblygu'r gweithlu gofal cymdeithasol gyda'r awdurdodau lleol. Mae Cyngor Gofal Cymru hefyd yn codi proffil gwaith cymdeithasol a'i osod ar sail fwy proffesiynol. Mae'n briodol inni dynnu sylw at hynny wrth ymateb i'r adroddiad. Yr wyf yn darparu £3 miliwn eleni i roi cymorth i fyfyrwyr gwaith cymdeithasol drwy fwrsariâu.

Mae Peter yn ymrwymedig i gadw mewn cysylltiad â safbwyntiau plant a phobl ifanc a gaiff eu heithrio fwyaf, ac i ddangos parch tuag atynt er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn deall sut y gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth drwy ein gwaith, fel y gwnaethom drwy fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol plant ar gyfer iechyd.

Bu hwn yn gyfle i Aelodau godi materion eraill, megis camddefnyddio alcohol, a godwyd gan Denise, plant mewn carchardai, fel y soniodd David a Sandy, a'r fasnach mewn rhyw. Rhaid inni ddweud wrth Peter mai dyma'r materion a godwyd a'r rhai y gwn fod Aelodau yn pryderu yn eu cylch. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn myfyrio ar yr adroddiad, a byddaf yn ymateb yn llawn yn y flwyddyn newydd. Dewiswyd Peter yn llywydd ar Rwydwaith Ewropeaidd yr Ombwdsmyn Plant eleni. Trefnwyd cyfarfod blynnyddol y comisiynwyr yng Nghaerdydd a chynhaliwyd derbyniad gan David Melding. Yr ydym yn falch o gyfraniad ein comisiynydd yn Ewrop ac yn y byd o ran datblygu'r hyn a fu'n ymrwymiad trawsbleidiol, wedi'i gyflawni gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ers iddo ddechrau yn y rôl hon dros dair blynedd yn ôl. Diolch. Mae heddiw yn ddiwrnod pwysig i blant a phobl ifanc.

5.20 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** If **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Os derbynir gwelliant amendment 2 is carried, amendment 6 will 2, bydd gwelliant 6 yn methu fall.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amendment 1: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn

Morgan, Jonathan	Law, Peter
Randerson, Jenny	Lewis, Huw
Ryder, Janet	Lloyd, Val
Thomas, Owen John	Mewies, Sandy
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Morgan, Rhodri
Williams, Brynle	Neagle, Lynne
Williams, Kirsty	Pugh, Alun
	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 4: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 6: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew

Francis, Lisa	Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
German, Michael	Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William	Gregory, Janice
Isherwood, Mark	Griffiths, John
Jones, Alun Ffred	Gwyther, Christine
Jones, Elin	Hart, Edwina
Jones, Helen Mary	Hutt, Jane
Jones, Ieuan Wyn	Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Laura Anne	James, Irene
Lloyd, David	Jones, Ann
Melding, David	Jones, Carwyn
Morgan, Jonathan	Law, Peter
Randerson, Jenny	Lewis, Huw
Ryder, Janet	Lloyd, Val
Thomas, Owen John	Mewies, Sandy
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn	Morgan, Rhodri
Williams, Brynle	Neagle, Lynne
Williams, Kirsty	Pugh, Alun
	Sargeant, Carl
	Sinclair, Karen
	Thomas, Catherine
	Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 7: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, David
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Law, Peter
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 8: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM2174 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. welcomes the third Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales and congratulates the commissioner and his office for their dedication to protecting the interests of children; and*

*2. notes that the Minister for Health and Social Services will draw up a response and report to the National Assembly on this by 31 January 2005.*

Cynnig NDM2174 wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu trydydd Adroddiad Blynnyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru ac yn llonyfarch y comisiynydd a'i swyddfa ar eu hymroddiad i amddiffyn buddiannau plant; ac*

*2. yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn llunio ymateb ac adroddiad arno ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol erbyn 31 Ionawr 2005.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Dadl Fer  
Short Debate**

**Lefelau'r Dreth Gyngor yng Nghaerdydd  
Council Tax Levels in Cardiff**

**Jenny Randerson:** I have agreed to allow Jonathan Morgan and Lorraine Barrett to contribute to the debate.

Council tax payers in Cardiff will be faced with a double whammy next year. The

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf wedi cytuno i ganiatáu i Jonathan Morgan a Lorraine Barrett gyfrannu at y ddadl.

Bydd talwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd yn wynebu dwy ergyd y flwyddyn nesaf.

combined effects of rebanding and a poor local government settlement will inevitably mean council tax rises well into double figures, even if the council chooses to cut services. Yesterday, the First Minister—who I regret to see has left the Chamber—resorted to bluster and insult when challenged on this by Michael German. He resorted to using the old chestnut that council tax levels are the responsibility of local government. Fortunately, I have the opportunity today to put the record straight by arguing the case in detail.

First, let us consider the impact of rebanding. It is true, of course, that, taking Wales as a whole, the effect will be neutral. However, the impact in some areas will be much greater than in others. The greatest turmoil will be in Cardiff, because this is the local authority area with the highest percentage of households moving up one or more bands—67 per cent, and 14 per cent of those will move up two or more bands. This is due to the increase in property values in Cardiff, which is of no consolation to householders who need to continue to live in Cardiff for work purposes or simply to remain in their communities.

Let us consider the 67 per cent in more detail. Of the top 10 communities in Wales hardest hit by rebanding, five are in Cardiff. They are: Riverside, with 93 per cent of households going up at least one band; Cathays, with 91 per cent; Adamsdown, with 90 per cent; Grangetown with 87 per cent; and Canton, with 86 per cent. This, in itself, is nearly 25,000 households. Most of us here—and I knew that I would have a select, but quality, audience—know Cardiff well and will immediately be struck by the wards on this list. They are not the leafy suburbs, but inner-city areas and some of the poorest communities in Cardiff. For example, Adamsdown is an area of influence as a Communities First ward. I realise that, in itself, this does not affect the total tax take from Cardiff. However, it does affect the balance of where the money comes from. Given that two thirds of Cardiff households have moved up by one band or more, these households are bound to have to shoulder a

Mae'n anochel y bydd effeithiau cyfunol ailfandio a setliad llywodraeth leol gwael yn golygu codiadau ffigurau dwbl yn y dreth gyngor, hyd yn oed os bydd y cyngor yn dewis cwtogi ar wasanaethau. Ddoe, bu'r Prif Weinidog—gresynaf ei fod wedi gadael y Siambra—yn gegfawr ac yn sarhaus wrth iddo gael ei herio gan Michael German ar y mater. Cododd yr un hen ddadl mai llywodraeth leol sy'n gyfrifol am lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Yn ffodus, mae cyfle gennyl heddiw i unioni'r cam hwnnw drwy ddadlau'r achos yn fanwl.

Yn gyntaf, gadewch inni ystyried effaith ailfandio. Mae'n wir, wrth gwrs, y bydd yr effaith yn niwtral, o ystyried Cymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, bydd yr effaith mewn rhai ardaloedd yn llawer mwy nag mewn ardaloedd eraill. Bydd yr helynt fwyaf yng Nghaerdydd, oherwydd dyma'r ardal awdurdod lleol lle y mae'r ganran uchaf o gartrefi yn symud i fyny un band neu fwy—67 y cant, a bydd 14 y cant o'r rheini yn symud i fyny dau fand neu fwy. Y rheswm dros hyn yw'r cynnydd mewn gwerth eiddo yng Nghaerdydd, nad yw o unrhyw gysur i'r deiliaid cartrefi hynny y mae angen iddynt barhau i fyw yng Nghaerdydd oherwydd gwaith neu am y rheswm syml eu bod am aros yn eu cymunedau.

Gadewch inni ystyried y 67 y cant yn fanylach. O'r 10 cymuned yng Nghymru y mae ailfandio yn effeithio arnynt fwyaf, mae pump yng Nghaerdydd, sef Glan yr Afon, gyda 93 y cant o gartrefi yn symud i fyny o leiaf un band; Cathays, gyda 91 y cant; Adamsdown, gyda 90 y cant; Grangetown gydag 87 y cant; a Threganna gydag 86 y cant. Mae hyn ynddo'i hun gyfwerth â bron 25,000 o gartrefi. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o honom yma—a gwyddom y byddai gennyl gynulleidfa ddethol, ond o safon, heddiw—yn gyfarwydd â Chaerdydd a bydd y wardiau ar y rhestr hon yn eu taro ar unwaith. Nid yr ardaloedd deniadol ydynt, ond ardaloedd yng nghanol y ddinas a rhai o'r cymunedau tlofa yng Nghaerdydd. Er enghraifft, mae Adamsdown yn ardal â dylanwad fel ward Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Sylweddolaf nad yw hyn, ynddo'i hun, yn effeithio ar gyfanswm y dreth a dderbynir yng Nghaerdydd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n effeithio ar y cydbwysedd o ran tarddiad yr arian. O gofio bod dau gartref

greater burden as part of the total.

I take this opportunity to welcome the Minister's attempt to limit the impact on the households that have moved up more than one band, and to welcome the fact that the money for the transitional damping mechanism will be additional money from the Assembly and not taken from the revenue support grant settlement. However, this will simply mean that the pain is spread over a longer period, and it will eventually kick in.

I turn to the problems for Cardiff caused by the local government settlement as a whole. Cardiff will receive the lowest increase in funding of only 3.5 per cent. This, again, could have been worse, because the new formula, which, by a terrible coincidence, is being introduced at the same time as rebanding, would, if it were implemented fully and accurately, give Cardiff only a 2.2 per cent increase this year. The Minister has introduced the 3.5 per cent floor this year, but one must assume that the full impact of the new formula will be felt in future years. The measure to alleviate the effect on Cardiff is not popular with other councils, as they have to provide the funding. However, 3.5 per cent does not cover inflationary pressures, combined with the additional responsibilities being imposed on the council by the Assembly. For instance, according to the WLGA estimate, an additional £47 million is needed across Wales to pay for the teachers' workload agreement, yet the Labour Assembly Government is allocating only £25 million extra, which is roughly half of what is needed. The figure for Cardiff is £2.4 million, so, on a pro rata basis, this means that it is likely to spend roughly twice as much in practice on this new legal responsibility. In addition, several other specific grants that go to local authorities are being frozen next year, such as grants for education support and training funding. That is a real-terms cut in all those funds, and councils will have to make up the difference between real cost and income.

o bob tri yng Nghaerdydd wedi symud i fyny un band neu fwy, mae'r cartrefi hyn yn siŵr o orfod ysgwyddo mwy o faich fel rhan o'r cyfanswm.

Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu ymgais y Gweinidog i gyfyngu ar yr effaith ar y cartrefi sydd wedi symud i fyny mwy nag un band, ac i groesawu'r ffaith y bydd yr arian ar gyfer y dull dampio trosiannol yn arian ychwanegol o'r Cynulliad ac na fydd yn dod o setliad y grant cynnal refeniw. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn golygu bod y boen yn cael ei hymestyn dros gyfnod hwy, ond daw yn amlwg yn y pen draw.

Trof at broblemau Caerdydd a achoswyd gan y setliad llywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol. Caerdydd fydd yn cael y cynnydd lleiaf mewn arian, sef dim ond 3.5 y cant. Unwaith eto, gallai hyn fod wedi bod yn waeth oherwydd byddai'r fformiwlau newydd, a gaiff ei chyflwyno, drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad ofnadwy, ar yr un pryd â'r broses aifandio, yn rhoi cynnydd o dim ond 2.2 y cant i Gaerdydd eleni, pe câi ei gweithredu'n llawn ac yn gywir. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno'r terfyn isaf o 3.5 y cant eleni, ond rhaid rhagdybio y caiff effaith lawn y fformiwlau newydd ei theimlo yn y dyfodol. Nid yw'r mesur i leihau'r effaith ar Gaerdydd yn boblogaidd ymhlið cynghorau eraill, am mai hwy sy'n gorfol rhoi'r arian. Fodd bynnag, nid yw 3.5 y cant yn ddigon i gwmpasu'r pwysau o ran chwyddiant, ynghyd â'r cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol a osodir ar y cyngor gan y Cynulliad. Er enghraift, yn ôl amcangyfrif CLILC, mae angen £47 miliwn ychwanegol ledled Cymru i dalu am y cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, ond dim ond £25 miliwn ychwanegol y mae Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn ei ddyrannu, sef tua hanner yr hyn sydd ei angen. Y ffigur ar gyfer Caerdydd yw £2.4 miliwn, ac felly, ar sail pro rata, mae hyn yn golygu ei fod yn debygol o wario tua dwywaith y swm hwnnw yn ymarferol ar y cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol newydd hwn. Yn ogystal, caiff nifer o grantiau penodol eraill sy'n mynd i awdurdodau lleol eu rhewi y flwyddyn nesaf, megis arian ar gyfer grantiau cynnal addysg a hyfforddiant. Mae hynny'n doriad mewn termau real yn yr holl gronfeydd hynny, a bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau dalu'r

gwahaniaeth rhwng y gost wirioneddol a'r incwm.

5.30 p.m.

The reason for Cardiff's having such a poor settlement is a change in the standard spending assessment for personal social services, and, although the concept of the new formula was first mooted several years ago, it is recent changes to the formula that have hit Cardiff so hard. As a result, Cardiff will lose £4.2 million in revenue support grant. Can that be right? Cardiff's social services department received one of the worst social services inspection reports in Wales, and it is now grappling with attempted improvements. It also has a history of overspending, despite having a high staff-vacancy level. In order to improve, it must fill those vacancies, and that was one of the issues of concern in the inspector's report. However, filling vacancies costs money, so an overspent service faces enforced extra costs to improve, yet receives a major budget cut from the Assembly. Surely, there is something wrong here?

Y rheswm dros setliad gwael Caerdydd yw newid yn yr asesiad o wariant safonol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol personol, ac, er i'r cysyniad o fformiwlau newydd gael ei grybwyllyn gyntaf sawl blwyddyn yn ôl, newidiadau diweddar i'r fformiwlau sydd wedi bwrw Caerdydd mor galed. O ganlyniad, bydd Caerdydd yn colli £4.2 miliwn yn y grant cynnal refeniw. A all hynny fod yn iawn? Cafodd adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Caerdydd un o'r adroddiadau arolygu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gwaethaf yng Nghymru, ac mae bellach yn bwrw ati i geisio gwella. Mae ganddi hanes o orwario hefyd, er gwaethaf y ffaith bod nifer o swyddi gwag ganddi. Er mwyn gwella, rhaid iddi lenwi'r swyddi hynny, a dyna un o'r materion a oedd yn peri pryder yn adroddiad yr arolygydd. Fodd bynnag, mae llenwi swyddi yn costio arian, ac felly mae gwasanaeth sydd wedi gorwario yn wynebu costau ychwanegol gorfodol i wella, ond eto yn cael toriad mawr yn y gyllideb gan y Cynulliad. Rhaid bod rhywbeth o'i le yma.

Council tax payers in Cardiff are used to large council tax increases. Since the formation of the new council in 1996, council tax has risen by 154 per cent. In 1997, it rose by 15.8 per cent, and in 1998 it rose by 12.3 per cent, but in 1999 it rose by only 3.62 per cent—guess what: it was an election year. In 2000, it rose by 8.9 per cent, in 2001 by 9.7 per cent, in 2002 by 8.7 per cent, and in 2003 by 11.95 per cent. This year, there has once again been a low increase of 2.58 per cent, as it was another election year. However, that low increase came at the expense of a big raid on reserves, and, consequently, they are now low and cannot be used to cushion the blow of the impending council tax increases.

It is true that Cardiff has also been hit by other events in recent years, one of which was the 2001 census, which the council belatedly challenged. It had some success in that challenge, but I am still convinced, as

Mae talwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd yn gyfarwydd â chodiadau mawr yn y dreth gyngor. Ers sefydlu'r cyngor newydd yn 1996, mae'r dreth gyngor wedi codi 154 y cant. Yn 1997, cododd 15.8 y cant, ac yn 1998 cododd 12.3 y cant, ond yn 1999 cododd dim ond 3.62 y cant—a hynny'n flwyddyn etholiad, wrth gwrs. Yn 2000, cododd 8.9 y cant, yn 2001 cododd 9.7 y cant, yn 2002 cododd 8.7 y cant, ac yn 2003 cododd 11.95 y cant. Eleni, bu cynnydd isel unwaith eto o 2.58 y cant, am mai blwyddyn etholiad arall ydoedd. Fodd bynnag, defnyddiwyd llawer o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn i allu sicrhau'r cynnydd isel hwnnw, ac, o ganlyniad, maent bellach yn isel ac ni ellir eu defnyddio i leihau effaith y codiadau yn y dreth gyngor a gyflwynir maes o law.

Mae'n wir bod digwyddiadau eraill mewn blynnyddoedd diweddar wedi effeithio ar Gaerdydd hefyd. Un o'r digwyddiadau hynny oedd cyfrifiad 2001, a heriwyd gan y cyngor yn rhy hwyr. Cafodd rywfaint o lwyddiant yn

are many others, that the census under-represents the population of Cardiff. Over these years, the proportion of Cardiff's revenue budget, funded by council tax, has risen from 17 per cent in 1997 to 21 per cent now. That is the manifestation of the serial funding problems faced in Cardiff, which will worsen significantly next year.

The Minister is right to raise the profile of council tax benefit but, until you can ensure 100 per cent take-up of it, council tax will remain unfair. We heard earlier this afternoon of an astonishingly low 63 per cent take-up among pensioners. This is specifically not a debate on local income tax, but I cannot avoid pointing out that the people who will suffer most from the massive council tax increases that seem likely for Cardiff will be the poorest in our community, and they are often the oldest.

I refer back to the First Minister's comments yesterday—which he can see if he reads the Record—and remind him that, even if Cardiff County Council were to go for a standstill budget next year, which will mean significant cuts in services such as education and social services, there will be council tax increases in the order of 10 to 20 per cent because of rebanding and because of the loss of standard spending assessment grant for social services. If it tries to make up the money lost from the social services grant by increasing council tax, the gearing effect, which comes into play because councils raise only one fifth of their funding from council tax, of the small percentage increases in revenue raised will mean council tax increases that are five times greater.

I ask the Minister—and I am aware that Brian Gibbons is standing in for Sue Essex; I am grateful to him for doing so and understand why the Minister is unable to be here, and I ask him to relay this to the Minister—to look again at the situation, even at this late stage. Will she reconsider the latest changes to the SSA formula or, at the very least, consider long-term rather than

yr her honno, ond yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig o hyd, fel y mae llawer o bobl eraill, bod y cyfrifiad yn tangynrychioli poblogaeth Caerdydd. Dros y blynnyddoedd hyn, mae cyfran cyllideb refeniw Caerdydd, a ariennir gan y dreth gyngor, wedi codi o 17 y cant yn 1997 i 21 y cant erbyn hyn. Dengys hynny'r problemau ariannu cyfresol a wynebir yng Nghaerdydd, a fydd yn gwaethygù'n sylweddol y flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae'n briodol i'r Gweinidog godi proffil budd-dal y dreth gyngor ond, hyd nes y gallwch sicrhau y bydd pawb sy'n gymwys yn manteisio arno, bydd y dreth gyngor yn parhau i fod yn annheg. Clywsom yn gynharach y prynhawn yma mai dim ond 63 y cant o bensiynwyr sy'n manteisio arno, sy'n ffigur rhyfeddol o isel. Nid dadl ar dreth incwm leol yw hon yn benodol, ond ni allaf beidio â nodi mai'r bobl a fydd yn dioddef fwyaf yn sgîl y codiadau sylweddol yn y dreth gyngor y mae Caerdydd yn debygol o'u hwynebu fydd y rhai tlotaf yn ein cymuned, sef y rhai hynaf yn aml.

Cyfeiriaf yn ôl at sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog ddoe—gall eu gweld os bydd yn darllen y Cofnod—gan ei atgoffa, hyd yn oed os bydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn dewis cyllideb sefydlog y flwyddyn nesaf, a fydd yn golygu toriadau sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau megis addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, bydd codiadau yn y dreth gyngor o ryw 10 i 20 y cant oherwydd aifandio ac am ei fod wedi colli grant yr asesiad o wariant safonol i wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Os bydd yn ceisio gwneud iawn am yr arian a gaiff ei golli o'r grant gwasanaethau cymdeithasol drwy godi'r dreth gyngor, bydd yr effaith gerio, sy'n berthnasol am mai dim ond pumed o arian cynhorau sy'n dod o'r dreth gyngor, o'r codiadau canran bach yn y refeniw a godir yn golygu codiadau yn y dreth gyngor sy'n bum gwaith yn fwy.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog—a gwn fod Brian Gibbons yn dirprwyo dros Sue Essex; yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo am wneud hynny a deallaf pam na all y Gweinidog fod yma, a gofynnaf iddo gyfleu hyn i'r Gweinidog—ailystyried y sefyllfa, hyd yn oed mor hwyr â hyn. A fydd yn ailystyried y newidiadau diweddaraf i fformiwla'r asesiad o wariant safonol neu, o leiaf, yn ystyried mesurau

short-term measures to alleviate the impact on Cardiff and abandon plans to introduce rebanding next year? After all, the previous Minister, Edwina Hart, abandoned her first attempt at this and went back to the drawing board. It now makes great sense to wait for the final outcome of the UK Government's review of local taxation, which is due at the end of next year. The Government may introduce significant changes to council tax at that time, especially now that it has been able to see the figures for rebanding in Wales. I know that we like to run ahead of England on policy initiatives, but rebanding is certainly one issue where we do not need to be blazing a trail.

hirdymor yn hytrach na mesurau byrdymor i leihau'r effaith ar Gaerdydd a rhoi'r gorau i'r cynlluniau i gyflwyno bandiau newydd y flwyddyn nesaf? Wedi'r cyfan, rhoddodd y cyn-Weinidog, Edwina Hart, y gorau i'w hymgais gyntaf i wneud hyn a dechreuodd eto. Gwna synnwyr yn awr i aros am ganlyniad terfynol adolygiad Llywodraeth y DU o drethiant lleol, y bwriedir ei gyhoeddi ddiwedd y flwyddyn nesaf. Efallai y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno newidiadau sylwedol i'r dreth gyngor bryd hynny, yn enwedig yn awr ei bod wedi gallu gweld y ffigurau ar gyfer ailfandio yng Nghymru. Gwn ein bod yn hoffi bod ar y blaen i Loegr o ran mentrau polisi, ond yn sicr mae ailfandio yn fater lle nad oes angen inni fod yn arloesol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I thank Jenny Randerson for opening this short debate. It is an extremely important subject, and far-reaching in its impact. In Cardiff, for every house that has moved down a band in the revaluation process, 60 properties will move up. That is the impact facing thousands of people living in the capital city. The Government must recognise the huge financial hardship that that will cause. Together with a poor budget settlement, as Jenny Randerson outlined in her speech, it will no doubt lead to massive tax increases of at least between 10 and 20 per cent. That will hit elderly people. My grandparents live in one of those leafy suburbs—Whitchurch in north Cardiff—where 70 per cent of properties are being moved up at least one band. That area of Cardiff is populated by elderly people, retired people and people on modest incomes. This will hit a huge number of people. The suffering will not only be felt by the people in Cardiff—it will also be extended to Labour MPs at the next election.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Diolchaf i Jenny Randerson am agor y ddadl fer hon. Mae'n bwnc pwysig iawn, ac mae ei effaith yn eang. Yng Nghaerdydd, ar gyfer pob tŷ sydd wedi symud i lawr band yn y broses ailbrisio, bydd 60 o gartrefi yn symud i fyny. Dyna'r effaith sy'n wynebu miloedd o bobl sy'n byw yn y brifddinas. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod y caledi ariannol mawr y bydd hynny'n ei achosi. Ynghyd â'r setliad cyllidebol gwael, fel yr amlinelloedd Jenny Randerson yn ei haraith, yn ddi-au bydd yn arwain at godiadau treth enfawr, rhwng 10 ac 20 y cant o leiaf. Bydd hynny'n ergyd i bobl oedrannus. Mae fy mam-gu a'm tad-cu yn byw yn un o'r ardaloedd deniadol hynny—yr Eglwys Newydd yng ngogledd Caerdydd—lle y mae 70 y cant o'r cartrefi yn symud i fyny o leiaf un band. Pobl oedrannus, pobl sydd wedi ymddeol a phobl ar incwm cymedrol sy'n byw yn yr ardal honno o Gaerdydd. Bydd hyn yn effeithio ar nifer fawr o bobl. Nid dim ond pobl Caerdydd a fydd yn dioddef—bydd ASau Llafur yn dioddef hefyd yn yr etholiad nesaf.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I thank Jenny for allowing me to contribute to this debate. I am afraid that the old chestnut of it is the council's responsibility to set council tax, is a Liberal Democrat chestnut that it has used many times to attack Labour over the past few years. The council tax system is not perfect, and we all recognise that. It is important to point out that some of the alternatives, such as the Liberal Democrats'

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolchaf i Jenny am ganiatáu imi gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Mae arnaf ofn mai dadl y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yw'r un a ddefnyddiwyd ganddynt sawl gwaith i ymosod ar Lafur dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, sef mai cyfrifoldeb y cyngor yw pennu'r dreth gyngor. Nid yw system y dreth gyngor yn berffaith, ac mae pob un ohonom yn cydnabod hynny. Mae'n bwysig nodi y

plans for a local income tax, would also hit Cardiff's hardworking families. A two parent family on average earnings in Cardiff could be some £40 a month worse off. We must look at the current system and ensure that two out of every three elderly people who are eligible for council tax benefit but who do not currently claim it receive the right to have their council tax burden reduced or eliminated. We must also consider other people who should be entitled to reductions due to low income.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have given permission for a Deputy Minister to reply. I call on Brian Gibbons, the Deputy Minister for Transport.

**The Deputy Minister for Transport (Brian Gibbons):** I extend the Minister's apology for not being able to respond personally to the debate. Members will know about the personal circumstances. I listened carefully to what Jenny had to say, because council tax is never far from my mind. My local authority has the second highest council tax in Wales. Whatever problems you have in Cardiff, the council tax payers in Neath Port Talbot, Merthyr Tydfil, Blaenau Gwent, Rhondda Cynon Taf—the poorest communities in Wales—have those problems in spades. So, that is the context in which we must consider this subject. We talk about the hoary old chestnuts, and we must acknowledge that the local government settlement sets the context in which any council tax level is set. However, ultimately, this is part of local democracy and local public accountability, and it is the local authority that sets the council tax for its area. It is with that in mind that Sue Essex, in delivering her local government settlement, has tried to ensure that Cardiff, along with every other local authority, will have a minimum increase to ensure that it is able to respond to the pressures of the next financial year.

5.40 p.m.

If the Assembly Government had allowed the formula in Cardiff and other local authorities

byddai rhai o'r dewisiadau amgen, megis cynlluniau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gael treth incwm leol, yn effeithio ar deuluoedd gweithgar yng Nghaerdydd hefyd. Gallai teulu â dau riant gyda lefel enillion gyfartalog yng Nghaerdydd fod tua £40 y mis yn waeth eu byd. Rhaid inni edrych ar y system bresennol a sicrhau bod baich treth gyngor dau o bob tri pherson oedrannus sy'n gymwys i gael budd-dal y dreth gyngor ond nad ydnt yn ei hawlio ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei leihau neu ei ddileu. Rhaid inni ystyried pobl eraill hefyd y dylai fod ganddynt hawl i gael gostyngiadau oherwydd incwm isel.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi rhoi caniatâd i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ymateb. Galwaf ar Brian Gibbons, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Drafnidiaeth.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Drafnidiaeth (Brian Gibbons):** Ymddiheuraf ar ran y Gweinidog am beidio â gallu ymateb yn bersonol i'r ddadl. Bydd yr Aelodau yn gwybod am yr amgylchiadau personol. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Jenny, am fod y dreth gyngor ar flaen fy meddwl o hyd. Mae gan fy awdurdod lleol y dreth gyngor uchaf ond un yng Nghymru. Pa broblemau bynnag sydd gennych yng Nghaerdydd, mae gan dalwyr y dreth gyngor yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot, Merthyr Tudful, Blaenau Gwent, Rhondda Cynon Taf—y cymunedau tlota yng Nghymru—broblemau dirifedi o'r fath. Felly, rhaid inni ystyried y pwnc hwn yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Siaradwn am yr un hen ddadleuon, a rhaid inni gydnabod bod y setliad llywodraeth leol yn gosod y cyd-destun ar gyfer pennu unrhyw dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, mae hyn yn rhan o ddemocratiaeth leol ac atebolwydd cyhoeddus lleol, a'r awdurdod lleol sy'n pennu'r dreth gyngor ar gyfer ei ardal. Gan gofio hynny mae Sue Essex, wrth gyflwyno ei setliad llywodraeth leol, wedi ceisio sicrhau y caiff Caerdydd, ynghyd â phob awdurdod lleol arall, yr isafswm cynnydd er mwyn sicrhau y gall ymateb i bwysau'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

Pe bai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi caniatáu i'r fformiwla yng Nghaerdydd ac

to continue as before, they would only have had an increase of around 2 per cent in the revenue support grant. However, the Minister has taken steps to increase that figure to 3.5 per cent, which means an additional £4 million for Cardiff. That will result in a record level of £313 million in revenue support grant being available from the Assembly Government to Cardiff—virtually £1,000 for every man, woman and child; £994 to be exact. In addition to that, there are specific grants, which Jenny mentioned, in relation to learning disabilities strategies, extra support for carer strategies, for the education and health of young people, for sustainable waste programmes and through Communities First, and there is extra money for community regeneration.

In addition, Cardiff County Council will receive a further £3 million as a reward for the performance targets that it has agreed with the Assembly Government and there is also £1.4 million to tackle problems of deprivation in the poorer areas of the city. The Minister has asked all councils to act reasonably when setting their budgets and to keep council tax payers in mind. Cardiff is no exception. Indeed, Cardiff is in a better position than most authorities when setting council tax. If the council works within reasonable limits, it is estimated that there need be little change in council tax for households that stay within the same band, and the effect of a band movement in most cases should be relatively moderate.

We recognise the difficulty, as Jenny highlighted, for those people on low-fixed incomes, particularly elderly people. We, therefore, welcome the fact that all households where there are elderly people will receive £200 to £300 extra as part of the winter fuel allowance. Linked to that is the extra £100 that the Chancellor awarded to people over 70 to meet the additional cost of living, with specific reference to council tax increases. We are also concerned that the level of take-up for council tax benefit is not high enough and, hopefully, the Department for Work and Pensions's reminder, issued with the winter fuel payments, will alert

awdurdodau lleol eraill barhau fel o'r blaen, dim ond cynnydd o ryw 2 y cant yn y grant cynnal refeniw y byddent wedi'i gael. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cymryd camau i gynyddu'r ffigur hwnnw i 3.5 y cant, sef £4 miliwn ychwanegol i Gaerdydd. Bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd £313 miliwn mewn grant cynnal refeniw ar gael gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i Gaerdydd, sef y lefel uchaf erioed—bron £1,000 i bob dyn, menyw a phlentyn; £994 i fod yn fanwl gywir. Yn ogystal, mae grantiau penodol, a grybwyllywyd gan Jenny, mewn perthynas â strategaethau anableddau dysgu, strategaethau cymorth ychwanegol i ofalwyr, o ran addysg ac iechyd pobl ifanc, ar gyfer rhagleni gwastraff cynaliadwy a thrwy Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac mae arian ychwanegol i adfywio cymunedau.

Yn ogystal, bydd Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn cael £3 miliwn pellach fel gwobr am y targedau perfformiad y mae wedi cytuno arnynt gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn ogystal ag £1.4 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â phroblemau amddifadedd yn ardaloedd tloaf y ddinas. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn i bob cyngor weithredu'n rhesymol wrth bennu eu cylidebau a chadw talwyr y dreth gyngor mewn cof. Nid yw Caerdydd yn eithriad i hynny. Mewn gwirionedd, mae Caerdydd mewn gwell sefyllfa na'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau wrth bennu'r dreth gyngor. Os bydd y cyngor yn gweithio o fewn terfynau rhesymol, amcangyfrifir na fydd angen llawer o newid yn y dreth gyngor i'r cartrefi hynny sy'n aros o fewn yr un band, a dylai effaith symud band fod yn gymharol fach yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion.

Cydnabyddwn yr anhawster, fel yr amlygodd Jenny, i'r bobl hynny ar incwm sefydlog isel, yn enwedig pobl oedrannus. Felly, croesawn y ffaith y bydd pob cartref lle y mae pobl oedrannus yn cael £200 i £300 yn ychwanegol fel rhan o'r lwfans tanwydd gaeaf. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny mae'r £100 ychwanegol a roddodd y Canghellor i bobl dros 70 oed i dalu'r gost o fyw ychwanegol, gan gyfeirio'n benodol at godiadau yn y dreth gyngor. Pryderwn hefyd nad yw nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar fudd-dal y dreth gyngor yn ddigon uchel a gobeithiwn y bydd nodyn atgoffa'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, a anfonwyd gyda'r taliadau tanwydd gaeaf,

people to that. However, there is only one way of fully addressing this issue, namely reforming the council tax benefit. Along with Nick Raynsford at the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, we have impressed upon the Department for Work and Pensions the need for reform. Members will recall the Minister's written submission in the balance of funding review, emphasising that point.

We also look forward to Sir Michael Lyons's work on the balance of funding. The Minister indicated earlier her flexible approach in terms of listening to Members' contributions on council tax and ensuring that Sir Michael Lyons's work will be informed by a broad range of opinions expressed in the Assembly.

In the meantime, the Minister has asked officials to set up a working group to look at how we can improve take-up of council tax benefit. We are pleased that all local authorities have agreed to take part, along with the Department for Work and Pensions and other agencies, in a special meeting on 15 December to discuss this matter. There are some good examples of work that local authorities are doing throughout Wales to improve the take-up of council tax and housing benefits.

We must use the conference to work with DWP and other agencies to encourage the wider dissemination of best practice so that we can decrease the burden of high council taxes or, if the benefit take-up is fully achieved, even eliminate that burden. There has been a legal requirement on the Valuation Office Agency to revalue all households across Wales. In Cardiff, a high level of households will move up one band. The First Minister has pointed out that, in many cases, the delay in undertaking the revaluation exercise has contributed to this steep increase. Recognising the special pressures on these households, a number of issues need to be taken into account in an attempt to mitigate the effects. The Assembly Government will provide around £2.9 million to Cardiff to ensure that no property in the authority moves up more than one band.

yn hysbysu pobl am hynny. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un ffordd sydd o ymdrin â'r mater hwn yn llawn, sef diwygio budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Ar y cyd â Nick Raynsford yn Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yr ydym wedi pwysio ar yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau am yr angen i ddiwygio'r budd-dal. Bydd Aelodau yn cofio cyflwyniad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog yn yr adolygiad o gydbwysedd cyllid, a bwysleisiodd y pwynt hwnnw.

Edrychwn ymlaen at waith Syr Michael Lyons ar gydbwysedd cyllid hefyd. Nododd y Gweinidog yn gynharach ei hymagwedd hyblyg o ran gwrando ar gyfraniadau Aelodau ar y dreth gyngor a sicrhau y bydd gwaith Syr Michael Lyons yn seiliedig ar amrywiaeth eang o sylwadau a fynegwyd yn y Cynulliad.

Yn y cyfamser, mae'r Gweinidog wedi gofyn i swyddogion sefydlu gweithgor i ystyried sut y gallwn gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar fudd-dal y dreth gyngor. Yr ydym yn falch bod pob awdurdod lleol wedi cytuno i gymryd rhan, ynghyd â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ac asiantaethau eraill, mewn cyfarfod arbennig ar 15 Rhagfyr i drafod y mater hwn. Mae enghreifftiau da o waith y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei wneud ledled Cymru i gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n manteisio ar fudd-dal y dreth gyngor a budd-dal tai.

Rhaid inni ddefnyddio'r gynhadledd i gydwethio â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ac asiantaethau eraill i annog y broses o ledaenu arfer gorau yn ehangach er mwyn inni allu lleihau baich trethi cyngor uchel neu dileu'r baich hwnnw hyd yn oed, os bydd pawb sy'n gymwys yn manteisio ar y budd-dal. Bu gofyniad cyfreithiol ar Asiantaeth y Swyddfa Brisio i ailbrisio pob cartref yng Nghymru. Yng Nghaerdydd, bydd nifer fawr o gartrefi yn symud i fyny un band. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi nodi, yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, bod yr oedi cyn cynnal yr ymarfer ailbrisio wedi cyfrannu at y cynnydd mawr hwn. Gan gydnabod y pwysau arbennig ar y cartrefi hyn, mae angen ystyried nifer o faterion er mwyn ceisio lleihau'r effeithiau. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi tua £2.9 miliwn i Gaerdydd er mwyn sicrhau nad oes unrhyw eiddo yn yr awdurdod yn symud

Revisions to the population figures will also mean an extra £610,000 for Cardiff as part of that readjustment.

Following discussions between the Welsh Assembly Government and the Chancellor, Gordon Brown has introduced a new scheme which provides an additional £13 million to local authorities outside the revenue support grant. Where there is business growth, we will allow local authorities to retain a proportion of its business rate income to support its own expenditure. We are not in a position to say how much each individual local authority will retain under the Chancellor's agreement, but Cardiff, as one of Wales's major business centres, will benefit to a large extent, reflecting its business base.

To conclude, there is no firm correlation between local government settlements and council tax increases. Jenny made it clear in her contribution that the level of council tax increases reflects political priority and the context in which they are taking place. Last year, as Jenny said, Cardiff had one of the lowest council tax increases, despite the fact that its settlement was also below the Welsh average. In the previous year, Cardiff had one of the highest settlements and one of the highest council tax increases. Therefore, it is clear that the level of council tax settlements will ultimately depend on the political decision of the parties in control in Cardiff.

i fyny mwy nag un band. Bydd diwygiadau i'r ffigurau poblogaeth hefyd yn golygu £610,000 ychwanegol i Gaerdydd fel rhan o'r broses ailaddasu honno.

Yn dilyn trafodaethau rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Canhellor, mae Gordon Brown wedi cyflwyno cynllun newydd sy'n rhoi £13 miliwn ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol y tu allan i'r grant cynnal refeniw. Lle y ceir twf busnes, byddwn yn caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol gadw cyfran o'u hincwm ardrothi busnes i gefnogi eu gwariant eu hunain. Nid ydym mewn sefyllfa i allu dweud faint y bydd pob awdurdod lleol unigol yn ei gadw o dan gytundeb y Canhellor, ond bydd Caerdydd, fel un o brif ganolfannau busnes Cymru, yn elwa i raddau helaeth, gan adlewyrchu ei sail busnes.

I gloi, nid oes cydberthynas gadarn rhwng setliadau llywodraeth leol a chodiadau yn y dreth gyngor. Eglurodd Jenny yn ei chyfraniad fod y lefel o godiadau yn y dreth gyngor yn adlewyrchu blaenoriaeth wleidyddol a'r cyd-destun lle y maent yn digwydd. Y llynedd, fel y dywedodd Jenny, yr oedd gan Caerdydd un o'r codiadau isaf yn y dreth gyngor, er gwaethaf y ffait bod ei setliad yn llawer is na chyfartaledd Cymru hefyd. Yn y flwyddyn cyn hynny, cafodd Caerdydd un o'r setliadau uchaf ac un o'r codiadau uchaf yn y dreth gyngor. Felly, mae'n amlwg y bydd lefel setliadau'r dreth gyngor yn dibynnu ar benderfyniad gwleidyddol y pleidiau mewn grym yng Nghaerdydd yn y pen draw.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's business to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.47 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.47 p.m.*

#### Aelodau a'u Pleidiadau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)

Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody-Kneafsey, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

17/11/2004