



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Mawrth 17 Gorffennaf 2001**

**Tuesday 17 July 2001**

## Cynnwys Contents

- 4 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
*Statement by the Presiding Officer*
- 4 Ethol Aelodau Tri Phwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio  
*Election of Members to Three Planning Decision Committees*
- 9 Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru  
*Questions to the First Minister*
- 28 Datganiad ar Adroddiad McKenzie  
*Statement on the McKenzie Report*
- 39 Datganiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus  
*Statement on Diversity of Public Appointments*
- 48 Datganiad Busnes  
*Business Statement*
- 50 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 50 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
*Composite Motion: Approval of Orders*
- 53 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001  
a Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyr) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001  
*Approval of the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001  
and the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales)  
Regulations 2001*
- 63 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*
- 64 Cynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol  
*The Voluntary Sector Scheme*
- 78 Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar Adroddiad Macpherson ar Ymchwiliad Stephen  
Lawrence  
*The Committee on Equality of Opportunity's Report on the Macpherson Report on the  
Stephen Lawrence Inquiry*
- 95 Diwygio'r Cyfarwyddyd ar Gwestiynau'r Cynulliad  
*Revision of the Guidance on Assembly Questions*
- 96 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*
- 97 Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad  
*The New Assembly Building*

115 Cynnig Trefniadol  
*Procedural Motion*

116 Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad: Parhad  
*The New Assembly Building: Continued*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefaryd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyflwyno cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod yn ymwneud ag adeilad newydd y Cynulliad. Dosbarthwyd y cynnig i'r Aelodau tua awr yn ôl. Oherwydd pwysigrwydd y cynnig i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a chan fod toriad yr haf yn dechrau yr wythnos nesaf, byddaf yn caniatáu cynnig trefniadol i gynnig cynnal y ddadl y prynhawn yma, er mwyn i'r Cynulliad Cenedlathol gael cyfle i ystyried y mater difrifol hwn cyn gynted ag sydd yn bosibl.

Os caiff y cynnig trefniadol ei dderbyn, bydd yn caniatáu i'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno'r cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod fel yr eitem olaf ar yr agenda heddiw.

Er hwylustod i'r Aelodau, gofynnaf iddynt gyflwyno unrhyw welliannau i'r cynnig erbyn 4.30 p.m. fan bellaf. Byddai hynny'n ein galluogi i drafod y cynnig ac unrhyw welliannau priodol, er ar fyr rybudd. Caiff unrhyw welliannau a gyflwynir eu cylchredeg ar e-bost a bydd copi caled hefyd ar gael yn y Siambr.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Assembly Government has tabled a no-named day motion relating to the new Assembly building. The motion was distributed to Members about an hour ago. Due to the importance of the motion to all Assembly Members, and as the summer recess starts next week, I will allow a procedural motion proposing that the debate be held this afternoon, so that the National Assembly has an opportunity to consider this serious issue as soon as possible.

If the procedural motion is accepted, it will allow the Government to propose the no-named day motion as the last item on today's agenda.

For Members' convenience, I ask them to table any amendments to the motion by 4.30 p.m. at the latest. That would enable us to discuss the motion and any appropriate amendments, albeit at short notice. Any amendments that are tabled will be circulated by e-mail, and a hard copy will also be available in the Chamber.

**Ethol Aelodau Tri Phwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio  
Election of Members to Three Planning Decision Committees**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly resolves*

*1. That a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee 2001/4 be established, in accordance with Standing Order No. 35 to discharge the functions of the Assembly under sections 77(1) and 78(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion and that the Assembly's functions in that respect be delegated to that Committee;*

*2. That the members of that Committee be:*

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu*

*1. Bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio 2001/4, yn cael ei sefydlu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan adran 77 (1) a 78 (1) Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn y cyswllt hwnnw yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw;*

*2. Mai aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw fydd:*

*Richard Edwards (Chair), Mick Bates, John Griffiths and Rhodri Glyn Thomas.*

*Richard Edwards (Cadeirydd), Mick Bates, John Griffiths a Rhodri Glyn Thomas.*

*3. That the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 35.16 or on 31 August 2001 whichever is the earlier.*

*3. Y bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35.16 neu ar 31 Awst 2001, p'un bynnag sy'n dod gyntaf.*

*4. That if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Secretary.*

*4. Os bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyrau penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r materion a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna yn yr achos hwnnw dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â mater o'r fath, i Brif Weinidog Cymru.*

### **Schedule**

### **Atodlen**

*Called in application by Marks and Spencer Plc for proposed extension to the existing Marks and Spencer retail store on land west of existing Tesco Store, Culverhouse Cross, Ely, Cardiff.*

*Cais wedi'i alw i mewn gan Marks and Spencer Plc ar gyfer estyniad arfaethedig i siop bresennol Marks and Spencer ar dir i'r gorllewin o siop Tesco, Croes Cwrlwys, Trelai, Caerdydd*

*Planning appeal by Cardiff Community Health Care NHS Trust for outline planning permission for mixed use development at Whitchurch Hospital, Park Road, Cardiff including hospital, residential, leisure, community and retail uses with playing fields. (NDM752)*

*Apêl cynllunio gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Cymunedol Caerdydd am ganiatâd cynllunio bras ar gyfer datblygiad defnydd cymysg yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd, Park Road, Caerdydd gan gynnwys defnydd ysbyty, preswyl, hamdden, cymunedol a manwerthu gyda chaeau chwarae. (NDM752)*

*I propose that*

*Cynigiau fod*

*the National Assembly resolves*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu*

*1. That a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee 2001/5 be established, in accordance with Standing Order No. 35 to discharge the functions of the Assembly under section 78(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 in respect of the matters identified in the schedule to this motion (together, in the case of the third matter identified in the schedule, with the functions of the Assembly under section 20(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 and that the Assembly's functions in those respects be delegated to that Committee;*

*1. Bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio 2001/5, yn cael ei sefydlu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan adran 78 (1) Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr Atodlen i'r cynnig hwn (ynghyd â swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad, mewn perthynas â'r trydydd mater a nodir yn yr atodlen, o dan adran 20(1) Deddf Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig ac Ardaloedd Cadwraeth) 1990), a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn y cyswllt hwnnw yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw;*

*2. That the members of that Committee be: Sue Essex (Chair), David Davies, Geraint*

*2. Mai aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw fydd: Sue Essex (Cadeirydd), David Davies, Geraint*

*Davies and Karen Sinclair.*

3. *That the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 35.16 or on 30 September 2001 whichever is the earlier.*

4. *That if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Secretary.*

### **Schedule**

*Planning appeal by National Windpower Limited for proposed windfarm development comprising 17 wind turbine generators, access tracks, substation and ancillary equipment on land at Jordanston, Fishguard, Pembrokeshire.*

*Planning appeal by Mr P Davies, Eurogate Project Limited, for proposed development of a new millennium village settlement at Brynglas, St Brides, Wentloog, Newport.*

*Planning appeal and listed building consent appeal by BT Cellnet Limited for proposed installation of telecommunications equipment cabins with aerials on land at Empire House, 54-57 Mountstuart Square, Butetown, Cardiff. (NDM753)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly resolves*

1. *That a committee, to be known as Planning Decision Committee 2001/6 be established, in accordance with Standing Order No. 35 to discharge the functions of the Assembly under section 77(1) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion and that the Assembly's functions in that respect be delegated to that Committee;*

2. *That the members of that Committee be: David Davies, John Griffiths, Tom*

*Davies a Karen Sinclair.*

3. *Y bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35.16 neu ar 30 Medi 2001, p'un bynnag sy'n dod gyntaf.*

4. *Os bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyrau penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r materion a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna yn yr achos hwnnw dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir yn mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â mater o'r fath, i Brif Weinidog Cymru.*

### **Atodlen**

*Apêl cynllunio gan National Windpower Limited ar gyfer cynllun i ddatblygu fferm wynt yn cynnwys 17 cynhyrchydd tyrbîn gwynt, traciau mynediad, is-orsaf ac offer atodol ar dir yn Jordanston, Abergwaun, Sir Benfro.*

*Apêl cynllunio gan Mr P Davies, Eurogate Project Limited, ar gyfer cynllun i ddatblygu anheddiad pentref y mileniwm newydd ym Mrynglas, Llansanffraid Gwynllwg, Casnewydd.*

*Apêl cynllunio ac apêl adeilad rhestredig gan BT Cellnet Limited ar gyfer cynllun i osod cabanau offer telathrebu gydag erialau ar dir yn Empire House, 54-57 Sgwâr Mount Stuart, Butetown, Caerdydd. (NDM753)*

Cynigiad fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn penderfynu*

1. *Bod pwyllgor, i'w adnabod fel Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio 2001/6, yn cael ei sefydlu, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35, i gyflawni swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad o dan adran 77 (1) Deddf Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref 1990 mewn perthynas â'r mater a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, a bod swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad yn y cyswllt hwnnw yn cael eu dirprwyo i'r Pwyllgor hwnnw;*

2. *Mai aelodau'r Pwyllgor hwnnw fydd: David Davies, John Griffiths, Tom*

*Middlehurst and Rhodri Glyn Thomas.*

3. *That the Committee shall cease to exist when the Chair of the Committee signs the decision letter in accordance with Standing Order No. 35.16 or on 30 September 2001 whichever is the earlier.*

4. *That if the Committee shall cease to exist without the Chair having signed a decision letter in respect of the matter identified in the schedule to this motion then in that event the functions identified in paragraph 1 above are, in relation to such matter, delegated to the First Secretary.*

#### **Schedule**

*Called in application by Mr and Mrs S George for proposed conversion of barn and reconstruction of remains of former dwelling and demolition of derelict buildings at Enfield, Portfield Gate, Haverfordwest. (NDM754)*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the first motion.

*Middlehurst a Rhodri Glyn Thomas.*

3. *Y bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod pan fydd Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor yn llofnodi'r llythyr penderfynu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 35.16 neu ar 30 Medi 2001, p'un bynnag sy'n dod gyntaf.*

4. *Os bydd y Pwyllgor yn peidio â bod heb i'r Cadeirydd lofnodi llythyrau penderfynu mewn perthynas â'r materion a nodir yn yr atodlen i'r cynnig hwn, yna yn yr achos hwnnw dirprwyir y swyddogaethau a nodir ym mharagraff 1 uchod, mewn perthynas â mater o'r fath, i Brif Weinidog Cymru.*

#### **Atodlen**

*Cais wedi'i alw i mewn gan Mr a Mrs S George ar gyfer cynllun i drosi sgubor ac ailgodi adfeilion hen anheddfa a dymchwel adeiladau wedi dadfeilio yn Enfield, Portfield Gate, Hwlfordd. (NDM754)*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig cyntaf.

*Cynnig: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David

Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar yr ail  
the second motion. gynnig.

*Cynnig: O blaid 33, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion: For 33, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Jones, Helen Mary

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on **Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar y  
the third motion. trydydd cynnig.

*Cynnig: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 0.*



Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cwestiynau i Brif Weinidog Cymru Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Rôl Cymru wrth i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd Ehangu Role of Wales in European Union Enlargement**

**C1 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y rôl sydd gan Gymru i'w chwarae wrth i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ehangu? (OAQ12660)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cynnig her a chyfle arbennig i Gymru, yn ogystal ag elfen o berygl. Mae'n bwysig bod Cymru'n ymateb yn bositif. Mae Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd y Cynulliad wedi penderfynu sefydlu gweithgor i ystyried sut y dylai Cymru ymateb i'r her, y perygl a'r cyfle. Yr

**Q1 Gareth Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the role that Wales has to play in European Union enlargement? (OAQ12660)

**The First Minister:** The enlargement of the European Union presents significant challenges and opportunities for Wales, as well as an element of risk. It is important that Wales responds positively. The Assembly's Committee on European Affairs has decided to establish a working group to consider how Wales should respond to the challenge, the

ydym wedi gofyn i'r pleidiau gwleidyddol a'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol yng Nghymru am enwebiadau i'r gweithgor.

**Gareth Jones:** Os gwahoddir chi yng nghyfarfod nesaf cynhadledd y rhanbarthau gyda grym deddfwriaethol i arwyddo datganiad Fflandrys, sydd yn argymhell y dylai'r rhanbarthau chwarae rhan weithredol yn y trafodaethau a fydd yn arwain at y gynhadledd ryng-lywodraethol nesaf, a ddilynwch arweiniad eich cydweithiwr yn yr Alban, Henry McLeish, ac arwyddo'r datganiad ar ran Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf, yn fwy na thebyg.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Pryd y cynhelir y cyfarfod cyntaf yn y Cynulliad ar ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? Pa bynciau allweddol a drafodir yn y cyfarfod hwnnw?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni wn pryd y cynhelir cyfarfod cyntaf y gweithgor. Nid yw'r gweithgor wedi'i sefydlu eto, gan mai dim ond yn ddiweddar yr ysgrifenasom at y pleidiau a'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol yn gofyn am enwebiadau. Cyfrifoldeb y Pwyllgor yw penderfynu pryd y cynhelir y cyfarfod cyntaf. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw'r blaenoriaethau.

Y pwynt arwyddocaol imi yw bod Cymru, ers cenhedlaeth, pan ymunodd Prydain Fawr â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, wedi bod mewn marchnad arbennig i ddenu ffatrioedd newydd gan gwmnïau o Japan, megis Panasonic a Sharp. Bryd hynny, Cymru oedd y lle gorau i sefydlu ffatri oherwydd bod y costau llafur yn isel. Erbyn hyn, mae'r sector hwnnw yn symud tua'r dwyrain. Ni allwn ymfrostio mai Cymru yw'r lle gorau i sefydlu ffatri o ran cost llafur bellach. Rhaid inni drafod yr her honno, a'r perygl i'r ffatrioedd a ddaeth i Gymru o Japan ac Unol Daleithiau'r America yn fuan wedi i Brydain Fawr ymuno â'r farchnad gyffredin, fel y'i gelwid ar y pryd, yn 1973.

**Jonathan Morgan:** While the small working group's work will be extremely important in determining the Assembly's strategy on

risk and the opportunity. We have asked the political parties and the private and voluntary sectors in Wales for nominations to the working group.

**Gareth Jones:** If, at the next meeting of the conference of regions with legislative powers, you are invited to sign the Flanders declaration, which recommends that the regions should be actively involved in the discussions leading up to the next inter-governmental conference, will you follow the lead of your counterpart in Scotland, Henry McLeish, and sign the declaration on behalf of the National Assembly for Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is more than likely that I will do so.

**Eleanor Burnham:** When will the first meeting on the enlargement of the European Union be held at the Assembly? What key issues will be discussed at that meeting?

**The First Minister:** I do not know when the working group's first meeting will be held. The working group has not yet been established, as we only recently wrote to the parties and the private and voluntary sectors asking for nominations. It is up to the Committee to decide when the first meeting will be held. It is the priorities that are important.

What is significant to me is that, for a generation, since Great Britain joined the European Union, Wales has been in a strong position to attract Japanese companies, such as Panasonic and Sharp, to open factories here. At that time, Wales was the best place to establish a factory as the labour costs were low. By now, that sector is moving eastwards. We can no longer claim that Wales is the best place to establish a factory as regards labour costs. We must discuss that challenge, and the risk to the factories that came to Wales from Japan and the United States of America soon after Great Britain joined the common market, as it was then known, in 1973.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Er y bydd gwaith y gweithgor bychan yn bwysig iawn wrth benderfynu ar strategaeth y Cynulliad ar

engaging with the countries that will become members of the EU, do you and your office have any opportunities to visit some of the applicant countries to establish informal links, to act as a lever before more formal links are established when they become full members of the EU?

**The First Minister:** As much as I would like to visit Poland or the Czech Republic, I have not been able to do so yet. However, representatives from those countries have visited Wales. In June, the Polish Ambassador and the Czech Ambassador visited the Assembly and I had lengthy discussions with them on this topic.

gysylltu â gwledydd a ddaw yn aelodau o'r UE, a oes gennych chi neu eich swyddfa unrhyw gyfleoedd i ymweld â rhai o'r gwledydd sydd yn ymgeisio er mwyn sefydlu cysylltiadau anffurfiol, i weithredu fel hwb cyn sefydlu cysylltiadau mwy ffurfiol pan ddônt yn aelodau llawn o'r UE?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Er y byddwn wrth fy modd yn ymweld â Gwlad Pwyl neu'r Weriniaeth Tsiec, nid wyf wedi gallu gwneud hynny hyd yma. Fodd bynnag, bu cynrychiolwyr o'r gwledydd hynny ar ymweliad â Chymru. Ym mis Mehefin, ymwelodd Llysgennad Pwyl a Llysgennad Tsiec â'r Cynulliad a chefais drafodaethau hir gyda hwy ar y testun hwn.

2:10 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 2 wedi ei dynnu yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 2 has been withdrawn.

### **Archwilio Gwaith Llywodraeth Cymru yn Ystod y Toriad Scrutinising the Government of Wales's Work during Recess**

**C3 Cynog Dafis:** Sut y gall y Cynulliad archwilio gwaith Llywodraeth Cymru yn ystod y toriad? (OAQ12656)

**Q3 Cynog Dafis:** How can the Assembly scrutinise the Government of Wales's work during recess? (OAQ12656)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae unrhyw gynulliad yn gallu archwilio gwaith unrhyw lywodraeth yn ystod unrhyw doriad. Mae'n rhaid i waith llywodraeth fynd rhagddo am 12 mis o'r flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r un corff seneddol yn cyfarfod am 12 mis o'r flwyddyn. Gellir archwilio mewn ffordd wahanol yn ystod y toriad nag yn ystod Cyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad, neu yn ystod cyfarfodydd Pwyllgor. Ni ddown â chynigion deddfwriaethol gerbron y Cynulliad yn ystod y toriad.

**The First Minister:** Any assembly is able to scrutinise the work of any government during any recess. The work of any government must continue for 12 months of the year. However, no parliamentary body sits for 12 months of the year. There are different means of scrutinising during the recess than during Assembly Plenary sessions or Committee meetings. We do not bring legislative motions before the Assembly during recess.

**Cynog Dafis:** Fodd bynnag, mae llywodraethau ambell waith yn gohirio gwneud penderfyniadau a datganiadau pwysig tan y toriad er mwyn osgoi cael eu harchwilio. Mae bron yn sicr y ceir datganiad ar y pecyn cymorth i ffermwyr, yn enwedig ynglŷn â phrynu ŵyn, a bydd hynny'n fater tyngedfennol. I ba raddau yr ydych wedi gwneud eich gwaith cartref ac wedi pwyso ar yr Adran dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig i sicrhau bod y pecyn hwnnw'n ddigonol? A ydych, felly, yn fodlon

**Cynog Dafis:** However, governments occasionally delay making important decisions and announcements until recess to avoid scrutiny. It is almost certain that an announcement will be made on the support package for farmers, especially with regard to buying lambs, which will be a vitally important issue. To what extent have you done your homework and urged the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs to ensure that that package is sufficient? Are you willing to make

gwneud trefniadau naill ai i gael cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig neu Gyfarfod Llawn i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu trafod yn fanwl natur y pecyn pan ddaw ac i ba raddau y mae yn becyn digonol i ddiwallu'r argyfwng presennol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn perthnasol. Bydd Cynog wedi sylwi bod y gadair o'i flaen yn wag heddiw, gan fod Carwyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, mewn cyfarfod yn Llundain gyda Gweinidogion amaethyddiaeth eraill yn trafod y mater hwn. Felly, gall Carwyn roi'r newyddion inni ac eraill yn y Cynulliad sydd yn delio â materion amaethyddol a materion gwledig eraill yfory a dydd Iau. Hefyd, bydd Carwyn yr un mor gwrtais ag y mae fel arfer yn rhannu gwybodaeth â llefarwyr materion gwledig y pleidiau eraill.

**Peter Black:** Do you agree that one of the important aspects of the recess is being able to take forward the Assembly's work at party conferences nationally because of the limited powers that the Assembly has? Should not Plaid Cymru also take advantage of the recess to attend the conference of the Scottish National Party?

**The First Minister:** Perhaps it should as they are now partners in the House of Commons, though the SNP, curiously, believes in independence whereas Plaid Cymru does not. The important point is that there is no democratic country in the world that does not have a summer recess. However, the work of governments, be it the *Assemblée Nationale* in France or the *Bundestag* in Germany, continues during the summer recess and over the Christmas period and other periods of recess. You cannot scrutinise in the same way, of course, when you do not have Plenary sessions. However, you can continue to scrutinise and I assure the Assembly that there will be no cynical attempt to either delay difficult decisions or in any other way play with the timetable to avoid proper scrutiny.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yn awr eich bod wedi gwneud eich achos dros gael gwyliau hir dros yr haf, a

arrangements either to convene a meeting of the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee or a Plenary Session to ensure that we can discuss in detail the nature of the package when it comes and to what extent the package is sufficient in the face of the present crisis?

**The First Minister:** That is a pertinent question. Cynog will have noticed that the seat in front of him is empty today, as Carwyn Jones, the Minister for Rural Affairs, is in a meeting in London with other agriculture Ministers discussing this issue. Carwyn, therefore, can give the news to us and others in the Assembly who deal with agricultural and other rural affairs tomorrow and Thursday. Carwyn will also be his usual courteous self in sharing information with other parties' rural affairs spokespeople.

**Peter Black:** A gytunwch mai un o agweddau pwysicaf y toriad yw'r gallu i ddatblygu gwaith y Cynulliad mewn cynadleddau pleidiau yn genedlaethol oherwydd y pwerau cyfyngedig sydd gan y Cynulliad? Oni ddylai Plaid Cymru fanteisio ar y toriad hefyd i fynychu cynhadledd Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban—yr SNP?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Efallai y dylai, gan eu bod bellach yn bartneriaid yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, er bod yr SNP, yn rhyfedd ddigon, yn credu mewn annibyniaeth, yn wahanol i Plaid Cymru. Y pwynt pwysig yw nad oes gwlad ddemocrataidd yn y byd nad yw'n cael toriad dros yr haf. Fodd bynnag, mae gwaith llywodraethau, boed yn *Assemblée Nationale* yn Ffrainc neu'n *Bundestag* yn yr Almaen, yn parhau dros doriad yr haf a chyfnod y Nadolig a chyfnodau eraill o doriad. Ni allwch archwilio yn yr un modd, wrth gwrs, pan nad oes gennych Gyfarfodydd Llawn. Fodd bynnag, gallwch barhau i archwilio a sicrhaf y Cynulliad na fydd ymgais sinigaidd naill ai i oedi penderfyniadau anodd na chwarae â'r amserlen mewn unrhyw ffordd arall er mwyn osgoi archwiliad priodol.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Now that you have made your case for having long summer holidays, will you

ddywedwch wrthym beth yn union yw eich safbwynt—cyn ichi fynd ar eich gwyliau—yn glŷn â phreifateiddio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd? Dylech fod wedi clywed datganiad Tony Blair ddoe pan ddywedodd ei fod am gyflwyno arian preifat i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, a fydd yn cynnwys capasiti rhydd, y fenter cyllid preifat, llawdriniaeth ddewisol a rheoli. A ydych yn rhannu safbwynt Tony Blair neu yn croesawu penderfyniad undeb y GMB heddiw i docio hyd at £1 miliwn o arian i'r Blaid Lafur mewn protest yn erbyn y cynllun?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fel rhagymadrodd, Ieuan, byddaf i ffwrdd ar wyliau, fel arfer, am bythefnos yn y Mwnt ym Mae Ceredigion. Nid wyf yn siŵr i ble mae Ieuan yn mynd am ei wyliau nag am faint. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn y Cabinet yn cael pythefnos o wyliau neu lai. Y gwaith a gyflawnwn yn ystod y cyfnod hwn sydd yn bwysig, nid ceisio sgorio pwyntiau rhad yn glŷn â gwyliau haf ac ati.

O ran yr hyn a ddywedodd Tony Blair yn glŷn â phreifateiddio, nid yw ef yn atebol i'r Cynulliad. Myfi sydd yn atebol i'r Cynulliad, felly ni welaf berthnasedd cwestiwn Ieuan. Os oedd am fod yn Aelod Seneddol, dylai fod wedi gwneud hynny ond, wrth gwrs, byddai wedi colli ei sedd. Felly, gwnaeth benderfyniad doeth.

Os ydych yn derbyn bod datganoli wedi digwydd, yr hyn a gynigiwn ni sydd yn bwysig yng Nghymru. Nid ydym wedi crybwyll y cynigion y mae Ieuan a'r GMB yn cwyno amdanynt.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn gyntaf, gwyddoch mai'r hyn a wrthwynebwn yn glŷn â'r toriad yw nid bod pobl yn cymryd gwyliau, ond y ffaith y byddwn i ffwrdd am dri mis ac yn methu â gofyn cwestiynau i chi. Dyna'r pwynt sylfaenol yn glŷn â'r tri mis i ffwrdd.

Yn ail, peidiwch â beio Tony Blair; dywedwch wrthym beth yw eich safbwynt chi yn glŷn â phreifateiddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Pan geir deddfu yn San Steffan, a fyddwch yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth eilaidd yn y Cynulliad a fydd yn gweithredu cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain? Beth yw eich safbwynt ar y mater hwn?

tell us what exactly is your view—before you go on your holidays—on privatisation in the health service? You should have heard Tony Blair's statement yesterday when he said that he wants private investment in the health service, which will extend to additional capacity, the private finance initiative, elective surgery and management. Do you share Tony Blair's opinion or do you welcome the GMB's decision today to cut up to £1 million in funding to the Labour Party in protest at the scheme?

**The First Minister:** As a preamble, Ieuan, I will be away on holiday, as usual, for a fortnight at Mwnt in Cardigan Bay. I am not sure where Ieuan is going on holiday nor for how long. Most of us in the Cabinet are taking a fortnight's holiday or less. What is important is the work that we do during this period, not trying to score cheap points about summer holidays and so on.

On Tony Blair's comments about privatisation, he is not accountable to the Assembly. I am accountable to the Assembly, therefore I fail to see the relevance of Ieuan's question. If he wished to continue as a Member of Parliament, he should have done so but, of course, he would have lost his seat. Therefore, he made a wise decision.

If you accept that devolution has occurred, it is what we propose that is important in Wales. We have not mentioned the proposals that Ieuan and the GMB complain about.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** First, you know that our objection regarding the recess is not that people are taking holidays, but the fact that we will be away for three months and will be unable to question you. That is the fundamental point about the three months off.

Secondly, do not blame Tony Blair; tell us what your stance is regarding the privatisation of the health service. When legislation is enacted in Westminster, will you present secondary legislation in the Assembly that will implement the plans of the Government in London? What is your stance on this matter?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hynny'n glir o'r araith a wneuthum gerbron Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf. Darllenwch yr hyn a ddywedais. Gwaredwch eich hun rhag yr obsesiwn hwn â'r hyn y mae Tony Blair a John Edmonds yn ei wneud. Cynulliad Cymru yw hwn, nid Cynulliad Prydain Fawr. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid wedi gofyn dau gwestiwn atodol. Ni all gael un arall tra ei fod yn eistedd.

**The First Minister:** That is clear from the speech I gave to the Wales Trades Union Congress last week. Read what I said. Rid yourself of this obsession with what Tony Blair and John Edmonds are doing. This is Wales's Assembly, not Great Britain's Assembly. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Leader of the Opposition has asked two supplementary questions. He cannot ask another from a sedentary position.

### **Creu Cysylltiadau Rhwng Cymru a Gwledydd Newydd yr UE Forging Links Between Wales and the New Countries of the EU**

**Q4 Christine Gwyther:** What mechanisms have been set up to forge links between Wales and the new candidate countries of the European Union? (OAQ12665)

**The First Minister:** Wales has already established links with some of the accession countries, mostly through private sector companies and consultancies. However, we are trying to establish a co-ordinated all-Wales strategy for engaging with the candidate countries. That is why an Assembly-led working group, which I will chair, is being established, as I mentioned in answer to an earlier question.

It is important that we make the right political decisions in terms of which countries, if they are approximately the same size as Wales—and many of the accession countries are—or which regions of larger countries, such as Poland, we wish to form a relationship with.

**Christine Gwyther:** You are correct to say that such links already exist, in the private and public sectors. Pioneering economic development work has been undertaken by the LEADER group in my constituency, namely the South Pembrokeshire Partnership for Action with Rural Communities. Will you join me in congratulating SPARC on its recent successful bid for LEADER+ funding and wish it continued success and excellence as it moves into pan-Pembrokeshire mode?

**C4 Christine Gwyther:** Pa fecanweithiau a sefydlwyd i greu cysylltiadau rhwng Cymru a'r gwledydd sydd yn ymgeiswyr newydd ar gyfer yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? (OAQ12665)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae Cymru eisoes wedi sefydlu cysylltiadau â'r gwledydd sydd am ymuno, yn bennaf drwy gwmnïau sector preifat a chwmnïau ymgynghori. Fodd bynnag, ceisiwn sefydlu strategaeth gydgysylltiedig i Gymru gyfan er mwyn creu cysylltiad â'r gwledydd sydd yn ymgeisio. Dyna pam y sefydlir gweithgor dan arweiniad y Cynulliad, a gaiff ei gadeirio gennyf fi, fel y soniais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn blaenorol.

Mae'n bwysig inni wneud y penderfyniadau gwleidyddol cywir yn nhermau pa wledydd, os dynt tua'r un maint â Chymru—ac mae nifer o'r gwledydd sydd am ymuno o'r un maint—ynteu pa ranbarthau o wledydd mwy, megis Gwlad Pwyl, y dymunwn greu perthynas â hwy.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud fod cysylltiadau o'r fath yn bodoli eisoes, yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus. Gwnaethpwyd gwaith datblygu economaidd arloesol gan y grŵp LEADER yn fy etholaeth, sef Partneriaeth De Sir Benfro dros Weithredu gyda Chymunedau Gwledig (SPARC). A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch SPARC ar ei gais llwyddiannus diweddar am arian LEADER+ a dymuno parhad i'w lwyddiant a'i ragoriaeth wrth ymestyn ar draws Sir Benfro gyfan?

**The First Minister:** I welcome the pan-Pembrokeshire mode. We all look forward to the Pembrokeshire take-over of the rest of the world. I am familiar with the work done by Joan Asby and others in the SPARC group. I held meetings with her recently to discuss the potential for spreading LEADER and SPARC into eastern Europe. I welcomed that.

We must make political decisions. The dilemma is whether Wales should link up with regions in Poland or the Czech Republic, or other countries that have experienced, or are experiencing, the same difficulties as us, namely over-dependence on coal, steel and staple industries such as slate quarrying and agriculture. Alternatively, we could link up with leading-edge regions or countries, which appear to be enjoying great economic success and are regarded as having the best prospects of moving upwards to the knowledge economy. We could also choose a mixture of both, with one strategy in Poland and another in the Czech Republic, for example. Those are the key choices that we must make. There is no substitute for making those choices at a political all-Wales level.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that, in any contact that we have with applicant countries in central and eastern Europe, the first message that should come from Wales is how much we welcome the fact that these countries are to become part of the European Union? This marks the end of a divide in Europe that terrified people for many years and blighted the prospects of generations. We are now at the beginning of a more optimistic period in the history of the European Union.

2:20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree with that. However, you put your finger on the factor that makes this extension of the European Union more problematic than previous ones. Previous extensions to include countries such as Britain, Ireland, Denmark and, despite their brief fascist post-war histories, Greece, Spain and Portugal involved countries that were part of the same civilisation. It will be

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Croesawaf yr ymestyn ar draws Sir Benfro gyfan. Edrychwn ymlaen i gyd at Sir Benfro yn gorchfygu'r byd. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r gwaith a wnaeth Joan Asby ac eraill yng ngrŵp SPARC. Cynhaliais gyfarfodydd â hi yn ddiweddar i drafod y potensial ar gyfer lledaenu LEADER a SPARC i ddwyrain Ewrop. Croesawais hynny.

Rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau gwleidyddol. Y broblem yw a ddylai Cymru greu cysylltiad â rhanbarthau yng Ngwlad Pwyl neu Weriniaeth Tsiec, neu wledydd eraill sydd wedi profi, neu yn profi, yr un anawsterau â ni, sef gorddibyniaeth ar lo, dur a diwydiannau sefydlog megis chwareli llechi neu amaethyddiaeth. Ar y llaw arall, gallasem greu cysylltiad â rhanbarthau neu wledydd blaengar sydd yn ymddangos fel pe baent yn mwynhau llwyddiant economaidd ac sydd yn cael eu hystyried fel pe bai ganddynt y cyfleoedd gorau i symud i fyny i'r economi wybodaeth. Gallem hefyd ddewis cymysgedd o'r ddau, gydag un strategaeth yng Ngwlad Pwyl ac un arall yng Ngweriniaeth Tsiec, er enghraifft. Dyna'r dewisiadau allweddol sydd o'n blaenau. Nid oes dewis arall ond gwneud y dewisiadau hynny ar lefel wleidyddol Cymru gyfan.

**David Melding:** A gytunwch mai'r neges gyntaf a ddylai ddod o Gymru, mewn unrhyw gysylltiad a wnawn â gwledydd sydd yn ymgeisio o ganol a dwyrain Ewrop, yw'r croeso brwd a roddwn i'r ffaith bod y gwledydd hyn ar fin dod yn rhan o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? Mae hyn yn nodi diwedd y rhaniad yn Ewrop a gododd arswyd ar bobl am flynyddoedd lawer ac a ddifethodd obeithion cenedlaethau. Yr ydym yn awr ar fin dechrau cyfnod mwy gobeithiol yn hanes yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhoesoch eich bys ar y ffactor sydd yn gwneud yr ehangu hwn o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn fwy problematig na rhai blaenorol. Yr oedd ehangu blaenorol i gynnwys gwledydd megis Prydain, Iwerddon a Denmarc, ynghyd â Groeg, Sbaen a Phortiwgal er gwaethaf y cyfnodau byr o ffasgiaeth yn y gwledydd hynny ar ôl y

harder to absorb some of the other countries into western European democratic culture as some will have had 50 years of communist rule and Stalinist command economies. That transformation will be more difficult. Any help that we can offer them, particularly in the former coal and steel regions, will probably be welcome and we would also benefit from it.

rhyfel, yn cwmpasu gwledydd oedd yn rhan o'r un gwarediddiad. Bydd yn anos derbyn rhai o'r gwledydd eraill i ddiwylliant democrataidd gorllewin Ewrop gan y bydd gan rai ohonynt gefndir economaidd o 50 mlynedd o reolaeth gomiwnyddol a Stalinaidd. Bydd y trawsnewidiad hwnnw yn anos. Caiff unrhyw gymorth y gallwn ei gynnig iddynt, yn arbennig yn y rhanbarthau glo a dur blaenorol, ei groesawu fwy na thebyg, a byddem ninnau yn cael budd ohono.

### **Refferendwm ar Aelodaeth o Arian Sengl Ewrop Referendum on Membership of the Single European Currency**

**Q5 Janice Gregory:** Has the First Minister had any discussions with the UK Government about the possible dates for a referendum on membership of the single European currency? (OAQ12676)

**C5 Janice Gregory:** A yw Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch dyddiadau posibl ar gyfer refferendwm ar aelodaeth o arian sengl Ewrop? (OAQ12676)

**The First Minister:** I meet with representatives of the UK Government regularly to discuss a wide range of issues. As you will be aware, Janice, the UK Government has said time and again that the Treasury will complete an assessment of the five key economic tests within two years of the general election, which was held on 7 June. If the UK Government recommends UK entry into economic and monetary union, it will be put to a vote in Parliament and then to a referendum of the British people.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â chynrychiolwyr Llywodraeth y DU i drafod amrywiaeth eang o faterion. Fel y gwyddoch, Janice, dywedodd Llywodraeth y DU droeon y bydd y Trysorlys yn cwblhau asesiad o'r pump prif brawf economaidd o fewn dwy flynedd i'r etholiad cyffredinol, a gynhaliwyd ar 7 Mehefin. Os bydd Llywodraeth y DU yn argymhell bod y DU yn ymuno â'r undeb economaidd ac ariannol, cynhelir pleidlais arno yn San Steffan ac yna refferendwm o bobl Prydain.

**Janice Gregory:** There has been recent media speculation on the possibility of holding a referendum on the euro on the same day as the next election to the devolved administrations. I ask you to use your influence as First Minister to impress upon our UK Government the need to ensure that the two polls do not clash and that the referendum is held on a different day to the next Assembly elections.

**Janice Gregory:** Bu dyfalu yn y cyfryngau yn ddiweddar ynghylch y posibilrwydd o gynnal refferendwm ar yr ewro ar yr un diwrnod â'r etholiadau nesaf ar gyfer y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig. Gofynnaf ichi ddefnyddio eich dylanwad fel Prif Weinidog Cymru i roi ar ddeall i Lywodraeth y DU yr angen i sicrhau na fydd y ddau etholiad yn gwrthdaro ac na chynhelir y refferendwm ac etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad ar yr un diwrnod.

**The First Minister:** I am having a routine meeting with the Prime Minister on Monday morning. There is nothing to prevent us discussing whatever matters we consider to be of importance to the UK and to Wales. I will refer to that point, Janice, as I think that

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Caf gyfarfod arferol â'r Prif Weinidog fore Llun. Nid oes unrhyw beth i'n hatal rhag trafod pa bynnag faterion yr ystyriwn sydd yn bwysig i'r DU ac i Gymru. Cyfeiriaf at y pwynt hwnnw, Janice, gan y tybiaf y bydd hynny yn addas.



might be apposite.

**Dafydd Wigley:** A dderbyniwch fod angen cael gwared ar yr ansicrwydd sydd yn bodoli ym myd diwydiant a masnach ynghylch mynediad i arian sengl Ewrop? A dderbyniwch hefyd, y dylem gynnal refferendwm ar yr ewro mor fuan â phosibl unwaith y bydd yr amodau yn addas? Cefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Janice, sef y byddai'n amhriodol cynnal refferendwm ar yr un diwrnod ag etholiad y Cynulliad. Os yw'r Llywodraeth yn teimlo bod yn rhaid gohirio etholiadau lleol Cymru am flwyddyn er mwyn osgoi eu bod yn cyd-daro ag etholiad y Cynulliad, yna'n bendant mae angen sicrhau nad yw'r refferendwm ar yr un diwrnod.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n bwysig bod modd inni ganolbwyntio ar ein hetholiad ym mis Mai 2003. Mae'n fater o gost ac o wneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â'r amseriad. Y Llywodraeth a'r Trysorlys sydd yn gyfrifol am y pwnc sensitif hwn sydd yn ymwneud â dyfodol Prydain fawr a hwy sydd yn gorfod gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn cytuno ag egwyddor yr hyn a ddywedodd Janice gerbron y Cynulliad ac mae Dafydd yn cytuno ag ef.

**Mick Bates:** As we know, tourism plays a vital role in Wales. However, it is currently expensive to visit Britain. Joining the euro would make a visit to Wales a much more attractive option. The foot and mouth disease crisis has hit tourism hard. Does the First Minister agree that joining the euro would give Welsh tourism a much-needed boost and that the sooner we join the better?

**The First Minister:** That is an interesting point, Mick, with which I have some sympathy, almost irrespective of the currency issue. It is a hassle to change money when you go abroad and to change the unspent sums back at the end of the holiday. With Ireland to our west and the other 10 countries to our east—if you go through the Channel ports or Harwich or any other way—adopting the euro coinage on 1 January 2002, Great Britain will be the odd one out. However, you did not mention the other issue, Mick. If the price at which you joined the euro was locked at today's rate, that would be a disaster for

**Dafydd Wigley:** Do you accept that the uncertainty that exists in industry and trade as regards joining the European single currency needs to be dispelled? Do you also accept that we should hold a referendum as soon as the conditions are right? I agree with Janice that it would be inappropriate to hold the referendum on the same day as the Assembly election. If the Government feels that the Welsh local elections must be delayed for a year in order to avoid a clash with the Assembly election then there is most definitely a need to ensure that the referendum is not held on the same day.

**The First Minister:** It is important that we are able to focus on our election in May 2003. It is a matter of cost and of deciding on the timing. The Government and the Treasury are in charge of this sensitive subject, which has a bearing on the future of the UK, and it is they who must make that decision. However, I agree with the principle of what Janice said, as does Dafydd.

**Mick Bates:** Fel y gwyddom, mae twristiaeth yn chwarae rhan bwysig yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddud i ymweld â Phrydain ar hyn o bryd. Byddai ymuno â'r ewro yn gwneud ymweld â Chymru yn ddewis llawer mwy deniadol. Bu clwy'r traed a'r genau yn ergyd drom i dwristiaeth. A gytuna Prif Weinidog Cymru y byddai ymuno â'r ewro yn rhoi'r hwb angenrheidiol i dwristiaeth yng Nghymru a gorau po gyntaf yr ymunwn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt diddorol, Mick, ac mae gennyf beth cydymdeimlad ag ef, bron heb ystyried mater yr arian. Mae'n drafferthus newid arian wrth fynd dramor a newid yr arian nad ydych wedi ei wario yn ôl ar ddiwedd y gwyliau. Gydag Iwerddon i'r gorllewin a'r 10 gwlad arall i'r dwyrain—os ewch drwy borthladdoedd y Sianel neu Harwich neu unrhyw ffordd arall—yn mabwysiadu arian yr ewro ar 1 Ionawr 2002, Prydain Fawr fydd yr unig un ar ôl. Fodd bynnag, ni soniasoch am y mater arall, Mick. Pe cai'r pris ar yr adeg yr ymunoch â'r ewro ei gadw ar gyfradd heddiw, byddai

tourism, agriculture and manufacturing. Therefore, we need the exchange rate for sterling to fall relative to the euro, and the euro's rate to rise.

hynny'n drychineb i dwristiaeth, amaethyddiaeth a gweithgynhyrchu. Felly, mae angen i gyfradd cyfnewid sterling ostwng mewn perthynas â'r ewro, ac i gyfradd yr ewro godi.

### Cyhoeddiadau am Bolisiâu Policy Announcements

**C6 Elin Jones:** Sawl cyhoeddiad am bolisiâu drwy ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru a'i Gabinet wedi'u gwneud yn ystod oes y Cynulliad? (OAQ12654)

**Q6 Elin Jones:** How many policy announcements through written statements have the First Minister and his Cabinet made during the lifetime of the Assembly? (OAQ12654)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Anodd dweud beth yn union yw cyhoeddiadau ar bolisi neu ar newid polisi. Cyfrifom dros 130 o eitemau a bostiwyd ar y rhyngwyd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Credaf mai nifer fach ohonynt sydd yn ddatganiadau ar bolisiâu newydd.

**The First Minister:** It is difficult to define what exactly policy or change of policy announcements are. We have counted over 130 items that have been posted on the internet since the Assembly's inception. I do not believe that many of those those would count as statements on new policies.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, Brif Weinidog, anfonodd eich Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Carwyn Jones lythyr a oedd yn ddatganiad, yn cyhoeddi cyllid LEADER ar gyfer saith grŵp yng Nghymru. Croesawodd Christine Gwyther y ffaith fod cyllid ar gael i gynllun yn Sir Benfro. Fodd bynnag, gwrthodwyd sawl cais hefyd, gan gynnwys Antur Teifi yn fy etholaeth i. Pam nad oedd y Llywodraeth yn teimlo bod cyhoeddiad felly yn haeddu datganiad i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol na chwestiynu gan Aelodau, fel y dymunem?

**Elin Jones:** First Minister, last week, your Minister for Rural Affairs, Carwyn Jones sent a letter that was a statement, announcing LEADER funding for seven groups in Wales. Christine Gwyther welcomed the fact that funding was available for a scheme in Pembrokeshire. However, several bids were also rejected, including that of Antur Teifi in my constituency. Why did the Government feel that this kind of announcement did not merit a statement to the National Assembly, nor questioning from Members, as we would have wished?

Yn sgîl y ffaith fod cyllid LEADER wedi diflannu o nifer o ardaloedd yn y gorllewin a'r gogledd, a oes gan eich Llywodraeth unrhyw fwriad i ddod o hyd i gyllid arall, i sicrhau bod y gwaith clodwiw a wnaethpwyd gan y grwpiau LEADER yn y gorffennol yn gallu parhau ar lawr gwlad?

In light of the fact that LEADER funding has disappeared from several parts of west and north Wales, does your Government have any intention of finding other funding sources to ensure that the excellent work done by the LEADER groups in the past can continue at grassroots level?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dechreuaf gyda'r cwestiwn ar yr egwyddor o pryd y rhoddir datganiad ar y fewnwyd, a phryd y gwneir datganiad ysgrifenedig, yn hytrach na datganiad llafar yn y Siambr neu mewn Pwyllgor. Nid yw penderfyniad yn golygu newid mewn polisi. Os ydych yn cyhoeddi newid polisi, credaf ei fod yn angenrheidiol ei wneud gerbron y Cynulliad ar bob cyfrif. Os nad yw hynny'n gyfleus, dylech

**The First Minister:** I will begin with the question on the principle of placing a statement on the intranet, or making a written statement, rather than an oral statement in the Chamber or in Committee. A decision does not constitute a change in policy. If you are announcing a change in policy, it is essential that it should be done before the Assembly. If that is not convenient, the change should be announced before the relevant Committee.

gyhoeddi'r newid gerbron y Pwyllgor perthnasol. Fodd bynnag, os gwnewch benderfyniad gweithredol, ni chredaf fod yr un egwyddor yn berthnasol.

O ran llwyddiant y cynllun LEADER II yn Sir Benfro a gwrthod estyniad o'r arian Ewropeaidd i gynlluniau tebyg mewn ardaloedd gwledig eraill yng Nghymru, mater ichi ysgrifennu ataf yw hynny. Os credwch fod achos dros ailystyried y penderfyniad, rhoddwch gais ysgrifenedig gerbron Carwyn neu finnau. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cewch eglurhad, os y caniateir hynny gan reolau cyfrinachedd.

**David Davies:** Do you agree that we need an urgent policy announcement—through written statement or other means—relating to the Department for the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs? I refer particularly to the fact that DEFRA officials and vets have, in some instances, agreed compensation figures with farmers and subsequently changed their minds? Do you not agree that that is a disgrace and must be examined as quickly as possible?

**The First Minister:** You have described it as a scandal and therefore I accept it as a scandal. However, I have not heard the other side of the story. If you put that query in writing, then I am sure that Carwyn or I would be interested in pursuing it. You mentioned that these are DEFRA vets. I guess that DEFRA will happily provide the necessary information. You will then receive a full, proper and courteous response to your request for information, on why this change of mind occurred.

However, if you take an executive decision, I do not believe that the same principle applies.

Concerning the success of the LEADER II programme in Pembrokeshire, and the refusal to extend the European funding for similar schemes in other rural areas in Wales, that is a matter on which you should write to me. If you believe that there is cause to reconsider the decision, please submit that request to Carwyn or myself in writing. I am sure that you will receive an explanation, confidentiality rules permitting.

**David Davies:** A gytunwch fod angen datganiad polisi brys arnom—drwy ddatganiad ysgrifenedig neu ddull arall—yn ymwneud ag Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig (DEFRA)? Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at y ffaith fod swyddogion a milfeddygon DEFRA, mewn rhai achosion, wedi cytuno ar ffigurau iawndal gyda ffermwyr ac yna wedi ailfeddwl? Oni chytunwch fod hynny yn gywilyddus ac y dylid ymchwilio i'r mater cyn gynted â phosibl?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fe'i disgrifiwyd gennych fel sgandal felly fe'i derbyniaf fel sgandal. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi clywed ochr arall y stori. Pe baech yn cyflwyno'r ymholiad hwnnw yn ysgrifenedig, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gan Carwyn neu minnau ddiddordeb mewn dilyn ei drywydd. Soniasoch mai milfeddygon DEFRA yw'r rhain. Tybiaf y byddai DEFRA yn fodlon darparu'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol. Byddwch wedyn yn derbyn ymateb llawn, priodol a chwrtais i'ch cais am wybodaeth, ynglŷn â'r ailfeddwl hwn.

### **Cyflwyno Mentrau'r Cynulliad o ran Polisiau Delivering the Assembly's Policy Initiatives**

**Q7 Alun Cairns:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how the Cabinet plans to involve outside organisations in the delivery of the Assembly's policy initiatives? (OAQ12675)

**The First Minister:** I will do so by means of an example, namely the establishment of the business and social partners support unit. Its

**C7 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar sut y mae'r Cabinet yn bwriadu cynnwys sefydliadau allanol wrth gyflwyno mentrau'r Cynulliad o ran polisiau? (OAQ12675)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gwnaf hynny drwy ddefnyddio enghraifft, sef sefydlu'r uned gymorthartneriaid busnes a chymdeithas. Ei

purpose is to strengthen the capacity of business and trade unions to input the Assembly's work. Good progress has been made. The draft business plan is for the unit to be set up as a company limited by guarantee. Its first board meeting has been arranged for 22 August 2001.

**Alun Cairns:** Early last week, the First Minister endorsed the Thatcherite agenda of the private finance initiative, which I welcomed. Later in the week, the unions threatened strike action. Yesterday, the Prime Minister, Tony Blair hardened his position and earlier this afternoon, in response to Ieuan Wyn Jones in the Chamber, you sought to u-turn from your previously-stated position. Is it not the case that you and the Government of Wales are in complete disarray over this policy? Will you confirm whether the unions—particularly the GMB—remain equal partners in the Labour movement?

2:30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I completely deny the basis of that question. It reached the height of inanity. I was asked for my view of private finance being used in the public sector. I said that we would consider it in a non-dogmatic way. I am not sure how that can suddenly turn into endorsing a Thatcherite agenda, because if there was anyone who was not non-dogmatic in these matters, it was Margaret Thatcher. I was consistent in what I said to the Assembly and to the Wales Trade Union Congress conference. We will consider this in a non-dogmatic way, buying expertise from the private sector, when appropriate—when the private sector has the expertise—and taking advantage of the public sector's expertise, when it has the expertise. We will apply that principle right across public services in Wales.

**John Griffiths:** One organisation that has engaged with the Assembly is Jubilee 2000 Welsh Coalition, which is campaigning to cancel the debt burden of the world's poorest countries. About an hour ago, in the Assembly Neuadd, it launched its booklet

nod yw cryfhau gallu busnesau ac undebau llafur i gyfrannu at waith y Cynulliad. Gwnaethpwyd gynnydd da. Y cynllun busnes drafft yw sefydlu'r uned fel cwmni cyfyngedig drwy warant. Trefnwyd cyfarfod cyntaf ei fwrdd ar gyfer 22 Awst 2001.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn gynnar yr wythnos diwethaf, cymeradwyodd Prif Weinidog Cymru agenda Thatcheriaid y fenter cyllid preifat, a chroesawais hynny. Yn ddiweddarach yn yr wythnos, bygythiodd yr undebau gynnal streic. Ddoe, caledodd y Prif Weinidog, Tony Blair, ei safiad, ac yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, mewn ymateb i Ieuan Wyn Jones yn y Siambr, ceisiasoch droi yn eich carn oddi wrth eich safbwynt blaenorol. Onid yw'n wir eich bod chi a Llywodraeth Cymru mewn anhrefn llwyr ynglŷn â'r polisi hwn? A gadarnhewch a yw'r undebau—yn arbennig y GMB—yn parhau'n bartneriaid cyfartal yn y mudiad Llafur?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr wyf yn gwadu sail y cwestiwn hwnnw yn llwyr. Yr oedd yn eithafol o hurt. Gofynnwyd am fy marn ar ddefnyddio cyllid preifat yn y sector cyhoeddus. Dywedais y buasem yn ei ystyried mewn modd annogmataidd. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y gall hynny newid ar amrantiad i gymeradwyo agenda Thatcheriaid, oherwydd os oedd unrhyw un nad oedd yn annogmataidd yn y materion hyn, Margaret Thatcher oedd honno. Yr oeddwn yn gyson yn yr hyn a ddywedais wrth y Cynulliad a chynhadledd Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru. Ystyriwn hyn mewn modd annogmataidd, gan brynu arbenigedd o'r sector preifat pan fo'n briodol—pan fo'r arbenigedd gan y sector preifat—a manteisio ar arbenigedd y sector cyhoeddus pan fo'r arbenigedd ganddo. Defnyddiwn yr egwyddor honno ar draws y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**John Griffiths:** Un sefydliad sydd wedi cysylltu â'r Cynulliad yw Welsh Coalition Jiwbilî 2000, sydd yn ymgychu dros ddiddymu dyledion sydd yn fwrn ar wledydd tlotaf y byd. Tuag awr yn ôl, yn Neuadd y Cynulliad, lansiodd ei lyfryn 'Learning the

'Learning the Lessons' and it will take its campaign to the forthcoming G8 summit in Genoa. Will you join Jubilee 2000 and me in calling for the summit to drop the debt of the world's poorest countries?

**The First Minister:** I picked up a copy of that booklet in the Neuadd as I came into the Chamber, but I have not had a chance to read it yet. Due to other pressures I was not able to be present at the launch at lunchtime. However, I support the principles. I know people involved in the Jubilee 2000 campaign extremely well and I endorse their work. I also endorse what you said about the importance that the G8 summit in Genoa should give to cancelling debt.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The outside bodies with whom the Cabinet is communicating—or should be communicating—include bodies that deal with tourism in Wales, Welsh rural affairs and the farming unions. What will he say to them about the fact that no new assistance has been announced from the end of June onwards for the tourism industry and other businesses affected by the foot and mouth disease outbreak? Is it not a scandal that we are about to go into recess and that there is no promise of additional money in July, August, September and much of October to help businesses that face bankruptcy, hardship and poverty in rural Wales? Will he take this opportunity to commit his administration to pledge fresh resources to those hard-hit businesses?

**The First Minister:** I pledge that my administration will continue with its programme of holding a meeting of the rural partnership on 24 July. Edwina Hart, Carwyn Jones, other Ministers and I have worked hard on a package. I did not choose that date; as far as I know, it was chosen by partners in the rural support unit. It is unfortunate that it happens to be a week after the Assembly will have risen for the summer recess. That is beyond our control. However, it would not be right, in terms of building a partnership with outside organisations, if we did not use that rural partnership as the basis for making a final announcement or agreeing a policy for the package that we are preparing. We are

Lessons' ac aiff â'i ymgyrch i'r uwchgynhadledd G8 arfaethedig yn Genoa. A ymunwch â Jiwibili 2000 a minnau i alw ar yr uwchgynhadledd i ddileu dyledion gwledydd tlotaf y byd?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Casglais gopi o'r llyfryn hwnnw yn y Neuadd wrth ddod i'r Siambr, ond nid wyf wedi cael cyfle i'w ddarllen hyd yn hyn. Oherwydd galwadau eraill ni allwn fod yn bresennol yn yr achlysur lansio amser cinio. Fodd bynnag, cefnogaf yr egwyddorion. Yr wyf yn adnabod pobl sydd yn ymwneud ag ymgyrch Jiwibili 2000 yn dda iawn a chefnogaf eu gwaith. Cefnogaf hefyd yr hyn a ddywedasochoch ynglŷn â'r pwys y dylai uwchgynhadledd Genoa ei roi ar ddileu'r ddyled.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae'r cyrff allanol y cyfathreba'r Cynulliad â hwy—neu y dylai gyfathrebu â hwy—yn cynnwys cyrff sydd yn ymdrin â thwristiaeth yng Nghymru, materion gwledig Cymru a'r undebau ffermio. Beth a ddywed wrthynt am y ffaith na chyhoeddwyd unrhyw gymorth pellach o ddiwedd Mehefin ymlaen i'r diwydiant twristiaeth a busnesau eraill yr effeithiwyd arnynt gan glwy'r traed a'r genau? Onid yw'n sgandal ein bod ar drothwy toriad ac nad oes addewid o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer Gorffennaf, Awst, Medi na'r rhan fwyaf o Hydref i helpu busnesau yng nghefn gwlad Cymru sydd yn wynebu methdaliad, caledi a thlodi? A ddefnyddia'r cyfle hwn i ymrwymo ei weinyddiaeth i addo adnoddau newydd i'r busnesau hynny a gafodd ergyd drom?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Addawaf y bydd fy ngweinyddiaeth yn parhau â'i rhaglen o gynnal cyfarfod o'r bartneriaeth wledig ar 24 Gorffennaf. Mae Edwina Hart, Carwyn Jones, Gweinidogion eraill a minnau wedi gweithio'n galed ar becyn. Nid myfi a ddewisodd y dyddiad hwnnw; cyhyd ag y gwn, fe'i dewiswyd gan bartneriaid yn yr uned cymorth gwledig. Mae'n anffodus ei fod yn digwydd wythnos ar ôl i'r Cynulliad gau ar gyfer toriad yr haf. Mae hynny y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n briodol, yn nhermau adeiladu partneriaeth â sefydliadau allanol, pe na baem yn defnyddio'r bartneriaeth wledig honno fel sail ar gyfer gwneud datganiad terfynol neu

working hard on this package because we recognise—as much as you do, if not more, Nick—how important it is to try to sustain the tourism industry and other businesses in rural Wales, which have been blasted by the foot and mouth disease epidemic this summer.

**Nick Bourne:** You do not need the rural partnership to tell you that businesses face bankruptcy every day in rural Wales. Why can this not be brought forward to the Assembly now? It is another example of a lack of direction. We have experienced it also in terms of public services. Many Members of your party do not want to use the private finance initiative, including the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, but you today seem to pledge yourself to it. That is good news; let us hope that that view is shared by Labour Assembly Members. That lack of direction is also evident on the partnership agreement: half the Labour Assembly Members hate it, the other half accept it through gritted teeth, but you hang onto it because it provides you with a lifeline.

I accused you of lack of direction. Perhaps I should retract that. It is obvious that your administration is heading for hell in a handcart.

**The First Minister:** You talked about a lack of direction but, at first, you gave the impression that you really cared about tourism businesses in mid Wales. Then, of course, you had to start on the snide sneers and smears, which are your speciality. Either you want us to concentrate on what we are doing to rebuild the tourism industry in mid Wales—no doubt when you are in mid Wales, you like to give the impression that you are interested in that—or you do not. However, you have another agenda on privatisation and so on. That is what you really believe despite the apparent crocodile tears about the tourism industry in Wales. Privatisation is what it is all about.

gytuno ar bolisi ar gyfer y pecyn yr ydym yn ei baratoi. Gweithiwn yn galed ar y pecyn hwn oherwydd cydnabyddwn—gymaint â chi, os nad yn fwy, Nick—bwysigrwydd ceisio cynnal y diwydiant twristiaeth a busnesau eraill yng Nghymru wledig, a ddiodefodd yn enbyd yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau yr haf hwn.

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oes angen y bartneriaeth wledig arnoch i ddweud wrthyech fod busnesau gwledig yn wynebu methdaliad bob dydd yng Nghymru wledig. Pam na ellir dwyn hyn gerbron y Cynulliad yn awr? Mae'n enghraifft arall o ddiffyg cyfeiriad. Profwyd hyn hefyd gyda'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid yw llawer o Aelodau eich plaid am ddefnyddio'r fenter cyllid preifat, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ond yr ydych chi heddiw fel pe baech yn ymrywmo eich hun iddo. Mae hynny'n newyddion da; gobeithio bod Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn rhannu'r farn honno. Mae'r diffyg cyfeiriad hwnnw yn amlwg hefyd yn y cytundeb partneriaeth: mae hanner Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad yn ei gasáu, a'r hanner arall yn ei dderbyn yn gyndyn, ond yr ydych chi yn dal eich gafael ynddo, gan ei fod yn cynnig dihangfa i chi.

Fe'ch cyhuddais o ddiffyg cyfeiriad. Efallai y dylwn dynnu hynny'n ôl. Mae'n amlwg fod eich gweinyddiaeth yn mynd ar ei phen i uffern mewn berfa.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Soniasoch am ddiffyg cyfeiriad, ond, yn gyntaf, creasoch yr argraff eich bod yn pryderu o ddifrif am fusnesau twristiaeth yng nghanolbarth Cymru. Yna, wrth gwrs, yr oedd yn rhaid i chi ddechrau gwneud sylwadau gwawdlyd a dirmygus, rhywbeth yr ydych yn arbenigo ynddo. Naill ai yr ydych am inni ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn y ceisiwn ei wneud i ailadeiladu'r diwydiant twristiaeth yng nghanolbarth Cymru—yn ddiamau, yr ydych yn hoff o greu'r argraff bod gennych ddiddordeb yn hynny pan fyddwch yng nghanolbarth Cymru—neu ddim. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych agenda arall ar breifateiddio ac ati. Dyna'r hyn a gredwch mewn gwirionedd, er gwaethaf y ffug wlyo ynglŷn â'r diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'r cyfan yn ymwneud â phreifateiddio.

**Effaith 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf' ar Ddwyrain De Cymru**  
**Effects of 'Putting Wales First' on South East Wales**

**Q8 William Graham:** Will the First Minister make a statement concerning how the implementation of the policies outlined in 'Putting Wales First: A Partnership for the People of Wales' have affected south-east Wales? (OAQ12671)

**The First Minister:** South-east Wales has half the population of Wales and half the gross domestic product. However, it is also a region of Wales that has a wide contrast between rich and poor sub regions. Residents in all parts of south-east Wales will share in the benefits of the introduction of free dental checks and prescriptions for young people under 25, the provision of free school milk for all key stage 1 pupils and free entry to museums in Wales. However, the Communities First programme and the Health Inequalities Fund are examples of targeted action where particular areas in south-east Wales that are lagging behind the other areas will be the prime beneficiaries.

**William Graham:** The temporarily suspended Deputy First Minister—the co-author of 'Putting Wales First'—said some weeks ago that it was only at the beginning of this month that consultants had been appointed to consider creating new, real jobs for Corus. Will you now take the opportunity to demonstrate your commitment to those people made redundant at Llanwern and ensure that these posts are made available to them at the first opportunity?

**The First Minister:** The consultancy exercise has a medium-term agenda of considering how employment opportunities, residential opportunities and transportation links between the different areas of south-east Wales, and Gwent in particular, relate to each other. However, that does not in any way inhibit the immediate efforts to try to create additional jobs in Newport and Ebbw Vale. I was pleased, although it is perhaps small comfort for those in Corus, that we received good news about the LG Electronics Wales

**C8 William Graham:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ynghylch sut y mae gweithredu'r polisïau a amlinellir yn 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf: Partneriaeth ar gyfer Pobl Cymru' wedi effeithio ar dde-ddwyrain Cymru? (OAQ12671)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** De-ddwyrain Cymru sydd â hanner poblogaeth Cymru a hanner y cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn rhanbarth o Gymru sydd â gwahaniaethau mawr rhwng is-ranbarthau cyfoethog a thlawd. Bydd trigolion ym mhob rhan o dde-ddwyrain Cymru yn rhannu'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl cyflwyno archwiliadau deintyddol a phresgripsiynau am ddim i bobl ifanc o dan 25 oed, darparu llaeth am ddim i holl ddisgyblion ysgol cyfnod allweddol 1 a mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhaglen Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r Gronfa Anghydraddoldebau Iechyd yn enghreifftiau o weithgaredd wedi'i dargedu lle y bydd ardaloedd arbennig o dde-ddwyrain Cymru ar ei hôl hi o gymharu ag ardaloedd eraill ar eu hennill.

**William Graham:** Rai wythnosau yn ôl, dywedodd Dirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru sydd wedi ei wahardd dros dro—cyd-awdur 'Rhoi Cymru'n Gyntaf'—mai dim ond ar ddechrau'r mis hwn y penodwyd ymgynghorwyr i ystyried creu swyddi newydd, gwirioneddol ar gyfer Corus. A ddefnyddiwch y cyfle yn awr i ddangos eich ymrwymiad i'r bobl hynny a ddiswyddwyd yn Llanwern a sicrhau y bydd y swyddi hyn ar gael iddynt cyn gynted â phosibl?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gan yr ymarfer ymgynghori agenda ar gyfer y tymor canolig o edrych ar y berthynas rhwng cyfleoedd cyflogaeth, cyfleoedd preswyl a chysylltiadau trafndiaeth rhwng gwahanol ardaloedd yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, a Gwent yn arbennig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd yn amharu ar yr ymdrechion presennol i geisio creu swyddi ychwanegol yng Nghasnewydd a Glynebwy. Yr oeddwn yn falch, er nad yw o bosibl yn fawr o gysur i'r rheini yn Corus, inni dderbyn newyddion da

Ltd Consortium that safeguards 1,600 jobs in Newport in TV cathode-ray production.

ynghlŷn ag LG Electronics Wales Ltd Consortium sydd yn diogelu 1,600 o swyddi yng Nghasnewydd mewn cynhyrchu pelydrau cathod ar gyfer y teledu.

### **Effeithiau Ehangu'r UE ar Gymru Effects of EU Enlargement on Wales**

**Q9 Phil Williams:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the Secretary of State for Wales regarding the effects of European Union enlargement on Wales? (OAQ12659)

**C9 Phil Williams:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi'u cael gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynghylch effeithiau ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ar Gymru? (OAQ12659)

**The First Minister:** I have regular discussions with the Secretary of State for Wales about a wide variety of issues, usually on a weekly or daily basis. They include subjects such as the effects of EU enlargement on Wales. Assembly administration officials are also in regular contact with their Whitehall colleagues on enlargement issues. I last took part in a joint ministerial video conference on Europe on 1 March and enlargement was one of the issues that was discussed on that occasion.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddaf yn cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar amrywiaeth eang o faterion, yn wythnosol neu'n ddyddiol fel arfer. Maent yn cynnwys pynciau megis effeithiau ehangu'r UE ar Gymru. Bydd swyddogion gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â'u cyfoedion yn Whitehall ar faterion ehangu. Cymerais ran mewn cynhadledd fideo cyd-weinidogol ar Ewrop ar 1 Mawrth ac ehangu oedd un o'r materion a drafodwyd ar yr achlysur hwnnw.

**Phil Williams:** You are aware of the EU's twinning initiative to provide technical assistance to candidate countries. However, at the recent European Affairs Committee, we were informed that the participation of Wales has been,

**Phil Williams:** Yr ydych yn ymwybodol o fenter gefeillio'r UE i ddarparu cymorth technegol i wledydd sydd yn ymgeisio. Fodd bynnag, yn y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd yn ddiweddar, fe'm hysbyswyd y bu cyfranogiad Cymru yn,

'modest when compared with other parts of the UK, for example with Scotland, and above all, when compared with parts of Europe such as Germany'.

Do you accept that that could be a serious lost opportunity and what steps are you and the Secretary of State for Wales taking to ensure a much greater participation of Wales within the UK's relatively active involvement?

A dderbyniwch y gallai hynny olygu colli cyfle gwirioneddol a pha gamau yr ydych chi ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn eu cymryd i sicrhau llawer mwy o gyfraniad gan Gymru o fewn cyfraniad eithaf gweithgar y DU?

**The First Minister:** For that reason, Assembly officials undertook twinning missions to Poland and Hungary in April. We are maintaining regular contact with Assembly officials and with the foreign and commonwealth officials on enlargement issues. The key issue is that at some stage—and it will be over the next few months, I emphasise the word, 'few'—we must decide with whom to twin at a political level. The missing link, to which I believe you refer,

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Am y rheswm hwnnw, trefnodd swyddogion y Cynulliad deithiau gefeillio i Wlad Pwyl a Hwngari ym mis Ebrill. Yr ydym yn cadw cysylltiad rheolaidd â swyddogion y Cynulliad ac â'r swyddogion tramor a'r gymanwlad ar faterion ehangu. Y mater allweddol yw y bydd angen inni rywbryd—dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, a phwysleisiaf y gair, 'ychydig'—benderfynu â phwy i efeillio ar lefel wleidyddol. Y cyswllt coll, y tybiaf y



Phil, is the question of putting together a package of private, public and voluntary sector consultancies who sell 'know-how' and are funded to sell it from the European Commission's Phare programme and, maybe, the Foreign and Commonwealth Offices's 'know-how' fund as well. I accept that we are behind Scotland in that regard and we will do our best to put that right.

**Peter Rogers:** Do you accept that the EU enlargement poses a real threat to Welsh agriculture, especially as the eastern European countries will have access to cheap land and labour, making it impossible for us to compete on basic commodities? Do you also accept that that will lead to further job losses in agriculture—we have seen 50,000 in the last two years—a move to larger farming units and also to much more small, part-time farming in Wales? Will you outline how you intend to protect rural Wales from the dark clouds that are gathering around EU enlargement?

2:40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** That is the \$64 million question. If countries such as Poland are brought in to the EU, will the common agricultural policy be based on price support or unlimited production of standardised commodities? Such countries have a large, low-cost peasant labour force, and are only slowly catching up with standards in western Europe. CAP will be expensive if it is retained in its present form. On the other hand, if it is taken away or if CAP policies were scrapped or completely reformed, joining the European Community would seem to be much less attractive to countries such as Poland.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10 has been withdrawn.

cyfeiriwch ato, Phil, yw'r cwestiwn o greu pecyn o ymgynghoriadau preifat, cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol sydd yn gwerthu 'gwybodaeth' ac sydd wedi eu hariannu i'w werthu o raglen Phare y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, ac, efallai, gronfa wybodaeth y Swyddfa Dramor a'r Gymanwlad hefyd. Derbyniaf ein bod ar ei hôl hi o gymharu â'r Alban yn hynny o beth a gwnawn ein gorau i unioni hynny.

**Peter Rogers:** A dderbyniwch fod ehangu'r UE yn fygythiad gwirioneddol i amaethyddiaeth Cymru, yn arbennig gan y bydd gan wledydd dwyrain Ewrop fynediad i diroedd a llafur rhad, gan ei gwneud yn amhosibl inni gystadlu ar nwyddau sylfaenol? A dderbyniwch hefyd y bydd hynny yn arwain at golli mwy o swyddi amaethyddol—gwelwyd colli 50,000 yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf—symudiad tuag at unedau ffermio mwy a hefyd tuag at lawer mwy o ffermio rhan-amser ar raddfa lai yng Nghymru? A amlinellwch sut y bwriadwch ddiogelu Cymru wledig rhag y cymylau duon sydd yn casglu uwchben ehangu'r UE?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyna'r cwestiwn mawr. Os caiff gwledydd megis Gwlad Pwyl eu cynnwys yn yr UE, a fydd y polisi amaethyddiaeth cyffredin (CAP) yn seiliedig ar gymorth prisiau neu gynhyrchu nwyddau safonol yn ddi-ddiwedd? Mae gan wledydd o'r fath weithlu gwerinol mawr cost isel, ac maent yn araf iawn yn cyrraedd safonau gorllewin Ewrop. Bydd CAP yn ddrud os caiff ei gadw yn ei ffurf bresennol. Ar y llaw arall, os caiff ei ddiddymu neu pe bai polisïau CAP yn cael eu dileu neu eu diwygio, byddai ymuno â'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn ymddangos yn llawer llai deniadol i wledydd megis Gwlad Pwyl.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 10 yn ôl.

### **Perthynas Rhwng y Cabinet a'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc Relationship between the Cabinet and the Subject Committees**

**Q11 Pauline Jarman:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the relationship between his Cabinet colleagues and the

**C11 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar y berthynas rhwng ei gyd-aelodau yn y Cabinet a'r

Subject Committees? (OAQ12668)

**The First Minister:** All Cabinet Ministers sit on their relevant Subject Committees.

**Pauline Jarman:** What discussions have you had with the Cabinet since one of your Ministers suggested that papers that are presented in evidence to committees should be vetted? How would that contribute towards open and inclusive government?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that you understand the issue. No attempt is made to vet contributions. Certain controversial papers may be considered by Committee Chairs, the Cabinet and the clerk before they are sent to committees, but that is nothing to do with the administration.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The relationship between Subject Committees and the Assembly is important, particularly when Subject Committee review reports are being considered. Several months ago, 'A Culture in Common' was merely noted by the Assembly. If the Government had any backbone, the report would have been approved by the Assembly.

As you know, a higher education review is being conducted and its important report should be endorsed by the Assembly in the winter after it has been considered in full Plenary session. Will the Government endorse the report when it is considered in Plenary?

**The First Minister:** It would be premature to anticipate the results of a debate or to set the terms of a motion for a debate that is three months hence.

**Rod Richards:** Does the Government of Wales hold the Chairs of Subject Committees in the same high regard as the Westminster Government holds the Chairs of Select Committees?

**The First Minister:** I have no basis for making a comparison. However, I am a former Select Committee Chair in the House of Commons and I welcome the evidence of the continued independence of the House of

Pwyllgorau Pwnc? (OAQ12668)

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae pob Gweinidog yn y Cabinet yn eistedd ar eu Pwyllgorau Pwnc perthnasol.

**Pauline Jarman:** Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Cabinet ers i un o'ch Gweinidogion awgrymu y dylai papurau a gyflwynir mewn tystiolaeth i bwyllgorau gael eu harchwilio? Sut y byddai hynny yn cyfrannu at lywodraeth agored a chynhwysol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn deall y mater. Ni wneir unrhyw ymgais i archwilio cyfraniadau. Efallai y caiff rhai materion dadleuol eu hystyried gan Gadeiryddion Pwyllgorau, y Cabinet a'r clerck cyn eu hanfon i'r pwyllgorau, ond nid oes â wnelo hynny â'r weinyddiaeth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'r berthynas rhwng Pwyllgorau Pwnc a'r Cynulliad yn bwysig, yn arbennig pan ystyrir adroddiadau adolygiad Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Rai misoedd yn ôl, dim ond ei nodi gan y Cynulliad a gafodd 'Diwylliant Cytûn'. Pe bai gan y Llywodraeth asgwrn cefn o gwbl, byddai'r adroddiad wedi cael ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad.

Fel y gwyddoch, cynhelir adolygiad o addysg uwch, a dylai'r adroddiad pwysig arno gael ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad yn y gaeaf ar ôl ei ystyried mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. A wnaiff y Llywodraeth gymeradwyo'r adroddiad pan gaiff ei ystyried mewn Cyfarfod Llawn?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n rhy gynnar rhagweld canlyniad dadl neu osod telerau cynnig ar gyfer dadl na fydd yn digwydd am dri mis.

**Rod Richards:** A yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn dangos yr un parch uchel tuag at Gadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Pwnc ag y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn ei ddangos tuag at Gadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Dethol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes gennyf unrhyw sail dros wneud cymhariaeth. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn gyn-Gadeirydd Pwyllgor Dethol yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin a chroesawaf dystiolaeth o barhad annibyniaeth Tŷ'r

Commons, its Select Committees and the Chairs of Select Committees.

Cyffredin, ei Bwyllgorau Dethol a Chadeiryddion Pwyllgorau Dethol.

### ‘Wales in the World’

**Q12 Geraint Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the recommendations for the National Assembly made in the House of Commons Select Committee on Welsh Affairs report, ‘Wales in the World: The Role of the UK Government in Promoting Wales Abroad’? (OAQ12669)

**C12 Geraint Davies:** A wnaiff Prif Weinidog Cymru ddatganiad ar yr argymhellion ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a wnaethpwyd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ‘Wales in the World: The Role of the UK Government in Promoting Wales Abroad’? (OAQ12669)

**The First Minister:** We will respond to the recommendations shortly. Many of the recommendations are made jointly to the Assembly and the UK Government. That is proper for the House of Commons Welsh Affairs Committee. We will consider our response in close liaison with the Wales Office and other relevant Government departments such as the Foreign and Commonwealth Office, which administers the British Council.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Byddwn yn ymateb i'r argymhellion cyn bo hir. Gwneir nifer o'r argymhellion i'r Cynulliad ac i Lywodraeth y DU ar y cyd. Mae hynny'n briodol ar gyfer Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig Tŷ'r Cyffredin. Byddwn yn ystyried ein hymateb ar ôl trafodaeth fanwl â Swyddfa Cymru ac adrannau perthnasol eraill y Llywodraeth megis y Swyddfa Dramor a'r Gymanwlad, sydd yn gweinyddu'r Cyngor Prydeinig.

**Geraint Davies:** One of the recommendations states that a strategy should be developed

**Geraint Davies:** Mae un o'r argymhellion yn datgan y dylid datblygu strategaeth

‘for promoting Wales as a first-choice destination for foreign visitors to the UK. This should involve working with tour operators which bring foreign tourists into the country to try to persuade them to include Wales on more of their itineraries, and working with UK transport providers (such as the train operating companies) to promote the provision of efficient, affordable transport links between Wales and other UK tourist destinations.’

Has any progress been made in achieving such aims?

A wnaethpwyd unrhyw gynnydd i gyflawni'r amcanion hynny?

**The First Minister:** I was pleased that the President of the Society of American Travel Writers said a couple of days ago that he thought that the flow of American tourists was beginning to return as a result of much less coverage of foot and mouth disease in Wales than in March and April. A couple of months ago, the Society of American Travel Writers had an extremely successful conference in Cardiff.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Llywydd Cymdeithas Awduron Teithio America wedi dweud ddeuddydd yn ôl fod y llif o dwristiaid Americanaidd yn dechrau dychwelyd o ganlyniad i lawer llai o sylw i glwy'r traed a'r genau yng Nghymru nag ym Mawrth ac Ebrill. Tua deufis yn ôl, cafodd Cymdeithas Awduron Teithio America gynhadledd lwyddiannus iawn yng Nghaerdydd.

Kim Howells raised the key issue, although the language that he used was somewhat inflammatory. However, he is right in a way. The strong pound causes problems and London hotels can seem very expensive to

Cododd Kim Howells y mater allweddol, er bod yr iaith a ddefnyddiodd ychydig yn ymfflamychol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n iawn mewn ffordd. Mae'r bunt gref yn creu problemau a gall gwestai Llundain

non-American visitors. Such factors often put people off visiting London and the rest of the country. London is their prime gateway. We need to persuade people that, after they land at Heathrow, they do not have to turn right along the M4 and pay £150 a night in an hotel in London; instead, they should turn left and come to Wales, where they would get much better value for money for their dollar, yen, Deutschmark or whatever.

ymddangos yn ddruod iawn i ymwelwyr o'r tu allan i America. Mae ffactorau o'r fath yn darbwyllo pobl i beidio ag ymweld â Llundain a gweddill y wlad. Llundain yw eu prif borth. Mae angen inni ddarbwyllo pobl nad oes angen iddynt droi i'r dde ar hyd yr M4 ar ôl glanio yn Heathrow a thalu £150 y noson am westy yn Llundain; yn hytrach dylent droi i'r chwith a dod i Gymru, lle y gallent gael llawer gwell gwerth am eu doleri, yen, Deutschmark neu beth bynnag.

### **Datganiad ar Adroddiad McKenzie Statement on the McKenzie Report**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I am pleased to present the report 'Lifting Every Voice', which is dedicated to the memory of Stephen Lawrence. It is important to begin with the dedication because the death of that young man and the subsequent report into the investigation of his death have meant that all organisations have had to turn the microscope on themselves.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad 'Lifting Every Voice', er cof am Stephen Lawrence. Mae'n bwysig dechrau gyda'r cyflwyniad gan fod marwolaeth y gŵr ifanc hwnnw a'r adroddiad dilynol ar yr ymchwiliad i'w farwolaeth wedi golygu y bu'n rhaid i bob sefydliad droi'r chwyddwydr arnynt eu hunain.

All organisations—not only the Metropolitan police—have a new momentum to identify and challenge institutional racism within their structures and within the organisations over which they have some influence. The National Assembly for Wales is no different in that respect.

Mae gan bob sefydliad—nid dim ond heddlu Llundain—fomentwm newydd i nodi a herio hiliaeth sefydliadol o fewn eu strwythurau ac o fewn y sefydliadau y mae ganddynt rywfaint o ddylanwad drostynt. Nid yw Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn wahanol o gwbl yn hynny o beth.

'Lifting Every Voice' is a comprehensive report that represents the beginning of the Assembly's process of getting to grips with the under-representation of black staff within our organisation, and with the cultural change that is needed if change will be real and fundamental.

Mae 'Lifting Every Voice' yn adroddiad cynhwysfawr sydd yn cynrychioli dechrau proses y Cynulliad o fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith y tangynrychiolir staff du o fewn ein sefydliad, ac â'r newid diwylliannol sydd ei angen er mwyn i'r newid fod yn real ac yn sylfaenol.

Roger McKenzie, who is now the Race Equality Officer for the Trades Union Congress, wrote the report. It is the product of a partnership project between the Assembly and the Public and Commercial Services union, which represents the majority of the Assembly's staff. I am proud that we were able to work in partnership with PCS.

Roger McKenzie, sydd bellach yn Swyddog Cydraddoldeb Hiliol Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur, a ysgrifennodd yr adroddiad. Mae'n gynnyrch prosiect partneriaeth rhwng y Cynulliad a'r undeb Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol (PCS), sydd yn cynrychioli'r mwyafrif o staff y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn falch inni allu gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r PCS.

The report is the beginning of the process, not the end.

Dechrau'r broses yw'r adroddiad, nid y diwedd.

Racism—institutional or otherwise—can only be successfully challenged if we all stand together regardless of the other differences that we may have. Racism divides us as individuals and divides our communities. Racism only serves the interests of those anti-democratic forces that want to sow division and discord in our society. That must be one of the big lessons to be learned from the disturbances in some towns in northern England, in which the parties of the far right have sought to benefit from dividing communities against each other.

Wales has a proud tradition of diversity: Cardiff is home to one of the oldest black communities in the United Kingdom. We are proud of that fact and want to ensure that all the people of Wales are able to play a full and active role in the life of this country. We want to ensure that—as the report says—every voice can be heard.

The report's recommendations on the Assembly's employment policies and practices and training and structural arrangements have been considered in detail by an implementation group that was chaired by Roger McKenzie. The implementation group included senior Assembly officials, trade union representatives and representatives of the Commission for Racial Equality, the Equal Opportunities Commission and the Disability Rights Commission.

Although the report focused on identifying and challenging institutional racism, it is clear that there are many areas of crossover to other areas of inequality. The implementation group has made that connection and I fully endorse that approach.

Senior officials within the Assembly—in particular the Permanent Secretary—have supported the process. There has been a clear recognition that challenging inequality is not an event but a process, which requires commitment for the long term. That is reflected within the report and within the work of the implementation group.

Dim ond os safwn oll gyda'n gilydd, beth bynnag fo'r gwahaniaethau eraill rhyngom, y gellir herio hiliaeth—boed yn sefydliadol neu fel arall—yn llwyddiannus. Fe'n gwahenir gan hiliaeth fel unigolion a chymunedau. Dim ond hybu buddiannau'r grymoedd gwrth-ddemocrataidd hynny sydd am hau ymrannu ac anghytgord yn ein cymdeithas a wna hiliaeth. Rhaid bod hynny'n un o'r gwersi mawr i'w dysgu o'r cythrwfl mewn rhai trefi yng ngogledd Lloegr, lle y ceisiodd pleidiau'r asgell dde eithafol elwa ar rannu cymunedau a'u troi yn erbyn ei gilydd.

Mae gan Gymru draddodiad o amrywiaeth y mae'n ymfalchïo ynddo: mae Caerdydd yn gartref i un o'r cymunedau duon hynaf o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ymfalchïwn yn y ffaith honno ac yr ydym am sicrhau y gall holl bobl Cymru chwarae rôl gyflawn a gweithredol ym mywyd y wlad hon. Yr ydym am sicrhau—fel y dywed yr adroddiad—clywir llais pawb.

Ystyriwyd argymhellion yr adroddiad ar bolisiau ac arferion cyflogaeth y Cynulliad ynghyd â'i drefniadau hyfforddi a strwythurol yn fanwl gan grŵp gweithredu a gadeiriwyd gan Roger McKenzie. Yr oedd y grŵp gweithredu yn cynnwys uwch swyddogion y Cynulliad, cynrychiolwyr undebau llafur a chynrychiolwyr y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal a Chomisiwn Hawliau'r Anabl.

Er i'r adroddiad ganolbwyntio ar nodi a herio hiliaeth sefydliadol, mae'n amlwg bod llawer o feysydd sydd yn gorgyffwrdd â meysydd eraill o anghydraddoldeb. Mae'r grŵp gweithredu wedi gwneud y cysylltiad hwnnw a chymeradwyaf yr ymagwedd honno yn llwyr.

Mae uwch swyddogion o fewn y Cynulliad—a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn arbennig—wedi cefnogi'r broses. Cydnabuwyd yn glir nad digwyddiad yw herio anghydraddoldeb ond proses, sydd yn galw am ymrwymiad hirdymor. Adlewyrchir hynny o fewn yr adroddiad ac o fewn gwaith y grŵp gweithredu.

As Assembly Members, we must recognise our responsibilities. It is not only the Assembly's senior officials and staff who need to engage in the process; we also must exercise our leadership role by what we say and what we do and by how we say things and how we carry out our business.

We must always ask ourselves what we can do to contribute to equality. We need to do that, not because of some ridiculous notion of political correctness, but because it is the right thing to do. In this day and age, it simply cannot be right for the talent, skills and experience that exist in communities throughout this country to be wasted and ignored simply because a person happens to be black, a woman, disabled or lesbian or gay. To allow that to happen would, it strikes me, be irresponsible and just plain stupid.

We must also be mindful that we can influence many other organisations—not only those that we fund, but also many others in the private and voluntary sectors. Within the confines of the law, we must use our influence to bring about change on equality.

Although, along with other organisations in the public services, we are covered by the general duties of the new Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000, there is an opportunity for all private and voluntary sector organisations in Wales to commit to the Act's requirements. That means that we need to take steps to eliminate race discrimination from the functions of such organisations and positively promote good race relations.

Already, the TUC, which is the largest voluntary organisation in the UK, has signalled its compliance with the legislation. I hope that others will do the same.

The action plan of 'Lifting Every Voice' is part of our contribution as a major public service organisation to complying with the terms of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. We will continually review the organisation, setting up an action plan for

Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, rhaid inni gydnabod ein cyfrifoldebau. Nid dim ond uwch swyddogion a staff y Cynulliad sydd angen ymrwymo i'r broses; rhaid inni hefyd ymarfer ein rôl arweiniol drwy'r hyn a ddywedwn a'r hyn a wnawn a thrwy'r ffordd y dywedwn bethau a'r ffordd y cynhaliwn ein busnes.

Rhaid inni ofyn i'n gilydd beth y gallwn ei wneud er mwyn cyfrannu at gydraddoldeb. Mae angen inni wneud hynny, nid oherwydd rhyw syniad chwerthinllyd o gywirdeb gwleidyddol, ond am mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud. Yn yr oes sydd ohoni, ni all fod yn iawn i wastraffu neu anwybyddu talent, sgiliau a phrofiad sydd yn bodoli mewn cymunedau ledled y wlad hon dim ond oherwydd bod person yn digwydd bod yn ddu, yn fenyw, yn anabl neu'n lesbiad neu'n hoyw. Byddai caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd, yn fy marn i, yn anghyfrifol ac yn hollol dwp.

Rhaid inni gofio y gallwn ddylanwadu ar lawer o sefydliadau eraill—nid yn unig y rheini a ariannwn, ond llawer o rai eraill hefyd o fewn y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol. O fewn cyfyngiadau'r gyfraith, rhaid inni ddefnyddio ein dylanwad er mwyn sicrhau newid ym maes cydraddoldeb.

Er ein bod, ynghyd â sefydliadau eraill o fewn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn ddarostyngedig i ddyletswyddau cyffredinol y Ddeddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000 newydd, mae cyfle i bob un o sefydliadau'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol yng Nghymru ymrwymo i ofynion y Ddeddf. Golyga hynny fod angen inni gymryd camau i ddiddymu achosion o wahaniaethu ar sail hil o swyddogaethau sefydliadau o'r fath a hyrwyddo cysylltiadau hiliol da mewn ffordd gadarnhaol.

Eisoës, mae'r TUC, sef sefydliad gwirfoddol mwyaf y DU, wedi dangos ei fod yn cydymffurfio â'r ddeddfwriaeth. Gobeithiaf y gwna eraill yr un fath.

Mae cynllun gweithredu 'Lifting Every Voice' yn rhan o'n cyfraniad fel sefydliad gwasanaeth cyhoeddus mawr tuag at gydymffurfio â thermau Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000. Adolygwn y sefydliad yn barhaus, gan lunio cynllun

change; monitoring how we meet the challenges that we set ourselves; developing tough and achievable targets for progress: these are a few of the building blocks for change. The Assembly has the real opportunity to become an exemplar for race equality. That must be our target. We must be determined to achieve real and fundamental change. There are no fast and easy solutions for challenging racism. This administration, and every Assembly Member, will join me in the determination to lift every voice in our community.

2:50 p.m.

Equality benefits all of us, not just those who currently suffer discrimination of whatever kind. The implementation of this report will ensure that everyone in Wales—to quote the late and great Martin Luther King junior—‘will not be judged by the colour of their skin but by the content of their character.’

**Helen Mary Jones:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I strongly endorse everything that you have said about the dangers and waste inherent in perpetuating inequality, the positive benefits for all of us in promoting equality and, most importantly, our shared responsibility for promoting justice and equality. I echo your thanks to the PCS for its support for carrying this work forward.

We welcome and strongly endorse the report’s recommendations. I have some questions regarding its implementation. First, what role will the Committee on Equality of Opportunity have in monitoring the report’s implementation? This is primarily a matter for the Executive. However, the Committee would want to have a role. Your statement talked of the Assembly becoming an exemplar and perhaps a beacon of good practice. We all endorse that strongly. What specific plans do you have to shine that beacon’s light across, in particular, Assembly sponsored public bodies and local government? Can you assure us that the report’s excellent recommendations, particularly as regards recruitment and

gweithredu ar gyfer newid; monitro sut y cyflawnwn yr heriau a bennwyd gennym ar ein cyfer ni ein hunain; datblygu targedau anodd a chyflawnadwy ar gyfer cynnydd: dyma rai o’r elfennau ar gyfer newid. Y Cynulliad sydd â’r cyfle gwirioneddol i fod yn esiampl o ran cydraddoldeb hiliol. Rhaid i hynny fod yn darged inni. Rhaid inni fod yn benderfynol o gyflawni newid gwirioneddol a sylfaenol. Nid oes atebion cyflym a hawdd i herio hiliaeth. Ymuna’r weinyddiaeth hon, a phob Aelod o’r Cynulliad, â mi yn y penderfyniad i godi pob llais o fewn ein cymuned.

Mae cydraddoldeb o fudd i bawb ohonom, nid dim ond y rheini y gwahaniaethir yn eu herbyn ym mha ffordd bynnag ar hyn o bryd. Bydd gweithredu’r adroddiad hwn yn sicrhau y bernir pawb yng Nghymru—i ddyfynnu’r diweddar ŵr mawr Martin Luther King yr ieuaf—‘nid yn ôl lliw eu croen ond yn ôl natur eu cymeriad.’

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Cymeradwyaf yn gryf bopeth a ddywedasoeh ynglŷn â’r peryglon a’r gwastraff sydd ynghlwm wrth ganiatáu i anghydraddoldeb barhau, y buddiannau cadarnhaol i bawb ohonom wrth hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb ac, yn bwysicaf oll, y cyfrifoldeb a rannwn dros hyrwyddo cyfiawnder a chydraddoldeb. Adleisiaf eich diolch i’r PCS am ei gymorth wrth ddatblygu’r gwaith hwn.

Croesawn argymhellion yr adroddiad ac fe’i cymeradwywn yn gryf. Mae gennyf rai cwestiynau o ran ei weithredu. Yn gyntaf, beth fydd rôl y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wrth fonitro’r ffordd y gweithredir yr adroddiad? Mae hwn yn fater i’r Weithrediaeth yn bennaf. Fodd bynnag, byddai’r Pwyllgor am gael rôl. Soniasoch yn eich datganiad am y Cynulliad yn dod yn batrwm ac efallai yn esiampl o arfer da. Cymeradwywn oll hynny’n gryf. Pa gynlluniau penodol sydd gennych i drosglwyddo’r patrwm hwnnw ar draws cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yn arbennig, a llywodraeth leol? A allwch ein sicrhau na rwystir argymhellion gwych yr adroddiad, yn arbennig o ran recriwtio a dethol, gan law farw arfer

selection, will not be held back by the dead hand of traditional civil service practice? If you encounter any interference of that kind, will you undertake to inform the Assembly, so that we can all support you in ensuring that that does not happen? Finally, do you agree with me that it behoves all of us, and particularly Assembly Members, to be careful how we discuss race issues, at such a sensitive time? Will you join me in condemning the British National Party for its plans to bring its message of hate to Wales this summer?

**Edwina Hart:** The whole Chamber condemns the British National Party and its campaign of racial hatred, which seems to be gaining momentum across the country. Let us hope that it does not darken Wales. There have already been some incidents. There have been demonstrations against the BNP in Swansea, at which some Assembly Members were present. It is important that we are vigilant and that we use language cautiously. We must recognise that, at this time, one word from us could give the wrong impression.

There is a role for the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. I hope that the Permanent Secretary will update the Committee regularly on the implementation of the McKenzie report. Members' contributions will be useful for the Permanent Secretary and his officials as barometers of progress and also in inputting helpful suggestions. As an exemplar, once we put our own house in order, it is incumbent upon us to consider all aspects of Assembly sponsored public bodies and local government. I have had serious discussions with local government regarding the establishment of equality units. I hope that once they are established they will take forward the Assembly's work on the McKenzie report into local government. I intend to write to all Ministers with responsibility for ASPBs so that the report's message can reach those bodies. There is also a role for the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to monitor how the ASPBs adopt the best practice outlined in the McKenzie report.

On recruitment and selection no Assembly

gwasanaeth sifil traddodiadol? Os dewch ar draws unrhyw ymyrraeth o'r math hwnnw, a addawch hysbysu'r Cynulliad, er mwyn inni i gyd allu eich cefnogi wrth sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd? Yn olaf, a gytunwch â mi y dylem oll, ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn arbennig, fod yn ofalus sut y trafodwn faterion hiliol, ar adeg mor sensitif? A ymunwch â mi wrth gondemnio'r Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig (BNP) a'i chynlluniau i ddod â'i neges o gasineb i Gymru yr haf hwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Condemnia'r Siambr gyfan y Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig a'i hymgyrch o gasineb hiliol, sydd, fe ymddengys, yn ennill tir ar draws y wlad. Gobeithiwn na thywylla Gymru. Bu rhai achosion eisoes. Bu gwrthdystiadau yn erbyn y BNP yn Abertawe, lle yr oedd rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn bresennol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod ar ein gwylidwraeth ac y defnyddiwn iaith yn ochelgar. Rhaid inni gydnabod y gallai un gair gennym, ar hyn o bryd, greu'r argraff anghywir.

Mae rôl ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Gobeithiaf y rhydd yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol newyddion rheolaidd i'r Pwyllgor ar y ffordd y gweithredir adroddiad McKenzie. Bydd cyfraniadau'r Aelodau yn ddefnyddiol i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol a'i swyddogion fel mesuryddion cynnydd a hefyd wrth gynnig awgrymiadau buddiol. Fel esiampl, unwaith y byddwn wedi rhoi ein tŷ ein hunain mewn trefn, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried holl agweddau'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol. Cefais drafodaethau dwys gyda llywodraeth leol ynglŷn â sefydlu unedau cydraddoldeb. Gobeithiaf, unwaith y cânt eu sefydlu, y datblygant waith y Cynulliad ar adroddiad McKenzie o fewn llywodraeth leol. Bwriadaf ysgrifennu at bob Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad er mwyn i neges yr adroddiad allu cyrraedd y cyrff hynny. Mae rôl hefyd ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, sef monitro sut y gall y cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad fabwysiadu'r arfer gorau a amlinellir yn adroddiad McKenzie.

O ran recriwtio a dethol ni fynnai un Aelod



Member nor I would wish to interfere with any good practice that may be introduced in Wales. The Permanent Secretary is also determined that we will have exemplar practice in terms of recruitment and selection. That is important. I hope that other UK administrations will take that message on board.

**Alun Pugh:** Do you agree that one lesson that can be learned from incidents in Bradford and Oldham is that school recruitment along racial lines is deeply divisive and unhelpful in building a just and tolerant society?

**Edwina Hart:** There are many lessons that we can learn from the difficulties that some communities across the UK are facing. I read with interest the report on school recruitment practices along racial lines. The issue must be addressed, but it is important to recognise that only when children mix from an early age and begin to understand each others' cultures do barriers start to break down.

**David Melding:** On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I welcome this report, the Minister's statement and her intense commitment to these issues. Her statement follows an interesting and worthwhile debate on the report in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity where it attracted all-party support. It contains many worthwhile, interesting and challenging recommendations that will, no doubt, stretch political parties, the civil service and other organisations. I welcome the call for open recruitment into the civil service for specific grades. Identifying specific jobs within specific grades is important and, while generic skills are needed in many areas of the civil service, that should not obscure the vast opportunity to recruit people with specific job skills for specific roles. I am pleased that we have not yet encountered the dead hand of civil service inertia, but rather effective engagement from the civil service in its recognition of the report's recommendations. Helen Mary read the riot act in the event of matters being reversed, but she welcomed the fact that we are making progress.

o'r Cynulliad na minnau ymyrryd ag unrhyw arfer da a allai gael ei gyflwyno yng Nghymru. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol hefyd yn benderfynol y cawn arfer enghreifftiol yn nhermau recriwtio a dethol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Gobeithiaf yr ystyria gweinyddiaethau eraill o fewn y DU y neges honno.

**Alun Pugh:** A gytunwch mai un wers y gellir ei dysgu oddi wrth ddiwyddiadau yn Bradford ac Oldham yw bod system recriwtio ysgolion ar hyd llinellau hiliol yn peri rhwyg ddofn ac yn anfuddiol yn y broses o greu cymdeithas gyfiawn a goddefol?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae llawer o wersi y gallwn eu dysgu o'r anawsterau y mae rhai cymunedau ar draws y DU yn eu hwynebu. Darllenais yr adroddiad ar arferion recriwtio mewn ysgolion ar hyd llinellau hiliol â diddordeb. Rhaid ymdrin â'r mater, ond mae'n bwysig cydnabod mai dim ond pan fydd plant yn cymysgu pan fyddant yn ifanc gan ddechrau deall diwylliannau ei gilydd y dechreuir dymchwel y gwahanfuriau.

**David Melding:** Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn, datganiad y Gweinidog a'i hymrwymiad cryf i'r materion hyn. Mae ei datganiad yn dilyn dadl ddiddorol a gwerth chweil ar yr adroddiad yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal lle y sicrhawyd cefnogaeth pob plaid. Mae'n cynnwys llawer o argymhellion gwerth chweil, diddorol a heriol a fydd, yn ddi-os, yn ymestyn pleidiau gwleidyddol, y gwasanaeth sifil a sefydliadau eraill. Croesawaf yr alwad am system recriwtio agored i'r gwasanaeth sifil ar gyfer graddau penodol. Mae nodi swyddi penodol o fewn graddau penodol yn bwysig ac, er bod angen sgiliau cyffredinol mewn llawer o feysydd yn y gwasanaeth sifil, ni ddylai hynny fwrw'r cyfle bendigedig i recriwtio pobl â sgiliau swydd penodol ar gyfer rolau penodol i'r cysgod. Yr wyf yn falch nad ydym eto wedi dod ar draws llaw farw llesgedd y gwasanaeth sifil. Yn hytrach, cafwyd ymrwymiad effeithiol gan y gwasanaeth sifil wrth iddo gydnabod argymhellion yr adroddiad. Darllenodd Helen Mary y ddeddf derfysg rhag ofn i bethau gael eu gwyrdroi, ond croesawodd y ffaith ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd.

I am cautious about the call for equal opportunities training for all Assembly Members. That is not possible because it is *ultra vires* and we do not have any such legal power. It would also impose a condition on our elected representatives that I consider to be inappropriate. I am completely committed to equal opportunities training and receive it regularly; I always have as an Assembly Member and I will continue to receive it. I also received extensive training when I worked in the voluntary sector. However, it is up to individual Members to ensure that they are well-briefed and well-trained on these issues and it is up to the public to scrutinise us on whether we can reflect their interests adequately by receiving such training. We could make progress if AMs involved in public appointments were required to take equal opportunities training. That is part of the equal opportunities agenda for improving public appointments. Minister, no doubt, you will join me in noting the emphasis that the private sector places on equality of opportunity because it realises that it adds to effective business.

**Edwina Hart:** From my private sector background, I know the level of equal opportunities training that is undertaken to ensure that it is at the core of recruitment practices. We can learn from the private sector and the vigorous way in which many companies have adopted practices. I accept your point that we would not be able to coerce people into training or make it mandatory. In the next Committee on Equality of Opportunity in October, we will need to discuss what we can do to assist Members on this. However, I agree that AMs who are involved in public appointments should receive equal opportunities training. The Presiding Officer has been supportive in encouraging Members to undertake such training, and I will ask him again if there is anything he can do to assist us in encouraging Members to do so.

When Committees decide who will take part in public appointments, it is possible for them to indicate whether they would expect those nominees to undergo this type of training as it

Petrusaf ynglŷn â'r alwad am hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal i bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Nid yw hynny'n bosibl am ei fod yn *ultra vires* ac nid oes gennym bŵer cyfreithiol o'r fath. Byddai hefyd yn rhoi amod ar ein cynrychiolwyr etholedig a ystyriaf yn amhriodol. Yr wyf yn gwbl ymrwymedig i hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal a chyfranogaf ohono yn rheolaidd; yr wyf wedi bod yn ymrwymedig i hynny bob amser fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad a pharhaf i gyfranogi ohono. Cefais hyfforddiant helaeth hefyd pan weithiais yn y sector gwirfoddol. Fodd bynnag, cyfrifoldeb Aelodau unigol yw sicrhau eu bod wedi eu briffio'n dda a'u hyfforddi'n helaeth ar y materion hyn a chyfrifoldeb y cyhoedd yw craffu arnom i weld pa un a allwn adlewyrchu eu buddiannau yn ddigonol drwy gyfranogi o hyfforddiant o'r fath. Gallem wneud cynnydd pe byddai'n ofynnol i AC sydd yn ymwneud â phenodiadau cyhoeddus ymgymryd â hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal. Mae hynny'n rhan o'r agenda cyfle cyfartal ar gyfer gwella penodiadau cyhoeddus. Weinidog, mae'n siŵr yr ymunwch â mi wrth nodi'r pwyslais a rydd y sector preifat ar gyfle cyfartal gan ei fod yn sylweddoli yr ychwanega at fusnes effeithiol.

**Edwina Hart:** O'm cefndir sector preifat, gwn beth yw lefel yr hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal yr ymgymeryd ag ef i sicrhau bod hynny wrth wraidd arferion recriwtio. Gallwn ddysgu o'r sector preifat a'r ffordd egniol y mabwysiadwyd arferion gan lawer o gwmnïau. Derbyniaf eich pwynt na allem wthio pobl i gael hyfforddiant na'i wneud yn orfodol. Yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal nesaf ym mis Hydref, bydd angen inni drafod beth y gallwn ei wneud i gynorthwyo'r Aelodau yn hyn o beth. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf y dylai AC sydd yn gysylltiedig â phenodiadau cyhoeddus gael hyfforddiant cyfle cyfartal. Bu'r Llywydd yn gefnogol gan annog Aelodau i ymgymryd â hyfforddiant o'r fath, a gofynnaf iddo eto a oes unrhyw beth y gall ei wneud i'n cynorthwyo wrth annog yr Aelodau i wneud hynny.

Pan fydd Pwyllgorau yn penderfynu pwy fydd yn cymryd rhan mewn penodiadau cyhoeddus, mae'n bosibl iddynt ddynodi a ddisgwylent i'r enwebeion hynny ymgymryd

would helpfully reinforce the messages in the McKenzie report. I welcome your comments on open recruitment because that is essential. It is certainly the best practice, and I wish the Permanent Secretary all the best in ensuring full implementation of those recommendations. It will bring about a more diverse workforce in the Assembly, with all the skills and abilities of the people of Wales who wish to apply for jobs in the civil service.

**Richard Edwards:** I welcome the report, its contents and the fact that it has attracted all-party support. Do you agree that promoting the equality agenda in general is a question of ethical correctness and not of political correctness and that, on a point of basic human decency, promoting racial equality in particular and preventing the evil of racism, be it institutional or otherwise, should transcend all other political concerns? Do you also agree that it is incumbent on each of us to have the courage and determination to pursue the recommendations of Roger McKenzie's report with the utmost vigour?

3:00 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I totally concur with Richard Edwards. In my view, it is an ethical and moral issue and has never been one of political correctness. It is for us to do the right things for the right reasons and to fight discrimination at its source everywhere we go. The Assembly has set a good example in dealing with such issues. I hope that our example will be appreciated and that, more importantly, people will understand that we as politicians are taking a lead and taking people in the right direction. Assembly Members need to reinforce those messages at every opportunity.

**David Davies:** Does the Minister agree that the vast majority of British people from all ethnic groups are very tolerant and that it is a shame that a small minority of whites, blacks and Asians are intolerant and guilty of racism? Does she agree that we must condemn not only them, but also those on the far right and the far left? They include extremist groups, such as the Anti-Nazi

â'r math hwn o hyfforddiant gan y byddai o gymorth wrth atgyfnerthu'r negeseuon yn adroddiad McKenzie. Croesawaf eich sylwadau ar recriwtio agored gan fod hynny'n hanfodol. Dyna'r arfer gorau yn sicr, a dymunaf yn dda i'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol wrth sicrhau y gweithredir yr argymhellion hynny yn llawn. Bydd yn arwain at weithlu mwy amrywiol o fewn y Cynulliad, gyda holl sgiliau a galluoedd pobl Cymru sydd yn dymuno gwneud cais am swyddi o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil.

**Richard Edwards:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad, ei gynnwys a'r ffaith iddo sicrhau cefnogaeth pob plaid. A gytunwch fod hyrwyddo agenda cydraddoldeb yn gyffredinol yn fater o gywirdeb moesegol ac nid cywirdeb gwleidyddol ac, ar lefel cwrteisi dynol sylfaenol, y dylai hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb hiliol yn arbennig ac atal drygioni hiliaeth, boed yn sefydliadol neu fel arall, drosesgyn pob mater gwleidyddol arall? A gytunwch hefyd y dylem oll fod yn ddigon dewr a phenderfynol i ymateb i argymhellion adroddiad Roger McKenzie â'r egni mwyaf posibl?

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â Richard Edwards. Yn fy marn i, mater moesegol a moesol ydyw ac ni fu erioed yn fater o gywirdeb gwleidyddol. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb arnom i wneud y pethau iawn am y rhesymau iawn ac i ymladd yn erbyn achosion lle y gwahaniaethir yn erbyn pobl ym mhobman yr awn. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi gosod esiampl dda wrth ddelio â materion o'r fath. Gobeithiaf y gwerthfawrogir ein hesiampl ac, yn bwysicach, y bydd pobl yn deall ein bod ni fel gwleidyddion yn rhoi arweiniad ac yn rhoi pobl ar ben y ffordd. Mae angen i Aelodau'r Cynulliad atgyfnerthu'r negeseuon hynny ar bob cyfle posibl.

**David Davies:** A gytuna'r Gweinidog bod y mwyafrif helaeth o bobl Prydain o bob grŵp ethnig yn oddefol iawn a'i bod yn drueni bod lleiafrif bach o bobl wyn, du ac Asiaidd yn anoddefol ac yn euog o hiliaeth? A gytuna bod yn rhaid inni gondemnio nid yn unig y bobl hynny, ond hefyd y rheini ar yr asgell dde eithafol a'r asgell chwith eithafol? Yn eu plith mae grwpiau eithafol, fel y Gynghrair

League, which whip up fear and hatred, according to the Asian Labour Member of Parliament for Bradford West—everything that he has said is to be condoned. All those who wish to see tolerance and equality in this country should join in condemning those from whatever part of the political spectrum who whip up bigotry and hatred.

**Edwina Hart:** I join you in condemning bigotry from whatever direction it comes. It is essential that we condemn bigots and anyone who stirs up racial hatred, but we must recognise that the dealings of the British National Party and the far right must be questioned. They are whipping up racial hatred in places such as Oldham. We must try to ensure that that does not happen in Wales, which is why it is important that there has been consensus throughout the Assembly's four political parties that we will condemn racism and do everything possible to ensure that there is no racism in Wales.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As Liberal Democrats, we support any move that will give men and women the opportunity to pursue their aims, develop their talents and fulfil their potential. A key role of the state and the community is enhancing the liberty of the individual and creating opportunities for diversity and expression. That is why the report aims to improve racial equality and opportunities for ethnic minorities in employment and training. I welcome the report, as it addresses the need in a Wales of cultural and racial diversity to promote racial participation to make our public bodies more representative of the Welsh people.

In its action plan, the Assembly should have a written racial policy within an equal opportunities policy that is clearly linked to organisation, aims and policies. A clear and constant public commitment is needed from the highest political and administrative levels. A race equality policy needs to be negotiated with the unions and placed under continuing joint review. It should be communicated to all employees, job applicants, potential job applicants, customers, clients, suppliers of

Wrth-Natsiaidd, sydd yn ennyn ofn a chasineb, yn ôl yr Aelod Seneddol Llafur dros Orllewin Bradford—ni ddylid condemnio unrhyw beth a ddywedodd. Dylai pawb sydd yn dymuno gweld goddefgarwch a chydraddoldeb yn y wlad hon ymuno â'r sawl sydd yn condemnio'r rheini o ba ran bynnag o'r sbectrwm gwleidyddol sydd yn ennyn culfarn a chasineb.

**Edwina Hart:** Ymunaf â chi i gondemnio culfarn o ba gyfeiriad bynnag y daw. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn condemnio pobl gulfarn ac unrhyw un sydd yn ysgogi casineb hiliol, ond rhaid inni gydnabod bod yn rhaid amau ffyrdd y Blaid Genedlaethol Brydeinig a'r asgell dde eithaf o weithredu. Enynnant gasineb hiliol mewn lleoedd fel Oldham. Rhaid inni geisio sicrhau na fydd hynny yn digwydd yng Nghymru, a dyna pam bod y consensws a gafwyd ar draws pedair plaid wleidyddol y Cynulliad yn bwysig, sef y condemiwn hiliaeth ac y gwnawn bopeth o fewn ein gallu i sicrhau na cheir hiliaeth yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, cefnogwn unrhyw gam a rydd y cyfle i ddynion a merched fynd ar drywydd eu nodau, datblygu eu doniau a chyflawni eu potensial. Un o rolau allweddol y wladwriaeth a'r gymuned yw rhoi mwy o ryddid i'r unigolyn a chreu cyfleoedd ar gyfer amrywiaeth a mynegiant. Dyna pam yr anela'r adroddiad at wella cydraddoldeb hiliol a chyfleoedd ar gyfer lleiafrifoedd ethnig ym maes cyflogaeth a hyfforddiant. Croesawaf yr adroddiad, am ei fod yn ymdrin â'r angen, mewn Cymru amrywiol, yn ddiwylliannol ac yn hiliol, i hyrwyddo cyfranogiad hiliol er mwyn sicrhau bod ein cyrff cyhoeddus yn cynrychioli pobl Cymru yn well.

Yn ei gynllun gweithredu, dylai'r Cynulliad fod wedi ysgrifennu polisi hiliol ysgrifenedig o fewn polisi cyfle cyfartal sydd wedi'i gysylltu'n glir â sefydliad, nodau a pholisïau. Mae angen ymrwymiad cyhoeddus clir a pharhaus o'r lefelau gwleidyddol a gweinyddol uchaf. Mae angen negodi polisi cydraddoldeb hiliol gyda'r undebau a'i adolygu ar y cyd yn barhaus. Dylid sicrhau bod pob cyflogai, ymgeisydd am swydd, darpar ymgeisydd am swydd, cwsmer,

goods and services and the public at large.

Also needed is a review of the procedures that have been put in place, the inclusion of black society and an analysis of the figures that relate to ethnic minorities in the Assembly and the labour market. The report aims to increase the number of black people who are employed in the Assembly, to deal with the barriers to their entering the Assembly, to increase the diversity of the mix of other nationalities and to increase the morale of black employees, their awareness of their rights and their confidence that any problem will be dealt with quickly. We aim to create an image of the Assembly as an organisation with a genuine commitment to racial equality. The Assembly's performance—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have been very patient. Following that preamble, I would welcome a question.

**Eleanor Burnham:** We welcome the report, as it is in line with our policy of increasing access for the most disadvantaged sectors of the community, but we must ensure—and I hope that I have the Minister's commitment—that all Members will make an effort to implement the ideas expressed, that racism will not continue and that Assembly employment is made more accessible to all.

**Edwina Hart:** I give that commitment. This is about hearts and minds. Even though we have started to undertake the work of the McKenzie report, we must also consider the mechanics involved. We must sell the message of what the mechanics put in place.

A good framework is important. We must show our public commitment and recognise that not only the Assembly and its policies, but the people who provide us with goods and services and all aspects of Welsh society are involved, because our actions will impact on them.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I welcome everything that has been said. I am a member of the Welsh Labour Party and a former member of the

cleient, cyflenwr nwyddau a gwasanaethau a'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol yn ymwybodol ohono.

Hefyd mae angen adolygu'r gweithdrefnau a roddwyd ar waith, i ba raddau y cynhwysir y gymdeithas ddu a dadansoddiad o'r ffigurau sydd yn ymwneud â lleiafrifoedd ethnig o fewn y Cynulliad a'r farchnad lafur. Anela'r adroddiad at gynyddu nifer y bobl ddu a gyflogir o fewn y Cynulliad, delio â'r hyn sydd yn eu rhwystro rhag dod i'r Cynulliad, cynyddu amrywiaeth y gymysgedd o genhedloedd eraill a chynyddu morâl cyflogeion du, eu hymwybyddiaeth o'u hawliau a'u hyder yr ymdrinnir ag unrhyw broblem yn gyflym. Anelwn at greu delwedd o'r Cynulliad fel sefydliad sydd yn wirioneddol ymrwymedig i gydraddoldeb hiliol. Mae perfformiad y Cynulliad—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Bûm yn amyneddgar iawn. Yn dilyn y rhagymadrodd hwnnw, byddwn yn croesawu cwestiwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Croesawn yr adroddiad, gan ei fod yn unol â'n polisi o gynyddu mynediad i'r sectorau o'r gymuned sydd dan yr anfantais fwyaf, ond rhaid inni sicrhau—a gobeithiaf y caf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog—yr ymdrecha pob Aelod i weithredu'r syniadau a fynegwyd, na fydd hiliaeth yn parhau ac y'i gwneir yn haws i bawb gael eu cyflogi o fewn y Cynulliad.

**Edwina Hart:** Rhoddaf yr ymrwymiad hwnnw. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chalonnau a meddyliau. Er ein bod wedi dechrau ymgymryd â gwaith adroddiad McKenzie, rhaid inni hefyd ystyried y mecanwaith dan sylw. Rhaid inni werthu'r neges y mae'r mecanwaith wedi'i sefydlu.

Mae fframwaith da yn bwysig. Rhaid inni ddangos ein hymrwymiad cyhoeddus a chydabod nad dim ond y Cynulliad a'i bolisiau sydd dan sylw, ond y bobl sydd yn darparu nwyddau a gwasanaethau inni a'r holl agweddau ar gymdeithas Cymru, gan y caiff y camau a gymerwn effaith arnynt.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Croesawaf bopeth a ddywedwyd. Yr wyf yn aelod o Blaid Lafur Cymru ac yn gyn-aelod o'r Gynghrair Wrth-

Anti-Nazi League that existed in Penarth, where we had a problem a number of years ago. I welcome your comments, Minister, on working with Assembly sponsored public bodies and local government on ensuring that black and ethnic minority communities have the opportunity to join the workforce. That may be in the civil service or in other public bodies in Wales. Will the workforce audits and the planned recruitment and advancement strategy recommended in the McKenzie Report be promoted to ASPBs and local authorities? Do you welcome the fact that Cardiff City and County Council is already considering a scheme, which it hopes to introduce shortly, to target its local black and ethnic minority community to encourage more applications? That could possibly involve voluntary work placements.

Recommendation 37 of the report proposes that Assembly Members undergo mandatory equality training, which is an issue that I have probably mentioned too often. However, David Melding mentioned it, and I take his comments on board—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a debate. I would be grateful if you could ask questions on the statement.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will conclude by asking how can we preach to others if we do not ensure that we conduct ourselves properly?

**Edwina Hart:** David and you are in agreement on that point. It is a means to an end, and some of us would be more draconian than others. The nature of the debate here shows that there is a way forward. There is a general consensus and recognition on which we must build. I congratulate local authorities that take steps to ensure that we have better participation in the workforce. We will promote any good framework to ASPBs, but it involves more than promotion alone. As I said in response to Helen Mary Jones, we might want to look in detail at ASPBs and their responsibilities with regard to this agenda.

Natsïaidd a fodolai ym Mhenarth, lle y cawsom broblem ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl. Croesawaf eich sylwadau, Weinidog, ar gydweithio â chyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol ar sicrhau y caiff cymunedau croenddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig y cyfle i ymuno â'r gweithlu. Gallai hynny fod o fewn y gwasanaeth sifil neu mewn cyrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru. A gaiff yr archwiliadau o weithluoedd a'r strategaeth recriwtio a dyrchafu arfaethedig a argymhellir yn adroddiad McKenzie eu hyrwyddo o fewn cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol? A groesawch y ffaith fod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd eisoes yn ystyried cynllun, y gobeithia ei gyflwyno cyn hir, er mwyn targedu ei gymuned groenddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig leol ac annog mwy o geisiadau ganddynt? Gallai hynny olygu lleoliadau gwaith gwirfoddol o bosibl.

Cynigia argymhelliad 37 o'r adroddiad y dylai Aelodau'r Cynulliad ymgymryd â hyfforddiant cydraddoldeb gorfodol, sef mater yr wyf wedi'i grybwyll yn rhy aml, fwy na thebyg. Fodd bynnag, crybwyllodd David Melding y peth, a derbynias ei sylwadau—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ofyn cwestiynau ar y datganiad.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Dof i ben drwy ofyn sut y gallwn bregethu wrth eraill os na sicrhawn ein bod yn ymddwyn yn briodol ein hunain?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae David a chithau yn cytuno ar y pwynt hwnnw. Dull o gyrraedd y nod ydyw, a byddai rhai ohonom yn fwy didrugaredd nag eraill. Dengys natur y ddadl yma bod ffordd ymlaen. Mae consensws a chydabyddiaeth gyffredinol y mae'n rhaid inni eu defnyddio fel sail. Llongyfarchaf awdurdodau lleol sydd yn cymryd camau i sicrhau bod gennym lefel well o gyfranogiad yn y gweithlu. Byddwn yn hyrwyddo unrhyw fframwaith da i gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, ond mae angen mwy na hyrwyddo yn unig. Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i Helen Mary Jones, efallai y byddwn am edrych yn fanwl ar gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad a'u cyfrifoldebau o ran yr agenda hon.

**John Griffiths:** Securing an ethnically diverse workforce is, in itself, a major achievement for the Assembly and many other organisations. However, do you agree that it is also important to monitor what happens, so that we know that there are equal opportunities for promotion, training and development for ethnic minorities and also for women and the disabled?

‘Communities First’ is a flagship that seeks to tackle economic and social disadvantage. It has interestingly spread to Cardiff’s ethnic communities through an innovative scheme. Do you foresee other local authorities in Wales with similarly high percentages of ethnic minority communities coming forward with similar schemes?

**Edwina Hart:** I hope that the Cardiff project will be emulated elsewhere when we see how it works. It is an innovative project, which is of interest to a wide community. It is good that it has appeared in the first tranche of ‘Communities First’ projects.

Your point on monitoring is correct. Unless we monitor all that we do in terms of women’s issues and disabled issues, we will never have a clear picture of what we are doing. It is an essential part of our work in this area. The necessary arrangements are in hand internally in that respect. However, monitoring work must also be undertaken in other bodies to see what data can be collated.

**John Griffiths:** Mae sicrhau gweithlu sydd yn amrywiol o ran ethnigrwydd yn gyflawniad mawr, ynddo’i hun, i’r Cynulliad a llawer o sefydliadau eraill. Fodd bynnag, a gytunwch ei bod hefyd yn bwysig monitro beth sydd yn digwydd, er mwyn inni wybod y gweithredir cyfle cyfartal er hyrwyddo, hyfforddi a datblygu ar gyfer lleiafrifoedd ethnig a hefyd ar gyfer merched a’r anabl?

Mae ‘Rhoi Cymunedau’n Gyntaf’ yn gynllun allweddol sydd yn ceisio mynd i’r afael ag anfantais economaidd a chymdeithasol. Mae’n ddiddorol iddo ledu i gymunedau ethnig Caerdydd drwy gynllun arloesol. A ragwelwch y bydd awdurdodau lleol eraill yng Nghymru sydd â chanrannau uchel tebyg o gymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn cyflwyno cynlluniau tebyg?

**Edwina Hart:** Gobeithiaf yr efelychir prosiect Caerdydd mewn mannau eraill pan welwn sut mae’n gweithio. Mae’n brosiect arloesol, sydd o ddiddordeb i gymuned eang. Mae’n dda o beth iddo ymddangos yn haen gyntaf prosiectau ‘Rhoi Cymunedau’n Gyntaf’.

Mae eich pwynt ar fonitro yn gywir. Oni wnawn fonitro popeth a wnawn yn nhermau materion yn ymwneud â merched a’r anabl, ni fydd gennym byth ddarlun clir o’r hyn a wnawn. Mae’n rhan hanfodol o’n gwaith yn y maes hwn. Mae’r trefniadau angenrheidiol ar y gweill yn fewnol yn hynny o beth. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ymgymryd hefyd â gwaith monitro o fewn cyrff eraill er mwyn gweld pa ddata y gellir ei goladu.

### **Datganiad ar Amrywiaeth mewn Penodiadau Cyhoeddus Statement on Diversity of Public Appointments**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** The Assembly will recall that, in February, we endorsed the broad proposals contained in a report from the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, entitled ‘Report for the National Assembly for Wales Equal Opportunities Committee on Public Appointments to Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies’. We agreed that the Government of

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Bydd y Cynulliad yn cofio, ym mis Chwefror, inni gymeradwyo’r cynigion cyffredinol a gynhwyswyd mewn adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, yn dwyn y teitl ‘Report for the National Assembly for Wales Equal Opportunities Committee on Public Appointments to Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies’. Cytunwyd y byddai Llywodraeth

Wales would report on progress towards implementation by July. I am pleased today to fulfil that commitment and update you on the work undertaken.

I invited colleagues to offer feedback and comments. Since our debate, I have had discussions with Cabinet colleagues, and held a productive meeting with Members who participate in the public appointments process as Subject Committee nominees. We have also issued a consultation document.

As well as continuing to consult, we have been trying to implement some of the immediate lessons learnt from the report. A number of appointment exercises are now using consultants to assist either with making advertisements more attractive or with the work of headhunting candidates. In particular, the Public Appointments Unit has invited companies to bid for work in the forthcoming round of Welsh Development Agency appointments. This involves refining the appointments process and headhunting candidates, with an emphasis on increasing diversity of applicants. It is important that we get good people from a wide range of backgrounds to apply for these key posts.

We all appreciate that it is essential that public bodies should better reflect the communities that they serve. This report, and the work that we have undertaken, shows clearly that this is a very complex and difficult area. However, the report highlights the problems faced, and suggests ways in which they may be tackled, while the consultation responses have suggested other problems that we also need to consider.

Some detailed and considered responses have been returned on the consultation to date. I am pleased that those who have responded have welcomed the recommendations being made.

3:10 p.m.

Several organisations were concerned that we should not divorce the issue of remuneration

Cymru yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran gweithredu'r cynigion erbyn Gorffennaf. Yr wyf yn falch heddiw o allu cyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw a rhoi newyddion ichi ar y gwaith yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef.

Gwahoddais gyd-Aelodau i gynnig adborth a sylwadau. Ers ein dadl, yr wyf wedi trafod gyda chyd-Aelodau'r Cabinet, a chynnal cyfarfod cynhyrchiol gyda'r Aelodau sydd yn cyfranogi yn y broses penodiadau cyhoeddus fel enwebeion Pwyllgorau Pwnc. Yr ydym hefyd wedi cyhoeddi dogfen ymgynghori.

Yn ogystal â pharhau i ymgynghori, buom yn ceisio gweithredu rhai o'r gwersi uniongyrchol a ddysgwyd o'r adroddiad. Mae nifer o ymarferion penodi bellach yn defnyddio ymgynghorwyr i gynorthwyo naill ai â'r gwaith o wneud hysbysebion yn fwy deniadol neu o herwela ymgeiswyr. Yn arbennig, mae'r Uned Penodiadau Cyhoeddus wedi gwahodd cwmnïau i gynnig am waith yng nghylch penodiadau arfaethedig Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Mae hyn yn cynnwys coethi'r broses penodiadau a herwela ymgeiswyr, gyda phwyslais ar gynyddu amrywiaeth yr ymgeiswyr. Mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau bod pobl dda o amrywiaeth eang o gefndiroedd yn gwneud cais am y swyddi allweddol hyn.

Yr ydym oll yn gwerthfawrogi ei bod yn hanfodol y dylai cyrff cyhoeddus adlewyrchu'r cymunedau a wasanaethant yn well. Dengys yr adroddiad hwn yn glir, a'r gwaith yr ymgwymerwyd ag ef, fod hwn yn faes cymhleth ac anodd iawn. Fodd bynnag, amlyga'r adroddiad y problemau a wynebwyd, ac awgryma ffyrdd y gellir mynd i'r afael â hwy, tra yr awgrymwyd problemau eraill hefyd y mae angen inni eu hystyried gan yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad.

Yr wyf wedi derbyn rhai ymatebion manwl ac ystyrlon ar yr ymgynghoriad. Yr wyf yn falch i'r rheini a ymatebodd groesawu'r argymhellion a wnaethpwyd.

Yr oedd sawl sefydliad yn awyddus inni beidio ag ysgaru'r mater o dâl i'r rhai a



for public appointees from the need to widen access to public appointments. We recently consulted on the issue of remuneration and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity debated the final report. In light of this consultation, this issue will be considered in parallel with all the others included in the report.

The next step is for officials to collate the consultation responses and submit an action plan to the Executive. That will give us a work programme, which we can implement and evaluate. I look forward to seeing the progress of this action plan. I still want to encourage individuals and organisations to come forward with ideas to help us move forward. The task is difficult, because it involves not only changing processes, but challenging perceptions and re-educating everyone to the point where it is taken for granted that public appointments are open to all and representative of the society in which we live. That is a tall order.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome this statement in light of the previous one, because it will help us to get to grips with this issue. It is ironic that this statement has been made on the same day as the Commission for Racial Equality's conference—which I attended this morning as it is being held nearby—on 'Beyond Rhetoric', which looks at moving this agenda forward. The First Minister was present and he commented that doing nothing is not an appropriate or applicable situation. We must be proactive in this. In light of that, this statement is apt, especially as this is one of the areas with which we can get to grips, especially as the National Assembly is responsible for nearly 600 appointments and over 143 bodies.

Although I welcome this statement, I am disappointed with the advertisements and headhunting that have occurred. I look forward to the action plan. However, can you tell me whether that action plan will have set targets? Will we be able to measure progress against it? Against what kind of timescale will that action plan be set? When do you anticipate it being completed and to which

benodir i swyddi cyhoeddus a'r angen i ehangu mynediad i benodiadau cyhoeddus. Ymgynghorasom yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â thâl a chynhaliodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ddadl ar yr adroddiad terfynol. Yng ngoleuni'r ymgynghoriad hwn, caiff y mater hwn ei ystyried ochr yn ochr â phob un arall a gynhwysir yn yr adroddiad.

Y cam nesaf yw i swyddogion goladu'r ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad a chyflwyno cynllun gweithredu i'r Weithrediaeth. Bydd hynny'n rhoi rhaglen waith inni, y gallwn ei gweithredu a'i gwerthuso. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld cynnydd y cynllun gweithredu hwn. Yr wyf am barhau i annog unigolion a sefydliadau i gyflwyno syniadau i'n helpu i symud yn ein blaenau. Mae'n dasg anodd, gan nad mater o newid prosesau yn unig ydyw, ond o herio canfyddiadau ac ailaddysgu pobl er mwyn creu sefyllfa lle y cymerir yn ganiataol bod penodiadau cyhoeddus yn agored i bawb ac yn cynrychioli'r gymdeithas yr ydym yn byw ynddi. Mae hynny'n dipyn o gamp.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwn yng ngoleuni'r datganiad blaenorol, gan y bydd yn ein cynorthwyo i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Mae'n eironig i'r datganiad hwn gael ei wneud ar yr un diwrnod â chynhadledd y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol—yr oeddwn yn bresennol ynddo y bore yma gan y caiff ei gynnal gerllaw—ar 'Y Tu Hwnt i Rethreg', sydd yn edrych ar ddatblygu'r agenda hon. Yr oedd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn bresennol a gwnaeth y sylw nad yw gwneud dim yn briodol nac yn gymwys. Rhaid inni fod yn rhagweithiol yn hyn o beth. Yng ngoleuni hynny, mae'r datganiad hwn yn briodol, yn arbennig gan fod hwn yn un o'r meysydd y gallwn fynd i'r afael ag ef, yn arbennig gan fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfrifol am bron i 600 o benodiadau a thros 143 o gyrff.

Er fy mod yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn, yr wyf yn siomedig â'r hysbysebion a'r achosion o herwela. Edrychaf ymlaen at y cynllun gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, a allwch ddweud wrthyf pa un a fydd gan y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw dargedau penodedig? A fydd yn bosibl inni fesur cynnydd yn ei erbyn? Beth fydd amserlen y cynllun gweithredu hwnnw? Pryd y rhagwelwch y

Committee will it be presented?

**Edwina Hart:** The action plan will be a matter for the Executive. However, if that is a request from you, as a member of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I would be delighted to place the action plan on the agenda for discussion. I will be minded to set targets. It would be useful to discuss targets and the timescales involved. I understand your disappointment, but I wanted to run an experiment to see how far we could get in terms of appointing to large organisations, such as the WDA, if we employed consultants to look at adverts and advise on how the headhunting would be done. If any valuable lessons could be learnt from that process—which will be completed by the end of September or beginning of October—we could discuss that in Committee. We need to take some practical steps to assess what else needs to be done. We might not want to take that course of action again. Therefore, it is important to analyse what we have done and consider it as a key appointment. If it is good practice, it could become normal practice elsewhere. That is the basis on which it was done. I am more than happy for the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to discuss the targets and timescales of the action plan.

**Peter Law:** I welcome the Minister's statement. We all want to see the diversification of public appointments. We want more women, people from ethnic minorities, disabled people and real people to be appointed. They need a fair remuneration for their work, because it is becoming a harder job.

We can be proud of the fact that we have the most open and transparent appointment system in the UK. This is in stark contrast to what it was like under the Tories. They ran their appointment system like some political gameshow saying, 'come on down, the price is right'; or, 'double your money, take your pick if you want to'; or 'buy one, get one free with a Tory membership card'. I have told you before—

caiff ei gwblhau ac i ba Bwyllgor y caiff ei gyflwyno?

**Edwina Hart:** Mater i'r Weithrediaeth fydd y cynllun gweithredu. Fodd bynnag, os yw hynny'n gais gennych, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, byddwn wrth fy modd yn rhoi'r cynllun gweithredu ar yr agenda i'w drafod. Byddaf yn awyddus i osod targedau. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol trafod y targedau a'r amserlen dan sylw. Deallaf eich siom, ond yr oeddwn am gynnal arbrawf er mwyn gweld pa mor bell y gallem fynd o ran penodi i sefydliadau mawr, fel y WDA, pe baem yn cyflogi ymgynghorwyr i edrych ar hysbysebion ac i roi cyngor ar y ffordd y dylid herwela. Os gellid dysgu unrhyw wersi gwerthfawr o'r broses honno—a gwblheir erbyn diwedd Medi neu ddechrau Hydref—gallem drafod hynny yn y Pwyllgor. Mae angen inni gymryd rhai camau ymarferol i asesu beth arall y mae angen ei wneud. Efallai na fyddwn am weithredu yn y ffordd honno eto. Felly, mae'n bwysig dadansoddi yr hyn a wnaethom a'i ystyried fel penodiad allweddol. Os yw'n arfer da, gallai ddod yn arferol mewn mannau eraill. Dyna'r sail y'i gwnaethpwyd arno. Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal drafod targedau ac amserlen y cynllun gweithredu.

**Peter Law:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Yr ydym oll am weld amrywiaeth ym maes penodiadau cyhoeddus. Yr ydym am weld mwy o ferched, pobl o leiafrifoedd ethnig, pobl anabl a phobl go iawn yn cael eu penodi. Mae angen tâl teg arnynt am eu gwaith, gan fod y gwaith yn mynd yn anos.

Gallwn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith mai gennym ni y mae'r system benodi fwyaf agored a thryloyw yn y DU. Mae hyn mewn gwrthgyferbyniad amlwg â'r sefyllfa a fodolai o dan y Torïaid. Yr oeddent yn rhedeg eu system penodiadau fel rhyw gêm wleidyddol gan ddweud, '*come on down, the price is right*'; neu, 'dyblwch eich arian, dewiswch yr hyn a fynnwch'; neu 'prynwch un, a chewch un am ddim gyda cherdyn aelodaeth y blaid Doriaidd'. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrthych o'r blaen—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a debate. I have not called you to give a preamble, before you ask questions.

**Peter Law:** If I could give a preamble—

**The Presiding Officer:** You have already had a long preamble.

**Peter Law:** I thought the first political speaker had the right to preamble.

It is important to extend the length and breadth of the trawl. We need people-friendly adverts. I agree with the Minister on that. In this new era, it is important to ensure that we get the right people for the right jobs.

I have been pleased to see some of the changes to the health trusts, which play an important role in our most important national institution. The Minister for Health and Social Services does such a good job. We need—and I shall be watching for—a radical change in the appointment of health trust chairpersons, bearing in mind some of the points that are made in the Assembly month after month about the national health service.

Will the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities provide us in future with an alphabetical list of public appointees that shows the public body with which they are associated? We would then know who has been appointed to multiple public bodies—there are still a few such people. I ask that sifting and shortlisting be done by independent people, not by senior civil servants, who should not be involved at all. I am concerned that quangos are retirement homes for some senior civil servants or local government officials.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is getting a bit long again. The preamble was long; the question is a bit long now.

**Peter Law:** In the interests of the people of Wales, I ask that full lists of appointments to all public bodies made by the National Assembly for Wales be sent to all Members

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid dadl yw hon. Nid wyf wedi eich galw i ragymadroddi, cyn gofyn cwestiynau.

**Peter Law:** Pe gallwn ragymadroddi—

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydych eisoos wedi rhoi rhagymadrodd hir.

**Peter Law:** Credwn fod hawl gan y siaradwr gwleidyddol cyntaf i ragymadroddi.

Mae'n bwysig ymestyn hyd a lled y broses recriwtio. Mae angen hysbysebion sydd yn denu pobl. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog yn hynny o beth. Yn yr oes newydd hon, mae'n bwysig sicrhau y cawn y bobl iawn ar gyfer y swyddi iawn.

Bûm yn falch o weld rhai o'r newidiadau i'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd, sydd yn chwarae rhan bwysig yn ein sefydliad cenedlaethol pwysicaf. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud gwaith mor dda. Mae angen—a byddaf yn cadw llygad am hyn—newid radical arnom wrth benodi cadeiryddion ymddiriedolaethau iechyd, gan gofio rhai o'r pwyntiau a wneir o fewn y Cynulliad fis ar ôl mis ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau, o nawr ymlaen, baratoi rhestr yn nhrefn y wyddor o'r rhai a benodwyd i swyddi cyhoeddus gan nodi'r corff cyhoeddus y maent yn gysylltiedig ag ef? Gwyddem wedyn pwy a benodwyd i nifer o gyrff cyhoeddus—ceir ychydig o bobl o'r fath o hyd. Gofynnaf i'r gwaith o nithio a llunio rhestr fer gael ei wneud gan bobl annibynnol, nid gan uwch weision sifil, na ddylent fod yn gysylltiedig o gwbl. Pryderaf fod cwangos yn gartrefi ymddeol i rai uwch weision sifil neu swyddogion llywodraeth leol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hyn yn mynd ychydig yn faith eto. Yr oedd y rhagymadrodd yn faith; mae'r cwestiwn ychydig yn faith yn awr.

**Peter Law:** Er mwyn pobl Cymru, gofynnaf i restrau cyflawn o benodiadau i bob corff cyhoeddus a wneir gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael ei hanfon at bob

within 48 hours of the appointment being made. I have asked for that before, as it is happening with health appointments.

**Edwina Hart:** I will examine the system for advising Members of appointments to all public bodies, so that Members can fully appraise them. That will be done as soon as an appointment is in the public domain and has been accepted by the individual concerned. We will try to put a timescale on that. I assure you that it will be quick.

I agree that some of the problems emerge at the sifting and shortlisting stage. In my experience of equality issues, that is where the damage is done, because people do not even get to the final interview. It is important that, in all large-scale appointments, we ensure that every interviewer is involved in the sifting and shortlisting if possible. You will appreciate that there are sometimes hundreds and hundreds of applications. It is also important that independent advisers are involved and able to request further information, if necessary, to audit the process. You have my assurance on that.

If you like, I shall also get officials busy writing a list of all current public appointees so that you can start adding up the days, Peter.

**David Melding:** I welcome the Minister's statement. On behalf of the Welsh Conservative Party, I assure her of our support in the work that she is doing on behalf of the Executive to improve the process of public appointments. I agree with Peter Law that the process has been improved. We will also support arrangements for further improvements.

I make that comment somewhat reluctantly, given Peter Law's earlier comments. I know that you are shortly to make an announcement on whether Mr Law is to be appointed chair of the hyperbole commission. We would heartily recommend his appointment.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A salaried post.

aelod o fewn 48 awr wedi i'r penodiad gael ei wneud. Yr wyf wedi gofyn am hynny o'r blaen, gan fod hynny'n digwydd gyda phenodiadau ym maes iechyd.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn archwilio'r system ar gyfer hysbysu'r Aelodau am benodiadau i bob corff cyhoeddus, er mwyn i'r Aelodau allu eu gwerthuso'n llawn. Gwneir hynny cyn gynted ag y bydd penodiad yn wybodaeth gyhoeddus ac wedi'i dderbyn gan yr unigolyn dan sylw. Ceisiwn bennu amserlen ar gyfer hynny. Fe'ch sicrhaf y bydd yn gyflym.

Cytunaf y daw rhai o'r problemau i'r amlwg ar adeg nithio a llunio'r rhestr fer. Yn fy mhrofiad i o faterion cydraddoldeb, dyna pryd y gwneir y niwed, gan nad yw pobl yn cyrraedd y cyfweliad terfynol hyd yn oed. Mae'n bwysig, ym mhob penodiad ar raddfa fawr, y sicrhawn bod pob cyfwelydd yn rhan o'r gwaith nithio a llunio rhestr fer os yn bosibl. Byddwch yn gwerthfawrogi bod cannoedd ar gannoedd o geisiadau yn dod i law weithiau. Mae hefyd yn bwysig cynnwys ymgynghorwyr annibynnol, a'u bod yn gallu gofyn am wybodaeth bellach, os bydd angen, er mwyn archwilio'r broses. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi yn hynny o beth.

Os hoffech, gofynnaf i swyddogion fynd ati i ysgrifennu rhestr o bawb sydd wedi'i benodi ar hyn o bryd er mwyn ichi allu cyfrif y diwrnodau, Peter.

**David Melding:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Ar ran Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, fe'i sicrhaf o'n cefnogaeth yn y gwaith a wna ar ran y Weithrediaeth i wella proses penodiadau cyhoeddus. Cytunaf â Peter Law fod y broses wedi gwella. Cefnogwn hefyd drefniadau ar gyfer gwelliannau pellach.

Yr wyf ychydig yn gyndyn o wneud y sylw hwnnw, o gofio sylwadau cynharach Peter Law. Gwn eich bod ar fin cyhoeddi pa un a yw Mr Law i'w benodi'n gadeirydd y comisiwn gormodiaith. Argymhellem ei benodi'n galonnog.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Swydd gyflogedig.

**David Melding:** At the heart of the matter is a need to encourage a wide range of applicants. We have not done that well enough in the past. It will take time. We must stick with the task; it will require a good deal of patience.

Will the Minister elaborate on the work that is being done on terms and conditions for appointees, particularly those who are appointed to chairs of various public bodies? If we want younger people from a wider range of backgrounds to apply for such positions, they will have to be given adequate terms and conditions. They may be taking career breaks to take up a public appointment. Arrangements will have to be made, for example, for pensions or childcare. We have to be thoroughly professional in the way in which we make public appointments.

**Edwina Hart:** I thank David for those comments. The terms and conditions of chairs are absolutely essential if we are to involve a different profile of people in Assembly sponsored public bodies. In the next few weeks, I will consider how to put together a final report on the remuneration package, which will cover not just childcare but carers in general. It is rather like how I try to deal with councillors' allowances: I consider what I require from councillors under the modernising local government agenda and other such matters. There is certainly more work to be done. I am more than happy to report back to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity in the autumn when I have undertaken that work.

It is important that there is cross-party support on such issues. However, more work must be done. It will be a long haul to make the public appointments system more transparent in the order that we require.

**Richard Edwards:** I add my welcome of the statement and, hyperbole notwithstanding, I welcome the prospect of wider access to public appointments so that they become genuinely representative of the population in general. Do you agree that it is important that independent advisers and assessors who

**David Melding:** Mae'r angen i annog amrywiaeth eang o ymgeiswyr wrth wraidd y mater. Ni wnaethom hynny yn ddigon da yn y gorffennol. Fe gymer amser. Rhaid inni ddal ati; bydd yn galw am lawer o amynedd.

A ymhelaetha'r Gweinidog ar y gwaith a wneir ar dermau ac amodau ar gyfer y sawl a benodir, yn arbennig y rheini a benodir yn gadeiryddion cyrff cyhoeddus amrywiol? Os ydym am weld pobl iau o amrywiaeth ehangach o gefndiroedd yn gwneud cais am swyddi o'r fath, bydd rhaid rhoi termau ac amodau cymwys iddynt. Efallai eu bod yn cymryd hoe yn eu gyrfa er mwyn ymgymryd â phenodiad cyhoeddus. Bydd rhaid gwneud trefniadau, er enghraifft, ar gyfer pensiynau neu ofal plant. Rhaid inni fod yn gwbl broffesiynol wrth wneud penodiadau cyhoeddus.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf i David am y sylwadau hynny. Mae termau ac amodau cadeiryddion yn gwbl hanfodol er mwyn cael ystod eang o bobl i ymgymryd â gwaith mewn cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf, ystyriaf sut i lunio adroddiad terfynol ar y pecyn taliadau, a fydd yn cwmpasu gofalmwyr yn gyffredinol, nid gofal plant yn unig. Mae ychydig yn debyg i'r ffordd y ceisiaf ddelio â lwfansau cynghorwyr: ystyriaf yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ofyn gan gynghorwyr o dan yr agenda moderneiddio llywodraeth leol a materion eraill o'r fath. Yn sicr mae mwy o waith i'w wneud. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i roi adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn yr hydref pan fyddaf wedi ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig bod cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol i faterion o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gwneud mwy o waith. Bydd yn dipyn o ymdrech gwneud y system penodiadau cyhoeddus yn fwy tryloyw yn y drefn sydd yn ofynnol gennym.

**Richard Edwards:** Croesawaf innau hefyd y datganiad ac, er gwaethaf y gormodiad, croesawaf y gobaith o fynediad ehangach i benodiadau cyhoeddus er mwyn iddynt gynrychioli'r boblogaeth yn gyffredinol mewn gwirionedd. A gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig y dylai ymgynghorwyr ac aseswyr

participate in appointment procedures should be representative and equality-trained, not just drawn from a magical circle of the great and the good in the time-honoured fashion?

annibynol sydd yn rhan o weithdrefnau penodi fod yn gynrychioliadol ac wedi'u hyfforddi ym maes cydraddoldeb, nid dim ond wedi'u tynnu o gylch hud y mawrion a'r cyfiawn yn y ffordd draddodiadol?

3:20 p.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I agree with that. As you know, we have considered independent assessors in Wales, with the specific purpose of ensuring that they are equality-trained and form a diverse group. It is important that all sides of the public appointment equation are correct, whether it involves politicians or independent assessors. If chairs and members of Assembly sponsored public bodies are involved, perhaps that they should also, dare I say it, be equality-trained.

**Edwina Hart:** Cytunaf â hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi ystyried aseswyr annibynol yng Nghymru, gyda'r diben penodol o sicrhau eu bod wedi'u hyfforddi ym maes cydraddoldeb ac yn ffurfio grŵp amrywiol. Mae'n bwysig bod pob ochr o hafaliad penodiad cyhoeddus yn gywir, boed yn cynnwys gwleidyddion neu aseswyr annibynol. Os bydd cadeiryddion ac aelodau o gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad yn gysylltiedig, efallai y dylent hwy hefyd, os meiddiaf ei ddweud, fod wedi'u hyfforddi ym maes cydraddoldeb.

**Pauline Jarman:** You may recall that, last October, I expressed concern that civil servants taking part in the recruitment process should be trained. I note, from your statement today, the use of consultants and the Public Appointments Unit's invitation to companies, rather than public sector employees, to bid for work in the WDA's forthcoming round of appointments. Will you give an assurance that this is not the first symptom of creeping privatisation in the public sector?

**Pauline Jarman:** Efallai y cofiwech imi, fis Hydref diwethaf, fynegi pryder y dylid hyfforddi gweision sifil sydd yn cymryd rhan yn y broses recriwtio. Nodaf, o'ch datganiad heddiw, y defnydd o ymgynghorwyr a gwahoddiad yr Uned Penodiadau Cyhoeddus i gwmnïau, yn hytrach na chyflogeion y sector cyhoeddus, i wneud cais am waith yng nghylch penodiadau arfaethedig y WDA. A roddwch sicrwydd nad hwn yw'r symptom cyntaf o breifateiddio graddol yn y sector cyhoeddus?

**Edwina Hart:** That is not the case. I have given an assurance that I want to consider best practices. It is fair to say that civil servants do not have all the necessary skills for this process, therefore they may need to be trained. We must consider these issues individually. The decision in terms of the WDA was made because there will be widespread interest in its new Chair and board members. Therefore, we used consultants and advisers in drawing up the advertisements. It is clear that the Assembly's boring advertisements in *The Western Mail* are of no benefit to us. It is easy to say that we should perhaps broadcast jingles on the radio, but we must have a strategic approach towards advertising and the use of consultants. However, this is a one-off, to see what lessons can be learnt and utilised elsewhere.

**Edwina Hart:** Nid dyna ydyw. Rhoddais sicrwydd fy mod am ystyried arferion gorau. Mae'n deg dweud nad oes gan weision sifil yr holl sgiliau angenrheidiol ar gyfer y broses hon, felly efallai y bydd angen eu hyfforddi. Rhaid inni ystyried y materion hyn yn unigol. Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad yn nhermau'r WDA gan y bydd cryn ddiddordeb yn ei Gadeirydd newydd ac aelodau newydd y bwrdd. Felly, defnyddiwyd ymgynghorwyr a chynghorwyr i lunio'r hysbysebion. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hysbysebion diflas y Cynulliad yn *The Western Mail* o unrhyw fudd inni. Mae'n hawdd dweud y dylem efallai ddarlledu rhigymau ar y radio, ond rhaid inni gael ymagwedd strategol tuag at hysbysebu a'r defnydd o ymgynghorwyr. Fodd bynnag, arbrawf unigryw yw hwn, er mwyn gweld pa wersi y gellir eu dysgu a'u defnyddio mewn manau eraill.

The fact that a whole host of people never see Assembly job advertisements is also an issue. How can we access those people? We are not talking about tapping someone on the shoulder and telling them that they will be a WDA board member, we are telling them that, if they are interested in making a contribution to public service, application forms are available. Looking at the agenda in this way is an experiment to see what examples of best practice arise. The use of consultants in a limited form is important and, as this will be a limited area, they will be used.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Do you have any plans to limit membership of ASPBs, particularly chairs, to one committee per person?

**Edwina Hart:** I have asked myself this question many times, and have been questioned about it by other people. I have nothing in hand at present. However, as the question has been raised today, I will take it on board and report back to the Assembly.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats also welcome the progress towards ensuring greater equality, and greater awareness of equality, in public life and appointments, so that talented individuals can contribute to enriching the work carried out by public bodies in Wales. How do you propose to find these people, and will you give an assurance that this work will be monitored closely?

**Edwina Hart:** I believe that the people are there. The problem is that they do not find the advertisements appealing, as they do not like the workload and are unsure about what they are supposed to do. It is only recently, since the National Assembly's establishment, that we have started to tackle the issue of job descriptions and the role and responsibilities of board members. They are not chief executives and they have a clearly defined role. Once we clarify what people appointed to public body boards are there to do, and open up matters in terms of remuneration, we

Mae'r ffaith bod llu o bobl na welant fyth hysbysebion swyddi y Cynulliad hefyd yn fater i'w drafod. Sut y gallwn gyrraedd y bobl hynny? Nid ydym yn sôn am dapio rhywun ar ei ysgwydd a dweud wrtho ei fod am gael ei wneud yn aelod o fwrdd y WDA, dywedwn wrthynt, os oes diddordeb ganddynt mewn gwneud cyfraniad at wasanaeth cyhoeddus, bod ffurflenni cais ar gael. Mae edrych ar yr agenda yn y modd hwn yn arbrawf er mwyn gweld pa enghreifftiau o arfer gorau sydd yn codi. Mae defnyddio ymgynghorwyr mewn modd cyfyngedig yn bwysig a, chan y bydd hwn yn faes cyfyngedig, cânt eu defnyddio.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i gyfyngu aelodaeth o gyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yn enwedig cadeiryddion, i un pwyllgor fesul person?

**Edwina Hart:** Gofynnais y cwestiwn hwn imi fy hun droeon, ac fe'i gofynnwyd imi gan bobl eraill. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw beth ar y gweill. Fodd bynnag, gan i'r cwestiwn gael ei godi heddiw, fe'i hystyriaf a chyflwynaf adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd yn croesawu'r cynnydd tuag at sicrhau mwy o gydraddoldeb, a mwy o ymwybyddiaeth o ran cydraddoldeb, mewn bywyd a phenodiadau cyhoeddus, er mwyn i unigolion dawnus allu cyfrannu at gyfoethogi'r gwaith a gyflawnir gan gyrff cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Sut y bwriadwch ddod o hyd i'r bobl hyn, ac a roddwch sicrwydd y caiff y gwaith hwn ei fonitro'n fanwl?

**Edwina Hart:** Credaf fod y bobl yno. Y broblem yw nad yw'r hysbysebion yn apelio atynt, gan na hoffant y baich gwaith a'u bod yn ansicr ynglŷn â'r hyn y disgwylir iddynt i'w wneud. Dim ond yn ddiweddar, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yr ydym wedi dechrau mynd i'r afael â disgrifiadau swyddi a rôl a chyfrifoldebau aelodau o'r bwrdd. Nid prif weithredwyr mohonynt ac mae ganddynt rôl a ddiffiniwyd yn glir. Unwaith y byddwn yn glir ynglŷn â'r hyn y disgwylir i bobl a benodwyd i fyrddau cyrff cyhoeddus i'w wneud, ac y byddwn yn

cannot expect people, who merely want something to do, to work four days a week for a public body, take all of their time and pay them £20,000 or so per annum. It is unacceptable because desirable people will not come forward and only a certain age-group will be able to afford to carry out the work. In terms of the public appointments' agenda, there are plenty of people capable of making a contribution and we should reach out to the wider world. We have not yet sought hard enough to find those people.

agored ynghylch materion yn ymwneud â thâl, ni allwn ddisgwyl i bobl, sydd ond eisiau rhywbeth i'w wneud, weithio pedwar diwrnod yr wythnos i gorff cyhoeddus, rhoi eu hamser i gyd a chael tâl o tua £20,000 y flwyddyn. Mae'n annerbyniol oherwydd ni fydd pobl y byddem yn dymuno eu cael yn ymgeisio a dim ond grŵp oedran arbennig a fydd yn gallu fforddio cyflawni'r gwaith. O ran yr agenda penodiadau cyhoeddus, mae digon o bobl a allai wneud cyfraniad a dylem ymestyn allan i'r byd ehangach. Nid ydym eto wedi chwilio'n ddigon caled am y bobl hynny.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** Before I turn to business for the next three weeks, I will confirm the changes to this week's business. As you mentioned earlier, Presiding Officer, you are content for us to consider the no-named day motion on the new Assembly building, which was tabled earlier today. I will propose a procedural motion after the last item on today's agenda to allow the debate to be held. As was agreed in Business Committee this morning, a procedural motion will be proposed on Thursday to bring forward the no-named day motion, tabled on 12 July, on the delegation of the functions of the Children's Commissioner for Wales Act 2001 to the First Minister. Information on this matter was circulated to all Members this afternoon.

Turning to the next three weeks' business, which will take place after the summer recess and the party conference season, the Business Committee agreed this morning that business for the next three weeks of Plenary is as shown on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I will make arrangements, as usual, to post a copy of the business statement to the intranet and the internet.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes unrhyw sylwadau ar y datganiad busnes?

**Elin Jones:** Ers tua pedwar mis bellach,

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cyn imi droi at fusnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf, cadarnhaf y newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Fel y crybwyllwyd yn gynharach gennyh, Lywydd, yr ydych yn fodlon inni ystyried y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, a gyflwynwyd yn gynharach heddiw. Cynigiau cynnig trefniadol ar ôl yr eitem olaf ar yr agenda heddiw i ganiatáu i'r ddatl gael ei chynnal. Fel y cytunwyd yn y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, cynigir cynnig trefniadol ddydd Iau i ystyried y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod, a gyflwynwyd ar 12 Gorffennaf, ar ddirprwyo swyddogaethau Deddf Comisiynydd Plant Cymru 2001 i Brif Weinidog Cymru. Dosbarthwyd gwybodaeth ar y mater hwn i bob Aelod y prynhawn yma.

Gan droi at fusnes y tair wythnos nesaf, a fydd yn digwydd ar ôl toriad yr haf a thymor cynadleddau'r pleidiau, cytunodd y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma y bydd busnes ar gyfer Cyfarfodydd Llawn y tair wythnos nesaf yn dilyn yr hyn a ddangosir ar we'r Siambr o dan dogfennau ategol. Gwnaf drefniadau, yn unol â'r arfer, i roi copi o'r datganiad busnes ar y fewnwyd a'r rhyngwyd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments on the business statement?

**Elin Jones:** For about four months, we have



buom yn disgwyl cyhoeddiad gan y Llywodraeth ar becyn adfywio gwledig yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau. Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach fod y Cabinet wedi gweithio'n galed ar hyn, ond ni dderbyniaf fod cyhoeddi pecyn o'r fath yn debyg o ddigwydd ychydig ddiwrnodau ar ôl dechrau toriad tri mis yr haf. Mae hyn yn sarhad ar rôl ddemocrataidd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Er mwyn imi allu cynrychioli fy etholaeth, sydd yn etholaeth wledig, yn effeithiol, rhaid i'r Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth roi'r hawl i mi archwilio unrhyw ddatganiad y mae'n debygol o'i gyflwyno ar ddyfodol cefn gwlad.

A ydych, felly, yn barod i ailystyried eich datganiad busnes, ac i ddod â datganiad cychwynnol ar becyn adfywio gwledig i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Iau er mwyn fy ngalluogi i, fel cynrychiolydd etholaeth wledig, i archwilio gwaith y Llywodraeth?

**Nick Bourne:** Elin Jones has just referred to a point that I raised earlier. The First Minister's response was entirely unsatisfactory and extremely dismissive of the whole of rural Wales. It is inappropriate that this announcement should be made immediately after the Assembly goes into recess for 12 weeks. It is important that we have a clear statement on Thursday as to what help is being offered to rural businesses for July, which we are already half way through, and the rest of the summer. This was promised in a statement made by the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities on 27 March. Why is that statement not forthcoming?

**Andrew Davies:** As the First Minister indicated, we take the issues confronting the rural economy seriously. My Cabinet colleague, Carwyn Jones, is not here today because he is in important discussions with the Westminster Government and agriculture Ministers from the other devolved administrations. I will discuss an announcement on this package with Carwyn and other Cabinet colleagues. We will come back in due course with a package of proposals, and will inform Members of that.

been awaiting a Government announcement on a rural regeneration package in the wake of foot and mouth disease. I accept what the First Minister said earlier that the Cabinet has worked hard on this, but I do not accept that such an announcement should be made a few days after the start of the three-month summer recess. This is an insult to the National Assembly's democratic functions. To allow me to effectively represent my constituency, which is rural, the Assembly and the Government must give me the right to scrutinise any statement that it is likely to make on the future of the countryside.

Are you, therefore, willing to reconsider your business statement, and to bring an initial statement on the rural regeneration package to Plenary on Thursday to enable me, as a representative of a rural constituency, to scrutinise the Government's work?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae Elin Jones newydd gyfeirio at bwynt a godais yn gynharach. Yr oedd ymateb Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gwbl anffoddhaol ac yn hynod ddiystyriol o Gymru wledig yn ei chyfanrwydd. Mae'n amhriodol cyhoeddi hyn yn syth ar ôl i'r Cynulliad ddechrau ar ei doriad o 12 wythnos. Mae'n bwysig inni gael datganiad clir ddydd Iau ynglŷn â pha gymorth a gynigir i fusnesau gwledig ar gyfer Gorffennaf, yr ydym eisoes hanner ffordd drwyddo, a gweddill yr haf. Addawyd hyn mewn datganiad a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ar 27 Mawrth. Pam na chyflawnir yr addewid hwnnw?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y nododd y Prif Weinidog, cymerwn y materion sydd yn wynebu'r economi wledig o ddifrif. Nid yw fy nghyd-Aelod o'r Cabinet, Carwyn Jones, yma heddiw gan ei fod mewn trafodaethau pwysig gyda Llywodraeth San Steffan a Gweinidogion amaeth y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Trafodaf gyhoeddiad ar y pecyn hwn gyda Carwyn a chyd-Aelodau eraill o'r Cabinet. Dychwelwn maes o law â phe cyn o gynigion, a hysbyswn yr Aelodau am hynny.

## Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of Order. Presiding Officer, have you received a request for a statement, under Standing Order No. 6.8, on the underspend in the Assembly's various budget headings? I have asked the First Minister regularly for information as to how this matter will be dealt with. It seems that we are now facing another three months of uncertainty. I wonder, Presiding Officer, whether you can assist Assembly Members, and whether, under any circumstances, that issue can be dealt with before the summer recess?

**The Presiding Officer:** I am always keen to assist Assembly Members. However, I am unable to assist in this instance, because, as you know, the likelihood of the Cabinet making a statement between now and Thursday is rather limited. Thursday's Plenary session already has a full agenda. If Members are keen to ensure further statements, that can be done electronically. It is open to Members, if they so wish, to press to reconvene Assembly Committees, should they wish to discuss matters in greater detail. As regards reconvening the whole Assembly, I would have to receive a request from the First Minister. I have not yet received such a request.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Lywydd, a dderbyniasoch gais am ddatganiad, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.8, ar y tanwariant ym mhenawdau cyllidebol amrywiol y Cynulliad? Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog yn rheolaidd am wybodaeth ynglŷn â sut yr ymdrinnir â'r mater hwn. Ymddengys ein bod bellach yn wynebu tri mis arall o ansicrwydd. Tybed, Lywydd, a allwch gynorthwyo Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac, o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau, y gellir delio â'r mater hwnnw cyn toriad yr haf?

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn awyddus bob amser i gynorthwyo Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf fod o gymorth yn yr achos hwn, oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, prin yw'r tebygolrwydd y gwnaiff y Cabinet ddatganiad rhwng yn awr a dydd Iau. Mae agenda Cyfarfod Llawn dydd Iau yn llawn eisoes. Os bydd yr Aelodau yn awyddus i sicrhau datganiadau pellach, gellir gwneud hynny yn electronig. Mater i'r Aelodau, os dymunant, yw rhoi pwysau i ailgynnull Pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, os byddant am drafod materion yn fanylach. O ran ailgynnull y Cynulliad llawn, byddai'n rhaid imi dderbyn cais gan Brif Weinidog Cymru. Ni dderbyniais gais o'r fath hyd yma.

## Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under Standing Order No. 22.25,*

*1. approves the Education (Foundation Body) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 12 June 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee, which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the Education (Foundation Body) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on*

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiad fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 22.25,*

*1. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyrff Sefydledig) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mehefin 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchmyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Cyrff Sefydledig) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar*

26 June 2001;

2. *approves the Change of Category of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 12 June 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the Change of Category of Maintained Schools (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001;*

3. *approves the Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 12 June 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the Learning and Skills Act 2000 (Commencement No. 4) (Wales) Order 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001;*

4. *approves the NHS (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 19 June 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the NHS (General Dental Services) (Amendment) (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 9 July 2001;*

5. *approves the Sweeteners in Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001;*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special*

26 Mehefin 2001;

2. *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Newid Categori Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mehefin 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Newid Categori Ysgolion a Gynhelir (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001;*

3. *yn cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Mehefin 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Dysgu a Medrau 2000 (Cychwyn Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001;*

4. *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 19 Mehefin 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol) (Diwygio) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001, a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf 2001.*

5. *yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Melysyddion mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001;*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig*

*attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the Sweeteners in Food (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001 and the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 9 July 2001;*

*6. approves the Street Works (Inspection Fees) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001; and*

*considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order the Street Works (Inspection Fees) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001. (NDM744)*

*o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Melysyddion mewn Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001, a'r Memorandwm Cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf 2001;*

*6. yn cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gweithfeydd Stryd (Ffioedd Archwilio) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001; ac*

*yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Gweithfeydd Stryd (Ffioedd Archwilio) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM744)*

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

3:30 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001 a Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001**

**Approval of the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001 and the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001**

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001. (NDM745)*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001. (NDM745)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education (Assisted Places) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001;*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001;*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001. (NDM746)*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001. (NDM746)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly considers the principle of the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001. (NDM747)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee which does not draw the special attention of the Assembly to any matter under Standing Order No. 11.5, in relation to the draft Order, the Education (Assisted Places) (Incidental Expenses) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2001, laid in the Table Office on 3 July 2001;*

*2. approves that the Order is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 26 June 2001. (NDM748)*

The Education (Schools) Act 1997 provides for the progressive abolition of the assisted places scheme, with pupils holding places in September 1997 being permitted to continue to receive assistance with a fee remission until they complete either their primary or secondary education under the scheme. No new pupils were admitted to the scheme after the intake in September 1997. This was consistent with the Government's longstanding commitment to abolish the scheme and to redirect the resources saved to contribute towards the cost of reducing class sizes. From a peak of 1,006 assisted pupils in the 1997-98 school year, the number of pupils continuing to hold assisted places in Wales has reduced to 539 in the current school year. We estimate that this will reduce further to around 400 in the 2001-02 school year, to which these amendment regulations will apply. Pupil numbers will continue to fall by at least 136 places annually. The majority of those holding assisted places will have left the scheme by July 2004.

These amendment regulations are made annually in England and Wales to operate the parental contribution tables and, if

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001. (NDM747)*

Cynigiaf fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, nad yw'n tynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn arbennig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 11.5 at unrhyw faterion sy'n peri pryder yn y Gorchymyn drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Lleoedd a Gynorthwyir) (Mân Dreuliau) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2001, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Gorffennaf 2001;*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 26 Mehefin 2001. (NDM748)*

Mae'r Ddeddf Addysg (Ysgolion) 1997 yn darparu ar gyfer diddymu'r cynllun lleoedd a gynorthwyir yn raddol, gyda disgyblion sydd â lleoedd ym Medi 1997 yn cael caniatâd i barhau i gael cymorth gyda'r ffi wedi ei dileu hyd nes y byddant wedi cwblhau naill ai eu haddysg gynradd neu uwchradd o dan y cynllun. Ni dderbyniwyd unrhyw ddisgyblion newydd i'r cynllun ar ôl y rhai a dderbyniwyd ym Medi 1997. Yr oedd hyn yn gyson ag ymrwymiad hirsefydlog y Llywodraeth i ddiddymu'r cynllun ac ailgyfeirio'r adnoddau a arbedwyd i gyfrannu tuag at y gost o leihau maint dosbarthiadau. O'r uchafswm o 1,006 o ddisgyblion a gynorthwywyd ym mlwyddyn ysgol 1997-98, mae nifer y disgyblion sydd yn parhau i fod â lleoedd a gynorthwyir yng Nghymru wedi gostwng i 539 yn y flwyddyn ysgol gyfredol. Rhagwelwn y bydd hyn yn gostwng ymhellach i tua 400 yn y flwyddyn ysgol 2001-02, gyda'r rheoliadau diwygio hyn yn berthnasol iddynt. Bydd nifer y disgyblion yn parhau i ostwng o leiaf 136 o leoedd y flwyddyn. Bydd mwyafrif y rhai â lleoedd a gynorthwyir wedi gadael y cynllun erbyn Gorffennaf 2004.

Gwneir y rheoliadau diwygio hyn yn flynyddol yng Nghymru a Lloegr i weithredu'r tablau cyfraniadau rhieni ac, os

appropriate, to reflect any tax or benefit changes resulting from the budget statement that impact on the computation of parents' incomes for the purposes of calculating the amount that they are required to contribute towards fees and related costs. Both sets of amendment regulations included in these motions uplift, in line with inflation at 2 per cent, the tables used to calculate the amount that the parents of children continuing to hold assisted places at former participating independent schools must contribute towards tuition fees. The tables are also used to calculate parents' eligibility to receive uniform grant and travel grant, which are available under the scheme. The amount of uniform grant payable is also increased in line with inflation, as is the dependence allowance, which is used to calculate relevant income, from £1,400 to £1,430.

Operating the tables and allowances in this way ensures that, in real terms, parents of children who continue to hold assisted places are not penalised in their entitlement to fee remission as a consequence of inflation. The relevant incomes of around 15 per cent of parents of assisted place holders in Wales are such that they are currently in receipt of full fee remission. The powers enabling the regulations to be made in relation to pupils still in the residual scheme who were granted a place prior to abolition are contained in section 3(1), 3(2), 3(5) and 3(9) of the Education (Schools) Act 1997. These powers were transferred to the National Assembly for Wales on 1 July. In accordance with the requirement to consult in section 3(7) of the Act, I confirm that the 2 per cent increase to the parental contribution tables and the uplift in the dependence allowance was agreed by me in consultation with the assisted places committee of the Independent Schools Council, which represents the 15 former participating independent schools in Wales that continue to provide assisted places under section 2(1) of the Act. The consultees were happy with the proposed uplift, the basis for which is the October 2000 retail price increase of 2 per cent.

Today's debate is about the principle and approval of these two related sets of

yw'n briodol, i adlewyrchu unrhyw newidiadau mewn treth neu fudd-daliadau sydd yn deillio o ddatganiad y gyllideb sydd yn effeithio ar gyfrifiad incwm rhieni at ddibenion cyfrifo'r swm y mae'n ofynnol iddynt ei gyfrannu tuag at ffioedd a chostau cysylltiedig. Mae'r ddwy gyfres o reoliadau diwygio a gynhwysir yn y cynigion hyn yn codi, yn unol â chwyddiant ar 2 y cant, y tablau a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo'r swm y mae rhieni plant sydd yn parhau i fod â lleoedd a gynorthwyir yn yr ysgolion annibynnol a oedd yn cymryd rhan cyn hynny yn gorfod ei gyfrannu tuag at ffioedd hyfforddiant. Defnyddir y tablau hefyd i gyfrifo cymhwyster y rhieni i gael grant gwisg ysgol a grant teithio, sydd ar gael o dan y cynllun. Cynyddir swm y grant gwisg ysgol sydd yn daladwy hefyd yn unol â chwyddiant, yn yr un modd â lwfans dibyniaeth, a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo incwm perthnasol, o £1,400 i £1,430.

Mae gweithredu'r tablau a'r lwfansau yn y ffordd hon yn sicrhau, mewn termau gwirioneddol, na chaiff rhieni plant sydd yn parhau i fod â lleoedd a gynorthwyir eu cosbi o ran eu hawl i ddileu'r ffi o ganlyniad i chwyddiant. Mae incwm perthnasol tua 15 y cant o rieni deiliaid lleoedd a gynorthwyir yng Nghymru yn golygu bod y ffi ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei dileu yn llwyr. Yn adran 3(1), 3(2), 3(5) a 3(9) o Ddeddf Addysg (Ysgolion) 1997 cynhwysir y pwerau sydd yn galluogi i'r rheoliadau gael eu gwneud mewn perthynas â disgyblion sydd yng ngweddill y cynllun a gafodd le cyn y diddymiad. Trosglwyddwyd y pwerau hyn i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar 1 Gorffennaf. Yn unol â'r gofyniad i ymgynghori yn adran 3(7) o'r Ddeddf, cadarnhaf y cytunais ar y cynnydd o 2 y cant i'r tablau cyfraniadau rhieni a'r codiad yn y lwfans dibyniaeth drwy ymgynghori â phwyllgor lleoedd a gynorthwyir y Cyngor Ysgolion Annibynnol, sydd yn cynrychioli'r 15 ysgol annibynnol yng Nghymru a oedd yn arfer cymryd rhan sydd yn parhau i ddarparu lleoedd a gynorthwyir o dan adran 2(1) o'r Ddeddf. Yr oedd y rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy yn fodlon ar y codiad arfaethedig, a sail hyn yw'r cynnydd mewn prisiau manwerthu o 2 y cant ym mis Hydref 2000.

Mae dadl heddiw yn ymwneud ag egwyddor a chymeradwyaeth y ddwy gyfres

regulations. The proposed changes are designed to ensure that parents are not penalised as a direct consequence of inflation. They are technical in nature and do not impact in any other way on the operation of the assisted places scheme in Wales as phase-out progresses. I commend both motions to Members.

**Y Llywydd:** Er hwylustod, byddwn yn trafod y ddau Orchymyn gyda'i gilydd ond byddwn yn pleidleisio arnynt ar wahân. Pwysleisiaf nad dadl ar egwyddor y cynllun yw hon, ond dadl ar egwyddor uwchraddio yn unig.

**Gareth Jones:** Mater o egwyddor yw hwn, nid gwrthwynebiad. Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau hyn.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu diddymu lleoedd a gynorthwyr. Wrth wneud hynny, mae'n datgan ei gwrthwynebiad i ymyrraeth gan y sector preifat mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Wrth gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau hyn ar sail yr egwyddor honno, cawn ein hatgoffa o'r egwyddor bresennol. Onid yw hyn yn croes-ddweud ac yn anghyson tra bod y Llywodraeth bresennol—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hyn yn ymylu ar fod allan o drefn. Yr ydym yn trafod uwchraddio, nid yr egwyddorion.

**Gareth Jones:** Mae anghysondeb o ran egwyddor yma. Mae'r Llywodraeth bresennol am i'r sector preifat chwarae rhan fwy mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ond, ar y llaw arall, mae'n diddymu lleoedd a gynorthwyr. Ymhle y mae'r cysondeb? Beth yw safbwynt y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar y mater hwn?

**Jonathan Morgan:** We will support these regulations. We recognise that it is important to provide an annual uplift. This is done on an England and Wales basis. We have previously supported the assisted places scheme and we understand the Government's wish to phase out this project. However, why is it that, in many cases, the increase in the uplift in terms of the amount payable in

gysylltiedig hyn o reoliadau. Bwriad y newidiadau arfaethedig yw sicrhau na chosbir rhieni o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i chwyddiant. Maent yn dechnegol eu natur ac nid effeithiant mewn unrhyw ffordd arall ar weithrediad y cynllun lleoedd a gynorthwyr yng Nghymru wrth i'r gwaith o'i diddymu fynd rhagddo. Cymeradwyaf y ddau gynnis i'r Aelodau.

**The Presiding Officer:** For the sake of convenience, we will discuss both Orders together but we will vote on them separately. I emphasise that this is not a debate on the principle of the scheme, but on the principle of uprating only.

**Gareth Jones:** This is a matter of principle, not an objection. I accept that we must approve these regulations.

The Government has decided to abolish assisted places. In doing so, it declares its objection to private sector intervention in public services. In approving these regulations on the basis of that principle, we are reminded of the current principle. Is this not contradictory and inconsistent while the current Government—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is on the verge of being out of order. We are discussing uprating, not the principles.

**Gareth Jones:** There is an inconsistency of principle here. The current Government wants to bring the private sector increasingly into public services but, on the other hand, it is abolishing assisted places. Where is the consistency? Where do the First Minister and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning stand on this issue?

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cefnogwn y rheoliadau hyn. Cydnabyddwn ei bod yn bwysig darparu codiad blynyddol. Gwneir hyn ar sail Cymru a Lloegr. Yn y gorffennol yr ydym wedi cefnogi'r cynllun lleoedd a gynorthwyr a deallwn ddymuniad y Llywodraeth i diddymu'r prosiect hwn yn raddol. Fodd bynnag, pam nad yw'r cynnydd yn y codiad, mewn llawer o achosion, o ran y swm sydd



support of these fees does not match the increases in fees levied by some of the schools to which they refer? The amounts payable are now significantly less as a proportion of the overall amount of fees that children are expected to find.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats support the fact that this scheme is being phased out. The money is better spent on supporting and improving state education for everyone, rather than being directed to help a few individuals. However, we accept that those who started their education under the scheme before the decision to abolish it was taken, should be allowed to complete their education with state support. These regulations enable the amounts related to this scheme to rise in line with inflation, ensuring that the level of support remains the same for those who continue in the scheme. This should be supported.

**David Davies:** I recently had the opportunity to attend a splendid speech day at the Haberdashers' Monmouth School for Boys. It is a wonderful school. My pleasure—

**Peter Law:** It is a school for girls.

**David Davies:** No, it is not.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Interruptions and alleged corrections are not helpful.

**David Davies:** I point out to the Member who sits on the South East Wales Regional Committee that there are two private schools in that town—one for boys and one for girls.

It was a splendid event, at which my happiness was marred only by the fact that I knew that, up until 1975, anyone who had the academic ability could have gone to that school, had they lived in the area. Since then, due to the dogmatic, socialist ideas that have taken over and infected education, it is now only open to certain people. It saddens me that the Government is abolishing the assisted places scheme and, in doing so, it is penalising parents deliberately. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning knows, or should know, perfectly well that school

yn daladwy i ategu'r ffioedd hyn yn cyfateb â'r cynnydd mewn ffioedd a godir gan rai o'r ysgolion y cyfeiriant atynt? Mae'r symiau sydd yn daladwy yn awr yn sylweddol llai fel cyfran o swm cyffredinol y ffioedd y disgwylir i blant ddod o hyd iddynt.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cefnoga'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol y ffaith fod y cynllun hwn yn cael ei ddiddymu yn raddol. Caiff yr arian ei wario'n well ar gefnogi a gwella addysg y wladwriaeth i bawb, yn hytrach na'i gyfeirio tuag at helpu ychydig o unigolion. Fodd bynnag, derbyniwn y dylai'r rheini a ddechreuodd eu haddysg o dan y cynllun cyn i'r penderfyniad i'w ddiddymu gael ei gymryd, gael cwblhau eu haddysg â chefnogaeth y wladwriaeth. Galluoga'r rheoliadau hyn i'r symiau sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r cynllun hwn godi yn unol â chwyddiant, gan sicrhau bod lefel y gefnogaeth yn parhau yr un peth ar gyfer y rheini sydd yn parhau i fod yn y cynllun. Dylid cefnogi hyn.

**David Davies:** Yn ddiweddar, cefais gyfle i fynychu diwrnod gwobrwyo gwych yn Ysgol Haberdashers i Fechgyn, Trefynwy. Mae'n ysgol wych. Fy mhleser—

**Peter Law:** Ysgol i ferched ydyw.

**David Davies:** Nage.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw ymyriadau a chywiriadau honedig o unrhyw gymorth.

**David Davies:** Dywedaf wrth yr Aelod sydd yn eistedd ar Bwyllgor Rhanbarth y Ddeddwyrain fod dwy ysgol breifat yn y dref honno—un i fechgyn ac un i ferched.

Yr oedd yn ddigwyddiad gwych, a dim ond un ffaith yn unig a amharodd ar fy hapusrwydd sef fy mod yn gwybod, hyd at 1975, y gallai unrhyw un a oedd â'r gallu academaidd fod wedi mynd i'r ysgol honno, pe baent wedi byw yn yr ardal. Ers hynny, oherwydd y syniadau dogmataidd, sosialaidd sydd wedi meddiannu a heintio addysg, mae ar gael yn awr i rai pobl yn unig. Mae'n peri tristwch imi fod y Llywodraeth yn diddymu'r cynllun lleoedd a gynorthwyr a'i bod, wrth wneud hynny, yn cosbi rhieni yn fwriadol. Gŵyr y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu

fees have risen by 6 per cent. This uplift is only worth 2 per cent.

We will support this motion because 2 per cent is better than nothing, but we do so with heavy hearts. The Conservative Party fully supports private education. We are not ashamed of that. Private education is good. It is a pity that there are still a few socialists in the Labour Party. I know that there are socialists on the other side of the Chamber, but there is still an adherence to this socialist dogma and chippiness about private education in the Labour Party. It should address the fact that so many comprehensive schools are in such a disgraceful state that people have to spend their money on private education. Labour Members should visit those schools. If they were to do so, as I have done on many occasions, they would see—

3:40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is not relevant to our debate, which is merely on the uprating of this Order, as I have indicated on three occasions in two languages.

**David Davies:** We will support the regulations. However, I hope that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will take the opportunity to visit one of the excellent independent schools in Wales to see why they are so successful. Perhaps she would then change her views on assisted places schemes.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before I call Rod Richards, who I am sure will be completely in order, I emphasise the fact that this debate is not about the principle of the assisted places scheme.

**Gareth Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Dywedoch wrthyf i fod yn dawel ar ôl eiliad neu ddwy ond cafodd ein ffrind David Davies tua phum munud i siarad.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Dywedais wrtho ef i fod yn dawel hefyd.

**Rod Richards:** I am greatly concerned about what the Minister said. My understanding is that the uprating of the assisted places

Gydol Oes i'r dim, neu dylai wybod, fod ffioedd ysgol wedi codi 6 y cant. Dim ond 2 y cant yw gwerth y codiad hwn.

Cefnogwn y cynnig hwn gan fod 2 y cant yn well na dim, ond gwawn hynny â chalon drom. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yn cefnogi addysg breifat yn llawn. Nid oes arnom gywilydd o hynny. Mae addysg breifat yn dda. Mae'n drueni bod rhai sosialwyr ar ôl yn y Blaid Lafur o hyd. Gwn fod sosialwyr ar ochr arall y Siambr, ond mae ymlyniad o hyd wrth yr athrawiaeth sosialaidd hon a'r anniddigrwydd ynglŷn ag addysg breifat yn y Blaid Lafur. Dylai ymdrin â'r ffaith fod cymaint o ysgolion cyfun mewn cyflwr mor gywilyddus fel bod pobl yn gorfod gwario eu harian ar addysg breifat. Dylai'r Aelodau Llafur ymweld â'r ysgolion hyn. Pe baent yn gwneud hynny, fel y gwneuthum innau ar sawl achlysur, byddent yn gweld—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol i'n dadl, sydd ond yn sôn am uwchraddio'r Gorchymyn hwn yn unig, fel y nodais ar dri achlysur yn y ddwy iaith.

**David Davies:** Cefnogwn y rheoliadau. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ymweld ag un o'r ysgolion annibynnol rhagorol yng Nghymru i weld pam eu bod mor llwyddiannus. Efallai wedyn y byddai'n newid ei barn ar gynlluniau lleoedd a gynorthwyr.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn imi alw ar Rod Richards, a fydd mae'n siŵr yn hollol mewn trefn, pwysleisiaf y ffaith nad ymwneud ag egwyddor y cynllun lleoedd a gynorthwyr a wna'r ddadl hon.

**Gareth Jones:** Point of order. You told me to be quiet after a second or two but our friend David Davies was allowed around five minutes to speak.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I also told him to be quiet.

**Rod Richards:** Pryderaf yn fawr ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Yn ôl a ddeallaf bydd uwchraddio'r cynllun lleoedd a

scheme will take into account any gains that parents may have made through the Chancellor of the Exchequer's announcement, including changes in benefits. Does that mean that these families, who by definition are on small incomes, because of this mean-minded uprating, will not be any better off as a result of changes in taxation and other benefits that the Chancellor has announced? That is my understanding of what she said and I would be grateful if she could clarify that.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Thank you for your contributions. Gareth Jones, I am always happy to stand at this lectern to tell you about my commitment as Minister and the Assembly's commitment to delivering comprehensive education in Wales. I have said that on many occasions. I responsible for education in Wales and the Government of Wales is responsible for delivering the comprehensive agenda. I can maintain that commitment to the delivery. It was helpful that you raised that in terms of—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It was not helpful because this debate is not about comprehensive education but a technical uprating as you indicated in your earlier speech.

**Jane Davidson:** Absolutely. I will move on swiftly to the technical uprating. The mechanism that is used to consider uprating, retail price index, operates across England and Wales. In terms of the effective and efficient use of public money, it is not a matter for me if schools in the independent sector raise fees above the rate of inflation. That is a matter for them. Had we continued with this scheme, it would have cost the Assembly £10 million in 2003 and would only have looked after the interests of 1,900 children in Wales. In fact, we will have costs of £2 million in 2003 before the phasing out. That money would be better used to deal with the issues that are important to this Assembly and to the majority of Assembly Members, namely making all our schools excellent in tackling class sizes. I also indicate that, proportionately, there is a smaller number of schools in the independent sector in Wales

gynorthwyr yn ystyried unrhyw enillion y bydd rhieni wedi eu gwneud o bosibl o ganlyniad i gyhoeddiad Canghellor y Trysorlys, gan gynnwys newidiadau mewn budd-daliadau. A yw hynny'n golygu na fydd y teuluoedd hyn, sydd drwy ddiffiniad ar incwm bach, oherwydd yr uwchraddio crintachlyd hwn, yn well eu byd o ganlyniad i newidiadau mewn trethi a budd-daliadau eraill a gyhoeddwyd gan y Canghellor? Dyna'r hyn a ddywedodd yn ôl a ddeallaf i a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai egluro hynny.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniadau. Gareth Jones, yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon sefyll wrth y darllenfwrdd hwn i ddweud wrthyhych am fy ymrwymiad fel Gweinidog ac ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i gyflwyno addysg gyfun yng Nghymru. Dywedais hynny ar sawl achlysur. Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am addysg yng Nghymru ac mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn gyfrifol am gyflwyno'r agenda gyfun. Gallaf gynnal yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i gyflwyno. Bu o gymorth ichi godi hynny o ran—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oedd o gymorth oherwydd nid yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud ag addysg gyfun ond ag uwchraddio technegol fel y dywedasoch yn eich araith yn gynharach.

**Jane Davidson:** Yn hollol. Symudaf ymlaen yn gyflym at yr uwchraddio technegol. Mae'r mecanwaith a ddefnyddir i ystyried uwchraddio, mynegai prisiau manwerthu, yn gweithredu ledled Cymru a Lloegr. O ran y defnydd effeithiol ac effeithlon o arian cyhoeddus, nid yw'n fater imi os bydd ysgolion yn y sector annibynnol yn codi ffioedd yn uwch na chyfradd chwyddiant. Mater iddynt hwy yw hynny. Pe baem wedi parhau â'r cynllun hwn, byddai wedi costio £10 miliwn i'r Cynulliad yn 2003 a byddai ond wedi gofalu am fuddiannau 1,900 o blant yng Nghymru. Mewn gwirionedd, bydd gennym gostau o £2 filiwn yn 2003 cyn diddymu'r cynllun yn raddol. Câi'r arian ei ddefnyddio'n well i ddelio â'r materion sydd yn bwysig i'r Cynulliad hwn ac i'r mwyafrif o Aelodau'r Cynulliad sef gwneud pob un o'n hysgolion yn rhagorol o ran mynd i'r afael â maint dosbarthiadau. Nodaf hefyd, yn

because of our healthy, popular and excellent comprehensive system. On Rod Richards's final point, the uprating operates in the same way as in England as I said, therefore benefit and taxation issues were addressed in my introduction.

gyfatebol, fod nifer llai o ysgolion yn y sector annibynnol yng Nghymru oherwydd ein system gyfun iach, boblogaidd a rhagorol. O ran pwynt olaf Rod Richards, gweithreda'r uwchraddio yn yr un ffordd ag y gweithreda yn Lloegr fel y dywedais, felly ymdriniwyd â materion trethi a budd-daliadau yn fy nghyflwyniad.

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar egwyddor y Gorchymyn cyntaf.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the principle of the first Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pledleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn cyntaf. **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the first Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pleidleisiwn yn awr ar **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on  
egwyddor yr ail Orchymyn. the principle of the second Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Pledleisiwn yn awr ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo'r ail Orchymyn. **The Presiding Officer:** We will now vote on the motion to approve the second Order.

*Cynnig: O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*  
*Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn** **Point of Order**

**Gareth Jones:** Ceisiais bleidleisio o blaid yn **Gareth Jones:** I tried to vote in favour of the

y bleidlais ddiwethaf ond ni chofrestrwyd fy mhleidlais. Y cyfan a ymddangosodd oedd tri golau coch.

**Y Llywydd:** Cofrestrwn eich pleidlais. Os y cewch anhawster, deallaf mai'r hyn sy'n briodol yw tynnu'r cerdyn allan ac yna ei roi yn ôl. Deallaf fod y bleidlais wedi'i chofrestru.

last motion, but my vote was not registered. Three red lights were all that appeared.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will register your vote. If you are in difficulty, I understand that the appropriate action is to take out and then re-insert the card. I understand that the vote has been registered.

### **Cynllun y Sector Gwirfoddol The Voluntary Sector Scheme**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of William Graham.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw William Graham.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

1. notes the action taken to implement the voluntary sector scheme, which was laid in the Table Office on 28 June 2001, in the period up to 31 March 2001, and agrees to publish the annual report, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 9 July 2001;

1. yn nodi'r camau a gymerwyd i roi ar waith gynllun y sector gwirfoddol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mehefin 2001, yn y cyfnod hyd at 31 Mawrth 2001, ac yn cytuno i gyhoeddi'r adroddiad blynyddol, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf 2001;

2. recognises the important contribution made by the voluntary sector and the constructive manner in which the sector and the Assembly have worked together over the year, in particular through the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council;

2. yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig y sector gwirfoddol a'r ffordd adeiladol y mae'r sector a'r Cynulliad wedi cydweithio yn ystod y flwyddyn, yn arbennig drwy Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol;

3. agrees that recommendations from the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council should be referred to the appropriate Ministers and Committees for action. (NDM751)

3. yn cytuno y dylid cyfeirio argymhellion Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol at y Gweinidogion a'r Pwyllgorau priodol er mwyn iddynt allu gweithredu arnynt. (NDM751)

It is just over a year since we adopted the voluntary sector scheme. This is a unique Assembly initiative that goes much further than the compacts that exist for the voluntary sector in other parts of the UK. Our scheme provides a framework that represents statutory backing to relations between the Assembly and the voluntary sector. When the scheme was launched, I made it clear that such a scheme was an important and necessary step in the Assembly's pursuit of a

Ychydig dros flwyddyn sydd ers inni fabwysiadu cynllun y sector gwirfoddol. Mae hon yn fenter unigryw gan y Cynulliad sydd yn mynd llawer ymhellach na'r compactau sydd yn bodoli ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Darpara ein cynllun fframwaith sydd yn cynrychioli cefnogaeth statudol i gysylltiadau rhwng y Cynulliad a'r sector gwirfoddol. Pan lanswyd y cynllun, eglurais fod cynllun o'r fath yn gam pwysig ac angenrheidiol wrth i'r



new approach to government, in which everyone in all sectors would have a role to play. This debate will reveal what has been achieved since the voluntary sector scheme was introduced.

The report on the scheme's first year notes how our commitments have been taken forward. The Assembly is being judged on what it achieves rather than on what it says it will achieve. As well as fulfilling a statutory commitment, the report also provides an opportunity for the voluntary sector and the people of Wales to see that we are serious about honouring our commitments. That means being open and honest about our progress and acknowledging that more can be done.

I support William Graham's amendment without reservation. It is a positive addition to the motion. It reinforces the message that the voluntary sector has an important role to play in helping the Assembly formulate policy and not only commenting on it as part of a consultation process. Although there remains much to be done, there are clear signs that we have made progress. In a letter to the First Minister on 4 June, Tom Jones, the chair of the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, stated that positive ways forward had been identified but that many contributions were still work in progress. That is a fair assessment. With Tom's permission, we are including his letter in the report.

What have we achieved in the past year? We have formally established the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council, which I chair. This is proving to be constructive and productive. Members of all political parties and the voluntary sector are showing a willingness and commitment to working together in line with Assembly policy objectives. I was determined from the outset that the council should not be a talking shop and I have been keen to ensure that its meetings are used for genuine dialogue and challenging debates. I cannot over-emphasise the valuable and meaningful contribution that voluntary sector representatives have made to ensure that the council is a success. The contribution of my Cabinet colleagues, Edwina Hart and Andrew Davies, at the last

Cynulliad fabwysiadu ymagwedd newydd tuag at lywodraeth, lle y byddai gan bawb ym mhob sector ran i'w chwarae. Bydd y ddatl hon yn datgelu'r hyn a gyflawnwyd ers cyflwyno'r cynllun sector gwirfoddol.

Noda'r adroddiad ar flwyddyn gyntaf y cynllun sut y datblygwyd ein hymrwymiaidau. Bernir y Cynulliad ar yr hyn a gyflawna yn hytrach na'r hyn a ddywed y bydd yn ei gyflawni. Yn ogystal â chyflawni ymrwymiad statudol, rhydd yr adroddiad hefyd gyfle i'r sector gwirfoddol a phobl Cymru weld ein bod o ddifrif ynglŷn ag anrhydeddu ein hymrwymiaidau. Mae hynny'n golygu bod yn agored ac onest ynglŷn â'n cynnydd a chydabod y gellir gwneud mwy.

Cefnogaf welliant William Graham yn ddiamod. Mae'n ychwanegiad cadarnhaol i'r cynnig. Atgyfnertha'r neges fod gan y sector gwirfoddol ran bwysig i'w chwarae wrth helpu'r Cynulliad i lunio polisi ac nid yn unig gwneud sylwadau arno fel rhan o broses ymgynghori. Er bod llawer i'w wneud eto, mae arwyddion clir ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd. Mewn llythyr at Brif Weinidog Cymru ar 4 Mehefin, dywedodd Tom Jones, cadeirydd Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, fod camau gweithredu cadarnhaol wedi eu nodi ond mai gwaith ar droed oedd llawer o'r cyfraniadau o hyd. Mae hynny'n asesiad teg. Gyda chaniatâd Tom, amgaeir ei lythyr yn yr adroddiad.

Beth a gyflawnasom yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? Yr ydym yn ffurfiol wedi sefydlu Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol, a gadeiriaf. Mae'n profi i fod yn adeiladol ac yn gynhyrchiol. Mae aelodau pob plaid wleidyddol a'r sector gwirfoddol yn dangos parodrwydd ac ymrwymiad i gydweithio yn unol ag amcanion polisi'r Cynulliad. Yr oeddwn yn benderfynol o'r cychwyn na ddylai'r cyngor fod yn siop siarad a bŵm yn awyddus i sicrhau y defnyddir ei gyfarfodydd ar gyfer deialog gwirioneddol a dadleuon heriol. Ni allaf orbwysleisio y cyfraniad gwerthfawr ac ystyrllon a wnaeth cynrychiolwyr y sector gwirfoddol wrth sicrhau bod y cyngor yn llwyddo. Ychwanegodd cyfraniad fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet, Edwina Hart ac Andrew Davies

meeting added to the significance of the discussion. Jane Davidson is also a member, which strengthens the Cabinet's commitment to the council.

3:50 p.m.

A major concern is that recommendations that arise from council meetings must be followed through. The motion before you today addresses that concern and reinforces that Voluntary Sector Partnership Council's contribution to the relationship between the sector and the Assembly. The requirements for twice-yearly meetings between Assembly Ministers and representatives of the relevant voluntary sector networks is another major innovation. There have been two rounds of meetings so far and they are becoming more productive. I am confident that their usefulness will continue to improve as time goes on. I am also conscious of my role to support ministerial colleagues in developing and maintaining their close links with a wide range of sectoral representatives in all policy areas and to ensure that their dialogue is proactive and reactive. A further significant development this year was the strategic review of funding for the voluntary sector, which was instigated at the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council's request. We are already implementing recommendations. I am most concerned about the sector's capacity to engage in partnership working. A modest start has been made with additional resources for the county voluntary councils, the Black Voluntary Sector Network and the 21 organisations elected to represent their networks on the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council.

yn y cyfarfod diwethaf, at bwysigrwydd y drafodaeth. Mae Jane Davidson hefyd yn aelod, sydd yn cryfhau ymrwymiad y Cabinet i'r cyngor.

Un pryder mawr yw bod yn rhaid gweithredu ar yr argymhellion sydd yn deillio o gyfarfodydd y cyngor. Mae'r cynnig ger eich bron heddiw yn rhoi sylw i'r pryder hwnnw ac yn atgyfnerthu'r cyfraniad hwnnw gan Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol i'r berthynas rhwng y sector a'r Cynulliad. Mae'r galw am gyfarfodydd ddwywaith y flwyddyn rhwng Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a chynrychiolwyr y rhwydweithiau sector gwirfoddol perthnasol yn gam arloesol mawr arall. Bu dwy rownd o gyfarfodydd hyd yn hyn ac maent yn dod yn fwy cynhyrchiol. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd eu defnyddioldeb yn parhau i wella wrth i amser fynd heibio. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol hefyd o'm rôl wrth gefnogi cyd-Aelodau gweinidogol i ddatblygu a chynnal eu cysylltiadau agos ag ystod eang o gynrychiolwyr y sectorau ym mhob maes polisi a sicrhau bod eu deialog yn rhagweithiol ac adweithiol. Un datblygiad arwyddocaol pellach eleni oedd yr adolygiad strategol o gyllid ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol, a ddechreuwyd ar gais Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol. Yr ydym eisoes yn gweithredu'r argymhellion. Pryderaf yn fawr am allu'r sector i ymwneud â gwaith partneriaeth. Gwnaethpwyd dechreuad cymhedrol gydag adnoddau ychwanegol gan y cynghorau gwirfoddol sirol, Rhwydwaith Du y Sector Gwirfoddol, a'r 21 o sefydliadau a etholwyd i gynrychioli eu rhwydweithiau ar Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol.

There are challenges ahead. We must finalise the code of practice for funding the voluntary sector to provide the necessary clarity, transparency and consistency. That consultation process will be completed by the autumn and the first version of the code will be available soon after that. We must consider ways of making the meetings between Assembly Ministers and the voluntary sector network more productive and raise the public profile of the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council. We must review the proliferation of partnerships at a local and all-Wales level. A research study into the partnership working is shortly being commissioned and we shall consider the results later this year. These steps, together with proposals for increasing public participation and consultation will help cement and build upon our close relationship with the voluntary and community sector that is so powerful in Wales. As the First Minister said in his foreword to the draft annual report, we could not have made this year's progress without the voluntary sector's full co-operation. We cannot take that co-operation for granted. The measures outlined in this motion show that we mean business and will reassure Members and the voluntary sector that we are committed to making this partnership and the voluntary sector scheme work.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am pleased, on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, to welcome this first annual report of the National Assembly voluntary sector scheme. The voluntary sector—from big international, non-governmental organisations to the small, informal local groups running local activities in their own community—has a vital role to play in civil society in Wales and in building the nation. The Government of Wales Act 1998 recognises that, and the scheme sets out how the Assembly, through the Government of Wales, will develop the voluntary sector and enhance its role. The Voluntary Sector Partnership Council is the key forum for monitoring and developing the scheme and ensuring that the needs and experience of the voluntary sector continue to receive high priority in Government policy-making at all levels. I take this opportunity to thank colleagues on the Partnership Council—

Mae heriau o'n blaen. Rhaid inni gwblhau'r cod ymarfer ar gyfer ariannu'r sector gwirfoddol i sicrhau'r eglurder, y tryloywder a'r cysondeb angenrheidiol. Cwblheir y broses ymgynghori honno erbyn yr hydref a bydd fersiwn cyntaf y cod ar gael yn fuan wedi hynny. Rhaid inni ystyried ffyrdd o wneud y cyfarfodydd rhwng Gweinidogion y Cynulliad a rhwydwaith y sector gwirfoddol yn fwy cynhyrchiol a chodi proffil cyhoeddus Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol. Rhaid inni adolygu amlhad y partneriaethau ar lefel leol a lefel Cymru gyfan. Comisiynir astudiaeth ymchwil i'r gwaith partneriaeth yn fuan a byddwn yn ystyried y canlyniadau yn ddiweddarach y flwyddyn hon. Bydd y camau hyn, ynghyd â chynigion i gynyddu cyfranogiad ac ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn helpu wrth gryfhau ac adeiladu ar ein perthynas agos â'r sector gwirfoddol a chymunedol sydd mor bwerus yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn ei ragair i'r adroddiad blynyddol drafft, ni allem fod wedi gwneud y cynnydd hwn eleni heb gydweithrediad llawn y sector gwirfoddol. Ni allwn gymryd y cydweithredu hwnnw yn ganiataol. Dengys y mesurau a amlinellir yn y cynnig hwn ein bod o ddifrif a rhoddwn sicrwydd i'r Aelodau a'r sector gwirfoddol ein bod yn ymrwymedig i wneud i'r bartneriaeth hon a chynllun y sector gwirfoddol weithio.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch, ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, o groesawu'r adroddiad blynyddol cyntaf hwn ar gynllun sector gwirfoddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae gan y sector gwirfoddol—o sefydliadau anlywodraethol rhyngwladol mawr, i'r grwpiau lleol bach, anffurfiol sydd yn cynnal gweithgareddau lleol yn eu cymuned eu hunain—rôl holl bwysig i'w chwarae mewn cymdeithas waraidd yng Nghymru ac wrth adeiladu'r genedl. Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn cydnabod hynny, a nodar cynllun sut y bydd y Cynulliad, drwy Lywodraeth Cymru, yn datblygu'r sector gwirfoddol ac yn gwella ei rôl. Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol yw'r fforwm allweddol ar gyfer monitro a datblygu'r cynllun a sicrhau bod anghenion a phrofiad y sector gwirfoddol yn parhau i gael blaenoriaeth uchel wrth lunio polisiau'r Llywodraeth ar bob lefel. Manteisiaf ar y

political and voluntary sector representatives. The debates are always challenging, intelligent and to the point.

We welcome this first report, which gives evidence of substantial and solid progress in setting up the procedures that will be needed to deliver on the scheme's long-term aspirations. We particularly welcome the regular meetings that have taken place with Ministers. However, as the Minister acknowledged, there is still much to be done. Key funding issues remain unresolved. The sector aspires to a three-year funding cycle for core-funded organisations, subject to rigorous monitoring on agreed targets. It has proved challenging this year for Government officials even to be able to provide the information as to what exactly the Government of Wales pays to the voluntary sector. The working group is making progress, but it has been slow. By this time next year, there must either be a clear agreement about three-year funding, or a statement from the Government about why it is unable to agree to it. The sector's representatives have been patient on these issues. The Government would be well advised not to try their patience much further and I am sure that the Minister would agree with me.

Another key area in which this report demonstrates progress but not resolution is that of the role of the voluntary organisations in local and national partnerships. There is consensus that it has a vital role. However, as the sector works to identify what exactly that role is and how best it can contribute, the Government struggles. To what extent is the Government prepared to invest in building the capacity of smaller, local groups in particular to participate? To what extent is it prepared to challenge other partners, notably some sectors of local government? Those sectors may be reluctant to develop truly equal partnerships with organisations that they have tended to see as clients in the past. Perhaps the Government will face the greatest challenge in this area as it works to ensure the full participation of voluntary and community groups in the development of community strategies. It will be hard to strike

cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'm cyd-aelodau ar y Cyngor Partneriaeth—cynrychiolwyr gwleidyddol a rhai'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'r dadleuon bob amser yn heriol, deallus a phwrpasol.

Croesawn yr adroddiad cyntaf hwn, sydd yn rhoi tystiolaeth o gynnydd sylweddol a chadarn wrth sefydlu'r gweithdrefnau y bydd eu hangen i gyflawni dyheadau hirdymor y cynllun. Croesawn yn arbennig y cyfarfodydd rheolaidd a gynhaliwyd gyda'r Gweinidogion. Fodd bynnag, fel y cydnabu'r Gweinidog, mae llawer eto i'w wneud. Erys materion ariannu allweddol heb eu datrys. Mae'r sector yn anelu at gylch ariannu tair blynedd ar gyfer sefydliadau a ariennir gan arian craidd, yn amodol ar fonitro targedau cytûn yn drylwyr. Bu'n anodd i swyddogion y Llywodraeth eleni hyd yn oed ddarparu'r wybodaeth am beth yn union y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei dalu i'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'r gweithgor yn gwneud cynnydd, ond bu'n araf. Erbyn yr adeg hon y flwyddyn nesaf, rhaid cael naill ai cytundeb clir ynglŷn ag ariannu tair blynedd, neu ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth ar pam na all gytuno i hynny. Bu cynrychiolwyr y sector yn amyneddgar ynglŷn â'r materion hyn. Byddai'r Llywodraeth yn ddoeth i beidio â threthu eu hamynedd lawer yn fwy ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi.

Un maes allweddol arall lle mae'r adroddiad hwn yn dangos cynnydd ond nid penderfyniad yw rôl y sefydliadau gwirfoddol mewn partneriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol. Mae consensws bod hon yn rôl holl bwysig. Fodd bynnag, wrth i'r sector weithio i nodi beth yn union yw'r rôl honno a sut y gall gyfrannu orau, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio ymgodymu â hyn. I ba raddau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn barod i fuddsoddi i gynyddu gallu grwpiau lleol, llai yn arbennig i gymryd rhan? I ba raddau y mae'n barod i herio partneriaid eraill, rhai sectorau llywodraeth leol yn enwedig? Efallai fod y sectorau hynny yn amharod i ddatblygu partneriaethau gwirioneddol gyfartal â sefydliadau y maent wedi tueddu i'w hystyried yn gleientiaid yn y gorffennol. Efallai mai yn y maes hwn y bydd y Llywodraeth yn wynebu'r her fwyaf wrth iddi weithio i sicrhau cyfranogiad llawn gan

a balance between imposing a rigid formula and demanding that local government stick to it with all the implied criticism on local democracy, and taking a much more *laissez-faire* approach, risking perpetuating traditional inequalities and bad practices.

I trust that by the next annual report on the scheme, we will have set out clearly how such challenges have been met, and will show a commitment to resourcing the sector's participation.

By next year's report, we expect more clarity on the mainstreaming of the scheme's development of the voluntary sector, across all aspects of the Government of Wales's work. This year's action plan tells us much about the excellent work of the voluntary sector division. However, it does not state clearly what other divisions must do. For example, the responsibility for the work on the role of the voluntary sector in developing community strategies must rest with the appropriate division. The appropriate division's work may be supported by the voluntary sector division, but must not rest with the voluntary sector division alone.

I commend the reporting mechanism used in the report on the equal opportunities scheme to the Minister, where the actions— or otherwise—of all divisions were clearly reported. Developing the voluntary sector is a matter for all in the Assembly, not the responsibility of the few.

The political will of the Assembly, including the Government, to develop and enhance the voluntary sector is not in question. I commend the personal commitment of Jane Hutt, as Minister responsible. This report demonstrates that the structures are now in place for the Government to play its full role in that development and enhancement. By next year, we must be able to see concrete action to show that that development is occurring.

**David Melding:** I propose amendment 1 in

y grwpiau gwirfoddol a chymunedol wrth ddatblygu strategaethau cymunedol. Bydd yn anodd taro cydbwysedd rhwng gosod fformiwla gaeth a mynnu bod llywodraeth leol yn glynu wrthi gyda'r holl feirniadaeth ymhlyg ar ddemocratiaeth leol, a chymryd ymagwedd llawer mwy *laissez-faire*, gyda'r posibilrwydd o barhau â'r anghydraddoldebau traddodiadol a'r arferion gwael.

Hyderaf y byddwn, erbyn yr adroddiad blynyddol nesaf ar y cynllun, wedi nodi'n glir sut y bodlonwyd heriau o'r fath, ac y byddwn yn dangos ymrwymiad i roi adnoddau i alluogi'r sector i gyfranogi.

Erbyn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf, disgwyliwn fwy o eglurder ar brif-ffrydio'r modd y mae'r cynllun yn datblygu'r sector gwirfoddol, ar draws pob agwedd ar waith Llywodraeth Cymru. Dywed cynllun gweithredu eleni lawer wrthym am waith rhagorol is-adran y sector gwirfoddol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n nodi'n glir yr hyn y mae'n rhaid i'r is-adrannau eraill ei wneud. Er enghraifft, rhaid i'r is-adran briodol fod yn gyfrifol am y gwaith ar rôl y sector gwirfoddol wrth ddatblygu strategaethau cymunedol. Gellir ategu gwaith yr is-adran briodol gan is-adran y sector gwirfoddol, ond ni ddylai hyn fod yn gyfrifoldeb ar is-adran y sector gwirfoddol yn unig.

Cymeradwyaf y mecanwaith cofnodi a ddefnyddiwyd yn yr adroddiad ar y cynllun cyfle cyfartal i'r Gweinidog, lle y cofnodwyd gweithrediadau—neu fel arall—pob is-adran yn glir. Mater i bawb yn y Cynulliad yw datblygu'r sector gwirfoddol, nid cyfrifoldeb rhai yn unig.

Nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn ag ewyllys wleidyddol y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys y Llywodraeth, i ddatblygu a gwella'r sector gwirfoddol. Cymeradwyaf ymrwymiad personol Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog cyfrifol. Dengys yr adroddiad hwn fod y strwythurau ar waith erbyn hyn er mwyn i'r Llywodraeth chwarae rhan lawn yn y gwaith datblygu a gwella hwnnw. Erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, rhaid inni allu gweld camau pendant i ddangos bod y datblygiad hwnnw'n digwydd.

**David Melding:** Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw

the name of William Graham: insert new point after point 1 and renumber subsequent points:

*values particularly the work of the voluntary sector in its contributions to the National Assembly's policy formulation process;*

I am pleased to be a part of this debate and I welcome the Minister's speech and the gracious way in which she supported the amendment. The amendment enhances the motion, which I am sure will attract cross-party support. I am pleased to be on the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council. I think that I have attended every meeting. I would have to verify that, but I have a high attendance record. The speakers in this debate so far have, at least, an equally high attendance record. That demonstrates the commitment of all major political parties to the voluntary sector's work.

It is pleasing to see that the Partnership Council has become a vital part of the Assembly's mechanisms and not just a quirky experiment. It will be mainstreamed across public life in Wales. It is an excellent model for a range of organisations, such as local authorities. It is churlish not to congratulate your opponents when they have advanced an idea that has been taken up and works. The Executive has done well in this area. That comes from the heart. I was formerly employed in the voluntary sector, and perhaps I will return to it if the electorate is not as favourably disposed to me in future. I was hoping to hear cries of 'shame' or 'no, no' to that—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Shame. No, no.']

The Partnership Council meetings have been informative and have ensured that we have focused on the issues that are of concern to the sector. That is sometimes uncomfortable. As politicians, we have arrived at meetings and have been kept on edge. We are not simply told that everything is fine, and that they are pleased that we are there to speak. It has been an engagement between partners. That is pleasing, if sometimes a little

William Graham: rhoi pwynt newydd i mewn ar ôl pwynt 1 ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dod wedyn:

*yn gwerthfawrogi'n arbennig waith y sector gwirfoddol o ran y ffordd y mae'n cyfrannu at broses llunio polisi y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol;*

Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn rhan o'r ddadl hon a chrosawaf araith y Gweinidog a'r ffordd raslon y cefnogodd y gwelliant. Mae'r gwelliant yn gwella'r cynnig, a fydd, mae'n siŵr, yn denu cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn aelod o Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol. Yr wyf wedi mynychu pob cyfarfod, fe gredaf. Byddai'n rhaid imi gadarnhau hynny, ond mae gennyf gofnod presenoldeb da. Mae gan y siaradwyr yn y ddadl hon hyd yn hyn, o leiaf, gofnod presenoldeb yr un mor dda. Mae hynny'n dangos ymrwymiad pob plaid wleidyddol o bwys i waith y sector gwirfoddol.

Mae'n bleser gweld bod y Cyngor Partneriaeth wedi dod yn rhan holl bwysig o fecanweithiau'r Cynulliad ac nid yn arbrawf mympwyol yn unig. Caiff ei brif-ffrydio ar draws bywyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'n fodel rhagorol ar gyfer ystod o sefydliadau, megis awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n anfoesgar peidio â llongyfarch eich gwrthwynebwyr pan fyddant wedi datblygu syniad a derbyniwyd ac sydd yn gweithio. Gwnaeth y Weithrediaeth yn dda yn y maes hwnnw. Daw hynny o'r galon. Fe'm cyflogwyd yn flaenorol yn y sector gwirfoddol, ac efallai y dychwelaf iddo os na fydd yr etholaeth yn ffafriol imi yn y dyfodol. Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio clywed bloedd o 'gwarth' neu 'na, na' i hynny—[AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Gwarth. Na, na.']

Bu cyfarfodydd y Cyngor Partneriaeth yn llawn gwybodaeth ac maent wedi sicrhau ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar y materion sydd o bryder i'r sector. Weithiau mae hynny'n anghysurus. Fel gwleidyddion, yr ydym wedi cyrraedd cyfarfodydd ac wedi cael ein cadw ar bigau drain. Ni ddywedir wrthym yn syml fod popeth yn iawn, a'u bod yn falch ein bod yno i siarad. Bu'n ymrwymiad rhwng partneriaid. Mae hynny'n ddymunol, os

challenging and uncomfortable.

We must monitor our progress and the outcomes from the Partnership Council and similar innovations throughout the sector. General attendance among Assembly Members must be monitored, while the parties' spokespeople attend all the meetings. I hope that I will not be regarded as speaking against colleagues. I only remark that the attendance record among AMs, in general, has sometimes been disappointing. That is something for all parties, not for a particular group.

4:00 p.m.

Like Helen Mary, I feel that we must emphasise the building up of the voluntary sector in its capacity to deliver in terms of consultation and participation. It used to be said that the media was the fourth estate. The extra estate that delivers effective civil liberties and a proper democracy is the voluntary and community sector—if I can combine the two. It is essential to modern governance that they are properly engaged. That requires us to be responsible when we ask them to respond to a wide range of documents, which is part of developing public policy more effectively and innovatively. We must ensure that they have the wherewithal to deliver.

On funding, I agree with colleagues who call more vociferously for three-year funding cycles throughout the sector. This is as important at local authority level as it is among the organisations that receive direct funding from the Assembly. The voluntary sector is not an add-on; it is a vital part of the governance of Wales and the Assembly's operation. It is also vital to the public sector bodies that are linked to the Assembly and the local authorities that are part of the Government of Wales.

The voluntary sector has already shown its worth. It played a valuable role in the consultation processes, which I have seen at close hand. I particularly reflect on the carers' strategy and the adult mental health strategy, which have been greatly improved by the productive involvement of the voluntary sector. Its involvement was not

ychydig yn heriol ac anghysurus ar adegau.

Rhaid inni fonitro ein cynnydd a chanlyniadau'r Cyngor Partneriaeth a dulliau arloesol tebyg ar draws y sector. Rhaid monitro presenoldeb cyffredinol ymhlith Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a rhaid i lefarwyr y pleidiau fynychu pob cyfarfod. Gobeithiaf na chaf fy ystyried fel rhywun sydd yn siarad yn erbyn fy nghyd-Aelodau. Sôn yr wyf fod y cofnod presenoldeb ymhlith Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, yn gyffredinol, wedi bod yn siomedig ar adegau. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth i bob plaid ac nid un grŵp yn benodol.

Fel Helen Mary, teimlaf fod yn rhaid inni bwysleisio'r gwaith o gynyddu gallu'r sector gwirfoddol i gyflawni o ran ymgynghori a chyfranogi. Arferid dweud mai'r cyfryngau oedd y bedwaredd ystad. Yr ystad ychwanegol sydd yn cyflwyno iawnderau sifil effeithiol a democratiaeth briodol yw'r sector gwirfoddol a chymunedol—os gallaf gyfuno'r ddau. Mae'n hanfodol i lywodraeth fodern fod y ddau wedi eu cysylltu'n gywir. Mae hynny'n galw arnom i fod yn gyfrifol pan ofynnwn iddynt ymateb i ystod eang o ddogfennau, sydd yn rhan o ddatblygu polisi cyhoeddus mewn modd mwy effeithiol ac arloesol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod ganddynt y modd i gyflawni.

O ran ariannu, cytunaf â'r cyd-Aelodau sydd yn galw'n fwy croch am gylioedd ariannu tair blynedd ar draws y sector. Mae hyn yr un mor bwysig ar lefel awdurdod lleol ag y mae ymhlith y sefydliadau a gaiff eu hariannu'n uniongyrchol gan y Cynulliad. Nid ychwanegiad yw'r sector gwirfoddol; mae'n rhan hanfodol o lywodraeth Cymru a gweithrediad y Cynulliad. Mae'n holl bwysig hefyd i gyrff y sector cyhoeddus sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r Cynulliad a'r awdurdodau lleol sydd yn rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru.

Mae'r sector gwirfoddol eisoes wedi dangos ei werth. Chwaraeodd ran werthfawr yn y prosesau ymgynghori, a welais yn agos. Myfyriaif yn arbennig ynghylch strategaeth y gofalgwyr a'r strategaeth iechyd meddwl oedolion, a gafodd eu gwella'n fawr gan y rhan gynhyrchiol a chwaraeodd y sector gwirfoddol. Nid oedd y rhan a chwaraeodd

critical, gratuitous and ill-aimed, but targeted at improving the work that we are trying to do, and proceeded on that basis.

Since the 1960s, the voluntary sector has developed greatly. In the 1960s, which was not long ago, the voluntary sector was seen as a basement operation. The voluntary sector is now upfront and a vital aspect of the governance of Wales. It effectively engages many people to whom, without its help, we could not speak directly. In a world of rapid globalisation, we need the voluntary sector more than ever. It will be an effective partner in the years ahead.

**Mick Bates:** I join others in congratulating the Minister on how this process was handled. It is a credit to the Minister and the Assembly that this scheme was established so quickly after the Assembly's establishment.

I am pleased that the scheme involves true partnership. That partnership does not impinge on the independence and innovation of the voluntary sector. It is important to recognise that, when we talk about partnership, we do not mean control. It is a two-way process, where we come to the table, as an Assembly, and put forward our proposals. One particular field is well on the way, namely continuity of funding, for which the Liberal Democrats have long argued. We are pleased to see that, whenever budgets are noted, core budgets now remain for three years.

The voluntary sector has had a tremendous impact as a vehicle to show people in Wales how effective the Assembly can be. There is room to build on this principle of partnership. I note, in particular, how we recommend the a third: a third: a third model, when we consider how we can promote partnership. One good thing about the European funding process is that it reminds people that they must take the voluntary sector into account. That is a critical process. However, I often draw your attention, Minister—and I work in the voluntary sector—to the fact that local

yn feirniadol, yn ddi-alw-amdano nac wedi ei thargedu'n wael, ond fe'i targedwyd tuag at wella'r gwaith y ceisiwn ei wneud, ac aeth rhagddi ar y sail honno.

Ers y 1960au, mae'r sector gwirfoddol wedi datblygu llawer. Yn y 1960au, nad oedd mor hir yn ôl â hynny, ystyriwyd y sector gwirfoddol yn weithrediad islawr. Erbyn hyn mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn agored ac yn agwedd holl bwysig ar lywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n ymwneud yn effeithiol â llawer o bobl na fyddem, heb ei gymorth, yn gallu siarad â hwy yn uniongyrchol. Mae angen y sector gwirfoddol arnom yn fwy nag erioed o'r blaen mewn byd lle ceir globaleiddio cyflym. Bydd yn bartneriaeth effeithiol yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

**Mick Bates:** Ymunaf ag eraill wrth longyfarch y Gweinidog ar y ffordd yr ymdriniwyd â'r broses hon. Mae'r ffaith fod y cynllun hwn wedi ei sefydlu mor gyflym ar ôl sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn glod i'r Gweinidog a'r Cynulliad.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y cynllun yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth wirioneddol. Nid yw'r bartneriaeth honno yn gwrthdaro ag annibyniaeth a dyfeisgarwch y sector gwirfoddol. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod, wrth sôn am bartneriaeth, nad ydym yn golygu rheolaeth. Mae'n broses ddwy ffordd, lle y deunw at y bwrdd, fel Cynulliad, a chyflwyno ein cynigion. Mae un maes penodol ar y trywydd iawn, sef parhad ariannu, y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi dadlau o'i blaid ers cryn amser. Yr ydym yn falch o weld bod y cyllidebau craidd, pryd bynnag y caiff cyllidebau eu nodi, yn parhau yn awr am dair blynedd.

Cafodd y sector gwirfoddol effaith aruthrol fel cyfrwng i ddangos i bobl yng Nghymru pa mor effeithiol y gall y Cynulliad fod. Mae lle i adeiladu ar yr egwyddor hon o bartneriaeth. Nodaf, yn arbennig, sut yr argymhellwn y model traean: traean: traean, pan ystyriwn sut y gallwn hyrwyddo partneriaeth. Un peth da ynglŷn â'r broses ariannu Ewropeaidd yw ei bod yn atgoffa pobl bod yn rhaid iddynt ystyried y sector gwirfoddol. Mae honno'n broses holl bwysig. Fodd bynnag, tynnaf eich sylw yn aml, Weinidog—a gweithiaf yn y sector gwirfoddol—at y ffaith fod gan



government still has a long way to go, before—

**Christine Chapman:** You mentioned structural funds and European funding. I draw your attention to the recent decision by the Objective 1 Programme Monitoring Committee to advance payments for the voluntary sector. Many people in the voluntary sector believe that this has been a tremendous boost for them. I accept your point on funding for the voluntary sector.

**Mick Bates:** It was of tremendous assistance. As someone who has assisted in writing funding applications, I know how much it means to have that advance payment.

It is important that we build capacity. We talk of establishing the model of a third: a third: a third. It is no good having rhetoric unless you can deliver. We must go further to ensure that local authorities, every youth group and voluntary organisation understand that, when we talk of partnership, it is all very well for the larger voluntary groups to sit as equals at a table with a Minister. Too often, however, it is difficult for the smaller groups to have their voice heard. I mention this particularly in the context of community development, where it is extremely important that excluded groups are included via our efforts to provide them with the resources to fund the best way of becoming involved. Often, that means a consultation process. Where consultation occurs, it must be as simple as possible for thorough evaluation to achieve the necessary aims. Too often, the forms for consultation have been too long and put people off replying. That is not the best method.

Finally, we need to establish a good way of assessing the impact of our dealings with the voluntary sector. We have all praised the manner in which the scheme has been implemented, but we must monitor what we do carefully. Often, the suggestions that we make have deep resource implications for all voluntary groups. Again, I refer to those small voluntary groups that often cannot afford to meet all health and safety standards or all the equal opportunities regulations that

lywodraeth leol ffordd bell i fynd o hyd, cyn—

**Christine Chapman:** Soniasoch am gronfeydd strwythurol ac arian Ewropeaidd. Tynnaf eich sylw at y penderfyniad diweddar gan Bwyllgor Monitro Rhaglen Amcan 1 i roi taliadau ymlaen llaw i'r sector gwirfoddol. Cred llawer o bobl yn y sector gwirfoddol fod hyn wedi bod yn hwb aruthrol iddynt. Derbyniaf eich pwynt ynglŷn ag ariannu ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol.

**Mick Bates:** Bu o gymorth aruthrol. Fel rhywun sydd wedi helpu wrth ysgrifennu ceisiadau am arian, gwn gymaint y mae'n ei olygu i gael y taliad ymlaen llaw hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynyddu gallu. Soniwn am sefydlu'r model traean: traean: traean. Ni fydd rhethreg o unrhyw werth oni allwch gyflawni. Rhaid inni fynd ymhellach i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol, pob grŵp ieuenctid a sefydliad gwirfoddol yn deall, pan fyddwn yn sôn am bartneriaeth, ei bod yn hawdd i'r grwpiau gwirfoddol mwy eistedd yn gyfartal wrth fwrdd gyda Gweinidog. Yn rhy aml, fodd bynnag, mae'n anodd i'r grwpiau llai leisio eu barn. Soniaf yn arbennig am hyn yng nghyd-destun datblygiad cymunedol, lle mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod grwpiau sydd wedi eu hallgáu yn cael eu cynnwys drwy gyfrwng ein hymdrechion i roi'r adnoddau iddynt ariannu'r ffordd orau o gyfranogi. Yn aml, golyga hynny broses ymgynghori. Pan fydd ymgynghori'n digwydd, rhaid iddo fod mor syml â phosibl er mwyn i werthusiad trylwyr gyflawni'r nodau angenrheidiol. Yn rhy aml, bu'r ffurflenni ar gyfer ymgynghori yn rhy hir, gan beri i bobl beidio ag ateb. Nid dyna'r dull gorau.

Yn olaf, mae angen inni sefydlu ffordd dda o asesu effaith ein hymwneud â'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae pob un ohonom wedi canmol y ffordd y gweithredwyd y cynllun, ond rhaid inni fonitro'r hyn a wnawn yn ofalus. Yn aml, mae goblygiadau adnoddau dwfn i bob grŵp gwirfoddol i'r awgrymiadau a wnawn. Unwaith eto, cyfeiriaf at y grwpiau gwirfoddol bach hynny na allant, yn aml, fforddio bodloni'r holl safonau iechyd a diogelwch neu'r holl reoliadau ar gyfle

we want to implement. I join with everyone in commending this scheme and look forward to it becoming an increasing success. As a result of the leadership that we have given it this year, it will do so.

**Owen John Thomas:** I welcome the additional funding for the black voluntary sector, bearing in mind the voluntary sector's potential to play a key role in promoting social inclusion, as a service provider and as an economic player providing jobs and transferable skills, often in disadvantaged areas. In Cardiff earlier this year, unemployment among the Somali population was recorded at a staggering 95 per cent. Against such a background, the work of the black voluntary sector is of crucial importance.

I also stress the need for small voluntary local groups to be given the capacity to respond to the Government's call for greater participation in partnership and to be able to contribute fully to consultations. We must be assured that county volunteer services receive sufficient funding so that, in turn, they can provide funding for small voluntary local groups to attend meetings, consult with others and contribute meaningfully on matters that affect them in their communities. Such groups should not be dissuaded from greater participation because they must fund their own voluntary efforts.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** I thank Members for their contributions. I re-emphasise the importance of this scheme, which you have backed today, and the council's key role. That must be our flagship for how we proceed with this. I also acknowledge the points made. Helen Mary said that we must demonstrate its importance by showing the outcomes and the impacts of the extensive time that the voluntary sector gives in helping us to formulate policy and influence Government. Owen John also mentioned that

cyfartal y dymunwn eu gweithredu. Ymunaf â phawb wrth gymeradwyo'r cynllun hwn ac edrychaf ymlaen i'w weld yn datblygu i fod yn llwyddiant cynyddol. O ganlyniad i'r arweinyddiaeth a roddasom iddo eleni, bydd yn gwneud hynny.

**Owen John Thomas:** Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol du, o gofio potensial y sector gwirfoddol i chwarae rhan allweddol wrth hybu cynhwysedd cymdeithasol, fel darparwr gwasanaethau ac fel chwaraewr economaidd sydd yn darparu swyddi a sgiliau trosglwyddadwy, yn aml mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Yng Nghaerdydd yn gynharach eleni, cofnodwyd cyfradd ddiweithdra syfrdanol o 95 y cant ymhlith y boblogaeth Somali. Yn erbyn cefndir o'r fath, mae gwaith y sector gwirfoddol du yn holl bwysig.

Pwysleisiaf hefyd yr angen i roi'r gallu i grwpiau lleol gwirfoddol bach fel y gallant ymateb i alwad y Llywodraeth am fwy o gyfranogiad mewn partneriaeth a chyfrannu'n llawn i ymgynghoriadau. Rhaid ein sicrhau bod gwasanaethau gwirfoddol sirol yn cael digon o arian fel y gallant, yn eu tro, ddarparu arian i grwpiau lleol gwirfoddol bach i fynychu cyfarfodydd, ymgynghori ag eraill a chyfrannu'n ystyrlon ar faterion sydd yn effeithio arnynt yn eu cymunedau. Ni ddylid darbwyllo grwpiau o'r fath i beidio â chyfranogi mwy oherwydd rhaid iddynt ariannu eu hymdrechion gwirfoddol eu hunain.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Ailbwysleisiaf bwysigrwydd y cynllun hwn, a gefnogwyd gennych heddiw, a rôl allweddol y cyngor. Rhaid i hynny fod yn esiampl inni o ran y ffordd yr awn yn ein blaenau gyda hyn. Cydnabyddaf hefyd y pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd. Dywedodd Helen Mary fod yn rhaid inni ddangos ei bwysigrwydd drwy ddangos y canlyniadau ac effeithiau'r amser helaeth y mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn ei roi i'n helpu wrth lunio polisi a dylanwadu ar Lywodraeth. Soniodd Owen John am hynny hefyd.

4:10 p.m.

As David Melding said, the voluntary sector should not be on the margins. Its work should be mainstreamed. David mentioned basement operations. I have been in several scruffy basements where voluntary sector work is carried out.

This also involves enabling the sharp, challenging and innovative end of the voluntary sector to have a role and a voice. As Mick Bates said, that is often in the form of community action. We must recognise that the more excluded members of our society and our communities do not always have the resources or the voice. That is why we must recognise the importance of capacity building, which is a new term. We must give resources and support to organisations across Wales. For example, we have given an extra £155,000 to the councils for voluntary service this year, so that they can build capacity. The work of those councils is important. We have given an extra £36,000 to the black voluntary sector. We also support organisations such as the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, which does so much to enable the voluntary sector to participate.

It is also important that we ensure that work on the code of practice for funding the voluntary sector and the strategic review of funding is continued. As Helen Mary said, the voluntary sector's patience is being tried. When the consultation period has come to an end, we will develop a model for our partners in local government and also for Assembly sponsored public bodies. The strategic review of funding in the voluntary sector includes the code of practice, which will lead to the three-year funding cycles. We are trying to ensure that the Assembly will be first to introduce that kind of funding. The review also includes the tracking of funding, which is a big exercise. We are tracking all Assembly divisions, policy streams and policy evaluations to find out what funding input there is into the voluntary sector. I reassure colleagues that all Assembly divisions must be engaged in the voluntary sector. Although they will obviously be supported by the Assembly's voluntary sector branch, this will not be implemented by that branch only. Ministers' role in meeting with the networks is important in that respect, as it ensures that all the Assembly's policy

Fel y dywedodd David Melding, ni ddylai'r sector gwirfoddol fod ar yr ymylon. Dylid prif-ffrydio ei waith. Soniodd David am weithrediadau islawr. Bûm mewn sawl islawr anniben lle y cyflawnir gwaith y sector gwirfoddol.

Mae hynny'n golygu galluogi ochr finio, heriol ac arloesol y sector gwirfoddol i gael rôl a llais. Fel y dywedodd Mick Bates, mae hynny yn aml ar ffurf gweithredu cymunedol. Rhaid inni gydnabod nad oes gan aelodau ein cymdeithas a'n cymunedau sydd yn cael eu hallgáu fwyaf yr adnoddau na'r llais bob tro. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod pwysigrwydd cynyddu gallu, sydd yn derm newydd. Rhaid inni roi adnoddau a chymorth i sefydliadau ar draws Cymru. Er enghraifft, rhoddasom £155,000 ychwanegol i'r cynghorau ar gyfer gwasanaeth gwirfoddol eleni, fel y gallant gynyddu gallu. Mae gwaith y cynghorau hynny yn bwysig. Rhoddasom £36,000 ychwanegol i'r sector gwirfoddol du. Cefnogwn sefydliadau hefyd fel Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, sydd yn gwneud cymaint i alluogi'r sector gwirfoddol i gymryd rhan.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod y gwaith ar god ymarfer ariannu'r sector gwirfoddol a'r adolygiad strategol o ariannu yn parhau. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary, trethir amynedd y sector gwirfoddol. Pan fydd y cyfnod ymgynghori wedi dod i ben, byddwn yn datblygu model ar gyfer ein partneriaid mewn llywodraeth leol a hefyd i gyrrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Mae'r adolygiad strategol o ariannu yn y sector gwirfoddol yn cynnwys y cod ymarfer, a fydd yn arwain at gylchoedd ariannu tair blynedd. Ceisiwn sicrhau mai'r Cynulliad fydd y cyntaf i gyflwyno'r math hwnnw o ariannu. Mae'r adolygiad hefyd yn cynnwys dilyn hynt yr arian, sydd yn waith mawr. Yr ydym yn dilyn hynt pob is-adran, ffrydiau polisi a gwerthusiadau polisi'r Cynulliad i ddarganfod pa fewnbwn ariannu sydd i'r sector gwirfoddol. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i'r cyd-Aelodau bod yn rhaid i bob is-adran o'r Cynulliad ymwneud â'r sector gwirfoddol. Er, yn amlwg, y cânt eu cefnogi gan gangen sector gwirfoddol y Cynulliad, ni chaiff hyn ei weithredu gan y gangen honno yn unig. Mae rôl y Gweinidogion wrth gyfarfod â'r rhwydweithiau yn bwysig yn hynny o beth,

areas—including education and lifelong learning, environment, housing and health and social care—must engage with the networks. The Ministers' policy officials must be involved and engage with the issues raised by the voluntary sector.

We are making progress on this and, as all Members recognise, we are developing a new style of government. Andrew Davies will organise a seminar on the Assembly's legislative process for the voluntary sector. The sector is keen to be engaged further in this. It does not want to be engaged in policy development only; it wants to understand the legislative process that is important to the Government of Wales. Committees also have a role to ensure that the views of the voluntary sector are properly considered in their deliberations during reviews and consultation processes. The voluntary sector has played a key role in all policy development that has been driven by Committees.

This approach is a starting point. We are taking the first steps towards a new form of democracy that will engage with the people of Wales through a vibrant, robust and diverse voluntary and community sector. The publication of annual reports and holding debates such as this today will keep us on the right track and will ensure that we demonstrate that we mean business, and that the voluntary sector's involvement is producing outcomes.

gan ei bod yn sicrhau bod yn rhaid i bob maes polisi y Cynulliad—gan gynnwys addysg a dysgu gydol oes, yr amgylchedd, tai a iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol—ymwneud â'r rhwydweithiau. Rhaid i swyddogion polisi y Gweinidogion ymwneud â hyn ac ymgymryd â'r materion a godir gan y sector gwirfoddol.

Yr ydym yn gwella hyn, ac fel y cydnabu pob un o'r Aelodau, yr ydym yn datblygu math newydd o lywodraeth. Bydd Andrew Davies yn trefnu seminar ar broses ddeddfwriaethol y Cynulliad i'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae'r sector yn awyddus i ymwneud ymhellach â hyn. Nid yw am ymwneud â datblygu polisi yn unig; mae am ddeall y broses ddeddfwriaethol sydd yn bwysig i Lywodraeth Cymru. Mae gan y Pwyllgorau rôl hefyd wrth sicrhau y caiff barn y sector gwirfoddol ei hystyried yn gywir yn eu penderfyniadau yn ystod adolygiadau a'r prosesau ymgynghori. Mae'r sector gwirfoddol wedi chwarae rhan allweddol yn yr holl waith ar ddatblygu polisi a hybwyd gan y Pwyllgorau.

Man cychwyn yw'r ymagwedd hon. Cymerwn y camau cyntaf tuag at ffurf newydd ar ddemocratiaeth a fydd yn ymwneud â phobl Cymru drwy sector gwirfoddol a chymunedol bywiog, cadarn ac amrywiol. Bydd cyhoeddi adroddiadau blynyddol a chynnal dadleuon fel yr un heddiw yn ein cadw ar y trywydd iawn ac yn sicrhau y dangoswn ein bod o ddifrif, a bod y rhan a chwaraeir gan y sector gwirfoddol yn cynhyrchu canlyniadau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard

German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:  
 Amended motion:

*the National Assembly*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

- |  |  |
|--|--|
| <p><i>1. notes the action taken to implement the voluntary sector scheme, which was laid in the Table Office on 28 June 2000, in the period up to 31 March 2001, and agrees to publish the annual report, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 9 July 2001;</i></p> <p><i>2. values particularly the work of the voluntary sector in its contributions to the National Assembly's policy formulation process;</i></p> <p><i>3. recognises the important contribution made by the voluntary sector and the constructive manner in which the sector and the Assembly have worked together over the year, in particular through the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council;</i></p> <p><i>4. agrees that recommendations from the Voluntary Sector Partnership Council should be referred to the appropriate Ministers and</i></p> | <p><i>1. yn nodi'r camau a gymerwyd i roi ar waith gynllun y sector gwirfoddol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 28 Mehefin 2001, yn y cyfnod hyd at 31 Mawrth 2001, ac yn cytuno i gyhoeddi'r adroddiad blynyddol, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf 2001;</i></p> <p><i>2. yn gwerthfawrogi'n arbennig waith y sector gwirfoddol o ran y ffordd y mae'n cyfrannu at broses llunio polisi y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol;</i></p> <p><i>3. yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig y sector gwirfoddol a'r ffordd adeiladol y mae'r sector a'r Cynulliad wedi cydweithio yn ystod y flwyddyn, yn arbennig drwy Gyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol;</i></p> <p><i>4. yn cytuno y dylid cyfeirio argymhellion Cyngor Partneriaeth y Sector Gwirfoddol at y Gweinidogion a'r Pwyllgorau priodol er</i></p> |
|--|--|

*Committees for action.*

*mwyn iddynt allu gweithredu arnynt.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar Adroddiad Macpherson ar Ymchwiliad  
Stephen Lawrence  
The Committee on Equality of Opportunity's Report on the Macpherson Report  
on the Stephen Lawrence Inquiry**

**Helen Mary Jones:** I propose that

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly notes the report of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity on the education recommendations of the Stephen Lawrence inquiry report, which was laid in the Table Office on 6 July 2001. (NDM749)*

As chair of the sub-group that was established by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I commend the report to the Assembly and thank all the sub-group members. At various times throughout the past 18 months—yes, it took 18 months to get the report sorted out—Kirsty Williams, Gareth Jones, Lorraine Barrett, Richard Edwards and David Melding have made invaluable contributions. If other colleagues participated, I hope that they will forgive me for missing them out, but the report took a long time.

I also thank the staff of the Committee Secretariat—in my view, the unsung heroes of our National Assembly—for their unstinting and often patient work. I also thank the equality unit and colleagues on the Committee for all that they have done to bring the report to the Assembly. Later, I shall say more about other contributors.

It behoves us to recall what led to the Stephen Lawrence inquiry. A young black man was brutally murdered for no reason other than the colour of his skin. The investigation of that murder was horribly bungled and the alleged perpetrators were never convicted. That the incident sent shockwaves throughout these islands was a surprise to some of us, because—tragically—Stephen's death and its aftermath are far from unique in the history of race relations in our country. We must not forget that racist violence is a daily reality for many black people in Wales. That the tragedy had such an impact is a tribute to the tireless campaigning of Stephen's parents.

Given that background, and given the strong commitment to the promotion of equality in all parts of the Assembly, the Committee on

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ar argymhellion addysg adroddiad ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM749)*

Fel cadeirydd yr is-grŵp a sefydlwyd gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad a diolchaf i bob aelod o'r is-grŵp. Ar wahanol adegau dros y 18 mis diwethaf—ie, cymerodd 18 mis i roi trefn ar yr adroddiad—gwnaeth Kirsty Williams, Gareth Jones, Lorraine Barrett, Richard Edwards a David Melding gyfraniadau amhrisiadwy. Os bu Aelodau eraill yn cymryd rhan, gobeithiaf y byddant yn maddau imi am eu hepgor yn fy niolchiadau, ond cymerodd yr adroddiad amser maith.

Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i staff Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Pwyllgorau—arwyr diglod ein Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn fy marn i—am eu gwaith parod ac, yn aml, amyneddgar. Diolchaf hefyd i'r uned cyfle cyfartal ac i'm cyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor am yr holl waith a wnaethant i gyflwyno'r adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad. Yn nes ymlaen, byddaf yn dweud rhagor am y cyfranwyr eraill.

Mae'n briodol inni gofio yr hyn a arweiniodd at ymchwiliad Stephen Lawrence. Llofruddiwyd dyn du ifanc yn filain dim ond oherwydd lliw ei groen. Bu'r ymchwiliad i'r llofruddiaeth honno yn hynod ddiffygiol ac ni cholllarnwyd y rhai yr honnwyd iddynt gyflawni'r drosedd erioed. Bu'r ffaith i'r digwyddiad roi cymaint o ysgydwad i bobl ar draws yr ynysoedd hyn yn syndod i rai ohonom, oherwydd—gwaetha'r modd—fod marwolaeth Stephen a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd wedyn ymhell o fod yn unigryw yn hanes cysylltiadau hiliol ein gwlad. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio bod llawer o bobl ddu yng Nghymru yn wynebu trais hiliol yn feunyddiol. Mae'r ffaith i'r drychineb gael cymaint o effaith yn glod i ymgyrchu diflino rhieni Stephen.

O ystyried y cefndir hwnnw, a'r ymrwymiad cryf i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal ym mhob rhan o'r Cynulliad, disgwyliodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle

Equality of Opportunity expected a fairly easy ride when we embarked on the work. We were tasked with supporting the implementation of the Macpherson report's recommendations on education, which is a matter for the Assembly. Earlier today, when we debated the McKenzie report, we heard about how we can put our own house in order, which is also a matter for the Assembly. The committee is also monitoring the Macpherson report's comments about matters that relate to police and criminal justice, but such matters were not for our sub-group.

I was happy enough to be chair of the sub-group, because I expected that I would for a few months be lightly steering the direction of work that was progressing anyway. That was not to be. At every turn, we encountered complacency. 'Oh, we have already mainstreamed these issues,' said one arm's-length body that gave evidence to the Committee. When pressed by David Melding, it was unable to give a single example of anything that it had done. We experienced resistance to change: 'Oh, we can do this as part of something else;' 'We have done it already;' 'We are already doing it.' Above all, we experienced an unwillingness to give the work priority.

I should stress that the personal commitment of the two education Ministers who were involved was never in doubt and individual officials, both from the Assembly and from arm's-length bodies, expressed that they were fully supportive of the commitment. However, time and again, the sub-group found that we returned to the full committee to report that minimal progress or no progress at all had been made. We felt that the work was not being given the priority that it needed, which was a deeply frustrating and disappointing process. I fear that that lack of progress is indicative of the history of institutional discrimination in this as in so many institutions in public life—I stress that I am talking not about individuals but about a pattern and an approach—which has led some people to feel that racism in education was simply not their problem.

Eventually, that log-jam was broken. On behalf of the sub-group and the Committee, I

Cyfartal gael rhwydd hynt pan ddechreuasom y gwaith. Cawsom y dasg o gefnogi'r broses o weithredu argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson ar addysg, sydd yn fater i'r Cynulliad. Yn gynharach heddiw, pan gynhaliwyd dadl ar adroddiad McKenzie, clywsom sut y gallwn gael trefn ar bethau o fewn y Cynulliad, sydd hefyd yn fater i'r Cynulliad. Mae'r pwyllgor hefyd yn monitro'r sylwadau yn adroddiad Macpherson ynglŷn â materion sydd yn ymwneud â'r heddlu a chyfiawnder troseddol, ond nid oedd y materion hynny yn rhan o gylch gwaith yr is-grŵp hwn.

Yr oeddwn yn ddigon parod i gadeirio'r is-grŵp, am imi ddisgwyl y byddwn am ychydig fisoedd yn rhyw lywio cyfeiriad y gwaith a oedd yn mynd rhagddo fodd bynnag. Ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Dro ar ôl tro, gwelsom hunanfodlonrwydd. 'O, yr ydym wedi prif ffrydio'r materion hyn eisoes,' dywedodd un corff hyd-braich a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor. Pan bwysodd David Melding arno, ni allai roi yr un enghraifft o unrhyw beth a wnaethai. Gwelsom anfodlonrwydd i newid: 'O, gallwn wneud hyn fel rhan o rywbeth arall,' 'Gwnaethom hynny eisoes,' 'Gwnawn hynny eisoes,'. Yn anad dim, gwelsom amharodrwydd i roi blaenoriaeth i'r gwaith.

Dylwn bwysleisio na fu amheuaeth erioed ynglŷn ag ymrwymiad personol y ddau Weinidog addysg dan sylw a mynegodd swyddogion unigol, o'r Cynulliad a'r cyrff hyd-braich, eu bod yn gwbl ymrwymedig. Fodd bynnag, dro ar ôl tro, gwelodd yr is-grŵp ei fod yn gorfod dychwelyd i'r pwyllgor llawn a nodi mai prin oedd y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd os o gwbl. Yr oeddem yn teimlo nad oedd y gwaith yn cael y flaenoriaeth yr oedd ei hangen arno, a fu'n broses a achosodd gryn rwystredigaeth a siom. Ofnaf fod y diffyg cynnydd yn arwydd o wahaniaethu sefydliadol a gafwyd yn y sefydliad hwn yn ogystal ag mewn cymaint o sefydliadau cyhoeddus eraill—pwysleisiaf nad sôn am unigolion yr wyf ond am batrwm ac ymagwedd—a barodd i rhai pobl deimlo nad eu problem hwy oedd hiliaeth mewn addysg.

O'r diwedd, daeth tro ar fyd. Ar ran yr is-grŵp a'r Pwyllgor, diolchaf i'n cadeirydd,



thank our chair, Edwina Hart, for our part in achieving that, which has meant that we are able to present the report to the Assembly.

The report speaks for itself, so I will highlight only one aspect of its response to recommendation 68, which concerned the recording and reporting of racist incidents in schools. Macpherson recommends that the reports of such incidents be published school by school. That was, as our report makes clear, a topic of much debate in the sub-group and on the Committee. No consensus could be reached. In the end, we have asked the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to work with the Commission for Racial Equality to find the right way forward and we are grateful that she has agreed to do so. The sub-group and the committee does not feel that we ducked the issue. We felt that it was only fair to put before the Assembly that there was no consensus, and the matter had to be handed to the Executive for action.

4:20 p.m.

I commend the Committee's report to the Assembly and to the Government of Wales. I trust that the sometimes difficult process of its preparation has reminded us all that driving forward justice and equality is rarely a matter of cosy consensus. It is more often one of challenge and sometimes of painful learning. I trust also that lessons have been learnt and that that will enable future equality initiatives to be driven forward more easily. After all, if the Assembly is to meet its statutory equality commitments, we must be seen to deliver change. We must be seen to deliver that change willingly.

Finally, I thank the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning for her agreement to allow the Committee on Equality of Opportunity to continue to monitor the implementation of the report's recommendations in partnership with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. We are grateful for that and look forward to keeping the Assembly fully informed of the progress.

Edwina Hart, am ein rhan wrth gyflawni hynny, a olygai ein bod mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno'r adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

Mae'r adroddiad yn hunan-esboniadol, felly ni fyddaf ond yn tynnu sylw at un agwedd ar ei ymateb i argymhelliad 68, a oedd yn ymwneud â chofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol mewn ysgolion a hysbysu'r awdurdodau ohonynt. Argymhella Macpherson y dylid cyhoeddi digwyddiadau o'r fath fesul ysgol. Yr oedd hynny, fel yr eglura ein hadroddiad, yn bwnc y bu cryn ddadlau yn ei gylch o fewn yr is-grŵp ac ar y Pwyllgor. Ni ellid dod i gytundeb. Yn y diwedd, gofynasom i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gydweithio â'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol i ddod o hyd i'r ffordd briodol ymlaen ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddi am gytuno i wneud hynny. Ni theimla'r is-grŵp na'r pwyllgor inni osgoi'r mater. Teimlwyd ei bod ond yn deg inni ddweud wrth y Cynulliad nad oedd consensws ynglŷn â hyn, a bod yn rhaid trosglwyddo'r mater i'r Weithrediaeth weithredu arno.

Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor i'r Cynulliad ac i Lywodraeth Cymru. Hyderaf fod y broses o'i baratoi, a fu'n un anodd ar adegau, wedi ein hatgoffa ni oll mai yn anaml y ceir consensws cyfleus wrth sicrhau cyfiawnder a chydraddoldeb. Yn amlach na pheidio, mater sydd yn herio ac yn rhoi gwersi poenus ydyw. Hyderaf hefyd fod gwersi wedi eu dysgu ac y bydd hynny yn ein galluogi i ddatblygu mentrau ar gydraddoldeb yn y dyfodol yn haws. Wedi'r cyfan, er mwyn i'r Cynulliad fodloni ei ymrwymadau statudol ynglŷn â chydraddoldeb, rhaid inni gael ein gweld yn sicrhau newid. Rhaid inni gael ein gweld yn newid o'n gwirfodd.

I gloi, diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes am gytuno i ganiatáu i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal barhau i fonitro'r gwaith o weithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad mewn partneriaeth â'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am hynny ac edrychwn ymlaen at roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Cynulliad ar y datblygiadau.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I welcome the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report and that of the education working party. There could not have been a more thoughtful group of people to drive the agenda forward than those in the education working party and the Committee. Careful thought has been given to how we can best address the Macpherson report's recommendations in Wales. I am pleased that such constructive proposals have been made and join with Helen Mary Jones in commending the report to Members.

The education working party comprised officials from the Pupil Support Division of the Assembly's Training and Education Department, the Equality Policy Unit, Race Equality First, Estyn, the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, the All-Wales Ethnic Minority Association, South Wales Police and the Commission for Racial Equality. The working party's report will form a sound base for developing positive action to promote cultural awareness and tackle racism in our schools. I thank the working party for its commitment and for the major contribution that it has made to the discussions.

Some of the work that is highlighted in the report is already underway, although the report took some 18 months to put together, as Helen Mary Jones said. When I became Minister, I wanted to pick up the work my predecessor did to drive forward the equality agenda. For example, ACCAC has been undertaking detailed work with the National Assembly for Wales and various equality organisations to draw up guidance on identifying equal opportunities issues in the curriculum and hopes to launch the guidance towards the end of the year. We are also considering the content and status of the personal and social education framework in June next year. Estyn has also made significant steps in highlighting the implications of the Macpherson report for school inspections. The revised inspection framework and handbook now includes additional references to the fact that all schools have the responsibility to promote

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Croesawaf adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ac adroddiad y gweithgor addysg. Ni ellid bod wedi cael grŵp mwy ystyriol o bobl i ddatblygu'r agenda na'r rhai yn y gweithgor addysg a'r Pwyllgor. Ystyriwyd yn ofalus beth fyddai'r ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael ag argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn falch y gwnaethpwyd argymhellion mor gadarnhaol ac ymunaf â Helen Mary Jones i gymeradwyo'r adroddiad i'r Aelodau.

Yr oedd y gweithgor addysg yn cynnwys swyddogion o'r Is-Adran Cymorth i Ddisgyblion o fewn Adran Addysg a Hyfforddiant y Cynulliad, yr Uned Polisi Cydraddoldeb, Race Equality First, Estyn, Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, Cymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan, Heddlu De Cymru a'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol. Bydd adroddiad y gweithgor yn sail gadarn i ddatblygu gweithredu cadarnhaol i hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth ddiwylliannol a mynd i'r afael â hiliaeth yn ein hysgolion. Diolchaf i'r gweithgor am ei ymrwymiad ac am y cyfraniad sylweddol a wnaeth at y trafodaethau.

Mae rhywfaint o'r gwaith a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad eisoes yn mynd rhagddo, er ei bod wedi cymryd tua 18 mis i baratoi'r adroddiad, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones. Pan gefais fy mhenodi yn Weinidog, yr oeddwn am ailgydio yng ngwaith fy rhagflaenydd o ran datblygu'r agenda cydraddoldeb. Er enghraifft, gwnaeth ACCAC waith manwl gyda Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac amryw o sefydliadau cydraddoldeb i lunio canllawiau ar nodi materion sydd yn ymwneud â chyfle cyfartal yn y cwricwlwm ac mae'n gobeithio lansio'r canllawiau tua diwedd y flwyddyn. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried cynnwys a statws y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol ym mis Mehefin y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae Estyn hefyd wedi cymryd camau sylweddol i nodi goblygiadau adroddiad Macpherson i arolygiadau ysgolion. Mae'r fframwaith a'r llawlyfr arolygu diwygiedig bellach yn cynnwys cyfeiriadau ychwanegol at y ffaith

racial equality. Inspectors are reminded to gather evidence of the effect of a school's policy and practice for equality of opportunities and take into account the effectiveness of a school's measures to tackle harassment. They have also recently been advised of a need to identify how schools record and report racist incidents to the appropriate authorities.

In addition, I have had further bilateral discussions with the Commission for Racial Equality regarding some of the issues that the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report has raised. We continue to work closely with ACCAC and the CRE on implementing some of the immediate recommendations. Those discussions will plan an action programme for September. The plan will outline and put into operation our commitments in response to the recommendations of the Macpherson report and will build on the detailed work and proposals of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the education working party. I have agreed with the CRE that I will meet leaders of the black and ethnic minority communities in September to launch the report and action plan.

On one of the specific proposals from the education working party, under recommendation 67 of the Macpherson report, there are already initial plans for discussion with the Department of Education and Skills in early autumn about the promotion of suitably and culturally diverse curriculum material. There has, as Helen Mary Jones said, been considerable discussion about recording and reporting racist incidents and how we can best tackle racial harassment in schools. I recognise the concerns felt by some that publicly reporting racist incidents could have a negative effect for schools, perhaps stigmatising those who are alert to the problems and are trying to address them proactively. I have agreed with the CRE that while local education authorities should monitor racist incidents in schools in their area, this information should not be published. Rather, we need to focus in the first instance on the consistent and accurate reporting of racist incidents in schools, alongside strategies to prevent and

bod cyfrifoldeb ar bob ysgol i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb hiliol. Atgoffir yr arolygwyr i gasglu tystiolaeth ar effaith polisi ac arfer ysgol ym maes cyfle cyfartal ac ystyried effeithiolrwydd mesurau ysgol i fynd i'r afael ag achosion o aflonyddu. Fe'u hysbyswyd yn ddiweddar hefyd bod angen iddynt nodi sut y mae ysgolion yn cofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol a hysbysu'r awdurdodau priodol ohonynt.

Yn ogystal, cefais gyd-drafodaethau pellach gyda'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol ynglŷn â rhai o'r materion a godwyd o fewn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Parhawn i gydweithio'n agos gydag ACCAC a'r Comisiwn ar weithredu rhai o'r argymhellion cyntaf. Yn sgîl y trafodaethau hynny byddwn yn llunio rhaglen weithredu erbyn mis Medi. Bydd y cynllun yn nodi ein hymrwymiaidau mewn ymateb i argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson ac yn eu rhoi ar waith a bydd yn adeiladu ar gynigion a gwaith manwl y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'r gweithgor addysg. Cytunais â'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol y byddaf yn cyfarfod ag arweinwyr cymunedau pobl ddu a lleiafrifoedd ethnig ym mis Medi er mwyn lansio'r adroddiad a'r cynllun gweithredu.

O ran un o gynigion penodol y gweithgor addysg, o dan argymhelliad 67 o adroddiad Macpherson, mae cynlluniau cychwynnol eisoes ar y gweill i gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ar ddechrau'r hydref ynglŷn â hyrwyddo deunydd cwricwlwm addas o ran amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol. Bu cryn drafodaeth ynglŷn â chofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol a hysbysu'r awdurdodau ohonynt, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones ynghyd â'r ffordd orau o fynd i'r afael ag aflonyddu hiliol mewn ysgolion. Cydnabyddaf y pryderon sydd gan rai pobl y gallai cyhoeddi digwyddiadau hiliol gael effaith negyddol ar ysgolion, ac efallai waradwyddo'r rhai sydd yn effro i'r problemau ac yn ceisio eu datrys mewn modd rhagweithiol. Cytunais â'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, er y dylai awdurdodau addysg lleol fonitro digwyddiadau hiliol mewn ysgolion o fewn eu hardaloedd, ni ddylid cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth hon. Yn hytrach, mae angen inni ganolbwyntio yn y lle cyntaf ar sicrhau y caiff yr awdurdodau

address racism. Only when we are satisfied that this consistent and preventative approach is in place would I feel it appropriate to review the present position.

Our response to the Macpherson report recommendations will also be progressed alongside the requirements of the Race Relations (Amendment) Act 2000. The CRE is currently working on a code of practice for public bodies, outlining their duties under the Act, which is due to be published in April 2002. The next step is to draw up an action plan and timetable to take these education recommendations forward. We also need to give further consideration to how we can address other related issues, such as training and promoting ethnic minority membership of school governing bodies. By September, we will have a firm action plan in place that will be based on positive and practical initiatives for schools, LEAs, and other organisations, which can be discussed by the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity.

I believe that we can now be proud of the thorough way in which the education working party and the Committee on Equality of Opportunity have addressed the Macpherson report recommendations. I am confident that we must further promote racial awareness and tackle racism in Welsh schools in the most effective way possible, with the Assembly's full support.

**Gareth Jones:** Diolchaf finnau am y cyfle i gyfrannu at ddadl ar bwnc astrus a sensitif. Yr wyf yn sicr ein bod i gyd yn ddyledus i'r gweithgor ac i'r Pwyllgor am adroddiad sydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r maes addysgol mewn perthynas â hiliaeth.

Mae'r drafodaeth ar yr adroddiad hwn yn angenrheidiol ac yn amserol o ystyried y digwyddiadau treisgar diweddar mewn cymunedau yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Yr oedd yn syndod mawr i bob un ohonom,

eu hysbysu o ddigwyddiadau hiliol o fewn ysgolion mewn modd cyson a chywir er mwyn atal hiliaeth a mynd i'r afael â hi. Dim ond pan fyddwn wedi bodloni ein hunain fod dulliau cyson ac ataliol ar waith y byddwn yn teimlo ei bod yn briodol adolygu'r sefyllfa bresennol.

Caiff ein hymateb i argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson hefyd ei ddatblygu ochr yn ochr â gofynion Deddf Cysylltiadau Hiliol (Diwygio) 2000. Mae'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol wrthi'n gweithio ar gôd ymarfer ar gyfer cyrff cyhoeddus, a fydd yn nodi eu dyletswyddau o dan y Ddeddf. Bwriedir ei gyhoeddi ym mis Ebrill 2002. Y cam nesaf yw llunio cynllun gweithredu ac amserlen i ddatblygu'r argymhellion hyn ym maes addysg. Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried ymhellach sut y gallwn fynd i'r afael â materion cysylltiedig eraill, megis hyfforddiant ac annog pobl o'r lleiafrifoedd ethnig i ddod yn aelodau o gyrff llywodraethol ysgolion. Erbyn mis Medi, bydd gennym gynllun gweithredu cadarn ar waith a fydd yn seiliedig ar fentrau cadarnhaol ac ymarferol ar gyfer ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a sefydliadau eraill. Gellir trafod y cynllun yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

Credaf y gallwn erbyn hyn ymfalchïo yn y ffordd y mae'r gweithgor addysg a'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi mynd i'r afael ag argymhellion adroddiad Macpherson. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog bod yn rhaid inni hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth hiliol ymhellach a mynd i'r afael â hiliaeth mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol bosibl, gyda chefnogaeth lawn y Cynulliad.

**Gareth Jones:** I am also grateful for the opportunity to contribute to a debate on a complicated and sensitive issue. I am certain that we are all indebted to the working party and the Committee for a report that grapples with the educational field in relation to racism.

The debate on this report is essential and timely bearing in mind the recent violent incidents in communities in north-west England. I am sure that it was a great surprise to us all to hear Lord Ouseley

yr wyf yn siŵr, glywed yr Arglwydd Ouseley yn cyfeirio at y digwyddiadau hynny. Cyfeiriodd at ddiffygion y system addysg. Yr oedd yn hynod feirniadol o'r sefyllfa bresennol sydd yn tueddu i greu a hyrwyddo gwahaniadau a sectorau ethnig—Asiaidd neu wyn—ymhlith y cymunedau. Yr oedd hynny yn ffactor o bwys. Dywedodd un prifathro:

'yr hyn y dylem ei wneud yw creu proffil llawer iawn uwch o ddeall diwylliannau eraill, a phe dechreuid hynny yn yr ysgolion cynradd, gallwn adeiladu arno yn yr ysgolion uwchradd a cheisio newid canfyddiadau pobl yn raddol'.

Deallaf fod ACCAC yn paratoi canllawiau ar gyfleoedd cyfartal a fydd yn tynnu sylw ein hysgolion at agweddau cwricwlaidd pwysig. A fydd y canllawiau hyn yn ddigon cryf? Yr anhawster yw bod y mater difrifol hwn yn ymwneud ag ymagweddau negyddol sydd yn datblygu yn fuan ym mlynnyddoedd cynnar yr unigolyn. Dyna pam bod angen rhoi sylw i brofiadau cadarnhaol cynnar yn y cartref ac yn yr ysgol.

Mae adroddiad Macpherson yn diffinio hiliaeth sefydliadol fel un yn seiliedig ar ragfarn, anwybodaeth a diffyg ystyriaeth. Mae mor hawdd anfon cam-negeseuon a chreu camargraffiadau wrth geisio, â'r ewyllys orau yn y byd, wella pethau. Drwy wneud hynny, mae pethau yn aml yn gwaethygu. Dyna pam bod yr adroddiad yn iawn i bwysleisio'r angen am hyfforddiant o'r radd flaenaf. Nid wyf yn sicr a oes digon o ymrwymiad yma i ddarparu'r adnoddau ychwanegol sydd eu hangen i sicrhau hyfforddiant effeithiol.

Yr wyf yn hynod falch fod y Pwyllgor yn argymhell adolygu gofynion hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Gobeithiaf y caiff mwy o sylw ei roi i'r mater hwn yn rhan o fframwaith datblygiad proffesiynol athrawon, sydd o dan ymgynghoriad ar hyn o bryd. Mae gwir angen i'n hathrawon sydd mewn swyddi ddeall y gofynion dwys ac astrus sydd ynghlwm â hyn.

4:30 p.m.

Mae argymhelliad 68 yn ymwneud â chofnodi digwyddiadau hiliol. Mae'n

referring to those incidents. He referred to the shortcomings in the education system. He was extremely critical of the current situation, which tends to create and promote divisions and ethnic sectors—Asian or white—among communities. That was an important factor. One head teacher said:

'what we should do is create a much higher profile in understanding other cultures, and if that was started in the primary schools, we could build on that in the secondary schools and try to change people's perceptions gradually'.

I understand that ACCAC is preparing guidelines on equality of opportunity that will draw our schools' attention to important curricular aspects. Will these guidelines be robust enough? The difficulty is that this serious issue involves negative attitudes developed at the initial stages of an individual's early years. That is why attention needs to be given to early positive experiences in the home and at school.

The Macpherson report defines institutional racism as one based on prejudice, ignorance and lack of consideration. It is so easy to send out the wrong messages and to give the wrong impression by trying, with the best will in the world, to improve things. In so doing, things often deteriorate. That is why the report is right to emphasise the need for first rate training. I am not sure whether there is sufficient commitment here to provide the additional resources that are required to ensure effective training.

I am extremely pleased that the Committee recommends a review of the induction training needs of teachers. I hope that more attention will be paid to this matter as part of the teachers' professional development framework, which is under consultation at present. We must ensure that teachers that are in post understand the profound and complex needs around this issue.

Recommendation 68 deals with recording racist incidents. It is vital that our school

hollbwysig bod ein harolygwyr ysgolion yn derbyn hyfforddiant trylwyr ar y mater hwn. Ni ddylem ddisgyn i'r fagl o greu cynghrair ysgolion ar sail nifer y digwyddiadau a gofnodir. Byddai hynny yn gamarweiniol ac yn tansailio gwaith da. Yr wyf felly yn falch bod y fframwaith arolygu bellach yn cynnwys cyfeiriadau at gyfrifoldeb ysgolion i hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb hiliol ac i rwystro hiliaeth rhag dod yn rhan o ddatblygiad moesol, cymdeithasol a diwylliannol y plentyn. Mae angen eglurdeb pellach ar y ddau beth hynny.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddweud bod yr adroddiad yn cyffwrdd ar bob agwedd o bwys sydd yn ymwneud â hiliaeth yn ein hysgolion. Mae'n pwysleisio cyfraniadau gwahanol gyrff a mudiadau, ond y prif her fydd i'r holl sefydliadau, awdurdodau lleol yn enwedig, weithredu fel bod hyrwyddo a pharchu amryw ddiwylliannau yn rhan annatod, greiddiol o'u gweithgarwch ac nid yn rhywbeth atodol, ychwanegol. Dyna pam y bydd yn rhaid i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes sylweddoli arwyddocâd y ffaith fod y fframwaith addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol yn ychwanegiad i'r cwricwlwm ac nid yn rhan ohono ar hyn o bryd.

Rhaid i'n hysgolion weithredu cwricwlwm sydd yn ymgorffori egwyddorion pwysig fel hyn fel ei fod yn rhan naturiol o bob gwers, pob pwnc, pob athro a phob disgybl, ac nid yn rhywbeth sydd yn cael ei drin a'i drafod mewn gwers arall, gan athro arall, gyda grŵp arall. Ni fedrwn osgoi egwyddor cydraddoldeb, a dylai pob gweithgaredd ysgol fod yn seiliedig arno. Mae'n ofyn mawr, ond nid oes gennym ddewis arall.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The Liberal Democrats support equality of opportunity for all, regardless of from where they come or what they represent. We believe in basic human rights, and the best way to inform people and encourage good practice is through education.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff local education authority. I will follow on briefly from Gareth Jones's comments as the

inspectors receive thorough training on this issue. We should not fall into the trap of creating a league table of schools on the basis of the incidents recorded. That would be misleading and would undermine good work. I am therefore pleased that the inspection framework now includes references to the responsibility of schools to promote racial equality and to stop racism from becoming part of the moral, social and cultural development of the child. Those two issues need greater clarification.

I close by saying that the report touches upon every important aspect involving racism in our schools. It emphasises the contribution of various organisations and bodies, but the main challenge will be for all the institutions, particularly local authorities, to act so as to ensure that the need to promote and respect diverse cultures becomes an essential and core part of their activities rather than an addendum. That is why the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee must realise the significance of the fact that the personal and social education framework is currently an addition to the curriculum and is not a part of it.

Our schools must implement a curriculum that incorporates such important principles so that they are a natural part of every lesson, every subject, every teacher, every pupil, and not something that is discussed in a separate lesson, with a separate teacher, and a separate group. We cannot avoid the principle of equality, and every school activity should be based on it. It is a great requirement, but we have no other choice.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi cyfle cyfartal i bawb, o ble bynnag y deuant a beth bynnag y maent yn ei gynrychioli. Credwn mewn hawliau dynol sylfaenol, a'r ffordd orau o addysgu pobl ac annog arfer da yw drwy addysg.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o awdurdod addysg lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Hoffwn gyfeirio'n fyr at sylwadau Gareth Jones wrth i Awdurdod

Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority is proceeding to the next full review. As public and social education is not a statutory subject and is usually pushed off the timetable because it is such a broad area and teachers feel less than confident in wading in, do we need to consider it further? Anti-racism cannot be restricted to one area, it must be implemented throughout the curriculum. Recommendation 68 suggests that the Assembly produces two leaflets for pupils and teachers to encourage the reporting of incidents. This kind of initiative will work most successfully if teachers or outside agencies are also allowed to simultaneously promote discussion and training in the school on the nature of racism. It is also important that local community agencies are actively involved in whatever initiative the school undertakes. It is important to consider teacher training. Is enough time devoted to equal opportunity issues? As a society, we are putting more emphasis on such areas, but are equivalent resources being devoted to it? We must also consider the opportunities for continuous professional development for teachers. The organisations must be encouraged to offer training, and it is important that local education authorities are also encouraged and have the resources to take up those offers.

The working party recommended that action to fund appropriate in-service training support could be taken through the grant for education, support and training. The grants for education support and training circular includes a performance indicator for the number of teachers taking racial awareness issues. It states that,

‘The Assembly will review what needs to be done in the light of what is received for the performance indicator’.

So it should. I draw the Assembly’s attention to the fact that there is presently a requirement under the Local Government (Best Value Performance Indicators) (Wales) Order 2001 to include the number of racial incidents per 100,000 population recorded throughout Wales in each local authority area. There is no

Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru nesáu at yr adolygiad llawn nesaf. Gan nad yw addysg gyhoeddus a chymdeithasol yn bwnc statudol a chan ei fod yn un sydd fel arfer yn cael ei wasgu oddi ar yr amserlen am ei fod yn faes mor helaeth ac nad yw athrawon yn teimlo’n hyderus iawn i’w drafod, a oes angen inni ystyried hyn ymhellach? Ni ellir cyfyngu gwrth-hiliaeth i un maes, rhaid ei weithredu ar draws y cwricwlwm. Awgryma argymhelliad 68 y dylai’r Cynulliad lunio dwy daflen ar gyfer disgyblion ac athrawon i’w hannog i hysbysu’r awdurdodau o ddigwyddiadau. Y ffordd fwyaf llwyddiannus i fenter o’r fath fydd os gall athrawon neu asiantaethau allanol hyrwyddo trafodaeth a hyfforddiant o fewn ysgolion ar natur hiliaeth ar yr un pryd. Mae’n bwysig hefyd bod asiantaethau yn y gymuned leol yn cymryd rhan ragweithiol ym mha fenter bynnag y bydd yr ysgol yn ymgymryd â hi. Mae’n bwysig ystyried hyfforddiant athrawon. A roddir digon o amser i faterion cyfle cyfartal? Fel cymdeithas, rhown fwy o bwyslais ar y meysydd hynny, ond a roddir yr adnoddau cyfatebol? Rhaid inni ystyried hefyd y cyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus i athrawon. Rhaid annog y sefydliadau i gynnig hyfforddiant, ac mae’n bwysig ein bod yn annog yr awdurdodau addysg lleol hefyd a bod ganddynt yr adnoddau i fanteisio ar y cynigion hynny.

Argymhellodd y gweithgor y gellid cymryd camau i weithredu cymorth hyfforddiant mewn swydd drwy’r grant ar gyfer addysg, cymorth a hyfforddiant. Mae cylchlythyr grantiau ar gyfer addysg, cymorth a hyfforddiant yn cynnwys dangosydd perfformiad ar gyfer nifer yr athrawon sydd yn cael hyfforddiant ar faterion sydd yn ymwneud ag ymwybyddiaeth hiliol. Noda,

A dylai wneud hynny. Tynnaf sylw’r Cynulliad at y ffaith bod gofyniad ar hyn o bryd o dan Orchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Dangosyddion Perfformiad Gwerth Gorau) (Cymru) 2001 i gynnwys nifer y digwyddiadau hiliol fesul 100,000 o’r boblogaeth a gofnodwyd ledled Cymru ym

comparator. There is no comparative information available nationally, so that there are no Welsh or English averages or top quartile data to compare with. The Assembly will be able to assist in that process.

**Richard Edwards:** I welcome the report and its recommendations and I commend the hard work of all concerned. It is a big step in the right direction, but it is only a step. We have a long way to go before ethnic minorities in this country and throughout the UK can feel confident that cultural diversity is valued and that racial harmony is promoted in deeds as well as words. After all, the Assembly employs only 1 per cent of its staff from an ethnic minority in a city where 6 per cent of the population is from an ethnic minority. The grim events of recent weeks in many towns and cities of northern England are a salutary reminder—if it were needed—of the difficulties and frustrations that abound and of the evil political forces that are ready to exploit and exacerbate them.

The focus on education and the education system is crucial. I emphasise the point that I made in my short debate on racism in March this year: early years education is critical. As the report says, research in this city shows that half the racist incidents explored by the race equality council involve young people under 16-years-old and that a quarter of those incidents involve children aged between six and 10-years-old. That is an indictment of our supposedly civilised and tolerant culture.

The child is father of the man, so we must catch him young, when he is impressionable and malleable. We must inculcate values of mutual respect and tolerance through education that celebrates difference as part of the rich mosaic of life, while making it clear that difference and diversity are rooted in a common humanity. To use the words of Roger McKenzie, we need an education that will give

mhob ardal awdurdod lleol. Nid oes cymharydd. Nid oes gwybodaeth gymharol ar gael yn genedlaethol, felly nid oes niferoedd cyfartalog ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr na data am y pedwarant uchaf y gellir cymharu â hwy. Bydd y Cynulliad yn gallu cynorthwyo yn y broses honno.

**Richard Edwards:** Croesawaf yr adroddiad a'i argymhellion a chymeradwyaf waith caled pawb a oedd yn ymwneud ag ef. Mae'n gam mawr i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ond dim ond un cam ydyw. Mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn y gall lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn y wlad hon a ledled y DU deimlo'n hyderus bod amrywiaeth ddiwylliannol yn cael ei gwerthfawrogi a bod cytgord hiliol yn cael ei hyrwyddo trwy weithredoedd yn ogystal â geiriau. Wedi'r cyfan, dim ond 1 y cant o'r staff a gyflogir gan y Cynulliad sydd o'r lleiafrifoedd ethnig mewn dinas lle y mae 6 y cant o'r boblogaeth o leiafrif ethnig. Mae digwyddiadau erchyll yr wythnosau diwethaf mewn llawer o drefi a dinasoedd yng ngogledd Lloegr yn ein hatgoffa—os oes angen hynny—o'r anawsterau a'r rhwystredigaethau lu a'r grymoedd gwleidyddol cas sydd yn barod i fanteisio arnynt a'u gwaethygu.

Mae'r pwyslais ar addysg a'r system addysgol yn holl bwysig. Pwysleisiaf y pwynt a wneuthum yn fy nadl fer ar hiliaeth ym mis Mawrth eleni: mae addysg blynyddoedd cynnar yn hanfodol. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, dengys ymchwil yn y ddinas hon fod hanner y digwyddiadau hiliol yr ymchwiliodd y cyngor cydraddoldeb hiliol iddynt yn ymwneud â phobl ifanc o dan 16 oed a bod chwarter o'r digwyddiadau hynny yn ymwneud â phlant rhwng chwech a 10 mlwydd oed. Mae hynny'n gondemniad o'n diwylliant gwaraidd a goddefgar tybiedig.

Y plentyn yw tad y dyn, felly rhaid inni ei ddal yn ifanc pryd y gellir dylanwadu a gwneud argraff arno. Rhaid inni argymhell gwerthoedd o barch a goddefgarwch at eraill drwy addysg sydd yn dathlu gwahaniaeth fel rhan o batrwm cyfoethog bywyd, tra'n egluro bod gwahaniaeth ac amrywiaeth wedi eu gwreiddio mewn un ddynolryw. I ddefnyddio geiriau Roger



wing to every voice and make opportunity for all a reality, not just a glib soundbite.

McKenzie, mae angen inni sicrhau addysg sydd yn rhoi llais i bob un ac yn gwireddu cyfleoedd i bawb, ac nid geiriau bachog, disylwedd.

If we do not target the child in his or her early years, we are left fire-fighting as the child accumulates the baggage of a society in which racial stereotyping and generalisation corrode civilised values and feed racism and intolerance. We have a culture and ethos that allows distortion and misrepresentation based on racial stereotyping and that encourages exclusive political ideologies that exploit difference in terms of them and us and of superior and inferior, often with the collusion of a craven press—tabloid and sometimes broadsheet.

Os nad ydym yn targedu'r plentyn yn ystod ei flynyddoedd cynnar, bydd gennym frwydr barhaus am weddill ei oes wrth i'r plentyn hel gwendidau cymdeithas lle y mae stereoteipio a chyffredinoli ar sail hiliol yn difa gwerthoedd gwaraidd ac yn annog hiliaeth a diffyg goddefgarwch. Mae gennym ddiwylliant ac ethos sydd yn esgor ar aflunio a cham-gynrychiolaeth yn seiliedig ar stereoteipiau hiliol ac sydd yn hyrwyddo athrawiaethau gwleidyddol a fydd yn allgáu ac yn manteisio ar wahaniaethau yn nhermau 'ni a nhw' ac uwchraddol ac israddol, yn aml drwy gydgyllwyn gwasg lwfr—gan gynnwys papurau tabloid ac weithiau bapurau'r dalenni llydain.

That leads to those who are perceived to be most different being targeted for racist abuse and violence, which in turn leaves us with the murder of Stephen Lawrence. Is it any wonder that the establishment failed to respond effectively to Stephen's murder when it presided over the ethos and culture that led directly to his death? I regret to say that even the present UK Government, in pursuing its asylum seekers policy, is guilty of pandering to prejudicial stereotyping instead of seeking to eradicate it.

Mae hynny'n arwain at y rhai y credir eu bod fwyaf gwahanol yn dod yn darged o ymddygiad hiliol a threisgar, sydd yn ei dro yn ein harwain at lofruddiaeth Stephen Lawrence. A oes ryfedd bod y sefydliad gwleidyddol wedi methu ag ymateb yn effeithiol i lofruddiaeth Stephen pan oedd yn ben ar ethos a diwylliant a arweiniodd yn uniongyrchol at ei farwolaeth? Mae'n resyn gennyf ddweud bod hyd yn oed Llywodraeth bresennol y DU, wrth ddilyn ei pholisi ar geiswyr lloches, yn euog o ymostwng i stereoteipio rhagfarnllyd yn hytrach na cheisio ei ddileu.

There must be a consistent and sustained onslaught on prejudice, intolerance and the acceptability of racist behaviour. Mainstreaming and integrating racial and cultural diversity throughout the curriculum, implementing the advice in the Commission for Racial Equality's 'Learning for All', training and guidance for teachers and governors with examples of good practice and tackling racist bullying and harassment as part of a whole-school strategy are crucial elements.

Rhaid inni frwydro yn ddi-ball yn erbyn rhagfarn, diffyg goddefgarwch a derbynoldeb ymddygiad hiliol. Mae prif ffrydio ac integreiddio amrywiaeth hiliol a diwylliannol ar draws y cwricwlwm, gweithredu ar y cyngor yn nogfen y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, 'Learning for All', hyfforddiant a chanllawiau i athrawon a llywodraethwyr ynghyd ag enghreifftiau o arfer da a mynd i'r afael â bwlio ac aflonyddu'n hiliol fel rhan o strategaeth ysgol gyfan yn elfennau holl bwysig.

For monitoring and the effective recording and

Er mwyn monitro, cofnodi a hysbysu'r

reporting of racist incidents, we must have accurate recording. We must take care that no obstacles or disincentives exist to schools' tackling the issue proactively. Therefore, I take the point that recorded racist incidents should be published at a local education authority level, rather than school by school, although that information should be available to the Assembly. In this most critical matter, we do not want to replicate the worst features of league tables, which, in the guise of offering parents more informed choice, often incite schools to promote themselves at the expense of the needs of their students.

As a former member of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I greatly regret that, because of timetabling problems, I can no longer be a member. The committee's work does not arouse the interest of our glorious media, as you might expect, but that work is crucial. It is most critical that the Committee is not considered a ghetto, as some Members think it should be.

I say to David Davies—who I am glad to see back in the Chamber—that I note with some concern his apparent belief that to be anti-nazi is bigoted or extremist.

4:40 p.m.

**David Davies** *rose*—

**Richard Edwards:** I do not want you to hold things up, David. Please sit down.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Richard is almost finished. He is already out of time.

**Richard Edwards:** For some of us, the equality agenda, which embraces fundamental questions of social justice and human dignity, overrides all other concerns in politics. The fight against racism, in particular, encapsulates that agenda like nothing else. The fight must be systematic and rigorous and requires steadfast and courageous leadership from every Assembly Member.

awdurdodau ynglŷn â digwyddiadau hiliol yn effeithiol, rhaid inni gael cofnodion cywir. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad oes unrhyw rwystrau nac anghymelliadau a fydd yn atal ysgolion rhag mynd i'r afael â'r mater mewn modd rhagweithiol. Felly, derbynïaf y pwynt y dylid cyhoeddi digwyddiadau hiliol a gofnodwyd ar lefel awdurdod addysg lleol yn hytrach na fesul ysgol, er y dylai'r wybodaeth honno fod ar gael i'r Cynulliad. Yn y mater holl bwysig hwn, nid ydym am efelychu nodweddion gwaethaf y tablau cynghrair, sydd, yn aml, dan gochl rhoi dewis mwy hyddysg i rieni, yn annog ysgolion i hybu eu hunain ar draul anghenion eu disgyblion.

Fel cyn-aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, gresynaf yn fawr na allaf fod yn aelod o hyd oherwydd problemau amserlen. Nid yw gwaith y pwyllgor yn ennyn diddordeb ein cyfryngau godidog, fel y byddech yn disgwyl, ond mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn holl bwysig. Mae'n bwysig iawn na chaiff y Pwyllgor ei ystyried yn geto, fel y cred rhai Aelodau y dylai fod.

Dywedaf wrth David Davies—sydd wedi dychwelyd i'r Siambr, yr wyf yn falch o nodi—fy mod yn nodi gyda pheth pryder y cred yn ôl pob golwg mai peth rhagfarnllyd neu eithafol yw bod yn wrth-natsiaidd.

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Richard Edwards:** Nid wyf am ichi darfu ar y trafodion, David. Eisteddwech os gwelwch yn dda.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae Richard bron â gorffen. Mae eisoes wedi mynd dros ei amser.

**Richard Edwards:** I rai ohonom, mae'r agenda cydraddoldeb, sydd yn cynnwys materion sylfaenol megis cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac urddas pobl yn bwysicach nag unrhyw faterion eraill mewn gwleidyddiaeth. Mae'r frwydr yn erbyn hiliaeth, yn arbennig, yn crynhoi'r agenda honno i'r dim. Rhaid i'r frwydr fod yn systematig ac yn drwyadl ac mae'n galw

am arweinyddiaeth ddi-sigl a dewr gan bob Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

**Alison Halford:** Would you mind if I do not speak, Mr Deputy Presiding Officer? I apologise, but I have a sore throat.

**Alison Halford:** A fyddai gwahaniaeth gennyh Mr Dirprwy Lywydd pe na bawn yn siarad? Ymddiheuraf, ond mae gwddf tost gennyf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Of course not. I hope that it gets better quickly.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Wrth gwrs. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn teimlo'n well yn fuan.

**Edwina Hart:** I will make a few comments in support of fellow Committee Members and Helen Mary Jones's opening speech, which dealt with a key issue that arose in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's report.

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaf ychydig sylwadau i gefnogi fy nghyd-Aelodau ar y Pwyllgor ac araith agoriadol Helen Mary Jones, a ymdriniodd â mater allweddol a godwyd o fewn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

I share some of the Committee's concerns about our early difficulties regarding the production of the report. There is a question of the report's ownership. It was very much the Committee's report. I am afraid that some within the new Assembly structures are still too precious to recognise the important role of Committees in undertaking such work.

Rhannaf rai o bryderon y Pwyllgor ynglŷn â'r anawsterau a gawsom ar y dechrau o ran paratoi'r adroddiad. Cyfyd y mater o berchenogaeth yr adroddiad. Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ydoedd yn anad dim. Ofnaf fod rhai o fewn strwythurau newydd y Cynulliad yn rhy rwysgfawr o hyd i gydnabod rôl bwysig y Pwyllgorau wrth ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn.

I welcome the commitment of the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, as well as Rosemary Butler, who was supportive in the early stages when we were considering work to implement the Stephen Lawrence report. It is essential that we take on board Gareth Jones's comments, particularly those concerning teacher training and in-house training for teachers and head teachers. That is essential if we are to deal with some of the issues.

Croesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, yn ogystal ag ymrwymiad Rosemary Butler, a oedd yn gefnogol yn ystod y camau cynnar pan oeddem yn ystyried y gwaith o weithredu adroddiad Stephen Lawrence. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn ystyried sylwadau Gareth Jones, yn arbennig y rhai sydd yn ymwneud â hyfforddiant athrawon a hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon a phenaethiaid. Mae hynny'n hanfodol er mwyn inni ymdrin â rhai o'r materion.

In its last week of business before the summer recess, it is important that the Assembly discusses key racism issues. I support the comments that others have made. It is important that such issues are discussed properly in the Assembly and have an impact on the lives of the people of Wales.

Yn ystod yr wythnos olaf o'i fusnes cyn toriad yr haf, mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn trafod materion allweddol sydd yn ymwneud â hiliaeth. Cefnogaf y sylwadau a wnaeth Aelodau eraill. Mae'n bwysig i faterion o'r fath gael eu trafod mewn modd priodol yn y Cynulliad ac yn dylanwadu ar fywydau pobl Cymru.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I thought that you had forgotten about me, Deputy Presiding Officer.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Meddyliais eich bod wedi anghofio amdanaf, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

The debate has been consensual in some ways. I am sure that it would be difficult for an outsider to know which Member belongs to which party—perhaps with one exception. I endorse everything that has been said. Like other Members, I welcome the recommendation to collate and report racial incidents, but I have concerns about how records might be published and used—I welcome the Minister's assurance on that. All schools would have to sign up to that proposal, otherwise there would be a distorted view of the situation in Wales. It could seem that schools with a high number of black and ethnic minority pupils had a proportionately high problem.

As Richard Edwards said, we want no league tables, which would be totally unfair. I welcome the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning's commitment to taking equality training to LEAs. I hope that all governors and school staff—teaching and non-teaching—will undertake equality training. The challenge for us all is to ensure that the recommendations are implemented. Words are easy but actions take a bit more effort.

**David Davies:** I am grateful for the opportunity to clarify my earlier comments. I suspect that Richard Edwards deliberately misheard me. I did not at any point talk about being anti-Nazi. I talked about the Anti-Nazi League, which is a political organisation. I reflected the comments of two Labour MPs—Siôn Simon and Marsha Singh, who said that the far right was not only to blame. The far right takes its share of the blame—we all accept that—but the extreme left is also to blame. It deliberately played upon the fears of certain communities and exploited those fears to whip up violence. Both MPs made that point. They knew what they were talking about, unlike Richard Edwards. Marsha Singh went quite a bit further in suggesting that some violence was simply general yobbery and drunkenness. He called for the police to be able to use water cannon on protestors, whether black, white, extreme left or extreme right. It was wonderful that an Asian Labour MP talked such common sense. Far more common sense came from him than from

Bu consensws yn y ddadl ar sawl ystyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n anodd i unrhyw un o'r tu allan wybod i ba blaid y mae'r Aelodau yn perthyn—ac un eithriad o bosibl. Ategap y cyfan a ddywedwyd. Fel yr Aelodau eraill, croesawaf yr argymhelliad i goladu gwybodaeth am ddiwyddiadau hiliol a hysbysu'r awdurdodau ohonynt, ond yr wyf yn pryderu ynglŷn â'r ffordd y câi cofnodion eu cyhoeddi a'u defnyddio—croesawaf sicrwydd y Gweinidog ar hynny. Byddai'n rhaid i bob ysgol gytuno ar y cynnig hwnnw, fel arall byddai camargraff o'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Gellid ymddangos fel pe bai gan ysgolion â nifer uchel o ddisgyblion du neu ddisgyblion o leiafrifoedd ethnig broblem llawer mwy.

Fel y dywedodd Richard Edwards, nid oes eisiau tablau cynghrair arnom. Byddai hynny'n hollol annheg. Croesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i roi hyfforddiant ar gydraddoldeb i'r AALI. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob llywodraethwr ac aelod o staff—athrawon ac aelodau o staff nad ydynt yn addysgu—yn cael hyfforddiant ar gydraddoldeb. Yr her i ni oll yw sicrhau y caiff yr argymhellion eu gweithredu. Haws dweud na gwneud.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i egluro fy sylwadau cynharach. Credaf i Richard Edwards fy nghamddeall yn fwriadol. Nid oeddwn yn sôn am fod yn wrth-natsiaidd o gwbl. Siaradais am y Cynghrair Gwrth-Natsiaidd, sydd yn sefydliad gwleidyddol. Yr oeddwn yn adleisio sylwadau dau Aelod Seneddol Llafur—Siôn Simon a Marsha Singh, a ddywedodd nad yr adain dde eithaf oedd ar fai yn unig. Mae'r adain dde eithaf yn rhannol gyfrifol—yr ydym oll yn derbyn hynny—ond mae'r adain chwaith eithaf hefyd ar fai. Chwaraeodd ar ofnau rhai cymunedau yn fwriadol a manteisiodd ar yr ofnau hynny er mwyn ennyn trais. Gwnaeth y ddau AS y pwynt hwnnw. Gwyddent beth yr oeddent yn sôn amdano, yn wahanol i Richard Edwards. Aeth Marsha Singh ymhellach o dipyn gan awgrymu mai ymddygiad iobiaidd a meddwdod oedd wrth wraidd y trais mewn nifer o achosion. Galwodd ar yr heddlu i fod mewn sefyllfa i ddefnyddio canon dŵr ar wrthdystwyr,

certain Assembly Members today.

**David Melding:** The Committee on Equality of Opportunity and its sub-committee did valuable work in this area, led most ably by Helen Mary. She was tenacious enough to ensure that the subject was not sidelined. Initially, we had a somewhat cool reception, but matters have gathered pace now, which is pleasing. I can summarise the position by saying that we feel confident that we are on track, but we have a long way to go.

I will respond to one or two matters: I do not have enough time to respond to what every Member said in this valuable debate. However, I welcome the interest taken by a wide cross-section of Members in this issue. The Minister welcomed the constructive proposals and we are confident that the Executive is taking these issues forward meaningfully. Estyn's work on inspection is valuable, and the greater role of personal and social education in the curriculum and promotional materials will be important as we seek to mainstream these issues. However, I say to the Minister, and I am sure that she is aware of this, that, with an action plan and a timetable, we will be able to monitor your progress most effectively. I assure you that we will do so, and we have every confidence that you will respond adequately to these issues.

boed yn ddu, yn wyn, ar y chwith eithaf neu ar y dde eithaf. Yr oedd yn wych clywed AS Llafur sydd yn Asiad yn siarad mor synhwyrol. Yr oedd yntau'n llawer mwy synhwyrol na rhai Aelodau'r Cynulliad heddiw.

**David Melding:** Gwnaeth y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal a'i is-bwyllgor waith gwerthfawr yn y maes hwn, o dan arweiniad medrus Helen Mary. Bu'n ddigon cyndyn i sicrhau na chafodd y pwnc ei roi o'r neilltu. Ar y dechrau cawsom ymateb llugoer braidd, ond mae pethau wedi datblygu erbyn hyn, sydd yn dda. Gallaf grynhoi'r sefyllfa drwy ddweud ein bod yn teimlo'n hyderus ein bod ar y trywydd iawn, ond bod tipyn o ffordd i fynd.

Ymatebaf i un neu ddau fater: nid oes digon o amser gennyf i ymateb i'r hyn a ddywedodd pob Aelod yn y ddadl werthfawr hon. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y ffaith i drawstoriad eang o'r Aelodau ymddiddori yn y mater hwn. Croesawodd y Gweinidog y cynigion adeiladol ac yr ydym yn ffyddiog y bydd y Weithrediaeth yn gweithredu ar y materion hyn mewn modd ystyrlon. Mae gwaith arolygu Estyn yn werthfawr, a bydd rôl ehangach addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol yn y cwricwlwm a deunyddiau hyrwyddo yn bwysig wrth inni geisio rhoi'r materion hyn yn y brif ffrwd. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn ymwybodol o hyn, mai drwy gynllun gweithredu ac amserlen y gallwn fonitro eich cynnydd fwyaf effeithiol. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y gwnawn hynny, ac yr ydym yn ffyddiog y byddwch yn ymateb i'r materion hyn yn ddigonol.

Gareth Jones said that ACCAC's guidelines need to be strong. I agree with that: it is a serious matter that needs to be at the top of our agenda, which must be reflected in the guidance that will be sent out. Gareth made the crucial point that ensuring effective training on a range of equality issues during initial teacher training, is a different issue to the professional, in-post development that is needed. That is an ongoing matter and it is important that it is achieved.

Dyweddodd Gareth Jones fod angen i ganllawiau ACCAC fod yn gryf. Cytunaf â hynny: mae'n fater difrifol a ddylai fod ar frig ein hagenda. Rhaid i hynny gael ei adlewyrchu yn y canllawiau a gaiff eu dosbarthu. Gwnaeth Gareth bwynt holl bwysig bod sicrhau hyfforddiant effeithiol ar ystod o faterion sydd yn ymwneud â chydreddoldeb yn ystod hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon, yn fater gwahanol i'r datblygiad proffesiynol, mewn swydd sydd ei angen. Mae hynny'n fater sydd yn mynd rhagddo ac mae'n bwysig i hynny gael ei gyflawni.

Pauline Jarman made the point that we must mainstream race and diversity issues. It is not just a matter for PSE or for a restricted range of subjects; it concerns the whole spectrum of the school environment and curriculum. It is true that there are many sins of commission in this area, but there have also been many sins of omission. Those can be equally damaging, or more damaging in some cases.

Gwnaeth Pauline Jarman y pwynt bod yn rhaid inni brif ffrydio materion sydd yn ymwneud â hil ac amrywiaeth. Nid mater i addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol neu ystod gyfyngedig o bynciau yn unig ydyw; mae'n ymwneud â phob agwedd ar amgylchedd a chwricwlwm yr ysgol. Mae'n wir dweud bod gormod o fentrau yn y maes hwn, ond mae gormod o bethau sydd wedi eu hepgor hefyd. Gallai'r rhain fod yr un mor niweidiol, neu'n fwy niweidiol mewn rhai achosion.

Edwina Hart praised the Committee's work. I do not think that the Committee would have achieved what it has achieved without your inspiring lead, Edwina. You have really encouraged us. You have not ducked tough issues. We have been able to come forward with interesting proposals.

Canmolwyd gwaith y Pwyllgor gan Edwina Hart. Ni chredaf y byddai'r Pwyllgor wedi cyflawni'r hyn a gyflawnodd heb eich arweiniad ysbrydoledig, Edwina. Yr ydych wedi ein calonogi yn wir. Ni wnaethoch osgoi unrhyw faterion anodd. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gyflwyno cynigion diddorol.

In summary, I thank everyone for their interest this afternoon. Members grasp this subject's importance. However, we have made a modest start and there is a long way to go. We will need to monitor our progress most vigorously.

I grynhoi, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am eu diddordeb y prynhawn yma. Mae'r Aelodau yn sylweddoli pa mor bwysig yw'r pwnc hwn. Fodd bynnag, er ein bod wedi dechrau'n weddol mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd. Bydd angen inni fonitro ein cynnydd yn drwyadl iawn.

*Cynnig: O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

### **Diwygio'r Cyfarwyddyd ar Gwestiynau'r Cynulliad Revision of the Guidance on Assembly Questions**

**The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod  
**(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly adopts the guidance on Assembly questions as laid in the Table office on 9 July 2001. (NDM750)* y Cynulliad yn mabwysiadu'r cyfarwyddyd ar gwestiynau'r Cynulliad a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Gorffennaf 2001. (NDM750)

*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick

Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd yn ôl i'r Gadair am 4.48 p.m.  
 The Presiding Officer returned to the Chair at 4.48 p.m.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Minister for Assembly Business Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod  
**(Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, brings forward the no-named day motion on the new Assembly building tabled on 12 July 2001.* y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn dwyn ymlaen y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad a gyflwynwyd ar 12 Gorffennaf 2001.



*Cynnig: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

### **Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad The New Assembly Building**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of William Graham, amendment 2 in the name of Michael German and amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 4, 5, 6, 7 a 8 yn enw William Graham, gwelliant 2 yn enw Michael German a gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly, further to its resolution of 21 June 2000, resolves:*

*to seek competitive tenders for the completion of the Assembly building based on the design prepared by the Richard Rogers Partnership and either lease it to the Assembly or sell it for an agreed lump sum; and, pending acceptance of such a tender, to suspend works on the building. (NNDM773)*

I regret having to report to the Assembly today that, despite previous assurance by the Richard Rogers Partnership and the findings of the Turner and Townsend review of estimates in the spring and last summer, it will not be possible to deliver the new Assembly building within the approved construction budget of £13.8 million and, therefore, within the overall projected budget of £26.6 million. When I reported on progress to the Assembly in January, I noted that, despite the fact that the project remained on budget, some cost pressures were emerging and that there could be some small call on contingencies. In light of that, I signalled my intention to commission a thorough review of costs.

The review involved the Assembly's external independent quantity surveyors, the Symmonds Group, the Richard Rogers Partnership and its surveyors, Hanscomb, the management contractor, Skanska, and our in-house quantity surveyor. The review has been time-consuming and very thorough. It highlighted significant underestimates in the cost plan prepared by the Richard Rogers Partnership. The main conclusion was a forecast out-turn construction cost of £24 million, with substantial risks of further costs. That meant a project out-turn cost in excess of £40 million. When it became apparent, during the review, that the costs were higher than anticipated, a cost reduction exercise, undertaken by the Richard Rogers Partnership, was instigated by my officials.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ymhellach at ei benderfyniad ar 21 Mehefin 2000, yn penderfynu:*

*ceisio tendrau cystadleuol i gwblhau adeilad y Cynulliad, wedi ei seilio ar y dyluniad a baratowyd gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, ac un ai ei brydlesu i'r Cynulliad neu ei werthu am un swm y cytunwyd arno; a gohirio gwaith ar yr adeilad nes i'r fath dendr gael ei dderbyn. (NNDM773)*

Gresynaf fod yn rhaid imi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad heddiw na fydd modd codi adeilad newydd y Cynulliad o fewn y gyllideb adeiladu a gymeradwywyd sef £13.8 miliwn ac, felly, o fewn cyfanswm y gyllideb arfaethedig sef £26.6 miliwn, er gwaethaf y sicrwydd a roddwyd gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers o'r blaen a chanfyddiadau adolygiad Turner a Townsend o'r amcangyfrifon yn y gwanwyn a'r haf diwethaf. Pan roddais adroddiad ar y datblygiadau i'r Cynulliad ym mis Ionawr, nodais fod rhai pwysau o ran costau yn dod i'r golwg, er gwaethaf y ffaith i'r prosiect barhau i fod o fewn ei gyllideb, ac y byddai angen defnyddio rhywfaint o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn. Yng ngoleuni hynny, nodais fy mwriad i gomisiynu adolygiad trylwyr o'r costau.

Yr oedd yr adolygiad yn cynnwys syrfewyr meintiau annibynnol, allanol y Cynulliad, sef Grŵp Symmonds, Partneriaeth Richard Rogers a'i syrfewyr, Hanscomb, y contractwr rheoli, Skanska a'n syrfewr meintiau mewnol. Bu'r adolygiad yn hirfaith ac yn drwyadl iawn. Amlygodd achosion o danamcangyfrif sylweddol yn y cynllun cost a baratowyd gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers. Y prif gasgliad oedd rhagweld cost adeiladu alldro o £24 miliwn, gyda risg sylweddol o gostau pellach. Golygai hynny y gallai cost alldro y prosiect fod yn uwch na £40 miliwn. Pan ddaeth yn amlwg, yn ystod yr adolygiad, bod y costau'n uwch nag a ragwelwyd, ar anogaeth fy swyddogion, ymgymerodd Partneriaeth Richard Rogers ag ymarfer lleihau costau. Yn sgîl hynny bu

This brought about design changes that led to some cost savings, but not to the extent that would bring the scheme back within budget. The figures presented today reflect those design changes. The Assembly will want to note that they include a reduction in the building's footprint, which has not compromised the basic design, its visual impact or the facilities that will be available to members of the public.

It is clear that the scheme design that we were invited to sign off in November could not have been constructed for anywhere near the estimates we were provided with at that time. The estimating process is a matter for the scheme's cost consultant and forms part of the Richard Rogers Partnership design team's commission. I am confident that the administration's policy steering group or the Assembly's project team could not have done any more than they have to predict and control costs. In recognition of my stated desire to keep tight control of costs, the Assembly has, throughout the process, been advised on costs by our independent quantity surveyors, appointed in January 2001.

Cost increases of this magnitude require us to question whether it is right to proceed or not, and, if it is right, whether to continue with the current procurement method and the present architectural team. The policy steering group and I remain of the view that the Assembly still needs a new chamber and that it should be built on the current site and to the Richard Rogers Partnership design. This was the Assembly's resolution in June 2000, and it is still possible to deliver a building in accordance with the Assembly's wishes. Unfortunately, we have also come to the conclusion that we cannot be confident with the current arrangements that the building could be delivered within a cost that the Assembly would consider to be reasonably close to its expectations.

Members will be aware that a letter I received from Lord Rogers has been placed in the public domain. This is unfortunate, as I would not normally wish to comment on correspondence between the Assembly and one of its contractors. However, as it is in the public domain and raises serious issues, I feel that I must comment. I am satisfied that Lord

newidiadau i'r cynllun a arweiniodd at rai arbedion, ond nid y fath arbedion a fyddai'n sicrhau bod y cynllun o fewn y gyllideb eto. Mae'r ffigurau a gyflwynir heddiw yn adlewyrchu'r newidiadau hynny i'r cynllun. Bydd y Cynulliad am nodi eu bod yn cynnwys lleihad yng nghwmpas yr adeilad, nad yw wedi cyfaddawdu'r cynllun sylfaenol, ei olwg na'r cyfleusterau a fydd ar gael i aelodau'r cyhoedd.

Mae'n amlwg na ellid bod wedi adeiladu'r cynllun y gofynnwyd inni ei gymeradwyo'n derfynol ym mis Tachwedd o fewn yr amcangyfrifon a roddwyd inni ar y pryd o bell ffordd. Mae'r broses amcangyfrifo yn fater i ymgynghorydd cost y cynllun ac yn rhan o gomisiwn tîm cynllunio Partneriaeth Richard Rogers. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog na allai grŵp llywio polisi'r weinyddiaeth na thîm prosiect y Cynulliad fod wedi gwneud rhagor i ragweld a rheoli costau. Fel cydnabyddiaeth o'm dymuniad datganedig i reoli costau'n dynn, cafodd y Cynulliad, drwy gydol y broses, wybodaeth ar gostau gan ein syrfewyr meintiau annibynnol, a benodwyd ym mis Ionawr 2001.

Mae cynnydd mor fawr mewn costau yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol inni holi a yw'n briodol bwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun ai peidio, ac, os yw'n briodol, a ddylid parhau â'r dull caffael presennol a'r tîm pensaernïol presennol. Mae'r grŵp llywio polisi a minnau o'r farn o hyd bod angen siambr newydd ar y Cynulliad ac y dylid ei chodi ar y safle bresennol ac yn unol â chynllun Partneriaeth Richard Rogers. Dyna oedd penderfyniad y Cynulliad ym mis Mehefin 2000, ac mae'n bosibl codi adeilad yn unol â dymuniadau'r Cynulliad o hyd. Yn anffodus, yr ydym hefyd wedi dod i'r casgliad na allwn fod yn hyderus y gellid codi'r adeilad am bris y byddai'r Cynulliad yn ei ystyried yn weddol agos at ei ddisgwyliadau o dan y trefniadau presennol.

Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol bod llythyr a gefais gan yr Arglwydd Rogers bellach yn gyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n anffodus, gan na fyddwn fel arfer am wneud sylwadau ar ohebiaeth rhwng y Cynulliad ac un o'i gontractwyr. Fodd bynnag, gan ei fod yn eiddo cyhoeddus bellach ac yn codi materion difrifol, teimlaf fod yn rhaid imi wneud

Rogers and his team had every opportunity to present the cost plan and their views on the current situation to me personally, as the investment decision-maker, and to the policy steering group. I am also satisfied that the majority of the cost increase identified as a result of the cost review is not due to client changes or enhancements. In total, we estimate that, even with the most generous interpretation, only about £1.2 million of the increase is due to the client.

Finally, I have no doubt, on the basis of external independent professional advice received from the Symmonds Group during the cost review, that most of the cost increase is due to the underestimation of the scope, content and work contained in the Richard Rogers Partnership's original cost plan.

As you have heard, the Richard Rogers Partnership has said that my representatives—and I understand that to mean my officials and their professional advisers—have attempted to disguise costs. Officials have kept me fully informed on costs throughout the project. Neither the policy steering group nor I have been misled at any stage and I have every confidence in the advice that I have received. Lord Rogers was asked to substantiate that statement, but was unable to provide any evidence. The discussions with Lord Rogers have not been able to reconcile our views on the reason for the cost increases or to convince me that we will be able to work together to deliver the building within an agreed budget.

Colleagues from the policy steering group share that view and we concluded unanimously that we should terminate the employment of the Richard Rogers Partnership. Termination takes effect as from today. The Assembly's resolution that a Chamber should be built to RRP's design is not affected. The policy steering group remains of the view that there is a need for the Chamber, that it should be on the existing site and that the RRP design should be progressed through to completion. The

sylwadau arno. Yr wyf yn fodlon bod yr Arglwydd Rogers a'i dîm wedi cael pob cyfle i gyflwyno'r cynllun cost ac i roi eu barn ar y sefyllfa bresennol imi yn bersonol, fel yr unigolyn sydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar fuddsoddi, ac i'r grŵp llywio polisi. Yr wyf hefyd yn fodlon nad newidiadau neu welliannau y cleient sydd yn gyfrifol am y cynnydd mewn costau a nodwyd o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad o gostau. Amcangyfrifwn, hyd yn oed ar ôl rhoi'r wedd fwyaf hael ar gostau, mai dim ond £1.2 miliwn o'r cynnydd, fel cyfanswm, y gellir ei briodoli i'r cleient.

Yn olaf, nid oes unrhyw amheuaeth gennyf, ar sail y cyngor proffesiynol annibynnol allanol a roddodd Grŵp Symmonds yn ystod yr adolygiad o gostau, mai'r tanamcangyfrifon a geir yng nghynllun cost gwreiddiol Partneriaeth Richard Rogers ynglŷn â chwmpas, cynnwys a gwaith sydd yn gyfrifol am y rhan fwyaf o'r cynnydd mewn costau.

Fel y clywsoch, dywedodd Partneriaeth Richard Rogers fod fy nghynrychiolwyr—a deallaf mai fy swyddogion a'u hymgyngorwyr proffesiynol a olyga—wedi ceisio celu costau. Mae'r swyddogion wedi rhoi gwybodaeth lawn imi ynglŷn â'r costau drwy gydol y prosiect. Ni chafodd y grŵp llywio polisi na minnau ychwaith ein camarwain ar unrhyw adeg ac yr wyf yn gwbl hyderus am y cyngor a gefais. Gofynnwyd i'r Arglwydd Rogers brofi'r datganiad hwnnw, ond ni allai roi unrhyw dystiolaeth. Nid yw'r trafodaethau gyda'r Arglwydd Rogers wedi helpu inni ddod i gytundeb barn ynglŷn â'r rheswm dros y cynnydd mewn costau nac i'm darbwylllo y byddwn yn gallu cydweithio i godi'r adeilad o fewn y gyllideb y cytunwyd arni.

Mae cyd-Aelodau o'r grŵp llywio polisi yn cyd-fynd â hynny a buom yn unfrydol y dylem derfynu cyflogaeth Partneriaeth Richard Rogers. Daw i ben heddiw. Nid effeithir ar benderfyniad y Cynulliad y dylid adeiladu Siambr yn unol â chynllun RRP. Mae'r grŵp llywio polisi o'r farn o hyd bod angen dadleudy, y dylai fod ar y safle bresennol ac y dylid parhau â chynllun RRP nes iddo gael ei gwblhau. Mae hawl gan y Cynulliad i ddefnyddio dogfennau'r cynllun er mwyn cwblhau'r gwaith o godi'r adeilad.

Assembly is entitled to use the design documents to complete the building.

The motion before you offers us a means of achieving that. We are of the view that, by going to the market and seeking the services of a developer to finish the design and construct the building, the Assembly will be able to achieve its desired outcome. It will be able to do so in a way that leads to cost reduction, an increased degree of cost certainty prior to the contract being signed and risk transfer from the public to the private sector.

In essence, the course of action that we propose will be to proceed with the RRP design in a way that keeps costs to a minimum and gives us as much cost certainty as possible. I believe that this will best be achieved by appointing a developer to complete the design and construct the building, either for an agreed lump sum or on the basis of a lease agreement. That would mean suspending the work currently taking place on site and following the European Union procurement rules to secure a new developer to take the design forward. This is bound to cause delay to the current programme and it is evident that the building will not be completed before the next election. It is important to note that the motion only commits the Assembly to go to the market to establish the cost of pursuing the developer option. Final decisions on whether developer options offer value for money and whether we should proceed will not be taken until then.

In commending the motion to the Assembly, I reiterate that I very much regret that it has not been possible to proceed with the scheme as originally proposed. However, it is the Assembly's duty to act professionally and responsibly, to be vigilant on behalf of the people of Wales and to do everything possible to reduce costs and obtain value for money. Given that we no longer have confidence in the present contractual arrangements, we believe that it is better to take remedial steps now than to face an uncertain and potentially costly future. I believe that the course of action set out in the motion offers the best way forward to ensure that the people of Wales and the Assembly

Mae'r cynnig ger eich bron yn fodd inni gyflawni hynny. Yr ydym o'r farn y bydd y Cynulliad yn gallu cyflawni ei ddymuniad drwy fynd i'r farchnad a cheisio gwasanaethau datblygwr i gwblhau'r cynllun a chodi'r adeilad. Bydd yn gallu gwneud hynny mewn ffordd a fydd yn arwain at leihau costau, mwy o sicrwydd o ran costau cyn i'r contract gael ei lofnodi a throsglwyddo'r risg o'r sector cyhoeddus i'r sector preifat.

Yn y bôn, y camau a argymhellwn yw bwrw ymlaen â chynllun RRP mewn modd sydd yn lleihau costau i'r eithaf a rhoi cymaint o sicrwydd â phosibl inni o ran costau. Credaf mai'r ffordd orau o gyflawni hynny fydd penodi datblygwr i gwblhau'r cynllun a chodi'r adeilad, naill ai am gyfandaliad y cytunwyd arno neu ar sail cytundeb prydles. Golygai hynny ohirio'r gwaith sydd yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn o bryd ar y safle a dilyn rheolau caffael yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i sicrhau datblygwr newydd a fydd yn bwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun. Bydd hyn wrth reswm yn achosi oedi o safbwynt y rhaglen bresennol ac mae'n amlwg na chaiff yr adeilad ei gwblhau cyn yr etholiad nesaf. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod y cynnig ond yn ymrwymo'r Cynulliad i fynd i'r farchnad i ganfod beth fydd dilyn opsiwn y datblygwr yn ei gostio. Ni wneir penderfyniadau terfynol pa un a yw'r opsiynau ar gyfer datblygwyr yn rhoi gwerth am arian ac a ddylem fwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun ai peidio tan hynny.

Wrth gymeradwyo'r cynnig i'r Cynulliad, pwysleisiaf fy mod yn edifarhau'n fawr iawn nad oedd modd parhau â'r cynllun fel y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol. Fodd bynnag, mae dyletswydd ar y Cynulliad i ymddwyn yn broffesiynol ac yn gyfrifol, i fod yn wyliadwrus ar ran pobl Cymru ac i wneud popeth o fewn ei allu i leihau costau a sicrhau gwerth am arian. O gofio nad oes gennym unrhyw ffydd yn y trefniadau cytundebol presennol erbyn hyn, credwn y byddai'n well pe baem yn cymryd camau unioni yn awr yn hytrach nag wynebu dyfodol ansicr a chostus o bosibl. Credaf fod y camau a nodwyd yn y cynnig yn rhoi'r ffordd orau ymlaen er mwyn sicrhau y bydd gan bobl Cymru a'r Cynulliad

have the landmark building that we all envisaged, but in the most cost-effective way.

**Y Llywydd:** Os ymddengys y byddwn yn parhau wedi 5.30 p.m., byddaf yn gofyn i'r Trefnydd gynnig cynnig trefniadol pellach i'n galluogi i barhau wedi'r amser hwnnw a galwaf bleidlais ar hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendments in the name of William Graham. Amendment 1: delete everything after 'to' and insert '*cancel the new Assembly building project*'.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*to publish immediately the full costs expended and or committed to the new Assembly building to date.*

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*to publish immediately the reasons for ending the contract with the Richard Rogers Partnership and the costs associated with that decision.*

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*to publish immediately the costs of discontinuing with the new Assembly building project.*

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*to deplore the failure to set out the facts of the circumstances surrounding the cancellation of the contract at an early date.*

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*to postpone the decision on the new Assembly building until all the facts and figures are established regarding the project costs expended or committed to date and the costs of cancelling the contract with the Richard Rogers Partnership are published, if necessary recalling the full Assembly in the*

yr adeilad o fri yr oeddem oll yn ei ragweld, ond yn y ffordd fwyaf cost effeithiol.

**The Presiding Officer:** If it appears that we will continue after 5.30 p.m., I will ask the Minister for Assembly Business to propose a further procedural motion to allow us to continue after that time and I will call a vote on that.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw William Graham. Gwelliant 1: dileer popeth a rhoi '*Canslo prosiect Adeilad newydd y Cynulliad*' yn ei le.

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwaneger pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*cyhoeddi ar unwaith y costau llawn a dalwyd neu a ymrwymwyd i'w talu am Adeilad newydd y Cynulliad hyd yn hyn.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwaneger pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*cyhoeddi ar unwaith y rhesymau am derfynu'r contract gyda Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers a'r costau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r penderfyniad hwnnw.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwaneger pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*cyhoeddi ar unwaith gostau peidio â pharhau â Phrosiect Adeilad newydd y Cynulliad.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwaneger pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*gresynu'r methiant i gyhoeddi'r ffeithiau ynghylch canslo'r contract yn gynnar.*

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwaneger pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*gohirio'r penderfyniad ar Adeilad newydd y Cynulliad hyd nes y sefydlir yr holl ffeithiau a'r ffigurau ynghylch costau'r prosiect a dalwyd neu yr ymrwymwyd i'w talu hyd yn hyn, ac y cyhoeddir costau canslo'r cytundeb gyda Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers, gan alw'r Cynulliad cyfan yn ôl dros Doriad yr*

*summer recess.*

Presiding Officer, I thank you for your flexibility in indicating that this debate can continue beyond 5.30 p.m. I hope that that sets a sensible precedent if nothing else sensible comes from reopening this issue yet again. I deplore the fact that this is being sprung on us at this late stage. If you had not shown such flexibility, we would have had insufficient time to debate this. I cannot understand why it is necessary. We have not been given all the facts and figures. They should be given to all Assembly Members and should be available to the general public, to enable them to see what is being done in their name. I cannot understand why that is not the case.

It could well be that, at this stage, cancellation is the most sensible option. We have not been informed of the cost of cancellation. However, I have seen an authoritative document, upon which the Minister might like to comment, that indicates that the cost of cancellation at this stage would be £10 million. That document also indicates that the total cost of proceeding would be no less than £47 million. The same document indicates that there is no faith in the project being delivered within £47 million nor in items such as the roof being included in that cost. Last time I looked at the weather, a roof seemed to be essential. If that increases the cost further, the original estimate of £50 million that we discussed, for which we were accused of scaremongering, appears to be closer to the truth. Fifty million pounds now seems to be the cost of this building, which, by any token, is a massive amount.

5:00 p.m.

There has been talk of it being a symbol of the new Wales, but this morning I looked out of the windows on the other side of this building at the black hole that represents the new Assembly building and I must say that it looked rather symbolic of the disaster—and I am glad that the First Minister has returned to the Chamber—facing this administration. To be fair to Rhodri Morgan, he sought to review the decision on the new building at an

*Haf os oes angen.*

Lywydd, diolch ichi am fod yn hyblyg wrth nodi y gall y ddadl hon barhau ar ôl 5.30 p.m. Gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n rhoi cynsail synhwyrol hyd yn oed os na ddaw unrhyw beth synhwyrol yn sgîl y penderfyniad i ddychwelyd at y mater hwn unwaith eto. Gresynaf wrth y ffaith bod hyn wedi'i gyflwyno inni mor hwyr. Pe na baech wedi bod mor hyblyg, ni fyddem wedi cael digon o amser i gynnal dadl ar y mater hwn. Ni allaf ddeall pam bod hyn yn angenrheidiol. Nid ydym wedi cael yr holl fanylion. Dylai pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad gael y manylion a dylent fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd, er mwyn iddynt gael gweld beth a gaiff ei wneud yn eu henw hwy. Ni allaf ddeall pam na ddigwyddodd hynny.

Mae'n ddigon posibl mai canslo'r adeilad yw'r opsiwn mwyaf synhwyrol ar hyn o bryd. Ni chawsom wybodaeth ynglŷn â chost canslo. Fodd bynnag, gwelais ddogfen awdurdodol, efallai yr hoffai'r Gweinidog wneud sylwadau arni, sydd yn nodi mai cost canslo fyddai £10 miliwn ar hyn o bryd. Noda'r ddogfen honno hefyd y byddai'n costio o leiaf £47 miliwn inni fwrw ymlaen â'r adeilad. Noda'r un ddogfen nad oes unrhyw un yn hyderus y caiff y prosiect ei gyflawni am lai na £47 miliwn na bod eitemau megis y to wedi eu cynnwys yn y gost honno. Y tro diwethaf imi edrych ar y tywydd, ymddengys imi y byddai to yn hanfodol. Os bydd hynny yn peri i'r gost gynyddu eto, ymddengys fod yr amcangyfrif gwreiddiol sef £50 miliwn a grybwyllwyd gennym, a chawsom ein cyhuddo o godi bwganod o'r herwydd, yn nes at y gwirionedd. Ymddengys mai £50 miliwn fydd cost yr adeilad hwn erbyn hyn, sydd yn swm enfawr ar unrhyw gyfrif.

Bu sôn y byddai'r adeilad yn symbol o'r Gymru newydd, ond y bore yma pan edrychais allan o'r ffenestri ar ochr arall yr adeilad hwn ar y twll du lle y bydd adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, rhaid imi ddweud ei fod yn edrych fel symbol o'r drychineb—ac yr wyf yn falch bod Prif Weinidog Cymru wedi dychwelyd i'r Siambr—a wyneba'r weinyddiaeth hon. A bod yn deg â Rhodri Morgan, ceisiodd adolygu'r penderfyniad ar

early stage. I do not think that he is in favour of its construction. He did not favour this option when we last voted on it. At this eleventh hour, would it not be sensible to cancel the project and concentrate on issues that matter to the people of Wales such as health, education and rural services? We do not have all the figures, so we cannot be certain, but I have seen documents that indicate that cancellation is the sensible option. If the facts and figures that I have seen are correct, continuing with the project would be expensive.

I encourage Edwina Hart—who has previously had a reputation for openness, which has taken a bit of a dent over this—to publish the figures so that we can all see them. If we are going to make a decision on this, those figures should be available to us and they should not be trotted out quickly at the beginning of a debate when we do not have a copy of the statement in front of us. That is not how this Assembly should operate. Therefore, I encourage the Minister to publish the figures. If necessary, we should be recalled during the summer recess to consider this matter, if the facts and figures become available.

I take no real pleasure in saying that this was a disaster waiting to happen and that we predicted it. This issue is more serious than party politics. It affects the institution of the Assembly and the perception of Wales. As I said, the black hole next to the Assembly building serves as a symbol. I hope that that is not how people will remember the first term of the National Assembly for Wales, but nothing that I have heard this afternoon convinces me otherwise. Money, time and effort have been wasted. This issue keeps coming back to us. Should we not be cancelling this project now or, at least, see all the facts and figures so that we can make a sensible decision rather than send further good money after bad?

**Michael German:** I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point:

*to instruct the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to bring forward, following receipt and consideration of tenders, a recommendation as to whether*

yr adeilad newydd yn gynnar. Ni chredaf ei fod o blaid ei adeiladu. Nid oedd o blaid yr opsiwn hwn pan gynhaliwyd pleidlais arno y tro diwethaf. Ar yr adeg hon, oni fyddai'n synhwyrol canslo'r prosiect a chanolbwyntio ar faterion sydd o bwys i bobl Cymru, megis iechyd, addysg a gwasanaethau gwledig? Nid ydym wedi cael yr holl ffigurau, felly ni allwn fod yn sicr, ond gwelais ddogfennau sydd yn nodi mai canslo yw'r opsiwn synhwyrol. Os yw'r manylion a welais yn gywir, byddai bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect yn gostus.

Anogaf Edwina Hart—bu ganddi enw da am fod yn agored cyn hyn, ond niweidiwyd hwnnw i raddau yn sgîl hyn—i gyhoeddi'r ffigurau fel y gallwn oll eu gweld. Er mwyn inni wneud penderfyniad ar hyn, dylai'r ffigurau fod ar gael inni ac ni ddylid bod wedi eu hadrodd yn gyflym inni ar ddechrau dadl lle nad oes gennym gopi o'r datganiad ger ein bron. Nid dyna'r ffordd y dylai'r Cynulliad hwn weithredu. Felly, anogaf y Gweinidog i gyhoeddi'r ffigurau. Dylem gael ein galw yn ôl, os bydd angen, yn ystod toriad yr haf i ystyried y mater hwn, os daw'r manylion i law.

Nid ymlawenhaf o gwbl wrth ddweud bod hyn yn drychineb yn yr arfaeth ac y gallwn fod wedi ei rhagweld. Mae'r mater hwn yn fwy difrifol na gwleidyddia pleidiol. Effeithia ar sefydliad y Cynulliad a'r ddelwedd o Gymru. Fel y dywedais, mae'r twll du wrth ymyl adeilad y Cynulliad yn symbol o hynny. Gobeithiaf nad felly y bydd pobl yn cofio tymor cyntaf Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ond nid wyf wedi clywed unrhyw beth y prynhawn yma sydd yn fy narbwyllo fel arall. Gwastraffwyd arian, amser ac ymdrech. Mae'r mater hwn yn dychwelyd dro ar ôl tro. Oni ddylem ganslo'r prosiect hwn yn awr neu, o leiaf, weld yr holl fanylion er mwyn inni allu wneud penderfyniad synhwyrol yn hytrach na gwastraffu rhagor o arian?

**Michael German:** Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ychwaneger fel pwynt newydd:

*ar ôl i'r tendrau ddod i law ac ar ôl eu hystyried, cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i argymhell p'un a ddylai'r prosiect barhau, ac*



*the project should proceed and, if so, on what basis.* *os felly, ar ba sail.*

I take a different view on this than the Conservatives, as do the Welsh Liberal Democrats. We voted for this building in June last year, and we voted, as was recommended, for certainty. Pausing the project today is an example of prudent management. We are pausing, not cancelling or abandoning, this process to achieve greater certainty and greater clarity on the figures. That is a wise choice because many of us feel let down by the process that has led to this cost over-run. We feel that we have not been given the significant figures on which we could have worked, or the level of certainty that we desired. This decision has been made today to provide us with a greater level of certainty.

It is not an irreversible step. We are making a decision now on whether we want to take the time to test the market to see whether it can provide us with that higher level of certainty, which will then lead us to make a final decision. The Assembly is deciding on the ability to stop, change or substantially alter this project, in terms of its financial profile. Our colleagues in London and Edinburgh would have loved to have had the opportunity to do that. I remind Nick of his Government's fated project, Portcullis House, which was built despite a huge cost over-run. Unlike us today, it could not have made the decision to pause, refer, stop, change and alter. The Scottish Parliament has encountered the same over-run with its building. We are fortunate, in that we have the appropriate checks and balances in the system, to enable us to pursue the proper financial profile, and to be able to reflect and change direction. My amendment 2, and Plaid Cymru's similar amendment 3, reinforces that position. That is why we are being prudent.

It is essential for people to know that using indigenous materials is still an important issue. You heard from the Minister that these

Yr wyf wedi dod i gasgliad gwahanol i'r Ceidwadwyr ar hyn, fel y gwnaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Pleidleisiwyd o blaid yr adeilad hwn gennym ym mis Mehefin y llynedd, a phleidleisiwyd, fel yr argymhellwyd, o blaid sicrwydd. Mae gohirio'r prosiect heddiw yn enghraifft o reoli doeth. Gwnawn ohirio'r broses hon, nid ei chanslo neu roi gorau iddi a wnawn, er mwyn cael mwy o sicrwydd ac eglurder ynglŷn â'r ffigurau. Mae hynny'n ddewis doeth am fod llawer ohonom yn teimlo ein bod wedi ein siomi gan y broses a arweiniodd at gostau uwch na'r disgwyl. Teimlwn nad ydym wedi cael y ffigurau pwysig y gallem fod wedi gweithio arnynt, na'r sicrwydd yr oeddem am ei gael. Gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwn heddiw er mwyn rhoi mwy o sicrwydd inni.

Nid yw'n weithred na ellir ei dadwneud. Yr ydym yn gwneud penderfyniad yn awr pa un a ydym am gael amser i brofi'r farchnad i ganfod a all roi mwy o sicrwydd inni, a fyddai wedyn yn rhoi arweiniad inni wrth wneud penderfyniad terfynol. Mae'r Cynulliad yn penderfynu ar y pŵer i atal, newid neu ddiwygio'r prosiect hwn yn sylweddol, o ran ei broffil ariannol. Byddai ein cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain a Chaeredin wedi bod wrth eu bodd i gael y cyfle i wneud hynny. Atgoffaf Nick o brosiect anffodus y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, sef Portcullis House, a godwyd er gwaethaf y ffaith i'r costau fynd y tu hwnt i'r gyllideb o bell ffordd. Yn wahanol inni heddiw, ni allai fod wedi gwneud y penderfyniad i ohirio, cyfeirio, atal, newid na diwygio. Mae Senedd yr Alban wedi wynebu'r un broblem o ran mynd y tu hwnt i'r gyllideb. Yr ydym yn ffodus, am fod gennym rwystrau a gwrthbwysau priodol yn y system, sydd yn ein galluogi i ddilyn y proffil ariannol cywir a bod mewn sefyllfa i ailystyried a newid cyfeiriad. Mae fy ngwelliant 2 i a gwelliant 3 Plaid Cymru sydd yn debyg iddo, yn atgyfnerthu'r sefyllfa honno. Dyna pam ein bod yn ymddwyn yn ddoeth.

Mae'n hanfodol i bobl wybod bod y defnydd o ddeunyddiau Cymreig yn fater pwysig o hyd. Clywsoch gan y Gweinidog nad oedd y

were not major factors in the cost over-run. We know that the figures presented to us on indigenous materials represent a small element of the over-run. However, we should not lay aside our commitment to use, where possible, indigenous materials from Wales, such as wood and slate. That would be an important symbol if we proceed. Similarly, we should not lay aside our commitment to using renewable energy and energy-efficient systems in the building. These do not significantly alter the cost differences that we now face.

It would be imprudent for this Assembly to continue as before. That is why I support this amendment and motion. It will give us an opportunity, as an Assembly, to take forward a development for which we have voted on many occasions. It will allow us to put in place the checks and balances so obviously missing from other buildings of this sort. Those checks and balances put us in a better position than ever before. I therefore feel that this is the right approach. We are not taking a negative approach. We are pausing, reflecting and taking the view forward that we still want this building to be built within an appropriate financial envelope, which is what this motion states.

**Cynog Dafis:** Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwaneger fel pwynt newydd:

*ar ôl i'r tendrau ddod i law ac ar ôl eu hystyried, cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i argymhell p'un a ddylai'r prosiect barhau, ac os felly, ar ba sail.*

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliant a fabwysiadwyd, wedi inni ei ddrafftio, gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae problem ramadegol gyda geiriad y cynnig. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod modd cymhwyso hynny.

Mae datganiad Edwina Hart yn achosi diflastod inni i gyd. Mae'n achosi, yn ddiamau, peth llawenydd ymysg Ceidwadwyr Cymru, ond diflastod i'r rhan fwyaf ohonom.

rhain yn ffactorau pwysig o safbwynt mynd y tu hwnt i'r gyllideb. Gwyddom mai elfen fach o'r ffigurau a gyflwynwyd inni ar ddeunyddiau Cymreig yw'r costau hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem roi'r gorau i'n hymrwymiad i ddefnyddio deunyddiau o Gymru, megis coed a llechi, lle bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Byddai hynny'n symbol pwysig os bwriwn ymlaen â'r adeilad. Yn yr un modd, ni ddylem roi gorau i'n hymrwymiad i ddefnyddio systemau ynni adnewyddadwy ac sydd yn effeithlon o ran ynni o fewn yr adeilad. Nid yw'r rhain yn newid y gwahaniaethau mewn cost a wynebwn yn awr yn sylweddol.

Byddai'n annoeth i'r Cynulliad hwn barhau ar yr un trywydd. Dyna pam y cefnogaf y gwelliant a'r cynnig hwn. Rhydd gyfle inni, fel Cynulliad, fwrw ymlaen â datblygiad yr ydym wedi pleidleisio arno lawer gwaith. Bydd yn caniatáu inni roi rhwystrau a gwrthbwysau na fu'n bresennol yn amlwg mewn adeiladau eraill o'r fath. Mae'r rhwystrau a'r gwrthbwysau hynny yn ein rhoi mewn gwell sefyllfa nag erioed. Felly teimlaf mai honno yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen. Nid ydym yn mabwysiadu ymagwedd negyddol. Yr ydym yn petruso, yn ailfeddwl ac yn cadw at y farn ein bod am i'r adeilad hwn gael ei godi o fewn terfyn ariannol priodol, sef diben y cynnig hwn.

**Cynog Dafis:** I propose amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as new point:

*to instruct the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to bring forward, following the receipt and consideration of tenders, a recommendation as to whether the project should proceed and if so on what basis.*

Plaid Cymru supports the motion. We have tabled an amendment, which was adopted, after we drafted it, by the Liberal Democrats. There is a grammatical problem with the wording of the motion. I am sure that that can be adjusted.

We are all disheartened by Edwina Hart's statement. It doubtless causes some rejoicing among the Welsh Conservatives, but the majority of us are disheartened. It also causes

Mae hefyd yn achosi cryn dipyn o ddieter. Mae'n anfoddfaol ein bod yn wynebu'r cynnydd posibl hwn yng nghost yr adeilad ar yr adeg hon.

Mae'r math hwn o gynnydd mewn cost yn digwydd yn aml, fel y dywedodd Mike German. Digwyddodd gyda Senedd yr Alban a Portcullis House. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem ddefnyddio hynny fel esgus. Dylai'r ffaith iddo ddigwydd yn yr achosion hynny fod wedi ein gwneud yn fwy gwyliadwrus. Dylem fod wedi rhagweld y math o bethau sydd yn digwydd gydag adeiladau o fri. Mae adeiladau cyhoeddus weithiau yn rhoi cyfle i ddatblygwyr wneud elw oherwydd eu statws uchel.

Mae'n amlwg i mi, serch hynny—ac mae'n bwysig cofnodi hyn—bod y bai pennaf yn y mater hwn, heb unrhyw amheuaeth, ar Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, gan mai ar sail ei ffigurau y penderfynwyd bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect. Yr oeddem yn hyderus bod y ffigurau'n ddilys.

Cofiaf fynychu cyflwyniad gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers ac yr oedd Richard Rogers ei hunan yn bresennol. Cofiaf ofyn iddo'n benodol pa warant y gellid ei roi bod modd codi'r adeilad o fewn y gost amcangyfrifedig. Dywedodd Richard Rogers yn y cyfarfod hwnnw ei fod yn hyderus y gellid gwneud hynny a chyfeiriodd at record ei gwmni wrth godi adeiladau cyhoeddus, a oedd yn cadarnhau hynny.

Mae angen inni—ac yr wyf yn cadarnhau yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei ddweud yn barod—wrthod yr awgrym mai gofynion ychwanegol y Cynulliad, megis defnyddio deunyddiau Cymreig a mynediad i'r methodig, sydd wedi achosi'r codiad hwn. Materion ymylol yw'r rhai hynny yn nhermau'r codiad y cyfeiriwn ato.

Felly, mae bai ar Rogers. Defnyddiwyd y gair 'twyll' gan bobl yn y cyd-destun hwn. Mae'n air addas. Mae'n air cryf.

5:10 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddwn yn gofyn i chi ailystyried y gair 'twyll', gan y gallai gael ei

much anger. It is unacceptable that we are faced with this possible increase in the cost of the building at this stage.

This kind of increase in cost often occurs, as Mike German said. It happened with the Scottish Parliament and Portcullis House. However, we should not use that as an excuse. The fact that it occurred in those cases should have made us more vigilant. We should have foreseen the kinds of things that happen with prestigious buildings. Public buildings sometimes give developers an opportunity to make a profit because of their high status.

It is obvious to me, nevertheless—and it is important to put this on record—that the main fault in this matter, without any doubt, lies with the Richard Rogers Partnership, as we decided to proceed with the project on the basis of its figures. We were confident that the figures were valid.

I remember attending a presentation by the Richard Rogers Partnership and Richard Rogers himself was present. I remember asking him specifically what guarantee could be given that the building could be built within the estimated cost. Richard Rogers said in that meeting that he was confident it could be done and he referred to his company's past record in constructing public buildings, which confirmed that.

We need to—and I endorse what has already been said—reject the suggestion that it is the Assembly's additional requirements, such as using Welsh materials and disabled access, that have caused this increase. Such matters are peripheral in terms of the increase to which we refer.

Therefore, the fault lies with Rogers. People have used the word 'deception' in this context. That is an appropriate word. It is a strong word.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would ask you to reconsider the word 'deception'. It

ddehongli fel sarhad ar berson nad yw'n Aelod o'r Cynulliad.

**Cynog Dafis:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ailystyried fy nefnydd o'r gair.

Serch hynny, mae angen darganfod pam nad oedd rheolydd y prosiect na thîm y prosiect wedi rhagweld y problemau hyn yn gynt, ac wedi darparu ar eu cyfer. Dylid bod wedi ystyried y ffaith fod gennym adeilad arloesol a phrosiect o fri yn y rhagweliadau ynghylch cost y prosiect yn y lle cyntaf.

Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n dda bod gennym y cyfle yn awr i gamu i mewn—a dyna sy'n digwydd heddiw—cyn colli rheolaeth yn llwyr ar y prosiect, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn achos Senedd yr Alban a Portcullis House. Mae grŵp Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig. Dylai'r gwaith gael ei ohirio a dylem derfynu'r cytundeb gyda Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers. Cytunwn y dylem droi at dendro cystadleuol er mwyn dod o hyd i ddatblygydd i barhau â'r cynllun, gyda'r opsiwn o brynu neu brydlesu'r adeilad am gyfnod cyn iddo ddod yn eiddo i'r Cynulliad gydag amser.

Y cam nesaf fyddai cytundeb ar bris. Byddai risg unrhyw gynnydd mewn cost yn cael ei ddatblygwr. Dyna'r unig ffordd gyfrifol i symud ymlaen ar hyn o bryd. Golyga hynny y byddai gan y datblygwr gymhelliant i reoli'r pris, sy'n wahanol i'r sefyllfa bresennol. Mae'n drueni na fyddem wedi dewis y llwybr hwnnw yn y lle cyntaf. Byddai'n dda cael ateb ynglŷn â pham na wnaethpwyd hynny. Serch hynny, mae angen sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer y methodig yn cael ei diogelu o hyd. O bopeth yn y byd, mae'n rhaid sicrhau hynny. Yn ogystal, rhaid gofalu nad yw ansawdd yr adeilad yn cael ei fforffedu. Mae angen sicrhau bod yr adeilad yn esiampl o ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac y defnyddir deunyddiau Cymreig. Yn fy marn i, mae hynny'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer yr holl brosiect.

Mae grŵp Plaid Cymru bob amser wedi cefnogi'r egwyddor o gael dadleudy newydd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n bwysig o hyd. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaethom

could be viewed as insulting to a person who is not a Member of this Assembly.

**Cynog Dafis:** I am willing to reconsider my use of that word.

However, we must discover why the project manager and project team could not have foreseen these problems and made provision for them. The fact that we have an innovative building and prestigious project should have been built into the cost projections in the first place.

Having said that, it is a good thing that we now have the opportunity to step in—and that is what is happening today—before we lose all control of the project, as occurred in the case of the Scottish Parliament and Portcullis House. Therefore, the Plaid Cymru group supports the motion. The work should be suspended and the contract with the Richard Rogers Partnership terminated. We agree that we should go out to competitive tender to find a developer to continue with the scheme and that we should have the option of buying or leasing the building for a period before it becomes the Assembly's property in due course.

The next step would be an agreement on cost. The risk of any increase in cost would then be off-loaded onto the developer. That is the only responsible way forward. That would mean that the developer would have an incentive to control the cost, which is not the case at the moment. It is a shame that we did not opt for this choice in the first place. I would like a response as to why we did not pursue that in the first place. However, we must still ensure that provision for the disabled is secured. We must ensure that above all. We must also ensure that the quality of the building is not forfeited. We must ensure that the building is still an example of sustainable development, built with indigenous materials. In my opinion, that is the bottom-line for the whole project.

The Plaid Cymru group has always supported the principle of having a new debating chamber for the National Assembly. That is still important. However, we did not support a

gefnogi adeilad o'r math hwnnw am bris o £40 miliwn a mwy. Felly, mae ein gwelliant yn ddigon clir. Cyfrifoldeb y Gweinidog yn awr yw gweinyddu'r prosiect. Ei chyfrifoldeb hi yw argymhell i'r Cynulliad a ddylid bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect neu beidio.

Hoffwn wybod beth sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud ynglŷn â gwelliannau Ceidwadwyr Cymru. O'n rhan ni, mae'n bwysig bod yr holl wybodaeth ar gael yn gyhoeddus. Nid yw celu gwybodaeth yn dderbyniol. Ceir adegau pan fo hynny'n briodol, ond yn hwyr neu'n hwyrach rhaid datgelu'r gwirionedd. Mae'n rhaid gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau ar sail y gwirionedd.

Felly, rhaid derbyn, os nad oes modd cyflawni'r gwaith am bris fforddadwy, bod posibilrwydd o beidio â bwrw ymlaen â'r cynllun hwn. Mae'n fater agored. Rhaid inni gael neges glir i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Dyma safbwynt grŵp Plaid Cymru. Hoffem weld y Cynulliad Cendlaethol yn cael cartref teilwng. Mae'n bwysig bod hynny'n digwydd. Nid yw'r adeilad hwn yn gartref teilwng. Mae'n gartref hollol anaddas. Gŵyr Ceidwadwyr Cymru hynny'n iawn waeth beth a ddywedant yn gyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, os na allwn sicrhau cartref am bris credadwy mae'n bosibl yn y pen draw y bydd yn rhaid inni fyw hebdo.

**Ron Davies:** I was disappointed to hear Edwina's statement and I know that she and colleagues from other political parties will have had a difficult time considering this matter. From reading the report and listening to Edwina's statement, it is obvious that the heart of the issue that we face is the difference of opinion between the Richard Rogers Partnership and Edwina's specialist advisers. I believe that that puts most of us in a difficult position. We are asked to accept the difference of opinion, but we have not seen the evidence of the case that would, presumably, be argued on the part of the Richard Rogers Partnership. Yet, as an Assembly, we are being asked to endorse the decision that has been put to us.

I accept that we must make a decision and I am prepared to support Edwina's

building that would cost £40 million and more. Our amendment is crystal clear. It is the Minister's responsibility to administer the project. It is her responsibility to recommend to the Assembly whether or not to proceed with the project.

I would like to hear what the Minister has to say on the Welsh Conservatives' amendments. As far as we are concerned, it is important that all information is made public. Suppressing information is unacceptable. There are times when that is appropriate, but, sooner or later the truth must be revealed. We must take any decisions on the basis of that truth.

Therefore, we must accept that, unless it is possible to carry out the work at an affordable price, there is a possibility that we cannot proceed with this scheme. It is an open matter. We must issue a clear message to that end.

This is Plaid Cymru's view. We would like the Assembly to have a fitting home. It is important that that happens. This building is not a fitting home. It is totally unsuitable. The Welsh Conservatives know that, despite their public declarations. However, if we cannot secure that fitting home at a credible price, we will possibly have to do without one.

**Ron Davies:** Bu'n siom imi glywed datganiad Edwina a gwn y byddai hi a'i chyd-Aelodau o'r pleidiau gwleidyddol eraill wedi cael amser anodd wrth ystyried y mater hwn. Ar ôl darllen yr adroddiad a gwranddo ar ddatganiad Edwina, mae'n amlwg mai'r gwahaniaeth barn rhwng Partneriaeth Richard Rogers ac ymgynghorwyr arbennig Edwina sydd wrth wraidd y broblem a wynebwn. Credaf fod hynny yn rhoi'r rhan fwyaf ohonom mewn sefyllfa anodd. Gofynnir inni dderbyn bod gwahaniaeth barn, ond nid ydym wedi gweld unrhyw dystiolaeth o'r ddatganiad y gallid ei rhoi gerbron, mae'n siŵr, o blaid Partneriaeth Richard Rogers. Ac eto, fel Cynulliad, gofynnir inni gymeradwyo'r penderfyniad a osodwyd ger ein bron.

Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni wneud penderfyniad ac yr wyf yn barod i gefnogi

recommendation. I know that Edwina is mindful to reject the amendment in the name of William Graham. However, I ask her to accept the fact that the Assembly has been placed in a difficult position. It has been asked to endorse this decision blindly. I understand that there are issues of commercial confidentiality, but I ask Edwina to acknowledge that even if she cannot accept these amendments today—which I appreciate—to undertake that all relevant information, apart from that which must be protected by commercial confidentiality, will be placed in the public domain at the earliest opportunity.

Our problem seems to be that we have the Richard Rogers Partnership on the one hand and the professional advisers on the other. The Richard Rogers Partnership is hardly your back-street dealer. It has an international reputation. It has won an international competition. An independent panel adjudged its design, which inspired many people's imaginations. On the other hand, we have the professional advisers. They come and go, some are in-house and some out-of-house. It must be said that they have not been spectacularly successful over the last few years. I can recall my sense of confidence and elation about 12 months ago, when I was told that we had the Turner and Townsend report. The whole project had been crawled over. We had had a risk assessment, which had meant a three-month delay for the project. It was only costing £300,000 but nevertheless we were assured that we had it right, that we knew all eventualities and that we could proceed with confidence with the contract. Somebody got it wrong. It was a risk assessment, but it did not foresee the particular risk that now faces us.

The difficulty with a project of this nature is that the architect's design is only 50 per cent complete. There is an inevitable dynamic element to it. The project must grow. When that happens, unexpected eventualities will always occur. It seems to me that the Assembly's current problem is that it has been obsessed with costs. It has not given due consideration to value for money, and what the Assembly building should be.

argymhelliad Edwina. Gwn fod Edwina yn ystyried gwrthod y gwelliant yn enw William Graham. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf iddi dderbyn y ffaith bod y Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa anodd. Gofynnwyd iddo gymeradwyo'r penderfyniad hwn yn ddi-gwestiwn. Deallaf fod materion sydd yn ymwneud â chyfrinachedd masnachol, ond gofynnaf i Edwina gydnabod hyd yn oed os na all dderbyn y gwelliannau hyn heddiw—a gwerthfawrogaf hynny—addo y caiff pob darn o wybodaeth berthnasol, heblaw gwybodaeth y mae'n rhaid ei diogelu oherwydd cyfrinachedd masnachol, ei rhoi yn eiddo cyhoeddus ar y cyfle cyntaf.

Ymddengys imi mai'r broblem yw bod gennym Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers ar y naill law a'r ymgynghorwyr proffesiynol ar y llaw arall. Nid cwmni dibwys yw Partneriaeth Richard Rogers o bell ffordd. Mae iddo enw rhyngwladol. Enillodd gystadleuaeth ryngwladol. Dyfarnwyd ei gynllun, sydd wedi ysbrydoli llawer o bobl, gan banel annibynnol. Ar y llaw arall, ceir ymgynghorwyr proffesiynol. Maent yn newid yn ddi-baid, mae rhai yn fewnol a rhai yn allanol. Rhaid dweud na fuont yn llwyddiannus iawn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Gallaf gofio fy nheimpladau o hyder a gorfoledd tua 12 mis yn ôl, pan ddywedwyd wrthym am adroddiad Turner and Townsend. Craffwyd ar bob agwedd ar y prosiect. Cawsom asesiad risg, a olygai ohirio'r prosiect am dri mis. Dim ond £300,000 oedd y gost ond eto i gyd, rhoddwyd sicrwydd inni ein bod ar y trywydd iawn, y byddem yn gwybod am unrhyw beth a allai ddigwydd ac y gallem fwrw ymlaen â'r contract yn gwbl hyderus. Yr oedd rhywun yn anghywir. Asesiad risg ydoedd, ond ni ragwelodd y risg benodol a wynebwn yn awr.

Yr anhawster o safbwynt prosiectau o'r fath yw mai dim ond hanner orffenedig yw cynllun y pensaer. Mae elfen anochel o ddeinamig yn perthyn iddo. Rhaid i'r prosiect dyfu. Pan ddigwydd hynny, bydd bob amser yn arwain at bethau annisgwyl. Ymddengys imi mai problem bresennol y Cynulliad yw bod ganddo obsesiwn gyda chost. Nid yw wedi rhoi ystyriaeth briodol i werth am arian, a'r hyn y dylai adeilad y Cynulliad fod.

I hope that we will not cause a self-inflicted wound this afternoon. An architect with an international reputation has prepared this design. However, we are now told that the footprint, the roof, and the internal architecture must all be changed. I hope that we will not embark on a project where unnamed contractors—I hope that you can find them, Edwina, but I do not know who they will be—will dispense with certain pieces of the design. What will be the end result? It will not be the prestigious building to which we have committed ourselves, as designed by the Richard Rogers Partnership. We will end up with something that is perhaps fit for purpose, but will certainly not meet our wider aspirations.

I conclude by saying that we have no option but to accept the recommendations put to us by Edwina with a heavy heart. I hope that we will not sacrifice principles of value for money for ideas of cost or price, or forget the wider issue of providing—let's say it—a building of architectural renown that is recognised across the world.

I hope, Edwina, that your recommendation will be accepted. However, I also hope that we will not have to revisit this issue yet again in six or nine months' time because the professional advisers got it wrong.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Cyfeiriodd Cynog at ei ddieter ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa a wynebwn heddiw. Rhaid cyfaddef fy mod innau yn gandryll amdani. Credaf inni gael ein camarwain—heb feio neb, gan nad ydym mewn sefyllfa i wybod pwy a gamarweiniodd pwy. Nid oes amheuaeth inni ddilyn y llwybr hwn gan ddisgwyl i'r prosiect ddod i fwcwl am gost sylweddol is na'r hyn sydd yn edrych yn debygol.

5:20 p.m.

Fel y dywedodd Ron, os gwnaethpwyd camgymeriadau yn y broses hyd yma, sut y gwyddom na wneir camgymeriadau yn y dyfodol? Sut y gallwn gael sicrwydd am y ffigurau yr ydym yn gweithredu arnynt? Cyfaddefaf yn barod, fel y gŵyr fy nghyfeillion yng ngrŵp Plaid Cymru, imi

Gobeithiaf na fyddwn yn peri niwed i ni ein hunain y prynhawn yma. Paratowyd y cynllun hwn gan bensaer ag iddo enw da yn rhyngwladol. Fodd bynnag, dywedwyd wrthym bellach bod yn rhaid newid cwmpas yr adeilad, y to a'r bensaerniaeth fewnol. Gobeithiaf na fyddwn yn cychwyn ar brosiect lle y bydd contractwyr di-enw—gobeithiaf y gallwch ddod o hyd iddynt, Edwina, ond ni wn o ble y deuant—yn cael gwared o rannau penodol o'r cynllun. Beth fydd y canlyniad terfynol? Nid yr adeilad o fri, yn ôl cynllun Partneriaeth Richard Rogers, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo iddo. Cawn rywbeth a fydd yn addas at ei ddiben yn y pen draw, ond yn sicr ni fydd yn bodloni ein dyheadau ehangach.

Gorffennaf drwy nodi nad oes unrhyw opsiwn gennym ond derbyn yr argymhellion a osodwyd ger ein bron gan Edwina â chalon drom. Gobeithiaf na fyddwn yn aberthu egwyddorion gwerth am arian oherwydd syniadau am gost neu bris, nac yn anghofio'r mater ehangach o godi—gadewch inni ddweud hynny—adeilad o fri yn bensaernïol a gaiff ei gydnabod ledled y byd.

Gobeithiaf, Edwina, y caiff eich argymhelliad ei dderbyn. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf hefyd na fydd yn rhaid inni ddychwelyd at y mater hwn drachefn ymhen chwe neu naw mis am fod yr ymgynghorwyr proffesiynol yn anghywir.

**Dafydd Wigley:** Cynog referred to his anger at the situation that we face today. I must confess that I am livid about it. I believe that we have been misled—without blaming anyone, as we are not yet in a position to know who misled whom. There is no doubt that we followed this path expecting this project to be completed at a much lower cost than is now likely.

As Ron said, if errors have been made in the process to date, how do we know that that will not happen in future? How can we have confidence in the figures on which we are working? I willingly admit that I supported the option to locate the Assembly at City Hall, as my friends in the Plaid Cymru group

geflogi'r opsiwn o leoli'r Cynulliad yn Neuadd y Ddinas. Derbyniais y penderfyniad i'w leoli yma am nifer o resymau, gan gynnwys y ffaith yr ymddangosai y byddai lleoli'r Cynulliad yn Neuadd y Ddinas yn ddrutach o lawer na'r gost o godi adeilad newydd yma. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffigurau hyn yn gwneud i'r sefyllfa a'r dadansoddiad hwnnw edrych yn chwerthinllyd. Ar ba sail yr ydym, fel corff, yn cael ein harwain i wneud penderfyniadau? A gawsom gyngor digonol? Er na wn yn union ym mha le y mae'r bai, gwn fod bai ar rywun ar ryw gam o'r broses.

I have examined the figures on the project's cost increases. There have even been increases since last November. The cost of the roof carcassing has increased from £560,000 to £1.6 million. That is an increase of 200 per cent. The glazing costs have increased from £1.2 million to £1.7 million in seven or eight months. The cost of the timber cladding has increased from £200,000 to £1.2 million, and the cost of the metalwork has increased from £240,000 to £547,000. These increases, which add up to the costs that we debate today, must have been assessable at the time. What level of incompetence has led us to the position today where we must face the embarrassment of the building costing £40 million, or possibly even £50 million? How can we square that cost with our own electors when it must be balanced against other expenditures?

All Members know that this debating chamber is inadequate. We cannot see each other, the roof is too low and there are pillars. We need a building that is worthy. However, we must ask what procedures are used by the Assembly to assess, calculate and decide on major capital expenditure projects such as this. If the procedures can go wrong in relation to our own debating chamber, why should they not go wrong with a host of other projects, be they hospitals, schools or other buildings, throughout Wales? We must be sure in our own minds and hearts, as elected representatives charged with guarding public money, that we are receiving proper analysis, proper information and that we make decisions on a proper basis.

I support the motion but let there be no doubt

know. I accepted the decision to locate it here for several reasons, including the fact that it appeared that locating the Assembly at City Hall would be much more expensive than constructing a new building here. However, these figures make that situation and analysis look laughable. On what basis are we, as a body, led to make decisions? Did we receive adequate advice? Although I do not know where exactly the fault lies, I know that someone along the line is to blame.

Yr wyf wedi archwilio'r ffigurau ar y cynnydd yng nghost y prosiect. Bu'r costau yn cynyddu ers mis Tachwedd diwethaf hyd yn oed. Cynyddodd cost cragen y to o £560,00 i £1.6 miliwn, sef cynnydd o 200 y cant. Cynyddodd cost gosod gwyrdr o £1.2 miliwn i £1.7 miliwn o fewn saith neu wyth mis. Cynyddodd cost gorchudd pren o £200,000 i £1.2 miliwn a chynyddodd cost gwaith metel o £240,000 i £547,000. Rhaid y gellid bod wedi asesu'r costau cynyddol hyn, sydd yn cyfrif am y costau yr ydym yn eu trafod heddiw, ar y pryd. Pa fwnglereiddiwrch sydd wedi ein harwain at y sefyllfa heddiw lle y mae'n rhaid inni wynebu'r embaras o adeilad a fydd yn costio £40 miliwn neu hyd yn oed £50 miliwn o bosibl? Sut y gallwn egluro'r gost honno i'n hetholwyr ein hunain lle y mae'n rhaid ei wrthbwysio yn erbyn gwariant arall?

Gŵyr pob Aelod fod y dadleudy hwn yn annigonol. Ni allwn weld ein gilydd, mae'r to yn rhy isel ac mae pileri. Mae angen adeilad teilwng arnom. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni ofyn pa weithdrefnau a ddefnyddir gan y Cynulliad i asesu, cyfrifo a phenderfynu ar brosiectau gwariant cyfalaf mawr megis y prosiect hwn. Os gall y gweithdrefnau fynd o'i le, mewn perthynas â'n dadleudy, oni allant fynd o'i le gyda llu o brosiectau eraill, boed yn ysbytai, yn ysgolion neu'n adeiladau eraill, ledled Cymru? Rhaid inni fod yn gwbl sicr, fel cynrychiolwyr etholedig sydd â dyletswydd o warchod arian cyhoeddus, ein bod yn cael dadansoddiad cywir, gwybodaeth gywir a'n bod yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar sail gywir.

Cefnogaf y cynnig ond ni ddylai fod unrhyw



that, when we return to this—  
[CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS:  
'Oh.'].]

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** I support the motion, as it gives us an opportunity to consider alternative figures and to obtain all the information that we require in order to make a decision. One alternative decision, Alun, is not to go ahead with the project. However, we can only decide whether or not to proceed when we have the facts in full. I support the motion—although I hope that it will be amended—so that we can make that decision.

The message must go out from the Assembly to all those who are considering tendering for the contract that we are not a soft touch. We will not be taken for a ride on this or any another project. The line has been drawn in the sand, and we stand with that line.

**Alison Halford:** It is difficult to follow that comment. I agree with everything that Dafydd Wigley said. If anyone wants to know what went wrong, I commend the Auditor General's report, 'Accommodation Arrangements for the National Assembly for Wales'. It makes sad bedtime reading. The information is all contained in the report. Dafydd is right to say that we have been let down. Edwina Hart has been given the poisoned chalice.

Let us take a look at what has happened. In March 1998, it was decided that an architectural competition should be held to find a design for the building. Six designs were entered in the competition and a plot of land was set aside. Five of the six designs did not fit within the scope of the plot of land. Yet, the officials pressed on. The name of the architect who won the competition was announced. However, the project was not costed properly. No contract was signed. Two years into the project, a contract had not even been signed with the architect. What else went wrong? The Richard Rogers Partnership was allowed to use its own quantity surveyor. Its fees increased with the cost of the building, which increased by 73 per cent. Are we not entitled to ask who is responsible for

amheuaeth, pan ddychwelwn at hyn—  
[AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD:  
'O'].]

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Dafydd Wigley:** Cefnogaf y cynnig, am ei fod yn rhoi cyfle inni ystyried ffigurau amgen ac i gael yr holl wybodaeth sydd ei hangen arnom i wneud penderfyniad. Penderfyniad amgen, Alun, yw peidio â pharhau â'r prosiect. Fodd bynnag, dim ond ar ôl inni gael yr holl fanylion y gallwn benderfynu a ddylid bwrw ymlaen â'r prosiect ai peidio. Cefnogaf y cynnig—er y gobeithiaf y caiff ei ddiwygio—er mwyn inni allu gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw.

Rhaid i'r Cynullid roi'r neges i bawb sydd yn ystyried rhoi tendr ar gyfer y contract nad gwirion ydym. Ni chawn ein twyllo o ran y prosiect hwn nac unrhyw brosiect arall. Mae ein bwriad yn hysbys a chadwn at y bwriad hwnnw.

**Alison Halford:** Mae'n anodd dilyn y sylw hwnnw. Cytunaf â'r cyfan a ddywedodd Dafydd Wigley. Os oes unrhyw un am wybod beth aeth o'i le, argymhellaf adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, 'Trefniadau Swyddfa ar gyfer Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'. Mae'n ddeunydd darllen diflas. Ceir yr holl wybodaeth yn yr adroddiad. Mae Dafydd yn llygad ei le i ddweud ein bod wedi ein siomi. Cafodd Edwina Hart y cwpan gofidiau.

Gadewch inni ystyried yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Ym mis Mawrth 1998, penderfynwyd y dylid cynnal cystadleuaeth bensaernïol i ddod o hyd i gynllun ar gyfer yr adeilad. Cyflwynwyd chwe chynllun i'r gystadleuaeth a neilltuwyd darn o dir. Nid oedd modd adeiladu pump o'r chwe chynllun o fewn y tir a neilltuwyd. Ac eto, bwriodd y swyddogion ymlaen â'r gystadleuaeth. Cyhoeddwyd enw'r pensaer a enillodd y gystadleuaeth. Fodd bynnag, ni chostiwyd y prosiect yn gywir. Ni lofnodwyd contract. Ddwy flynedd ar ôl i'r prosiect gychwyn, ni lofnodwyd contract hyd yn oed gyda'r pensaer. Beth arall aeth o'i le? Caniatwyd i Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers ddefnyddio ei syrfëwr meintiau ei hun. Cynyddodd ei ffioedd wrth i gost yr adeilad gynyddu 73 y

drawing up these contracts and who has allowed us to reach this situation? It is not frontbench Assembly Members. It is not me, although I have to go back to north Wales to explain the ever-escalating cost to my constituents. It is the officials that we employ. I give the officials their due; they considered risk assessment—

**Alun Cairns:** Do you not accept that officials are not elected representatives, who must accept the ultimate responsibility? It is not good enough to blame officials. Ministers must be held to account.

**Alison Halford:** That is unfair. I have to go back to north Wales to respond to people who ask why they must pay this money. We pay officials and we pay experts. In fairness, the experts have also let us down badly. We have been let down by the procurement process, which has been flawed—

**Cynog Dafis:** Will Alison accept that it is not just the people of north Wales who have concerns? This is a matter of concern for people throughout Wales.

**Alison Halford:** I accept that. I know that it is not good form to blame anyone. However, Dafydd is right. We must have an Assembly building. Let us hope that we can build it at no greater cost. Let us try to learn from the enormous mistakes that have been made. My God, if you read the Auditor General's report, you will see the number of mistakes that have been made. I agree with Dafydd that we have been let down badly. It is dreadful that so many things have gone wrong. The Assembly worked hard to prevent what has just happened. I agree that Edwina should consider this. We should all consider it because, as Dafydd said, this is happening over and over again. We must find a way of costing an expensive building in Wales and sticking to those costs.

cant. Onid oes hawl gennym ofyn pwy sydd yn gyfrifol am lunio'r contractau hyn a phwy a fu'n gyfrifol am y sefyllfa a wynebwn? Nid Aelodau meinciau blaen y Cynulliad. Nid myfi, er bod yn rhaid imi ddychwelyd i'r gogledd i esbonio'r gost fythol gynyddol i'm hetholwyr. Y swyddogion a gyflogir gennym sydd yn gyfrifol. A bod yn deg â'r swyddogion, ystyriwyd asesiad risg ganddynt—

**Alun Cairns:** Oni dderbyniwch nad cynrychiolwyr etholedig yw'r swyddogion, sydd yn gorfod ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb yn y pen draw? Nid yw'n ddigon da rhoi bai ar swyddogion. Rhaid i'r Gweinidogion fod yn atebol bob amser.

**Alison Halford:** Mae hynny'n annheg. Rhaid imi ddychwelyd i'r gogledd i ymateb i bobl sydd yn gofyn pam bod yn rhaid iddynt dalu'r arian hwn. Yr ydym yn talu swyddogion ac yr ydym yn talu arbenigwyr. A bod yn deg, mae'r arbenigwyr wedi ein siomi'n fawr hefyd. Cawsom ein siomi gan y broses gaffael, a fu'n ddiffygiol—

**Cynog Dafis:** A dderbynia Alison nad pobl gogledd Cymru yn unig sydd yn pryderu? Mae hwn yn achos pryder i bobl ledled Cymru?

**Alison Halford:** Derbyniaf hynny. Gwn nad yw'n beth cwrtais rhoi bai ar unrhyw un. Fodd bynnag, mae Dafydd yn llygad ei le. Rhaid inni gael adeilad Cynulliad. Gobeithio y gallwn ei godi heb gost ychwanegol. Gadewch inni geisio dysgu o'r camgymeriadau enfawr a wnaethpwyd. Duw a wŷr, os darllenwch adroddiad yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol, cewch weld nifer y camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd. Cytunaf â Dafydd ein bod wedi ein siomi'n fawr. Mae'n ofnadwy bod cymaint o bethau wedi mynd o'i le. Gweithiodd y Cynulliad yn galed i atal hynny rhag digwydd. Cytunaf y dylai Edwina ystyried hyn. Dylem oll ei ystyried, fel y dywedodd Dafydd, mae hyn yn digwydd dro ar ôl tro. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o gostio adeilad drud yng Nghymru a chadw at y costau hynny.

## Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Presiding Officer:** I draw Members' attention to the fact that, as this business was not programmed to continue after 5.30 p.m., we will be in contravention of Standing Orders if we continue without holding a vote. I therefore invite the Minister for Assembly Business to propose a procedural motion to extend today's session.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at y ffaith y byddwn yn mynd yn groes i'r Rheolau Sefydlog pe baem yn parhau â'r ddadl heb gynnal pleidlais gan na fwriadwyd i'r busnes hwn barhau ar ôl 5.30 p.m. Felly, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig cynnig trefniadol i ymestyn y Cyfarfod heddiw.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.16, allows the debate on the new Assembly building to continue after 5.30 p.m.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.16, yn caniatáu i'r ddadl ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad barhau wedi 5.30 p.m.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 2.*

*Motion: For 46, Abstain 0, Against 2.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny

Halford, Alison  
Pugh, Alun

Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad: Parhad The New Assembly Building: Continued**

**William Graham:** As Alison fondly imagined, this is a poisoned chalice. It is no comfort to the Welsh Conservatives that our warnings over the last two years have been vindicated. That is no satisfaction. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] It is a serious point. We must ensure that there is no further squandering of taxpayers' money. We know that the cost of the building may well exceed £50 million. I remind Members that the architect originally suggested that the building would not cost more than £13 million. We have been misled time and time again. We must only consider the precedent of the Scottish Parliament. The cost of that building is £250 million and it is still rising. Will the Minister tell us where the breakdown occurred? What are the reasons for ditching the Richard Rogers Partnership? It cannot be for procurement reasons, as they were given in the original design brief. It was always known that Welsh materials should be used. There was serious underestimation. There are concerns about the glass wall technology. It is, after all, technically unproven, and there are few examples of it. Concerns have already been raised about the roof structure. That is a matter of concern. Will the Minister tell us what is the cost of termination? Was this a design and built contract? To say that we are opting for some form of private finance initiative is no solution. Insufficient financial figures have been given. Will the Minister publish the correct figures as soon as possible? In terms of the cost of curtailing the project, only the beginning of the foundations—the piling alone—has been laid. That can easily be used if the site is sold to another project.

**William Graham:** Fel y disgrifiodd Alison, cwpan gofidiau yw hwn. Nid yw'r ffaith bod ein rhybuddion dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf wedi'u cyfiawnhau o unrhyw gysur i Geidwadwyr Cymru. Ni rydd hynny unrhyw foddhad inni. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Mae'n bwynt difrifol. Rhaid inni sicrhau na wastraffir rhagor o arian y trethdalwyr. Gwyddom y gallai cost yr adeilad fod yn uwch na £50 miliwn. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau i'r pensaer awgrymu'n wreiddiol na fyddai'r adeilad yn costio mwy na £13 miliwn. Cawsom ein camarwain dro ar ôl tro. Rhaid inni ond ystyried cynsail Senedd yr Alban. Mae cost yr adeilad hwnnw yn £250 miliwn ac mae'n parhau i godi. A ddywed y Gweinidog wrthym lle y digwyddodd y chwalfa? Beth yw'r rhesymau dros gefnu ar Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers? Ni all fod am resymau caffael, oherwydd yr oedd y rheini yn y briff cynllunio gwreiddiol. Yr oedd bob amser yn hysbys y dylid defnyddio deunyddiau Cymreig. Yr oedd yr amcangyfrif yn hynod annigonol. Mae pryderon ynglŷn â'r dechnoleg mur gwydr. Wedi'r cyfan, ni chafodd ei phrofi'n dechnoleg, a phrin yw'r enghreifftiau ohoni. Mynegwyd pryderon eisoes ynglŷn â strwythur y to. Mae hwnnw'n destun pryder. A ddywed y Gweinidog wrthym faint yw cost rhoi terfyn ar y cynllun? Ai contract cynllunio ac adeiladu oedd hwn? Nid yw dweud ein bod yn dewis rhyw fath o fenter cyllid preifat yn ateb. Rhoddwyd ffigurau ariannol annigonol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gyhoeddi'r ffigurau cywir cyn gynted â phosibl? O ran cost cwtogi ar y prosiect, dim ond dechreuadau'r sylfeini—sef y pyst yn unig—a osodwyd. Gellid defnyddio'r rheini yn hawdd pe bai'r safle'n cael ei werthu i brosiect arall.

5:30 p.m.

Entering into a fixed-price contract will be remarkably impossible. However, I ask the Minister to comment on that. We ask you to consider our amendments with the greatest possible concern and to support them.

**Lorraine Barrett:** It is difficult to know what to say. This is disappointing but I remain committed to the project and to the notion of a new debating Chamber—hopefully, this debating Chamber.

To stop this going ahead, as the Conservatives would have us do, would be a huge backward step for Wales. It would be worse than failing to build Zala Hadid's opera house. What is Wales's problem? Do we not have vision? Are we forever to be seen as an unadventurous and visionless country by those who respect quality and creativity? That is what the new building is supposed to be about. There were many Japanese journalists here today. I am sure that they were not impressed with our current building. We have an excuse for a Government building, while we talk about the new, confident Wales and say that we are looking to find our place in the world and use other such clichés about Wales.

Turning to the Conservatives, we could always find other things on which to spend the money. That is the case with every decision that we take. It is easy for the hypocrites on the other side of the Chamber to say 'stop this building'.

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will not give way.

When the new Chamber, Committee rooms and public spaces are completed, they will enjoy the improved facilities—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I heard you use the word 'hypocrite'. I ask you to reconsider that.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will reconsider it.

Bydd llunio contract pris sefydlog yn hollol amhosibl. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gynnig sylw ar hynny. Gofynnwn ichi ystyried ein gwelliannau gan ddangos y pryder mwyaf posibl a'u cefnogi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Mae'n anodd gwybod beth i'w ddweud. Mae hyn yn siom ond yr wyf yn ymrwymedig i'r prosiect o hyd ac i'r cysyniad o Siambr ddadlau newydd—sef y Siambr ddadlau hon, gobeithio.

Byddai atal hyn rhag mynd yn ei flaen, fel y mae'r Ceidwadwyr am inni ei wneud, yn gam enfawr yn ôl i Gymru. Byddai'n waeth na methu â chodi tŷ opera Zala Hadid. Beth sydd yn bod ar Gymru? Onid oes gennym weledigaeth? A gawn ein hystyried fel gwlad ddifenter a diweledigaeth am byth gan y rheini sydd yn parchu ansawdd a chreadigrwydd? Dyna oedd diben yr adeilad newydd. Yr oedd nifer o newyddiadurwyr Siapaniaidd yma heddiw. Yr wyf yn siŵr na chreodd ein hadeilad presennol argraff arnynt. Esgus o adeilad Llywodraeth yw hwn wrth inni siarad am y Gymru newydd, hyderus, a dweud ein bod yn chwilio am ein lle yn y byd ac yn defnyddio ystrydebau eraill o'r fath am Gymru.

Gan droi at y Ceidwadwyr, gallem ganfod pethau eraill i wario'r arian arnynt bob amser. Dyna sydd yn wir am bob penderfyniad a wnawn. Mae'n hawdd i'r rhagrithwyr ar ochr arall y Siambr ddweud 'dylid rhoi stop ar yr adeilad hwn'.

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**Lorraine Barrett:** Nid wyf yn ildio.

Pan gaiff y Siambr newydd, yr ystafelloedd Pwyllgor newydd a'r manau cyhoeddus newydd eu cwblhau, byddant yn mwynhau'r cyfleusterau gwell—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fe'ch clywais yn defnyddio'r gair 'rhagrithiwr'. Gofynnaf i chi ailystyried hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Fe'i hailystyriaf.

**The Presiding Officer:** Will you rephrase—

**Y Llywydd:** A wnewch chi aralleirio—

**Lorraine Barrett:** No. I am sorry, Llywydd, but several of them have told me privately that they look forward to the new building and that they will enjoy it when it is built.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Na wnaif. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Lywydd, ond dywedodd sawl un ohonynt wrthyf yn breifat eu bod yn edrych ymlaen at yr adeilad newydd ac y byddant yn ei fwynhau pan gaiff ei adeiladu.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not consider the use of the word 'hypocrite' to be in line with our Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ystyriaf fod y defnydd o'r gair 'rhagrithiwr' yn unol â'r Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr.

**Lorraine Barrett:** For you, I will take it back for now.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Er eich mwyn chi, fe'i tynnaf yn ôl yn awr.

**The Presiding Officer:** I ask you to rephrase your remarks.

**Y Llywydd:** Gofynnaf ichi aralleirio eich sylwadau.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I will refer to them as the disingenuous Tories.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Cyfeirïaf atynt fel Torïaid ffuantus.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is also inappropriate to describe the Welsh Conservative group as Tories. We have been down this road before.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae hefyd yn amhriodol disgrifio grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru fel Torïaid. Trafodasom hyn o'r blaen.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Very well. The Conservatives on the other side will enjoy the new building when it is built, as they have told me privately. I will not break confidences by mentioning names.

**Lorraine Barrett:** O'r gorau. Bydd y Ceidwadwyr ar yr ochr arall yn mwynhau'r adeilad newydd pan gaiff ei adeiladu, fel y dywedasant wrthyf yn breifat. Ni thorraf ymddiriedaeth drwy grybwyll enwau.

We welcome visitors from all over the world, whether Bangor, Barry, Bahrain or Bermuda. This building and its Chamber is not good enough for Wales or any other country.

Croesawn ymwelwyr o bedwar ban y byd, pa un ai o Fangor, y Barri, Bahrain neu Bermwda. Nid yw'r adeilad hwn a'r Siambr hon yn ddigon da ar gyfer Cymru nac ar gyfer unrhyw wlad arall.

**Nick Bourne** *rose*—

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way to the leader of the Welsh Conservatives?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. A ydych yn ildio i arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru?

**Lorraine Barrett:** No, I am not. I want to finish this.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Nac ydwyf. Yr wyf am orffen hyn.

It is a depressing day but we must not crumble. We must achieve a building worthy of the name of the Government of Wales. If having a worthy parliamentary building is good enough for Scotland and for the UK, it is good enough for us. It is probably too late, but has the Minister considered bringing in

Mae hwn yn ddiwrnod trist ond ni ddylem roi'r ffidil yn y to. Rhaid inni sicrhau adeilad teilwng ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru. Os yw cael adeilad seneddol teilwng yn ddigon da ar gyfer yr Alban ac ar gyfer y DU, mae'n ddigon da i ni. Fwy na thebyg mae'n rhy hwyr, ond a ystyriodd y Gweinidog ddwyn

the likes of the Royal Institute of British Architects to mediate in discussions. I feel sad that Richard Rogers's name will not be associated with this building. If Bilbao can do it, why cannot we?

I accept the motion with a heavy heart, as Ron said. We have a responsibility to protect the public purse, but we also have a responsibility not to make Wales look like some backwater hick town.

**Glyn Davies:** What a shambles this is. What an embarrassing, first-rank, 'cawl' of a shambles we face today. Over the last two years, I have stood in this Chamber on many occasions and I have asked, begged and sometimes even bullied, to try to persuade Members not to go ahead with this project. I have warned about the costs, and have said that they were hopelessly understated. I have also said that it was a huge mistake for us to even think about making an investment of this sort until we had some scores on the board and the Welsh people truly had an affection for this place and it was something that we could do with some degree of support. Sometimes, I spoke unreasonably. Sometimes, I spoke with anger. I remember on one occasion that I spoke with such ferocity about the First Minister's leadership qualities that he was half way to the rostrum to sort me out. I think that we all remember that occasion.

On this occasion, my main concern is that the people of Wales and Assembly Members have not been told the truth. I well remember discussing this plan with a builder who knew exactly what the cost of this sort of project was. I showed him the model. He told me it would cost a good £30 million if the bleeping thing can be built.

The cost then was £22.8 million; it is now over £40 million, perhaps £50 million. The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities can give us no guarantee that the costs will not rise further. There is doubt about the buildability of the building—about the roof. I have never heard of a building that was half built until we knew we could put a roof on it, except perhaps for an open-air swimming pool. It is absolutely outrageous.

Sefydliad Brenhinol Penseiri Prydain a'i debyg i gyfryngu mewn trafodaethau? Gresynaf na chaiff enw Richard Rogers ei gysylltu â'r adeilad hwn. Os gall Bilbao ei wneud, pam na allwn ni?

Derbyniaf y cynnig gyda chalon drom, fel y dywedodd Ron. Mae cyfrifoldeb gennym dros ddiogelu'r pwrs cyhoeddus, ond mae cyfrifoldeb gennym hefyd dros beidio â gwneud i Gymru edrych fel tref wladaidd hen ffasiwn.

**Glyn Davies:** Dyma draed moch yw hwn. Yr ydym yn wynebu cawl cywilyddus o'r radd flaenaf heddiw. Dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, sefais yn y Siambr hon ar sawl achlysur a gofynnais, erfyniais ac ar adegau bwliais hyd yn oed, i geisio darbwyllo'r Aelodau i beidio â mynd ymlaen â'r prosiect hwn. Rhybuddiais ynglŷn â'r costau, a dywedais eu bod wedi'u tanbriso'n enbyd. Dywedais hefyd ei fod yn gamgymeriad enfawr inni hyd yn oed ystyried gwneud buddsoddiad o'r math hwn tan inni gyflawni rhywbeth a bod gan bobl Cymru hoffter gwirioneddol o'r lle hwn a'i fod yn rhywbeth y gallem ei wneud gyda rhywfaint o gefnogaeth. Yn achlysurol, siaradais yn afresymol. Yn achlysurol, siaradais yn ddig. Cofiaf un achlysur pan siaradais â chymaint o ffyrnigrwydd am rinweddau Prif Weinidog Cymru fel arweinydd nes iddo anelu at y rostrwm i roi taw arnaf. Credaf y gall pob un ohonom gofio'r achlysur hwnnw.

Ar yr achlysur hwn, fy mhrif bryder yw na ddywedwyd y gwir wrth bobl Cymru ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Cofiaf yn iawn drafod y cynllun hwn gydag adeiladwr a wyddai yn union beth fyddai cost y math hwn o brosiect. Dangosais y model iddo. Dywedodd wrthyf y byddai'n costio £30 miliwn o leiaf pe gellid adeiladu'r peth bondigrybwyll.

Y gost bryd hynny oedd £22.8 miliwn; bellach mae dros £40 miliwn, ac efallai yn £50 miliwn. Ni all y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau roi unrhyw sicrwydd inni na fydd y costau'n cynyddu ymhellach. Ceir amheuaeth ynglŷn ag ymarferoldeb adeiladu'r adeilad—ynglŷn â'r to. Ni chlywais erioed am adeilad a oedd wedi hanner ei adeiladu nes inni wybod y gallem roi to arno, ar wahân efallai i bwl

nofio awyr agored. Mae'n hollol warthus.

Blaming Lord Rogers is fair, but we should not only blame him. The Government and the First Minister must share some of the blame. I have referred to lack of leadership before. Even now, I do not know what the First Minister's view is—perhaps he will tell us during this debate. We do not know whether he is in favour of a new building, whether he is in favour of an extension, about which I was rude, or in favour of not going ahead at all. He does not want to tell us. Perhaps he will stand up and tell us today. One option that we face is abandoning the building, as we want. It seems that the cost of that will perhaps be £10 million. We will have to consider that. I have heard other Members speak. I have heard Cynog Dafis and Dafydd Wigley recognise that this may be the truth. I heard Mike German speak, but I was not quite sure what he was talking about regarding the Liberal Democrat view. There was something about checks and balances. I thought to myself, all we really need are big cheques and empty balances. That seems to be the only sensible thing that he said.

One point that I wish to make is that I do not feel any anger as I speak today. I feel a genuine sense of sadness because of what this will do—not only during this debate, but throughout the summer—to the reputation, not just of the Assembly, but of Wales. When you have something as shambolic as this, which, I imagine, will be reported across Britain, it will reflect on us all, no matter how hard we argued against this project. Let us blame Lord Rogers—that is justified, and that argument has been made. However, we must also point the finger at the First Minister. He has not given leadership on this most important project. I am certain that he will sit there today and not make his views known. That is an unacceptable way to go forward.

We should abandon the project today. It is doomed, as Fraser used to say in *Dad's Army*. It is a completely doomed project. However,

Mae'n deg beio'r Arglwydd Rogers, ond nid ef yn unig y dylem ei feio. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth a Phrif Weinidog Cymru rannu peth o'r bai. Cyfeiriais at ddiffyg arweiniad o'r blaen. Hyd yn oed yn awr, ni wn beth yw safbwynt Prif Weinidog Cymru—efallai y dywed wrthym yn ystod y ddadl hon. Ni wyddom a yw'n ffafrio'r adeilad newydd, a yw'n ffafrio estyniad, yr oeddwn yn anfoesgar ynglŷn ag ef, neu a yw'n ffafrio peidio â mynd ymlaen â'r cynllun o gwbl. Nid yw am ddweud wrthym. Efallai y saif ar ei draed a dweud wrthym heddiw. Un opsiwn a wynebwn yw rhoi'r gorau i'r adeilad, fel y dymunwn ni. Yn ôl pob tebyg gallai hynny gostio £10 miliwn. Bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Clywais Aelodau eraill yn siarad. Clywais Cynog Dafis a Dafydd Wigley'n cydnabod y gallai hynny fod yn wir. Clywais Mike German yn siarad, ond nid oeddwn yn siŵr am beth yr oedd yn siarad o ran safbwynt y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Soniwyd rhywbeth am sieciau a balansau. Meddyliais wrthyf fy hun, mai'r unig beth sydd ei angen arnom mewn gwirionedd yw sieciau mawr a balansau gwag. Ymddengys mai dyna oedd yr unig beth synhwyrol a ddywedodd.

Un pwynt y dymunaf ei wneud yw na theimlaf yn ddig o gwbl wrth siarad heddiw. Teimlaf yn wirioneddol drist oherwydd yr hyn a wnaiff hyn—nid yn unig yn ystod y ddadl hon, ond drwy gydol yr haf—i enw da nid dim ond y Cynulliad, ond enw da Cymru. Pan fydd rhywbeth yn gymaint o draed moch â hyn, bydd adroddiadau yn ei gylch ar y newyddion ledled Prydain, fe ddychmygaf, adlewyrcha ar bob un ohonom, waeth pa mor galed y dadleuasom yn erbyn y prosiect hwn. Gadewch inni feio'r Arglwydd Rogers—gellir cyfiawnhau hynny, a mynegwyd y ddadl honno. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd bwyntio'r bys at Brif Weinidog Cymru. Ni roddodd arweiniad ar y prosiect pwysig hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr eistedda yn y fan honno heddiw a pheidio â gwneud ei safbwyntiau'n hysbys. Mae hynny'n ffordd annerbyniol o barhau.

Dylem roi'r gorau i'r prosiect heddiw. *'It is doomed'* fel y dywedai Fraser yn *Dad's Army*. Mae methiant y prosiect yn anochel.



let us assume that other Members will not support that view. We must spend the summer considering these costs. If they are exactly as we suspect they are today, I believe that a majority of Assembly Members will have to come around to agree with the Conservatives that we speak for the people of Wales when we call for this project to be abandoned.

**Peter Law:** This is, sadly, a poor example to those we oversee outside, without a shadow of a doubt. We are in a difficult situation. That is what comes with openness and accountability when things go wrong. It can be uncomfortable, but it is honest. It is fair to say that we do not look professional having got to this situation. However, the Minister has acted in the best propriety and has explained the difficulties to the Assembly today. It is a problem. As Members know, I did not vote in favour of this design as I felt, at the time, that it was not appropriate. I voted in favour of what was known as the car park option, which would have cost approximately £10 million less than the current design, but would probably be in the region of £25 million less by now. That is how it was at the time. I did not think that the design was appropriate. Some Members felt that it looked like a petrol filling station and there was also a question mark about its weather-proofing. The Audit Committee considered the design and, thankfully, said that an independent quantity surveyor should be brought in. I am glad that that happened, because it probably played a part in bringing about the current situation.

5:40 p.m.

Having said that, we are where we are. Democracy spoke last June. I am a democrat, and recognise that I was in a minority at that time. Three of the Assembly's political parties have taken a reasoned and appropriate approach to this situation. The building's foundations are partly in place, but perhaps work will not proceed. On the other hand, we are now in a void, with a void. Therefore, we must reassess the situation carefully. That is the common sense approach. We cannot merely cancel the project.

Fodd bynnag, gadewch inni dybio na fydd Aelodau eraill yn cefnogi'r farn honno. Rhaid inni dreulio'r haf yn ystyried y costau hyn. Os byddant yn union fel yr amheuw'n heddiw, credaf y bydd mwyafrif Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cytuno â'r Ceidwadwyr ein bod yn siarad dros bobl Cymru wrth alw am roi'r gorau i'r prosiect hwn.

**Peter Law:** Yn anffodus, mae hon yn enghraifft wael i'r rheini a oruchwyliwn y tu allan, heb os nac oni bai. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa anodd. Dyna a ddaw law yn llaw â bod yn agored ac yn atebol pan aiff pethau o chwith. Gall fod yn anghyfforddus, ond mae'n onest. Mae'n deg dweud nad yw'r ffaith inni gyrraedd y sefyllfa hon yn ein rhoi mewn goleuni proffesiynol. Fodd bynnag, gweithredodd y Gweinidog yn briodol gan egluro'r anawsterau gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw. Mae'n broblem. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, ni phleidleisiais o blaid y cynllun hwn bryd hynny, am nad oeddwn o'r farn ei fod yn briodol. Pleidleisiais o blaid yr hyn a adwaenir fel yr opsiwn maes parcio, a fyddai wedi costio tua £10 miliwn yn llai na'r cynllun presennol, ond a fyddai fwy na thebyg tua £25 miliwn yn llai erbyn hyn. Dyna sut yr oedd hi ar y pryd. Ni chredwn fod y cynllun yn briodol. Yr oedd rhai Aelodau o'r farn ei fod yn edrych fel gorsaf betrol ac yr oedd amheuw'n hefyd ynglŷn â'i allu i wrthsefyll y tywydd. Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio'r cynllun a dweud, diolch byth, y dylid cynnwys syrfewr meintiau annibynnol. Yr wyf yn falch i hynny ddigwydd oherwydd, yn fwy na thebyg, fe chwaraeodd ran yn y broses o greu'r sefyllfa bresennol.

Ar ôl dweud hynny, dyma ein sefyllfa. Siaradodd llais democratiaeth fis Mehefin diwethaf. Yr wyf yn ddemocrat, a chydabyddaf fy mod mewn lleiafrif bryd hynny. Mabwysiadodd tri o grwpiau gwleidyddol y Cynulliad ymagwedd resymol a phriodol tuag at y sefyllfa hon. Mae sylfeini'r adeilad yn rhannol yn eu lle, ond efallai na fydd y gwaith yn parhau. Ar y llaw arall, yr ydym bellach mewn gwacter, gyda gwacter. Felly, rhaid inni ailasesu'r sefyllfa yn ofalus. Dyna yw'r ymagwedd synnwyr

cyffredin. Nid oes modd inni ganslo'r prosiect.

The Conservative Party's bunch of political opportunists followed me last June and voted against the building. They now have the audacity to propose a number of amendments opposed to the project's continuation. That is an affront to democracy, as there was an overwhelming mandate for the building, even though I did not give my support. This reflects the Conservatives' usual divisive and destructive approach. This is the party that did not believe in the Assembly—

Fe'm dilynwyd gan griw o fanteiswyr gwleidyddol y Blaid Geidwadol fis Mehefin diwethaf a phleidleisio yn erbyn yr adeilad. Bellach maent yn ddigon haerllug i gynnig nifer o welliannau sydd yn gwrthwynebu parhad y prosiect. Mae hynny'n tramgwyddo democratiaeth, am fod mandad aruthrol ar gyfer yr adeilad, er na roddais fy nghefnogaeth iddo. Adlewyrcha hyn ymagwedd rwygol a dinistriol arferol y Ceidwadwyr. Dyma'r blaid na chredai yn y Cynulliad—

**Nick Bourne:** Will Peter Law explain what is undemocratic about proposing amendments in the hope that people will support them? If they are not supported, we will act accordingly. I do not see anything undemocratic in that.

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff Peter Law egluro beth sydd yn annemocrataidd ynglŷn â chynnig gwelliannau gan obeithio y bydd pobl yn eu cefnogi? Os na chânt gefnogaeth, fe weithredwn yn unol â hynny. Ni welaf unrhyw beth yn annemocrataidd ynglŷn â hynny.

**Peter Law:** The Conservative Party has never wanted to do anything but cause destruction and as much division as possible. You have a short memory when it comes to the fact that it was your Government that poured £220 million into creating the lake, and everything that comes with it, in Cardiff Bay. As prudent people, you should not forget that. Other Members have other things to say. The pure hypocrisy—

**Peter Law:** Nid yw'r Blaid Geidwadol erioed wedi dymuno gwneud unrhyw beth ar wahân i beri dinistr a chymaint o raniadau â phosibl. Mae gennych gof byr pan ddaw i'r ffaith mai eich Llywodraeth chi a roddodd £220 miliwn i greu'r llyn, a phopeth a ddaw ynghyd ag ef, ym Mae Caerdydd. Fel pobl ddarbodus, ni ddylech anghofio hynny. Mae gan Aelodau eraill bethau eraill i'w dweud. Y rhagrith pur—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This debate is about the proposed Assembly chamber. It is not about the history of Cardiff Bay. Will you give way to David Davies?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r siambr Cynulliad arfaethedig. Nid yw'n ymwneud â hanes Bae Caerdydd. A ildiwch i David Davies?

**Peter Law:** I thought that he had been ruled out of order. This reflects the Conservative group's hypocrisy because, on Thursday, they will support investing a further £25 million in the Wales Millennium Centre, the total cost of which will amount to over £100 million. That is the hypocrisy that I am talking about. I am a realist—

**Peter Law:** Tybiais iddo gael ei ddyfarnu allan o drefn. Adlewyrcha hyn ragrith y grŵp Ceidwadol oherwydd, ddydd Iau, cefnogant fuddsoddiad pellach o £25 miliwn yng Nghanolfan Mileniwm Cymru, a bydd cyfanswm y gost dros £100 miliwn. Dyna'r rhagrith y soniaf amdano. Yr wyf yn realydd—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have drawn attention to the fact that, according to the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber, allegations of hypocrisy, untruthfulness or

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Tynnais sylw at y ffaith, yn unol â'r Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr, nad yw honiadau o ragrith, anonestrwydd neu sylwadau ffug mewn trefn.

false utterances are not in order. I would ask Members not to use such expressions.

**Peter Law:** It appears to be hypocrisy, which will be confirmed on Thursday.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I cannot allow this rephrasing of discourteous language. It is not appropriate.

**Peter Law:** I withdraw my comments about hypocrisy and merely repeat that they are a bunch of political opportunists.

**Nick Bourne:** For your information, we have a free vote on this unlike perhaps your party. More to the point, I would be interested to hear—I tried to put the same point to Lorraine Barrett—what amount do you consider to be acceptable for a new Assembly building; if not £50 million, why not £100 million? I am concerned about this waste of money for Welsh taxpayers. That is not hypocritical. I have made the point time and again and have still not received a satisfactory answer. Perhaps you, rather than a Minister, may be able to provide that answer. What figure would be acceptable; if not £50 million, why not £100 million?

**Peter Law:** I am taking the common sense approach by pausing and considering and reassessing the situation, before the Assembly comes back with a report. Every reasonable Member will support that approach, with the exception of you and your group. The fact is that you have never been in favour of the Assembly, the new building design, the car park option or anything else. The only common sense approach would be to progress as outlined in the motion. We must not adopt a blank cheque mentality—and I do not think that anyone has done so—as a prudent approach is vital. We must wait for the Minister to come back on this before we decide on what action to take, which should be reasonable and appropriate.

**David Davies:** I am delighted to follow that amazing speech by Peter Law. We first opposed this building when there was a price tag of £13 million. We said that we wanted the money to be spent on a children's hospital and were accused of being political

Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau beidio â defnyddio ymadroddion o'r fath.

**Peter Law:** Ymddengys fel rhagrith, a chaiff hyn ei gadarnhau ddydd Iau.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allaf ganiatáu'r aralleiriad hwn o iaith anghwrtais. Nid yw'n briodol.

**Peter Law:** Tynnaf fy sylwadau ynglŷn â rhagrith yn ôl ac ailadroddaf eu bod yn griw o fanteiswyr gwleidyddol.

**Nick Bourne:** Er gwybodaeth ichi, mae gennym bleidlais rydd ar hyn yn annhebyg i'ch plaid chi o bosibl. Yn bwysicach, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb clywed—ceisiais gyfleu yr un pwynt i Lorraine Barrett—pa swm a ystyriwch sydd yn dderbyniol ar gyfer adeilad newydd i'r Cynulliad; os nad yw'n £50 miliwn, beth am £100 miliwn? Ar ran trethdalwyr Cymru yr wyf yn bryderus am y gwastraff hwn o arian. Nid yw hynny'n rhagrithiol. Gwneuthum y pwynt droeon ac nid wyf wedi derbyn ateb boddhaol eto. Efallai y gallech chi, yn hytrach na'r Gweinidog, ddarparu'r ateb hwnnw. Pa ffigur fyddai'n dderbyniol; os nad yw'n £50 miliwn, beth am £100 miliwn?

**Peter Law:** Yr wyf yn mabwysiadu'r ymagwedd synnwyr cyffredin drwy oedi ac ystyried ac ailasesu'r sefyllfa, cyn i'r Cynulliad ddychwelyd gydag adroddiad. Bydd pob Aelod rhesymol yn cefnogi'r ymagwedd honno, ac eithrio chi a'ch grŵp. Y gwir amdani yw na fuoch erioed o blaid y Cynulliad, cynllun yr adeilad newydd nac unrhyw beth arall. Yr unig ymagwedd synnwyr cyffredin fyddai symud ymlaen fel yr amlinellwyd yn y cynnig. Ni ddylem fabwysiadu meddylfryd siec wag—ac ni chredaf i unrhyw un wneud hynny—gan fod ymagwedd ddarbodus yn hanfodol. Rhaid inni aros i'r Gweinidog ymateb i hyn cyn inni benderfynu pa gamau i'w cymryd, a ddylai fod yn rhesymol ac yn briodol.

**David Davies:** Yr wyf yn falch iawn o ddilyn yr araith syfrdanol honno gan Peter Law. Gwrthwynebasom yr adeilad hwn yn gyntaf oll pan bennwyd pris o £13 miliwn arno. Dyweddasom ein bod am weld yr arian yn cael ei wario ar ysbyty plant ac fe'n cyhuddwyd o

opportunists. Since then, the cost has continued to rise. Each time, our line on this has been consistent. We have asked for the project to be halted and for the money to be spent on something that would be of benefit to the people of Wales. That is not being hypocritical, but entirely consistent.

**Peter Law:** Why then do you support the development of the Millennium Centre and the pumping of more public funds into that?

**David Davies:** You seem to think that I do, no-one else is aware of that. I have never made a statement on it. Perhaps, you might like to reflect on why you were happy to serve under the man who fully supported what you referred to as the lake in the ground in Cardiff Bay. However, this debate is not about the Conservative Party—although Peter Law would like it to be—it is about this administration and why it now comes before us to tell us that the new figure will be £47 million. Not only that, but they seem to have had a row with the developer and are examining all sorts of other options, including—laughingly enough—what appears to be some sort of private finance initiative.

When we mentioned £50 million, we were accused of exaggerating wildly. It now seems that we were wrong and that we had underestimated the cost. I am somewhat new to public life. I came here two years ago having spent time running a small business, where if we lost so much as £100 I had to explain myself. It seems to me that having lost millions of pounds like this, someone in this building should be considering their position.

Ni chredaf fod gair yn Gymraeg na Saesneg i ddisgrifio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd ond mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud yn blwmp ac yn blaen y dylem stopio'r prosiect yn awr a gwario'r arian ar rywbeth defnyddiol yng Nghymru.

**Richard Edwards:** It is a matter of concern and misgiving, to say the least, that events have developed in this way. Many questions need to be answered. Clearly, costs cannot be allowed to spiral totally out of control and if

fod yn fanteiswyr gwleidyddol. Ers hynny, cynyddodd y gost yn barhaus. Bob tro, bu ein safbwynt yn gyson. Gofynasom am roi terfyn ar y prosiect hwn ac i'r arian gael ei wario ar rywbeth a fyddai o fudd i bobl Cymru. Nid bod yn rhagrithiol yw hynny, ond bod yn gwbl gyson.

**Peter Law:** Pam felly y cefnogwch ddatblygiad Canolfan y Mileniwm a chyfrannu mwy o arian cyhoeddus at hynny?

**David Davies:** Ymddengys eich bod o dan yr argraff fy mod yn cefnogi hynny, ond nid oes unrhyw un arall yn ymwybodol o hynny. Ni wneuthum ddatganiad arno erioed. Efallai yr hoffech ystyried paham yr oeddech yn fodlon gwasanaethu o dan ŵr a lwyr gefnogai'r hyn y cyfeiriasoch ato fel llyn yn y ddaear ym Mae Caerdydd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r ddadl hon yn ymwneud â'r Blaid Geidwadol—er yr hoffai Peter Law hynny—mae'n ymwneud â'r weinyddiaeth hon a pham y daw ger ein bron yn awr a dweud wrthym mai £47 miliwn fydd y ffigur newydd. Ac nid dim ond hynny, ond mae'n debyg iddynt gael ffrae â'r datblygwr a'u bod yn archwilio pob math o opsiynau eraill, gan gynnwys—yn chwerrhinllyd ddigon—yr hyn sydd yn ôl pob tebyg yn rhyw fath o fenter cyllid preifat.

Pan grybwyllasom £50 miliwn, fe'n cyhuddwyd o ormodiaith anghyfrifol. Ymddengys bellach ein bod yn anghywir ac inni danamcangyfrif y gost. Yr wyf yn gymharol newydd i fywyd cyhoeddus. Deuthum yma ddwy flynedd yn ôl ar ôl treulio amser yn rhedeg busnes bach, lle yr oedd yn rhaid imi esbonio pe baem yn colli gymaint â £100. Tybiaf y dylai rywun yn yr adeilad hwn ystyried ei sefyllfa ar ôl colli miliynau o bunnoedd fel hyn.

I do not believe that there is a word in Welsh or English to describe what has occurred but I must say frankly that we must stop the project now and spend the money on something useful in Wales.

**Richard Edwards:** Mae'n fater o gryn bryder ac amheuaeth, a dweud y lleiaf, i ddigwyddiadau ddatblygu yn y modd hwn. Mae angen ateb nifer o gwestiynau. Yn amlwg, ni ellir caniatáu i'r costau fynd y tu

that means goodbye Richard Rogers, then so be it. I note all the Tory amendments, and have to say that I am not taking any lectures on what we need or do not need from a party that, for 18 years, cocked its snook at Welsh democracy, denuded all our public services in the process and built no children's hospital of which I am aware—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. These amendments have been moved by the Welsh Conservative group. I wish we could agree that at the request of the Welsh Conservative group we do not use the expression 'Tories'.

**Richard Edwards:** I will accept your ruling, Llywydd, and substitute 'Conservative' for 'T-O-R-Y'.

Of course they do not want to invest in our democratic future—they do not believe in it, and they claim to speak for the people of Wales. Let us be clear, a new building is not about individual AMs choosing a nice Chamber in which to sit and debate. I have said before that we are transient politicians—here today, gone tomorrow. This is about investing in our future democracy and in the future wellbeing of all our citizens. That is why we need the new building, not this underground car park. For goodness sake, that building needs to be more than fit for purpose.

**Alun Cairns:** I regret that this debate has had to be called today. It is clearly not only an embarrassment to the Government of Wales, but to the Assembly and to Wales in terms of how we run our public services. The Welsh Conservative group takes no pleasure from this debate nor from repeating some of the things that we warned at that time—

**Cynog Dafis:** Mae'r digwyddiadau hyn yn achosi embaras inni i gyd. Yr wyf yn teimlo'n sâl ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae pobl yn dweud bod hwn yn rhyw fath o embaras i Gymru, fel petai hyn yn adlewyrchiad o'n hanallu ni yng Nghymru i wneud y pethau

hwnt i bob rheolaeth ac os golyga hynny ffarwelio â Richard Rogers, yna bydded felly. Nodaf holl welliannau'r Toriaid, ac mae'n rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf am wrando arnynt hwy yn traethu am yr hyn sydd ei angen arnom neu beidio gan blaid a wffiodd ddemocratiaeth Gymreig am 18 mlynedd, ac a ddinoethodd ein holl wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn y broses ac na adeiladodd unrhyw ysbyty plant yr wyf i'n ymwybodol ohono—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cynigiwyd y gwelliannau hyn gan grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru. Hoffwn pe gallem gytuno â chais grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru i beidio â defnyddio'r ymadrodd 'Torïaid'.

**Richard Edwards:** Derbyniaf eich dyfarniad, Lywydd, a rhoi 'Ceidwadwr' yn lle 'T-O-R-I'.

Wrth gwrs, nid ydynt am fuddsoddi yn ein dyfodol democrataidd—ni chredant ynddo, a honnant eu bod yn siarad dros bobl Cymru. Gadewch inni fod yn glir, nid yw adeilad newydd yn ymwneud ag ACau unigol yn dewis Siambr ddymunol i eistedd a dadlau ynddi. Dywedais o'r blaen ein bod yn wleidyddion dros dro—yma heddiw, ond wedi diflannu yfory. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â buddsoddi yn ein democratiaeth yn y dyfodol a lles ein holl ddinasyddion yn y dyfodol. Dyna pam bod angen yr adeilad newydd arnom, ac nid y maes parcio tanddaearol hwn. Er mwyn y mawredd, rhaid i'r adeilad hwnnw fod yn fwy na theilwng at y diben hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Gresynaf fod yn rhaid galw'r ddaidl hon heddiw. Mae'n amlwg ei fod yn embaras nid yn unig i Lywodraeth Cymru, ond hefyd i'r Cynulliad ac i Gymru o safbwynt sut yr ydym yn rhedeg ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ni rydd y ddaidl hon unrhyw bleser i grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru nac ailadrodd rhai o'r pethau y rhybuddiasom yn eu cylch bryd hynny—

**Cynog Dafis:** These events are a cause of embarrassment for us all. I feel sick about the way that people say that this is some kind of an embarrassment for Wales, as if it is a reflection of our inability in Wales to do these things. Has Alun Cairns heard of the

hyn. A yw Alun Cairns wedi clywed am Ddôm y Mileniwm, am Portcullis House ac am Ganolfan Pompidou ym Mharis? A yw'r gwledydd hynny yn cywilyddio a chyhuddo'u hunain o fethu â rheoli prosiectau a rhedeg eu busnesau'n iawn o achos bod prosiectau yn methu? A allwn dyfu allan o'r hunan-gywilyddio a'r hunan-ddiraddio parhaus hwn? A allwn ni wynebu problem, ceisio'i datrys a'i gadael felly?

5:50 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn siomedig bod Cynog Dafis yn cymryd yr agwedd honno. Mae llanast y prosiect hwn—a llanast ydyw—yn adlewyrchu ar Gymru yn gyfan gwbl. Fel Aelodau sydd yn cynrychioli pobl Cymru, rhaid i bob un ohonom dderbyn ein cyfrifoldeb, rhai yn fwy na'r lleill.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych am feio Cymru gyfan am y sefyllfa sydd wedi datblygu. Penderfyniad gwleidyddol oedd adeiladu siambr newydd a rhaid i wleidyddion dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am y penderfyniad gwleidyddol hwnnw. Nid yw'n ddim i wneud â Chymru gyfan. Mae'n ymwneud â chyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol. Yr hyn yr hoffwn ei glywed y prynhawn yma yw pwy sydd yn derbyn cyfrifoldeb gwleidyddol am y sefyllfa hon ac am y ffaith fod y costau wedi chwyddo? Ni phleidleisiais dros adeilad newydd a fyddai'n costio £47 miliwn. Pleidleisiais dros adeilad a fyddai'n costio £28 miliwn. Pwy sydd yn derbyn y cyfrifoldeb am y ffaith fod £20 miliwn wedi cael ei ychwanegu at y gost? A oes rhywun y prynhawn yma am dderbyn y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw?

**Alun Cairns:** Derbyniaf un o bwyntiau Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ond mae'r sefyllfa hon yn adlewyrchu ar Gymru. Mae'n amlwg bod Partneriaeth Richard Rogers wedi peri problemau, ond rhaid i'r Cabinet ac Aelodau'r pleidiau a bleidleisiodd dros yr adeilad dderbyn cyfrifoldeb. Rhaid i'r Blaid Geidwadol hefyd dderbyn cyfrifoldeb gan inni fethu ag atal y prosiect cyn hyn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas a gododd—**

**Alun Cairns:** Nid wyf am ildio. Rhaid i un

Millennium Dome, of Portcullis House and the Pompidou Centre in Paris? Do those countries become ashamed and accuse themselves of not being able to run their own projects and businesses properly because projects fail? Can we grow out of this self-deprecation and this continuous self-abasement? Can we face a problem, try and resolve it and leave it at that?

**Alun Cairns:** I am disappointed that Cynog Dafis takes that attitude. The mess of this project—and it is a mess—reflects on the whole of Wales. As Members who represent the people of Wales, we must all accept our responsibility, some more than others.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** You want to blame the whole of Wales for the situation that has arisen. Building a new chamber was a political decision and politicians must accept responsibility for that political decision. It is nothing to do with the whole of Wales. It is about political responsibility. What I would like to hear this afternoon is who will accept political responsibility for this situation and for the fact that the costs have inflated? I did not vote for a new building that would cost £47 million. I voted for a building that would cost £28 million. Who accepts the responsibility for the fact that an additional £20 million has been added to this cost? Is there anybody this afternoon going to accept that responsibility?

**Alun Cairns:** I accept one of Rhodri Glyn Thomas's points, but this situation does reflect on Wales. It is obvious that the Richard Rogers Partnership has caused problems, but the Cabinet and Members of parties who voted in favour of the building must accept responsibility. The Conservative Party must also accept responsibility as we did not stop the project before now.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas rose—**

**Alun Cairns:** I will not give way. One

person dderbyn cyfrifoldeb ar ran y Cynulliad a Phrif Weinidog Cymru yw'r person hwnnw. Dychwelaf i'm haraith.

We expressed concern at the time about the costs. We predicted that the costs would rise. I take no pleasure in the fact that we have been proved right in many of those respects because it is a problem now, as many Members said earlier. I believe it was Peter Law who said that this is where we are. I accept that in many ways. I rarely agree with Peter Law, but I will take that point from his speech. The reasons that were given in favour of the new building by the three other parties at the time of the debate were prestige, status and vision. Lorraine Barrett has mentioned those today. We need to answer prestige, status and vision with cost because that is what it ultimately comes down to. When we sought to stop the progression of the new Assembly building, I asked Members how they could look a constituent in the eye who was waiting for a hip operation when we are spending vast sums of money on a new debating chamber in Cardiff Bay. Some of you might have noticed that I was late in coming to the Chamber today. The reason that I was late was because a constituent came to see me and refused to leave the Assembly building until I could guarantee that she was going to be rehoused. That is the problem we face. The police and officials were doing everything possible to support me, but she would not leave the building until she had a commitment that she could be rehoused. That is the state of public services in Wales and that is the kind of issue with which we must deal.

I accept the principle behind the argument of prestige, status and vision in many ways. However, the ultimate question is at what cost? We are already over £40 million. The figure of £100 million has been mentioned. However, many Members have argued today for a blind commitment to the new Assembly building, no matter what the cost. It is a blind commitment to prestige, status and vision—and for what? For the 60 politicians in this Chamber. What better message to send to the rest of the United Kingdom than to spend the money on a better health service, education service and better housing? That lady did not

person must accept responsibility on behalf of the Assembly and that person is the First Minister. I return to my speech.

Mynegasom bryder ar y pryd ynglŷn â'r costau. Rhagwelasom y byddai'r costau'n cynyddu. Nid ymfalchïaf yn y ffaith inni gael ein profi'n gywir o ran nifer o'r agweddau hynny am ei fod yn broblem yn awr, fel y dywedodd nifer o'r Aelodau yn gynharach. Credaf mai Peter Law a ddywedodd mai dyma yw'r sefyllfa. Derbyniaf hynny ar sawl gwedd. Anaml y cytunaf â Peter Law, ond cymeraf y pwynt hwnnw o'i araith. Y rhesymau a roddwyd o blaid yr adeilad newydd hwn gan y tair plaid arall ar adeg y ddadl oedd bri, statws a gweledigaeth. Crybwyllodd Lorraine Barrett y rhain heddiw. Mae angen inni gymharu bri, statws a gweledigaeth gyda chost oherwydd diwedd y gân yw'r geiniog yn y pen draw. Pan geisiasom atal datblygiad adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, gofynnais i'r Aelodau sut y gallent edrych ym myw llygad etholwr sydd yn aros am lawdriniaeth ar ei glun tra'n bod ni'n gwario llwyth o arian ar siambr ddadlau newydd ym Mae Caerdydd. Efallai y sylwodd rhai ohonoch fy mod yn hwyr yn cyrraedd y Siambr heddiw. Y rheswm fy mod yn hwyr oedd am i etholwr ddod i'm gweld a gwrthod gadael adeilad y Cynulliad tan imi allu roi sicrwydd iddi y byddai'n cael ei hailgartrefu. Dyna'r broblem a wynebwn. Yr oedd yr heddlu a swyddogion yn gwneud popeth o fewn eu gallu i'm cefnogi, ond gwrthodai adael yr adeilad tan iddi gael ymrwymiad y gallai gael ei hailgartrefu. Dyna gyflwr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cymru a dyna'r math o fater sydd yn rhaid inni ddelio ag ef.

Derbyniaf yr egwyddor sydd yn sail i'r ddadl o fri, statws a gweledigaeth ar sawl gwedd. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn sylfaenol yw ar ba gost? Yr ydym eisoes dros £40 miliwn. Crybwyllwyd ffigur o £100 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, dadleuodd nifer o Aelodau heddiw am ymrwymiad dall i adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, beth bynnag fo'r gost. Ymrwymiad dall ydyw i fri, statws a gweledigaeth—ac i beth? Ar gyfer y 60 o wleidyddion yn y Siambr hon. Pa neges well i'w throsglwyddo i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig na gwario'r arian ar wasanaeth iechyd gwell, gwasanaeth addysg gwell a thai gwell? Nid

have to come to the Assembly. That would be a strong message on devolution, not the £50 million—or whatever figure it will come to—being spent on a new Assembly building.

**Huw Lewis:** One of the most difficult aspects about being in political life, which I am sure that you will accept, Alun, is that you must also consider what happens if you do not do something. Therefore, what is the Conservative Party suggesting today? Are you suggesting that we invest £10 million, which would be the cost of cancellation, in a hole in the ground? Is that the monument to Tory Party saloon-bar politics?

**Alun Cairns:** Every Conservative Member who has spoken so far has sought to address this matter with dignity, not to carp or capitalise on cheap political points. [*Laughter.*]

**David Melding:** Perhaps a little levity may not be inappropriate. We are asked what to do with the great hole that has now been dug for the foundations of the new building. We are supposed to be against landfill sites, but perhaps we could make one exception, and take all the failed policies and all the paper that this Executive has generated and put them in that hole.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun Cairns, I draw your attention to the fact that you have gone well over the standard allocation of five minutes.

**Alun Cairns:** I will draw my comments to a close, Llywydd.

Huw Lewis asked where we stop. It is clear that the Government of Wales and the Minister are prepared to cut their losses in relation to the Richard Rogers Partnership. That may be right or wrong. We are prepared to cut our losses in relation to the Assembly building. The principle is exactly the same. If the Assembly says enough is enough for Richard Rogers, the Welsh Conservative Party says enough is enough for the new building.

**Richard Edwards:** Point of order, I draw

oedd rhaid i'r wraig honno ddod i'r Cynulliad. Byddai hynny'n neges glir ar ddatganoli, ac nid y £50 miliwn—neu ba bynnag ffigur y bo—yn cael ei wario ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad.

**Huw Lewis:** Un o'r agweddau anoddaf ar fod yn rhan o fywyd gwleidyddol, yr wyf yn siŵr y derbyniwch, Alun, yw bod yn rhaid ichi hefyd ystyried beth a ddigwydd os na wnewch chi rywbeth. Felly, beth a awgryma'r Plaid Geidwadol heddiw? A awgrymwch inni fuddsoddi £10 miliwn, sef cost diddymu'r cynllun, mewn twll yn y ddaear? Ai dyna yw symbol gwleidyddiaeth tafarn y Plaid Doriaidd?

**Alun Cairns:** Ceisiodd pob Aelod Ceidwadol a siaradodd hyd yn hyn fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ag urddas, ac nid er mwyn lladd arno neu fanteisio ar bwyntiau gwleidyddol diwerth. [*Chwerthin.*]

**David Melding:** Efallai nad yw ychydig o wamalrwydd yn anaddas. Gofynnwyd inni beth y dylid ei wneud â'r twll enfawr sydd bellach wedi'i gloddio ar gyfer sylfeini'r adeilad newydd. Yr ydym i fod i wrthwynebu safleoedd tirlenwi, ond efallai y gallem wneud un eithriad, a chasglu holl bolisiau aflwyddiannus a'r holl bapur a gynhyrchodd y Weithrediaeth hon ynghyd a'u rhoi yn y twll hwnnw.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Alun Cairns, tynnaf eich sylw at y ffaith ichi fynd ymhell dros y dogn safonol o amser o bum munud.

**Alun Cairns:** Dof â'm sylwadau i fwewl, Lywydd.

Gofynnodd Huw Lewis beth yw'r pen draw. Mae'n amlwg fod Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Gweinidog yn barod i dorri'u colledion mewn perthynas â Phartneriaeth Richard Rogers—yn gam neu'n gymwys. Yr ydym ni'n barod i dorri'n colledion mewn perthynas ag adeilad y Cynulliad. Yr un yn union yw'r egwyddor. Os dywed y Cynulliad wrth Richard Rogers mai digon yw digon, dywed Plaid Geidwadol Cymru mai digon yw digon o ran yr adeilad newydd.

**Richard Edwards:** Pwynt o drefn, tynnaf



your attention to the fact that you allowed Huw Lewis to refer to the boys' club there as the 'Tory Party'.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have been trying to catch up with all the indiscretions that have been happening in this Chamber. Huw, will you refer to the Welsh Conservative group accordingly? Alun Pugh, no mention of Tories, please.

**Alun Pugh:** Of course not, Llywydd.

Things do not always go according to the most meticulous and best-laid plans. Just ask Michael Portillo, who has just been voted out of the Conservative leadership contest.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not debating the future of the Conservative Party; we are trying to debate the future of the Assembly building.

**Alun Pugh:** We have an overrun on cost that nobody wants. Many of us want a building of which the nation can be proud, rather than a multi-million pound hole, which is slowly filling up with rainwater this afternoon. However, we must listen to the real concerns of the people whom we represent. It is a long way from Colwyn Bay to Cardiff Bay, and many people in my constituency will be unhappy at this escalation of costs, and will rightly insist that there must be a bottom line. Edwina Hart is absolutely right to pause at this stage, and examine whether it is possible to deliver a building, at an acceptable price, of which we can be proud.

**Rod Richards:** I speak on behalf of the independent Tory in the building. We have heard many Members describe how they feel. Dafydd Wigley said that he was livid, Glyn Davies said that he was saddened and Alun Cairns said that he was embarrassed. Looking at the First Minister, I do not detect any of those emotions on his face. Llywydd, you will recall that when the First Minister took over from his predecessor, Alun Michael, some time ago, he wanted several weeks to examine all the papers and documents, and

eich sylw at y ffaith ichi ganiatáu i Huw Lewis gyfeirio at glwb y bechgyn yn y fan acw fel 'Y Blaid Doriaidd'.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi bod yn ceisio dilyn pob amryfusedd a ddigwydd yn y Siambr hon. Huw, a gyfeiriwch at grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru felly? Alun Pugh, peidiwch â chrybwyll Torïaid, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Alun Pugh:** Wrth gwrs, Lywydd.

Nid yw pethau pob amser yn dilyn y cynlluniau mwyaf manwl a thrylwyr. Gofynnwch i Michael Portillo, sydd newydd gael ei bleidleisio allan o'r gystadleuaeth i arwain y Ceidwadwyr.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym yn cynnal dadl ar ddyfodol y Blaid Geidwadol; yr ydym yn ceisio cynnal dadl ar ddyfodol adeilad y Cynulliad.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r costau wedi mynd y tu hwnt i'r gyllideb ac nid oes unrhyw un am weld hynny. Mae nifer ohonom am weld adeilad y gall y genedl ymfalchïo ynddo, yn hytrach na thwll a gostiodd filiynau o bunnoedd, sydd yn araf lenwi â dŵr glaw y prynhawn yma. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni wrando ar bryderon gwirioneddol y bobl hynny a gynrychiolwn. Mae cryn bellter rhwng Bae Colwyn a Bae Caerdydd, a bydd nifer o bobl yn fy etholaeth i yn anhapus â'r cynnydd hwn mewn costau, a byddent yn mynnu, a hynny'n briodol, bod yn rhaid pennu terfyn. Mae Edwina Hart yn hollol gywir i oedi ar yr adeg hon, ac archwilio a yw'n bosibl codi adeilad, am bris derbyniol, y gallwn ymfalchïo ynddo.

**Rod Richards:** Siaradaf ar ran y Tori annibynnol yn yr adeilad. Clywsom nifer o'r Aelodau yn disgrifio sut y teimlant. Dywedodd Dafydd Wigley ei fod yn gandryll, dywedodd Glyn Davies ei fod yn drist a dywedodd Alun Cairns ei fod yn teimlo embaras. Gan edrych ar Brif Weinidog Cymru, ni sylwaf ar unrhyw un o'r emosiynau hyn ar ei wyneb. Lywydd, fe gofiwch pan gymerodd Prif Weinidog Cymru yr awenau oddi wrth ei ragflaenydd, Alun Michael, beth amser yn ôl, yr oedd yn

check that everything was in order, so that he could make a decision of his own. Clearly he had heard his predecessor, Alun Michael, say that he was not aware that the 10-year extension of the lease of this building was part of the deal. That is why I can understand why Rhodri Morgan wanted to take several weeks to ensure that every i was dotted and every t was crossed. At that moment in time, he took ownership of the project and became responsible for it. It was not the responsibility of his predecessor, Alun Michael, nor that of Alun Michael's predecessor, Ron Davies. Rhodri Morgan took charge of the project. The First Minister knows, as do all Government Ministers, that officials advise and Ministers decide. The buck stops with Rhodri Morgan, not with anyone else.

dymuno treulio sawl wythnos yn archwilio'r holl bapurau a'r dogfennau, a sicrhau bod popeth mewn trefn, fel y gallai wneud penderfyniad drosto'i hun. Yn amlwg, fe glywodd ei ragflaenydd, Alun Michael yn dweud nad oedd yn ymwybodol fod estyn prydles yr adeilad hwn am 10 mlynedd yn rhan o'r fargen. Dyna pam y gallaf ddeall pam bod Rhodri Morgan am dreulio sawl wythnos yn sicrhau bod pob manylyn yn ei le. Bryd hynny, cymerodd feddiant o'r prosiect a daeth yn gyfrifol amdano. Nid cyfrifoldeb ei ragflaenydd, Alun Michael, ydoedd na rhagflaenydd Alun Michael, Ron Davies. Ysgwyddodd Rhodri Morgan y cyfrifoldeb dros y prosiect. Gŵyr Prif Weinidog Cymru, fel y gŵyr pob Gweinidog yn y Llywodraeth, mai swyddogion sydd yn cynghori a Gweinidogion sydd yn penderfynu. Rhodri Morgan sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf, ac nid unrhyw un arall.

6:00 p.m.

I was outraged when Edwina Hart stood at the lectern to deliver her speech without even offering an apology. It was not that she did not offer an apology to Members, she did not even offer an apology to the people who put us here. She, and the Government, owes them—not only us—an apology for the mess that they have created. As for Mike German, his speech about pausing for time was so complacent that it was nauseating. People have hedged around as to who is responsible and what should happen. The buck stops with Rhodri Morgan. He should resign on this issue because it is his responsibility. You should resign, Rhodri, and resign now. For God's sake, go.

Fe'm cythruddwyd pan safodd Edwina Hart ger y darllenfwrdd i draethu ei haraith heb hyd yn oed gynnig ymddiheuriad. Nid yn unig na chynigodd ymddiheuriad i'r Aelodau, ond ni chynigodd ymddiheuriad hyd yn oed i'r bobl a oedd yn gyfrifol am ein rhoi yma ychwaith. Mae arni hi, a'r Llywodraeth, ymddiheuriad—nid dim ond i ni—ond iddynt hwy am y llanast a greasant. O ran Mike German, yr oedd ei araith ynglŷn ag oedi mor hunanfodlon fel ei fod yn gyfoglyd. Bu pobl yn hel dail ynglŷn â phwy sydd yn gyfrifol a beth ddylai ddigwydd. Rhodri Morgan sydd yn bennaf gyfrifol. Dylai ymddiswyddo ar y mater hwn am mai ei gyfrifoldeb ef ydyw. Dylech ymddiswyddo, Rhodri, ac ymddiswyddo yn awr. Ewch, er mwyn Duw.

**Pauline Jarman:** The contents of today's motion and the First Minister cannot be defended. Why else would we be looking for a solution to the matter that we can defend? I ask Rhodri Morgan, or Edwina Hart—or whoever responds to this debate—whether the tender document issued, subject to today's vote, will be based on the original design or on a scaled-down version.

**Pauline Jarman:** Ni ellid amddiffyn cynnwys y cynnig heddiw na Phrif Weinidog Cymru. Pam arall y byddem yn edrych am ateb i'r mater y gallwn ei amddiffyn? Gofynnaf i Rhodri Morgan, neu Edwina Hart—neu bwy bynnag fydd yn ymateb i'r ddatl hon—a fydd y ddogfen dendr a ryddheir, yn ddibynnol ar bleidlais heddiw, yn seiliedig ar y cynllun gwreiddiol neu ar fersiwn ar raddfa lai.

The motion asks us to either lease the building or buy it for an agreed lump sum.

Gofyn y cynnig inni naill ai brydlesu'r adeilad neu ei brynu am gyfandaliad y

We have had too much of 'either' and 'or'. The procurement process has so far been doubtful. I do not know what procurement advice Ministers have received or from where that advice came. My serious concern is that the Assembly could now be threatened with litigation. Has legal advice been sought and, if so, what was that advice? At the end of the day, even though we are all responsible, the main responsibility lies with the First Minister.

**Geraint Davies:** I am very disappointed with what we have heard today. The cost increase is exponential and worrying. However, we must remember why the Assembly exists. We fought for devolution because we wanted a government of Wales that would be accountable to the people of Wales. Our most important task and responsibility is to bring to account the people who took these decisions. If we fail to do so, we will fail the people of Wales. It is vital, therefore, that the decision-makers are brought to account.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I have listened carefully to today's contributions. One of the most extraordinary contributions was made by Alun Cairns. He rightly spoke of investing in health, education and other key areas. However, he should remember that it was John Redwood who sent back £100 million to the Treasury. That amount would have been enough to build two Assembly chambers. [CONSERVATIVE ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Your comments are out of date.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I think that Ieuan Wyn Jones was about to come to the subject under discussion.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I tell Alun, and his Welsh Conservative friends, that this is not an embarrassment for the people of Wales; it is a massive embarrassment for the Government of Wales. We must have the self-confidence as a nation to hold this Government to account. We must not accuse the people of Wales for this Government's failure. That point must be made today. This is a massive embarrassment. It is not a situation in which we want to be. The Government must take responsibility for it.

cytunwyd arno. Cawsom ormod o 'naill ai' a 'neu'. Hyd yn hyn bu'r broses gaffael yn amheus. Ni wn pa gyngor a dderbyniodd y Gweinidogion ynghylch caffael nac o ble y daeth y cyngor hwnnw. Fy mhryder mawr yw y gellid bygwth y Cynulliad yn awr ag ymgyfreithiad. A geisiwyd cyngor cyfreithiol ac os felly, beth oedd y cyngor hwnnw? Yn y pen draw, er bod pob un ohonom yn gyfrifol, ar ysgwyddau Prif Weinidog Cymru y mae'r prif gyfrifoldeb.

**Geraint Davies:** Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn gyda'r hyn a glywsom heddiw. Mae'r cynnydd yn y gost yn cyflymu ac yn peri pryder. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio pam bod y Cynulliad yn bodoli. Brwydrasom dros ddatganoli am ein bod am weld llywodraeth Cymru a fyddai'n atebol i bobl Cymru. Ein tasg a'n cyfrifoldeb pwysicaf fydd dwyn y bobl hynny a wnaeth y penderfyniadau hyn i gyfrif. Os methwn â gwneud hynny, byddwn yn siomi pobl Cymru. Mae'n hanfodol, felly, y dygir y rheini a wnaeth y penderfyniadau i gyfrif.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwrandawais yn astud ar gyfraniadau heddiw. Gwnaethpwyd un o'r cyfraniadau mwyaf syfrdanol gan Alun Cairns. Siaradodd yn briodol am fuddsoddi mewn iechyd, addysg a meysydd allweddol eraill. Fodd bynnag, dylai gofio mai John Redwood a anfonodd £100 miliwn yn ôl i'r Trysorlys. Byddai'r swm hwnnw'n ddigon i adeiladu dwy siambr ar gyfer y Cynulliad. [AELODAU CEIDWADOL O'R CYNULLIAD: 'Hen hanes yw eich sylwadau'.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Credaf fod Ieuan Wyn Jones ar fin troi at y pwnc sydd yn destun trafodaeth.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dywedaf wrth Alun, a'i gyfeillion ym Mhlaid Geidwadol Cymru, nad embaras yw hwn i bobl Cymru; yn hytrach mae'n embaras enfawr i Lywodraeth Cymru. Rhaid inni fel cenedl feddu ar yr hunanhyder i ddwyn y Llywodraeth hon i gyfrif. Ni ddylem gyhuddo pobl Cymru am fethiant y Llywodraeth hon. Rhaid gwneud y pwynt hwnnw heddiw. Mae hwn yn embaras enfawr. Nid yw hon yn sefyllfa y dymunwn fod ynddi. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gymryd cyfrifoldeb drosti.

**Alun Cairns:** I sought to highlight, Ieuan, that this reflects badly on Wales, and is an embarrassment to Wales. When you are higher up the learning curve, I am sure that you will appreciate that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** As always, I am grateful for Alun's advice. It is vital that everyone in this Chamber understands that devolution has brought great self-confidence to the people of Wales. We should not run that down. However, as I have made clear during this short contribution, we have a responsibility to hold this Government to account for what has happened. This situation is an embarrassment. I will be writing to the Chair of the Audit Committee asking the Committee to consider how the contract was determined so far. I accept Alison Halford's point—I listened to it with great care. There is now a case for us to ask the Audit Committee to reconsider this issue.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you agree, Ieuan, that it is enlightening, but ironic that Alun Cairns wants to deflect responsibility for this decision from the Government and the First Minister to the people of Wales, and blame them for a decision taken by this Government? The Welsh Conservatives do not want to hold the Government to account. They want to blame the people of Wales and devolution. The Government must take responsibility.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If you wanted to make a speech, you should have indicated that.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** He made an excellent intervention.

**David Davies:** The Leader of the Opposition's idea of responsible opposition is to fully support the Government in spending millions of pounds on a new building. He then runs away and hides, and says that it has nothing to do with him and that he is not to blame when, suddenly, as we predicted all along, the cost hits £50 million.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is responsible opposition to say this: we have already spent £8 million on this building. That money

**Alun Cairns:** Ceisiais bwysleisio, Ieuan, yr adlewyrcha hyn yn anffafriol ar Gymru, a'i fod yn embaras i Gymru. Pan fyddwch wedi aeddfedu, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwerthfawrogwch hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fel erioed, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyngor Alun. Mae'n hanfodol fod pawb yn y Siambr hon yn deall fod datganoli wedi dod â llawer o hunanhyder i bobl Cymru. Ni ddylem fychanu hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel yr eglurais yn ystod y cyfraniad byr hwn, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i ddwyn y Llywodraeth hon i gyfrif am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Mae'r sefyllfa hon yn embaras. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn gofyn i'r Pwyllgor ystyried sut y penderfynwyd ar y contract hyd yn hyn. Derbyniaf bwynt Alison Halford—gwrandawais arno yn ofalus iawn. Bellach mae rheswm gennym dros ofyn i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio ailystyried y mater hwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A gytunwch, Ieuan, fod hyn yn goleuo'r mater, ond ei fod yn eironig bod Alun Cairns yn dymuno gwyrô'r cyfrifoldeb dros y penderfyniad hwn oddi wrth y Llywodraeth a Phrif Weinidog Cymru i bobl Cymru, a'u beio am benderfyniad a wnaethpwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon? Nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru am ddwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif. Maent am feio pobl Cymru a datganoli. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Pe baech am wneud araith, dylech fod wedi nodi hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oedd yn ymyriad campus.

**David Davies:** Syniad Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid o wrthblaid resymol yw cefnogi'r Llywodraeth yn llawn wrth wario miliynau o bunnoedd ar adeilad newydd. Yna, rhed ymaith a chuddio a dweud nad oes ganddo unrhyw beth i'w wneud ag ef ac nad ef sydd ar fai, yn sydyn, pan fo'r gost yn cyrraedd £50 miliwn, fel y rhagwelaisom o'r cychwyn cyntaf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Bod yn wrthblaid resymol yw dweud hyn: gwariasom £8 miliwn eisoes ar yr adeilad hwn. Byddai'r

would be wasted if the Welsh Conservatives had their way today. If you support this motion and our amendment, this project will be suspended to allow Assembly Members to consider all options. That is responsible opposition and not the irresponsible opposition that the Welsh Conservatives are demonstrating. This Government must listen carefully to what is being said in this Chamber today. It is not a foregone conclusion that this Assembly building will proceed. People must be taken to task for the situation in which we find ourselves. However, I hope that the people of Wales understand that we will act responsibly when the final decision is taken.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I have listened carefully to what has been said in the Chamber today. I am not surprised that Members have expressed serious concerns about the serious situation in which we find ourselves. I did not reach this decision lightly. We are proposing this early action so that the situation does not spiral out of control. We have tried to keep a tight grip on cost. Listening to the Welsh Conservatives, you could swear that I had squandered £50 million. We have not squandered that money. We took early, remedial action to try to assure and advise the Assembly about the arising problems. The word 'embarrassment' has been used today. I am not embarrassed about coming to this Chamber today. I am sad that we are in this position. The people of Wales must not be embarrassed. They have an open and accountable Assembly, which is trying to discuss the issues concerning the governance of Wales and the new Assembly building rationally. That is the important issue.

6:10 p.m.

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Edwina Hart:** When we talk about the future, let us be clear that, in my opinion, devolution is the future. We are discussing the wider issue of what building will be

arian hwnnw'n cael ei wastraffu pe bai Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n cael eu ffordd heddiw. Os cefnogwch y cynnig hwn a'n gwelliant, caiff y prosiect hwn ei ohirio i ganiatáu i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ystyried yr holl opsiynau. Bod yn wrthblaid gyfrifol yw hynny ac nid bod yr wrthblaid anghyfrifol, sef yr hyn y mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n ei harddangos. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth hon wrando'n astud ar yr hyn a ddywedir yn y Siambr hon heddiw. Nid yw'n anochel y bydd yr adeilad Cynulliad hwn yn mynd rhagddo. Rhaid galw pobl i gyfrif am y sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y bydd pobl Cymru yn deall y gweithredwn yn gyfrifol pan wneir y penderfyniad terfynol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Gwrandawais yn astud ar yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn y Siambr heddiw. Ni synnaf i'r Aelodau fynegi pryderon dwys am y sefyllfa ddifrifol yr ydym ynddi. Nid ar chwarae bach y deuthum i'r penderfyniad hwn. Cynigiwn weithredu'n gynnar i sicrhau nad aiff y sefyllfa y tu hwnt i bob rheolaeth. Ceisiasom gadw gafael gadarn ar y gost. O wrando ar Geidwadwyr Cymru, gallech dyngu imi wastraffu £50 miliwn. Ni wastraffasom yr arian hwnnw. Cymerasom gamau cynnar, adferol i geisio sicrhau a chynghori'r Cynulliad am y problemau a gyfyd. Defnyddiwyd y gair 'embaras' heddiw. Ni theimlwn imbaras ynglŷn â dod i'r Siambr hon heddiw. Yr wyf yn drist ein bod yn y sefyllfa hon. Ni ddylai pobl Cymru deimlo imbaras. Mae ganddynt Gynulliad agored ac atebol, sydd yn ceisio trafod y materion sydd yn ymwneud â llywodraethu Cymru ac adeilad newydd y Cynulliad yn rhesymegol. Dyna'r pwnc pwysig.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Edwina Hart:** Pan siaradwn am y dyfodol, gadewch inni fod yn glir mai datganoli yw'r dyfodol yn fy marn i. Yr ydym yn trafod y mater ehangach o ba adeilad a godir at y

erected for the democratic purpose, which we want in terms of a new Chamber. It is incumbent on us to have a wider vision, to which Ron Davies referred. His contribution today was particularly thoughtful and I will bear his points in mind. However, regarding William Graham's amendments, it is not that I am not prepared to disclose information, but I must consider commercial sensitivity and other issues at this stage.

I am sure that the National Audit Office will wish to examine these figures in depth and all the books will be open to it. Ieuan indicated that he will write to the chair of the Audit Committee. That is appropriate. However, I must be mindful that I want this project to run. I must ensure that I do not disclose anything that would not allow it to run for the benefit and value for money for the people of Wales.

The Assembly has clearly expressed its will to construct the building, which Richard Rogers designed. This proposal offers us the opportunity to stop and consider whether we can deliver on this. That is the key issue. I understand people's concerns about costs. However, at least we have had the luxury—and Mike German referred to this—of putting the project on hold. They did not put the project on hold in Westminster or Scotland. We have had the luxury to consider the options available.

Nick Bourne referred to the black hole. He refers to the past, but I must bear in mind the future. We can discuss what has happened in terms of these figures, and work out solutions, but I must look to the future and consider what we want.

Cynog commented that we need to be more vigilant in dealing with the construction of public buildings. Any lessons that can be learnt will be learnt from this. As the Minister in charge of this project, I am prepared to accept my responsibility, hence why I came here today. I could have carried on, terminated the contract and gone into recess. I chose not to do that. I chose to make all the facts and figures available and to come to this Chamber and be honest with you. It is a brutal world outside, but the only people

diben democrataidd yr ydym yn ei ddymuno o ran Siambr newydd. Ein dyletswydd yw meddu ar weledigaeth ehangach, y cyfeiriodd Ron Davies ati. Yr oedd ei gyfraniad heddiw yn arbennig o feddylgar a chadwaf ei bwyntiau mewn cof. Fodd bynnag, o ran gwelliannau William Graham, nid yw'n wir nad wyf yn barod i ddatgelu gwybodaeth, ond rhaid imi ystyried sensitifrwydd masnachol a materion eraill ar hyn o bryd.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol am archwilio'r ffigurau hyn yn fanwl a bydd y llyfrau i gyd ar gael iddi. Nododd Ieuan y bydd yn ysgrifennu at gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae hynny'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gofio fy mod am weld y prosiect hwn yn mynd rhagddo. Rhaid imi sicrhau na ddatgelaf unrhyw beth na fyddai'n caniatáu iddo fynd rhagddo er budd a gwerth am arian i bobl Cymru.

Mynegodd y Cynulliad yn glir ei ddyhead i adeiladu'r adeilad, a gynlluniodd Richard Rogers. Cynigia'r cynnig hwn y cyfle inni oedi ac ystyried a allwn weithredu ar hyn. Dyna'r pwnc allweddol. Deallaf bryderon pobl ynglŷn â chostau. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf cawsom y fantais—a chyfeiriodd Mike German at hyn—o ohirio'r prosiect. Ni ohiriasant y prosiect yn San Steffan nac yn yr Alban. Cawsom y fantais o ystyried yr opsiynau sydd ar gael.

Cyfeiriodd Nick Bourne at y twll du. Cyfeiria at y gorffennol, ond rhaid imi gadw'r dyfodol mewn cof. Gallwn drafod yr hyn a ddigwyddodd o ran y ffigurau hyn, a chanfod atebion, ond rhaid imi edrych i'r dyfodol ac ystyried yr hyn a ddymunwn.

Dywedodd Cynog fod angen inni fod yn fwy gofalus wrth ddelio ag adeiladu adeiladau cyhoeddus. Caiff unrhyw wersi sydd i'w dysgu eu dysgu o hyn. Fel y Gweinidog sydd yn gyfrifol am y prosiect hwn, yr wyf yn barod i dderbyn fy nghyfrifoldeb, a dyna pam y deuthum yma heddiw. Gallwn fod wedi parhau, dod â'r contract i ben a symud ymlaen at y toriad. Dewisais beidio â gwneud hynny. Dewisais edrych ar yr holl ffeithiau a ffigurau sydd ar gael a dod ger eich bron yn y Siambr hon a bod yn onest gyda chi. Mae'n

who will embarrass us are those who bay on about whether we should have a Chamber. There is no embarrassment in saying that there is something wrong, and to stop, look, listen and learn. It would be appropriate if we could work out a solution.

Alison Halford raised many other issues, which we must consider—

**Cynog Dafis:** Deallaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwrthod gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr. Hoffwn glywed ei sylwadau ynglŷn â'r rheini. Cydymdeimlwn â'r rhesymau dros eu gwrthod. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gael sicrwydd, serch hynny, y bydd yr holl wybodaeth ariannol ac arall, sydd yn ymwneud â'r prosiect, ar gael i'r Cynulliad, er mwyn iddo allu penderfynu'n gyfrifol a synhwyrol ar sail yr wybodaeth honno, pan fo angen penderfyniad yn yr hydref. A gaf i'r sicrwydd hwnnw?

**Edwina Hart:** I will give the necessary assurance, Cynog, as long as it does not jeopardise the future in terms of commercial sensitivity. I am happy to ensure that all information, which can go into the public domain, is made available as soon as possible. I assure you of that, because transparency is the key with these issues. We must be mindful about the future in terms of delivering this project.

I listened with interest to your comments, Lorraine, about the idea of mediation. I will consider that. However, I turn to the amendments. I reject your amendment 1, William, because the Assembly previously decided to proceed with the project, therefore, the amendment is premature at this stage. I am pleased to accept Mike German's amendment 2 and Jocelyn Davies's amendment 3, because they provide a way forward and give us the necessary accountability in the autumn, when we return to discuss these issues in detail. I reject William Graham's other amendments. I must reject them, not because I am not prepared to provide information, but because it is not appropriate, at this stage, for me to give information in this area. As soon as I can, I will give all the necessary facts. I have no

fyd creulon y tu allan, ond yr unig bobl a fydd yn peri embaras inni fydd y rheini sydd yn rhygnu ymlaen ynglŷn ag a ddylem gael Siambr. Nid oes unrhyw embaras yn gysylltiedig â dweud bod rhywbeth yn bod, ac atal pethau, edrych, gwrando a dysgu. Byddai'n briodol pe gallem ddod o hyd i ateb.

Cododd Alison Halford nifer o faterion eraill, y mae'n rhaid inni eu hystyried—

**Cynog Dafis:** I understand that the Minister will reject the Conservatives' amendments. I would like to hear her comments on those. We sympathise with the reasons for rejecting them. However, we would like assurance, despite that, that all the financial and other information relating to this project will be available to the Assembly so that it can responsibly and sensibly decide on the basis of that information, when a decision must be made in the autumn. May I have that assurance?

**Edwina Hart:** Rhoddaf y sicrwydd angenrheidiol, Cynog, ar yr amod nad yw'n peryglu'r dyfodol o ran sensitifrwydd masnachol. Yr wyf yn fodlon sicrhau bod yr holl wybodaeth, a all gael ei rhyddhau i'r cyhoedd, ar gael cyn gynted â phosibl. Fe'ch sicrhaf o hynny, gan fod tryloywder yn allweddol o ran y materion hyn. Rhaid inni ystyried y dyfodol o ran cyflwyno'r prosiect hwn.

Gwrandawais â diddordeb ar eich sylwadau, Lorraine, ynglŷn â'r syniad o gyfryngu. Ystyriaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, trof at y gwelliannau. Gwrthodaf eich gwelliant 1, William, gan i'r Cynulliad benderfynu yn flaenorol parhau â'r prosiect, felly, mae'r gwelliant yn gynamserol ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn gwelliant 2 Mike German a gwelliant 3 Jocelyn Davies, gan eu bod yn darparu ffordd ymlaen a rhoi'r atebolrwydd angenrheidiol inni yn yr hydref, pan ddychwelwn i drafod y materion hyn yn fanwl. Gwrthodaf welliannau eraill William Graham. Rhaid imi eu gwrthod, nid am nad wyf yn barod i ddarparu gwybodaeth, ond am nad yw'n briodol, ar hyn o bryd, imi roi gwybodaeth yn y maes hwn. Cyn gynted ag y gallaf, rhoddaf yr holl ffeithiau angenrheidiol. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw

doubt that the NAO and the Audit Committee will deal with all these facts and write reports on them.

It is difficult, when I feel so passionately about democracy and having a new Assembly Chamber to stand up and say this today. It is not easy, because I thought that I had done everything properly. I took advice. I considered that advice and decided to proceed. In some ways, I feel hurt that things have not panned out in the way I wanted. However, I am a politician and I chose to enter this game. I am a Minister, and I have to take responsibility. It was important to discuss this today and it is not an easy decision for the Assembly to make.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I will be brief. I understand the difficult position in which you have been placed this afternoon as Minister, but I implore you to apologise on behalf of the administration to the people of Wales for the mistakes that have been made. I am sure that they have been made by the administration and not just by Lord Rogers's partnership. If an apology is not forthcoming, the people of Wales will be able to see this Government's arrogant approach—*[Interruption.]*

**Peter Law:** Is hypocrisy now in order, Llywydd?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Hypocrisy is not in order. I have already ruled on that.

**Edwina Hart:** I have always tried not to be arrogant in my dealings with people generally, in the Assembly and in my constituency. This is not arrogance; I am stating the facts. I have to be the Assembly's physician on commercially-sensitive information in terms of what actions we take in the future, and what decisions we are likely to make. It would be wrong of me to apologise for something like that, if I did not think that, ultimately, I had anything to apologise for. I will accept my responsibility in this matter and the Assembly's judgment, when all the facts are available. However, it was important to have a proper debate on the future of the building.

amheuaeth y bydd y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol a'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn delio â'r holl ffeithiau hyn ac yn ysgrifennu adroddiadau arnynt.

Mae'n anodd, pan deimlaf mor gryf dros ddemocratiaeth a chael Siambr newydd i'r Cynulliad i sefyll ar fy nhraed a dweud hyn heddiw. Nid yw'n hawdd, oherwydd credais fy mod wedi gwneud popeth yn iawn. Cymerais gyngor. Ystyriais y cyngor hwnnw a phenderfynais barhau. Ar rai agweddau, teimlaf i'r byw na ddatblygodd pethau fel y dymunais. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn wleidydd a dewisais ymuno â'r byd hwn. Yr wyf yn Weinidog, a rhaid imi gymryd cyfrifoldeb. Yr oedd yn bwysig trafod hyn heddiw ac nid yw'n benderfyniad hawdd i'r Cynulliad ei wneud.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Byddaf yn gryno. Deallaf y sefyllfa anodd y'ch rhoddwyd chi ynnddi y prynhawn yma fel Gweinidog, ond ymbiliaf arnoch i ymddiheuro i bobl Cymru ar ran y weinyddiaeth am y camgymeriadau a wnaethpwyd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y'u gwnaethpwyd gan y weinyddiaeth ac nid dim ond gan bartneriaeth yr Arglwydd Rogers. Os na fydd ymddiheuriad, gall pobl Cymru weld ymagwedd drahaus y Llywodraeth hon—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Peter Law:** A yw rhagrith bellach mewn trefn, Lywydd?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw rhagrith mewn trefn. Dyfarnais eisoes ar hynny.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf bob amser wedi ceisio peidio â bod yn drahaus wrth ddelio â phobl yn gyffredinol, yn y Cynulliad ac yn fy etholaeth. Nid agwedd drahaus yw hyn; nodi'r ffeithiau a wnaethpwyd. Rhaid imi fod yn feddyg y Cynulliad ar wybodaeth sydd yn fasnachol sensitif o ran pa gamau a gymerwn yn y dyfodol, a pha benderfyniadau yr ydym yn debygol o'u gwneud. Byddai'n anghywir imi ymddiheuro am rywbeth felly, pe na chredwn yn y pen draw, fod gennyf unrhyw beth i ymddiheuro amdano. Derbyniaf fy nghyfrifoldeb am y mater hwn a dyfarniad y Cynulliad, pan fydd yr holl ffeithiau ar gael. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yn bwysig cael dadl wirioneddol ar ddyfodol yr adeilad.



I thank the majority of Members for how this debate has been conducted. It is difficult for all of us to believe that devolution is here, but it is sad that one party clearly does not and continues to make the new Assembly Chamber a scapegoat rather than discuss its future, which is the real issue.

Diolchaf i'r mwyafrif o'r Aelodau am y modd y cynhaliwyd y ddadl hon. Mae'n anodd i unrhyw un ohonom gredu bod datganoli yma, ond mae'n drist nad yw un blaid yn amlwg yn credu hynny ac yn parhau i wneud Siambr newydd y Cynulliad yn fwch dihangol yn hytrach na thrafod ei dyfodol, sef y mater o bwys.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42*  
*Amendment 1: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 42*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 42, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0*  
*Amendment 2: For 42, Abstain 9, Against 0*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Amendment 3 is **Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd gwelliant 3 yn ôl.  
withdrawn.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 40*  
*Amendment 4: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 40*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41*  
*Amendment 5: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 41*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary

Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 41  
Amendment 6: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 41*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42  
 Amendment 7: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 42*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet

Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42  
 Amendment 8: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 42*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Richards, Rod  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:  
Amended motion:

*the National Assembly, further to its resolution of 21 June 2000, resolves:*

*to seek competitive tenders for the completion of the Assembly building based on the design prepared by the Richard Rogers Partnership and either lease it to the Assembly or sell it for an agreed lump sum; and pending acceptance of such a tender, to suspend works on the building.*

*to instruct the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to bring forward, following receipt and consideration of tenders, a recommendation as to whether the project should proceed and, if so, on what basis.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ymhellach at ei benderfyniad ar 21 Mehefin 2000, yn penderfynu:*

*ceisio tendrau cystadleuol i gwblhau adeilad y Cynulliad, wedi ei seilio ar y dyluniad a baratowyd gan Bartneriaeth Richard Rogers, ac un ai ei brydlesu i'r Cynulliad neu ei werthu am un swm y cytunwyd arno; a gohirio gwaith ar yr adeilad nes i'r fath dendr gael ei dderbyn;*

*ar ôl i'r tendrau ddod i law ac ar ôl eu hystyried, cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau i argymhell p'un a ddylai'r prosiect barhau, ac os felly, ar ba sail.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 43 , Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 8  
Amended motion: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 8*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Richards, Rod  
Rogers, Peter

Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein **The Presiding Officer:** That is the end of  
gweithgareddau cynhyrfus am heddiw. our exciting proceedings for today.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.19 p.m.  
The session ended at 6.19 p.m.*