



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 17 Mai 2006  
Wednesday, 17 May 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 4 Atal Rheolau Sefydlog  
Suspension of Standing Orders
- 7 Sefydlu Comisiwn Cysgodol  
The Establishment of a Shadow Commission
- 8 Ethol Aelodau i'r Comisiwn Cysgodol  
Election of Members to the Shadow Commission
- 9 Sefydlu Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog  
The Establishment of a Committee on Standing Orders
- 14 Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog  
Election of Members to the Committee on Standing Orders
- 15 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 33 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon  
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport
- 47 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ  
Questions to the House Committee
- 51 Cwestiwn Brys: Colli Swyddi (Vauxhall, Ellesmere Port)  
Urgent Question: Job Losses (Vauxhall, Ellesmere Port)
- 56 Ceisio Cytundeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi  
Bodloni Gofynion Cynnig Gwenda Thomas o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 a  
Drafodwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Tachwedd 2005  
The Seeking of the National Assembly's agreement that the Welsh Assembly  
Government has Satisfied the Requirements of the Standing Order No. 31 Proposal  
by Gwenda Thomas that was debated in Plenary on 23 November 2005
- 61 Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i'r Prif Grwpiau Gwariant  
Approval of Changes to Main Expenditure Groups
- 76 Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu  
The Manufacturing Industry
- 98 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 99 Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu: Parhad  
The Manufacturing Industry: Continued
- 117 Estyn—Adroddiad Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant  
Estyn—the Report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training
- 121 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion

- 122 Estyn—Adroddiad Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant: Parhad  
Estyn—the Report of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training:  
Continued

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o’r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Orders Nos. 37.5 and 37.6:*

*1. suspends Standing Order 6.13, and that part of Standing Order No. 5.4 that requires the weekly business statement to constitute the agreed timetable for Assembly business, to allow NNDM3046 and NNDM3047—relating to the establishment and election of the Shadow Commission—to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 17 May 2006; and*

*2. suspends Standing Order No. 6.14 to allow any amendments in relation to NNDM3046, tabled before 11 a.m. on Wednesday 17 May, to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 17 May 2006. (NDM3048)*

**John Marek:** I will speak against this motion as an Assembly Members rather than as Deputy Presiding Officer.

The Chair of the House Committee knew nothing about this motion, that there should be a Shadow Commission, until it was tabled yesterday afternoon. The House Committee is meeting tomorrow, but it officially knows nothing about this motion until it is presented tomorrow. I contend that there ought to be proper consultation. I am not against the motion, as such—there ought to be a Shadow Commission; should the Government of Wales Bill be carried there are changes that will necessarily have to be made to our procedures. However, I insist on proper consultation. I am at a loss to understand why the Business Minister should table a motion like this without consulting the Chair of the House Committee, or the House Committee itself, formally. I do not understand it, although I have a reason for it, which I may

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 37.5 a 37.6:*

*1. yn gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 a'r rhan honno o Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4 sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol mai'r datganiad busnes wythnosol yw'r amserlen gytûn ar gyfer busnes y Cynulliad, i ganiatáu i NNDM3046 ac NNDM3047—sy'n ymwneud â sefydlu ac ethol y Comisiwn Cysgodol—gael eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 17 Mai 2006; a*

*2. yn gohirio Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.14 i ganiatáu i unrhyw welliannau mewn perthynas ag NNDM3046, a gyflwynwyd cyn 11 a.m. ddydd Mercher 17 Mai, gael eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 17 Mai 2006. (NDM3048)*

**John Marek:** Byddaf yn siarad yn erbyn y cynnig hwn fel Aelod Cynulliad yn hytrach nag fel Dirprwy Lywydd.

Ni wyddai Cadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ ddim am y cynnig hwn, sef y dylid cael Comisiwn Cysgodol, nes iddo gael ei gyflwyno brynhawn ddoe. Mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn cyfarfod yfory, ond ni wŷr ddim am y cynnig hwn yn swyddogol nes caiff ei gyflwyno yfory. Yr wyf yn dadlau y dylid cael ymgynghori priodol. Nid wyf yn erbyn y cynnig, fel y cyfryw—dylid cael Comisiwn Cysgodol; os bydd Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei dderbyn bydd yn rhaid gwneud rhai newidiadau yn ein gweithdrefnau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn mynnu cael ymgynghori priodol. Ni allaf ddeall pam y byddai'r Trefnydd yn cyflwyno cynnig fel hwn heb ymgynghori â Chadeirydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ, neu Bwyllgor y Tŷ ei hun, yn ffurfiol. Nid wyf yn ei ddeall, er bod gennyf reswm drosto, a hwyrach y

give later.

I believe that the House Committee should be involved. There ought to be some involvement about the relationship that should exist between the Shadow Commission and the House Committee.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I hate to interrupt my present colleague, but this is not a substantive debate on a motion; it is about the suspension of Standing Orders. If you catch my eye later on a substantive motion, you may deploy those arguments at that time.

**John Marek:** I understand what you say and will pay attention to it. I have no intention of speaking on the substantive motion; I am merely arguing why we should not suspend Standing Orders to consider weighty matters that should be properly considered, rather than tabled under a no named day motion where Standing Orders have to be suspended. I think that these matters are weighty and the House Committee ought to have been consulted. That means that we ought not to be suspending Standing Orders. That is the thrust of my argument.

I do not want to take a long time over this, but I want it on the record. I am not against this motion, but there ought to have been proper consultation. I urge the Assembly not to support this motion to suspend Standing Orders, but to enter into a proper process. A motion could then be taken as a normal, named day motion once consultation has taken place. Instead, we have this action by the Business Minister on her own account, without reference to any of the other authorities of the National Assembly.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This motion is not on the Business Minister's own account. I have agreed to this motion as being in order, and I have given my consent for it to appear on the agenda.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** As you say, this motion has been agreed through the appropriate channels in the Business Committee.

rhoddaf hwnnw'n ddiweddarach.

Credaf y dylai Pwyllgor y Tŷ gael ei gynnwys. Dylid sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gynnwys o ran y berthynas a ddylai fodoli rhwng y Comisiwn Cysgodol a Phwyllgor y Tŷ.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar draws fy nghyd-Aelod, ond nid dadl wirioneddol ar gynnig yw hon; mae a wnelo ag atal Rheolau Sefydlog. Os byddwch yn dal fy sylw yn nes ymlaen ar gynnig gwreiddiol, gallwch ddefnyddio'r dadleuon hynny bryd hynny.

**John Marek:** Deallaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, a byddaf yn rhoi sylw i hynny. Nid yw'n fwriad o gwbl gennyf siarad am y cynnig gwreiddiol; dim ond dadlau pam na ddylem atal Rheolau Sefydlog i ystyried materion pwysig y dylid eu hystyried yn briodol, yn hytrach na'u cyflwyno o dan gynnig heb ddyddiad trafod llw y mae'n rhaid atal Rheolau Sefydlog. Credaf fod y materion hyn yn bwysig ac y dylid bod wedi ymgynghori â Phwyllgor y Tŷ. Golyga hynny na ddylem fod yn atal Rheolau Sefydlog. Dyna yw byrddwn fy nabl.

Nid wyf am dreulio gormod o amser ar hyn, ond yr wyf am sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gofnodi. Nid wyf yn erbyn y cynnig hwn, ond dylid bod wedi cynnal ymgynghoriad priodol. Anogaf y Cynulliad i beidio â chefnogi'r cynnig hwn i atal Rheolau Sefydlog, ond i ddilyn proses briodol. Yna gellid cyflwyno cynnig fel cynnig arferol gyda dyddiad trafod cyn gynted ag y bydd yr ymgynghori wedi digwydd. Yn lle hynny, mae'r Trefnydd yn gweithredu ohoni ei hun, heb gyfeirio at unrhyw un o awdurdodau eraill y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid y Trefnydd sy'n gyfrifol am y cynnig hwn. Yr wyf wedi cytuno bod y cynnig hwn mewn trefn, ac yr wyf wedi caniatáu iddo ymddangos ar yr agenda.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Fel y dywedwch, cytunwyd ar y cynnig hwn drwy'r sianeli priodol yn y Pwyllgor Busnes.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes siaradwyr eraill. Mae angen mwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid y cynnig er mwyn ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no other speakers. This motion will require a two-thirds majority vote in favour for it to be carried.

*Cynnig (NDM3048): O blaid 45, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 1.*

*Motion (NDM3048): For 45, Abstain 1, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Thomas, Owen John

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelod canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Member voted against:

Marek, John

## Sefydlu Comisiwn Cysgodol The Establishment of a Shadow Commission

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.1, resolves:* *Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, yn penderfynu:*

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <p>1. <i>to establish a committee to plan for the matters within the responsibility of the future Assembly Commission as set out in clause 27 of the Government of Wales Bill;</i></p> <p>2. <i>that the title of the committee shall be the Shadow Commission;</i></p> <p>3. <i>that membership of the Shadow Commission shall comprise one Assembly Member from the Labour Party, one from Plaid Cymru, one from the Welsh Conservative Party and one from the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party and the Presiding Officer who shall chair the committee;</i></p> <p>4. <i>that the terms of reference of the shadow commission shall be to plan for the matters within the responsibility of the Assembly Commission;</i></p> <p>5. <i>that the committee shall cease to exist on 2 May 2007. (NNDM3046)</i></p> | <p>1. <i>sefydlu pwyllgor i gynllunio ar gyfer y materion a ddaw dan gyfrifoldeb y darpar Gomisiwn y Cynulliad, yn unol â'r hyn a bennir yng Nghymal 27 Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru;</i></p> <p>2. <i>mai teitl y pwyllgor fydd y Comisiwn Cysgodol.</i></p> <p>3. <i>y bydd aelodau'r Comisiwn Cysgodol yn cynnwys un Aelod Cynulliad o'r Blaid Lafur, un o Blaid Cymru, un o Blaid Ceidwadwyr Cymru ac un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru a'r Llywydd a fydd yn cadeirio'r pwyllgor;</i></p> <p>4. <i>mai cylch gorchwyl y Comisiwn Cysgodol fydd cynllunio ar gyfer y materion a ddaw dan gyfrifoldeb y darpar Gomisiwn y Cynulliad;</i></p> <p>5. <i>y bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod ar 2 Mai 2007. (NNDM3046)</i></p> |
|--|---|

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes siaradwyr ar y cynnig hwn, felly awn yn syth at bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no speakers on this motion, so we will move to the vote.

*Cynnig (NNDM3046): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NNDM3046): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Ethol Aelodau i'r Comisiwn Cysgodol Election of Members to the Shadow Commission**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
 propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following Members to its Shadow Commission:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i'w Gomisiwn Cysgodol:*

*Dafydd Elis-Thomas (Presiding Officer), Lorraine Barrett (Labour), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), William Graham (Conservative), Peter Black (Liberal Democrat), and elects the Presiding Officer to be the Chair of the Shadow Commission. (NNDM3047)*

*Dafydd Elis-Thomas (y Llywydd), Lorraine Barrett (y Blaid Lafur), Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru), William Graham (y Blaid Geidwadol), Peter Black (y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol), ac yn ethol y Llywydd i gadeirio'r Comisiwn Cysgodol. (NNDM3047)*

*Cynnig (NNDM3047): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NNDM3047): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:



The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Sefydlu Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog The Establishment of a Committee on Standing Orders**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I Y Trefnydd (**Jane Hutt**): Cynigiaf fod propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, in Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â  
accordance with Standing Order No. 8.1, Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1, yn penderfynu:  
resolves:*

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>1. to establish an advisory committee to recommend Standing Orders for the Assembly constituted under the Government of Wales Bill;</p> <p>2. that the title of the committee shall be the Committee on Standing Orders;</p> <p>3. that membership of the committee shall comprise seven Assembly Members: four from the Labour Party, one from Plaid Cymru, one from the Welsh Conservative Party and one from the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party, who shall chair the committee;</p> <p>4. that the terms of reference for the Committee on Standing Orders shall be to:</p> <p>a) make every effort to recommend new Standing Orders that are capable of securing a two-thirds majority approval by Plenary;</p> <p>b) prepare a report that shall set out proposed new Standing Orders for consideration by Plenary.</p> <p>5. that the committee shall report on or before 31 January 2007. The committee shall cease to exist on 1 March 2007. (NDM3044)</p> | <p>1. sefydlu pwyllgor cynghorol i argymhell Rheolau Sefydlog ar gyfer y Cynulliad o dan Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru;</p> <p>2. mai teitl y pwyllgor fydd y Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog;</p> <p>3. y bydd saith Aelod Cynulliad yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor: pedwar o'r Blaid Lafur, un o Blaid Cymru, un o Blaid Ceidwadwyr Cymru ac un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, a fydd yn cadeirio'r pwyllgor;</p> <p>4. mai cylch gorchwyl y Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog fydd:</p> <p>a) gwneud pob ymdrech i argymhell Rheolau Sefydlog newydd a fydd yn sicrhau cymeradwyaeth mwyafrif o ddau draean yn y Cyfarfod Llawn;</p> <p>b) paratoi adroddiad a fydd yn amlinellu Rheolau Sefydlog newydd arfaethedig i'w hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.</p> <p>5. y bydd y pwyllgor yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar 31 Ionawr 2007 neu cyn hynny. Bydd y pwyllgor yn dod i ben ar 1 Mawrth 2007. (NDM3044)</p> |
|---|--|

**John Marek:** Again, I speak as an Assembly Member and not as Deputy Presiding Officer on this motion. I wish to put on record that I can tell you categorically that the Deputy Presiding Officer had no knowledge of this motion, was not consulted upon it, and had no influence over what it says. I would have thought, under Standing Orders, that certainly the officers of the house—that is, the Presiding Officer and the Deputy Presiding Officer—would have been acknowledged to have more knowledge of Standing Orders than the ordinary Assembly Member. I certainly know that the Deputy Presiding Officer has spent his time for the past six years interpreting and refining Standing Orders, and seeing how they can be framed expeditiously so that Government business is expedited while scrutiny of that business is effective and thorough. Therefore, I am mystified as to why it is not proposed that the Deputy Presiding Officer or the Presiding

**John Marek:** Eto, siaradaf fel Aelod Cynulliad, nid fel Dirprwy Lywydd, ar y cynnig hwn. Hoffwn gofnodi y gallaf ddweud wrthyach yn bendant nad oedd y Dirprwy Lywydd yn gwybod dim am y cynnig hwn, nid ymgynghorwyd ag ef yn ei gylch, ac nid oedd ganddo unrhyw ddylanwad ar ei gynnwys. Byddwn wedi meddwl, o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, y byddid wedi cydnabod bod gan swyddogion y tŷ—hynny yw, y Llywydd a'r Dirprwy Lywydd—fwy o wybodaeth am Reolau Sefydlog nag Aelod Cynulliad arferol. Gwn yn sicr fod y Dirprwy Lywydd wedi treulio ei amser yn y chwe blynedd diwethaf yn dehongli ac yn mireinio Rheolau Sefydlog, ac yn ymchwilio sut y gellir eu llunio'n gyflym fel y gellir cyflymu busnes y Llywodraeth tra bydd y gwaith o graffu ar y busnes hwnnw'n effeithiol ac yn drwyadl. Felly, ni allaf ddeall pam na chynigir y dylai'r Dirprwy Lywydd neu'r Llywydd fod ar y pwyllgor.

Officer be on the committee.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I wish that you would not include me in these points of argument. I am perfectly aware of everything that goes on in this place.

**John Marek:** Yes, of course. I shall not refer to you again, but what I have said is on the record. I am also aware of the arguments that go on in this place.

The Deputy Presiding Officer knew nothing about it until this motion appeared on the net. Indeed, it is strange that we have the Business Minister tabling a motion excluding people who could have contributed to the intrinsic workings of this committee. I do not mean just by presenting evidence or whatever, but by being involved in the discussion to be able to fashion the Standing Orders properly. I can only conclude that the Government is fixing the agenda again. [*Interruption.*] Yes. Hear, hear, Carl. We see in the Government of Wales Bill that the Secretary of State for Wales is not—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry to call my esteemed colleague to order, but this is not a debate about a Bill that is presently, I believe—though I have not got there yet—before the House of Lords at Westminster; this is a debate about an intention to establish a committee on Standing Orders, which is a matter for the Assembly.

**John Marek:** I agree with that. However, with respect, the Bill does lay down certain restrictions so that if we do not have a set of Standing Orders, the Secretary of State for Wales will write a set for us. I merely make the comment in passing that that clearly was a Labour Party fix. The second fix is that the Labour Party has decided not to appoint the Deputy Presiding Officer to any part in this committee. I have to say this on record: it is a great pity that personal antagonisms take precedence over the wellbeing of the Assembly. Yes, Huw Lewis can laugh, but I want this on record, and I want it understood exactly what the Labour Party has been doing as far as the establishment of this committee is concerned.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddai'n well gennyf pe na baech yn fy nghynnwys i yn y pwyntiau hyn yn y ddadl. Yr wyf yn hollol ymwybodol o bopeth sy'n digwydd yn y lle hwn.

**John Marek:** Wrth gwrs. Ni chyfeiriaf atoch eto, ond mae'r hyn a ddywedais wedi'i gofnodi. Yr wyf fi hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r dadleuon yma.

Ni wyddai'r Dirprwy Lywydd ddim am hyn nes i'r cynnig ymddangos ar y we. Yn wir, mae'n rhyfedd fod gennym Drefnydd sy'n cyflwyno cynnig nad yw'n cynnwys pobl a allai fod wedi cyfrannu at waith priodol y pwyllgor hwn. Nid wyf yn golygu drwy gyflwyno tystiolaeth neu beth bynnag, ond drwy fod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth er mwyn gallu llunio'r Rheolau Sefydlog yn gywir. Ni allaf ond dod i'r casgliad bod y Llywodraeth unwaith eto yn trefnu'r agenda er ei budd ei hun. [*Torri ar draws.*] Ie. Clywch, clywch, Carl. Gwelwn ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru nad yw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf alw fy nghyd-Aelod uchel ei barch i drefn, ond nid dadl yw hon am Fesur sydd, mi gredaf—er nad wyf wedi cyrraedd yno eto—gerbron Tŷ'r Arglwyddi yn San Steffan ar hyn o bryd; dadl yw hon am y bwriad i sefydlu pwyllgor ar Reolau Sefydlog, sy'n fater i'r Cynulliad.

**John Marek:** Cytunaf â hynny. Fodd bynnag, gyda phob parch, mae'r Mesur yn gosod rhai cyfyngiadau sy'n dweud, os na fydd gennym gyfres o Reolau Sefydlog, y bydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ysgrifennu cyfres i ni. Dim ond sôn wrth fynd heibio yr wyf fi fod hyn wedi ei drefnu er budd y Blaid Lafur. Yr ail achos o hyn yw bod y Blaid Lafur wedi penderfynu peidio â phenodi'r Dirprwy Lywydd ar gyfer unrhyw ran yn y pwyllgor hwn. Mae'n rhaid i mi gofnodi hyn: mae'n drueni mawr fod gwrthwynebiaethau personol yn cael blaenoriaeth dros les y Cynulliad. Ie, gall Hugh Lewis chwerthin, ond yr wyf am gofnodi hyn, ac yr wyf am i bawb ddeall yn union beth mae'r Blaid Lafur wedi bod yn ei wneud o ran sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn.

We already have a new Bill that gives functions to Ministers, which means that Ministers will not be answerable to Plenary. Plenary will not be supreme as it presently is; it will have functions to pass new legislation, but it will not be supreme.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are coming close to holding a Second Reading debate on the Bill, which I seem to have heard before.

**John Marek:** I will always accede to your requests. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Let me finish what I was saying. If this motion is passed and this committee, rigged by the Government, produces Standing Order that do not allow for full and effective scrutiny, the Welsh people will be cheated by the Labour Party in exercising its cronyism and fixing, as it is doing this afternoon. I urge Members to vote against this motion.

2.10 p.m.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** It is unfortunate that I have to stand up and refute virtually all that has been said, because John Marek has made a considerable contribution to the National Assembly for Wales, and it is disappointing that he should make this undermining allegation, which I refute. There is one Office of the Presiding Officer in the National Assembly, and it is important that we recognise that. This committee, as the Assembly and my colleagues across the parties know, has a considerable task ahead of it and we have had considerable discussions about how we can, together, in the best sense of the collaboration that we have built up in the Assembly, take forward this important task. I am delighted that this committee will be chaired by Jenny Randerson and that we have a full representation of people with the experience and commitment to ensure that, as and when the Government of Wales Bill proceeds through the House of the Lords and goes on the statute book, we will have a robust set of Standing Orders to take us forward post May 2007. In that spirit of goodwill and

Mae gennym Fesur newydd eisoes sy'n rhoi swyddogaethau i Weinidogion, sy'n golygu na fydd y Gweinidogion yn atebol i'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Nid y Cyfarfod Llawn fydd uchaf, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd; bydd ganddo swyddogaethau i basio deddfwriaeth newydd, ond ni fydd yn uchaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydym ar fin cynnal dadl Ail Ddarlleniad ar y Mesur, a chredaf imi glywed hynny o'r blaen.

**John Marek:** Byddaf bob amser yn cytuno â'ch ceisiadau. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Gadewch imi orffen yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud. Os caiff y cynnig hwn ei dderbyn, ac os bydd y pwyllgor hwn, sydd wedi'i drefnu er budd y Llywodraeth, yn llunio Rheolau Sefydlog nad ydynt yn caniatáu craffu effeithiol a llawn, caiff pobl Cymru eu twyllo gan y Blaid Lafur wrth ddangos ffafriaeth a threfnu pethau er ei lles ei hun, yn union fel y mae'n ei wneud y prynhawn yma. Anogaf yr aelodau i bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig hwn.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'n anffodus fod yn rhaid imi sefyll a gwrthbrofi bron popeth a ddywedwyd, gan fod John Marek wedi gwneud cyfraniad sylweddol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac mae'n siomedig ei fod yn gwneud yr honiad anffafriol hwn, ac yr wyf yn ei wrthod. Un swydd Llywydd sydd yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod hynny. Mae gan y pwyllgor hwn, fel y gŵyr y Cynulliad a'm cyd-Aelodau ym mhob plaid, dasg anferthol o'i flaen a chawsom drafodaethau helaeth am y ffordd y gallwn gyflawni'r dasg bwysig hon gyda'n gilydd, drwy gydweithredu fel y gwnawn yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn falch iawn fod y pwyllgor hwn i gael ei gadeirio gan Jenny Randerson a bod gennym gynrychiolaeth lawn o bobl sydd â'r profiad a'r ymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd gennym gyfres gadarn o Reolau Sefydlog ar ôl Mai 2007, pan fydd Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei roi gerbron Tŷ'r Arglwyddi ac yn dod yn gyfraith gwlad. Yn yr ysbryd hwnnw o ewyllys da ac ymrwymiad, dylem symud ymlaen a phleidleisio ar y cynnig hwn.

commitment, we should move forward and vote on this motion.

**Y Llywydd:** Gwelaf nad oes neb arall am gyfrannu i'r ddadl ddiddorol hon, felly galwaf bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** I see that no-one else wishes to contribute to this interesting debate, therefore, I will call for a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3044): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion (NDM3044): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Marek, John

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog**  
**Election of Members to the Committee on Standing Orders**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
 propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following Members to the Committee on Standing Orders:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i'r Pwyllgor ar y Rheolau Sefydlog:*

*Jane Hutt (Labour), Ann Jones (Labour), Val Lloyd (Labour), Gwenda Thomas (Labour), Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru), Lisa Francis (Conservative), Jenny Randerson (Liberal Democrat), and elects Jenny Randerson to be the Chair of the committee. (NDM3045)*

*Jane Hutt (y Blaid Lafur), Ann Jones (y Blaid Lafur), Val Lloyd (y Blaid Lafur), Gwenda Thomas (y Blaid Lafur), Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru), Lisa Francis (y Blaid Geidwadol), Jenny Randerson (y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol), ac yn ethol Jenny Randerson i gadeirio'r Pwyllgor. (NDM3045)*

*Cynnig (NDM3045): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*  
*Motion (NDM3045): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Diddymu Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus The Abolition of Smoking in Public Places**

**C1 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd gyda diddymu ysmygu mewn manau cyhoeddus? OAQ0806(HSS)

**Q1 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister give a progress report on the abolition of smoking in public places? OAQ0806(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** We are making good progress with our preparations for a ban on smoking in enclosed public places. We will be issuing draft regulations in Wales once the Health Bill has received Royal Assent. We aim to get the ban in force by summer 2007, but we must ensure that all the necessary arrangements are in place before then.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd da gyda'n paratodau ar gyfer gwahardd ysmygu mewn manau cyhoeddus caeedig. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi rheoliadau drafft yng Nghymru cyn gynted ag y bydd y Mesur Iechyd wedi cael y Cydsyniad Brenhinol. Ein nod yw rhoi'r gwaharddiad ar waith erbyn yr haf 2007, ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod yr holl drefniadau angenrheidiol ar waith cyn hynny.

**David Lloyd:** Mae 400 o bobl yng Nghymru yn marw o sgîl-efeithiau anadlu mwg rhywun arall bob blwyddyn, ac mae profiad Iwerddon yn datgelu mai'r gwanwyn yw'r amser gorau i ddechrau gwaharddiad. Dyna pam daeth y gwaharddiad i rym yn Iwerddon ym Mawrth 2004, a pham daeth y gwaharddiad yn yr Alban i rym ym Mawrth eleni. Gan gofio hynny, beth yw'r siawns o weld y gwaharddiad yng Nghymru yn dod i rym ym Mawrth 2007?

**David Lloyd:** Four hundred people in Wales die every year from the side-effects of inhaling someone else's smoke, and the experience in Ireland reveals that the best time to start a ban is in the spring. That is why the ban came into force in Ireland in March 2004, and why the ban in Scotland came into force in March this year. Given that, what chance is there of the ban in Wales coming into force in March 2007?

**Brian Gibbons:** Given the democratic scrutiny procedures and the proper

**Brian Gibbons:** O ystyried y gweithdrefnau craffu democrataidd a'r gofynion priodol ar

requirements for legal notice and so forth, it would be difficult to get the necessary consultation and implement due process within the timescale that you ask for. I would not be averse to trying to achieve that timetable if possible, but there are legal and due process constraints that may not allow that to happen. We would not want to start the ban if there were a question about whether due process had been adhered to, because that would distract from its effective implementation. However, I hear what you say, and I am not opposed to the sentiment expressed.

gyfer hysbysiad cyfreithiol ac ati, byddai'n anodd trefnu'r ymgynghori angenrheidiol a rhoi'r broses briodol ar waith o fewn yr amserlen yr ydych yn gofyn amdani. Ni fyddwn yn gwrthwynebu ceisio cyflawni hynny o fewn yr amserlen honno os yw'n bosibl, ond mae cyfyngiadau cyfreithiol a phroses briodol na fyddant efallai yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd. Ni fyddem am gychwyn y gwaharddiad pe bai amheuaeth a fyddai'r broses briodol wedi cael ei dilyn, goherwydd byddai hynny'n tynnu oddi wrth y gwaith o'i gweithredu'n effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddeall yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, ac nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r farn a fynegwyd.

### **Addysgu Dwyieithog yn Ysgol Nyrsio Coleg y Brifysgol Bangor Bilingual Teaching in the University College Bangor School of Nursing**

**C2 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cymorth ariannol a gynigir ar gyfer addysgu dwyieithog yn ysgol nyrsio coleg y brifysgol, Bangor? OAQ0862(HSS)

**Q2 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the financial assistance provided for bilingual teaching at university college Bangor school of nursing? OAQ0862(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Welsh health programmes are negotiated with the five higher education providers following analysis of the workforce plans. The budget allocation identifies the additional cost of bilingual provision.

**Brian Gibbons:** Caiff rhaglenni iechyd Cymru eu negodi gyda'r pum darparwr addysg uwch ar ôl dadansoddi'r cynlluniau gweithlu. Mae'r gyllideb a ddyrennir yn nodi cost ychwanegol y ddarpariaeth ddwyieithog.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ar ymweliad diweddar â'r ysgol nyrsio, dysgais fod y gwaith a wneir ym Mangor yn arloesol ac yn torri tir newydd. Mae paratoi deunyddiau Cymraeg yn golygu costau ychwanegol, a'r honiad a wneir gan yr ysgol yw nad ydynt yn cael dim arian ychwanegol i dalu'r costau hynny. A wnewch chi, gyda'ch cyfeillion yn y Cabinet, edrych eto ar y ddarpariaeth hon sydd, fel y dywedais, yn arloesol ac yn torri tir newydd yng Nghymru?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** On a recent visit to the school of nursing, I learned that the work undertaken in Bangor is innovative and groundbreaking. Preparing Welsh-language material has additional cost implications, and the school claims that it does not receive additional funding to meet those costs. Will you, with your Cabinet colleagues, revisit this provision, which, as I say, is innovative and breaking new ground in Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** I have heard what you have said, and the point that you make is worth listening to. As you have visited the school of nursing, you will be aware that a considerable amount of excellent work is taking place with undergraduate and postgraduate nursing students on the promotion of bilingualism. Something of the order of a quarter of the clinical teaching at the bedside takes place through the medium of Welsh where appropriate, and that is good. I heard what you said, and I will take that

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedwch, ac mae'r pwynt a wnewch yn haeddu sylw. Gan eich bod wedi ymweld â'r ysgol nyrsio, fe wyddoch fod llawer iawn o waith rhagorol yn cael ei wneud gyda myfyrwyr nyrsio israddedig ac ôl-raddedig ar hyrwyddo dwyieithrwydd. Caiff tua chwarter yr addysgu clinigol wrth ymyl y gwely ei wneud drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg lle mae'n briodol, ac mae hynny'n beth da. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedwch, a byddaf yn ei ystyried.



away.

**Mark Isherwood:** It is essential that people in north-west Wales are cared for by bilingual nurses. Logically, these nurses are best educated and recruited locally. How do you respond to concerns raised by newly qualified nurses within North West Wales NHS Trust when they were informed that no jobs were available?

**Brian Gibbons:** The health service's main priority is to deliver health services to patients in the local area, as you suggested, Mark, in a way that is sensitive to cultural needs and so forth. If that has to be done, extra nurses will need to be employed to deliver those services and achieve health service targets. However, each health service organisation must use its resources to deliver services to patients and to deliver financial balance. I am sure that you would agree that that can be a difficult task, but that must be the basis on which health service organisations operate.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'n hanfodol i bobl yn y gogledd-orllewin gael gofal gan nyrsys dwyieithog. Yn rhesymegol, addysgu a recriwtio'r nyrsys hyn yn lleol sydd orau. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i bryderon a godwyd gan nyrsys newydd gymhwyso yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd-orllewin Cymru pan ddywedwyd wrthynt nad oedd swyddi ar gael?

**Brian Gibbons:** Prif flaenoriaeth y gwasanaeth iechyd yw darparu gwasanaethau iechyd i gleifion yn yr ardal leol, fel yr awgrymoch, Mark, mewn ffordd sy'n diwallu anghenion diwylliannol, ac ati. Os oes yn rhaid gwneud hynny, bydd angen cyflogi mwy o nyrsys i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny a chyrraedd targedau'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i bob gwasanaeth iechyd ddefnyddio'i adnoddau i ddarparu gwasanaethau i gleifion a mantoli'r gyllideb. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno y gall hynny fod yn dasg anodd, ond rhaid i sefydliadau'r gwasanaeth iechyd seilio'u gweithrediadau ar hynny.

### **Dileu Swyddi yn y GIG NHS Staff Redundancies**

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** Will there be any NHS staff redundancies of any description in Wales as a result of financial deficits? OAQ0801(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** All NHS bodies must operate within their financial allocations and examine measures such as reducing reliance on agency staff and questioning the need to fill non-essential vacancies in order to balance their books and to deliver quality services for NHS patients in Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** You are clearly unaware of the fact that there are NHS trusts in Wales, the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust being one, which have been considering options that have included the reduction in the number of staff members. Some of the options considered by Cardiff and the Vale include a reduction of 152 whole-time equivalent posts. That was the least draconian measure; the most draconian was to freeze all vacancies with a view to possibly holding an

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** A fydd swyddi unrhyw aelod o staff y GIG yng Nghymru yn cael eu dileu o ganlyniad i ddiffygion ariannol? OAQ0801(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Rhaid i holl gyrff y GIG weithredu o fewn eu dyraniadau ariannol ac archwilio mesurau megis dibynnu'n llai ar staff asiantaeth a chwestiynu'r angen i lenwi swyddi gwag nad ydynt yn hanfodol er mwyn mantoli'r gyllideb a darparu gwasanaethau o safon i gleifion y GIG yng Nghymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn ymwybodol fod yna ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru, ac mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn un ohonynt, sydd wedi bod yn ystyried dewisiadau sydd wedi cynnwys lleihau niferoedd staff. Ymhlith rhai o'r dewisiadau a ystyriwyd gan Gaerdydd a'r Fro mae cwtogi 152 o swyddi amser cyflawn cyfatebol. Dyna oedd y cam lleiaf llym; y cam llymaf oedd rhewi pob swydd wag gyda'r bwriad o gynnal adolygiad

organisational review with compulsory redundancies. These papers are public. Surely, as Minister, you should be aware of the pressures faced by the trusts, which are now in the difficult situation of having to decide whether to invest in what you tell them to invest in, or to decide whether they are in a position to cut back on jobs. In a letter sent to me this week, you state that you are personally committed to ensuring that the NHS does not lose highly qualified staff. How committed are you, and does that commitment extend to your putting your job on the line too?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not quite follow the logical sequence in that question. However, the first priority, as I said to Mark, is that the health service delivers to meet the needs of patients, and does so within the context of the resources available to it. The key word in your assertion was 'options'. It is my understanding that the options have not been brought forward as concrete proposals. You will know as well as I do that when organisations are looking at challenges, they will undertake an appraisal of a wide range of options. Obviously, a large number of those options will be rejected as inappropriate to the task. This is the challenge facing Cardiff and the Vale. It is making good progress in addressing this by ensuring that its workforce planning is better in line, particularly in nursing—for example, the reliance on agency nursing in recent years has been cut almost by a half. That creative use of those types of options is more likely to deliver benefits for patients than some of the options that you are suggesting.

2.20 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** The Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust has been creative in recent years, as, I am sure, have other trusts in Wales. In the situation in Cardiff, the trust has made savings in the past three years of up to £40 million. However, there will come a point in the future when those savings cannot be made. A report by the chief executive, put to the trust board on 4 May, states that implementing the local delivery plan, which is there to ensure that the trust meets the

trefniadaeth o bosibl gyda diswyddo gorfodol. Mae'r papurau hyn ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Oni ddylech, fel Gweinidog, fod yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau sy'n wynebu'r ymddiriedolaethau, sydd bellach yn y sefyllfa anodd o orfod penderfynu buddsoddi yn yr hyn y dywedwch wrthynt am fuddsoddi ynddo, neu benderfynu a ydynt mewn sefyllfa i gwtogi swyddi. Mewn llythyr a anfonwyd ataf yr wythnos hon, dywedwch eich bod wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau na fydd y GIG yn colli staff gyda chymwysterau uchel. Faint yw eich ymrwymiad, ac a yw'r ymrwymiad hwnnw yn cynnwys bod eich swydd chi yn y fantol hefyd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn deall trefn resymegol y cwestiwn hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, y flaenoriaeth gyntaf, fel y dywedais wrth Mark, yw bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn diwallu anghenion cleifion, ac yn gwneud hynny yng nghyd-destun yr adnoddau sydd ganddo. Y gair allweddol yn eich honiad oedd 'dewisiadau'. Hyd y gwn i, nid yw'r dewisiadau wedi eu cyflwyno fel cynigion pendant. Fe wyddoch cystal â mi fod sefydliadau, pan fyddant yn edrych ar heriau, yn gwneud arfarniad o ystod eang o ddewisiadau. Yn amlwg, caiff nifer fawr o'r dewisiadau hynny eu gwrthod fel rhai sy'n amhriodol i'r dasg. Dyna'r her sy'n wynebu Caerdydd a'r Fro. Mae'n gwneud cynnydd da wrth fynd i'r afael â hyn drwy sicrhau ei bod yn cynllunio'i gweithlu'n well, yn enwedig o ran nyrsio—er enghraifft, mae'r ddibyniaeth ar nyrsys asiantaeth wedi ei haneru bron yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae defnyddio mathau hynny o ddewisiadau yn greadigol fel hyn yn fwy tebygol o fod o fudd i gleifion na rhai o'r dewisiadau a awgrymwch.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro wedi bod yn greadigol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, fel y mae ymddiriedolaethau eraill yng Nghymru, mae'n sicr gennyf. Yng Nghaerdydd, mae'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi arbed hyd at £40 miliwn yn y tair blynedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, bydd adeg rywbryd yn y dyfodol pan na ellir sicrhau'r arbedion hyn. Dywed adroddiad gan y prif weithredwr, a gyflwynwyd i fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth ar 4

ambitious 2009 waiting time target, will be difficult. In fact, the chief executive states that if the local delivery plan is not fully funded, in the same way as the staff contracts have not been fully funded, it will receive only £14 million from you as opposed to the anticipated £26 million that it needs to do the job properly. He states that not only will the trust not meet the key milestones for the waiting time target for 2006, it will fail to maintain the existing orthopaedic 12-month in-patient and day-case waiting times. Therefore, it is not just a question of sustaining what it has now and doing better in three years' time; he states quite clearly that the trust will fail to keep the current obligations that you have set for it. Is it not time that you reviewed where the money is going in the system to ensure that the trusts have the money that they need to do the job properly?

**Brian Gibbons:** I agree with the point that you made that all health organisations must carefully monitor where their money goes, and that it must go towards delivering front-line patient services. It is true to say that negotiations are going on with Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust regarding what it requires in order to deliver the 2009 programme. The original difference between the two sides has significantly narrowed; I do not think that the gap has been fully and finally narrowed, but, given the starting point of the discussions, considerable progress has been achieved. Everyone needs to have the resources to deliver the targets for 2009, which are ambitious and I am pleased that you acknowledged that delivering waiting times is an ambitious challenge. It is a pity that you did not take that view last month.

**Jenny Randerson:** If you are not aware of the Cardiff and Vale trust's difficulties, perhaps you have been made aware today of the Royal Gwent Hospital's difficulties, which it is seeking to solve by closing a ward. That will mean not just the loss of jobs; it will also have a direct impact on the service and level of care provided to patients. Have

Mai, fod gweithredu'r cynllun cyflawni lleol, sydd â'r nod o sicrhau bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn cyrraedd targed uchelgeisiol 2009 ar gyfer amseroedd aros, yn anodd. Yn wir, dywed y prif weithredwr os na chaiff y cynllun cyflawni lleol ei ariannu'n llawn, fel y methwyd ag ariannu contractau staff yn llawn, dim ond £14 miliwn a gaiff gennych o'i gymharu â'r £26 miliwn disgwylidig sydd ei angen arni i wneud y gwaith yn iawn. Mae'n dweud nid yn unig y bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn methu â chyrraedd y cerrig milltir allweddol ar gyfer y targed amseroedd am 2006, ond hefyd yn methu â chynnal yr amseroedd aros presennol o 12 mis ar gyfer cleifion mewnlol a chleifion allanol orthopedig. Felly, nid mater o gynnal yr hyn sydd ganddi yn awr a gwneud yn well ymhen tair blynedd yw hyn; mae'n dweud yn ddigon clir y bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn methu â chyflawni'r rhwymedigaethau presennol a bennwyd gennych ar ei chyfer. Onid yw'n bryd i chi edrych i ble y mae'r arian yn mynd yn y system, er mwyn sicrhau bod gan yr ymddiriedolaethau yr arian y mae arnynt ei angen i wneud y gwaith yn iawn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Cytunaf â'ch pwynt fod yn rhaid i bob sefydliad iechyd fonitro'm ofalus i ble yr aiff ei arian, a bod yn rhaid ei wario ar ddarparu gwasanaethau cleifion rheng flaen. Mae'n wir dweud bod trafodaethau'n cael eu cynnal gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro ynghylch yr hyn y mae arni ei angen i ddarparu rhaglen 2009. Mae'r gwahaniaeth gwreiddiol rhwng y ddwy ochr wedi lleihau'n sylweddol; ni chredaf fod y bwlch wedi ei leihau'n gyfan gwbl, ond o ystyried man cychwyn y trafodaethau, gwnaed cryn dipyn o gynnydd. Mae angen i bawb gael yr adnoddau i gyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer 2009, sy'n uchelgeisiol, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cydnabod bod cyflawni amseroedd aros yn her uchelgeisiol. Mae'n drueni nad oeddech yn meddwl hynny fis diwethaf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Os nad ydych yn ymwybodol o anawsterau Ymddiriedolaeth Caerdydd a'r Fro, efallai eich bod wedi clywed heddiw am anawsterau Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, sy'n ceisio eu datrys drwy gau ward. Bydd hynny nid yn unig yn golygu colli swyddi; bydd hefyd yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar y gwasanaeth a'r gofal a

you had any conversations with hospital representatives, and have you received any representations from medical practitioners or nurses who work there about the implications for patients of what is proposed?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am very up to date with what is going on in Cardiff, and so the first part of your assertion is untrue. On the situation at the Royal Gwent Hospital, there are a number of things going on. I think that you were referring to the reconfiguration of surgical provision and whether or not the way in which surgical services are provided at the hospital means that it is capable of delivering the waiting times targets within the context of the more efficient deployment of resources. That means, particularly in areas such as surgery, developing better care pathways, considering day-care surgery and so forth. If people are developing better care pathways and day surgery, then the need for overnight stays will decrease. That makes good sense for patients, for the health service and for its efficiency. Those are the types of discussions that need to be held in the national health service as part of driving the service forwards.

**Jenny Randerson:** That would all be very well if there was an issue regarding better care pathways, but one of the proposals involves doing away with a dedicated orthopaedic ward, and ensuring that orthopaedic beds are shared as part of another ward. Have you any knowledge of the desperate problems faced at the University Hospital of Wales in Cardiff some years ago, when that provision was made? Massive waiting lists were built up for orthopaedic services as a result of that sharing of beds. I was told by the trusts and their representatives that the sharing of beds was bad clinical practice, because of the danger of cross-infection, and because emergencies push out the orthopaedic cases. Minister, should you not stop spinning and start to stand up for the patients and think about the impact that this will have on them?

**Brian Gibbons:** Jenny, if you would care to go to look at the orthopaedic treatment centre

gaiff cleifion. A ydych wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gyda chynrychiolwyr yr ysbyty, ac a ydych wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau gan feddygon neu nyrsys sy'n gweithio yno ynghylch goblygiadau'r hyn a gynigir i gleifion?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn hollol ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghaerdydd, ac felly mae rhan gyntaf eich honiad yn anghywir. O ran y sefyllfa yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, mae nifer o bethau'n digwydd. Credaf mai cyfeirio at gyflunio'r ddarpariaeth feddygol yr oeddech, a'r cwestiwn a yw'r ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau llawfeddygol eu darparu yn yr ysbyty yn golygu ei fod yn gallu cyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer amseroedd aros yng nghydestun dyrannu adnoddau'n fwy effeithlon. Golyga hynny, yn enwedig mewn meysydd megis llawdriniaeth, ddatblygu llwybrau gofal gwell, ystyried llawdriniaeth gofal dydd, ac ati. Os yw pobl yn datblygu llawdriniaeth ddydd a llwybrau gofal gwell, yna bydd yr angen i aros dros nos yn lleihau. Mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr i gleifion, i'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac i'w effeithlonrwydd. Dyna'r math o drafodaethau y mae angen eu cynnal yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol fel rhan o'r broses o yrru'r gwasanaeth ymlaen.

**Jenny Randerson:** Byddai hynny'n ddigon teg pe byddai problem o ran llwybrau gofal gwell. Ond mae un o'r cynigion yn golygu cael gwared ar ward orthopedig benodol, a sicrhau bod gwelyau orthopedig yn cael eu rhannu fel rhan o ward arall. A ydych yn gwybod am y problemau dyrys a oedd yn wynebu Ysbyty Athrofaol Cymru yng Nghaerdydd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, pan wnaed y ddarpariaeth honno? Gwelwyd rhestrau aros enfawr am wasanaethau orthopedig oherwydd rhannu gwelyau. Dywedodd yr ymddiriedolaethau a'u cynrychiolwyr wrthyf fod rhannu gwelyau yn arfer clinigol gwael, oherwydd perygl trawsheintio, ac oherwydd bod achosion brys yn cael blaenoriaeth dros achosion orthopedig. Weinidog, oni ddylech roi'r gorau i roi sbin ar bethau, a dechrau gweithredu o blaid y cleifion a meddwl am yr effaith a gaiff hyn arnynt?

**Brian Gibbons:** Jenny, pe byddech yn trafferthu edrych ar y ganolfan triniaeth

at St Woolos Hospital in Newport, which cost between £7 million and £9 million, you would see that that is not spinning. If you walked into it, you would have a very sore nose or head.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, in one of your responses to Jonathan Morgan, you said that you would expect health bodies to monitor carefully where the money goes. I do not think that anyone would disagree with you, but I put it to you that the people of Wales expect you, as Minister, to monitor overall where all of the money goes. In that context, can you tell me what analysis you have undertaken with regard to looking at the deficits, bearing in mind that we know that posts are being frozen, even if we do not yet know of redundancies? What percentage of the current deficits are a result of historic underfunding and what percentage are as a result of inefficient management? If they are caused by neither of those things, could you give us an account of what is causing them?

**Brian Gibbons:** A number of the factors that are contributing to the financial pressures have been well rehearsed; they include the cost of contractual change, of modernisation, energy costs, and the costs of new technology. The cost pressures and the reasons behind them are well known. It is my responsibility to keep an overarching view on how the health service is performing in financial terms, but I do not think that we can have it that, yesterday, opposition parties were saying that there was too much political interference in the running of the health service yet, today, the same parties are taking exactly the opposite view. If we are to have the type of consensus that David Melding spoke about yesterday, we need some consistency from opposition parties on the particular approach that they will take. If they are not consistent in their approach, this type of consistency will not be possible.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, you should be careful not to conflate the views of all opposition parties as if they were the same, as I certainly do not recall making that point. However, the Record will no doubt show which of us is right on that point.

orthopedig yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw yng Nghasnewydd, a gostiodd rhwng £7 miliwn a £9 miliwn, byddech yn gweld nad rhoi sbin ar bethau yw hynny. Pe byddech yn cerdded i mewn iddo, byddai gennyh drwyn neu ben poenus iawn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, mewn un o'ch ymatebion i Jonathan Morgan yr oeddech yn dweud y byddech yn disgwyl i gyrff iechyd fonitro'n ofalus i ble y mae'r arian yn mynd. Ni chredaf y byddai neb yn anghytuno â chi, ond dywedaf wrthyh fod pobl Cymru yn disgwyl i chi, fel Gweinidog, fonitro'n gyffredinol i ble y mae'r holl arian yn mynd. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a allech ddweud wrthyf pa ddadansoddiad a wnaed gennyh i edrych ar y diffygion, gan gofio ein bod yn gwybod bod swyddi'n cael eu rhewi, hyd yn oed os nad ydym eto'n gwybod am achosion o ddiswyddo? Pa ganran o'r diffygion presennol sy'n ganlyniad i danariannu hanesyddol, a pha ganran sy'n ganlyniad i reoli aneffeithlon? Os na chânt eu hachosi gan y rhain, a allech ddweud wrthym beth yn union sy'n eu hachosi?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae nifer o'r ffactorau sy'n cyfrannu at y pwysau ariannol yn rhai sy'n ailddigwydd; maent yn cynnwys cost newid cytundebol, moderneiddio, costau ynni, a chostau technoleg newydd. Mae'r pwysau costau a'r rhesymau amdanynt yn gyfarwydd iawn. Fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw cadw golwg gyffredinol ar y ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn perfformio'n ariannol, ond ni chredaf ei bod yn dderbyniol i'r gwrthbleidiau, ddoe, fod yn dweud bod gormod o ymyrraeth wleidyddol wrth redeg y gwasanaeth iechyd, a heddiw fod yr un pleidiau'n dweud i'r gwrthwyneb. Os ydym am sicrhau'r math o gonsensws y soniodd David Melding amdano ddoe, mae angen ychydig gysondeb gan y gwrthbleidiau yn eu dull o weithredu. Os na fyddant yn gyson, ni fydd y math hwn o gonsensws yn bosibl.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, dylech ochel rhag cyfuno safbwyntiau pob gwrthblaid fel petaent yr un fath, oherwydd ni allaf gofio gwneud y pwynt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siŵr y bydd y Cofnod yn dangos pwy sy'n gywir ar y pwynt hwnnw.

The pressures that you point to are not pressures that differ from one place to another; they have an impact on all healthcare providers. I am asking you to identify why there is so much more of a problem in some places than others. Do you agree with some of your Labour AM colleagues in west Wales, who think that the health service management there is so poor that no reconfiguration should take place until all the trust board, for example, that of Carmarthenshire, is replaced? Can I press you to commit yourself to ensuring that, if there are redundancies in the health service in Wales as a result of these deficits, those redundancies will be made up of inefficient managers and not clinical providers?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before the Minister answers that question, yesterday's Record has already been published, and has been available for at least an hour and a half.

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the reasons Sir Derek Wanless told us that change was needed in the NHS in Wales was because the basic present configuration of services is inherently unsustainable, and that is one of the main structural reasons that is contributing to a number of the financial pressures that you were talking about that are peculiar to certain parts of Wales. If we look at those parts of Wales where the financial pressures are greatest, we see that they are probably those parts where the requirement for service reconfiguration is the greatest. Therefore, unless we take on board the key message that Sir Derek Wanless gave to us, we will continue to repeat the same line of questioning.

2.30 p.m.

There is a real need for radical reform to make the NHS in all parts of Wales fit for the twenty-first century, and also to reorganise it and reconfigure it in a way that is sustainable, includes clinical services, and operates within the record levels of public investment that has come into those services.

Nid yw'r pwysau y cyfeiriwch atynt yn bwysau sy'n amrywio o fan i fan; maent yn effeithio ar bob darparwr gofal iechyd. Yr wyf yn gofyn ichi ddweud pam mae'r broblem lawer yn fwy mewn rhai mannau nag mewn mannau eraill. A gytunwch â rhai o'ch cyd-Aelodau Llafur yn y gorllewin, sy'n credu bod rheolwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd yno mor wael fel na ddylid cyflunio o gwbl nes caiff holl fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth, er enghraifft, bwrdd sir Gaerfyrddin, ei ddisodli? A gaf fi bwysu arnoch i ymrwymo i sicrhau, os bydd diswyddiadau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'r diffygion hyn, mai ar reolwyr aneffeithlon, nid ar ddarparwyr clinigol, y bydd i diswyddiadau hynny'n effeithio?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, mae Cofnod ddoe eisoes wedi ei gyhoeddi'n barod, ac mae ar gael ers awr a hanner o leiaf.

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r rhesymau pam y dywedodd Syr Derek Wanless wrthym fod angen i'r GIG yng Nghymru newid oedd am fod cyfluniad sylfaenol presennol gwasanaethau yn anghynaliadwy, a dyna un o'r prif resymau strwythurol sy'n cyfrannu at lawer o'r pwysau ariannol yr oeddech yn sôn amdanynt ac sy'n digwydd yn benodol mewn rhai rhannau yng Nghymru. Os edrychwn ar y rhannau hynny o Gymru lle y mae'r pwysau ariannol mwyaf, gwelwn ei bod yn debygol mai yn y rhannau hynny y mae'r angen mwyaf am gyflunio gwasanaethau. Felly, oni bai ein bod yn derbyn y neges allweddol a roddodd Syr Derek Wanless inni, byddwn yn parhau i ail-adrodd yr un cwestiynau.

Mae gwir angen diwygio sylfaenol i wneud y GIG ym mhob rhan o Gymru yn addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, a'i ad-drefnu a'i ailgyflunio hefyd mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gwasanaethau clinigol a gweithredu o fewn y lefelau uchaf erioed o fuddsoddi cyhoeddus yn y gwasanaethau hynny.

**Yr Achosion o MRSA yn Ysbytai Cymru**  
**The Instances of MRSA in Welsh Hospitals**

**Q4 William Graham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the instances of MRSA in Welsh hospitals? OAQ0835(HSS)

**C4 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr achosion o MRSA yn ysbytai Cymru? OAQ0835(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The incidence of healthcare-associated infections, together with the rates of other bloodstream infections, is now available on the National Public Health Service website, as highlighted in my recent written statement. Patients are now able to view instances of all types of bloodstream infection, including MRSA, by their local trust.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae nifer yr achosion o heintiau sy'n gysylltiedig â gofal iechyd, ynghyd â'r cyfraddau o heintiau llif gwaed eraill, ar gael erbyn hyn ar wefan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol. Yr oedd fy natganiad ysgrifenedig yn ddiweddar y tynnu sylw at hynny. Bellach gall cleifion weld nifer yr achosion o heintiau llif gwaed o bob math, gan gynnwys MRSA, yn eu hymddiriedolaeth leol.

**William Graham:** I am sure that you will agree that a sterile environment is vital in fighting such infections as MRSA and that the new surgical orthopaedic unit at St Woolos Hospital, which was opened recently, minimises the risk of cross-infection. Will you confirm the importance of maintaining clean and adequate orthopaedic wards and that this will be a paramount consideration in the reported closure of wards at the Royal Gwent Hospital?

**William Graham:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod amgylchedd di-haint yn hanfodol i ymladd heintiau fel MRSA, a bod yr uned orthopedig lawfeddygol newydd yn Ysbyty Gwynllyw, a agorwyd yn ddiweddar, yn lleihau risg traws-heintio. A gadarnhewch bwysigrwydd cynnal wardiau orthopedig glân a digonol, ac y bydd hyn yn un o'r prif ystyriaethau yn y bwriad honedig i gau wardiau yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent?

**Brian Gibbons:** Certainly. It is important that patients going into hospital are assured that their health will not be put at increased risk because they are going into a dangerous environment. There is no doubt that a hospital can be a potentially dangerous environment. It is reassuring that, with regard to infections such as MRSA, while the level of performance still needs improvement, the levels of infection are lower in Wales than in other parts of the United Kingdom. That is welcome news. However, even with the present levels of infection, there are further grounds for improvement. Hopefully, the resolution that we will be working up on the back of the proposal from Val Lloyd will be a further contribution in that direction.

**Brian Gibbons:** Wrth gwrs. Mae'n bwysig i gleifion sy'n mynd i'r ysbyty gael gwybod na fydd eu hiechyd mewn mwy o berygl am eu bod yn mynd i amgylchedd peryglus. Nid oes amheuaeth na all ysbyty fod yn amgylchedd peryglus. Mae'n galonogol, o ran lefelau heintiau fel MRSA, er bod angen gwella lefel y perfformiad o hyd, fod lefelau heintiau'n is yng Nghymru nag yn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hynny'n newyddion da. Fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed gyda lefelau presennol heintiau, mae lle i wella eto. Gobeithio y bydd yr ateb y byddwn yn ei baratoi yn sgîl cynnig Val Lloyd yn gyfraniad pellach yn y cyfeiriad hwnnw.

**Janet Davies:** On the issue of hospital cleanliness as raised by William Graham—and we are aware of Val Lloyd's proposal under Standing Order No. 31 on that—have you considered doing away with the privatisation of cleaning services in hospitals? Is this on your agenda and, if so,

**Janet Davies:** O ran y mater a gododd William Graham ynghylch glanweithdra mewn ysbytai—a gwyddom am gynnig Val Lloyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 ar hynny—a ydych wedi ystyried rhoi'r gorau i breifateiddio gwasanaethau glanhau mewn ysbytai? A yw hyn ar eich agenda, ac os

how far along the path of thinking about it have you got?

**Brian Gibbons:** To the best of my knowledge, the number of contracted-out providers in Welsh hospitals is exceedingly small. I think that there is such a provider in the Neath Port Talbot Hospital in my constituency, and that there are some in north-west Wales. In Swansea, facilities services have come in-house following the recent tendering process. Therefore, the amount of contracting out within Wales is relatively small. Consequently, I do not think that it would be a major factor in Wales, compared to other parts of the United Kingdom.

ydyw, pa mor bell yr ydych wedi mynd o ran meddwl am hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Hyd y gwn, mae nifer y darparwyr ar gontract allanol mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru yn fychan iawn. Credaf fod darparwr o'r fath yn Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot yn fy etholaeth i, a bod rhai yn y gogledd-orllewin. Yn Abertawe, daeth gwasanaethau cyfleusterau o dan ofal yr ysbyty yn dilyn y broses dendro'n ddiweddar. Felly, mae nifer y contractau allanol yng Nghymru yn gymharol fychan. O ganlyniad, nid wyf yn credu y byddai'n ffactor mawr yng Nghymru, o'i chymharu â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

### **Darpariaeth Gwasanaethau Deintyddol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin The Provision of Dental Services in Carmarthenshire**

**C5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau deintyddol yn sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ0813(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Twelve personal dental services pilot schemes were secured for NHS provision in Carmarthenshire, protecting provision for 52,600 existing patients and providing for an additional 7,000 patients. Recent establishments have also seen three new dental practices being established in Llanelli, Llandeilo and Whitland, which will provide an additional 28,000 places.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, Weiniog, mae'r cynllun gwasanaethau deintyddol personol wedi bod yn llwyddiant mawr yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Serch hynny, mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf dywedsoch nad oedd angen i gleifion, o reidrwydd, ymuno â gwasanaeth deintyddol preifat; ac y gallai cleifion, yn gyffredinol drwy Gymru, gael gwasanaeth o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. A ydych yn dweud y gall pawb sy'n chwilio am wasanaeth o dan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru gael y gwasanaeth hwnnw?

**Brian Gibbons:** No; I would not think that we are at that situation at present. One reason why we are retaining the access fund centrally is to redistribute that money

**Q5 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the dental services provision in Carmarthenshire? OAQ0813(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Sicrhawyd 12 o gynlluniau peilot gwasanaethau deintyddol personol i'r darparu gan y GIG yn sir Gaerfyrddin, gan ddiogelu darpariaeth ar gyfer 52,600 o gleifion presennol a darparu ar gyfer 7,000 o gleifion ychwanegol. Yn ddiweddar sefydlwyd tair deintyddfa newydd yn Llanelli, Llandeilo a Hendy-gwyn a fydd yn darparu 28,000 o leoedd ychwanegol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** As I have said before, Minister, the personal dental services scheme has been a great success in Carmarthenshire. However, in a written statement last week you stated that patients did not necessarily need to access private dental services; and that Welsh patients, generally, could have access to a dentist under the national health service. Are you saying that everyone who wishes to have access to a dentist under the national health service in Wales can access that service?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nac ydwyf; ni chredaf ein bod yn y sefyllfa honno ar hyn o bryd. Un rheswm pam yr ydym yn cadw'r gronfa fynediad yn ganolog yw er mwyn



according to which parts of Wales have the poorest access at present. When we are in a position to be clear as to where the greatest access needs are, that money, hopefully, will be made available to those communities on a needs basis. Therefore, our recognition that that pool exists is a recognition that some parts of Wales, even after the success of PDS, will need extra resources to help them to deliver improved access.

**Glyn Davies:** What proportion of the population who live in Carmarthenshire have access to an NHS dentist compared to the rest of Wales? When will you reach a position when 100 per cent of the people in Carmarthenshire—and, indeed, 100 per cent of the people in Wales—have access to an NHS dentist?

**Brian Gibbons:** I cannot give you a definitive date for that, one reason for that being that there is an unquantified number of people who choose not to use NHS dentistry, for their own reasons. However, we want to get to a situation, in all parts of Wales, where people who want to access NHS dentistry are able to do so. I cannot give you a precise timescale when that will be delivered, because that will depend partly on the allocation that I have just mentioned to Rhodri Glyn. However, it also depends on investment decisions at a local health board level, depending on their overall priorities in their health communities.

aiddosbarthu'r arian hwnnw yn ôl pa rannau o Gymru sy'n cael y drafferth fwyaf i gael y gwasanaeth ar hyn o bryd. Pan fyddwn mewn sefyllfa i weld yn glir ble mae'r anghenion mwyaf o ran cael gwasanaeth, gobeithio y rhoddir yr arian hwnnw i'r cymunedau hynny yn ôl yr angen. Felly, mae'r ffaith ein bod yn cydnabod bod y gronfa honno'n bodoli yn gydnabyddiaeth y bydd angen adnoddau ychwanegol ar rai rhannau o Gymru, hyd yn oed ar ôl llwyddiant y gwasanaethau deintyddol personol, i'w helpu i ddarparu gwell gwasanaeth.

**Glyn Davies:** Pa gyfran o boblogaeth sir Gaerfyrddin sy'n gallu mynd at ddeintydd y GIG o'u cymharu â gweddill Cymru? Pryd y cyrhaeddwch sefyllfa pan fydd 100 y cant o bobl sir Gaerfyrddin—ac yn wir, 100 y cant o bobl Cymru—yn gallu mynd at ddeintydd y GIG?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni allaf roi dyddiad pendant ichi ar gyfer hynny, ac un rheswm am hynny yw bod nifer anfesuradwy o bobl yn dewis peidio â defnyddio deintydd y GIG, am eu rhesymau eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am gyrraedd sefyllfa, ym mhob rhan o Gymru, lle gall pobl sydd am gael gwasanaeth deintydd y GIG gael hynny. Ni allaf roi amserlen fanwl ichi yn dangos pryd y cyflawnir hynny, oherwydd bydd hynny'n dibynnu'n rhannol ar y dyraniad yr wyf newydd sôn amdano wrth Rhodri Glyn. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn dibynnu ar benderfyniadau buddsoddi ar lefel byrddau iechyd lleol, yn ôl eu blaenoriaethau cyffredinol yn eu cymunedau iechyd.

### **Ffioedd a Godir gan Gartrefi Nyrsio Fees Charged by Nursing Homes**

**C6 Alun Ffred Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffioedd a godir gan gartrefi nyrsio? OAQ0820(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** To reiterate the point made by the First Minister to you on 4 April, fees in care homes, with nursing care, are agreed between the home, local authorities, local health boards and service users, depending on the individual's personal circumstances. The fee is set in accordance with the agreed care package.

**Q6 Alun Ffred Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on fees charged by nursing homes? OAQ0820(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ailadroddaf y pwynt a wnaed gan y Prif Weinidog ar 4 Ebrill, sef bod ffioedd mewn cartrefi gofal, gyda gofal nyrsio, yn cael eu cytuno rhwng y cartref, awdurdodau lleol, byrddau iechyd lleol a defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth, yn ôl amgylchiadau personol yr unigolyn. Caiff y ffi ei gosod yn unol â'r pecyn gofal y

cytunwyd arno.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Mae dau bwynt yma. Yn gyntaf, a gredwch fod y ffioedd hynny, ar gyfartaledd, yn cyfateb i'r costau sydd ar y cartrefi hynny? Hefyd, beth fydddech yn ei ddweud wrth etholwyr, fel fy rhai i, sy'n wynebu galwad gan y cartrefi nyrsio hyn am ffioedd ychwanegol, ar ben y ffioedd sydd wedi eu cytuno â'r awdurdod lleol? Mae gennyf gwpl ar eu pensiwn sydd newydd gael cais am £20 yr wythnos gan gartref nyrsio i edrych ar ôl chwaer un o'r pensiynwyr hynny, ac nid ydynt mewn sefyllfa i dalu. A ydych yn gwneud unrhyw beth i ymateb i'r broblem honno?

**Brian Gibbons:** Assistance for nursing fees—not continuing NHS care, but the nursing element of care—was increased by 3.5 per cent this year, which, as you know, is higher than the staff inflation rate. Therefore, there has been a somewhat above staff inflation increase. The case that you raise is of some concern. It is difficult to respond without getting the precise details of that case; it would depend on whether that person was paying their own way, or whether they were receiving care as part of an NHS or a local authority assessment. If the allocation was purely on the basis of a local authority assessment and they came within the eligibility criteria for free residential or nursing home care, and if there has been no change in their circumstances, one would want to seek further clarification as to why a top-up fee was being required. However, we would need to see the specifics of the case to clarify that, rather than rushing to judgment on the basis of inadequate information.

**Christine Chapman:** You will be aware, Minister, of the Wanless social care review team report on care for older people, which was published in March. This report focuses on England, but there are trends that apply to Wales, and its findings can help inform policy here. What consideration will the Welsh Assembly Government give to the estimates for spending requirements for social care over the next 20 years contained in the report? This is particularly important as the report also estimates that the proportion of care home fees that are wholly privately funded is between one quarter and one third,

**Alun Ffred Jones:** There are two points here. First, do you believe those fees, on average, correspond to the costs faced by those homes? And what would you tell constituents, such as mine, who face a demand from these nursing homes for additional fees on top of the fees agreed with the local authority? I have a couple, who are pensioners, who have just been asked for an additional £20 a week by a nursing home to look after the sister of one of those pensioners, and they are not able to pay. Are you doing anything to respond to that problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r cymorth ar gyfer ffioedd nyrsio-nid ar gyfer gofal parhaus y GIG, ond yr elfen nyrsio mewn gofal-wedi cynyddu 3.5 y cant eleni, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, yn uwch na'r gyfradd chwyddiant staff. Felly, cafwyd cynnydd sydd ychydig yn fwy na chwyddiant staff. Mae'r achos a godwch yn achosi pryder. Mae'n anodd ymateb heb gael manylion yr achos hwnnw; byddai'n dibynnu ar y cwestiwn a oedd y person hwnnw'n talu drosto'i hun, neu a oedd yn cael gofal fel rhan o asesiad gan y GIG neu awdurdod lleol. Os oedd y dyraniad ar sail asesiad awdurdod lleol yn unig ac yntau'n bodloni'r meini prawf ar gyfer cael gofal cartref nyrsio neu gartref preswyl am ddim, ac os na fu newid yn ei amgylchiadau, byddwn am gael eglurhad pellach pam yr oedd cais wedi ei wneud am ffi atodol. Fodd bynnag, byddai angen inni weld manylion yr achos i wneud hynny'n glir, yn hytrach na rhuthro i fynegi barn ar sail gwybodaeth annigonol.

**Christine Chapman:** Gwyddoch, Weinidog, am yr adroddiad gan dîm adolygiad gofal cymdeithasol Wanless ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth. Ar Loegr y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn canolbwyntio, ond mae yna dueddiadau ynddo sy'n berthnasol i Gymru, a gall ei ddarganfyddiadau helpu llywio polisi yma. Pa ystyriaeth fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei rhoi i'r amcangyfrifon a gynhwysir yn yr adroddiad ar gyfer gofynion gwario ar ofal cymdeithasol yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd nesaf? Mae hyn yn arbennig o bwysig gan fod yr adroddiad hefyd yn amcangyfrif bod cyfran y

and it is likely that this figure is considerably higher in Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am pleased that the UK Government has responded positively to the new Derek Wanless report, which was commissioned by the King's Fund, and that it has set up a working group to respond to that. That is important, because when the Royal Commission on Long-term Care for the Elderly was established, one of its main recommendations required primary legislation, which can only be delivered through Westminster, but also suggested that a number of the funding pressures that would follow from that should only be available through general taxation, which clearly we as an Assembly Government are not in a position to deliver either. It is very encouraging that the UK Government has responded by setting up a working group and that, hopefully, in the light of that, it will be able to come up with a set of proposals that will respond to what Sir Derek said in the King's Fund report.

2.40 p.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Help the Aged has recently published a report about the average costs of fees at a care home. They have gone up, as the Minister is probably aware, 50 per cent over the last five years. At the same time, the state pension has gone up 21.5 per cent. About 40 per cent of people in care homes in Wales are paying the full fees. What is the Government doing to address what is going to be an increasing problem? I realise that it is, in many ways, a difficult demographic problem. Thankfully, people are living longer, so it is going to become an increasing problem for people to meet those costs. What is the Government doing in relation to that long-term problem?

**Brian Gibbons:** In terms of the wider issue, what I said to Christine Chapman is probably the most pertinent point. Clearly, there are legal constraints in terms of how we can respond and what we can do within our existing powers. Given the cost implications

ffioedd cartrefi gofal sy'n cael eu hariannu'n breifat rhwng chwarter a thraean, ac mae'n debyg fod y ffigur hwnnw'n sylweddol uwch yng Nghymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol i adroddiad newydd Derek Wanless, a gomisiynwyd gan Gronfa'r Brenin, ac wedi sefydlu gweithgor i ymateb i hynny. Mae hynny'n bwysig, oherwydd pan sefydlwyd y Comisiwn Brenhinol ar Ofal Hirdymor i'r Henoed, yr oedd un o'i brif argymhellion yn gofyn am ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol, a San Steffan yn unig all wneud hynny. Ond awgrymai hefyd mai drwy drethu cyffredinol yn unig y dylid cael arian ar gyfer llawer o'r pwysau ariannu a fyddai'n dilyn o hynny, ac yn amlwg nid ydym fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn sefyllfa i wneud hynny ychwaith. Mae'n galonogol iawn fod Llywodraeth y DU wedi ymateb drwy sefydlu gweithgor ac y gall, yng ngoleuni hynny, gobeithio, gyflwyno cyfres o gynigion a fydd yn ymateb i'r hyn a ddywedodd Syr Derek yn adroddiad Cronfa'r Brenin.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae Help the Aged yn ddiweddar wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad ar cost gyfartalog ffioedd mewn cartrefi gofal. Maent wedi codi, fel y gwyr y Gweinidog, mae'n siŵr, 50 y cant yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Yn yr un cyfnod, 21.5 y cant o gynnydd a fu ym mhensiwn y wladwriaeth. Mae tua 40 y cant o'r bobl sydd mewn cartrefi gofal yng Nghymru yn talu'r ffioedd llawn. Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r hyn a ddaw yn broblem gynyddol? Sylweddolaf ei bod yn broblem ddemograffig anodd ar lawer ystyr. Mae pobl yn byw'n hŷn, sy'n dda o beth, felly bydd yn broblem gynyddol i bobl dalu'r costau hynny. Beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ynglŷn â'r broblem hirdymor honno?

**Brian Gibbons:** O ran y mater ehangach, mae'n debyg mai'r hyn a ddywedais wrth Christine Chapman yw'r pwynt mwyaf perthnasol. Yn amlwg, mae cyfyngiadau cyfreithiol o ran sut y gallwn ymateb a'r hyn y gallwn ei wneud o fewn ein pwerau

of responding to some of the points made in Sir Derek's report, those would clearly be beyond the bounds of affordability given the Assembly's budget. Any approach within the foreseeable future would have to be done in partnership with the Government in Westminster. It would be very difficult for us to go our own way in this, because we would not have the resources to do it, even if we had the legal powers.

presennol. O gofio'r goblygiadau ariannol o ymateb i rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed yn adroddiad Syr Derek, byddai'r rheini'n amlwg yn fwy nag y gellid ei fforddio, o gofio cyllideb y Cynulliad. Byddai angen i unrhyw ddull gweithredu yn y dyfodol rhagweladwy fod ar y cyd â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Byddai'n anodd iawn inni ddilyn ein llwybr ein hunain yn y mater hwn, oherwydd ni fyddai'r adnoddau gennym i wneud hynny, hyd yn oed pe bai gennym y pwerau cyfreithiol.

### **Gwasanaethau Iechyd Rhyw i Bobl Ifanc yng Nghymru Sexual Health Services for Young People in Wales**

**Q7 Sandy Mewies:** Will the Minister make a statement on sexual health services for young people in Wales? OAQ0856(HSS)

**C7 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau iechyd rhyw i bobl ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ0856(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government has a programme of action in place to improve the sexual health and wellbeing of both young people and adults in Wales and to ensure that people have prompt access to contraception and modern, well-organised services to diagnose and treat sexually transmitted diseases.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru raglen weithredu ar waith i wella lles ac iechyd rhyw pobl ifanc ac oedolion yng Nghymru, ac i sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cael dulliau atal cenhedlu a gwasanaethau modern, trefnus yn brydlon i ganfod a thrin heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol.

**Sandy Mewies:** Your written statement today builds on our strategic framework for sexual health and I welcome it wholeheartedly. I am especially glad to see that we are progressing on developing requirements to ensure high-quality sexual health services across Wales. Flintshire County Council has recently approved Flintshire's sex and relationships education policy and is working to train people to give sexual health advice to young people. Will you join me in congratulating it on the work that it has done so far?

**Sandy Mewies:** Mae eich datganiad ysgrifenedig heddiw yn adeiladu ar ein fframwaith strategol ar gyfer iechyd rhyw ac fe'i croesawaf yn frwd. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o weld ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd wrth ddatblygu gofynion i sicrhau darparu gwasanaethau iechyd rhyw o safon uchel ledled Cymru. Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn ddiweddar wedi cymeradwyo polisi addysg rhyw a pherthynas yn sir y Fflint, ac mae'n gweithio i hyfforddi pobl i roi cyngor i bobl ifanc ar iechyd rhywiol. A ymunwch â mi i'w longyfarch ar y gwaith y mae wedi ei wneud hyd yma?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. I was in a meeting this morning in which I heard very positive reports about Flintshire County Council's social services department in relation to the innovation that is taking place in adult services as well. In relation to young people's services, it complements the approach that we are taking in the strategy outlined by Dr Marion Lyons, by which particular effort is being made to increase the information that is available to young people by targeting clubs,

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwnaf. Mewn cyfarfod fore heddiw clywais adroddiadau cadarnhaol iawn am adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cyngor Sir y Fflint o ran y gwaith arloesol sy'n mynd ymlaen mewn gwasanaethau i oedolion yn ogystal. O ran gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc, mae'n ategu ein dull gweithredu yn y strategaeth a amlinellwyd gan Dr Marion Lyons, lle gwneir ymdrech arbennig i gynyddu'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc drwy dargedu clybiau, clybiau

youth clubs, nightclubs, bars and places where young people go, and by having more vigorous performance targets so that people will have access to emergency contraception within 24 hours and to clinics where sexually transmitted diseases can be dealt with within 48 hours. Flintshire is establishing good practice, which is consistent with our strategy.

**Janice Gregory:** I applaud your strategy and await the outcomes with interest. However, you will be aware that incidents of sexually transmitted diseases, including the silent disease, chlamydia, are rising within Valley communities. How confident are you that this strategy will address those issues in our Valley communities?

**Brian Gibbons:** I know that you have been raising this issue for a number of years, and I am pleased, as I am sure you will be, to see from the Cabinet statement that we are looking at this. The statement said that an advisory group on sexual health is considering a competence framework to underpin the development of a more nurse-led service. It will also be considering details of how high-quality, accessible testing for chlamydia in the under-25 age group can be best introduced across Wales. I am sure that you will welcome that, because we all know that the scourge of chlamydia disease is particularly prevalent in people who are under 25; certainly, that is the age group in which the incidence of this particular disease is increasing most dramatically.

**Leanne Wood:** Young people aged between 16 and 24 are currently witnessing the biggest increase in sexually transmitted infection rates of any age group, yet they still face significant barriers in terms of accessing sexual-health advice. According to a new report published last month by the Welsh Consumer Council, those barriers include inadequate customer care, long waiting times for sexually transmitted infection tests, limited opening hours of clinics, inability to make appointments at local clinics, expensive contraception in shops, limited availability of free contraception and fears over confidentiality. You claim in your most

ieuenctid, clybiau nos, barrau a mannau lle mae pobl ifanc yn mynd. Yr ydym hefyd yn gosod targedau perfformiad mwy cadarn, fel y gall pobl gael dulliau atal cenhedlu brys cyn pen 24 awr, a mynd i glinigau lle gellir ymdrin cyn pen 48 awr â chlefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol. Mae sir y Fflint yn sefydlu arfer da sy'n cyd-fynd â'n strategaeth.

**Janice Gregory:** Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'ch strategaeth ac yn edrych ymlaen yn frwd at weld y canlyniadau. Fodd bynnag, gwyddoch fod achosion o glefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol, gan gynnwys y clefyd mud, clamydia, ar gynnydd yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd. Pa mor hyderus ydych chi y bydd y strategaeth hon yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny yn ein cymunedau yn y Cymoedd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwn eich bod wedi codi'r mater hwn ers llawer blwyddyn, ac yr wyf yn falch, fel chithau, mae'n siŵr, o weld yn natganiad y Cabinet ein bod yn edrych ar hyn. Dywedai'r datganiad fod grŵp cynghori ar iechyd rhywiol yn ystyried fframwaith cymhwysedd i ategu datblygiad gwasanaeth a ddarperir yn fwy gan nyrsys. Bydd hefyd yn ystyried manylion y ffordd orau i gyflwyno profion cyfleus o safon uchel ar gyfer chlamydia yn y grŵp oed o dan 25 oed ledled Cymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn croesawu hynny, gan ein bod i gyd yn gwybod bod melltith clefyd chlamydia yn arbennig o gyffredin ymhlith pobl o dan 25 oed; yn sicr, dyna'r grŵp oedran lle mae'r achosion o'r clefyd penodol hwn yn cynyddu gyflymaf.

**Leanne Wood:** Ar hyn ymhlith pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 24 oed y mae'r cynnydd mwyaf mewn cyfraddau clefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol o unrhyw grŵp oedran, ond eto maent yn dal i wynebu rhwystrau sylweddol wrth gael cyngor ar iechyd rhyw. Yn ôl adroddiad newydd a gyhoeddwyd fis diwethaf gan Gyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru, mae'r rhwystrau hynny yn cynnwys gofal cwsmeriaid annigonol, amseroedd aros hir am brofion heintiau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol, oriau agor cyfyngedig clinigau, methu gwneud apwyntiadau mewn clinigau lleol, dulliau atal cenhedlu drud mewn siopau, prinder dulliau atal cenhedlu am ddim

recent statement, Minister, that good progress is being made, but do you have any plans to assess the effectiveness of current service provision and how you will consider the findings of the Welsh Consumer Council in such an assessment?

**Brian Gibbons:** You should be in a position to have had a chance to read today's Cabinet statement on sexual health services, and you will have seen some of the progress that we are making. Equally, in terms of our soft target for last June, to deliver the 24-hour target for emergency contraception and the 48-hour target for sexually transmitted disease, we are working through the results of the health service in Wales to see how various organisations performed. Once we are clear as to how individual organisations performed against that target, we will take the necessary performance-management steps to ensure that organisations that did not fully deliver on the target will be investigated. They will have to put in place proposals to deliver the target that they should have delivered last year.

ac ofnau ynghylch cyfrinachedd. Weinidog, yn eich datganiad diweddaraf, yr ydych yn honni bod cynnydd da yn digwydd, ond a oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i asesu effeithiolrwydd eich darpariaeth gyfredol o wasanaethau, a sut y byddwch yn ystyried darganfyddiadau Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cymru mewn asesiad o'r fath?

**Brian Gibbons:** Dylech fod mewn sefyllfa i fod wedi darllen datganiad y Cabinet heddiw ar wasanaethau iechyd rhyw, a byddwch wedi gweld rhywfaint o'r cynnydd yr ydym yn ei wneud. Yn yr un modd, o ran ein targed meddal ar gyfer mis Mehefin diwethaf, i gyrraedd y targed 24 awr ar gyfer dulliau atal cenhedlu brys a'r targed 48 awr ar gyfer clefyd a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol, yr ydym yn dadansoddi canlyniadau'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru i weld sut yr oedd amrywiol sefydliadau'n perfformio. Pan fyddwn yn glir sut y perfformiodd sefydliadau unigol yn erbyn y targed hwnnw, byddwn yn cymryd y camau angenrheidiol i reoli perfformiad er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn ymchwilio i'r sefydliadau a fethodd gyrraedd y targed yn llawn. Bydd yn rhaid iddynt roi cynigion ar waith i gyrraedd y targed y dylent fod wedi'i gyrraedd y llynedd.

### **Hybu Arloesi yn y GIG The Promotion of Innovation in the NHS**

**Q8 Val Lloyd:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote innovation in the NHS? OAQ0854(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** In March 2005, I launched the National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare. NLIAH supports NHS Wales to deliver the 'Designed for Life' agenda by building leadership capacity and capability to secure continuous service improvement through technology, innovation, leading-edge thinking and best practice.

**Val Lloyd:** The Multidisciplinary Nanotechnology Centre at the University of Wales Swansea is pioneering research into microscopic electronic devices and biomedical implants to control the release of drugs into the human body. Swansea university is also working in partnership with Morriston Hospital's accident and emergency

**C8 Val Lloyd:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu arloesi yn y GIG? OAQ0854(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Ym mis Mawrth 2005, lansiais yr Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd. Mae AGAAGI yn cynorthwyo GIG Cymru i ddarparu agenda 'Cynllun Oes' drwy feithrin y gallu i arwain a'r gallu i sicrhau gwelliant parhaus mewn gwasanaethau drwy dechnoleg, arloesi, meddwl blaengar ac arfer gorau.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae'r Ganolfan Nanotechnoleg Aml-ddisgyblaeth ym Mhrifysgol Cymru Abertawe yn arloesi mewn ymchwil i ddyfeisiau electronig microsgopig a mewnbaniadau biofeddygol i reoli rhyddhau cyffuriau yn y corff dynol. Mae prifysgol Abertawe yn ogystal yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gydag adran damweiniau ac

department to conduct research into the relationship between blood flow and clotting. Do you agree that these types of innovative projects will contribute to improving the future treatment of patients in Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. From the point of view of promoting and encouraging these developments, I was pleased to see that, in the draft, or consultation, document on science policy, the health sector was regarded as being one of the big sectors in the overall science policy for Wales. This type of innovative developments, such as the ones to which you referred, will, hopefully, be at the heart of science policy in Wales, once the final decisions on it are made. It is also worthwhile to draw attention to the Wish fund that we set up in August with the Wales Office of Research and Development for Health and Social Care. Through this, special financial assistance is available to individuals and groups in the NHS, so that, where they develop innovative projects, they can be further developed and, potentially, go onto the open market, consequently providing additional benefit for those individuals and for the NHS in Wales.

achosion brys Ysbyty Treforys i ymchwilio i'r berthynas rhwng llif gwaed a cheulad gwaed. A ydych yn cytuno y bydd y mathau hyn o brosiectau arloesol yn cyfrannu at wella'r modd y caiff cleifion eu trin yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ydwyf. O safbwynt hyrwyddo ac annog y datblygiadau hyn, yr oedd yn bleser gennyf weld, yn y ddogfen ddrafft, neu'r ddogfen ymgynghori, ar bolisi gwyddoniaeth fod y sector iechyd yn cael ei ystyried yn un o'r sectorau mawr yn y polisi gwyddoniaeth cyffredinol ar gyfer Cymru. Bydd y math hwn o ddatblygiadau arloesol, megis y rhai y cyfeirich atynt, gobeithio wrth wraidd polisi gwyddoniaeth yng Nghymru, ar ôl gwneud y penderfyniadau terfynol amdano. Mae'n werth tynnu sylw hefyd at y gronfa Ddymuno a sefydlwyd gennym ym mis Awst gyda Swyddfa Cymru ar gyfer Ymchwil a Datblygu Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol. Drwy gyfrwng hon, mae cymorth ariannol arbennig ar gael i unigolion a grwpiau yn y GIG, er mwyn sicrhau, pan fyddant yn datblygu prosiectau arloesol, y gellir eu datblygu ymhellach, a hwyrach sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd y farchnad agored ac o ganlyniad yn darparu budd ychwanegol i'r unigolion hynny ac i'r GIG yng Nghymru.

### **Dyfodol Gofal Iechyd Sylfaenol ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni The Future of Primary Healthcare in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney**

**Q9 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of primary healthcare in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney? OAQ0866(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Local health boards are responsible for the provision of primary healthcare in their areas. This is the case in both Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney. Plans are now being worked up with local clinicians and the local community for consideration over forthcoming months into the autumn.

**C9 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol gofal iechyd sylfaenol ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni? OAQ0866(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn eu hardaloedd. Digwydd hyn ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni. Ar hyn o bryd, mae cynlluniau'n cael eu datblygu gyda chlinigwyr lleol a'r gymuned leol i'w hystyried dros y misoedd nesaf ac yn ystod yr hydref.

2.50 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** While fully supporting the investment and progress made by the NHS in Merthyr and Rhymney, many of my constituents continue to worry about local health services as a whole. I attended a

**Huw Lewis:** Er eu bod yn cefnogi'n llawn y buddsoddiad a'r cynnydd a wnaed gan y GIG ym Merthyr a Rhymni, mae nifer o'm hetholwyr yn dal i boeni am wasanaethau iechyd lleol yn gyffredinol. Bùm mewn

packed public meeting on Monday, with many residents expressing genuine concern about the future of health services in the area. Would you restate to the people of Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney your commitment to delivering on the promise of a new primary healthcare hospital for Merthyr, and reaffirm the Assembly Government's commitment to upgrading services offered at Prince Charles Hospital?

**Brian Gibbons:** On that last point, I think that you probably know that a considerable amount of investment is already going in to Prince Charles Hospital, even as we speak. One of the big challenges in terms of that money going into the hospital is that we must not just replace like with like, but that we deliver genuine value-added services as part of that investment project for the people of Merthyr and Rhymney. We all know that the health of the population in Merthyr is among the worst in Wales and possibly the United Kingdom. Part of the reason behind that, as Derek Wanless told us, is the inadequately developed primary care service and that consequently too many people end up with major complications of diseases that should have been treated at an earlier stage. Greatly enhancing the primary care services in Merthyr and Rhymney has to be a major challenge for us in the Assembly, but, more particularly, for the health community in Merthyr. I would certainly be willing to give a commitment to ensure that that happens.

cyfarfod cyhoeddus ddydd Llun a oedd dan ei sang, a mynegwyd pryder gwirioneddol gan nifer o drigolion ynghylch dyfodol gwasanaethau iechyd yn yr ardal. A fydddech yn datgan eto wrth bobl Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni eich ymrwymiad i gyflawni'r addewid am ysbyty gofal iechyd syflaenol newydd i Ferthyr, ac yn datgan eto ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i uwchraddio gwasanaethau a gynigir yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar y pwynt olaf hwnnw, credaf eich bod, mae'n debyg, yn gwybod bod swm sylweddol eisoes yn cael ei fuddsoddi yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl, wrth inni siarad. Un o'r heriau mwyaf o ran rhoi'r arian hwnnw i'r ysbyty yw bod yn rhaid inni nid yn unig gynnig tebyg am debyg, ond hefyd ddarparu gwasanaethau gwerthychwanegol gwirioneddol fel rhan o'r prosiect buddsoddi hwnnw ar gyfer pobl Merthyr a Rhymni. Gwyddom i gyd fod iechyd pobl Merthyr ymhlith y gwaethaf yng Nghymru, ac o bosibl y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel y dywedodd Derek Wanless wrthym, rhan o'r rheswm y tu ôl i hynny yw'r gwasanaeth gofal sylfaenol nad yw ddatblygu'n ddigonol. O ganlyniad, bod gormod o bobl yn wynebu cymhlethdodau sylweddol gyda chlefydau y dylid bod wedi'u trin yn gynharach. Mae'n rhaid i wella gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol ym Merthyr a Rhymni fod yn her sylweddol inni yn y Cynulliad, ond yn fwy arbennig i'r gymuned iechyd ym Merthyr. Byddwn yn sicr yn barod i ymrwymo i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

### **Y Contract Deintyddol Cyffredinol Newydd The New General Dental Contract**

**C10 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y contract deintyddol cyffredinol newydd? OAQ0840(HSS)

**Q10 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the new general dental contract? OAQ0840(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Information from local health boards and the NHS business services authority indicates that over 97 per cent of dentists have signed up to the new dental contract from 1 April, providing care to over 95 per cent of dental-service patients, who were on the NHS prior to the changes. Additional investment worth £30 million has been provided for NHS dentistry in 2006-07.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gwybodaeth gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdod gwasanaethau busnes y GIG yn nodi bod dros 97 y cant o ddeintyddion wedi ymrwymo i'r contract deintyddol newydd o 1 Ebrill, gan ddarparu gofal i dros 95 y cant o gleifion y gwasanaeth deintyddol a oedd yn rhan o'r GIG cyn y newidiadau. Darparwyd buddsoddiad ychwanegol gwerth £30 miliwn



ar gyfer deintyddiaeth y GIG yn 2006-07.

**Owen John Thomas:** You seem to be looking at the situation through rose-tinted spectacles, Minister. The general dental contract has been rushed through by the Welsh Assembly Government and approximately half of Cardiff's dental practices are involved in unresolved disputes over funding streams. Cardiff Local Health Board has been awarded £1 million to implement the new dental contracts, which practitioners estimate to be approximately £4 million short of the amount required. The ramifications of the situation, if unresolved, could result in more practices leaving the NHS and redundancies, ultimately diminishing access for the public to a national health service dentist. What steps are you taking to avert this potential crisis?

**Owen John Thomas:** Weinidog, mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn edrych ar y sefyllfa'n obeithiol. Rhuthrwyd y contract deintyddol cyffredinol drwodd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac mae tua hanner practisau deintyddol Caerdydd yn wynebu anghydfodau sydd heb eu datrys ynghylch ffrydiau ariannu. Rhoddwyd £1 filiwn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd i roi'r contractau deintyddol newydd ar waith, ac mae ymarferwyr yn amcangyfrif eu bod tua £4 miliwn yn brin o'r swm angenrheidiol. Gallai goblygiadau'r sefyllfa, os na chânt eu datrys, olygu bod mwy o bractisau'n gadael y GIG a diswyddiadau, ac yn y pen draw byddai hynny'n ei gwneud yn fwy anodd cael gwasanaeth deintydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i osgoi'r argyfwng posibl hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** It is extraordinary when you say that I am looking through rose-tinted spectacles because, in reality, spending on NHS dentistry since the Assembly was established has increased by almost 90 per cent. Equally, we know that the level of investment in the NHS in Cardiff is the highest in Wales, at over £15 million. I do not think that that is the view through rose-tinted spectacles; that is the reality. The fact that the overwhelming majority of dentists signed up for the national health service on 1 April speaks for itself. It is true that there are some unresolved contractual issues, which we hope to work through with the individual dentists, but to portray that in the apocalyptic and cataclysmic terms that you have chosen to use here today is totally divorced from reality.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n rhyfeddol eich clywed yn dweud fy mod yn edrych ar y sefyllfa'n obeithiol, oherwydd mewn gwirionedd mae'r gwariant ar ddeintyddiaeth y GIG ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad wedi cynyddu bron 90 y cant. Yn yr un modd, gwyddom mai lefel y buddsoddiad yn y GIG yng Nghaerdydd yw'r uchaf yng Nghymru, sef dros £15 miliwn. Ni chredaf mai edrych ar y sefyllfa'n obeithiol yw hynny; dyna'r gwirionedd. Mae'r ffaith fod mwyafrif helaeth y deintyddion wedi ymrwymo i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol ar 1 Ebrill yn adrodd cyfrolau. Mae'n wir fod rhai problemau gyda chontractau sydd heb eu datrys, a gobeithiwn allu eu datrys gyda'r deintyddion unigol. Ond mae portreadu hynny yn y termau apocalyptiaidd a thrychinebus y dewisech eu defnyddio yma heddiw yn hollol groes i'r gwirionedd.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

#### **Datblygu Gêm Broffesiynol Rygbi'r Gynghrair Development of Professional Rugby League**

**Q1 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the development of professional rugby league in Wales? OAQ0788(CWS)

**C1 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu rygbi'r cynghrair proffesiynol yng Nghymru? OAQ0788(CWS)

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** What recent discussions has the Minister had regarding the development of professional rugby league in Wales? OAQ0785(CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** There is one professional rugby league team in Wales, the Celtic Crusaders. They play their home games at Bridgend's Brewery field and the local AM, Carwyn Jones, tells me that they have made a decent start to the season. If they can beat Blackpool in their next game, they will be well set for promotion.

**Janet Ryder:** I declare an interest as a patron of the Wales Rugby League. I congratulate your Cabinet colleague for supporting such a great team. I hope that you will join me in congratulating the Wales Rugby League on being awarded governing body status by the Sports Council for Wales. That puts it on a par with the Welsh Rugby Union and the Football Association of Wales, and it is a great step forward for rugby league in Wales. I am sure that you are aware that rugby league is now a summer sport; as such, it does not compete with soccer or rugby union because, as their seasons draw to an end, ours is about to kick off in a fortnight's time. That brings problems, however, in that many clubs use the summer to repair their pitches. Would you agree to work with the rugby league and support and help it to gain access to those pitches for the many and increasing number of youth teams, in particular, that are taking up rugby league to ensure that the sport can continue to develop even further?

**Alun Pugh:** We are certainly happy to look at that. Personally, I would never fancy the idea of playing rugby in summer; the pitches would be far too hard for someone like me. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. What is the point of shouting?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly agree that the attainment of governing-body status is good for Welsh rugby league and for sport overall.

**C2 Janet Ryder:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar ar ddatblygu rygbi'r gynghair proffesiynol yng Nghymru? OAQ0785(CWS)

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Mae yna un tîm rygbi'r gynghair proffesiynol yng Nghymru, Celtic Crusaders. Maent yn chwarae eu gemau cartref ar Gae'r Bragdy ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr a dywed yr AC lleol, Carwyn Jones, wrthyf fod y tymor wedi dechrau'n eithaf da iddynt. Os gallant drechu Blackpool yn eu gêm nesaf, bydd cyfle da iddynt gael dyrchafiad.

**Janet Ryder:** Datganaf fuddiant fel noddwr Cynghrair Rygbi Cymru. Hoffwn longyfarch eich cyd-Weinidog yn y Cabinet am gefnogi cystal tîm. Gobeithio yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Cynghrair Rygbi Cymru ar gael statws corff llywodraethu gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru. Mae hynny'n ei roi ar yr un lefel ag Undeb Rygbi Cymru a Chymdeithas Bêl-droed Cymru, ac mae'n gam mawr ymlaen i rygbi'r cynghair yng Nghymru. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol fod rygbi'r cynghair bellach yn gêm haf; fel y cyfryw, nid yw'n cystadlu â phêl-droed na rygbi'r undeb, oherwydd wrth i'w tymhorau hwy dynnu at eu terfyn, mae ein tymor ni ar fin dechrau ymhen pythefnos. Fodd bynnag, daw problemau yn sgîl hynny gan fod nifer o glybiau'n defnyddio'r haf i adfer cyflwr eu caeau. A gytunwch i weithio gyda'r cynghrair rygbi a'i gefnogi a'i helpu i sicrhau bod y caeau hynny ar gael i'r timau ieuenctid niferus a chynyddol, yn arbennig, sy'n dechrau chwarae rygbi'r cynghrair i sicrhau y gall y gamp hon barhau i ddatblygu ymhellach?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym yn sicr yn fodlon edrych ar hynny. Yn bersonol, ni fyddwn yn hoff o'r syniad o chwarae rygbi yn yr haf; byddai'r caeau lawer yn rhy galed i rywun fel fi. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Beth yw diben gweiddi?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr yr wyf yn cytuno bod cael statws corff llywodraethu yn dda i rygbi'r cynghrair yng Nghymru ac i chwaraeon yn gyffredinol.

**Janet Ryder:** You are right that playing rugby league in summer makes it a fast, hard and open game that is not for those who are in any way weak—it takes a real man to play proper rugby league at top-class level. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] Are you aware, Minister, that only yesterday, the rugby league announced its under-19 squad to compete in the European championships at the end of July, that we have eight development officers working in Wales now, and that we operate in 27 schools? Will you join me in congratulating the five students from Wales who have gained their places in the Great Britain squad to tour New Zealand and Australia in July?

**Alun Pugh:** I am happy to do that, and I am pleased that our colleagues in the Sports Council for Wales are taking the development agenda in rugby league seriously. I am pleased to see that some £34,000 has been allocated to support grass-roots work.

**Laura Anne Jones:** How are you working with local authorities to ensure that the much-needed investment in rugby facilities and pitches is being delivered? Of course, if the facilities are available, particularly all-round facilities, as was touched on earlier, then people will have the choice of playing rugby union or rugby league.

**Alun Pugh:** We would certainly like to see more people play both codes of rugby. Rugby is a terrific game that plays a huge part in Welsh culture, and the development of national sports, such as rugby, is a key part of the ‘Climbing Higher’ agenda.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod chwarae rygbi'r cynghrair yn yr haf yn ei gwneud yn gêm gyflym, galed ac agored nad yw'n addas i bobl sy'n wan mewn unrhyw ffordd—mae angen dyn go iawn i chwarae rygbi'r cynghrair yn iawn ar y lefel uchaf. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: ‘O’.] A oeddech yn gwybod, Weinidog, fod y cynghrair rygbi ddoe wedi cyhoeddi ei garfan dan 19 a fydd yn cystadlu ym mhencampwriaeth Ewrop ddiwedd mis Gorffennaf, a bod gennym wyth o swyddogion datblygu yn gweithio yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, a'n bod yn gweithredu mewn 27 o ysgolion? A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch y pum myfyriwr o Gymru a enillodd eu lleoedd yng ngharfan Prydain Fawr i fynd ar daith i Seland Newydd ac Awstralia ym mis Gorffennaf?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn barod iawn i wneud hynny ac yn falch fod Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn cymryd yr agenda ddatblygu ar gyfer rygbi'r cynghrair o ddifrif. Yr wyf yn falch gweld bod tua £34,000 wedi'i neilltuo i gefnogi gwaith ar lawr gwlad

**Laura Anne Jones:** Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod y buddsoddiad y mae cymaint o'i angen gymaint mewn cyfleusterau a chaeau rygbi yn cael ei ddarparu? Wrth gwrs, os bydd y cyfleusterau ar gael, yn enwedig cyfleusterau y gellir eu defnyddio drwy gydol y flwyddyn, fel y trafodwyd yn gynharach, yna gall pobl ddewis chwarae rygbi'r undeb neu rygbi'r cynghrair.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddem yn sicr yn hoffi gweld mwy o bobl yn chwarae'r ddau fath o rygbi. Mae rygbi'n gêm wych sy'n rhan enfawr o ddiwylliant Cymru, ac mae datblygiad chwaraeon cenedlaethol, megis rygbi, yn rhan allweddol o'r agenda ‘Dringo'n Uwch’.

### **Hyrwyddo'r Iaith Gymraeg yng Nghanol De Cymru Promoting the Welsh Language in South Wales Central**

**Q3 Leanne Wood:** What new measures is the Minister implementing to promote the Welsh language in South Wales Central? OAQ0793(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** As part of the Assembly

**C3 Leanne Wood:** Pa gamau newydd y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0793(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Fel rhan o ymrwymiad

Government's commitment to creating a fully bilingual Wales, we are working hard to promote the Welsh language to all of the people of Wales and in every part of Wales—including, of course, your region of South Wales Central.

**Leanne Wood:** I understand that at a public meeting last night in Swansea, you yet again refuted the need for new legislation on the Welsh language. Can you therefore update me on how your programme of persuasion and good will, supported by your Tory allies, is coming along? Also, why are you happy to stand by and let your Labour colleagues—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I was about to call Leighton Andrews to ask a supplementary, but I am having second thoughts, given his sedentary intervention. I understood Leanne Wood to refer to something that the Minister said in Swansea, which may or may not have relevance to South Wales Central.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, can you also tell me why you are happy to stand back and let your Labour colleagues on Rhondda Cynon Taf Council Borough Council slash funding for Welsh-medium playscheme places and after-school clubs, thereby decimating 12 years of hard work and denying my constituents the opportunities that you claim to support? Do you not think that you have a duty to intervene?

**Alun Pugh:** There are many positive news stories coming out from the private sector and the voluntary sector in terms of positive promotion of the Welsh language. Organisations as diverse as BT and the Principality Building Society see the importance of promoting Welsh as part of their Welsh identity. There are a lot of good-news stories around.

In the case of the private and the voluntary sectors, we are not in the business of having major new legislation to go into those areas because we believe that a process of encouragement is securing the best way forward in creating the bilingual Wales that

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i greu Cymru gwbl ddwyieithog, yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg ymhlith holl bobl Cymru ac ym mhob rhan o Gymru—gan gynnwys, wrth gwrs, eich rhanbarth chi yng Nghanol De Cymru.

**Leanne Wood:** Deallaf eich bod, mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus yn Abertawe neithiwr, unwaith eto wedi gwrthod yr angen am ddeddfwriaeth newydd ar yr iaith Gymraeg. A allwch, felly, roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf imi am hynt eich rhaglen o berswâd ac ewyllys da, sy'n cael ei chefnogi gan y Toriaid? A hefyd, pam yr ydych yn fodlon gadael i'ch cyd-Aelodau Llafur—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr oeddwn ar fin galw ar Leighton Andrews i ofyn cwestiwn atodol, ond yr wyf wedi ailfeddwl, o gofio iddo ymyrryd ar ei eistedd. Deallais fod Leanne Wood yn cyfeirio at rywbeth a ddywedodd y Gweinidog yn Abertawe, a all fod yn berthnasol i Ganol De Cymru neu beidio.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, a allwch hefyd ddweud wrthyf pam yr ydych yn fodlon gadael i'ch cyd-Aelodau Llafur ar Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf gwtogi'r cyllid ar gyfer lleoedd mewn cynlluniau chwarae a chlybiau ar ôl ysgol dry gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan ddileu 12 mlynedd o waith caled, felly, a gwrthod y cyfleoedd i'm hetholwyr yr ydych yn honni eu cefnogi? Oni chredwch fod dyletswydd arnoch i ymyrryd?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae nifer o straeon newyddion cadarnhaol yn dod o'r sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol o ran hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg yn gadarnhaol. Mae sefydliadau mor amrywiol â BT a Chymdeithas Adeiladau Principality yn gweld pwysigrwydd hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg fel rhan o'u delwedd Gymreig. Mae yna nifer o straeon newyddion da.

Yn achos y sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol, nid ydym yn bwriadu cyflwyno prif ddeddfwriaeth newydd yn y meysydd hynny, oherwydd credwn fod proses o annog yn sicrhau'r ffordd orau ymlaen i greu'r Gymru ddwyieithog y mae'r holl Aelodau yn

all Members want to see.

**Leighton Andrews:** Weinidog, a wnewch chi longyfarch grwpiau o oedolion yn y Rhondda sy'n dysgu Cymraeg, megis y grwpiau o Faerdy a Llwynypia?

3.00 p.m.

A gytuna'r Gweinidog fod grwpiau fel y rhain yn rhoi cyfle pwysig i bobl sydd eisiau dysgu Cymraeg gyda'i gilydd, ac felly y dylem eu cefnogi?

**Alun Pugh:** Gwn fod llawer o bobl yn y Rhondda yn dysgu'r Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd, a hoffwn eu llongyfarch am eu gwaith.

**David Melding:** Will you join me in congratulating the Welsh Language Board and the Vale of Glamorgan Council who have promoted Welsh among Welsh learners in the vale during the past few years, and its social use in particular? They meet and discuss issues in some of the pubs of the Vale of Glamorgan, and one can almost see the spirit of Iolo Morganwg looming, wanting to make a contribution. [*Laughter.*]

**Alun Pugh:** One of the good things that we can draw from the last census return and other evidence is the upsurge of interest in the Welsh language, in terms of the number of adults learning the Welsh language and the number of enrolments for Welsh-medium education. There is a very positive story to be told in those parts of Wales which, in the past, have not had Welsh speakers in great volumes.

**Jenny Randerson:** I was delighted to see the Welsh language use survey, which flowed directly from 'Iaith Pawb'. It revealed an increase of just under 9 per cent in the number of Welsh speakers in South Wales Central, whereas there was a drop in the number of Welsh speakers elsewhere. However, only 41 per cent of those Welsh speakers were fluent, which serves to underline the importance of the Welsh-medium education system. Therefore, do you share my concern that proposals to boost, develop and expand the thriving and popular Welsh-medium system in Cardiff, met with

dymuno'i gweld.

**Leighton Andrews:** Minister, will you congratulate groups of adults in Rhondda who learn Welsh, such as those groups from Maerdy and Llwynypia?

Does the Minister agree that such groups are an important opportunity for those who wish to learn Welsh to get together, and that we should, therefore, support them?

**Alun Pugh:** I am aware that many people in Rhondda are currently learning Welsh, and I congratulate them on their work.

**David Melding:** A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chyngor Bro Morgannwg sydd wedi bod yn hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg, a'i defnyddio'n gymdeithasol yn benodol, ymhlith dysgwyr Cymraeg yn y fro yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf? Byddant yn cwrdd i drafod materion yn rhai o'r tafarndai ym Mro Morgannwg, ac mae ysbryd Iolo Morganwg i'w deimlo yno bron, yn ysu am gael gwneud cyfraniad. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Alun Pugh:** Un o'r pethau da y gallwn ei gasglu o ganlyniadau'r cyfrifiad diwethaf a thystiolaeth arall yw'r cynnydd yn y diddordeb yn y Gymraeg, o ran nifer yr oedolion sy'n dysgu Cymraeg a'r nifer sy'n cofrestru ar gyfer addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae stori gadarnhaol iawn i'w hadrodd yn y rhannau hynny o Gymru lle na fu llawer o siaradwyr Cymraeg yn y gorffennol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld yr arolwg ar ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg, a ddeilliodd yn uniongyrchol o 'Iaith Pawb'. Dangosodd gynnydd o 9 y cant bron yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg yng Nghanol De Cymru, ond gostyngiad yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg mewn mannau eraill. Fodd bynnag, dim ond 41 y cant o'r siaradwyr Cymraeg hynny sy'n rhugl, sy'n tanlinellu pwysigrwydd y system addysg Gymraeg. Felly, a ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu am yr ymateb negyddol iawn a gafwyd i gynigion i roi hwb, datblygu ac ehangu'r system Gymraeg ffyniannus a phoblogaidd

such a gravely negative response during the consultation period, which included a strong and overtly anti-Welsh-language approach by some of the campaigners? Will you condemn that element of the campaign?

**Alun Pugh:** We want to see a positive response to the growing demand for Welsh-medium education in all parts of Wales—let us be clear about that. You also mentioned the issue of evidence, and I said earlier that it was very encouraging to see that growth in the overall census results, which reverses nearly a century of decline in the language. However, we have never had enough detailed evidence to properly inform language planning, and that is why, as part of the increased investment in the Welsh language, we have ploughed a considerable amount of resources into additional census information and the amassing of additional evidence, which will inform future policy development.

yng Nghaerdydd yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori, gan gynnwys dull gwrth-Gymreig cryf ac amlwg gan rai o'r ymgyrchwyr? A wnewch chi gondemnio'r elfen honno yn yr ymgyrch?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym am weld ymateb cadarnhaol i'r galw cynyddol am addysg Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru—gadewch inni fod yn glir am hynny. Soniech hefyd am dystiolaeth, a dywedais yn gynharach ei bod yn galonogol iawn gweld y twf hwnnw yng nghanlyniadau cyffredinol y cyfrifiad, sy'n gwrthdroi bron i ganrif o ddirywiad yn yr iaith. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym erioed wedi cael digon o dystiolaeth fanwl i lywio'r broses o gynllunio iaith yn gywir, a dyna pam yr ydym, fel rhan o'r buddsoddi cynyddol yn y Gymraeg, wedi rhoi llawer iawn o adnoddau i gael gwybodaeth ychwanegol o'r cyfrifiad ac i gasglu tystiolaeth ychwanegol, a fydd yn llywio'r broses o ddatblygu polisiau yn y dyfodol.

### **Gwella Mynediad at Ddrama a Cherddoriaeth Improving Access to Drama and Music**

**Q4 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on improving access to drama and music in Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney? OAQ0796(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Almost £125,000 was spent by the Arts Council of Wales on projects in the Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney areas in 2005-06, including £25,000 specifically aimed at developing music activities. A further £250,000 was given to Spectacle Theatre to develop drama projects in Merthyr Tydfil and the surrounding areas, but I accept that we need to do more.

**Huw Lewis:** Thank you, Minister; it is moving in the right direction. However, there can be no doubt that Merthyr is in dire need of a well-situated and sustainably funded arts venue that serves and engages with the local community. As regards the arts, Merthyr remains the dog that has not yet barked; it is a town ideally situated to serve the cultural needs of its own, and many other, communities, but, so far, it has been starved of the necessary investment and vision. Will the Minister join me in recognising the

**C4 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wella'r mynediad i ddrama a cherddoriaeth ym Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni? OAQ0796(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Gwariwyd bron i £125,000 gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar brosiectau yn ardaloedd Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni yn 2005-06, gan gynnwys £25,000 a neilltuwyd yn benodol i ddatblygu gweithgareddau cerddoriaeth. Rhoddwyd £250,000 yn ychwanegol i Theatr Spectacle i ddatblygu prosiectau drama ym Merthyr Tudful a'r ardaloedd o amgylch, ond yr wyf yn derbyn bod angen inni wneud mwy.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch, Weiniidog; yr ydym yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiau mae angen dybryd ym Merthyr am leoliad celfyddydol mewn man da sy'n cael ei ariannu mewn ffordd gynaliadwy ac sy'n gwasanaethu'r gymuned leol ac yn ymgysylltu â hi. O ran y celfyddydau, nid yw Merthyr wedi bod mewn sefyllfa i ddangos ei photensial llawn; mae'r dref mewn man delfrydol i wasanaethu anghenion diwylliannol ei chymunedau ei hun, a llawer cymuned arall, ond hyd yma ni welwyd y

importance of a new arts venue for Merthyr Tydfil and the huge cultural and economic boost that it would give not only to Merthyr, but to the northern Valleys as a whole?

**Alun Pugh:** This is a matter that I raised in early meetings with Dai Smith, the interim chair of the Arts Council of Wales. You are right to say that it is not just a cultural imperative, important though that is. There are much wider concerns in terms of social inclusion and economic development.

**William Graham:** Do you agree that the money spent by the Arts Council of Wales in 2005—nearly £40,000 on seven projects in the borough to engage children in a wide range of musical activities—should be further encouraged?

**Alun Pugh:** Yes, and that is why the Assembly Government has consistently increased investment in culture in general, and in arts in particular.

buddsoddiad na'r weledigaeth angenrheidiol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i gydnabod pwysigrwydd lleoliad celfyddydol newydd ar gyfer Merthyr Tudful a'r hwb diwylliannol ac economaidd enfawr y byddai lle o'r fath yn ei roi, nid yn unig i Ferthyr ond i'r Cymoedd gogleddol yn gyffredinol?

**Alun Pugh:** Codais y mater hwn mewn cyfarfodydd yn gynharach gyda Dai Smith, cadeirydd dros dro Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud nad y rheidrwydd diwylliannol yw'r unig beth i'w ystyried, er bod hwnnw'n bwysig. Mae pryderon llawer ehangach o ran cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a datblygu economaidd.

**William Graham:** A ydych yn cytuno o dylid rhoi anogaeth bellach i'r arian a wariwyd gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn 2005—bron i £40,000 ar saith o brosiectau yn y fwrdeistref i gynnwys plant mewn amrywiaeth eang o weithgareddau cerddorol?

**Alun Pugh:** Ydwyf, a dyna pam mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyson wedi cynyddu buddsoddiad mewn diwylliant yn gyffredinol, ac yn y celfyddydau'n benodol.

### **Adeiladau Hanesyddol Historical Buildings**

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd ein hadeiladau hanesyddol? OAQ0767(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae ein hadeiladau hanesyddol yn rhan bwysig o'n treftadaeth. Mae gennym 30,000 o adeiladau ar y rhestr statudol ar hyn o bryd. Mae treftadaeth yn cefnogi llawer o bethau, yn enwedig twristiaeth ac addysg.

**Owen John Thomas:** Fel yr ydych yn cydnabod, rhan bwysig o etifeddiaeth gyfoethog Cymru yw'r amgylchedd adeiledig. Mae ein cestyll, er enghraifft, yn adlewyrchu ein gwytnwch fel cenedl, ac mae gennym eglwysi, capeli, ac adeiladau diwydiannol, tai mawr y boneddigion a bythynnod y werin, sydd i gyd yn bwysig wrth greu delwedd gadarnhaol ac atyniadol o Gymru. Mae'n drueni nad yw Cadw yn fodlon cydnabod pwysigrwydd llawer o adeiladau o bwysigrwydd lleol oni bai bod ganddynt arwyddocâd cenedlaethol hefyd. Pa

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of our historic buildings? OAQ0767(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Our historic buildings are an important part of our heritage. We have 30,000 buildings on the statutory list at present. Heritage supports many things, especially tourism and education.

**Owen John Thomas:** As you have acknowledged, an important part of Wales's rich heritage is our built environment. Our castles, for example, are testimony to our resilience as a nation, and we have churches, chapels and industrial buildings, the great houses of the gentry and the cottages of ordinary people, which are all important in creating a positive and attractive image of Wales. It is disappointing that Cadw is not prepared to acknowledge the importance of many buildings of local importance unless they are also of national significance. What

gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i newid y meini prawf a ddefnyddir gan Cadw fel y gallwn warchod a hyrwyddo adeiladau sydd yn drysorau lleol?

**Alun Pugh:** I am not sure that the Edwardian castles stand as a monument to our strength as a nation. You know that listing matters are covered by the law. There will be a major review in terms of heritage protection in the autumn, which will be a joint review conducted by us and colleagues in the Department for Culture Media and Sport. There will be an opportunity for consultation at that time and I know that you will have much to say on it.

**Owen John Thomas:** Bob tro y caiff adeilad o arwyddocâd lleol ei ddymchwel, mae'r gymuned, a Chymru gyfan, yn colli rhan o'i hetifeddiaeth ac o'i photensial economaidd i ddenu buddsoddiad. Er enghraifft, nid oes un o'r 100 o lanfeydd glo Caerdydd ar ôl i goffâu statws y porthladd fel prif borthladd glo'r byd. A fydddech yn fodlon annog awdurdodau lleol i wneud arolwg o'u hadeiladau arwyddocaol fel y gallwn warchod i'r dyfodol eu hetifeddiaeth gyfoethog?

**Alun Pugh:** I am not sure that you are right to say that there is nothing left of importance in terms of Cardiff's maritime history. As I said, we have some 30,000 listed buildings, which are listed against statutory criteria. It is down in the law. There will also be this review in the autumn, and I have every intention of taking that through to legislation in due course.

**Lisa Francis:** The emerging culture strategy and the environment strategy that landed on our desks today offer unique opportunities to seize the day and develop ambitious outcomes for Wales's unique heritage, a large part of which is made up of our historic buildings. Is it not high time that we had an annual state of the historic environment report, including an audit of the built historic environment?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that Wales is particularly rich in terms of its built

steps are you taking to change the criteria used by Cadw so that we can safeguard and promote buildings that are local treasures?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r cestyll Edwardaidd yn dangos ein cryfder fel cenedl. Gwyddoch fod materion sy'n ymwneud â rhestru yn cael eu cynnwys gan y gyfraith. Bydd adolygiad mawr o'r broses o ddiogelu treftadaeth yn yr hydref, a fydd yn adolygiad ar y cyd a arweinir gennym ni a chydweithwyr yn yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon. Bydd cyfle i ymgynghori bryd hynny, a gwn y bydd gennych lawer i'w ddweud ar y mater.

**Owen John Thomas:** Every time a building of local significance is demolished, the community, and Wales as a whole, loses part of its heritage and its economic potential to attract investment. For example, not one of the 100 coal jetties in Cardiff remains to acknowledge the status of the port as the world's main coal-exporting port. Would you be prepared to encourage local authorities to conduct a survey of their buildings of importance so that we can safeguard their rich heritage for the future?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ydych yn gywir i ddweud nad oes dim byd o bwys ar ôl o ran hanes morol Caerdydd. Fel y dywedais, mae gennym tua 30,000 o adeiladau rhestredig, a restrir yn erbyn meini prawf statudol. Mae hynny wedi'i nodi yn y gyfraith. Gwneir yr adolygiad hwnnw hefyd yn yr hydref, ac yr wyf yn llawn fwriadu sicrhau bod deddfwriaeth yn cael ei llunio yn sgîl hynny maes o law.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae'r strategaeth ddiwylliant a'r strategaeth amgylcheddol ddiweddaraf a laniodd ar ein desgiau heddiw yn gyfleoedd unigryw i fanteisio i'r eithaf a datblygu canlyniadau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer treftadaeth unigryw Cymru y mae ein hadeiladau hanesyddol yn rhan fawr ohoni. Onid yw'n bryd inni gael adroddiad blynyddol ar gyflwr yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, gan gynnwys archwiliad o'r amgylchedd hanesyddol adeiledig?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod Cymru yn gyfoethog iawn yn ei hamgylchedd



environment. We think in terms of Edwardian castles but, turning one's eyes to the south of the nation, Blaenavon ironworks has rightly been regarded as a world heritage site. In terms of an annual report, Cadw has produced such reports for many years.

**Lisa Francis:** That is not quite the same thing as what I am asking for. An annual state of the historic environment report has been produced by English Heritage for the past five years. The report provides an account of current trends that affect the historic environment, including buildings, and the threats and challenges faced by those who are charged with running all of that in a sustainable way. Are you saying that Wales does not deserve the same thing?

**Alun Pugh:** No. I am saying that I am not sure that we should simply ape the practice of English quangos. I certainly believe that the protection of the historic environment is rightly an important statutory obligation for the Assembly.

adeiledig. Yr ydym yn dueddol o feddwl am gestyll Edwardaidd, ond os trown ein sylw at y de, mae gwaith haearn Blaenafon wedi'i ystyried, ac yn haeddiannol felly, yn safle treftadaeth y byd. O ran adroddiad blynyddol, mae Cadw wedi cynhyrchu adroddiadau o'r fath ers blynyddoedd lawer.

**Lisa Francis:** Nid yw hynny'n union yr un fath â'r hyn yr wyf yn gofyn amdano. Mae adroddiad blynyddol ar gyflwr yr amgylchedd hanesyddol wedi'i gynhyrchu gan English Heritage dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi cyfrif o dueddiadau presennol sy'n effeithio ar yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, gan gynnwys adeiladau, a'r bygythiadau a'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r rheini sy'n gyfrifol am redeg hynny i gyd mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. A ydych yn dweud nad yw Cymru yn haeddu'r un peth?

**Alun Pugh:** Na. Dweud yr wyf nad wyf yn siŵr a ddylem ddilyn arferion cwangos yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn bendant o'r farn fod gwarchod yr amgylchedd hanesyddol, yn haeddiannol, yn rhwymedigaeth statudol bwysig i'r Cynulliad.

### Saethyddiaeth Maes Field Archery

**Q6 Leighton Andrews:** What is the Minister doing to encourage field archery in Wales? OAQ0798(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Support for archery in Wales is provided through the Sports Council for Wales, in consultation with the governing bodies of the sport. In the case of field archery, this involves the Welsh Field Archery Association.

3.10 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** As you are aware, the 2008 World Field Archery Championships are scheduled to be held in the Rhondda. The Pentref Bowmen have been in discussion with your department regarding support for this event. This will be a major opportunity to promote not only field archery, but the Rhondda, globally. I encourage you and your officials to support this event, as I am sure Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council will be doing.

**C6 Leighton Andrews:** Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hybu saethyddiaeth maes yng Nghymru? OAQ0798(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae saethyddiaeth yng Nghymru yn cael cefnogaeth drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, drwy ymgynghori â'r cyrff llywodraethu saethyddiaeth. O ran saethyddiaeth maes, mae Cymdeithas Saethyddiaeth Maes Cymru yn gysylltiedig.

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y gwyddoch, cynhelir Pencampwriaethau Saethyddiaeth Maes y Byd 2008 yn Rhondda. Mae Saethwyr Pentref wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'ch adran i gael cymorth ar gyfer y digwyddiad hwn. Bydd hwn yn gyfle mawr, nid yn unig i hyrwyddo saethyddiaeth maes ond hefyd Rhondda ei hun, ar draws y byd. Hoffwn eich annog chi a'ch swyddogion i gefnogi'r digwyddiad hwn, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda

Cynon Taf yn ei wneud.

**Alun Pugh:** We support the event coming to the Rhondda. In terms of direct financial assistance, that will have to be evaluated against our criteria for supporting major events. It is true to say that this will generate additional bed nights in areas such as the Rhondda, which is good to see. We will have a further meeting. I understand that Jean Howells, the chair of the organising committee, met my officials earlier this week. We would want to take this on and we would take a supportive approach to negotiations.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r ffaith ffod y digwyddiad i gael ei gynnal yn Rhondda. O ran cymorth ariannol uniongyrchol, bydd yn rhaid pwysu a mesur hynny yn erbyn ein meini prawf ar gyfer cefnogi digwyddiadau mawr. Mae'n wir dweud y bydd hyn yn golygu bod mwy o bobl yn aros mewn ardaloedd fel Rhondda, sy'n beth da i'w weld. Byddwn yn cael cyfarfod pellach. Deallaf fod Jean Howells, cadeirydd y pwyllgor trefnu, wedi cyfarfod â'm swyddogion yn gynharach yn yr wythnos. Byddem am fod yn rhan o hyn, a byddai gennym agwedd gefnogol at drafodaethau.

**Alun Cairns:** The Welsh Conservative Party is keen to support the World Field Archery Championships in the Rhondda, as we do all field sports, because they have an important part to play. Following the ban on hunting, will the Minister pledge his support for game shooting, which is another important field sport? Many of those participating in game shooting—

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol yng Nghymru yn awyddus i gefnogi Pencampwriaethau Saethyddiaeth Maes y Byd yn Rhondda, fel y gwnawn gydag unrhyw chwaraeon maes, oherwydd bod iddynt ran bwysig i'w chwarae. Yn dilyn y gwaharddiad ar hela, a wnaiff y Gweinidog addo cefnogi saethu gêm, sydd hefyd yn bwysig fel chwaraeon maes? Mae nifer o'r rheini sy'n cymryd rhan mewn saethu gêm-

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think that your question is in order. I stand to be corrected by some of my hunting friends, but I do not believe that archery is used to shoot game in Wales any more.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chredaf fod eich cwestiwn yn berthnasol. Efallai y caf fy nghywiro gan rai o'm cyfeillion sy'n hela, ond ni chredaf fod saethyddiaeth yn cael ei defnyddio i saethu gêm yng Nghymru mwyach.

**Alun Cairns:** With the greatest of respect, Presiding Officer, my question relates to field sports in general. I hope that the Minister would share my support of other field sports, such as shooting.

**Alun Cairns:** Gyda'r parch mwyaf, Lywydd, mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn â chwaraeon maes yn gyffredinol. Gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy nghefnogaeth i chwaraeon maes eraill, fel saethu.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The question refers specifically to field archery. Therefore, I stand by my ruling. It is not about general field sports, unless any Member can urgently show me that bows and arrows are still used in the pursuit of field sports.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r cwestiwn yn cyfeirio'n benodol at saethyddiaeth maes. Felly, yr wyf yn cadw at fy nyfarniad. Nid yw'n ymwneud â chwaraeon maes yn gyffredinol, oni all unrhyw Aelod ddangos imi yn awr bod bwâu a saethau yn cael eu defnyddio ym myd chwaraeon maes o hyd.

**Alun Pugh:** It is good to see the Conservatives supporting the principles of Robin Hood.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n dda gweld y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi egwyddorion Robin Hood.

**Cynllun Chwaraeon y Ddraig  
Dragon Sport Initiative**

**Q7 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister provide an update on the Dragon Sport initiative? OAQ0784(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** A total of 96 per cent of our primary and junior schools and nearly 103,000 children have taken part in Dragon Sport activities in the last year. It is good to see that more than 700 sports clubs are running Dragon Sport activities and that more than 5,000 volunteers are involved in this programme.

**John Griffiths:** The success of this scheme relies on engaging volunteers and commitment at a local level. In that context, would you join me in congratulating Newport, which saw 4,000 children take part in sessions in the past year alone? This has been primarily assisted by the University of Wales, Newport athletics club and the Newport Gwent Dragons, which have an impressive outreach programme for schools in the area.

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that the Dragon Sport programme has been successful across Wales. Newport has been particularly successful because every eligible school in the city is engaged in the programme. When we roll it out to secondary schools later this year, I am sure that it will get an equally enthusiastic response.

**Glyn Davies:** I am a great supporter of Dragon Sport and what it has achieved. It is wonderful for young children in Wales. An important aspect of the programme is the ability to play on playing fields and green spaces in schools in Wales. Will you improve the record keeping in terms of the way in which playing fields are being used? I have tried to find out the extent to which we are losing playing fields in Wales, but the information is unavailable.

**Alun Pugh:** We get the occasional problem

**C7 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynllun Chwaraeon y Ddraig? OAQ0784(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae 96 y cant o'n hysgolion cynradd a'n hysgolion iau a bron i 103,000 o blant wedi cymryd rhan yng ngweithgareddau Chwaraeon y Ddraig yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Mae'n dda gweld bod dros 700 o glybiau chwaraeon yn cynnal gweithgareddau Chwaraeon y Ddraig a bod dros 5,000 o wirfoddolwyr yn gysylltiedig â'r rhaglen hon.

**John Griffiths:** Mae llwyddiant y cynllun hwn yn dibynnu ar ymgysylltu â gwirfoddolwyr a sicrhau ymrwymiad ar lefel leol. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Casnewydd, lle mae 4,000 o blant wedi cymryd rhan mewn sesiynau yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yn unig? Cafwyd cymorth yn y lle cyntaf gan glwb athletau Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd a Dreigiau Casnewydd Gwent, sydd â rhaglen allgymorth nodedig ar gyfer ysgolion yn yr ardal.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod rhaglen Chwaraeon y Ddraig wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ledled Cymru. Bu Casnewydd yn arbennig o lwyddiannus oherwydd bod pob ysgol gymwys yn y ddinas wedi cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen. Pan fyddwn yn cyflwyno'r rhaglen i ysgolion uwchradd yn ddiweddarach eleni, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr ymateb lawn mor frwdfrydig.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf yn gefnogwr brwd i raglen Chwaraeon y Ddraig a'r hyn y mae wedi'i gyflawni. Mae'n rhaglen ragorol ar gyfer plant ifanc yng Nghymru. Un o agweddau pwysig y rhaglen yw'r gallu i chwarae ar feysydd chwarae a manau gwyrdd mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi wella'r broses o gadw cofnodion am y ffordd y caiff meysydd chwarae eu defnyddio? Yr wyf wedi ceisio dod o hyd i wybodaeth am y graddau yr ydym yn colli meysydd chwarae yng Nghymru, ond nid yw'r wybodaeth ar gael.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn cael ambell problem

with the disposal of school playing fields, but it is not a systematic problem across Wales. We do not have the problems here that they have, for example, in south-east England, where there are intensive development pressures and land values are sky high. Therefore, there is a systematic problem there. I am pleased to say that we do not have those problems in Wales, but we occasionally have problems with specific sites. In those circumstances, we take advice from the Sports Council for Wales.

gwerthu meysydd chwarae ysgolion, ond nid yw'n broblem systematig ledled Cymru. Nid ydym yn gweld yr un problemau yma ag a welir, er enghraifft, yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, lle mae pwysau mawr i ddatblygu tir a gwerthoedd tir yn aruthrol o uchel. Felly, mae problem systematig yno. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud nad oes gennym y problemau hynny yng Nghymru, ond weithiau byddwn yn wynebu problemau gyda safleoedd penodol. Bryd hynny, byddwn yn ceisio cyngor gan Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru.

### **CyMAL—Amgueddfeydd, Archifau a Llyfrgelloedd Cymru** **CyMAL—Museums, Archives and Libraries Wales**

**Q8 Rosemary Butler:** Will the Minister provide a progress report on CyMAL? OAQ0763(CWS)

**C8 Rosemary Butler:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd am CyMAL? OAQ0763(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Since its establishment in April 2004, CyMAL has made excellent progress in the establishment of advice and support services for local museums, archives and libraries. This activity is underpinned by new grant schemes totalling more than £1.8 million a year, which will ensure that more people benefit from these public services.

**Alun Pugh:** Ers ei sefydlu yn Ebrill 2004, mae CyMAL wedi gwneud cynnydd ardderchog wrth sefydlu gwasanaethau cyngor a chymorth i amgueddfeydd, archifau a llyfrgelloedd lleol. Ategir y gweithgarwch hwn gan gynlluniau grant newydd gwerth dros £1.8 miliwn y flwyddyn, a fydd yn sicrhau y gall mwy o bobl gael budd o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hyn.

**Rosemary Butler:** Thank you for that response, Minister. The recent award by CyMAL of £8,256 to Newport Museum and Art Gallery for the display of artefacts from the Newport medieval ship was very well received. That was on top of the £3 million that has already been committed by the Welsh Assembly Government for the conservation and eventual display of the ship, which is of international archaeological importance.

**Rosemary Butler:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Cafwyd croeso cynnes i'r swm o £8,256 a roddwyd yn ddiweddar gan CyMAL i Amgueddfa ac Oriel Gelf Casnewydd i arddangos arteffactau o long ganoloesol Casnewydd. Yr oedd hynny'n ychwanegol at y £3 miliwn a ymrwymwyd eisoes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddiogelu'r llong, sydd o bwysigrwydd archeolegol rhyngwladol, a'i harddangos yn y pen draw.

In the words of Jennifer Stuart, the heritage lottery fund's manager for Wales, museums are evolving, and the more interactive, innovative and high tech they are, the more chance they have of survival. Have you any plans for CyMAL to develop a funding stream specifically for the development of high-tech and innovative projects for the display of our national heritage across Wales?

Yng ngeiriau Jennifer Stewart, rheolwraig cronfa dreftadaeth y loteri i Gymru, mae amgueddfeydd yn esblygu, a pho fwyaf rhyngweithiol, arloesol a thechnolegol ydynt, mwyaf oll yw eu gobaidh o barhau. A oes gennych unrhyw gynlluniau i CyMAL ddatblygu llyfr arian yn benodol ar gyfer datblygu prosiectau arloesol sy'n defnyddio uwch dechnoleg i arddangos ein treftadaeth genedlaethol ledled Cymru?

**Alun Pugh:** You are certainly right in saying that CyMAL's grant schemes, both large and

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud bod cynlluniau grant CyMAL,

small, are making a real difference in Wales. We have no intention of introducing a long-term revenue support grant scheme, because some of those local museums and archives are run by voluntary organisations, and some by local authorities. We are not in the business of supplying core funding, but, for the activities that you are talking about, such as the development work and innovative new projects, there will certainly be continued access to funding.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Despite the fact that certain public libraries are performing extremely well—and I have to commend Wrexham Library, which is an excellent library—I understand that only nine authorities achieved the standard in March 2005. What measures are you taking to ensure that all local authority public libraries achieve your 2005-08 targets?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to say that there is a lack of consistency across different public library authorities in Wales. You mentioned Wrexham, and I would certainly agree that it is doing some very good work. In fact, it has been commissioned to do some additional work on marketing for the library sector across Wales. John Griffiths also pointed out last week that Newport is doing well. It is fair to say that there is a lack of consistency, but, overall, the analysis of the public library standards shows that they are driving up standards, and it is also heartening to see a growth in expenditure on library books and, best of all, a 14 per cent increase in visitor numbers.

waeth beth fo'u maint, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yng Nghymru. Nid oes gennym fwriad i gyflwyno cynllun grant cynnal refeniw hirdymor, gan fod rhai o'r amgueddfeydd a'r archifau lleol hynny'n cael eu rhedeg gan sefydliadau gwirfoddol, a rhai gan awdurdodau lleol. Nid ydym yn gyfrifol am ddarparu cyllid craidd, ond ar gyfer y gweithgareddau a grybwyllwyd gennych, megis y gwaith datblygu a phrosiectau arloesol newydd, yn sicr bydd arian ar gael iddynt o hyd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Er bod rhai llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus yn perfformio'n eithriadol o dda—ac mae'n rhaid imi ganmol Llyfrgell Wrecsam, sy'n llyfrgell ardderchog—deallaf mai naw awdurdod yn unig a gyrhaeddodd y safon ym mis Mawrth 2005. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau y bydd llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus pob awdurdod lleol yn cyrraedd eich targedau ar gyfer 2005-08?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle yn dweud bod diffyg cysondeb ar draws gwahanol awdurdodau llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Yr oedech yn sôn am Wrecsam, ac yn sicr byddwn yn cytuno ei bod yn gwneud gwaith da iawn. Yn wir, fe'i comisiynwyd i wneud rhywfaint o waith ychwanegol ar farchnata ar gyfer y sector llyfrgelloedd ledled Cymru. Eglurodd John Griffiths hefyd yr wythnos diwethaf fod Casnewydd yn gwneud yn dda. Mae'n deg dweud bod diffyg cysondeb, ond ar y cyfan dengys y dadansoddiad o safonau llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus eu bod yn codi eu safonau. Mae hefyd yn galonogol gweld twf yn y gwariant ar lyfrau llyfrgell, ac yn well na hynny, cynnydd o 14 y cant yn nifer yr ymwelwyr.

### **Digwyddiadau Chwaraeon Mawr yng Nghaerdydd Hosting Major Sporting Events in Cardiff**

**Q9 Jonathan Morgan:** What assessment has the Minister made of the impact upon Cardiff and south Wales of hosting major sporting events as a result of the helpful delays to the new Wembley stadium? OAQ0799(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** As a consequence of the delays in construction at Wembley stadium, the Millennium Stadium hosted the FA Cup final

**C9 Jonathan Morgan:** Pa asesiad mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith cynnal digwyddiadau chwaraeon mawr ar Gaerdydd a de Cymru o ganlyniad i'r oedi gyda stadiwm newydd Wembley? OAQ0799(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** O ganlyniad i'r oedi wrth adeiladu stadiwm Wembley, cynhaliwyd rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA yn Stadiwm y

last weekend—a terrific match—and will be staging the Football League play-offs and the FA Community Shield. Each of these events will bring a significant number of visitors to south Wales, boosting the local economy, and, hopefully, boosting Swansea City Football Club too.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Thank you, Minister, for that reply. While I accept that there are huge benefits to the capital city, particularly for our businesses, the promotion of tourism, and the further recognition of Cardiff as a vibrant capital city capable of hosting such events, there are additional costs that have to be borne, particularly by the local authority. What assistance is provided to Cardiff to help it to cope with its responsibility as the capital city?

**Alun Pugh:** Part of the difficulties of being a capital city is that you get more than your fair share of these highlight events. Events such as the FA Cup final have been a terrific advert for Cardiff and for Wales. The extra cost pressure is part of the general rate support grant that the local authority receives.

Mileniwm y penwythnos diwethaf—gêm ardderchog—a chynhelir gemau terfynol y Cynghair Pêl-droed a Tharian Gymunedol yr FA yno hefyd. Daw pob un o'r digwyddiadau hyn â nifer sylweddol o ymwelwyr i dde Cymru, gan hybu'r economi leol, a hybu Clwb Pêl-droed Dinas Abertawe hefyd, gobeithio.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ymateb hwnnw. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod buddiannau enfawr i'r brifddinas, yn arbennig o ran ein busnesau, hyrwyddo twristiaeth, ac ennill cydnabyddiaeth bellach i Gaerdydd fel prifddinas lewyrchus a all gynnal digwyddiadau o'r fath, mae yna gostau ychwanegol hefyd, yn arbennig i'r awdurdod lleol. Pa gymorth a roddir i Gaerdydd i'w helpu i ddelio â'i chyfrifoldeb fel y brifddinas?

**Alun Pugh:** Rhan o'r anawsterau o fod yn brifddinas yw'r ffaith y cewch fwy na'ch cyfran deg o'r digwyddiadau blaenllaw hyn. Yr oedd digwyddiadau fel rownd derfynol Cwpan yr FA yn hysbyseb ardderchog i Gaerdydd ac i Gymru. Mae pwysau'r costau ychwanegol yn rhan o'r grant cynnal trethi cyffredinol a roddir i'r awdurdod lleol.

### Hyrwyddo Chwaraeon Promoting Sport

**Q10 Irene James:** What action is the Minister taking to promote sport in Wales? OAQ0778(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Our 'Climbing Higher' strategy is placing sport and physical activity at the heart of Welsh life and Government. Working with our Sports Council for Wales, a fully integrated 'Climbing Higher' action plan will be launched shortly, allowing us to promote the delivery of the very ambitious targets that we have set ourselves.

**C10 Irene James:** Pa gamau mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo chwaraeon yng Nghymru? OAQ0778(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae ein strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch' yn golygu bod chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol wrth wraidd bywyd a Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Gan weithio gyda Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, caiff cynllun gweithredu 'Dringo'n Uwch' cwbl integredig ei lansio'n fuan, a fydd yn caniatáu inni hyrwyddo darparu'r targedau'r uchelgeisiol iawn yr ydym wedi eu gosod inni ein hunain.

3.20 p.m.

**Irene James:** Thank you for that response, Minister. Will you join me in commending the Abercarn Bowls Club, which has successfully bid for a grant of over £15,000 to provide a new women's changing room

**Irene James:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo Clwb Bowls Aber-carn, sydd wedi gwneud cais llwyddiannus am grant o dros £15,000 i ddarparu ystafell newid

and to provide greater access and participation among local women? Do you agree that bowling, as a sport for everyone of all ages, is an excellent activity that promotes better health for all the community?

**Alun Pugh:** Yes. Such grants make a huge difference for the better in communities. As well as contributing towards health gain, the sport improves the social lives of the people who take part in it.

newydd i fenywod, ac i sicrhau gwell mynediad a chyfranogiad ymhlith menywod lleol? A gytunwch fod bowlio, fel chwaraeon i bawb o bob oed, yn weithgaredd ardderchog sy'n hyrwyddo gwell iechyd i'r gymuned gyfan?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf. Mae grantiau o'r fath yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr er gwell mewn cymunedau. Yn ogystal â chyfrannu at wella iechyd, mae'r gweithgaredd yn gwella bywydau cymdeithasol y bobl sy'n cymryd rhan.

## **Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee**

### **Datblygiadau Technoleg Gwybodaeth a Chyfathrebu Information and Communications Technology Developments**

**Q1 Alun Cairns:** Will the representative of the House Committee make a statement on the latest information and communications technology developments for Assembly Members? OAQ0010(HC)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** ICT developments for Assembly Members in the coming months will include enhancing the capability of the broadband facility. The work has three aspects. The first is an increase in the network capacity providing up to 8MB broadband, although the exact bandwidth will depend on an individual's ability to take that much. The second is the provision of a second broadband connection for every Member, enabling Members to have a broadband connection in their home or anywhere else of their choice. The third is broadband access for Members' laptops through a virtual private network, which will enable Members to use laptops at most locations where broadband connections are available.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to the Member for his response. Will he agree that we have made significant progress over the past 12 to 18 months in upgrading services for Members in general and for Assembly Parliamentary Service staff? Although many of the transformation changes have been quite difficult to achieve, in relation to Merlin and its support in this respect, in view

**C1 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff cynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ ddatganiad am y datblygiadau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu diweddaraf ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad? OAQ0010(HC)

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Bydd datblygiadau TGCh ar gyfer Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ystod y misoedd nesaf yn cynnwys gwella grym y cyfleuster band eang. Mae tair agwedd ar y gwaith. Mae'r agwedd gyntaf yn cynnwys cynyddu capasiti'r rhwydwaith gan ddarparu band eang hyd at 8MB, er y bydd union led y band yn dibynnu ar allu unigolyn i gymryd cymaint â hynny. Mae a wnelo'r ail â darparu ail gyswllt band eang i bob Aelod, gan alluogi Aelodau i sefydlu cyswllt band eang yn eu cartrefi neu rywle arall o'u dewis. Bydd y drydedd yn rhoi mynediad band eang i gliniaduron Aelodau drwy rwydwaith preifat rhithwir, a fydd yn galluogi Aelodau i ddefnyddio gliniaduron yn y rhan fwyaf o fannau lle mae cysylltiadau band eang ar gael.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ei ymateb. A yw'n cytuno ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd sylweddol yn ystod y 12 i 18 mis diwethaf yn uwchraddio gwasanaethau i Aelodau yn gyffredinol, ac i staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad? Er bod llawer o'r newidiadau trawsffurfio wedi bod yn ddigon anodd eu cyflawni, o ran Merlin a'r cymorth cysylltiedig yn y cyd-

of the fact that the IT sub-committee of the House Committee is now reviewing all wider services in relation to IT, including the Senedd, individual services and support, among others, does he agree that Merlin needs to listen to calls from Assembly Members to answer their needs, particularly bearing in mind that the Merlin contract is the largest contract ever commissioned by the Welsh Assembly Government?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There have been a number of ongoing ICT issues, with which the ICT sub-group of the House Committee has been dealing. My understanding is that many, but not all, of these issues have now been resolved. Merlin does work under contract to the National Assembly for Wales and is obliged to respond to the needs of Members as and when requested. The schedules, which are currently being developed within the overall Merlin contracts, will provide Members with services specifically designed to meet their requirements. I will take on board what you have said, Alun, and I will ensure that Merlin is made well aware of the need to service Members as quickly and as efficiently as possible.

**Elin Jones:** Ar hyn o bryd, y cyfarwyddyd a roddir i Aelodau a staff yw i logio oddi ar ein cyfrifiaduron bob nos yn hytrach na'u diffodd, sydd yn defnyddio ynni sylweddol ac yn wastraff. A gytunwch ei bod yn dda ein bod wedi cael cadarnhad y bore yma, yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor technoleg gwybodaeth, ei bod yn bosibl inni ddiffodd ein cyfrifiaduron bob nos? A wnewch chi sicrhau bod Aelodau a staff y Cynulliad yn cael cyfarwyddyd i ddiffodd eu cyfrifiaduron bob nos fel ein bod yn arbed ynni?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Yes, I agree with you completely, Elin. I certainly switch off the monitor, because I can do that by pressing the switch on the right-hand side when I finish in the afternoon. It may well be that all Members' equipment here can be switched off centrally, perhaps 15 minutes or so after the end of the session, or when Members have stopped working—I do not know. However, I will investigate it and make sure that a decision is made so that the

destun hwn, o gofio fod is-bwyllgor TG Pwyllgor y Tŷ bellach yn adolygu'r holl wasanaethau ehangach mewn perthynas â TG, gan gynnwys y Senedd, gwasanaethau unigol a chymorth, ymhlith eraill, a yw'n cytuno bod angen i Merlin wrando ar geisiadau gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad i ddiwallu eu hanghenion, yn arbennig o gofio mai contract Merlin yw'r contract mwyaf a gomisiynwyd erioed gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae yna nifer o faterion TG parhaus wedi bod, ac mae is-grŵp TGCh Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi bod yn ymdrin â hwy. Yr wyf ar ddeall fod nifer o'r materion hyn, er nad pob un, bellach wedi'u datrys. Mae Merlin yn gweithio o dan contract i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac mae rhwymedigaeth arno i ymateb i anghenion Aelodau yn ôl y galw. Bydd yr amserlenni, sy'n cael eu datblygu ar hyn o bryd o fewn contractau cyffredinol Merlin, yn darparu gwasanaethau i'r Aelodau sydd wedi'u cynllunio'n benodol i fodloni eu gofynion. Ystyriaf yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennych, Alun, ac fe sicrhaf y caiff Merlin wybod yn glir fod angen gwasanaethu Aelodau mor gyflym ac mor effeithlon â phosibl.

**Elin Jones:** At present, the advice given to Members and to staff is to log off our computers each night rather than switch them off, which uses a considerable amount of energy and is a waste. Do you agree that it was good to hear confirmation at the IT sub-committee meeting this morning that it is acceptable for us to switch off our computers at night? Will you ensure that Members and Assembly staff are given guidance to switch off their computers at night so that we can save energy?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwnaf, cytunaf yn llwyr â chi, Elin. Yr wyf yn sicr yn diffodd y monitor, oherwydd gallaf wneud hynny drwy bwyso'r botwm ar yr ochr dde pan fyddaf yn gorffen yn y prynhawn. Mae'n ddigon posibl y gellir diffodd offer pob Aelod yma'n ganolog, efallai tua 15 munud ar ôl diwedd y sesiwn, neu pan fydd Aelodau wedi rhoi'r gorau i weithio—ni wn. Fodd bynnag, fe ymchwiliaf i hynny gan sicrhau gwneud penderfyniad a fydd yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i



conservation of energy remains at the forefront, if at all possible. arbed ynni, os yw'n bosibl o gwbl.

### **Adeilad Newydd y Cynulliad The New Assembly Building**

**Q2 Rosemary Butler:** How many people have visited the new Assembly building? OAQ0011(HC)

**C2 Rosemary Butler:** Faint o bobl sydd wedi ymweld ag adeilad newydd y Cynulliad? OAQ0011(HC)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Senedd opened to the public on Tuesday, 7 February 2006. From that time until Sunday, 14 May 2006, 127,215 people have visited the Senedd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Agorodd y Senedd i'r cyhoedd ddydd Mawrth, 7 Chwefror 2006. O'r adeg honno tan ddydd Sul, 14 Mai 2006, yr oedd 127,215 o bobl wedi ymweld â'r Senedd.

**Rosemary Butler:** That is a sensational number. I am sure that we would all agree that the building is an architectural gem. I have a lot of visitors who find looking up at the ceiling breathtaking. It is marvellous. However, I do not think that enough is being made of the Senedd's green credentials. Although you have a new brochure out, 'Explore the Senedd', I note that there is only a small paragraph about green issues and the technology that we have installed in the building. There is just a small mention of what is happening with the cowl and the stale air, and a small mention of the geothermal coils and the heating. Is there any chance of our developing a DVD or a video that could be run on a loop so that when people come to visit, particularly on the weekend, they can look at the building and sit and watch a video or a DVD? I am sure that that would make life much more enjoyable for people visiting the Assembly.

**Rosemary Butler:** Mae hynny'n nifer rhyfeddol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod yr adeilad yn em bensaernïol. Mae nifer o ymwelwyr yn rhyfeddu wrth syllu i fyny ar y nenfwd. Mae'n odidog. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf bod digon o gyhoeddusrwydd yn cael ei roi i nodweddion gwyrdd y Senedd. Er ichi gyhoeddi llyfryn newydd, 'Crwydro'r Senedd', sylwaf mai paragraff byr yn unig sydd am faterion gwyrdd a'r dechnoleg yr ydym wedi'i gosod yn yr adeilad. Prin yw'r sôn am yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r cwfl a'r hen aer, a phrin yw'r sôn am y coiliau geothermol a'r gwres. A oes unrhyw obaith y gallem ddatblygu DVD neu fideo y gellid ei ddarlledu'n barhaus, fel y gall pobl a ddaw i ymweld â'r lle, yn arbennig ar benwythnosau, edrych ar yr adeilad ac eistedd a gwyllo fideo neu DVD? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai hynny'n gwneud bywyd lawer yn fwy pleserus i'r bobl a fydd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The production of a DVD, or at least information for Members, was considered by the House Committee about 18 months to two years ago, but it was postponed at that time because of the construction of this building. Your suggestion is a good one, and we now need to revisit that. There is a House Committee meeting tomorrow, and I shall ensure that it is on the agenda for consideration.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ystyriodd Pwyllgor y Tŷ a ellid cynhyrchu DVD, neu o leiaf wybodaeth i Aelodau, tua 18 mis neu ddwy flynedd yn ôl, ond fe'i gohiriwyd bryd hynny oherwydd y gwaith o godi'r adeilad hwn. Mae eich awgrym yn un da, ac mae'n bryd yn awr inni ailystyried hynny. Bydd cyfarfod o Bwyllgor y Tŷ yfory, ac fe sicrhaf y caiff y mater ei gynnwys ar yr agenda i'w ystyried.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I believe that all Members will share the joy of our now being the attraction with the second highest visitor figures in Wales after the

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Credaf y bydd pob Aelod yn rhannu'r llawenydd mai ni erbyn hyn yw'r atyniad sy'n denu'r ffigurau ymwelwyr uchaf ond un

National History Museum at St Fagans. That puts to bed any of the doubters who believed that this building would not be an attraction to the people of Wales, and would not be an attraction for us all to enjoy. Would the House Committee consider doing a small survey of how much people spend in the area, so that we can also work out the economic impact of the building over a period of time? We would then be able to adjust those figures, and perhaps put to bed any of those doubters who may still be left lurking in certain corners of the Chamber.

I welcome Rosemary's point on a DVD for this building. Would the House Committee also take on board the matter of the presentation of this building to people who are just passing through it, using the television screens that are available throughout? If a looped DVD were available, perhaps that could be placed on the screens. I know that some Members like to see the faces of Members perpetually recurring on the screens, but, unfortunately, it might be a better use of resource to try to tell people about this building, about democracy, and about how this building works. I hope that the House Committee can consider that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am not sure whether we should consider the comparisons between St Fagans and this building too closely. I am not sure either that I can recommend to the House Committee that we engage and spend finances on commercial exercises about spending in the area, as I do not think that that is a proper use of moneys voted by the Assembly for running the National Assembly. However, your last point is certainly a good one, and I shall ensure that it is also, together with Rosemary's point, on the agenda for tomorrow's meeting.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Some visitors to the building in the past few months have made representations to me and, I know, to other Assembly Members, regretting that it is now more difficult, because of the layout of the building, for them to have informal access to Assembly Members in the way that they could in the previous Chamber. Has the House Committee received any

ying Nghymru, ar ôl Amgueddfa Werin Cymru yn Sain Ffagan. Mae hynny'n tawelu unrhyw un rai o'r amheuwyr a oedd yn credu na fyddai'r adeilad hwn yn atyniad i bobl Cymru, ac na fyddai'n atyniad inni bob un ei fwynhau. A wnaiff Pwyllgor y Tŷ ystyried gwneud arolwg bach o faint y mae pobl yn ei wario yn yr ardal, er mwyn inni allu hefyd gyfrifo effaith economaidd yr adeilad dros gyfnod o amser? Wedyn, byddem yn gallu addasu'r ffigurau hynny, ac efallai dawelu unrhyw rai o'r amheuwyr hynny a all fod yn dal i lechu yn rhai o gorneli'r Siambr.

Croesawaf bwynt Rosemary am DVD ar gyfer yr adeilad hwn. A wnaiff Pwyllgor y Tŷ hefyd ystyried y mater o gyflwyno'r adeilad hwn i bobl sy'n pasio drwyddo, gan ddefnyddio'r sgriniau teledu sydd ar gael drwyddo draw? Pe gellid defnyddio DVD parhaus, efallai y gellid ei ddarlledu ar y sgriniau. Gwn fod rhai Aelodau yn hoffi gweld wynebau Aelodau yn ymddangos byth a hefyd ar y sgriniau, ond yn anffodus efallai y byddem yn defnyddio hadnoddau'n well drwy geisio dweud wrth bobl am yr adeilad hwn, am ddemocratiaeth, ac am y ffordd y mae'r adeilad hwn yn gweithio. Gobeithio y gall Pwyllgor y Tŷ ystyried hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a ddylem ystyried y cymariaethau rhwng Sain Ffagan a'r adeilad hwn yn rhy agos. Nid wyf yn siŵr ychwaith a allaf argymhell i Bwyllgor y Tŷ y dylem ddefnyddio a gwario ein cyllidebau ar ymarferion masnachol ynglŷn â gwariant yn yr ardal, gan nad wyf yn credu bod hynny'n ddefnydd priodol o arian a bleidleisiwyd gan y Cynulliad i'w ddefnyddio i redeg y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, mae eich pwynt olaf yn sicr yn bwynt da, ac fe sicrhaf fod hwnnw hefyd, ynghyd â phwynt Rosemary, yn cael ei gynnwys ar yr agenda ar gyfer y cyfarfod yfory.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae rhai sydd wedi ymweld â'r adeilad yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf wedi cyflwyno sylwadau imi ac i Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad, mi wn, yn gresynu ei bod bellach yn anos, oherwydd cynllun yr adeilad, iddynt allu mynd yn anffurfiol at Aelodau'r Cynulliad, fel yr arferent ei wneud yn y Siambr flaenorol. A yw Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi cael unrhyw

representations in that regard and, if not at this stage, would you be prepared to do so?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We have had representations about public access to parts of this building, and the fact that it is more difficult to have informal access to Members here than in the old Chamber. The matter is under consideration by the new building sub-group that has been established, and I hope that we can make improvements to it in due course.

sylwadau cyffelyb, ac os nad ydynt ar hyn o bryd, a fydddech yn barod i wneud hynny?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydym wedi cael sylwadau ynglŷn â mynediad i'r cyhoedd i rannau o'r adeilad hwn, a'r ffaith ei bod yn anos gallu mynd yn anffurfiol at Aelodau o'i gymharu â'r hen Siambr. Mae'r mater yn cael ei ystyried gan yr is-grŵp a sefydlwyd ar gyfer yr adeilad newydd, a gobeithio y gallwn wella'r sefyllfa maes o law.

### **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

#### **Colli Swyddi (Vauxhall, Ellesmere Port) Job Losses (Vauxhall, Ellesmere Port)**

**Carl Sargeant:** What discussion has the Minister had regarding the job losses at the Vauxhall Ellesmere Port plant and the effect that it will have on north-east Wales? EAQ(EIN)

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** The prospective loss of 900 jobs at GM's facility at Ellesmere Port is disappointing news. My ministerial colleagues at the Department of Trade and Industry and I are working closely together to establish what this may mean for Welsh workers and the automotive industry in Wales. I have discussed the issue with the chief executive of the Welsh Automotive Forum. Our other Team Wales partners will work with their colleagues in England to ensure that we respond to this decision as positively as we can.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you for that response, Minister. Many of my constituents will be affected by today's decision. I have already had discussions with some of the workforce, who are deeply concerned that this does not only affect them personally, but also their families. You have given me assurances that you will talk to the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, and I understand that there is a delegation from his department at the plant today. Will you assure me that, although this is a cross-border issue, you will open up discussions with all relevant bodies, so that workers who live in Wales and work

**Carl Sargeant:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch y colli swyddi yng ngweithfeydd Vauxhall yn Ellesmere Port a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar y gogledd-ddwyrain? EAQ(EIN)

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Mae'r posibilrwydd o golli 900 o swyddi yng nghyfleuster GM yn Ellesmere Port yn newyddion siomedig. Yr wyf yn cydweithio'n agos â'm cyd-Weinidogion yn yr Adran Diwydiant a Masnach i weld beth y gallai hyn ei golygu i weithwyr yng Nghymru a'r diwydiant moduro yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater gyda phrif weithredwr Fforwm Modurol Cymru. Bydd ein partneriaid eraill yn Nhîm Cymru yn gweithio gyda'u cydweithwyr yn Lloegr i sicrhau ein bod yn ymateb i'r penderfyniad hwn mor gadarnhaol â phosibl.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Bydd y penderfyniad heddiw yn effeithio ar nifer o'm hetholwyr. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cael trafodaethau gyda rhai o'r gweithlu, sy'n pryderu'n ddifrifol y bydd hyn nid yn unig yn effeithio arnynt hwy'n bersonol, ond ar eu teuluoedd hefyd. Yr ydych wedi rhoi sicrwydd imi y byddwch yn siarad â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwydiant a Masnach, a deallaf fod cynrychiolwyr o'i adran ar y safle heddiw. A allwch roi sicrwydd imi, er bod hwn yn fater trawsffiniol, y byddwch yn dechrau trafodaethau gyda'r holl gyrff perthnasol, fel

at the Vauxhall plant at Ellesmere Port will not be forgotten, and that they and their families will be engaged in a process of support?

na fydd gweithwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru ac sy'n gweithio ar safle Vauxhall yn Ellesmere Port yn mynd yn angof, ac y bydd proses o gefnogaeth yn cael ei rhoi ar waith iddynt hwy a'u teuluoedd?

3.30 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** I am willing to give that commitment. We are liaising with the Department of Trade and Industry on this issue. There has been speculation for some time about developments at Ellesmere Port. It is well known that the company is experiencing huge difficulties, particularly in its base in America. The credit rating and other operations are in very serious difficulties, but we will work with the DTI, the unions and the company to identify ways in which this might affect both those employed at Ellesmere Port and the supply chain in terms of those Welsh companies who are supplying GM. However, rest assured that we will keep in touch and I will keep Members informed of any developments.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn barod i roi'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Yr ydym yn cysylltu â'r Adran Diwydiant a Masnach ar y mater hwn. Bu rhywfaint o ddyfalu ers tro ynglŷn â datblygiadau yn Ellesmere Port. Mae'n hysbys fod y cwmni'n wynebu anawsterau mawr, yn enwedig yn ei ganolfan yn America. Mae'r statws credyd a gweithrediadau eraill mewn anawsterau difrifol, ond byddwn yn gweithio gyda'r adran diwydiant a masnach, yr undebau a'r cwmni i nodi ffyrdd y gallai hyn effeithio ar bobl a gyflogir yn Ellesmere Port, ynghyd â'r gadwyn gyflenwi o ran y cwmnïau hynny o Gymru sy'n cyflenwi GM. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn cadw mewn cysylltiad ac y byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am unrhyw ddatblygiadau.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Job losses at Vauxhall Ellesmere Port are deeply regrettable, and I endorse what Carl Sargeant has said. However, a number of businesses in north-east Wales are also dependent on the plant. Presumably, those jobs may be at risk. Will you carry out an assessment or an audit to see what effect the Vauxhall decision might have on these businesses and bring that information to the relevant committee?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gresyn o'r mwyaf yw'r colledion swyddi yn Vauxhall Ellesmere Port, ac yr wyf yn ategu'r hyn a ddywedodd Carl Sargeant. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o fusnesau yn y gogledd-ddwyrain yn ddibynnol ar y ffatri. Byddwn yn tybio y gall y swyddi hynny fod mewn perygl. A fyddwch yn gwneud asesiad neu archwiliad i weld pa effaith y gallai penderfyniad Vauxhall ei chael ar y busnesau hyn, a rhoi'r wybodaeth honno i'r pwyllgor perthnasol?

**Andrew Davies:** I am more than happy to give that commitment, which follows on from the commitment I gave to Carl Sargeant. The Welsh automotive forum is unable, at this stage, to say what the precise implications will be for Welsh-based companies, but we will be working with it—as we have done when previous such announcements have been made by large companies in the automotive sector—and I will keep the committee and Members informed.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon ymrwymo i hynny, sy'n dilyn o'r ymrwymiad a roddais i Carl Sargeant. Ni all fforwm modurol Cymru ddweud ar hyn o bryd beth yw'r union oblygiadau i gwmnïau yng Nghymru, ond byddwn yn cydweithio ag ef—fel y gwnaethom yn y gorffennol yn dilyn cyhoeddiadau o'r fath gan gwmnïau mawr yn y sector modurol—a byddaf yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r pwyllgor ac i'r Aelodau.

**Mark Isherwood:** This is devastating news, and I personally know people on both sides

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae hyn yn newyddion trist ofnadwy, ac yr wyf yn bersonol yn

of the border who could be affected by this. This is against the backdrop of UK vehicle production falling last year by 2.6 per cent, whereas it increased by 3.4 per cent in Germany. As John Marek will be interested to hear, the Czech Republic has seen an increase of 35 per cent. Tony Woodley of the Transport and General Workers Union said today that manufacturing is being massacred, and that if manufacturing matters to this country then the Government must have a plan to support manufacturing.

Amicus's general secretary, Derek Simpson, said that this is another devastating blow to the car industry and UK manufacturing in general, and that this plant or industry in our county cannot afford to keep shedding skills like this.

Jonathan Browning, the Vauxhall chairman, said that quality and productivity have shown significant improvements, so the workforce must be credited for that, but that the issue of long-term competitiveness remains.

What action, working with your colleagues in London, do you propose to take in order to address that issue of long-term competitiveness? What action have you taken to identify Welsh resident employees so that appropriate support might be given to them, and what action will you take to, hopefully, ensure that there will be no compulsory redundancies and that the new Astra will come to Ellesmere Port to secure the long-term jobs there for people on both sides of the border?

**Andrew Davies:** It is reading too much into the situation to say that this is manufacturing in meltdown or the end of the automotive sector in the UK. If you look at the automotive sector overall, it continues to do very well indeed. In Wales alone, 25,000 people are employed in the automotive sector. Overall, exports are increasing and the UK continues to have more global manufacturers than before making vehicles. The number of cars produced stands at 1.6 million, as has been the case every year since 2000. The sector is clearly experiencing major difficulties, particularly with the fact

adnabod pobl ar ddwy ochr y ffin y gallai hyn effeithio arnynt. Yn gefndir i hyn mae'r ffaith fod cynhyrchiant modurwl wedi gostwng 2.6 y cant y llynedd yn y DU a chynyddu 3.4 y cant yn yr Almaen. Byddai o ddiddordeb i John Marek glywed bod y Weriniaeth Siec wedi gweld cynnydd o 35 y cant. Yn ôl Tony Woodley o Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol, mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu heddiw ar ei liniau, ac os yw'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn bwysig i'r wlad hon, rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gael cynllun i gefnogi gweithgynhyrchu.

Yn ôl Derek Simpson, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol Amicus, mae hon yn ergyd drom arall i'r diwydiant ceir a gweithgynhyrchu yn y DU yn gyffredinol, ac ni all y ffatri hon na diwydiant yn ein sir fforddio parhau i gael gwared â sgiliau fel hyn.

Yn ôl Jonathan Browning, cadeirydd Vauxhall, gwelwyd gwelliannau sylweddol o ran ansawdd a chynhyrchiant. Felly, rhaid canmol y gweithlu am hynny, ond mae problem bod yn gystadleuol yn y tymor hir yn parhau.

Gan weithio gyda'ch cyd-aelodau yn Llundain, pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno o fod yn gystadleuol yn y tymor hir? Pa gamau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i nodi gweithwyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru i sicrhau rhoi cymorth priodol iddynt, a pha gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd i sicrhau, gobeithio, na fydd diswyddiadau gorfodol ac y bydd yr Astra newydd yn dod i Ellesmere Port i sicrhau'r swyddi tymor hir yno i bobl o bobtu'r ffin?

**Andrew Davies:** Byddai dweud bod gweithgynhyrchu ar ei liniau neu bod y sector modurwl yn y DU yn wynebu difodiant yn darllen gormod i mewn i'r sefyllfa. Os edrychwch ar y sector modurwl yn gyffredinol, mae'n dal i wneud yn dda iawn. Yng Nghymru yn unig cyflogir 25,000 o bobl yn y sector modurwl. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r allforion yn cynyddu ac mae mwy o weithgynhyrchwyr ceir byd-eang nag erioed o'r blaen yn y DU. Cynhyrchir 1.6 miliwn o geir bob blwyddyn, ffigur sydd wedi parhau'n sefydlog bob blwyddyn er 2000. Mae'r sector yn amlwg yn wynebu

that there is significant over capacity in the sector globally, as we have already seen in relation to the very sad demise of MG Rover last year. The sector is very competitive, and the cost pressures on companies are continuing to bear down, but the Assembly Government and the Government in London continue to support the industry. The UK Government has provided a whole range of financial support packages since 1996, and £25 million has been invested in the Ellesmere Port plant by the UK Government, which mirrors the support that we have given to a range of companies in the sector. In terms of redundancies, we do not know what the impact will be at the moment, because my understanding is that the company will be seeking voluntary redundancies. Clearly, we do not know what impact that will have. When such voluntary redundancy schemes are announced, companies often find that the schemes are oversubscribed and more people are seeking redundancies than there are vacancies available. Therefore, we still do not know what the implications will be, either for the workers from Wales who work at Ellesmere Port or for the Welsh companies that supply goods and services to the Ellesmere Port plant.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am equally shocked and concerned about this, and commiserate, as the other speakers have, with those concerned and their families. This is a really bad blow, because we know that the Astra is a popular car, and I am sure that you, having been in the automotive industry, understand this as much as anyone. I note that—as we will debate the manufacturing industry later—in your economic strategy for November 2005, you asserted that the high-technology, automotive and aerospace sectors and so on are key sectors that are identified as important to the future of the Welsh economy. I can only hope that you are doing your best to mitigate any consequences for Welsh employees. Do you have any idea or will you be assessing how many people from Wales will be affected? How soon will you come back to tell us about the results and how you are going to alleviate this heavy blow to those from Wales who will be affected?

anawsterau mawr, yn enwedig o ran y ffaith fod gormod o gapasiti yn y sector byd-eang, fel y gwelsom eisoes gyda diflaniad trist MG Rover y llynedd. Mae'r sector yn gystadleuol iawn, ac mae'r pwysau o ran costau yn parhau i wasgu ar gwmnïau. Ond mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Llywodaeth yn Llundain yn parhau i gefnogi'r diwydiant. Darparwyd ystod gyflawn o becynnau cymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth y DU er 1996 a buddsoddwyd £25 miliwn yn ffatri Ellesmere Port gan Lywodraeth y DU, sy'n adlewyrchu'r cymorth yr ydym wedi'i roi i amrywiol gwmnïau yn y sector. O ran diswyddiadau, ni wyddom beth fydd yr effaith ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd yr wyf ar ddeall y bydd y cwmni'n gofyn am ddiswyddiadau gwirfoddol. Yn amlwg, ni wyddom pa effaith a gaiff hynny. Pan gyhoeddir cynlluniau diswyddo gwirfoddol o'r fath, bydd cwmnïau yn aml yn gweld bod mwy o bobl yn gwneud cais am gael eu diswyddo nag sydd o leoedd gwag. Felly, ni wyddom beth fydd y goblygiadau, i'r gweithwyr o Gymru sy'n gweithio yn Ellesmere Port nac i'r cwmnïau o Gymru sy'n cyflenwi nwyddau a gwasanaethau i ffatri Ellesmere Port.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf finnau wedi fy arswydo ac yn pryderu ynghylch hyn, fel y siaradwyr eraill, lawn cymaint â'r rheini dan sylw a'u teuluoedd. Mae hyn yn ergyd drom, oherwydd gwyddom fod yr Astra yn gar poblogaidd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi, ar ôl gweithio yn y diwydiant modurrol, yn deall hyn cystal â neb. Sylwaf—gan y byddwn yn trafod y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn ddiweddarach—ichi haeru yn eich strategaeth economaidd ar gyfer Tachwedd 2005 fod y sectorau uwch-dechnoleg, moduron ac awyrofod ac yn y blaen yn sectorau allweddol a nodir fel sectorau pwysig i ddyfodol economi Cymru. Ni allaf ond gobeithio eich bod yn gwneud eich gorau i liniaru unrhyw ganlyniadau sy'n wynebu gweithwyr o Gymru. A wyddoch neu a fyddwch yn asesu faint o bobl o Gymru y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt? Pryd y cawn wybod gennych am y canlyniadau, a sut fyddwch chi'n lleddfu'r ergyd drom hon i'r rheini o Gymru y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said, it is too early to say what the impact will be on Welsh employees at Ellesmere Port, or on Wales-based companies that are supplying goods and services to the plant. It is a voluntary redundancy scheme, and until the company has worked with the workforce and the unions to identify who will be taking up the offer of voluntary redundancy, we cannot say from where those workers will be. I have given a commitment that I will keep the committee and Members informed of developments.

**John Marek:** When the Minister makes contact with the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry, will he impress upon him the need to ensure that, when companies make workers redundant in this country, the penalty that these companies must pay is not much less than it is in almost any other European Union country? Does he agree that, just for once, the Labour Party should stand up for the rights of working men and women in this country?

**Andrew Davies:** We were not going to get a different message from the Member to that which we have heard on countless occasions before. As I have said on previous occasions, when companies have had financial assistance from the Government, and, indeed, from the UK Government, and they break the terms and conditions of the grant offer, they will have to repay it. I have made my views clear about companies off-shoring or relocating, which is that the workforce should be consulted on that basis. I made it clear in my statement yesterday on the job losses at Continental Teves UK Ltd that that was my position.

However, you must bear in mind that the UK has had the most successful economy in the whole of the eurozone, particularly when set against our major competitors, France and Germany. In France and Germany, unemployment is still near the 10 per cent mark, which is, significantly, almost twice the level in the UK, and certainly twice the level in Wales. We have been singularly successful in Britain in terms of attracting inward investment. As ever with these issues, you must take a balanced view, and the performance of the UK and the Welsh

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar weithwyr o Gymru yn Ellesmere Port, neu ar gwmnïau yng Nghymru sy'n cyflenwi nwyddau a gwasanaethau i'r ffatri. Mae'n gynllun diswyddo gwirfoddol, a nes i'r cwmni weithio gyda'r gweithlu a'r undebau i nodi pwy fydd yn derbyn y cynnig diswyddo gwirfoddol, ni allwn ddweud o ble y daw'r gweithwyr hynny. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y datblygiadau i'r pwyllgor ac i'r Aelodau.

**John Marek:** Pan fydd y Gweinidog yn cysylltu â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwydiant a Masnach, a fydd yn pwysleisio wrtho fod angen sicrhau na fydd y gosb y mae'n rhaid i gwmnïau ei thalu pan fyddant yn diswyddo gweithwyr yn y wlad hon lawer yn is nag ydyw mewn unrhyw wlad arall bron yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd? A yw'n cytuno, am unwaith, y dylai'r blaid Lafur sefyll dros hawliau gweithwyr yn y wlad hon?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid oeddem am gael neges wahanol gan yr Aelod i'r hyn a glywyd ganddo ar achlysuron dirifedi yn y gorffennol. Fel y dywedais ar achlysuron blaenorol, pan fydd cwmnïau wedi cael cymorth ariannol gan y Llywodraeth, ac yn wir, gan Lywodraeth y DU, ac yn torri telerau ac amodau'r cynnig grant, rhaid iddynt ei adalu. Yr wyf wedi datgan yn glir beth yw fy marn am gwmnïau sy'n symud neu'n ymsefydlu dramor, sef y dylid ymgynghori â'r gweithlu. Gwneuthum yn glir yn fy natganiad ddoe am y swyddi a gollir yn Continental Teves UK Ltd mai dyna oedd fy safbwynt.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gofio mai economi'r DG yw'r economi fwyaf llwyddiannus yn ardal yr ewro, yn enwedig o ystyried ein prif gystadleuwyr, Ffrainc a'r Almaen. Yn Ffrainc a'r Almaen mae diweithdra'n dal yn agos i 10 y cant, ac mae hynny, yn arwyddocaol iawn, bron ddwywaith y lefel yn y DU ac yn bendant ddwywaith yn fwy na'r lefel yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi bod yn arbennig o lwyddiannus ym Mhrydain wrth ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad. Fel bob amser gyda'r materion hyn, rhaid ichi gymryd golwg gytbwys, ac mae perfformiad

economy clearly demonstrates that, on balance, both we and the UK Government are managing the economy extremely well.

economi'r DU a Chymru yn dangos yn glir ein bod ni a Llywodraeth y DU ar y cyfan yn rheoli'r economi'n dda iawn.

**Ceisio Cytundeb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi Bodloni Gofynion Cynnig Gwenda Thomas o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 a Drafodwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Tachwedd 2005**

**The Seeking of the National Assembly's agreement that the Welsh Assembly Government has Satisfied the Requirements of the Standing Order No. 31 Proposal by Gwenda Thomas that was debated in Plenary on 23 November 2005**

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I propose that:

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. recognises that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills:*

*1. yn cydnabod bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau:*

*a) brought forward the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2006, which commences section 175 of the Education Act 2002 for approval in Plenary 31 January 2006; and*

*a) wedi dod â Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006 ymlaen, sy'n cychwyn adran 175 Deddf Addysg 2002 ar gyfer ei gymeradwyo yng Nghyfarfod Llawn 31 Ionawr 2006; a*

*b) will issue guidance to support local education authorities and governing bodies exercise their functions to safeguard and promote the welfare of children, which includes the nomination of a named governor responsible for child protection matters and the setting up of local education authority databases of nominated governors for consultation during the summer term to take effect in schools during the autumn term 2006;*

*b) yn cyhoeddi arweiniad i gefnogi awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrff llywodraethu i arfer eu swyddogaethau i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant, sy'n cynnwys enwebu llywodraethwr wedi'i enwi a fydd yn gyfrifol am faterion sy'n ymwneud ag amddiffyn plant a sefydlu cronfeydd data awdurdodau addysg lleol o lywodraethwyr a enwebwyd ar gyfer ymgynghori yn ystod tymor yr haf gyda'r bwriad o roi hyn ar waith mewn ysgolion yn ystod tymor Hydref 2006;*

*2. believes that the actions sought by Gwenda Thomas in her Standing Order No. 31.2 motion NDM2641 debated on 23 November 2005, will have been satisfactorily completed, and therefore that it should not proceed with the remaining steps in the Standing Order No. 31 procedure. (NDM3043)*

*2. yn credu y bydd y camau a geisiodd Gwenda Thomas yn ei chynnig NDM2641 dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31.2 a drafodwyd ar 23 Tachwedd 2005 wedi cael eu cwblhau'n foddhaol, ac felly na ddylai fwrw ymlaen â gweddill camau gweithdrefn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31. (NDM3043)*

On 23 November last year, in response to Gwenda Thomas's motion under Standing Order No. 31, I confirmed my plans to bring forward secondary legislation to commence section 175 of the Education Act 2002, which would place local education authorities and the governing bodies of schools and further

Ar 23 Tachwedd y llynedd, wrth ymateb i gynnig Gwenda Thomas o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, bu imi gadarnhau fy nghynlluniau i gyflwyno is-ddeddfwriaeth i gychwyn adran 175 o Ddeddf Addysg 2002, a fydd yn gosod dyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrff llywodraethol ysgolion a



education institutions under a statutory duty to safeguard children. On 31 January, the Assembly agreed the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2006, bringing section 175 into force from 1 September 2006.

3.40 p.m.

In agreeing to commence the legislation on 31 January, the Assembly recognised that the timescales associated with Standing Order No. 31 and Assembly secondary legislative procedures could have significantly delayed the implementation of the legislation and guidance in schools until 2007. Guidance to support local authorities, schools and further education institutions in exercising this duty is being drafted and will shortly be issued for consultation. I am happy to provide the Assembly with further reassurances today that the guidance will reflect the terms of Gwenda Thomas's motion in respect of both the nomination of a named governor responsible for child protection matters and the setting up of local authority databases of nominated governors.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I am happy to support the motion before us. I am pleased that the commencement Order was approved in Plenary on 31 January this year. I am also content with the Minister's assurance that draft guidance on the second part of my Standing Order No. 31 proposal, in respect of the nomination of a named governor responsible for child protection matters and the setting up of the local education authority database of nominated governors, will be issued during the summer term, with the aim of issuing the guidance to schools during the autumn term this year. This will be a further step forward in safeguarding and protecting our children and I hope that we will all want to support the motion today.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Gwenda Thomas's idea clearly deserves our support, as it may lead to better protection for schoolchildren. It was made clear in the original debate that, at the very least, the guidance would need to be issued, but I have yet to see it and therefore I do not yet know whether I approve of its contents. This motion asks me to vote in

sefydliadau addysg bellach i ddiogelu plant. Ar 31 Ionawr cytunodd y Cynulliad ar Orchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006 i ddod ag adran 175 i rym o 1 Medi 2006.

Wrth gytuno i gychwyn y ddeddfwriaeth ar 31 Ionawr, yr oedd y Cynulliad yn cydnabod y gallai'r amserlenni'n gysylltiedig â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31 a gweithdrefnau is-ddeddfwriaeth y Cynulliad fod wedi oedi gweithredu'r ddeddfwriaeth a'r canllawiau mewn ysgolion yn sylweddol tan 2007. Mae canllawiau i gynorthwyo awdurdodau lleol, ysgolion a sefydliadau addysg bellach wrth arfer y ddyletswydd hon yn y broses o gael eu llunio, a chânt eu cyhoeddi maes o law ar gyfer ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn fodlon rhoi sicrwydd pellach i'r Cynulliad heddiw y bydd y canllawiau'n adlewyrchu telerau cynnig Gwenda Thomas o ran enwebu llywodraethwr a fydd yn gyfrifol am faterion amddiffyn plant a sefydlu cronfeydd data awdurdodau lleol o lywodraethwyr wedi eu henwebu.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn falch cefnogi'r cynnig ger ein bron. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Cyfarfod Llawn wedi cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn cychwyn ar 31 Ionawr eleni. Yr wyf hefyd yn fodlon â sicrwydd y Gweinidog y bydd canllawiau drafft ar ail ran fy nghynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, o ran enwebu llywodraethwr wedi eu henwi i fod yn gyfrifol am faterion amddiffyn plant a sefydlu cronfa ddata mewn awdurdodau addysg lleol o lywodraethwyr wedi eu henwebu, yn cael eu cyhoeddi yn ystod tymor yr haf, gyda'r bwriad o roi canllawiau i ysgolion yn ystod tymor yr hydref eleni. Bydd hyn yn gam pellach ymlaen i ddiogelu ac amddiffyn ein plant, a gobeithio y byddwn i gyd am gefnogi'r cynnig heddiw.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae syniad Gwenda Thomas yn amlwg yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth oherwydd gallai arwain at well diogelwch i blant ysgol. Gwnaed yn glir yn y ddadl wreiddiol y byddai angen cyhoeddi'r canllawiau o leiaf, ond nid wyf wedi eu gweld eto, felly, ni wn eto a wyf yn cymeradwyo eu cynnwys. Mae'r cynnig hwn

blind faith that I will approve of the contents of that guidance, and I am afraid that I cannot do that. The motion expects me, and the rest of us, to trust that sometime in the future Gwenda Thomas's proposal will become a reality, without any evidence that that is the case. We have also said that this proposal requires training and support for those school governors who might take up the onerous responsibility envisaged in the proposal. Training and support are vital for the success of this measure. I do not believe, Minister, that you have yet discharged your duties in relation to this measure. I hope that that will happen soon and, if it does, I will congratulate you. However, I would rather that you came back to us once you have done it.

In the meantime, perhaps you can tell us today which local authorities have implemented this proposal and which have not. Perhaps you could give us a timetable as to when you plan to fulfil all the requirements of Gwenda Thomas's Standing Order No. 31 proposal. Although Plaid Cymru fully supports Gwenda's proposal that each school shall have a named governor with responsibility for the protection and welfare of its pupils, we cannot vote for a motion that gives the impression that the Minister has completed her part of the Standing Order No. 31 proposal when she has yet to do so.

**Peter Black:** I strongly support the sentiments that Jocelyn has expressed. This issue of how Standing Order No. 31 motions should be dealt with has been dogged by confusion. Our understanding, and, I think, the understanding set out in the Standing Order, is that the Minister needs to report back to Plenary within a set time on the issues that are raised by the Standing Order proposal and the motion that has been carried by Plenary. The misunderstanding that has arisen is that I think that some people on the Government side were under the impression that providing that Gwenda Thomas was satisfied, that would be fine. In fact, once a motion has been carried by Plenary, it becomes the property of Plenary and, therefore, it is Plenary that has to be satisfied

yn gofyn imi bleidleisio'n ddall i gymeradwyo cynnwys y canllawiau hynny, ac mae arnaf ofn na allaf wneud hynny. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn disgwyl i mi, a'r gweddill ohonom, fod yn ffyddiog y bydd cynnig Gwenda Thomas rywbryd yn y dyfodol yn cawl ei wireddu, heb unrhyw dystiolaeth mai dyna'r achos. Yr ydym hefyd wedi dweud, yn sgîl y cynnig hwn, fod angen hyfforddiant a chymorth i'r llywodraethwyr ysgol hynny a allai ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb mawr hwnnw a ragwelir yn y cynnig. Mae hyfforddiant a chymorth yn hanfodol i lwyddiant y mesur hwn. Ni chredaf, Weinidog, eich bod wedi cyflawni'ch dyletswyddau eto mewn cysylltiad â'r mesur hwn. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n digwydd yn fuan, ac os bydd, byddaf yn eich llongyfarch. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n well gennyf pe baech yn dod yn ôl atom ar ôl ichi wneud hynny.

Yn y cyfamser, efallai y gallwch ddweud wrthym heddiw pa awdurdodau lleol sydd wedi gweithredu'r cynnig hwn a pha rai sydd heb wneud. Efallai y gallech roi amserlen inni pryd yr ydych yn bwriadu cyflawni holl ofynion cynnig Gwenda Thomas o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Er bod Plaid Cymru yn llwyr gefnogi cynnig Gwenda y bydd gan bob ysgol lywodraethwr wedi ei enwebu i fod yn gyfrifol am ddiogelwch a lles ei disgyblion, ni allwn bleidleisio dros gynnig sy'n rhoi'r argraff fod y Gweinidog wedi cwblhau ei rhan hi o'r cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 pan nad yw wedi gwneud hynny hyd yma.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi'n gryf y sylwadau gan Jocelyn. Bu dryswch mawr ynghylch y broblem hon o ymdrin â chynigion o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Yr hyn a ddeallwn ni, a'r hyn sydd wedi ei osod allan yn y Rheol Sefydlog, mi gredaf, yw bod angen i'r Gweinidog ddod ag adroddiad yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn o fewn amser penodol am y materion a godir gan y cynnig o dan y Rheol Sefydlog ac am y cynnig sydd wedi ei basio gan y Cyfarfod Llawn. Y camddealltwriaeth sydd wedi codi, mi gredaf, yw bod rhai pobl ar ochr y Llywodraeth wedi cael yr argraff y byddai popeth yn iawn cyn belled â bod Gwenda Thomas wedi ei bodloni. Mewn gwirionedd, pan fydd y Cyfarfod Llawn wedi pasio cynnig, y Cyfarfod Llawn biau'r cynnig hwnnw, ac

that the Standing Order No. 31 proposal has been dealt with appropriately.

Like Jocelyn, I totally support what Gwenda put forward in her motion, which is that we should have a designated governor responsible for child protection matters. It is important that we get the guidance in place as soon as possible. I look forward to that guidance coming back to Plenary for us to approve and to being able to scrutinise it to ensure that it delivers everything that we and Gwenda expected from her original motion.

This motion has come to us out of time in terms of Standing Order No. 31, which sets out a timetable for when this matter should come before us. We accept that that has happened, and we will move on from that, as there is no point in having sour grapes about it, but, for the future, I hope that lessons will have been learnt, and that Ministers respond within the timescale set out by Standing Order No. 31. I hope that they come back to us in good time and do not assume that, because they may bring guidance or whatever at some point in the future, that will satisfy what Assembly Members believe should happen. There must be some regard to the will of Plenary in this matter, and that now should be met. Having said that, we are prepared to vote for this motion because, clearly, action is being taken, but in future, we need to have learnt the lessons of this particular instance.

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I make it absolutely clear that the Government knows that, once a motion has been carried in Plenary, it is then an Assembly motion and has to be properly dealt with in those terms. However, as I said in my earlier contribution, and I think that I also said it in my contribution of 31 January, in practice, we were overtaken by an opportunity that we wanted to seize. That is why, in the three-month timescale, we had the debate on 31 January, when I brought forward the commencement Order to enable us to do exactly as was required under Standing Order

felly rhaid bodloni'r Cyfarfod Llawn fod y cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 wedi ei drin yn briodol

Fel Jocelyn, yr wyf finnau yn llwyr gefnogi'r hyn y mae Gwenda wedi'i gyflwyno yn ei chynnig, sef y dylid cael llywodraethwr penodedig sy'n gyfrifol am faterion amddiffyn plant. Mae'n bwysig inni sefydlu'r canllawiau cyn gynted â phosibl. Edrychaf ymlaen at weld y canllawiau hynny'n dod yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn er mwyn inni eu cymeradwyo a chraffu arnynt, i sicrhau eu bod yn darparu popeth yr ydym ni a Gwenda yn ei ddisgwyl o'i chynnig gwreiddiol hi.

Mae'r cynnig hwn wedi'i gyflwyno inni y tu allan i'r amser arferol o ran Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31, sy'n gosod amserlen pryd y dylai'r mater hwn ddod ger ein bron. Derbyniwn fod hynny wedi digwydd, a byddwn yn symud ymlaen, gan nad oes diben bod yn chwerw ynglŷn â'r mater. Ond yn y dyfodol, gobeithio y bydd gwersi wedi'u dysgu, ac y bydd Gweinidogion yn ymateb o fewn yr amserlen sydd wedi ei gosod yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Gobeithio y byddant yn rhoi ymateb inni mewn da bryd ac na fyddant yn tybied, oherwydd y gallent gyflwyno canllawiau neu beth bynnag rywbryd yn y dyfodol, y bydd hynny'n bodloni'r hyn y mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn credu ddylai ddigwydd. Rhaid rhoi rhyw ystyriaeth i ewyllys y Cyfarfod Llawn yn y mater hwn, a dylid gwneud hynny'n awr. Wedi dweud hynny, yr ydym yn barod i bleidleisio o blaid y cynnig hwn, ond yn y dyfodol, mae angen inni ddysgu'r gwersi sy'n codi o'r achos penodol hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Hoffwn wneud yn hollol glir fod y Llywodraeth yn gwybod bod cynnig, ar ôl iddo gael ei dderbyn yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, yn mynd yn gynnig o eiddo'r Cynulliad, a bod yn rhaid ymdrin ag ef yn briodol fel hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais yn fy nghyfraniad cynharach, a chredaf imi ddweud hyn yn fy nghyfraniad ar 31 Ionawr, yn ymarferol cododd cyfle yr oeddem yn awyddus i fanteisio arno. Dyna'r rheswm, yn yr amserlen o dri mis, pam y cawsom y ddadl ar 31 Ionawr, pan gyflwynais y Gorchymyn cychwyn i'n galluogi i wneud yn union beth

No. 31. In practical terms, therefore, the Assembly recognised at that point that elements of those procedures had been overtaken by the arrangements that were in existence prior to the debate on 23 November.

In my contribution today, I made it clear that the coming-into-force date is September 2006. We have already said what the guidance would have in place, broadly, in committee terms, but I tell all Members that the guidance will reinforce the need for schools to have effective and accessible policies and procedures in place for designating a member of staff and a governor with lead responsibility for child protection, for referring concerns about a child's welfare, whether that child is at risk or in need, for co-operating across the support agencies to address concerns about broader child welfare, for effective and safe recruitment practices, for handling allegations against staff, for exercising disciplinary and dismissal function, and for training and raising awareness. The nominated governor role will be to ensure that the school has effective policies for each of these key areas, that procedures are accessible to those who ask for them, and to be the designated person for referring allegations against the headteacher to the statutory authorities.

I hope that Members will support the discharging of the functions under Standing Order No. 31. The Government remains utterly committed to taking forward the safeguarding children agenda. We will have opportunities to look further at these issues when the guidance is published for consultation in committee in the usual way.

oedd yn ofynnol o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Yn ymarferol, felly, yr oedd y Cynulliad yn cydnabod bryd hynny fod y trefniadau a oedd ar waith cyn y ddadl ar 23 Tachwedd wedi mynd yn drech nag elfennau o'r gweithdrefnau hynny.

Yn fy nghyfraniad heddiw, eglurais mai Medi 2006 yw'r dyddiad y daw i rym. Yr ydym eisoes wedi dweud beth fyddai'r canllawiau'n ei ddarparu, yn fras, o ran y pwyllgor. Ond dywedaf wrth bob Aelod y bydd y canllawiau'n atgyfnerthu'r angen i ysgolion sicrhau bod ganddynt bolisiau a gweithdrefnau effeithiol ar waith sydd ar gael i bawb i ddynodi aelod o'r staff a llywodraethwr a fydd yn bennaf gyfrifol am amddiffyn plant, am gyfeirio pryderon am les plentyn, p'un a fydd y plentyn hwnnw mewn perygl neu mewn angen, am gydweithredu ar draws yr asiantaethau cymorth i fynd i'r afael â phryderon am les plant yn fwy cyffredinol, am arferion recriwtio effeithiol a diogel, am ddelio â honiadau yn erbyn staff, am arfer swyddogaeth disgyblu a diswyddo, ac am hyfforddiant a chynyddu ymwybyddiaeth. Rôl y llywodraethwr wedi ei enwebu fydd sicrhau bod gan yr ysgol bolisiau effeithiol ar waith ar gyfer pob un o'r meysydd allweddol hyn, bod y gweithdrefnau ar gael i'r rheini sy'n gofyn amdanynt, a bod hefyd yn berson wedi ei enwi i gyfeirio honiadau yn erbyn y pennaeth i'r awdurdodau statudol.

Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n cefnogi cyflawni'r swyddogaethau o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dal wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i weithredu'r agenda diogelu plant. Cawn gyfleoedd i ystyried y materion hyn ymhellach pan gaiff y canllawiau eu cyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghori yn y pwyllgor yn y ffordd arferol.

*Cynnig (NDM3043): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 11.*

*Motion (NDM3043): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Ryder, Janet

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Newidiadau i'r Prif Grwpiau Gwariant Approval of Changes to Main Expenditure Groups**

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** I propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.6, approves the changes to main expenditure groups for the financial year 2006-07 laid in the Table Office on Tuesday 9 May by the Finance Minister, Sue Essex. (NDM3040)*

Each year, it is my responsibility to seek approval for changes in the main expenditure groups from those previously approved in the Assembly's budget. In most cases, such changes are technical in nature, and they are often the result of changes in accounting procedures. In some cases, the changes result from a transfer of function to the Assembly, while in other cases the changes result from

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Cynigiai fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.6, yn cymeradwyo'r newidiadau i'r prif grwpiau gwariant ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2006-07, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mawrth 9 Mai gan y Gweinidog Cyllid, Sue Essex. (NDM3040)*

Bob blwyddyn, fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw ceisio cymeradwyaeth am y newidiadau yn y prif grwpiau gwariant o'u cymharu â'r hyn a gymeradwywyd yn flaenorol yng nghyllideb y Cynulliad. Gan amlaf, mae newidiadau o'r fath yn rhai technegol o ran natur, a byddant yn aml yn codi o ganlyniad i newidiadau mewn gweithdrefnau cyfrifyddu. Mewn rhai achosion, mae'r newidiadau'n deillio o

funds having been added to the block in consequence of extra expenditure announced by the Chancellor. An increase in the block is initially added to the reserve, and when the Government has decided to allocate that money to an expenditure group, it is necessary and proper that I seek the approval of the Assembly through a motion such as this one.

3.50 p.m.

The documents laid last week were termed as MEG-to-MEG transfers insofar as the proposed transfers include transfers from the reserve. I acknowledge that it would perhaps be more accurate to say that the motion is simply to change MEG allocations.

There are 21 adjustments to the budget contained in the motion. I draw your attention to the transfer of £141 million to reflect the Assembly Government's new responsibility for the management of rail transport in Wales—a change which has been widely welcomed by the Assembly.

The motion also brings onto the face of the budget the additional funding announced by the Chancellor in the pre-budget report and the March budget. I refer Members to the Cabinet statement released on 28 March. A description of each transfer is given in the notes which accompany table 1 attached to the motion.

I am seeking approval for the addition of £13 million to the education expenditure group to be allocated to local education authorities for distribution to schools with the highest concentration of disadvantaged children. This adjustment to the budget is indicative of the continued high priority that the Assembly Government gives to schools and to enabling all children and young people, particularly where they suffer the effects of disadvantage, to achieve their full potential.

The Minister for Education, Lifelong

drosglwyddo swyddogaeth i'r Cynulliad, ond mewn achosion eraill mae'r newidiadau'n ganlyniad i ychwanegu cyllid at y bloc o herwydd cyhoeddi gwariant ychwanegol gan y Canghellor. Ychwanegir cynnydd yn y bloc at y gronfa wrth gefn i ddechrau, a phan fydd y Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu dyrannu'r arian hwnnw i grŵp gwariant, mae'n angenrheidiol ac yn briodol fy mod yn ceisio cymeradwyaeth y Cynulliad drwy gynnig fel hwn.

Galwyd y dogfennau a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf yn drosglwyddiadau o un prif grŵp gwariant i un arall, yn yr ystyr bod y trosglwyddiadau a gynnigir yn cynnwys trosglwyddiadau o'r gronfa wrth gefn. Cydnabyddaf y byddai'n fwy cywir, hwyrach, i ddweud mai newid dyraniadau prif grwpiau gwariant yn unig y mae'r cynnig.

Mae'r cynnig yn cynnwys 21 o addasiadau i'r gyllideb. Tynnaf eich sylw at drosglwyddo £141 miliwn i adlewyrchu cyfrifoldeb newydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad dros reoli trafniadaeth rheilffordd yng Nghymru—newid a groesawyd yn helaeth gan y Cynulliad.

Mae'r cynnig hefyd yn ymgoffori yn y gyllideb y cyllid ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd gan y Canghellor yn yr adroddiad cyn y gyllideb ac yng nghyllideb mis Mawrth. Cyfeiriaf Aelodau at y datganiad gan y Cabinet a gyhoeddwyd ar 28 Mawrth. Disgrifir pob trosglwyddiad yn y nodiadau gyda thabl 1, sydd wedi ei gysylltu wrth y cynnig.

Yr wyf yn ceisio cymeradwyaeth am y £13 miliwn ychwanegol i'r grŵp gwariant addysg sydd i'w ddyrannu i awdurdodau addysg lleol i'w ddsbarthu i ysgolion sydd â'r ganran uchaf o blant difreintiedig. Mae'r addasiad hwn yn y gyllideb yn dangos y flaenoriaeth uchel y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dal i'w rhoi i ysgolion ac i alluogi pob plentyn a pherson ifanc, yn enwedig lle maent yn wynebu effeithiau anfantais, i gyflawni eu potensial llawn.

Bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu

Learning and Skills will use powers delegated to her under section 14 of the Education Act 2002 to distribute this sum of money, in accordance with the usual arrangements for making grants for education and childcare. The arrangements were the subject of consideration by the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee on 3 May.

Assembly Members will welcome and approve the transfer to health of the sum of £2.6 million to further improve the provision of NHS primary dental services. The transfer of extra money to the social justice budget will allow further expenditure on a police-led education programme on community safety issues, relating to drugs, alcohol, domestic abuse and anti-social behaviour. It will also support the implementation of the recommendations in the 'Hidden Harm' report by the Advisory Council on the Misuse of Drugs.

Members will be aware that, at first sight, the total Assembly budget seems to reduce. However, let me prevent any misconceptions about the reasons for this. The apparent reduction is only as a result of the fact that the Assembly now receives European funding without the need to negotiate Treasury expenditure cover, and is, therefore, required to show this funding as a specific receipt. The total Assembly budget has been adjusted to provide a figure for the Treasury-financed expenditure net of all European funding. This adds clarity to our budget, and it will be warmly welcomed by Assembly Members. The apparent reductions in the budget for enterprise, innovation and networks and the environment, planning and countryside is simply a reflection of the fact that these budgets are now reported net of the significant European funds that they receive.

Details of the changes are set out in the tables that have been issued to Members, and the Assembly's financial monitoring systems will be updated to reflect the changes as soon as possible.

Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn defnyddio pwerau a ddirprwywyd iddi o dan adran 14 o Ddeddf Addysg 2002 i ddosbarthu'r arian hwn, yn unol â'r trefniadau arferol ar gyfer rhoi grantiau addysg a gofal plant. Ystyriwyd y trefniadau gan y Pwyllgor Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar 3 Mai.

Bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn croesawu ac yn cymeradwyo'r cynnig i drosglwyddo swm o £2.6 miliwn i iechyd i wella darpariaeth gwasanaethau deintyddol sylfaenol y GIG ymhellach. Bydd trosglwyddo arian ychwanegol i gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn ei gwneud yn bosibl gwario rhagor ar raglen addysg o dan arweiniad yr heddlu ar faterion diogelwch cymunedol, yn ymwneud â chyffuriau, alcohol, cam-drin yn y cartref ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Bydd hefyd yn helpu gweithredu'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad gan y Cyngor Ymgynghorol ar Gamddefnyddio Cyffuriau, 'Niwed Cudd'.

Bydd Aelodau'n ymwybodol fod cyfanswm cyllideb y Cynulliad, ar yr olwg gyntaf, yn ymddangos yn llai. Fodd bynnag, egluraf y rhesymau dros hyn rhag i neb gamddeall. Yr unig reswm pam mae'r gyllideb yn ymddangos yn llai yw fod y Cynulliad yn cael arian Ewropeaidd erbyn hyn heb orfod negodi darpariaeth gwariant y Trysorlys. Felly, mae'n ofynnol iddo ddangos y cyllid hwn fel derbyniad penodol. Mae cyfanswm cyllideb y Cynulliad wedi'i addasu i ddarparu ffigur ar gyfer y gwariant a ariannir gan y Trysorlys heb yr holl arian Ewropeaidd. Mae hyn yn gwneud ein cyllideb yn fwy eglur, a bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn croesawu hynny'n fawr. Yr unig reswm pam mae'r gyllideb ar gyfer menter, arloesed a rhwydweithiau a'r amgylchedd, cynllunio a chefn gwlad yn ymddangos yn llai yw'r ffaith fod y cyllidebau hyn bellach yn cael eu cofnodi heb y symiau Ewropeaidd sylweddol a gânt.

Mae manylion am y newidiadau wedi eu gosod allan yn y tablau a roddwyd i'r Aelodau, a chaiff systemau monitro ariannol y Cynulliad eu diweddarau i adlewyrchu'r newidiadau mor fuan â phosibl.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for coming forward with the revised figures and for her usual openness in the way in which she has presented the figures. Most of the changes are technical and are mostly accounting changes. I also thank the Members' research service which has been extremely helpful in finding a way around some of the points in the notes with which I have needed assistance. For example, I discovered that some figures which are shown as reductions are actually increases in the social justice budget.

I hope that the Minister will take up two particular issues on the social justice budget. I realise that matters in relation to police pension payments will go to the Home Office. However, at the same time, can we take the opportunity to reinforce the message—as the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has done—about the way in which we expect the full costs of level 2 policing and restructuring to be met from the Home Office? We should not miss that opportunity for a free shot to underline the point.

I am aware that the Minister has previously referred to my next point in relation to the £13 million that will go directly to schools where there are disadvantaged children, which we wholly endorse. However, the Minister has acknowledged that there needs to be flexibility in the criteria for determining disadvantaged schools; there is a problem with the eligibility-for-free-school-meals criteria used, which has been referred to by Members across all parties. I hope that there will be some flexibility because one or two schools near the margin will, perhaps, have a legitimate concern there. However, subject to that, we are happy with these figures and I thank the Minister for bringing them forward.

**Janet Ryder:** Plaid Cymru will support this money. While we will support the transfer into the education budget of £13 million for the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme, and while we accept that you need to target money within the education budget, I will raise several points, which might be better

**Nick Bourne:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am gyflwyno'r ffigurau diwygiedig ac am eu cyflwyno yn ei ffordd agored arferol. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r newidiadau yn rhai technegol ac yn newidiadau cyfrifyddu yn bennaf. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau sydd wedi rhoi cymaint o gymorth i egluro rhai o'r pwyntiau yn y nodiadau, cymorth yr oedd arnaf fi ei angen. Er enghraifft, darganfŷm fod rhai ffigurau sydd i'w gweld fel gostyngiadau yn godiadau mewn gwirionedd yn y gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â dau fater penodol yn y gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Sylweddolaf fod materion mewn perthynas â thaliadau pensiwn yr heddlu yn fater i'r Swyddfa Gartref. Fodd bynnag, ar yr un pryd, a gawn ni achub ar y cyfle hwn i atgyfnerthu'r neges—fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio—am y ffordd y disgwyliwn i'r Swyddfa Gartref dalu costau llawn plismona ac ailstrwythuro lefel 2. Ni ddylem golli'r cyfle hwnnw i danlinellu'r pwynt.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol fod y Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio eisoes at fy mhwynt nesaf mewn cysylltiad â'r £13 miliwn a gaiff ei roi'n uniongyrchol i ysgolion lle mae plant difreintiedig, rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei gefnogi'n llwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod bod angen hyblygrwydd o ran y meini prawf ar gyfer pennu ysgolion difreintiedig; cyfyd problem gyda'r meini prawf i bennu cymhwyster i gael cinio ysgol am ddim, a chyfeiriodd Aelodau o bob plaid at hynny. Gobeithio y bydd ychydig hyblygrwydd oherwydd efallai y bydd gan un neu ddwy ysgol ar y ffin bryderon dilys yn hyn. Fodd bynnag, yn amodol ar hynny, yr ydym yn fodlon ar y ffigurau hyn, a diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am eu cyflwyno.

**Janet Ryder:** Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r arian hwn. Er ein bod yn cefnogi'r cynnig i drosglwyddo £13 miliwn i'r gyllideb addysg i godi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yn rhaglen Cymru, ac er ein bod yn derbyn bod angen ichi dargedu arian yn y gyllideb addysg, codaf sawl pwynt byddai'n well efallai i'ch cyd-Weinidog, y



addressed by your colleague, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills.

We have never had the opportunity, as an Assembly, to debate this money. It was announced in a written statement; neither Plenary nor the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee were given the opportunity to discuss it. We had a report on this as part of the Minister's report to the last Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee meeting but we are still waiting to be told how this money will be monitored. When the Minister came to the Committee on School Funding meeting at the end of March, she promised that, when she brought the details to committee, she would tell us how she was going to monitor the money. [*Interruption.*] It is on the record, Minister. When you came to committee, there was nothing there to say how it was going to be monitored. We need to know what the monitoring procedures are going to be so that we can see that this targeted money will have an effect.

I draw your attention, Finance Minister—and I am sure that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is well aware of this—to the fact that the instrument being used to distribute this grant, as Nick Bourne pointed out, is a very blunt tool. It can be used at a county level, but when you take it below that level and when a Minister tells counties which schools should have this money, which has never happened before, it is not a good indicator. Even your own backbench colleagues have pointed out that it does not work. On 20 March, Carl Sargeant, in the Flintshire *Evening Leader*, said that measuring the proportion of free school dinners in a school was not an accurate method of judging whether its pupil base was disadvantaged. He said,

‘Some of the indicators need to be more balanced and we really need to look at updating the criteria.’

If it is educational achievement that you are trying to update, use an educational indicator. It needs to be a better method. If the county level had been used, then, with discussions at that county level, the Minister would have

Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oeseu hateb a Sgiliau ymdrin â hwy.

Nid ydym erioed wedi cael cyfle, fel Cynulliad, i drafod yr arian hwn. Fe'i cyhoeddwyd mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig; nid yw'r Cyfarfod Llawn na'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi cael cyfle i'w drafod. Cawsom adroddiad ar hyn fel rhan o adroddiad y Gweinidog i gyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ond yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl clywed sut y caiff yr arian hwn ei fonitro. Pan ddaeth y Gweinidog i gyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion ddiwedd mis Mawrth, addawodd, wrth gyflwyno'r manylion i'r pwyllgor, y byddai'n dweud wrthym sut yr oedd am fonitro'r arian. [*Torri ar draws.*] Dyna beth sydd wedi'i gofnodi, Weinidog. Pan ddaeth i'r pwyllgor, nid oedd dim i ddweud sut yr oeddech yn bwriadu monitro'r arian. Mae angen inni wybod beth fydd y gweithdrefnau monitro fel y gallwn weld y bydd yr arian hwn sydd wedi'i dargedu yn cael effaith.

Tynnaf eich sylw, Weinidog Cyllid—ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn hollol ymwybodol o hyn—at y ffaith nad yw'r offeryn a ddefnyddir ar gyfer dosbarthu'r grant hwn, fel yr eglurodd Nick Bourne, yn un cynnil iawn. Gellir ei ddefnyddio ar lefel sir, ond pan ewch o dan y lefel honno a phan fydd Gweinidog yn dweud wrth siroedd pa ysgolion a ddylai gael yr arian hwn, nad yw erioed wedi digwydd o'r blaen, nid yw'n ddangosydd da. Mae hyd yn oed eich cyd-aelodau ar y meinciau cefn wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad yw'n gweithio. Ar 20 Mawrth, dywedodd Carl Sargeant, yn *Evening Leader* sir y Fflint, nad oedd mesur cyfran y plant sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim mewn ysgol yn ffordd gywir i farnu a oedd ei disgyblion yn ddifreintiedig. Meddai,

Mae angen i rai o'r dangosyddion fod yn fwy cytbwys ac mae gwir angen inni ystyried diweddarau'r meini prawf.

Os cyflawniad addysgol yr ydych yn ceisio'i ddiweddarau, defnyddiwch ddangosydd addysgol. Mae angen dull gwell. Pe bai'r lefel sirol wedi ei defnyddio fel sail, yna gyda thrafodaethau ar y lefel honno byddai'r

achieved what she wanted to achieve in conjunction with her colleagues in local government. Instead, she has dictated to them in which schools they should spend this money. So, it is important that we get monitoring procedures in place, because we want to see exactly what impact this is going to have.

**Peter Black:** The Liberal Democrats will also support this motion because, even if we disagree with the way in which the money is being distributed to schools, we are not going to oppose an injection of £13 million into education. That is an important principle. Any headteacher will say that they welcome that, no matter in what form it comes. However, we have reservations about the way that the money is being distributed.

When I first heard about this proposal to introduce the RAISE grant, to distribute money according to deprivation measures, particularly that of free school meals, my first question was on the assumption behind this whole grant being that schools already have adequate finance. Many schools will tell you that that is simply not the case. It is no coincidence that the £13 million that is being put into the education budget is only £3 million short of the £16 million that was held back as a result of the Gershon review—of the 1 per cent saving that has been held back from local government, £16 million would have gone to education. Schools in 21 of the 22 authorities around Wales are feeling the force of that decision and are struggling to make ends meet as a result of the Welsh Assembly Government's withholding that money. The Finance Minister and the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills have said that they had made it clear to local education authorities that this money should not be taken out of school budgets. If that is the case, why did they not withhold £17 million rather than £33 million? If that £16 million had been put forward, I am sure that local education authorities would have been more than happy to have passed it on to schools.

4.00 p.m.

Gweinidog wedi cyflawni'r hyn yr oedd am ei gyflawni ar y cyd â'i chydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol. Yn lle hynny, mae wedi mynnu dweud wrthynt ym mha ysgolion y dylent wario'r arian hwn. Felly, mae'n bwysig fod gennym weithdrefnau monitro ar waith, oherwydd yr ydym am weld yn union pa effaith a gaiff hyn.

**Peter Black:** Bydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol hefyd yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, oherwydd hyd yn oed os ydym yn anghytuno â'r ffordd y dosberthir yr arian i ysgolion, nid ydym am wrthwynebu rhoi £13 miliwn ychwanegol i addysg. Mae hynny'n egwyddor bwysig. Bydd unrhyw bennaeth yn dweud ei fod yn croesawu hynny, ym mha ffurf bynnag y daw. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn amheus ynglŷn â'r ffordd y dosberthir yr arian.

Pan glywais gyntaf am y cynnig hwn i gyflwyno grant Rhagori, i ddosbarthu arian yn ôl mesurau amddifadedd, yn enwedig yn ôl canran y plant sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim, fy nghwestiwn cyntaf oedd am y dybiaeth sy'n sail i'r grant hwn fod ysgolion eisoes yn cael digon o gyllid. Bydd llawer o ysgolion yn dweud wrthynt nad yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad yw bod y swm o £13 miliwn sy'n cael ei roi yn y gyllideb addysg yn £3 miliwn yn unig yn brin o'r £16 miliwn a ataliwyd o ganlyniad i adolygiad Gershon—o'r arbediad o 1 y cant na roddwyd i lywodraeth leol, byddai £16 miliwn wedi mynd i addysg. Mae ysgolion mewn 21 o'r 22 o awdurdodau ledled Cymru yn teimlo effaith y penderfyniad hwnnw ac yn cael anhawster i gael dau ben llinyn ynghyd oherwydd penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i beidio â rhoi'r arian hwnnw. Mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi dweud iddynt egluro wrth awdurdodau addysg lleol na ddylid cymryd yr arian hwn o gyllidebau ysgolion. Os yw hynny'n wir, pam nad ataliwyd £17 miliwn ganddynt yn hytrach na £33 miliwn? Pe bai'r swm hwnnw o £16 miliwn wedi'i gyflwyno, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai awdurdodau addysg lleol wedi bod yn fwy na pharod i'w drosglwyddo i ysgolion.

The questions about the way in which this money is being distributed are valid. I think that we all consider free school meals to be a rough-and-ready indicator of deprivation. Carl Sargeant very much believes that, and, for once, I agree with him. We have to take that on board. In discussions in the Committee on School Funding, we have also come to that conclusion. We would hope that the Minister will be looking to review that particular indicator that measures deprivation.

There are other issues around this. The whole grant is being micromanaged by the Minister. Local government was not properly consulted on this. I understand that, in meetings with Ministers, local government made a number of points about how it is unhappy with the way in which the grant was being directed to specific schools without enabling it to have any say on its distribution. It is unhappy that this money, in some instances, in its belief, was going to schools that were likely to be closed in the near future, and it is unhappy that this grant is only being guaranteed for two years, when we have consistently talked, since this Assembly was established, about grants being sustainable over a longer period of time. It is also unhappy about the lack of consultation with it regarding the fact that this grant does not seem to have any objectives and that there is no means of measuring it. The whole RAISE grant is a shambles. It is going to some schools that have high numbers of pupils receiving free school meals, and yet there are other schools in deprived areas that are not receiving that money—Ogmore School in my region is one, and Rhyl High School in north Wales is another. It is going to primary schools but not to the schools that they feed into.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that the Minister is also breaking an agreement that the parties came to on the budget settlement, when a new pot of money was agreed to support small schools that suffer severe financial pressures? The Minister has made a bold statement in the literature that accompanies this grant that that money, instead of helping with administration costs, as was intended, will now be used as schools' proportion of

Mae'r cwestiynau ynghylch y ffordd y caiff yr arian hwn ei ddosbarthu yn ddilys. Credaf fod pawb ohonom yn ystyried mai dangosydd digon amrwd o amddifadedd yw cinio ysgol am ddim. Mae Carl Sargeant yn credu hynny, ac am unwaith yr wyf yn cytuno ag ef. Rhaid inni ystyried hynny. Mewn trafodaethau yn y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, daethom i'r casgliad hwnnw hefyd. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog am adolygu'r dangosydd penodol hwnnw sy'n mesur amddifadedd.

Cyfyd materion eraill ynglŷn â hyn. Mae'r holl grant yn cael ei feicoreoli gan y Gweinidog. Nid ymgynghorwyd yn llawn â llywodraeth leol ar y mater hwn. Deallaf fod llywodraeth leol, mewn cyfarfodydd gyda Gweinidogion, wedi cyflwyno nifer o bwyntiau ynglŷn â'i hanfodlonrwydd â'r modd yr oedd y grant yn cael ei gyfeirio at ysgolion penodol heb roi cyfle i lywodraeth leol gael lleisio barn am y dosbarthiad. Mae'n anfodlon bod yr arian hwn, mewn rhai achosion, ym marn llywodraeth leol yn mynd i ysgolion a oedd yn debygol o gael eu cau yn y dyfodol agos, ac mae'n anfodlon mai am ddwy flynedd yn unig y caiff y grant hwn ei sicrhau, a ninnau wedi bod yn sôn o hyd, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn, am sicrhau bod grantiau'n gynaliadwy dros gyfnod hwy. Mae hefyd yn anfodlon am y diffyg ymgynghori o ran y ffaith nad ymddengys bod gan y grant hwn unrhyw amcanion ac nad oes modd ei fesur. Mae'r grant Rhagori yn draed moch. Caiff ei roi i rai ysgolion sydd â niferoedd mawr o ddisgyblion sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim, ond eto nid yw ysgolion eraill mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn cael yr arian hwnnw—mae Ysgol Bro Ogwr yn fy rhanbarth i yn un o'r rhain, ac Ysgol Uwchradd y Rhyl yn y gogledd yn un arall. Caiff ei roi i ysgolion cynradd, ond nid i'r ysgolion y mae'r rheini'n eu bwydo.

**Janet Ryder:** A gytunwch fod y Gweinidog hefyd yn torri cytundeb a wnaed gan y pleidiau ar y setliad cyllid, pan gytunwyd ar gronfa newydd o arian i gynorthwyo ysgolion bach sy'n dioddef pwysau ariannol difrifol? Mae'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud datganiad beiddgar yn y deunydd sy'n dod gyda'r grant hwn y bydd yr arian hwnnw, yn hytrach na helpu gyda chostau gweinyddol, fel y'i bwriadwyd, yn cael ei ddefnyddio bellach fel

the RAISE grant. That further disadvantages small schools and totally breaks the cross-party agreement on the budget.

**Peter Black:** It is certainly true that money for other purposes and from other grants has been taken to go into the RAISE grant. That is a loss for some local councils.

The Minister has said that if this money had been given to all schools, as has happened in England, it would have been a smaller amount of money. I attended a school budget forum meeting in Swansea last week and spoke to headteachers, all of whom feel strongly about the way in which this grant has been handled. I think that most headteachers would have welcomed that small amount of money and it would have been better, perhaps, if that money had been distributed across the whole of Wales in that way.

We are not able to vote against this or table any amendments to this motion because of the way in which it has been brought before us. However, I hope that the Minister will take note of some of the criticisms that are coming from local government and opposition spokespeople on this, and, at the very least, will adjust the deprivation measures and refine them according to the RAISE grant so that the schools that have large numbers of deprived pupils will at least receive some of that money, which they are not currently receiving.

**John Marek:** I echo what Peter Black has said. I wish to talk about the money for disadvantaged schools and the fact that eligibility is based on school meals. I do not think that the Minister did this because she was not thinking carefully; I think that she was thinking carefully. She was ensuring that certain constituencies had more of the money than others. That is a simple matter. I also agree with Carl Sargeant on this. I wonder how many secondary schools—let us keep it to that for the moment—have not received the money in his constituency and how many have. In Karen Sinclair's constituency, it is only Ruabon High School that has received the money; none of the others have. In my constituency of Wrexham, only Rhosnesni

cyfran ysgolion o'r grant Rhagori. Mae hynny'n rhoi ysgolion bach dan anfantais ychwanegol ac mae'n chwalu'n llwyr y cytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y gyllideb.

**Peter Black:** Mae'n sicr yn wir bod arian at ddibenion eraill ac o grantiau eraill wedi'i gymryd i'w roi yn y grant Rhagori. Mae hynny'n golled i rai cynghorau lleol.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, pe bai'r arian hwn wedi'i roi i bob ysgol, fel y digwyddodd yn Lloegr, y byddaiswm wedi bod yn llai. Euthum i gyfarfod fforwm ar gyllideb ysgolion yn Abertawe yr wythnos diwethaf. Bûm yn siarad â phenaethiaid, a theimlai pob un ohonynt yn gryf ynghylch y modd yr ymdriniwyd â'r grant hwn. Credaf y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o benaethiaid wedi croesawu'r swm bach hwnnw o arian, a hwyrach y buasai'n well pe bai'r arian hwnnw wedi ei ddosbarthu drwy Gymru gyfan fel hynny.

Ni allwn bleidleisio yn erbyn hyn na chyflwyno unrhyw welliannau i'r cynnig hwn oherwydd y modd y cafodd ei gyflwyno ger ein bron. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn nodi rhai o'r beirniadaethau a wnaed gan lywodraeth leol a llefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau ar hyn. Gobeithio hefyd y bydd o leiaf yn addasu'r mesurau amddifadedd ac yn eu mireinio yn unol â'r grant Rhagori, fel y bydd yr ysgolion sydd â nifer fawr o blant difreintiedig yn cael rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw nad ydynt yn ei gael ar hyn o bryd.

**John Marek:** Ategaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Peter Black. Hoffwn sôn am yr arian i ysgolion difreintiedig a'r ffaith fod cymhwyster yn seiliedig ar ginio ysgol. Ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog wedi gwneud hyn am nad oedd yn meddwl yn ofalus; credaf ei bod yn meddwl yn ofalus. Yr oedd yn sicrhau bod rhai etholaethau'n cael mwy o'r arian nag eraill. Mae hynny'n fater syml. Cytunaf hefyd â Carl Sargeant ar hyn. Tybed faint o ysgolion uwchradd—canolbwyntiwn ar hynny am y tro—nad ydynt wedi cael yr arian yn ei etholaeth ef, a faint sydd wedi ei gael. Yn etholaeth Karen Sinclair, dim ond Ysgol Uwchradd Rhiwabon sydd wedi cael yr arian; nid oes yr un o'r lleill wedi ei gael. Yn fy etholaeth i yn Wrecsam, dim ond

High School has received it; none of the others have. Most people in Wrexham will tell you that it is other schools that are disadvantaged and deserve the money. Has the Minister simply done this because it is the usual south Wales M4 Cabinet, and it cannot think about anything that is further than 20 miles north of Cefncoedycymer? I would not be surprised. You must answer the following question, Minister: why do you disadvantage north Wales? Perhaps we need to do a little investigation into this. Let us go around the Cabinet table. How many schools in the constituencies of the Cabinet Members will benefit? I wonder. North-east Wales is certainly not benefiting. I do not think that Carl Sargeant is benefiting. I will give way to Karen Sinclair. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I want to hear this intervention.

**Karen Sinclair:** Thank you, John. I am well aware that there were some schools that I thought should benefit that did not. In fact, I am lobbying hard and making representations to Jane Davidson with regard to one school. How many letters have you sent, and how many times have you spoken to the Minister about these schools between the publication of the list and speaking now in the Chamber? I would be very grateful if you would answer that question directly.

**John Marek:** I will answer it by saying that I am making a speech on this subject and that I am asking the Minister to adopt a fair policy across the whole of Wales instead of seeking to advantage certain parts of Wales over others. That is what is happening with this. I do not think that I need to say any more. We all understand what is going on here. Mark?

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you agree with me that following a recent meeting—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Is this an intervention? I thought that John Marek had finished.

**Mark Isherwood:** I asked a question to the Minister with responsibility for local

Ysgol Uwchradd Rhosnesni sydd wedi ei gael; dim un o'r lleill. Bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn Wrecsam yn dweud wrthych mai ysgolion eraill sy'n ddifreintiedig ac sy'n haeddu cael yr arian. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi gwneud hyn oherwydd mai Cabinet arferol yr M4 a'r de sydd yma, ac na all ystyried unrhyw beth ymhellach nag 20 milltir i'r gogledd o Gefncoedycymer? Ni fyddai hynny'n fy synnu. Rhaid ichi ateb y cwestiwn canlynol, Weinidog: pam yr ydych yn rhoi'r gogledd dan anfantais? Efallai fod angen ymchwilio i hyn. Gadewch inni fynd o amgylch bwrdd y Cabinet. Faint o ysgolion yn etholaethau Aelodau'r Cabinet fydd yn elwa? Tybed. Mae'n sicr nad yw'r gogledd-ddwyrain yn elwa. Ni chredaf fod Carl Sargeant yn elwa. Ildiaf i Karen Sinclair. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn glywed yr ymyriad hwn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Diolch, John. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn bod rhai ysgolion yr oeddwn wedi credu y dylent elwa heb gael arian. Yn wir, yr wyf yn llobio'n galed ac yn cyflwyno sylwadau i Jane Davidson mewn perthynas ag un ysgol. Faint o lythrau a anfonwyd gennych, a sawl gwaith yr ydych wedi siarad â'r Gweinidog am yr ysgolion hyn rhwng adeg cyhoeddi'r rhestr a siarad heddiw yn y Siambr? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw'n uniongyrchol.

**John Marek:** Atebaf y cwestiwn drwy ddweud fy mod yn cyflwyno araith ar y pwnc hwn ac yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog fabwysiadu polisi teg ledled Cymru, yn hytrach na cheisio sicrhau bod rhai rhannau o Gymru yn elwa mwy nag eraill. Dyna beth sy'n digwydd yn hyn. Ni chredaf fod angen dweud mwy. Mae pob un ohonom yn deall y sefyllfa. Mark?

**Mark Isherwood:** A gytunwch â mi yn dilyn cyfarfod diweddar—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ai ymyriad yw hwn? Yr oeddwn yn credu bod John Marek wedi gorffen.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol

government on this specific point last week, with your agreement and on behalf of both of us.

**John Marek:** It is the usual Labour policy of trying to make mischief. It knows when it is trying to rig something, and it is trying to rig the distribution of this money. It should come to its senses, and I will listen with interest to what the Minister has to say about the fairness of the distribution of this money based upon school meals. It is certainly not fair in Wrexham or in the constituencies of Karen Sinclair and Carl Sargeant. Something is wrong somewhere.

**Jenny Randerson:** I thank the Minister for her statement, which she has made in her usual helpful and transparent manner. The Welsh Liberal Democrats certainly welcome the additional money for health, and we welcome additional money for education. However, I would briefly like to repeat the concerns raised about the process that has been used. I would like the Minister to consider whether, as Finance Minister, she regards this as an ideal and appropriate way of announcing significant amounts of new money for a particular budget.

There has been no opportunity to question the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills in detail about the way in which this money has been allocated, which is clearly controversial. Years ago, I was told as a school governor that the percentage of children eligible for free school meals was a very blunt instrument and a poor indicator or real need. As an example, schools with high numbers of ethnic minority pupils do not accurately reflect any level of deprivation because there is a trend for ethnic minority pupils not to take free school meals.

We will support this, because you cannot refuse to support it, and I wonder whether this is why the Minister has chosen to do it in this way. The Labour Assembly Government has an uncanny knack of turning a good news story into a bad news story. In this case, it is done by the obduracy of the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, who

ar y pwynt hwn yr wythnos diwethaf, gyda'ch cytundeb ac ar ein rhan ein dau.

**John Marek:** Polisi arferol Llafur o geisio creu drygioni yw hyn. Mae'n gwybod pan fydd yn ceisio trefnu rhywbeth er lles Llafur ei hun, ac mae'n ceisio gwneud hynny yn y ffordd y mae'n dosbarthu'r arian hwn. Dylai bwylllo, a byddaf yn gwrando'n astud ar yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am degwch y modd y dosberthir yr arian hwn yn seiliedig ar ginio ysgol. Yn sicr, nid yw'n deg yn Wrecsam nac yn etholaethau Karen Sinclair a Carl Sargeant. Mae rhywbeth o'i le rywle.

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, yn ei ffordd gymwynasgar ac eglur arferol. Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn sicr yn croesawu'r arian ychwanegol ar gyfer iechyd, a chroesawn arian ychwanegol ar gyfer addysg. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ailadrodd yn fyr y pryderon a godwyd am y broses a ddefnyddiwyd. Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ystyried a yw hi, fel y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn ystyried bod hon yn ffordd ddelfrydol a phriodol i gyhoeddi symiau sylweddol o arian newydd ar gyfer cyllideb arbennig.

Ni chafwyd cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn fanwl am y modd y dyrannwyd yr arian hwn, sy'n amlwg yn bwnc llosg. Flynyddoedd yn ôl, dywedwyd wrthyf fel llywodraethwr ysgol mai ffordd amrwd o nodi amddifadedd oedd canran y plant sy'n gymwys i gael cinio ysgol am ddim, a bod hynny'n ddangosydd gwael o angen gwirioneddol. Fel enghraifft, nid yw ysgolion sydd â niferoedd mawr o ddisgyblion o leiafrifoedd ethnig yn adlewyrchu'n gywir unrhyw lefel o amddifadedd am fod tuedd i ddisgyblion o leiafrifoedd ethnig beidio â chymryd cinio ysgol am ddim.

Byddwn yn cefnogi hyn, oherwydd ni allwch wrthod ei gefnogi, a thybed ai dyna pam y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dewis ei wneud fel hyn? Mae gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad ddawn ryfedd o droi newyddion da yn newyddion drwg. Yn yr achos hwn, mae hyn yn digwydd oherwydd ystyfnigrwydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a

has twisted and turned in insisting that she would not bring to Plenary these proposals for agreement.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that we need to ask the Finance Minister, who is also the Minister with responsibility for local government and public services, whether, in her opinion, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has broken the agreed protocol with local government over the issuing of new money to schools? If a special grant is issued to local government, the protocol followed is that it will be notified if that grant is to come to an end, or it will be given for the full three years for which it is issued, and it will then roll into the RSG.

4.10 p.m.

A sum of £3 million was issued last year to schools that were underachieving. Without any warning at all, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has rolled that money into this new agreement. It has meant that, in some cases, local authorities have had to tell schools, 'I am sorry, the Minister with responsibility for education has taken away the money that we were giving you to raise standards'. Do you agree that the Minister with responsibility for local government and public services needs to look at whether her Cabinet colleague has broken that protocol with local government?

**Jenny Randerson:** I agree with you, Janet, but I think that one of the most significant things is that Welsh local government agrees with you. Perhaps the concern of some schools that have lost money is one of the reasons why the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills was so keen to avoid scrutiny.

We have to look at our processes. With our current limited powers, our main task at present is to allocate money and to make sure that money is spent efficiently. We have been able to ask questions here today, but Jane Davidson will not be there to answer them. The task falls to the Finance Minister, who, I believe, should not have to shoulder that responsibility. It is not adequate for a

Sgiliau, sydd wedi gwneud pob ymdrech i fynnu na fyddai'n cyflwyno'r cynigion hyn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn i gytuno arnynt.

**Janet Ryder:** A gytunwch fod angen inni holi'r Gweinidog Cyllid, sydd hefyd yn gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, yn ei barn hi, wedi torri'r protocol y cytunwyd arno gyda llywodraeth leol dros ddosbarthu arian newydd i ysgolion? Os caiff grant arbennig ei roi i lywodraeth leol, y protocol a ddilynir yw y bydd yn cael gwybod os bydd y grant hwnnw'n dod i ben, neu y bydd yn cael ei roi am y tair blynedd lawn a fwriadwyd ac yna'n cael ei gynnwys yn y Grant Cynnal Refeniw.

Dosbarthwyd swm o £3 miliwn y llynedd i ysgolion a oedd yn tangyflawni. Heb unrhyw rybudd o gwbl, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi cynnwys yr arian hwnnw yn y cytundeb newydd hwn. Mae'n golygu, mewn rhai achosion, fod awdurdodau lleol wedi gorfod dweud wrth ysgolion, 'Mae'n ddrwg gennym, mae'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am addysg wedi atal yr arian yr oeddem yn ei roi ichi i godi safonau'. A gytunwch fod angen i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ystyried a yw ei chyd-Weinidog yn y Cabinet wedi torri'r protocol hwnnw gyda llywodraeth leol?

**Jenny Randerson:** Cytunaf â chi, Janet, ond y peth pwysig, yn fy marn i, yw bod llywodraeth leol Cymru yn cytuno â chi. Efallai mai'r pryder a fynegwyd gan rai ysgolion sydd wedi colli arian yw un o'r rhesymau pam mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau mor awyddus i osgoi prosesau craffu.

Rhaid inni edrych ar ein prosesau. Gyda'n pwerau cyfyngedig presennol, ein prif dasg ar hyn o bryd yw dyrannu arian a sicrhau y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario'n effeithlon. Yr ydym wedi gallu gofyn cwestiynau yma heddiw, ond ni fydd Jane Davidson yno i'w hateb. Y Gweinidog Cyllid fydd yn gwneud hynny, ac ni chredaf y dylai orfod cymryd y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Nid yw'n ddigonol i

Minister to avoid scrutiny in this way.

**The Finance Minister (Sue Essex):** A large number of points were raised, and I will try to link some of them together. First, I thank Nick for his considered contribution. I will do my best to answer the points that he made. On the money going into the social justice budget, it would have been nice if someone could have said, 'What good news this money is', because this money is going right to the front line to support those youngsters most in need, to follow up on schemes that are working extremely well in schools and to intensify and extend those schemes. That is the money that went through the social justice budget.

**Leanne Wood:** Will you take an intervention?

**Sue Essex:** No, I have a lot of points to respond to, Leanne, and I will not be able to get through them all.

In terms of the points about the police, the money coming in and going out relates to the complications of the police funding system that we have. As you know, Edwina Hart has made representations about the cost of the merger, which I have endorsed, but we have also made the point that we feel that the chance should be seized to streamline the funding system of police authorities in Wales. It is an extremely complex way of funding, with money coming in and going out again, but that is what that money is about.

In terms of counting the numbers receiving free school meals, several Members have mentioned, over the past couple of weeks, instances in their own constituencies that they feel need to be looked at again. If someone wishes to make representations that the figures are not right, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has confirmed that they should be looked at, just to make sure that people feel that that is fair.

On Janet Ryder's contribution, which picked up some of the things that Peter Black and Jenny Randerson said, this is new money.

Weinidog osgoi prosesau craffu fel hyn.

**Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex):** Codwyd nifer o bwyntiau, a cheisiaf gysylltu rhai ohonynt. I ddechrau, hoffwn ddiolch i Nick am ei gyfraniad ystyriol. Gwnaf fy ngorau i ateb y pwyntiau a wnaeth. O ran yr arian sy'n mynd i'r gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, byddai wedi bod yn braf pe bai rhywun wedi dweud, 'Mae'r arian hwn yn newyddion da iawn', oherwydd mae'r arian hwn yn mynd yn syth i'r rheng flaen i gynorthwyo'r bobl ifanc hynny sydd ag arnynt ei angen fwyaf, i ddilyn cynlluniau sy'n gweithio'n arbennig o dda mewn ysgolion, ac i ddwysáu ac ehangu'r cynlluniau hynny. Dyna'r arian a aeth drwy'r gyllideb cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

**Leanne Wood:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Sue Essex:** Na wna, mae gennyf lawer o bwyntiau i ymateb iddynt, Leanne, ac ni fyddaf yn gallu mynd drwyddynt i gyd.

O ran y pwyntiau am yr heddlu, mae'r arian sy'n dod i mewn ac sy'n mynd allan yn gysylltiedig â chymhlethdodau system ariannu'r heddlu. Fel y gwyddoch, gwnaeth Edwina Hart rai sylwadau am gostau uno, ac yr wyf wedi'u cefnogi. Ond yr ydym hefyd wedi nodi ein bod yn credu y dylid bachu ar y cyfle i symleiddio system ariannu awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru. Mae'n ffordd gymhleth iawn o ariannu, gydag arian yn dod i mewn ac yn mynd allan eto, ond dyna yw pwrpas yr arian hwnnw.

O ran cyfrif y niferoedd sy'n cael cinio ysgol am ddim, mae nifer o Aelodau wedi sôn, yn ystod yr ychydig o wythnosau diwethaf, am achosion yn eu hetholaethau eu hunain y maent yn credu bod angen edrych arnynt eto. Os bydd rhywun am wneud sylwadau nad yw'r ffigurau'n gywir, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi cadarnhau y dylid edrych arnynt, dim ond er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn teimlo bod hynny'n deg.

O ran cyfraniad Janet Ryder, a gyfeiriodd at rai o'r pethau a grybwyllodd Peter Black a Jenny Randerson, arian newydd yw hwn. Yn



Interestingly, Jane and I have had considerable discussions about how we achieve for the underachievers. We know that, in education terms, we have made huge strides in Wales. We are not getting enough success from those youngsters who are trapped in an underachievement trap. When the question of allocating the money arose and when the transference came across the block—and it was good news from Gordon Brown, yet again—I was happy to say that the bulk of the allocation should make a start. I want to make sure that we make a start at trying to address the underachievement issue because it is a blot on a civilised society. I think that we all feel strongly about this.

To pick up on Jenny's point about the process, I would have preferred not to have used this process, but it was just one of those timing issues. The budget announcement from Gordon Brown came late in March, towards the end of the second session. There was a lot of pressure on us to make speedy decisions, and as you know, there were a lot of representations on the education side. We looked at the Standing Orders; we could not go through the process of putting that budget through in that financial year and follow Standing Orders. That is reality of it. Therefore, I am doing this now in a MEG-to-MEG motion.

You must accept that, when we get this money, there are occasions when a Government is faced with pressure to make quick decisions. I hope that, by coming forwards today, you will take my word that that was the approach that we felt that we had to make. As I said, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has gone through some of the education points in detail in about an hour's session in the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee.

I do not believe that there is any point in my going into huge detail. Many questions have been raised; I will pick up on some of the main themes. Free school meals were brought forward as an indicator—and it is based on eligibility, not on pure take-up—because of

ddiddorol ddigon, mae Jane a minnau wedi cael trafodaethau sylweddol am y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflawni ar gyfer y rheini sy'n tangyflawni. Gwyddom, o ran addysg, ein bod wedi cymryd camau breision yng Nghymru. Nid ydym yn gweld digon o lwyddiant gan y bobl ifanc hynny sydd wedi'u dal mewn cylch o dangyflawni. Pan gododd y cwestiwn o ddyrannu'r arian, a phan gafodd yr arian ychwanegol ei drosglwyddo i'r bloc—a newyddion da a gafwyd gan Gordon Brown, unwaith eto—yr oeddwn yn falch dweud y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r dyraniad yn ddechrau da. Yr wyf am sicrhau ein bod yn dechrau'r gwaith o geisio mynd i'r afael â phroblem tangyflawni, oherwydd mae'n destun cywilydd i gymdeithas waraidd. Credaf ein bod bob un yn teimlo'n gryf am hyn.

I ddychwelyd at bwynt Jenny am y broses, byddai wedi bod yn well gennyf beidio â defnyddio'r broses hon, ond yr amseriad oedd y broblem. Daeth cyhoeddiad y gyllideb gan Gordon Brown ddiwedd mis Mawrth, tuag diwedd yr ail sesiwn. Yr oedd llawer o bwysau arnom i wneud penderfyniadau'n gyflym, ac fel y gwyddoch, cafwyd nifer o sylwadau gan yr ochr addysg. Edrychwyd ar y Rheolau Sefydlog; ni allem fynd drwy'r broses o gyflwyno'r gyllideb honno yn y flwyddyn ariannol honno a dilyn y Rheolau Sefydlog. Dyna'r gwirionedd. Felly, yr wyf yn gwneud hyn yn awr mewn cynnig i drosglwyddo rhwng prif grwpiau gwariant.

Rhaid ichi dderbyn, pan gawn yr arian hwn, fod yna adegau pan fydd Llywodraeth yn wynebu pwysau i wneud penderfyniadau cyflym. Fy ngobaith yw y byddwch, gan imi ddod ger eich bron heddiw, yn cymryd fy ngair mai dyna'r dull yr oeddem yn teimlo ei bod yn rhai inni ei ddefnyddio. Fel y dywedais, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi mynd drwy rai o'r pwyntiau ynglŷn ag addysg yn fanwl mewn sesiwn o tuag awr yn y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

Ni chredaf fod diben imi fynd drwy unrhyw bwynt yn fanwl iawn. Mae nifer o gwestiynau wedi eu codi; a thrafodaf rai o'r prif themâu. Cyflwynwyd cinio ysgol am ddim fel dangosydd—ac mae'n seiliedig ar gymhwysedd, nid ar niferoedd yn unig—

the work of Estyn and the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, which showed that it is a good proxy for disadvantaged children. This money is about children, Peter. It may be going to schools, because that is where free school meals, and other underachievement, is easily managed and calculated. However, we want to follow this process, and see how we can follow it, and how we can support the children who are most in need and are underachieving.

**Peter Black:** If you accept that the money is going on a specific activity, in some instances, it will go to schools that are struggling with their core funding. They will have to have greater class sizes, and yet we are using this money, so those children will be gaining on the one hand and losing out on the other.

**Sue Essex:** I do not know exactly where that argument is going; I can face your efficiency one. If you would like to write to Jane and me, we will look at that again. However, one argument that was mentioned was, 'Oh, well, the school might close'. This money is primarily to support those children in terms of learning. It is not necessarily to go into the fabric of the building; it is about the help and support that individual children need. We must—and I say this as Finance Minister—look at ways and methods in which we can target those resources to the children who are most in need. We had to make a quick decision, and we are all content with that. I have lost count of the formulae that have come up with which someone does not have some gripe or other. My challenge to everyone is to come up with something better; I am prepared to listen.

**Karen Sinclair:** As John Marek declined to answer my simple question to him—and you will know that I questioned figures and statistics in the Wrexham area—will you clarify whether you have had any representation from John Marek, other than the hot air that he spat out in the Chamber today, whether by e-mail, letter or spoken word about the Wrexham area?

**Sue Essex:** I have had many representations, but I do not remember any representation

oherwydd gwaith Estyn a Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, a ddangosodd ei fod yn gyfrwng da i allu nodi plant difreintiedig. Mae'r arian hwn yn ymwneud â phlant, Peter. Efallai mai i ysgolion y mae'n mynd, am mai dyna ble y caiff prydau ysgol am ddim, ynghyd â thangyflawniadau eraill, eu rheoli a'u cyfrifo'n rhwydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am ddilyn y broses hon, a gweld sut y gallwn ei dilyn, a sut y gallwn gynorthwyo'r plant sydd fwyaf mewn angen ac sy'n tangyflawni.

**Peter Black:** Os ydych yn derbyn y caiff yr arian ei wario ar weithgarwch penodol, mewn rhai achosion bydd yn mynd i ysgolion sy'n cael trafferthion gyda'u harian craidd. Bydd angen iddynt gael dosbarthiadau mwy o faint, ac eto yr ydym yn defnyddio'r arian hwn, felly bydd y plant hynny ar eu hennill ar y naill law ac ar eu colled ar y llaw arall.

**Sue Essex:** Ni wn yn union i ba gyfeiriad y mae'r ddadl honno yn mynd; gallaf wynebu eich dadl ar effeithlonrwydd. Os hoffech ysgrifennu at Jane a minnau, byddwn yn ystyried hynny eto. Fodd bynnag, un ddadl a godwyd oedd, 'O, wel, efallai y bydd yr ysgol yn cau'. Prif ddiben yr arian hwn yw cynorthwyo'r plant hynny o ran dysgu; nid yw o anghenraid ar gyfer adeiladwaith ysgolion. Mae'n ymwneud â helpu a chynorthwyo'r plentyn unigol sydd mewn angen. Rhaid inni edrych—a dywedaf hyn fel y Gweinidog Cyllid—ar y ffordd y gallwn dargedu'r adnoddau hynny i'r plant sydd fwyaf mewn angen. Yr oedd yn rhaid inni wneud penderfyniad cyflym, ac yr ydym i gyd yn fodlon ar hynny. Ni allaf gofio faint o fformiwlâu sydd wedi eu hawgrymu pan nad oedd rhywun yn anfodlon ar ryw agwedd arnynt. Fy her i bawb yw awgrymu rhywbeth gwell; yr wyf yn fodlon gwranddo.

**Karen Sinclair:** Gan fod John Marek wedi gwrthod ateb fy nghwestiwn syml iddo—a gwyddoch fy mod wedi amau ffigurau ac ystadegau yn ardal Wrecsam—a wnewch chi egluro a ydych wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau gan John Marek, ac eithrio'r malu awyr yn y Siambr heddiw, naill ai drwy e-bost, llythyr neu ar lafar am ardal Wrecsam?

**Sue Essex:** Cefais nifer o sylwadau, ond ni allaf fi, na'm cyd-Weinidog Jane Davidson,

from John Marek, and neither does my colleague, Jane Davidson. gofio unrhyw sylwadau gan John Marek.

I will wind up now, as there are other pressures on our time. This extra money is good news. I do not think that anyone here has argued against the distribution of that extra funding that we had from Gordon Brown. Therefore, we have made the right decisions. There may be arguments around the formula, but there always are. As I said, this is the beginning of a major effort to tackle underachievement. I am sure that those discussions about distributing money with the local government association, and with all sorts of organisations, will carry on apace. In the meantime, it is important that that money gets to the front line. That is why the decision was made, across the piece, in education, dentistry, and the social justice field. This money is needed. I feel strongly that we made that decision in good faith to ensure that money was going to the front line, and that will indeed happen if everyone agrees to this motion.

Dof i ben yn awr, gan fod galwadau eraill ar ein hamser. Mae'r arian ychwanegol hwn yn newyddion da. Ni chredaf fod neb yma wedi dadlau yn erbyn dosbarthu'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw a gawsom gan Gordon Brown. Felly, yr ydym wedi gwneud y penderfyniad cywir. Efallai y bydd dadleuon ynglŷn â'r fformiwla, ond mae hynny'n digwydd bob tro. Fel y dywedais, dyma ddechrau ar ymdrech fawr i fynd i'r afael â thangyflawni. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y trafodaethau hynny am ddsbarthu arian gyda'r gymdeithas llywodraeth leol, a chyda pob math o sefydliadau, yn parhau. Yn y cyfamser, mae'n bwysig fod yr arian yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen. Dyna pam y gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad, yn gyffredinol, mewn addysg, deintyddiaeth a maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae angen yr arian hwn. Teimlaf yn gryf inni wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw yn ffyddiog i sicrhau y byddai'r arian yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen, a bydd hynny'n sicr o ddigwydd os bydd pawb yn cytuno i'r cynnig hwn.

*Cynnig (NDM3040): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3040): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu The Manufacturing Industry**

Motion (NDM3041): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3041): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the increasing strength of competition within the manufacturing sector globally;*

*1. yn nodi cryfder cynyddol y gystadleuaeth yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn fyd-eang;*

*2. recognises the continuing need for the manufacturing sector in Wales to position itself to take advantage of the global situation;*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru roi ei hun mewn sefyllfa i fanteisio ar y sefyllfa fyd-eang;*

*3. endorses the need for continued public sector support for the sector in Wales.*

*3. yn cadarnhau'r angen i roi cefnogaeth barhaus gan y sector cyhoeddus i'r sector yng Nghymru.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In point 2, after 'global situation', insert:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ym mhwynt 2, cynnwys ar ôl 'sefyllfa fyd-eang':

*and, in the light of the limited availability of footloose international companies in the manufacturing sector, recognises the growing importance of indigenous small and medium-sized enterprises and urges the*

*ac, yng ngoleuni'r nifer gyfyngedig o gwmpniau rhyngwladol troedrydd yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu, yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cynyddol busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint cynhenid ac yn annog y Llywodraeth i*

- Government to take proactive steps to help existing manufacturing SMEs in Wales to expand and new ones to be established;* *gymryd camau rhagweithiol i helpu'r BBaCh yn y maes gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru i ehangu ac i sefydlu rhai newydd;*
- Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. In point 3, after 'Wales', insert: *Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ym mhwynt 3, cynnwys ar ôl 'Cymru':*
- and therefore recognises the need for a more focused and strategic approach to the use of EU funding.* *ac felly'n cydnabod yr angen am ddull gweithredu mwy strategol a phenodol at y defnydd o gyllid yr UE.*
- Amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: *Gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*
- target investment at growth industries and industries of the future.* *yn targedu buddsoddiad at ddiwydiannau twf a diwydiannau'r dyfodol.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: *Gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*
- recognises that Wales's manufacturing position would be strengthened by membership of the euro.* *yn cydnabod y byddai safle Cymru o ran gweithgynhyrchu'n cael ei gryfhau drwy aelodaeth o'r ewro.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: *Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*
- regrets the drop in manufacturing output in Wales while the sector in the rest of the UK is growing, and expresses concern at falls in the index of production, construction, manufacturing and the value of exports, as well as the increase in unemployment over the last 12 months, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise its failures and revise its strategies accordingly.* *yn gresynu at y gostyngiad yn y cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru tra bo'r sector yng ngweddill y DU yn tyfu, ac yn mynegi pryder am ostyngiadau yn y mynegai cynhyrchu, adeiladu, gweithgynhyrchu ac yng ngwerth allforion, a hefyd y cynnydd mewn diweithdra dros y 12 mis diwethaf, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod ei methiannau ac adolygu ei strategaethau yn unol â hynny.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: *Gwelliant 6 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*
- calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to undertake appropriate and regular surveys of employers in the manufacturing industry and to take action accordingly to ensure the upskilling of employees within the sector.* *yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnal arolygon priodol a rheolaidd o gyflogwyr yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a gweithredu yn unol â hynny i sicrhau bod sgiliau'r gweithwyr yn y sector yn cael eu gloywi.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add as a new point at the end of the motion: *Gwelliant 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government, in* *yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru,*

*view of its commitment to sustainability, to introduce new policies to help the manufacturing sector in Wales to reduce its energy consumption and maximize its recycling capacity in order to lessen the carbon footprint emanating from this sector, without undermining its growth potential.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 5 a 6 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. notes the increasing strength of competition within the manufacturing sector globally;*

*2. recognises the continuing need for the manufacturing sector in Wales to position itself to take advantage of the global situation;*

*3. endorses the need for continued public sector support for the sector in Wales. (NDM3041)*

4.20 p.m.

Manufacturing is a core part of the Welsh economy, providing around 14 per cent of all jobs in Wales and, at over 19 per cent, making the greatest contribution of any sector to Wales gross value added. However, manufacturing, particularly the automotive sector with its problem of overcapacity, continues to be subject to immense ongoing competitive pressure. Monday's announcement by Continental AG, this morning's news about the Vauxhall plant at Ellesmere Port, and uncertainty over the Welsh plants of Visteon UK Ltd and Krupp Camford Pressings Ltd underline the continuing structural change within the sector. Yet parts of the manufacturing sector continue to thrive, such as Airbus in Broughton in Flintshire, and that is testimony to the innovation and flexibility of the Welsh

*ying ngoleuni ei hymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd, i gyflwyno polisiau newydd i helpu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru i ddefnyddio llai o ynni ac ailgylchu hyd eithaf eu gallu er mwyn lleihau'r ôl-troed carbon sy'n deillio o'r sector hwn, heb danseilio ei botensial ar gyfer twf.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 5 and 6 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn nodi cryfder cynyddol y gystadleuaeth yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn fyd-eang;*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru roi ei hun mewn sefyllfa i fanteisio ar y sefyllfa fyd-eang;*

*3. yn cadarnhau'r angen i roi cefnogaeth barhaus gan y sector cyhoeddus i'r sector yng Nghymru. (NDM3041)*

Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn rhan ganolog o economi Cymru, yn darparu tua 14 y cant o holl swyddi Cymru ac yn cyfrannu dros 19 y cant, sef y cyfraniad mwyaf gan unrhyw sector yng Nghymru at werth ychwanegol crynswth. Fodd bynnag, mae gweithgynhyrchu, yn arbennig y sector modurol gyda'i broblem o orgynhyrchu, yn parhau i wynebu pwysau cystadleuol mawr. Mae cyhoeddiad Continental AG ddydd Llun, y newyddion y bore yma am waith Vauxhall yn Ellesmere Port, ac ansicrwydd am weithfeydd Visteon UK Ltd a Krupp Camford Pressings Ltd yng Nghymru yn tanlinellu'r newid strwythurol parhaus yn y sector. Ond mae rhannau o'r sector gweithgynhyrchu'n dal i ffynnu, megis Airbus ym Mrychdyn yn sir y Fflint, ac mae hynny'n dyst i arloesedd a hyblygrwydd y

workforce.

Manufacturing in Wales has been a major priority for this Government and the UK Government for many years and, as well as sustaining our traditional base, we are supporting moves towards higher value-added activities. Last year, for example, financial aid under the regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grant schemes totalled over £55 million, assisting 220 individual manufacturing projects, with the prospect of creating over 4,000 new jobs and safeguarding a further 2,700. On the training front, we have provided support for modern apprentices in engineering and manufacturing to win over 3,000 national vocational qualification awards. Increasingly, we have helped the sector to help itself; for instance, by supporting sectoral fora for key manufacturing sectors, such as the automotive, aerospace and electronics sectors. These fora are now well established and have proved their worth in helping those particular sectors to respond to the increasing competitive challenge that they face.

Last year, in the wake of the MG Rover crisis, the automotive taskforce was reconstituted and led by the Welsh Automotive Forum, supported by the Assembly Government. It played a key role in assisting companies to secure the support available to the supply chain. Accelerate Wales, another Assembly Government-funded programme helps automotive companies to improve performance as well as diversify their customer base, and that has been extremely successful. As a result, last year's crisis following MG Rover's demise proved to be far smaller than anticipated, with only three companies with more than 15 per cent of their turnover remaining with MG Rover. That is a significant reduction from the position five years earlier, and that process continues.

In addition, the impact of these structural changes on the supply chain in Wales is monitored, managed and therefore minimised. Welsh suppliers now have a much better spread of risk in their customer

gweithlu yng Nghymru.

Mae gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru wedi bod yn un o brif flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth hon a Llywodraeth y DU ers blynyddoedd lawer, ac yn ogystal â chynnal ein sail draddodiadol yr ydym yn cefnogi symudiadau tuag at weithgareddau sydd â gwerth uwch. Y llynedd, er enghraifft, rhoddwyd dros £55 miliwn o gymorth ariannol o dan y cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a chynlluniau grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, gan gynorthwyo 220 o brosiectau gweithgynhyrchu unigol, gyda'r posibilrwydd o greu dros 4,000 o swyddi newydd a diogelu 2,700 o swyddi eraill. O ran hyfforddiant, yr ydym wedi rhoi cymorth i brentisiaethau modern y maes peirianeg a gweithgynhyrchu i ennill dros 3,000 o gymwysterau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn gynyddol wedi helpu'r sector i helpu ei hun; er enghraifft, drwy gefnogi fforymau sectoraidd ar gyfer sectorau gweithgynhyrchu allweddol, megis y sectorau modurol, awyrofod ac electroneg. Mae'r fforymau hyn bellach wedi hen sefydlu ac wedi profi eu gwerth i helpu'r sectorau hynny i ymateb i'r her gystadleuol gynyddol sy'n eu hwynebu.

Y llynedd, yn sgîl argyfwng MG Rover, ailgynllunwyd y tasglu modurol o dan arweiniad Fforwm Modurol Cymru, gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr oedd iddo ran allweddol wrth gynorthwyo cwmnïau i sicrhau'r cymorth sydd ar gael i'r gadwyn gyflenwi. Mae Sbardun Cymru, rhaglen arall a ariennir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn helpu cwmnïau modurol i wella perfformiad yn ogystal ag amrywio'u cwsmeriaid, ac mae hynny wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn. O ganlyniad, yr oedd yr argyfwng y llynedd yn dilyn tranc MG Rover yn llai nag a ddisgwyliwyd, a thri chwmni'n unig gyda thros 15 y cant o'u trosiant a oedd yn dal gydag MG Rover. Mae hynny'n ostyngiad sylweddol o'i gymharu â'r sefyllfa bum mlynedd yn gynharach, ac mae'r broses honno'n parhau.

Yn ogystal, caiff effaith y newidiadau strwythurol hyn ar y gadwyn gyflenwi yng Nghymru ei monitro, ei rheoli ac felly ei lleihau i'r eithaf. Mae cyflenwyr yng Nghymru bellach yn agored i risg fwy

base, partly as a result of the interventions that we as a Government have made. Through our co-funding with the Department of Trade and Industry and the Welsh manufacturing advisory service, MAS Cymru, we continue to promote innovation across the sector. This highly valued service is proving invaluable in helping Welsh small and medium-sized enterprises to improve their competitive performance.

Despite these improvements, the growth of China and India involves sustained competitive pressure, and multinational companies are making new manufacturing investments in countries that have recently joined the European Union, as we saw in Monday's announcement by Continental Teves Ltd in Ebbw Vale. These changes reflect the new global order and, as such, are not within our control. However, in recent years, the Welsh economy has performed extremely well: gross value added per head, gross disposable household income per head, and average weekly earnings in Wales have all grown faster than the UK average since 2001. Only the east of England in the UK has seen a bigger increase than Wales over this period. Unemployment still remains, as it has done over most of the last three years, below the UK average.

gwasgaredig o dipyn oherwydd eu sylfaen o gwsmeriaid, yn rhannol o ganlyniad i'r ymyriadau gennym ni fel Llywodraeth. Drwy ein gwaith o gyd-ariannu gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a gwasanaeth cynghori gweithgynhyrchu Cymru, MAS Cymru, yr ydym yn parhau i hybu arloesi ar draws y sector. Caiff y gwasanaeth hwn ei werthfawrogi'n fawr ac mae'n gymorth gwerthfawr i fusnesau bach a chanolig wella'u perfformiad cystadleuol.

Er gwaetha'r gwelliannau hyn, mae twf China ac India yn rhoi pwysau cystadleuol parhaus, ac mae cwmnïau amlwladol yn gwneud buddsoddiadau gweithgynhyrchu newydd mewn gwledydd sydd wedi ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ddiweddar, fel y gwelsom yn y cyhoeddiad ddydd Llun gan Continental Teves Ltd yng Nglynebwy. Mae'r newidiadau hyn yn adlewyrchiad o'r drefn fyd-eang newydd, ac fel y cyfryw ni allwn eu rheoli. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf mae economi Cymru wedi perfformio'n hynod dda: mae gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen, incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario y pen ac enillion wythnosol cyfartalog Cymru wedi tyfu'n gyflymach na'r cyfartaledd yn y DU er 2001. Dim ond dwyrain Lloegr yn y DU sydd wedi gweld mwy o gynnydd na Chymru dros y cyfnod hwn. Mae diweithdra'n parhau, fel y mae wedi parhau am y rhan fwyaf o'r tair blynedd diwethaf, yn is na'r cyfartaledd yn y DU.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.24 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.24 p.m.*

Manufacturing continues to play a vital role in the successful performance of the Welsh economy, and we are determined to support the sector in the changes that it needs to make. That involves dialogue with business and the private sector, and that is why, in 2004, I set up the manufacturing task and finish group, chaired by Colin Johnson, the former plant manager of the Ford engine plant at Bridgend, to look at what more could be done to assist the sector, and how we could fine-tune and improve our support. It will come as no surprise that the group identified the training and development of the Welsh workforce as one key issue, reflecting the vital role played by knowledge in today's

Mae gweithgynhyrchu yn parhau yn rhan hanfodol o berfformiad llwyddiannus economi Cymru, ac yr ydym yn benderfynol o gynorthwyo'r sector yn y newidiadau y mae angen iddo'u gwneud. Mae hynny'n cynnwys cael trafodaethau gyda busnesau a'r sector preifat, a dyna pam y sefydlais y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu yn 2004, gan gadeiryddiaeth Colin Johnson, cyn-reolwr gwaith peiriannau Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, i weld beth y gellid ei wneud yn ychwanegol i gynorthwyo'r sector, a sut y gallem fireinio a gwella ein cymorth. Ni fydd neb yn synnu bod y grŵp wedi nodi mai un mater allweddol yw hyfforddi a datblygu gweithlu Cymru, i adlewyrchu rôl



products and services.

My ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson, and I have responded positively through the skills and employment action plan and the increasing emphasis on work-based learning. The task and finish group said that it wanted a more integrated and joined-up approach between business support and training support. I believe that we have made considerable improvements in that respect, and even more will flow from Jane Davidson's and my new merged departments. I have been able to report good progress made against other recommendations, including investment in infrastructure and support for other investments, as well as increasing the focus on regulation and reducing regulation.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that the steel industry has a strong role to play in the economy of Wales? In my constituency of Newport East, we are seeing strong investment and recruitment in the steel industry and, of course, it is very highly skilled and high-tech work. Do you agree that it has a strong role to play in the future of the economy of Wales?

**Andrew Davies:** Yes, indeed, and I think that the industry would attest to the fact that, as a Government, we have supported it even given the constraints placed on us by European Union state aid issues. We work closely with the industry. Corus is the predominant employer, but we have also worked closely with Celsa, Alpha Steel and others. The steel industry has certainly transformed its operations. Many of the operators are now some of the most efficient in the whole of the European Union. However, just as in other manufacturing sectors, they face huge global competitive pressures, and, wherever we can, we will help them to address and overcome those pressures.

Following my request, the manufacturing task and finish group continued to meet throughout 2005, and has recommended the creation of a new manufacturing forum, involving industrialists, members of the trade

hanfodol gwybodaeth mewn cynhyrchu a gwasanaethu heddiw.

Mae fy nghyd-Weinidog Jane Davidson a minnau wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol drwy'r cynllun gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth, a'r pwyslais cynyddol ar ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith. Dywedodd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ei fod am gael dull mwy integredig a chydgyssylltiedig rhwng cymorth i fusnesau a chymorth hyfforddi. Credaf inni wneud gwelliannau sylweddol yn y maes hwnnw, a bydd hyd yn oed mwy yn llifo o adran Jane Davidson a'm hadran innau sydd newydd uno. Yr wyf wedi gallu adrodd am gynnydd da yn erbyn argymhellion eraill, gan gynnwys buddsoddi mewn seilwaith a chymorth i fuddsoddiadau eraill, yn ogystal â chanolbwyntio mwy ar reoliadau a lleihau rheoleiddio.

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch fod i'r diwydiant dur ran gref yn economi Cymru? Yn fy etholaeth i yn Nwyrain Casnewydd yr ydym yn gweld buddsoddi a recriwtio mawr yn y diwydiant dur, ac wrth gwrs, mae'n waith sy'n galw am sgiliau da iawn a sgiliau uwchdechnoleg. A gytunwch fod iddo ran gref yn nyfodol economi Cymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Oes, yn bendant, a chredaf y byddai'r diwydiant yn tystio i'r ffaith ein bod ni, fel Llywodraeth, wedi ei gefnogi hyd yn oed o gofio'r cyfyngiadau a roddwyd arnom o ran cymorth gwladwriaethol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r diwydiant. Corus yw'r prif gyflogwr, ond yr ydym hefyd wedi gweithio'n agos gyda Celsa, Alpha Steel ac eraill. Mae'r diwydiant dur yn sicr wedi trawsnewid ei ffyrdd o weithredu. Mae nifer o'r gweithredwyr bellach gyda'r mwyaf effeithiol yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gyfan. Fodd bynnag, fel y sectorau gweithgynhyrchu eraill, maent yn wynebu pwysau cystadleuol byd-eang a byddwn yn eu cynorthwyo, ble bynnag y gallwn, i wynebu'r pwysau hynny a'u gorchfygu.

Ar fy nghais i, parhaodd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i gwrdd drwy gydol 2005 ac mae wedi argymhell llunio fforwm gweithgynhyrchu newydd, sy'n cynnwys diwydianwyr, aelodau undebau llafur a

unions and business support organisations, such as the Confederation of British Industry and the Engineers Employers' Federation, along with representatives of the relevant sector skills councils. This will concentrate upon issues of generic concern to the sector, including the image of manufacturing, recruitment, skills, and the important area of improving public sector procurement. It is important for this new forum to work closely with the UK manufacturing forum, and exploratory discussions have been held with the DTI to establish how best to effect links. The existing sectoral fora will, of course, continue their work, supported by the Assembly Government, and will develop new strategies concerning design, logistics and fulfilment, technical support and associated business support services.

sefydliadau cymorth busnes, megis Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a'r Ffederasiwn Cyflogwyr Peirianwyr, ynghyd â chynrychiolwyr o'r cynghorau sgiliau sector perthnasol. Bydd hwn yn canolbwyntio ar faterion sydd o bwys cyffredinol i'r sector, gan gynnwys delwedd gweithgynhyrchu, recriwtio, sgiliau a'r maes pwysig o wella caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig i'r fforwm newydd hwn gydweithio'n agos â fforwm gweithgynhyrchu'r DU, ac mae trafodaethau cychwynnol wedi eu cynnal gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i sefydlu sut orau i greu cysylltiadau. Bydd y fforymau sectoraidd presennol yn parhau eu gwaith, wrth gwrs, gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a byddant yn datblygu strategaethau newydd yn ymwneud â dylunio, logisteg a chyflawni, cymorth technegol a gwasanaethau cymorth busnes cysylltiedig.

There are signs of a fragile recovery in the global manufacturing sector. For example, the CBI's March monthly trends survey indicated this. While it is a fragile recovery, with our support, I believe that manufacturing in Wales will continue to develop a strong competitive advantage, and position itself to take advantage of this global upturn.

Mae yna arwyddion gwelliant bregus yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu byd-eang. Er enghraifft, dangoswyd hyn yn arolwg tueddiadau misol y CBI ym mis Mawrth. Er mai gwella bregus ydyw, credaf y bydd gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, gyda'n cefnogaeth ni, yn parhau i ddatblygu mantais gystadleuol gref, ac yn gosod ei hun mewn sefyllfa i fanteisio ar y gwelliant byd-eang hwn.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: Ym mhwynt 2, cynnwys ar ôl 'sefyllfa fyd-eang':

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: In point 2, after 'global situation', insert:

*ac, yng ngoleuni'r nifer gyfyngedig o gwmnïau rhyngwladol troedrydd yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu, yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd cynyddol busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint cynhenid ac yn annog y Llywodraeth i gymryd camau rhagweithiol i helpu'r BBaCh yn y maes gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru i ehangu ac i sefydlu rhai newydd;*

*and, in the light of the limited availability of footloose international companies in the manufacturing sector, recognises the growing importance of indigenous small and medium-sized enterprises and urges the Government to take proactive steps to help existing manufacturing SMEs in Wales to expand and new ones to be established;*

Gwelliant 2: Ym mhwynt 3, cynnwys ar ôl 'Cymru':

Amendment 2: In point 3, after 'Wales', insert:

*ac felly'n cydnabod yr angen am ddull gweithredu mwy strategol a phenodol at y defnydd o gyllid yr UE.*

*and therefore recognises the need for a more focused and strategic approach to the use of EU funding.*

Gwelliant 7: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Amendment 7: Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yng ngoleuni ei hymrwymiad i gynaliadwyedd, i gyflwyno polisiau newydd i helpu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru i ddefnyddio llai o ynni ac ailgylchu hyd eithaf eu gallu er mwyn lleihau'r ôl-troed carbon sy'n deillio o'r sector hwn, heb danseilio ei botensial ar gyfer twf.*

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government, in view of its commitment to sustainability, to introduce new policies to help the manufacturing sector in Wales to reduce its energy consumption and maximize its recycling capacity in order to lessen the carbon footprint emanating from this sector, without undermining its growth potential.*

Krupp Camford Pressings in Llanelli and Continental Teves Ltd yesterday; Vauxhall in Ellesmere Port today. No-one can be in any doubt that manufacturing businesses in the UK as a whole—and in Wales, of course—are fighting for their lives. In Wales, we have seen clothing manufacturers close virtually all of their plants in our towns. In the food processing industry—the supposed jewel in the crown—we are seeing plant after plant disappear. Some 70,000 jobs have gone in the manufacturing industry since Labour came to power, according to ONS figures.

Krupp Camford Pressings yn Llanelli a Continental Teves Ltd ddoe; Vauxhall yn Ellesmere Port heddiw. Ni all neb amau nad yw busnesau gweithgynhyrchu yn y DU gyfan—ac yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs—yn brwydro am eu heinioes. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi gweld gweithgynhyrchwyr dillad yn cau fwy neu lai bob un o'u gweithfeydd yn ein trefi. Yn y diwydiant prosesu bwyd—ein trysor yn ôl pob sôn—fe welwn y naill waith ar ôl y llall yn diflannu. Mae tua 70,000 o swyddi yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu wedi eu colli ers i Lafur ddod i rym, yn ôl ffigurau'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol.

Of course, there are global factors at work, as Andrew Davies pointed out, which mean that, on a practical level, no party in government can stop a company from closing or from going elsewhere in a free market. However, we are in the ninth year of a Labour Government, and we must ask whether the Labour administration in the Assembly is doing more than trying to manage the decline. It talks up the knowledge-based economy, but that is no comfort for a worker losing a well paid or a reasonably well paid job away from the M4 corridor or on Deeside.

Wrth gwrs, mae ffactorau byd-eang ar waith, fel y soniodd Andrew Davies, sy'n golygu na all yr un blaid lywodraethol, yn ymarferol, rwystro cwmni rhag cau na symud i rywle arall mewn marchnad rydd. Fodd bynnag, dyma nawfed flwyddyn Llywodraeth Lafur, a rhaid inni ofyn a yw'r weinyddiaeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad yn gwneud mwy na cheisio rheoli'r dirywiad. Mae'n canmol yr economi wybodaeth, ond nid yw hynny o ddim cysur i weithiwr sy'n gadael swydd sy'n talu'n dda neu'n gymharol dda mewn ardal ymhell o draffordd yr M4 neu Lannau Dyfrdwy.

Un peth y mae'n rhaid ei wneud yw creu a datblygu cwmnïau cynhenid. Wrth gwrs bod croeso i gwmnïau rhyngwladol llwyddiannus fel Euro/DPC Cyf yn fy etholaeth i, a ddaeth yno, gyda llaw, drwy ymdrechion fy rhagflaenydd, Dafydd Wigley, ac sydd, yn ddi-ddorol, wedi cael ei brynu yn ddiweddar gan gwmni arall o'r Almaen. Dylai'r pwyslais, ers degawdau, fod wedi bod ar ddatblygu cwmnïau sydd â'u gwreiddiau yma yn naear Cymru—cwmnïau na fyddant yn diflannu dros y dŵr ar yr awel groes gyntaf.

One thing that has to be done is establish and develop indigenous companies. Of course successful global companies are welcome, such as Euro/DPC Ltd in my constituency, which, incidentally, invested there thanks to the efforts of my predecessor, Dafydd Wigley, and which, interestingly, was recently purchased by another German company. For decades, the emphasis should have been on developing companies with their roots in Wales—companies that will not disappear overseas at the first hint of an ill wind.

4.30 p.m.

Yr ydym yn croesawu ymdrech y Llywodraeth wrth greu'r rhaglen KB4B, un o'r syniadau a gymerwyd o fanifesto'r Blaid. Mae stori Continental Teves yn wers i ni. Yr oedd y gwaith yng Nglynebwy, yn ôl bob sôn, yn broffidiol—y mwyaf proffidiol yn y grŵp—ond y gwaith hwnnw sy'n cau, nid y gwaith yn yr Almaen. Dyna sydd yn dangos gwerth cwmnïau cynhenid. Mae'r Almaen yn dal i lwyddo i gynyddu ei sector gweithgynhyrchu er waethaf yr amgylchiadau economaidd byd-eang, yn groes i'n profiad ni.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth sicrhau twf y tu allan i gorneli dwyreiniol y wlad. Mae'r strategaeth wledig, os oes yna un—nid wyf i wedi ei gweld—yn dadfeilio o flaen ein llygaid. Mae grym prynu'r archfarchnadoedd yn lladd ein diwydiannau prosesu bwyd a nid oes neb yn gwneud dim. Heb y rhain, pa ddyfodol fydd i'n ffermwyr ac i ran bwysig o'r economi wledig? Mae pryder gwirioneddol hefyd am y cronfeydd cydgyfeirio. Mae'n holl bwysig gofalu nad arian y cynllun datblygu gwledig yn unig sydd ar gael y tu allan i'r ardaloedd trefol. Dywedwn eto—ac mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw am hyn yn gyson—y dylai fod targedau rhanbarthol er mwyn ceisio mesur llwyddiant yr arian Ewropeaidd pan fydd yr ail raglen yn dechrau.

Wrth bwysleisio'r angen am swyddi o ansawdd, mae'n rhaid iddynt fod yn rhai cynaliadwy ac fe ddylid mesur pob prosiect yn erbyn ei effaith ar yr amgylchedd a'n hól troed amgylcheddol. Nid oes llawer o bwynt i siarad am hynny, os nad ydym yn ei weithredu mewn gwirionedd.

Wrth edrych ar y maes cynaliadwyedd, dylem ei weld fel cyfle yn hytrach na fel rhwystr i ddatblygu economaidd. Mae cyfle i ddatblygu'r sector i gynhyrchu offer ar gyfer ynni cynaliadwy ac i arbed ynni. I wneud hynny, rhaid priodi arbenigedd ein prifysgolion a byd busnes gyda pholisïau'r Llywodraeth. Mae stori Cambrian Engineering ym Mangor yn un drist rhyfeddol. Yr oedd 150 o swyddi yn y cwmni yn creu tyrrau tyrbinau gwynt. Yr oedd y cwmni yn barod i gymryd mantais o'r

We welcome the Government's efforts in creating the KB4B programme, one of the ideas lifted from Plaid's manifesto. The Continental Teves story is a lesson to us. The plant in Ebbw Vale was, apparently, profitable—the most profitable in the group—but it is that plant that is closing, not the one in Germany. That demonstrates the worth of indigenous companies. Germany is still managing to expand its manufacturing sector, despite the global economic situation, contrary to our experience.

The Government must ensure growth outside of the eastern corners of the country. The rural strategy, if there is one—I have not seen it—is crumbling before our eyes. The purchasing power of the supermarkets is killing our food processing industries and no-one is doing anything. Without these, what hope is there for our farmers and for an important part of the rural economy? There is also real concern about convergence funding. It is vital to ensure that it is not just rural development plan money that is available outside urban areas. We say again—Plaid Cymru has called for this consistently—that there should be regional targets to try to measure the success of European funding when the second programme starts.

In emphasising the need for quality jobs, they must be sustainable, and the value of every project should be measured in terms of its environmental impact and our environmental footprint. There is very little point in talking about that if we do not implement it in reality.

Looking at sustainability, we should see it as an opportunity rather than a barrier to economic development. There is an opportunity to develop equipment to produce sustainable energy and energy conservation. To do so, we must marry the expertise available in our universities and businesses with Government policies. The story of Cambrian Engineering in Bangor is an extremely sad one. There were 150 jobs in the company which created towers for wind turbines. The company was ready to take

farchnad honno, ond nid oedd polisïau'r Llywodraeth yn eu lle ac mae'r cwmni wedi cau ei ddrysau a symud i'r Alban.

Bu llwyddiannau yn rhaglen Amcan 1—nid oes dadl am hynny—er nad ydyw busnesau at ei gilydd wedi gallu elwa yn ddigonol ar yr arian. Un cynllun llwyddiannus a fu'n gweithredu yng Ngwynedd oedd y rhaglen datblygu busnes. Defnyddiwyd £1.25 miliwn o arian Ewropeaidd, gan ddenu £1.5 miliwn o arian preifat, a'r canlyniad oedd creu 130 o fusnesau bach a 240 o swyddi newydd. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog edrych yn fanwl ar y cynllun hwnnw gyda golwg i'w ehangu ar draws ardaloedd y Cymoedd a gorllewin Cymru ar gyfer y rhaglen nesaf. Yr hyn sydd ei angen, yn fwy na dim, yw gweledigaeth. Byddai wedi bod yn llawer haws pe bai Llywodraethau'r Torïaid a Llafur wedi gwrandao ar Blaid Cymru yn ôl yn y 1970au pan gynhyrchwyd y cynllun economaidd cyntaf ar gyfer Cymru, yn lle ei anwybyddu a dweud nad oedd mo'i angen. Yr oedd angen y cynllun ac efallai na fyddem yn y twll yr ydym ynddo heddiw pe bawn wedi dechrau ar y gwaith yn llawer cynt.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*target investment at growth industries and industries of the future.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises that Wales's manufacturing position would be strengthened by membership of the euro.*

I will give you three facts. On gross value added—the wealth that we get from manufacturing—Wales had a six-point advantage over the UK as a whole in 1999 and, by last year, that had fallen to a three-point advantage. Our manufacturing output in Wales is falling at a faster rate than in the UK as a whole—that is the second fact. The third fact is that exports from Wales were up 2.9 per cent last year, but exports from the UK as a whole were up 9.1 per cent. The problem is

advantage of that market, but the Government policies were not in place, and the company closed its doors and moved to Scotland.

There have been successes in the Objective 1 programme—there is no argument about that—although business as a whole has not been able to benefit sufficiently from the money. The business development programme was one successful scheme implemented in Gwynedd. It used £1.25 million of European money, attracting £1.5 million of private funding, and resulted in the creation of 130 small businesses and 240 new jobs. I ask the Minister to look carefully at that scheme with a view to expanding it across the Valleys and west Wales for the next programme. What is needed, more than anything, is vision. It would have been much easier had the Tory and Labour Governments listened to Plaid Cymru back in the 1970s when the first economic plan for Wales was produced, instead of ignoring it and saying that it was not required. The plan was required and perhaps we would not be in the hole in which we find ourselves today had we started on the work much earlier.

**Michael German:** Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn targedu buddsoddiad at ddiwydiannau twf a diwydiannau'r dyfodol.*

Cynigïaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod y byddai safle Cymru o ran gweithgynhyrchu'n cael ei gryfhau drwy aelodaeth o'r ewro.*

Dyma i chi dair ffaith. O ran gwerth ychwanegol crynswth—y cyfoeth a gawn o weithgynhyrchu—yr oedd gan Gymru fantais o chwe phwynt dros y DU gyfan yn 1999, ac erbyn y llynedd yr oedd hynny wedi gostwng i fantais o dri phwynt. Mae ein cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn gostwng yn gyflymach nag yn y DU gyfan—dyna'r ail ffaith. Y drydedd ffaith yw fod allforion o Gymru wedi codi 2.9 y cant y llynedd, ond cododd allforion o'r DU gyfan 9.1 y cant. Y

that the competition that we talk about is manufacturing in eastern Europe or in lower-wage economies, but it is the competition in the United Kingdom that we are not winning. We are not winning because we are not pitching ourselves at the right level. There are several lessons that the Minister either has to take on board, or has taken on board, that have come through his taskforce and others during the last 12 months. The first lesson is about the strategic view: if you are going to be strategic, it means that you have to narrow your focus. You have to broaden your horizons, but narrow your focus. That means, for example, that more of our Objective 1 money and European funding in the next round has to be focused on the things that matter most to us, and that is about what is needed to develop the manufacturing sector for the future. The needs of the manufacturing sector of the future will not be the same as those of the past: they are about change, new ideas, innovation, higher-value products, and a requirement for greater skills. I think that we have learned those lessons already. There is a question mark, Minister, over the speed at which you and your policies can tackle the change happening in the manufacturing industry in Wales. Being ahead of the game means that you have to be faster and fleetier of foot with your policies.

The second issue is that of procurement. We know that the public sector in Wales generates £4 billion-worth of requirements for goods and services from the private sector. That is £4 billion in contracts and services. Those in the private sector must now be geared up faster to meet the demands of those contracts, so that they can gain them here in Wales—we know that they are not being gained. One of the problems that we have is small businesses may generate few jobs—perhaps one job extra here and there—but it is precisely those businesses from which you have withdrawn funding for assistance for them to develop and grow. Often, it is not the first tier, but the second, third or fourth tier in the supply chain that we need to ensure is strong enough because we need to have that base in our economy, and it is not there at the moment.

broblem yw mai'r gystadleuaeth y siaradwn amdani yw gweithgynhyrchu yn nwyrain Ewrop neu mewn economïau mae cyflogau is, ond nid ydym yn ennill y gystadleuaeth yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Nid ydym yn ennill am nad ydym yn cynnig ein hunain ar y lefel iawn. Mae nifer o wersi y mae'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog eu derbyn, neu y mae wedi'u derbyn, ac a nodwyd gan y tasglu hwn ac eraill yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Mae'r wers gyntaf ynglŷn â'r darlun strategol: i fod yn strategol, mae'n golygu bod rhaid ichi gyfyngu eich ffocws. Rhaid ichi ehangu eich gornelion, ond cyfyngu eich ffocws. Golyga hyn, er enghraifft, fod rhaid canolbwyntio mwy o'n harian Amcan 1 a'n harian Ewropeaidd yn y cylch nesaf ar y pethau sydd bwysicaf inni, ac mae a wnelo hynny â'r hyn sydd ei angen i ddatblygu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ni fydd anghenion y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn y dyfodol yr un fath ag anghenion y gorffennol: maent yn ymwneud â newid, syniadau newydd, arloesedd, nwyddau gwerth uwch, a gofyniad am sgiliau gwell. Credaf ein bod wedi dysgu'r gwersi hynny eisoes. Mae marc cwestiwn, Weinidog, ynghylch pa mor gyflym y gallwch chi a'ch polisiau fynd i'r afael â'r newid sy'n digwydd yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Mae bod ar flaen y gad yn golygu bod rhaid ichi fod yn gyflymach gyda'ch polisiau.

Yr ail fater yw caffael. Gwyddom fod y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n cynhyrchu gwerth £4 biliwn o ofynion am nwyddau a gwasanaethau gan y sector preifat, sef £4 biliwn mewn contractau a gwasanaethau. Rhaid i'r rheini yn y sector preifat fod yn barod ynghynt yn awr i fodloni gofynion y contractau hynny, fel y gallant eu hennill yma yng Nghymru—gwyddom na chânt eu hennill. Un o'r problemau sydd gennym yw mai dim ond ychydig swyddi y gall busnesau bach eu creu—efallai un swydd ychwanegol fan hyn a fan draw—ond dyna'r union fusnesau yr ydych wedi tynnu arian oddi wrthynt, sef arian i'w helpu i ddatblygu a thyfu. Nid yr haen gyntaf, yn aml, ond yr ail, y drydedd neu'r bedwaredd haen yn y gadwyn gyflenwi y mae angen inni sicrhau ei bod yn ddigon cryf, oherwydd mae angen arnom angen y sail honno yn ein heconomi, ac ar hyn o bryd nid yw yno.

The third issue is of early warning. Just yesterday, I read out Continental AG's annual report to you, Minister. If there was a smallish division in your department of one or two people who can read documents quite well, I am sure that they would be able to identify and target those companies in Wales that are in difficulty or are experiencing difficulties with market conditions, particularly those whose headquarters are located elsewhere in the world. In that way, we could track what happens to those companies so that we could have some early warning of the needs of those companies and be in there. It is all very well to say that we cannot intervene, but we can be ready to assist before the event rather than afterwards, simply by being present through your contract management system.

The next issue is about lean production, which is what drives all manufacturing in Wales: that is, to get the best value for your output with the least amount of production costs. We are doing that, and we are doing as much as we can, but there will come a time when production will be as lean as you can possibly make it, and the incremental steps to get leaner in some of these companies are at their tightest. That was the case with Continental Teves, which had a very lean production system—that is why it was so profitable. However, there are other reasons why you need to be involved.

Finally, on research and development, little of our manufacturing base has research and development contained within it. In your answer to me yesterday on Continental Teves, you said that the reason for Continental AG's protecting its plant in Germany is that it has the research and development plant attached to it. Surely, there is a case here for a much bigger initiative to ensure that research and development is part of our manufacturing sector. We ignore manufacturing at our peril. It is a vital part of our economy, and it must be supported. We look to you, Minister, to get your skates on and accelerate the progress of those policies that meet those needs.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis.

Y trydydd mater yw rhybudd cynnar. Ddoe ddiwethaf y darllenais adroddiad blynyddol Continental AG ichi, Weinidog. Pe bai isadran ddigon bach yn eich adran o un neu ddau o bobl sy'n gallu darllen dogfennau yn lled dda, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallent nodi a thargedu'r cwmnïau hynny yng Nghymru sydd mewn trafferthion neu sy'n cael anawsterau gydag amodau'r farchnad, yn enwedig y rheini sydd â'u pencadlysoedd mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd. Fel hynny gallem ddilyn yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r cwmnïau hynny fel y gallem gael rhyw fath o rybudd cynnar o anghenion y cwmnïau hynny a bod yn barod i weithredu. Mae'n iawn dweud na allwn ymyrryd, ond gallwn fod yn barod i gynorthwyo cyn y digwyddiad yn hytrach nag wedyn drwy ddim ond bod yn bresennol drwy eich system rheoli contractau.

Mae a wnelo'r mater nesaf â chynhyrchu darbodus, sef yr hyn sy'n arwain holl weithgynhyrchu Cymru: hynny yw, cael y gwerth gorau am eich cynnyrch gyda'r costau cynhyrchu isaf. Yr ydym yn gwneud, ac yn gwneud cymaint ag a allwn, ond daw amser pan fydd cynhyrchu mor ddarbodus ag y gallwch ei wneud, a bydd y camau cynyddol i fod yn fwy darbodus yn rhai o'r cwmnïau hyn mor dynn ag sy'n bosibl. Yr oedd hynny'n wir am Continental Teves, a oedd â system gynhyrchu ddarbodus iawn—dyna pam yr oedd mor broffidiol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhesymau eraill pam mae angen i chi gael llaw yn y broses.

Yn olaf, o ran ymchwil a datblygu, ychydig iawn o'n sylfaen weithgynhyrchu sy'n cynnwys ymchwil a datblygu. Yn eich ateb imi ddoe ar Continental Teves, yr oeddech yn dweud mai rheswm Continental AG dros ddiogelu ei safle yn yr Almaen oedd bod safle ymchwil a datblygu'n gysylltiedig ag ef. Yn sicr, mae dadl yma dros fenter lawer mwy i sicrhau bod ymchwil a datblygu yn rhan o'n sector gweithgynhyrchu. Anwybyddwn weithgynhyrchu ar berygl i ni ein hun. Mae'n rhan hanfodol o'n heconomi, a rhaid ei gefnogi. Disgwylwch i chi, Weinidog, frysio a chyflymu cynnydd y polisiau hynny sy'n diwallu'r anghenion hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 5:

Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the drop in manufacturing output in Wales while the sector in the rest of the UK is growing, and expresses concern at falls in the index of production, construction, manufacturing and the value of exports, as well as the increase in unemployment over the last 12 months, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise its failures and revise its strategies accordingly.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to undertake appropriate and regular surveys of employers in the manufacturing industry and to take action accordingly, to ensure the upskilling of employees within the sector.*

I almost feel sorry for the Minister in that the Government has proposed a debate on the manufacturing sector when, quite obviously, it is experiencing an extremely difficult time. As has already been highlighted, several thousands of manufacturing jobs have been lost just in recent weeks, and the trend is continuing. The First Minister and the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks have often criticised me for highlighting maybe one quarter or one month. However, it is obvious to anyone observing or watching the news that this has become a continuing trend, so much so that unemployment in the UK is at its highest for four years, and 25 per cent of the manufacturing jobs in Wales have been lost since 1999.

4.40 p.m.

Several facts have been highlighted, but when we consider the loss of 65,000 manufacturing jobs, according to my data, or 70,000 jobs, according to Alun Ffred Jones, that is very worrying. I appreciate that the Minister has put the best spin on the manufacturing base, but without being derogatory in any fashion to those who have just lost their jobs, the usual company that is

ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu am y gostyngiad yn y cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru tra bo'r sector yng ngweddill y DU yn tyfu, ac yn mynegi pryder am ostyngiadau yn y mynegai cynhyrchu, adeiladu, gweithgynhyrchu ac yng ngwerth allforion, a hefyd y cynnydd mewn diweithdra dros y 12 mis diwethaf, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod ei methiannau ac adolygu ei strategaethau yn unol â hynny.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynnal arolygon priodol a rheolaidd o gyflogwyr yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a gweithredu yn unol â hynny, i sicrhau bod sgiliau'r gweithwyr yn y sector yn cael eu gloywi.*

Yr wyf bron yn teimlo trueni dros y Gweinidog am fod y Llywodraeth wedi cynnig dadl ar y sector gweithgynhyrchu a hithau, yn hollol amlwg, yn cael amser anodd iawn. Fel y tynnwyd sylw eisoes, collwyd miloedd lawer o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, ac mae'r duedd yn parhau. Mae'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wedi fy meirniadu'n aml am dynnu sylw at un chwarter efallai neu un mis. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg i unrhyw un sy'n gwyllo'r newyddion fod hyn wedi mynd yn duedd barhaus, i gymaint graddau nes bod diweithdra yn y DU ar y lefel uchaf ers pedair blynedd, a chollwyd 25 y cant o'r swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru er 1999.

Tynnwyd sylw at nifer o ffeithiau, ond pan ystyriwn fod 65,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu wedi'u colli, yn ôl fy nata i, neu 70,000 o swyddi yn ôl Alun Ffred Jones, mae hynny'n bryder mawr. Sylweddolaf fod y Gweinidog wedi ceisio rhoi'r darlun mwyaf cadarnhaol o'r sylfaen weithgynhyrchu, ond heb fod yn ddifrifol mewn unrhyw fodd i'r rheini sydd newydd golli eu swyddi, y cwmni



wheeled out is Airbus UK, and rightly so—it is an extremely successful company. However, if the Minister is prepared to take the credit for some of the expansions and developments at Airbus, I hope that he is prepared to take some of the responsibility and blame for those companies that are leaving Wales. He talks about market forces, but Airbus itself is a creation of market forces, and he needs to accept responsibility for many of the jobs that have been lost.

The Minister highlighted that £55 million was spent in regional selective assistance last year, but only £20 million of that went on supporting indigenous Welsh companies. He highlighted the fact that China, eastern Europe and the global environment are placing great pressure on Welsh manufacturers. That is right, and it is a challenge that we need to address, but the same could be said about the rest of the United Kingdom. Mike German rightly highlighted that while manufacturing output for the last four quarters fell by 6.6 per cent in Wales, according to the manufacturing index, it fell by 1.1 per cent in the rest of the UK. Jobs in manufacturing for the last four quarters fell by 3.9 per cent in Wales, but by only 3.3 per cent in the UK as a whole. If we look at the index of production, and use 2002 as the baseline for the Office of National Statistics figures, by 2005 Wales has 93 points for production industries and 92.2 for manufacturing industries. For the rest of the United Kingdom, the rate is 98.2; in other words, there is a minor drop from the baseline across the rest of the United Kingdom. In the manufacturing industries, it is 100.7. Since 2002, the rest of the United Kingdom in terms of the manufacturing index has improved slightly, but in Wales we have dropped by almost eight points from that base.

Statistics can prove anything, and the Minister has sought as his salvation to highlight the Confederation of British Industry trends survey for one month—the very criticism that he has made of me. To

a ddefnyddir fel enghraifft fel rheol yw Airbus UK, a hynny'n gwbl gywir—mae'n gwmni llwyddiannus iawn. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r Gweinidog yn barod i dderbyn y clod am rywfaint o'r ehangu a'r datblygu yn Airbus, gobeithio ei fod yn barod i dderbyn rhywfaint o'r cyfrifoldeb a'r bai am y cwmnïau hynny sy'n gadael Cymru. Mae'n siarad am rymoedd y farchnad, ond mae Airbus ei hun wedi'i greu gan rymoedd y farchnad, ac mae angen iddo dderbyn cyfrifoldeb am nifer o'r swyddi a gollwyd.

Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod £55 miliwn wedi ei wario ar gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol y llynedd, ond dim ond £20 miliwn ohono a wariwyd i gynorthwyo cwmnïau cynhenid yng Nghymru. Tynnodd sylw at y ffaith fod Tsieina, dwyrain Ewrop a'r amgylchedd byd-eang yn rhoi pwysau mawr ar weithgynhyrchwyr Cymru. Mae hynny'n wir, ac mae'n her y mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hi. Ond gellid dweud yr un peth am weddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Tynnodd Mike German sylw yn gywir ddigon fod y cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu am y pedwar chwarter diwethaf, er iddo ostwng 6.6 y cant yng Nghymru, yn ôl y mynegai gweithgynhyrchu wedi gostwng 1.1 y cant yng ngweddill y DU. Gostyngodd nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu am y pedwar chwarter diwethaf 3.9 y cant yng Nghymru, ond 3.3 y cant yn unig yn y DU gyfan. Os edrychwn ar y mynegai cynhyrchu a defnyddio 2002 fel sylfaen ar gyfer ffigurau'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol, erbyn 2005 mae gan Gymru 93 o bwyntiau am y diwydiannau cynhyrchu a 92.2 am y diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu. Am weddill y Deyrnas Unedig, 98.2 yw'r gyfradd; mewn geiriau eraill, mae gostyngiad bach o'r sylfaen ledled gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn y diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu, 100.7 ydyw. Er 2002, o ran y mynegai gweithgynhyrchu mae gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig wedi gwella ychydig, ond yng Nghymru yr ydym wedi gostwng bron wyth pwynt o'r sylfaen honno.

Gall ystadegau brofi unrhyw beth, a cheisiodd y Gweinidog achub ei hun drwy dynnu sylw at arolwg o duediadau Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain am fis—yr union feirniadaeth a wnaeth ohonof fi. I'w

paraphrase him, the Minister said that if you look at the figures for February, there were green shoots of recovery in the manufacturing sector. This is at a time when Wales has had the benefit of structural funding when the rest of the United Kingdom in general has not. Some areas in the rest of the UK have had the opportunity of structural funds, but not in the same proportion or on a comparative scale. Therefore, it is interesting to look at the statistics and data that the website of the Welsh European Funding Office highlights. It states that there was a target for 3,000 new jobs to be created in the high-technology sector, and only 723 jobs are in place at the moment. I know that we are not yet at the end of the structural funds period, but is a tall order to achieve the target between now and the end of the period given that we have only achieved 723 out of a target of 3,000. Most worryingly, only 175 new firms have been created within the high-tech sector, although the target was to create 2,000 firms. Minister, these are not our targets—they are yours. The global environment and pressures affect everyone in the United Kingdom, so why is it that England is doing better than Wales? I can tell you one of the reasons why—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am not sure that you can; you have to come to an end.

**Alun Cairns:** To close, I am delighted that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills is in the Chamber, because she must accept much of the responsibility. Many of these companies are looking to the future, but with a widening gap of GCSE qualifications between England and Wales, there is no wonder at the situation because, when they are looking for an improved skills base, those are the facts with which they have to contend.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I rise to support amendments 1 and 2. I welcome this debate. It is regrettable that it has taken so much pressure from the opposition to bring it about but we are grateful that it has been put forward today. I will illustrate some of the points that Alun Ffred Jones made about the

aralleirio, dywedodd y Gweinidog, os edrychwch ar y ffigurau am fis Chwefror, fod arwyddion bod y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn adfer. Mae hyn ar adeg pan gafodd Cymru fudd o gronfeydd strwythurol pan na chafodd gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig hynny yn gyffredinol. Mae rhai ardaloedd yng ngweddill y DU wedi cael y cyfle i fanteisio ar gronfeydd strwythurol, ond nid ar yr un raddfa na graddfa gymharol. Felly, mae'n ddi-ddorol edrych ar yr ystadegau a'r data ar wefan uchafbwyntiau Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Mae'n dweud bod targed i greu 3,000 o swyddi newydd yn y sector uwch-dechnoleg, a dim ond 723 o swyddi a grëwyd hyd yn hyn. Gwn nad ydym wedi cyrraedd diwedd cyfnod y cronfeydd strwythurol eto, ond mae'n gofyn tipyn i gyrraedd y targed rhwng hyn a diwedd y cyfnod, o gofio mai dim ond 723 sydd wedi eu creu o darged o 3,000. Y peth mwyaf pryderus yw mai dim ond 175 o gwmnïau newydd a grëwyd yn y sector uwch-dechnoleg, er mai'r targed oedd creu 2,000 o gwmnïau. Weinidog, nid ein targedau ni yw'r rhain—eich rhai chi ydynt. Mae'r amgylchedd byd-eang a'r pwysau yn effeithio ar bawb yn y Deyrnas Unedig, felly, pam mae Lloegr yn gwneud yn well na Chymru? Gallaf ddweud wrthy ch un o'r rhesymau dros hyn—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf yn siŵr y gallwch wneud hynny; rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Alun Cairns:** I gloi, yr wyf wrth fy modd fod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn y Siambr, gan fod yn rhaid iddi dderbyn llawer o'r cyfrifoldeb. Mae nifer o'r cwmnïau hyn yn edrych i'r dyfodol, ond gyda bwlch sy'n ehangu o ran cymwysterau TGAU rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, nid yw'r sefyllfa'n peri syndod, oherwydd pan fyddant yn edrych am sylfaen sgiliau well, dyna'r ffeithiau y mae'n rhaid iddynt ymgodymu â hwy.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Codaf i gefnogi gwelliannau 1 a 2. Croesawaf y ddadl hon. Mae'n anffodus ei bod wedi cymryd cymaint o bwysau gan yr wrthblaid i weithredu arni, ond yr ydym yn ddiolchgar ei bod wedi ei chyflwyno heddiw. Byddaf yn sôn am rai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Alun Ffred Jones ynglŷn

importance of manufacturing and some of the problems that we face, using examples from the main manufacturing base in the area that I represent, namely Llanelli.

We have seen a substantial drop in the numbers and percentage of manufacturing jobs in Llanelli. Time does not allow me to give great detail, but I will give some examples. In 2000, 25.1 per cent of the working population in the town were working in manufacturing; in 2004, that had gone down to 18.4 per cent. I acknowledge that that figure fluctuates from year to year but the trend since 1999 is clearly downward. The figures are still higher than the Welsh average, which is why this debate is vital to Llanelli as a community.

Manufacturing jobs have steadily been lost and the extent of the problem has been partly concealed, if you just look at the headline figures, by some people being redefined as 'economically inactive'. We have a very high percentage of economically inactive people in the Llanelli travel-to-work area: some 33.5 per cent. Many of those people are disabled, are people at home with children or are people who are in a situation where that genuinely reflects their position. However, there are many people who have simply given up. The most worrying point about that is that some of those people are young. We are not now talking only about men in their 40s and 50s who have lost jobs in traditional industries; we are talking about young people from 18 to 25 who are simply not getting into the jobs market and, as a result, are suffering from depression and, sometimes, drug and alcohol problems.

There are many figures that could be quoted and some jobs have come in and they are welcome. However, many of those jobs are service jobs. The jobs that have replaced the manufacturing jobs are less secure—or are perceived as such—and are less well paid and some of the public-sector jobs, while welcome, may not be sustainable beyond the period of European funding.

â phwysigrwydd gweithgynhyrchu a rhai o'r problemau a wynebwn, gan ddefnyddio enghreifftiau o'r brif sylfaen weithgynhyrchu yn yr ardal yr wyf yn ei chynrychioli, sef Llanelli.

Gwelsom leihad sylweddol yn nifer a chanran y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn Llanelli. Nid oes digon o amser imi fanylu ar hyn, ond fe roddaf rai enghreifftiau. Yn 2000, yr oedd 25.1 y cant o'r boblogaeth weithio yn y dref yn gweithio yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu; yn 2004, lleihaodd y nifer hwnnw i 18.4 y cant. Cydnabyddaf fod y ffigur hwnnw'n amrywio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, ond mae'r duedd er 1999 yn amlwg yn gostwng. Mae'r ffigurau'n dal yn uwch na chyfartaledd Cymru, a dyna pam mae'r ddadl hon yn hanfodol i Lanelli fel cymuned.

Collwyd swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn raddol a chelwyd graddau'r broblem yn rhannol, ac os edrychwch ar y ffigurau pennawd gwelwch fod hynny wedi ei wneud drwy ailddiffinio rhai pobl fel 'economaidd anweithgar'. Mae gennym ganran uchel iawn o bobl economaidd anweithgar yn ardal Llanelli lle mae pobl yn teithio i'r gwaith: tua 33.5 y cant. Mae nifer o'r rheini'n anabl, yn bobl sy'n aros gartref gyda'u plant neu sydd mewn sefyllfa lle mae hynny'n wirioneddol yn adlewyrchu eu cyflwr. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o bobl wedi rhoi'r ffidil yn y to. Y pwynt sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf yn hynny yw bod rhai o'r bobl hynny yn ifanc. Nid am ddyinion yn eu 40au a'u 50au sydd wedi colli swyddi mewn diwydiannau traddodiadol yr ydym yn sôn; yr ydym yn sôn am bobl ifanc rhwng 18 a 25 oed nad ydynt, yn syml, yn cyrraedd y farchnad swyddi, ac sydd o ganlyniad yn dioddef iselder, ac weithiau broblemau cyffuriau ac alcohol.

Mae llawer o ffigurau y gellid eu dyfynnu, ac mae rhai swyddi wedi dod i mewn ac maent i'w croesawu. Fodd bynnag, swyddi gwasanaethu yw nifer o'r swyddi hynny. Mae'r swyddi sydd wedi disodli'r swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn llai diogel—neu mae yna syniad eu bod yn llai diogel—ac nid ydynt yn talu cystal, ac efallai nad yw rhai o'r swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus, er bod croeso iddynt, yn gynaliadwy ar ôl cyfnod cyllid Ewropeaidd.

We all have to acknowledge the global economic realities that have put particular pressure on the car industry in Wales; no-one would pretend otherwise. However, Welsh workers are more vulnerable as they do not have the protection that their European colleagues enjoy. It was interesting to see—not for the first time—Andrew Davies distancing himself yesterday from the Brown-Blair position that this flexible labour market is good for people. I remember being told in 1999 and again in 2003—

**Catherine Thomas:** I am touched by your concern for my constituency and my constituents. You refer to the car industry. Since the announcement of the 90-day consultation at Krupp Camford Pressings Ltd in Llanelli, have you visited the plant? Have you met with the management? Have you met with the trade unions and shop stewards? Have you arranged for the Minister to visit, as he will do the week after next? Your concern is touching, but what spade work have you done on the ground to back it up?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I have been doing spade work on the ground since 1999, as Catherine Thomas well knows. There was, for example, a huge issue then about whether the management would recognise the union and it did, partly through representations from the Government and partly through representations from me. I have received representations from the workforce and I have written to the company, for the record. Also for the record, those constituents are also my constituents and are also constituents of Lisa Francis and Nick Bourne. That is how things stand.

We are faced with global trends that are causing considerable difficulties and no-one can deny that. However, we are faced with no strategic response at all from the Labour Assembly Government and, at best, we are firefighting. I could give further, specific examples, not only from Llanelli but from other parts of the region that I represent. When I have asked the Minister and his team for early intervention to try to head off potential redundancies, I have received a disappointing response.

Rhaid inni oll gydnabod y realiti economaidd byd-eang sydd wedi rhoi pwysau penodol ar y diwydiant ceir yng Nghymru; ni fyddai neb yn honni fel arall. Fodd bynnag, mae gweithwyr yng Nghymru yn fwy diamddiffyn am nad oes ganddynt yr un lefel o ddiogelwch â'u cydweithwyr yn Ewrop. Yr oedd yn ddiddorol gweld Andrew Davies—nid am y tro cyntaf—yn ymbellhau ddoe oddi wrth safbwynt Brown-Blair fod y farchnad lafur hyblyg hon yn dda i bobl. Cofiaf glywed yn 1999 ac unwaith eto yn 2003—

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'ch pryder am fy etholaeth a'm hetholwyr. Cyfeiriwch at y diwydiant ceir. Ers cyhoeddi'r ymgynghoriad 90 diwrnod yn Krupp Camford Pressing Ltd yn Llanelli, a ydych wedi ymweld â'r safle? A ydych wedi cwrdd â'r rheolwyr? A ydych wedi cwrdd â'r undebau llafur a'r swyddogion undeb? A ydych wedi trefnu i'r Gweinidog ymweld, fel y bydd yn ei wneud yr wythnos ar ôl nesaf? Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich pryder, ond pa waith caib a rhaw yr ydych chi edi'i wneud ar lawr gwlad i'w ategu?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bûm yn gwneud gwaith caib a rhaw ar lawr gwlad ers 1999, fel y gŵyr Catherine Thomas yn dda. Er enghraifft, yr oedd problem enfawr bryd hynny a fyddai'r rheolwyr yn cydnabod yr undeb. Gwnaethant hynny yn rhannol drwy sylwadau gan y Llywodraeth ac yn rhannol drwy sylwadau gennyf fi. Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau gan y gweithlu ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y cwmni, er gwybodaeth. Er gwybodaeth hefyd, mae'r etholwyr hynny yn etholwyr i mi hefyd, a hefyd yn etholaethwyr i Lisa Francis a Nick Bourne. Dyna'r sefyllfa bresennol.

Mae tueddiadau byd-eang yn ein hwynebu sy'n achosi anawsterau sylweddol ac ni all neb wadu hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn cael unrhyw ymateb strategol o gwbl gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, ac ar y gorau yr ydym yn ymdrin â phroblemau wrth iddynt godi. Gallwn roi enghreifftiau penodol eraill, nid o Lanelli yn unig, ond o rannau eraill o'r rhanbarth a gynrychiolir gennyf. Pan wyf wedi gofyn i'r Gweinidog a'i dîm ymyrryd yn gynnar i geisio osgoi diswyddiadau posibl, yr wyf wedi cael ymateb siomedig.

4.50 p.m.

We are handicapped by the lack of a sub-regional strategy to attract and maintain employment in those parts of the Objective 1 region that are further to the west and north and we lack, for example, a systematic approach to a systematic approach to appropriate infrastructure development. There are also issues regarding business support being bureaucratic and complex, although I would acknowledge that there have been some positive steps in that direction. This acts as a disincentive to the start-up and development of local businesses, which are more likely, as Alun Ffred Jones has pointed out, to provide sustainable employment.

When the Assembly Government does something positive in this regard, it does not always maintain it. I refer specifically to the learning-worker project, which was a huge success. A pilot project was run in Llanelli between September 2002 and March 2005. Almost 2,000 workers working for 300 organisations significantly contributed to improving their skills. This project was abandoned because it was too costly, and certainly not because it was not delivering results. Even when positive action is taken it is not always maintained.

Communities such as those in Llanelli and the region that I represent have a right to expect the Assembly Government to give the highest priority to sustainable economic development, which includes creating conditions within which manufacturing can operate and innovate. We all know that so much depends on having a decent job. Unfortunately, the Minister appears to be like a rabbit caught in the headlights of a car. He reacts and responds and protects his own tail, and is incapable of strategic planning or long-term vision. Communities across Wales deserve better.

**Lynne Neagle:** It has become usual to start any speech on manufacturing in Wales by mentioning India, China and eastern Europe. However, I will start my contribution by focusing on Wales, because, in a globalised

Mae'r ffaith nad oes gennym strategaeth is-ranbarthol i ddenu cyflogaeth a'i chynnal yn y rhannau hynny o'r rhanbarth Amcan 1 sydd ymhellach i'r gorllewin a'r gogledd yn ein llesteirio, ac nid oes gennym, er enghraifft, ddull systematig o ddatblygu seilwaith priodol. Mae yna broblemau hefyd am fod cymorth busnes yn fiwrocraataidd ac yn gymhleth, er y byddwn yn cydnabod bod rhai camau cadarnhaol wedi eu cymryd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Mae hyn yn cymhell pobl i beidio â dechrau na datblygu busnesau lleol, sy'n fwy tebygol, fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred Jones, o ddarparu cyflogaeth gynaliadwy.

Pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud rhywbeth cadarnhaol yn y cyfeiriad hwn, nid yw bob amser yn ei gynnal. Cyfeiriaf yn benodol at y prosiect gweithwyr sy'n dysgu, a fu'n llwyddiant ysgubol. Cynhaliwyd prosiect peilot yn Llanelli rhwng mis Medi 2002 a mis Mawrth 2005. Cyfrannodd bron 2,000 o weithwyr a oedd yn gweithio i 300 o sefydliadau yn sylweddol at wella eu sgiliau. Rhoddwyd y gorau i'r prosiect hwn am ei fod yn rhy gostus, ac yn sicr nid am nad oedd yn cael canlyniadau. Hyd yn oed pan gymerir camau cadarnhaol, nid ydynt bod amser yn cael eu cynnal.

Mae gan gymunedau megis cymunedau yn Llanelli a'r rhanbarth a gynrychiolir gennyf yr hawl i ddisgwyl i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i ddatblygu economaidd cynaliadwy, sy'n cynnwys creu amodau lle y gall gweithgynhyrchu weithredu ac arloesi. Gwyddom oll fod cymaint yn dibynnu ar gael swydd dda. Yn anffodus, ymddengys nad yw'r Gweinidog yn gwybod i ble i droi. Mae'n adweithio, yn ymateb ac yn ei amddiffyn ei hun, ac nid oes ganddo'r gallu i gynllunio'n strategol na llunio gweledigaeth hirdymor. Mae cymunedau ledled Cymru yn haeddu gwell.

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae wedi dod yn arfer dechrau unrhyw araith ar weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru drwy sôn am India, Tsieina a dwyrain Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad drwy ganolbwyntio ar Gymru,

Wales, we must fight to be masters of our own economic destiny. Too often, manufacturing is misrepresented as being a tired blast from the past, which is in terminal decline and has nothing to offer the future of the Welsh economy. That notion is wrong. The manufacturing sector accounts for 170,000 jobs in Wales, which is 14.7 per cent of all jobs compared with just 1 per cent employed in agriculture. In terms of contributing to future economic development, the manufacturing industry accounts for 80 per cent of European Union private-sector research and development expenditure. That is a phenomenal contribution to our future prosperity and associated social benefits.

However, there is no doubt that the sector has undergone, and is still undergoing, painful change and restructuring. The grave news from Ebbw Vale, and further afield in Ellesmere Port, underlines that trend. In my own constituency, the number of manufacturing jobs has fallen by one-fifth, as a proportion of total jobs, since 1999. That is a disproportionate impact on an area that is already struggling with the burdens of ill health and accompanying inactivity.

The fact that unemployment figures have fallen during the same period to just 5 per cent is testament to the responsible economic management of Labour administrations in Cardiff bay and Westminster.

**Alun Cairns:** Does the Member share the concern of Tony Woodley, the general secretary of the Transport and General Workers' Union, who said today that 100,000 jobs across the United Kingdom are being replaced by temporary or agency jobs, which often pay the minimum wage?

**Lynne Neagle:** I am sure that the Transport and General Workers' Union, of which I am a proud member, will take no notice of any crocodile tears from the Tories on manufacturing. It is all too aware that only Labour will continue to support manufacturing in Wales.

oherwydd mewn Cymru sydd wedi'i globaleiddio rhaid inni frwydro i feistrolï ein tynged economaidd ein hunain. Yn rhy aml, caiff gweithgynhyrchu ei gamgynrychioli fel diwydiant sydd wedi chwythu'i blwch, sy'n dirywio'n derfynol ac sy'n cynnig dim i ddyfodol economi Cymru. Mae'r syniad hwnnw'n anghywir. Mae'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yn cyfrif am 170,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru, sef 14.7 y cant o'r holl swyddi o'u cymharu â dim ond un y cant a gyflogir mewn amaethyddiaeth. O ran cyfrannu at ddatblygu economaidd yn y dyfodol, mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn cyfrif am 80 y cant o wariant sector preifat yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar ymchwil a datblygu. Mae hwnnw'n gyfraniad rhyfeddol i'n ffyniant yn y dyfodol a buddiannau cymdeithasol cysylltiedig.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r sector yn ddiau wedi mynd drwy broses boenus o newid ac ailstrwythuro, ac mae'n parhau i wneud hynny. Mae'r newyddion difrifol o Lynebwy, ac ymbellach i ffwrdd yn Ellesmere Port, yn tanlinellu'r duedd honno. Yn fy etholaeth fy hun, mae nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu wedi gostwng un rhan o bump, fel cyfran o'r holl swyddi, er 1999. Mae hynny'n effaith anghymesur ar ardal sydd eisoes yn brwydro yn erbyn beichiau salwch ac anweithgarwch cysylltiedig.

Mae'r ffaith fod ffigurau diweithdra wedi gostwng yn ystod yr un cyfnod i ddim ond 5 y cant yn dystiolaeth i'r rheolaeth economaidd gyfrifol gan weinyddiaethau Llafur ym mae Caerdydd a San Steffan.

**Alun Cairns:** A yw'r Aelod yn pryderu, fel Tony Woodley, ysgrifennydd cyffredinol Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol, a ddywedodd heddiw fod 100,000 o swyddi ledled y Deyrnas Unedig yn cael eu disodli gan swyddi dros dro neu swyddi asiantaeth, sy'n aml yn talu'r isafswm cyflog?

**Lynne Neagle:** Yr wyf yn siŵr na fydd Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol yr wyf yn aelod balch ohono yn rhoi sylw i unrhyw dagrau ffug gan y Torïaid am weithgynhyrchu. Mae'n rhy ymwybodol mai Llafur yn unig a fydd yn parhau i gefnogi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

The catastrophic job losses in manufacturing under the Tories—100,000 jobs in Wales—were certainly not accompanied by an overall economic uplift. However, we must recognise that the loss of manufacturing jobs, such as those in the automotive industry in Torfaen—at TRW Automotive and Trico, which have been in the borough for a number of generations—presents different challenges to many other job losses. Research undertaken by Amicus shows that when manufacturing workers are made redundant they rarely find a comparable job. Two-thirds cannot find a job within a year, and, of those who do, many are paid 40 per cent less.

Although Team Wales's response to closures and job losses is generally swift and useful, it is necessarily an exercise in firefighting. That makes Government intervention, in terms of regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grants, crucial in developing the sustainable elements of our manufacturing industry. We should recognise the positive impact of the £52 million allocated by the Government last year alone.

I said that I would not begin by considering competition from the east, but I will turn briefly to that now, if only to say that we cannot and should not be looking to compete on cost. Already, employers in Wales are far more likely to pay the minimum wage—25 per cent do so—than in the rest of the UK, where the figure stands at 17 per cent. That is not the area of manufacturing that we should be fighting to create and sustain. We have to recognise that there are multinational companies that will tell potential contractors not to bid for work unless they base their figures on production taking place in a low-wage economy. I have been told this twice in a number of months regarding jobs being lost in Torfaen.

The long-term survival of manufacturing in Wales depends on innovation, on higher skills levels, and, I believe, on better selling techniques in three areas. The first of those

Yn bendant, ni fu gwelliant economaidd cyffredinol yn sgil y nifer trychinebus o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a gollwyd o dan y Toriaid-100,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod colli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu, megis y rhai yn y diwydiant cerbydau modur yn Nhor-faen-yn TRW Automotive a Trico, sydd wedi bod yn y fwrdeistref ers cenedlaethau lawer-yn dod â heriau gwahanol i lawer o swyddi eraill a gollir. Dengys gwaith ymchwil a wnaed gan Amicus mai anaml iawn y bydd gweithwyr gweithgynhyrchu yn dod o hyd i swydd gymaradwy ar ôl eu diswyddo. Mae dwy ran o dair yn methu cael swydd ar ôl blwyddyn, ac o blith y rheini sy'n cael swydd caiff nifer eu talu 40 y cant yn llai.

Er bod ymateb Tîm Cymru i achosion o gau a cholli swyddi yn gyflym ac yn ddefnyddiol yn gyffredinol, mater yw o reidrwydd o ymladd tân ar ôl iddo gychwyn. Mae hynny'n golygu bod ymyrryd gan y Llywodraeth, o ran cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, yn hanfodol i ddatblygu'r elfennau cynaliadwy yn ein diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Dylem gydnabod effaith gadarnhaol y £52 miliwn a ddyrannwyd gan y Llywodraeth y llynedd yn unig.

Dywedais na fyddwn yn dechrau drwy ystyried y gystadleuaeth yn nwyrain Ewrop, ond trof yn gyflym at hynny yn awr, dim ond er mwyn dweud na allwn ac na ddylem geisio cystadlu â hwy ar gostau. Mae cyflogwyr yng Nghymru eisoes yn fwy tebygol o dalu'r isafswm cyflog—mae 25 y cant yn gwneud hynny—nag yng ngweddill y DU, lle mae'r ffigur yn 17 y cant. Nid dyna'r maes gweithgynhyrchu y dylem fod yn brwydro dros ei greu a'i gynnal. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod yna gwmnïau rhyngwladol a fydd yn dweud wrth eu darpar contractwyr am beidio â chynnig am waith oni fyddant yn seilio'u ffigurau ar gynhyrchu mewn economi cyflog isel. Yr wyf wedi clywed hyn ddwywaith mewn nifer o fisoedd ynglŷn â cholli swyddi yn Nhor-faen.

Mae parhaud gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru dros gyfnod hir yn dibynnu ar arloesedd, ar lefelau sgiliau uwch, ac yn fy marn i mae'n dibynnu ar well technegau gwerthu mewn tri

areas is better selling to Asian markets, where we lag behind our European partners in exploiting the Chinese market, for example. The second is better selling in terms of public procurement; let us look at the French example, where public works contracts are linked to getting local economically inactive people back to work. The third is better selling of manufacturing as an industry with a future. It is not a dirty, dying sector. Those companies expanding in Torfaen emphasise this point, with production depending on state-of-the-art, computer-driven technology.

Underpinning all this is the skills agenda. As Alan Johnson recently noted, India and China are producing 4 million graduates a year, few of whom are getting degrees in medieval history. If we want to compete at the high-skill, value-added end of the market, then the Flying Start program, which is aimed at giving children between birth and 3 years of age in deprived communities the best start in life, is as important as economic development initiatives like 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. More and better links with business through schools are equally vital, as companies still report that school and university leavers are not job-ready.

Manufacturing in Wales has a future, but that is not the same as fighting to keep the status quo. We can no longer offer the choice to our children of pursuing academic excellence or getting a good manufacturing job or apprenticeship. We must create a system where these ambitions co-exist.

I welcome the steps taken by the Assembly Government and trade unions in Wales to create this high-skills job market, but ask, for the sake of my constituents and those in similarly affected regions, that the change comes faster still.

**Mark Isherwood:** Investment is attracted by flexibility, workplace skills, infrastructure and competitive levels of taxation and

maes. Y maes cyntaf yw gwerthu'n well i farchnadoedd yn Asia, lle yr ydym yn llusgo y tu ôl i'n partneriaid Ewropeaidd o ran manteisio ar y farchnad yn Tsieina, er enghraifft. Yr ail yw gwerthu'n well o ran caffael cyhoeddus; gadewch inni edrych ar yr enghraifft yn Ffrainc, lle y mae contractau gwaith cyhoeddus yn gysylltiedig â chael pobl leol economaidd anweithgar yn ôl i'r gwaith. Y trydydd yw gwerthu gweithgynhyrchu'n well fel diwydiant sydd â dyfodol. Nid sector brwnt sy'n darfod mohono. Mae'r cwmnïau hynny sy'n ehangu yn Nhor-faen yn pwysleisio'r pwynt hwn, a'r broses gynhyrchu yn dibynnu ar y dechnoleg gyfrifiadurol ddiweddaraf.

Yn sail i hyn oll mae'r agenda sgiliau. Fel y dywedodd Alan Johnson yn ddiweddar, mae India a Tsieina yn cynhyrchu 4 miliwn o raddedigion y flwyddyn, a nifer fach o'r rheini sy'n graddio mewn hanes canoloesol. Os ydym am gystadlu â'r farchnad sgiliau uchel, gwerth ychwanegol, yna mae'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, sy'n anelu at roi'r dechrau gorau i blant rhwng eu geni a'u pen-blwydd yn 3 oed mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, mor bwysig â mentrau datblygu economaidd fel 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Mae mwy o gysylltiadau a chysylltiadau gwell â busnesau drwy ysgolion yr un mor bwysig, gan fod cwmnïau'n dweud o hyd nad yw'r rheini sy'n gadael yr ysgol a'r brifysgol yn barod ar gyfer swyddi.

Mae dyfodol gan weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ond nid yw hynny'r un fath â brwydro i gadw'r sefyllfa bresennol. Ni allwn gynnig y dewis i'n plant mwyach o fynd ar drywydd rhagoriaeth academiaidd neu gael swydd neu brentisiaeth weithgynhyrchu dda. Rhaid inni greu system lle y mae'r uchelgeisiau hyn yn cydfodoli.

Croesawaf y camau a gymerwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac undebau llafur yng Nghymru i greu'r farchnad hon ar gyfer swyddi sgiliau uchel, ond gofynnaf, er lles fy etholwyr a'r rheini mewn rhanbarthau yr effeithir arnynt yn yr un modd, amn i'r newid ddod yn gyflymach fyth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae buddsoddi'n cael ei ddenu gan hyblygrwydd, sgiliau'r gweithle, seilwaith a lefelau cystadleuol o drethu a



regulation. However, since devolution, manufacturing has fallen from a position where it accounted for over 25 per cent of the Welsh economy to just 19 per cent this year. Over the last year alone, manufacturing jobs in Wales fell by 7,000, and Welsh unemployment rose back up to 5 per cent. Meanwhile, in one in five Welsh working-age households, no-one has a job.

We must be concerned by the growing dependence of the Welsh economy on public-sector spending rather than wealth generation. Public spending in Wales will be £13.6 billion by 2008, but Wales pays only £4.7 billion a year in tax. Treasury data shows that the proportion of economic activity in Wales generated by the public sector has risen from 47 per cent in 1998 to 55 per cent in 2004. In England, the figure is only 37 per cent and in Scotland, 48 per cent.

A Cardiff Business School professor told me that he finds it amazing that just about everyone he bumps into at conferences here works in the public sector. He went on to say that it is very kind of British taxpayers to spend all this money in our country.

As the general secretary of the Transport and General Workers' Union said today in response to job losses at Vauxhall in Ellesmere Port, where many Welsh residents work, 'manufacturing is being massacred'.

Gordon Brown inherited the best job-creation record in Europe and inward investment second only to the United States internationally. However, Labour's new burdens on business are eroding the competitiveness on which our future prosperity will depend.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mark, I am grateful to you for giving way. I have listened to you very carefully, as I did to Alun before you. Neither of you has yet—and this is reflected in your amendments—suggested what policies you would like to see implemented. When will you do that? Are we to assume that there will

rheoleiddio. Fodd bynnag, ers datganoli mae gweithgynhyrchu wedi gostwng o sefyllfa lle yr oedd yn cyfrif am fwy na 25 y cant o economi Cymru i ddim ond 19 y cant eleni. Yn ystod y llynedd yn unig, bu gostyngiad o 7,000 yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, a chododd diweithdra yng Nghymru yn ôl i 5 y cant. Yn y cyfamser, mewn un teulu o bob pump o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru, nid oes gan neb swydd.

Rhaid inni bryderu ynghylch dibyniaeth gynyddol economi Cymru ar wariant y sector cyhoeddus, yn hytrach nag ar greu cyfoeth. Bydd gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn £13.6 biliwn erbyn 2008, ond dim ond £4.7 biliwn o drethi y flwyddyn y mae Cymru'n ei dalu. Dengys data'r Trysorlys fod cyfran y gweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru sy'n cael ei greu gan y sector cyhoeddus wedi codi o 47 y cant yn 1998 i 55 y cant yn 2004. Yn Lloegr dim ond 37 y cant yw'r ffigur, ac yn yr Alban 48 y cant.

Dywedodd athro yn Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd wrthyf ei fod yn syfrdanu bod bron pawb y mae'n dod ar eu traws mewn cynadleddau yma yn gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus. Aeth yn ei flaen i ddweud bod trethdalwyr ym Mhrydain yn garedig iawn i wario'r holl arian hwn yn ein gwlad.

Fel y dywedodd ysgrifennydd cyffredinol Undeb y Gweithwyr Cludiant a Chyffredinol heddiw wrth ymateb i'r swyddi a gollwyd yn Vauxhall yn Ellesmere Port, lle y mae nifer o drigolion o Gymru yn gweithio, 'mae'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn cael ei ladd'.

Etifeddodd Gordon Brown y record orau yn Ewrop o greu swyddi a'r record orau yn rhyngwladol o fewnfuddsoddi, ar wahân i'r Unol Daleithiau. Fodd bynnag, mae pwysau newydd y blaid Lafur ar fusnesau yn erydu'r natur gystadleuol y bydd ein ffyniant yn y dyfodol yn dibynnu arni.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mark, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Yr wyf wedi gwrandao arnoch yn astud, fel y gwrandewais ar Alun cyn hynny. Nid oes neb ohonoch hyd yma—ac adlewyrchir hyn yn eich gwelliannau—wedi awgrymu pa bolisiau yr hoffech weld eu gweithredu. Pryd fyddwch yn gwneud

be a repeat of the policies of the former Conservative Government, which led to hundreds of thousands of jobs being lost in the manufacturing industry, and 130,000 people being made unemployed in Wales?

hynny? A ddylem dybio yr ailadroddir polisiau'r hen Lywodraeth Geidwadol, a arweiniodd at golli cannoedd ar filoedd o swyddi yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, a 130,000 o bobl yn cael eu diswyddo yng Nghymru?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Before you reply to that, Mark, I invite the Business Minister to propose an extension for one hour.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cyn ichi ateb hynny, Mark, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynneg estyniad o awr.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21(iii), extends Plenary until 6.30 p.m..*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21(iii), yn estyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.30 p.m..*

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.  
Procedural motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 4.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Pugh, Alun  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Lewis, Huw  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu: Parhad** **The Manufacturing Industry: Continued**

**Mark Isherwood:** I am glad, Jeff, that you spoke in the present tense, and asked what we will do. When we are in Government, we will follow truth with the economy rather than economy with the truth.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn falch, Jeff, ichi siarad yn yr amser presennol, a gofyn beth fyddwn yn ei wneud. Pan fyddwn yn y Llywodraeth, byddwn yn rhoi'r gwirionedd cyn yr economi, yn hytrach na'r economi cyn y gwirionedd.

5.00 p.m.

I will start by recognising that, according to Cardiff Business School in the 1980s and early 1990s, Wales was one of the top recipients of inward investment in the whole of Europe. However, since 1997, the UK has fallen from fourth to thirteenth position in the global competitiveness league and, within the UK, Wales has fallen from first to ninth position in terms of inward investment. In fact, Gordon Brown got his tax, spend, borrowing and growth forecasts all wrong. The reality is that Wales is living on the never-never.

Dechreuaf drwy gydnabod bod Cymru, yn ôl Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd yn yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, yn un o'r gwledydd a welodd y mewnfuddsoddi mwyaf yn Ewrop gyfan. Fodd bynnag, er 1997 mae'r DU wedi gostwng o'r pedwerydd safle i'r trydydd safle ar ddeg yng nghynghrair cystadleurwydd y byd, ac yn y DU mae Cymru wedi gostwng o'r safle cyntaf i'r nawfed safle o ran mewnfuddsoddi. Yn wir, yr oedd rhagamcanion Gordon Brown yn anghywir o ran treth, gwariant, benthyca a thwf. Y realiti yw bod Cymru'n byw ar goel.

The Brown legacy, after nine years as Chancellor of the Exchequer, is a UK growth rate that is now nineteenth out of 25 in the European Union. The UK is now seventy-third out of 117 in the league table of Government deficits. The growth in output per UK worker has fallen to a 15-year low. French workers are now 93 per cent more productive than UK workers. This gap in productivity growth will mean that we cannot sustain our living standards compared to the wider world.

Yr hyn y mae Brown wedi'i gyflawni, ar ôl naw mlynedd fel Canghellor y Trysorlys, yw cyfradd dwf yn y DU sydd bellach yn y pedwerydd safle ar bymtheg allan o 25 yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r DU bellach yn y trydydd safle ar ddeg a thrigain o'r 117 yn nhabl y cynghrair o ran diffygion y Llywodraeth. Mae'r twf mewn cynhyrchiant fesul gweithiwr yn y DU wedi gostwng i lefel na welwyd er 15 mlynedd. Erbyn hyn mae gweithwyr o Ffrainc 93 y cant yn fwy cynhyrchiol na gweithwyr yn y DU. Bydd y bwch hwn mewn twf cynhyrchiant yn golygu na allwn gynnal ein safonau byw o'n cymharu â'r byd ehangach.

Largely due to the burden of regulation, business investment is now at its lowest level on record. Research and development spending is now down to 1.9 per cent of gross domestic product, lower than the United States, France and Germany. The UK trade deficit is now at its highest level since records started in the seventeenth century. Business taxes have risen as our international competitors have cut corporate taxes.

Yn bennaf o ganlyniad i faich rheoleiddio, mae buddsoddi gan fusnesau ar ei lefel isaf erioed. Mae gwario ar waith ymchwil a datblygu bellach wedi gostwng i 1.9 y cant o'r cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, sy'n is na'r Unol Daleithiau, Ffrainc a'r Almaen. Mae diffyg masnach y DU bellach ar ei lefel uchaf ers i'r cofnodion ddechrau yn yr ail ganrif ar bymtheg. Mae trethi busnes wedi codi wrth i'n cystadleuwyr rhyngwladol ostwng trethi corfforaeth.

As former Chancellor of the Exchequer, Ken Clarke, has stated, Gordon Brown's policies are remorselessly eroding our international competitiveness, and his claimed economic success is an illusion. The Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development has stated that low UK skill levels are impediments to economic capacity. Worse still, Wales now has poorer basic skills than almost anywhere else in the United Kingdom. Growing numbers of young people are not in training, education or work. Reference has been made to Airbus in Broughton, where 80 per cent of the applicants for the apprenticeship scheme fail their basic skills tests. At the annual CBI seminar at the Assembly last year, it was emphasised that the costs imposed on business had risen rapidly in recent years and that profits had peaked at a lower level than during the last two economic cycles.

In Wales, the inscrutable Andrew Davies has had to scrap Rhodri's target for Welsh prosperity after this fell to the lowest level among all UK nations or regions. His legacy is best summed up by the North Wales Economic Forum, which stated that the success of Ireland is due to the economy being a strong priority, and that it appears that Wales has been stricter and more bureaucratic than other European nations.

At a time of European enlargement, localisation and new paradigm economics, this legacy of cack-handed business incompetence and failure is why Welsh and UK manufacturing is declining. This Labour Welsh Assembly Government has degraded the health service, dumbed down education, and driven out investment.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am never surprised by the negativity driven by the opposition Members in Wales. If inward investor were to listen to Mark Isherwood, they would never come to Wales, because all that the opposition does is talk it down. It is a disgrace.

Manufacturing has long been a key to Flintshire's economy, and more than a third

Fel y mae cyn Ganghellor y Trysorlys, Ken Clarke, wedi ei ddweud, mae polisiau Gordon Brown yn erydu ein cystadleurwydd rhyngwladol yn ddidrugaredd, a chamargraff yw ei lwyddiant economaidd honedig. Mae'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithredu a Datblygu Economaidd wedi dweud bod lefelau sgiliau isel yn y DU yn rhwystro gallu economaidd. Gwaeth na hynny, mae gan Gymru sgiliau sylfaenol gwaeth yn awr na bron unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae niferoedd cynyddol o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn hyfforddiant, addysg na gwaith. Cyfeiriwyd at Airbus ym Mrychdyn, lle y mae 80 y cant o'r ymgeiswyr am y cynllun prentisiaeth yn methu eu profion sgiliau sylfaenol. Yn y seminar CBI blynyddol yn y Cynulliad y llynedd, pwysleisiwyd bod y costau ar fusnesau wedi codi'n gyflym yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, a bod yr uchafbwynt elw yn is nag yn ystod y ddau gylch economaidd diwethaf.

Yng Nghymru, mae difynegiant Andrew Davies wedi rhoi'r gorau i darged Rhodri ar gyfer ffyniant yng Nghymru ar ôl i hynny ostwng i'r lefel isaf o holl wledydd neu ranbarthau'r DU. Crynhoir ei etifeddiaeth orau gan Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru, a ddywedodd fod llwyddiant Iwerddon yn tarddu o wneud yr economi'n flaenoriaeth gadarn, a'i bod yn ymddangos bod Cymru wedi bod yn llymach ac yn fwy biwrocraidd na gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop.

Ar adeg o ehangu yn Ewrop, lleoleiddio ac economeg batrymol newydd, yr anghymwystra a'r methiant busnes trwsgl hyn yw'r rheswm pam mae gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru a'r DU yn dirywio. Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn y Cynulliad wedi diraddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd, gostwng safonau addysg ac erlid buddsoddi.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ni fyddaf byth yn synnu at yr agweddau negyddol sy'n cael eu harddel gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yng Nghymru. Pe bai mewnfuddsoddwr yn gwrandao ar Mark Isherwood, ni fyddai byth yn dod i Gymru, oherwydd y cyfan a wna'r gwrthbleidiau yw ei diraddio. Mae'n warthus.

Mae gweithgynhyrchu wedi bod yn allweddol i economi sir y Fflint ers amser

of the workers in the county are employed in this sector. Between 1997 and the beginning of this year, we have helped around 5,900 extra people in Flintshire into work, 900 of which have entered the county's manufacturing industry. This impressive level of job creation has also coincided with the introduction of the national minimum wage, new family-friendly laws and the rebuilding of our public services.

The industry is not without its challenges, and we recognise that. In Wales, we are well-placed to meet those challenges. The motion is right to note the increasing strength of competition with the global manufacturing sector globally. We cannot compete with the low-wage economies on the basis of cost, nor should we want to do so when the real price is often workers working in poverty and in terrible conditions, and child labour. One of the key messages that we have to remember in Wales is that what we have to deliver for our manufacturing industry is not the power of the elbow, but the power of the mind.

As was kindly mentioned by Alun, Airbus UK at Broughton, in my constituency, is internationally renowned for its manufacturing centre of excellence, and it is one of the exemplar companies in the world. It is a highly innovative company, working across new boundaries to set new competitive global aerospace industry initiatives. I recently congratulated Airbus on a record year, and I was delighted to hear the Minister announcing £5.2 million of regional selective assistance to enable the skills of the workforce, not the company, to be enhanced. That is about investing in the people, not the product. We should be commended for that.

This is not just about Airbus. We have delivered over £52 million of regional selective assistance and Assembly investment grant, in delivering to 271 individual manufacturers across Wales, and that has safeguarded over 2,000 jobs.

maith, a chaiff dros draean o'r gweithwyr yn y sir eu cyflogi yn y sector hwn. Rhwng 1997 a dechrau'r flwyddyn hon, yr ydym wedi helpu tua 5,900 o bobl ychwanegol yn y sir y Fflint i gael gwaith, ac y mae 900 ohonynt wedi ymuno â diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu'r sir. Mae'r nifer nodedig hwn o swyddi a sydd wedi eu creu hefyd wedi cyd-fynd â chyflwyno'r isafswm cyflog cenedlaethol, cyfreithiau newydd sy'n ystyriol o deuluoedd, ac ailadeiladu ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Mae'r diwydiant yn wynebu heriau o hyd, a chydabyddwn hynny. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym mewn sefyllfa dda i ymateb i'r heriau hynny. Mae'r cynnig yn iawn i sylwi ar gryfder cynyddol y gystadleuaeth yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu ar hyd a lled y byd. Ni allwn gystadlu â'r economïau cyflog isel ar sail cost, ac ni ddylem fod am wneud hynny o goffio mai'r pris gwirioneddol yw gweithwyr sy'n aml yn gorfod gweithio mewn tlodi ac o dan amodau arswydus, a llafur plant. Un o'r negeseuon allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni eu cofio yng Nghymru yw nad nerth bôn braich y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddarparu ar gyfer ein diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, ond grym y meddwl.

Fel y crybwyllwyd yn garedig gan Alun, mae Airbus UK ym Mrychdyn, yn fy etholaeth i, yn adnabyddus yn rhyngwladol am ei ganolfan rhagoriaeth gweithgynhyrchu, ac mae'n un o'r cwmnïau sy'n esiampl i eraill yn y byd. Mae'n gwmni arloesol iawn sy'n gweithio ar draws ffiniau newydd i bennu mentrau cystadleuol newydd ar gyfer y diwydiant awyrofod ar draws y byd. Cefais gyfle i longyfarch Airbus yn ddiweddar ar flwyddyn lwyddiannus iawn, ac yr oeddwn yn falch clywed y Gweinidog yn cyhoeddi £5.2 miliwn o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i sicrhau y gellir gwella sgiliau'r gweithlu, nid y cwmni. Mae hynny'n ymwneud â buddsoddi yn y bobl, nid y cynnyrch. Dylid ein cymeradwyo am hynny.

Nid ag Airbus yn unig y mae hyn yn ymwneud. Yr ydym wedi darparu dros £52 miliwn o gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a grantiau buddsoddi'r Cynulliad i ddarparu ar gyfer 271 o weithgynhyrchwyr unigol ledled Cymru, ac mae hynny wedi diogelu dros 2,000 o swyddi.

Another huge manufacturing success story in Alyn and Deeside, and in Flintshire, is Corus Living Solutions, which Sandy Mewies and I visit regularly. It has been awarded a £92 million contract by the defence agency, to supply the most advanced type of modular building in the UK. Again, it is a huge vote of confidence in the skill of the workforce, and it bodes well for the future of the company in Flintshire.

I must mention my regional Conservative colleague. Only the other week, he claimed in the Chamber that Tory investment was responsible for making Deeside one of the most successful economies in Wales. Does he call serving 13,000 redundancy notices in a day investment? I do not. They devastated the industry in Wales, including the mining industry, and I will take no lecture from the Conservatives—today, or in the future—on their track record.

**Mark Isherwood:** I know very well about that because I was working for the building society, which included the John Summers Building Society, which took the cheques off the redundant workers as they came through. It was devastating and heartbreaking, and it will take generations to be forgotten, so I will never belittle that. However, Peter Walker and other Secretaries of State for Wales worked, on principle, very hard over the 1980s and early 1990s to bring in a swath of new factories to Deeside industrial park, and that has enabled Flintshire to have among the lowest unemployment rates in Wales, and, in the Welsh context, above-average incomes. That is to the credit of the last decade, so stop running it down.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have made one speech, Mark.

**Carl Sargeant:** You cannot kid a kidder, Mark—I have never heard so much drivel in all my life. The fact is that a Tory Government made all these cuts, and you

Enghraifft arall o lwyddiant gweithgynhyrchu enfawr yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, ac yn Sir y Fflint, yw Corus Living Solutions. Bydd Sandy Mewies a minnau'n ymweld â'r lle yn rheolaidd. Dyfarnwyd contract gwerth £92 miliwn iddo gan yr asiantaeth amddiffyn, i ddarparu'r math o adeilad modiwlwr mwyaf datblygedig yn y DU. Unwaith eto, mae'n dangos bod hyder mawr yn sgiliau'r gweithlu, ac mae'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer dyfodol y cwmni yn sir y Fflint.

Rhaid imi sôn am fy nghyd-Aelod Ceidwadol rhanbarthol. Wythnos diwethaf yn unig yr honnodd yn y Siambr fod buddsoddiad y Torïaid yn gyfrifol am wneud Glannau Dyfrdwy yn un o'r economïau mwyaf llwyddiannus yng Nghymru. Yn ei farn ef, ai buddsoddiad yw cyflwyno 13,000 o rybuddion diswyddo mewn diwrnod? Nid dyna fy marn i. Dinistriwyd y diwydiant ganddynt yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y diwydiant mwyngloddio, ac ni dderbyniaf unrhyw bregeth gan y Ceidwadwyr—heddiw, nac yn y dyfodol—am yr hyn a wnaethant.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gwn yn dda iawn am hynny, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn gweithio i'r gymdeithas adeiladu, a oedd yn cynnwys Cymdeithas Adeiladu John Summers, a gymerodd y sieciau oddi ar y gweithwyr a ddiswyddwyd wrth iddynt gyrraedd. Yr oedd yn drychinebus ac yn dorcalonnes, ac fe gymer genedlaethau i allu ei anghofio. Felly, ni fyddaf byth yn bychanu hynny. Fodd bynnag, bu Peter Walker ac Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Cymru eraill yn gweithio'n galed iawn, o ran egwyddor, yn ystod yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au i ddod â llu o ffatrïoedd newydd i barc diwydiannol Glannau Dyfrdwy. Mae hynny wedi sicrhau bod gan Sir y Fflint gyfraddau diweithdra sydd ymhlith yr isaf yng Nghymru, ac yng nghydestun Cymru, incymau sy'n uwch na'r cyfartaledd. Mae hynny'n glod i'r degawd diwethaf, felly, rhowch y gorau i'w feirniadu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi gwneud un araith, Mark.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ni allwch dwyllo twyllwr, Mark—ni chlywais gymaint o nonsens erioed yn fy myw. Y gwir amdani yw mai Llywodraeth Doriäidd a wnaeth yr holl

should not forget that. I am glad that you remember taking the redundancy cheques off all those people in Flintshire, because they certainly will not forget; they will remember that it was a Tory Government that did that to them.

This Labour Government has, and will continue, to support manufacturing in Wales, and I am proud to be part of that. We have several high-manufacturing, aerospace and high-technology companies in Flintshire.

**Alun Cairns** *rose—*

**Carl Sargeant:** I am coming to an end now, Alun.

We have 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. The Welsh Assembly Government has established a manufacturing forum in Wales to ensure that the public sector remains relevant and effective for the future. We should congratulate the Minister on the delivery of jobs and manufacturing in Wales. This is a very successful policy from Labour.

**Eleanor Burnham:** As someone whose former husband was managing director of several manufacturing companies, I am fully aware of how the industry has contracted over the last 30 years. We heard the sad news of Ellesmere Port earlier. Looking back at the manufacturing task and finish group's 2004 report, which highlighted an array of issues and concerns, it makes you wonder what is happening. At the top of the list of priorities then was the fact that the Government should put in training support. I will focus my contribution on training.

That report stressed that identifying, promoting and meeting the current and future skill needs of manufacturing managers is a key requirement. Worryingly, it also noted that several manufacturers within the group reported that workforce deficiencies in basic skills are holding back, or have the capacity to hold back, broader improvements and

doriadau hyn, ac ni ddylech anghofio hynny. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cofio cymryd y sieciau diswyddo oddi ar yr holl bobl hynny yn sir y Fflint, oherwydd yn sicr ni fyddant hwy byth yn anghofio hynny; byddant yn cofio mai Llywodraeth Dori'aidd a wnaeth hynny iddynt.

Mae'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon wedi cefnogi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, a bydd yn parhau i wneud hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch o fod yn rhan o hynny. Mae gennym nifer o gwmnïau uwch-weithgynhyrchu, awyrfod ac uwch-dechnoleg yn sir y Fflint.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd—*

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf yn dod tua'r diwedd yn awr, Alun.

Mae gennym 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi sefydlu fforwm gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod y sector cyhoeddus yn dal yn berthnasol ac yn effeithiol ar gyfer y dyfodol. Dylem longyfarch y Gweinidog ar ddarparu swyddi a gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Mae hwn yn bolisi llwyddiannus iawn gan Lafur.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Gan fod fy nghyn-wr yn arfer bod yn gyfarwyddwr rheoli ar nifer o gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r modd y mae'r diwydiant wedi crebachu yn ystod y 30 mlynedd diwethaf. Clywsom y newyddion trist ynglŷn ag Ellesmere Port yn gynharach. Gan edrych yn ôl ar adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu a gyhoeddwyd yn 2004, a oedd yn tynnu sylw at amrywiaeth o faterion a phryderon, mae'n gwneud i chi feddwl beth sy'n digwydd. Ar frig y rhestr o flaenoriaethau bryd hynny yr oedd y ffaith y dylai'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno cymorth hyfforddi. Bydd fy nghyfraniad i'n canolbwyntio ar hyfforddiant.

Pwysleisiodd yr adroddiad hwnnw fod nodi, hyrwyddo a diwallu anghenion sgiliau rheolwyr gweithgynhyrchu yn awr ac yn y dyfodol yn ofyniad craidd. Mater sy'n peri pryder hefyd yw ei fod yn dweud bod nifer o weithgynhyrchwyr yn y grŵp wedi sôn bod diffygion yn sgiliau sylfaenol y gweithlu yn atal gwelliannau a mentrau ehangach, neu y

initiatives. Therefore, Minister—and Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills—what are you doing? Has there been an improvement in basic skills? When I think back to some of the 14 to 16-year-old underachievers who I used to take around to companies, it worried me greatly that they could not even aspire to the wonderful companies that we were visiting.

What progress do you, Minister—and the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, again—have to report on your efforts to identify and address the basic skills deficiency through partnership between employers, employees and your Labour Assembly Government? This report also recommended that the Labour Assembly Government should accelerate the process of change and the support being developed through its Welsh procurement initiative, which was alluded to previously. I believe that this recommendation's intent was to ensure that manufacturing businesses in Wales are able to make the most of the wealth of opportunities provided by the £4 billion spent by the public sector in Wales every year on goods, services and construction.

5.10 p.m.

Worryingly, the manufacturing sector in Wales has a limited research and development base. As has been mentioned, innovation is vital in a globally competitive world, where Wales, along with many other developed nations, struggles to compete with low-wage, low-production-cost countries. I urge you and the Labour Assembly Government to take this far more seriously to ensure greater collaboration between academia and business, and to ensure more Government support, particularly for research and development. The task and finish group also recommended an urgent need for greater clarity of the public support available to manufacturers to assist with their training needs so that they are enabled to plan development activities with confidence. Will you reassure us that this vital issue is being addressed and provide an update on that? Will you confirm how you are raising awareness? Awareness of the excitement that

gallent eu hatal. Felly, Weinidog—a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—beth yr ydych chi'n ei wneud? A fu gwelliant mewn sgiliau sylfaenol? Pan feddyliaf am rai o'r tangyflawnwyr 14 i 16 oed yr oeddwn yn arfer mynd â hwy o gwmpas cwmnïau, yr oedd yn fy mhoeni'n fawr na allent hyd yn oed obeithio gweithio i'r cwmnïau gwych yr oeddem yn ymweld â hwy.

Pa gynnydd y gallwch chi, Weinidog—a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, eto—sôn amdano o ran eich ymdrechion i nodi'r diffyg sgiliau sylfaenol a mynd i'r afael â hynny drwy bartneriaeth rhwng cyflogwyr, cyflogeion a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad? Argymhellodd yr adroddiad hwn hefyd y dylai Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad gyflymu'r broses o newid a'r cymorth sy'n cael ei ddatblygu drwy fenter gaffael Cymru y cyfeiriwyd ati'n gynharach. Credaf mai bwriad yr argymhelliad hwn oedd sicrhau y gall busnesau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfoeth cyfleoedd a ddarperir gan y £4 biliwn sy'n cael ei wario gan y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn ar nwyddau, gwasanaethau ac adeiladu.

Mater sy'n peri pryder yw mai cyfyngedig yw sylfaen ymchwil a datblygu'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Fel y crybwyllwyd, mae arloesedd yn hanfodol mewn byd cystadleuol, lle y mae Cymru, ynghyd â nifer o wledydd datblygedig eraill, yn brwydro i gystadlu â gwledydd sydd â chyflogau isel a chostau cynhyrchu isel. Fe'ch anogaf chi a Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad i roi ystyriaeth lawer mwy difrifol i hyn er mwyn sicrhau gwell cydweithredu rhwng academia a busnesau, ac i sicrhau mwy o gymorth gan y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig ar gyfer gwaith ymchwil a datblygu. Argymhellodd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen hefyd fod angen brys am fwy o eglurder ynghylch y cymorth cyhoeddus sydd ar gael i weithgynhyrchwyr i ddiwallu eu hanghenion hyfforddi, i'w galluogi i gynllunio gweithgareddau datblygu yn hyderus. A wnewch chi ein sicrhau bod y mater hanfodol hwn yn cael sylw a rhoi'r wybodaeth



manufacturing companies can offer is vital, and it will mean that Wales can thrive in the manufacturing industry in the twenty-first century.

**Lisa Francis:** It is always tempting in a debate such as this to reel off statistics and figures in much the same way as telephone numbers, and the effects of this can sometimes be to bore one witless. I will speak about skills and skills deficits. Last year, the Economic Development and Transport Committee visited mid Wales, as the Minister will recall—well, he will not recall the visit because he was not there, but he received a report on it. In that area, there has been a long tradition of manufacturing in the Llanidloes, Newtown and Welshpool corridor, and, at that meeting, ELWa told us that there was clear evidence of a downward spiral in terms of manufacturing skills, with fairly low demand from adults in the region who wanted to engage in education and training.

In a meeting of the Economic Development and Transport Committee in January of last year, Minister, you informed us that the manufacturing task and finish group was asking Future Skills Wales to constantly look at the needs of employers. However, at that meeting in Newtown—you will have seen the report—the private sector representatives who gave evidence told us that they felt that there was no fair or regular assessment of the skills that manufacturers required. I appreciate that there is a large variety of businesses requiring a massive variety of different skills in areas like mid Wales, and it is clearly going to be difficult to supply training programmes to cover that variety. That is why the shared apprenticeship scheme was so valuable in that area. It enabled three or four companies who needed tool makers, machine operators, computer numerical lathe control operators, and so on, to take on two or three youngsters and see them gaining valuable experience and learning those skills.

ddiweddaraf am hynny? A wnewch chi gadarnhau sut yr ydych yn cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth? Mae ymwybyddiaeth o'r cyffro y gall cwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu ei gynnig yn hanfodol, a bydd yn golygu y gall Cymru ffynnu yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae'n demtasiwn bob amser mewn dadl fel hon i restru ystadegau a ffigurau mewn ffordd debyg iawn i rifau teleffon, a gall hyn arwain weithiau at ddiflasiu rhywun yn llwyr. Byddaf fi hefyd yn siarad am sgiliau a diffyg sgiliau. Y llynedd, ymwelodd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth â'r canolbarth, fel y bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio—wel, ni fydd yn cofio'r ymweliad oherwydd nid oedd yno, ond cafodd adroddiad arno. Yn yr ardal honno, mae traddodiad maith o weithgynhyrchu yng nghoridor Llanidloes, y Drenewydd a'r Trallwng, ac yn y cyfarfod hwnnw dywedodd ELWa wrthym fod tystiolaeth glir o duedd ar i lawr mewn sgiliau gweithgynhyrchu, a galw cymharol isel gan oedolion yn y rhanbarth a oedd am ymwneud ag addysg a hyfforddiant.

Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ym mis Ionawr y llynedd, Weinidog, cawsom wybod gennych fod y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar weithgynhyrchu yn gofyn i Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru edrych yn barhaus ar anghenion cyflogwyr. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yn y Drenewydd—byddwch wedi gweld yr adroddiad—dywedodd cynrychiolwyr y sector preifat a roddodd dystiolaeth eu bod yn teimlo nad oedd asesiad teg na rheolaidd o'r sgiliau yr oedd eu hangen ar weithgynhyrchwyr. Cydnabyddaf fod amrywiaeth mawr o fusnesau ag arnynt angen amrywiaeth mawr o wahanol sgiliau mewn ardaloedd fel y canolbarth, ac yn amlwg bydd yn anodd darparu rhaglenni hyfforddi i gwmpasu'r amrywiaeth hwnnw. Dyna pam yr oedd y cynllun prentisiaeth a rennir mor werthfawr yn yr ardal honno. Yr oedd yn galluogi tri neu bedwar cwmni yr oedd arnynt angen gwneuthurwyr offer, gweithredwyr peiriannau, gweithredwyr rheoli turn rhifol cyfrifiadurol, ac ati, i gyflogi dau neu dri pherson ifanc a'u gweld

yn ennill profiad gwerthfawr ac yn dysgu'r sgiliau hynny.

Sadly, because that scheme could not get a guarantee of support from ELWa or the WDA, it had to close. Minister, you might think that that is small beer for that area, but the move really hurt the Severn valley community in mid Wales because it prevented skills coming through. Losing 10 apprentices a year in a small engineering economy is a lot. Losing manufacturing jobs in areas like this, where it is not unusual for the travel-to-work area to cover a radius of around 30 miles, is a huge body blow to the local economy. We then saw the development of a system where training providers were funded to decide what training they would provide and to then sell it to manufacturers in a market place.

Yn anffodus, oherwydd na allai'r cynllun hwnnw gael sicrwydd cymorth gan ELWa na WDA, bu'n rhaid iddo gau. Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn meddwl mai rhywbeth dibwys yw hynny i'r ardal honno, ond niweidiwyd cymuned dyffryn Hafren yn y canolbarth yn fawr gan y cam oherwydd yr oedd yn atal y broses o feithrin sgiliau. Mae colli 10 prentis y flwyddyn mewn economi beirianeg fach yn llawer. Mae colli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu mewn ardaloedd fel hyn, lle nad yw'n anarferol i'r ardal teithio-i'r-gwaith gwmpasu radiws o ryw 30 milltir, yn ergyd enfawr i'r economi leol. Wedyn gwelsom ddatblygu system lle câi darparwyr hyfforddiant eu hariannu i benderfynu pa hyfforddiant y byddent yn ei ddarparu ac yna i'w werthu i weithgynhyrchwyr mewn marchnadle.

What needs to be developed is the provision of demand-led training. What has that shared apprenticeship scheme, and many like it throughout Wales, been replaced with, particularly now that we have seen you bringing the WDA and ELWa into the Government? How do you intend to address the issue of demand-led training? How do you intend to interact with the private sector to find out what it wants? I would be very grateful if you were to address those points when you respond to this debate. I appreciate that it is early days, but you must have a strategy and a plan, and we would like to hear about it.

Yr hyn y mae angen ei ddatblygu yw darparu hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar y galw. Beth a roddwyd yn lle'r cynllun prentisiaeth a rennir, a nifer o gynlluniau tebyg ledled Cymru, yn enwedig gan eich bod yn awr wedi dod â WDA ac ELWA o dan adain y Llywodraeth? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar y galw? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu rhyngweithio â'r sector preifat i weld beth y mae arno ei angen? Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe byddech yn delio â'r pwyntiau hynny wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon. Cydnabyddaf mai megis dechrau yr ydym, ond rhaid bod gennych strategaeth a chynllun, a hoffem glywed amdanynt.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Diolchaf am y cyfle i gyfrannu i'r drafodaeth hon. Yr wyf yn hynod o falch ein bod wedi cael cyfle o'r diwedd i gael dadl ar y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu. Mae wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod tipyn o gonsensws bellach fod y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu mewn trafferthion difrifol. Efallai fod gwahaniaeth barn ynglŷn â phwy sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, ac ynghylch yr hyn y dylem ei wneud i geisio goresgyn y broblem, ond o leiaf y derbynir bod argyfwng yn y sector.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I am very pleased that we have at last had an opportunity to have a debate on the manufacturing industry. It has drawn attention to the fact that there is considerable consensus by now that the manufacturing industry is in dire straits. There may be a difference of opinion as to who is responsible for that, and about what we should do to try to overcome the problem, but at least it is accepted that the sector is in crisis.

Mae nifer o'r siaradwyr wedi tynnu sylw at

Many of the speakers have highlighted

bethau hynod o bwysig. Yn ei araith, soniodd Alun Ffred am yr angen i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd cwmnïau cynhenid, a chytunodd nifer o bobl eraill â hynny, fel Alun Cairns. Yr oedd Alun Ffred hefyd yn pwysleisio'r angen inni gael twf y tu allan i goridorau'r A55 a'r M4 ac, yn naturiol, cytunodd llawer o Aelodau o wahanol rannau o Gymru â hynny, yn enwedig lle'r oedd yn berthnasol i'w hetholaethau. Pwysleisiodd Alun Ffred hefyd—ac mae gennyf ddiddordeb personol yn hyn—yr angen i helpu'r diwydiannau prosesu bwyd mewn ardaloedd gwledig, gan eu bod wedi cael ergydion trwm eleni, gyda 500 o swyddi wedi eu colli yn y sector. Clywsom hefyd gan Mike German fod ffigurau cymharol gwerth ychwanegol crynswth Cymru wedi gwaethygu mewn perthynas â gweddill Prydain, bod allbwn cynhyrchu i lawr ac yn syrthio yn gynt yng Nghymru a bod tyfiant allforion yn llai.

Tynnodd nifer o Aelodau, gan gynnwys Alun Cairns, sylw at y nifer o swyddi sydd wedi'u colli yn y sector er 1999. Yn ei haraith, bu i Lynne Neagle wneud pwynt hynod o bwysig yr ydym oll yn ei dderbyn, sef ei bod yn anodd iawn ichi gael swydd newydd sydd yn taluystal wedi ichi golli swydd yn y sector hwn. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o hynny ar draws Cymru. Defnyddiodd Helen Mary Jones yr enghraifft o Lanelli fel rhywle lle y bu gostyngiad sylweddol yn nifer y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y sector dros y pedair blynedd rhwng 2000 a 2004.

Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni geisio dod i ryw fath o ddealltwriaeth ar draws y Siambr ynghylch sut y gallwn oresgyn y problemau dybryd hyn sy'n bodoli. Rhaid cyfaddef fy mod yn tueddu i gydymdeimlo â'r sylw a wnaed—nid wyf yn cofio gan bwy—fod y Gweinidog yn hapus i gysylltu'r Llywodraeth â llwyddiannau. Pan mae grant ar gael i'w roi i gwmmi, mae'r Gweinidog yn hapus i gael llun wedi'i dynnu ohono'n ysgwyd llaw gyda chynrychiolydd o'r cwmni. Fodd bynnag, os bydd cwmni yn mynd i'r wal, mae'n dweud, 'Nid yw hynny'n ddim byd i wneud â ni; mae'n ymwneud â phroblemau rhyngwladol—Tsieina ac India'. Yr ydym wedi clywed hwnnw sawl gwaith heddiw.

Nid oes gennyf broblem gyda'r Llywodraeth

extremely important points. In his speech Alun Ffred referred to the need to emphasise the importance of indigenous companies, and several others agreed with that, such as Alun Cairns. Alun Ffred Jones also emphasised the need to secure growth outside the A55 and M4 corridors, and, naturally, several Members from various parts of Wales concurred with that, especially where it was relevant to their constituencies. Alun Ffred also emphasised—and I have a personal interest in this—the need to assist the food processing industries in rural areas, as they have received exceptionally heavy blows this year, with 500 jobs lost in the sector. We also heard from Mike German how Wales's comparative gross added value figures have worsened compared with the rest of Britain, that production output is down and is decreasing more rapidly in Wales, and that export growth is less.

Many Members, including Alun Cairns, drew attention to the number of jobs that have been lost in the sector since 1999. In her speech, Lynne Neagle made a very important point, which we all accept, that it is exceptionally difficult to find a new job that pays as well once you have lost a job in this sector. We are aware of that throughout Wales. Helen Mary Jones used Llanelli as an example of an area where there has been a sharp decline in the number of people working in the sector in the four years between 2000 and 2004.

However, we must try to reach some kind of understanding in the Chamber as to how we overcome some of the serious problems that exist. I must admit that I tend to sympathise with a comment made—I cannot remember by whom—that the Minister is happy to associate the Government with successes. When a grant is available to be awarded to a company, the Minister is happy to have his photograph taken shaking the hand of a representative of the company. However, if a company goes to the wall, he says, 'That has nothing to do with us; it is because of international problems—China and India'. We have heard that repeatedly today.

I do not have any problem with the

yn derbyn clod os yw'n rhoi grant i gwmni, ond mae cyfrifoldeb arni hefyd i ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb pan mae pethau yn mynd o'i le. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod 72,000 o swyddi wedi'u colli yng Nghymru er 1997. Derbyniwn fod swyddi newydd wedi'u creu, ond rhaid cofio y bu'n anodd iawn creu swyddi o'r un ansawdd, cyflog a sylwedd yn y sector ers hynny.

We need to look for specific responses. I think that it was Jeff Cuthbert who challenged one opposition Member—not from my party, as it happens—asking, 'What would you do differently?'. We have made a number of suggestions. We have asked why, for example, we cannot have different tax rates—corporation tax, for example—in places like the Objective 1 areas. Why does the Government not consider that particular proposal? What about helping companies with business rates in those areas that are badly hit by job losses? Imaginative suggestions like those of the sorts of things that we could do to help those industries are not currently being considered.

I put another point to the Minister. A lot of the companies that have been hit in the food sector in rural Wales would ask the Government to think again on some of the regulations in relation to taking away waste material from those plants. Those are the kinds of things that we ought to be looking at in the context of this debate. I hope that, when the Minister responds, he is prepared to take some responsibility for the things that have happened in recent years.

5.20 p.m.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** It is clear that recent announcements confirm the scale of the challenges facing our manufacturing sector, but those changes are not just being made in Wales. In fact, across the whole of the advanced industrial world, particularly in other parts of the United Kingdom, there has been a significant fall in manufacturing employment.

Government being praised if it awards a grant to a company, but it is also duty bound to shoulder the responsibility when things go wrong. We must accept that 72,000 jobs have been lost in Wales since 1997. We accept that new jobs have been created, but we must not forget that it has been exceptionally difficult to create jobs of the same standard, salary and substance in the sector since then.

Mae angen inni chwilio am ymatebion penodol. Credaf mai Jeff Cuthbert a heriodd un Aelod o'r gwrthbleidiau—nid o'm plaid i, fel mae'n digwydd—drwy ofyn, 'Beth fydddech chi'n ei wneud yn wahanol?'. Yr ydym wedi gwneud nifer o awgrymiadau. Yr ydym wedi gofyn pam, er enghraifft, na allwn gael cyfraddau treth gwahanol—treth gorfforaeth, er enghraifft—mewn lleoedd fel ardaloedd Amcan 1. Pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn ystyried y cynnig penodol hwnnw? Beth am helpu cwmnïau gyda threthi busnes yn yr ardaloedd hynny y mae colli swyddi'n effeithio'n wael arnynt? Nid yw awgrymiadau llawn dychymyg, fel rhai sy'n sôn am y mathau o bethau y gallem eu gwneud i helpu'r diwydiannau hynny, yn cael eu hystyried ar hyn o bryd.

Gofynnaf gwestiwn arall i'r Gweinidog. Byddai nifer o'r cwmnïau yr effeithiwyd arnynt yn y sector bwyd yng Nghymru wledig yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ailfeddwl am rai o'r rheoliadau mewn perthynas â gwaredu deunydd gwastraff o'r gweithfeydd hynny. Dyna'r mathau o bethau y dylem fod yn eu hystyried yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog, wrth ymateb, yn barod i gymryd rhywfaint o'r cyfrifoldeb am y pethau sydd wedi digwydd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Mae'n amlwg bod cyhoeddiadau'n ddiweddar yn cadarnhau maint yr heriau sy'n wynebu ein sector gweithgynhyrchu, ond nid yng Nghymru yn unig y mae'r newidiadau hynny'n cael eu gwneud. A dweud y gwir, ar draws y byd diwydiannol datblygedig, yn arbennig mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, bu gostyngiad sylweddol mewn swyddi gweithgynhyrchu.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Andrew Davies:** No. The statistics that have been quoted are very selective—

**Alun Cairns:** Give way.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. He has said only one sentence and I do not know how on earth one can intervene.

**Andrew Davies:** The quoting of statistics has been very selective, as Alun Cairns has admitted in committee before. From the time when the Assembly was set up, or just after that—from December 1999 until December 2005—the number of manufacturing jobs in Wales declined by 17 per cent, which is a significant fall. However, that compares with a decline of 23 per cent over the whole of the UK in the same period. If you look on a regional basis, you will see that Wales had the smallest percentage decline during this period out of any of the nations and regions of the United Kingdom. Similarly, as in the figures that I quoted on gross domestic household income, average weekly earnings and GVA per capita, Wales has outperformed most parts of the United Kingdom; in fact, only the east of England has performed better. On exports, there were again selective quotes from some opposition Members but, if you look over the longer term, you will see that Wales has exceeded the export growth of the rest of the United Kingdom at nearly 34 per cent as opposed to just over 25 per cent.

That, however, is not to deny that we face significant challenges. Some of the questions that have been raised with me today are about, for example, what Government, business and the public sector can do for manufacturing as well as the wider economy. There are challenges about demand-led business support, including skills training. That is exactly what we are doing; that is exactly what the merger with the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board and Education and Learning Wales will do. Whereas before, they offered supplier-led business support—the public sector trying to second-guess what the private

**Alun Cairns:** A ildiwch?

**Andrew Davies:** Na wnaf. Mae'r ystadegau a ddyfynnwyd yn rhai dewisol iawn—

**Alun Cairns:** Ildiwch.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dim ond un frawddeg y mae wedi ei dweud ac ni wn sut yn y byd y gall rhywun ymyrryd.

**Andrew Davies:** Mae'r ystadegau wedi eu dyfynnu'n ddewisol iawn, fel y cyfaddefodd Alun Cairns yn y pwyllgor o'r blaen. O'r adeg pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad, neu ychydig wedi hynny—o fis Rhagfyr 1999 tan fis Rhagfyr 2005—gostyngodd nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru 17 y cant, sy'n ostyngiad sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n cymharu â gostyngiad o 23 y cant ledled y DU yn yr un cyfnod. Os edrychwch ar sail ranbarthol, fe welwch mai yng Nghymru y bu'r gostyngiad canrannol lleiaf yn ystod y cyfnod hwn o blith holl wledydd a rhanbarthau'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yn yr un modd, fel yn y ffigurau a ddyfynnais ar incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario, enillion wythnosol cyfartalog a GYC y pen, mae Cymru wedi gwneud yn well na'r rhan fwyaf o rannau'r Deyrnas Unedig; a dweud y gwir, dim ond dwyrain Lloegr sydd wedi gwneud yn well. O ran allforion, unwaith eto cafwyd dyfyniadau dewisol gan rai o Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, ond os edrychwch dros y tymor hwy, fe welwch fod Cymru wedi rhagori ar dwf allforion gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig bron 34 y cant o'i gymharu ag ychydig dros 25 y cant.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n gwadu ein bod yn wynebu heriau sylweddol. Mae a wnelo rhai o'r cwestiynau a godwyd gyda mi heddiw, er enghraifft, â'r hyn y gall Llywodraeth, busnes a'r sector cyhoeddus ei wneud dros weithgynhyrchu yn ogystal â thros yr economi ehangach. Mae yna heriau ynglŷn â chymorth busnes sy'n cael ei arwain gan y galw, gan gynnwys hyfforddiant sgiliau. Dyna'n union yr ydym yn ei wneud; dyna'n union y bydd yr uno ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru yn ei wneud. Yr oeddent gynt yn cynnig cymorth busnes yn cael ei arwain gan y cyflenwr—a'r sector

sector and particularly companies in the manufacturing sector needed—now, business support will be streamlined precisely around the needs of business. That was a clear message that came out of the consultation and the nearly 100 meetings that I have had with the business community since the First Minister announced the merger.

**Lisa Francis:** I am glad that you acknowledge that that is the challenge that lies ahead, following the merger. Can you outline what the strategy is to create that demand-led skills agenda?

**Andrew Davies:** It is working with the manufacturing industry and the sectoral fora, where they exist, as I outlined in my opening remarks. It is also working with the specific sector skills councils to identify the needs of those sectors, and my ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson, and I are now working together to deliver on that.

Several questions have been raised about what we, as a Government, are doing. On procurement, I quite agree with you. The public sector procurement of goods and services is significant. We acknowledge that, which is precisely why I set up the business procurement taskforce, which I chair. We are now creating a more level playing field for small companies to have access to public sector goods and services.

The account management system that used to exist in the public sector was not as good as it could have been. A review is being undertaken by the north Wales director of my department, Vanessa Griffiths, looking at this precise issue, to see how we can get more effective account management.

In response to Mike German's question about advance information I say that, yes, we have good relationships with companies such as Continental Teves. However, if the local management team is negotiating with its German parent company, and those negotiations are confidential, it is entirely a matter for them to decide when they divulge the results of those discussions with us. When I met him yesterday, Tom Whyatt

cyhoeddus yn ceisio rhag-weld yr hyn yr oedd ei angen ar y sector preifat a chwmnïau penodol yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu. Yn awr caiff cymorth busnes ei symleiddio'n union o amgylch anghenion busnesau. Dyna oedd y neges glir a ddeilliodd o'r ymgynghori, ac o ryw 100 o gyfarfodydd a gefais gyda'r gymuned fusnes ers i'r Prif Weinidog gyhoeddi'r uno.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf yn falch ichi gydnabod mai dyna'r her sy'n eich wynebu, yn dilyn yr uno. A allwch amlinellu beth yw'r strategaeth ar gyfer creu'r agenda sgiliau honno sy'n cael ei harwain gan y galw?

**Andrew Davies:** Gweithio gyda'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a'r fforymau sectoraidd, lle maent yn bodoli, yw hynny, fel yr amlinellais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol. Mae hefyd yn golygu gweithio gyda'r cynghorau sgiliau sector penodol i nodi anghenion y sectorau hynny, ac mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson, a minnau yn awr yn gweithio gyda'n gilydd i gyflawni hynny.

Codwyd nifer o gwestiynau am yr hyn yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, yn ei wneud. O ran caffael, cytunaf â chi. Mae caffael nwyddau a gwasanaethau yn y sector cyhoeddus yn bwysig. Cydnabyddwn hynny, a dyna'n union pam y sefydlais y tasglu caffael busnes yr wyf yn ei gadeirio. Yr ydym bellach yn sicrhau tegwch fel y gall cwmnïau bach gael gafael ar nwyddau a gwasanaethau yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Nid oedd y system rheoli cyfrifon a arferai fodoli yn y sector cyhoeddus cystal ag y gallai fod. Cynhelir adolygiad gan Vanesa Griffiths, gyfarwyddwraig y gogledd yn fy hadran i, sy'n ystyried yr union fater hwn, i weld sut y gallwn gael rheolaeth cyfrifon fwy effeithiol.

I ymateb i gwestiwn Mike German am wybodaeth ymlaen llaw dywedaf hyn. Oes, mae gennym berthynas dda â chwmnïau megis Continental Teves. Fodd bynnag, os yw'r tîm rheoli lleol yn negodi gyda'i riant-gwmni yn yr Almaen, a'r negodiadau hynny'n gyfrinachol, eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw penderfynu pryd i ddatgelu canlyniadau'r trafodaethau hynny i ni. Pan gyfarfûm â Tom Whyatt ddoe, yr oedd yn llawn canmoliaeth

could not have been more fulsome in his praise of the support that he has had from us as a Government and from the public sector generally, and he acknowledges that there is nothing more that we could have done.

In terms of when redundancies are made, I know that the Conservative Party does not like being reminded of this fact, but, from 1979 to 1997, some 360,000 manufacturing jobs were lost in Wales. The Tory Government closed down the Welsh mining industry. It decimated swathes of the manufacturing industry, so I will not take any lessons from the Tories on that.

**Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**Andrew Davies:** When Corus announced thousands of redundancies in Wales, this Labour Government put in place a rapid response to those redundancies.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Member give way?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is not giving way.

**Alun Cairns:** He is chicken.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Andrew Davies:** I am not taking any lectures from the Tories. When Corus announced its redundancies, by the time they came into effect, only 120 former Corus employees were actually unemployed, because we were proactive in dealing with those redundancies. When Dewhirst closed its manufacturing base in Wales, this Government and I responded to the needs of those workers in Swansea, Cardigan and Fishguard. What happened in Wales from 1979 to 1997 was that Welsh workers were told either to get on their bike or that their unemployment was a price worth paying. This Government believes in manufacturing; we are putting our money where our mouth is, unlike the opposition, which can only talk it down.

wrth sôn am y gefnogaeth a gafodd gennym ni fel Llywodraeth a chan y sector cyhoeddus yn gyffredinol, ac mae'n cydnabod nad oes rhagor y gallem fod wedi ei wneud.

O ran pan fydd diswyddiadau, gwn nad yw'r Blaid Geidwadol yn hoffi cael ei hatgoffa o'r ffaith hon, ond o 1979 i 1997 collwyd tua 360,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Caeodd y Llywodraeth Dori'aid y diwydiant glo yng Nghymru. Dinistriodd rannau helaeth o'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, felly, ni dderbyniaf unrhyw feirniadaeth ar hynny gan y Toriaid.

**Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**Andrew Davies:** Pan gyhoeddodd Corus fod miloedd o bobl yn colli eu swyddi yng Nghymru, ymatebodd y Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn gyflym i'r diswyddiadau hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn ildio.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n llwfr.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Andrew Davies:** Ni dderbyniaf unrhyw feirniadaeth gan y Toriaid. Pan gyhoeddodd Corus ei ddiswyddiadau, erbyn iddynt ddod i rym dim ond 120 o gyn-gyflogeion Corus a oedd yn ddi-waith mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd buom yn brysur yn delio â'r diswyddiadau hynny. Pan gaeodd Dewhirst ei ganolfan weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, ymatebodd y Llywodraeth hon a minnau i anghenion y gweithwyr hynny yn Abertawe, Aberteifi ac Abergwaun. Yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yng Nghymru o 1979 i 1997 oedd bod gweithwyr Cymru wedi cael gorchymyn i fynd ar eu beic neu bod eu diweithdra yn bris gwerth ei dalu. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn credu mewn gweithgynhyrchu; yr ydym yn ategu'r hyn a ddywedwn ag arian, yn wahanol i'r gwrthbleidiau na allant wneud dim ond ei feirniadu.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun



Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 5, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 35.  
Amendment 3: For 5, Abstain 10, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.  
Amendment 4: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 5: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 6: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 7: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary

Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

5.30 p.m.

Motion (NDM3041): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3041): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the increasing strength of competition within the manufacturing sector globally;*

*1. yn nodi cryfder cynyddol y gystadleuaeth yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu yn fyd-eang;*

*2. recognises the continuing need for the manufacturing sector in Wales to position itself to take advantage of the global situation;*

*2. yn cydnabod yr angen parhaus i'r sector gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru roi ei hun mewn sefyllfa i fanteisio ar y sefyllfa fyd-eang;*

*3. endorses the need for continued public sector support for the sector in Wales.*

*3. yn cadarnhau'r angen i roi cefnogaeth barhaus y sector cyhoeddus i'r sector yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig (NDM3041): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM3041): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Estyn—Adroddiad Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant  
 Estyn—the Report of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training**

Motion (NDM3042): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3042): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the annual report of Her Majesty’s  
 Chief Inspector of Education and Training;*

*1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol Prif  
 Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ei  
 Mawrhydi;*

*2. the chief inspector’s view that standards  
 are improving in many areas of education  
 and training;*

*2. barn y prif arolygydd bod safonau’n  
 gwella mewn nifer o feysydd addysg a  
 hyfforddiant;*

3. *the action being taken though our distinctive agenda for Wales, 'The Learning Country', to break down barriers to learning and address the areas for improvement identified by the chief inspector.*

3. *y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd drwy ein hagenda unigryw ar gyfer Cymru, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', i chwalu'r rhwystrau i ddysgu a rhoi sylw i'r meysydd ar gyfer gwella a nodwyd gan y prif arolygydd.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*instructs the Assembly Government to direct funding towards reducing the number of children not in education, training or employment.*

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyfeirio cyllid tuag at leihau nifer y plant nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the number of children leaving school with inadequate literacy, numeracy and social interaction skills.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder nifer y plant sy'n gadael yr ysgol gyda sgiliau llythrennedd, rhifedd a rhyngweithio cymdeithasol annigonol.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the inspectors' observations that 30 per cent of learners were absent from the lessons assessed and the lack of effective strategies to help learners keep up their attendance.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder sylwadau arolygwyr bod 30 y cant o ddysgwyr yn absennol o'r gwersi a aseswyd a diffyg strategaethau effeithiol i helpu dysgwyr i fod yn bresennol yn gyson.*

Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the failure to address education issues relating to the youth justice system.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder y methiant i roi sylw i faterion addysg sy'n ymwneud â'r system cyfiawnder ieuencid.*

Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*instructs the Assembly Government to address the 0 per cent growth in real terms in further education spending.*

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi sylw i'r twf gwirioneddol o 0 y cant yn y gwariant ar addysg bellach.*

Amendment 6 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 6 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the failure to meet Assembly Government set examination targets in secondary schools and colleges.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder na lwyddwyd i gyflawni'r targedau arholiadau a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn ysgolion uwchradd a cholegau.*

Amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern that schools in deprived areas in England outperform schools in such areas in Wales.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder bod perfformiad ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn Lloegr yn well na pherfformiad ysgolion mewn ardaloedd tebyg yng Nghymru.*

Amendment 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes the concern expressed by Estyn of the condition of school buildings and the lack of co-ordination in planning their maintenance and repair.*

*yn nodi'r pryder a fynegwyd gan Estyn ynghylch cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion a diffyg cydlynid wrth gynllunio'r gwaith o'u cynnal a'u cadw a'u hatgyweirio.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the limited effect of community consortia for education and training and 14-19 networks and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to provide these partnerships with the resources and powers to bring about change.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder effaith gyfyngedig consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant a rhwydweithiau 14-19 ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi i'r partneriaethau hyn yr adnoddau a'r pwerau ar gyfer sicrhau newid.*

Amendment 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve provision for learning for young people with mental health problems.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella'r ddarpariaeth ddysgu ar gyfer pobl ifanc gyda phroblemau iechyd meddwl.*

Amendment 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*recognises the need for local education authorities to address the lack of provision of full-time education for excluded pupils in Wales.*

*yn cydnabod yr angen i awdurdodau addysg lleol roi sylw i'r diffyg yn yr addysg amser llawn a ddarperir ar gyfer disgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd yng Nghymru.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 8, 9, 10 a 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Before I call the Minister, I require the help of Plenary. We have voted to end this particular item before going on to the short debate at 6 p.m. Six or seven Members have indicated that they wish to speak, therefore I ask everyone to be as succinct as possible, including the Minister—although I cannot

Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog, mae angen cymorth y Cyfarfod Llawn arnaf. Yr ydym wedi pleidleisio dros orffen yr eitem benodol hon cyn symud ymlaen i'r ddafl fer am 6 p.m. Mae chwech neu saith Aelod wedi dangos eu bod am siarad, felly, gofynnaf i bawb fod mor gryno â phosibl, gan gynnwys

stop anyone from taking five or 15 minutes—so that we can get in at least one Member from each party.

**Glyn Davies:** Point of order. Is it in order for me to postpone my short debate at this stage of the proceedings?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We should do it when we come to that item. I will take further advice, but we should not waste any time. We will start the debate, and I call the Minister to propose the motion.

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I propose that:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. notes the annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training;

2. the chief inspector's view that standards are improving in many areas of education and training;

3. the action being taken though our distinctive agenda for Wales, 'The Learning Country', to break down barriers to learning and address the areas for improvement identified by the chief inspector. (NDM3042)

I am pleased to speak on the chief inspector's report today, and I am delighted to welcome her and her team; they are in the public gallery. I express my thanks to her and her team for their contribution to Wales's evidence-based debate.

To take a quick canter through the report, we are extremely pleased to see that standards in schools are rising. The percentage of lessons where the standard achieved by pupils received the top two inspection grades has increased by 30 percentage points in the primary sector, and by 16 percentage points in the secondary sector since 1999. Behaviour is assessed as good in almost all primary schools and 83 per cent of secondary schools, and the quality of teaching continues to improve year on year. That is a tribute to our teaching profession.

y Gweinidog—er na allaf atal neb rhag cymryd pump neu 15 munud—er mwyn sicrhau y gall o leiaf un Aelod o bob plaid siarad.

**Glyn Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. A yw mewn trefn imi ohirio fy nadl fer ar yr adeg hon yn y trafodion?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dylem wneud hynny pan gyrhaeddwn yr eitem honno. Ceisiaf gael cyngor pellach, ond ni ddylem wastraffu amser. Cawn ddechrau'r ddadl, a galwaf ar y Gweinidog i gynnig y cynnig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ei Mawrhydi;

2. barn y prif arolygydd bod safonau'n gwella mewn nifer o feysydd addysg a hyfforddiant;

3. y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd drwy ein hagenda unigryw ar gyfer Cymru, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', i chwalu'r rhwystrau i ddysgu a rhoi sylw i'r meysydd ar gyfer gwella a nodwyd gan y prif arolygydd. (NDM3042)

Yr wyf yn falch cael siarad am adroddiad y prif arolygydd heddiw, ac mae'n bleser gennyf ei chroesawu hi a'i thîm; maent yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Diolch iddi hi a'i thîm am eu cyfraniad i ddadl Cymru yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth.

O edrych yn gyflym drwy'r adroddiad, yr ydym yn falch iawn gweld bod safonau mewn ysgolion yn gwella. Mae canran y gwersi, lle y cafodd y safon a gyrhaeddwyd gan y disgyblion y ddwy radd arolygu uchaf, wedi codi 30 o bwyntiau canrannol yn y sector cynradd, ac 16 pwynt canrannol yn y sector uwchradd er 1999. Asesir bod ymddygiad yn dda ym mhob ysgol gynradd bron ac mewn 83 y cant o ysgolion uwchradd, ac mae ansawdd yr addysgu'n dal i wella o flwyddyn i flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n deyrnged i'n hathrawon.



However, some real challenges are also laid out in the report, such as improving the achievement of boys, and I have asked Estyn in its remit for this year to look at the issue, particularly in terms of best practice. It is also a challenge to put the right arrangements for child protection in place, which is an issue that we looked at in Plenary yesterday and today, and we will look at the Estyn report again in committee. Addressing the links between social deprivation and pupil achievement is also an issue, and the evidence from the Joseph Rowntree Foundation and others demonstrates that it is not the individual pupil with a free school meal—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am sorry to interrupt, Minister, but I have a way forward that may help Plenary. If the Member who has the short debate wishes to propose a postponement, I can accept it under Standing Order 6.19(v). If that proposal is carried, this debate could go on until 6.30 p.m. without the constraints on time that exist at present.

Fodd bynnag, mae rhai heriau gwirioneddol hefyd wedi eu gosod allan yn yr adroddiad, fel gwella cyflawniad bechgyn, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i Estyn edrych ar y mater yn ei gylch gwaith am eleni, yn enwedig o ran arfer gorau. Mae rhoi'r trefniadau cywir ar waith i amddiffyn plant, mater a ystyriwyd gennym yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe a heddiw, hefyd yn her, a byddwn yn edrych ar adroddiad Estyn eto yn y pwyllgor. Mae mynd i'r afael â'r cysylltiadau rhwng amddifadedd cymdeithasol a chyflawniad disgyblion hefyd yn broblem, ac mae'r dystiolaeth gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree ac eraill yn dangos nad y disgybl unigol sy'n cael pryd bwyd ysgol am ddim—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar draws, Weinidog, ond mae gennyf ffordd ymlaen a allai helpu'r Cyfarfod Llawn. Os bydd yr Aelod sydd â'r ddadl fer am gynnig ei gohirio, gallaf dderbyn hynny o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.19(v). Os derbynnir y cynnig hwnnw, gallai'r ddadl hon barhau tan 6.30 p.m. heb y cyfyngiadau amser sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**Glyn Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order 6.19(v), postpones the short debate.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The postponement has been proposed, and so I will put it to the vote. If the short debate is postponed, the Estyn debate can continue until 6.30 p.m..

**Glyn Davies:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog 6.19(v), yn gohirio'r ddadl fer.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cynigiwyd gohirio'r ddadl fer, ac felly cynhaliad bleidlais. Os gohirir y ddadl fer, gall y ddadl ar Estyn barhau tan 6.30 p.m..

*Cynnig: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Idris Jones, Denise

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Estyn—Adroddiad Prif Arolygydd Ei Mawrhydi dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant:  
 Parhad  
 Estyn—the Report of Her Majesty’s Chief Inspector of Education and Training:  
 Continued**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** My urgings on timings for speakers no longer apply, including to the Minister, so please take up to 15 minutes if you wish.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid yw fy anogaeth am amser i siaradwyr yn berthnasol mwyach, gan gynnwys y Gweinidog, felly, cymerwch hyd at 15 munud os dymunwch.

**Jane Davidson:** As I was saying, in the report, Estyn mentioned the issue of disadvantage, and we reached an agreement earlier today on the new £16 million raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme. As other Members, particularly Lynne Neagle, have already said this afternoon, it is also about the new Flying Start programme, focusing on the most disadvantaged young people in our communities and being able to give them support throughout the education system.

**Jane Davidson:** Fel yr oeddwn yn ei ddweud, yn yr adroddiad soniai Estyn am anfantais, a daethom i gytundeb yn gynharach heddiw ar y rhaglen newydd ar gyfer codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru sy'n werth £16 miliwn. Fel y mae Aelodau eraill, yn arbennig Lynne Neagle, wedi ei ddweud eisoes y prynhawn yma, mae a wnelo hefyd â'r rhaglen newydd Dechrau'n Deg, gan ganolbwyntio ar y bobl ifanc fwyaf difreintiedig yn ein cymunedau, a gallu rhoi cymorth iddynt drwy'r system addysg yn gyfan.

It is of concern that the chief inspector notes that examination results at GCSE have improved only slightly since last year. Overall, the results maintain the improvements of 10 and 6 percentage points since 1996 in the percentage achieving at least five GCSEs at grades A\* to C and A\* to G, but the rate of increase has slowed down. Therefore, this Government has focused strongly on that and I am grateful to my colleague, Christine Chapman, for the work on 14-19 learning pathways. The action plan

Mae'n peri pryder bod y prif arolygydd yn nodi mai bach iawn fu'r gwelliant yng nghanlyniadau arholiadau TGAU ers y llynedd. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r canlyniadau'n parhau'r gwelliannau o 10 a 6 pwynt canrannol er 1996 yn y ganran sy'n cyflawni o leiaf pum TGAU gradd A\* i C ac A\* i G, ond mae cyfradd y cynnydd wedi arafu. Felly, mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi canolbwyntio'n gryf ar hynny, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'm cyd-Aelod, Christine Chapman, am y gwaith ar lwybrau dysgu 14-

and guidance have now been published, there is substantial extra funding in the budget, we are revising the curriculum to develop a more skills-based curriculum to be introduced from 2008, and we are introducing the Welsh baccalaureate. I am pleased to note the chief inspector's conclusion that the work of 14-19 networks and young people's partnerships have led to a better exchange of information and stronger links between providers, although we know, from other work that she has done, that we still have a way to go in getting the right kinds of collaboration between providers in the post-16 sector.

There is also a pretty strong message from the post-16 sector in general. Colleges have now passed the national target for 18 per cent of work to be grade 1 by 2007, the proportion of teaching with outstanding features and no important shortcomings is above 80 per cent, and the standards achieved by adults in community-based learning were good or better in 84 per cent of classes. However, there is another big issue, namely work-based learning. We have looked hard at this in committee. We know that a growing number of learners complete their NVQs before leaving training, but I am sure that we would all share the inspectorate's assessment that we must continue to improve the quality of provision in this area. Action is already in hand to address the key issues identified in her report. Failure to achieve a key skills qualification has been identified as a significant contributor to the lack of completion of frameworks. A £670,000 project is in place to support and train providers who deliver skills in a work-based context. We have increased the funding available for delivering basic skills in work-based settings. Arrangements have been put in place to review providers' performance and to drive up quality and standards where they are considered to be less than satisfactory, which will mean removing money from providers if they do not meet quality tests by 2008.

We will also provide support for those providers who need help to improve. In addition to ongoing support from learning

9. Mae'r cynllun gweithredu a'r canllawiau wedi'u cyhoeddi bellach, mae llawer o arian ychwanegol yn y gyllideb, yr ydym yn diwygio'r cwricwlwm i ddatblygu cwricwlwm sy'n fwy seiliedig ar sgiliau i'w gyflwyno o 2008, ac yr ydym yn cyflwyno bagloriaeth Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch sylwi ar gasgliad y prif arolygydd fod gwaith y rhwydweithiau 14-19 a'r partneriaethau pobl ifanc wedi arwain at well cyfnewid gwybodaeth a chysylltiadau cryfach rhwng darparwyr, er y gwyddom, o'r gwaith arall y mae wedi'i wneud, fod llawer gennym i'w wneud o hyd i gael y math cywir o gydweithredu rhwng darparwyr yn y sector ôl-16.

Daw neges eithaf cryf hefyd o'r sector ôl-16 yn gyffredinol. Mae colegau yn awr wedi rhagori ar y targed cenedlaethol o 18 y cant o waith i gael gradd 1 erbyn 2007, mae cyfran yr addysgu gyda nodweddion rhagorol a dim diffygion pwysig yn uwch na 80 y cant, ac yr oedd y safonau a gyflawnwyd gan oedolion ym maes dysgu yn y gymuned yn dda neu'n well mewn 84 y cant o ddsbarthiadau. Fodd bynnag, mae yna fater pwysig arall, sef dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith. Yr ydym wedi ystyried hyn yn fanwl yn y pwyllgor. Gwyddom fod nifer cynyddol o ddysgwyr yn cwblhau eu NVQ cyn gadael hyfforddiant, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno ag asesiad yr arolygiaeth ei bod yn rhaid inni barhau i wella ansawdd y ddarpariaeth yn y maes hwn. Mae camau'n cael eu cymryd eisoes i ymdrin â'r materion allweddol a nodir yn ei hadroddiad. Nodwyd bod methu ennill cymhwyster sgiliau allweddol yn un o'r ffactorau sylweddol sy'n cyfrannu at fethu â chwblhau fframweithiau. Mae prosiect gwerth £670,000 ar waith i gefnogi a hyfforddi darparwyr sy'n cyflwyno sgiliau mewn cyd-destun yn seiliedig ar waith. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r arian sydd ar gael i gyflwyno sgiliau sylfaenol yn y gweithle. Mae trefniadau wedi'u rhoi ar waith i adolygu perfformiad darparwyr, ac i wella ansawdd a safonau lle yr ystyrir nad ydynt yn foddhaol, a bydd hynny'n golygu cymryd arian oddi wrth ddarparwyr os na fyddant yn bodloni'r profion ansawdd erbyn 2008.

Byddwn hefyd yn rhoi cymorth i'r darparwyr hynny sydd ag angen help arnynt i wella. Yn ogystal â chymorth parhaus gan dimau

provision teams, performance improvement advisers are directed towards those providers who have been identified as having the greatest need of support. We are also working for the Skills for Business network, the new network of sector skills councils, to develop a combined apprenticeship route as part of the 14-19 learning pathways, and we have appointed Peter McGowan as a vocational skills champion to raise the profile of vocational skills and to identify the key barriers that are holding back the expansion of good-quality vocational learning.

Turning to the amendments tabled by Lisa Francis, the areas for improvement identified in the chief inspector's report have now been given detailed attention in the development of 'The Learning Country 2: Delivering the Promise', which sets out the good progress made to date, which the chief inspector acknowledges, and, in each sector, it provides details on the next steps to build on the achievements and to realise the agenda for action set out in 'The Learning Country'. As the key areas for improvement in the chief inspector's report are recognised and addressed in 'The Learning Country 2', I ask the Assembly to reject amendments 1 to 7.

On amendments 8 and 9 tabled by Kirsty Williams, 'The Learning Country 2' sets out our commitment to improve school buildings and to consider carefully, as part of the 14-19 action plan, the most effective format for collaborative working at the local level, which we would all want to see. I, therefore, ask the Assembly to reject both of those amendments.

While work is under way to develop guidance for schools, local education authorities and other partners on promoting the mental health and social wellbeing of pupils, this remains an important area that requires ongoing attention. In addition, we are currently seeking framework powers in the Education and Inspections Bill to provide a platform to develop policy and practice that is best suited to ensure that there is adequate educational provision for excluded pupils. These are key areas on which our approach is evolving. I would, therefore, ask the

darpariaeth dysgu, caiff cynghorwyr gwella perfformiad eu cyfeirio at y darparwyr hynny y nodwyd bod arnynt yr angen mwyaf am gymorth. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda'r rhwydwaith Sgiliau i Fusnes, y rhwydwaith newydd o gynghorau sgiliau sector, i ddatblygu llwybr prentisiaeth gyfunol fel rhan o'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19. Yr ydym wedi penodi Peter McGowan yn hyrwyddwr sgiliau galwedigaethol i godi proffil sgiliau galwedigaethol ac i nodi'r rhwystrau allweddol sy'n atal dysgu galwedigaethol da rhag ehangu.

I droi at y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Lisa Francis, mae'r meysydd a nodwyd ar gyfer eu gwella yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd bellach wedi cael sylw manwl wrth ddatblygu 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2: Cyflawni'r Addewid'. Mae hwn yn gosod allan y cynnydd da a wnaed hyd yma, ac mae'r prif arolygydd yn ei gydnabod. Ac ym mhob sector mae'n rhoi manylion am y camau nesaf i adeiladu ar y cyflawniadau a gwireddu'r agenda ar gyfer gweithredu sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'. Gan fod 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2' yn cydnabod y meysydd allweddol ar gyfer gwella yn adroddiad y prif arolygydd ac yn ymdrin â hwy, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod gwelliannau 1 i 7.

O ran gwelliannau 8 a 9 a gyflwynwyd gan Kirsty Williams, mae 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2' yn gosod allan ein hymrwymiad i wella adeiladau ysgolion ac i ystyried yn ofalus, fel rhan o'r cynllun gweithredu 14-19, y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i gydweithredu'n lleol, sy'n rhywbeth yr hoffai pob un ohonom ei weld. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad wrthod y ddau welliant hwnnw.

Er bod gwaith ar y gweill i ddatblygu canllawiau i ysgolion, awdurdodau addysg lleol a phartneriaid eraill ar hyrwyddo iechyd meddwl a lles cymdeithasol disgyblion, mae hwn yn dal yn faes pwysig sy'n gofyn am sylw parhaus. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wrthi'n ceisio cael pwerau fframwaith yn y Mesur Addysg ac Arolygiadau ar hyn o bryd i ddarparu llwyfan i ddatblygu polisi ac arfer sydd fwyaf addas i sicrhau bod darpariaeth addysgol ddigonol ar gyfer disgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd. Mae'r rhain yn feysydd allweddol lle y mae ein dull yn datblygu.

Assembly to support amendments 10 and 11. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gefnogi gwelliannau 10 ac 11.

5.40 p.m.

I am obviously pleased that the chief inspector's report confirms that the agenda set out in 'The Learning Country' remains relevant and current. I welcome the report, and the fact that there are major challenges that we need to respond to publicly. We also wish to pay tribute to the commitment and hard work of practitioners and managers across Wales who have contributed to the improvements in the standards achieved.

Mae'n amlwg fy mod yn falch bod adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn cadarnhau bod yr agenda sydd wedi ei gosod allan yn 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' yn dal yn berthnasol ac yn gyfredol. Croesawaf yr adroddiad, a'r ffaith fod heriau mawr y mae angen inni ymateb iddynt yn gyhoeddus. Hoffem roi teyrnged hefyd i ymrwymiad a gwaith caled ymarferwyr a rheolwyr ledled Cymru sydd wedi cyfrannu at y gwelliannau a gafwyd yn y safonau.

It is a challenging agenda and there is still much to do. 'The Learning Country 2' is out to consultation at the moment and it considers these specific issues. I commend the chief inspector's report to the Assembly and commend to Members the Government's motion, amended by amendments 10 and 11.

Mae'n agenda heriol ac erys llawer i'w wneud. Mae ymgynghori ar 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2' yn mynd yn ei flaen ar hyn o bryd ac mae'n ystyried y materion penodol hyn. Cymeradwyaf adroddiad y prif arolygydd i'r Cynulliad a chymeradwyaf gynnig y Llywodraeth i'r Aelodau, wedi'i ddiwygio gan welliannau 10 ac 11.

**William Graham:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

**William Graham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*instructs the Assembly Government to direct funding towards reducing the number of children not in education, training or employment.*

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyfeirio cyllid tuag at leihau nifer y plant nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the number of children leaving school with inadequate literacy, numeracy and social interaction skills.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder nifer y plant sy'n gadael yr ysgol gyda sgiliau llythrennedd, rhifedd a rhyngweithio cymdeithasol annigonol.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the inspectors' observations that 30 per cent of learners were absent from the lessons assessed and the lack of effective strategies to help learners keep up their attendance.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder sylwadau arolygwyr bod 30 y cant o ddysgwyr yn absennol o'r gwersi a aseswyd a diffyg strategaethau effeithiol i helpu dysgwyr i fod yn bresennol yn gyson.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the failure to address education issues relating to the youth justice system.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*instructs the Assembly Government to address the 0 per cent growth in real terms in further education spending.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern the failure to meet Assembly Government set examination targets in secondary schools and colleges.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern that schools in deprived areas in England outperform schools in such areas in Wales.*

I acknowledge the report as being thorough and comprehensive. I also acknowledge that the new inspection arrangements incorporate a common structure for inspecting the education and training of learners of all ages. The report highlights many continuing improvements across all levels of education throughout Wales, and I wholly endorse the Minister's rightful praise of the profession. It also highlights many of the continuing issues that face our schools and colleges. The motion that we consider today links this report with 'The Learning Country', which is described by the Labour Assembly Government as a distinctive agenda for Wales. However, the chief inspector's report clearly indicates that this agenda is not working properly. The Government has set out its target aspirations, but, as is the case with so many of its targets, including its manifesto promises, they are incapable of fruition.

All aspects of education in Wales face many problems, which range from declining pupil numbers to the fact that unprecedented numbers of teachers in Welsh schools are

*yn nodi gyda phryder y methiant i roi sylw i faterion addysg sy'n ymwneud â'r system cyfiawnder ieuenctid.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi sylw i'r twf gwirioneddol o 0 y cant yn y gwariant ar addysg bellach.*

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder na lwyddwyd i gyflawni'r targedau arholiadau a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad mewn ysgolion uwchradd a cholegau.*

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder bod perfformiad ysgolion mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig yn Lloegr yn well na pherfformiad ysgolion mewn ardaloedd tebyg yng Nghymru.*

Cydnabyddaf fod yr adroddiad yn drylwyr ac yn gynhwysfawr. Cydnabyddaf hefyd fod y trefniadau arolygu newydd yn cynnwys strwythur cyffredin ar gyfer arolygu addysg a hyfforddiant dysgwyr o bob oed. Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at nifer o welliannau parhaus ar draws pob lefel mewn addysg ledled Cymru, a chymeradwyaf yn llwyr y ffaith fod y Gweinidog yn canmol y proffesiwn, sy'n gwbl gywir. Mae hefyd yn tynnu sylw at nifer o'r problemau parhaus y mae ein hysgolion a'n colegau yn eu hwynebu. Mae'r cynnig a ystyriwn heddiw yn cysylltu'r adroddiad hwn â 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', a ddisgrifir gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad fel agenda unigryw ar gyfer Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae adroddiad y prif arolygydd yn dangos yn glir nad yw'r agenda hon yn gweithio'n iawn. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gosod allan ei dyheadau o ran targedau, ond fel sy'n wir gyda chynifer o'i thargedau, gan gynnwys ei haddewidion maniffesto, ni allant gael eu gwireddu.

Mae pob agwedd ar addysg yng Nghymru yn wynebu nifer o broblemau, yn amrywio o niferoedd disgyblion sy'n lleihau i'r ffaith fod niferoedd digyffelyb o athrawon mewn

approaching their retirement while trying to adapt to meet the wider requirements expected of teachers and schools. The amendments tabled by the Welsh Conservative group highlight the urgent issues that we need to face to ensure, as the chief inspector says, that education and training fulfil a vital role in making a difference to the lives and future of individuals and communities in Wales.

As is the case with every problem that the Government faces, it hides behind the fact that it is spending more on the services that it provides. It appears to be blinded by the size of the pound sign and blind to growing inefficiencies. Education funding is confined within the straitjacket of historical spending patterns. Its progress is restricted by the fact that schools are compared with other local schools rather than with the best schools. Let us be bold in Wales and aim for the best.

The report outlines progress but highlights that almost every step forward is accompanied by a step backwards. I will give a few examples. The report states that national curriculum assessment results at key stage 3 remained static in mathematics and had declined in science. It also states:

‘Pupils’ examination results at GCSE in key stage 4 improved only slightly since last year and it does not look as though pupils will be able to achieve any of the Welsh Assembly Government’s ambitious targets by 2007.’

It is noted in the report that, for secondary school pupils, key skills had not changed since last year, and that information and communication technology skills had not improved and remained weak in almost half of the secondary schools inspected. The chief inspector states that secondary schools still have a long way to go to meet the Government’s target of reducing absenteeism to below 7 per cent by 2007, and that 80 per cent of secondary schools have failed to

ysgolion yng Nghymru yn agosáu at oed ymdeol gan geisio ymaddasu i fodloni’r gofynion ehangach a ddisgwylir gan athrawon ac ysgolion. Mae’r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn tynnu sylw at y materion brys y mae angen inni eu hwynebu i sicrhau, fel y dywed y prif arolygydd, fod addysg a hyfforddiant yn cyflawni rôl hanfodol wrth wneud gwahaniaeth i fywydau a dyfodol unigolion a chymunedau yng Nghymru.

Fel sy’n wir gyda phob problem sy’n wynebu’r Llywodraeth, mae’n cuddio y tu ôl i’r ffaith ei bod yn gwario mwy ar y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddi. Ymddengys ei bod wedi’i dallu gan yr arian dan sylw ac nad yw’n gweld yr aneffeithlonrwydd cynyddol. Mae’r arian a roddir i addysg wedi’i gyfyngu gan batrymau gwario hanesyddol. Cyfyngir ar ei chynnydd oherwydd y ffaith fod ysgolion yn cael eu cymharu ag ysgolion lleol eraill yn hytrach nag â’r ysgolion gorau. Gadewch inni fod yn eofn yng Nghymru ac anelu at y gorau.

Mae’r adroddiad yn amlinellu cynnydd ond yn tynnu sylw fod cam yn ôl yn digwydd ar ôl pob cam ymlaen. Dyma i chi rai enghreifftiau. Dywed yr adroddiad fod canlyniadau asesiadau’r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 wedi parhau yn eu hunfan mewn mathemateg ac wedi gostwng mewn gwyddoniaeth. Dywed hefyd:

‘Dim ond ychydig y mae canlyniadau arholiadau disgyblion wedi gwella mewn TGAU yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 ers y llynedd, ac nid yw’n debyg y bydd disgyblion yn gallu cyflawni unrhyw un o dargedau uchelgeisiol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru erbyn 2007.’

Dywedir yn yr adroddiad, ar gyfer disgyblion ysgolion uwchradd, nad oedd sgiliau allweddol wedi newid ers y llynedd, ac nad oedd sgiliau technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu wedi gwella a’u bod yn parhau’n wael yn hanner yr ysgolion uwchradd bron a arolygwyd. Dywed y prif arolygydd fod gan ysgolion uwchradd lawer i’w wneud eto i gyrraedd targed y Llywodraeth o ostwng absenoldeb i lai na 7 y cant erbyn 2007, a bod 80 y cant o ysgolion uwchradd wedi methu â

improve their pupils' attendance in recent years. She goes on to say:

'Work-based learning continues to be a cause of great concern. This is a serious issue given that many areas of Wales have difficulties in providing services for the health and care of young people, elderly people and vulnerable members of their communities.'

If we seek an education system that allows our children to achieve their highest potential by attaining academic and vocational qualifications, and provides the widest opportunities for lifelong learning within a safe environment, we need to address some fundamental issues.

The report notes that 10 per cent of all primary schools have shortcomings in terms of their arrangements for child protection because staff are not adequately trained in child-protection issues, or teachers are not clear about the procedures of their school or local authority. This issue requires all-party support for it to be immediately resolved.

The report also outlines how economic prosperity in Wales depends on people from all backgrounds being able to take part fully in employment and to contribute to building a better society. We must reduce the number of children leaving school with inadequate literacy, numeracy and social interaction skills. Seven per cent of young people in Wales leave school with no more than one GCSE qualification at grade C or its equivalent. This is compared with only 2.6 per cent in England.

There is a requirement to redirect funding towards reducing the number of children who are not in education, training or employment. Despite an increase of 52 per cent in spending on education in Wales, standards sadly remain the worst in the United Kingdom.

It is an amazing fact that, in Wales today, 28 per cent of adults struggle with reading and 32 per cent find basic mathematics difficult. We need to balance this against the comments made about work-based learning

gwella presenoldeb eu disgyblion yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae'n mynd ymlaen i ddweud:

'Mae dysgu yn y gweithle'n parhau i fod yn destun pryder mawr. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol o gofio bod llawer o ardaloedd yng Nghymru'n cael anawsterau o ran darparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer iechyd a gofal pobl ifanc, pobl oedrannus ac aelodau bregus o'r gymdeithas.'

Os ceisiwn gael system addysg sy'n galluogi ein plant i gyflawni eu potensial gorau drwy gyrraedd cymwysterau academiaidd a galwedigaethol, ac sy'n rhoi'r cyfleoedd ehangaf ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes mewn amgylchedd diogel, mae angen inni ymdrin â rhai materion sylfaenol.

Dywed yr adroddiad fod gan 10 y cant o ysgolion cynradd ddiffygion yn eu trefniadau amddiffyn plant am nad yw staff wedi'u hyfforddi'n ddigonol ym maes amddiffyn plant, neu am nad yw athrawon yn deall gweithdrefnau eu hysgol neu'r awdurdod lleol. Mae angen cefnogaeth pob plaid gyda'r broblem hon er mwyn ei datrys ar unwaith.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn amlinellu sut y mae ffyniant economaidd yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar allu pobl o bob cefndir i gymryd rhan lawn mewn cyflogaeth a chyfrannu at ddatblygu cymdeithas well. Rhaid inni leihau nifer y plant sy'n gadael yr ysgol gyda sgiliau llythrennedd, rhifedd a rhyngweithio cymdeithasol annigonol. Mae 7 y cant o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn gadael yr ysgol gyda dim mwy nag un cymhwyster TGAU gradd C neu gymhwyster cyfatebol. Mae hynny o'i gymharu â dim ond 2.6 y cant yn Lloegr.

Mae'n ofynnol ailgyfeirio cyllid i leihau nifer y plant nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu gyflogaeth. Er y cynnydd o 52 y cant mewn gwariant ar addysg yng Nghymru, ein safonau, yn anffodus, yw'r gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig o hyd.

Mae'r ffaith fod gan 28 y cant o oedolion anawsterau darllen a bod gan 32 y cant anawsterau mewn mathemateg sylfaenol yng Nghymru heddiw yn ffaith anghredadawy. Mae angen inni gydbwysu hyn yn erbyn y



and the care of young people. It was in work-based learning provision that inspectors observed that 30 per cent of learners were absent from the lessons being assessed. There is a lack of an effective strategy to help learners maintain their attendance. It is pointless for the Assembly Government to set targets if providers lack effective strategy guidance to deliver these targets.

When the Minister read the comments concerning accommodation in secondary schools not being outstanding, did she recall the days of previous Labour Governments, which, as the First Minister described in Plenary yesterday, commissioned the construction of trash-built schools in the 1960s?

There are major education issues relating to the youth justice system where the report identifies a lack of progress, especially with regard to young offenders who broke the law but were not taken into custody and who still do not attend full-time education or training. Consequently, they are unable to gain a recognised qualification that might help them to find employment, increasing the likelihood that they will reoffend. Of those in prison in Wales, 6 out of 10 are virtually illiterate and innumerate.

The Minister will try to convince people to leave it to her and that everything is all right. However, on closer scrutiny, the inspector reported that all is not as the Minister wishes us to believe. The amendments proposed by the Conservative group support the observations of the chief inspector and outline a way forward in delivering—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**William Graham:** I ask that the Minister looks again at the way in which we improve the quality of education in Wales.

**Peter Black:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 8: add a new point at the end of

sylwadau a wnaed am ddysgu'n seiliedig ar waith a gofalu am bobl ifanc. Yn y ddarpariaeth dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith y sylwodd arolygwyr fod 30 y cant o'r dysgwyr yn absennol o'r gwersi a oedd yn cael eu hasesu. Mae diffyg strategaeth effeithiol i helpu dysgwyr i gynnal eu lefelau presenoldeb. Nid oes diben i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad bennu targedau os nad oes gan ddarparwyr ganllawiau strategaeth effeithiol ar gyfer cyflawni'r targedau hyn.

Pan ddarllenodd y Gweinidog y sylwadau sy'n dweud nad yw adeiladau ac ystafelloedd mewn ysgolion uwchradd o safon eithriadol, a oedd yn cofio diwrnodau Llywodraethau Llafur blaenorol a gomisiynodd waith, fel y disgrifiodd y Prif Weinidog yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddoe, i adeiladu ysgolion o safon isel yn y 1960au?

Mae yna broblemau addysgol pwysig mewn perthynas â'r system cyfiawnder ieuencid, lle mae'r adroddiad yn nodi diffyg cynnydd, yn arbennig o ran troseddwr ifanc sydd wedi torri'r gyfraith ond na chymerwyd i'r ddalfa ac nad ydynt o hyd yn mynychu addysg neu hyfforddiant llawn amser. O ganlyniad, ni allant ennill cymhwyster cydnabyddedig a allai eu helpu i gael gwaith, sy'n cynyddu'r tebygolrwydd y byddant yn aildroseddu. O'r rheini sydd yn y carchar yng Nghymru, mae 6 o bob 10 fwy neu lai yn anllythrennog ac yn anrhifog.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ceisio darbwylllo pobl i adael llonydd iddi fwrw ati a bod popeth yn iawn. Fodd bynnag, o graffu'n agosach, dywedai'r arolygydd nad yw popeth fel y mae'r Gweinidog am inni ei gredu. Mae'r gwelliannau a gynigir gan y grŵp Ceidwadwyr yn ategu arsylwadau'r prif arolygydd ac yn amlinellu ffordd ymlaen wrth gyflwyno—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**William Graham:** Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried y ffordd y gallwn wella ansawdd addysg yng Nghymru.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 8: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y

the motion:

*notes the concern expressed by Estyn of the condition of school buildings and the lack of co-ordination in planning their maintenance and repair.*

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern the limited effect of community consortia for education and training and 14-19 networks and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to provide these partnerships with the resources and powers to bring about change.*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve provision for learning for young people with mental health problems.*

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the need for local education authorities to address the lack of provision of full-time education for excluded pupils in Wales.*

I welcome the Minister's acceptance of amendments 10 and 11. It is important, with regard to those two amendments in particular, that we take action to deal with those students and young people who have mental-health problems, and I am pleased that the Minister has acknowledged that there is more work to be done on that.

In terms of pupil referral units for those pupils who cannot attend school for health or other reasons, a quarter of students have an SEN statement, and at least two-thirds of local education authorities do not yet provide all excluded pupils with the full-time education to which they are entitled. There are a number of needs that are not being met, not least school places for excluded pupils. It is important that that is addressed. The issue of the large number of children with special educational needs who are excluded from school has been raised on a number of occasions, as has the need to try to get some

cynnig:

*yn nodi'r pryder a fynegwyd gan Estyn ynghylch cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion a diffyg cydlynad wrth gynllunio'r gwaith o'u cynnal a'u cadw a'u hatgyweirio.*

Cynigiad welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder effaith gyfyngedig consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant a rhwydweithiau 14-19 ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi i'r partneriaethau hyn yr adnoddau a'r pwerau ar gyfer sicrhau newid.*

Cynigiad welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella'r ddarpariaeth ddysgu ar gyfer pobl ifanc gyda phroblemau iechyd meddwl.*

Cynigiad welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod yr angen i awdurdodau addysg lleol roi sylw i'r diffyg yn yr addysg amser llawn a ddarperir ar gyfer disgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd yng Nghymru.*

Croesawaf y ffaith fod y Gweinidog yn derbyn gwelliannau 10 ac 11. Mae'n bwysig, o ystyried y ddau welliant hwnnw'n arbennig, inni weithredu i ymdrin â'r myfyrwyr a'r bobl ifanc hynny sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod bod mwy o waith i'w wneud ar hynny.

O ran unedau cyfeirio disgyblion ar gyfer y disgyblion hynny na allant fynychu'r ysgol am resymau iechyd neu resymau eraill, mae gan chwarter y myfyrwyr ddatganiad AAA, ac nid yw o leiaf dwy ran o dair o awdurdodau addysg lleol hyd yma yn darparu'r addysg amser llawn i bob disgybl wedi'i wahardd sydd â'r hawl i'w chael. Mae nifer o anghenion nad ydynt yn cael eu diwallu, yn arbennig o ran lleoedd ysgol i ddisgyblion sydd wedi'u gwahardd. Mae'n bwysig ymdrin â hynny. Mae problem y nifer fawr o blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig sy'n cael eu gwahardd o'r ysgol wedi ei

awareness among schools in particular about how that can be avoided. That is an issue that has been raised as part of our review on special educational needs, but also in terms of a number of sessions of evidence where that issue has been raised with the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee.

In terms of the other two amendments proposed by the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I feel that the amendment on school buildings is crucial. Estyn has expressed concern over the condition of school buildings and the lack of co-ordination in planning their maintenance and repair. That is reflected in our amendment. Although the Government continually notes the amount of money that is being put into school capital, the amount of money that is being spent by local education authorities underlines Estyn's point, that it is consistently less than that which the Government claims is being put in. That money is not being earmarked for school capital when it reaches local education authorities. We need to step up our game in terms of school buildings if we are to come anywhere near meeting the target that has been set by the Government, that all school buildings should be fit for purpose by 2010. I am very concerned that all those who have so far come before the Committee on School Funding—along with many who have come before the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee—have said that they do not believe that that target is attainable. We are waiting for the Minister to give us the figures from the local education authorities which were promised in July. Those figures will, no doubt, allow us to evaluate how achievable that target is.

5.50 p.m.

I think that it is appropriate that we continue to express our concern and note Estyn's concern that that target may not be met. I think that it is also appropriate that we continue to put on record the concerns of local education authorities, headteachers, parents, and the children and teachers who have to work in these buildings, that the condition of our school buildings is not acceptable. There are still far too many that

chodi droeon, felly hefyd yr angen i geisio cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth mewn hysgolion yn arbennig o'r ffordd y gellir osgoi sefyllfa felly. Mae hynny'n fater a godwyd fel rhan o'n hadolygiad o anghenion addysgol arbennig, ond hefyd o ran nifer o sesiynau tystiolaeth lle mae'r mater wedi ei godi gyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau.

O ran y ddau welliant arall a gynigiwyd gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, teimlaf fod y gwelliant ar adeiladau ysgolion yn hanfodol. Mynegodd Estyn bryder ynghylch cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion a'r diffyg cydlynw wrth gynllunio'u cynnal a'u cadw a'u hatgyweirio. Adlewyrchir hynny yn ein gwelliant. Er bod y Llywodraeth yn nodi'n gyson faint o arian sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi mewn cyfalaf ysgolion, mae'r swm sy'n cael ei wario gan awdurdodau addysg lleol yn ategu pwynt Estyn, sef ei fod yn gyson yn llai na'r swm y mae'r Llywodraeth yn honni ei fuddsoddi. Nid yw'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer cyfalaf ysgolion wrth iddo gyrraedd awdurdodau addysg lleol. Mae angen inni gymryd camau brys o ran adeiladau ysgolion os ydym i ddod yn agos at gyrraedd y targed sydd wedi ei osod gan y Llywodraeth, sef y dylai pob adeilad ysgol fod yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn fod pawb a ddaeth gerbron y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion hyd yn hyn—ynghyd â'r llu a ddaeth gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—wedi dweud nad ydynt yn credu y gellir cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Yr ydym yn aros i'r Gweinidog roi inni'r ffigurau gan yr awdurdodau addysg lleol a addawyd ym mis Gorffennaf. Bydd y ffigurau hynny, yn ddiau, yn caniatu inni fesur pa mor bosibl yw cyrraedd y targed hwnnw.

Credaf ei bod yn briodol inni barhau i ddatgan ein pryder a nodi pryder Estyn efallai na chyflawnir y targed hwnnw. Credaf ei bod hefyd yn briodol inni barhau i roi ar gofnod bryderon awdurdodau addysg lleol, penaethiaid, rhieni, a'r plant a'r athrawon sy'n gorfod gweithio yn yr adeiladau hyn, nad yw cyflwr adeiladau ein hysgolion yn dderbyniol. Mae llawer gormod ohonynt yn anaddas at y diben o hyd. Ni allwn weld

are not fit for purpose. We cannot see a way through, given the current level of resources for that particular point.

On amendment 9, the Minister has promised us a way forward on CCETs and 14-19 networks. This is still very much in limbo. We are still waiting for concrete proposals and we are still waiting to see how those partnerships will work on the ground. Again, I think that it is appropriate that we note the concern expressed by Estyn and others that those partnerships are still not working properly.

I am grateful to William for mentioning work-based learning, which continues to be a source of concern for the entire Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee. That is why the committee has spent a significant amount of time this year looking at work-based learning and how we can move forward on that. Estyn continues to raise that issue with us; I do not see any light at the end of the tunnel given that Estyn continues to flag up that concern. I accept that the Minister is doing everything that she can to raise that issue with the providers. Now that ELWa has been taken into the Welsh Assembly Government, I would hope that the Minister is able to focus her efforts much more closely in terms of raising standards among work-based learning providers, to ensure that the criticisms that Estyn has flagged up for a number of years can finally be addressed. The new, amalgamated Department for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills now has the opportunity to address that issue.

To briefly mention the funding of schools, we need to try to get more money out there. Headteachers are still raising that issue. Far too many teachers are being made redundant when there are issues around class sizes and investment in schools that should be addressed.

**Janet Ryder:** I add Plaid Cymru's congratulations to Susan Lewis and her team of inspectors for producing the report, and also to our teaching workforce. Without their

ffordd i ddatrys y sefyllfa, o ystyried lefel bresennol yr adnoddau a ddarperir ar gyfer y pwynt penodol hwnnw.

O ran gwelliant 9, mae'r Gweinidog wedi addo ffordd ymlaen inni ar Gonsortia Cymunedol dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant a rhwydweithiau 14-19. Mae'r mater wedi mynd yn angof i ryw raddau. Yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl cynigion pendant ac yn dal i ddisgwyl gweld sut y bydd y partneriaethau hynny'n gweithio ar lawr gwlad. Eto, credaf ei bod yn briodol inni nodi'r pryder a fynegwyd gan Estyn ac eraill nad yw'r partneriaethau hynny'n gweithio'n iawn o hyd.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i William am grybwyll dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, sy'n parhau'n destun pryder i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau cyfan. Dyna pam mae'r pwyllgor wedi treulio llawer iawn o amser eleni yn trafod dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith a sut y gallwn symud ymlaen ar hynny. Mae Estyn yn parhau i godi'r mater hwnnw gyda ni; ni welaf unrhyw oleuni ar ddiwedd y twnnel o gofio bod Estyn yn parhau i nodi'r pryder hwnnw. Derbyniaf fod y Gweinidog yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i godi'r mater hwnnw gyda'r darparwyr. Gan fod ELWa yn awr wedi dod yn rhan o Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, byddwn yn gobeithio y gallai'r Gweinidog ganolbwyntio ei hymdrechion lawer yn agosach o ran codi safonau ymhlith darparwyr dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, er mwyn sicrhau y gellir ymdrin o'r diwedd â'r beirniadaethau y mae Estyn wedi bod yn eu nodi ers llawer blwyddyn. Bellach mae gan yr Adran dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau newydd, unedig gyfle i ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw.

Gan sôn yn gyflym am ariannu ysgolion, mae angen inni geisio dosbarthu mwy o arian iddynt. Mae penaethiaid yn codi'r mater hwnnw o hyd. Mae llawer gormod o athrawon yn cael eu diswyddo pan fydd problemau gyda maint dosbarthiadau a buddsoddi mewn ysgolion y dylid ymdrin â hwy.

**Janet Ryder:** Hoffwn ychwanegu llongyfarchiadau Plaid Cymru i Susan Lewis a'i thîm o arolygwyr am gynhyrchu'r adroddiad, a hefyd i'n gweithlu o athrawon.

hard work and dedication, standards would not be rising. It is a great tribute to teachers in our classrooms that we see increases, generally, in the education system in Wales.

As many other Members have said, there are areas of concern, as this report highlights. We all share many of those concerns. There are concerns about further education and the fact that not enough people are completing their courses and gaining qualifications. As Susan Lewis has identified, in many cases that is because students have been given poor guidance when registering at college; they may not be on quite the right course. Some years ago, to be cynical, you could say that some colleges attracted students so that they could draw down the money for courses. With the new ELWa funding, that should not be happening. Students should be recruited to courses that they will complete, because colleges are paid on completion of courses. Therefore, why are we still facing this problem?

The Minister has highlighted that one way forward for the 14-19 age group is through the learning pathways. A key part of the pathway is that students spend more time in colleges, as they play a bigger part in the provision of education. If the right support is not there for vulnerable students at 14 years of age, there are many concerns that we need to consider. The support has to be there, especially if we are going to encourage an increasing number of 14-year-olds to go into college situations. Some 14-year-olds may not have the maturity to deal with that, and they need proper guidance, care and support. I accept that tutors and individual coaches will, hopefully, try to overcome that.

**Christine Chapman:** I will just remind you, Janet, that that is the big feature of the 14-19 learning pathways action plan. For young people, in whatever setting—college, work, training or still in school—there is a strong emphasis on the learning coach. There has been much development work done on that. Therefore, I hope that you would acknowledge the work that is being done. We know that there is more to progress on this,

Heb eu gwaith caled a'u hymroddiad hwy, ni fyddai safonau'n codi. Mae'n deyrnged fawr i athrawon yn ein hystafelloedd dosbarth ein bod yn gweld gwelliant, yn gyffredinol, yn y gyfundrefn addysg yng Nghymru.

Fel y dywedodd llawer Aelod arall, mae yna feysydd pryder, fel y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn tynnu sylw. Yr ydym bob un yn rhannu nifer o'r pryderon hynny. Mae pryderon ynghylch addysg bellach a'r ffaith nad oes digon o bobl yn cwblhau eu cyrsiau ac yn ennill cymwysterau. Fel y mae Susan Lewis wedi ei ddweud, mewn llawer achos y rheswm am hynny yw bod myfyrwyr wedi cael arweiniad gwael wrth gofrestru yn y coleg; efallai nad ydynt ar y cwrs cywir. Rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, i fod yn sinigaidd, gellid dadlau bod rhai colegau wedi denu myfyrwyr er mwyn iddynt allu hawlio'r arian ar gyfer cyrsiau. Gyda chyllid newydd ELWa, ni ddylai hynny fod yn digwydd. Dylai myfyrwyr gael eu recriwtio i gyrsiau y byddant yn eu cwblhau, am fod colegau'n cael eu talu ar ôl cwblhau cyrsiau. Felly, pam yr ydym yn dal i wynebu'r broblem hon?

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi tynnu sylw mai un ffordd ymlaen i'r grŵp oed 14-19 yw'r llwybrau dysgu. Rhan allweddol o'r llwybr yw'r ffaith bod myfyrwyr yn treulio mwy o amser mewn colegau, gan fod iddynt fwy o ran wrth ddarparu addysg. Os na ddarperir y cymorth cywir i fyfyrwyr diamddiffyn yn 14 oed, mae yna nifer o bryderon y mae angen inni eu hystyried. Mae'n rhaid darparu'r cymorth, yn arbennig os ydym am annog nifer cynyddol o bobl ifanc 14 oed i fynd i'r coleg. Efallai na fydd gan rai pobl ifanc 14 oed yr aeddfedrwydd i ymdopi â hynny, ac mae arnynt angen canllawiau, gofal a chymorth priodol. Derbyniaf y bydd tiwtoriaid a hyfforddwyr unigol, gobeithio, yn ceisio goresgyn hynny.

**Christine Chapman:** Hoffwn eich atgoffa, Janet, mai dyna'r brif nodwedd yng nghynllun gweithredu'r llwybrau dysgu 14-19. I bobl ifanc, waeth beth fo'r lleoliad—coleg, gwaith, hyfforddiant neu yn yr ysgol o hyd—mae pwyslais cryf ar yr hyfforddwr dysgu. Gwnaed llawer o waith datblygu ar hynny. Felly, gobeithio y byddech yn cydnabod y gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo. Gwyddom fod llawer mwy i'w wneud ar hyn,

but we have started on a—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. There is plenty of time for a speech if you want to make one later.

**Janet Ryder:** We will have to monitor carefully the role that those learning coaches play. There is still a great deal to do to recruit them, to get them trained, and to get the system working properly, as well as to train teachers in schools and lecturers in colleges on how this new 14-19 pathway will work. We need to look at the support that is given in colleges. Some colleges are doing a good job, but some need to look at that.

It is interesting to ask how those colleges will meet that improvement, especially in the training sector, given that they are seeing frozen budgets this year. They will not even be able to meet inflationary pay increases from August 2006. One wonders what kind of improvement and leeway there is in colleges for that.

As other Members have highlighted, there are concerns about work-based training. Given that those concerns are with the health professions and the caring professions—which are now, perhaps, the biggest employers in Wales—the whole committee has expressed concern. That must be addressed.

Finally, on child protection and the issues raised in this report on child protection, almost one in 10 primary schools have shortcomings in their arrangements for child protection. Staff may not have been made well enough aware of those issues. It is on the back of that issue that the Government commissioned the extra Estyn inspection to which Peter Black alluded yesterday. The school inspections were only completed in March this year. The report has now been published, and I draw the Minister's attention to two of the recommendations in that further report.

One is that the Welsh Assembly Government, in collaboration with the Department for Education and Skills, should introduce a single list of unsuitable persons, which is

and yr ydym wedi dechrau ar—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn: Mae digon o amser am araith os hoffech ei gwneud yn ddiweddarach.

**Janet Ryder:** Bydd yn rhaid inni fonitro rôl yr hyfforddwyr dysgu hynny'n ofalus. Mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd i'w recriwtio, i'w hyfforddi, ac i roi'r system ar waith yn iawn, yn ogystal â hyfforddi athrawon mewn ysgolion a darlithwyr mewn colegau ar y ffordd y bydd y llwybr 14-19 newydd hwn yn gweithio. Mae angen inni edrych ar y cymorth a roddir mewn colegau. Mae rhai colegau'n gwneud gwaith da, ond mae angen i rai ohonynt edrych ar hynny.

Mae'n ddiddorol gofyn sut y bydd y colegau hynny'n sicrhau'r gwelliant hwnnw, yn arbennig yn y sector hyfforddi, o gofio bod eu cyllidebau'n cael eu rhewi eleni. Ni fyddant hyd yn oed yn gallu fforddio codiadau cyflog chwyddiannol o fis Awst 2006. Tybed pa fath o welliant a chyfle sydd mewn colegau ar gyfer hynny.

Fel y mae Aelodau eraill wedi tynnu sylw, mae pryderon ynghylch hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith. O gofio bod y pryderon hynny'n gysylltiedig â'r proffesiynau iechyd a'r proffesiynau gofal—sef y cyflogwyr mwyaf yng Nghymru, o bosibl, erbyn hyn—mae'r pwyllgor cyfan wedi mynegi pryder. Rhaid ymdrin â hynny.

I gloi, o ran amddiffyn plant a'r materion a godwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn am amddiffyn plant, mae gan bron i un ysgol gynradd o bob 10 ddiffygion yn eu trefniadau ar gyfer amddiffyn plant. Efallai nad yw'r staff wedi cael gwybodaeth ddigonol am y materion hynny. Ar sail y mater hwnnw y comisiynodd y Llywodraeth yr arolygiad ychwanegol gan Estyn y cyfeiriodd Peter Black ato ddoe. Dim ond ym mis Mawrth eleni y cwblhawyd yr arolygiadau ysgol. Bellach mae'r adroddiad wedi'i gyhoeddi, a thynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at ddau o argymhellion yr adroddiad pellach hwnnw.

Mae'r naill yn dweud y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, mewn cydweithrediad â'r Adran Addysg a Sgiliau, gyflwyno un rhestr o bobl anaddas, a gaiff ei diweddarau'n

kept up to date and can be consulted via a single point of inquiry, in accordance with the future vetting and barring schemes. What progress has been, and is being, made on that? The last recommendation notes that the Welsh Assembly Government should issue clear guidance to schools and LEAs on the action that they should take when they receive information that casts doubt on the suitability of existing staff or prospective employees, and that this guidance should draw attention to the need to observe locally agreed safeguarding procedures. That is exactly what we have been asking for, and is what Peter Clarke recommended in Clywch.

Why do inspectors still find that that has not been actioned? I asked the Minister yesterday whether she was satisfied that all adults, other than teachers, who have access to children on school sites, have been checked. If she is not satisfied with that, what action is she taking to ensure that that is addressed?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** In general, and very clearly, the report shows that enormous advances have been made in terms of education and learning in Wales; we can take heart from that. However, there are points of concern.

My speech today could just as easily have been made during the previous debate on manufacturing. Estyn's report points to the need for more work in the FE and work-based learning sectors to increase standards and decrease the disparities in quality across Wales. Positive points for action are clear in this report and they must, and will, be acted upon. We need to support and reform the FE and work-based learning sectors to enable them to be dynamic in their work with Welsh businesses and deliver wider choices and access to courses, especially in our poorest communities.

Tony Blair was right in his speech to the Confederation of British Industry last night. The growing competition that our economy faces is not from low-wage, low-skill economies, but, increasingly, we are confronted with low-wage, high-skill

rheolaidd ac y gellir edrych arni drwy un pwynt ymholi, yn unol â'r cynlluniau fetio a gwahardd a gyflwynir yn y dyfodol. Pa gynnydd a wnaed, ac sy'n cael ei wneud, ar hynny? Dywed yr argymhelliad olaf y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyhoeddi canllawiau clir i ysgolion ac AALl ar y camau gweithredu y dylent eu cymryd pan fyddant yn cael gwybodaeth sy'n bwrw amheuan ar addasrwydd staff presennol neu ddarpar gyflogeion, ac y dylai'r canllawiau hyn dynnu sylw at yr angen i ddilyn gweithdrefnau diogelu wedi eu cytuno'n lleol. Dyna'n union yr ydym wedi gofyn amdano ac a argymhellwyd gan Peter Clarke yn Clywch.

Pam mae arolygwyr yn gweld o hyd na weithredwyd ar hynny? Gofynnais i'r Gweinidog ddoe a oedd yn fodlon bod pob oedolyn, ar wahân i athrawon, sy'n dod i gysylltiad â phlant ar safleoedd ysgol wedi eu gwirio. Os nad yw'n fodlon am hynny, pa gamau y mae'n eu cymryd i sicrhau ymdrin â hynny?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yn gyffredinol, ac yn glir iawn, dengys yr adroddiad fod datblygiadau aruthrol wedi'u gwneud o ran addysg a dysgu yng Nghymru; mae hynny'n galonogol. Fodd bynnag, mae yna bwyntiau sy'n peri pryder.

Gallai fy araith heddiw fod wedi ei gwneud lawn mor hawdd yn ystod y ddadl flaenorol ar weithgynhyrchu. Dengys adroddiad Estyn fod angen mwy o waith yn y sector AB a'r sector dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, er mwyn codi safonau a lleihau'r anghysondebau mewn ansawdd ledled Cymru. Mae pwyntiau gweithredu cadarnhaol yn amlwg yn yr adroddiad hwn a rhaid gweithredu arnynt, a gwneir hynny. Mae angen inni gefnogi a diwygio'r sector AB a'r sector dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith er mwyn eu galluogi i fod yn ddeinamig yn eu gwaith gyda busnesau yng Nghymru a chyflwyno dewisiadau a mynediad ehangach i gyrsiau, yn arbennig yn ein cymunedau tlotaf.

Yr oedd Tony Blair yn llygad ei le yn ei araith i Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain neithiwr. Mae'r gystadleuaeth gynyddol sy'n wynebu ein heconomi yn dod nid o economïau cyflog isel, sgil isel, ond yn gynyddol yr ydym yn wynebu economïau

economies, particularly from China and India. As Lynne Neagle mentioned in the previous debate, both those countries are now producing 2 million graduates every year, mainly in sciences and engineering.

6.00 p.m.

This is a serious threat to Wales and its future. We need to push harder and further with the changes to our education system to align it better with the demands of the modern workforce. Within this context, the role of our FE sector and work-based learning sector in developing basic and vocational skills has never been more important. The teaching of vocational skills, and what used to be called soft skills—the ability to communicate effectively, to work in teams and to solve problems—is what modern-day employers are crying out for. We need to ensure that the Assembly Government and employers work vigorously with the FE sector and work-based learning sector to do more in this area. While Estyn points to clear signs of progress in some courses, with greater links being made to enterprise and sustainable development, more still needs to be done. If we are to attract the higher-value-added jobs and raise the levels of basic skills in Wales, more FE colleges and work-based learning providers need to be empowered to offer high-quality work experience in partnership with community businesses.

The provision of welding courses in Ystrad Mynach college in my constituency gives a good example of the kind of forward planning assistance we clearly need. The college wanted to close the course down, but this was in contradiction, on the basis of my own investigation, to the needs and desires of local employers, and certainly the sector skills councils such as Summit Skills Centre and the Welding Institute, all of whom wanted the courses to remain. As it happened, major practical problems have now prevented the college from continuing the provision of the course in any event. However, we need to learn lessons about the provision of such skilled courses. Now that ELWa is in-house, we properly expect a fully joined-up approach between education and

cyflog isel, sgil uchel, yn arbennig o Tsieina ac India. Fel y soniodd Lynne Neagle yn y ddadl flaenorol, mae'r ddwy wlad honno bellach yn cynhyrchu 2 filiwn o raddedigion bob blwyddyn, ym maes y gwyddorau a pheirianeg yn bennaf.

Mae hwn yn fygythiad mawr i Gymru a'i dyfodol. Mae angen inni wthio'n galetach ac ymhellach gyda'r newidiadau yn ein system addysg i'w chysoni'n well â gofynion y gweithlu modern. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, ni fu gan ein sector AB a'n sector dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith erioed rôl bwysicach o ran datblygu sgiliau sylfaenol a galwedigaethol. Mae cyflogwyr heddiw yn galw'n daer am ddysgu sgiliau galwedigaethol, a'r hyn a arferai gael eu galw'n sgiliau meddal—y gallu i gyfathrebu'n effeithiol, gweithio mewn timau a datrys problemau. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyflogwyr yn gweithio'n ddiwyd gyda'r sector AB a'r sector dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith i wneud mwy yn y maes hwn. Er bod Estyn yn nodi arwyddion clir o gynnydd mewn rhai cyrsiau, a mwy o gysylltiadau â menter a datblygu cynaliadwy, mae angen gwneud mwy o hyd. Er mwyn denu'r swyddi sy'n ychwanegu mwy o werth a chodi lefelau sgiliau sylfaenol yng Nghymru, mae angen grymuso mwy o golegau AB a darparwyr dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith i gynnig profiad gwaith o safon uchel mewn partneriaeth â busnesau cymunedol.

Mae'r cyrsiau weldio a gynigir yng ngholeg Ystrad Mynach yn fy etholaeth i yn enghraifft dda o'r math o gymorth blaengynllunio y mae ei angen arnom yn amlwg. Yr oedd y coleg yn bwriadu dod â'r cwrs i ben, ond ar sail fy ngwaith ymchwil fy hun, yr oedd hyn yn groes i anghenion a dymuniadau cyflogwyr lleol, ac yn bendant y cynghorau sgiliau sector, fel Canolfan Sgiliau Summit a'r Sefydliad Weldio, a oedd am weld y cyrsiau'n parhau. Fel y digwyddodd, mae problemau ymarferol sylweddol wedi rhwystro'r coleg rhag parhau i ddarparu'r cwrs beth bynnag. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni ddysgu gwersi ynglŷn â darparu cyrsiau sgiliau o'r fath. Gan fod ELWa bellach wedi uno â ni, yr ydym yn disgwyl gweld mabwysiadu hollol gydgyssylltiedig rhwng



the Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks. Artificial departmental boundaries that do not exist in the real world cannot be allowed to inhibit progress.

I agree with the points made by William Graham about the work that we still have to do with regard to our youth justice system. Estyn states that standards have failed to improve since last year. Young people who have broken the law but are not given custodial sentences, are not being given the chance to get back into education and training promptly and thereby break the cycle of criminality they are stuck in. Those who are imprisoned face long delays in re-entering education once released from custody. The result is a period of time where the temptation to go back to crime is very high. We are in danger of overlooking a generation of young people who need our help the most. Further education, work-based learning, soft skills and education within the youth justice system may not be the mainstream of government education provision, but they are no less vital. These kinds of provision are a lifeline to people in deprived communities.

Flexible education provision post 16 is a major gateway back into the world of work for thousands of people in my constituency of Caerphilly. Despite the earlier debate on the MEG, the RAISE programme will make a massive difference to young people in my constituency. At the moment, 35 per cent of all adults in the Caerphilly constituency have no qualifications at all, and most of them left school 10 years ago or more. We want to ensure that that type of end gain is not repeated for the next generation, and I welcome that investment.

I hope that any criticisms that I have made are seen as positive contributions. I am not interested in carping criticism, but rather in flagging up work that needs to be done. I am sure that I am pushing at an open door and that it will be responded to positively by the Minister and her colleagues.

**Mark Isherwood:** Where this report has

addysg a'r Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau. Ni ellir caniatáu i ffiniau adrannol artiffisial nad ydynt yn bodoli allan yn y maes rwystro cynnydd.

Cytunaf â'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan William Graham ynglŷn â'r gwaith y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud o hyd o ran ein system cyfiawnder ieuencid. Dywed Estyn nad yw safonau wedi gwella ers y llynedd. Nid yw pobl ifanc sydd wedi torri'r gyfraith ond nad ydynt yn cael eu ddedfrydu i garchar yn cael y cyfle i ddychwelyd i addysg a hyfforddiant ar unwaith, a thrwy hynny dorri eu cylch o droseddu. Mae'r rheini sy'n treulio cyfnodau yn y carchar yn wynebu oedi hir cyn dychwelyd i addysg ar ôl eu rhyddhau o'r carchar. O ganlyniad, mae yna gyfnod lle mae'r temtasiwn i aildroseddu yn gryf iawn. Yr ydym mewn perygl o ddiystyru cenhedlaeth o bobl ifanc y mae angen ein help arnynt fwyaf. Efallai nad yw addysg bellach, dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith, sgiliau meddal ac addysg yn y system cyfiawnder ieuencid ym mhrif ffrwd darpariaeth addysg y llywodraeth, ond maent yr un mor hanfodol. Mae'r mathau hyn o ddarpariaeth yn rhaff achub i bobl mewn cymunedau difreintiedig.

Mae'r ddarpariaeth addysg hyblyg ôl-16 yn brif borth yn ôl i'r gwaith i filoedd o bobl yn fy etholaeth i yng Nghaerffili. Er gwaethaf y ddadl gynharach ar y Prif Grŵp Gwariant, bydd y rhaglen Rhagori yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i bobl ifanc yn fy etholaeth i. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gan 35 y cant o'r holl oedolion yn etholaeth Caerffili unrhyw gymwysterau o gwbl, a gadawodd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yr ysgol 10 mlynedd neu fwy yn ôl. Yr ydym am sicrhau na chaiff y math hwnnw o sefyllfa ei ailadrodd ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf, a chroesawaf y buddsoddiad hwnnw.

Gobeithio yr ystyrir unrhyw feirniadaeth a wneuthum fel cyfraniad cadarnhaol. Nid oes gennyf ddiddordeb mewn pigo beiau a beirniadu, ond yn hytrach dynnu sylw at y gwaith y mae angen ei wneud. Yr wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn gwthio yn erbyn drws agored ac y ceir ymateb cadarnhaol gan y Gweinidog a'i chyd-Aelodau.

**Mark Isherwood:** Lle mae'r adroddiad hwn

identified progress, we must congratulate learners and those who work with them. However, we must also note several areas of concern. The report states that standards in core subjects at key stage 1 has stayed static over the past five years, and that results at key stage 3 have remained static in mathematics and have declined in science. It also states that it does not look as though pupils will achieve any of the Welsh Assembly Government's ambitious GCSE targets by 2007 and, even worse, that 7 per cent of young people still leave school with no more than one GCSE at grade G, or the equivalent. Only last month, Estyn also reported that education choices for 14 to 19-year-olds are limited and that there are too few links between courses and local job markets. We must also be concerned about the overlap and the weak involvement of employers in community consortia for education and training, as identified in this report.

As the 'Lost Children of Wales' report states, and I must keep repeating this:

'today, in Welsh schools, too many pupils' minds are unseen and their owners are made economically disabled'.

It adds that they become disillusioned, and that

'school inadvertently trains them in absenteeism as they devise ways out of what they see as a raw deal'.

This Estyn report states that secondary schools still have a long way to go to meet the national target to reduce absenteeism to below 7 per cent by 2007, adding that 30 per cent of pupils were absent from the classes observed. The hard truth is that the number of young people not in education, training or employment has risen. This is linked, in turn, to growing numbers lacking the basic skills of literacy and numeracy, and without the social skills, to which Jeff referred, that are required to enter the labour market. As I said

wedi nodi cynnydd, rhaid inni longyfarch dysgwyr a'r rheini sy'n gweithio gyda hwy. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd sylwi ar sawl maes sy'n achosi pryder. Mae'r adroddiad yn dweud bod safonau yn y pynciau craidd yng nghyfnod allweddol 1 wedi parhau'n yn eu hunfan dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf, a bod y canlyniadau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 wedi parhau yn eu hunfan mewn mathemateg ac wedi gostwng mewn gwyddoniaeth. Mae'n dweud hefyd nad yw'n ymddangos yn debygol y bydd disgyblion yn cyrraedd unrhyw un o dargedau TGAU uchelgeisiol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru erbyn 2007, ac yn waeth na hynny, fod 7 y cant o bobl ifanc yn gadael yr ysgol o hyd gydag un TGAU gradd G, neu gymhwyster cyfatebol, ar y mwyaf. Fis diwethaf yn unig yr adroddodd Estyn hefyd fod dewisiadau addysg ar gyfer pobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed yn gyfyngedig ac nad oes digon o gysylltiadau rhwng cyrsiau a marchnadoedd swyddi lleol. Rhaid inni hefyd bryderu am yr achosion o orgyffwrdd a'r diffyg ymgysylltu gan gyflogwyr mewn consortia cymunedol ar gyfer addysg a hyfforddiant, fel y nodir yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Fel y dywed yr adroddiad 'Lost Children of Wales', a rhaid imi barhau i ailadrodd hyn:

heddiw, yn ysgolion Cymru, caiff gormod o ddisgyblion eu hanwybyddu ac o ganlyniad maent yn economaidd anabl.

Mae'n ychwanegu eu bod yn dadrithio, a bod

yr ysgol yn anfwriadol yn eu hyfforddi i fod yn absennol wrth iddynt ddyfeisio ffyrdd i ddianc o'r hyn sydd, yn eu tyb hwy, yn fargen wael.

Dywed adroddiad Estyn fod gan ysgolion uwchradd lawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd i gyflawni'r targed cenedlaethol o leihau achosion o absenoldeb i lai na 7 y cant erbyn 2007, gan ychwanegu bod 30 y cant o ddisgyblion yn absennol o'r dosbarthiadau a arsylwyd. Y gwir plaen yw bod nifer y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth wedi codi. Caiff hyn ei gysylltu, yn ei dro, â'r nifer cynyddol sydd heb sgiliau sylfaenol mewn llythrennedd a rhifedd, a heb y sgiliau cymdeithasol y

earlier, even the flagship Airbus apprenticeship scheme at Broughton reports that up to 80 per cent of applicants fail basic skills tests.

The Welsh Assembly Government postcode lottery of funding already significantly favours schools in the most deprived counties. The shortcomings of this policy are highlighted by GCSE underachievement in areas such as Wrexham, which measures low on deprivation and, therefore, funding, and by schools in Merthyr Tydfil, one of the most deprived areas, which recorded the best school attendance in Wales. One headteacher there stated that it made him angry when links were automatically made between deprivation and poor achievement. The Minister must explain why figures obtained by the *Times Educational Supplement* reveal that schools in high free-school-meal areas in England outperform their Welsh equivalents by more than three times at GCSE level.

This Estyn report states that further education colleges still have much work to do if they are to reach their targets by 2007. However, this must be considered in the context of three years of zero growth in further education funding, with unit core funding cuts and falling student numbers since 2003. So much for widening participation. The picture worsens with Estyn's statement that work-based learning continues to be a cause of great concern.

A failure to meet the learning needs of young offenders makes it more likely that they will reoffend, and the failure to address education standards in the youth justice system, which is highlighted in this report, is a gross betrayal. We must champion the life chances of all young people, by building on solid foundations, developing education with the developing child. We must break the self-fulfilling prophecy that low expectations of pupils in too many areas produce low aspirations in too many young people.

cyfeiriodd Jeff atynt ac sy'n angenrheidiol i ymuno â'r farchnad lafur. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae hyd yn oed cynllun prentisiaeth blaenllaw Airbus ym Mrychdyn yn sôn bod 80 y cant o ymgeiswyr yn methu profion sgiliau sylfaenol.

Mae loteri cod post Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran ariannu eisoes i raddau helaeth yn ffafrio ysgolion yn y siroedd mwyaf difreintiedig. Tynnir sylw at ddiffygion y polisi hwn gan achosion o dangyflawni ar lefel TGAU mewn ardaloedd fel Wrecsam, sy'n ardal o amddifadedd isel a lle mae ariannu'n isel o'r herwydd, a chan ysgolion ym Merthyr Tudful, un o'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, lle yr oedd y lefel bresenoldeb orau yng Nghymru. Dywedodd un pennaeth yno ei fod yn cynddeiriogi pan wneir cysylltiadau awtomatig rhwng amddifadedd a chyflawni gwael. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog esbonio pam mae ffigurau a gafwyd gan y *Times Educational Supplement* yn dangos bod ysgolion mewn ardaloedd lle caiff nifer uchel o ddisgyblion brydau ysgol am ddim yn Lloegr yn perfformio dros deirgwaith yn well nag ysgolion cyfatebol yng Nghymru ar lefel TGAU.

Dywed yr adroddiad hwn gan Estyn fod gan golegau addysg bellach lawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd i gyrraedd eu targedau erbyn 2007. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried hyn yng nghyd-destun tair blynedd heb ddim cynnydd yn yr arian ar gyfer addysg bellach, a thoriadau mewn arian craidd fesul uned a gostyngiad yn nifer y myfyrwyr er 2003. Beth am ehangu cyfranogiad? Mae'r darlun yn gwaethygu gyda datganiad Estyn fod dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith yn parhau i achosi pryder mawr.

Mae methu diwallu anghenion dysgu troseddwy'r ifanc yn golygu eu bod yn fwy tebygol o aildroseddu, ac mae'r methiant i fynd i'r afael â safonau addysg yn y system cyfiawnder ieuencid, a amlygir yn yr adroddiad hwn, yn frad mawr. Rhaid inni hyrwyddo cyfleoedd bywyd pob plentyn ifanc, drwy adeiladu ar sylfeini cadarn, datblygu addysg gyda'r plentyn sy'n datblygu. Rhaid inni dorri'r broffwydoliaeth hunangyflawnol sy'n dweud bod disgywiliadau isel gan ddisgyblion mewn gormod o ardaloedd yn cynhyrchu dyheadau

isel mewn gormod o bobl ifanc.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I would like to commend the Estyn team and all the hard-working people in schools throughout Wales, despite facing huge difficulties, including the quality of school buildings, to which Peter alluded. When I am called to different schools across my region of North Wales, I am devastated and terribly concerned by the health and safety issues and the possibility of accidents that arise when you have rotten doors and windows and leaky roofs. One school comes to mind where some of the facilities cannot be used because of the heat in summer—the temperature in the computer suite was about 100 degrees when I, and other Members, visited on a June day.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Hoffwn ganmol tîm Estyn a'r holl bobl weithgar mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru, er eu bod yn wynebu anawsterau mawr, gan gynnwys ansawdd adeiladau ysgolion y cyfeiriodd Peter ato. Pan gaf fy ngalw i wahanol ysgolion ar draws fy rhanbarth yng Ngogledd Cymru, yr wyf yn arswydo ac yn pryderu o weld y problemau iechyd a diogelwch a'r posibilrwydd damweiniau sy'n codi pan fydd gennych ddrysau a ffenestri wedi pydru a thoeon sy'n gollwng dŵr. Mae un ysgol yn dod i'r meddwl yn syth, lle na ellir defnyddio rhai o'r cyfleusterau oherwydd y gwres yn yr haf—yr oedd y tymheredd yn yr ystafell gyfrifiaduron tua 100 gradd pan fûm i ac Aelodau eraill yno ar ddiwrnod ym mis Mehefin.

There are concerns, obviously, that the lack of financial commitment, particularly with the 30 per cent to 40 per cent cut in the school buildings improvement grant, will have a detrimental effect, and that the targets that the Welsh Assembly Government has set itself will not be reached. I realise that there is a pressure on time, therefore I will be as brief as possible, Deputy Presiding Officer.

Yn amlwg, mae yna bryderon y bydd y diffyg ymrwymiad ariannol, yn enwedig gyda'r gostyngiad o 30 y cant i 40 y cant yn y grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion, yn cael effaith niweidiol, ac na fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cyrraedd y targedau y mae wedi eu gosod iddi ei hun. Sylweddolaf fod amser yn brin, felly, ceisiaf fod mor gryno â phosibl, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

I am also concerned about exclusion, because, in some of the worst areas, exclusion is high and rising. I used to deal with some of these underachieving, excluded pupils; many come from complex family circumstances, where life is not as it is for many of us. I note that some of the referral units are, according to Estyn, not well attended. In its view, a quarter of the students attending have a statement of special educational need, and at least two thirds of local authorities do not yet provide all excluded pupils with the full-time education to which they are entitled. I was a magistrate before I came to the Assembly, and it was always a great concern that so many excluded pupils were entering the justice system because no provision was being made for them.

Yr wyf hefyd yn pryderu am waharddiadau, oherwydd yn rhai o'r ardaloedd gwaethaf mae nifer yr achosion o wahardd yn uchel ac ar gynydd. Arferwn ddelio â rhai o'r disgyblion hyn sy'n tangyflawni ac yn cael eu gwahardd; mae amgylchiadau teuluol nifer ohonynt yn gymhleth, ac nid yw bywyd yr un fath ag ydyw i lawer ohonom. Sylwaf fod y ffigurau presenoldeb yn rhai o'r unedau cyfeirio, yn ôl Estyn, yn isel. Yn eu barn hwy, mae gan chwarter y myfyrwyr sy'n mynychu ddatganiad o angen addysgol arbennig, ac nid yw o leiaf dwy ran o dair o awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd yn darparu'r addysg anser llawn y mae gan ddisgyblion a waharddir yr hawl i'w chael. Yr oeddwn yn ynad cyn imi ddod i'r Cynulliad, ac yr oedd yn bryder mawr bob amser fod cynifer o ddisgyblion wedi eu gwahardd yn dod yn rhan o'r system cyfiawnder am nad oedd unrhyw ddarpariaeth ar eu cyfer.

The other area that concerns me is the FE sector and the work-based sector, to which

Un o'r meysydd eraill sy'n achosi pryder imi yw'r sector AB a'r sector yn seiliedig ar

Jeff referred. The constant cuts are unsustainable, Minister. I do not understand why, in this key area, you are constantly squeezing FE colleges.

The last point that I would like to make relates to Welsh-language provision.

6.10 p.m.

Nodaf fod gan Estyn bryder mawr ynglŷn ag addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Lle mae anawsterau, maent yn bod oherwydd diffyg athrawon i ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, yn enwedig yn y chweched dosbarth. Teimlaf fod pryder ynglŷn â hyn, oherwydd sut y gallwn ddatblygu 'Iaith Pawb' a gwella darpariaeth yn y Gymraeg os oes anawsterau o'r fath? Mae'r targedau yn 'Iaith Pawb' i fod i gynyddu'r canran o bobl sy'n medru'r iaith, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fydd hynny'n bosibl. Gobeithiaf, Weinidog, y byddwch yn gallu gwneud rhywbeth i gyrraedd y nod.

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):**

Thank you to all who contributed to the debate. I am sure that there has been strong agreement across the Assembly, as there has been in committee, about the key areas in which we need to invest in order to improve the education system in Wales.

I just want to demonstrate the fact that, sometimes, the use of statistics can lead you in one direction when there are other statistics that lead you in another. Mark Isherwood, you regularly say in the Chamber that the number of young people who are not in education, employment or training has gone up, but you fail to mention that that figure concerns 16 to 18-year-olds. I know that it has gone up by 2 per cent in that group, but, in the 19 to 24-year-old group, it has come down by 3 per cent. Therefore, you must make sure that you consider both sides of the equation when making that kind of argument.

People have been happy to talk about the fact that Wales is the worst in terms of the number of people not achieving any qualifications, but it has been the worst since the middle of the 1990s. We are trying

waith y cyfeiriodd Jeff atynt. Ni ellir cynnal y toriadau cyson, Weinidog. Nid wyf yn deall pam yr ydych, yn y maes allweddol hwn, yn rhoi pwysau di-baid ar golegau AB.

Mae a wnelo'r pwynt olaf yr hoffwn ei wneud â ddarpariaeth yn y Gymraeg.

I note that Estyn is very concerned about Welsh-medium education. Where there are problems, they exist because of a lack of teachers who can teach through the medium of Welsh, especially in sixth forms. I feel there is concern about this, because how can we expand 'Iaith Pawb' and improve provision in Welsh if there are such difficulties? The targets in 'Iaith Pawb' are supposed to increase the numbers of people who can speak Welsh, but I am not sure whether that will be possible. I hope, Minister, that you will be able to do something to achieve that aim.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):**

Diolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at y ddatl. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod cytundeb cryf ar draws y Cynulliad, fel yr oedd yn y pwyllgor, am y meysydd allweddol y mae angen inni fuddsoddi ynddynt er mwyn gwella'r system addysg yng Nghymru.

Yn syml, hoffwn ddangos y ffaith fod defnyddio ystadegau, weithiau, yn gallu'ch arwain i un cyfeiriad pan fydd yna ystadegau eraill sy'n eich arwain i gyfeiriad arall. Mark Isherwood, yr ydych yn dweud yn rheolaidd yn y Siambr fod nifer y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant wedi cynyddu, ond nid ydych yn sôn fod y ffigur yn cyfeirio at bobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed. Gwn ei fod wedi cynyddu 2 y cant yn y grŵp hwnnw, ond yn y grŵp 19 i 24 oed mae'r ffigur wedi gostwng 3 y cant. Felly, rhaid ichi wneud yn siŵr eich bod yn ystyried y ddwy ochr wrth ddefnyddio'r math hwnnw o ddatl.

Mae pobl wedi bod yn barod i sôn am y ffaith mai Cymru yw'r ardal waethaf o ran nifer y bobl nad ydynt yn ennill unrhyw gymwysterau, ond Cymru yw'r gwaethaf er canol y 1990au. Yr ydym yn gwneud popeth

everything that we can to address that, and, from 1999, when the Assembly was established, we had four years when that percentage stayed the same—8 per cent did not gain a GCSE qualification—but the figure has come down a percentage point, and it has remained at that level for the last two years. Although it is still a statistic that we do not want to see, and on which we do want to improve, it is a statistic, like the others, that is going in the right direction. The fact that it came down a whole percentage point between 1999 and 2005 has been really important for those girls and boys who are achieving.

That is what the RAISE grant will do. As Jeff said in reference to his constituency, it will target the largest cohorts of the most disadvantaged, who are disproportionately represented in the statistics regarding those who do not achieve. The data that is used by every education establishment demonstrates year on year that it is not individual young people having free school meals that influences education outcomes, but the size of the free school meal quotient. We know, from the 'Narrowing the Gap' work, that we can break the links with deprivation with the right kind of input. As Sue said in her contribution this afternoon, we are starting with this, we will learn lessons and we will want to apply those lessons more widely, and I am glad that Members supported that.

In terms of the other contributions from the Conservatives, I appreciate the concerns raised and I have acknowledged them on many occasions in committee, as I am sure that you will agree. However, because we are taking steps on absenteeism, for example, we are actually taking quite radical steps in terms of the youth justice system. We have had a learning project in place and we want to link it closely with our 14-19 agenda, for example, and that is why we cannot support the amendments. I think that you will be able to hold us to account on 'The Learning Country 2' and those elements of the agendas in taking this forward.

I agree with those people who say that school

o fewn ein gallu i fynd i'r afael â hynny, ac o 1999 ymlaen, pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad, cawsom bedair blynedd pan na welwyd unrhyw newid yn y ganran—nid enillodd 8 y cant gymhwyster TGAU—ond mae'r ffigur wedi gostwng un pwynt canran ac wedi parhau ar y lefel honno ers dwy flynedd. Er ei fod yn parhau'n ystadegyn nad ydym am ei weld ac yr hoffem wella arno, mae'n ystadegyn, fel unrhyw ystadegyn arall, sy'n symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'r ffaith iddo ostwng un pwynt canran cyfan rhwng 1999 a 2005 wedi bod yn bwysig iawn i'r merched a'r bechgyn hynny sydd yn cyflawni.

Dyna y bydd grant Rhagori yn ei wneud. Fel y dywedodd Jeff wrth gyfeirio at ei etholaeth, bydd yn targedu'r carfanau mwyaf o'r rhai mwyaf difreintiedig, nad ydynt yn cael eu cynrychioli'n deg yn yr ystadegau am y rheini nad ydynt yn cyflawni. Mae'r data a ddefnyddir gan bob sefydliad addysg yn dangos, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, nad pobl ifanc unigol sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim sy'n dylanwadu ar ganlyniadau addysg, ond yn hytrach gyfanswm y rhai sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim. Gwyddom o'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd mewn perthynas â 'Cau'r Bwlch' y gallwn dorri'r cysylltiadau ag amddifadedd gyda'r cyfraniad cywir. Fel y dywedodd Sue yn ei chyfraniad y prynhawn yma, yr ydym yn dechrau gyda hyn, byddwn yn dysgu gwersi, a byddwn am gymhwyso'r gwersi hynny'n ehangach, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Aelodau wedi cefnogi hynny.

O ran y cyfraniadau eraill gan y Ceidwadwyr, gwerthfawrogaf y pryderon a godwyd ac yr wyf wedi'u cydnabod droeon yn y pwyllgor, fel y cytunwch, yr wyf yn siŵr. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd ein bod yn cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael ag absenoldeb, er enghraifft, yr ydym yn cymryd camau cymharol radical o ran y system cyfiawnder ieuenctid. Mae prosiect dysgu wedi bod ar waith gennym, ac yr ydym am sicrhau cyswllt agos rhwng y prosiect hwn â'n hagenda 14-19, er enghraifft, a dyna pam na allwn gefnogi'r gwelliannau. Credaf y byddwch yn gallu ein dwyn i gyfrif ar 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu 2' a'r elfennau hynny yn yr agendâu wrth inni ddatblygu hyn.

Cytunaf â'r bobl hynny sy'n dweud bod

buildings are extremely important—they are important to all of us. I have never opened as many school buildings as I have in the last year, and that is because the money is starting to be seen on the ground. You will all be looking with a great deal of interest at the report that we will publish in July, as it will say whether your local authority, the area that you represent, however small or large it may be, has invested in school buildings the money provided by the Assembly Government for that purpose. We will all be looking carefully at that report.

To those of you who ask why some of those areas with a higher take-up of free school meals—to use that indicator again—have done better in England, I say that it is because they had dedicated expenditure focused on free school meals from Gordon Brown. We have evidence from the Excellence in Cities work. You will know from the Chancellor's recent announcement that the additional funding in England will go differentially to schools depending on their level of disadvantage. That is because we are a party of social justice.

Finally, Eleanor, once again, there has been no cut in the school buildings improvement grant. Read the Record of the many occasions when the Finance Minister and I have stated as much. I am grateful to Members for their contributions. I repeat William's remarks that all of us want to improve standards in Wales further, and the biggest key issue facing us is that of work-based learning, which is why we have devoted so much time to it in committee, and why I absolutely accept and welcome Jeff's role as critical friend, to keep driving that agenda forwards in Wales.

adeiladau ysgolion yn bwysig tu hwnt—maent yn bwysig i bob un ohonom. Nid wyf erioed wedi agor cynifer o adeiladau ysgolion ag a wneuthum yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a'r rheswm am hynny yw bod yr arian yn dechrau cael ei weld ar lawr gwlad. Bydd gan bob un ohonoch ddi-ddordeb mawr yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddir gennym ym mis Gorffennaf, a fydd yn dweud a yw eich awdurdod lleol, yr ardal yr ydych yn ei chynrychioli, waeth beth yw ei maint, wedi buddsoddi'r arian a ddarparwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion at y diben hwnnw. Bydd pob un ohonom yn edrych yn fanwl ar yr adroddiad hwnnw.

I'r sawl ohonoch sy'n gofyn pam mae rhai o'r ardaloedd hynny lle mae mwy o ddisgyblion yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim—i ddefnyddio'r dangosydd hwnnw eto—wedi gwneud yn well yn Lloegr, dywedaf mai'r rheswm yw eu bod wedi cael gwariant penodol gan Gordon Brown i ganolbwyntio ar brydau ysgol am ddim. Mae gennym dystiolaeth o'r gwaith Excellence in Cities. Gwyddoch o gyhoeddiad y Canghellor yn ddiweddar y bydd yr arian ychwanegol yn Lloegr yn mynd ar sail wahaniaethol i ysgolion yn ôl eu lefel amddifadedd. Hynny am ein bod yn blaid dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

I gloi, Eleanor, unwaith eto ni fu toriad yn y grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion. Darllenwch y Cofnod ar yr adegau niferus hynny pan ddywedwyd hynny gennyf fi a'r Gweinidog Cyllid. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Hoffwn ailadrodd sylwadau William ein bod bob un am weld gwelliant pellach mewn safonau yng Nghymru, ac mai'r mater allweddol mwyaf sy'n ein hwynebu yw dysgu'n seiliedig ar waith. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi treulio cymaint o amser yn ei drafod yn y pwyllgor, a pham yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr ac yn croesawu rôl Jeff fel ffrind beirniadol, er mwyn dal i ddatblygu'r agenda honno yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.*

*Amendment 1: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
 Amendment 2: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*



*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 3: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 4: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 5: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 6: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 7: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amendment 8: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue

Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
 Amendment 9: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 10: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 11: For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue

Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

6.20 p.m.

Motion (NDM3042) as amended: to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3042) fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes the annual report of Her Majesty's Chief Inspector of Education and Training;*

*1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol Prif Arolygydd Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ei Mawrhydi;*

*2. the chief inspector's view that standards are improving in many areas of education and training;*

*2. barn y prif arolygydd bod safonau'n gwella mewn nifer o feysydd addysg a hyfforddiant;*

*3. the action being taken though our distinctive agenda for Wales, 'The Learning Country', to break down barriers to learning and address the areas for improvement identified by the chief inspector.*

*3. y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd drwy ein hagenda unigryw ar gyfer Cymru, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu', i chwalu'r rhwystrau i ddysgu a rhoi sylw i'r meysydd ar gyfer gwella a nodwyd gan y prif arolygydd.*

*4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to improve provision for learning for young people with mental health problems.*

*4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella'r ddarpariaeth ddysgu ar gyfer pobl ifanc gyda phroblemau iechyd meddwl.*

*5. recognises the need for local education authorities to address the lack of provision of*

*5. yn cydnabod yr angen i awdurdodau addysg lleol roi sylw i'r diffyg yn yr addysg*

*full-time education for excluded pupils in amser llawn a ddarperir ar gyfer disgyblion  
Wales. sydd wedi'u gwahardd yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig (NDM3042): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3042): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.*

*Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
completes business for this afternoon. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.20 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 6.20 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)