



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 16 Tachwedd 2000**

**Thursday 16 November 2000**

## Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Datganiad gan y Llywydd  
*Statement by the Presiding Officer*
- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau  
*Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities*
- 11 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd  
*Questions to the Minister for Environment*
- 20 Datganiad ar Gynllun Iawndal Bellwin  
*Statement on the Bellwin Compensation Scheme*
- 29 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 33 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales):  
Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru  
*Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales):  
The Welsh Joint Education Committee*
- 58 Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy  
*Sustainable Development Scheme*
- 90 Dadl Fer: Cyfraniad y Sector Cydweithredol a Chydfuddiannol wrth Hyrwyddo  
Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol a Chyfranogiad Cymunedol yng Nghymru  
*Short Debate: The Contribution of the Co-operative and Mutual Sector to the  
Promotion of Social Inclusion and Community Involvement in Wales*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

### **Datganiad gan y Llywydd Statement by the Presiding Officer**

**The Presiding Officer:** In Plenary on Tuesday, Alun Pugh raised a point of order under Standing Order No. 4.6, on the prohibition of paid advocacy, regarding Alun Cairns's contribution to proceedings relating to Lloyds TSB. I agreed to check the Record and have done so. I have also noted that Alun Cairns declares in the register of interests his interest relating to his employment as a business development consultant. I am satisfied, following further advice, that Alun Cairns's contribution to the debate was not in breach of Standing Order No. 4.6.

**Y Llywydd:** Yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mawrth, cododd Alun Pugh bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 4.6, ar atal eiriolaeth daledig, o ran cyfraniad Alun Cairns i'r trafodion a oedd yn ymwneud â Lloyds TSB. Cytunais i wirio'r Cofnod ac yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny. Nodais hefyd fod Alun Cairns yn datgan yn y gofrestr o fuddiannau ei fuddiant o ran ei gyflogaeth fel ymgynghorydd datblygu busnes. Yr wyf yn fodlon, yn dilyn cyngor pellach, nad oedd cyfraniad Alun Cairns i'r ddadl yn torri Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 4.6.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau Questions to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities**

#### **Codiadau'r Dreth Gyngor (Cyngor Sir Ceredigion) Council Tax Increases (Ceredigion County Council)**

**C1 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau egluro pam nad yw Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn gymwys i dderbyn cymorth cyfamserol i gyfyngu ar godiadau yn y dreth gyngor? (OAQ7788)

**Q1 Elin Jones:** Will the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities explain why Ceredigion County Council is not eligible for transitional assistance to limit council tax increases? (OAQ7788)

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** The exemplifications that we have prepared so far are based on broad assumptions. I do not yet know in real terms which authorities will receive a transitional grant. When we have the final information from authorities to feed into the settlement, the outcome may be different, and the list of authorities that now qualify to receive the grant may change. At the moment, Ceredigion is on the borderline.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Seilir yr enghreifftiadau a baratoesom hyd yn hyn ar ragdybiaethau cyffredinol. Ni wn eto mewn termau gwirioneddol pa awdurdodau a gaiff grant cyfamserol. Pan gawn yr wybodaeth derfynol gan awdurdodau i'w bwydo i mewn i'r setliad, gall y canlyniad fod yn wahanol, a gall y rhestr o awdurdodau sydd bellach yn gymwys i gael y grant newid. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Ceredigion ar y ffin.

**Elin Jones:** Fel y gwyddoch, Ceredigion fydd yr unig sir o bosibl o fewn ardal Amcan 1 i gollu arian yn sgîl mabwysiadu'r asesiad gwariant safonol newydd. Bydd hynny'n cyfyngu'n eithriadol ar allu Cyngor Sir Ceredigion i weithredu Amcan 1. Oherwydd sefyllfa unigryw'r cyngor yn y cyd-destun

**Elin Jones:** As you know, Ceredigion will possibly be the only county within the Objective 1 area to lose money following the adoption of the new standard spending assessment. That will seriously restrict Ceredigion County Council's ability to implement Objective 1. Because of the

hwn, a edrychweh yn garedig ar y posibilrwydd o ddarparu cyllid cyfamserol ar gyfer Ceredigion?

**Edwina Hart:** When I have the additional figures, I will review the issues regarding transitional arrangements and will then see which authorities qualify.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I am encouraged by what I have heard this morning. Will the Minister consider the exceptional circumstances that prevail in Flintshire? As a consequence of the review of the distribution formula, it has lost about £2.3 million in revenue support grant. Will the Minister consider revisiting the issue of transitional relief at the earliest opportunity?

**Edwina Hart:** When I announce my final budget in December, I will look across the board at all the requests from Committees regarding their budget provision. In the budget round, I will look to see whether there are any additional resources. Flooding may also need to be dealt with in that context. I will bear in mind Tom's point on Flintshire and Elin's point on Ceredigion, and will look to see whether there is anything that I can do in terms of transitional arrangements.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Leaving aside the flooding, which is a separate issue, will the Minister accept that the new standard spending assessment is detrimental to many areas of rural Wales? Ceredigion, in particular, will face increases of 8 or 9 per cent and this follows large increases in many areas last time, which were well above the rate of inflation. What does the Minister say to the areas where inflation is running at 2 per cent and council tax increases, under the Liberal-Labour alliance, are likely to be 9 per cent in some areas?

**Edwina Hart:** Council tax is a matter for the local authority concerned. My budget allowed for an excellent settlement to local government and also for average figures in respect of council tax.

council's unique situation in this context, will you look favourably upon the possibility of providing transitional funding for Ceredigion?

**Edwina Hart:** Pan fydd y ffigurau ychwanegol gennyf, adolygaf y materion o ran trefniadau cyfamserol gan weld wedyn pa awdurdodau fydd yn gymwys.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Fe'm calonogir gan yr hyn a glywais y bore yma. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried yr amgylchiadau eithriadol sydd yn bodoli yn Sir y Fflint? O ganlyniad i'r adolygiad o'r fformwla ddsbarthu, mae wedi colli tua £2.3 miliwn mewn grant cynnal refeniw. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried y mater o ryddhad cyfamserol ar y cyfle cyntaf a gaiff?

**Edwina Hart:** Pan gyhoeddaf fy nghyllideb derfynol ym mis Rhagfyr, byddaf yn edrych yn gyffredinol ar bob cais gan y Pwyllgorau o ran y gyllideb a ddarperir iddynt. Yn y cylch cyllideb, byddaf yn edrych i weld a oes unrhyw adnoddau ychwanegol. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid ymdrin â llifogydd yn y cydestun hwnnw hefyd. Cadwaf bwynt Tom ar Sir y Fflint a phwynt Elin ar Geredigion mewn cof, ac edrychaf i weld a oes unrhyw beth y gallaf ei wneud o ran y trefniadau cyfamserol.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ac eithrio'r llifogydd, sydd yn fater ar wahân, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn bod yr asesiad gwariant safonol newydd yn niweidiol i sawl ardal yng Nghymru wledig? Bydd Ceredigion, yn arbennig, yn wynebu codiadau o 8 neu 9 y cant ac mae hyn yn dilyn codiadau mawr mewn sawl ardal y tro diwethaf, a oedd llawer yn uwch na'r gyfradd chwyddiant. Beth sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud wrth yr ardaloedd lle mae chwyddiant yn rhedeg ar 2 y cant ac mae codiadau'r dreth gyngor, o dan glymblaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Llafur, yn debygol o fod yn 9 y cant mewn rhai ardaloedd?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r dreth gyngor yn fater i'r awdurdod lleol dan sylw. Caniataodd fy nghyllideb ar gyfer setliad rhagorol i lywodraeth leol a hefyd ar gyfer ffigurau rhagorol ar gyfartaledd mewn perthynas â'r

dreth gyngor.

### **Gosod Gwres Canolog drwy Gynlluniau Prydles Central Heating Installation through Lease Schemes**

**C2 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar bolisi'r weinyddiaeth ar osod gwres canolog drwy gynlluniau prydles? (OAQ7792) [R]

**Edwina Hart:** The new home energy efficiency scheme that started on 6 November will provide the homes of the needy with central heating. The Assembly will pay for those systems through a finance leasing arrangement that will offer greater benefits than outright purchase and allow us to undertake 2,700 installations by March 2002, against 1,400 through outright purchase for the same level of funding.

**David Lloyd:** Mae angen sicrhau system weinyddu rymus ar gyfer y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yng Nghymru. A yw'r Gweinidog yn hyderus na fydd unrhyw oedi wrth weinyddu'r broses hon yng Nghymru a bod digon o gwmnïau cofrestredig i wneud y gwaith yn brydlon?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you for that extremely valid point. I am led to believe by my officials that I can be confident that there will not be delays, but in the light of your comments, I will make further inquiries and reply to your concern. It is essential that this scheme is excellent, that we get the necessary take-up and that all the work can be undertaken. I will act on your point.

**David Melding:** Does the Minister agree that, in order for people to stay well, they need warm homes and that it is a major public health goal to keep homes as warm as possible? Not being able to afford to heat your home is a poverty indicator. Will you ensure that health is high on the agenda in assessing needy people?

**Edwina Hart:** The point of the home energy efficiency scheme for the installation of central heating, which provides a maximum grant of £2,000, is to consider those at greatest risk. That includes those whose health is affected by lack of heating. I hope

**Q2 David Lloyd:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the administration's policy on the installation of central heating through lease schemes? (OAQ7792) [R]

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref newydd a ddechreuodd ar 6 Tachwedd yn rhoi gwres canolog yn nhai'r anghenus. Bydd y Cynulliad yn talu am y systemau hynny drwy drefniant prydlesu ariannol a fydd yn cynnig gwell manteision na phryniant llwyr ac yn caniatáu inni osod 2,700 o systemau erbyn Mawrth 2002, o'u cymharu â 1,400 drwy bryniant llwyr ar gyfer yr un lefel o ariannu.

**David Lloyd:** There is a need to ensure a strong administrative system for the home energy efficiency scheme in Wales. Is the Minister confident that there will not be any delay in administering this process in Wales and that there are enough registered companies to complete the work on time?

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch ichi am y pwynt dilys iawn hwnnw. Caf fy arwain i gredu gan fy swyddogion y gallaf fod yn hyderus na fydd oedi, ond yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau, gwnaf ymholiadau pellach ac ateb eich pryder. Mae'n hanfodol bod y cynllun hwn yn rhagorol, ein bod yn sicrhau'r gyfradd dderbyn angenrheidiol ac y gellir ymgymryd â'r holl waith. Gweithredaf ar eich pwynt.

**David Melding:** A gytuna'r Gweinidog bod angen cartrefi cynnes ar bobl er mwyn eu cadw'n iach a bod cadw cartrefi mor gynnes â phosibl yn brif nod iechyd cyhoeddus? Mae peidio â gallu fforddio gwresogi eich cartref yn ddangosydd tloidi. A wnewch chi sicrhau bod iechyd yn uchel ar yr agenda wrth asesu pobl anghenus?

**Edwina Hart:** Diben y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref ar gyfer gosod gwres canolog, sydd yn rhoi uchafswm grant o £2,000, yw ystyried y rheini sydd yn wynebu'r risg fwyaf. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y rheini yr effeithir ar eu hiechyd oherwydd y

that the scheme will assist us with such issues. We are all aware of the links between lack of heating and poor health among old people, and their needs, particularly to get quality heating in their homes.

**Rosemary Butler:** I am pleased with your response to Dai, but I am concerned that this excellent scheme will not be implemented in my constituency because of bureaucracy. Can you assure me that there will be a clear run for people to apply? I think that they have until February to do so, but can they apply now or do they have to wait until February? It is essential that the companies that complete the work are *au fait* with the individual situations of these people.

**Edwina Hart:** In the light of your comments and those of Dai Lloyd, there are issues that I need to raise with officials. I, like you, would be concerned if bureaucracy affected the scheme's implementation and I will consider the bureaucratic challenges or hurdles and, if necessary, I will do some steamlining.

diffyg gwres. Gobeithiaf y bydd y cynllun yn ein cynorthwyo gyda materion o'r fath. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol o'r cysylltiadau rhwng diffyg gwresogi ac iechyd gwael ymysg hen bobl, a'u hanghenion, yn arbennig i gael system wresogi o ansawdd yn eu cartrefi.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ar eich ymateb i Dai, ond pryderaf na weithredir y cynllun rhagorol hwn yn fy etholaeth oherwydd biwrocratiaeth. A allwch fy sicrhau y bydd gan bobl ryddid i wneud cais? Credaf fod ganddynt tan fis Chwefror i wneud hynny, ond a allant wneud cais yn awr neu a fydd yn rhaid iddynt aros tan fis Chwefror? Mae'n hanfodol bod y cwmnïau sydd yn cwblhau'r gwaith yn gyfarwydd â sefyllfaoedd unigol y bobl hyn.

**Edwina Hart:** Yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau a rhai Dai Lloyd, mae materion y mae angen imi eu codi gyda swyddogion. Byddwn, fel chi, yn pryderu be bai biwrocratiaeth yn effeithio ar weithrediad y cynllun a byddaf yn ystyried yr heriau neu'r rhwystrau biwrocraidd ac, os bydd angen, cyflymaf y broses.

### **Ailddatblygu Cymunedau Abertawe Redevelopment of Swansea Communities**

**Q3 Alun Cairns:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the redevelopment of communities in Swansea? (OAQ7862)

**Edwina Hart:** The Assembly is committed to tackling social disadvantage and developing an improved quality of life in all communities in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** Given that many parts of Wales have recently experienced horrendous flooding, will you join me in congratulating the City and County of Swansea, which offered a universal flood defence support policy to all tenants, be they private or council house tenants? In congratulating Swansea, will you also condemn Cardiff City and County Council, which offered flood defence support exclusively to council-owned property?

**Edwina Hart:** The Labour authority in

**C3 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar ailddatblygu cymunedau yn Abertawe? (OAQ7862)

**Edwina Hart:** Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais gymdeithasol a datblygu gwell ansawdd bywyd ym mhob cymuned yng Nghymru.

**Alun Cairns:** O gofio bod sawl rhan o Gymru wedi dioddef llifogydd erchyll yn ddiweddar, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Dinas a Sir Abertawe, a gynigiodd bolisi cymorth cyffredinol o ran amddiffynfeydd llifogydd i'w holl denantiaid, boed yn denantiaid preifat neu'n denantiaid tai cyngor? Wrth longyfarch Abertawe, a gondemniwch Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd hefyd, a gynigiodd gymorth o ran amddiffynfeydd llifogydd i eiddo sydd yn berchen i'r cyngor yn unig?

**Edwina Hart:** Bydd yr awdurdod Llafur yn

Swansea will be delighted to hear your comments and I join you in congratulating the Labour authority concerned. I will not condemn Cardiff because the issue is a matter for the local authority.

Abertawe yn falch o glywed eich sylwadau ac ymunaf â chi i longyfarch yr awdurdod Llafur dan sylw. Ni chondemniaf Gaerdydd oherwydd mae hwn yn fater i'r awdurdod lleol.

**Peter Black:** Will you consider the concerns of the People in Communities project in Blaenymaes, Swansea, about future funding and help to ensure that the project continues into the next financial year?

**Peter Black:** A ystyriwch bryderon y prosiect Pobl mewn Cymunedau ym Mlaenymaes, Abertawe, ynglŷn ag ariannu yn y dyfodol a helpu i sicrhau bod y prosiect yn parhau i mewn i'r flwyddyn ariannol nesaf?

**Edwina Hart:** I will consider that point, because I do not want any successful projects across Wales to fail, as some of them have been so valuable in developing community capacity.

**Edwina Hart:** Byddaf yn ystyried y pwynt hwnnw oherwydd nad wyf am i unrhyw brosiectau llwyddiannus ledled Cymru fethu, gan y bu rhai ohonynt mor werthfawr wrth ddatblygu gallu cymunedol.

**Janet Davies:** On the redevelopment of communities in Swansea, at the last South East Wales Regional Committee meeting, it was stated that a community of 6,000 people in Cardiff had received £18 million for redevelopment. Will you fund communities in Swansea proportionately at that level?

**Janet Davies:** O ran ailddatblygu cymunedau yn Abertawe, yng nghyfarfod diwethaf Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y De-ddwyrain, nodwyd bod cymuned o 6,000 o bobl yng Nghaerdydd wedi cael £18 miliwn at ddibenion ailddatblygu. A ariannwch gymunedau yn Abertawe yn gymesur ar y lefel honno?

**Edwina Hart:** I cannot answer that question off the top of my head, Janet, but I will be delighted to consider that. If you tell me which community in Cardiff it is, I will reply to you later.

**Edwina Hart:** Ni allaf ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw yn fyrfyfyr, Janet, ond byddaf yn falch o ystyried hynny. Os dywedwch wrthyf pa gymuned yng Nghaerdydd yw honno, rhoddaf ateb ichi yn ddiweddarach.

9:12 a.m.

### Mudiad yr Undebau Credyd Credit Union Movement

**Q4 Lorraine Barrett:** Will Edwina Hart make a statement on the progress of the credit union movement in Wales over the past year? (OAQ7763)

**C4 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart ddatganiad ar hynt mudiad yr undebau credyd yng Nghymru dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf? (OAQ7763)

**Edwina Hart:** I am pleased to say that the credit union movement is making good progress. There have been more than 4,000 new members in the last year, bringing the membership in Wales up to more than 14,000. The Assembly has provided £455,000 for 2000-01 from the Pathway to Prosperity fund towards a joint partnership project between the Wales Co-operative Centre and the Association of British Credit Unions Limited to support and develop the

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod hynt mudiad yr undebau credyd yn mynd rhagddo'n dda. Cafwyd mwy na 4,000 o aelodau newydd yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, gan ddod â'r aelodaeth yng Nghymru i fwy na 14,000. Darparodd y Cynulliad £455,000 ar gyfer 2000-01 o'r gronfa Ffordd i Ffyniant tuag ag brosiect partneriaeth ar y cyd rhwng Canolfan Gydweithredol Cymru a Chymdeithas Undebau Credyd Prydain Cyfyngedig i gefnogi a datblygu'r mudiad.

movement. Where possible, that funding and other funding resources are being used to match European funding opportunities. I had the pleasure of formally launching this project in the Assembly on international credit union day on 19 October and I thank Members who joined me on that day. We all agree, across all parties in the Chamber, that the credit union movement is excellent.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for those encouraging remarks. What progress have you made in establishing a credit union for the Assembly, which every Member would have the opportunity to join, as well as our support staff and civil servants?

**Edwina Hart:** The Wales Co-operative Centre, together with the main trade union here, the Public and Commercial Services Union, are considering ways of developing a credit union based on the National Assembly. That would be open to all Members and their staff. I understand that they are in discussions, but as you know, several issues surrounding the common bond would have to be addressed, such as whether it would be for the National Assembly itself, or whether it would extend to the community. Those issues cannot be rushed. It is essential that we build up support for a credit union, particularly among Assembly staff, rather than imposing it from the top. I hope that, during the next six months, progress will be made on this. It is essential that we demonstrate good practice in the Assembly. I would not want people to think that credit unions are for the poor. They are not. Credit unions are for everyone and the experience in America is important in that regard. It would be wonderful if we had a credit union here for Assembly Members and the Permanent Secretary to join it. That would send out a clear message.

**Brian Hancock:** Thank you, Lorraine, for reading my notes and asking that question. I second it. Edwina, credit unions must pay business rates and are not classed as charities. Have you considered that, and will you do something about it?

**Edwina Hart:** I am often lobbied by credit

Lle bo hynny'n bosibl, defnyddir yr arian hwnnw ac adnoddau ariannol eraill i gyfateb â chyfleoedd ariannol Ewropeaidd. Cefais y pleser o lansio'r prosiect hwn yn ffurfiol yn y Cynulliad ar ddiwrnod undebau credyd rhyngwladol ar 19 Hydref a diolchaf i'r Aelodau a ymunodd â mi ar y diwrnod hwnnw. Cytuna bob un ohonom ar draws pob plaid yn y Siambr, fod mudiad yr undebau credyd yn rhagorol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch am y sylwadau calonogol hynny. Pa gynnydd a wnaethoch wrth sefydlu undeb credyd ar gyfer y Cynulliad, y byddai gan bob Aelod y cyfle i ymuno ag ef, yn ogystal â'n staff cynorthwyol a gweision sifil?

**Edwina Hart:** Mae Canolfan Gydweithredol Cymru, ynghyd â'r prif undeb llafur yma, yr Undeb Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, yn ystyried ffyrdd o ddatblygu undeb credyd yn seiliedig ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Byddai hynny'n agored i bob Aelod a'u staff. Deallaf eu bod mewn trafodaethau, ond fel y gwyddoch, byddai'n rhaid rhoi sylw i sawl mater ynghylch y cyswllt cyffredin, megis a fyddai ar gyfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei hun, neu a fyddai'n cael ei ymestyn i'r gymuned. Ni ellir rhuthro'r materion hynny. Mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn creu cefnogaeth ar gyfer undeb credyd, yn arbennig ymhlith staff y Cynulliad, yn hytrach na'i fynnu o'r brig. Gobeithiaf y gwneir cynnydd ar hyn yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf. Mae'n hanfodol inni arddangos arfer da yn y Cynulliad. Ni fyddwn am i bobl feddwl mai rhywbeth i'r tlawd yw undebau credyd. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae undebau credyd i bawb ac mae'r profiad yn America yn bwysig yn hynny o beth. Byddai'n wych pe bai gennym undeb credyd yma er mwyn i Aelodau'r Cynulliad a'r Ysgrifennydd Parhaol ymuno ag ef. Byddai hynny'n anfon neges glir.

**Brian Hancock:** Diolch, Lorraine, am ddarllen fy nodiadau a gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw. Eiliaf ef. Edwina, rhaid i undebau credyd dalu cyfraddau busnes ac ni chânt eu hystyried yn elusennau. A ydych wedi ystyried hynny, ac a wnewch rywbeth yn ei gylch?

**Edwina Hart:** Caf fy lobio yn aml gan



unions about issues regarding their position when they have premises and so on. I will take that point forward. It must be dealt with nationally. We must consider the role of credit unions and the help that they can offer in terms of the UK as well as Wales. I will inform you of my representations after I have made them.

**Christine Gwyther:** I am pleased to hear that you are supporting the joining of credit unions by the well-off—as Assembly Members doubtless are—as well as by those who are less well-off. We must be imaginative about credit unions. In my constituency, the Landsker credit union uses rurality as its common bond. That is an exciting development for rural Wales. I add that it lies in Pembrokeshire, which—as we know—is in rural Wales. The leader of the Welsh Conservatives forgets to mention, when he talks about standard spending assessments, that Pembrokeshire had a healthy SSA from you Edwina. I thank you for that.

**Edwina Hart:** I am keen on credit unions, and rurality is applicable to a common bond. We have had successful credit unions in rural areas. Long may they continue.

undebau credyd ynghylch materion sydd yn ymwneud â'u sefyllfa pan fydd ganddynt eiddo ac yn y blaen. Byddaf yn gweithredu ar y pwynt hwnnw. Mae'n rhaid ymdrin ag ef yn genedlaethol. Rhaid inni ystyried rôl undebau credyd a'r cymorth y gallant ei gynnig yn nhermau'r DU yn ogystal â Chymru. Fe'ch hysbysaf o'm sylwadau ar ôl imi eu rhoi.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn cefnogi'r ffaith bod pobl gefnog—fel y mae Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ddiu—yn ogystal â'r rheini sydd yn llai cefnog, yn ymuno ag undebau credyd. Rhaid inni fod yn llawn dychymyg ynglŷn ag undebau credyd. Yn fy etholaeth, defnyddia'r undeb credyd Landsger wledigrwydd fel ei gyswllt cyffredin. Mae hwnnw'n ddatblygiad cyffrous i Gymru wledig. Ychwanegaf ei fod yn Sir Benfro, sydd—fel y gwyddom—yn y Gymru wledig. Mae arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn anghofio dweud, pan sonia am asesiadau gwariant safonol, fod Sir Benfro wedi cael asesiad gwariant safonol iach gennych Edwina. Diolch ichi am hynny.

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn frwd dros undebau credyd, ac mae gwledigrwydd yn berthnasol i gyswllt cyffredin. Cawsom undebau credyd llwyddiannus mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Hir oes iddynt.

### **Gwaith Atgyweirio Tai sydd wedi Cronni yng Nghymru Backlog of Housing Repairs in Wales**

**Q5 Janet Ryder:** Will Edwina Hart outline the administration's policy for addressing the present backlog of housing repairs in Wales? (OAQ7789) [R]

**Edwina Hart:** Housing repairs is not an issue for the administration alone. It is an issue for all politicians and parties across Wales. We are committed to improving housing conditions in Wales. I have increased housing capital for the next three years in the draft budget. I have also urged all local authorities to consider all available options to maximise those resources.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that there is an estimated £700 million backlog of repairs needed in housing? As you said, in your partnership agreement, you have pledged £21

**C5 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff Edwina Hart amlinellu polisi'r weinyddiaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r gwaith atgyweirio tai sydd wedi cronni yng Nghymru? (OAQ7789) [R]

**Edwina Hart:** Nid yw atgyweirio tai yn fater i'r weinyddiaeth yn unig. Mae'n fater i bob gwleidydd a phlaid ledled Cymru. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i wella cyflwr tai yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi cynyddu cyfalaf tai am y tair blynedd nesaf yn y gyllideb ddrafft. Yr wyf hefyd wedi annog pob awdurdod lleol i ystyried yr holl opsiynau sydd ar gael i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar yr adnoddau hynny.

**Janet Ryder:** A gytunwch fod gwaith atgyweirio tai gwerth £700 miliwn ar gyfartaledd wedi cronni? Fel y dywedasoeh, yn eich cytundeb partneriaeth, yr ydych wedi

million over three years to address this problem. However, how do you intend for councils to fund the £729 million deficit?

**Edwina Hart:** We are considering a range of options that local authorities can undertake. The Local Government and Housing Committee, of which you are a member, is considering stock transfer. I have also indicated to the Committee that I want to consider the private finance initiative option, but it is essential that we continue to consider options that can assist local government in this regard. We must recognise that, although we are putting substantial increases of £5 million, £15 million and £20 million into housing capital over the next three years, we are reversing the trend by considering some of these issues. It is important that we look at the situation over approximately a ten-year period in clearing all the backlog and repairs. I would love to have a magic wand to have all the necessary money to deal with the issue, but I am afraid I do not. It is a question of prioritising, and to be fair to this administration, we give greater priority to housing than many of the administrations in the past.

**John Griffiths:** Your recent visit, Edwina, to Ringwood Hill in Newport East to meet residents of publicly provided housing with structural defects was greatly appreciated by residents and myself. Those people have suffered greatly for many years through no fault of their own. Will you assure those residents that you will leave no stone unturned in seeking a solution to those problems in conjunction with the local authority?

**Edwina Hart:** I was grateful for the invitation to visit them, and I have since started to look through the necessary paper work. I assure you that my predecessor, Peter Law, left no stone unturned in this area either. I will try to make further representations to the local authority and also consider any other avenues that I can pursue. However, I am aware of the human suffering that these individuals have experienced and the stress that they feel about their position. Nobody could fail to be moved when you meet them and listen to some of their stories.

addo £21 miliwn dros dair blynedd i ymdrin â'r broblem hon. Fodd bynnag, sut y bwriadwch i gynghorau ariannu'r diffyg o £729 miliwn?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr ydym yn ystyried ystod o opsiynau y gall awdurdodau lleol ymgymryd â hwy. Mae'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai, yr ydych yn aelod ohono, yn ystyried trosglwyddo stoc. Yr wyf hefyd wedi awgrymu wrth y Pwyllgor fy mod am ystyried yr opsiwn menter cyllid preifat, ond mae'n hanfodol ein bod yn parhau i ystyried opsiynau a all gynorthwyo llywodraeth leol yn hyn o beth. Rhaid inni gydnabod, er ein bod yn rhoi codiadau sylweddol o £5 miliwn, £15 miliwn ac £20 miliwn i gyfalaf tai dros y tair blynedd nesaf, gwrthdrown y duedd drwy ystyried rhai o'r materion hyn. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar y sefyllfa dros gyfnod o tua deng mlynedd wrth glirio'r holl waith sydd wedi cronni a'r holl atgyweiriadau. Hoffwn gael ffon hud er mwyn cael yr holl arian sydd ei angen i ymdrin â'r mater, ond yn anffodus nid oes gennyf un. Mater o flaenoriaethu ydyw, ac i fod yn deg â'r weinyddiaeth hon, rhoddwn fwy o flaenoriaeth i dai na llawer o'r gweinyddiaethau yn y gorffennol.

**John Griffiths:** Gwerthfawrogwyd eich ymweliad diweddar, Edwina, â Ringwood Hill yn Nwyrain Casnewydd i gyfarfod â thrigolion tai a ddarperir yn gyhoeddus sydd â diffygion strwythurol yn fawr gan y trigolion a minnau. Mae'r bobl hynny wedi dioddef yn aruthrol dros lawer o flynyddoedd ac nid hwy oedd ar fai. A sicrhewch y trigolion hynny y byddwch yn troi pob carreg i geisio dod o hyd i ateb i'r problemau hynny mewn cydweithrediad â'r awdurdod lleol?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr oeddwn yn ddiolchgar am y gwahoddiad i ymweld â hwy, ac ers hynny yr wyf wedi dechrau edrych drwy'r gwaith papur angenrheidiol. Fe'ch sicrhaf fod Peter Law, fy rhagflaenydd, wedi troi pob carreg yn y maes hwn hefyd. Ceisiaf gyflwyno sylwadau pellach i'r awdurdod lleol ac ymchwilio i bob dull a modd arall posibl. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o ddioddefaint dynol yr unigolion hyn a'r straen a deimlant ynglŷn â'u sefyllfa. Ni allwch ond deimlo trueni pan fyddwch yn cyfarfod â hwy ac yn gwrandao ar rai o'u

storïau.

**William Graham:** Will the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities make a statement, at a time of your convenience, regarding the drop in tenders advertised by local authorities particularly in respect of the high costs of capital work for housing?

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau ddatganiad, pan fydd yn gyfleus ichi, o ran y gostyngiad mewn tendrau a hysbysebair gan awdurdodau lleol yn arbennig mewn perthynas â chostau uchel gwaith cyfalaf ar gyfer tai?

**Edwina Hart:** Thank you, William, for drawing that issue to my attention. I will consider the issue with officials and reply to you and, if necessary, make a statement to Plenary.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolch, William, am dynnu'r mater hwnnw i'm sylw. Ystyriaf y mater gyda swyddogion a rhoddaf ateb ichi ac, os bydd angen, gwnaf ddatganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd Questions to the Minister for Environment**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae cwestiwn 1 wedi ei dynnu yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 1 has been withdrawn.

### **Mynd i'r Afael â'r Newid yn yr Hinsawdd yng Nghymru Tackling Climate Changes in Wales**

**C2 Cynog Dafis:** Pa fesurau sydd yn eu lle i fynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yng Nghymru? (OAQ7830)

**Q2 Cynog Dafis:** What measures are being taken to tackle climate changes in Wales? (OAQ7830)

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** The UK climate change programme that is published tomorrow sets out the Government's and the devolved administrations' strategic approach to tackling climate change. It focuses on action to reduce emissions over the next decade. It also starts to put in place measures that will allow us to reduce our dependence on fossil fuels and make a radical shift to more sustainable patterns of energy generation and consumption.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Mae rhaglen newid yn yr hinsawdd y DU a gyhoeddir yfory yn nodi ymagwedd strategol y Llywodraeth a'r gweinyddiaethau datganoledig tuag at fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd. Canolbwyntia ar gamau i leihau gollyngiadau dros y degawd nesaf. Mae hefyd yn dechrau rhoi mesurau ar waith a fydd yn caniatáu inni leihau ein dibyniaeth ar danwydd ffosil a newid yn radical i batrymau mwy cynaliadwy o gynhyrchu a defnyddio ynni.

**Cynog Dafis:** Felly, gallaf barhau â'm deialog â'r Cabinet ynglŷn â'r ffordd y mae ceisiadau cynllunio am gynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy wedi eu galw i mewn. Dywedodd Rhodri Morgan yn ddiweddar fod yn rhaid ichi ymateb gan fod Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn dweud bod hyn yn fater o bwysigrwydd cenedlaethol. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru wrthyf eu bod yn disgwyl cyfarwyddyd clir gan y Cabinet.

**Cynog Dafis:** Therefore, I can continue my dialogue with the Cabinet regarding how planning applications for renewable energy schemes have been called in. Rhodri Morgan recently said that you must respond because the Countryside Council for Wales have stated that this is a matter of national importance. However, the Countryside Council for Wales told me that they want clear guidance from the Cabinet.

Yng ngoleuni'r math o ddeunydd sydd yn y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, y byddwn yn ei drafod yn ddiweddarach, pryd y bydd Sue Essex yn dweud wrth Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru fod y Llywodraeth hon yn awyddus i weld twf ynni adnewyddadwy ac y dylent deilwra eu cyngor yn ôl y flaenoriaeth strategol honno?

**Sue Essex:** First, I will address the issue of calling in applications because Cynog and others have strong feelings on that. There have been 17 major applications for wind farm energy developments and of those we have asked for 13 to be called in. Of those 13, six have actually been called in. That was because those six hit the criteria of being of national importance. I emphasise that since my time in office, I have adhered to the criteria on calling in applications. I often ask officials whether the request for application meets the criteria and if it does, I take that on board. That does not mean that the development does not go ahead, but it will be delayed for a while and covered in a different way. There is now a review of the call-in procedure. The categories were put to the Committee in March. However, as part of the review, I am happy to consider the criteria for calling applications in if that would help you and others. I am keen to consider the procedures for it, as I know that causes local government frustration. That review will take place.

9:22 a.m.

Guidance has been available to the Countryside Council for Wales in the form of 'Planning Guidance Wales'. The message encourages development. As Cynog, I and anyone who has sat on the Planning Decision Committee knows, planning raises considerable controversy. The planning system must steer a path between often conflicting and competing interests. There are strongly-held different views. I will go into more detail about how we want to strengthen guidance to put in place the firmer base for making decisions that CCW and other organisations want in the sustainable development debate later on. That will be

In the light of the kind of material contained in the sustainable development scheme, which we will discuss later, when will Sue Essex inform the Countryside Council for Wales that this Government is eager to see the growth of renewable energy and that they should tailor their advice according to that strategic priority?

**Sue Essex:** Yn gyntaf, ymdriniaf â'r mater o alw ceisiadau i mewn gan fod gan Cynog ac eraill deimladau cryf ynglŷn â hynny. Bu 17 o geisiadau o bwys ar gyfer datblygiadau ynni ffermydd gwynt ac o'r rheini yr ydym wedi gofyn i 13 ohonynt gael eu galw i mewn. O'r 13 hynny, galwyd chwech i mewn. Yr oedd hynny am fod y chwech wedi bodloni'r meini prawf o fod o bwysigwrydd cenedlaethol. Pwysleisiaf fy mod, ers fy amser yn y swydd, wedi glynu wrth y meini prawf ar gyfer galw ceisiadau i mewn. Yn aml, gofynnaf i swyddogion a yw'r cais i wneud cais yn bodloni'r meini prawf ac os ydyw, fe'i ystyriaf. Ni olyga hynny nad yw'r datblygiad yn mynd yn ei flaen, ond caiff ei oedi am ychydig ac ymdrinnir ag ef mewn ffordd wahanol. Bellach mae adolygiad o'r weithdrefn galw i mewn. Cyflwynwyd y categorïau i'r Pwyllgor ym mis Mawrth. Fodd bynnag, fel rhan o'r adolygiad, yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried y meini prawf ar gyfer galw ceisiadau i mewn pe bai hynny'n eich helpu chi ac eraill. Yr wyf yn awyddus i ystyried y gweithdrefnau ar ei gyfer, gan y gwn fod hynny'n achosi rhwystredigaeth i lywodraeth leol. Caiff yr adolygiad hwnnw ei gynnal.

Bu arweiniad ar gael i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ar ffurf 'Arweiniad Cynllunio Cymru'. Mae'r neges yn annog datblygiad. Fel y gŵyr Cynog, minnau ac unrhyw un sydd wedi eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Penderfyniadau Cynllunio, mae cynllunio yn bwnc dadleuol iawn. Rhaid i'r system gynllunio lywio llwybr rhwng buddiannau sydd yn gwrthdaro ac yn cystadlu â'i gilydd yn aml. Mae barnau cryf gwahanol. Af i fwy o fanylion am sut yr ydym am gryfhau arweiniad er mwyn rhoi ar waith y sylfaen gadarnhach ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau y mae Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru a sefydliadau eraill am eu cael yn y ddadl ar

more appropriate. I have spoken to Cynog about this and he is happy for us to cover that further in that debate.

**Richard Edwards:** To broaden the scope of the question, do you agree that the brunt of the devastation caused by climate change is borne by people in the third world? I am thinking of drought in east Africa and the terrible flooding along the Brahmaputra valley in Assam and Bangladesh. People in the third world pay the heaviest cost for the polluting activities of developed countries, including our own. Do you not think that, aside from protecting ourselves in meeting the challenge of climate change, we also have a moral responsibility for the wellbeing of its innocent victims in non-developed third world countries?

**Sue Essex:** Richard is quite right to draw our attention to our global obligations. That is the purpose of the Kyoto protocol and the discussions in the Hague. I am pleased that the UK Government has taken a strong lead on this to put in place our commitments to reduce emissions. It is important that Europe and the developed world, including North America—it is important that North America brings this on board—understand the causes of climate change, our contribution to them historically and how we must progress in future. Richard is right that we need to take into account the developing countries of the world and consider how we can support rather than hinder them in their development and ensure that they develop in a sustainable way.

ddatblygiad cynaliadwy yn ddiweddarach. Bydd hynny'n fwy priodol. Yr wyf wedi siarad â Cynog ynglŷn â hyn ac mae'n fodlon inni gwmpasu hynny yn ddiweddarach yn y ddadl honno.

**Richard Edwards:** I ehangu cwmpas y cwestiwn, a gytunwch mai pobl yn y trydydd byd sydd yn dioddef fwyaf o'r dinistr a achosir gan newid yn yr hinsawdd? Yr wyf yn meddwl am y sychder yn nwyrain Affrica a'r llifogydd ofnadwy ar hyd dyffryn Brahmaputra yn Assam a Bangladesh. Y bobl yn y trydydd byd sydd yn talu'r gost fwyaf am weithgareddau llygredd gwledydd datblygedig, gan gynnwys ein gwlad ni. Oni chredwch, ar wahân i ddiogelu ein hunain wrth ateb her y newid yn yr hinsawdd, fod gennym gyfrifoleb moesol dros les ei ddioddefwyr diniwed yng ngwledydd annatblygedig y trydydd byd?

**Sue Essex:** Mae Richard yn iawn i dynnu ein sylw at ein rhwymedigaethau byd-eang. Dyna bwrpas protocol Kyoto a'r trafodaethau yn yr Hague. Yr wyf yn falch bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi cymryd yr awenau ynglŷn â hyn er mwyn rhoi ein hymrwymiaadau i leihau gollyngiadau ar waith. Mae'n bwysig bod Ewrop a'r byd datblygedig, gan gynnwys Gogledd America—mae'n bwysig bod Gogledd America yn ystyried hyn—yn deall achosion newid yn yr hinsawdd, ein cyfraniad tuag atynt yn hanesyddol a sut y mae'n rhaid inni ddatblygu yn y dyfodol. Mae Richard yn iawn bod angen inni ystyried gwledydd datblygol y byd gan ystyried sut y gallwn eu cefnogi yn hytrach na'u rhwystro yn eu datblygiad a sicrhau eu bod yn datblygu mewn ffordd gynaliadwy.

### Datblygu Llwybrau Beicio Developing Cycle Routes

**Q3 Ann Jones:** What recent discussions has Sue Essex had with cycling groups in Wales regarding the development of cycle routes? (OAQ7862)

**Sue Essex:** The development of local cycle routes in Wales is primarily a matter for the local authorities. However, I meet representatives of Sustrans and the Cyclists' Touring Club from time to time to discuss cycling issues in general. On 11 April, I

**C3 Ann Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae Sue Essex wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda grwpiau beicio yng Nghymru ynghylch datblygu llwybrau beicio? (OAQ7862)

**Sue Essex:** Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yn bennaf yw datblygu llwybrau beicio lleol yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, cyfarfyddaf â chynrychiolwyr o Sustrans a'r Cyclists' Touring Club o bryd i'w gilydd i drafod materion beicio yn gyffredinol. Ar 11 Ebrill,

attended the launch of the highly prestigious all-party Assembly cycling group, which was supported by the CTC, the Welsh Cycling Union and Sustrans. On 21 June, I officially opened the national cycle network in Wales at Cardiff City Hall.

**Ann Jones:** We all agree that we must do all that we can to encourage alternatives to using the car. One way of doing that is to provide adequate cycle routes. I understand that Wales is currently the only part of the United Kingdom that lacks a cycling strategy. When does Sue expect to be able to put such a strategy before the Assembly?

**Sue Essex:** I hope that a substantial part of the transport framework, which will be published fairly soon, will be devoted to cycling. It is important that that is integrated, as Ann says, into our whole approach to transport. We also have a transport forum, on which there are representatives with a wide interest in transport. Sustrans is represented in that forum. If aspects of developing that strategy and transport need to be taken forward, I would be happy to put in more effort and pay more attention to that, if that is what is needed.

**David Melding:** I am sure that the Minister agrees that cycle routes must be safe. They can be a hazard if they are designed poorly. Will she ensure that the networks are developed using best possible practice? The level of accidental death in Wales is unacceptably high.

**Sue Essex:** That is an important point. When I talked to cyclists, they said that safety was the main point to be considered when developing cycle routes. Some of our routes are none too safe. I also feel strongly about segregating cyclists from pedestrians. The more we encourage cyclists and walkers, the more we need to ensure that each have their own space. We need to learn from best practice in design and try to work with local government to incorporate it. I understand that it is difficult for some local authorities.

yr oeddwn yn bresennol yn achlysur lansio grŵp beicio clodfawr y Cynulliad sydd yn cynnwys pob plaid, a gefnogwyd gan CTC, Undeb Beicio Cymru a Sustrans. Ar 21 Mehefin, agorais y rhwydwaith beicio cenedlaethol yng Nghymru yn swyddogol yn Neuadd y Ddinas, Caerdydd.

**Ann Jones:** Cytuna pob un ohonom bod yn rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i annog ffyrdd amgen o deithio yn lle defnyddio'r car. Un ffordd o wneud hynny yw drwy ddarparu llwybrau beicio digonol. Deallaf mai Cymru yw'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig ar hyn o bryd heb strategaeth feicio. Pryd y bydd Sue yn disgwyl gallu cyflwyno strategaeth o'r fath gerbron y Cynulliad?

**Sue Essex:** Gobeithiaf y caiff rhan sylweddol o'r fframwaith trafndiaeth, a gaiff ei gyhoeddi cyn bo hir, ei neilltuo i feicio. Mae'n bwysig y caiff hynny ei integreiddio, fel y dywed Ann, yn ein hymagwedd gyfan tuag at drafndiaeth. Mae gennym fforwm trafndiaeth hefyd, â chynrychiolwyr sydd â diddordeb cyffredinol mewn trafndiaeth. Cynrychiolir Sustrans yn y fforwm hwnnw. Os bydd angen gweithredu ar agweddau ar ddatblygu'r strategaeth a'r drafndiaeth honno, byddwn yn fodlon gwneud mwy o ymdrech a thalu mwy o sylw i hynny, os mai dyna beth sydd ei angen.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytuna'r Gweinidog bod yn rhaid i lwybrau beicio fod yn ddiogel. Gallant fod yn beryglus os cânt eu cynllunio'n wael. A wnaiff sicrhau y datblygir y rhwydweithiau gan ddefnyddio'r arfer gorau posibl? Mae lefel y marwolaethau damweiniol yng Nghymru yn annerbyniol o uchel.

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Pan siaradais â beicwyr, dywedasant mai diogelwch oedd y prif bwynt i'w ystyried wrth ddatblygu llwybrau beicio. Nid yw rhai o'n llwybrau yn ddiogel iawn. Teimlaf yn gryf hefyd am wahanu beicwyr oddi wrth gerddwyr. Po fwyaf yr anogwn feicwyr a cherddwyr, y mwyaf y bydd angen inni sicrhau bod gan y ddau eu lle eu hunain. Mae angen inni ddysgu o arfer gorau mewn cynllunio a cheisio gweithio gyda llywodraeth leol i'w ymgorffori. Deallaf ei

These are existing urban areas where there are often narrow roads and there is competition for space between cars, cyclists and walkers, and also greenery. However, it is important, as you say, that we seek out examples of good practice and try to disseminate them.

fod yn anodd i rai awdurdodau lleol. Ardaloedd trefol sydd yn bodoli eisoes yw'r rhain lle mae ffyrdd cul yn aml a chystadleuaeth am le rhwng ceir, beicwyr a cherddwyr, a gwyrddni hefyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig, fel y dywedwch, ein bod yn ceisio canfod enghreifftiau o arfer da ac yn ceisio eu dosbarthu.

### **Targedau Ailgylchu yng Nghymru Recycling Targets in Wales**

**Q4 Brian Hancock:** Will Sue Essex make a statement on recycling targets in Wales? (OAQ7825)

**C4 Brian Hancock:** A wnaiff Sue Essex ddatganiad ynghylch targedau ailgylchu yng Nghymru? (OAQ7825)

**Sue Essex:** 'Waste Strategy 2000: England and Wales' sets out a range of targets on recycling. The Assembly will publish its waste strategy in the autumn of 2001, which will include a range of recycling targets. What those targets should be, and whether they should be statutory, will be considered in the preparation of the strategy.

**Sue Essex:** Mae 'Strategaeth Gwastraff 2000: Cymru a Lloegr' yn nodi ystod o dargedau ar ailgylchu. Bydd y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi ei strategaeth gwastraff yn ystod hydref 2001, a fydd yn cynnwys ystod o dargedau ailgylchu. Ystyrir beth ddylai'r targedau hynny fod, ac a ddylent fod yn statudol, wrth baratoi'r strategaeth.

**Brian Hancock:** Only 3 per cent of our household waste is recycled. That percentage is much lower than that of England and of other European countries. What practical measures will you bring forward to increase recycling in Wales?

**Brian Hancock:** Dim ond 3 y cant o'r gwastraff o'n cartrefi a ailgylchir. Mae'r canran hwnnw yn llawer is nag ydyw yn Lloegr a gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill. Pa fesurau ymarferol a gyflwynwch i gynyddu ailgylchu yng Nghymru?

**Sue Essex:** You are right that our record on recycling is extremely poor. Through setting recycling targets and asking local authorities to prepare recycling plans, hopefully, we will get the message through that we must make a major shift on this. We discussed this in the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee meeting yesterday. Money will be available in the budget to help local authorities, working with the voluntary sector, which has a strong role in helping to achieve those targets.

**Sue Essex:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod ein hanes ailgylchu yn eithriadol o wael. Drwy osod targedau ailgylchu a gofyn i awdurdodau lleol baratoi cynlluniau ailgylchu, gobeithio y llwyddwn i gyfleu'r neges bod yn rhaid inni wneud newid mawr mewn perthynas â hyn. Trafodasom hyn yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ddoe. Bydd arian ar gael yn y gyllideb i helpu awdurdodau lleol, sydd yn gweithio gyda'r sector gwirfoddol, sydd â rôl gref i'w chwarae wrth helpu i gyflawni'r targedau hynny.

**Christine Humphreys:** Do you agree that the only way to achieve an effective recycling strategy is for the Assembly to take a leading role and provide incentives to local authorities? Will you press the UK Government to widen the landfill tax credits to fund such a scheme so that we can achieve a truly national strategy in Wales?

**Christine Humphreys:** A gytunwch mai'r unig ffordd o gyflawni strategaeth ailgylchu effeithiol yw i'r Cynulliad gymryd rôl arweiniol a darparu cymhellion i awdurdodau lleol? A fyddwch yn gwasgu ar Lywodraeth y DU i ehangu credydau'r dreth dirlenwi i ariannu cynllun o'r fath fel y gallwn gyflawni strategaeth wirioneddol genedlaethol yng

Nghymru?

**Sue Essex:** On the second point, I have already done so, and will continue to do so. We need to ensure that those credits are used to support that mainstream change to which Brian referred. I am on record as having written to the Minister asking for the landfill tax regime to be changed, and I will continue to argue for that.

On the first point, about supporting local authorities and mainstreaming recycling, that must be done. It is critical that we tackle this home differentiation at source, so that people feel that they are part of it. I believe that the population is willing to do this. It is more difficult in some cases than others: in inner cities where there are many flats, it is hard to find storage facilities. However, we can find ways to do this. The policy is being developed. The critical issue is to involve everybody in their own house communities, so that they feel that they play an active part in contributing to that recycling scheme.

**Alun Cairns:** What consideration has the Minister given to promoting the recycling of sandbags for the benefit of homeowners in Cardiff who are being neglected by the Labour-controlled Cardiff City and County Council?

**Sue Essex:** I suppose that there is a certain degree of ingenuity in that question, if a little inaccuracy. I will wait for the facts that Jonathan has promised me and I will consider them. In Ely—I have discussed this with Rhodri Morgan—there was no discrimination on the ground. I was concerned about the point that you raised the other day. Rhodri said—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is answering questions on recycling.

**Sue Essex.** I will follow that up when I get the facts.

**Sue Essex:** Ar yr ail bwynt, yr wyf eisoes wedi gwneud hynny, a byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny. Mae angen inni sicrhau y defnyddir y credydau hynny i gefnogi'r newid prif ffrwd y cyfeiriodd Brian ato. Cofnodwyd fy mod wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog yn gofyn i'r system treth dirlenwi gael ei newid, a byddaf yn parhau i ddadlau dros hynny.

Ar y pwynt cyntaf, ynglŷn â chefnogi awdurdodau lleol a dod ag ailgylchu i'r brif ffrwd, rhaid gwneud hynny. Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â gwahaniaethu cartrefi o'r cychwyn, fel bod pobl yn teimlo eu bod yn rhan ohono. Credaf fod y boblogaeth yn fodlon gwneud hyn. Mae'n anos mewn rhai achosion nag eraill: yng nghanol dinasoedd lle mae llawer o fflatiau, mae'n anodd dod o hyd i gyfleusterau storio. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o wneud hyn. Mae'r polisi yn cael ei ddatblygu. Y mater holl bwysig yw cynnwys pawb yn eu cymunedau cartref, fel y teimlant eu bod yn chwarae rhan weithredol wrth gyfrannu at y cynllun ailgylchu hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** Pa ystyriaeth a roddodd y Gweinidog i hyrwyddo ailgylchu bagiau tywod er budd perchnogion tai yng Nghaerdydd a esgeulusir gan Gyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd a reolir gan y blaid Lafur?

**Sue Essex:** Tybiaf fod rhywfaint o ddyfeisgarwch yn y cwestiwn hwnnw, os nad ychydig o anghywirdeb. Arhosaf am y ffeithiau y mae Jonathan wedi eu haddo imi a byddaf yn eu hystyried. Yn Nhrelái—yr wyf wedi trafod hyn gyda Rhodri Morgan—nid oedd unrhyw wahaniaethu ar lawr gwlad. Yr oeddwn yn pryderu am y pwynt a godasoch y diwrnod o'r blaen. Dywedodd Rhodri—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb cwestiynau ar ailgylchu.

**Sue Essex:** Gweithredaf ar hynny pan gaf y ffeithiau.



**Rheilffordd Arfordir Gogledd Cymru  
The North Wales Coast Rail Link**

**C5 Gareth Jones:** A yw Sue Essex wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau â Railtrack ynghylch datblygu rheilffordd arfordir gogledd Cymru? (OAQ7828)

**Sue Essex:** My officials have recently been in discussion with Railtrack concerning the delay in implementing the speed improvements along the north coast main line. Although all the infrastructure is in place, design flaws have resulted in a delay in Railtrack being able to authorise drivers to travel at the optimum speed for the route.

On 11 October, my officials wrote to the north west zone director expressing our concern, and he has asked for an urgent review of the current installation, and hopes to be able to offer 90 miles per hour for some 12 miles of the route, and 85 mph for the remainder.

**Gareth Jones:** A allwch fy sicrhau mai yng Nghymru y gwariwyd y £500,000 a roddodd y Cynulliad i wella rheilffordd y gogledd, ac nid y tu allan i Gymru?

9:32 a.m.

**Sue Essex:** The £500,000 was given to Conwy council on behalf of the consortium in north Wales to make their local authority's contribution to the work. The money has been processed through the transport grant. That money has been spent in Wales. The difficulty has come because of an inaccuracy, as I understand it, in the design that Railtrack put in place. I am extremely unhappy about it, to put it mildly, because it gives off all the wrong signals. The Assembly wants to play its part in improving the railway line. We had high hopes of seeing this achievement on the ground. On behalf of people in north Wales and other users of that line, I am disappointed that it will be delayed. I assure you that we will pursue this vigorously.

**Alun Pugh:** In view of the chaos on the privatised railways, do you believe that Railtrack should be spending our money on

**Q5 Gareth Jones:** Has Sue Essex had any discussions with Railtrack regarding progress with the north Wales coast link? (OAQ7828)

**Sue Essex:** Yn ddiweddar, bu fy swyddogion yn trafod gyda Railtrack ynglŷn â'r oedi wrth weithredu'r gwelliannau cyflymder ar hyd prif linell arfordir y gogledd. Er bod yr isadeiledd i gyd ar waith, mae gwendidau cynllunio wedi arwain at oedi cyn y gall Railtrack awdurdodi gyrwyr i deithio ar y cyflymder uchaf ar gyfer y daith.

Ar 11 Hydref, ysgrifennodd fy swyddogion at gyfarwyddwr cylchfa'r gogledd-orllewin gan fynegi ein pryder, ac mae wedi gofyn am adolygiad brys o'r gosodiad cyfredol, ac mae'n gobeithio gallu cynnig 90 milltir yr awr am tua 12 milltir o'r daith, ac 85 milltir yr awr am y gweddill.

**Gareth Jones:** Can you assure me that the £500,000 that the Assembly gave to improve the north rail link was spent in Wales, and not elsewhere?

**Sue Essex:** Rhoddwyd y £500,000 i gyngor Conwy ar ran y consortiwm yng ngogledd Cymru i wneud cyfraniad eu hawdurdod lleol i'r gwaith. Proseswyd yr arian drwy'r grant trafniadaeth. Gwariwyd yr arian hwnnw yng Nghymru. Cafwyd anhawster oherwydd anghywirdeb, fel y deallaf, yn y cynllun a roddodd Railtrack ar waith. Yr wyf yn eithriadol o anhapus ynglŷn â hynny, a dweud y lleiaf, oherwydd mae'n rhoi'r arwyddion anghywir i gyd. Mae'r Cynulliad am chwarae ei ran wrth wella'r rheilffordd. Yr oeddem yn disgwyl gweld hyn yn cael ei gyflawni ar lawr gwlad. Ar ran pobl gogledd Cymru a defnyddwyr eraill y llinell honno, yr wyf yn siomedig y caiff ei oedi. Gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn yn ymdrin ymhellach â'r mater hwn.

**Alun Pugh:** Yng ngoleuni'r dryswch ar y rheilffyrdd a breifateiddiwyd, a gredwch y dylai Railtrack fod yn gwario ein harian ar

rail upgrades, rather than increased dividends to its shareholders?

**Sue Essex:** I could not possibly comment, Alun, but privately I will have a few words with you. It is vital, following on from the point I made to Gareth, that the Assembly is prepared to put its precious money into supporting these infrastructure improvements. There are many areas in Wales that need those improvements for us to make the leap forward in convenient and safe railway travel that we want to see. Once Railtrack has gone through this difficult period, where it must emphasise safety following the Hatfield accident—I understand that—when they have more capacity to enter into discussions again, I will want to ensure that we get our fair allocation of resources in Wales. I will be meeting—next week I think—with Tom Winsor, the rail regulator, and I will make these points.

**Peter Rogers:** The new A55 across Ynys Môn is nearing completion and there is concern that the bridges will not be able to cope with the extra flow of traffic. What are you doing to promote the shift freight from road to rail in the region?

**Sue Essex:** I am not aware which bridges you are talking about, but I will go back and check that. Are you talking about trunk road bridges?

**Peter Rogers:** I am saying that there will be too much traffic coming over the Menai Straits and if we could move that freight transport onto the railways—

**Sue Essex:** I will take up the point on bridges, but I am not aware of any bridges that are impeding that on the A55. I do not know whether you are referring to local roads.

In terms of freight, there are freight facilities, which have not been taken up, perhaps, in the way that we had anticipated. There has been a bit of underspend but it is in the budget for subsequent years. I want to see whether there is an opportunity to promote that. Some reports were done recently by the WDA, which I think will be helpful in promoting freight facility grants. We have been working with the CBI to identify opportunities for

uwchraddio rheilffyrdd, yn hytrach na buddrannau cynyddol i'w gyfranddalwyr?

**Sue Essex:** Ni allwn roi sylwadau ar hynny o gwbl, Alun, ond siaradaf â chi yn breifat. Mae'n holl bwysig, yn dilyn ymlaen o'r pwynt a wnes i Gareth, bod y Cynulliad yn barod i roi ei arian gwerthfawr i gefnogi'r gwelliannau isadeiledd hyn. Mae sawl ardal yng Nghymru sydd angen y gwelliannau hynny er mwyn inni gymryd y cam ymlaen o ran teithio cyfleus a diogel ar y rheilffordd yr ydym am ei weld. Unwaith y bydd Railtrack wedi mynd drwy'r cyfnod anodd hwn, lle mae'n rhaid iddo bwysleisio diogelwch yn dilyn damwain Hatfield—deallaf hynny—pan fydd mwy o allu ganddynt i ddechrau trafod eto, byddaf am sicrhau y cawn ein dyraniad teg o adnoddau yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn cyfarfod—yr wythnos nesaf fe gredaf—â Tom Winsor, y rheoleiddiwr rheilffyrdd, a chodaf y pwyntiau hyn.

**Peter Rogers:** Mae'r A55 newydd ar draws Ynys Môn bron wedi ei chwblhau ac mae pryder na fydd y pontydd yn gallu ymdopi â llif ychwanegol y traffig. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo symud llwythi o'r ffordd i'r rheilffordd yn yr ardal?

**Sue Essex:** Nid wyf yn ymwybodol pa bontydd y soniwyd amdanynt, ond af yn ôl a gwirio hynny. A ydych yn sôn am bontydd cefnffyrdd?

**Peter Rogers:** Yr wyf yn dweud y bydd gormod o draffig yn mynd dros Afon Menai ac os gallwn symud trafndiaeth llwythi i'r rheilffyrdd—

**Sue Essex:** Ystyriaf y pwynt am bontydd, ond nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw bontydd sydd yn rhwystro hynny ar yr A55. Ni wn a ydych yn cyfeirio at ffyrdd lleol.

Yn nhermau cludo nwyddau, mae cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau, na chafodd eu defnyddio, efallai, yn y ffordd a ragwelwyd gennym. Bu ychydig o danwario ond mae yn y gyllieb ar gyfer y blynyddoedd i ddod. Yr wyf am weld a oes cyfle i hyrwyddo hynny. Gwnaethpwyd rhai adroddiadau yn ddiweddar gan y WDA, a fydd, fe dybiaf, o fudd wrth hyrwyddo grantiau cyfleusterau cludo nwyddau. Buom yn gweithio gyda'r

taking this up. If this is successful I hope that we will be looking for more funds to go into that scheme, but we must show that we can spend that money.

CBI i nodi cyfleoedd i ddatblygu hyn. Os yw hyn yn llwyddiannus, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn edrych am ragor o arian i fynd i mewn i'r cynllun hwnnw, ond rhaid inni ddangos y gallwn wario'r arian hwnnw.

### **Strategaeth Rheoli Gwastraff y Cynulliad The Assembly's Waste Management Strategy**

**Q6 Lynne Neagle:** Will Sue Essex give an update on the Assembly's waste management strategy? (OAQ7812)

**C6 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff Sue Essex egluro'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf o ran strategaeth rheoli gwastraff y Cynulliad? (OAQ7812)

**Sue Essex:** The Assembly will publish a draft waste strategy for consultation in the spring and introduce a final document in autumn 2001. The strategy will be developed in partnership with key stakeholders and I am establishing a Wales waste forum so that we can take forward the strategic issues that need to be addressed, which will bring key players together. A paper considered by the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee yesterday sets out the issues in detail; we had a long discussion on this.

**Sue Essex:** Bydd y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi strategaeth rheoli gwastraff drafft ar gyfer ymgynghori yn y gwanwyn a chyflwyno dogfen derfynol yn ystod hydref 2001. Datblygir y strategaeth mewn partneriaeth â buddianwyr ac yr wyf yn sefydlu fforwm gwastraff Cymru fel y gallwn ddatblygu'r materion strategol y mae angen ymdrin â hwy, a ddaw a chwaraewyr allweddol ynghyd. Mae papur a ystyriwyd ddoe gan Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn nodi'r materion yn fanwl; cawsom drafodaeth hir ar hyn.

**Lynne Neagle:** As you are aware, waste management is an issue of particular concern in my constituency and many of my constituents were heartened that the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee agreed to seek an end to toxic waste imports as part of the Department of Environment, Transport and the Regions's ongoing review of the waste management plan. Are you able to provide any feedback on discussions that you may have had with DETR on this issue?

**Lynne Neagle:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae rheoli gwastraff yn fater o bryder penodol yn fy etholaeth i a chalonogwyd llawer o'm hetholwyr bod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth wedi cytuno i geisio dod â mewnfornion o wastraff gwenwynig i ben fel rhan o adolygiad parhaus Adran yr Amgylchedd, Trafnidiaeth a'r Rhanbarthau o'r cynllun rheoli gwastraff. A allwch ddarparu unrhyw adborth ar drafodaethau a gawsoch o bosibl â'r Adran ar y mater hwn?

**Sue Essex:** We presented the Assembly's comments. As yet I have not received the final response, but clearly those points have gone through. Within the waste strategy we must find places and consider hazardous waste, but that is not necessary as it is in your constituency, where you are discussing the import and export of waste.

**Sue Essex:** Cyflwynasom sylwadau'r Cynulliad. Hyd yn hyn ni dderbyniais yr ateb terfynol ond yn amlwg nodwyd y pwyntiau hynny. O fewn y strategaeth gwastraff rhaid inni ddod o hyd i leoedd a rhoi ystyriaeth i wastraff peryglus, ond nid yw hynny o anghenraid fel y mae yn eich etholaeth chi, lle y trafodwch fewnforio ac allforio gwastraff.

**Geraint Davies:** Do you agree that recycling should be the backbone of any waste management strategy, and that the reuse of items such as plastic bags and bottles should

**Geraint Davies:** A gytunwch y dylai ailgylchu fod yn asgwrn cefn unrhyw strategaeth rheoli gwastraff, ac y dylid annog ailddefnyddio eitemau fel bagiau a photeli

be encouraged? What proposals do you have to achieve this?

**Sue Essex:** That is an important point. Before you introduce recycling there is the reuse, reduce, reuse, recycle mantra that we all quote. In terms of the waste strategy, we hope to come forward with practical proposals that enable people to take that issue on board. It very much depends on partners. Retailers issue plastic bags. The UK needs to have a philosophy that retailers do the same as is done elsewhere in the world and go back to using ground paper and other forms. That is a part of reducing packaging and something that we need to take forward.

**William Graham:** Will the Minister ensure that systems that can convert waste products into refuse derived fuel via the process of pyrolysis are included in the waste management strategy?

**Sue Essex:** There will be a range of alternatives in the waste strategy that suggest technical ways of dealing with waste and that will be part of the waste forum's consideration.

plastig? Pa gynigion sydd gennych i gyflawni hyn?

**Sue Essex:** Mae hynny'n bwynt pwysig. Cyn ichi gyflwyno ailgylchu mae'r mantra aildddefnyddio, lleihau, aildddefnyddio, ailgylchu a ddyfynnir gan bob un ohonom. Yn nhermau'r strategaeth gwastraff, gobeithiwn gyflwyno cynigion ymarferol sydd yn galluogi pobl i gynnwys y mater hwnnw. Mae'n dibynnu llawer iawn ar bartneriaid. Mae manwerthwyr yn dosbarthu bagiau plastig. Mae angen i'r DU fod ag athroniaeth bod manwerthwyr yn gwneud yr un peth ag y gwneir mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd a mynd yn ôl i ddefnyddio papur garw a ffurfiau eraill. Mae hynny'n rhan o leihau pecynnu a rhywbeth y mae angen i bob un ohonom ei ddatblygu.

**William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog sicrhau y cynhwysir systemau sydd yn trosi cynnyrch gwastraff yn danwydd sydd yn tarddu o wastraff drwy'r broses pyrolysis yn y strategaeth rheoli gwastraff?

**Sue Essex:** Bydd ystod o ddewisiadau eraill yn y strategaeth gwastraff a fydd yn awgrymu ffyrdd technegol o ymdrin â gwastraff a bydd hynny'n rhan o ystyriaeth y fforwm gwastraff.

### **Datganiad ar Gynllun Iawndal Bellwin Statement on the Bellwin Compensation Scheme**

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I made the following statement to the Local Government and Housing Committee yesterday, and I feel that it is appropriate, with your agreement, Presiding Officer, to make the same statement to the Assembly.

On Monday, I announced the activation of the Bellwin scheme in Wales, which covers the cost to local authorities of taking immediate action to safeguard life or property or to prevent suffering or severe inconvenience.

The grant rate is normally 85 per cent from Government, but for the purposes of this particular emergency grant, it will be paid to local authorities at the rate of 100 per cent for

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Gwneuthum y datganiad canlynol i'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai ddoe, a theimlaf ei bod yn briodol, gyda'ch cytundeb, Lywydd, i wneud yr un datganiad i'r Cynulliad.

Ddydd Llun, cyhoeddais fod y cynllun Bellwin wedi cychwyn yng Nghymru, sydd yn cwmpasu'r gost i awdurdodau lleol o gymryd camau ar unwaith i ddiogelu bywyd neu eiddo neu atal dioddefaint neu anghyfleustra difrifol.

Y gyfradd grant fel arfer yw 85 y cant oddi wrth y Llywodraeth, ond at ddibenion y grant argyfwng penodol hwn, fe'i telir i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfradd o 100 y cant am

eligible costs above their threshold. This threshold is set at 0.2 per cent of revenue budgets. There is no fixed budget and all qualifying claims will be met.

Local authorities are not yet in the position to determine the extent of the claims that they will be submitting. Therefore, I do not yet know whether it will be necessary to approach the Treasury for assistance in accordance with the rules in the statement of funding policy. The grants paid under the Bellwin scheme are over and above the additional funding that we have already received from the Treasury, which is intended to help, repair and improve flood defences.

Expenditure likely to qualify for Bellwin support would mainly cover evacuating people and temporarily re-housing them, supplying food and other stores, maintaining key communications, clearing obstructions and debris and for staff overtime costs. It can also cover revenue costs for initial repairs to roads, but it would not cover capital expenditure nor would it provide reimbursement for costs that can normally be insured. It will be up to local authorities to assess the damage and submit claims, certified by district audit, to the Assembly for payment. All local authorities have been contacted and provided with the details of how they can submit claims.

Members of the Committee emphasised the importance of a rapid response by the Assembly to claims under the Bellwin scheme. I have undertaken to ensure that this happens.

The Bellwin scheme only covers revenue expenditure. I have issued all Members with a technical annex, which provides more details of the scheme and qualifying thresholds. I recognise that some authorities will have to undertake significant capital works to restore services and repair damage. Once the full extent of the problems and the cost of dealing with them becomes clear, I will review whether there is a case for any additional capital allocations from the Assembly for individual authorities.

gostau cymwys sydd yn uwch na'u trothwy. Pennir y trothwy hwn ar 0.2 y cant o'r cyllidebau refeniw. Nid oes cyllideb benodedig a chaiff pob hawliad cymwys ei dalu.

Nid yw awdurdodau lleol mewn sefyllfa eto i bennu graddau'r hawliadau y byddant yn eu cyflwyno. Felly, ni wn eto a fydd angen mynd i'r Trysorlys am gymorth yn unol â'r rheolau yn y datganiad ar bolisi ariannu. Mae'r grantiau a delir o dan gynllun Bellwin yn ychwanegol at yr arian ychwanegol a dderbynasom eisoes gan y Trysorlys, y bwriedir iddo helpu, atgyweirio a gwella amddiffynfeydd llifogydd.

Byddai gwariant sydd yn debygol o fod yn gymwys am gefnogaeth Bellwin i raddau helaeth yn cwmpasu symud pobl a'u hailgartrefu dros dro, cyflenwi bwyd a nwyddau eraill, cynnal cysylltiadau allweddol, clirio rhwystrau ac ysbwriel a thalu costau goramser staff. Gall hefyd gwmpasu costau refeniw ar gyfer atgyweiriadau cychwynnol i ffyrdd, ond ni fyddai'n cwmpasu gwariant cyfalaf nac ychwaith yn ad-dalu costau y gellir eu hyswrio fel arfer. Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau lleol fydd asesu'r difrod a chyflwyno hawliadau, wedi eu hardystio gan archwiliad dosbarth, i'r Cynulliad am daliad. Cysylltwyd â phob awdurdod lleol a rhoddwyd manylion iddynt am sut y gallant gyflwyno hawliadau.

Pwysleisiodd aelodau'r Pwyllgor bwysigrwydd ymateb cyflym gan y Cynulliad i hawliadau o dan gynllun Bellwin. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd.

Dim ond gwariant refeniw a gwmpesir gan y cynllun Bellwin. Yr wyf wedi dosbarthu atodiad technegol i bob Aelod, sydd yn rhoi rhagor o fanylion am y cynllun a'r trothwyon cymwys. Cydnabyddaf y bydd yn rhaid i rai awdurdodau wneud gwaith cyfalaf sylweddol i adfer gwasanaethau ac atgyweirio difrod. Unwaith y daw graddau llawn y problemau a chost ymdrin â hwy yn eglur, byddaf yn arolygu a oes achos dros ddyraniadau cyfalaf ychwanegol gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer awdurdodau unigol.

**Janet Ryder:** I welcome your statement and the assurances that you have given. As you said, Bellwin covers immediate action and works completed within about a two-month timescale. It does not cover, as you said, expenditure of a capital nature, any element of betterment or long-term work or repair and restoration. I appreciate that councils are not yet in a position to quantify and no one expects you to write blank cheques. However, because of the nature and significant widespread damage that has occurred, will you extend that two-month period considerably? I understand that you have the capacity to do that. I also ask that you consider making capital assistance available to councils immediately and provide, within the formula, the cost of betterment, where required, and the cost of long-term repair work. I also ask that you consider including, in this 100 per cent funding, the 0.2 per cent of the revenue budget that councils are expected to spend. For example, Flintshire is expected to spend about £300,534, and Denbighshire and Wrexham are expected to spend over £200,000 and £250,000 respectively. Councils would not normally expect to recover these costs under Bellwin. However, because of the nature and extent of the damage, will you consider refunding them this time and will you reconsider next year's capital allowances to councils? I realise that you referred to that in your statement.

9:42 a.m.

We would welcome your assurance that the money will be made available quickly and, where necessary, up-front to councils, or that assurances will be given to them that they can proceed with work immediately. Finally, after this has been settled, will you examine the Bellwin scheme to ensure that it covers more of the issues that have been raised, for example, capital costs and improvements?

**Edwina Hart:** On the matters with which I can deal, I will consider your points regarding the difficulties for local authorities in this regard and the scheme. I will reconsider those issues to see whether I can improve them.

**Janet Ryder:** Croesawaf eich datganiad a'r sicrwydd a roddasoch. Fel y dywedasoch, mae Bellwin yn cwmpasu camau uniongyrchol a gwaith a gwblhawyd o fewn amserlen o tua dau fis. Nid yw'n cwmpasu, fel y dywedasoch, wariant o natur cyfalaf, unrhyw elfen o wella neu waith tymor hir neu atgyweirio a gwaith adfer. Gwerthfawrogaf nad yw'r cynghorau mewn sefyllfa eto i feintoli ac nid oes neb yn disgwyl ichi ysgrifennu sieciau gwag. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd natur y difrod a'r ffaith ei fod wedi digwydd ar raddfa eang iawn, a fyddwch yn ymestyn y cyfnod dau fis hwnnw yn sylweddol? Deallaf fod y gallu gennych i wneud hynny. Gofynnaf ichi hefyd ystyried sicrhau bod cymorth cyfalaf ar gael i gynghorau ar unwaith a'ch bod yn darparu, o fewn y fformwla, gost gwella, lle bo'n ofynnol, a chost gwaith atgyweirio tymor hir. Gofynnaf ichi hefyd ystyried cynnwys yn yr arian 100 y cant hwn, y 0.2 y cant o'r gyllideb refeniw y disgwylir i'r cynghorau ei wario. Er enghraifft, disgwylir i Sir y Fflint wario tua £300,534, a disgwylir i Sir Ddinbych a Wrecsam wario dros £200,000 a £250,000 yn eu tro. Ni fyddai disgwyl i gynghorau fel arfer adennill y costau hyn o dan Bellwin. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd natur a graddau'r difrod, a ystyriwch eu had-dalu y tro hwn ac a ystyriwch lwfansau cyfalaf y flwyddyn nesaf i gynghorau? Sylweddolaf eich bod wedi cyfeirio at hynny yn eich datganiad.

Byddem yn croesawu eich sicrwydd y bydd yr arian ar gael yn gyflym a, lle bo angen, o flaen llaw i gynghorau, neu y rhoddir sicrwydd iddynt y gallant fynd ymlaen â'r gwaith ar unwaith. Yn olaf, ar ôl i hyn gael ei setlo, a fyddwch yn archwilio'r cynllun Bellwin i sicrhau ei fod yn cwmpasu rhagor o'r materion a godwyd, er enghraifft, costau cyfalaf a gwelliannau?

**Edwina Hart:** O ran y materion y gallaf ymdrin â hwy, byddaf yn ystyried eich pwyntiau o ran yr anawsterau i awdurdodau lleol yn hyn o beth a'r cynllun. Ailystyriaf y materion hynny i weld a allaf eu gwella.

At this stage, the 0.2 per cent requirement for local government will remain. I have no idea how much money will be contributed from local authorities. Under Bellwin, I must pay them in real terms. It might be necessary for me to go the Treasury to look for additional funds in this respect. If I do so, the first thing that the Treasury will consider is how this is kept to the 0.2 per cent that will be kept to in England. I do not want to endanger my negotiating position with the Treasury if additional funds are required from it. It is in that context that I make my comments about the 0.2 per cent.

On the issues for the future, Sue Essex, the First Minister and I will discuss how all this is likely to impact on future incidents of flooding in Wales. I hope that, when Sue receives the report from the Environment Agency—and I hope that that will happen shortly—we can work on the wider issue of flooding in Wales. We must decide what needs to be done in terms of local government and what type of capital expenditure will be needed over a period of years, and start to address those issues properly for the future in Wales. We will not want a repeat of the events of the last four weeks or so in 20 years' time.

**William Graham:** The Welsh Conservatives welcome the Minister's statement. I endorse Janet Ryder's comments and welcome Edwina Hart's response to them. However, nobody wants to wait 20 years for repairs or improvements. As Assembly Members, and as councillors, we are sick and tired of people coming to us repeatedly to complain about flooding. It seems that the same people are affected year after year, or month after month, depending on where they live and when floods and such troubles occur there. Will you redouble your efforts in that respect and ensure that a clear line is drawn so that, when people are affected, the local authorities cannot blame the Environment Agency and vice versa? Those concerns were presented to you yesterday, and I ask you to consider them and take them further.

Allegations against Cardiff City and County Council will be made in Westminster today. I

Ar yr adeg hon, bydd y swm gofynnol o 0.2 y cant i lywodraeth leol yn parhau. Nid oes syniad gennyf faint o'r arian a gaiff ei gyfrannu gan awdurdodau lleol. Yn ôl Bellwin, rhaid imi eu talu mewn termau real. Efallai y bydd angen imi fynd i'r Trysorlys i edrych am arian ychwanegol yn hyn o beth. Os gwnaf hynny, y peth cyntaf y bydd y Trysorlys yn ei ystyried yw sut y cedwir y swm o 0.2 y cant y cedwir ato yn Lloegr. Nid wyf am beryglu fy sefyllfa negodi gyda'r Trysorlys os bydd angen arian ychwanegol oddi wrtho. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw y gwnaf fy sylwadau am y 0.2 y cant.

Ar faterion y dyfodol, bydd Sue Essex, Prif Weinidog Cymru a minnau yn trafod sut y bydd hyn i gyd yn debygol o effeithio ar lifogydd yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Gobeithio, pan gaiff Sue yr adroddiad gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd—a gobeithio y digwydd hynny'n fuan—y gallwn weithio ar fater ehangach llifogydd yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni benderfynu beth sydd angen ei wneud yn nhermau llywodraeth leol a pha fath o wariant cyfalaf fydd ei angen dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd, gan ddechrau ymdrin â'r materion hynny yn gywir ar gyfer y dyfodol yng Nghymru. Ni fyddem am weld digwyddiadau'r pedair wythnos diwethaf yn digwydd eto ymhen 20 mlynedd neu fwy.

**William Graham:** Croesawa Ceidwadwyr Cymru ddatganiad y Gweinidog. Ategef sylwadau Janet Ryder a chroesawaf ymateb Edwina Hart iddynt. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai unrhyw un eisiau aros 20 mlynedd am atgyweiriadau neu welliannau. Fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ac fel cynghorwyr, yr ydym wedi hen ddiflasu ar bobl yn dod atom dro ar ôl tro i gwyno am lifogydd. Ymddengys yr effeithir ar yr un bobl flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, neu fis ar ôl mis, gan ddibynnu ar ble maent yn byw a phryd y bydd llifogydd a phroblemau o'r fath yn digwydd yno. A wnewch chi ddyblu eich ymdrechion yn hynny o beth, a sicrhau y tynnir llinell glir fel na all awdurdodau lleol feio Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, ac i'r gwrthwyneb, pan effeithir ar bobl? Cyflwynwyd y pryderon hynny ichi ddoe a gofynnaf ichi eu hystyried a'u datblygu ymhellach.

Caiff honiadau yn erbyn Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd eu gwneud yn San Steffan heddiw.

know, Llywydd, that you are not too keen on what happens elsewhere, but this is an important point about Cardiff. I trust, Minister, that you will use your best offices to ensure that, where flooding takes place in the city and county of Cardiff, remedial measures are taken by Cardiff council employees without discrimination, and without asking whether people are private householders or council tenants. They are all ratepayers and are entitled to full protection, as you rightly know.

**Edwina Hart:** You made those points eloquently in Committee. If allegations are made against Cardiff council and if any evidence can be given to me, I will fully consider that matter. Your other point is also important. It is always the same culverts and drains that seem to be the problem. Putting aside the wider scale problems in north Wales, which were a result of appalling weather conditions, the smaller scale flooding that occurred throughout Wales was due to culvert maintenance and drainage problems. That is an essential area that Sue Essex and I want to address. I agree that it is unacceptable that, every time that we have a heavy downpour, certain houses are always affected. It is important that the Assembly is seen to be discussing with local government, which will be part of the group, so that we can solve those immediate problems. As I indicated, I cannot do anything about the rainfall but we can do everything possible to stop flooding.

**Tom Middlehurst:** I thank the Minister for her prompt response to events in north Wales, and for her announcement of a full reimbursement of costs, above the Bellwin threshold. That is welcome by the authorities affected by the devastation of the last few weeks.

Will you assure us that you and your officials will respond as flexibly and as positively as possible to applications from local authorities? Will you also ensure that we avoid a bureaucratic logjam that will prevent urgent action being taken to give authorities the assistance that they desperately need under present circumstances?

Gwn, Lywydd, na phoenwch ryw lawer am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd mewn mannau eraill, ond mae hwn yn bwynt pwysig ynglŷn â Chaerdydd. Hyderaf, Weinidog, y gwnewch eich gorau yn rhinwedd eich swydd i sicrhau, pan fydd llifogydd yn digwydd yn ninas a sir Caerdydd, y cymerir camau unioni gan staff cyngor Caerdydd heb wahaniaethu, a heb ofyn a yw pobl yn ddeiliaid tai preifat neu'n denantiaid y cyngor. Maent oll yn drethdalwyr ac mae ganddynt yr hawl i gael eu diogelu'n llawn, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn.

**Edwina Hart:** Gwnaethoch y pwyntiau hynny yn huawdl yn y Pwyllgor. Os gwneir honiadau yn erbyn cyngor Caerdydd ac os gellir rhoi unrhyw dystiolaeth imi, ystyriaf y mater yn llawn. Mae eich pwynt arall yn bwysig hefyd. Ymddengys mai'r un ceffosydd a draeniau sydd yn achosi'r broblem bob amser. Ac eithrio'r problemau ar raddfa ehangach yng ngogledd Cymru, a ddeilliodd o dywydd erchyll, achoswyd y llifogydd a fu ar raddfa lai ledled Cymru gan broblemau cynnal a chadw ceffosydd a draeniau. Mae hwnnw'n faes hanfodol y mae Sue Essex a minnau am ymdrin ag ef. Cytunaf ei fod yn annerbyniol bod tai penodol yn cael eu heffeithio bob tro y cawn law trwm iawn. Mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn gweld bod y Cynulliad yn trafod gyda llywodraeth leol, a fydd yn rhan o'r grŵp, fel y gallwn ddatrys y problemau uniongyrchol hynny. Fel y nodais, ni allaf wneud unrhyw beth am y glaw ond gallwn wneud popeth sydd yn bosibl i atal llifogydd.

**Tom Middlehurst:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb prydlon i ddigwyddiadau yng ngogledd Cymru, ac am ei chyhoeddiad yr ad-delir costau'n llawn, yn uwch na throthwy Bellwin. Croesewir hynny gan yr awdurdodau a effeithiwyd gan ddinistr yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf.

A wnewch chi ein sicrhau y byddwch chi a'ch swyddogion yn ymateb mor hyblyg a chadarnhaol â phosibl i geisiadau gan awdurdodau lleol? A wnewch chi sicrhau hefyd ein bod yn osgoi tagfa fiwrocraidd a fydd yn atal camau brys rhag cael eu cymryd i roi'r cymorth sydd ei angen yn enbyd ar awdurdodau o dan yr amgylchiadau presennol?



**Edwina Hart:** I assure you that I do not want to see bureaucracy preventing work being undertaken. If Members have examples of that, particularly in the affected local authority areas, I ask them to advise my office immediately so that I can investigate and ensure that the necessary steps are taken. That is important. There is always much hearsay about such matters, so evidence would be gratefully appreciated if there are such issues that need to be dealt with.

**Christine Humphreys:** I thank Edwina for her statement. We welcome the fact that the money will be released under the Bellwin scheme. However, I endorse the comments of the previous speakers and stress the importance of the capital works that will have to be undertaken, such as the work on drains and culverts to which you referred. That can affect other capital expenditure in some of Wales's hard-pressed local authorities. Will you guarantee to look favourably at local authorities such as Flintshire, which have had what could be termed a 'less favourable' standard spending assessment settlement, so that any costs that they have incurred do not affect the rest of their capital budgets?

**Edwina Hart:** I must seriously consider the implications of the flooding and its impact on revenue. This is not only about drains and culverts, but about road restoration. Members have told me about villages that are effectively cut off, which can only be accessed along 800 feet of terrible roads. There are many issues to consider. I would be wrong to say 'yes' to you without having the full information in front of me. However, we will return to this issue and, once we have a clearer picture of what is going on, it will be appropriate for me to examine the budgetary and financial package. There are resource implications in all of this and we all want to do as much as possible to ensure that we deal with the flooding issue properly. Therefore, it is essential that I consider the budgetary position and what is achievable within it.

**Ann Jones:** I draw your attention to a problem that may arise as regards the emergency services. The emergency

**Edwina Hart:** Fe'ch sicrhaf nad wyf am weld biwrocraatiaeth yn atal gwaith rhag cael ei wneud. Os oes gan Aelodau enghreifftiau o hynny, yn arbennig yn ardaloedd yr awdurdodau lleol yr effeithiwyd arnynt, gofynnaf iddynt ddweud wrth fy swyddfa ar unwaith fel y gallaf ymchwilio iddynt a sicrhau y cymerir y camau angenrheidiol. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae llawer o sôn bob amser am faterion o'r fath, felly gwerthfawrogir tystiolaeth yn fawr os oes materion y mae angen ymdrin â hwy.

**Christine Humphreys:** Diolchaf i Edwina am ei datganiad. Croesawn y ffaith y rhyddheir yr arian o dan y cynllun Bellwin. Fodd bynnag, ategaf sylwadau'r siaradwyr blaenorol gan bwysleisio pwysigrwydd y gwaith cyfalaf y bydd yn rhaid ymgymryd ag ef, fel y gwaith ar y draeniau a'r ceuffosydd y cyfeiriasoch atynt. Gall hynny effeithio ar wariant cyfalaf arall mewn rhai o'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru sydd yn ei chael hi'n anodd. A sicrhewch yr edrychwch yn ffafriol ar awdurdodau lleol fel Sir y Fflint, sydd wedi cael yr hyn y gellid ei alw yn setliad asesiad gwariant safonol 'llai ffafriol', fel na fydd unrhyw gostau a gafwyd yn effeithio ar weddill eu cyllidebau cyfalaf?

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid imi ystyried yn ddwys goblygiadau'r llifogydd a'u heffaith ar refeniw. Mae hyn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â draeniau a cheuffosydd, ond ag adfer ffyrdd. Mae'r Aelodau wedi sôn wrthyf am bentrefi sydd fwy neu lai wedi eu hynysu, a gellir ond eu cyrraedd ar hyd 800 troedfedd o ffyrdd ofnadwy. Mae llawer o faterion i'w hystyried. Byddwn ar fai pe bawn yn dweud 'ie' wrthyf heb gael yr wybodaeth lawn ger fy mron. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn dychwelyd i'r mater hwn a, pan fydd gennym ddarlun cliriach o'r hyn sydd yn digwydd, bydd yn briodol imi archwilio'r pecyn cyllidebol ac ariannol. Mae i hyn i gyd oblygiadau o ran adnoddau ac yr ydym oll am wneud cymaint â phosibl i sicrhau yr ymdriniwn â mater llifogydd yn gywir. Felly, mae'n hanfodol fy mod yn ystyried y sefyllfa gyllidebol a'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni o'i mewn.

**Ann Jones:** Tynnaf eich sylw at broblem a allai godi o ran y gwasanaethau brys. Cafodd cyllidebau'r gwasanaethau brys a'r

services', and local authorities' budgets have had a hammering over the last few weeks. However, the emergency services are not funded to deal with flooding calls and so on. For example, the fire service's formula is based purely on fire calls, and I suppose that other emergency services are dealt with in other ways. I want to find a way of protecting the budgets of the fire service and the police in the months ahead. They have incurred additional resource and revenue costs. Can we include in this formula a contingency plan for the emergency services in the latter part of this financial year?

**Edwina Hart:** I am aware of the budgetary pressures on the emergency services. I am not directly responsible for Home Office and fire service issues, but I will consider funding issues that may arise from them. Yesterday, the Local Government and Housing Committee paid tribute to the work of the emergency services. I am sure, Presiding Officer, that you will join me in paying tribute to them for the excellent work that they have undertaken through the last difficult weeks. Where would be without them?

**Alun Pugh:** I thank you for your rapid and welcome response. Denbighshire is only just recovering from the hangover of the Rhuddlan Borough Council debt crisis, and was looking forward to a significant school improvements programme next year. Do you accept that it would be a tragedy if the horseshoe pass crisis was to replace the Rhuddlan debt crisis, and can I have assurance of sympathy towards requests for capital funding?

9:52 a.m.

**Edwina Hart:** I must look at all matters in the round. We are aware of the issues regarding the Horseshoe Pass, but there must be equality of treatment across the board in that respect. We must recognise the needs of all badly affected local authorities. It would be wrong of me, without all the detailed information that I require, to give a statement off the cuff today.

**Karen Sinclair:** At the beginning, Edwina,

awdurdodau lleol amser anodd iawn dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r gwasanaethau brys wedi eu hariannu i ddelio â galwadau llifogydd ac yn y blaen. Er enghraifft, seilir fformwla'r gwasanaeth tân ar alwadau tân yn unig, a thbybiaf yr ymdrinnir â'r gwasanaethau brys eraill mewn ffyrdd eraill. Yr wyf am ddod o hyd i ffordd o ddiogelu cyllidebau'r gwasanaeth tân a'r heddlu yn y misoedd i ddod. Mae ganddynt gostau adnoddau a refeniw ychwanegol. A allwn gynnwys gynllun wrth gefn ar gyfer y gwasanaethau brys yn y fformwla hwn ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon?

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pwysau cyllidebol ar y gwasanaethau brys. Nid wyf yn uniongyrchol gyfrifol am faterion y Swyddfa Gartref a'r gwasanaeth tân, ond byddaf yn ystyried materion cyllido a allai godi ohonynt. Ddoe, talodd y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Thai deyrnged i waith y gwasanaethau brys. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Lywydd, yr ymunwch â ni i dalu teyrnged iddynt am y gwaith rhagorol a wnaethant dros yr wythnosau anodd diwethaf. Beth fyddai ein cyflwr hebddynt?

**Alun Pugh:** Diolchaf ichi am eich ymateb prydlon a groesewir. Mae Sir Ddinbych newydd gael ei thraed dani ar ôl argyfwng dyledion Cyngor Bwrdeistref Rhuddlan, ac yr oedd yn edrych ymlaen at raglen gwella ysgolion sylweddol y flwyddyn nesaf. A dderbyniwch y byddai'n drueni pe bai argyfwng Bwlch yr Oernant yn cymryd lle argyfwng dyledion Rhuddlan, ac a allaf gael sicrwydd o gydymdeimlad tuag at geisiadau am arian cyfalaf?

**Edwina Hart:** Rhaid imi edrych ar bob mater yn ei holl agweddau. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r materion o ran Bwlch yr Oernant, ond rhaid cael cydraddoldeb triniaeth yn gyffredinol yn hynny o beth. Rhaid inni gydnabod anghenion pob awdurdod lleol yr effeithiwyd yn wael arnynt. Byddwn ar fai yn rhoi datganiad byrffyr heddiw, heb gael yr holl wybodaeth fanwl sydd ei hangen arnaf.

**Karen Sinclair:** Ar y dechrau, Edwina,

you talked about immediate action to safeguard life and property. We have a particular problem in Corwen, where a culvert floods every year. Would that fall into the category of protecting property? Nothing actually blew up, but every year the houses are flooded. It is a difficult grey area, but it needs to be addressed. Given the additional rainfall this year and the possibility of more later in the year and a repeat of the situation next year—although I hope not—where do areas such as Corwen fit into this?

**Edwina Hart:** As you have raised that point, my officials will look at it. It is a possible grey area, but I do not believe that it will turn out to be so. The rules may not necessarily apply to that. If you write to me with that example, I will try to clarify the issue. This issue will not only impact on you, it will also impact on other Assembly Members whose constituencies have been badly affected.

**Lorraine Barrett:** To save you trouble and to put the facts on the record, Cardiff council distributed over 2,000 sandbags during the recent floods. If residents wanted them delivered, that was done. I am assured by the officer who organised the sandbags that people are not asked if they are council tenants. In fact, the officer in charge of the operation was upset to hear the recent comments in this Chamber. He said that if people need help, they will get it. They are ratepayers and that is the end of the story.

**Edwina Hart:** I thank Lorraine for those comments, which help to clarify the position. If there is evidence that Members can provide to the contrary, I would be grateful to receive it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to respond to Lorraine Barrett's comments. The document that we used was from a senior official in Cardiff council. It is on the notice of motion for this afternoon's council agenda.

soniasoch am gymryd camau uniongyrchol i ddiogelu bywyd ac eiddo. Mae gennym broblem benodol yng Nghorwen, lle mae ceuffos yn gorlifo bob blwyddyn. A fyddai hynny'n syrthio i'r categori o ddiogelu eiddo? Ni ffrwydrodd unrhyw beth, ond bob blwyddyn mae'r tai yn dioddef llifogydd. Mae hwn yn faes annelwig anodd, ond mae angen ymdrin ag ef. O gofio'r glaw ychwanegol eleni a'r posibilrwydd o ragor yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn a'r un sefyllfa yn digwydd eto y flwyddyn nesaf—er y gobeithiaf na ddigwydd hynny—beth yw sefyllfa Corwen yn hyn o beth?

**Edwina Hart:** Gan eich bod wedi codi'r pwynt hwnnw, bydd fy swyddogion yn ymchwilio iddo. Mae'n ardal annelwig bosibl, ond ni chredaf mai fel hynny y bydd yn y pen draw. Efallai nad yw'r rheolau o reidrwydd yn berthnasol i hynny. Os ysgrifennwch ataf gan nodi'r enghraifft honno, ceisiaf egluro'r mater. Bydd y mater hwn yn effeithio nid yn unig arnoch chi, bydd yn effeithio hefyd ar Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad yr effeithiwyd yn wael ar eu hetholaethau hwy.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Er mwyn arbed trafferth ichi ac i gofnodi'r ffeithiau, dosbarthodd cyngor Caerdydd dros 2,000 o fagiau tywod yn ystod y llifogydd diweddar. Os oedd trigolion yn dymuno iddynt gael eu dosbarthu, yna gwnaethpwyd hynny. Dywedodd y swyddog a drefnodd y bagiau tywod wrthyf na ofynnir i bobl os ydynt yn denantiaid y cyngor. Yn wir, yr oedd y swyddog a oedd yn gyfrifol am y gwaith wedi cynhyrfu wrth glywed y sylwadau diweddar yn y Siambr hon. Dywedodd fod pobl yn derbyn y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt. Trethdalwyr ydynt a dyna ddiwedd y stori.

**Edwina Hart:** Diolchaf i Lorraine am y sylwadau hynny, sydd yn helpu i egluro'r sefyllfa. Os oes tystiolaeth y gall Aelodau ei rhoi i'r gwrthwyneb, byddwn yn ddiolchgar i'w chael.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ymateb i sylwadau Lorraine Barrett. Daeth y ddogfen a ddefnyddiasom oddi wrth uwch swyddog yng nghyngor Caerdydd. Mae ar yr hysbysiad o gynnig ar

It is part of a motion being moved by the Liberal Democrat and Conservative group and it states clearly that the local authority will provide flood protection and sandbags only to council properties to which it has legal obligation. It does not have the power or resources to provide flood protection and sandbags to private homes. The Lord Mayor of Cardiff has confirmed that. It may have happened in Ely, but that is the ward that the Lord Mayor represents. I can assure the Minister that it has not happened throughout the rest of the city.

**Janice Gregory:** I extend my sympathy to all those people who were badly affected, in north Wales predominantly, by the flooding. In my own constituency we were lucky. As you know, I represent a predominantly examining valley. Recent events have shown problems—where we did not believe any existed—with mine shafts and the collapsing of the ground. Will you consider discussing these issues with local authorities such as Bridgend County Borough Council, which has not budgeted for this kind of problem? Can I meet you officially to discuss the problems as soon as possible?

**Edwina Hart:** I would be delighted to meet you. The issue of mine shafts occurs in places other than the Ogwr constituency. We saw an example of it in England on the news. What happens to disused coal mines when they pump out water is a difficult issue. I will take that on board and will be delighted to meet the Member.

**The First Minister:** I speak neither as First Minister nor as First Secretary—following the Speaker's ruling in Parliament yesterday—but as the Assembly Member for Cardiff West. When I visited the constituency, on both sides of the river, in the Ely ward and in the Caerau ward—which the Lord Mayor does not represent—there were neatly stacked rows of sandbags by large numbers of private houses around the Riverside Terrace area of the Caerau ward and in Mill Road, Ely. They were distributed without discrimination as to whether they

gyfer agenda'r cyngor y prynhawn yma. Mae'n rhan o gynnig a gynnigir gan grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Ceidwadwyr a noda'n glir y bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn diogelu rhag llifogydd ac yn darparu bagiau tywod dim ond i eiddo'r cyngor y mae ganddo rwymedigaeth gyfreithiol iddynt. Nid oes ganddo'r grym na'r adnoddau i ddarparu diogelwch rhag llifogydd a bagiau tywod i gartrefi preifat. Mae Arglwydd Faer Caerdydd wedi cadarnhau hynny. Efallai iddo ddigwydd yn Nhrelái, ond dyna'r ward y mae'r Arglwydd Faer yn ei chynrychioli. Gallaf sicrhau'r Gweinidog na ddigwyddodd yn ngweddill y ddinas.

**Janice Gregory:** Estynnaf fy nghydymdeimlad i'r bobl hynny yr effeithiwyd yn wael arnynt, yn bennaf yng ngogledd Cymru, gan y llifogydd. Yr oeddem yn ffodus iawn yn fy etholaeth i. Fel y gwyddoch, cynrychiolaf hen gwm glo. Mae digwyddiadau diweddar wedi datgelu problemau—lle nad oeddem yn credu bod rhai yn bodoli—gyda siafftau a'r ddaear yn disgyn. A wnewch chi ystyried trafod y materion hyn gydag awdurdodau lleol fel Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr nad oes darpariaeth yn ei gyllideb ar gyfer y math hon o broblem? A allaf gyfarfod â chi yn swyddogol i drafod y problemau cyn gynted â phosibl?

**Edwina Hart:** Byddwn yn falch o gyfarfod â chi. Mae mater siafftau yn digwydd mewn lleoedd heblaw etholaeth Ogwr. Gwelsom enghraifft ohono yn Lloegr ar y newyddion. Mae'r hyn sydd yn digwydd i byllau glo segur pan fyddant yn pwmpio dŵr allan yn fater anodd. Byddaf yn ystyried hynny ac yn falch o gyfarfod â'r Aelod.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ni siaradaf fel Prif Weinidog Cymru nac fel y Prif Ysgrifennydd—yn dilyn dyfarniad y Llefarydd yn y Senedd ddoe—ond yn hytrach fel Aelod y Cynulliad ar gyfer Gorllewin Caerdydd. Pan ymwelais â'm hetholaeth, ar ddwy ochr yr afon, yn ward Trelái ac yn ward Caerau—nad yw'r Arglwydd Faer yn ei chynrychioli—yr oedd rhesi o fagiau tywod wedi eu pentyrru'n daclus y tu allan i nifer fawr o dai preifat o amgylch ardal Riverside Terrace yn ward Caerau ac yn Mill Road, Trelái. Fe'u dosbarthwyd yn ddi-wahân pa un

were council property or private property. I do not know from where Jonathan Morgan believed those sandbags came, but he should be aware of that before making remarks about Cardiff council.

**The Presiding Officer:** I hope that Peter Law is not going to talk about sandbags.

**Peter Law:** Yes I am, indeed. I thank Lorraine Barrett for clarifying the situation about the good practical work being done on the ground by Cardiff council. Does the First Minister agree that we have, once again, heard the Conservative windbags mislead the Assembly this time, on the subject of sandbags?

**Edwina Hart:** On the serious issue of flooding, it would not be appropriate for me to agree or disagree with you publicly.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for making that statement in Plenary.

a oeddent yn eiddo'r cyngor neu'n eiddo preifat. Ni wn o ble y credodd Jonathan Morgan y daeth y bagiau tywod hynny, ond dylai fod yn ymwybodol o hynny cyn gwneud sylwadau am gyngor Caerdydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Gobeithiaf nad yw Peter Law yn mynd i sôn am fagiau tywod.

**Peter Law:** Ydw, yr wyf, yn wir. Diolchaf i Lorraine Barrett am egluro'r sefyllfa am y gwaith ymarferol da sydd yn cael ei wneud ar lawr gwlad gan gyngor Caerdydd. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno ein bod wedi clywed, unwaith eto, y malwyr awyr Ceidwadol yn camarwain y Cynulliad, y tro hwn, ar bwnc bagiau tywod?

**Edwina Hart:** Ar fater difrifol llifogydd, ni fyddai'n briodol imi gytuno neu anghytuno â chi'n gyhoeddus.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch ichi am wneud y datganiad hwnnw yn y Cyfarfod Llawn.

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Rosemary Butler:** Point of order. I do not have a copy of the Standing Orders in front of me, therefore I am not sure which Standing Order this comes under. Given that inclusion is one of the Assembly's main planks, can I have an assurance that you will allow me to raise issues relating to Newport in due proportion to the number of times that Cardiff issues are raised in the Assembly. We have plunged to new depths this morning, by discussing, in the National Assembly, an item that is on the agenda for a Cardiff City and County Council meeting this afternoon. Therefore, when John Griffiths or myself raise issues relating to Newport during Plenary, will you give us the same amount of time as is wasted on Cardiff?

**Alun Cairns:** Further to that point of order, my statements in the Chamber this morning related either to questions that I asked or to a supplementary question asked by another Member, and were strictly in accordance with the code of conduct under Standing Orders.

**Rosemary Butler:** Pwynt o drefn. Nid oes gennyf gopi o'r Rheolau Sefydlog o'm blaen, felly nid wyf yn siŵr o dan ba Reol Sefydlog y daw hyn. O ystyried bod cynhwysiant yn un o brif themâu y Cynulliad, a allwch fy sicrhau y byddwch yn caniatáu imi godi materion yn ymwneud â Chasnewydd yn gymesur â nifer yr adegau y caiff materion yn ymwneud â Chaerdydd eu codi yn y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi suddo i ddyfnderoedd newydd fore heddiw, drwy drafod, yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, eitem sydd ar agenda cyfarfod Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd brynhawn heddiw. Felly, pan fydd John Griffiths neu minnau yn codi materion yn ymwneud â Chasnewydd yn ystod y Cyfarfod Llawn, a roddwch yr un faint o amser inni ag a wastreffir ar Gaerdydd?

**Alun Cairns:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, yr oedd fy natganiadau yn y Siambr y bore yma yn ymwneud naill ai â chwestiynau a ofynnais neu i gwestiwn atodol a ofynnwyd gan Aelod arall, ac yr oeddent yn hollol unol â'r cod ymddygiad o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog.

**Rosemary Butler:** I was not referring to Alun.

**The Presiding Officer:** Clearly not. I suggest to Members that during the Christmas constituency weeks, we should all take some time off to read the Protocol on Conduct in the Chamber. I will certainly do so myself. As regards the point about balance of local, regional, national and other interests, I attempt to secure, at all times and in all places, and especially during statements, that we have a representative viewpoint in the Chamber. We heard a number of statements on flooding. I tried to ensure that party spokespeople had an opportunity to contribute, where that was appropriate, and that all Members whose constituencies I knew to have been affected were allowed the same opportunity. I believe that it was during the last statement, but I stand to be corrected, that I invited Members to e-mail me if they felt that they had not had that opportunity. I assure you that, if references need to be made to any city or county in Wales—and I will not say especially to the county of Conwy—I will allow that. However, as it is controllable under Standing Orders, I will not allow time wasting in the Assembly through repetition of points which are clearly intended to prevent the progress of business and that have a party political nature. It is legitimate to raise points of concern, as we heard this morning in relation to Cardiff. Raising such points to enable Members to respond is legitimate and that is the purpose of the Assembly. However, the Assembly is not just about Cardiff; it is about Conwy and everywhere else.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Pwynt o drefn. Cyfeiriodd Rhodri yn fyr at ddyfarniad Llefarydd Tŷ'r Cyffredin ddoe ynglŷn â sut y dylid cyfeirio ato yn rhinwedd ei swydd. Mae'n debyg eich bod wedi gweld copi o'r dyfarniad erbyn hyn. Gofynnwyd i'r Llefarydd sut y dylid cyfeirio at Rhodri Morgan pan fyddai'n gofyn cwestiynau Seneddol. Dyfarnodd o blaid defnyddio'r teitl 'Prif Ysgrifennydd', nid 'Prif Weinidog Cymru'. A fu i Llefarydd Tŷ'r Cyffredin ymgynghori â Swyddfa'r Llywydd cyn gwneud y cyfryw ddyfarniad? A wnewch chi ein cynghori ar sut y dylem ni yn y

**Rosemary Butler:** Nid oeddwn yn cyfeirio at Alun.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hynny'n amlwg. Awgrymaf i'r Aelodau yn ystod wythnosau etholaeth y Nadolig, y dylem oll gymryd amser i ddarllen y Protocol ar Ymddygiad yn y Siambr. Yn sicr fe wnaif hynny fy hun. Ynghylch y pwynt am gydbwysedd buddiannau lleol, rhanbarthol, cenedlaethol a buddiannau eraill, ceisiaf ddiogelu, bob amser ac ym mhob man, ac yn enwedig yn ystod datganiadau, bod gennym safbwynt cynrychioliadol yn y Siambr. Clywsom nifer o ddatganiadau ar lifogydd. Ceisiais sicrhau bod llefarwyr y pleidiau yn cael cyfle i gyfrannu, lle bo hynny'n briodol, a bod pob Aelod y gwn i'w etholaeth gael ei effeithio yn cael yr un cyfle. Credaf mai yn ystod y datganiad olaf, ond yr wyf yn agored i gael fy nghywiro, yr estynnais wahoddiad i Aelodau anfon e-bost ataf pe teimlasent na chawsant y cyfle hwnnw. Fe'ch sicrhaf, os oes angen gwneud unrhyw gyfeiriadau at unrhyw ddinas neu sir yng Nghymru—ac ni ddywedaf yn enwedig at sir Conwy—byddaf yn caniatáu hynny. Fodd bynnag, gan fod modd ei reoli o dan y Rheolau Sefydlog, ni chaniatâf wastraffu amser yn y Cynulliad drwy ailadrodd pwyntiau a fwriedir yn amlwg i atal cynnydd busnes ac sydd o natur plaid wleidyddol. Mae'n ddilys codi pwyntiau o bryder, fel y clywsom fore heddiw mewn perthynas â Chaerdydd. Mae codi pwyntiau o'r fath i alluogi Aelodau i ymateb yn ddilys a dyna bwrpas y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, nid â Chaerdydd yn unig y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud; mae'n ymwneud â Chonwy a phobman arall.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Point of order. Rhodri referred briefly to the ruling made yesterday by the Speaker of the House of Commons as regards how he should be referred to ex-officio. I believe that you have seen a copy of the ruling by now. The Speaker was asked how Rhodri Morgan should be referred to during Parliamentary questions. He ruled in favour of using the title 'First Secretary', rather than 'First Minister'. Did the Speaker of the House of Commons consult the Office of the Presiding Officer before making that ruling? Will you advise us on how we in the

Cynulliad gyfeirio at Rhodri yn rhinwedd ei swydd—fel Prif Weinidog ynteu fel Prif Ysgrifennydd?

**Y Llywydd:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, galwaf ar y Prif Weinidog.

10:02 a.m.

**The First Minister:** Further to that point of order, I am not aware of any consultation with Cabinet Secretariat before the Speaker responded to the point of order raised yesterday by Robert Walter, a Conservative front-bench spokesman on Welsh affairs. I think that the same is true regarding the Office of the Presiding Officer. The House of Commons is a venerable and esteemed institution, as is the Speaker's office. However, it would have been more courteous to consult before the Speaker made this reference. We would not want to see the House of Commons's reference to its Standing Orders having any bearing on ours. The Government of Wales Act 1998 refers to 'the Assembly First Secretary' and 'Assembly Secretaries'. That is clearly what the legal title remains. However, there was no implication about what consistent principle is being applied here. Although I have not seen the Hansard record yet, I do not think that any reference was made to the Secretary of State for Home Affairs always being referred to by that name, rather than by the common usage title of Home Secretary. Until I have studied Hansard, it is not clear to me what principle the Speaker was using yesterday in making his divination on the titles that should be used in the House of Commons.

**William Graham:** This matter was raised yesterday as a point of clarification in the House of Commons. It does not refer to what happens here. The Welsh Conservatives are entirely content to abide by the Presiding Officer's ruling. The First Minister can call himself whatever he wishes.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i Ieuan Wyn am godi'r pwynt hwn. Yr oeddwn innau yn Llundain ddoe, mewn Tŷ arall, yn trafod materion cyfansoddiadol, sef Gogledd Iwerddon. Ni welais yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, ond mae'r cofnod ohono gennyf

Assembly should refer to Rhodri ex-officio—as First Minister or as First Secretary?

**The Presiding Officer:** Further to that point of order, I call the First Minister.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw ymgynghoriad ag Ysgrifenyddiaeth y Cabinet cyn i'r Llefarydd ymateb i'r pwynt o drefn a godwyd ddoe gan Robert Walter, llefarydd meinciau blaen y Ceidwadwyr ar faterion Cymreig. Credaf fod yr un peth yn wir ynghylch Swyddfa'r Llywydd. Mae Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn sefydliad hybarch ac uchel ei glod, yn yr un modd â swyddfa'r Llefarydd. Fodd bynnag, byddai wedi bod yn fwy cwrtais i ymgynghori cyn i'r Llefarydd wneud y cyfeiriad hwn. Ni fyddem am weld cyfeiriad Tŷ'r Cyffredin at ei Reolau Sefydlog yn cael unrhyw effaith ar ein rhai ni. Cyfeiria Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 at 'Brif Ysgrifennydd y Cynulliad' ac 'Ysgrifenyddion y Cynulliad'. Mae'n glir mai dyna yw'r teitl cyfreithiol o hyd. Fodd bynnag, nid awgrymwyd pa egwyddor gyson a gaiff ei chymhwysio yma. Er nad wyf wedi gweld cofnod Hansard eto, ni chredaf y gwnaethpwyd unrhyw gyfeiriad at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Cartref y cyfeirir ato bob amser wrth yr enw hwnnw, yn hytrach na defnyddio'r teitl a ddefnyddir yn gyffredin, sef Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Nes y byddaf wedi astudio Hansard, nid yw'n glir i mi pa egwyddor yr oedd y Llefarydd yn ei ddefnyddio ddoe wrth ddarogan y teitlau y dylid eu defnyddio yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin.

**William Graham:** Codwyd y mater hwn ddoe fel pwynt o eglurhad yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Ni chyfeiria at yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yno. Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn hollol fodlon i gadw at ddyfarniad y Llywydd. Gall Prif Weinidog Cymru ddefnyddio pa enw bynnag y dymuna.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank Ieuan Wyn for raising this point. I was in London yesterday, in another House, discussing constitutional issues, namely Northern Ireland. I did not see what occurred in the House of Commons, but I have the record of

o'm blaen. Cyn mynd ymhellach, gan mai dyma'r tro cyntaf imi gyfeirio ato, mae'n briodol imi longyfarch fy nghyfaill a'm cyn-gydweithiwr, y Llefarydd Martin, ar ei ddyrchafiad i'w swydd. Dymunaf yn dda iddo, oherwydd nid yw'n swydd hawdd.

it in front of me. Before progressing further, as this is the first time that I have referred to him, it is appropriate for me to congratulate my friend and former colleague, Speaker Martin, on his promotion to his post. I wish him well, as it is not an easy job.

Yr wyf bellach wedi gweld cofnod Hansard a phwynt o drefn Robert Walter, Aelod Seneddol Gogledd Dorset, sydd yn llefarydd ar Gymru ar ran y Blaid Geidwadol yn San Steffan. Cododd bwynt o drefn ynglŷn â Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 ac, yn benodol, y teitl y dylid ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer Prif Weinidog Cymru mewn cwestiynau a godir yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Dyfynnaf y Llefarydd:

I have now seen the Hansard record and the point of order raised by Robert Walter, the Member of Parliament for Dorset North, who is a spokesperson on Wales on behalf of the Conservative Party in Westminster. He raised a point of order regarding the Government of Wales Act 1998 and, specifically, the title that should be used for the First Minister in questions raised in the House of Commons. I quote the Speaker:

'The hon. Gentleman has made a fair point. Normally, the Table Office would have corrected the notices to use the First Secretary's correct title. I hope that the proper designation will appear on the Order Paper in future. However, I thank the hon. Gentleman for raising this matter.'

Yng ngholofn 927 o Hansard, gwelir y cwestiynau a atebwyd gan Is-Ysgrifennydd Seneddol Cymru, David Hanson. Yn ei gwestiwn, cyfeiriodd Nigel Evans ato fel 'Minister', fel sydd yn arferol yn San Steffan. Hynny yw, mae'n arferol yn San Steffan i ddisgrifio Gweinidogion fel Gweinidogion, neu gan ddefnyddio teitl cyffredin, fel y dywedodd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gynharach. Felly, nid oes cysondeb rhwng yr hyn a ymddengys ar bapur trefn Tŷ'r Cyffredin a'r hyn a ddywedir yno. Fodd bynnag, mater i Dŷ'r Cyffredin yw hynny.

In column 927 of Hansard, questions answered by David Hanson, the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Wales, can be seen. In his question, Nigel Evans referred to him as 'Minister', as is usual in Westminster. That is, it is usual in Westminster to describe Ministers as Ministers, or by using a common title, as the First Minister said earlier. Therefore, there is no consistency between what appears on the House of Commons order paper and what is said there. However, that is a matter for the House of Commons.

Fe gysylltaf â'r Llefarydd newydd heddiw ac anfon copi ato o Gofnod y Cynulliad ar gyfer 17 Hydref, pan gododd Alun Pugh bwynt o drefn ynglŷn â'r teitl 'Ysgrifenyddion'. Fel y cyfeiriodd William Graham, mae'r ateb a roddais yn egluro'r pwynt. Yr ydym yn bwriadu, ar fyrder, yn yr esboniad neu'r geirlyfr ar ddechrau ein Rheolau Sefydlog o dan y teitl 'Dehongli', gynnwys yr eglurhad y gellir cyfeirio at Ysgrifennydd o dan y Ddeddf, fel Gweinidog yn ôl Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Felly, mae ein safle yn glir ar y mater hwn ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth y Trefnydd, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, Prif Weinidog Cymru ac arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Nid oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ddoe o fewn ysbryd datganoli a byddaf yn ceisio gwneud iawn am

I will contact the new Speaker today and send him a copy of the Assembly's Record for 17 October, when Alun Pugh raised a point of order about the title 'Secretaries'. As William Graham mentioned, my answer clarifies the point. We intend, post-haste, to include, in the explanation or the glossary at the beginning of our Standing Orders under the title 'Interpretation', the explanation that a Secretary under the Act, can be referred to as a Minister according to the Assembly's Standing Orders. Therefore, our position is clear on this matter and I am grateful for the support of the Minister for Assembly Business, the Welsh Conservative Party, the First Minister and the leader of the opposition. Events in the House of Commons yesterday were not within the spirit of



hynny.

**Brian Hancock:** Point of order. I apologise for the fact that I forgot to declare an interest when I asked my question about recycling. I am a director of a small company that advises on safety and environment management matters.

devolution and I will try to put that right.

**Brian Hancock:** Pwynt o drefn. Ymddiheuraf imi anghofio datgan buddiant pan ofynnais fy nghwestiwn ar ailgylchu. Yr wyf yn gyfarwyddwr cwmni bach sydd yn cynghori ar faterion diogelwch a rheolaeth amgylcheddol.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 10.05 a.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 10.05 a.m.*

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales)**

#### **Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru The Welsh Joint Education Committee**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jonathan Morgan and amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Yr wyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Jonathan Morgan a gwelliant 2 yn enw Andrew Davies.

**Gareth Jones:** Cynigiau fod

**Gareth Jones:** I propose that

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*the National Assembly*

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gynnal trafodaethau gyda Chyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn*

*calls upon the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to hold discussions with the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the Welsh Local Government Association in order to*

*(a) cael dealltwriaeth glir ynglŷn â statws cyfreithiol ac amgylchiadau ariannol CBAC, gan sicrhau bod ffrwyth y trafodaethau hynny, gan gynnwys unrhyw awdit ariannol, yn cael ei ddwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad*

*(a) obtain a clear understanding of the legal status and financial circumstances of the WJEC, ensuring that the outcome of these discussions, including any financial audit is brought to the attention of the Assembly*

*(b) sicrhau bod camau effeithiol yn cael eu cymryd i ddiogelu dyfodol y corff cenedlaethol holl bwysig hwn.*

*(b) ensure that effective steps be taken to guarantee the future of this crucially important national body.*

Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy.

I declare an interest as a member of Conwy County Borough Council.

Yr wyf yn falch o gael y cyfle i gynnig y cynnig hwn yn enw Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Prif bwrpas y cynnig yw ceisio cael dealltwriaeth glir o statws cyfreithiol ac ariannol Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru ac, o gael hynny, cymryd unrhyw gamau angenrheidiol i ddiogelu dyfodol y corff hwnnw.

I am pleased to have the opportunity to propose this motion in the name of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. The motion's main intention is to try to gain a clear understanding of the legal and financial status of the Welsh Joint Education Committee and, having done that, to take any steps necessary to safeguard the future of that body.

Yn sgîl y ddadl hon a'r trafodaethau a fydd yn deillio ohoni, cawn well dehongliad a dealltwriaeth o gyfraniad a phwysigrwydd CBAC i addysg yng Nghymru heddiw. Hefyd, cawn ddeall beth yn union yw'r berthynas rhwng y corff hwnnw a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o ran disgwyliadau, cyfrifoldebau ac atebolrwydd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r sefyllfa yn aneglur a dweud y lleiaf. Byddai sefydlu a deall natur a goblygiadau y berthynas honno yn fodd i ni, fel Aelodau, ystyried rôl y corff mewn unrhyw gynlluniau a pholisïau addysgol cenedlaethol i'r dyfodol. Felly, mae hon yn ddadl o bwys.

Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod y corff yn gweithio'n dra effeithiol yn y maes arholi ac asesu. Mae cynnydd da wedi ei wneud yn ddiweddar yn y maes hwnnw, a ystyrir yn faes creiddiol i'r corff. Mae hefyd yn faes unigryw, gan ei fod yn ymwneud ag arholi drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac arholiadau Cymreig.

Yn yr un modd, mae'r gwaith a gyflawnir yn y maes hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon Cymru a chytundebau lefel gwasanaeth ag awdurdodau lleol yn gynyddol effeithiol a llwyddiannus. Nid oes ond angen imi gyfeirio at y gerddorfa ieuencid fel enghraifft o hynny. Er nad yw CBAC yn gorff cyhoeddus fel rhai eraill a noddir gan y Cynulliad, mae'n ymwneud yn anuniongyrchol ag arian cyhoeddus ac yn dibynnu, er enghraifft, ar ffioedd arholiadau oddi wrth ysgolion Cymru i gyflawni ei ddyletswyddau statudol.

Felly, yn ddi-os, mae CBAC yn chwarae rhan allweddol ac unigryw ym myd addysg Cymru. O'r herwydd dylai'r Cynulliad sicrhau nid yn unig ei fodolaeth, ond ei ffyniant. Dylai polisïau addysg y Cynulliad bob amser ystyried cyfraniad a dylanwad y corff cenedlaethol holl bwysig hwn. Yr unig ffordd o sicrhau hynny fyddai rhyddhau CBAC o'r gofynion statudol i dendro'n gystadleuol â byrddau arholi enfawr Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, mater arall yw hynny. Mae'n gweithio dan anfantais, o ystyried graddfa a maint byrddau arholi Lloegr.

Following this debate and the discussions arising from it, we will gain a better interpretation and understanding of the contribution and importance of the WJEC to education in Wales today. Also, we will be able to understand exactly what the relationship is between that body and the National Assembly in terms of expectations, responsibilities and accountability. At the moment, the situation is unclear to say the least. Establishing and understanding the nature and the implications of that relationship would be a way for us, as Members, to consider the role of the body in any national educational plans and policies for the future. This is, therefore, an important debate.

I am convinced that this body works effectively in the examination and assessment field. Good progress has been made recently in that field, which is considered to be a core area for the body. It is also a unique area because it relates to Welsh-medium examinations as well as Welsh examinations.

In the same way, the work that is undertaken in the field of in-service training for teachers in Wales and service level agreements with local authorities is increasingly effective and successful. I need only refer to the youth orchestra as an example of that. Although the WJEC is not a public body like other Assembly sponsored bodies, it deals indirectly with public money and depends, for example, on examination fees from Wales's schools to undertake its statutory duties.

Therefore, without doubt, the WJEC plays a vital and unique part in the world of education in Wales. Therefore, the Assembly should ensure not only that it survives, but that it prospers. The Assembly's education policies should always consider the contribution and influence of this crucial national body. The only way of ensuring that would be to release the WJEC from the statutory requirements to tender competitively with England's huge examination boards. However, that is another matter. It works at a disadvantage, considering the scale and size of England's

Os yw'r sefyllfa yn dderbyniol, pam yr ydym yn cynnal dadl ac yn galw am ddehongliad o'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol ac ariannol? Dros flwyddyn yn ôl, ar 30 Mehefin 1999, cyflwynais ddatganiad barn a oedd yn datgan pryder ynghylch y newid arfaethedig yn statws y corff. Yr adeg honno, byddai hynny wedi diddymu unrhyw ddylanwad a fyddai gan y Cynulliad ar ddatblygiad a pholisïau'r corff. Honnwyd hefyd nad oedd materion fel ag y dylent fod, yn gyfreithiol nac yn ariannol. Yr oedd hynny dros flwyddyn yn ôl. Cydnabuwyd pwysigrwydd y corff a gofynnwyd am gyfle cynnar i edrych yn fanwl ar y sefyllfa ac i wneud argymhellion. Er bod cefnogwyr fy natganiad yn cynnwys Mike German, Jonathan Morgan a John Marek—yr oedd ganddo gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol—ac er i nifer ohonom ysgrifennu at yr Ysgrifennydd Addysg Ôl-16 ar y pryd, gwrthodwyd y cais am ymchwiliad pellach.

10:12 a.m.

Yn ddiweddarach, tua phytnefnos neu dair wythnos yn ôl, cafwyd honiadau a chyhuddiadau yn y wasg a'r cyfryngau bod y Cyd-bwyllgor yn gweithredu ar sail gyfreithiol a oedd yn simsan, a dweud y lleiaf ac, o bosibl, yn anghyfreithlon. Yn yr un modd, cyfeiriwyd at broblemau ariannol, ac yr oedd cyfeiriad at y ffaith fod yn rhaid i'r corff glustnodi dros £400,000 fel cyllid argyfwng rhag ofn y byddai'n rhaid iddo dalu arian yn ôl i ffynonellau grantiau o Ewrop. Cyfeiriwyd hefyd at rwygiadau mewnol ac at gyflwr a pherchnogaeth yr adeilad. O wrando ar y cyhuddiadau hyn, byddai rhywun yn meddwl bod y sefyllfa yn dywyll iawn ac yn bygwth bodolaeth y corff a rhan holl bwysig o gyfundrefn addysg Cymru, sef yr adran asesu ac arholi. Pe digwyddai unrhyw fethiant, er mai perthyn i lywodraeth leol y mae CBAC, byddai'n sgîl-ffeithio'n drwm ar y Cynulliad. Yng ngolwg y cyhoedd, yn gam neu'n gymwys, byddai'r bai am unrhyw fethiant yn cael ei roi ar ysgwyddau'r Cynulliad. Yn naturiol, gyda'r holl sylw negyddol a gafodd y corff, ac y mae'n parhau i'w gael, a'r holl amheuan ynghylch ei hyfywedd, ein teimlad ni fel grŵp yw bod angen inni glirio'r awyr unwaith ac am byth

examination boards.

If the situation is satisfactory, why are we holding a debate and asking for an interpretation of the legal and financial situation? Over a year ago, on 30 June 1999, I tabled a statement of opinion expressing concern about the proposed change in the status of the body. At that time, that would have removed any influence that the Assembly would have had on the development and policies of the body. It was also claimed that matters were not as they should be, legally or financially. That was over a year ago. The importance of the body was acknowledged and a request was made for an early opportunity to look in detail at the situation and to make recommendations. Although the supporters of my statement included Mike German, Jonathan Morgan and John Marek—it had cross-party support—and although many of us wrote to the then Secretary for Post-16 Education, our request for a further inquiry was rejected.

Later, about two or three weeks ago, allegations and accusations were made in the press and the media that the WJEC was operating on a legal basis that was at best shaky and possibly illegal. In the same way, financial problems were referred to and it was mentioned that the body had to earmark over £400,000 as an emergency fund in case it had to repay money to European grant sources. Internal splits were also mentioned, as well as the condition and ownership of the building. From listening to these accusations, one would think that this was a bleak situation which threatened the existence of the body and an essential part of the Welsh education system, namely the assessment and examinations department. If any failure occurred, although the WJEC belongs to local government, there would be a severe knock-on effect on the Assembly. In the public's eyes, rightly or wrongly, the blame for any failure would be laid at the door of the Assembly. Naturally, with all the negative attention that the body has received and is still receiving, and all the doubts about its viability, our feeling as a group is that we need to clear the air once and for all so that its legal and financial status and its

fel bod ei sefyllfa gyfreithiol ac ariannol a'i berthynas â'r Cynulliad yn cael eu gwneud yn gwbl eglur i ni fel Aelodau.

Gan i'r Llywodraeth wrthod ein cais i wneud datganiad ar y sefyllfa gythryblus, ein teimlad fel grŵp oedd y dylem ddefnyddio amser penodedig ar gyfer dadl: y ddadl hon. Dyna'r unig ddewis a oedd yn agored inni. Dyna pam fod y ddadl yn cael ei chyflwyno ger bron y Cynulliad heddiw. Yr wyf yn falch o weld yng ngwelliant 2 Andrew Davies fod y Llywodraeth yn cydnabod yr angen i gynnal trafodaethau gyda CBAC a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn cael gwell dealltwriaeth ac eglurder ynglŷn â'r materion cyfreithiol ac ariannol hyn. Er hynny, nodwn gyda siomedigaeth amharodrwydd y Llywodraeth i fynnu'r trylwyredd a fyddai'n dod yn sgîl archwiliad ariannol. Mae'r gwelliannau, i raddau helaeth, yn cydfynd â'n dyheadau. Hyd y gwelaf, nid yw gwelliant Jonathan yn gwella na chryfhau ein hamcan, a chredaf fod gosod amserlen mor dynn â Ionawr 2001 yn wrthgynhyrchiol. Mae angen amser a phwyll i fynd i'r afael â hyn. Nid yw'r gwelliant yn mynnu, fel y gofynnwn ni, bod unrhyw archwiliad ariannol na'r hyn sydd yn deillio ohono yn cael eu dadlennu i Aelodau Cynulliad. Mae'r Cyd-bwyllgor yn cynnal archwiliad ar hyn o bryd ar yr Uned Ewropeaidd. Yn sgîl yr holl drafferthion sydd wedi bod a'r cyfeirio at hynny, teimlaf y dylai'r archwiliad hwnnw, o leiaf, gael ei gyflwyno inni ac y dylem gael unrhyw wybodaeth sydd yn deillio ohono. Apeliad ar Jonathan i dynnu gwelliant 1 yn ôl. Fel y saif ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn anfodlon ei gefnogi. Wedi dweud hynny, Lywydd, hoffem i'r cynnig gwreiddiol sefyll.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose amendment 1. Delete the words '*ensuring that the outcome of these discussions, including any financial audit is brought to the attention of the Assembly*' and replace with:

*and to lay a report outlining the conclusions of these discussions before the Assembly prior to the end of January 2001.*

On behalf of the Welsh Conservative group, I congratulate Plaid Cymru for bringing this issue to the attention of the Assembly. It is

relationship with the Assembly are made clear to us as Members.

As the Government rejected our request to make a statement on the troubled situation, our feeling as a group was that we should use the allocated time for a debate: this debate. That was the only choice open to us. That is why this debate is being presented to the Assembly today. I am pleased to see in Andrew Davies's amendment 2 that the Government recognises the need to hold discussions with the WJEC and the Welsh Local Government Association to achieve a better understanding and clarity on these legal and financial matters. Despite this, we note with disappointment the Government's unwillingness to demand the thoroughness that would stem from a financial audit. The amendments, in the main, concur with our aspirations. As far as I see, Jonathan's amendment does not improve or strengthen our objective, and I believe that setting such a tight timescale as January 2001 is counterproductive. Time and caution are needed to address this. The amendment does not insist, as we do, that any financial audit or its conclusions be disclosed to Assembly Members. The WJEC is currently undertaking an audit on the European Unit. Following all past troubles and the references to that, I feel that that audit, at least, should be presented to us and that we should receive any information that derives from it. I appeal to Jonathan to withdraw amendment 1. As it stands at the moment, we are unwilling to support it. Having said that, Presiding Officer, we would like the original motion to stand.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiaf welliant 1. Dileu'r geiriau '*gan sicrhau bod ffrwyth y trafodaethau hynny, gan gynnwys unrhyw awdit ariannol, yn cael ei ddwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad*' a rhoi'r canlynol yn eu lle:

*a gosod adroddiad yn amlinellu casgliadau'r trafodaethau hynny gerbron y Cynulliad cyn diwedd Ionawr 2001.*

Ar ran grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru, llongyfarchaf Blaid Cymru am dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at y mater hwn. Mae'n amlwg na

clear that we can no longer, even if we could in the past, rely on the Government to bring forward issues of such national concern. This issue has been rumbling in the press, among the people who are involved with the WJEC and others, for some time. As usual, it is up to the two opposition parties in the Assembly to try to focus the agenda. The Ministers on the front bench should welcome this debate because it was their esteemed colleague, Mr Michael German, who raised the matter in the first place. Perhaps next time Cabinet members will consult with each other before one of them decides to leak dynamite information such as Elizabeth Appleby's documents on her legal opinion regarding the legal basis of the WJEC. That legal document had wide ramifications and displayed what many believe to be shaky legal foundations. Bearing that in mind, it is crucial that this motion is passed today and that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is empowered by the Assembly to gain a fuller understanding of the legal position of this crucial organisation.

It is regrettable that no statement has been made thus far. Just because one Minister has had a local difficulty with this organisation, it should not prevent front-bench Members from coming forward with a statement offering advice to colleagues on what has been a problematic situation. I am disappointed that the Government of Wales has not seized the opportunity earlier and that it has taken this long to resolve. This has been a long-running concern, as we have outlined. If this concern has been raised previously with a former education secretary, I would like to know whether any discussions have taken place prior to the public statements, that were made by the Minister for Economic Development and people within the WJEC, and whether representations have been made in the past by the WJEC and its advisers. This is a serious situation and it needs to be resolved.

As has already been pointed out, the Welsh Joint Education Committee is a crucial body for the education system in Wales and, with ACCAC, our curriculum authority, it determines the shape of examinations in

allwn ddibynnu ar y Llywodraeth bellach i gyflwyno materion o bryder cenedlaethol o'r fath, hyd yn oed os gallem wneud hynny yn y gorffennol. Gwelwyd y mater hwn ar ffurf sibrydion yn y wasg, ymysg y bobl sydd yn ymwneud â CBAC ac eraill, ers peth amser. Fel arfer, y ddwy wrthblaid yn y Cynulliad sydd yn gorfod ceisio rhoi ffocws i'r agenda. Dylai'r Gweinidogion ar y meinciau blaen groesawu'r drafodaeth hon oherwydd eu cydweithiwr uchel ei barch, Mr Michael German, a gododd y mater yn y lle cyntaf. Efallai y tro nesaf y bydd aelodau'r Cabinet yn ymgynghori â'i gilydd cyn y bydd un ohonynt yn penderfynu rhyddhau gwybodaeth ffrwydrol i'r cyfryngau megis dogfennau Elizabeth Appleby ar ei barn gyfreithiol ynghylch sail gyfreithiol CBAC. Yr oedd gan y ddogfen gyfreithiol honno oblygiadau eang ac arddangosodd yr hyn sydd ym marn llawer yn seiliau cyfreithiol sigledig. O ystyried hynny, mae'n hanfodol y caiff y cynnig hwn ei dderbyn heddiw ac y caiff y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes awdurdod gan y Cynulliad i feithrin dealltwriaeth lawnach o sefyllfa gyfreithiol y sefydliad hanfodol hwn.

Mae'n anffodus na wnaethpwyd datganiad hyd yma. Ni ddylai'r ffaith bod un Gweinidog wedi cael anhawster lleol gyda'r sefydliad hwn atal Aelodau'r meinciau blaen rhag dod ymlaen gyda datganiad yn cynnig cyngor i gyd-Aelodau ar yr hyn a fu'n sefyllfa broblematig. Yr wyf yn siomedig nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi manteisio ar y cyfle yn gynharach a'i fod wedi cymryd cymaint o amser â hyn i'w ddatrys. Bu hyn yn bryder ers cryn amser, fel yr ydym wedi amlinellu. Os codwyd y pryder hwn yn flaenorol gyda chyn ysgrifennydd addysg, hoffwn wybod pa un ai a gynhaliwyd unrhyw drafodaethau cyn y datganiadau cyhoeddus ai peidio, a wnaethpwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a phobl o fewn CBAC, a pha un ai a wnaethpwyd sylwadau yn y gorffennol gan CBAC a'i gynghorwyr. Mae hon yn sefyllfa ddifrifol ac mae angen ei datrys.

Fel y nodwyd eisoes, mae Cyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru yn gorff holl bwysig ar gyfer y system addysg yng Nghymru ac, o fewn ACCAC, ein hawdurdod cwricwlwm, mae'n pennu ffurf arholiadau yng Nghymru a chaiff

Wales and has an impact on thousands of students who sit their examinations every year. Let us compare this to the Scottish situation. For example, it would be a disaster if the WJEC were to fall victim to a judicial review and had to cease trading. We are talking about an extreme, but if that were to happen, it would have a chaotic effect on students, including those who were applying to attend universities. Although I said that there is no direct comparison, one only has to look at the havoc that was wreaked in Scotland when the curriculum authority made serious mistakes and at the anguish that was caused for thousands of students during the last academic year. The front bench should take note of what happened to Sam Galbraith who was Minister for Education at the time. Very conveniently, Mr Galbraith was quickly reshuffled to another portfolio before calls for his resignation became deafening. I would hope that we could resolve any issues with the WJEC before they descended into the situation that we saw in Scotland.

The financial situation, as Gareth has indicated, is equally if not more important. If the WJEC continued to face such financial situations, as have been outlined, this would also have drastic ramifications. Therefore, it is crucial that we get straight answers on the health and wellbeing of the WJEC as it stands. I know that Plaid Cymru is not content with the amendment. I was not aware at that time that a full financial audit was being undertaken. Clearly, we wish to see the results of that financial audit as and when they are available. The reasons for tabling the amendment were that if another financial audit was commissioned, it would take a considerable period of time. As a group—

**Cynog Dafis:** Hoffwn ei gwneud yn glir i Jonathan Morgan nad yw ein cynnig yn galw am archwiliad ariannol newydd. Deallaf fod archwiliad ariannol yn cael ei wneud ar yr Uned Ewropeaidd. Credwn y dylai'r canlyniadau gael eu rhyddhau i'r Cynulliad ac y dylai o leiaf gasgliadau unrhyw archwiliad ariannol ehangach fod yn wybyddus. Deallaf fod sensitifrwydd ynglŷn â datgelu manylion ariannol CBAC, sydd mewn maes cystadleuol. Byddai'r manylion hynny felly ar gael i'w gystadleuwyr. Dylai'r

effaith ar filoedd o fyfyrwyr sydd yn sefyll eu harholiadau bob blwyddyn. Gadewch inni gymharu hyn â'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban. Er enghraifft, byddai'n drychineb pe bai CBAC yn agored i arolwg barnwrol ac yn gorfod rhoi'r gorau i fasnachu. Yr ydym yn siarad am eithafion, ond pe bai hynny'n digwydd, byddai'n peri anhrefn i fyfyrwyr, gan gynnwys y rhai hynny sydd yn gwneud cais i fynychu prifysgolion. Er imi ddweud nad oes cymhariaeth uniongyrchol, dim ond edrych sydd rhaid ar yr helynt a achoswyd yn yr Alban pan wnaeth yr awdurdod cwricwlwm gamgymeriadau difrifol ac ar y gofid a achoswyd i filoedd o fyfyrwyr yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf. Dylai'r fainc flaen nodi beth ddigwyddodd i Sam Galbraith a oedd yn Weinidog dros Addysg ar y pryd. Yn gyfleus iawn, ad-drefnwyd Mr Galbraith i bortffolio arall cyn i'r galwadau iddo ymddiswyddo ddod yn fyddarol. Gobeithiaf y gallem ddatrys unrhyw faterion gyda CBAC cyn iddynt ddatblygu i'r sefyllfa a welsom yn yr Alban.

Mae'r sefyllfa ariannol, fel y nododd Gareth, yr un mor bwysig os nad yn bwysicach. Pe byddai CBAC yn parhau i wynebu sefyllfaoedd ariannol o'r fath, fel yr amlinellwyd, byddai gan hyn hefyd oblygiadau difrifol. Felly, mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn cael atebion uniongyrchol ar iechyd a lles CBAC fel y saif. Gwn nad yw Plaid Cymru'n fodlon gyda'r gwelliant. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol ar y pryd bod archwiliad ariannol llawn yn cael ei gynnal. Yn amlwg, dymunwn weld canlyniadau'r archwiliad ariannol pryd a phan fyddant ar gael. Y rhesymau dros gyflwyno'r gwelliant oedd pe câi archwiliad ariannol arall ei gomisiynu, byddai'n cymryd cyfnod sylweddol o amser. Fel grŵp—

**Cynog Dafis:** I would like to make it clear to Jonathan Morgan that our motion does not call for another financial audit. I understand that a financial audit is being undertaken on the European Unit. We believe that the results should be released to the Assembly and that the conclusions, at least, of any wider financial audit should be made available. I understand that there is sensitivity as regards disclosing financial details of the WJEC, which is in a competitive field. Those details would then be available to its

wybodaeth ynglŷn â'r holl gasgliadau fod yn ein meddiant, a dyna pam y gwrthwynebwn welliant y Llywodraeth.

10:22 a.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to Cynog, but our position still stands. The amendment was tabled because of the lack of a timescale and a timetable. It is all very well requesting a Government minister to go away and do something, but unless you provide some sort of timetable within which you expect a reply, this could go on for months. This needs to be cleared up as quickly as possible. Naturally, we would wish to examine the results of any financial audits that are being undertaken by the WJEC, or rather by external advisers. However, our position is still clear. A timetable to the end of January 2001—approximately 10 weeks—is sufficient for the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to meet with those in charge of the WJEC to establish their legal basis, and to establish what problems they have within the organisation.

The Minister may argue that the time frame is too tight, but if we want the answers and if we want the work to be done, the Government of Wales needs to be pressurised into getting the job done and done swiftly. Therefore, my amendment still stands. We need this definitive reply from the Minister as quickly as possible, before the exam season starts. I have, therefore, in my amendment, deleted the time-consuming element of an extra financial audit, although the particular aspect of having that timetable should still stand. As I have outlined, time is of the essence in getting this work done. That is why we felt that the amendment adds value to the motion in adding a timetable that had not been outlined in the original motion. We ask that the motion be amended as I have tabled, and that the Minister returns as quickly as possible with the result of her discussions with the WJEC. I appeal that this is not kicked into the long grass as we have seen with so many other issues, and I appeal to the Assembly to support my amendment.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose

competitors. The information about all the conclusions should be in our possession, and that is why we oppose the Government's amendment.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Cynog, ond erys ein safbwynt. Cyflwynwyd y gwelliant oherwydd diffyg terfyn amser ac amserlen. Digon hawdd yw gofyn i weinidog y Llywodraeth fynd ymaith a gwneud rhywbeth, ond oni bai eich bod yn darparu rhyw fath o amserlen y gallwch ddisgwyl ateb o'i mewn, gallai hyn fynd ymlaen am fisoedd. Mae angen clirio hyn cyn gynted â phosibl. Yn naturiol, byddem yn dymuno archwilio canlyniadau unrhyw archwiliadau ariannol a gaiff eu cynnal gan CBAC, neu yn hytrach gan gynghorwyr allanol. Fodd bynnag, mae ein safbwynt yn glir o hyd. Mae amserlen hyd ddiwedd Ionawr 2001—tua 10 wythnos—yn ddigonol i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gwrdd â'r rhai hynny sydd yn rheoli CBAC i sefydlu eu sail gyfreithiol, a sefydlu pa broblemau sydd ganddynt o fewn y sefydliad.

Gallai'r Gweinidog ddadlau bod y terfyn amser yn rhy dynn, ond os ydym am gael yr atebion ac os ydym am i'r gwaith gael ei wneud, mae angen pwysu ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wneud y gwaith yn gyflym. Felly, erys fy ngwelliant. Mae angen yr ateb pendant hwn arnom gan y Gweinidog cyn gynted â phosibl, cyn i dymor yr arholiadau ddechrau. Felly, yr wyf, yn fy ngwelliant, wedi dileu yr elfen lafurus o archwiliad ariannol ychwanegol, er y dylai'r agwedd arbennig o gael yr amserlen honno sefyll o hyd. Fel yr amlinellais, mae amser yn holl bwysig er mwyn cyflawni'r gwaith hwn. Dyna pam y teimlem fod y gwelliant yn ychwanegu gwerth at y cynnig wrth ychwanegu amserlen nas amlinellwyd yn y cynnig gwreiddiol. Gofynnwn i'r cynnig gael ei ddiwygio fel y cyflwynais, a bod y Gweinidog yn dychwelyd cyn gynted â phosibl gyda chanlyniad ei thrafodaethau gyda CBAC. Apeliaf na chaiff hyn ei gicio i'r glaswellt hir fel y gwelsom gyda chymaint o faterion eraill, ac apeliaf i'r Cynulliad gefnogyd fy ngwelliant.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiad welliant 2 yn

amendment 2 in the name of Andrew Davies. enw Andrew Davies.

After 'National Assembly' delete all text and replace with:

*calls upon the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to hold discussions with the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the Welsh Local Government Association in order to (a) obtain a clear understanding of the legal status and financial circumstances of the WJEC, ensuring that the outcome of these discussions is brought to the attention of the Assembly and (b) to report on steps taken to safeguard the future of this crucially important national body.*

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council. In discussing the concerns over the current situation at the WJEC, we should not lose sight of the fact that the ultimate aim of this debate is to guarantee the future of the organisation and secure that the functions that it currently undertakes do not disappear. In doing so we inevitably come to the question of what powers the Assembly has over the body. What scope do we have to take steps and to take action?

Following local government reorganisation in 1996, the statutory order that assigned a range of specific functions to the organisation was withdrawn by the then Welsh Office. Today, this means that the Assembly has no powers of direction over the WJEC. While it is true that the Assembly cannot tell the WJEC what to do, a further and, arguably, more important question arises: what is the Assembly's responsibility regarding our national examinations body? We have a responsibility to ensure its continued existence. The Assembly is committed to raising standards and improving the education service in Wales and we must give careful and thorough attention to our national examination board. We are glad that the administration has finally recognised that. Furthermore, there is a financial link between the National Assembly and the WJEC, despite the lack of direct authority.

At the time of reorganisation, the property ownership rights of the former WJEC transferred to Rhondda Cynon Taff County

Ar ôl 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol', dileu'r testun i gyd a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gynnal trafodaethau gyda Chyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn (a) cael dealltwriaeth glir ynglŷn â statws cyfreithiol ac amgylchiadau ariannol CBAC, gan sicrhau bod ffrwyth y trafodaethau hynny yn cael ei ddwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad a (b) adrodd ar y camau sydd yn cael eu cymryd i ddiogelu dyfodol y corff cenedlaethol holl bwysig hwn.*

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf. Wrth drafod y pryderon ynghylch y sefyllfa bresennol yn CBAC, ni ddylem anghofio am y ffaith mai nod terfynol y drafodaeth hon yn y pen draw yw sicrhau dyfodol y sefydliad a sicrhau nad yw'r swyddogaethau y mae'n ymgymryd â hwy ar hyn o bryd yn diflannu. Wrth wneud hynny deun yn anochel at y cwestiwn o ba bwerau sydd gan y Cynulliad dros y corff. Pa gyfle sydd gennym i gymryd camau a gweithredu?

Yn dilyn ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol ym 1996, tynnwyd y gorchymyn statudol a oedd yn neilltuo ystod o swyddogaethau penodol i'r sefydliad yn ôl gan y Swyddfa Gymreig ar y pryd. Heddiw, golyga hyn nad oes gan y Cynulliad unrhyw bwerau cyfeiriad dros CBAC. Er ei bod yn wir na all y Cynulliad ddweud wrth CBAC beth i'w wneud, mae cwestiwn pellach a, gellir dadlau, cwestiwn pwysicach yn codi: beth yw cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad ynghylch ein corff arholi cenedlaethol? Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i sicrhau ei barhad. Mae'r Cynulliad yn ymrwymedig i godi safonau a gwella'r gwasanaeth addysg yng Nghymru a rhaid inni roi sylw gofalus a thrylwyr i'n bwrdd arholi cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn falch bod y weinyddiaeth wedi cydnabod hynny o'r diwedd. Ymhellach, mae cyswllt ariannol rhwng y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a CBAC, er gwaethaf y diffyg awdurdod uniongyrchol.

Adeg yr ad-drefnu, trosglwyddodd hawliau perchenogaeth eiddo yr hen CBAC i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf, yn



Borough Council, unlike other property that was transferred to the residuary body. The reasons for that remain unclear. It is intended to transfer the property to WJEC Ltd with the support of all 22 unitary authorities in Wales. The recent allegations of the misuse of corporate credit cards and other related financial matters have caused all those authorities to be precautionary in their agreement to transfer, and this has hindered the process. Should the transfer of the property proceed, I understand that the Assembly's consent is required under section 123 of the Local Government Act to enable the transfer of a property portfolio with an estimated value of £3.8 million to WJEC Ltd for a nil consideration. It seems that it will fall to the First Minister or the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities to determine that request. Would any Minister act while the legal and financial doubts prevail? Would they risk acting *ultra vires*?

Within the memorandum of association of WJEC Ltd, there is a provision for the Secretary of State for Wales to decide on the distribution of any property remaining under certain circumstances should the company be wound up or dissolved. Is the Secretary of State for Wales aware of this responsibility? Is he content that an Assembly Minister has questioned the legal status of the WJEC? I make these points to substantiate that there are clear links in responsibility between the Assembly and the Wales Office insofar as the business of WJEC Ltd and its local authority directors is concerned. I have been told that there is an expectation that part of the WJEC chief executive's £90,000 salary will be underwritten by the National Assembly. So that there is no doubt, could we have a statement on that matter?

The company is registered under the Companies Act 1985 and 1989 as a company limited by guarantee and not having a share capital. The memorandum of association and articles of association were passed on 28 March 1996, and amended on 14 December 1998 and 27 September 1999. Yet, there remains significant doubt as to its legality following the irresponsible leak of the barrister's opinion. The unresolved issue of

wahanol i unrhyw eiddo arall a drosglwyddwyd i'r corff gweddilliol. Erys y rhesymau dros hynny'n aneglur. Bwriedir trosglwyddo'r eiddo i CBAC Cyf gyda chymorth bob un o'r 22 awdurdod unedol yng Nghymru. Mae'r honiadau diweddar o gamddefnyddio cardiau credyd corfforaethol a materion ariannol eraill cysylltiedig wedi achosi i'r holl awdurdodau hynny fod yn rhagofalus wrth gytuno i drosglwyddo, ac mae hyn wedi llesteirio'r broses. Pe byddai trosglwyddiad yr eiddo'n parhau, deallaf fod angen caniatâd y Cynulliad o dan adran 123 o'r Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol i alluogi trosglwyddo portffolio eiddo yr amcangyfrifir ei bod yn werth £3.8 miliwn i CBAC Cyf heb unrhyw gydnabyddiaeth. Ymddengys y disgwylir i Brif Weinidog Cymru neu'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau bennu'r cais hwnnw. A fyddai unrhyw Weinidog yn gweithredu tra bod yr amheuon cyfreithiol ac ariannol yn parhau? A fyddent yn mentro gweithredu *ultra vires*?

O fewn y memorandwm cysylltiad â CBAC Cyf, mae darpariaeth i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru benderfynu ar ddsbarthiad unrhyw eiddo sydd yn parhau o dan amgylchiadau penodol pe byddai'r cwmni yn cael ei ddirwyn i ben neu yn cael ei ddiddymu. A yw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ymwybodol o'r cyfrifoldeb hwn? A yw'n fodlon bod un o Weinidogion y Cynulliad wedi cwestiynu statws cyfreithiol CBAC? Gwnaf y pwyntiau hyn i gadarnhau bod cysylltiadau clir mewn cyfrifoldeb rhwng y Cynulliad a'r Swyddfa Gymreig lle mae busnes CBAC Cyf a'i gyfarwyddwyr awdurdod lleol yn y cwestiwn. Dywedwyd wrthyf bod disgwyl y caiff rhan o gyflog £90,000 prif weithredwr CBAC ei warantu gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fel nad oes unrhyw amheuaeth, a allwn gael datganiad ar y mater hwnnw?

Cofrestrir y cwmni o dan Ddeddf Cwmnïau 1985 ac 1989 fel cwmni sydd yn gyfyngedig yn ôl gwarant a heb gyfalaf cyfranddaliad. Cytunwyd ar y memorandwm cysylltiad a'r erthyglau cysylltiad ar 28 Mawrth 1996, ac fe'u diwygiwyd ar 14 Rhagfyr 1998 a 27 Medi 1999. Er hyn, erys amheuaeth sylweddol o ran ei gyfreithlonrwydd yn dilyn datgeliad anghyfrifol o farn y bargyfreithiwr. Rhaid archwilio'n llawn y mater nas

alleged inappropriate expenditure by former employees must be fully investigated. Let us not forget that the income of the WJEC, as Gareth outlined, in part relates to examination fees paid for by our schools. It is public money. Let us not forget that former employees are also superannuated, and benefit again from significant public investment in the pension funds.

To sit back and do nothing about this is perilous. Wales needs and deserves its own national examination board. How this service is delivered and by whom should be imperative. If a few egos or reputations are damaged, bruised or even destroyed in this endeavour, it is unfortunate, but we cannot continue to pretend that there is nothing wrong.

**Christine Humphreys:** I declare an interest as a registered teacher and as someone who did some work for the WJEC many years ago. As other speakers have said, it is important for Wales that the WJEC's current problems are resolved. It is one of our most crucial educational bodies, one with which I am sure most people who have been born and educated in Wales have had some association in the past, even if it was only to sit their exams. It is a crucial body. I did some work with the WJEC about 15 years ago at the end of the O-Level examinations, looking at the new combined syllabus and then going on to the GCSE courses. It was through that experience that I gained some insight of the WJEC's workings and learned to respect many of the people who worked there. Their input was marvellous.

The Assembly has a close interest in the WJEC's affairs and would like to see all its current problems resolved—its legal, financial and managerial problems. However, as other speakers have said, the Assembly has no power over the WJEC, as it was set up and is funded by local authorities in Wales, and remains within the control of the Welsh Local Government Association and local authorities. All the Assembly can do is seek discussions and work with the WJEC and the WLGA to resolve the situation. It is

datryswyd o wariant amhriodol a honnwyd gan gyn gyflogeion. Ni ddylem anghofio bod incwm CBAC, fel yr amlinellodd Gareth, yn rhannol yn gysylltiedig â ffioedd arholiadau y talwyd amdanynt gan ein hysgolion. Arian cyhoeddus yw hwn. Ni ddylem anghofio bod cyn gyflogeion hefyd yn cael pensiwn, ac yn manteisio eto o fuddsoddiad cyhoeddus sylweddol yn y cronfeydd pensiwn.

Mae eistedd yn ôl a gwneud dim ynghylch hyn yn beryglus. Mae angen ei bwrdd arholi cenedlaethol ei hun ar Gymru ac mae'n ei haeddu. Dylai'r modd y caiff y gwasanaeth hwn ei gyflwyno a chan bwy fod yn holl bwysig. Os caiff rhywfaint o hunanfaldher neu enwau da eu niweidio neu hyd yn oed eu dinistrio yn yr ymdrech hon, mae'n anffodus, ond ni allwn barhau i esgus nad oes unrhyw beth o'i le.

**Christine Humphreys:** Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes gofrestredig ac fel rhywun a wnaeth rywfaint o waith ar gyfer CBAC flynyddoedd yn ôl. Fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, mae'n bwysig i Gymru y caiff problemau presennol CBAC eu datrys. Mae'n un o'n cyrff addysgol pwysicaf, un yr wyf yn siŵr bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl a anwyd ac a addysgwyd yng Nghymru wedi cael rhywfaint o gysylltiad ag ef yn y gorffennol, hyd yn oed os mai dim ond i sefyll eu harholiadau yr oedd hynny. Mae'n gorff holl bwysig. Gwneuthum beth gwaith gyda CBAC tua 15 mlynedd yn ôl ar ddiwedd yr arholiadau Lefel O, yn edrych ar y maes llafur cytûn newydd ac yna'n mynd ymlaen i'r cyrsiau TGAU. Yn sgîl y profiad hwnnw y deuthum i ddeall rhywfaint ar weithredoedd CBAC a dysgu i barchu llawer o'r bobl a oedd yn gweithio yno. Yr oedd eu mewnbwn yn ardderchog.

Mae gan y Cynulliad ddi-ddordeb manwl ym materion CBAC a hoffai weld ei holl broblemau presennol yn cael eu datrys—ei broblemau cyfreithiol, ariannol a rheolaethol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, nid oes gan y Cynulliad unrhyw bŵer dros CBAC, gan iddo gael ei sefydlu a'i ariannu gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, ac erys o fewn rheolaeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol. Y cyfan y gall y Cynulliad ei wneud yw ceisio trafod a gweithio gyda CBAC a

important that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning does this as soon as possible. We do not want any more trouble with the board. It is far too important for Wales. As an Assembly we must do what we can to enable discussions between the relevant parties, with strong ministerial involvement, and keep the Assembly informed of the situation. I hope that the Minister will ensure that this happens.

10:32 a.m.

I will deal quickly with some of the WJEC's problems. According to legal opinion, which Jonathan and Pauline have already mentioned, the WJEC has been acting *ultra vires*. While it remains under local authority control, the legal status appears to be questionable. It must be set up as a free, commercial body, which it is not at present. We have already heard about some of the financial problems relating to the WJEC. Thousands, perhaps millions of pounds may need to be spent. These financial problems have arisen purely because proper financial measures and guarantees have not been in place, because it was not properly constituted and the legal status was unclear. On the managerial problems, some management structure problems have been highlighted, and it has had no chief executive for nearly a year.

On political comments, the major problems are a result of the fact, as I said earlier, that the WJEC is not legally constituted. It was set up as a privatised company by the Tories, which was not appropriate for its purpose. The political doctrine that seemed to overrule practicalities was then continued by the Labour Party, which did not establish a proper board of directors when it had the chance. Instead, the board consists of 22 councillors. You could argue that Labour has been trying to maintain political control no matter what the cost.

On some of the issues raised by Pauline, this matter must not be personalised. It must be

Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i ddatrys y sefyllfa. Mae'n bwysig bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn gwneud hyn cyn gynted â phosibl. Nid ydym am gael rhagor o drafferth gyda'r bwrdd. Mae'n llawer rhy bwysig i Gymru. Fel Cynulliad rhaid inni wneud cymaint ag y gallwn i alluogi trafodaethau rhwng y pleidiau perthnasol, gyda chyfranogiad cryf gan Weinidogion, a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar y sefyllfa i'r Cynulliad. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn sicrhau y bydd hyn yn digwydd.

Ymdriniaf yn gyflym â rhai o broblemau CBAC. Yn ôl barn gyfreithiol, a grybwyllwyd eisoes gan Jonathan a Pauline, bu CBAC yn gweithredu *ultra vires*. Er ei fod yn parhau i fod o dan reolaeth awdurdod lleol, ymddengys bod amheuaeth ynghylch y statws cyfreithiol. Rhaid ei sefydlu fel corff masnachol rhydd, rhywbeth nad ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Clywsom eisoes am rai o'r problemau ariannol sydd yn ymwneud â CBAC. Efallai y bydd angen gwario miloedd, efallai miliynau, o bunnoedd. Deilliodd y problemau ariannol hyn yn benodol oherwydd nad oedd mesurau a gwarantau ariannol priodol wedi cael eu sefydlu, oherwydd na chafodd ei gyfansoddi'n gywir a bod y statws cyfreithiol yn aneglur. O ran y problemau rheolaethol, amlinellwyd rhai problemau gyda'r strwythur rheolaethol, a bu heb brif weithredwr am bron i flwyddyn.

Ynglŷn â sylwadau gwleidyddol, mae'r prif problemau yn deillio o'r ffaith, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, nad yw CBAC wedi'i gyfansoddi'n gyfreithiol. Fe'i sefydlwyd fel cwmni wedi'i breifateiddio gan y Toriaid, nad oedd yn briodol ar gyfer ei bwrpas. Parhaodd y Blaid Lafur wedyn â'r ddysgeidiaeth wleidyddol a ymddengys ei fod yn dirymu pethau ymarferol, ac ni sefydlodd fwrdd gwirioneddol o gyfarwyddwyr pan gafodd y cyfle. Yn hytrach, mae'r bwrdd yn cynnwys 22 cynghorydd. Gallech ddadlau bod Llafur wedi bod yn ceisio cadw rheolaeth wleidyddol beth bynnag fo'r gost.

Ar rai o'r materion a godwyd gan Pauline, rhaid peidio â phersonoli'r mater hwn. Rhaid

recognised that there are real problems in the WJEC, some are fundamental to its set-up, some are as a result of these fundamental difficulties. The fundamental issues must be resolved to solve the others, and none of this will be done by personalising it. The real issue is how to change the WJEC's set-up and thereby try to resolve the financial issues. No one individual is to blame for the situation, and there is no point in trying to apportion blame rather than resolve the fundamental issues that must be resolved for this crucial education body in Wales.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae polisïau, ac felly deddfwriaeth, yn seiliedig yn aml ar agwedd syml, unffurf, sydd hefyd weithiau yn creu trefniadau annigonol. Pan basiwyd Deddf Addysg Foster yn 1870, nid oedd unrhyw amrywiaeth ynddi i ymdrin â'r gwahaniaethau sylweddol rhwng Lloegr a Chymru. Anwybyddwyd y ffaith bod tri chwarter pobl Cymru bryd hynny yn siarad Cymraeg a bod gan Gymru ei hanes a'i thraddodiadau ei hunan yn ymestyn yn ôl dros 1,500 o flynyddoedd. Yr oedd yr hyn a oedd yn iawn i Loegr yn iawn i Gymru—dyna oedd yr agwedd.

Mae gan addysg rôl ganolog yng ngoroesiad y genedl Gymreig. Mae'n un o gerrig milltir ein hanes, megis cyfieithu'r Beibl, ysgolion cylchynol Griffith Jones, y *Welsh Not* a Brad y Llyfrau Gleision, sefydlu Prifysgol Cymru, Deddf Addysg Cymru 1889, creu Adran Addysg Gymraeg yn 1907, yr ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg swyddogol gyntaf a sefydlu Cydbwyllgor Addysg Cymru yn 1949. Nid digwyddiad di-nod, felly, oedd sefydlu CBAC. Yr oedd yn rhan o ymateb pobl Cymru i'r gyfundrefn unffurf a anwybyddai ein bodolaeth. Yr oedd yn rhan o broses i ddatblygu'r adnoddau a fyddai'n ein galluogi i greu cyfundrefn addysg i adlewyrchu anghenion y bobl. Yr oedd cael y modd i gynnal gwasanaeth arholiadau yn gam mawr ymlaen, er mwyn datblygu meysydd cyfrwng Saesneg o fewn ein hysgolion, meysydd llafur a fyddai'n cynnwys pynciau megis hanes, daearyddiaeth, crefydd a Saesneg hyd yn oed, a hefyd meysydd llafur y pynciau cyfrwng Cymraeg.

cydnabod bod problemau gwirioneddol yn CBAC, bod rhai ohonynt yn sylfaenol i'w drefniadaeth, a rhai yn deillio o'r anawsterau sylfaenol hyn. Rhaid datrys y materion sylfaenol er mwyn datrys y gweddill, ac ni wneir dim o hyn drwy ei bersonoli. Y mater gwirioneddol yw sut i newid trefniadaeth CBAC ac felly geisio datrys y materion ariannol. Nid oes bai ar unrhyw un unigolyn am y sefyllfa, ac nid oes pwynt ceisio beio rhywun yn hytrach na datrys y materion sylfaenol sydd yn rhaid eu datrys ar gyfer y corff addysgol hanfodol hwn yng Nghymru.

**Owen John Thomas:** Government policies, and therefore legislation, are often based on a simple, uniform attitude, which also sometimes creates insufficient arrangements. When the Foster Education Act was passed in 1870, there was no variation in it to deal with the substantial differences between England and Wales. The fact that three quarters of the people of Wales spoke Welsh at the time was ignored as was the fact that Wales had its own history and traditions stretching back over 1,500 years. What was right for England was right for Wales—that was the attitude.

Education has a central role in the survival of the Welsh nation. It is one of the milestones of our history, such as translating the Bible, Griffith Jones's circulating schools, the *Welsh Not* and the Treachery of the Blue Books, the establishment of the University of Wales, the Welsh Education Act 1889, creating a Welsh Education Department in 1907, the first official Welsh medium school and the establishment of the Welsh Joint Education Committee in 1949. The establishment of the WJEC, therefore, was not an insignificant event. It was part of the response of the people of Wales to the uniform system that ignored our existence. It was part of a process to develop the resources that would enable us to create an education system to reflect people's needs. Having the means to sustain an examination service was a great leap forward, to develop English medium syllabuses within our schools, syllabuses which included subjects such as history, geography, religion and even English, and also syllabuses for the Welsh medium subjects.

Y mae'n hanfodol i gynhyrchu papurau arholiad ar gyfer ysgolion Cymru fel bod y meysydd llafur yn cael eu hadlewyrchu yn y papurau hynny.

Mae CBAC wedi llenwi'r rôl hon yn arbennig o dda am dros 50 mlynedd. Mae'r angen am y gwasanaeth hwn yn fwy yn awr nag erioed. Fodd bynnag, tanseiliwyd sefyllfa CBAC gan benderfyniad y Llywodraeth ganolog a chanoliaethol yn San Steffan yng nghanol y 1990au i breifateiddio'r byrddau arholi. Ni allwn sefyll yn stond tra bod CBAC yn dioddef yn sgîl yr amgylchiadau negyddol a osodwyd arno.

Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon ac yn yr Alban mae'r byrddau arholiad, y Council for the Curriculum, Examinations and Assessment a'r Scottish Qualifications Authority, yn cyfuno'r gwaith a wneir ar wahân yng Nghymru gan CBAC ac ACCAC. Mae hyn yn dangos ei bod yn bosibl creu trefn amgen i'r gyfundrefn annigonol bresennol ar gyfer CBAC.

Gallwn ddefnyddio, ac fe ddylem ddefnyddio heddiw, ein grym fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i ddechrau dad-wneud y drwg a wnaethpwyd yn y gorffennol. Gallwn ddechrau heddiw drwy roi cefnogaeth i'r cynnig hwn fel cam ymlaen tuag at greu trefn debycach i'r un sydd yn bodoli ar gyfer addysg yng Ngogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban.

**Jane Davidson:** I declare an interest as a registered teacher. Gareth, I welcome this debate and I am grateful to Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales for giving me the opportunity to put the record straight. I am pleased that Members have prefaced everything that they have said by recognising the WJEC as a crucially important national body and one that needs our confidence in its continuing role. If one aspect of our discussion today is to be widely reported in the media it should be our confidence in the WJEC as an examination body.

The importance of a Welsh examinations body, responding to developments and changes to the curriculum and the objectives of the education system in Wales—not least the provision of examinations in the Welsh language—cannot be overstated. The WJEC

It is essential to produce examination papers for the schools of Wales so that the syllabuses are reflected in those papers.

The WJEC has fulfilled this role extremely well for over 50 years. The need for this service is now greater than ever. However, the WJEC's status was undermined by the decision of the central and centralist Government in Westminster in the mid 1990s to privatise the examination boards. We cannot stand still while the WJEC suffers due to the negative circumstances placed upon it.

In Northern Ireland and Scotland, the examination boards, the Council for the Curriculum, Examinations and Assessment and the Scottish Qualifications Authority, combine the work that is done separately in Wales by the WJEC and ACCAC. This shows that it is possible to create an alternative system to the present inadequate system for the WJEC.

We can use, and we should use today, our powers as a National Assembly, to begin to undo the harm done in the past. We can begin today by supporting this motion as a step forward towards creating a system that is more similar to that which exists for education in Northern Ireland and Scotland.

**Jane Davidson:** Datganaf fuddiant fel athrawes gofrestredig. Gareth, croesawaf y ddadl hon ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Blaid Cymru—The Party of Wales am roi'r cyfle imi unioni pethau. Yr wyf yn falch bod Aelodau wedi rhagflaenu popeth a ddywedasant drwy gydnabod bod CBAC yn gorff cenedlaethol hanfodol bwysig ac yn gorff sydd angen ein hyder yn ei rôl barhaus. Os caiff un agwedd ar ein trafodaeth heddiw ei gyhoeddi'n eang yn y wasg, ein hyder yn CBAC fel corff arholi ddylai hynny fod.

Ni ellir gor-bwysleisio pwysigrwydd corff arholi Cymreig, yn ymateb i ddatblygiadau a newidiadau i'r cwricwlwm ac amcanion y system addysg yng Nghymru—yn arbennig y ddarpariaeth o arholiadau yn y Gymraeg. Mae CBAC yn ddarparwr arholiadau o

is a highly respected provider of quality examinations and is an important organisation in the Assembly's drive for a better Wales. We want to work with the WJEC to ensure that the company's core functions and aims help the Assembly in its drive to improve educational standards in Wales. The Assembly, ACCAC as the regulatory body, and the WJEC have worked together well in the past as shown in the examination results of recent years. The successes of Welsh children in GCSE's and A Levels have been greatly helped by the high standards and excellent work of the WJEC. Let us not be fooled by the recent reports into thinking that the WJEC in any way is struggling to perform its core business. Its excellent work on examinations is highlighted by the fact that its share of the GCSE examinations market in England has increased from 13,000 entries in 1992 to 76,000 entries last year. In Wales, there were almost 285,000 entries this year. For A Levels, entries in England increased from 1,600 to over 5,500. In Wales, there were almost 28,000 entries in 2000. This demonstrates that the WJEC's examinations work is a healthy business with a turnover of about £10 million, and a surplus last year of over £300,000. It also demonstrates that it is of sufficient quality to cross the border, with schools and colleges in England using the services of our examination body in Wales.

10:42 a.m.

As Gareth said, in the area of in-service training for teachers, over 3,000 delegates attended WJEC events in the last year on the new syllabuses for A and AS levels.

Its expertise in the fields of the arts, culture and the Welsh language is recognised by the fact that all 22 local authorities have three-year service level agreements with the WJEC to deliver services on their behalf, paid by the LEAs. This is a commitment of confidence. The fact that these are for three years shows a continuing commitment and confidence in our institution in Wales.

I turn now to explain why we amended Plaid Cymru's motion.

ansawdd uchel ei barch ac mae'n sefydliad pwysig yn ymgyrch y Cynulliad tuag at well Cymru. Yr ydym am weithio gyda CBAC i sicrhau bod swyddogaethau a nodau craidd y cwmni yn helpu'r Cynulliad yn ei ymgyrch i wella safonau addysgol yng Nghymru. Mae'r Cynulliad, ACCAC fel y corff rheoleiddio, a CBAC wedi cydweithio'n dda yn y gorffennol fel y dangosir yng nghanlyniadau arholiadau y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Cynorthwywyd llwyddiannau plant Cymru mewn arholiadau TGAU a Safon Uwch yn fawr gan safonau uchel a gwaith ardderchog CBAC. Ni ddylem gael ein twyllo gan yr adroddiadau diweddar i feddwl bod CBAC yn brwydro mewn unrhyw ffordd i berfformio ei fusnes craidd. Amlygir ei waith ardderchog ar arholiadau gan y ffaith bod ei gyfran o'r farchnad arholiadau TGAU yn Lloegr wedi cynyddu o 13,000 o ymgeiswyr yn 1992 i 76,000 y llynedd. Yng Nghymru, cafwyd bron i 285,000 o ymgeiswyr eleni. Ar gyfer Safon Uwch, cynyddodd yr ymgeiswyr yn Lloegr o 1,600 i dros 5,500. Yng Nghymru, cafwyd bron i 28,000 o ymgeiswyr yn 2000. Mae hyn yn dangos bod gwaith arholi CBAC yn fusnes iach â throiant o tua £10 miliwn, a gwarged y llynedd o dros £300,000. Dengys hefyd ei fod o ansawdd digonol i groesi'r ffin, gydag ysgolion a cholegau yn Lloegr yn defnyddio gwasanaethau ein corff arholi yng Nghymru.

Fel y dywedodd Gareth, yn y maes o hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon, mynychodd dros 3,000 o gynrychiolwyr ddigwyddiadau CBAC yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ar y meysydd llafur newydd ar gyfer safon Uwch ac Uwch Gyfrannol.

Nodir ei arbenigedd ym maes y celfyddydau, diwylliant a'r iaith Gymraeg gan y ffaith bod gan bob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol gytundebau lefel gwasanaeth tair blynedd gyda CBAC i ddarparu gwasanaethau ar eu rhan, wedi'u talu gan yr AALI. Mae hwn yn ymrwymiad o hyder. Mae'r ffaith bod y rhain am gyfnod o dair blynedd yn dangos ymrwymiad parhaus a hyder yn ein sefydliad yng Nghymru.

Trof yn awr i esbonio pam inni ddiwygio cynnig Plaid Cymru.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr ydych yn pwysleisio—ac mae'n bwysig eich bod yn gwneud hynny—elfennau craidd gwaith CBAC, ac nid oes dadl ynghylch y llwyddiannau hynny. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn bwriadu cloi'r hyn sydd gennych i'w ddweud, yr wyf yn deall bod trafferthion mawr CBAC yn deillio o'r ffaith ei fod wedi ymestyn i feysydd eraill megis yr Uned Ewropeaidd. Pa sylwadau sydd gennych, a pha gyfarwyddyd a fydd gennych, i CBAC ynglŷn ag ymgymryd â'r mathau hyn o weithgareddau? Ai y rhain yw'r math o weithgareddau y byddwch yn eu cefnogi, ynteu a fyddwch yn cyfarwyddo CBAC i ganolbwyntio'n unig ar y gwaith creiddiol hwn, sef maes arholi ac asesu, ac efallai cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth ag awdurdodau lleol a hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon?

**Jane Davidson:** I do not need to direct the WJEC. In fact, as Pauline clearly outlined, I do not have powers to direct the WJEC. However, I hope that I will make it absolutely clear that the board has taken this issue seriously, and the board and the Welsh Local Government Association have already made the decision to concentrate totally on the core functions. I will demonstrate later how we view the legal and financial situation.

I return to why we propose to amend Plaid Cymru's motion. In doing so, I want to emphasise that we support the spirit of the motion. However, we must recognise that the WJEC is a private company, albeit one of immense importance to all local government in Wales, as demonstrated by the service level agreements, and the fact that every school and college in Wales uses the WJEC, and to the Assembly in the delivery of its education objectives. We have no powers to demand to see the internal financial audit reports of the WJEC, or any other private company in Wales, and it would be completely inappropriate for such an audit to be debated in the Assembly chamber.

It is also important to say that, in the light of the Scottish experience—

**Cynog Dafis:** A gaf egluro i Jane Davidson nad yw ein cynnig yn gofyn am weld

**Gareth Jones:** You emphasise—and it is important that you do so—the core elements of the WJEC's work, and there can be no argument as to the success of these. However, if you intend to wind up what you have to say, I understand that the WJEC's great difficulties stem from the fact that it branched out to other areas, such as the European Unit. What comments do you have, and what instructions will you give, to the WJEC concerning the undertaking of these kinds of activity? Are these the kinds of activities that you will support, or will you direct the WJEC to concentrate only on this core work, that is the area of examinations and assessment, and perhaps service level agreements with local authorities and in-service training for teachers?

**Jane Davidson:** Nid oes angen imi gyfarwyddo CBAC. Yn wir, fel yr amlinellodd Pauline yn glir, nid oes gennyf bwerau i gyfarwyddo CBAC. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf y gwnaf yn hollol glir bod y bwrdd wedi cymryd y mater hwn o ddirif, a bod y bwrdd a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru eisoes wedi gwneud y penderfyniad i ganolbwyntio'n llwyr ar y swyddogaethau craidd. Byddaf yn dangos yn ddiweddarach sut y gwelwn y sefyllfa gyfreithiol ac ariannol.

Dychwelaf at pam y bwriadwn ddiwygio cynnig Plaid Cymru. Wrth wneud hynny, yr wyf am bwysleisio ein bod yn cefnogi ysbryd y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cydnabod bod CBAC yn gwmni preifat, er ei fod yn un o bwysigrwydd anferth i bob llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, fel y dangoswyd gan y cytundebau lefel gwasanaeth, a'r ffaith bod pob ysgol a choleg yng Nghymru yn defnyddio CBAC, ac i'r Cynulliad wrth gyflwyno ei amcanion addysgol. Nid oes gennym bwerau i fynnu cael gweld adroddiadau archwiliad ariannol mewnol CBAC, neu unrhyw gwmni preifat arall yng Nghymru, a byddai'n hollol amhriodol trafod archwiliad o'r fath yn siambr y Cynulliad.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud, o ystyried profiad yr Alban—

**Cynog Dafis:** May I clarify to Jane Davidson that our motion does not ask to see the details

manyllion archwiliad ariannol? Mae'n sôn am ffrwyth y trafodaethau hynny, gan gynnwys canlyniadau unrhyw archwiliad ariannol. A yw'n fodlon ein sicrhau yn awr y cawn wybodaeth lawn am yr hyn a ddengys unrhyw archwiliad ariannol am iechyd ariannol CBAC? Yn benodol, a fydd yn gwarantu y bydd canlyniadau'r archwiliad ar yr Uned Ewropeaidd yn hysbys inni?

**Jane Davidson:** As you see from our amendment, I have undertaken to make the outcomes of discussions between the Assembly and the Welsh Local Government Association available to the Assembly. I will come specifically to the issues that you addressed.

First I want to respond to Jonathan Morgan and Owen John Thomas, who used the Scottish experience as an example. However, somewhat ironically, Jonathan used it unfavourably and Owen John Thomas used it as a model that we could consider. The recent Scottish experience demonstrates that it is a model that we do not want to consider at present. The reason I say this is because it was mentioned in the debate. We have already had a debate on combining the regulatory functions of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales and the examination functions of the Welsh Joint Education Committee. That proposal was rightly turned down because we need to keep the examinations body as a competitive body. I am fully committed to doing that.

We cannot guarantee the WJEC's survival. That is why we have amended the motion. As a private company, it must survive on its own merit, but we all know that that merit is great. However, I want to assure the Assembly that I am doing all that I can to ensure that we are able to safeguard the future of this successful and highly respected awarding body. I was particularly delighted to hear the word 'safeguard' in Gareth's opening remarks.

Yesterday, I met the Welsh Local Government Association and the WJEC to talk about Members' concerns in advance of this debate. I am grateful to members and officers of both organisations for their

of a financial audit? It mentions the outcome of those discussions, including the findings of any financial audit. Is she willing to give us an assurance now that we will have all the information about what any financial audit shows about the financial health of the WJEC? In particular, will she guarantee that the results of the financial audit of the European Unit will be made available to us?

**Jane Davidson:** Fel y gwelwch o'n gwelliant, yr wyf wedi ymgymryd i sicrhau bod canlyniadau trafodaethau rhwng y Cynulliad a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar gael i'r Cynulliad. Deuaf yn benodol at y materion y cyfeiriasoch atynt.

I ddechrau yr wyf am ymateb i Jonathan Morgan ac Owen John Thomas, a ddefnyddiodd brofiad yr Alban fel enghraifft. Fodd bynnag, yn eithaf eironig, defnyddiodd Jonathan ef yn anffafriol a defnyddiodd Owen John Thomas ef fel model y gallem ei ystyried. Dengys profiad diweddar yr Alban ei fod yn fodel nad ydym am ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd. Y rheswm pam y dywedaf hyn yw oherwydd iddo gael ei grybwyll yn y ddadl. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cael dadl ar gyfuno swyddogaethau rheoleiddiol Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru a swyddogaethau arholi Cydbwyllgor Addysg Cymru. Gwrthodwyd y cynnig hwnnw yn gywir oherwydd bod angen inni gadw'r bwrdd arholi fel corff cystadleuol. Yr wyf yn hollol ymrwymedig i wneud hynny.

Ni allwn warantu goroesiad CBAC. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi diwygio'r cynnig. Fel cwmni preifat, rhaid iddo oroesi ar ei liwt ei hun, ond gwyddom oll bod hynny'n ardderchog. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am sicrhau'r Cynulliad fy mod yn gwneud cymaint ag y gallaf i ddiogelu dyfodol y cwmni dyfarnu llwyddiannus ac uchel ei barch hwn. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch i glywed y gair 'diogelu' yn sylwadau agoriadol Gareth.

Ddoe, cyfarfûm â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a CBAC i siarad am bryderon yr Aelodau cyn y ddadl hon. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i aelodau a swyddogion y ddau sefydliad am eu cymorth ar y materion hyn.



assistance on these issues. We discussed the legal and financial status that has been the focus of recent media attention. I take this opportunity to update Members on those discussions.

The WJEC board will elect a new Chair at its meeting on 18 December. At the same time, it intends to confirm the job description for a new chief executive with the aim of making an appointment by April next year. I am particularly pleased at this development sought by my predecessor, Rosemary Butler, because this demonstrates the board's commitment to regularise its position and regain public confidence. Unfortunately, a joint letter from the WJEC, the WLGA and the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, in response to the press allegations to set the record straight, has not yet been published to make it clear that the board and our WLGA partners are taking all steps necessary. The board is also putting in place arrangements for a further independent financial audit of the European work undertaken by the WJEC. The previous audit, which has been the subject of press reports, had limited terms of reference. This investigation will be a root and branch look at areas of concern highlighted by the earlier audit and the board. That will ensure that the new chief executive and the new Chair will be able to start their work with all the information necessary to ensure that the WJEC can operate on a sound financial footing. This is not an issue for us to debate today. This is for the board and the officers of the WJEC to take forward in conjunction with partners in the WLGA. I point out, in response to Pauline Jarman's input, that I was pleased to hear that the WLGA is fairly advanced on transferring the ownership of the buildings to the WJEC, subject to a satisfactory outcome of the financial audit. That is a proper way for local government to behave on an issue of this importance.

I will turn now to the two specific issues raised in the motion. Much was made in the recent press reports about the legal status of

Trafodasom y statws cyfreithiol ac ariannol a fu yn ffocws sylw diweddar yn y cyfryngau. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y trafodaethau hynny i'r Aelodau.

Bydd bwrdd CBAC yn ethol Cadeirydd newydd yn ei gyfarfod ar 18 Rhagfyr. Ar yr un pryd, bwriada gadarnhau'r disgrifiad swydd ar gyfer prif weithredwr newydd gyda'r bwriad o benodi erbyn Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o'r datblygiad hwn a geisiwyd gan fy rhagflaenydd, Rosemary Butler, oherwydd bod hyn yn dangos ymrwymiad y bwrdd i reoleiddio ei sefyllfa ac adennill hyder y cyhoedd. Yn anffodus, ni chyhoeddwyd llythyr ar y cyd gan CBAC, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg Cymru eto, mewn ymateb i honiadau'r wasg i roi'r ddsygl yn wastad, i egluro bod y bwrdd â'n partneriaid yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn cymryd y camau angenrheidiol. Mae'r bwrdd hefyd yn gwneud trefniadau ar gyfer archwiliad ariannol annibynnol pellach o'r gwaith Ewropeaidd yr ymgymerir ag ef gan CBAC. Roedd cylch gorchwyl cyfyngedig i'r archwiliad blaenorol, a oedd yn destun adroddiadau'r wasg. Bydd yr ymchwiliad hwn yn edrych ar wreiddiau a changhennau'r meysydd o bryder a amlygwyd gan yr archwiliad cynharach a'r bwrdd. Bydd hynny'n sicrhau y gall y prif weithredwr newydd a'r Cadeirydd newydd ddechrau ar eu gwaith â'r holl wybodaeth angenrheidiol i sicrhau y gall CBAC weithredu ar sail ariannol gadarn. Nid yw hyn yn fater inni ei ddadlau heddiw. Mae hyn i'r bwrdd a swyddogion CBAC ei weithredu mewn cydweithrediad â phartneriaid yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Nodaf, mewn ymateb i fewnbwn Pauline Jarman, fy mod yn falch o glywed bod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn weddol ddatblygedig o ran trosglwyddo perchenogaeth yr adeiladau i CBAC, yn amodol ar ganlyniad boddhaol yr archwiliad ariannol. Mae hynny'n ffordd briodol i lywodraeth leol ymddwyn ar fater mor bwysig â hwn.

Trof yn awr at y ddau fater penodol a godwyd yn y cynnig. Rhoddwyd llawer o sylw yn y wasg yn ddiweddar i statws

the WJEC. Both reports refer to extracts and transcripts of legal advice from three years ago. The WJEC's present board took further legal advice on its status in July last year. The advice clearly states that as long as the WJEC has its core business and is financially secure, no questions arise. The WLGA and the directors of education are entirely content with the legal status, and the board—an all-party board of our colleagues in local government—is also entirely content.

**Nick Bourne:** Does the Minister accept that any doubts about the uncertainty of the WJEC's legal status are as a direct result of information being leaked by the Deputy First Minister along with the legal opinion that indicated the contrary to what you are now suggesting?

**Jane Davidson:** I do not accept that. One of the important issues—and the reason why I welcome today's debate—is that this has been rambling for a long time. It is important that we lay it to rest today. I am pleased to tell Members that I have put arrangements in place, with support from existing members and officers of the WJEC, to have regular biannual meetings with the new chair and chief executive following their appointments, to create a strong working relationship between the Assembly and the WJEC. I will also undertake, as promised in the motion, to report the outcome of these discussions to the Assembly after the WJEC's independent financial audit has been completed. There is no guarantee that that will be completed by January, Jonathan. I would therefore be grateful if you would consider withdrawing your amendment. It is important that the Assembly gets the proper information at the right time, which is following the discussions with the WJEC board. I am keen to develop our relationship with the WJEC in the future.

10:52 a.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** What is the timescale for this? When do you anticipate information being made available?

cyfreithiol CBAC. Cyfeiria'r ddau adroddiad at ddetholiadau a thrawsysgrifau o gyngor cyfreithiol a gafwyd dair blynedd yn ôl. Cymerodd bwrdd presennol CBAC gyngor cyfreithiol pellach ar ei statws ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Noda'r cyngor yn amlwg cyn belled â bod gan CBAC ei fusnes craidd a'i fod yn ariannol ddiogel, ni choda unrhyw gwestiynau. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'r cyfarwyddwyr addysg yn hollol fodlon â'r statws cyfreithiol, ac mae'r bwrdd—bwrdd holl bleidiau ein cydweithwyr mewn llywodraeth leol—hefyd yn hollol fodlon.

**Nick Bourne:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod unrhyw amheuan ynghylch amhendranrwydd statws cyfreithiol CBAC yn deillio'n uniongyrchol o wybodaeth yn cael ei rhyddhau gan Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog Cymru ynghyd â'r farn gyfreithiol a nododd i'r gwrthwyneb i'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu yn awr?

**Jane Davidson:** Ni dderbyniaf hynny. Un o'r materion pwysig—a'r rheswm pam y croesawaf y drafodaeth heddiw—yw bod hyn wedi parhau am amser hir. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ei ddatrys heddiw. Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud wrth yr Aelodau fy mod wedi gwneud trefniadau, â chymorth gan aelodau a swyddogion presennol CBAC, i gael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd ddwywaith y flwyddyn gyda'r cadeirydd newydd a'r prif weithredwr yn dilyn eu penodiadau, i greu perthynas waith gref rhwng y Cynulliad a CBAC. Byddaf hefyd yn ymgymryd, fel yr addawyd yn y cynnig, i gyflwyno adroddiad ar ganlyniad y trafodaethau hyn i'r Cynulliad wedi i archwiliad ariannol annibynnol CBAC gael ei gwblhau. Ni cheir sicrwydd y caiff hwnnw ei gwblhau erbyn Ionawr, Jonathan. Felly byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ystyried tynnu eich gwelliant yn ôl. Mae'n bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn cael y wybodaeth gywir ar yr adeg gywir, sef yn dilyn y trafodaethau â bwrdd CBAC. Yr wyf yn awyddus i ddatblygu ein perthynas â CBAC yn y dyfodol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer hyn? Pryd y rhagwelwch y bydd gwybodaeth ar gael?

**Jane Davidson:** In my conversations with the WJEC, it has been keen to get this in place before the new chief executive is in post. It is intended that that should happen in April of next year. As it is a matter for the WJEC, all I can do is accept its determination to achieve that. On such an important matter, a financial audit must take the time appropriate to deal with the relevant issues. However, I undertake that, as soon as I have had discussions with WJEC following the audit, any information appropriate to bring before the Assembly will be brought before you. I would also be happy, on the basis of today's debate, to deliver that information in a statement to Plenary, if it is appropriate to do so.

To conclude, this issue is not in the long grass, Jonathan. I have only been in post for, I think, a month. The first action that I took on these concerns was to ensure that I had a proper briefing and met the people necessary to take this forward and to ensure the right method of engagement. I hope that the Assembly will demonstrate its confidence in this important organisation's work today, and ensure that those who have turned to other exam boards during the difficult period will turn back to the WJEC. That will help us to support our Wales-based examination body, and, in particular, to look at increasing its share of the market across the border.

**Cynog Dafis:** Dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad drwy bwysleisio rôl allweddol CBAC yn hanes addysg yng Nghymru a'i gyfraniad aruthrol i ddatblygu agenda briodol a gwahanol ar lawer ystyr i Gymru. Mae ei waith ym maes arholiadau a hyfforddi athrawon wedi bod o ansawdd uchel hyd at heddiw. Mae'n anodd dychmygu cyfundrefn addysg Gymreig heb ei gyfraniad aruthrol.

Heddiw, yr ydym wedi cymryd cam pwysig ymlaen. Mae gwelliant Llafur—ac mae Jane Davidson yn cydnabod hyn—wedi mabwysiadu geiriad ein cynnig yn gyfan gwbl, ar wahân i un cymal bach. Ystyr hynny yw ein bod o'r diwedd wedi perswadio, yn wir, byddwn yn dweud ein bod wedi gorfodi

**Jane Davidson:** Yn fy sgrysiâu â CBAC, bu'n awyddus i sefydlu hyn cyn i'r prif weithredwr newydd ddechrau ar ei swydd. Bwriedir i hynny ddigwydd ym mis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Gan mai mater i CBAC ydyw, y cyfan y gallaf ei wneud yw derbyn ei benderfyniad i gyflawni hynny. Ar fater mor bwysig, rhaid i archwiliad ariannol gymryd yr amser priodol i ymdrin â'r materion perthnasol. Fodd bynnag, addawaf, cyn gynted ag y byddaf wedi cael trafodaethau â CBAC yn dilyn yr archwiliad, y caiff unrhyw wybodaeth sydd yn briodol i'w rhoi gerbron y Cynulliad ei rhoi ger eich bron. Byddwn hefyd yn hapus, ar sail y ddatl heddiw, i gyflwyno'r wybodaeth honno mewn datganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn, os yw'n briodol i wneud hynny.

I gloi, nid yw'r mater hwn wedi cael ei fwrw o'r neilltu, Jonathan. Dim ond ers mis, fe gredaf, yr wyf wedi bod yn fy swydd. Y cam cyntaf a gymerais ynglŷn â'r pryderon hyn oedd sicrhau fy mod wedi cael fy mriffio'n gywir ac wedi cwrdd â'r bobl angenrheidiol i weithredu hyn a sicrhau'r dull cywir o weithredu. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn dangos ei hyder yng ngwaith y sefydliad pwysig hwn heddiw, a sicrhau y bydd y rhai hynny sydd wedi troi at fyrddau arholi eraill yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn yn troi yn ôl at CBAC. Bydd hynny yn ein helpu i gynorthwyo ein corff arholi a leolir yng Nghymru, ac, yn arbennig, i edrych ar gynyddu ei gyfran o'r farchnad dros y ffin.

**Cynog Dafis:** I begin my contribution by stressing the WJEC's key role in the history of education in Wales and its massive contribution to developing an agenda for Wales that is appropriate and, in many ways, different. Its work on examinations and in training teachers has been of high quality to date. It is difficult to imagine a Welsh education system without its massive contribution.

Today, we have taken an important step forward. Labour's amendment—and Jane Davidson acknowledges this—has adopted the wording of our motion in its entirety, apart from one minor clause. That means that at last we have persuaded, indeed, I would say that we have forced the Government of

Llywodraeth Cymru i dderbyn ei chyfrifoldeb dros ddyfodol CBAC. Mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Jane yn awgrymu nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn hollol fodlon derbyn y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw o hyd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes amheuaeth gennyf mai'r ffaith bod y ddadl hon yn digwydd heddiw sydd wedi gorfodi Llywodraeth Cymru i gymryd y cyfrifoldeb hwnnw.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn ceisio ers Tachwedd 1998 i gael yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig, ac wedyn y weinyddiaeth yma, i edrych i mewn i'r holl gwestiwn hwn. Mae gennyf lythyrau o'r cyfnod hwnnw oddi wrth Peter Hain ac Alun Michael. Codwyd y mater yn y Siambr hon ac yn y Cynulliad dair, bedair neu ragor o weithiau. Yr ateb a gawsom bob tro oedd nad oedd a wnelo hyn â'r Cynulliad o gwbl ac mai mater i'r CBAC a CLLIC yn unig ydoedd. O leiaf yr ydym yn symud ymlaen o'r safbwynt hwnnw heddiw.

Ddiwrnod cyn y ddadl hon, cyfarfu CBAC â'r Gweinidog Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Cefais innau gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr CBAC ddoe hefyd. Yr oedd hynny'n anghyfrifol yn fy marn i, ond yr ydym yn symud ymlaen. Mater anghyfrifol arall, wrth gwrs, oedd ymddygiad Mike German yn rhyddhau cofnod rhwng y bargyfreithiwr Elizabeth Appleby a swyddogion CBAC i'r cyfryngau. Mae gennyf gopi o'r cofnod ac mae ei gynnwys yn ddigon i beri i wallt pen dyn godi. Nid af i fanylion y cyngor hwnnw, ond rhaid inni gymryd sylw ohono, hyd yn oed yn awr.

Yr oedd hynny ddwy flynedd yn ôl, pan weithredai CBAC mewn modd gwahanol. Bryd hynny, gwnaeth CBAC golled o dros £500,000 yn 1996-97 a cholled o £130,000 y flwyddyn ddilynol. Erbyn hyn, mae CBAC yn hyderus bod ei sefyllfa ariannol yn gadarn. Bu enillion yn y farchnad gystadleuol yn Lloegr, rhywbeth y mae Jane Davidson mor falch yn ei gylch. Yn sicr, ymddengys bod y sefyllfa wedi gwella'n sylweddol. Mynna CBAC hefyd fod y broblem gyfreithiol wedi ei datrys erbyn hyn, drwy iddo ganolbwyntio ar ei swyddogaethau craidd. Mae yn y broses o gau ei Uned Ewropeaidd, a oedd yn un rheswm dros yr anawsterau yn ei farn ef. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl eraill yn amau hynny

Wales to accept its responsibility for the future of the WJEC. What Jane said suggests that the Government is still not completely willing to accept that responsibility. However, I have no doubt that it is the fact that this debate is taking place today that has forced the Government of Wales to take that responsibility.

Since November 1998 I have been trying to get the former Welsh Office, and subsequently the administration here, to look into this whole question. I have letters from that period from Peter Hain and Alun Michael. The matter has been raised in this Chamber and in the Assembly, three or four times or more. The response that we received every time was that this had nothing whatsoever to do with the Assembly and that it was a matter for the WJEC and the WLGA alone. At least we are moving on from that viewpoint today.

A day before this debate, the WJEC met with the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning. I also had a meeting with WJEC representatives yesterday. That was irresponsible in my opinion, but we are moving forward. Another irresponsible matter, of course, was Mike German's conduct in leaking a minute between the Queen's Counsel Elizabeth Appleby and WJEC officials to the press. I have a copy of the minute and it is enough to make the hairs on the back of your neck stand up. I will not go into the detail of that advice, but we must pay attention to it, even now.

That was two years ago, when the WJEC was operating differently. At that time, the WJEC made a loss of over £500,000 in 1996-97 and a loss of £130,000 the following year. By now, the WJEC is confident that its financial position is stable. There have been gains in the competitive market in England, something that Jane Davidson is so proud of. It certainly seems that the situation has improved substantially. The WJEC also insists that the legal problem has now been resolved, as it is concentrating on its core functions. It is in the process of closing its European Unit, which it views as one of the reasons for the difficulties. However, other people doubt that and contradict that opinion.

ac yn dweud i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae'n hanfodol bod y Gweinidog, gyda CBAC a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, a chan gymryd ei chynghor annibynnol ei hunan, yn dod at wraidd y mater ac yn cael dadansoddiad clir ac awdurdodol o iechyd ariannol a chyfreithiol CBAC.

Clywsom heddiw gan Pauline Jarman am yr honiad am rôl y Cynulliad mewn perthynas â chyflog y prif weithredwr. Nid ydym wedi clywed dim gan Jane Davidson ynglŷn â hynny. Efallai yr hoffai gadarnhau neu wadu yn awr fod y Cynulliad neu'r adran yn cyfrannu at gyflog y prif weithredwr newydd. Ymddengys na wneir datganiad ynglŷn â hynny yn awr.

Ni fu gan CBAC brif weithredwr ers ymddiswyddiad neu ymddeoliad Ian Hume beth amser yn ôl. Yr oedd yn destun pryder fod corff pwysig fel hwn heb lyw nac arweinydd. Gweithredodd CBAC yn hynod o effeithiol o ystyried yr anhawster hwnnw.

Rhaid penderfynu a oes angen ail-strwythuro CBAC yn ôl y math o awgrymiadau sydd gan Elizabeth Appleby. Rhaid inni gael gwybod a oes angen hynny mwyach. Yn fy marn i, ac ym marn fy mhlaid, mae angen ystyriaeth bellach. Dyma lle y gwahaniaethaf yn glir oddi wrth safbwynt Jane Davidson. Rhaid inni fod yn fodlon gofyn a yw'r patrwm sefydliadol sydd gennym yng Nghymru yn briodol i'n hanghenion fel gwlad fach. Mae rhai Aelodau yn ysgwyd eu pennau. Nid ydynt hyd yn oed yn fodlon gofyn a yw ein patrwm sefydliadol yn briodol i wlad fach. Wrth gwrs y dylem fod yn gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw.

Ceisiau drafod hyn mewn dadl flaenorol ynglŷn ag adolygiad pum mlynedd CBAC. Bryd hynny, cawsom gefnogaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ein galwad i gysylltu'r adolygiad hwnnw â gweithgarwch CBAC a rhai sefydliadau eraill hefyd. Mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid inni yn awr wynebu'r ffaith fod marchnad gystadleuol yn ffordd gwbl anaddas o ddiogelu gwasanaeth arholiadau mewn gwlad fach fel Cymru sydd â'i hanghenion penodol ei hunan. Rhaid inni holi a yw'r rhaniad swyddogaethau rhwng ACCAC a CBAC yn briodol. Mae lle i gredu

It is essential that the Minister, with the WJEC and the Welsh Local Government Association, and taking her own independent advice, gets to the root of the issue and obtains a clear and authoritative interpretation of the WJEC's financial and legal health.

We heard today from Pauline Jarman about the allegation concerning the Assembly's role in relation to the chief executive's salary. We have not heard anything about that from Jane Davidson. Perhaps she would like to confirm or deny now that the Assembly or the department contributes towards the new chief executive's salary. It appears that a statement on that will not be made now.

The WJEC has not had a chief executive since the resignation or retirement of Ian Hume some time ago. It was a cause for concern that an important organisation such as this had no-one to steer or lead it. The WJEC operated extremely effectively considering that difficulty.

We must decide whether there is a need to restructure the WJEC according to suggestions such as those of Elizabeth Appleby. We must know whether that is still required. In my opinion, and that of my party, further consideration is required. This is where I clearly differ from Jane Davidson's viewpoint. We must be willing to ask whether the institutional pattern that we have in Wales is appropriate to our needs as a small country. Some Members are shaking their heads. They are not even willing to ask whether our institutional pattern is appropriate to a small country. Of course we should be asking that question.

We attempted to discuss this in a previous debate on the WJEC's quinquennial review. At that time, the Liberal Democrats supported us in our call to link that review with the activities of the WJEC and some other organisations. It is possible that we must now face the fact that a competitive market is a completely inappropriate way of safeguarding the examination service in a small country such as Wales that has its own specific needs. We must ask whether the division of functions between ACCAC and the WJEC is appropriate. There is room to

ei fod yn wastrafflyd o ran adnoddau.

believe that it is wasteful in terms of resources.

Yn ei hadolygiad, dylai Jane Davidson ystyried a ddylid creu corff cyhoeddus cenedlaethol a fyddai'n cyfuno swyddogaethau datblygu cwricwlwm, asesu a gwarantu safonau gyda darparu arholiadau cyhoeddus. Beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng arholiadau ac asesuadau? Yr un math o broses ydyw. Byddai integreiddio'r elfennau hynny yn synhwyrol, fel y cred yr Albanwyr a phobl Gogledd Iwerddon. Yr oedd sylw Jane Davidson ynghylch y sefyllfa yn yr Alban a'r problemau a gawsant gyda chyhoeddi canlyniadau arholiadau yn gwbl *frivolous*. Rhaid edrych ar fodel a gofyn a ydyw'n briodol, yn hytrach na chyfeirio at broblemau penodol sydd wedi digwydd codi mewn amgylchiadau arbennig. Efallai y byddai'n werth gofyn a yw'r Llywodraeth yn y fan hon am awgrymu i Weithrediaeth yr Alban y dylai weithredu'r model Cymreig. Tybed beth a ddywedai pe awgrymid hynny?

In her review, Jane Davidson should consider whether a national public body should be created that would combine the functions of curriculum development, assessment and safeguarding standards with the provision of public examinations. What is the difference between examinations and assessments? It is the same kind of process. Integrating those elements would be sensible, as the Scots and the people of Northern Ireland believe. Jane Davidson's comment regarding the situation in Scotland and the problems that they suffered in publishing examination results was completely frivolous. We must look at a model and ask whether it is appropriate, rather than refer to specific problems that happened to arise in particular circumstances. Perhaps it would be worth asking whether the Government here is going to suggest to the Scottish Executive that it should implement the Welsh model? I wonder how it would react to that suggestion?

Byddai angen deddfwriaeth newydd i wneud hyn—

New legislation would be required to do this—

**Jane Davidson:** In terms of your proposal to link ACCAC and the WJEC, you have already said that Wales is a small country. Therefore, it is important that we increase the market share regarding examinations. Scotland has a different curriculum, but Wales is part of the national curriculum. It is important that we continue to enable the WJEC to expand on its market share in England which, for its directors, local government in Wales, is a success story that brings extra income into Wales, enabling the examination body to work. Do you not accept that?

**Jane Davidson:** Yn nhermau eich cynnig i gysylltu ACCAC â CBAC, yr ydych eisoes wedi dweud mai gwlad fechan yw Cymru. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cynyddu cyfran y farchnad o ran arholiadau. Mae gan yr Alban gwricwlwm gwahanol, ond mae Cymru yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn parhau i alluogi CBAC i ehangu ar ei gyfran o'r farchnad yn Lloegr sydd, i'w gyfarwyddwyr, llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, yn llwyddiant a ddaw ag incwm ychwanegol i Gymru, gan alluogi'r bwrdd arholi i weithio. Oni dderbyniwch hynny?

11:02 a.m.

**Cynog Dafis:** Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r egwyddor o werthu gwasanaethau y tu hwnt i ffiniau Cymru. Mae Jane yn hapus i adael i'r gallu i gystadlu'n llwyddiannus yn y farchnad ofalu am ddyfodol a thynged CBAC. Yr ydych yn gallu ennill a cholli mewn marchnad. Nid yw'r ffaith fod CBAC yn llwyddiannus a llewyrchus heddiw yn golygu y bydd hynny'n wir ymhen pum mlynedd,

**Cynog Dafis:** I do not object to the principle of selling services beyond the boundaries of Wales. Jane is happy to leave the future and fate of the WJEC to its ability to compete successfully in the market. You can win and lose in a market. The fact that the WJEC is successful and thriving today does not mean that the situation will be the same in five years' time, because the market could be

oherwydd gallai'r farchnad fod yn fwy cystadleuol a didostur erbyn hynny. Rhaid inni sicrhau diogelwch parhaol i'r corff arholi, heb ddibynnu ar y farchnad.

Ynglŷn â chwricwlwm cenedlaethol, yr oeddwn o'r farn mai dyna sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn awyddus i greu sefyllfa sydd yn caniatáu i'r cwricwlwm hwnnw ddatblygu'n wahanol, os yw hynny'n briodol, i'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol yn Lloegr. Nid wyf yn dweud y dylai hynny ddigwydd bob amser, ond dylai fod yn opsiwn. Nid wyf am greu sefyllfa lle na fydd ein corff arholi yn gallu mynd i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw gan fod llwyddiant masnachol ei bapurau arholiad yn dibynnu ar farchnad tu hwnt i Gymru. Rhaid inni fod yn barod i fod yn fwy radical. Fodd bynnag, dim ond gofyn am i hynny gael ei ystyried yr wyf ar hyn o bryd, a dyna'r oll y gofynnais amdano pan fuom yn dadlau hyn o'r blaen. Nid wyf yn gofyn am ymrwymiad, dim ond ystyriaeth. Nid wyf yn gallu deall, er fy mod yn deall yn iawn, pam fod y Llywodraeth eisiau osgoi'r posibilrwydd o ystyried model amgen.

Wrth sôn am fodel amgen, nid wyf yn dweud y dylid trosglwyddo cyfrifoldebau a swyddogaethau CBAC i ACCAC. Mae nifer o ddadleuon yn erbyn gwneud hynny. Mae llawer ohonom yn pryderu bod ACCAC yn rhy barod i hidlo awgrymiadau yn ymwneud ag arholiadau a chwricwlwm o'r QCA yn Llundain. Rhaid inni gael corff yng Nghymru sydd â'r gallu i fod yn wreiddiol. Mae pryderon hefyd ynglŷn â'r maes llafur Saesneg, gan mai'r cyfan a wna ACCAC yw derbyn yr awgrymiadau o Lundain. Rhaid cyfuno adnoddau CBAC ac ACCAC i weithio ar gwricwlwm a meysydd llafur Cymreig.

I gloi, wrth iddi gynnal trafodaethau pellach gyda CBAC, a wnaiff Jane Davidson ofyn barn y corff hwnnw ar ba fath o fodel a ddylai fod gennym yng Nghymru? Efallai y caiff ei synnu gan yr ateb.

more competitive and cut-throat by then. We must ensure that the examination body is protected at all times, without depending on the market.

Regarding a national curriculum, I assumed that that is what we have in Wales. I am eager to create a situation that allows that curriculum to develop differently, if it is appropriate, to the national curriculum in England. I am not saying that it should happen at all times, but it should be an option. I do not want to create a situation where our examining body cannot move in that direction because the commercial success of its exam papers depends on markets beyond Wales. We must be willing to be more radical. However, all I am asking is for consideration to be given to this, which is all I asked for when we debated this previously. I am not asking for a commitment, only consideration. I cannot understand, yet I understand full well, why the Government wants to close its mind to the possibility of considering an alternative model.

When talking of an alternative model, I am not saying that the responsibilities and functions of the WJEC should be transferred to ACCAC. There are many arguments against doing that. Many of us are concerned that ACCAC is too willing to filter examination and curriculum suggestions that come from the QCA in London. We must have a body in Wales that can think for itself. There are also concerns about the English syllabus, because ACCAC merely accepts suggestions from London. We must combine the resources of the WJEC and ACCAC to work on a Welsh curriculum and syllabus.

Finally, during further discussions with the WJEC, will Jane Davidson ask the opinion of that body on what kind of model we should have in Wales? Perhaps she will be surprised by the response.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 7, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 45.*

*Amendment 1: For 7, Abstain 0, Against 45.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment rejected.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 23.  
 Amendment 2: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 23.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline



Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Law, Peter  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment adopted.*

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly*

*calls upon the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to hold discussions with the Welsh Joint Education Committee and the Welsh Local Government Association in order to (a) obtain a clear understanding of the legal status and financial circumstances of the WJEC, ensuring that the outcome of these discussions is brought to the attention of the Assembly and (b) to report on steps taken to safeguard the future of this crucially important national body.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gynnal trafodaethau gyda Chyd-bwyllgor Addysg Cymru a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn (a) cael dealltwriaeth glir ynglŷn â statws cyfreithiol ac amgylchiadau ariannol CBAC, gan sicrhau bod ffrwyth y trafodaethau hynny yn cael ei ddwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad a (b) adrodd ar y camau sydd yn cael eu cymryd i ddiogelu dyfodol y corff cenedlaethol holl bwysig hwn.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 7.  
 Amended motion: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 7.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Edwards, Richard  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Feld, Val  
 German, Michael

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Humphreys, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion adopted.*

### **Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development Scheme**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendment 7 in the name of David Davies. I would be grateful if Members stuck to the time limit, as many Members wish to speak.

**The Minister for Environment (Sue Essex):** I propose that

*the National Assembly*

*1. Adopts as its sustainable development scheme, in accordance with section 121(1) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, the document entitled 'Learning to Live Differently' laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2000;*

*2. Requests the Minister for Environment to develop an action plan in consultation with Assembly Members and others for implementing the scheme;*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dewisiais welliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 7 yn enw David Davies. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai Aelodau yn cadw o fewn yr amser penodedig, gan fod llawer o Aelodau yn dymuno siarad.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd (Sue Essex):** Cynigiau fod

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. Yn mabwysiadu'r ddogfen 'Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2000 fel ei gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, yn unol ag Adran 121(1) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998;*

*2. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu, drwy ymgynghori ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac eraill, ar gyfer gosod y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ar waith;*

3. Requests the Minister for Environment to bring forward practical options to ensure that sustainable development is mainstreamed and promoted within the Assembly's structures;

4. Requests the Minister for Environment to bring forward within three months an initial set of indicators of sustainable development that take account of responses to the document 'A Sustainable Wales—Measuring the Difference', consultation on which closed on 27 October;

5. Thanks all individuals and organisations who responded to that consultation document.

I begin with a personal statement. A couple of years ago, I campaigned for the sustainable development requirement to be included in the Government of Wales legislation. Therefore, I was naturally delighted to see that achieved. It is a trick of history that I should propose the motion to adopt the sustainable development scheme. This is a satisfying moment for me. However, I also pay tribute to many people who have made an important contribution to this, especially Christine Gwyther and Carwyn Jones, who as Members with former responsibility for this issue have played an important part in the process. I hope that, Chris, in particular, will take great satisfaction from seeing the scheme on the statue if it is adopted today.

I return to the debate that we had two years ago about the sustainable development requirement being included in the legislation. At that time, it was not a forgone conclusion that we would have an amended piece of legislation. There was a statement about equal opportunities, which I and other Members would have liked to see, but it was not a forgone conclusion that something like section 121 would be included. This is a great tribute to the people who were involved in developing the legislation, particularly Ron Davies. They, and the Government, realised the great opportunity that the Government of Wales Bill gave us not only to secure devolution, but to secure legislation that encourages us to act differently.

3. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gyflwyno opsiynau ymarferol i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan annatod o strwythurau'r Cynulliad, a'i fod yn cael ei hyrwyddo;

4. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gyflwyno casgliad cychwynnol o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy o fewn tri mis, gan ystyried yr ymatebion i'r ddogfen 'Cymru Gynaliadwy—Mesur y Gwahaniaeth', y daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori arni i ben ar 27 Hydref;

5. Yn diolch i'r holl unigolion a sefydliadau a ymatebodd i'r ddogfen ymgynghori honno.

Dechreuaf gyda datganiad personol. Ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, ymgyrchais dros gynnwys y gofyniad datblygu cynaliadwy yn neddfwriaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Felly, yn naturiol yr oeddwn yn falch iawn i weld y cyflawnwyd hynny. Mae'n un o ystrywiau hanes y dylwn gynnig y cynnig i fabwysiadu'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae hon yn ennyd sydd yn rhoi boddhad mawr imi. Fodd bynnag, talaf deyrnged i lawer o bobl a wnaeth gyfraniad pwysig i hyn, yn enwedig Christine Gwyther a Carwyn Jones, sydd, fel Aelodau â chyfrifoldeb blaenorol dros y mater hwn, wedi chwarae rhan bwysig yn y broses. Gobeithiaf y bydd Chris, yn arbennig, yn cael llawer o foddhad o weld y cynllun ar y statud os caiff ei fabwysiadu heddiw.

Dychwelaf i'r ddadl a gawsom ddwy flynedd yn ôl ynglŷn â chynnwys y gofyniad am ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn y ddeddfwriaeth. Ar y pryd, nid oedd yn anochel y byddai gennym ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth diwygiedig. Yr oedd datganiad ynglŷn â chyfle cyfartal, y byddwn i ac Aelodau eraill wedi hoffi ei weld, ond nid oedd yn anochel y cynhwysid rhywbeth fel adran 121. Mae hyn yn deyrnged fawr i'r bobl a oedd yn gysylltiedig â datblygu'r ddeddfwriaeth, yn arbennig Ron Davies. Sylweddolasant hwy, a'r Llywodraeth, y cyfle mawr a roddai Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru inni nid yn unig i sicrhau datganoli, ond i sicrhau deddfwriaeth sydd yn ein hannog i weithredu'n wahanol.

It saddens me that we do not get enough coverage of how the Assembly deals with issues and how it tries to do so differently. When I go elsewhere in the UK, people who know what we are doing see this as an exciting opportunity for us. Sustainable development is an important issue in terms of working differently. Therefore, I give my heartfelt thanks to the people who had the foresight to include this in the legislation and face up to the points made at the time. It may seem strange, but it was suggested to me that a commitment to sustainable development might cause us lose our competitive edge as an economy, and that including it in the legislation would put Wales at a competitive disadvantage. I am glad that, two years on, that is not said anymore. People now realise that quite the reverse can be true. If we can get this right, it will not put us at a disadvantage; it will give us a considerable advantage.

I wanted to give that background because, over the past two years, I have seen a remarkable change in attitude, from traditional areas where you would expect a degree of support and in my dealings with business and the private sector. Many of those organisations are now signing up to sustainable development.

**Ron Davies:** I am grateful for your earlier remarks. I place on record my tribute to a range of conservation organisations that were heavily involved at the time in lobbying the then Government to introduce this measure. I single out the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds. I suppose I should declare an interest because I pay an annual subscription to the RSPB, although I am not sure whether that counts as my gaining from it. However, I commend it for its work in framing the amendment and then in ensuring, when it eventually went through the House of Lords, that it was expressed with greater clarity. It did a superb job and it deserves recognition.

**Sue Essex:** The charter that we produced was prepared with the RSPB's help. It is important that a range of people and organisations are acknowledged.

Mae'n fy nhristáu na roddir digon o sylw i sut yr ymddrinnia'r Cynulliad â materion a sut y ceisia wneud hynny'n wahanol. Pan âf i fannau eraill yn y DU, bydd pobl a wŷr beth a wnawn yn gweld hyn fel cyfle cyffrous inni. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn fater pwysig o ran gweithio'n wahanol. Felly, diolchaf o waelod calon i'r bobl a oedd â'r rhagweledigaeth i gynnwys hyn yn y ddeddfwriaeth ac sydd yn fodlon wynebu'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd ar y pryd. Gall ymddangos yn rhyfedd, ond awgrymwyd imi y gallai ymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy achosi inni golli ein mantais gystadleuol fel economi, ac y byddai ei gynnwys yn y ddeddfwriaeth yn rhoi Cymru o dan anfantais gystadleuol. Ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, yr wyf yn falch na chaiff hynny ei ddweud mwyach. Sylweddola pobl yn awr y gall y gwrthwyneb fod yn wir. Os gallwn gael hyn yn iawn, ni fydd yn ein rhoi o dan anfantais; bydd yn rhoi mantais sylweddol inni.

Yr oeddwn yn dymuno rhoi'r cefndir hwnnw oherwydd, yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, gwelais newid rhyfeddol o ran agwedd, o ardaloedd traddodiadol lle y byddech yn disgwyl rhywfaint o gefnogaeth ac wrth imi ymwneud â busnesau a'r sector preifat. Mae llawer o'r sefydliadau hyn bellach yn ymrwymo i ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

**Ron Davies:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau cynharach. Cofnodaf fy nheyrnged i amrywiaeth o sefydliadau cadwraeth a fu'n weithgar iawn bryd hynny wrth lobïo'r Llywodraeth ar y pryd i gyflwyno'r mesur hwn. Cyfeiriaf yn arbennig at y Gymdeithas Frenhinol Er Gwarchod Adar. Tybiaf y dylwn ddatgan buddiant gan fy mod yn talu tanysgrifiad blynyddol i'r RSPB, er nad wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny'n cyfrif fel fy mod yn elwa arno. Fodd bynnag, fe'i canmolaf am ei gwaith wrth lunio'r gwelliant ac yna sicrhau, pan aeth drwy Dŷ'r Arglwyddi yn y pen draw, y cafodd ei fynegi â mwy o eglurder. Gwnaeth waith rhagorol a haedda gydnabyddiaeth.

**Sue Essex:** Paratowyd y siarter a gynhyrchwyd gennym gyda chymorth yr RSPB. Mae'n bwysig y cydnabyddir amrywiaeth o bobl a sefydliadau.

11:12 a.m.

As we take this scheme forward, we are operating in a more positive framework and environment where people can see the benefits of linking social, economic and environmental issues. We are trying to mainstream this initiative in terms of what our partners do. It is very much about having a healthy and flourishing economy. It is important that the message goes out that this is not in competition with a healthy and flourishing environment. Indeed, the chairman of Shell UK has said that:

‘Companies not interested in sustainable development issues will not survive long’.

Those are interesting and salutary words.

What does the scheme say? I will not go through it in detail, but I hope that it is presented in a clear and common sense way that people can understand. It is important that people understand that the words are supposed to be translated into action. The scheme says to us, as an Assembly, that it is important that we mainstream this policy and principle in everything that we do. In this scheme, we are committed to reviewing all our existing policies and programmes over five years and ensure that all our new programmes take sustainable development into account. It is about integration and linking strategies as well as realising that we need to push specific policies and issues such as biodiversity, integrated transport and Objective 1 funding; many of the issues that you debate in Committees. They must be integrated and linked. In particular, we must review planning guidance and ensure that is done in accordance with the scheme. We must look at how we work. It is about working with organisations and people at every level, and the Assembly must give the lead.

As a starting point, and to put a bit of reality into this—excuse me, I am suffering from a cold, so if I use the odd tissue now and again I am not crying or overcome with emotion, it is just the usual bug. We must be realistic about our situation in Wales. In many ways, we start from a low base. We have low rates

Wrth inni ddatblygu'r cynllun hwn ymhellach, gweithredwn o fewn fframwaith ac amgylchedd mwy positif lle y gall pobl weld manteision cysylltu materion cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Ceisiwn ddod â'r fenter hon i'r brif ffrwd o ran yr hyn a wna ein partneriaid. Mae'n ymwneud llawer â chael economi iach a llewyrchus. Mae'n bwysig y trosglwyddir y neges nad yw hyn yn cystadlu ag amgylchedd iach a llewyrchus. Yn wir, dywedodd cadeirydd Shell UK:

‘Ni fydd cwmnïau nad oes ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn materion datblygu cynaliadwy yn para'n hir’.

Mae'r rheini yn eiriau diddorol a llesol.

Beth ddywed y cynllun? Nid âf drwyddo yn fanwl, ond gobeithiaf y'i cyflwynir mewn ffordd glir gyda synnwyr cyffredin y gall pobl ei deall. Mae'n bwysig y dealla pobl fod y geiriau i fod cael eu troi yn weithredoedd. Dywed y cynllun wrthym ni, fel Cynulliad, ei bod yn bwysig inni ddod â'r polisi a'r egwyddor hon yn rhan annatod o bopeth a wnawn. Yn y cynllun hwn, yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i adolygu'r holl bolisiau a rhaglenni presennol dros bum mlynedd a sicrhau y bydd ein holl raglenni newydd yn ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'n ymwneud ag integreiddio a chysylltu strategaethau yn ogystal â sylweddoli bod angen inni wthio polisiau a materion penodol megis bioamrywiaeth, trafnidiaeth integredig ac arian Amcan 1; llawer o'r materion a drafodwch mewn Pwyllgorau. Rhaid iddynt fod yn integredig ac wedi'u cysylltu â'i gilydd. Yn arbennig, rhaid inni adolygu arweiniad cynllunio a sicrhau y gwneir hynny yn unol â'r cynllun. Rhaid inni edrych ar y modd y gweithiwn. Mae'n ymwneud â gweithio gyda sefydliadau a phobl ar bob lefel, a rhaid i'r Cynulliad roi arweiniad.

Fel man cychwyn, ac i roi ychydig o sylwedd i hyn—esgusodwch fi, yr wyf yn dioddef o annwyd, felly os defnyddiaf hances yn awr ac yn y man nid wyf yn crïo nac wedi fy llethu gan deimlad, ond dim ond y byg cyffredin ydyw. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig ynglŷn â'n sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Mewn llawer o ffordd,

of recycling, which we mentioned, high carbon dioxide emissions and a series of indicators that are not particularly good. We know that Wales's economy has been dramatically transformed, but it has still not broken through the barriers of having high wages and a new, clean economy. We are still dependent on a comparatively small number of manufacturing firms and we have comparatively high rates of chronic sickness and inactivity. We also have low wages, but they are not so low that we could sell ourselves overseas—nor would we wish to I might add—as a cheap labour economy. Instead, we must sell ourselves on the basis of the quality of our environment, workforce and society. We have some wonderful advantages and riches of which to take advantage. We have riches in terms of our visual environment, our coastal and marine environment, and riches in terms of some of the experiences from which organisations have learnt.

Over the last few years, there have been many examples of good practice. Some of those examples are on display in the milling area and I hope that Members take advantage of the opportunity to learn about the work of organisations such as SPARC, the Groundwork Trust, the Dyfi Eco-Valley Partnership, the Arts Factory in Ferndale, Trawsfynydd Community Trust, Powys Farm Futures and Assembly initiatives such as Safe Routes to Schools. An enormous richness of experience exists in Wales, some of which was developed prior to us discussing sustainable development, but much of which has been encouraged by the fact that we use that kind of language and terminology.

I am pleased to say that we can do our bit through grants and other regimes to try to pump-prime and encourage the practice of sustainable development. I want to say encouraging words about that. There are many examples in Wales from which we can learn. There are things that we can do at the local level. I want to stress that action at the local level is key to making this transformation, because people can identify with initiatives for improvements within their local communities. For example, I hope that our Communities First initiative will be a

dechreuwn ar y gwaelod. Mae gennym gyfraddau ailgylchu isel, a grybwyllwyd, gollyngiadau uchel o garbon deuocsid a chyfres o ddangosyddion nad ydynt yn arbennig o dda. Gwyddom fod economi Cymru wedi'i thrawsffurfio'n ddramatig, ond ni oresgynnodd rwystrau cyflogau uchel ac economi lân, newydd eto. Yr ydym yn parhau i fod yn ddibynnol ar nifer cymharol fechan o gwmnïau gweithgynhyrchu ac mae gennym gyfraddau cymharol uchel o salwch cronig ac anweithgaredd. Mae gennym gyflogau isel hefyd, ond nid ydynt mor isel fel y gallem werthu ein hunain dramor—a hoffwn ychwanegu na fyddem yn dymuno hynny—fel economi llafur rhad. Yn lle hynny, rhaid inni werthu ein hunain ar sail ansawdd ein hamgylchedd, ein gweithlu a'n cymdeithas. Mae gennym rai manteision a chyfoeth gwych i fanteisio arnynt. Mae gennym gyfoeth o safbwynt ein hamgylchedd gweledol, ein hamgylchedd arfordirol a morol, a chyfoeth o safbwynt rhai o'r profiadau y dysgodd ein sefydliadau ohonynt.

Yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, cafwyd llawer o enghreifftiau o arfer da. Arddangosir rhai o'r enghreifftiau hynny yn y neuadd a gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau yn manteisio ar y cyfle i ddysgu am waith sefydliadau megis SPARC, Ymddiriedolaeth Groundwork, Partneriaeth Eco-Dyffryn Dyfi, y Ffatri Gelfyddydau yng Nglyn Rhedynog, Ymddiriedolaeth Gymunedol Trawsfynydd, Powys Farm Futures a mentrau'r Cynulliad megis Ffyrdd Diogel i Ysgolion. Mae cyfoeth profiad anferthol yn bodoli yng Nghymru, y datblygwyd rhywfaint ohono cyn inni drafod datblygu cynaliadwy, ond annogwyd llawer ohono gan y ffaith ein bod yn defnyddio'r math hwnnw o iaith a therminoleg.

Yr wyf yn falch i ddweud y gallwn chwarae ein rhan drwy grantiau a systemau eraill i geisio ysgogi ac annog yr arfer o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf am ddweud geiriau calonogol am hynny. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau yng Nghymru y gallwn ddysgu oddi wrthynt. Mae pethau y gallwn eu gwneud ar lefel leol. Yr wyf am bwysleisio bod gweithredu ar y lefel leol yn allweddol i wneud y trawsffurfiad hwn, oherwydd gall pobl uniaethu â mentrau ar gyfer gwelliannau o fewn eu cymunedau lleol. Er enghraifft, gobeithiaf y bydd ein menter Cymunedau yn

good pilot for sustainable development. Among the wishes to tackle deprivation, I hope that we will clearly conceive how communities can use objectives on sustainability to help them achieve that.

We also have large-scale initiatives at the national level, such as Objective 1 funding and developing a waste strategy, which are about providing jobs as well as helping the environment. Those are good vehicles for developing sustainable development policies. As a small nation, we can take advantage of those initiatives and share our experiences.

What does the motion say? What will we do once this scheme has been approved? There are three important things that we must do. One is to put the indicators in place. We hoped, initially, that they would be part of the scheme, but because we had considerable responses to the consultation, I agreed to extend that time and it is right and proper that we do that. It is important that we get this right. We are happy to support a seminar on this, which Groundwork Wales, RSPB Cymru, WWF Cymru and others have arranged. Over the next few months, it is important that we put those sustainability indicators in place.

We also need to look, as part of the motion, at the structures that we have in place for mainstreaming sustainability. I know that has been a concern for many. However, the scheme is now in place and we have a clear view of where we want to go. We need to look at the political and administrative structures for achieving that. In terms of the political structures, I was one of those people who fervently supported the idea for a sustainable development committee, a bit like the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. However, after 18 months in the Assembly I am not so sure. It is a sensible option, but I want to consider other options, because I would like to find a vehicle that involves all Members so that everyone feels that they are involved, because that is important. This issue does not only concern the Environment Committee, but all Committees, such as the

Gyntaf yn rhaglen beilot dda i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Ymhlith y dymuniadau i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn dirnad yn glir sut y gall cymunedau ddefnyddio amcanion ar gynaliadwyedd i'w helpu i gyflawni hynny.

Mae gennym hefyd fentrau ar raddfa eang ar y lefel genedlaethol, megis arian Amcan 1 a datblygu strategaeth ar wastraff, sydd yn ymwneud â darparu swyddi yn ogystal â helpu'r amgylchedd. Mae'r rheini yn gyfryngau da ar gyfer datblygu polisiau datblygu cynaliadwy. Fel cenedl fach, gallwn fanteisio ar y mentrau hynny a rhannu ein profiadau.

Beth ddywed y cynnig? Beth a wnawn unwaith y cymeradwyir y cynllun hwn? Mae tri pheth pwysig sydd yn rhaid inni eu gwneud. Un ohonynt yw rhoi'r dangosyddion yn eu lle. Yr oeddem yn gobeithio, yn y lle cyntaf, y byddent yn rhan o'r cynllun, ond oherwydd inni gael ymateb sylweddol i'r ymgynghoriad, cytunais i ymestyn yr amser hwnnw ac mae'n iawn ac yn gyfiawn inni wneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael hwn yn iawn. Yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi seminar ar hyn, a drefnwyd gan Groundwork Cymru, RSPB Cymru, WWF Cymru ac eraill. Yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn rhoi'r dangosyddion cynaliadwyedd hynny yn eu lle.

Mae angen inni edrych hefyd, fel rhan o'r cynnig, ar y strwythurau sydd yn eu lle ar gyfer prif ffrydio cynaliadwyedd. Gwn fod hynny wedi bod yn destun pryder i lawer. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynllun bellach yn ei le ac mae gennym olwg clir o ble y dymunwn fynd. Mae angen inni edrych ar y strwythurau gwleidyddol a gweinyddol er mwyn cyflawni hynny. O ran y strwythurau gwleidyddol, yr oeddwn yn un o'r bobl hynny a gefnogodd yn frwd y syniad o bwyllgor datblygu cynaliadwy, ychydig fel y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl 18 mis yn y Cynulliad nid wyf mor siŵr. Mae'n ddewis synhwyrol, ond yr wyf am ystyried dewisiadau eraill, oherwydd hoffwn ddod o hyd i gyfrwng sydd yn cynnwys pob Aelod fel bod pawb yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu cynnwys, am fod hynny'n bwysig. Mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â'r

Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, the Economic Development Committee and the Agriculture and Rural Development Committee. Whatever Committee Members sit on, they can play a part. It is important that all Members feel that they understand and own this concept and can translate it to their local communities. Over the next couple of months, I want us to discuss structures and consider the options that can be put in place.

Third, I want to make an important administrative point about the organisation. This can never be about one or two people in the sustainable development unit achieving everything, although they have done a miraculous job. I pay tribute to that small group of people who have worked so hard, including the officials and agencies, such as the Environment Agency and the Countryside Council for Wales. A lot of outside support has helped us to reach this point, but it is—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am sorry to interrupt, but I am conscious about protecting back benchers' time.

**Sue Essex:** I will quickly mention a few other points.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Not too many, I hope.

**Sue Essex:** It is important that I say a few things. Cynog is not here, but I particularly wanted to cover one point for his benefit.

This is an important scheme and it is a critical day for this—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** It is important to protect the back benchers.

**Sue Essex:** I will be as quick as I can and refer to the main points.

The action plan will be developed over the next couple of months. I mention the challenges, because it is important that we

Pwyllgor Amgylchedd, ond â'r holl Bwyllgorau, megis y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, Y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a'r Pwyllgor Amaethyddiaeth a Datblygu Gwledig. Pa bynnag Bwyllgor yr eistedda Aelodau arnynt, gallant chwarae rhan. Mae'n bwysig bod pob aelod yn teimlo y deallant y cysyniad hwn a'u bod yn berchen arno ac y gallant ei gymhwyso i'w cymunedau lleol. Yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, yr wyf am drafod strwythurau ac ystyried yr opsiynau y gellir eu rhoi ar waith.

Yn drydydd, yr wyf am wneud pwynt gweinyddol pwysig am y trefniant. Ni all hyn byth fod yn un neu ddau berson yn yr uned datblygu cynaliadwy yn cyflawni popeth, er eu bod wedi gwneud gwaith gwyrthiol. Talaf deyrnged i'r grŵp bach hwnnw o bobl sydd wedi gweithio mor galed, gan gynnwys y swyddogion a'r asiantaethau, megis Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a Chyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru. Mae llawer o gefnogaeth o'r tu allan wedi ein helpu i gyrraedd y man hwn, ond—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf dorri ar eich traws, ond yr wyf yn ymwybodol o ddiogelu amser y meinciau cefn.

**Sue Essex:** Soniaf yn gyflym am ychydig o bwyntiau eraill.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dim gormod, gobeithiaf.

**Sue Essex:** Mae'n bwysig fy mod yn dweud rhai pethau. Nid yw Cynog yma, ond yr wyf yn benodol am gwmpasu un pwynt er ei les ef.

Mae hwn yn gynllun pwysig ac mae'n ddiwrnod tyngedfennol i'r—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n bwysig diogelu'r meinciau cefn.

**Sue Essex:** Byddaf mor gyflym â phosibl a chyfeiriaf at y prif bwyntiau.

Caiff y cynllun gweithredu ei ddatblygu yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. Soniaf am yr heriau, oherwydd ei bod yn bwysig inni



realise that there are some real challenges. We are not camouflaging the difficulties.

While, perhaps, reassessing our indicators on quality of life, it is important that we do not simply consider GDP, but other quality of life indicators. I would like us to develop that. It is also important that we look at Wales in the global setting and consider our international obligations and how that affects us. We need to take that on board. It also means making different decisions in different ways.

I made a commitment that I would cover renewable energy. I propose that as well as taking a fundamental look at planning guidance, which will feed into the energy strategy, a small group is set up of those that are directly involved, such as the wind energy producers and environmental groups. They can then work on producing a technical advice note. I hope that the chair of the National Assembly sustainable energy group might want to be part of that. That is for him to consider. However, if we can crack this in the next few weeks we can move from a reactive to a proactive situation, which is what everybody wants. I am keen to see many places developing green energy and other forms of renewable energy. I give a commitment that we will endeavour to produce that document in an inclusive way. Also, you have my commitment that I want this mainstreamed throughout the Assembly. I hope that when we next review 'Betterwales.com' we can amend it and include some of these points.

11:22 a.m.

I have already indicated to Plaid Cymru that I am happy to support amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5. The European regional innovation grant application is a good idea and we will take that forward. We do not have an identified sum of match funding for it at the moment, but it is sensible to apply for that grant. I am not prepared to support amendment 6. It is not that I do not agree with the spirit of the amendment; I disagree with its wording. We need to sit down with

sylweddoli bod rhai heriau gwirioneddol. Nid ydym yn cuddliwio'r anawsterau.

Er ein bod, o bosibl, yn ailasesu ein dangosyddion ar ansawdd bywyd, mae'n bwysig nad ystyriwn CMC yn unig, ond dangosyddion ansawdd bywyd eraill. Hoffwn inni ddatblygu hynny. Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni edrych ar Gymru o ran ei sefyllfa bydeang ac ystyried ein hymrwymiaidau a sut yr effeithia hynny arnom ni. Mae angen inni gynnwys hynny. Golyga hefyd wneud penderfyniadau gwahanol mewn ffyrdd gwahanol.

Ymrwymais y byddwn yn cwmpasu ynni adnewyddadwy. Cynigiaf, yn ogystal â chymryd golwg sylfaenol ar arweiniad cynllunio, a fydd yn bwydo i mewn i'r strategaeth ar ynni, y sefydlir grŵp bach o'r rheini sydd yn gysylltiedig â'r mater yn uniongyrchol, megis cynhyrchwyr ynni gwynt a grwpiau amgylcheddol. Gallant wedyn weithio ar gynhyrchu nodyn cyngor technegol. Gobeithiaf y bydd cadeirydd grŵp ynni cynaliadwy'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn dymuno bod yn rhan o hynny. Mater iddo ef yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, os gallwn lwyddo yn hyn o beth yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosaf nesaf gallwn symud o sefyllfa adweithiol i sefyllfa weithredol, sef yr hyn a ddymuna pawb. Yr wyf yn awyddus i weld llawer o leoedd yn datblygu ynni gwyrdd a ffurfiau eraill ar ynni adnewyddadwy. Ymrwymaf y ceisiwn gynhyrchu'r ddogfen honno mewn ffordd gynhwysol. Hefyd, cewch fy ymrwymiad y dymunaf wneud hyn yn rhan annatod drwy'r Cynulliad. Pan adolygw'n 'Gwellcymru.com' nesaf gobeithiaf y gallwn ei ddiwygio a chynnwys rhai o'r pwyntiau hyn.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi i Plaid Cymru fy mod yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5. Mae'r cais am grant menter rhanbarthol Ewropeaidd yn syniad da a byddwn yn datblygu hynny ymhellach. Nid oes gennym swm a nodwyd o arian cyfatebol ar ei gyfer ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'n synhwyrol ymgeisio am y grant hwnnw. Nid wyf yn barod i gefnogi gwelliant 6. Nid fy mod yn anghytuno â meddylfryd y gwelliant; anghytunaf â'r geiriad. Mae angen inni

local government and agree on a system that it is happy with.

I turn now to David Davies's amendment. Sometimes I am lost for words. In this case, I will try to put a few together. I do not know how you have missed this, David, but we have been doing what the amendment calls for throughout this year. Planning guidance review has taken place, the planning forum has reported and we talk constantly in Committee about mainstreaming sustainable development in planning guidance. We are doing that now. Amendment 7 is superfluous. I accept it in spirit, but it is superfluous.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose the following amendments, all in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

I propose amendment 1. At the end of point 1 add:

*instructs the Executive to use this scheme as the basis of an application for a European regional innovation grant.*

I propose amendment 2. At the end of amended point 1 add:

*and notes that the key policies documents which will contribute to sustainable development should include 'Betterwales.com' and 'Building Excellent Schools Together'.*

I propose amendment 3. Add at the end of point 2:

*within three months with provision for periodical updating thereafter.*

I propose amendment 4. In point 3 of the motion after 'practical options' add 'within three months'.

I propose amendment 5. After point 4 insert new point 5:

*requests all Ministers to demonstrate how they are promoting sustainable development in the exercise of their functions.*

I propose amendment 6. After new point 5

eistedd a thrafod â llywodraeth leol a chytuno ar system y mae'n hapus â hi.

Trof yn awr at welliant David Davies. Weithiau yr wyf yn gegrwth. Yr yr achos hwn, ceisiaf ddweud rhywbeth. Ni wn sut y collasoch hyn, David, ond buom yn gwneud yr hyn a fynna'r gwelliant drwy gydol y flwyddyn hon. Cynhaliwyd adolygiad o arweiniad cynllunio, cafwyd adroddiad gan y fforwm cynllunio a siaradwn yn gyson yn y Pwyllgor am wneud datblygu cynaliadwy yn rhan annatod o arweiniad cynllunio. Gwnawn hynny yn awr. Nid oes angen gwelliant 7. Derbyniaf y meddylfryd, ond nid oes ei angen.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol, oll yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Cynigiaf welliant 1. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 1 ychwaneger:

*yn cyfarwyddo'r Weithrediaeth i ddefnyddio'r cynllun hwn fel sail ar gyfer cymhwyso grant menter rhanbarthol Ewrop.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ar ddiwedd pwynt 1 wedi'i ddiwygio ychwaneger:

*ac yn nodi y dylai'r dogfennau polisi allweddol a fydd yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu cynaliadwy gynnwys 'Gwellcymru.com' ac 'Adeiladu Ysgolion Rhagorol Gyda'n Gilydd'.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwaneger ar ddiwedd pwynt 2:

*o fewn tri mis gyda darpariaeth ar gyfer diweddaru rheolaidd wedi hynny.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ym mhwynt 3 y cynnig, yn dilyn 'opsiynau ymarferol' ychwaneger 'o fewn tri mis'.

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ar ôl pwynt 4 ychwaneger pwynt 5 newydd:

*yn gofyn i'r holl Weinidogion ddangos sut y maent yn hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy wrth weithredu eu swyddogaethau.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Yn dilyn pwynt 5

insert new point 6 and renumber accordingly: newydd, ychwaneger pwynt 6 ac ail-rifer yn unol â hynny:

*emphasises the importance of adequate training of local government officials and calls upon the Executive to put in place procedures for monitoring the promotion of sustainable development by local government.* yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd hyfforddiant digonol i swyddogion llywodraeth leol ac yn galw ar y Weithrediaeth i roi gweithdrefnau ar waith i fonitro'r gwaith o hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy gan lywodraeth leol.

Hoffwn gydnabod, ar ran Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, ymrwymiad Sue Essex i'r mater hwn a hefyd y gydnabyddiaeth a roddodd i'r rhai a weithiodd yn y maes hwn yn y gorffennol. Cydnabyddwn hefyd y modd y mae datblygu cynaliadwy wedi dod yn ganolog ac yn ganolbwynt i weithgareddau'r Cynulliad. I would like to acknowledge, on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, Sue Essex's commitment to this matter and also the recognition that she has given to those who have worked in this field in the past. We also acknowledge the way in which sustainable development has become central to and a focus of the Assembly's activities.

Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy drafft oherwydd gall y Cynulliad fod yn flaengar ar y mater hwn. Mae'n holl bwysig bod y Cynulliad yn flaengar nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond yn Ewrop. Mae hefyd yn gyfle inni weithredu yn gynhwysol. Yr oedd hynny'n ddelfryd i lawer ohonom wrth inni ddechrau yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn glir ynghylch beth yn union yw datblygu cynaliadwy. Fel y dywedodd Sue, nid rhywbeth y mae a wnelo â chynllunio neu â'r amgylchedd yn unig ydyw; mae'n egwyddor a ddylai fod yn rhan o holl weithgareddau a meysydd polisi yn y Cynulliad. I welcome the opportunity to discuss the draft sustainable development scheme because the Assembly can be innovative on this matter. It is crucial that the Assembly is at the forefront not only in Wales, but in Europe. It is also an opportunity for us work inclusively. That was an ideal important to many of us when we started in the Assembly. It is important that we be clear about what exactly sustainable development is. As Sue said, it is not something that relates solely to planning or the environment; it is a principle that should be part of all Assembly activities and areas of policy.

Mae angen inni ddatblygu economi gynaliadwy a chynnig gwasanaethau cynaliadwy i bobl Cymru. Mae'n rhaid i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fod yn greiddiol i bob peth y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei gyflawni. Dylai digwyddiadau'r wythnosau diwethaf fod yn symbyliad inni sylweddoli pa mor bwysig yw datblygu cynaliadwy. Dylai'r problemau sydd wedi codi o ganlyniad i'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, megis y llifogydd, fod yn rhybudd i ni. Os na fyddwn yn newid ein ffordd o fyw, byddwn yn wynebu problemau enfawr. We need to develop a sustainable economy and offer sustainable services to the people of Wales. Sustainable development must be core to all that the Assembly delivers. The events of the past weeks should stimulate us into realising how important sustainable development is. The problems that have arisen as a result of climate change, such as the floods, should be a warning to us. If we do not change our way of life, we will face enormous problems.

Bwriad ein gwelliannau a gynigwyd ar 14 Medi oedd sicrhau ein bod yn sefydlu'r strwythur a fyddai'n caniatáu i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fod yn greiddiol ac yn ganolog i bolisiau a gweithgareddau'r Cynulliad. Felly, croesawn yn fawr y ffaith y bydd yr uned datblygu cynaliadwy yn symud i brif uned The aim of our amendments proposed on 14 September was to ensure that we put in place the structure that would allow sustainable development to be core to the Assembly's policies and activities. Therefore, we welcome the fact that the sustainable development unit will move to the

bolisi y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n holl bwysig. Mae'n cydnabod bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn ymwneud â phob maes polisi sydd yn dod o dan awdurdod y Cynulliad.

Bellach, mae gennym gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy drafft. Mawr obeithiwn y bydd y Cynulliad yn unedig yn ei gefnogaeth i'r cynllun. Yn sicr, mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn ei groesawu. Croesawn hefyd y ffaith ein bod wedi cael cyfle i gyfrannu ato. Gobeithiwn ein bod wedi ei gryfhau drwy ein cyfraniadau. Cydnabyddaf yn arbennig gyfraniad Cynog Dafis a'i awgrymiadau cadarnhaol ac adeiladol ar gyfer y cynllun drafft hwn.

Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod y cynllun drafft yn cael ei weithredu. Pa mor dda bynnag yw cynllun, os yw'n gorwedd yn segur ar silff, nid yw fawr o werth i neb. Ein gobaith yw y caiff ei weithredu. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau hyn. Yr wyf hynod o falch bod Sue yn barod i gefnogi pump o'n gwelliannau, ac yn croesawu ysbryd y chweched. Yr wyf yn barod i dynnu'r gwelliant hwnnw'n ôl, ar ôl yr addewidion a roddodd i weithio gyda llywodraeth leol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydlynu'r hyn sydd yn digwydd o ran datblygu cynaliadwy mewn llywodraeth leol â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yma yn y Cynulliad. Hefyd mae'r pwynt am hyfforddiant yn holl bwysig, ac yr wyf yn falch o dderbyn ei hymrwymiad ar hynny. Tynnaf y gwelliant yn ôl fel arwydd o ewyllys da a chydweithrediad.

I will refer to the scheme itself in English because the scheme is only available in English. We welcome the scheme, it is greatly improved, and I have already referred to the contribution that we as a party have made to it. I endorse everything that Sue said about the people who have worked diligently on preparing this scheme and bringing it forward to the Assembly.

In particular we welcome the fact that the sustainable development scheme will form the overarching framework for all the Assembly's work. We hope that this will really impact on policy and decision-making in the Assembly, and not simply be banded about as an empty phrase.

Assembly's central policy unit. That is crucial. It recognises that sustainable development is relevant to all policy areas that come under the Assembly's authority.

We now have a draft sustainable development scheme. I very much hope that the Assembly will be united in its support of the scheme. Certainly, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales welcomes it. We also welcome that we have had an opportunity to contribute to it. We hope that we have strengthened it through our contributions. I acknowledge in particular Cynog Dafis's contribution and his positive and constructive suggestions for this draft scheme.

It is important that we ensure that the draft scheme is implemented. However good a scheme is, if it lies idle on a shelf, it is of little worth to anyone. Our hope is that it will be implemented. That is why we have proposed these amendments. I am exceptionally pleased that Sue is prepared to support five of our amendments, and welcomes the spirit of the sixth. I am ready to withdraw that amendment, after the promises that she made to work with local government. It is important that we co-ordinate what is happening from the point of view of sustainable development in local government with what is happening here in the Assembly. Also, the point about training is all-important, and I am pleased to accept her undertaking on that. I will withdraw that amendment as a sign of goodwill and co-operation.

Cyfeiriaf at y cynllun ei hunan yn Saesneg gan mai dim ond yn Saesneg y mae'r cynllun ar gael. Croesawn y cynllun, mae wedi'i wella'n fawr, a chyfeiriais eisoes at y cyfraniad a wnaethom ni fel plaid iddo. Cymeradwyaf bopeth a ddywedodd Sue am y bobl a weithiodd yn ddiwyd i baratoi'r cynllun hwn a'i gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad.

Yn benodol croesawn y ffaith y bydd y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy yn ffurfio fframwaith trosfwaol i holl waith y Cynulliad. Gobeithiwn y caiff hyn effaith wirioneddol ar y broses o wneud polisiau a phenderfyniadau yn y Cynulliad, ac na chaiff ei daflu o gwmpas fel geiriau gwag.

We welcome the positive language used in this scheme. It is vital that sustainable development is not seen as an obstacle to overcome and a barrier to other developments. We note especially section 5C, point 5.4, where the document states

‘grasping growth opportunities in key sustainable development sectors (for example environmental technology, public transport, renewable energy and Information and Communications Technology).’

This says clearly that sustainable development is a great economic opportunity for Wales, as well as an environmental and social opportunity. We emphasise that there are real opportunities here for Wales to develop differently, which will be good economically, environmentally and socially.

We are pleased to see included a recognition that the Assembly’s sustainable development policies cannot be seen in isolation. This is a truly global issue and I warm to Sue’s references about our international responsibilities. I hope that that will be included in the indicators when they come before the Assembly. We have an obligation to contribute to international targets and to work with our European partners in this.

We are also pleased that the establishment of a sustainable development panel is included. I have some sympathy for Sue’s references to the need for a cross-cutting committee. I also see this sustainable development panel as being central to developing this scheme. There is work to be done here on defining exactly how this will operate, but we believe that having an advisory panel of experts on sustainable development will be crucial to the scheme’s success.

Another section of the scheme that we welcome is 4.2, where the key environmental limits noted are climate change, bio-diversity, minimising harmful emissions and promoting the sustainable use of natural resources. These are the four key aspects and they should be given greater priority over other environmental considerations, such as the landscape, although that is also important.

Croesawn yr iaith bositif a ddefnyddir yn y cynllun hwn. Mae’n hanfodol na welir datblygu cynaliadwy fel atalfa i’w goresgyn a rhwystr i ddatblygiadau pellach. Nodwn yn enwedig adran 5C, pwynt 5.4, lle noda’r ddofen

Dywed hyn yn glir fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn gyfle economaidd mawr i Gymru, yn ogystal â chyfle amgylcheddol a chymdeithasol. Pwysleisiwn fod yma gyfleoedd gwirioneddol i Gymru ddatblygu’n wahanol, a fydd yn dda yn economaidd, yn amgylcheddol ac yn gymdeithasol.

Yr ydym yn falch o weld y cynhwysir cydnabyddiaeth na ellir gweld polisiau datblygu cynaliadwy y Cynulliad ar eu pen eu hunain. Mae hyn yn fater byd-eang gwirioneddol ac fe’m calonogwyd gan gyfeiriadau Sue at ein cyfrifoldebau rhyngwladol. Gobeithaf y cânt eu cynnwys yn y dangosyddion pan ddönt gerbron y Cynulliad. Mae gennym ymrwymiad i gyfrannu at dargedau rhyngwladol ac i weithio gyda’n partneriaid Ewropeaidd yn hyn o beth.

Yr ydym yn falch hefyd y cynhwysir sefydlu panel datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae gennyf rywffaint o gydymdeimlad tuag at gyfeiriadau Sue at yr angen am bwyllgor trawsbynciol Gwelf hefyd y panel datblygu cynaliadwy hwn yn ganolog i ddatblygu’r cynllun hwn. Mae gwaith i’w wneud yma ar ddiffinio yn union sut y bydd yn gweithredu, ond credwn y bydd panel ymgynghorol o arbenigwyr ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn holl bwysig i lwyddiant y cynllun.

Adran arall o’r cynllun a groesawn yw 4.2, lle y nodir y cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol allweddol fel newid hinsawdd, bio-amrywiaeth, lleihau gollyngiadau niweidiol a hyrwyddo’r defnydd cynaliadwy o adnoddau naturiol. Dyma’r pedair agwedd allweddol a dylid rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth iddynt nag i ystyriaethau amgylcheddol eraill, megis y tirlun, er bod hynny’n bwysig hefyd.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I hate to interrupt you, Rhodri, but you are already over your five minutes.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thought I had 10 minutes to move the amendment.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have five minutes down on my order paper.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I kept to five minutes last time.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Do what you can.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I will quickly go through the amendments.

On the first amendment, I am grateful for Sue's reference to the importance of the European grant. We have an excellent sustainable development scheme, but it is important that we create a mechanism that ensures that it moves forward. This grant, although not a large amount of money, could be as much as 3 million euros, which is about £2 million. If we were successful, it would mean that Wales would lead the way in Europe. It is important that we see the Assembly as being innovative in Wales, as well as throughout Europe. Therefore I am glad that we will apply for that grant and that we have the administration's support.

11:32 a.m.

Amendment 2 notes the need to include these two key documents, 'Betterwales.com' and 'Building Excellent Schools Together', within the list of key strategic policies. Amendment 3 emphasises the need to implement the scheme, as does amendment 4. On amendment 5, it is important that we can ensure that all Ministers are scrutinised on how they respond to sustainable development. It is not just a matter for Sue to respond on behalf of the administration and the Ministers. Many of us have had difficulties in trying to table questions to other Ministers about how they respond to sustainable development and their responsibilities for it. We will withdraw amendment 6.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'n gas gennyf dorri ar eich traws, Rhodri, ond yr ydych eisoes wedi cael dros bum munud.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Credais fod gennyf 10 munud i gynnig y gwelliant.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennyf bum munud yma ar fy mhapur trefn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cedwais i bum munud y tro diwethaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwnewch yr hyn allwch.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Af drwy'r gwelliannau yn gyflym.

Ar y gwelliant cyntaf, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gyfeiriad Sue at bwysigrwydd y grant Ewropeaidd. Mae gennym gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy rhagorol, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn creu dull sydd yn sicrhau ei fod yn mynd yn ei flaen. Gallai'r grant hwn, er nad yw'n swm mawr o arian, fod cymaint â 3 miliwn ewro, sef tua £2 miliwn. Pe baem yn llwyddiannus, golygai y byddai Cymru yn arwain y ffordd yn Ewrop. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn gweld y Cynulliad yn flaengar yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â ledled Ewrop. Felly yr wyf yn falch y byddwn yn ymgeisio am y grant hwnnw a bod gennym gefnogaeth y weinyddiaeth.

Noda gwelliant 2 yr angen i gynnwys y ddwy ddogfen allweddol hyn, 'Gwellcymru.com' ac 'Adeiladu Ysgolion Rhagorol Gyda'n Gilydd', ar restr y polisiau strategol allweddol. Pwysleisia gwelliant 3 yr angen am weithredu'r cynllun, fel y gwna gwelliant 4. O ran gwelliant 5, mae'n bwysig sicrhau y cedwir llygad craff ar yr holl Weinidogion o ran sut yr ymatebant i ddatblygiad cynaliadwy. Nid yw'n fater i neb ond Sue ymateb ar ran y weinyddiaeth a'r Gweinidogion. Cafodd llawer ohonom anawsterau wrth geisio cyflwyno cwestiynau i Weinidogion eraill ynghylch sut yr ymatebant i ddatblygu cynaliadwy a'u cyfrifoldebau drosto. Tynnwn welliant 6 yn ôl.

We are happy to agree with David Davies's amendment 7, but as Sue said, it is already included in the scheme. It has already been enacted in the Assembly, therefore it is superfluous. However, we are glad to see the Welsh Conservative Party's commitment to sustainable development. It may, in part, make up for all the bad news about sustainable development during the 18 years of Tory administration between 1979 and 1997. We welcome the scheme, and we hope that you will support our five amendments. I warmly endorse the scheme and hope that it will be unanimously supported.

**David Davies:** I propose amendment 7. Insert new point 2 and renumber accordingly:

*requests that the Minister for Environment conducts an immediate review of planning policy and guidance in Wales to ensure that all available policy and guidance puts sustainable development as the number one priority.*

The Conservative group has always had a commitment to sustainable development and to the environment in general. I say to the previous speaker that I developed a personal commitment to the environment during the many years I spent surfing the south Wales coast. The commitment from the Conservative party is much more consistent than that we have seen from Plaid Cymru. On the one hand, it has been trying to placate hauliers by claiming that it wants to decrease fuel duty, and on the other, it is trying to placate the green lobby by saying that it wants to increase it. I saw the previous speaker doing virtually both these things in a recent television debate recently.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Do you accept, David, that at no time have we said that fuel taxation should be lowered? We have talked about stabilising the price of fuel at a time when prices are high, therefore your accusation is unfounded and misleading.

**David Davies:** I will not get into a debate with you about this, but I have not been misleading about our own policy on fuel. I suspect that many of the hauliers with whom you have been dealing have been misled by

Yr ydym yn fodlon cytuno â gwelliant 7 David Davies, ond fel y dywedodd Sue, mae eisoes wedi'i gynnwys yn y cynllun. Fe'i deddfwyd eisoes yn y Cynulliad, felly nid oes ei angen. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn falch i weld ymrwymiad Plaid Geidwadol Cymru i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Gall, yn rhannol, wneud yn iawn am yr holl newyddion drwg am ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn ystod y 18 mlynedd o weinyddiaeth Doriaidd rhwng 1979 a 1997. Croesawn y cynllun a gobeithiwn y cefnogwch ein pum gwelliant. Cymeradwyaf y cynllun yn frwd a gobeithiaf y caiff gefnogaeth unfrydol.

**David Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt 2 newydd ac ail-rifo yn unol â hynny:

*yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gynnal adolygiad ar unwaith o bolisi a chanllawiau cynllunio yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau bod yr holl bolisiau a chanllawiau yn rhoi datblygu cynaliadwy fel y prif flaenoriaeth.*

Mae grŵp y Ceidwadwyr bob amser wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac i'r amgylchedd yn gyffredinol. Dywedaf wrth y siaradwr blaenorol imi ddatblygu ymrwymiad personol i'r amgylchedd yn ystod y blynyddoedd lawer a dreuliais yn syrffio ar hyd arfordir de Cymru. Mae ymrwymiad y blaid Geidwadol wedi bod yn llawer mwy cyson na'r hyn a welsom gan Blaid Cymru. Ar un llaw, bu'n ceisio tawelu cludwyr drwy honni ei bod am ostwng y dreth ar danwydd, ac ar y llaw arall, ceisia dawelu'r lobi gwyrdd drwy ddweud ei bod am ei chynyddu. Gwelais y siaradwr blaenorol yn gwneud fwy neu lai y ddau beth hwn mewn dadl ar y teledu yn ddiweddar.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A dderbyniwch, David, na ddywedasom ar unrhyw adeg y dylid lleihau'r dreth ar danwydd? Siaradasom am sefydlogi pris tanwydd ar adeg pan oedd prisiau yn uchel, felly mae eich cyhuddiad yn ddi-sail ac yn gamarweiniol.

**David Davies:** Nid âf i ddadlau â chi ynglŷn â hyn, ond ni fŷm yn gamarweiniol ynghylch ein polisi ein hunain ar danwydd. Tybiaf fod llawer o'r cludwyr yr ymdriniasoch â hwy wedi cael eu camarwain gan yr hyn a

what you have said. That aside, I re-emphasise the Conservative commitment to protecting the environment. The recent floods were a timely reminder of what can go wrong and what is happening to our climate at present because of policies that have been pursued by governments all over the world for decades. Hindsight is wonderful. I am sure that nobody realised what damage was being done. Those of us who have the privilege of holding political office, have a duty to do all we can to try to reduce the damage.

What concerns me about this scheme is not so much the sentiment, because, by and large, we agree with everything in it. However, in the words of Nye Bevan, it is a sermon. It is a good sermon, but it is a sermon nonetheless. Prior to the last election, this Government wore its green credentials on its sleeve. Tony Blair in 1989 suggested that the greenhouse effect was one of the most serious problems that we faced—

**Helen Mary Jones:** This Government in the context of this room surely means the Government of Wales, not the Government at Westminster, whomever it may be.

**David Davies:** This is such a wide issue, that when I talk about the Government, I refer to the Government in Westminster and in Cardiff, because both have a role to play in this.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Can you make that clear?

**David Davies:** I have made it clear. Tony Blair talked about the greenhouse effect before the last election, but subsequently his Government—in Cardiff and in Westminster—has failed to reach the low standards that it has set itself. For example, it has set itself a target of producing 10 per cent of all electricity by 2010 from renewable energy sources, but nobody in the industry thinks that that is possible.

There is a lack of action in pursuing policies that will put into effect the worthy sentiments

ddywedasoeh. A diystyru hynny, ailbwyseisiaf ymrwymiad y Ceidwadwyr i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd. Roedd y llifogydd diweddar yn atgoffa rhywun yn amserol o'r hyn all fynd o'i le a'r hyn a ddigwydd i'n hinsawdd ar hyn o bryd oherwydd polisïau a ddilynwyd gan lywodraethau dros yr holl fyd ers degawdau. Mae ôl-ddoethinebu yn rhywbeth gwych. Yr wyf yn siŵr na sylweddolodd neb pa ddifrod oedd yn cael ei wneud. Mae gan y rheini ohonom sydd â'r fraint o ddal swydd wleidyddol ddyletswydd i wneud popeth a allwn i geisio lleihau'r difrod.

Yr hyn sydd yn fy mhryderu am y cynllun hwn yw nid cymaint y teimlad, oherwydd, ar y cyfan, cytunwn â phopeth ynddo. Fodd bynnag, yng ngeiriau Nye Bevan, mae'n bregeth. Mae'n bregeth dda, ond yn bregeth serch hynny. Cyn yr etholiad diwethaf, gwisgodd y Llywodraeth hon ei chymwysterau gwyrdd ar ei llawes. Ym 1989 awgrymodd Tony Blair mai'r effaith tŷ gwydr oedd un o'r problemau mwyaf difrifol oedd yn ein hwynebu—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yng nghyd-destun yr ystafell hon ystyr Llywodraeth, yn debyg iawn, yw Llywodraeth Cymru, nid y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan, pwy bynnag yw honno.

**David Davies:** Mae hwn yn fater mor eang, fel pan siaradaf am y Llywodraeth, cyfeiriai at y Llywodraeth yn San Steffan ac yng Nghaerdydd, mae gan y ddwy ran i'w chwarae yn hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Allech chi egluro hynny?

**David Davies:** Yr wyf wedi ei egluro. Siaradodd Tony Blair am yr effaith tŷ gwydr cyn yr etholiad diwethaf, ond wedi hynny methodd ei Lywodraeth—yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan—â chyrraedd y safonau isel a osododd iddi hi ei hun. Er enghraifft, gosododd darged iddi hi ei hun o gynhyrchu 10 y cant o'r holl drydan o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy erbyn 2010, ond ni chred neb yn y diwydiant fod hynny yn bosibl.

Mae diffyg gweithredu wrth ganlyn polisïau a fydd yn rhoi'r teimladau teilwng yn y



in this document. I will focus on two of these. The first is the waste strategy. One of the biggest contributors to the greenhouse effect is methane gas, 90 per cent of which comes from landfill sites. I will give credit where it is due and acknowledge that the Minister for Environment and the administration are trying to reduce the amount of waste that goes into landfill sites. However, the present policy is not working. The problem is that not many companies will recycle waste. Whenever landfill tax increases, as it does every year, the companies in that business increase their prices as well. Therefore, we are not reaching a situation where less is being put into landfill and more is being recycled, because the current policy does not allow that to happen.

If we are to have a more sustainable waste policy, landfill tax must be redistributed to local authorities so that it can be put to proper use instead of filling up the Treasury's coffers. I understand that the Minister for Environment said in the Committee yesterday, and perhaps she can clarify this afterwards, that she accepts that and believes that this policy must be adopted. However, it is not happening at the moment and I ask you to redouble your efforts in asking your colleagues in Westminster to allow that tax to be redistributed.

I now turn to my amendment. I was astonished at the Minister's words. She appeared to say that she supported the amendment, but what it called for was already happening and therefore it was not necessary and she would not vote for it. However, my amendment calls for sustainable planning policies to be the number one priority and for sustainable development to be the priority when planning policy is made. I do not care how many reviews are going on in the Assembly at the moment: that simply is not happening. There is nothing sustainable about allowing bulldozers to go over large swathes of countryside and for them to be concreted over. We are destroying the countryside for future generations and, more pertinently at the moment, we are creating a situation where houses are being built on flood plains against the advice of groups such as the

ddogfen hon ar waith. Canolbwyntiaf ar ddau o'r rhain. Y cyntaf yw'r strategaeth gwastraff. Un o'r cyfranwyr mwyaf i'r effaith tŷ gwydr yw llosgnwy, y mae 90 y cant ohono yn dod o safleoedd tirlenwi. Rhoddaf glod lle mae'n deilwng a chydabyddaf fod y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd a'r weinyddiaeth yn ceisio lleihau'r swm o wastraff sydd yn mynd i mewn i safleoedd tirlenwi. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r polisi presennol yn gweithio. Y broblem yw na fydd llawer o gwmnïau yn ailgylchu gwastraff. Pa bryd bynnag y bydd y dreth dirlenwi yn codi, fel y gwna bob blwyddyn, bydd y cwmnïau yn y busnes hwnnw yn codi eu prisiau hefyd. Felly, nid ydym yn cyrraedd sefyllfa lle caiff llai ei roi i mewn i dirlenwi a mwy ei ailgylchu, oherwydd nad yw'r polisi presennol yn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd.

Os ydym i gael polisi gwastraff mwy cynaliadwy, rhaid ailddosbarthu'r dreth dirlenwi i awdurdodau lleol fel y gellir ei defnyddio'n gywir yn lle llenwi coffrau'r Tryslorlys. Deallaf i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ddweud yn y Pwyllgor ddoe, ac efallai y gall egluro hyn wedyn, ei bod yn derbyn ac yn credu bod yn rhaid mabwysiadu'r polisi hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd a gofynnaf ichi ymdrechu'n galetach i ofyn i'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan ganiatáu i'r dreth honno gael ei hailddosbarthu.

Trof at fy ngwelliant yn awr. Fe'm synnwyd gan eiriau'r Gweinidog. Ymddengys fel pe bai'n dweud ei bod yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, ond bod yr hyn a alwai amdano eisoes yn digwydd ac felly nad oedd ei angen ac na fyddai'n pleidleisio o'i blaid. Fodd bynnag, mae fy ngwelliant yn galw am bolisiau cynllunio cynaliadwy i fod yn brif flaenoriaeth ac i ddatblygu cynaliadwy fod yn flaenoriaeth pan wneir polisi cynllunio. Nid oes ots gennyf faint o adolygiadau sydd yn digwydd yn y Cynulliad ar hyn o bryd: yn syml nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Nid oes dim yn gynaliadwy ynghylch caniatáu i deirw dur fynd dros diroedd eang o gefn gwlad a'u concredio. Difethwn gefn gwlad i genedlaethau'r dyfodol ac, yn fwy perthnasol ar hyn o bryd, crëwn sefyllfa lle caiff tai eu hadeiladu ar orlifdiroedd yn erbyn cyngor grwpiau megis Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd. Digwyddodd hynny 25 gwaith yn y flwyddyn

Environment Agency. That has happened 25 times in the last year alone in Wales.

**David Melding:** Does my colleague agree that the administration could set ambitious targets for building on brownfield sites. Why will it not do so?

**David Davies:** I could not agree more. In England, John Prescott has set a target of 60 per cent of all new housing to be built on brownfield sites. Since that promise was made, it has not been kept, as is the case with so many other promises made by this Government. However, at least it was a worthy enough target to set, even if he failed to live up to it. On repeated occasions we have asked the Minister for Environment in this Chamber to come up with a similar target for Wales. The only answer we can get is that Wales is different so we should have different targets. In fact, no target has been set in Wales for development on brownfield sites. That is a great pity, not only because houses built on flood plains are more likely to get flooded—and we should not be surprised when that happens—but also because the area of run-off for water is less and the floodwater simply goes elsewhere.

We have proposed amendment 7 today because although we support the generally worthy sentiments in the scheme we do not believe that not enough is being delivered and that there is sufficient action. I hope that other Members will look carefully at the amendment, and if they, like the Minister for Environment, agree that it is a worthy amendment, I hope that they will support it. We would also like to see more action in other areas of sustainable development and more done to support the innovative companies that are springing up throughout Wales that could assist in this. For example, there is a company in Bridgend that uses ground glass as an aggregate, rather than sand. That is topical at the moment. In addition, there is a company in Monmouthshire that claims to be able to recycle waste as a fertiliser in a way that does not damage the ground. There are innovative companies throughout Wales and all sorts of action that are needed on these policies rather than worthy sentiments. However, we will

ddiwethaf yn unig yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** A gytuna fy nghyd-Aelod y gallai'r weinyddiaeth osod targedau uchelgeisiol ar gyfer adeiladu ar safleoedd meysydd llwyd. Pam na wnaiff hynny?

**David Davies:** Ni allwn gytuno mwy. Yn Lloegr, gosododd John Prescott darged o adeiladu 60 y cant o holl dai newydd ar safleoedd meysydd llwyd. Ers gwneud yr addewid honno, ni chadwyd iddi, fel yn achos cymaint o addewidion eraill a wnaethpwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon. Fodd bynnag, o leiaf yr oedd yn darged digon parchus i'w gosod, hyd yn oed os methodd â'i wireddu. Dro ar ôl tro gofynasom i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd yn y Siambr hon gynnig targed tebyg ar gyfer Cymru. Yr unig ateb a gawn yw bod Cymru yn wahanol felly dylem gael targedau gwahanol. Mewn gwirionedd, ni osodwyd targed yng Nghymru ar gyfer datblygu ar feysydd llwyd. Mae hynny'n drueni mawr, nid yn unig am fod tai a gaiff eu hadeiladu ar orlifdiroedd yn fwy tebygol o ddiodesdef llifogydd—ac ni ddylem synnu pan ddigwydd hynny—ond hefyd mae llai o le i'r dŵr ddiplannu ac mae'r gorlifant yn mynd i rywle arall.

Cynigiasom welliant 7 heddiw oherwydd er y cefnogwn deimladau teilwng cyffredinol y cynllun ni chredwn y caiff digon ei gyflawni a bod digon o weithredu. Gobeithiaf y bydd Aelodau eraill yn edrych yn ofalus ar y gwelliant, ac os cytunant, fel y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, ei fod yn welliant teilwng, gobeithiaf y byddant yn ei gefnogi. Hoffem hefyd weld rhagor o weithredu mewn meysydd eraill o ddatblygu cynaliadwy a rhagor yn cael ei wneud i gefnogi'r cwmnïau blaengar sydd yn codi ledled Cymru a allai gynorthwyo yn hyn o beth. Er enghraifft, mae cwmni ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr sydd yn defnyddio gwydr tir fel graean, yn hytrach na thywod. Mae hynny yn amserol ar hyn o bryd. Yn ogystal, mae cwmni yn Sir Fynwy sydd yn honni y gall ailgylchu gwastraff fel gwrtaith mewn ffordd nad yw'n difrodi'r ddaear. Mae cwmnïau blaengar ledled Cymru a phob math o weithredu y mae eu hangen ar y polisiau hyn yn hytrach na theimladau teilwng. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn a'r holl welliannau. Galwn ar

support this motion and all the amendments. We call on other Members to do so.

**Richard Edwards:** I express my disappointment at the poor turnout in the Chamber for this debate. I hope that it is not a true reflection of the interest in this most important subject. I would like to put away my party political hat on this occasion and say a few non-partisan words as Chair of the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee and report back to Plenary, the Committee's views on how we should promote sustainable development.

I welcome the moving of sustainable development into the environment portfolio. That makes sense and it is an important step forward in discharging our statutory duty for sustainability. I also welcome the motion's call for the Minister for Environment to bring forward practical options to ensure that sustainable development is mainstreamed and promoted within the Assembly's structures. I suggest that the Chair and the party spokespersons from the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee should be involved in drawing these up. Without wishing to prejudice the resolution to investigate the feasibility of establishing a sustainable development committee, the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee has agreed that it should champion sustainable development and scrutinise activity across the National Assembly from the sustainable development perspective.

11:42 a.m.

I note that the draft scheme states that sustainable development will be delivered through 'Betterwales.com'. When we discussed the responses to the consultation, there was a strong, cross-party feeling in the Committee that the sustainable development scheme should be the overarching strategy of the National Assembly from which all others, including 'Betterwales.com', should flow. Sustainable development should not be part of 'Betterwales.com'; it should be the other way round.

The scheme states that sustainable development provides the overarching

Aelodau eraill i wneud hynny.

**Richard Edwards:** Mynegaf fy siom o weld cyn lleied yn y Siambr ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Gobeithiaf nad yw hyn yn adlewyrchiad cywir o'r diddordeb yn y pwnc mwyaf pwysig hwn. Hoffwn roi fy het wleidyddol bleidiol o'r neilltu am y tro a dweud ychydig o eiriau amhleidiol fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn farn y Pwyllgor ar sut y dylem hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy.

Croesawaf symud datblygu cynaliadwy i bortffolio'r amgylchedd. Mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr ac mae'n gam pwysig ymlaen wrth gyflawni ein dyletswydd statudol i gynnaladwyedd. Croesawaf hefyd alwad y cynnig i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gyflwyno opsiynau ymarferol i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan annatod o strwythurau'r Cynulliad a'i fod yn cael ei hyrwyddo. Awgrymaf y dylai Cadeirydd a llefarwyr y pleidiau ar Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth fod yn gysylltiedig â'r gwaith o lunio'r rhain. Heb ddymuno niweidio'r penderfyniad i ymchwilio i ymarferoldeb sefydlu pwyllgor datblygu cynaliadwy, cytunodd Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth y dylai gefnogi datblygu cynaliadwy ac archwilio gweithgaredd ar draws y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol o safbwynt datblygu cynaliadwy.

Nodaf fod y cynllun drafft yn datgan y cyflawnir datblygu cynaliadwy drwy 'Gwellcymru.com'. Pan drafodwyd yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad, cafwyd teimlad cryf trawsbleidiol yn y Pwyllgor mai'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ddylai fod y strategaeth drosfwaol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y dylai pob un arall, gan gynnwys 'Gwellcymru.com', lifo ohoni. Ni ddylai datblygiad cynaliadwy fod yn rhan o 'Gwellcymru.com'; dylai fod i'r gwrthwyneb.

Noda'r cynllun fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn darparu'r fframwaith trosfwaol ar gyfer holl

framework for all of the Assembly's work, which is fine and we welcome that, but the fact remains that the Assembly's strategic plan is 'Betterwales.com', not the sustainable development scheme.

We feel that sustainable development should underpin all the National Assembly's policies and that all bids for resources to deliver 'Betterwales.com' and the partnership agreement objectives should be assessed for their long-term sustainability. Therefore, I welcome the commitments in section 5A of the draft scheme to green audits and the greening of appraisal mechanisms and definitions of value for money. I also welcome the commitment in section 5B that key strategies such as the national economic development strategy, Communities First, the transport framework, the national spatial framework and also the European structural funds programmes should not only be underpinned by sustainable development principles but linked together by them.

It is important that the Environment, Planning and Transport Committee is fully involved in developing adequate indicators. We must have a broad consensus to ensure proper ownership by the whole Assembly of our unique, statutory responsibility to promote a sustainable approach to everything that we do in Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** The sustainable development scheme will be the most important thing that the National Assembly has begun to do for Wales and the world when, hopefully, we adopt it today. The national vision of a sustainable Wales set out in the scheme is inspiring and exciting: a vision of a just society that is confident and proud of itself, cherishes its heritage, cultural and natural, and has a prosperous and self-sustaining economy. That is a vision that I am sure—and I now know, having heard David Davies's contribution—that all National Assembly Members will support. David's comments were interesting in the light of the previous Conservative Government at Westminster's refusal to develop, for example, a list of brownfield sites, thanks to which we do not even know where they are, let alone able to build on them. However, to move on from that

waith y Cynulliad, sydd yn iawn a chroesawn hynny, ond erys y ffaith mai cynllun strategol y Cynulliad yw 'Gwelwales.com', nid y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy.

Teimlwn y dylai datblygu cynaliadwy ategu holl bolisiâu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac y dylid asesu pob cynnig am adnoddau i gyflawni 'Gwelwales.com' a'r amcanion cytundeb partneriaeth ar gyfer cynaladwyiaeth yn y tymor hir. Felly, croesawaf yr ymrwymadau yn adran 5A y cynllun drafft i archwiliadau gwyrdd a gwyrddio dulliau gwerthuso a diffiniadau o werth am arian. Croesawaf hefyd yr ymrwymiad yn adran 5B na ddylid ategu strategaethau allweddol megis y strategaeth datblygu economaidd genedlaethol, Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, y fframwaith trafnidiaeth, y fframwaith gofodol cenedlaethol a hefyd y rhaglenni arian strwythurol Ewropeaidd gan egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy ond eu bod yn eu cysylltu ynghyd.

Mae'n bwysig bod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth yn hollol gysylltiedig â datblygu dangosyddion digonol. Rhaid inni gael consensws eang i sicrhau perchenogaeth gywir gan y Cynulliad cyfan o'n cyfrifoldeb statudol, unigryw i hyrwyddo ymagwedd gynaliadwy i bopeth a wnawn yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy fydd y peth pwysicaf y dechreuodd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ei wneud i Gymru a'r byd pan, gobeithiaf, y caiff ei fabwysiadu gennym heddiw. Mae'r weledigaeth genedlaethol o Gymru gynaliadwy a nodir yn y cynllun yn ysbrydoledig ac yn gyffrous: gweledigaeth o gymdeithas gyfiawn sydd yn hyderus ac yn ymfalchïo ynddi hi ei hun, yn coleddu ei hetifeddiaeth, ddiwylliannol a naturiol, ac sydd ag economi ffyniannus a hunangynaliadwy. Mae honno yn weledigaeth yr wyf yn siŵr—a gwn yn awr, ar ôl clywed cyfraniad David Davies—y bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ei chefnogi. Yr oedd sylwadau David yn ddiddorol yng ngoleuni penderfyniad y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol yn San Steffan i wrthod datblygu, er enghraifft, rhestr o safleoedd meysydd llwyd, a diolch

partisan point—

idduynt hwy nad ydym hyd yn oed yn gwybod ble maent, heb sôn am adeiladu arnynt. Fodd bynnag, i symud ymlaen o'r pwynt pleidiol hwnnw—

**David Davies:** Is that not partly because of the actions of Labour councils across Wales?

**David Davies:** Onid yw hynny'n rhannol oherwydd gweithredu gan gynghorau Llafur ledled Cymru?

**Helen Mary Jones:** It was a Tory Government action as far as I am concerned. However, I welcome your information if you can prove that it was the Labour Government's fault—

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr oedd yn weithredu gan y Llywodraeth Doriadaidd o'm rhan i. Fodd bynnag, coresawaf eich gwybodaeth os gallwch brofi mai bai y Llywodraeth Llafur oedd—

**David Davies:** Labour councils.

**David Davies:** Cynghorau Llafur.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Labour councils. I doubt it very much.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynghorau Llafur. Rwyf yn amau hynny'n fawr iawn.

This is a national vision for the whole nation and, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas said, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales is proud of it. We are grateful to the Government of Wales for accepting so much of our input so far, including our amendments today. As we have mentioned some key individuals today, I would like to take this opportunity to pay a tribute to the achievement of Cynog Dafis. His contribution in promoting the concept of sustainability in the political life of Wales is unparalleled. The hard work of Cynog and many others has brought us to the point today when we take the first solid step towards making the vision of a sustainable Wales reality. However, we should be under no illusion about the challenges with which making this vision a reality presents us. It makes huge demands on us all as politicians, public servants, individuals, and as a nation. If the scheme is to be successful, we must all change what we do, what we use, how we live, how we think and how we make decisions. I feel obliged to sound a slightly cautious note. Clause 121 of the Government of Wales Act states that:

Mae hon yn weledigaeth genedlaethol ar gyfer y genedl gyfan ac, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn falch ohoni. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i Lywodraeth Cymru am dderbyn cymaint o'n mewnbwn hyd yn hyn, gan gynnwys ein gwelliannau heddiw. Gan ein bod wedi crybwyll rhai unigolion allweddol heddiw, hoffwn gymryd y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i gyflawniad Cynog Dafis. Mae ei gyfraniad i hyrwyddo cysyniad cynaliadwyedd ym mywyd gwleidyddol Cymru yn unigryw. Daeth gwaith caled Cynog a llawer o rai eraill â ni at y pwynt heddiw pan gymerwn y cam pendant cyntaf tuag at wireddu'r weledigaeth o Gymru gynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem dwyllo ein hunain am yr heriau a gyflwynir inni wrth wneud y weledigaeth hon yn realiti. Mae'n disgwyl llawer iawn gennym ni i gyd fel gwleidyddion, gweision cyhoeddus, unigolion, ac fel cenedl. Os yw'r cynllun i lwyddo, rhaid inni oll newid yr hyn a wnawn, yr hyn a ddefnyddiwn, sut yr ydym yn byw, sut y meddyliwn a sut y gwnawn benderfyniadau. Teimlaf fod yn rhaid imi daro nodyn gofalus braidd. Mae cymal 121 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru yn nodi:

'the Assembly shall make a scheme setting out how it proposes, in the exercise of its functions, to promote sustainable development'.

The 'how' will be in the action plan, which will be crucial. We are grateful to the Government for accepting our amendment 2,

Bydd y 'sut' yn y cynllun gweithredu, a fydd yn holl bwysig. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywodraeth am dderbyn ein gwellant 2,

which means that we will have the action plan soon. It is crucial that its content includes a detailed plan, outlining how the Government will support the civil servants in learning how to mainstream sustainability into all policy. That is a key challenge, although I acknowledge what the Minister said about the progress that has been made, and we should not pretend that it will be easy.

Making sustainability a reality involved difficult, complex balances that we have often considered to be conflicts in the past; for example, jobs versus natural habitat and landscape versus renewable energy. Advising on those balances, in the interest of sustainability, presents the civil servants with huge challenges. I am afraid that we all know that the tradition of the British civil service, out of which the Welsh civil service is slowly growing, tends to be one of inertia and change minimisation. We must acknowledge that. If Welsh civil servants are to be able to mainstream sustainability, they will need a huge amount of input. There is a wealth of practical ideas on sustainability. The Government must ensure that civil servants can access them easily.

The opposition will give the highest priority to scrutinising this. To give a practical example, by the end of February next year, we will expect to see meaningful sustainability tests in the compliance section of every paper that goes to every Assembly Committee. If we do not get them, we will want to know why.

Finally, as the implementation of the scheme begins, I urge the Government to consider carefully how the full range of its actions, in the short term, are perceived. For example, I welcome what the Minister said today about renewable energy, and I am sure that Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales will wish to participate fully in that group. However, I stress to her that the recent calling in of applications has affected adversely how sustainable energy companies are viewing their future in Wales. That is in the present, not in the future; we must address what is happening now. The Government must be careful in the broad context of sustainability

sydd yn golygu y cawn y cynllun gweithredu yn fuan. Mae'n holl bwysig ei fod yn cynnwys cynllun manwl, yn amlinellu sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cefnogi'r gweision sifil wrth ddysgu sut i gael cynaliadwyedd yn rhan annatod o bob polisi. Mae hon yn her allweddol, er y cydnabyddaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog ynghylch y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd, ac ni ddylem esgus y bydd yn hawdd.

Yr oedd gwneud cynaliadwyedd yn realiti yn cynnwys cydbwysedd cymhleth, anodd yr ystyriasom yn aml ei fod yn wrthdaro yn y gorffennol; er enghraifft, swyddi yn erbyn cynefin naturiol a thirlun yn erbyn ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae rhoi cyngor ynglŷn â'r cydbwysedd, er lles cynaliadwyedd, yn cyflwyno heriau anferthol i weision sifil. Yr wyf yn ofni y gwyddom i gyd fod traddodiad gwasanaeth sifil Prydain, y mae gwasanaeth sifil Cymru yn tyfu ohono yn raddol, yn tueddu i fod yn swrth a sicrhau'r newid lleiaf posibl. Rhaid inni gydnabod hynny. Os yw gweision sifil Cymru i allu prif ffrydio cynaliadwyedd, bydd angen llawer iawn o fewnbwn arnynt. Ceir cyfoeth o syniadau ymarferol ar gynaliadwyedd. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth sicrhau y gall gweision sifil gael mynediad iddynt yn hawdd.

Bydd yr wrthblaid yn rhoi'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i archwilio hyn. I roi enghraifft ymarferol, erbyn diwedd Chwefror y flwyddyn nesaf, byddwn yn disgwyl gweld profion cynaliadwyedd ystyrion yn yr adran gydymffurfio ar bob papur a aiff i bob Pwyllgor yn y Cynulliad. Os na chawn y rheini, byddwn yn dymuno gwybod pam.

Yn olaf, wrth ddechrau gweithredu'r cynllun, anogaf y Llywodraeth i ystyried yn ofalus sut y canfyddir ystod lawn ei gweithredoedd, yn y tymor byr. Er enghraifft, croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog heddiw ynghylch ynni adnewyddadwy, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn dymuno cyfranogi'n llawn yn y grŵp hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf iddi fod y galw ceisiadau a wnaethpwyd yn ddiweddar wedi cael effaith andwyol ar y modd y gwêl cwmnïau ynni cynaliadwy eu dyfodol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny yn y presennol, nid yn y dyfodol; rhaid inni ymdrin â'r hyn sydd yn digwydd yn awr. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth fod

never to be seen to say one thing and then do another. In wholeheartedly supporting this motion with our amendments, I can pledge the full support of Plaid Cymru to making this scheme work. When we adopt this scheme today, we will raise high expectations of Wales at home and internationally. The Government of Wales must not disappoint those expectations.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Normally, I would ask the Minister for Environment to reply now, but many Members e-mailed me to say that they will speak for a shorter time. For those who want to speak for a minute, they can do so now.

**John Griffiths:** In Newport, 25 per cent of the land mass is comprised of sites of special scientific interest, with great pressure for urban and industrial development. That indicates that we must move towards a new mindset that does not pit jobs against the environment. Those two need not be mutually exclusive. We must move towards viewing these issues differently, and there has been a strong move towards brownfield development by the local authority in Newport.

There is a good recycling scheme in Newport called Waste Savers, of which Sue is aware. However, despite that and because of the growth of landfill in general, we are faced with a problem of growth rather than one of reduction, which indicates how much needs to be done. I suggest that the openness of the network of public paths in Wales is considered as one of the key indicators for sustainable development on the basis that the protection of the countryside and people's respect for it depend on whether they have access to it and can use it. If people are allowed to use the countryside, they will value it and will be more inclined to protect it. It is good for health, socially inclusive and is an all-round winner for us. I ask Sue to consider that as an aspect of the key indicators.

yn ofalus yng nghyd-destun eang cynaliadwyedd na chaiff ei gweld byth yn dweud un peth ac yna'n gwneud rhywbeth arall. Wrth gefnogi'r cynnig hwn yn galonnog gyda'n gwelliannau, gallaf addo cefnogaeth lawn Plaid Cymru i wneud i'r cynllun hwn weithio. Pan fabwysiadwn y cynllun hwn heddiw, byddwn yn codi disgwyliadau uchel o Gymru gartref ac yn rhyngwladol. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru beidio â siomi'r disgwyliadau hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Fel rheol, byddwn yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ateb yn awr, ond cefais e-bost gan lawer o Aelodau yn dweud y byddant yn siarad am gyfnod byrrach. I'r rheini sydd yn dymuno siarad am funud, gallant wneud hynny yn awr.

**John Griffiths:** Yng Nghasnewydd, mae 25 y cant o'r tir yn ei grynsyth yn cynnwys safleoedd o ddiddordeb gwyddonol arbennig, gyda phwysau mawr am ddatblygiad trefol a diwydiannol. Dengys hynny bod rhaid inni symud tuag at gyfeiriad meddwl newydd nad yw'n rhoi swyddi i gystadlu yn erbyn yr amgylchedd. Nid oes angen i'r ddau beth fod yn annibynnol ar ei gilydd. Rhaid inni symud tuag at edrych ar y materion hyn yn wahanol, a chafwyd symudiad cryf tuag at ddatblygu safleoedd maes llwyd gan yr awdurdod lleol yng Nghasnewydd.

Mae cynllun ailgylchu da yng Nghasnewydd o'r enw Waste Savers, y mae Sue yn ymwybodol ohono. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf hynny ac oherwydd twf tirlenwi yn gyffredinol, mae problem twf yn hytrach nag un o leihad yn ein hwynebu, sydd yn dangos faint sydd angen ei wneud. Awgrymaf yr ystyrir fod natur agored y rhwydwaith o lwybrau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn un o ddangosyddion allweddol datblygu cynaliadwy ar y sail o ddiogelu cefn gwlad a pharch pobl tuag ato yn dibynnu ar pa un a oes ganddynt fynediad iddo ac a allant ei ddefnyddio. Os caniateir i bobl ddefnyddio cefn gwlad, byddant yn ei werthfawrogi ac yn fwy parod i'w ddiogelu. Mae'n dda i iechyd, yn gynhwysol yn gymdeithasol ac yn llwyddiant cyffredinol inni. Gofynnaf i Sue ystyried hynny fel un o agweddau'r dangosyddion allweddol.

11:52 a.m.

**Mick Bates:** I do not want to waste my limited speaking time, but I deplore the fact that we have only a short time in which to debate this fundamental and landmark document. However, I express the thanks of the Liberal Democrats to all those who were involved in developing this document. The consultation process has led to the creation of a landmark document. Today, we demonstrated that we have a Welsh radical heritage and that we are now in the position to lead the world on the basis of this document. It is particularly important that we have, at last, made progress from perceiving growth as being only economic to realising that there is a set of social, cultural and environmental indicators that are fundamental to improving the quality of life of the people of Wales.

We have covered a great deal of ground in previous debates, but this one is good because there is an acceptance of the need for good indicators. I would also like to see a commitment to getting more informed data so that those indicators can be realistic and so that the evaluation process can mean something to all of us.

On the rural factor, I am pleased that there is a healthy food policy, promoting school milk and healthy food in schools, which will give us a platform to show how we are taking action to improve our local rural economy.

This document offers an excellent opportunity for the people of Wales. There are so many strengths in it, that we can state with justifiable pride that we are leading the world and that we will improve the quality of life for the people of Wales.

**Delyth Evans:** I repeat other people's regrets that we only have a minute to respond to this important debate.

In Gordon Brown's autumn statement last week, he resisted immense pressure to give in to the fuel lobby. That is vital to sustainable development, before anyone mentions that it is not relevant to our work here. Gordon Brown announced new measures to encourage the use of more fuel-efficient cars

**Mick Bates:** Nid wyf am wastraffu amser prin sydd gennyf i siarad, ond gresynaf mai dim ond amser byr sydd gennym i drafod y ddogfen sylfaenol a phwysig hon. Fodd bynnag, mynegaf ddiolch y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â datblygu'r ddogfen hon. Arweiniodd y broses ymgynghori at greu dogfen o bwys. Heddiw, dangoswyd bod gennym etifeddiaeth radical Gymreig a'n bod bellach mewn sefyllfa i arwain y byd ar sail y ddogfen hon. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig ein bod, o'r diwedd, wedi datblygu o weld twf fel rhywbeth economaidd yn unig i sylweddoli bod cyfres o ddangosyddion cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac amgylcheddol sydd yn sylfaenol wrth wella ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru.

Cwmpaswyd cryn dipyn mewn dadleuon blaenorol, ond mae'r ddadl hon yn dda oherwydd y derybynnir bod angen dangosyddion da. Hoffwn hefyd weld ymrwymiad i gael data mwy cytbwys fel y gall y dangosyddion hynny fod yn realistig ac y gall y broses werthuso olygu rhywbeth inni oll.

O ran yr elfen wledig, yr wyf yn falch bod polisi bwyd iach, yn hyrwyddo llaeth ysgol a bwyd iach mewn ysgolion, a fydd yn rhoi llwyfan inni ddangos sut y cymernw gamau i wella ein heconomi wledig leol.

Cynigia'r ddogfen hon gyfle rhagorol i bobl Cymru. Mae cynifer o gryfderau ynddi, fel y gallwn nodi â pharch haeddiannol ein bod yn arwain y byd ac y byddwn yn gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru.

**Delyth Evans:** Ailfynegaf ofidiau pobl eraill mai dim ond un funud sydd gennym i ymateb i'r ddadl bwysig hon.

Yn natganiad hydref Gordon Brown yr wythnos diwethaf, gwrthasfodd bwysau anferthol i ildio i'r lobi tanwydd. Mae hynny yn holl bwysig i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, cyn i neb grybwyll nad yw'n berthnasol i'n gwaith yma. Cyhoeddodd Gordon Brown fesurau newydd i annog y defnydd o geir sydd yn



and the use of low sulphur fuel, which will be available next year. That was in stark contrast to the behaviour of the opposition party, and I reject Rhodri Glyn Thomas's statement because Plaid Cymru backed proposals to call for a 4 pence drop in fuel duty at its conference. That approach is, at best, equivocal. Plaid Cymru is trying to have it both ways. That is not helpful to the future of the debate on sustainable development. We must tackle these difficult issues and take a responsible long-term view, which, I am glad to say, the Government in London and the Labour and Liberal Democrat administration here is doing. I am proud of that.

It is important to engage the business community on this. Sue mentioned earlier that there had been progress, but I would like to see more engagement with the private sector because it has to be on board. Sustainable development is a reality, which can also give businesses a competitive edge and more should take that on board. I urge the Assembly to engage more urgently with the private sector to get it to adopt this scheme and to engage wholeheartedly with this agenda, which is vital to the future of all of us.

**Christine Gwyther:** When Sue introduced this topic today, she said that it was difficult to attract the media's attention to it. As I recall, it was more interested in fluffy stories than heavy duty ones. Sustainable development must concern heavy industry. Delyth mentioned the ultra low sulphur petrol that will be available throughout Britain from as early as next March and the Chancellor's pre-budget statement looked forward to that. That petrol will be produced in Texaco, outside Pembroke Dock, so we are producing ultra low sulphur petrol for the UK and we are producing jobs in poor old west Wales, about which I am thrilled and proud.

**Sue Essex:** Thank you for your contributions today, and at the Committee meeting. I repeat my thanks to everyone who was involved in promoting this issue. To those who worked in the roadshows and to voluntary organisations,

defnyddio tanwydd mwy effeithlon a'r defnydd o danwydd sylffwr is, a fydd ar gael y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr oedd hynny yn hollol groes i ymddygiad yr wrthblaid, a gwrthodaf ddatganiad Rhodri Glyn Thomas oherwydd cefnogodd Plaid Cymru gynigion i alw am ostyngiad o 4 ceiniog yn y doll ar danwydd yn ei chynhadledd. Mae'r ymagwedd honno, ar ei gorau, yn amheus. Ceisia Plaid Cymru ei chael hi ddwy ffordd. Nid yw hynny yn ddefnyddiol i ddyfodol y ddadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion anodd hyn a chymryd golwg gyfrifol hir dymor, y mae'r Llywodraeth yn Llundain a'r weinyddiaeth Lafur a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yma, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud, yn ei wneud. Yr wyf yn falch o hynny.

Mae'n bwysig cynnwys y gymuned fusnes yn hyn. Soniodd Sue yn gynharach fod cynnydd wedi digwydd, ond hoffwn weld mwy o ymrwymiad gyda'r sector preifat oherwydd rhaid ei gynnwys. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy yn realiti, a all hefyd roi mantais gystadleuol i fusnesau a dylai rhagor ystyried hynny. Anogaf y Cynulliad i ymrwymo â'r sector preifat ar frys i'w gael i fabwysiadu'r cynllun hwn ac i ymrwymo â'i holl galon i'r agenda hwn, sydd yn holl bwysig i ddyfodol pawb ohonom.

**Christine Gwyther:** Pan gyflwynodd Sue y pwnc hwn heddiw, dywedodd ei fod yn anodd denu sylw'r cyfryngau ato. Yn ôl a gofiau, yr oedd ganddynt fwy o ddiddordeb mewn straeon ysgafn na straeon gwaith trwm. Rhaid i ddatblygu cynaliadwy ymwneud â diwydiant trwm. Soniodd Delyth am y petrol swlffwr tra isel a fydd ar gael ledled Prydain mor gynnar â Mawrth nesaf ac edrychodd datganiad y Canghellor cyn y gyllideb ymlaen at hynny. Caiff y petrol hwnnw ei gynhyrchu yn Texaco, y tu allan i Ddoc Penfro, felly cynhyrchwn betrol swlffwr tra isel ar gyfer y DU a chynhyrchwn swyddi yng ngorllewin Cymru dlawd, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd ac yn falch o hyn.

**Sue Essex:** Diolch am eich cyfraniadau heddiw, ac yn y cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor. Ailfynegaf fy niolch i bawb a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r gwaith o hyrwyddo'r mater hwn. I'r rheini a weithiodd yn y sioeau ar y

universities and agencies. It is a co-ordinated exercise and I will plug our 'Finding our Voices' event in Builth Wells on Saturday, which the Assembly sponsors and which will consider sustainable development at a grass roots level. Many messages in this Chamber are about taking sustainable development to the grass roots and into the communities where it can be enacted, and 'Finding our Voices' will push that forward.

I thank Rhodri Glyn for withdrawing amendment 6 on local government and for respecting what I said on that. We will do our best to meet the three-month deadline, which means that no-one can be sick or celebrate Christmas. Therefore, I hope you will understand the spirit in which we have accepted that deadline.

On David Davies's amendment, we cannot make a review of a review because the review is in place and is happening now. Sustainable development is at the heart of that review through the mineral planning guidance and other matters. On Richard Edwards's point on 'Betterwales.com', we all accept that it will need to be reviewed and updated. As our ideas on sustainable development progress, we will be looking to amend 'Betterwales.com'.

On Helen Mary's point about cultural changes in the civil service, we have already engaged with outside organisations. It was exciting to have an exchange of ideas. We all know that this is not going to be easy and that making these changes will lead to difficult choices, decisions and priorities. That exchange with the outside world, in its various forms, was important to help to get us where we are now and it will continue to be important in terms of taking this forward, through the action points and the indicators. It was good to hear about the contribution of Christine Gwyther's neck of the woods to sustainable development. On Delyth's point about the private sector, I hope that structural funds along with other funding through the business and environment schemes will enable the private sector to explore the opportunities for sustainable development schemes.

ffordd ac i'r sefydliadau gwirfoddol, prifysgolion ac asiantaethau. Mae'n ymarfer a gydlynwyd a rhoddaf sylw i'n digwyddiad 'Canfod ein Lleisiau' yn Llanfair ym Muallt ddydd Sadwrn, y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei noddi ac a fydd yn ystyried datblygu cynaliadwy ar lefel sylfaenol. Mae llawer o negeseuon yn y Siambr hon yn ymwneud â mynd â datblygu cynaliadwy yn ôl at y werin ac at y cymunedau lle y gellir ei weithredu, a bydd 'Canfod ein Lleisiau' yn rhoi hwb ymlaen i hynny.

Diolchaf i Rhodri Glyn am dynnu gwelliant 6 ar lywodraeth leol yn ôl ac am barchu'r hyn a ddywedais ar hynny. Gwnawn ein gorau i fodloni'r terfyn amser o dri mis, sydd yn golygu na all neb fynd yn sâl na dathlu'r Nadolig. Gobeithiaf y deallwch ysbryd derbyn y terfyn amser hwnnw.

O ran gwelliant David Davies, ni allwn adolygu adolygiad gan fod yr adolygiad yn ei le ac yn digwydd bellach. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy wrth wraidd yr adolygiad hwnnw drwy'r arweiniad cynllunio mwynol a materion eraill. O ran pwynt Richard Edwards ar 'Gwellcymru.com', derbyniwn oll fod angen ei adolygu a'i ddiweddarau. Wrth i'n syniadau ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy wneud cynnydd, rhaid inni edrych ar ddiwygio 'Gwellcymru.com'.

O ran pwynt Helen Mary ar newidiadau diwylliannol yn y gwasanaeth sifil, yr ydym eisoes wedi ymrwymo â sefydliadau allanol. Yr oedd yn gyffrous cyfnewid syniadau. Gwyddom oll nad yw'n mynd i fod yn hawdd ac y bydd gwneud y newidiadau hyn yn arwain at ddewisiadau, penderfyniadau a blaenoriaethau anodd. Yr oedd y cyfnewid hwnnw gyda'r byd y tu allan, yn ei ffurfiau amrywiol, yn bwysig i'n helpu ni i gyrraedd lle rydym yn awr a bydd yn parhau i fod yn bwysig o ran datblygu hyn, drwy'r pwyntiau gweithredu a'r dangosyddion. Yr oedd yn dda clywed am gyfraniad rhan Christine Gwyther o'r wlad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. O ran pwynt Delyth am y sector preifat, gobeithiaf y galluoga arian strwythurol ynghyd ag arian arall drwy'r cynlluniau busnes ac amgylchedd i'r sector preifat archwilio'r cyfleoedd am gynlluniau datblygu cynaliadwy.

Finally, during one of the interviews that I gave yesterday, I was told that people did not understand sustainable development and that it was a bureaucratic statement. However, I think that people have a better understanding than we realise. They are starting to make the connection between how they live now and what they want their children and grandchildren to inherit in the future. The concept of sustainable development may be expressed in difficult terms, but it is a very simple one. It is about the continuation of life in a healthy way for everyone sharing this planet and our environment. It is difficult, but exciting. As Mick said, it is exciting to think that we are at the cutting edge in this. It is a great opportunity and with everyone working together we can make huge advances. I thank everyone for their support and contributions.

Yn olaf, yn ystod un o'r cyfweiliadau a roddais ddoe, dywedwyd wrthyf nad oedd pobl yn deall datblygu cynaliadwy a'i fod yn ddatganiad biwrocraidd. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod gan bobl ddealltwriaeth well nag y tybiwn. Dechreuant wneud y cysylltiad rhwng sut y maent yn byw yn awr a'r hyn a ddymunant i'w plant a'u hwyrion a'u hwyresau etifeddu yn y dyfodol. Efallai y mynegir y cysyniad o ddatblygu cynaliadwy mewn termau anodd, ond mae'n syml iawn. Mae'n ymwneud â pharhad bywyd mewn ffordd iach i bawb sydd yn rhannu'r blaned hon a'n hamgylchedd. Mae'n anodd, ond yn gyffrous. Fel y dywedodd Mick, mae'n gyffrous meddwl ein bod ar flaen y gad yn hyn o beth. Mae'n gyfle gwych a chyda phawb yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd gallwn wneud cynnydd aruthrol. Diolchaf i bawb am eu cefnogaeth a'u cyfraniadau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth

Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun

Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hancock, Brian  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment adopted.*

*Tynnwyd gwelliant 6 yn ôl.  
Amendment 6 was withdrawn.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 7: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Halford, Alison  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Law, Peter  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment rejected.*

12:02 p.m.

Amended motion:

*The National Assembly*

*1. Adopts as its sustainable development scheme, in accordance with section 121(1) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, the document entitled 'Learning to Live Differently' laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2000, and instructs the Executive to use this scheme as the basis of an application for a European regional innovation grant and notes that the key policy documents, which will contribute to*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio:

*Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol*

*1. Yn mabwysiadu'r ddogfen 'Dysgu Byw'n Wahanol' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2000 fel ei gynllun datblygu cynaliadwy, yn unol ag adran 121(1) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, ac yn cyfarwyddo'r Weithrediaeth i ddefnyddio'r cynllun hwn fel sail ar gyfer cais am grant menter rhanbarthol Ewrop ac yn nodi y dylai'r dogfennau polisi allweddol, a fydd yn cyfrannu i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, gynnwys*



*sustainable development, should include 'Betterwales.com' and 'Building Excellent Schools Together';*

*2. Requests the Minister for Environment to develop an action plan in consultation with Assembly Members and others for implementing the scheme within three months with provision for periodical updating thereafter;*

*3. Requests the Minister for Environment to bring forward practical options within three months to ensure that sustainable development is mainstreamed and promoted within the Assembly's structures;*

*4. Requests the Minister for Environment to bring forward within three months an initial set of indicators of sustainable development that take account of responses to the document 'A Sustainable Wales – Measuring the Difference', consultation on which closed on 27 October;*

*5. Requests all Ministers to demonstrate how they are promoting sustainable development in the exercise of their functions;*

*6. Thanks all individuals and organisations that responded to that consultation document.*

*'Gwellcymru.com' ac 'Adeiladu Ysgolion Rhagorol Gyda'n Gilydd';*

*2. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu, drwy ymgynghori ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac eraill ar gyfer gosod y cynllun datblygu ar waith o fewn tri mis gyda darpariaeth ar gyfer diweddarau'n gyfnodol wedi hynny;*

*3. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gyflwyno opsiynau ymarferol o fewn tri mis i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn dod yn rhan annatod o strwythurau'r Cynulliad, a'i fod yn cael ei hyrwyddo;*

*4. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd gyflwyno casgliad cychwynnol o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy o fewn tri mis, gan ystyried yr ymatebion i'r ddogfen 'Cymru Gynaliadwy—Mesur y Gwahaniaeth', y daeth y cyfnod ymgynghori arni i ben ar 27 Hydref;*

*5. Yn gofyn i'r Gweinidogion ddangos sut y maent yn hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy wrth arfer eu swyddogaethau;*

*6. Yn diolch i'r holl unigolion a sefydliadau a ymatebodd i'r ddogfen ymgynghori honno.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Edwards, Richard  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
Feld, Val

German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Halford, Alison  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion adopted.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Cyfraniad y Sector Cydweithredol a Chydfuddiannol wrth Hyrwyddo Cynhwysiant Cymdeithasol a Chyfranogiad Cymunedol yng Nghymru**

#### **The Contribution of the Co-operative and Mutual Sector to the Promotion of Social Inclusion and Community Involvement in Wales**

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am proud to declare an interest as a Labour Co-operative Member of this Assembly in delivering my third short debate. Some people are a little suspicious as to why I have been lucky on three occasions; the computer likes me.

I have been a member of the Co-operative Party for around 15 years, but like many of us here, my early memory of the co-op, at a time when there were many co-ops in the Rhondda, is of the annual divvy when my mother could buy me new shoes for Easter with her windfall. There is something warm and secure about the co-op, but it is a harsh, competitive world out there now, and in

**Lorraine Barrett:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddatgan buddiant fel Aelod Llafur Cydweithredol o'r Cynulliad hwn wrth gyflwyno fy nhrydedd dadl fer. Mae rhai pobl ychydig yn ddrwgdybus ynglŷn â pham y bŵm yn ffodus ar dri achlysur; mae'r cyfrifiadur yn fy hoffi.

Bŵm yn aelod o'r Blaid Gydweithredol ers tua 15 mlynedd, ond fel llawer ohonom yma, fy atgof cynnar o'r sefydliad cydweithredol, ar adeg pan oedd llawer o sefydliadau cydweithredol yn y Rhondda, yw'r gyfran flynyddol pan allai fy mam brynu esgidiau newydd imi ar gyfer y Pasg gyda'i gorelw. Mae rhywbeth cynnes a diogel am y sefydliad cydweithredol, ond bellach mae'n

today's climate, the co-operative movement must compete, but at the same time, not lose its ideal and reasons for being.

The Rochdale pioneers' original concept was not a million miles away from what we are striving for in the Assembly, namely to tackle social exclusion and to help people to take ownership of their communities. To give you an idea of what can be and has been achieved by the co-operative and mutual sectors in promoting social inclusion and community involvement through initiatives such as retail co-ops, food co-ops housing co-ops, credit unions, workers' co-ops and community business. I also mention farmers' co-ops, but I will leave that to Mick Bates who has asked for a few minutes to make his contribution. I am also happy to allow Pauline Jarman to speak on behalf of the Plaid Cymru group and David Melding as a co-operative Conservative.

One of the most famous co-operative ventures in Wales is Tower Colliery; a successful business owned and controlled by its workers. It is a prime example of community involvement. Tower not only provides jobs and opportunities for the people living in its area, but its workers give support to and get involved in all kinds of community initiatives.

A well-known mutual in Wales is the Principality Building Society. It is our largest building society and is committed to remaining a mutual. Thanks are due to the UK Labour Government for protecting building societies by increasing the necessary vote needed to demutualise from 25 per cent to 50 per cent. We must not forget the Co-operative Bank, which is the only ethical bank in this country, and they said that that could not be done.

For young people looking for business support and training in the entertainment, media and arts field, Promo is a co-operative, based in Cardiff Bay, working with and in the

fyd cystadleuol, caled, ac yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni, rhaid i'r mudiad cydweithredol gystadlu, ond ar yr un pryd, beidio â cholli ei ddelfryd a'r rhesymau dros ei fodolaeth.

Nid oedd y cysyniad gwreiddiol arloeswyr Rochdale mor wahanol â hynny i'r hyn yr anelwn ato yn y Cynulliad, sef mynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol a helpu pobl i berchnogi eu cymunedau. I roi syniad ichi o'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni a'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gan y sectorau cydweithredol a chydfuddiannol wrth hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chyfranogiad cymunedol drwy fentrau megis sefydliadau cydweithredol manwerthu, sefydliadau cydweithredol bwyd, sefydliadau cydweithredol tai, undebau credyd, sefydliadau cydweithredol gweithwyr a busnes cymunedol. Crybwyllaf hefyd sefydliadau cydweithredol ffermwyr, ond gadawaf hynny i Mick Bates a ofynnodd am ychydig o funudau i wneud ei gyfraniad. Yr wyf hefyd yn fodlon caniatáu i Pauline Jarman siarad ar ran grŵp Plaid Cymru a David Melding fel Ceidwadwr cydweithredol.

Un o fentrau cydweithredol enwocaf Cymru yw Glofa'r Tŵr; busnes llwyddiannus a berchnogir ac a reolir gan ei weithwyr. Mae'n enghraifft wych o gyfranogiad cymunedol. Nid yn unig y mae'r Tŵr yn darparu swyddi a chyfleoedd i'r bobl sydd yn byw yn ei hardal, ond mae ei gweithwyr yn cefnogi pob math o fentrau cymunedol ac yn cyfranogi ynddynt.

Sefydliad cydfuddiannol adnabyddus yng Nghymru yw Cymdeithas Adeiladu'r Principality. Hon yw ein cymdeithas adeiladu fwyaf ac mae'n ymrwymedig i barhau'n sefydliad cydfuddiannol. Mae diolch yn ddyledus i Lywodraeth Lafur y DU am ddiogelu cymdeithasau adeiladu drwy gynyddu'r bleidlais angenrheidiol sydd ei hangen i anghilyddu o 25 y cant i 50 y cant. Ni ddylem anghofio'r Banc Cydweithredol, sef yr unig fanc moesegol yn y wlad hon, a dywedid na ellid gwneud hynny.

I bobl ifanc sydd yn edrych am gymorth busnes a hyfforddiant ym maes adloniant, y cyfryngau a'r celfyddydau, mae Promo yn sefydliad cydweithredol, wedi'i leoli ym Mae

community. Labour and Co-operative Members of this Assembly, in particular, look forward to the launch of the Wales Co-operative and Mutual Partnership, which will bring together all sectors of the co-operative movement in Wales for the first time. I know that other Members will welcome that move. It will include retail societies, workers' co-ops, housing co-ops, credit unions and building societies. The predatory attacks on building societies and other mutuals demonstrate why it is necessary for co-operators to unite in strength. When it is set up, I hope that that partnership will be able to work closely with the Assembly in representing and defending the sector's interests.

Turning to community businesses, the Objective 1 single programming document recognises the contribution that social economy organisations, including credit unions and local exchange trading schemes, make to local communities. It contains measures to stimulate their creation and expansion. However, no accurate statistics are maintained on the number and size of co-operatives and community businesses in Wales. I ask the Minister to consider finding a way to rectify that so that progress on the objectives for Objective 1 can be monitored effectively. We need to know from where we start to know where we are going. Last month, the Minister for Health and Social Services, Jane Hutt, launched the community food initiative. The Assembly will provide grants of up to £5,000 to a number of projects such as breakfast clubs, fruit tuck shops in primary schools, community cafés or cooking classes. In a display of co-operation, the fruit tuck shop idea is being jointly funded by the Assembly, the Food Standards Agency and the Ministry of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food. It is nice to see such co-working.

The fastest growing co-operative in Wales is the credit union. It is a real co-operative day today; my question 4 earlier was also about credit unions. This is probably the co-

Caerdydd, sydd yn gweithio gyda'r gymuned ac o'i mewn. Mae Aelodau Llafur ac Aelodau Cydweithredol y Cynulliad hwn, yn benodol, yn edrych ymlaen at lansio Partneriaeth Gydweithredol a Chydfuddiannol Cymru, a fydd yn dwyn pob sector o'r mudiad cydweithredol yng Nghymru ynghyd am y tro cyntaf. Gwn y croesewir y symudiad hwnnw gan Aelodau eraill. Bydd yn cynnwys cymdeithasau manwerthu, sefydliadau cydweithredol gweithwyr, sefydliadau cydweithredol tai, undebau credyd a chymdeithasau adeiladu. Dengys yr ymosodiadau rheibus ar gymdeithasau adeiladu a sefydliadau cydfuddiannol eraill pam ei bod yn angenrheidiol i gydweithredwyr uno mewn nerth. Wedi'i sefydlu, gobeithiaf y gall y bartneriaeth honno gydweithio'n agos â'r Cynulliad i gynrychioli ac amddiffyn buddiannau'r sector.

I droi at fusnesau cymunedol, cydnebydd dogfen rhaglennu sengl Amcan 1 y cyfraniad a wneir gan sefydliadau economi gymdeithasol, gan gynnwys undebau credyd a chynlluniau masnachu cyfnewid lleol, i gymunedau lleol. Cynhwysa fesurau i ysgogi eu creu a'u hehangu. Fodd bynnag, ni chedwir ystadegau cywir ar nifer a maint sefydliadau cydweithredol a busnesau cymunedol yng Nghymru. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried canfod ffordd o unioni hynny er mwyn monitro cynnydd ar yr amcanion ar gyfer Amcan 1 yn effeithiol. Mae angen inni wybod o lle y dechreuwn er mwyn gwybod i ble yr awn. Fis diwethaf, lansiodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Jane Hutt, y fenter fwyd gymunedol. Bydd y Cynulliad yn darparu grantiau o hyd at £5,000 i nifer o brosiectau megis clybiau brecwast, siopau ffrwythau hwylus mewn ysgolion cynradd, caffis cymunedol neu ddsbarthiadau coginio. Er mwyn dangos cydweithrediad, cydariennir syniad y siop ffrwythau hwylus gan y Cynulliad, yr Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd a'r Weinyddiaeth Amaethyddiaeth, Pysgodfeydd a Bwyd. Mae'n braf gweld cydweithio o'r fath.

Y sefydliad cydweithredol sydd yn tyfu gyflymaf yng Nghymru yw'r undeb credyd. Mae heddiw'n ddiwrnod cydweithredol gwirioneddol; yr oedd fy nghwestiwn 4 yn

operative that most people understand and can relate to. Edwina said in response to my question that she recently hosted an event in the Assembly, which was a huge success. There were representatives from all 47 credit unions across Wales. I am delighted that the Assembly has recognised the key role that credit unions play in community regeneration, by providing a £3.8 million package for the movement over the next three years. I was also pleased to read this week that our Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities recently called on the private banking sector to work with credit unions by possibly offering them assistance in the form of free banking facilities or staff secondments to help set up those credit unions. As I said, there are currently 47 credit unions registered in Wales. The largest is the Paysaver credit union, which is reported as having 1,164 members. However, there are other credit unions in the Rhondda Cynon Taff area and in Llanelli that are increasing their membership by an impressive number. Collectively, Welsh credit unions demonstrated the fastest growth in membership in Britain between October last year and August this year. I am sure that the reason for this impressive growth is that people are attracted to successful credit unions that offer a professional and friendly service five days a week in welcoming and attractive premises that inspire confidence. Gone are the days of draughty church halls where one went along and paid a few pounds. It is clear that membership is growing fastest in those areas where those conditions exist. The Association of British Credit Unions, in partnership with the Wales Co-operative Centre, is looking forward to developing the credit union strategy for Wales, funded by the Assembly and European Objective 1 money. The main thrust of that strategy is to provide all of our Welsh credit unions with the resources that they desperately need to enable them to provide the high level of fair and reasonable financial services that their communities deserves. Many credit union members were the most financially excluded people in Wales. That has changed because they joined a credit union, making them not only members but also owners of dynamic companies. However, as Edwina said earlier, credit unions are not only for those on low

gynharach hefyd yn ymwneud ag undebau credyd. Yn fwy na thebyg dyma'r sefydliad cydweithredol y gall y rhan fwyaf o bobl ei ddeall ac uniaethu ag ef. Dywedodd Edwina wrth ymateb i'm cwestiwn iddi lywyddu digwyddiad yn y Cynulliad yn ddiweddar, a oedd yn llwyddiant mawr. Yr oedd cynrychiolwyr o bob un o'r 47 undeb credyd ledled Cymru yno. Yr wyf wrth fy modd fod y Cynulliad wedi cydnabod rôl allweddol undebau credyd o ran adfywio cymunedau, drwy ddarparu pecyn o £3.8 miliwn ar gyfer y mudiad dros y tair blynedd nesaf. Yr oedd hefyd yn bleser darllen yr wythnos hon i'n Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau alw yn ddiweddar ar y sector bancio preifat i gydweithio ag undebau credyd drwy gynnig cymorth iddynt o bosibl ar ffurf cyfleusterau bancio am ddim neu secondio staff er mwyn helpu i sefydlu'r undebau credyd hynny. Fel y dywedais, ar hyn o bryd cofrestrwyd 47 o undebau credyd yng Nghymru. Y mwyaf yw undeb credyd Paysaver, y nodwyd fod ganddo 1,164 o aelodau. Fodd bynnag, mae undebau credyd eraill yn ardal Rhondda Cynon Taf ac yn Llanelli sydd yn cynyddu eu haelodaeth gyda nifer trawiadol. Gyda'i gilydd, undebau credyd Cymru a ddangosodd y twf cyflymaf o ran aelodaeth ym Mhrydain rhwng mis Hydref y llynedd a mis Awst eleni. Yr wyf yn sicr mai'r rheswm dros y twf trawiadol hwn yw y denir pobl at undebau credyd llwyddiannus sydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth proffesiynol a chyfeillgar bum diwrnod yr wythnos mewn safle croesawgar a deniadol sydd yn ennyn hyder. Mae dyddiau neuaddau eglwys drafftig lle'r eid a thalu ychydig o bunnoedd wedi hen ddiflannu. Mae'n eglur mai yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle y bodola'r amodau hynny y tyfa aelodaeth gyflymaf. Mae Cymdeithas Undebau Credyd Prydain, mewn partneriaeth â Chanolfan Gydweithredol Cymru, yn edrych ymlaen at ddatblygu strategaeth yr undeb credyd ar gyfer Cymru, a ariennir gan y Cynulliad ac arian Amcan 1 Ewrop. Prif fyrdwn y strategaeth honno yw darparu'r adnoddau ar gyfer pob un o undebau credyd Cymru sydd eu taer angen er mwyn eu galluogi i ddarparu lefel uchel y gwasanaethau ariannol teg a rhesymol y mae eu cymunedau yn eu haeddu. Yr oedd llawer o aelodau'r undebau credyd yn bobl a oedd wedi'u hallgáu fwyaf yn ariannol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny wedi

incomes. We all need to save, and those earning more can help the credit union get off the ground. I hope that when the Assembly's credit union is set up, all 60 Members will sign up to give it that boost.

12:12 p.m.

I began by mentioning the Rochdale pioneers. We often think of the co-operative movement as something from a bygone age. However, they were ahead of their time in their vision and their hope for their communities. Those pioneers were even mentioned in an economics article in *The Guardian* this week, using the John Lewis Partnership as an example of how it is possible to run a successful and dynamic business with a different corporate structure called mutualism. The same article also mentions the football supporters' trusts, which operate on a not for profit basis. Those trusts were set up because supporters were unhappy with the way their views and interests were being disregarded in some cases by those running the clubs. The phrase 'united we stand' came to my mind. I am not sure if Welsh football supporters have the same concerns, but it is an example of how people can take control of their community, whether it is the community in which they live, work or play. For me, Wales is a community and it has a long tradition of self-help and co-operation. That stems mainly from the fact that, historically, we depended so much on coal and the other heavy industries that naturally bound people together through the difficult and harsh times that were brought about by working in those industries.

The people of Wales, supported by this Assembly, can look forward in an imaginative way by taking the lead in developing and sustaining credit unions, food co-operatives, farmers' co-operatives, housing co-operatives and community

newid gan iddynt ymuno ag undeb credyd, gan eu gwneud nid yn unig yn aelodau ond hefyd yn berchnogion cwmnïau deinamig. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd Edwina yn gynharach, nid yw undebau credyd ar gyfer y rheini ar incwm isel yn unig. Mae angen inni i gyd gynilo, a gall y rheini sydd yn ennill mwy helpu'r undeb credyd i gychwyn yn dda. Gobeithiaf, pan fydd undeb credyd y Cynulliad wedi'i sefydlu, yr ymuna pob un o'r 60 Aelod ag ef er mwyn rhoi hwb iddo.

Dechreuais drwy grybwyll arloeswyr Rochdale. Yn aml meddyliwn am y mudiad cydweithredol fel rhywbeth o'r oes o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddent o flaen eu hamser o ran eu gweledigaeth a'u gobaith ar gyfer eu cymunedau. Crybwyllwyd yr arloeswyr hynny mewn erthygl ar economeg yn *The Guardian* yr wythnos hon hyd yn oed, gan ddefnyddio Partneriaeth John Lewis fel esiampl o sut y mae'n bosibl rhedeg busnes llwyddiannus a deinamig gyda strwythur corfforaethol gwahanol a elwir cydfuddiannaeth. Crybwylla'r un erthygl hefyd ymddiriedolaethau'r cefnogwyr pêl-droed, sydd yn gweithredu ar sail di-elw. Sefydlwyd yr ymddiriedolaethau hynny oherwydd bod cefnogwyr yn anhapus gyda'r ffordd y câi eu barn a'u buddiannau eu diystyru mewn rhai achosion gan y rheini a redai'r clybiau. Daeth yr ymadrodd 'mewn undod mae nerth' i'm meddwl. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes gan gefnogwyr pêl-droed Cymru yr un pryderon, ond mae'n enghraifft o sut y gall pobl gymryd rheolaeth o'u cymuned, pa un a yw'n gymuned lle y maent yn byw, yn gweithio neu'n chwarae ynddi. I mi, mae Cymru yn gymuned ac mae ganddi draddodiad hir o hunangymorth a chydweithredu. Deillia hynny yn bennaf o'r ffaith inni, yn hanesyddol, ddibynnu gymaint ar lo a'r diwydiannau trwm eraill a rwymodd pobl ynghyd yn naturiol drwy'r amserau anodd a chaled a ddaeth yn sgîl gweithio yn y diwydiannau hynny.

Gall pobl Cymru, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad hwn, edrych ymlaen mewn ffordd llawn dychymyg drwy gymryd yr awenau wrth ddatblygu a chynnal undebau credyd, sefydliadau cydweithredol bwyd, sefydliadau cydweithredol ffermio, sefydliadau

businesses. All these ventures will give strength and cohesion to a community. If this Assembly is going to tackle social exclusion, we must be ready to help and support those communities in any way we can by co-operation and mutuality.

**Mick Bates:** Discussing the promotion of social inclusion and community involvement and co-operation is refreshing. It is a concept that was almost buried during the Thatcher years, when individual and global greed almost crushed our need to work together. Nowhere was this clearer than in rural areas, where the long tradition of neighbours working together, shearing or harvesting, was squeezed out of the system by economic pressures. Those pressures overlooked the social and community needs that were so important to the survival of our Welsh rural communities. Fortunately, today, we have a regrowth of co-operation in agriculture. There have always been strong agricultural co-ops. Unfortunately, the major one in Wales has become a limited company and has lost its grass roots to some extent and, as such, has lost some of its popularity. However, we have seen that the isolation brought by the conflict economics of the Thatcher era has now led to greater empowerment.

It is with great pleasure that I relate two stories from my community, where community action groups have led to the formation of extremely successful co-operatives that involve many businesses. This process of empowerment is critical if sections of the community are to regain their place in a vibrant, sustainable community. We have discussed the sustainable development scheme and, as part of that, this development to empower people through improving their financial situation is critical. The credit union in Michaelstown in Ireland, for example, was borne out of a desire by farmers to co-operate. That co-operation in Ireland, and now in Wales, has led to the establishment in Ireland and Wales of machinery rings and to Montgomery rural enterprises. We also have many local initiatives where perhaps 10 or 20 farmers work together with a common aim.

cydweithredol tai a busnesau cymunedol. Rhydd y mentrau hyn i gyd gryfder a chydlyniad i gymuned. Os yw'r Cynulliad hwn am fynd i'r afael ag allgáu cymdeithasol, rhaid inni fod yn barod i helpu a chefnogi'r cymunedau hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd y gallwn drwy gydweithredu a chydffuddiannaeth.

**Mick Bates:** Mae trafod hyrwyddo cynhwysiant cymdeithasol a chyfranogiad a chydweithrediad cymunedol yn iachusol. Mae'n gysyniad a gladdwyd bron yn ystod blynyddoedd Thatcher, pan fu bron i'n hangen i gydweithio gael ei wasgu gan drachwant unigol a byd-eang. Nid oedd hyn yn fwy eglur yn unman nag yr oedd mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle y gwasgwyd y traddodiad hir o gymdogion yn cydweithio, yn cneifio neu'n cynaeafu, allan o'r system gan bwysau economaidd. Anwybyddodd y pwysau hynny'r anghenion cymdeithasol a chymunedol a oedd mor bwysig i oroesiad ein cymunedau gwledig yng Nghymru. Yn ffodus, heddiw, mae cydweithredu ym maes amaethyddiaeth yn aildyfu. Bu sefydliadau cydweithredol amaethyddol cryf erioed. Yn anffodus, aeth y prif un yng Nghymru yn gwmni cyfyngedig ac mae wedi colli ei wreiddiau i ryw raddau ac, fel y cyfryw, collodd rywfaint o'i boblogrwydd. Fodd bynnag, gwelsom i'r ynysu a grëwyd gan economeg gwrthdaro cyfnod Thatcher arwain at roi mwy o awdurdod i bobl.

Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf adrodd dwy stori o'm cymuned, lle yr arweiniodd grwpiau gweithredu cymunedol at ffurfio sefydliadau cydweithredol llwyddiannus dros ben sydd yn cynnwys llawer o fusnesau. Mae'r broses hon o roi awdurdod i bobl yn holl bwysig os yw adrannau o'r gymuned i adennill eu lle mewn cymuned egniol gynaliadwy. Trafodasom y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ac, fel rhan o hynny, mae'r datblygiad hwn i roi pŵer i bobl drwy wella eu sefyllfa ariannol yn holl bwysig. Deilliodd yr undeb credyd ym Michaelstown yn Iwerddon, er enghraifft, o ddymuniad ffermwyr i gydweithredu. Arweiniodd y cydweithrediad hwnnw yn Iwerddon, a bellach yng Nghymru, at sefydlu cylchoedd peiriannol yn Iwerddon a Chymru ac at fentrau gwledig Trefaldwyn. Mae gennym hefyd lawer o fentrau lleol lle y cydweithia 10 neu 20

That common aim has also been expressed, in the Welsh Meat Company, which has been subject to many attacks but still survives. I hope it will be successful.

In agriculture, we also see support for the farmers' ferry. This fund is an expression of the fundamental desire to return to a co-operative base and be inclusive. This process has given many options to many more people and stopped them feeling that they have no choice in Welsh society. I look forward to the growth of this co-operative spirit and I am certain that many Members will join Lorraine in promoting greater social inclusion through the spirit of co-operation.

**Pauline Jarman:** I declare an interest as a member of Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council and as a member of Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales's credit union, one of the first credit unions established in Wales and a highly successful one. My contribution to the debate is on an issue that that has not been touched upon in great depth, albeit that Brian Hancock asked a brief question earlier to the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities about rate relief for credit unions. The Assembly advice that is given to local authorities is that credit unions are not registered charities nor do they operate as charities. Therefore, current legislation does not provide for charitable rate relief to be granted to them. Assembly officials are further of the view that credit unions cannot be regarded as non profit-making organisations as they make and distribute profit to their members. It is not in the National Assembly's power, I am told, to change primary legislation on mandatory or discretionary rate relief. Officials are not aware of any plans by the Westminster Government to change the law in this respect. In view of that, business rates for credit unions, especially those located in high streets, such as that I opened in Pontyclun this week, are badly hit by this burden of taxation. I ask all Assembly Members to join me in asking the Secretary of State for Wales to draw this matter to the Westminster Government's attention so that primary legislation can be amended accordingly.

fffermwr efallai â nod gyffredin. Mynegwyd y nod gyffredin honno hefyd, yng Nghwmni Cig Cymru, a fu'n destun llawer o ymosodiadau ond sydd yn goroesi o hyd. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn llwyddiannus.

Mewn amaethyddiaeth, gwelwn gefnogaeth hefyd i fferi'r ffermwyr. Mae'r gronfa hon yn fynegiant o'r dymuniad sylfaenol i ddychwelyd i sail gydweithredol ac i gynhwysiant. Rhoddodd y broses hon lawer o opsiynau i lawer mwy o bobl a'u hatal rhag teimlo nad oes ganddynt ddewis yn y gymdeithas Gymreig. Edrychaf ymlaen at y twf yn yr ysbryd cydweithredol hwn ac yr wyf yn sicr yr ymuna llawer o Aelodau â Lorraine wrth hyrwyddo mwy o gynhwysiant cymdeithasol drwy ysbryd cydweithredu.

**Pauline Jarman:** Datganaf fuddiant fel aelod o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ac fel aelod o undeb credyd Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, un o'r undebau credyd cyntaf i gael eu sefydlu yng Nghymru ac un hynod llwyddiannus. Mae fy nghyfraniad i i'r ddadl ar fater nas cyffyrddwyd ag ef mewn dyfnder mawr, er i Brian Hancock ofyn cwestiwn byr yn gynharach i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau am gymorth trethi i undebau credyd. Y cyngor a roddir gan y Cynulliad i awdurdodau lleol yw nad elusennau cofrestredig mo undebau credyd ac na weithredant fel elusennau. Felly, nid yw'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol yn darparu ar gyfer rhoi cymorth trethi elusennol iddynt. At hynny, mae swyddogion y Cynulliad o'r farn na ellir ystyried undebau credyd fel sefydliadau di-elw gan y gwnânt elw a'i ddosbarthu i'w haelodau. Dywedir wrthyf nad yw o fewn pŵer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i newid deddfwriaeth sylfaenol ar gymorth trethi pa un ai'n orfodol neu yn ôl disgrisiwn. Nid yw'r swyddogion yn ymwybodol o unrhyw gynlluniau gan Lywodraeth San Steffan i newid y gyfraith hon yn hyn o beth. Yng ngoleuni hynny, caiff y baich trethiant hwn effaith wael ar gyfraddau busnes ar gyfer undebau credyd, yn arbennig y rheini a leolir ar y stryd fawr, megis yr un a agorais ym Mhontyclun yr wythnos hon. Gofynnaf i bob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ymuno â mi wrth ofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Gymru ddwyn y



mater hwn i sylw Llywodraeth San Steffan er mwyn i'r ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol allu cael ei diwygio'n unol â hynny.

**David Melding:** I declare an interest here. Although I am not a member of the Co-operative Party—I feared for a moment that I was about to be offered its whip—I am an account holder at the Co-operative Bank which offers an excellent service. I highly commend it and its commitment to ethical principles and particularly in regard to investment overseas. It is an excellent bank and service. The co-operative principle is completely compatible with Conservative aims. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh'.] Lorraine's speech was excellent and non-partisan, but Mick referred to the Thatcher era. I feel, as a Conservative, that this shows how social enterprise can use market mechanisms, which can empower people. We live in a global economy that disengages many people. That is the feeling that people have as consumers and employees. Yet the co-operative movement, which has a pedigree as old as the industrial age—and you can trace it back further to co-operative methods of farming—has been a source of great power for people to use in their communities. It has a great future ahead of it. We have heard about credit unions. For many people, the purchase of what some of us would regard as routine consumer items causes great difficulties. They are then subject to the use of credit that is only available with high interest. The use of credit unions in circumstances like those is commendable. I will certainly join the credit union that will be established in the Assembly.

12:22 p.m.

Lorraine has had three short debates. Although I do not judge the first two, I cannot remember them. However, this has been an excellent use of the short debate. I thank her for that and for the measured way in which she made her points. There is general consensus in the worth of the co-operative movement.

**The Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities (Edwina Hart):** I concur with David Melding's points. We are pleased that Lorraine chose this topic.

**David Melding:** Datganaf fuddiant yma. Er nad wyf yn aelod o'r Blaid Gydwethredol—ofnais am funud bod ei chwip ar fin cael ei chynnig imi—yr wyf yn ddeiliad cyfrif yn y Banc Cydwethredol sydd yn cynnig gwasanaeth gwych. Fe'i canmolaf yn fawr a'i ymrwymiad i egwyddorion moesegol ac yn benodol o ran buddsoddi dramor. Mae'n fanc ac yn wasanaeth gwych. Mae'r egwyddor gydwethredol yn gwbl gyson â nodau'r Ceidwadwyr. [AELODAU O'R CYNULLIAD: 'O'.] Yr oedd araith Lorraine yn wych ac yn amhleidiol, ond cyfeiriodd Mick at gyfnod Thatcher. Teimlaf, fel Ceidwadwr, y dengys hyn sut y gall menter gymdeithasol ddefnyddio mecanweithiau'r farchnad, a all roi awdurdod i bobl. Yr ydym yn byw mewn economi fyd-eang sydd yn eithrio llawer o bobl. Dyna deimlad pobl fel cwsmeriaid a chyflogeion. Eto i gyd bu'r mudiad cydwethredol, sydd yn meddu ar bedigri mor hen â'r oes ddiwydiannol—a gallwch ei olrhain yn ôl ymhellach i ddulliau cydwethredol o ffermio—yn ffynhonnell awdurdod mawr i bobl ei defnyddio yn eu cymunedau. Mae dyfodol gwych o'i flaen. Clywsom am undebau credyd. I lawer o bobl, mae prynu'r hyn y byddai rhai ohonom yn eu hystyried yn eitemau arferol cwsmeriaid yn achosi anawsterau mawr. Maent wedyn yn gorfod defnyddio credyd nad yw ar gael ond ar log uchel. Mae defnyddio undebau credyd mewn amgylchiadau fel hynny yn ganmoladwy. Byddaf yn sicr yn ymuno â'r undeb credyd a sefydlir yn y Cynulliad.

Mae Lorraine wedi cael tair dadl fer. Er na farnaf y ddwy gyntaf, ni allaf eu cofio. Fodd bynnag, bu hyn yn ddefnydd gwych o'r ddadl fer. Diolchaf iddi am hynny ac am ei ffordd bwylllog o wneud ei phwyntiau. Mae consensws cyffredinol yng ngerwerth y mudiad cydwethredol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Edwina Hart):** Cytunaf â phwyntiau David Melding. Yr ydym yn falch i Lorraine ddewis y pwnc

It shows the purpose of the short debate well and the consensus that exists in the Assembly on many issues. It gives us a good profile in the world in discussing issues that truly affect people.

Wales is a nation of communities. That is a characteristic of urban as well as rural Wales. I am not just thinking of the villages and towns which once depended on slate or coal. It is also true of cities and towns such as Cardiff, Swansea and Wrexham. The fact that Lorraine, Mick Bates, Pauline Jarman and David Melding contributed to today's debate shows that this subject strikes a chord everywhere—whatever part of Wales you come from and, in our case, whatever party we represent.

At the beginning of the Assembly's strategic document, 'Betterwales.com', a long-term vision was set out. We said that we wanted to create a 'united, confident and creative' Wales. To reach that point, we must start with what is best in Wales today and build on it. In this debate, Lorraine has focused on one of the traditional strengths of Wales and its people. Co-operation and a sense of mutuality have always been one of our strengths, and that is as true today as it has been in the past.

Lorraine helpfully brought together many different examples of co-operation and mutuality in her speech. She has done us all a service by reminding us of how many examples there are of this across Wales. Some of them, such as Tower Colliery, have proved to be an inspiration to people beyond the borders of Wales. To be the subject of an opera is tremendous.

I was pleased that Lorraine drew the Assembly's attention to the practical support that the administration has been able to give to the credit union movement in Wales. In doing this, we have shown that when we talk of encouraging and developing, we want concrete initiatives that can improve the quality of people's lives. I think that we generally agree now that the Americans are not very good at running elections. However,

hwn. Dengys ddiben y ddadl fer yn dda a'r consensws sydd yn bodoli yn y Cynulliad ar sawl mater. Rhydd broffil da inni yn y byd wrth drafod materion sydd yn effeithio ar bobl mewn gwirionedd.

Mae Cymru yn genedl o gymunedau. Mae hynny yn nodwedd ar Gymru drefol yn ogystal â Chymru wledig. Ni feddyliaf am y pentrefi a'r trefi a arferai ddibynnu ar lechi neu lo yn unig. Mae hefyd yn wir am ddinasoedd a threfi megis Caerdydd, Abertawe a Wrecsam. Mae'r ffaith i Lorraine, Mick Bates, Pauline Jarman a David Melding gyfrannu at ddadl heddiw yn dangos bod y pwnc hwn yn taro tant ym mhobman—o ba ran bynnag o Gymru y dewch ac, yn ein hachos ni, pa blaid bynnag a gynrychiolwn.

Ar ddechrau dogfen strategol y Cynulliad, 'Gwellcymru.com', nodwyd gweledigaeth tymor hir. Dywedasom ein bod am greu Cymru 'unedig, hyderus a chreadigol'. Er mwyn cyrraedd y pwynt hwnnw, rhaid inni ddechrau gyda'r hyn sydd orau yng Nghymru heddiw ac adeiladu arno. Yn y ddadl hon, canolbwyntiodd Lorraine ar un o gryfderau traddodiadol Cymru a'i phobl. Bu cydweithredu a synnwyr o gydfuddiannaeth yn un o'n cryfderau bob amser, ac mae hynny yr un mor wir heddiw ag y bu yn y gorffennol.

Tynnodd Lorraine lawer o enghreifftiau gwahanol o gydweithredu a chydfuddiannaeth ynghyd yn ei haraith mewn ffordd a oedd o gymorth. Gwnaeth gymwynas â phob un ohonom drwy ein hatgoffa o gymaint o enghreifftiau o hyn sydd ledled Cymru. Mae rhai ohonynt, megis Glofa'r Tŵr, wedi bod yn ysbrydoliaeth i bobl y tu hwnt i ffiniau Cymru. Mae bod yn destun opera yn anhygoel.

Yr oeddwn yn falch i Lorraine dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad at y gefnogaeth ymarferol y gallodd y weinyddiaeth ei rhoi i'r mudiad undebau credyd yng Nghymru. Drwy wneud hyn, dangosasom ein bod, wrth siarad am annog a datblygu, yn dymuno cael mentrau cadarn a all wella ansawdd bywydau pobl. Credaf ein bod yn cytuno'n gyffredinol bellach nad yw'r Americanaid yn dda iawn wrth gynnal etholiadau. Fodd bynnag, fel y

as I said in response to a question earlier in Plenary today, they certainly understand the value of credit unions. These unions play a central part in the lives of many Americans. David talked of globalism and capitalism; it is interesting to note that the market leader in capitalism has strong credit union roots.

Each credit union is a co-operative financial institution owned and controlled by its members. That is important. People join credit unions for all sorts of reasons. You reap the benefit of strong financial years and the credit union is there when you fall on hard times. Unlike banks, credit unions rely on financial reserves to absorb unexpected losses from loan defaults or other financial setbacks. We all know that banks will typically either close or pass on higher rates to their customers. Also, many communities in Wales have seen their banks closing over the years. That is one reason why I am glad to announce that credit unions have gone from strength to strength.

I was pleased to say to the Institute of Bankers where banks have helped in giving premises to credit unions, offering free banking and assisting with staff. That is to be welcomed. It also shows their responsibility, as commercial organisations, to Wales.

On Pauline's point, I will take up the issue of the treatment of credit unions and their position regarding business rates on premises. I am sure that the Assembly wants that. Lorraine also referred to the Objective 1 single programming document. She asked me to consider finding a way of obtaining accurate statistics on the number and size of co-operatives and community businesses in Wales.

Finding Welsh ways of developing what we already have in Wales depends on accurate and reliable statistics. I am more than happy to give Lorraine the assurance that she needs. You may remember that when I stood here on 31 October presenting the standard spending assessment formula for 2001-02, I said that full implementation of the proposed formula

dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn yn gynharach yn y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw, maent yn sicr yn deall gwerth undebau credyd. Mae'r undebau hyn yn chwarae rhan ganolog ym mywydau llawer o Americanaid. Siaradodd David am fod yn fyd-eang ac am gyfalafiaeth; mae'n ddiddorol nodi bod gan arweinydd y farchnad o ran cyfalafiaeth wreiddiau cryf mewn undebau credyd.

Mae pob undeb credyd yn sefydliad ariannol cydweithredol a berchnogir ac a reolir gan ei aelodau. Mae hynny yn bwysig. Ymunu pobl ag undebau credyd am bob math o resymau. Cewch fudd blynyddoedd ariannol cryf ac mae'r undeb credyd yno pan ddaw dyddiau anodd. Yn annhebyg i fanciau, dibynna undebau credyd ar gronfeydd ariannol wrth gefn i amsugno colledion annisgwyl yn sgîl diffygion benthyg neu anffodion ariannol eraill. Gwyddom oll fod banciau fel arfer naill ai'n cau neu'n pasio cyfraddau uwch ymlaen i'w cwsmeriaid. Hefyd, mae banciau llawer o gymunedau yng Nghymru wedi cau dros y blynyddoedd. Dyna un rheswm pam fy mod yn falch o gyhoeddi i undebau credyd fynd o nerth i nerth.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o ddweud wrth Sefydliad y Bancwyr lle yr helpodd banciau wrth roi safleoedd i undebau credyd, gan gynnig bancio am ddim a chynorthwyo o ran staff. Mae hynny i'w groesawu. Dengys hefyd eu cyfrifoldeb, fel sefydliadau masnachol, i Gymru.

O ran pwynt Pauline, ymglymeraf â mater y ffordd y trinnir undebau credyd a'u sefyllfa o ran cyfraddau busnes ar safleoedd. Yr wyf yn sicr bod y Cynulliad yn dymuno hynny. Cyfeiriodd Lorraine hefyd at ddogfen rhaglennu sengl Amcan 1. Gofynnodd imi ystyried canfod ffordd o gael ystadegau cywir ar nifer a maint sefydliadau cydweithredol a busnesau cymunedol yng Nghymru.

Mae'r broses o ganfod ffyrdd Cymreig o ddatblygu'r hyn sydd gennym eisoes yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar ystadegau cywir a dibynadwy. Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i roi'r sicrwydd sydd ei hangen arni i Lorraine. Efallai y cofiwch imi ddweud, pan sefais yma ar 31 Hydref i gyflwyno'r fformwla asesu gwariant safonol ar gyfer 2001-02, fod

depended on better data than was currently available. That is a fact in many areas of Welsh life. We need more accurate statistics.

In rural Wales, co-operative initiatives have been seen to be central to marketing the produce of farms. The rural development plan and the Objective 1 single programming document includes measures that we hope will enable farmers to help themselves and their communities to develop a viable future. I assure Mick that we are keen to support any co-operative action by farmers that is well thought out and commercially realistic. That must be a cornerstone of our rural development policy.

Lorraine's overview of the co-operative projects was so comprehensive that she even included football supporters' trusts. On that subject, I am not sure that all football supporters here will know that the motto of the Football Association of Wales is, I understand, the way to play is to play together. That is an appropriate and good way to end my speech, because that is what the co-operative and credit union movement is all about.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings our proceedings today to a close.

gweithredu'r fformwla arfaethedig yn llawn yn dibynnu ar ddata gwell nag a oedd ar gael ar y pryd. Mae hynny yn ffaith mewn sawl maes o fywyd Cymru. Mae angen mwy o ystadegau cywir arnom.

Yng Nghymru wledig, gwelwyd bod mentrau cydweithredol yn ganolog i'r broses o farchnata cynnyrch ffermydd. Mae'r cynllun datblygu gwledig a dogfen rhaglennu sengl Amcan 1 yn cynnwys mesurau a fydd, gobeithio, yn galluogi ffermwyr i helpu eu hunain a'u cymunedau i ddatblygu dyfodol dichonol. Sicrhaf Mick ein bod yn awyddus i gefnogi unrhyw gamau cydweithredol gan ffermwyr a ystyrir yn drylwyr ac sydd yn realistig yn fasnachol. Rhaid i hynny fod yn gonglfaen i'n polisi datblygu gwledig.

Yr oedd trosolwg Lorraine o'r prosiectau cydweithredol mor gynhwysfawr fel ei bod wedi cynnwys ymddiriedolaethau cefnogwyr pêl-droed hyd yn oed. O ran y pwnc hwnnw, nid wyf yn siŵr a yw pob cefnogwr pêl-droed yma yn gwybod mai arwyddair Cymdeithas Pêl-droed Cymru yw, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf i, y ffordd i chwarae yw cyd-chwarae. Mae hynny yn ffordd briodol a da i ddod â'm haraith i ben, oherwydd dyna ddiben y mudiad cydweithredol ac undebau credyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â'n trafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.30 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.30 p.m.*