



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 14 Mehefin 2006
Wednesday, 14 June 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- | | |
|-----|--|
| 3 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions to the Finance Minister |
| 22 | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad
Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside |
| 39 | Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder
Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Gamddefnyddio Sylweddau
The Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Social Justice and Regeneration
Committee's Review on Substance Misuse |
| 58 | Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Adrannau 76B a 76E Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail
Rhyw 1975 fel y'i Diwygiwyd gan Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog
The Delegation of Functions under Sections 76B and 76E of the Sex Discrimination
Act 1975 as amended by the Equality Act 2006 to the First Minister |
| 63 | 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'
'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' |
| 101 | Dadl Fer: Ailgylchu: Cynnydd—Ond Mae Cryn Ffordd i Fynd Eto
Short Debate: Recycling: Progress—But a Long Way to Go |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister

Gwariant Cyhoeddus Public Spending

Q1 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on any discussions with UK Government Ministers on public spending in Wales? OAQ0573(FIN)

C1 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw drafodaethau a gafwyd gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ0573(FIN)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I have regular meetings with the finance Ministers of each part of the UK, during which I report on public spending in Wales.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Byddaf yn cael cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion cyllid pob rhan o'r DU, lle byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad am wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Jocelyn Davies: Some of the manifesto pledges that you made in 2003 have turned out to be unaffordable. Will you give a commitment that, in the lead-up to the next elections, you will avoid promises that cannot be met in full and properly cost your promises?

Jocelyn Davies: Daeth yn amlwg nad oedd rhai o'r addewidion a wnaethoch yn eich maniffesto yn 2003 yn bosibl eu fforddio. A ymrwymwch y byddwch, yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiadau nesaf, yn osgoi gwneud addewidion na ellir eu cadw'n llawn, ac y byddwch yn costio eich addewidion yn briodol?

Sue Essex: That is your usual line, of course. We all take a responsible attitude, I am sure, as political parties, when we cost our promises, but you can never know exactly what the cost will be. This was never going to happen, but had any other political party been elected, it would have been in exactly the same situation. As you well know, we have managed to deliver well on our manifesto commitments, but we have made it clear that there is one—and you know which one it is—that we have changed. That was not just to do with its affordability; it was about definitions and how it could be achieved. It will be up to all of us again, with the impending elections, to ensure that we do our best to cost out any promises that we put in our manifestos, and that applies to all parties.

Sue Essex: Dyna eich dadl arferol, wrth gwrs. Yr ydym i gyd, yr wyf yn siŵr, fel pleidiau gwleidyddol yn bod yn gyfrifol yn ein hagwedd wrth gostio ein haddewidion, ond ni allwch wybod byth beth yn union fydd y gost. Ni fyddai hynny byth wedi digwydd, ond pe bai plaid wleidyddol arall wedi ei hethol, byddai yn yr un sefyllfa'n union. Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gyflawni ein hymrwymiaid maniffesto yn dda, ond yr ydym wedi egluro bod un—a gwyddoch pa un yw hwnnw—wedi ei newid gennym. Nid mater o allu fforddio yn unig oedd hynny; yr oedd yn ymwneud â diffiniadau a'r modd y gellid cyflawni'r ymrwymiad. Gan fod yr etholiadau'n nesáu, bydd yn gyfrifoldeb ar bob un ohonom i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud ein gorau glas i gostio unrhyw addewidion a roddwn yn ein maniffesto, ac mae hynny'n berthnasol i bob plaid.

The Presiding Officer: I call on the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, who is also their

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, sydd hefyd yn llefarydd

finance spokesperson.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Thank you for that build up, Llywydd. On a different tack, relating to the police mergers, an issue on which the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has been to Westminster and given a line on behalf of the whole Assembly, as I understand it, there has to be solidarity on this issue. Have you spoken with anyone from the Treasury with a view to settling the finance issue? We have to make it absolutely clear that we are united on this and that this line is not just being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government, but by all of us.

Sue Essex: I am glad to hear that you are the finance spokesperson for the Conservatives; I did not know that until I was informed by the Presiding Officer. It is useful to know that.

I am particularly pleased when there are issues on which we can all join together, because I think that the public likes to see that. Edwina and I have been absolutely clear on the financial implications here, and have made it clear to the Treasury and every person who can possibly influence this that we want a fair settlement in Wales, for the reasons that we have discussed many times. I am sure that we can all stick together on that line.

Nick Bourne: As finance spokesperson, I can say that, if it is helpful to you—and I assume that the other parties will take a similar stance—for a joint approach to be taken, with Edwina Hart and other Ministers, so that we are not landed with the bill in Wales, we would be happy to join you in that regard.

Sue Essex: Thank you, Nick. As I said, the reorganisation is the responsibility of the Home Office, and we are clear that it is its responsibility to fund it properly. We are also clear about the issue of precepts and that that has to be given due consideration so that, if a reorganisation takes place, that comes in in a fair way for the council tax payers of Wales.

cyllid iddynt.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Diolch am y rhagarweiniad hwnnw, Lywydd. Ar nodyn gwahanol, yn ymwneud ag uno'r heddluoedd, mater y bu'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn San Steffan yn ei gylch ac y cafodd gyfarwyddyd arno ar ran y Cynulliad cyfan, fel y deallaf, rhaid cael undod ar y mater hwn. A ydych wedi siarad ag unrhyw un o'r Trysorlys er mwyn ceisio setlo'r mater ariannol? Rhaid inni ddangos yn gwbl glir ein bod yn unedig ynghylch hyn, ac nad safbwynt Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn unig yw hwn, ond safbwynt pawb.

Sue Essex: Mae'n dda gennyf glywed mai chi yw llefarydd cyllid y Ceidwadwyr; ni wyddwn hynny tan i'r Llywydd ddweud wrthyf. Mae gwybod hynny'n ddefnyddiol.

Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch pan fydd yna faterion y gall pob un ohonom gytuno yn eu cylch, oherwydd credaf fod y cyhoedd yn hoffi gweld hynny. Mae Edwina a minnau wedi bod yn hollol glir ynghylch y goblygiadau ariannol yma, ac yr ydym wedi egluro wrth y Trysorlys a phawb a all ddylanwadu ar hyn ein bod am gael setliad teg yng Nghymru, am y rhesymau yr ydym wedi eu trafod lawer gwaith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn sefyll gyda'n gilydd arn y safbwynt hwnnw.

Nick Bourne: Fel llefarydd cyllid, gallaf ddweud, os bydd hyn o gymorth ichi—a thybiaf y bydd safbwynt y pleidiau eraill yn debyg—er mwyn cael dull ar y cyd, gydag Edwina Hart a Gweinidogion eraill, fel na fyddwn yn gorfod talu'r bil yng Nghymru, y byddem yn fodlon ymuno â chi yn hynny.

Sue Essex: Diolch ichi, Nick. Fel y soniais, y Swyddfa Gartref sy'n gyfrifol am yr ad-drefnu, ac yr ydym yn bendant mai ei chyfrifoldeb hi yw ariannu hynny'n briodol. Yr ydym hefyd yn bendant ynghylch mater praeseptau, a bod yn rhaid ystyried hynny'n briodol er mwyn iddo gael ei gyflwyno, os digwydd yr ad-drefnu, mewn ffordd deg i bobl Cymru sy'n talu'r dreth yngor.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid

Democrat Group (Michael German): On another topic, namely the nature of the Barnett formula, you will remember that during questions in the past, you have given an indication that you would be prepared to consider undertaking research on whether or not there is a case to be made for a better and more appropriate funding formula for Wales than the Barnett formula. Have you made any progress on initiating any research in that respect?

Sue Essex: We are doing work on looking at the levels of expenditure. However, if you remember, the commitment was a joint one—and the leader of the opposition is sitting there—and it was a question of looking at some of the work that had been done elsewhere to see whether there was a basis for consideration that we could extend in research. I am still waiting for that information—this was discussed around 18 months ago, I think—and I look forward to receiving anything that might come my way.

Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Ar fater arall, sef natur fformiwla Barnett, fe gofiwch eich bod, yn ystod cwestiynau yn y gorffennol, wedi awgrymu y byddech yn barod i ystyried ymchwilio i weld a oes achos dros gael fformiwla ariannu well a mwy priodol i Gymru na fformiwla Barnett. A ydych wedi gwneud unrhyw gynnydd i gychwyn unrhyw waith ymchwil yn y cyswllt hwnnw?

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn gwneud gwaith ar edrych ar lefelau gwariant. Fodd bynnag, os cofiwch yr oedd yn ymrwymiad ar y cyd—ac mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn eistedd yno— a chwestiwn ydoedd o edrych ar rywfaint o'r gwaith a oedd wedi ei wneud mewn manau eraill, i weld a oedd sail i'w hystyried y gallem ei hymestyn mewn gwaith ymchwil. Yr wyf yn dal i aros am y wybodaeth honno—trafodwyd hyn ryw 18 mis yn ôl, mi gredaf—ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael unrhyw beth a all ddod i law.

Y Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio The Social Justice and Regeneration Portfolio

Q2 Karen Sinclair: What factors did the Minister consider in determining the budget for the social justice and regeneration portfolio for the last three years?
OAO0577(FIN)

Sue Essex: The factors for determining all budget allocations are set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'. Included in that is meeting our manifesto commitments. One of the ones that we have met in full is the commitment to establish a crime-fighting fund of £100 million.

Karen Sinclair: The Liberal-Democrat-led Wrexham County Borough Council is in the process of reorganising its plans to tackle crime in the area. One option being considered is a reduction in the number of neighbourhood wardens. When it comes to law and order, it takes a lot of time for the local community to trust new methods and new solutions to cutting crime. Many of the wardens in the Wrexham area, such as those in Plas Madoc in my constituency, have earned the confidence of local people, and they bitterly oppose such a change. Minister,

C2 Karen Sinclair: Pa ffactorau a ystyriwyd gan y Gweinidog wrth bennu'r gyllideb ar gyfer y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio dros y tair blynedd diwethaf?
OAO0577(FIN)

Sue Essex: Mae'r ffactorau ar gyfer pennu pob dyraniad o'r gyllideb wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Mae cyflawni ein hymrwymiaidau maniffesto yn rhan o hynny. Un o'r rhai yr ydym wedi eu cyflawni'n llawn yw'r ymrwymiad i sefydlu cronfa atal troseddu o £100 miliwn.

Karen Sinclair: Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, o dan arweiniad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wrthi'n ad-drefnu ei gynlluniau ar hyn o bryd i fynd i'r afael â throseddu yn yr ardal. Un dewis sy'n cael ei ystyried yw lleihau nifer y wardeiniaid cymdogaeth. O ran cyfraith a threfn, mae'n cymryd llawer o amser i'r gymuned leol ymddiried mewn dulliau newydd ac atebion newydd i leihau troseddu. Mae nifer o'r wardeiniaid yn ardal Wrecsam, megis y rhai ym Mhlas Madog yn fy etholaeth i, wedi ennyn ymddiriedaeth pobl leol, ac maent yn

would you agree that the progress made by local neighbourhood wardens in such areas should not be jeopardised by council cost-cutting?

Sue Essex: I have a rule not to comment on any council's spending decisions, so I will put that to one side. However, I will address your point about the value of neighbourhood wardens. What we are seeing across Wales—and, in effect, across the UK, as I talk to colleagues in England and Scotland about this—is more attention being paid to the local neighbourhood and community. We have a good record in Wales on that, and I think that the public values our expenditure in those areas, and gets some degree of comfort and support from approaches such as neighbourhood wardens, as you suggested.

Leanne Wood: Over the past three years, there have been significant increases in domestic gas and electricity prices, and the Centre for Sustainable Energy has estimated that more than 300,000 households have now fallen into fuel poverty. Could you please tell us what contingencies there are in the budget to meet the significant costs of the number of households that have fallen back into fuel poverty, or is this likely to be another broken manifesto promise?

Sue Essex: I am not really sure what you were referring to in the second part of your question. We cannot do a lot about the price of fuel, but, certainly in the domestic housing situation, we can try to reduce people's energy use and therefore their energy costs. That is why the home energy efficiency scheme, and the extra money put into it, is so important. Across the piece, some interesting ideas will come out in local fuel and energy sources over the years, and that is part of Andrew's look at the energy programme. I think that a key area is to look at our buildings, particularly homes and schools, to see how we can reduce energy consumption. We can do a huge amount on that, and it will also have a knock-on effect: there will be less carbon dioxide going into the atmosphere and it will also reduce the costs in people's household budgets.

chwyrn yn erbyn newid felly. Weinidog, a gytunech na ddylid peryglu'r cynnydd y mae wardeiniaid cymdogaeth lleol yn ei wneud mewn ardaloedd o'r fath oherwydd torri costau gan y cyngor?

Sue Essex: Mae gennyf reol na fyddaf yn gwneud sylw ynghylch penderfyniadau gwario unrhyw gyngor, felly, rhoddaf hynny o'r neilltu. Fodd bynnag, deliaf â'ch pwynt ynghylch gwerth wardeiniaid cymdogaeth. Yr hyn a welwn ledled Cymru—a ledled y DU, mewn gwirionedd, wrth imi siarad â chyd-aelodau yn Lloegr ac yn yr Alban ynghylch hyn—yw bod y gymdogaeth a'r gymuned leol yn cael mwy o sylw. Mae gennym record dda ar hynny yng Nghymru, a chredaf fod y cyhoedd yn gwerthfawrogi ein gwariant yn y meysydd hynny, ac yn cael rhyw gysur a chefnogaeth gan ddulliau megis wardeiniaid cymdogaeth, fel yr awgrymch.

Leanne Wood: Yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, bu codiadau sylweddol ym mhrisiau nwy a thrydan domestig, ac mae'r Ganolfan Ynni Cynaliadwy wedi amcangyfrif bod dros 300,000 o gartrefi mewn tloidi tanwydd bellach. A allech ddweud wrthym pa gronfeydd wrth gefn sydd yn y gyllideb i dalu costau mawr nifer o gartrefi sydd mewn tloidi tanwydd drachefn, neu a yw hyn yn debygol o dorri addewid maniffesto arall?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr iawn at beth yr oeddech yn cyfeirio yn ail ran eich cwestiwn. Ni allwn wneud llawer ynghylch pris tanwydd, ond yn sicr o ran sefyllfa cartrefi gallwn geisio lleihau'r ynni a ddefnyddir gan bobl a thrwy hynny leihau eu costau ynni. Dyna pam mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni yn y cartref, a'r arian ychwanegol a roddwyd iddo, mor bwysig. Yn gyffredinol, bydd rhai syniadau diddorol yn dod yn amlwg mewn ffynonellau tanwydd ac ynni lleol yn ystod y blyneddau, ac mae hynny'n rhan o ofal Andrew dros y rhaglen ynni. Credaf ei bod yn allweddolinni edrych ar ein hadeiladau, yn enwedig cartrefi ac ysgolion, i weld sut y gallwn ddefnyddio llai o ynni. Gallwn wneud llawer iawn ar hynny, a bydd sgil-effaith i hynny hefyd: bydd llai o garbon deuocsid yn mynd i'r atmosffer a bydd hefyd yn lleihau'r costau yng nghyllidebau cartrefi pobl.

Mark Isherwood: The initial question referred to Wrexham and wardens, which, primarily, are affected by the revenue support grant settlement rather than the social justice settlement. Wrexham receives among the least revenue support grant per capita. Moving on to the specific question on social justice, why is it that after allowing for inflation, pay prices and the additional costs relating to the devolution of responsibilities for the Children and Family Court Advisory and Support Service and the fire and rescue service, there has been little or no growth in the budget for social justice and regeneration over the past three years, despite the housing crisis and cuts in many key voluntary sector services?

Mark Isherwood: Cyfeiriai'r cwestiwn gwreiddiol at Wrecsam a wardeiniaid, a setliad y grant cynnal refeniw sy'n effeithio arnynt yn bennaf, nid y setliad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae Wrecsam ymysg yr ardaloedd sy'n cael leiaf y pen o grant cynnal refeniw. I symud ymlaen i'r cwestiwn penodol am gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, pam, ar ôl cymryd chwyddiant i ystyriaeth, yn ogystal â phrisiau cyflogau a'r costau ychwanegol yn ymwneud â datganoli cyfrifoldebau am y Gwasanaeth Cynghori a Chynorthwyo Llys i Blant a Theuluoedd a'r gwasanaeth tân ac achub, mai ychydig gynydd, os o gwbl, a fu yn y gyllideb ar gyfer cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, er gwaethaf yr argyfwng tai a'r toriadau yn nifer o wasanaethau allweddol y sector gwirfoddol?

Sue Essex: I really do not understand how you can say that, Mark, particularly on housing, because that was very dear to my heart. The budget for the social housing grant programme went from £59.4 million in 2005-06 to £96.4 million in 2007-08. That is a huge increase according to anyone's mathematics. That money will go right to the heart of supporting some of the issues of affordable housing in Wales. Perhaps you should revisit that budget, and you will then see some of those figures.

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn deall sut y gallwch ddweud hynny, Mark, yn enwedig o ran tai, oherwydd yr oedd y maes hwnnw'n agos at fy nghalon. Cynyddodd y gyllideb ar gyfer y rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol o £59.4 miliwn yn 2005-06 i £96.4 miliwn yn 2007-08. Mae hynny'n gynydd aruthrol yn ôl symiau unrhyw un. Bydd yr arian hwnnw'n mynd i wraidd y gwaith o gefnogi rhai o'r materion ar dai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Efallai y dylech ailedrych ar y gyllideb honno, ac fe welwch rai o'r ffigurau hynny wedyn.

Y Portffolio Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Portfolio

Q3 Janet Ryder: Will the Minister make a statement on the overall allocation of funding to the education, lifelong learning and skills portfolio in comparison with public spending on education, lifelong learning and skills in England? OAQ0576(FIN)

C3 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr arian a ddyrennir yn gyffredinol i'r portffolio addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau o'i gymharu â gwariant cyhoeddus ar addysg, dysgu gydol oes a sgiliau yn Lloegr? OAQ0576(FIN)

Sue Essex: The education and lifelong learning budget will have increased by 125 per cent between 1999-2000 and 2007-08. This has enabled the Assembly Government to spend consistently more per capita than has been spent in England.

Sue Essex: Bydd y gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes wedi cynyddu 125 y cant rhwng 1999-2000 a 2007-08. Mae hyn wedi galluogi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wario mwy y pen nag sydd wedi ei wario yn Lloegr, a gwneud hynny'n gyson.

2.10 p.m.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you are aware

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn

that the Committee on School Funding today published its report. As a member of the committee, I am pleased that it has been well received by the profession and by unions. Some of its recommendations relate to you rather than to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. When an uplift in education spending is announced in England, how much of that transfers to Wales as our Barnett consequential? I would not ask you to give a commitment this early in response to the committee's recommendations, as I am sure that you will need time to consider the report, but will you confirm that you and your colleague, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, will respond to them in Plenary?

Sue Essex: Jane Davidson will be responding to the recommendations; it is an education report, and she takes responsibility for education. I deal with the revenue support grant through the local government formula, and I believe that you are a Plaid Cymru representative on the consultative forum for finance, which takes part in deliberations on that issue. I must make it clear that deliberations on RSG, which is the big chunk of money for local government, are held in partnership with representatives of local government, from across the political spectrum, and of the political groups in the Assembly.

We must be honest about this. It is wider than the education debate. I cannot respond to the report to which you referred, as I have not had the chance to consider it, but the money that comes to us as part of the Barnett formula is for us to deliver. We put virtually all the money that recently came over into education in one form or another. However, there is no point in the setting up of a National Assembly for Wales if we automatically divvy up the money in the same way as is done in England. Due consideration is given to that, and education has been a major beneficiary of money under the Barnett settlement, but it is for us, as the National Assembly for Wales, to decide how that money is spent. If you are going to mimic English distribution, there is little point in our being here.

gwybod bod y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion gyhoeddi ei adroddiad heddiw. Fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, yr wyf yn falch bod y proffesiwn a'r undebau wedi croesawu'r adroddiad. I chi yn hytrach nag i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau y mae rhai o'i argymhellion yn berthnasol. Pan gyhoeddir cynnydd mewn gwariant addysg yn Lloegr, faint o hwnnw sy'n trosglwyddo i Gymru fel swm canlyniadol o dan Barnett? Ni fyddwn yn gofyn ichi roi ymrwymiad mor gynnar â hyn mewn ymateb i argymhellion y pwyllgor, oherwydd bydd angen amser arnoch i ystyried yr adroddiad, mae'n siŵr. Ond a gadarnhewch y byddwch chi a'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, yn ymateb iddynt mewn Cyfarfod Llawn?

Sue Essex: Jane Davidson fydd yn ymateb i'r argymhellion; adroddiad addysg ydyw, a hi sy'n gyfrifol am addysg. Yr wyf fi'n delio â'r grant cynnal refeniw drwy'r fformiwla llywodraeth leol, a chredaf eich bod yn cynrychioli Plaid Cymru ar y fforwm ymgynghorol ar gyllid, sy'n cael trafodaethau ar y mater hwnnw. Rhaid imi egluro bod trafodaethau ar y grant cynnal refeniw, sef y rhan fawr o arian ar gyfer llywodraeth leol, yn digwydd ar y cyd â chynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol, o'r sbectrum gwleidyddol cyfan, a phob un o'r grwpiau gwleidyddol yn y Cynulliad.

Rhaid inni fod yn onest ynghylch hyn. Mae'n ehangach na'r drafodaeth addysg. Ni allaf ymateb i'r adroddiad yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ato, gan nad wyf wedi cael amser i'w ystyried. Ond ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw dosbarthu'r arian sy'n dod inni fel rhan o fformiwla Barnett. Rhoesom bron yr holl arian a ddaeth yn ddiweddar i addysg mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd diben sefydlu Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru os ydym am rannu'r arian yn yr un ffordd yn uniion ag a wneir yn Lloegr. Ystyrir hynny'n ddwys, a chafodd addysg lawer o'r arian a gafwyd o dan setliad Barnett, ond ein cyfrifoldeb ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yw penderfynu sut y gwerir yr arian hwnnw. Os ydych am ddynewared proses ddsbarthu Lloegr, nid oes llawer o ddiben inni fod yma.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that social justice must be at the heart of our spending in education, as in other portfolios? Furthermore, do you agree that initiatives like the 14-19 learning pathways, giving young people an opportunity to balance academic and vocational education, is right, as is our spending on basic skills for young people and adults who have problems with literacy and numeracy? That is the type of approach that will remain at the core of our social justice agenda.

Sue Essex: Like you, I feel strongly about that issue. It makes sense, economically, to do this. We cannot afford to have a whole group of people not achieving their potential. You are right about social justice. Everyone needs the chance to succeed and to do the best that they can in their school years and for their future lives. I believe in the 14-19 pathways and the value given to vocational training and achievement. We must stress the benefit of that work; it is very rewarding work, and is not inferior in any way. That is one of the most important areas in which the Assembly is involved. Basic skills are, in many ways, a determinant of life fulfilment and we are right to give them priority.

William Graham: Though you say that you have not had time to give detailed consideration to the Committee on School Funding's work, what is your opinion on three-year funding?

Sue Essex: Did you say PFI?

William Graham: Three-year funding.

Sue Essex: Sorry; I always have a problem in hearing what you say, William.

The three-year funding plans have gone out for consultation. That is an item for discussion in the partnership council meeting on Thursday. It is our intention, when the next comprehensive spending review comes along, to align that three-year period. That has been my intention for some time. There

Jeff Cuthbert: A gytunwch fod yn rhaid i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol fod wrth wraidd ein gwariant ym maes addysg, fel mewn portffolios eraill? A gytunwch ymhellach fod mentrau fel llwybrau dysgu 14-19, sy'n rhoi cyfle i bobl ifanc gael cydbwysedd rhwng addysg academaidd ac addysg alwedigaethol, yn briodol, fel y mae ein gwariant ar sgiliau sylfaenol ar gyfer pobl ifanc ac oedolion sydd â phroblemau llythrennedd a rhifedd? Dyna'r math o ddull a fydd yn parhau wrth wraidd ein hagenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Sue Essex: Fel chithau, mae gennyf deimladau cryfion ynghylch y mater hwnnw. Mae gwneud hyn yn synnwyr economaidd. Ni allwn fforddio cael grŵp cyfan o bobl nad ydynt yn cyrraedd eu potensial. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynghylch cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Mae angen cyfle ar bawb i lwyddo a gwneud eu gorau yn eu blynyddoedd ysgol ac yn eu bywydau yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn credu yn llwybrau dysgu 14-19 ac yn y gwerth a roddir i hyfforddiant a chyflawni'n alwedigaethol. Rhaid inni bwysleisio gwerth y gwaith hwnnw; mae'n waith sy'n rhoi boddhad, ac nid yw'n israddol o gwbl. Dyna un o'r meysydd pwysicaf y mae'r Cynulliad yn ymwneud hwy. Mewn llawer ffordd mae sgiliau sylfaenol yn penderfynu'r hyn a gyflawnir mewn bywyd, ac yr ydym yn iawn i roi blaenoriaeth iddynt.

William Graham: Er eich bod yn dweud nad ydych wedi cael amser i roi ystyriaeth fanwl i waith y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, beth yw eich barn am gyllido tair blynedd?

Sue Essex: Ai PFI a ddywedasoeh?

William Graham: Cyllido tair blynedd.

Sue Essex: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; yr wyf bob amser yn cael trafferth eich clywed yn siarad, William.

Mae'r broses o ymgynghori ar y cynlluniau cyllido tair blynedd wedi cychwyn. Mae hynny'n eitem i'w thrafod yng nghyfarfod y cyngor partneriaeth ddydd Iau. Ein bwriad, pan ddaw'r adeg ar gyfer yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr nesaf, yw alinio'r cyfnod tair blynedd hwnnw. Mae hynny'n fwriad gennyf

are some details to be worked on with regard to the formula, but we are determined to get that in place.

ers tro. Mae angen gwneud gwaith ar rai manylion o ran y fformiwla, ond yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Blaenoriaethau'r Dyfodol Future Priorities

Q4 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will the Minister make a statement on future priorities for the Assembly's budget provision? OAQ0571(FIN)

C4 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau'r dyfodol ar gyfer darpariaeth cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0571(FIN)

Q5 Helen Mary Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for Assembly budget provision? OAQ0570(FIN)

C5 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer darpariaeth cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0570(FIN)

Sue Essex: The Assembly Government's priorities are set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

Sue Essex: Mae blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi eu gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I was surprised at the Minister's earlier statement that the policy on the Barnett formula is in a cul-de-sac, waiting for the Assembly opposition to give you evidence. To turn to this particular issue, however, does the Minister accept that the financial situation of the ambulance service is now becoming very serious? Is she aware that the weekend before last, on the Thursday, Friday and Saturday nights, not one member of ambulance personnel was available on duty at Holyhead, which is a 24-hour station? At other stations on the island, I am told that there is only one paramedic available to be on duty. Does the Minister agree that that is not acceptable and that the ambulance service requires greater resources? When does she expect to make an announcement on this?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr oedd yn syndod i mi glywed datganiad cynharach y Gweinidog fod y polisi ar fformiwla Barnett yn methu datblygu ymhellach, yn aros i wrthbleidiau'r Cynulliad gyflwyno tystiolaeth i chi. Fodd bynnag, i droi at y mater penodol hwn, a yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod sefyllfa ariannol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans bellach yn mynd yn ddifrifol iawn? A yw'n ymwybodol, y penwythnos cyn y diwethaf, ar y nos Iau, y nos Wener a'r nos Sadwrn, nad oedd un aelod o'r personél ambiwlans ar ddyletswydd yng Nghaergybi, sy'n orsaf 24 awr? Mewn gorsafod eraill ar yr ynys, dywedir wrthyf mai un parafeddyg yn unig sydd ar gael i fod ar ddyletswydd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno nad yw hynny'n dderbyniol a bod angen mwy o adnoddau ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans? Pryd mae hi'n disgwyl gwneud cyhoeddiad am hyn?

Sue Essex: You should be clear that the ambulance service is Brian Gibbons's responsibility. If he makes requests for financial support during the budget process for the NHS across the piece, that is when due consideration is given to them. I admit that there are problems in delivering services in certain parts of Wales—that has been given a lot of publicity and, clearly, it gives cause for concern. The majority of service

Sue Essex: Dylech ddeall mai cyfrifoldeb Brian Gibbons yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Os bydd yn gwneud ceisiadau am gymorth ariannol yn ystod y broses gyllideb ar gyfer y GIG cyfan, dyna pryd y rhoddir ystyriaeth briodol iddynt. Yr wyf yn cyfaddef bod problemau wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru—rhoddyd cryn gyhoedduswydd i hynny, ac mae'n amlwg yn achosi pryder. Mae'r rhan fwyaf

provision is good and targets are being met.

In terms of financial requirements, I will wait to hear what comes out of the deliberations. I spoke to people in the NHS recently about many issues, including this, given the publicity about it. It is a complicated issue, and it is not just a matter of money being needed. As I understand it, there is a fair amount of revenue in the service. I think that there is a need for some capital provision, but until Brian submits a full report—and the budget round is coming up—it is difficult for me to respond. I know that the Minister concerned is making some provision in certain areas, and I am sure that he will report back to committee on that.

Helen Mary Jones: Earlier you referred to the need for evidence of the Barnett squeeze. Do you acknowledge that the latest public expenditure statistical analysis from the Treasury demonstrates that the Barnett squeeze is a reality, and given that that is evidence from Gordon Brown's Treasury, are you now prepared to negotiate with Labour colleagues at Westminster to at least stop this squeeze, if you do not properly renegotiate the whole formula?

Sue Essex: I do not think that I referred to a Barnett squeeze. What I said was that I am always open to suggestions, but you have to be aware that Barnett has served us well. It has certainly done so over recent years in terms of the money coming to us. There is no guarantee—it depends upon what people see as the basis for the formula—that we would be better off under a revised formula. The analysis showed that expenditure is 13 per cent higher in Wales than in England. That includes devolved and non-devolved expenditure. That is a considerable amount more than some people have been predicting. We will keep tabs on this, but those are the figures, and I think that an additional 13 per cent of expenditure is pretty significant.

Jonathan Morgan: When looking at future budget priorities, I would ask the

o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn dda ac yn cyrraedd targedau.

O ran gofynion ariannol, arhosaf i glywed beth fydd canlyniadau'r trafodaethau. Siaradais â phobl yn y GIG yn ddiweddar am lawer mater, gan gynnwys y mater hwn, oherwydd y cyhoeddusrwydd a gafodd. Mae'n fater cymhleth, ac nid mater o fod angen arian yn unig ydyw. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae cryn lawer o refeniw yn y gwasanaeth. Credaf fod angen rhywfaint o ddarpariaeth cyfalaf, ond nes bydd Brian yn cyflwyno adroddiad llawn—ac mae cylch y gyllideb ar droed—mae'n anodd imi ymateb. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dan sylw yn gwneud rhywfaint o ddarpariaeth mewn rhai meysydd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn adrodd yn ôl i'r pwyllgor ar hynny.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio'n gynharach at yr angen am dystiolaeth o'r wasgfa Barnett. A ydych yn cydnabod bod y dadansoddiad ystadegol diweddaraf o wariant cyhoeddus gan y Trysorlys yn dangos bod y wasgfa Barnett yn realiti? Ac o gofio bod hynny'n dystiolaeth o Drysorlys Gordon Brown, a ydych bellach yn barod i drafod gyda chyd-aelodau Llafur yn San Steffan i atal y wasgfa hon o leiaf, os nad ydych yn aildrafod yr holl fformiwla yn gywir?

Sue Essex: Ni chredaf imi gyfeirio at wasgfa Barnett. Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd fy mod bob amser yn agored i awgrymiadau, ond rhaid ichi fod yn ymwybodol bod Barnett wedi ein gwasanaethu'n dda. Yn sicr, mae wedi gwnweud hynny dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran yr arian sy'n ein cyrraedd. Nid oes sicrwydd—mae'n dibynnu beth yw barn pobl ynghylch sail y fformiwla—y byddem mewn sefyllfa well o dan fformiwla ddiwygiedig. Dangosodd y dadansoddiad fod gwariant 13 y cant yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n cynnwys gwariant datganoledig a gwariant nad yw'n ddatganoledig. Mae hynny lawer iawn yn fwy nag a ragwelwyd gan rai pobl. Byddwn yn parhau i fonitro hyn, ond dyna'r ffigurau, a chredaf fod gwariant ychwanegol o 13 y cant yn eithaf sylweddol.

Jonathan Morgan: Wrth edrych ar flaenoriaethau'r gyllideb yn y dyfodol,

Government to examine the way in which NHS trusts in Wales are seeking to implement Government guidelines, in particular the requirement to implement local delivery plans, which exist to ensure that NHS trusts meet the targets that your Government has set for 2009. Cardiff and the Vale NHS Trust has been allocated £14 million to meet these requirements, but estimates that £26.9 million is required, which is a shortfall of some £12.9 million. Will the Assembly Government commit to fully funding these schemes that you have required of NHS trusts as part of their delivery programme, so that they can at least attempt to meet the 2009 target that your Government has set?

byddwn yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth archwilio'r ffordd y mae ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru yn ceisio gweithredu canllawiau'r Llywodraeth, yn arbennig y gofyniad i weithredu cynlluniau cyflenwi lleol, sy'n bodoli i sicrhau bod ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn cyrraedd y targedau a bennwyd gan eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer 2009. Dyrannwyd £14 miliwn i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro i fodloni'r gofynion hyn, ond amcangyfrifir bod angen £26.9 miliwn, sy'n ddifffyg o ryw £12.9 miliwn. A fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymrwmo i gyllido'r cynlluniau hyn yn llawn, sef cynlluniau yr ydych wedi gofyn amdanynt gan ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG fel rhan o'u rhaglen gyflenwi, er mwyn iddynt allu o leiaf geisio cyrraedd y targed ar gyfer 2009 sydd wedi ei osod gan eich Llywodraeth?

2.20 p.m.

Sue Essex: It is a complicated situation, and, as the constituency Member for Cardiff North, I am obviously aware of the figures for Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust. However, it also involves issues across Wales. There is a close relationship between NHS staff, the trusts and local health boards, and those figures are being looked at and worked through. Although they are our targets, they are shared and owned by people within the health service, because they are reasonable and desired targets that people want to see. We must link that with the efficiency savings that are required, and, by the time of our budget round, we will have a more accurate feel of whether that is achievable or not. I give you that commitment.

Sue Essex: Mae'n sefyllfa gymhleth, ac fel Aelod etholaeth dros Ogledd Caerdydd yr wyf yn amlwg yn ymwybodol o'r ffigurau ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn ymwneud â materion ledled Cymru. Mae perthynas agos rhwng staff y GIG, yr ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol, ac edrychir ar y ffigurau hynny ac mae gwaith arnynt yn mynd rhagddo. Er mai ein targedau ni ydynt, maent yn cael eu rhannu a'u perchnogi gan bobl yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, gan eu bod yn dargedau rhesymol a dymunol y mae pobl yn dymuno'u gweld. Rhaid inni gysylltu hynny â'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd sy'n ofynnol, a phan ddaw ein cylch cyllideb bydd gennym syniad gwell a yw hynny'n gyraeddadwy ai peidio. Rhoddaf yr ymrwymiad hwnnw i chi.

David Lloyd: Following on from Helen Mary's question, I return to the vexed issue of the Barnett squeeze. Do you agree that the Barnett squeeze is a reality, and that we cannot keep up with the percentage of increases in health and education spending that are seen in England?

David Lloyd: I ddilyn ymlaen o gwestiwn Helen Mary, dychwelaf at fater dadleuol y wasgfa Barnett. A gytunwch fod y wasgfa Barnett yn realiti, ac na allwn gystadlu â chanran y cynnydd mewn gwariant iechyd ac addysg a welir yn Lloegr?

Sue Essex: Convergence is happening; I have never denied that. It is taking longer than anyone had anticipated but, in our view, the situation is still favourable. If you look at the spending levels that we have had, that is very important. I always make the point that

Sue Essex: Mae cydgyfeirio yn digwydd; Nid wyf erioed wedi gwadu hynny. Mae'n cymryd mwy o amser nag a ragwelwyd gan unrhyw un, ond yn ein barn ni mae'r sefyllfa'n ffafriol o hyd. Os edrychwch ar y lefelau gwariant a gawsom, mae hynny'n

it is the absolute spending levels that are crucial. If we did not have this large sum of money coming through, it would not matter what the formula was; the issue is that we get public spending that we can use.

In terms of what we spend on education and health, it is our decision. There has been broad agreement around that agenda and the way that we structure it. During last year's budget setting round I acknowledge that we did not have a majority, so we shared that, and there was no attempt by opposition parties to make major movements in terms of the way that that budget is structured and distributed. I do not get that message from outside; every area would like a bit more, but that is life, because we would all like that. Whether it is in the area of health, education, roads, transport or local government, that is the way that it is. In broad terms, the proportional distribution of our budget seems to work and to make sense.

David Lloyd: Following on, the Barnett squeeze convergence effect is important, because we start with greater needs, yet, year on year, we have a smaller percentage increase. The words in my original question were not mine but Rhodri Morgan's words in 2000; he said that we cannot cope with the same percentage increases in health and education that happen in England. The latest Treasury figures show that capital investment in health and education in Wales is lagging behind that in England, and that the gap has been increasing, year on year, since 1999. Do you still maintain that the Barnett formula is fair?

Sue Essex: We have major plans for capital, as you know. There is a danger in looking at those figures and making a direct comparison, because we are not always comparing like for like. Knowing England pretty well, in terms of the distribution of funding for school buildings, schools there are largely late Victorian and early Edwardian buildings, particularly in the big conurbations. So, there has been a huge need to spend in England. The unit cost of land

bwysig iawn. Byddaf bob amser yn pwysleisio mai'r lefelau gwario absoliwt sy'n hollbwysig. Pe na bai'r swm mawr hwn o arian yn dod drwyddo, waeth beth fyddai'r fformiwla; y pwynt yw ein bod yn cael gwariant cyhoeddus y gallwn ei ddefnyddio.

O ran yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wario ar addysg ac iechyd, ein penderfyniad ni ydyw. Cafwyd cytundeb cyffredinol ynghylch yr agenda honno a'r ffordd yr ydym yn ei strwythuro. Yn ystod cylch pennu'r gyllideb y llynedd, cydnabyddaf nad oedd gennym fwyafrif, felly rhannwyd hynny, ac ni wnaeth y gwrthbleidiau unrhyw ymgais i wneud penderfyniadau sylweddol am y ffordd y caiff y gyllideb ei strwythuro a'i dosbarthu. Nid wyf yn cael y neges honno o'r tu allan; hoffai pob maes gael ychydig yn rhagor, ond fel yna y mae pethau, oherwydd byddai pob un ohonom yn hoffi hynny. Boed ym maes iechyd, addysg, ffyrdd, trafniadaeth, neu lywodraeth leol, dyna sut y mae pethau. Yn gyffredinol, ymddengys fod dosbarthiad cyfrannol ein cyllideb yn gweithio ac yn gwneud synnwyr.

David Lloyd: I ddilyn ymlaen o hynny, mae effaith gydgyfeirio'r wasgfa Barnett yn bwysig, gan ein bod yn dechrau gyda mwy o anghenion, ond eto, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, cawn gynnydd canrannol llai. Nid fy ngeiriau i oedd yn fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol, ond geiriau Rhodri Morgan yn 2000; dywedodd na allwn ymdopi â'r un cynnydd canrannol mewn iechyd ac addysg ag sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr. Dengys ffigurau diweddaraf y Trysorlys nad yw buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn iechyd ac addysg yng Nghymru mor uchel ag ydyw yn Lloegr a bod y bwlch wedi cynyddu, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, er 1999. A ydych yn parhau i fynnu bod fformiwla Barnett yn deg?

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennym gynlluniau sylweddol ar gyfer cyfalaf. Mae'n beryglus edrych ar y ffigurau hynny a gwneud cymhariaeth uniongyrchol, gan nad ydym bob amser yn cymharu tebyg â thebyg. Yr wyf yn weddol gyfarwydd â Lloegr, ac o ran dosbarthu cyllideb ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion, i raddau helaeth maesygolion yno'n dyddio o ddiwedd oes Victoria a dechrau oes Edward, yn arbennig yn y cytrefi mawr. Felly, yr oedd angen mawr am wario yn

acquisition and of building costs are higher than in Wales, certainly in south-east England, so there is not necessarily read across. I also suspect that private finance initiative capital spend is included in those figures, which your party is not very happy with, if I remember correctly.

The important thing to ask is whether we are spending enough for what we need to do. Are we distributing it in the right way and are we doing the right thing for Wales? Over the past seven years, I have been completely mystified about why Plaid Cymru is still intent on comparing everything that we do with what is done in England. Since devolution the world has moved on. In terms of capital, we have put a huge sum on money in, but I would like to see a more consistent spend over time. If you look back over many years in the public sector, we have seen peaks and troughs of capital spend. We need more consistent direction, so that we do not have these massive periods when we replace our assets and that we actually have a more streamlined and sustainable approach. That will be one of the things that I will try to secure.

Lloegr. Mae'r gostau yr uned o gaffael tir a chostau adeiladau yn uwch nag yng Nghymru, yn sicr yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr, felly nid yw hyn o reidrwydd yn berthnasol. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn tybio bod gwariant cyfalaf menter cyllid preifat wedi'i gynnwys yn y ffigurau hynny, ac nid yw eich plaid chi yn fodlon iawn ar hynny, os cofiaf yn iawn.

Y peth pwysig i'w ofyn yw a ydym yn gwario digon ar gyfer yr hyn y mae angen i ni ei wneud. A ydym yn ei ddosbarthu yn y ffordd gywir ac a ydym yn gwneud y peth cywir dros Gymru? Dros y saith mlynedd diwethaf, mae wedi bod yn benbleth llwyr imi pam mae Plaid Cymru yn dal i fynnu cymharu popeth a wnawn â'r hyn a wneir yn Lloegr. Mae'r byd wedi symud yn ei flaen ers datganoli. O ran cyfalaf, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi swm sylweddol iawn o arian, ond hoffwn weld gwariant mwy cyson gydag amser. Os edrychwch yn ôl dros nifer o flynyddoedd yn y sector cyhoeddus, yr ydym wedi gweld amrywiadau mewn gwariant cyfalaf. Mae arnom angen cyfeiriad mwy cyson, er mwyn sicrhau na chawn y cyfnodau mawr hyn o adnewyddu ein hasedau, a bod gennym yn wir ddull symlach a mwy cynaliadwy. Dyna fydd un o'r pethau y byddaf yn ceisio'u sicrhau.

Y Portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol **The Health and Social Services Portfolio**

Q6 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget allocation to the health and social services portfolio? OAQ0553(FIN)

C6 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0553(FIN)

Q9 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget provision for the health and social services portfolio? OAQ0555(FIN)

C9 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb a ddarperir ar gyfer y portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol? OAQ0555(FIN)

Sue Essex: The budget allocation for the health and social services portfolio is £5.114 billion in 2006-07. This represents an increase of 6 per cent over the 2005-06 provision.

Sue Essex: Y gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r portffolio iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yw £5.114 biliwn yn 2006. Mae hyn yn gynnydd o 6 y cant o'i gymharu â darpariaeth 2005-06.

David Melding: You referred earlier to the situation in the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, and, according to the latest bulletin, the trust now faces having to reduce overall staffing as a result of its financial difficulties this year.

David Melding: Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio'n gynharach at y sefyllfa yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, ac yn ôl y bwletin diweddaraf mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn awr yn wynebu gorfod lleihau nifer y staff

Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust is not a repeat offender but it is in a particularly difficult position this year, which has been identified as a problem in England, where some trusts seem to face troubles one year and then not in another year. We need to look at the overall financial position and the way in which we distribute funds. Something is going wrong here. A one-year crisis, if it is a crisis, should not lead to such things as a reduction in staff levels.

Sue Essex: As I understand it from Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, although I may be wrong, the way forward is in a reduction of agency staffing, which is an overall aim. There are no redundancies from the core staff. I may be wrong but I think that that was the latest position. Every year, you have to look at allocations of money—not just allocations in distribution. I know that the Townsend formula was revised to try to secure that. There are issues that can be achieved through the efficiency agenda to reduce those costs, and we are seeing some of those being applied. It is an important principle to keep monitoring that spend closely and work, as I have said, through the NHS, in particular, and through the public sector as a whole, to see whether there is any way that that extra spend can be supported in those distributions of funding. You have my word that we will be doing that.

Mark Isherwood: Representatives of hospices across north Wales have told me that the Welsh Assembly Government's refusal to extend direct funding will lead to cuts in palliative care beds. The forum for voluntary hospices in Wales tells me that since the publication of the Assembly Government's strategic direction for palliative care services in Wales, there has been no attempt by local health boards and networks to address the funding of voluntary hospices. Hospices enable patients to have a quality end-of-life experience and they provide in-patient care for a much reduced rate than that paid in the NHS. They release

cyffredinol oherwydd ei hanawsterau ariannol eleni. Nid yw hyn wedi digwydd yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn y gorffennol, ond mae mewn sefyllfa arbennig o anodd eleni. Nodwyd bod hon yn broblem yn Lloegr, lle mae'n ymddangos bod rhai ymddiriedolaethau'n wynebu anawsterau un flwyddyn ond nid mewn blwyddyn arall. Mae angen inni edrych ar y sefyllfa ariannol gyffredinol a'r ffordd yr ydym yn dosbarthu arian. Mae rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le yma. Ni ddylai argyfwng un flwyddyn, os argyfwng ydyw, arwain at bethau fel gostwng lefelau staff.

Sue Essex: Yn ôl a ddeallaf o Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro, er y gallwn fod yn anghywir, y ffordd ymlaen yw drwy leihau staff asiantaeth, ac mae hynny'n nod cyffredinol. Nid oes diswyddiadau o gwbl o'r staff craidd. Efallai fy mod yn anghywir, ond credaf mai dyna oedd y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf. Bob blwyddyn, rhaid ichi edrych ar ddyraniadau arian—nid dyraniadau o ran dosbarthu'n unig. Gwn fod fformiwla Townsend wedi ei diwygio i geisio sicrhau hynny. Mae materion y gellid eu datrys drwy'r agenda effeithlonrwydd er mwyn lleihau'r costau hynny, a gwelwn rai ohonynt yn cael eu defnyddio. Un egwyddor bwysig yw parhau i fonitro'r gwariant hwnnw'n agos a gweithio, fel y dywedais, drwy'r GIG yn arbennig, a thrwy'r sector cyhoeddus cyfan, i weld a oes unrhyw ffordd y gellir cefnogi'r gwariant ychwanegol hwnnw yn y dosbarthiadau cyllido hynny. Rhoddaf fy ngair ichi y byddwn yn gwneud hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Mae cynrychiolwyr hosbisau ledled y gogledd wedi dweud wrthyf y bydd penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wrthod estyn cyllid uniongyrchol yn arwain at leihau gwelyau gofal lliniarol. Mae fforwm hosbisau gwirfoddol Cymru yn dweud wrthyf, ers cyhoeddi cyfeiriad strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwasanaethau lliniarol yng Nghymru, na fu unrhyw ymgais gan fyrddau iechyd lleol a rhwydweithiau i fynd i'r afael â'r broses hon o gyllido hosbisau gwirfoddol. Mae hosbisau yn galluogi cleifion i gael profiad o safon ar ddiwedd eu hoes, ac maent yn darparu gofal cleifion mewnol am gost

resources for the NHS, particularly at times of bed shortages. What urgent action will you take, and what assurance will you give, to make the budget provision necessary now to place hospices in Wales on a sound financial footing?

Sue Essex: It is fair to say that hospices are in the voluntary sector, but I agree with you, Mark. There is one in my own constituency, with which I have worked closely. They do extremely good work. There is a combination of some funding that has come from us, in terms of capital, and some money that they raise themselves. It is primarily a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services, but I will make this point to him, because I think that it is a belief held across Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust tells me that its combined shortfall for next year is £35 million. One of the ways in which it is planning to try to balance the books is to not open the brand-new, fully prepared operating theatres at Llandough Hospital for orthopaedic patients, which are designed to reduce the length of waiting lists in the area. Yesterday, when I talked about this with the First Minister, his reply was that the trust was still negotiating on the issue. Do you not think that it is rather late, at this point in the financial year, when the operating theatres are ready, to still have negotiations going on as to whether there is sufficient funding available for the activities of those operating theatres?

2.30 p.m.

Sue Essex: This will be an excellent facility and it will have a huge impact. My understanding of what has happened on this scheme is that, at a fairly late date, there was an agreement that they would extend it to make the whole building much bigger than it was in the original design, for which there was complete connection between the revenue side, the business case and the capital. It is the variation in the scheme that has extended and intensified it, and discussions at the moment are around the revenue. Everyone is hopeful that that can be solved fairly quickly, and that the building

lower yn is nag a delir yn y GIG. Maent yn rhyddhau adnoddau ar gyfer y GIG, yn arbennig pan fydd prinder gwelyau. Pa gamau brys y byddwch yn eu cymryd, a pha sicrwydd a roddwch i ddarparu'r gyllideb y mae ei hangen yn awr er mwyn rhoi sail ariannol gadarn i hosbisau yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: Mae'n deg dweud bod hosbisau yn y sector gwirfoddol, ond cytunaf â chi, Mark. Mae un hosbis yn fy etholaeth i, ac yr wyf wedi gweithio'n agos gyda hi. Maent yn gwneud eithriadol o dda. Mae yna gyfuniad o ryw faint o gyllid gennym ni, o ran cyfalaf, a rhywfaint o arian y maent yn ei godi eu hunain. Yn bennaf, mae'n fater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ond codaf y pwynt hwn gydag ef, oherwydd credaf ei bod yn farn gyffredin ledled Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Dywed Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro wrthyf mai £35 miliwn yw ei diffyg cyfunol am y flwyddyn nesaf. Un o'r ffyrdd y mae'n ceisio mantoli'r gyllideb yw peidio ag agor yr ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth newydd sbon sydd wedi'u paratoi'n llawn yn Ysbyty Llandochau ar gyfer cleifion orthopedig, ac sydd wedi'u cynllunio i leihau rhestrau aros yn yr ardal. Ddoe, pan siaradais â'r Prif Weinidog am hyn, ei ateb oedd bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn dal i drafod hyn. Oni chredwch ei bod braidd yn hwyr, ar yr adeg hon yn y flwyddyn ariannol, a'r ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth yn barod, fod trafodaethau'n parhau i weld a oes cyllid digonol ar gael ar gyfer gweithgareddau'r ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth hynny?

Sue Essex: Bydd hwn yn gyfleuster rhagorol a chaiff effaith enfawr. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r cynllun hwn yw fod cytundeb, yn hwyr yn y dydd, y byddent yn ei ymestyn i wneud yr adeilad cyfan lawer yn fwy nag yn y cynllun gwreiddiol, lle yr oedd cysylltiad llwyr rhwng yr ochr refeniw, yr achos fusnes a'r cyfalaf. Amrywio'r cynllun sydd wedi ei ymestyn a'i ddwysáu, ac mae'r trafodaethau'n ymwneud â'r refeniw ar hyn o bryd. Mae pawb yn ffyddiog y gellir datrys hynny'n lled gyflym ac y bydd yr adeilad yn cael ei ddefnyddio cyn hir oherwydd, fel y

will be up and operational soon, because, as you say, it is a good scheme and it needs to come through.

Jenny Randerson: That is useful information. One reason why Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust faces this significant shortfall is that the local health board is now further from the Townsend formula than it was a couple of years ago. Minister, you said that the Townsend formula had been revised to take account of this, but a great deal more revision is needed. The process by which LHBs are only making progress towards the formula in years of plenty in the NHS means that, currently, we are making no progress at all. Will you reconsider the proposal that was adopted originally that we only make progress towards the formula in years of plenty?

Sue Essex: As you know, that is Brian's decision, and not mine. However, I have lived with the formula long enough to know there are those who want it changed and those who want it to stay the same, because there are always winners and losers when you deal with this in distribution. Again, as I said to Mark, I will contact the Minister for Health and Social Services and tell him that it was your view that that should be implemented without it being related to growth. The problem, as you will rightly know, is that many people sitting in this Chamber today will have a view that is contrary to yours.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, yr ydych eisoes wedi cyfeirio at fformiwla Townsend. Yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, pe bai'r fformiwla wedi cael ei ariannu'n gywir byddai trafferthion ariannol yr ymddiriedolaeth a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, yn syml, yn dod i ben. Fodd bynnag, mae problemau eraill hefyd, ac mae dyledion a etifeddwyd dros y blynyddoedd. A ydych yn hapus, yn wyneb y problemau hyn sy'n wynebu ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd ledled Cymru, y gorfodir yr ymddiriedolaethau i gau wardiau ac i beidio â chyflogi staff er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r diffygion hyn sydd yn eu cyllidebau, a bod hynny'n arwain at doriadau yn y gwasanaeth i gleifion? A ydych yn hapus gyda hynny, ac

dywedwch, mae'n gynllun da ac mae angen ei weithredu.

Jenny Randerson: Mae hynny'n wybodaeth ddefnyddiol. Un rheswm pam mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn wynebu'r diffyg sylweddol hwn yw am fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol ymhellach oddi wrth fformiwla Townsend nag ydoedd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Weinidog, yr oeddech yn dweud bod y fformiwla Townsend wedi ei diwygio i ystyried hyn, ond mae angen llawer iawn mwy o adolygu. Mae'r broses lle mae BILLau yn gwneud cynnydd tuag at y fformiwla mewn blynyddoedd ffyniannus yn unig yn golygu nad ydym yn gwneud unrhyw gynnydd o gwbl ar hyn o bryd. A wneuch ailystyried y cynnig a fabwysiadwyd yn wreiddiol ac sy'n dweud mai mewn blynyddoedd o lawnder yn unig y byddwn yn gwneud cynnydd tuag at y fformiwla?

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, penderfyniad Brian yw hynny, nid fy mhenderfyniad i. Fodd bynnag, bûm yn byw gyda'r fformiwla yn ddigon hir i wybod bod yna rai sydd am ei newid a rhai sydd am iddi aros yr un fath, am fod rhai yn ennill a rhai yn colli bob tro wrth ichi ddelio â hyn wrth ddsbarthu. Unwaith eto, fel y dywedais wrth Mark, byddaf yn cysylltu â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ac yn dweud wrtho eich bod o'r farn y dylid ei gweithredu heb ei chysylltu â thwf. Y broblem, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, yw y bydd gan lawer o bobl sy'n eistedd yn y Siambr hon heddiw farn sy'n groes i'ch barn chi.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, you have already referred to the Townsend formula. In Carmarthenshire, had the formula been funded properly the financial difficulties of the trust and the local health board would quite simply come to an end. However, there are also other problems, and there are debts that have been inherited over the years. Are you happy, in the face of these problems that face trusts and local health boards throughout Wales, that the trusts are forced to close wards and not to employ staff in order to get to grips with these shortfalls in their budgets, and that that leads to cuts in the service for patients? Are you happy with that, and do you believe that financial management of

a ydych yn credu bod rheolaeth ariannol dros eu cyllidebau yn cyfiawnhau cau wardiau, peidio â chyflogi staff a thorri gwasanaethau i gleifion yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: It is up to Carmarthenshire to make its decisions. As you know, in health, so much of the day-to-day delivery is determined by the LHBs and the trusts. We all have to realise that there are enormous pressures on health spending right across the piece, and I think that, as a society, we have to be absolutely honest about this. However much money I could give from my budget to help out, it seems to me that there would still be demands for health, because techniques, capital, equipment and so on are costing more money and people are expecting higher standards.

The question that I grapple with is that of fair distribution—going back to the point that Dai made earlier—and whether there is fair distribution within our budget to health and social care. I include social care in that, because I feel strongly about it. We have put more money and that, in turn, not only gives people a better quality of life, but impacts on reducing some of the pressures on the NHS.

On the issue of distribution, that is really a matter for the Minister for Health and Social Services. All I know is that, as a society, we have to grapple with this issue of demand for health spending, and I think that is going to be a major issue for us in the coming years. That is the nature of the beast; the more we learn about how we can do things for people, to extend life and improve quality of life, the more amounts of money, largely, are required.

Cyllido Swyddfa Ranbarthol y Gogledd Financing of the North Wales Regional Office

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the financing of the new north Wales regional office at Llandudno Junction? OAQ0536(FIN)

Sue Essex: The finance is being provided by the Welsh Assembly Government for this scheme through the overall budget agreed by

their budgets justifies closing wards, not employing staff and cutting services to patients in Wales?

Sue Essex: Sir Gaerfyrddin sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau. Fel y gwyddoch, ym maes iechyd mae llawer o'r ddarpariaeth o ddydd i ddydd yn cael ei phenderfynu gan y BILlau a'r ymddiriedolaethau. Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod pwysau aruthrol ar wariant iechyd ar hyn o bryd yn gyffredinol, a chredaf fod yn rhaid inni, fel cymdeithas, fod yn gwbl onest ynghylch hyn. Waeth faint o arian y gallwn ei roi o'm cyllideb i helpu, mae'n ymddangos imi y byddai galwadau parhaus ym maes iechyd, gan fod technegau, cyfalaf, offer ac ati yn costio mwy o arian a phobl yn disgwyl safonau uwch.

Y cwestiwn yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd ei ddeall yw cwestiwn dosbarthiad teg—i fynd yn ôl at y pwynt a wnaeth Dai yn gynharach—ac a oes dosbarthiad teg yn ein cyllideb ar gyfer iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn cynnwys gofal cymdeithasol yn hynny, oherwydd mae gennyf deimladau cryf ynghylch hyn. Rhaid inni neilltuo rhagor o arian, ac y mae hynny yn ei dro nid yn unig yn rhoi gwell ansawdd bywyd i bobl, ond yn lleddfu ychydig ar y pwysau sydd ar y GIG.

O ran dosbarthu, mater i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw hynny mewn gwirionedd. Y cyfan a wn i yw fod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r mater o alw am wariant ar gyfer iechyd, a chredaf y bydd hynny'n fater o bwys inni yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Dyna fel y mae; po fwyaf y dysgw'n sut y gallwn wneud pethau i bobl, i ymestyn bywyd a gwella ansawdd bywyd, mwy'n y byd o arian y mae ei angen.

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido swyddfa ranbarthol y Gogledd yng Nghyffordd Llandudno? OAQ0536(FIN)

Sue Essex: Mae'r arian yn cael ei ddarparu gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y cynllun hwn drwy'r gyllideb gyffredinol y

the Assembly.

Brynle Williams: I wish to express my concern that one of the main reasons why Welsh companies are being excluded from the approved tender list is their lack of previous work to the Building Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method 'excellent' standard. While this is a highly desirable standard, it is not difficult to achieve, especially for large Welsh companies that can easily work with a BREEAM assessor throughout construction. Will the Minister explain why this issue was used to exclude Welsh companies from the approved tender list, and will she at least give me an assurance that Welsh firms will receive a proportion or a major share of the sub-contracting work?

Sue Essex: Rhodri answered this question for you yesterday, so I am probably expanding on the answer that he gave. There are very strict rules on tendering and procurement to which we must adhere. I do not get personally involved in the tendering process at all; that is left to officials. I know that there is a whole series of requirements on major construction work such as this that companies must meet. I also know that achieving high BREEAM standards, as we have achieved in this building, is absolutely crucial for us, because it fits our contribution to the environment and because that is the message that we need to send out as the leading public body.

In terms of the Llandudno Junction scheme, the contractor and the scheme that have been chosen are part of what is known as the considerate building scheme, which very much reflects this issue of using local labour. The contractor is committed to that, and I am certainly committed to it. I know that there will be a fair for local companies in terms of the services and goods that can be supplied. I hope that we can source as many of the materials as possible locally, certainly in terms of material such as slate and so on. In terms of specifying what the design is, you can support some of those local firms without necessarily infringing on the regulations.

Denise Idris Jones: Do you agree that the Llandudno Junction office, by creating a

cytunwyd arni gan y Cynulliad.

Brynle Williams: Hoffwn fynegi fy mhryder mai un o'r rhesymau pennaf pam mae cwmnïau o Gymru'n cael eu heithrio o'r rhestr dendro gymeradwy yw eu diffyg gwaith blaenorol sy'n cyrraedd safon 'ragorol' Dull Asesu Amgylcheddol y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladu. Er bod y safon hon yn hynod ddymunol, nid yw'n anodd ei chyrraedd, yn enwedig i gwmnïau mawr Cymru a all weithio'n hawdd gydag aseswr BREEAM drwy gydol y gwaith adeiladu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog esbonio pam y defnyddiwyd y mater hwn i eithrio cwmnïau Cymru o'r rhestr tender gymeradwy, ac a wnaiff roi sicrwydd imi y caiff cwmnïau Cymru o leiaf gyfran neu ran fawr o'r gwaith is-gontractio?

Sue Essex: Atebodd Rhodri'r cwestiwn hwn ichi ddoe, felly, mae'n debyg fy mod yn ymhelaethu ar yr ateb a roddodd ef. Mae rheolau llym iawn o ran tendro a chaffael y mae'n rhaid inni gadw atynt. Nid wyf yn ymwneud yn bersonol â'r broses dendro o gwbl; gwaith swyddogion yw hynny. Gwn fod cyfres gyfan o ofynion ar waith adeiladu mawr fel hwn y mae'n rhaid i gwmnïau eu bodloni. Gwn hefyd fod cyrraedd safonau uchel BREEAM, fel sydd wedi'u cyrraedd gyda'r adeilad hwn, yn hollol hanfodol inni, gan fod hynny'n ateb ein cyfraniad i'r amgylchedd ac am mai dyna'r neges y mae angen inni ei chyfleu fel y prif gorff cyhoeddus.

O ran cynllun Cyffordd Llandudno, mae'r contractiwr a'r cynllun a ddewiswyd yn rhan o'r hyn a elwir yn gynllun adeiladu ystyrlon, sy'n adlewyrchu'r mater hwn o ran defnyddio llafur lleol yn helaeth iawn. Mae'r contractiwr wedi ymrwymo i hynny, ac yr wyf finnau'n sicr wedi ymrwymo i hynny. Gwn y bydd ffair yn cael ei chynnal i gwmnïau lleol o ran y gwasanaethau a'r nwyddau y gellir eu darparu. Gobeithio y gallwn gael cynifer â phosibl o'r deunyddiau'n lleol, yn enwedig deunydd fel llechi, ac ati. O ran manylu ar y cynllun, gallwch gefnogi rhai o'r cwmnïau lleol hynny heb dorri'r rheoliadau o reidrydd.

Denise Idris Jones: A ydych yn cytuno bod swyddfa Cyffordd Llandudno, drwy greu

considerable number of jobs for local people, including opportunities for young apprentices, and by using materials that reflect an association with north Wales, which incorporates our commitment to sustainable development, is a huge boost for the economy of north Wales?

Sue Essex: Yes. It will be a very exciting building, both in terms of architecture and what it can do for the area. That particular part of north Wales will see a great deal of interest. Many people whom I speak to are quite excited by the idea of what that investment in that part of north Wales can bring. As you said, it will have an impact on training and job opportunities, but I think that it will also have an impact on the direct investment of companies and others in the area.

nifer sylweddol o swyddi i bobl leol, yn cynnwys cyfleoedd i brentisiaid ifanc, a thrwy ddefnyddio deunyddiau sy'n adlewyrchu cysylltiad â'r gogledd, sy'n ymgorffori ein hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, yn hwb mawr i economi'r gogledd?

Sue Essex: Ydwyf. Bydd yn adeilad cyffrous iawn, o ran pensaernïaeth a'r hyn y gall ei wneud i'r ardal. Bydd yn ennyn llawer o ddiddordeb yn y rhan benodol honno o'r gogledd. Mae nifer bobl y byddaf yn siarad â hwy yn frwd iawn am y syniad o'r hyn y gall y buddsoddiad hwnnw yn y rhan honno o'r gogledd ei ddarparu. Fel yr oeddech yn dweud, caiff effaith ar hyfforddiant a chyfleoedd swyddi, ond credaf y bydd hefyd yn cael effaith ar fuddsoddi uniongyrchol gan gwmnïau ac eraill yn yr ardal.

Gwella'r Fformiwlâu a Ddefnyddir i Ddyrannu Cyllidebau Improving the Formulae Used in Budget Allocations

Q8 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister provide an update on work being undertaken to improve the formulae used in budget allocations? OAQ0549(FIN)

C8 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am waith sy'n cael ei wneud i wella'r fformiwlâu a ddefnyddir i ddyrannu cyllidebau? OAQ0549(FIN)

Sue Essex: I have commissioned work on a range of formulae being used by the Assembly Government. I am testing out the rationale of both the deprivation and the population dispersal elements of those formulae in particular.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf wedi comisiynu gwaith ar amrywiaeth o fformiwlâu a ddefnyddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn profi rhesymeg elfennau amddifadedd a gwasgariad poblogaeth yn y fformiwlâu hynny'n benodol.

Lynne Neagle: You will be aware of my long-standing concerns about the local government formula, and you will also be aware that this issue has been picked up by the Committee on School Funding report, which was launched today. You recently assured me by letter about the work that you commissioned after the previous review proved insubstantial. Do you agree that allocations based on historical spend and sparsity weightings with no real evidence base do not make sense and are not in keeping with social justice? What assurances can you offer that the forthcoming review will be genuinely comprehensive and will ensure that education funding meets the needs of all our children?

Lynne Neagle: Fe wyddoch am fy mhryderon maith am y fformiwlâ llywodraeth leol, ac fe wyddoch hefyd fod y mater hwn wedi ei drafod gan adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, a lanswyd heddiw. Rhoesoch sicrwydd imi mewn llythyr yn ddiweddar am y gwaith a gomisiynwyd gennych ar ôl iddi ddod yn amlwg fod yr adolygiad blaenorol yn annigonol. A gytunwch nad yw dyraniadau sy'n seiliedig ar wariant hanesyddol a phwysoliadau teneurwydd poblogaeth heb dystiolaeth wirioneddol yn gwneud synnwyr, a'u bod yn groes i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol? Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei gynnig y bydd yr adolygiad sydd i ddod yn wirioneddol gynhwysfawr, ac y bydd yn sicrhau bod arian addysg yn diwallu anghenion ein plant i gyd?

Sue Essex: In terms of the existing distribution mechanism, when you say 'historical', it is historical in that it reflects what local authorities have traditionally spent. That is its basis. The distribution is based on a whole range of factors, which are not necessarily linked to historical spend. We are looking at this issue of the need to spend. We have accepted that deprivation has historically been an issue on which local authorities need to spend more. Some people—I know that you feel differently about this—have accepted that population dispersal provides a need to spend, but you are right to say that we have never done the direct work to see how much that might be, whether it is less or more than the weighting that we have, and what type it is. That is the detailed work that needs to be done. We will be working with local authorities and others to see whether we can bottom out what that means.

2.40 p.m.

I think that education will be the first area that we look at, particularly in the light of the committee's report. It is not exclusively about education, but that is the area that has really come to the fore regarding whether this is fair in terms of distribution. We have asked that education be the first area to be considered.

Sue Essex: O ran y dull dosbarthu presennol, pan ddywedwch 'hanesyddol', mae'n hanesyddol yn yr ystyr ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r hyn y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi'i wario'n draddodiadol. Dyna yw ei sail. Mae'r dosbarthiad yn seiliedig ar amrywiaeth helaeth o ffactorau, nad ydynt yn gysylltiedig â gwariant hanesyddol o reidrwydd. Yr ydym yn edrych ar y mater hwn o'r angen am wario. Yr ydym wedi derbyn bod amddifadedd yn hanesyddol wedi bod yn fater y mae angen i awdurdodau lleol wario mwy arno. Mae rhai pobl—gwn eich bod yn teimlo'n wahanol am hyn—wedi derbyn bod gwasgariad poblogaeth yn darparu'r angen am wario, ond yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud nad ydym erioed wedi gwneud y gwaith uniongyrchol i weld faint allai hynny fod, boed yn llai neu'n fwy na'r pwysoli sydd gennym, a pha fath ydyw. Dyna'r gwaith manwl y mae angen ei wneud. Byddwn yn gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol ac eraill i weld a allwn benderfynu beth yw ystyr hynny.

Credaf mai addysg fydd y maes cyntaf y byddwn yn edrych arno, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni adroddiad y pwyllgor. Nid yw'n ymwneud ag addysg yn unig, ond dyna'r maes sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg o ran a yw'n deg o ran dosbarthu. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i addysg gael ei ystyried fel y maes cyntaf.

Cyllido'r Portffolio Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Funding of the Local Government and Public Services Portfolio

Q10 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of the local government and public services portfolio in Wales? OAQ0568(FIN)

C10 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido'r portffolio llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? OAQ0568(FIN)

Sue Essex: The funding for the main expenditure group will rise from £3.9 billion in 2006-07 to over £4 billion in 2008-09. That is an increase of 12 per cent between 2005-06 and 2008-09.

Sue Essex: Bydd yr arian ar gyfer y prif grŵp gwariant yn codi o £3.9 biliwn yn 2006-07 i dros £4 biliwn yn 2008-09. Mae hynny'n gynydd o 12 y cant rhwng 2005-06 a 2008-09.

Nick Bourne: The Minister will recall that, at the time of the budget discussions at the end of the last calendar year, one of the messages that we were sending out was about

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio, adeg y trafodaethau am y gyllideb ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn galendr diwethaf, mai un o'r negeseuon a gyfleuwyd gennym oedd nifer y

the number of pensioners who were affected by council tax revaluation. I think that there was a decision at that time, perhaps linked to the budget, to try to publicise council tax benefit more effectively. Does the Minister have any figures on the take up of council tax benefit, as a proportion, and whether it has increased as a result of the recent efforts to publicise it?

Sue Essex: I have not had the figures yet. It is probably a bit early to say in this financial year because we were asking local authorities to work on the relief scheme for pensioners who are going up more than two bands. There is a working group that puts all these schemes together, and various schemes are now operating in Wales. I will ask them to give us some feedback as soon as they are in a position to do so; I will get that information and make sure that all Members get a response.

pensiynwyr yr oedd ailbrisió'r dreth gyngor yn effeithio arnynt. Credaf fod penderfyniad wedi ei wneud ar y pryd, hwyrach yn gysylltiedig â'r gyllideb, i geisio rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd i fudd-dal treth gyngor yn fwy effeithiol. A oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw ffigurau am nifer y bobl sy'n cael budd-dal treth gyngor, fel cyfran, ac a yw wedi cynyddu o ganlyniad i'r ymdrechion yn ddiweddar i'w roi cyhoeddusrwydd iddo?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf wedi cael y ffigurau eto. Hwyrach ei bod yn rhy gynnar i ddweud yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, gan ein bod yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol weithio ar y cynllun rhyddhad i bensiynwyr sy'n symud i fyny mwy na dau fand. Mae yna weithgor sy'n rhoi'r holl gynlluniau hyn at ei gilydd, ac mae amrywiol gynlluniau ar waith yng Nghymru bellach. Byddaf yn gofyn iddynt roi ymateb inni cyn gynted ag y gallant wneud hynny; caf afael ar y wybodaeth honno a sicrhau y caiff pob Aelod ymateb.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Arbedion Effeithlonrwydd Efficiency Savings

Q1 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on what is being done to encourage farmers to make efficiency savings in Wales? OAQ787(EPC)

C1 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud i annog ffermwyr i sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd yng Nghymru? OAQ787(EPC)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Farming Connect continues to help Welsh farmers to adapt their businesses to increase efficiency and adopt new, more sustainable business practices. Two of its key themes are promoting business efficiency via a free farm business development plan and safeguarding the environment through the use of an environmental opportunities review.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae Cyswllt Ffermio yn dal i helpu ffermwyr Cymru i addasu eu busnesau i gynyddu effeithlonrwydd a mabwysiadu arferion busnes newydd mwy cynaliadwy. Dau o'i themâu allweddol yw hyrwyddo effeithlonrwydd busnes drwy gynllun datblygu busnes ffermio am ddim, a diogelu'r amgylchedd drwy ddefnyddio adolygiad o gyfleoedd amgylcheddol.

Laura Anne Jones: Farm fixed costs have risen by 40 per cent in the past few years and variable costs have risen by 18 per cent. I recently had a meeting with the south and west Wales machinery ring, which is encouraging farmers to share machinery and

Laura Anne Jones: Mae costau sefydlog ffermydd wedi codi 40 y cant yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf a chostau amrywiol wedi codi 18 y cant. Cefais gyfarfod yn ddiweddar â chylch peiriannau'r de a'r gorllewin, sy'n annog ffermwyr i rannu

helping them to keep their costs to a minimum. Machinery rings provide a useful service to our farming communities and they are encouraged in England. Minister, how are you raising awareness of machinery rings in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: Machinery rings are quite common in Wales, and it is certainly right to say that they can help to reduce fixed on-farm costs. They enable farmers, generally, to reduce costs altogether. Some items of machinery are so expensive that they are best bought by a group of farmers, and machinery rings are an indication of how co-operation is the best way forward for farming in Wales.

Elin Jones: Bydd y toriadau yr ydych wedi eu hawgrymu ar gyfer Tir Mynydd yn golygu y bydd ffermwyr yn gorfod gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd sylweddol yn y dyfodol. Wythnos diwethaf, bu ichi ddweud mai'r gwrthbleidiau oedd yn gyfrifol am y gostyngiad yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Mynydd oherwydd y drafodaeth ar gyllideb y Cynulliad ym mis Hydref. O ran y toriad o £14 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Tir Mynydd yr ydych wedi ei gyhoeddi, faint ohono yr ydych yn beio'r gwrthbleidiau yn ei gylch?

Carwyn Jones: Y rhan fwyaf ohono.

Elin Jones: A gaf i fynd â chi yn ôl at y drafodaeth ar y gyllideb yn yr hydref? Gwahaniaeth o £1.3 miliwn sydd rhwng y gyllideb ddrafft a'r un derfynol o ran Tir Mynydd, ond yr ydych wedi cyhoeddi toriadau o £14 miliwn i Tir Mynydd. Mae hynny'n awgrymu, efallai, fod y gwrthbleidiau yn gyfrifol am £1.3 miliwn o'r gwahaniaeth, ond a ydych yn cytuno mai chi sy'n gyfrifol am £12.7 miliwn o'r toriad yn y gyllideb?

Carwyn Jones: O ble yr ydych yn credu y daeth yr arian i dalu ffioedd myfyrwyr? A wnaeth dyfu ar goed? Yr oedd hynny ymhell cyn yr hydref a chyn y gyllideb ddrafft. Rhaid i'r arian ddod o rywle i dalu am flaenoriaethau'r gwrthbleidiau, ac nid yw ffermwyr yn flaenoriaeth iddynt.

peiriannau ac yn eu helpu i gadw costau'n isel. Mae cylchoedd peiriannau yn wasanaeth defnyddiol i'n cymunedau ffermio, a chânt eu hannog yn Lloegr. Weinidog, sut yr ydych yn cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth am gylchoedd peiriannau yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae cylchoedd peiriannau yn ddigon cyffredin yng Nghymru, ac yn sicr mae'n wir dweud y gallant helpu lleihau costau sefydlog ar y fferm. Maent yn galluogi ffermwyr, yn gyffredinol, i leihau eu costau'n gyfan gwbl. Gan fod rhai peiriannau mor ddud, y peth gorau yw i grŵp o ffermwyr eu prynu, ac mae cylchoedd peiriannau'n dangos mai cydweithredu yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen i ffermio yng Nghymru.

Elin Jones: The cuts you have suggested for Tir Mynydd will mean that farmers will have to make substantial efficiency savings in future. Last week, you said that the opposition parties were responsible for the reduction in the Tir Mynydd budget because of the debate on the Assembly's budget in October. In terms of the cut of £14 million in the Tir Mynydd budget which you have announced, how much of that cut do you place at the door of the opposition parties?

Carwyn Jones: Most of it.

Elin Jones: May I take you back to the budget debate in the autumn? There was a difference of £1.3 million between the draft budget and the final budget in terms of Tir Mynydd, but you have announced cuts of £14 million to Tir Mynydd. That suggests, perhaps, that the opposition parties are responsible for £1.3 million of the difference, but do you agree that you are responsible for £12.7 million of the budget cut?

Carwyn Jones: Where do you think the money came from to pay for tuition fees? Did it grow on trees? That was a long before the autumn and the draft budget. The money has to come from somewhere to pay for the opposition parties' priorities, and farmers are not a priority for them.

Datblygu Tai Fforddiadwy Development of Affordable Housing

Q2 Glyn Davies: What plans does the Minister have to identify land suitable for the development of affordable housing on Assembly-owned forestry land? OAQ775(EPC)

C2 Glyn Davies: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i glustnodi tir sy'n addas ar gyfer datblygu tai fforddiadwy ar dir coedwigaeth sy'n eiddo i'r Cynulliad? OAQ775(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I made this announcement some years ago now and the plans are coming to fruition. Three sites in particular have been identified as part of the first phase, and one in particular, in Ceinws, in Powys, is being taken forward with some haste and with local support.

Carwyn Jones: Gwneuthum y cyhoeddiad hwn rai blynyddoedd yn ôl bellach, ac mae'r cynlluniau'n dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Nodwyd tri safle yn benodol fel rhan o'r cam cyntaf, ac mae un yn benodol, yng Ngheinws, ym Mhowys, yn cael ei ddatblygu gydag ychydig frys a chyda chefnogaeth leol.

Glyn Davies: Dealing with the issue of affordable housing is a huge problem in Wales, and it is usually associated with discussions on social housing. However, in my opinion, you have tackled it by taking the right route of increasing the supply of development land. However, as you know, my view is that you are going too slowly and in too limited a fashion. Will you consider introducing targets for houses built per annum so that we can understand how successful this good initiative is in delivering an answer to the problems of affordable housing?

Glyn Davies: Mae delio â thai fforddiadwy yn broblem enfawr yng Nghymru, ac fe'i cysylltir fel rheol â thrafodaethau am dai cymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, yn fy marn i yr ydych wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater yn y ffordd gywir drwy gynyddu'r cyflenwad o dir datblygu. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwyddoch, credaf eich bod yn symud yn rhy araf ac yn rhy gyfyngedig. A ystyriwch gyflwyno targedau ar gyfer y tai sy'n cael eu codi bob blwyddyn, fel y gallwn ddeall pa mor llwyddiannus yw'r fenter dda hon i ddarparu ateb i broblemau tai fforddiadwy?

Carwyn Jones: We covered the issue of targets yesterday, when I informed the Assembly of what would be in TAN 1 and its associated documents. It is important to remember that any planning application put forward by the Forestry Commission or by us has to go through the full planning process, and it is a matter for local authorities to identify the areas that they think are appropriate for the provision of affordable housing. We believe that the areas that we have identified are appropriate, and there are at least another 30 areas that could be looked at for the provision of land for affordable housing.

Carwyn Jones: Trafodwyd y targedau ddoe, pan soniais wrth y Cynulliad am yr hyn a fyddai'n cael ei gynnwys yn TAN 1 a'i ddogfennau cysylltiedig. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod yn rhaid i unrhyw gais cynllunio a gyflwynir gan y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth neu gennym ni fynd drwy'r broses gynllunio lawn, a dyletswydd awdurdodau lleol yw nodi'r ardaloedd a gredant sy'n briodol ar gyfer darparu tai fforddiadwy. Credwn fod yr ardaloedd a nodwyd gennym yn briodol, ac mae o leiaf 30 o ardaloedd eraill y gellid edrych arnynt ar gyfer darparu tir ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy.

Jocelyn Davies: Do you agree that development on forestry land and woodland should come within the planning regime, as you just outlined, but that the subdivision of woodland into small individual plots could potentially lead to many caravans and hard standings being sited there, which do not

Jocelyn Davies: A gytunwch y dylid cynnwys datblygiadau ar dir coedwigaeth a choetir o fewn y system gynllunio, fel yr amlinellwyd gennych ychydig yn ôl, ond y gallai isrannu coetir yn ddarnau bach unigol o dir arwain efallai at osod nifer o garafanau a lleiniau caled yno nad oes angen caniatâd

require planning consent? Will you therefore ensure that surplus Assembly-owned forestry land will never be subject to such subdivision? How do you intend to deter this practice in privately owned woodland?

Carwyn Jones: In terms of Assembly-owned land, which is the subject of the question, the intention is to ensure that the land is available for affordable housing and for no other purpose. That fact that the land is Assembly owned means that certain steps can be taken via covenants, for example, to ensure that the land is not used for anything other than the purpose intended, which will be affordable housing.

Mick Bates: The issue of affordable housing is a cloud hanging over all our heads, and I am concerned about the lack of urgency. In your response to Glyn Davies, you said something like, 'Some years ago, we started to examine this'. Are you satisfied with the progress that you have made over the years, when you think that you have only one possible project in Ceinws in Montgomeryshire?

Carwyn Jones: Yes, I am, because sites have to be identified first of all. They have to be assessed as to whether they are appropriate from a planning point of view, and work has to be done with the local authorities. I aim to be in a position by the middle of next year of having sites that either have planning permission or are being moved forward in terms of building. However, I am not aware of the other parties having expressed an interest in affordable-housing policies on Forestry Commission land before we did.

Mick Bates: I will ignore those last remarks, Minister. I have short debates on record, and I have raised the issue on many occasions. I support everyone else that does so, and so I hope that you will take a more constructive attitude than that which you have just displayed.

One problem appears to be too little liaison between those with the information about housing need, particularly for young people in rural areas, and the planners. What are you

cynllunio ar eu cyfer? A wnewch chi felly sicrhau na fydd tir coedwigaeth dros ben sy'n eiddo i'r Cynulliad fyth yn cael ei isrannu fel hynny? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu atal yr arfer hwn mewn coetir sy'n eiddo preifat?

Carwyn Jones: O ran tir sy'n eiddo i'r Cynulliad, sef yr hyn y mae'r cwestiwn yn cyfeirio ato, y bwriad yw sicrhau bod y tir ar gael ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy, ac nid at unrhyw ddiben arall. Mae'r ffaith fod y tir yn eiddo i'r Cynulliad yn golygu y gellir cymryd camau penodol drwy gyfamodau, er enghraifft, i sicrhau na chaiff y tir ei ddefnyddio at ddim byd ond y diben a fwriadwyd, sef tai fforddiadwy.

Mick Bates: Mae tai fforddiadwy yn gwmwl du uwch ein pennau, ac yr wyf yn pryderu nad oes unrhyw frys o gwbl. Yn eich ymateb i Glyn Davies, yr oeddech yn dweud rhywbeth tebyg i hyn, 'Rai blynnyddoedd yn ôl, dechreusom ystyried hyn'. A ydych yn fodlon â'r cynnydd yr ydych wedi'i wneud dros y blynnyddoedd, o gofio mai un prosiect posibl yn unig sydd gennych yng Ngheinws yn Sir Drefaldwyn?

Carwyn Jones: Ydwyf, yn sicr, oherwydd mae'n rhaid nodi safleoedd yn gyntaf. Rhaid eu hasesu i weld a ydynt yn briodol o safbwynt cynllunio, a rhaid gwneud gwaith gyda'r awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn bwriadu bod mewn sefyllfa erbyn canol y flwyddyn nesaf lle bydd gennym safleoedd sydd naill ai wedi cael caniatâd cynllunio neu'n symud ymlaen o ran gwaith adeiladu. Fodd bynnag, ni wn fod y pleidiau eraill wedi mynegi ddi-ddordeb mewn polisiau tai fforddiadwy ar dir y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth cyn inni wneud hynny.

Mick Bates: Byddaf yn anwybyddu'r sylwadau diwethaf hynny, Weinidog. Mae gennyf ddadleuon byr wedi'u cofnodi, ac yr wyf wedi codi'r mater droeon. Yr wyf yn cefnogi unrhyw un arall sy'n gwneud hynny, ac felly gobeithio y byddwch yn fwy adeiladol yn eich agwedd nag yr ydych wedi'i dangos yn awr.

Ymddengys mai un o'r problemau yw'r diffyg cyswllt rhwng y rheini sydd â'r ar wybodaeth am anghenion tai, yn enwedig ar gyfer pobl ifanc mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a'r

doing to ensure good co-operation between those who hold the information about housing need in local authorities and the planners, so that you can encourage them to work together to solve this affordable-housing crisis by releasing Government land?

Carwyn Jones: To be frank, if local council housing departments and planning departments are not working together properly, something is wrong with the way in which the councils are run. It surely must be important that council departments work together. However, we aim to provide national planning guidance to ensure that that work is taken together, and that is what TAN 1 is about. We are being constructive in moving forward with affordable housing, both via TAN 1, of course, and physically by constructing affordable houses that people can live in, hopefully in the near future.

cynllunwyr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau cydweithredu da rhwng y rheini sydd â'r wybodaeth am anghenion tai mewn awdurdodau lleol a'r cynllunwyr, fel y gallwch eu hannog i gydweithio i ddatrys yr argyfwng hwn mewn tai fforddiadwy drwy ryddhau tir y Llywodraeth?

Carwyn Jones: I fod yn onest, os nad yw adrannau tai ac adrannau cynllunio cynghorau lleol yn cydweithio'n gywir, mae rhywbeth o'i le ar y ffordd y mae'r cynghorau'n cael eu rhedeg. Does bosib nad yw'n bwysig i adrannau cynghorau gydweithio. Fodd bynnag, ein nod yw darparu canllawiau cynllunio cenedlaethol er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gwneud y gwaith hwnnw ar y cyd, a dyna y mae TAN 1 yn ei wneud. Yr ydym yn adeiladol yn ein ffordd o symud ymlaen gyda thair fforddiadwy, drwy TAN 1, wrth gwrs, ac yn ffisegol drwy adeiladu tai fforddiadwy y gall pobl fyw ynddynt, yn y dyfodol agos, gobeithio.

Llosgi Gwastraff The Incineration of Waste

Q3 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the incineration of waste in Wales? OAQ747(EPC)

C3 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am losgi gwastraff yng Nghymru? OAQ747(EPC)

Q7 Michael German: Will the Minister make a statement on the disposal of waste in landfill sites? OAQ755(EPC)

C7 Michael German: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am waredu gwastraff mewn safleoedd tirlenwi? OAQ755(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Landfill and incineration are way down in the waste-disposal hierarchy, as will be seen in the Wales waste strategy. Nevertheless, 100 per cent recycling will not happen in the near future, and so all options, unpalatable though they may be, have to be considered with regard to the disposal of waste.

Carwyn Jones: Mae tirlenwi a llosgi gwastraff yn isel iawn yn y system gwaredu gwastraff, fel y gwelir yn strategaeth gwastraff Cymru. Serch hynny, ni fydd ailgylchu 100 y cant o wastraff yn digwydd yn y dyfodol agos, ac felly rhaid ystyried pob dewis, er eu bod yn annymunol, i waredu gwastraff.

2.50 p.m.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer, Minister. I understand that incineration is low down in the hierarchy; however, several councils have looked upon it as an easy way out to try to achieve their obligations. Unfortunately, as in the case in Crumlin Burrows, where the incineration technology does not work and has, effectively, gone bust, that has caused problems. Is it possible to

Peter Black: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Deallaf fod llosgi gwastraff yn isel iawn yn y system; fodd bynnag, mae nifer o gynghorau wedi ystyried hynny'n ffordd hawdd i geisio cyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau. Yn anffodus, fel y gwelwyd yn achos Twyni Crymlyn, lle nad yw'r dechnoleg llosgi gwastraff yn gweithio a lle y mae, i bob pwrpas, wedi torri, mae

consider providing a specific fund or advice for councils to try to explore different technologies for disposing of waste? Several advanced technologies in Europe, for example, would give alternatives to incineration without having to resort to other methods that may be more expensive.

Carwyn Jones: Crumlin Burrows would not be the best example of a facility working. It is being turned around now but it has had a chequered history; there is no point in pretending otherwise. Nevertheless, there are similar facilities elsewhere in Europe that have functioned more efficiently. There is one on the Isle of Man, for example, where waste is disposed of. I am very keen for local councils to be able to explore all possibilities. They can visit facilities elsewhere in the UK where local councils have taken the lead in using innovative ways to dispose of waste but, ultimately, there is no getting away from the fact that there will be a need for landfill and possibly incineration in the future, given that we cannot recycle everything.

Michael German: At the bottom of the pile, you are talking about landfill. Several local authorities are seeking to change the pattern of their rubbish collection largely because their current landfill sites are filling up and have filled rapidly. Do you believe that the need for strategic planning on where you will site those landfill sites, which will be needed for decades to come, is included in any of your visionary statements?

Carwyn Jones: The regional waste plans addressed this issue. It is important that we realise that Welsh local authorities are too small to provide all the waste disposal facilities that are needed within the boundaries of that council. It certainly cannot be done economically. That is why it is important that local authorities work together, and there is good evidence that that is happening.

David Lloyd: A fyddech yn cytuno y bydd yr angen i fwydo llosgydd gyda sbwriel yn yr hirdymor yn tansilio ymdrechion i gael rhagor o ailgylchu?

hynny wedi achosi problemau. A yw'n bosibl ystyried darparu cronfa benodol neu gyngor i gynghorau i geisio ymchwilio i wahanol dechnolegau ar gyfer gwaredu gwastraff? Byddai nifer o dechnolegau uwch yn Ewrop, er enghraifft, yn darparu dewisiadau yn lle llosgi heb orfod troi at ddulliau eraill a all fod yn ddrutach.

Carwyn Jones: Nid Twyni Crymlyn fyddai'r enghraifft orau o'r ffordd y mae cyfleuster yn gweithio. Mae'r sefyllfa'n newid yn awr, ond mae ganddo hanes brith; nid oes diben ceisio dweud fel arall. Serch hynny, mae cyfleusterau tebyg mewn mannau eraill yn Ewrop sydd wedi gweithio'n fwy effeithlon. Mae un ar Ynys Manaw, er enghraifft, lle caiff gwastraff ei waredu. Yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i gynghorau lleol allu archwilio pob posibilrwydd. Gallant ymweld â chyfleusterau mewn mannau eraill yn y DU lle mae cynghorau lleol wedi cymryd yr awenau wrth ddefnyddio ffyrdd arloesol i waredu gwastraff. Ond yn y pen draw ni ellir osgoi'r ffaith y bydd angen safleoedd tirlenwi a llosgwyr o bosibl yn y dyfodol, o gofio na allwn ailgylchu popeth.

Michael German: Ar waelod y pentwr, yr ydych yn sôn am safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn ceisio newid patrwm eu gwasanaeth casglu sbwriel yn bennaf oherwydd bod eu safleoedd tirlenwi presennol yn llenwi ac wedi llenwi'n gyflym. A gredwch fod yr angen am gynllunio strategol ar leoliad y safleoedd tirlenwi hynny, y bydd eu hangen am ddegawdau i ddod, wedi'i gynnwys yn unrhyw un o'ch datganiadau gweledigaethol?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli bod awdurdodau lleol Cymru'n rhy fach i ddarparu'r holl gyfleusterau gwaredu gwastraff y mae eu hangen o fewn ffiniau'r cyngor hwinnw. Yn sicr, ni ellir gwneud hynny'n economaidd. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol gydweithio, ac mae tystiolaeth dda fod hynny'n digwydd.

David Lloyd: Would you agree that, in the long term, the need to feed an incinerator with rubbish will undermine efforts to have more recycling?

Carwyn Jones: Na fyddwn. Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny o gwbl. Mae cymhelliad da i sicrhau bod ailgylchu yn digwydd, sef bod pris da i'w gael am bapur wedi'i ailgylchu ac mae'r un peth yn wir am wydr. Yn y dyfodol, gellid ailgylchu llawer o'r gwastraff sy'n cael ei gladdu ar hyn o bryd, ond nid yw'n wir i ddweud bod cymhelliad i losgi gwastraff ac, felly, nad oes cymhelliad i ailgylchu.

Carwyn Jones: No, I would not. I do not accept that at all. There is good incentive to ensure that recycling takes place, namely that a good price can be had for recycled paper and for recycled glass. Much of the waste that is currently disposed of through landfill could be recycled in future, but it is not true to say that there is incentive to incinerate waste, and that there is, therefore, no incentive to recycle.

Difa Plâu Pest Control

Q4 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on pest control in Wales? OAQ788(EPC)

C4 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddifa plâu yng Nghymru? OAQ788(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Extensive advice on the appropriate methods of control is available from local authority environmental health departments and the Assembly Government's wildlife management unit.

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyngor helaeth am y dulliau rheoli priodol ar gael gan adrannau iechyd yr amgylchedd mewn awdurdodau lleol ac yn uned Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar reoli bywyd gwyllt.

Laura Anne Jones: Welsh farmers are having real difficulties protecting their lambs. More and more lambs have been taken by foxes since the introduction of the ban on hunting with dogs. I have been contacted by many farmers in south-east Wales from whom many lambs have been taken by foxes since the ban. How are you looking to address this problem and that of the increase in fox numbers?

Laura Anne Jones: Mae ffermwyr yng Nghymru yn wynebu anawsterau mawr i ddiogelu eu hŵyn. Mae mwy a mwy o ŵyn yn cael eu colli oherwydd llwynogod ers cyflwyno'r gwaharddiad ar hela â chŵn. Yr wyf wedi siarad â nifer o ffermwyr yn y de-ddwyrain sydd wedi colli llawer o'u hŵyn oherwydd llwynogod ers y gwaharddiad. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon a phroblem y cynnydd yn nifer y llwynogod?

Carwyn Jones: I have not seen any scientific study that states that more lambs are being taken. I spoke to many farmers before the ban on hunting with dogs came in, and only a small number could tell me that they were losing lambs to foxes. Lots of people had heard of that happening to others, or they thought that they might possibly have lost a lamb to a fox but the hard evidence was not as clear as many farmers imagined. Nevertheless, advice is available, through the leaflets produced by the wildlife management unit, and they are free of charge.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf wedi gweld unrhyw astudiaeth wyddonol sy'n dweud bod mwy o ŵyn yn cael eu colli. Siaradais â nifer o ffermwyr cyn y gwaharddiad ar hela â chŵn, a nifer fach ohonynt yn unig a allai ddweud wrthyf eu bod yn colli ŵyn oherwydd llwynogod. Yr oedd nifer o bobl wedi clywed bod hynny'n digwydd i eraill, neu'n credu efallai y gallent fod wedi colli ŵyn i lwynog, ond nid oedd y dystiolaeth mor bendant ag yr oedd nifer o ffermwyr yn ei ddychmygu. Serch hynny, mae cyngor ar gael, drwy'r taflenni a gynhyrchir gan yr uned rheoli bywyd gwyllt, a'r rheini am ddim.

Newid Hinsawdd Climate Change

Q5 Sandy Mewies: Will the Minister make a statement on initiatives to tackle climate change in the light of the new environment strategy? OAQ770(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The strategy deals with climate change as a key priority and contains actions to identify how we can minimise greenhouse gas emissions. We will develop a climate change adaptation plan for Wales and establish a cross-sector climate change group to inform our work on that.

Sandy Mewies: In view of the questions that you have already answered and the responses that you have made, it seems clear that everyone has to play their own part in promoting ways of reducing the effects of climate change, particularly in terms of recycling. Flintshire County Council continues to do its part to help. It is now expanding its kerb-side green waste recycling scheme to provide an extra 27,000 homes with a brown wheelie bin to collect garden waste for composting. So, will you join me in congratulating Flintshire County Council on this scheme, which is helping to reduce the amount of waste sent to landfill and, therefore, to help meet Wales's target of recycling a minimum of 40 per cent of waste by 2010?

Carwyn Jones: Yes, I am happy to join you in congratulating Flintshire County Council on what it has done. I have always said that the easier it is for people to recycle, the more recycling will take place. That means that the more kerb-side collections can be made available for the different types of waste, the more people will recycle. It is simply easier to put a green bag or a brown box outside the front door than it is to take rubbish to a civic amenities site.

Helen Mary Jones: The environment strategy action plan states that ambitious targets on the reduction of emissions will be set. Will you consider producing year-on-

C5 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau i fynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd yn wyneb y strategaeth amgylcheddol newydd? OAQ770(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r strategaeth yn delio â newid yn yr hinsawdd fel un o'r prif flaenoriaethau, ac mae'n cynnwys camau gweithredu i nodi sut y gallwn sicrhau cyn lleied o allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr â phosibl. Byddwn yn datblygu cynllun addasu ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd i Gymru ac yn sefydlu grŵp ar draws y sectorau ar newid yn yr hinsawdd i lywio'r gwaith a wnawn ar hynny.

Sandy Mewies: Yn sgîl y cwestiynau yr ydych eisoed wedi'u hateb a'r ymatebion a roddwyd gennych, mae'n ymddangos yn amlwg fod yn rhaid i bawb wneud eu rhan yn y broses o hyrwyddo ffyrdd i leihau effeithiau newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn enwedig o ran ailgylchu. Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn parhau i wneud ei ran i helpu. Mae'r cyngor yn awr yn ehangu ei gynllun ailgylchu gwastraff gwyrdd ar ymyl y ffordd drwy ddarparu bin sbwriel brown ar gyfer 27,000 o gartrefi ychwanegol er mwyn casglu gwastraff gardd ar gyfer compostio. Felly, a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir y Fflint am y cynllun hwn, sy'n helpu lleihau'r gwastraff a anfonir i safleoedd tirlenwi ac felly'n helpu cyrraedd targed Cymru o ailgylchu o leiaf 40 y cant o wastraff erbyn 2010?

Carwyn Jones: Yn sicr, yr wyf yn falch ymuno â chi i longyfarch Cyngor Sir y Fflint am yr hyn y mae wedi'i wneud. Yr wyf wedi dweud o'r cychwyn cyntaf po hawsaf yw'r broses ailgylchu, y mwyaf o ailgylchu fydd yn digwydd. Mae hynny'n golygu po fwyaf y gellir ei gasglu o ymyl y ffordd ar gyfer gwahanol fathau o wastraff, mwyaf o wastraff y bydd pobl yn ei ailgylchu. Yn syml, mae'n haws rhoi bag gwyrdd neu flwch brown y tu allan i ddrws y ffyrnt na mynd â sbwriel i safle amwynderau dinesig.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae cynllun gweithredu'r strategaeth amgylcheddol yn dweud y caiff targedau uchelgeisiol eu gosod ar gyfer lleihau allyriadau. A ystyriwch

year targets similar to those in the Climate Change Bill, and will you set out a detailed plan specifically on how the reduction in carbon dioxide will be achieved?

Carwyn Jones: That will have to be considered as part of the climate change adaptation plan, but we want figures that are as measurable as possible. Whether it can be done annually is open to questioning, but it should be done regularly enough for people to understand what is being done in reducing greenhouse gases.

David Melding: Do you agree that it is equally important to manage our response to climate change, because it is now inevitable that we will face, in the next generation, significant increases in the average temperature, a rise in the sea level of something like a metre and more storm events? This will have a big impact on many coastal communities around Wales, for instance. We must accept that this will happen and that we will have to manage it.

Carwyn Jones: That is quite true. Consideration will have to be given in years to come to the defences of coastal settlements. Consideration is being given to the need to deal with flooding, particularly flash flooding, as, once again, south-east England has gone from a situation of having no rain to having a sudden downpour, which has contributed to flash flooding and other difficulties. How we live now will affect the climate and how people live in 50 years' time, and so the next 20 or 30 years will be crucial in ensuring that those who come after us enjoy a healthy and safe environment in a stable climate. We must tackle that in this present day, as politicians.

The Presiding Officer: I call Janet Ryder.

Janet Ryder: My supplementary question is to question 6.

The Presiding Officer: I will try again and call Eleanor Burnham.

gynhyrchu targedau o flwyddyn i flwyddyn tebyg i'r rheini yn y Mesur ar Newid yn yr Hinsawdd, ac a wnewch chi osod allan cynllun manwl yn benodol ar y ffordd y caiff y gostyngiad mewn carbon deuocsid ei gyflawni?

Carwyn Jones: Bydd yn rhaid ystyried hynny fel rhan o'r cynllun addasu ar gyfer y newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond yr ydym am weld ffigurau sydd mor fesuradwy â phosibl. Ni wn a fyddai'n bosibl gwneud hynny bob blwyddyn, ond dylai gael ei wneud yn ddigon rheolaidd i bobl ddeall yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud i leihau nwyon tŷ gwydr.

David Melding: A gytunwch ei bod lawn mor bwysig inni reoli ein hymateb i'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, gan ei bod yn anorfod bellach y byddwn, yn ystod y genhedlaeth nesaf, yn wynebu cynnydd sylweddol yn y tymheredd cyfartalog, codiad o tua metr yn lefel y môr, a mwy o stormydd? Bydd hyn yn cael effaith fawr ar nifer o gymunedau ar hyd arfordir Cymru, er enghraifft. Rhaid inni dderbyn y bydd hyn yn digwydd ac y bydd yn rhaid inni ei reoli.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny'n ddigon gwir. Yn y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried amddiffynfeydd ar gyfer aneddiadau ar yr arfordir. Mae ystyriaeth yn cael ei rhoi i'r angen am ddelio â llifogydd, yn enwedig fflachlifogydd, wrth i ddeddwyrain Lloegr, unwaith eto, fynd o sefyllfa lle na fu dim glaw i gyfnod o law trwm, a hynny wedi cyfrannu at fflachlifogydd ac anawsterau eraill. Bydd y ffordd yr ydym yn byw yn awr yn effeithio ar yr hinsawdd a'r ffordd y bydd pobl yn byw ymhen 50 mlynedd. Felly, mae'r 20 neu 30 mlynedd nesaf yn hollbwysig i sicrhau bod y bobl a ddaw ar ein hôl yn mwynhau amgylchedd iach a diogel mewn hinsawdd sefydlog. Rhaid i ni, fel gwleidyddion, fynd i'r afael â hynny yn awr.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Janet Ryder.

Janet Ryder: Mae fy nghwestiwn atodol yn ymwneud â chwestiwn 6.

Y Llywydd: Rhoddaf gynnig arall a galwaf ar Eleanor Burnham.

Eleanor Burnham: I gwestiwn 6?

Eleanor Burnham: To question 6?

Janet Ryder: Llywydd, Brynle has not yet asked question 6.

Janet Ryder: Lywydd, nid yw Brynle wedi gofyn cwestiwn 6 eto.

The Presiding Officer: I did look towards Brynle, but he did not seem to be getting up.

Y Llywydd: Edrychais ar Brynle, ond nid oedd yn ymddangos fel pe bai'n mynd i godi.

Eleanor Burnham: I am quite happy to continue, Llywydd.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i barhau, Lywydd.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I call Brynle Williams.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Galwaf ar Brynle Williams.

Y Cynllun Stoc Trig The Fallen Stock Scheme

Q6 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the fallen stock scheme in north Wales? OAQ781(EPC)

C6 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynllun stoc trig yn y Gogledd? OAQ781(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: A press release issued on 2 June 2006 provides all the current information on the fallen stock scheme in the north. I know that officials continue to work closely with the local authority, the State Veterinary Service and the National Fallen Stock Scheme Company Ltd to resolve the situation.

Carwyn Jones: Mae datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd ar 2 Mehefin 2006 yn rhoi'r holl wybodaeth gyfredol am y cynllun stoc trig yn y gogledd. Gwn fod swyddogion yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos gyda'r awdurdod lleol, y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol a'r Cwmni Cynllun Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol Cyf i ddatrys y sefyllfa.

Brynle Williams: Do you recognise that the recent interruption in fallen stock collections in north Wales demonstrates the inherent vulnerability of the service with just one company serving the whole region? How will we ensure the continuity of service in north Wales?

Brynle Williams: A ydych yn cydnabod bod y tarfu'n ddiweddar ar gasgliadau stoc trig yn y gogledd yn dangos gwendid cynhenid y gwasanaeth, gydag un cwmni'n unig i wasanaethu'r rhanbarth cyfan? Sut y byddwn yn sicrhau parhad y gwasanaeth yn y gogledd?

Carwyn Jones: I am encouraged by the fact that other companies came forward to offer their services under the national fallen stock scheme, which provides the 50 per cent discount for farmers. I trust that, in years to come, there will be healthy competition for the contract when it comes up for bidding.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n galonogol gweld bod cwmnïau eraill wedi cynnig eu gwasanaethau o dan y cynllun stoc trig cenedlaethol, sy'n rhoi'r gostyngiad o 50 y cant i ffermwyr. Yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, hyderaf y gwelir cystadlu brwd am y contract pan wahoddir ceisiadau amdano.

Janet Ryder: Further to that, how will you start to develop that provision so that north Wales will not have to rely on just one provider? What grants will you make available, and how will you ensure that new service providers come forward so that farmers are not reliant on one provider, and that they get a good service provider to get rid of that fallen stock quickly?

Janet Ryder: At hynny, sut yr ewch ati i ddechrau datblygu'r ddarpariaeth honno fel na fydd angen i'r gogledd ddibynnu ar un darparwr yn unig? Pa grantiau fydd ar gael, a sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod darparwyr gwasanaeth newydd yn dod ymlaen fel na fydd ffermwyr yn dibynnu ar un darparwr, ac y cânt ddarparwr gwasanaeth da i gael gwared ar y stoc trig hwnnw'n gyflym?

3.00 p.m.

Carwyn Jones: It has happened. Historically, it has been the case that one company has bid, and that company has, therefore, got the contract. However, several companies expressed an interest in the scheme following the recent difficulties, and I hope that many of those companies will then take an interest in bidding for the national fallen stock scheme contract in the future.

Eleanor Burnham: This has been appalling, and I think that north Wales farmers are extremely concerned that it will be even worse because of the company that has apparently fallen by the wayside in Marchwiel. Would it not be easier if farmers were allowed to bury their animals, as has always happened in the past?

Carwyn Jones: No.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny wedi digwydd. Yn hanesyddol, mae un cwmni wedi gwneud cais, ac o ganlyniad dyfarnwyd y contract i'r cwmni hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o gwmnïau wedi mynegi diddordeb yn y cynllun yn dilyn yr anawsterau diweddar, a gobeithio y bydd nifer o'r cwmnïau hynny wedyn yn dangos diddordeb mewn cynnig am gcontract y cynllun stoc trig cenedlaethol yn y dyfodol.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae hon wedi bod yn sefyllfa echrydus, a chredaf fod ffermwyr y Gogledd yn pryderu'n fawr iawn y bydd hyd yn oed yn waeth oherwydd y cwmni sydd i'w weld wedi methu ym Marchwiel. Oni fyddai'n haws pe caniateid i ffermwyr gladdu eu hanifeiliaid, fel sydd wedi digwydd erioed yn y gorffennol?

Carwyn Jones: Na fyddai.

Iechyd Da Byw Livestock Health

Q8 Gwenda Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on livestock health? OAQ756(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The second annual Wales animal health and welfare strategy action plan was published in April 2006; it sets out specific targets that will build on the existing high level of animal health and welfare in Wales.

Gwenda Thomas: Do you agree that farmers can increase the biosecurity of their cattle herds by using simple and inexpensive measures to reduce the risk of spreading bovine tuberculosis, and should be encouraged to do so?

Carwyn Jones: Yes, and that was the view in the scientific evidence that was presented to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee when the committee looked at this issue. We hope, in the next few weeks, to receive the results of a study that investigates how those biosecurity measures can be taken forward, with a view to informing the final decision on the intensive

C8 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am iechyd da byw yng Nghymru? OAQ756(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Cyhoeddwyd yr ail gynllun gweithredu blynyddol ar strategaeth iechyd a lles anifeiliaid Cymru ym mis Ebrill 2006; mae'n gosod allan dargedau penodol a fydd yn adeiladu ar lefel uchel bresennol iechyd a lles anifeiliaid yng Nghymru.

Gwenda Thomas: A ydych yn cytuno y gall ffermwyr gynyddu bioddiogelwch eu gyrrroedd gwartheg drwy ddefnyddio mesurau syml a rhad i leihau'r risg i dwbercwlosis buchol ledaenu, ac y dylid eu hannog i wneud hynny?

Carwyn Jones: Ydwyf, a dyna oedd y farn a fynegwyd yn y dystiolaeth wyddonol a gyflwynwyd i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad pan ystyriodd y pwyllgor y mater hwn. Yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf, gobeithiwn gael canlyniadau astudiaeth sy'n ymchwilio i'r ffordd y gellir datblygu'r mesurau bioddiogelwch hynny, gyda'r bwriad o

treatment area under the Wales TB action plan.

Lisa Francis: What contingency plans does the Minister have in place for occasions when commercial companies are unable to pick up the carcasses of dead animals following the banning of on-farm burial? The recent news is that some farmers have had to endure stinking, rotten carcasses on their yards for more than two weeks following the failure of a commercial company to remove them. That impacts on the health and hygiene not only of farm livestock but also of farm families and their workers. What discussions have you had with local authorities about contingency plans when events such as that occur?

Carwyn Jones: If the livestock are dead, then the issue of livestock health does not arise. I refer you to my response to a previous question; as I said, there were great difficulties with the scheme last year, and those difficulties were ironed out. When a potential difficulty was discovered this year, it was dealt with quickly to minimise disruption to farms and farmers.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Hoffwn eich cyfeirio yn ôl at achosion o TB. Bu ichi ddweud yn wreiddiol fod angen ichi gasglu 400 o foch daear marw er mwyn paratoi adroddiad ar y mater hwn. Yn ddiweddar, yr ydych wedi dweud eich bod wedi casglu—nid yn bersonol, wrth reswm; yr oedd eich adran wedi sicrhau'r casglu—dros 400 o foch daear marw. Pryd felly y gallwn ddisgwyl yr adroddiad dros dro, ac yr adroddiad ei hun? Mae nifer o ffermwyr yn credu eich bod wedi eu camarwain drwy ddweud fod angen casglu'r anifeiliaid hyn yn gyntaf ac yna dweud eich bod wedi eu casglu, ond heb roi amserlen ar gyfer cyhoeddi'r adroddiad.

Carwyn Jones: Mae 559 o foch daear wedi cael eu casglu. Y nod yw sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu profi dros yr haf. Felly, gobeithiwn fydd gennym y canlyniadau mewn ychydig o fisoedd, yn yr hydref.

lywio'r penderfyniad terfynol ar yr ardal driniaeth ddwys o dan gynllun gweithredu TB Cymru.

Lisa Francis: Pa gynlluniau wrth gefn sydd ar waith gan y Gweinidog ar gyfer adegau pan na fydd cwmnïau masnachol yn gallu casglu cyrff anifeiliaid marw ar ôl gwahardd claddu ar y fferm? Clywsom yn ddiweddar fod rhai ffermwyr wedi gorfod dioddef cael cyrff pwdr, drewllyd ar eu buarthau am fwy na phythefnos ar ôl i gwmni masnachol fetu eu cludo ymaith. Mae hynny nid yn unig yn effeithio ar iechyd a hylendid da byw ar y fferm, ond hefyd ar iechyd a hylendid teuluoedd fferm a'u gweithwyr. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gydag awdurdodau lleol ynghylch cynlluniau wrth gefn pan fydd digwyddiadau felly?

Carwyn Jones: Os yw'r da byw wedi marw, yna nid oes problem o ran iechyd da byw. Fe'ch cyfeirïaf at fy ymateb i gwestiwn blaenorol; fel y dywedais, cafwyd anawsterau mawr gyda'r cynllun y llynedd, a datryswyd yr anawsterau hynny. Pan ddarganfuwyd anhawster posibl eleni, deliwyd ag ef yn gyflym er mwyn amharu cyn lleied â phosibl ar ffermydd a ffermwyr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I should like to refer you back to cases of TB. You said originally that you needed to collect 400 dead badgers in order to prepare a report on this matter. You have said recently that you have collected—not personally, obviously; your department had ensured the collection—of over 400 dead badgers. When, therefore, can we expect the interim report, and the report itself? Many farmers believe that you have misled them by saying that these animals need to be collected first and then saying that you have collected them, but without giving a timetable for the report.

Carwyn Jones: A total of 559 badgers have been collected. The aim is to ensure that those are tested during the summer. Hopefully, therefore, we will have the results in a few months' time, in the autumn.

Polisi Diogelu Agregau Aggregate Safeguarding Policy

Q9 Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's aggregate safeguarding policy? OAQ748(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I am pleased to say that unitary development plans that have recently been adopted or are close to adoption include proposals to safeguard sand and gravel resources fully in accord with national planning policy.

Nick Bourne: The Minister will be aware—indeed, I think that we have discussed this previously—of the decision of independent inspectors to overturn recommendations on quarrying in the Brecon Beacons National Park in relation to the unitary development plan. I think that the Minister then indicated that independent inspectors act independently, which is quite true. I invite him to look at the policy, because it is flawed. I think that he suggested that it prevents building on the land, but much of the land is totally unsuitable for house building anyway, and there are other ways of protecting it. In light of that, will you revisit this aggregate policy, which is causing great concern in parts of the area that I represent?

Carwyn Jones: Other local authorities have taken the policy into consideration, but I cannot comment on any particular UDP, because I have a role in determining whether the UDP can be approved or not.

C9 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar ddiogelu agregau? OAQ748(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn falch dweud bod cynlluniau datblygu unedol a fabwysiadwyd yn ddiweddar, neu sydd ar fin eu mabwysiadu, yn cynnwys cynigion i ddiogelu adnoddau tywod a graean yn gwbl unol â pholisi cynllunio cenedlaethol.

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol—yn wir, credaf inni drafod hyn yn y gorffennol—o benderfyniad arolygwyr annibynnol i wrthod argymhellion ar chwarelu ym Mharc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog mewn perthynas â'r cynllun datblygu unedol. Credaf fod y Gweinidog bryd hynny wedi dweud bod arolygwyr annibynnol yn gweithredu'n annibynnol, sy'n hollol wir. Yr wyf yn ei wahodd i edrych ar y polisi, gan ei fod yn wallus. Credaf iddo awgrymu ei fod yn atal pobl rhag adeiladu ar y tir, ond mae rhan helaeth o'r tir yn hollol anaddas ar gyfer adeiladu tai beth bynnag, ac mae ffyrdd eraill i'w ddiogelu. O gofio hynny, a ailystyriwch y polisi agregau hwn, sy'n achosi pryder mawr mewn rhannau o'r ardal a gynrychiolaf fi?

Carwyn Jones: Mae awdurdodau lleol eraill wedi ystyried y polisi, ond ni allaf roi sylwadau ar unrhyw CDU penodol, gan fy mod yn rhan o'r broses o benderfynu a ellir cymeradwyo'r CDU neu beidio.

Effaith Deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd Impact of European Legislation

Q10 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of European legislation on the habitats and landscapes of Wales? OAQ768(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: In response to European legislation, and as part of our commitment to the natural environment, we have designated 19 special protection areas for the conservation of birds, and 90 special areas of conservation for the protection of rare or threatened habitats and species in Wales.

C10 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith deddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd ar gynefinoedd a thirweddi Cymru? OAQ768(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mewn ymateb i ddeddfwriaeth Ewropeaidd, ac fel rhan o'n hymrwymiad i'r amgylchedd naturiol, yr ydym wedi dynodi 19 o ardaloedd diogelwch arbennig i warchod adar, a 90 o ardaloedd cadwraeth arbennig i warchod cynefinoedd a rhywogaethau sy'n brin neu dan fygythiad yng Nghymru.

Mark Isherwood: I understand that a judgment by the European Court of Justice last October found that the United Kingdom has failed to fulfil its obligations under the habitats directive, and then, in a separate measure, the UK has signed up to the European convention on landscapes. What will be the implications for Wales of these two measures, and how will this impact on economic development and renewable energy under technical advice note 8?

Carwyn Jones: I do not anticipate there being any effect on what we have put in place in Wales. We have a proud record in terms of protecting our environment in recent years, and I do not anticipate that difficulties will arise as a result of a legal judgment.

Mark Isherwood: Deallaf bod dyfarniad gan Lys Cyfiawnder Ewrop fis Hydref diwethaf wedi cael bod y Deyrnas Unedig wedi methu â chyflawni ei rhwymedigaethau o dan y gyfarwyddeb cynefinoedd, ac yna, mewn mesur ar wahân, mae'r DU wedi ymrwymo i'r confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar dirwedd. Beth fydd goblygiadau'r ddau fesur hyn i Gymru, a sut y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar ddatblygu economaidd ac ynni adnewyddadwy o dan nodyn cyngor technegol 8?

Carwyn Jones: Ni ragwelaf unrhyw effaith ar yr hyn sydd ar waith gennym yng Nghymru. Mae gennym record dda o ran diogelu ein hamgylchedd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac ni ragwelaf y bydd anawsterau'n codi o ganlyniad i ddyfarniad cyfreithiol.

Y Strategaeth Amgylcheddol The Environment Strategy

Q11 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister make a statement on the environment strategy for Wales? OAQ782(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The strategy was published on 17 May. It sets out the Government's long-term strategy for the environment for the next 20 years.

Karen Sinclair: The recently published environment strategy for Wales makes clear the importance of setting high environmental standards in our local communities, as standards are often worse in the most deprived areas of Wales. Will you outline the important role that this environmental strategy will have in ensuring that everyone plays their part, including local businesses, in ensuring that we set quality local environmental standards for our communities, and that serious penalties will be imposed if high environmental benchmarks are not met, which will put people off from breaking laws?

Carwyn Jones: The environment strategy is designed to deal with what we can do, what local authorities can do, and what the Assembly Government's agencies can do. It was clear in the consultation on the strategy that the urban environment was seen as of

C11 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y strategaeth amgylcheddol ar gyfer Cymru? OAQ782(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Cyhoeddwyd y strategaeth ar 17 Mai. Mae'n gosod allan strategaeth hirdymor y Llywodraeth ar gyfer yr amgylchedd am yr 20 mlynedd nesaf.

Kate Sinclair: Mae'r strategaeth amgylcheddol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer Cymru yn egluro pwysigrwydd pennu safonau amgylcheddol uchel yn ein cymunedau lleol, gan fod safonau'n aml yn waeth yn ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru. A amlinellwch rôl bwysig y strategaeth amgylcheddol hon wrth sicrhau bod pawb yn gwneud eu rhan, gan gynnwys busnesau lleol, i sicrhau ein bod yn gosod safonau amgylcheddol lleol o safon ar gyfer ein cymunedau, ac y caiff cosbau difrifol eu gosod oni fodlonir meincnodau amgylcheddol uchel, a fydd yn darbwyllo pobl i beidio â thorri'r gyfraith.

Carwyn Jones: Nod y strategaeth amgylcheddol yw ymdrin â'r hyn y gallwn ni ei wneud, beth y gall awdurdodau lleol ei wneud, a beth y gall asiantaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud. Yr oedd yn amlwg o'r ymgyngori am y strategaeth

exceptional importance. Many people were saying, 'A good environment to us means no graffiti, no chewing gum, and no rubbish on the streets'. That is of at least equal importance to the countryside—we must look at the environment in its broadest possible terms. Initially, we will try to ensure that we can encourage people, which may well include private businesses. However, if there comes a time when the strategy is not working, then we may well need to consider using the stick as well as the carrot, if I can put it that way.

fod yr amgylchedd trefol yn eithriadol o bwysig. Yr oedd nifer o bobl yn dweud, 'Mae amgylchedd da i ni yn golygu dim graffiti, dim gwm cnoi, a dim sbwriel ar y strydoedd'. Mae hynny o leiaf mor bwysig i gefn gwlad—rhaid inni edrych ar yr amgylchedd yn ei ystyr ehangaf posibl. I ddechrau, byddwn yn ceisio sicrhau y gallwn annog pobl, a all yn hawdd gynnwys busnesau preifat. Fodd bynnag, os daw adeg pan na fydd y strategaeth yn gweithio, yna mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd angen inni ystyried defnyddio'r ffon yn ogystal â'r foronen, os caf ei roi felly.

Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 15 Technical Advice Note 15

Q12 Glyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of local planning authority development plans on 'Technical Advice Note (Wales) 15: Development and Flood Risk'? OAQ774(EPC)

C12 Glyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith cynlluniau datblygu awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ar 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol (Cymru) 15: Datblygu a Pherygl Llifogydd'? OAQ774(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Local planning authorities should use TAN 15 to inform the preparation of their local development plans.

Carwyn Jones: Dylai awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ddefnyddio TAN 15 i lywio'r broses o baratoi eu cynlluniau datblygu lleol.

Glyn Davies: We all know that the impact of TAN 15 has been to take a lot of land that was previously zoned for development out of development plans, and I support that policy. However, land must be identified to take the place of that which has been taken out, and we know that local authorities across Wales are not identifying that land anything like quickly enough. Will you make a statement to encourage them to move quickly to compensate for the land that has been taken out of development plans following the imposition of the new TAN 15?

Glyn Davies: Gwyddom i gyd mai effaith TAN 15 fu cymryd llawer o dir a oedd gynt wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer datblygiadau nad oeddent yn rhan o gynlluniau datblygu, a chefnogaf y polisi hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid nodi tir yn lle'r tir hwnnw a dynnwyd allan, a gwyddom nad yw awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru yn nodi'r tir hwnnw yn ddigon cyflym o bell ffordd. A wnewch ddatganiad i'w hannog i symud yn gyflym i wneud iawn am y tir a dynnwyd allan o gynlluniau datblygu yn dilyn cyflwyno'r TAN 15 newydd?

Carwyn Jones: Local planning authorities are obliged to keep a supply of land for five years when it comes to development, to identify areas that can be developed. If local planning authorities do not do that, they run the risk of a legal challenge from agreed applicants.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n ofynnol i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol gadw cyflenwad o dir am bum mlynedd pan ddaw'n fater o ddatblygu, er mwyn nodi ardaloedd y gellir eu datblygu. Os na wnaiff awdurdodau cynllunio lleol hynny, mae perygl y byddant yn wynebu her gyfreithiol gan ymgeiswyr sydd wedi eu cytuno.

Cynllun Tir Mynydd Tir Mynydd Scheme

C13 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y **Q13 Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will the Minister

Gweinidog ddatganiad am newidiadau i gynllun Tir Mynydd? OAQ791(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Ar 24 Mai, datgenais bod yn rhaid i gyllideb y cynllun ostwng i £24 miliwn yn 2007, a £22 miliwn yn 2008.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae'r amaethwyr yn pryderu eich bod wedi troi eich cefn ar y diwydiant. Dywedant eich bod wedi gwneud hynny oherwydd nad yw cefnogaeth i ffermwyr yn chwarae'n dda ar feinciau cefn Llafur, a'ch bod yn llygadu swydd y Prif Weinidog wedi'r etholiad yn 2007. A wnech ymateb i hynny?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw hwn yn gwestiwn perthnasol i bortffolio'r Gweinidog, ac mae llawer o elfennau dychmygus iddo.

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf ychwanegu at yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud eisoes yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgor. Ni dderbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Ieuan amdanaf, ond derbyniaf ei fod yn cyfaddef na fydd Plaid Cymru yn ennill yr etholiad.

3.10 p.m.

Datblygu Cynaliadwy Sustainable Development

Q14 Jenny Randerson: What progress has been made in meeting the Welsh Assembly Government's targets in regard to sustainable development? OAQ758(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Of the commitments in the plan, 51 per cent are on track to be completed, and 37 per cent by next May. Around 12 per cent have encountered some delays, but we are hopeful that these will be completed soon.

Jenny Randerson: In relation to sustainable energy, Minister, recent research has revealed that you are due to miss your target of having 10 per cent of energy production from sustainable, green sources by 2010. Are you aware, Minister, that Scotland's target for 2010 is not a modest 10 per cent, but 18 per cent, and that it is now on course to achieve that by 2007? Will you look at renewable energy again in order to ensure that we have a full and proper range of sources of

make a statement on changes to the Tir Mynydd scheme? OAQ791(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: On 24 May, I announced that the budget would have to be reduced to £24 million in 2008, and £22 million in 2008.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Farmers are concerned that you have turned your back on the industry. They say you have done so because support for farmers does not go down well on the Labour backbenches, and that you are eyeing the First Minister's job following the election in 2007. Will you respond to that?

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is not a pertinent question to the Minister's portfolio, and there are many imaginative aspects to it.

Carwyn Jones: I cannot add to what I have already said in the Chamber, and in committee. I do not accept what Ieuan has said about me, but I accept he is admitting that Plaid Cymru will not win the election.

C14 Jenny Randerson: Pa gynnydd a wnaed i fodloni targedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy? OAQ758(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: O'r holl ymrwymadau'r cynllun, mae 51 y cant ar y trywydd cywir i gael eu cwblhau, a 37 ohonynt erbyn mis Mai nesaf. Bu rhywfaint o oedi mewn perthynas â rhyw 12 y cant, ond yr ydym yn obeithiol y cânt eu cwblhau'n fuan.

Jenny Randerson: O ran ynni cynaliadwy, Weinidog, dangosodd ymchwil yn ddiweddar fod disgwyl ichi fethu eich targed o sicrhau y bydd 10 y cant o ynni'n cael gynhyrchu drwy ddefnyddio ffynonellau gwyrdd a chynaliadwy erbyn 2010. A ydych yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, nad 10 y cant yw targed yr Alban ar gyfer 2010, ond 18 y cant, a'i bod bellach ar y trywydd cywir i gyflawni hynny erbyn 2007? A ailedrychwch ar ynni adnewyddadwy i sicrhau ein bod yn

renewable energy utilised in this country, and will you in particular look at issues such as energy crops and biomass?

Carwyn Jones: Energy crops and biomass can play a strong role in energy production and are mentioned in TAN 8, if I remember rightly. TAN 8 is a young piece of planning policy and it needs to have a chance to work before further revision can take place.

defnyddio amrywiaeth lawn a phriodol o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy yn y wlad hon, ac a edrychwch yn benodol ar faterion megis cynydau ynni a biomas?

Carwyn Jones: Gall cynydau ynni a biomas fod yn rhan gref o gynhyrchu ynni, a sonnir amdanynt yn TAN 8, os cofiaf. Darn newydd o bolisi cynllunio yw TAN 8, ac mae angen rhoi cyfle iddo weithio cyn y gellir gwneud gwaith diwygio pellach.

Cefnogi'r Diwydiant Amaethyddol Supporting the Agriculture Industry

C15 Alun Ffred Jones: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i gefnogi'r diwydiant amaethyddol mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol? OAQ790(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Drwy Tir Mynydd, Tir Gofal ac hefyd drwy ffyrdd eraill o helpu ffermwyr, er enghraifft, Cyswllt Ffermio.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cyfeiriaf at Tir Mynydd a'r cwestiwn a ofynnodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yn gynharach. Yn 2001, gwnaethoch ddatganiad ar gynllun Tir Mynydd, gan ddweud ei fod

'yn cyfrannu at gynnal y gymdeithas mewn cymunedau gwledig mynyddig, a hefyd yn helpu i ddiogelu amgylchedd y tir mynyddig drwy sicrhau bod tir mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol yn cael ei reoli mewn ffordd gynladwy'.

Beth sydd wedi newid ers 2001 fel eich bod yn dileu'r taliadau yma nawr?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r ffigurau'n amlwg yn dangos bod ffermwyr yn yr ucheldir yn gwneud mwy o elw—nid wyf yn dweud eu bod yn gwneud elw mawr—na'r rheiny sydd yn yr iseldir. O achos hynny, nid yw'n gall i gael cynllun sy'n rhoi mwy arian i'r rheiny sy'n gwneud mwy o elw. Nid yw'n elw mawr, ond dyna'r hyn y mae'r ffigurau'n dangos. Mae gwendid mawr yn y fan honno ac mae'n rhaid edrych ar hynny. Hefyd, os nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau am roi blaenoriaeth i Tir Mynydd, mae hynny'n fater iddyn nhw.

Q15 Alun Ffred Jones: What plans does the Minister have to support the agriculture industry in less favoured areas? OAQ790(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Through Tir Mynydd, Tir Gofal and also through other means of assisting farmers, for example, Farming Connect.

Alun Ffred Jones: I refer to Tir Mynydd and the question which Ieuan Wyn Jones asked earlier. In 2001, you made a statement on the Tir Mynydd scheme, saying that

'it contributes to sustaining the community in rural mountainous areas, and also assists in protecting the environment of the mountainous areas by ensuring that land in less favoured areas is controlled in a sustainable way'.

What has changed since 2001 to make you abolish these payments now?

Carwyn Jones: Figures show that upland farmers are making more profit—I am not saying that they are making a huge profit—than those on the lowlands. As a result, it is not wise to have a scheme that gives more money to those who are making more profit. It is not a big profit, but that is what the figures show. There is a big weakness there and we must look at that. And if the opposition parties do not wish to give priority to Tir Mynydd, that is a matter for them.

**Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder
Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar Gamddefnyddio Sylweddau
The Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Social Justice and
Regeneration Committee's Review on Substance Misuse**

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I welcome this report and the opportunity to discuss in Plenary the very important subject of what we are doing to tackle substance misuse in Wales. Turning to the report itself, I would like to put on record my appreciation of the hard work put in by present and past members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in collecting the evidence and presenting the findings. I also take this opportunity to formally thank Roger Chaffey, the former clerk to the committee, who retired last week, for all his hard work in this regard. I am delighted to be able to accept virtually all of the recommendations contained in the report. I believe that this clearly demonstrates that my views on what needs to be done to deliver our substance misuse strategy in Wales chime not only with the views of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, but, even more importantly, with those of our partners and stakeholders who presented evidence during the review. Gaining consensus on the issues is a crucial ingredient in tackling any agenda, but for one as complex as substance misuse, it is vital to success.

In accepting the recommendations, I am pleased to have been able to indicate that work on implementing many of them is well under way, and in some cases complete. This is partly a reflection of the fact that the production of this report, as acknowledged by the Chair of the committee in the debate in April, was rather delayed due to the urgent work that the committee needed to undertake on police restructuring. As a result of the delay, some of the evidence used in compiling the report is almost two years out of date and could not, therefore, reflect recent developments. It is also a reflection of the pace at which we are trying to implement the substance misuse strategy and the priority that I have attached to this part of my

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn a'r cyfle i drafod pwnc pwysig iawn mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, sef yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru. I droi at yr adroddiad ei hun, hoffwn gofnodi fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'r gwaith caled a wnaed gan gyn-aelodau ac aelodau presennol y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wrth gasglu'r dystiolaeth a chyflwyno'r darganfyddiadau. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn hefyd i ddiolch yn ffurfiol i Roger Chaffey, cyn glerc y pwyllgor a ymddeolodd yr wythnos diwethaf, am ei holl waith caled yn hyn. Mae'n bleser gennyf allu derbyn bron pob un o'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad. Credaf fod hyn yn arwydd clir fod fy safbwyntiau ar yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud i weithredu ein strategaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru nid yn unig yn cyd-fynd â safbwyntiau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ond yn bwysicach fyth â safbwyntiau ein partneriaid a'n rhanddeiliaid a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth yn ystod yr adolygiad. Mae sicrhau consensws ar y materion yn holl bwysig wrth fynd i'r afael ag unrhyw agenda, ond i agenda mor gymhleth â chamddefnyddio sylweddau, mae'n hanfodol i'w llwyddiant.

Wrth dderbyn yr argymhellion, yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi gallu dangos bod y gwaith o weithredu nifer ohonynt eisoes yn mynd rhagddo, ac mewn rhai achosion mae wedi'i gwblhau. Mae hyn yn rhannol yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod oedi wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn, fel y cydnabu Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn y ddatl ym mis Ebrill, oherwydd y gwaith brys y bu'n rhaid i'r pwyllgor ei wneud mewn perthynas ag ailstrwythuro'r heddlu. O ganlyniad i'r oedi, mae darnau o'r dystiolaeth a ddefnyddiwyd wrth lunio'r adroddiad bron yn ddwy flywydd oed, ac felly ni allai adlewyrchu datblygiadau diweddar. Mae hefyd yn adlewyrchu cyflymder ein hymdrech i weithredu'r strategaeth ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau a'r

portfolio. I think that it might be helpful to set the recommendations and my response to them in context if I outline very briefly the five key priorities that I set for implementing the strategy when I took over this agenda and where we are with each one of them.

The crucial foundation was putting in place effective local delivery structures for the national strategy. Bringing community safety partnerships into the picture has meant that we have local action plans in place in all 22 areas in Wales, which, in turn, means that local priorities and needs are being addressed for the first time. Addressing the significant underfunding for substance misuse services was obviously vital. By 2007-08, I will have increased the annual budget for the substance misuse action fund by over 600 per cent. I have also ensured that partners are given minimum indicative budgets that look three years ahead, to enable long-term planning and retention of staff. Last year I also set up a capital development fund to begin to address the lack of investment in premises and so on over the years.

The development of comprehensive policy guidance has also been fundamental, including a Welsh version of 'Models of Care'. Work on developing the various models of the Welsh substance misuse treatment framework is well under way. Over time, this will help to ensure equality of access and quality of treatment services across Wales, so that it is not a postcode lottery. We are ensuring that this guidance is embedded in local cultures by a comprehensive implementation and training programme for key models, such as the model on commissioning services.

Clearly, we could not increase services without supporting and developing a skilled workforce. A training-needs analysis of the workforce has been completed and we are now implementing a programme to address

flaenoriaeth a roddais i'r rhan hon o'm portffolio. Er mwyn gosod yr argymhellion a'm hymateb iddynt yn eu cyd-destun, credaf y gallai fod yn ddefnyddiol imi amlinellu'n gryno iawn y pum blaenoriaeth allweddol a osodais ar gyfer gweithredu'r strategaeth pan ddeuthum yn gyfrifol am yr agenda hon, a pha mor bell yr ydym wedi cyrraedd gyda phob un ohonynt.

Y sylfaen hollbwysig oedd rhoi ar waith strwythurau darparu lleol effeithiol ar gyfer y strategaeth genedlaethol. Mae cynnwys partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol wedi golygu bod gennym gynlluniau gweithredu lleol ar waith ym mhob un o'r 22 o ardaloedd yng Nghymru. Mae hynny, yn ei dro, yn golygu yr eir i'r afael â blaenoriaethau ac anghenion lleol am y tro cyntaf. Yr oedd yn mynd i'r afael â'r tangyllido sylweddol mewn gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau yn amlwg yn hanfodol. Erbyn 2007-08, byddaf wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb flynyddol ar gyfer y gronfa weithredu ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau dros 600 y cant. Yr wyf hefyd wedi sicrhau bod partneriaid yn cael lleiafswm cyllidebau dangosol a fydd yn ymestyn dros dair blynedd, er mwyn gallu cynllunio ar gyfer yr hirdymor a chadw staff. Y llynedd sefydlais gronfa datblygu cyfalaf hefyd i ddechrau mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg buddsoddi mewn adeiladau, ac ati, dros y blynyddoedd.

Mae datblygu canllawiau polisi cynhwysfawr wedi bod yn hanfodol hefyd, gan gynnwys fersiwn Cymru o 'Models of Care'. Mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu gwahanol fodelau'r fframweithiau trin camddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru yn mynd rhagddo'n dda. Gydag amser, bydd hyn yn helpu sicrhau bod pawb yn cael yr un gwasanaethau triniaeth o'r un safon ledled Cymru, fel na fydd loteri cod post. Yr ydym yn sicrhau bod y canllawiau hyn yn rhan annatod o ddiwylliannau lleol drwy raglen gynhwysfawr o weithredu a hyfforddi ar gyfer modelau allweddol, megis y model ar gyfer comisiynu gwasanaethau.

Yn amlwg, ni allem gynyddu gwasanaethau heb gefnogi a datblygu gweithlu medrus. Mae dadansoddiad o anghenion hyfforddiant y gweithlu wedi ei gwblhau, ac erbyn hyn yr ydym yn gweithredu rhaglen i fynd i'r afael

those needs as part of the implementation of the drug and alcohol national occupational standards. We are also supporting staff development through action learning sets, conferences and so on.

Finally, setting up mechanisms so that we can monitor and review what is happening on the ground has been a crucial part of our work. This information can now be fed back into both national and local policy development and funding allocation decisions. For the first time, we have detailed information about those in treatment and waiting for treatment, and we will soon be able to measure changes against a set of agreed key performance indicators. I believe that we have achieved much in this agenda by engaging and working closely with our partners and stakeholders. Their commitment has been vital to our key achievements, such as the creation of over 3,500 additional treatment places for substance misusers and reduced waiting times in many areas. The improvements in assessing local needs and the regional commissioning of services can be held up as best-practice examples of how we see 'Making the Connections' making a difference.

However, there is still much more to do. My ultimate aim is for individuals to be able to access the services of their choice as soon as they wish to do so. We have some way to go to achieve this, particularly in relation to children and young people. However, we all know that providing treatment services is only part of the solution in this agenda. We also have a huge challenge in terms of the prevention of harm and educating people not to become dependent on drugs or alcohol in the first place. We must also continue our work to ensure that the families of substance misusers, particularly children, are identified and receive more support. Last, but by no means least, we must continue to take on those who oppose what we are doing by refusing to support the provision of local services. They need to realise how lucky they are that their family has not been blighted by substance misuse rather than stigmatising those who have been.

â'r anghenion hynny fel rhan o weithredu'r safonau galwedigaethol cenedlaethol ar gyfer cyffuriau ac alcohol. Yr ydym hefyd yn cefnogi datblygiad staff, drwy setiau dysgu gweithredol, cynadleddau, ac ati.

Yn olaf, mae sefydlu mecanweithiau fel y gallwn fonitro ac adolygu'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad wedi bod yn rhan hollbwysig o'n gwaith. Gellir yn awr fwydo'r wybodaeth hon i mewn i ddatblygiad polisiau cenedlaethol a lleol a gwneud penderfyniadau cyllido. Am y tro cyntaf, mae gennym wybodaeth fanwl am bobl sy'n cael triniaeth neu sy'n aros i gael triniaeth, a chyn hir byddwn yn gallu mesur newidiadau yn erbyn set o ddangosyddion perfformiad allweddol wedi eu cytuno. Credaf ein bod wedi cyflawni llawer yn yr agenda hon drwy ymgysylltu â'n partneriaid a'n rhanddeiliaid a gweithio'n agos gyda hwy. Mae eu hymrwymiad wedi bod yn hollbwysig i'n cyflawniadau allweddol, megis creu dros 3,500 o leoedd triniaeth ychwanegol i bobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, a lleihau amseroedd aros mewn nifer o ardaloedd. Gellir ystyried y gwelliannau mewn asesu anghenion lleol a chomisiynu gwasanaethau'n rhanbarthol yn enghreifftiau o arfer gorau yn y ffordd y credwn y bydd 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' yn gwneud gwahaniaeth.

Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud o hyd. Fy nod yn y pen daw yw i unigolion allu cael y gwasanaethau a ddymunant cyn gynted ag a ddymunant. Mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn y byddwn yn cyflawni hyn, yn enwedig o ran plant a phobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom i gyd mai rhan yn unig o'r ateb yn yr agenda hon yw darparu gwasanaethau triniaeth. Yrn ydym yn wynebu her fawr hefyd o ran atal niwed a dysgu pobl i beidio â mynd yn ddibynnol ar gyffuriau ac alcohol yn y lle cyntaf. Rhaid inni hefyd barhau ein gwaith i sicrhau bod teuluoedd pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, yn enwedig plant, yn cael eu nodi ac yn cael mwy o gymorth. Yn olaf, ond nid y lleiaf o bell ffordd, rhaid inni barhau i herio'r rheini sy'n gwrthwynebu'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud drwy wrthod cefnogi darparu gwasanaethau lleol. Mae angen iddynt sylweddoli mor ffodus ydynt nad yw eu teulu hwythau wedi dioddef oherwydd camddefnyddio

sylweddau, yn hytrach na stigmatiddio'r rheini sydd wedi dioddef.

We are about to review the current national substance misuse strategy and make preparations for its successor. This report, and the evidence presented during its preparation, will provide crucial information to assist us in that process. I thank the committee again for its support in tackling this agenda.

Yr ydym ar fin adolygu'r strategaeth genedlaethol bresennol ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau a pharatoi ar gyfer yr un nesaf. Bydd yr adroddiad hwn, a'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd yn ystod ei baratoi, yn rhoi gwybodaeth hollbwysig i'n cynorthwyo yn y broses honno. Hoffwn ddiolch i'r pwyllgor unwaith eto am ei gymorth wrth fynd i'r afael â'r agenda hon.

Leanne Wood: I have several points to make. First of all, you partly accept recommendation 1, but you did not respond to the question about supervised consumption rooms. I would be grateful to hear your view on that, particularly on the legal issue that was previously raised by the Home Office. With regard to minimum standards and your response to recommendation 2, can we now expect that everyone in Wales can receive the same level of service, with the same number of options or choices, regardless of where they live? That is not clear from your response. In other words, can we now expect to see the end of the postcode lottery in substance misuse services?

Leanne Wood: Mae gennyf nifer o bwyntiau i'w gwneud. Yn gyntaf oll, yr ydych yn derbyn argymhelliad 1 yn rhannol, ond nid oeddech yn ymateb i'r cwestiwn ynglŷn ag ystafelloedd defnyddio o dan oruchwyliaeth. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am glywed eich barn am hynny, yn enwedig y mater cyfreithiol a godwyd gynt gan y Swyddfa Gartref. O ran safonau gofynnol a'ch ymateb i argymhelliad 2, a allwn ddisgwyl bellach y bydd pawb yng Nghymru yn gallu cael gwasanaeth o'r un safon, gyda'r un nifer o ddewisiadau, waeth ble maent yn byw? Nid yw hynny'n glir yn eich ymateb. Mewn geiriau eraill, a allwn yn awr ddisgwyl gweld diwedd ar y loteri cod post mewn gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau?

In recommendation 5, you are asked to assess the impact of the abolition of section 64 funding. I am aware of organisations, like Youthlink Wales, which was based in Caerphilly, that were providing excellent substance misuse services before they lost their section 64 funding. We need to know how that loss of funding has impacted on services on the ground. I feel that your response to recommendation 5 does not address that. I accept the point that you made that there may not be an imbalance of funding between drug and alcohol services. However, it is a fact that problematic drug users receive more political attention than problematic alcohol users. That was a balance that the committee was keen to see redressed.

Yn argymhelliad 5, gofynnir ichi asesu effaith diddymu cyllid adran 64. Gwn am sefydliadau, fel Cyswllt Ieuencid Cymru, a oedd yng Nghaerffili, a oedd yn darparu gwasanaethau ardderchog ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau cyn iddo golli ei gyllid adran 64. Mae angen inni wybod sut y mae colli'r cyllid hwnnw wedi effeithio ar wasanaethau ar lawr gwlad. Teimlaf nad yw eich ymateb i argymhelliad 5 yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Derbyniaf y pwynt a wnaethoch nad oes diffyg cydbwysedd efallai rhwng gwasanaethau cyffuriau ac alcohol. Fodd bynnag, y gwir amdani yw bod defnyddwyr cyffuriau sydd â phroblemau yn cael mwy o sylw gan wleidyddion na defnyddwyr alcohol sydd â phroblemau. Yr oedd hwnnw'n gydbwysedd yr oedd y pwyllgor yn awyddus i weld ei unioni.

3.20 p.m.

Facilitating joint working is a key issue, particularly with the reorganisation of the

Mae hwyluso gweithio ar y cyd yn fater allweddol, yn enwedig gydag ad-drefnu'r

probation service. When the national offender management system comes in, in full, I understand that the probation headquarters will be located in Bristol, which will make local partnership working on the ground in Wales a lot more challenging than it already is. Minister, you are aware of the problems faced by Taff Ely Drug Support and Drugaid in the Valleys: they have problems with their contracts with the probation service. If we are serious about joint working, you should be able to intervene when UK Government policy directly contravenes what you are trying to do in Wales.

I could make many more points. I am particularly supportive of your statement asking people not to oppose services for substance misusers, particularly as it is a problem that could affect anybody. I know of many people whose lives have been touched by substance and alcohol misuse problems; they are in every community and touch the lives of almost every family. Those points are vitally important, but I will keep any further points that I have for another time.

Edwina Hart: Thank you, Leanne, for your comments, particularly the final ones because I think that it is important, as I indicated when I answered questions last week, that we recognise that these services need to be provided. Everybody's family will be touched in some way by someone who may be homeless or someone who may experience drug or alcohol abuse; as a member of society, you will be affected somewhere along the line. It is important that we provide the necessary facilities so that we can help individuals. There is actually quite a good success rate when you intervene and help individuals; they can get on and lead normal lives.

Obviously there are issues about joint working, which is really the key to this agenda. I think that you understand that we have not necessarily been happy with all the proposals regarding the probation service. I wish very much that I could wave a magic

gwasanaeth prawf. Pan fydd y system genedlaethol ar gyfer rheoli troseddwyd yn gweithredu'n llawn, deallaf mai ym Mryste y bydd prif swyddfa'r gwasanaeth prawf. Bydd hynny'n gwneud gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn lleol ar lawr gwlad yng Nghymru lawer yn fwy o her nag ydyw eisoes. Weinidog, fe wyddoch am y problemau sy'n wynebu Cymorth Cyffuriau Taf Elái a Drugaid yn y Cymoedd: maent yn cael problemau gyda'u contractau gyda'r gwasanaeth prawf. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â gweithio ar y cyd, dylech fod yn gallu ymyrryd pan fydd polisi Llywodraeth y DU yn mynd yn hollol groes i'r hyn yr ydych yn ceisio'i wneud yng Nghymru.

Gallwn wneud llawer mwy o bwyntiau. Yn benodol yr wyf yn cefnogi'ch datganiad i ofyn i bobl beidio â gwrthwynebu gwasanaethau i bobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, yn enwedig gan ei bod yn broblem a allai effeithio ar unrhyw un. Yr wyf yn adnabod nifer y mae problemau camddefnyddio sylweddau ac alcohol wedi effeithio ar eu bywydau; maent i'w cael ym mhob cymuned ac maent yn cyffwrdd â bywydau bron bob teulu. Mae'r pwyntiau hyn yn hollbwysig, ond fe godaf unrhyw bwyntiau eraill sydd gennyf rywbryd arall.

Edwina Hart: Diolch ichi Leanne, am eich sylwadau, yn enwedig y rhai olaf oherwydd credaf ei bod yn bwysig, fel y dywedais wrth ateb cwestiynau yr wythnos diwethaf, inni gydnabod bod angen darparu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Effeithir ar bob teulu mewn rhyw ffordd neu'i gilydd gan rywun a all fod yn ddigartref, neu rywun a all fod yn camddefnyddio cyffuriau neu alcohol; fel aelod o gymdeithas, bydd hyn yn effeithio arnoch chi rywbryd neu'i gilydd mewn bywyd. Mae'n bwysig inni ddarparu'r cyfleusterau angenrheidiol fel y gallwn helpu unigolion. Mae'r gyfradd lwyddo yn eithaf uchel, mewn gwirionedd, pan fyddwch yn ymyrryd ac yn helpu unigolion; maent yn gallu symud ymlaen a byw bywydau normal.

Mae'n amlwg fod problemau ynglŷn â gweithio ar y cyd, sef yr allwedd mewn gwirioneddol i'r agenda hon. Credaf eich bod yn deall nad ydym o reidrwydd wedi bod yn fodlon ar bob un o'r cynigion ar gyfer y gwasanaeth prawf. Byddai'n dda iawn gennyf

wand on some days and say to the Whitehall Government, 'No, hang on a second, this is Wales; can we do it differently?'. I will continue to lobby on these issues because I think that your points were well made.

On the bias of funding towards drugs rather than alcohol, I think that we all have to accept that alcohol dependence is more widespread than the use of illegal drugs. I cannot accept that we have a funding bias one way or another, because it is the community safety partnerships that prioritise how they are going to do it. I firmly believe that a joint approach, such as the one that we have used in Wales, is correct. I agree that the resources from the Home Office for individuals in the criminal justice system are biased to drug issues, as opposed to alcohol. I think that you made a good point about getting the political balance right when we talk about these issues, so that we do not just talk about drug abuse, but about drug and alcohol abuse. I recognise the seriousness of alcohol abuse. The existing balance of treatment services needs to be further reviewed and we need to look at that balance carefully, certainly when we are looking at our future strategies. I would be happy to take on board the point that you made.

There is a big issue about the equality of access to treatment and I think that I have acknowledged that. If you are in a certain part of Wales, you will have a shorter waiting list and a choice of treatment. As a result of the report and developing new strategies, I think that that will be a key area, because we will have to try to ensure that everybody can have the treatment that they want within their areas. That is going to be quite expensive in real terms, but we have had additional resources in the last few years and I hope that we can continue with the expenditure in this area and try to right the wrongs.

You also alluded to issues regarding section 64. It was a review of this funding stream; I did accept, as you know, the recommendation to end central funding for the voluntary

allu bwrw hud ar Whitehall ambell ddiwrnod a dweud, 'Na, arhoswch funud, Cymru yw hon, a gawn ni wneud pethau'n wahanol?'. Byddaf yn parhau i lobio dros y materion hyn gan fy mod yn credu bod eich pwyntiau yn rhai da.

O ran rhoi mwy o gyllid ar gyfer cyffuriau yn hytrach nag alcohol, credaf fod rhaid inni bob un dderbyn bod dibyniaeth ar alcohol yn fwy cyffredin na defnyddio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon. Ni allaf dderbyn bod y naill yn cael mwy na'r llall, gan mai'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol sy'n blaenoriaethu sut y maent yn mynd ati i wneud hynny. Credaf yn gryf fod ar y cyd, fel yr arferemi wneud yng Nghymru, yn gywir. Cytunaf fod yr adnoddau gan y Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer unigolion yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn ffafrio cyffuriau, yn hytrach nag alcohol. Credaf ichi wneud pwynt da ynglŷn â chael y cydbwysedd gwleidyddol yn iawn pa fyddwn yn sôn am y materion hyn, fel na fyddwn yn sôn am gamddefnyddio cyffuriau yn unig, ond am gamddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol. Cydnabyddaf mor ddifrifol yw camddefnyddio alcohol. Mae angen adolygu ymhellach y cydbwysedd presennol rhwng gwasanaethau triniaeth, ac mae angen inni edrych ar y cydbwysedd hwnnw yn ofalus, yn sicr pan fyddwn yn ystyried ein strategaethau yn y dyfodol. Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn y pwynt a wnaethoch.

Mae yna broblem fawr o ran sicrhau bod yr un gwasanaeth ar gael i bawb, a chredaf fy mod wedi cydnabod hynny. Os ydych yn byw mewn rhan benodol o Gymru, bydd rhestr aros fyrrach a dewis o driniaeth. O ganlyniad i'r adroddiad a datblygu strategaethau newydd, credaf y bydd hwnnw'n faes allweddol, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid inni geisio sicrhau bod pawb yn gallu cael y driniaeth a ddymunant yn eu hardaloedd. Bydd hynny'n eithaf drud mewn termau real, ond yr ydym wedi cael adnoddau ychwanegol yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, a gobeithio y gallwn barhau'r gwariant yn y maes hwn a cheisio unioni'r cam.

Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio hefyd at faterion yn ymwneud ag adran 64. Yr oedd yn adolygiad o'r ffrwd ariannu hon; fel y gwyddoch, derbyniais yr argymhelliad i roi terfyn ar

sector through section 64. Primarily, it undermined the statutory responsibilities of the community safety partnerships for commissioning substance misuse services. Continuing this small funding stream also ran contrary to my wish, and that of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, to streamline funding. I appreciate that some organisations have expressed their concerns, but Youthlink has been treated in exactly the same way as other organisations with regard to section 64 funding. It is a matter for the organisation in that it did not take up the offer of a meeting with the CSP, on a regional basis, until quite recently to discuss some issues. However, I can assure you that help was offered at the time that I took the decision to end the funding stream, but I am happy to take up that issue further, Leanne, if you want to raise it with me again in correspondence.

Thank you for your contribution today, and for your contributions in committee discussions. It is important that we try to take a cross-party approach to alcohol and substance misuse, and that there is unity among us politicians as to the importance of that agenda and of ensuring that sufficient cash goes into it. It is important that we, as politicians, realise that we are talking about extremely vulnerable members of society; we must do our best by them.

Mark Isherwood: I welcome the fact that you accept almost all of the report's recommendations. I notice, in your statement, that some of the evidence might not now reflect recent developments, and I will address that in my questions to you. You are absolutely right that we also have a huge challenge in the prevention of harm and educating people not to become dependent on alcohol or drugs in the first place.

Last Friday, I had the great pleasure of presenting certificates at a DAWN celebratory event to service users who have achieved various Duke of Edinburgh awards and vocational awards, as well as to volunteers with the Supporting Others through Volunteer Action organisation and the north Wales community justice

ariannu canolog ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol drwy adran 64. Yn bennaf, yr oedd yn tanseilio cyfrifoldebau statudol y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol dros gomisiynu gwasanaethau camddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr oedd y ffrwd ariannu fach hon hefyd yn groes i ddymuniad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio a'm dymuniad innau, i brif-ffrydio arian. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod rhai sefydliadau wedi mynegi pryderon, ond mae Cyswllt Ieuentid wedi cael ei drin yn yr un ffordd yn union â sefydliadau eraill o ran cyllid adran 64. Mater i'r sefydliad ydyw, gan na dderbyniodd y cynnig i gyfarfod â'r bartneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, yn rhanbarthol, tan yn gymharol ddiweddar i drafod rhai materion. Fodd bynnag, gallaf eich sicrhau bod cymorth wedi ei gynnig pan benderfynais roi terfyn ar y ffrwd ariannu. Ond yr wyf yn barod i ystyried y mater hwnnw ymhellach, Leanne, os hoffech ei godi gyda mi eto mewn gohebiaeth.

Diolch ichi am eich cyfraniad heddiw a'ch cyfraniadau yn nhrefodaethau'r pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig inni geisio ymdrin â chamddefnyddio alcohol a sylweddau mewn ffordd drawsbleidiol, a bod undod ymhlith y gwleidyddion ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd yr agenda honno, a sicrhau gwario digon o arian arno. Mae'n bwysig i ni, fel gwleidyddion, sylweddoli ein bod yn sôn am aelodau eithriadol o ddiameddiffyn mewn cymdeithas; rhaid inni wneud ein gorau glas drostynt.

Mark Isherwood: Croesawaf y ffaith eich bod yn derbyn bron pob un o argymhellion yr adroddiad. Sylwaf, yn eich datganiad, efallai nad yw rhywfaint o'r dystiolaeth bellach yn adlewyrchu datblygiadau diweddar, a byddaf yn ymdrin â hynny yn fy nghwestiynau ichi. Yr ydych yn hollol iawn ein bod yn wynebu her fawr i atal niwed a dysgu pobl i beidio â mynd yn ddibynnol ar alcohol neu gyffuriau yn y lle cyntaf.

Ddydd Gwener diwethaf, cefais y pleser mawr o gyflwyno tystysgrifau mewn digwyddiad i ddathlu DAWN i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau sydd wedi ennill amrywiol wobrau Dug Caeredin a gwobrau galwedigaethol, yn ogystal â gwirfoddolwyr gyda'r sefydliad Cefnogi Eraill drwy Weithredu Gwirfoddol, a phartneriaeth

partnership. For those of you who do not know, the DAWN partnership includes NACRO, CAIS, SOVA, the Duke of Edinburgh's Award scheme and the Prince's Trust, working in partnership with the National Probation Service and health authorities to address the education, training and employment needs of offenders and substance misusers. They raised several questions, feeding back from working groups in four key areas: substance misuse, housing, training and employment. I will try to focus my questions on those.

We spoke about the need to expand drug and alcohol treatment and education programmes. How do you respond to their statement that much focus and funding seems to be aimed at drug-related services, and that there should be as much, if not more, focus on alcohol-related services, as this substance can lead to drug-taking?

Recommendations 7 and 8 of the report talk of the need to address the current bias towards crime reduction outcomes. Again, the conference said that service users tend to access a better standard of service having been through the criminal justice system; having broken the law, they can be fast-tracked. Where is the quality provision and fast-tracking for those who have not offended?

How will you address concerns about the impact of Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales regulations when providers may have to deregister, but then Welsh social services cease to refer service users to them? How will you address the lack of dual diagnostic treatment where mental health issues are associated with substance misuse, particularly in the context of those with post-traumatic stress disorder?

Recommendations 10 and 20 refer to buildings and mobile units. How will you address the concern that funding decisions need to be based on qualitative as well as

cyfiawnder cymunedol y gogledd. I'r rheini ohonoch nad ydych yn gwybod, mae partneriaeth DAWN yn cynnwys NACRO, CAIS, SOVA, ynghyd â chynllun Gwobr Dug Caeredin a Prince's Trust, drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r Gwasanaeth Prawf Cenedlaethol ac awdurdodau iechyd i fynd i'r afael ag anghenion addysg, hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth troseddwyr a phobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau. Codwyd llawer cwestiwn ganddynt, yn deillio o weithgorau mewn pedwar maes allweddol: camddefnyddio sylweddau, tai, hyfforddiant a chyflogaeth. Byddaf yn ceisio canolbwyntio fy nghwestiwn ar y rheini.

Buom yn siarad am yr angen i ehangu rhaglenni trin ac addysgu ar gyfer cyffuriau ac alcohol. Sut mae ymateb i'w gosodiad bod llawer o ganolbwyntio fel pe baent yn anelu at wasanaethau sy'n ymwneud â chyffuriau, ac y dylai fod cymaint, os nad mwy, o ganolbwyntio ar wasanaethau'n ymwneud ag alcohol, gan fod y sylwedd hwn yn gallu arwain at gymryd cyffuriau?

Mae argymhellion 7 a 8 yn yr adroddiad yn sôn am yr angen i fynd i'r afael â'r duedd bresennol tuag at ganlyniadau lleihau troseddu. Unwaith eto, dywedodd y gynhadledd fod defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n tueddu i gael gwasanaeth gwell ar ôl bod drwy'r system cyfiawnder troseddol; ar ôl torri'r gyfraith, cânt eu rhoi ar y llwybr carlam. Ble y mae'r ddarpariaeth o safon a'r llwybr carlam ar gyfer y rheini nad ydynt wedi torri'r gyfraith?

Sut y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â phryderon ynglŷn ag effaith rheoliadau Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru pan fydd darparwyr hwyrach yn gorfod dadgofrestru, ond gwasanaethau cymdeithasol Cymru wedyn yn peidio â chyfeirio defnyddwyr gwasanaethau atynynt? Sut y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg triniaeth ddiagnostig ddeuol lle mae problemau iechyd meddwl yn gysylltiedig â chamddefnyddio sylweddau, yn arbennig yng nghyd-destun pobl sy'n dioddef gan anhwylder straen wedi trawma?

Mae argymhellion 10 ac 20 yn cyfeirio at adeiladau ac unedau symudol. Sut y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryder fod angen i benderfyniadau cyllido fod yn seiliedig ar

quantitative measures, where, in the case of these highly vulnerable and often excluded client groups, it is often impossible to quantify the goals achieved?

fesurau ansawdd yn ogystal â mesurau maint, pan fydd yn aml yn amhosibl mesur y nodau a gyflawnwyd yn achos y grwpiau cleientiaid diamddiffyn iawn hyn sy'n aml wedi eu hallgáu?

Leanne referred to recommendation 5 and the potential impact of section 64 funding. I listened to your response concerning Youthlink with close interest. You stated that the funding was withdrawn according to the recommendation made in an independent review, but the review's author, I am advised, stated that he specifically gave instructions not to review Youthlink Wales. How do you respond to that and its claim that it was not offered advice? The section 64 funding administrator told Youthlink that he had been instructed not to talk to it under any circumstances.

Cyfeiriodd Leanne at argymhelliad 5 ac effaith bosibl cyllid adran 64. Gwrandewais ar eich ymateb Gyswllt Ieuenctid gyda diddordeb mawr. Dywedasoeh fod y cyllid wedi'i atal yn unol â'r argymhelliad a wnaed mewn adolygiad annibynnol. Ond dywedodd awdur yr adolygiad, fe ddeallaf, iddo roi cyfarwyddiadau penodol i beidio ag adolygu Cyswllt Ieuenctid Cymru. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb i hynny a'i honiad na chafodd gyngor? Dywedodd gweinyddwr cyllid adran 64 wrth Cyswllt Ieuenctid ei fod wedi cael cyfarwyddyd i beidio â siarad ag ef o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau.

Recommendation 6 highlights the need to provide evaluation and business support services. How will we improve the situation where, in the past, organisations such as Touchstone 12, which wanted to speak to somebody for that very purpose, was denied that? Recommendations 15 and 16 refer to the need for joined-up working arrangements, and you referred to the Choose Life programme in the HM Prison Liverpool, which I have been privileged to work with, alongside the DICE programme. I visited and spoke to prisoners and offenders there. How do you answer the DAWN partnership's concerns that substance misusers are often fearful of reporting overdoses in case of police intervention; that there is a lack of provision of support for those exiting detoxification. There needs to be more rehabilitation services to carry on the process of rebuilding lives. Substance misusers are reluctant to ask for help from social services, due to the fear of having children taken away from them.

Mae argymhelliad 6 yn tynnu sylw at yr angen am ddarparu gwasanaethau gwerthuso a chymorth i fusnesau. Sut y byddwn yn gwella'r sefyllfa lle mae sefydliadau, megis Touchstone 12, a oedd am siarad â rhywun am yr union beth hwnnw, yn y gorffennol wedi methu â chael hynny? Cyfeiria argymhellion 15 a 16 at yr angen am drefniadau gweithio cydgysylltiedig, a yr oeddech chi'n cyfeirio at y rhaglen Choose Life yng Ngharchar EM Lerpwl. Cefais y fraint o weithio gyda honno ochr yn ochr â rhaglen DICE. Ymwelais â charcharorion a throreddwyr yno a siarad â hwy. Sut yr ydych yn ateb pryderon partneriaeth DAWN fod pobl yn am l yn rhy ofnus i sôn am orddosio rhag ofn y bydd yr heddlu'n ymyrryd; bod prinder cymorth ar gyfer y rheini sy'n gorffen cyfnod dadwenwyno. Mae angen cael mwy o wasanaethau adsefydlu i barhau'r broses o ailadeiladu bywydau. Mae pobl sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau yn anfodlon gofyn am help gan wasanaethau cymdeithasol, am eu bod yn ofni y byddant yn mynd â'u plant oddi wrthynt.

3.30 p.m.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Was there a question there?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A oedd yna gwestiwn?

Mark Isherwood: Yes; I asked whether the Minister would comment on the concerns raised.

Mark Isherwood: Oedd; gofynnais a fyddai'r Gweinidog yn gwneud sylwadau am y pryderon a godwyd.

Edwina Hart: I am pleased that you have been out and about, talking to your constituents about the concerns that they have about the substance misuse policy. There was a lot of detail in the points that you made. I would welcome it if the organisations concerned wrote to me directly, and I would be more than happy to deal with the points that they raise.

I will deal with the report that is before us and the substantial written response that I gave to the committee's report. You focused on several issues that I have to comment on. You made a point about the focus on the criminal justice system. The Assembly Government's resources are certainly not skewed towards individuals in the criminal justice system. Our aim is to provide ready and easy access to treatment services for all. It is true to say, however, that Home Office resources for substance misuse are primarily, but not exclusively, aimed at those in the criminal justice system, but that is because it has an aim to reduce crime and re-offending rates, and that is what it says is its overall function. An overall aim of the Assembly Government is also to reduce crime and create safer communities, and it is therefore right that we support the work that is undertaken by the Home Office in that area. I do not suppose that Members would wish me to turn down £5 million, with which I had to implement a drugs implementation programme in Wales because it was a criminal justice focus issue. I would hope that that would not be the case because, ultimately, more money for treatment, whether there is a criminal justice focus or not, means reduced waiting times for all, which is important.

You made the point about mobile units, and I am keen on some of these because I think that they are a cost-efficient way of working. However, it is up to community safety partnerships and others to consider the issues surrounding their usage, but I strongly support it.

On section 64 funding and the continual

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn falch ichi fod o gwmpas, yn siarad â'ch etholwyr am y pryderon sydd ganddynt ynglân â'r polisi ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr oedd llawer iawn o fanylion yn y pwyntiau a wnaethoch. Byddwn yn falch pe bai'r sefydliadau dan sylw yn ysgrifennu ataf yn uniongyrchol, a byddwn yn fwy na bodlon ymdrin â'r pwyntiau a godir ganddynt.

Byddaf yn ymdrin â'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron a'r ymateb ysgrifenedig sylweddol a roddais i adroddiad y pwyllgor. Yr oeddech yn canolbwyntio ar nifer o faterion y mae'n rhaid imi wneud sylwadau arnynt. Soniech am y sylw a roddir i'r system cyfiawnder troseddol. Nid yw adnoddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicr yn tueddu at unigolion yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol. Ein nod yw ei gwneud yn hawdd i bawb gael gwasanaethau triniaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir dweud bod adnoddau'r Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer maes camddefnyddio sylweddau yn anelu'n bennaf, ond nid yn llwyr, at y rheini sydd yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol. Ond mae hynny oherwydd bod ganddi nod o leihau cyfraddau troseddu ac aildroseddu, a dyna mae'n ei ddweud yw ei swyddogaeth gyffredinol. Un o nodau cyffredinol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yw lleihau troseddu a chreu cymunedau mwy diogel, ac felly mae'n briodol inni gefnogi'r gwaith a wneir gan y Swyddfa Gartref yn y maes hwnnw. Nid wyf yn tybied y byddai Aelodau am imi wrthod £5 miliwn, y gorfu imi ei ddefnyddio i roi rhaglen weithredu ar gyffuriau ar waith yng Nghymru am ei fod yn fater a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar gyfiawnder troseddol. Byddwn yn gobeithio na fydddech am imi wneud hynny, oherwydd yn y pen draw mae mwy o arian ar gyfer triniaeth, boed yn canolbwyntio ar gyfiawnder troseddol neu beidio, yn golygu amseroedd aros byrrach i bawb, sy'n bwysig.

Yr oeddech yn sôn am unedau symudol, ac yr wyf yn awyddus i weld rhai o'r rhain oherwydd yr wyf yn credu eu bod yn ffordd gost-effeithiol o weithio. Fodd bynnag, partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol ac eraill sy'n gyfrifol am ystyried y materion sy'n ymwneud â'u defnyddio, ond yr wyf yn gadarn o blaid hynny.

O ran arian adran 64 a'r ffaith fod mater

raising of the Youthlink issue with me, I am not aware of some of the allegations that you have made today. If you want to write to me, I will investigate them, but, as far as I am aware, all applicants knew about this, they were all advised of what was going on at the time, it was made clear to all of the organisations concerned and, knowing my officials and the staff who work in the division as I do, I know that if they have indicated that anybody could come to them to talk about issues, they would have tried to help in any way that they could. I am always concerned to ensure that organisations have done good work in any field. Even if we change our funding arrangements, we can provide help and support and perhaps find funding elsewhere. As I indicated to Leanne, I would be happy to take that point forward.

I am conscious that I omitted to respond to Leanne about safe injecting facilities and drug consumption rooms. I am aware of the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report that this has emanated from, but my priority for the use of Assembly Government resources continues to be the building of treatment services. I am aware that a few areas of the world provide such facilities, but I understand that some areas, such as Australia, regret their introduction. I will pursue that and try to find out a bit more about it. The legal position of effectively sanctioning individuals to take illegal drugs that have been obtained from illegal sources remains a very real issue, particularly for the staff who would be required to run the facilities. This relates to UK Government legislation and is a matter for the Home Office. I can also imagine, if I were ever to consider these centres, the outrage that we would have, when we cannot even open centres for legitimate purposes in terms of helping people with drug and alcohol problems and running homelessness projects. If the agenda develops at all, I will report back to the Assembly.

Mick Bates: I join you in praising those people who prepared the report, and in particular the work of Roger Chaffey, who retired last week.

Cyswllt Ieuenctid yn cael ei godi gyda mi'n barhaus, ni wn am rai o'r honiadau a wnaethoch heddiw. Os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf, byddaf yn ymchwilio iddynt. Ond am a wn i, yr oedd pob ymgeisydd yn ymwybodol o hyn, cawsant i gyd wybod beth oedd yn digwydd ar y pryd, eglurwyd hyn i'r holl sefydliadau dan sylw, ac o adnabod fy swyddogion a'r staff sy'n gweithio yn yr is-adran fel yr wyf fi, gwn os ydynt wedi dweud y gallai unrhyw un ddod atynt i drafod materion y byddent wedi ceisio helpu mewn unrhyw ffordd a fyddai'n bosibl iddynt. Yr wyf bob amser yn awyddus i sicrhau bod sefydliadau wedi gwneud gwaith da mewn unrhyw faes. Hyd yn oed os newidiwn ein trefniadau ariannu, gallwn roi help a chymorth ac efallai ddod o hyd i arian o fan arall. Fel y dywedais wrth Leanne, byddwn yn falch mynd â'r pwynt hwnnw ymhellach.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol nad ymatebais i Leanne ynglŷn â chyfleusterau chwistrellu diogel ac ystafelloedd defnyddio cyffuriau. Gwn am yr adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree y mae hyn wedi deillio ohono, ond fy mlaenoriaeth ar gyfer defnyddio adnoddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o hyd yw datblygu gwasanaethau triniaeth. Gwn fod ychydig ardaloedd yn y byd sy'n darparu cyfleusterau felly, ond deallaf fod rhai ardaloedd, megis Awstralia, yn difaru eu cyflwyno. Ymchwiliad i hynny a cheisio cael gwybod mwy amdano. Mae'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol o ran caniatáu i unigolion, i bob diben, gymryd cyffuriau anghyfreithlon a gafwyd o ffynonellau anghyfreithlon yn dal yn broblem wirioneddol, yn arbennig i'r staff a fyddai'n angenrheidiol i redeg y cyfleusterau. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â deddfwriaeth Llywodraeth y DU a yn fater i'r Swyddfa Gartref ei ystyried. Gallaf hefyd ddychmygu'r twrw a gaem pe byddwn byth yn ystyried y canolfannau hyn, pan na allwn hyd yn oed agor canolfannau at ddibenion cyfreithlon i helpu pobl sydd â phroblemau cyffuriau ac alcohol a chynnal prosiectau i'r digartref. Os bydd yr agenda'n datblygu o gwbl, byddaf yn cyflwyno adroddiad i'r Cynulliad.

Mick Bates: Ymunaf â chi i ganmol y bobl hynny a baratodd yr adroddiad, ac yn arbennig waith Roger Chaffey a ymddeolodd yr wythnos diwethaf.

In a strategic sense, Minister, you started by saying that you accept almost all the recommendations. Could you tell us which of the recommendations you have not accepted? That would help to give us a bit of guidance.

I will make some brief points. You made comments as if you knew exactly the number of people on waiting lists, for example, and the number of beds required. One of the major issues that I saw in the committee report was the lack of data and the lack of robust data from some people. Could you expand on just how certain you are that your comments are based on data because, as I understand the situation, there is still no firm data, and anecdotal evidence suggests that there are long waiting times for treatment? Could you comment further, since you seem to have the data, on how quickly people are receiving treatment throughout Wales? I am certain that we all applaud your approach to this and your political will to resolve these issues, but it may be that other parts of the machine do not reflect your political will to do so.

Finally, what mechanism will you use to monitor and evaluate people's efforts to achieve all these recommendations, and what will you propose to do about it? I accept that the funding will increase, but are you prepared, on the back of evidence gained from your monitoring and evaluation, to take real action, particularly where you find that the data on waiting times are not good enough?

Edwina Hart: I think that the data issues are key in terms of some of the discussions that you had in committee and that I have had over the years with my officials and various organisations. The Welsh substance misuse database has been providing us with data since April 2005. Its first annual report will be published in September 2006. All the treatment providers are reporting in to the database for the first time, which will give us a clear picture of the nature and type of problems reported by those entering treatment. So, we have some information there. The database has also given us a

Yn strategol, Weinidog, yr oeddech yn dechrau drwy ddweud eich bod yn derbyn bron pob argymhelliad. A allech ddweud wrthym pa argymhellion nad ydych wedi eu derbyn? Byddai hynny'n helpu rhoi rhyw arweiniad inni.

Fe wnaif rai pwyntiau byr. Yr oeddech yn gwneud sylwadau fel pe baech yn gwybod yn union faint o bobl sydd ar restrau aros, er enghraifft, a nifer y gwelyau sydd eu hangen. Un o'r prif broblemau a welais yn adroddiad y pwyllgor oedd prinder data a phrinder data cadarn gan rai pobl. A allech ddweud yn fanylach yn union pa mor sicr yr ydych fod eich sylwadau'n seiliedig ar ddata, oherwydd yn ôl a ddeallaf fi nid oes data cadarn o hyd, ac mae tystiolaeth anecdotaidd yn awgrymu bod yna amseroedd aros hir am driniaeth? A allech wneud ragor o sylwadau, gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod gennych y data, pa mor gyflym y mae pobl yn cael triniaeth ledled Cymru? Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn canmol eich dull o ddelio â hyn a'ch ewyllys wleidyddol i ddatrys y materion hyn, ond efallai nad yw rhannau eraill o'r peiriant yn adlewyrchu'ch ewyllys wleidyddol i wneud hynny.

Yn olaf, pa fecanwaith a ddefnyddiwyd i fonitro a gwerthuso ymdrechion pobl i gyflawni'r holl argymhellion hyn, a beth fyddwch yn cynnig ei wneud am y peth? Derbyniaf y bydd yr arian yn cynyddu, ond a ydych, ar sail tystiolaeth a gafwyd o'ch gwaith monitro a gwerthuso, yn barod i gymryd camau gwirioneddol, yn arbennig lle gwelwch nad yw'r data ar amseroedd aros yn ddigon da?

Edwina Hart: Credaf fod y problemau data yn allweddol o ran rhai o'r trafodaethau a gawsoch yn y pwyllgor ac a gefais innau dros y blynyddoedd gyda'm swyddogion ac amrywiol sefydliadau. Mae cronfa ddata Cymru ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau wedi bod yn darparu data inni ers mis Ebrill 2005. Cyhoeddir ei hadroddiad blynyddol cyntaf ym mis Medi 2006. Mae'r holl ddarparwyr triniaeth yn cyfrannu at y gronfa ddata am y tro cyntaf, a fydd yn rhoi darlun clir inni o natur a math y problemau y mae'r rheini sy'n dechrau cael triniaeth yn sôn amdanynt. Felly, mae gennym rywffaint o wybodaeth

picture of those seeking help, and work is underway to establish a research programme, which will include prevalent studies to help future planning. That will tackle your point about needing to get the information so that we can plan for the future. I hope that that will complement the work at local level, while we require the community safety partnerships to undertake a needs and gap analysis as part of their commissioning process. So, there is information around that. Clearly, when we have a further discussion in committee, I will be happy to share some of this further information with Members, if they so wish.

You will also be aware that there was a formal consultation on the introduction of key performance indicators for substance misuse treatment, which came to an end in April 2006. We will hopefully issue the final KPIs, supported by detailed guidance and implementation arrangements, in July 2006. Meanwhile, we are also undertaking the national audit of waiting times, which will also explore the management of referrals and identify best practice for dissemination, because I am concerned about the management of referrals, how we deal with those and how we keep information on them.

We have made good strides on waiting times. There are areas on which we need to do more work, and I will take up the point that you raised on this, Mick. Not only have I presented my statement today, but I have issued a detailed Cabinet written statement outlining my responses and indicating which recommendations have received a positive response. I have also noted the areas on which I am already doing work. I have made one negative response, which I do not think is particularly negative in the context of how I have responded.

Ann Jones: Thank you for your statement, and I congratulate the Members on the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee for

yno. Mae'r gronfa ddata hefyd wedi rhoi darlun inni o'r rheini sy'n gofyn am help, ac mae gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i sefydlu rhaglen ymchwil, a fydd yn cynnwys astudiaethau cyffredin i helpu cynllunio yn y dyfodol. Bydd hynny'n mynd i'r afael â'ch pwynt ynglŷn â'r angen i gael y wybodaeth fel y gallwn gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n ategu'r gwaith yn lleol, tra byddwn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol wneud dadansoddiad o'r anghenion a'r bwch fel rhan o'u proses gomisiynu. Felly, mae yna wybodaeth ynglŷn â hynny. Yn amlwg, pan drafodwn hyn ymhellach yn y pwyllgor, byddaf yn fodlon rhannu rhywfaint o'r wybodaeth bellach hon gydag Aelodau, os dymunant hynny.

Fe wyddoch hefyd fod ymgynghori ffurfiol wedi bod am gyflwyno dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol ar gyfer triniaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau a ddaeth i ben ym mis Ebrill 2006. Gobeithio y byddwn yn cyhoeddi'r dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol terfynol, ynghyd â chanllawiau manwl a threfniadau gweithredu, ym mis Gorffennaf 2006. Yn y cyfamser, yr ydym hefyd yn gwneud yr archwiliad cenedlaethol o amseroedd aros, a fydd hefyd yn archwilio rheoli atgyfeiriadau ac yn nodi arferion gorau i'w lledaenu, oherwydd yr wyf yn bryderus ynglŷn â'r modd y rheolir atgyfeiriadau, sut yr ydym yn delio â hwy, a sut yr ydym yn cadw gwybodaeth amdanynt.

Yr ydym wedi cymryd camau cadarnhaol o ran amseroedd aros. Mae yna feysydd lle y mae angen inni wneud mwy o waith, a byddaf yn trafod y pwynt a godwyd gennych am hyn, Mick. Yr wyf nid yn unig wedi cyflwyno fy natganiad heddiw, ond yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig manwl gan y Cabinet yn amlinellu fy ymatebion ac yn nodi pa argymhellion sydd wedi cael ymateb cadarnhaol. Yr wyf hefyd wedi nodi'r meysydd yr wyf eisoes yn gwneud gwaith arnynt. Yr wyf wedi gwneud un ymateb negyddol, nad yw'n arbennig o negyddol, yn fy marn i, yng nghyd-destun y ffordd yr wyf wedi ymateb.

Anne Jones: Diolch am eich datganiad, a hoffwn longyfarch Aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am roi

giving such a high priority to what is a very difficult subject for us to get our heads around. I welcome the increase in funding and I am sure that the partnerships already set up will also welcome that. I am sure that they will spend it wisely, effectively and efficiently.

I particularly want to ask for your comments on your commitment to training staff in these difficult areas. How can we help those who are probably best placed to help people affected by substance misuse, namely the rehabilitated drug users and those taking part in the Choose Life project, which Mark mentioned? I have seen the outside work that Choose Life does and how it helps those people, for whom there was no hope at one time, to rebuild their lives. There is also the course at Her Majesty's Prison Altcourse, which works with many young Welsh offenders. How can we monitor whether these people will get the training and job opportunities to work with those whose lives will closely resemble theirs and for whom their stories will mean a great deal as they try to cope with alcohol and drug addiction?

3.40 p.m.

Edwina Hart: That is quite a difficult question in terms of how we would monitor this and look at what has happened. You are quite right; sometimes individuals who have experienced alcohol and drug abuse are the best people to explain to people why they should not go where they have been, and I have often met such people when visiting projects. When people start to understand what it is like to be in prison because you have had to steal to fund a drug habit and, consequently, you end up in the criminal justice system, it puts the fear into a lot of people to recognise that they do not want to go there. Given the spiralling of alcoholics through debt into homelessness, they are sometimes the best people—particularly when dealing with young people—to say, 'You do not want to go there. This is my experience'. When you are talking to younger people, they respect someone more if they

cymaint o flaenoriaeth i bwnc sy'n anodd iawn inni ei amgyffred. Croesawaf y cynnydd mewn arian, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y partneriaethau a sefydlwyd eisoes hefyd yn croesawu hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn ei wario'n ddoeth, yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon.

Hoffwn ofyn yn benodol am eich sylwadau ar eich ymrwymiad i hyfforddi staff yn y meysydd anodd hyn. Sut y gallwn helpu'r bobl hynny sydd, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn y sefyllfa orau i helpu pobl y mae camddefnyddio sylweddau yn effeithio arnynt, sef y defnyddwyr cyffuriau sydd wedi'u hadsefydlu a'r rheini sy'n cymryd rhan yn y prosiect Choose Life y soniodd Mark amdano? Yr wyf wedi gweld y gwaith allanol a wneir gan Choose Life a'r ffordd y mae'n helpu'r bobl hynny, nad oedd unrhyw obaith iddynt ar un adeg, i ailadeiladu eu bywydau. Mae cwrs ar gael hefyd yng Ngharchar Ei Mawrhydi Altcourse sy'n gweithio gyda nifer o droseddwr ifanc o Gymru. Sut y gallwn fonitro a fydd y bobl hyn yn cael yr hyfforddiant a'r cyfleoedd swyddi i weithio gyda'r bobl hynny y bydd eu bywydau'n debyg iawn i'w bywydau hwy, a'u storïau'n golygu llawer iawn iddynt wrth geisio ymdopi â bod yn gaeth i alcohol a chyffuriau?

Edwina Hart: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn digon anodd o ran sut y byddem yn monitro hyn ac yn edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle; weithiau, unigolion sydd â phrofiad o gamddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau yw'r bobl orau i esbonio wrth bobl pam na ddylent wneud yr hyn y maent hwy wedi ei wneud, ac yr wyf yn aml wedi cwrdd â phobl felly wrth ymweld â phrosiectau. Pan fydd pobl yn dechrau deall sut beth yw bod mewn carchar am eich bod wedi gorfod dwyn i dalu am gyffuriau, ac o ganlyniad yn dod yn rhan o'r system cyfiawnder troseddol, mae'n codi ofn ar lawer o bobl i sylweddoli nad ydynt am i hynny ddigwydd. O gofio bod pobl sy'n gaeth i alcohol yn symud yn gyflym o fod mewn dyled i fod yn ddigartref, hwy yw'r bobl orau weithiau—yn arbennig wrth ymdrin â phobl ifanc—i ddweud, 'Dydych chi ddim am wneud hynny. Dyma ichi

have been through that, because they are not teachers, police officers or anyone like that; they are quite real, and are people whom the young people could become like themselves if they do not look out. So, I will certainly look at that particular aspect.

You also made a valid point about staff training. It is important that staff recognise the wider world that they are involved in, and there are certainly points that I will take up with my officials.

Ann, you made a point about money, and we have been very lucky in terms of the additional money that we have had, but more money is always needed in this area. If we are going to crack the issue of services across Wales and have equality of opportunity of access to services across Wales, we will have to look at the financial implications. There are also issues about using money smarter, and I think that we are using money a lot smarter than we were five years ago in this particular agenda in order to get more value from what we are doing.

Laura Anne Jones: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I welcome the recommendations borne out of our review into substance misuse. You have acknowledged today that there is inequality in terms of access to services throughout Wales. Can you assure me, Minister, that the needs of those in rural areas in particular—normally those people with major problems in accessing services due to transport or other issues—are recognised and addressed, and that you will work with other Ministers to ensure that these issues are addressed when considering the recommendations that we have put forward?

Areas such as Abergavenny are often overlooked, even though they have a higher than average number of drug users. Not so long ago, the Assembly Government withdrew its funding from a Teen Challenge organisation that offered drug rehabilitation support. This is a much-needed service in this area at this time, so I hope that this will not

mhrofiad i'. Pan fyddwch yn siarad â phobl iau, maent yn parchu rhywun yn fwy os oes gan hwnnw brofiad o hynny, oherwydd nid athrawon ydynt na'r heddlu neu unrhyw un felly; maent yn bobl go iawn, ac yn bobl y gallai'r bobl ifanc ddilyn eu camau os na fyddant yn ofalus. Felly, byddaf yn sicr yn ymchwilio i'r agwedd benodol honno.

Fe wnaethoch bwynt dilys hefyd ynglŷn â hyfforddi staff. Mae'n bwysig i staff gydnabod y byd ehangach y maent yn rhan ohono, ac yn sicr mae yna bwyntiau y byddaf yn eu codi gyda fy swyddogion.

Ann, yr oeddech yn sôn am arian, ac yr ydym wedi bod yn ffodus iawn o ran yr arian ychwanegol a gawsom, ond mae angen mwy o arian yn y maes hwn bob amser. Os ydym i ddatrys problem gwasanaethau ledled Cymru a sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i allu cael gwasanaethau ledled Cymru, bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried y goblygiadau ariannol. Mae yna faterion hefyd ynghylch defnyddio arian yn ddoethach, a chredaf ein bod yn defnyddio arian lawer yn ddoethach nag a fyddem bum mlynedd yn ôl yn yr agenda benodol hon er mwyn cael mwy o werth o'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud.

Laura Anne Jones: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Croesawaf yr argymhellion sy'n deillio o'n hadolygiad o gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr ydych wedi cydnabod heddiw fod anghydraddoldeb wrth allu cael gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. A allwch fy sicrhau, Weinidog, y caiff anghenion y rheini mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn benodol—fel rheol y bobl hynny sy'n wynebu problemau mawr wrth geisio cael gwasanaethau oherwydd materion cludiant neu faterion eraill—eu cydnabod a'u diwallu, ac y byddwch yn gweithio gyda Gweinidogion eraill i sicrhau mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn wrth ystyried yr argymhellion a gyflwynwyd gennym?

Caiff ardaloedd megis y Fenni eu diystyru'n aml, er bod yno nifer mwy na'r arfer o ddefnyddwyr cyffuriau. Tynnodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei harian yn ôl o sefydliad Teen Challenge yn ddiweddar, a oedd yn cynnig cymorth adsefydlu cyffuriau. Mae angen mawr am y gwasanaeth hwn yn yr ardal hon ar hyn o bryd, felly, gobeithio na

be repeated.

Finally, Minister, what action you are taking to reverse the closure of detoxification beds to Welsh service users, as is happening in Wrexham, where beds are being contracted to English providers?

Edwina Hart: Thank you for your comments. I concur that we need equality of access to treatment, and that that should be the priority. I think that that also emerges from the report in many ways across a number of the recommendations; it is a key issue for Government, and I think that it is a key issue for the National Assembly as a whole. As I said in my statement, if we are to tackle the problem of substance misuse, when people make up their minds to go for treatment, the treatment should be there. It is a fine thing to say, but it will be difficult to achieve. However, if we all move forward and press for it and try to get the systems in place, it is something that might be achievable. You should always have it as your aim, even if you cannot guarantee it, as that will up the ante in terms of the services that are provided.

On access, you are quite right to look at the transport issues and how we innovatively develop services for the particular needs of those living in rural areas. I am always happy to look at those particular issues.

There is a lot of talk about the Assembly withdrawing funding, but it is the community safety partnerships that look at the work that is being undertaken in this area; they make their decisions on the basis of what they think is best for their area. Sometimes, when we are blamed for this, it is not down to us, as we have devolved responsibility to the people on the ground who we think are best placed to deal with these issues.

There are always issues about beds, and beds disappearing and so on, but when you look at the number of spaces that are available, you cannot always define them by the number of beds; there has been an increase of 4,500

fydd hyn yn digwydd eto.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i wrthdroi'r broses o gau gwelyau dadwenwyno i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, fel sy'n digwydd yn Wrecsam, lle mae gwelyau'n cael eu rhoi ar contract i ddarparwyr o Loegr?

Edwina Hart: Diolch am eich sylwadau. Cytunaf fod angen cydraddoldeb wrth allu cael triniaeth, ac mai hynny ddylai fod yn flaenoriaeth. Credaf fod hynny'n codi hefyd o'r adroddiad mewn llawer ffordd ar draws nifer o argymhellion; mae'n fater allweddol i'r Llywodraeth, a chredaf ei fod yn fater allweddol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn gyfan. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, os ydym i fynd i'r afael â phroblem camddefnyddio sylweddau, pan fydd pobl yn penderfynu mynd i gael triniaeth, dylai'r driniaeth fod ar gael. Mae'n ddigon hawdd dweud hyn, ond bydd yn anodd ei gyflawni. Fodd bynnag, os symudwn ni ymlaen i gyd a phwyso amdano a cheisio rhoi'r systemau ar waith, mae'n rhywbeth y gellid ei gyflawni. Dylai hyn fod yn nod ichi bob amser, hyd yn oed os na allwch ei warantu, oherwydd bydd hynny'n gosod mwy o her o ran y gwasanaethau a ddarperir.

O ran gallu cael gwasanaethau, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ystyried y materion cludiant a'r modd y datblygwn wasanaethau'n arloesol i ddiwallu anghenion penodol y bobl hynny sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Yr wyf bob amser yn fodlon ystyried y materion penodol hynny.

Mae yna lawer o siarad am atal arian gan y Cynulliad, ond y partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol sy'n ystyried y gwaith a wneir yn y maes hwn; maent yn seilio'u penderfyniadau ar yr hyn a gredant sydd orau i'w hardal hwy. Weithiau, pan gawn y bai am hyn, nid ni sy'n penderfynu, gan ein bod wedi datganoli cyfrifoldeb i'r bobl ar lawr gwlad a gredwn sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Mae yna broblemau bob amser gyda gwelyau, a gwelyau'n diflannu, ac ati. Ond pan edrychwch ar nifer y lleoedd gwag sydd ar gael, ni allwch eu diffinio bob amser yn ôl nifer y gwelyau; bu cynnydd o 4,500 yn nifer

places for treatment between 2003-04 and 2005-06.

The Presiding Officer: This is an important issue, and, therefore, I will extend the time in order to accommodate everyone. I call on Janice Gregory.

Janice Gregory: Minister, thank you for your statement today and for the detailed responses to each of the recommendations that you gave in your written statement.

You will know that, in undertaking the substance misuse review, the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee quickly became aware of the complexity of the factors behind substance misuse. As everyone has said, the review was a serious piece of work, examining a serious issue. I add my thanks to the present and past members of the committee, and to Roger Chaffey, who retired last week, and his team, for all the work that they have put into compiling the committee's report.

However, to do justice to the subject, the committee realised that it would have to gather a great deal of evidence from a wide range of sources; to this end, the committee received 51 responses to its written consultation, 17 oral presentations, and visited 13 projects. It was when we visited those projects that we realised—or at least had an idea of—the scale of what we were facing. Therefore, the evidence not only produced a significant information base, but also provoked much discussion in committee, and a real consensus began to appear.

Given the amount of thought, time and effort that went into the report, I am delighted that you have been so receptive to the recommendations, Minister. We would all have liked 100 per cent acceptance, but we understand that some of them could not have been accepted, and I am grateful to you for giving us your reasons why they were partially accepted or rejected.

On alcohol, as you know, Minister, I am the patron of Bryn Awel House, so I know your understanding and commitment to tackling

y lleoedd ar gyfer triniaeth rhwng 2003-04 a 2005-06.

Y Llywydd: Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, ac felly byddaf yn ymestyn yr amser er mwyn rhoi cyfle i bawb. Galwaf ar Janice Gregory.

Janice Gregory: Weinidog, diolch am eich datganiad heddiw ac am yr ymatebion manwl i bob un o'r argymhellion a wnaethoch yn eich datganiad ysgrifenedig.

Fel y gwyddoch, buan y daeth y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ymwybodol o gymhlethdod y ffactorau y tu ôl i gamddefnyddio sylweddau, wrth iddo ymgymryd â'r adolygiad o gamddefnyddio sylweddau. Fel y mae pawb wedi ei ddweud, yr oedd yr adolygiad yn waith difrifol, yn ymchwilio i fater difrifol. Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau presennol a chyn-aelodau'r pwyllgor ac i Roger Chaffey, a ymddeolodd yr wythnos diwethaf, a'i dîm am yr holl waith a wnaethant wrth lunio adroddiad y pwyllgor.

Fodd bynnag, i wneud cyfiawnder â'r pwnc, sylweddolodd y pwyllgor y byddai'n rhaid iddo gasglu llawer iawn o dystiolaeth o amrywiaeth helaeth o ffynonellau, ac i'r perwyl hwn, derbyniodd y pwyllgor 51 o ymatebion i'w ymgynghori ysgrifenedig, 17 o gyflwyniadau ar lafar ac ymwelodd â 13 o brosiectau. Wrth inni ymweld â'r prosiectau hynny y sylweddolwyd—neu y cafwyd syniad, o leiaf—am faint yr hyn a oedd yn ein hwynebu. Felly, yn ogystal â darparu sail wybodaeth sylweddol, ysgogodd y dystiolaeth gryn drafodaeth yn y pwyllgor, a dechreuodd consensws gwirioneddol ddod yn amlwg.

O gofio faint o waith meddwl, amser ac ymdrech a olygodd yr adroddiad hwn, yr wyf wrth fy modd eich bod mor barod i dderbyn yr argymhellion, Weinidog. Byddem i gyd wedi hoffi gweld derbyn pob un, ond deallwn na fyddai modd derbyn pob un, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am roi eich rhesymau inni dros eu gwrthod neu eu derbyn yn rhannol.

O ran alcohol, fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, fi yw yn noddwr Tŷ Bryn Awel, felly, gwn am eich dealltwriaeth a'ch ymrwymiad i fynd i'r

alcohol misuse. This was a huge area that the committee went into, but only touched upon. We now know as a committee the mountain that must be climbed, if you like, in tackling this issue.

On needle exchange services and the joint audit with England, do you have a timescale, Minister, of when you will be able to update the committee on that report? As you know, I have concerns relating to confidentiality, which could prove to be a barrier to people using a needle exchange service.

The recommendations are aimed at ensuring that there is an equality of access to appropriate and effective treatment services for all those in need of them, and I am sure that Wales will now begin to see real action to achieve this.

Edwina Hart: I appreciate that it was probably a difficult task for you, Janice, as Chair of the committee, drawing the strands together of what is an exceptionally detailed report. If Members have not had the opportunity to read the report and the response, it would be worthwhile their doing so, in terms of the amount of work that has gone into this, and the amount of background information that the committee collected when taking evidence. I have asked my officials to look at the evidence that the committee took that is not contained in the report. It is useful when a committee does a report—it has the time to speak to many organisations that my officials or I would not necessarily come into regular contact with. The evidence that committees gain sometimes helps us to develop policy even further in those areas, because they are on the ground, and they are doing the work out there.

On your point on the needle exchange services, I will try to include something in my report to committee in July. Needle exchange is a big issue, and there are concerns about how it is done and where it is done, and so on. It is important that people recognise the importance of needle exchange, because it prevents the transmission of HIV/AIDS and other blood-borne viral

afael â chamddefnyddio alcohol. Yr oedd hwn yn faes enfawr i'r pwyllgor fynd i'r afael ag ef, ond megis dechrau oedd hynny. Gwyddom yn awr, fel pwyllgor, mor fawr yw'r mynydd sydd i'w ddringo, os mynnwch, wrth fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon.

O ran gwasanaethau cyfnewid nodwyddau a'r archwiliad ar y cyd â Lloegr, Weinidog, a oes gennych amserlen pryd y byddwch yn gallu rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r pwyllgor am yr adroddiad hwnnw? Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch cyfrinachedd, a gallai hynny fod yn rhwystr i bobl sy'n defnyddio gwasanaeth cyfnewid nodwyddau.

Mae'r argymhellion wedi'u hanelu at sicrhau cael gwasanaethau triniaeth priodol ac effeithiol yn gyfartal gan bawb y mae arnynt eu hangen, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Cymru yn awr yn dechrau gweld gweithredu gwirioneddol i gyflawni hyn.

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn sylweddoli ei bod yn dasg anodd i chi Janice, mae'n siŵr, fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, i ddwyn holl elfennau'r adroddiad hynod fanwl hwn ynghyd. Os nad yw'r Aelodau wedi cael cyfle i ddarllen yr adroddiad a'r ymateb, byddai'n werth iddynt wneud hynny, oherwydd yr holl waith sy'n sail i hyn a'r wybodaeth gefndir a gasglwyd gan y pwyllgor wrth gymryd tystiolaeth. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion edrych ar y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor ac sydd heb ei chynnwys yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n ddefnyddiol pan fydd pwyllgor yn llunio adroddiad—mae ganddo'r amser i siarad â nifer o sefydliadau na fyddwn i na'm swyddogion yn dod i gysylltiad â hwy'n rheolaidd. Mae'r dystiolaeth a gaiff pwyllgorau yn ein helpu weithiau i ddatblygu polisi hyd yn oed ymhellach yn y meysydd hynny, gan eu bod wrthi yn gwneud y gwaith, yn y cymunedau.

Am eich pwynt am y gwasanaethau cyfnewid nodwyddau, ceisiaf gynnwys rhywbeth yn fy adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ym mis Gorffennaf. Mae cyfnewid nodwyddau yn fater o bwys, ac mae yna bryderon am y ffordd y caiff hynny ei wneud a ble, ac yn y blaen. Mae'n bwysig i bobl gydnabod pwysigrwydd cyfnewid nodwyddau, oherwydd ei fod yn atal trosglwyddo HIV/AIDS a heintiau feirol

infections. It is important that drug users do not share equipment, and that we have the facilities in Wales to deal with some of the needle exchange issues.

In light of your comments, Janice, the complexity of this area and how it links into other parts of my portfolio is interesting. As part of its forward work programme, the committee has now chosen to look at youth homelessness, has it not? I think that we will also see some issues about substance misuse when the committee considers that report, which will then be helpful in formulating a policy.

As Minister, I thank you, Janice, Chair of the committee, and the committee once again for the excellent work that has been done in this area. As you indicated, I have had to reject only one recommendation. I always try to look positively at the committee's reports. I may not always agree with recommendations, but if I see merit in them, it is important that we accept them and work through them as a Government.

Gwenda Thomas: Will you confirm, Minister—as I am sure you will—that any consultation on the needs of children and young people who misuse substances, referred to under recommendation 21, will give due consideration to the evidence provided by children and young people to the 'Keeping Us Safe' review?

3.50 p.m.

Edwina Hart: Yes. I can confirm that, when developing the children and young people's model of the substance misuse treatment framework, particular emphasis was placed on ensuring that young people were consulted. The consultation document will be issued in the summer, and consultation workshops will also be held across Wales. Funky Dragon will be helping the Assembly with the delivery of these workshops. We have also been looking at the views of the children's commissioner in this area, and, during the consultation period, we will undertake to map the current provision of substance misuse education, prevention and

eraill a drosglwyddir drwy waed. Mae'n bwysig i ddefnyddwyr cyffuriau beidio â rhannu offer, a bod gennym y cyfleusterau yng Nghymru i ddelio â rhai o'r problemau cyfnewid nodwyddau.

Yng ngoleuni'ch sylwadau, Janice, mae cymhlethdod y maes hwn a'r ffordd y mae'n cysylltu â rhannau eraill fy portffolio yn ddi-ddorol. Fel rhan o'i flaenraglen waith, mae'r pwyllgor yn awr wedi dewis edrych ar bobl ifanc sy'n ddigartref, onid ydyw? Credaf y gwelwn hefyd rai materion yn ymwneud â chamddefnyddio sylweddau pan fydd y pwyllgor yn ystyried yr adroddiad hwnnw, a fydd wedyn o gymorth wrth lunio polisi.

Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf yn diolch ichi, Janice, Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, a'r pwyllgor unwaith yn rhagor am y gwaith rhagorol a wnaed yn y maes hwn. Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, dim ond un argymhelliad y bu'n rhaid imi ei wrthod. Byddaf bob amser yn ceisio edrych yn gadarnhaol ar adroddiadau'r pwyllgor. Efallai nad wyf bob amser yn cytuno â'r argymhellion, ond os gwelaf rinwedd ynddynt, mae'n bwysig inni eu derbyn a gweithio drwyddynt fel Llywodraeth.

Gwenda Thomas: A allwch gadarnhau, Weinidog—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnewch—y bydd unrhyw ymgynghori am anghenion plant a phobl ifanc sy'n camddefnyddio sylweddau, fel y cyfeirir atynt o dan argymhelliad 21, yn rhoi ystyriaeth ddyledus i'r dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan blant a phobl ifanc i'r adolygiad 'Ein Cadw'n Ddiogel'?

Edwina Hart: Gallaf. Gallaf gadarnhau, wrth ddatblygu'r model plant a phobl ifanc yn y fframwaith triniaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau, fod pwyslais arbennig wedi ei roi ar sicrhau ymgynghori â phobl ifanc. Cyhoeddir y ddogfen ymgynghori yn yr haf, a chynhelir gweithdai ymgynghori ledled Cymru. Bydd y Ddraig Ffyni yn helpu'r Cynulliad wrth ddarparu'r gweithdai hyn. Yr ydym hefyd wedi bod yn edrych ar sylwadau'r comisiynydd plant yn y maes hwn, ac yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori byddwn yn mynd ati i fapio'r ddarpariaeth bresennol o addysg camddefnyddio sylweddau a gwasanaethau atal a thrin i blant

treatment services for children and young people across Wales. Therefore, arising from the committee's report on these issues, we also have a lot of work going forward on the issue of children. I have to say that one difficult area, as you know, is that of the children of drug users, which is an area of real concern. I am very pleased that 'Hidden Harm' is being implemented by the Assembly Government, but I still think that we have a lot of work to do in that particular field, and I am grateful for your comments.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Weinidog, hoffwn i, fel y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfranwyr, ddiolch i chi am eich ymateb ystyrllon a chynhwysfawr i'r adroddiad hwn. Cefais gyfle i eistedd ar y pwyllgor ac i gymryd rhan yn y gwaith o lunio'r adroddiad. Un pwynt penodol sydd gennyf, a chredaf y byddech yn cytuno af ef, Weinidog, sef bod problem ynghylch sicrhau cysondeb y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer pobl sydd â phroblemau alcohol a chyffuriau ledled Cymru. Mae'n anghyson ac mae'n ddibynnol i raddau helaeth ar wirfoddolwyr ac ar gefnogaeth elusenol. A wnewch chi ystyried a thrafod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y posibilrwydd o gomisiynu rhai o'r gwasanaethau hyn yn genedlaethol, er mwyn sicrhau bod dosraniad teg ohonynt, fel bod pawb yng Nghymru yn cael cyfle i gael y gwasanaethau hyn mor agos â phosibl i'w cartrefi?

Edwina Hart: I thank Rhodri Glyn for his comments, and I am happy to take up various points with the Minister for Health and Social Services. I think that there are quite a lot of issues that we need to discuss arising from the committee's report. I am not certain that that would actually help matters, because I think that local commissioning is actually quite good. However, I understand your point about equity of funding and availability, which I will certainly take forward.

Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Adrannau 76B a 76E Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Rhyw 1975 fel y'i Diwygiwyd gan Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb 2006 i'r Prif Weinidog

The Delegation of Functions under Sections 76B and 76E of the Sex Discrimination Act 1975 as amended by the Equality Act 2006 to the First Minister

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiad fod

a phobl ifanc ledled Cymru. Felly, yn deillio o adroddiad y pwyllgor ar y materion hyn, mae gennym hefyd lawer o waith yn mynd rhagddo ym maes plant. Rhaid imi ddweud bod plant defnyddwyr cyffuriau yn faes anodd ac yn faes o bryder gwirioneddol, fel y gwyddoch. Yr wyf yn falch iawn fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu 'Niwed Cudd', ond credaf o hyd fod gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud yn y maes penodol hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich sylwadau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Minister, like most of the contributors, I should also like to thank you for your considered and comprehensive response to the report. I had the opportunity to sit on the committee and to take part in the work of drafting the report. I have only one specific point to make, and it is one that I think you would agree with, Minister, namely that there is a problem in ensuring consistent provision for people with alcohol and drug problems across Wales. It is inconsistent and depends largely on volunteers and on charitable support. Will you consider and discuss with the Minister for Health and Social Services the possibility of commissioning some of these services nationally, to ensure that they are fairly distributed, so that everyone in Wales has the opportunity to access these services as close as possible to their homes?

Edwina Hart: Diolch i Rhodri Glyn am ei sylwadau, ac yr wyf yn fodlon codi amrywiol bwyntiau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Credaf fod yna nifer fawr o faterion y mae angen inni eu trafod yn deillio o adroddiad y pwyllgor. Nid wyf yn siŵr y byddai hynny'n helpu pethau mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd yr wyf o'r farn fod comisiynu lleol yn eithaf da. Fodd bynnag, deallaf eich pwynt am ariannu ac argaeledd teg, a byddaf yn sicr yn mynd â hyn ymhellach.

propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,

resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in or under sections 76B(3)(a) and 76E(3)(a) and (b) of the Sex Discrimination Act 1975, as inserted into that Act by the Equality Act 2006, to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM3093)

Nothing in the motion will have the effect of reducing the pre-eminence of the authority of the full Assembly or of reducing the role of the Assembly committees in the exercise of the above functions. This delegation will be made in the knowledge that those functions will, as appropriate, be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and to staff.

Following the delegation, the National Assembly for Wales will be consulted on the Sex Discrimination (Public Authorities) (Statutory Duties) Order 2006, and the First Minister will be consulted on the statutory code of practice. The Sex Discrimination (Public Authorities) (Statutory Duties) Order 2006 will amend the Sex Discrimination Act 1975, and introduce a duty on all public authorities to promote equality of opportunity between men and women and, once passed, the duty will come into force in April 2007. This is a non-devolved issue, but, in order to support the effective introduction of the duty, the Department of Trade and Industry aims to lay the Order and code of practice before Parliament in March 2007. That code of practice is currently being drafted by the Equal Opportunities Commission.

Helen Mary Jones: Plaid Cymru will, of course, support this delegation. It is an appropriate delegation since it is Government action that is predominantly needed, and it is right that the Government should take responsibility for preparing the scheme.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,

yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan adrannau 76B(3)(a) a 76E(3)(a) a (b) Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Rhyw 1975, fel y'u mewnosodwyd yn y Ddeddf honno gan Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb 2006, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM3093)

Ni fydd dim yn y cynnig hwn yn lleihau goruchafiaeth awdurdod y Cynulliad llawn nac yn lleihau rôl pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad wrth arfer y swyddogaethau uchod. Caiff y swyddogaethau hyn eu dirprwyo ar y ddealltwriaeth y dirprwyir y swyddogaethau hynny ymhellach, fel sy'n briodol, i'r Gweinidog Cynulliad priodol ac i staff.

Yn dilyn y dirprwyo, ymgynghorir â Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar Orchymyn Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Rhyw (Awdurdodau Cyhoeddus) (Dyletswyddau Statudol) 2006 ac ymgynghorir â'r Prif Weinidog ar y cod ymarfer statudol. Bydd Gorchymyn Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Rhyw (Awdurdodau Cyhoeddus) (Dyletswyddau Statudol) 2006 yn diwygio Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Rhyw 1975, ac yn cyflwyno dyletswydd ar bob awdurdod cyhoeddus i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i ddynion a menywod, ac ar ôl ei phasio daw'r ddyletswydd i rym ym mis Ebrill 2007. Nid yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli, ond er mwyn sicrhau cyflwyno'r ddyletswydd yn effeithiol, mae'n fwriad gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant gyflwyno'r Gorchymyn a'r cod ymarfer gerbron y Senedd ym mis Mawrth 2007. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal yn llunio drafft y cod ymarfer hwnnw.

Helen Mary Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru, wrth gwrs, yn cefnogi'r ddirprwyaeth hon. Mae'n ddirprwyaeth briodol gan mai gweithredu o du'r Llywodraeth sydd ei angen yn bennaf, ac mae'n briodol y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn gyfrifol am baratoi'r cynllun. Fodd bynnag,

However, the Minister will be aware that I have expressed to her in the past my concern that the National Assembly as a body and the Welsh Assembly Government are being put in a position where they have to produce a plethora of official schemes to tackle different aspects of the equality agenda. We have the race equality scheme, and now for gender as well as disability. The Minister will be aware of my concern that too much time and energy will be needed to write the schemes and that may divert from the actual delivery. The Minister will not be surprised to hear me say that I am not entirely sure that it is acceptable for a body such as the National Assembly, which is so far ahead in terms of Government action and consensus around equality issues, to be subjected to legislative requirement after legislative requirement by a Westminster Government that perhaps ought to pick the beam out of its own eye on equality issues before it starts trying to get the splinter out of ours.

The Minister will also be aware that there is a question about the piecemeal nature of this legislation. Will the Minister commit herself today to continue to press the Westminster Government for a single equality Act that will put all the strands of equality on the same footing and clarify this plethora of different schemes needing to be brought in at different times? Some of this is not within the Minister's power to change, but I hope that she has some influence. I suspect that she shares some of my frustration around these issues.

Finally, I ask the Minister for her assurance that she will ensure that, once the gender equality scheme is in place and is delegated to her, all departments across Government respond with the same quality of preparation and action. In the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, when the annual equality report is published, year after year, we have seen that there are some Government divisions that clearly know what they are doing, that have a major commitment and that are clearly getting leadership, but I am sure that the Minister will accept that there are others who are a long way behind. In responding to the debate today, will the Minister tell me what

gŵyr y Gweinidog imi fynegi fy mhryder wrthi yn y gorffennol fod y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel corff a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa lle mae'n rhaid iddynt gynhyrchu toreh o gynlluniau swyddogol i fynd i'r afael â gwahanol agweddau ar yr agenda cydraddoldeb. Mae'r cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol gennym, a bellach ar gyfer rhyw yn ogystal ag anabledd. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod fy mod yn pryderu y bydd angen gormod o amser ac egni i ysgrifennu'r cynlluniau, a all dynnu sylw oddi y cyflwyno mewn gwirionedd. Ni fydd y Gweinidog yn synnu fy nghlywed yn dweud nad wyf yn gwbl siŵr ei bod yn dderbyniol i gorff fel y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, sydd gymaint ar y blaen o ran gweithredu gan y Llywodraeth a chonsensws parthed materion cydraddoldeb, orfod wynebu'r naill ofyniad deddfwriaethol ar ôl y llall gan Lywodraeth yn San Steffan a ddylai, efallai, fwrw'r trawst o'i llygaid ei hun ar faterion cydraddoldeb cyn dechrau ceisio cael gwared â'r mân frychau sydd gennym ni.

Gŵyr y Gweinidog hefyd fod amheuaeth ynghylch natur ddarniog y ddeddfwriaeth hon. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo heddiw i barhau i bwysu ar Lywodraeth San Steffan am un Ddeddf cydraddoldeb a fydd yn gosod holl elfennau cydraddoldeb ar yr un sail gan egluro'r llu cynlluniau gwahanol hyn y mae angen eu cyflwyno ar adegau gwahanol? Nid yw'r pŵer gan y Gweinidog i newid rhai pethau, ond gobeithio bod ganddi ryw faint o ddylanwad. Tybiaf ei bod hi fel finnau yn teimlo'n rhwystredig ynghylch y materion hyn.

Yn olaf, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog am addewid y bydd yn sicrhau y bydd pob adran o'r Llywodraeth yn ymateb gyda'r un safon o baratoi a gweithredu, pan fydd y cynllun cydraddoldeb rhyw ar waith. Yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, pan gyhoeddir yr adroddiad cydraddoldeb blynyddol, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, yr ydym wedi gweld bod rhai o adrannau'r Llywodraeth yn gwybod yn union yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud, bod ganddynt ymrwymiad cryf a'u bod yn cael arweiniad amlwg. Ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn bod eraill ymhell ar ei hôl hi. Wrth ymateb i'r ddadl heddiw, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud

will be done to ensure that, with regard to the gender equality scheme, those divisions that are dragging their feet are compelled to take the necessary action?

Jenny Randerson: The Welsh Liberal Democrats will be supporting this motion. I do not want to repeat the words of Helen Mary Jones, but I agree with her. Although this delegation is appropriate to the Government, it is important that the Government keeps in mind the need to engage all Assembly committees on equality issues, and particularly keeps in mind the need to continue the dialogue with the Committee of Equality of Opportunity, which works extremely well and positively on a cross-party basis. This is an important new set of initiatives. There is a world of difference between the initial legislation and the need to promote equality of opportunity between men and women, and I hope that we will start to see some significant progress as a result of it. Once again, powers in relation to non-devolved departments are a problem and I hope that the Government here will be in positive discussion with Ministers in the UK Government to ensure that they take their responsibilities in relation to this as seriously as I am sure the Minister here will.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I thank Helen Mary and Jenny for their comments. We strive to be an exemplar, and we believe that we are unique; we have a unique advantage because of our statutory duty to promote equality of opportunity under the Government of Wales Act 1998. That is also encapsulated in our Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and it is very important that we have the standing advisers there, including the Equal Opportunities Commission, which is guiding us in how we can take forward our commitment to gender equality in relation to public services and public duty. It is also important that we make progress, and that is why a statute to underpin our aspirations is important. We have learned a great deal as a result of having to deliver and implement a compliant race equality scheme, and the key point is the delivery and the implementation of the scheme. A great deal is being learned in the consultation that we are undertaking on the disability equality

wrthryf beth a wneir i sicrhau gorfodi'r isadrannau hynny sy'n llusgo'u traed i gymryd y camau angenrheidiol yng nghydestun y cynllun cydraddoldeb rhyw?

Jenny Randerson: Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Nid wyf am ailadrodd geiriau Helen Mary Jones, ond yr wyf yn cytuno â hi. Er bod y ddirprwyaeth hon yn briodol i'r Llywodraeth, mae'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth gadw mewn cof yr angen am ymgysylltu â phob un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad ar faterion cydraddoldeb a'i bod yn cofio'n benodol yr angen am barhau'r dialog gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, sy'n gweithio'n dda iawn ac yn gadarnhaol ar draws yr holl bleidiau. Mae hon yn gyfres newydd a phwysig o fentrau. Mae byd o wahaniaeth rhwng y ddeddfwriaeth gychwynnol a'r angen am hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal rhwng dynion a menywod, a gobeithio y gwelwn gynnydd sylweddol o ganlyniad. Unwaith eto, mae pwerau yng nghydestun adrannau nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli yn broblem, a gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth yma yn cael trafodaethau cadarnhaol gyda Gweinidogion yn Llywodraeth y DU i sicrhau eu bod yn cymryd eu cyfrifoldebau yn y cyswllt hwn gymaint o ddifrif ag y bydd y Gweinidog yma yn ei wneud.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Diolch i Helen Mary ac i Jenny am eu sylwadau. Ein nod yw gosod esiampl, a chredwn ein bod yn unigryw; mae gennym fantais unigryw oherwydd ein dyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Crisialir hynny hefyd yn ein Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, ac mae'n bwysig iawn bod gennym y cynghorwyr sefydlog yno, gan gynnwys y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal sy'n rhoi arweiniad inni o ran y modd y gallwn ddatblygu ein hymrwymiad i gydraddoldeb rhyw yng nghydestun gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a dyletswydd gyhoeddus. Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni wneud cynnydd, a dyna pam y mae'n bwysig sicrhau statud yn sail i'n dyheadau. Yr ydym wedi dysgu llawer o orfod cyflwyno a gweithredu cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol sy'n cydymffurfio, a'r pwynt allweddol yw cyflwyno'r cynllun a'i weithredu. Yr ydym yn dysgu llawer o'n hymgynghori am y ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb anabledd a'r

duty and the gender equality duty, and there are forthcoming consultation events this month.

In terms of reassurance that we are pressing for a single equality Act, you know that the Welsh Assembly Government has consistently promoted that, and Trevor Phillips also expressed that point very firmly when he visited the committee recently as part of his equalities review. We must look to our 'Mainstreaming Equality' objectives. To reassure Jenny and Helen Mary, an independent equality audit is being undertaken.

4.00 p.m.

That was one of the key recommendations of the committee's report on mainstreaming equality, and that will identify an independent baseline audit of where we are across the whole Assembly Government. In moving to an outcome-based annual report, and delivery, I think that we will see that our objectives are being fulfilled.

ddyletswydd cydraddoldeb rhyw, ac mae digwyddiadau ymgynghori ar y gweill ar gyfer y mis hwn.

O ran sicrwydd ein bod yn pwysu am un Ddeddf cydraddoldeb, gwyddoch fod Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyrwyddo hynny'n gyson, a bod Trevor Phillips hefyd wedi mynegi'r pwynt hwnnw'n gryf iawn pan ymwelodd â'r pwyllgor yn ddiweddar fel rhan o'i adolygiad cydraddoldebau. Rhaid inni edrych ar ein hamcanion 'Prif Ffrydio Cydraddoldeb'. I dawelu meddyliau Jenny a Helen Mary, mae archwiliad cydraddoldeb annibynnol ar y gweill.

Dyna oedd un o brif argymhellion adroddiad y pwyllgor ar brif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb, a bydd hynny'n nodi archwiliad sylfaenol annibynnol o'r sefyllfa ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfan. Wrth symud ymlaen at adroddiad blynyddol yn seiliedig ar ganlyniadau, a darparu, credaf y gwelwn ein hamcanion yn cael eu cyflawni.

*Cynnig (NDM3093): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3093): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**‘Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu’
 ‘Wales: A Vibrant Economy’**

Motion (NDM3092): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3092): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

notes the development of the Welsh Assembly Government’s strategic framework for economic development, ‘Wales: A Vibrant Economy’.

yn nodi datblygiad fframwaith strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, ‘Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu’.

Amendment 1 withdrawn.

Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl.

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
 Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
 Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to deliver its key economic targets since it came to power, and its failure to secure adequate matched funding from the UK Treasury for its Objective 1 programme and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran cyflawni ei thargedau economaidd allweddol ers iddi ddod i rym, a’i methiant o ran sicrhau digon o arian cyfatebol o Drysorlys y DU ar gyfer ei rhaglen Amcan 1 ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) make better use of convergence funding for the next round by ensuring that the UK Treasury provides matched funding; and

a) defnyddio cyllid cydgyfeirio’n well ar gyfer y rownd nesaf drwy sicrhau bod Trysorlys y DU yn darparu arian cyfatebol; a

b) emphasise the importance of indigenous businesses in improving the economy.

b) pwysleisio pwysigrwydd busnesau brodorol i wella’r economi.

- Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- in light of increases in energy costs and predictions for climate change, calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that sustainable development and environmental considerations are central to all its economic policies.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- regrets the drop in manufacturing output in Wales while the sector in the rest of the UK is growing and expresses concern at the falls in the index of production, construction, manufacturing, as well as the increase in unemployment over the last 12 months and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise its failures and revise its strategies accordingly.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- regrets that Wales is now the poorest region of the UK when measured by the internationally recognised economic indicator of GVA.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes the further widening of the growth in the value of exports between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes that statutory registration in the tourism sector would have a negative impact on the economy of tourist areas and therefore opposes any plan for statutory registration in the tourism sector.*
- Amendment 8 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Assembly Government to target support at new businesses in growth sectors.*
- Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn ngoleuni'r cynnydd mewn costau ynni a'r rhagolygon ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy ac ystyriaethau amgylcheddol yn ganolog i'w holl bolisiau economaidd.*
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn gresynu at y gostyngiad yn y cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru tra bo'r sector yng ngweddill y DU yn tyfu, ac yn mynegi pryder am ostyngiadau yn y mynegai cynhyrchu, adeiladu, gweithgynhyrchu a hefyd y cynnydd mewn diweithdra dros y 12 mis diwethaf, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod ei methiannau ac adolygu ei strategaethau yn unol â hynny.*
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn gresynu mai Cymru erbyn hyn yw rhanbarth tlotaf y DU o'i mesur ar sail y dangosydd economaidd GVA, a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol.*
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi bod y twf yng ngwerth allforion rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig wedi ehangu ymhellach.*
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi y byddai cofrestru statudol yn y sector twristiaeth yn cael effaith negyddol ar economi ardaloedd twristiaeth ac felly'n gwrthwynebu unrhyw gynllun ar gyfer cofrestru statudol yn y sector twristiaeth.*
- Gwelliant 8 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu cymorth penodol i fusnesau newydd mewn sectorau twf.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to give greater priority to infrastructure, particularly transport, projects in the next round of European structural funding.

Amendment 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to do more to help the economic revitalisation of town centres and to ensure that town centres remain economically viable.

Amendment 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

instructs the Assembly Government to develop a green jobs strategy, and to do more to assist and promote green businesses and industries.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 4, 5, 6, and 7 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 8, 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1 has been withdrawn.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the development of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategic framework for economic development, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. (NDM3092)

'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' sets out the Assembly Government's strategic framework for creating a vibrant economy, an economy that delivers strong and sustainable growth, as well as providing opportunities for all. Since 1999, when this Assembly was established, the Welsh economy has made tangible and remarkable progress, both in absolute terms as well as relative to the rest

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i brosiectau seilwaith, a phrosiectau trafnidiaeth yn benodol, yn y cylch ariannu strwythurol Ewropeaidd nesaf.

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud mwy i helpu gydag adfywio economaidd canol trefi ac i sicrhau bod canol trefi'n parhau'n economaidd hyfyw.

Gwelliant 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd, a gwneud rhagor i gynorthwyo a hyrwyddo busnesau a diwydiannau gwyrdd.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 8, 9, 10 ac 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn nodi datblygiad fframwaith strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. (NDM3092)

Mae 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' yn gosod fframwaith strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer creu economi sy'n ffynnu, economi sy'n sicrhau twf cryf a chynaliadwy, yn ogystal â rhoi cyfleoedd i bawb. Er 1999, pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad hwn, mae economi Cymru wedi gwneud cynnydd pendant a nodedig, mewn termau absoliwt yn ogystal ag o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU. Yn

of the UK. In 1999, unemployment in Wales was running at 30 per cent above the UK level. Today, and for much of the last three years, the unemployment rate in Wales has remained below the UK average.

In fact, the latest figures from the Office for National Statistics this morning confirmed our remarkable record, with employment in Wales up again by 15,000 over the last year and up by 5,000 over the last quarter. At 4.9 per cent, the unemployment rate in Wales remains below the UK average of 5.3 per cent. Wales is maintaining a jobs rate well above its historical average, with the level up over 100,000 since the start of the Assembly. In fact, the number of jobs in Wales has increased by nearly 10 per cent since devolution, compared to a 7 per cent increase for the UK as a whole over the same period.

Alun Cairns *rose—*

Andrew Davies: This transformation is echoed across almost every aspect of economic activity, from gross domestic household income, average earnings, economic inactivity, investment in public transport, to investment in our ICT infrastructure, including broadband connectivity. Wales today is a dynamic, vibrant and exciting place with a highly skilled, flexible and adaptable workforce. It is the best place to start a business and the best place to grow a business.

‘WAVE’ sets out how we are building on this remarkable success and provides a first-class framework for policy development.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Minister for finally giving way. Can he tell us when he—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister had been his feet for around one minute 40 seconds when you got up, and he is giving way at two minutes. That is hardly a long wait. Let us have a bit of common courtesy.

Alun Cairns: I am very grateful to the Minister for giving way. For the record, can

1999, yr oedd diweithdra yng Nghymru 30 y cant yn uwch na lefel y DU. Heddiw, ac am ran helaeth o'r tair blynedd diwethaf, mae'r gyfradd ddiweithdra wedi parhau islaw cyfartaledd y DU.

Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd ffigurau diwethaf o'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol y bore yma yn cadarnhau record hynod, ac mae cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu eto 15,000 dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf a 5,000 dros y chwarter diwethaf. Ar lefel o 4.9 y cant, mae'r gyfradd ddiweithdra yng Nghymru yn dal islaw cyfartaledd y DU o 5.3 y cant. Mae Cymru yn cynnal cyfradd swyddi ymhell uwchlaw ei chyfartaledd hanesyddol, ac mae'r lefel wedi cynyddu dros 100,000 ers dechrau'r Cynulliad. Mewn gwirionedd, mae nifer y swyddi yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu bron i 10 y cant ers datganoli, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o 7 y cant ar gyfer y DU yn gyffredinol dros yr un cyfnod.

Alun Cairns *a gododd—*

Andrew Davies: Mae'r trawsnewid hwn yn cael ei ailadrodd ar draws bron pob agwedd ar weithgaredd yr economi, o incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario, enillion cyfartalog, anweithgarwch economaidd, buddsoddi mewn cludiant cyhoeddus, i fuddsoddi yn ein seilwaith TGCh, gan gynnwys cysylltedd band-eang. Heddiw mae Cymru yn lle deinamig, bywiog a chyffrous gyda gweithlu medrus a hyblyg. Dyma'r lle gorau i ddechrau busnes a'r lle gorau i dyfu busnes.

Mae 'WAVE' yn gosod allan sut yr ydym yn datblygu'r llwyddiant hynod hwn ac yn rhoi fframwaith o safon ar gyfer datblygu polisi.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio o'r diwedd. A all ddweud wrthym pan fydd—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oedd y Gweinidog wedi bod ar ei draed am ryw funud a 40 eiliad pan fu ichi godi, ac mae'n ildio ar ôl dwy funud. Nid yw hynny'n amser maith i aros o bell ffordd. Gadewch inni gael ychydig gwrteisi cyffredin.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ildio. Ar gyfer y cofnod, a all

he tell us for how long he has been bringing gross domestic household income figures to the former Economic Development and Transport Committee and the former Economic Development Committee as evidence of a growing economy? When did he first quote them as a demonstration of growth in the economy?

Andrew Davies: Alun Cairns is as grudging in his interventions as he is in everything else. I always present a full portfolio of information to the committee. I regret to say that on many occasions Alun and his colleagues do not seem to understand the statistics or to recognise their value. We have consulted widely on 'WAVE', holding over 50 seminars with key stakeholders and customers. Over 140 written responses were received as part of this process of consultation, and the overwhelming response was positive, confirming the value of 'WAVE' as the overall framework for enterprise, innovation and networks. Where suggestions were made, we are looking to act upon them and to improve our services, for example, by cutting back on duplication and streamlining the system of grants in my department.

As a Government, we shall take forward the development of this framework, by looking not only at what we do, but at how we operate, and, in particular, at how we deliver for our customers. The creation of my new department has allowed us to introduce a step change in the quality of support available, with the emphasis very much on outcomes and not processes. I believe that we have brought together the best of the merging bodies—the practices, standards, customer service and, most importantly, the people—to form a single new organisation. What 'WAVE' does is to provide that organisation with a clear vision of a vibrant Welsh economy, delivering strong and sustainable economic growth.

One key area of work for the newly created department will be to embed this vision into the programmes, policies and action plans that will deliver the ambitions set out in this framework document. This process has already begun with the department's business plan for 2006-07 and the development of a

ddweud wrthym am ba hyd mae wedi bod yn dod â ffigurau incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario i'r hen Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a'r hen Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd fel tystiolaeth o economi sy'n tyfu? Pryd y dyfynnwyd hwy ganddo gyntaf fel prawf o dwf yn yr economi?

Andrew Davies: Mae Alun Cairns mor anfoddog yn ei ymyriadau ag ydyw ym mhopeth arall. Byddaf yn cyflwyno portffolio llawn o wybodaeth i'r pwyllgor bob amser. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud bod Alun a'i gyd-Aelodau yn aml i'w gweld yn methu â deall yr ystadegau nac chydabod eu gwerth. Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori'n helaeth am 'WAVE', gan gynnal 50 o seminarau gyda rhanddeiliaid a chwsmeriaid allweddol. Cafwyd dros 140 o ymatebion ysgrifenedig fel rhan o'r broses ymgynghori hon, ac yr oedd y mwyafrif llethol yn gadarnhaol, gan gadarnhau gwerth 'WAVE' fel y fframwaith cyffredinol ar gyfer menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau. Lle y gwnaed awgrymiadau, yr ydym yn bwriadu gweithredu arnynt a gwella'n gwasanaethau, er enghraifft, drwy leihau dyblygu a thrwy symleiddio'r system grantiau yn fy adran i.

Fel Llywodraeth, byddwn yn parhau i ddatblygu'r fframwaith hwn, drwy edrych nid yn unig ar yr hyn a wnawn, ond ar y ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio, ac yn arbennig ar y ffordd yr ydym yn darparu ar gyfer ein cwsmeriaid. Mae creu fy adran newydd i wedi ein galluogi i gyflwyno newid mawr yn safon y cymorth sydd ar gael, a'r pwyslais i raddau helaeth iawn ar ganlyniadau, nid ar brosesau. Credaf ein bod wedi dwyn ynghyd yr agweddau gorau ar y cyrff a unwyd—yr arferion, y safonau, y gwasanaeth gwsmeriaid ac, yn bwysicach na dim, y bobl—i ffurfio un sefydliad newydd. Yr hyn y mae 'WAVE' yn ei wneud yw rhoi i'r sefydliad hwnnw weledigaeth glir o economi Cymru sy'n ffynnu, gan sicrhau twf economaidd cryf a chynaliadwy.

Un maes gwaith allweddol ar gyfer yr adran newydd fydd ymgorffori'r weledigaeth hon yn y rhaglenni, y polisiau a'r cynlluniau gweithredu a fydd yn cyflawni'r uchelgeisiau sydd wedi'u gosod allan yn y ddogfen fframwaith hon. Mae'r broses hon eisoes wedi dechrau gyda chynllun busnes yr adran

number of complementary strategies, such as the new Wales transport strategy, evidence-based policy making and Challenge, which has always been a key priority for me as a Minister. Challenge will be guided by the new ministerial advisory groups, chaired respectively by Richard Parry Jones and Keith Brookes, and by a sharpened policy and strategy capability. The fact that we have attracted people of such competence and expertise reflects the huge opportunities in Wales to influence Government.

Key actions set out in 'WAVE' to deliver our priorities of increasing employment and earnings are, first, that we shall continue to support job creation and to help individuals to tackle barriers that obstruct their participation in the world of work—for example, we shall support new capital investment projects that create or safeguard jobs in assisted areas of Wales. As a result of the merger with the Assembly sponsored public bodies, we are bringing all capital grants together into one single flexible investment fund for business, in the invest Wales business area, to improve customer service and to streamline delivery. The second priority is our determination to continue investing to regenerate communities and stimulate economic growth across Wales. The consultation showed widespread support for our emphasis on tailoring economic development programmes to meet different local circumstances; for example, in the Heads of the Valleys area, we are working in partnership with the local authorities and the private and voluntary sectors to create a vibrant economic landscape, offering new opportunities for a well-educated, skilled and healthy population. This is a model for regeneration and one that we would wish to extend in future over a wider area of the south Wales Valleys; we will also look to use that model in other parts of Wales.

We shall help businesses to grow and to increase value added per job and earnings by using a wide range of measures. These include investing in our transport networks and other economic infrastructures, including the £8 million, 15-year investment

ar gyfer 2006-07 a datblygu nifer o strategaethau ategol, megis strategaeth drafnidiaeth newydd Cymru, llunio polisïau ar sail tystiolaeth a Her, sydd wedi bod yn brif flaenoriaeth erioed i mi fel Gweinidog. Caiff Her ei arwain gan y grwpiau cynghori gweinidogol newydd, dan gadeiryddiaeth Richard Parry Jones a Keith Brookes, a chan allu polisi a strategaeth craffach. Mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi denu pobl gyda'r fath allu ac arbenigedd yn adlewyrchu'r cyfleoedd enfawr yng Nghymru i ddylanwadu ar Lywodraeth.

Y camau allweddol sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn 'WAVE' i gyflawni ein blaenoriaethau o gynyddu cyflogaeth ac enillion, yn gyntaf, yw y byddwn yn parhau i gefnogi creu swyddi ac i helpu unigolion i fynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau sy'n atal eu cyfranogi ym myd gwaith—er enghraifft, byddwn yn cefnogi prosiectau buddsoddi cyfalaf newydd sy'n creu neu'n diogelu swyddi mewn ardaloedd yng Nghymru a gynorthwyr. O ganlyniad i'r uno â'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, yr ydym yn dwyn ynghyd ein holl grantiau cyfalaf yn un gronfa fuddsoddi hyblyg ar gyfer busnes, yn ardal fusnes Buddsoddi Cymru, i wella gwasanaeth i gwsmeriaid a symleiddio'r darparu. Yr ail flaenoriaeth yw ein penderfyniad i barhau i fuddsoddi i adfywio cymunedau ac ysgogi twf economaidd ledled Cymru. Yr oedd yr ymgynghori'n dangos cefnogaeth eang i'n pwyslais ar deilwra rhaglenni datblygu economaidd yn ôl gwahanol amgylchiadau lleol; er enghraifft, yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda'r awdurdodau lleol a'r sectorau preifat a gwirfoddol i greu hinsawdd economaidd ffyniannus, gan gynnig cyfleoedd newydd ar gyfer poblogaeth hyddysg, fedrus ac iach. Mae hwn yn fodel ar gyfer adfywio ac yn un y dymunem ei estyn ymhellach dros ardal ehangach yng Nghymoedd y de; byddwn hefyd yn ystyried defnyddio'r model hwnnw mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

Byddwn yn cynorthwyo busnesau i dyfu a chynyddu gwerth ychwanegol fesul swydd ac enillion drwy ddefnyddio ystod eang o fesurau. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys buddsoddi yn ein rhwydweithiau cludiant a'n seilweithiau economaidd eraill, gan gynnwys

programme to deliver a first-class integrated transport system throughout Wales. We shall continue to attract more high-valued-added functions to Wales and to support companies and sectors with strong growth potential. This objective will be greatly assisted by the new knowledge bank for business, which targets existing companies that can make best use of public sector support to generate economic growth across Wales. We are also determined to secure further improvement of our skills base—I am working closely on that with my ministerial colleague, Jane Davidson—and to use the opportunities created by the mergers to deliver more demand-led training, tailored specifically to the needs of business. We shall also help them to become more competitive by supporting other drivers to business growth, namely, entrepreneurship, innovation and investment, as well as international trade. We are committed to focusing our resources where they can have the greatest impact and to increasingly encouraging an investment culture. Finally, we will also ensure that all economic programmes and policies support sustainable development, particularly by encouraging clean-energy generation and resource efficiency.

In conclusion, I think that 'WAVE' is a well-researched strategic framework, based on sound analysis of the Welsh economy. The amendments that have been proposed should all be rejected as they are either inaccurate, inappropriate or, certainly in my judgment, do not add value to 'WAVE' or the Welsh economy. 'WAVE' sets out our priorities to raise employment, income and prosperity by creating a favourable business environment, including support for manufacturing, exports, tourism, new start-up businesses, strong and vibrant communities, as well as town centres. Moreover, the Assembly Government has a statutory duty to promote sustainable development, and 'WAVE' aims to ensure that all its economic programmes support sustainable development by integrating consideration of the social and environmental with a more traditional economic analysis.

y rhaglen fuddsoddi gwerth £8 miliwn dros 15 mlynedd i ddarparu system gludiant integredig o'r safon uchaf ledled Cymru. Byddwn yn parhau i ddenu mwy o swyddogaethau gwerth ychwanegol uchel i Gymru, ac i gefnogi cwmnïau a sectorau sydd â photensial cryf i dyfu. Cynorthwyr yr amcan hwn yn fawr gan y gronfa wybodaeth newydd i fusnesau, sy'n targedu cwmnïau presennol sy'n gallu gwneud y defnydd gorau o gefnogaeth gan y sector cyhoeddus i greu twf economaidd ledled Cymru. Yr ydym hefyd yn benderfynol o sicrhau gwelliant pellach yn ein sail sgiliau—yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos ar hynny gyda fy nghyd-Weinidog, Jane Davidson—ac i ddefnyddio'r cyfleoedd a grëir gan yr uno i ddarparu hyfforddiant yn cael ei arwain gan y galw wedi'i deilwra'n arbennig at anghenion busnes. Byddwn hefyd yn eu cynorthwyo i fod yn fwy cystadleuol drwy gefnogi ffactorau eraill sy'n ysgogi twf busnes, sef entrepreneuriaeth, arloesi a buddsoddi, yn ogystal â masnach ryngwladol. Yr ydym wedi ymrwmo i ganolbwyntio ein hadnoddau lle y gallant gael yr effaith fwyaf, ac i annog diwylliant buddsoddi'n gynyddol. Yn olaf, byddwn hefyd yn sicrhau y bydd pob rhaglen a pholisi economaidd yn cefnogi datblygu cynaliadwy, yn arbennig drwy annog creu ynni glân ac effeithlonrwydd adnoddau.

I gloi, credaf fod 'WAVE' yn fframwaith strategol sydd wedi ei ymchwilio'n dda, wedi'i seilio ar ddadansoddiad cadarn o economi Cymru. Dylid gwrthod yr holl welliannau a gynigwyd gan eu bod yn wallus, yn amhriodol neu, yn sicr yn fy marn i, yn methu ag ychwanegu gwerth at 'WAVE' nac at economi Cymru. Mae 'WAVE' yn gosod ein blaenoriaethau i gynyddu cyflogaeth, incwm a ffyniant drwy greu amgylchedd busnes ffafriol, gan gynnwys cefnogaeth i fyd gweithgynhyrchu, allforion, twristiaeth, busnesau newydd, cymunedau cryf a bywiog, yn ogystal â chanol trefi. At hynny, mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddyletswydd statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, a nod 'WAVE' yw sicrhau bod ei holl raglenni economaidd yn cynnal datblygu cynaliadwy drwy gyfuno ystyriaeth o agweddau cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol â dadansoddiad economaidd mwy traddodiadol.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.10 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.10 p.m.*

In conclusion, I invite the Assembly to note the development of the Assembly Government's strategic framework for economic development, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', and our determination as a Government to continue to improve people's quality of life across the whole of Wales.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 2: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran cyflawni ei thargedau economaidd allweddol ers iddi ddod i rym, a'i methiant o ran sicrhau digon o arian cyfatebol o Drysorlys y DU ar gyfer ei rhaglen Amcan 1 ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i:

a) defnyddio cyllid cydgyfeirio'n well ar gyfer y rownd nesaf drwy sicrhau bod Trysorlys y DU yn darparu arian cyfatebol; a

b) pwysleisio pwysigrwydd busnesau brodorol i wella'r economi.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gogleuni'r cynnydd mewn costau ynni a'r rhagolygon ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd, yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod datblygu cynaliadwy ac ystyriaethau amgylcheddol yn ganolog i'w holl bolisiau economaidd.

Mae'r ddadl hon—os dadl hefyd—yn dweud popeth am wendid y sefydliad hwn. Dyma gynnig di-ddim am ddogfen a gafodd ei chyhoeddi saith mis yn ôl. Mae'r ddogfen allan i ymgynghori arni, ond ni chyhoeddwyd ymateb y Llywodraeth eto. Hefyd, ym mis Ionawr, dywedodd y Gweinidog mai fframwaith strategol oedd 'WAVE', ac y byddai cynllun gweithredu yn cael ei gynhyrchu i gyd-fynd a'r ddogfen, ond nid oes golwg o hwnnw ychwaith. Efallai y buasai'n well peg i hongian dadl megis hon arno.

I gloi, gwahoddaf y Cynulliad i sylwi ar ddatblygiad fframwaith statudol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', a'n penderfyniad fel Llywodraeth i barhau i wella ansawdd bywyd pobl ledled Cymru.

Alun Ffred Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to deliver its key economic targets since it came to power, and its failure to secure adequate matched funding from the UK Treasury for its Objective 1 programme and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to:

a) make better use of convergence funding for the next round by ensuring that the UK Treasury provides matched funding; and

b) emphasise the importance of indigenous businesses in improving the economy.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

in light of increases in energy costs and predictions for climate change, calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that sustainable development and environmental considerations are central to all its economic policies.

This debate—if it is a debate—tells us everything about the weakness of this establishment. We have a motion of little substance on a document that was published seven months ago. The document is out for consultation, but the Government's response is yet to be published. Also, in January the Minister said that 'WAVE' was a strategic framework, and that an implementation scheme would be produced to coincide with the document, but there is no sign of that either. That might have been a better peg on which to hang a debate like this.

Serch hynny, mae 'WAVE' wedi ei chanmol fel disgrifiad o'r sefyllfa fel y mae hi. Yn sicr, mae gwybodaeth gefndirol angenrheidiol ynddi. Fodd bynnag, dyna ydyw, yn bennaf, ac mae'n arddangos yr un gwendidau, ac efallai'r un cryfderau, â chynllun gofodol Cymru o ran hynny. Mae hynny hefyd yn disgrifio rhai o nodweddion Cymru, ond yn cynnig fawr o arweiniad na gweledigaeth i'r dyfodol. Ble ydym am fynd, a sut, yn arbennig, mae cyrraedd yno? I rannau helaeth o Gymru, nid oes gan 'WAVE' ddim byd i'w ddweud.

Yn amlwg, un peth y mae 'WAVE' yn berthnasol iddo yw'r cronfeydd cydgyfeirio, ac mae'n rhaid gwneud gwell defnydd o hynny y tro nesaf. A yw 'WAVE' yn cynnig yr arweiniad hwnnw? Beth yn union sy'n digwydd gyda dogfen fframwaith strategol Prydain, y fframwaith cyfeirio strategol cenedlaethol, o ran y cronfeydd cydgyfeirio a'i pherthnasedd i 'WAVE'? Byddwn yn gobeithio y gallai'r Gweinidog ein goleuo ni heddiw parthed sefyllfa'r ddogfen honno.

Wrth fynd heibio, ni ddylem golli golwg ar rai o lwyddiannau rhaglen Amcan 1. Mae'n werth nodi bod Gwynedd, er enghraifft, wedi llwyddo i sgorio'n uwch ar bob un pennawd bron na chyfartaledd Cymru dan arweiniad ei chynghor sir, yn cydweithio'n glòs gyda phartneriaid sector preifat a'r sector gwirfoddol a Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru. Dangoswyd beth sy'n bosibl; dyna Blaid Cymru ar waith. Weinidog, gofynnaf hyn unwaith eto: pa ran y bydd y cynllun gofodol a themâu rhanbarthol a adnabuwyd gan y grwpiau yn chwarae wrth benderfynu ar y cynlluniau strategol hynny fydd yn cael cefnogaeth o dan y cronfeydd cydgyfeirio?

Yn ddigon teg, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffigurau cyflogaeth, ac mae'n honni llwyddiant wrth ostwng nifer y di-waith, ond rhan yn unig o'r darlun yw hynny.

The big picture is still depressingly gloomy in much of west Wales and the Valleys. The First Minister's target on gross domestic product per capita, that is, to achieve 90 per cent of the UK average by 2010, has apparently been ditched, and GDP/GVA is even derided as a means of measuring

Nonetheless, 'WAVE' has been praised as a description of the current situation. It certainly contains essential background information. However, that is what it is in the main, and it demonstrates the same weaknesses, and perhaps the same strengths, as the Wales spatial plan in that regard. That, too, describes some of Wales's characteristics, but offers very little by way of leadership or vision for the future. Where do we want to go, and how, in particular, will we get there? 'WAVE' has nothing to say about large parts of Wales.

Clearly, one thing to which 'WAVE' is relevant is the convergence funds, and better use must be made of that next time. Does 'WAVE' offer that guidance? What exactly is happening with the strategic framework document for Britain, the national strategic reference framework, with regard to the convergence funds and its relevance to 'WAVE'? I would hope that the Minister could enlighten us today as to the situation with regard to that document.

In passing, we should not lose sight of some of some successes in the Objective 1 programme. It is worth noting that Gwynedd, for example, has succeeded in scoring higher than the Welsh average under almost every heading under the leadership of its county council, working closely with private and voluntary partners and the Welsh European Funding Office. It has demonstrated what is possible, and is an example of Plaid Cymru in action. Minister, I ask this once again: what role will the spatial plan and the regional themes identified by the groups play in deciding the strategic plans which will be supported under the convergence funds?

In all fairness, the Minister referred to the employment figures, and he claims success in reducing unemployment, but that is only part of the picture.

Mae'r darlun ehangach yn ddu iawn o hyd mewn llawer rhan o orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. Ymddengys fod targed y Prif Weinidog ar gyfer cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen, hynny yw, i gyflawni 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y DU erbyn 2010, wedi ei fwrw heibio, ac mae cynnyrch mewnwladol

economic wellbeing. However, while it is still the method used by the EU to measure the economic health of regions, it cannot be dismissed just because the figures for west Wales and the Valleys remain stubbornly low—the lowest in the UK, and still low even by the standards of an enlarged EU.

Even the employment figures hide the quality and nature of the new jobs created. Why would the impact on GVA be so negligible otherwise? This is the big challenge for us now: to create good quality, sustainable jobs in communities the length and breadth of Wales, and ‘WAVE’ tells us very little about how we are to achieve this. ‘WAVE’ claims that Wales has exceeded the Lisbon agenda targets in job creation, but is that true? As is the case in the rest of the UK, our manufacturing base has been further eroded with the recent gloomy news from Ebbw Vale, Llantrisant and Llanelli. It is ironic that Gordon Brown is visiting Blaenau Gwent today—the architect of Labour’s economic policy who has failed to give the workers of the UK the same rights as their EU counterparts.

Before I close, I will mention the need to grow an indigenous business base: this is the best bulwark against the vagaries of the global market. Again, I concede that the Minister has started down this road but this is a long-term strategy that should have been started decades ago, but the Tories and Labour refused to even contemplate the idea of economic planning for Wales. The people of the Valleys and rural Wales are paying the price of that betrayal.

In conclusion, ‘WAVE’ reminds me of a family that knows that it wants to go somewhere warm, sunny and prosperous but does not know where that land lies or how to get there. ‘WAVE’ brings together a great deal of facts about the situation of the Welsh economy but there is a danger that we are collecting all the facts but have no idea what to do with them: paralysis through analysis. The time has surely come to do some

crynswth/gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn destun sbort hyd yn oed fel modd i fesur lles economaidd. Fodd bynnag, er ei fod yn dal i gael ei ddefnyddio gan yr UE i fesur iechyd economaidd rhanbarthau, ni ellir ei wrthod dim ond am fod y ffigurau ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd yn aros yn ystyfnig o isel—yr isaf yn y DU, ac yn isel o hyd, hyd yn oed yn ôl safonau’r UE ar ôl ehangu.

Mae hyd yn oed y ffigurau diweithdra yn cuddio ansawdd a natur y swyddi newydd sydd wedi eu creu. Pam y byddai’r effaith ar werth ychwanegol crynswth mor fach fel arall? Dyma’r her fawr inni yn awr: creu swyddi cynaliadwy o safon mewn cymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru, ac ychydig iawn y mae ‘WAVE’ yn ei ddweud wrthym sut y byddwn yn cyflawni hyn. Mae ‘WAVE’ yn honni bod Cymru wedi rhagori ar dargedau agenda Lisboa i greu swyddi, ond a yw hynny’n wir? Fel yng ngweddill y DU, mae ein sylfaen weithgynhyrchu wedi crebachu ymhellach gan y newyddion trist yn ddiweddar o Lynebwy, Llantrisant a Llanelli. Mae’n eironig fod Gordon Brown—pensaer polisi economaidd Llafur sydd wedi methu â rhoi’r un hawliau i weithwyr yn y DU ag sydd gan eu cymheiriaid yn yr UE—heddiw yn ymweld â Blaenau Gwent.

Cyn imi gloi, byddaf yn sôn bod angen tyfu sylfaen o fusnesau cynhenid: dyna’r ffordd orau i’n hamddiffyn ein hunain rhag mympwyon y farchnad fyd-eang. Eto, yr wyf yn cydnabod bod y Gweinidog wedi dechrau ar hyd y llwybr hwn, ond mae hon yn strategaeth hirdymor y dylid bod wedi dechrau arni ddegawdau’n ôl. Ond yr oedd y Torïaid a Llafur yn gwrthod hyd yn oed ystyried y syniad o gynllunio economaidd ar gyfer Cymru. Mae pobl y Cymoedd a chefn gwlad Cymru yn talu’r pris am y bradychiad hwnnw.

I gloi, mae ‘WAVE’ yn fy atgoffa o deulu sy’n gwybod ei fod am fynd i rywle cynnes, braf a ffyniannus ond nad yw’n gwybod ble mae’r lle hwnnw na sut i’w gyrraedd. Mae ‘WAVE’ yn dwyn ynghyd nifer o ffeithiau am sefyllfa’r economi yng Nghymru, ond mae perygl ein bod yn casglu’r holl ffeithiau ond heb syniad yn y byd beth i’w wneud â hwy: gorddadansoddi yn atal gweithredu. Mae’n sicr yn hen bryd inni ddechrau

planning rather than cobbling together everything that is going on and calling it a strategy.

Alun Cairns: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the drop in manufacturing output in Wales while the sector in the rest of the UK is growing and expresses concern at the falls in the index of production, construction, manufacturing, as well as the increase in unemployment over the last 12 months and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise its failures and revise its strategies accordingly.

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that Wales is now the poorest region of the UK when measured by the internationally recognised economic indicator of GVA.

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the further widening of the growth in the value of exports between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that statutory registration in the tourism sector would have a negative impact on the economy of tourist areas and therefore opposes any plan for statutory registration in the tourism sector.

I want to take a constructive approach to this debate. In taking a constructive approach, any individual writing a strategy needs to know where they are, where they want to get to and the route that they want to take to get there. Once that is concluded, there should be an action plan and a timescale by which it would be achieved. The difficulty with 'WAVE' is that it does not contain that. It has a good analysis and an effective list of aspirations but, in terms of how we get there, the timescales and the policies are missing. That

cynllunio yn hytrach na thafllu popeth sy'n digwydd at ei gilydd a'i alw'n strategaeth.

Alun Cairns: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y gostyngiad yn y cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru tra bo'r sector yng ngweddill y DU yn tyfu, ac yn mynegi pryder am ostyngiadau yn y mynegai cynhyrchu, adeiladu, gweithgynhyrchu a hefyd y cynnydd mewn diweithdra dros y 12 mis diwethaf, ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod ei methiannau ac adolygu ei strategaethau yn unol â hynny.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y ffaith mai Cymru erbyn hyn yw rhanbarth tlotaf y DU o'i mesur ar sail y dangosydd economaidd GVA, a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol.

Cynigiau welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod y twf yng ngwerth allforion rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig wedi ehangu ymhellach.

Cynigiau welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi y byddai cofrestru statudol yn y sector twristiaeth yn cael effaith negyddol ar economi ardaloedd twristiaeth ac felly'n gwrthwynebu unrhyw gynllun ar gyfer cofrestru statudol yn y sector twristiaeth.

Yr wyf am fod yn adeiladol tuag at y ddadl hon. Wrth fod yn adeiladol, bydd angen i unrhyw unigolyn sy'n ysgrifennu strategaeth wybod ble y mae, i ble y mae am fynd a'r llwybr y mae am ei ddilyn i gyrraedd yno. Pan fydd hynny wedi'i gwblhau, dylai fod cynllun gweithredu ac amserlen ar gyfer ei gyflawni. Yr anhawster gyda 'WAVE' yw nad yw'n cynnwys hynny. Mae'n cynnwys dadansoddiad da a rhestr effeithiol o ddyheadau, ond o ran sut i gyrraedd yno, mae'r amserlenni a'r polisiau ar goll. Dyna

is the weakness of this policy and of 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'.

Our starting point has got to be 'A Winning Wales', because that is where we came from last time. That policy failed in terms of the details of action plans on how to get there, but at least it was pretty specific in terms of where it wanted to get to. It had that target of getting to 90 per cent of UK gross value added by 2010; that target was underlined in chapter 5 of the document, entitled 'Targets' where it says that success would mean achieving 90 per cent of UK GVA by 2010. Furthermore, in the debate that proposed that document, the First Minister was explicit about its being a target. So, clearly, that is where we start off in terms of the economic development strategy.

In his introduction, the Minister said that he believes that, since 1999, he has made tangible and remarkable progress, both actual and relative. Let us break that down. When we look at the data, we see that that is not quite the case. In terms of the trend of information, I readily admit that it is not right to look at one-off, quarterly changes in either direction, and the Minister has rightly said that at many meetings and during many Assembly debates, but we need to look at the trends. However, Minister, is it not the reality that we have now got to the state where, whichever trend you are addressing, be it economic activity, the index of manufacturing, manufacturing output, the value of exports or unemployment, the gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom is widening. That must be the measure. Unless we accept that and take it as our starting point, what hope do we have when we are looking towards the aspirations in the document? I notice that the Minister is shaking his head; I would happily accept an intervention on those points if he wants to seek to correct them, or perhaps he is waiting for an e-mail from a civil servant or special adviser to tell him what line he should be taking on it. In the quarterly statistical reports that he brings to the committee, the trends are quite obvious in terms of the widening gap between Wales and the rest of the United Kingdom.

wendid y polisi hwn a 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'.

Ein man cychwyn wrth raid yw 'Cymru'n Ennill', oherwydd dyna oedd ein sylfaen y tro diwethaf. Methodd y polisi hwnnw ym manylion cynlluniau gweithredu ar gyfer cyrraedd yno, ond o leiaf yr oedd yn benodol iawn o ran i ble yr oedd am fynd. Yr oedd iddo'r targed hwnnw o gyrraedd 90 y cant o werth ychwanegol crynswth y DU erbyn 2010; amlinellwyd y targed hwnnw ym mhennod 5 yn y ddogfen, a elwir yn 'Targedau' lle mae'n dweud y byddai llwyddiant yn golygu cyrraedd 90 y cant o GYC y DU erbyn 2010. At hynny, yn y ddatl a gynigiodd y ddogfen honno, yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn bendant ynglŷn â'i osod yn darged. Felly, yn amlwg, dyna ein man cychwyn o ran y strategaeth datblygu economaidd.

Yn ei gyflwyniad dywedodd y Gweinidog ei fod yn credu, er 1999, iddo wneud cynnydd pendant a nodedig, yn wirioneddol ac yn gymharol. Gadewch inni ddadansoddi hynny. Pan edrychwn ar y data, gwelwn nad felly y mae. O ran tuedd gwybodaeth, cyfaddefaf ar unwaith nad yw'n iawn edrych ar newidiadau untro, chwarterol i'r naill gyfeiriad neu'r llall, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn ddigon cywir wedi dweud hynny mewn llawer cyfarfod ac yn ystod llawer datl yn y Cynulliad. Ond mae angen inni edrych ar y tueddiadau. Fodd bynnag, Weinidog, onid y gwir yw ein bod mewn sefyllfa yn awr lle mae'r bwlch rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn ehangu, waeth pa duedd yr ydych yn edrych arni, boed yn weithgaredd economaidd, y mynegai gweithgynhyrchu, cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu, gwerth allforion neu ddiweithdra. Rhaid i hynny fod yn ffon fesur. Oni dderbyniwn hynny a'i gymryd fel ein man cychwyn, pa obaith sydd gennym pan fyddwn yn anelu at y dyheadau yn y ddogfen? Sylwaf fod y Gweinidog yn ysgwyd ei ben; byddwn yn barod i dderbyn ymyriad ar y pwyntiau hynny os yw am geisio'u cywiro. Ond efallai ei fod yn aros am e-bost gan was sifil neu gynghorydd arbenigol i ddweud wrtho sut y dylai ymateb. Yn yr adroddiadau ystadegol chwarterol y daw â hwy i'r pwyllgor, mae'r tueddiadau'n hollol mlwg o ran y bwlch sy'n ehangu rhwng Cymru a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

4.20 p.m.

Coming back to what 'A Winning Wales' had and what gave it an element of credibility, namely the target of having 90 per cent of UK GVA by 2010, that was what every policy was aiming at. We all know that the Minister and this tired Government is not going to achieve it. Repeating the same old, tired policies means that we will not achieve that target. The Minister knows that he is not going to achieve it, so what he has done? He has decided to move the goalposts. We are no longer measuring UK GVA, which is the internationally recognised standard, used by the European Commission, as Alun Ffred said, and across the globe. GVA is the recognised standard in terms of wealth and prosperity, but the Minister has now decided to come up with the gross domestic household income. I intervened earlier to ask him when he started using this as a measure, and he knows that he only recently brought it before the committee, because, when he went through all the standard measures in his quarterly report, there was clearly not a single positive measure that he could show on a trend basis. That is why he has now decided, in desperation, to come up with this gross domestic household income as the measure that we must use to measure success. That smacks of desperation, Minister; you have overcome the issue of stating that we should not look at sporadic changes month on month, or quarter on quarter, because those trends exist, and you are highlighting a completely new measure.

Let us look at what the business community has said—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Let us not, because your time has run out. You can finish, if you do so very quickly.

Alun Cairns: Finally, the Confederation of British Industry, the Federation of Small Businesses and the Institute of Chartered Accountants, among other bodies, namely the leading bodies in relation to business interests in Wales, have been very critical of

I ddychwelyd at yr hyn yr oedd 'Cymru'n Ennill' yn ei gynnwys a'r hyn a oedd yn ei wneud yn lled gredadwy, sef y targed o gael 90 y cant o GYC yn y DU erbyn 2010, dyna oedd nod pob polisi. Gwyddom i gyd nad yw'r Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth ddiffygiol hon yn mynd i'w gyflawni. Mae ailadrodd yr un hen bolisiau diffygiol yn golygu na fyddwn yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Gŵyr y Gweinidog nad yw'n mynd i'w gyrraedd, felly, beth mae wedi ei wneud? Mae wedi penderfynu newid y rheolau. Nid ydym yn mesur GYC y DU mwyach, sef y safon a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol ac a ddefnyddir gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, ac ar draws y byd. GYC yw'r safon gydnabyddedig o ran cyfoeth a ffyniant, ond mae'r Gweinidog wedi penderfynu defnyddio'r incwm aelwydydd mewnwladol crynswth yn awr. Ymyrrais yn gynharach i ofyn iddo pryd y dechreuodd ddefnyddio hwn fel mesur. Gŵyr mai'n ddiweddar y cafodd ei gyflwyno gerbron y pwyllgor, oherwydd, pan ystyriodd yr holl fesurau safonol yn ei adroddiad chwarterol, yr oedd yn amlwg nad oedd yr un mesur cadarnhaol y gallai ei ddangos ar sail tuedd. Dyna pam y mae'n awr, mewn anobaith, wedi penderfynu defnyddio'r incwm aelwydydd mewnwladol crynswth hwn fel y mesur y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddefnyddio i fesur llwyddiant. Dengys hynny anobaith llwyr, Weinidog; yr ydych wedi datgan na ddylem edrych ar newidiadau achlysurol yn fisol, nac yn chwarterol, oherwydd bod y tueddiadau hynny'n bodoli, ac yr ydych yn thynnu sylw at fesur cwbl newydd.

Gadewch inni edrych ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y gymuned fusnes—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni beidio â gwneud hynny, oherwydd mae eich amser wedi dod i ben. Gallwch orffen, os gwnewch hynny'n gyflym iawn.

Alun Cairns: Yn olaf, mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a Sefydliad y Cyfrifyddion Siartredig, ymhlith cyrff eraill, sef y prif gyrff sy'n gysylltiedig â buddiannau busnes yng Nghymru, wedi bod yn feirniadol iawn o'r

the lack of detail, the timescale and the policy that will take the Minister to where he wants to get.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: More Members will be able to contribute if succinct speeches are made.

Michael German: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 8: add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to target support at new businesses in growth sectors.

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to give greater priority to infrastructure, particularly transport, projects in the next round of European structural funding.

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to do more to help the economic revitalisation of town centres and to ensure that town centres remain economically viable.

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

instructs the Assembly Government to develop a green jobs strategy, and to do more to assist and promote green businesses and industries.

The key issue for me is the fact that we are, in the middle of June, debating a document that was issued at the beginning of November 2005. Seven and a half months on, what are we trying to debate? Is this a debate on economic development in general or on a document that is already seven and a half months old? In fact, why are we bothering to debate a paper of this sort today, when we should be taking a response to this report, stating what the business community, the general public and the economic environment says in Wales. I could have accepted that. At the same time, we could have had progress

diffyg manylion, yr amserlen a'r polisi a fydd yn mynd â'r Gweinidog i'r man y mae am ei gyrraedd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gall mwy o Aelodau gyfrannu os gwneir areithiau byr.

Michael German: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 8: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu cymorth penodol i fusnesau newydd mewn sectorau twf.

Cynigiau welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i brosiectau seilwaith, a phrosiectau trafnidiaeth yn benodol, yn y cylch ariannu strwythurol Ewropeaidd nesaf.

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i wneud mwy i helpu gydag adfywio economaidd canol trefi ac i sicrhau bod canol trefi'n parhau'n economaidd hyfyw.

Cynigiau welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd, a gwneud rhagor i gynorthwyo a hyrwyddo busnesau a diwydiannau gwyrdd.

Y mater allweddol i mi yw'r ffaith ein bod, ganol mis Mehefin, yn trafod dogfen a gyhoeddwyd ddechrau mis Tachwedd 2005. Saith mis a hanner yn ddiweddarach, beth yr ydym yn ceisio'i drafod? Ai dadl ar ddatblygu economaidd yn gyffredinol yw hon, neu ar ddogfen sydd wedi'i chyhoeddi ers saith mis a hanner bellach? A dweud y gwir, pam yr ydym yn trafferthu trafod papur o'r fath heddiw, pan ddylem fod yn trafod ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn, yn nodi beth mae'r gymuned fusnes, y cyhoedd a'r amgylchedd economaidd yng Nghymru yn ei ddweud. Gallwn fod wedi derbyn hynny. Ar

on the delivery of this report. Looking through the document, the key chapter for me is chapter 4, 'Delivery on the Framework' because that is what matters—getting things done. However, chapter 4 is the shortest chapter in the whole report, apart from the progress report, which is even shorter, and the final part on assessing progress. Those are the three shortest chapters in the report.

There could have been a better debate today. I am tempted to say that the Business Manager put this debate in place as a filler debate, when we should have had a much more stringent debate on economic policy, which would have given us some meat to debate today.

Let us look at where this document is deficient. First, what we should have had today, and what this document lacks, is a focus on European funding, which was not present when it was written. However, we know about that funding now and the key interests of future economic development, particularly of west Wales and the Valleys, lie in what happens between 1 January 2007 and December 2013. We are six months shy of January 2007, so surely we should be debating how we will use that enormous economic leverage and where we will apply it that is different from before. That is what I expected to hear in this debate today.

Furthermore, why is this document absolutely silent on state aids? For the future of investment in our industry from 1 January 2007 to 31 December 2013, the state aids map is crucial. We are in the middle of a negotiation with the Department of Trade and Industry about the whole of east Wales: Cardiff, the Vale of Glamorgan, Powys, Monmouthshire and Newport, right through to Flintshire and Wrexham. We are currently in debate about whether or not the public sector will be able to support private sector industry and development in those areas and whether or not we will go for the whole of east Wales or parts of it and, if so, which parts of it. However, we hear nothing about that because this document was written

yr un pryd, gallem fod wedi gwneud cynnydd i gyflawni'r adroddiad hwn. O edrych drwy'r ddogfen, y bennod allweddol imi yw pennod 4, 'Cyflawni'r Fframwaith', oherwydd dyna sy'n cyfrif—cyflawni pethau. Fodd bynnag, pennod 4 yw'r bennod fyrraf yn yr adroddiad cyfan, ar wahân i'r adroddiad ar gynnydd, sydd hyd yn oed yn fyrrach, a'r rhan olaf ar asesu cynnydd. Dyna'r tair pennod fyrraf yn yr adroddiad.

Gellid bod wedi cael gwell dadl heddiw. Caf fy nhemtio i ddweud bod y Trefnydd wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon heddiw fel dadl lanw, pan ddylem fod wedi cael dadl lawer llymach ar bolisi economaidd. Byddai hynny wedi rhoi rhywbeth o sylwedd inni ei drafod heddiw.

Gadewch inni edrych ar ddiffygion y ddogfen hon. Yn gyntaf, yr hyn y dylem fod wedi'i gael heddiw, a'r hyn sy'n brin yn y ddogfen hon, yw ffocws ar arian Ewropeaidd, nad oedd ar gael pan gafodd ei hysgrifennu. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom am yr arian hwnnw bellach ac mae buddiannau allweddol datblygu economaidd yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, yn dibynnu ar yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd rhwng 1 Ionawr 2007 a Rhagfyr 2013. Mae chwe mis cyn Ionawr 2007, felly, mae'n sicr y dylem fod yn trafod sut y byddwn yn defnyddio'r fantais economaidd enfawr honno a ble y byddwn yn ei defnyddio sy'n wahanol i'r hyn ydoedd gynt. Dyna yr oeddwn yn disgwyl ei glywed yn y ddadl hon heddiw.

At hynny, pam nad yw'r ddogfen hon yn cyfeirio o gwbl at gymorth y wladwriaeth? O ran dyfodol buddsoddi yn ein diwydiant o 1 Ionawr 2007 i 31 Rhagfyr 2013, mae map cymorth y wladwriaeth yn hanfodol. Yr ydym wrthi'n trafod ar y cyd â'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ynglŷn ag ochr ddwyreiniol Cymru yn gyfan: Caerdydd, Bro Morgannwg, Powys, sir Fynwy a Chasnewydd, hyd at sir y Fflint a Wrecsam. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn trafod a fydd y sector cyhoeddus yn gallu cefnogi diwydiant a datblygiad y sector preifat yn yr ardaloedd hynny, ac a fyddwn yn cwmpasu ochr ddwyreiniol Cymru yn gyfan neu rannau ohoni, ac os felly, pa rannau. Fodd bynnag, ni chlywn ddim byd am hynny oherwydd

before that discussion took place. We need to hear about those issues but we are not doing so. That is why I feel let down by having to debate this document today.

There are a few issues where I think that the document could be far bolder. We talk about research and development, which is crucial. In the example of Continental Teves in Ebbw Vale, it was quite clear that the fact that one of the factories in the chain, in Germany, had a research and development section attached to it was why that factory was saved, although it produced virtually identical products to the factory in Ebbw Vale. That is an indication that we need to be doing more in that area. The question that both Ministers have to answer is why does the Welsh university sector gets less of the cake than it deserves in the research funding that comes for the whole of the United Kingdom? That is something that we need to address, along with the question of why we are not doing as well as other parts of the United Kingdom in that area.

On skills in small and medium-sized enterprises, we know that training is crucial if we are going to help them to develop. For example, Ford in Bridgend is likely to invest in the skills of its workforce and in new training, but a three or four-person business is unlikely to have the ability, in cash terms, to be able to invest in retraining, or to be able to release people to go for retraining unless it is in their own time. We need to address those shorter-term issues, and we needed to see some response in this document.

So, in conclusion, I would look for delivery from this document. I do not see it, and the tide seems to be somewhat stationary rather than a wave overwhelming us and the economic development coming as we would expect it. The added value is not in this document yet, and I would have hoped for better from the Minister.

Carl Sargeant: I welcome the 'WAVE' document, which illustrates the Labour

ysgrifennwyd y ddogfen hon cyn cael y drafodaeth honno. Mae angen inni glywed am y materion hynny, ond nid yw hynny'n digwydd. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi fy siomi am fod yn rhaid inni drafod y ddogfen hon heddiw.

Mae yna ychydig faterion lle y credaf y gallai'r ddogfen fod lawer yn fwy pendant. Soniwn am ymchwil a datblygu, sy'n hanfodol. Yn achos Continental Teves yng Nglynebwy, yr oedd yn amlwg iawn mai'r rheswm pam yr achubwyd un o'r ffatrioedd yn y gadwyn, yn yr Almaen, oedd oherwydd bod ganddi adran ymchwil a datblygu, er ei bod yn cynhyrchu cynnyrch a oedd bron yn union yr un fath â'r cynnyrch yn ffatri Glynebwy. Mae hynny'n dangos ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud mwy yn y maes hwnnw. Y cwestiwn y mae'n rhaid i'r ddau Weinidog ei ateb yw pam mae sector prifysgolion Cymru yn cael llai na'i haeddiant o'r arian ymchwil ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan? Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag ef, ynghyd â'r cwestiwn pam nad ydym yn gwneud cystal â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn y maes hwnnw.

O ran sgiliau mewn mentrau bach a chanolig, gwyddom fod hyfforddiant yn hanfodol os ydym i'w helpu i ddatblygu. Er enghraifft, mae Ford ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn debygol o fuddsoddi yn sgiliau ei weithlu ac mewn hyfforddiant newydd, ond mae busnes sydd â thri neu bedwar o bobl yn annhebygol o feddu ar y gallu, yn ariannol, i fuddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant sgiliau newydd, neu i ryddhau pobl i gael hyfforddiant sgiliau newydd oni bai eu bod yn gwneud hynny yn eu hamser eu hunain. Rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r materion tymor byrrach hynny, ac yr oedd angen inni weld rhywfaint o ymateb yn y ddogfen hon.

Felly, i gloi, byddwn yn disgwyl i'r ddogfen hon gyflawni pethau. Ni welaf hynny, ac ymddengys ein bod yn aros yn ein hunfan, heb unrhyw ddatblygiadau mawr a heb y datblygu economaidd fel y byddem yn ei ddisgwyl. Nid yw'r gwerth ychwanegol yn y ddogfen hon eto, a byddwn wedi gobeithio am well gan y Gweinidog.

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddogfen 'WAVE', sy'n dangos gwaith

Assembly Government's strategic work for economic development in Wales. It is typical of opposition Members' whingeing that they do not recognise success in the economy of Wales and how well we have done. There are some simple facts with which I will start my contribution.

Since the Assembly was established in 1999, the Welsh economy has undergone a dramatic transformation, with over 100,000 more people in employment today. Wales's unemployment rate has fallen from 30 per cent above the UK average, and is now below that average. Average earnings have increased by over 10 per cent in real terms, and exports have grown faster in Wales than anywhere else in the UK. That is a remarkable achievement.

Janet Ryder: Will you take an intervention?

Carl Sargeant: In a little while, Janet. Let me get into it; 30 seconds is not bad.

Despite Westminster retaining authority over key areas of the macro-economic framework within which business operates, most notably in fiscal policy and other areas of regulation, the Assembly has overriding authority over transport, planning and the labour market and research and development. We have seen a significant improvement in the Welsh economy since 1999, which is testimony to the Welsh Assembly Government's management of these areas. Since 1999, the Welsh Assembly Government has made an excellent start in modernising the Welsh economy and providing a diverse, competitive, high added value, high-skilled economy that responds to sustainable development opportunities and spreads economic prosperity throughout Wales.

Janet Ryder: Thank you for giving way, Carl, and for giving us that good-news story. I hope that you will include in that good-news story the fact that the economic policy of the Labour Government has been so successful that it has created, in Ynys Môn, an area that has the lowest GVA in the UK, which has still left Wales at the bottom of the EU countries for GVA. Where will that

Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad dros ddatblygu economaidd yng Nghymru. Mae'n nodweddiadol fod Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n cwyno nad ydynt yn cydnabod llwyddiant yr economi yng Nghymru a'r ffyniant sydd wedi digwydd. Mae yna rai ffeithiau syml, a dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad drwy eu nodi.

Ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999, mae economi Cymru wedi gweld trawsnewid dramatig, ac mae dros 100,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn cyflogaeth heddiw. Mae cyfradd ddiweithdra Cymru wedi gostwng o 30 y cant yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU, ac mae bellach yn llai na'r cyfartaledd. Mae enillion cyfartalog wedi cynyddu dros 10 y cant mewn termau real, ac mae allforion wedi tyfu'n gyflymach yng Nghymru nag yn unrhyw fan arall yn y DU. Mae hynny'n gyflawni aruthrol.

Janet Ryder: A wnewch chi gymryd ymyriad?

Carl Sargeant: Ymhen ychydig, Janet. Gadewch imi barhau; nid yw 30 eiliad yn ddrwg.

Er bod San Steffan yn cadw awdurdod dros feysydd allweddol yn y fframwaith macro-economaidd y mae busnesau'n gweithredu o'i fewn, ac yn bennaf ei pholisi cyllidol a meysydd rheoleiddio eraill, gan y Cynulliad y mae'r prif awdurdod dros drafnidiaeth, cynllunio a'r farchnad lafur ac ymchwil a datblygu. Gwelsom welliant sylweddol yn economi Cymru er 1999, sy'n brawf o reolaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y meysydd hynny. Er 1999, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dechrau'n ardderchog i foderneiddio economi Cymru a darparu economi amrywiol, gystadleuol lle mae gwerth ychwanegol uchel, sgiliau uchel sy'n ymateb i gyfleoedd datblygu cynaliadwy, ac sy'n lledu ffyniant economaidd ledled Cymru.

Janet Ryder: Diolch ichi am ildio, Carl, ac am roi inni'r newyddion da hynny. Gobeithio y byddwch yn cynnwys yn y newyddion da hynny y ffaith fod polisi economaidd y Llywodraeth Lafur mor llwyddiannus nes iddi greu, yn Ynys Môn, ardal sydd â'r GYC isaf yn y DU, sy'n golygu bod Cymru o hyd ar waelod gwledydd yr UE o ran GYC. Ble y bydd hynny'n ymddangos yn eich rhestr o

figure in your list of successes?

Carl Sargeant: Janet, yet again, you are highly critical of the Welsh Assembly Government's policies, but Plaid Cymru has nothing to offer.

We need to build on our successes, and I will highlight some aspects of industry in Alyn and Deeside, although I am sure that they are relevant to the whole of Wales. I will not mention Airbus, Alun Cairns, though I will if you want me to. I welcome the high priority given to transport in the 'WAVE' document, and we must not forget the rail infrastructure. My colleague, Karen Sinclair, and I have been big supporters of the Wrexham to Bidstone line in Flintshire and Wrexham. Transport, principally roads, remains a constant priority for industry, not just in Wales but throughout the UK. Transport is crucial to business success, and it is crucial that the infrastructure is in place.

4.30 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: Will you give way?

Carl Sargeant: Yes, in a minute; stop shouting. [*Laughter.*]

Delays cost money, and efficient transport links are a crucial factor in investment decisions. We need to bring Wales closer to existing potential markets through transport improvements, and to ensure a truly mobile workforce. However, all decisions relating to transport need to be more sensitive to the communities on which any construction will impact—I am referring in particular to the way in which the A55 and A494 trunk road impacts parts of my constituency.

Eleanor Burnham: How embarrassed would you have felt, as I did a few weeks ago with a Dutch businessman, when the crap rolling stock was in such bad repair that one lorry was locked and the other one was blocked? What does that tell a businessman from Holland about transport in Wales?

lwyddiannau?

Carl Sargeant: Janet, unwaith eto, yr ydych yn feirniadol iawn o bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond nid oes gan Plaid Cymru ddim i'w gynnig.

Rhaid inni adeiladu ar ein llwyddiannau, a thynnaf sylw at rai agweddau ar y diwydiant yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, er fy mod yn siŵr eu bod yn berthnasol i Gymru gyfan. Ni chrybwyllaf Airbus, Alun Cairns, er y gwnaf os hoffech imi wneud hynny. Croesawaf y flaenoriaeth uchel a roddwyd i drafnidiaeth yn y ddogfen 'WAVE', ac ni ddylem anghofio'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Karen Sinclair, a minnau wedi bod yn fawr ein cefnogaeth i'r llinell o Wrecsam i Bidstone yn sir y Fflint, ac yn Wrecsam. Mae cludiant, yn enwedig ar y ffyrdd, yn dal yn flaenoriaeth i ddiwydiant, nid yng Nghymru'n unig ond ledled y DU. Mae cludiant yn hanfodol i lwyddiant busnesau, ac mae'n hanfodol cael y seilwaith yn ei le.

Eleanor Burnham: A ildiwch?

Carl Sargeant: Gwnaf, ymhen munud; peidiwch â gweiddi. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae oedi'n costio arian, ac mae cysylltiadau cludiant effeithiol yn ffactor hanfodol mewn penderfyniadau buddsoddi. Rhaid inni ddod â Chymru'n nes at farchnadoedd posibl presennol drwy wella cludiant, a sicrhau gweithlu gwirioneddol symudol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i bob penderfyniad am gludiant fod yn fwy sensitif i'r cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt gan waith adeiladu—cyfeiriaf yn arbennig at y modd y mae'r A55 a chefnffordd yr A494 yn effeithio ar rannau o'm hetholaeth i.

Eleanor Burnham: Faint o gywilydd y byddech wedi'i deimlo, fel y gwneuthum i ychydig wythnosau'n ôl gyda gŵr busnes o'r Iseldiroedd, pan oedd y cerbydau trên gwarthus mewn cyflwr mor wael fel yr oedd un toiled wedi'i gloi a'r llall wedi'i flocio? Beth mae hynny'n ei ddweud wrth ŵr busnes o'r Iseldiroedd am gludiant yng Nghymru?

Carl Sargeant: I am sure that the Dutch businessman was embarrassed to be travelling with you.

Since the launch of the 'WAVE' document, issues surrounding energy supply, security, and, most critically, cost have become of increasing concern to industry. The 'WAVE' strategy provides an increased focus on areas such as raising the quality of jobs as a means of improving the economy. However, business leaders tell us that we also need to improve the quality of the skills of people entering the workplace. I am pleased that the Assembly Government has an integrated approach to the economy and education.

However, I urge the Government not to undervalue the importance of so-called soft skills, or core skills, such as time-management, listening skills, communication and negotiation. Local businesses tell me that these skills, as well as high-end, quality skills, are increasingly sought after.

The Labour Government's 'WAVE' strategy is right. As I mentioned at the beginning of my contribution, the facts are that the Tories wrecked the economy, the Liberals just guess at the economy, and Plaid Cymru does not have a clue what to do with the economy. Under this Labour Assembly Government, the economic future is bright.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dyna enghraifft wych o pam na ddylem gredu fawr o'r hyn a ddywed Llafur yn y ddogfen hon ar yr economi. Mae geiriau Carl Sargeant yn enghraifft berffaith sy'n dangos mai'r unig ffordd yr ydych yn ateb eich gelynyon yw drwy ddweud pethau fel yr oedd yn ei awgrymu ar ddiwedd ei araith.

Un peth hynod o ddiddorol yw mai'r cyfan a ddywedodd y Gweinidog oedd na ddylem bleidleisio o blaid y gwelliannau; ni ddywedodd wrthym pam. Ni wnaeth hyd yn oed gyfeirio at gynnwys y gwelliannau, dim ond gofyn i Aelodau Llafur eu gwrthod gan eu bod yn dod oddi wrth y gwrthbleidiau.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gyfeirio at welliant 3, sy'n cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd cael arian cyfatebol ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 1. Yr

Carl Sargeant: Yr wyf yn siŵr fod y gŵr busnes o'r Iseldiroedd yn teimlo cywilydd wrth deithio gyda chi.

Ers lansio'r ddogfen 'WAVE', mae materion yn ymwneud â chyflenwi ynni, diogelwch, a chostau yn bennaf, wedi dod yn achos mwy a mwy o bryder i ddiwydiant. Mae strategaeth 'WAVE' yn rhoi mwy o ffocws ar feysydd megis codi safon swyddi fel modd i wella'r economi. Fodd bynnag, dywed arweinwyr busnes wrthym fod angen inni hefyd wella safon sgiliau pobl sy'n dod i mewn i'r gweithle. Yr wyf yn falch fod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ymagwedd integredig tuag at yr economi ac addysg.

Fodd bynnag, anogaf y Llywodraeth i beidio â thanbrisio pwysigrwydd yr hyn a elwir yn sgiliau meddal, neu sgiliau craidd, megis rheoli amser, sgiliau gwranddo, cyfathrebu a negodi. Dywed busnesau lleol wrthyf fod mwy a mwy o alw am y sgiliau hyn, yn ogystal â'r uwch sgiliau o safon.

Mae'r strategaeth 'WAVE' gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn gywir. Fel y soniais ar ddechrau fy nghyfraniad, y ffaith yw fod y Torïaid wedi dinistrio'r economi, dim ond dyfalu am yr economi y mae'r Rhyddfrydwyr, ac nid oes gan Blaid Cymru syniad beth i'w wneud â'r economi. O dan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad hwn, mae dyfodol disglair i'r economi.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: There we had an excellent example of why we should not believe much of what Labour says in this document on the economy. Carl Sargeant's comments are a perfect example showing that the only way you respond to your enemies is to say things like his suggestions at the end of his speech.

One extremely interesting point is that all the Minister said is that we should not vote in favour of the amendments; he did not tell us why. He did not even refer to the contents of the amendments; he just asked Labour Members to reject them, since they have been tabled by the opposition parties.

However, I will refer to amendment 3, which refers to the importance of having match funding for the Objective 1 programme. I was

oeddwn yn synnu—fel yr oedd Mike German—na wnaeth y Gweinidog, ar unrhyw bwynt yn ei araith, hyd y cofiaf, sôn am bwysigrwydd arian Amcan 1 ar gyfer y cyfnod sydd wedi bod, nac ychwaith am yr arian sy'n dod o 2007 ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hynod bwysig ein bod yn ymwybodol o fethiant y Llywodraeth.

Nick Bourne: Does the fact that there has been no mention of this European funding not say volumes about this Government's approach? Does it not underline the fact, on the day that Gordon Brown has gone to Blaenau Gwent—and it is interesting that Rhodri Morgan has not yet gone—that no approach has been made to him about the funding that we will need to ensure that the money that is coming to Wales will be put to useful effect? We will not get any extra money—the Government has made no appeal at all. Is that not the truth?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is absolutely the truth. It is remarkable that all that the Minister did was dismiss the opposition amendments without so much as an argument. He did not even mention the need for match funding for European funding, because he is not prepared to go to Gordon Brown and say that Wales desperately needs that match funding to make the best use of Objective 1 money.

Let us examine what happened since the first round of Objective 1 was given to Wales. A bid was made at that point for match funding, but it was rejected by Gordon Brown. What did that mean to the Welsh block? It meant that for every single year of that programme, this Government has had to find £65 million from public funds to ensure that there was sufficient match funding, on top of what was coming from the private sector, and on top of what was coming from the voluntary sector, to ensure that that programme worked. What does that mean? It means that over the lifetime of the programme, over £400 million has had to come from health and education in order to meet the match funding requirements of this Government. If it does not make a bid for match funding for the next round, that means that another £400 million has to come from health and education. Why is this Minister silent on this vital issue? Is he not

surprised—as was Mike German—that the Minister did not, at any time in his speech, as far as I recall, make any reference to the importance of Objective 1 funding for the period just past, nor did he mention the funding to come from 2007. However, it is extremely important that we are aware of the Government's failure.

Nick Bourne: Onid yw'r ffaith na fu unrhyw sôn am yr arian Ewropeaidd hwn yn siarad cyfrolau am ymagwedd y Llywodraeth hon? Onid yw'n tanlinellu'r ffaith, ar y diwrnod yr aeth Gordon Brown i Flaenau Gwent—ac mae'n ddi-ddorol nad yw Rhodri Morgan wedi mynd eto—na chysylltwyd ag ef ynglŷn â'r arian y bydd arnom ei angen i sicrhau y caiff yr arian a ddaw i Gymru ei ddefnyddio'n ddoeth? Ni chawn unrhyw arian ychwanegol—nisd yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud unrhyw apêl o gwbl. Onid dyna'r gwir?

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Dyna'r gwir yn hollol. Mae'n rhyfeddol mai'r cyfan a wnaeth y Gweinidog oedd diystyru gwelliannau'r gwrthbleidiau heb ddadl hyd yn oed. Ni soniodd hyd yn oed am yr angen am arian i gyfateb i arian Ewropeaidd, am nad yw'n fodlon mynd at Gordon Brown i ddweud bod ar Gymru angen dybryd am yr arian cyfatebol hwnnw er mwyn gwneud y defnydd gorau o arian Amcan 1.

Gadewch inni archwilio'r hyn a ddigwyddodd ers rhoi'r cylch cyntaf o Amcan 1 i Gymru. Gwnaed cais am arian cyfatebol bryd hynny, ond fe'i gwrthodwyd gan Gordon Brown. Beth a olygodd hynny i floc Cymru? Golygodd fod y Llywodraeth, am bob blwyddyn yn y rhaglen honno, wedi gorfod dod o hyd i £65 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus i sicrhau bod digon o arian cyfatebol, yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a ddeuai o'r sector preifat, ac yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a ddeuai o'r sector gwirfoddol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y rhaglen honno'n gweithio. Beth mae hynny'n ei olygu? Mae'n golygu, dros gyfnod y rhaglen, fod dros £400 miliwn wedi gorfod dod o gronfeydd iechyd ac addysg er mwyn bodloni gofynion arian cyfatebol y Llywodraeth hon. Os na wnaiff gais am arian cyfatebol ar gyfer y cylch nesaf, golyga hynny y bydd yn rhaid i £400 miliwn arall ddod o'r cronfeydd iechyd ac addysg. Pam

prepared to stand up now for Wales and say to the Treasury, 'We need that match funding in order to make the best use of Objective 1 money'?

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you not see this convergence money from Europe—£1.5 billion over the next seven years—as extra investment in Wales? Can you not see it being used strategically by the Welsh Assembly Government to benefit life within Wales? You cannot bring yourself to see it in that way.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: It is not extra money; it is money to which we are entitled. Let us make it absolutely clear that the reason why we are entitled to another round of convergence money is your Government's failure to raise the GDP of Wales. What we are saying is, given that we have had a second chance, should we not make better use of it the second time around? Why should we have to raid the education and health budgets in order to make up for the failure of this Minister and the First Minister to fight for extra money for Wales under convergence funding? Why is it going to be even more important the second time around? It will be even more important because of the effect of the Barnett formula. The Barnett formula will squeeze Wales over the next four years to the extent that, by the end of the next convergence period, if we continue with the same level of increases in education that we have had over the last period, we will be spending less per head in Wales than in England.

When we came into the Assembly in 1999, we were significantly ahead in terms of health and education. By 2007-13, if the current profile of spending continues, the Assembly Government, if it is still in office, will be spending less per head on education and health because of the failure to go for match funding and the failure to look at the consequences of the Barnett formula. We are not asking the Government to give this good-news story, which no-one out there recognises; we are asking it to go to the Treasury and say, 'Wales deserves this money; why are you letting us down?'.

mae'r Gweinidog hwn yn dawel ar y mater pwysig hwn? Onid yw'n fodlon sefyll yn awr dros Gymru a dweud wrth y Trysorlys, 'Mae arnom angen yr arian cyfatebol hwnnw er mwyn gwneud y defnydd gorau o arian Amcan 1'?

Jeff Cuthbert: Onid ydych yn gweld yr arian cydgyfeirio hwn o Ewrop—£1.5 biliwn dros y saith mlynedd nesaf—fel buddsoddiad ychwanegol yng Nghymru? Oni allwch ei weld yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n strategol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella bywyd yng Nghymru? Ni allwch ddiodef ei weld felly.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid arian ychwanegol mohono; mae'n arian y mae gennym hawl iddo. Gadewch inni ei gwneud yn hollol glir mai'r rheswm y mae gennym hawl i gylch arall o arian cydgyfeirio yw methiant eich Llywodraeth i godi CMC Cymru. Dyma yr ydym yn ei ddweud: gan ein bod wedi cael ail gyfle, oni ddylem ei ddefnyddio'n well yr ail dro? Pam y dylem dynnu arian o'r cyllidebau addysg ac iechyd i wneud iawn am fethiant y Gweinidog hwn a'r Prif Weinidog i frwydro dros arian ychwanegol i Gymru o dan arian cydgyfeirio? Pam y bydd hyd yn oed yn bwysicach yr ail dro? Bydd hyd yn oed yn bwysicach oherwydd effaith fformiwla Barnett. Bydd fformiwla Barnett yn gwasgu ar Gymru dros y pedair blynedd nesaf i'r fath raddau fel y byddwn, erbyn diwedd y cyfnod cydgyfeirio nesaf, os byddwn yn parhau â'r un lefel o gynnydd mewn addysg ag a gawsom yn ystod y cyfnod diwethaf, yn gwario llai y pen yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr.

Pan ddaethom i'r Cynulliad yn 1999, yr oeddem ar y blaen yn sylweddol o ran iechyd ac addysg. Erbyn 2007-13, os bydd y proffil gwariant presennol yn parhau, bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, os bydd yn dal mewn grym, yn gwario llai y pen ar addysg ac iechyd oherwydd y methiant i ymgeisio am arian cyfatebol a'r methiant i edrych ar ganlyniadau fformiwla Barnett. Nid ydym yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth adrodd y stori hon o newyddion da nad oes neb yn ei hadnabod; yr ydym yn gofyn iddi fynd at y Trysorlys a dweud, 'Mae Cymru'n haeddu'r arian hwn, pam yr ydych yn ein siomi?'.

Christine Chapman: There are two broad aspects behind the 'WAVE' strategy, and I strongly support both. First, it is about increasing employment even further, and, secondly, it is about raising the quality of jobs. We have made very good progress on the first, because when the Conservatives ceased control over the Welsh economy, our unemployment levels were 30 per cent higher than the UK average. We know that unemployment is now at or below the UK average, although we need to tackle the deeper problem of economic inactivity.

On Monday evening, I attended a business network event in Rhondda Cynon Taf, which the First Minister also attended. I was pleased to see that the statistics showed that, even in an area such as Rhondda Cynon Taf, which has high rates of deprivation, progress has been made between 2001 and this year.

On the second theme of quality of jobs, we need to do much more, particularly in the Valleys communities. Establishing better-paid jobs is crucial. We need higher levels of disposable income to trigger more spending for local businesses and increase the flow of customer and service-provider transactions to create a thriving economy in the Valleys.

4.40 p.m.

Through Objective 1 and the network of business support, I think that we have genuinely started to promote a culture of innovation and entrepreneurship in the Valleys, but this needs to continue and to be built upon. Like many Members in the Chamber, I very much welcome the new Heads of the Valleys strategy, for which all of us who are looking after the Heads of the Valleys areas in particular have really big ambitions. I will give you one example in my own area, namely the graduate teleworking initiative project, which is an Objective 1 project. It provides support for business in the early years, and is an excellent example of what can happen when you intervene to nurture entrepreneurial potential.

I wish to focus on business support in

Christine Chapman: Mae dwy agwedd yn fras ar y strategaeth 'WAVE', a chefnogaf y ddwy yn gryf. Yn gyntaf, mae'n golygu cynyddu cyflogaeth yn fwy fyth, ac yn ail, mae'n golygu codi safon swyddi. Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd da ar y cyntaf, oherwydd pan roddodd y Ceidwadwyr y gorau i reoli economi Cymru, yr oedd ein lefelau diweithdra 30 y cant yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU. Gwyddom fod diweithdra bellach ar yr un lefel â chyfartaledd y DU, neu hyd yn oed yn is, er bod angen inni fynd i'r afael â phroblem ddyfnach anweithgarwch economaidd.

Nos Lun, bûm mewn digwyddiad rhwydwaith busnes yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle yr oedd y Prif Weinidog hefyd yn bresennol. Yr oeddwn yn falch gweld bod yr ystadegau'n dangos bod cynnydd rhwng 2001 ac eleni, hyd yn oed mewn ardal fel Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle mae lefelau uchel o amddifadedd.

O ran yr ail thema'n ymwneud â safon swyddi, mae angen inni wneud llawer mwy, yn enwedig yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd. Mae sefydlu swyddi sy'n talu'n well yn hanfodol. Mae angen lefelau uwch o incwm i'w wario er mwyn ysgogi gwariant uwch i fusnesau lleol a chynyddu llif y trafodion cwsmeriaid a darparwyr gwasanaethau i greu economi ffyniannus yn y Cymoedd.

Drwy Amcan 1 a'r rhwydwaith o gymorth busnes, credaf ein bod yn wirioneddol wedi dechrau hybu diwylliant o arloesedd ac entrepreneuriaeth yn y Cymoedd, ond rhaid sicrhau bod hyn yn parhau ac y cael ei ddatblygu. Fel nifer o Aelodau yn y Siambr, croesawaf strategaeth newydd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, gan fod gan bob un ohonom sy'n gofalu am ardaloedd Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn arbennig ddyheadau mawr iawn ar eu cyfer. Rhoddaf un enghraifft o'm hardal fy hun, sef prosiect y menter telathrebu i raddedigion, sy'n brosiect Amcan 1. Mae'n rhoi cymorth i fusnesau yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, ac yn enghraifft ardderchog o'r hyn a all ddigwydd pan fyddwch yn ymyrryd i feithrin potensial entrepreneuriaidd.

Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar gymorth busnes yn

particular, and I have several points that I want to raise with the Minister. I accept the need to streamline business support and focus it on those businesses that are best placed to deliver the higher levels of added value that the Welsh economy needs. However, we must not give the impression that we are neglecting smaller businesses that want to start on the ladder. I know that the Minister attended and spoke at the B2B exhibition this morning—I was there later on, and had the opportunity to speak to representatives of a number of small businesses. I was very impressed by the level of innovation, and I am optimistic for the future of Wales, given the sort of companies that we now have. However, the message that is coming out is that they still need support at this very crucial time.

Minister, what does the shift in the approach to supporting the high value added function mean for the most deprived parts of Wales, such as my constituency? I know that many people will consider setting up a business as a way of becoming economically active and of growing the local economy. These people will often come from areas of social disadvantage, and I am interested in what you are doing to strongly retain factors of social justice, in terms of deprivation, in the way in which you are structuring business support.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Member for giving way and for the point that she made. Does she share the concern of the Welsh Conservative Party about the squeeze on funding made available to enterprise agencies that are there to support the communities and the business start-ups in the areas that you have highlighted?

Christine Chapman: Like you, Alun, I was involved in discussions with local enterprise agencies, but I know that the Minister and officials have talked through these issues. There may, possibly, have been some communication there that should have been a little better, but I am optimistic that the way forward is now much clearer. We have had some fairly major changes, but I am working closely with those agencies in my area.

arbennig, ac mae gennyf nifer o bethau yr hoffwn eu trafod gyda'r Gweinidog. Derbyniaf fod angen symleiddio cymorth busnes a sicrhau ei fod yn canolbwyntio ar y busnesau hynny sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i ddarparu'r lefelau uwch o werth ychwanegol y mae ar economi Cymru eu hangen. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem roi'r argraff ein bod yn esgeuluso busnesau llai sydd am ddechrau ar yr ysgol. Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn yr arddangosfa B2B y bore yma ac wedi siarad yno—yr oeddwn yno'n ddiweddarach, a chefais gyfle i siarad â chynrychiolwyr nifer o fusnesau bach. Creodd lefel yr arloesedd argraff fawr arnaf, ac yr wyf yn obeithiol am ddyfodol Cymru, o ystyried y mathau o gwmmniau sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, y neges sy'n dod i'r amlwg yw bod angen cymorth arnynt o hyd yn ystod y cyfnod pwysig iawn hwn .

Weinidog, beth mae'r newid hwn yn y dull o gefnogi'r swyddogaeth gwerth ychwanegol uchel yn ei olygu i ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru, fel fy etholaeth i? Gwn y bydd nifer o bobl yn ystyried sefydlu busnes fel ffordd i fod yn economaidd weithgar a datblygu'r economi leol. Daw'r bobl hyn yn aml o ardaloedd sydd o dan anfantais gymdeithasol, ac mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn yr hyn a wnewch i gynnal ffactorau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn gadarn, o ran amddifadedd, yn y ffordd yr ydych yn ailstrwythuro cymorth busnes.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am ildio ac am y pwynt a wnaeth. A yw hi, fel Plaid Geidwadol Cymru, yn pryderu am y gwasgu ar yr arian a ddarperir i asiantaethau menter i gefnogi'r cymunedau a'r busnesau sy'n cychwyn yn yr ardaloedd yr ydych wedi tynnu sylw atynt?

Christine Chapman: Fel chi, Alun, yr oeddwn yn rhan o drafodaethau gydag asiantaethau menter lleol, ond gwn fod y Gweinidog a swyddogion wedi trafod y materion hyn. Efallai bod rhywfaint o'r cyfathrebu a ddylasai fod ychydig yn well, ond yr wyf yn obeithiol fod y ffordd ymlaen bellach lawer yn gliriach. Yr ydym wedi cael rhai newidiadau cymharol fawr, ond yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r asiantaethau hynny yn fy ardal.

Finally, I would like to flag up this statistic: of the 50 businesses working as part of the Knowledge Bank for Business, none are from the Cynon valley, although I understand that two companies have been identified for potential inclusion in the future. Like other Members, I am optimistic about the way in which the 'WAVE' strategy is going, but we must ensure that we do not give the impression that our smaller businesses will lose out. As I said, I welcome this strategy and I am optimistic about the economy of Wales.

Lisa Francis: I want to address my comments particularly to our amendment 7, which deals with the tourism economy. It has been interesting to read the responses of business organisations to this 'WAVE' document. The Confederation of British Industry acknowledges that the private sector must undoubtedly be the key driver in striving for sustainable economic growth. We say amen to that. It is, after all, the private sector that will increase wealth and create new jobs. That means that it must be encouraged and supported, and not overburdened. It is timely to talk about tourism today; I do not know whether any Members have seen the *Western Mail* business section, which deals with tourism, but I will come to that later.

The Federation of Small Businesses states that, in its quest for sustainability, this Government must not force businesses into instituting measures that will see their viability suffer, and that educating businesses, and not enforcement, is the key to promoting sustainable practices. At a time when the business sector is being strangled by red tape and stifled by increasing taxation, this Government's proposal to introduce statutory registration for accommodation providers in Wales—which it has lately gone quiet about, so I assume that it is still one of its proposals—will be an example of enforcement rather than education.

There is always a need to drive up accommodation standards in Wales. No experience in hospitality can ever be too good. However, an added layer of regulation,

Yn olaf, hoffwn dynnu sylw ar yr ystadegyn hwn: o'r 50 o fusnesau sy'n gweithio fel rhan o'r Banc Gwybodaeth ar gyfer Busnes, nid oes un ohonynt o gwm Cynon, er y deallaf fod dau gwmni wedi eu nodi i'w cynnwys efallai yn y dyfodol. Fel yr Aelodau eraill, yr wyf yn ffyddiog am y ffordd y mae strategaeth 'WAVE' yn datblygu, ond rhaid inni sicrhau na rown yr argraff y bydd ein busnesau llai ar eu colled. Fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn croesawu'r strategaeth hon, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog am economi Cymru.

Lisa Francis: Hoffwn gyfeirio fy sylwadau yn arbennig at ein gwelliant rhif 7, sy'n ymdrin â'r economi dwristiaeth. Mae wedi bod yn ddiddorol darllen ymatebion sefydliadau busnes i'r ddogfen 'WAVE'. Mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn cydnabod nad oes amheuaeth nad y sector preifat yn sicr ddylai ddarparu'r ysgogiad allweddol wrth anelu at dwf economaidd cynaliadwy. Dywedwn amen i hynny. Wedi'r cyfan, y sector preifat a fydd yn cynyddu cyfoeth ac yn creu swyddi newydd. Golyga hynny fod angen ei annog a'i gefnogi, a pheidio â rhoi gormod o bwysau arno. Mae'n amserol siarad am dwristiaeth heddiw; ni wn a oes unrhyw Aelodau wedi gweld adran fusnes y *Western Mail*, sy'n ymdrin â thwristiaeth, ond dof at hynny'n ddiweddarach.

Mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn dweud na ddylai'r Llywodraeth hon, wrth geisio sicrhau cynaliadwyedd, orfodi busnesau i sefydlu mesurau a fydd yn golygu bod eu hyfywdra'n dioddef, ac mai addysgu busnesau, nid gorfodaeth, yw'r allwedd i hybu arferion cynaliadwy. Ar adeg pan gaiff y sector busnes ei grogi gan fiwrocratiaeth a'i dagu gan drethiant uwch, bydd cynnig y Llywodraeth hon i gyflwyno cofrestru statudol ar gyfer darparwyr llety yng Nghymru—nad yw wedi sôn amdano'n ddiweddar, felly tybiaf ei fod yn dal yn un o'i chynigion—yn enghraifft o orfodi yn hytrach nag addysgu.

Mae angen codi safonau llety yng Nghymru bob amser. Ni all unrhyw brofiad mewn lletygarwch fyth fod yn rhy dda. Fodd bynnag, ni fydd haen ychwanegol o

enforced by a Government that does not understand how business works, will not improve those standards. Moreover, I remind Members that the cheapest quote for the statutory registration scheme, when it was last looked at by the Economic Development and Transport Committee, or whatever it calls itself these days, two years or so ago, was £712,000 per annum. Will the Government undertake the enforcement of the scheme itself or will it get the local authorities to do it? We never got an answer to that one. Do local authorities have the manpower to do it, let alone the desire? I recall that an option of contracting out carrying out inspections to third parties was looked at two years ago. Where does the added cost to business end? This poses many unanswered questions. The Minister tells us, in his tourism strategy, that he wants to focus on excellence, yet he could do that through encouragement and support, not enforcement. A harmonised grading scheme that was universally understood would be the best way forward, and I will tell you why: if statutory registration goes ahead, and there is resistance from business in respect of compliance, the additional costs incurred by the Government in enforcement could be considerable. It could mean a big outlay with nothing much achieved at the end; in fact, rather like this 'WAVE' document.

Minister, you also need to consider that the Lyons review of local authority funding has recommended a bed tax on accommodation providers—a levy designed to fund public transport schemes. If you stick this proposed 10 per cent tax per night on all accommodation providers, on top of the 17.5 per cent value-added tax that many already pay, you will be left with the UK becoming one of the highest taxed holiday destinations in Europe. Can Wales, which depends on tourism for £2.5 billion of income every year and the employment of 100,000 people, really afford such a burden of regulation? Can we afford a new tax that will add £100 to the cost of the holiday of an average family of four, and could wipe up to £50 million off annual Welsh accommodation revenues? Businesspeople have said that 'WAVE' lacks a cohesive strategy with a realistic timescale of things that are achievable. You have the

reoliadau, sy'n cael eu gorfodi gan Lywodraeth nad yw'n deall sut mae busnes yn gweithio, yn gwella'r safonau hynny. At hynny, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau mai'r dyfynbris rhataf ar gyfer y cynllun cofrestru statudol, pan edrychwyd arno ddiwethaf gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, neu beth bynnag yw ei enw erbyn hyn, tua dwy flynedd yn ôl, oedd £712,000 y flwyddyn. A fydd y Llywodraeth yn gwneud y gwaith o orfodi'r cynllun ei hun, neu a fydd yn gofyn i'r awdurdodau lleol wneud hynny? Ni chawsom ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw. A oes gan awdurdodau lleol ddigon o staff i'w wneud, heb sôn am yr awydd? Cofiaf fod dewis i osod contractau allan i drydydd partïon i wneud arolygiadau gael ei drafod ddwy flynedd yn ôl. A oes diwedd ar y gost ychwanegol i fusnes? Mae nifer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Dywed y Gweinidog wrthym, yn ei strategaeth dwristiaeth, ei fod am ganolbwyntio ar ragoriaeth, ond gallai wneud hynny drwy annog a chefnogi, nid gorfodi. System raddio unfurf y byddai pawb yn ei deall fyddai'r ffordd orau ymlaen, a dywedaf wrthy ch pam: os cyflwynir system gofrestru statudol, ac os bydd busnesau'n gwrthod cydymffurfio, gallai'r costau ychwanegol i'r Llywodraeth oherwydd gorfodi fod yn sylweddol. Gallai olygu gwariant sylweddol heb gyflawni fawr ddim yn y pen draw; sy'n debyg, mewn gwirionedd, i'r ddogfen 'WAVE' hon.

Weinidog, mae angen hefyd ichi ystyried bod adolygiad Lyons o gyllid awdurdodau lleol wedi argymhell treth gwelyau ar ddarparwyr llety—ardoll wedi'i chynllunio i ariannu cynlluniau cludiant cyhoeddus. Os gorfodwch y dreth arfaethedig hon o 10 y cant y noson ar bob darparwr llety, ar ben yr 17.5 y cant o dreth ar werth y mae nifer ohonynt eisoes yn ei thalu, y DU fydd un o'r cychfannau gwyliau uchaf ei drethi yn Ewrop. A all Cymru, sy'n dibynnu ar dwristiaeth am £2.5 biliwn o incwm bob blwyddyn a swyddi ar gyfer 100,000 o bobl, yn wir fforddio baich rheoleiddio o'r fath? A allwn fforddio treth newydd a fydd yn ychwanegu £100 at gost gwyliau teulu cyffredin o bedwar, ac a allai arwain at golli hyd at £50 miliwn o refeniw llety blyneddol yng Nghymru? Mae pobl fusnes wedi dweud nad oes yn 'WAVE' strategaeth gydlynus gydag amserlen realistig o bethau y gellir eu

power to change that, Minister. Scrap this proposed tax today, give us your assurance that it will not happen in Wales, and drop the statutory registration scheme.

Jeff Cuthbert: The long-term future of the Welsh economy relies on continued private and public sector partnership, geared towards implementing the strategic goals of the Assembly Government. Each side in this process, the Government and the private sector, must pull its weight if we are to succeed in our aims. The private sector in Wales cannot be a silent partner. If it takes grants to develop wealth, it must also begin to be an active partner in the delivery of social justice within our modern economy.

I have said many times before that delivering strong and sustainable economic growth will be such only if it is matched with a concurrent rise in basic and higher value added skills. We have a vital short-term issue to consider alongside 'WAVE' today: the baby-boomer generation is fast retiring, while considerable skills gaps remain in the current workforce, and the impact on our economy is clear. We will have to find innovative ways to maintain the high skilled jobs until our workforce retrains and the younger generation comes on stream. This is no easy task. A harsh market-driven economy waits for no-one.

As Chair of the Objective 1 programme monitoring committee, I am also pleased that 'WAVE' will be aided by a more strategic approach to the delivery of convergence funding in west Wales and the Valleys.

4.50 p.m.

There is no doubt that, if we want to achieve an increasingly skilled, innovative and entrepreneurial workforce, and an advanced technology and knowledge base, we must work to our strengths. Some 33 per cent of our entire population is to be found in the Valleys, and this is a great source of strength for many of the world's finest companies.

cyflawni. Gallwch newid hynny, Weinidog. Dilewch y dreth arfaethedig hon heddiw, rhowch sicrwydd inni na chaiff ei chyflwyno yng Nghymru, a rhowch y gorau i'r cynllun cofrestru statudol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae dyfodol hirdymor economi Cymru yn dibynnu ar bartneriaeth barhaus rhwng y sector preifat a'r sector cyhoeddus, sy'n anelu at weithredu nodau strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Rhaid i'r ddwy ochr yn y broses hon, y Llywodraeth a'r sector preifat, dynnu eu pwysau i gyrraedd ein nodau. Ni all y sector preifat yng Nghymru weithredu fel partner mud. Os yw'n cymryd grantiau i ddatblygu cyfoeth, rhaid iddo hefyd ddechrau bod yn bartner gweithredol wrth sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn ein heconomi fodern.

Dywedais lawer gwaith o'r blaen mai drwy gael cynnydd cydamserol mewn sgiliau sylfaenol a sgiliau gwerth ychwanegol uwch yn unig y gwelir twf economaidd cadarn a chynaliadwy. Mae gennym fater byrdymor hanfodol i'w ystyried ochr yn ochr â 'WAVE' heddiw: mae'r genhedlaeth a gynhyrchodd lawer iawn o fabanod yn cyflym ymddeol, ac mae bylchau sylweddol mewn sgiliau yn y gweithlu presennol o hyd, a'r effaith ar ein heconomi yn amlwg. Bydd yn rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd arloesol i gynnal y swyddi medrus iawn nes caiff ein gweithlu ei ailhyfforddi a nes daw'r genhedlaeth iau i ymuno ag ef. Nid yw'n dasg hawdd. Nid yw economi gystadleuol sy'n cael ei harwain gan y farchnad yn aros i neb.

Fel Cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Amcan 1, yr wyf hefyd yn falch gweld y bydd 'WAVE' yn cael cymorth dull strategol o gyflwyno arian cydgyfeirio yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd.

Os ydym am gael gweithlu cynyddol fedrus, arloesol ac entrepreneuriaidd, a sylfaen dechnoleg a gwybodaeth ddatblygedig, yna'n sicr rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar ein cryfderau. Mae tua 33 y cant o'n poblogaeth gyfan yn byw yn y Cymoedd, ac mae hyn yn gryfder sylweddol ynddo'i hun i nifer o gwmnïau gorau'r byd. Bydd strategaeth Blaenau'r

The Heads of the Valleys strategy, fuelled by strategic thinking and driven in part by European funding, will provide the perfect testing ground for the delivery of 'WAVE', for it will be in the Valley communities that I expect to see the first signs of 'WAVE' making the difference. The far more strategic approach to funding and development combined with the incredibly dedicated and hard-working workforce mean that the Valleys are the most obvious place to detect a resurgence.

While much in 'WAVE' is welcome, I believe that there could be more emphasis on social justice and its relationship to economic justice. The Bevan Foundation recently concluded that access to a job, the fair distribution of pay and other benefits, and the recognition and respect afforded to those in the workplace were essential to the promotion of social justice in the labour market—I endorse those sentiments. The critical actors in our economy are people, as workers and as consumers. Issues such as unpaid care work and voluntary work contribute immeasurably to the development of soft and basic skills, and impact upon our economy. The ways and means of assessing these skills and the contribution made should be found—we may then take a different view of our calculations towards gross domestic product.

Furthermore, in-work poverty, in which people have a job but remain in poverty, still blights our vision of a Wales in which the economic model is one in which high value added jobs dominate. How can we seek to achieve this step change when many people, particularly women, are still in this position? I am sad to say that in-work poverty in Wales has increased since the mid 1990s. Today, 37 per cent of those in income poverty live in households with at least one adult in work; that figure was 30 per cent in the mid 1990s, but I accept that what we included in the definition of what we call 'poverty' has also increased considerably since that time, and we have also had the introduction of the minimum wage. Nevertheless, low pay is clearly an issue to be tackled if men and, particularly, women are to access the sustainable economy that 'WAVE' seeks to

Cymoedd, yn cael ei thanio gan feddylfryd strategol a'i gyrru'n rhannol gan gyllid Ewropeaidd, yn fan arbrofi perffiaith ar gyfer cyflwyno 'WAVE', gan mai yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd y disgwyliaf weld yr arwyddion cyntaf fod 'WAVE' yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Mae'r dull llawer mwy strategol o ddefnyddio cyllid a datblygu ynghyd â'r gweithlu hynod ymroddedig a diwyd yn golygu mai'r Cymoedd yw'r lle mwyaf amlwg i sylwi ar adfywiad.

Er y dylid croesawu sawl rhan o'r ddogfen 'WAVE', credaf y gellid rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol a pherthynas hynny â chyfiawnder economaidd. Daeth Sefydliad Bevan i'r casgliad yn ddiweddar fod gallu cael swydd, dosbarthu cyflog a budd-daliadau eraill yn deg, a chydabod a pharchu pobl yn y gweithle yn hanfodol i hyrwyddo cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn y farchnad lafur—yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r egwyddorion hynny. Pobl yw'r cyfanogwyr hanfodol yn ein heconomi, fel gweithwyr ac fel defnyddwyr. Mae materion fel gwaith gofal di-dâl a gwaith gwirfoddol yn cyfrannu'n anfesuradwy at ddatblygu sgiliau meddal a sgiliau sylfaenol, ac yn effeithio ar ein heconomi. Dylid cael y dulliau i asesu'r sgiliau hynny a'u cyfraniad—efallai wedyn y byddem yn edrych yn wahanol ar ein cyfrifiadau o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth.

At hynny, mae tlodi mewn gwaith, lle y mae gan bobl swydd ond yn dal mewn tlodi, yn dal i lesteirio ein gweledigaeth o Gymru lle mae'r patrwm economaidd yn batrwm lle mae swyddi gwerth ychwanegol uchel yn hollbwysig. Sut y gallwn geisio cyflawni'r newid graddol a chynifer hwn o bobl, menywod yn arbennig, yn dal yn y sefyllfa hon? Yn anffodus, mae tlodi mewn gwaith yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu ers canol y 1990au. Heddiw, mae 37 y cant o bobl sydd mewn tlodi incwm yn byw mewn cartrefi lle y mae o leiaf un oedolyn yn gweithio; y ffigur cyfatebol oedd 30 y cant ganol y 1990au, ond derbyniam fod yr hyn a gynhwysem yn y diffiniad o'r hyn a alwn yn 'dlodi' hefyd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol ers hynny, ac mae'r isafswm cyflog hefyd wedi ei gyflwyno. Serch hynny, mae cyflog isel yn amlwg yn fater i fynd i'r afael ag ef os yw

engender.

Finally, I welcome 'WAVE' greatly, but we must continue to balance the need to strive for a modern and high-tech driven economy with the need to ensure that basic skill needs are met and our social justice goals not overlooked. However, once again, the people of the Valleys, and certainly Caerphilly, are looking to businesses in Wales to do their share and not just to comment from the sidelines. 'WAVE' commands all of us to sit up, listen and act.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I will call you to speak, Eleanor, but I must call the Minister to reply at 4.55 p.m..

Eleanor Burnham: Thank you for calling me to speak, even if it is only for a short interjection.

It is notable that the tracking indicators for sustainable development in annex B are still in the development phase. The Welsh Liberal Democrats would like to see an indicator similar to that used in Scotland, where its Government publishes an annual index that divides carbon dioxide emissions as the equivalent mass of carbon by total gross value added. I believe that sustainable development is crucial to the future of Wales and its people, and a green jobs strategy is certainly crucial to enabling both those balls to stay in the air. Minister, where is your green jobs strategy? Have you spoken to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, for instance, about ensuring that all new buildings are energy efficient? The Labour Assembly Government must put green jobs at the heart of Wales's future prosperity.

What is the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills doing to address the educational skills issue, which is so vital to increasing prosperity and which the Confederation of British Industry is disappointed about, as is the Federation of Small Businesses and the Institute of

dynion, a menywod yn arbennig, i fod yn rhan o'r economi gynaliadwy y mae 'WAVE' yn ceisio'i chynhyrchu.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn croesawu 'WAVE' yn gynnes iawn, ond rhaid inni barhau i gydbwysu'r angen am anelu at economi fodern yn cael ei llywio gan uwch dechnoleg â'r angen am sicrhau bod anghenion sgiliau sylfaenol yn cael eu diwallu, ac na chaiff ein nodau ar gyfer cyfiawnder cymdeithasol eu diystyru. Fodd bynnag, unwaith eto, mae pobl y Cymoedd, ac yn sicr Caerffili, yn disgwyl i fusnesau yng Nghymru wneud eu rhan, nid yn unig gwneud sylwadau ar y cyrion. Mae 'WAVE' yn gofyn i bob un ohonom godi, gwrando a gweithredu.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf arnoch i siarad, Eleanor, ond rhaid imi alw'r Gweinidog i ymateb am 4.55 p.m.

Eleanor Burnham: Diolch ichi am fy ngalw i siarad, hyd yn oed am gyfnod byr.

Mae'n nodedig fod y dangosyddion olrhain ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yn atodiad B yn dal i gael eu datblygu. Hoffai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru weld dangosydd tebyg i'r un a ddefnyddir yn yr Alban, lle y mae ei Llywodraeth yn cyhoeddi mynegai blynyddol sy'n rhannu gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid fel y mas cyfatebol o garbon â chyfanswm y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Credaf fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn hanfodol i ddyfodol Cymru a'i phobl, ac mae strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd yn sicr yn hanfodol i'n galluogi i wneud y ddau beth ar yr un pryd. Weinidog, ble y mae eich strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd? A ydych wedi siarad â'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, er enghraifft, ynglŷn â sicrhau bod pob adeilad newydd yn defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon? Rhaid i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad roi swyddi gwyrdd wrth wraidd ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol.

Beth y mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn ei wneud i ymdrin â'r mater sgiliau addysgol, sydd mor hanfodol i ffyniant parhaus ac sy'n destun siom i Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach a Sefydliad y Cyfrifwyr Siartredig? Ein neges i chi,

Chartered Accountants? Our message to you, Minister, is, 'Can do much better for Wales'.

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): It has been an interesting debate. The responses from opposition Members does not reflect the response that we have had from the overwhelming majority of respondents, particularly those in the business community who have welcomed the analysis and description of the Welsh economy as a foundation on which to build our economic policies. Therefore, to say that it is a thin document, as several people said, is just not true.

I despair, because I reported to committee on the status of this document and on the fact that it is a high-level strategic framework, which will inform the business plans of my department and those of other departments in the allocation of priorities. That was made clear on several occasions, as I am sure that the Chair of the committee will confirm. I also made it clear that one of the reasons for having the 'WAVE' document was for it to be a foundation for negotiation with the UK Government and the European Commission about the national strategic reference framework for the convergence programme. The NSRF contains many references to 'WAVE' as a foundation, so to say that it has no relationship to future funding, particularly to that of the convergence programme, is some way off.

Mark Isherwood: I will give you some comments about the universal support of the business sector and the basis of the document. The document states that it is not intended to be a detailed delivery plan. Why then does the CBI state that, for it to be credible, 'WAVE' should be an action plan? It is setting out our future economic development, so it should be framed as a business plan for Wales, with clear actions, costs and a timeframe within which it will operate. Why does the Federation of Small Businesses express concern that, as a policy framework rather than a strategy for defined measures and detailed direction for the Welsh economy, this document offers little to business?

Weinidog, yw 'Gall wneud lawer yn well i Gymru'.

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl ddiddorol. Nid yw'r ymatebion gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau yn adlewyrchu'r ymateb a gawsom gan fwyaftrif helaeth yr ymatebwyr, yn arbennig y rheini o'r gymuned fusnes sydd wedi croesawu'r dadansoddiad a'r disgrifiad o economi Cymru fel sylfaen i adeiladu ein polisïau economaidd arni. Felly, nid yw dweud ei bod yn ddogfen denau, fel y dywedodd sawl un, yn wir o gwbl.

Yr wyf yn anobeithio, oherwydd cyflwynais adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar statws y ddogfen hon, ac ar y ffaith ei bod yn fframwaith strategol lefel uchel a fydd yn llywio cynlluniau busnes fy adran a chynlluniau busnes adrannau eraill wrth ddyrannu blaenoriaethau. Eglurwyd hynny lawer gwaith, fel y gall Cadeirydd y pwyllgor gadarnhau, mae'n siŵr. Eglurais hefyd mai un o'r rhesymau dros gyflwyno'r ddogfen 'WAVE' oedd er mwyn iddi fod yn sylfaen ar gyfer trafod gyda Llywodraeth y DU a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynghylch y fframwaith cyfeirio strategol cenedlaethol ar gyfer y rhaglen cyfeiriant. Mae'r fframwaith yn cynnwys nifer o gyfeiriadau at 'WAVE' fel sylfaen, felly, mae dweud nad oes ganddi unrhyw gysylltiad â chyllid yn y dyfodol, yn arbennig cyllid y rhaglen cydgyfeiriant, yn amhriodol.

Mark Isherwood: Dyma ichi rai sylwadau am gefnogaeth gyffredinol y sector busnes a sail y ddogfen. Mae'r ddogfen yn dweud na fwriedir iddi fod yn gynllun darparu manwl. Pam, felly, y mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yn dweud, er mwyn iddi fod yn gredadwy, y dylai 'WAVE' fod yn gynllun gweithredu? Mae'n gosod allan ein datblygiad economaidd yn y dyfodol, felly, dylid ei llunio fel cynllun busnes ar gyfer Cymru, gyda chymau gweithredu, costau ac amserlen glir ar gyfer ei gweithredu. Pam mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn mynegi pryder nad oes gan y ddogfen hon, fel fframwaith polisi yn hytrach na strategaeth ar gyfer mesurau wedi eu diffinio a chyfeiriad manwl i economi Cymru, fawr

i'w gynnig i fusnes?

Andrew Davies: You should address those questions to the CBI and other business organisations. In the meetings that I have had with them, they recognise the analysis.

Andrew Davies: Dylech gyfeirio'r cwestiynau hynny at Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a sefydliadau busnes eraill. Yn y cyfarfodydd a gefais gyda hwy, maent yn cydnabod y dadansoddiad.

The comments of some Members today have not reflected comments made in committee, and I noted with interest Mike German's comment, which was in great contrast to the comments of his economic spokesperson—and I assume that she still is the economic spokesperson—who said in committee,

Nid yw sylwadau rhai Aelodau heddiw wedi adlewyrchu sylwadau a wnaed yn y pwyllgor, a sylwais gyda diddordeb ar sylw Mike German, a oedd yn hollol wahanol i sylwadau ei lefarydd economaidd—a chymeraf mai hi yw'r lefarydd economaidd o hyd—a ddywedodd yn y pwyllgor,

'It is very welcome that we have this strategy prior to the new round of European funding, and it will be hugely beneficial. What the Minister has said about this being the umbrella now for everything that drives forward policy in this area has to be of benefit...I welcome that very much'.

Croesewir y strategaeth hon cyn y cylch newydd o gyllid Ewropeaidd, a bydd yn fuddiol iawn. Rhaid bod budd yn yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog fod hwn yn awr yn gweithredu fel ymbarél gyfer popeth sy'n llywio polisi yn y maes hwn...croesawaf hynny'n fawr.

She then went on to make several references to welcoming this document, so members on the committee are not briefing either their leaders or the Members taking part in this debate.

Aeth ymlaen wedyn i gyfeirio droeon at groesawu'r ddogfen hon, felly, nid yw aelodau'r pwyllgor yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'w harweinwyr nac i'r Aelodau sy'n cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon.

Michael German: You have quoted something that happened six or seven months ago; I am referring to the fact that, today, we expected to have something meaty to develop and discuss and that is not in this document. We are supposed to be discussing the 'WAVE' document and, in terms of those issues, it has now passed by—the wave has gone.

Michael German: Yr ydych wedi dyfynnu rhywbeth a ddigwyddodd chwe neu saith mis yn ôl; yr wyf yn cyfeirio at y ffaith ein bod heddiw wedi disgwyl cael rhywbeth swmpus i'w ddatblygu a'i drafod, ac nid dyna sydd yn y ddogfen hon. Yr ydym i fod yn trafod y ddogfen 'WAVE', ac o ran y materion hynny, mae hi bellach wedi bod—mae'r don wedi hen fynd.

Andrew Davies: Clearly, Mike is slightly embarrassed by the fact that his economic spokesperson disagrees with him in terms of the response.

Andrew Davies: Yn amlwg, mae Mike yn teimlo ychydig gywilydd nad yw ei lefarydd economaidd yn cytuno ag ef ar yr ymateb.

The caricature of the Welsh economy as described by opposition Members is just that: a caricature. Alun Cairns raised a point about trends. He said that on every trend the gap is widening. It is not. If you look at employment growth, you will see that for most of the last three years, as was reflected in the figures published today, unemployment is below the UK average. If you look at economic inactivity and exports,

Rhaid cofio mai gwawdlun yw'r disgrifiad o economi Cymru gan Aelodau'r wrthblaid. Cododd Alun Cairns bwynt am dueddiadau. Dywedodd fod y bwlch yn ehangu ar bob tuedd. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Os edrychwch ar dwf cyflogaeth, fe welwch am y rhan helaethaf o'r tair blynedd diwethaf, fel yr adlewyrchwyd yn y ffigurau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw, fod lefelau diweithdra'n is na chyfartaledd y DU. Os edrychwch ar

you will see that export growth since 1999, when the Assembly was established, was at 37 per cent, and that has exceeded the growth—

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Andrew Davies: No, I am not taking any more interventions.

It has exceeded the growth for the rest of the UK. I know that there is this obsession with GVA, but I will just say—[*Interruption.*] No, I am not giving way.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister has about 30 seconds, otherwise this debate will lapse, so let him have his 30 seconds.

Andrew Davies: GVA remains a tracking indicator in 'WAVE'. The gap in GVA between Wales and the UK is at the narrowest that it has been since 1999, and it widened considerably under the Tories.

We have made substantial progress in the Welsh economy since devolution, with over 100,000 more people being in employment than was the case in 1999. We have a success story but we are not complacent, and 'WAVE' gives us a sound foundation for taking forward our future policies.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Amendment 1 has been withdrawn, and so I call for a vote on amendment 2.

anweithgarwch economaidd ac allforion, fe welwch fod allforion wedi cynyddu 37 y cant er 1999, pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad, a bod hynny'n fwy na thwf—

Alun Cairns: A ildiwch?

Andrew Davies: Na wnaif, ni chymeraf ragor o ymyriadau.

Mae'n fwy na'r twf ar gyfer gweddill y DU. Gwn fod yna ryw obsesiwn â gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, ond hoffwn ddweud—[*Torri ar draws.*] Na, nid wyf yn ildio.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae gan y Gweinidog tua 30 eiliad, neu fe ddaw'r ddadl hon i ben. Felly gadewch iddo gael ei 30 eiliad.

Andrew Davies: Mae gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn dal yn ddangosydd olrhain yn 'WAVE'. Mae'r bwlch mewn gwerth ychwanegol crynswth rhwng Cymru a'r DU ar ei leiaf er 1999, a chynyddodd yn sylweddol o dan y Toriaid.

Gwnaethom gynnydd sylweddol yn economi Cymru ers datganoli, ac mae dros 100,000 yn fwy o bobl mewn swyddi nag yn 1999. Mae gennym hanes o lwyddiant, ond nid ydym yn gorffwys ar ein rhwyfau, ac mae 'WAVE' yn rhoi sylfaen gadarn inni weithredu ein polisiau arni yn y dyfodol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl, ac felly galwaf am bleidlais ar welliant 2.

Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

5.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 6: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 9, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44.
Amendment 7: For 9, Abstain 0, Against 44.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.
 Amendment 8: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise

James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 9: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 10: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 11: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3092): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3092): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

notes the development of the Welsh Assembly Government's strategic framework for economic development, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'.

yn nodi datblygiad fframwaith strategol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'.

*Cynnig (NDM3092): O blaid 34, Ymatal 11, Yn erbyn 8.
Motion (NDM3092): For 34, Abstain 11, Against 8.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin

Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Ailgylchu: Cynnydd—Ond Mae Cryn Ffordd i Fynd Eto Recycling: Progress—But a Long Way to Go

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I ask Members leaving the Chamber to please do so expeditiously and quietly.

Nick Bourne: I am allowing a minute each to Mick Bates, Dai Lloyd and Lorraine Barrett at the end of my speech.

Recycling has become one of the buzzwords of recent times. It is, of course, nothing new, but, perhaps surprisingly, it is only recently that people have woken up to its importance as a means of promoting sustainability. It is no longer seen as an add-on, but is becoming integral to how we live our lives.

One thing is clear: waste is on the increase. According to the European Environment Agency, the total volume of waste generated in the EU is on the increase and amounts to 3.5 tonnes of waste per capita per year. Last year, the UK produced nearly 400 million tonnes of waste. Household waste represents about a tenth of that total, and it is on this aspect that I want to concentrate.

The total amount of municipal waste in Wales last year was 1.94 million tonnes, up from 1.83 million tonnes the year before, an increase of some 6 per cent. The vast bulk of that municipal waste, some 82 per cent, is household waste. This tells us that we need to have coherent policies in place to deal with household waste. It is a daunting problem, but 60 per cent of household waste can be recycled or composted, and that must be our aim. Other European countries have been able to achieve that. If we deal with the

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gofynnaf i Aelodau sy'n gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n gyflym ac yn dawel.

Nick Bourne: Byddaf yn rhoi munud yr un i Mick Bates, Dai Lloyd a Lorraine Barrett ar ddiwedd fy araith.

Mae ailgylchu wedi dod yn air poblogaidd yn ddiweddar. Nid yw'n newydd, wrth gwrs, ond efallai mai'r hyn sy'n peri syndod yw mai'n ddiweddar y mae pobl wedi sylweddoli ei bwysigrwydd fel ffordd i hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd. Nid yw'n cael ei ystyried mwyach yn rhywbeth ychwanegol, ond mae'n dod yn rhan annatod o'n ffordd o fyw.

Mae un peth yn glir: mae gwastraff ar gynydd. Yn ôl Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Ewrop, mae cyfanswm y gwastraff sy'n cael ei greu yn y DU ar gynydd, sef 3.5 tonnelli o wastraff y pen y flwyddyn. Y llynedd, cynhyrchodd y DU bron 400 miliwn o dunelli o wastraff. Gwastraff cartrefi yw tua un rhan o ddeg o'r cyfanswm hwnnw, ac ar yr agwedd honno yr hoffwn ganolbwyntio.

Cyfanswm y gwastraff trefol yng Nghymru y llynedd oedd 1.94 miliwn o dunelli, 1.83 miliwn o dunelli'n fwy nag yn y flwyddyn flaenorol, sef cynnydd o ryw 6 y cant. Gwastraff cartrefi yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r gwastraff trefol hwnnw, sef rhyw 82 y cant. Mae hyn yn dweud wrthym fod angen inni roi polisiau cydlynol ar waith i ddelio â gwastraff cartrefi. Mae'n broblem sy'n digalonni, ond gellir ailgylchu neu gompostio 60 y cant o wastraff cartref, a rhaid anelu at hynny. Mae gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop wedi

problem of household waste, then a large part of the waste problem is solved, although not all of it, by any means.

We have a golden opportunity to make Wales a shining example of best practice in recycling. It is a sad fact that Wales currently has one of the worst recycling rates in Europe. Some authorities, such as Ceredigion and Powys in my own area, and Newport and Caerphilly, are getting it right, and we must build on their best practice. Let us take a closer look at what has been achieved in some areas of Wales so far.

Until recently, the high performance in Ceredigion, my home county, was due solely to bring banks, and the county council decided to pay £19 per tonne to community organisations for recycling domestic waste. The number of recycling banks in Ceredigion has risen steadily over time. There are now some 30 recycling sites around the county, although that is still not nearly enough. There are also five civic amenity sites, which are operated under contract to a variety of private companies. The contractors range in scale from small community groups such as church halls, charities and scout groups to larger private companies. In addition, the council has implemented its own bring-bank schemes in rural areas of the county. This scheme rewards communities for recycling by making a financial contribution to the groups involved. There are currently 14 of these rural recycling sites operating in the north of the county, giving residents an opportunity to recycle glass, paper, cans and some plastics. The move towards kerbside recycling has been crucial to improving the county's record. In 2003 and 2004, the county council ran two kerbside collection trials—the recycle in the bag scheme and the recycle in the box scheme. In the recycle in the bag scheme, all of the recyclable material is put in a bag together and it is then separated out later at a materials recovery facility. In the recycle in the box scheme, the waste is separated out by the consumer, and this scheme has not proven to be as successful as the other, perhaps due to the nature of the county. We do need to look at different ways

llwyddo i gyflawni hynny. Os deliwn â phroblem gwastraff cartrefi, yna caiff rhan helaeth o'r broblem wastraff ei datrys, er nad yr holl broblem, o bell ffordd.

Mae gennym gyfle gwych i sicrhau bod Cymru'n enghraifft ardderchog o arfer gorau ym maes ailgylchu. Mae'n drist bod gan Gymru un o'r cyfraddau ailgylchu gwaethaf yn Ewrop ar hyn o bryd. Mae rhai awdurdodau, megis Ceredigion a Phowys yn fy ardal fy hun, a Chasnewydd a Chaerffili, yn llwyddo yn y maes hwn, a rhaid inni adeiladu ar eu harfer gorau hwy. Gadewch inni edrych yn fanylach ar yr hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru hyd yma.

Tan yn ddiweddar, banciau dod â gwastraff oedd yn gyfrifol am y perfformiad uchel yng Ngheredigion, y sir lle'r wyf fi'n byw, a phenderfynodd y cyngor sir dalu £19 y dunnell i sefydliadau cymunedol am ailgylchu gwastraff cartrefi. Mae nifer y banciau ailgylchu yng Ngheredigion wedi cynyddu'n raddol gydag amser. Mae rhyw 30 o safleoedd ailgylchu ledled y sir bellach, er nad yw hynny'n ddigon o hyd. Mae yno bum safle amwynder dinesig hefyd, a weithredir o dan contract i amrywiol gwmnïau preifat. Mae'r contractwyr yn amrywio o ran maint o grwpiau cymunedol bach, megis neuaddau eglwys, elusennau a grwpiau sgowtiaid, i gwmnïau preifat mawr. Yn ogystal, mae'r cyngor wedi gweithredu ei gynlluniau ei hun ar gyfer banciau dod â gwastraff yn rhannau gwledig y sir. Mae'r cynllun hwn yn gwobrwyo cymunedau am ailgylchu drwy wneud cyfraniad ariannol i'r grwpiau sy'n cymryd rhan. Ar hyn o bryd, mae 14 o'r safleoedd ailgylchu gwledig hyn ar waith yn rhan ogleddol y sir, gan roi cyfle i drigolion ailgylchu gwydr, papur, caniau a rhai plastigau. Mae'r cam tuag at ailgylchu ar ymyl y ffordd wedi bod yn allweddol i wella record y sir. Yn 2003 a 2004, trefnodd y cyngor sir dau dreial casglu ar ymyl y ffordd—y cynllun ailgylchu yn y bag a'r cynllun ailgylchu yn y blwch. Yn y cynllun ailgylchu yn y bag, rhoddir yr holl ddeunydd i'w ailgylchu mewn bag gyda'i gilydd ac yna caiff ei wahanu'n ddiweddarach mewn cyfleuster adfer deunyddiau. Yn y cynllun ailgylchu yn y blwch, caiff y gwastraff ei wahanu gan y cwsmer, ac nid yw'r cynllun

of approaching recycling in different areas of Wales.

There are a number of obstacles to further improvement. The Assembly Government tends to favour cleanstream recyclates, which requires the different types of waste to be separated out. The Welsh Assembly Government has set targets for recycling and composting that are currently non-statutory. The legislation states that composting targets must be met through the centralised composting of collected source-segregated wastes and no allowance is made for home composting. If allowance were made for home composting, Ceredigion would be the best performing authority in Wales. However, Powys is currently assessed as the best because of the method of calculation used, with Ceredigion second.

Powys recycles some 33 per cent of its waste, and the county has topped the table for the second year running. Worryingly, it is the capital, Cardiff, that is at the bottom of the table, recycling a rather pathetic 11 per cent of its rubbish. Powys co-ordinates 65 multi-material bring sites and 50 individual bring banks. Local community groups are closely involved, and are a key to the success. There are six waste and recycling centres, in Welshpool, Newtown, Machynlleth, Llandegley, Brecon, and Ystradgynlais.

The recycling record is celebrated by the Centre for Alternative Technology, which is located just outside Machynlleth in Powys. The centre is an example of best practice. Nearly all the waste produced there is recycled. All of the kitchen waste is recycled into compost then put on to the vegetable beds in the gardens. All of the paper and cardboard from the offices is recycled, and is either re-used as packaging in the mail order department or sold reprocessed into other products. Plastic packaging, glass bottles and jars and tin cans are recycled while scrap metal is taken to a scrap yard in Welshpool, and Tetra Pak cartons are turned into other products.

hwn wedi bod mor llwyddiannus â'r llall, efallai oherwydd natur y sir. Mae angen inni ystyried ffyrdd gwahanol i ailgylchu mewn ardaloedd gwahanol yng Nghymru.

Mae nifer o bethau sy'n rhwystro gwelliant pellach. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn tueddu i ffafrio deunydd ailgylchu ffrwd lân, sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol gwahanu gwahanol fathau o wastraff. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi pennu targedau ar gyfer ailgylchu a chompostio nad ydynt yn statudol ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth yn dweud bod yn rhaid cyrraedd targedau compostio drwy ganoli compostio gwastraff sy'n cael ei wahanu yn y tarddle, ac ni chaniateir ar gyfer compostio gartref. Pe bae Ceredigion yn caniatáu ar gyfer compostio gartref, ef fyddai'r awdurdod â'r perfformiad gorau yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, asesir mai Powys yw'r gorau ar hyn o bryd oherwydd y dull cyfrifo a ddefnyddir, a Cheredigion sy'n ail.

Mae Powys yn ailgylchu rhyw 33 y cant o'i gwastraff, ac mae'r sir ar frig y tabl am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder yw bod y brifddinas, Caerdydd, ar waelod y tabl, yn ailgylchu dim ond 11 y cant o'i gwastraff. Mae Powys yn cydlynu 65 o safleoedd lle gellir dod â gwahanol ddeunyddiau a 50 o fanciau i ddod â gwastraff unigol. Mae grwpiau cymunedol lleol yn cymryd rhan flaenllaw, ac yn allweddol i'r llwyddiant. Mae yna chwe chanolfan gwastraff ac ailgylchu, yn y Trallwng, y Drenewydd, Machynlleth, Llandegla, Aberhonddu ac Ystradgynlais.

Y Ganolfan Dechnoleg Amgen, y tu allan i Fachynlleth ym Mhowys, sy'n dathlu'r record ailgylchu. Mae'r ganolfan yn enghraifft o arfer gorau. Ailgylchir bron yr holl wastraff a gynhyrchir yno. Ailgylchir yr holl wastraff cegin yn gompost a'i roi ar y gwelyau llysiau yn y gerddi. Ailgylchir yr holl bapur a'r cardbord o'r swyddfeydd a'i aildefnyddio fel deunydd pacio yn yr adran archebu drwy'r post, neu caiff ei werthu wedi'i ailbrosesu'n gynhyrchion eraill. Ailgylchir pecynnau plastig, poteli gwydr a jariau a chaniau tun ac eir â metel sgrap i iard sgrap yn y Trallwng. Caiff cartonau Tetra Pak eu troi'n gynhyrchion eraill.

Powys is doing well, but it is not resting on its laurels—it has big plans to expand weekly collections of dry recyclables, including glass, by 2009. The council is also aiming to minimise transport distances for collected materials, which is a problem in rural areas. Powys is setting a good example, and we must ensure that other authorities follow suit.

Mae Powys yn gwneud yn dda, ond nid yw'n gorffwys ar ei rhwyfau—mae ganddi gynlluniau mawr i ehangu casgliadau wythnosol o ddeunyddiau ailgylchu sych, gan gynnwys gwydr, erbyn 2009. Mae'r cyngor hefyd yn anelu at leihau pellteroedd teithio ar gyfer deunyddiau wedi eu casglu, sy'n broblem mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Mae Powys yn gosod esiampl dda, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod awdurdodau eraill yn ei dilyn.

5.10 p.m.

The figures are encouraging in some areas of Wales, but we must not lose sight of the fact that the situation here is not nearly as good as that in England. Last year, Wales recycled a little over 18 per cent of its household waste, while the figure for England was 23 per cent. Worryingly, the amount of landfill in Wales increased last year. Our best local authorities are managing to achieve a consistently high recycling rate of just over 30 per cent, but the best authority in England—St Edmundsbury Borough Council in Suffolk—is managing to recycle over 50 per cent. Why is it so successful? Other successful local authorities in England include Lichfield and Daventry, and some of the London boroughs, and I will come on to those. Recycling is much more successful in England.

Mae'r ffigurau'n galonogol mewn rhai ardaloedd yng Nghymru, ond ni ddylem anghofio'r ffaith nad yw'r sefyllfa yma cystal ag ydyw yn Lloegr o bell ffordd. Y llynedd, ailgylchodd Cymru ychydig dros 18 y cant o'i gwastraff cartrefi, ond ailgylchodd Lloegr 23 y cant. Yn anffodus, cynyddodd y gwastraff tirlenwi yng Nghymru y llynedd. Mae ein hawdurdodau lleol gorau yn llwyddo i gyrraedd cyfradd ailgylchu uchel yn gyson o ychydig dros 30 y cant. Ond mae'r awdurdod gorau yn Lloegr—Cyngor Bwrdeistref St Edmundsbury yn Suffolk—yn llwyddo i ailgylchu dros 50 y cant? Pam mae mor llwyddiannus? Ymhlith yr awdurdodau lleol llwyddiannus eraill yn Lloegr mae Litchfield a Daventry, a rhai o fwrdeistrefi Llundain, a byddaf yn trafod y rhain yn ddiweddarach. Mae ailgylchu lawer yn fwy llwyddiannus yn Lloegr.

The key features that best authorities in England appear to have in common is that, first, they operate a good doorstep recycling service, with three or four boxes or wheelie bins in which to separate out the recyclable materials. That is a better way of operating in urban areas. Secondly, the recycling of garden waste and composting waste is seen as an important initiative in those areas that have high recycling rates. They also often have additional initiatives and regular campaigns to keep these issues at the forefront of people's consciousness, such as the 'Slim your Bin' campaign in Daventry. We have not really seen that done by authorities in Wales in order to keep recycling in the public consciousness.

Y nodweddion allweddol sy'n gyffredin ymhlith yr awdurdodau gorau yn Lloegr yw, yn gyntaf, eu bod yn defnyddio gwasanaeth da o ailgylchu ar stepen y drws, gyda thri neu bedwar blwch neu finiau ar olwynion i wahanu'r deunyddiau i'w hailgylchu. Mae'n ffordd well o weithredu mewn ardaloedd trefol. Yn ail, ystyrir bod ailgylchu gwastraff gerddi a chompostio gwastraff yn fenter bwysig yn yr ardaloedd hynny lle mae cyfraddau ailgylchu uchel. Yn aml mae ganddynt fentrau ychwanegol ac ymgyrchoedd rheolaidd hefyd i sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o'r materion hyn drwy'r amser, megis ymgyrch 'Slim your Bin' yn Daventry. Nid yw awdurdodau yng Nghymru wedi gwneud hynny mewn gwirionedd i sicrhau bod y cyhoedd drwy'r amser yn ymwybodol o ailgylchu.

We need to learn from successful authorities in England. Wales does not have to have one of the worst recycling records in Europe. We must act now to meet the Welsh Assembly Government's target of 40 per cent of municipal waste being recycled by 2009-10. It is wrong that councils in Wales should, in general, lag so far behind those in England—certainly in terms of the average, and even when looking at the best.

I disagree with the Government's plan to charge people for disposing of household rubbish. A better way is to provide a discount on council tax for those who recycle—providing an incentive rather than a penalty will win hearts and minds. That is the way to move forward. It is also less likely that there will be fly-tipping if you provide for a discount rather than charging a penalty for those who produce the rubbish. That seems to me to be a better way of proceeding.

Planning applications for new supermarkets should include the condition that they offer recycling facilities to local people. They have a part to play, as they sell much of the material that creates the waste problem, after all. If we do not have the powers to do that, we should seek them. We also need to reduce the amount of waste created from producers; I am thinking in particular of Sunday and Saturday newspapers—we are all familiar with the amount of superfluous cellophane wrapping. Many products have too much wrapping, and the manufacturers, as well as the distributors and retailers, have a key part to play.

There is often talk about plastic bags in supermarkets. When I was in Hong Kong earlier in the year, I noted that there is a voluntary scheme there whereby, on certain days, supermarkets will not give out bags to customers. Customers are told to bring their own bags, and if, by chance, they do not, they make a contribution to charity. It is a good way of proceeding—it wins people over, and creates a campaign in the community. We must be imaginative in that way. To do things voluntarily is a good way of proceeding, although you need the back-up statutory

Mae angen inni ddysgu gan awdurdodau llwyddiannus yn Lloegr. Nid oes rhaid i Gymru gael un o'r cyfraddau ailgylchu gwaethaf yn Ewrop. Rhaid inni weithredu'n awr i gyrraedd targed Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ailgylchu 40 y cant o wastraff trefol erbyn 2009-10. Mae'n anghywir bod perfformiad cynghorau yng Nghymru, ar y cyfan, mor wael o'u cymharu â'r rheini yn Lloegr—yn sicr o ran y cyfartaledd, a hyd yn oed wrth edrych ar y rhai gorau.

Anghytunaf â chynllun y Llywodraeth i godi tâl ar bobl am waredu sbwriel cartrefi. Ffordd well yw rhoi gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor i'r rheini sy'n ailgylchu—bydd rhoi cymhelliant yn hytrach na chosb yn sicrhau cefnogaeth pobl. Dyna'r ffordd i symud ymlaen. Mae hefyd yn llai tebygol y bydd tipio anghyfreithlon os rhowch ostyngiad yn hytrach na gosod cosb ar y rheini sy'n cynhyrchu'r sbwriel. Mae hynny'n ymddangos yn ffordd well i symud ymlaen.

Dylai ceisiadau cynllunio ar gyfer archfarchnadoedd newydd gynnwys yr amod eu bod yn cynnig cyfleusterau ailgylchu i bobl leol. Mae ganddynt ran i'w chwarae, am eu bod yn gwerthu llawer o'r deunydd sy'n creu'r broblem gwastraff, wedi'r cyfan. Os nad oes gennym y pwerau i wneud hynny, dylem eu cael. Mae angen inni leihau'r gwastraff sy'n cael ei greu gan gynhyrchwyr hefyd; meddyliaf yn benodol am bapurau dydd Sul a dydd Sadwrn—yr ydym i gyd yn gyfarwydd â'r holl ddeunydd lapio seloffen diangen. Mae gormod o ddeunydd lapio ar lawer o nwyddau, ac mae gan y gweithgynhyrchwyr, yn ogystal â'r dosbarthwyr a'r manwerthwyr, ran allweddol i'w chwarae.

Siaredir yn aml am fapiau plastig mewn archfarchnadoedd. Pan oeddwn yn Hong Kong yn gynharach eleni, sylwais fod cynllun gwirfoddol yno lle na fydd archfarchnadoedd yn rhoi bagiau i gwsmeriaid ar ddiwrnodau penodol. Dywedir wrth gwsmeriaid am ddod â'u bagiau eu hunain, ac os digwydd iddynt beidio â gwneud hynny, byddant yn rhoi cyfraniad i elusen. Mae'n ffordd dda i symud ymlaen—mae'n ennill cefnogaeth pobl, ac yn creu ymgyrch yn y gymuned. Rhaid inni ddangos dychymyg fel hynny. Mae gwneud pethau'n

powers. However, we have a long way to go.

The motto that is used—certainly in Ceredigion—is ‘reduce, reuse, recycle’, and it is a good motto. We need to encourage that, and we need to have campaigns and ensure that this is put across in education in schools and in civic facilities. We need to ensure that all public sector buildings and all public sector authorities are exemplars. We have the ability to recycle in our Assembly offices, but we need to ensure that that is carried across in other ways. We have a facility in the post office where we can recycle our plastic bottles, cans, and so on. That sort of initiative needs to be rolled out to all employers, not just those in the public sector. There is much to be done. We have made some progress, but there is a long way to go.

Mick Bates: Thank you, Nick, for allowing me to speak in your debate today. This is an important issue, and there are significant challenges. To give an example of the scale of those challenges, while we have some good examples—and you mentioned Ceredigion and, in particular, Powys—there is a challenge in as much as that, last year, in Wales the amount of material that was not recycled or composted went up by 440 kg per person. That is a significant increase, and yet the Government still preaches the gospel that we are on course to reach our targets.

Equally, if we take an overall measure, such as the ecological footprint, the footprint in Wales currently stands at over five globes per person, whereas the world average is 1.8. People must reduce that, because the most significant contributor to our large footprint here in Wales is waste. Already, within Europe, certain countries have abolished landfill altogether and that has been mainly achieved by co-responsibility. All parts of the chain—manufacturers and retailers—must play their part by paying towards the disposal of waste. We know that plastics are a particular problem.

wirfoddol yn ffordd dda i symud ymlaen, er bod arnoch angen y pwerau statudol wrth gefn. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym lawer i'w wneud o hyd.

Yr arwyddair a ddefnyddir—yn sicr yng Ngheredigion—yw ‘lleihau, aildefnyddio, ailgylchu’, ac mae'n arwyddair da. Mae angen inni annog hynny, ac mae angen inni gael ymgyrchoedd a sicrhau cyfleu hyn mewn addysg mewn ysgolion ac mewn cyfleusterau dinesig. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod pob adeilad yn y sector cyhoeddus a phob awdurdod yn y sector cyhoeddus yn gosod esiempl. Mae gennym y gallu i ailgylchu yn ein swyddfeydd yn y Cynulliad, ond mae angen inni sicrhau gwneud hynny mewn ffyrdd eraill. Mae gennym gyfleuster yn y swyddfa bost lle y gallwn ailgylchu ein poteli plastig, caniau, ac ati. Mae angen cyflwyno'r math hwnnw o fenter i bob cyflogwr, nid yn unig i'r rheini sydd yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae llawer i'w wneud. Yr ydym wedi gwneud rhyw gynnydd, ond erys llawer i'w wneud.

Mick Bates: Diolch, Nick, am ganiatáu imi siarad yn eich dadl heddiw. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig, ac mae yna heriau mawr. I roi enghraifft o raddau'r heriau hynny ichi, er bod gennym rai enghreifftiau da—yr oeddech yn sôn am Geredigion, ac am Bowys yn benodol—mae yna her yn yr ystyr bod faint o ddeunydd na chafodd ei ailgylchu neu ei gompostio wedi cynyddu 440kg y pen yng Nghymru y llynedd. Mae hwnnw'n gynnydd mawr, ac eto mae'r Llywodraeth yn dal i bregethu ein bod ar y trywydd cywir i gyrraedd ein targedau.

Yn yr un modd, os cymerwn fesur cyffredinol, megis yr ôl-troed ecolegol, mae'r ôl-troed yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn bum glôb fesul person, ond cyfartaledd y byd yw 1.8. Rhaid i bobl leihau hynny, oherwydd y cyfrannwr mwyaf sylweddol i'n hól-troed mawr ni yma yng Nghymru yw gwastraff. Yn Ewrop, mae rhai gwledydd eisoes wedi diddymu tirlenwi'n gyfan gwbl, a chyflawnwyd hynny i raddau helaeth drwy gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd. Rhaid i bob rhan o'r gadwyn—gweithgynhyrchwyr a manwerthwyr—wneud ei rhan i dalu am waredu gwastraff. Gwyddom fod plastigau yn broblem arbennig.

In conclusion, it is about changing behaviour and Nick was perfectly correct to say that we should incentivise the system wherever possible to change people's behaviour to recycle more.

David Lloyd: Yr wyf hefyd yn llongyfarch Nick Bourne am ddewis y pwnc allweddol hwn. Yn sylfaenol, mae hyn yn ymwneud â lleihau gwastraff yn y lle cyntaf, y gallu i ail-ddefnyddio pethau drosodd a throsodd ac i ailgylchu. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud i'w gwneud yn llawer haws i bobl ailgylchu. Yn y pen draw, fel y dywedodd Mick, beth sydd ei angen yw i ni, fel unigolion, newid y ffordd yr ydym yn ymddwyn. Mae hynny'n golygu bod gennym i gyd ran i'w chwarae, yn hytrach na beio'r Llywodraeth o hyd.

Lorraine Barrett: I agree with nearly everything that Nick has said on this issue. I raise the point about inequality among local authorities across Wales, to which Nick alluded, with regard to the doorstep collection service that they provide. So many different types of rubbish are collected by some authorities and not by others. My authority in the Vale of Glamorgan collects different types of rubbish every other week and you have to remember which one goes out which week, otherwise you miss it and you end up going down to the amenities site with the waste. We all need to ensure that it is made as easy as possible for everyone to be able to recycle as much as they possibly can, because people want to do that.

I am still disappointed that we do not seem to be considering the autoclave system. I have raised this with the Minister many times as it is one of the bees in my bonnet, and the committee has also discussed it. An autoclave system could be one way of recycling even more of our waste products.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Recycling presents a great challenge for us and no-one can pretend that we are anywhere close to the position that we would like to be in. If we look at where we began, some six years ago the amount of recycling in Wales was around 4 per cent. Historically, it has been far too easy for us to find holes in the

I gloi, mae a wnelo hyn â newid ymddygiad, ac yr oedd Nick yn hollol iawn i ddweud y dylem gymell y system lle mae hynny'n bosibl, i newid ymddygiad pobl er mwyn iddynt ailgylchu mwy.

David Lloyd: I also congratulate Nick Bourne on selecting this key issue. Fundamentally, it is a matter of reducing waste in the first place, the ability to re-use things time and time again, and to recycle. There is a great deal of work to be done to make it far easier for people to recycle. At the end of the day, as Mick said, what is required is for us, as individuals, to change our behaviour. That means we all have a part to play, rather than always be blaming the Government.

Lorraine Barrett: Yr wyf yn cytuno â bron popeth a ddywedodd Nick am y mater hwn. Codaf y pwynt ynghylch anghydraddoldeb ymhlith awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, fel y cyfeiriodd Nick, o ran y gwasanaeth a ddarparant i gasglu ar stepen y drws. Cesglir cymaint o wahanol fathau o sbwriel gan rai awdurdodau, ond nid gan eraill. Mae fy awdurdod i ym Mro Morgannwg yn casglu gwahanol fathau o sbwriel bob yn ail wythnos, a rhaid ichi gofio pa un sy'n mynd allan bob wythnos, neu byddwch yn ei golli ac yn gorfod mynd â'r gwastraff i'r safle amwynderau. Mae angen inni bob un sicrhau ei fod mor hawdd â phosibl i bawb allu ailgylchu cymaint â phosibl, oherwydd mae pobl am wneud hynny.

Yr wyf yn siomedig o hyd nad ydym yn ystyried y system awtoclaf. Yr wyf wedi codi hyn gyda'r Gweinidog lawer gwaith gan fod gennyf chwilen yn fy mhen ynghylch hyn, ac mae'r pwyllgor hefyd wedi ei drafod. Gallai system awtoclaf fod yn un ffordd i ailgylchu hyd yn oed mwy o'n cynhyrchion gwastraff.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae ailgylchu yn her fawr i ni ac ni all unrhyw un esgus ein bod yn agos at y sefyllfa yr hoffem fod ynddi. Os awn yn ôl i'r dechrau, tua chwe blynedd yn ôl, yr oedd tua 4 y cant yn cael ei ailgylchu yng Nghymru. Yn hanesyddol, mae hi wedi bod llawer yn rhy hawdd inni ddod o hyd i dyllau yn y

ground into which to throw rubbish, if I can put it that way. That has been the way in which rubbish has been dealt with in our countryside. We know that landfill sites cannot be provided forever and a day and we must ensure that the amount of waste going into landfill reduces as much as possible year by year. There will always be a need for landfill in the foreseeable future and possibly for incineration as well. I visited the Netherlands recently, a country with a far better record on recycling than Wales, and it incinerates a great deal of waste and landfills a lot less. I have also visited the Isle of Man, which moved away from landfill because its landfill site was full. There was nowhere else to take the waste that it produced—it had to move towards an energy-from-waste plant to deal with the residue that could not be recycled.

It is right to say that the target that we set for 2005-06 was 20 per cent, and we are just short of it. I would obviously have preferred better news than that, but it is not too far short. I am confident that we can reach 40 per cent by 2010. I have always taken the view that encouragement is ultimately better than trying to force people to do something because, for example—and this is a view that I share with Nick—if you tax or charge people to remove black bin-liners, you run the risk of extra fly-tipping. There is nothing to stop people from shifting bin-bags across the road to put them outside their neighbours' house in the hope that their neighbour gets charged. On my side of the street on which I live—and this is nothing to do with me incidentally—the rubbish is collected at 7 a.m. but, on the other side, it is collected at midday. Quite often, our neighbours who live opposite will naturally take their waste over the road to our side to have it collected earlier. In those circumstances, it would be difficult to envisage how a system of taxation or charging would actually operate.

5.20 p.m.

I have always taken the view that it is far easier to increase the rate of recycling if you make it as easy as possible for people to recycle on the doorstep. That is why I have

ddae'r i daflu sbwriel i mewn iddynt, os caf ei roi fel hynny. Dyna oedd y ffordd i ddelio â sbwriel yn ein cefn gwlad. Gwyddom na ellir darparu safleoedd tirlenwi am byth, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwastraff sy'n mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi yn lleihau cymaint â phosibl flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Bydd angen safleoedd tirlenwi bob amser yn y dyfodol agos, ac o bosibl system llosgi gwastraff hefyd. Yn ddiweddar, bûm ar ymweliad â'r Iseldiroedd, gwlad sydd â record lawer gwell o ailgylchu na Chymru. Mae'n llosgi llawer iawn o wastraff ac yn tirlenwi llawer llai. Bûm ar ymweliad hefyd ag Ynys Manaw, a roddodd y gorau i dirlenwi gan fod ei safle tirlenwi yn llawn. Nid oedd unman arall i roi'r gwastraff—bu'n rhaid adeiladu gwaith troi gwastraff yn ynni i ddelio â gweddill y gwastraff na ellid ei ailgylchu.

Mae'n iawn dweud mai'r targed a bennwyd gennym ar gyfer 2005-06 oedd 20 y cant, ac yr ydym bron â'i gyrraedd. Wrth gwrs, byddwn wedi hoffi cael newyddion gwell na hynny, ond nid yw'n brin iawn o'r targed. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gallwn gyrraedd 40 y cant erbyn 2010. Yr wyf bob amser o'r farn fod anogaeth yn well yn y pen draw na cheisio gorfodi pobl i wneud rhywbeth, oherwydd er enghraifft—a chytunaf â Nick ar hyn—os byddwch yn trethu pobl neu'n codi tâl arnynt am gael gwared â bagiau biniau du, mae perygl y cewch fwy o achosion o dipio anghyfreithlon. Nid oes dim i atal pobl rhag symud bagiau biniau ar draws y ffordd i'w rhoi y tu allan i dŷ eu cymydog yn y gobaith y codir tâl ar eu cymydog. Ar fy ochr i o'r stryd lle yr wyf yn byw—ac nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â mi, gyda llaw—cesglir y sbwriel am 7 a.m, ond, ar yr ochr arall fe'i cesglir ganol dydd. Yn lled aml bydd ein cymydogion sy'n byw gyferbyn yn naturiol yn mynd â'u gwastraff ar draws y ffordd i'n hochr ni er mwyn iddo gael ei gasglu'n gynharach. O dan yr amgylchiadau hynny, byddai'n anodd rhagweld sut y byddai system o drethu neu godi tâl yn gweithio mewn gwirionedd.

Yr wyf bob amser o'r farn ei bod lawer yn haws cynyddu cyfradd ailgylchu os y gwnewch hi mor hawdd â phosibl i bobl ailgylchu ar stepen y drws. Dyna pam yr wyf

always been a great believer in encouraging doorstep collection. Some authorities in Wales—Nick has alluded to them; Caerphilly and Newport would be others that I would put forward—have a good record in terms of encouraging kerbside collection in particular. Frankly, if people have to drive to a civic amenities site, that is, in itself, a disincentive. If you were an ice-cream seller and were to come to the civic amenities site at Tythegston, outside Bridgend, on a Sunday, you would make a fortune, because there is an enormous queue there. You can expect to queue for at least half an hour to take, for example, some cans to the can recycler, because cans are not collected on the doorstep in Bridgend. Quite often, you will see people take a lot of green waste to that site, because there is no green waste collection in Bridgend.

There would be two effects if there were collections of waste of that sort in my particular part of the world. The first is that more people would leave waste out to be recycled and, secondly, there would be fewer car journeys involving people going to the landfill site; it would hit two buttons in that regard. Bridgend County Borough Council recently introduced two brown boxes for the collection of newspaper and glass but there has been a certain shyness among people to leave their brown box containing bottles out for all the world to see. You will often see bottles of wine and spirits hidden underneath jam and sauce jars, and people putting the paper box on top of the bottle box.

David Melding: I bet that the Queen Mum never minded putting her gin bottles out.

Carwyn Jones: I make no comment on that; I bow to your greater experience and knowledge, David.

The serious point is that, yes, we need to change the way that adults—those who leave out the rubbish, if I can put it that way—think, but we must also look at the way that children think. Many Members may have visited eco schools to see the work that they do. Eco schools are superb in the sense that

bob amser wedi credu'n gryf mewn annog casglu ar stepen y drws. Mae gan rai awdurdodau yng Nghymru—ac mae Nick wedi cyfeirio atynt; byddai Caerffili a Chasnewydd yn awdurdodau eraill y byddwn yn eu hawgrymu—record dda o ran annog casglu ar ymyl y ffordd yn arbennig. A dweud y gwir, os oes rhaid i bobl yrru i safle amwynderau dinesig, mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn wrthanogaeth. Pe baech yn werthwr hufen iâ ac yn dod i'r safle amwynderau dinesig yn Llandudwg, y tu allan i Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr, ar ddydd Sul, byddech yn gwneud ffortiwn, oherwydd mae ciw anferth yno. Gallwch ddisgwyl ciwio am o leiaf hanner awr, er enghariff i fynd â chaniau i'r ailgylchwr caniau, gan na chesglir caniau ar stepen y drws ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Yn ddigon aml fe welwch bobl yn mynd â llawer o wastraff gwyrdd i'r safle hwnnw, gan nad oes system casglu gwastraff gwyrdd ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr.

Byddai dwy effaith pe gwastraff o'r math hwnnw'n cael ei gasglu yn fy ardal i. Yr effaith gyntaf yw y byddai mwy o bobl yn gadael gwastraff allan i gael ei ailgylchu, ac yn ail, byddai llai o bobl yn gorfod teithio mewn car i'r safle tirlenwi; byddai'r effaith yn ddeublyg yn hynny o beth. Yn ddiweddar, cyflwynodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ddau focs brown i gasglu papur newydd a gwydr, ond bu rhywfaint o swildod ymhlith pobl i adael eu bocs brown allan yn cynnwys poteli i bawb eu gweld. Yn aml fe welwch boteli gwin a gwirodydd wedi eu cuddio o dan botiau jam a saws, a phobl yn rhoi'r bocs papur ar ben y bocs poteli.

David Melding: Mae'n siŵr gen i nad oedd ots gan y Fam Frenhines roi ei photeli jin allan.

Carwyn Jones: Nid wyf am wneud unrhyw sylw ar hynny; ildiaf i'ch profiad a'ch gwybodaeth helaethach, David.

Y pwynt difrifol yw bod angen inni newid y ffordd y mae oedolion—y rhai sy'n rhoi'r sbwriel allan, os caf ei esbonio felly—yn meddwl. Ond rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar y ffordd y mae plant yn meddwl. Efallai bod nifer o Aelodau wedi ymweld ag eco-ysgolion i weld y gwaith a wnânt. Mae eco-

they instil in children the belief that recycling is something normal, not unusual, which would be the case for their parents and grandparents. They see the reuse and recycling of materials as something perfectly normal, and those are habits that they will hopefully carry on acquiring and keeping for the rest of their lives and will pass on to their children. The eco schools initiative is fantastic, and one that we are keen to continue to support and see expand.

There is a financial incentive for local authorities to recycle. The reason why there is a preference for clean-stream waste is that it is worth more money, frankly, and local authorities are able to benefit more from selling it. Not so long ago, maybe three or four years ago, there was a great deal of concern that recyclable paper and glass would cease to have a market. Fortunately, that is not the case: the changeover at the UPM paper mill in Shotton has had a real effect in terms of boosting the demand for recyclable paper. That causes a problem in the forestry end of my portfolio, but it has ensured a long-term market and that a good price is paid for paper. The same situation exists with glass. There are challenges with cans and with plastic. At present, plastic is not, in the main, recycled in the UK; it is taken to the far east and recycled by hand, because it has to be sorted by hand. It then comes back to Europe and is used for the padding in padded jackets that many people wear in the winter.

There is still a great deal of work to be done in terms of moving recycling forward, but in all honesty—I listened to the contributions carefully, and the reality is that there is general agreement in terms of what needs to be done in terms of recycling—we have come a long way in a short time, but there is a saying in Welsh that people will be familiar with:

Nid da lle gellir gwell.

That is what we want to do over the next four years, particularly, up to 2010 and beyond. We want to go on ensuring that recycling becomes the norm and that people see it as something that they do out of habit, week

ysgolion yn wych yn yr ystyr eu bod yn meithrin yn y plant y gred bod ailgylchu yn rhywbeth arferol, nid anarferol, sef yr hyn a fyddai'n wir i'w rhieni a'u neiniau a'u teidiau. Iddynt hwy, mae ailddefnyddio ac ailgylchu deunyddiau yn rhywbeth hollol arferol, a dyna'r arferion y byddant yn parhau i'w meithrin a'u cadw, gobeiothio, weddill eu hoes ac yn eu trosglwyddo i'w plant hwy. Mae'r fenter eco-ysgolion yn un wych, ac yn un yr ydym yn awyddus i barhau i'w chefnogi a'i gweld yn ehangu.

Mae yna gymhelliant ariannol i awdurdodau lleol ailgylchu. Y rheswm pam mae gwastraff ffrwd lân yn cael ei ffafrio yw ei fod yn werth mwy o arian, a dweud y gwir, a gall awdurdodau lleol elwa'n fwy o'i werthu. Ychydig amser yn ôl, dair neu bedair blynedd, efallai, yr oedd llawer iawn o bryder y byddai'r farchnad ar gyfer papur a gwydr i'w ailgylchu yn peidio â bod. Yn ffodus, nid felly y mae: mae'r newid ym melin bapur UPM yn Shotton wedi cael effaith wirioneddol ar hybu'r galw am bapur i'w ailgylchu. Mae hynny'n achosi problem o ran coedwigaeth yn fy mhortffolio, ond mae wedi sicrhau marchnad dros gyfnod hir ac y telir pris da am bapur. Mae'r un peth yn wir am wydr. Mae caniau a phlastig yn her. Ar hyn o bryd nid yw plastig, ar y cyfan, yn cael ei ailgylchu yn y DU: eir ag ef i'r dwyrain pell a'i ailgylchu â llaw, oherwydd rhaid ei dddoli â llaw. Yna daw yn ôl i Ewrop a'i ddefnyddio ar gyfer y padin mewn siacedi cwiltiog y bydd nifer o bobl yn eu gwisgo yn y gaeaf.

Mae llawer iawn o waith i'w wneud o hyd i ddatblygu'r system ailgylchu, ond a dweud y gwir—gwrandewais ar y cyfraniadau'n ofalus, a'r gwir yw bod cytundeb cyffredinol ar yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud o ran ailgylchu—yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer mewn amser byr, ond mae yna ymadrodd yn Gymraeg y bydd pobl yn gyfarwydd ag ef:

Nid da lle gellir gwell.

Dyna'r hyn yr ydym am ei wneud dros y pedair blynedd nesaf, yn arbennig, hyd at 2010 ac wedyn. Yr ydym am barhau i sicrhau bod ailgylchu'n dod yn rhywbeth arferol, a bod pobl yn ei ystyried yn rhywbeth a wnânt

after week, not as an unusual act. That means increasing the number of kerbside collections for different materials and ensuring that facilities where people can take goods for recycling are more widely available than perhaps they are now. Ultimately, it may mean that a time will come when, if encouragement does not work, consideration may have to be given to some kind of system of incentives, or some kind of system of financial penalties.

But, that is in the distance; encouragement is working so far and we need to make sure that we keep an eye on the good work that is being done by many of our local authorities and ensure that those that are lagging behind learn from the best practice that exists elsewhere in Wales. We are behind England at the moment—we have been behind England for many years—but, over the next five or 10 years, we will catch up. Eventually, as we have done in so many other things, we will take over.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

o ran arfer, wythnos ar ôl wythnos, nid fel rhywbeth anarferol. Mae hynny'n golygu cynyddu nifer y casgliadau ar ymyl y ffordd ar gyfer gwahanol ddeunyddiau, a sicrhau bod cyfleusterau lle y gall pobl fynd â nwyddau i'w hailgylchu ar gael yn fwy cyffredinol nag ar hyn o bryd, efallai. Yn y pen draw, gall olygu y daw amser, os na fydd anogaeth yn gweithio, y bydd yn rhaid ystyried rhyw fath o system o gymhellion, neu ryw fath o system o gosbau ariannol.

Ond mae hynny yn y dyfodol; mae anogaeth yn gweithio hyd yn hyn, ac mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn cadw llygad ar y gwaith da a wneir gan gynifer o'n hawdurdodau lleol a sicrhau bod y rheini sydd ar ei hôl hi yn dysgu o'r arfer gorau sydd i'w weld mewn manau eraill yng Nghymru. Nid ydym cystal â Lloegr ar hyn o bryd—nid ydym wedi bod cystal â Lloegr ers llawer blwyddyn—ond dros y pum neu'r 10 mlynedd nesaf byddwn yn gwella. Yn y pen draw, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud gyda chynifer o bethau eraill, byddwn yn rhagori ar Loegr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.25 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.25 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)

Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)